TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON TUESDAY, 17TH APRIL 2018 - DAY 67

67

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT **SOLE MEMBER:**

REGISTRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR. DIARMAID MCGUINNESS SC

MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. KATHLEEN LEADER BL

MS. ELIZABETH MULLAN, SOLICITOR

FOR SGT. McCABE: MR. MICHAEL MCDOWELL SC

MR. PAUL MCGARRY SC MR. BREFFNI GORDON BL

INSTRUCTED BY: SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY

HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY

DUBLIN 7

FOR THE COMMISSIONER:

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC MR. NOEL WHELAN BL MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL MR. JOHN FITZGERALD BL

INSTRUCTED BY: MS. ALISON MORRISSEY

MS. EMMA GRIFFIN

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

MR. PATRICK McCANN SC FOR MR. BRIAN PURCELL:

MR. GERARD MEEHAN BL MR. CHARLES WALLACE INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

FOR SUPT. TAYLOR: MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS

MS. TARA BURNS SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL

MR. CARTHAGE CONLON M.E. HANAHOE SOLICITORS **INSTRUCTED BY:**

SUNLIGHT CHAMBERS 21 PARLIAMENT STREET

DUBLIN 2

FOR MRS. MICHELLE TAYLOR:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FELIX MCENROY SC O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT 51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR MR. JOHN WILSON:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MARK HARTY SC PETER CONNOLLY COURT SOLICITORS 6 CAPEL STREET FIRST FLOOR

DUBLIN 1

FOR JOHN McGUINNESS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DARREN LEHANE BL

LAWLOR PARTNERS SOLICITORS

ARRAN SQUARE ARRAN QUAY DUBLIN 7

FOR ALISON O'REILLY:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FÍONÁN Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH BL

AUGUSTUS CULLEN LAW SOLICITORS 18 BOW STREET

SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR MR. NOEL BRETT:

MR. SEÁN BARTON McCANN FITZGERALD

RIVERSIDE ONE 37-42 SIR JOHN ROGERSON'S QUAY GRAND CANAL DOCK

DUBLIN 2

FOR MR. GERALD KEAN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DAVID BOUGHTON BL

KEAN SOLICITORS
NO. 2 UPPER PEMBROKE STREET
DUBLIN 2

FOR MR. JOHN KENNEDY:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC

MICHAEL HEGARTY

REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS

12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE

DUBLIN 2

FOR MR. MICHEÁL MARTIN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FEICHÍN MCDONAGH SC

MR. LIAM GUIDERA

MASON HAYES & CURRAN

BARROW STREET

DUBLIN 4

FOR MS. D:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. THOMAS P. HOGAN SC FANNING & KELLY SOLICITORS

HATCH HALL

HATCH STREET LOWER SAINT KEVIN'S

DUBLIN 2

FOR MR. PAUL WILLIAMS: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JOHN FREEMAN BL FANNING & KELLY SOLICITORS HATCH HALL HATCH STREET LOWER SAINT KEVIN'S DUBLIN 2

INDEX

WITNESS	PAGI
DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT FRANK WALSH	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS	43
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	62
RE-EXAMINED BY MR MARRINAN	63

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON TUESDAY, 17TH APRIL	-
2			<u>2018:</u>	
3				
4			MR. MARRINAN: Detective Superintendent Frank Walsh,	
5			please.	10:03
6				
7			DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT FRANK WALSH, HAVING BEEN	
8			SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
9			MR. MARRINAN: Detective Superintendent Walsh's	
10			statement to the Tribunal investigators appears at page	10:03
11			1832 of the materials.	
12	1	Q.	Detective superintendent, you have already given	
13			evidence earlier on	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	2	Q.	in an earlier term of reference. And you were	10:04
16			Commissioner Callinan's private secretary?	
17		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
18	3	Q.	From January 2012, is that right?	
19		Α.	I believe it was February.	
20	4	Q.	February 2012?	10:04
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	5	Q.	I think in your statement you say:	
23				
24			"On 23rd January 2012, on the retirement of the then	
25			private secretary, I transferred to Commissioner	10:04
26			Callinan's office as his new private secretary."	
27		Α.	Sorry, that may be correct, my apologies.	
28	6	Q.	So that is correct. And I think that you worked with	
29			him until his retirement in late March of 2014?	

1	Α.	That's	correct.

- 7 Q. And thereafter, with the Acting Commissioner and then
 subsequently full-time Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan?
- 4 A. That's correct, Chairman.
- 5 8 Q. And you worked with her as her private secretary until 10:05 6 18th July of 2016, and at that time you transferred to 7 the Liaison and Protection Unit in Security and 8 Intelligence, is that right?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 9 Q. Where was your office in relation to the Commissioner's 10:05 office?
- 12 A. The Commissioner's office is over two floors, so, if 13 you enter the front door there is a stairway leading 14 straight upstairs to the Commissioner's office. My 15 office was on the ground floor immediately on the 10:05 16 right-hand side as you entered the front door.
- 17 10 Q. And what did most of your work entail?
- A. Administrative work, dealing with the public, dealing
 with public representatives, dealing with foreign
 police forces, embassies, etcetera. One of my main
 roles was looking after all protected disclosure files.
- 22 11 Q. Right. And were these primarily matters that concerned 23 the Commissioner, that you were dealing with as his 24 private secretary in the first instance with 25 Commissioner Callinan?

10.06

A. To a certain extent. There would -- I suppose, yeah,
they would have dealt with the Commissioner on a
personal basis but I suppose 50% personal to the
Commissioner and the rest would have been general to

			the organisation.	
2	12	Q.	All right. So he looked to you as his administrative	
3			officer, isn't that right?	
4		Α.	That's correct. There were two positions: There was a	
5			personal assistant who is at the rank of chief	10:06
6			superintendent, the chief superintendent would have had	
7			responsibility for policy matters; the private	
8			secretary, which was my role, I would have had	
9			responsibility for day-to-day administration.	
10	13	Q.	And who was the chief superintendent at that time?	10:06
11		Α.	It was Chief Superintendent Orla McPartlin at the time.	
12	14	Q.	And in terms of your working relationship with	
13			Commissioner Callinan, how would you describe that?	
14		Α.	Good professional working relationship, yes.	
15	15	Q.	Obviously you were on friendly terms with him?	10:07
16		Α.	Reasonably friendly with the Commissioner, yes. We	
17			attended some social events together, he would have	
18			asked me to accompany him to some social events, yes,	
19			so friendly basis.	
20	16	Q.	Well you know the matters we are considering and	10:07
21			principally you are being called in relation to a	
22			letter that had been sent to the Commissioner by	
23			Mr. Kean, solicitor?	
24		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
25	17	Q.	But just before we come to that, so that we can get a	10:07
26			flavour of your knowledge of what was going on at the	
27			time, obviously in late 2013 the issues that Maurice	
28			McCabe had agitated about were to the fore, is that	
29			right?	

- 1 A. That's correct, yes.
- 2 18 Q. And one is assuming that there was a great deal of discussion about it informally at Headquarters?
- 4 A. Yes, I have given evidence previously that there were a
 5 lot of rumours around Headquarters at that time. 10:08
- 6 19 Q. Well, I am not talking about rumours in relation to
 7 Maurice McCabe; I am just talking about discussions
 8 about the issues as they presented themselves.
- 9 A. Yes, yes.
- 10 20 Q. And there is no harm in that, one would have thought it 10:08
 11 might be encouraged that people would openly discuss
 12 these issues. From your discussions with the
 13 Commissioner, could you discern what his position was?

10:09

- 14 Α. His position was that he was trying to solve the problems that were coming up. It was -- it was very 15 16 much, there was a lot of material appearing in the 17 public domain and he was trying to address the issues. 18 My sense was that, while he wasn't enjoying obviously 19 what was happening, that he was anxious to address the 20 issues and was trying to address them at that particular time. 21
- 22 21 Q. Well, obviously he wasn't enjoying what was happening 23 but did he regard, as far as you could tell, Sergeant 24 McCabe as perhaps a thorn in the side of the Gardaí?
- A. I couldn't -- I could give a personal opinion on that, but I couldn't -- I couldn't refer to any particular time when I recall a conversation involving him giving out about Sergeant McCabe.
- 29 22 Q. Well, just feel free to express your personal opinion

4		- . •	
	٦n	relation	to it.

- A. Well, my personal opinion was, yes, that he wished it
 would go away and he was hoping to try and address the
 issues. But as I say, I never -- I can't recall any
 conversation that we may have had where he castigated
 Sergeant McCabe or was --
- 7 23 Q. That is very helpful. Did you get any -- did you get 8 any sense that perhaps Commissioner Callinan was 9 becoming frustrated with the issues surrounding 10 Sergeant McCabe?

10 · 10

- 11 Α. I would say that is probably fair to say, yes. 12 everybody was frustrated with the issues that were 13 appearing at that particular time. We were trying to address them in the midst of other work that was very 14 15 important and had to go on, so it was an extra burden, 10:10 16 I suppose, on the office that we could have done without but, nevertheless, it needed to be addressed 17 18 and I believe we were trying hard to address it at the 19 time.
- 20 24 Q. Now, obviously subsequently when Commissioner

 10:10

 O'Sullivan took over the reins, substantial progress

 was made in relation to dealing with whistleblowers,

 isn't that right?
- 24 A. I believe so, yes.
- 25 Q. And indeed, I think it fair to say that Commissioner 10:10

 O'Sullivan met face-to-face with Sergeant McCabe, isn't that right?
- A. She did indeed, as did I. She asked me to go and meet him. I met Sergeant McCabe in Mullingar and we sat

- down for a meeting for several hours.
- 2 26 Q. Well, was there any discussion perhaps towards the end 3 of 2013 that you might have had with Commissioner 4 Callinan that perhaps he ought to have met face-to-face 5 with Sergeant McCabe to discuss the issues?

- A. I don't recall ever having that conversation with him,no.
- 8 27 Q. Was there anybody suggesting at senior management level that perhaps that's what ought to be done?
- It may have been suggested to him, I genuinely don't 10 Α. 10 · 11 11 know. It was not in my presence, to the best of my 12 recollection. I can never remember it being suggested 13 that he should sit down and meet with him. I know at 14 the time the Commissioner was anxious to get out to the 15 various stations and meet people, and certainly we, as 10:11 16 his staff, were encouraging that. Commissioner 17 Callinan was a person who was literally in the office 18 from 7:00-7:30 in the morning until late in the 19 I do recall saying to him on several occasions that it would be good to get out and about 20 10:12 and meet people, probably good for himself as well 21 22 because he was -- and I don't wish to be seeing to be buttering the man up, he had his faults like anybody 23 24 else, but he spent long hours in the office and I 25 personally thought it would be good that he would get 10.12 out and meet people outside in stations and show 26 27 himself out there as the Commissioner. That may have 28 been an opportunity for him to meet Sergeant McCabe,

but I don't believe I ever said to him you should go

29

- 1 and meet Sergeant McCabe.
- 2 28 Q. Was there any sense at this time in December of 2013,
- going into January of 2014, that the Commissioner was
- 4 being overwhelmed by the problems that were presenting

10:13

10:14

- 5 themselves?
- 6 A. Certainly, as an office staff, I think we were all
- 7 probably worried that things were getting -- the volume
- 8 of allegations and instances that were coming before
- 9 him were becoming greater and greater and that he was
- under pressure, I have no doubt about that. Again it's 10:13
- 11 not something that I would have discussed, I wouldn't
- have said, Commissioner, you are under pressure, you
- 13 need to take a few days off.
- 14 29 Q. No, I understand that, but I mean, your views in this
- regard are very helpful. Previously you told the
- 16 Chairman that rumours were rife in Garda Headquarters
- in relation to Sergeant McCabe?
- 18 A. That's correct, Chairman, yes.
- 19 30 Q. And because you had dealt with him personally that you
- 20 didn't attach any significance, and certainly you
- 21 weren't one to spread any rumours in relation to him?
- 22 A. Well, that plus the fact that I had responsibilities
- for the confidential reporting documents, I would have
- an in-depth knowledge of them, and I would feel that
- 25 maybe I would be a target to ask me a question, people
- 26 might know that I knew something about them so I was
- very circumspect as to what I would discuss.
- 28 31 Q. What were the rumours?
- 29 A. Well, the rumours -- I suppose it was more a curiosity

- about Sergeant McCabe's motive for bringing these matters to light.
- 3 32 Q. And what was being attributed as his motive?
- A. I suppose the motive that was being spoken about at the
 time was that he wasn't happy with how the DPP's
 directions were conveyed to him arising out of the
 alleged incident that occurred some years previously,
 and that perhaps that he was some way annoyed over this
 as well and was getting his own back on his management.

10:16

11 33 Q. And did you at any time discuss that with the Commissioner?

They were the types of rumours.

10

29

them.

- A. I have no recollection of discussing it in any detail.

 It may have been discussed, I couldn't say for definite
 that I didn't, but there is nothing remarkable jumping
 out at me to say, yes, I remember a conversation that
 we had. I don't believe so, no.
- 18 34 Q. Well, is it a position that you don't believe that you
 19 had any discussion with him touching on the subject of,
 20 I'll put it, the 2006 investigation of Sergeant McCabe? 10:15
- Yes, I don't believe that the Commissioner and I had a 21 Α. 22 direct conversation involving that. I may have been 23 present in a room while the matter was being discussed. 24 I couldn't say that I wasn't, but I have no 25 recollection of anything specific being discussed 26 between he and I. And our relationship, as I said, was 27 professional and I would bring files to his attention and discuss them and decide the best way to deal with 28

More often than not the Commissioner would

Τ			decide the best way to deal with them. I would advise	
2			on occasions and he wouldn't necessarily always take my	
3			advice, but that's just that is the way the office	
4			worked. So we wouldn't be sitting down having a	
5			general conversation and discussing other people's	10:16
6			curiosity on the questions that were being asked about	
7			files we were dealing with.	
8	35	Q.	Superintendent Taylor was the press officer at this	
9			time, is that right?	
10		Α.	That's right, yes.	10:16
11	36	Q.	And we have a statement from, or a number of statements	
12			from Superintendent Taylor. Was he a frequent caller	
13			to the Commissioner?	
14		Α.	He was a frequent caller, yes.	
15	37	Q.	And were they close?	10:17
16		Α.	They seemed to be they seemed to be close, yes.	
17	38	Q.	All right. Okay. Just on one matter, I think that you	
18			had previously given your career in An Garda Síochána,	
19			and I think that you were attested in 1981, is that	
20			right?	10:17
21		Α.	That's right, November '81, yes.	
22	39	Q.	And that you were in Pearse Street?	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	40	Q.	And that sergeant or Commissioner Callinan was a	
25			sergeant in Pearse Street?	10:17
26		Α.	He was there as a sergeant at that time, yes.	
27	41	Q.	You have heard some cross-examination and discussion	
28			here at the Tribunal in relation to John Wilson and a	
29			story that it's suggested was circulating in Pearse	

1 Street --2 That's correct. Α. 3 42 0. -- in or around about that time. Do you recall that? I have a vague recollection of that. I actually worked 4 Α. 5 with -- John Wilson was on the same unit as I was on. 10:17 John arrived there two or three years after I, so I 6 7 know John Wilson quite well, yes. I have a 8 recollection of the incident. If I was asked to swear it was true, I couldn't, I don't honestly know. 9 You have a recollection that it was something that 10 43 Q. 10.18 was --11 12 Yeah, I am not sure was it because I read it in the Α. 13 transcripts recently or do I remember it from way back. 14 44 Q. Ah, well now, there is a big distinction between the 15 two, as to whether or not you remember it as something 10:18 16 that was discussed or you remember it just simply from 17 hearing it at the Tribunal? 18 Yeah, but it is nearly 30 years ago. Α. 19 45 I know, but... Q. I genuinely couldn't say I remember it happening. 20 Α. 10:18 But do you remember discussion about it back in your 21 46 Q. 22 time in Pearse Street? 23 I don't really, no. Α. 24 You don't? 47 Q. 25 No. no. Α. 10:18 When was it that former Commissioner Callinan arrived? 26 48 0. 27 I think he didn't arrive until 1986, is that right?

I really don't know.

28

29

Α.

time.

Em, I don't know that. I know he was there for a short

We will hear from him in due course. In terms of the 1 49 Q. 2 impending appearance of the Commissioner before the 3 Public Accounts Committee, you recall that? I do. 4 Α. 5 50 Did you attend any of the pre-PAC meetings? Q. 10:19 6 Α. I didn't. 7 They were quite extensive, isn't that right? 51 Q. Yes. 8 That's correct, yes. Α. And a great deal of effort went into preparing for 9 52 Q. them --10 10.19 11 Α. That's correct. 12 53 -- isn't that so? But you didn't have any role or 0. 13 function in appearing, in the Commissioner's 14 appearance? 15 Not in his appearances other than I would have prepared 10:19 Α. 16 material on protected disclosures, I would have 17 prepared possibly a document saying how many protected 18 disclosures there had been and how many had been 19 finalised, how many were ongoing, etcetera. 20 54 You recently had an interview with our investigators? Q. 10:20 That's right. 21 Α. 22 55 It went on for I think four hours in total, maybe Q. longer, and it dealt with a letter that the Tribunal 23 24 uncovered, and notes made by former Commissioner 25 Callinan touching on matters of concern to Sergeant 10.20 McCabe. Have you time had time to reflect on matters 26 27 further beyond what you discussed with our

No, I think I made a very open and frank discussion

investigators?

28

29

Α.

1 with the investigators. I told them everything that I 2 know about the letter. There is just one perhaps issue, and if we could look 3 56 Q. at it, look at it more closely, but in a general sense; 4 you'll appreciate that the Chairman asked for 5 10:21 6 information touching on the terms of reference to the 7 Tribunal, isn't that right? 8 Yes, that's correct. Α. And you are aware of the fact that the Tribunal wrote 9 57 Q. 10 out to each superintendent or garda of superintendent 10 · 21 11 rank and above --12 Yes. Α. 13 -- for information that could be of assistance to the 58 Q. 14 Tribunal, and you got that letter, isn't that right? 15 I did indeed, yes. Α. 10:21 16 And in fact, you very helpfully provided a very long 59 0. 17 and detailed statement to the Tribunal, but there was 18 no reference to this incident --19 That's correct, yes. Α. -- in that, isn't that right? 20 60 Q. 10:21 That's correct. 21 Α. 22 You are also, I am sure, aware of the fact that, 61 Q. 23 similarly, Commissioner Callinan was asked to make a 24 statement to the Tribunal, and, in fact, was 25 interviewed on a number of occasions, extensively over 10.22 hours, and he made no reference to this incident 26 27 involving Gerald Kean, isn't that right? 28 well, I am not aware of it. I take it that that is Α. 29 correct.

- 1 And similarly, Mr. Kean didn't advise the Tribunal, but 62 Q. 2
- that is perhaps understandable because he is outside
- the process. So as matters stood, the Tribunal wasn't 3
- informed in relation to this letter that had been sent 4

10.23

10:23

10:23

- 5 by Gerald Kean in his interaction with the
- Commissioner, isn't that right? 6
- 7 That's right, yes. Α.
- 8 63 And not only that, the letter received in the 0.
- 9 Commissioner's office didn't appear on the
- correspondence register, isn't that right? 10
- 11 I don't know that. Α.
- 12 64 Well, I think that you were shown a copy of it by the Q.
- 13 investigators?
- 14 Α. Of the correspondence register?
- 15 65 Q. Yes.
- 16 Yeah, possibly. yes, I am sure I was, yeah. Α.
- 17 66 I think it was pointed out to you that it didn't appear Q.
- 18 there?
- 19 Okay, yeah, I accept that, yes. Α.
- 20 67 And there was no formal response to it, isn't that Q.
- right? 21
- 22 That's correct. In that, there was no response in Α.
- 23 writing.
- 24 Yes. Well, no formal response? 68 Q.
- 25 There was a response, there was no -- yeah, I accept Α.
- 26 there was no formal response.
- 27 69 Well, your response was informal, we will come to it in Q.
- 28 due course, but your response was informal, isn't that
- 29 right?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 70 Q. So there was no formal response. You keep a diary in
- 3 relation to appointments and such matters, isn't that

10.24

10:24

- 4 so?
- 5 A. Yes, there was an electronic diary, I also have a
- 6 personal diary.
- 7 71 Q. And there is no reference in that to a meeting with
- 8 Mr. Kean?
- 9 A. There is a reference in my personal diary, yes.
- 10 72 Q. what?
- 11 A. There is a reference in your personal diary.
- 12 73 Q. You kept a reference of that, is that right?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 74 Q. You might be able to provide that to us.
- 15 A. I have already discovered it. I have the diary with me 10:24
- 16 here also.
- 17 75 Q. That is excellent. Thank you. So, as far as these
- 18 matters are concerned, there was actually nothing in
- 19 the Commissioner's office to suggest that a letter had
- 20 been seen -- received from Gerald Kean, isn't that
- 21 right?
- 22 A. The letter was in the office.
- 23 76 Q. Yes, but other than that?
- 24 A. It seems not. Yeah.
- 25 77 Q. And there ought to have been a record?
- 26 A. There ought to have been, yes.
- 27 78 Q. The letter that was received ought to have been filed
- on Sergeant McCabe's file, isn't that right?
- 29 A. That's correct.

- 1 79 Q. That file stretches to some 3,500 pages?
- 2 A. Correct, yes.
- 3 80 Q. But it didn't make its way to the Sergeant McCabe file?
- 4 A. It didn't, no.
- 5 81 Q. I mean, somebody looking at this may think that this

10:25

10:25

10:26

10 · 26

- 6 was sort of a matter that was being swept under the
- 7 carpet so nobody would be able to see what had
- 8 happened?
- 9 A. Okay, well, perhaps --
- 10 82 Q. Is there any sense of that?
- 11 A. No, not at all, no.
- 12 83 Q. Okay. Well, you have had an opportunity to see
- 13 Commissioner Callinan's supplemental statement that he
- 14 made?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 84 Q. And you'll appreciate from that that he made no
- 17 reference at all to talking to Gerald Kean prior to the
- 18 Marian Finucane show on the Saturday?
- 19 A. I was never aware that he had spoken to Gerald Kean.
- 20 85 Q. You are aware from superintendent -- or Mr. Callinan's
- 21 supplemental statement to the Tribunal?
- 22 A. Yeah, I am aware now since I met the investigators,
- 23 yes.
- 24 86 Q. Yes. Is your evidence and does your evidence, does it
- remain that you had no knowledge that he had spoken to
- 26 Gerald Kean on the Saturday?
- 27 A. Absolutely, yes.
- 28 87 Q. Does it surprise you that he didn't tell you that?
- 29 A. Not particularly, no.

1 88 Q. Well, right, we will come to that anyway. If we could 2 just perhaps, if you could just give your evidence as 3 to how this first arose, what did the Commissioner say 4 to you in the first instance?

10:26

10.27

10:27

10:27

10.28

5 Okay. I understand the letter came by courier, I Α. understand it was marked "Private and Confidential". 6 7 In the normal course of events, post arriving to the 8 Commissioner's office is sorted in a downstairs administration office, it's sorted by staff there. 9 There are three Civil Service staff and two sergeants 10 11 attached to the office, so they would divide up the 12 post into its various categories, such as personal, 13 secret, confidential, private and confidential, 14 etcetera, etcetera. What they could open was opened 15 and was put through the correspondence register. 16 Letters that were marked "personal", "private and confidential" etcetera would be delivered either 17 18 directly to myself or the chief superintendent for us 19 to deal with. In the normal course of events we would open the post that was appropriate for us to open and 20 send them back downstairs to be entered on to the 21 22 correspondence register. Matters that were private and 23 confidential or personal, we would bring to the direct attention of the Commissioner for he or she to open 24 25 them themselves, unless we were directed otherwise. 26 There may be a case where a letter would arrive, if the 27 Commissioner wasn't in the office and I might be talking to the Commissioner on the phone and say there 28 29 is a personal letter here for you, sometimes it would

1			be obvious what it was, it would be obvious where it	
2			was coming from and I could say it's one from the	
3			Department, from the Secretary General, whatever it	
4			might be, and invariably I would be told, go ahead,	
5			open it and see what it is. So then, we could deal	10:28
6			with it like that.	
7				
8			This particular letter, I understand was delivered by	
9			courier, would have been probably delivered to myself.	
10			I have no recollection of actually getting the letter,	10:28
11			we had huge volumes of post, I have no recollection of	
12			getting that particular letter but I do recall	
13			discussing it with the Commissioner. In the normal	
14			course of events I would have brought that letter to	
15			the Commissioner, handed it to him to open or maybe he	10:28
16			would have asked me to open it. I recall	
17	89	Q.	If we just can look at the letter as it came in at	
18			1878. You see there:	
19				
20			"Dear Martin	10:29
21			I enclose copy letter which I have received"	
22		Α.	There is nothing on the screen. Can I refer to my own	
23			documents?	
24	90	Q.	Yes, you can. It's in Volume 7 if you wish to refer to	
25			it there.	10:29
26		Α.	And sorry, the page number?	
27	91	Q.	1878.	
28		Α.	Yes, I have it here now.	
29	92	Q.	"Dear Martin	

Τ.			I enclose copy letter which I have received from	
2			Maurice McCabe. I am also enclosing draft response. I	
3			have not sent these letters to the other person. I	
4			would be grateful if you would look at the letter that	
5			I have received and my proposed draft response. I need	10:29
6			to be factually correct, and any assistance would	
7			certainly be appreciated."	
8				
9			And enclosed with that is a letter that was sent by	
10			Maurice McCabe to Mr. Kean, and that appears at page	10:30
11			1879, going to page 1881 of the material. This is	
12			clearly a private matter between Sergeant McCabe and	
13			Mr. Kean, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
15	93	Q.	It had absolutely nothing to do with the Garda	10:30
16			Commissioner, isn't that right?	
17		Α.	No, ostensibly, no.	
18	94	Q.	And you weren't aware of the fact that, of course,	
19			according to Mr. Kean, and this hasn't been confirmed	
20			by Mr. Callinan, but according to Mr. Kean he had	10:30
21			spoken with Commissioner Callinan on the Saturday	
22			before his appearance on the 26th January on the Marian	
23			Finucane Show, he had spoken at length with the	
24			Commissioner and in fact got most of the information	
25			that he subsequently used on the show from the	10:31
26			Commissioner?	
27		Α.	That's correct.	
28	95	Q.	You weren't aware of that?	
29		Δ.	I was not aware. no.	

96 Q. 1 So this was just, as far as you were concerned, a 2 letter effectively out of the blue from Mr. Kean to the 3 Commissioner, asking for some advice in relation to a private matter between he and Sergeant McCabe, isn't 4 5 that right? 10:31 6 I'm sorry, I don't follow the question. Α. 7 97 This was a letter out of the blue from Mr. Kean to the Q. 8 Commissioner, is that right --9 Yes. Α. 10 98 -- looking for advice from the Commissioner --Q. 10:32 11 Yes. Α. 12 99 -- in relation to a private matter between Mr. Kean and Ο. 13 Sergeant McCabe? Private matter, em, well, it was very much a public 14 Α. 15 matter obviously at that point in time. 10:32 16 Well, no, it's a private matter insofar as Mr. McCabe, 100 Q. 17 in his letter -- or Sergeant McCabe in his letter to 18 Mr. Kean, sets out clearly that he believes that he has 19 been defamed. 20 Α. Okay. 10:32 21 Isn't that right? 101 Q. 22 Yes. Α. 23 102 This is a matter, a private matter between Sergeant Q. 24 McCabe and Mr. Kean. 25 In other words, what is being put to you is CHAIRMAN: 26 it's not part of the Commissioner's public duties, it's 27 two citizens having a row with each other, which of 28 course will go to the courts and become public, but as 29 regards the public function of the Commissioner, it's

1 nothing to do, it would seem on the face of it, with 2 the public function of the Commissioner. Is that fair, 3 Mr. Marrinan? MR. MARRINAN: Yes. sir. 4 5 I would disagree slightly, Chairman, in that, the fact Α. 10:33 6 that it had been aired on the public airwaves, then in 7 my opinion it was now a public matter. 8 103 In your opinion. And in your opinion do you think it's Q. appropriate for the Garda Commissioner to be advising a 9 solicitor as to how he should draft a response to a 10 10:33 11 letter concerning an action for defamation? Do you 12 think that is appropriate? No. I didn't believe so. 13 Α. 14 104 Q. I mean, in hindsight, the fact that this matter 15 was even considered by the Commissioner at the time was 10:33 16 inappropriate, wasn't it? 17 I wouldn't go that far. I would say --Α. 18 105 Well, it ought to have been referred to the Press Q. 19 Office if Mr. Kean was merely seeking information, 20 isn't that right? 10:34 21 Possibly, yes. Α. 22 Or Mr. Kean ought to have been advised in a 106 Q. 23 fairly frank letter saying that it wasn't a matter for 24 the Garda Commissioner and if he wished to find out information in relation to this matter, he could look 25 10:34 at the transcript from the PAC meeting where the 26 27 Commissioner set out his stall, isn't that right?

That would certainly be an alternative means of dealing

28

29

Α.

with it, yes.

- Yet it appears that the Commissioner sought some advice 1 107 Q.
- from you as to how he should deal with this letter, is 2
- 3 that right?
- we had a general discussion on it, yes. 4 Α.
- 5 108 And did you perhaps venture a view, look, this isn't Q.

10:35

10:35

10:35

10:36

- 6 really a matter for you, why is Mr. Kean writing this
- 7 letter to you?
- 8 Em, my concern with the letter -- Sergeant McCabe's Α.
- letter to the solicitor was very obviously something 9
- that may end up in litigation, and I thought it was 10
- 11 inappropriate for the Commissioner to be seen to be
- 12 advising a solicitor in a case involving a member of An
- 13 Garda Síochána which would possibly go before the
- 14 courts for adjudication.
- 15 109 well, it wasn't just inappropriate to be seen to be Q.
- 16 doing that; it was inappropriate to do it, isn't that
- 17 riaht?

25

26

- 18 Yes, yes, absolutely, yes.
- 19 110 So you advised the Commissioner that in your view that Q.
- 20 it was inappropriate?
- I actually agreed with the Commissioner, he was also of 21 Α.
- 22 the view that it was inappropriate.

No, I was not, no.

- 23 But of course, you weren't aware of the fact that 111 Q.
- 24 he had spent nearly an hour on the phone on the
- Saturday?
- 27 112 And he didn't tell you? Q.
- 28 He didn't, no. Α.

Α.

29 113 Does it surprise you, looking back at this in Q.

1			hindsight, that he didn't advise you, look, the reason	
2			that I got this letter is because I gave him the	
3			information?	
4		Α.	Knowing Commissioner Callinan, no, it doesn't surprise	
5			me and I don't mean anything bad by that. But he	10:36
6			wouldn't normally have long conversations with me in	
7			relation to who he was speaking to. So no, it doesn't	
8			surprise me.	
9	114	Q.	Ah, look, you are dealing with a letter that has come	
10			in. I'm sure it's not every day of the week that a	10:36
11			solicitor writes in looking for advice from the Garda	
12			Commissioner as to how to respond to a letter that had	
13			been written in relation to proposed defamation	
14			proceedings, it's not every day of the week, is it?	
15		Α.	It's not every day of the week.	10:36
16	115	Q.	Has it ever happened before?	
17		Α.	I couldn't recall a specific instance but I deal	
18			well, at that point in time I dealt with maybe 20	
19			letters a week from solicitors to the Commissioner.	
20	116	Q.	So you must have at the very least have found this	10:37
21			somewhat peculiar?	
22		Α.	It was unusual, most definitely unusual, yes.	
23	117	Q.	But perhaps not so had you been advised that	
24			Commissioner Callinan had provided the information to	
25			Mr. Kean before he went on the show?	10:37
26		Α.	That would certainly have put a different slant on it,	
27			yes.	
28	118	Q.	Yes. So I will come back to the question that I asked	
29			you: Are you surprised that Commissioner Callinan	

1			didn't tell you that nugget of information that perhaps	
2			would have thrown some light on this unusual	
3			occurrence?	
4		Α.	Well, given the type of relationship I had with the	
5			Commissioner, that is what I have been just trying to	0:3
6			explain. I am not surprised, no. It would have been	
7			preferable for me trying to advise if I knew all the	
8			facts, obviously, but I wasn't given that information,	
9			so	
10	119	Q.	So, in any event, did you both then consider the letter 10	0:3
11			that had been sent by Sergeant McCabe to Mr. Kean?	
12			CHAIRMAN: Just before you go on there, Mr. Marrinan,	
13			forgive a brief interruption. What Mr. Marrinan has	
14			been asking you about, superintendent, he says, look,	
15			you are sitting in the Garda Commissioner's office, you 10	0:3
16			are his secretary, you are in charge of administration	
17			and a letter comes from in from a solicitor, a	
18			well-known solicitor, saying, oh, Maurice McCabe is	
19			suing me for libel and here is a draft response to his	

bizarre may be bandied about but surely you were
utterly astonished and I am not getting any sense of

that, or any sense of how your conversation developed

and I really do need your help on that.

25 A. Chairman --

20

23

24

26

29

CHAIRMAN: I mean, I can't think of anything stranger.

initial letter, now please advise me. And the word

10:38

10:39

I mean, there has been a lot of strange things but this

is really, really, really strange.

A. I would say, Chairman, utterly astonished would be very

Τ			strong. I wasn't utterly astonished by it. But I will	
2			try and set out the conversation that we had in	
3			relation.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Right, do. You know, Superintendent, given	
5			that it must be the case certainly that, in the course	10:39
6			of correspondence, you get a lot of letters from a lot	
7			of disgruntled people	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9			CHAIRMAN: who may or may not necessarily be	
10			completely lacking in paranoia and so you would get odd	10:39
11			correspondence, but this is a piece of official	
12			correspondence from a solicitor to the Garda	
13			Commissioner asking him, apparently out of the blue,	
14			how do I reply to a letter from Maurice McCabe accusing	
15			me of libelling him on the radio? So the first	10:40
16			question that would come into your head is: Well, what	
17			has that got to do with us? We should surely put it in	
18			the file for people who are somewhat out of touch with	
19			reality and that's the place for it, not any	
20			conversation with the Garda Commissioner?	10:40
21		Α.	Well, Chairman, I will try to explain the conversation	
22			we had around it, I am kind of waiting for it to	
23			develop to that point in time. I can do it now if you	
24			wish.	
25			CHAIRMAN: Well, yes.	10:40
26	120	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Well do, because, I mean, I am not	
27			getting any flavour at all of just how bizarre this is,	
28			do you understand?	
29		Α.	I understand where you are coming from, yes.	

- 1 Bizarre --
- 2 121 Q. You see, as a lawyer, and you have studied some law
- 3 yourself, isn't that right?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 122 Q. And that is why the Commissioner was bringing you in on 10:41
- 6 this?
- 7 A. That's correct, yes.
- 8 123 Q. It just seems quite astonishing that a solicitor would
- 9 request the Garda Commissioner, who was the employer of

10 · 41

10:41

- 10 Sergeant McCabe, to help him draft a legal letter in
- response to the letter from Sergeant McCabe?
- 12 A. I agree, I agree 100 percent.
- 13 124 Q. Do you find it as astonishing as I am stating it to be?
- A. Astonishing is not the word I would have used.
- 15 125 Q. What word would you use?
- 16 A. Most unusual, and inappropriate. And that is what I
- said and agreed with the Commissioner; that it was
- inappropriate for him to send a response to Mr. Kean on
- this letter, given that the subject of the letter would
- 20 probably end up in litigation and involved a member of
- 21 An Garda Síochána, for whom the Commissioner had
- 22 responsibility.
- 23 126 Q. Well, you know, I mean that was what you said to the
- investigators, because it might end up in litigation.
- I mean, is that because we might be discovered in
- 26 giving this help to Mr. Kean?
- 27 A. No.
- 28 127 Q. It was either inappropriate or it wasn't.
- 29 A. It was inappropriate, yes.

- 1 128 Q. Yes. But in any event, the letter that was drafted by 2 the Commissioner, the handwritten letter, is at page 3 1895 of the material. I don't intend to open it all, 4 but did he draft this in your presence?
- 5 A. No.

10:43

- 6 129 Q. He drafted this privately in his office, did he?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 130 Q. And you will see that the first paragraph there is in 9 the first person: "Can I just --"
- 10 A. Mr. Marrinan, if I may just go back -- 10:43
- 11 131 Q. Yes, of course.
- 12 A. -- because I am anxious to address what the Chairman
 13 has asked about the conversation that we had.
- 14 132 Q. Of course, yes.
- 15 A. The Commissioner expressed his view that this matter 10:43

 16 was inappropriate for him to address back to Mr. Kean.

 17 I was in agreement with that, for the reasons I have
- stated, given that Maurice McCabe was a member of the force, etcetera, etcetera. The Commissioner was still
- anxious to do something for Mr. Kean, and I do
- recollect him saying, because he was a great supporter of the guards and he was anxious to assist him in some
- way. Now, that is the conversation that we had around
- this. Most likely what happened after that was,
- because I don't remember exactly, but the Commissioner
- said he'd take some time to consider it and the next
- thing that he came up with was his handwritten notes on
- this.
- 29 133 Q. Chief superintendent, it would appear that the

1			Commissioner was deceiving you at the time, if that is	
2			the conversation that you had, wouldn't it?	
3		Α.	It would appear that I certainly didn't have all the	
4			information.	
5	134	Q.	Well, that he was deceiving you and quite deliberately	10:44
6			deceiving you, because it wasn't a matter of Mr. Kean	
7			being in some way or expressing views, positive views	
8			about the Gardaí; it was the fact that Mr. Callinan had	
9			assisted Mr. Kean during the course of a conversation	
10			he had with him on Saturday the 25th January, we know	10:44
11			that to be so?	
12		Α.	We know now, yes. I know that now, yes.	
13	135	Q.	So if Mr. Callinan was offering you a reason as to why	
14			he should respond to what was agreed to be an	
15			inappropriate letter and he was saying he was doing it	10:45
16			because Mr. Kean was in some way well-disposed to the	
17			Gardaí, he was in fact deceiving you, isn't that right?	
18		Α.	Deception is very strong word. He certainly wasn't	
19			giving me all the information. I can't really speak to	
20			his state of mind, but I think deception is probably a	10:45
21			strong word.	
22	136	Q.	The letter starts off in the first person:	
23				
24			"Can I just first of all say that I am invited on	
25			several radio and television programmes to discuss many	10:45
26			topical issues where I voice my opinions as I am	
27			entitled to do and I hope I always act fairly to	
28			everyone."	

1 Looking back on this and looking at the content of this 2 draft and the whole circumstances that we are dealing 3 with here, do you regret dealing with it in the way that you did deal with it? 4 5 Certainly if I had the information then that I have Α. 10:46 now, I would have dealt with it differently. 6 7 And do you think in any sense that the fact that this 137 Q. 8 was done at all perhaps reflects on the view that the Commissioner Callinan had towards Sergeant McCabe at 9 the time and was influenced by that? 10 10.47 11 Α. That calls for an opinion which is -- I don't think my 12 opinion is --13 Well, you are very close --138 Q. 14 Α. -- relevant. 15 139 well, it is, and you are very close to what was going Q. 10:47 16 on at the time. So what -- I'm sorry, what you are asking me then is? 17 Α. 18 140 Do you think the fact that Commissioner Callinan Q. 19 drafted this inappropriate response for Mr. Kean was 20 influenced by his attitude towards Sergeant McCabe at 10:47 the time? 21 22 At the time he drafted the response I believed that Α. 23 this was an attempt to get over an administrative 24 impasse, so to speak. 25 All right. And the administrative impasse, it could 141 Q. 10 · 47 26 have been dealt with by just simply writing back to 27 Mr. Kean, pointing out that his letter was inappropriate, isn't that right? 28 29 It could have, yes. Α.

- 1 142 Q. It could have been dealt with by writing back to
 2 Mr. Kean and referring him to the Garda press officer?
- 3 A. That's correct, yes.
- 4 143 Q. It could have been dealt by writing back to Mr. Kean
 5 and referring him to the evidence that had been given 10:48
 6 by the former Commissioner to the Public Accounts
- 7 Committee?

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 8 A. That's correct, yes.
- But I am wondering about the use of the 9 10 words impasse. Why is it an impasse? I mean, it's 10 · 48 11 perfectly clear what one ought to do: This is nothing 12 to do with me, send this particular individual who 13 clearly is not fully is touch with reason for writing 14 to me about this thing, to Superintendent Taylor or 15 somebody in the Press Office and palm him off with a 10:48 16 few statistics and get him off my back, isn't that the 17 response you'd actually have expected?
 - A. Yes, Chairman, the difficulty was, as I say, I didn't have the full information, I didn't know there had been other telephone calls. The impasse as I referred to, as I referred to it, stems from the fact that the Commissioner realised, and I advised, that it was inappropriate to respond to it. Notwithstanding that, the Commissioner was anxious to do something to assist Mr. Kean because of the fact, as he put it, that he was very -- he was very good to the guards or was a great supporter of An Garda Síochána and he was anxious to assist him.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: I still don't -- I still don't see that.

- 1 You can be a great supporter of the Dublin Gaelic
- football team and not drafting responses on their
- 3 behalf to any libel actions that might be taken against
- 4 individual members of them.
- 5 A. I appreciate that, Chairman, but that was the decision

10:50

- 6 that was made at the time based on the facts as --
- 7 well, I knew them at that particular time.
- 8 CHAIRMAN: But you must have thought the Commissioner
- 9 had lost all touch with reality?
- 10 A. Certainly in hindsight, Chairman, if I was aware of the 10:49
- other telephone calls that had taken place, I would
- have looked at this completely differently, but based
- on the information that I had and what I was told at
- that particular time, I agreed that this was a good way
- of dealing with what we saw as an impasse, that we'd
- try and assist him in some way. We did discuss the
- 17 content of what was going back to Mr. Kean.
- 18 CHAIRMAN: Right. We have got to that point,
- 19 Mr. Marrinan. Excuse my interruption.
- 20 144 Q. MR. MARRINAN: But in any event, the handwritten letter 10:50
- at page 1895, and then that was given to you, is that
- right, and you typed up a note, you typed that up.
- 23 It's at page 1896.
- 24 A. That's correct, yes.
- 25 145 Q. And there are four paragraphs on that, and I think that 10:50
- you had indicated to the Commissioner that you knew
- 27 Mr. Kean personally, is that so?
- 28 A. That's correct.
- 29 146 Q. And it was decided that no written response or formal

- 1 response would be made, is that right?
- 2 A. I'm not quite sure was that ever decided as such, that
- there would be no written response, but it was
- 4 certainly decided that I would go and see him, see
- 5 Mr. Kean.
- 6 147 Q. Well, what was the purpose of that?
- 7 A. The purpose of that was to assist him arising from the

10:51

10:52

10:52

- 8 Commissioner's concerns.
- 9 148 Q. What concerns?
- 10 A. His concerns that he was anxious to assist him in some
- 11 way because he was a supporter of An Garda Síochána.
- 12 149 Q. But you just -- you write a letter, all right, in
- response, that's the first option, isn't that right?
- 14 A. Yeah, I am merely trying to say that I have no
- recollection of the Commissioner saying do not write to 10:51
- him or me saying we will not write to him.
- 17 150 Q. The normal response that one would expect is that you
- write a letter in response to a letter, isn't that
- 19 right?
- 20 A. That would be the normal response, yes.
- 21 151 Q. If not, you pick up the phone and you make a phone
- call, isn't that right?
- 23 A. That's right.
- 24 152 Q. What is the purpose of setting up a meeting for a
- face-to-face with Mr. Kean? What is the reason for
- 26 that in this instance?
- A. Well, from my point of view, it was to convey the
- 28 Commissioner's thoughts and response to the letter.
- 29 153 Q. Why couldn't that be done on the phone?

- 1 A. There is no reason it couldn't be done on the phone.
- 2 154 Q. So in any event, you make an arrangement to go to
- 3 Mr. Kean. What date was it that you went in February
- 4 to --
- 5 A. I believe it was the 12th February.
- 6 155 Q. 12th. And I think that the investigators went through

10:53

10:53

- 7 some telephone records that we had, but they merely
- 8 indicate that you phoned the Commissioner first thing
- 9 in the morning and then phoned Mr. Kean I think, and
- then later on went down to Mr. Kean's office, isn't
- 11 that so?
- 12 A. That's correct, yes.
- 13 156 Q. And that you saw Mr. Kean for about half an hour, is
- that right?
- 15 A. Yeah, I would have thought it was less than half an
- hour.
- 17 157 Q. Right. And you had this typed note with you, is that
- 18 right?
- 19 A. That's correct.
- 20 158 Q. And we know that that typed note, that the four
- 21 paragraphs made it -- made their way into Mr. Kean's
- response to Sergeant McCabe, isn't that right?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- 24 159 Q. And that response is at 1898. And we know that the
- second paragraph there "I would like to say that I am $_{10:54}$
- invited on several radio and TV programmes..." that
- that is almost verbatim from the note and paragraph one
- of note, isn't that right?
- 29 A. That's correct, yes.

160 Q. And then if one turns over the page at page 2, the 1 2 subject of the fixed charge penalty system on the show 3 that day, that corresponds with paragraph 2 of Commissioner Callinan's note, isn't that right? 4 5 That's correct, yes. Α. 10:54 6 161 Q. Again, the next paragraph, it was also the case of 7 course that the Data Protection Commissioner's views --8 that is verbatim, paragraph 3 of Commissioner Callinan's note, isn't that right? 9 That's correct. 10 Α. 10:54 11 162 And then the next paragraph: Q. 12 13 "I have no doubt that GSOC investigation will fully examine all of these matters." 14 15 10:54 16 That is paragraph 4 of the note, isn't that right? 17 Yes, that's correct. Α. 18 163 And can you just tell us how it is that that is so? Q. 19 Because I brought it to Mr. Kean and discussed it with Α. 20 I think the investigators asked me whether I left 10:55 him a copy, I don't recall leaving him a copy. 21 I think 22 it's quite obvious that I did because he has them I don't believe I brought the handwritten 23 24 version. But I certainly brought the typed version. 25 As I say, I couldn't swear 100 percent that I left a 10:55 26 copy of it, but I would say quite possibly I did. 27 164 Q. well, regardless, somehow or another the Commissioner's draft made its way into the actual letter that was sent 28 29 by Mr. Kean?

- 1 A. That's correct, yes, I accept that.
- 2 165 Q. And you then left and returned to the Commissioner.
- 3 Did you update him then as to what had happened?
- 4 CHAIRMAN: Just before we get to that point,
- 5 Mr. Marrinan, I think Mr. Kean said that one of the

10:57

- 6 possibilities was that he had actually dictated the
- 7 letter in front of the superintendent, and I don't
- 8 know, he wasn't particularly definite about that.
- 9 166 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Was there any possibility?
- 10 A. I don't believe so. If he was -- I can't remember him
- dictating it. I think I would remember that so I would
- say, no, that didn't happen.
- 13 167 Q. You see, one way of looking at this, and looking at it
- 14 at the bigger picture in relation to this, and forgive
- me for putting this so bluntly as I am going to put it; 10:56
- I mean, one view of this is that this was something
- that was very obviously inappropriate, there should
- 18 never have been any assistance offered to Mr. Kean,
- that the only reason that assistance was offered to
- Mr. Kean was because Commissioner Callinan took the
- view that Mr. Kean was in conflict with Sergeant
- McCabe, right, and that he didn't want to side with
- 23 Sergeant McCabe but he'd side with Mr. Kean to put down
- 24 Sergeant McCabe, do you understand?
- 25 A. I understand. I don't necessarily agree but I
- 26 understand.
- 27 168 Q. Yeah. Well, I am just putting the bigger picture to
- 28 you.
- 29 A. Yeah.

- That he didn't want to do this publicly or where there would be a record of his interaction with Mr. Kean, so that he sent you down with the note to either give to Mr. Kean or read out to Mr. Kean, which would be part of his response to Sergeant McCabe, and that you'd
- return from your mission and there would be no record kept of that in the Commissioner's office?

10:58

10:58

10:59

- 8 A. I disagree with that.
- 9 170 Q. Yes. That's perhaps an extreme view of what may have occurred. But then there has to be some other explanation if that is not correct, do you understand?
- 12 A. I do.
- 13 Because we have a series of factors that would tend to 171 Q. 14 suggest that this was being done unofficially, all 15 right, and that this wasn't an official response, and 16 therefore, Commissioner Callinan's time that was occupied drafting this letter, the time that it took to 17 18 discuss these matters with you and for you to be 19 dispatched off to Mr. Kean's office, was utilised for a 20 particular reason, all right, and it wasn't just the reason to keep Mr. Kean happy. Can you help us in any 21 22 way at all in relation to your view, looking back at 23 this in hindsight and with the benefit of hindsight, as 24 to what was actually going on?
- A. Certainly. With the benefit of hindsight, as I say, I would have done things differently knowing what I know now. After I delivered or read these to Mr. Kean, I returned and the investigators tell me there was a phone call between -- from my number then to the

Commissioner's -- to the Commissioner, so I am
assuming -- I don't recall it but I am assuming I would
have rung him and told him I have been down with

Mr. Kean, I have given him the details, that is where
we are currently at. In relation to this being a
clandestine activity, certainly I can see why it would
be seen that that is what we were trying to do.

8 172 Q. Yes.

9 I think the mere fact -- or the very fact that the Α. letters are here before the Tribunal shows there was no 11:00 10 11 attempt by me to hide these letters in any way, shape 12 or form. After I rang the Commissioner on that day my 13 next port of call would be to put this matter through 14 the system because it hadn't been correspondence 15 registered, corr reged as recall it. So my next action 11:00 16 after the meeting with Gerald Kean would have been to 17 return the file into the typing pool, get it to be 18 assigned a number. The number it should have been 19 assigned and the file it should have been on is the 20 three-and-a-half thousand page filed that I have 11:00 previously referred to on Sergeant McCabe. And if I 21 22 may just take this opportunity as far as disclosure in 23 response to the Chairman's letter is concerned, once I 24 got that letter, I immediately went to the Commissioner's office and retrieved Sergeant McCabe's 25 11:00 file on which all correspondence that I dealt with in 26 27 relation to Sergeant McCabe I would have normally said was definitely filed. On this case I would say this 28 29 letter wasn't on it for some reason, I don't really

know why. So, therefore, that is why it wasn't 1 2 discovered when the Chairman originally wrote looking for discovery. I would have assumed everything on the 3 file was discovered. This obviously wasn't on the 4 5 file, but it was on a file, it has been discovered. Now, I would accept I didn't discover it because I had 6 7 no recollection of it. My diary entry for the 12th 8 February 2004 [sic] reads: 9

11:01

11:01

11:02

11 . 02

"Gerald Kean meeting at 11:30am."

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α.

10

12 That is the only note I have of it.

Does it say it's in relation to Sergeant McCabe? 13 173 Ο.

> No, it doesn't. And if I could point out also that the correspondence register system it would normally -- if a case -- if a letter came in with a heading on the letter, heading, shall we say, the 'DPP v. Frank walsh', if that was the heading on the letter, the file would be put on the correspondence register and the file description would be the 'DPP v. Frank Walsh', followed by the number that was assigned to it. I just note from Mr. Kean's letter that there is no heading on the letter. It may be an explanation, I cannot say, but it may be an explanation as to why it got filed on a different file, and I don't know where it was filed, to be quite honest, but it was filed. So there was no attempt, either to escape discovery on the matter or to hide the file some place. And I may not have answered all of the original question, I'm sorry, I took the

- opportunity to try and explain.
- 2 174 Q. Yes. No, that is fair enough. You have to be given
- 3 every opportunity. Thank you very much.
- 4 A. Thank you.

5

6 MR. McDOWELL: No questions, Chairman.

7

- 8 THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL
- 9 <u>O'HIGGINS:</u>
- 10 175 Q. MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Good morning, superintendent.

11 · 03

11:03

11 · 03

- 11 My name is Michael O'Higgins.
- 12 A. Morning.
- 13 176 Q. I am counsel for Superintendent Taylor and I have a few
- 14 questions for you, I hope not to be very long.
- 15 A. Thank you.
- 16 177 Q. You knew Commissioner Callinan and at the time Deputy
- 17 Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan professionally, isn't
- that right?
- 19 A. That's correct, yes.
- 20 178 Q. You didn't know my client but you observed him going in 11:03
- and out of the Commissioner's office?
- 22 A. That's correct, yes. I would know him on a hello
- basis, on a first name basis, yes.
- 24 179 Q. It seems, and correct me if I am wrong, that you had an
- ongoing contact with Sergeant McCabe over a period?
- 26 A. That's correct, Chairman, yes.
- 27 180 Q. And just, the context for that is, I think in your
- 28 statement when you said there were rumours going around
- you said you didn't want to be party to it because you

1 had contact with him and you didn't want that contact 2 sullied by reference to that? 3 That's correct, Chairman, yes. Α. when you made your statement to the Tribunal, did you 4 181 Ο. 5 consult your diaries to see what contact you had had 11:04 6 with Sergeant McCabe? 7 Yes, I did, yes. Α. 8 182 And would that also have included your personal diary? Q. 9 Yes. Α. And can I ask you, am I correct in my view that in your 11:04 10 183 Q. 11 original statement to the Tribunal, you didn't mention 12 this matter? 13 The Gerald Kean matter? Α. 14 184 Q. Yes. 15 That's correct, yes. Α. 11:04 16 And would the diary entry not have alerted you to an 185 Ο. 17 event? What was the actual entry, can you recollect? 18 The entry just says "Gerald Kean meeting at 11:30 on 19 12th February 2014". And when you were going through your diary would that 20 186 Q. 11:04 21 not have alerted you to a Sergeant McCabe moment, for a 22 want of a better description? 23 It possibly would have if I had Sergeant McCabe's name Α. 24 If I could point out, I reviewed I think maybe

remarkable, and --

six diaries, and I have one of them before me, and I

appropriate and that needed to be discovered. This is

have it marked with the various entries that were

one of six, as I say. This entry, to me, wasn't

11:05

25

26

27

28

29

Т	18/	Q.	I do appreciate it was Mr. Kean as opposed to sergeant	
2			McCabe, but given that this was your only contact with	
3			Mr. Kean and must be, I would assume you would accept	
4			my categorisation of it as an unusual contact, would	
5			that not have brought immediately to mind Sergeant	11:05
6			McCabe?	
7		Α.	It should have, but I obviously completely missed it.	
8			It's not marked in any shape or form on the diary.	
9			Everything else is tabbed, it's not marked	
10			unfortunately.	11:06
11	188	Q.	All right. You have said a couple of times in answer	
12			to questions that if you had known then what you know	
13			now, you would have dealt with it differently, and you	
14			have expressly made reference to some telephone calls	
15			of which you were unaware, but for my assistance, would	11:06
16			you set out what it is that you know now that had you	
17			known then would have coloured your approach?	
18		Α.	well, I understand from testimony that has been given	
19			that Commissioner Callinan was in contact with Gerald	
20			Kean prior to his appearance on the RTÉ programme and	11:06
21			that he gave him, or allegedly gave him certain	
22			information that Mr. Kean used during the course of	
23			that programme.	
24	189	Q.	Now, I infer from your answer, therefore, that in your	
25			discussions with Commissioner Callinan and in your	11:07
26			discussions with Mr. Kean, the Marian Finucane	
27			programme didn't get referenced?	
28		Α.	I would imagine it did. I wasn't aware of the Marian	
29			Finucane programme.	

190 Q. Sorry, maybe I put the question a bit more tight: That 1 2 Marian Finucane wasn't referenced and/or, and more 3 pertinently, Commissioner Callinan's reference to Marian Finucane was not referenced to you either by the 4 5 Commissioner Callinan or by Mr. Kean? 11:07 6 Sorry, are we talking about when the letter came in and Α. 7 my discussion --8 191 Yes, we are talking about the morning you spoke to the Q. 9 Commissioner and the time you spent in Mr. Kean's office --10 11:07 11 Yes. Α. 12 192 -- neither Commissioner Callinan said to you words or 0. 13 words effect, I was aware Mr. Kean was going on the 14 programme and I gave him a steer, and Mr. Kean didn't 15 say, look, I have said these things on the radio, I'm 11:08 16 vulnerable now and I want to know can the Commissioner 17 supply me with the evidence to back up what he said, 18 neither of those conversations took place? 19 No, they did not. Α. 20 Could I just ask you to look at Mr. Kean's letter. 193 Q. 11:08 think it's at page 1878. 21 22 Yes. Α. 23 Now, if, to take a slightly different hypothesis, let 194 Q. 24 us suppose there had been no contact between Commissioner Callinan and Mr. Kean prior to the 25 11:08 26 programme and this letter arrived in, it wouldn't --27 you wouldn't have been having the discussion you were having, isn't that so? 28

That's correct, yes.

29

Α.

commences "Dear Martin", isn't that right?

A. Yes.

Under Martin", isn't that right?

A. Yes.

Ves.

A. Yes.

A. Yes.

A. Yes.

A. Yes.

A. Yes.

And the letter is written to the Commissioner but

11:09

11:09

11:10

7

1

195

Q.

8 "I need to be factually correct and any assistance 9 would certainly be appreciated."

- Did it occur to you that a letter written in that
 manner might be predicated on a conversation preceding
 it?
- 14 A. It didn't occur to me, no.
- 15 198 Q. It didn't occur to you. Now, the letter wasn't recorded in the post register?
- 17 A. It seems not, no.
- 18 199 Q. And to be clear --
- 19 A. It certainly wasn't on the day it came in. No, it
 20 wasn't.
- 21 200 Q. And to be clear, your statement deals with this in some detail. That wasn't, because it was marked private or
- confidential, isn't that right?
- A. Well, originally it was because it was marked private and confidential.
- 26 201 Q. But that wouldn't explain its exclusion from the post register?
- 28 A. No, it wouldn't, no.
- 29 202 Q. Because there is a method to deal with that?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 203 Q. And when you arrived in the office, Commissioner
- 3 Callinan already had the four paragraphs drafted?
- 4 A. When I arrive -- no, I gave the Commissioner the
- 5 letter, he opened it, we had a quick discussion around

11:10

11:11

11:11

11 · 11

- 6 the appropriateness or otherwise of responding to it.
- 7 Most likely the Commissioner said leave it with me, I
- 8 will have a think about it.
- 9 204 Q. All right.
- 10 A. He subsequently produced the four paragraphs.
- 11 205 Q. And just to be clear about this, the Commissioner
- didn't say words or words effect, oh great, I spoke to
- Mr. Kean on this, giving a bit of background and now I
- am dragged into the middle of this row, he never said
- 15 anything to that effect?
- 16 A. I have no recollection of that.
- 17 206 Q. Well, I mean, no recollection might allow for the
- 18 possibility of such a discussion taking place but not
- remembering it, versus no such discussion took place,
- can you tell us where you are on those?
- 21 A. I would say no such discussion took place. Because, as
- I say, I wasn't aware of any prior phone calls or
- anything like that, so I still wasn't aware until I met
- 24 with the investigators that there had been prior phone
- calls -- prior phone calls. So I would say, in all I
- 26 would say that, no, that conversation that did not take
- 27 place.
- 28 207 Q. And Mr. Kean said in his statement to the Tribunal that
- once the threat of proceedings had been made he wanted

1 the Commissioner to provide the evidence to him in 2 respect of that which he had said to him a couple of 3 days previously, and he emphasised that many, many times in his evidence here before the Tribunal. but vou 4 5 seem confident he never mentioned that he had had prior 11:12 6 communication with the Commissioner before going on the 7 programme? 8 That the Commissioner never mentioned it to me? Α. No. Mr. Kean. Mr. Kean in his statement to the 9 208 Q. Tribunal said, look, I wrote to the Commissioner 10 11:12 11 because I wanted him to produce evidence of what he told me. 12 13 Okay. Α. And he mentioned this many, many times in giving 14 209 Q. 15 evidence, but he never mentioned it to you that he had 11:12 16 had prior communication and that the Commissioner had 17 provided him with information? 18 Mr. Kean never mentioned, no, he didn't. Α. 19 210 He didn't. okay. Now, you volunteered to talk to Q. 20 Mr. Kean. Was that before or after the Commissioner 11:12 had an opportunity to think, when he said leave it with 21 22 me for a while, when did the suggestion spring that 23 someone would talk to him; was it at that point or 24 later, or can you remember? 25 I think it was probably -- most likely at that point in 11:13 Α. time, because the Commissioner was in a quandary as to 26 27 how he would deal with it. And I suppose in an effort to assist I told him that I knew Mr. Kean, that he had 28 29 acted for me previously, and that I had known him for

- 1 some years.
- 2 211 Q. There is from my recollection, I hope this is correct,
- 3 some indication that there was contact between the
- 4 Commissioner's office and Mr. Kean before you went to
- 5 Mr. Kean's office, did the Commissioner tell you about
- 6 that, no?
- 7 A. There was contact that morning, it would seem from the
- telephone records.
- 9 212 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. That was obviously me ringing Gerald Kean to set up the 11:13
- 11 meeting.
- 12 213 Q. Right.
- 13 A. That was from my telephone extension to Mr. Kean's
- 14 mobile telephone number, as far as I can recall.
- 15 214 Q. Now, you make reference to the four paragraphs and you
- describe them as notes, isn't that right?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 215 Q. And I wonder if we could just put those up on screen
- for a moment, please, the typed version is easier to
- read. 1896. Now, I don't want to be unnecessarily

11 · 14

- 21 pedantic about this, but, first of all, I would
- respectfully suggest to you, they are not notes; notes
- are notes that are made of relevant points, but why I'm
- suggesting to you these are not notes is that this is
- actually the voice of Mr. Kean speaking in the first
- person and written in a manner in which it's both
- 27 anticipated and calculated will appear in Mr. Kean's
- responding letter to Sergeant McCabe, do you follow me?
- 29 A. I follow you, yes.

- 1 216 Q. In other words, it's not a coincidence that this format
- 2 appeared in the letter, but rather, from its very
- 3 creation that was its only purpose, do you follow me?
- 4 A. I follow you.
- 5 217 Q. And when this was presented to you, it must, I suggest
- to you, have been presented to you in terms that the
- 7 Commissioner was saying, this is what I think he should

11:16

11:16

- put in his letter, isn't that right?
- 9 A. That's correct, yes.
- 10 218 Q. Yes. What was your response to that?
- 11 A. I don't believe I had a response to the fact that it
- 12 was being written in the first person --
- 13 219 Q. Okay. What impression did you form as a result of that
- request?
- 15 A. My main concern at that point in time was that no
- information was being provided to Mr. Kean that wasn't
- 17 already in the public domain.
- 18 220 Q. Well, I wonder could that assuage any of your concerns?
- 19 I mean, the issue isn't whether the information is
- private. The information -- the crux, it seems to me,
- is, if it is a crux, that the Commissioner is assisting
- a solicitor to respond in a piece of litigation, and
- the assistance is being provided in a way that it is
- the thoughts of the solicitor, when in fact it's his
- own thoughts; do you see the distinction?
- 26 A. I see the distinction, yes.
- 27 221 Q. And mindful of the questions that were asked earlier,
- that this was in effect a private dispute between
- citizens, how unusual do you think it is that the

- Commissioner was writing in the first person material that would go into that letter which was unattributed
- 3 to him and untraceable to him?
- A. I don't agree that it was untraceable to him. The
 Commissioner's handwritten notes and the letter and my

11:17

11:17

11:18

11 · 18

- 6 typed version of -- we disagreed that they are notes,
- 7 the handwritten note is how I described it, but they
- 8 were all in the Commissioner's office on a file,
- 9 perhaps not on the correct file but on a file in the
- 10 Commissioner's office. There was no attempt to hide
- those.
- 12 222 Q. When I say unseen or untraced or unattributable I am
- saying that the person sending the letter makes no
- reference to the Commissioner; the person receiving the
- 15 letter is unaware of the Commissioner's contribution,
- that is what I mean by that.
- 17 A. Okay.

Α.

19

- 18 223 Q. I mean, do you think it's an acceptable thing to do?
- are asking me, my concern with this letter was not
- 21 whether it was written in the first or third person; my

I think -- to try and answer the question, I think you

- concern with the letter was that it was correct and
- already in the public domain, that we weren't in breach
- of any data protection issues or anything like that by
- 25 providing it. They were the concerns I had. To be
- honest, I didn't give it any thought as to whether it
- was in the first person or not.
- 28 224 Q. Both yourself and the Commissioner, it appeared,
- readily formed the view it wouldn't be appropriate to

- overtly engage in the matter, isn't that right? 1 2 We formed -- well, my view was that it wouldn't be Α. 3 appropriate to engage at all. 4 Yes. Well, does it follow then that this was not an 225 Ο. 5 appropriate engagement if you are saying you didn't 11:18 6 think it was appropriate to engage at all, does it 7 follow you don't think this is an appropriate 8 engagement? Well, having discussed the matter with the 9 Α. Commissioner, he was anxious to assist Mr. Kean 10 11 · 19 11 because, as I said, of the quote, Mr. Kean is a good 12 friend or is very friendly towards the guards and he 13 was anxious to assist him. That is where I was coming 14 from in delivering the --15 226 You see, if it were the case that it would not have Q. 11:19 16 been appropriate to engage overtly, I would suggest to 17 you that the case for engaging covertly is even less 18 plausible? 19 It was certainly never meant to be a covert engagement. Α. Well, how was it supposed to be anything different when 11:19 20 227 Q.
- the Commissioner was writing in the first person to the solicitor in a fashion that was never going to be
- visible, how could it be anything other than covert, with respect?
- A. With respect, the fact that the file is before us today 11:19
 will show that it was never meant to be a covert visit.
- 27 Had the file been properly recorded on Sergeant
- 28 McCabe's file, it would have been discovered earlier
- and I would have had the opportunity address this at an

Т			earlier stage.	
2	228	Q.	Could I ask that page, sorry, page 26 of your	
3			statement, and I will give the proper number for that	
4			just in one moment, page 1857, please.	
5		Α.	Yes.	11:20
6	229	Q.	If I could ask you to go that you were dealing at	
7			line 387, as you describe, with a little bit of an	
8			impasse, isn't that right?	
9		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
LO	230	Q.	And you go on to say:	11:20
L1				
L2			"We were both agreed it wasn't prudent for us to write	
L3			back to Mr. Kean given it was a legal adviser seeking	
L4			advice from the Commissioner."	
L5				11:21
L6			Isn't that right?	
L7		Α.	That's correct.	
L8	231	Q.	"In relation to a matter which could end up being in	
L9			court." Isn't that right?	
20		Α.	Yes.	11:21
21	232	Q.	"Especially in the light of the fact that the subject	
22			of the letter was a serving member of An Garda	
23			Síochána."	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	233	Q.	So am I correct in interpreting that, that if there had	11:21
26			been an official response the Commissioner would have	
27			been the subject of both scrutiny and in all	
28			probability or certainty criticism for adopting that	
g			course?	

1		Α.	I think that the thought process was more just on the	
2			appropriateness. I don't think I certainly didn't	
3			give any thought to what might happen with any such	
4			letter later on in proceedings.	
5	234	Q.	The question of getting any advice from the head of	11:21
6			internal legal affairs did not arise, is that right?	
7		Α.	Did not arise, no.	
8	235	Q.	Is that a surprise?	
9		Α.	Usually, I suppose, letters from legal representatives	
10			would be referred to the head of legal services. On	11:22
11			this occasion the Commissioner was dealing with the	
12			matter, he had decided this was the way he was going to	
13			deal with the matter, so therefore it wasn't sent on	
14			that route.	
15	236	Q.	Well, in effect, is it your answer that the manner in	11:22
16			which the Commissioner was dealing with it by his	
17			conduct, indicated he had considered the option of	
18			legal affairs and was not going to resort to it or did	
19			he actually apply his mind to it?	
20		Α.	I couldn't say. And I don't recall applying my own	11:22
21			mind to that particular avenue, and I don't recall it	
22			being discussed, no.	
23	237	Q.	Could I just ask you to go to the next page, I am	
24			almost finished now, at line 403. I just want to read	
25			through a few lines:	11:23
26				
27			"I have no recollection of saying to Gerald Kean that	
28			the notes were being provided to him 'off the record'.	

29

I think the fact that I was going to meet ${\tt Mr.}$ Kean and

1			the fact we were not committing the notes to formal	
2			correspondence then that could be considered as being	
3			off the record."	
4				
5			You see that?	11:23
6		Α.	I do.	
7	238	Q.	Is that your do you think the same as you're sitting	
8			here now as when you put that in your statement?	
9		Α.	Yeah. Well, it was an answer to a specific question	
10			from the investigators as regards whether the matter	11:23
11			was on or off the record, so I was trying to explain my	
12			thought process on it at the time.	
13	239	Q.	And you did view it as being off the record?	
14		Α.	I am sorry, say again.	
15	240	Q.	You did view it as being off the record?	11:23
16		Α.	Em, yeah, it's off the record, yes.	
17	241	Q.	Now, the words off the record has perhaps different	
18			meanings and connotations to people, but in a general	
19			sense I would take an off the record exchange to be one	
20			that is confidential between the parties and will not	11:24
21			be disclosed to third parties unless there is some	
22			overriding obligation to do so, would that be a fair	
23			description?	
24		Α.	That would, yes.	
25	242	Q.	Why was it necessary to be dealing in that level of	11:24
26			subterfuge?	
27		Α.	Well, I would disagree with the subterfuge aspect of	
28			it, in the first instance, and if to refer back to	
29			the previous line on the statement that you quoted	

_			Troil, you will see that it also not only refers to	
2			Mr. Kean, it refers to a member of An Garda Síochána.	
3			My concern, and I believe the Commissioner's concern at	
4			the time, related not only to protecting Gerald Kean,	
5			it was also to protect a member of An Garda Síochána	11:24
6			who may be involved in litigation with the solicitor.	
7	243	Q.	Sorry?	
8		Α.	It's just important to point out that it wasn't this	
9			wasn't about protecting Gerald Kean. It was equally	
10			about protecting a member of An Garda Síochána for whom	11:25
11			the Commissioner had responsibility.	
12	244	Q.	So are you putting forward the proposition that the	
13			persons whom the Commissioner was seeking to protect	
14			was primarily Sergeant McCabe and perhaps indirectly	
15			Mr. Kean?	11:2
16		Α.	No, I would say both equally.	
17	245	Q.	Could I suggest to you that there was a third person	
18			who was being protected and whose interests were	
19			dwarfing the other two, which was Commissioner	
20			Callinan's own position?	11:25
21		Α.	You are suggesting it to me? Yeah, I can see why you	
22			would say that, yes.	
23	246	Q.	You can see why I would say that?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	247	Q.	You are a little bit hesitant at the description of	11:25
26			your dealings in this matter as being clandestine, but	
27			could I point to the straws in the wind, which I'd	
28			respectfully suggest do point up very strongly that it	
29			was clandestine. Firstly, the letter didn't make	

itself on to the post register; second, it never got filed on Sergeant McCabe's file; thirdly, there was no official response; fourth, the official response was drafted in a way to keep the Commissioner off the radar; five, it never got mentioned in initial 11:26 statements; and taking all of those together cumulatively, they point very strongly to the fact that when Mr. Kean said here in evidence the other day that it was clear to him that the Commissioner did not want a record of any contact with his office, that is what 11 · 26 was happening?

A. I see where you are coming from, but I would again suggest that there is another element to it and that is the fact that the letters and my typed notes and the Commissioner's handwritten notes are here before the Tribunal today.

CHAIRMAN: Sorry, superintendent, you appreciate to get to that, Commissioner never told us, you never told us, Mr. Kean never told us, and it took counsel rooting through tens of thousands of documents to actually find 11:27 this, and then lo and behold, when the investigators put it to people, everybody says oh, I am so grateful for you to draw this to my attention, now I remember it, despite the fact that this must be one of the most bizarre things you ever had to do in the course of your 11:27 duties.

11:27

A. I wouldn't say that, Chairman. I would point out,

Chairman, that in December of last year, I got an email

from an office in Headquarters and it was -- official

1 email is not the correct word, but it was a general 2 email to various people asking did anybody know about a file dealing with Gerald Kean, solicitor. The moment I 3 got that, I said, yeah, I dealt with Mr. Kean on this 4 5 matter. It was only then, that was the first 11:28 realisation that I had that this hasn't been discovered 6 7 and I immediately responded --8 I know, but unfortunately, you know, my job, unfortunately my job is unfortunately to sit in 9 judgment on people and to call things when the time 10 11 · 28 11 comes as they are obvious. And I have no idea as to 12 the veracity or otherwise of your testimony, I need to 13 listen to everything, but you are telling me that when the Garda Commissioner receives a letter from a 14 15 solicitor, which apparently has nothing to do with him, 11:28 16 and drafts a handwritten response, and you go out to 17 that solicitor and you actually give him a typed 18 version which you have typed up in the office in 19 relation to a matter which is between him and a member 20 of the Garda Siochana that that is something you 11:29 forget, you are telling me that? 21 22 Chairman, the only note I have of it other than the Α. 23 file is -- and I have it here before me, I brought the 24 original diary to show if you wish, it's already been discovered, there is a copy of it on the record, but it 11:29 25 just says "Gerald Kean meeting". When I went through 26 the diaries there was no reference in it to Sergeant 27 McCabe, therefore I didn't put -- I can't even recall 28

seeing it, to be quite honest.

29

Т	248 Q.	MR. MICHAEL O HIGGINS: My Ilhai question then is,	
2		chief superintendent, the purpose of the exercise was	
3		for Commissioner Callinan and An Garda Síochána to get	
4		his version of events out there in this dispute,	
5		without having to account for it publicly?	11:29
6	Α.	I can see why that would be why people would believe	
7		that.	
8		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Thank you very much.	
9		CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, you are representing	
10		Superintendent Taylor. Now, any information in	11:30
11		relation to Superintendent Taylor's involvement in the	
12		various telephone calls which led to the communication	
13		between Mr. Kean and the Garda Commissioner involving	
14		the Garda Press Office only came to light when I	
15		specifically asked the question have you any	11:30
16		instructions on that.	
17		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yeah.	
18		CHAIRMAN: I need to ask you again, have you any	
19		instructions relative to this and any knowledge that	
20		Superintendent Taylor had of this matter, however one	11:30
21		likes to characterise it, clandestine other otherwise,	
22		let's take it as a set of objective facts that the	
23		Garda Commissioner drafted a response to a solicitor's	
24		letter from Maurice McCabe threatening libel	
25		proceedings; do you have any instructions on that?	11:30
26		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: The answer to that, Chairman,	
27		is no, but I will double-check over lunchtime, but the	
28		answer is no.	
29		CHAIRMAN: Well, you could make a telephone call	

1	because this is very significant	
2	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: We will do it now, but the	
3	answer is no.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Given that he was involved in setting up the	
5	communication between Dr. Kean and Commissioner	11:30
6	Callinan, and given that it was only when the matter	
7	actually came to light through another party that he	
8	was involved in that, that this actual revelation was	
9	made or accepted by Superintendent Taylor, I'd actually	
LO	really like to know	11:31
L1	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: That will be done, Chairman.	
L2	CHAIRMAN: what he knew in relation to this matter	
L3	and given also that he was apparently very close to	
L4	Commissioner Callinan on everybody's account in Garda	
L5	Headquarters, in fact so close that nobody else knew,	11:31
L6	it seems, what they were talking about or anything to	
L7	do with their private discussions, what discussion he	
L8	had with him, if any, after this matter. So I had	
L9	would like to know that if you have a chance,	
20	Mr. O'Higgins.	11:31
21	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, you may take that as	
22	done now, that will be done immediately. I would just	
23	say there has been a lot of evidence suggesting a close	
24	working relationship but, for instance, immediately	
25	subsequent to the Public Accounts Committee senior	11:31
26	management withdrew to discuss the matter, my client	
27	was not party to that, and there are lots of things to	
28	which he was not party. But I hear what you are	
29	saying, Chairman, we will have a response quickly.	

Т			CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that, Mr. O'Higgins. So is	
2			there any questions on behalf of I think the Garda	
3			Commissioner? Mr. Lehane, you don't have any	
4			questions? Mr. O'Higgins, yes.	
5				11:32
6			THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL	
7			O'HIGGINS:	
8	249	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Superintendent, the letter was	
9			discovered as part of the Commissioner's office, the	
10			discovered made by the Commissioner's office?	11:32
11		Α.	Correct.	
12	250	Q.	Can I just, you may already have covered this but just	
13			so I am clear with precision as to the documents that	
14			are concerned, from your knowledge of matters can you	
15			offer any view as to whether the documents in question	11:32
16			that you made reference to, the notes, the letter and	
17			so on, as to where you feel they would have been put in	
18			circumstances where you accept they weren't registered	
19			on what has been termed the McCabe file, Sergeant	
20			McCabe's file?	11:33
21		Α.	Yes, Chairman, I can only assume, as I say, normally	
22			there will be a heading on a letter and it will be	
23			recorded under the heading. As I say, a note on	
24			Mr. Kean's that there is no heading. I would in the	
25			normal course of events it would be correspondence to	11:33
26			the Commissioner from Dr. Gerald Kean, of whatever	
27			date, would be put in, in lieu of there being no	
28			heading on the letter. I don't know where the letter	
29			was discovered, whether it was discovered on a file	

2			been discovered. My intention when I sent the letter	
3			and attachments back to be filed was that it would be	
4			put on the Sergeant McCabe file where every other piece	
5			of correspondence that I dealt with in relation to	11:34
6			Sergeant McCabe was kept.	
7	251	Q.	Right.	
8		Α.	Amounting to over three-and-a-half thousand pages.	
9	252	Q.	The fact that the letter was included as part of the	
10			Commissioner's office discovery, can you infer anything	11:34
11			from that in relation to where the documents, where it	
12			is likely the documents were kept?	
13		Α.	Well, they were kept in the Commissioner's office. But	
14			I can't I can't say where, I don't know at this	
15			point in time, I don't know which file they were on but	11:34
16			they were still in the Commissioner's office.	
17	253	Q.	And when you say documents plural, what documents are	
18			you talking about?	
19		Α.	I'm talking about the letter from Mr. Kean, the	
20			attachment of the letter from Sergeant McCabe, the	11:34
21			Commissioner's handwriting on the notes and my typed	
22			version of those four paragraphs.	
23	254	Q.	Yes. Thank you very much.	
24				
25			THE WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	11:34
26	255	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Just two matters arising. Detective	
27			superintendent, you say that you became aware of this	
28			in December last, is that right?	

entitled just what I've said, or where else it may have

1

29

A. December '17, that's correct.

- 1 256 Q. Did you make a statement to the Tribunal at that time?
- 2 A. I did -- well, I have a copy of the response that I
- made at the time. I don't know whether it came back to
- 4 the Tribunal, I'm sure it did.
- 5 257 Q. I'm not sure that it did. Could I have a look at that, 11:35
- 6 please?
- 7 A. Certainly. I'll just make sure it's the correct one.
- 8 [DOCUMENT HANDED TO MR. MARRINAN]
- 9 258 Q. I am not going to pursue that because there may have
- 10 been on face value some break down in communication
- 11 between the liaison team and the Tribunal, so I am not

11:37

- going to pursue that matter, all right, in fairness to
- 13 you, all right?
- A. But perhaps, if I could just say, I'm merely -- I
- merely refer to that to show that immediately when this 11:36
- 16 question arose, I immediately recognised that, yes,
- that was something I dealt with and within a couple of
- hours I had literally gone back and said, yes, I know
- about this.
- 20 259 Q. That indeed would appear to be the situation.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 260 Q. It's just that the Tribunal weren't advised of that
- development.
- 24 CHAIRMAN: So it took until the investigators went out
- 25 for you to get the opportunity to say that?
- 26 A. Oh, right, I am sorry, Chairman.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: And we weren't told.
- 28 261 Q. MR. MARRINAN: I am not going to visit any fault on you
- for that, all right, on the basis of the document that

1			you produced there.	
2		Α.	Thank you.	
3	262	Q.	The other matter that I wanted to ask you about was	
4			whether or not Commissioner Callinan had indicated to	
5			you that he was in direct contact himself on the 12th	11:37
6			February 2014 with Mr. Kean?	
7		Α.	No, he did not.	
8	263	Q.	You are aware of the fact that apparently there were	
9			two text messages sent by Commissioner Callinan from	
10			his mobile number to Mr. Kean's mobile number at 7:51	11:37
11			and 7:57am on the 12th February of 2014?	
12		Α.	I was so informed by the investigators, that is the	
13			first time I became aware of that.	
14	264	Q.	And it would appear that you were talking to	
15			Commissioner Callinan that morning on the phone prior	11:38
16			to going to see Mr. Kean, is that right?	
17		Α.	That's correct, yes. Again, that would have been	

to the investigators, it was more than likely my
telling the Commissioner that I was going to ring
Gerald Kean to make an appointment to see him.
Now, the final matter, detective superintendent, is
that in answer to Mr. O'Higgins you stated that you
believed that the Commissioner's concern at the time in

inferred from the telephone records and, as I suggested

11:39

- drafting the letter for Mr. Kean related not only to
 protecting Gerald Kean but it was also to protect a
 member of An Garda Síochána who may be involved in
- 28 litigation with a solicitor?

18

29 A. Yes, that was certainly my thought process, and I

- 1 believe it was his also.
- 2 266 Q. How could that be so?
- 3 A. Because our discussion centred around the fact that
- 4 this litigation could end up before the courts and
- 5 involved a solicitor whom the Commissioner described as 11:39
- 6 being a friend of An Garda Síochána or words to that
- 7 effect, and a member of An Garda Síochána. It wasn't
- 8 just left at one side of it; it was also and a member
- 9 of An Garda Síochána.
- 10 267 Q. How was that going to protect, in this instance we know 11:39
- it's Sergeant McCabe? How was the Commissioner
- drafting a response for Mr. Kean going to protect
- 13 Sergeant McCabe?
- 14 A. Well, it was the appropriateness of doing the response,

11 · 40

- 15 that is where the --
- 16 268 Q. I asked you how was that going to protect Sergeant
- 17 McCabe's interests?
- 18 A. Because the Commissioner didn't -- my opinion is that
- 19 the Commissioner didn't want to be seen to be assisting
- 20 Gerald Kean to protect himself against a lawsuit from a 11:40
- 21 member of An Garda Síochána, so he was concerned
- 22 that -- I believe he was concerned that Gerald Kean was
- being sued, but he was also concerned that it would be
- inappropriate for him to be advising Gerald Kean, given
- 25 that the person who might be taking that lawsuit was a
- 26 member of An Garda Síochána under his control. I am
- 27 not sure if that answers the question.
- 28 269 Q. I am not sure that I follow you. Are you suggesting
- that you believe that part of the Commissioner's reason

- for drafting this letter for Mr. Kean was in part to protect Sergeant McCabe?
- A. No, I don't think that is what I am suggesting -- it goes to the appropriateness of doing a response to the letter in the first instance.

- 6 270 Q. You are not suggesting, as your answer would appear to suggest, that the motivation of Commissioner Callinan was to protect in part Sergeant McCabe?
- Protect mightn't be the word to use, no. But his 9 Α. concern was twofold, and my concern was twofold: 10 That 11 the two parties involved, number one -- not necessarily 12 in that order, but Gerald Kean and Sergeant McCabe --13 Sergeant McCabe being a member of An Garda Síochána, it 14 was inappropriate for the Commissioner to be helping Gerald Kean to defend himself, equally it would have 15 11:41 16 been inappropriate for him to be helping Sergeant McCabe to take a case against Gerald Kean. So there is 17 18 protection involved there for both parties. I'm not 19 saying he was protecting him fully from --
- 20 271 Q. And obviously Mr. Kean was consulted in relation to that. Did anybody consult with Sergeant McCabe?
- 22 A. I didn't, no.
- 23 272 Q. Did the Commissioner advise Sergeant McCabe that he'd protected his interests by drafting this letter?
- A. Well, we had no correspondence -- from a personal point 11:42 of view, I had no correspondence from Sergeant McCabe on that particular issue.
- MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much.
- 29 A. Thank you.

1		CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, was there anything that you	
2		think might have arisen?	
3		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I beg your pardon, sorry? I	
4		have three matters to confirm by way of instructions.	
5		My client, David Taylor, had no knowledge of any	11:43
6		contact between the Commissioner and Mr. Kean prior to	
7		his appearing on the programme. Number two, my client	
8		had no knowledge that Mr. Kean sent a letter into the	
9		Commissioner's office. And number three, which follows	
10		by extension, he was unaware of any response to that	11:43
11		letter.	
12		CHAIRMAN: All right. That's fine. So there is no	
13		questions arising out of that. Thank you.	
14	Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
15			11:43

15

THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

16

MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, that concludes the evidence today, and no further witnesses are scheduled for this The hall here, St. George's Hall, is not 11:44 available to us next week due to other necessities, and it is intended to resume the sittings of the Tribunal and the taking of evidence -- and I should say that it is obviously intended to serve the remaining material today, if possible, on all relevant parties. I should say, of course, Chairman, that you will remember that a fortnight in advance of the conclusion of the O'Higgins module, you indicated that you would like to hear submissions from counsel for the Tribunal in relation

1 to the law relating to cross-examination as to credit 2 and the duty of the Tribunal in relation to disclosure, 3 and on day 61 I made submissions to you, on the 8th march, in relation to that issue here in public. We 4 5 didn't obviously address any of the factual issues on the O'Higgins module, but each of the parties had the 6 7 benefit of being circulated with those submissions and 8 hearing them in public, and most parties I think, if not all of them, agreed with the submissions as to the 9 duty of the Tribunal. I just say that in the context 10 11 of, I suppose, seeking to explain and excuse the volume of material that will be served on relevant parties. 12 13 And obviously the material to be served on parties with 14 full representation who have an interest in all of the matters, will receive all of the volumes and other 15 16 parties who don't have as extensive a right of 17 representation will not necessarily get all of the 18 volumes. They will get everything appropriate to their 19 interest and any reputational issues appropriate 20 thereto.

11:45

11 · 45

11:45

11:46

11 · 46

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

It is intended to resume sittings, commencing from the 30th April onwards, and to sit as continuously as possible thereafter until the conclusion of matters, followed by appropriate submissions at an appropriate stage. It might be perhaps just helpful to the parties to indicate the nature of the volumes and the number of the volumes that will be served.

29

Obviously some eight volumes have been served to date.	
It is intended to serve what will turn out to be 21	
volumes, that is 13 volumes more. And Volumes 9 and 10	
will deal principally with material relating to	
Superintendent Taylor; Volume 11 will deal with	11:47
statements from personnel, both civilian and Garda	
personnel in the Press Office and the spotlight records	
that have been examined by the FSNI; Volume 12 will	
deal with Superintendent Ferris's statements in	
relation to matters and relevant appendices; Volume 13	11:47
will deal with Superintendent Taylor's latest statement	
to the investigators and the appendices thereto, as	
well as the statement of Mrs. Michelle Taylor; Volumes	
14 and 15 will deal exclusively with journalists and	
material relating to publications and editors of	11:47
papers; Volume 16 will deal to a very large degree with	
a technical evidence emanating from the guards relating	
to devices, computers, systems, etcetera, insofar as	
they are relevant; Volume 17 will deal almost	
principally with material relating to reports and	11:48
statements from the Forensic Service of Northern	
Ireland concerning their examination of phones from	
Superintendent Taylor, ex-Commissioner Callinan,	
ex-Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan, laptops, Garda	
systems, etcetera; Volume 18 will be another volume	11:48
relating to journalists, and that will be followed by	
two succeeding volumes concerning material relating to	
RTÉ, which will be contained in volumes 19 and 20; and	
there will be then a miscellaneous, as it were, mop-up	

1	volume containing some material that's already been	
2	circulating already but unpaginated. So it's intended	
3	that these materials would be made available to the	
4	relevant parties as soon as possible, with a view to	
5	the continuation of the hearings.	: 49
6	CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness, thank you very much. I	
7	think it's very appropriate to record here that we have	
8	to adjourn now for a time. That is of course	
9	precipitated by the unavailability of the hall and it's	
10	really the only venue that is big enough to contain	: 49
11	what comes forward, but I want to express a word of	
12	gratitude to counsel and solicitor for the Tribunal and	
13	documentary counsel and our office manager,	
14	administrative staff and registrar, an absolutely vast	
15	amount of work is being done behind the scenes. It $_{11}$: 49
16	will be appreciated that in an ordinary civil case the	
17	duty of parties, for instance, to a commercial dispute	
18	is to find the documents that are relevant to	
19	themselves and make discovery to each other, but many	
20	parties are represented here and the duty of the	: 50
21	Tribunal is to get such documents as are available,	
22	gather them in, sort them out in relation to relevance,	
23	discard what is irrelevant, is not going to help	
24	anybody and there obviously I have a role, and then to	
25	pass them out to the parties. But it involves	: 50
26	extraordinary amounts of work. And in this regard, as	
27	I have mentioned before, counsel have not stinted in	
28	the sense that they have literally read through	
29	absolutely everything to find the significance of it	

and it would be very easy to say ah, there's 15 boxes over there in the corner, let's just take a sample out of each and see where that -- but that was not done. The, I suppose, the approach of someone who is working in the public service from the point of view of my own philosophy, is to do the job and to do more than the job because that's, it seems to me, what the privilege of working for the people of Ireland involves and that certainly has been done within the Tribunal team. So I want to say thank you. And the results of that are obvious, it seems to me, to everybody over the course of the last two weeks, even if they weren't obvious before.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

There is a second matter I might mention which is what Mr. McGuinness has said in relation to the whole issue of credit and credibility. Clearly we have had a long discussion about that and particular reference has been made to the O'Callaghan case, the case law has been analysed in detail by Mr. McGuinness and again those submissions are very helpful and no one has sought to disagree with them. So, certain things will be sent out and they will be redacted. There will be issues perhaps in relation to credit but they can't be raised, it seems to me, without first of all making an application to me; in other words, I am making the same ruling as Mr. Justice O'Higgins made in the course of the O'Higgins Commission: If people want to raise issues as to credit they can come to me and say, all

11:51

11:51

1 right, well what does this redacted piece mean, is it 2 anything to do with me, would you at all be influenced? 3 And ultimately that is the test. Because even in an ordinary case, the judge is entitled to rule that 4 5 cross-examination as to credit is limited by first of 11:52 6 all relevance to the issues and secondly, there has to 7 be a limit in terms of time and in terms of decorum and 8 a preliminary view has therefore been taken in terms of what is taken out and expressed in laconic terms, that 9 at the moment issues as to credit are not going to 10 11:52 11 assist the Tribunal, they will lead us down paths that But that is only 12 are unnecessary and become upsetting. 13 a preliminary view, and if people wish to make an 14 application, well then I ask you to cast your mind back to the Keith Harrison module where there was an 15 11:53 16 application in private in relation to a matter, I am not going to mention that, and that was done, and 17 18 eventually ruled out by me. I am not saying I would 19 take the same attitude, but if people want to raise 20 matters that are external to the facts which we are 11:53 dealing with, then they might kindly make an 21 22 application and just, if they wouldn't mind just flag that and we will deal with that, of course in public 23 24 because that is the ordinary and normal way of doing 25 it, but if there are strong reasons for going into 11:53 private session in relation to those matters, then of 26 27 course I will hear those submissions and make my decision accordingly. 28

29

1	So there it is. For two weeks, and we are back and
2	hopefully we will continue on. Mr. McGuinness, what is
3	your estimate for the time of arrival at the airport?
4	MR. McGUINNESS: If I had the trumpet I would sound it
5	now, Chairman, but it's difficult to predict. We
6	certainly hope that the major part of the evidence
7	would be concluded by the middle of June.
8	CHAIRMAN: Yes. And can I ask parties, I know people
9	say look, do I have time to make submissions, you can
10	certainly have 24 hours but I don't want to hang around 11:5
11	for a week while you make your minds up. If it's not
12	perfectly obvious to you at this point what case you
13	are making it's not going to become perfectly obvious
14	in consequence of a week of doing your garden and in
15	the meantime seriously considering your papers. So I 11:5
16	will allow a day, but that is it. And don't ask
17	counsel to ask me because I think they all know what a
18	grumpy and unreasonable person I am in relation to
19	getting on with things. All right. Thank you.
20	11:5
21	THE TRIBUNAL THEN ADJOURNED TO MONDAY, 30TH APRIL 2018
22	AT 10:00AM
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	

1	12:3, 65:6, 65:11	9	24:3, 24:10, 26:1,	appear [8] - 18:9,
	2014" [1] - 44:19		27:11, 54:14, 55:5	18:17, 31:29, 32:3,
	2016 [1] - 7:6		advise [6] - 14:1,	50:27, 64:20, 65:14,
'17 [1] - 63:29	2017 [2] - 1:6, 1:10	9 [1] - 70:3	18:1, 27:1, 28:7,	67:6
'81 [1] - 14:21	2018 [3] - 1:18, 6:2,		28:20, 67:23	appearance [4] -
' DPP [2] - 42:17,	74:21	A	advised [5] - 25:22,	16:2, 16:14, 23:22,
42:20	21 [2] - 2:30, 70:2		26:19, 27:23, 34:22,	45:20
'off [1] - 55:28	23rd [1] - 6:24		64:22	APPEARANCES[1] -
	24 [1] - 74:10	able [2] - 19:14, 20:7	adviser[1] - 54:13	2:1
1	25th [1] - 32:10	above-named [1] -	advising [3] - 25:9,	appearances [1] -
-		1:27	26:12, 66:24	16:15
	26 [1] - 54:2	absolutely [5] -	affairs [2] - 55:6,	appeared [2] - 51:2,
1 [1] - 3:7	26th [1] - 23:22	20:27, 23:15, 26:18,	55:18	52:28
10 [1] - 70:3		71:14, 71:29		
100 [2] - 30:12, 38:25	3	accept [6] - 18:19,	agitated [1] - 8:28	appearing [4] - 9:16,
10:00AM [1] - 74:22		18:25, 39:1, 42:6,	ago [1] - 15:18	10:13, 16:13, 68:7
11 [1] - 70:5	3 [1] - 38:8	45:3, 62:18	agree [4] - 30:12,	appendices [2] -
11:30 [1] - 44:18	3,500 [1] - 20:1	acceptable [1] -	39:25, 52:4	70:10, 70:12
11:30am [1] - 42:10	1	52:18	agreed [6] - 26:21,	application [4] -
12 [2] - 3:24, 70:8	30 [1] - 15:18	accepted [1] - 61:9	30:17, 32:14, 35:14,	72:26, 73:14, 73:16,
12th [6] - 37:5, 37:6,	30th [1] - 69:23	accompany [1] -	54:12, 69:9	73:22
42:7, 44:19, 65:5,	30TH [1] - 74:21	8:18	agreement [1] -	apply [1] - 55:19
42.7, 44.19, 65.5, 65:11	32 [1] - 2:12	according [2] -	31:17	applying [1] - 55:20
	37-42 [1] - 3:17	23:19, 23:20	ahead [1] - 22:4	appointment [1] -
13 [2] - 70:3, 70:10	387 [1] - 54:7	accordingly [1] -	aired [1] - 25:6	65:21
14 [1] - 70:14		73:28	airport [1] - 74:3	appointments [1] -
15 [2] - 70:14, 72:1	4		airwaves [1] - 25:6	19:3
16 [2] - 1:6, 70:16		account [2] - 60:5,	alerted [2] - 44:16,	appreciate [6] - 17:5,
17 [2] - 1:10, 70:19	4 00000	61:14	44:21	20:16, 35:5, 45:1,
17TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1	4 [3] - 3:3, 3:28,	Accounts [3] - 16:3,	ALISON [2] - 2:18,	58:17, 62:1
18 [2] - 3:13, 70:25	38:16	34:6, 61:25	3:12	appreciated [3] -
1832 [1] - 6:11	403 [1] - 55:24	accusing [1] - 29:14	allegations [1] - 12:8	23:7, 47:9, 71:16
1857 [1] - 54:4	43 [1] - 5:5	act [1] - 32:27	alleged [1] - 13:7	approach [3] - 45:17,
1878 [3] - 22:18,		ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9	•	47:4, 72:4
22:27, 46:21	5	acted [1] - 49:29	allegedly [1] - 45:21	appropriate [15] -
1879 [1] - 23:11		Acting [1] - 7:2	allow [2] - 48:17,	21:20, 25:9, 25:12,
1881 [1] - 23:11	F00/ 7:00	action [3] - 1:28,	74:16	44:27, 52:29, 53:3,
1895 [2] - 31:3, 35:21	50% [1] - 7:28	25:11, 41:15	almost [3] - 37:27,	53:5, 53:6, 53:7,
1896 [2] - 35:23,	51 [1] - 3:3	actions [1] - 35:3	55:24, 70:19	
50:20		activity [1] - 41:6	alternative [1] -	53:16, 69:18, 69:19, 69:25, 71:7
1898 [1] - 37:24	6	actual [3] - 38:28,	25:28	•
18th [1] - 7:6		44:17, 61:8	amount [1] - 71:15	appropriateness [4]
19 [1] - 70:28	6 [2] - 3:6, 5:4	address [10] - 9:17,	amounting [1] - 63:8	- 48:6, 55:2, 66:14,
1921 [1] - 1:10		9:19, 9:20, 10:3,	amounts [1] - 71:26	67:4
1921 [1] - 1.10 1981 [1] - 14:19	61 [1] - 69:3	10:14, 10:18, 31:12,	analysed [1] - 72:20	April [1] - 69:23
	62 [1] - 5:6	31:16, 53:29, 69:5	AND [3] - 1:4, 1:5,	APRIL [3] - 1:18, 6:1,
1986 [1] - 15:27	63 [1] - 5:7	addressed [1] -	1:9	74:21
	67 [1] - 1:18	10:17	annoyed [1] - 13:8	arise [2] - 55:6, 55:7
2	_	adjourn [1] - 71:8	answer [10] - 45:11,	arisen [1] - 68:2
	7	ADJOURNED [1] -	45:24, 52:19, 55:15,	arising [4] - 13:6,
2 [9] - 2:30, 3:18,		74:21	56:9, 60:26, 60:28,	36:7, 63:26, 68:13
3:21, 3:21, 3:25, 3:32,	7 [4] - 2:12, 3:11,	adjudication [1] -	61:3, 65:23, 67:6	arose [2] - 21:3,
4:3, 38:1, 38:3	3:14, 22:24	26:14	answered [1] - 42:28	64:16
20 [2] - 27:18, 70:28	7:00-7:30 [1] - 11:18		answers [1] - 66:27	ARRAN [3] - 2:12,
2004 [1] - 42:8	7:51 [1] - 65:10	administration [3] -	anticipated [1] -	3:10, 3:10
2004 [1] - 42.8 2006 [1] - 13:20	7:57 [1] - 65:10 7:57am [1] - 65:11	8:9, 21:9, 28:16	50:27	arrangement [1] -
1	1.37 am [1] - 03.11	administrative [5] -	anxious [10] - 9:19,	37:2
2012 [3] - 6:18, 6:20,	•	7:18, 8:2, 33:23,	11:14, 31:12, 31:20,	arrival [1] - 74:3
6:24	8	33:25, 71:14	31:22, 34:24, 34:27,	arrive [3] - 15:27,
2013 [3] - 8:27, 11:3,		adopting [1] - 54:28	36:10, 53:10, 53:13	21:26, 48:4
12:2	8 [2] - 2:20, 2:25	advance [1] - 68:27	anyway [1] - 21:1	arrived [4] - 15:6,
2014 [5] - 1:4, 6:29,	8th [1] - 69:3	advice [7] - 14:3,	apologies [1] - 6:27	15:26, 46:26, 48:2
	Jan [1] = JJ.J		apologies [i] - 0.27	, , ,
L	1	1	I	1

arriving [1] - 21:7 categorisation [1] -BRIAN [1] - 2:22 14:29, 71:2 В **AS**[1] - 6:1 brief [1] - 28:13 circumspect [1] bring [2] - 13:27, centred [1] - 66:3 aspect [1] - 56:27 12:27 background [1] assigned [3] - 41:18, 21:23 certain [3] - 7:26, circumstances [2] -48:13 33.2 62.18 45:21, 72:22 41:19, 42:21 **bringing** [2] - 13:1, bad [1] - 27:5 **CERTAIN** [1] - 1:4 citizens [2] - 24:27, 30.5 assist [10] - 31:22, bandied [1] - 28:21 34:24, 34:28, 35:16, brought [6] - 22:14, certainly [24] - 11:15, 51:29 BARROW [1] - 3:28 38:19, 38:23, 38:24, 12:6, 12:20, 23:7, civil [1] - 71:16 36:7, 36:10, 49:28, BARTON [1] - 3:16 Civil [1] - 21:10 53:10, 53:13, 73:11 45:5, 59:23 25:28, 27:26, 29:5, based [2] - 35:6, burden [1] - 10:15 32:3. 32:18. 33:5. civilian [1] - 70:6 assistance [7] -35:12 35:10, 36:4, 38:24, BURNS [1] - 2:27 clandestine [4] -17:13, 23:6, 39:18, 39:19, 45:15, 47:8, basis [5] - 7:28, 8:19, but.. [1] - 15:19 40:25, 41:6, 47:9, 41:6, 57:26, 57:29, 43:23, 64:29 51:23 47:19, 53:19, 55:2, buttering [1] - 11:23 60:21 became [2] - 63:27, **assistant** [1] - 8:5 64:7, 65:29, 72:9, clear [6] - 34:11, **BY** [24] - 1:5, 1:8, 74:6, 74:10 assisted [1] - 32:9 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:28, 47:18, 47:21, 48:11, become [3] - 24:28, assisting [2] - 51:21, certainty [1] - 54:28 58.9 62.13 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:13, 73:12, 74:13 66:19 certify [1] - 1:25 clearly [4] - 23:12, 3:20, 3:23, 3:27, 3:30, becoming [2] - 10:9, CHAIRMAN [25] -24:18, 34:13, 72:17 assuage [1] - 51:18 4:1, 5:4, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 12.9 24:25, 28:12, 28:26, assume [2] - 45:3, 6:8, 43:8, 62:6, 63:25 client [4] - 43:20, BEEN [1] - 6:7 29:4. 29:9. 29:25. 61:26, 68:5, 68:7 62:21 beg [1] - 68:3 34:9, 34:29, 35:8, assumed [1] - 42:3 C close [7] - 14:15, behalf [2] - 35:3, 35:18, 39:4, 58:17, 14:16, 33:13, 33:15, assuming [3] - 9:2, 62:2 59:8, 60:9, 60:18, 61:13, 61:15, 61:23 41:2 calculated [1] behind [1] - 71:15 60:29, 61:4, 61:12, astonished [3] closely [1] - 17:4 50:27 behold [1] - 58:21 62:1, 64:24, 64:27, 28:22, 28:29, 29:1 coincidence [1] caller [2] - 14:12, believes [1] - 24:18 68:1, 68:12, 71:6, 51.1 astonishing [3] -14:14 benefit [3] - 40:23, 74:8 coloured [1] - 45:17 30:8, 30:13, 30:14 Callinan [34] - 7:25, Chairman [30] - 6:17, **AT**[1] - 74:22 40:25, 69:7 coming [6] - 9:15, 8:13, 10:8, 11:4, 7:4, 12:16, 12:18, attach [1] - 12:20 best [3] - 11:11, 12:8, 22:2, 29:29, 11:17, 14:24, 15:26, 17:5, 25:5, 28:25, 13:28, 14:1 attached [1] - 21:11 53:13, 58:12 16:25, 17:23, 23:20, 28:29, 29:21, 31:12, better [1] - 44:22 attachment [1] commences [1] -23:21, 27:4, 27:24, 34:18, 35:5, 35:10, between [16] - 13:26, 47:2 63:20 27:29, 32:8, 32:13, 42:2, 43:6, 43:26, 15:14, 23:12, 24:4, commencing [1] attachments [1] -33:9, 33:18, 39:20, 44:3, 58:27, 58:28, 24:12, 24:23, 40:29, 63:3 69:22 43:16, 45:19, 45:25, 59:22, 60:26, 61:11, 46:24, 50:3, 51:28, commercial [1] attempt [4] - 33:23, 46:5, 46:12, 46:25, 61:21, 61:29, 62:21, 56:20, 59:19, 60:13, 41:11, 42:27, 52:10 71:17 48:3. 60:3. 61:6. 64:26, 68:14, 68:18, 61:5, 64:11, 68:6 Commission [1] attend [1] - 16:5 61:14, 65:4, 65:9, 68:26, 74:5 beyond [1] - 16:27 attended [1] - 8:17 65:15, 67:7, 70:23 Chairman's [1] big [2] - 15:14, 71:10 Commissioner [150] attention [3] - 13:27, Callinan's [9] - 6:16, 41:23 bigger [2] - 39:14, - 6:16, 6:25, 7:2, 7:3, 21:24, 58:23 6:26, 20:13, 20:20, CHAMBERS [1] -39:27 7:23, 7:25, 7:27, 7:29, attested [1] - 14:19 38.4 38.9 40.16 2:29 bit [4] - 46:1, 48:13, 8:13, 8:16, 8:22, 9:13, attitude [2] - 33:20, 46:3, 57:20 chance [1] - 61:19 54:7, 57:25 10:8, 10:20, 10:25, 73:19 CANAL[1] - 3:18 characterise [1] bizarre [4] - 28:21, 11:3, 11:14, 11:16, attributed [1] - 13:3 cannot [1] - 42:23 60.21 29:27, 30:1, 58:25 11:27, 12:3, 12:12, AUGUSTUS[1] -**CAPEL**[1] - 3:6 charge [2] - 28:16, BL [11] - 2:7, 2:10, 13:12, 13:21, 13:29, 3:13 career [1] - 14:18 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, 14:13, 14:24, 15:26, available [3] - 68:21, carpet [1] - 20:7 CHARLES [1] - 2:23 2:28, 3:9, 3:12, 3:20, 16:2, 16:24, 17:23, 71:3, 71:21 CARTHAGE[1] -CHARLETON [2] -4.1 18:6, 20:13, 21:3, avenue [1] - 55:21 1:12, 2:2 21:24, 21:27, 21:28, blue [3] - 24:2, 24:7, aware [18] - 17:9, case [14] - 21:26, CHARLTON[1] -29:13 22:13, 22:15, 23:16, 17:22, 17:28, 20:19, 26:12, 29:5, 38:6, bluntly [1] - 39:15 3.2423:21, 23:24, 23:26, 20:20, 20:22, 23:18, 41:28, 42:16, 53:15, check [1] - 60:27 BOUGHTON [1] -24:3, 24:8, 24:10, 23:28, 23:29, 26:23, 53:17, 67:17, 71:16, CHIEF [2] - 2:19, 24:29, 25:2, 25:9, 3:20 35:10, 45:28, 46:13, 72:19, 73:4, 74:12 25:15, 25:24, 25:27, **BOW** [1] - 3:13 48:22, 48:23, 63:27, cast [1] - 73:14 chief [7] - 8:5, 8:6, 26:1, 26:11, 26:19, boxes [1] - 72:1 65:8, 65:13 castigated [1] - 10:5 8:10, 8:11, 21:18, 26:21, 27:4, 27:12, breach [1] - 52:23 **CASTLE**[1] - 1:17 31:29.60:2 27:19, 27:24, 27:29, break [1] - 64:10 categories [1] circulated [1] - 69:7 28:5, 29:13, 29:20, BREFFNI [1] - 2:10 21:12 circulating [2] -30:5, 30:9, 30:17, BRETT [1] - 3:16

30:21, 31:2, 31:15, 62:14, 66:21, 66:22, conversation [16] -62:25, 68:26, 71:8, 54:6, 55:11, 55:16, 31:19, 31:25, 32:1, 66:23 9:27, 10:5, 11:6, 72:11, 72:27, 73:23, 56:25, 59:3, 73:21 33:9, 33:18, 34:6, concerning [3] -13:16, 13:22, 14:5, 73:27 dealings [1] - 57:26 34:22, 34:24, 35:8, 25:11, 70:22, 70:27 28:23, 29:2, 29:20, court [1] - 54:19 deals [1] - 47:21 35:26, 36:15, 37:8, 29:21, 31:13, 31:23, COURT [3] - 1:13, dealt [13] - 7:27, concerns [5] - 36:8. 38:4, 38:8, 39:2, 36:9, 36:10, 51:18, 32:2, 32:9, 47:12, 2:3, 3:6 12:19, 16:23, 27:18, 39:20, 40:16, 41:1, 52:25 48:26 courts [3] - 24:28, 33:6, 33:26, 34:1, 41:12, 43:16, 43:17, conversations [2] concluded [1] - 74:7 26:14, 66:4 34:4, 41:26, 45:13, 45:19, 45:25, 46:3, 27:6, 46:18 concludes [1] covered [1] - 62:12 59:4, 63:5, 64:17 46:5, 46:9, 46:12, convey[1] - 36:27 68:18 covert [3] - 53:19, Dear [3] - 22:20, 46:16, 46:25, 47:1, conclusion [2] conveyed [1] - 13:6 53:23, 53:26 22:29, 47:2 48:2, 48:4, 48:7, 68:27.69:24 copy [8] - 18:12, covertly [1] - 53:17 deceiving [4] - 32:1, 48:11, 49:1, 49:6, conduct [1] - 55:17 22:21, 23:1, 38:21, creation [1] - 51:3 32:5, 32:6, 32:17 49:8, 49:10, 49:16, 38:26, 59:25, 64:2 **December** [4] - 12:2, confident [1] - 49:5 credibility [1] - 72:17 49:20, 49:26, 50:5, corner [1] - 72:2 confidential [8] -58:28, 63:28, 63:29 credit [6] - 69:1, 51:7, 51:21, 52:1, corr [1] - 41:15 deception [2] -12:23 21:13 21:17 72:17, 72:24, 72:29, 52:14, 52:28, 53:10, 32:18, 32:20 21:23, 47:23, 47:25, correct [61] - 6:14, 73:5, 73:10 53:21, 54:14, 54:26, 56:20 6:17, 6:21, 6:27, 6:28, decide [2] - 13:28, criticism [1] - 54:28 55:11, 55:16, 57:11, 7:1, 7:4, 7:9, 8:4, confidential" [1] cross [3] - 14:27, 57:13, 57:19, 58:4, 21:6 8:24, 9:1, 12:18, decided [4] - 35:29, 69:1, 73:5 58:9, 58:18, 59:14, 14:23, 15:2, 16:8, 36:2, 36:4, 55:12 confirm [1] - 68:4 CROSS [4] - 5:5, 5:6, 60:3, 60:13, 60:23, confirmed [1] -16:11, 17:8, 17:19, decision [2] - 35:5, 43:8. 62:6 61:5, 61:14, 62:3, 17:21, 17:29, 18:22, 73:28 23:19 cross-examination 62:26, 65:4, 65:9, 19:29, 20:2, 23:6, [3] - 14:27, 69:1, 73:5 conflict [1] - 39:21 decorum [1] - 73:7 65:15, 65:20, 66:5, 23:14, 23:27, 30:7, defamation [2] -**CONLON** [1] - 2:28 **CROSS-EXAMINED** 66:11, 66:18, 66:19, 34:3, 34:8, 35:24, 25:11 27:13 **CONNOLLY** [1] - 3:5 [4] - 5:5, 5:6, 43:8, 67:7, 67:14, 67:23, 35:28, 37:12, 37:19, defamed [1] - 24:19 connotations [1] -62:6 68:6, 70:23, 70:24 37:23, 37:29, 38:5, defend [1] - 67:15 56.18 crux [2] - 51:20, COMMISSIONER [1] 38:10, 38:17, 39:1, **CONOR** [1] - 2:15 51:21 definite [2] - 13:14, - 2:14 40:11, 43:19, 43:22, consequence [1] -**CULLEN** [1] - 3:13 Commissioner's [33] 43:24, 43:26, 44:3, definitely [2] - 27:22, 74:14 cumulatively [1] -- 7:10, 7:12, 7:14, 44:10, 44:15, 46:29, 58:7 41.28 consider [2] - 28:10, 16:13, 18:9, 19:19, 47:8, 50:2, 51:9, 52:9, curiosity [2] - 12:29, 31:26 degree [1] - 70:16 21:8, 24:26, 28:15, 52:22, 54:9, 54:17, considered [3] deliberately [1] -36:8, 36:28, 38:7, 54:25, 59:1, 62:11, 25:15, 55:17, 56:2 **CURRAN** [1] - 3:27 32:5 38:27, 40:7, 41:1, 63:29, 64:7, 65:17 considering [2] delivered [4] - 21:17, 41:25, 43:21, 50:4, correspondence 8:20, 74:15 D 22.8 22.9 40.27 52:5, 52:8, 52:10, [16] - 18:10, 18:14, delivering [1] - 53:14 consult [2] - 44:5, 52:15, 57:3, 58:15, 21:15, 21:22, 29:6, 67:21 Department [1] -62:9, 62:10, 63:10, **DARREN**[1] - 3:9 29:11, 29:12, 41:14, 22:3 consulted [1] - 67:20 63:13, 63:16, 63:21, 41:26, 42:15, 42:19, **Data** [1] - 38:7 contact [13] - 43:25, depth [1] - 12:24 65:24, 66:29, 68:9 56:2, 62:25, 63:5, data [1] - 52:24 44:1, 44:5, 45:2, 45:4, **Deputy** [1] - 43:16 Committee [3] -67:25, 67:26 date [3] - 37:3, 45:19, 46:24, 50:3. describe [3] - 8:13, 16:3, 34:7, 61:25 corresponds [1] -62:27, 70:1 50:7, 58:10, 65:5, 50:16, 54:7 committing [1] -**DAVID**[1] - 3:20 68:6 described [2] - 52:7, 56:1 COSTELLO [1] - $\textbf{David}\, [\textbf{1}] \textbf{-} 68:5$ contain [1] - 71:10 66:5 communication [5] -**DAY**[1] - 1:18 contained [1] - 70:28 description [4] -49:6, 49:16, 60:12, counsel [7] - 43:13, day-to-day [1] - 8:9 containing [1] - 71:1 42:20, 44:22, 56:23, 61:5. 64:10 58:19, 68:29, 71:12, days [2] - 12:13, 49:3 content [2] - 33:1, 57:25 **COMPANY**[1] - 2:11 71:13, 71:27, 74:17 deal [20] - 9:2, 13:28, **DESMOND** [1] - 3:23 35:17 completely [3] couple [3] - 45:11, 14:1, 16:9, 21:19, context [2] - 43:27, despite [1] - 58:24 29:10, 35:12, 45:7 49:2, 64:17 22:5, 26:2, 27:17, 69:10 detail [3] - 13:13, computers [1] courier [2] - 21:5, 33:4, 47:29, 49:27, continuation [1] -47:22, 72:20 70:18 55:13, 70:4, 70:5, detailed [1] - 17:17 71:5 concern [10] - 16:25, course [23] - 16:1, 70:9, 70:11, 70:14, continue [1] - 74:2 details [1] - 41:4 26:8, 51:15, 52:20, 18:28, 21:7, 21:19, 70:16, 70:19, 73:23 continuously [1] -**Detective** [1] - 63:26 52:22, 57:3, 65:24, 22:14, 23:18, 24:28, dealing [17] - 7:18, 69:23 **DETECTIVE** [2] - 5:3, 67:10 26:23, 29:5, 31:11, 7:19, 7:23, 10:22, contribution [1] concerned [8] - 7:22, 31:14, 32:9, 38:7, 14:7, 25:28, 27:9, 52:15 **detective** [4] - 6:4, 19:18, 24:1, 41:23, 45:22, 54:29, 58:25, 33:2, 33:3, 35:15, control [1] - 66:26 6:9, 6:12, 65:22

develop[1] - 29:23 developed [1] -28:23 development[1] -64:23 devices [1] - 70:18 diaries [3] - 44:5, 44:25, 59:27 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diary [12] - 19:2, 19:5, 19:6, 19:9, 19:11, 19:15, 42:7, 44:8, 44:16, 44:20, 45:8, 59:24 dictated [1] - 39:6 dictating [1] - 39:11 different [5] - 27:26, 42:25, 46:23, 53:20, 56:17 differently [4] - 33:6, 35:12, 40:26, 45:13 difficult [1] - 74:5 difficulty [1] - 34:18 **DIGNAM**[1] - 2:15 direct [3] - 13:22, 21:23, 65:5 directed [1] - 21:25 directions [1] - 13:6 **DIRECTLY** [2] - 5:4, directly [1] - 21:18 disagree [4] - 25:5, 40:8, 56:27, 72:22 disagreed [1] - 52:6 discard [1] - 71:23 discern [1] - 9:13 disclosed [1] - 56:21 disclosure [3] - 7:21, 41:22, 69:2 DISCLOSURES [2] -1:3, 1:4 disclosures [2] -16:16, 16:18 discover [1] - 42:6 discovered [14] -19:15, 30:25, 42:2, 42:4, 42:5, 44:27, 53:28, 59:6, 59:25, 62:9, 62:10, 62:29, 63:2 discovery [4] - 42:3, 42:27, 63:10, 71:19 discuss [9] - 9:11, 11:5, 12:27, 13:11, 13:28, 32:25, 35:16, 40:18, 61:26 discussed 191 -12:11, 13:14, 13:23, 13:25, 15:16, 16:27, 38:19, 53:9, 55:22

discussing [3] -13:13, 14:5, 22:13 discussion [16] -9:3, 11:2, 13:19, 14:27, 15:21, 16:29. 26:4, 46:7, 46:27, 48:5, 48:18, 48:19, 48:21, 61:17, 66:3, 72:18 discussions [5] -9:7, 9:12, 45:25, 45:26, 61:17 disgruntled [1] -29.7 dispatched [1] disposed [1] - 32:16 dispute [3] - 51:28, 60:4. 71:17 distinction [3] -15:14, 51:25, 51:26 divide [1] - 21:11 **DOCK** [1] - 3:18 **DOCKERY** [1] - 3:23 DOCUMENT [1] -64:8 document [2] -16:17, 64:29 documentary [1] -71:13 documents [11] -12:23, 22:23, 58:20, 62:13, 62:15, 63:11, 63:12, 63:17, 71:18, 71.21 domain [3] - 9:17, 51:17, 52:23 DONAL [1] - 2:16 done [14] - 10:16, 11:9, 33:8, 36:29, 37:1, 40:14, 40:26,

61:11, 61:22, 71:15,

door [2] - 7:13, 7:16

double [1] - 60:27

double-check [1] -

doubt [2] - 12:10,

down [9] - 11:1,

11:13, 14:4, 37:10,

39:23, 40:3, 41:3,

downstairs [2] -

DPP's [1] - 13:5

Dr [2] - 61:5, 62:26

25:10, 28:19, 30:10,

31:4, 33:2, 38:28

draft [8] - 23:2, 23:5,

64:10, 73:11

21:8, 21:21

72:3, 72:9, 73:17

60.27

38:13

drafted [7] - 31:1, 31:6, 33:19, 33:22, 48:3, 58:4, 60:23 drafting [6] - 35:2, 40:17, 65:25, 66:12, 67:1, 67:24 drafts [1] - 59:16 dragged [1] - 48:14 draw [1] - 58:23 **Dublin** [1] - 35:1 **DUBLIN** [15] - 1:17, 2:12, 2:20, 2:25, 2:30, 3:3, 3:7, 3:11, 3:14, 3:18, 3:21, 3:25, 3:28, 3:32, 4:3 due [3] - 16:1, 18:28, 68:21 during [2] - 32:9, 45:22 duties [2] - 24:26, 58:26 duty [4] - 69:2, 69:10, 71:17, 71:20 dwarfing [1] - 57:19 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:5

9:11

66:4

9:22

44:17

73:18

events [7] - 8:17,

8:18, 21:7, 21:19,

22:14, 60:4, 62:25

EVIDENCE [1] - 1:9

evidence [17] - 6:13,

9:4, 20:24, 21:2, 34:5,

46:17, 49:1, 49:4,

49:11, 49:15, 58:8,

70:17, 74:6

61:23, 68:18, 68:23,

ex [2] - 70:23, 70:24

ex-Commissioner

exactly [1] - 31:25

examination [4] -

14:27, 69:1, 70:22,

examine [1] - 38:14

examined [1] - 70:8

[2] - 70:23, 70:24

eventually [1] -

Ε

easier [1] - 50:19 easy [1] - 72:1 editors [1] - 70:15 effect [6] - 46:13, 48:12, 48:15, 51:28, 55:15, 66:7 effectively[1] - 24:2 effort [2] - 16:9, 49:27 eight [1] - 70:1 either [5] - 21:17, 30:28, 40:3, 42:27, electronic [1] - 19:5 element [1] - 58:13 **ELIZABETH**[1] - 2:7 em [4] - 15:28, 24:14, 26:8, 56:16 email [3] - 58:28, 59:1, 59:2 emanating [1] -70:17 embassies [1] - 7:20 **EMMA**[1] - 2:18 emphasised [1] **employer**[1] - 30:9 enclose [2] - 22:21, enclosed [1] - 23:9 enclosing [1] - 23:2

EXAMINED [8] - 5:4, encouraged [1] -5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 6:8, encouraging [1] -43:8, 62:6, 63:25 11:16 **excellent** [1] - 19:17 end [6] - 11:2, 26:10, exchange [1] - 56:19 30:20, 30:24, 54:18, exclusion [1] - 47:26 exclusively [1] engage [4] - 53:1, 53:3, 53:6, 53:16 excuse [2] - 35:19, engagement [3] -69.11 53:5, 53:8, 53:19 exercise [1] - 60:2 engaging [1] - 53:17 expect [1] - 36:17 enjoying [2] - 9:18, expected [1] - 34:17 explain [6] - 28:6, entail [1] - 7:17 29:21, 43:1, 47:26, enter [1] - 7:13 56:11, 69:11 entered [2] - 7:16, explanation [3] -40:11, 42:23, 42:24 entitled [3] - 32:27, express [2] - 9:29, 63:1, 73:4 71:11 entries [1] - 44:26 expressed [2] entry [5] - 42:7, 31:15, 73:9 44:16, 44:17, 44:18, expressing [1] - 32:7 44:28 **expressly** [1] - 45:14 **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:9 extension [2] equally [3] - 57:9, 50:13, 68:10 57:16 67:15 **extensive** [2] - 16:7, escape [1] - 42:27 69.16 especially [1] - 54:21 extensively [1] -ESTABLISHED[1] -17:25 extent [1] - 7:26 estimate [1] - 74:3 external [1] - 73:20 etcetera [9] - 7:20, extra [1] - 10:15 16:19, 21:14, 21:17, extraordinary [1] -31:19, 70:18, 70:25 71:26 evening [1] - 11:19 extreme [1] - 40:9 event [5] - 28:10, 31:1, 35:20, 37:2,

F

face [8] - 10:26, 11:4, 25:1, 36:25, 64:10 face-to-face [3] -10:26, 11:4, 36:25 fact [31] - 12:22, 17:9, 17:16, 17:22, 17:24, 23:18, 23:24, 25:5, 25:14, 26:23, 32:8, 32:17, 33:7, 33:18, 34:21, 34:25, 41:9, 51:11, 51:24, 53:25, 54:21, 55:29, 56:1, 58:7, 58:14, 58:24, 61:15, 63:9, 65:8, 66:3 factors [1] - 40:13 facts [4] - 28:8, 35:6, 60:22, 73:20 factual [1] - 69:5 factually [2] - 23:6,

47:8	2:17, 3:16	frequent [2] - 14:12,	67:17	heading [8] - 42:16,
fair [5] - 10:11,	FITZWILLIAM[1] -	14:14	GERALD [1] - 3:20	42:17, 42:18, 42:22,
10:25, 25:2, 43:2,	3:24	friend [2] - 53:12,	GERARD [1] - 2:22	62:22, 62:23, 62:24,
56:22	five [1] - 58:5	66:6	given [19] - 6:12, 9:4,	62:28
fairly [2] - 25:23,	fixed [1] - 38:2	friendly [4] - 8:15,	14:18, 28:4, 28:8,	Headquarters [5] -
32:27	flag [1] - 73:22	8:16, 8:19, 53:12	29:4, 30:19, 31:18,	9:3, 9:5, 12:16, 58:29,
fairness [1] - 64:12	flavour [2] - 8:26,	front [3] - 7:13, 7:16,	34:5, 35:21, 41:4,	61:15
FANNING [2] - 3:30,	29:27	39:7	43:2, 45:2, 45:18,	hear [4] - 16:1,
4:1	floor [1] - 7:15	frustrated [2] - 10:9,	54:13, 61:4, 61:6,	61:28, 68:28, 73:27
far [6] - 9:23, 19:17,	FLOOR [1] - 3:7	10:12	61:13, 66:24	heard [1] - 14:27
24:1, 25:17, 41:22,	floors [1] - 7:12	FSNI [1] - 70:8	GORDON [1] - 2:10	HEARING [1] - 6:1
50:14	follow [8] - 24:6,	full [3] - 7:3, 34:19,	GRAND[1] - 3:18	hearing [2] - 15:17,
fashion [1] - 53:22	50:28, 50:29, 51:3,	69:14	grateful [2] - 23:4,	69:8
fault [1] - 64:28	51:4, 53:4, 53:7,	full-time [1] - 7:3	58:22	hearings [1] - 71:5
faults [1] - 11:23	66:28	fully [3] - 34:13,	gratitude [1] - 71:12	HEGARTY[1] - 3:23
FEBRUARY [2] - 1:6,	followed [3] - 42:21,	38:13, 67:19	great [6] - 9:2, 16:9,	HELD [1] - 1:17
1:10	69:25, 70:26	function [3] - 16:13,	31:21, 34:26, 35:1,	hello [1] - 43:22
February [8] - 6:19,	FOLLOWING [1] -	24:29, 25:2	48:12	help [5] - 28:24,
6:20, 37:3, 37:5, 42:8,	1:5	FÍONÁN [1] - 3:12	greater [2] - 12:9	30:10, 30:26, 40:21,
44:19, 65:6, 65:11	following [1] - 1:26	I IONAN [I] - 5.12	GRIFFIN [1] - 2:18	71:23
FEICHÍN [1] - 3:26	follows [1] - 68:9	G	ground [1] - 7:15	helpful [4] - 10:7,
FELIX [1] - 3:2	FOLLOWS [1] - 6:1	G	grumpy [1] - 74:18	12:15, 69:26, 72:21
Ferris's [1] - 70:9	football [1] - 35:2		GSOC [1] - 38:13	helpfully [1] - 17:16
FERRY [1] - 2:28	FOR [16] - 1:8, 2:6,	Gaelic [1] - 35:1	guards [4] - 31:22,	helping [2] - 67:14,
few [4] - 12:13,	2:9, 2:14, 2:22, 2:27,	Garda [35] - 12:16,	34:26, 53:12, 70:17	67:16
34:16, 43:13, 55:25	3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12,	14:18, 23:15, 25:9,	GUIDERA [1] - 3:27	hesitant [1] - 57:25
file [28] - 19:28, 20:1,	3:16, 3:20, 3:23, 3:26,	25:24, 26:13, 27:11,	GWEN [1] - 1:30	hide [3] - 41:11,
20:3, 29:18, 41:17,	3:29, 4:1	28:15, 29:12, 29:20,	Gwen [1] - 1:25	42:28, 52:10
41:19, 41:26, 42:4,	force [1] - 31:19	30:9, 30:21, 34:2,	Owen [i] - 1.20	himself [5] - 11:21,
42:5, 42:18, 42:20,	forces [1] - 7:20	34:27, 36:11, 54:22,	Н	11:27, 65:5, 66:20,
42:25, 42:28, 52:8,	fore [1] - 8:28	57:2, 57:5, 57:10,	П	67:15
52:9, 53:25, 53:27,	foreign [1] - 7:19	59:14, 59:20, 60:3,		hindsight [6] - 25:14,
53:28, 58:2, 59:3,	forensic [1] - 70:21	60:13, 60:23, 61:14,	half [4] - 37:13,	27:1, 35:10, 40:23,
59:23, 62:19, 62:20,	forget [1] - 59:21	62:2, 65:27, 66:6,	37:15, 41:20, 63:8	40:25
62:29, 63:4, 63:15	forgive [2] - 28:13,	66:7, 66:9, 66:21,	HALIDAY[1] - 2:11	HOGAN [1] - 3:29
filed [8] - 19:27,	39:14	66:26, 67:13, 70:6,	hall [3] - 68:20, 71:9	honest [3] - 42:26,
41:20, 41:28, 42:24,	form [3] - 41:12,	70:24	HALL [2] - 3:30, 4:2	52:26, 59:29
42:25, 42:26, 58:2,	45:8, 51:13	garda [2] - 17:10,	HANAHOE[1] - 2:29	honestly [1] - 15:9
63:3	formal [6] - 18:20,	60:14	hand [1] - 7:16	hope [4] - 32:27,
files [3] - 7:21, 13:27,	18:24, 18:26, 19:2,	Gardaí [3] - 9:24,	HANDED [1] - 64:8	43:14, 50:2, 74:6
14:7	35:29, 56:1	32:8, 32:17	handed [1] - 22:15	hopefully [1] - 74:2
final [2] - 60:1, 65:22	format [1] - 51:1	garden [1] - 74:14	handwriting [1] -	hoping [1] - 10:3
finalised [1] - 16:19	formed [2] - 52:29,	gather [1] - 71:22	63:21	hour [3] - 26:24,
fine [1] - 68:12	53:2	General [1] - 22:3	handwritten [8] -	37:13, 37:16
finished [1] - 55:24	former [3] - 15:26,	general [6] - 7:29,	31:2, 31:27, 35:20,	hours [6] - 11:1,
Finucane [6] - 20:18,	16:24, 34:6	14:5, 17:4, 26:4,	38:23, 52:5, 52:7,	11:24, 16:22, 17:26,
23:23, 45:26, 45:29,	fortnight [1] - 68:27	56:18, 59:1	58:15, 59:16	64:18, 74:10
46:2, 46:4	forward [2] - 57:12,	genuinely [2] -	hang [1] - 74:10	HOUSE [3] - 2:11,
first [24] - 7:24, 21:3,	71:11	11:10, 15:20	happy [2] - 13:5,	2:19, 2:24
21:4, 29:15, 31:8,	four [7] - 16:22,	George's [1] - 68:20	40:21	huge [1] - 22:11
31:9, 32:22, 32:24,	35:25, 37:20, 48:3,	GERAGHTY [1] - 3:2	hard [1] - 10:18	hypothesis [1] -
36:13, 37:8, 43:23,	48:10, 50:15, 63:22	Gerald [26] - 17:27,	harm [1] - 9:10	46:23
50:21, 50:25, 51:12,	fourth [1] - 58:3	18:5, 19:20, 20:17,	Harrison [1] - 73:15	
52:1, 52:21, 52:27,	FRANK [2] - 5:3, 6:7	20:19, 20:26, 41:16,	HARTY [1] - 3:5	Ī
53:21, 56:28, 59:5,	Frank [3] - 6:4,	42:10, 44:13, 44:18,	HATCH [4] - 3:30,	•
65:13, 67:5, 72:25,	42:17, 42:20	45:19, 50:10, 55:27,	3:31, 4:2, 4:2	
73:5	frank [2] - 16:29,	57:4, 57:9, 59:3,	HAVING [1] - 6:7	idea [1] - 59:11
FIRST [1] - 3:7	25:23	59:26, 62:26, 65:21,	HAYES [1] - 3:27	imagine [1] - 45:28
firstly [1] - 57:29	free [1] - 9:29	65:26, 66:20, 66:22,	head [3] - 29:16,	immediately [8] -
FITZGERALD [2] -	FREEMAN [1] - 4:1	66:24, 67:12, 67:15,	55:5, 55:10	7:15, 41:24, 45:5,

59:7, 61:22, 61:24, 64:15, 64:16 impasse [7] - 33:24, 33:25, 34:10, 34:20, 35:15, 54:8 impending [1] - 16:2 important [2] -10:15, 57:8 impression [1] -51:13 **IN** [1] - 1:17 in-depth [1] - 12:24 inappropriate [19] -25:16, 26:11, 26:15, 26:16, 26:20, 26:22, 30:16, 30:18, 30:28, 30:29, 31:16, 32:15, 33:19, 33:28, 34:23, 39:17, 66:24, 67:14, 67:16 incident [4] - 13:7, 15:8, 17:18, 17:26 included [2] - 44:8, 63:9 indeed [4] - 10:25, 10:28, 17:15, 64:20 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 indicate [2] - 37:8, 69:27 indicated [4] - 35:26, 55:17, 65:4, 68:28 **indication** [1] - 50:3 indirectly [1] - 57:14 individual [2] -34:12, 35:4 infer [2] - 45:24, 63:10 inferred [1] - 65:18 influenced [3] -33:10, 33:20, 73:2 informal [3] - 18:27, 18:28, 47:4 **informally** [1] - 9:3 information [20] -17:6, 17:13, 23:24, 25:19, 25:25, 27:3, 27:24, 28:1, 28:8, 32:4, 32:19, 33:5, 34:19, 35:13, 45:22, 49:17, 51:16, 51:19, 51:20, 60:10 informed [2] - 18:4, 65:12 initial [2] - 28:20, 58:5 **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:3, insofar [2] - 24:16, 70:18

21:4, 27:17, 36:26, 56:28, 61:24, 66:10, 67:5, 71:17 instances [1] - 12:8 INSTRUCTED [13] - 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:28, 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:13, 3:20, 3:23, 3:27, 3:30, 4:1 instructions [4] -

60:16, 60:19, 60:25, 68:4 INSTRUMENT [1] -

intelligence [1] - 7:8 intend [1] - 31:3 intended [5] - 68:22, 68:24, 69:22, 70:2, 71:2 intention [1] - 63:2

internion [1] - 03.2 interaction [2] -18:5, 40:2 interest [2] - 69:14, 69:19

interests [3] - 57:18, 66:17, 67:24 internal [1] - 55:6 interpreting [1] -54:25

interruption [2] -28:13, 35:19 interview [1] - 16:20 interviewed [1] -17:25 INTO [1] - 1:3

invariably [1] - 22:4 investigation [2] -13:20, 38:13 investigators [17] -6:10, 16:20, 16:28,

37:26 involved[8] - 30:20, 57:6, 61:4, 61:8, 65:27, 66:5, 67:11, 67:18

involvement[1] -60:11 involves[2] - 71:25, 72:8 involving[5] - 9:27,

13:22, 17:27, 26:12, 60:13 | Ireland [2] - 70:22,

72:8

instance [9] - 7:24,

issue [5] - 17:3, 51:19, 67:27, 69:4, 72:16 issues [17] - 8:27, 9:8, 9:12, 9:17, 9:20, 10:4, 10:9, 10:12, 11:5, 32:26, 52:24,

69:5, 69:19, 72:23,

72:29, 73:6, 73:10

itself [1] - 58:1

irrelevant [1] - 71:23

.I

January [5] - 6:18, 6:24, 12:3, 23:22, 32:10 job [4] - 59:8, 59:9, 72:6, 72:7 **JOHN** [7] - 2:17, 2:28, 3:5, 3:9, 3:17, 3:23, 4:1 John [4] - 14:28, 15:5, 15:6, 15:7 journalists [2] -70:14, 70:26 judge [1] - 73:4 JUDGE [2] - 1:12, judgment [1] - 59:10 July [1] - 7:6 jumping [1] - 13:15 June [1] - 74:7 JUSTICE [3] - 1:8, 1:12. 2:2 justice [1] - 72:27

Κ

KATHLEEN [1] - 2:7 KAVANAGH[1] - 2:4 Kean [113] - 8:23, 17:27, 18:1, 18:5, 19:8, 19:20, 20:17, 20:19, 20:26, 23:10, 23:13, 23:19, 23:20, 24:2, 24:7, 24:12, 24:18, 24:24, 25:19, 25:22, 26:6, 27:25, 28:11, 30:18, 30:26, 31:16, 31:20, 32:6, 32:9, 32:16, 33:19, 33:27, 34:2, 34:4, 34:25, 35:17, 35:27, 36:5, 36:25, 37:3, 37:9, 37:13, 38:19, 38:29. 39:5. 39:18. 39:20, 39:21, 39:23, 40:2, 40:4, 40:21,

40:27, 41:4, 41:16, 42:10, 44:13, 44:18, 45:1, 45:3, 45:20, 45:22, 45:26, 46:5, 46:13, 46:14, 46:25, 48:13, 48:28, 49:9, 49:18, 49:20, 49:28, 50:4, 50:10, 50:25, 51:16, 53:10, 53:11, 54:13, 55:27, 55:29, 57:2, 57:4, 57:9, 57:15. 58:8. 58:19. 59:3, 59:4, 59:26, 60:13, 61:5, 62:26, 63:19, 65:6, 65:16, 65:21, 65:25, 65:26, 66:12, 66:20, 66:22, 66:24, 67:1, 67:12, 67:15, 67:17, 67:20, 68:6. 68:8

KEAN [2] - 3:20, 3:20 **Kean's** [11] - 37:10, 37:21, 40:19, 42:22, 46:9, 46:20, 50:5, 50:13, 50:27, 62:24, 65:10

keep [3] - 19:2, 40:21, 58:4 Keith [1] - 73:15 KELLY [2] - 3:30, 4:1 KENNEDY [1] - 3:23 kept [5] - 19:12, 40:7, 63:6, 63:12, 63:13 KEVIN'S [2] - 3:31,

4:3 kind [1] - 29:22 kindly [1] - 73:21 knowing [2] - 27:4,

knowledge [7] - 8:26, 12:24, 20:25, 60:19, 62:14, 68:5, 68:8

40:26

known [4] - 28:18, 45:12, 45:17, 49:29

L

lacking [1] - 29:10

laconic [1] - 73:9 laptops [1] - 70:24 large [1] - 70:16 last [3] - 58:28, 63:28, 72:12 late [3] - 6:29, 8:27, 11:18 latest [1] - 70:11 LAW [1] - 3:13 law [3] - 30:2, 69:1, 72:19 LAWLOR [1] - 3:9 lawsuit [2] - 66:20, 66:25 lawyer [1] - 30:2 lead [1] - 73:11

LEADER[1] - 2:7 leading [1] - 7:13 least [1] - 27:20 leave [2] - 48:7, 49:21

leaving [1] - 38:21

led [1] - 60:12 left [4] - 38:20, 38:25, 39:2, 66:8 legal [6] - 30:10, 54:13, 55:6, 55:9, 55:10, 55:18

LEHANE [1] - 3:9 Lehane [1] - 62:3 length [1] - 23:23 less [2] - 37:15, 53:17

letter [99] - 8:22,

16:23, 17:2, 17:14, 18:4, 18:8, 19:19, 19:22, 19:27, 21:5, 21:26, 21:29, 22:8, 22:10, 22:12, 22:14, 22:17, 22:21, 23:1, 23:4, 23:9, 24:2, 24:7, 24:17, 25:11, 25:23, 26:2, 26:7, 26:8, 26:9,

27:2, 27:9, 27:12, 28:10, 28:17, 28:20, 29:14, 30:10, 30:11, 30:19, 31:1, 31:2, 32:15, 32:22, 33:27, 35:20, 36:12, 36:18, 36:28, 38:28, 39:7, 40:17, 41:23, 41:24, 41:29, 42:16, 42:17, 42:18, 42:22, 42:23, 46:6, 46:20, 46:26, 47:1, 47:11, 47:15, 48:5, 50:28, 51:2, 51:8, 52:2, 52:5,

52:22, 54:22, 55:4, 57:29, 59:14, 60:24, 62:8, 62:16, 62:22, 62:28, 63:2, 63:9, 63:19, 63:20, 65:25, 67:1, 67:5, 67:24, 68:8, 68:11

letters [8] - 21:16, 23:3, 27:19, 29:6, 41:10, 41:11, 55:9, 58:14

52:13, 52:15, 52:20,

level [2] - 11:8, 56:25 liaison [2] - 7:7, 64:11 **LIAM** [1] - 3:27 libel [3] - 28:19, 35:3, 60:24 libelling [1] - 29:15 lieu [1] - 62:27 light [5] - 13:2, 28:2, 54:21, 60:14, 61:7 likely [5] - 31:24, 48:7, 49:25, 63:12, 65:19 **limit** [1] - 73:7 limited [1] - 73:5 line [3] - 54:7, 55:24, 56:29 lines [1] - 55:25 listen [1] - 59:13 literally [3] - 11:17, 64:18, 71:28 litigation [7] - 26:10, 30:20, 30:24, 51:22, 57:6, 65:28, 66:4 **LITTLE** [2] - 2:20, 2:25 **lo** [1] - 58:21 look [14] - 17:3, 17:4, 22:17, 23:4, 25:25, 26:5, 27:1, 27:9, 28:14, 46:15, 46:20, 49:10, 64:5, 74:9 looked [2] - 8:2, 35:12 looking [11] - 7:21, 20:5, 24:10, 26:29, 27:11, 33:1, 39:13, 40:22, 42:2 lost [1] - 35:9 **LOWER** [2] - 3:31, 4:2 lunchtime [1] - 60:27

M

M.E [1] - 2:29 MADE [2] - 1:3, 1:8 main [2] - 7:20, 51:15 major [1] - 74:6 **MALONE** [1] - 1:30 Malone [1] - 1:25 man [1] - 11:23 management [3] -11:8, 13:9, 61:26 manager [1] - 71:13 manner [3] - 47:12, 50:26, 55:15 march [1] - 69:4

March [1] - 6:29 Marian [6] - 20:18, 23:22, 45:26, 45:28, 46:2. 46:4 **MARK**[1] - 3:5 marked [7] - 21:6, 21:16, 44:26, 45:8, 45:9, 47:22, 47:24 Marrinan [6] - 25:3, 28:12, 28:13, 31:10, 35:19. 39:5 MARRINAN [15] -2:6, 5:4, 5:7, 6:4, 6:8, 6:9, 25:4, 29:26, 35:20, 39:9, 63:25, 63:26, 64:8, 64:28, 67:28 MARTIN [1] - 3:26 Martin [3] - 22:20, 22:29.47:2 MASON [1] - 3:27 material [13] - 9:16, 16:16, 23:11, 31:3, 52:1, 68:24, 69:12, 69:13, 70:4, 70:15, 70:20, 70:27, 71:1 materials [2] - 6:11, 71:3 matter [41] - 13:23, 14:17, 20:6, 23:12, 24:4, 24:12, 24:14, 24:15, 24:16, 24:23, 25:7, 25:14, 25:23, 25:25, 26:6, 31:15, 32:6, 41:13, 42:27, 44:12, 44:13, 53:1, 53:9, 54:18, 55:12, 55:13, 56:10, 57:26, 59:5, 59:19, 60:20, 61:6, 61:12, 61:18, 61:26, 64:12, 65:3, 65:22, 72:15, 73:16 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:5 matters [20] - 7:22, 8:7, 8:20, 13:2, 16:25, 16:26, 18:3, 19:3, 19:18, 21:22, 38:14, 40:18, 62:14, 63:26, 68:4, 69:15, 69:24, 70:10, 73:20, 73:26 Maurice [8] - 8:27, 9:7, 23:2, 23:10, 28:18, 29:14, 31:18, 60:24 McCabe [63] - 2:9, 8:28, 9:7, 9:24, 9:28, 10:6, 10:10, 10:26, 10:29, 11:5, 11:28,

12:1, 12:17, 13:20,

16:26, 20:3, 23:2,

23:10, 23:12, 24:4, 24:13, 24:16, 24:17, 24:24, 28:11, 28:18, 29:14, 30:10, 30:11, 31:18, 33:9, 33:20, 37:22, 39:22, 39:23, 39:24, 40:5, 41:21, 41:27, 42:13, 43:25, 44:6, 44:21, 45:2, 45:6, 50:28, 57:14, 59:28, 60:24, 62:19, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 66:11, 66:13, 67:2, 67:8, 67:12, 67:13, 67:17, 67:21, 67:23, 67:26 McCabe's [9] - 13:1. 19:28, 26:8, 41:25, 44:23, 53:28, 58:2, 62:20, 66:17 McCANN [2] - 2:22, 3:16 McCOURT [1] - 3:2 McDONAGH [1] -3:26 McDOWELL [2] -2:9. 43:6 McENROY [1] - 3:2 McGARRY [1] - 2:10 McGuinness [7] -3:9, 68:18, 71:6, 72:16, 72:20, 74:2, 74.4 MCGUINNESS [2] -2:6, 2:16 McPartlin [1] - 8:11 mean [16] - 12:14, 20:5, 25:14, 27:5, 28:26, 28:27, 29:26, 30:23, 30:25, 34:10, 39:16, 48:17, 51:19, 52:16, 52:18, 73:1 meanings [1] - 56:18 means [1] - 25:28 meant [2] - 53:19, 53:26 meantime [1] - 74:15 MEEHAN [1] - 2:22 meet [8] - 10:28, 11:13, 11:15, 11:21, 11:26, 11:28, 12:1, 55.29 meeting [8] - 11:1, 19:7, 25:26, 36:24, 41:16, 42:10, 44:18, 50:11 meeting" [1] - 59:26 meetings [1] - 16:5

member [14] - 26:12, 30:20, 31:18, 54:22, 57:2, 57:5, 57:10, 59:19, 65:27, 66:7, 66:8, 66:21, 66:26, 67:13 members [1] - 35:4 mention [3] - 44:11, 72:15. 73:17 mentioned [7] - 49:5, 74.7 50:19, 54:4, 59:3,

73:10

MONDAY [1] - 74:21

mop [1] - 70:29

49:8, 49:14, 49:15, 49:18, 58:5, 71:27 mere [1] - 41:9 merely [5] - 25:19, 36:14, 37:7, 64:14, 64.15 messages [1] - 65:9 met [5] - 10:26, 10:29, 11:4, 20:22, 48:23 method [1] - 47:29 MICHAEL [14] - 2:9, 2:27, 3:23, 5:5, 43:8, 43:10, 60:1, 60:8, 60:17, 60:26, 61:2, 61:11, 61:21, 68:3 Michael [1] - 43:11 MICHELLE [1] - 3:2 Michelle [1] - 70:13 MICHEÁL [1] - 3:26 middle [2] - 48:14, midst [1] - 10:14 might [17] - 9:11, 11:3, 12:26, 19:14, 21:27, 22:4, 30:24, 30:25, 35:3, 47:12, 48:17, 55:3, 66:25, 68:2, 69:26, 72:15, 73:21 mightn't [1] - 67:9 mind [6] - 32:20, 45:5, 55:19, 55:21, 73:14, 73:22 $\boldsymbol{mindful}\, [1] - 51:27$ minds [1] - 74:11 MINISTER [1] - 1:8 miscellaneous [1] -70:29 missed [1] - 45:7 mission [1] - 40:6 mobile [3] - 50:14, 65:10 module [3] - 68:28, 69:6, 73:15 moment [5] - 44:21,

mop-up [1] - 70:29 morning [7] - 11:18, 37:9, 43:10, 43:12, 46:8, 50:7, 65:15 MORRISSEY [1] -2:18 most [9] - 7:17, 23:24, 27:22, 30:16, 31:24, 48:7, 49:25, 58:24, 69:8 motivation [1] - 67:7 motive [3] - 13:1, 13:3, 13:4 **MR** [69] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4, 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:10, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 2:15, 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, 2:22, 2:23, 2:27, 2:28. 2:28. 3:2. 3:5. 3:9, 3:12, 3:16, 3:20, 3:23, 3:26, 3:27, 3:29, 4:1, 5:4, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 6:4, 6:8, 6:9, 25:4, 29:26, 35:20, 39:9, 43:6, 43:8, 43:10, 60:1, 60:8, 60:17, 60:26, 61:2, 61:11, 61:21, 62:6, 62:8, 63:25, 63:26, 64:8, 64:28, 67:28, 68:3, 68:18, 74:4 MRS [1] - 3:2 MS [6] - 2:7, 2:7, 2:18, 2:18, 2:27, 3:29 MUIRCHEARTAIGH [1] - 3:12 MULLAN [1] - 2:7 Mullingar [1] - 10:29 MURPHY [1] - 2:14 must [6] - 27:20, 29:5, 35:8, 45:3, 51:5, 58:24 **MÍCHEÁL** [4] - 2:15, 5:6, 62:6, 62:8

Ν

name [3] - 43:11, 43:23, 44:23 named [1] - 1:27 nature [1] - 69:27 nearly [2] - 15:18, 26:24 necessarily [5] -14:2, 29:9, 39:25, 67:11, 69:17 necessary [1] necessities [1] -

MEMBER [2] - 1:12,

68:21 need [6] - 12:13, 23:5, 28:24, 47:8, 59:12, 60:18 72:19 needed [2] - 10:17, 44.27 never[17] - 10:4, 43:9, 43:10, 60:1, 11:12, 20:19, 39:18, 48:14, 49:5, 49:8, 49:15, 49:18, 53:19, 62:7, 62:8, 68:3 53:22, 53:26, 58:1, O'Higgins [11] -58:5, 58:18, 58:19 nevertheless [1] -62:1, 62:4, 65:23, 10.17 68:1, 68:27, 69:6, new [1] - 6:26 72:27, 72:28 next [7] - 31:26, 38:6, 38:11, 41:13, 41:15, 55:23, 68:21 **NO**[1] - 3:21 nobody [2] - 20:7, 70:24 61:15 NOEL [2] - 2:16, 3:16 normal [7] - 21:7, 21:19, 22:13, 36:17, 36:20, 62:25, 73:24 38:22, 59:11, 72:11, normally [4] - 27:6, 72:12, 74:12, 74:13 41:27, 42:15, 62:21 obviously [18] - 8:15, Northern [1] - 70:21 8:27, 9:18, 9:22, **NORTHUMBERLA** 10:20, 24:15, 26:9, **ND**[1] - 3:3 28:8, 39:17, 42:4, note [14] - 35:22, 45:7, 50:10, 67:20, 37:17, 37:20, 37:27, 68:24, 69:5, 69:13, 37:28, 38:4, 38:9, 70:1. 71:24 38:16, 40:3, 42:12, occasion [1] - 55:11 42:22, 52:7, 59:22, occasions 131 -62:23 11:20, 14:2, 17:25 notes [16] - 1:27, occupied [1] - 40:17 16:24, 31:27, 50:16, occur [3] - 47:11, 50:22, 50:23, 50:24, 47:14, 47:15 52:5, 52:6, 55:28, occurred [2] - 13:7, 56:1, 58:14, 58:15, 40:10 62:16, 63:21 occurrence [1] **nothing** [7] - 13:15, 28:3 19:18, 22:22, 23:15, odd [1] - 29:10 25:1, 34:11, 59:15 **OF** [4] - 1:3, 1:9, notwithstanding [1] 1:12, 2:3 - 34:23 offer [1] - 62:15 November [1] offered [2] - 39:18, 14:21 39:19 nugget [1] - 28:1 offering [1] - 32:13 number [15] - 14:11, office [41] - 6:26, 17:25, 22:26, 40:29, 7:10, 7:11, 7:12, 7:14, 41:18, 42:21, 50:14, 54:3, 65:10, 67:11, 7:15, 10:16, 11:17, 11:24, 12:6, 14:3, 68:7, 68:9, 69:27 18:9, 19:19, 19:22, Nóirín [3] - 7:3, 21:8. 21:9. 21:11. 43:17, 70:24 21:27, 28:15, 31:6, 37:10, 40:7, 40:19, 41:25, 43:21, 46:10,

48:2, 50:4, 50:5, 52:8, 0 52:10, 58:10, 58:29, 59:18, 62:9, 62:10, O'Callaghan [1] -63:10, 63:13, 63:16, 68:9, 71:13 O'HIGGINS [16] -Office [4] - 25:19, 2:15, 2:27, 5:5, 5:6, 34:15, 60:14, 70:7 **OFFICE** [2] - 2:19, 60:8, 60:17, 60:26, 61:2, 61:11, 61:21, officer [3] - 8:3, 14:8, official [6] - 29:11, 43:11, 60:9, 61:20, 40:15, 54:26, 58:3, 58:29 often [1] - 13:29 ON [4] - 1:6, 1:10, **O'MARA**[1] - 3:2 1:18, 6:1 O'REILLY [1] - 3:12 once [2] - 41:23, O'Sullivan [5] - 7:3, 48.29 10:21, 10:26, 43:17, **ONE** [1] - 3:17 one [24] - 7:20, 9:2, objective [1] - 60:22 9:10, 12:21, 14:17, obligation [1] - 56:22 17:3, 22:2, 34:11, observed [1] - 43:20 obvious [8] - 22:1,

17:3, 22:2, 34:11, 36:17, 37:27, 38:1, 39:5, 39:13, 39:16, 44:25, 44:28, 54:4, 56:19, 58:24, 60:20, 64:7, 66:8, 67:11, 72:21 ongoing [2] - 16:19, 43:25 onwards [1] - 69:23 open [9] - 16:29, 21:14, 21:20, 21:24, 22:5, 22:15, 22:16, 31:3

48:5 openly [1] - 9:11 opinion [9] - 9:25, 9:29, 10:2, 25:7, 25:8, 33:11, 33:12, 66:18 opinions [1] - 32:26

opened [2] - 21:14,

opportunity [8] - 11:28, 20:12, 41:22, 43:1, 43:3, 49:21, 53:29, 64:25

opposed [1] - 45:1 option [2] - 36:13, 55:17

order [1] - 67:12 ordinary [3] - 71:16, 73:4, 73:24

organisation [1] -8:1 original [3] - 42:29,

44:11, 59:24 originally [2] - 42:2, 47:24

Orla [1] - 8:11

OSMOND [2] - 2:19, 2:24 ostensibly [1] -23:17 **OTHER** [1] - 1:4 otherwise [4] -21:25, 48:6, 59:12, 60:21 ought [8] - 11:4, 11:9, 19:25, 19:26, 19:27, 25:18, 25:22, 34:11 outside [2] - 11:26, 18.2 overriding [1] -56:22 overtly [2] - 53:1, 53:16

overwhelmed [1] -12:4

own [6] - 13:9, 22:22, 51:25, 55:20, 57:20, 72:5

Ρ

PAC [2] - 16:5, 25:26

PAGE[1] - 5:2 page [15] - 6:10, 22:26, 23:10, 23:11, 31:2, 35:21, 35:23, 38:1, 41:20, 46:21, 54:2, 54:4, 55:23 pages [2] - 20:1, 63:8 palm [1] - 34:15 papers [2] - 70:16, 74:15 paragraph [8] - 31:8, 37:25, 37:27, 38:3, 38:6, 38:8, 38:11, 38:16 paragraphs [6] -35:25, 37:21, 48:3, 48:10, 50:15, 63:22 paranoia [1] - 29:10 pardon [1] - 68:3 PARLIAMENT[1] part [8] - 24:26, 40:4, 62:9, 63:9, 66:29, 67:1, 67:8, 74:6 particular [12] - 9:21. 9:26, 10:13, 22:8, 22:12, 34:12, 35:7, 35:14, 40:20, 55:21, 67:27, 72:18 particularly [2] -

20:29, 39:8

parties [16] - 56:20, 56:21, 67:11, 67:18, 68:25, 69:6, 69:8, 69:12, 69:13, 69:16, 69:26, 71:4, 71:17, 71:20, 71:25, 74:8 **PARTNERS**[1] - 3:9 party [4] - 43:29, 61:7, 61:27, 61:28 pass [1] - 71:25 PASSED [1] - 1:5 paths [1] - 73:11 PATRICK [2] - 2:6, 2.22 **PAUL** [2] - 2:10, 4:1 Pearse [4] - 14:22, 14:25, 14:29, 15:22 peculiar [1] - 27:21 pedantic [1] - 50:21 PEMBROKE [1] -3:21 penalty [1] - 38:2 people [17] - 9:11, 11:15, 11:21, 11:26, 12:25, 29:7, 29:18, 56:18, 58:22, 59:2, 59:10, 60:6, 72:8, 72:28, 73:13, 73:19, 74:8 people's [1] - 14:5 percent [2] - 30:12, 38.25 perfectly [3] - 34:11, 74:12, 74:13 perhaps [21] - 9:24, 10:8, 11:2, 11:4, 11:9, 13:8, 17:3, 18:2, 20:9, 21:2, 26:5, 27:23, 28:1, 33:8, 40:9, 52:9, 56:17, 57:14, 64:14, 69:26, 72:24 period [1] - 43:25 person [15] - 11:17,

23:3, 31:9, 32:22,

50:26, 51:12, 52:1,

52:13, 52:14, 52:21,

52:27, 53:21, 57:17,

personal [15] - 7:28,

8:5, 9:25, 9:29, 10:2,

21:12, 21:16, 21:23,

19:6, 19:9, 19:11,

21:29, 44:8, 67:25

personally [3] -

11:25, 12:19, 35:27

personnel [2] - 70:6,

persons [1] - 57:13

PETER [4] - 1:12,

pertinently [1] - 46:3

66:25, 74:18

		<u> </u>		
2:2, 2:4, 3:5	47:12	37:26	Q	recently [2] - 15:13,
philosophy[1] - 72:6	predict [1] - 74:5	progress [1] - 10:21		16:20
phone [11] - 21:28,	preferable [1] - 28:7	proper [1] - 54:3		recognised [1] -
26:24, 36:21, 36:29,	preliminary [2] -	properly [1] - 53:27	quandary [1] - 49:26	64:16
37:1, 40:29, 48:22,	73:8, 73:13	proposed [2] - 23:5,	QUAY [3] - 2:12,	recollect [2] - 31:21,
48:24, 48:25, 65:15	prepared [2] - 16:15,	27:13	3:10, 3:17	44:17
phoned [2] - 37:8,	16:17	proposition [1] -	questions [8] - 14:6,	recollection [14] -
37:9	preparing [1] - 16:9	57:12	43:6, 43:14, 45:12,	11:12, 13:13, 13:25,
phones [1] - 70:22	presence [2] - 11:11,	protect [10] - 57:5,	51:27, 62:2, 62:4,	15:4, 15:8, 15:10,
pick [1] - 36:21	31:4	57:13, 65:26, 66:10,	68:13	22:10, 22:11, 36:15,
picture [2] - 39:14,	present [1] - 13:23	66:12, 66:16, 66:20,	quick [1] - 48:5	42:7, 48:16, 48:17,
39:27	presented [3] - 9:8,	67:2, 67:8, 67:9	quickly [1] - 61:29	50:2, 55:27
piece [4] - 29:11,	51:5, 51:6	PROTECTED [2] -	quite [9] - 15:7, 16:7,	record [13] - 19:25,
51:22, 63:4, 73:1	presenting [1] - 12:4	1:3, 1:4	30:8, 32:5, 36:2,	40:2, 40:6, 56:3,
PLACE[1] - 3:24	Press [4] - 25:18,	protected [5] - 7:21,	38:22, 38:26, 42:26,	56:11, 56:13, 56:15,
place [8] - 29:19,	34:15, 60:14, 70:7	16:16, 16:17, 57:18,	59:29	56:16, 56:17, 56:19,
35:11, 42:28, 46:18,	press [2] - 14:8, 34:2	67:24	quote [1] - 53:11	58:10, 59:25, 71:7
48:18, 48:19, 48:21,	pressure [2] - 12:10,	protecting [5] - 57:4,	quoted [1] - 56:29	record' [1] - 55:28
48:27	12:12	57:9, 57:10, 65:26,		recorded [3] - 47:16,
plausible [1] - 53:18	previous [1] - 56:29	67:19	R	53:27, 62:23
plural [1] - 63:17	previously [7] - 9:4,	protection [3] - 7:7,		records [4] - 37:7,
plus [1] - 12:22	12:15, 13:7, 14:18,	52:24, 67:18	radar [1] - 58:5	50:8, 65:18, 70:7
point [20] - 24:15,	41:21, 49:3, 49:29	Protection [1] - 38:7	radio [4] - 29:15,	redacted [2] - 72:23,
27:18, 29:23, 35:18,	primarily [2] - 7:22,	provide [2] - 19:14,	32:25, 37:26, 46:15	73:1
36:27, 39:4, 42:14,	57:14	49:1	raise [2] - 72:28,	REDDY [1] - 3:24
44:24, 49:23, 49:25,	principally [3] - 8:21,	provided [6] - 17:16,	73:19	refer [5] - 9:26,
51:15, 57:8, 57:27,	70:4, 70:20	27:24, 49:17, 51:16,	raised [1] - 72:24	22:22, 22:24, 56:28,
57:28, 58:7, 58:27,	private [23] - 6:16,	51:23, 55:28	rang [1] - 41:12	64:15
63:15, 67:25, 72:5, 74:12	6:25, 6:26, 7:5, 7:24,	providing[1] - 52:25	rank [2] - 8:5, 17:11	reference [17] - 6:15,
	8:7, 21:6, 21:13,	prudent [1] - 54:12	rather [2] - 47:4, 51:2	17:6, 17:18, 17:26, 19:7, 19:9, 19:11,
pointed [1] - 18:17	21:16, 21:22, 23:12,	Public [3] - 16:3,	RE [2] - 5:7, 63:25	19:7, 19:9, 19:11,
pointing [1] - 33:27	24:4, 24:12, 24:14,	34:6, 61:25	RE-EXAMINED [2] -	45:14, 46:3, 50:15,
points [1] - 50:23	24:16, 24:23, 47:22,	public [16] - 7:18,	5:7, 63:25	52:14, 59:27, 62:16,
police [1] - 7:20	47:24, 51:20, 51:28,	7:19, 9:17, 24:14, 24:26, 24:28, 24:29,	read [6] - 15:12,	72:18
policy [1] - 8:7	61:17, 73:16, 73:26 privately[1] - 31:6	25:2, 25:6, 25:7,	40:4, 40:27, 50:20,	referenced [3] -
pool [1] - 41:17 port [1] - 41:13	privilege [1] - 72:7	51:17, 52:23, 69:4,	55:24, 71:28	45:27, 46:2, 46:4
position [4] - 9:13,	probability [1] -	69:8, 72:5, 73:23	readily [1] - 52:29	referred [5] - 25:18,
9:14, 13:18, 57:20	54:28	publications [1] -	reads [1] - 42:8	34:20, 34:21, 41:21,
positions [1] - 8:4	problems [2] - 9:15,	70:15	realisation [1] - 59:6	55:10
positive [1] - 32:7	12:4	publicly [2] - 40:1,	realised [1] - 34:22	referring [2] - 34:2,
possibilities [1] -	proceedings [4] -	60:5	reality [2] - 29:19,	34:5
39:6	27:14, 48:29, 55:4,	PURCELL [1] - 2:22	35:9	refers [2] - 57:1, 57:2
possibility [2] - 39:9,	60:25	purpose [5] - 36:6,	really [11] - 15:23,	reflect [1] - 16:26
48:18	process [4] - 18:3,	36:7, 36:24, 51:3,	15:29, 26:6, 28:24,	reflects [1] - 33:8
possible [3] - 68:25,	55:1, 56:12, 65:29	60:2	28:28, 32:19, 41:29,	regard [3] - 9:23,
69:24, 71:4	produce [1] - 49:11	pursue [2] - 64:9,	61:10, 71:10	12:15, 71:26
possibly [6] - 16:17,	produced [2] -	64:12	reason [10] - 27:1,	regardless [1] -
18:16, 25:21, 26:13,	48:10, 65:1	put [19] - 13:20,	32:13, 34:13, 36:25,	38:27
38:26, 44:23	professional [2] -	21:15, 24:25, 27:26,	37:1, 39:19, 40:20,	regards [2] - 24:29,
post [7] - 21:7,	8:14, 13:27	29:17, 34:25, 39:15,	40:21, 41:29, 66:29	56:10
21:12, 21:20, 22:11,	professionally [1] -	39:23, 41:13, 42:19,	reasonably [1] - 8:16	reged [1] - 41:15
47:16, 47:26, 58:1	43:17	46:1, 50:18, 51:8,	reasons [2] - 31:17,	register [9] - 18:10,
pre [1] - 16:5	programme [8] -	56:8, 58:22, 59:28,	73:25	18:14, 21:15, 21:22,
pre-PAC [1] - 16:5	45:20, 45:23, 45:27,	62:17, 62:27, 63:4	receive [1] - 69:15	42:15, 42:19, 47:16,
preceding [1] - 47:12	45:29, 46:14, 46:26,	putting [3] - 39:15,	received [6] - 18:8,	47:27, 58:1
precipitated [1] -	49:7, 68:7	39:27, 57:12	19:20, 19:27, 22:21,	registered [2] -
71:9	programmes [1] -		23:1, 23:5	41:15, 62:18
precision [1] - 62:13	32:25		receives [1] - 59:14	REGISTRAR[1] - 2:4
predicated [1] -	programmes [1] -		receiving [1] - 52:14	registrar [1] - 71:14

regret [1] - 33:3 respect [3] - 49:2, 48:14 30:18, 34:12 shall [1] - 42:17 reins [1] - 10:21 53:24, 53:25 **RTÉ** [2] - 45:20, sending [1] - 52:13 **SHANE** [1] - 2:14 related [2] - 57:4, respectfully [2] -70:28 senior [2] - 11:8, shape [2] - 41:11, 65:25 50:22. 57:28 **rule** [1] - 73:4 61:25 45.8 respond [4] - 27:12, ruled [1] - 73:18 **sense** [10] - 9:18, SHIP [2] - 2:20, 2:25 relating [7] - 69:1, 70:4, 70:15, 70:17, 32:14, 34:23, 51:22 ruling [1] - 72:27 10:8, 12:2, 17:4, short [1] - 15:28 20:10, 28:22, 28:23, 70:20, 70:26, 70:27 responded [1] - 59:7 rumours [8] - 9:5, show [9] - 11:26, relation [38] - 7:10, responding [2] -9:6, 12:16, 12:21, 33:7, 56:19, 71:28 20:18, 23:23, 23:25, sent [12] - 8:22, 18:4, 8:21, 9:6, 10:1, 10:22, 48:6, 50:28 12:28, 12:29, 13:10, 27:25, 38:2, 53:26, 12:17, 12:21, 14:28, 23:3, 23:9, 28:11, response [43] -43:28 59:24, 64:15 18:4, 19:3, 24:3, 18:20, 18:22, 18:24, 38:28, 40:3, 55:13, rung [1] - 41:3 **shown** [1] - 18:12 24:12, 25:25, 27:7, 18:25, 18:26, 18:27, 63:2, 65:9, 68:8, shows [1] - 41:10 27:13, 29:3, 39:14, 18:28, 19:2, 23:2, 72:22 S sic [1] - 42:8 40:22, 41:5, 41:27, 23:5, 25:10, 28:19, sergeant [3] - 14:24, side [5] - 7:16, 9:24, 42:13, 54:18, 59:19, 14:25, 14:26 30:11, 30:18, 33:19, 39:22, 39:23, 66:8 **SAINT**[2] - 3:31, 4:3 60:11, 61:12, 63:5, 33:22, 34:17, 35:29, Sergeant [61] - 9:23, significance [2] sample [1] - 72:2 63:11, 67:20, 68:29, 36:1, 36:3, 36:13, 9:28, 10:6, 10:10, 12:20 71:29 sat [1] - 10:29 69:2, 69:4, 70:10, 36:17, 36:18, 36:20, 10:26, 10:29, 11:5, significant [1] - 61:1 Saturday [5] - 20:18, 71:22, 72:16, 72:24, 36:28, 37:22, 37:24, 11:28, 12:1, 12:17, similarly [2] - 17:23, 20:26, 23:21, 26:25, 73:16, 73:26, 74:18 40:5, 40:15, 41:23, 13:1, 13:20, 16:25, 32:10 relationship [5] -51:10, 51:11, 54:26, 19:28, 20:3, 23:12, simply [2] - 15:16, saw [2] - 35:15, 8:12, 8:14, 13:26, 58:3, 59:16, 60:23, 24:4, 24:13, 24:17, 33:26 28:4, 61:24 37:13 61:29, 64:2, 66:12, 24:23, 26:8, 28:11, Siochana [1] - 59:20 **SC** [14] - 2:6, 2:6, relative [1] - 60:19 66:14, 67:4, 68:10 30:10, 30:11, 33:9, SIR [1] - 3:17 2:9. 2:10. 2:14. 2:15. relevance [2] responses [1] - 35:2 33:20, 37:22, 39:21, sit [3] - 11:13, 59:9, 2:15, 2:22, 2:27, 3:2, 71:22, 73:6 responsibilities [1] -39:23, 39:24, 40:5, 69:23 3:5, 3:23, 3:26, 3:29 41:21, 41:25, 41:27, relevant [8] - 33:14, 12:22 **sitting** [3] - 14:4, scenes [1] - 71:15 42:13, 43:25, 44:6, 50:23, 68:25, 69:12, responsibility [4] -28:15, 56:7 scheduled [1] -44:21, 44:23, 45:1, 70:10, 70:19, 71:4, 8:7, 8:9, 30:22, 57:11 sittings [2] - 68:22, 68:19 45:5, 50:28, 53:27, 71:18 rest [1] - 7:29 69:22 screen [2] - 22:22, remain [1] - 20:25 result [1] - 51:13 57:14, 58:2, 59:27, **situation** [1] - 64:20 50:18 62:19, 63:4, 63:6, remaining [1] - 68:24 results [1] - 72:10 six [2] - 44:25, 44:28 scrutiny [1] - 54:27 63:20, 66:11, 66:13, remarkable [2] resume [2] - 68:22, slant [1] - 27:26 **SEAN** [1] - 2:11 66:16, 67:2, 67:8, 13:15, 44:29 69.22 $\textbf{slightly} \ [2] - 25.5,$ SEANAD[1] - 1:6 67:12, 67:13, 67:16, remember [13] -**RESUMED** [1] - 6:1 46:23 second [3] - 37:25, 67:21, 67:23, 67:26 11:12, 13:16, 15:13, retirement [2] - 6:24, SMITHFIELD [1] -58:1, 72:15 sergeants [1] - 21:10 15:15, 15:16, 15:20, series [1] - 40:13 15:21, 31:25, 39:10. secondly [1] - 73:6 retrieved [1] - 41:25 so.. [1] - 28:9 secret [1] - 21:13 seriously [1] - 74:15 39:11, 49:24, 58:23, return [2] - 40:6, social [2] - 8:17, 8:18 secretary [7] - 6:16, serve [2] - 68:24, 68:26 41:17 **SOLE** [2] - 1:12, 2:2 6:25, 6:26, 7:5, 7:24, remembering [1] -70.2 returned [2] - 39:2, solicitor [19] - 8:23, 8:8, 28:16 served [4] - 69:12. 48:19 40:28 25:10, 26:9, 26:12, Secretary [1] - 22:3 69:13, 69:28, 70:1 reply [1] - 29:14 revelation [1] - 61:8 27:11, 28:17, 28:18, security [1] - 7:7 service [2] - 70:21, reporting [1] - 12:23 reviewed [1] - 44:24 29:12, 30:8, 51:22, see [24] - 20:7, 72.5 reports [1] - 70:20 rife [1] - 12:16 51:24, 53:22, 57:6, representation [2] -20:12, 22:5, 22:18, Service [1] - 21:10 right-hand [1] - 7:16 59:3, 59:15, 59:17, 30:2, 31:8, 34:29, services [1] - 55:10 69:14, 69:17 ring [1] - 65:20 65:28, 66:5, 71:12 36:4, 39:13, 41:6, Services [1] - 1:25 representatives [2] ringing [1] - 50:10 SOLICITOR [1] - 2:7 44:5, 51:25, 51:26, 7:19, 55:9 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:30 RIVERSIDE [1] **solicitor's** [1] - 60:23 53:15, 56:5, 57:1, serving [1] - 54:22 represented [1] -3:17 SOLICITOR'S [2] -57:21, 57:23, 58:12, session [1] - 73:26 71:20 **ROAD** [1] - 3:3 2:19, 2:23 60:6, 65:16, 65:21, representing [1] -ROGERSON'S [1] set [5] - 25:27, 29:2, SOLICITORS [8] -72:3 45:16, 50:10, 60:22 60.9 2:29, 3:6, 3:9, 3:13, seeing [2] - 11:22, sets [1] - 24:18 reputational [1] role [3] - 8:8, 16:12, 3:20, 3:24, 3:30, 4:1 59:29 69:19 setting [2] - 36:24, 71:24 **solicitors** [1] - 27:19 seeking [4] - 25:19, request [2] - 30:9, roles [1] - 7:21 solve [1] - 9:14 54:13, 57:13, 69:11 51:14 several [4] - 11:1, room [1] - 13:23 someone [2] - 49:23, seem [3] - 25:1, 49:5, 11:19, 32:25, 37:26 RESOLUTIONS [1] rooting [1] - 58:19 72:4 50:7 **SEÁN** [1] - 3:16 1:5 route [1] - 55:14 sometimes [1] send [3] - 21:21, SGT [1] - 2:9 resort [1] - 55:18 row [2] - 24:27, 21:29

SUPERINTENDENT somewhat [2] -STENOGRAPHY[1] **TAYLOR**[2] - 2:27, 68:4, 68:9 27:21, 29:18 - 1:30 [2] - 5:3, 6:7 3:2 three-and-a-half [2] soon [1] - 71:4 stenography [1] -Superintendent [14] Taylor [11] - 14:8, 41:20, 63:8 - 6:4, 6:9, 14:8, 14:12, **sorry** [13] - 6:27, 1:25 14:12, 34:14, 43:13, thrown [1] - 28:2 **still** [5] - 31:19, 29.4 34.14 43.13 60:10. 60:20. 61:9. 22:26, 24:6, 33:17, tight [1] - 46:1 42:29, 46:1, 46:6, 34:29, 48:23, 63:16 60:10, 60:11, 60:20, 68:5, 70:5, 70:13, **TO** [2] - 64:8, 74:21 61:9, 70:5, 70:11, 70.23 54:2, 56:14, 57:7, stinted [1] - 71:27 today [4] - 53:25, 58:17, 64:26, 68:3 stood [1] - 18:3 70:23 Taylor's [2] - 60:11, 58:16, 68:19, 68:25 sort [2] - 20:6, 71:22 superintendent [19] 70.11 story [1] - 14:29 together [2] - 8:17, - 6:12, 8:6, 8:10, 8:11, team [3] - 35:2, 58.6 sorted [2] - 21:8, straight [1] - 7:14 21.9 17:10, 20:20, 21:18, 64:11, 72:9 took [9] - 10:21, strange [2] - 28:27, sought [2] - 26:1, 28:14, 31:29, 39:7, technical [1] - 70:17 39:20, 40:17, 42:29, 28:28 72:21 43:10, 58:17, 60:2, telephone [10] -46:18, 48:19, 48:21, stranger [1] - 28:26 62:8, 63:27, 65:22, **sound** [1] - 74:4 straws [1] - 57:27 34:20, 35:11, 37:7, 58:19, 64:24 45.14 50.8 50.13 **speaking** [2] - 27:7, STREET [9] - 2:20, topical [1] - 32:26 supplemental [2] -50:14, 60:12, 60:29, total [1] - 16:22 2:25, 2:30, 3:6, 3:13, 20:13, 20:21 65:18 specific [3] - 13:25, 3:21, 3:28, 3:31, 4:2 touch [3] - 29:18, **supply** [1] - 46:17 27:17, 56:9 television [1] - 32:25 34:13, 35:9 Street [4] - 14:22, supporter [4] tend [1] - 40:13 specifically [1] -14:25, 15:1, 15:22 touching [3] - 13:19, 31:21, 34:27, 35:1, tens [1] - 58:20 60.15 stretches [1] - 20:1 16:25, 17:6 spent [3] - 11:24, 36:11 term [1] - 6:15 towards [4] - 11:2, strong [4] - 29:1, 26:24, 46:9 **suppose** [10] - 7:26, termed [1] - 62:19 33:9, 33:20, 53:12 32:18, 32:21, 73:25 spoken [5] - 13:4, 7:28, 10:16, 12:29, strongly [2] - 57:28, terms [9] - 8:12, transcript [2] - 1:26, 13:4, 46:24, 49:27, 20:19, 20:25, 23:21, 8:15, 16:1, 17:6, 51:6, 25:26 58:7 55:9, 69:11, 72:4 73:7, 73:8, 73:9 23:23 studied [1] - 30:2 transcripts [1] supposed [1] - 53:20 **spotlight** [1] - 70:7 test [1] - 73:3 subject [5] - 13:19, 15:13 spread [1] - 12:21 **SUPREME** [2] - 1:13, testimony [2] transferred [2] -30:19, 38:2, 54:21, spring [1] - 49:22 54:27 45:18, 59:12 6:25, 7:6 **SUPT** [1] - 2:27 **SQUARE**[1] - 3:10 submissions [8] text [1] - 65:9 TRIBUNAL [3] - 1:3, surely [2] - 28:21, St [1] - 68:20 68:29, 69:3, 69:7, THE [13] - 1:4, 1:8, 2:6, 74:21 1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6. **staff** [5] - 11:16, 69:9, 69:25, 72:21, **Tribunal** [31] - 6:10, surprise [5] - 20:28, 2:14, 6:1, 43:8, 62:6, 14:28, 15:17, 16:23, 12:6, 21:9, 21:10, 73:27. 74:9 26:29, 27:4, 27:8, 71:14 subsequent [1] -63:25, 68:16, 74:21 17:7, 17:9, 17:14, 55.8 themselves [4] - 9:8, 17:17, 17:24, 18:1, stage [2] - 54:1, surprised [2] -69:26 subsequently [4] -12:5, 21:25, 71:19 18:3, 20:21, 41:10, 27:29, 28:6 **THEN** [2] - 68:16, 44:4, 44:11, 48:28, **stairway** [1] - 7:13 7:3, 10:20, 23:25, surrounding [1] -49:4, 49:10, 58:16, 48:10 74:21 stall [1] - 25:27 10.9 64:1, 64:4, 64:11, starts [1] - 32:22 thereafter [2] - 7:2, substantial [1] swear [2] - 15:8, 64:22, 68:22, 68:29, **STATE**[2] - 2:19, 10:21 38:25 69:2, 69:10, 71:12, subterfuge [2] therefore [6] - 40:16, 2:23 swept [1] - 20:6 42:1, 45:24, 55:13, 71:21, 72:9, 73:11 56:26, 56:27 state [1] - 32:20 **SWORN** [1] - 6:8 59:28, 73:8 **TRIBUNALS** [1] - 1:9 succeeding [1] statement [19] -70:27 system [3] - 38:2, thereto [2] - 69:20, true [1] - 15:9 6:10, 6:22, 14:11, 17:17, 17:24, 20:13, sued [1] - 66:23 41:14, 42:15 70:12 trumpet [1] - 74:4 systems [2] - 70:18, 20:21, 43:28, 44:4, suggest [9] - 19:19, third [3] - 52:21, **try** [6] - 10:3, 29:2, 70.25 29:21, 35:16, 43:1, 44:11, 47:21, 48:28, 40:14, 50:22, 51:5, 56:21, 57:17 Síochána [17] -52.19 thirdly [1] - 58:2 49:9, 54:3, 56:8, 53:16, 57:17, 57:28, 14:18, 26:13, 30:21, trying [10] - 9:14, 56:29, 64:1, 70:11, THOMAS [1] - 3:29 58:13 67:7 34:27, 36:11, 54:23, 9:17, 9:20, 10:13, 70:13 suggested [4] thorn [1] - 9:24 57:2, 57:5, 57:10, statements [5] -11:10, 11:12, 14:29, thoughts [3] - 36:28, 10:18, 28:5, 28:7, 60:3, 65:27, 66:6, 36:14, 41:7, 56:11 14:11, 58:6, 70:6, 65:18 51:24, 51:25 66:7, 66:9, 66:21, TUESDAY [2] - 1:18, 70:9, 70:21 suggesting [7] thousand [2] - 41:20, 66:26, 67:13 stating [1] - 30:13 11:8, 50:24, 57:21, 63:8 **turn** [1] - 70:2 stations [2] - 11:15, 61:23, 66:28, 67:3, thousands [1] -T 67:6 58:20 turns [1] - 38:1 11:26 TV [1] - 37:26 **statistics** [1] - 34:16 suggestion [1] threat [1] - 48:29 two [14] - 7:12, 8:4, 49.22 **steer** [1] - 46:14 threatening [1] tabbed [1] - 45:9 suing [1] - 28:19 15:6, 15:15, 21:10, stems [1] - 34:21 60.24 TARA[1] - 2:27 24:27, 57:19, 63:26, stenographic [1] sullied [1] - 44:2 three [6] - 15:6, target [1] - 12:25 SUNLIGHT [1] - 2:29 21:10, 41:20, 63:8, 65:9, 67:11, 68:7, 1:27

70:27, 72:12, 74:1	UPPER [1] - 3:21	WALSH [2] - 5:3, 6:7	35:29, 36:3, 47:1,
twofold [2] - 67:10	upsetting [1] - 73:12	Walsh' [2] - 42:18,	47:11, 50:26, 51:12,
type [1] - 28:4		42:20	52:21
•• · · ·	upstairs [1] - 7:14		_ ·
typed [11] - 35:22,	utilised [1] - 40:19	Walsh's [1] - 6:9	wrote [3] - 17:9,
37:17, 37:20, 38:24,	utterly [3] - 28:22,	WAS [4] - 6:8, 43:8,	42:2, 49:10
50:19, 52:6, 58:14,	28:29, 29:1	62:6, 63:25	
59:17, 59:18, 63:21		week [8] - 27:10,	Y
types [1] - 13:10	V	27:14, 27:15, 27:19,	
typing [1] - 41:17		68:20, 68:21, 74:11,	
3,p9(1)		74:14	year [1] - 58:28
- 11	vague [1] - 15:4	weeks [2] - 72:12,	years [4] - 13:7,
U	value [1] - 64:10		15:6, 15:18, 50:1
	various [5] - 11:15,	74:1	yourself [2] - 30:3,
ultimately [1] - 73:3	21:12, 44:26, 59:2,	well-disposed [1] -	52:28
		32:16	32.20
unattributable [1] -	60:12	well-known [1] -	É
52:12	vast [1] - 71:14	28:18	E
unattributed [1] -	venture [1] - 26:5	WHELAN [1] - 2:16	
52:2	venue [1] - 71:10	whistleblowers [1] -	ÉIDEANN AIG
unavailability [1] -	veracity [1] - 59:12	10:22	ÉIREANN [2] - 1:5,
71:9	verbatim [4] - 1:26,	-	1:6
unaware [3] - 45:15,	37:27, 38:8, 38:23	whole [2] - 33:2,	,
52:15, 68:10	' '	72:16	Ó
1	version [7] - 38:24,	WILLIAMS[1] - 4:1	
uncovered [1] -	50:19, 52:6, 59:18,	Wilson [3] - 14:28,	
16:24	60:4, 63:22	15:5, 15:7	Ó [1] - 3:12
UNDER [2] - 1:3, 1:9	versus [1] - 48:19	WILSON [1] - 3:5	
under [5] - 12:10,	view [21] - 26:5,	wind [1] - 57:27	
12:12, 20:6, 62:23,	26:19, 26:22, 31:15,	wish [5] - 11:22,	
66:26	33:8, 36:27, 39:16,	22:24, 29:24, 59:24,	
understandable [1] -	39:21, 40:9, 40:22,		
18:2	44:10, 52:29, 53:2,	73:13	
unfortunately [4] -	56:13, 56:15, 62:15,	wished [2] - 10:2,	
45:10, 59:8, 59:9	67:26, 71:4, 72:5,	25:24	
unit [2] - 7:7, 15:5	73:8, 73:13	withdrew [1] - 61:26	
1	· ·	WITHDREW [1] -	
unless [2] - 21:25,	views [4] - 12:14,	68:16	
56:21	32:7, 38:7	WITNESS [5] - 5:2,	
unnecessarily [1] -	visible [1] - 53:23	43:8, 62:6, 63:25,	
50:20	visit [2] - 53:26,	68:16	
unnecessary [1] -	64:28	witnesses [1] -	
73:12	voice [2] - 32:26,	68:19	
unofficially [1] -	50:25		
40:14	Volume [2] - 22:24,	wonder [2] - 50:18,	
unpaginated [1] -	70:5	51:18	
71:2	volume [9] - 12:7,	wondering [1] - 34:9	
	69:11, 70:8, 70:10,	word [8] - 28:20,	
unreasonable [1] -		30:14, 30:15, 32:18,	
74:18	70:16, 70:19, 70:25,	32:21, 59:1, 67:9,	
unseen [1] - 52:12	71:1	71:11	
untraceable [2] -	volumes [12] - 22:11,	words [10] - 24:25,	
52:3, 52:4	69:15, 69:18, 69:27,	34:10, 46:12, 46:13,	
untraced [1] - 52:12	69:28, 70:1, 70:3,	48:12, 51:1, 56:17,	
unusual [6] - 27:22,	70:13, 70:27, 70:28	66:6, 72:26	
28:2, 30:16, 45:4,	volunteered [1] -	1	
51:29	49:19	worried [1] - 12:7	
up [21] - 9:15, 11:23,	vulnerable [1] -	write [5] - 36:12,	
21:11, 26:10, 30:20,	46:16	36:15, 36:16, 36:18,	
30:24, 31:27, 35:22,	13.10	54:12	
	14/	writes [1] - 27:11	
36:21, 36:24, 46:17,	W	writing [8] - 18:23,	
50:10, 50:18, 54:18,		26:6, 33:26, 34:1,	
57:28, 59:18, 61:4,	waiting [1] - 29:22	34:4, 34:13, 52:1,	
66:4, 70:29, 74:11	WALLACE[1] - 2:23	53:21	
update [1] - 39:3		written [8] - 27:13,	
	Walsh [1] - 6:4	[]	
		1	I