TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE ON THURSDAY, 5TH OCTOBER 2017 - DAY 32

32

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES APPEARANCES

MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT SOLE MEMBER: **REGISTRAR:** MR. PETER KAVANAGH FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR. DIARMAID MCGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. KATHLEEN LEADER BL MS. ELIZABETH MULLAN, SOLICITOR MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC FOR THE COMMISSIONER: MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL MR. NOEL WHELAN BL MR. JOHN FITZGERALD BL MS. KATHY DONALD **INSTRUCTED BY:** CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE **OSMOND HOUSE** LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8 MR. PAUL ANTHONY MCDERMOTT SC MS. SARAH MCKECHNIE BL FOR TUSLA: ARTHUR COX **INSTRUCTED BY:** TEN EARLSFORT TERRACE DUBLIN 2 MR. MARK HARTY SC MR. PETER PAUL DALY BL FOR GARDA HARRISON: MR. ANTHONY QUINN BL KILFEATHER & COMPANY SOLICITORS **INSTRUCTED BY:** THE HALLS QUAY STREET GALWAY FOR SUPT. ENGLISH: MR. PADRAIG DWYER SC MR. BRIAN GAGEBY BL MR. CARTHAGE CONLON M.E. HANAHOE SOLICITORS **INSTRUCTED BY:** SUNLIGHT CHAMBERS 21 PARLIAMENT STREET

DUBLIN 2

FOR INSP. SHERIDAN, INSP. DURKIN & SGT. MCGOWAN: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MR. MICHAEL HEGARTY REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

FOR MARISA	SIMMS:	MR. HUGH HARTNETT SC MR. JOSEPH BARNES BL
INSTRUCTED	BY:	MR. MARK MULLANEY MULLANEYS SOLICITORS 1-2 TEELING STREET SLIGO IRELAND

FOR C/SUPT. MCGINN:	MR. CONOR POWER SC MR. CATHAL Ó BRAONÁIN BL
INSTRUCTED BY:	DANIEL SPRING & COMPANY 50 FITZWILLIAM SQUARE
	DUBLIN 2

FOR MS. RITA MCDERMOTT: MR. NIALL O'NEILL BL

SUPERINTENDENT	EUGENE	MCGOVERN	
CROSS-EXAMINED	BY MR.	HARTY	
CROSS-EXAMINED	BY MR.	BARNES	
CROSS-EXAMINED	BY MR.	DIGNAM	
RE-EXAMINED BY	MS. LEA	DER	

THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON THURSDAY, 5TH OCTOBER 2017 AT 1:30PM:

1

2

3

19

MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, we are in a position to 4 5 proceed, and I think Mr. Harty is in a position to 13:35 continue his cross-examination of Superintendent 6 7 However, I should just clarify a number of McGovern. 8 matters arising from yesterday. In accordance with the wishes of the Tribunal, Superintendent McGovern, 9 Superintendent McLoughlin and Chief Superintendent 10 13.35 11 McGinn have furnished additional statements which do 12 deal with the issue concerning the note. And an 13 inquiry has been made with the former Assistant 14 Commissioner Kenny, who is on the far side of the 15 world, and has no, as I understand it, no recollection 13:36 16 of the phone call. But searches are being made as to 17 whether any notes might exist in the regional office. 18 Mr. Dignam has explained that.

20 Insofar as the note of Chief Superintendent McGinn is 13:36 concerned, I should just say that obviously, as a 21 22 matter of precaution, I asked Ms. Leader to check 23 yesterday with Chief Superintendent McGinn about the 24 issue of notes, and I should say, of course, that Chief 25 Superintendent McGinn furnished the note immediately to 13:36 Ms. Leader and did so obviously in the belief that the 26 27 material had, in fact, already been furnished to the 28 Tribunal, and I can say that, in fact, Chief 29 Superintendent McGinn, through Sergeant Duffy, made

available to the Tribunal for inspection and for the 1 2 possession of the Tribunal for such period as was necessary, the volume of materials that Chief 3 Superintendent McGinn had submitted through the 4 5 northern office to HQ. It does appear, and I think it 13.37 6 is accepted, that Chief Superintendent McGinn submitted 7 the note from her diary to Headquarters and it had 8 reached there, and I don't say this in any way as a criticism of Mr. Power, who is acting on behalf of 9 Chief Superintendent McGinn, he told the Tribunal that 10 13.37 11 he believed that the chief superintendent had submitted it to the Tribunal. It didn't, in fact, reach the 12 13 Tribunal, as such, and we didn't receive it in June. 14 And that's obviously what the purposes of our searches 15 were yesterday, to confirm whether that was so. We did 13:37 16 confirm, having thrice searched our papers, that it is 17 not, was not then within the Tribunal's papers.

19 I have been given a very clear explanation by Mr. Dignam as to how it got separated from the 20 13:38 documents that were forwarded. They were being 21 22 categorised into the categories that the Tribunal had sought and, on its face, it didn't appear to relate to 23 the HSE or Tusla, as such, and it didn't get forwarded 24 25 in that context. Mr. Dignam has obviously assured me 13.38 26 that a review is being taken of any material, lest 27 there be any other matter at all, and he has obviously paid heed to the Tribunal's remarks yesterday and is 28 29 renewing, obviously, his pledge of complete cooperation

18

1 and assistance in that regard, and we are obviously 2 very grateful to get that. 3 Subject to anything anyone else may wish to say, I 4 5 think Mr. Harty is in a position to proceed and I was 13:38 6 going to recall Superintendent McGovern for that 7 purpose. 8 MR. POWER: Chairperson, could I just make a comment to the Tribunal, please? First of all, I want to 9 apologise to the Tribunal for a statement that I made 10 13.39 11 yesterday, suggesting, in fact very clearly stating, 12 that the document in question had been provided to the 13 Tribunal in June of 2017. I apologise for that. 14 Tribunal. 15 Mr. Power, there's no need to apologise. CHAIRMAN: 13:39 16 MR. POWER: It was incorrect. 17 Counsel act on their instructions. I CHAIRMAN: 18 completely understand that, that is what you were told, 19 and I actually don't think it is a big deal and there's 20 no need to say anything about it, but thanks. 13:39 MR. POWER: My client, of course, Chief Superintendent 21 22 McGinn, also apologises in that regard. Thank you, 23 Chairperson. 24 Chairman, might I just also express my MR. DIGNAM: 25 gratitude to Mr. McGuinness for having explained the 13.39 situation to the Tribunal and also express the deep 26 27 regret on this side of the house, if I can put it that way, for the error in relation to the documentation. 28 29 We are very conscious that that led to an interruption

1 in the work of the Tribunal yesterday and inconvenience 2 to all concerned, including you, Chairman, and the 3 other parties, and, as I say, that is very much regretted. We have heard and taken on board your 4 5 remarks yesterday and your reminder, Chairman, as to 13:40 6 the necessity for cooperation and assistance, and as 7 Mr. McGuinness has outlined and explained to the 8 Tribunal team, the review of our processes in order to ensure that there isn't this type of error again in the 9 future which leads to any inconvenience or difficulty 10 13.40 11 for the parties or indeed for the work of the Tribunal. 12

13 I might just also take the opportunity, Chairman, to 14 say that the members of An Garda Síochána who were 15 dealing with the discovery and disclosure process acted 13:40 16 at all times bona fides and there's no question of concealment, or anything like that. I just think that 17 is important to say, Chairman. 18 19 CHAIRMAN: Well, I think as I said yesterday, I believe 20 I'm going to go for the chaos theory before the 13:40 conspiracy theory, and the reality of this is, we are 21 22 inundated with documents and it's bound to be case that

something will fall through the cracks. Now, it could
be something is going to be made of it, but Mr. Harty
is entitled to do that in the event that something
emerges that he feels is important. So I think we will
just carry on. I'm not viewing anyone as being either
uncooperative or deceitful. It's just one of these
things.

		MR. DIGNAM: Thank you, Chair.	
		SUPERINTENDENT EUGENE MCGOVERN CONTINUED TO BE	
		CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. HARTY:	
			13:41
1	Q.	MR. HARTY: Good afternoon, Superintendent. Now, we	
		were dealing yesterday when this issue arose with the	
		decision to make the referral to GSOC. Now, can I ask,	
		who made the decision to make the referral to GSOC and	
		on what basis?	13:41
	Α.	I think, Mr. Chairman, I explained, yesterday, on the	
		day the rationale and the decision-making process, I	
		explained that fully, and	
2	Q.	Sorry, I'm not talking about rationale	
	Α.	In relation to the second part of the question, it was	13:41
		a decision that was made after joint discussion between	
		myself and Chief Superintendent McGinn.	
3	Q.	And I take it that the person who made the final	
		decision in those circumstances would have been Chief	
		Superintendent McGinn?	13:42
	Α.	The decision was the decision was reached and I was	
		assigned with the responsibility of making the 102	
		referral because of the fact that the relevant	
		incidents that related to the actual referral had taken	
		place in my district.	13:42
4	Q.	I understand. In relation to that, because An Garda	
		Síochána would not be making, strictly speaking, a	
		section 85 referral, it was certainly decided between	
		yourself and Chief Superintendent McGinn that it would	
	2	A. 2 Q. A. 3 Q. A.	 SUPERINTENDENT EUGENE MCGOVERN CONTINUED TO BE CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. HARTY: 1 Q. MR. HARTY: Good afternoon, Superintendent. Now, we were dealing yesterday when this issue arose with the decision to make the referral to GSOC. Now, can I ask, who made the decision to make the referral to GSOC and on what basis? A. I think, Mr. Chairman, I explained, yesterday, on the day the rationale and the decision-making process, I explained that fully, and 2 Q. Sorry, I'm not talking about rationale A. In relation to the second part of the question, it was a decision that was made after joint discussion between myself and Chief Superintendent McGinn. 3 Q. And I take it that the person who made the final decision in those circumstances would have been Chief Superintendent McGinn? A. The decision was the decision was reached and I was assigned with the responsibility of making the 102 referral because of the fact that the relevant incidents that related to the actual referral had taken place in my district. 4 Q. I understand. In relation to that, because An Garda Siochána would not be making, strictly speaking, a section 85 referral, it was certainly decided between

be a section 102 referral, isn't that correct? 1 2 That was the decision that we came to in relation to Α. the referral of the matter and the referral was made in 3 accordance with section 102. As I explained. 4 5 Mr. Chairman, the decision, if it had been reached, not 13:42 6 to make the referral, then a rationale was -- I had a 7 responsibility to make a rationale in relation to why I 8 didn't make the referral also.

- Okay. You referenced yesterday Circular, HQ Directive 9 5 Q. And I think we now, in fact, have received a 10 10/10.13.43 11 copy of HQ Directive 10/10, which is at page 2484. Now, just from the point of view of background, this is 12 13 a directive that is coming out in 2010 in respect of a 14 part of the Act which came into force on the 9th May 15 2007. That is recited at the top of the document. And 13:43 16 then at paragraph (a) of that, it recites first, yet 17 again, the coming into force of the Act. It then says:
- 19 "Section 102(1) of the Act requires the Garda 20 Commissioner must refer any matter to the Garda 13:44 Síochána Ombudsman Commission when he forms a certain 21 22 view, namely that the matter appears to indicate that a conduct of the member of An Garda Síochána may have 23 24 resulted in the death of or serious harm to a person." 25 13.4426

He then recites section 102. And then on the next page:

28 29

27

18

"The Commissioner has delegated his function under

10

section 102(1) of the Act to members of superintendent
 rank. The Commissioner is empowered to delegate his
 functions under the Act by virtue of the provisions of
 section 31 of the Act.

13:44

The Act provides at section 82 that conduct includes 6 7 both acts and omissions. The death or serious harm 8 must be the result of the conduct of a member of the Garda Síochána. Therefore, there is no obligation to 9 refer a cause of death or serious harm that occurs 10 13.44 11 prior to Garda contact, nor is there a duty to refer in 12 a case of death or serious harm that occurs after the 13 death of the dead or injured person has had contact with the Garda Síochána but where such a death or 14 15 injury is in no way related to the conduct of the 13:45 16 member. The provision speaks of the conduct having resulted in rather than caused death or serious harm. 17 18 The person killed or seriously harmed may be a civilian or a garda. The garda whose conduct forms the basis of 19 20 a section 102(1) referral may be on or off duty." 13:45

22 It then goes on to say:

5

21

23

24 "The definitive interpretation of any of these
25 provisions is a matter for the courts. However, the
26 following is the agreed position of the Garda
27 Commissioner and the Ombudsman Commission as to the
28 state of the law. Serious harm is defined in section
29 82 as follows:

11

2 Creates a substantial risk of death, causes serious 3 disfigurement, causes substantial loss or impairment or mobility of the body as a whole or the function of any 4 5 particular bodily member or organ. This definition 13:45 reflects the conduct of serious harm for the purposes 6 7 of the Non-Fatal offences Against the Person Act 1997 8 (the 1997 Act). There is established case law in the definition of serious harm for the purpose of the act, 9 including the judgment of Mr. Justice Kearns in The 10 13.4611 People (DPP) v. Kirwin, Court of Criminal Appeal, 28th 12 October 2005. Loss or impairment of mobility 13 encompasses the effects of long and short duration. 14 Disfigurement is defined as meaning to spoil the 15 experience of, including scarring. The gender, age, 13:46 16 etcetera, of the person disfigured is inconsequential. 17 One may be disfigured on a location of the body that is 18 usually covered by clothing. Disfigurement connotes an 19 outcome rather than a consequence of a short duration." 20 13:46 It goes on to discuss the '97 Act. But if we then move 21 22 on to the next paragraph: 23

1

24 "However, for the purposes of section 102(1) of the
25 2005 Act, all that is required to activate the Garda 13:46
26 Commissioner's duty to refer is that he forms a view
27 that the conduct of the member may have resulted in
28 serious harm. Therefore, the threshold of knowledge
29 that is required to activate the duty is rather lower

12

1 than the context of the 1997 Act. A superintendent who 2 has to consider a referral under section 102(1) makes 3 the assessment of whether serious harm may have occurred at the time that the circumstances of the 4 5 matters comes to his or her attention. One does not 13:47 have to await the outcome of medical assessment or 6 7 intervention to assess the quality of recovery. The 8 decision to refer a matter rests solely with the Garda Commissioner. The Ombudsman Commission does not and 9 cannot have an involvement in that decision. 10 The Act 13.47 11 requires that the Garda Commissioner must refer a 12 matter where he forms a certain view, namely the matter 13 that appears to him to indicate that the conduct of a 14 member of An Garda Síochána may have resulted in death 15 or serious harm; in other words, the duty to refer 13:47 16 exists from the time the view is formed. Likewise. the decision not to refer a matter is solely for the Garda 17 18 Commissioner. The duty to refer and any subsequent 19 action of the Garda Síochána Ombudsman Commission staff are, in law, two separate and distinct, though 20 13:47 unrelated, issues. By this, it is meant the decision 21 22 to refer is one for the Garda Commissioner. The Act makes no provision for a provisional or courtesy 23 24 referral. Either the matter is referred or not. 25 13.47

The Garda Síochána Ombudsman Commission receive section
102 referrals. There is no question of the
Commissioner pulling in the Garda Síochána Ombudsman
Commission staff. The actions of Garda Síochána

13

Ombudsman Commission on foot of a Section 101(2) 1 2 referral is prescribed by the provisions of the Act. The reaction of the Garda Síochána Ombudsman Commission 3 to a section 102 referral is a matter for the Garda 4 5 Síochána Ombudsman Commission and its investigation 13:48 6 staff, having regard to the provisions of the Act. 7 when a matter comes to the attention of a 8 superintendent and he/she deems it appropriate to consider the matter in the context of a section 102 of 9 10 the 2005 Act, he must complete the form attached at 13.48 11 Annex 1 entitled 'Decision made in consideration of the provisions of section 102(1) of the Garda Síochána Act 12 13 2005'. This form must be completed once the decision 14 is made to either refer the matter or not refer the matter to the Ombudsman Commission. The Garda 15 13:48 16 Commissioner is of the view that in each individual 17 case at the time of the taking of the decision, a 18 superintendent who acts reasonably and reaches a 19 decision in good faith not to refer has done all that 20 can be expected of him or her." 13:49 21

There's then further matters to deal with specific categories in relation to the discharge of weapons, I understand. It is evident from that directive that distress is not covered by the definition of serious harm, isn't that correct?

13.49

- A. The word 'distressed' is not mentioned, yes, in theactual directive.
- 29 6 Q. Because it requires -- would you charge, and are you

14

telling this Tribunal that you would charge somebody 1 2 with an offence of assault causing serious harm in respect of no physical injury having occurred? 3 4 Mr. Chairman, that wouldn't be a decision that I would Α. 5 be in a position to make. That would be a matter for 13:49 the Director of Public Prosecutions. So to relate this 6 7 to a particular criminal investigation, this is a 8 situation where I may refer the matter on the day in 9 relation to a decision in relation to a criminal charge, that's a matter that is referred to the DPP and 13:50 10 11 the DPP makes decisions in all those particular types 12 of situations.

137Q.Is it the practice in the Donegal division to seek14directions for [sic] the DPP in respect of assault15causing serious harm under the Non-Fatal Offences16Against the Person Act where no physical injury has17occurred?

- 18 Mr. Chairman, it's a sort of a hypothetical situation. Α. 19 Where incidents have occurred where injuries have been 20 sustained and a decision needs to be made in relation 13:50 21 to which section under the Non-Fatal Offences Against 22 the Person Act somebody requires to be charged, that 23 matter will be referred to the DPP, and the decision is 24 for the DPP's office to make.
- Q. Where injuries have been sustained. Where no injuries 13:51
 have been sustained, you accept that if they were to
 charge somebody under the Non-Fatal Offences Against
 the Person Act, it would be a section 2 assault because
 there would be no harm?

15

Gwei Malon Stenograpi Service Ltc.

13:50

1		Α.	But there are also sections under the Non-Fatal	
2			Offences Against the Person Act that don't require	
3			injuries to be sustained, and those matters are also	
4			required to be referred to the Director of Public	
5			Prosecutions.	13:51
6	9	Q.	But not in respect of an assault charge causing serious	
7			harm, nobody would think that an assault causing	
8			serious harm could involve distress	
9		Α.	Yes, but	
10	10	Q.	as its constituent factor?	13:51
11		Α.	But a criteria in relation to this particular referral,	
12			what was set out in the actual statement of complaint	
13			that was provided, it was validated and it presented,	
14			as far as I was concerned, and in consultation between	
15			myself and Chief Superintendent McGinn, it created a	13:51
16			substantial risk of death and it's part of the actual	
17			definition of serious harm. As far as we were	
18			concerned, what was presented on the day presented, it	
19			creates a substantial risk of death. We were happy	
20			that what was presented to us created a substantial	13:52
21			risk of death for Ms. Simms in relation to what was	
22			alleged.	
23	11	Q.	What substantial risk of death was there?	
24		Α.	In relation to the threats that were actually made, or	
25			that she alleged were made.	13:52
26	12	Q.	Can you explain to me, Superintendent McGovern, what	
27			function GSOC has in respect of crime prevention?	
28		Α.	This was not an exercise in crime prevention. The	
29			referral of this matter to the Garda Ombudsman	

Commission was for them to do an evaluation in relation 1 2 to whether they deemed it subject of an investigation It was -- this matter referred to the 3 at their level. conduct of a serving member of the Garda Síochána. The 4 5 Garda Ombudsman Commission are an independent authority 13:52 for investigating complaints involving members of An 6 7 Garda Síochána, and, for that reason, this matter was 8 referred to them to evaluate and to make a decision in relation to how this matter should proceed by way of an 9 investigation. 10 13.53 Because there was a serious and substantial risk of 11 13 Q. 12 death? 13 Α. Or harm on the day to the actual person who made the 14 complaint in this matter and her children, Ms. Simms. 15 14 Yes. And you say that in order to protect Ms. Simms Q. 13:53 16 and her family, her children, you were referring the 17 matter to GSOC? 18 No, I didn't say I was referring the matter to GSOC to Α. 19 protect her. I said I was referring the matter to GSOC 20 to make a determination in relation to the 13:53 investigation that required to be undertaken because of 21 22 the fact that the allegations were made against a serving member of An Garda Síochána. 23 24 15 Are you telling me that if there is a situation where a Q. 25 guard is standing outside a building with a loaded gun, 13:53 threatening to shoot somebody inside, that the 26 27 appropriate response for Gardaí up the ranks is to call 28 GSOC? The matter would be referred to GSOC. 29 Α. Yes. Yes.

17

And wait until such time as the GSOC man arrives, and 1 16 Q. 2 if the garda goes into the building and shoots the 3 person, as he has threatened to do, so be it? I think that is a totally different situation where you 4 Α. 5 are dealing with a fluid and active situation. of 13:54 course there would have to be some action to prevent 6 7 that particular situation progressing to a crime. 8 17 This was a fluid and active situation. This was very Ο. serious. This involved a meeting that required two 9 superintendents, a chief superintendent, an inspector, 10 13.54 11 a detective inspector and a garda. It had to be called 12 at short notice. It was very urgent. The threats to 13 kill were very serious. The domestic abuse issues were 14 very serious. This is why you were all there, because 15 it was so urgent. This is perhaps why nobody took any 13:54 16 notes, because you were so busy dealing with the 17 situation on the ground. 18 There were also issues in relation to threats to kill Α. 19 that took place over that particular weekend, and those 20 situations on the day were the subject of assessments 13:54

and crime prevention plans in place. And as I said
previously, that is the reason why Detective Inspector
O'Donnell was present at that particular meeting.
Where were the crime protection plans in respect of
Marisa Simms and her children?

13:55

A. In relation to Marisa Simms, the protection plan for
her children was the referral of the matter to Tusla.
Q. Yet again, and I am just clarifying you with this, that
if a guard is standing outside a building with a gun,

18

2 appropriate response from An Garda Síochána is to call Tusla? 3 No, that's not what I said. You asked me what the 4 Α. 5 protection plans were in place for Marisa Simms and her 13:55 children and I said the referral of the matter to Tusla 6 7 was the protection plan --8 20 Was the protection plan? Ο. 9 -- in relation to her children. Ms. Simms at this Α. moment in time was no longer resident at the actual 10 13.55 11 address where the allegations were made. She was now 12 living at a substantial geographical distance away from 13 this particular --14 21 Ο. we've already discussed this, Superintendent; we both 15 know that geographical distance is no protection 13:55 against domestic abuse. We dealt with this evidence 16 17 yesterday. 18 No, but --Α. 19 22 She wasn't safe if these threats were real, and you Q. 20 know that and I know that. 13:56 Ms. Simms had already been provided with appropriate 21 Α. 22 crime prevention advice. We were aware of the location 23 at this stage where she was residing and crime 24 prevention measures were in place. We would have known 25 where she was and she would have been in a position to 13.56 make contact with a Garda member if she required 26 27 immediate assistance. 28 23 who gave her the crime prevention advice? Q. 29 She was given crime prevention advice in relation to Α.

saying he's about to go in and shoot somebody, the

1

19

1			the initial incidents that were reported by her.	
2	24	Q.	By whom?	
3		Α.	Well, at the time she was given them by Sergeant	
4			Gillespie at the time of the initial reports that she	
5			made.	13:56
6	25	Q.	Oh, the earlier year, is it?	
7		Α.	Yeah, well, she would have been aware of what the	
8			appropriate crime prevention requirements for herself	
9			were in relation to those particular incidents.	
10	26	Q.	It was urgent, Superintendent McGovern, because of the	13:56
11			seriousness of the situation on the ground, that you	
12			all met and discussed this. There's no question that	
13			was your evidence. And what you did in relation to	
14			protecting Marisa Simms from threats to burn, which you	
15			say you took seriously, is, you made a referral to GSOC	13:57
16			so they could perhaps initiate criminal proceedings	
17			against Garda Harrison, or disciplinary proceedings,	
18			and you sent a referral to Tusla. Well, anybody would	
19			expect, if you took those threats seriously, that you	
20			would do something about them yourselves. And the	13:57
21			reason why I am asking these questions is, I want to	
22			know what you did?	
23		Α.	The matter was referred to the Garda Ombudsman	
24			Commission for a decision to be made in relation to	
25			what level of investigations they proposed to undertake	13:57
26			in relation to the matter because a serving Garda	
27			member was involved. As I've indicated yesterday,	
28			there were other urgent matters that required to be	
29			followed up in relation to it and in accordance with	

1			our requirements under section 89 of the Act, and they
2			were being undertaken. In relation to the threats that
3			had taken place in relation to Garda Harrison,
4			Detective Inspector O'Donnell there had been
5			measures already put in place the previous weekend and 13:58
6			Detective Inspector O'Donnell was in charge of that
7			particular investigation. But there was a significant
8			crime prevention plan in place in relation to the
9			address at which
	דר	0	
10	27	Q.	What was the crime prevention plan in respect of Marisa 13:58 Simms?
11			
12		Α.	Marisa Simms was not residing at the address with
13	28	Q.	What was the crime prevention plan in respect of Marisa
14			Simms?
15		Α.	She would have been given crime prevention advice.
16	29	Q.	No, you said there was a significant crime prevention
17			plan. I want to know what it was?
18		Α.	It was at Garda Harrison's address in relation to the
19			threats
20	30	Q.	So if Marisa Simms walked up to went to Garda 13:58
21			Harrison's address in order to get herself burnt by
22			Garda Harrison, you would have been able to deal with
23			it then. What plan was put in place in respect of
24			protecting Marisa Simms from these threats which you
25			were expecting us all to believe you took so seriously? 13:58
26		Α.	The
27	31	Q.	What plan was put in place? I just want an answer to
28			that one question. Tell me what plan you took, put in
29			place to protect Marisa Simms of the threats that you
29			prace to protect marisa stimus of the threats that you

1			were expecting us all with straight faces to accept you	
2			believed?	
3		Α.	The threats already had been made at this particular	
4			stage of the actual investigation. It was now the	
5			subject of an investigation.	13:59
6	32	Q.	Simple answer to the question: Did you put any crime	
7			prevention plans in place in respect of protecting	
8			Marisa Simms from the threats of Garda Keith Harrison?	
9		Α.	Ms. Simms would have been provided with crime	
10			prevention advice in relation	13:59
11	33	Q.	Yes or no?	
12		Α.	Yes, in relation to her own self-protection.	
13	34	Q.	when?	
14		Α.	When she would have spoke to the members at Letterkenny	
15			Garda Station, she would have been given crime	13:59
16			prevention advice at that particular stage.	
17	35	Q.	No, she wasn't.	
18		Α.	Well, I understood	
19	36	Q.	Inspector Sheridan was in the room with you on the 8th	
20			October. She never said she gave her any crime	13:59
21			protection advice.	
22		Α.	It would be normal	
23	37	Q.	Sergeant McGowan never said she gave her any protection	
24			advice. It would have been normal this is a	
25			situation where you are all you are expecting us to	14:00
26			believe these threats were definitely made seriously	
27			and were taken seriously by An Garda Síochána. The	
28			first thing I would expect An Garda Síochána to do, if	
29			a threat, death threat is made against me, is, I would	

1 expect them to take steps to make sure it isn't carried 2 out. 3 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harty, just on a point of clarification, it may help, but, then again, I actually may be wrong 4 5 about this because I didn't pay a huge amount of 14:00 6 attention, but I thought that after the first incident which we have minimised because there was two 7 interpretations possible, that is to say the distressed 8 husband --9 10 MR. HARTY: Yes. 14.0011 CHAIRMAN: -- that there was some advice given --12 MR. HARTY: There was at that stage. 13 CHAIRMAN: -- in relation to that. I thought that was 14 what the superintendent was actually referring to in 15 saying the earlier incident. I didn't think he meant 14:00 16 thinking in August or September. He did. 17 MR. HARTY: 18 I thought he was going back to - this is CHAIRMAN: 2011, isn't it? 19 20 This is the 2012 incident, February 2012. MR. HARTY: 14:00 CHAIRMAN: Yes, it's May 2012, that's right. 21 22 He did, but he then changed his position MR. HARTY: 23 further to say that she was given the advice in 24 Letterkenny Garda Station. 25 CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, you're entitled to ask him 14:01 26 about that. 27 38 MR. HARTY: And I am asking, who gave him that advice Q. 28 and how do you know that advice was given -- gave her that advice? 29

23

I certainly gave Marisa Simms no advice. As the 1 Α. 2 Chairman has indicated, I explained the situation in relation to the 2011, 2012 situation. 3 She was given crime prevention advice. The crime prevention sergeant 4 5 on the day was put in place in relation to that 14:01 6 particular situation, so she was fully aware of the 7 actual crime prevention measures that were there for 8 her own personal safety.

9 39 Q. What crime prevention --

And we were now aware of the location that she was 10 Α. 14.01 11 residing at. She had the contact details of Garda 12 members in that there, and in particular Inspector 13 Sheridan in relation to the matter, and any cause for 14 concern that she would have had, she would have been in 15 a position to make immediate and urgent contact with a 14:01 16 member of the force if a threat were to be evident to 17 her at any stage into the future.

- 18 40 Q. Did you tell her, or who told her what she was to do if19 approached by Keith Harrison?
- A. I certainly didn't tell her anything in relation -- 14:01
 A. I certainly didn't tell her anything in relation -- 14:01
 That would be standard crime prevention advice in
 respect of threats that are taken seriously, wouldn't
 it?

A. Well, unfortunately, I cannot speak for what she was
told by Inspector Sheridan or Sergeant McGowan in 14:02
relation to that particular aspect when she made the
statement. But certainly on the day, the fact on the
day that she was in Letterkenny Garda Station on the
6th October making a substantial statement of complaint

24

in relation to the matter, I would certainly on the day 1 2 be of the view that she would be well aware of her situation in relation to approaching or contact with 3 Garda Harrison into the future, subject to the 4 5 completion of the actual criminal investigation. 14:02 6 42 Q. And just so we are clear on that, are you telling this 7 Tribunal that if somebody has death threats, that the 8 appropriate mechanism for An Garda Síochána is to deal with the matter -- to any external body that can 9 possibly deal with it except An Garda Síochána, and 10 14.02 11 assume that the person who has received the death 12 threats has sufficient information to deal with their 13 own safety, is that what you are telling the Tribunal? 14 Α. No, I'm not, I'm not telling the Tribunal that. Crime 15 prevention advice is provided to victims of 14:03 16 threat-related incidents. Just advice? Just advice? Is that how you deal with a 17 43 Q. 18 potential criminal act - you give advice to the person 19 who might potentially be affected? 20 We certainly do. And -- -Α. 14:03 What else do you do, ordinarily? Let's take an 21 44 Ο. 22 ordinary case. 23 There's a responsibility on them to take and put Α. 24 measures in place for their own personal safety. 25 45 If you ordinarily know of the person who has made a Q. 14.03threat to kill which you or the person to whom it has 26 27 been communicated takes seriously, do you simply give that person advice, is that all you do? 28 29 We pay their location passing attention in relation to Α.

25

1 a situation that may possibly occur into the future. 2 We put in place a catalogue of information in relation 3 to that particular person. 4 46 What sort of catalogue of information do you put 0. 5 together? 14:04 6 where they are residing, give them contact details for Α. 7 the actual -- their local station or whatever the actual district station, that they can get immediate 8 contact, we provide them on the day with crime 9 prevention advice, we provide them with the services of 14:04 10 11 the crime prevention officer, who in Donegal is 12 Sergeant Wallace. 13 47 So when was Marisa Simms given the contact Q. Okay. 14 details for Sergeant Wallace after these threats? I can't answer the question in relation to that 15 Α. 14:04 16 specific incident because I didn't do the evaluation of 17 that particular threat. 18 48 You were the one who apparently decided that the Gardaí Q. 19 were not going to take any further steps in the 20 investigation of this at a meeting on the 8th October. 14:04 You have now told this Tribunal that everything that 21 22 was done on the 8th October in relation to further investigation had to do with preserving evidence under 23 24 section 89 of the Act, isn't that correct? That has been your evidence. The Gardaí were going to take no 25 14.05further steps? 26 27 No, I didn't, I didn't, I didn't say that, Α. Mr. Chairman. There were further steps taken to 28 29 preserve evidence in the event of awaiting a decision

26

		by GSOC in relation to what investigations they	
		proposed to take in relation to a referral.	
49	Q.	And aside from that, your evidence is the Gardaí were	
		not going to investigate any further until you heard	
		from GSOC?	4:05
	Α.	There were investigative measures put in place into the	
		future to preserve evidence in relation to this	
		particular case, and, as I indicated yesterday,	
		Mr. Chairman, one of those specific measures was the	
		actual securing and dumping of Ms. Marisa Simms' phone, $_{4}$	4:05
		which was of significant importance to this particular	
		Tribunal.	
50	Q.	In relation to the serious risk of death which you have	
		said was going to be caused by Keith Harrison, future	
		tense, making allowances for a reading of section 102 $^{-1}$	4:06
		that allows for future crime, what steps did you take	
		to prevent this future crime?	
	Α.	To save repeating what I've said already, Ms. Simms was	
		given crime prevention advice in relation to the	
		situation between herself and Mr. Harrison. She was ${}_{1}$	4:06
		also advised	
51	Q.	No, she wasn't. Nobody gave her that advice. So	
		that's simply not true.	
	Α.	Okay, well	
52	Q.	That never happened. Nobody said that it happened $~$ $_1$	4:06
		before. I'm asking you what you do when somebody is at	
		serious risk of a threat, which apparently you tell me	
		you all took so seriously. Because I am horrified to	
		think that, in Donegal, if there are threats which the	
	50	A. 50 Q. A. 51 Q. A.	 proposed to take in relation to a referral. 49 Q. And aside from that, your evidence is the Gardaí were not going to investigate any further until you heard from GSOC? A. There were investigative measures put in place into the future to preserve evidence in relation to this particular case, and, as I indicated yesterday, Mr. Chairman, one of those specific measures was the actual securing and dumping of Ms. Marisa Simms' phone, which was of significant importance to this particular Tribunal. 50 Q. In relation to the serious risk of death which you have said was going to be caused by Keith Harrison, future tense, making allowances for a reading of section 102 that allows for future crime? A. To save repeating what I've said already, Ms. Simms was given crime prevention advice in relation to the situation between herself and Mr. Harrison. She was also advised 51 Q. No, she wasn't. Nobody gave her that advice. So that's simply not true. A. Okay, well 52 Q. That never happened. Nobody said that it happened before. I'm asking you what you do when somebody is at serious risk of a threat, which apparently you tell me you all took so seriously. Because I am horrified to

1 Gardaí take seriously and believe seriously, nobody 2 does anything about them. So can you confirm that that is the case? 3 No, that is not the case, Mr. Chairman. All threats 4 Α. 5 that come to our attention are assessed. 14:07 And if you take them seriously, what do you do? 6 53 Q. 7 We require statements of complaint from the actual Α. 8 parties involved, the matter is the subject of a criminal investigation and is referred to the Director 9 of Public Prosecutions for decision in relation to 10 14.07 11 prosecution. 12 54 Because that is the way you should deal with it, isn't Q. 13 that right? 14 Α. And that was the plan that was put in place in relation to this particular situation, as well. Other than the 15 14:07 16 fact that the matter was referred initially on the day to the Garda Ombudsman Commission because there was a 17 18 serving Garda member the subject of the allegations, 19 for a decision to be made in relation to what measures they proposed to put in place, what actions they 20 14:07 proposed to put in place in relation to the 21 22 investigation. 23 55 Superintendent, you know and I know that what you would Q. 24 do after you have evidence in relation to this, you 25 would gather together your necessary evidence and, if 11.08 26 you take the threat seriously, the next thing you would 27 do is arrest the suspect offender and bring them in. That's precisely what you would do, isn't that correct? 28 29 If this investigation was an investigation where a Α.

28

Garda member was not involved in the actual 1 2 allegations, we would investigate the matter and a decision would be made thereafter in relation to an 3 arrest and interview situation. 4 5 56 Yes. There would be an arrest? Q. 14:08 On this occasion, this was a different situation. 6 Α. 7 Unfortunately, there was a serving Garda member 8 involved in this particular allegation. As a result, refer the matter to the Garda Ombudsman Commission for 9 them to make a decision in relation to what course of 10 14.09 11 investigations they proposed or wished to take in 12 relation to the matter. That was always going to 13 affect how we dealt with it in the immediate aftermath 14 of the actual complaint. 15 57 I hadn't read into the missing sentence, but clearly Q. 14:09 16 you were able to read into Marisa Simms' statement, 17 which was that Garda Harrison said he was going to bury 18 and burn Marisa Simms after GSOC had an opportunity to 19 consider whether or not it would admit the 20 investigation. I didn't realise that the threat 14:09 somehow was going to disappear while GSOC had time to 21 22 carry out its investigation. Is it there somewhere? 23 The threat and the investigation are two totally Α. 24 different things. The investigation, the criminal 25 investigation and the evaluation of the threat are two 14.09different situations. 26 27 58 Q. They are. They are entirely. And the point is that 28 you did nothing about evaluating the threat? 29 The threat was evaluated, and crime prevention --Α.

29

 A. By ourselves. GO Q. By yourselves? A. Yes. 	ce. What 14:10
	ce. What 14:10
4 A. Yes.	ce. What 14:10
	ce. What 14:10
5 61 Q. And crime prevention measures were put in pla	
6 were they?	
7 A. Ms. Simms was given crime prevention advice i	n relation
8 to it.	
9 62 Q. Not at the time, not at the time. And I'm as	king you
10 what you say was done by way of crime prevent	ion. 14:10
11 Because if you believed these threats were se	rious,
12 that's what you would have done, or at least	that is
13 what I hope you would have done. Perhaps I'm	wrong.
14 But I would certainly hope that senior office	rs in
15 Donegal division don't simply leave people wa	ndering 14:10
16 the street with a likely and serious death th	reat
17 hanging over their heads. But you didn't do	it, did
18 you? And I have to put it to you that the re	ason why
19 you didn't is because nobody ever said that t	here was a
20 serious chance that these threats were either	meant 14:11
21 seriously or taken seriously. Because had yo	u believed
22 that, I have no doubt, Superintendent McGover	n, that an
23 officer of your calibre would have done somet	hing about
24 it. But you didn't, did you?	
25 A. We did, Mr. Chairman. The matter was referre	d to the 14:11
Garda Ombudsman Commission on the 8th and 9th	October
27 for the purposes of an evaluation in relation	to what
28 level of criminal investigation they proposed	to take
29 in relation to the matter. Their decision wa	s always

1			going to be a determination for what we done. In	
2			relation to the	
3	63	Q.	And their decision had no function, purpose, power,	
4		•	ability, or anything else, in respect of crime	
5			prevention?	14:11
6		Α.	I've never represented to the Tribunal, Mr. Chairman,	
7			that the Garda Ombudsman Commission had any function in	
8			relation to crime prevention. I have never represented	
9			that position.	
10	64	Q.	The Garda Ombudsman wouldn't be in a position to	14:12
11		•	ensure, for example, that routine checks are made with	
12			the local Garda station with Marisa Simms, would they?	
13			They wouldn't have any ability to do that?	
14		Α.	It wouldn't, it wouldn't be a function of the Garda	
15			Ombudsman Commission.	14:12
16	65	Q.	No, the Garda Ombudsman Commission wouldn't be in a	
17			position to inspect Marisa Simms' home to make sure	
18			that it is safe from the point of view of an intruder	
19			and give advice on maintaining an alarm, installing a	
20			panic button, the usual things you would advise	14:12
21			somebody in these circumstances, would they?	
22		Α.	NO.	
23	66	Q.	The Garda Ombudsman Commission wouldn't even have the	
24			power to arrest somebody if they saw an offence being	
25			committed, would they? They don't have powers of	14:13
26			arrest. If the Garda Ombudsman Commission decided to	
27			sit outside Marisa Simms' home to make sure that	
28			nothing happened, they wouldn't have been in a position	
29			to; they have no power of arrest to stop Keith Harrison	

1 from going into that house, would they? 2 NO. Α. They have no crime prevention powers, functions or 3 67 0. 4 anything else, so what I want to know from you, 5 Superintendent, in these threats that you're expecting 14:13 6 this Tribunal to believe, you believed, what did you do 7 to protect the victim? 8 The victim returned to Garda Harrison a short time Α. after the statement of complaint was made. The threats 9 that were made to Mr. Harrison were at a particular 10 14.13 location in the actual Churchill sub-district. That 11 12 was the subject of a significant threat assessment. It 13 was receiving ongoing passing patrols, including armed 14 patrols, at that particular location. Ms. Simms was 15 now back at that particular location. So the threat in 14:14 16 relation to Garda Harrison and any threat on the day in relation to Ms. Simms would have been evaluated and was 17 18 actually -- it was actually site-specific to one 19 location at that particular time. 20 And therefore, I take it there was ongoing evaluation 68 0. 14:14 after your meeting of the 8th October? 21 22 There was ongoing crime prevention measures in place in Α. 23 relation to Garda Harrison. 24 69 In relation to Ms. Simms? Q. 25 Ms. Simms returned to Garda Harrison and was residing Α. 14.14 at that address. 26 27 70 Q. Can I be just clear on this, are victims of domestic violence safer in the presence of their abuser or when 28 they are away from their abuser? 29

32

1		Α.	Of course they're safer away from their actual abuser,	
2			but unfortunately	
3	71	Q.	So the threat increases when Ms. Simms is back with	
4			Garda Harrison	
5		Α.	But	14:15
6	72	Q.	if you believe the threat is real?	
7		Α.	we cannot prevent Ms. Simms on the day from	
8			returning to reside with the partner on the day that	
9			had made the threats against her. We cannot stop that	
10			situation. We can only give people advice.	14:15
11			Ms. Simms	
12	73	Q.	What advice did you give to Ms. Simms when she went	
13			back with Garda Harrison?	
14		Α.	I certainly didn't provide her with any advice.	
15	74	Q.	Nobody did.	14:15
16		Α.	She would have been aware of her entitlements under the	
17			domestic violence legislation in relation to	
18			application for orders.	
19	75	Q.	A safety order?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:15
21	76	Q.	Which is not a barring order?	
22		Α.	NO .	
23	77	Q.	A safety order, which simply says to somebody 'don't	
24			watch and beset my house', if I live in a house, and	
25			'if I live in a different dwelling and I could live in	14:15
26			the same dwelling as you, you are not to abuse me'?	
27		Α.	well, it's	
28	78	Q.	In terms of somebody being burnt to death, which was	
29			the serious threat which you all thought was so serious	

1 and so genuine, I'm not entirely sure that a safety 2 order will work in respect of a cohabitee? 3 Α. Mr. Chairman, that was a decision that Ms. Simms had to make for herself. She made the decision in this 4 5 particular situation to return to reside with Garda 14:16 6 Harrison. 7 79 You see, in respect --Q. 8 We couldn't prevent -- with respect, we couldn't Α. prevent Ms. Simms from returning to reside with Garda 9 Harrison. She made that decision herself. She can 10 14.1611 only be provided with the relevant information. She 12 can only be provided with information in relation to 13 whatever protection measures she can put in place to protect herself. We cannot force her or make her to do 14 15 that. 14:16 16 You could protect the children, couldn't you? 80 Q. 17 Well, we referred the children to the HSE, to Tusla, Α. 18 for evaluation in relation to the actual allegations 19 that were contained in the statement of complaint. 20 81 No, that is not correct. **Q**. 14:16 It is correct, Mr. Chairman. 21 Α. 22 No, it isn't correct. The statement of complaint was 82 Q. never given to them, and what they were told was that 23 24 there was a row which was witnessed by the children 25 where there had been physical contact which one of the 14.17 children may have seen. 26 27 That is --Α. 28 83 That is what they were told. They were never told that Q. 29 the children were potentially at risk of a seriously

34

1 taken, seriously intended threat to burn. They were 2 never told that, and they're very clear on that. That is the -- that is the actual evidence that 3 Α. Yes. Tusla have given to the Tribunal. Mr. Chairman. 4 5 Nevertheless, Sergeant McGowan, the district liaison 14:17 6 manager with Tusla, has given contradictory evidence to 7 this Tribunal as far as she is aware, and she is more 8 than one hundred percent happy that she provided Tusla with the actual information that was contained within 9 the actual statement of complaint in relation to the 10 14.17 11 alleged threats that were perpetrated in front of the 12 children, and I refer to children plural, that is what 13 was contained in the statement of complaint as made by 14 Marisa Simms. 15 84 The situation is, is that I would have thought that if Q. 14:18

16 the Gardaí were seriously of the view that there was a 17 serious death threat, seriously intended, that they 18 would have made sure that Tusla acted instantly?

19A. Tusla received an immediate referral in relation to the20matter.14:18

21 85 Q. For emotional abuse?

And that's the criteria for which we were entitled to 22 Α. make the referral. Once we make the referral to Tusla, 23 24 the responsibility then transfers to Tusla to carry out 25 an evaluation in relation to the alleged abuse or the 14.18 alleged emotional abuse in relation to the actual 26 27 children. And Sergeant McGowan is the district liaison 28 manager, and, as has been represented on the referral 29 form that went to Tusla, Sergeant McGowan was

1 identified as the person on the day to be contacted to 2 update Tusla in relation to the referrals in relation to both children, and that occurred. And we have heard 3 evidence in relation to the meeting that 4 5 Sergeant McGowan had with Tusla, the update that she 14:19 6 gave them in relation to the matter and the strategy 7 meeting that was held on the 21st October 2013 in 8 relation to those particular allegations. And nowhere in your referral does it say the children 9 86 Q. are at risk from immediate threats? 10 14.1911 Α. The referral document is limited in what was supplied 12 to Tusla, and that was done for a particular reason; it 13 was done for the particular reason that we do not 14 supply, we do not supply statements of evidence to 15 Tusla. We identify the member on the actual referral 14:19 16 form who is in a position to brief the relevant social worker in Tusla in relation to the level of allegation 17 18 that's there in relation to the children that are 19 referred. And that is what took place in this 20 particular case: Sergeant McGowan was identified as 14:19 the district liaison manager to liaise with Tusla in 21 22 relation to the matter, and she done that, and she 23 subsequently held a strategy meeting with Tusla in 24 relation to it --We will come back to all of that, and there's no need 25 87 Q. $14 \cdot 20$ to go into it right now, because I was really 26 27 fundamentally concerned about what you were or weren't doing yourselves in relation to the GSOC referral, the 28 29 criminal investigation. Now, section 89 of the Act,

36

can you tell me what that says? Just so we are all
 clear of precisely what you've said you had to do.
 Section 89 of the Act, Garda Síochána Act, says:

5 "He Garda Commissioner:-

4

15

6 (a) shall ensure that members of the Garda Síochána, on 7 becoming aware of a complaint, take any lawful measures 8 that appear to them to be necessary or expedient for 9 the purpose of obtaining and preserving evidence 10 relating to the conduct that is the subject matter of 11 the complaint, and

12 (b) may postpone notifying a member of the Garda
13 Síochána whose conduct is the subject matter of the
14 complaint until those measures are taken."

16Now, can you explain to me why it was necessary or17expedient to take a statement of evidence from Andrew18Simms or Emma -- I think it is Emma Roulston, on the19day of the 8th October, and why it couldn't have been20done by GSOC? We're not talking about preserving the21scene of crime here.

A. I'm not in an a position to answer that question,
Mr. Chairman. I didn't make any decision in relation
to who should or shouldn't be interviewed in relation
to the actual follow-up Garda investigation. I didn't 14:21
make any decision as to who should or shouldn't be
interviewed.

14:21

28 88 Q. Oh! Because, you see, Inspector Sheridan's notes from
29 the meeting make it clear that certain people are to be

37

1 interviewed.

2 A. Yes.

3 89 0. Three people were named: Andrew Simms, Emma Roulston It also is noted beside those names that 4 and Paula. 5 Brigid McGowan was to carry out two of the interviews 14:21 6 and Paula was on honeymoon. So can you explain to me, 7 because you have made some considerable play on a 8 section of the Garda Act which isn't referred to in the notes, section 89, you said that's why investigative 9 10 steps were done. Those were the only investigative 14.22 11 steps, so can you explain to me why those investigative 12 steps had to be done?

- 13 Well, in relation to the first question you asked me, Α. 14 you do not see my name referenced there on those 15 particular notes as the person who made that decision. 14:22 16 You told me, when I was asking you questions, that 90 Q. 17 insofar as the Gardaí took any steps afterwards, it was 18 to preserve evidence under their obligations under 19 section 89 of the Act. That was the evidence -- sorry, 20 do you accept that that is what you told me, 14:22 Superintendent? 21
- MS. LEADER: Sorry, sir, just before Superintendent
 McGovern replies, it may be that the microphones are
 sensitive, but it does appear that voices are getting
 raised at the moment and I don't think anybody is doing 14:22
 it on purpose or anything, but -MR. HARTY: I am sorry.
- 28 CHAIRMAN: We could perhaps turn down the microphones a29 little bit then.

38

1	91	Q.	MR. HARTY: You told me in your own evidence that	
2			insofar as any investigative steps were taken as a	
3			result of that meeting, it was to preserve evidence	
4			under section 89. Do you accept that you gave this	
5			answer?	14:23
6		Α.	And I gave that answer and made specific reference to	
7			the fact on the day of securing of Ms. Simms' phone and	
8			the dumping of the data that was contained on that	
9			phone and the significance that it had into the future	
10			in relation to the actual investigation.	14:23
11	92	Q.	That wasn't decided at that meeting?	
12		Α.	I believe there is a remark on that particular document	
13			dump.	
14	93	Q.	Yes.	
15		Α.	Yes. Well, that is what that refers to, the dumping of	14:23
16			a phone.	
17	94	Q.	That was decided two days earlier between Inspector	
18			Sheridan and Ms. Simms, that Ms. Simms would drop in a	
19			phone on that day?	
20		Α.	That may be the case. I don't wish to ask a question,	14:23
21			but are you suggesting to me that the notes that have	
22			been presented to the Tribunal by Inspector Sheridan	
23			were prepared over a number of days as opposed to	
24	95	Q.	NO.	
25		Α.	at the meeting of the 8th? Well, that word that is	14:24
26			on that particular document in relation to dump, that	
27			is something that was discussed and agreed at that	
28			particular management meeting.	
29	96	Q.	And you accept that the taking of statements,	

therefore, from Emma Roulston, Andrew Simms and Paula, 1 2 was also discussed at that meeting?

If -- yes, there was a discussion at the meeting in 3 Α. relation to statements that required to be taken. I 4 5 have no notes in relation to who should or should not 14:24 be interviewed at the earlier stage of the 6 7 investigation because I didn't form part of that 8 decision-making process or I wasn't assigned any responsibility in that regard, so I didn't make any 9 notes about that. All I have -- you have the notes of 10 14.24 11 Inspector Sheridan, she has made notes in relation to 12 who should be interviewed, and those decisions were 13 made at that particular meeting.

14 97 Q. They were made. And the point is that those interviews serve no purpose under section 89 because this is not 15 14:25 16 evidence that is ephemeral or likely to be affected by a couple of days passing, and if the Gardaí had 17 18 difficulty in investigating it themselves, that 19 evidence would have been better taken by GSOC, 20 according to your version of events?

14:25

Well, any decision to take a statement or any decision 21 Α. 22 to preserve evidence, it was made in good faith at that particular meeting. And I cannot comment in relation 23 24 to what the criteria was for those particular statements to be taken earlier rather than other 25 14.25statements, but if Inspector Sheridan has a note that 26 27 those statements were designated to be taken, then I 28 have no difficulty with that note, that decisions were 29 made at that particular meeting.

40

1 And what I have to put to you is that that decision was 98 Q. 2 made because ostensibly there was still to be a criminal investigation, isn't that correct? 3 At that stage, Mr. Chairman, a decision had not been 4 Α. 5 reached by GSOC in relation to what level of 14:26 6 involvement or investigation they proposed to take in 7 relation to the actual referral that they had received. 8 99 Well, we will come to your notes at 2462. Top of the Ο. 9 page: 10 14.2611 "Spoke to Sergeant McGowan. Update re Keith Harrison 12 to assist Inspector Sheridan re taking of statements." 13 14 So you actioned that matter yourself, because Sergeant 15 McGowan had to be directed by you, you were her 14:26 district officer, you were the person to tell her. 16 Is this the 8th now? 17 It is? CHAIRMAN: 18 MR. HARTY: 8th October. It is four hours after the 19 GSOC referral. I made an entry in my journal at 4:26pm on 8th 20 Yes. Α. 14:27 October 2013. That is a phone call I received from 21 22 Sergeant McGowan, not a phone call I made to Sergeant Sergeant McGowan made me aware in relation to 23 McGowan. 24 the Keith Harrison investigation that she had been 25 tasked to assist Inspector Sheridan in the taking of 14.27 26 statements. 27 100 who tasked her to do that? Q. 28 I cannot answer that question, Mr. Chairman. A]] I Α. 29 know is that Sergeant McGowan --

41

1 101 Q. I take it Inspector --

_		٩.		
2		Α.	Please. All I'm saying is that Sergeant McGowan told	
3			me at 4:26pm on 8th October 2013 that she had been	
4			tasked to assist Inspector Sheridan in taking	
5			statements.	14:27
6	102	Q.	Can I just get a line of command clear in my head.	
7			Inspectors in one district don't task sergeants in	
8			other districts to do things. That would ordinarily be	
9			within the district line chain of command, isn't that	
10			correct?	14:27
11		Α.	That would be correct, Mr. Chairman, yes.	
12	103	Q.	And you are the superintendent; you didn't task her to	
13			assist Inspector Sheridan in taking statements, so can	
14			I take it that the only person with authority to	
15			instruct Sergeant McGowan to take statements would have	14:28
16			been Chief Superintendent McGinn?	
17		Α.	That may well have been the situation in relation to	
18			this phone call that I have received, but I cannot give	
19			a definitive answer to the Tribunal as to who tasked	
20			Sergeant McGowan to take the statements. All I know is	14:28
21			that Sergeant McGowan made me aware that she had been	
22			tasked to assist Inspector Sheridan in the taking of	
23			statements, and that is the note that I made in	
24			relation to it. It was a phone call I received, not a	
25			phone call that I made to give an instruction or a	14:28
26			direction.	
27	104	Q.	No, and that is of immense assistance, because it's the	
28			first time that I learned that Chief Superintendent	
29			McGinn must have been the person to give a direction to	

42

1			Sergeant McGowan to take statements, because it didn't	
2			come from your district?	
3		Α.	I didn't say that, that Chief Superintendent McGinn	
4			gave that direction. I cannot say that Chief	
5			Superintendent McGinn gave that direction, but I know	14:29
6			that	
7	105	Q.	Who else could have? You're the superintendent in her	
8			district.	
9		Α.	I didn't, I didn't give her a direction	
10	106	Q.	NO.	14:29
11		Α.	to assist in the taking of statements.	
12	107	Q.	And your notes	
13		Α.	She made me aware from and it may well have	
14			materialised from the meeting that took place earlier	
15			on on that day, on the 8th October, that Sergeant	14:29
16			McGowan would be tasked with assisting Inspector	
17			Sheridan in the taking of statements. That's all the	
18			help I can give in relation to that aspect of it.	
19	108	Q.	But you certainly took no part in that decision-making	
20			process?	14:29
21		Α.	No, I didn't, I didn't task Sergeant McGowan to assist	
22			Inspector Sheridan in the taking of follow-up	
23			statements in relation to the matter, Chairman.	
24	109	Q.	And you accept as a matter of Garda	
25		Α.	Yeah.	14:29
26	110	Q.	line of command, that that can only have come from	
27			somebody superior to your rank if it came from outside	
28			your district? Would I be wrong in that? But I	
29			understand that superintendents in one district aren't	

1 supposed to task people in other districts to carry out
2 investigations?

But we can't really say to the fact that Sergeant 3 Α. McGowan was already involved in this investigation. 4 5 She already had been assisting Inspector Sheridan in 14:30 6 the taking of the original statement of complaint on 7 the 6th October, and I suppose this was follow-up 8 notification to me that she had been tasked to assist Inspector Sheridan in taking --9

She had been involved much more than that; she had been 14:30 10 111 Q. 11 involved in the passing on of the anonymous letter, she 12 was involved in the Pulse complaint, she had been 13 involved in much more than simply the investigation. 14 She was the person who advised you the previous week about the involvement of the issue. She was well aware 14:30 15 16 of all of the issues and all of the detail. But vou 17 were not the person who assigned her to take statements 18 from Inspector Sheridan. And that simply -- I want your confirmation that the only person with authority 19 20 to assign her would have been superior to you, because 14:31 no one within your district did it. isn't that correct? 21 I must say, Mr. Harty, I was wondering about 22 CHAIRMAN: that myself and just thinking about just a few pages 23 24 previously where I think what happened was that 25 Sergeant McGowan went to Superintendent McGovern and 14.31 26 got permission, isn't that right? MR. HARTY: That's correct. That's what happened in 27 the earlier case. 28

29 CHAIRMAN: Oh, was that on the -- that might have been

44

1 on the 3rd? 2 On the 3rd October she went and informed MR. HARTY: 3 Superintendent McGovern that a meeting had been arranged with Marisa Simms to take a statement on the 4 5 6th October. 14:31 6 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 7 And she requested permission. MR. HARTY: 8 CHAIRMAN: Yes. And he gave permission. 9 MR. HARTY: And he gave permission, and that would be 10 logical. 14.31 11 CHAIRMAN: Yes. And that was for Sunday the 6th. But 12 I would have -- perhaps I'm wrong in thinking that 13 perhaps this was a continuation of that investigation; 14 am I wrong? MR. HARTY: 15 I understood that the purpose was, and 14:32 16 Sergeant McGowan's own view in relation to it, her own 17 evidence, was that she was there to assist and nothing It was Inspector Sheridan's investigation. 18 more. 19 Yes, well, I suppose when you start, you CHAIRMAN: 20 finish, to use the time-honoured phrase, but I don't 14:32 21 know. 22 MR. HARTY: Perhaps. 23 In any event, there were decisions made to take 112 Q. 24 additional statements at that meeting, isn't that 25 correct. on the 8th October? 14.32 26 Yes, there was, Mr. Chairman. Α. 27 113 Q. And there is no clear explanation from you as to why 28 that was necessary under section 89 of the Garda Síochána Act? 29

45

Statements were identified to be taken in relation to 1 Α. 2 the ongoing investigation. But also, part of the 3 actual investigation was also the threats that had been made in relation to Garda Harrison, and that was the 4 5 reason why Detective Inspector O'Donnell was present at 14:32 6 that particular meeting. So some of the statements 7 that were to be taken, also related to the actual 8 threats that were made in relation to Garda Harrison. 9 114 Okay. Q. So some of the actual follow-up jobs that were required 14:33 10 Α. 11 to be undertaken related to that particular situation 12 as well. 13 Sorry, I just want to be clear on that. 115 Okay. Ο. Ι 14 accept that relations were not good between Paula 15 McDermott and Garda Harrison, but no one is suggesting 14:33 16 that Paula McDermott was involved in the death threats on Garda Harrison, are they? 17 18 Well, I think, Mr. Harty, I mean, the CHAIRMAN: 19 situation vis-à-vis the anonymous letter, I think, as I 20 have commented, you read newspapers nowadays and 14:33 sometimes they suffer from capital-letter disease, 21 22 everything is the name of a pub, it's like as if we are 23 speaking German and nouns have to have a capital 24 letter. This is, in fact, a very articulate letter and 25 it doesn't have any capital-letter disease. But I 14:33 26 don't think any of us have a notion as to who might be 27 involved, and I am not sure --28 MR. HARTY: I'm not talking about the anonymous letter, 29 sir.

46

1 No. I'm not sure there is any point in CHAIRMAN: 2 speculating it could have been so-and-so, because then 3 we'll have to bring them in and ask them or --MR. HARTY: No, the reason why I'm asking is that the 4 5 superintendent has said that insofar as people were 14:34 being identified for interview and taking of 6 statements, it was in respect of death threats on Garda 7 8 Harrison, but I'm just pointing out to him that three of those people, Emma Roulston, Paula McDermott and 9 Andrew Simms, were in respect of the threats allegedly 10 14.34 11 made by Garda Harrison, isn't that correct? That would be correct. 12 Α. 13 Sorry, I thought you were referring to the CHAIRMAN: 14 anonymous letter --15 MR. HARTY: NO. 14:34 16 CHAIRMAN: -- which I don't think made any reference to 17 death threats. It made reference to a strain --18 MR. HARTY: Yes. 19 CHAIRMAN: -- on a particular individual and worry in 20 relation to the children. So that seems to be a very 14:34 concerned kind of a letter. 21 22 MR. HARTY: Yes. 23 So maybe we're talking about something CHAIRMAN: 24 different. 25 what I'm talking about is that MR. HARTY: 14.34Superintendent McGovern had suggested that the people 26 27 who were listed for interview were in relation to the 28 death threats on Garda Harrison, and that is correct, 29 but at a later page in the notes, so on page 906 of

47

1 Inspector Sheridan's notes -- if we go down to the next 2 section, just there. That is perfect, thank you. 3 "Interview Emma Roulston. Paula. Andrew. 4 Phone 5 dumped." 14:35 6 7 And all of that was in relation to the alleged serious 8 death threats made by Garda Harrison, isn't that correct? 9 As I've said, Mr. Chairman, there were jobs identified 10 Α. 14.35 11 to be carried out in relation to two different 12 investigations that were under discussion --13 I'm asking what job did this have a relation to? 116 Yes. Q. 14 Simple question, simple answer. I can't answer that, Mr. Chairman. 15 I don't know Α. 14:35 16 actually on the day what each of the actual jobs that 17 were assigned or the statements being taken, what 18 specifically they relate to in relation to the 19 investigation. The people that were --Are you seriously telling this Tribunal that people in 20 117 Q. 14:35 that room thought that Emma Roulston, Paula McDermott 21 22 or Andrew Simms were involved in the anonymous death threats made against Garda Harrison? Is that your 23 24 evidence? And yes or no to that evidence. 25 I'm not saying that. I never said that. Α. It's no. 14.36 26 118 well then, why are these people listed as being 0. 27 required for interview by An Garda Síochána if you say it has nothing to do with the other element? There are 28 29 people listed at other stages in respect of the death

48

threats against Garda Harrison, but in respect of the statement made by Marisa Simms these are obviously the witnesses that are be interviewed. Do you accept that? A. They are names that Inspector Sheridan wrote on her

sheet that required statements to be taken from.

14:36

14.36

5 6

1

2

3

4

119 Q. Was that discussed?

A. It was discussed, yes. The statement was discussed at
the actual meeting and what immediate steps needed to
be taken in relation to interviewing certain parties.
And they're the names that Inspector Sheridan wrote
down on her sheet as jobs that I understand she was
assigned to do.

13 120 Q. well, in fact she --

14 Α. There were two separate, there were two separate 15 entities going on at that particular meeting, there 14:37 16 were two separate investigations under suggestion. There was the session in relation to the actual 17 18 statement of complaint as made by Marisa Simms, but 19 there was also the issue in relation to the death 20 threats that were received by Garda Harrison. And, 14:37 Mr. Chairman, if you want to refer to my notes that in 21 22 relation to the same date that I spoke to Sergeant 23 McGowan and she made me aware she was assisting 24 Inspector Sheridan, if you look at an entry that I made 25 on that same day at 8:24am it reflects on a follow-up 14.3726 inquiry or part of the investigation that was assigned 27 to Inspector Sheridan on that particular day. А follow-up that she carried out in relation to a job 28 29 that she was assigned at that particular meeting or

49

conference.

2	121	Q.	Yes?	
3		Α.	So it reflects that there was other jobs assigned not	
4			just simply in relation to the statement of complaint	
5			and the referral, to GSOC, there was also urgent jobs	14:37
6			to be done in relation to the actual threats that were	
7			received by Garda Harrison, and my entry of 8:24pm	
8			reflects on one of those urgent inquiries or	
9			investigation that was required to be followed up on.	
10	122	Q.	And she told you she texted the chief superintendent,	14:38
11			is that correct?	
12		Α.	She told me she had updated Chief Superintendent McGinn	
13			in relation to the outcome of that particular	
14			investigation or inquiry that she had undertaken.	
15	123	Q.	What discussion was made in respect of Martin McDermott	14:38
16			at that meeting of the 8th October?	
17		Α.	He was discussed as a person of interest in relation to	
18			the death threats that had been made in relation to	
19			Garda Harrison.	
20	124	Q.	Was there any other discussion in relation to him?	14:38
21			CHAIRMAN: I'm not sure because okay, I understood	
22			if we go back to May 2012, I think it was in July 2012	
23			he got the eight year sentence for manslaughter of the	
24			unfortunate Garda McLoughlin, and then I understood	
25			that about a year later he had escaped and was perhaps	14:39
26			living in Londonderry	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28			CHAIRMAN: is that right?	

1		CHAIRMAN: And then there was either some extradition	
2		process or something else that happened?	
3	Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
4		CHAIRMAN: But I don't know, was he at large at that	
5		stage?	14:39
6		MR. HARTY: No, he was in Portlaoise Prison at this	
7		stage.	
8	Α.	No, he was in Portlaoise Prison at that particular	
9		stage. There was an issue in relation to where the	
10		actual threatening phone call had originally been made	14:39
11		and an investigative inquiry required to be carried out	
12		in relation to the prison and the entry at 8:24pm on	
13		that particular date was the outcome of the inquiry	
14		that was undertaken or investigation undertaken by	
15		Inspector Sheridan.	14:39
16		CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, you can make a phone call in a	
17		prison, isn't that right, but you have to get	
18		permission and I think you have to use a box, in other	
19		words a landline, isn't that right?	
20	Α.	well, unfortunately on the day there had and it	14:39
21		was	
22		CHAIRMAN: Well, I know about budgies and mobile phones	
23		in prison.	
24	Α.	Yes.	
25		CHAIRMAN: And I think there were incidents of people	14:39
26		having both.	
27	Α.	Yes.	
28		CHAIRMAN: Which are not allowed.	
29	Α.	And on this occasion, Mr. Chairman, that situation	

 seized as a result of the search that was carried out by our colleagues in the prison service in relation to the inquiry that we done. CHAIRMAN: Yeah. So that was presumably a mobile mobile phone. I mean, that presumably proved nothing? A. I can't answer that question, Mr. Chairman. CHAIRMAN: It was right to follow it through A. Yes. CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went? motion Yes. CHAIRMAN: All right. 125 Q. MR. HARTY: Was any other discussion had at that conference in relation to the relationship between Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Siochána? modi if it's derogatory discussion that is implied, absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother, meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison, Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott. modi the discussion in relation to Martin McDermott. meating 	1			arose in relation to this and a particular item was	
4the inquiry that we done.5CHAIRMAN: Yeah. So that was presumably a mobile6phone. I mean, that presumably proved nothing?7A. I can't answer that question, Mr. Chairman.8CHAIRMAN: It was right to follow it through9A. Yes.10CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went?11A. Yes.12CHAIRMAN: All right.1312514Conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána?16A. I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	2			seized as a result of the search that was carried out	
5CHAIRMAN: Yeah. So that was presumably a mobile14.406phone. I mean, that presumably proved nothing?77A. I can't answer that question, Mr. Chairman.8CHAIRMAN: It was right to follow it through9A. Yes.10CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went?11A. Yes.12CHAIRMAN: All right.1312514Conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána?16A. I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott related26the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	3			by our colleagues in the prison service in relation to	
 phone. I mean, that presumably proved nothing? A. I can't answer that question, Mr. Chairman. CHAIRMAN: It was right to follow it through A. Yes. CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went? A. Yes. CHAIRMAN: All right. 125 Q. MR. HARTY: Was any other discussion had at that conference in relation to the relationship between Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána? A. I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no if it's derogatory discussion that is implied, absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother, Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison, Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott related the discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related to the actual death threats that were received by Garda Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal 	4			the inquiry that we done.	
7A.I can't answer that question, Mr. Chairman.8CHAIRMAN: It was right to follow it through9A.9A.10CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went?11A.12CHAIRMAN: All right.1312512CHAIRMAN: All right.1312514Conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Siochána?16A.17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	5			CHAIRMAN: Yeah. So that was presumably a mobile	4:40
8CHAIRMAN: It was right to follow it through9A.10CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went?11A.12CHAIRMAN: All right.1312514Conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Siochána?16A.17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	6			phone. I mean, that presumably proved nothing?	
9A.Yes.10CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went?14:4011A.Yes.12CHAIRMAN: All right.13125Q.MR. HARTY: Was any other discussion had at that14conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána?16A.I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	7		Α.	I can't answer that question, Mr. Chairman.	
10CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went?11.11A.Yes.12CHAIRMAN: All right.13125Q.14MR. HARTY: Was any other discussion had at that14conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána?16A.17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	8			CHAIRMAN: It was right to follow it through	
11A.Yes.12CHAIRMAN: All right.13125Q.14Conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána?16A.17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	9		Α.	Yes.	
12CHAIRMAN: All right.13125 Q.MR. HARTY: Was any other discussion had at that14conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Siochána?16A.I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	10			CHAIRMAN: but that was as far as it went?	4:40
13125Q.MR. HARTY: Was any other discussion had at that14conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána?16A.I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.14:4126The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	11		Α.	Yes.	
14conference in relation to the relationship between15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána?14:4016A.I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't1717really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,14:4121Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.14:4126The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related14:4128Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	12			CHAIRMAN: All right.	
15Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána?14:4016A.I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't1617really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no1818if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,1919absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to14:4120the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,14:4121Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This14:4123meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't14:4123motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory14:4124background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,14:4125Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.14:4126The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related14:4127to the actual death threats that were received by Garda14:4128Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal14:41	13	125	Q.	MR. HARTY: Was any other discussion had at that	
16A.I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't17really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no18if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26the discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	14			conference in relation to the relationship between	
17 really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no 18 if it's derogatory discussion that is implied, 19 absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to 20 the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother, 14:41 21 Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This 22 meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't 23 motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory 24 background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison, 25 Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott. 14:41 26 The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related 27 to the actual death threats that were received by Garda 28 Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	15			Martin McDermott, his family and An Garda Síochána? 14	4:40
18 if it's derogatory discussion that is implied, 19 absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to 20 the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother, 14:41 21 Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This 22 meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't 23 motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory 24 background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison, 25 Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott. 14:41 26 The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related 27 to the actual death threats that were received by Garda 28 Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	16		Α.	I'm going to say no, Mr. Chairman, because I don't	
19absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother,21Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This22meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't23motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory24background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	17			really know what I'm being asked. No, there was no	
20the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother, Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This14:4121Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This14:4122meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't14:4123motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory14:4124background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,14:4125Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.14:4126The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related14:4127to the actual death threats that were received by Garda14:4128Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal14:41	18			if it's derogatory discussion that is implied,	
Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison, Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott. 14:41 The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related to the actual death threats that were received by Garda Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	19			absolutely not. There was no discussion in relation to	
22 meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't 23 motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory 24 background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison, 25 Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott. 14:41 26 The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related 27 to the actual death threats that were received by Garda 28 Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	20			the relationship between Marisa Simms, her brother, $^{_{14}}$	4:41
 motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison, Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott. The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related to the actual death threats that were received by Garda Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal 	21			Garda Harrison, the Garda organisation. No. This	
 background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison, Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott. 14:41 The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related to the actual death threats that were received by Garda Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal 	22			meeting was not for that particular purpose. It wasn't	
25Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.14:4126The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	23			motivated in any way towards churning up any derogatory	
26The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	24			background or otherwise in relation to Garda Harrison,	
27to the actual death threats that were received by Garda28Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	25			Marisa Simms or her connection to Martin McDermott.	4:41
28 Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	26			The discussion in relation to Martin McDermott related	
	27			to the actual death threats that were received by Garda	
29 reflects on the follow-up that was carried out by	28			Harrison and, as I say, the entry I made in my journal	
25 refrects on the forlow-up that was callied out by	29			reflects on the follow-up that was carried out by	

Inspector Sheridan in relation to that particular
 meeting.

3 CHAIRMAN: Just, I'm sorry, Mr. Harty, to interrupt, but you appreciate, superintendent, all the questions 4 5 that Mr. Harty is obliged to ask you in relation to 14:41 6 this are as to whether this meeting was in effect an 7 ill-motivated meeting in relation to Garda Harrison as 8 opposed to a genuine investigation and you'll appreciate that that is the line. So, it's perhaps not 9 necessary to necessarily go into a great deal of detail 14:42 10 11 in relation to matters if you feel it's not absolutely 12 necessary.

- 13 126 Q. MR. HARTY: I take it nobody indicated that there was
 14 any problems at that meeting taking statements from
 15 Rita Bogle, or McDermott, or Paula McDermott? 14:42
 16 A. Not to my recollection, Mr. Chairman.
- 17 127 Q. Nobody indicated that there was any bad blood between
 18 Rita McDermott, Paula McDermott and An Garda Síochána?
 19 A. Not to my recollection, Mr. Chairman.
- 20 128 Q. Is there a situation in your mind that it was discussed 14:42
 21 at the meeting that there was a conflict of interest
 22 between An Garda Síochána and the McDermott family due
 23 to Martin McDermott's conviction?
- A. It was never suggested there was any conflict of
 interest between An Garda Síochána and the connection 14:43
 between Martin McDermott and Marisa Simms and Garda
 Harrison.
- 28 129 Q. Sorry, I am reading -29 CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, Mr. Harty, I'm just wondering, I

53

1 mean let's suppose there was and let's suppose they 2 didn't like Martin McDermott, it would be perfectly 3 natural, wouldn't it? But I mean there's nobody else to carry out an investigation, it has to be the Gardaí, 4 5 even though one of their members has unfortunately been 14:43 the victim of a homicide. 6 I am not sure that is going 7 to help. 8 MR. HARTY: I am reading verbatim from Chief Superintendent McGinn's statement which I received this 9 morning. 10 $14 \cdot 43$ 11 130 Q. But you're satisfied that that was never raised at the 12 meeting? 13 I am not sure -- what was? CHAIRMAN: MR. HARTY: A conflict of interest between An Garda 14 15 Síochána and the McDermott family. 14:43 16 CHAIRMAN: Well, there may be some people who might be 17 better off not being on the investigation, but that is 18 not quite the same thing. 19 MR. HARTY: There's always a conflict of interest 20 between people who are being investigated for crimes. 14:43 Well. I don't -- it's not -- it wasn't that there was a 21 Α. 22 conflict of interest. It was suggested at that 23 particular meeting, and it was agreed, that these 24 particular allegations would be best investigated by an 25 independent authority. $14 \cdot 44$ Why? Why is there a conflict of interest? Rita 26 131 0. 27 McDermott has apparently gone to An Garda Síochána of 28 her own volition and that appears to be common case; 29 Paula McDermott has gone to An Garda Síochána willingly

54

1 of her own volition and apparently common case; in 2 respect of Marisa Simms there is a conflict as to how voluntary it was, but certainly she did arrive in 3 Letterkenny Garda Station under her own steam - and how 4 5 could anybody have said that the McDermott family, that 14:44 there was a conflict of interest between An Garda 6 7 Síochána and the McDermott family due to previous 8 interactions between An Garda Síochána and Martin McDermott? And just so we can complete chief 9 superintendent's sentence from her statement that she 10 14.4511 decided to type up last night, and that there was --12 13 "Due to previous interactions between An Garda Síochána and Martin McDermott --" 14 15 14:45 16 And never missing an opportunity, God bless Chief 17 Superintendent Sheridan [sic]. 18 19 "-- who was at the time was serving a sentence for the 20 manslaughter of Garda Gary McLoughlin, and the fact 14:45 that the persons close to Martin McDermott were 21 22 identified by Garda Harrison as possible suspects for the 999 threats and the domestic circumstances of Garda 23 24 Harrison were associated with the threats, it was 25 agreed that the matter should be referred to GSOC in 14.45accordance with section 102 of the Garda Síochána Act." 26 27 Your initial recollection was that conversation never 28 29 took place and it's only when I said to you that it was

55

contained in the statement of Chief Superintendent
 McGinn that you thought that it might have been
 discussed.

I don't think I ever denied to this Tribunal that one 4 Α. 5 of the purposes for referring the section 102 referral 14:45 was that we felt that it required an independent 6 investigation. And an independent investigation, the 7 authority for investigating members of An Garda 8 Síochána who are involved in criminal related matters 9 is the responsibility of the Garda Síochána Ombudsman 10 14.4611 Commission. I already said that to the Tribunal. 12 Would the McDermott family think that because they were 132 Q. 13 related to Martin McDermott that An Garda Síochána 14 would not investigate the alleged threats made by Garda 15 Keith Harrison? Is that what you are saying? 14:46 16 I honestly didn't pick up anybody as saying CHAIRMAN: 17 that. 18 MR. HARTY: That's what is -- I'm looking at page 2469. 19 No, no, Mr. Harty, it's fine. But honestly, CHAIRMAN: I mean that would be a strange thing. 20 It's like 14:46 saying, you know, if prisoners want to stab and kill 21

each other, let them at it. I don't think -- I'd be
shocked to think the Gardaí would take any such
attitude.

MR. HARTY: The statement which we received, the first 14:46
ever account of this meeting on the 8th October from
Chief Superintendent McGinn, which was drafted last
night after listening all day to Superintendent
McGovern's evidence, has this reference added into it

56

1 and I want to confirm with Superintendent McGovern, who 2 prior to me indicating that it was in Chief 3 Superintendent McGinn's statement said that it didn't 4 happen --5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, I see, that Mr. Harty. But perhaps I'm 14:47 6 not getting the correct, I suppose, meaning or direction of the questions. 7 Sorry, the direction of the question is --8 MR. HARTY: CHAIRMAN: No, no, if I get it wrong please correct 9 10 me. 14.4711 MR. HARTY: Yes. Perhaps if we read --12 Just hang on a minute. I don't necessarily CHAIRMAN: 13 want to read that. 14 MR. HARTY: Yes. 15 CHAIRMAN: But is the idea that Chief Superintendent 14:47 16 McGinn was taking the view that it is better that 17 somebody from outside investigate the matter? 18 MR. HARTY: That's -- apparently, and I'm asking --19 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 20 MR. HARTY: Well no, this was apparently the discussion 14:47 had. And one of the elements of that, which Chief 21 22 Superintendent McGinn is suggesting was discussed at 23 the time, was that Martin McDermott had been involved 24 in the death of Garda Gary McLoughlin, and that was discussed at the time. 25 14 · 48 All right. Well, fine. Do you recall any 26 CHAIRMAN: 27 such discussion as to whether it should be Gardaí in 28 Donegal or perhaps another division who might be 29 involved? It does sometimes happen, doesn't it, that

57

1 another division will investigate something? 2 It was the view of Chief Superintendent McGinn Α. Yeah. 3 that it would be appropriate that the matter would be investigated outside of the Donegal division. 4 Τ 5 represented the situation here yesterday. And as a 14:48 6 result she requested the regional assistant 7 commissioner to appoint an independent investigator 8 from outside of the division to carry out the investigation. 9

And just help me, did that ever happen? 10 CHAIRMAN: 14.48 11 Α. At that time he decided on the day that that wasn't the 12 appropriate way to deal with the matter and he 13 subsequently appointed me to investigate it. This was after we had received a decision from GSOC that they 14 didn't propose to advance it. That didn't -- it didn't 14:49 15 16 happen. He indicated that I should be the person 17 appointed.

18 CHAIRMAN: Right.

A. I was subsequently appointed. Internal Affairs decided
 that it wasn't appropriate due to the fact that I had 14:49
 made the section 102 referral. And Superintendent Mary
 Murray of Sligo Garda Station was subsequently
 appointed to carry out the actual --

CHAIRMAN: Yes, I knew she'd come into it. So, it
eventually did happen that someone from outside the 14:49
division came in?

- A. Yes, Mr. Chairman. It did eventually get to the point
 where there was somebody independent.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: But she sent an initial letter and then I

58

1 think there was litigation or something like that. 2 MR. HARTY: She was appointed in February and she sent 3 a letter identifying --In December. 4 CHAIRMAN: 5 MR. HARTY: In December. 14:49 6 CHAIRMAN: Yes. MR. HARTY: 7 She was appointed in February, just after 8 the Tusla investigation. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Those facts help. And if you want to 9 10 ask a question about that, Mr. Harty, then please do. 14 · 49 11 133 MR. HARTY: The situation is that, I have to put it to Q. 12 you, because no one mentioned this at any stage, it's 13 in nobody's notes, nobody mentioned this at any stage 14 until Chief Superintendent McGinn wrote her statement 15 last night, having sat here for two and a half hours, 14:50 16 in relation to this matter, that there was no such 17 discussion about Martin McDermott and the death of a 18 garda in Buncrana? 19 Like --Α. You didn't need to be reminded about Martin McDermott 20 134 Ο. 14:50 and the death of a garda in Buncrana. I take it? 21 22 I didn't unfortunately, Mr. Chairman. Α. 23 135 NO. Q. 24 I was the superintendent on call on the weekend that he Α. 25 was sadly killed, even though I wasn't stationed in the 14:50 26 district at the time. No, nobody at that meeting would have -- maybe Inspector Sheridan, in all fairness to 27 28 Inspector Sheridan who was there, she was new to the division, she wasn't in the division when this 29

59

1 particular incident occurred. But everybody else that 2 was there would not have needed to be reminded in 3 relation to the actual tragedy that had occurred to 4 Garda McLoughlin. 5 136 There was no need for discussion? Q. 14:50 6 NO. NO. I mean, Martin McDermott also came up at this Α. 7 particular meeting --8 137 Yes. Ο. 9 -- in relation to the actual allegations or the alleged Α. threats that were made to Garda Harrison on the weekend 14:51 10 11 of the wedding. 12 And the Gardaí in Donegal were more than able to 138 Q. 13 investigate those, weren't they? 14 Α. well, they formed part of the discussion at that 15 particular meeting. There were preliminary inquiries 14:51 16 to be carried out. Detective Inspector O'Donnell was 17 carrying out investigations and inquiries in relation 18 to those particular alleged threats. That was one --19 excuse me, that was one avenue of inquiry that he was 20 embarking on. Chief Superintendent McGinn was always 14:51 of the view, and I have never said otherwise, that an 21 22 independent investigation was the most appropriate 23 investigation to be carried out in relation to this 24 matter, bearing in mind that there was a serving guard 25 in the Donegal division allegedly involved in the act 14.5126 of criminality that was alleged by Ms. Simms and she 27 was always of the view --28 Superintendent, I have to stop you. Chief 139 Q. Superintendent McGinn in her statement to the Tribunal, 29

60

1 which she wrote yesterday evening, makes it clear that 2 central to bringing in GSOC was the fact that Martin McDermott was involved in the death of a Garda Síochána 3 and therefore there might be issues with the McDermott 4 5 family and Gardaí in Donegal investigating it, but 14:52 there was no difficulty with Gardaí in Donegal 6 7 investigating Martin McDermott in respect of the death threats against Garda Keith Harrison, isn't that the 8 case? Yes or no. There was no difficulty. I take it, 9 Detective Inspector O'Donnell remained stationed in 10 14.5211 Letterkenny while he carried out his inquiries? 12 Mr. Harty, would you mind just clarifying CHAIRMAN: 13 the point for me please? What is the point? 14 MR. HARTY: The point is, is that the latest 15 justification for the GSOC referral, which is contained 14:52 16 in the freshly minted statement of Chief Superintendent 17 McGinn, is that it was done because of potential views 18 of conflicts of interest between An Garda Síochána and 19 the McDermott family, because of Martin McDermott's involvement in the death of Garda Gary McLoughlin some 20 14:53 number of years previously, and that, therefore, the 21 22 Gardaí in Donegal could not be seen or could 23 potentially be seen to be prejudiced and biased. And 24 why I say that couldn't be the case is because there 25 was no difficulty for Gardaí in Donegal to investigate 14.53 26 Martin McLoughlin -- Martin McDermott, excuse me, that 27 was perhaps an unforgivable slip of the tongue --Martin McDermott in respect of the death threats 28 29 against Garda Harrison, if such sensitivities were

61

being observed it would have been perfectly easy for 1 2 somebody in the midlands division, where Portlaoise is 3 situated, to carry out those inquiries and investigated. 4 5 CHAIRMAN: well now, I understand somebody did carry 14:54 out some inquiries in Portlaoise Prison. but -- well 6 7 first of all, do you remember a discussion about look, 8 is it better for us to investigate or is it better for somebody from outside the division to investigate? Do 9 you remember any such discussion at all. 10 14.5411 superintendent? Certainly there was a discussion in relation to the 12 Α. 13 independence of the actual investigation. 14 CHAIRMAN: All right. So you thought there was a discussion? 15 14:54 16 But it wasn't one of the -- it wasn't a criteria that I Α. used for making the section 102 referral, which is 17 possibly being implied. 18 19 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 20 That is not the reason why the section 102 referral was 14:54 Α. It may well have been a point that was raised at 21 made. 22 the actual meeting, and I mean it was a fair point. 23 There was concern maybe that we wouldn't be seen to be 24 impartial because of the fact on the day that there may well be issues of conflict in relation to the 25 14.54possibility, because of Garda McLoughlin's death and 26 27 the possibility of Martin McDermott's connection to Nevertheless it's not one of 28 actually Garda Harrison. 29 the reasons that I used to make the section 102

62

1			referral.
2			CHAIRMAN: Okay. I understand your position then,
3			thank you.
4	140	Q.	MR. HARTY: And in fact up until that point there had
5			been no problem with members of the Donegal division 14:55
6			investigating, isn't that correct?
7		Α.	Investigating which?
8	141	Q.	Investigating the complaints of the alleged
9			complaints of Marisa Simms, there was no problem up
10			until that meeting on the 8th October? 14:55
11		Α.	Unfortunately we didn't actually have a statement of
12			complaint from Marisa Simms in relation to any of the
13			allegations until 6th October 2013 so
14	142	Q.	How did it become fortunate that you did get the
15			statement of complaint from Marisa Simms? How did that $_{14:55}$
16			unfortunate situation become fortunate?
17		Α.	Ms. Simms decided to make complaints in relation to the
18			actual allegation that had been represented to us, not
19			just indirectly by her but by members of her family in
20			relation to situations that were ongoing. Ms. Simms at $_{14:55}$
21			this stage decided to make a statement of complaint in
22			relation to the matter.
23	143	Q.	And what was fortunate about the fact that Ms. Simms
24			had decided to make a statement? How did that change
25			the course of things for the better? 14:56
26		Α.	Well, it changed the course of things in the sense that
27			we had a statement of complaint at that stage, we were
28			in a position to investigate allegations of
29			criminality.

144 Q. And how did that become fortunate? Because nobody 1 2 investigated, nobody investigated. Superintendent, do 3 you accept that nobody from October 2013 to December 2014 took a single step to investigate the complaint of 4 5 Marisa Simms? 14:56 6 Steps were taken, Mr. Chairman, to carry out those Α. 7 particular investigations. I cannot account for the 8 obstructions that took place in relation to preventing those investigations taking place but steps and 9 measures were put in place to carry out, carry out 10 14.57 11 those particular investigations. 12 145 What instructions were taken in respect of any member Q. 13 of An Garda Síochána in speaking to Garda Keith 14 Harrison between October -- I was careful, I said 15 December 2014, I am not saying that the Garda Síochána 14:57 16 are responsible for not investigating after December 17 2014. What steps were taken by any member of An Garda 18 Síochána in any division to interview Garda Keith 19 Harrison in respect of the statement of complaint of 20 Marisa Simms? 14:57 Again, Mr. Chairman, the matter was referred to the 21 Α. 22 Garda Ombudsman Commission for a decision in October 2013. 23 24 And they rejected it within hours effectively. 146 Q. 25 Α. NO. 14.57They said it was not a section 102 referral. 26 147 0. 27 No. no. That is not correct, Mr. Chairman. They may Α. well have indicated their dissatisfaction in relation 28 29 to the referral of the matter under section 102 when

64

they felt on the day it would have been more 1 2 appropriate to have been referred in accordance with section 85. That nevertheless didn't stop GSOC from 3 4 carrying out inquiries in relation to the matter. The 5 matter -- and there's evidence provided to the Tribunal 14:58 from Mr. O'Doherty in relation to the matter from the 6 7 Garda Ombudsman Commission, he was assigned responsibility and as a result he made contact with 8 Ms. Simms and she declined to cooperate with the Garda 9 Ombudsman Commission in relation to any investigation 10 14.58 11 that they considered appropriate. And as a result they 12 subsequently decided to take no further action in 13 relation to the matter. So it was referred back to the 14 Garda organisation at that stage. Superintendent, firstly, you're incorrect. Nobody 15 148 Q. 14:58 16 asked Marisa Simms to cooperate with an investigation 17 by GSOC. Nobodv. Okay. So will you please accept 18 that? Nobody asked Marisa Simms would she cooperate with an investigation by GSOC. That was nobody's 19 20 evidence, would you accept that? 14:59 It is my understanding that Ms. Simms was contacted by 21 Α. 22 Mr. O'Doherty on behalf of the Garda Ombudsman 23 Commission and she declined to cooperate with any 24 inquiries or investigations that were being undertaken by the Garda Ombudsman Commission. 25 14.59He asked her did she wish the statement to be 26 149 0. investigated by GSOC and she said no. That is not to 27 28 say that somebody is declining to cooperate. She was 29 asked a question had she ever -- she'd never submitted

65

1 a complaint to GSOC and when she was contacted about 2 it, she said no, she didn't want them to investigate 3 it. It is not --Sorry, as I understand the chronology, on 4 CHAIRMAN: 5 the 11th October certainly there was a conversation 14:59 6 between Mr. O'Doherty and Marisa Simms where she asked could she in fact decline to have her statement 7 8 investigated. No, she asked was -- she asked --9 MR. HARTY: Yes. 10 CHAIRMAN: 14.5911 MR. HARTY: She said it hadn't been submitted. She 12 would need to speak about it with her mother, because 13 it was the first time she learnt of her mother's 14 statement, and then she rang them back on the 15th I 15 think to say that she did not wish GSOC to have 15:00 16 anything to do with the matter. 17 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Email to stop GSOC is the 15th 18 October. Yes. 19 MR. HARTY: Yes. 20 And then it was 6th November that Mr. Wright 15:00 CHAIRMAN: rang Superintendent McGovern to inform him of that. 21 22 So the 6th November --MR. HARTY: But I mean, the question on this is? 23 CHAIRMAN: I am 24 wondering, the question on this is what?? 25 MR. HARTY: The question on this is that apparently 15.0026 Superintendent McGovern says the only reason this 27 wasn't investigated was because apparently blocks kept 28 being put in their way and that's why the investigation 29 didn't take place. The first legal block put in your

66

1 way, superintendent, was in December 2014. Marisa 2 Simms had made it clear that she did not wish GSOC to investigate in October at the very latest, the middle 3 of October 2013. What other steps did the Garda 4 5 Síochána take to investigate it? 15:01 Mr. Chairman, when the Garda Ombudsman Commission 6 Α. declined to involve themselves further in relation to 7 8 the actual referral and in the lack -- with the lack of cooperation by Ms. Simms in relation to the matter it 9 was referred back to the Garda organisation. 10 At that 15.0111 particular point, Chief Superintendent McGinn again 12 requested the appointment of an independent 13 superintendent from outside the division to carry out 14 the investigation, and the investigation of the 15 allegations that were contained in the statement, as 15:01 16 the Garda Ombudsman Commission had now indicated. because due to a lack of cooperation by Ms. Simms, they 17 18 were not having any further involvement in relation to 19 the matter. And as I have already indicated, the 20 regional assistant commissioner on the day decided to 15:01 appoint me to take charge of the investigation at that 21 22 particular point. Subsequently, Garda Internal Affairs 23 in Garda headquarters decided that it wasn't 24 appropriate that I should be the investigating member 25 in relation to the matter because of the fact that I 15.02had been involved in the section 102 referral and as a 26 27 consequence Superintendent Murray from Sligo Garda Station was appointed to take charge of the actual 28 29 investigation. All I'm saying, that's the process of

67

1 how the investigation --

2 CHAIRMAN: Can I just clear up the dates before you go 3 on, Mr. Harty? What date in February was 4 Superintendent Mary Murray appointed? Can you help me 5 on that? 15:02 6 MR. HARTY: 10th February, I think. was it? And then the date of the letter in 7 CHAIRMAN: 8 December 2014 from Superintendent Murray? MR. HARTY: Was the 2nd December, I think was the first 9 notification. 10 15.0211 CHAIRMAN: Do you think that is correct? I just don't 12 want to write down the wrong date. Sorry, it was 1st December was the letter. 13 MR. HARTY: Is the letter in the materials? 14 CHAIRMAN: Yes. It is 15 I presume. 15:02 16 It is. MR. HARTY: 17 All I can help you with is --Α. 18 MR. HARTY: 2094. 19 -- on the dates; the 7th January 2014 was the date that Α. I was appointed to investigate the matter. 20 15:03 7th January. And just for the Tribunal's information, 21 150 Ο. 22 it wasn't that it was inappropriate because of any 23 sensitivity, it's just not lawful under the Garda 24 Síochána discipline regulations for somebody to be 25 involved in investigation of an affair where they 15.03have --26 27 Yes. Α. 28 -- disciplinary investigation where they have engaged 151 Q. 29 in a previous -- in the matter previously, isn't that

1 correct? 2 Yeah. On the 22nd January 2014 my appointment was Α. 3 subsequently terminated. CHAIRMAN: So you didn't last long. That's not in any 4 5 way pejorative, as if you were in a football match for 15:03 only five minutes. 6 7 No. Chairman. Α. 8 But, it was just, you were subject to what CHAIRMAN: they were telling you to do. 9 Yes, Chairman. 10 Α. 15.0311 CHAIRMAN: And am I correct in thinking that the first 12 protected disclosure by Garda Keith Harrison under the 13 relevant legislation or under the administrative 14 measures then in place was the 9th May 2014? 15 I can't say, I can't assist. Α. 15:03 16 CHAIRMAN: It was, I think. And that included also a 17 bullying claim as well. 18 MR. HARTY: Officially I think it was made on the 15th May. But there may have been some discussion. 19 But I 20 think the official making of the protected disclosure 15:04 21 was 15th May. 22 In relation to that, the disciplinary --152 Q. 23 CHAIRMAN: Are you sure? The 9th May there was 24 discussion and it was actually made on the 15th? I think that is it. 25 MR. HARTY: 15.0426 CHAIRMAN: All right. 27 153 MR. HARTY: The situation is, Superintendent McGovern, Q. that you in fact were perfectly capable of 28 29 investigating the criminal matter, it's just a bar in

69

respect of the Garda Síochána discipline regulations that meant you couldn't investigate the disciplinary side of it, isn't that right? There's no bar on you being involved in the criminal investigation, the only bar was on you being involved in the disciplinary investigation, isn't that correct? Yes or no will do fine, superintendent.

- 8 A. Well, I am going to say no is not the right answer and 9 yes is not the right answer. Unfortunately in these 10 particular scenarios, the appointment is a double -- 15:04 11 154 Q. No, it isn't.
- 12 It's a double appointment. The appointment is to carry Α. 13 out both a disciplinary and a criminal investigation. 14 155 Ο. There is no provision in respect of a particular 15 appointment under law any way, shape or form for the 15:05 16 criminal investigation of a Garda -- a member of An Garda Síochána. There is no provision. There is no 17 18 section. The only people who are governed by specific 19 sections in that regard are GSOC. There is no law 20 which says that a particular guard may or may not 15:05 investigate another guard. Do you accept that? 21
- 22 A. I accept that, Mr. Chairman.
- 23 156 Q. There is a restriction in respect of the Garda disciplinary regulations that the person appointed to investigate disciplinary matters may not have been involved -- may not be a person who has been involved in an earlier aspect of the same case, isn't that correct?
- 29 A. Yes, Mr. Chairman.

70

Gwei Malon Stenograpi Service Ltc.

15:04

15.05

So the answer is: If An Garda Síochána were seriously 1 157 Q. 2 believing there was criminal matters here to be 3 investigated it was entirely open to An Garda Síochána to appoint you to carry out that criminal 4 5 investigation, isn't that correct? Isn't that correct? 15:06 6 CHAIRMAN: Yes, but what point are you making, 7 Mr. Harty, out of that? I mean he could be, he might 8 It has come up, by the way, in relation to a not be. previous matter, as to an inspector who indicated I'm 9 10 not happy to investigate this because I know the two 15.0611 individuals involved and there was a ruling on that and 12 there was also a GSOC ruling much later which said 13 well, that may not be entirely desirable, but there was 14 nothing wrong with it. Which I suppose is the point 15 you're making, yes. 15:06 16 MR. HARTY: Yes. 17 But your point is? CHAIRMAN: 18 My point is very simple: The Gardaí didn't MR. HARTY: 19 believe the threats. They didn't believe that they 20 were made seriously. 15:06 21 CHAIRMAN: Okay. 22 They didn't believe they were made MR. HARTY: 23 honestly. 24 All right. CHAIRMAN: 25 Or they didn't believe that Ms. Simms MR. HARTY: 15.07believed them or that Garda Harrison believed them. 26 27 CHAIRMAN: All right. 28 Because if they had they would have MR. HARTY: 29 investigated them.

71

1 I thought that he rang her while she was at CHAIRMAN: 2 the wedding to say there's just been a death threat. 3 MR. HARTY: No, this is the criminal investigation of Garda Harrison. 4 5 CHAIRMAN: Yes. But I thought that he rang her at the 15:07 6 wedding and said someone has threatened to shoot me. 7 MR. HARTY: No, no, these aren't the threats to Garda 8 Harrison, these are the threats allegedly made by Garda Harrison --9 10 CHAIRMAN: Oh! 15.0711 MR. HARTY: -- to Marisa Simms. 12 well, we may be getting mixed up. CHAIRMAN: I could 13 have been getting mixed up there, Superintendent 14 McGovern. So maybe --15 As I previously indicated, my appointment was to carry Α. 15:07 16 out both the criminal and the disciplinary aspects of 17 the allegations against Garda Harrison. 18 MR. HARTY: Garda Harrison, yes. 19 And that is the way the appointment was made. Α. So as a 20 result, my involvement was terminated. So they 15:07 terminated both my appointment in relation to the 21 22 disciplinary and criminal aspects of it. And 23 Superintendent Murray was subsequently appointed in the 24 same fashion. 25 And Superintendent Murray didn't do anything in respect 15:08 158 Q. of that appointment until December 2014. So a high 26 27 level conference is convened in Letterkenny Garda Station on the 8th October because of the seriousness 28 29 of the threats made and the domestic violence carried

72

1 out by Garda Keith Harrison. As a result of that 2 meeting a reference is made to GSOC which Garda Headquarters, within 20 minutes or so, knows is an 3 invalid reference, which GSOC contacts you, Chief 4 5 Superintendent McGinn, within a matter of hours to say 15:08 it's an invalid reference. Within five days of that --6 7 Now, at that same meeting a variety of people were 8 given jobs to carry out by way of investigation and statements to be taken. At that meeting, four days 9 later, five days later I should say, it is clear that 10 15.09 11 GSOC will not be investigating. It takes a further two 12 months for a disciplinary investigation to be 13 commenced, to be led by yourself, when you are a person 14 who cannot carry out the disciplinary investigation, 15 instead of carrying on with the criminal investigation 15:09 16 it all goes back to Headquarters, Superintendent Murray is appointed and she does nothing from December 2014. 17 18 During the course of all this, this high level, vitally 19 important, must be done quickly meeting, it's so important it's the subject-matter of a section 102 20 15:09 referral to GSOC, must go to HSE, everybody must act 21 22 now and ye did nothing at all. 23 In other words, the question is: Was this a CHAIRMAN: 24 complete charade, is the meaning of the question? 25 I would suggest, Mr. Chairman, that we done everything Α. 15.1026 in our power to carry out the investigations in a 27 timely and speedy fashion. But as has been represented 28 here today the --29 who stopped you carrying out your 159 Q. MR. HARTY:

73

1			investigations?	
2			CHAIRMAN: I think he ought to be able to finish there.	
3			So you were saying, the question is: Was this a	
4			complete charade, the whole thing?	
5		Α.	No, Mr. Chairman. Every effort was made to investigate	15:10
6			this matter. It was referred to the Garda Ombudsman	
7			Commission initially, when they decided not to take it	
8			on board and Chief Superintendent McGinn requested an	
9			independent superintendent to carry out the inquiries	
10			or investigations. I subsequently was appointed. My	15:10
11			appointment was subsequently terminated. A new	
12			superintendent was appointed in relation to it. Every	
13			effort was being made to carry out the investigation in	
14			relation to the matter.	
15	160	Q.	MR. HARTY: What effort was made by Superintendent	15:11
16			Murray between February and December 2014?	
17		Α.	With respect, Mr. Chairman, I can't answer that	
18			question.	
19	161	Q.	Well then, don't say that every effort was made.	
20		Α.	I'm talking about the Donegal divisional involvement in	15:11
21			relation to the matter.	
22	162	Q.	Okay. In relation to the Donegal divisional	
23			involvement, you knew that day that the section 102	
24			referral was being queried and it was not going to go	
25			ahead as a section 102, didn't you ? You were awaiting	15:11

- for a decision on it, but it was looking likely it 26
- wasn't going to go ahead, isn't that correct? 27
- It was being evaluated in accordance with section 102, 28 Α. the Garda Ombudsman Commission on the day were obliged 29

74

to come back with a decision in relation to the 102 1 aspect of it, nevertheless, I explained yesterday, the 2 3 criteria in relation to section 102, the criteria in relation to section 85, the outcome was going to be no 4 5 different. Marisa Simms decided not to cooperate with 15:12 6 any inquiries or investigations that were being --7 Marisa Simms --163 **Q**.

- 8 A. -- undertaken by GSOC in relation to the matter, and as 9 a result they terminated their involvement in relation 10 to the matter. Irrespective of whether the referral 15:12 11 was made under section 102 or made under section 85 the 12 outcome would have been exactly the same.
- 13 164 Q. Section 85 of the Act, superintendent, you are a very 14 bright man, I have no doubt, and you know full well 15 that section 85 of the Act is about the forwarding of a 15:12 16 complaint made under section 83 by a person who is 17 intending to make a complaint under section 83, isn't 18 that correct?
- 19 CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, that could be so, it's a matter for legal argument. One of the things that is 20 15:12 If somebody comes in, let's say it's a 21 on my mind: 22 domestic violence situation, just leave this out of 23 account altogether and just say a garda happens to be a 24 bit deranged and is beating up his wife and then she says, having made a statement, no, I'm not going ahead 25 15.13 26 with that, can that be sent by the Gardaí under section 27 85 --28 MR. HARTY: Yes.

29 CHAIRMAN: -- or section 83 to GSOC or are you limited

75

in fact in sending things on to section 102? 1 2 we're obliged, where any complaint is made in relation Α. to a member of An Garda Síochána we're obliged to refer 3 it to the Garda Ombudsman Commission irrespective of 4 5 the fact of whether an investigation has been 15:13 undertaken in relation to it. And it's a matter then 6 7 thereafter for the Garda Ombudsman Commission to make a 8 decision as to whether in fact they involve themselves in relation to it. 9 But if it is a situation, let's say, of 10 CHAIRMAN: 15.1311 domestic violence and you refer it, do you have to refer under section 102 or could you refer under 12 13 section 85? 14 Α. You can refer under section 85. I suppose an example of it, Mr. Chairman, is a member of the public writes a 15:13 15 16 letter to my office where it implies that a member of 17 the force on the day has not carried out their duties 18 to a requisite standard, they're not actually making a 19 complaint, but that letter will automatically be 20 referred to the Garda Ombudsman Commission because it 15:14 contains some form of complaint in relation to the 21 actual actions or the actual duties of a member of An 22 Garda Síochána. 23 24 CHAIRMAN: And that would go under section 85, would 25 it? 15.14That would go under section 85. 26 Α. 27 CHAIRMAN: Oh, I see. All right. So yes, you can do But then if the member of the public says oh, 28 that. 29 forget it, we were neighbours and we were just having a

76

tiff or whatever, that is the end of it?

2 The Garda Ombudsman Commission will make contact with Α. the person who wrote the letter and they will ask them 3 whether they wish to make a complaint or they wish them 4 5 to follow-through in an investigation in relation to 15:14 6 conduct of that particular member, if they say no, then 7 the Garda Ombudsman Commission will terminate their involvement in the matter forthwith. 8

15.14

- 9 CHAIRMAN: And there's nothing they can do about it 10 basically?
- 11 A. No, Chairman.

1

12

CHAIRMAN: Okay.

13 Sorry, sir, perhaps I should clarify it in MR. HARTY: 14 relation to it. The decision to make a complaint to the Garda Síochána Ombudsman Commission is a decision 15 15:14 16 made by the complainant. And that is under section 83. 17 They can make that complaint to the Garda Síochána 18 Ombudsman Commission by making it in a Garda station. 19 But that is a person wishing and wanting to make a 20 complaint to An Garda Síochána Ombudsman Commission. 15:15 That is then forwarded by the Garda commissioner under 21 22 section 85. When I say commissioner I mean the 23 delegated function down through the ranks in relation It is then forwarded under section 85. 24 to that. Once 25 it has been forwarded -- and if the person has wished 15.15to make a complaint there is no reason for contact. 26 27 The practice has grown-up in GSOC whereby it is not 28 clear whether or not the person who is ostensibly the 29 complainant in fact wishes to make a complaint, the

1 practice has grown-up in GSOC to be sure to be sure to 2 contact people to ask them did they in fact intend to 3 make a complaint to GSOC. CHAIRMAN: All right. I understand. 4 Thank vou. 5 Mr. Harty. I understand that. But what the 15:15 6 superintendent seems to be saying is this: Let us 7 suppose a garda and someone who is not a garda are 8 neighbours and a complaint is that the garda is releasing rats into their premises, if that complaint 9 is made to the superintendent he has to forward it to 10 15.1611 GSOC because it is conduct in relation to a garda. 12 MR. HARTY: No, that's not correct. 13 CHAIRMAN: Am I right in thinking that? 14 Α. You are correct, Mr. Chairman. No, you're not. 15 MR. HARTY: 15:16 16 We're bound by a directive to forward it to the Garda Α. 17 Ombudsman Commission and a copy to Internal Affairs of 18 any complaint that is made to us to suggest on the day 19 inappropriate behaviour by a member of the force. 20 That is not GSOC --MR. HARTY: 15:16 whether they are on duty or off duty? 21 CHAIRMAN: 22 Yes, whether they are on duty or off duty. Α. 23 So, it just could be a question of people CHAIRMAN: 24 living side by side, as happens, people taking extreme 25 dislike to each other and just causing mischief, again 15.16 you've got to refer it? 26 27 Α. Yeah, if the actual, if the complaint reflects on the 28 actual behaviour of the person as a member of An Garda 29 Síochána yes is the answer.

78

165 Sorry, sir, I have to interject there. 1 Q. MR. HARTY: 2 You're not correct in that, superintendent. There is 3 no obligation on anybody to inform GSOC in respect of that sort of behaviour. That is not an obligation. 4 5 There is an obligation undoubtedly within the Gardaí's 15:17 6 own system. Can you tell me what directive there is saying that where a complaint is made by a member of 7 8 the public in respect of the actions of a member of An Garda Síochána off duty, that where it comes to the 9 attention of the Garda commissioner it must be 10 15.1711 forwarded to GSOC? There is none. 12 The conduct of a member --Α. 13 Sorry, can you just answer me that: Is there such a 166 Q. directive? 14 15 There is such a directive. Where we were made aware of 15:17 Α. 16 a complaint by a member of the public in relation to the conduct of a member of the force irrespective of 17 18 whether they wished to or don't wish us to investigate 19 that particular allegation we refer that matter to the 20 Garda Ombudsman Commission for their attention. 15:17 Under what section? 21 167 Ο. Under section 85. 22 Α. Under section 85? 23 168 **Q**. 24 Section 85 referrals. Α. 25 Can I read you section 85? And this is entering into 169 0. 15.1826 the realm of the surreal at this stage. 27 "When the Garda Commissioner or a member of An Garda 28 Síochána receives a complaint under section 83(2) he or 29

79

1 she shall immediately:-

2 (a) record the complaint and the date and time of its 3 receipt, (b) provide the complainant with a written 4 5 acknowledgment of its receipt, and 15:18 6 (c) forward to the Ombudsman Commission a copy of the 7 complaint or if the complaint is not made in writing a 8 copy of the record of the complaint." 9 Now, are you telling me that if somebody goes into a 10 15.1811 Garda station to complain about their neighbour guard 12 that you issue them with a receipt acknowledging that 13 they have made a complaint to the Garda Síochána 14 Ombudsman Commission even where that person has said 15 they don't want it to be investigated? 15:18 16 Yes, we refer allegations or complaints against members Α. of the force to the Garda Ombudsman Commission. 17 We 18 refer them in accordance with section 85 and in 19 accordance with our HQ Directive --Okay. So you issue --20 170 Q. 15:19 Headquarters Directive 50/2013 is the instruction to us 21 Α. in relation to the referrals of matters on the day that 22 come to our attention, to the Garda Ombudsman 23 24 Commission. in accordance with section 85. 25 And you say that that is under section 85? 171 Q. 15.19Well, the referral is in accordance with section 85. 26 Α. 27 172 I will have a look at that in a moment. But firstly, I Ο. take it you issue them with a receipt in accordance 28 with section 85? 29

80

What I do as the district officer in my area, when I 1 Α. 2 receive such correspondence generally it will be by way of written correspondence, when a member of the public 3 comes into the Garda station their complaint will be 4 5 recorded or otherwise on what we have, a form, a GSOC1, 15:19 6 which is the actual official complaints form that we 7 use for referring matters to the Garda Ombudsman 8 Commission. Where the letter is received from a member of the public, I will acknowledge that letter, I will 9 reflect on the fact that it appears to contain an 10 15.19 11 allegation in relation to a member of the force and 12 that I'm referring the matter to the Garda Ombudsman 13 Commission for whatever attention they deem appropriate 14 in relation to the matter. That is my policy in relation to it and in accordance with the instructions 15 15:20 16 that I have been issued on HQ Directive 50/2013. 17 In section 85 you are obliged to issue a written 173 Q. 18 receipt. I comply with the requirements as set out in HQ 19 Α. 20 Directive 50/2013. 15:20 I'm talking about the law. You're required to issue a 21 174 Ο. 22 written receipt. 23 Yes. And I always issue a written receipt. It is a Α. 24 GSOC1. The copy is provided to the complainant if it is made in that fashion. 25 In relation to a letter that $15 \cdot 20$ 26 is received at the Garda station, I notify the party in writing that I have referred that particular letter to 27 the Garda Ombudsman Commission for whatever attention 28 29 they deem appropriate. It may well not require any

81

1 further follow-up or investigations by me other than to 2 carry out the inquiry or to clarify for the person 3 making the complaint as to what's the particular situation in relation to their complaint. 4 5 175 In relation to circular 20th May 2013 --Q. 15:21 Do we have that? 6 CHAIRMAN: 7 I've just received a copy of it now. MR. HARTY: 8 MS. LEADER: Sorry, sir, a copy will be circulated but I gave a copy to Mr. Harty's junior once I received it. 9 MR. HARTY: 10 Yes. 15.2111 MS. LEADER: It was referred to yesterday during the 12 course of Superintendent McGovern's evidence. 13 MR. HARTY: That doesn't even describe what a complaint 176 Q. 14 is, does it? 15 That there is an instruction, a direction to members of 15:21 Α. 16 the force in relation to receipts of complaints and it's an instruction as to what I am required to do as a 17 18 district officer in the event of the receipt of a 19 complaint in accordance with the provisions as set out 20 in that particular directive. And I have explained how 15:21 I deal with it as the district officer in my area. 21 22 It doesn't even cover whether or not a complaint is an 177 Q. admissible complaint? 23 24 That is a decision for the Garda Ombudsman Commission Α. 25 to make following receipt of the actual documentation. 15.21And also a copy of it is always supplied to Internal 26 27 Affairs in relation to it. 178 Let's assume that that -- I notice it doesn't say you 28 Q. 29 should comply with the provisions of section 85, it

82

doesn't say you should issue a receipt, advise the
 person that you are forwarding it to the Garda
 Ombudsman Commission?

I always notify the actual -- the person from whom I 4 Α. 5 have received the actual documentation, I notify them 15:22 in writing of the receipt of the actual document and I 6 notify them also that I have referred the matter to the 7 8 Garda Ombudsman Commission for whatever attention they deem appropriate in relation to it, the complaint, what 9 they perceive to be alleged complaint in relation to 10 15.22 11 the conduct of a member of the force.

12 179 Q. So what notification did you send to Marisa Simms?
13 A. I didn't deal with this matter in accordance with
14 section 85. I dealt with this matter in accordance
15 with section 102, which does not require a notification 15:22
16 to the party who has made the complaint.

17 180 Q. Why did you not notify Marisa Simms that this was going18 to GSOC?

A. Mr. Chairman, I made the referral in accordance with
 section 102 and I complied with the requirements that 15:23
 were placed on me in relation to 102 and the actual
 person the subject of the actual complaint.

23 181 Q. That meeting went on, on the 8th October, what
24 discussion was made as to what was to be done with
25 Garda Harrison now?

A. It was my understanding that Chief Superintendent
 McGinn was to have contact on the day with Internal
 Affairs in relation to that particular situation.

29 182 Q. And what was to be done?

83

Gwei Malon Stenograpi Service Ltc.

15:23

1 That was, that was a decision that required to be made Α. 2 into the future. I made, I made, I made no decision in relation to what should or shouldn't happen in relation 3 to Garda Harrison. I engaged in no conversation in 4 5 relation to what should or shouldn't --15:23 Nobody discussed it? 6 183 Q. 7 I have no note, I have no note in relation to any Α. 8 discussion that took place in relation to what should happen to Garda Harrison in relation --9 You've no notes about that meeting at all. You only 10 184 Q. 15.2411 have a note about who attended. 12 I have a note in relation to what my function was, and Α. 13 that was the section 102 referral. 14 185 Q. Yeah. I am asking you, because you seem to be quite 15 clear as to other matters that were discussed, can you 15:24 16 tell me what was decided that would be done with Garda 17 Harrison? 18 I don't recall, Mr. Chairman, what specifically was Α. 19 discussed in relation to what happened --I would ask you to try to recall. 20 186 **Q**. 15:24 -- what was going to happen to Garda Harrison. 21 Α. 22 Mr. Chairman, it was not my decision to make in 23 relation to what should or shouldn't happen to Garda Harrison. He wasn't in my district. I had never had 24 any involvement with Garda Harrison before. 25 I have 15.24never met him since, until such time as we have come 26 27 here before the Tribunal. I had no engagement with him and it was not my decision as the district officer in 28 29 Milford at that given time to make any decision as to

84

1			what should or shouldn't happen to Garda Harrison in	
2			relation to these particular allegations.	
3	187	Q.	Was it not discussed at all, or was it?	
4	107	ч. А.	I cannot say definitively whether it was or wasn't	
5		~ •	discussed. But I certainly would imagine and I would 15:	05
6			be happy that it would have been discussed, what the	25
7			consequences would be in relation to the if the	
8			allegation contained in the actual statement of	
9			complaint of Marisa Simms were true.	
	100	0		
10	188	Q.	If the allegation contained in the statement of Marisa	25
11			Simms on the basis of the fact that it required two	
12			superintendents, an inspector, a detective inspector, a	
13			Garda Síochána and a chief superintendent, I'm assuming	
14			that Garda Harrison's employment problems would be the	
15			least of his worries, if he was convicted, if you were 15:	25
16			all taking it so seriously. So can you tell me what	
17			was to be done if it wasn't convicted of him?	
18		Α.	I hadn't fulfilled as I said, Mr. Chairman, I	
19			fulfilled no role in making the decision in relation to	
20			what should or shouldn't happen to Garda Harrison in $^{15:}$	25
21			relation to the matter. That was that Chief	
22			Superintendent McGinn was responsible for.	
23	189	Q.	What were the consequences if the investigation were	
24			carried out and the allegations were found to be true	
25			and that there were in fact credible threats to kill 15 :	26
26			which were made with the intention that they would be	
27			believed? What was to happen?	
28		Α.	If the investigations upheld the actual criminal	
29			allegations that were made by Marisa Simms these are	

1			hypothetical situation unfortunately, Mr. Chairman	
2			if the matter was referred to the Director of Public	
3			Prosecutions and prosecutions were directed in relation	
4			to the matter then a decision in relation to Garda	
5			Harrison and his employment situation that was a	15:26
6			decision that would have to be made by Internal	
7			Affairs.	
8	190	Q.	Were you surprised to know that almost immediately	
9			after this meeting Chief Superintendent McGinn is	
10			writing to Internal Affairs to deal with his employment	15:26
11			situation there and then?	
12		Α.	I am aware that Chief Superintendent McGinn wrote to	
13			Garda Headquarters in relation to Garda Harrison's	
14			position as a serving member in the Donegal division,	
15			yes.	15:27
16	191	Q.	Did you know that she was going to do that when you	
17			were at that meeting on the 8th October?	
18		Α.	I would have to say, Mr. Chairman, yes is the answer to	
19			that.	
20	192	Q.	That's what I have been asking you.	15:27
21		Α.	No. Well, I am saying I wasn't involved in any	
22			discussion in relation to the matter. That's the	
23			question	
24	193	Q.	How did you know that there was an intention to deal	
25			with his employment in the Donegal division?	15:27
26		Α.	There would have been a significant responsibility on	
27			Chief Superintendent McGinn, being aware of the	
28			allegations that were contained in the statement as	
29			presented by Marisa Simms, to bring those particular	

1 allegations and the consequences of them to the 2 attention of her superiors. I would have been under no illusion but that Chief Superintendent McGinn --3 You went further than that. I didn't -- nobody said --4 194 0. 5 you did not say that Chief Superintendent McGinn would 15:27 bring it to the attention of the assistant 6 7 commissioner, you said that you were aware that there 8 would be consequences for Garda Harrison in respect of his employment in the Donegal division as a result of a 9 conversation that you had at the meeting. 10 So I am 15.28 11 asking you, what conversation was had in respect of the 12 future employment of Garda Harrison or the continued 13 employment of Garda Harrison in the Donegal division at 14 that meeting?

15 I don't think, Mr. Chairman, I said what Mr. Harty is Α. 15:28 16 saying I said. I explained on the day what the situation would be in the event of the investigation of 17 18 the matter, the subsequent decision by the Director of 19 Public Prosecutions and a follow-up, if required, would 20 require to be made by Internal Affairs at Garda 15:28 Headquarters. A follow-up question was put to me in 21 22 relation to Chief Superintendent McGinn's 23 responsibility in relation to the matter and I have 24 expressed my opinion in relation to that situation as 25 well and I'm going to reiterate I did not involve 15.28 myself in the decision-making process in relation to 26 27 what should happen to Garda Harrison. Chief Superintendent McGinn of course had responsibility on 28 29 the day to bring these matters to the attention of her

superiors and decisions required to be made based on 1 2 the content of the statement that was made by Marisa That would be a mandatory requirement on Chief 3 Simms. Superintendent McGinn. And yes, she did forward a 4 5 report in relation to those particular matters. 15:29 And did you discuss this at all at that meeting? 6 195 Q. 7 I certainly can't say definitively, Chairman, if that Α. 8 issue was discussed at that particular meeting. Yes, I was aware, having spoken to Chief Superintendent McGinn 9 I was aware of the fact on the day that these matters 10 15.29 11 on the day were being referred to Garda Headquarters in 12 relation to the content of what --13 Do you mind if I interrupt? I understand CHAIRMAN: 14 you've had some unpleasant thing like root canal 15 treatment or something, am I wrong? 15:29 16 NO. Α. 17 I thought you had an appointment for 3:30. CHAIRMAN: 18 MR. HARTY: That is another witness I understand. 19 CHAIRMAN: I may have picked up things in the wrong 20 Ms. Leader what was -- or Mr. McGuinness. way. Ι 15:29 21 clearly got things wrong. I'm sorry to accuse you of 22 that superintendent. I'd be in pain, all right. 23 Α. 24 MR. McGUINNESS: The position, Chairman, is that we 25 were notified a couple of days ago that Chief 15:30 Superintendent McGinn had a personal medical 26 27 appointment. 28 CHAIRMAN: Oh yes, sorry, I didn't mean to go into I mixed up the chief superintendents. 29 that. So we can

88

1 go on.

2 MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.

3 CHAIRMAN: Or do we have some other witness who has a problem? 4 5 MR. McGUINNESS: No, no. Certainly as far as I 15:30 6 understand it we can proceed with Superintendent 7 McGovern and Chief Superintendent McGinn I think won't be reached this afternoon, and were Mr. Harty and all 8 9 others to finish with Superintendent McGovern I had intended to interject the evidence of Garda Campbell 10 15.3011 who had made a statement at short notice and is 12 available. If we can't reach him today he's not 13 available tomorrow and it would be proposed to have his 14 evidence on Monday, if that were suitable. So I think 15 we should proceed and see where we get to. But it's 15:31 16 not my intention to call and start Chief Superintendent 17 McGinn today. 18 Okay. I am sorry, I obviously got that --CHAIRMAN: 19 picked it up entirely the wrong way. And Garda 20 Campbell I presume is in volume 7, is he? 15:31 21 MR. MCGUINNESS: Yes. 22 CHAIRMAN: what page is he at, just so I can see? IS 23 he at the very end? 24 MR. MCGUINNESS: He's I think 2464, it's five statements from the end. 25 15.31 196 Superintendent McGovern, can I put it this 26 MR. HARTY: 0. 27 way: Leaving that meeting on the 8th October, did you believe that Garda Keith Harrison would be returning to 28 29 work at the end of his leave period over the following

89

number of days?

2 I certainly was aware that Chief Superintendent McGinn Α. 3 proposed on the day to refer the matter to Garda Headquarters Internal Affairs section and I have seen 4 5 the report that she sent in relation to it. I have 15:32 seen the report that Chief Superintendent McGinn 6 7 prepared and sent in relation to the actual situation. 8 I have. And you weren't involved in any decision-making process 9 197 Q. in relation to that? 10 15.3211 Α. It wasn't, it wasn't my decision to make. I couldn't 12 make a decision in relation to what should or shouldn't 13 happen to Garda Harrison. It was not my 14 responsibility. Not my decision. Chief Superintendent 15 McGinn prepared her report in relation to the matter. 15:32 16 She may well have consulted me in relation to the 17 matter, yes, but not in relation to any decision in relation to Garda Harrison. I had no decision-making 18 19 ability in relation to that. I made no decisions. She 20 prepared her documentation in relation to the matter 15:33 and she referred that documentation to Internal Affairs 21 and it was a decision to be made thereafter. 22 And that document was a document calling for the 23 198 **Q**. 24 immediate suspension of Garda Harrison, isn't that 25 correct or alternatively a transfer out of the Donegal 15.33 division? 26 27 I cannot --Α. 28 Perhaps go to 1629. This is the last sentence. 199 0. 29 CHAIRMAN: What is the date of it?

90

1 MR. HARTY: This is 10th October. This is the initial 2 sally. Very last sentence: 3 "An alternative to suspension --" 4 5 15:33 6 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, you said Chief Superintendent Sally? Chief superintendent -- I'm not sure what I 7 MR. HARTY: 8 said. Chief Superintendent McGinn signed this on the 10th October. Sent it on the 10th October. 9 10 15.33 11 "An alternative suspension would be to transfer Garda 12 Harrison to another division." 13 14 And that was conclusion of it; it was a request for 15 suspension or in the alternative out of Donegal. 15:34 16 Yes, Mr. Chairman, I seen this report, yes. Α. And the point about it is, is that Garda Harrison on 17 200 Q. 18 the 10th October, it's being requested that he be 19 either suspended or out of Donegal. And still that 20 suspension would have been dependent on the 15:34 investigation then, wouldn't it, being completed? 21 22 The request to chief superintendent --Α. 23 He was going to be suspended until the criminal 201 **Q**. 24 investigation was completed? 25 Yeah, the request to the Chief Superintendent Internal Α. 15.34Affairs by Chief Superintendent McGinn would have been 26 27 based on the statement of complaint as presented by Marisa Simms on 6th October. 28 29 202 And he would have been suspended until the 0.

91

1			investigation was completed, isn't that correct?	
2		Α.	I can't answer that, Mr. Chairman. I don't know what	
3			decision	
4	203	Q.	In your experience where members are suspended during	
5			the course of a criminal investigation those members	15:35
6			remain suspended until the conclusion of the criminal	
7			investigation, isn't that correct?	
8		Α.	Well, where a decision is made to suspend a member	
9			certainly initially it would, there would be a certain	
10			timeframe put on the actual suspension notice.	15:35
11			CHAIRMAN: Can I just stop there? We might try and go	
12			on for a bit, should we, Ms. Kelly, change	
13			stenographers now?	
14			STENOGRAPHER: No, it is fine.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Well, if you are here for another hour, it	
16			might be a good idea.	
17				
18			THE HEARING ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND THEN RESUMED	
19			AS FOLLOWS:	
20	204	Q.	MR. HARTY: Superintendent McGovern, I think you left	15:46
21			the meeting on 8th October, you had been certain that	
22			what was decided at that meeting would have	
23			consequences for Garda Harrison's employment in the	
24			short-term and could potentially have consequences for	
25			Garda Harrison's employment in the long-term, isn't	15:47
26			that correct?	
27		Α.	Based on the reports as presented on the 10th October	
28			2013, yes, there were consequences identified in that	
29			report for Garda Harrison.	

205 Yes. And did you see that report of the 10th October? 1 Q. 2 I cannot tell the Tribunal when I I seen that report. Α. 3 seen that report, but I certainly seen that report. I've looked at the report again and I have certainly 4 5 have seen that report, yes. 15:47 6 206 You see, what I have to put to you is not only did you Q. have an obligation to Marisa Simms to investigate her 7 8 complaints, you also had an obligation to Garda Harrison to investigate the complaints because this 9 hanging out there in relation to him, had immediate 10 15.4711 consequences for his employment, isn't that correct? 12 Yes, the statement of complaint as made by Marisa Α. 13 Simms, if the content of it were factual, yes, it had 14 consequences for Garda Harrison. 15 207 Even if the consequences weren't factual, it had Q. 15:48 16 immediate consequences for Garda Harrison because the 17 chief superintendent wrote to have him suspended or moved division, and it came back that an alternative 18 was suggested by internal affairs which was that he was 19 20 to be kept on station duties only. So, this 15:48 21 investigation had consequences immediately for Garda 22 Harrison, whether the contents of the statement were 23 true or false, you accept that? 24 Yes, Mr. Chairman. Α. 25 Q. So you had an obligation in An Garda Síochána to 208 15.48investigate that, both for Ms. Simms and for Garda 26 27 Harrison, isn't that correct? That is correct. 28 Α. 29 209 Now, after that meeting, you contacted the chief Ο.

93

superintendent in respect of the GSOC referrals, isn't 1 2 that correct, on 9th October, isn't that correct? From 3 your notes -- or your notes read: "Chief superintendent re GSOC, no response." 4 That would be correct. That is simply a note I made on 15:49 5 Α. 9th October. I would have spoken to chief 6 7 superintendent Letterkenny and at that stage I had 8 received no decision or response from GSOC in relation to the actual referral, the section 102 referral. 9 And then the chief superintendent received 10 210 Q. 15.5011 correspondence in relation to it from chief 12 superintendent Anthony McLoughlin, isn't that correct? 13 Because that correspondence was forwarded to you I 14 think at page 1714. 15 15:50 16 "With reference to the above and previous correspondence... dated 10th October, the content of 17 18 which is noted, your recommendations have been 19 considered. Having read the accompanying attachments I 20 am of the view that in the circumstances as outlined in 15:50 the attached statement --" 21 22 23 Etcetera. 24 25 "-- the more appropriate action in this matter 15.50available to local Garda management is for the member 26 27 concerned to be confined to indoor duties. From the details contained in the correspondence received at 28 29 this office to date it is unclear why this matter was

94

deemed suitable for referral to the Garda Síochána 1 2 Ombudsman Commission pursuant to the provisions of 3 section 102 of the Garda Síochána Act, as amended, I am therefore to seek your views and those of the district 4 5 officer in this regard. 15:51 6 7 Report in early course please." 8 And that was dated 21st October. And it appears to be 9 10 forwarded to you on page 1782 by Chief Superintendent 15.51 11 McGinn: 12 13 "I refer to the above matter and attached 14 correspondence from Chief Superintendent, Internal 15 Affairs, which is forwarded for your information and 15:51 16 report please." 17 18 And you were required to explain to the head office as 19 to why this section 102 referral was made, isn't that 20 correct? 15:52 That is correct. Chairman. 21 Α. 22 And you replied to that on page 1781: 211 Q. 23 24 "The section 102 referral in this case was based on the content of the statement of complaint made by Marisa 25 15.52 26 Simms and follow-up briefing, as provided by Inspector 27 Goretti Sheridan, who had met with and recorded the 28 criminal complaint by Ms. Simms. For your information 29 please."

Page 1780 is Chief Superintendent McGinn's response, and she says:

5 "On 8th October a case conference was held to assess 15:52 6 and analyse all the available information regarding the 7 alleged assaults and threats to Marisa Simms by Garda 8 Harrison. After analysis and consideration of the seriousness of the incidents, including the threat to 9 Ms. Simms and her children and the threats against 10 15.52 11 Garda Harrison, it was determined that the behaviour of 12 Garda Harrison created a substantial risk of death or 13 serious harm to Ms. Simms and her children. 14 Consequently it fell within the remit of section 102 of the Act and therefore the referral was made by the 15 15:53 16 district officer in Milford, the area where most of the 17 serious alleged offences took place."

18

1

2

3

4

19That's correct, isn't it, that is what she wrote? Did20you see that letter?15:53

- A. I believe so, Mr. Chairman. No issue arises in
 relation to the content of it.
- 23 212 Q. Except that in fact you had two different reasons as to
 24 why you were making the complaint. Your letter doesn't
 25 set out a reason, but if we go to page 1612, which is 15:53
 26 from the report of Darren Wright, senior investigating
 27 officer at GSOC, and if we go down to the action taken,
 28 that paragraph, thank you.

29

"It is clear from the available information that the matter should have been notified to GSOC pursuant to section 85 of the Act on receipt of the complaint from Ms. Simms. It has not been done. It is also clear that the matter should not have been the subject of a section 105 referral as there is no death or serious harm.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

17

18

19

Two different rationales have been provided for the 9 referral from the superintendent and the chief 10 15.5411 superintendent concerned. The superintendent stated it 12 was due to the psychological harm element of the 13 incident: the chief superintendent has stated the 14 referral was made as they believe there is the chance 15 that Harrison may cause death or serious harm to Simms 15:54 at some point in the future." 16

So they were in fact different justifications for the section 102 referral, isn't that correct?

20A.I acknowledge that, Mr. Chairman. I made my15:5421submissions and Chief Superintendent McGinn made hers22and I have put on the section 102 referral my23definitive reasonings for referring the matter in the24first place, when I referred it on the 8th and 9th25October.26212212O

26 213 Q. But in any event, you were aware from the letter sent
27 by Anthony McLoughlin on page 1714, which is dated 21st
28 October 2013, that because of the matters raised in the
29 section 102 referral, Garda Harrison was to be confined

97

1			on indoor duties, isn't that correct?	
2		Α.	Yes. That was the decision that was made by Internal	
3			Affairs in relation to the matter.	
4	214	Q.	And the fact of the matter is, nobody investigated the	
5			complaint because fundamentally the matter had given \square	5:55
6			rise to Garda Harrison being put on indoor duties and	
7			nobody in Donegal division saw that there was any	
8			reason to progress the matter any further?	
9		Α.	Mr. Chairman, bar going back over the reasonings I have	
10			already given in relation to what investigative	5:56
11			measures was put in place in the Donegal division in	
12			relation to the referral of the matter and the	
13			follow-up attention it got I cannot add anything	
14			further on the day in relation to the actual matter,	
15			Chairman.	5:56
16	215	Q.	And you left Garda Harrison stuck in mandatory station	
17			duties until he went out sick the following summer.	
18		Α.	Mr. Chairman, I didn't do that. I wasn't responsible	
19			for making those decisions.	
20	216	Q.	And you never went to Garda Harrison and asked him what ${}_{1}$	5:56
21			his version of events was, did you?	
22		Α.	I've never spoken to Garda Harrison in relation to the	
23			matter. I wasn't physically investigating the actual	
24			criminal complaints that were contained in the actual	
25			statement made by Marisa Simms on 6th October 2013.	5:57
26	217	Q.	Did you suggest to Sergeant McGowan that she or	
27			Inspector Sheridan, or the two of them combined, should	
28			put the statement of Marisa Simms to Garda Harrison?	
29		Α.	I didn't do that, Chairman. It wasn't my	

- 1 responsibility to do that.
- 2 218 Q. Do you accept that he could have expected that at least 3 where he was being kept on station duty by reason of 4 apparently a serious criminal complaint, he could have 5 at least expected to be asked for his version of 15:57 6 events?

15.58

15:58

A. Yes, Mr. Chairman, that course of action was planned
and, again, as I explained in relation to why that
course of action never took place.

10 219 Q. No, it didn't -- it was never planned.

11 A. It was, Mr. Chairman.

- 12 220 No. Your plan was that it would go to GSOC and they 0. 13 might deal with it. I am asking you about senior 14 members of the force in Donegal, which one of you 15 planned to put the matters to Garda Harrison to see 16 whether they were true, false, exaggerated, 17 understated, whatever, so that Garda Harrison could 18 return to normal policing duties, what plan was done 19 for that?
- 20 When the Garda Ombudsman Commission decided not to Α. 15:58 pursue the matter any further, then again, to save 21 22 repeating myself, Chairman, Chief Superintendent McGinn 23 requested the appointment of an independent 24 superintendent from outside the division to carry out 25 the particular investigations. I was appointed 15.58 26 subsequently. My appointment on the day was cancelled. 27 Superintendent Murray was appointed thereafter in relation to the matter and I think the Tribunal is 28 29 familiar with what the outcome of that particular

99

1			situation was.	
2	221	Q.	By the time Superintendent Murray had acted, it was 15	
3			months I want to be fair to her, 15 months from the	
4			date of the original receipt of the original	
5			complaint. Do you think a member of An Garda Síochána	15:59
6			should be permitted, allowed, caused, required to sit	
7			on station duties for 15 months without anyone putting	
8			an allegation to him?	
9		Α.	Mr. Chairman, it's a situation that	
10	222	Q.	Yes or no.	15:59
11		Α.	No, I cannot answer that question, Mr. Chairman. It	
12			was a situation that outside my control. So when it	
13			was outside of my control then there is no point in me	
14			making providing a view or otherwise to the Tribunal	
15			in relation to it.	16:00
16	223	Q.	Have you ever found yourself where you have been	
17			confined to station duties for 15 months because of an	
18			allegation made against you?	
19			CHAIRMAN: Well, maybe first of all have you ever been	
20			working just in a station like desk duties for a year	16:00
21			and a bit?	
22		Α.	On the direction of a senior officer?	
23			CHAIRMAN: Well, I presume you would be there because	
24			of a senior officer says what you are going to do for	
25			the next while is this or you are there	16:00
26		Α.	No, Mr. Chairman.	
27			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
28	224	Q.	MR. HARTY: I take it you wouldn't like it?	
29		Α.	I've been lucky that I have never had that experience,	

- 1
 - Mr. Chairman.
- 2 225 And the situation is that, I take it you would expect Q. 3 if somebody had made an allegation against you that your superiors had somehow used, firstly to seek your 4 5 suspension, secondly to seek your movement from a 16:01 6 division and then thirdly to keep you on station duty 7 for 15 months, I take it you would agree with me that 8 the least you would expect is somebody would come and ask you for your version of events? Would you 9 expect -- would you expect it or not, superintendent? 10 16.01 11 It's not a hard question.
- 12 It was always intended that the actual allegations that Α. 13 were contained in this particular statement would be 14 put to Garda Harrison at some stage during the course 15 of the investigations, irrespective of who was carrying 16:01 16 out the investigations.
- 17 226 And would you expect them to take 15 months to do that? Q. 18 Some investigations take longer periods of time than Α. 19 others. Some are smooth running, some are presented 20 with certain difficulties on the day that prevent 16:01 issues or concerns in relation to those particular 21 22 investigations advancing in a significantly fast and 23 timely fashion. These situations were presented in 24 this particular investigation and the timeframes in 25 relation to what they are, what happened and how they 16.02occurred is very, very clear and it's been presented 26 27 before the Tribunal.
- And had you investigated it and had you believed that 28 227 Q. 29 the allegations were serious, I take it -- I would put

to you, you would have investigated it, had you investigated it this could all have been dealt with in October 2013?

It's a hypothetical situation, Mr. Chairman. 4 Α. I was not 5 appointed to investigate it. I cannot answer that 16:02 particular situation. It was -- it was the intention 6 7 of the referral to the Garda Ombudsman Commission that 8 it would have received an investigation by an independent investigating authority at that particular 9 That didn't happen. It may well have been the 10 time. 16.02 11 same situation, like, Marisa Simms did not cooperate 12 with the Garda Ombudsman Commission in relation to that 13 particular investigation, she also withdrew her 14 criminal complaint to An Garda Síochána in relation to 15 the matter, so the situation was always going to be 16:03 16 presented with a difficulty in relation to the 17 investigations. _

18 228 The statement wasn't withdrawn by Marisa Simms until Q. 19 Januarv. The Garda Síochána Ombudsman Commission had 20 indicated they weren't going to be able to proceed with 16:03 the matter, they knew that by the middle of October. 21 22 The next thing that is done is a letter is written to get somebody from outside the division, and that is 23 24 sent in November to investigate the matter. That 25 appointment doesn't come out until January. You auite 16.03 rightly say I can't do the disciplinary investigation. 26 27 And then two weeks later Superintendent Murray is But GSOC led to precisely one week's 28 investigating it. 29 delay in the investigation of this matter, every other

- delay in the investigation of this matter falls at the
 feet of An Garda Síochána.
- A. All I can say, Mr. Chairman, I wasn't involved in
 delaying the investigative process.
- 5 229 And then if we come back to your notes at 2462. And Q. 16:04 6 sorry, I should say before I come to that, you do 7 accept that allegations of this nature hanging over a 8 member of An Garda Síochána on their personnel file and insofar as his dealings with his colleagues is 9 10 concerned, they are serious matters left hanging out 16.0411 there, isn't that correct?
- A. The allegations that were contained in the statement as
 made by Marisa Simms on 6th October were extremely
 serious in nature.
- 15 230 Q. Yes. But not so serious that anyone felt they needed 16:04
 16 to investigate it in Donegal?
- A. Mr. Chairman, I have already answered that particular
 situation. I cannot advance it any further.
- 19 231 Q. And you accept, would you wish if such allegations were
 20 made against you, that they would be investigated 16:05
 21 promptly?
- A. I think everybody would hope that allegations made
 against them would be investigated and a conclusion
 would be reached.
- 25 232 Q. And you accept that Garda Harrison didn't get that?
 26 A. Marisa Simms, by withdrawing her statement of complaint
 27 in relation to the matter, certainly prevented the
 28 substantive investigation of the matter.
- 29 233 Q. That was three months later and it didn't prevent the

substantive investigation of the matter, in fact two
 weeks later Superintendent Mary Murray was appointed to
 investigate it, and did nothing for a further ten
 months.

- 5 Ms. Simms failed to cooperate with the Garda Ombudsman Α. 16:05 Commission in relation to the matter. 6 She subsequently 7 withdraw her statement of complaint. Superintendent 8 Murray was appointed to carry out certain investigations in relation to the matter, but her 9 investigation, she would have been presented with 10 16.0611 difficulties bearing in mind that there was a lack of 12 cooperation at this particular time by Marisa Simms in 13 relation to the matter due to the fact that she had 14 withdrawn her statement of complaint in relation to the matter. 15 She didn't withdrew the complaints, she 16:06 16 withdrew her cooperation with the investigation. 17 234 She never made a complaint to the Garda Síochána Q. Ombudsman commission, isn't that correct? Please 18 19 accept the blindingly obvious, it makes it easier for 20 us. 16:06 No, she didn't make a complaint directly to the Garda 21 Α.
- 22 Ombudsman Commission in relation to the matter. We referred the matter because of the fact there was a 23 24 Garda member, a serving Garda member, involved and 25 because of the serious nature of the incident that was 16.06alleged. We referred that matter or I referred that 26 27 matter specific on the day to the Garda Ombudsman Commission for the purpose of investigations. 28 Marisa 29 Simms was provided with the opportunity when contacted

by Mr. O'Doherty to cooperate with them in relation to
 the investigation.

3 235 Q. Please don't use the word cooperate. That is4 inaccurate.

5 Well, that is word and that is the word I propose to Α. 16:06 She did not cooperate with the actual -- with 6 use. 7 Mr. O'Doherty in relation to the matter and indicated 8 she did not wish to have any involvement in relation to the matter. It subsequently on the day was referred 9 back to ourselves. Ms. Simms subsequently withdrew her 16:07 10 11 statement and made a statement not withdrawing the 12 allegations but withdrawing her cooperation in relation 13 to the Garda investigation in relation to the matter. 14 And as I say, Superintendent Murray after my 15 appointment was terminated was subsequently appointed 16:07 16 to carry out certain investigations in relation to the 17 matter.

18 236 Q. Was there any point appointing Superintendent Murray to
19 carry out an investigation once Marisa Simms had
20 withdrawn her statement?

16:07

- There still was an obligation to carry out inquiries in 21 Α. 22 relation to the allegations that were contained within the statement of Marisa Simms to verify in some shape 23 24 or form whether in fact those particular allegations were true. And if they were true, as you have already 25 16.07 26 represented to the Tribunal, they had significant 27 consequences for Garda Harrison if those allegations were deemed to be true. 28
- 29 237 Q. Which was why it was important when Marisa Simms did a

- 1 statement of retraction it said that the contents were 2 true but she no longer wished to pursue a criminal 3 complaint? That's correct. As I have indicated she withdrew her 4 Α. 5 cooperation with the criminal investigation that she 16:08 6 had commenced on 6th October 2013. But the statement remained valuable for the purposes 7 238 **Q**. of --8 She did not indicate at any stage, irrespective of the 9 Α. fact that it's represented at this Tribunal -- it's 10 16.08 11 been represented at this Tribunal that what was contained in that statement is not in fact true. 12 Τt 13 was never -- she never represented at any stage to An 14 Garda Síochána and at the time she made her statement 15 of withdrawal what was contained in the statement, the 16:08 16 allegations that were contained within it, which were 17 extremely, were not true and factual. 18 Before we move on from that particular point, is there 239 Q. 19 anything in that statement by Marisa Simms to say that 20 (a) the contact from Garda Harrison made to her by way 16:08 of text messages or otherwise, over the course of the 21 22 2011, 2012 fitted within the definition of harassment under the Non-Fatal Offences Against the Person Act? 23 24 Because nobody asked her whether she found the contact at the time to be harassment. 25 16:09 26 What Ms. Simms represented in her statement of Α. 27 complaint on 6th October 2013, I am 100 percent satisfied fall within the remit of section 10 of the 28
 - 106

Non-Fatal Offences Against the Person Act in relation

29

to harassment.

2 240 Q. Right. Why do you say it falls within the meaning ofthe Act?

4 A. That's my --

5 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harty, as I said before, I have not only 16:09 6 read the Act but also wrote about the Act, and I wonder 7 is this getting a bit like the famous case, when the 8 man pointed the gun at the person behind the counter and counsel failed to ask the question 'How did you 9 feel when the gun was pointed at you?', you know it can 16:10 10 11 be inferred. It is a famous case. Indeed, I think it 12 appeared in a film, was it called The General? I am 13 not sure.

14 241 Ο. MR. HARTY: what I am asking about that is very simple, which is: The harassment -- insofar as Marisa Simms 15 16:10 16 refers to the harassment element at all. she refers to 17 looking back on it, it's all retrospective, not how she 18 felt at the time, so it's very clear that at the time 19 she didn't feel harassed, and it didn't come within 20 Section 10. In relation to the threats, central to a 16:10 threat to kill in order to be a criminal offence is 21 22 whether the person who makes the threat intends the 23 person who hears the threat to believe that they are 24 going to do it, isn't that correct? 25 Yes, the person to whom the threat is made, certainly Α. 16.1026 on the day is a validating criteria that they would 27 believe that the threats may well be carried out.

28 242 Q. I don't think they need to believe it, I think the29 person who makes the threat has to want the person to

107

whom they make it?

2 No, the person -- the injured party is the person who Α. 3 receives the actual threat. The crime is not dictated by who makes it. the crime is dictated by the person 4 5 who receives the actual threat. 16:11 6 243 Well, just so we are clear and, as I say, the Tribunal Q. has read it: 7 8 "A person without lawful excuse makes to another a 9 threat by means of intending the other person to 10 16.11 11 believe it will be carried out, to kill or cause serious harm to the other person, shall be guilty of an 12 13 offence." 14 15 In other words, I have a four-year-old who tells me on 16:11 16 a regular basis he is going to kill me, neither of us 17 believe that I am going to believe him that he is going 18 to do it. And in relation to threats to kill, the use 19 of the words "I am going to burn you" is only a criminal offence if the person who says it intends the 20 16:11 other person to believe that they are going to carry it 21 22 And there is nothing in the statement from Marisa out. 23 Simms to suggest that she believed that Garda Harrison 24 intended her to think that she was going to carry -- he 25 was going to carry it out, nothing. 16.1226 So what is being put to you then, chief CHAIRMAN: 27 superintendent, is the notion that in the statement, no criminal offence is disclosed at all. 28 29 MR. HARTY: There are one or two minor ones, I would

accept, in the statement, in the frame in which it is 1 2 provided, there is certainly mention in the statement 3 of an assault, perhaps under section 3, certainly a section 2 assault. but in terms of the actual 4 seriousness of the statement, nobody in that room seems 16:12 5 6 to have thought that Keith Harrison was going to carry 7 it out. 8 CHAIRMAN: In other words, did you think it was a

9 lovers' tiff or a series of lovers' tiffs or did you 10 think it was something more serious than that on 11 reading the statement? I think is basically the 12 question.

16.12

- A. On reading the statement and the actual allegations
 that were presented within the statement by Marisa
 Simms, the allegations that were contained therein were 16:13
 deemed to be extremely serious in nature.
- 17 244 MR. HARTY: But you didn't investigate them, you didn't Q. 18 engage in any crime prevention steps in relation to it, 19 you didn't give Marisa Simms any crime prevention 20 advice, you didn't carry out surveillance of Marisa 16:13 Simms' home, you didn't bring Garda Harrison in to 21 22 investigate them, you didn't do anything. You sent it 23 to GSOC and you sent it to Tusla.
- A. No, as I already said, Mr. Chairman, Ms. Simms was provided with crime prevention advice. She was given advice by Inspector Sheridan and it's in the reports that are presented to the Tribunal in relation to the actual domestic violence orders that were available to her. And it was represented to this Tribunal she was

109

1			actually Googling these particular orders for the	
2			purposes of acquiring information in relation to them.	
2				
			So she was provided with that particular advice. What	
4			we couldn't prevent and what we weren't in a position	
5			on the day to prevent was the situation whereby she was	16:14
6			to return to reside with Garda Harrison. That	
7			situation we couldn't prevent. That is prevention we	
8			can't do.	
9	245	Q.	Inspector Sheridan gave her advice in relation to	
10			safety orders.	16:14
11		Α.	That would be correct, Mr. Chairman.	
12	246	Q.	She didn't give her advice in relation to the is it	
13			a GIM form?	
14		Α.	No, no, she didn't serve any GIM forms on that is	
15			acknowledged, there were no GIM forms served by	16:14
16			Inspector Sheridan on Marisa Simms.	
17	247	Q.	And a GIM form is a form that is standard practice to	
18			be served on somebody who has been the subject matter	
19			of a threat, isn't that correct?	
20		Α.	Yes, subject to the classification of the threat, yes.	16:14
21	248	Q.	What is the classification of the threat on a GIM form?	
22		·	How do you mean?	
23		Α.	The nature or the seriousness of the actual threat.	
24	249		If a threat is serious you would serve a GIM form, is	
25	2.15	۷.	that correct?	16:14
26		Α.	Yes.	10.14
27	250			
	250	Q.	And if it's not serious you wouldn't?	
28		Α.	No. You would give certain advice, crime prevention	
29			advice in relation to the matter and it wouldn't	

1			qualify for the service of the actual GIM forms.
2	251	Q.	But if a threat was serious it would qualify for the
3	231	۷.	service of a GIM form?
4		Α.	Yes, Chairman.
5	252	Q.	After the 10th October, your dates then suggest that
6	252	ų.	you have contact from Sergeant McGowan on 11th October,
7			"Possible couple back together, withdrawal of
8			complaint". Firstly, can you just tell me from those
9			notes is that contact from that is 2462 from
10			Sergeant McGowan to you or you to Sergeant McGowan?
11		Α.	No, that is a contact from Sergeant McGowan to me.
12	253	Q.	How did she say she believed the couple were back
13	200	۷.	together?
14		Α.	I don't recall, Chairman, if she actually told me how
15		/	she came by that information or where she or how she 16:15
16			believed it.
17	254	Q.	You then spoke to her on 12th October, again regarding
18	234	۷.	Garda Harrison, isn't that correct? That is what your
19			note says at the bottom of 2462.
20		Α.	Yes, it's simply a note of the fact on the day we spoke 16:16
20		Α.	
22			in relation to the matter and nothing nothing further arose in relation to it.
	255	0	
23 24	255	Q.	I think your notes in relation to Garda Harrison cease
24			on 12th October, isn't that correct?
25		Α.	That would be correct. And I have reviewed my notes
26			and I have allowed my contemporaneous notes to be
27			looked at, and I had no further dealings in relation to
28			the investigation or the matter that I had any cause to
29			make any notes in my journal in relation to, and I

1			subsequently went on transfer on 25th of October.	
2	256	Q.	But you did in fact have dealings with a letter	
3			received from Mr. Hone. It is dated 16th of October, I	
4			understand you say you didn't receive it until 22nd	
5			October, is that correct?	16:17
6		Α.	That certainly would be the situation.	
7	257	Q.	It's stamped.	
8		Α.	Mr. Chairman, that wouldn't be something I would be	
9			writing on my journal.	
10	258	Q.	And that is at page 769. And your evidence to the	16:17
11			Chairman was that it didn't arrive until 22nd October.	
12		Α.	Yes, it's date-stamped in our office on 22nd October.	
13	259	Q.	And you were aware at that stage of the strategy	
14			meeting having taken place, I take it, with Sergeant	
15			McGowan?	16:18
16		Α.	I think I have already said, I am aware that the	
17			strategy meeting took place, I don't know exactly when	
18			I became aware that the strategy meeting had taken	
19			place. But I was aware the strategy meeting had taken	
20			place. I would have I certainly on the day would	16:18
21			have been made aware at some stage by Sergeant McGowan	
22			that the strategy meeting had taken place, but I cannot	
23			assist the Tribunal in relation to when exactly on the	
24			day I became aware that it had taken place.	
25	260	Q.	You left was your last day in Milford the 24th	16:18
26			October?	
27		Α.	It was either the 24th or 25th. I think my date of	
28			transfer was the 25th of October and I think I still	
29			was in Milford tidying up on certain correspondence or	

1			outstanding correspondence of other matters before I	
2			left.	
3	261	Q.	But you read Mr. Hone's letter and you forwarded it to	
4			Sergeant McGowan on 24th October?	
5		Α.	I certainly did. 16:19	
6	262	Q.	My understanding from your evidence was that at that	
7			stage you certainly were aware of the strategy meeting	
8			having taken place?	
9		Α.	I was. I am not sure whether it was that day or it	
10			may well I certainly, I didn't speak to Sergeant	
11			McGowan specific in relation to it, but when that	
12			letter would have arrived I put a standard covering	
13			letter out to her in relation to the content of the	
14			actual letter.	
15	263	Q.	Your evidence yesterday was that on the arrival of the $16:19$	
16			letter on 22nd October, you would have known on the	
17			arrival of that letter that the strategy meeting had	
18			been held, that is at page 85, line 4, 5 or 3, 4 and	
19			5 of yesterday's transcript.	
20		Α.	I would have known on the 24th when I was answering the $_{\rm 16:20}$	
21			letter.	
22	264	Q.	So you knew when you were answering the letter on the	
23			24th?	
24		Α.	I would have well, when I sent the correspondence, I	
25			think it's dated the 24th October, the correspondence I $_{16:20}$	
26			sent to Sergeant McGowan in relation to	
27	265	Q.	You certainly knew when you were sending the letter to	
28			the Sergeant McGowan that the strategy meeting had	
29			already taken place?	

1 Yeah, as far as I can recall, Mr. Chairman, I was aware Α. 2 that Sergeant McGowan had already done the follow-up 3 with Tusla in relation to the matter, or the HSE. 4 And in your statement at page 196, at the very bottom: 266 Q. 5 16:20 6 "I am aware that the HSE confirmed to Sergeant McGowan 7 that they had closed their case on the matter." 8 It's a very definite statement, and every other 9 statement that you have given, superintendent, you have 16:21 10 11 been able to --12 That sentence arose yesterday and I wasn't -- I wasn't Α. 13 fully in a position to explain. Now I have read the 14 statement again and I don't think that comment is 15 directly related to the 24th October. It's a comment 16:21 16 in relation to the actual complete follow-up in relation to the matter, that basically I was putting a 17 18 note in my statement that I was aware on the day that 19 the referrals that I had made to the HSE in relation to 20 the matter had been finalised. 16:21 21 267 Right. 0. 22 Α. Not --23 I would have to put it to you, that is an unusual 268 **Q**. 24 explanation, superintendent, in circumstances whereby 25 the next line is "as per correspondence dated 1st 16.21 November 2013", in other words, your statement is very 26 27 chronological. 28 Yeah, but as I say, I have no -- there is no -- I Α. 29 didn't put a date on that there. Like, I mean my

114

1 statement is chronological in relation to dates. If 2 you look at it on 24th of October, then I -- or 25th October, whichever date it is, I am no longer based at 3 the Milford Garda district, so anything that followed 4 5 thereafter is correspondence I received in the Buncrana 16:22 Garda district and not specific in relation my role as 6 7 the district officer in Milford. 8 269 Sorry, and I am slightly confused as to how you were Q. 9 told that Sergeant McGowan or when you were told that 10 Sergeant McGowan had been advised by the HSE that they 16.22 11 had closed their case? 12 That is just, when I was making my statement on 4th Α. 13 July, that is -- that is a statement I was in a 14 position to make, that I was aware that the case in relation to the referrals had been finalised. 15 16:22 16 when did they close the case? 270 Q. 17 I cannot -- I cannot tell the Tribunal when that date Α. 18 was. 19 271 when did they inform Sergeant McGowan? Q. I cannot tell you that date either. 20 Α. 16:23 21 272 You see, the reason why I have to ask you these 0. 22 questions, superintendent, is that, in fact, from the 23 date of the strategy meeting on 21st October to contact 24 made by Sergeant McGowan in January of the following 25 year, and this is common case by Sergeant McGowan and 16.23the witnesses from Tusla, nothing was done by Tusla. 26 27 So in fact, your recollection in your statement that 28 the HSE had confirmed to Sergeant McGowan that they had 29 closed their case on the matter adds up, because they

115

1 did nothing until Sergeant McGowan contacted them 2 again.

What I am saying, Mr. Chairman, is that line in my 3 Α. statement, that comment in my statement is relevant to 4 5 the completion of my statement on 4th July 2017, 16:24 nothing in relation to what I knew or didn't know what 6 7 was going on in January of 2014. I had no further 8 involvement in relation to the matter once I left on 25th October, and. I know it's been represented to the 9 Tribunal in relation to Tusla, I received no request, 10 16.24 11 I had received no request and that is all I can say, I 12 had received no request from the HSE or Tusla for 13 either a copy of the statements that had been made in 14 relation to this particular matter the subject of the 15 referral or for an opportunity on the day to view or 16:24 16 review those particular statements. I am just saying that I myself as the district officer in Milford had 17 18 received no such request. 19 273 No, I appreciate that, and I don't think anyone has Q. suggested that you did receive such request. 20

No, I am just making it clear that I actually hadn't 21 Α. 22 received any request.

23 274 And I would have difficulty with your suggestion that Q. 24 this is somehow a closing off on the matter as your 25 statement goes on to deal with the matters of GSOC at 16.2426 some length and your disciplinary matters.

16:24

27 Α. Well, all I can say, Mr. Chairman, is, I don't believe there is anything significant in relation to the 28 I see nothing, nothing irregular in relation 29 matter.

116

1 to the actual comment that I have made there, that I am 2 aware that the matter was -- had been finalised. 3 If you wish to tell me that the matter in fact was never finalised, then I have no difficulty 4 5 acknowledging that I was mistaken in relation to my 16:25 comments in relation to it. 6 7 275 Superintendent McGovern, I had put to you that as far **Q**. as you were aware the HSE had closed their 8 investigation in October of that year, because that is 9 10 what your statement says. 16.2511 12 "On 24th October I provided Sergeant McGowan with a 13 copy of this reply and requested she should liaise with 14 Ms. Bridgeen Smith, social worker, HSE, to confirm there would be no further HSE intervention in the 15 16:25 16 I am aware that the HSE confirmed to Sergeant matter. 17 McGowan that they closed their case on the matter." 18 Yes, but --Α. 19 276 One sentence follows the other. Q. 20 No, all I am going to say, Mr. Chairman, is, in Α. 16:26 relation to the correspondence I sent on 24th October 21 22 2013 which presented a question, not in fact -- I 23 wasn't making a statement, I was asking a question, I 24 don't recall seeing any reply to that particular piece 25 of correspondence. 16.26CHAIRMAN: Yes, could I just intervene, superintendent? 26 On the 24th, I suppose the next day you were going to 27 28 other duties in another part of the country. 29 Yes. Α.

1 Obviously I have learned a great deal about CHAIRMAN: 2 how the HSE operate and I suppose the Gardaí would have been much more aware of at least some of it prior to 3 the start of this Tribunal, but it may be that Gardaí 4 5 might think as follows. Again, lets take it as 16:26 hypothetical, not this case, here is a statement made 6 7 by a woman who says that her husband is out of control, is an alcoholic and is beating her and the children. 8 Let's suppose that she makes a statement to that effect 9 10 to the Gardaí. Let's suppose you pass it over, which 16.27 11 you are obliged to do. And then let's suppose, let's 12 say a month later, if there even are bruises they would 13 have been well gone at that stage, she comes in and 14 says I am suffering from mental problems, I never meant 15 to make the statement and I am an alcoholic as well. 16:27 16 The Gardaí of course would be in a position then you 17 couldn't possibly bring a criminal prosecution, isn't 18 that the case? You would be finished in that instance. 19 Yes, in those particular situations, Chairman, we have Α. grave difficulty in pursuing those particular 20 16:27 prosecutions because the injured party generally will 21 22 not cooperate with our investigations. We don't have 23 an actual statement of complaint or they have withdrawn 24 their statement of complaint. 25 Okay. I can appreciate that. And I mean, CHAIRMAN: 16.27 26 one will have seen them over the years where indeed the 27 injured party will refuse to turn up in court and then 28 you have to apply to the judge for a warrant and then 29 you are arresting someone whose is supposedly a victim

118

1 of something and the whole thing becomes very unpleasant, and well, it's all contraindicated really. 2 But if it was the HSE did you think that maybe they 3 would be in the same position, if someone got an 4 5 initial contact in consequence of what the Gardaí sent 16:28 to the HSE and then the person makes the same 6 7 statement, if you like, of withdrawal and disavowal, I 8 am an alcoholic, I never meant to say any of that, were you under the impression at that time looking back to 9 10 October 2013, appreciating that procedures have changed 16:28 11 somewhat, that the HSE would be in the exactly the same position, they couldn't take it any further? 12 13 Α. NO. 14 CHAIRMAN: You think they could? 15 Once we would make the referral to the HSE or Tusla, as 16:28 Α. 16 the case may be, like, I mean they would -- and they would always carry out some form of evaluation in 17 18 relation to the actual content of the actual referral. 19 CHAIRMAN: Yes. And the fact on the day that our statement of complaint 16:29 20 Α. may well have been withdrawn would not -- and I am -- I 21 22 am not speaking for Tusla or the HSE, it would not 23 prohibit them from making the inquiries that they 24 needed to make to satisfy themselves that the referral 25 that we made on the day wasn't justified or that there 16.29wasn't evidence in support of it. 26 27 CHAIRMAN: So, as Donna McTeague said, perhaps in circumstances such as that they might speak to the 28 29 young lady alone just to try and get a sense of what is

119

1 going on before speaking to anybody else and try and 2 build up a rapport and see what is really going on? Certainly, like, this referral, Sergeant McGowan was 3 Α. identified as the officer to make contact with in 4 5 relation to the matter, so that Sergeant McGowan could 16:29 provide the relevant social worker with an up-to-date 6 7 set of facts or information that was in her possession 8 to assist them in making their actual investigation or inquiries. And it was in existence then, it's utilised 9 quite significantly more now but they were in a 10 16.29 11 position on the day to seek permission from ourselves 12 to sit down and review or the sharing of information, 13 the review of the statements, but it would be something 14 that is done significantly oftener now. So they could in effect conduct their own 15 CHAIRMAN: 16:30 16 investigations? 17 Yeah, yeah. The fact that a criminal investigation is Α. 18 withdrawn wouldn't stop that situation. 19 CHAIRMAN: Yes, I think I understand that. So, they 20 would be in a better position, but they wouldn't --16:30 well, I suppose unless it's a place of a safety order 21 22 where they would have to bring people to court and all 23 that, I mean which is the most serious kind of thing, 24 there was nothing to prevent them talking and seeing 25 where people stood? 16:30 26 No, absolutely not. Α. 27 CHAIRMAN: All right. I understand. 28 Superintendent McGovern, I have no more MR. HARTY: 29 questions, and thank you and I am sorry for taking so

120

1 much time.

-			
2		MS. LEADER: I just don't know if Mr. Harty wants to	
3		put it to the superintendent that the actual referral	
4		which he signed I think on 9th October was signed other	
5		than on a bona fide basis? That is the referral to the $_{16:30}$)
6		HSE.	
7		CHAIRMAN: Yes, the referral to the HSE, was that done	
8		in good faith based on the statement or did you think	
9		the statement had been taken in - I am sorry, the word	
10		dodgy is coming to mind and that is the word I would	I
11		use - circumstances whereby you shouldn't make a	
12		referral in good faith or did you do it in good faith?	
13		That is the issue.	
14	Α.	Based on the content of the statement and the	
15		allegations contained therein, and the fact on the day $16:31$	I
16		it was represented to us that and I would say it was	
17		represented to us that two children were actually	
18		were witness to a domestic violence-related situation	
19		and that is what was contained in the statement, we	
20		made two separate referrals, there was a mandatory $16:31$	Í
21		obligation on me under the regulations on the day to	
22		make that referral, and I am more than satisfied, and I	
23		still am more than satisfied, that it was a proper and	
24		appropriate referral to make to the HSE.	
25		CHAIRMAN: That's fine.	i
26		MR. HARTY: Sorry, just as a matter of propriety, I	
27		should just say, ask one or two questions in relation	
28		to that.	
29		CHAIRMAN: Well, if you wish, but I mean	

121

2 somehow --3 277 You signed off the referral as it had been compiled by Q. Sergeant McGowan, isn't that correct? 4 5 I had contacted Sergeant McGowan, asked her to prepare Α. the actual referrals in relation to both children. 6 She 7 took those referrals to me. I signed off on them as the 8 designated officer, which I am required to do, and I forwarded them, as the correspondence dictates I 9 forwarded them to the HSE for relevant attention. 10 11 278 Q. And insofar as the details contained on that referral 12 form, it is mirrored in the statement of Marisa Simms, 13 isn't that correct? This isn't a trick question, my 14 understanding is that the detail contained on the 15 statement is --

I don't want anyone to feel that I am

16:32

16.32

16:32

1

MR. HARTY:

- 16 It was a short -- a very, very -- it was a very, very Α. short synopsis of the actual terms of the referral. 17 18 One thing I should say to you, and in fairness to you, 279 Q. 19 would it not have been better to use a standard 20 referral form in relation to this rather than an abuse 16:33 child protection referral form? 21
- 22 Again, Mr. Chairman, this aspect was discussed here Α. 23 already. That is the appropriate, the proper and 24 appropriate designated form under the Children First 25 Guidelines and Regulations for An Garda Síochána to use 16:33 to make referrals of this particular nature to the HSE 26 27 or Tusla. That is the form, that is the form that we 28 It is the designated form at Appendix 5 of the use. 29 actual Regulations and it is the correct form.

122

1			Irrespective maybe of what may well have been thought	
2			it is the correct form.	
3	280	Q.	The form itself deals with child abuse, it doesn't	
4		~ -	and child protection, it doesn't deal with child	
5			welfare?	16:33
6		Α.	Well, it's emotional. And this was entered into in	
7			relation to the definition under the "domestic	
8			violence" under the Children First Guidelines or Policy	
9			and it is validated and it did qualify on the day for	
10			referral under those regulations.	16:33
11	281	Q.	And no one in Tusla believed that this came within the	
12			description of emotional abuse?	
13		Α.	well, it comes within the definition of the guidelines	
14			contained in the Children First Guidelines and as far	
15			as I was concerned, and I am still I have no reason	16:34
16			to change my view in relation to it, it's represented	
17			as emotional abuse and required referral as a mandatory	
18			referral on our behalf to Tusla.	
19	282	Q.	You accept that the experts in relation to it, in	
20			Tusla, believed it does not fall within the categories?	16:34
21		Α.	Well, Mr. Chairman, once the referral is made by the	
22			Garda authorities then after that it is the	
23			responsibility of	
24			CHAIRMAN: I know. And certainly there's some question	
25			as to the wording but their take on it is, yes, it was	16:34
26			and it should have been referred, now what Am I	
27			getting it wrong?	
28			MR. HARTY: No, it's the category of referral. This is	
29			a referral under appendix 5.	

CHAIRMAN: Oh yes, the category. But it should have
 been referred.

3 MR. HARTY: No, I am not arguing in relation to that. I am not saying on the basis of the information 4 5 available to Superintendent McGovern that his referral 16:34 was made not bona fide on his part, and that suggestion 6 7 is not being made, and if Ms. Leader needs me to make 8 that clear to him I am happen to say that I do not have any suggestion that Superintendent McGovern in terms of 9 filling out that form was doing anything that he didn't 16:35 10 11 honestly believe he ought to do at the time. And if 12 that clarification needed to be made I have no 13 difficulty making that clarification.

- A. Just one point, Mr. Chairman, I gather there's no
 allegation being made against me for doing it for the 16:35
 purposes of victimising either Garda Harrison or
 Ms. Simms in relation to the matter? It was done bona
 fide because of the actual content of the statement and
 for no other purpose or reason.
- CHAIRMAN: That is what I understand, but I have to 16:35
 look at things and make my mind up about,
- superintendent, whether people make the allegation or
 not, but it is helpful to see where the direction is
 and the direction is not going in.
- 25 MR. HARTY: Insofar as that impression might have been 16:35 26 given, there is not a suggestion -- I don't have 27 instructions in relation to that and it wouldn't be my 28 case. Thank you, superintendent.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: So Mr. Barnes, is there any questions?

124

1 MR. BARNES: Yes, sir, I have a few questions. And I 2 wonder if my friend would help me have a line of sight 3 of the witness. I appreciate it is not a criminal case but it would be helpful. 4 5 16:36 6 SUPERINTENDENT MCGOVERN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY 7 MR. BARNES: 8 283 MR. BARNES: Good afternoon, Superintendent McGovern. 0. I just have a few questions apropos of the question 9 posited by the Chairman; namely, was this ill motivated 16:36 10 11 as opposed to a genuine investigation? And I might 12 gloss that by saying, or at least was it motivated 13 otherwise than the ostensible reason for which it was 14 conducted? And, was that right or was it just not 15 right? You understand that? 16:36 16 You are asking me was our investigation ill motivated? Α. 17 No, I am not. I am saying that that is where I am 284 Q. 18 coming from, as the Chairman framed -- looking through 19 the prism of the Chairman, if you like, framed. Yes, 20 effectively that it was not conducted for the 16:37 ostensible reason of a proper criminal investigation, 21 22 which is proper to the Garda brand and that would pass 23 muster publically, or was it genuine; and that is where 24 we are coming from, you understand that? 25 I understand. And the situation hasn't changed for me. Α. 16:37 26 It was a genuine complaint made by Marisa Simms and it 27 was a genuine Garda investigation based on the actual 28 content of that particular statement, motivated for no other reason. 29

125

285 And you understand that she, while she has acknowledged 1 Q. 2 the general nature of the fact that she -- on the basis of the duration of the interview, if you like, and her 3 emotional state and for various other reasons it's 4 5 inaccurate, that there's a certain amount of prompting, 16:38 6 that when it got to the material aspect of the -- at 7 the very end of the interview, that she was nodding 8 along and agreeing with things and that there were several amendments that were not initialled and they 9 were not appropriate, you understand that? 10 16:38 11 Α. I understand that she -- those submissions have been 12 Nevertheless, when she did make her statement of made. 13 withdrawal she did not indicate that the content of 14 that particular statement was untrue. So from the very 15 outset An Garda Síochána and the people that were 16:38 16 tasked to investigate it, we were more than satisfied 17 that the content of the statement as presented by 18 Marisa Simms was true and factual and validated proper 19 criminal complaints. 286 And she will go further and say, I suppose, that the 20 0. 16:38 21 texts which may be superficially seductive I suppose as 22 to corroboration, were made in the context of a domestic dispute and are not at all reliable as 23 24 corroboration. So that is basically the framework of 25 where my cross-examination will be coming, you

16.39

27 Α. I appreciate it, but as far as the investigation team are concerned, the actual text messages in fact on the 28 29 day actually validated the content of the statement of

understand that?

26

126

1 complaint as opposed to the other way round.

2 287 That is your position and I quite appreciate that, but Q. 3 hers is opposed to it. And that I suggest to you is a reasonable proposition but I will move on. 4 Now. is it 5 normal in the context of a normal criminal 16:39 investigation that you would speak in terms of, as you 6 7 have spoken, securing an undertaking, an undertaking 8 from a victim to come in and give a statement? То secure an undertaking, that suggests a reluctance or a 9 lack of voluntariness. Is that part of your experience 16:40 10 11 as a senior guard of securing undertakings from victims 12 to make a complaint?

A. I think in this instance the initial complaints were
 made by or on behalf of Marisa Simms by concerned
 family members. So the subsequent contact was made
 with Marisa Simms in relation to presenting herself
 to make --

16:40

- 18 288 Q. None of which is an answer to the question, by the way.
 19 None of which is an answer to the question.
- 20 Please, if you let me finish I will answer the question 16:40 Α. for you. As a consequence Ms. Simms was contacted and 21 22 it may well be phraseology in the English language, but 23 as a result of the contact with her whether you say she 24 agreed to come in, she undertook to come in or she was 25 going to come in, then that's simply the situation. 16.4026 She agreed, whatever way you want to put it, she agreed 27 to present at Letterkenny Garda Station on 6th October 28 to make a statement of complaint to Garda personnel and 29 that is what happened.

127

Her sister was apprehensive and the primary 1 289 Q. Right. 2 motivation we have heard from Rita McDermott, the primary motivation of Paula's involvement was to make 3 sure there was no hassle at the wedding, not out of 4 5 concern for her sister, her mother alerted the Gardaí 16:41 6 and thereby you apprehended that there might be 7 something of interest in relation to Keith Harrison. 8 And what you said, and you definitely did use at least three different phrases, the first of which, which 9 might have been a little bit ill-advised, was an 10 16.4111 undertaking to come in to give a statement. Now, I am asking you, is it part of your experience as a senior 12 13 quard to secure undertakings from victims to come in 14 and give a statement? And is such, the requirement of an undertaking consistent with voluntariness? 15 16:42 16 Mr. Chairman, we contact injured parties, victims, on a Α. 17 daily basis, and sometimes those particular people 18 agree to allow us to come and visit them, sometimes on 19 the day they request on the day that they come and meet 20 So, look it, the wording that is used there is us. 16:42 Ms. Simms gave an undertaking that she was going to 21 22 come to Letterkenny Garda Station on 6th October to 23 meet up with the Garda members concerned and that is 24 all I read into it, Chairman. 25 Well, and you modified your phraseology in the next 290 Q. 16.42reference in direct examination to the word 26 27 "arrangement". You made an arrangement, which is But in cross-examination you 28 fairly innocuous. 29 referred to an agreement to come in. Now, that

128

1 suggests a negotiation, a reluctance, maybe a little 2 bit of arm-twisting, can I put that to you? 3 Α. Well, all I can say, Mr. Chairman, is my understanding that Marisa Simms' arm was not twisted by anyone 4 5 involved in this particular investigation to come to 16:43 Letterkenny Garda Station to make a statement of 6 7 complaint in relation to the matter. She came there of 8 her own free will. She was free to leave at any point of the actual statement-taking process, as has already 9 10 been represented by both Inspector Sheridan and 16.43 11 Sergeant McGowan, she didn't choose to do that. She came there of her own free will, she was told her 12 13 rights in relation to leaving the station if she so 14 wished, she made her statement of complaint and she went home. And that's it in simplistic terms. 15 16:43 16 well, is arrangement a little bit better than 291 Q. 17 undertaking or agreement in the context of her 18 reluctance that you apprehended? 19 Well, all I can say, Mr. Chairman, for me it's playing Α. with words in the English language as opposed on the 20 16:44 day just dealing with the simplistic aspect of 21 22 Ms. Simms being contacted by the Garda members 23 concerned and the 6th of October 2013, Sunday, 6th 24 October 2013 was the day that was arranged for her to 25 come to Letterkenny Garda Station to make a statement 16.44of complaint. 26 27 292 well, she kind of says that she was afraid that there Q. 28 would be guards, from Gweedore, coming down while there 29 are Canadian visitors and there was a wedding going on

129

1 and there was enough conflict. I suppose I am putting 2 words now into the equation that perhaps are not 3 supported by evidence. But certainly, certainly there was a sense of embarrassment, there was a sense of 4 5 trying to avoid guards coming to the house while there 16:44 6 were visitors, there was a sense of a need to comply 7 and give an undertaking or make an agreement with the 8 guards to give a statement that she wasn't particularly willing to give, isn't that the context? 9

- As I said earlier on, Mr. Chairman, sometimes we go to 10 Α. 16.4511 witnesses, sometimes they -- or victims and they come to us. On this occasion Ms. Simms was contacted, the 12 13 undertaking was given that we had no difficulty on the 14 day travelling to, it was in Meenderryowen in Annagry 15 she was living at that particular time, to take the 16:45 16 statement off her and not to put her under any inconvenience in relation to having to come to us in 17 18 relation to the matter, but she expressed to us --19 represented -- she expressed concerns that she didn't 20 want Garda members on the day calling out there at that 16:45 particular time, so she undertook, whatever word you --21 22 we wish to use, and I am going to use, she gave an 23 undertaking that she would present at Letterkenny Garda Station on 6th October 2013 to make her statement of 24 25 complaint. 16.45well, you appreciate that she takes a different view. 26 293 Q.
- A. No, I acknowledge that she has -- she is making a
 different representation in relation to the matter.
 They are just my views, Mr. Chairman, in relation to

130

1 it. 2 Now, would you think it's good for the Garda brand that 294 Q. victims, as you call them, would spend maybe two hours, 3 up to two hours in the Garda station on chitchat. about 4 5 five-and-a-half going into ambient features of their 16:46 6 intimate personal life and perhaps the last hour, at a 7 stretch, dealing with these serious -- I will just use 8 your own words here, serious threats to burn, to burn out, which is never part of the evidence, do you think 9 that that is a good signal to be sending out to the 10 16.46 11 public, that if they are victims they will spend an 12 awful long time before they get to the meat of it, talking about really irrelevant matters? 13 14 Α. Well, from a criminal investigation perspective, you 15 simply just can't sit down and start taking a statement 16:47 16 of evidence. Unfortunately, if you do that, it will 17 become very disjointed, no structure on it and it 18 creates a difficulty both for both the actual person from whom you are taking the statement and from the 19 people that is trying to take the statement. 20 So quite 16:47 a considerable time needs to be done preparing on the 21 22 day, the actual preparation work for the actual taking 23 of the statement before that actually takes place. And 24 this was explained by Inspector Sheridan and Sergeant 25 McGowan in relation to what they done and what needed 16.47 to be done prior to the actual taking of the statement. 26 27 I don't think it's represented that the statement 28 subsequently on the day was all recorded in one hour, 29 that everything that was done prior to that was by way

131

1 of introduction. It would not have been possible on 2 the day to record the 33 pages on the day in the 3 structured fashion that it was in simply an hour.

Q. 38 I believe. 4 295

28

- 5 38 pages, sorry. Α.
- 6 296 Just using perhaps a medical analogy, in relation to a **Q**. 7 matter, let's say to use your words, of serious and 8 urgent focus, and you present at Accident & Emergency, the analogy is that you would spend about 9
- seven-and-a-half hours in triage talking to a nurse 10 16.4811 about matters of your intimate personal life when the 12 gravamen of your presentation is to deal with threats 13 to burn, to burn out, possible risk of death, serious 14 harm, that doesn't make sense, does it?
- 15 I wasn't present at the actual taking of the actual Α. 16:49 16 statement.
- 17 297 I know, but you had experience --Q.

18 No, no, please, please, I wasn't present at the taking Α. of the actual statement so I don't know exactly on the 19 20 day what questions were asked or what information on 16:49 21 the day specific was sought. Nevertheless, Ms. Simms, 22 if she so chose or she wished not to provide any 23 intimate details in relation to her past, she was --24 that was her prerogative, she didn't wish to do that. 25 Oh, yeah --298 Q. She provided those facts on the day to Inspector 26 Α. 27 Sheridan and to Sergeant McGowan as part of the actual

29 I am not going to go into those unfortunate 299 0. Right.

structure of the taking of that particular statement.

132

16.49

16:48

1 details and questioning to which she was subjected to 2 in any great degree, but I would ask you to refer to page 71 of the materials. And maybe two-thirds or four 3 fifths of the way down the page. She instructs me she 4 5 was asked the question: Do you have more feeling for 16:50 Andrew or for Keith? And it's recorded there as if 6 7 it's part of a fluent narrative: "I had more feelings for Keith than Andrew." Now, what part of a valid 8 investigation as to threats to kill and harassment is 9 that? 10 16.5011 MR. DOCKERY: Chairman, that question was never put to 12 either of the two members who took the statement, and 13 it's the first time I have heard the suggestion made 14 that that portion of the statement was tricked or 15 cajoled out of Ms. Simms. It seems to be part of a 16:50 16 rolling narrative that grows additional limbs as the 17 days go by. 18 MR. BARNES: Well, I can't say that I remember that 19 that question was put, as such, and I would appreciate 20 the comments of the Chairman in relation to it. 16:51 But would you accept that -- by the way, she does say 21 300 0. 22 that that question was asked and she gives it as an 23 egregious example of the interview going anywhere other 24 than where it should have been going. And do you not 25 accept that it is the obligation of the interviewers, 16.51if you like, to direct the interview in relation to 26 27 matters which are relevant, which didn't happen for about seven-and-a-half hours intimate? 28 29 We often find that in relation to taking of statements Α.

133

1 from injured parties, that you often have to paint a 2 picture in relation to the actual background to what has led to the actual problems in the first place. And 3 as a result, there would certainly be -- there will be 4 5 quite a bit of background information included in the 16:52 6 statement in relation to both the injured party and the 7 person who is being complained about, provided the 8 person making the statement is happy and willing to provide that information. And Ms. Simms made this 9 statement, it was read over to her at the end. 10 She was 16:52 11 entitled to add or subtract anything that was contained 12 in that statement that she wasn't happy with or would 13 have felt was inappropriate, but she didn't do that. 14 She signed -- she -- the statement has been presented to the Tribunal. It's obvious on the day it was read 15 16:52 16 over to her. There was amendments made or she 17 initialled certain amendments that were made. If this, 18 what you have represented on the day was unacceptable, 19 unacceptable background material, unacceptable 20 questions on the day that may well have been put to her 16:52 and included in her statement, she was in a position to 21 22 say to the Garda officers that read over that statement 23 to her, and that is the reason why statements are read 24 other: is there anything you wish to withdraw, subtract, amend or otherwise. That was her prerogative 16:53 25 when that was done. So if she didn't want that 26 27 particular material in her statement, she was in a position to tell the officer who was reading it over to 28 29 her or making the amendments, I don't wish that there,

134

1 please strike that out, and that would have been done. 2 Don't you think it would be good for the Garda brand if 301 Q. 3 these type of details, which it might be argued were -could, to a certain degree, be desirable for the 4 5 purposes of maintaining a flowing narrative that 16:53 6 eventually comes to the meat, that having regard to 7 irrelevant personal details, the statement might have 8 been truncated to protect the interests of the witness? These personal details or personal information on the 9 Α. day that was provided by Marisa Simms, she provided 10 16:54 11 them. She provided that information. 12 You heard her speak in an impassioned way when she was 302 Q. 13 recalled, when it was asked was she in effect a grandstander or somebody looking for publicity, she was 14 15 on the point of weeping, talking about all her personal 16:54 16 details being aired in public unnecessarily, and one 17 might have formed the impression that it was this 18 process that victimised her rather than her domestic row on 28th September 2014 -- '13. Would you agree or 19 20 disagree? 16:54 Would you please repeat the question for me, please? 21 Α. 22 It's a fairly awkward question, so I don't think I 303 0. 23 She was recalled to the witness-box and it was will. 24 put to her that she was a publicity seeker and other 25 things. And she said that her motivation, that why 16:55 26 would anybody want to come here and have their details 27 aired in public, she referred to a garda blue-lighting her on her day to Dunnes, and that her motivation was 28 29 to seek peace. I am saying that -- you understand

135

1			that?	
2		Α.	I understand I understand that she said that, yes.	
3	304	Q.	And that she feels more victimised from that interview	
4			and what ensued from it than anything that occurred on	
5			September 28th 2013, do you understand?	16:55
6		Α.	I understand what you are saying, yes.	
7	305	Q.	Okay.	
8			CHAIRMAN: And do you want to say something about it,	
9			is what counsel is saying?	
10		Α.	All I can say, Mr. Chairman, is, she came to	16:55
11			Letterkenny Garda Station on 6th October 2013, she made	
12			a statement to Inspector Sheridan, Sergeant McGowan,	
13			two extremely experienced officers. She presented	
14			facts to them which they recorded in a statement of	
15			evidence which was subsequently read over to her and	16:56
16			she signed off on. There is no way that Sergeant	
17			McGowan or Inspector Sheridan would have taken down	
18			details that they felt on the day was so personal to	
19			her that it was going to actually victimise her greater	
20			than the actual complaints that she had put in her	16:56
21			statement. It would never arise. Like, I mean, the	
22			statement was taken for the purposes of conducting a	
23			criminal investigation, and the facts that were	
24			presented, they were presented by Ms. Simms on the day,	
25			on that particular day, and they were recorded in her	16:56
26			statement.	
27	306	Q.	Well, you do know that she was shocked when contacted	
28			by GSOC in the course of a medical examination, or a	

29

medical appointment, which kind of suggests that the

infection was brewing at around the time of the 1 2 interview, but she was shocked to discover that the 3 statement had gone to GSOC because she hadn't informed -- been informed that it would be. She was 4 5 shocked that it was sent to GSOC and she thought it was 16:57 6 for the eyes of the chief only. So when you say she is 7 making a criminal complaint, she says at least that it 8 didn't seem like that to her. What do you say? I know, Mr. Chairman, she has represented that 9 Α. particular fact, but from the outset and -- there 10 16.57 11 was -- there was never any other understanding of what 12 her purpose at Letterkenny Garda Station was, by the 13 members that were taking the statement. She was there 14 to make a statement of complaint. 15 307 You weren't there and you are not in a position to give 16:57 Q. 16 that evidence, I might suggest to you? Well, no, I wasn't, I wasn't there, but you are asking 17 Α. 18 me for my opinion in relation to a situation and I'm --19 I will give you my opinion, but I certainly on the day 20 can't speak nor I don't intend to speak on the day for 16:58 Sergeant McGowan or for Inspector Sheridan. And, I 21 22 mean, you can represent a situation in relation to how 23 your client felt on that particular day, and I accept 24 your representation, but I cannot put it past that 25 particular situation. 16:58 No, but you are after saying that you weren't there but 26 308 Q. 27 you would put it in categorical terms that there was 28 never any other understanding, and I am saying that you can't give that particular piece of evidence because 29

137

you don't know?

- 2 I am speaking for myself and I give that evidence on my Α. 3 own behalf; as far as I was concerned, that Marisa Simms was coming to Letterkenny on 6th October, came to 4 5 Letterkenny on 6th October to make a criminal 16:58 6 complaint. It was never my understanding at any stage. 7 until it was represented here to the Tribunal, that she 8 was there solely for the purpose of presenting a statement for Chief Superintendent McGinn. That 9 situation never arose. 10 16.59
- 11 309 So you have characterised the contents of the Q. 12 statement, presumably the contents at the very end, as 13 meriting, if you like, and I am just using the phrasing 14 and I am putting it in a sentence, as meriting serious 15 criminal investigation, a serious risk of harm and 16:59 16 possibly death, emotional harm, emotional and 17 psychological trauma, threats to burn, threats to burn 18 out, which were never made, a potential situation in 19 the future and a matter of serious and urgent focus. 20 That is how you characterised the contents of the 16:59 statement. Can you give us some justification for such 21 22 an evaluation, as a senior Garda officer, having regard to the contents of the statement? 23
- A. Mr. Chairman, that's what the statement says. That is what is presented in the statement. And as -- being asked a question as an experienced officer of 33 years service and having served in the day on the Donegal Women's Domestic Violence Services Board, I have represented this already to the Tribunal, I mean,

138

1 Ms. Simms presented to me as a person on the day who 2 was a significant victim of domestic violence. The 3 situation that presented in that particular statement raised serious concerns for me in relation to 4 5 Ms. Simms, her safety and the safety of her children. 17:00 6 From a rural policing perspective, I certainly would be 7 of the view on the day that most -- many of the murder 8 investigations that I have been involved in on the day have been domestic-related, and I had serious concerns 9 what the future consequences may well have been if this 17:01 10 11 situation was allowed to continue, if the facts as 12 contained in the statement as made by Marisa Simms on 13 the 6th October were correct, and I have to take it 14 still on today's date that those facts are correct 15 because when she made her statement of withdrawal she 17:01 16 never indicated at any stage to An Garda Síochána that 17 the facts that she made or the complaints that she made 18 on 6th of October and the situation that she presented 19 on 6th of October were untrue, and if that is the 20 situation, then the statement that she made, in fact, 17:01 on the day is false. 21 22 Right. Well, what parts of the statement, let's just 310 Q.

take the last one, this was to sort of -- this arose -take the last one, this was to sort of -- this arose -these comments, or most of them, arose in the context
of justifying, in answer to Ms. Leader's question, why 17:01
there would be such a high level Garda meeting with the
chief super, two supers, an inspector and a garda from
Internal Affairs, that it would be more perhaps
appropriate perhaps to a murder, and you indicated in

139

1 your answer, you used some of these phrases, and I am 2 asking you to point out for what pieces of evidence in the 38-page statement, right at the end thereof, which 3 4 would justify such a dramatic and urgent and serious 5 application of Garda resources? I mean, it seems to me 17:02 that a number of serious Gardaí were converging on the 6 7 control centre, perhaps with blue lights blazing, to 8 deal with a serious emergency, and can you just point out, please, what portions of the statement would 9 justify such a dramatic action and particularly the 10 17.02 11 phrasing that you have used to justify such a 12 high-level meeting?

13 The statement represented the criminal offences, as I Α. have outlined here to the Tribunal. One very important 14 and significant factor in relation to this whole fact 15 17:03 16 was, that the actual person against whom the complaints 17 were made was a serving member of An Garda Síochána. 18 For that particular reason, there was a greater 19 responsibility on us to ensure that if these facts 20 were -- if the facts or the actual criminal complaints 17:03 that is contained in that statement were correct. there 21 22 was an obligation on senior management to address that 23 particular issue.

24 311 Q. Well, would you like to allow me to tone down and give
25 you an opportunity to point out, by reference to the 17:03
26 document itself, what it is that justifies your
27 phraseology and the serious and urgent focus about
28 which you speak, and to focus your mind in a serious
29 way on the particular portions of the statement which

140

1			justify the position you have adopted?	
2			CHAIRMAN: So the question is, what are the worst bits	
3			of the statement, is that	
4			MR. BARNES: That is a much more elegant way of putting	
5			it.	17:04
6			CHAIRMAN: In other words, if you were to pick the	
7			highlights just from memory, what would you tend to	
8			maybe that is the best way of answering it.	
9		Α.	The most significant criminal offences contained in	
10			that particular statement is a threat by alleged	17:04
11			threat by Garda Harrison on the day to burn and bury	
12			Marisa Simms and her children and her sister. I think	
13			that is a significant and serious threat if it were to	
14			be carried out.	
15	312	Q.	MR. BARNES: And as an experienced guard, promoted	17:04
16			through the ranks over years of service, who has a lot	
17			of experience of evaluating evidence, can you point to	
18			anything that any piece of evidence that supports	
19			such really serious fears? You said, "serious risk of	
20			harm and possibly death".	17:05
21		Α.	Unfortunately, experience would dictate that, sadly,	
22			domestic violence-related situations unfortunately have	
23			in the past, and sadly no doubt into the future, will	
24			result in murder investigations.	
25	313	Q.	How many times do you want to avoid pointing to the	17:05
26			relevant matters?	
27		Α.	Do you want me to read out the actual paragraph of the	
28			statement?	
29			CHAIRMAN: No, you can answer the question if you wish	

1 any way you like. But what you are saying is that in 2 terms of the actual text, reading it as a Garda officer, it was something, and I actually am now going 3 to use the word alarm bells, that it was something 4 5 where you became concerned as to the past perhaps 17:06 6 leading to the future in the context of the experience you had had as an officer over many years. 7 8 That's correct. Mr. Chairman. I have represented that Α. Unfortunately, on the day, statistics will 9 already. show that before a victim of domestic violence has the 10 17.06 11 courage to come forward and make a complaint in 12 relation to abuse by a partner, that at least 25 13 previous incidents have already occurred. On this 14 occasion, Ms. Simms, she represented a catalogue of domestic-violence-related issues in the statement that 15 17:06 16 she made on 6th October. Like, I mean, based on what 17 was contained in that particular statement. one would 18 have to have serious cause for concerns for her 19 welfare, her safety and her ability to make decisions 20 in relation to the environment that she found herself 17:07 in. And the criteria for investigating criminal 21 22 offences, we only have to have reasonable cause to suspect that what is represented to us, in fact, on the 23 24 day are, in fact, factual, that justifies us in making 25 certain decisions and carrying out certain 17.07 But Ms. Simms came in on 6th of 26 investigations. 27 October, she made a specific and a lengthy statement in relation to a catalogue of incidents highlighting 28 29 threats to kill, threats to burn, assaults that were

142

perpetrated and incidents of -- and a significant 1 2 incident of domestic violence that occurred in the presence of her two children. If we weren't to act or 3 to carry out some form of investigations or put 4 5 measures in place on the day in relation to those 17:07 particular threats, then we would have been found 6 7 wanting in relation to our responsibilities on the day 8 as Garda investigators.

MR. BARNES: In relation to your evaluation, please, 9 314 Q. would you point out the piece of evidence that is the 10 17.08 11 worst example of a threat to kill and cause serious 12 injury within the meaning of Section 5 of the Non-Fatal 13 Offences Against the Person Act, 1997, and why the 14 threat therein contained is in any sense credible and 15 hangs together as something that would be credible? 17:08 16 In other words, I think the question is, how CHAIRMAN: 17 do you make the connection with potential homicide and 18 what is in the statement?

A. Ms. Simms alleged that she received a threat -- I will
read from her statement, at page 20 of her statement. 17:08
She arrives home to a particular situation at her
residence in Churchill and she relates to an incident
involving what was a request on the day to take home
curry chips, and this is what she says:

17:08

"He said don't think a curry chip will make up for me
being gone all evening. He started on in front of the
girls and I felt completely drained and just wanted him
to stop. I kept trying to put the child's top on and

25

143

he said no, he wouldn't stop, they know what is going 1 2 on, meaning the children. This is the first time that he even started going on -- this is the first time that 3 he even started going on in front of them. He kept 4 5 making comments and ranting on about my sister, saying 17:09 who does she think she is? I will take her down a peg 6 7 or two, and also said I am going to bury her and you. 8 He kept repeating this and I told him to stop, but it was as if he went into a total rant. He then said I am 9 going to burn you, and at that point I could see the 10 17.09 11 child's eyes filling up as she was getting upset so at 12 that stage I put their coats over their pyjamas and 13 told them we are going to the car." 14 MR. BARNES: Okay. Thank you. 15 I mean, that there -- and this was done also on the day 17:09 Α. 16 fuelled by alcohol consumption. 17 Yes. Well, isn't it not fair to say that - maybe it 315 Q. isn't - that looking at the entire statement, that he 18 also threatened or is alleged to have threatened that 19 20 "you would only see the children at the weekends"? 17:10 That has been represented, Mr. Chairman, yes. 21 Α. 22 So as an example of evaluation, can I put it to you, 316 0. and I am saying this seriously, that let's assume she 23 24 was burned, immolated and killed on the Monday and 25 buried on the Wednesday, it doesn't make sense really, 17.10 does it, that she would see her children at the 26 27 weekend? That's just part of a catalogue of comments, or 28 Α. 29 otherwise, that were made. The situation is, in

144

1 domestic-violence-related situations, like, you never 2 know where the actual incident of domestic violence If Ms. Simms had not to take her children 3 will end. and leave the house on this particular occasion -- this 4 5 represented as a significant and serious incident 17:11 involving Ms. Simms and her children. 6 If she didn't 7 decide to put her children in the car and get out of 8 there at that particular time, no one can actually decide or make or provide a view as to what may well 9 have followed in relation to that particular incident. 10 17.11 11 317 Q. Right. So you thought this was a serious situation, 12 there was -- really, the Garda involvement perhaps was 13 ended when she withdrew her statement. Did you not 14 think that perhaps, in your own phrasing, being a 15 victim, and the other phrases of emotional and physical 17:11 16 trauma, that when she went back to Garda Harrison, that 17 she might have Stockholm syndrome, or something like 18 that, and it was really important to get her away from 19 him because there was a serious threat? As a 20 traumatised victim of psychological trauma, did you not 17:12 21 put on your crime prevention hat and do something about 22 that, if you thought there was any reality to it 23 whatsoever?

A. As I have already said, Mr. Chairman, we could not
prevent Marisa Simms from going back to the environment 17:12
of the day that she had left and the environment that
she had -- the violence and threatening environment
that she had left at the time she made this particular
statement. We couldn't prevent her from going back

145

1 She was given advice in relation to the there. 2 domestic violence order that she could seek in relation to the matter. She never sought any of those orders. 3 Nevertheless, we could not prevent her from going back 4 5 there. And that, unfortunately, is a classic example 17:12 of a victim of domestic violence; unfortunately on the 6 7 day they can't take themselves out of the actual 8 environment which is presented -- which presents these particular serious situations. They just -- sadly, 9 they can't make those particular decisions. And this 10 17.13 11 is a situation that represented to us. Ms. Simms on 12 the day represented as a victim of domestic violence, 13 apart from the criminal threats that were made there. 14 but we cannot, other than to give advice or to assist 15 Ms. Simms in whatever way we could, we can only provide 17:13 16 advice.

In relation to this high-level meeting of serious 17 318 Q. 18 Gardaí, you indicated that you were discussing pathways 19 of investigation, which obviously culminated in a 20 reference to GSOC. Can you tell the Tribunal what were 17:13 those various pathways of investigation that you 21 22 considered?

23 In other words, what options did you think CHAIRMAN: 24 were on the table vis-á-vis GSOC in the context of the 25 statement you had in front of you? 17.14

Once the decision was made to refer the matter to GSOC, 26 Α. 27 then we were -- we were obliged bar carrying out urgent inquiries to preserve possible evidence that would be 28 of assistance on the day to GSOC. We would have 29

146

awaited the outcome of the GSOC evaluation before we
 would have carried out any further high-profile
 investigations in relation to the matter.

4 319 Q. MR. BARNES: And once GSOC -- sorry, I should say -- I
am instructed -- why do you say that Ms. Simms failed 17:14
to cooperate with GSOC, in circumstances where she
never agreed or was indeed informed of a reference to
GSOC?

That is the situation. The investigating officer in 9 Α. GSOC made contact with her and she decided not to 10 17.15 11 cooperate with any investigation or inquiries that GSOC 12 were undertaking in relation to the matter, and, as a 13 result, the Garda Ombudsman Commission, they terminated their involvement in the matter due to lack of 14 15 cooperation by the party that made the statement, 17:15 16 Ms. Simms on this occasion.

Do you think 'failed' is an appropriate word and would 17 320 Q. 18 you care to suggest perhaps a more appropriate word? 19 Ms. Simms didn't cooperate with the investigations Α. 20 being undertaken by GSOC in relation to the matter. 17:15 She didn't cooperate with any inquiries that they were 21 22 making in relation to the matter. She told them she 23 didn't wish to pursue the matter -- or didn't wish GSOC 24 to pursue the matter on her behalf.

25 321 Q. Now, in relation to section 10 of the -26 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Barnes, can I just ask you, and perhaps
27 other people as well. I appreciate it's been a long
28 day and it has been good to perhaps catch up with other
29 things in the morning, but where are we now?

147

1 MR. BARNES: I can indicate that I won't be much 2 longer. 3 CHAIRMAN: And, Mr. Dockery, are you going to ask Yes. 4 anv questions? 5 MR. DOCKERY: I won't have any questions. 17:16 6 CHAIRMAN: I understand you have had a change of status 7 and I just wanted to say you are very welcome here. 8 CHAIRMAN: And is there any other questions after 9 Mr. Barnes? 10 I think I have three questions. MS. LEADER: 17.16 11 CHAIRMAN: Very good. Well, let's try and finish, 12 because unfortunately in the morning there is another 13 thing that I have to do and it's not before 11:00, and 14 on Monday there is another thing that I have to do and it's not before 11:00, and both are official 15 17:16 16 responsibilities elsewhere. 17 MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, I was slow to press the button. Τ 18 have some questions, but I don't think I have any more 19 than ten minutes, and it may be that I'll be covering 20 some of the same ground as Ms. Leader. 17:17 21 CHAIRMAN: Well, it may be too much. I think we have 22 been around the quadrangle a number of times. I would 23 like to try and feel we have got this done today. 24 MR. BARNES: In relation to your high-level meeting on 322 Q. 25 8th October 2013, did you evaluate the evidence of 17.17 26 alleged harassment and it was indicated by the 27 investigating -- one or other of the investigating Gardaí that the material in contemplation was 28 29 interpersonal communications between the parties in a

148

1 domestic relationship between 2010 and the unhappy 2 circumstances on 28th September 2013, and did you evaluate that as a credible -- to make a credible 3 reference to the Director of Public Prosecutions? 4 5 I am sorry, Mr. Chairman. I don't actually understand Α. 17:18 6 what I am being asked. 7 In other words, if this is just -- well, I CHAIRMAN: 8 think it was Rita McDermott who said a new relationship will have blisters. Now, no one is to ascribe to me 9 the using of that phrase, but that is what she said, 10 17.18 11 and if this was just blisters would you have any 12 credible reason to refer this actual statement to the 13 Director of Public Prosecutions? 14 Α. Certainly not in relation to that one point or one 15 aspect. I mean, the statement had to be taken on face 17:18 16 value in its entirety. It identified a catalogue of incidents. And, look at, we have been through the 17 18 definition of 'harassment', but harassment has to be an 19 ongoing situation, and the reality of the situation 20 which was presented in that particular statement 17:19 presented a requirement to carry out an investigation 21 22 into alleged harassment, and it's alleged, everything 23 in the statement is alleged until such times as it's 24 investigated, evidence is secured in relation to the 25 allegations that are contained therein and that the 17.19 matter is referred then at that particular point to the 26 27 Director of Public Prosecutions to decide if sufficient evidence is in existence to commence criminal 28 29 proceedings in the matter.

149

323 MR. BARNES: Well, not every complaint, if complaint it 1 Q. 2 was, not every complaint results in a reference to the 3 DPP, and you have indicated -- you were asked a question, you have indicated it's not my decision or my 4 5 call. Now, I have to put it to you that that is not 17:19 the case and that you are, as the superintendent, an 6 7 evaluative filter and you decide whether or not 8 something is credible or would affect your credibility if you were to send it on and make a recommendation to 9 prosecute, and I am putting it to you that in relation 10 17.20 11 to the so-called evidence of threats to kill and cause 12 serious injury and to say that Keith Harrison, without 13 lawful authority or reasonable excuse throughout the 14 period from 2010 to 2013, harassed, by means of 15 interpersonal calls, that the situation is not credible 17:20 16 and the reason there wasn't a reference is that nobody 17 in their right mind would make a reference on the basis 18 of the evidence in this statement in relation to either 19 section, do you understand that? I understand what you are saying. The situation is 20 Α. 17:20 this -- this statement would have been investigated 21 22 based on the entirety of the matters contained therein. 23 One aspect of it, only one aspect of it was the 24 allegations in relation to alleged harassment. And I want to say, Chairman, in relation to any investigation 17:20 25 involving a member of An Garda Síochána, the decision 26 27 in relation to whether proceedings should or should not

commence in relation to that matter cannot be made on the day by me or at any other level other than at the

150

28

29

office of Director of Public Prosecutions. So it's not 1 2 correct to say that this matter could have been filtered out at local level. This matter could not 3 have been filtered out at local level. The actual 4 5 complaints were made in relation to a serving member of 17:21 An Garda Síochána. The decision in relation to any 6 7 criminal proceedings in this matter must be made by 8 the -- somebody in the office of the Director of Public Prosecutions. 9

well, that is the decision to prosecute, but the 10 324 Q. 17.21 11 decision to refer it to the Director of Public 12 Prosecutions, Judge Charleton and very many people in 13 this room have read so many documents coming from Garda 14 officers that are -- that underneath the signature such as you as superintendent, "forwarded for favour of your 17:21 15 attention, please". Now, I know that once you had 16 involved yourself in the GSOC reference, that it went 17 18 to Mary Murray. But in exploring pathways for prosecution, neither you nor Mary Murray nor anybody 19 20 else was prepared to make a reference and put their 17:22 credibility or their signature on a reference to the 21 22 DPP on the basis of Marisa Simms' statement for several months before she withdrew it, isn't that the position? 23 24 The position is that before any material would be Α. 25 referred to the Director of Public Prosecutions, and 17:22 indeed the allegations that were made would require 26 27 some form of investigation, and the presentation of a file to the Director of Public Prosecutions to assist 28 29 that office in making a decision in relation to -- it's

151

not referred specific on the day to have criminal 1 2 prosecution taken. Files are referred by our offices to the Director of Public Prosecutions seeking their 3 expert advice in relation to whether, in fact, criminal 4 5 proceedings should be commenced in the first place in 17:22 relation to the evidence contained within the relevant 6 7 investigation file.

- 8 325 I just have to put it to you finally that -- why, in Q. 9 fact, was the alleged statement if there was any -anybody had any genuine interest in pursuing a proper 10 17.23 11 investigation and referral to the DPP, why wasn't the 12 fundamental matter of the statement ever put to Keith 13 Harrison?
- 14 Α. I have explained that situation in relation to why it never got to the point where Keith Harrison wasn't 15 17:23 16 interviewed in relation to the matter. First of all. we had a statement of withdrawal made by Ms. Simms in 17 18 relation to the matter, and then we have the situation 19 in relation to the actual different stages on the day 20 where attempts were made to carry out investigations in 17:23 relation to this particular allegation. 21 But at the 22 point that Superintendent Murray would have received 23 the actual paperwork to carry out the investigations in 24 relation to the matter, at that point Marisa Simms had 25 already made a statement of withdrawal in relation to 17.23 the matter, which would significantly have impacted on 26 27 Superintendent Murray's ability to investigate the 28 matter.
- 29 MR. BARNES: Thank you.

152

1 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dignam, can you be as concise as you 2 can, bearing in mind, honestly, I think I know almost 3 everything that is to be known about this now. 4 MR. DIGNAM: Yes Chairman I will be very brief and I 5 will simply ask questions to draw matters to the 6 Tribunal's attention which may be of assistance to the 7 Tribunal.

8 9

THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM:

- MR. DIGNAM: Firstly, just to pick up on that last 10 326 Q. 17.24 11 point, Superintendent McGovern, and it echos something 12 that Mr. Harty said, which was that, and he asserted as 13 a fact when he was putting it to you, that there was no 14 plan for anybody to talk to Garda Harrison. Would you 15 just clarify, you were an investigating officer and 17:24 16 investigating member for a very brief period of time in 17 early to mid-January, isn't that right --
- 18 A. Well --
- 19 327 Q.

-- of 2014?

It's stated there was always an intention to interview 20 Α. 17:25 Garda Harrison in relation to the actual allegations 21 22 that were contained in the statement and situations arose that impacted on that particular situation. 23 Ι 24 wasn't the actual investigating officer; I was the 25 officer in charge of the district where these 17:25 particular incidents would have occurred. 26 when the 27 investigation was completed by the people that were 28 assigned the investigation, then it would have been my 29 responsibility to evaluate the file and forward that

153

1			file to the Director of Public Prosecutions so that a
2			decision could be made in relation to whether, in fact,
3			it justified the commencement of criminal proceedings
4			in relation to the matter.
5	328	Q.	Yes. And you were appointed I think that GSOC
6			formally closed their case, if I might put it that way,
7			or their investigation or assessment of the case in
8			November 2013, isn't that right?
9		Α.	That would be correct.
10	329	Q.	They had expressed the view quite early on that section $_{17:25}$
11			102 wasn't appropriate, but they were going to consider
12			the matter, and then they finally said in November of
13			2013 that they weren't going to that they were
14			finished their process?
15			CHAIRMAN: The 6th of November. 17:26
16		Α.	They had made a decision based on the fact that Marisa
17			Simms would not cooperate with them in relation to
18			their inquiries.
19			MR. DIGNAM: Yes.
20		Α.	Not based on the actual section of referral. They went $_{\rm 17:26}$
21			through the process of evaluating it in the same way as
22			if it had been a section 85 complaint, but it was the
23			decision of Ms. Simms, or her lack of, that word
24			whether 'cooperation' is the word I used, her lack
25			of cooperation with GSOC, they decided not to have any $$_{\rm 17:26}$$
26			further involvement in relation to the matter and they
27			referred it back to us.
28	330	Q.	And then you were appointed on, I think, 4th of January
29			2014 to carry out the disciplinary and criminal

154

1			investigation, isn't that right?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	331	Q.	Yes. And that appointment was terminated about	
4			two-and-a-half to three weeks later because you had had	
5			the previous involvement of making the section 102	7:26
6			referral. The question I have for you, Superintendent	
7			McGovern, is, is it unusual or is it usual that a	
8			particular member is appointed to carry out both the	
9			disciplinary and criminal investigation, or is it more	
10			usual for two separate members to be appointed to carry 🖞	7:27
11			out two separate investigations?	
12		Α.	No, the common practice is one member will be appointed	
13			to carry out both investigations. Both investigations	
14			will run alongside each other.	
15	332	Q.	Yes. But there is nothing unusual in you being	7:27
16			appointed to carry out both investigations?	
17		Α.	No, that is the actual common practice, so whoever	
18			would have followed on from me would have received the	
19			same appointment.	
20	333	Q.	And, in fact, that is what occurred, isn't it:	7:27
21			Superintendent Murray, you may not know this, but we	
22			will hear from Superintendent Murray that she was	
23			appointed to carry out both investigations?	
24		Α.	That is my understanding, yes.	
25	334	Q.	And can I take it and can the Tribunal take it that as	7:27
26			part of a disciplinary or criminal investigation, the	
27			intention and the plan would be to interview all	
28			relevant parties, including Garda Harrison?	
29		Α.	That would be correct, Chairman.	

155

335 Now, you -- Mr. Harty opened a document to you at page 1 Q. 2 1629, which is Chief Superintendent McGinn's letter to the assistant commissioner in Internal Affairs, Human 3 Resources, Superintendent McLoughlin, and he opened the 4 5 final half -- half of the final paragraph -- I hope I 17:28 6 am on the right page -- yes, sorry, Mr. Harty opened 7 half of the final paragraph in relation to what 8 recommendations or courses of action Chief Superintendent McGinn was proposing. Are you aware, 9 Superintendent McGovern, that that is, in fact, a 10 17.28 11 six-page letter and that the first five pages are 12 essentially Chief Superintendent McGinn setting out the 13 background and essentially setting out her rationale 14 for the options which she sees as being available, 15 which are the ones that are opened to you by Mr. Harty? 17:29 16 Yes, I am, I am aware that it's -- it's a six-page Α. 17 document. 18 336 Yes. And that's quite a full exposition of her views. Q. 19 She is expressing those to both the assistant 20 commissioner and indeed to the superintendent in 17:29 Internal Affairs in Phoenix Park? 21 22 It was a comprehensive evaluation of the situation. Α. 23 And she suggests suspension or transfer in relation to 337 **Q**. 24 Garda Harrison, isn't that right? 25 Α. Yes. 17:29 26 338 Now, I have to put this to you, Superintendent 0. 27 McGovern, because it has been asserted in the statement provided by Garda Harrison to this Tribunal in March 28 29 2017 that Garda Headquarters was in some way involved

156

in a conspiracy or in collusion to harm or do down, if 1 2 I might put it that way, Garda Harrison. Now. the 3 response to that came from Headquarters, isn't that right; that letter was addressed to Headquarters and 4 5 the response came from the superintendent, 17:30 6 Superintendent McLoughlin, which Mr. Harty I think has 7 opened also, which is at page 1714, which again is an 8 open letter addressed to Chief Superintendent McGinn, and he disagrees with Chief Superintendent McGinn, 9 isn't that right? 10 17.30 11 That's correct, Chairman. Α. 12 339 What he says is: No, I don't accept that what you are 0. 13 suggesting is the correct way to proceed. What I am 14 suggesting is indoor duties. That's correct, Chairman. 15 Α. 17:30 16 Now, it's a matter for the Tribunal to assess 340 Yes. 0. 17 that response, but to the extent that it can be 18 suggested that there is some sort of collusion or conspiracy, do you agree --19 20 I am not sure if this man is in a position MR. HARTY: 17:30 to give an opinion as to other people's collusion or 21 22 He can certainly say whether he was otherwise. 23 involved in a conspiracy, but I am not sure that the 24 Garda legal team should be in a position to call a 25 variety of Gardaí to give opinions as to what --17.31well, I mean, look, I think the situation 26 CHAIRMAN: 27 is, he has been asked about everything except his 28 opinion on Beethoven's string quartets. And I am going 29 to allow the question.

157

1 I won't push the point then, Chairman. MR. DIGNAM: 2 341 In relation then to two matters of fact, Superintendent Q. McGovern, just for clarification or confirmation 3 purposes, the Appendix 5 to the Children First 4 5 Guidelines, which is on page 1252, and if I understand 17:31 your evidence correctly you have already given this 6 7 evidence, is this the form that you always use when you 8 are notifying cases to Tusla, the HSE and Tusla? Yes, that is the form that we currently use for 9 Α. notifications to Tusla. 10 17.31 11 342 Q. Yes. And then in relation to, in Mr. Harty's debate 12 with you about whether you gave crime prevention advice 13 or not or whether crime prevention advice was given, 14 you referred to, I think, to crime prevention advice 15 having been given in May 2011 -- after the May 2011 17:32 16 events, if I put it that way? 17 There was, yes. And at that particular stage, like, Α. 18 the GM forms that were referred to, they were also 19 served on both parties to that particular incident. And I am not going to ask you to look at them in any 20 343 Ο. 17:32 detail at all, Superintendent McGovern, but at page 21 22 234, and running essentially to page 252, but if you 23 just look at page 234, that is a letter from you to the 24 chief superintendent Letterkenny. And am I correct in my understanding of paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 that they are 17:32 25 26 referring to crime prevention advice, et cetera? That's correct. 27 Α. So is it that, and I don't think there is any 28 344 Q. 29 controversy about this, is it that that you were

158

1 referring to when you were talking about the crime 2 prevention advice being given after May 2011? 3 Α. That's correct, and it would also be relevant at the time in relation to the actual -- the sourcing of the 4 5 addresses for Sergeant Wallace, the crime prevention 17:33 officer as well. 6 7 And then finally, Superintendent, in relation to --345 **Q**. 8 this obviously isn't a trial of the allegations that are made by Ms. Simms, but Mr. Harty was putting it to 9 you that no offences were, in fact, made out, or even 10 17.33 11 no basis for charges were made out in the statement of 12 Ms. Simms, and, in the course of doing so, he described 13 any expressions of feeling or of fear that she made 14 were essentially retrospective in nature, that is how 15 she felt at the time of making the statement rather 17:33 16 than at the time that she was -- that alleged threats 17 were made by Garda Harrison, et cetera. 18 Sorry to interject again. There is no MR. HARTY: 19 expression of fear at all in the statement in relation to anything retrospectively in relation to it. 20 Ι 17:33 didn't suggest that and so --21 22 If I could ask you to look at page 81 --346 Q. MR. DIGNAM: 23 CHAIRMAN: This is the position: Any scholar of 24 criminal law will realise that you have to prove a 25 mental element. Every scholar of criminal law will 17.34 also know that is either done two ways: 26 by the person 27 actually admitting it in a statement or by saying it to somebody else, which is also an admission, or by 28 inference from the facts and circumstances surrounding 29

159

1 it. That is the situation. You can't look inside 2 people's heads. And vis-á-vis things that occur, well, then, I think it still is a rule of criminal law that 3 people intend the natural and probable consequences of 4 5 their actions. There it is. 17:34 6 MR. DIGNAM: Yes. 7 So you wanted to point out a particular CHAIRMAN: 8 thing, and that is it. What is it? MR. DIGNAM: On page 81, 86 and 89, Superintendent 9 347 Q. Perhaps if we look at page 81 firstly, which 17:34 10 McGovern. 11 is the incident, the Jim Quinn incident, as it has 12 become known, Superintendent McGovern, if I could ask you to look at the bottom of that page where Ms. Simms 13 14 says: "I was terrified of him and the only other time 15 that I had seen him like this was the night of his 17:35 16 brother's 21st in Galway." Did you read the statement 17 and were you aware of that statement within Ms. Simms' 18 statement? 19 Yes. Α. And page 86 - I don't propose to go through the 20 348 Ο. 17:35 21 statement, Chairman - page 86. If you look at the 22 bottom of page 86, did you read at the time the 23 sentence "I felt totally harassed at this point and 24 felt I couldn't do anything unless I had okayed it with 25 him." Et cetera. And she goes on. And then at page 17.36 26 89 -- sorry, did you read that sentence when you read 27 the statement? 28 I did, Chairman yes. Α. 29 And at page 89, finally, Superintendent McGovern, and 349 Q.

160

1			this is in relation to the allegation of a threat to	
2			burn, did you see the sentence	
3			CHAIRMAN: I think the answer is going to be 'yes', so	
4			just read out the sentence.	
4 5	250	0	-	
	350	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: It's, in fact, on page 90, Superintendent	17:36
6			McGovern, the sentence at the top of the page:	
7			"I was really frightened of him at this stage as he was	
8			in such a rage it was as if he was not in control of	
9			himself and he was crazy."	
10			Had you read that sentence?	17:36
11		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
12			MR. DIGNAM: Thank you, Superintendent.	
13				
14			THE WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER:	
15	351	Q.	MS. LEADER: Yesterday, Superintendent, you told the	17:36
16			Tribunal that you had there was a requirement on you	
17			regardless to refer the matter to GSOC, is that	
18			correct, to refer the matter of the statement that	
19			Ms. Simms made in relation to Garda Harrison to GSOC?	
20		Α.	Yes, one if it had not been referred under section	17:37
21			102, it would have had to have been referred under	
22			section 85.	
23	352	Q.	And you referred to two particular Garda directives	
24			that you'd received from HQ in order to base that	
25			particular assertion that you made, isn't that correct,	17:37
26			superintendent?	
27		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
28	353	Q.	Now, one related to section 102, which has been	
20		ų.		
29			referred to at length by Mr. Harty, but in relation to	

161

1 the directive with regard to section 85 of Garda 2 Siochana Act, first of all, Superintendent, I think it 3 is correct to say that directives are there in order to assist guards to carry out their duties, is that 4 5 correct? 17:37 6 That would be correct, Chairman, yes. Α. 7 354 And in that directive, in relation to section 85, which Q. is Directive 50/13, I think there is a paragraph in it, 8 whether it is correct or not, Superintendent, which 9 10 says that: 17.38 11 "All complaints made by a member of the public concerning the conduct of a member of An Garda Síochána 12 13 will immediately be forwarded in writing to the Garda 14 Síochána Ombudsman Commission, with a copy submitted to the Chief Superintendent Internal Affairs." 15 17:38 16 That's correct, yes. Α. 17 And is that what you were basing that particular 355 Q. 18 assertion on, that, no matter what happened, there was 19 going to be a referral to GSOC? 20 Yes, that was the point I was trying to make: Α. 17:38 irrespective of whether it qualified for a 102 21 22 referral, it had to be referred in accordance with 23 section 85, and the process within GSOC is basically 24 exactly the same thereafter. 25 Whether that be a correct statement of the law or not, 356 0. 17.38 26 but you were relying on that directive, is that 27 correct? 28 Yes, and I --Α. 29 CHAIRMAN: I don't think we have a page number for that

162

1		yet?	
2		MS. LEADER: Yes, we do. 2495. It was circulated this	
3		afternoon.	
4		CHAIRMAN: Anyway, you feel you were following that?	
5	Α.	Yes, indeed, and, like, I mean, I have complied with	17:39
6		that directive on many occasions in the past.	
7		MS. LEADER: Thank you very much, Superintendent.	
8		CHAIRMAN: All right. That is it. It's hopefully	
9		11:00 in the morning. If it's any different, I will	
10		tell them. Thank you.	17:39
11			
12		THE HEARING WAS THEN ADJOURNED TO FRIDAY, 6TH OCTOBER	
13		<u>2017 AT 11:00AM</u>	
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
29			

'13 [1] - 135:19 **'97** [1] - 12:21 'cooperation' [1] -154:24 'Decision [1] - 14:11 'distressed' [1] -14:27 'failed' [1] - 147:17 'harassment' [1] -149:18 'how [1] - 107:9 'if [1] - 33:25 'yes' [1] - 161:3 1 1 [2] - 14:11, 158:25 1-2 [1] - 3:5 **10** [3] - 106:28, 107:20, 147:25 **10/10** [2] - 10:10, 10:11 **100** [1] - 106:27 **101(2** [1] - 14:1 102 [43] - 9:22, 10:1, 10:4, 10:26, 13:27, 14:4, 14:9, 27:15, 55:26, 56:5, 58:21, 62:17, 62:20, 62:29, 64:26, 64:29, 67:26, 73:20, 74:23, 74:25, 74:28, 75:1, 75:3, 75:11, 76:1, 76:12, 83:15, 83:20, 83:21, 84:13, 94:9, 95:3, 95:19, 95:24, 96:14, 97:19, 97:22, 97:29, 154:11, 155:5, 161:21, 161:28, 162:21 **102(1** [6] - 10:19, 11:1, 11:20, 12:24, 13:2, 14:12 105 [1] - 97:6 10th [9] - 68:6, 91:1, 91:9, 91:18, 92:27, 93:1, 94:17, 111:5 **11:00** [3] - 148:13, 148:15, 163:9 11:00AM [1] - 163:13 11th [2] - 66:5, 111:6 **12** [1] - 2:30 **125** [1] - 4:6 **1252** [1] - 158:5 12th [2] - 111:17, 111:24

15 [6] - 100:2, 100:3, 100:7, 100:17, 154:29 101:7, 101:17 **153** [1] - 4:7 15th [5] - 66:14, 66:17, 163:13 69:18, 69:21, 69:24 2094 [1] - 68:18 **16** [1] - 1:6 20th [1] - 82:5 **161** [1] - 4:8 21 [1] - 2:25 1612 [1] - 96:25 1629 [2] - 90:28, 156:2 16th [1] - 112:3 **17** [1] - 1:10 160:16 1714 [3] - 94:14, 97:27, 157:7 113.16 1780 [1] - 96:2 234 [2] - 158:22, 1781 [1] - 95:22 158:23 1782 [1] - 95:10 **1921** [1] - 1:10 **196** [1] - 114:4 2464 [1] - 89:24 1997 [4] - 12:7, 12:8, 2469 [1] - 56:18 13:1, 143:13 2484 [1] - 10:11 1:30PM [1] - 5:2 2495 [1] - 163:2 1st [2] - 68:13, 114:25 2 2 [7] - 2:17, 2:26, 2:30, 3:9, 15:28, 109:4, 158:25 25 [1] - 142:12 20 [2] - 73:3, 143:20 **252** [1] - 158:22 2005 [3] - 12:12, 25th [5] - 112:1, 12:25, 14:10 2005' [1] - 14:13 115:2, 116:9 2007 [1] - 10:15 28th [4] - 12:11, 2010 [3] - 10:13, 149:1, 150:14 2nd [1] - 68:9 2011 [6] - 23:19, 24:3, 106:22, 158:15, 159:2 2012 [7] - 23:20, 23:21, 24:3, 50:22, 158.25 106:22 31 [1] - 11:4 2013 [27] - 36:7, 32 [1] - 1:18 41:21, 42:3, 63:13, 64:3, 64:23, 67:4, 82:5, 92:28, 97:28, 98:25, 102:3, 106:6, 3:30 [1] - 88:17 106:27, 114:26, 117:22, 119:10, 129:23, 129:24, 130:24, 136:5, 136:11, 148:25, 149:2, 150:14, **4** [2] - 113:18 154:8, 154:13 2014 [16] - 1:4, 64:4, 42:3 64:15, 64:17, 67:1, 68:8, 68:19, 69:2, 154:28 69:14, 72:26, 73:17, 74:16, 116:7,

135:19, 153:19, 89 [12] - 21:1, 26:24, 5 2017 [8] - 1:6, 1:10, 5 [6] - 113:18, 113:19, 1:18, 5:2, 7:13, 122:28, 123:29, 116:5, 156:29, 143:12, 158:4 **50** [1] - 3:9 50/13 [1] - 162:8 50/2013 [3] - 80:21, **21st** [5] - 36:7, 95:9, 81:16, 81:20 97:27, 115:23, 5TH [2] - 1:18, 5:1 6 22nd [5] - 69:2, 112:4, 112:11, 112:12, 6th [26] - 24:29, 44:7, 45:5, 45:11, 63:13, 66:20, 66:22, 91:28, 2462 [4] - 41:8, 103:5, 98:25, 103:13, 111:9, 111:19 106:6, 106:27, 127:27, 128:22, 129:23, 130:24, 136:11, 138:4, 138:5, 139:13, 24th [11] - 112:25, 139:18, 139:19, 112:27, 113:4, 142:16, 142:26, 113:20, 113:23, 154:15 113:25, 114:15, 6TH [1] - 163:12 115:2, 117:12, 117:21, 117:27 7 7 [1] - 89:20 112:27, 112:28, 71 [1] - 133:3 769 [1] - 112:10 7th [2] - 68:19, 68:21 135:19, 136:5, 149:2 8 3 8 [1] - 2:14 81 [3] - 159:22, 160:9, 3 [3] - 109:3, 113:18, 160:10 82 [2] - 11:6, 11:29 83 [4] - 75:16, 75:17, 75:29, 77:16 33 [2] - 132:2, 138:26 83(2 [1] - 79:29 38 [2] - 132:4, 132:5 85 [32] - 9:28, 65:3, 38-page [1] - 140:3 75:4, 75:11, 75:13, 75:15, 75:27, 76:13, 76:14, 76:24, 76:26, 3rd [2] - 45:1, 45:2 77:22, 77:24, 79:22, 79:23, 79:24, 79:25, 4 80:18, 80:24, 80:25, 80:26, 80:29, 81:17, 82:29, 83:14, 97:3, 4:26pm [2] - 41:20, 113:18, 154:22, 161:22, 162:1, 4th [3] - 115:12, 116:5, 162:7, 162:23 86 [4] - 160:9, 160:20, 160:21, 160:22

36:29, 37:3, 38:9, 38:19, 39:4, 40:15, 45:28, 160:9, 160:26, 160:29 8:24am [1] - 49:25 8:24pm [2] - 50:7, 51:12 8th [24] - 22:19, 26:20, 26:22, 30:26, 32:21, 37:19, 39:25, 41:17, 41:18, 41:20, 42:3, 43:15, 45:25, 50:16, 56:26, 63:10, 72:28, 83:23, 86:17, 89:27, 92:21, 96:5, 97:24, 148:25 9 9 [2] - 4:4, 4:5 90 [1] - 161:5 906 [1] - 47:29 **999** [1] - 55:23 9th [8] - 10:14, 30:26, 69:14, 69:23, 94:2, 94:6, 97:24, 121:4 А ability [5] - 31:4, 31:13, 90:19, 142:19, 152:27 able [6] - 21:22, 29:16, 60:12, 74:2, 102:20, 114:11 above-named [1] -1.27 absolutely [3] - 52:19, 53:11, 120:26 abuse [11] - 18:13, 19:16, 33:26, 35:21, 35:25, 35:26, 122:20, 123:3, 123:12, 123:17, 142:12 abuser [3] - 32:28, 32:29.33:1 accept [25] - 15:26, 22:1, 38:20, 39:4, 39:29, 43:24, 46:14, 49:3, 64:3, 65:17, 65:20, 70:21, 70:22, 93:23, 99:2, 103:7, 103:19, 103:25, 104:19, 109:1, 123:19, 133:21, 133:25, 137:23, 157:12

accepted [1] - 6:6 Accident[1] - 132:8 accompanying [1] -94:19 accordance [17] - 5:8, 10.4 20.29 55.26 65:2, 74:28, 80:18, 80:19, 80:24, 80:26, 80:28, 81:15, 82:19, 83:13, 83:14, 83:19, 162:22 according [1] - 40:20 account [3] - 56:26, 64:7, 75:23 accuse [1] - 88:21 acknowledge [3] -81:9, 97:20, 130:27 acknowledged [2] -110:15, 126:1 acknowledging [2] -80:12, 117:5 acknowledgment [1] -80:5 acquiring [1] - 110:2 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9 act [13] - 7:17, 12:9, 25:18, 60:25, 73:21, 95:3, 96:15, 97:3, 106:23, 107:3, 107:6, 143:3 Act [35] - 10:14, 10:17, 10:19, 11:1, 11:3, 11:4, 11:6, 12:7, 12:21, 12:25, 13:1, 13:10, 13:22, 14:2, 14:6, 14:10, 14:12, 15:16, 15:22, 15:28, 16:2, 21:1, 26:24, 36:29, 37:3, 38:8, 38:19, 45:29, 55:26, 75:13, 75:15, 106:29, 143:13, 162:2 Act) [1] - 12:8 acted [3] - 8:15, 35:18, 100:2 acting [1] - 6:9 action [10] - 1:28, 13:19, 18:6, 65:12, 94:25, 96:27, 99:7, 99:9, 140:10, 156:8 actioned [1] - 41:14 actions [5] - 13:29, 28:20, 76:22, 79:8, 160:5 activate [2] - 12:25, 12:29 active [2] - 18:5, 18:8 acts [2] - 11:7, 14:18 actual [112] - 9:24,

14:28, 16:12, 16:16, 17:13, 19:10, 22:4, 24:7, 25:5, 26:7, 26:8, 27:10, 28:7, 29:1, 29:14, 32:11, 33:1, 34:18, 35:3, 35:9, 35:10, 35:26, 36:15, 37:25, 39:10, 41:7, 46:3, 46:7, 46:10, 48:16, 49:8, 49:17, 50:6, 51:10, 52:27, 58:23, 60:3, 60:9, 62:13, 62:22, 63:18, 67:8, 67:28, 76:22, 78:27, 78:28, 81:6, 82:25, 83:4, 83:5. 83:6. 83:21. 83:22, 85:8, 85:28, 90:7, 92:10, 94:9, 98:14, 98:23, 98:24, 101:12, 105:6, 108:3, 108:5, 109:4, 109:13, 109:28, 110:23, 111:1, 113:14. 114:16. 117:1, 118:23, 119:18, 120:8, 121:3, 122:6, 122:17, 122:29, 124:18, 125:27, 126:28, 129:9, 131:18, 131:22, 131.26 132.15 132:19, 132:27, 134:2, 134:3, 136:20, 140:16, 140:20, 141:27, 142:2, 145:2, 146:7, 149:12, 151:4, 152:19, 152:23, 153:21, 153:24, 154:20, 155:17, 159:4 add [2] - 98:13, 134:11 added [1] - 56:29 additional [3] - 5:11, 45:24, 133:16 address [7] - 19:11, 21:9, 21:12, 21:18, 21:21, 32:26, 140:22 addressed [2] - 157:4, 157:8 addresses [1] - 159:5 adds [1] - 115:29 ADJOURNED [2] -92:18, 163:12 administrative [1] -69:13 admissible [1] - 82:23 admission [1] -

159:28 admit [1] - 29:19 admitting [1] - 159:27 adopted [1] - 141:1 advance [2] - 58:15, 103.18 advancing[1] -101:22 advice [46] - 19:22, 19:28, 19:29, 21:15, 22:10, 22:16, 22:21, 22:24, 23:11, 23:23, 23:27, 23:28, 23:29, 24:1, 24:4, 24:21, 25:15, 25:17, 25:18, 25:28, 26:10, 27:19, 27:22, 30:7, 31:19, 33:10, 33:12, 33:14, 109:20, 109:25, 109:26, 110:3, 110:9, 110:12, 110:28, 110:29, 146:1, 146:14, 146:16, 152:4, 158:12, 158:13, 158:14, 158:26, 159:2 advise [2] - 31:20, 83:1 advised [4] - 27:21, 44:14, 115:10, 128.10 affair [1] - 68:25 affairs [1] - 93:19 Affairs [17] - 58:19, 67:22, 78:17, 82:27, 83:28, 86:7, 86:10, 87:20, 90:4, 90:21, 91:26, 95:15, 98:3, 139:28, 156:3, 156:21, 162:15 affect [2] - 29:13, 150:8 affected [2] - 25:19, 40:16 afraid [1] - 129:27 aftermath [1] - 29:13 afternoon [4] - 9:6, 89:8, 125:8, 163:3 afterwards [1] - 38:17 age [1] - 12:15 ago [1] - 88:25 agree [4] - 101:7, 128:18, 135:19, 157:19 agreed [8] - 11:26, 39:27, 54:23, 55:25, 127:24, 127:26, 147:7 agreeing [1] - 126:8

agreement [3] -128:29, 129:17, 130:7 ahead [3] - 74:25, 74:27, 75:25 aired [2] - 135:16, 135:27 alarm [2] - 31:19, 142:4 alcohol [1] - 144:16 alcoholic [3] - 118:8, 118:15, 119:8 alerted [1] - 128:5 allegation [14] - 29:8, 36:17, 63:18, 79:19, 81:11, 85:8, 85:10, 100:8, 100:18, 101:3, 124:15, 124:22, 152:21, 161:1 allegations [37] -17:22, 19:11, 28:18, 29:2, 34:18, 36:8, 54:24, 60:9, 63:13, 63:28, 67:15, 72:17, 80:16, 85:2, 85:24, 85:29, 86:28, 87:1, 101:12, 101:29, 103:7, 103:12, 103:19, 103:22, 105:12, 105:22, 105:24, 105:27, 106:16, 109:13, 109:15, 121:15, 149:25, 150:24, 151:26, 153:21, 159:8 alleged [25] - 16:22, 16:25, 35:11, 35:25, 35:26, 48:7, 56:14, 60:9, 60:18, 60:26, 63:8, 83:10, 96:7, 96:17, 104:26, 141:10, 143:19, 144:19, 148:26, 149:22, 149:23, 150:24, 152:9, 159:16 allegedly [3] - 47:10, 60:25, 72:8 allow [3] - 128:18, 140:24, 157:29 allowances [1] - 27:15 allowed [4] - 51:28, 100:6. 111:26. 139:11 allows [1] - 27:16 almost [2] - 86:8, 153:2 alone [1] - 119:29

alongside [1] - 155:14 alternative [4] - 91:4, 91:11, 91:15, 93:18 alternatively [1] -90:25 altogether [1] - 75:23 ambient [1] - 131:5 amend [1] - 134:25 amended [1] - 95:3 amendments [4] -126:9, 134:16, 134:17, 134:29 amount [2] - 23:5, 126:5 analogy [2] - 132:6, 132:9 analyse [1] - 96:6 analysis [1] - 96:8 AND [4] - 1:4, 1:5, 1:9, 92:18 Andrew [8] - 37:17, 38:3, 40:1, 47:10, 48:4, 48:22, 133:6, 133:8 Annagry [1] - 130:14 Annex [1] - 14:11 anonymous [5] -44:11, 46:19, 46:28, 47:14, 48:22 answer [28] - 21:27, 22:6, 26:15, 37:22, 39:5, 39:6, 41:28, 42:19, 48:14, 48:15, 52:7, 70:8, 70:9, 71:1, 74:17, 78:29, 79:13, 86:18, 92:2, 100:11, 102:5, 127:18, 127:19, 127:20, 139:25, 140:1, 141:29, 161:3 answered [1] - 103:17 answering [3] -113:20, 113:22, 141:8 ANTHONY [2] - 2:15, 2.20 Anthony [2] - 94:12, 97:27 anyway [1] - 163:4 apart [1] - 146:13 apologise [3] - 7:10, 7:13, 7:15 apologises [1] - 7:22 Appeal [1] - 12:11 appear [4] - 6:5, 6:23, 37:8, 38:24 APPEARANCES[1] -2.1 appeared [1] - 107:12 Appendix [2] - 122:28,

158:4 appendix [1] - 123:29 application [2] -33:18, 140:5 apply [1] - 118:28 appoint [3] - 58:7, 67:21, 71:4 appointed [27] -58:13, 58:17, 58:19, 58:23, 59:2, 59:7, 67:28, 68:4, 68:20, 70:24, 72:23, 73:17, 74:10, 74:12, 99:25, 99:27, 102:5, 104:2, 104:8, 105:15, 154:5, 154:28, 155:8, 155:10, 155:12, 155:16, 155:23 appointing [1] -105:18 appointment [20] -67:12, 69:2, 70:10, 70:12, 70:15, 72:15, 72:19, 72:21, 72:26, 74:11, 88:17, 88:27, 99:23, 99:26, 102:25, 105:15, 136:29, 155:3, 155:19 appreciate [10] - 53:4, 53:9. 116:19. 118:25, 125:3, 126:27, 127:2, 130:26, 133:19, 147:27 appreciating [1] -119:10 apprehended [2] -128:6, 129:18 apprehensive [1] -128:1 approached [1] -24:19 approaching [1] -25:3 appropriate [25] -14:8, 17:27, 19:2, 19:21, 20:8, 25:8, 58:3, 58:12, 58:20, 60:22.65:2.65:11. 67:24, 81:13, 81:29, 83:9, 94:25, 121:24, 122:23, 122:24, 126:10. 139:29. 147:17, 147:18, 154:11 apropos [1] - 125:9 area [3] - 81:1, 82:21, 96:16

argued [1] - 135:3 arguing [1] - 124:3 argument [1] - 75:20 arise [1] - 136:21 arises [1] - 96:21 arising [1] - 5:8 arm [2] - 129:2, 129:4 arm-twisting [1] -129:2 armed [1] - 32:13 arose [8] - 9:7, 52:1, 111:22, 114:12, 138:10, 139:23, 139:24, 153:23 arranged [2] - 45:4, 129:24 arrangement [2] -128:27, 129:16 arrangement" [1] -128:27 arrest [6] - 28:27, 29:4, 29:5, 31:24, 31:26, 31:29 arresting [1] - 118:29 arrival [2] - 113:15, 113:17 arrive [2] - 55:3, 112.11 arrived [1] - 113:12 arrives [2] - 18:1, 143:21 ARTHUR [1] - 2:16 articulate [1] - 46:24 AS [2] - 5:1, 92:19 ascribe [1] - 149:9 aside [1] - 27:3 aspect [10] - 24:26, 43:18, 70:27, 75:2, 122:22, 126:6, 129:21, 149:15, 150:23 aspects [2] - 72:16, 72:22 assault [7] - 15:2, 15:14, 15:28, 16:6, 16:7, 109:3, 109:4 assaults [2] - 96:7, 142:29 asserted [2] - 153:12, 156:27 assertion [2] - 161:25, 162:18 assess [3] - 13:7, 96:5, 157:16 assessed [1] - 28:5 assessment [4] -13:3, 13:6, 32:12, 154:7 assessments [1] -18:20

assign [1] - 44:20 assigned [10] - 9:22, 40:8, 44:17, 48:17, 49:12, 49:26, 49:29, 50:3, 65:7, 153:28 assist [15] - 41:12, 41:25, 42:4, 42:13, 42:22, 43:11, 43:21, 44:8, 45:17, 69:15, 112:23, 120:8, 146:14, 151:28, 162:4 assistance [6] - 7:1, 8:6, 19:27, 42:27, 146:29, 153:6 Assistant [1] - 5:13 assistant [5] - 58:6, 67:20, 87:6, 156:3, 156:19 assisting [3] - 43:16, 44:5, 49:23 associated [1] - 55:24 assume [3] - 25:11, 82:28, 144:23 assuming [1] - 85:13 assured [1] - 6:25 AT [2] - 5:2, 163:13 attached [3] - 14:10, 94:21, 95:13 attachments [1] -94:19 attempts [1] - 152:20 attended [1] - 84:11 attention [18] - 13:5, 14:7, 23:6, 25:29, 28:5, 79:10, 79:20, 80:23, 81:13, 81:28, 83:8, 87:2, 87:6, 87:29, 98:13, 122:10, 151:16, 153:6 attitude [1] - 56:24 August [1] - 23:16 authorities [1] -123:22 authority [7] - 17:5, 42:14, 44:19, 54:25, 56:8, 102:9, 150:13 automatically [1] -76:19 available [9] - 6:1, 89:12, 89:13, 94:26, 96:6, 97:1, 109:28, 124:5, 156:14 avenue [1] - 60:19 avoid [2] - 130:5, 141:25 await [1] - 13:6 awaited [1] - 147:1 awaiting [2] - 26:29,

74:25

aware [39] - 19:22, 20:7, 24:6, 24:10, 25:2, 33:16, 35:7, 37:7. 41:23. 42:21. 43:13, 44:15, 49:23, 79:15, 86:12, 86:27, 87:7, 88:9, 88:10, 90:2, 97:26, 112:13, 112:16, 112:18, 112:19, 112:21, 112:24, 113:7, 114:1, 114:6, 114:18, 115:14, 117:2, 117:8, 117:16, 118:3, 156:9, 156:16, 160:17 awful [1] - 131:12 awkward [1] - 135:22

В

background [6] -10:12, 52:24, 134:2, 134:5, 134:19, 156:13 bad [1] - 53:17 bar [5] - 69:29, 70:3, 70:5, 98:9, 146:27 Barnes [3] - 124:29, 147:26, 148:9 BARNES [15] - 3:3, 4:6, 125:1, 125:7, 125:8, 133:18, 141:4, 141:15, 143:9, 144:14, 147:4, 148:1, 148:24, 150:1, 152:29 barring [1] - 33:21 base [1] - 161:24 based [12] - 88:1, 91:27, 92:27, 95:24, 115:3, 121:8, 121:14, 125:27, 142:16, 150:22, 154:16, 154:20 basing [1] - 162:17 basis [11] - 9:10, 11:19, 85:11, 108:16, 121:5, 124:4, 126:2, 128:17, 150:17, 151:22, 159:11 **BE** [1] - 9:3 bearing [3] - 60:24, 104:11.153:2 beating [2] - 75:24, 118:8

became [3] - 112:18, 112:24, 142:5 become [5] - 63:14, 63:16, 64:1, 131:17, 160.12 becomes [1] - 119:1 becoming [1] - 37:7 Beethoven's [1] -157:28 behalf [6] - 6:9, 65:22, 123:18, 127:14, 138:3, 147:24 behaviour [4] - 78:19, 78:28, 79:4, 96:11 behind [1] - 107:8 belief [1] - 5:26 bells [1] - 142:4 beset [1] - 33:24 beside [1] - 38:4 best [2] - 54:24, 141:8 better [9] - 40:19, 54:17, 57:16, 62:8, 63:25, 120:20, 122:19, 129:16 between [23] - 9:16, 9:28, 16:14, 27:20, 39:17, 46:14, 52:14, 52:20, 53:17, 53:22, 53:25, 53:26, 54:14, 54:20, 55:6, 55:8, 55:13, 61:18, 64:14, 66:6, 74:16, 148:29, 149:1 biased [1] - 61:23 big [1] - 7:19 bit [9] - 38:29, 75:24, 92:12, 100:21, 107:7, 128:10, 129:2, 129:16, 134:5 bits [1] - 141:2 BL [11] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:11, 2:16, 2:19, 2:20, 2:23, 3:3, 3:8, 3:11 blazing [1] - 140:7 bless [1] - 55:16 blindingly [1] - 104:19 blisters [2] - 149:9, 149:11 block [1] - 66:29 blocks [1] - 66:27 blood [1] - 53:17 blue [2] - 135:27, 140:7 blue-lighting [1] -135:27 board [2] - 8:4, 74:8 Board [1] - 138:28 bodily [1] - 12:5 body [3] - 12:4, 12:17,

25:9 Bogle [1] - 53:15 bona [4] - 8:16, 121:5, 124:6, 124:17 **bottom** [4] - 111:19, 114:4, 160:13, 160:22 bound [2] - 8:22, 78:16 box [2] - 51:18, 135:23 brand [3] - 125:22, 131:2, 135:2 BRAONÁIN [1] - 3:8 brewing [1] - 137:1 BRIAN [1] - 2:23 Bridgeen [1] - 117:14 brief [3] - 36:16, 153:4, 153:16 briefing [1] - 95:26 BRIEFLY [1] - 92:18 bright [1] - 75:14 Brigid [1] - 38:5 bring [8] - 28:27, 47:3, 86:29, 87:6, 87:29, 109:21, 118:17, 120:22 bringing [1] - 61:2 brother [1] - 52:20 brother's [1] - 160:16 bruises [1] - 118:12 budgies [1] - 51:22 build [1] - 120:2 building [3] - 17:25, 18:2. 18:29 bullying [1] - 69:17 Buncrana [3] - 59:18, 59:21, 115:5 buried [1] - 144:25 burn [14] - 20:14, 29:18, 35:1, 108:19, 131:8, 132:13, 138:17, 141:11, 142:29, 144:10, 161:2 burned [1] - 144:24 burnt [2] - 21:21, 33:28 bury [3] - 29:17, 141:11, 144:7 busy [1] - 18:16 button [2] - 31:20, 148:17 **BY** [18] - 1:5, 1:8, 2:12, 2:16, 2:20, 2:24, 2:29. 3:4. 3:8. 4:5. 4:6, 4:7, 4:8, 9:4, 125:6, 153:9, 161:14

С C/SUPT [1] - 3:7 cajoled [1] - 133:15 calibre [1] - 30:23 Campbell [2] - 89:10, 89:20 Canadian [1] - 129:29 canal [1] - 88:14 cancelled [1] - 99:26 cannot [25] - 13:10, 24:24, 33:7, 33:9, 34:14, 40:23, 41:28, 42:18, 43:4, 64:7, 73:14, 85:4, 90:27, 93:2, 98:13, 100:11, 102:5, 103:18, 112:22, 115:17, 115:20, 137:24, 146:14, 150:28 capable [1] - 69:28 capital [3] - 46:21, 46:23, 46:25 capital-letter [2] -46:21.46:25 car [2] - 144:13, 145:7 care [1] - 147:18 careful [1] - 64:14 carried [16] - 23:1, 48:11, 49:28, 51:11, 52:2, 52:29, 60:16, 60:23, 61:11, 72:29, 76:17, 85:24, 107:27, 108:11, 141:14, 147:2 carry [45] - 8:27, 29:22, 35:24, 38:5, 44:1, 54:4, 58:8, 58:23, 62:3, 62:5, 64:6, 64:10, 67:13, 70:12, 71:4, 72:15, 73:8, 73:14, 73:26, 74:9, 74:13, 82:2, 99:24, 104:8, 105:16, 105:19, 105:21, 108:21, 108:24, 108:25, 109:6, 109:20, 119:17, 143:4, 149:21, 152:20, 152:23, 154:29, 155:8, 155:10, 155:13. 155:16. 155:23, 162:4 carrying [7] - 60:17, 65:4, 73:15, 73:29, 101:15, 142:25, 146:27

CARTHAGE[1] - 2:24

case [35] - 8:22, 11:12, 12:8, 14:17, 25:22, 27:8, 28:3, 28:4, 36:20, 39:20, 44:28, 54:28, 55:1, 61:9, 61:24, 70:27, 95:24, 96:5, 107:7, 107:11, 114:7, 115:11, 115:14, 115:16, 115:25, 115:29, 117:17, 118:6, 118:18, 119:16, 124:28, 125:3, 150:6, 154:6, 154:7 cases [1] - 158:8 CASTLE[1] - 1:17 catalogue [6] - 26:2, 26:4, 142:14, 142:28, 144:28, 149:16 catch [1] - 147:28 categorical [1] -137:27 categories [3] - 6:22, 14:23, 123:20 categorised [1] - 6:22 category [2] - 123:28, 124:1 CATHAL[1] - 3:8 caused [3] - 11:17, 27:14, 100:6 causes [2] - 12:2, 12:3 causing [5] - 15:2, 15:15, 16:6, 16:7, 78:25 cease [1] - 111:23 central [2] - 61:2, 107:20 centre [1] - 140:7 CERTAIN [1] - 1:4 certain [16] - 10:21, 13:12, 37:29, 49:9, 92:9, 92:21, 101:20, 104:8. 105:16. 110:28, 112:29, 126:5, 134:17, 135:4, 142:25 certainly [38] - 9:28, 24:1, 24:20, 24:27, 25:1, 25:20, 30:14, 33:14, 43:19, 55:3, 62:12, 66:5, 85:5, 88:7, 89:5, 90:2, 92:9, 93:3, 93:4, 103:27, 107:25, 109:2, 109:3, 112:6, 112:20. 113:5. 113:7, 113:10, 113:27, 120:3,

123:24, 130:3, 134:4, 137:19, 139:6, 149:14, 157.22 certify [1] - 1:25 cetera [3] - 158:26, 159:17, 160:25 chain [1] - 42:9 Chair [1] - 9:1 Chairman [122] - 5:4, 7:24, 8:2, 8:5, 8:13, 8:18, 9:11, 10:5, 15:4, 15:18, 24:2, 26:28, 27:9, 28:4, 30:25, 31:6, 34:3, 34:21, 35:4, 37:23, 41:4, 41:28, 42:11, 43:23, 45:26, 48:10, 48:15, 49:21, 51:3, 51:29, 52:7, 52:16, 53:16, 53:19, 58:27, 59:22, 64:6, 64:21, 64:27, 67:6, 69:7, 69:10, 70:22, 70:29, 73:25, 74:5, 74:17, 76:15, 77:11, 78:14, 83:19.84:18.84:22. 85:18, 86:1, 86:18, 87:15, 88:7, 88:24, 91:16, 92:2, 93:24, 95:21, 96:21, 97:20, 98:9, 98:15, 98:18, 98:29, 99:7, 99:11, 99:22, 100:9, 100:11. 100:26. 101:1, 102:4, 103:3, 103:17, 109:24, 110:11, 111:4, 111:14, 112:8, 112:11, 114:1, 116:3, 116:27, 117:20, 118:19, 122:22, 123:21, 124:14, 125:10, 125:18, 125:19, 128:16, 128:24, 129:3, 129:19, 130:10, 130:29, 133:11, 133:20, 136:10, 137:9, 138:24, 142:8, 144:21, 145:24, 149:5, 150:25, 153:4, 155:29, 157:11, 157:15, 158:1, 160:21, 160:28, 161:11, 161:27, 162:6 CHAIRMAN [152] -7:15, 7:17, 8:19,

23:3, 23:11, 23:13, 23:18, 23:21, 23:25, 38:28, 41:17, 44:22, 44:29, 45:6, 45:8, 45:11, 45:19, 46:18, 47:1, 47:13, 47:16, 47:19, 47:23, 50:21, 50:28, 51:1, 51:4, 51:16, 51:22, 51:25, 51:28, 52:5, 52:8, 52:10, 52:12, 53:3, 53:29, 54:13, 54:16, 56:16, 56:19, 57:5, 57:9, 57:12, 57:15, 57:19, 57:26, 58:10, 58:18, 58:24, 58:29, 59:4, 59:6, 59:9, 61:12, 62:5, 62:14, 62:19, 63:2, 66:4, 66:10, 66:17, 66:20, 66:23, 68:2, 68:7, 68:11, 68:14, 69:4, 69:8, 69:11, 69:16, 69:23, 69:26, 71:6, 71:17, 71:21, 71:24. 71:27, 72:1, 72:5, 72:10, 72:12, 73:23, 74:2, 75:19, 75:29, 76:10, 76:24, 76:27, 77:9, 77:12, 78:4, 78:13, 78:21, 78:23, 82:6, 88:13, 88:17, 88:19, 88:28, 89:3, 89:18, 89:22, 90:29, 91:6, 92:11, 92:15, 100:19, 100:23, 100:27, 107:5, 108:26, 109:8, 117:26, 118:1, 118:25, 119:14, 119:19. 119:27. 120:15, 120:19, 120:27, 121:7, 121:25, 121:29, 123:24, 124:1, 124:20, 124:29, 136:8, 141:2, 141:6, 141:29, 143:16, 146:23, 147:26, 148:3, 148:6, 148:8, 148:11, 148:21, 149:7, 153:1, 154:15, 157:26, 159:23, 160:7, 161:3, 162:29, 163:4, 163:8 chairperson [1] - 7:8 Chairperson [1] - 7:23 CHAMBERS [1] - 2:25 chance [2] - 30:20, 97:14

change [4] - 63:24. 92:12, 123:16, 148:6 changed [4] - 23:22, 63:26, 119:10, 125.25 chaos [1] - 8:20 characterised [2] -138:11, 138:20 charade [2] - 73:24, 74.4 charge [9] - 14:29. 15:1, 15:10, 15:27, 16:6, 21:6, 67:21, 67:28, 153:25 charged [1] - 15:22 charges [1] - 159:11 Charleton [1] - 151:12 CHARLETON [2] -1:12, 2:2 CHARLTON [1] - 2:29 check [1] - 5:22 checks [1] - 31:11 CHIEF [1] - 2:12 chief [22] - 6:11, 18:10, 50:10, 55:9, 85:13, 88:29, 91:6, 91:7, 91:22, 91:25, 93:17, 93:29, 94:3, 94:6, 94:10, 94:11, 97:10, 97:13, 108:26, 137:6, 139:27, 158:24 Chief [64] - 5:10, 5:20, 5:23, 5:24, 5:28, 6:3, 6:6, 6:10, 7:21, 9:17, 9:19, 9:29, 16:15, 42:16, 42:28, 43:3, 43:4, 50:12, 54:8, 55:16, 56:1, 56:27, 57:2. 57:15. 57:21. 58:2, 59:14, 60:20, 60:28, 61:16, 67:11, 73:4, 74:8, 83:26, 85:21, 86:9, 86:12, 86:27, 87:3, 87:5, 87:22, 87:27, 88:3, 88:9, 88:25, 89:7, 89:16, 90:2, 90:6, 90:14, 91:8, 91:26, 95:10, 95:14, 96:2, 97:21, 99:22, 138:9, 156:2. 156:8. 156:12, 157:8, 157:9, 162:15 child [4] - 122:21, 123:3, 123:4 child's [2] - 143:29, 144:11 children [32] - 17:14, 17:16, 18:25, 18:27,

19:6, 19:9, 34:16, 34:17, 34:24, 34:26, 34:29, 35:12, 35:27, 36:3, 36:9, 36:18, 47:20, 96:10, 96:13, 118:8, 121:17, 122:6, 139:5, 141:12, 143:3, 144:2, 144:20, 144:26, 145:3, 145:6, 145:7 Children [4] - 122:24, 123:8, 123:14, 158:4 chip [1] - 143:26 chips [1] - 143:24 chitchat [1] - 131:4 choose [1] - 129:11 chose [1] - 132:22 chronological [2] -114:27, 115:1 chronology [1] - 66:4 Churchill [2] - 32:11, 143:22 churning [1] - 52:23 Circular [1] - 10:9 circular [1] - 82:5 circulated [2] - 82:8, 163:2 circumstances [11] -9:19, 13:4, 31:21, 55:23, 94:20, 114:24, 119:28, 121:11, 147:6, 149:2, 159:29 civilian [1] - 11:18 claim [1] - 69:17 clarification [4] - 23:3, 124:12, 124:13, 158:3 clarify [4] - 5:7, 77:13, 82:2, 153:15 clarifying [2] - 18:28, 61:12 classic [1] - 146:5 classification [2] -110:20. 110:21 clear [22] - 6:19, 25:6, 32:27, 35:2, 37:2, 37:29, 42:6, 45:27, 46:13, 61:1, 67:2, 68:2. 73:10. 77:28. 84:15, 97:1, 97:4, 101:26, 107:18, 108:6, 116:21, 124:8 clearly [3] - 7:11, 29:15, 88:21 client [2] - 7:21, 137:23 close [2] - 55:21, 115:16

closed [6] - 114:7, 115:11, 115:29, 117:8, 117:17, 154:6 closing [1] - 116:24 clothing [1] - 12:18 coats [1] - 144:12 cohabitee [1] - 34:2 colleagues [2] - 52:3, 103:9 collusion [3] - 157:1, 157:18, 157:21 combined [1] - 98:27 coming [10] - 10:13, 10:17, 121:10, 125:18, 125:24, 126:25, 129:28, 130:5, 138:4, 151:13 command [3] - 42:6, 42:9, 43:26 commence [2] -149:28, 150:28 commenced [3] -73:13, 106:6, 152:5 commencement [1] -154:3 comment [6] - 7:8, 40:23, 114:14. 114:15, 116:4, 117:1 commented [1] -46:20 comments [5] - 117:6, 133:20, 139:24, 144:5, 144:28 commission [9] -77:15, 77:20, 80:6, 80:17, 80:24, 99:20, 104:6, 104:18, 104:28 Commission [53] -10:21, 11:27, 13:9, 13:19, 13:26, 13:29, 14:1, 14:3, 14:5, 14:15, 17:1, 17:5, 20:24, 28:17, 29:9, 30:26, 31:7, 31:15, 31:16, 31:23, 31:26, 56:11, 64:22, 65:7, 65:10, 65:23, 65:25, 67:6, 67:16, 74:7, 74:29, 76:4, 76:7, 76:20, 77:2, 77:7, 77:18, 78:17, 79:20, 80:14.81:8.81:13. 81:28, 82:24, 83:3, 83:8, 95:2, 102:7, 102:12, 102:19, 104:22, 147:13, 162:14 COMMISSIONER [1] -2:9

Commissioner [12] -5:14, 10:20, 10:29, 11:2, 11:27, 13:9, 13:11, 13:18, 13:22, 13:28, 14:16, 37:5 commissioner [9] -58:7, 67:20, 77:21, 77:22, 79:10, 79:28, 87:7, 156:3, 156:20 Commissioner's [1] -12:26 committed [1] - 31:25 common [5] - 54:28, 55:1, 115:25, 155:12. 155:17 communicated [1] -25:27 communications [1] -148:29 COMPANY [2] - 2:20, 3:8 compiled [1] - 122:3 complain [1] - 80:11 complainant [4] -77:16, 77:29, 80:4, 81:24 complained [1] -134:7 complaint [96] - 16:12, 17:14, 24:29, 28:7, 29:14, 32:9, 34:19, 34:22, 35:10, 35:13, 37:7, 37:11, 37:14, 44:6, 44:12, 49:18, 50:4, 63:12, 63:15, 63:21, 63:27, 64:4, 64:19, 66:1, 75:16, 75:17, 76:2, 76:19, 76:21, 77:4, 77:14, 77:17, 77:20, 77:26, 77:29, 78:3, 78:8, 78:9, 78:18, 78:27, 79:7, 79:16, 79:29, 80:2, 80:7, 80:8, 80:13, 81:4, 82:3, 82:4. 82:13. 82:19. 82:22. 82:23. 83:9. 83:10, 83:16, 83:22, 85:9, 91:27, 93:12, 95:25, 95:28, 96:24, 97:3, 98:5, 99:4, 100:5, 102:14, 103:26, 104:7, 104:14, 104:17, 104:21, 106:3, 106:27, 118:23, 118:24, 119:20, 125:26, 127:1, 127:12, 127:28, 129:7, 129:14,

129:26, 130:25, 137:7, 137:14, 138:6, 142:11, 150:1, 150:2, 154:22 complaint" [1] - 111:8 complaints [19] - 17:6, 63:8, 63:9, 63:17, 80:16, 81:6, 82:16, 93:8, 93:9, 98:24, 104:15, 126:19, 127:13, 136:20, 139:17, 140:16, 140:20, 151:5, 162:11 complete [6] - 6:29, 14:10, 55:9, 73:24, 74:4. 114:16 completed [5] - 14:13, 91:21, 91:24, 92:1, 153:27 completely [2] - 7:18, 143:28 completion [2] - 25:5, 116:5 complied [2] - 83:20, 163:5 comply [3] - 81:19, 82:29, 130:6 comprehensive [1] -156:22 concealment [1] -8:17 concern [3] - 24:14, 62:23, 128:5 concerned [16] - 5:21, 8:2, 16:14, 16:18, 36:27, 47:21, 94:27, 97:11, 103:10, 123:15, 126:28, 127:14, 128:23, 129:23, 138:3, 142:5 concerning [2] - 5:12, 162:12 concerns [5] - 101:21, 130:19, 139:4, 139:9. 142:18 concise [1] - 153:1 conclusion [3] -91:14, 92:6, 103:23 conduct [19] - 10:23, 11:6, 11:8, 11:15, 11:16, 11:19, 12:6, 12:27, 13:13, 17:4, 37:10, 37:13, 77:6, 78:11, 79:12, 79:17, 83:11, 120:15, 162:12 conducted [2] -125:14, 125:20 conducting [1] -

136:22 conference [4] - 50:1, 52:14, 72:27, 96:5 confined [3] - 94:27, 97:29, 100:17 confirm [5] - 6:15, 6:16, 28:2, 57:1, 117:14 confirmation [2] -44:19, 158:3 confirmed [3] - 114:6, 115:28, 117:16 conflict [10] - 53:21, 53:24, 54:14, 54:19, 54:22, 54:26, 55:2, 55:6, 62:25, 130:1 conflicts [1] - 61:18 confused [1] - 115:8 CONLON [1] - 2:24 connection [4] -52:25, 53:25, 62:27, 143:17 connotes [1] - 12:18 CONOR [2] - 2:9, 3:7 conscious [1] - 7:29 consequence [4] -12:19, 67:27, 119:5, 127.21 consequences [15] -85:7, 85:23, 87:1, 87:8, 92:23, 92:24, 92:28, 93:11, 93:14, 93:15, 93:16, 93:21, 105:27, 139:10, 160:4 consequently [1] -96.14 consider [4] - 13:2, 14:9, 29:19, 154:11 considerable [2] -38:7. 131:21 consideration [2] -14:11.96:8 considered [3] -65:11, 94:19, 146:22 consistent [1] -128:15 conspiracy [4] - 8:21, 157:1, 157:19, 157:23 constituent [1] - 16:10 consultation [1] -16:14 consulted [1] - 90:16 consumption [1] -144:16 contact [27] - 11:11, 11:13, 19:26, 24:11, 24:15, 25:3, 26:6, 26:9, 26:13, 34:25,

65:8, 77:2, 77:26, 78:2, 83:27, 106:20, 106:24, 111:6, 111:9, 111:11, 115:23, 119:5, 120:4, 127:15, 127:23, 128:16, 147:10 contacted [11] - 36:1, 65:21, 66:1, 93:29, 104:29, 116:1, 122:5, 127:21, 129:22, 130:12, 136:27 contacts [1] - 73:4 contain [1] - 81:10 contained [34] - 34:19, 35:9, 35:13, 39:8, 56:1, 61:15, 67:15, 85:8, 85:10, 86:28, 94:28, 98:24, 101:13, 103:12, 105:22, 106:12, 106:15, 106:16, 109:15, 121:15, 121:19, 122:11, 122:14, 123:14, 134:11, 139:12, 140:21, 141:9, 142:17, 143:14, 149:25, 150:22, 152:6, 153:22 contains [1] - 76:21 contemplation [1] -148:28 contemporaneous [1] - 111:26 content [14] - 88:2, 88:12, 93:13, 94:17, 95:25, 96:22, 113:13, 119:18, 121:14, 124:18, 125:28, 126:13, 126:17, 126:29 contents [6] - 93:22, 106:1, 138:11, 138:12, 138:20, 138:23 context [10] - 6:25, 13:1, 14:9, 126:22, 127:5, 129:17, 130:9, 139:24, 142:6, 146:24 continuation [1] -45:13 continue [2] - 5:6, 139:11 **CONTINUED** [1] - 9:3 continued [1] - 87:12 contradictory [1] -

35:6 contraindicated [1] -119:2 control [5] - 100:12, 100:13, 118:7, 140:7, 161:8 controversy [1] -158:29 convened [1] - 72:27 converging [1] - 140:6 conversation [5] -55:28, 66:5, 84:4, 87:10, 87:11 convicted [2] - 85:15, 85:17 conviction [1] - 53:23 cooperate [17] - 65:9, 65:16, 65:18, 65:23, 65:28, 75:5, 102:11, 104:5, 105:1, 105:3, 105:6, 118:22, 147:6, 147:11, 147:19, 147:21, 154:17 cooperation [10] -6:29, 8:6, 67:9, 67:17, 104:12, 104:16, 105:12, 106:5, 147:15, 154:25 **copy** [12] - 10:11, 78:17, 80:6, 80:8, 81:24, 82:7, 82:8, 82:9, 82:26, 116:13, 117:13, 162:14 correct [90] - 10:1, 14:26, 26:24, 28:28, 34:20, 34:21, 34:22, 41:3, 42:10, 42:11, 44:21, 44:27, 45:25, 47:11, 47:12, 47:28, 48:9. 50:11. 50:29. 51:3, 57:6, 57:9, 63:6, 64:27, 68:11, 69:1, 69:11, 70:6, 70:28, 71:5, 74:27, 75:18, 78:12, 78:14, 79:2, 90:25, 92:1, 92:7, 92:26, 93:11, 93:27. 93:28. 94:2. 94:5, 94:12, 95:20, 95:21, 96:19, 97:19, 98:1, 103:11, 104:18, 106:4, 107:24, 110:11, 110:19, 110:25, 111:18, 111:24, 111:25, 112:5, 122:4. 122:13. 122:29, 123:2,

139:13, 139:14, 140:21, 142:8, 151:2, 154:9, 155:29, 157:11, 157:13, 157:15, 158:24, 158:27, 159:3, 161:18, 161:25, 161:27, 162:3, 162:5, 162:6, 162:9, 162:16, 162:25, 162:27 correctly [1] - 158:6 correspondence [15] -81:2, 81:3, 94:11, 94:13, 94:28, 95:14, 112:29, 113:1, 113:24, 113:25, 114:25, 115:5, 117:21, 117:25, 122:9 correspondence.. [1] - 94:17 corroboration [2] -126:22, 126:24 counsel [3] - 7:17, 107:9, 136:9 counter [1] - 107:8 country [1] - 117:28 couple [4] - 40:17, 88:25, 111:7, 111:12 courage [1] - 142:11 course [19] - 5:24, 7:21, 18:6, 29:10, 33:1, 63:25, 63:26, 73:18, 82:12, 87:28, 92:5, 95:7, 99:7, 99:9, 101:14, 106:21, 118:16, 136:28, 159:12 courses [1] - 156:8 COURT [2] - 1:13, 2:3 court [2] - 118:27, 120:22 Court [1] - 12:11 courtesy [1] - 13:23 courts [1] - 11:25 cover [1] - 82:22 covered [2] - 12:18, 14:25 covering [2] - 113:12, 148:19 COX [1] - 2:16 cracks [1] - 8:23 crazy [1] - 161:9 created [3] - 16:15, 16:20, 96:12 creates [3] - 12:2, 16:19, 131:18 credibility [2] - 150:8, 151:21

credible [8] - 85:25, 143:14, 143:15, 149:3, 149:12, 150:8, 150:15 crime [52] - 16:27, 16:28, 18:7, 18:21, 18:24, 19:22, 19:23, 19:28, 19:29, 20:8, 21:8, 21:10, 21:13, 21:15, 21:16, 22:6, 22:9, 22:15, 22:20, 24:4, 24:7, 24:9, 24:21, 25:14, 26:9, 26:11, 27:16, 27:17, 27:19, 29:29, 30:5, 30:7, 30:10, 31:4, 31:8, 32:3, 32:22, 37:21, 108:3, 108:4, 109:18, 109:19, 109:25, 110:28, 145:21, 158:12, 158:13, 158:14, 158:26, 159:1, 159:5 crimes [1] - 54:20 Criminal [1] - 12:11 criminal [61] - 15:7, 15:9, 20:16, 25:5, 25:18, 28:9, 29:24, 30:28, 36:29, 41:3, 56:9, 69:29, 70:4, 70:13, 70:16, 71:2, 71:4, 72:3, 72:16, 72:22, 73:15, 85:28, 91:23, 92:5, 92:6, 95:28, 98:24, 99:4, 102:14, 106:2, 106:5, 107:21, 108:20, 108:28, 118:17, 120:17, 125:3, 125:21, 126:19, 127:5, 131:14, 136:23, 137:7, 138:5, 138:15, 140:13, 140:20, 141:9, 142:21, 146:13, 149:28, 151:7, 152:1, 152:4, 154:3, 154:29, 155:9, 155:26, 159:24, 159:25. 160:3 criminality [2] - 60:26, 63.29 criteria [8] - 16:11, 35:22, 40:24, 62:16, 75:3, 107:26, 142:21 criticism [1] - 6:9 **CROSS** [6] - 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 9:4, 125:6, 153.9

 $\begin{array}{c} \text{cross} \text{ [3] - 5:6,} \\ 126:25, 128:28 \\ \text{cross-examination} \\ \text{ [3] - 5:6, 126:25,} \\ 128:28 \\ \text{CROSS-EXAMINED} \\ \text{ [6] - 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 9:4,} \\ 125:6, 153:9 \\ \text{culminated [1] -} \\ 146:19 \\ \text{curry [2] - 143:24,} \\ 143:26 \\ \end{array}$

D daily [1] - 128:17 DALY [1] - 2:19 DANIEL [1] - 3:8 Darren [1] - 96:26 data [1] - 39:8 date [19] - 49:22, 51:13, 68:3, 68:7, 68:12, 68:19, 80:2, 90:29, 94:29, 100:4, 112:12, 112:27, 114:29, 115:3, 115:17, 115:20, 115:23, 120:6, 139:14 date-stamped [1] -112:12 dated [6] - 94:17, 95:9, 97:27, 112:3, 113:25, 114:25 dates [4] - 68:2, 68:19, 111:5, 115:1 DAY [1] - 1:18 days [9] - 39:17, 39:23, 40:17, 73:6, 73:9, 73:10, 88:25, 90:1, 133:17 dead [1] - 11:13 deal [21] - 5:12, 7:19. 14:22, 21:22, 25:8, 25:10, 25:12, 25:17, 28:12, 53:10, 58:12, 82:21, 83:13, 86:10, 86:24, 99:13, 116:25, 118:1, 123:4, 132:12, 140:8 dealing [6] - 8:15, 9:7, 18:5, 18:16, 129:21, 131:7 dealings [3] - 103:9, 111:27, 112:2 deals [1] - 123:3 dealt [4] - 19:16, 29:13, 83:14, 102:2 death [45] - 10:24,

11:7, 11:10, 11:12, 11:13, 11:14, 11:17, 12:2, 13:14, 16:16, 16:19, 16:21, 16:23, 17:12, 22:29, 25:7, 25:11, 27:13, 30:16, 33:28, 35:17, 46:16, 47:7, 47:17, 47:28, 48:8, 48:22, 48:29, 49:19, 50:18, 52:27, 57:24, 59:17, 59:21, 61:3, 61:7, 61:20, 61:28, 62:26, 72:2, 96:12, 97:6, 97:15, 132:13, 138:16 death" [1] - 141:20 debate [1] - 158:11 deceitful [1] - 8:28 December [12] - 59:4, 59:5, 64:3, 64:15, 64:16, 67:1, 68:8, 68:9, 68:13, 72:26, 73:17, 74:16 decide [4] - 145:7, 145:9, 149:27, 150:7 decided [21] - 9:28, 26:18, 31:26, 39:11, 39:17, 55:11, 58:11, 58:19, 63:17, 63:21, 63:24, 65:12, 67:20, 67:23, 74:7, 75:5, 84:16, 92:22, 99:20, 147:10, 154:25 decision [80] - 9:8, 9:9, 9:12, 9:16, 9:19, 9:21. 10:2. 10:5. 13:8, 13:10, 13:17, 13:21, 14:13, 14:17, 14:19, 15:4, 15:9, 15:20, 15:23, 17:8, 20:24, 26:29, 28:10, 28:19, 29:3, 29:10, 30:29, 31:3, 34:3, 34:4, 34:10, 37:23, 37:26, 38:15, 40:8, 40:21, 41:1, 41:4, 43:19, 58:14, 64:22, 74:26, 75:1, 76:8, 77:14, 77:15, 82:24, 84:1, 84:2, 84:22, 84:28, 84:29, 85:19, 86:4.86:6.87:18. 87:26, 90:9, 90:11, 90:12, 90:14, 90:17, 90:18, 90:22, 92:3, 92:8, 94:8, 98:2, 146:26, 150:4, 150:26, 151:6, 151:10, 151:11, 151:29, 154:2,

154:16, 154:23 decision-making [6] -9:12, 40:8, 43:19, 87:26, 90:9, 90:18 decisions [10] - 15:11, 40:12, 40:28, 45:23, 88:1, 90:19, 98:19, 142:19, 142:25, 146:10 decline [1] - 66:7 declined [3] - 65:9, 65:23, 67:7 declining [1] - 65:28 **deem** [3] - 81:13, 81:29, 83:9 deemed [4] - 17:2, 95:1, 105:28, 109:16 deems [1] - 14:8 deep [1] - 7:26 defined [2] - 11:28, 12:14 definite [1] - 114:9 definitely [2] - 22:26, 128:8 definition [8] - 12:5, 12:9, 14:25, 16:17, 106:22, 123:7, 123:13, 149:18 definitive [3] - 11:24, 42:19, 97:23 definitively [2] - 85:4, 88.7 degree [2] - 133:2, 135:4 delay [2] - 102:29, 103.1delaying [1] - 103:4 delegate [1] - 11:2 delegated [2] - 10:29, 77:23 denied [1] - 56:4 dependent [1] - 91:20 deranged [1] - 75:24 derogatory [2] -52:18, 52:23 describe [1] - 82:13 described [1] - 159:12 description [1] -123:12 designated [4] -40:27, 122:8, 122:24, 122:28 desirable [2] - 71:13, 135:4 desk [1] - 100:20 DESMOND [1] - 2:28 detail [4] - 44:16, 53:10, 122:14, 158:21 details [13] - 24:11,

26:6, 26:14, 94:28, 122:11, 132:23, 133:1, 135:3, 135:7, 135:9. 135:16. 135:26, 136:18 detective [2] - 18:11, 85:12 Detective [6] - 18:22, 21:4, 21:6, 46:5, 60:16, 61:10 determination [2] -17:20, 31:1 determined [1] - 96:11 DIARMAID[1] - 2:6 diary [1] - 6:7 dictate [1] - 141:21 dictated [2] - 108:3, 108:4 dictates [1] - 122:9 different [16] - 18:4, 29:6, 29:24, 29:26, 33:25, 47:24, 48:11, 75:5, 96:23, 97:9, 97:18, 128:9, 130:26, 130:28, 152:19, 163:9 difficulties [2] -101:20, 104:11 difficulty [13] - 8:10, 40:18, 40:28, 61:6, 61:9, 61:25, 102:16, 116:23, 117:4, 118:20, 124:13, 130:13, 131:18 Dignam [4] - 5:18, 6:20, 6:25, 153:1 DIGNAM [15] - 2:9, 4:7, 7:24, 9:1, 148:17, 153:4, 153:9, 153:10, 154:19, 158:1, 159:22, 160:6, 160:9, 161:5, 161:12 direct [2] - 128:26, 133:26 directed [2] - 41:15, 86:3 direction [11] - 42:26, 42:29, 43:4, 43:5, 43:9, 57:7, 57:8, 82:15, 100:22, 124:23. 124:24 directions [1] - 15:14 Directive [4] - 10:9, 10:11, 80:21, 162:8 directive [15] - 10:13, 14:24, 14:28, 78:16, 79:6, 79:14, 79:15, 80:19, 81:16, 81:20, 82:20, 162:1, 162:7,

162:26, 163:6 directives [2] -161:23, 162:3 directly [2] - 104:21, 114.15Director [15] - 15:6, 16:4, 28:9, 86:2, 87:18, 149:4, 149:13. 149:27. 151:1, 151:8, 151:11, 151:25, 151:28, 152:3, 154:1 disagree [1] - 135:20 disagrees [1] - 157:9 disappear [1] - 29:21 disavowal [1] - 119:7 discharge [1] - 14:23 disciplinary [17] -20:17, 68:28, 69:22, 70:2, 70:5, 70:13, 70:24, 70:25, 72:16, 72:22, 73:12, 73:14, 102:26, 116:26, 154:29, 155:9, 155:26 discipline [2] - 68:24, 70:1 disclosed [1] - 108:28 disclosure [3] - 8:15, 69:12, 69:20 DISCLOSURES [2] -1:3. 1:4 discover[1] - 137:2 discovery [1] - 8:15 discuss [2] - 12:21, 88:6 discussed [20] -19:14, 20:12, 39:27, 40:2, 49:6, 49:7, 50:17, 53:20, 56:3, 57:22, 57:25, 84:6, 84:15, 84:19, 85:3, 85:5, 85:6, 88:8, 122.22 discussing [1] -146:18 discussion [23] - 9:16, 40:3, 48:12, 50:15, 50:20, 52:13, 52:18, 52:19, 52:26, 57:20, 57:27, 59:17, 60:5, 60:14, 62:7, 62:10, 62:12, 62:15, 69:19, 69:24, 83:24, 84:8, 86:22 disease [2] - 46:21, 46:25 disfigured [2] - 12:16, 12:17 disfigurement [3] -

12:3, 12:14, 12:18 disjointed [1] - 131:17 dislike [1] - 78:25 dispute [1] - 126:23 dissatisfaction [1] -64.28 distance [2] - 19:12, 19:15 distinct [1] - 13:20 distress [2] - 14:25, 16:8 distressed [1] - 23:8 district [27] - 9:25, 26:8, 32:11, 35:5, 35:27, 36:21, 41:16, 42:7, 42:9, 43:2, 43:8, 43:28, 43:29, 44:21, 59:26, 81:1, 82:18, 82:21, 84:24, 84:28, 95:4, 96:16, 115:4, 115:6, 115:7, 116:17, 153:25 districts [2] - 42:8, 44:1 division [27] - 15:13, 30:15, 57:28, 58:1, 58:4, 58:8, 58:26, 59:29, 60:25, 62:2, 62:9. 63:5. 64:18. 67:13.86:14.86:25. 87:9, 87:13, 90:26, 91:12, 93:18, 98:7, 98:11, 99:24, 101:6, 102:23 divisional [2] - 74:20, 74:22 DOCKERY [3] - 2:28, 133:11, 148:5 Dockery [1] - 148:3 document [11] - 7:12, 10:15, 36:11, 39:12, 39:26, 83:6, 90:23, 140:26, 156:1, 156:17 documentation [5] -7:28, 82:25, 83:5, 90:20.90:21 documents [3] - 6:21, 8:22, 151:13 dodgy [1] - 121:10 Domestic [1] - 138:28 domestic [25] - 18:13, 19:16, 32:27, 33:17, 55:23, 72:29, 75:22, 76:11, 109:28, 121:18, 123:7, 126:23, 135:18, 139:2, 139:9, 141:22, 142:10, 142:15, 143:2,

145:1, 145:2, 146:2, 146:6, 146:12, 149:1 domestic-related [1] -139:9 domestic-violencerelated [2] - 142:15, 145:1 DONAL [1] - 2:10 DONALD [1] - 2:12 done [39] - 14:19, 26:22, 30:10, 30:12, 30:13, 30:23, 31:1, 36:12, 36:13, 36:22, 37:20, 38:10, 38:12, 50:6, 52:4, 61:17, 73:19, 73:25, 83:24, 83:29, 84:16, 85:17, 97:4, 99:18, 102:22, 114:2, 115:26, 120:14, 121:7, 124:17, 131:21, 131:25, 131:26, 131:29, 134:26, 135:1, 144:15, 148:23, 159:26 Donegal [27] - 15:13, 26:11, 27:29, 30:15. 57:28, 58:4, 60:12, 60:25, 61:5, 61:6, 61:22, 61:25, 63:5, 74:20, 74:22, 86:14, 86:25, 87:9, 87:13, 90:25, 91:15, 91:19, 98:7, 98:11, 99:14, 103:16, 138:27 Donna [1] - 119:27 double [2] - 70:10, 70:12 doubt [3] - 30:22, 75:14, 141:23 down [14] - 38:28, 48:1, 49:11, 68:12, 77:23, 96:27, 120:12, 129:28, 131:15. 133:4. 136:17, 140:24, 144:6, 157:1 DPP [8] - 12:11, 15:10, 15:11, 15:14, 15:23, 150:3, 151:22, 152:11 DPP's [1] - 15:24 drafted [1] - 56:27 drained [1] - 143:28 dramatic [2] - 140:4, 140:10 draw [1] - 153:5 drop [1] - 39:18 DUBLIN [6] - 1:17, 2:14, 2:17, 2:26,

2:30, 3:9 due [8] - 53:22, 55:7, 55:13, 58:20, 67:17, 97:12, 104:13, 147:14 Duffy [1] - 5:29 dump [2] - 39:13, 39:26 dumped [1] - 48:5 dumping [3] - 27:10, 39:8, 39:15 Dunnes [1] - 135:28 duration [3] - 12:13, 12:19, 126:3 during [4] - 73:18, 82:11, 92:4, 101:14 DURKIN [1] - 2:28 duties [14] - 76:17, 76:22, 93:20, 94:27, 98:1, 98:6, 98:17, 99:18, 100:7, 100:17, 100:20, 117:28, 157:14, 162:4 duty [13] - 11:11, 11:20, 12:26, 12:29, 13:15, 13:18, 78:21, 78:22, 79:9, 99:3, 101:6 dwelling [2] - 33:25, 33:26 DWYER [1] - 2:23 DÁIL [1] - 1:5 Ε EARLSFORT [1] -2:17 early [3] - 95:7, 153:17, 154:10 easier [1] - 104:19 easy [1] - 62:1 echos [1] - 153:11 effect [4] - 53:6, 118:9, 120:15, 135:13 effectively [2] - 64:24, 125:20 effects [1] - 12:13 effort [4] - 74:5, 74:13, 74:15, 74:19 egregious [1] - 133:23 eight [1] - 50:23 either [13] - 8:27, 13:24, 14:14, 30:20, 51:1, 91:19, 112:27, 115:20, 116:13, 124:16, 133:12, 150:18, 159:26

elegant [1] - 141:4 element [4] - 48:28, 97:12, 107:16, 159:25 elements [1] - 57:21 ELIZABETH [1] - 2:7 elsewhere [1] -148:16 email [1] - 66:17 embarking [1] - 60:20 embarrassment [1] -130:4 emergency [1] - 140:8 Emergency [1] - 132:8 emerges [1] - 8:26 Emma [7] - 37:18, 38:3, 40:1, 47:9, 48:4, 48:21 emotional [9] - 35:21, 35:26, 123:6, 123:12, 123:17, 126:4, 138:16, 145:15 employment [10] -85:14, 86:5, 86:10, 86:25, 87:9, 87:12, 87:13, 92:23, 92:25, 93.11 empowered [1] - 11:2 encompasses [1] -12:13 end [9] - 77:1, 89:23, 89:25, 89:29, 126:7, 134:10, 138:12, 140:3, 145:3 ended [1] - 145:13 engage [1] - 109:18 engaged [2] - 68:28, 84:4 engagement [1] -84:27 ENGLISH [1] - 2:23 English [2] - 127:22, 129:20 ensued [1] - 136:4 ensure [4] - 8:9, 31:11, 37:6, 140:19 entered [1] - 123:6 entering [1] - 79:25 entire [1] - 144:18 entirely [5] - 29:27, 34:1, 71:3, 71:13, 89.19 entirety [2] - 149:16, 150:22 entities [1] - 49:15 entitled [5] - 8:25, 14:11, 23:25, 35:22, 134:11 entitlements [1] -

33:16 entry [5] - 41:20, 49:24, 50:7, 51:12, 52:28 environment [5] -142:20, 145:25, 145:26, 145:27, 146:8 ephemeral [1] - 40:16 EQUALITY [1] - 1:9 equation [1] - 130:2 error [2] - 7:28, 8:9 escaped [1] - 50:25 essentially [4] -156:12, 156:13, 158.22 159.14 ESTABLISHED [1] -1:8 established [1] - 12:8 et [3] - 158:26, 159:17, 160:25 etcetera [2] - 12:16, 94:23 EUGENE [2] - 4:4, 9:3 evaluate [4] - 17:8, 148:25, 149:3, 153:29 evaluated [3] - 29:29, 32:17, 74:28 evaluating [3] - 29:28, 141:17, 154:21 evaluation [13] - 17:1, 26:16, 29:25, 30:27, 32:20, 34:18, 35:25, 119:17, 138:22, 143:9, 144:22, 147:1, 156:22 evaluative [1] - 150:7 evening [2] - 61:1, 143:27 event [6] - 8:25, 26:29, 45:23, 82:18, 87:17, 97:26 events [5] - 40:20, 98:21, 99:6, 101:9, 158.16eventually [3] - 58:25, 58:27, 135:6 evidence [55] - 19:16, 20:13, 26:23, 26:25, 26:29, 27:3, 27:7, 28:24, 28:25, 35:3, 35:6, 36:4, 36:14, 37:9, 37:17, 38:18, 38:19, 39:1, 39:3, 40:16, 40:19, 40:22, 45:17, 48:24, 56:29, 65:5, 65:20, 82:12, 89:10, 89:14, 112:10, 113:6,

113:15, 119:26, 130:3, 131:9, 131:16, 136:15, 137:16, 137:29, 138:2, 140:2, 141:17, 141:18, 143:10, 146:28, 148:25, 149:24, 149:28, 150:11, 150:18, 152:6, 158:6, 158:7 EVIDENCE [1] - 1:9 evident [2] - 14:24, 24:16 exactly [6] - 75:12, 112:17, 112:23, 119:11, 132:19, 162:24 exaggerated [1] -99:16 examination [5] - 5:6, 126:25, 128:26, 128:28, 136:28 EXAMINED [8] - 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 4:8, 9:4, 125:6, 153:9, 161:14 example [6] - 31:11, 76:14, 133:23, 143:11, 144:22, 146:5 except [3] - 25:10, 96:23, 157:27 excuse [4] - 60:19. 61:26, 108:9, 150:13 exercise [1] - 16:28 exist [1] - 5:17 existence [2] - 120:9, 149:28 exists [1] - 13:16 expect [8] - 20:19, 22:28, 23:1, 101:2, 101:8, 101:10, 101.17 expected [3] - 14:20, 99:2, 99:5 expecting [4] - 21:25, 22:1, 22:25, 32:5 expedient [2] - 37:8, 37:17 experience [9] -12:15, 92:4, 100:29, 127:10, 128:12, 132:17, 141:17, 141:21, 142:6 experienced [3] -136:13, 138:26, 141:15 expert [1] - 152:4 experts [1] - 123:19 explain [6] - 16:26,

37:16, 38:6, 38:11, 95:18, 114:13 explained [13] - 5:18, 7:25, 8:7, 9:11, 9:13, 10:4, 24:2, 75:2, 82:20, 87:16, 99:8, 131:24, 152:14 explanation [3] - 6:19, 45:27, 114:24 exploring [1] - 151:18 exposition [1] -156:18 express [2] - 7:24, 7:26 expressed [4] - 87:24, 130:18, 130:19, 154:10 expressing [1] -156:19 expression [1] -159:19 expressions [1] -159:13 extent [1] - 157:17 external [1] - 25:9 extradition [1] - 51:1 extreme [1] - 78:24 extremely [4] -103:13, 106:17, 109:16, 136:13 eyes [2] - 137:6, 144:11 F face [2] - 6:23, 149:15 faces [1] - 22:1 fact [66] - 5:27, 5:28, 6:12, 7:11, 9:23, 10:10, 17:22, 24:27, 28:16, 39:7, 44:3, 46:24, 49:13, 55:20, 58.20 61.2 62.24 63:4, 63:23, 66:7, 67:25, 69:28, 76:1, 76:5, 76:8, 77:29, 78:2, 81:10, 85:11, 85:25, 88:10, 96:23, 97:18, 98:4, 104:1, 104:13, 104:23, 105.24 106.10 106:12, 111:20, 112:2, 115:22, 115:27, 117:3,

117:22, 119:20,

120:17, 121:15,

126:2, 126:28,

137:10, 139:20,

140:15, 142:23,

142:24, 152:4, 152:9, 153:13, 154:2, 154:16, 155:20, 156:10, 158:2, 159:10, 161:5 factor [2] - 16:10, 140:15 facts [11] - 59:9, 120:7, 132:26, 136:14, 136:23, 139:11, 139:14, 139:17, 140:19, 140:20, 159:29 factual [5] - 93:13, 93:15, 106:17, 126:18, 142:24 failed [3] - 104:5, 107:9, 147:5 fair [3] - 62:22, 100:3, 144:17 fairly [2] - 128:28, 135:22 fairness [2] - 59:27, 122:18 faith [5] - 14:19, 40:22, 121:8, 121:12 fall [3] - 8:23, 106:28, 123:20 falls [2] - 103:1, 107:2 false [3] - 93:23, 99:16, 139:21 familiar [1] - 99:29 family [11] - 17:16, 52:15, 53:22, 54:15, 55:5, 55:7, 56:12, 61:5, 61:19, 63:19, 127:15 famous [2] - 107:7, 107:11 far [11] - 5:14, 16:14, 16:17, 35:7, 52:10, 89:5, 114:1, 117:7, 123:14, 126:27, 138:3 fashion [5] - 72:24, 73:27, 81:25, 101:23, 132:3 fast [1] - 101:22 Fatal [7] - 12:7, 15:15, 15:21, 15:27, 16:1, 106:29, 143:12 fatal [1] - 106:23 favour[1] - 151:15 fear [2] - 159:13, 159:19 fears [1] - 141:19 features [1] - 131:5 February [6] - 23:20, 59:2, 59:7, 68:3, 68:6, 74:16

FEBRUARY [2] - 1:6, 1:10 feelings [1] - 133:7 feet [1] - 103:2 fell [1] - 96:14 felt [11] - 56:6, 65:1, 103:15, 107:18, 134:13, 136:18, 137:23, 143:28, 159:15, 160:23, 160:24 few [3] - 44:23, 125:1, 125:9 fide [3] - 121:5, 124:6, 124:18 fides [1] - 8:16 fifths [1] - 133:4 file [5] - 103:8, 151:28, 152:7, 153:29, 154:1 files [1] - 152:2 filling [2] - 124:10, 144:11 film [1] - 107:12 filter [1] - 150:7 filtered [2] - 151:3, 151:4 final [4] - 9:18, 156:5, 156:7 finalised [4] - 114:20, 115:15, 117:2, 117:4 finally [4] - 152:8, 154:12, 159:7, 160:29 fine [5] - 56:19, 57:26, 70:7, 92:14, 121:25 finish [5] - 45:20, 74:2, 89:9, 127:20, 148:11 finished [2] - 118:18, 154:14 First [4] - 122:24, 123:8, 123:14, 158:4 first [23] - 7:9, 10:16, 22:28, 23:6, 38:13, 42:28, 56:25, 62:7, 66:13, 66:29, 68:9, 69:11, 97:24, 100:19, 128:9, 133:13, 134:3, 144:2, 144:3, 152:5, 152:16, 156:11, 162:2 firstly [6] - 65:15, 80:27, 101:4, 111:8, 153:10, 160:10 fitted [1] - 106:22 FITZGERALD [1] -2:11 FITZWILLIAM[2] -2:30, 3:9

five [6] - 69:6, 73:6, 73:10, 89:24, 131:5, 156:11 five-and-a-half [1] -131.5 flowing [1] - 135:5 fluent [1] - 133:7 fluid [2] - 18:5, 18:8 focus [4] - 132:8, 138:19, 140:27, 140:28 follow [16] - 37:25, 43:22, 44:7, 46:10, 49:25, 49:28, 52:8, 52:29, 77:5, 82:1, 87:19, 87:21, 95:26, 98:13, 114:2, 114:16 follow-through [1] -77:5 follow-up [14] - 37:25, 43:22, 44:7, 46:10, 49:25, 49:28, 52:29, 82:1, 87:19, 87:21, 95:26, 98:13, 114:2, 114:16 followed [5] - 20:29, 50:9, 115:4, 145:10, 155:18 FOLLOWING [1] - 1:5 following [7] - 1:26. 11:26, 82:25, 89:29, 98:17, 115:24, 163:4 FOLLOWS [2] - 5:1, 92.19 follows [3] - 11:29, 117:19, 118:5 foot [1] - 14:1 football [1] - 69:5 FOR [10] - 1:8, 2:6, 2:9, 2:15, 2:19, 2:23, 2:27, 3:3, 3:7, 3:11 force [12] - 10:14, 10:17, 24:16, 34:14, 76:17, 78:19, 79:17, 80:17, 81:11, 82:16, 83:11, 99:14 forget [1] - 76:29 form [32] - 14:10, 14:13, 35:29, 36:16, 40:7, 70:15, 76:21, 81:5, 81:6, 105:24, 110:13, 110:17, 110:21, 110:24, 111:3, 119:17, 122:12, 122:20, 122:21, 122:24, 122:27, 122:28, 122:29, 123:2, 123:3, 124:10, 143:4, 151:27,

158:7, 158:9 formally [1] - 154:6 formed [3] - 13:16, 60:14, 135:17 former [1] - 5:13 forms [8] - 10:21, 11:19, 12:26, 13:12, 110:14, 110:15, 111:1, 158:18 forthwith [1] - 77:8 fortunate [4] - 63:14. 63:16, 63:23, 64:1 forward [6] - 78:10, 78:16, 80:6, 88:4, 142:11, 153:29 forwarded [14] - 6:21, 6:24, 77:21, 77:24, 77:25, 79:11, 94:13, 95:10, 95:15, 113:3, 122:9, 122:10, 151:15, 162:13 forwarding [2] -75:15, 83:2 four [4] - 41:18, 73:9, 108:15, 133:3 four-year-old [1] -108:15 frame [1] - 109:1 framed [2] - 125:18, 125:19 framework [1] -126:24 free [3] - 129:8, 129:12 freshly [1] - 61:16 FRIDAY [1] - 163:12 friend [1] - 125:2 frightened [1] - 161:7 front [4] - 35:11, 143:27, 144:4, 146:25 fuelled [1] - 144:16 fulfilled [2] - 85:18, 85:19 full [2] - 75:14, 156:18 fully [3] - 9:13, 24:6, 114:13 function [8] - 10:29, 12:4, 16:27, 31:3, 31:7, 31:14, 77:23, 84:12 functions [2] - 11:3, 32:3 fundamental [1] -152:12 fundamentally [2] -36:27, 98:5 furnished [3] - 5:11, 5:25, 5:27 future [16] - 8:10,

24:17, 25:4, 26:1, 27:7, 27:14, 27:16, 27:17, 39:9, 84:2, 87:12, 97:16, 138:19, 139:10, 141:23, 142:6

G

GAGEBY [1] - 2:23 Galway [1] - 160:16 GALWAY [1] - 2:21 GARDA [1] - 2:19 garda [17] - 11:19, 18:2, 18:11, 59:18, 59:21, 75:23, 78:7, 78:8, 78:11, 95:1, 99:20, 102:12, 104:17, 135:27, 139:27 Garda [320] - 8:14, 9:26, 10:19, 10:20, 10:23, 11:9, 11:11, 11:14, 11:26, 12:25, 13:8, 13:11, 13:14, 13:17, 13:19, 13:22, 13:26, 13:28, 13:29, 14:3, 14:4, 14:12, 14:15, 16:29, 17:4, 17:5. 17:7. 17:23. 19:2, 19:26, 20:17, 20:23, 20:26, 21:3, 21:18, 21:20, 21:22, 22:8. 22:15. 22:27. 22:28, 23:24, 24:11, 24:28, 25:4, 25:8, 25:10, 28:17, 28:18, 29:1, 29:7, 29:9, 29:17, 30:26, 31:7, 31:10, 31:12, 31:14, 31:16. 31:23. 31:26. 32:8, 32:16, 32:23, 32:25, 33:4, 33:13, 34:5, 34:9, 37:3, 37:5, 37:6, 37:12, 37:25, 38:8, 43:24, 45:28, 46:4, 46:8, 46:15, 46:17, 47:7, 47:11, 47:28, 48:8, 48:23, 48:27, 49:1, 49:20, 50:7, 50:19, 50:24, 52:15, 52:21, 52:24, 52:27, 53:7, 53:18, 53:22, 53:25, 53:26, 54:14, 54:27, 54:29, 55:4, 55:6, 55:8, 55:13, 55:20, 55:22, 55:23, 55:26, 56:8, 56:10, 56:13, 56:14, 57:24, 58:22,

60:4, 60:10, 61:3, 61:8, 61:18, 61:20, 61:29, 62:26, 62:28, 64:13, 64:15, 64:17, 64:18, 64:22, 65:7, 65:9, 65:14, 65:22, 65:25, 67:4, 67:6, 67:10, 67:16, 67:22, 67:23, 67:27, 68:23, 69:12, 70:1, 70:16, 70:17, 70:23, 71:1, 71:3, 71:26, 72:4, 72:7, 72:8, 72:17, 72:18, 72:27, 73:1, 73:2, 74:6, 74:29, 76:3, 76:4, 76:7, 76:20, 76:23, 77:2, 77:7, 77:15, 77:17, 77:18, 77:20, 77:21, 78:16, 78:28, 79:9, 79:10, 79:20, 79:28, 80:11, 80:13, 80:17, 80:23, 81:4, 81:7, 81:12, 81:26, 81:28, 82:24. 83:2. 83:8. 83:25, 84:4, 84:9, 84:16, 84:21, 84:23, 84:25, 85:1, 85:13, 85:14, 85:20, 86:4, 86:13, 87:8, 87:12, 87:13, 87:20, 87:27, 88:11, 89:10, 89:19, 89.28 90.3 90.13 90:18, 90:24, 91:11, 91:17, 92:23, 92:25, 92:29, 93:8, 93:14, 93:16, 93:21, 93:25, 93:26, 94:26, 95:3, 96:7, 96:11, 96:12, 97:29, 98:6, 98:16, 98:20, 98:22, 98:28, 99:15, 99:17, 100:5, 101:14, 102:7, 102:14, 102:19, 103:2, 103:8, 103:25, 104:5, 104:21, 104:24, 104:27, 105:13, 105:27, 106:14, 106:20, 108:23, 109:21, 110:6, 111:18, 111:23, 115:4, 115:6, 122:25, 123:22, 124:16, 125:22, 125:27, 126:15, 127:27, 127:28, 128:22, 128:23. 129:6, 129:22, 129:25, 130:20, 130:23, 131:2,

131:4, 134:22, 135:2, 136:11, 137:12, 138:22, 139:16, 139:26, 140:5, 140:17, 141:11, 142:2, 143:8, 145:12, 145:16, 147:13, 150:26, 151:6, 151:13, 153:14, 153:21, 155:28, 156:24, 156:28, 156:29, 157:2, 157:24, 159:17, 161:19, 161:23, 162:1, 162:12, 162:13 Gardaí [28] - 17:27, 26:18, 26:25, 27:3, 28:1, 35:16, 38:17, 40:17, 54:4, 56:23, 57:27, 60:12, 61:5, 61:6, 61:22, 61:25, 71:18, 75:26, 118:2, 118:4, 118:10, 118:16, 119:5, 128:5, 140:6, 146:18, 148:28, 157:25 Gardaí's [1] - 79:5 Gary [3] - 55:20, 57:24, 61:20 gather [2] - 28:25, 124:14 gender [1] - 12:15 general [2] - 107:12, 126:2 generally [2] - 81:2, 118:21 genuine [7] - 34:1, 53:8, 125:11, 125:23, 125:26, 125:27, 152:10 geographical [2] -19:12, 19:15 German [1] - 46:23 Gillespie [1] - 20:4 GIM [8] - 110:13, 110:14, 110:15, 110:17, 110:21, 110:24, 111:1, 111:3 girls [1] - 143:28 given [28] - 6:19, 19:29, 20:3, 21:15, 22:15, 23:11, 23:23, 23:28, 24:3, 26:13, 27:19, 30:7, 34:23, 35:4, 35:6, 73:8, 84:29, 98:5, 98:10, 109:25, 114:10,

124:26, 130:13, 146:1, 158:6, 158:13, 158:15, 159:2 gloss [1] - 125:12 GM [1] - 158:18 God [1] - 55:16 Googling [1] - 110:1 Goretti [1] - 95:27 governed [1] - 70:18 grandstander [1] -135:14 grateful [1] - 7:2 gratitude [1] - 7:25 gravamen [1] - 132:12 grave [1] - 118:20 great [3] - 53:10, 118:1, 133:2 greater [2] - 136:19, 140:18 ground [3] - 18:17, 20:11, 148:20 grown [2] - 77:27, 78:1 grown-up [2] - 77:27, 78:1 grows [1] - 133:16 GSOC [79] - 9:8, 9:9, 16:27, 17:17, 17:18, 17:19, 17:28, 17:29, 18:1, 20:15, 27:1, 27:5, 29:18, 29:21, 36:28, 37:20, 40:19, 41:5, 41:19, 50:5, 55:25, 58:14, 61:2, 61:15, 65:3, 65:17, 65:19, 65:27, 66:1, 66:15, 66:17, 67:2, 70:19, 71:12, 73:2, 73:4, 73:11, 73:21, 75:8, 75:29, 77:27, 78:1, 78:3, 78:11, 78:20, 79:3, 79:11, 83:18, 94:1, 94:4, 94:8, 96:27, 97:2, 99:12, 102:28, 109:23, 116:25, 136:28, 137:3, 137:5, 146:20, 146:24, 146:26, 146:29, 147:1, 147:4, 147:6, 147:8, 147:10. 147:11. 147:20, 147:23, 151:17, 154:5, 154:25, 161:17, 161:19, 162:19, 162:23 GSOC1 [2] - 81:5, 81:24

10

quard [9] - 17:25. 18:29, 60:24, 70:20, 70:21, 80:11, 127:11, 128:13, 141:15 guards [4] - 129:28, 130:5, 130:8, 162:4 Guidelines [4] -122:25, 123:8, 123:14, 158:5 guidelines [1] -123:13 guilty [1] - 108:12 gun [4] - 17:25, 18:29, 107:8, 107:10 Gweedore [1] - 129:28 Gwen [1] - 1:25 GWEN [1] - 1:30 н half [8] - 59:15, 131:5, 132.10 133.28 155:4, 156:5, 156:7 HALLS [1] - 2:21 HANAHOE[1] - 2:24 hang [1] - 57:12 hanging [4] - 30:17, 93:10, 103:7, 103:10 hangs [1] - 143:15 happy [6] - 16:19, 35:8, 71:10, 85:6, 134:8. 134:12 harassed [3] - 107:19, 150:14, 160:23 harassment [10] -106:22, 106:25, 107:1, 107:15, 107:16, 133:9, 148:26, 149:18, 149:22, 150:24 hard [1] - 101:11 harm [29] - 10:24, 11:7. 11:10. 11:12. 11:17, 11:28, 12:6, 12:9, 12:28, 13:3, 13:15, 14:26, 15:2, 15:15, 15:29, 16:7, 16:8, 16:17, 17:13, 96:13, 97:7, 97:12, 97:15, 108:12, 132.14 138.15 138:16, 141:20, 157:1 harmed [1] - 11:18 HARRISON [1] - 2:19 Harrison [119] - 20:17, 21:3, 21:22, 22:8, 24:19, 25:4, 27:14,

27:20, 29:17, 31:29, 32:8, 32:10, 32:16, 32:23, 32:25, 33:4, 33:13, 34:6, 34:10, 41:11, 41:24, 46:4, 46:8, 46:15, 46:17, 47:8, 47:11, 47:28, 48:8, 48:23, 49:1, 49:20, 50:7, 50:19, 52:21, 52:24, 52:28, 53:7, 53:27, 55:22, 55:24, 56:15, 60:10, 61:8, 61:29, 62:28, 64:14, 64:19, 69:12, 71:26, 72:4, 72:8, 72:9, 72:17, 72:18, 73:1.83:25.84:4. 84:9, 84:17, 84:21, 84:24, 84:25, 85:1, 85:20, 86:5, 87:8, 87:12, 87:13, 87:27, 89:28, 90:13, 90:18, 90:24, 91:12, 91:17, 92:29, 93:9, 93:14, 93:16. 93:22. 93:27. 96:8, 96:11, 96:12, 97:15, 97:29, 98:6, 98:16, 98:20, 98:22, 98:28, 99:15, 99:17, 101:14, 103:25, 105:27, 106:20, 108:23, 109:6, 109:21. 110:6. 111:18, 111:23, 124:16, 128:7, 141:11, 145:16, 150:12, 152:13, 152:15, 153:14, 153:21, 155:28, 156:24, 156:28, 157:2, 159:17, 161:19 Harrison's [6] - 21:18, 21:21, 85:14, 86:13, 92:23, 92:25 HARTNETT [1] - 3:3 Harty [27] - 5:5, 7:5, 8:24, 23:3, 44:22, 46:18, 53:3, 53:5, 53:29, 56:19, 57:5, 59:10, 61:12, 68:3, 71:7, 78:5, 87:15, 89:8, 107:5, 121:2, 153:12, 156:1, 156:6, 156:15, 157:6, 159:9, 161:29 HARTY [94] - 2:19, 4:5, 9:4, 9:6, 23:10, 23:12. 23:17. 23:20. 23:22, 23:27, 38:27, 39:1, 41:18, 44:27,

45:2, 45:7, 45:9, 45:15, 45:22, 46:28, 47:4, 47:15, 47:18, 47:22, 47:25, 51:6, 52:13, 53:13, 54:8, 54:14, 54:19, 56:18, 56:25, 57:8, 57:11, 57:14, 57:18, 57:20, 59:2, 59:5, 59:7, 59:11, 61:14, 63:4, 66:9, 66:11, 66:19, 66:22, 66:25, 68:6, 68:9, 68:13, 68:16, 68:18, 69:18, 69:25, 69:27, 71:16, 71:18, 71:22, 71:25, 71:28, 72:3, 72:7, 72:11, 72:18, 73:29, 74:15, 75:28, 77:13, 78:12, 78:15, 78:20, 79:1, 82:7, 82:10, 82:13, 88:18, 89:26, 91:1, 91:7, 92:20, 100:28, 107:14, 108:29, 109:17. 120:28. 121:26, 122:1, 123:28, 124:3, 124:25, 157:20, 159:18 Harty's [2] - 82:9, 158:11 hassle [1] - 128:4 hat [1] - 145:21 he/she [1] - 14:8 head [2] - 42:6, 95:18 Headquarters [10] -6:7, 73:3, 80:21, 86:13, 87:21, 88:11, 90:4, 156:29, 157:3, 157:4 headquarters [2] -67:23, 73:16 heads [2] - 30:17, 160:2 hear [1] - 155:22 heard [6] - 8:4, 27:4, 36:3, 128:2, 133:13, 135:12 HEARING [3] - 5:1, 92:18, 163:12 hears [1] - 107:23 heed [1] - 6:28 HEGARTY [1] - 2:29 HELD [1] - 1:17 held [4] - 36:7, 36:23, 96:5, 113:18 help [8] - 23:4, 43:18, 54:7, 58:10, 59:9, 68:4, 68:17, 125:2 helpful [2] - 124:23,

125:4 herself [8] - 20:8, 21:21, 27:20, 34:4, 34:10, 34:14, 127:16, 142:20 high [7] - 72:26, 73:18, 139:26, 140:12, 146:17, 147:2, 148:24 high-level [3] -140:12, 146:17, 148:24 high-profile [1] -147.2 highlighting [1] -142:28 highlights [1] - 141:7 himself [1] - 161:9 home [6] - 31:17, 31:27, 109:21, 129:15, 143:21, 143:23 homicide [2] - 54:6, 143:17 Hone [1] - 112:3 Hone's [1] - 113:3 honestly [5] - 56:16, 56:19, 71:23, 124:11, 153:2 honeymoon [1] - 38:6 honoured [1] - 45:20 hope [4] - 30:13, 30:14, 103:22, 156:5 hopefully [1] - 163:8 horrified [1] - 27:28 hour [4] - 92:15, 131:6, 131:28, 132:3 hours [8] - 41:18, 59:15, 64:24, 73:5, 131:3, 131:4, 132:10, 133:28 HOUSE [1] - 2:13 house [5] - 7:27, 32:1, 33:24, 130:5, 145:4 house' [1] - 33:24 **HQ** [7] - 6:5, 10:9, 10:11, 80:19, 81:16, 81:19, 161:24 HSE [25] - 6:24, 34:17, 73:21, 114:3, 114:6, 114:19, 115:10, 115:28, 116:12, 117:8, 117:14, 117:15, 117:16, 118:2, 119:3, 119:6, 119:11, 119:15, 119:22, 121:6, 121:7, 121:24, 122:10, 122:26, 158:8

huge [1] - 23:5 HUGH [1] - 3:3 Human [1] - 156:3 hundred [1] - 35:8 husband [2] - 23:9, 118:7 hypothetical [4] -15:18, 86:1, 102:4, 118:6

idea [2] - 57:15, 92:16 identified 191 - 36:1. 36:20, 46:1, 47:6, 48:10, 55:22, 92:28, 120:4, 149:16 identify [1] - 36:15 identifying [1] - 59:3 ill [4] - 53:7, 125:10, 125:16, 128:10 ill-advised [1] - 128:10 ill-motivated [1] - 53:7 illusion [1] - 87:3 imagine [1] - 85:5 immediate [10] -19:27, 24:15, 26:8, 29:13, 35:19, 36:10, 49:8, 90:24, 93:10, 93:16 immediately [5] -5:25, 80:1, 86:8, 93:21. 162:13 immense [1] - 42:27 immolated [1] -144:24 impacted [2] - 152:26, 153:23 impairment [2] - 12:3, 12:12 impartial [1] - 62:24 impassioned [1] -135:12 implied [2] - 52:18, 62:18 implies [1] - 76:16 importance [1] - 27:11 important [7] - 8:18, 8:26, 73:19, 73:20, 105:29, 140:14, 145:18 impression [3] -119:9, 124:25, 135:17 IN [1] - 1:17 inaccurate [2] - 105:4, 126:5 inappropriate [3] -68:22, 78:19, 134:13

11

incident [15] - 23:6, 23:15, 23:20, 26:16, 60:1, 97:13, 104:25, 143:2, 143:22, 145:2, 145:5, 145:10, 158:19, 160:11 incidents [12] - 9:24, 15:19, 20:1, 20:9, 25:16, 51:25, 96:9, 142:13, 142:28, 143:1, 149:17, 153.26included [3] - 69:16, 134:5, 134:21 includes [1] - 11:6 including [6] - 8:2, 12:10, 12:15, 32:13, 96:9. 155:28 inconsequential [1] -12:16 inconvenience [3] -8:1, 8:10, 130:17 incorrect [2] - 7:16, 65:15 increases [1] - 33:3 indeed [7] - 8:11, 107:11, 118:26, 147:7, 151:26, 156:20, 163:5 independence [1] -62:13 independent [11] -17:5, 54:25, 56:6, 56:7, 58:7, 58:28, 60:22, 67:12, 74:9, 99:23, 102:9 INDEX [1] - 4:1 indicate [5] - 10:22, 13:13, 106:9, 126:13, 148:1 indicated [20] - 20:27, 24:2. 27:8. 53:13. 53:17, 58:16, 64:28, 67:16, 67:19, 71:9, 72:15, 102:20, 105:7, 106:4, 139:16, 139:29, 146:18, 148:26, 150:3, 150:4 indicating [1] - 57:2 indirectly [1] - 63:19 individual [2] - 14:16, 47:19 individuals [1] - 71:11 indoor [4] - 94:27, 98:1, 98:6, 157:14 infection [1] - 137:1 inference [1] - 159:29 inferred [1] - 107:11

inform [3] - 66:21, 79:3, 115:19 information [21] -25:12, 26:2, 26:4, 34:11, 34:12, 35:9, 68:21, 95:15, 95:28, 96:6, 97:1, 110:2, 111:15, 120:7, 120:12, 124:4, 132:20, 134:5, 134:9, 135:9, 135:11 informed [4] - 45:2, 137:4, 147:7 initial [7] - 20:1, 20:4, 55:28, 58:29, 91:1, 119:5, 127:13 initialled [2] - 126:9, 134:17 initiate [1] - 20:16 injured [7] - 11:13, 108:2, 118:21, 118:27, 128:16, 134:1, 134:6 injuries [4] - 15:19, 15:25, 16:3 injury [5] - 11:15, 15:3, 15:16, 143:12, 150:12 innocuous [1] -128:28 inquiries [17] - 50:8, 60:15, 60:17, 61:11, 62:3, 62:6, 65:4, 65:24, 74:9, 75:6, 105:21, 119:23, 120:9, 146:28, 147:11, 147:21, 154:18 inquiry [8] - 5:13, 49:26, 50:14, 51:11, 51:13, 52:4, 60:19, 82.2 INQUIRY [2] - 1:3, 1:9 inside [2] - 17:26, 160:1 insofar [8] - 5:20, 38:17, 39:2, 47:5. 103:9, 107:15, 122:11, 124:25 INSP [2] - 2:27, 2:28 inspect [1] - 31:17 inspection [1] - 6:1 inspector [6] - 18:10, 18:11, 71:9, 85:12, 139:27 Inspector [46] - 18:22, 21:4, 21:6, 22:19, 24:12, 24:25, 37:28, 39:17, 39:22, 40:11, 40:26, 41:12, 41:25,

42:1, 42:4, 42:13, 42:22, 43:16, 43:22, 44:5, 44:9, 44:18, 45:18, 46:5, 48:1, 49:4, 49:10, 49:24, 49:27, 51:15, 53:1, 59:27, 59:28, 60:16, 61:10, 95:26, 98:27, 109:26, 110:9, 110:16, 129:10, 131:24, 132:26, 136:12, 136:17, 137:21 inspectors [1] - 42:7 installing [1] - 31:19 instance [2] - 118:18, 127:13 instantly [1] - 35:18 instead [1] - 73:15 instruct [1] - 42:15 instructed [1] - 147:5 **INSTRUCTED** [7] -2:12, 2:16, 2:20, 2:24, 2:29, 3:4, 3:8 instruction [4] -42:25, 80:21, 82:15, 82:17 instructions [4] -7:17, 64:12, 81:15, 124:27 instructs [1] - 133:4 **INSTRUMENT**[1] -1:8 intend [3] - 78:2, 137:20, 160:4 intended [5] - 35:1, 35:17, 89:10, 101:12, 108:24 intending [2] - 75:17, 108:10 intends [2] - 107:22, 108:20 intention [6] - 85:26, 86:24, 89:16, 102:6, 153:20, 155:27 interactions [2] - 55:8, 55:13 interest [11] - 50:17, 53:21, 53:25, 54:14, 54:19, 54:22, 54:26, 55:6, 61:18, 128:7, 152:10 interests [1] - 135:8 interject [3] - 79:1, 89:10, 159:18 Internal [16] - 58:19, 67:22, 78:17, 82:26, 83:27, 86:6, 86:10, 87:20, 90:4, 90:21, 95:14, 98:2, 139:28,

156:3, 156:21, 162:15 internal [2] - 91:25, 93:19 interpersonal [2] -148:29, 150:15 interpretation [1] -11:24 interpretations [1] -23:8 interrupt [2] - 53:3, 88:13 interruption [1] - 7:29 intervene [1] - 117:26 intervention [2] - 13:7, 117.15interview [14] - 29:4, 47:6, 47:27, 48:4, 48:27, 64:18, 126:3, 126:7, 133:23, 133:26, 136:3, 137:2, 153:20, 155:27 interviewed [7] -37:24, 37:27, 38:1, 40:6, 40:12, 49:3, 152:16 interviewers [1] -133:25 interviewing [1] - 49:9 interviews [2] - 38:5, 40:14 intimate [4] - 131:6, 132:11, 132:23, 133.28 INTO [1] - 1:3 introduction [1] -132:1 intruder [1] - 31:18 inundated [1] - 8:22 invalid [2] - 73:4, 73:6 investigate [33] - 27:4, 29:2, 56:14, 57:17, 58:1, 58:13, 60:13, 61:25, 62:8, 62:9, 63:28, 64:4, 66:2, 67:3, 67:5, 68:20, 70:2, 70:21, 70:25, 71:10, 74:5, 79:18, 93:7, 93:9, 93:26, 102:5, 102:24, 103:16, 104:3, 109:17, 109:22, 126:16, 152:27 investigated [20] -54:20, 54:24, 58:4, 62:4, 64:2, 65:27, 66:8, 66:27, 71:3, 71:29, 80:15, 98:4, 101:28, 102:1,

102:2, 103:20, 103:23, 149:24, 150:21 investigating [23] -17:6, 40:18, 56:8, 61:5, 61:7, 63:6, 63:7, 63:8, 64:16, 67:24, 69:29, 73:11, 96:26, 98:23, 102:9, 102:28, 142:21, 147:9, 148:27, 153:15, 153:16, 153:24 investigation [124] -14:5, 15:7, 17:2, 17:10, 17:21, 21:7, 22:4, 22:5, 25:5, 26:20, 26:23, 28:9, 28:22, 28:29, 29:20, 29:22, 29:23, 29:24, 29:25, 30:28, 36:29, 37:25, 39:10, 40:7, 41:3, 41:6, 41:24, 44:4, 44:13, 45:13, 45:18, 46:2, 46:3, 48:19, 49:26, 50:9, 50:14, 51:14, 53:8, 54:4, 54:17, 56:7, 58:9, 59:8, 60:22, 60:23, 62:13, 65:10, 65:16, 65:19, 66:28, 67:14, 67:21, 67:29, 68:1, 68:25, 68:28, 70:4, 70:6, 70:13, 70:16, 71:5, 72:3, 73:8, 73:12, 73:14, 73:15, 74:13, 76:5, 77:5, 85:23, 87:17, 91:21, 91:24, 92:1, 92:5, 92:7, 93:21, 101:24. 102:8. 102:13. 102:26. 102:29, 103:1, 103:28, 104:1, 104:10, 104:16, 105:2, 105:13, 105:19, 106:5, 111:28, 117:9, 120:8, 120:17, 125:11, 125:16, 125:21, 125:27, 126:27, 127:6, 129:5, 131:14, 133:9, 136:23, 138:15, 146:19, 146:21, 147:11, 149:21, 150:25, 151:27, 152:7, 152:11, 153:27, 153:28, 154:7, 155:1, 155:9, 155:26

investigations [41] -20:25, 27:1, 29:11, 44:2, 48:12, 49:16, 60:17, 64:7, 64:9, 64:11, 65:24, 73:26, 74:1, 74:10, 75:6, 82:1, 85:28, 99:25, 101:15, 101:16, 101:18, 101:22, 102:17, 104:9, 104:28, 105:16, 118:22, 120:16, 139:8, 141:24, 142:26, 143:4, 147:3, 147:19, 152:20, 152:23, 155:11, 155:13, 155:16, 155:23 investigative [8] -27:6, 38:9, 38:10, 38:11. 39:2. 51:11. 98:10, 103:4 investigator[1] - 58:7 investigators [1] -143:8 involve [4] - 16:8, 67:7, 76:8, 87:25 involved [34] - 18:9, 20:27, 28:8, 29:1, 29:8, 44:4, 44:10, 44:11, 44:12, 44:13, 46:16, 46:27, 48:22, 56:9, 57:23, 57:29, 60:25, 61:3, 67:26, 68:25, 70:4, 70:5, 70:26, 71:11, 86:21, 90:9, 103:3, 104:24, 129:5, 139:8, 151:17, 156:29, 157:23 involvement [18] -13:10, 41:6, 44:15, 61:20, 67:18, 72:20, 74:20, 74:23, 75:9, 77:8, 84:25, 105:8, 116:8, 128:3, 145:12, 147:14, 154:26, 155:5 involving[4] - 17:6, 143:23, 145:6, 150:26 **IRELAND** [1] - 3:6 irregular [1] - 116:29 irrelevant [2] - 131:13, 135:7 irrespective [7] -75:10, 76:4, 79:17, 101:15, 106:9, 123:1, 162:21 issue [17] - 5:12, 5:24,

9:7, 44:15, 49:19, **KATHY** [1] - 2:12 51:9, 80:12, 80:20, 80:28, 81:17, 81:21, 81:23. 83:1. 88:8. 96:21, 121:13, 140:23 issued [1] - 81:16 issues [8] - 13:21, 18:13, 18:18, 44:16, 61:4, 62:25, 101:21, 142:15 item [1] - 52:1 itself [2] - 123:3, 140:26 J January [9] - 68:19, 68:21, 69:2, 102:19, 102:25, 115:24, 116:7, 153:17, 154:28 Jim [1] - 160:11 job [2] - 48:13, 49:28 jobs [7] - 46:10, 48:10, 48:16, 49:11, 50:3, 50:5, 73:8 JOHN [1] - 2:11 joint [1] - 9:16 **JOSEPH** [1] - 3:3 journal [4] - 41:20, 52:28, 111:29, 112:9 JUDGE [2] - 1:12, 2:3 judge [1] - 118:28 Judge [1] - 151:12 judgment [1] - 12:10 July [3] - 50:22, 115:13, 116:5 June [2] - 6:13, 7:13 junior [1] - 82:9 Justice [1] - 12:10 JUSTICE [3] - 1:8, 1:12, 2:2 justification [2] -61:15, 138:21 justifications [1] -97:18 justified [2] - 119:25, 154:3 justifies [2] - 140:26, 142:24 justify [4] - 140:4, 140:10, 140:11, 141:1 justifying [1] - 139:25 Κ

KATHLEEN [1] - 2:7

KAVANAGH[1] - 2:4 Kearns [1] - 12:10 keep [1] - 101:6 Keith [20] - 22:8, 24:19, 27:14, 31:29, 41:11, 41:24, 56:15, 61:8, 64:13, 64:18, 69:12, 73:1, 89:28, 109:6, 128:7, 133:6, 133:8, 150:12, 152:12, 152:15 Kelly [1] - 92:12 Kenny [1] - 5:14 kept [6] - 66:27, 93:20, 99:3, 143:29, 144:4, 144.8 KILFEATHER[1] -2:20 kill [13] - 18:13, 18:18, 25:26, 56:21, 85:25, 107:21, 108:11, 108:16, 108:18, 133:9, 142:29, 143:11, 150:11 killed [3] - 11:18, 59:25, 144:24 kind [4] - 47:21, 120:23, 129:27, 136:29 Kirwin [1] - 12:11 knowledge [1] - 12:28 known [5] - 19:24, 113:16, 113:20, 153:3, 160:12 knows [1] - 73:3 L lack [8] - 67:8, 67:17, 104:11, 127:10, 147:14, 154:23, 154:24 lady [1] - 119:29 landline [1] - 51:19 language [2] - 127:22, 129:20 large [1] - 51:4 last [10] - 55:11, 56:27, 59:15, 69:4, 90:28, 91:2, 112:25, 131:6, 139:23, 153.10latest [2] - 61:14, 67:3 law [10] - 11:28, 12:8, 13:20, 70:15, 70:19, 81:21, 159:24, 159:25, 160:3, 162:25

lawful [4] - 37:7, 68:23, 108:9, 150:13 leader [4] - 5:22, 5:26, 88:20, 124:7 Leader [1] - 148:20 LEADER [11] - 2:7, 4:8, 38:22, 82:8, 82:11, 121:2, 148:10, 161:14, 161:15, 163:2, 163:7 leader's [1] - 139:25 leading [1] - 142:6 leads [1] - 8:10 learned [2] - 42:28, 118:1 learnt [1] - 66:13 least [10] - 30:12, 85:15, 99:2, 99:5, 101:8, 118:3, 125:12, 128:8, 137:7, 142:12 leave [5] - 30:15, 75:22, 89:29, 129:8, 145:4 leaving [2] - 89:27, 129:13 led [4] - 7:29, 73:13, 102:28. 134:3 left [8] - 92:20, 98:16, 103:10, 112:25, 113:2, 116:8, 145:26, 145:28 legal [3] - 66:29, 75:20, 157:24 legislation [2] - 33:17, 69:13 length [2] - 116:26, 161:29 lengthy [1] - 142:27 lest [1] - 6:26 letter [40] - 44:11, 46:19, 46:21, 46:24, 46:25, 46:28, 47:14, 47:21, 58:29, 59:3, 68:7, 68:13, 68:14, 76:16, 76:19, 77:3, 81:8, 81:9, 81:25, 81:27, 96:20, 96:24, 97:26, 102:22, 112:2, 113:3, 113:12, 113:13, 113:14, 113:16, 113:17, 113:21, 113:22, 113:27, 156:2, 156:11, 157:4, 157:8, 158:23 Letterkenny [17] -22:14, 23:24, 24:28, 55:4, 61:11, 72:27, 94:7, 127:27,

128:22, 129:6, 129:25, 130:23, 136:11, 137:12, 138:4, 138:5, 158:24 level [14] - 17:3, 20:25, 30:28, 36:17, 41:5, 72:27, 73:18, 139:26. 140:12. 146:17, 148:24, 150:29, 151:3, 151:4 liaise [2] - 36:21, 117:13 liaison [3] - 35:5, 35:27, 36:21 life [2] - 131:6, 132:11 lighting [1] - 135:27 lights [1] - 140:7 likely [3] - 30:16, 40:16, 74:26 likewise [1] - 13:16 limbs [1] - 133:16 limited [2] - 36:11, 75:29 line [8] - 42:6, 42:9, 43:26, 53:9, 113:18, 114:25, 116:3, 125:2 listed [3] - 47:27, 48:26, 48:29 listening [1] - 56:28 litigation [1] - 59:1 LITTLE [1] - 2:13 live [3] - 33:24, 33:25 living [4] - 19:12, 50:26, 78:24, 130:15 loaded [1] - 17:25 local [5] - 26:7, 31:12, 94:26, 151:3, 151:4 location [8] - 12:17, 19:22, 24:10, 25:29, 32:11, 32:14, 32:15, 32:19 logical [1] - 45:10 Londonderry [1] -50:26 long-term [1] - 92:25 look [15] - 49:24, 62:7, 80:27, 115:2, 124:21, 128:20, 149:17, 157:26, 158:20, 158:23, 159:22, 160:1. 160:10, 160:13, 160:21 looked [2] - 93:4, 111:27 looking [7] - 56:18, 74:26, 107:17, 119:9, 125:18, 135:14, 144:18 loss [2] - 12:3, 12:12

lovers' [2] - 109:9 lower [1] - 12:29 lucky [1] - 100:29

Μ

M.E [1] - 2:24 MADE [2] - 1:3, 1:8 maintaining [2] -31:19, 135:5 MALONE [1] - 1:30 Malone [1] - 1:25 man [4] - 18:1, 75:14, 107:8, 157:20 management [3] -39:28, 94:26, 140:22 manager [3] - 35:6, 35:28, 36:21 mandatory [4] - 88:3, 98:16, 121:20, 123:17 manslaughter [2] -50:23. 55:20 March [1] - 156:28 Marisa [83] - 18:25. 18:26, 19:5, 20:14, 21:10, 21:12, 21:13, 21:20, 21:24, 21:29, 22:8, 24:1, 26:13, 27:10, 29:16, 29:18, 31:12, 31:17, 31:27, 35:14, 45:4, 49:2, 49:18, 52:20, 52:25, 53:26, 55:2, 63:9, 63:12, 63:15, 64:5, 64:20, 65:16, 65:18, 66:6, 67:1, 72:11, 75:5, 75:7, 83:12, 83:17, 85:9, 85:10, 85:29, 86:29, 88:2, 91:28, 93:7, 93:12, 95:25, 96:7, 98:25, 98:28, 102:11, 102:18, 103:13, 103:26, 104:12, 104:28, 105:19, 105:23, 105:29, 106:19, 107:15, 108:22, 109:14, 109:19, 109:20, 110:16, 122:12, 125:26, 126:18, 127:14, 127:16, 129:4, 135:10, 138:3, 139:12, 141:12, 145:25, 151:22, 152:24, 154:16 MARISA[1] - 3:3

MARK [2] - 2:19, 3:4 **MARRINAN**[1] - 2:6 Martin [22] - 50:15, 52:15, 52:25, 52:26, 53:23, 53:26, 54:2, 55:8, 55:14, 55:21, 56:13, 57:23, 59:17, 59:20, 60:6, 61:2, 61:7, 61:19, 61:26, 61:28. 62:27 Mary [5] - 58:21, 68:4, 104:2, 151:18, 151:19 match [1] - 69:5 material [7] - 5:27, 6:26, 126:6, 134:19, 134:27, 148:28, 151:24 materialised [1] -43:14 materials [3] - 6:3, 68:14, 133:3 matter [186] - 5:22, 6:27, 10:3, 10:20, 10:22, 11:25, 13:8, 13:12, 13:17, 13:24, 14:4, 14:7, 14:9, 14:14, 14:15, 15:5, 15:8. 15:10. 15:23. 16:29, 17:3, 17:7, 17:9, 17:14, 17:17, 17:18, 17:19, 17:29, 18:27, 19:6, 20:23, 20:26, 24:13, 25:1, 25:9, 28:8, 28:16, 29:2. 29:9. 29:12. 30:25, 30:29, 35:20, 36:6, 36:22, 37:10, 37:13, 41:14, 43:23, 43:24, 55:25, 57:17, 58:3, 58:12, 59:16, 60:24, 63:22, 64:21, 64:29, 65:4, 65:5, 65:6, 65:13, 66:16, 67:9, 67:19, 67:25, 68:20, 68:29, 69:29, 71:9, 73:5, 73:20, 74:6, 74:14, 74:21, 75:8, 75:10, 75:20, 76:6, 77:8, 79:19, 81:12, 81:14, 83:7, 83:13, 83:14, 85:21, 86:2, 86:4, 86:22, 87:18, 87:23, 90:3, 90:15, 90:17, 90:20, 94:25, 94:29, 95:13, 97:2, 97:5, 97:23, 98:3, 98:4, 98:5, 98:8, 98:12, 98:14, 98:23, 99:21, 99:28,

102:15, 102:21, 102:24, 102:29, 103:1, 103:27, 103:28, 104:1, 104:6, 104:9, 104:13, 104:15, 104:22, 104:23, 104:26, 104:27, 105:7, 105:9, 105:13, 105:17, 110:18, 110:29, 111:21, 111:28, 114:3, 114:7, 114:17, 114:20, 115:29, 116:8, 116:14, 116:24, 116:29, 117:2, 117:3, 117:16, 117:17, 120:5, 121:26, 124:17, 129:7, 130:18, 130:28, 132:7, 138:19, 146:3, 146:26, 147:3, 147:12. 147:14. 147:20, 147:22, 147:23, 147:24, 149:26, 149:29, 150:28, 151:2, 151:3, 151:7, 152:12, 152:16, 152:18, 152:24, 152:26, 152:28, 154:4, 154:12, 154:26, 157:16, 161:17, 161:18, 162:18 MATTERS[1] - 1:5 matters [28] - 5:8, 13:5, 14:22, 16:3, 20:28, 53:11, 56:9, 70:25, 71:2, 80:22, 81:7, 84:15, 87:29, 88:5, 88:10, 97:28, 99:15, 103:10, 113:1, 116:25, 116:26, 131:13, 132:11, 133:27, 141:26, 150:22, 153:5, 158:2 McDermott [39] - 2:15, 3:11, 46:15, 46:16, 47:9, 48:21, 50:15, 52:15, 52:25, 52:26, 53:15, 53:18, 53:22, 53:26, 54:2, 54:15, 54:27, 54:29, 55:5, 55:7, 55:9, 55:14, 55:21, 56:12, 56:13, 57:23, 59:17, 59:20, 60:6, 61:3, 61:4,

61:7, 61:19, 61:26, 61:28, 128:2, 149:8 McDermott's [3] -53:23, 61:19, 62:27 McGinn [57] - 3:7, 5:11, 5:20, 5:23, 5:25, 5:29, 6:4, 6:6, 6:10, 7:22, 9:17, 9:20, 9:29, 16:15, 42:16, 42:29, 43:3, 43:5, 50:12, 56:2, 56:27, 57:16, 57:22, 58:2, 59:14, 60:20, 60:29, 61:17, 67:11, 73:5, 74:8, 83:27, 85:22, 86:9, 86:12, 86:27, 87:3, 87:5, 87:28, 88:4, 88:9, 88:26, 89:7, 89:17, 90:2, 90:6, 90:15, 91:8, 91:26, 95:11, 97:21, 99:22, 138:9, 156:9, 156:12, 157:8, 157:9 McGinn's [5] - 54:9, 57:3, 87:22, 96:2, 156:2 McGovern [37] - 4:4, 5:7, 5:9, 7:6, 9:3, 16:26, 20:10, 30:22, 38:23, 44:25, 45:3, 47:26, 57:1, 66:21, 66:26, 69:27, 72:14, 89:7, 89:9, 89:26, 92:20. 117:7. 120:28, 124:5, 124:9, 125:6, 125:8, 153:11, 155:7, 156:10, 156:27, 158:3, 158:21, 160:10, 160:12, 160:29, 161:6 McGovern's [2] -56:29, 82:12 McGowan [57] - 2:28, 22:23, 24:25, 35:5, 35:27, 35:29, 36:5, 36:20, 38:5, 41:11, 41:15, 41:22, 41:23, 41:29, 42:2, 42:15, 42:20, 42:21, 43:1, 43:16, 43:21, 44:4, 44:25, 49:23, 98:26, 111:6, 111:10, 111:11, 112:15, 112:21, 113:4, 113:11, 113:26, 113:28, 114:2, 114:6, 115:9, 115:10, 115:19,

115:24, 115:25, 115:28, 116:1, 117:12, 117:17, 120:3, 120:5, 122:4, 122:5, 129:11, 131:25, 132:27, 136:12, 136:17, 137:21 McGowan's [1] -45:16 MCGUINNESS [1] -2:6 McGuinness [10] -2:10, 5:4, 7:25, 8:7, 88:20, 88:24, 89:2, 89:5, 89:21, 89:24 MCKECHNIE [1] -2:16 McLoughlin [11] -5:10, 50:24, 55:20, 57:24, 60:4, 61:20, 61:26, 94:12, 97:27, 156:4, 157:6 McLoughlin's [1] -62:26 McTeague [1] -119:27 me' [1] - 33:26 mean [26] - 46:18, 52:6, 54:1, 54:3, 56:20, 60:6, 62:22, 66:23, 71:7, 77:22, 88:28, 110:22, 114:29, 118:25, 119:16, 120:23, 121:29, 136:21, 137:22, 138:29, 140:5, 142:16, 144:15, 149:15, 157:26, 163:5 meaning [6] - 12:14, 57:6, 73:24, 107:2, 143:12, 144:2 means [2] - 108:10, 150:14 meant [6] - 13:21, 23:15, 30:20, 70:2, 118:14, 119:8 measures [16] - 19:24, 21:5, 24:7, 25:24, 27:6, 27:9, 28:19, 30:5, 32:22, 34:13, 37:7, 37:14, 64:10, 69:14, 98:11, 143:5 meat [2] - 131:12, 135:6 mechanism [1] - 25:8 medical [5] - 13:6, 88:26, 132:6, 136:28, 136:29

Meenderryowen [1] -130:14 meet [2] - 128:19, 128:23 meeting [68] - 18:9, 18:23, 26:20, 32:21, 36:4, 36:7, 36:23, 37:29, 39:3, 39:11, 39:25, 39:28, 40:2, 40:3, 40:13, 40:23, 40:29, 43:14, 45:3, 45:24, 46:6, 49:8, 49:15, 49:29, 50:16, 52:22, 53:2, 53:6, 53:7, 53:14, 53:21, 54:12, 54:23, 56:26, 59:26, 60:7, 60:15, 62:22. 63:10. 73:2. 73:7, 73:9, 73:19, 83:23, 84:10, 86:9, 86:17, 87:10, 87:14, 88:6, 88:8, 89:27, 92:21, 92:22, 93:29, 112:14, 112:17, 112:18, 112:19, 112:22, 113:7, 113:17, 113:28, 115:23, 139:26, 140:12, 146:17, 148:24 member [53] - 10:23, 11:8, 11:16, 12:5, 12:27, 13:14, 17:4, 17:23, 19:26, 20:27, 24:16, 28:18, 29:1, 29:7, 36:15, 37:12, 64:12, 64:17, 67:24, 70:16, 76:3, 76:15, 76:16, 76:22, 76:28, 77:6, 78:19, 78:28, 79:7, 79:8, 79:12, 79:16, 79:17, 79:28, 81.3 81.8 81.11 83:11, 86:14, 92:8, 94:26, 100:5, 103:8, 104:24, 140:17, 150:26, 151:5, 153:16, 155:8, 155:12, 162:11, 162:12 MEMBER [2] - 1:12, 2:2 members [22] - 8:14, 11:1, 17:6, 22:14, 24:12, 37:6, 54:5, 56:8, 63:5, 63:19, 80:16, 82:15, 92:4, 92:5, 99:14, 127:15, 128:23, 129:22, 130:20, 133:12,

137:13, 155:10 memory [1] - 141:7 mental [2] - 118:14, 159:25 mention [1] - 109:2 mentioned [3] - 14:27, 59:12, 59:13 meriting [2] - 138:13, 138:14 messages [2] -106:21, 126:28 met [3] - 20:12, 84:26, 95:27 MICHAEL [1] - 2:29 microphones [2] -38:23, 38:28 mid [1] - 153:17 mid-January [1] -153:17 middle [2] - 67:3, 102:21 midlands [1] - 62:2 might [27] - 5:17, 7:24, 8:13, 25:19, 44:29, 46:26, 54:16, 56:2, 57:28, 61:4, 71:7, 92:11, 92:16, 99:13, 118:5, 119:28, 124:25, 125:11, 128:6, 128:10, 135:3, 135:7, 135:17, 137:16, 145:17, 154:6, 157:2 Milford [7] - 84:29, 96:16, 112:25, 112:29, 115:4, 115:7, 116:17 mind [11] - 53:20, 60:24, 61:12, 75:21, 88:13, 104:11, 121:10, 124:21, 140:28, 150:17, 153:2 minimised [1] - 23:7 MINISTER [1] - 1:8 minor [1] - 108:29 minted [1] - 61:16 minute [1] - 57:12 minutes [3] - 69:6, 73:3, 148:19 mirrored [1] - 122:12 mischief [1] - 78:25 missing [2] - 29:15, 55:16 mistaken [1] - 117:5 mixed [3] - 72:12, 72:13.88:29 mobile [2] - 51:22, 52:5 mobility [2] - 12:4,

12:12 modified [1] - 128:25 moment [3] - 19:10, 38:25, 80:27 Monday [3] - 89:14, 144:24, 148:14 month [1] - 118:12 months [10] - 73:12, 100:3, 100:7, 100:17, 101:7, 101:17, 103:29, 104:4, 151:23 morning [4] - 54:10, 147:29, 148:12, 163.9 most [6] - 60:22, 96:16, 120:23, 139:7, 139:24, 141:9 mother [2] - 66:12, 128:5 mother's [1] - 66:13 motivated [6] - 52:23, 53:7, 125:10, 125:12, 125:16, 125.28 motivation [4] - 128:2, 128:3, 135:25, 135:28 move [3] - 12:21, 106:18, 127:4 moved [1] - 93:18 movement [1] - 101:5 MR [158] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4, 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:9, 2:10, 2:10, 2:11, 2:11, 2:15, 2:19, 2:19, 2:20, 2:23, 2:23, 2:24, 2:28, 2:29, 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:7, 3:8, 3:11, 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 5:4, 7:8, 7:16, 7:21, 7:24, 9:1, 9:4, 9:6, 23:10, 23:12, 23:17, 23:20, 23:22, 23:27, 38:27, 39:1, 41:18, 44:27, 45:2, 45:7, 45:9, 45:15, 45:22, 46:28, 47:4, 47:15, 47:18, 47:22, 47:25, 51:6, 52:13, 53:13, 54:8, 54:14, 54:19, 56:18, 56:25, 57:8, 57:11, 57:14, 57:18, 57:20, 59:2, 59:5, 59:7, 59:11. 61:14. 63:4. 66:9, 66:11, 66:19, 66:22, 66:25, 68:6, 68:9, 68:13, 68:16, 68:18, 69:18, 69:25,

69:27, 71:16, 71:18, 71:22, 71:25, 71:28, 72:3, 72:7, 72:11, 72:18, 73:29, 74:15, 75:28, 77:13, 78:12, 78:15, 78:20, 79:1, 82:7, 82:10, 82:13, 88:18, 88:24, 89:2, 89:5, 89:21, 89:24, 89:26, 91:1, 91:7, 92:20, 100:28, 107:14, 108:29, 109:17, 120:28, 121:26, 122:1, 123:28, 124:3, 124:25, 125:1, 125:7, 125:8, 133:11, 133:18, 141:4, 141:15, 143:9, 144:14, 147:4, 148:1, 148:5, 148:17, 148:24, 150:1, 152:29, 153:4, 153:9, 153:10. 154:19. 157:20, 158:1, 159:18, 159:22, 160:6, 160:9, 161:5, 161:12 MS [15] - 2:7, 2:7, 2:12, 2:16, 3:11, 4:8, 38:22, 82:8, 82:11, 121:2, 148:10, 161:14, 161:15, 163:2, 163:7 MULLAN [1] - 2:7 MULLANEY [1] - 3:4 MULLANEYS [1] - 3:4 murder [3] - 139:7, 139:29, 141:24 MURPHY [1] - 2:10 Murray [20] - 58:22, 67:27, 68:4, 68:8, 72:23, 72:25, 73:16, 74:16, 99:27, 100:2, 102:27, 104:2, 104:8, 105:14, 105:18, 151:18, 151:19, 152:22, 155:21, 155:22 Murray's [1] - 152:27 must [12] - 10:20, 11:8, 13:11, 14:10, 14:13, 42:29, 44:22, 73:19, 73:21, 79:10, 151:7 muster [1] - 125:23 MÍCHEÁL [1] - 2:9

Ν

name [2] - 38:14, 46:22 named [2] - 1:27, 38:3 namely [3] - 10:22, 13:12, 125:10 names [3] - 38:4, 49:4, 49:10 narrative [3] - 133:7, 133:16, 135:5 natural [2] - 54:3, 160:4 nature [8] - 103:7, 103:14, 104:25, 109:16, 110:23, 122:26, 126:2, 159:14 necessarily [2] -53:10, 57:12 necessary [7] - 6:3, 28:25, 37:8, 37:16, 45:28, 53:10, 53:12 necessity [1] - 8:6 need [8] - 7:15, 7:20, 36:25, 59:20, 60:5, 66:12, 107:28, 130:6 needed [6] - 49:8, 60:2, 103:15, 119:24, 124:12, 131:25 needs [3] - 15:20, 124:7, 131:21 negotiation [1] - 129:1 neighbour [1] - 80:11 neighbours [2] -76:29, 78:8 never [41] - 22:20, 22:23, 27:25, 31:6, 31:8, 34:23, 34:28, 35:2, 48:25, 53:24, 54:11, 55:16, 55:28, 60:21, 65:29, 84:24, 84:26. 98:20. 98:22. 99:9, 99:10, 100:29, 104:17, 106:13, 117:4, 118:14, 119:8, 131:9, 133:11, 136:21, 137:11, 137:28, 138:6, 138:10, 138:18. 139:16. 145:1, 146:3, 147:7, 152:15 nevertheless [7] -35:5, 62:28, 65:3, 75:2, 126:12, 132:21, 146:4 new [3] - 59:28, 74:11,

149:8 newspapers [1] -46:20 next [9] - 10:26, 12:22, 28:26, 48:1, 100:25, 102:22, 114:25, 117:27, 128:25 NIALL [1] - 3:11 night [4] - 55:11, 56:28, 59:15, 160:15 nobody [25] - 16:7, 18:15, 27:22, 27:25, 28:1, 30:19, 33:15, 53:13, 53:17, 54:3, 59:13, 59:26, 64:1, 64:2, 64:3, 65:15, 65:17, 65:18, 84:6, 87:4, 98:4, 98:7, 106:24, 109:5, 150:16 nobody's [2] - 59:13, 65:19 NOEL [1] - 2:11 Non [7] - 12:7, 15:15, 15:21, 15:27, 16:1, 106:29, 143:12 non [1] - 106:23 Non-Fatal [7] - 12:7, 15:15, 15:21, 15:27, 16:1, 106:29, 143:12 non-fatal [1] - 106:23 none [3] - 79:11, 127:18, 127:19 normal [5] - 22:22, 22:24, 99:18, 127:5 northern [1] - 6:5 note [15] - 5:12, 5:20, 5:25, 6:7, 40:26, 40:28, 42:23, 84:7, 84:11, 84:12, 94:5, 111:19, 111:20, 114:18 noted [2] - 38:4, 94:18 notes [27] - 1:27, 5:17, 5:24, 18:16, 37:28, 38:9, 38:15, 39:21, 40:5, 40:10, 40:11, 41:8, 43:12, 47:29, 48:1, 49:21, 59:13, 84:10, 94:3, 103:5, 111:9, 111:23, 111:25, 111:26, 111:29 nothing [21] - 29:28, 31:28, 45:17, 48:28, 52:6, 71:14, 73:17, 73:22, 77:9, 104:3, 108:22, 108:25, 111:21, 115:26, 116:1, 116:6,

116:29, 120:24, 155:15 notice [4] - 18:12, 82:28, 89:11, 92:10 notification [4] - 44:8, 68:10, 83:12, 83:15 notifications [1] -158:10 notified [2] - 88:25, 97:2 notify [5] - 81:26, 83:4, 83:5, 83:7, 83:17 notifying [2] - 37:12, 158.8 notion [2] - 46:26, 108:27 nouns [1] - 46:23 November [7] - 66:20, 66:22, 102:24, 114:26, 154:8, 154:12, 154:15 nowadays [1] - 46:20 nowhere [1] - 36:9 number [7] - 5:7, 39:23, 61:21, 90:1, 140:6, 148:22, 162:29 nurse [1] - 132:10 Ο O'Doherty [5] - 65:6, 65:22, 66:6, 105:1, 105:7 O'Donnell [6] - 18:23, 21:4. 21:6. 46:5. 60:16, 61:10 O'HIGGINS [1] - 2:9 O'NEILL [1] - 3:11 obligation [11] - 11:9, 79:3, 79:4, 79:5, 93:7. 93:8. 93:25. 105:21, 121:21, 133:25, 140:22 obligations [1] - 38:18 obliged [7] - 53:5, 74:29, 76:2, 76:3, 81:17, 118:11, 146:27

observed [1] - 62:1

obtaining [1] - 37:9

obvious [2] - 104:19,

obviously [12] - 5:21,

6:27, 6:29, 7:1, 49:2,

5:26, 6:14, 6:25,

obstructions [1] -

64.8

134:15

142:14, 145:4, 147:16 occasions [1] - 163:6 occur [2] - 26:1, 160:2 occurred [13] - 13:4, 15:3, 15:17, 15:19, 36:3, 60:1, 60:3, 101:26, 136:4, 142:13, 143:2, 153:26, 155:20 occurs [2] - 11:10, 11:12 October [91] - 12:12, 22:20, 24:29, 26:20, 26:22, 30:26, 32:21, 36:7, 37:19, 41:18, 41:21, 42:3, 43:15, 44:7, 45:2, 45:5, 45:25, 50:16, 56:26, 63:10, 63:13, 64:3, 64:14, 64:22, 66:5, 66:18, 67:3, 67:4, 72:28, 83:23, 86:17, 89:27, 91:1, 91:9, 91:18, 91:28, 92:21, 92:27, 93:1, 94:2, 94:6, 94:17, 95:9, 96:5, 97:25, 97:28, 98:25, 102:3, 102:21, 103:13, 106:6, 106:27, 111:5, 111:6, 111:17, 111:24, 112:1, 112:3, 112:5, 112:11, 112:12, 112:26, 112:28, 113:4, 113:16, 113:25, 114:15, 115:2, 115:3, 115.23 116.9 117:9, 117:12, 117:21, 119:10, 121:4, 127:27, 128:22, 129:23, 129:24, 130:24, 136:11, 138:4, 138:5, 139:13, 139:18, 139:19, 142:16, 142:27, 148:25 OCTOBER [3] - 1:18, 5:2, 163:12 OF [4] - 1:3, 1:9, 1:12, 2:3 offence [6] - 15:2, 31:24, 107:21,

89:18, 118:1,

146:19, 159:8

51:29, 130:12,

occasion [6] - 29:6,

108:13, 108:20, 108:28 offences [7] - 12:7, 96:17, 106:23, 140:13, 141:9. 142:22, 159:10 Offences [6] - 15:15, 15:21, 15:27, 16:2, 106:29, 143:13 offender [1] - 28:27 office [10] - 5:17, 6:5, 15:24, 76:16, 94:29, 95:18, 112:12, 151:1, 151:8, 151:29 **OFFICE** [1] - 2:12 officer [26] - 26:11, 30:23, 41:16, 81:1, 82:18, 82:21, 84:28, 95:5, 96:16, 96:27, 100:22, 100:24, 115:7, 116:17, 120:4, 122:8, 134:28, 138:22, 138:26, 142:3, 142:7, 147:9, 153:15, 153:24, 153:25, 159:6 officers [4] - 30:14, 134:22, 136:13, 151:14 offices [1] - 152:2 official [3] - 69:20, 81:6, 148:15 officially [1] - 69:18 often [2] - 133:29, 134:1 oftener [1] - 120:14 okayed [1] - 160:24 old [1] - 108:15 Ombudsman [63] -10:21, 11:27, 13:9, 13:19, 13:26, 13:28, 14:1, 14:3, 14:5, 14:15, 16:29, 17:5, 20:23, 28:17, 29:9, 30:26, 31:7, 31:10, 31:15, 31:16, 31:23, 31:26. 56:10. 64:22. 65:7, 65:10, 65:22, 65:25, 67:6, 67:16, 74:6, 74:29, 76:4, 76:7, 76:20, 77:2, 77:7, 77:15, 77:18, 77:20, 78:17, 79:20, 80:6.80:14.80:17. 80:23.81:7.81:12. 81:28, 82:24, 83:3, 83:8, 95:2, 99:20, 102:7, 102:12, 102:19, 104:5,

104:18, 104:22, 104:27, 147:13, 162:14 omissions [1] - 11:7 **ON** [4] - 1:6, 1:10, 1:18, 5:1 once [11] - 14:13, 35:23, 77:24, 82:9, 105:19, 116:8, 119:15, 123:21, 146:26, 147:4, 151:16 one [48] - 8:28, 12:17, 13:5, 13:22, 21:28, 26:18, 27:9, 32:18, 34:25, 35:8, 42:7, 43:29, 44:21, 46:15, 50:8, 54:5, 56:4, 57:21, 59:12, 60:18, 60:19, 62:16, 62:28, 75:20, 99:14, 102:28, 108:29, 117:19, 118:26, 121:27, 122:18, 123:11, 124:14, 131:28, 135:16, 139:23, 140:14, 142:17, 145:8, 148:27, 149:9, 149:14, 150:23, 155:12, 161:20, 161:28 ones [2] - 108:29, 156:15 ongoing [6] - 32:13, 32:20, 32:22, 46:2, 63:20, 149:19 open [2] - 71:3, 157:8 opened [5] - 156:1, 156:4, 156:6, 156:15, 157:7 operate [1] - 118:2 opinion [5] - 87:24, 137:18, 137:19, 157:21, 157:28 opinions [1] - 157:25 opportunity [6] - 8:13, 29:18, 55:16, 104:29, 116:15, 140:25 opposed [6] - 39:23, 53:8, 125:11, 127:1, 127:3, 129:20 options [2] - 146:23, 156:14 order [12] - 8:8. 17:15. 21:21, 33:19, 33:21, 33:23, 34:2, 107:21, 120:21, 146:2, 161:24, 162:3

16

orders [5] - 33:18, 109:28, 110:1, 110:10, 146:3 ordinarily [3] - 25:21, 25:25, 42:8 ordinary [1] - 25:22 organ [1] - 12:5 organisation [3] -52:21, 65:14, 67:10 original [3] - 44:6, 100:4 originally [1] - 51:10 OSMOND [1] - 2:13 ostensible [2] -125:13, 125:21 ostensibly [2] - 41:2, 77.28 OTHER [1] - 1:4 otherwise [9] - 52:24, 60:21, 81:5, 100:14, 106:21, 125:13, 134:25, 144:29, 157:22 ought [2] - 74:2, 124:11 ourselves [3] - 30:2, 105:10, 120:11 outcome [8] - 12:19, 13:6, 50:13, 51:13, 75:4, 75:12, 99:29, 147:1 outlined [3] - 8:7, 94:20, 140:14 outset [2] - 126:15, 137:10 outside [14] - 17:25, 18:29, 31:27, 43:27, 57:17, 58:4, 58:8, 58:25, 62:9, 67:13, 99:24. 100:12. 100:13, 102:23 outstanding [1] -113:1 own [17] - 22:12, 24:8, 25:13, 25:24, 39:1, 45:16. 54:28. 55:1. 55:4, 79:6, 120:15, 129:8, 129:12, 131:8, 138:3, 145:14 Ρ

PADRAIG[1] - 2:23 page [40] - 10:11, 10:27, 41:9, 47:29, 56:18, 89:22, 94:14, 95:10, 95:22, 96:2, 96:25, 97:27, 112:10, 113:18,

114:4, 133:3, 133:4, 143:20, 156:1, 156:6, 156:11, 156:16, 157:7, 158:5, 158:21, 158:22, 158:23, 159:22, 160:9, 160:10, 160:13, 160:20, 160:21, 160:22, 160:25, 160:29, 161:5, 161:6, 162:29 PAGE[1] - 4:2 pages [4] - 44:23, 132:2, 132:5, 156:11 paid [1] - 6:28 pain [1] - 88:23 paint [1] - 134:1 panic [1] - 31:20 papers [2] - 6:16, 6:17 paperwork [1] -152:23 paragraph [7] - 10:16, 12:22, 96:28, 141:27, 156:5, 156:7, 162:8 paragraphs [1] -158:25 Park [1] - 156:21 PARLIAMENT[1] -2:25 part [19] - 9:15, 10:14, 16:16, 40:7, 43:19, 46:2, 49:26, 60:14, 117:28, 124:6, 127:10, 128:12, 131:9, 132:27, 133:7, 133:8, 133:15, 144:28, 155:26 particular [132] - 12:5, 15:7, 15:11, 16:11, 18:7, 18:19, 18:23, 19:13, 20:9, 21:7, 22:3, 22:16, 24:6, 24:12, 24:26, 26:3, 26:17, 27:8, 27:11, 28:15, 29:8, 32:10, 32:14, 32:15, 32:19, 34:5, 36:8, 36:12, 36:13, 36:20, 38:15, 39:12, 39:26, 39:28, 40:13, 40:23, 40:24, 40:29, 46:6, 46:11, 47:19.49:15.49:27. 49:29, 50:13, 51:8, 51:13, 52:1, 52:22, 53:1, 54:23, 54:24, 60:1.60:7.60:15.

60:18, 64:7, 64:11,

67:11, 67:22, 70:10, 70:14, 70:20, 77:6, 79:19, 81:27, 82:3, 82:20, 83:28, 85:2, 86:29, 88:5, 88:8, 99:25, 99:29, 101:13, 101:21, 101:24, 102:6, 102:9, 102:13, 103:17, 104:12, 105:24, 106:18, 110:1, 110:3, 116:14, 116:16, 117:24, 118:19, 118:20, 122:26, 125:28, 126:14, 128:17, 129:5, 130:15, 130:21, 132:28, 134:27, 136:25, 137:10, 137:23, 137:25, 137:29, 139:3, 140:18, 140:23, 140:29, 141:10, 142:17. 143:6. 143:21, 145:4, 145:8, 145:10, 145:28, 146:9, 146:10, 149:20, 149:26, 152:21, 153:23, 153:26, 155:8, 158:17, 158.19 160.7 161:23, 161:25, 162:17 particularly [2] -130:8, 140:10 parties [9] - 8:3, 8:11, 28:8, 49:9, 128:16, 134:1, 148:29, 155:28. 158:19 partner [2] - 33:8, 142:12 parts [1] - 139:22 party [7] - 81:26, 83:16, 108:2, 118:21, 118:27, 134:6, 147:15 pass [2] - 118:10, 125:22 PASSED [1] - 1:5 passing [4] - 25:29, 32:13. 40:17. 44:11 past [5] - 132:23, 137:24, 141:23, 142:5, 163:6 pathways [3] - 146:18, 146:21, 151:18 PATRICK [1] - 2:6 patrols [2] - 32:13,

32:14 PAUL [2] - 2:15, 2:19 Paula [11] - 38:4, 38:6, 40:1, 46:14, 46:16, 47:9.48:4.48:21. 53:15, 53:18, 54:29 Paula's [1] - 128:3 pay [2] - 23:5, 25:29 peace [1] - 135:29 peg [1] - 144:6 pejorative [1] - 69:5 People [1] - 12:11 people [30] - 30:15, 33:10, 37:29, 38:3, 44:1, 47:5, 47:9, 47:26, 48:19, 48:20, 48:26, 48:29, 51:25, 54:16, 54:20, 70:18, 73:7, 78:2, 78:23, 78:24, 120:22, 120:25, 124:22, 126:15, 128:17, 131:20, 147:27, 151:12, 153:27, 160:4 people's [2] - 157:21, 160:2 per [1] - 114:25 perceive [1] - 83:10 percent [2] - 35:8, 106:27 perfect [1] - 48:2 perfectly [3] - 54:2, 62:1.69:28 perhaps [30] - 18:15, 20:16, 30:13, 38:28, 45:12, 45:13, 45:22, 50:25, 53:9, 57:5, 57:11, 57:28, 61:27, 77:13, 90:28, 109:3, 119:27, 130:2, 131:6, 132:6, 139:28, 139:29, 140:7. 142:5. 145:12, 145:14, 147:18, 147:26, 147:28, 160:10 period [4] - 6:2, 89:29, 150:14, 153:16 periods [1] - 101:18 permission [6] -44:26, 45:7, 45:8, 45:9, 51:18, 120:11 permitted [1] - 100:6 perpetrated [2] -35:11, 143:1 person [59] - 9:18, 10:24, 11:13, 11:18, 12:16. 17:13. 18:3. 25:11, 25:18, 25:25,

25:26, 25:28, 26:3, 36:1, 38:15, 41:16, 42:14, 42:29, 44:14, 44:17, 44:19, 50:17, 58:16, 70:24, 70:26, 73:13, 75:16, 77:3, 77:19, 77:25, 77:28, 78:28, 80:14, 82:2, 83:2, 83:4, 83:22, 106:23, 107:8, 107:22, 107:23, 107:25, 107:29, 108:2, 108:4, 108:9, 108:10, 108:12, 108:20, 108:21, 119:6, 131:18, 134:7, 134:8, 139:1, 140:16, 159:26 Person [7] - 12:7, 15:16, 15:22, 15:28, 16:2, 106:29, 143:13 personal [10] - 24:8, 25:24, 88:26, 131:6, 132:11, 135:7, 135:9, 135:15, 136:18 personnel [2] - 103:8, 127:28 persons [1] - 55:21 perspective [2] -131:14, 139:6 PETER [4] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4, 2:19 Phoenix [1] - 156:21 phone [15] - 5:16, 27:10, 39:7, 39:9, 39:16, 39:19, 41:21, 41:22, 42:18, 42:24, 42:25, 48:4, 51:10, 51:16, 52:6 phones [1] - 51:22 phrase [2] - 45:20, 149:10 phraseology [3] -127:22, 128:25, 140:27 phrases [3] - 128:9, 140:1, 145:15 phrasing [3] - 138:13, 140:11, 145:14 physical [4] - 15:3, 15:16, 34:25, 145:15 physically [1] - 98:23 pick [3] - 56:16, 141:6, 153:10 picked [2] - 88:19, 89:19 picture [1] - 134:2 piece [4] - 117:24, 137:29, 141:18,

17

143:10 pieces [1] - 140:2 PLACE [1] - 2:30 place [48] - 9:25, 18:19, 18:21, 19:5, 19:24, 21:3, 21:5, 21:8, 21:23, 21:27, 21:29, 22:7, 24:5, 25:24, 26:2, 27:6, 28:14, 28:20, 28:21, 30:5, 32:22, 34:13, 36:19, 43:14, 55:29, 64:8, 64:9, 64:10, 66:29, 69:14, 84:8, 96:17, 97:24, 98:11, 99:9, 112:14, 112:17, 112:19, 112:20, 112:22, 112:24, 113:8, 113:29, 120:21, 131:23, 134:3, 143:5, 152:5 placed [1] - 83:21 plan [15] - 18:26, 19:7, 19:8, 21:8, 21:10, 21:13. 21:17. 21:23. 21:27, 21:28, 28:14, 99:12, 99:18, 153:14, 155:27 planned [3] - 99:7, 99:10.99:15 plans [4] - 18:21, 18:24, 19:5, 22:7 play [1] - 38:7 playing [1] - 129:19 please" [1] - 151:16 pledge [1] - 6:29 plural [1] - 35:12 point [43] - 10:12, 23:3, 29:27, 31:18, 40:14, 47:1, 58:27, 61:13, 61:14, 62:21, 62:22, 63:4, 67:11, 67:22, 71:6, 71:14, 71:17, 71:18, 91:17, 97:16, 100:13, 105:18, 106:18, 124:14, 129:8, 135:15, 140:2, 140:8, 140:25, 141:17, 143:10, 144:10, 149:14, 149:26, 152:15, 152:22, 152:24, 153:11. 158:1. 160:7, 160:23, 162:20 pointed [2] - 107:8, 107:10 pointing [2] - 47:8,

141:25 policing [2] - 99:18, 139:6 policy [2] - 81:14, 123.8 portion [1] - 133:14 portions [2] - 140:9, 140:29 Portlaoise [4] - 51:6, 51:8, 62:2, 62:6 posited [1] - 125:10 position [36] - 5:4, 5:5, 7:5, 11:26, 15:5, 19:25, 23:22, 24:15, 31:9, 31:10, 31:17, 31:28, 36:16, 37:22, 63:2, 63:28, 86:14, 88:24, 110:4, 114:13, 115:14, 118:16, 119:4, 119:12, 120:11, 120:20, 127:2, 134:21, 134:28, 137:15, 141:1, 151:23, 151:24, 157:20, 157:24, 159:23 possession [2] - 6:2, 120:7 possibility [2] - 62:26, 62:27 possible [6] - 23:8, 55:22, 111:7, 132:1, 132:13, 146:28 possibly [6] - 25:10, 26:1, 62:18, 118:17, 138:16, 141:20 postpone [1] - 37:12 potential [4] - 25:18, 61:17, 138:18, 143:17 potentially [4] - 25:19, 34:29, 61:23, 92:24 **POWER** [4] - 3:7, 7:8, 7:16, 7:21 power [6] - 6:9, 7:15, 31:3, 31:24, 31:29, 73:26 powers [2] - 31:25, 32:3 practice [6] - 15:13, 77:27, 78:1, 110:17, 155:12, 155:17 precaution [1] - 5:22 precisely [3] - 28:28, 37:2, 102:28 prejudiced [1] - 61:23 preliminary [1] - 60:15 premises [1] - 78:9 preparation [1] -

131:22 prepare [1] - 122:5 prepared [5] - 39:23, 90:7, 90:15, 90:20, 151.20preparing [1] - 131:21 prerogative [2] -132:24, 134:25 prescribed [1] - 14:2 presence [2] - 32:28, 143:3 present [7] - 18:23, 46:5, 127:27, 130:23, 132:8, 132:15, 132:18 presentation [2] -132:12, 151:27 presented [28] -16:13, 16:18, 16:20, 39:22, 86:29, 91:27, 92:27, 101:19, 101:23, 101:26, 102:16, 104:10, 109:14, 109:27, 117:22, 126:17, 134:14, 136:13, 136:24, 138:25, 139:1, 139:3, 139:18, 146:8, 149:20, 149:21 presenting [2] -127:16, 138:8 presents [1] - 146:8 preserve [6] - 26:29, 27:7, 38:18, 39:3, 40:22, 146:28 preserving [3] - 26:23, 37:9, 37:20 press [1] - 148:17 presumably [3] - 52:5, 52:6, 138:12 presume [3] - 68:15, 89:20, 100:23 prevent [14] - 18:6, 27:17, 33:7, 34:8, 34:9, 101:20, 103:29, 110:4, 110:5, 110:7, 120:24, 145:25, 145:29, 146:4 prevented [1] - 103:27 preventing [1] - 64:8 prevention [45] -16:27, 16:28, 18:21, 19:22, 19:24, 19:28, 19:29, 20:8, 21:8, 21:10, 21:13, 21:15, 21:16, 22:7, 22:10, 22:16, 24:4, 24:7, 24:9, 24:21, 25:15,

26:10, 26:11, 27:19, 29:29, 30:5, 30:7, 30:10, 31:5, 31:8, 32:3, 32:22, 109:18, 109:19, 109:25, 110:7, 110:28, 145:21, 158:12, 158:13, 158:14, 158:26, 159:2, 159:5 previous [9] - 21:5, 44:14, 55:7, 55:13, 68:29, 71:9, 94:16, 142:13, 155:5 previously [5] - 18:22, 44:24, 61:21, 68:29, 72:15 primary [2] - 128:1, 128:3 prism [1] - 125:19 Prison [2] - 51:6, 62:6 prison [5] - 51:8, 51:12, 51:17, 51:23, 52.3 prisoners [1] - 56:21 probable [1] - 160:4 problem [3] - 63:5, 63:9, 89:4 problems [4] - 53:14, 85:14, 118:14, 134:3 procedures [1] -119:10 proceed [7] - 5:5, 7:5, 17:9, 89:6, 89:15, 102.20 157.13 proceedings [7] -20:16, 20:17, 149:29, 150:27, 151:7, 152:5, 154:3 process [14] - 8:15, 9:12, 40:8, 43:20, 51:2, 67:29, 87:26, 90:9, 103:4, 129:9, 135:18. 154:14. 154:21, 162:23 processes [1] - 8:8 profile [1] - 147:2 progress [1] - 98:8 progressing [1] - 18:7 prohibit [1] - 119:23 promoted [1] - 141:15 prompting [1] - 126:5 promptly [1] - 103:21 proper [6] - 121:23, 122:23, 125:21, 125:22, 126:18, 152:10 propose [3] - 58:15, 105:5, 160:20 proposed [9] - 20:25, 27:2, 28:20, 28:21,

29:11, 30:28, 41:6, 89:13, 90:3 proposing [1] - 156:9 proposition [1] -127.4 propriety [1] - 121:26 prosecute [2] -150:10, 151:10 prosecution [4] -28:11.118:17. 151:19, 152:2 Prosecutions [15] -15:6, 16:5, 28:10, 86:3, 87:19, 149:4, 149:13, 149:27, 151:1, 151:9, 151:12, 151:25, 151:28, 152:3, 154:1 prosecutions [2] -86:3. 118:21 protect [7] - 17:15, 17:19, 21:29, 32:7, 34:14, 34:16, 135:8 PROTECTED [2] - 1:3, 1:4 protected [2] - 69:12, 69:20 protecting [3] - 20:14, 21:24, 22:7 protection [12] -18:24, 18:26, 19:5, 19:7, 19:8, 19:15, 22:12, 22:21, 22:23, 34:13, 122:21, 123:4 prove [1] - 159:24 proved [1] - 52:6 provide [9] - 26:9, 26:10, 33:14, 80:4, 120:6, 132:22, 134:9, 145:9, 146:15 provided [23] - 7:12, 16:13, 19:21, 22:9, 25:15, 34:11, 34:12, 35:8, 65:5, 81:24, 95:26, 97:9, 104:29, 109:2, 109:25, 110:3, 117:12, 132:26, 134:7, 135:10, 135:11, 156:28 provides [1] - 11:6 providing [1] - 100:14 provision [4] - 11:16, 13:23, 70:14, 70:17 provisional [1] - 13:23 provisions [8] - 11:3, 11:25, 14:2, 14:6, 14:12, 82:19, 82:29, 95:2 psychological [3] -

97:12, 138:17, 145:20 pub [1] - 46:22 public [10] - 76:15, 76:28, 79:8, 79:16, 81:3, 81:9, 131:11, 135:16, 135:27, 162:11 Public [15] - 15:6, 16:4, 28:10, 86:2, 87:19, 149:4, 149:13, 149:27, 151:1, 151:8, 151:11, 151:25, 151:28, 152:3, 154:1 publically [1] - 125:23 publicity [2] - 135:14, 135:24 pulling [1] - 13:28 Pulse [1] - 44:12 purpose [12] - 7:7, 12:9, 31:3, 37:9, 38:26, 40:15, 45:15, 52:22. 104:28. 124:19, 137:12, 138:8 purposes [11] - 6:14, 12:6. 12:24. 30:27. 56:5, 106:7, 110:2, 124:16, 135:5, 136:22, 158:4 pursuant [2] - 95:2, 97.2 pursue [4] - 99:21, 106:2, 147:23, 147:24 pursuing [2] - 118:20, 152:10 push [1] - 158:1 put [63] - 7:27, 21:5, 21:23, 21:27, 21:28, 22:6, 24:5, 25:23, 26:2, 26:4, 27:6, 28:14, 28:20, 28:21, 30:5, 30:18, 34:13, 41:1, 59:11, 64:10, 66:28, 66:29, 87:21, 89:26, 92:10, 93:6, 97:22, 98:6, 98:11, 98:28, 99:15, 101:14. 101:29. 108:26, 113:12, 114:23, 114:29, 117:7, 121:3, 127:26, 129:2. 130:16, 133:11, 133:19, 134:20, 135:24, 136:20, 137:24, 137:27, 143:4, 143:29,

```
144:12, 144:22,
 145:7, 145:21,
 150:5, 151:20,
 152:8, 152:12,
 154:6, 156:26,
 157:2, 158:16
putting [8] - 100:7,
 114:17, 130:1,
 138:14, 141:4,
 150:10, 153:13,
 159:9
pyjamas [1] - 144:12
          Q
```

quadrangle [1] -

12:19, 12:29, 40:25,

122:20, 135:18,

159:15

156:13

94:4

rats [1] - 78:9

4:8, 161:14

150:13

148:22 qualified [1] - 162:21 qualify [3] - 111:1, 111:2, 123:9 quality [1] - 13:7 quartets [1] - 157:28 QUAY [1] - 2:21 queried [1] - 74:24 questioning [1] -133:1 questions [18] - 20:21, 38:16, 53:4, 57:7, 115:22, 120:29, 121:27, 124:29, 125:1, 125:9, 132:20, 134:20, 148:4, 148:5, 148:8, 148:10, 148:18, 153:5 quickly [1] - 73:19 Quinn [1] - 160:11 QUINN [1] - 2:20 quite [9] - 54:18, 84:14, 102:25, 120:10, 127:2, 131:20, 134:5, 154:10, 156:18 R rage [1] - 161:8 raised [5] - 38:25, 54:11, 62:21, 97:28, 139:4 rang [4] - 66:14,

77:23, 141:16

rather [7] - 11:17,

rant [1] - 144:9

89:8, 103:24 reaches [1] - 14:18 reaction [1] - 14:3 read [27] - 29:15, 29:16, 46:20, 57:11, 57:13, 79:25, 94:3, 94:19, 107:6, 108:7, 113:3, 114:13, 128:24, 134:10, 134:15, 134:22, 134:23, 136:15, 141:27, 143:20, 151:13, 160:16, 160:22, 160:26, 161:4, 161:10 reading [7] - 27:15, 53:28, 54:8, 109:11, 109:13, 134:28, 142:2 real [2] - 19:19, 33:6 realise [2] - 29:20, 159:24 reality [3] - 8:21, 145:22, 149:19 really [11] - 36:26, 44:3, 52:17, 119:2, 120:2, 131:13, 141:19. 144:25. 145:12, 145:18, 161:7 realm [1] - 79:26 reason [24] - 17:7, 18:22, 20:21, 30:18, 36:12, 36:13, 46:5, 47:4, 62:20, 66:26, 77:26, 96:25, 98:8, 99:3. 115:21. 66:21, 72:1, 72:5 123:15, 124:19, rank [2] - 11:2, 43:27 125:13, 125:21, ranks [3] - 17:27, 125:29. 134:23. 140:18, 149:12, 150:16 ranting [1] - 144:5 reasonable [3] rapport [1] - 120:2 127:4, 142:22,

reasonably [1] - 14:18 reasonings [2] rationale [5] - 9:12, 97:23.98:9 9:14, 10:6, 10:7, reasons [3] - 62:29, 96:23, 126:4 rationales [1] - 97:9 recalled [2] - 135:13, 135:23 RE [2] - 4:8, 161:14 receipt [13] - 80:3, re [3] - 41:11, 41:12, 80:5, 80:12, 80:28, 81:18, 81:22, 81:23, RE-EXAMINED [2] -82:18, 82:25, 83:1, 83:6, 97:3, 100:4 reach [2] - 6:12, 89:12 receipts [1] - 82:16 reached [6] - 6:8, receive [5] - 6:13, 9:21. 10:5. 41:5. 13:26, 81:2, 112:4, 116:20 received [33] - 10:10, 25:11, 35:19, 41:7, 41:21, 42:18, 42:24, 49:20, 50:7, 52:27, 54:9, 56:25, 58:14, 81:8, 81:26, 82:7, 82:9, 83:5, 94:8, 94:10, 94:28, 102:8, 112:3, 115:5, 116:10, 116:11, 116:12, 116:18, 116:22, 143:19, 152:22, 155:18, 161:24 receives [3] - 79:29, 108:3, 108:5 receiving [1] - 32:13 recited [1] - 10:15 recites [2] - 10:16, 10:26 recollection [5] - 5:15, 53:16, 53:19, 55:28, 115:27 recommendation [1] -150:9 recommendations [2] - 94:18, 156:8 record [3] - 80:2, 80:8, 132:2 recorded [6] - 81:5, 95:27, 131:28, 133:6, 136:14, 136:25 recovery [1] - 13:7 REDDY [1] - 2:29 refer [34] - 10:20, 11:10, 11:11, 12:26, 13:8, 13:11, 13:15, 13:17, 13:18, 13:22, 14:14, 14:19, 15:8, 29:9, 35:12, 49:21, 76:3, 76:11, 76:12, 76:14, 78:26, 79:19,

80:16, 80:18, 90:3, 95:13, 133:2, 146:26, 149:12, 151:11, 161:17, 161:18 reference [19] - 39:6, 47:16, 47:17, 56:29, 73:2, 73:4, 73:6, 94:16, 128:26, 140:25, 146:20, 147:7, 149:4, 150:2, 150:16, 150:17, 151:17, 151:20, 151:21 referenced [2] - 10:9, 38:14 referral [91] - 9:8, 9:9, 9:23, 9:24, 9:28, 10:1, 10:3, 10:6, 10:8, 11:20, 13:2, 13:24, 14:2, 14:4, 16:11, 16:29, 18:27, 19:6, 20:15, 20:18, 27:2, 35:19, 35:23, 35:28, 36:9, 36:11, 36:15, 36:28, 41:7, 41:19, 50:5, 56:5, 58:21, 61:15, 62:17, 62:20, 63:1, 64:26, 64:29, 67:8, 67:26, 73:21, 74:24, 75:10, 80:26, 83:19, 84:13, 94:9.95:1.95:19. 95:24, 96:15, 97:6, 97:10, 97:14, 97:19, 97:22, 97:29, 98:12, 102:7, 116:15, 119:15, 119:18, 119:24, 120:3, 121:3, 121:5, 121:7, 121:12, 121:22, 121:24, 122:3, 122:11, 122:17, 122:20, 122:21, 123:10, 123:17, 123:18, 123:21, 123:28, 123:29, 124:5, 152:11, 154:20, 155:6, 162:19, 162:22 referrals [11] - 13:27, 36:2, 79:24, 80:22, 94:1, 114:19, 115:15, 121:20, 122:6, 122:7, 122:26 referred [48] - 13:24, 15:10, 15:23, 16:4, 17:3, 17:8, 17:29, 20:23, 28:9, 28:16, 30:25, 34:17, 36:19,

19

38:8, 55:25, 64:21, 65:2, 65:13, 67:10, 74:6, 76:20, 81:27, 82:11.83:7.86:2. 88:11, 90:21, 97:24, 104:23, 104:26, 105:9, 123:26, 124:2, 128:29, 135:27, 149:26, 151:25, 152:1, 152:2, 154:27, 158:14, 158:18, 161:20, 161:21, 161:23, 161:29, 162:22 referring [11] - 17:16, 17:18. 17:19. 23:14. 47:13, 56:5, 81:7, 81:12, 97:23, 158:26, 159:1 refers [3] - 39:15, 107:16 reflect [1] - 81:10 reflects [6] - 12:6, 49:25, 50:3, 50:8, 52:29, 78:27 refuse [1] - 118:27 regard [9] - 7:1, 7:22, 14:6, 40:9, 70:19, 95:5, 135:6, 138:22, 162:1 regarding [2] - 96:6, 111:17 regardless [1] -161:17 regional [3] - 5:17, 58:6.67:20 REGISTRAR[1] - 2:4 regret [1] - 7:27 regretted [1] - 8:4 regular [1] - 108:16 regulations [7] -68:24, 70:1, 70:24, 121:21, 122:25, 122:29, 123:10 reiterate [1] - 87:25 rejected [1] - 64:24 relate [3] - 6:23, 15:6, 48:18 related [15] - 9:24, 11:15, 25:16, 46:7, 46:11, 52:26, 56:9, 56:13, 114:15, 121:18, 139:9, 141:22, 142:15, 145:1, 161:28 relates [1] - 143:22 relating [1] - 37:10 relation [366] - 7:28, 9:15, 9:26, 10:2,

10:7, 14:23, 15:9, 15:20, 16:11, 16:21, 16:24, 17:1, 17:9, 17:20. 18:18. 18:26. 19:9, 19:29, 20:9, 20:13, 20:24, 20:26, 20:29, 21:2, 21:3, 21:8, 21:18, 22:10, 22:12, 23:13, 24:3, 24:5, 24:13, 24:20, 24:26, 25:1, 25:3, 25:29, 26:2, 26:15, 26:22, 27:1, 27:2, 27:7, 27:13, 27:19, 28:10, 28:14, 28:19, 28:21, 28:24, 29:3, 29:10, 29:12, 30:7, 30:27, 30:29, 31:2, 31:8, 32:16, 32:17, 32:23, 32:24, 33:17, 34:12, 34:18, 35:10, 35:19, 35:25, 35:26, 36:2, 36:4, 36:6, 36:8, 36:17, 36:18, 36:22, 36:24, 36:28, 37:23, 37:24, 38:13, 39:10, 39:26, 40:4, 40:5, 40:11, 40:23, 41:5, 41:7, 41:23, 42:17, 42:24, 43:18, 43:23, 45:16, 46:1, 46:4. 46:8. 47:20. 47:27, 48:7, 48:11, 48:13, 48:18, 49:9, 49:17, 49:19, 49:22, 49:28, 50:4, 50:6, 50:13, 50:17, 50:18, 50:20, 51:9, 51:12, 52:1, 52:3, 52:14, 52:19, 52:24, 52:26, 53:1, 53:5, 53:7, 53:11, 59:16, 60:3, 60:9, 60:17, 60:23, 62:12, 62:25, 63:12, 63:17, 63:20, 63:22, 64:8, 64:28, 65:4, 65:6, 65:10, 65:13, 67:7, 67:9, 67:18, 67:25, 69:22, 71:8, 72:21, 74:12, 74:14, 74:21, 74:22, 75:1, 75:3, 75:4, 75:8, 75:9, 76:2, 76:6, 76:9, 76:21, 77:5, 77:14, 77:23, 78:11, 79:16, 80:22, 81:11, 81:14, 81:15, 81:25, 82:4, 82:5, 82:16, 82:27, 83:9, 83:10, 83:21, 83:28, 84:3, 84:5, 84:7, 84:8,

84:9, 84:12, 84:19, 84:23, 85:2, 85:7, 85:19, 85:21, 86:3, 86:4. 86:13. 86:22. 87:22, 87:23, 87:24, 87:26, 88:5, 88:12, 90:5, 90:7, 90:10, 90:12, 90:15, 90:16, 90:17, 90:18, 90:19, 90:20, 93:10, 94:8, 94:11, 96:22, 98:3, 98:10, 98:12, 98:14, 98:22, 99:8, 99:28, 100:15, 101:21, 101:25, 102:12, 102:14, 102:16, 103:27, 104:6, 104:9, 104:13, 104:14, 104:22, 105:1, 105:7, 105:8, 105:12, 105:13, 105:16, 105:22, 106:29, 107:20, 108:18, 109:18, 109:27.110:2. 110:9, 110:12, 110:29, 111:21, 111:22, 111:23, 111:27, 111:29, 112:23, 113:11, 113:13, 113:26, 114:3, 114:16, 114.17 114.19 115:1, 115:6, 115:15, 116:6, 116:8, 116:10, 116:14, 116:28, 116:29, 117:5, 117:6, 117:21, 119:18, 120:5, 121:27. 122:6. 122:20, 123:7, 123:16, 123:19, 124:3, 124:17, 124:27, 127:16, 128:7, 129:7, 129:13, 130:17, 130:18, 130:28, 130:29. 131:25. 132:6, 132:23, 133:20, 133:26, 133:29, 134:2, 134:6, 137:18, 137:22, 139:4, 140:15, 142:12, 142:20, 142:28, 143:5, 143:7, 143:9, 145:10.146:1. 146:2, 146:17, 147:3, 147:12, 147:20, 147:22,

147:25, 148:24, 149:14, 149:24, 150:10, 150:18, 150:24, 150:25, 150:27, 150:28, 151:5, 151:6, 151:29, 152:4, 152:6, 152:14, 152:16, 152:18, 152:19, 152:21, 152:24, 152:25, 153:21, 154:2, 154:4, 154:17, 154:26, 156:7, 156:23, 158:2, 158:11, 159:4, 159:7, 159:19, 159:20, 161:1, 161:19, 161:29, 162:7 relations [1] - 46:14 relationship [4] -52:14, 52:20, 149:1, 149:8 releasing [1] - 78:9 relevant [12] - 9:23, 34:11, 36:16, 69:13, 116:4, 120:6, 122:10, 133:27, 141:26, 152:6, 155:28, 159:3 reliable [1] - 126:23 reluctance [3] - 127:9, 129:1, 129:18 relying [1] - 162:26 remain [1] - 92:6 remained [2] - 61:10, 106:7 remark [1] - 39:12 remarks [2] - 6:28, 8:5 remember [3] - 62:7, 62:10. 133:18 reminded [2] - 59:20, 60:2 reminder [1] - 8:5 remit [2] - 96:14, 106:28 renewing [1] - 6:29 repeat [1] - 135:21 repeating [3] - 27:18, 99:22, 144:8 replied [1] - 95:22 replies [1] - 38:23 reply [2] - 117:13, 117:24 report [15] - 88:5, 90:5, 90:6, 90:15, 91:16, 92:29, 93:1, 93:2. 93:3. 93:4. 93:5, 95:7, 95:16,

96:26 reported [1] - 20:1 reports [3] - 20:4, 92:27, 109:26 represent [1] - 137:22 representation [2] -130:28, 137:24 represented [31] -31:6, 31:8, 35:28, 58:5, 63:18, 73:27, 105:26, 106:10, 106:11, 106:13, 106:26, 109:29, 116:9, 121:16, 121:17, 123:16, 129:10, 130:19, 131:27, 134:18, 137:9, 138:7, 138:29, 140:13, 142:8, 142:14, 142:23, 144:21, 145:5, 146:11, 146:12 request [11] - 91:14, 91:22, 91:25, 116:10, 116:11, 116:12, 116:18, 116:20, 116:22, 128:19, 143:23 requested [7] - 45:7, 58:6, 67:12, 74:8, 91:18, 99:23, 117:13 require [6] - 16:2, 28:7, 81:29, 83:15, 87:20, 151:26 required [24] - 12:25, 12:29, 16:4, 17:21, 18:9, 19:26, 20:28, 40:4, 46:10, 48:27, 49:5, 50:9, 51:11, 56:6, 81:21, 82:17, 84:1, 85:11, 87:19, 88:1, 95:18, 100:6, 122:8, 123:17 requirement [4] -88:3, 128:14, 149:21, 161:16 requirements [4] -20:8, 21:1, 81:19, 83:20 requires [4] - 10:19, 13:11, 14:29, 15:22 requisite [1] - 76:18 reside [4] - 33:8, 34:5, 34:9. 110:6 residence [1] - 143:22 resident [1] - 19:10 residing [5] - 19:23, 21:12, 24:11, 26:6, 32:25

20

RESOLUTIONS [1] -1:5 resources [1] - 140:5 Resources [1] - 156:4 respect [35] - 10:13, 15:3, 15:14, 16:6, 16:27, 18:24, 21:10, 21:13, 21:23, 22:7, 24:22, 31:4, 34:2, 34:7, 34:8, 47:7, 47:10, 48:29, 49:1, 50:15, 55:2, 61:7, 61:28, 64:12, 64:19, 70:1, 70:14, 70:23, 72:25, 74:17, 79:3, 79:8, 87:8, 87:11, 94:1 response [8] - 17:27, 19:2. 94:4. 94:8. 96:2, 157:3, 157:5, 157:17 responsibilities [2] -143:7, 148:16 responsibility [15] -9:22, 10:7, 25:23, 35:24, 40:9, 56:10, 65:8, 86:26, 87:23, 87:28.90:14.99:1. 123:23, 140:19, 153:29 responsible [3] -64:16, 85:22, 98:18 restriction [1] - 70:23 rests [1] - 13:8 result [15] - 11:8, 29:8, 39:3, 52:2, 58:6, 65:8, 65:11, 72:20, 73:1, 75:9, 87:9, 127:23, 134:4, 141:24, 147:13 resulted [4] - 10:24, 11:17, 12:27, 13:14 results [1] - 150:2 **RESUMED** [2] - 5:1, 92:18 retraction [1] - 106:1 retrospective [2] -107:17, 159:14 retrospectively[1] -159:20 return [3] - 34:5, 99:18, 110:6 returned [2] - 32:8, 32:25 returning [3] - 33:8, 34:9, 89:28 review [5] - 6:26, 8:8, 116:16, 120:12, 120:13 reviewed [1] - 111:25

rightly [1] - 102:26 rights [1] - 129:13 rise [1] - 98:6 risk [14] - 12:2, 16:16, 16:19, 16:21, 16:23, 17:11, 27:13, 27:27, 34:29, 36:10, 96:12, 132:13, 138:15, 141:19 RITA [1] - 3:11 Rita [5] - 53:15, 53:18, 54:26, 128:2, 149:8 role [2] - 85:19, 115:6 rolling [1] - 133:16 room [4] - 22:19, 48:21, 109:5, 151:13 root [1] - 88:14 Roulston [6] - 37:18, 38:3, 40:1, 47:9, 48:4, 48:21 round [1] - 127:1 routine [1] - 31:11 row [2] - 34:24, 135:19 rule [1] - 160:3 ruling [2] - 71:11, 71:12 run [1] - 155:14 running [2] - 101:19, 158:22 rural [1] - 139:6 S sadly [4] - 59:25, 141:21, 141:23, 146:9 safe [2] - 19:19, 31:18 safer [2] - 32:28, 33:1 safety [11] - 24:8, 25:13, 25:24, 33:19, 33:23, 34:1, 110:10, 120:21, 139:5, 142:19 sally [1] - 91:2 Sally [1] - 91:6 SARAH[1] - 2:16 sat [1] - 59:15 satisfied [5] - 54:11, 106:28, 121:22, 121:23, 126:16 satisfy [1] - 119:24 save [2] - 27:18, 99:21 saw [2] - 31:24, 98:7 SC [11] - 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:9, 2:10, 2:15, 2:19, 2:23, 2:28, 3:3, 3:7 scarring [1] - 12:15 scenarios [1] - 70:10 scene [1] - 37:21

scholar [2] - 159:23, 159:25 SEANAD[1] - 1:6 search [1] - 52:2 searched [1] - 6:16 searches [2] - 5:16, 6:14 second [1] - 9:15 secondly [1] - 101:5 Section [3] - 14:1, 107:20, 143:12 section [107] - 9:28, 10:1, 10:4, 10:19, 10:26, 11:1, 11:4, 11:6, 11:20, 11:28, 12:24, 13:2, 13:26, 14:4, 14:9, 14:12, 15:21, 15:28, 21:1, 26:24, 27:15, 36:29, 37:3, 38:8, 38:9, 38:19, 39:4, 40:15, 45:28, 48:2, 55:26, 56:5, 58:21, 62:17, 62:20, 62:29, 64:26, 64:29, 65:3, 67:26, 70:18, 73:20, 74:23, 74:25, 74:28, 75:3, 75:4, 75:11, 75:13, 75:15, 75:16, 75:17, 75:26, 75:29, 76:1, 76:12, 76:13, 76:14, 76:24, 76:26, 77:16, 77:22, 77:24, 79:21, 79:22, 79:23, 79:24, 79:25, 79:29, 80:18, 80:24, 80:25, 80:26, 80:29, 81:17, 82:29, 83:14, 83:15, 83:20, 84:13, 90:4, 94:9, 95:3, 95:19, 95:24, 96:14, 97:3, 97:6, 97:19, 97:22, 97:29, 106:28, 109:3, 109:4, 147:25, 150:19. 154:10. 154:20, 154:22, 155:5, 161:20, 161:22, 161:28, 162:1, 162:7, 162:23 sections [2] - 16:1, 70:19 secure [2] - 127:9, 128:13 secured [1] - 149:24 securing [4] - 27:10. 39:7, 127:7, 127:11 seductive [1] - 126:21 see [19] - 34:7, 37:28, 38:14, 57:5, 76:27, 89:15, 89:22, 93:1,

93:6, 96:20, 99:15, 115:21, 116:29, 120:2, 124:23, 144:10, 144:20, 144:26, 161:2 seeing [2] - 117:24, 120:24 seek [7] - 15:13, 95:4, 101:4, 101:5, 120:11, 135:29, 146:2 seeker [1] - 135:24 seeking [1] - 152:3 seem [2] - 84:14, 137:8 sees [1] - 156:14 seized [1] - 52:2 self [1] - 22:12 self-protection [1] -22:12 send [2] - 83:12, 150:9 sending [3] - 76:1, 113:27, 131:10 senior [9] - 30:14, 96:26, 99:13, 100:22, 100:24, 127:11, 128:12, 138:22, 140:22 sense [8] - 63:26, 119:29, 130:4, 130:6, 132:14, 143:14, 144:25 sensitive [1] - 38:24 sensitivities [1] -61.29 sensitivity [1] - 68:23 sent [16] - 20:18, 58:29, 59:2, 75:26, 90:5, 90:7, 91:9, 97:26, 102:24, 109:22, 109:23, 113:24, 113:26, 117:21, 119:5, 137:5 sentence [15] - 29:15, 50:23, 55:10, 55:19, 90:28, 91:2, 114:12, 117:19, 138:14, 160:23, 160:26, 161:2, 161:4, 161:6, 161:10 separate [7] - 13:20, 49:14, 49:16, 121:20, 155:10, 155:11 separated [1] - 6:20 September [4] -23:16, 135:19, 136:5, 149:2 Sergeant [61] - 5:29, 20:3, 22:23, 24:25,

26:12, 26:14, 35:5, 35:27, 35:29, 36:5, 36:20, 41:11, 41:14, 41:22, 41:23, 41:29, 42:2, 42:15, 42:20, 42:21, 43:1, 43:15, 43:21, 44:3, 44:25, 45:16, 49:22, 98:26, 111:6, 111:10, 111:11, 112:14, 112:21, 113:4, 113:10, 113:26, 113:28, 114:2, 114:6, 115:9, 115:10, 115:19, 115:24, 115:25, 115:28, 116:1, 117:12, 117:16, 120:3, 120:5, 122:4, 122:5, 129:11, 131:24, 132:27, 136:12, 136:16, 137:21, 159:5 sergeant [1] - 24:4 sergeants [1] - 42:7 series [1] - 109:9 serious [73] - 10:24, 11:7, 11:10, 11:12, 11:17, 11:28, 12:2, 12:6, 12:9, 12:28, 13:3, 13:15, 14:25, 15:2, 15:15, 16:6, 16:8, 16:17, 17:11, 18:9, 18:13, 18:14, 27:13, 27:27, 30:11. 30:16, 30:20, 33:29, 35:17, 48:7, 96:13, 96:17, 97:6, 97:15, 99:4, 101:29, 103:10, 103:14, 103:15, 104:25, 108:12, 109:10, 109:16. 110:24. 110:27, 111:2, 120:23, 131:7, 131:8, 132:7, 132:13, 138:14, 138:15, 138:19, 139:4, 139:9, 140:4, 140:6, 140:8, 140:27. 140:28. 141:13, 141:19, 142:18, 143:11, 145:5, 145:11, 145:19, 146:9, 146:17, 150:12 seriously [24] - 11:18, 20:15, 20:19, 21:25, 22:26, 22:27, 24:22, 25:27, 27:28, 28:1,

28:6, 28:26, 30:21, 34:29, 35:1, 35:16, 35:17, 48:20, 71:1, 71:20, 85:16, 144:23 seriousness [5] -20:11, 72:28, 96:9, 109:5, 110:23 serve [3] - 40:15, 110:14, 110:24 served [4] - 110:15, 110:18, 138:27, 158:19 service [5] - 52:3, 111:1, 111:3, 138:27, 141:16 services [1] - 26:10 SERVICES [1] - 1:30 Services [2] - 1:25, 138:28 serving [11] - 17:4, 17:23, 20:26, 28:18, 29:7, 55:19, 60:24, 86:14, 104:24, 140:17.151:5 session [1] - 49:17 set [5] - 16:12, 81:19, 82:19, 96:25, 120:7 setting [2] - 156:12, 156:13 seven [2] - 132:10, 133:28 seven-and-a-half [2] -132:10, 133:28 several [2] - 126:9, 151.22 SGT [1] - 2:28 shall [3] - 37:6, 80:1, 108:12 SHANE [1] - 2:10 shape [2] - 70:15, 105:23 sharing [1] - 120:12 sheet [2] - 49:5, 49:11 SHERIDAN [1] - 2:27 Sheridan [37] - 22:19, 24:13, 24:25, 39:18, 39:22, 40:11, 40:26, 41:12, 41:25, 42:4, 42:13, 42:22, 43:17, 43:22, 44:5, 44:9, 44:18, 49:4, 49:10, 49:24, 49:27, 51:15, 53:1, 55:17, 59:27, 59:28, 95:27, 98:27, 109:26, 110:9, 110:16, 129:10, 131:24, 132:27, 136:12, 136:17, 137:21 Sheridan's [3] - 37:28,

45:18, 48:1 SHIP [1] - 2:13 shocked [4] - 56:23, 136:27, 137:2, 137:5 shoot [3] - 17:26, 19:1, 72:6 shoots [1] - 18:2 short [8] - 12:13, 12:19, 18:12, 32:8, 89:11, 92:24, 122:16, 122:17 short-term [1] - 92:24 show [1] - 142:10 sic [1] - 15:14 sic] [1] - 55:17 sick [1] - 98:17 side [5] - 5:14, 7:27, 70:3, 78:24 sight [1] - 125:2 signal [1] - 131:10 signature [2] - 151:14, 151:21 signed [7] - 91:8, 121:4, 122:3, 122:7, 134:14, 136:16 significance [1] - 39:9 significant [13] - 21:7, 21:16, 27:11, 32:12, 86:26, 105:26, 116:28, 139:2, 140:15, 141:9, 141:13, 143:1, 145:5 significantly [4] -101:22, 120:10, 120:14, 152:26 SIMMS [1] - 3:3 Simms [147] - 16:21, 17:14, 17:15, 18:25, 18:26, 19:5, 19:9, 19:21, 20:14, 21:11, 21:12, 21:14, 21:20, 21:24, 21:29, 22:8, 22:9, 24:1, 26:13, 27:18, 29:18, 30:7, 31:12, 32:14, 32:17, 32:24, 32:25, 33:3, 33:7, 33:11, 33:12, 34:3, 34:9, 35:14, 37:18, 38:3, 39:18, 40:1, 45:4, 47:10, 48:22, 49:2, 49:18, 52:20, 52:25, 53:26, 55:2, 60:26, 63:9, 63:12, 63:15, 63:17, 63:20, 63:23, 64:5, 64:20, 65:9, 65:16, 65:18, 65:21, 66:6, 67:2, 67:9, 67:17, 71:25, 72:11, 75:5,

75:7, 83:12, 83:17,

85:9, 85:11, 85:29, 86:29, 88:3, 91:28, 93:7, 93:13, 93:26, 95:26, 95:28, 96:7, 96:10, 96:13, 97:4, 97:15, 98:25, 98:28, 102:11, 102:18, 103:13, 103:26, 104:5, 104:12, 104:29, 105:10, 105:19, 105:23, 105:29, 106:19, 106:26, 107:15, 108:23, 109:15, 109:19, 109:24, 110:16, 122:12, 124:17, 125:26, 126:18, 127:14, 127:16, 127:21, 128:21, 129:22, 130:12, 132:21, 133:15, 134:9, 135:10, 136:24, 138:4, 139:1, 139:5, 139:12. 141:12. 142:14, 142:26, 143:19, 145:3, 145:6, 145:25, 146:11, 146:15, 147:5, 147:16, 147:19, 152:17, 152:24, 154:17, 154.23 159.9 159:12, 160:13, 161:19 Simms' [9] - 27:10, 29:16, 31:17, 31:27, 39:7, 109:21, 129:4, 151:22, 160:17 simple [5] - 22:6, 48:14, 71:18, 107:14 simplistic [2] -129:15, 129:21 simply [13] - 25:27, 27:23, 30:15, 33:23, 44:13, 44:18, 50:4, 94:5, 111:20, 127:25, 131:15, 132:3, 153:5 single [1] - 64:4 Siochana [1] - 162:2 sister [4] - 128:1, 128:5, 141:12, 144:5 sit [4] - 31:27, 100:6, 120:12, 131:15 site [1] - 32:18 site-specific [1] -32:18 situated [1] - 62:3 situation [82] - 7:26,

18:4, 18:5, 18:7, 18:8, 18:17, 20:11, 22:25, 24:2, 24:3, 24:6, 25:3, 26:1, 27:20, 28:15, 29:4, 29:6, 33:10, 34:5, 35:15, 42:17, 46:11, 46:19, 51:29, 53:20, 58:5, 59:11, 63:16, 69:27, 75:22, 76:10, 82:4.83:28.86:1. 86:5, 86:11, 87:17, 87:24, 90:7, 100:1, 100:9, 100:12, 101:2, 102:4, 102:6, 102:11. 102:15. 103:18, 110:5, 110:7, 112:6, 120:18, 121:18, 125:25, 127:25, 137:18, 137:22, 137:25, 138:10, 138:18, 139:3, 139:11. 139:18. 139:20, 143:21, 144:29, 145:11, 146:11, 147:9, 149:19, 150:15. 150:20, 152:14, 152:18, 153:23, 156:22, 157:26, 160.1situations [10] - 15:12, 18:20, 29:26, 63:20, 101:23, 118:19, 141:22, 145:1, 146:9. 153:22 six [2] - 156:11, 156:16 six-page [2] - 156:11, 156:16 slightly [1] - 115:8 Sligo [2] - 58:22, 67:27 SLIGO [1] - 3:5 slip [1] - 61:27 slow [1] - 148:17 Smith [1] - 117:14 smooth [1] - 101:19 so-and-so [1] - 47:2 so-called [1] - 150:11 social [3] - 36:16, 117:14, 120:6 SOLE [2] - 1:12, 2:2 solely [3] - 13:8. 13:17, 138:8 **SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:7 SOLICITOR'S [1] -2:12

15:8, 15:18, 17:24,

SOLICITORS [4] -2:20, 2:24, 2:29, 3:4 someone [5] - 58:25, 72:6, 78:7, 118:29, 119.4sometimes [6] -46:21, 57:29, 128:17, 128:18, 130:10, 130:11 somewhat [1] -119:11 somewhere [1] -29:22 sorry [32] - 9:14, 38:19, 38:22, 38:27, 46:13, 47:13, 53:3, 53:28, 53:29, 57:8, 66:4, 68:13, 77:13, 79:1, 79:13, 82:8, 88:21, 88:28, 89:18, 91:6, 103:6, 115:8, 120:29, 121:9, 121:26, 132:5, 147:4, 148:17, 149:5, 156:6, 159:18, 160:26 sort [5] - 15:18, 26:4, 79:4, 139:23, 157:18 sought [3] - 6:23, 132:21, 146:3 sourcing [1] - 159:4 speaking [6] - 9:27, 46.23 64.13 119:22, 120:1, 138:2 speaks [1] - 11:16 specific [12] - 14:22, 26:16, 27:9, 32:18, 39:6, 70:18, 104:27, 113:11, 115:6, 132:21, 142:27, 152:1 specifically [2] -48:18.84:18 speculating [1] - 47:2 speedy [1] - 73:27 spend [3] - 131:3, 131:11, 132:9 spoil [1] - 12:14 spoken [4] - 88:9. 94:6, 98:22, 127:7 SPRING [1] - 3:8 SQUARE [1] - 3:9 stab [1] - 56:21 staff [3] - 13:19, 13:29, 14:6 stage [29] - 19:23, 22:4, 22:16, 23:12, 24:17, 40:6, 41:4, 51:5, 51:7, 51:9, 59:12, 59:13, 63:21,

22

63:27, 65:14, 79:26, 118:24, 119:7, 94:7, 101:14, 106:9, 119:20, 121:8, 106:13, 112:13, 121:9, 121:14, 121:19, 122:12, 112:21, 113:7, 118:13, 138:6, 122:15, 124:18, 139:16, 144:12, 125:28, 126:12, 158:17, 161:7 126:14, 126:17, 126:29, 127:8, stages [2] - 48:29, 152:19 127:28, 128:11, stamped [2] - 112:7, 128:14, 129:6, 112:12 129:9, 129:14, 129:25, 130:8, standard [5] - 24:21, 130:16, 130:24, 76:18, 110:17, 131:15, 131:19, 113:12, 122:19 131:20, 131:23, standing [2] - 17:25, 131:26, 131:27, 18:29 132:16, 132:19, start [4] - 45:19, 132:28, 133:12, 89:16, 118:4, 131:15 133:14, 134:6, started [3] - 143:27, 134:8, 134:10, 144:3, 144:4 134:12, 134:14, state [2] - 11:28, 126:4 134:21, 134:22, STATE[1] - 2:12 134:27, 135:7, statement [202] - 7:10, 136:12, 136:14, 16:12, 24:27, 24:29, 136:21. 136:22. 29:16, 32:9, 34:19, 136:26, 137:3, 34:22, 35:10, 35:13, 137:13, 137:14, 37:17, 40:21, 44:6, 138:9, 138:12, 45:4, 49:2, 49:7, 138:21, 138:23, 49:18, 50:4, 54:9, 138:24, 138:25, 55:10, 56:1, 56:25, 139:3, 139:12, 57:3, 59:14, 60:29, 139:15, 139:20, 61:16, 63:11, 63:15, 139.22 140.3 63:21, 63:24, 63:27, 140:9, 140:13, 64:19, 65:26, 66:7, 140:21, 140:29, 66:14, 67:15, 75:25, 141:3, 141:10, 85:8.85:10.86:28. 141:28, 142:15, 88:2.89:11.91:27. 142:17, 142:27, 93:12, 93:22, 94:21, 143:18, 143:20, 95:25, 98:25, 98:28, 144:18, 145:13, 101:13, 102:18, 145:29, 146:25, 103:12, 103:26, 147:15, 149:12, 104:7, 104:14, 149:15, 149:20, 105:11, 105:20, 149:23, 150:18, 105:23, 106:1, 150:21, 151:22, 106:7. 106:12. 152:9, 152:12, 106:14, 106:15, 152:17, 152:25, 106:19, 106:26, 153:22, 156:27, 108:22, 108:27, 159:11, 159:15, 109:1, 109:2, 109:5, 159:19, 159:27, 109:11, 109:13, 160:16, 160:17, 109:14, 114:4, 160:18, 160:21, 114:9, 114:10, 160:27, 161:18, 114:14, 114:18, 162:25 114:26, 115:1, 115:12, 115:13, 129:9 115:27, 116:4, statements [34] -116:5, 116:25, 117:10, 117:23, 118:6, 118:9, 118:15, 118:23,

42:15, 42:20, 42:23, 43:1, 43:11, 43:17, 43:23, 44:17, 45:24, 46:1, 46:6, 47:7, 48:17, 49:5, 53:14, 73:9, 89:25, 116:13, 116:16, 120:13, 133:29, 134:23 stating [1] - 7:11 Station [14] - 22:15, 23:24, 24:28, 55:4, 58:22, 67:28, 72:28, 127:27. 128:22. 129:6, 129:25, 130:24, 136:11, 137:12 station [16] - 26:7, 26:8. 31:12. 77:18. 80:11, 81:4, 81:26, 93:20, 98:16, 99:3, 100:7, 100:17, 100:20, 101:6, 129:13, 131:4 stationed [2] - 59:25, 61:10 statistics [1] - 142:9 status [1] - 148:6 steam [1] - 55:4 STENOGRAPHER[1] - 92:14 stenographers [1] -92:13 stenographic [1] -1:27 STENOGRAPHY [1] -1:30 stenography [1] - 1:25 step [1] - 64:4 steps [16] - 23:1, 26:19, 26:26, 26:28, 27:16, 38:10, 38:11, 38:12, 38:17, 39:2, 49:8. 64:6. 64:9. 64:17, 67:4, 109:18 still [8] - 41:2, 91:19, 105:21, 112:28, 121:23, 123:15, 139:14, 160:3 Stockholm [1] -145:17 stood [1] - 120:25 **stop** [10] - 31:29, 33:9, 60:28, 65:3, 66:17, 92:11, 120:18, statement-taking [1] -143:29, 144:1, 144:8 stopped [1] - 73:29 straight [1] - 22:1 5:11, 28:7, 36:14, strain [1] - 47:17 39:29, 40:4, 40:25, strange [1] - 56:20 40:26, 40:27, 41:12, strategy [11] - 36:6, 41:26, 42:5, 42:13,

36:23, 112:13, 112:17, 112:18, 112:19, 112:22, 113:7, 113:17, 113:28, 115:23 street [1] - 30:16 STREET [4] - 2:13, 2:21, 2:25, 3:5 stretch [1] - 131:7 strictly [1] - 9:27 strike [1] - 135:1 string [1] - 157:28 structure [2] - 131:17, 132:28 structured [1] - 132:3 stuck [1] - 98:16 sub [1] - 32:11 sub-district [1] -32:11 subject [17] - 7:4, 17:2, 18:20, 22:5, 25:4, 28:8, 28:18, 32:12, 37:10, 37:13, 69:8, 73:20, 83:22, 97:5, 110:18, 110.20 116.14 subject-matter [1] -73:20 subjected [1] - 133:1 submissions [2] -97:21, 126:11 submitted [6] - 6:4, 6:6, 6:11, 65:29, 66:11, 162:14 subsequent [3] -13:18, 87:18, 127:15 subsequently [18] -36:23, 58:13, 58:19, 58:22, 65:12, 67:22, 69:3, 72:23, 74:10, 74:11, 99:26, 104:6, 105:9, 105:10, 105:15, 112:1, 131:28, 136:15 substantial [10] - 12:2, 12:3, 16:16, 16:19, 16:20, 16:23, 17:11, 19:12, 24:29, 96:12 substantive [2] -103:28, 104:1 subtract [2] - 134:11, 134:25 suffer [1] - 46:21 suffering [1] - 118:14 sufficient [2] - 25:12, 149:27 suggest [9] - 73:25, 78:18, 98:26, 108:23, 111:5, 127:3, 137:16,

147:18, 159:21 suggested [6] - 47:26, 53:24, 54:22, 93:19, 116:20, 157:18 suggesting [6] - 7:11, 39:21, 46:15, 57:22, 157:13, 157:14 suggestion [6] -49:16, 116:23, 124:6, 124:9, 124:26, 133:13 suggests [4] - 127:9, 129:1, 136:29, 156.23 suitable [2] - 89:14, 95:1 summer [1] - 98:17 Sunday [2] - 45:11, 129:23 SUNLIGHT [1] - 2:25 super [1] - 139:27 superficially [1] -126:21 SUPERINTENDENT 131 - 4:4. 9:3. 125:6 superintendent [61] -6:11, 11:1, 13:1, 14:8, 14:18, 18:10, 23:14, 28:23, 42:12, 43:7, 47:5, 50:10, 53:4, 59:24, 60:28, 62:11, 64:2, 65:15, 67:1, 67:13, 67:27, 70:7, 74:9, 74:12, 75:13, 78:6, 78:10, 79:2, 85:13, 88:22, 91:6, 91:7, 91:22, 91:25, 93:17, 94:1, 94:4, 94:7, 94:10, 94:12, 97:10, 97:11, 97:13, 99:24, 101:10, 104:2, 108:27, 114:10, 114:24, 115:22, 117:26, 121:3, 124:22, 124:28, 150:6, 151:15, 156:20, 157:5, 158:24, 161:26 Superintendent [130] -5:6, 5:9, 5:10, 5:20, 5:23, 5:25, 5:29, 6:4, 6:6, 6:10, 7:6, 7:21, 9:6, 9:17, 9:20, 9:29, 16:15, 16:26, 19:14, 20:10, 30:22, 32:5, 38:21, 38:22, 42:16, 42:28, 43:3, 43:5, 44:25, 45:3, 47:26, 50:12, 54:9, 55:17,

23

56:1, 56:27, 56:28, 57:1, 57:3, 57:15, 57:22, 58:2, 58:21, 59:14, 60:20, 60:29, 61:16, 66:21, 66:26, 67:11, 68:4, 68:8, 69:27, 72:13, 72:23, 72:25, 73:5, 73:16, 74:8, 74:15, 82:12, 83:26, 85:22, 86:9, 86:12, 86:27, 87:3, 87:5. 87:22. 87:28. 88:4, 88:9, 88:26, 89:6, 89:7, 89:9, 89:16, 89:26, 90:2, 90:6, 90:14, 91:8, 91:26, 92:20, 95:10, 95:14, 96:2, 97:21, 99:22, 99:27, 100:2, 102:27, 104:7, 105:14, 105:18, 117:7, 120:28, 124:5, 124:9, 125:8, 138:9, 152:22, 152:27.153:11. 155:6, 155:21, 155:22, 156:2, 156:4, 156:9, 156:10, 156:12, 156:26, 157:6, 157:8, 157:9, 158:2, 158:21, 159:7, 160.9 160.12 160:29, 161:5, 161:12, 161:15, 162:2, 162:9, 162:15, 163:7 superintendent's [1] -55:10 superintendents [4] -18:10. 43:29. 85:12. 88:29 superior [2] - 43:27, 44:20 superiors [3] - 87:2, 88:1, 101:4 supers [1] - 139:27 supplied [2] - 36:11, 82:26 supply [2] - 36:14 support [1] - 119:26 supported [1] - 130:3 supports [1] - 141:18 suppose [17] - 44:7, 45:19, 54:1, 57:6, 71:14, 76:14, 78:7, 117:27, 118:2, 118:9, 118:10, 118:11, 120:21, 126:20, 126:21,

130:1 supposed [1] - 44:1 supposedly [1] -118:29 SUPREME [2] - 1:13, 2:3 SUPT [1] - 2:23 surprised [1] - 86:8 surreal [1] - 79:26 surrounding [1] -159:29 surveillance [1] -109:20 suspect [2] - 28:27, 142:23 suspects [1] - 55:22 suspend [1] - 92:8 suspended [6] -91:19, 91:23, 91:29, 92:4, 92:6, 93:17 suspension [8] -90:24, 91:4, 91:11, 91:15, 91:20, 92:10, 101:5. 156:23 sustained [4] - 15:20, 15:25, 15:26, 16:3 syndrome [1] - 145:17 synopsis [1] - 122:17 system [1] - 79:6 Síochána [80] - 8:14, 9:27, 10:21, 10:23, 11:9, 11:14, 13:14, 13:19, 13:26, 13:28, 13:29, 14:3, 14:5, 14:12, 17:4, 17:7, 17:23, 19:2, 22:27, 22:28, 25:8, 25:10, 37:3, 37:6, 37:13, 45:29, 48:27, 52:15, 53:18, 53:22, 53:25, 54:15, 54:27, 54:29, 55:7, 55:8, 55:14, 55:26, 56:9, 56:10, 56:13, 61:3, 61:18, 64:13, 64:15, 64:18, 67:5, 68:24, 70:1, 70:17, 71:1, 71:3, 76:3, 76:23, 77:15, 77:17, 77:20, 78:29, 79:9, 79:29, 80:13, 85:13, 93:25, 95:1, 95:3, 100:5, 102:14, 102:19, 103:2, 103:8, 104:17, 106:14, 122:25, 126:15, 139:16, 140:17, 150:26, 151:6, 162:12, 162:14

Т table [1] - 146:24 task [4] - 42:7, 42:12, 43:21, 44:1 tasked [8] - 41:25, 41:27, 42:4, 42:19, 42:22, 43:16, 44:8, 126:16 team [3] - 8:8, 126:27, 157:24 TEELING [1] - 3:5 ten [2] - 104:3, 148:19 TEN [1] - 2:17 tend [1] - 141:7 tense [1] - 27:15 term [2] - 92:24, 92:25 terminate [1] - 77:7 terminated [8] - 69:3, 72:20, 72:21, 74:11, 75:9, 105:15, 147:13, 155:3 terms [8] - 33:28, 109:4, 122:17, 124:9, 127:6, 129:15, 137:27, 142:2 TERRACE [1] - 2:17 terrified [1] - 160:14 text [3] - 106:21, 126:28, 142:2 texted [1] - 50:10 texts [1] - 126:21 **THE** [13] - 1:4, 1:8, 1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6, 2:9, 2:21, 5:1, 92:18, 153:9, 161:14, 163:12 themselves [5] -40:18, 67:7, 76:8, 119:24, 146:7 THEN [2] - 92:18, 163:12 theory [2] - 8:20, 8:21 thereafter [6] - 29:3, 76:7, 90:22, 99:27, 115:5, 162:24 thereby [1] - 128:6 therefore [8] - 11:9, 12:28, 32:20, 40:1, 61:4, 61:21, 95:4, 96:15 therein [5] - 109:15, 121:15, 143:14, 149:25, 150:22 thereof [1] - 140:3 thinking [5] - 23:16, 44:23, 45:12, 69:11, 78:13

thirdly [1] - 101:6 thirds [1] - 133:3 threat [46] - 22:29, 24:16, 25:16, 25:26, 26:17, 27:27, 28:26, 29:20, 29:23, 29:25, 29:28, 29:29, 30:16, 32:12, 32:15, 32:16, 33:3, 33:6, 33:29, 35:1, 35:17, 72:2, 96:9, 107:21, 107:22, 107:23, 107:25, 107:29, 108:3, 108:5, 108:10, 110:19, 110:20, 110:21, 110:23, 110:24, 111:2, 141:10, 141:11, 141:13, 143:11, 143:14, 143:19, 145:19, 161:1 threat-related [1] -25:16 threatened [4] - 18:3, 72:6, 144:19 threatening [3] -17:26, 51:10, 145:27 threats [68] - 16:24, 18:12, 18:18, 19:19, 20:14, 20:19, 21:2, 21:19, 21:24, 21:29, 22:3, 22:8, 22:26, 24:22, 25:7, 25:12, 26:14, 27:29, 28:4, 30:11, 30:20, 32:5, 32:9, 33:9, 35:11, 36:10, 46:3, 46:8, 46:16, 47:7, 47:10, 47:17, 47:28, 48:8, 48:23, 49:1, 49:20, 50:6, 50:18, 52:27, 55:23, 55:24, 56:14, 60:10, 60:18, 61:8, 61:28, 71:19, 72:7, 72:8, 72:29, 85:25, 96:7, 96:10, 107:20, 107:27, 108:18, 131:8, 132:12, 133:9, 138:17, 142:29, 143:6, 146:13, 150:11, 159:16 three [6] - 38:3, 47:8, 103:29, 128:9, 148:10, 155:4 threshold [1] - 12:28 thrice [1] - 6:16 throughout [1] -150:13

THURSDAY [2] - 1:18, 5:1 tidying [1] - 112:29 tiff [2] - 77:1, 109:9 tiffs [1] - 109:9 time-honoured [1] -45:20 timeframe [1] - 92:10 timeframes [1] -101:24 timely [2] - 73:27, 101:23 TO [2] - 9:3, 163:12 today [4] - 73:28, 89:12, 89:17, 148:23 today's [1] - 139:14 together [5] - 26:5, 28:25, 111:7, 111:13, 143:15 tomorrow [1] - 89:13 tone [1] - 140:24 tongue [1] - 61:27 took [20] - 18:15, 18:19, 20:15, 20:19, 21:25, 21:28, 27:28, 36:19, 38:17, 43:14, 43:19, 55:29, 64:4, 64:8, 84:8, 96:17, 99:9, 112:17, 122:7, 133:12 top [4] - 10:15, 41:8, 143:29, 161:6 total [1] - 144:9 totally [3] - 18:4, 29:23, 160:23 towards [1] - 52:23 tragedy [1] - 60:3 transcript [2] - 1:26, 113:19 transfer [5] - 90:25, 91:11, 112:1, 112:28, 156:23 transfers [1] - 35:24 trauma [3] - 138:17, 145:16, 145:20 traumatised [1] -145.20 travelling [1] - 130:14 treatment [1] - 88:15 triage [1] - 132:10 trial [1] - 159:8 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:3, 2:6 Tribunal [58] - 5:9, 5:28, 6:1, 6:2, 6:10, 6:12, 6:13, 6:22, 7:9, 7:10, 7:13, 7:14, 7:26, 8:1, 8:8, 8:11, 15:1, 25:7, 25:13, 25:14, 26:21, 27:12,

31:6, 32:6, 35:4, 35:7, 39:22, 42:19, 48:20, 56:4, 56:11, 60:29, 65:5, 84:27, 93:2, 99:28, 100:14, 101:27, 105:26, 106:10, 106:11, 108:6, 109:27, 109:29, 112:23, 115:17, 116:10, 118:4, 134:15, 138:7, 138:29, 140:14, 146:20, 153:7, 155:25, 156:28, 157:16, 161:16 Tribunal's [4] - 6:17, 6:28, 68:21, 153:6 TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:9 trick [1] - 122:13 tricked [1] - 133:14 true [12] - 27:23, 85:9, 85:24, 93:23, 99:16, 105:25, 105:28, 106:2, 106:12, 106:17, 126:18 truncated [1] - 135:8 try [6] - 84:20, 92:11, 119:29, 120:1, 148:11, 148:23 trying [4] - 130:5, 131:20, 143:29, 162:20 turn [2] - 38:28, 118:27 TUSLA [1] - 2:15 Tusla [37] - 6:24, 18:27, 19:3, 19:6, 20:18, 34:17, 35:4, 35:6, 35:8, 35:18, 35:19, 35:23, 35:24, 35:29, 36:2, 36:5, 36:12, 36:15, 36:17, 36:21, 36:23, 59:8, 109:23. 114:3. 115:26. 116:10. 116:12, 119:15, 119:22, 122:27, 123:11, 123:18, 123:20, 158:8, 158:10 twisted [1] - 129:4 twisting [1] - 129:2 two [38] - 13:20, 18:9, 23:7, 29:23, 29:25, 38:5, 39:17, 48:11, 49:14, 49:16, 59:15, 71:10, 73:11, 85:11, 96:23. 97:9. 98:27. 102:27, 104:1,

108:29, 121:17, 121:20, 121:27, 131:3, 131:4, 133:3, 133:12, 136:13, 139:27, 143:3, 144:7, 155:4, 155:10, 155:11, 158:2, 159:26, 161:23 two-and-a-half [1] -155:4 two-thirds [1] - 133:3 type [3] - 8:9, 55:11, 135:3 types [1] - 15:11 U unacceptable [3] -134:18, 134:19 unclear [1] - 94:29 uncooperative [1] -8:28 under [54] - 10:29, 11:3, 13:2, 15:15, 15:21, 15:27, 16:1, 21:1, 26:23, 33:16, 38:18, 39:4, 40:15, 45:28, 48:12, 49:16, 55:4. 64:29. 68:23. 69:12, 69:13, 70:15, 75:11, 75:16, 75:17, 75:26, 76:12, 76:14, 76:24, 76:26, 77:16, 77:21. 77:24. 79:21. 79:22, 79:23, 79:29, 80:25, 87:2, 106:23, 109:3, 119:9, 121:21, 122:24, 123:7, 123:8, 123:10, 123:29, 130:16, 161:20, 161:21 UNDER [2] - 1:3, 1:9 underneath [1] -151:14 understated [1] -99.17 understood [4] -22:18, 45:15, 50:21, 50:24 undertake [1] - 20:25 undertaken [10] -17:21, 21:2, 46:11, 50:14, 51:14, 65:24, 75:8, 76:6, 147:20 undertaking [11] -127:7, 127:9, 128:11, 128:15, 128:21, 129:17,

130:7, 130:13, 130:23, 147:12 undertakings [2] -127:11, 128:13 undertook [2] -127:24, 130:21 undoubtedly [1] - 79:5 unforgivable [1] -61:27 unfortunate [3] -50:24, 63:16, 132:29 unfortunately [16] -24:24, 29:7, 33:2, 51:20, 54:5, 59:22, 63:11, 70:9, 86:1, 131:16, 141:21, 141:22, 142:9, 146:5, 146:6, 148:12 unhappy [1] - 149:1 unless [2] - 120:21, 160:24 unnecessarily [1] -135:16 unpleasant [2] -88:14, 119:2 unrelated [1] - 13:21 untrue [2] - 126:14, 139:19 unusual [3] - 114:23, 155:7, 155:15 **up** [46] - 17:27, 20:29, 21:20, 37:25, 43:22, 44:7, 46:10, 49:25, 49:28, 50:9, 52:23, 52:29, 55:11, 56:16, 60:6, 63:4, 63:9, 68:2, 71:8, 72:12, 72:13, 75:24, 77:27, 78:1, 82:1, 87:19, 87:21, 88:19, 88:29, 89:19, 95:26, 98:13, 112:29, 114:2, 114:16, 115:29, 118:27, 120:2, 120:6, 124:21, 128:23, 131:4, 143:26, 144:11, 147:28, 153:10 up-to-date [1] - 120:6 update [3] - 36:2, 36:5, 41:11 updated [1] - 50:12 upheld [1] - 85:28 upset [1] - 144:11 urgent [12] - 18:12, 18:15, 20:10, 20:28, 24:15, 50:5, 50:8, 132:8, 138:19, 140:4, 140:27, 146:27

155:7, 155:10 utilised [1] - 120:9 V valid [1] - 133:8 validated [4] - 16:13, 123:9, 126:18, 126:29 validating [1] - 107:26 valuable [1] - 106:7 value [1] - 149:16 variety [2] - 73:7, 157:25 various [2] - 126:4, 146:21 verbatim [2] - 1:26, 54:8 verify [1] - 105:23 version [4] - 40:20, 98:21, 99:5, 101:9 victim [11] - 32:7, 32:8, 54:6, 118:29, 127:8, 139:2, 142:10, 145:15, 145:20, 146:6, 146:12 victimise [1] - 136:19 victimised [2] -135:18, 136:3 victimising [1] -124.16 victims [8] - 25:15, 32:27, 127:11, 128:13, 128:16, 130:11, 131:3, 131:11 view [22] - 10:12, 10:22, 12:26, 13:12, 13:16, 14:16, 25:2, 31:18, 35:16, 45:16, 57:16, 58:2, 60:21, 60:27, 94:20, 100:14, 116:15, 123:16, 130:26, 139:7, 145:9, 154:10 viewing [1] - 8:27 views [4] - 61:17, 95:4, 130:29, 156:18 Violence [1] - 138:28 violence [19] - 32:28, 33:17. 72:29. 75:22. 76:11, 109:28, 121:18, 123:8, 139:2, 141:22, 142:10, 142:15, 143:2, 145:1, 145:2, 145:27, 146:2,

usual [3] - 31:20,

146:6, 146:12 violence-related [2] -121:18, 141:22 virtue [1] - 11:3 vis-à-vis [1] - 46:19 vis-á-vis [2] - 146:24, 160.2visit [1] - 128:18 visitors [2] - 129:29, 130:6 vitally [1] - 73:18 voices [1] - 38:24 volition [2] - 54:28, 55:1 volume [2] - 6:3, 89:20 voluntariness [2] -127:10, 128:15 voluntary [1] - 55:3

W

wait [1] - 18:1 walked [1] - 21:20 Wallace [3] - 26:12, 26:14, 159:5 wandering [1] - 30:15 wants [1] - 121:2 warrant [1] - 118:28 WAS [4] - 125:6, 153:9, 161:14, 163:12 watch [1] - 33:24 ways [1] - 159:26 weapons [1] - 14:23 wedding [5] - 60:11, 72:2, 72:6, 128:4, 129:29 Wednesday [1] -144:25 week [1] - 44:14 week's [1] - 102:28 weekend [5] - 18:19, 21:5, 59:24, 60:10, 144:27 weekends [1] - 144:20 weeks [3] - 102:27, 104:2. 155:4 weeping [1] - 135:15 welcome [1] - 148:7 welfare [2] - 123:5, 142:19 whatsoever [1] -145:23 WHELAN [1] - 2:11 whereby [4] - 77:27, 110:5, 114:24, 121:11 whichever [1] - 115:3 whole [4] - 12:4, 74:4,

119:1, 140:15 wife [1] - 75:24 willing [2] - 130:9, 134:8 willingly [1] - 54:29 wish [19] - 7:4, 39:20, 65:26, 66:15, 67:2, 77:4, 79:18, 103:19, 105:8, 117:3, 121:29, 130:22, 132:24, 134:24, 134:29, 141:29, 147:23 wished [6] - 29:11, 77:25, 79:18, 106:2, 129:14, 132:22 wishes [2] - 5:9, 77:29 wishing [1] - 77:19 withdraw [2] - 104:7, 134:24 withdrawal [7] -106:15, 111:7, 119:7, 126:13, 139:15, 152:17, 152:25 withdrawing [3] -103:26, 105:11, 105:12 withdrawn [6] -102:18, 104:14, 105:20, 118:23, 119:21, 120:18 withdrew [7] - 102:13, 104:15, 104:16, 105:10, 106:4, 145:13, 151:23 witness [6] - 88:18, 89:3, 121:18, 125:3, 135:8, 135:23 WITNESS [3] - 4:2, 153:9, 161:14 witness-box [1] -135:23 witnessed [1] - 34:24 witnesses [3] - 49:3, 115:26, 130:11 woman [1] - 118:7 Women's [1] - 138:28 wonder [2] - 107:6, 125:2 wondering [3] - 44:22, 53:29, 66:24 word [14] - 14:27, 39:25, 105:3, 105:5, 121:9, 121:10, 128:26, 130:21, 142:4, 147:17, 147:18, 154:23, 154:24 wording [2] - 123:25,

words [15] - 13:15, 51:19, 73:23, 108:15, 108:19, 109:8, 114:26, 129:20, 130:2, 131:8, 132:7, 141:6, 143:16, 146:23, worker [3] - 36:17, 117:14, 120:6 world [1] - 5:15 worries [1] - 85:15 worry [1] - 47:19 worst [2] - 141:2, Wright [2] - 66:20, write [1] - 68:12 writes [1] - 76:15

128:20

149:7

143:11

96:26

writing [6] - 80:7,

112:9, 162:13

written [6] - 80:4,

81:23, 102:22

wrote [9] - 49:4,

96:19, 107:6

ye [1] - 73:22

117:9

81:27, 83:6, 86:10,

81:3, 81:17, 81:22,

49:10, 59:14, 61:1,

77:3, 86:12, 93:17,

Υ

year [7] - 20:6, 50:23,

50:25, 100:20,

108:15, 115:25,

years [5] - 61:21,

141:16, 142:7

118:26, 138:26,

yesterday [21] - 5:8,

5:23, 6:15, 6:28,

9:7, 9:11, 10:9,

7:11, 8:1, 8:5, 8:19,

19:17, 20:27, 27:8,

58:5, 61:1, 75:2,

82:11, 113:15,

114:12, 161:15

young [1] - 119:29

yourself [5] - 9:29,

100:16, 151:17

20:20, 30:3, 36:28

41:14, 73:13,

yourselves [3] -

yesterday's [1] -

113:19

É

ÉIREANN [2] - 1:5, 1:6

Ó

Ó [1] - 3:8