TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE

ON WEDNESDAY, 11TH OCTOBER 2017 - DAY 36

36

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT **SOLE MEMBER:**

REGISTRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR. DIARMAID MCGUINNESS SC

MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. KATHLEEN LEADER BL

MS. ELIZABETH MULLAN, SOLICITOR

MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC FOR THE COMMISSIONER:

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL MR. NOEL WHELAN BL MR. JOHN FITZGERALD BL MS. KATHY DONALD

INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE

LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

MR. PAUL ANTHONY MCDERMOTT SC MS. SARAH MCKECHNIE BL FOR TUSLA:

ARTHUR COX **INSTRUCTED BY:**

TEN EARLSFORT TERRACE

DUBLIN 2

FOR GARDA HARRISON:

MR. MARK HARTY SC MR. PETER PAUL DALY BL

MR. ANTHONY QUINN BL KILFEATHER & COMPANY SOLICITORS **INSTRUCTED BY:**

THE HALLS QUAY STREET

GALWAY

FOR SUPT. ENGLISH: MR. PADRAIG DWYER SC

MR. BRIAN GAGEBY BL MR. CARTHAGE CONLON M.E. HANAHOE SOLICITORS **INSTRUCTED BY:**

SUNLIGHT CHAMBERS 21 PARLIAMENT STREET

DUBLIN 2

FOR INSP. SHERIDAN,

INSP. DURKIN & SGT. McGOWAN: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MR. MICHAEL HEGARTY

REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS

12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE

DUBLIN 2

MR. HUGH HARTNETT SC MR. JOSEPH BARNES BL MR. MARK MULLANEY FOR MARISA SIMMS: **INSTRUCTED BY:**

MULLANEYS SOLICITORS 1-2 TEELING STREET

SLIGO IRELAND

FOR C/SUPT. McGINN:

MR. CONOR POWER SC MR. CATHAL Ó BRAONÁIN BL DANIEL SPRING & COMPANY 50 FITZWILLIAM SQUARE DUBLIN 2 **INSTRUCTED BY:**

FOR MS. RITA MCDERMOTT: MR. NIALL O'NEILL BL

1	THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON WEDNESDAY, 11TH	
2	OCTOBER 2017:	
3		
4	MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, thank you for the time. I	
5	should just explain where matters are at, at the	11:1
6	present. We received yesterday a number of documents	
7	from An Garda Síochána, one of them was, amongst	
8	others, of a collection of minutes of different	
9	management accountability meetings, if I could put it	
10	that way. One of them dated the 5th November refers to	11:1
11	a regional divisional meeting held in Dundalk at which	
12	a number of senior Gardaí were present, and it's	
13	recorded on, in one line of the minutes that Chief	
14	Superintendent McGinn updated the meeting on the	
15	investigation concerning Garda Keith Harrison. It	11:1
16	doesn't obviously explicitly relate or refer directly	
17	to a HSE referral, but it's a sentence there in the	
18	document and that's being circulated and disclosed to	
19	all the parties.	
20		11:1
21	Another minute relates to a divisional accountability	
22	meeting at Letterkenny Garda Station on 29/11, and	
23	among the participants were Chief Superintendent	
24	McGinn, Superintendent McGovern, Superintendent Finan,	
25	Superintendent Archbold, who is now deceased, Inspector	11:1
26	Harrison and Sergeant Duffy. And it appears from the	
27	minutes that Mr. Gerry Hone from the HSE spoke to the	

28

29

meeting, that arrangement having been made obviously

some time prior to the meeting, in relation to HSE

referrals. The minutes of that have been circulated. 1 2 Garda Harrison isn't referred to explicitly. 3 to be more on the level of a general strategic-type meeting of the type which has in fact already been 4 5 referred to in the evidence. 7

6

8

9

10

11

However, notwithstanding that, these documents appear to the Tribunal counsel to fall within the scope of being considered to be potentially relevant to some of the witnesses, some of the evidence, perhaps, and they were disclosed and circulated on that basis.

11:16

11 · 16

11:17

11:17

11:17

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Obviously behind that is a concern about their appearance at this stage of the matter, at least this stage of the hearings, so I was going to suggest, Chairman, that you would give an opportunity to both the Garda Commissioner and counsel for the HSE to explain, if they wish, and if they have the appropriate instructions, to outline to the Tribunal where these documents came from, how is it that they perhaps have just come to light at this stage and their potential relevance. And I should say in that context, it is the intention of the Tribunal to recall a number of witnesses so that you, Chairman, can make such inquiry as you think fit in relation to the matters. If I could see the two documents, if anyone CHAIRMAN: has a copy of them here it would perhaps help to focus. MR. McGUINNESS: So, Chairman, that is all I would like to say at the moment. Obviously from the point of view

1	of the Tribunal and the presentation of evidence, we	
2	hope to make and take steps to recall any relevant	
3	witness as soon as possible.	
4	CHAIRMAN: All right.	
5	MR. McGUINNESS: But I would like to hear the parties.	11:18
6	CHAIRMAN: If you don't mind, let me go through these	
7	so I know what I am talking about. So there is a	
8	divisional accountability meeting in Letterkenny Garda	
9	Station on 29th of November 2013 at 10:00am, and Chief	
10	Superintendent McGinn is there, Superintendent McGovern	11:18
11	of Buncrana, Superintendent Finan, Superintendent	
12	Archbold and Inspector Harrison, acting Milford	
13	superintendent, Sergeant Peter Duffy, divisional	
14	office. And then it goes through:	
15		11:18
16	"Gerry Hone spoke to the meeting re HSE referrals. Big	
17	increase in Garda referrals to HSE."	
18		
19	It says:	
20		11:19
21	"29 referrals this year. Liaison between the Garda and	
22	HSE is very good on the ground. New Freedom of	
23	Information impact. Case conference on each referral.	
24	MF "	
25		11:19
26	Who presumably is Michael Finan?	
27	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
28	CHAIRMAN: " suggested the referral form could be	
29	improved so that more information would be included in	

1	the referral."	
2		
3	Yes. Certainly historically I've had evidence that	
4	happened.	
5		11:19
6	"Where a referral is received the parents must be	
7	informed of the existence of the referral. JH still a	
8	9-5 service costing sought."	
9		
10	Now, why is this potentially in any way relevant to	11:19
11	anything? I mean, you are saying it's relevant,	
12	Mr. McGuinness, I am wondering why are you saying it's	
13	in any way relevant?	
14	MR. McGUINNESS: Well, it's arguably just potentially	
15	relevant because it's a meeting concerning inter alia	11:20
16	the superintendent, Superintendent McGovern who made	
17	the referral to Mr. Hone, who is speaking at the	
18	meeting to him and the senior guards. It's in relation	
19	to HSE referrals in a general sense of course and it	
20	would seem on one interpretation perhaps to relate to	11:20
21	the type of referral that had been made by	
22	Superintendent McGovern a number of two months ago,	
23	to Mr. Hone, in fact. And obviously there is no	
24	mention of Garda Harrison directly in that, but it	
25	obviously at a general level touches on the sort of	11:20
26	concerns that were explored in evidence.	
27	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, it seems to be concerns may well	
28	have been gone through just looking at the document	
29	and where we might go in relation to it, where it might	

1	go is that they are having, it seems, a high-level	
2	meeting with Gerry Hone. By high level I don't know	
3	that everyone is very important, I mean that it is to	
4	do with policy, and basically how they are getting on.	
5	I mean, it's heartening I suppose to realise that they $_{ ext{ iny 1}}$	1:21
6	are having such meetings, but why has it anything to do	
7	with what I am inquiring into? And that is what I am	
8	wondering about. I mean, how potentially could it?	
9	MR. McGUINNESS: Well, I suppose, Chairman, it's a	
10	matter as to whether any party might think it	1:21
11	appropriate to inquire whether Garda Harrison's case	
12	was discussed at the meeting.	
13	CHAIRMAN: It could be. It could be. But, it could	
14	have been discussed at any other meeting as well.	
15	Well, maybe on this, can we just stick with this	1:21
16	document for a moment? I would like to hear	
17	Mr. McDermott first of all. Thank you for drawing that	
18	to my attention, Mr. McGuinness.	
19	MR. McDERMOTT: Chairman, the position of Tusla is,	
20	this is a document which appears to have no relevance	1:21
21	whatsoever to the Tribunal's term of reference. We	
22	have checked with Mr. Hone and his recollection is that	
23	the minute is accurate, he was asked and attended a	
24	meeting where they discussed at a very high level how	
25	referrals were being made. He addressed this in his	1:22
26	evidence, you will recall, Chairman, where he said at	
27	the time Tusla were concerned that they weren't getting	
28	very much information in referrals, and that they	
29	needed more information, and this document confirms the	

1 accuracy of that evidence; which is, it appears he was 2 asked to attend a meeting where he made the point I 3 would like to get more information when you make There is no mention of Garda Harrison 4 5 there. Mr. Hone doesn't recall any mention of Garda 11:22 Harrison at the meeting. And insofar as Tusla were 6 7 asked to discover documentation relating to Garda 8 Harrison, they discovered documentation relating to Garda Harrison, and they didn't discover documentation 9 that doesn't relate to Garda Harrison, of which there 10 11 · 23 11 is clearly a very large volume existing. So that's the 12 simple position, and obviously Mr. Hone is more than 13 happy to make a statement or give evidence simply to 14 confirm that. But this appears to be a completely irrelevant document. Clearly the Gardaí and the HSE 15 11:23 16 and Tusla are meeting all of the time about all kinds 17 of issues, but what this Tribunal is looking at is the 18 case of Garda Harrison, so here is a document that 19 doesn't mention him and there it is. But we will 20 obviously assist the Tribunal in any way we possibly 11:23 can, if somebody thinks this could in some way be 21 22 Mr. Hone is happy -- he can't put it any 23 further than that minute but would be more than happy, 24 if required, to make a statement or give evidence to 25 confirm that position. And what we haven't been able 11 · 23 26 to ascertain is, how he came to attend the meeting. 27 Presumably either somebody rang him or emailed him and said will you attend and he attended. And that's the 28 minute: the minute is then what was discussed. 29

1	hope that's of some assistance to the Tribunal.	
2	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
3	MR. McDERMOTT: As I said, we will provide whatever	
4	assistance we can if anybody wants to explore did A	
5	phone B, did B phone A or any other issue relating to	11:24
6	how Mr. Hone came to attend a meeting where he was	
7	indicating he'd like to get more information when	
8	referrals are made.	
9	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Is Mr. Hone available?	
10	MR. McDERMOTT: He is in Donegal at the moment, so not	11:24
11	immediately, but we will make him available as soon as	
12	may be if anybody wants to explore it further.	
13	CHAIRMAN: Well, Donegal, speaking from experience,	
14	depending on where you are, is a five-hour drive away,	
15	so it can't be today.	11:25
16	MR. McDERMOTT: It wouldn't be today if he was	
17	required.	
18	CHAIRMAN: Yes. What other meetings, I wonder,	
19	Mr. McDermott, were there between the Gardaí and	
20	Mr. Hone in relation to, I suppose, policy matters	11:25
21	or that kind of thing? In other words, what is our	
22	documentation like? Can we do it better? Where	
23	potentially there might have been some reference to	
24	this particular case as opposed to any one of the other	
25	29 referrals up to November 2013.	11:25
26	MR. McDERMOTT: Yes, Chairman, my instructions are we	
27	have discovered everything relating to Garda Harrison.	
28	Obviously if the Tribunal starts going down the road of	
29	meetings that don't involve Garda Harrison or where he	

1	is not mentioned, presumably Tusla and the Gardaí are	
2	talking and meeting and interacting all of the time,	
3	so yes.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Mr. McDermott, what is the legal	
5	definition of relevance?	11:25
6	MR. McDERMOTT: I think, certainly in a court case, you	
7	identify the issues by reference to the Pleadings.	
8	There are no Pleadings in a tribunal, but a tribunal	
9	has to have focus. And I think on a number of	
LO	occasions during the Tribunal when the Chair, when you,	11:26
L1	sir, have engaged with counsel and said why are you	
L2	asking these things or what is the purpose of this, on	
L3	occasion the answer seems to have been this is	
L4	inquisitorial, therefore we can ask anything and raise	
L5	any issue. My understanding of an inquisitorial	11:26
L6	process, even in a civil law system, is, it has to have	
L7	a focus, there has to be an issue. I know the courts	
L8	have said you shouldn't use the word allegations	
L9	because a tribunal isn't investigating allegations, but	
20	it is investigating claims and there has to be a focus	11:26
21	and that is why you have a term of reference. So, the	
22	term of reference relates to Garda Harrison and we have	
23	sought to disclose documents and sought to give	
24	evidence relating to Garda Harrison. And that's as far	
25	as it goes. But of course, presumably the Gardaí and	11:27
26	Tusla in Donegal must have a huge number of	
27	interactions that don't deal with Garda Harrison, and	
28	that is the position. If one starts going down that	
29	avenue we could be here for a very long time. But	

1	obviously we will do whatever we are asked to do. But
2	I think we are satisfied you have heard the evidence
3	relating to Garda Harrison. There was a referral,
4	there was a meeting with Garda Harrison and Ms. Simms,
5	and then there was a follow-up meeting with the
6	children, they both went very well, and Tusla wrote a
7	letter saying that's the end of it, do you have any
8	queries? That is it. There isn't anything further
9	that we are aware of, sir.
10	CHAIRMAN: Mr. McDermott, if you go back and you think, 11:2
11	is there a focus to this? Well, it seems to me
12	yesterday I tried to outline what I was thinking of,
13	and that's not a bad exercise because if a judge
14	retires to write a judgment, the first question that
15	occurs to one's mind is: What exactly is this case
16	about? Now, I focused lastly on the letter to Minister
17	Zappone of the 10th February 2017, and in terms of
18	focus, and in terms of identifying what needs to be
19	decided, it's clear that it is said that the HSE were
20	influenced in their actions by the Garda Síochána 11:2
21	leaning on them. The HSE have said before the
22	Tribunal, no, in fact if the Gardaí had actually shown
23	us the statement or given us a proper précis in
24	relation to it we would have actually done a lot more.
25	How much more is up in the air because it wasn't
26	followed up, but certainly there would have been
27	separate meetings, there would have been no question of
28	Keith Harrison living with the children of Marisa
29	Simms. And what might have happened after that, I

don't know. But certainly it was a response on a different level to having a chat in an office and having a 15-minute chat in a house. But what is claimed is that through very specific evidence relayed by Marisa Simms to Garda Keith Harrison, one of the 11:29 social workers divulged that the Gardaí had leaned on Now, I know Marisa Simms hasn't stood over that and indeed the questions asked by counsel for Marisa Simms seem to devolve down to not a communication in words but something to do with the look on her face. 11 · 29 So the focus, if there is a focus, is: Was there any leaning at all? I suppose this is a meeting where potentially one might say there could be such leaning, it's a meeting we don't know about. I agree there may be other meetings, but if one goes back to the classic 11:30 definition of a fact in issue, that is a fact upon which the result of the case may turn; and relevance means another fact which may influence the outcome of the fact in issue. So, in a court case obviously people would call evidence that is relevant to 11:30 themselves, in an inquiry one has to find out what might be potentially relevant, and it looks to me as if potentially this could be something where just such a matter as whether or not the précis provided orally by Sergeant McGovern to Tusla was or was not adequate and 11:30 could things have been improved. In other words, it could come up as an example. So, therefore, I would be happier to see Mr. Hone back and to see what the story is in relation to that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

MR. McDERMOTT: Of course, Chairman. Absolutely. 1 2 CHAIRMAN: Now, could I just ask the Garda 3 Commissioner, just dealing with this document alone, please, for the moment, because we will get into a 4 5 tangle or my mind will get into a tangle if we have to 11:31 6 look at everything all at once. So, what is the 7 situation there? I mean, you are under an obligation, as you appreciate, to cooperate with the Tribunal. 8 MR. DIGNAM: Yes, sir. 9 You appreciate as well that you have to look 11:31 10 11 for everything that is potentially relevant. And, what 12 is the situation vis-á-vis this only coming late? 13 MR. DIGNAM: Yes, Chairman, and I will confine my 14 remarks at this stage to this document as the Tribunal has requested. Chairman, in my respectful submission, 15 11:31 16 this document when disclosure was being made, simply 17 wouldn't have appeared relevant to anybody who looked 18 I can appreciate, and readily appreciate, how 19 it has become of interest, if I put that way, and I will address the test of relevance in just a moment. 20 11:32 but it has become of interest as the Tribunal has 21 22 progressed, as issues have been clarified and as issues 23 have been explored by the Tribunal. As Mr. McGuinness 24 has indicated, a number of the relevant Gardaí, if I 25 might put it that way, were present, and Mr. Hone, who 11:32 26 is obviously a witness for Tusla, for the HSE was also 27 present. So I can see how, as the organic process of the Tribunal has proceeded, it has become of interest 28 29 and, as I say, I can appreciate why Tribunal counsel

have identified it as being a document of interest.

In relation to the strict legal sense of relevance -- So, in those circumstances, Chairman, if this document had been looked at a number of months ago, it wouldn't have appeared to be relevant and, therefore, wouldn't have been expected to be provided to the Tribunal at that stage.

11:32

11:33

11:33

11:33

In relation to the test of relevance, Chairman, one of the ingredients of that is, if it reasonably gives rise to a line of inquiry. And I think I can't gainsay or dispute that, in light of the evidence that has been given and in light of some of the submissions, for example, that has been made by Mr. Harty, that it doesn't reasonably give rise to a line of inquiry. It may well be that Mr. Harty will want to inquire of the people who were at that meeting what was discussed, was Garda Harrison discussed, was Garda Harrison's case discussed, and in those circumstances it is a matter which is properly before the Tribunal at this stage, and which Mr. Harty may wish to use in cross-examining any relevant witnesses.

 CHAIRMAN: Well, of -- sorry, yes?

MR. DIGNAM:

point I would make in relation to the issue which the

I might just conclude, Chairman, just one

Chair identified as being a possible line of inquiry,

is the fact that it is alleged that pressure was

brought to bear on -- it is alleged, sorry, that the

1	social worker said that pressure was brought to bear by	
2	her on her on her management. I don't think it was	
3	ever said that that pressure was brought to bear by	
4	Mr. Hone and Mr. Hone was the only person present. So,	
5	we are now going one step further. Because the case	11:34
6	that would have to be made is that Mr. Hone was	
7	pressurised at a meeting with An Garda Síochána, he	
8	then brought pressure on the social work team leader	
9	who then brought pressure to bear on the social worker.	
10	CHAIRMAN: Well, no, I appreciate nobody has alleged	11:34
11	that. But of the people at the meeting who is	
12	available?	
13	MR. DIGNAM: Superintendent McGovern obviously is	
14	readily available, not today, Chairman.	
15	CHAIRMAN: Well, he is up in Buncrana?	11:34
16	MR. DIGNAM: Yes.	
17	CHAIRMAN: Chief Superintendent McGinn is here.	
18	MR. DIGNAM: Yes. Sergeant Peter Duffy is here.	
19	Superintendent Finan, I understand has gone back to	
20	Donegal after giving evidence yesterday.	11:34
21	CHAIRMAN: He was here yesterday.	
22	MR. DIGNAM: Yes. And the Tribunal will be aware of	
23	that Superintendent Archbold has passed away.	
24	Inspector Harrison, I would have to make inquiries in	
25	relation to that, but he hasn't been in attendance at	11:35
26	the Tribunal, Chair.	
27	CHAIRMAN: But he was just an acting inspector.	
28	MR. DIGNAM: Yes.	
29	CHAIRMAN: An acting superintendent.	

1	MR. DIGNAM: Yes.
2	CHAIRMAN: Sergeant Duffy, haven't we had Sergeant
3	Duffy at some stage?
4	MR. DIGNAM: No, we haven't. But he is present.
5	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, I am actually mixing him up with 11:35
6	Garda Karl Campbell, who was here yesterday.
7	MR. DIGNAM: Yes. We did hear from a Sergeant Karen
8	Duffy in the last module.
9	CHAIRMAN: Oh, yes, that's right. So then turning to
10	Mr. Harty; Mr. Harty, do you want to have some of these 11:35
11	called? Let's just stick with one document at the
12	moment, so we won't get mixed up.
13	MR. HARTY: Firstly, Mr. Dignam very fairly set out the
14	test which ought to be applied in respect of the
15	discovery of documents, which is the train of inquiry 11:35
16	test. It, therefore, is a broader test than what would
17	appear to be material. And my worry is that Mr. Dignam
18	and Mr. McDermott have both indicated that they have
19	engaged in strictly material searches in relation to
20	matters to date, and that simply will not meet the 11:36
21	requirements of the Tribunal in carrying out its
22	investigation, because it is the question of a document
23	that leads to a train of inquiry is the relevant test.
24	And undoubtedly reference contacts between An Garda
25	Síochána and the HSE in respect of other cases would
26	not be material and would not lead to a train of
27	inquiry, but contacts between An Garda Síochána and the
28	HSE in relation to the manner in which contacts are
29	being made is a matter which would be directly relevant

2 3 what has not been clarified by Mr. McDermott - and I appreciate he has had some short period of time to deal 4 5 with this - is how this meeting came about; Mr. Hone's 11:37 notes in relation to it; any documentation received by 6 7 Mr. Hone in relation to it. It would appear to be 8 clear that Tusla or the HSE have limited their searches to documentation referencing An Garda Síochána and 9 Garda Harrison as a combined three-point search. And 10 11:37 11 that simply would not be sufficient to meet the tests 12 of the train of inquiry test for relevance. 13 Mr. Dignam, I think, appreciates that the train of 14 inquiry test is the appropriate test and certainly contacts between Chief Superintendent McGinn, 15 11:38 16 Superintendent McGovern, on a lesser basis in this case Superintendent Finan in that he indicated that he had 17 18 no awareness at all of the Tusla reference and didn't 19 know it was going to happen, they are clearly relevant 20 and as such, recalling the witnesses unfortunately will 11:38 not be sufficient absent full and proper searches of 21 22 train of inquiry relevance of documentation. 23 So you are saying my test is Peruvian Guano? CHAIRMAN: 24 It is still the test. It is still MR. HARTY: Yes. the law in this jurisdiction. They have attempted to 25 11:38 change it in other jurisdictions. 26 27 Am I not entitled to inquire into what I 28 feel is relevant myself. I mean, why am I bound by 29 Peruvian Guano? Is there any case which says Peruvian

in that they would lead to a train of inquiry.

1	Guano is the test which tribunals should follow? I am	
2	asking that question I am asking that	
3	MR. HARTY: Obviously I can't make	
4	CHAIRMAN: I am continuing to speak Mr. Harty. I am	
5	asking that question because in England and Wales they 11:3	39
6	have said this is ridiculous, that discovery will go on	
7	forever and in consequence of that they have moved to a	
8	reasonable search for documents. Now am I not entitled	
9	to make any own inquiries on things? I mean, if this	
10	appears to be relevant of course I am going to follow 11:3	39
11	what you say, but a train of inquiry that leads to a	
12	train of inquiry, is that not too wide? That is my	
13	only question.	
14	MR. HARTY: The answer is that the courts in the UK and	
15	Wales have thrown out <u>Peruvian Guano</u> , leading to	39
16	problems immediately. And the Irish courts, when	
17	offered the same choice, have to date stuck with	
18	Peruvian Guano and it remains the law in Ireland. And	
19	in those circumstances and it is my view, that	
20	Peruvian Guano in any event is the correct test. I am 11:3	39
21	not suggesting that anybody should swamp anyone with	
22	documentation, but if the test is being if the	
23	searches are being carried out on an incorrect basis,	
24	then it is clear that there would be other	
25	documentation that are relevant that is relevant, I $_{ m 11:4}$	10
26	should say.	
27	CHAIRMAN: Why do you say that? Why do you think	
28	there's more documents some place? I mean, how are	
29	they going to help on the issue as to whether the HSE	

1 was lent on by the Garda? That is what I am inquiring 2 into.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

The situation is that, as Chief MR. HARTY: Superintendent McGinn was giving evidence we received her diary entry, which didn't come up in the Garda search because it didn't mention Tusla. This document that we have before us still hasn't been produced or the Tusla version of it, the Tusla side of it, still hasn't been produced by Tusla because it doesn't mention Garda Keith Harrison. But they are clearly relevant in circumstances whereby evidence has been given by Mr. Hone that he had no further contact. Now, in fact, we do now know that he attended a meeting. still don't know what was at that meeting, how he came to be there, why he came to be there. Was it reference 11:41 the Simms/Harrison family that gave rise to this meeting being called? These are questions I don't -train of inquiry, these are the questions that arise. CHAIRMAN: No, no, Mr. Harty, I can't have a dialogue with you if every time I try to speak you actually It doesn't help. So please don't interrupt me. I am simply asking you this, and all I interrupt. wanted to interrupt and ask you a question was, and it's pretty normal in exchanges with counsel: Look, the meeting is actually headed, it says "re HSE referrals", and it seems in general terms to be about the whole notion of HSE referrals, now I mean are you saying that Tusla and the HSE are actually in default in not producing this document so far?

11:40

11 · 40

11:41

11 · 41

1	MR. HARTY: Yes, absolutely.	
2	CHAIRMAN: You are. And in what way are they in	
3	default?	
4	MR. HARTY: Firstly, because I have questions that	
5	arise instantly from it, which means that to an	1:42
6	inquiring mind they clearly give rise to a train of	
7	inquiry. They are therefore relevant. And therefore,	
8	they are in default. This is contact between four	
9	witnesses to this Tribunal who have already given	
10	evidence in respect of the issues of how Gardaí carry	1:42
11	out HSE referrals. If it gives rise to an inquiry it	
12	is relevant. And even now, the HSE have not produced	
13	the documentation giving rise to this meeting.	
14	CHAIRMAN: You mean the email perhaps inviting Gerry	
15	Hone?	1:42
16	MR. HARTY: Or, was it Gerry Hone who called the	
17	meeting? Even that question I don't know the answer	
18	to.	
19	CHAIRMAN: Or the other way around, yes.	
20	MR. HARTY: I literally don't know.	1:43
21	CHAIRMAN: Yes, okay.	
22	MR. HARTY: So it is definitely relevant. And the	
23	searches are clearly not being carried out on the	
24	correct basis.	
25	CHAIRMAN: Well, searches take an enormous amount of	1:43
26	time and trouble and, you know, there's debates about	
27	what are the right search words, etcetera, and with	
28	hundreds of thousands of emails, and I am sure in the	
29	case of HSE or Tusla you are talking about millions of	

1	emails, one has to narrow it down in some respect.
2	What is your suggestion, Mr. Harty, in relation to this
3	issue and what is your suggestion as to what I might
4	do?
5	MR. HARTY: In relation to the HSE, if I were doing 11:43
6	if I was suggesting search terms for an electronic
7	document search I would suggest that the names of any
8	of the Garda witnesses before this Tribunal, for a
9	limited period, obviously, from the start of October to
10	the start of March; the general meetings, and the
11	search terms in relation to that
12	CHAIRMAN: Wait a minute. Just go back. From the
13	start of October when? And why October?
14	MR. HARTY: Because that is when the referral was made.
15	CHAIRMAN: I know.
16	MR. HARTY: The 8th October. The 8th October was the
17	date 8th October 2013.
18	CHAIRMAN: Until when?
19	MR. HARTY: 1st march I think would be a date that
20	would
21	CHAIRMAN: Why is the 1st March a good date?
22	MR. HARTY: Because we know that the HSE had closed its
23	file just the week prior, the 27th of February. So
24	that is the relevant period.
25	CHAIRMAN: Yes. So 27th February?
26	MR. HARTY: Yes. And in that regard it would strike me
27	that the appropriate Gardaí whose name should be
28	searched against are Chief Superintendent McGinn,
29	Superintendent McGovern, Inspector Sheridan and

Sergeant McGowan. In that there is no question of any	
contacts by anybody else or involvement by anybody else	
in relation to that, in relation to the Harrison case.	
CHAIRMAN: You will appreciate at this stage,	
Mr. Harty, that Marisa Simms did not stand over her	11:45
allegation that the social worker told her in her home	
that she was leaned on, her principal, Bridgeen Smith,	
was leaned on, and that what I am going on here is a	
hearsay account of what allegedly Marisa Simms said to	
Garda Keith Harrison in consequence of the social	11:45
worker going out the door. I mean, I am apparently	
being expected to condemn social workers and the Gardaí	
on the basis of a piece of evidence that the person who	
is expected to know most about it isn't even prepared	
to swear to, despite having written to a minister of	11:45
government to that effect in February of this year.	
MR. HARTY: The Tribunal is and Mr. McDermott	
referred to the €1 stamp. Had the €1 stamp been spent	
what we would have received was documentation showing	
that a referral was made and rejected, that there was	11:46
subsequently a meeting, that subsequent to that meeting	
nothing was done until after a phone call was made on	
the documentation by Donna McTeague asking about the	
process of the criminal investigation, that is what the	
documentation tells us, and then the following	11:46
meetings. What the evidence has told us is that	
Sergeant McGowan now says that she made the phone call	
to advise somebody in Tusla, and she didn't say who,	
that the statement of Marisa Simms had been withdrawn.	

1	Donna McTeague did not agree with her written evidence
2	in relation to it and said that it wasn't about the
3	process of the criminal investigation, and that while
4	it was misleading it wasn't quite why she made the
5	call. In relation to that, the €1 stamp would not have 11:47
6	answered our questions. The question of when somebody
7	may have put pressure or somebody else, whether or not
8	the pressure was put on and whatever is reported by way
9	of third parties, whether the pressure was put on
10	before the first office visit or between the office 11:47
11	visit and the home visit, is something that the
12	Tribunal has to assess on the basis of the evidence
13	before it. But it is patently clear that absent a
14	contact from An Garda Síochána to the HSE in January,
15	there is no other starting gun for the visit, the 11:48
16	contact made by Donna McTeague to Marisa Simms and
17	Keith Harrison.
18	
19	So while it may not be stood over in relation to what
20	was said, this Tribunal has no proper explanation as to $_{11:48}$
21	the inertia on the part of the HSE between the 21st
22	October and the beginning of February.
23	CHAIRMAN: Well, these are very good closing
24	submissions, if I may say so, Mr. Harty, and very
25	interesting. Now the question before us is: What do 11:48
26	we do? And you suggest a fresh search.
27	MR. HARTY: I suggest a fresh search.
28	CHAIRMAN: And in terms of witnesses, what do you
29	suggest?

1	MR. HARTY: Well, obviously a search precedes the
2	witnesses and the necessity for calling any witness may
3	be minimised on the basis of the search and what is
4	produced in that search.
5	CHAIRMAN: So who do you suggest should be called? We 11:49
6	are just again dealing with this document.
7	MR. HARTY: With this document.
8	CHAIRMAN: And at the moment I am finding it hard to be
9	suspicious, but I appreciate that you are making a case
10	here. It seems, as I say, to be a high-level meeting, 11:49
11	but of the people at the meeting who do you want to
12	have called?
13	MR. HARTY: Who would be necessary
14	CHAIRMAN: No, no, I think
15	MR. HARTY: Sorry.
16	CHAIRMAN: you make the submission and I make the
17	decision. So, who do you think should be called? Who
18	do you feel ought to be called?
19	MR. HARTY: Necessary in relation to that document, but
20	limited to that document on the basis of the search 11:49
21	that is being carried out, is Chief Superintendent
22	McGinn, Superintendent McGovern, in terms of
23	Superintendent Finan I don't see that he can be have
24	had the Harrison case or the Harrison/Simms case in his
25	mind when he didn't know that there was a
26	Harrison/Simms reference.
27	CHAIRMAN: Well, I mean, that sounds to me to be
28	sensible because certainly he didn't know a great deal
29	about it when he gave evidence yesterday.

MR. HARTY: He knew nothing yesterday. And obviously Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: And you are happy to accept that? MR. HARTY: Well, I have no difficulty with the evidence. His evidence was that the discussion in relation to the HSE took place at sometime when he wasn't present. CHAIRMAN: So it's Chief Superintendent McGinn, Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE? MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: well, that is the problem with inquiries, that is a problem with tribunals and that is presumably			
CHAIRMAN: And you are happy to accept that? MR. HARTY: Well, I have no difficulty with the evidence. His evidence was that the discussion in relation to the HSE took place at sometime when he wasn't present. CHAIRMAN: So it's Chief Superintendent McGinn, Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE? MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	1	MR. HARTY: He knew nothing yesterday. And obviously	
MR. HARTY: Well, I have no difficulty with the evidence. His evidence was that the discussion in relation to the HSE took place at sometime when he wasn't present. CHAIRMAN: So it's Chief Superintendent McGinn, Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE? MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	2	Mr. Hone.	
evidence. His evidence was that the discussion in relation to the HSE took place at sometime when he wasn't present. CHAIRMAN: So it's Chief Superintendent McGinn, Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE? MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	3	CHAIRMAN: And you are happy to accept that?	
relation to the HSE took place at sometime when he wasn't present. CHAIRMAN: So it's Chief Superintendent McGinn, Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE? MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	4	MR. HARTY: Well, I have no difficulty with the	
CHAIRMAN: So it's Chief Superintendent McGinn, Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE? MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan? MGGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a information of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	5	evidence. His evidence was that the discussion in	1:50
CHAIRMAN: So it's Chief Superintendent McGinn, Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE? MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. 11:31 CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. 11:31 CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	6	relation to the HSE took place at sometime when he	
Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE? MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a information of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	7	wasn't present.	
MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	8	CHAIRMAN: So it's Chief Superintendent McGinn,	
believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	9	Superintendent McGovern and Gerry Hone of HSE?	
be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	10	MR. HARTY: And there is an argument and my solicitor	1:50
meeting and why this meeting had to take place. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	11	believes that Ms. Smith and Ms. McGowan ought perhaps	
CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith? MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a trist train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	12	be recalled, perhaps as to the necessity for this	
MR. HARTY: Yes. CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	13	meeting and why this meeting had to take place.	
CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan? MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	14	CHAIRMAN: Ms. Bridgeen Smith?	
MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	15	MR. HARTY: Yes.	1:51
McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	16	CHAIRMAN: And Sergeant McGowan?	
Smith I think is the she was the point of contact, one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	17	MR. HARTY: Sergeant McGowan sorry, not Sergeant	
one below Mr. Hone. CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	18	McGowan, she wasn't at that meeting. Ms. Bridgeen	
CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere. MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	19	Smith I think is the she was the point of contact,	
MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	20	one below Mr. Hone.	1:51
necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	21	CHAIRMAN: But she is not mentioned anywhere.	
came about. I am fishing in the absence of any information as to potential. The document has caused a train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	22	MR. HARTY: She is not mentioned anywhere, but the	
25 information as to potential. The document has caused a 11:51 26 train of inquiry in my mind and absent other 27 documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. 28 CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	23	necessity you see, I don't know how this meeting	
train of inquiry in my mind and absent other documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	24	came about. I am fishing in the absence of any	
documentation the inquiry is broad reaching. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	25	information as to potential. The document has caused a $^{\scriptscriptstyle 4}$	1:51
CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	26	train of inquiry in my mind and absent other	
, i , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	27	documentation the inquiry is broad reaching.	
that is a problem with tribunals and that is presumably	28	CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the problem with inquiries,	
	29	that is a problem with tribunals and that is presumably	

1 why some of them have gone on for decades. There has 2 to come a point where I am entitled to say no, enough. MR. McDERMOTT: Chairman, if it assists, I have checked 3 and Mr. Hone is available in the morning and it may be 4 5 this issue could be dealt with in five minutes. 11:52 6 What do you say about a search, 7 Mr. McDermott. 8 MR. MCDERMOTT: If Mr. Hone gives evidence for five minutes in the morning he will either say yes, the 9 minute is accurate, we just discussed high level things 11:52 10 11 and then he can be asked by Mr. Harty was there a 12 secret discussion not recorded in the minutes where you 13 actually all had a discussion about doing down Garda 14 Harrison, and Mr. Hone can then say yes, that is what 15 happened, or he can say, no, that didn't happen, and 11:52 16 that would be the end of the issue. In terms of 17 disclosure, we made disclosure on the basis of the term 18 of reference. The term of reference is to investigate 19 contacts between members of An Garda Síochána and Tusla 20 in relation to Garda Keith Harrison. And obviously, 11:52 the last six words of that sentence appear to be the 21 22 important ones, and the six words which give the rest 23 of the sentence its meaning. We are satisfied we have disclosed documents that identify contacts between 24 members of the Gardaí and Tusla in relation to Garda 25 11:53 Harrison. Here is a minute of a meeting that doesn't 26 27 involve Garda Harrison, and therefore it wasn't disclosed. That is as far as I can put it. 28 29 MR. HARTY: Sir, if I could reply to that briefly.

1 CHAIRMAN: Yes, I just wanted to ask him one question, 2 Mr. Harty, please. You are possibly aware of the quote attributed to a famous professor of theology in 3 relation to a PhD by one of his students, I can't say 4 5 it in German I am afraid, something like for 'heaven's 11:53 6 sake, have the courage to leave gaps', by doing what 7 you suggest am I not leaving gaps? First question. 8 Secondly, am I entitled to leave gaps? That is a question for you, Mr. McDermott. 9 MR. McDERMOTT: Sorry, Chairman, I think the position 10 11:54 11 is, once you start getting into meetings that don't 12 involve Garda Harrison that is not a finite category of 13 inquiry or disclosure that can ever be made. The only 14 way we can assist the Tribunal is on the basis of a 15 defined subject matter. And, as we understood it, the 11:54 16 defined subject matter are contacts between the Gardaí and Tusla in relation to Garda Harrison. But I think 17 18 the only way I can advance it and help the Tribunal, 19 which is obviously what we are trying to do, is to say let Mr. Hone attend in the morning and within two 20 11:54 minutes we will quickly find out was this a meeting at 21 22 which Garda Harrison was discussed, in which case 23 Mr. Hone can and should be questioned as to: 24 you discuss about him? Why did you discuss him? What 25 was said about him? Or, was it a meeting where he 11:55 In which case that would seem to be 26 wasn't discussed? 27 the end of the matter. So, like all conspiracies, one can perhaps talk all day about what might have 28 29 happened, and clearly any time a member of the Gardaí

bumped into a member of Tusla in the street in Donegal, they could have discussed Garda Harrison, every time they were both in a petrol station filling up their cars at the same time they could have discussed Garda Harrison, every time they were in an ATM queue they 11:55 could have discussed Garda Harrison, but all we can really do is try to identify any records or any conversations we are aware of where Garda Harrison's case was discussed, and we have done our best to do that within the, I suppose, scope of human fallibility. 11:55 And we will continue to try to do that. But as I said, the best we can do to assist is to make Mr. Hone available at the earliest opportunity in the morning and immediately identify what happened at the meeting and did he phone and say, can I come to a meeting, or 11:56 did someone phone him and say, can you come to a meeting. And I don't know if either answer will assist anybody, but we will find out who called who. CHAIRMAN: Yes. what do you say about Bridgeen Smith? I can't understand why she would be MR. MCDERMOTT: 11:56 called to give evidence about a meeting she wasn't at. And I surmise some attempt is now being made to recall witnesses perhaps to make a case that was never made when they were in the box. I mean, we are talking about one minute of one meeting at which one of my 11:56 witnesses was present. And if we call Bridgeen Smith we probably should recall every Tusla witness to say, what do you know about the meeting you weren't at? Presumably the answer would be relatively concise; I

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1	don't know anything about the meeting I wasn't at. But	
2	if there is an enthusiasm to pursue that for a few	
3	hours again we will assist in any way that we can.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Well, I don't want to ask somebody to get	
5	into a car and drive down from Donegal. I mean, apart 1	1:57
6	from anything else, I feel for the risk of any accident	
7	that might occur. So I don't want to call anybody	
8	unless it's absolutely essential. I mean, that seems	
9	to me to be the right test. So look, I have heard	
10	submissions, unless anybody else wants to say	1:57
11	anything Mr. Harty, you wanted to reply briefly.	
12	MR. HARTY: Firstly in relation to secret discussions	
13	at meetings, I am not characterising anything as secret	
14	or otherwise. In relation to what Mr. McDermott has	
15	just said, it is clear that they have run the most	1:57
16	limited possible search terms in relation to this	
17	documentation. He doesn't even look for documentation	
18	referencing Simms.	
19	CHAIRMAN: Have you done a search in relation to the	
20	Simms?	1:57
21	MR. McDERMOTT: Yes. Broad computer searches were done	
22	to make sure we captured any document that could come	
23	within the term of reference.	
24	CHAIRMAN: All right.	
25	MR. HARTY: Sorry, but in relation to the limit, this	1:57
26	meeting, which both the Tribunal and I agree is	
27	relevant, as the Gardaí appear to agree is relevant,	
28	there must be some HSE documentation in relation to it.	
29	CHAIRMAN: There may be. I mean, one of the things	

that one might expect is, say a letter or an email, I	
beg your pardon, from somebody in divisional	
headquarters saying, look, this whole subject of	
referrals has got a bit chaotic and we want to have a	
meeting and see can we sort it out. I mean, it would	11:58
seem in the ordinary course of events to be something	
like that. It's not, however, in the slightest bit	
likely that anyone would put in that anything to do	
with Garda Keith Harrison or any plans that they had in	
relation to it, but the meeting obviously just didn't	11:58
take place because a number of people happened to be in	
the same queue at Family Meats, the famous butchers in	
Donegal Town, so there must be something leading behind	
it, and I am wondering, Mr. McDermott, why the HSE	
haven't found that. And I am not saying any of this is	11:59
an alarm bell, I am not at all, but I am just raising a	
query. So, do you have I mean, it's clear a meeting	
can't take place without people arranging meeting, so	
we don't have any arranging the meeting stuff.	
MR. McDERMOTT: No. And nor did we produce this	11:59
minute. It's because this was a meeting that didn't	
involve Garda Harrison, and so, didn't appear to	
involve or be relevant to an inquiry into Garda	
Harrison. I can't put it any further than that, other	
than making Mr. Hone available at the first opportunity	11:59
to indicate or to confirm that Garda Harrison wasn't	
discussed at the meeting and if he wasn't discussed at	
the meeting, it's not immediately obvious.	
CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, can you look for whatever led up	

1	to the meeting?	
2	MR. McDERMOTT: We will ask him to bring tomorrow	
3	anything relevant to the meeting.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Yes, I think we'd need to have it. Now, the	
5	burden unfortunately in relation to everything being	1:59
6	captured virtually electronically is that compared to	
7	30 or 40 years ago there is a vast amount of	
8	documentation. I appreciate that, and I appreciate how	
9	difficult it is for people. But equally, the facility	
10	that is available to get stuff together by email and	2:00
11	attach it, surely can be used in relation to this. So	
12	you don't just come up with a bunch of stuff, you can	
13	actually send it to the Tribunal and also just	
14	distribute it by email yourself prior to anyone	
15	arriving. I am sure you have Mr. Harty's email and	2:00
16	that can be done, can't it? So do you want more than	
17	that, Mr. Harty? Are you suggesting I should do more	
18	than that?	
19	MR. HARTY: I think that the relevant searches would be	
20	contacts between members of An Garda Síochána and 1	2:00
21	the identified members of An Garda Síochána and Tusla,	
22	from October to March. And that is the relevant	
23	searches that should be made. In relation to that, the	
24	Tribunal will recall the startling evidence that even	
25	though Sergeant Brigid McGowan said she was in regular 🕣	2:01
26	contact with Tusla, Ms. Bridgeen Smith says she didn't	
27	have any contact, the principal social worker didn't	
28	have any contact with Brigid McGowan from 21st October	
29	until the day after the until the week after, I	

1	should say, the closure of the investigation, HSE	
2	investigation, into the Simms children.	
3	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
4	MR. HARTY: And that would be relevant because that is	
5	directly relevant to her evidence. And if there is	12:01
6	documentation in relation to that, that is directly	
7	relevant and calls into question I don't believe	
8	that it is possible to deal with this tomorrow, in	
9	circumstances where the searches that have been carried	
10	out have been so restrictive in the manner which they	12:01
11	have been carried out.	
12	CHAIRMAN: What do you suggest?	
13	MR. HARTY: I would suggest a broader search needs to	
14	be carried out in relation to contact between, and as I	
15	say, I have identified the	12:02
16	CHAIRMAN: Yes. But, can I tell you, Mr. Harty, I	
17	actually don't want to know the HSE meeting the Garda	
18	about the unfortunate cases that have been referred to	
19	prior to and somewhere about children being locked up	
20	in the dog cages that people tend to use nowadays and	12:02
21	the revelations during sexual education classes. I	
22	mean, they are going on all the time and I am sure	
23	there's hundreds and thousands of them. I don't want	
24	to know about those. I mean, I don't see why I should	
25	know about them.	12:02
26	MR. HARTY: And neither do I, but there aren't hundreds	
27	and thousands. There is reference in this to 29	
28	referrals in the year, 29th of November 2013.	
29	CHAIRMAN: Well, should I look at every single one of	

1	those?	
2	MR. HARTY: I don't think we need to look at every	
3	single one of them. I think we need documentation that	
4	deals with the contacts in relation to them.	
5	CHAIRMAN: But there has to be contacts in relation to 12:00	3
6	them. I mean, under the Children First Guidelines that	
7	is what it says; it says there should be contact,	
8	formal and informal. I mean, just, I don't know.	
9	MR. HARTY: The Children First Guidelines also say that	
10	records should be kept of all contacts and that is	3
11	something we now know didn't take place.	
12	CHAIRMAN: All right.	
13	MR. HARTY: So, I do not want myself to be journeying	
14	through vast amount of documentation of which the	
15	majority of which is blacked out. That is not 12:00	3
16	something I want, and the Tribunal will be fully aware	
17	why I don't want it. Nor do I want the Tribunal but	
18	I do want, if any witness is to be recalled, to ensure	
19	that we aren't met with a situation whereby this	
20	documentation, relevant documentation, isn't put. And 12:00	3
21	that is the chain of inquiry test in relation to it,	
22	not a search which says Garda Síochána, Tusla, Garda	
23	Keith Harrison, Marisa Simms. It's simply an	
24	inadequate search.	
25	CHAIRMAN: All right. Okay. Well, thank you very much 12:00	3
26	everyone for your submissions, let's deal with this	
27	document first. Now, there is, I think, two things	
28	that someone who is conducting any inquiry ought to be	
29	very well aware of, and the first is this: One can	

inquire and inquire and dig and the more you dig the larger the hole grows, but that doesn't necessarily mean that you are going to discover what you need to find. And so, there has to be a focus and the focus has to be reasonable. The submission has been that I 12:04 am stuck with the Peruvian Guano test. enlighten those who may not know about the Peruvian Guano test, it was a case in the 19th century, at a time when typewriters hadn't been invented and when people wrote to each other using possibly guill pens, 12:04 because again it was at a time when the fountain pen, that wonderful invention, was still in its infancy, and what that said was that the test for discovery is that you discover documents relevant to the facts in issue, which are defined in legal cases by the Pleadings, 'I 12:05 allege such-and-such' and the defendant denies such-and-such, and furthermore, that you should disclose documents which might lead to a document relevant to an issue in the Pleadings. So in other words, two-tier, not only what is directly relevant but 12:05 documents which might put people on a chain of inquiry leading to another document. I think it's too broad, but for the moment I am just going to apply it.

2425

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

The second thing that a judge needs to be aware of is this, it's very easily illustrated: In 1916 we had a revolution in this city and a man called Patrick Henry Pearse came out of the GPO and read a famous document. If you read the book by that great historian Charles

12:05

Townsend, and if you look at the documents in the military archives, you will realise that some people said that he came out and stood on the steps of the GPO, other people said that he went over to Nelson's Pillar, other people put him in a different place, and the reality is there was never any steps then and nor are there any steps now at the GPO, so he couldn't have been standing on the steps of the GPO. So, the fact people make mistakes is not necessarily an indication that they are lying; it is perhaps an indication that in any eyewitness account there may be divergencies, there may be mistakes in recollection, and what one is looking for is the overall picture.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

Now, what is to be done in relation to this? Well, the 12:06 document came to light, it seems, yesterday. I have examined it this morning. It's a divisional accountability meeting at Letterkenny Garda Station on 29th November 2013. Potentially that could be at a time when the HSE/Tusla investigation in relation to 12:06 the various domestic blisters, to use the words of Rita McDermott, between Marisa Simms and Keith Harrison, could have been in issue. He is not mentioned in the document anywhere, but Gerry Hone is mentioned, and the subject matter is: How are we doing referrals? 12:07 there any way we can do them better? And it is possible in that context, just possible, and I put it in the realm of possibility, certainly not even close to probability, that somebody might have mentioned

something in relation to Keith Harrison. meeting also had to come into being somehow. it just didn't happen. I gave a colourful example early on of people standing in a queue in Donegal Town in the Family Meats Butchers and deciding to have a meeting, that is not likely. So it seems to me there probably are some documents missing and we will look at it in the potential exercise of the possibility that something might emerge from that. So I would ask for that to be done.

12:07

12:08

12:08

12:09

11

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Now, I have been asked to go further, which is to say that, firstly, the searches conducted by the HSE/Tusla were inadequate, but the term of reference is, Garda Keith Harrison and contacts between the Garda and Tusla 12:08 in relation to him. So that is the search that has been done and that is what has been thrown up. don't intend to ask for a search to be done in relation to every Garda interaction over a four- or five-month period -- October, November, December, January, February, March, a six-month period, between the Garda and Tusla, because I just don't see that it's relevant. They have business interacting with each other. But I am asking that a further search should be done in relation to Garda Keith Harrison and any documents of any kind which mention him over that five-month period and I am asking as well that Gerry Hone should be I am not asking for Bridgeen Smith to be recalled. recalled, because I actually don't think that she has

anything to do with anything to do with this unless the documents so indicate. And it seems to me that Chief Superintendent McGinn and Superintendent McGovern should also give evidence in relation to that. And insofar as there may be officers journals or notebooks 12:09 in any way mentioning this, would they please just have another look and see if there is any mention of this and photocopy that? That can all be scanned into an email and I would ask that the HSE be so kind as to send that, not just directly to the Tribunal, please, 12:09 but also to the solicitors who are involved in the Tribunal.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

Now, when can we do that, is the next question? But we have another issue, which is another document, and 12:10 let's discuss the question of time when we have looked at that document. So maybe, Mr. McGuinness, you would be so kind as to outline that document to us. MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, Chairman. That is the minutes of a regional meeting held in Dundalk Garda Station on 5th 12:10 November of 2013. There is a wide attendance, starting with Assistant Commissioner Kenny listed as I think chairing the meeting, with all other relevant senior officers from, it would appear, each district and division within that region. Of note, if it is to be 12:10 noted, in fact, Chief Superintendent Sheridan was there, Chief Superintendent McGinn was there, and we have been furnished with the minutes of the meeting which encompass a total of five pages of very, very

extensive minutes of a large number of policing issues	
in the most general sense, with a report from each	
division, and the final sentence of the report relating	
to the Donegal division simply records that Chief	
Superintendent McGinn gave an overview of the	12:11
investigation in relation to Garda Keith Harrison.	
There is no express mention of a HSE referral or any	
other issue as such. So that's a document which I	
think the Garda Commissioner accepts ought to have been	
previously furnished to the Tribunal in terms of its	12:11
potential for a line of inquiry.	
CHAIRMAN: Where do you think the potential will bring	
us or could potentially bring us, Mr. McGuinness?	
MR. McGUINNESS: Well, I suppose just anchoring it in	
the evidence, obviously Chief Superintendent McGinn's	12:12
evidence is that she phoned Assistant Commissioner	
Kenny after the meeting of the 8th October to keep him	
informed, and the Tribunal had obviously received the	
documentation which it circulated, which showed the	
emails which went up to the assistant commissioner's	12:12
office from then on and including the reports which	
have been referred to in the last few days. So in one	
sense it's perhaps not surprising or in any way on	
first viewing it is not in any way a matter of great	
comment that the chief superintendent would be giving	12:12
an update at a divisional regional meeting. What Chief	
Superintendent McGinn told them is another matter, it's	
obviously not it's not gone into in any detail in	
the	

1	CHAIRMAN: No. I wonder, how often do these meetings
2	take place? Have we any idea about that?
3	MR. McGUINNESS: I think they are quarterly but I could
4	be wrong in that.
5	CHAIRMAN: Maybe someone might just take instructions 12:13
6	on that. Because this one is the 5th November and this
7	is the only one we have of a regional meeting, isn't
8	it?
9	MR. McGUINNESS: That is of any relevance, yes.
10	Obviously on a practical level 12:13
11	CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MCGINN: Chairman, they are
12	monthly meetings regionally.
13	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So it is a monthly management
14	meeting. Right.
15	MR. McGUINNESS: On a practical level, I suppose given 12:13
16	that Chief Superintendent McGinn is to be recalled in
17	relation to the other document, certainly it seems an
18	appropriate inquiry to make about what was discussed
19	and why it was discussed, etcetera, and what records
20	there may be of it. Other than that, Chairman, I don't 12:13
21	see any possible relevance.
22	CHAIRMAN: Well, what am I supposed to do,
23	Mr. McGuinness? I mean, have you any potential
24	suggestion about it? I mean, we could look for months
25	for further regional I mean, potentially every 12:14
26	monthly management meeting the Gardaí hold, presumably
27	in Dundalk for the northern region, could have
28	mentioned Garda Keith Harrison.
29	MR. McGUINNESS: In fact, Chairman, we have been shown

1	others and there is no potential relevance in any
2	others that we have been shown.
3	CHAIRMAN: And I don't want to look into them because I
4	don't feel it's any of my business as to what the
5	police are doing about various investigations or what 12:14
6	resources they have or whatever.
7	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.
8	CHAIRMAN: I just don't want to know. But it's Keith
9	Harrison that is the focus of this.
10	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. Now, obviously the other officer $_{12:14}$
11	who is recorded as being present there is Chief
12	Superintendent Sheridan and we could potentially
13	require the submission of a statement from Chief
14	Superintendent Sheridan and see what he says and/or
15	whether it leads to his recall is another issue. But I $_{\rm 12:15}$
16	see no real objection to recalling Chief Superintendent
17	McGinn on that issue.
18	CHAIRMAN: What about Mr. McGoey?
19	MR. McGUINNESS: I don't see any relevance there.
20	CHAIRMAN: Well, he is the crime analyst, so it could 12:15
21	be that somebody mentioned the crimes allegedly
22	committed against Marisa Simms and he gave a view on
23	them. I mean, everyone else in the Tribunal has given
24	a view on that, why not Mr. McGoey?
25	MR. McGUINNESS: It's my understanding he was there to $_{12:15}$
26	deal with different issues and obviously they are
27	redacted matters that just don't concern any work of
28	the Tribunal.

29

CHAIRMAN: Okay. So, Mr. Dignam, do you want to make a

1 submission? I mean, where are we at in relation to 2 I could probably stay now here for another week 3 and we would probably get more documents, in which case I would be asked to do more things. Appreciating that, 4 5 you know, people look for things and they find things 12:16 6 and even in your own house if you have lost something 7 then something else will turn up even months later. 8 But even still. Chairman, there is an express reference to 9 MR. DIGNAM: Garda Harrison in the document and there is an express 10 12:16 11 reference to an investigation. I think it is a matter, 12 I think it is a document which should have been 13 provided at an earlier stage. We will have to wait to 14 hear what Chief Superintendent McGinn says about what 15 she said, because it may have had nothing to do with 12:16 16 the referral to Tusla but obviously the interaction between a referral to Tusla, a GSOC investigation and 17 18 possibly a criminal investigation is something which 19 Mr. Harty on behalf of Garda Harrison makes something 20 of and which the Tribunal has an interest in and a 12:16 legitimate interest in. 21 22 I don't know whether you have had a CHAIRMAN: Yes. 23 chance to have a chat with Chief Superintendent McGinn 24 this morning as to what her recollection of this is and 25 as to whether she wouldn't mind drawing up a brief 12 · 17 statement as to that. The worry that arises is: 26 27 thought that that was the end of any involvement she had with Garda Keith Harrison, then apart from the 28 29 reminders that she caused to be sent following the

1	appointment of Superintendent Murray, and this would	
2	seem to indicate that she had some kind of involvement.	
3	Now, if she was going to give an outline, I would	
4	imagine for someone of her obvious application and	
5	diligence, that she would have got someone to tell her,	12:17
6	look, what is the up-to-date on this thing? And again	
7	you might say, well then, if that happened, well, where	
8	is it?	
9	MR. DIGNAM: Yes.	
10	CHAIRMAN: So, there is the problem.	12:17
11	MR. DIGNAM: You will appreciate that Chief	
12	Superintendent McGinn is separately represented, I	
13	think Mr. Ó Braonáin can address you as to what	
14	CHAIRMAN: No, I know, but that doesn't mean you can't	
15	talk to her. I can't talk to her because of my	12:17
16	position, but there is nothing to stop you talking to	
17	her.	
18	MR. DIGNAM: No, I appreciate that.	
19	CHAIRMAN: After all, you do represent the Garda	
20	Commissioner.	12:18
21	MR. DIGNAM: I do.	
22	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, I should perhaps have addressed	
23	that question to Mr. Ó Braonáin, but in any event.	
24	MR. DIGNAM: In relation to documents in a broader	
25	sense, you will recall, Chairman, that this document,	12:18
26	the awareness of this document came about because Chief	
27	Superintendent McGinn said in evidence that she	
28	probably discussed Garda Harrison's case at a	
29	management meeting and that led to a discussion about	

1	PAF meetings or PALF meetings being held at district	
2	division and regional levels and in light of that	
3	evidence a search was carried out for minutes of all	
4	management meetings, otherwise known as PAF or PALF	
5	meetings.	12:18
6	CHAIRMAN: So, that is what led to this?	
7	MR. DIGNAM: That is what led to this, yes. And where	
8	we stand at the moment, Chairman, is that the minutes	
9	of regional meetings have been provided, although we	
10	are still searching for two I think management	12:18
11	meetings, regional management meetings.	
12	CHAIRMAN: Are they within the relevant period though?	
13	MR. DIGNAM: They are, yes, Chairman. They are, yes.	
14	CHAIRMAN: Because we are dealing with a very small	
15	number of months.	12:19
16	MR. DIGNAM: Yes.	
17	CHAIRMAN: I mean, one has to be realistic about this,	
18	Mr. Dignam, and again I hope I am not coming across as	
19	coming down on you, because I am not, and I am not	
20	intending to, but I really have to try and keep some	12:19
21	kind of a focus on this. Because if you say okay, what	
22	happened? Well, look, I went through it yesterday, but	
23	what happened was, there was the argument on the 28th	
24	September 2013, everybody admits that. We know that it	
25	came to the attention of the Gardaí shortly afterwards,	12:19
26	we know that Rita McDermott made a statement about it,	
27	that she spoke to Sergeant Durkin in relation to it and	
28	Garda McGowan. We know that a statement was made by	
29	Marisa Simms in Letterkenny on 6th October, to what	

extent or in circumstances is in dispute. And then we know that on 8th of October there was a referral to And we know as well that the Gardaí are saying, look, there had to be a referral to Tusla because that is our duty under the Children First Guidelines and 12:20 this came, even at a minimal level, within it. And we know that Tusla are saying they got some kind of garbled account. We know that Sergeant McGowan says no, it wasn't a garbled account. But what Tusla are saying we would have done more had we got a fuller 12:20 account and then matters move on. But the question is: In the event that things got stalled perhaps because of other work in social work, but then were revived again, could this have anything to do with it, this monthly management meeting, such as any business that is acting 12:20 sensibly would have? So I mean, if this is something to do with it, fine, but how could other management meetings have anything to do with that? Because what we are focusing on is the Gardaí allegedly, through hearsay now, getting HSE involved in the Harrisons' 12:20 lives, Harrison/Simms lives. I can assure you, Chairman, that the MR. DIGNAM: searches are being conducted are for the relevant time period. There is no question of us carrying out a trawl for all management minutes for a long periods of 12.21 time, that wouldn't assist the Tribunal. We have also I think provided the divisional management meetings for the relevant period insofar as any of them might be relevant to the work of the Tribunal, and we have also

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1	gathered in all of the minutes of management meetings	
2	for each of the districts in Donegal, they haven't been	
3	reviewed as to whether there is anything relevant in	
4	them to the work of the Tribunal, but that process is	
5	being carried out currently, Chairman.	12:21
6	CHAIRMAN: Well, I mean yes.	
7	MR. DIGNAM: But that does give rise to, we certainly	
8	don't want to flood the Tribunal with any unnecessary	
9	or irrelevant material.	
10	CHAIRMAN: No. We all know the Supreme Court	12:21
11	pronouncements on discovery and we all know they	
12	haven't worked.	
13	MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, when I say we don't	
14	propose providing the Tribunal with volumes of	
15	management committee meetings.	12:22
16	CHAIRMAN: Well, you know perfectly well I don't want	
17	them.	
18	MR. DIGNAM: No.	
19	CHAIRMAN: I couldn't care less about them, frankly.	
20	MR. DIGNAM: Yes.	12:22
21	CHAIRMAN: It's to do with Garda Harrison that I am	
22	inquiring into.	
23	MR. DIGNAM: Yes. And that is why they are being	
24	reviewed currently; to see if there is anything	
25	relevant in relation to the work of the Tribunal and	12:22
26	Garda Harrison.	
27	CHAIRMAN: Yes. But you know, under normal	
28	circumstances people nowadays agree the exchange of	
29	documents and the rules provide that you should set out	

1 issues. That of course has made everything worse 2 because you can make anything, it seems, relevant to 3 anything. And it used to be that these issues were defined by the Pleadings. Now, we don't have any 4 5 Pleadings here, but you know and I know what is of 12:22 6 importance. 7 MR. DIGNAM: Yes. 8 But you know as well that in consequence of things coming to light, it seems at the moment in good 9 10 faith, that is certainly the presumption I am making in 12:23 11 consequence of evidence, that questions may be asked as 12 to the process. It may be that if you swore an 13 affidavit as to the process and you were prepared to 14 stand over the process in terms of the searches you 15 have made, that this would at least be something 12:23 16 against which a test could be made in the event that 17 other stuff is turned up which we are not aware of, in 18 which case a query can be made: Well, you are supposed, according to your affidavit, to have done 19 20 such-and-such and this didn't turn up but the reality 12:23 is if you did that then this would have turned up. 21 22 those are the questions I think which one might be entitled to ask. 23 24 I am happy to arrange that, Chairman, and MR. DIGNAM: 25 I have absolutely no difficulty in doing that. 12:23 26 CHAIRMAN: How long would it take to do? I am not 27 asking for an affidavit as to documents. I am trying 28 to follow the modern procedure of the High Court, which 29 is that people agree categories of documents which may

1	be relevant and then exchange them without the	
2	necessity for an affidavit. But in this instance, can	
3	you do an affidavit as to the methodology of the search	
4	and the categories looked in with a view to assisting	
5	the Tribunal? Can you do that?	12:24
6	MR. DIGNAM: Yes, Chairman.	
7	CHAIRMAN: Can you do that within a week?	
8	MR. DIGNAM: I don't see any difficulty within that,	
9	Chairman.	
10	CHAIRMAN: Will it take a week?	12:24
11	MR. DIGNAM: I would hope that I could do it in less	
12	than a week, but without specific instructions as to	
13	exactly how long it will take I don't want to guarantee	
14	that I could do it in less than that.	
15	CHAIRMAN: Well, it's nothing to do with my feelings	12:24
16	but I came in today hoping that I was going to be	
17	finishing with this and could begin thinking about the	
18	very serious issues that have arisen, and now it seems	
19	we are into next week.	
20	MR. DIGNAM: Chairman, if you could give me a week with	12:24
21	an assurance that if it can be done in less time than	
22	that it will be done in less time.	
23	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thanks. So, Mr. Ó Braonáin, would you	
24	like to help in any way?	
25	MR. Ó BRAONÁIN: I am certainly happy, and Chief	12:24
26	Superintendent McGinn is certainly happy to assist the	
27	Tribunal in any way that	
28	CHAIRMAN: Is it possible?	
29	MR. Ó BRAONÁIN: In relation to a statement the	

1	Tribunal suggested, I am sure there is no difficulty	
2	about that.	
3	CHAIRMAN: Well, is it possible that someone would have	
4	a brief chat with her, perhaps, outside and see where	
5	we stand in relation to that? What she now recalls, it ${}_{12}$	2:25
6	would be useful perhaps to know that now. Would you	
7	agree, Mr. Harty?	
8	MR. HARTY: I have no difficulty with somebody having a	
9	chat with Chief Superintendent McGinn, and I have no	
10	problem with that being informed to the Tribunal at	2:25
11	this stage. There is one issue in particular I am	
12	very happy in relation to the suggestion of an	
13	affidavit of methodology, something which is used in	
14	the courts, and it's a very effective way of ensuring	
15	that the process has the sufficient level of inquiry,	2:25
16	and I have no difficulty with that. There is one issue	
17	which arises from this in relation to the witnesses	
18	that would be required to be called, but I will address	
19	that when	
20	CHAIRMAN: No, do. Do tell me. What do you say about 12	2:25
21	that?	
22	MR. HARTY: Well, this is now the second clear mention	
23	of an involvement on the part of Assistant Commissioner	
24	Kenny. Chief Superintendent Terry McGinn obviously is	
25	directly relevant in relation to it, and Chief	2:26
26	Superintendent Jim Sheridan, who, while it was a broad	
27	general meeting, Chief Superintendent Sheridan had some	
28	detailed interaction with Garda Harrison at an earlier	
29	stage, and it would surprise me if his ears didn't at	

1	least prick up when his name was mentioned at a	
2	divisional management meeting, but I think of primary	
3	concern to me in relation to it would be the state of	
4	knowledge and the awareness of Assistant Commissioner	
5	Kenny. The Tribunal will be aware that when we came	12:26
6	here, and it was put, and I think accurately put to	
7	Garda Harrison at the time that there wasn't a	
8	scintilla of evidence to suggest that the matter went	
9	outside the Donegal division, on the basis of what	
10	was	12:26
11	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, it did go outside the Donegal	
12	division, it had to. I mean, once there was a GSOC	
13	referral, it had to go to up to and I think also in	
14	relation to personnel, I mean, once the statement was	
15	made I think it had to be referred to Headquarters.	12:27
16	But it's the influence of Headquarters.	
17	MR. HARTY: Yes.	
18	CHAIRMAN: They had to be kept informed, but that might	
19	be like people sending in returns to the Revenue, you	
20	know.	12:27
21	MR. HARTY: It could be. But it's only during the	
22	evidence of Chief Superintendent McGinn that we learned	
23	there was a phone call made to Assistant Commissioner	
24	Kenny. We now know that it was a matter which was	
25	brought up subsequent to that phone call at a meeting	12:27
26	of the 5th November. I don't know and if	
27	Mr. McGuinness has had an opportunity of looking at the	
28	PALF meetings in the surrounding months and if nothing	
29	arises I am very happy with that. But the Tribunal	

will be aware that this document was only produced because it was in direct response to questions that were raised on Garda Harrison's behalf to Chief Superintendent McGinn, that these meetings were raised by Chief Superintendent McGinn, giving rise to the 12:27 train of inquiry and at the end of that, Chief Superintendent McGinn's evidence, the Tribunal directed that Chief Superintendent McGinn produce the minutes of the PALF meetings. But I would submit, and I think it's accepted by Mr. Dignam, that these were clearly 12 · 28 relevant and, as such, I do feel that it is important that a further search should be carried out, whereby the integrity of it can be stood over by way of an affidavit as to methodology. CHAIRMAN: Yes. No, that makes sense. Well, for a 12:28 start, there is nothing to stop your solicitor, Mr. Ó Braonáin, asking Chief Superintendent McGinn what recollection she has, perhaps, of this meeting, if any, and then a statement can be supplied. Certainly an affidavit as to documents is a good idea. I am aware 12:28 that Assistant Commissioner Kenny is retired and is on an extended holiday somewhere in the Far East. I think the first step is, if we have a statement then he can be asked over the telephone as to what his recollection is in relation to that. I mean, that is what can be 12:29 done. In the event that he has something to add, well, we are going to have to adjourn until such time as he If he doesn't -- if I am informed of is available. that and the basis for saying that, I will look at

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1	that, but it seems to me also I think we do need to	
2	have Chief Superintendent McGinn back on that, Chief	
3	Superintendent Sheridan and who else do you suggest we	
4	ought to inquire in relation to this? I mean, it is	
5	sticking out a bit that if there is an update that 12	: 29
6	something might have been said at it, you know. So	
7	what is your suggestion?	
8	MR. McGUINNESS: I think it's sufficient for present	
9	purposes to get a statement from those, that the	
10	Tribunal have mentioned; Chief Superintendent McGinn, 12	::30
11	Chief Superintendent Sheridan and if possible an	
12	account from Assistant Commissioner Kenny. If it's	
13	necessary to go further I don't see it at the moment.	
14	CHAIRMAN: Yes. So it's a question of softly, softly,	
15	see where we are at, and then see what else needs to be $_{12}$: 30
16	done.	
17	MR. McGUINNESS: I think so, Chairman. That seems to	
18	be the extent necessary at present.	
19	CHAIRMAN: It seems a terrible, you know, delay,	
20	Mr. McGuinness, appreciating it's not your fault.	: 30
21	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. There are two ways of looking at	
22	it, perhaps. One is, obviously Mr. Dignam will come up	
23	with his affidavit of process and methodology for	
24	searching and that can be provided then at the end of a	
25	week from today. On the other hand, there is a view 12	: 30
26	that says, well, let's take the evidence of the	
27	witnesses that are available as soon as we can and	
28	proceed with their evidence tomorrow.	
29	CHAIRMAN: Well, I am asked for a week in relation to	

1 this affidavit, as to methodology of searching 2 documents. 3 MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. But on one view --CHAIRMAN: That brings us to next Wednesday. 4 5 MR. McGUINNESS: On one view the affidavit shouldn't 12:31 prevent the taking of evidence that is currently 6 7 available. And it shouldn't in fact influence it in 8 any way on one view. One difficulty, Chairman, that I have to point out is the very practical one about next 9 10 week, is that next week is the only week where we don't 12:31 11 have the use of this large room. It's blocked off for State use from 16th to 20th. So we wouldn't be able to 12 13 reconvene here in that week next week. 14 CHAIRMAN: Yes, all right. I think we have to have the 15 affidavits -- the affidavit as to the methodology of 12:32 16 search and documents before we go to these witnesses. 17 I think that is the only fair way to approach it. And I think also that, as we have this time, Napoleon had a 18 suspicion in relation to lawyers and gave them strict 19 time limits, so you will forgive me for doing the same 20 12:32 thing, but I think we need that affidavit by this day 21 22 week, next Wednesday. I think we also need Chief 23 Superintendent McGinn and any other witness available 24 who is in a position to say what happened at this 25 meeting. And I would actually like to include someone 12:32 26 who is outside the Garda loop and Mr. McGoey seems to 27 be outside the Garda loop, if he is available I would 28 like to see what he has got to say about this. And 29 they should also be available by next Wednesday.

1 next Wednesday I mean 10:00 in the morning. Then we 2 can't sit unfortunately here next week. Look, it's 3 just impractical, so I am going to adjourn any further evidence to Monday week and any submissions also to 4 5 Monday week to follow immediately after. 12:33 6 7 Now, there is just one other thing that is on my mind, 8 if I might mention it now. There was one witness left behind from the HSE/Tusla from the last section of 9 evidence that we heard, and I am just wondering, she 10 12:33 11 had given birth I think, and is it possible to get her 12 in on Tuesday week and to have any submissions that 13 anyone wants to make in relation to the issue as to 14 influence by the Gardaí in relation to Sergeant McCabe 15 on Tusla/HSE on the Tuesday of that week as well? 12:34 16 MR. MCDERMOTT: Yes. Chairman. I think that is the 17 24th of October. And that should be fine. We will get back if there is any difficulty. So I understand, the 18 19 Tribunal is proposing to sit in this module on the 23rd of October, and then possibly --20 12:34 21 CHAIRMAN: Well, I would do it on Monday, but I can't, 22 so you will appreciate that. You are not going to 23 accuse me of going on a week's holiday, Mr. McDermott, 24 others may. Chairman, just on that issue, 25 MR. McGUINNESS: 12:34 26 obviously Sergeant McCabe's legal advisors aren't here 27 today, and I am not sure that they know --28 CHAIRMAN: No, I appreciate that, but we have got to

get things to an end and we will put it on the website

1	and in the event that there is any difficulty people	
2	can come back to us. But, Mr. McDermott, are you in a	
3	position to say whether that young lady is available?	
4	MR. McDERMOTT: As far as we know, Chairman, she would	
5	be available for the 24th of October and we will tell	12:34
6	you immediately if we are wrong about that. But off	
7	the top of our heads we think she is around at the	
8	moment.	
9	CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, maybe it's safer to say	
10	the Wednesday, is it? Because the submissions and	12:35
11	evidence could go on for two days and it would give	
12	people time. I want to try and get things wrapped up	
13	if at all possible, appreciating what you say,	
14	Mr. McGuinness, but if it's on the website would that	
15	cause a difficulty? We will certainly contact them as	12:35
16	well. I know Mr. Barnes is out, but he will be back	
17	soon hopefully.	
18	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. Obviously we will contact any	
19	relevant party who was represented at the last module	
20	and inform them immediately of the intention of the	12:35
21	Tribunal to deal with the matter on the 25th.	
22	CHAIRMAN: Yes. All right. Well, I think that is the	
23	best that can be done. There is no point in saying any	
24	more.	
25		12:36
26	THE TRIBUNAL THEN ADJOURNED TO MONDAY, 23RD OCTOBER	
27	2017 AT 10:00AM	
28		

1	5	adjourn [2] - 51:27, _ 54:3	apply [1] - 35:23 appointment [1] -	16:25, 38:21 attended [3] - 8:23,
1-2 _[1] - 3:5 10:00 _[1] - 54:1 10:00AM _[1] - 55:27	50 [1] - 3:9 5th [4] - 4:10, 38:20, 40:6, 50:26	ADJOURNED [1] - 55:26 admits [1] - 44:24 advance [1] - 28:18	43:1 appreciate [15] - 14:8, 14:10, 14:18, 14:29, 16:10, 18:4,	9:28, 20:13 attention [2] - 8:18, 44:25 attributed [1] - 28:3
10:00am [1] - 6:9 10th [1] - 12:17	6	- advise [1] - 23:28 advisors [1] - 54:26	23:4, 25:9, 32:8, 43:11, 43:18, 54:22,	available [16] - 10:9, 10:11, 16:12, 16:14,
11TH [2] - 1:18, 4:1 12 [1] - 2:30		affidavit [13] - 47:13, 47:19, 47:27, 48:2,	54:28 appreciates [1] -	27:4, 29:13, 31:25, 32:10, 51:28, 52:27,
15-minute [1] - 13:3 16 [1] - 1:6	6th [1] - 44:29	48:3, 49:13, 51:14,	18:13 appreciating թյ -	53:7, 53:23, 53:27, 53:29, 55:3, 55:5
16th [1] - 53:12	8	51:20, 52:23, 53:1, 53:5, 53:15, 53:21	42:4, 52:20, 55:13	avenue [1] - 11:29
17 _[1] - 1:10 1916 _[1] - 35:26	8 [1] - 2:14	affidavits [1] - 53:15 afraid [1] - 28:5	approach [1] - 53:17 appropriate [5] -	aware [11] - 12:9, 16:22, 28:2, 29:8,
1921 [1] - 1:10 19th [1] - 35:8	8th [5] - 22:16,	afterwards [1] - 44:25	5:18, 8:11, 18:14, 22:27, 40:18	34:16, 34:29, 35:25, 47:17, 50:5, 51:1,
1st [2] - 22:19, 22:21	22:17, 39:17, 45:2	ago [3] - 7:22, 15:5,	Archbold [3] - 4:25,	51:20
2	9	32:7 agree [7] - 13:14,	6:12, 16:23 archives [1] - 36:2	awareness [3] - 18:18, 43:26, 50:4
-		24:1, 30:26, 30:27, 46:28, 47:29, 49:7	arguably [1] - 7:14 argument [2] -	В
2 [4] - 2:17, 2:26, 2:30, 3:9	Δ	air [1] - 12:25	26:10, 44:23	
2013 [7] - 6:9, 10:25,	A	alarm [1] - 31:16 alia [1] - 7:15	arise [2] - 20:18, 21:5	bad [1] - 12:13
22:17, 33:28, 36:19, 38:21, 44:24	able [2] - 9:25, 53:12	allegation [1] - 23:6	arisen [1] - 48:18	Barnes [1] - 55:16 BARNES [1] - 3:3
2014 [1] - 1:4	above-named [1] - 1:27	allegations [2] - 11:18, 11:19	arises [3] - 42:26, 49:17, 50:29	basis [12] - 5:11,
2017 [6] - 1:6, 1:10, 1:18, 4:2, 12:17,	absence [1] - 26:24	allege [1] - 35:16 alleged [3] - 15:28,	arrange [1] - 47:24 arrangement [1] -	18:16, 19:23, 21:24, 23:13, 24:12, 25:3,
55:27 20th [1] - 53:12	absent [3] - 18:21, 24:13, 26:26	15:29, 16:10	4:28	25:20, 27:17, 28:14, 50:9, 51:29
21 [1] - 2:25	absolutely [4] - 14:1, 21:1, 30:8, 47:25	allegedly [3] - 23:9, 41:21, 45:19	arranging [2] - 31:18, 31:19	bear [4] - 15:29,
21st [2] - 24:21, 32:28	accept [1] - 26:3	alone [1] - 14:3	arriving[1] - 32:15 ARTHUR[1] - 2:16	16:1, 16:3, 16:9 become [3] - 14:19,
23rd [1] - 54:19 23RD [1] - 55:26	accepted [1] - 51:10 accepts [1] - 39:9	amount [3] - 21:25, 32:7, 34:14	AS[1] - 4:1	14:21, 14:28 beg [1] - 31:2
24th [2] - 54:17, 55:5	accident [1] - 30:6	analyst [1] - 41:20 anchoring [1] -	ascertain [1] - 9:26 assess [1] - 24:12	begin [1] - 48:17
25th [1] - 55:21 27th [2] - 22:23,	according [1] - 47:19 account [6] - 23:9,	39:14	assist [7] - 9:20,	beginning [1] - 24:22 behalf [2] - 42:19,
22:25	36:11, 45:8, 45:9, 45:11, 52:12	AND [3] - 1:4, 1:5, 1:9	28:14, 29:12, 29:17, 30:3, 45:26, 48:26	51:3 behind [3] - 5:13,
28th [1] - 44:23 29 [3] - 6:21, 10:25,	accountability [4] -	answer [5] - 11:13, 19:14, 21:17, 29:17,	assistance [2] - 10:1, 10:4	31:13, 54:9
33:27 29/11 [1] - 4:22	4:9, 4:21, 6:8, 36:18 accuracy [1] - 9:1	29:29	Assistant [7] - 38:22,	believes [1] - 26:11 bell [1] - 31:16
29th [3] - 6:9, 33:28,	accurate [2] - 8:23, 27:10	answered [1] - 24:6 ANTHONY [2] - 2:15,	39:16, 49:23, 50:4, 50:23, 51:21, 52:12	below [1] - 26:20
36:19	accurately [1] - 50:6	2:20 apart [2] - 30:5,	assistant [1] - 39:20 assisting [1] - 48:4	best [3] - 29:9, 29:12, 55:23
3	accuse [1] - 54:23 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9	42:28	assists [1] - 27:3	better [2] - 10:22, 36:26
30 [1] - 32:7	acting [4] - 6:12, 16:27, 16:29, 45:15	appear _[7] - 5:7, 17:17, 18:7, 27:21,	assurance [1] - 48:21	between [17] - 6:21,
36 [1] - 1:18	action [1] - 1:28	30:27, 31:22, 38:24	assure [1] - 45:22	10:19, 17:24, 17:27, 18:15, 21:8, 24:10,
4	actions [1] - 12:20 add [1] - 51:26	appearance [1] - 5:14	AT _[1] - 55:27 ATM _[1] - 29:5	24:21, 27:19, 27:24, 28:16, 32:20, 33:14,
	address [3] - 14:20, 43:13, 49:18	APPEARANCES [1] - 2:1	attach [1] - 32:11 attempt [1] - 29:22	36:22, 37:15, 37:21, 42:17
40 [1] - 32:7	addressed [2] - 8:25,	appeared [2] - 14:17, 15:6	attempted [1] - 18:25	big [1] - 6:16
	43:22 adequate [1] - 13:25	application [1] - 43:4	attend [5] - 9:2, 9:26, 9:28, 10:6, 28:20	birth [1] - 54:11 bit [3] - 31:4, 31:7,
		applied [1] - 17:14	attendance [2] -	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,

52:5 46:5, 51:12 16:29, 17:2, 17:5, 43:26, 48:25, 49:9, computer [1] - 30:21 BL [11] - 2:7, 2:10, carry [1] - 21:10 17:9, 18:23, 18:27, 49:24, 49:27, 50:22, concern [3] - 5:13, 2:11, 2:11, 2:16, 2:19, carrying [2] - 17:21, 19:4, 19:27, 20:19, 51:3, 51:5, 51:6, 51:8, 41:27, 50:3 21:2, 21:14, 21:19, 51:17. 52:2. 52:10. 2:20, 2:23, 3:3, 3:8, 45:24 concerned [1] - 8:27 cars [1] - 29:4 21:21, 21:25, 22:12, 52:11, 53:22 3:11 concerning [2] blacked [1] - 34:15 CARTHAGE[1] -22:15, 22:18, 22:21, children [4] - 12:6, 4:15, 7:15 22:25, 23:4, 24:23, 12:28, 33:2, 33:19 concerns [2] - 7:26, blisters [1] - 36:21 2.24 24:28, 25:5, 25:8, blocked [1] - 53:11 Children [3] - 34:6, case [25] - 6:23, 7:27 25:14, 25:16, 25:27, 34:9, 45:5 book [1] - 35:29 8:11, 9:18, 10:24, concise [1] - 29:29 26:3, 26:8, 26:14, choice [1] - 19:17 bound [1] - 18:28 11:6, 12:15, 13:17, conclude [1] - 15:25 26:16, 26:21, 26:28, circulated [4] - 4:18, **box** [1] - 29:24 13:19. 15:19. 16:5. condemn [1] - 23:12 **BRAONÁIN**[3] - 3:8, 18:16, 18:29, 21:29, 27:6, 28:1, 29:19, 5:1, 5:11, 39:19 conducted [2] -30:4, 30:19, 30:24, 23:3, 25:9, 25:24, circumstances [7] -48:25, 48:29 37:13, 45:23 30:29, 31:29, 32:4, Braonáin [4] - 43:13, 28:22, 28:26, 29:9, 15:4, 15:20, 19:19, conducting [1] -33:3, 33:12, 33:16, 29:23, 35:8, 42:3, 20:11, 33:9, 45:1, 43:23, 48:23, 51:17 34:28 33:29, 34:5, 34:12, 43:28, 47:18 46:28 BRIAN [1] - 2:23 **conference** [1] - 6:23 34:25, 39:12, 40:1, cases [3] - 17:25, city [1] - 35:27 Bridgeen [7] - 23:7, confine [1] - 14:13 40:5, 40:13, 40:22, 33:18, 35:15 civil [1] - 11:16 26:14, 26:18, 29:19, confirm [3] - 9:14, 41:3, 41:8, 41:18, CASTLE[1] - 1:17 claimed [1] - 13:4 29:26, 32:26, 37:28 9:25, 31:26 41:20, 41:29, 42:22, categories [2] claims [1] - 11:20 brief [2] - 42:25, 49:4 confirms [1] - 8:29 43:10, 43:14, 43:19, 47:29, 48:4 clarified [2] - 14:22, briefly [2] - 27:29, **CONLON** [1] - 2:24 43:22, 44:6, 44:12, category [1] - 28:12 18:3 30:11 CONOR [2] - 2:9, 3:7 44:14, 44:17, 46:6, $\textbf{Brigid} \ [2] \ - \ 32{:}25,$ CATHAL[1] - 3:8 classes [1] - 33:21 consequence [4] -46:10, 46:16, 46:19, caused [2] - 26:25, classic [1] - 13:15 32:28 19:7, 23:10, 47:8, 46:21, 46:27, 47:8, 42.29 bring [3] - 32:2, clear [7] - 12:19, 47:11 47:26, 48:7, 48:10, century [1] - 35:8 18:8, 19:24, 24:13, 39:12, 39:13 considered [1] - 5:9 48:15, 48:23, 48:28, **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:4 30:15, 31:17, 49:22 **brings** [1] - 53:4 conspiracies [1] -49:3, 49:20, 50:11, certainly [14] - 7:3, clearly [8] - 9:11, broad [4] - 26:27, 28:27 50:18, 51:15, 52:14, 30:21, 35:22, 49:26 11:6, 12:26, 13:1, 9:15, 18:19, 20:10, contact [12] - 20:12, 52:19, 52:29, 53:4, broader [3] - 17:16, 18:14, 25:28, 36:28, 21:6, 21:23, 28:29, 21:8, 24:14, 24:16, 53:14, 54:21, 54:28, 40:17, 46:7, 47:10, 51:10 33:13, 43:24 26:19, 32:26, 32:27, 55:9. 55:22 48:25, 48:26, 51:19, close [1] - 36:28 brought [6] - 15:29, 32:28, 33:14, 34:7, CHAMBERS [1] closed [1] - 22:22 16:1, 16:3, 16:8, 16:9, 55:15 55:15, 55:18 2:25 certify [1] - 1:25 closing [1] - 24:23 50:25 contacts [13] chance [1] - 42:23 bumped [1] - 29:1 chain [2] - 34:21, closure [1] - 33:1 17:24, 17:27, 17:28, change [1] - 18:26 35:21 bunch [1] - 32:12 collection [1] - 4:8 18:15, 23:2, 27:19, chaotic [1] - 31:4 Chair [3] - 11:10, colourful [1] - 37:3 Buncrana [2] - 6:11, 27:24, 28:16, 32:20, characterising [1] -15:27, 16:26 34:4, 34:5, 34:10, combined [1] - 18:10 16:15 30:13 chairing [1] - 38:23 coming [4] - 14:12, 37:15 burden [1] - 32:5 Charles [1] - 35:29 Chairman [36] - 4:4, 44:18, 44:19, 47:9 business [3] - 37:23, context [2] - 5:22, CHARLETON [2] -5:16, 5:24, 5:28, 8:9, comment [1] - 39:25 36:27 41:4, 45:15 1:12, 2:2 8:19, 8:26, 10:26, COMMISSIONER [1] continue [1] - 29:11 butchers [2] - 31:12, CHARLTON[1] -14:1, 14:13, 14:15, continuing [1] - 19:4 37:5 - 2.9 15:4, 15:10, 15:25, Commissioner [11] conversations [1] -**BY** [10] - 1:5, 1:8, chat [5] - 13:2, 13:3, 16:14, 27:3, 28:10, 2:12, 2:16, 2:20, 2:24, 5:17, 14:3, 38:22, 29:8 42:23, 49:4, 49:9 38:19, 40:20, 40:29, 2:29, 3:4, 3:8 39:9, 39:16, 43:20, cooperate [1] - 14:8 checked [2] - 8:22, 42:9, 43:25, 44:8, copy [1] - 5:27 49:23, 50:4, 50:23, 27:3 44:13, 45:22, 46:5, 51:21, 52:12 C correct [2] - 19:20, chief [2] - 39:25, 46:13, 47:24, 48:6, commissioner's [1] -21:24 49:25 48:9, 48:20, 52:17, 39:20 costing.. [1] - 7:8 CHIEF [2] - 2:12, C/SUPT [1] - 3:7 53:8, 54:16, 54:25, committed [1] counsel [6] - 5:8, cages [1] - 33:20 55:4 41:22 5:17, 11:11, 13:8, Campbell [1] - 17:6 Chief [38] - 4:13, chairman [1] - 40:11 committee [1] -14:29, 20:24 4:23, 6:9, 16:17, captured [2] - 30:22, CHAIRMAN [115] -46.15 courage [1] - 28:6 18:15. 20:3. 22:28. 32:6 5:26, 6:4, 6:6, 6:28, communication [1] course [6] - 7:19, 25:21, 26:8, 38:2, car [1] - 30:5 7:27, 8:13, 10:2, 10:9, 13:9 11:25, 14:1, 19:10, 38:26, 38:27, 39:4, care [1] - 46:19 10:13, 10:18, 11:4, **COMPANY**[2] - 2:20, 31:6, 47:1 39:15, 39:26, 40:16, carried [9] - 19:23, 12:10, 14:2, 14:10, Court [2] - 46:10, 41:11, 41:13, 41:16, 21:23, 25:21, 33:9, 15:24, 16:10, 16:15, compared [1] - 32:6 47:28 42:14, 42:23, 43:11, 33:11, 33:14, 44:3, 16:17, 16:21, 16:27, completely [1] - 9:14 court [2] - 11:6,

13:19 13:2, 36:5, 41:26 distribute [1] - 32:14 37:4, 39:4, 46:2, 50:9, 17:19 COURT [2] - 1:13, difficult [1] - 32:9 district [2] - 38:24, 50:11 England [1] - 19:5 2:3 difficulty [10] - 26:4, 44:1 Donna [3] - 23:23, ENGLISH [1] - 2:23 24:1, 24:16 courts [4] - 11:17, 47:25, 48:8, 49:1, districts [1] - 46:2 enlighten [1] - 35:7 19:14, 19:16, 49:14 49:8, 49:16, 53:8, divergencies [1] door [1] - 23:11 enormous [1] -COX [1] - 2:16 54:18, 55:1, 55:15 36.11 down [7] - 10:28, 21.25 11:28, 13:9, 22:1, crime [1] - 41:20 dig [2] - 35:1 division [6] - 38:25, ensure [1] - 34:18 crimes [1] - 41:21 Dignam [7] - 17:13, 39:3, 39:4, 44:2, 50:9, 27:13, 30:5, 44:19 ensuring [1] - 49:14 drawing [2] - 8:17, criminal [3] - 23:24, 17:17, 18:13, 41:29, 50:12 enthusiasm [1] -44:18, 51:10, 52:22 42:25 divisional [9] - 4:11, 24:3, 42:18 **DIGNAM** [33] - 2:9, drive [2] - 10:14, 4:21, 6:8, 6:13, 31:2, cross [1] - 15:22 entitled [5] - 18:27, 14:9, 14:13, 15:25, 36:17, 39:26, 45:27, cross-examining [1] 19:8, 27:2, 28:8, 16:13, 16:16, 16:18, 50:2 **DUBLIN** [6] - 1:17, - 15:22 47:23 16:22, 16:28, 17:1, divulged [1] - 13:6 2:14, 2:17, 2:26, 2:30, entry [1] - 20:5 17:4, 17:7, 42:9, 43:9, **DOCKERY** [1] - 2:28 D **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:9 43:11, 43:18, 43:21, **Duffy** [6] - 4:26, 6:13, document 1391 equally [1] - 32:9 43:24, 44:7, 44:13, 16:18, 17:2, 17:3, 4:18, 7:28, 8:16, 8:20, essential [1] - 30:8 **DALY**[1] - 2:19 44:16, 45:22, 46:7, 17:8 8:29, 9:15, 9:18, 14:3, ESTABLISHED[1] -**DANIEL** [1] - 3:8 46:13, 46:18, 46:20, Dundalk [3] - 4:11, 14:14, 14:16, 15:1, date [6] - 17:20, 46:23, 47:7, 47:24, 15:4, 17:11, 17:22, 38:20, 40:27 etcetera [2] - 21:27, 19:17, 22:17, 22:19, 48:6, 48:8, 48:11, 20:6, 20:29, 22:7, during [3] - 11:10, 40:19 22:21, 43:6 48:20 25:6, 25:7, 25:19, 33:21. 50:21 event [6] - 19:20, dated [1] - 4:10 diligence [1] - 43:5 25:20, 26:25, 30:22, Durkin [1] - 44:27 43:23, 45:12, 47:16, **DAY**[1] - 1:18 direct [1] - 51:2 34:27, 35:18, 35:22, **DURKIN** [1] - 2:28 51:26, 55:1 days [2] - 39:22, directed [1] - 51:7 35:28, 36:16, 36:24, events [1] - 31:6 **duty** [1] - 45:5 55:11 directly [8] - 4:16, 38:15, 38:17, 38:18, **DWYER** [1] - 2:23 evidence [44] - 5:5, deal [7] - 11:27, 18:4, 7:24, 17:29, 33:5, 39:8, 40:17, 42:10, **DÁIL** [1] - 1:5 5:10. 6:1. 7:3. 7:26. 25:28, 33:8, 34:26, 33:6, 35:20, 38:10, 42:12, 43:25, 43:26, 8:26, 9:1, 9:13, 9:24, 41:26, 55:21 49:25 Ε 11:24, 12:2, 13:4, dealing [3] - 14:3, disclose [2] - 11:23, documentation [24] -13:20, 15:13, 16:20, 25:6, 44:14 9:7, 9:8, 9:9, 10:22, 20:4, 20:11, 21:10, earliest [1] - 29:13 deals [1] - 34:4 disclosed [4] - 4:18, 18:6, 18:9, 18:22, 23:13, 23:26, 24:1, EARLSFORT[1] dealt [1] - 27:5 19:22, 19:25, 21:13, 5:11, 27:24, 27:28 24:12, 25:29, 26:5, debates [1] - 21:26 2.17 23:19, 23:23, 23:25, disclosure [4] -27:8, 29:21, 32:24, early [1] - 37:4 decades [1] - 27:1 26:27, 30:17, 30:28, 14:16, 27:17, 28:13 33:5, 38:4, 39:15, ears [1] - 49:29 deceased [1] - 4:25 DISCLOSURES [2] -32:8, 33:6, 34:3, 39:16, 43:27, 44:3, December [1] easily [1] - 35:26 34:14, 34:20, 39:19 1:3, 1:4 47:11, 50:8, 50:22, 37:20 documents [24] -East [1] - 51:22 discover [4] - 9:7, 51:7, 52:26, 52:28, education [1] - 33:21 decided [1] - 12:19 4:6, 5:7, 5:20, 5:26, 9:9, 35:3, 35:14 53:6, 54:4, 54:10, deciding [1] - 37:5 11:23, 17:15, 19:8, effect [1] - 23:16 discovered [2] - 9:8, 55:11 decision [1] - 25:17 19:28, 27:24, 35:14, effective [1] - 49:14 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:9 35:18, 35:21, 36:1, either [3] - 9:27, default [3] - 20:28, discovery [4] exactly [2] - 12:15, 37:7, 37:25, 38:2, 27:9, 29:17 21:3. 21:8 17:15, 19:6, 35:13, defendant [1] - 35:16 42:3, 43:24, 46:29, electronic [1] - 22:6 46.11 examined [1] - 36:17 47:27, 47:29, 51:20, electronically [1] defined [4] - 28:15, discuss [3] - 28:24, examining [1] -53:2, 53:16 28:16, 35:15, 47:4 15:22 dog [1] - 33:20 definitely [1] - 21:22 discussed [19] -**ELIZABETH**[1] - 2:7 example [3] - 13:27, domestic [1] - 36:21 definition [2] - 11:5, 8:12, 8:14, 8:24, 9:29, email [6] - 21:14, 15:15, 37:3 **DONAL** [1] - 2:10 31:1, 32:10, 32:14, 13:16 15:18, 15:19, 15:20, exchange [2] -**DONALD**[1] - 2:12 32:15, 38:9 delay [1] - 52:19 27:10, 28:22, 28:26, 46:28, 48:1 29:2, 29:4, 29:6, 29:9, done [18] - 12:24, emailed [1] - 9:27 denies [1] - 35:16 exchanges [1] -23:22, 29:9, 30:19, 31:27, 40:18, 40:19, **DESMOND** [1] - 2:28 emails [3] - 21:28, 20:24 30:21, 32:16, 36:15, 22:1, 39:20 43:28 despite [1] - 23:15 exercise [2] - 12:13, 37:10, 37:17, 37:18, discussion [4] emerge [1] - 37:9 detail [1] - 39:28 37:8 37:24, 45:10, 47:19, detailed [1] - 49:28 26:5, 27:12, 27:13, encompass [1] **existence** [1] - 7:7 48:21, 48:22, 51:26, 38:29 43:29 devolve[1] - 13:9 existing [1] - 9:11 52:16, 55:23 dialogue [1] - 20:19 discussions [1] end [7] - 12:7, 27:16, expect [1] - 31:1 Donegal [12] - 10:10, 30:12 28:27, 42:27, 51:6, **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 expected [3] - 15:7, dispute [2] - 15:13, 10:13, 11:26, 16:20, 52:24, 54:29 diary [1] - 20:5 23:12, 23:14 29:1, 30:5, 31:13, engaged [2] - 11:11,

experience [1] -

different [4] - 4:8,

10:13	finite [1] - 28:12	G	GPO [4] - 35:28,	HARTY [44] - 2:19,
explain [2] - 4:5,	first [9] - 8:17, 12:14,		_ 36:4, 36:7, 36:8	17:13, 18:24, 19:3,
5:18	24:10, 28:7, 31:25,		great [3] - 25:28,	19:14, 20:3, 21:1,
explanation [1] -	34:27, 34:29, 39:24,	GAGEBY [1] - 2:23	35:29, 39:24	21:4, 21:16, 21:20,
24:20	51:23	gainsay [1] - 15:12	ground [1] - 6:22	21:22, 22:5, 22:14,
explicitly [2] - 4:16,	First [3] - 34:6, 34:9,	GALWAY[1] - 2:21	grows [1] - 35:2	22:16, 22:19, 22:22,
5:2	45:5	gaps [2] - 28:7, 28:8	GSOC [2] - 42:17,	22:26, 23:17, 24:27,
explore [2] - 10:4,	firstly [4] - 17:13,	gaps' [1] - 28:6	50:12	25:1, 25:7, 25:13,
10:12	21:4, 30:12, 37:13	garbled [2] - 45:8,	Guano [8] - 18:23,	25:15, 25:19, 26:1,
explored [2] - 7:26,	fishing [1] - 26:24	45:9	18:29, 19:1, 19:15,	26:4, 26:10, 26:15,
14:23	fit [1] - 5:25	GARDA [1] - 2:19	19:18, 19:20, 35:6,	26:17, 26:22, 27:29,
express [3] - 39:7,	FITZGERALD[1] -	Garda [83] - 4:7,	35:8	30:12, 30:25, 32:19,
42:9, 42:10	2:11	4:15, 4:22, 5:2, 5:17,	guarantee [1] - 48:13	33:4, 33:13, 33:26,
extended [1] - 51:22	FITZWILLIAM[2] -	6:8, 6:17, 6:21, 7:24,	guards [1] - 7:18	34:2, 34:9, 34:13,
extensive [1] - 39:1	2:30, 3:9	8:11, 9:4, 9:5, 9:7,	Guidelines [3] -	49:8, 49:22, 50:17,
extent [2] - 45:1,	five [6] - 10:14, 27:5,	9:9, 9:10, 9:18, 10:27,	34:6, 34:9, 45:5	50:21
52:18	27:8, 37:19, 37:26,	10:29, 11:22, 11:24,	gun [1] - 24:15	Harty [17] - 15:15,
eyewitness [1] -	38:29	11:27, 12:3, 12:4,	GWEN [1] - 1:30	15:17, 15:22, 17:10,
36:11	five-hour [1] - 10:14	12:20, 13:5, 14:2,	Gwen [1] - 1:25	19:4, 20:19, 22:2,
	five-month [2] -	15:19, 16:7, 17:24,	5 11 5 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 	23:5, 24:24, 27:11,
F	37:19, 37:26	17:27, 18:9, 18:10,	Н	28:2, 30:11, 32:17,
	flood [1] - 46:8	20:1, 20:5, 20:10,		_ 33:16, 42:19, 49:7
	focus [12] - 5:27,	22:8, 23:10, 24:14,		Harty's [1] - 32:15
face [1] - 13:10	11:9, 11:17, 11:20,	27:13, 27:19, 27:20,	HALLS _[1] - 2:21	headed [1] - 20:25
facility [1] - 32:9	12:11, 12:18, 13:11,	27:25, 27:27, 28:12,	HANAHOE[1] - 2:24	headquarters [1] -
fact [13] - 5:4, 7:23,	35:4, 41:9, 44:21	28:17, 28:22, 29:2,	hand [1] - 52:25	31:3
12:22, 13:16, 13:18,	focused [1] - 12:16	29:4, 29:6, 29:8, 31:9,	happier [1] - 13:28	Headquarters [2] -
13:19, 15:28, 20:13,	focusing [1] - 45:19	31:22, 31:23, 31:26,	happy [9] - 9:13,	50:15, 50:16
36:8, 38:26, 40:29,	follow [5] - 12:5,	32:20, 32:21, 33:17,	9:22, 9:23, 26:3,	heads [1] - 55:7
53:7	19:1, 19:10, 47:28,	34:22, 36:18, 37:14,	47:24, 48:25, 48:26,	hear [4] - 6:5, 8:16,
facts [1] - 35:14	54:5	37:15, 37:19, 37:21,	49:12, 50:29	17:7, 42:14
fair [1] - 53:17	follow-up [1] - 12:5	37:25, 38:20, 39:6,	hard [1] - 25:8	heard [3] - 12:2,
fairly [1] - 17:13	followed [1] - 12:26	39:9, 40:28, 42:10,	HARRISON [1] - 2:19	30:9, 54:10
faith [1] - 47:10	FOLLOWING [1] -	42:19, 42:28, 43:19,	Harrison [57] - 4:15,	HEARING [1] - 4:1
fall [1] - 5:8	1:5	43:28, 44:28, 46:21,	4:26, 5:2, 6:12, 7:24,	hearings [1] - 5:15
fallibility [1] - 29:10	following [3] - 1:26,	46:26, 49:28, 50:7,	9:4, 9:6, 9:8, 9:9,	hearsay [2] - 23:9,
family [3] - 20:16,	23:25, 42:29	51:3, 53:26, 53:27	9:10, 9:18, 10:27,	45:20
31:12, 37:5	FOLLOWS [1] - 4:1	garda [1] - 17:6	10:29, 11:22, 11:24,	heartening [1] - 8:5
famous [3] - 28:3,	FOR [10] - 1:8, 2:6,	Gardaí [20] - 4:12,	11:27, 12:3, 12:4,	heaven's [1] - 28:5
31:12, 35:28	2:9, 2:15, 2:19, 2:23,	9:15, 10:19, 11:1,	12:28, 13:5, 15:19,	HEGARTY[1] - 2:29
far [4] - 11:24, 20:29,	2:27, 3:3, 3:7, 3:11	11:25, 12:22, 13:6,	16:24, 18:10, 20:10,	held [3] - 4:11,
27:28, 55:4	forever [1] - 19:7	14:24, 21:10, 22:27,	23:3, 23:10, 24:17,	38:20, 44:1
Far [1] - 51:22	forgive [1] - 53:20	23:12, 27:25, 28:16, 28:29, 30:27, 40:26,	25:24, 27:14, 27:20,	HELD [1] - 1:17
fault [1] - 52:20	form [1] - 6:28	44:25, 45:3, 45:19,	27:26, 27:27, 28:12,	help [5] - 5:27,
February [6] - 12:17,	formal [1] - 34:8	54:14	28:17, 28:22, 29:2,	19:29, 20:21, 28:18,
22:23, 22:25, 23:16,	fountain [1] - 35:11	gathered [1] - 46:1	29:5, 29:6, 31:9,	48:24
24:22, 37:21	four [2] - 21:8, 37:19	general [7] - 5:3,	31:22, 31:24, 31:26, 34:23, 36:22, 37:1,	Henry [1] - 35:27
FEBRUARY [2] - 1:6,	frankly [1] - 46:19	7:19, 7:25, 20:26,	37:15, 37:25, 39:6,	high [5] - 8:1, 8:2,
1:10	Freedom [1] - 6:22	22:10, 39:2, 49:27	40:28, 41:9, 42:10,	8:24, 25:10, 27:10
feelings [1] - 48:15	fresh [2] - 24:26,	German [1] - 28:5	42:19, 42:28, 46:21,	High [1] - 47:28
few [2] - 30:2, 39:22	24:27	Gerry [8] - 4:27,	46:26, 49:28, 50:7	high-level [2] - 8:1,
file [1] - 22:23	full [1] - 18:21	6:16, 8:2, 21:14,	Harrison's [5] - 8:11,	25:10
filling [1] - 29:3	fuller [1] - 45:10	21:16, 26:9, 36:24,	15:19, 29:8, 43:28,	historian [1] - 35:29
final [1] - 39:3	fully [1] - 34:16	37:27	51:3	historically [1] - 7:3
Finan [6] - 4:24,	furnished [2] -	given [7] - 12:23,	Harrison/Simms [3]	hold [1] - 40:26
6:11, 6:26, 16:19,	38.28 30.10	g, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		hole [1] - 35:2

15:14, 20:12, 21:9,

40:15, 41:23, 54:11

government [1] -

23:16

fine [2] - 45:17,

finishing [1] - 48:17

18:17, 25:23

54:17

38:28, 39:10

35:17

furthermore [1] -

- 25:24, 25:26, 45:21

HARTNETT[1] - 3:3

Harrisons' [1] -

hole [1] - 35:2

home [2] - 23:6,

54:23

24:11

holiday [2] - 51:22,

Hone [33] - 4:27, important [3] - 8:3, INSP [2] - 2:27, 2:28 Irish [1] - 19:16 50:18 6:16, 7:17, 7:23, 8:2, 27:22, 51:11 Inspector [4] - 4:25, irrelevant [2] - 9:15, KILFEATHER[1] -8:22, 9:5, 9:12, 9:22, impractical [1] - 54:3 6:12, 16:24, 22:29 46:9 2:20 10:6, 10:9, 10:20, improved [2] - 6:29, inspector [1] - 16:27 issue [21] - 10:5, **kind** [7] - 10:21, 13:28, 14:25, 16:4, 37:26, 38:9, 38:18, 13:26 instance [1] - 48:2 11:15, 11:17, 13:16, 16:6, 18:7, 20:12, IN [1] - 1:17 instantly [1] - 21:5 13:19, 15:26, 19:29, 43:2, 44:21, 45:7 21:15, 21:16, 26:2, kinds [1] - 9:16 inadequate [2] -INSTRUCTED [7] -22:3, 27:5, 27:16, 26:9, 26:20, 27:4, 34:24, 37:14 35:14, 35:19, 36:23, knowledge [1] - 50:4 2:12, 2:16, 2:20, 2:24, 27:8, 27:14, 28:20, 38:15, 39:8, 41:15, include [1] - 53:25 2:29, 3:4, 3:8 known [1] - 44:4 28:23, 29:12, 31:25, 41:17, 49:11, 49:16, included [1] - 6:29 instructions [4] -36:24, 37:27 54:13, 54:25 5:19, 10:26, 40:5, including [1] - 39:21 L Hone's [1] - 18:5 incorrect [1] - 19:23 48:12 issues [10] - 9:17, hope [4] - 6:2, 10:1, 11:7, 14:22, 21:10, increase [1] - 6:17 INSTRUMENT [1] lady [1] - 55:3 44:18, 48:11 39:1, 41:26, 47:1, indeed [1] - 13:8 large [3] - 9:11, 39:1, hopefully [1] - 55:17 47:3, 48:18 indicate [3] - 31:26, integrity [1] - 51:13 53:11 hoping [1] - 48:16 38:2, 43:2 intend [1] - 37:18 larger [1] - 35:2 hour[1] - 10:14 J indicated [3] - 14:24, intending [1] - 44:20 last [5] - 17:8, 27:21, hours [1] - 30:3 17:18, 18:17 intention [2] - 5:23, 39:22, 54:9, 55:19 house [2] - 13:3, indicating [1] - 10:7 January [2] - 24:14, lastly [1] - 12:16 42:6 inter [1] - 7:15 indication [2] - 36:9, 37.20 late [1] - 14:12 **HOUSE** [1] - 2:13 interacting [2] -JH [1] - 7:7 law [3] - 11:16, HSE [35] - 4:17, 4:27, inertia [1] - 24:21 11:2, 37:23 Jim [1] - 49:26 18:25, 19:18 4:29, 5:17, 6:16, 6:17, infancy [1] - 35:12 interaction [3] -JOHN [1] - 2:11 lawyers [1] - 53:19 6:22, 7:19, 9:15, influence [4] - 13:18, 37:19, 42:16, 49:28 JOSEPH [1] - 3:3 lead [3] - 17:26, 18:1, 12:19, 12:21, 14:26, interactions [1] -50:16, 53:7, 54:14 journals [1] - 38:5 35:18 17:25, 17:28, 18:8, influenced [1] -11:27 journeying [1] leader [1] - 16:8 19:29, 20:25, 20:27, 12:20 interest [6] - 14:19, 34.13 **LEADER**[1] - 2:7 20:28, 21:11, 21:12, 14:21, 14:28, 15:1, inform [1] - 55:20 JUDGE [2] - 1:12, leading [3] - 19:15, 21:29, 22:5, 22:22, 42:20, 42:21 informal [1] - 34:8 31:13, 35:22 24:14, 24:21, 26:6, information [7] interesting [1] judge [2] - 12:13, 26:9, 30:28, 31:14, leads [3] - 17:23, 6:23, 6:29, 8:28, 8:29, 24:25 35:25 19:11, 41:15 33:1, 33:17, 38:9, interpretation [1] -9:3, 10:7, 26:25 judgment [1] - 12:14 39:7, 45:20 leaned [3] - 13:6, informed [5] - 7:7, jurisdiction [1] -23:7, 23:8 HSE/Tusla [3] interrupt [3] - 20:21, 39:18, 49:10, 50:18, 18:25 leaning [3] - 12:21, 36:20, 37:13, 54:9 20:22, 20:23 51:28 jurisdictions [1] -13:12, 13:13 huge [1] - 11:26 INTO [1] - 1:3 ingredients [1] -18:26 learned [1] - 50:22 **HUGH** [1] - 3:3 invented [1] - 35:9 JUSTICE [3] - 1:8, least [3] - 5:14, human [1] - 29:10 invention [1] - 35:12 inquire [6] - 8:11, 1:12, 2:2 47:15. 50:1 hundreds [3] investigate [1] -15:17, 18:27, 35:1, leave [2] - 28:6, 28:8 21:28, 33:23, 33:26 27:18 52:4 Κ leaving [1] - 28:7 investigating [2] inquiries [3] - 16:24, ı **led** [4] - 31:29, 43:29, 19:9, 26:28 11:19, 11:20 44:6, 44:7 investigation [11] inquiring [4] - 8:7, Karen [1] - 17:7 left [1] - 54:8 4:15, 17:22, 23:24, 20:1, 21:6, 46:22 Karl [1] - 17:6 idea [2] - 40:2, 51:20 legal [4] - 11:4, 15:3, 24:3, 33:1, 33:2, inquiry [28] - 5:24, **KATHLEEN** [1] - 2:7 identified [4] - 15:1, 35:15, 54:26 13:21, 15:12, 15:16, 36:20, 39:6, 42:11, **KATHY**[1] - 2:12 15:27, 32:21, 33:15 legitimate [1] - 42:21 15:27, 17:15, 17:23, 42:17, 42:18 **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:4 $\textbf{identify}~{\tiny [4]}-11.7,$ lent [1] - 20:1 investigations [1] -17:27, 18:1, 18:12, keep [2] - 39:17, 27:24, 29:7, 29:14 less [5] - 46:19, 18:14, 18:22, 19:11, 41:5 44.20 identifying [1] -48:11, 48:14, 48:21, 19:12, 20:18, 21:7, inviting [1] - 21:14 Keith [17] - 4:15, 12.18 48:22 21:11, 26:26, 26:27, involve [5] - 10:29, 12:28, 13:5, 20:10, illustrated [1] - 35:26 lesser [1] - 18:16 28:13, 31:23, 34:21, 27:27, 28:12, 31:22, 23:10, 24:17, 27:20, imagine [1] - 43:4 **letter** [3] - 12:7, 34:28, 35:21, 39:11, 31.23 31:9, 34:23, 36:22, immediately [7] -12:16, 31:1 40:18, 49:15, 51:6 involved [2] - 38:11, 37:1, 37:15, 37:25, 10:11, 19:16, 29:14, Letterkenny [4] -INQUIRY [2] - 1:3, 39:6, 40:28, 41:8, 31:28, 54:5, 55:6, 4:22, 6:8, 36:18, involvement[4] -42:28 55:20 44:29 inquisitorial [2] -23:2, 42:27, 43:2, Kenny [7] - 38:22, impact [1] - 6:23

IRELAND [1] - 3:6

Ireland [1] - 19:18

49.23

11:14, 11:15

38:5, 45:28

insofar [3] - 9:6,

importance [1] -

47:6

level [12] - 5:3, 7:25,

8:1, 8:2, 8:24, 13:2,

25:10, 27:10, 40:10,

39:17, 49:24, 50:5,

50:24, 51:21, 52:12

kept [2] - 34:10,

40:15, 45:6, 49:15 levels [1] - 44:2 liaison [1] - 6:21 light [6] - 5:21, 15:13, 15:14, 36:16, 44:2. 47:9 likely [2] - 31:8, 37:6 limit [1] - 30:25 limited [4] - 18:8, 22:9, 25:20, 30:16 limits [1] - 53:20 line [5] - 4:13, 15:12, 15:16, 15:27, 39:11 listed [1] - 38:22 literally [1] - 21:20 **LITTLE** [1] - 2:13 lives [2] - 45:21 living [1] - 12:28 locked [1] - 33:19 look [21] - 13:10, 14:6, 14:10, 20:24, 30:9, 30:17, 31:3, 31:29, 33:29, 34:2, 36:1, 37:7, 38:7, 40:24, 41:3, 42:5, 43:6, 44:22, 45:4, 51.29 54.2 looked [4] - 14:17, 15:5, 38:16, 48:4 looking [5] - 7:28, 9:17, 36:13, 50:27, 52:21 looks [1] - 13:22 loop [2] - 53:26, 53:27 lost [1] - 42:6

М

lying [1] - 36:10

M.E [1] - 2:24 MADE [2] - 1:3, 1:8 majority [1] - 34:15 MALONE [1] - 1:30 Malone [1] - 1:25 man [1] - 35:27 management [15] -4:9, 16:2, 40:13, 40:26, 43:29, 44:4, 44:10, 44:11, 45:15, 45:17, 45:25, 45:27, 46:1, 46:15, 50:2 manner [2] - 17:28, 33:10 March [4] - 22:10, 22:21, 32:22, 37:21 march [1] - 22:19 Marisa [12] - 12:28, 13:5, 13:7, 13:8, 23:5, 23:9, 23:29, 24:16, 34:23, 36:22, 41:22, 44:29 MARISA[1] - 3:3 MARK [2] - 2:19, 3:4 MARRINAN [1] - 2:6 material [4] - 17:17, 17:19, 17:26, 46:9 matter [15] - 5:14, 8:10, 13:24, 15:20. 17:29, 28:15, 28:16, 28:27, 36:25, 39:24, 39:27, 42:11, 50:8, 50:24, 55:21 matters [6] - 4:5, 5:25, 10:20, 17:20, 41:27, 45:11 MATTERS [1] - 1:5 McCabe [1] - 54:14 McCabe's [1] - 54:26 McDermott [33] -2:15, 3:11, 8:17, 8:19, 10:3, 10:10, 10:16, 10:19, 10:26, 11:4, 11:6. 12:10. 14:1. 17:18, 18:3, 23:17, 27:3, 27:7, 27:8, 28:9, 28:10, 29:20, 30:14, 30:21, 31:14, 31:20, 32:2, 36:22, 44:26,

54:16, 54:23, 55:2, 55:4

McGinn [31] - 3:7, 4:14, 4:24, 6:10, 16:17, 18:15, 20:4, 22:28, 25:22, 26:8, 38:3, 38:27, 39:5, 39:27, 40:16, 41:17, 42:14, 42:23, 43:12, 43:27, 48:26, 49:9, 49:24, 50:22, 51:4, 51:5, 51:8, 51:17, 52:2, 52:10, 53:23

MCGINN [1] - 40:11

McGinn's [2] - 39:15, 51:7 McGoey [3] - 41:18,

41:24, 53:26 **McGovern** [11] -4:24, 6:10, 7:16, 7:22, 13:25, 16:13, 18:16, 22:29, 25:22, 26:9, 38:3

McGowan [11] - 2:28, 23:1, 23:27, 26:11, 26:16, 26:17, 26:18, 32:25, 32:28, 44:28, 45:8

MCGUINNESS [1] -

2:6

McGuinness [33] - 2:10, 4:4, 5:28, 6:5, 6:27, 7:12, 7:14, 8:9, 8:18, 14:23, 38:17, 38:19, 39:13, 39:14, 40:3, 40:9, 40:15, 40:23, 40:29, 41:7, 41:10, 41:19, 41:25, 50:27, 52:8, 52:17, 52:20, 52:21, 53:3, 53:5, 54:25, 55:14, 55:18

MCKECHNIE [1] - 2:16

McTeague [3] -

23:23, 24:1, 24:16
mean [38] - 7:11, 8:3,
8:5, 8:8, 14:7, 18:28,
19:9, 19:28, 20:27,
21:14, 23:11, 25:27,
29:24, 30:5, 30:8,
30:29, 31:5, 31:17,
33:22, 33:24, 34:6,
34:8, 35:3, 37:2,
40:23, 40:24, 40:25,
41:23, 42:1, 43:14,
44:17, 45:16, 46:6,
50:12, 50:14, 51:25,

meaning [1] - 27:23 means [2] - 13:18, 21:5

52:4, 54:1

meats [2] - 31:12, 37:5

meet [2] - 17:20, 18:11

meeting [82] - 4:11,

4:14, 4:22, 4:28, 4:29,

5:4, 6:8, 6:16, 7:15, 7:18, 8:2, 8:12, 8:14, 8:24, 9:2, 9:6, 9:16, 9:26, 10:6, 11:2, 12:4, 12:5, 13:12, 13:14, 15:18, 16:7, 16:11, 18:5, 20:13, 20:14, 20:17, 20:25, 21:13, 21:17, 23:21, 25:10, 25:11, 26:13, 26:18, 26:23, 27:26, 28:21, 28:25, 29:14, 29:15, 29:17, 29:21, 29:25, 29:28, 30:1, 30:26, 31:5, 31:10, 31:17, 31:18, 31:19, 31:21, 31:27, 31:28, 32:1, 32:3, 33:17, 36:18, 37:2, 37:6, 38:20, 38:23, 38:28, 39:17, 39:26, 40:7, 40:14, 40:26, 43:29, 45:15,

49:27, 50:2, 50:25, 51:18, 53:25

meetings [26] - 4:9, 8:6, 10:18, 10:29, 12:27, 13:15, 22:10, 23:26, 28:11, 30:13, 40:1, 40:12, 44:1, 44:4, 44:5, 44:9, 44:11, 45:18, 45:27, 46:1, 46:15, 50:28, 51:4, 51:9

member [2] - 28:29,

29:1 **MEMBER** [2] - 1:12,

members [4] - 27:19, 27:25, 32:20, 32:21 mention [11] - 7:24, 9:4, 9:5, 9:19, 20:6, 20:10, 37:26, 38:7, 39:7, 49:22, 54:8 mentioned [10] -11:1, 26:21, 26:22, 36:23, 36:24, 36:29, 40:28, 41:21, 50:1, 52:10 mentioning [1] -

38:6 met [1] - 34:19 methodology [6] -48:3, 49:13, 51:14, 52:23, 53:1, 53:15 MF [1] - 6:24

MICHAEL[1] - 2:29 Michael [1] - 6:26 might [24] - 7:29, 8:10, 10:23, 12:29, 13:13, 13:22, 14:25, 15:25, 22:3, 28:28, 30:7, 31:1, 35:18, 35:21, 36:29, 37:9, 40:5, 43:7, 45:28, 47:22, 50:18, 52:6,

Milford [1] - 6:12 military [1] - 36:2 millions [1] - 21:29 mind [8] - 6:6, 12:15, 14:5, 21:6, 25:25, 26:26, 42:25, 54:7 minimal [1] - 45:6 minimised [1] - 25:3 Minister [1] - 12:16 minister [1] - 23:15 MINISTER [1] - 1:8 minute [10] - 4:21, 8:23, 9:23, 9:29, 22:12, 27:10, 27:26, 29:25, 31:21

minutes [16] - 4:8,

4:13, 4:27, 5:1, 27:5, 27:9, 27:12, 28:21, 38:19, 38:28, 39:1, 44:3, 44:8, 45:25, 46:1, 51:8 misleading [1] - 24:4 missing [1] - 37:7 mistakes [2] - 36:9, 36:12 mixed [1] - 17:12 mixing [1] - 17:5 modern [1] - 47:28

moment [12] - 5:29, 8:16, 10:10, 14:4, 14:20, 17:12, 25:8, 35:23, 44:8, 47:9, 52:13, 55:8 Monday [3] - 54:4,

module [3] - 17:8,

54:19, 55:19

54:5, 54:21 MONDAY [1] - 55:26 month [3] - 37:19,

37:21, 37:26 monthly [4] - 40:12, 40:13, 40:26, 45:14 months [6] - 7:22, 15:5, 40:24, 42:7,

44:15, 50:28 morning [7] - 27:4, 27:9, 28:20, 29:13, 36:17, 42:24, 54:1 most [3] - 23:14,

30:15, 39:2

move [1] - 45:11 moved [1] - 19:7 MR [142] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4, 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:9, 2:10, 2:10, 2:11, 2:11, 2:15, 2:19, 2:19, 2:20, 2:23, 2:23, 2:24, 2:28, 2:29, 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:7, 3:8, 3:11, 4:4,

5:28, 6:5, 6:27, 7:14,

8:9, 8:19, 10:3, 10:10,

10:16, 10:26, 11:6, 14:1, 14:9, 14:13, 15:25, 16:13, 16:16, 16:18, 16:22, 16:28, 17:1, 17:4, 17:7, 17:13, 18:24, 19:3, 19:14, 20:3, 21:1, 21:4, 21:16, 21:20, 21:22, 22:5, 22:14, 22:16, 22:19, 22:22, 22:26, 23:17, 24:27, 25:1, 25:7, 25:13, 25:15, 25:19, 26:1, 26:4, 26:10, 26:15,

26:17, 26:22, 27:3,

27:8, 27:29, 28:10,
29:20, 30:12, 30:21,
30:25, 31:20, 32:2,
32:19, 33:4, 33:13,
33:26, 34:2, 34:9,
34:13, 38:19, 39:14,
40:3, 40:9, 40:15,
40:29, 41:7, 41:10,
41:19, 41:25, 42:9,
43:9, 43:11, 43:18,
43:21, 43:24, 44:7,
44:13, 44:16, 45:22,
46:7, 46:13, 46:18,
46:20, 46:23, 47:7,
47:24, 48:6, 48:8,
48:11, 48:20, 48:25,
48:29, 49:8, 49:22,
50:17, 50:21, 52:8,
52:17, 52:21, 53:3,
53:5, 54:16, 54:25,
55:4, 55:18
MS [5] - 2:7, 2:7,
2:12, 2:16, 3:11
MULLAN [1] - 2:7
MULLANEY [1] - 3:4
MULLANEYS [1] -
3:4
MURPHY [1] - 2:10
Murray [1] - 43:1
must [4] - 7:6, 11:26,
30:28, 31:13
MÍCHEÁL [1] - 2:9
inionent [i] 2.0
NI
N

48:19, 53:4, 53:9, 53:10, 53:13, 53:22, 53:29, 54:1, 54:2 **NIALL** [1] - 3:11 nobody [1] - 16:10 **NOEL** [1] - 2:11 normal [2] - 20:24, 46:27 northern [1] - 40:27 note [1] - 38:25 notebooks [1] - 38:5 noted [1] - 38:26 notes [2] - 1:27, 18:6 nothing [7] - 23:22, 26:1, 42:15, 43:16, 48:15, 50:28, 51:16 notion [1] - 20:27 notwithstanding [1] November [9] - 4:10, 6:9, 10:25, 33:28, 36:19, 37:20, 38:21, 40:6, 50:26 nowadays [2] -33:20, 46:28 number [11] - 4:6, 4:12, 5:23, 7:22, 11:9, 11:26, 14:24, 15:5, 31:11, 39:1, 44:15

55:5

4:2, 55:26

1:12, 2:3

OF [4] - 1:3, 1:9,

offered [1] - 19:17

OFFICE [1] - 2:12

office [5] - 6:14,

13:2, 24:10, 39:21

officer [1] - 41:10

officers [2] - 38:5,

ON [4] - 1:6, 1:10,

often [1] - 40:1

1:18. 4:1

0

O'HIGGINS [1] - 2:9

name [2] - 22:27, named [1] - 1:27 names [1] - 22:7 Napoleon [1] - 53:18 narrow [1] - 22:1 necessarily [2] -35:2, 36:9 necessary [4] -25:13, 25:19, 52:13, 52:18 necessity [4] - 25:2, 26:12, 26:23, 48:2 need [7] - 32:4, 34:2, 34:3, 35:3, 52:1, 53:21, 53:22 needed [1] - 8:29 needs [4] - 12:18, 33:13, 35:25, 52:15 Nelson's [1] - 36:4 never [2] - 29:23, 36:6 new [1] - 6:22

next [10] - 38:14,

O'NEILL [1] - 3:11 objection [1] - 41:16 obligation [1] - 14:7 obvious [2] - 31:28, 43:4 obviously [31] - 4:16, 4:28, 5:13, 5:29, 7:23, 7:25, 9:12, 9:20, 10:28, 12:1, 13:19, 14:26, 16:13, 19:3, 22:9, 25:1, 26:1, 27:20, 28:19, 31:10, 39:15, 39:18, 39:28, 40:10, 41:10, 41:26, 42:16, 49:24, 52:22, 54:26, 55:18 occasion [1] - 11:13 occasions [1] -11:10 occur [1] - 30:7 occurs [1] - 12:15 October [16] - 22:9, 22:13, 22:16, 22:17, 24:22, 32:22, 32:28, 37:20, 39:17, 44:29, 45:2, 54:17, 54:20,

once [4] - 14:6, 28:11, 50:12, 50:14 one [43] - 4:7, 4:10, 4:13, 7:20, 10:24, 11:28, 13:5, 13:13, 13:15, 13:21, 15:10, 15:25, 16:5, 17:11, 22:1, 26:20, 28:1, 28:4, 28:27, 29:25, 30:29, 31:1, 33:29, 34:3, 34:29, 36:12, 39:22, 40:6, 40:7, 44:17, 47:22, 49:11, 49:16, 52:22, 53:3, 53:5, 53:8, 53:9, 54:7, one's [1] - 12:15 ones [1] - 27:22 opportunity [4] -5:16, 29:13, 31:25, opposed [1] - 10:24 orally [1] - 13:24 ordinary [1] - 31:6 organic [1] - 14:27 OSMOND [1] - 2:13 OTHER [1] - 1:4 otherwise [2] -30:14, 44:4 ought [6] - 17:14, 25:18, 26:11, 34:28, 39:9, 52:4 outcome [1] - 13:18 outline [4] - 5:19, 12:12, 38:18, 43:3 outside [5] - 49:4, 50:9, 50:11, 53:26, 53:27 overall [1] - 36:13 overview [1] - 39:5 own [2] - 19:9, 42:6

OCTOBER [3] - 1:18, 2:25 49:23 4:23 6:5, 24:9 55:19 55:12 52:22

23:13

19:20, 35:6, 35:7

2:2, 2:4, 2:19

PETER [4] - 1:12,

Peter [2] - 6:13, P petrol [1] - 29:3 PADRAIG[1] - 2:23 **PhD** [1] - 28:4 PAF [2] - 44:1, 44:4 phone [8] - 10:5, pages [1] - 38:29 23:22, 23:27, 29:15, PALF [4] - 44:1, 44:4, 29:16, 50:23, 50:25 50:28, 51:9 phoned [1] - 39:16 pardon [1] - 31:2 photocopy [1] - 38:8 parents [1] - 7:6 picture [1] - 36:13 PARLIAMENT[1] piece [1] - 23:13 pillar [1] - 36:5 part [2] - 24:21, place [8] - 19:28, 26:6, 26:13, 31:11, participants [1] -31:18, 34:11, 36:5, 40:2 particular [2] -PLACE [1] - 2:30 10:24, 49:11 **plans** [1] - 31:9 parties [3] - 4:19, Pleadings [6] - 11:7, 11:8, 35:15, 35:19, party [2] - 8:10, 47:4, 47:5 point [8] - 5:29, 9:2, **PASSED** [1] - 1:5 15:26, 18:10, 26:19, passed [1] - 16:23 27:2, 53:9, 55:23 patently [1] - 24:13 police [1] - 41:5 PATRICK [1] - 2:6 policing [1] - 39:1 Patrick [1] - 35:27 policy [2] - 8:4, PAUL [2] - 2:15, 2:19 10.20 Pearse [1] - 35:28 position [8] - 8:19, pen [1] - 35:11 9:12, 9:25, 11:28, pens [1] - 35:10 28:10, 43:16, 53:24, people [21] - 13:20, 55:3 15:18, 16:11, 25:11, possibility [2] -31:11, 31:18, 32:9, 36:28, 37:8 33:20, 35:10, 35:21, possible [12] - 6:3, 36:2, 36:4, 36:5, 36:9, 15:27, 30:16, 33:8, 37:4, 42:5, 46:28, 36:27, 40:21, 48:28, 47:29, 50:19, 55:1, 49:3, 52:11, 54:11, 55:13 perfectly [1] - 46:16 possibly [5] - 9:20, perhaps [17] - 5:10, 28:2, 35:10, 42:18, 5:20, 5:27, 7:20, 54:20 21:14, 26:11, 26:12, potential [7] - 5:21, 28:28, 29:23, 36:10, 26:25, 37:8, 39:11, 39:23. 43:22. 45:12. 39:12, 40:23, 41:1 49:4, 49:6, 51:18, potentially [13] - 5:9, 7:10. 7:14. 8:8. 10:23. period [9] - 18:4, 13:13, 13:22, 13:23, 22:9. 22:24. 37:20. 14:11, 36:19, 39:13, 37:21, 37:26, 44:12, 40:25, 41:12 45:24, 45:28 POWER [1] - 3:7 periods [1] - 45:25 practical [3] - 40:10, person [2] - 16:4, 40:15, 53:9 precedes [1] - 25:1 personnel [1] - 50:14 prepared [2] - 23:14, Peruvian [8] - 18:23, 47.13 18:29, 19:15, 19:18, present [11] - 4:6.

4:12, 14:25, 14:27,

29:26, 41:11, 52:8,

16:4, 17:4, 26:7,

52:18 45:27, 52:24 11:22 reasonably [2] reported [1] - 24:8 presentation [1] providing[1] - 46:14 15:11, 15:16 relating [7] - 9:7, 9:8, reports [1] - 39:21 précis [2] - 12:23, 6:1 recalled [5] - 26:12, 10:5, 10:27, 11:24, represent [1] - 43:19 12:3, 39:3 pressure [8] - 15:28, 13:24 34:18, 37:28, 37:29, represented [2] relation [70] - 4:29, 16:1. 16:3. 16:8. 16:9. purpose [1] - 11:12 40.16 43:12, 55:19 24:7, 24:8, 24:9 purposes [1] - 52:9 recalling [2] - 18:20, 5:25, 7:18, 7:29, requested [1] - 14:15 10:20, 12:24, 13:29, pressurised [1] pursue [1] - 30:2 41:16 require [1] - 41:13 16:7 received [6] - 4:6, 15:3, 15:10, 15:26, put [17] - 4:9, 9:22, required [3] - 9:24, 16:25, 17:19, 17:28, presumably [7] -14:19, 14:25, 24:7, 7:6, 18:6, 20:4, 23:19, 10:17, 49:18 18:6, 18:7, 22:2, 22:5, 6:26, 9:27, 11:1, 39:18 24:8, 24:9, 27:28, requirements [1] -11:25, 26:29, 29:29, recollection [5] -22:11, 23:3, 24:2, 31:8, 31:24, 34:20, 17.21 40:26 35:21, 36:5, 36:27, 8:22, 36:12, 42:24, 24:5, 24:19, 25:19, RESOLUTIONS [1] presumption[1] -50:6, 54:29 51:18, 51:24 26:6, 27:20, 27:25, 28:4, 28:17, 30:12, 47:10 reconvene[1] resources [1] - 41:6 30:14, 30:16, 30:19, 53:13 pretty [1] - 20:24 Q respect [4] - 17:14, 30:25, 30:28, 31:10, recorded [3] - 4:13, prevent[1] - 53:6 17:25, 21:10, 22:1 32:5, 32:11, 32:23, previously [1] -27:12, 41:11 respectful [1] - 14:15 quarterly [1] - 40:3 33:6, 33:14, 34:4, 39:10 records [4] - 29:7, response [2] - 13:1, **QUAY** [1] - 2:21 34:5, 34:21, 36:15, 34:10, 39:4, 40:19 prick [1] - 50:1 queries [1] - 12:8 36:20, 37:1, 37:16, redacted [1] - 41:27 **primary** [1] - 50:2 rest [1] - 27:22 query [2] - 31:17, 37:18, 37:25, 38:4, **REDDY** [1] - 2:29 principal [2] - 23:7, restrictive [1] - 33:10 47:18 39:6, 40:17, 42:1, 32:27 refer [1] - 4:16 result [1] - 13:17 questioned [1] -43:24, 44:27, 46:25, probability [1] reference [16] - 8:21, **RESUMED** [1] - 4:1 28.23 48:29, 49:5, 49:12, 36:29 10:23, 11:7, 11:21, retired [1] - 51:21 questions [8] - 13:8, 49:17, 49:25, 50:3, problem [4] - 26:28, 11:22, 17:24, 18:18, retires [1] - 12:14 20:17, 20:18, 21:4, 50:14, 51:25, 52:4, 26:29, 43:10, 49:10 20:15, 25:26, 27:18, returns [1] - 50:19 24:6, 47:11, 47:22, 52:29, 53:19, 54:13, problems [1] - 19:16 30:23, 33:27, 37:14, revelations [1] -51:2 54:14 procedure [1] -42:9, 42:11 33:21 queue [3] - 29:5, relatively [1] - 29:29 referencing [2] revenue [1] - 50:19 31:12, 37:4 relayed [1] - 13:4 18:9, 30:18 proceed [1] - 52:28 reviewed [2] - 46:3, quickly [1] - 28:21 relevance [13] - 5:22, referral [17] - 4:17, proceeded [1] -46:24 quill [1] - 35:10 8:20, 11:5, 13:17, 6:23, 6:28, 7:1, 7:6, 14:28 revived [1] - 45:13 QUINN [1] - 2:20 14:20, 15:3, 15:10, 7:7, 7:17, 7:21, 12:3, process [10] - 11:16, revolution[1] quite [1] - 24:4 18:12, 18:22, 40:9, 22:14, 23:20, 39:7, 14:27, 23:24, 24:3, 35:27 40:21, 41:1, 41:19 quote [1] - 28:2 42:16, 42:17, 45:2, 46:4, 47:12, 47:13, **ridiculous** [1] - 19:6 relevant [52] - 5:9, 45:4, 50:13 47:14, 49:15, 52:23 rise 181 - 15:11. R 6:2, 7:10, 7:11, 7:13, referrals [16] - 5:1, produce [2] - 31:20, 15:16, 20:16, 21:6, 7:15, 9:22, 13:20, 6:16, 6:17, 6:21, 7:19, 21:11, 21:13, 46:7, 13:22, 14:11, 14:17, 8:25, 8:28, 9:4, 10:8, produced [5] - 20:7, 51:5 raise [1] - 11:14 14:24, 15:6, 15:23, 10:25, 20:26, 20:27, 20:9, 21:12, 25:4, risk [1] - 30:6 raised [2] - 51:3, 17:23, 17:29, 18:19, 21:11, 31:4, 33:28, 51:1 Rita [2] - 36:21, 18:28, 19:10, 19:25, 36:25 producing[1]-44:26 raising [1] - 31:16 20:11, 21:7, 21:12, 20:29 referred [6] - 5:2, **RITA**[1] - 3:11 rang [1] - 9:27 21.22 22.24 30.27 5.5 23.18 33.18 professor [1] - 28:3 road [1] - 10:28 re [2] - 6:16, 20:25 31:23, 32:3, 32:19, 39:22, 50:15 progressed [1] room [1] - 53:11 reaching [1] - 26:27 32:22, 33:4, 33:5, refers [1] - 4:10 14:22 rules [1] - 46:29 read [2] - 35:28, 33:7, 34:20, 35:14, regard [1] - 22:26 pronouncements [1] run [1] - 30:15 35:29 35:19, 35:20, 37:22, region [2] - 38:25, - 46:11 readily [2] - 14:18, 38:23, 44:12, 45:23, 40:27 proper [3] - 12:23, 16:14 45:28, 45:29, 46:3, regional [8] - 4:11, 18:21, 24:20 real [1] - 41:16 46:25, 47:2, 48:1, 38:20, 39:26, 40:7, properly [1] - 15:21 realise [2] - 8:5, 36:2 49:25, 51:11, 55:19 propose [1] - 46:14 40:25, 44:2, 44:9, realistic [1] - 44:17 remains [1] - 19:18 44:11 proposing[1]reality [2] - 36:6, remarks [1] - 14:14 regionally [1] - 40:12 54:19 47:20 reminders [1] -REGISTRAR[1] - 2:4 PROTECTED [2] really [2] - 29:7, 42:29 regular [1] - 32:25 1:3, 1:4 44:20 reply [2] - 27:29, rejected [1] - 23:20 provide [2] - 10:3,

safer [1] - 55:9 sake [1] - 28:6 **SARAH**[1] - 2:16 satisfied [2] - 12:2, 27:23 **SC** [11] - 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:9, 2:10, 2:15, 2:19, 2:23, 2:28, 3:3, 3:7

relates [2] - 4:21,

relate [3] - 4:16,

7:20, 9:10

30:11

39:3

report [2] - 39:2,

realm [1] - 36:28

reasonable [2] -

19:8, 35:5

provided [6] - 13:24,

15:7, 42:13, 44:9,

scanned [1] - 38:8 scintilla [1] - 50:8 scope [2] - 5:8, 29:10 SEANAD [1] - 1:6 search [26] - 18:10, 19:8, 20:6, 21:27, 22:6, 22:7, 22:11, 24:26, 24:27, 25:1, 25:3, 25:4, 25:20, 27:6, 30:16, 30:19, 33:13, 34:22, 34:24,	13:25, 17:2, 23:1, 23:27, 26:16, 26:17, 32:25, 44:27, 45:8, 54:14, 54:26 serious [1] - 48:18 service [1] - 7:8 Services [1] - 1:25 SERVICES [1] - 1:30 set [2] - 17:13, 46:29 sexual [1] - 33:21 SGT [1] - 2:28	51:16 SOLICITOR [1] - 2:7 SOLICITOR'S [1] - 2:12 SOLICITORS [4] - 2:20, 2:24, 2:29, 3:4 solicitors [1] - 38:11 someone [7] - 29:16, 34:28, 40:5, 43:4, 43:5, 49:3, 53:25 sometime [1] - 26:6 somewhere [2] -	Station [3] - 4:22, 6:9, 36:18 stay [1] - 42:2 stenographic [1] - 1:27 STENOGRAPHY [1] - 1:30 stenography [1] - 1:25 step [2] - 16:5, 51:23 steps [5] - 6:2, 36:3,	24:29, 25:5, 28:7, 33:12, 33:13, 50:8, 52:3 suggested [2] - 6:28, 49:1 suggesting [3] - 19:21, 22:6, 32:17 suggestion [5] - 22:2, 22:3, 40:24, 49:12, 52:7 SUNLIGHT [1] - 2:25 SUPERINTENDENT
37:16, 37:18, 37:24,	SHANE [1] - 2:10 Sheridan [8] - 22:29,	33:19, 51:22	36:6, 36:7, 36:8 stick [2] - 8:15, 17:11	[1] - 40:11
44:3, 48:3, 51:12,	38:26, 41:12, 41:14,	soon [4] - 6:3, 10:11,	sticking [1] - 52:5	superintendent [5] -
53:16	49:26, 49:27, 52:3,	52:27, 55:17	still [9] - 7:7, 18:24,	6:13, 7:16, 16:29,
searched [1] - 22:28	52:11	sorry [7] - 15:24,	20:7, 20:8, 20:14,	39:25, 49:26
searches [13] -	SHERIDAN [1] - 2:27	15:29, 25:15, 26:17,	35:12, 42:8, 44:10	Superintendent [57]
17:19, 18:8, 18:21,	SHIP [1] - 2:13	28:10, 30:25, 46:13	stood [4] - 13:7,	- 4:14, 4:23, 4:24,
19:23, 21:23, 21:25,	short [1] - 18:4	sort [2] - 7:25, 31:5	24:19, 36:3, 51:13	4:25, 6:10, 6:11, 7:16,
30:21, 32:19, 32:23,	shortly [1] - 44:25	sought [3] - 7:8,	stop [2] - 43:16,	7:22, 16:13, 16:17, 16:19, 16:23, 18:15,
33:9, 37:13, 45:23, 47:14	showed [1] - 39:19	11:23	51:16	18:16, 18:17, 20:4,
searching [3] -	showing [1] - 23:19	sounds [1] - 25:27 speaking [2] - 7:17,	story [1] - 13:28 strategic [1] - 5:3	22:28, 22:29, 25:21,
44:10, 52:24, 53:1	shown [3] - 12:22, 40:29, 41:2	10:13	strategic-type [1] -	25:22, 25:23, 26:8,
second [2] - 35:25,	side [1] - 20:8	specific [2] - 13:4,	5:3	26:9, 38:3, 38:26,
49:22	Simms [16] - 12:4,	48:12	street [1] - 29:1	38:27, 39:5, 39:15,
secondly [1] - 28:8	12:29, 13:5, 13:7,	spent [1] - 23:18	STREET [4] - 2:13,	39:27, 40:16, 41:12,
secret [3] - 27:12,	13:9, 23:5, 23:9,	SPRING [1] - 3:8	2:21, 2:25, 3:5	41:14, 41:16, 42:14,
30:12, 30:13	23:29, 24:16, 30:18,	SQUARE [1] - 3:9	strict [2] - 15:3,	42:23, 43:1, 43:12,
section [1] - 54:9	30:20, 33:2, 34:23,	stage [11] - 5:14,	53:19	43:27, 48:26, 49:9,
see [21] - 5:26,	36:22, 41:22, 44:29	5:15, 5:21, 14:14,	strictly [1] - 17:19	49:24, 49:27, 50:22, 51:4, 51:5, 51:7, 51:8,
13:28, 14:27, 25:23, 26:23, 31:5, 33:24,	SIMMS [1] - 3:3	15:8, 15:21, 17:3,	strike [1] - 22:26	51:17, 52:2, 52:3,
37:22, 38:7, 40:21,	Simms/Harrison [1] - 20:16	23:4, 42:13, 49:11, 49:29	stuck [2] - 19:17,	52:10, 52:11, 53:23
41:14, 41:16, 41:19,		stalled [1] - 45:12	35:6	supplied [1] - 51:19
46:24, 48:8, 49:4,	simple [1] - 9:12 simply [7] - 9:13,	stamp [3] - 23:18,	students [1] - 28:4 stuff [4] - 31:19,	suppose [7] - 8:5,
52:13, 52:15, 53:28	14:16, 17:20, 18:11,	24:5	32:10, 32:12, 47:17	8:9, 10:20, 13:12,
seem [5] - 7:20, 13:9,	20:22, 34:23, 39:4	stand [4] - 23:5,	subject [4] - 28:15,	29:10, 39:14, 40:15
28:26, 31:6, 43:2	single [2] - 33:29,	44:8, 47:14, 49:5	28:16, 31:3, 36:25	supposed [2] -
send [2] - 32:13,	34:3	standing [2] - 36:8,	submission [5] -	40:22, 47:19
38:10	sit [2] - 54:2, 54:19	37:4	14:15, 25:16, 35:5,	SUPREME [2] - 1:13,
sending [1] - 50:19	situation [4] - 14:7,	start [5] - 22:9,	41:13, 42:1	2:3 Supreme [1] - 46:10
senior [3] - 4:12, 7:18, 38:23	14:12, 20:3, 34:19	22:10, 22:13, 28:11,	submissions [7] -	SUPT [1] - 2:23
sense [6] - 7:19,	six [3] - 27:21, 27:22,	51:16	15:14, 24:24, 30:10,	surely [1] - 32:11
15:3, 39:2, 39:23,	37:21	starting [2] - 24:15, 38:21	34:26, 54:4, 54:12, 55:10	surmise [1] - 29:22
43:25, 51:15	six-month [1] - 37:21 slightest [1] - 31:7	startling [1] - 32:24	55:10 submit [1] - 51:9	surprise [1] - 49:29
sensible [1] - 25:28	SLIGO [1] - 3:5	starts [2] - 10:28,	subsequent [2] -	surprising [1] -
sensibly [1] - 45:16	small [1] - 44:14	11:28	23:21, 50:25	39:23
sent [1] - 42:29	Smith [8] - 23:7,	STATE [1] - 2:12	subsequently [1] -	surrounding [1] -
sentence [4] - 4:17,	26:11, 26:14, 26:19,	state [1] - 50:3	23:21	50:28
27:21, 27:23, 39:3	29:19, 29:26, 32:26,	State [1] - 53:12	such' [1] - 35:16	suspicion [1] - 53:19
separate [1] - 12:27	37:28	statement [13] -	such-and-such [2] -	suspicious [1] - 25:9
separately [1] -	social [9] - 13:6,	9:13, 9:24, 12:23,	35:17, 47:20	swamp [1] - 19:21
43:12 September [1] -	16:1, 16:8, 16:9, 23:6,	23:29, 41:13, 42:26,	such-and-such' [1] -	swear [1] - 23:15 swore [1] - 47:12
44:24	23:10, 23:12, 32:27,	44:26, 44:28, 48:29, 50:14, 51:10, 51:23	35:16	system [1] - 11:16
sergeant [3] - 6:13,	45:13	50:14, 51:19, 51:23, 52:9	sufficient [4] - 18:11,	Síochána [11] - 4:7,
16:18, 17:7	softly [2] - 52:14 SOLE [2] - 1:12, 2:2	station [2] - 29:3,	18:21, 49:15, 52:8	12:20, 16:7, 17:25,
Sergeant [14] - 4:26,	solicitor [2] - 26:10,	38:20	suggest [11] - 5:15, 22:7, 24:26, 24:27,	17:27, 18:9, 24:14,

27:19, 32:20, 32:21, 34:22

Т

tangle [2] - 14:5 team [1] - 16:8 **TEELING** [1] - 3:5 telephone [1] - 51:24 TEN [1] - 2:17 tend [1] - 33:20 term [7] - 8:21, 11:21, 11:22, 27:17, 27:18, 30:23, 37:14 terms [11] - 12:17, 12:18, 20:26, 22:6, 22:11, 24:28, 25:22, 27:16, 30:16, 39:10, 47:14 TERRACE [1] - 2:17 terrible [1] - 52:19 Terry [1] - 49:24 test [20] - 14:20, 15:10. 17:14. 17:16. 17:23, 18:12, 18:14, 18:23, 18:24, 19:1, 19:20, 19:22, 30:9, 34:21, 35:6, 35:8, 35:13, 47:16 tests [1] - 18:11 THE [10] - 1:4, 1:8, 1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6, 2:9, 2:21, 4:1, 55:26 themselves [1] -13:21 THEN [1] - 55:26 theology [1] - 28:3 therefore [7] - 11:14, 13:27, 15:6, 17:16, 21:7, 27:27 thinking [2] - 12:12, 48:17 thinks [1] - 9:21 third [1] - 24:9 thousands [3] -21:28, 33:23, 33:27 three [1] - 18:10 three-point [1] -18:10 thrown [2] - 19:15, 37:17 tier [1] - 35:20 **TO**[1] - 55:26 today [6] - 10:15, 10:16, 16:14, 48:16, 52:25, 54:27 together[1] - 32:10

tomorrow [3] - 32:2,

33:8, 52:28

took [1] - 26:6 top [1] - 55:7 total [1] - 38:29 touches [1] - 7:25 Town [2] - 31:13, 37:4 Townsend [1] - 36:1 train [13] - 17:15, 17:23, 17:26, 18:1, 18:12, 18:13, 18:22, 19:11, 19:12, 20:18, 21:6, 26:26, 51:6 transcript [1] - 1:26 trawl [1] - 45:25

11:19 **TRIBUNAL** [3] - 1:3, 2:6, 55:26

tribunal [3] - 11:8,

Tribunal [56] - 5:8, 5:19, 5:23, 6:1, 9:17, 9:20, 10:1, 10:28, 11:10, 12:22, 14:8, 14:14, 14:21, 14:23, 14:28, 14:29, 15:7, 15:21, 16:22, 16:26, 17:21, 21:9, 22:8, 23:17, 24:12, 24:20, 28:14, 28:18, 30:26, 32:13, 32:24, 34:16, 34:17, 38:10, 38:12, 39:10, 39:18, 41:23, 41:28, 42:20, 45:26, 45:29, 46:4, 46:8, 46:14, 46:25, 48:5, 48:27, 49:1, 49:10, 50:5, 50:29, 51:7, 52:10, 54:19, 55:21 Tribunal's [1] - 8:21 tribunals [2] - 19:1,

TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:9 tried [1] - 12:12 trouble [1] - 21:26 try [5] - 20:20, 29:7, 29:11, 44:20, 55:12 trying [2] - 28:19, 47:27

26:29

Tuesday [2] - 54:12, 54:15

turn [3] - 13:17, 42:7, 47:20 turned [2] - 47:17, 47:21

turning [1] - 17:9 **Tusla** [34] - 8:19, 8:27, 9:6, 9:16, 11:1, 11:26, 12:6, 13:25, 14:26, 18:8, 18:18, 20:6, 20:8, 20:9, 20:28, 21:29, 23:28, 27:19, 27:25, 28:17, 29:1, 29:27, 32:21, 32:26, 34:22, 37:15, 37:22, 42:16, 42:17, 45:3, 45:4, 45:7, 45:9

TUSLA[1] - 2:15

Tusla/HSE [1] - 54:15

two [8] - 5:26, 7:22, 28:20, 34:27, 35:20, 44:10, 52:21, 55:11

two-tier [1] - 35:20

type [3] - 5:3, 5:4, 7:21

typewriters [1] - 35:9

UK [1] - 19:14 UNDER [2] - 1:3, 1:9 under [4] - 14:7, 34:6, 45:5, 46:27 understood [1] undoubtedly [1] -17:24 unfortunate [1] -33:18 unfortunately [3] -18:20, 32:5, 54:2 unless [3] - 30:8, 30:10, 38:1 unnecessary [1] -46:8 up [26] - 10:25, 12:5, 12:25, 12:26, 13:27, 16:15, 17:5, 17:12, 20:5, 29:3, 31:29, 32:12, 33:19, 37:17, 39:20, 42:7, 42:25, 43:6, 47:17, 47:20, 47:21, 50:1, 50:13, 50:25, 52:22, 55:12 up-to-date [1] - 43:6 update [2] - 39:26, 52:5 updated [1] - 4:14 useful [1] - 49:6

V

various [2] - 36:21, 41:5 vast [2] - 32:7, 34:14 verbatim [1] - 1:26 version [1] - 20:8 view [9] - 5:29, 19:19, 41:22, 41:24, 48:4, 52:25, 53:3, 53:5, 53:8 viewing [1] - 39:24 virtually [1] - 32:6 vis-á-vis [1] - 14:12 visit [4] - 24:10, 24:11, 24:15 volume [1] - 9:11 volumes [1] - 46:14

W

wait [2] - 22:12,

42.13

Wales [2] - 19:5, 19:15 wants [4] - 10:4, 10:12, 30:10, 54:13 ways [1] - 52:21 website [2] - 54:29, 55:14 WEDNESDAY [2] -1:18, 4:1 Wednesday [5] -53:4. 53:22. 53:29. 54:1, 55:10 week [21] - 22:23, 32:29, 42:2, 48:7, 48:10, 48:12, 48:19, 48:20, 52:25, 52:29, 53:10, 53:13, 53:22, 54:2, 54:4, 54:5, 54:12, 54:15 week's [1] - 54:23 whatsoever [1] -8:21 WHELAN [1] - 2:11 whereby [3] - 20:11, 34:19, 51:12 whole [2] - 20:27, 31:3 wide [2] - 19:12, 38:21 wish [2] - 5:18, 15:22 withdrawn [1] -23:29 witness [7] - 6:3, 14:26, 25:2, 29:27, 34:18, 53:23, 54:8 witnesses [13] -5:10, 5:24, 15:23, 18:20, 21:9, 22:8, 24:28, 25:2, 29:23,

29:26, 49:17, 52:27,

wonder [2] - 10:18,

wonderful [1] - 35:12

wondering [4] - 7:12,

8:8, 31:14, 54:10

53:16

13:10, 13:26, 21:27, 27:21, 27:22, 35:20, 36.21 worker [5] - 16:1, 16:9, 23:6, 23:11, 32:27 workers [2] - 13:6, 23:12 worry [2] - 17:17, 42:26 worse [1] - 47:1 wrapped [1] - 55:12 write [1] - 12:14 written [2] - 23:15, 24:1 wrote [2] - 12:6,

word [1] - 11:18

words [8] - 10:21,

Υ

35:10

year [3] - 6:21, 23:16, 33:28 years [1] - 32:7 yesterday [9] - 4:6, 12:12, 16:20, 16:21, 17:6, 25:29, 26:1, 36:16, 44:22 young [1] - 55:3 yourself [1] - 32:14

Ζ

Zappone [1] - 12:17

€

€1 [3] - 23:18, 24:5

Ė

ÉIREANN [2] - 1:5, 1:6

0

Ó [7] - 3:8, 43:13, 43:23, 48:23, 48:25, 48:29, 51:17