TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON THURSDAY, 12TH APRIL 2018 - DAY 64

64

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT **SOLE MEMBER:**

REGISTRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR. DIARMAID MCGUINNESS SC

MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. KATHLEEN LEADER BL

MS. ELIZABETH MULLAN, SOLICITOR

FOR SGT. McCABE: MR. MICHAEL MCDOWELL SC

MR. PAUL MCGARRY SC MR. BREFFNI GORDON BL

INSTRUCTED BY: SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY

HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY

DUBLIN 7

FOR THE COMMISSIONER:

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC MR. NOEL WHELAN BL MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL MR. JOHN FITZGERALD BL

INSTRUCTED BY: MS. ALISON MORRISSEY

MS. EMMA GRIFFIN

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

MR. PATRICK McCANN SC FOR MR. BRIAN PURCELL:

MR. GERARD MEEHAN BL MR. CHARLES WALLACE INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

FOR SUPT. TAYLOR: MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS

MS. TARA BURNS SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL

INSTRUCTED BY: M.E. HANAHOE SOLICITORS

SUNLIGHT CHAMBERS 21 PARLIAMENT STREET

DUBLIN 2

FOR MRS. MICHELLE TAYLOR: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FELIX MCENROY SC O'MARA GERAGHTY MCCOURT 51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR MR. JOHN WILSON:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MARK HARTY SC PETER CONNOLLY **COURT SOLICITORS** 6 CAPEL STREET FIRST FLOOR DUBLIN 1

FOR JOHN McGUINNESS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DARREN LEHANE BL

LAWLOR PARTNERS SOLICITORS

ARRAN SQUARE ARRAN QUAY DUBLIN 7

FOR ALISON O'REILLY:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FÍONÁN Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH BL AUGUSTUS CULLEN LAW SOLICITORS

18 BOW STREET **SMITHFIELD** DUBLIN 7

FOR MR. NOEL BRETT:

MR. SEÁN BARTON MCCANN FITZGERALD

RIVERSIDE ONE 37-42 SIR JOHN ROGERSON'S QUAY GRAND CANAL DOCK

FOR MR. GERALD KEAN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DAVID BOUGHTON BL

KEAN SOLICITORS
NO. 2 UPPER PEMBROKE STREET
DUBLIN 2

INDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
MR. GERALD KEAN	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS	5
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCGARRY	95
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS	99
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. CONNOLLY	109
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	112
EXAMINED BY MR. BOUGHTON	145
FURTHER CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS	152
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS	155
MR. NOEL BRETT	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER	162
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCDOWELL	174
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS	177
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM	183
FURTHER CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCDOWELL	205
RE-EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER	208
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	210
MR. DIARMUID O'SULLIVAN	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	217
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCDOWELL	233
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS	234
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE	235
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	236

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON THURSDAY, 12TH	
2			APRIL 2018:	
3				
4			MR. McGUINNESS: The first witness this morning,	
5			Chairman, is Mr. Gerald Kean, please.	10:02
6			MR. BARTON: Chairman, before Mr. Kean, I wonder could	
7			I possibly make an application for representation?	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes, it is actually better if you sit down	
9			because the microphone will get you.	
10			MR. BARTON: I am terribly sorry, Judge. Seán Barton,	10:02
11			McCann FitzGerald, I am with Mr. Noel Brett who is on	
12			the witness list and I believe I should formally apply	
13			for representation.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Yes, thank you very much. That is	
15			absolutely fine.	10:03
16				
17			MR. GERALD KEAN, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	
18			EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS:	
19	1	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: For the convenience of parties,	
20			Chairman, Mr. Kean made a statement to the Tribunal	10:03
21			investigators and that is to be found at Volume 7, page	
22			1725 of the Tribunal's papers. And Mr. Kean, I don't	
23			know if you want to see that statement now or at some	
24			stage but it's available to you on your left-hand side	
25			or on screen, if required.	10:03
26		Α.	Thank you very much.	
27	2	Q.	Mr. Kean, I think you are a solicitor by profession	
28			practising in the City of Dublin?	
29		Α.	That is correct, Mr. Chairman.	

_)	Q.	And I think on the zoth January you participated in a	
2			radio programme on RTÉ radio one hosted by Marian	
3			Finucane on that Sunday morning?	
4		Α.	That is correct.	
5	4	Q.	Okay. We have the transcript there and I will open	10:04
6			that in a minute. But when had you been invited on	
7			that programme?	
8		Α.	I can't remember but it's normally four or five days	
9			beforehand.	
10	5	Q.	Yes. And I think you'd appeared on that programme	10:04
11			perhaps on a number of occasions before?	
12		Α.	Many times, yeah.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Did I hear a year or was that	
14	6	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: 2014.	
15		Α.	On the programme, Mr. Chairman?	10:04
16			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
17		Α.	Was it 26th January 2014, I think. 26th January 2014.	
18	7	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. And are you told the topics in	
19			advance of going on the programme?	
20		Α.	No. Normally you are told the topics on the morning	10:05
21			when the papers are reviewed, but on the odd occasion	
22			you might get a call the day beforehand or two days	
23			beforehand saying oh, by the way, this is going to be	
24			important to review a particular topic that was in the	
25			news at the time.	10:05
26	8	Q.	Yes.	
27		Α.	But normally you would be told only on the morning.	
28	9	Q.	And the Sunday papers feature largely as sort of a	

loose agenda in some ways for discussion?

- 1 A. Absolutely.
- 2 10 Q. And the events of the preceding week?
- 3 A. Absolutely.
- 4 11 Q. And had you followed the events of the preceding week?
- 5 A. I can't remember. I mean, I do keep reasonably up to

10:06

10:06

- 6 date in reading the papers.
- 7 12 Q. Yes.
- 8 A. Because --
- 9 13 Q. We will see obviously in a minute that quite a bit of
- the discussion related to the proceedings of the Public 10:05
- 11 Accounts Committee before which the Commissioner at the
- time, Commissioner Callinan, had appeared that week,
- 13 presumably you recall that?
- 14 A. Yes, I do, yeah.
- 15 14 Q. And it was a week distinguished with some controversy
- arising from a row, in a sense, that was going on
- 17 between An Garda Síochána and the Public Accounts
- 18 Committee as to whether whistleblowers would be called
- to give evidence, do you recall that?
- 20 A. I do recall that.
- 21 15 Q. Okay. And I am sure you didn't watch the
- 22 Commissioner's evidence or read the five hours of it
- or -- but you probably saw that he caused controversy
- in the course of his evidence when referring to the
- actions of the whistleblowers as disgusting, he found
- them personally disgusting?
- 27 A. Yes. I was aware of the controversy and I was aware
- that it was being covered in the papers.
- 29 16 Q. Now, as I understand it from your statement, you had

- met Commissioner Callinan previously, isn't that
 correct?
- Yeah, my recollection is I only ever met the 3 Α. Commissioner once, if I met him a second time I simply 4 5 don't remember, and that was a charity function that I 10:07 was hosting in Cork in UCC in The Quad, and I was MCing 6 7 the event and the Commissioner was there, if I 8 recollect, with his wife and I remember meeting him afterwards and being introduced to him and we had a 9 very nice conversation and my recollection is we would 10 10.07 11 have exchanged cards and said we must catch up again, 12 you know, it was a nice conversation, a social setting.
- 13 17 Q. Yes, yes. And had you invited him to that charity event?
- No, I hadn't. 15 In fact, I didn't know he was attending Α. 10:07 16 until I was given the list of dignitaries sitting in the front row. There's about 2,000 or 3,000 people at 17 18 this event every year and it's for local charities and 19 I am normally given the list at my request as to who I 20 should acknowledge and he was on that list, but I 10:07 didn't invite anybody, no. 21
- 22 18 Q. Yes, yes. Well, did you have him -- you had him on 23 your phone in terms of his phone number, and did you 24 intend that he might be invited to other events?
- 25 A. Yeah, yeah, when we exchanged numbers, I took his
 26 number and in fact I subsequently remember hosting a
 27 dinner part in Drayton Manor and actually inviting him
 28 and his wife to attend, but they were unable to attend
 29 due to late notice. So I had his number from that

-	
1	time.
	L IIIIC.

- 2 19 Q. Okay. Did you have any other contact with him at all?
- 3 A. Other than -- I do recollect contacting him about the

10.08

10:09

10:09

- 4 dinner party, but that didn't go any further.
- 5 20 Q. Okay.
- 6 A. At that time. And then, there was a suggestion we
- 7 would meet for lunch but I was heading out of the
- 8 country then and by the time I came back we didn't
- 9 arrange anything.
- 10 21 Q. All right. And your attendance then at RTÉ on the
- morning of Sunday the 26th, you'd spoken to the
- 12 Commissioner before that, as I understand it?
- 13 A. Yes, yeah. I had spoken to the Commissioner -- the
- 14 records, phone records, I think about four times on the
- 15 Saturday.
- 16 22 Q. Okay.
- 17 A. And I think the records will show that I spoke to him
- before the programme as well.
- 19 23 Q. Okay. We will come to that in due course. But we have
- a transcript of the programme, and there should be I
- 21 hope a loose copy of it there in front of you, is that
- 22 right?
- 23 A. Yes, I have a loose copy of the programme, yes.
- 24 Q. We have distributed, Chairman, a more complete version
- of it showing the whole introduction by Ms. Finucane,
- indicating the topics; I am not sure, Mr. Kean, whether
- 27 you have that one or is it just the one in the folder
- you are relying on?
- 29 A. I just have the one in the folder.

_	23	Q.	remaps we will give you the more comprete version	
2			there.	
3			(Same handed)	
4		Α.	Thank you.	
5	26	Q.	And I am going to try and skip over parts of it	10:1
6			obviously that aren't particularly relevant, but the	
7			first page there which is page number 3, as it were, at	
8			the bottom, that is Ms. Finucane introducing the	
9			programme, do you see that?	
10		Α.	Yes, I do.	10:1
11	27	Q.	And she reads out a number of headlines on that page,	
12			and on down to the next page, page 4, and then in the	
13			middle of page 5 she introduces the guests and you were	
14			introduced there after Mr. Rabbitte, who was the	
15			Minister for Communications, Energy and Natural	10:1
16			resources, and the other guests were Mr. Martin	
17			Donnellan, former Assistant Commissioner, Nóirín	
18			Hegarty, former editor of The Sunday Tribune and	
19			Managing Destination Editor with Lonely Planet, and she	
20			says "we will be joined shortly by Phillip blond,	10:1
21			political philosopher". And she says at the bottom of	
22			page 5:	
23				
24			"If I could start off, I think I will start off with,	
25			there's a lot of coverage in the papers today about	10:1
26			charities, there's a lot of coverage in the papers	
27			today about the Gardaí and interrelated among all of	
28			that, as it were, fite fuaite is the PAC with not	
29			everybody singing from the one hymn-sheet, it has to be	

1			said, at the moment. So I want to go to you first on	
2			this, Pat Rabbitte. You were a member of the PAC and	
3			many of us will remember the hearings, it was chaired	
4			by Jim Mitchell, into the DIRT Inquiry, and people were	
5			very pleased, it has to be said; do you think it has	10:11
6			changed or changed for the worse or the better?"	
7				
8			And then Mr. Rabbitte makes a contribution on page 6	
9			there, and there is some debate between Ms. Finucane	
10			and Mr. Rabbitte about the way the proceedings are	10:11
11			going. It goes on to page 7. And then she turns to	
12			you on page, the top, the sort of middle page 8, I	
13			don't know if you see that?	
14		Α.	I do, yes.	
15	28	Q.	And she says:	10:12
16				
17			"Gerald? Gerald Kean."	
18				
19			And you are quoted as saying then:	
20				10:12
21			"I totally, yeah, I suppose my views on this are very	
22			clear: I totally accept what the Minister says and I	
23			think you know people will know that I'm a great	
24			admirer of John McGuinness, and I think the Public	
25			Accounts Committee do a great job, however I have	10:12
26			concerns. And certainly it is fine for the committee	
27			to pursue its main functions of checking where public	
28			purse monies are going, but when it comes to a	
29			situation involving the Commissioner of An Garda	

1	Stochana and there is a question of criminality	
2	involved, then I am very, very clear in my opinion, and	
3	I think it's reflected by Mary Carr in The Mail today,	
4	that matters of criminality should be left within An	
5	Garda Síochána to deal with. And if, as some political	10:12
6	commentators and media persona have said this week,	
7	they don't have confidence in An Garda Síochána, then	
8	we have a really serious programme, because I do have	
9	confidence in the Garda Síochána and I do think that	
10	matters of criminality, where there's allegations of	10:13
11	criminality have to be dealt with within the force.	
12		
13	Ms. Finucane: But the force investigating the force?	
14		
15	Mr. Kean: Well, that is what the force is there for.	10:13
16	I mean, let me put it this way, and I mean I am not	
17	sure and I don't understand why this hasn't been	
18	highlighted in the media and stuff, but if we take for	
19	example the one that I have an interest in, these	
20	penalty points"	10:13
21	CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness, I think at this point we are	
22	probably at a page where it should perhaps go on the	
23	monitor, are we?	
24	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, at page 1705.	
25	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	10:13
26	MR. McGUINNESS: And you continue on there at the	
27	bottom of page 1705:	
28		

"-- and the role of... and the Commissioner of An Garda

Síochána there, and there's two points, and I know	
Nóirín and Martin were talking beforehand about, first	
of all this criticism of him saying before the Public	
Accounts Committee that "it's my force", and this I	
mean, with all due respects, the head of the armed	10:13
forces calls "his men". I mean, nobody is suggesting	
the Commissioner is at home with the Deputy	
Commissioners and Assistant Commissioners sitting	
around the fire, planning a coup d'état. I mean, "my	
force" denotes pride. It does. And I did my usual	10:14
yesterday, I contacted guards all over the country, I	
spoke with 13, 14 members of the force. Now they're	
mostly guards, one inspector and one sergeant, and they	
are basically are saying there's nothing with that. It	
is his force. He is the leader. And he is not	10:14
suggesting for one moment it's not a very important	
organisation that is there for the benefit and at the	
behest of the State. Of course he's not. It's just a	
turn of phrase. And then I know there is this question	
about referring to "disgusting", you know, I mean when	10:14
you put that in context, what he is saying is that he's	
always stated, and I have been present at one I only	
met the man personally once, so he's not somebody I	
know that well. But, I know at one function he	
advocated in no uncertain terms the importance of	10:14
whistleblowers and the importance of protecting them."	

Now, could I just pause there and go back to your position in relation to these matters? You had

followed the events at least from a distance the 1 2 previous week, isn't that right? 3 Α. That's correct. 4 29 And had you formed your own view about what the PAC 0. 5 were doing? 10:15 6 I'm not sure I had. I'm not sure I had formed my own Α. 7 view about what the PAC were doing. I had certain views but --8 Yeah. Well, had you formed a view yourself that it was 9 30 Q. inappropriate for the whistleblowers to have done what 10 10:15 11 you thought they'd done, sort of taking data relating 12 to people, circulating it and --13 Yes, I mean --Α. 14 31 Ο. -- then appearing before --15 In the public domain, it had been -- it was clear to me 10:15 Α. 16 that what was being said was that Sergeant McCabe hadn't cooperated, so I was taking the view, I thought 17 18 that was wrong. That would have been a view that I 19 held at that time, I said that is -- you know, I don't 20 think that is right. I think if there is a complaint 10:16 then there should be cooperation. I felt, you know, I 21 22 felt concerned, there is no doubt, that if anybody was 23 suggesting the Garda force shouldn't investigate acts 24 or potential acts of criminality in relation to other 25 cases, I thought that was wrong. I thought it was 10:16 26 wrong and I made it clear that anybody should persecute 27 a whistleblower or that they should be treated badly. I have acted for 28 I mean, that is wrong.

whistleblowers, so I would be, you know, a great

- admirer of them. So I think I definitely formed the
- view that if somebody had a complaint and they weren't
- 3 cooperating, that I felt that to be wrong.
- 4 32 Q. Yes. But in terms of what they had done, what was your

10.17

10:17

10:17

- 5 understanding of what they had done, the
- 6 whistleblowers?
- 7 A. Oh, sorry, my understanding of what they had done at
- 8 that stage was that they had refused to cooperate and I
- 9 think it was some four months earlier that the Minister
- 10 had said that in the Dáil.
- 11 33 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. Mr. Shatter. And so, I accepted that as being correct
- to a great extent. That, you know, why would they
- 14 mislead the Government and the country? That they
- weren't cooperating. So I had form that opinion.
- 16 34 Q. You are referring obviously to the investigation done
- by Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony?
- 18 A. Yes, I didn't -- I didn't read that report, but what I
- did read what the then Minister Shatter said in the
- 20 páil.
- 21 35 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. And I would always say if there wasn't cooperation, as
- I believed there wasn't at that time, based on that
- information, that I thought that was wrong.
- 25 36 Q. Yes. But it was an inquiry into the erasure or the way 10:17
- 26 penalty points were dealt with?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 37 Q. You obviously understood that?
- 29 A. Yes, I did.

- 1 38 Q. Yes. And did you know how that had come into the public domain?
- 3 Α. Well, again, I'm not sure I specifically knew it had come in, but I was aware it was there, yeah. 4 5 feeling on that was, again, and I think I said this on 10:18 6 the programme, that is a matter that the guards should 7 investigate and should follow through. And I think I 8 remember saying at one stage that, was it the O'Mahony Tribunal that there was three or four quards 9 disciplined following that, so I felt that was the way, 10
- 11 you know, that the guards should investigate that.
- 12 39 Q. Yes.
- 13 A. I didn't -- I didn't mean to suggest, nor would I

 14 suggest, that PAC shouldn't look at it. Of course not.

 15 But if there was an element of criminality then I felt 10

 16 that was within the domain of An Garda Síochána.
- 17 40 Q. Yes. But did that embrace, as it were, the sort of
 18 leaking of information about the Pulse records and the
 19 provision of them to public figures?
- 20 A. Did that, sorry?
- 21 41 Q. Did that include in your mind the leaking, as it were?

- A. Yes, yes, because I was -- yes, and again I was led to believe what was happening was instead of not only were they not cooperating or Sergeant McCabe wasn't, that there was a leakage of information to certain members
- of the Dáil, and again I felt at that time I didn't
- 27 think that was the appropriate way to do this. You
- 28 know, they should follow the procedures through An
- 29 Garda Síochána first, if they weren't happy with the

- outcome then of course they had other remedies to
 pursue thereafter.

 Yes. So you thought that was probably an inappropriate
- way to be, as it were, dealing with the problem?

 A. Well, I didn't have -- I mean, I suppose it's fair to say that I felt it unusual, bearing in mind that I am

10:20

- led to believe at the same time, as the Minister had said some three or four months earlier, that they weren't cooperating with the guards.
- 10 43 Q. Okay. Well, had you seen headlines relating to sort of 10:19
 11 stories in the paper like, you know, 'Judge has his
 12 points wiped' or 'Sports star...'?
- A. Oh, I was aware that there was allegations about this
 and I had commented that that was wrong. I even
 cleared up that I have never had a penalty point
 squashed or even anybody suggested to me, neither I
 suggested to anybody, but I did genuinely feel that
 that is wrong anyway, because it's unfair.
- 19 44 Q. Yes. And I think in fairness to you I think you did
 20 clarify for the investigators that you had no personal 10:19
 21 interest in this?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 45 Q. You had no penalty points issue in relation to 24 guards --
- 25 A. No, no.
- 26 46 Q. -- that were wiped or erased. But you seem to have 27 launched into, as it were, an early defence at this 28 stage in the programme of the Commissioner?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 47 Q. His stance?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 48 Q. And you say "I spoke to 13, 14 members of the force", 4 did you do that?
- 5 A. Yeah, yeah. You see, don't forget, on that morning I 10:20
 6 left Wicklow, I went to the local station, I was doing
- 7 something with my car, I think, I don't know was it tax
- 8 or some query in relation to that, and there would be
- 9 people I'd know and we sat down. At that stage I was
- interested to know their views in relation to it's his

10.20

10:21

10 · 21

- force. My recollection is it wasn't anything to do
- 12 with Sergeant McCabe, it was more like, you know, did
- they find this --
- 14 49 Q. The Commissioner's position?
- A. Sorry, the Commissioner's position, yes. Did they find 10:20
- it strange that he was saying it's his force. And none
- of the lads that were there at that time thought it was
- 18 strange. They thought, you know -- I think it's fair
- 19 to say, I can't remember the exact response but they
- 20 didn't think that was strange, no.
- 21 50 Q. Yes. But you see, at the top of page 1706 you are
- referring to what you did, and at the top it says:
- "I did my usual yesterday --"
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 51 Q. "-- I contacted guards all over the -- " Is that the
- 26 county? It says "county" there?
- 27 A. County, yeah.
- 28 52 Q. "I spoke to 13, 14 members of the force."
- 29 A. Yeah.

2			say that to the people of Ireland on the radio when you	
3			were	
4		Α.	Because to be fair to the Commissioner he asked me not	
5			to mention that we had spoken.	10:21
6	54	Q.	Okay.	
7		Α.	Or that the information came from him. That is a	
8			slightly different issue, that is the issue of Sergeant	
9			McCabe.	
10	55	Q.	All right.	10:21
11		Α.	Yeah. I would gladly have said that because I would	
12			have felt it would have been nice to be able to say, by	
13			the way, I spoke to the Commissioner and he told me	
14			one, two, three and four, but he asked me not to	
15			disclose where the information was coming from, and I	10:21
16			didn't.	
17	56	Q.	All right. Anyway, just to continue on then your next	
18			contribution in the programme, towards the bottom of	
19			page 1706.	
20		Α.	I am sorry oh, yes.	10:22
21	57	Q.	And you have referred in the previous paragraph to the	
22			fact that:	
23				
24			"The Commissioner at one function, he advocated in no	
25			uncertain terms the importance of whistleblowers, the	10:22
26			importance of protecting them but"	
27				
28			And Ms. Finucane says:	

1 53 Q. You spoke to the head of the force, and why didn't you

1		"But yet there was fierce undermining sorry, Nóirín,	
2		you wanted to come in on that."	
3			
4		But you continue there, apparently, it says:	
5			10:2
6		"Well, yeah, the undermining is the fact that when	
7		whistleblowers first of all do not cooperate in any	
8		way, shape or form with the investigation, the	
9		investigative committee under Inspector John O'Mahony,	
10		who is a very respectful man, they didn't cooperate	10:2
11		with that at all. They go in, they breached the Data	
12		Protection Act. That is clear. I mean, I think that	
13		he is clear and from the information that I have it	
14		looks as if they breached the Act, which is a criminal	
15		offence. And then what they do is they spoon feed this	10:2
16		information to certain independents in Dáil Éireann	
17		instead of the proper practice and procedure. I don't	
18		believe for one minute that the Minister or sorry,	
19		that the Commissioner and the deputy commissioners and	
20		assistant commissioners are going to condone for one	10:2
21		moment any illegality that takes place within An Garda	
22		Síochána."	
23			
24		Now, can I just pause there and ask you this: Were	
25		these your views that you were propounding here?	10:2
26	Α.	They were my views I was propounding, but they were	
27		very much based on the information I had received in a	

29 58 Q. Yes. But did you, watching the week's proceedings did

28

number of calls the previous day with the Commissioner.

1	you you appear to have taken the view yourself that
2	the Commissioner was right to be doing what he was
3	doing and saying what he was saying. In other words,
4	you agreed with his stance before the PAC, would that
5	be fair to say?

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

24

10:24

No, not necessarily. And to be honest, I didn't follow Α. the whole giving of evidence, as I think you referred to earlier. No, it wouldn't be fair to say that I agreed in blanket. No. My opinion at the time, which would have been very strongly held, is that if, as it seemed, based on the Minister's reporting to the Dáil, Minister Shatter in October of 2015, if the whistleblowers were refusing to cooperate with the internal Garda investigation, I felt that to be wrong, and if the Minister -- and as the Commissioner was critical of that, then I would certainly have stood by his views in that regard. But I wouldn't -- I wouldn't agree with words -- I think there was a word disgusting used, no, I wouldn't agree with any of that, no.

10:24

10.24

just felt, and I would always feel, that if there is an 10:25 investigation set up then there should be cooperation

10:25

22 with that investigation. And as I said, there are

23 remedies thereafter if they are not satisfied with the

findings of that investigation.

25 Well, I mean, I'm just trying to understand so 59 Q. that I don't make a mistake about this, were you 26 27 representing your own views here or were you speaking on behalf of the Commissioner? 28

29 No, I was representing my own views, but very much Α.

1			based on the information which was in the public domain	
2			since October and following information given to me by	
3			the Commissioner.	
4	60	Q.	Well, did he tell you that they didn't cooperate with	
5			it or did you take that that from	10:25
6		Α.	Oh, no, he told me three or four times. The	
7			Commissioner told me that Sergeant McCabe did not	
8			cooperate in any way, shape or form, with the internal	
9			investigation.	
10	61	Q.	Well, did he tell you what he had done to try and get	10:25
11			the cooperation?	
12		Α.	I don't recollect that. I mean, I do recollect him	
13			saying something like, you know, I am trying to sort	
14			the problem out but it's very difficult. And he was	
15			very adamant on three or four occasions because I asked	10:26
16			him, I said, so, is he is not cooperating at all, he	
17			said, no, he's not.	
18	62	Q.	Did he tell you whether he had issued any instruction	
19			to them, whether they had been paraded and told that	
20			there was an investigation proceeding and that if	10:26
21			anyone had information, that they should provide it	
22			to	
23		Α.	I don't recollect the exact wording. No, I don't	
24			remember that exact wording.	
25	63	Q.	But that is what I am asking you. Do you recollect	10:26
26			whether he told you of any step that he had taken or	
27			not?	
28		Α.	Oh, I do remember him saying something along the lines	
29			of this Tribunal or sorry, this investigation was	

1			set up to look into these complaints and to look into	
2			the complaints of Sergeant McCabe and/or others, I	
3			can't remember, and that he did not, Sergeant McCabe I	
4			should say, did not cooperate with that investigation.	
5	64	Q.	Okay. We will come back to that in a few minutes. One	10:2
6			of the other things is that you are saying "They go in,	
7			they breach the Data Protection Act. That is clear."	
8		Α.	Yeah. And that again was said to me during the course	
9			of those calls with Mr. Callinan. He said they were in	
10			breach of the Data Protection Act and I said oh, all	10:2
11			right, okay.	
12	65	Q.	But did you not pick that up as part of the row that	
13			was going on the previous week?	
14		Α.	I'm not sure I specifically did, no. I would be wrong	
15			to say I specifically did. I didn't you know, I	10:2
16			don't specifically remember that.	
17	66	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	But I do remember, you know, my conversations, because	
19			they were very pertinent to what was going to happen	
20			the following day, and I was very clear about what I	10:2
21			was being told by the then-Commissioner.	
22	67	Q.	Yes. Well, I mean presumably you had picked up that	
23			the Commissioner had given his evidence and there was	
24			this sort of stand off, a public stand-off which had	
25			emerged as to whether the Committee would be calling	10:2

Yes, I believe I did.

the whistleblowers, presumably you knew that?

by the time this programme was being broadcast?

Yes. And that the Committee hadn't taken that decision

26

27

28

29

Α.

68 Q.

- A. I don't recollect that. I can't remember if that was the case.
- 3 69 Q. Well, do you know that or have you got a recollection 4 of the fact that Sergeant McCabe in fact gave evidence 5 the following week in private?

- No, I don't. No, I don't recollect that. 6 The net Α. issue I was dealing with was very simple. 7 The net 8 issue I was dealing with was: You know, did I have a problem with a whistleblower not cooperating with the 9 Garda inquiry? And that was kind of -- that was really 10:28 10 11 the net issue I was concerned with. And in my view, based on very clear information I got from the 12 13 Commissioner, I thought that was wrong.
- 14 70 Q. Yeah. You took a view that if a guard had a problem,
 15 the Commissioner had established an inquiry, they 10:28
 16 should cooperate with the inquiry?
- 17 A. Yes, yes. And I mistakenly, or otherwise, believed 18 that the Commissioner was somebody beyond reproach, I 19 didn't -- at this stage hindsight is a great virtue, I 20 believed I was getting truth from the Commissioner at 10:29 21 that time.
- 22 71 Q. Yes. But you see you do go on to say this: "They go in, they breach the Data Protection Act. That is clear." What were you intending to convey there?
- A. Again, during -- this was a follow-on in the conversation with Martin Callinan, he had already stated that in his opinion, and the words were very similar, that Sergeant McCabe was obstructive, he was difficult, he had breached data protection and I

2 believe the Commissioner to be telling me the truth at 3 that time. Yes. Well, obviously, the where he had done it is 4 72 Q. 5 perhaps a detail, if it had been done at all, but did 10:29 6 you understand what was involved in that or what did 7 you understand meant? 8 My understanding is that he may -- there was a number Α. of possibilities but one of them was that maybe that 9 Sergeant McCabe had accessed files he shouldn't have 10 10:30 11 and/or given out information in relation to those files 12 to third parties, things like that. But I didn't have 13 specifics on it. It was based on the information I 14 received in my telephone conversations with the 15 Commissioner. 10:30 16 Okav. But you understood the generality of it? 73 Q. 17 Α. Yes. 18 74 The accessing of information? Q. 19 Yes. Α. 20 75 And then the dissemination of it? Q. 10:30 21 Absolutely. Α. 22 Whether to public figures or TDs or --76 Q. 23 Yes. And that was a question -- and to be fair, Α. 24 Mr. Chairman, that was a question I didn't ask the 25 Commissioner. 10:30 26 All right. 77 Q. 27 Α. That was something that he had volunteered; that information was volunteered to me. 28

actually didn't go into where he had done it but I

1

29

78

Q.

Yes.

You say then at the end of the page there:

3

4

5

"It looks as if they breached the Act, which is a criminal offence. And then what they do is, they spoon feed this information to certain independents in Dáil Éireann."

10:30

10:31

6

7 And you knew that of your own knowledge, did you?

- A. Well, no, no, but it was in the public domain. But it
 was an issue I raised again with the Commissioner and
 he agreed that it was all wrong and that that was
 happening.
- 12 79 Q. Yes. But the identification of spoon feeding
 13 independents, you took that from the public domain or
 14 did the Commissioner tell you that?
- 15 Well no, the way that arose from my recollection, when Α. 10:31 16 I was talking to the Commissioner and asked him about 17 the first point, being did they cooperate or not, then 18 he volunteered, then he said they are also in breach of 19 Data Protection Act, then the follow-on from that was 20 that I said -- or it certainly came up, yeah, is it a 10:31 case then that he's spoon feeding independents in the 21 22 Dáil? And he said, yes, that is what he is doing. 23 you know, I could have brought that up as a third 24 point.
- 25 80 Q. Yes. And did you have any recollection of some of the 10:31 independent TDs getting a dossier in late 2012?
- 27 A. I don't remember, no. I don't think it went into that 28 much detail about who got what or when, no.
- 29 81 Q. Or that the matter of naming people was ruled out by

Т			the Ceann Comnairie?	
2		Α.	No, I don't recollect discussing any of that.	
3	82	Q.	Or that a press conference was to be held and the Data	
4			Commissioner intervened to try and warn people about	
5			not naming people?	10:32
6		Α.	Yeah, I don't remember any conversation on that.	
7	83	Q.	And did you have any knowledge of that yourself in a	
8			general way?	
9		Α.	I don't think so, I'm not sure.	
10	84	Q.	Okay.	10:32
11		Α.	I'm not sure.	
12	85	Q.	And just going back to the programme there, the middle	
13			of page 1707, Ms. Finucane said:	
14				
15			"Gerald, do you remember Donegal?	10:32
16				
17			Mr. Kean: Yes, I do. Yes, I do. I'm not saying	
18			sorry, I didn't say there's no wrongdoing in the Garda	
19			Síochána.	
20				10:32
21			I said I don't accept that the Minister sorry, that	
22			the Commissioner, deputy commissioners and assistant	
23			commissioners are all sitting around saying let's bury	
24			this, let's bury this. I don't accept that."	
25		Α.	Yes.	10:32
26	86	Q.	And again, that seems to be a position very firmly in	
27			support of the Commissioner?	
28		Α.	Pardon?	
29	87	Q.	Very firmly in support of the Commissioner?	

Α.	Yeah, I think it would be, you know. It's fair to say	
	that I am the son of a sergeant in the guards, God rest	
	him, so, you know, I have made it very well known on	
	many programmes that I am pro the Garda. I am pro	
	Garda. However, however, I have acted against the	10:33
	Garda Commissioner and the Department for people who	
	suffered wrongs at the behest of the guards. I think	
	the problem is that I get annoyed when I hear somebody	
	saying they are crooked guards and then they talk about	
	the guards in the force, and I found it difficult in	10:33
	total then I find it difficult to understand how	
	someone can say well, the guards shouldn't be	
	investigating criminality. Well, if that is the case	
	then my attitude will be we'll disband the force. So,	
	my view in relation to that was, I was very critical of	10:33
	the Garda activities in Donegal. I have acted, as I	
	have said, for clients against An Garda Síochána. But	
	what I am saying is that the vast majority of the	
	members of the force in my opinion, and certainly in my	
	dealings, are very decent people. So I wouldn't for	10:33
	one minute condone what went on in Donegal. In fact, I	
	was outspoken. I also didn't believe, whether you call	
	it naive or not, I just didn't accept the Commissioner	
	and the assistant commissioners and deputy	
	commissioners are all sitting around the fire, having a	10:34
	nice glass of wine and saying let's bury all this, put	
	that on the fire there and let's move on. Now, if that	
	happened then, you know, I am wrong. But that was a	
	view that T	

- 1 88 Q. Yes. And I think you have very fairly referred to the 2 fact that your late father was in the guards?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 89 Q. And I think you did volunteer to the investigators you had other -- some other relations in the guards?

10 · 34

10:35

10:35

A. Yeah, yeah. My uncle, God rest him, was the last station sergeant in --

8 90 I think in the course of the programme other people Q. contribute and you are recorded as coming back in at 9 page 1714 of our book. And Mr. Rabbitte had been had 10 11 been, as it were, sounding a warning perhaps against a 12 danger of people coming in naming persons who mightn't 13 be there to defend themselves, and the Committee's 14 actions about what they might have to decide about 15 people, and you chime in and you say at the bottom of 16 the page:

1718

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

"I think the important thing is that, we all agree and I think it's accepted, that the vast majority of An Garda Síochána here deserve our support and confidence. But it annoys me when people are not getting the facts right. And Nóirín is simply and absolutely totally incorrect when she says that the whistleblowers have done everything they can within An Garda Síochána to have this matter investigated. It is just simply wrong. She is believing what she is reading in the papers. The fact of the matter is that Inspector John O'Mahony, who we accept is a wonderful -- I've never

met the man, but I've heard great things about him, was

1	set up to investigate this.	
2		
3	Ms. Finucane: Yeah, but I have no doubt the other men	
4	are wonderful men too"	
5		10:35
6	Then you are recorded as saying:	
7		
8	"I have no doubt about that as well. I am not denying	
9	that at all, but what I am saying is, they did not	
10	cooperate with that investigation. And by the way,	10:36
11	just so that we are aware of these as a result of	
12	John O'Mahony's investigation, three or four members of	
13	the force have been sent forward for disciplinary	
14	action. Secondly, many new reforms have been put in	
15	place based on his which were needed. We are not	10:36
16	saying nobody is suggesting of course there were	
17	wrongdoings, but in addition to that, which people	
18	don't know, is the antifraud mechanism, which is in	
19	place, has sent four relatively senior members of An	
20	Garda Síochána files to the DPP for criminal	10:36
21	prosecution.	
22		
23	Ms. Finucane: But you sound like that's outrageous.	
24	but you know that I want that, because that's the way	
25	it's supposed to be.	10:36
26		
27	Mr. Kean: It should be that way, yes.	
28	•••	
29	But what I'm saying is, and you're absolutely right,	

1	and everyone of them who have done a wrongdoing should	
2	go, but what I am saying is that for some reason, it's	
3	as if there is a whitewash here. Nobody is aware that	
4	they are trying to do something and that's under the	
5	guise of the Commissioner and I think it reflects badly	10:37
6	on the rank and file members if there is just one-way	
7	criticism of An Garda Síochána. I believe the Garda	
8	Síochána are well able to deal with it. And if, by the	
9	way, at the end of that they don't get a say, and if	
10	they don't if the whistleblowers, who have a very	10:37
11	legitimate right to air their grievances, if they don't	
12	go through the proper channels to get that, well	
13	absolutely fire on ahead. Fire on ahead."	
14		
15	Then Ms. Hegarty chimes in there. And then you say:	10:37
16		
17	"Nobody said it was investigated thoroughly."	
18		
19	And it goes on there, at the top of page 1717 you say:	
20		10:37
21	"In fact, I'm saying the very opposite. You can't have	
22	it investigated thoroughly when an inspector is set up	
23	to investigate and the two don't cooperate. They	
24	don't cooperate with the inspector.	
25		10:37
26	Ms. Hegarty: What is the outcome? And then you've got	
27	to ask the question, Gerald, why did they not	
28	cooperate? That is the culture within the Gardaí."	

1 And the debate goes on there. But going back to the 2 middle of page 1715, you are repeating the suggestion 3 of non-cooperation there? Yeah. 4 Α. 5 91 And then you are also highlighting the fact that some Q. 10:38 6 members have been sent forth for disciplinary action, 7 and then you are talking about some new reforms which 8 have been put in place based on his report. Yeah. 9 Α. And is this something that the Commissioner told you? 10 92 Q. 10:38 11 Yes. Α. 12 93 All right. You didn't know that of your own knowledge? Ο. 13 No. Α. 14 94 Q. You see, the suggestion might be made and entertained 15 by people, Mr. Kean, that you were acting as a 10:38 16 surrogate, a spokesman for the Commissioner in this 17 regard, to bolster his position? 18 well, I didn't see that at the time. Α. 19 95 Okay. Q. And I repeat, I didn't see that at the time. 20 Α. Ι 10:38 didn't -- I believe that I had access to somebody who I 21 22 felt at that time was beyond reproach, I felt that the

information he was giving to me -- I believed the

information that he was giving to me was correct, it

certainly didn't contradict what Minister Shatter had

said some four months earlier, on 1st, 2nd and/or 3rd

of October 2013. So I believed he was telling me the

truth, and I was, I suppose, being honest in saying

this, beyond doubt, that I was delighted to hear it

10:39

32

23

24

25

26

27

28

from his mouth because I felt that I was getting it 1 2 from the right person and I genuinely felt there was no 3 vested interest and he was very quick to point out that following the O'Mahony investigation a number of guards 4 5 had been sent forward for disciplinary action, which I think was an attempt by him to show that this was a 6 7 very, very serious attempt to deal with these issues. 8 So that's all I can say. I did believe him. know, if it's suggested I was a mouthpiece, I did not 9 feel that at the time because if he had said something 10 10 · 40 11 that damaged the guards or himself, and I'm sure he wouldn't, but if he had, I would have no hesitation in 12 13 repeating that as well. 14 96 Q. Yes. 15 But I can understand how somebody might feel that I was 10:40 Α. 16 a mouth -- that I was acting as his mouthpiece. 17 can understand how they might feel that. But I didn't 18 feel it at the time, no. 19 97 Obviously in the context of what you said on the radio Q. 20 programme you say you spoke to 13 or 14 members? 10:40 21 Yeah. Α. 22 You said you did your usual, presumably that is 98 Q. 23 sounding people out?

A. Yeah, normally when I appear on the Marian Finucane
show I would be outspoken against the HSE, I would
talked to nurses beforehand. The records show I spoke,
you know, if it's taxi regulator problems I'd talk to
taxi drivers. It's always something I have done and I
have no problem. My phone records show that I rang a

10 · 40

number of guards as well, but that wasn't about 1 2 Sergeant McCabe, that was more about the comment that 3 it's his force and there was some criticism. I was surprised at suggesting, you know, that someone 4 5 would read into him saying it's his force, that it was 10:41 something other than the Garda Síochána acting for and 6 7 at the behest of the people in the State. That is what 8 they are there for. They are not there for the Commissioner. 9 But you rang the Commissioner. Did you ring the 10 99 Q. 10 · 41 11 Commissioner? Did you initiate this contact? My recollection is, and I think the phone records 12 Α. 13 confirm this, that on the Friday I telephoned a friend, 14 an acquaintance of mine, who again is very 15 well-respected within An Garda Síochána, and that is 10:41 16 Diarmuid O'Donovan. 0'Sullivan? 17 100 Q. 18 Sorry, Diarmuid O'Sullivan. Α. 19 101 Yes? Q. And I rang Diarmuid, and I would speak to Diarmuid the 20 Α. odd time, you know, from time to time and get his 21 22 advice or ask directions, where I might go for -- you 23 know, to get an answer to a question. And I have a 24 recollection on the Friday I rang him and said, listen, I need to clarify this. Because at that time it's 25 10 · 41 three months in the public domain that Sergeant McCabe 26 27 hadn't cooperated, but I also wanted to -- like, I am 28 not an investigative journalist, I am just a panelist,

so I just wanted to make sure nothing had changed.

1 That yes, I had information from October, but three 2 months have passed and for all I know Sergeant McCabe 3 could have been in the Head Office every day cooperating, so I wanted to find out what was the 4 5 position at the moment and where we were at. 10:42 6 102 Okay. Q. 7 And Diarmuid is always very helpful and I will bow to Α. 8 any evidence he may give, but my recollection is that I might have turned to him for advice and that he may 9 have said, Martin Callinan, oh, I met him not long ago 10 10.42 11 and he said he is the Commissioner, well if I can get 12 clarification from him I am really happy. 13 And Diarmuid O'Sullivan, he had a very long and 103 Q. 14 distinguished career in An Garda Síochána --15 Yeah. Α. 10:42 16 -- Special Branch matters dealing with subversives for 104 Q. 17 many years, is that correct? I know it was very distinguished. 18 Α. 19 105 Then he became, I think, head of the division in Dun Q. 20 Laoghaire, the Dun Laoghaire division and County Louth as well? 21 22 Yes. Α. 23 And he was still a serving member at this time in 2014, 106 0. 24 isn't that right? 25 Α. Yes. 10 · 43 I mean, he says that he didn't provide the 26 107 Ο. 27 Commissioner's number to you and that he wouldn't have done so if you had asked him, is that right? 28 I would say he is correct, I had the Commissioner's 29 Α.

1 number.

- 2 108 Q. You had the Commissioner's number?
- 3 A. And I'm sure it is correct, yeah.
- 4 109 Q. Were you ringing him first to get his view or were you 5 ringing him to see whether he thought it wise to ring 10:43

6 the Commissioner?

7 I think, and again this is just from recollection, Α. because at the time, you know -- at the time I would 8 imagine I rang him to see who would be the best person 9 to clarify the McCabe situation for me, who could I 10 11 turn to. Like, for example, you know, over the years 12 when I'd a bad robbery in Drayton Manor I remember 13 ringing Diarmuid saying who do I ring, who is the best 14 person to ring to know what is happening with the 15 investigation. So, it would be a sounding bite. 16 don't recollect ringing Diarmuid and saying can you 17 tell me what the story is on Sergeant McCabe, because I 18 am not sure he might have known, but I have a feeling I 19 might have said to him, Diarmuid, can you point me in 20 the right direction or who should I go to.

10 · 43

10:44

10:44

10 · 44

21 110 Q. So you weren't turning to him for the sort of inside 22 verified story, as it were?

23 No, I don't believe I was. Because, you know, if I Α. 24 knew that he was, you know, in charge of the 25 investigation or something I might have, but I didn't. You know, he was somebody who I'd -- you know, who I'd 26 27 great time for and I knew he would give me a right Like, who can I talk to about clarifying the 28 steer. position in relation to McCabe. That would be my 29

1			recollection.	
2	111	Q.	Yes. So I mean, was the Commissioner the last or the	
3			first person that you thought you could get through to	
4			to get this information then?	
5		Α.	Well, I am not sure that I thought of who I was going	10:4
6			to be talking to. I mean, I was delighted when there	
7			was a suggestion that the Commissioner would be the man	
8			that would clarify matters for me. And you know, I	
9			know I was very pleased at that.	
10	112	Q.	Okay. Perhaps we will just look at some other	10:4
11			documents. I think you were written to by the Tribunal	
12			and you wrote in response by letter of the 14th	
13			December 2007, and that is to be found at page 1768 of	
14			the documents.	
15		Α.	Yes, I have it, yes.	10:4
16	113	Q.	And you say:	
17				
18			"Dear Ms. Mullan	
19			I refer to your letter dated 13th December 2017 under	
20			the aforementioned reference number.	10:4
21				
22			My only involvement with Mr. Maurice McCabe was around	
23			the review of the papers on the Marian Finucane show	
24			which took place sometime back. I don't have the file	
25			in front of me at the time of dictating this letter,	10:4
26			but I can certainly give you the exact date if needed.	
27				
28			I was asked to review the papers on the Marian Finucane	
29			Show RTÉ Radio One It is a task I undertake on a	

1 regular basis during the year. I was advised that one 2 of the topics that would be discussed related to 3 Maurice McCabe. On a Saturday prior to my appearance on the show I spoke at length to Mr. Martin Callinan, 4 5 former Commissioner of the Garda Síochána. In fact, we 10:46 had lengthy conversations on Saturday. 6 I was advised 7 by Martin Callinan that Maurice McCabe did not 8 cooperate with internal investigations carried out by An Garda Síochána regarding his assertions and claims 9 being made at the time. 10 10 · 46 11 I clarified this response on a number of occasions as I 12 13 knew I would be asked to comment on same the following 14 day on the Marian Finucane programme. Martin Callinan 15 assured me that Mr. Maurice McCabe did not cooperate 10:46 16 with the investigations. He also agreed with me when I 17 expressed an opinion that I thought this was wrong, or 18 words to that effect. 19 20 Subsequently I appeared on the Marian Finucane show and 10:47 expressed my concerns about Mr. Maurice McCabe not 21 22 cooperating with the Garda Síochána. This proved to be 23 correct, as is well-documented. 24 Maurice McCabe issued proceedings against RTÉ and 25 10.47 26 myself. The proceedings against me were dropped and I

27

28

29

did not contribute in any way, shape or form towards

compensation or his costs. I did offer an apology when

it became clear at the time that the information that I

1	had received, and I think most people had come to	
2	receive the same information, was simply incorrect.	
3		
4	If I can of any further assistance please don't	
5	hesitate to contact me."	10:47
6		
7	Etcetera. You were then asked, if we turn to page	
8	1770, you were asked by the Tribunal to furnish any	
9	relevant documentation and details of the telephone	
10	numbers that you were using. I think you replied to	10:47
11	that at page 1771, saying:	
12		
13	"I don't have any written documentation. However, I	
14	did have lengthy conversations with Martin Callinan on	
15	the Saturday before I appeared on the Marian Finucane	10:48
16	show."	
17		
18	You put the phone number in there.	
19		
20	"Mr. Callinan did confirm on several occasions to me	10:48
21	that Maurice McCabe had not cooperated with the	
22	internal Garda investigations into his complaint.	
23	Based on these representations I was happy to repeat	
24	the facts on the Marian Finucane show the following	
25	morning. Subsequently, it transpired these	10:48
26	representations and assertions by Mr. Callinan were	
27	incorrect. I was sued by Maurice McCabe but this case	
28	has recently been dropped. I have already apologised	
29	after the matter was corrected and clarified in the	

Τ			Dail. The apology was to Mr. McCabe through his	
2			solicitor. I paid no compensation or contribution	
3			towards his costs and the case did not proceed.	
4				
5			The only documentation I would have in relation to the	10:4
6			matter concerns a claim brought against me by	
7			Mr. McCabe's solicitors, but I don't see how this could	
8			be relevant to the Tribunal.	
9				
10			There were proceedings suing myself and RTÉ for	10:4
11			defamation. As I say, the case has been dropped and I	
12			made no contribution in any way, shape or form to	
13			Mr. McCabe nor his legal team.	
14				
15			I hope this clarifies matters."	10:4
16				
17			Etcetera. Now, I think you did provide phone records.	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	114	Q.	And perhaps we could just look at those first. Page	
20			1784.	10:4
21		Α.	I think the inspectors who were very helpful to me did	
22			a little summary of the relevant calls, because I won't	
23			recognise, you know, numbers. So I don't know, is that	
24			note there? I saw	
25	115	Q.	Yes, perhaps we will go straight to that. It's at page	10:4
26			1789.	
27		Α.	Yes, yes.	
28	116	Q.	And the first date there is 24th January. And that is	
29			just three minutes past six and that appears to show	

- you phoning Diarmuid O'Sullivan, is that correct?
- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 117 Q. And that would be the initial contact, is it?
- 4 A. I believe that to be the initial contact, yes.
- 5 118 Q. Yes. Now, you were asked by the investigators whether

10:50

10:50

- 6 you had been contacted by the Press Office and you
- 7 don't seem to have excluded that possibility?
- 8 A. Well, no, not at that time. I was not contacted by any
- 9 member of An Garda Síochána, nor the Press Office, who
- I include in that, I was not contacted by anybody from
- 11 An Garda Síochána in relation to the Marian Finucane
- show prior to the Saturday. I am saying on the
- 13 Saturday I might have got a call, but I initiated the
- 14 contact.
- 15 119 Q. With the Gardaí?
- 16 A. With the Gardaí.
- 17 120 Q. In the first instance?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 121 Q. Without doubt?
- 20 A. Without any shadow of a doubt. Nobody rang me and said 10:50
- 21 that -- I mean, I'm -- you know, I can only say I'm
- 99.9 percent sure, nobody rang and said hello, is that
- 23 Gerald Kean, I believe you are doing the Marian
- 24 Finucane show on Sunday, we need your help, there was
- 25 nothing like that I remember.
- 26 122 Q. Yes. But you do seem to contemplate the possibility,
- if not probability, of having been contacted by the
- 28 Press Office on the Saturday?
- 29 A. I am just saying I can't remember, but it's certainly a

1	possibil	lity.

- 2 Do you remember speaking -- whether you spoke to 123 Q. 3 Superintendent Taylor in these days or not?
- I don't recollect. But if Superintendent Taylor said 4 Α. 5 he did speak to me, then I'm happy to accept that. 10:51 don't recollect it. 6
- 7 All right. And just to be clear, were you ever briefed 124 Q. 8 negatively by Superintendent Taylor about Sergeant McCabe or any other person? 9
- Certainly not anybody else, and I don't remember ever 10 Α. 10:51 11 being briefed negatively by Sergeant Taylor.
- 12 Superintendent Taylor? 125 Q.
- Superintendent Taylor, sorry. I don't recollect ever 13 Α. 14 being briefed negatively by him in relation to Sergeant 15 McCabe. 10:52
- 16 Had you any relationship, professional or otherwise, 126 Ο. 17 with Superintendent Taylor?
- 18 No, no, I mean -- no, I had communications in the past, Α. 19 you know, on the odd occasion, maybe two or three 20 occasions over the last 20 years with the Press Office, 10:52 but very rarely. But I don't recollect having -- no, I 21 22 mean, I wouldn't recognise him if he was here, it 23 doesn't mean I haven't met him, because I do meet a lot 24 of people, but I don't recognise -- I don't remember 25 meeting him.

26 Just going back to the phone record then, there 127 Q. 27 is a call on the following day, which is the Saturday, just before midday, where you appear to have spoken to 28 29 Diarmuid O'Sullivan again?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 128 Q. And that appears to be much longer duration?
- 3 A. Yes
- 4 129 Q. And can you recollect the content of that in a general

5 way?

A. In a general way, yeah, I mean, I don't remember -- I

am reasonably confident that I would have explained to

Diarmuid that this programme is coming on, that I am

aware it's in the public domain that Sergeant McCabe

10 hasn't cooperated. I would have probably discussed

10:53

10:53

10:53

- 11 Minister Shatter's comments, as I say, some months
- 12 earlier. I would say that I want to get an update, I
- want to get some clear guidance as to what is the
- 14 position in relation to this, and you know, that
- conversation could well have taken place.
- 16 130 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. Sorry, not could well have taken place, I believe did 18 take place.
- 19 131 Q. I am not sure whether Mr. O'Sullivan can recall the 20 detail of it or the content of it, but that is your
- 21 recollection?
- 22 A. Maybe he can, yeah. I mean, as I say, I have -- I have
- great time for Diarmuid, so I'd accept what he says.
- 24 But I believe at this stage I am in pursuit of my
- objective, which is to talk to somebody in a senior
- position to clarify (a) that the Minister's comments
- are still accurate and (b) there had been no changes,
- and (c) Sergeant McCabe, you know, is he cooperating or
- 29 not.

- 1 132 Q. Yes. But you seem to have been anxious to get the
- 2 Garda view to be able to repeat the Garda view, I mean
- 3 is that not, as it were, bottom line here?
- 4 A. Well, as I say, I am not an investigative journalist, I
- 5 am a panelist and if I am getting not a view, but if I

10:54

10:54

- 6 am getting what I believe a statement of fact from the
- 7 Commissioner I am very happy and relaxed, at that time.
- 8 133 Q. Yes. And irrespective of your profession as a
- 9 solicitor, do you not think it was perhaps wholly
- inappropriate to be seeking to ring the Garda
- 11 Commissioner directly to get his private views or --
- and then repeat them without attribution?
- 13 A. No, no, not whatsoever.
- 14 134 Q. Why?
- 15 A. First of all, I am not operating in this domain as a
- 16 practising solicitor --
- 17 135 Q. No.
- 18 A. -- I am operating as a panelist --
- 19 136 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. -- commenting on newspaper articles. That is number
- one. Number two is, I wasn't looking to for the
- Commissioner's view, I was looking for the factual
- position. And number three, I am dealing with the
- 24 Commissioner of An Garda Síochána, who I believe at
- 25 that stage is beyond reproach. So, therefore, I am not 10:55
- looking for a view, I am looking for a statement of
- 27 fact.
- 28 137 Q. Yes. And did you expect the Garda Commissioner to
- 29 differ in his exposition of his views that he had

- 1 already expressed the previous week in public?
- 2 A. Well no, no, what I expected him to say maybe -- first
- of all, I didn't follow him in -- to the extent -- and
- 4 I think you have agreed with this already, I didn't
- follow his evidence from start to finish before the

10:55

10:56

10:56

- 6 Public Accounts Committee, but I was interested in
- 7 getting information that that was up to date and was
- 8 accurate. Had it changed? Had Sergeant McCabe started
- 9 to cooperate? Had he written in saying he will
- 10 cooperate? Like, this was -- I was very pleased to be
- getting what I saw as statements of fact from the
- 12 Commissioner at that time.
- 13 138 Q. Yes. And it appears to show then that he called you on
- the 25th, about ten to one, at lunchtime, on that day,
- and you appear to have had a lengthy conversation?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 139 Q. And is there any other detail that you can recall?
- 18 A. Em, I don't think there is anything else I can recall
- other than what is in my affidavit. I mean, you know,
- 20 he certainly stated to me that Sergeant McCabe had not
- only not cooperated with the investigation but that he
- was also troublesome, obstructive, difficult. You
- know, these were the -- he left me in no impression --
- sorry, in left me in no doubt that Sergeant McCabe was
- 25 not cooperating and was obstructive.
- 26 140 Q. But as I understand your statement, you appear to have
- 27 suggested to him to get his agreement --
- 28 A. I have a recollection of saying --
- 29 141 O. -- as to whether it'd be fair to describe him as

- obstructive?
- 2 A. Yeah, I certainly have a recollection of saying, he
- 3 seems to be -- it would be a phrase I would use, he
- 4 seems to be difficult, this fella, or he seems to be
- obstructive, and that then led into -- because that was 10:57
- 6 my view, I was saying why isn't he cooperating, why is
- 7 he ignoring everybody, why is he -- so that is
- 8 certainly my recollection, that I could well have said

10:57

- 9 that first. Is he difficult, this guy?
- 10 142 Q. Yeah. And it appears to have been followed up by a
- 11 text from Mr. Callinan slightly later that day, just
- 12 nearly at ten past one. Can you recollect what that
- 13 text --
- 14 A. I can't, no.
- 15 143 Q. -- might be? Have you been able to retrieve any text?
- 16 A. No, no. I mean, just as a matter of format, even this
- morning I delete as many texts as I can because I have
- one of those phones that keeps coming up, I don't have
- a laptop, I don't have a computer, I don't have -- I
- 20 don't do -- so my phone keeps coming up that it's
- 21 heavily loaded or something, so I delete what I can
- 22 when I can. But that text, I don't recollect what that
- text was at all. But it should be noted that, in fact
- I think you may have omitted to say that, Martin
- Callinan didn't ring me just once, he rang me twice. I 10:58
- think it's not clear from the records. He rang me at
- 27 12:50 and he rang me again at 13:09.
- 28 144 Q. That appears to be a text, according to the --
- 29 A. Oh, is it? Sorry, you are right, a text, yeah. So I

- don't know -- I don't know -- I mean, in hindsight if I
 knew where we would be today I would have been
 delighted to have kept the texts.

 According to the telephone records, which I think you
- According to the telephone records, which I think you accept, there are further calls between yourself and 10:58

 Mr. O'Sullivan and then yourself and Martin Callinan in that afternoon.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 146 Q. With another text then followed from Mr. Callinan there 10 at 16:26. What was happening at that stage?

- 11 Α. well, again, I can't recollect specifically other than 12 I would imagine I might have rang Diarmuid back and 13 said, listen, thanks a million, that was great, I was 14 actually speaking to Martin Callinan and he has clarified a number of issues to me. 15 That would be 10:59 16 something I would often do, is to thank him for 17 initiating the introduction. That is an educated 18 The conversations with Martin Callinan right up 19 until before the programme were very consistent, in 20 that Sergeant McCabe had not cooperated, etcetera, 10:59 21 etcetera, as I have said already, and was in breach of 22 the Data Protection Act in this.
- 23 147 Q. Yes. There appear to be two further calls then from 24 Mr. Callinan, one at 16:50 to you and then a call the 25 next morning?
- A. Before I went on the programme?
- 27 148 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 149 Q. Do you recollect that?

- 1 A. No. Again, there would have been nothing inconsistent
- in what he was saying. You know, there would have been
- 3 nothing inconsistent. It might have been a reiteration
- 4 of facts or it might have been the fact that he
- 5 mentioned the data protection breaches in the second

11:00

11:00

- 6 call or the later call, I don't recollect. But there
- 7 was nothing inconsistent. He was very clear in what he
- 8 was saying to me from the first call to the call right
- 9 before the programme.
- 10 150 Q. Well, was he -- I mean, were you seeking further
- clarifications? Was he coming back with
- 12 clarifications?
- 13 A. He might have been. I don't -- I don't honestly
- remember.
- 15 151 Q. Yes. You see, at the top of your letter of the -- to
- 16 the Tribunal of the 14th December --
- 17 A. Sorry, what page is it?
- 18 152 Q. You do say, you have clarified this response "on a
- 19 number of occasions"?
- A. Yes, yes.
- 21 153 Q. So can you recollect what you were seeking to clarify
- and what he did clarify for you?
- 23 A. Yeah, I mean, I have a boring tendency sometimes to
- repeat myself, so I do know that I would have said
- several times, so you are saying to me, like, he didn't 11:01
- cooperate at all, no.
- 27 154 Q. Okay.
- 28 A. I might have said is there any reason for that or do
- you know why, I don't remember.

- 1 155 Q. Did you make any notes of any of these?
- 2 A. No, I didn't, no.
- 3 156 Q. All right.
- 4 A. Nor did I think it important.
- 5 157 Q. Okay. He appears to have sent a text to you on the
- 6 morning at 10:30. You were presumably in RTÉ at that

11:01

11:01

11:02

11 . 02

- 7 stage?
- 8 A. Yes. The programme starts at 11:00 so I would have
- 9 been in a room reading the papers.
- 10 158 Q. Was it a sort of good luck text or was there any
- information provided?
- 12 A. I can't remember. I can't remember. Nothing
- 13 significant. It was certainly nothing significant.
- 14 Otherwise I believe I would have remembered it.
- 15 159 Q. Okay. There is a call then from you on that day at
- 16 12:43 and do you recall phoning him after the
- 17 programme?
- 18 A. I do. That was a panic call.
- 19 160 Q. Pardon?
- 20 A. That was like in a state of panic.
- 21 161 Q. The alarm bells had gone off?
- 22 A. Because I had finished the programme and if I remember,
- 23 Marian had asked me to stay on for the second part, and
- the others were let go, and I stayed on and this was a
- different topic altogether and then as I was leaving
- the studio, which would normally be about 12:30-12:35,
- often it's earlier if I don't stay, but the producer
- came up to me and said by the way, Gerald, just to tell
- you, Sergeant McCabe has been on and he says that what

- 1 you said is completely incorrect and wrong.
- 2 162 Q. And defamatory?
- 3 A. Yeah, I don't know the words.
- 4 163 Q. That was being alleged?
- 5 A. Absolutely, yeah, yeah. I can't remember the exact

11:03

11:03

11:03

11 · 03

- 6 words but it was alarm bells because I was shocked, I
- 7 was saying, so the minute I got to -- I mean, I
- 8 mightn't even have got to my car when I rang Martin
- 9 Callinan and said, you know, what is this all about, he
- is saying this is wrong?
- 11 164 Q. Yes. And what did he say?
- 12 A. I can't remember his exact words but he was -- you
- know, he didn't back down, that's for sure, he didn't
- turn around and say oh Gerald, I am sorry, everything I
- told you is wrong. He didn't say that, that is for
- sure. He stuck to his guns and he said no, no, that is
- 17 not correct, everything I told you is correct or words
- is correct. But he reaffirmed the information he had
- given to me on a number of occasions prior to the
- programme.
- 21 165 Q. According to this chart then you received a phone call
- later from Mr. O'Sullivan in the afternoon, at
- 23 approximately 15:54?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 166 Q. Do you recall that? Was that a calming phone call?
- 26 A. I think -- Diarmuid himself may be able to throw light
- on what that was, I can't remember but I am assuming it
- was a calming phone call. You know, I am assuming it
- was don't worry about this because. You know, because

1 I was upset to be fair and I was concerned, that might 2 be a better word, that the information I had been given 3 may have been incorrect. Yes. It appears that after that, Mr. O'Sullivan phoned 4 167 Q. 5 Martin Callinan back immediately? 11:04 6 Right. Α. 7 I mean, within moments. Obviously you weren't privy to 168 Q. 8 that? No, I have no idea what that was. 9 Α. 10 169 But had you asked Diarmuid O'Sullivan to phone Martin Q. 11 · 04 11 Callinan and convey any unhappiness --12 I doubt it because I had done that already. Α. 13 You had done it yourself? 170 Q. 14 Α. I had done it myself. 15 Straight to the top again? 171 Q. 11:04 16 Pardon? Α. 17 Straight back to the top again? 172 Q. 18 Yeah. Yeah. Bearing in mind that all the information, Α. 19 you know, relevant to this was given to me by the 20 Commissioner. He was my immediate port of call back, 11:04 21 yeah. 22 Sorry, Mr. McGuinness, I just want to CHAIRMAN: 23 It seems if you add all the phone intervene.

28 A. Yes.

24

25

26

27

29 CHAIRMAN: I just wanted to clarify that.

conversations between Mr. Kean and Commissioner

been giving evidence. It's a very long time.

Callinan they amount to 57 minutes and 49 seconds,

which is approximately the amount of time you have now

11 · 04

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 173 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: And just to be clear, at page 1774,
- 3 you received a letter from Maurice McCabe then?
- 4 A. Yes. That's correct.
- 5 174 Q. And can I just ask you about some bits of it in a
- 6 moment, but before you left RTÉ on the morning of the

11:06

11:06

- 7 26th you obviously phoned Mr. Callinan from RTÉ while
- 8 you were there?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 175 Q. And did you tell the producers in RTÉ that, look, there 11:05
- is no problem here because I got all of this
- information from the Commissioner?
- 13 A. I don't recollect that, but it wouldn't surprise me if
- 14 I had said something like that.
- 15 176 Q. I mean, put it this way: You had been told that
- 16 Sergeant McCabe had phoned in?
- 17 A. Yes, my recollection is I said, you know, I certainly
- 18 at that stage would have, my recollection is, said to
- the producer I got this from the Commissioner, so...
- 20 177 Q. You would be likely to defend yourself?
- 21 A. Yeah, yeah.
- 22 178 Q. Presumably?
- 23 A. Yes, but I was still concerned because, you know,
- you're concerned when you come off air and you get
- 25 somebody ringing like Sergeant McCabe to say that
- 26 everything I have said in relation to his cooperation
- 27 was wrong, you know, you are obviously concerned and I
- was concerned.
- 29 179 Q. Okay. Anyway, the letter reads as follows:

1		
2	"I refer to the programme which was aired on RTÉ on	
3	Sunday, 26th January 2014. The programme was hosted by	
4	Marian Finucane. You were one of the people on the	
5	show. I am the garda sergeant at the centre of the	1:06
6	penalty points investigation by the Public Accounts	
7	Committee.	
8		
9	I contacted RTÉ station moments after I heard	
10	defamatory statements you made about me which were	1:07
11	aired by RTÉ. I was at work and was devastated when I	
12	heard what you said. Your horrendous statements	
13	accused me of having committed criminal and	
14	disciplinary offences. RTÉ's producer of the	
15	programme, Ann, said that they did not know you were	1:07
16	going to say what you said. I advised Ann I would be	
17	taking the matter further.	
18		
19	Hereunder is what you stated and affirmed publicly"	
20	11	1:07
21	And that is a quotation we have gone through from the	
22	transcript.	
23		
24	In the middle of the next page:	
25	11	1:07
26	"You publicly stated over the airwaves I have committed	
27	criminal offences. In other words, I was a criminal.	
28	You stated and adamantly affirmed three times that I	
29	have not coonerated with the O'Mahony inquiry you	

also stated twice I breached the Data Protection Act. 1 2 You also stated you had information on this. 3 stated I spoon fed TDs and did not go through proper practice and procedures. 4 5 11:07 6 All your statements are false and have done me great 7 Each of your accusations on me will be denied. harm. 8 I am a member of An Garda Síochána of sergeant rank. 9 have never committed any criminal offence and I have 28 11:07 10 11 years unblemished service. I am not a criminal. 12 not and never breached the Data Protection Act. I did 13 not fail or refuse to cooperate with the O'Mahony 14 investigation. I did not spoon feed evidence to any 15 I deny all your accusations and will show proof of 11:08 16 this at a later date. My character and reputation are 17 very important to me and you have destroyed them both, 18 see references below. 19 20 Your accusations publicly aired by RTÉ have done me 11:08 21 serious harm and damage. What the programme did was 22 essentially destroyed by reputation. I enforce the 23 I have never broken it. I am so upset and 24 annoyed and furious at the false allegations aired by 25 RTÉ against me. The defamatory/slanderous statements 11:08 were made at a time when the Government Public Accounts 26 27 Committee were deliberating on evidence I had given to 28 them. 29

1			I am the person who had reported the penalty points	
2			matter and my family and close friends contacted me	
3			when they heard the statements made by you and they	
4			were also disgusted. Furthermore, RTÉ has put this	
5			airing out on the RTÉ Player causing me further	11:08
6			humiliation accusations that I am a criminal.	
7			giving you an opportunity try and make amends for	
8			some of the damage done to me as a result of your	
9			public statements on the RTÉ programme, I think it is	
10			the least you can do and even if that is done I don't	11:09
11			believe it can undo all the harm caused by those	
12			defamatory, slanderous statements and remarks.	
13				
14			I have also written to RTÉ regarding their airing of	
15			the statements in question.	11:09
16				
17			I await hearing from you as a matter of urgency."	
18				
19			And then that is signed Maurice McCabe and he puts a	
20			number of different headings down there. Now, I am not	11:09
21			asking you to comment on any of the factual assertions	
22			or any of the matters that he alleges in relation to	
23			his own position, but you got the letter and presumably	
24			you were upset to get the letter?	
25		Α.	Yeah, I was. Because, you know, I certainly bore no	11:09
26			animosity towards Sergeant McCabe, so I was upset that	
27			he was upset.	
28	180	Q.	Yeah?	
29		Α.	And that he was annoyed and I felt understandably	

- annoyed if what he was saying was correct.
- 2 181 Q. Just going back to what you were doing and what you
- 3 thought you were doing on the Sunday?
- 4 A. Yeah.
- 5 182 Q. The debate in the PAC and in public and the debate on

11:11

11 · 11

- 6 the programme related to, inter alia, people coming
- 7 before the PAC and giving evidence and the position of
- 8 the Commissioner in relation to that, and the PAC
- 9 hadn't in fact decided whether to hear Sergeant
- 10 McCabe's evidence in private or in public. Did you not 11:10
- see that you were very publicly commenting on Sergeant
- 12 McCabe in a very adverse way?
- 13 A. Well, I didn't see it for one moment that I was
- commenting in an adverse way. I felt I was commenting
- on his position based on information given to me by the 11:10
- 16 Commissioner, which turned out to be adversely
- 17 affecting, maybe, his position. But I wasn't as
- interested, even though it was part of the, you know,
- the general topics, I wasn't as interested in the PAC
- as I was in the principle that if an investigation is
- set up within An Garda Síochána, then there should be
- cooperation from the complainant parties, and if there
- wasn't, as I was told there wasn't, I had a problem
- 24 with that.
- 25 183 Q. Yes. But were you not conscious of whether you were,
- in fact, influencing or maybe attempting to influence
- the public debate over whether the PAC should hear
- 28 him --
- 29 A. No. it didn't --

2 Yeah, I would be misleading the Tribunal if I said that Α. I thought I was influencing -- I was out to influence 3 the Public Accounts Committee's views towards this. 4 5 I was out to make the point, as I have said 11:11 6 before, that if there was non-cooperation, as I thought 7 there was, then I thought this was wrong, and I thought 8 it was wrong to be leaking information to independent TDs without cooperating with the internal 9 10 investigation. Now, the consequences of that may flow, 11:11 11 but it wasn't -- there was no ulterior motive. That 12 point, I was very much conscious of making. 13 Well, you got this letter, and you got it on the 6th 185 Q. 14 February, is that right? Or perhaps it's date-stamped 15 on the 4th? 11:12 16 I am not sure. Α. 17 The top of page 1774, it's date-stamped the 4th --186 Q. 18 The 4th, yeah, the 4th. Α. 19 187 You wrote to the Commissioner then and sent him a copy Q. of the letter. Perhaps we would look at page 1773. 20 11:12 21 Yes. Α. 22 188 Q. And you say: 23 24 "Dear Martin, 25 11:12 I enclose copy letter which I have received from 26 27 Maurice McCabe. I am also enclosing draft response. Ι

-- or hear him in private or --

184

Q.

1

28

29

have not sent these letters to the other person.

would be grateful if you could look at the letter that

- I have received and my proposed draft response. I need
- to be factually accurate and any assistance would be
- 3 appreciated."
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 189 Q. And just to get matters in terms of sequence I don't
- 6 want to misunderstand the chronology you were written
- 7 to by the Tribunal in December --
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 190 Q. -- isn't that right? And then you replied in the
- 10 letter we have seen. And you didn't disclose this
- correspondence in your reply; why was that?
- 12 A. Well, I think, I think -- what page is my reply? I am

11 · 13

11:13

- not sure where my reply is. Can you just go to my
- 14 reply for a second.
- 15 191 Q. Yes. We are at 1768.
- 16 A. Well, I didn't have the file in front of me, anyway,
- for a start. I was asked to review the papers. I am
- just refreshing my memory. Em, I think it's in the
- letter that I didn't have a file in front of me anyway,
- 20 but I do say:
- 21
- "If I can be of any assistance, please do not hesitate
- to contact me."
- 24 192 Q. Yes.
- A. And I don't think, you know, with due -- having already 11:14
- 26 got a letter from the Tribunal thanking me for my
- 27 speedy and cooperative assistance.
- 28 193 Q. Yes. No, we are always grateful for a speedy return.
- 29 A. I responded and gave everything as quickly as I could.

- 1 But I didn't have the file at that time.
- 2 194 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. So -- but there's no -- I mean, at that stage, no
- disrespect to the Tribunal because it's very important,
- 5 I suppose I was really concerned about where this was
- 6 going vis-á-vis myself personally.
- 7 195 Q. Yes. No, I can understand that. But in your second
- 8 letter to the Tribunal, which is at page 1771 -- you
- 9 see, the file had been very live, isn't that right,
- 10 because you had filed a defence in the proceedings in

11 · 15

11:15

11:15

- 11 November 2017?
- 12 A. Oh, yes, the file is very live at that stage. That is
- the file where Mr. McCabe set about suing me and RTÉ,
- 14 yes.
- 15 196 Q. Yes. But you did file a defence --
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 197 Q. -- in that, in November 2017.
- 18 A. Yeah.
- 19 198 Q. Okay. And presumably those proceedings were settled
- 20 before Christmas, is that right?
- 21 A. I can't remember the exact date. I think they were,
- yeah, yeah.
- 23 199 Q. Yes. So the file was -- it must have been prominent in
- the office when you were writing these letters back to
- 25 the Tribunal?
- 26 A. Yeah, yeah, it certainly was prominent vis-á-vis my --
- the problems I was having in defending a High Court
- 28 action.
- 29 200 Q. Yes, yes. And I don't want to be unfair to you,

Τ			Mr. Kean, because you are pread in your defence	
2			explicitly that you had contacted the Commissioner in	
3			advance of the programme, isn't that right?	
4		Α.	Yeah, I don't have I haven't seen sight of the	
5			defence for a while, but I accept what you are saying	11:15
6			is correct if it's there.	
7	201	Q.	Yes. And I have just lost the page where that is, and	
8			I will come back to it because it is of relevance.	
9			The this second letter, though, that we are looking	
10			at, you do refer to the proceedings again and	11:16
11		Α.	Yes, what page is that? Sorry.	
12	202	Q.	1771.	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	203	Q.	And you do say:	
15				11:16
16			"The only documentation I would have in relation to the	
17			matter concerns a claim brought against me by	
18			Mr. McCabe's solicitors, but I don't see how this would	
19			be relevant to the Tribunal."	
20		Α.	Yeah.	11:16
21	204	Q.	But you had sought the Commissioner's assistance in	
22			preparing your defence to the proceedings as well,	
23			isn't that correct?	
24		Α.	Em, I sought the Commissioner's assistance, as you will	
25			see from the correspondence, the moment I got Sergeant	11:17
26			McCabe's letter, because now it's serious. So Sergeant	
27			McCabe has sent the letter to me and I feel at this	
28			stage the most immediate and appropriate action for me	
29			to take is to send that to the Commissioner, since he	

1 gave me the information initially which led to the 2 complaint, and to ask him for assistance and help in 3 relation to a response. 4 205 Q. Yes. 5 By the way, just for the Tribunal, there is a typo in Α. 11:17 6 the letter that maybe I should just point out to the 7 I notice a typo there in -- it says "to the Tribunal. 8 other person". It should read "to any other person". 9 206 Yes. Q. 10 I don't know -- sorry, I don't have the letter. Α. 11:17 11 207 Yes. But again --Q. Yes, it's on page 1773. 12 Α. 13 I do want to be fair to you. Your defence filed 208 Q. 14 in the matter is at page 1805, and perhaps we will just 15 look at that. 11:18 16 Right. 1805? Α. 17 Yes. And I think is that the 17th November? 209 Q. 18 17th November 2017. 19 210 Yes. Q. 20 Α. Yes. 11:18 21 211 And at paragraph 16(v) at page 1807 --Q. 22 Yes. Α. 23 -- you do say in your defence publicly, as it were, in 212 Q. 24 that sense: 25 11:18 "The Second-Named Defendant had made inquiries prior to 26

whistleblowers did not cooperate with the

appearing on the show and had been informed by the

then-Commissioner of An Garda Síochána that the

27

28

29

- 1 investigation."
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 213 Q. But the point I'm just asking about is, in your first
- 4 letter back to the Tribunal on the 14th and then in
- your second letter that we have looked at at page 1771, 11:19

11 · 19

11:19

11:19

11 · 19

- 6 on the 20th --
- 7 A. Of December.
- 8 214 O. -- of December --
- 9 A. Yeah.
- 10 215 Q. -- you don't say that you had, in fact, or you don't
- disclose the correspondence with the Commissioner or
- the sequence of events in which you engaged the
- Commissioner in assisting you in drafting your response
- to Mr. McCabe, Sergeant McCabe?
- 15 A. Yeah, well I'm not sure --
- 16 216 Q. Why is that?
- 17 A. Well, I am not sure that -- I think it's fair to say
- that when -- that when you say assisting me in drafting
- 19 the defence --
- 20 217 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. -- the only record that I have in relation to the
- 22 Commissioner's assistance to me is long, long before.
- 23 It's several years before my defence.
- 24 218 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. I mean, it's like -- I think you seem to be implying
- that I was speaking to the Commissioner maybe a month
- or two before the defence. No. The last communication
- I had with the Commissioner was going back to --
- 29 219 Q. In 2014?

1 That is three years before, yeah. Α. Yes. Well, that is what we were looking at a few 2 Q. 220 minutes ago. Your letter of the 6th February to the 3 Commissioner --4 5 CHAIRMAN: Well, maybe I could clarify, Mr. Kean, if I might, please. The Tribunal letter says: 6 7 Tribunal would be obliged if you would furnish us with 8 any relevant documentation you have in connection with the events set out in your letter." 9 You reply: "I don't have any written documentation." 10 11 · 20 11 That is what you are being asked about. Now there is 12 written documentation. 13 In relation to my Pleadings? Α. 14 CHAIRMAN: No, it's not about your Pleadings. 15 about you writing to the Garda Commissioner and him 11:20 16 writing back, and you say: I don't have any written 17 documentation. Oh, I understand. 18 Α. 19 CHAIRMAN: But there was. 20 Right. Α. 11:20 CHAIRMAN: 21 That is what you are being asked about. 22 MR. McGUINNESS: So could we go back to the letter then 221 Q. 23 that you wrote to the Commissioner on 1773. 24 1773, yes. Α. 25 222 0. Yes. And you say: 11:20 26 27 "Dear Martin, 28

I enclose copy letter of receipt from Maurice McCabe.

29

Т			I am also enclosing draft response. I have not sent	
2			these letters to"	
3				
4			I think you meant to say "any other person"?	
5		Α.	Yes.	11:21
6	223	Q.	"I would be grateful if you could look at the letter	
7			that I received and a proposed draft response. I need	
8			to be factually accurate, and any assistance would	
9			certainly be appreciated."	
10				11:21
11			And then we have looked at Sergeant McCabe's letter to	
12			you. And at page 1777 is the draft that you sent to	
13			the Commissioner.	
14		Α.	Correct.	
15	224	Q.	And when I use the word "draft", defence; this is your	11:21
16			first response, as it were, to Sergeant McCabe?	
17		Α.	Yeah, it wasn't it was a draft response.	
18	225	Q.	A draft response?	
19		Α.	Yeah.	
20	226	Q.	Yes, exactly. And that sets out there what you are	11:21
21			proposing for his consideration?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	227	Q.	And it reads as follows:	
24				
25			"Dear Mr. McCabe,	11:21
26				
27			I refer to your recent correspondence received. At the	
28			very outset, I need to clarify a number of matters. I	
29			have on many occasions in the past spoken out about the	

importance of protecting and safeguarding the rights of whistleblowers, for want of a better phrase. already stated on a number of occasions admiration for the bravery of people such as yourself and others in trying to expose wrongdoings within not only An Garda 11:22 Síochána, but any other body or company. I have been strong in my views that all allegations of wrongdoing need to be investigated in full and the full rigours and processes of the law enforced where necessary. I have also stated that I believe any wrongdoings within 11 · 22 An Garda Síochána should be investigated in the first instance within that force and by the appropriate personnel appointed to so investigate. I have also stated on a number of occasions that if there were any attempt to whitewash or sweep under the carpet serious 11:22 concerns of any whistleblower, then the matter needs to be referred to the appropriate authorities and bodies outside An Garda Síochána. I have been advised that Inspector O'Mahony was appointed to investigate in full any complaints, including those of your good self. I 11:22 have also been advised that you failed to cooperate with Inspector O'Mahony's investigation. I have been advised that, in fact, you were directed by the Commissioner to cooperate, and again you failed in that I have also been advised that there was a 11 · 23 potential breach of the Data Protection Act by you and/or others and this was an allegation, and obviously, no doubt, will be investigated in due I also believe and state that anyone that course.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1	drip-feeds politicians or newspapers in relation to
2	allegations without following the proper procedures in
3	place was, in my opinion, not helping their own cause.
4	I believe that I have great respect for anybody
5	exposing wrongdoings in any organisation such as
6	yourself. I also complimented the Commissioner and the
7	force in disciplining some members of An Garda Síochána
8	and referring other files to the DPP where wrongdoings
9	had occurred. I should say for the record that I never
10	had any point squashed, nor was I ever approached by
11	any member of An Garda Síochána to assist in relation
12	to same. I believe that the work you and others in
13	your situation are doing is vital and important to both
14	uphold the honesty and integrity of our society. The
15	comments I made, for which I apologise if they caused
16	any offence, were:
17	
18	1. It was my opinion that the matter should be dealt
19	with within An Garda Síochána in the first instance.
20	11:2
21	2. I believe that everyone involved should have
22	cooperated with Inspector O'Mahony's investigation.

3. I was advised that there were potential breaches of the Data Protection Act, that this obviously is something that will be adjudicated upon in due course. I have no problem clarifying these issues again and certainly do not want to cause any personal offence to you or anybody else, save for my views outlined and

1 referred to above. 2 Yours sincerely." 3 4 5 And that is an unsigned draft. 11:24 6 Yes, yes. Α. And that is followed in our papers with the reply that 7 228 Q. 8 actually was sent, isn't that correct, at page 1779. Yes. I think -- sorry. Yes, that's correct. 9 Α. And it differs in a number of respects? 10 229 Q. 11:24 11 It does, yes. Α. 12 I think you understand that? 230 Ο. Yeah, yeah. 13 Α. 14 231 0. And you adopted a number of paragraphs into the draft 15 that we have seen? 11:25 16 Correct. Α. Okay. And the first one is, it's the third line down, 17 232 Q. 18 beginning "I would like to say", isn't that correct? 19 "I would like to say that I am invited on --" 20 Oh, yes, correct. Α. 11:25 21 233 And that was suggested by the Commissioner? Q. 22 Yes. Α. 23 And then on the next page --234 Q. 24 Well, sorry, could I just be clear there, by the Α. 25 Commissioner or somebody on his behalf. I am not sure, 11:25 26 you know, who gave me that draft. I am assuming it's 27 the Commissioner, but I am not sure if he consulted anybody else in advance of giving me... 28 29 Okay. Well, the first paragraph at the top of page 2. 235 Q.

		Α.	163.	
2	236	Q.	That first paragraph says:	
3				
4			"The subject of the FCPS on the show that day as part	
5			of the programme was well aired in the public domain	11:26
6			previously and so I was aware that you and your	
7			colleagues were advised to contact Assistant	
8			Commissioner O'Mahony and his team if you had any	
9			complaints to make without prejudice to the	
10			confidential reporting system. That was the point I	11:26
11			was making about cooperation with the investigation."	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	237	Q.	And the word "system" there, the word "mechanism" is	
14			used in the original suggested addition, but that is,	
15			in effect, something that was put in at the behest of	11:26
16			the Commissioner?	
17		Α.	Yes, or somebody on yes.	
18	238	Q.	Or somebody. And then the next paragraph:	
19				
20			"It was also the case, of course, that the Data	11:26
21			Protection Commissioner's views are well-known in the	
22			context of personal and sensitive data being aired in	
23			public. I fully agree with his views and I made this	
24			point on the radio."	
25				11:27
26			I think that was also suggested as to be included.	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	239	Q.	And did you know the Data Protection Commissioner's	
29			views?	

1 I am not sure I did because that information was given Α. 2 to me by the Commissioner, so I was standing over that. 3 240 Okay. Well, do you recall whether Commissioner Q. 4 Callinan told you about the Data Commissioner's views? 5 He may have done so. I mean, he may have done so. Α. 11:27 6 mean, we did have lengthy conversations and he may have 7 gone into that, but I may have chosen just to stick to 8 the core issue rather than elaborating any further. Yes. Can you recollect perhaps any reference to the 9 241 Q. fact that the Commissioner had enlisted the Data 10 11 · 27 11 Commissioner, Mr. Hawkes, at the time, and that he had 12 written to the Committee, the Public Accounts Committee 13 strongly --I can't recollect that. 14 Α. 15 242 -- in strong terms? Q. 11:27 16 I can't recollect. I am not saying he didn't say it to Α. 17 me, but again, it wasn't something that I was going 18 into on the radio, because I was making the point, as 19 is outlined here, but not elaborating any further because I didn't -- I wasn't taking notes, to the best 20 11:28 of my knowledge, in any way, shape or form of this, so 21 22 I was thinking of the general points (A) cooperation, and (B) data protection. 23 24 Mr. McGuinness, just vis-á-vis what you have CHAIRMAN: said, I think everyone agrees that whatever view 25 11 · 28 26 Mr. Hawkes took was a completely independent view, 27 based upon his view of the law and any advice he

received, just in case any misunderstanding might

28

29

appear.

1 MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. No, I was just trying to probe 2 whether Mr. Kean might have been told of the Data 3 Commissioner's views by the Garda Commissioner. I may well have been. As I say, we were on the phone 4 Α. 5 for a while, but I don't recollect. 11:28 6 243 Yes. Q. 7 It wasn't of relevance to me, I wasn't taking it in Α. 8 from the point of view of bringing it out on the 9 programme. 10 244 All right. The third paragraph there commencing "I Q. 11:28 11 have no doubt": 12 13 "I have no doubt that GSOC investigation will fully 14 examine all of these matters and address any 15 wrongdoing." 11:28 16 Yes. Α. 17 And that was inserted at the suggestion of the 245 Q. 18 Commissioner? 19 Yes. Α. And did you have any knowledge of the GSOC 20 246 0. 11:29 investigation? 21 22 No. Α. The Tribunal has heard evidence of a statement 23 247 okay. Q. 24 issued by the Commissioner on the -- on the evening of 25 the 29th January, which made reference to the matter 11:29 26 being referred to the GSOC body. Were you aware of 27 that yourself? 28 Α. No. 29 All right. But if that happened, it obviously 248 Q.

- 1 post-dated or perhaps might have been in the
- 2 contemplation of the Commissioner when he spoke to you
- 3 on the 25th or 26th?
- 4 A. Yeah, I can't comment on that. I mean, that is a
- 5 matter for the Commissioner.
- 6 249 Q. Did he mention GSOC to you, that he was going to send

- 7 these matters off to GSOC?
- 8 A. He could well have. I mean, he could well have. I
- 9 mean, don't forget, we were having lengthy
- 10 conversations. I am really trying to focus just on the 11:29
- core issue.
- 12 250 Q. Sure. The broad strokes, is it?
- 13 A. Well, the core issue of, did Sergeant McCabe cooperate,
- and, if not, why not, and, you know, was he
- obstructive. The data protection point was brought in 11:30
- by the Commissioner, it wasn't raised by me, other than
- saying, you know, I think it's wrong that information
- 18 might be going to independent TDs in the Dáil, or
- 19 something to that effect.
- 20 251 Q. Well, this is the letter that was sent back to Sergeant 11:30
- 21 McCabe.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 252 Q. Okay. And it doesn't obviously reveal or, I suppose,
- 24 disclose the fact that you had checked all of this with
- 25 the Commissioner prior to going on the programme. Was
- 26 there any reason why you --
- 27 A. Sorry?
- 28 253 Q. Was there any reason why you didn't, as it were,
- 29 disclose in this letter to Sergeant McCabe that you had

- checked these matters with the Commissioner? 1 2 I mean, I think maybe at that No, there was no reason. Α. stage it could be that I was still trying to honour the 3 terms of the original request from the Commissioner, 4 5 and that is that, you know, he not be associated with 11:31 6 giving me the information. That might be the case. 7 But I wasn't rushing to say, oh, it was the 8 Commissioner told me this. Not at that stage, no. And obviously the intricacies of the law of libel and 9 254 Q. defamation, it seems to be a feature now that it can be 11:31 10 11 part of a defence to show that you have made reasonable inquiries. 12 13 Yes. Α. 14 255 Q. Don't you know that? 15 Yes. Α. 11:31 16 Yes. And that is, in fact, what you pleaded as part of 256 Q. 17 your defence at --18 Subsequently, yes. 19 257 -- paragraph 16.5. Q. 20 Α. Yes. 11:31 But did you make a conscious decision then not to take 21 258 Q. 22 that line in this piece of correspondence?
- 23 A. Yeah, I think I was still very much believing that the
- information I had given was correct, because the
- Commissioner had not backed down in any way, shape. He
- didn't suggest one minute, oh, we might have a problem
- 27 here or -- you know, so at that stage I'm still
- confident that this matter won't be going any further,
- despite Sergeant McCabe's annoyance, and, you know, it

1 wasn't -- you know, my main intention here was to get a 2 reply back with the Commissioner's input, and the Commissioner didn't back down, the Commissioner was 3 still standing the ground as per the information he 4 5 gave me and I was happy to stand my ground based on 11:32 6 that information. 7 I don't know, have you considered Superintendent 259 Yes. 0. 8 walsh's statement that he made to the Tribunal --9 No. Α. -- which was furnished to you? 10 260 Q. 11:32 11 Yes, it was. I didn't get a chance to review them. Α. 12 Okay. Well, the investigators suggested to 261 Ο. Superintendent Walsh, who was acting as the sort of 13 14 private secretary to the Commissioner, that 15 Mr. Callinan, in fact, sent you text messages on the 11:32 16 morning of the 12th February at 7:51 in the morning. 17 Do you recall getting any text messages on that date 18 from the Commissioner? 19 On the morning of the programme? Α. Of the 12th February. This is after these letters now. 11:33 20 262 Q. No, I don't recollect getting one, no. 21 Oh, sorry. Α. 22 Because you had a meeting then with Superintendent 263 Q. 23 walsh on the 12th February, isn't that right? 24 Yeah, I didn't recollect that, but, now that I know, in Α. 25 fact I actually knew Frank Walsh from years back. 11:33 26 264 Yes. Ο. 27 So now I remember, yes, but I can't remember what was Α. in the text. 28

But have you a recollection of getting the

29

265

Q.

- texts, irrespective of what was in them?

 A. I don't really, no, I don't really, but I am not saying
- I didn't get it, I just don't recollect getting it.
- 4 266 Q. The investigators interviewed Superintendent Walsh, and
- the Tribunal will hear from him, but I think you are

11:33

11:34

11:34

- 6 aware that he retrieved a diary entry showing an
- 7 appointment with you at 11:30 that day, isn't that
- 8 correct?
- 9 A. If that is what it says, yes.
- 10 267 Q. Yes.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 268 Q. Now, the letter that we have been looking at, the
- response that you sent to Sergeant McCabe, that was
- sent out on the 12th February?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 269 Q. Isn't that right?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 270 Q. And that was sent out after you had met Superintendent
- 19 walsh?
- 20 A. I believe that to be the case.
- 21 271 Q. With the inclusions of the paragraphs that we've gone
- 22 through?
- A. Yes, yes.
- 24 272 Q. And if we go to page 1783, do you see that, Mr. Kean?
- 25 A. I do, indeed.
- 26 273 O. It's a handwritten --
- 27 A. Note.
- 28 274 Q. -- note. And we certainly understand that that is the
- 29 Commissioner's handwriting.

- 1 A. Is it?
- 2 275 Q. And have you seen that before?
- A. Oh, yes, I have, yeah. Sorry, did you say it's the
- 4 Commissioner's handwriting?
- 5 276 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. Oh, is it? Yeah. That was the -- I was given that by

11:35

11:35

11:35

- 7 way of response to what amendments or alterations I
- 8 should make to the draft letter.
- 9 277 Q. Okay. And you think -- you think you are confident
- 10 enough to say you were given that, or a copy of it?
- 11 A. Oh, I am certainly confident, yeah, because the
- phraseology in two of the paragraphs wouldn't be mine
- at all. "The subject of the FCPS" wouldn't be mine.
- 14 278 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. No, that was given to me, I have no doubt about that,
- from the Commissioner's office, to help me formulate a
- 17 response to Sergeant McCabe.
- 18 279 Q. Yes. And that first handwritten paragraph, that
- appears on the first page with the third line of the
- 20 reply.
- A. Yes, yes.
- 22 280 Q. The other three paragraphs we have seen, that text is
- almost verbatim, with the exception of one word, what
- is included at the top of page 2 of your actual
- response to Sergeant McCabe?
- 26 A. Right.
- 27 281 Q. Isn't that right?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 282 Q. Now, there is a typewritten version of that at page

1 1782. 2 Yes. Α. 3 283 Do you recall getting that from Superintendent Walsh? Q. 4 I couldn't remember who I got it from --Α. 5 284 Yes. Q. 11:36 6 -- until I heard about this meeting, and I recollect Α. 7 meeting Superintendent Walsh, and I believe that is 8 where I probably got this, because it wasn't emailed, faxed or posted to me or anything like that. 9 CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness, it might help, I suppose, 10 11:36 11 Mr. Kean and myself if, given that we didn't get any of 12 this from Mr. Kean when he said he hadn't got any 13 documents, you might indicate where the Tribunal 14 actually got it from, got all of these things from. MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. Well, I am just coming to 15 11:36 16 clarify a couple of issues. 17 You didn't provide that to the Tribunal, either of 285 Q. 18 those two? 19 I didn't have that. No, no, I didn't have that. Α. And my question, perhaps it was unclear at the time --20 286 Q. 21 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. Kean, you actually did have that. 22 No, no, I did not have --Α. 23 CHAIRMAN: At one stage you did have it. 24 I did not have it at the time --Α. CHAIRMAN: You are as familiar as I am with an 25 11:36 affidavit of discovery. 26 27 Α. Yes.

28

29

CHAIRMAN:

paragraph:

"I have in my possession". In the next

"I once had in my possession but no longer

1 have and the time I last had it in my possession is on 2 the schedule." Yes. from --3 Α. That is kind of what every lawyer knows, so 4 CHAIRMAN: 5 you did have this. 11:37 6 Yes, but I was not aware I had -- I did not remember Α. having that, I did not remember having that. 7 8 CHAIRMAN: Okay. So we were just going on to where we got it from. 9 10 Yes. Α. 11:37 11 287 MR. McGUINNESS: So the handwritten document that you Q. 12 looked at and I had understood you to agree with me 13 that that was provided to you on the day that you met 14 Superintendent Walsh, on 12th February 2014? 15 I believe that to be the case, yeah. Α. 11:37 16 And --288 Ο. 17 Sorry, I should also point out that there is no Α. 18 benefit - this is of great assistance to me, this document - there is no benefit for me to not produce 19 20 this document, because this document proves, in my 11:37 21 opinion, and I was very happy to get it, that there was 22 an active response from the Commissioner's office to 23 help me with the draft letter that I did, so I was very 24 pleased to get this document. 25 Now, you may not have retained that, is that the case? 289 Q. 11:38 26 Yes, that's correct, no. Α. 27 290 we, in fact, got this from disclosure from the Q. Commissioner's office, ultimately discovered by 28 Mr. Marrinan in late December. 29

- A. Yes, yes. And it also has to be said it wouldn't be unusual that, at that meeting, I didn't get the
- document. It may have been a case it was put in front

11:38

11:38

11:39

- 4 of me and I dictated the letter based on that, maybe,
- 5 because I never got the document.
- 6 291 Q. Yes.
- 7 A. It would not be unusual for me to dictate a letter, as
- 8 I did, on the same day incorporating that, but I was
- 9 very pleased to get this from the Tribunal.
- 10 292 Q. Yes, but I do want to nail this down. Have you a
- 11 recollection of having that produced to you in your
- office where the meeting took place with Superintendent
- Walsh on the 12th February 2014?
- 14 A. I have a vague recollection of getting that information
- on that day, which enabled me to send out the letter.
- 16 293 Q. Okay. Well, there is a typewritten version that we
- 17 were just going to ask you to look at, at --
- 18 A. At 1782?
- 19 294 Q. Yes, 1782. Superintendent Walsh has told the Tribunal
- 20 he typed up this version of what is the handwritten
- one.
- 22 A. Right.
- 23 295 Q. Have you any recollection of seeing that on the day?
- 24 A. I am not sure -- I am assuming it was a typed version I
- saw that I worked, you know, and dictated the letter
- from, I am assuming that. I am not sure when I saw the
- 27 written one or the typed one, but as they are both
- identical, I am not sure which I saw.
- 29 296 Q. Yes.

- 1 I am sure Superintendent Walsh could clarify that. Α. 2 I am just a wee bit confused as to, and 3 there has been mention of a text apparently coming from Superintendent Walsh, there has been mention of a 4 5 handwritten document, there has been mention of a 11:39 typescript of a handwritten document and there has been 6 7 mention of dictating something, there has been mention 8 of seeing something, but the actual sequence of what came when and what was done with it, I'm just -- at 9 this point, I am just not getting it, and that is 10 11:40 11 entirely my fault, Mr. McGuinness. 12 MR. MCGUINNESS: Perhaps I will just try and revisit it 13 with the witness. 14 297 Q. And sorry, Mr. Kean, just, the Chairman wants to be clear and I want to be clear on this too. 15 11:40 16 No problem. Α. 17 You met Superintendent Walsh? 298 Q.
- 19 299 Q. On the 12th February?

Yes.

Α.

18

A. Yeah. I actually hadn't recollected that until it was 11:40 mentioned to me, but, yes, I did, I remember that we did, yes.

- 23 300 Q. And you met him for the purpose of -- you were anxious to respond to Sergeant McCabe?
- 25 A. Correct.
- 26 301 Q. The draft that you'd sent to the Commissioner, he 27 hadn't replied to that letter in any form of 28 correspondence?
- 29 A. No, I had no correspondence from the Commissioner at

- any time in relation to this matter.
- 2 302 Q. And apparently the Commissioner and Superintendent
- Walsh agreed it wouldn't be appropriate for him to
- 4 reply, did you know that?
- 5 A. I assume that's correct, yes, bearing in mind that the
- 6 Commissioner had already told me that he didn't want me
- 7 to disclose where I was getting my information from in

11:41

11:41

11 · 41

- 8 advance.
- 9 303 Q. But Superintendent Walsh, whom I think you knew for
- over 30 years --
- 11 A. Yes, yes.
- 12 304 Q. -- was the Commissioner's private secretary.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 305 Q. Isn't that right?
- 15 A. Well, if you say so. I am assuming he was. He was
- 16 certainly in his office.
- 17 306 Q. Yes. But you had acted professionally for him?
- 18 A. I did, yeah. I would say, I am guessing 20 years ago.
- 19 307 Q. In the purchase of a house, some property anyway, is
- 20 that right?
- 21 A. Yeah. I don't remember, but I did act for him, and I
- am assuming that's correct, but it was a long time ago.
- 23 308 Q. Yes. And he came to your office?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 309 Q. And I am trying to be clear on this, did he come with
- one or other or both of these?
- 27 A. I don't remember that.
- 28 310 Q. And show them to you?
- 29 A. I don't remember that. He certainly showed them to me

- because that's why my letter was amended.
- 2 311 Q. Yes. And can we take it then that it's a very clear
- recollection and something you can happily swear to,
- 4 that one or other of these was shown to you and, as a
- 5 result, you amended your letter and included these in

11 · 42

11:42

11:43

- 6 your reply to Sergeant McCabe?
- 7 A. Yes, and when you say "shown", he may have read it out
- 8 to me. You know, there is a strong possibility, as
- 9 would not be unusual, that I dictated the letter when
- he was with me, I don't remember. But I am certainly
- satisfied that they were either read to me, shown to me
- and/or possibly given to me, though I have no record of
- that, that then assisted me in drafting the reply
- and amending the reply accordingly.
- 15 312 Q. Yes. Now, just to go to a portion of your statement.
- You do say, at the bottom of page 1736, of your shock
- on the day of the broadcast, and then telephoning the
- 18 former Commissioner for further clarification. That is
- 19 at the bottom of page 1736.
- 20 A. Right, yes.
- 21 313 Q. Were you concerned on that day, having regard to the
- phone call from Sergeant McCabe, that there might be
- follow-up, and then there was, in fact, follow-up?
- 24 A. Yes, yeah, I mean, I was concerned, yeah. I mean, I
- was shocked, as I said.
- 26 314 Q. And did you say that to the Commissioner when you spoke
- to him on the 26th?
- 28 A. I don't recollect what I said, but I think it's fair to
- assume that I was ringing him to express serious

- concern about what I had just heard.
- 2 315 Q. Yes. Well, did you adopt a wait-and-see approach,
- 3 because the letter from Sergeant McCabe didn't come
- 4 immediately?
- 5 A. No, no, it didn't, yeah. And my attitude was very much 11:44
- 6 wait and see.
- 7 316 Q. Yes. But it did come on the -- it did come on the 6th
- 8 February, and you immediately sent it to the
- 9 Commissioner on the 6th February, isn't that correct?
- 10 A. That is correct.
- 11 317 Q. And did you have some conversation then with the
- 12 Commissioner to, as it were, enlist his assistance and,

11 · 44

11:44

11:44

11 · 45

- in particular, in relation to the issue as to whether,
- 14 whether you were free to say in your defence, as it
- were, in the letter, that you'd consulted him
- 16 beforehand?
- 17 A. Well, I certainly would have been looking to him to
- provide evidence that what he had told me and what I
- subsequently stated in the Marian Finucane show was
- correct, so I was hoping to get some evidence to prove
- 21 that he was correct in giving me the information.
- 22 318 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. And I subsequently relaying it on the Marian Finucane
- show.
- 25 319 Q. Yes. Because the letter -- the letter that you wrote
- to him simply asked for him to look at the letter?
- 27 A. Yeah.
- 28 320 Q. But it didn't contain a request for evidence or
- documentation.

- 1 A. No, no.
- 2 321 Q. So when did you ask him for that?
- 3 A. No, I am not saying -- I am saying -- what I said was,
- I could have asked him for that. I expected that, I
- 5 expected something that would say, listen, the reason

11:45

11:45

- 6 not to worry, as I told you, is because here, 1, 2, 3,
- 7 4, 5, but I didn't get that.
- 8 322 Q. Why did you expect that if you hadn't asked for it in
- 9 the letter, unless you'd asked for it perhaps in a
- 10 phone call or --
- 11 A. I would expect it because I have got a letter from
- 12 Sergeant McCabe saying the information I gave was wrong
- and that all the information in relation to his
- cooperation was false, and that was information the
- 15 Commissioner gave to me. So, at that stage, it
- 16 wouldn't be unusual to expect a substantive response by
- 17 way of some evidence that what he said -- what the
- 18 Commissioner said was correct.
- 19 323 Q. You see, I have asked you about any text messages from
- Mr. Callinan to you on the morning of the 12th, but
- there is a call from Superintendent Walsh to you on the
- morning of the 12th at 8:26 a.m. Do you recall him
- 23 phoning you?
- 24 A. I don't, but I have no doubt he did, and the text might
- 25 have been from the Commissioner along the lines of, and 11:46
- I am only suggesting an educated guess, to say, listen,
- 27 expect a call from Superintendent Walsh, or something
- to that effect.
- 29 324 Q. Okay. And presumably you knew exactly who he was then

Т			at that Stage, Superintendent warsh, you had acted	
2			for	
3		Α.	No, I wouldn't say that. I have acted for hundreds of	
4			guards. I mean, I can't, with certainty, say I knew	
5			exactly who it was, but certainly, when I met him, I	11:46
6			knew who he was.	
7	325	Q.	Yes. But the drafts that we have looked at there with	
8			the four extra paragraphs, I mean, you said in your	
9			statement to the investigators that you checked the	
10			file and you confirmed that a copy of that wasn't on	11:47
11			the file, and you go on to say at page 1740, perhaps	
12			we'd just look at that, it's line 248, if you want to	
13			just check that there:	
14				
15			"A. I have checked my file and I confirm that a copy	11:47
16			of the Exhibit GK5 is not on the file. I believe now	
17			that it is fair to say that the former Commissioner	
18			Callinan, or somebody on his behalf, assisted in some	
19			way in drafting my response letter dated 12/2/2014."	
20		Α.	Yes.	11:47
21	326	Q.	And did you not recall at this stage the attendance of	
22			Superintendent Walsh	
23		Α.	I didn't, no.	
24	327	Q.	whom you had known and acted for, attending at your	
25			office on the 12th?	11:48
26		Α.	No, I didn't recollect that, no, no, but, I mean, it	
27			would be wrong of me if I said I did. I don't. But I	
28			was delighted, and I repeat this, and the inspectors	
29			were will note this. I was delighted to see this	

1			note, because, to me, it went a long way towards	
2			reaffirming everything I had been saying, but I don't	
3			remember how I got that.	
4			CHAIRMAN: But, Mr. Kean, it's not kind of every day	
5			that the personal secretary of the Garda Commissioner	11:48
6			turns up to one's office carrying a handwritten note	
7			personally written by the Garda Commissioner with a	
8			view to assisting you in correspondence with a public	
9			figure. It's hard to know why you didn't remember	
10			that.	11:48
11		Α.	Well, very simple: I mean, if I am seeing 30, 40	
12			people a day, six days a week, and this is, you know,	
13			this is a meeting that is arranged at short notice, I	
14			would be delighted to remember this, I mean it would	
15			have given me great pleasure to have had this note at	11:48
16			the very start; in fact, it would have been a great	
17			pleasure to have had it during the course of	
18			proceedings, but I didn't have it, and I was delighted	
19			that we got it.	
20	328	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: But you certainly had your original	11:49
21			letter to the Commissioner with your original draft	
22			response?	
23		Α.	I did, yes, yes.	
24	329	Q.	And you had the response that you actually issued, and	
25			you sent none of them to the Tribunal.	11:49
26		Α.	Oh, well, no. I apologise for that. That is an error	
27			on my part. At that stage, the Tribunal, who I have	
28			said on two occasions thanked me for all my	
29			contributions and help, I made everything available	

1			that I had at that time, but, to be fair to me, I was	
2			very much concentrating, as you can imagine, on being	
3			sued in the High Court for defamation by a plaintiff.	
4			This is the sole and this is my main concern. But I	
5			don't think there can be any doubt, unless you want to	11:49
6			talk to the inspectors, about the level of cooperation	
7			I have given from the very start and the speed at which	
8			that was given.	
9	330	Q.	Well, in fairness, perhaps I should ask you to look at	
10			another answer there at page 1741.	11:49
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	331	Q.	Because you do obviously talk about your own defence	
13			here. It's at line 257. You are being asked about the	
14			handwritten or the typed note.	
15		Α.	Yeah.	11:50
16	332	Q.	"I have no recollection of ever seeing this handwritten	
17			or typed note previously, but that does not mean I did	
18			not receive them."	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	333	Q.	"However, having now viewed the response issued by me	11:50
21			to Sergeant McCabe dated 12/2/2014, I note that the	
22			points listed in GK5 have been included in part of my	
23			file and response issued to Sergeant McCabe. As such,	
24			it is clear to me now that there was some input from	
25			the former Commissioner Callinan or somebody on his	11:50
26			behalf in drafting my response to Sergeant McCabe. The	
27			whole purpose of sending my draft response to the	
28			former Commissioner Callinan in the first instance was	
29			that there would be a considered response from him in	

1 order to protect myself and I expected that he would 2 evidence what he had stated to me over the phone on 3 25th January 2014." Yes. 4 Α. 5 334 But was it ever unclear to you that the response that Q. 11:50 6 you sent to Sergeant McCabe hadn't come from the 7 Commissioner, because you'd written to him only --8 No. I believe --Α. 9 335 Only written to him for that purpose? Q. Absolutely. No, I believe that the, and I have said 10 Α. 11:51 11 that in my affidavit, I believe that the amendments or 12 the additions that were proposed came from the Commissioner, yes, I believe that. 13 I mean, he may have 14 got advice internally, whatever, that is not for me to 15 say, but certainly, he is the only one I contacted. 11:51 But what I am mystified is, is that how can you be --16 336 Q. 17 have suggested that it might have come from some other 18 agent? 19 Well, no, what I am talking about there is, and I Α. certainly don't want you mystified, I want to be very 20 11:51 clear on this, what I am trying to say there is that I 21 22 don't know who in the Commissioner's office, or if it 23 was him, that helped me with this response. I wrote to 24 him, but I am just saying that I can't say it was him. 25 Maybe it was one of his assistants that drafted the 11:51 26 response on his behalf, but I am confident it came on 27 foot of my letter --It may be difficult -- it's kind of 28 CHAIRMAN: 29 difficult for me to imagine, certainly sitting here

1			now, someone in the Garda Commissioner's office	
2			dictating something to him and him writing it down in	
3			his own handwriting.	
4		Α.	Yes, yes, but I didn't know that was his handwriting.	
5			I had no idea whose handwriting that is. It was even	11:52
6			suggested to me at one stage was it somebody in my	
7			office's handwriting, and I said no.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Well, obviously we don't know until people	
9			tell us.	
10		Α.	Yeah. Well, I don't know, but it's been said to me	11:52
11			it's the Commissioner, I think, is that correct, that	
12			you said to me that's the Commissioner's handwriting?	
13			I didn't know this. But it doesn't surprise me.	
14	337	Q.	Yes. Can I just, in fairness, put to you what	
15			Superintendent walsh has said at page 1839 of his	11:52
16			statement, and perhaps at 1838, to put it in context.	
17			At line 88, it says:	
18				
19			"The Commissioner and I discussed the contents of this	
20			letter and attachments. I recall the Commissioner	11:53
21			being concerned as to the appropriateness of sending a	
22			written response to Mr. Kean. My recollection is that	
23			his concern centred on the fact that litigation was	
24			mentioned or contemplated which would have involved a	
25			member of An Garda Síochána. I think Commissioner	11:53
26			Callinan probably would have discussed this with me in	
27			some detail as I have studied law myself for a little	
28			while and he would sometimes ask for my	
29			non-professional opinion on legal issues. I recall	

1 that I was in agreement that it would probably be 2 inappropriate for the Commissioner of An Garda Síochána to be seen to be advising a member of the legal 3 profession on a matter that may come before the courts 4 5 involving a member of An Garda Síochána. Gerald Kean, 11:53 6 solicitor, is personally known to me and acted for me 7 in a professional capacity on a house purchase in the I have known Gerald Kean for probably 30 years. 8 I told Commissioner Callinan of my relationship with 9 Gerald Kean and I believe I offered to discuss the 10 11:53 matter further with Gerald Kean." 11 12 13 Now, can I just stop you there and ask you a few 14 The view taken at that time, therefore, seems 15 to be, on the part of the Commissioner and 11:54 Superintendent Walsh, that it was inappropriate to get 16 17 involved in this matter. But did you not see that it 18 was inappropriate for you to be seeking his help? 19 No, no, I thought it was very -- I thought it was Α. 20 vital. 11:54 To defend yourself against Sergeant McCabe? 21 338 Q. 22 No, I thought it was vital because -- and let me repeat Α. 23 what I said, and I think this goes very clear to 24 clarifying the point that the Chairman raised. There 25 is a very strong possibility that I never got this 11:54 They didn't want any link between their office 26 note. 27 and my office, which, now, in hindsight, I understand 28 So there is a very strong possibility, and that why.

is why I can't find anything about this, and that is

29

1			why the letter that went out went out the same day, and	
2			there is a very strong possibility that I dictated that	
3			letter with Superintendent Walsh. That is a	
4			possibility.	
5	339	Q.	Yes.	11:54
6		Α.	So the question to answer your question do I find it	
7			unusual, not at all; in fact, I find it absolutely	
8			imperative that I get to the Commissioner, give him the	
9			letter of complaint from Sergeant McCabe and then ask	
10			him, why have I got this? Why is he saying this?	11:54
11	340	Q.	Yes. You don't seem to have followed up in	
12			correspondence or in writing in any way with asking the	
13			Commissioner, well, you know, what is the evidence	
14			behind what you have told me?	
15		Α.	No, no, no, I didn't	11:55
16	341	Q.	How are you going to back me up?	
17		Α.	Yeah, exactly. But I can tell you that when he when	
18			I left the programme and rang him, that was the reason	
19			for the call, listen, we have a problem here, Sergeant	
20			McCabe is saying that what I said is incorrect, you	11:55
21			told me this, so now I am going to enlist your help in	
22			dealing with this problem. Now, I then waited, a	
23			wait-and-see, as you say, and then the letter came in	
24			and then I sent it to him and say, right, now let's	
25			you know, we need to respond to this.	11:55
26	342	Q.	Okay. Well, just to pick up where I left off in the	
27			quotation where Superintendent Walsh says:	
28				
29			"I believe I have offered to discuss the matter further	

1			with Gerald Kean."	
2				
3			Did Superintendent Walsh discuss it with you?	
4		Α.	I don't have a recollection of what was discussed. I	
5			am assuming he did, yeah.	11:5
6	343	Q.	"The reason for this was that the Commissioner remained	
7			concerned as to an official response to the letter of	
8			the 6th February 2014, but was nevertheless conscious	
9			of the need not to ignore the letter and to try and	
10			take some action to provide a response. The	11:5
11			Commissioner and I agreed I would meet with Mr. Kean,	
12			and I subsequently arranged a meeting with Mr. Kean on	
13			12/2/2014 at 11:30 a.m. at his office. The	
14			Commissioner had written some notes, which I believe	
15			was an attempted guidance perhaps for me in advance of	11:5
16			the meeting. I believe I probably typed them up for	
17			clarity and was probably conscious that if Mr. Kean	
18			asked for a copy of the notes, that I wouldn't be	
19			giving him a handwritten version. I met with Mr. Kean	
20			at 11:30 a.m. at his office on 12/2/2014. I had a	11:5
21			general conversation with him initially, pleasantry,	
22			and then a discussion about his correspondence of the	
23			6/2/2014. I have no note of the conversation, but	
24			would have confined any comments to the notes that I	
25			typed up. I was not aware of the Marian Finucane radio	11:5
26			programme on the 26/1/2014 which Gerald Kean was on,	

until the correspondence was received at the

the matters in any great detail so I relied on

Commissioner's office. Therefore, I could not go into

27

28

29

Τ			Commissioner Callinan's note that I had. To the best	
2			of my recollection, Mr. Kean made notes, but I don't	
3			believe I gave him a copy of the typed notes, but I am	
4			open to correction on that. Again, my best	
5			recollection is the notes were meant to assist, were	11:57
6			all matters that were already in the public domain. On	
7			my return to the office, I would have briefed the	
8			Commissioner on the meeting and subsequently would have	
9			asked that the letter and attachment and notes would be	
10			filed."	11:57
11				
12			So does that help you in any way?	
13		Α.	It does, yeah. It means that several days of	
14			exhaustive work carried out by employees in my office	
15			looking for a note that we thought might have been lost	11:57
16			or misfiled, I think it's fair to accept was never	
17			given to me.	
18	344	Q.	Okay. Did you perhaps not think it prudent to ring	
19			Superintendent Walsh when this arose in the context of	
20			a request from the Tribunal, to see had he given you a	11:57
21			note or	
22		Α.	I didn't even remember his involvement. I would have	
23			been delighted to, because I repeat what I said, this	
24			note is very helpful to me.	
25	345	Q.	Just as a side issue, had you any contact with Deputy	11:58
26			Commissioner O'Sullivan at that time in relation to any	
27			of these matters?	
28		Δ	Oh. sorry	

29 346 Q. Nóirín O'Sullivan?

- 1 A. No, I don't believe I have ever spoken to Nóirín
- 0'Sullivan in my life.
- 3 347 Q. Okay.
- 4 A. I don't believe I ever met her.
- 5 348 Q. And to be fair to yourself and obviously Commissioner
- 6 Callinan, did he ever mention to you any criminal
- 7 investigation that had occurred in relation to Sergeant

11:58

11:58

- 8 McCabe?
- 9 A. No, other than mentioning that there was possible
- 10 criminality involved in relation to breaches of the
- 11 Data Protection Act, or words to that effect.
- 12 349 Q. And had he ever raised any issue of any sexual abuse
- 13 allegations --
- 14 A. No.
- 15 350 Q. -- on anyone?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 351 Q. At any stage?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 352 Q. A file going to the DPP?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 353 Q. Did you ever speak to Commissioner Callinan about any
- of these matters after this correspondence of the 12th
- 23 February?
- A. No, I don't believe I did, I don't believe I did.
- 25 354 Q. Had you yourself heard any rumours about Sergeant
- 26 McCabe?
- 27 A. No, I heard nothing, if you are referring to
- 28 specifically the --
- 29 355 Q. Well, any rumours?

- A. No, none. I didn't hear anything about Tusla until I read it, no, no.
- 3 356 Q. Just looking at the overall events in terms of what was
 4 occurring in the political context and involving the
 5 Commissioner and the Public Accounts Committee, did you 11:59
 6 not see a danger in seeking out the view of the
- 7 Commissioner and speaking publicly then?
- No. I didn't, at that time. At that time -- I mean, 8 Α. hindsight is a great virtue and, you know, at that time 9 I genuinely felt, because I was brought up 10 11 in a house with my dad as a sergeant, that, you know, 12 people like the Commissioner were beyond reproach. I 13 mean, if I am wrong or if I was wrong, and I am not 14 saying I am wrong, that is my fault. But, you know, I didn't see anything -- you know, I was going to the 15 16 Commissioner believing that he was somebody beyond

12:00

12:00

- reproach, and when he gave me such very clear
 statements as to what the position was, I felt
 comfortable, and bearing in mind that the -- you know,
 as I say, the Minister for Justice had already
- 22 357 Q. But this is something that you chose to do, you intended to do and you did do, and putting out the Commissioner's view --

21

25 A. Yes.

reiterated these points some several months earlier.

- 26 358 Q. -- sub rosa, without disclosing to either the Marian
 27 Finucane Show or the public that you had spoken to the
 28 Commissioner, and that was the way he wanted it?
- 29 A. Yeah, well, I can't comment about him. But in relation

Т			to your point, I m while you are saying and pointing	
2			out the Commissioner's view, I thought that I was	
3			pointing out the official views and approaches of An	
4			Garda Síochána	
5	359	Q.	Yes.	12:01
6		Α.	hierarchy, not just the Commissioner. But I know	
7			what you are saying. But I didn't turn around and say,	
8			well, forget about what the guards think, I am going to	
9			say what the Commissioner thinks. I genuinely believed	
10			that the Commissioner was speaking on behalf of	12:01
11			management and An Garda Síochána at the very top level.	
12			MR. McGUINNESS: All right. Perhaps you would answer	
13			any further questions.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Maybe I could just comment. Given that	
15			everything has been gone through very thoroughly, I	12:01
16			would ask people to be as concise as they can. So	
17			Mr. McGarry.	
18			MR. McGARRY: Chairman, I just have a couple of	
19			matters.	
20				12:01
21			MR. KEAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCGARRY:	
22				
23	360	Q.	MR. McGARRY: Mr. Kean, Paul McGarry is my name. I am	
24			one of the counsel representing Sergeant McCabe. You	
25			have given evidence that Commissioner Callinan was a	12:01
26			man who you had met once and possibly had a phone	
27			conversation with on one other occasion before all of	
28			this?	
20		۸	Vac	

- 1 361 Q. And yet you spoke to him for approximately almost one
- 2 hour in total in the lead-up to the programme?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 362 Q. And you made it clear to him that you were going to use
- the information that he provided you on the programme?
- 6 A. Yes, that is correct.
- 7 363 Q. And he told you not to say that it came from him?
- 8 A. That is correct.
- 9 364 Q. How did he say that to you?
- 10 A. Mr. McGarry, I can't remember the exact wording, but he 12:02
- certainly said it to me on a couple of occasions, and
- possibly three occasions, I can't remember, but it
- wasn't just once. He said, listen, please don't
- 14 mention that we spoke or please don't mention that I'm

12:02

- 15 clarifying this position or giving you this
- information, or words to that effect.
- 17 365 Q. Did you not think that was a bit strange, a bit odd?
- 18 A. I didn't at the time, no, because, you know, I am
- 19 conscious that some people might want to remain
- anonymous. As I say, I am not an investigative
- journalist, but there is quite a lot of information
- appears in the paper from anonymous sources, so I
- 23 didn't think it was strange at the time, no.
- 24 366 Q. Well, you know that some of the information that he
- 25 gave you wasn't correct?
- A. I know now, or I believe so now.
- 27 367 Q. Yes. And you accepted him at his word at the time?
- 28 A. I did.
- 29 368 Q. Was that because he was the Garda Commissioner?

- 1 A. I think that is fair to say, yes.
- 2 369 Q. I see. So a person in his position could rely on the
- fact that you would relay the information without
- 4 questioning whether it might be correct or otherwise?
- 5 A. I think that would be correct to say.
- 6 370 Q. And you didn't ask him for any back-up information or

12:03

12:04

- 7 evidence to support what he was saying?
- 8 A. No, I didn't, not in those conversations.
- 9 371 Q. He told you a number of things, you have said, in
- relation to possible breaches of data protection,
- 11 cooperation with the O'Mahony investigation, other
- 12 Gardaí being the subject of disciplinary proceedings,
- and, in fact, you have said in your evidence that he
- 14 told you that Sergeant McCabe was obstructive in the
- investigation. You used the word "obstructive" I think 12:03
- twice or three times in your evidence.
- 17 A. Yeah, yes. And I think, you know, the tenor of the
- conversations, clearly, I'm clear that he continually,
- and when I say continually but certainly at regular
- intervals, referred to Sergeant McCabe as being
- obstructive and/or difficult and/or not cooperative or
- 22 not helping or not -- you know, words to that effect.
- 23 372 Q. Did you not think it was odd that the Commissioner was
- 24 giving you this level of information about the internal
- 25 operations of An Garda Síochána?
- A. Well, I didn't, because I think he had given a lot of
- information already to the Minister for Justice some
- three months earlier.
- 29 373 Q. Well, did you think it was proper or appropriate that

- 1 he would do that?
- A. Again, because he had given it to the Department of Justice or the Minister, I didn't think it was that inappropriate, no.
- And you are familiar with the Garda Síochána and the legislation covering An Garda Síochana, you said you have represented gardaí in a whole variety of areas, so you would be broadly familiar with --
- 9 A. Broadly familiar, yeah.
- 10 375 Q. And did you think in that context that him providing you with what, on any reading, is internal information about An Garda Síochána, disciplining four individuals, obstructing inquiries, did you think that that was permissible on the part of Mr. Callinan?

12:05

- 15 I didn't think there was any problem because I had Α. 16 formed that view on the basis that, again, deputy --17 or, sorry, Minister Shatter had, some three months 18 earlier, gone into great detail in the Dáil about the 19 difficulties of Mr. McCabe not cooperating, not being 20 helpful, not being -- and, in part, the -- as I have said before, I am not an investigative journalist in 21 22 this, I am simply a panelist. I also wanted to make 23 sure that -- you know, it was on my mind had the 24 position changed since Deputy Shatter, that maybe 25 Mr. McCabe had spent the last three weeks in head office providing information and details of his 26 27 complaints, I didn't know.
- 28 376 Q. And the information that Commissioner Callinan was 29 giving you, which subsequently you found out to be

1			incorrect, at the time he must have known it was	
2			incorrect?	
3		Α.	I believe that, yes.	
4	377	Q.	Yes. So, in reality, without questioning him in	
5			advance, you were a conduit for incorrect information	12:05
6			being provided in the public domain about Sergeant	
7			McCabe?	
8		Α.	I believe that that is correct now, yes.	
9			MR. McGARRY: Thank you.	
10		Α.	Not at all.	12:06
11				
12			MR. KEAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS:	
13				
14	378	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Good afternoon, Mr. Kean.	
15			Michael O'Higgins. I am counsel on behalf of	12:06
16			Superintendent Taylor, and I don't have very many	
17			questions for you, I hope. I hope to finish before	
18			lunch, which is at 12:30.	
19			You spoke to Commissioner Callinan	
20			CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, sorry, can I just ask, we	12:06
21			have to bear in mind nothing has been said about	
22			Superintendent Taylor in this evidence.	
23			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, if I could indicate	
24			to you what I respectfully contend may be relevant for	
25			my client.	12:06
26			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
27			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: My client's case in his	
28			statement to the Tribunal, in essence, says two things:	
29			one, I briefed against Sergeant McCabe, and two, I did	

1	that under the direction of Commissioner Callinan. And	
2	what I'm hoping is relevant and what I'm assuming is	
3	relevant in terms of any questions I have for Mr. Kean	
4	is, if Commissioner Callinan, if it is demonstrated	
5	that he is briefing, in the background, two	12:07
6	individuals, we would contend that is supportive of my	
7	client's position that he was being directed by	
8	Commissioner Callinan.	
9	CHAIRMAN: That makes sense, Mr. O'Higgins, if that is	
10	SO.	12:07
11	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: And I don't intend to conduct a	
12	lengthy cross-examination.	
13	CHAIRMAN: Well, half an hour is a long time. And as I	
14	said, absolutely nothing has been said now against	
15	Superintendent Taylor.	12:07
16	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, that is my only interest.	
17	CHAIRMAN: And indeed the question was asked by	
18	Mr. O'Higgins: "Were you contacted by the Garda Press	
19	Office?" "I don't think I was. I can't remember, but	
20	I don't think so."	12:07
21	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, Chairman	
22	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, just let me continue. "Were you	
23	briefed negatively by Superintendent Taylor in relation	
24	to Sergeant McCabe?" "No, I don't believe I was."	
25	And then the other thing is, I am taking from his	12:08
26	evidence that, as regards the Tusla matter, which I	
27	think is what was referred to, he didn't know about the	
28	Tusla matter, or indeed any allegation of sexual abuse.	
29	So how it is going to assist me. I don't know, but	

1			please carry on as concisely as you can.	
2			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: That is my only interest.	
3		Α.	Could I take insulin I need to take insulin. It's a	
4			two-second process	
5			CHAIRMAN: Wouldn't it be better maybe that you had	12:08
6			your lunch and come back	
7		Α.	No, no, it will only take	
8			CHAIRMAN: No, please, if you want to go outside, there	
9			is a door there and you can go out into the corridor.	
10				12:08
11			THE WITNESS THEN STOOD DOWN BRIEFLY.	
12				
13			CHAIRMAN: Thanks, Mr. Kean, you are sorted now.	
14		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
15	379	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Mr. Kean, when you spoke to	12:09
16			Commissioner Callinan and he briefed you and he	
17			indicated that he wanted the briefing that he had given	
18			you kept confidential, isn't that so?	
19		Α.	Yes, Mr. O'Higgins, yes.	
20	380	Q.	And you've indicated that you didn't find that	12:09
21			particularly surprising; information appears in the	
22			media all the time based on anonymous sources?	
23		Α.	That's correct, Mr. O'Higgins.	
24	381	Q.	And did you form a view as to why he wanted the matter	
25			kept confidential?	12:09
26			CHAIRMAN: But if he did form a view, again, I'm	
27			seriously not interested; it's what goes on in	
28			Mr. Kean's mind.	
29			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: All right.	

1 382 Q. When the programme completed, you've aired the concerns 2 that you felt might arise from Sergeant McCabe's

12:10

12:10

12:10

12:11

- 3 complaints, isn't that right?
- 4 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 5 383 Q. And you spoke to Commissioner Callinan?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 384 Q. And during the course of your calls with him, did the
- 8 issue arise as to whether his involvement with you
- 9 might become public?
- 10 A. I can't be sure. It wouldn't be beyond the realms of
- possibility that he might have said, you know, don't
- forget, please keep me out of this or keep my name away
- from it, but I can't remember anything specific.
- 14 385 Q. And did he say why he was anxious to remain in the
- 15 background?
- 16 A. I don't know, but I am not saying that happened, but
- 17 are we talking about the Sunday call? But he certainly
- 18 said it on the Saturday.
- 19 386 Q. Well, I am particularly interested in the Sunday call.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 387 Q. In the light of the fact that Sergeant McCabe had made
- a mistake and this might follow on, so to speak?
- 23 A. Yeah. Sergeant McCabe might have made a mistake?
- 24 388 Q. No, Sergeant McCabe had complained --
- 25 A. Yes, correct.
- 26 389 Q. -- there had been things said?
- 27 A. I am not sure and I can't recollect if the Commissioner
- again repeated, please keep my name out of it.
- 29 390 Q. Well, I am asking you a slightly different question.

			bid he express any concern. Took, I have been in the	
2			background now, it looks like I might come to the	
3			foreground and I don't want that? Did he say anything	
4			along those lines?	
5		Α.	No, no, no. He said that he stood by everything he	12:11
6			said and he didn't see any problem, or words to that	
7			effect, this will all wash itself out, or	
8	391	Q.	You used a sentence or two here, and bear in mind I am	
9			not a transcript, but you said it was obvious to you	
10			now that the Commissioner didn't want a link between	12:11
11			his office and you and, in hindsight, it's clear to you	
12			why that was. Why do you think the Commissioner didn't	
13			want a link between himself and your office?	
14		Α.	Well, I believe that, in hindsight, that, and this is	
15			just my own personal belief, that he used me to promote	12:12
16			a position that supported his stance in the matter and	
17			that which, in my opinion, was incorrect, and I ended	
18			up in the firing-line.	
19	392	Q.	And he had commenced that with you on the basis of	
20			keeping it confidential, and in his subsequent dealings	12:12
21			with you by having Superintendent Walsh attend your	
22			office and so forth, he wanted to assist you but he	
23			wanted to assist you in such a way that that assistance	
24			would not be apparent, isn't that so?	
25		Α.	Well, I believe that to be the case.	12:12
26	393	Q.	Do you remember at this stage, because it's just	
27			unclear to me from listening to your evidence,	
28			Superintendent Walsh attending at your office and	
29			reading out that note to you?	

- A. When I was reminded who it was, I do recollect that meeting taking place.
- 3 394 Q. So is your answer, therefore, that absent other people 4 who have gained knowledge from documents, you literally 5 have no memory of it, good, bad or indifferent?

12 · 14

- 6 well, no, I do have memory of it now when -- what Α. clicked was when they said Frank Walsh, and I 7 8 remember -- in fact, this was actually brought to my attention before I came in, and I said yes, I remember 9 Frank, actually now I remember this chap coming in, and 12:13 10 11 we did speak and he did help me and I believe that -- I 12 now believe, as I say, that I never got the note, but 13 it was definitely given to me, so I incorporated same 14 in my letter.
- 15 395 Q. Given that the contents of the note appear in your

 letter in slightly different sequence, you have
 paragraph 1 and then you have your letter and then you
 have paragraph 2, 3 and 4 --
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 396 Q. -- is it the case that you dictated into a dictaphone 12:14 what was said to you?
- 22 A. I would normally dictate into a dictaphone, yeah.
- 23 397 Q. So is it the case that the superintendent produced the 24 note, read it to you and you dictated it into your 25 dictaphone and handed the note back?
- A. There is a number of possibilities. That is one. He could have shown me the note and I could have dictated with the note in front of me. That is two. Number three is, he could have spoken to me as I am doing the

- letter. There is a number of possibilities. I can't remember which one.
- 3 398 Q. Well, again, I don't want to be wasting everyone's time 4 in examining theoretical possibilities, but it does 5 seem to me that this is an event which would be of 12:14 singular significance that would stand out for you for 6 a whole variety of reasons: you were under threat of 7 8 being sued, it was contact with the Commissioner, the Commissioner's private secretary was in your office. 9 Ι mean, would this not be something that would imprint 10 12:15 11 strongly on you?
- 12 Well, it clearly didn't. And, I mean, again I repeat Α. 13 that when my first meeting is at 6:45 in the morning 14 and I am going until 8:00 at night, this meeting could have taken five minutes. There is many other things 15 12:15 16 that happen in my day that should, and possibly don't, imprint on my mind. But what I am saying is, is that I 17 18 am obviously happy that somebody has appeared in front 19 of me from the Commissioner's office and is helping me draft a reply. So, as far as I am concerned, the 20 12:15 minute I get that information, draft my reply, next 21 22 meeting, I am moving on.
- 23 399 Q. Do you think it odd, as a solicitor and also as a
 24 potential defendant in a proceeding, that you were
 25 being handed material to assist you in your response,
 26 which was actually drafted in the first person,
 27 expressing your views on particular matters, did that
 28 strike you as an odd thing to occur?

29 A. No, not necessarily. I mean, I had asked for

1			assistance, and it didn't strike me as being odd. I	
2			mean, what I do, you know, what I what became clear	
3			to me was that the Commissioner didn't want to send any	
4			correspondence to me, that is why I had no letters, I	
5			had nothing in my file. There was no file opened, it	12:16
6			was only the file only started opening when I got	
7			the letter from Sergeant McCabe in my reply in my	
8			response. But to be fair, the way that it's drafted by	
9			the Commissioner, or whoever in his office did it, it	
10			was very helpful to me. I didn't you know, it	12:16
11			didn't strike me as being unusual.	
12	400	Q.	I think, Mr. Kean, it's probably the way I am putting	
13			the question. I accept in the peculiar or unusual	
14			circumstances it may not be unusual if you ask the	
15			Commissioner for information and he provided	12:16
16			information, but what I am suggesting an unusual	
17			feature is, in addition to providing information, he	
18			used your voice and used the word "I", and clearly did	
19			so with the intention that this would be inserted into	
20			your letter, and I am putting it to you that, as a	12:17
21			solicitor, that is a very unusual procedure?	
22		Α.	Well, again, my view on that is, it doesn't strike me	
23			as being unusual, but, yes, I mean, you know, in	
24			hindsight, maybe, but it didn't strike me as being	
25			unusual. I mean, I don't know who drafted it, I	12:17
26			assumed it was the Commissioner, it may have been	
27			somebody in his office, but I was happy to get some	
28			sort of input to help me in the draft response.	

29 401 Q. I mean, a solicitor might send papers to counsel with

Т			attendances and instructions and counsel might draft a	
2			letter, which would include the solicitor speaking in	
3			the first person as the solicitor's agent, that is a	
4			circumstance where you might sign a letter in the first	
5			person. But this particular circumstance, I am	12:17
6			suggesting to you, is very, very different, and perhaps	
7			unprecedented. Would you like to comment on that?	
8		Α.	I have no comment on that, no.	
9	402	Q.	You have no comment to make on that. Well, just in	
10			conclusion then, you made a statement to the Tribunal,	12:18
11			isn't that so?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	403	Q.	And you were anxious to impress, understandably, that	
14			you spoke to the Commissioner and you were careful to	
15			establish the facts as you saw them and you pressed him	12:18
16			three or four times to clarify, to make sure there was	
17			no mix-up, isn't that so?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	404	Q.	And again, I think you said on a number of occasions	
20			that the Commissioner was the ultimate authority, he	12:18
21			was beyond reproach, and I understand what you are	
22			saying when you are using that phraseology is that it	
23			wasn't only what he was saying, but the fact that it	
24			was coming from a person holding the rank of Garda	
25			Commissioner gave it extra weight?	12:18
26		Α.	I would agree with that.	
27	405	Q.	And as far as you were concerned, if a person was	
28			saying something that had with it the additional weight	
29			of emanating from a Garda Commissioner you were taking	

Τ			that without questioning it too much?	
2		Α.	That is fair to say.	
3	406	Q.	And although I know you have family connections with An	
4			Garda Síochána, that is your view as a person who isn't	
5			a guard in terms of the weight of what the Garda	12:19
6			Commissioner has to add to what he has got to say?	
7		Α.	Yeah, well, I think that's correct.	
8			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Thank you very much.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Just help me on, your point there,	
10			Mr. O'Higgins, is?	12:19
11			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, it's maybe somewhat of an	
12			obscure point, Judge, but we will be relying my own	
13			client will be relying on the relationship	
14			CHAIRMAN: I am anxious to understand it, yes.	
15			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: of the Garda Commissioner to	12:19
16			him, and I suppose I am just somewhat clumsily	
17			emphasising that Mr. Kean is a non-guard with a similar	
18			view, that is all.	
19			CHAIRMAN: So, in other words, what the Garda	
20			Commissioner says should go, is that the idea?	12:19
21			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Pretty much.	
22			CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you. Mr. Barton, I am	
23			sorry, are you for.	
24			MR. BARTON: For Mr. Brett, Chairman. I have no	
25			questions.	12:20
26			MR. CONNOLLY: Chairman, Peter Connolly, solicitor, on	
27			behalf of John Wilson. I just have two or three	
28			pertinent questions, if it's appropriate.	

Τ			MR. KEAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. CONNOLLY:	
2				
3	407	Q.	MR. CONNOLLY: Thanks, Mr. Kean. I just have a couple	
4			of short questions. I suppose the most obvious one is,	
5			was John Wilson mentioned in the briefing that you	12:20
6			received from the former Commissioner at the time?	
7		Α.	I believe he was, yes.	
8	408	Q.	Can you maybe elucidate in what context what was said	
9			to you with regard to former guard John Wilson?	
10		Α.	Very little, and whatever it was was quite	12:20
11			insignificant because I don't recollect it and	
12	409	Q.	Well, I suppose I would have to suggest to you it	
13			wasn't that insignificant in that you said in the on	
14			the show, when it aired on the 26th January, that it	
15			was, you used the plural, "they breached"?	12:20
16		Α.	Whistleblowers?	
17	410	Q.	Yes, they breached the Data Protection Act?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	411	Q.	So you'd agree with me that it was significant?	
20		Α.	Oh, sorry, I answered it wrong. What I meant to say	12:21
21			is, there was nothing specific to Mr. Wilson, other	
22			than what I have said already in the programme and in	
23			my affidavit. There was nothing outside that.	
24	412	Q.	Yes. And I think that's a matter of record and it's	
25			been opened before the Tribunal.	12:21
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	413	Q.	The last thing I want to ask you is, obviously you have	
28			given in evidence that Sergeant McCabe phoned the show	
29			at the time just as it was you were in mid-flow, or	

1			whatever, to point out that what was being said was	
2			untruthful, isn't that the case?	
3		Α.	Yeah, yeah. I'm not sure when he phoned.	
4	414	Q.	Yes.	
5		Α.	But I believe it was during the show, but I only found	12:21
6			out as I was leaving the studio.	
7	415	Q.	So you were worried about being sued afterwards?	
8		Α.	Well, my initial reaction is, I was worried that	
9			probably was on my mind, but I would not like to do	
10			somebody wrong, and I was worried that I had done	12:21
11			somebody wrong here and that the information I had	
12			given was incorrect, that worried me.	
13	416	Q.	Yes. And that sort of brings me to my final question.	
14			Did you look to any other sources of information in	
15			terms of verifying the information you'd been given,	12:22
16			because you seem to have been sold a pup in relation to	
17			what happened?	
18		Α.	Yes. Yeah, in hindsight I think you are probably	
19			correct. But as I say, I wasn't approaching this as an	
20			investigative journalist, I was simply a panelist	12:22
21			commenting, so I didn't look anywhere else and I didn't	
22			even know where to look other than	
23	417	Q.	You are a solicitor of 38 years standing, isn't that	
24			the case?	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:22
26	418	Q.	And you have referenced in your evidence about Minister	
27			Shatter, the commentary that was out in the open in	
28			October 2013?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

Т	419	Q.	Did you, for instance, inquire as you know, there	
2			was a report done by the Comptroller & Auditor General	
3			which had sort of said there were problems with	
4			cancellations of fixed charge penalty notices.	
5		Α.	Yes.	12:23
6	420	Q.	Did you look to any other sources of information?	
7		Α.	No, I didn't, no, no. This was the day before the	
8			programme. No, I didn't. It was a Saturday afternoon.	
9	421	Q.	You just went with the view you were being given?	
10		Α.	I went with the view that I believe was given, but, in	12:23
11			addition to that, was already in the public domain.	
12			MR. CONNOLLY: Thanks. I don't have any further	
13			questions, Chairman.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, just before I come to Mr. O'Higgins.	
15			It is Mr. O'Higgins? Yes. Is there any other question	12:23
16			on behalf of any other represented party here?	
17			Mr. O'Higgins, would you prefer to break until after	
18			lunch? It might be an opportune time.	
19			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
20			CHAIRMAN: We will take an hour now then, Mr. Kean.	12:23
21				
22			THE HEARING ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH	
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
29				

Т			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, AFTER LUNCH:	
2				
3			MR. BOUGHTON: Chairman, I am David Boughton, barrister	
4			representing Mr. Kean. I should have made an	
5			application for representation this morning. I won't	13:28
6			delay Mr. O'Higgins, but I might have a few very brief	
7			questions at the end.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, that makes perfect sense, that	
9			you should be represented. And secondly, yes, you	
10			would go last.	13:28
11				
12			MR. KEAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS:	
13				
14	422	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Good afternoon, Mr. Kean.	
15			Micheál O'Higgins is my name. I am counsel for certain	13:28
16			members of An Garda Síochána. I am just going to be	
17			asking you some questions, primarily on behalf of	
18			former Commissioner Callinan but also on behalf, to a	
19			much lesser extent, retired Chief Superintendent	
20			Diarmuid O'Sullivan and Superintendent Frank Walsh.	13:28
21		Α.	Thank you.	
22	423	Q.	So you are clear on my role?	
23		Α.	Pardon?	
24	424	Q.	You're clear on my role?	
25		Α.	I am clear.	13:29
26	425	Q.	Right. Now, can I just start with this issue as to the	
27			PAC itself, and I wonder if we could have could we	
28			have page 1348, please, of the materials up. You've	
29			told us Mr Kean that your nurnose in the sort of	

1			bank of information that you had in your mind in	
2			relation to the John O'Mahony report and the penalty	
3			points issue globally was pretty well information that	
4			was in the public domain, firstly, information that you	
5			had garnered from what Minister Shatter had said in the	13:29
6			Dáil and perhaps publicity surrounding that, isn't that	
7			so?	
8		Α.	Yes, and there may have been some other information	
9			that I read casually in newspapers, or whatever.	
10	426	Q.	Yes, understandably. Because this issue was in the	13:30
11			news at the time.	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	427	Q.	And also, of course, information that you learned in	
14			the telephone conversations with Martin Callinan in the	
15			period that has been under review in your evidence?	13:30
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	428	Q.	Now, in relation to and you're aware, of course,	
18			that, broadly speaking, the relevant chronology was, in	
19			terms of the PAC, Martin Callinan gave evidence before	
20			the PAC on the 23rd, the Thursday, and then you may not	13:30
21			have any familiarity with this, but the next day there	
22			the what became the controversial meeting in the car	
23			park on the 24th, of Bewley's Hotel, on the 24th	
24			January 2014, and in the news at the time there was a	
25			certain degree of flow-back from the former	13:30
26			Commissioner's comment, the use of the adjective	
27			"disgusting" in relation to the methods being used by	
28			the whistleblowers, all right. And that was	
29			interpreted as something that was said in the direction	

1 of the whistleblowers, and there was a controversy 2 surrounding that; were you, broadly speaking, aware of 3 that? Broadly speaking, yes. 4 Α. 5 429 All right. Well, now, we're looking then at page 1348, 13:31 Q. 6 and this is a part of the transcript from the PAC, and 7 we needn't call it up on the screen, but the context is 8 that Deputy Deasy, from whom the Tribunal heard yesterday or the day before yesterday, had asked Martin 9 Callinan a question about his views on how the 10 13:31 11 committee had been doing its business in terms of 12 looking into the PAC and the proposal to call Sergeant 13 McCabe, and Martin Callinan was giving his views. 14 this is the context of the bit I'm just going to ask 15 you to consider. So it's on page 1348 and it says the 13:31 16 following, and this is Martin Callinan speaking: 17 18 "I should preface my remarks by indicating that one of 19 the people who is now engaged in this so-called whistleblowing exercise is a person who is a serving 20 13:32 member of An Garda Síochána, as I understand it. 21 22 that is the case, then he or she is subject to the 23 disciplinary regulations, if it is the case that at any 24 time, at any place, anywhere, a member of An Garda 25 Síochána can step outside the ordinary standards 13:32 26 expected of that member. If that is the case, then I 27 would have to consider whether I would have to access 28 to the disciplinary regulations to deal with that

I'm not for a moment suggesting that I would go

29

issue.

down that road of exercising discipline in this particular case, but it was certainly something on which I would have to reserve my position. asked in general terms whether it's appropriate for a member of An Garda Síochána to use this Committee as a 13:32 platform for exercising whatever it is he or she wishes to exercise, and make unsubstantiated allegations or provide sensitive personal data to a third party, such as this Committee, then I will have to seriously consider my position and their position. 13:32 already indicated to the Chairman --" that is the Chairman of the PAC "-- that I have very serious concerns about the information, the data that has been passed on to the Committee. I am not aware of what is contained in that data, but I can also presume it from 13:33 the response of the Committee. I have no issue with the Committee taking legal advice in deciding how best to do its business, but it is the case that I have also taken legal advice and I am told that, as we speak, I am in breach of the Data Protection Act and that it is 13:33 possible that the person who supplied that information is in breach of the Data Protection Act. This is clearly a matter on which I will need to take action. I will reserve my position with regard to how I will deal with that. If I am asked in a general sense 13:33 whether I would be in favour of a member of the Garda Síochána coming in here and using this forum, this Committee to expose material in the fashion in which it has been exposed or to make allegations it hasn't

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Т			substantiated, I think that is fundamentally wrong.	
2				
3			And that was the position that he was offering. And I	
4			think you're aware that that issue is capable of being	
5			argued legitimately either side of the issue, isn't	13:33
6			that right? In other words, from Martin Callinan's	
7			perspective, and it was only his perspective, well that	
8			was his opinion.	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	430	Q.	Isn't that fair?	13:34
11		Α.	It seems so, yeah.	
12	431	Q.	Right. And I'm not, of course, inviting you to say who	
13			has the side of right in that issue between Sergeant	
14			McCabe and Martin Callinan, but undoubtedly, I think	
15			you'd agree with me, there were two points of view that	13:34
16			were almost diametrically opposed on the whole issue	
17			surrounding how the data was dealt with?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	432	Q.	Right. And just if we read on further, Deputy Deasy,	
20			who was asking the question, came back and asked:	13:34
21				
22			"Deputy John Deasy: The Commissioner is also making	
23			the case that it is not possible to make a	
24			comprehensive case because not all the information is	
25			available, is that correct?"	13:34
26				
27			And then Martin Callinan is noted to have said the	
28			following:	
29				

"If I may put it this way, I do not know what the Committee has at its disposal. Certainly, if it is anything like the level and extent of the knowledge that the assistant commissioner had at his disposal about the allegations made, if that mirrors what the 13:35 assistant commissioner was dealing with, clearly it would be impossible to make a judgment. That was part of my concern which I articulated in the letter to the Chairman. For instance, if the information is anonymous and if this Committee were to rely on 13:35 providing statistics in a public forum, then we are in a very rocky place, unless these matters can be explored and properly teased out. I have indicated to the Committee that there were issues within the system that needed to be corrected and this has been done. 13:35 However, I emphasise it is very important that, as a disciplined force, we do not allow a situation to occur in which 13,000 members of An Garda Síochána start making complaints about one another and investigating one another. We have to exercise some form of control. It is important that, as Commissioner, I have control and authority over the force. How can I manage the force unless I have access to that type of control? The organisation could not perform its policing or security remits if I and my officers were not in a 13:35 position to exercise that type of control? I do not want it to be said that I am considering disciplinary action with regard to these people. I have given it very careful consideration and I will continue to do

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

so. However, there may come a point at which I will
have to seriously consider this matter for all the
reasons I've indicated. I cannot allow a situation to
continue where information is being bandied around. I
realise people are relying on a certain section of the
law as an authority."

7

8

9

And then over the page, the photocopying seems to have clipped a bit out, but he concludes by saying:

13:36

10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

"Wrongdoing by any member of An Garda Síochána will not be tolerated by me or by any member of my office. Committee can take that as a given. There is a difference between reporting wrongdoing and consistently putting about large volumes of material. 13:36 These are the parameters I must consider. When I became aware of it, I issued a very clear direction to the two members involved. We had a discussion with Deputy McDonald on the last occasion I was before the Committee as to when I became aware of the identities 13:36 of these people and what they were saying. carefully checked my records since then. In December, following on from the information that the required member of the -- sorry, that the retired member of the force and a serving member of sergeant were working 13:37 together to provide information and material for the elective representative, I took advice and I was

29

advised that this was wrong."

1			And again, broadly speaking, that was the perspective	
2			of Martin Callinan, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	Well, I assume so.	
4	433	Q.	All right.	
5		Α.	You can see it.	13:37
6	434	Q.	Well, just to fill that out slightly further, and I	
7			appreciate that it may not be ultimately the	
8			disposition or desire of the Tribunal to in any sense	
9			referee this issue about the data breaches, if they	
10			were data breaches, and this issue about the rights or	13:37
11			wrongs of a serving member going on the PAC, but, in	
12			that context, could I ask perhaps if page 1916 might be	
13			brought up, which is part of the statement of John	
14			O'Mahony, who is the author of the internal Garda	
15			investigation into the penalty points issue. If	13:38
16			Mr. Kavanagh might scroll down a little bit because I	
17			just want to bring you to the relevant portion. It	
18			starts "I was aware". Yes:	
19				
20			"I was aware that on the 14th December"	13:38
21				
22			So this now, just to set this in context for you,	
23			Mr. Kean, this is a part of the statement of John	
24			O'Mahony, now retired, who carried out the	
25			investigation, and he says the following:	13:38
26				
27			"I was aware that on the 14th December 2012 the	
28			then-Commissioner Callinan issued a direction to	
29			Sergeant Maurice McCabe and to John Wilson to desist	

from accessing Pulse and from disclosing to third parties sensitive personal data regarding the cancellation of FCNs (fixed charge notices) by members of An Garda Síochána. Sergeant McCabe was informed of this direction firstly by his chief superintendent on 13:38 the same date. Garda Wilson was informed by his district officer on the same date. The Commissioner's direction further informed both members that 'if they had any further concerns, and without prejudice to their rights under the confidential reporting 13:39 mechanism, such matters should be brought to the attention of Assistant Commissioner John O'Mahony, Crime and Security, who willfully investigate those concerns'. My examination was in full process at this time. 13:39

16

17

18

19

20

21

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

The Commissioner issued a second directive on 27th November 2012, directing both members to 'desist searching Pulse and dissemination to third parties of sensitive personal data and restricting access to Pulse 13:39 until further notice'.

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Garda Wilson was informed of this direction on the same date by the district officer Monaghan. Efforts to communicate this directive to Sergeant McCabe failed due to his unavailability and he reported sick on the 31st December 2012. He returned off sick leave on the 31st March 2013. On the 1st April 2013, the second directive from the Commissioner was communicated to him

13:39

1	by his district officer. The Commissioner's direction	
2	of the 27th November 2012 did not include reference to	
3	my examination. However, in communicating this	
4	direction, I believe that his superintendent"	
5		13:40
6	I will pause there. I understand that is a	
7	Superintendent Curran, from whom a statement, I think,	
8	is available. Sorry, I've lost my place there.	
9		
LO	" I believe that his superintendent did inform	13:40
L1	Sergeant McCabe that if he had any further issues, he	
L2	should contact me as I had been appointed by the	
L3	Commissioner to examine the anonymous allegations made	
L4	concerning the operation of the FCPS. Neither Sergeant	
L5	McCabe nor Garda Wilson contacted me as a direct result	13:40
L6	of these directives. I concluded my examination the	
L7	last week of March 2013 and I finalised my report on or	
L8	about the 27th March 2013. I forwarded my report with	
L9	appendices to the Commissioner on the 28th March 2013.	
20	It subsequently became public knowledge that my report	13:40
21	had been forwarded to the Minister on the 28th March	
22	2013. While the report had been forwarded on this	
23	date, it had not been published. The report was, in	
24	fact, published on the 15th May 2015. It would appear	
25	that the Tribunal may already have a copy of my final	13:41
26	report, but, if it does not, a copy can be furnished on	
27	request."	
28		

And then he says the following in relation to the

contact that he personally had, it seems, with Sergeant McCabe:

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1

2

"Sergeant McCabe contacted my office by phone on the 23rd April 2013. I missed his call but reverted to him 13:41 approximately an hour and a half later. Detective Sergeant Ger Mealy, my personal assistant at the time, was present in the office during the call. Sergeant McCabe introduced himself to me as the person who had made the original complaints regarding fixed charge 13 · 41 penalties. This was, in fact, the first time that I formally became aware of the identity of the anonymous Sergeant McCabe wanted to know why he had not author. been interviewed by my inquiry team. He stated that he was aware that I had his list of allegations. 13:41 informed him that it was my understanding that the Commissioner had informed him the previous December that if he had any concerns he should contact me. stated that this was not true and that his chief superintendent told him he had to contact me before 13:41 contacting anyone else. I informed him this was not my understanding of what he had been told. Commissioner's direction does not make any reference to contacting anyone else."

2425

26

27

28

29

And then it goes on a little bit further, but we might scroll over - and I'm sure everybody else can read out a portion they feel is necessary - to the second-last paragraph of the same page, of the next page, page

13 · 42

1	1918. That's it there, thank you. And it commences
2	sorry, the portion that I think may be relevant reads
3	as follows:
4	
5	"While Sergeant McCabe did not wish to engage with my 13:42
6	examination, he did engage with An Garda Síochána
7	subsequently in relation to the matters I had examined.
8	On the 4th June 2013, he made a complaint against three
9	named officers under the Garda anti-fraud policy in
10	respect of 16 individualised FCN terminations conducted 13:42
11	by three authorised members. The content of these
12	allegations is similar to those made by the anonymous
13	author in issue. These complaints were investigated by
14	a chief superintendent, who forwarded an investigation
15	file for consideration to the office of the DPP on the $_{13:42}$
16	22nd November 2013. I'm aware that the DPP has
17	directed in these cases that there was to be no
18	prosecutions.
19	
20	In the course of my examination, no third party 13:43
21	approached me or any member of my team with any
22	information of relevance to the examination. My
23	examination would naturally have incorporated any such
24	approach. Notwithstanding that my final report had
25	already been submitted at the time, if Sergeant Maurice 13:45
26	McCabe had provided me with any further additional

material information to the Commissioner."

27

28

29

material or information, I would have forwarded such

1 And that statement is signed John O'Mahony, Assistant 2 Commissioner, dated 7th April 2017. CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, there is a question arising 3 out of that, I appreciate it, because otherwise we will 4 5 lose the train of thought, I suppose, in a way. 13:43 6 MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sorry, Judge, yes. 7 435 So, sorry, now, for reading that long tranche that you Q. 8 may not be familiar with. That is no problem. 9 Α. But really, the point I'm wishing to ask you to deal 10 436 Ο. 13 · 44 11 with is this: Sergeant McCabe has a particular view on 12 the issue as to whether it is or is not correct as to 13 whether he did participate or take up an opportunity of 14 participating in the O'Mahony investigation, or, as it 15 might be put, as to whether he failed to do so, all 13:44 16 right? He has a view on that. I want to ask you, would you agree with me, from your contacts with the 17 18 Commissioner, is it fair to say that Martin Callinan, 19 former Commissioner, had, in his mind at any rate, a 20 very clear view in relation to the question as to 13:44

and his view was that he had failed to do so?

21

22

23

25

29

Α.

Yes.

26 437 Q. Right. And that was a view genuinely held by him,
27 would that be fair? You wouldn't dispute that notion?
28 A. Well, that's not a question for me to answer. I don't

A. Well, that's not a question for me to answer. I don't know. But, I mean, he certainly was very clear in his

whether Sergeant McCabe had availed of an opportunity

to speak to Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony for the

purpose of the report? He had a clear view on that,

13 · 45

Т			view to me.	
2	438	Q.	Yes.	
3		Α.	I'm assuming he believed what he was saying. But I	
4			don't know in hindsight, I have no idea. At the time I	
5			believed him.	13:45
6	439	Q.	Yes. Well, not only that, but I'm suggesting to you,	
7			and this is why I read out the portion from the Dáil	
8			transcript of the PAC meeting, insofar as he conveyed	
9			to you material about the O'Mahony investigation and	
10			his views on whether or not there had been	13:45
11			participation or cooperation with that, he was really	
12			doing no more than he had already done in, and that he	
13			subsequently did on the public record, in terms of what	
14			he told the PAC, he was fundamentally against Sergeant	
15			McCabe appearing before the PAC and he was	13:46
16			fundamentally against the release of sensitive personal	
17			information belonging to citizens, isn't that fair?	
18		Α.	Yeah, that would seem to be correct, having seen this,	
19			yeah.	
20	440	Q.	Right. Now, can I ask you then in terms of the means	13:46
21			by which you made contact with An Garda Síochána. As	
22			you know, I also act for Diarmuid O'Sullivan, retired	
23			Chief Superintendent Diarmuid O'Sullivan, and my	
24			understanding from Diarmuid O'Sullivan, and I	
25			appreciate, I think you've indicated you regard him as	13:46
26			a very reliable person, who is distinguished and who I	

27

28

29

think in the past, and we needn't go into any private

business, in relation to your own role and I think in

details, but you had certain inquiries in relation to a

- 1 relation to a house burglary, and you were helped out
- 2 by the guards in relation to that?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 441 Q. And I think it was in that context that you came to
- 5 have an acquaintance with Chief Superintendent
- 6 0'Sullivan?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- 8 442 Q. Would it be fair, and I don't mean this pejoratively in

13 · 47

13:47

13:47

- any sense, but just judging by your disposition, you're
- a person who is well able to talk, you're an
- 11 accomplished speaker and you are an outgoing
- 12 personality.
- 13 A. Thank you very much.
- 14 443 Q. All right.
- 15 A. I appreciate that.
- 16 444 Q. Well, the reason I'm mentioning that, apart from the
- 17 general desire to get a witness on side, is that it's
- relevant to your contacts, if I may put it this way?
- 19 A. Yeah.
- 20 445 Q. You're somebody who is respectful and you will chat
- with somebody about affairs of the day, even if it's
- 22 the case that you've a specific purpose for a call, you
- 23 might also --
- 24 A. Yeah.
- 25 446 Q. -- not immediately get to the point, would that be fair 13:47
- and you've --
- 27 A. I'm long-winded?
- 28 447 Q. Well, I wouldn't use that expression, but --
- A. Well, no, you could be correct. I mean, you know, I'm

- lucky that I have people I can call and get information from, from time to time.
- 3 448 Q. Right.
- 4 A. And, you know, I would be personable, I would like to
- get on with them and I would like to be very open and

13 · 48

13:48

13:48

13 · 48

- 6 transparent with them. There's no question, I would
- 7 never ask somebody for information under false
- 8 pretences, or anything like that, no. But I would be
- 9 outgoing.
- 10 449 Q. And I'm not suggesting you did that at all.
- 11 A. No, no.
- 12 450 Q. And is it possible then in the context of your
- discussions with Diarmuid O'Sullivan and also I think
- perhaps with Martin Callinan, you were also -- also
- chatting over the telephone about things, about social
- 16 matters --
- 17 A. Absolutely.
- 18 451 Q. -- wholly unrelated to --
- 19 A. Absolutely. I mean, there's no question about that. I
- 20 mean, I wouldn't start with -- I wouldn't have got
- 21 straight to the point; I would have talked about many
- issues I couldn't think of offhand, you know, that
- 23 wouldn't be related to this particular topic.
- 24 452 Q. Indeed. So, insofar as there's been mention made that
- if one tots up the total number of minutes of the
- 26 telephone call --
- 27 A. Oh!
- 28 453 Q. -- that wouldn't be to suggest that the total number of
- 29 minutes were talking about fixed charge penalties?

- A. Oh, not at all, no, no. We could have been talking
 about anything: my father, my late uncles, holidays,
 the charity event in cork, which is something I support
 every year, as a Garda Síochána outing --
- 5 454 Q. Yes.
- A. -- the lunch. You know, and I tend to do with the radio most weeks on some channel or another. So topics would range. It wouldn't have been a call to say, can I ask you something, thank you, good luck, good-bye.
- 10 No.
- 11 455 Well, in relation to Diarmuid O'Sullivan then, his Q. 12 recollection, and in fairness I don't want to suggest 13 to you that he has a verbatim recollection, he has a 14 limited recollection of the calls, but he believes you 15 may have mentioned, in the course of your chats with 13:49 16 him, that you had met Commissioner Callinan, and I 17 think you may have instanced the event in cork, the
- 19 A. Yeah, that could well be correct.

charity event?

20 456 Q. Is that a possibility?

18

- 21 A. That is a strong possibility, yeah.
- 22 457 Q. All right. And my understanding of matters is that the 23 gist of your request of Diarmuid O'Sullivan was to 24 effectively ask his assistance in ascertaining to whom 25 you might speak to enable you, I don't know, get more 26 information in relation to the O'Mahony report and the

13:49

13:50

- 27 fixed charge penalties?
- 28 A. I think that is a strong possibility, yeah.
- 29 458 Q. Right. And that was really the long and the short of

Diarmuid O'Sullivan's role in matters? 1 2 I believe so, yeah. Α. 3 459 0. Right. Moving then to Commissioner Callinan, it is 4 important, I need to put one or two matters to you now, 5 Mr. Kean. 13:50 6 No problem. Α. 7 And give you an opportunity to deal with it. 460 Q. 8 No problem. Α. The first of them is, his position is that when you 9 461 Q. made contact with him, and I think you do fairly accept 13:51 10 11 it was you who contacted An Garda Síochána rather than 12 the other way round? 13 Absolutely correct. Α. 14 462 Q. Right. And his understanding of matters and 15 recollection is that your original request was to seek 13:51 16 information relating to the O'Mahony investigation, as 17 it had been published, and, in that context, 18 Commissioner Callinan was comfortable providing you 19 with such information as he had relating to that, it 20 was a published report; you wouldn't disagree with 13:51 that? 21 22 I wouldn't disagree with that. I think it is probably Α. 23 important just to point out that when I made contact 24 with him, I would certainly initially have outlined to 25 him why I was wanting to talk to him and that I was 13:51 26 doing the programme on Sunday and that Sergeant 27 McCabe's scenario and Sergeant Wilson were part of this

discussion.

Yes.

28

29

463

Q.

1		Α.	So it wasn't that I just rang up to inquire about the	
2			O'Mahony investigation without explaining that. So I	
3			think it's just fair to point that out.	
4	464	Q.	I'm not suggesting to you for a moment that you pulled	
5			off a trick, or anything like that.	13:5
6		Α.	Okay, sorry.	
7	465	Q.	Nobody is saying that at all. So now the one thing I	
8			do want to have to confront you with, if you don't	
9			mind	
10		Α.	No problem.	13:5
11	466	Q.	or make clear to you, there is a point of issue	
12			difference: Martin Callinan indicates that, in fact,	
13			he didn't tell you not to say "don't mention my name",	
14			his position on that, so that you have an opportunity	
15			to deal with it, is that, in fact, that issue as to	13:5
16			whether you did or didn't or should or shouldn't have	
17			mentioned his name never, in fact, arose because he was	
18			only speaking about facts that he had that he felt were	

22 A. No, that is simply incorrect.

is that a possibility?

23 467 Q. All right. Well, you see, I want to suggest to you
24 that, and again give you an opportunity to deal with
25 it, if you're going to go on the radio, as you do from
26 time to time, being a person who has a wide variety of
27 interests and are invited on radio programmes quite a
28 bit, would that be fair?

in the public domain, and there was no specific raising

of "don't mention my name" or anything of that nature, 13:52

13:53

29 A. Absolutely, yes.

19

20

If, as you did on this occasion, prior to going on a 1 468 Q. 2 radio programme, you want to make sure that you have 3 some degree of briefing information, however light, however brief and you avail of -- would it be fair to 4 5 say your general tendency, if you have a phone number, 13:53 6 avail of it, if needs be go to the top, if it means you 7 improve your bank of knowledge? 8 Yeah, well, I always like to check --Α. 9 469 Yes. Q. -- double-check, and that's what I did here. 10 Α. 13:53 11 470 Yes. Q. 12 I wanted to double-check. But can I tell you, which Α. 13 might help you in getting to the point, I would have 14 dearly loved to have said on that show that this 15 information was given to me by the Commissioner. 13:54 16 471 Yes. Q. 17 I would be very happy to say, I am very pleased to say Α. 18 that I had a conversation with the Commissioner 19 yesterday and he told me the following: McCabe didn't cooperate, Sergeant McCabe was 20 13:54 21 obstructive, Sergeant McCabe was difficult. I would 22 have loved that opportunity. 23 well, you see, we have to agree to differ on 472 Right. Q. 24 But I'm suggesting to you that the last thing 25 you might do on a radio programme would be to sort of 13:54 26 blurt out who your particular source is in any piece of 27 information, because that'd mean your information-flow 28 would simply dry up, and the next radio programme you

went on, you wouldn't have any information because

nobody would speak to you, I think is that a fair point?

- well, that's not the way I'd look at it, because for a 3 Α. number of reasons. First of all, I didn't foresee that 4 5 I would be ringing the Commissioner again. I'm not --13:54 6 as I say, I'm not an investigative journalist. 7 the radio every couple of weeks, I do the TV every 8 couple of weeks, a lot of that is social, or my commentary in relation to general matters. It's not 9 as -- you know, it might not -- I didn't foresee myself 13:55 10 11 coming back and doing another programme and Sergeant McCabe or Garda Wilson, so I didn't see that. 12 mean, if, for example, Martin Callinan hadn't said it, 13 14 not to mention his name, I think I would have said, do 15 you mind if I mention your name? And if he had said 13:55 16 yes, well, then, why would my sources dry up, because 17 he would have given me permission? But he specifically 18 told me that, you know, don't say we spoke or don't say 19 we had a chat or don't say I gave you information. That is very clear in my mind. 20 13:55
- I wish to suggest to you respectfully, I suggest to you 21 473 Q. 22 that you are mistaken in relation to that and that 23 simply didn't arise in the conversation. 24 view you formed, you shouldn't use his name, and you 25 didn't use his name, but I'm suggesting to you that was 13:55 a decision you took yourself and it simply didn't arise 26 27 in your conversation, that is my instruction.
- A. Well, you know, I don't know how to answer that, other than to say to you that I would have loved to have

1 mentioned on the programme - in fact, I would have 2 loved to have, talking to Sergeant McCabe after the programme and say, by the say, I'm sorry if there's 3 something wrong here but I got this information from 4 5 the Commissioner. That is simply not true. I mean, I 13:56 would have loved to have said on the show that this 6 7 information was given to me and I would love to have 8 been able to clarify that I spoke to the Commissioner one-on-one, me on him, and he told me this, and 9 therefore this is why we're in the situation. 10 13:56 11 couldn't say that at that time because I respected his 12 views and, for that reason, I didn't mention his name. 13 474 Now, staying now with Martin Callinan for a Q. Yes. 14 moment. Is it possible altogether that, in fact -- is 15 it possible altogether that Diarmuid O'Sullivan is 13:56 16 something of a red herring altogether, because, in 17 fact, and I'm not sure this was put to you, but my 18 understanding of matters, in fact, you may have had 19 contact with Mr. Taylor, with Superintendent Taylor, is 20 that right, and conveyed --13:56 I said already, I can't remember. I'm not denying I 21 Α. 22 did, I just can't remember if I spoke to Inspector 23 Taylor. 24 All right. Would you agree with me that, on foot of 475 Q. 25 whatever approach you had made to David Taylor, the 13:57 26 Commissioner telephoned you and you had a general 27 conversation of about 15 minutes or so, that appears to be in accordance with the records, would that be right? 28 well, I think the records confirm that. 29

Α.

1	476	Q.	Right.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Does it? I mean, I'm sorry, I'm not saying	
3			it doesn't, Mr. O'Higgins, I am just genuinely	
4			interested. Is there a record of a telephone	
5			conversation between David Taylor and Mr. Kean?	13:57
6			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sorry, no, this is excuse	
7			me, Chairman, between Martin Callinan and this witness,	
8			and Mr. Kean.	
9			CHAIRMAN: I'm not following then, please excuse me,	
10			but I don't understand. I thought the import of it was	13:57
11			that either David Taylor, acting as Garda Press	
12			Officer, as he was then, rang Mr. Kean or Mr. Kean rang	
13			David Taylor as Garda Press Officer, and the nature of	
14			the query was such that he had to be passed on, that is	
15			what I was taking from it. I may be wrong in taking	13:58
16			that, but is that what you are saying?	
17			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes, what I'm saying, Chairman,	
18			is that Superintendent Taylor mentioned to Martin	
19			Callinan, to my client, Martin Callinan, that Mr. Kean	
20			would wish to speak with him in relation to the fixed	13:58
21			charge penalty notice investigation.	
22			CHAIRMAN: All right. Mr. O'Higgins, I don't know is	
23			that part of your instructions?	
24			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: We're just checking on it,	
25			Judge. It's a very specific thing. I proceeded on the	13:58
26			basis that my client wasn't in the loop, but we will	
27			come back to it before the witness goes.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, it's new, so we will come back to it.	
29			And I take it, as you didn't ask the question,	

1	Mr. O'Higgins, as well, that Superintendent Taylor is	
2	not saying that he ever briefed Gerald Kean negatively	
3	in any way as to sex abuse or as to untrustworthiness	
4	or anything?	
5	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: That is certainly we would 13:	: 59
6	like to know and assist the Tribunal as to whether we	
7	are even a link on the chain.	
8	CHAIRMAN: But certainly, Mr. O'Higgins, your client's	
9	case, that is to say Commissioner Callinan's case, is,	
10	that the query came to Diarmuid O'Sullivan in some way 13:	: 59
11	through the Press Office and David Taylor and that it	
12	was mentioned in the conversation between him and	
13	Mr. Kean that he had already spoken to David Taylor,	
14	that is to say Mr. Kean had spoken to David Taylor; is	
15	that the position?	: 59
16	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: No, that the as I understand	
17	it, the direction of it was that Commissioner Callinan	
18	spoke with Superintendent David Taylor on Saturday the	
19	25th January, and Superintendent Taylor mentioned to	
20	mentioned that the witness, Mr. Kean, wished to speak	: 59
21	with Commissioner Callinan in relation to the fixed	
22	charge penalty notices investigation.	
23	MR. McGUINNESS: That is not in any of the statements.	
24	CHAIRMAN: Well, it may not be in anybody's statement,	
25	but if it is the instructions, I would still like to	: 00
26	find out, so	
27	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
28	CHAIRMAN: And forgive me if I am getting it wrong	
29	because I'm hearing it for the first time, the	

1		conversation was between who and who? Just start out	
2		with	
3		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Between Martin Callinan and	
4		David Taylor.	
5		CHAIRMAN: Right. And then prior to that there had	14:00
6		been a conversation between David Taylor and Gerald	
7		Kean?	
8		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Well, we don't know that, but I	
9		think it can be inferred from that that there was. We	
10		don't know what was said in that, but	14:00
11		CHAIRMAN: Well, certainly David Taylor was saying,	
12		look, Gerald Kean has been on to me to talk about the	
13		fixed charge penalty notices?	
14		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Well, I don't know if he had	
15		been on to the office, but certainly David Taylor	14:00
16		relayed my instructions are, Superintendent David	
17		Taylor relayed to Commissioner Callinan that Mr. Kean	
18		was looking to speak to him in relation to the	
19		investigation.	
20		CHAIRMAN: well, the ordinary way of knowing that would	14:00
21		be if Mr. Kean had rung up the Press Office.	
22		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Quite possibly.	
23		CHAIRMAN: I mean, they weren't meeting over coffee, I	
24		presume. I mean, did you perhaps ring the Garda Press	
25		Office?	14:01
26	Α.	I can't remember, Mr. Chairman.	
27		CHAIRMAN: Would you have rung the Garda Press Office	
28		before?	
29	Α.	Em, no. They would have rang me years ago. But I	

1		don't remember ringing them, no. I wouldn't have their	
2		number readily available.	
3		CHAIRMAN: And was Superintendent Taylor a person you	
4		would speak to in the sense	
5	Α.	No, not nobody I would know, no.	14:01
6		CHAIRMAN: No, I mean beyond if you met him at a	
7		reception or something?	
8	Α.	I wouldn't know him, no. I mean, if I met him, I don't	
9		remember, unlike Diarmuid O'Sullivan, who I would know.	
10		CHAIRMAN: Diarmuid O'Sullivan, you had a burglary, I	14:01
11		understand all of that.	
12	Α.	Yeah.	
13		CHAIRMAN: But connection with David Taylor, you had no	
14		connection?	
15	Α.	I don't recollect any connection at all.	14:01
16		CHAIRMAN: But you realise what is being put to you is	
17		this: that David Taylor had rung the Commissioner to	
18		say you were interested in speaking about fixed charge	
19		penalty notices.	
20	Α.	That may be the case, but I'm not sure that information	14:01
21		came from me.	
22		CHAIRMAN: Yes. You don't know how that might have	
23		come about?	
24	Α.	I don't know. I mean, you know, if David Taylor says I	
25		rang him, then I'm happy to accept that, but I do not	14:02
26		remember that. I remember ringing Diarmuid O'Sullivan	
27		and I remember saying to Diarmuid, you know, who should	
28		I go to to clarify this and that I'd met the	
29		Commissioner, would he be the man.	

1			CHAIRMAN: And you're saying that basically because you	
2			had dealings with him in the past of a business and	
3			also professional variety	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5			CHAIRMAN: vis-à-vis crimes that had been committed	14:02
6			against you	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8			CHAIRMAN: your normal course would have been, who	
9			do I need to speak to in the Gardaí? Diarmuid	
10			O'Sullivan is the person who would come to your mind?	14:02
11		Α.	Absolutely correct.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Not David Taylor?	
13		Α.	No, no, not at all.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Okay. But you are not ruling it out?	
15		Α.	I'm not ruling it out, no, no.	14:02
16			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Can I just indicate, Chairman?	
17			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: This is an issue that has taken	
19			us slightly by surprise, but I can confirm my solicitor	
20			is contacting my client now, that Mr. Kean was in	14:02
21			contact with him on this issue. When I have further	
22			instructions, we will inform the Tribunal. My	
23			solicitor is contacting the client now.	
24			CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, it is all new. But	
25			anyway, we will carry on.	14:02
26	477	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: And I'm going to ask you then	
27			in relation to the contact that you had with Martin	
28			Callinan on foot of that, and would you agree with me	
29			that there was a general conversation and you	

Т			mentioned, I think you have already indicated, that you	
2			were invited on or you were waiting to hear whether you	
3			would be featuring on the Marian Finucane programme on	
4			the Sunday, and that didn't last terribly long, and the	
5			records indicate there was a text message sent	14:03
6			subsequently, and my client's understanding of matters	
7			is that that would have indicated you and he could	
8			speak later?	
9		Α.	Right.	
10	478	Q.	So you, in other words, had you had introduced in a	14:03
11			general sense your purpose, you were going to go on the	
12			Marian Finucane programme and that is why you were	
13			looking for information?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	479	Q.	And my understanding of matters is that you rang back	14:03
16			later that day and he was not in a position to deal	
17			with you, and then he telephoned you later on, I think	
18			around the five o'clock mark, and again there was	
19			general conversation about charity work, social	
20			engagements and some degree of conversation about	14:04
21			acquaintances that were mutual to two of you in the	
22			Cork area. Would you differ with any of that?	
23		Α.	No. Yeah, as long as it's not being suggested that's	
24			all we spoke about.	
25	480	Q.	Not at all, no?	14:04
26		Α.	I have no doubt whatsoever that those conversations	
27			went on.	
28	481	Q.	I will bring it on to the relevant portions.	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 482 Q. I'm suggesting to you that you asked Commissioner
- 2 Callinan about the O'Mahony investigation, and he
- provided you with details in relation to that, because,
- 4 as he says, it was a public document, and this was
- 5 mostly around the cancellation process, do you recall

14 · 04

14:05

14:05

14 . 05

- 6 any of that?
- 7 A. Yeah, I'm reasonably confident that I didn't
- 8 specifically refer to the -- I think the first question
- 9 I would have said would have been, listen, I'm going on
- this programme, there seems to be suggestions that
- 11 Sergeant McCabe is not cooperating with the internal
- investigations, is that correct? I mean, what is the
- position? What is happening here? That's the sort of
- 14 question -- I'm not sure I went specifically into the
- 15 O'Mahony Tribunal. I kept as at a very generic
- question, because, for all I knew, there might have
- been other investigations going on other than O'Mahony
- 18 which I didn't know, so I didn't have that information.
- 19 So my question would have been very generic, in that is
- 20 Sergeant McCabe not cooperating with investigations,
- 21 internal investigations?
- 22 483 Q. It might help you, Mr. Kean, if I outline what my
- 23 instructions are in relation to --
- 24 A. Right.
- 25 484 Q. -- my client's recollection of the conversation.
- 26 A. Okay.
- 27 485 Q. And then you can say if you agree or disagree.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 486 Q. So my client indicates that you asked him about -- in a

1			general way about issues that had been raised at the	
2			PAC around the data protection and giving directions to	
3			whistleblowers, and so on. Do you recall that?	
4		Α.	No, I don't recall asking him specifically. I mean,	
5			I'm going back to this, and I hope I'm not being	14:06
6			obstructive here, I'm quite confident that when I	
7			started speaking about this, it was in very generic	
8			terms. I don't ever remember saying, listen, can we	
9			talk about the data protections breaches or can we talk	
10			about Sergeant McCabe not cooperating with a specific	14:06
11			O'Mahony inquiry. I think I would have gone on and	
12			said, listen, can you help me here, I have this	
13			programme, there's suggestions that I am reading in the	
14			media and the Minister seems to be suggesting that	
15			Sergeant McCabe is not cooperating. So is he not	14:06
16			cooperating? And then the conversation would have	
17			passed over to the Commissioner, who then went off and	
18			gave me his response.	
19	487	Q.	You mentioned that part of the source of your	
20			information that enabled you speak about these matters	14:06
21			knowledgeably on the radio was stuff that was in the	
22			public domain. You didn't use the word "stuff", but	
23			material that was in the public domain and what you had	
24			read?	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:07
26	488	Q.	So is it possible, therefore, that you had already in	
27			your mind a certain degree of information that enabled	
28			you ask general questions of Martin Callinan during	
29			this conversation?	

- 1 A. I think that is fair to say, yes.
- 2 489 Q. Would that be fair?
- 3 A. I think that is fair to say.
- 4 490 Q. All right. Do you recall the Commissioner indicating

14 · 07

14:07

14:08

14.08

- 5 his view that he didn't believe the PAC was an
- 6 appropriate venue for anybody to be making serious
- 7 allegations in what was a public forum?
- 8 A. I have a recollection of that.
- 9 491 Q. Right. And do you recall him mentioning his talking
- about giving directions to prevent unauthorised
- dissemination to third parties of sensitive material
- 12 concerning the --
- 13 A. I've a recollection of that.
- 14 492 Q. Right. And, well, you have already had read out to you
- the John O'Mahony's position on that and, broadly
- speaking, what those direction notices say. Does any
- of that ring a bell for you?
- 18 A. Not specifically, no. You know, the specifics, I can't
- 19 recollect. Just the general comments.
- 20 493 Q. Right. My instructions are that you asked general
- 21 questions such as where the investigation was located,
- 22 what sort of numbers were involved in the inquiries,
- and Commissioner Callinan indicated this was at Garda
- 24 Headquarters, but he'd have to get back to you in
- relation to any questions about numbers because he
- 26 didn't have that at his --
- 27 A. That could well be the case.
- 28 494 Q. Right. And it is in that context that he came back to
- you the following day, on the 26th January, with

_			Turther answers that he wash t abre to provide in the	
2			first conversation?	
3		Α.	Yeah, that could well be the case, yes.	
4	495	Q.	Right. And my understanding of matters is that on the	
5			26th January you contacted him to say that you were on	14:08
6			the show and afterwards you had been told that Sergeant	
7			McCabe rang into the programme taking issue with things	
8			you had said, does that ring a bell?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	496	Q.	And his recollection is that what you were relayed	14:09
11			to him was that what Sergeant McCabe appeared to be	
12			aggrieved about was that your comments had attributed	
13			to him the commission of criminal offences and also the	
14			separate matter of not cooperating with the O'Mahony	
15			inquiry, and that was something Sergeant McCabe was	14:09
16			aggrieved about?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	497	Q.	Right. And I think was threatening legal action, did	
19			you mention that?	
20		Α.	I could well have.	14:09
21	498	Q.	Right. And do you recall the Commissioner saying that	
22			he had not heard the programme, but he would do his	
23			best to listen to it later on?	
24		Α.	That could be the case.	
25	499	Q.	Right. His understanding of matters and his	14:10
26			instructions are that he did not actually expressly	
27			repeat, as I think you have indicated on a number of	
28			occasions, that Sergeant McCabe did not cooperate; he	
29			maintains, and I am putting this to you, that he told	

Т			you the facts as he understood them to be, which were	
2			the facts that he had already put into the public	
3			domain openly and was making no bones about, all right?	
4			That is his position on that. Do you disagree with	
5			that?	14:10
6		Α.	I totally disagree.	
7	500	Q.	All right.	
8		Α.	I mean, I don't know everything he has put into the	
9			public domain, but if he said that Sergeant McCabe was	
10			a troublemaker and he was obstructive and he was	14:10
11			difficult, if that's in the public domain, well, fine,	
12			but that's what he told me.	
13	501	Q.	Right.	
14		Α.	Or words to that effect.	
15	502	Q.	He instructs me that his conversations with you were	14:10
16			focused on the O'Mahony investigation and also remarks	
17			he had made at the PAC. I take it you don't disagree	
18			with that?	
19		Α.	Some of yes, part of the conversation would have	
20			covered those points.	14:11
21	503	Q.	Right. And I'm putting to you that he did not at any	
22			time disclose personal information about Sergeant	
23			McCabe, save that he would undoubtedly have made clear	
24			his critical view of the notion of a serving guard	
25			going on the PAC, but other than that, he did not	14:11
26			disclose any make any derogatory remarks about	
27			Sergeant McCabe of any personal nature?	
28		Α.	That's not correct.	
29	504	Q.	All right. And I'm suggesting to you that insofar as	

Т			you picked up a tone of criticism, it was in relation	
2			to his fundamental problem with Sergeant McCabe and any	
3			notion of a serving guard going on the PAC and	
4			disclosing sensitive data belonging to citizens?	
5		Α.	No, that is not correct.	14:11
6	505	Q.	All right. Now, can I just ask you then to deal	
7			with I think you've quite properly indicated to	
8			Mr. McGuinness, counsel for the Tribunal, that you're	
9			absolutely clear in your position that at no time did	
10			Commissioner Callinan bring up any matter of a sexual	14:12
11			allegation or anything of that nature?	
12		Α.	That is absolutely correct, he did not, no.	
13			MR. O'HIGGINS: Thanks very much.	
14		Α.	Thank you Mr. O'Higgins.	
15				14:12
16			MR. KEAN WAS EXAMINED BY MR. BOUGHTON:	
17				
18	506	Q.	MR. BOUGHTON: Mr. Kean, I think you said that before	
19			you're invited on broadcasts, that you make a point to	
20			inform yourself, is that right?	14:12
21		Α.	Yeah, I try and do that, yes.	
22	507	Q.	You said that you spoke to a number of Garda Síochána	
23			on the day before the broadcast in a general sense, is	
24			that right?	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:12
26	508	Q.	Where did you speak to those gardaí?	
27		Α.	well, I rang some, and the records are there, and I	
28			also went to Wicklow Garda Station, and that was in	
29			relation to a personal matter, and I had a coffee there	

- and spoke to a number of them as well.
- 2 509 Q. I think we know, as well, that you spoke to Diarmuid
- 3 O'Sullivan and Martin Callinan by phone?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 510 Q. When you spoke to Martin Callinan, were you asking him

14 · 13

14:13

14.14

- of his views of the Sergeant McCabe situation or the
- 7 facts of the Garda McCabe situation?
- 8 A. Well, my recollection was, I started with, you know, we
- 9 probably went through pleasantries and all that and
- then I told him I was going on the show, and I said,
- look, can I ask you, what is the story with Sergeant
- 12 Maurice McCabe, like, is it true that he's not
- cooperating? It would have been a general question
- like that, that's what I'm trying to say, is it true
- that he's not cooperating with investigations? Because 14:13
- I hadn't formed an opinion there was only one
- investigation at that stage. For all I knew, there
- 18 might have been another investigation within the force,
- 19 I don't know. I didn't know.
- 20 511 Q. Now, you appear regularly on television and radio in
- relation to current affairs on a whole range of topics?
- 22 A. Yes, I do.
- 23 512 Q. Would you ever hesitate if someone had given you
- information, be that person a celebrity, or a sports
- 25 person or an official, to say that you had spoken to
- 26 that person?
- 27 A. No, I would have no hesitation once it was okay with
- them.
- 29 513 Q. In what circumstances would you refrain from naming

1 them?

- A. Well, if I was asked not to, out of respect. If somebody said "please don't mention my name here", I wouldn't mention their name.
- 5 514 Q. It has been suggested that it might be unusual for you to have access to senior Garda in respect of reaching out to your personal or professional network. Would it be unusual?
- 9 A. No, I would have been friendlier -- I only met Martin
 10 Callinan, I think, once, but I would have been friendly 14:14
 11 with previous commissioners and met them socially, and
 12 I would have, you know, reasonably strong contacts
 13 within An Garda Síochána and probably other
 14 institutions.
- 15 515 Q. And if you were asked to comment on any other topics, you've mentioned the HSE, for example, would you have, within your network, the ability to reach out to senior officials?
- 19 I would in -- I mean, I'm very critical of the HSE, so Α. I'm not sure they would talk to me, but in those cases 20 14:15 I tend to talk to people, frontline workers like the 21 22 nurses and get their views of what is happening. 23 would have contacts in other institutions, semi-State 24 bodies, that would ask for an opinion or an advice to 25 clarify something, and, you know, if they say "don't 14 · 15 mention my name", as I say, then I won't mention their 26 27 name.
- 28 516 Q. In relation to the handwritten note which we're told 29 was written by Martin Callinan and the subsequent typed

2		Α.	Yes.	
3	517	Q.	we have heard that that came to you in a meeting	
4			with Mr. Walsh, Garda Walsh, on the 12th February 2014?	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:15
6	518	Q.	I think your recollection has been jogged to a certain	
7			extent of that meeting?	
8		Α.	Pardon?	
9	519	Q.	Your recollection of that meeting has been jogged or	
10			refreshed to a certain extent?	14:15
11		Α.	Yes, yeah.	
12	520	Q.	That handwritten and typed document, did you carry out	
13			a search at any point to see if you had retained a copy	
14			or the original?	
15		Α.	Oh, we did exhaustive searches for several days	14:15
16			involving many staff in my office looking for it. But	
17			in the light of what I have seen today, I'm now very	
18			confident I never got that.	
19	521	Q.	And you've said that you didn't take any notes in	
20			relation to that meeting. Are you certain that you	14:16
21			haven't	
22		Α.	I didn't, no, no.	
23	522	Q.	What is your usual way of recording a meeting such as	
24			this?	
25		Α.	Well, I would never record a conversation unless I had	14:16
26			the approval, but what I would do is, I would dictate	
27			the letter and I believe it would have happened that I	
28			would have dictated the response letter which went out	
29			the same day as I met with Superintendent Walsh based	

1

note --

- on the note that he had either shown me or given me or
- 2 read to me, but I didn't retain it, I don't believe I
- 3 retained a copy of it.
- 4 523 Q. The Tribunal wrote to you on the 12th December 2017
- 5 asking you whether you had any information in relation

14:16

14:17

14.17

- 6 to the reference material?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 524 Q. And I think you replied to that letter two days later
- 9 on the 14th December?
- 10 A. I know I responded immediately, yeah.
- 11 525 Q. And that letter has been read out to you already. In
- that letter, you said you didn't have the file in front
- of you at the time?
- 14 A. I didn't.
- 15 526 Q. I think you did give what we can call a full account of 14:16
- the evidence that you have given to the Tribunal today
- in that letter, would that be fair to say?
- 18 A. I think it is, yes.
- 19 527 Q. And I think four days later, on the 18th December, the
- Tribunal wrote to you and asked you if you had any
- 21 documentation?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- 23 528 Q. Do you recall that? And I think you sent a reply by
- email on the 20th December, and in that you said the
- only document you have is the file in relation to the
- 26 defamation proceedings?
- 27 A. Yes, correct, because I believed all that to be --
- 28 yeah.
- 29 529 Q. And it's been suggested that that file was live at the

- 1 time because you had only recently delivered your
- 2 defence in that?
- 3 A. Yes, correct.
- 4 530 Q. Am I right in saying as well that those proceedings
- 5 came to a resolution around that time?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 531 Q. Are you familiar with the terms, without going into the

14:18

14 · 18

- 8 detail of those terms, of that resolution?
- 9 A. Sorry?
- 10 532 Q. Are you familiar with the terms by which the defamation 14:17
- 11 proceedings came to --
- 12 A. Well, the case against me was dropped. I made no
- contribution to costs, made no contribution to
- compensation. I was preparing a full defence to fight.
- But it was agreed that the case would be dropped and it 14:18
- 16 was dropped against me at that stage.
- 17 533 Q. I think that is your last contact with the Tribunal
- 18 before Christmas 2017?
- 19 A. I believe so. I went away for Christmas then.
- 20 534 Q. Then, after Christmas, you had four meetings with the
- investigation team, the first on the 17th January
- 22 2017 --
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 535 Q. 2018, excuse me. In that first meeting, were documents
- 25 that we've seen today in your affidavit available to
- 26 you?
- 27 A. Yes, I believe they were, yes.
- 28 536 Q. And I think your affidavit contains the letter to
- 29 Martin Callinan, the draft response to Sergeant McCabe

1			and the handwritten and typed note?	
2		Α.	That is correct.	
3	537	Q.	Is it fair to say those were in the possession of the	
4			investigation team when you met them?	
5		Α.	That is correct, yeah.	14:18
6	538	Q.	I think you volunteered your phone records as part of	
7			the investigation and those are before the Tribunal?	
8		Α.	I did, I volunteered everything: the phone records, my	
9			defamation file, correspondence in relation to	
10			defamation.	14:18
11	539	Q.	I think you were thanked for your speedy cooperation?	
12		Α.	Oh, they were very complimentary, and I would like to	
13			pay compliments to the inspectors as well. I mean, I	
14			came down here three or four times, and we spoke on the	
15			phone, got phone records, got details of texts, got	14:19
16			everything they wanted, and they were very thankful for	
17			my support. But I also would like to compliment them,	
18			they were very helpful to me and	
19	540	Q.	And finally, Mr. Kean, I think you may have said this	
20			this morning, but have you ever had penalty points	14:19
21			cancelled or quashed?	
22		Α.	No, no.	
23			MR. BOUGHTON: Thanks, Mr. Kean.	
24			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, I am in a position	
25			now to provide information to the Tribunal, and I can	14:19
26			confirm there was contact and I would propose to put to	
27			Mr. Kean what the contact was.	
28				

1			MR. KEAN WAS FURTHER CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL	
2			O'HIGGINS:	
3				
4	541	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Good afternoon again, Mr. Kean.	
5			I'm just going to put a couple of matters on this very	14:19
6			discrete issue as ascertained by our client's	
7			instructions.	
8		Α.	Yeah.	
9	542	Q.	It would appear that you contacted the Garda Press	
10			Office around 10:00 or 10:30am the weekend that you	14:19
11			were appearing on the Marian Finucane show, you spoke	
12			to a sergeant there and you indicated you were looking	
13			for a steer on the whistleblowers as you were going on	
14			the Marian Finucane programme. Now, does that ring any	
15			bell with you?	14:20
16		Α.	No, but I accept it could be correct. I would have	
17			hoped that maybe the phone records because I was in	
18			the car that day, so the phone records, I'm surprised	
19			they don't show that, but that could well be the case,	
20			yes.	14:20
21	543	Q.	Now, I'm going to just inform you what's hearsay, but	
22			just for the continuity of it, the sergeant in the	
23			Press Office then contacted Superintendent Taylor and	
24			informed Superintendent Taylor of your query and gave	
25			Superintendent Taylor your phone number. Following	14:20
26			that exchange Superintendent Taylor rang you, you told	
27			him that you were going on the Marian Finucane	
28			programme and you were looking for a steer on	
29			whistleblowers. He told you or, sorry, you told him	

Τ			that you knew Commissioner Callinan but didn't have his	
2			number, and Superintendent Taylor said "leave it with	
3			me and I will be back to you". Does any of that ring a	
4			bell?	
5		Α.	It could be correct, but I got I had, and still	14:21
6			have, Martin Callinan's number, it may not be mobile,	
7			it may be the Commissioner's office, but I don't	
8			believe for one minute I said knew him well. I only	
9			met the gentleman	
10	544	Q.	Whatever.	14:21
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	545	Q.	In fact, my note is "told Superintendent Taylor that he	
13			knew Commissioner Callinan but didn't have his number".	
14			And Superintendent Taylor said "leave it with me and	
15			I'll get back to you". Again, I'm just going to tell	14:21
16			you the hearsay just to keep the continuity.	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	546	Q.	Superintendent Taylor then rang Commissioner Callinan,	
19			informed him that you were after ringing the Press	
20			Office and that he had called you back and that you	14:21
21			were looking for a steer on the whistleblowers as he	
22			was going on the Marian Finucane programme and	
23			Commissioner Callinan told my client to say that the	
24			whistleblowers did not cooperate with the O'Mahony	
25			investigation. He then called you back, this would be	14:22
26			a second phone call, and relayed that information to	
27			you. He did not give you the Commissioner's phone	
28			number. Does any of that ring a bell?	
29		Δ	No	

Т		MR. MICHAEL O HIGGINS: All right. That's as lar as we	
2		can put the matter, Chairman.	
3		CHAIRMAN: Is there any other source, do you think,	
4		from which the Commissioner's number could have been	
5		you would have had it? Just talking about him	14:22
6	Α.	No, Mr. Chairman, no. I would hope Diarmuid	
7		O'Sullivan's memory might be better than mine in what	
8		we discussed on the when I first made contact with	
9		him. Because I thought Diarmuid might have helped me,	
10		you know, who to ring or who to call. But no,	14:22
11		Mr. Chairman, I can't think of any.	
12		CHAIRMAN: You think it was Diarmuid O'Sullivan?	
13	Α.	I thought so, yeah. I genuinely did. I mean, Diarmuid	
14		O'Sullivan may have given me the Press Office number,	
15		for example, and I may have rang. But, you know, I	14:22
16		can't remember who it was. But I did make the contact	
17		to try and clarify. And just to be clear on this,	
18		"steer" is not a word I'd use, but I appreciate this is	
19		only	
20		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: It's paraphrasing.	14:23
21	Α.	I would be saying I would like to clarify, that is the	
22		word I would tend to use. I wouldn't normally use the	
23		word "steer".	
24		CHAIRMAN: And you've no dispute with Martin Callinan	
25		ringing you first?	14:23
26	Α.	No, no, Mr. Chairman.	
27		CHAIRMAN: Then you would have had his number, unless	
28		it was blocked, obviously, on the communication.	
29	Α.	Yes, Chairman.	

1			CHAIRMAN: All right.	
2				
3			MR. KEAN WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS:	
4				
5	547	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Mr. Kean, just a couple of matters.	14:23
6			We have Superintendent Taylor's billing records for the	
7			period.	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	548	Q.	And they do not show on his mobile account any phone	
10			call to your number.	14:23
11		Α.	Right.	
12	549	Q.	We also have your mobile records	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	550	Q.	which stem from the 17th January onwards, and they	
15			don't show a call from you to Superintendent Taylor's	14:23
16			mobile number either.	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	551	Q.	Have you or have you not a memory of speaking to him?	
19		Α.	I don't have a clear memory. What I have said is, it	
20			may have happened, but I don't have a clear memory, no.	14:24
21	552	Q.	Have you a memory of ringing the Press Office?	
22		Α.	No. It's possible, I would hope I thought my phone	
23			records might clarify this, but it's possible that if,	
24			for example, Mr. O'Sullivan, Diarmuid O'Sullivan can	
25			remember, Diarmuid might have said to me, here's the	14:24
26			number of the Press Office, give them a call. Diarmuid	
27			might be able to throw some light on that. But I find	
28			it hard to believe that I would ring up the Press	
29			Office to I wouldn't have had their number that	

- easily, I would have had to go looking for it somewhere or somebody who would have given it to me.
- 3 553 Q. Yes. Mr. O'Sullivan has said in his statement to the
- 4 Tribunal that he knew you through a number of different
- 5 methods, meeting you at rugby games. You had a nephew
- 6 who was a very good --
- 7 A. I forgot that.
- 8 554 Q. -- young rugby footballer, and his son was on the same

14 · 24

14:25

14 . 25

- 9 team in the same school, isn't that right?
- 10 A. That's right, yeah. I forgot that.
- 11 555 Q. And he said he met you socially?
- 12 A. Yeah.
- 13 556 Q. And he said he would have referred associates and friends to you for advice.
- 15 A. Yes, correct.
- 16 557 Q. And he also refers to the unfortunate burglary of your house as well as being --
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 558 Q. So he was probably the person most familiar to you and,
- in a sense, sort of local to you as well, would that be 14:25
- 21 fair to say?
- 22 A. It would be fair to say. You know, I would have got on
- with other people in the guards, but Diarmuid is one
- I've always had huge respect for, and, you know, he was
- relatively high -- well, sorry, he was very highly
- 26 positioned within An Garda Síochána.
- 27 559 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. So I thought he would be the person I might go to and
- say, listen, can you help me out, I just want to find

1			out what's happening.	
2	560	Q.	Yes. He was an energetic senior policeman?	
3		Α.	I think he was a great man, yeah.	
4	561	Q.	Now, could you look at page 1793 of our papers. This	
5			is a statement made by Martin Callinan, dated 4th	14:26
6			January 2018. It's got his handwriting on it there,	
7			you see that?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	562	Q.	With the date as well. It's received by the Tribunal	
10			on the 19th February for some reason. But you will see	14:26
11			that what was sent to former Commissioner Callinan was	
12			the letter that you sent to him, your proposed draft	
13			response and the typewritten four paragraphs, together	
14			with the handwritten four paragraphs, which	
15			Mr. Marrinan had discovered in the disclosure. So	14:26
16			that's sent to him for his comment. He then says:	
17				
18			"I met Mr. Gerald Kean on a couple of occasions at	
19			related charity events during my period as Commissioner	
20			of An Garda Síochána. I was not in regular contact	14:27
21			with him on a social or professional basis. My initial	
22			reaction to Mr. Kean's letter, which was marked	
23			'private and confidential', was to draft some notes	
24			reflecting my position on some of the matters that I	
25			have already referred to publicly concerning data	14:27
26			protection, cooperation with the O'Mahony	
27			investigation. However, on further consideration of	
28			the matter, I determined that this was an inappropriate	
29			letter to receive as Commissioner. I was now faced	

1			with how and in what manner I might possibly respond.	
2				
3			I discussed the matter with Superintendent Frank Walsh,	
4			then private secretary to the Commissioner. He also	
5			agreed it was inappropriate to get involved.	14:27
6				
7			As I recall, Superintendent Walsh indicated that he	
8			knew Mr. Kean for a number of years and offered to meet	
9			him to indicate that the Commissioner could not get	
10			involved. I believe that meeting subsequently took	14:27
11			place. I recall speaking with Mr. Kean by telephone	
12			within a short period of receiving his letter. I	
13			indicated that while I was sure he would understand I	
14			could not get involved, my position in relation to some	
15			of the points raised in his draft response was a matter	14:28
16			of public record. I did not issue a written response	
17			to Mr. Kean in respect of his correspondence to me."	
18				
19			Now, firstly, do you recall speaking to the	
20			Commissioner after you sent your letter to him in early	14:28
21			February?	
22		Α.	I have a recollection of that, yeah.	
23	563	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	Yeah.	
25	564	Q.	Obviously, you'll recall I asked you and you said that,	14:28
26			you didn't mention the Commissioner's name in the	
27			course of the broadcast?	
28		Α.	Correct.	
29	565	Q.	Because he had asked you not to?	

1 Α. Correct. 2 566 "Don't quote me on that" or --Q. 3 Correct. Α. You've no doubt about that? 567 4 0. 5 Absolutely no doubt about that. Α. 14:28 6 568 No doubt about that. Okay. And the way he describes Q. 7 it here, was that a continued or confirmation of his 8 position, as far as you were concerned, that he didn't want you to get him involved? 9 10 Correct, yeah, yeah. Α. 14 · 28 11 569 And he didn't want you to disclose the contact you had Q. with him? 12 13 That is correct, yeah. That was clear to me at the Α. 14 time. 15 570 And is that the reason why both your initial draft Q. 14:29 16 letter to Sergeant McCabe and the actual response you 17 issued to Sergeant McCabe doesn't identify the Commissioner as having provided you with any of the 18 19 information, nor does it identify the fact that you consulted him on your response? 20 14:29 That is correct. 21 Α. Sorry, Mr. McGuinness, again just to 22 CHAIRMAN: understand the question, are you saying that the 23 response to the Tribunal --24 25 I'm talking about the response to MR. McGUINNESS: 14 . 29 26 Sergeant McCabe. I thought I had put that in. 27 CHAIRMAN: Oh, I'm sorry, I beg your pardon. All 28 right. MR. McGUINNESS: And he doesn't mention here in this 29 571 Ο.

letter to the Tribunal, in his third supplemental 1 2 statement, any briefing of you, in any way, shape or 3 form, on the 24th, 25th or 26th. Are you crystal clear that all of those calls happened and that he provided 4 5 the information and steering, as it were, that you've given the Tribunal about? 6

14:30

14:30

14:30

- 7 well, when you ask did all the calls take place, yes, Α. 8 the phone records are there. So that confirms the record. Secondly, the fact that he and his office 9 chose to send me this letter -- or, sorry, to show me 10 11 this letter which helped me with my draft response, 12 shows there was an involvement from him at the start, I
- 13 believe. And thirdly, yes, I'm crystal clear about 14 what he told me about Sergeant McCabe.
- 15 572 I'm just concerned about one issue. Obviously the Q. 16 non-disclosure on the radio, you went along with that, 17 not revealing that the Commissioner -- you checked with 18 the Commissioner and this is what the Commissioner is 19 saying, and then the non-disclosure of it in the letter 20 to Sergeant McCabe and then in your initial response to 14:30 the Tribunal, you didn't reveal that you'd consulted 21 22 the Commissioner and that he had a hand in the drafting 23 of your response, would that not be suggestive of a 24 pattern of continued desire not to involve Commissioner Callinan in these matters? 25
- 26 Well, I think you're absolutely correct insofar as the Α. 27 first two. The third was an omission. I mean, the first two I did not want it to be known on the radio 28 29 or -- I think a radio programme or a communication with

a complainant is different than dealing with the 1 2 So there was no intention on my part to hold 3 In fact, as I've said already, those four paragraphs in that note and the fact they came from the 4 5 Commissioner's office was extremely helpful to me and 14:31 6 was important to me to show that what I was saying was, 7 I felt, a hundred percent correct. That is the way I felt. 8 Now, your counsel asked you about various 9 573 Yes. Q. correspondence with the Tribunal and your responses to 10 14:31 I think it had been left at the end of the 11 it. 12 statement that you gave the investigators that you were 13 going to search for further billing records? 14 Α. Yes. 574 15 And the Tribunal wrote to you on the 29th February and Q. 14:31 16 with a further reminder, which you haven't replied to 17 yet. 18 No. Α. 19 575 Will you reply to that? Q. Oh, I will, of course, yeah. We are still chasing it. 20 Α. Yes. And make every effort --21 576 Q. 22 Please remember, that if you look at the inspectors, Α. 23 the reason that they wrote to me thanking me for my 24 cooperation and how I'd helped and come down here every time I was asked at short notice, is, I'm very willing 25 14:32 to help in any way I can, and there's certainly no 26 27 intention on my part to -- there's nothing to be gained 28 by not helping in any way I can.

MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you, Mr. Kean.

Т		Α.	mank you, Chairman.	
2				
3			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
4				
5			MS. LEADER: The next witness, sir, is Mr. Noel Brett.	14:32
6			Mr. Brett gave a statement in March of last year and	
7			was interviewed by our investigators more recently.	
8			Those materials appear at Volume 6 at page 1530 of the	
9			materials.	
10				14:33
11			MR. NOEL BRETT, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	
12			EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER:	
13				
14	577	Q.	MS. LEADER: Mr. Brett, could you give a brief synopsis	
15			of your career to date to the Tribunal, please?	14:33
16		Α.	Yes. I graduated from University College Dublin with a	
17			social science degree in 1989. I moved immediately to	
18			the United Kingdom where I did my postgraduate	
19			training, and my earlier career was as a child	
20			protection social worker. I subsequently worked in	14:33
21			mental health social work. I was then promoted to a	
22			contracts manager with Kent County Council. I then	
23			became the assistant director of social services in the	
24			London borough of Newham in east London. And I	
25			returned to Ireland in March 1999 to take up a position	14:33
26			as general manager of Mayo General Hospital in	
27			Castlebar. I was promoted to assistant chief executive	
28			of the then Western Health Board in 2001, and I did	
29			that job until 2004, at which point sorry, 2005, at	

- which point I was appointed as CEO of the new Road

 Safety Authority. I was CEO there for eight years.
- And I moved to my current role as Chief Executive of the Banking and Payments Federation Ireland in October
- 5 2013, and I continue to hold that post. I should also

14:34

14:35

- 6 note that I am a member of the Board of the Policing
- 7 Authority and I am also a member of the Board of the
- 8 Western Development Commission.
- 9 578 Q. All right. Now, I think in around October 2012 in your
- 10 role, presumably, as Chief Executive of the Road Safety 14:34
- 11 Authority, you received certain information from
- Mr. Faughnan in relation to irregularities in the fixed
- 13 charge penalty notice?
- 14 A. Yes, that's correct. I was Chief Executive at that
- point of the Road Safety Authority. I had a statutory
- responsibility -- or the authority had a statutory
- 17 responsibility for certain parts of the administration
- of the penalty points system. I was contacted by email
- by Conor Faughnan, who was the director of consumer
- affairs in AA, the motoring association. In that
- email, he told me that he had been contacted by a
- 22 serving member of An Garda Síochána and that there were
- some worrying allegations in relation to impropriety
- around the penalty points system and he asked me if I
- would meet with Conor Faughnan, with himself, the next
- time I was in Dublin. I should say the Road Safety
- 27 Authority is based in County Mayo. So I subsequently
- 28 met him in Dublin a few days after that.
- 29 579 Q. Right. And you took up the matter insofar as you

Т			notified Assistant Commissioner Twomey, who was at	
2			that time had responsibility for traffic, is that	
3			correct?	
4		Α.	Well, that's correct. What Conor Faughnan told me, he	
5			gave me a very high level outline of alleged	14:35
6			impropriety, the cancellation, or the word "squaring"	
7			of penalty points, but he also told me that one of the	
8			board members of the authority	
9	580	Q.	You needn't go into that.	
10		Α.	Okay.	14:36
11	581	Q.	We're not looking into the fixed charge penalty notice	
12			system.	
13		Α.	So well, just to finish off. So because he had	
14			given me that information, I had asked him what he	
15			want what he thought should happen, and he said he	14:36
16			would raise it with a contact he had, a Ms. Carmel	
17			Foley, in GSOC, and I undertook to notify An Garda	
18			Síochána at that point, and I immediately straight	
19			after that, I phoned Assistant Commissioner Twomey and	
20			I told him what I had been told and I asked him to	14:36
21			inform the Garda Commissioner.	
22	582	Q.	And you informed your own board, and I think you also	
23			informed the Comptroller & Auditor General?	
24		Α.	No. At that point, I briefed my own chairman, Mr. Gay	
25			Byrne, and I informed the board. I only informed the	14:36
26			Comptroller & Auditor General and GSOC after I had met	
27			with Sergeant McCabe and had all the detail.	
28	583	Q.	All right. And you met with Sergeant McCabe, I think	
29			it was on the 25th October 2012, and discussed the	

- fixed charge penalty notice system, am I correct in that?
- 3 Α. Yes, that's correct. I met with Sergeant McCabe for the first time that evening and he took me through the 4 5 penalty point allegations and, you know, I was 14:37 satisfied from speaking with him that there were very 6 7 serious issues and he had all of the back-up. 8 went home that night, and the very next morning I referred the matter formally by registered post and 9 included the dossier. I sent it to the Comptroller & 10 14:37 11 Auditor General because of the alleged loss of revenue 12 to the State, and I sent it to GSOC because I believed 13 that GSOC had the statutory powers to formally 14 investigate it.
- 15 584 Q. So matters went on from there in relation to the fixed
 16 charge penalty notice system. I want to bring you to
 17 the following year, to July 2013, you had a meeting
 18 with the Department of Justice with regard to the fixed
 19 charge penalty notice system, is that correct?

14:37

- A. Yes, that meeting was held in late July 2013. I was asked by my then-Minister, Minister Varadkar, who was Minister for Transport, to accompany him to a meeting with the Minister for Justice to discuss the penalty point issues.
- 25 585 Q. And who was at that meeting?
- A. That meeting was attended by Minister Shatter, who was then the Minister for Justice; Minister Varadkar, who was the Minister for Transport; Brian Murphy, who the Minister's special adviser; Maurice Treacy, who was the

Т			principal officer at that point in the Department of	
2			Transport; by Brian Purcell, who was the Secretary	
3			General in the Department of Justice, and by myself.	
4	586	Q.	And I think immediately after that meeting you	
5			telephoned Sergeant McCabe, and was that as a result of	14:38
6			something you'd heard during the meeting?	
7		Α.	Yes, that's correct. During the meeting, Minister	
8			Shatter was having an exchange with myself and Minister	
9			Varadkar about whether or not Sergeant McCabe had	
10			cooperated with the O'Mahony investigation. I knew	14:38
11			from speaking to Sergeant McCabe that he hadn't been	
12			contacted and he hadn't been asked to participate. I	
13			explained that to Minister Shatter at the meeting and	
14			he was adamant that he hadn't. I was concerned, so	
15			much so that, straight after the meeting, after I	14:39
16			parted company with Minister Varadkar, I immediately	
17			rang Sergeant McCabe and I asked him, and he reassured	
18			me that he had not been contacted and that what he had	
19			told me originally stood. I believed at that point	
20			that it was important to immediately ring the Secretary	14:39
21			General, Brian Purcell, and alert him to this, because	
22			Minister Shatter seemed to believe the direct opposite.	
23	587	Q.	And you spoke to Mr. Purcell in relation to Sergeant	
24			McCabe's cooperation?	
25		Α.	I certainly did.	14:39
26	588	Q.	And what he had relayed to you?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	589	Q.	All right. Then if we could go on to February 2014, I	
29			think you again contacted Sergeant McCabe to support	

1			him, is that correct, to offer your support to him?	
2		Α.	Well, I had contacted Sergeant McCabe occasionally by	
3			text or by phone call	
4	590	Q.	Yes.	
5		Α.	if I felt he was having a hard time in the media, or	14:40
6			whatever, because I was very concerned for him and I	
7			felt I felt he was very marginalised and I would	
8			have contacted him on occasion.	
9	591	Q.	And I think there were certain reports in the media at	
10			that stage about his non-cooperation alleged	14:40
11			non-cooperation with the O'Mahony inquiry, is that	
12			correct?	
13		Α.	Yes, that's correct. I do remember a specific instance	
14			when I did actually physically ring him up, as opposed	
15			to text him, because the report was covered in the	14:40
16			media, I had read it, and I knew from my interaction	
17			with him that it was untrue. So I rang him up to say,	
18			look, you know, I still believe you.	
19	592	Q.	All right. Now, if we could then go on to 2013. You	
20			met with Superintendent David Taylor on a number of	14:40
21			occasions?	
22			CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, Ms. Leader, just before you go	
23			on to that, was I right in thinking that the telephone	
24			call about the non-cooperation, etcetera, was February	
25			2014?	14:41
26			MS. LEADER: That's my understanding. Perhaps	
27			Mr. Brett might clarify	

A. If I may just refer to my statement.

29 593 Q. The reference is page 1537 of the materials, if it

- 1 could be brought up.
- 2 A. Yes, that's correct. February 2014, yes.
- 3 594 Q. February 2014. You're happy that's correct?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 595 Q. So I just want to take you now to 2013 and a series of
- 6 meetings had you with Superintendent David Taylor.
- 7 A. 2013?
- 8 596 Q. As I understand it, yes. Sorry, 1540 of the materials
- 9 might assist you.
- 10 A. Just while it's coming up, I'd met with David Taylor in 14:41
- this context on three separate occasions.
- 12 597 Q. Yes.
- 13 A. Will I tell you about those?
- 14 598 Q. Yes. As I understood it, it was from 2013 onwards, is
- 15 that right?
- 16 A. Yes. My first meeting with him was where he called to

14:42

14 · 42

- 17 my office. I started in my current job after October
- 18 2013, so it was either -- it was late 2013. He called
- to my office and gave me a thesis that he had
- completed. So that was just a social call, handed me
- the thesis. I took it and he left.
- 22 599 Q. All right.
- 23 CHAIRMAN: Forgive me for -- just on the detail, am I
- right in thinking Mayo, or had you moved to Dublin at
- 25 that stage?
- A. No, sorry, I had taken up -- sorry, Chair, I had taken
- 27 up my current role in Nassau Street in Dublin, and he
- had turned up at my office to give me his thesis.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.

- 1 600 Q. MS. LEADER: How did you know Superintendent Taylor?
- 2 A. I had -- the Road Safety Authority and An Garda
- 3 Síochána would run a number of joint initiatives, such
- 4 as the Christmas drink driving campaign or conferences
- or events like that, and the press, both organisations'
- 6 press offices would collaborate on those events, and I
- 7 knew David Taylor, Superintendent Taylor, in that
- 8 context.
- 9 601 Q. And was it a scheduled meeting in your office in Nassau 10 Street or was it a more casual affair?

14 · 43

14:43

14:43

14 · 43

- 11 A. That first meeting would have been very casual. He
- would have texted, and I was free, so he turned up, and
- I would have made him a cup of tea, he would have told
- me about his thesis and given me the thesis.
- 15 602 Q. Okay. I think you've told the Tribunal investigators
- there were two subsequent meetings with
- 17 Superintendent Taylor, is that correct?
- 18 A. Yes, that's correct. He next contacted me after he had
- been suspended and arrested and he was off duty, and he
- called to my office on two occasions after that.
- 21 603 Q. And can you be any more specific about dates?
- 22 A. I'm really sorry, I can't, and I don't -- they weren't
- diaried events; they were, literally he turned up and I
- felt I was being pleasant and made him a cup of tea and
- spoke with him and off he went.
- 26 604 Q. All right. And I think Sergeant McCabe was discussed
- 27 during the course of those meetings?
- 28 A. Yes. The main thrust of those meetings was to do with
- 29 Superintendent Taylor's own situation, his suspension,

1			his arrest, you know, the fact that his children	
2			visited him in the Garda cell, him being off payroll,	
3			those kind of issues. But he did tell me or he did	
4			talk briefly about the way Sergeant McCabe was being	
5			treated by senior management in An Garda Síochána and	14:44
6			he made it clear to me that they were determined to	
7			disprove the penalty point issues that I had referred	
8			and that Sergeant McCabe had been talking about.	
9	605	Q.	Now, was he any more specific than saying "senior	
10			management in An Garda Síochána"?	14:44
11		Α.	He would have said to me that Commissioner Callinan was	
12			determined to bury this issue, as in, to finish this	
13			issue off, and he went on and told me, you know, that	
14			it was being treated in Crime and Security section,	
15			which, as I understand, it is where particular types of	14:44
16			crime are dealt with, and he told me that in the	
17			context of the seriousness in which the matter was	
18			being dealt.	
19	606	Q.	Was there any other particular Garda officer mentioned	
20			by name during the course of those two conversations?	14:45
21		Α.	No, not from memory, no.	
22	607	Q.	Now	
23		Α.	Sorry, I should clarify, in the context of Sergeant	
24			McCabe, he only mentioned Commissioner Callinan. In	
25			the context of the discussions about most of his	14:45
26			angst was directed at Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan,	
27			or Acting Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan as she would	
28			have been then, in the context of his own situation -	
29			his arrest, his suspension and his predicament.	

Τ	608	Q.	And in relation to computers and phones, did he say	
2			anything about those during the course of those two	
3			meetings?	
4		Α.	Yes. He told me that the Sergeant McCabe allegations	
5			were being dealt with in the Crime and Security	14:45
6			section. He went on to tell me that there was a	
7			particular computer system which was being used to deal	
8			with the Sergeant McCabe allegations. He told me that	
9			computer system was called Oisín and he went on to say	
10			that it was named after the grandson of an assistant	14:46
11			commissioner. I asked him in the context of it being	
12			treated in Crime and Security, that particular side of	
13			the house, you know, was there any likelihood that my	
14			phone would be intercepted, and he said to me that it	
15			was very likely that it was.	14:46
16	609	Q.	And did he say anything about media coverage in	
17			relation to Sergeant McCabe?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	610	Q.	Did you make any notes of any of those meetings,	
20			anything like that?	14:46
21		Α.	Not of those three meetings, I didn't, No.	
22	611	Q.	Okay. Now, insofar as he said to you that it may be	
23			likely that your phone had been intercepted, did you	
24			make any inquiries yourself on foot of that piece of	
25			information?	14:46
26		Α.	Yes, I did. I had had a concern earlier on that my	
27			phone may have been intercepted, and that arose from	
28			discussions I had had with Sergeant McCabe, because he	
29			would repeatedly get me to phone him on different	

1			phones and he had a phone behaviour that, you know I	
2			asked him one time, why do you do this? And he said,	
3			because it's possible our calls are being listened to.	
4			On that occasion, I asked Assistant Commissioner	
5			Twomey, who was well known to me and somebody I	14:47
6			respected and trusted, and he reassured me that that	
7			wouldn't be the case, so I was happy on that occasion.	
8			When Superintendent Taylor implied to me that or	
9			told me that it was likely that my phone was being	
10			intercepted, I thought that was more formal, and I took	14:47
11			it upon myself to ring the then-Commissioner Nóirín	
12			O'Sullivan and I asked her formally was my phone	
13			intercepted, being intercepted, and was it on the list	
14			that is overseen by the justice, there's a process for	
15			overseeing the interception of telephone traffic and	14:47
16			it's monitored independently by justice, and I	
17			specifically asked her if my name and my phone was on	
18			that list.	
19			CHAIRMAN: It has to be authorised by a High Court	
20			judge.	14:47
21		Α.	Okay, sorry, Chair, I'm not familiar with the process.	
22			I just knew that there was a justice who had some	
23			oversight.	
24			CHAIRMAN: A justice is a what? Do you mean the	
25			Department of Justice or	14:48
26		Α.	Sorry, I mean a High Court judge. Apologies,	
27			apologies.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
29	612	Q.	MS. LEADER: And I think the then-Commissioner	

Т			o Suffivan got back to you and provided you with some	
2			reassurance, is that correct?	
3		Α.	That's correct. Commissioner O'Sullivan came back to	
4			me and told me that it wasn't on the list of phones	
5			being intercepted as part of routine Garda work and	14:48
6			that my phone wasn't intercepted, and I took that at	
7			face value.	
8	613	Q.	Now, did you know Commissioner O'Sullivan prior to	
9			then? Had you spoken to her?	
10		Α.	Yes. I would have known Commissioner O'Sullivan when	14:48
11			she was deputy commissioner operations, because she	
12			would have had oversight of the traffic enforcement	
13			side of the Garda Síochána, and I would have had a	
14			limited amount of dealings with her.	
15	614	Q.	Okay. And in any of those dealings with former	14:48
16			Commissioner O'Sullivan, was there any discussion about	
17			Sergeant McCabe?	
18		Α.	Absolutely not. I can be very clear: no garda of any	
19			rank, of Commissioner down to garda rank, has ever	
20			raised with me any issues in relation to Sergeant	14:49
21			McCabe, ever.	
22	615	Q.	I suppose just to be specific about it, in relation to	
23			former Commissioner Callinan, has there been any	
24			discussion between you and him in relation to Sergeant	
25			McCabe?	14:49
26		Α.	Absolutely not, absolutely not.	
27	616	Q.	So the only discussion you had amongst the guards in	
28			relation to Sergeant McCabe was with	
29			Superintendent Taylor, is that correct?	

Т		Α.	That's correct.	
2	617	Q.	And Assistant Commissioner Twomey, insofar as you were	
3			notifying him of the alleged irregularities in the	
4			fixed charge penalty notice system back in 2012?	
5		Α.	That's correct.	14:49
6			MS. LEADER: If you would answer any questions anybody	
7			else might have.	
8		Α.	Thank you.	
9				
10			MR. BRETT WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McDOWELL:	14:49
11				
12	618	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: Just briefly, Mr. Brett. Michael	
13			McDowell is my name and I am one of the counsel for	
14			Sergeant McCabe. Sergeant McCabe has a recollection	
15			that you informed him that Commissioner Callinan had	14:50
16			become very angry in the course of a meeting you had	
17			with him. Does that ring a bell with you?	
18		Α.	Yes. I was asked by the inspectors about this, from	
19			the Tribunal.	
20	619	Q.	The investigators, yes.	14:50
21		Α.	Yeah, sorry, the Tribunal investigators. My assumption	
22			is that that refers to a meeting which was held at	
23			Garda Headquarters to discuss routine road safety	
24			business and it was a periodic meeting attended by my	
25			then-chairman, Gay Byrne, myself, the Commissioner and	14:50
26			some of his top team, to address general road safety	
27			performance issues. During that meeting	
28			then-Commissioner Callinan became quite annoyed with me	
29			on a particular topic and it became quite heated, so	

_			much so that we actually reft. That meeting, because	
2			of the number of people present, perhaps gained some	
3			currency out there. I think Sergeant McCabe may have	
4			heard about that meeting and asked me about it, and I	
5			did tell him that the Commissioner had become quite	14:51
6			annoyed. However, I must be clear that Sergeant McCabe	
7			and the penalty point issues were absolutely not	
8			mentioned in that meeting. I have never ever had a	
9			discussion with Commissioner Callinan about Sergeant	
10			McCabe.	14:51
11	620	Q.	It's just that Sergeant McCabe made a protected	
12			disclosure, and I just want to put to you that his	
13			understanding was, and he doesn't want to have a major	
14			dispute with you on this, but his understanding was	
15			that you had on one occasion told him that the	14:51
16			Commissioner had become very angry in the context of a	
17			discussion on Sergeant McCabe, and that his	
18			recollection was that the Commissioner, the veins stood	
19			out in his neck in an altercation with you on that	
20			matter.	14:51
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	621	Q.	Have you anything to say about that?	
23		Α.	The altercation or the I wouldn't describe it as an	
24			altercation. The heated exchange between myself and	
25			the Commissioner was to do with a road safety	14:51
26			performance issue in An Garda Síochána. It was	
27			absolutely not to do with Sergeant McCabe. And I did	
28			tell Sergeant McCabe about the meeting. But there was	
29			never a discussion about Sergeant McCahe And T	

Т			wouldn't have told him that. So I think there's a	
2			difference there.	
3	622	Q.	Maybe a misunderstanding, or whatever?	
4		Α.	Well, all I can say to you is that I am very, very	
5			clear, and there were so many people present, Sergeant	14:52
6			McCabe was not discussed in that meeting.	
7			MR. McDOWELL: I see. Thank you.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Were the veins bulging out on his neck?	
9		Α.	I can't recollect. It was a heated exchange, so much	
10			so that Gay Byrne and I left.	14:52
11			CHAIRMAN: Is that the kind of thing you would say?	
12		Α.	I honestly can't recollect, Chairman.	
13			CHAIRMAN: You can't recollect.	
14		Α.	Yeah.	
15			MR. McDOWELL: I don't want to put it further than	14:52
16			that, Chairman.	
17			CHAIRMAN: No, no, it is fine. I understand.	
18			MR. McDOWELL: Sergeant McCabe was under the impression	
19			that he was the subject of the conversation, and now we	
20			hear he wasn't.	14:52
21			CHAIRMAN: It seems not. So it was about Garda	
22			performance and checkpoints, the kind of thing that is	
23			necessary to keep drivers behaving themselves?	
24		Α.	That's correct, Chair. It was a short number of weeks,	
25			maybe perhaps a few months, after I had formally made	14:52
26			the referrals, and, you know, I felt there was a	
27			certain hostility towards me because I had done that.	
28			That was my assumption. But it was primarily about	
29			road safety and Garda activity	

1			CHAIRMAN: Yes. You put it down to human interaction,	
2			the importance of the subject.	
3		Α.	Absolutely.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Fair enough.	
5			MR. MCDOWELL: I'm happy with that.	14:53
6			CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, do you have any questions?	
7				
8			MR. BRETT WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS:	
9				
10	623	Q.	MS. BURNS: Good afternoon, Mr. Brett. My name is Tara	14:53
11			Burns and I'm appearing on behalf of Superintendent	
12			Taylor. You've indicated to Ms. Leader that you had a	
13			number of meetings with Superintendent Taylor. I take	
14			it from your evidence that you're indicating they	
15			occurred after you had completed your role with the	14:53
16			Road Safety Authority, is that correct?	
17		Α.	Yes, that's correct, all three, and the reason I'm	
18			certain of that is they took place in my current office	
19			in Nassau Street in Dublin. And I started in that job	
20			in October 2013.	14:53
21	624	Q.	I see. Now, in relation to that, it seems that your	
22			evidence in terms of the first meeting that you	
23			recollect occurring, that you recollect that occurring	
24			at a time when Superintendent Taylor provided you with	
25			his thesis, is that correct?	14:54
26		Α.	That's correct, but I don't have a diary date, whether	
27			it was late whether it was between October and	
28			December 2013 or whether it was into 2014 or even into	
29			2015, I don't recall. I'm very, very clear that the	

1			second two meetings took place after he was arrested	
2			and suspended.	
3	625	Q.	I see. And that is what I was wondering about. I take	
4			it when he was providing his thesis to you that it was	
5			a completed article at that stage?	14:54
6		Α.	I can't be certain. I think he was in the process of	
7			being ready to submit, is my memory.	
8	626	Q.	I see.	
9		Α.	It was a printed thesis, it wasn't a bound thesis.	
10	627	Q.	Certainly my instructions in relation to that is that	14:54
11			the thesis was completed and was to be submitted and he	
12			provided it to you. I think you discussed a thesis	
13			that you also were doing at the time, is that right?	
14		Α.	No.	
15	628	Q.	No?	14:54
16		Α.	I wasn't doing a thesis, no.	
17	629	Q.	Can you recollect how it came about that he was	
18			providing his thesis to you? Was it just out of the	
19			blue, or had there been any discussion about it?	
20		Α.	I actually don't remember what the subject matter of	14:55
21			the thesis was. I do know I did receive it. He	
22			contacted me by text to say could he come in. He came	
23			in, I made him a cup of coffee or a cup of tea, he	
24			talked about the course he was doing and he gave me the	
25			thesis, he said "you might be interested in it". I	14:55
26			think it may have been something to do about policing	
27			structures.	

fact completed his thesis, he completed that in early

28 630 Q. Yes, yes. In relation to that, in terms of when he in

- 2 2016. Do you take issue with that being the first time he perhaps had come into the office?
- A. No, I don't. All I can say is, I am just certain it
 happened in Dublin and I'm very certain about the
 second two meetings, in that they happened after his
 suspension and when he was off duty. I'm not clear of
 the time-line. I just know it was after I started in
 the RSA.

14:55

14:56

- 9 631 Q. I see.
- 10 A. And I wouldn't dispute his time-line.
- 11 632 Q. In terms of him visiting you again, he doesn't have a 12 recollection of coming into the office, but it 13 certainly seems to be from your evidence that you do 14 have a recollection of further meetings with him?
- 15 A. Oh, absolutely. There were definitely two further
 16 meetings, absolutely, I mean -- absolutely, yeah.
- Now, in relation to the discussions that you had with
 Superintendent Taylor and specifically in relation to
 your phone and Maurice McCabe and the computer system
 in Crime and Security, can you recollect how that
 conversation came to pass?
- 22 That was in one of the second two meetings. Α. Em, yes. 23 He was describing, explaining to me just his own 24 predicament in terms of being off work, off pay, all of 25 those issues, and he was explaining to me just how serious, what he would describe as senior management, 26 27 in his own case, Commissioner O'Sullivan, and in the case of Sergeant McCabe particularly, it would have 28 29 been Commissioner Callinan he was referring to, how

1 seriously they were taking the issue, and he went on 2 then to explain and illustrate that by saying this is 3 being dealt with, Sergeant McCabe issues are actually being dealt with in Crime and Security, they even have 4 5 this standalone computer system, it's called Oisín, 14:57 it's named after an assistant commissioner's grandson, 6 and the fact that it is Crime and Security, kind of in 7 8 Garda parlance, gives it a certain status. I see. Now, in relation to that, was that the first 9 634 Q. time you heard of anything to do with a computer 10 14:57 11 system, Oisín, or Sergeant McCabe's phone? 12 I'd never heard about the computer system, Oisín, ever Α. 13 before then. It was news to me. It was the first time 14 I ever heard about it. 635 15 You hadn't heard about that from Sergeant McCabe, had Q. 14:57 16 you? 17 No, absolutely not. Α. 18 But Sergeant McCabe had discussed with you concerns he 636 Q. 19 had in relation to his phone, is that right? Well, I would occasionally text or ring Sergeant 20 Α. 14:57 McCabe, because I genuinely believed the man and I was 21 22 satisfied with the information he had given me that I had referred on, and I noticed that he changed his 23 24 behaviour, he would get me to ring him on a landline or 25 do different things, and I asked him upfront, why have 14:57 26 you done this? Are you concerned? Why is this? And 27 he said, I'm concerned that our conversation may be

I suppose what I am asking you, Mr. Brett, just to cut

intercepted.

28

29

637

Q.

1		over you, you had had that discussion with Sergeant
2		McCabe prior to you then having the discussion with
3		Superintendent Taylor in relation to this?
4	Α.	Yes, that's correct. There were two separate issues

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

Yes, that's correct. There were two separate issues of Α. concern about my phone. The first was with Sergeant McCabe that led me to ask Assistant Commissioner Twomey if it was possible. I got a reassurance. The second one was when Superintendent Taylor told me that it was likely in the context of it being handled by Crime and That prompted me to go more formal and ring security. Commissioner O'Sullivan, or maybe Acting Assistant --Acting Commissioner O'Sullivan, I'm not sure what she was at that date, and ask her upfront, formally, and she came back to me and told me that it wasn't.

14:58

14 · 58

- So I take it from that answer that your initial 14:58 15 638 Q. I see. 16 information in relation to Sergeant McCabe's phone possibly being monitored, if we put it that way, that 17 18 firstly came from Sergeant McCabe. You then, in the 19 course of a discussion which occurred some time after 20 Superintendent Taylor provides you with his thesis and after he is arrested, that you then have a discussion 21 22 with Superintendent Taylor in relation to that, and, on 23 foot of all of that, you then speak to superintendent 24 Twomey, is that correct?
- The first -- when I became -- when I had the 25 Α. 14:59 discussion with Sergeant McCabe, I rang Assistant 26 27 Commissioner Twomey, whom I trusted and knew very, very 28 well, I asked him, he gave me assurance that it 29 wouldn't happen. It was when I met with

- 1 Superintendent Taylor, possibly on the second occasion,
- or maybe the third, but not the first, when -- because
- 3 the mood had changed between the thesis and the
- 4 suspension, when he said it to me that it was likely, I
- then took it more formally with the Commissioner, with
- 6 Nóirín O'Sullivan.
- 7 639 Q. I see. My apologies for my misputting them into line.
- 8 A. Okay.
- 9 640 Q. Just in relation to the conversation you had regarding
- the Oisín computer system, Superintendent Taylor agrees 14:59
- 11 that this was discussed with you. However, his
- instructions to me are that that arose from a
- conversation that you brought up in relation to
- 14 Sergeant McCabe's phone.
- A. Sorry, you're asking me about the computer system Oisin 15:00
- or about the phone?
- 17 641 Q. Yes, that discussion that you had emanated from you
- bringing up the question as to whether it was likely
- 19 that your phone had been intercepted?
- 20 A. Yeah, I asked him, in the context of him describing to

- 21 me this case of Sergeant McCabe being dealt with in
- 22 Crime and Security, in my mind that denotes a very
- particular kind of case, because he told me that, I
- said, gosh, Crime and Security, you know, would they be
- listening to my phone? And he said very likely.
- 26 642 Q. I see.
- 27 A. So that is what prompted me -- that's what prompted
- that.
- MS. BURNS: Thank you very much, Mr. Brett.

		Α.	mank you. mank you, charman.	
2			CHAIRMAN: In terms of the conversation, Ms. Burns,	
3			there's no difference between you really?	
4			MS. BURNS: No, Judge.	
5			CHAIRMAN: As far as I can see, there is none.	15:00
6			MS. BURNS: No, Chairman.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Yes. All right. Was there any other	
8			questions? Mr. Barton?	
9			MR. BARTON: No, thank you, Chairman.	
10			MR. DIGNAM: Chairman, I have just have some questions	15:01
11			for Mr. Brett.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
13				
14			MR. BRETT WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM:	
15				15:01
16	643	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Mr. Brett, my name is Conor Dignam. I	
17			appear on behalf of An Garda Síochána, and I have some	
18			questions for you on behalf particularly of former	
19			Commissioner Callinan, and I am going to try and do it	
20			quite quickly because in many respects I just want to	15:01
21			go through your statement and interview that you had	
22			with the Tribunal investigators for the purpose of	
23			clarification of some points, Mr. Brett, so I don't	
24			intend to dwell on any points, and we should be able to	
25			get through it reasonably quickly, in everybody's	15:01
26			interests.	
27		Α.	Thank you.	
28	644	Q.	Just firstly, in relation to the question that	
29			Mr. McDowell had asked you about Sergeant McCabe's	

Т			statement and protected disclosure about the	
2			conversation which he claimed that you told him about	
3			having with former Commissioner Callinan, if I can just	
4			ask you to go to page 3 of your interview, which is	
5			page 1532 of the booklet. You will see that you are	15:01
6			asked a question on line 35 of that interview, the	
7			investigators put to you an extract from the statement	
8			made by Sergeant McCabe to the Disclosures Tribunal on	
9			the 15th March 2017, and I quote, this is Sergeant	
10			McCabe's statement to the Tribunal:	15:02
11				
12			"I am aware that former Commissioner Callinan	
13			interviewed Noel Brett, the former Chairman of the Road	
14			Safety Authority, and angrily denounced me to him.	
15			Noel Brett later on told me about the hostile behaviour	15:02
16			he endured and how angry Martin Callinan was and that	
17			senior officers were sent to his home shortly after a	
18			family bereavement to interview him. Mr. Faughnan of	
19			the AA Roadwatch was questioned about this meeting with	
20			me and what documents were given to him. He was	15:02
21			sufficiently concerned with the tone of the meeting	
22			with senior gardaí that he had to take legal advice."	
23				
24			Now, I think that is the passage that, in effect,	
25			Mr. McDowell was asking you about. Did Commissioner	15:03
26			Callinan ever denounce Sergeant McCabe to you?	
27		Α.	Absolutely not.	
28	645	Q.	You never I think your evidence was that, in fact,	
29			vou never discussed Sergeant McCahe with Commissioner	

1	~ 11	1-1000
⊥	Cai	linan?

- 2 Yes, there was never, ever a discussion between I --Α. 3 and nor would I, because I was the person who had formally referred it back in 2012 to GSOC and the C&AG, 4 and I believed Sergeant McCabe and I believed this 5 15:03 would end up in a forum like this, so I was very clear 6 7 I would never, ever discuss it with the Commissioner. 8 what I just want to clarify for you, when you read me out the piece there and the reference to Conor Faughnan 9 being concerned at the tone of the meeting with senior 10 15:03 11 gardaí, I understand that refers to the two gardaí that 12 came to interview me and interview Conor Faughnan. 13 doesn't refer to the meeting with the Commissioner.
- 14 646 Q. No, no, I think that is right, and that is my
 15 understanding as well, Mr. Brett. I will ask you about 15:04
 16 that interview in just a few moments.
- 17 A. Okay.
- 18 647 Q. I can tell you, Mr. Brett, that Commissioner Callinan
 19 accepts that there was a heated exchange that night,
 20 and that he, in fact, phoned you later on that evening to apologise, I think, for having that heated exchange with you.
- 23 A. That's correct.
- 24 648 Q. I think it was about tachographs or some enforcement
 25 issue. But can you offer any enlightenment, Mr. Brett, 15:04
 26 as to how Sergeant McCabe could have formed the
 27 impression or could have made a statement that you had
 28 angrily denounced Sergeant McCabe to Commissioner
 29 Callinan?

- 1 A. That the Commissioner had denounced him to me?
- 2 649 Q. Yes. Sorry.
- 3 A. I don't know. I am absolutely clear that I did have a
- 4 discussion with Sergeant McCabe and I did tell him
- about the tone of that meeting and the way that myself

15:05

15:05

15:05

- 6 and my then-chairman were treated. It was so heated
- 7 that we actually left.
- 8 650 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. And, you know, I would have shared that with Sergeant 10 McCabe, absolutely.
- 11 651 Q. And I think you fairly said that you were in contact

 12 with Sergeant McCabe. You had concerns for him. First

 13 of all, you accepted the concerns that he raised about

 14 the fixed penalty points system, and that you were

 15 concerned for him and kept in touch with him to offer
- 16 support?
- 17 A. Yes, I tried to do that. And I would say to you, about
- 18 the meeting in the -- with the Commissioner, there were
- a lot of people present in that room, and the news of
- 20 that meeting and of the interaction spread, so much so
- 21 that I was out a few weeks before Easter and somebody
- said to me in a public venue, you know, "that should
- never have happened to you". So it was well-known
- 24 throughout -- throughout An Garda Síochána and
- 25 throughout the public service what had happened.
- 26 652 Q. Yes.
- 27 A. So, you know, Sergeant McCabe may have heard it from
- any source. But I'm very, very clear that I absolutely
- told him about the way I felt I had been treated. And

1			in my mind, I probably was forming the view that the	
2			treatment I got was because I had made the referral to	
3			GSOC at the C&AG, but I stand over that.	
4	653	Q.	And did you ever ask Commissioner Callinan that, did	
5			you ever say that to him?	15:06
6		Α.	No, I never discussed it with him again. He phoned, he	
7			said, look, I'm sorry, that shouldn't have happened,	
8			I'm under a lot of pressure. I said, look, forget	
9			about it, it doesn't matter, and I continued.	
10	654	Q.	Now, in relation then to the you mentioned the	15:06
11			interview by two gardaí. On page 4 of your	
12			statement or your interview, rather, which is page	
13			1533, again you're asked to comment on a statement by	
14			Sergeant McCabe, and Sergeant McCabe says sorry,	
15			I've already put this quote to you, but specifically	15:06
16			Sergeant McCabe is quoted as saying:	
17				
18			"I'm aware that former Commissioner Callinan	
19			interviewed Noel Brett, the former chairman of the Road	
20			Safety Authority and angrily denounced me to him. Noel	15:06
21			Brett later on told me about the hostile behaviour he	
22			endured and how angry Martin Callinan was and that	
23			senior officers were sent to his home shortly after a	
24			family bereavement to interview him."	
25				15:07
26			Now, as I read that, and you might correct me if you	
27			have a different impression, as I read that, there is a	
28			link being drawn between your interview by two senior	
29			officers, as they're described, and the denouncement of	

- Sergeant McCabe that is described in the first part of that passage.
- A. Well, I don't know. I mean, I can clarify for you what the interview was and --

15:07

5 655 Q. Yes, I was going to ask you about that.

6 A. Yes.

- 7 656 Q. Firstly, there seems to be a suggestion there that
 8 there was something inappropriate or wrong in relation
 9 to that interview. Do you consider it to have been an
 10 inappropriate or wrong interview or process that was
 11 engaged in? And I will ask you about the details of
 12 the process then?
- 13 Yeah, okay. No, I don't. There was an allegation that Α. 14 Sergeant McCabe had breached the Data Protection Act by 15 giving me the information and that I had then sent it 15:07 16 on and I had it in my possession and had kept it in my 17 possession. The issue -- certainly, they did not come 18 to my home and it was not shortly after a family 19 bereavement. It was before a family bereavement. I had actually taken those weeks off, my dad was dying at 15:08 20 that time, they contacted me, the detective 21 22 superintendent contacted me, and I said, look, I'll be 23 back in Dublin hopefully next week. And he said, no, 24 no, this has to happen now. I said, well, I'm in Mayo. 25 He said, that's fine, we'll come to Mayo, we'll be 15:08 26 there in the morning. And it took place at the Garda 27 station in Castlebar. And I was very clear, they were 28 extremely polite and extremely professional, and I 29 think I've said that in my statement.

- 1 657 Q. You did, yes.
- 2 A. But it struck me that they were seeking to prosecute
- 3 Sergeant McCabe, and I was concerned that I might get
- 4 prosecuted too.
- 5 658 Q. Yes. And was that -- I think part of the disclosure
- 6 which had been made to you by Sergeant McCabe, in that

15:09

15:09

15.00

- 7 disclosure there was a particular case, isn't that
- 8 right, but I don't want to get into the details or I
- 9 don't want to identify any individuals, there was a
- 10 particular claim or allegation made that a member of
- the board of the RSA had had penalty points quashed,
- isn't that right?
- 13 A. In the dossier that I was given, there were two -- it
- was alleged that two members of the board of the
- authority, so my board, if you like, I was reporting to 15:09
- this board, had had penalty points quashed one of
- them on two occasions and a second person on one
- 18 occasion.
- 19 659 Q. Yes. And that was stated, I think, to Conor Faughnan
- of the AA in the first instance, and then you
- 21 subsequently met Sergeant McCabe, and I think he
- 22 personally said that to you, isn't that right?
- A. Well, Conor Faughnan only mentioned one board member to
- me, he wasn't aware of the second. It was when I met
- 25 Sergeant McCabe and took possession of the dossier and
- 26 went through it in detail in the context of me having a
- 27 responsibility for the administration of penalty points
- that it became clear this there was a second board
- 29 member, potentially a second board member. And

subsequently that turned out to be a case of two people 1 2 in the same village with the same name, but it wasn't actually the board member, so it ended up with one 3 4 board member who had an allegation of it -- having 5 penalty points quashed on two occasions. When I met 15:10 6 that person and discussed it with them, it turned out 7 that it had actually happened on three occasions. And in relation to the person whose identity was 8 660 Q. 9 confused with another person, how significant would that have been (a) for the individual and (b) for the 10 15:10 11 board if it had emerged that penalty points had been 12 quashed? 13 If it was a proven issue, it would have been very Α. 14 significant for the board of the Road Safety Authority. If it was a case that a board member who was tasked 15 15:10 16 with overseeing my work and the statutory work of the 17 authority was availing of quashing of penalty points, 18 well clearly there would be -- it would be a huge issue 19 of credibility. And I think to your credit, you treated it extremely 20 661 Q. 15:10 seriously. According to your first statement, the 21 22 original statement that you made to the Tribunal, you 23 almost immediately, I think, contacted the Chairman of 24 the board, you met him I think the very next day or 25 possibly even that evening, I don't need to get into 15:11 26 these details, Mr. Brett, and, in fact, there was a

isn't that right?

board meeting scheduled for the very next day, and this

was dealt with by the board before the agenda items,

27

28

29

- A. Yeah, that's correct. I've set out the chronology in my initial statement.
- 3 662 Q. Yes?
- 4 A. And those are from contemporaneous notes at the time.
- 5 663 Q. So you fully appreciated the significance of a board, a 15:11 board member possibly having penalty points quashed and the credibility -- or the impact that would have on the work of the RSA and on the individual?
- 9 A. Yes, that's correct. I mean, in terms of good
 10 governance clearly you couldn't have a board or indeed 15:11
 11 myself as CEO being in that situation. You just would
 12 not have credibility.
- 13 664 Q. And it emerged then that in fact in one of the
 14 instances the person identified wasn't in fact the
 15 board member, it was simply a person of the same name? 15:11
- 16 A. The person of a same name in the same village, yes, correct.
- 18 665 Q. And it had been Sergeant McCabe who had told you that it was an RSA board member?
- 20 A. Well, it was contained in the dossier.
- 21 666 Q. Yes. And then to Sergeant McCabe's credit I think he 22 came to you a few days later, isn't that right, to say 23 in fact that's not the RSA board member?

15.12

A. Well, I was dealing with this matter with the Chairman and the board, this was a serious matter. I had contacted both of the board members that were named and told them exactly what was here and the Chairman had met one of them individually and had briefed the Minister. The second person said to me, look it, this

Т			is not me or this is not true. So I went back to	
2			Sergeant McCabe and said you need to double-check what	
3			you're saying about this individual and in fairness to	
4			Sergeant McCabe he did that and he came back and	
5			clarified that it was a person of the same name in the	15:12
6			same village, which in I don't want to name the	
7			county, but you can see how that would happen.	
8	667	Q.	Yes. Did he explain why he hadn't done that	
9			double-check before he passed the information to you?	
10		Α.	We didn't have that discussion.	15:12
11	668	Q.	Okay. Now was it that individual, and I may be wrong	
12			in this, Mr. Brett, so please correct me if I am, was	
13			it that individual who had made a complaint about	
14			his about the disclosure of data?	
15		Α.	No.	15:13
16	669	Q.	No?	
17		Α.	It was the individual with the three instances that led	
18			to the Garda interview of me and the Data Protection	
19			Commissioner also interviewing me under caution.	
20	670	Q.	Sorry, I was going to ask you that. There was a	15:13
21			separate Data Protection Commissioner investigation	
22			which is independent of An Garda Síochána?	
23		Α.	That took place in 2016 because the board member made	
24			the original complaint, the guards interviewed me, it	
25			didn't go anywhere and he remade the complaint in a	15:13
26			different format and the Data Protection Commissioner	
27			then interviewed me under caution and as I understand	
28			it, it didn't go any further.	
29	671	0.	Now if I can just ask you briefly then. Mr. Brett. just	

1			about technology matters. You have no knowledge other	
2			than what Superintendent Taylor told you about Oisin	
3			computers and Crime and Security issues, you've no	
4			direct knowledge of any of that, is that right?	
5		Α.	Absolutely not.	15:14
6	672	Q.	Yes?	
7		Α.	At the time of all of this I absolutely had not. And	
8			you know, so I wouldn't have. In my role as a board	
9			member of the Road Safety Authority subsequently I do	
10			have some knowledge. But at the time all this was	15:14
11			going on I had absolutely nothing. And I know nothing	
12			about the Oisin computer system. That is the only time	
13			I ever heard it mentioned.	
14	673	Q.	I don't propose asking you about it so, Mr. Brett, just	
15			to say that in fact that allegation I think was made in	15:14
16			Superintendent Taylor's protected disclosure also. In	
17			fact, the assistant commissioner who is named as having	
18			a grandson after which the computer system is named	
19			doesn't in fact have a grandson of that name?	
20		Α.	It's irrelevant to me. I don't know anything about	15:14
21			that.	
22	674	Q.	In relation then to the phone, the alleged phone	
23			interception, in fairness to Sergeant McCabe he didn't	
24			say to you watch your phones, they may be intercepted,	
25			you asked him about it because of his behaviour or	15:14
26			manner of contacting you or asking you to contact him	

28

29

Α.

on different numbers at different times, is that right?

That's correct. His behaviour changed. I asked him

why. He said because the call may be intercepted and

- that is what prompted me to contact Assistant
 Commissioner Twomey and ask him to get reassurance.
- 3 675 Q. Yes. You then left the Road Safety Authority in
 4 October 2013 and you've had three meetings with
 5 Superintendent Taylor: One at some point relatively 15:15
 6 shortly after October 2013, some time in the year or so
 7 after, that is the impression I have from what you are
 8 saying, but you can't put a specific date on it?
- 9 A. Well, I would be happy to accept it's from whenever he
 10 was ready to submit his thesis. So if I am told by his 15:15
 11 barrister it's 2016 I have no difficulty with that.
- 12 676 Q. The second and third both seem to have happened, if I
 13 understand your evidence correctly, after his arrest
 14 and suspension?
- 15 A. That's correct. And I wouldn't even have described
 16 them as meetings. He would have called him. I don't
 17 even think they're in my diary.
- 18 677 Q. Yes. At that stage he indicated that he believed your phone may have been intercepted?
- Not as baldly as that. He was explaining to me about 20 Α. 15:16 the way Sergeant McCabe was being treated, the fact 21 22 that it was being dealt with in Crime and Security, the 23 fact that they were out to get him, the fact that, you 24 know, they'd stop at nothing to get him, if you like, 25 and I kind of said, gosh, Crime and Security, does that 15:16 26 mean my phone would be intercepted and he said that's 27 That's what prompted me to formally contacted the Commissioner and ask her, but ask her -- I asked 28 29 her a very pointed question, you know: Is my phone

1			intercepted and is it done formally with the High Court	
2			Judge?	
3	678	Q.	In those conversations in 2016 and I think, sorry, just	
4			to try and pinpoint it in time, Mr. Brett, I think it's	
5			likely to have been late 2016 when you had that	15:17
6			conversation with Superintendent Taylor because in your	
7			interview with the investigators you say that it's	
8			likely that you had a	
9				
10			"I can't be specific as to the date that	15:17
11			Superintendent Taylor warned me about my engagement	
12			with Sergeant McCabe but it's likely that it may have	
13			been in 2016 as this is what prompted me to contact	
14			former Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan."	
15				15:17
16			And earlier in your interview a few lines above that	
17			you had said that you made that call to former	
18			Commissioner O'Sullivan in late 2016.	
19		Α.	I honestly, Chairman, cannot be clear with you on the	
20			date. I know it was I was actually working in my	15:17
21			Brussels office and I rang her from Brussels, because I	
22			remember where I was when I made the call, but I cannot	
23			be specific. And I have checked through my diary, I	
24			didn't make a diary entry, it was literally I	
25			thought I was finished with all of this when I referred	15:17
26			to GSOC and C&AG and I didn't treat it as something to	
27			make a note.	
28	679	Q.	And do I understand you correctly to say that during	
29			the course of those conversations Superintendent Taylor	

Τ			was at that stage telling you that the Gardai had been	
2			trying to do down Sergeant McCabe or trying to fight	
3			against him or whatever phrase you used in your	
4			evidence? Is it at that stage that he was giving that	
5			information?	15:18
6		Α.	It was during the second or third meeting that he was	
7			explaining in terms of how serious An Garda Síochána	
8			were taking the Sergeant McCabe issue that it was being	
9			managed in Crime and Security. Now, because I have	
LO			worked alongside An Garda Síochána for many years I	15:18
L1			understand what Crime and Security means as opposed to	
L2			it's in B division or D division or whatever. So that	
L3			intimated to me that there was a very particular focus	
L4			being taken on Sergeant McCabe. He then I would	
L5			have replied God, Crime and Security, gosh, that's a	15:18
L6			serious place, if you like, and he went on then to tell	
L7			me about this Oisin computer system and I would have	
L8			instinctively said, gosh, if Crime and Security are	
L9			dealing with this, you know, does that mean my phone is	
20			being listened to, and he said it's likely and I then	15:19
21			contacted the Commissioner.	
22	680	Q.	When Superintendent Taylor was referring to that, was	
23			he speaking in the present tense? Was he saying in	
24			late 2016 this was going on?	
25			CHAIRMAN: I must say I'm finding that very pretty	15:19
26			hard the difference between 2013 and 2016 is really	
27			very, very stark.	
28			MR. DIGNAM: That is what I want to explore.	

CHAIRMAN: And as to whether it is, you know,

Т		completing a thesis, beginning a thesis, having a	
2		thesis in draft, I just don't see how someone can make	
3		an error of three years. But there it is. It doesn't	
4		make sense to me now.	
5	Α.	I'm not trying to be in any way evasive, I just	15:19
6		genuinely do not know when the meeting took place. I	
7		do know that the first time he came to my office he was	
8		carrying a thesis. It wasn't a bound thesis. But	
9		clearly he had to have completed his thesis and if his	
10		barrister is saying to me	15:19
11		CHAIRMAN: It was bound in kind of blue buckram?	
12	Α.	No. It was just loose leaf. Photocopy.	
13		CHAIRMAN: That doesn't mean anything.	
14	Α.	Well, it was a thesis, he gave it to me and I did read	
15		it.	15:20
16		CHAIRMAN: What people are obliged to do when they	
17		complete a thesis is to actually get it professionally	
18		bound.	
19	Α.	Yes.	
20		CHAIRMAN: There's a shop there on Wexford Street,	15:20
21		isn't there	
22	Α.	I understand.	
23		CHAIRMAN: and you go into there, and you get that	
24		done. There's other places too. But it wasn't in that	
25		format?	15:20
26	Α.	No, it absolutely was not a bound thesis. But I am	
27		happy to accept the date, the timeframe that the	
28		barrister Superintendent Taylor's barrister gives.	
29		The reason T mentioned 2013 is T know it was in Dublin	

and I know it was after I arrived there. So I'm quite 1 happy to accept that timeframe of 2016. 2 3 CHAIRMAN: You may be, but I may not be. Sorry, Chairman. 4 Α. 5 CHAIRMAN: It's okay. You're trying to be helpful and 6 I appreciate that. 7 681 MR. DIGNAM: Mr. Brett, I think my question was that Q. 8 when -- you're quite sure that that conversation in 9 relation to the Garda opposition to Sergeant McCabe, if I may put it that way, happened in the second or third 10 11 meeting and you're quite sure that the second and third 12 meetings happened in 2016? 13 Yes. Α. 14 682 0. whatever about when the first meeting happened? 15 That's correct. Α. 15:21 Now --16 683 Ο. 17 And, as I say, the reason I can date those after 2016 Α. 18 is because I know that Superintendent Taylor was 19 suspended at that time. 20 684 Yes? Q. 15:21 So that is why I am very certain as to the timeframe of 21 Α. 22 Because that is what he was discussing with me. As a matter of interest, how did you know he was 23 685 Q. 24 suspended? Because he told me. 25 Α. 15:21 Right, okay. Was he was giving you this account --26 686 Ο. 27 this was my original question, Mr. Brett, was he giving 28 you this as happening in the present tense, in other

words in 2016, or something that had happened in

29

previous years:	1	previous	years?
-----------------	---	----------	--------

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

A. No, I took it from him that it was in the past tense.

I didn't feel my phone was then being actively -- you
know, I felt it was at the time.

687 So to come to a conclusion then, Mr. Brett, in your Q. 15:21 interview with the investigators and indeed in your original statement you refer to contacting Sergeant McCabe about -- in your interview, newspaper reports, about him not cooperating with the O'Mahony investigation and in your original statement you deal 15:22 with the meeting that you had in the Department of Justice at the request of the Minister for Transport and Tourism at the time. And your statement doesn't say it, but I read it as meaning that there had been a discussion at that meeting, I am looking at paragraph 15:22 29, on page 1558, that there had been a discussion at that meeting of Sergeant McCabe not cooperating with the O'Mahony investigation. I think you've confirmed that in your evidence in response to Ms. Leader's questions. You then say that you contacted Sergeant 15:22 McCabe immediately after the meeting to check whether he had cooperated and you had already had that conversation with him, so you had a good idea what the answer was I think. I just want to ask, were you aware either from the Department of Justice meeting or indeed 15:23 from Sergeant McCabe of the Commissioner having sent a letter to Sergeant McCabe in December 2012, whether you know the detailed date or anything like that, had you an awareness of a letter having been sent asking or

1			directing him to stop downloading matters from Pulse	
2			and pointing him in the direction of the O'Mahony	
3			investigation if he had any further concerns?	
4		Α.	No, I wasn't at all. And just to be clear, if I texted	
5			Sergeant McCabe or phoned any time, I would never be	15:23
6			discussing the detail. It was literally to say I hope	
7			you're okay, is there anything you need, keep your chin	
8			up. It was that type I wasn't discussing so I	
9			wouldn't have any line of sight on internal	
LO			communication or direction he might get. I have to say	15:24
L1			to you that when I phoned him after the meeting with	
L2			Minister Shatter I was quite annoyed, because I	
L3			believed what the Minister was saying and I felt I	
L4			was so I would have been quite robust with him in	
L5			saying, Maurice, you better not be telling me there's	15:24
L6			something wrong here and he reassured me, and I	
L7			believed him. That is why I rang the Secretary General	
L8			to say you need to tell the minister so he doesn't go	
L9			into the Dáil and say that Sergeant McCabe didn't	
20			cooperate because Sergeant McCabe is telling me that he	15:24
21			was never asked.	
22	688	Q.	And I should say I'm not asking these questions in any	
23			critical way, Mr. Brett, I just want to get the clear	
24			picture of what your state of knowledge was at the time	
25			and indeed what you were told by the Department of	15:24
26			Justice or indeed any Gardaí you were speaking with or	
27			indeed by Sergeant McCabe?	
28		Α.	Well, just to be clear then, I mean I wasn't aware of	
29			it. Indeed, I was taken aback that I wasn't	

1			interviewed myself as part of the O'Mahony report given	
2			that I was the person who was referring them. So you	
3			know, I wasn't aware of where Sergeant McCabe was	
4	689	Q.	Well, I can ask the next two questions very quickly.	
5		Α.	Okay.	15:25
6	690	Q.	I think you'll be able to answer them very simply. The	
7			first is: Were you aware that when Sergeant McCabe had	
8			raised his issues, raised his concerns and complaints	
9			with the Department of Justice that led to the O'Mahony	
10			investigation that he had insisted on confidentiality?	15:25
11		Α.	I wasn't aware of that.	
12	691	Q.	And were you aware that when Assistant Commissioner	
13			O'Mahony provided his report, and I don't think there	
14			is any disagreement but that he hadn't spoken to	
15			Sergeant McCabe when he provided his report, but that	15:25
16			Sergeant McCabe contacted him after it had been	
17			provided to the Minister before it had been published	
18			and that Inspector O'Mahony indicated that an	
19			appointment or a meeting could be arranged with a	
20			member of his team and Sergeant McCabe, were you aware	15:25
21			of that?	
22		Α.	I would have no line of sight no knowledge of that.	
23	692	Q.	Just in conclusion then, just to be clear, Mr. Brett,	
24			you never discussed Sergeant McCabe with former	
25			Commissioner Callinan?	15:26
26		Α.	Absolutely never.	
27	693	Q.	He wasn't discussed at the meeting which you think is	
28			the one that is being referred to by Sergeant McCabe	
29			and certainly he wasn't denounced by former	

- 1 Commissioner Callinan at that meeting? 2 Absolutely not. Α. 3 694 0. You have no complaint about being interviewed by the 4 two investigating Gardaí or the nature or manner or 5 tone of that interview? 15:26 None at all. 6 Α. 7 The only person who gave you advice about your phone 695 Q. 8 perhaps being intercepted was Superintendent Taylor? Yes. When I asked him --9 Α. 10 696 Yes? Q. 15:26 11 -- you know, would they intercept my phone he said it's Α. 12 likely. That's the level of the advice. 13 697 Yes. And that was in late 2016, it seems, or likely to Q. 14 have been late 2016? 15 It was after he was suspended. So whatever the date of 15:26 Α. 16 his suspension it was in the weeks after that. 17 CHAIRMAN: Well then that is a completely different 18 date because that's 28th May 2015. 19 well, I am really sorry, Chairman. Α. I know, you can't know these things. 20 CHAIRMAN: 15:27 appreciate you're taking a fact here and fact there and 21 22 you are trying to put it together.
- A. Yeah. What I am trying to do, Chair, is to locate them
 for you against other instances. So, in this case it
 was after his suspension. So, he would have come to me 15:27

some time after his suspension.

27 698 Q. MR. DIGNAM: To be fair to you, Mr. Brett, and indeed 28 in the hope that it will be of some assistance to the 29 Tribunal in putting a date on that, on page 1541 of

_	your fincerview with the finestigators, I don't want to
2	read a long excerpt, but you deal on the third line of
3	that page, you deal with the concern being raised
4	because of Sergeant McCabe's contacts with you from
5	different numbers, etcetera, and you say that you
6	raised it with Assistant Commissioner Twomey and you
7	say:
8	
9	"I spoke to Assistant Commissioner Twomey after
10	Sergeant McCabe raising the issue with me but prior to 15:2
11	Superintendent Taylor warning me that it was likely my
12	phone was being intercepted. Subsequent to
13	Superintendent Taylor warning me about my phone, I did
14	ring Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan in 2016 and I asked
15	her to formally check whether my name and phone
16	appeared on the list of phone interceptions overseen by
17	the judicial oversight process. I told her I was
18	querying this in relation to the penalty points issue
19	and my interactions with Sergeant McCabe in that
20	context. From memory I did not tell former
21	Commissioner O'Sullivan what had caused my concern
22	regarding conversation with Superintendent Taylor. I
23	made the call to former Commissioner O'Sullivan in late
24	2006"
25	15:2
26	Okay?
27	
28	" I believe, and I do remember that I was working
29	from my Brussels office the day I phoned her. She

1			informed me that she would check and revert to me,	
2			which she subsequently did. She subsequently told me	
3			that my phone had not been intercepted.	
4				
5			My calls with former Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan	15:28
6			were professional. Former Commissioner Nóirín	
7			O'Sullivan did not say that any another person's phone	
8			was being intercepted when I spoke with her.	
9				
10			As I have already stated, I cannot be specific as to	15:29
11			the date when Superintendent Taylor warned me about my	
12			engagement with Sergeant McCabe but it is likely that	
13			it may have been in 2016 as this is what prompted me to	
14			contact former Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan as	
15			detailed above."	15:29
16		Α.	I'm sorry, I don't know the actual date, yeah.	
17	699	Q.	Superintendent Taylor never said anything to you, as I	
18			understand from your interview, about the Ms. D	
19			allegation or any allegation that may have been made	
20			against Sergeant McCabe, is that right?	15:29
21		Α.	Never. Nobody did, no.	
22	700	Q.	He never told you that former Commissioner Callinan or	
23			former Commissioner O'Sullivan had instructed him to	
24			negatively brief against Sergeant McCabe?	
25		Α.	That's correct, never discussed.	15:29
26	701	Q.	And he never, as I understand your interview, never	
27			spoke to you or never negatively briefed you in	
28			relation to Sergeant McCabe?	
29		Α.	That's correct.	

1	702	Q.	Thank you.	
2		Α.	Thank you.	
3				
4			MR. McDOWELL: Chairman, just before Ms. Leader there	
5			are two matters which arise after all of that, if I	15:30
6			may, Chairman?	
7			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
8				
9			WITNESS WAS FURTHER CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCDOWELL AS	
10			FOLLOWS:	15:30
11	703	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: Just one: You said that at the time you	
12			surmised in your own mind that the anger that was	
13			demonstrated to you at the meeting about the	
14			tachographs may have had something to do with the fact	
15			that you had made the GSOC reference of the penalty	15:30
16			points issue, is that right?	
17		Α.	Yes, I have no evidence of that. I felt tense going	
18			into that meeting because I knew it was the first time	
19			I had seen the Commissioner. But he did nothing to	
20			imply that to me.	15:30
21	704	Q.	I appreciate that.	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	705	Q.	But isn't it equally possible that you somehow conveyed	
24			to Sergeant McCabe that you were worried about it, that	
25			that was the reason for his anger?	15:30
26		Α.	I don't believe so. I don't believe so.	
27	706	Q.	Because Sergeant McCabe seemed to connect the anger	
28			with him	
29		Α.	Yeah.	

1	707	Q.	and I am just trying to wonder could you have said	
2			to him, you know, I had an angry exchange?	
3		Α.	No. I'm clear that I told him about the nature of the	
4			engagement and the anger, but you know, there would be	
5			no reason why I would say it was in relation to him.	15:3
6	708	Q.	He has no recollection of tachographs being mentioned,	
7			but it was present in your mind that the anger might	
8			have been explained by reference of the penalty points	
9			issue to GSOC, is that right?	
10		Α.	I wouldn't have told Sergeant McCabe about tachographs,	15:3
11			I would have just told him about the nature of the	
12			meeting and the fact that Gay Byrne and I had to leave.	
13			I can't	
14	709	Q.	Clearly wires were crossed, and I'm not suggesting they	
15			weren't, but just in case it's suggested that Sergeant	15:3
16			McCabe was connected to two wholly unconnected thing,	
17			in the back of your mind there was a possible	
18			connection, is that right?	
19		Α.	Yes, but I have no evidence for that.	
20	710	Q.	And secondly, you were just asked now by Mr. Dignam	15:3
21			about a letter in 2013 that was sent to Sergeant	
22			McCabe. the evidence. vou don't know this. but I just	

29 CHAIRMAN: Are we talking about the two directive 14th

of that.

23

24

25

26

27

28

want to remind the Chairman, is that there was no

letter sent to him; he was called to a meeting where a

directive was read to him, he asked to receive a copy

of the directive and he was told he would not be given

a copy of the directive, but he made a tape recording

6 CHAIRMAN: Yes. In Mullingar, did you say? 7 MR. McDOWELL: No, listen, I could be wrong, Judge. 8 This witness doesn't know anything about it. 9 MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, if it's of any assistance 10 I misspoke in saying that it was sent, I accept that it 15	5:32
MR. McDOWELL: No. As I understand it, he was called to a meeting maybe I'm wrong. CHAIRMAN: Yes. In Mullingar, did you say? MR. McDOWELL: No, listen, I could be wrong, Judge. This witness doesn't know anything about it. MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, if it's of any assistance I misspoke in saying that it was sent, I accept that it 15	5:32
to a meeting maybe I'm wrong. CHAIRMAN: Yes. In Mullingar, did you say? MR. McDOWELL: No, listen, I could be wrong, Judge. This witness doesn't know anything about it. MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, if it's of any assistance I misspoke in saying that it was sent, I accept that it	5:32
6 CHAIRMAN: Yes. In Mullingar, did you say? 7 MR. McDOWELL: No, listen, I could be wrong, Judge. 8 This witness doesn't know anything about it. 9 MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, if it's of any assistance 10 I misspoke in saying that it was sent, I accept that it 15	5:32
7 MR. McDOWELL: No, listen, I could be wrong, Judge. 8 This witness doesn't know anything about it. 9 MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, if it's of any assistance 10 I misspoke in saying that it was sent, I accept that it 15	
This witness doesn't know anything about it. MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, if it's of any assistance I misspoke in saying that it was sent, I accept that it 15	
9 MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, if it's of any assistance 10 I misspoke in saying that it was sent, I accept that it 15	
I misspoke in saying that it was sent, I accept that it 15	
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
11 was used at a martin to common trooks and 10 - 114	5:32
11 was read at a meeting to Sergeant McCabe and if I said	
it was sent and I think I probably did say it was sent	
that was a misstatement on my part.	
MR. McDOWELL: That is fine, Judge. That is the end of	
15 it then.	5:32
16 CHAIRMAN: Well, the documentary evidence indicates	
that Pulse was restricted to Maurice McCabe, or from,	
18 14th December 2012.	
19 MR. DIGNAM: Yes.	
20 CHAIRMAN: And there was another communication of some 15	5:33
kind about it, 27th December 2012.	
MR. DIGNAM: That's right.	
23 CHAIRMAN: But I only heard about the second one today.	
I didn't know anything about it.	
MR. McDOWELL: My understanding, Chairman, and it's 15	5:33
probably wrong for me to even mention it with this	
27 witness, my understanding is that a letter was read or	
28 a directive was read to him	
CHAIRMAN: Well, that is probably the way it was done,	

1			all right.	
2			MR. McDOWELL: and he asked for a copy and he wasn't	
3			given it.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
5			MR. DIGNAM: As I say, Chairman, I think I did say it	15:33
6			was sent and that was a misstatement on my part. It	
7			was read at a meeting.	
8			CHAIRMAN: It was certainly sent with somebody who then	
9			read it out.	
10			MR. DIGNAM: Yes.	15:33
11			CHAIRMAN: As opposed to getting it on your hall table	
12			when you return room. Ms. Leader, did you have a	
13			question?	
14				
15			WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER AS FOLLOWS:	15:33
16	711	Q.	MS. LEADER: One thing I should have asked you,	
17			Mr. Brett. Mr. Varadkar in a letter sent to the	
18			Tribunal on the 18th December 2017 told the Tribunal	
19			that he was informed of rumours and innuendo about	
20			Sergeant McCabe by you. I don't know if you are able	15:34
21			to enlighten the Tribunal about that?	
22		Α.	Yes. I read An Taoiseach's letter in the pack I was	
23			given for today.	
24	712	Q.	Yes?	
25		Α.	I became aware of what I will say no more than rumour	15:34
26			and the content of the rumour that I heard was sex	
27			abuse. I was never given any I never heard any	
28			details as to whether that was, you know, adults,	
29			children, anything like that. So that rumour was doing	

1			the rounds and I alerted the Minister to that. But I	
2			did take it upon myself to ring Sergeant McCabe and ask	
3			him. I said, look, this kind of murmuring is going on	
4			and I should say to you nobody from An Garda	
5			Síochána ever told me, I heard it just generally	15:34
6			around, it was doing the rounds in the political	
7			system, it was doing the rounds with journalists, and I	
8			rang Sergeant McCabe and asked him and he reassured me	
9			that there wasn't an issue, he didn't go any further	
10			than that. In the course of briefing the Minister, my	15:35
11			Minister, I told him of that and I told him I had	
12			spoken to Sergeant McCabe and that Sergeant McCabe had	
13			given that assurance. I note in An Taoiseach's letter	
14			that he goes on to talk about other things	
15	713	Q.	Yes?	15:35
16		Α.	about computers and things, I have no knowledge of	
17			those things, never had, never did and I never raised	
18			them with the Taoiseach or the then-Minister. My	
19			briefing of him was literally this rumour is doing the	
20			asked, I have asked Sergeant McCabe, he has given me an	15:35
21			assurance and I believe him and we move on.	
22	714	Q.	You're happy the rumour didn't come from a guard?	
23		Α.	Absolutely.	
24			CHAIRMAN: It was just a floating rumour, if you like,	
25			where you can't even say who told you, that kind of	15:35
26			thing.	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	715	Q.	MS. LEADER: You don't know who	

A. I'm sorry, I mean, literally you'd hear it in the civil

1			service, you'd hear it from media people, but it was as	
2			vague as 'oh, you know, you can't trust him, he's got	
3			issues', that kind of thing, and I felt I needed to	
4			tell my Minister that and I did that. So I think	
5			that's what the Minister's letter now Taoiseach's	15:35
6			letter is referring to.	
7	716	Q.	He was Minister for Transport?	
8		Α.	He was my line Minister at that time.	
9	717	Q.	Thank you very much.	
10			CHAIRMAN: When are we talking about, Ms. Leader, I	15:36
11			wonder? So that is up to October 2013, so it has to be	
12			prior to that time.	
13		Α.	Yes, I suspect it was in the briefing for the meeting	
14			with Minister Shatter.	
15			MS. LEADER: And that was in July 2013.	15:36
16		Α.	2013, apologies.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Yes. So it was probably prior to that	
18			meeting?	
19		Α.	I suspect it was in the immediacy, on our way to that	
20			meeting.	15:36
21			CHAIRMAN: In or around then, yes. Okay, Ms. Leader,	
22			if you are finished I just have a couple of questions.	
23				
24			WITNESS WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN,	
25			AS FOLLOWS:	15:36
26	718	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The first one is this: I suppose I don't	
27			know this, but you seem to have been the first official	
28			person contacted about the fixed charge penalty notices	
29			loss of revenue which of course impacts on the	

Т			discipline of people on the roads which is, to put it	
2			mildly, very important to how the country operates and	
3			people's safety, am I right in thinking that you were	
4			the first person contacted or did you think you were?	
5		Α.	Well, I believed I was well, I don't think I was the	15:37
6			first official. My understanding is that Sergeant	
7			McCabe had when he spoke with me, it was like I have	
8			gone to my line management, I've gone to the	
9			confidential recipient, I've gone to the line	
10			department, I've gone to the Department of Transport,	15:37
11			so that would be at official level, to civil servants,	
12			I've gone to the Department of Taoiseach, I'm going	
13			nowhere, now I'm coming to you. When I went through it	
14			with him I believed him, I took it, I referred it	
15			formally the very next morning by registered post to	15:37
16			GSOC and C&AG and I felt that was the end of it. So I	
17			think other officials knew about it and had been	
18			approached by him in an escalating fashion from his own	
19			line management up, but I believe I'm probably the	
20			first person that formally referred it.	15:37
21	719	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And he eventually got to you?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	720	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I presume there's a Road Safety Authority	
24			Act but I'm not familiar with it, does it provide that	
25			the Road Safety Authority shall be independent in the	15:37
26			exercise of its functions, etcetera, etcetera?	
27		Α.	Absolutely. It's Road Safety Authority Act 2006. And	
28			it does provide the Road Safety Authority has statutory	
29			functions in administration of nenalty noints nutting	

- them on the Drivers Licence, things like that. 1
- 2 And how serious did you think this was for 721 Q. 3 road safety?
- It was cutting to the chase of everything I had spent 4 Α.
- 5 the previous years trying to do. It was critical. the confidence couldn't be in the system, you know, why 6

15:38

15:38

- 7 would you be doing road safety?
- 8 722 In other words, what is the point of having Q.
- 9 a police force if they are stopping people and
- enforcing penalties and the penalties are just 10
- 11 disappearing willy nilly?
- 12 Yes. Α.
- 13 So you felt it impacted on --723 CHAIRMAN: Q.
- 14 Α. Yes. And I don't want to go to whose names are in the 15 dossier --
- 16 724 No, no, and I don't want you to either. CHAIRMAN: Q.
- 17 But the types of names that were in there were also a Α.
- 18 concern to me because of the role some of those people
- 19 held in society.
- 20 Okay. And the second thing that I wanted to 15:38 725 CHAIRMAN: Q.
- asked you about was this: This mention of Oisin, and 21
- 22 it's becoming a wee bit confused, as I understand it
- 23 there is a computer system - and I have looked at it -
- 24 in Garda Headquarters, which is Oisin, which is about
- 25 crime and security and it deals with terrorism, organised crime, that kind of thing. Now, I am not 26
- 27 saying any more than that. But, the conversation you
- had with Superintendent Taylor, I may be getting the 28
- 29 wrong impression so this is why I am asking you, a

1			stand alone computer system, was that one that related	
2			solely to Maurice McCabe and whistleblowers or was it	
3			that he had been put in the Crime and Security system	
4			under the Oisin computer system? The name by the way	
5			doesn't matter.	15:39
6		Α.	Chairman, what I understood from that was that this	
7			investigation into Sergeant McCabe was being treated in	
8			a special way, like a Crime and Security investigation	
9			and it was in the system rather than in Pulse or a	
10			routine day-to-day system, that it was in the special	15:39
11			Crime and Security system, but I have no knowledge	
12			beyond that.	
13	726	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And then that's obviously a computer system	
14			that is much harder to get at, if you like, than the	
15			others?	15:39
16		Α.	Well, I really don't know. I assume it is.	
17	727	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Well, I mean, I presume, dealing with	
18			terrorism and	
19		Α.	That's my understanding. That is what I took from that	
20			discussion.	15:40
21	728	Q.	CHAIRMAN: and also international police relations	
22			on information on	
23		Α.	Yes. I assumed that it was only accessible by senior	
24			managers and by people working in Crime and Security	
25			and I took that that the investigation was being	15:40
26			treated with a certain seriousness in that context.	
27	729	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. The third thing then was: Given that	
28			David Taylor was suspended on the 28th May 2015, he was	
29			questioned on the 28th and 29th May 2015 and then he	

Τ			was at liberty thereafter, does that help you at all in	
2			relation to	
3		Α.	I'm really sorry and I'm somewhat embarrassed I cannot	
4			ground it for you more than that. I can't. I just	
5			don't know.	15:40
6	730	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But when you're saying 2016, I mean it could	
7			easily be 2015?	
8		Α.	It literally could, chair. And I'm really sorry for	
9			that.	
10	731	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I'm not trying to suggest that to you or say	15:40
11			that that is the right answer because I don't know and	
12			you don't know	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	732	Q.	CHAIRMAN: but there is a range of dates and it	
15			could go back to 2015?	15:40
16		Α.	It may.	
17	733	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And you think in any event you had, what,	
18			you believe you had a first contact when you were in	
19			Mayo or was it post October 2013 when you were in	
20			Nassau Street?	15:41
21		Α.	No, no, the contacts all definitely happened after I	
22			came to Nassau Street. And that is why I was vague as	
23			to whether it was late '13, '14, '15 or even up into	
24			'16, because the only reference I have is that it was	
25			in Nassau Street.	15:41
26	734	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Look, maybe you can't help us on this, I	
27			don't know, but one of the things that is perhaps	
28			important is the attitude of Superintendent Taylor	
29			towards Nóirín O'Sullivan. I don't want to open this	

- up as a big item for discussion, but you did mention in the course of your evidence that he called to your
- office, after his suspension, so it is probably after
- June 2015, June 2015 or after, and that the main thrust
- was him and Nóirín O'Sullivan and the way he had been

15 · 42

15:42

15:42

15.42

- 6 treated. What had Nóirín O'Sullivan got to do with it,
- 7 can you recall?
- 8 A. Well, the main purpose of him coming to see me was not 9 to talk about Maurice McCabe, he came to talk about his
- own woes or to tell me about his own woes. I don't
- 11 know why he chose to come and tell me, but he did. And
- 12 he talked about being suspended, being arrested, I
- think he said he was in a Garda station in Balbriggan,
- 14 that his children had to visit him there. So, that was
- 15 the context.
- 16 735 Q. CHAIRMAN: All of that kind of stuff, all right. But
- 17 what has Nóirín O'Sullivan got to do with it? From the
- conversation what did you understand Nóirín O'Sullivan
- 19 had do with it?
- 20 A. My recollection of it was that he was attributing the
- blame for his predicament, that Nóirín O'Sullivan was
- 22 directing his arrest and the inquiry into him. That's
- literally as much as I know about that.
- 24 736 Q. CHAIRMAN: I don't believe she ever had anything to do
- with it, certainly on the face of the papers that I
- have.
- 27 A. I have no sight, other than that -- his angst was
- against Nóirín O'Sullivan when he saw me.
- 29 737 Q. CHAIRMAN: What was saying by Nóirín O'Sullivan?

1 Literally look, what she has done to him. Α. 2 CHAIRMAN: On what basis was he saying that? 738 Q. 3 I really don't know that, chair. He told me his story Α. about being arrested, he told me he was the second 4 5 superintendent since the foundation of the State to be 15:43 arrested, and all of those things, that was the 6 7 Now I wasn't -- I listened. context. 8 739 CHAIRMAN: And you couldn't really weave into it any Q. 9 kind of coherent narrative yourself as to -well, I didn't have -- I had nothing to correlate it 10 Α. 15 · 43 11 with. 12 740 CHAIRMAN: And your purpose was tea and sympathy Ο. 13 basically? 14 Α. I don't know why he chose to come to see me. 15 741 CHAIRMAN: I don't mean that badly, Mr. Brett. Q. 15:43 16 Α. Yeah. 17 742 CHAIRMAN: I mean that insofar as you were doing Q. 18 anything there was nothing you could do, it was a 19 question of just listening and offering some kind 20 words? 15:43 Nothing more than that. And that was all I could do. 21 Α. 22 Maybe he came to me because I had assisted Sergeant McCabe with a previous issue. But I had nothing I 23 24 could do for him. 25 CHAIRMAN: Thank vou. 15 · 43 Thank you very much. And again my apologies for the 26 Α. 27 vagueness on those dates.

too definite a date, perhaps.

It can't be helped. It's better than having

28

29

CHAIRMAN:

1		Α.	Thank you.	
2				
3			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
4				
5				15:43
6			His interview with the investigators is to be found in	
7 8			Volume 7 on page 1809, sir.	
9			MR. DIARMUID O'SULLIVAN, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	
10	742	•	DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN AS FOLLOWS:	15:44
11	743	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think, Mr. O'Sullivan, that you	
12			retired from An Garda Síochána in 2016, is that right?	
13		Α.	That's correct, Mr. Chairman.	
14	744	Q.	I think it was after a long and distinguished career	
15			and you retired at the chief superintendent level, is	15:44
16			that right?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	745	Q.	Would you just give a brief summary of your career in	
19			An Garda Síochána for the benefit of the Chairman?	
20		Α.	Yes, Mr. Chairman. I joined An Garda Síochána in June	15:44
21			1977. Following my initial training I was transferred	
22			to Harcourt Terrace Garda station. Then in 1982 I was	
23			transferred to Special Branch, took up office in Dublin	
24			Castle, as a matter of fact. In 1990, approximately, I	
25			think, I was promoted to the rank of sergeant and was	15:45
26			transferred to Fitzgibbon Street Garda Station. I	
27			returned to SDU in 1990, I believe, and worked as a	
28			D/Sergeant in charge of one of the districts, a couple	
29			of districts and also had responsibility for the Agent	

1			Handling Unit, as it was known at the time. '92'97	
2			I think I was promoted to inspector, I went to the	
3			parking fines office. I was then transferred to	
4			Crumlin Garda station as an inspector and I returned to	
5			SDU in '99 I think. I was then inspector with	15:45
6			responsibility for the southern division, I also had	
7			responsibility for left wing, which was dealing with	
8			ISIS, which are now known as, and I also had	
9			responsibility for the Agent Handling Unit, I was	
10			inspector in charge of the Agent Handling Unit. Then	15:46
11			in 2002 I was promoted to the rank of superintendent, I	
12			was transferred on change of management to Garda	
13			Headquarters. I returned to SDU as detective	
14			superintendent in 2003 with responsibility for	
15			operational matters in SDU, primarily the investigation	15:46
16			of subversive crime within and outside the	
17			jurisdiction, as well responsibility for the management	
18			of agents, and it was then known. I also had	
19			responsibility for witness protection, part of my time	
20			there. In 2012 I was promoted to chief superintendent.	15:47
21			I was transferred to Dun Laoghaire Garda station and I	
22			was also, in the end of 2015 I think I took up	
23			responsibility for Louth division and I retired in	
24			January 2016.	
25	746	Q.	Now I think in common with other serving members and	15:47
26			former members of An Garda Síochána of the rank of	
27			superintendent and above you were written to by the	
28			Tribunal asking whether or not you had any information	
29			in your nossession that could be of assistance to the	

1	Tribunal,	isn't	that	right?

2 That's correct, Chairman. At this point I think it is Α. 3 important for me to outline to yourself that at that time when I made my first statement and my subsequent 4 5 statements I didn't appreciate the relevance of the 6 phone calls and my phone communication with Mr. Kean. 7 Having viewed them in the papers, in the Tribunal, and 8 having reviewed the phone contacts, phone contacts I think I'm in a better position to help the Tribunal 9 with regard to that communication, Chairman. 10

15:48

15 · 48

15:48

15 · 49

- 11 747 Q. Well, that would indeed be helpfully, but I am just 12 simply putting this in context in the history, because 13 your statement to the Tribunal at page 1828 is your 14 response to the Tribunal and at that time you didn't 15 believe that you had any information that you could 16 give to the Tribunal and your statement is nine lines 17 long and indicates that you can't be of assistance to 18 the Tribunal, isn't that right?
- 19 That's correct. Α.
- 20 I think that subsequent to that you were interviewed by 15:48 748 Q. our investigators on the 23rd February of this year 21 22 over nearly a two-hour period when they put certain 23 records in their possession to you and also quoted from 24 a statement that then had been made by Mr. Gerald Kean, 25 solicitor, isn't that right?
- That's correct. 26 Α.
- 27 749 Q. And the focus of their inquiries clearly was to the extent of trying to establish whether or not you were a 28 29 point of contact between Mr. Kean and former Garda

1	Commissioner	Callinan,	ısn't	that	rıght?

that, isn't that right?

2 A. That's correct.

9

- And I think that your stance during that period of time and your statement interview which is 19 pages long and starts at page 1809 of the material, that the stance that you adopted at that time was that you had no recollection at all of the phone call from Mr. Kean on the 25th January of 2014 or any calls subsequent to
- 10 A. That's correct, Judge. I just couldn't put any
 11 significance to those calls. So that's why most of my
 12 replies were I don't recall or I don't recollect or it
 13 may have something to do with the Marian Finucane
 14 programme.

15:50

15:50

- 15 751 Q. Well, I think all most of your responses were I don't
 16 recall, I don't recollect. But when Mr. Kean's
 17 recollection was put to you in relation to a memory
 18 that you had perhaps been the point of contact you
 19 answered "I have no reason to dispute what he has
 20 said", do you recall that?
- That's correct, Chairman. The reasoning behind that 21 Α. 22 was I think that Mr. Kean has said or indicated that it 23 may have something to do with the Marian Finucane 24 programme which went out on the 26th January 2014 and I -- if that was the situation I had no reason to 25 15:51 26 dispute it whatsoever, that he may have discussed that 27 programme with me, like minded position at this point in time. 28
- 29 752 Q. Well, what we are concerned about here is establishing,

_			as far as we can, what Mr. Rean's point of contact was	
2			and how it came that former Commissioner Callinan	
3			phoned him on the 25th January. You have been here all	
4			day, have you, whilst he has been giving evidence,	
5			Mr. Kean gave evidence?	15:51
6		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
7	753	Q.	I think that you know him well over the years, isn't	
8			that right?	
9		Α.	Yeah, I know him. I know him, I would have had	
10			reasonable detailed discussion with him and talked to	15:52
11			him in relation to different matters, including	
12			legitimate policing matters as well as, we'll say,	
13			social matters.	
14	754	Q.	Yes. I suppose the appearance of former Commissioner	
15			Callinan before the Public Accounts Committee on the	15:52
16			23rd January 2014 was a point of some controversy that	
17			was in the public domain as well, isn't that right?	
18		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
19	755	Q.	And Mr. Kean's phone calls with you and indeed contact	
20			that you had with former Commissioner in the day after,	15:52
21			the subsequent on the Saturday, and indeed on the	
22			Sunday, has your recollection of these events improved	
23			having heard Mr. Kean's evidence? Have you now a	
24			recollection of being a point of contact?	
25		Α.	I don't believe for one second that I was a point of	15:53
26			contact. I believe that Gerald Kean called me on the	
27			24th January 2014 where I had a conversation with him	
28			for approximately five minutes, at approximately around	
29			six o'clock.	

1	756	0 -	What was	the	conversation	ahout?
_	, , ,	•	wiiae was	CIIC	CONVENSACION	ubout.

Α.	I couldn't possibly be specific as to what that	
	conversation was about. I can only say, if it related	
	to a programme that he was participating on or if it	
	related to anything involving Assistant Commissioner	15:53
	John O'Mahony's inquiry and investigation into the	
	quashing of penalty points I would not have got	
	involved in the discussion and I did not get involved	
	in the discussion with him, and it's quite possible, as	
	would have been my practice in the past, to refer it to	15:53
	the Press Office. And if I can explain and expand	
	slightly on my practice in the past: I worked	
	primarily, most of my time, in Special Branch and I	
	would have been contacted on different occasions by	
	members of the media and I would always refer them to	15:54
	the Press Office, because I think it is very important	
	because of the sensitivity and everything else that	
	goes with it, that was my natural protocol to refer	
	journalists. Also I would have had long time	
	experience in dealing with solicitors, because of the	15:54
	investigation into subversive crimes, dealing with	
	prisoners, solicitors representing prisoners, so even	
	though I would see Gerald Kean's call to me was on an	
	unlegalistic perspective I would immediately, we'll	
	say, have got into my head saying, hang on a minute	15:54
	now, I don't know what Gerald Kean is getting into here	
	and I would have also referred him to the most	
	appropriate place, which would have been the Press	
	Office.	

- 1 757 Q. Were you in regular contact with the Commissioner Callinan in around about that time?
- A. Again, I can't be absolutely specific but I can for the benefit of the Tribunal and yourself, Mr. Chairman, say that there were sensitive matters in the division being 15:55
- 6 investigated at the time, as well issues in relation to

15:55

15:55

15:56

- 7 the closing of Stepaside Garda station. So I would
- 8 have reason to be in communication with the
- 9 Commissioner more and above what would have been in normal business.
- 11 758 Q. All right. So, for instance, had you phoned him to 12 perhaps offer him some support after his experience 13 before the Public Accounts Committee?
- 14 A. Absolutely not, Chairman.
- 15 759 Q. If we could have page 1831 up on the screen. Can the
 16 Chairman take it that your stated position in relation
 17 to this is that when Mr. Kean contacted you, even
 18 though you have no recollection of the phone call, but
 19 that would you have referred him to the Press Office,
 20 is that right?
- A. I certainly believe that my initial reaction would have been: Mr. Kean, I think the best place for you to have discussions in relation to that is the Press Office and not me.
- 25 760 Q. Here we have a phone call on the 24th January 2014 from 15:56

 Mr. Kean to you, lasting five minutes and 16 seconds at

 18:03, do you see that?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 761 Q. It would appear that you didn't refer him to the Press

- 1 Office because he phoned you the following morning, do 2 you see that? 3 I do. Α. 762 At 11:58:25? 4 Ο. 5 Yes. Α. 15:56 6 763 And that call lasted 13 minutes and 18 seconds. 0. Do you see that? 7 8 Yes. Α. And then not long after, about 40 minutes later, Martin 9 764 Q. Callinan, the Commissioner, phoned Gerald Kean, do you 10 15:57 11 see that? 12 That's correct. Α. 13 That might suggest that in fact that you were a point 765 Q. 14 of contact, do you see there? 15 Yes. Α. 15:57 16 Now if we could just go down then to the day after --766 Ο. 17 or the day of the broadcast on the 26th January, do you 18 see there? 19 Yes. Α. There's a call from former Commissioner Callinan to 20 767 Q. 15:57 Gerald Kean at 9:43 in the morning, it lasted five 21 22 minutes 26 seconds, followed by a text message shortly 23 afterwards. And then there's a subsequent call at 24 12:43, it lasted seven minutes and 51 seconds from
- 27 A. That's correct.

you see there?

25

26

28 768 Q. Then there is a contact between you and Gerald Kean at 15:54:36 lasting two minutes and 52 seconds, do you see

Gerry Kean again to former Commissioner Callinan, do

15:57

1			it there?	
2		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
3	769	Q.	We're told by Mr. Kean that he thought that that might	
4			be a comfort call that he had received from you. And	
5			then immediately after that call you call Commissioner	15:58
6			Callinan and that call lasts 15 minutes 25 seconds.	
7		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
8	770	Q.	You appreciate that the record there, from any common	
9			sense point of view, would indicate that you were in	
10			contact with Mr. Kean who was then in contact with	15:58
11			Commissioner Callinan. Mr. Kean appeared on the Marian	
12			Finucane show, he contacted Mr. Callinan and then there	
13			was contact between you and Mr. Kean and between you	
14			and then Mr. Callinan. It would appear that you were	
15			discussing in or around this time Mr. Kean's appearance	15:59
16			on the Marian Finucane show?	
17		Α.	Yes, it could be perceived as that, but if I can	
18			explain to you, Chairman, that may help you, we'll say,	
19			understand these contacts. I never heard the Marian	
20			Finucane programme on the day in question and actually	15:59

Finucane programme on the day in question and actually 21 when it was brought to my attention that there was 22 something mentioned with regard to the John O'Mahony 23 investigation into the cancelling of speeding tickets 24 or Maurice McCabe, that it was mentioned in that 25 programme, I went on line to find out, well, what did 15:59 26 Gerald Kean say in this programme. So when I looked at 27 it on line I couldn't find anything. 28 But you say when it was mentioned, who CHAIRMAN: 29 mentioned it?

1		Α.	When the investigators mentioned it to me, when it was	
2			brought to my attention, I subsequently went on line to	
3			find out what was said in the programme, but I couldn't	
4			find anything on it. And it's only last week when I	
5			got the transcript of the programme that I discovered	16:00
6			that part of it obviously had been taken down. So when	
7			I rang Gerald Kean at nearly four o'clock, 15:54, I had	
8			absolutely no idea what happened on the Marian Finucane	
9			programme. I was completely, we'll say, oblivious.	
10			Because I hadn't heard it. And I still haven't heard	16:00
11			it to this day.	
12	771	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Well, you see, the only problem about	
13			that is that you were phoning him at 15:54 on a	
14			Sunday	
15		Α.	Yes.	16:00
16	772	Q.	and you're obviously discussing something and it	
17			happened to be the day on which he has appeared on the	
18			Marian Finucane show, and immediately after that call	
19			you phone the Garda Commissioner?	
20		Α.	That's correct.	16:01
21	773	Q.	Are you still resisting the suggestion that in fact you	
22			had been the point of contact you may not have a	
23			recollection of this, but are you resisting the	
24			suggestion that you were the point of contact for	
25			Mr. Kean?	16:01
26		Α.	For Mr. Kean with Commissioner Callinan?	
27	774	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	I can't possibly say that I was, because	
29	775	Q.	Well, are you saying definitively that you weren't?	

- well, if you're asking me, we'll say, did I assist 1 Α. 2 Gerald Kean in communicating with Martin Callinan, Commissioner at the time, I'd have to say I'm not sure. 3 4 What I can recall was that when he asked me, and I 5 believe he did ask me, when I relook and revisit the 16:01 6 communication, who may be the appropriate person to 7 call, I first would have told him it was the Press 8 Office. If I suggested somebody else it possibly was merely he may have said to me well, is it possible to 9 talk to the Commissioner, and I would have said to him 10 16:02 11 I'm not sure. But I mean, if you know him maybe that's 12 an appropriate person to talk to, but I can't give you 13 that information or advise you in that regard. And 14 secondly --
- 15 776 Q. And if he said, well, I don't have his mobile number
 16 there would perhaps be absolutely nothing wrong with
 17 you talking to the Commissioner and saying would you
 18 mind ringing Gerald Kean?

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

16:02

A. Well, there probably wouldn't, but the thing is that he did advise me, Gerald Kean had said to me that he knew 16:02 Commissioner Callinan at the time, that he had met him at charity affair down in Cork and that they had each other's phone numbers, is what I believe. And the reason that I can now recall that was, I was thinking what charity event was the Commissioner at, I wonder. So that is merely, we'll say, the reason why I would -- that is why I think that it was Gerald Kean that said to me, what about the Commissioner? I wouldn't have put the Commissioner forward as a person that he should

1	be -	_

2	777	Q.	Okay. Can we have your final position in relation to	
3			this, because obviously, as I say, you've made a	
4			statement to the Tribunal, you've been interviewed by	
5			the Tribunal investigators, you're here to give	16:03
6			evidence in relation to this today, I put the telephone	
7			records to you, I have suggested to you that it looks	
8			on the basis of the telephone records that you were in	
9			communication with Gerald Kean and he had phoned you,	
10			that perhaps you had given him or you had asked	16:03
11			Commissioner Callinan to call Mr. Kean, and the	
12			following day, after Mr. Kean was agitated because of	
13			the phone call in from Sergeant McCabe, that you may	
14			have been involved in phoning him that afternoon to, as	
15			he put it, a comfort all, all right, and it looks as	16:04
16			though maybe immediately after that you had phoned	
17			Commissioner Callinan, because the records suggest it,	
18			and perhaps you had told him that you had put	
19			Mr. Kean's mind at ease in relation to the information	
20			that had been supplied?	16:04
21		Α.	Well, if I can take the last part of it first, I	

A. Well, if I can take the last part of it first, I certainly didn't call Mr. Kean in relation to a comfort call, because I had no knowledge of what was discussed. My communication with Commissioner Callinan subsequent to that, I don't know exactly what it related to, it could have -- we could have had mentioned something about the Marian Finucane programme or did Gerald Kean make contact with you or whatever, that could have happened.

16:04

CHAIRMAN: You know, chief superintendent, it's a very weird coincidence, you speak to Gerald Kean and immediately you put the phone down you ring Commissioner Callinan and you speak to him for 15 minutes. Now I don't mean to be showing off my primary 16:05 level ability with mathematics, but you actually spoke to Gerald Kean for 31 minutes and 9 seconds, you add in your communication with Commissioner Callinan in relation to this, we're talking about just shy of 47 minutes, and you're saying I have no recollection, you 16:05 answered our letter by saying I have no recollection, you said to our inspectors, that is what everyone is calling them, the investigators, I've no recollection, and then you see all these phone records and you say well, oh, I have no idea what it is about. I mean, 16:05 seriously? I'm certainly saying, Chairman, that I now believe that Α.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

A. I'm certainly saying, Chairman, that I now believe that it had to have something to do with the programme that Gerald Kean was going on. I am absolutely quite happy that that had to have something to do with the programme he was going on. What I can say is that I have no recollection of actually what the discussion pertaining to the programme was.

CHAIRMAN: Here's a programme, they discuss Maurice McCabe, Maurice McCabe is infuriated, he rings RTÉ, RTÉ tell Gerald Kean, Gerald Kean comes off the programme and at quarter to one lo and behold he rings Martin Callinan. Immediately after that you ring Gerald Kean

and immediately after speaking to Gerald Kean you ring

1 Martin Callinan. I mean, you know, if it was a jigsaw 2 puzzle you'd be putting it together.

> Α. Absolutely.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

CHAIRMAN: So you put it together and you give me the pattern, that is what Mr. Marrinan is asking you.

16:06

16:07

16:07

16:07

Well, what I am saying is that Gerald Kean rang me on Α. the 24th, I can't recall exactly what the conversation was, it was in relation to five minutes and whatever. Having a conversation with Gerald Kean, you can go on before you ever get to the point of what the phone call 16:06 was for. So then, that's a short conversation. On the 15th -- or on the following day, when there was a conversation for 13 minutes, I believe that at that time that Gerald Kean mentioned the fact to me that he was going on the Marian Finucane programme the following day and who may be the appropriate person to talk to. That's what I believed in that regard. believed that I said the most appropriate person is the Press Office. We may further have on gone in relation

to having a discussion, who else might be the appropriate person. He did suggest would it be possible to talk to Martin Callinan, I would have said to him well, I don't know, but I mean, if you know Martin Callinan maybe, but I can't give you his phone number and I won't be giving you his phone number in that regard. At 16:14 on that day there was another

conversation with Gerald Kean, again I just can't

remember exactly, it may be that he either did get in 28 contact with Martin Callinan or whatever. 29 I don't

1			know.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Yes. Appreciating that it's difficult to be	
3			dragged into these things	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5			CHAIRMAN: and that you're a very distinguished	16:08
6			policeman who had a very distinguished career and	
7			offered the State service, I still would like you to	
8			try and put things together. So, I'm going to leave it	
9			to Mr. Marrinan now if he has any further questions.	
10	778	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: What is your final position in relation	16:08
11			to it? I mean, for instance, what are we to take of	
12			the fact that on Sunday afternoon you were ringing	
13			Gerald Kean and that immediately after you phoned	
14			Martin Callinan? What were those phone calls about?	
15		Α.	Well, first of all, in relation to my conversation with	16:08
16			Gerald Kean on the Sunday, I can't be sure, but it	
17			could have to do with, did you get in contact with	
18			somebody? Because as I have said, Mr. Chairman, I	
19			never heard the programme, right. I didn't hear the	
20			Marian Finucane programme. As well as that, I never	16:09
21			knew that Maurice McCabe contacted the programme. I	
22			never knew that there was a civil action taken by	
23			Maurice McCabe against RTÉ or Gerald Kean until about a	
24			week ago or four days ago, or five days ago. I never	
25			knew that happened. I knew nothing of those events.	16:09
26			So when I was communicating with Gerald Kean, my belief	
27			and memory is that it was related to, did you get in	
28			contact with somebody and did you appear on the	
29			programme? It was a matter to that effect.	

1	779	Q.	And your call to the Garda Commissioner immediately	
2			after that call?	
3		Α.	Well, I called the Garda Commissioner immediately after	
4			all that, I could have asked him did Gerald Kean make	
5			contact with you, but we weren't I didn't get into	16:0
6			conversation in relation to the programme with him	
7			because I know nothing about the programme and nothing	
8			came from either the Commissioner or Gerald Kean in	
9			relation to that programme that assisted me when I was	
10			asked originally about making a statement, so it was	16:1
11			completely off my mind.	
12			CHAIRMAN: And if the Commissioner had rung you up and	
13			said look, would you ever ring up your man and calm him	
14			down, would that stick in your mind?	
15		Α.	Oh certainly. If anything of that nature happened it	16:1
16			would have resonated with me.	
17			CHAIRMAN: It's very hard to know what you were talking	
18			about. You certainly weren't talking about show	
19			jumping. So, what else was it?	
20		Α.	well, as I say, I mean, you talk are you talking	16:1
21			about Gerald Kean or the Commissioner?	
22			CHAIRMAN: I'm talking about this circle of	
23			communication.	
24		Α.	As I say, and as I said Chairman, I firmly believe that	
25			the matter in relation to the Marian Finucane programme	16:1
26			was discussed between myself and Gerald Kean,	
27			certainly. And who may be the appropriate person to	

29

contact in relation to issues pertaining to the

investigation by John O'Mahony, that certainly I

1		believe. As for the rest of the conversation I can't	
2		possibly tell you, other than I did ring Gerald Kean	
3		back on the Sunday and I do believe that that	
4		conversation related to did he get in contact with	
5		somebody, did he go on the programme and then, as you	16:11
6		can see, it's only for two minutes and whatever, so I	
7		got very little information from Gerald Kean, for	
8		whatever reason, at that time and then that could have	
9		precipitated, well, what is going on with Gerald Kean,	
10		he didn't give me any information whether he was on the	16:11
11		programme or not, that could have precipitated my call	
12		to Commissioner Callinan. And I'm merely saying that	
13		could have precipitated my call to Commissioner	
14		Callinan. It could also have been work related or	
15		issues in relation to what was happening in Dun	16:11
16		Laoghaire at that time. It could have. But as you say	
17		it would be reasonable to assume it had certainly	
18		something to do with the programme, but I can be honest	
19		with you and say that there was nothing discussed. For	
20		instance, the Commissioner never brought it to my	16:11
21		attention that he had been in communication with Gerald	
22		Kean after the programme and something happened in the	
23		programme that may have concern for other people.	
24		MR. MARRINAN: Maybe Mr. Callinan can fill in the gaps.	
25		Thank you very much.	16:12
26	Α.	Thank you.	
27			

780 Q. MR. McDOWELL: Chief superintendent, just one question.

28

29

WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McDOWELL AS FOLLOWS:

1			CHAIRMAN: If you wouldn't mind explaining to the chief	
2			superintendent who you are for, he probably knows.	
3	781	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: I am appearing for Sergeant Maurice	
4			McCabe, among other counsel. Did you ever hear any	
5			rumours in An Garda Síochána about Sergeant McCabe and	16:12
6			sexual abuse?	
7		Α.	No. I heard rumours in relation to him being	
8			investigated for matters, but I wasn't a hundred	
9			percent sure. I heard describe them as floating	
10			rumours, about something about some sexual matters.	16:12
11			But I have absolutely no knowledge or specifics in	
12			relation to it. And it was one of the areas that I	
13			avoided, we'll say, to the best of my ability, other	
14			than that kind of distant rumour and I never actually	
15			asked anybody ever what actually are the specifics of	16:12
16			the relationship. I'm absolute believer, if you don't	
17			know the specifics and if you don't know the facts and	
18			you don't know the evidence and you have no evidence to	
19			support what has been said keep your mouth shut.	
20	782	Q.	Thank you.	16:13
21				
22			WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS AS FOLLOWS:	
23	783	Q.	MS. BURNS: Mr. O'Sullivan, I'm Tara Burns and I appear	
24			on behalf of Superintendent Taylor. You've indicated	
25			in your evidence to Mr. Marrinan that your normal	16:13
26			practice would be to refer any inquiries on to the	
27			Press Office, is that correct?	
28		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	

29 784 Q. I see. And in terms then of your communications with

1			Mr. Kean, they occurred on the evening of the 24th	
2			January at six o'clock in the evening just after that	
3			and then the following morning at 11:58 on the 25th	
4			January, is that correct?	
5		Α.	That's correct.	16:13
6	785	Q.	So I suppose there's the possibility that if Mr. Kean	
7			took up your option of contacting the Press Office that	
8			obviously could have happened that morning before he	
9			contacted you?	
10		Α.	It could have happened then or subsequent, I'm not	16:14
11			sure.	
12	786	Q.	Thank you very much.	
13		Α.	Thank you.	
14				
15			MR. LEHANE: Mr. Chairman, I just have one question for	16:14
16			this witness.	
17				
18			WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE AS FOLLOWS:	
19	787	Q.	MR. LEHANE: Good afternoon my name is Darren Lehane	
20			and I appear for John McGuinness. Just in connection	16:14
21			with the 15-minute telephone call that you had with	
22			Mr. Callinan on the 26th, do you have any recollection	
23			of him mentioning that he met with Deputy McGuinness a	
24			short while prior to that telephone call?	
25		Α.	I'm quite satisfied he didn't. That conversation never	16:14
26			occurred or arose.	
27	788	Q.	Thank you.	
28				
29			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I beg your pardon. Mr. Lehane, if	

1			you give me a question to read your question again,	
2			sorry. All right. So, there was no mention of any	
3			meeting in a car park. All right. So that is fine.	
4				
5			WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS AS	16:14
6			FOLLOWS:	
7	789	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Mr. O'Sullivan, just one or two	
8			matters. Can you assist the Tribunal just in relation	
9			to putting your best description on it, your	
10			acquaintance with Mr. Kean, was it reasonably limited	16:15
11			or was it more full?	
12		Α.	It's reasonably limited. I might have a call from	
13			Mr. Kean, we'll say, on 1st November 2011 and I	
14			mightn't hear from him again until 1st November 2012.	
15			That may be the way. And then I might have a	16:15
16			conversation with him on two or three different	
17			occasions.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Is it All Souls Day you're referring to?	
19		Α.	Sorry.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Why 1st November?	16:15
21		Α.	Oh, I just picked November, sorry.	
22			CHAIRMAN: All right.	
23	790	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Mr. Kean has indicated, we	
24			don't want to go into any unnecessary private matters,	
25			but he indicated his contacts with you in large measure	16:15
26			would have been arising out of the burglary that he	
27			suffered and also a business premises in the Dun	
28			Laoghaire area I think?	
20		۸	Vos Ho has a business interest in Dun Lacabaire and T	

1			had discussions with him in relation to policing	
2			matters in that regard.	
3	791	Q.	I think you also met him at, I think your son's rugby	
4			match and he was there supporting a nephew at a cup	
5			final or something of that nature?	16:16
6		Α.	That's right. He attended his nephew's games on	
7			occasions and my son was also playing.	
8	792	Q.	You have indicated to the Chairman that you yourself at	
9			no point actually listened to the Marian Finucane	
10			programme on the weekend in question?	16:16
11		Α.	That's correct.	
12	793	Q.	And that it was only in fact when you had a chance to	
13			read the transcript of the programme in the Tribunal	
14			papers that you managed to actually read the excerpts	
15			dealing with Mr. Kean's contributions concerning the	16:16
16			penalty point question?	
17		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
18	794	Q.	Just broadly speaking in a general way did these series	
19			of phone calls and did your contacts with Mr. Kean on	
20			this occasion, did they loom large in your life or do	16:17
21			they stick out in your life as a memorable event?	
22		Α.	Absolutely not, Chairman. As a matter of fact they	
23			have no relevance to me whatsoever. And when I was	
24			asked to make a statement originally I actually	
25			contacted the investigators here in Dublin Castle to	16:17
26			find out exactly what areas I was to cover and that is	
27			basically, we'll say, why my first statement related	
28			to only amounted to nine lines. Because I thought I	
29			didn't have any dealings with Maurice McCabe but I	

- subsequently in relation to reading that, I was a chief
 superintendent in Dun Laoghaire when a complaint was
 made from the Data Protection Commissioner, which was
 investigated by the office in Dun Laoghaire and I had
 briefed Superintendent Martin Fitzgerald in relation to that investigation and advised him as to what he should
- 8 795 Q. You needn't go into any names in relation to that, but
 9 that was something that was dealt with in a normal
 10 routine way, statements obtained, sent up the line, and 16:18
 11 that took its normal course?

do relative to that inquiry, investigation.

- 12 I distinctly remember having a conversation with Α. Yeah. 13 Superintendent Fitzgerald and advising him, listen, 14 this is how this is to be done: Statement number one. statement number two, statement number three, up to me, 16:18 15 16 we will send it up for advice and take our cue from 17 there and follow the investigation according to the 18 advice that we receive from HQ.
- 19 796 Q. Other than that peripheral connection, did you yourself
 20 personally to your knowledge ever cross paths with 16:18
 21 Sergeant Maurice McCabe?
- A. I don't believe I did. As I said in my statement, I
 would have had occasion to travel, we'll say, across
 country in relation to subversive investigations and
 Cavan-Monaghan would be an area we would visit very
 regularly, so it is possible that I may have met
 Maurice McCabe but I just have no recollection of it or
 I can't recall it happening.

16:19

29 797 Q. Thanks very much.

7

Т	Α.	Thank you.	
2		CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
3		MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much.	
4	Α.	Thanks Mr. Chairman.	
5			16:19
6		THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
7			
8		MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, that concludes all the	
9		evidence of the witnesses scheduled for today. There	
10		are more scheduled for tomorrow.	16:19
11		CHAIRMAN: Do you want to tell me about that?	
12		MR. McGUINNESS: It includes Mr. Seamus McCarthy, the	
13		Comptroller and Auditor General, and Mr. McLindon and	
14		Mr. Brian Purcell the former secretary.	
15		CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you very much.	16:20
16			
17		THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL FRIDAY, 13TH APRIL	
18		2018 AT 10:00AM	
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
29			

	1		1	
•	119:27, 149:9,	1793 [1] - 157:4	121:19, 121:22,	230:7, 235:1
	206:29, 207:18	17th [4] - 61:17,	122:5, 123:8, 123:16,	25 [1] - 225:6
	15 [3] - 133:27,	61:18, 150:21, 155:14	163:5, 165:17,	257 [1] - 86:13
'13 [1] - 214:23	225:6, 229:4	18 [2] - 3:13, 224:6	165:20, 167:19,	25th [9] - 45:14,
'14 [1] - 214:23	15-minute [1] -	1805 [2] - 61:14,	168:5, 168:7, 168:14,	71:3, 87:3, 135:19,
'15 [1] - 214:23	235:21	61:16	168:18, 177:20,	160:3, 164:29, 220:8,
'16 [1] - 214:24	152 [1] - 4:10	1807 [1] - 61:21	177:28, 194:4, 194:6,	221:3, 235:3
'97 [1] - 218:1	1530 [1] - 162:8	1809 [2] - 217:7,	196:26, 197:29,	26 [1] - 224:22
'99 [1] - 218:5	1532 [1] - 184:5	220:5	206:21, 210:11,	26/1/2014 [1] - 91:26
'desist [1] - 120:18	1533 [1] - 187:13	1828 [1] - 219:13	210:15, 210:16,	26th [15] - 6:1, 6:17,
'if [1] - 120:8	1537 [1] - 167:29	183 [1] - 4:17	214:19	9:11, 52:7, 53:3, 71:3,
'judge [1] - 17:11	1540 [1] - 168:8	1831 [1] - 223:15	2014 [23] - 1:4, 6:14,	81:27, 109:14,
' oh [1] - 210:2	1541 [1] - 202:29	1838 [1] - 88:16	6:17, 35:23, 53:3,	142:29, 143:5, 160:3,
'private [1] - 157:23	155 [1] - 4:11	1839 [1] - 88:15	62:29, 77:14, 78:13,	220:24, 224:17,
'sports [1] - 17:12	1558 [1] - 199:16	18:03 [1] - 223:27	87:3, 91:8, 113:24,	235:22
opening (i)	15:54 [3] - 50:23,	18th [2] - 149:19,	148:4, 166:28,	27th [4] - 120:17,
1	226:7, 226:13	208:18	167:25, 168:2, 168:3,	121:2, 121:18, 207:21
•	15:54:36 [1] - 224:29		177:28, 220:8,	28 [1] - 54:10
	15.54.36 [1] - 224.29 15th [3] - 121:24,	19 [1] - 220:4	220:24, 221:16,	28th [5] - 121:19,
1 [4] - 3:7, 66:18,	184:9, 230:12	1916 [1] - 119:12	221:27, 223:25	121:21, 202:18,
83:6, 104:17	,	1918 [1] - 123:1	2015 [11] - 21:12,	213:28, 213:29
109 [1] - 4:7	16 [3] - 1:6, 123:10, 223:26	1921 [1] - 1:10	121:24, 177:29,	29 [1] - 199:16
10:00 [1] - 152:10		1977 [1] - 217:21	202:18, 213:28,	29th [3] - 70:25,
10:00AM [1] - 239:18	16(v [1] - 61:21	1982 [1] - 217:22	213:29, 214:7,	161:15, 213:29
10:30 [1] - 49:6	16.5 [1] - 72:19	1989 [1] - 162:17	214:15, 215:4, 218:22	2nd [1] - 32:26
10:30am [1] - 152:10	162 [1] - 4:14	1990 [2] - 217:24,	2016 [20] - 179:1,	Ziid [i] - 32.20
112 [1] - 4:8	16:14 [1] - 230:26	217:27	192:23, 194:11,	3
11:00 [1] - 49:8	16:26 [1] - 47:10	1999 [1] - 162:25	195:3, 195:5, 195:13,	J
11:30 [3] - 74:7,	16:50 [1] - 47:24	19th [1] - 157:10	195:18, 196:24,	
91:13, 91:20	17 [1] - 1:10	1st [5] - 32:26,	196:26, 198:2,	3 [5] - 10:7, 66:24,
11:58 [1] - 235:3	1705 [2] - 12:24,	120:28, 236:13,	198:12, 198:17,	83:6, 104:18, 184:4
11:58:25 [1] - 224:4	12:27	236:14, 236:20	198:29, 202:13,	3,000 [1] - 8:17
12/2/2014 [4] - 84:19,	1706 [2] - 18:21,		202:14, 203:14,	30 [3] - 80:10, 85:11,
86:21, 91:13, 91:20	19:19	2	204:13, 214:6,	89:8
12:30 [1] - 99:18	1707 [1] - 27:13		217:12, 218:24	31 [1] - 229:7
12:30-12:35 [1] -	1714 [1] - 29:10	2 [9] - 2:30, 3:18,	2017 [12] - 1:6, 1:10,	31st [2] - 120:27,
49:26	1715 [1] - 32:2	3:20, 3:21, 66:21,	37:19, 59:11, 59:17,	120:28
12:43 [2] - 49:16,	1717 [1] - 31:19	67:29, 75:24, 83:6,	61:18, 124:2, 149:4,	32 [1] - 2:12
224:24	1725 [1] - 5:22	104:18	150:18, 150:22,	35 [1] - 184:6
12:50 [1] - 46:27	1736 [2] - 81:16,	2,000 [1] - 8:17	184:9, 208:18	37-42 [1] - 3:17
12TH [2] - 1:18, 5:1	81:19	20 [2] - 42:20, 80:18	2018 [5] - 1:18, 5:2,	38 [1] - 110:23
12th [13] - 73:16,	174 [1] - 4:15	2001 [1] - 162:28	150:24, 157:6, 239:18	3rd [1] - 32:26
73:20, 73:23, 74:14,	1740 [1] - 84:11	2002 [1] - 218:11	205 [1] - 4:18	
77:14, 78:13, 79:19,	1741 [1] - 86:10	2003 [1] - 218:14	208 [1] - 4:19	4
83:20, 83:22, 84:25,	1768 [2] - 37:13,	2004 [1] - 162:29	20th [3] - 62:6,	•
93:22, 148:4, 149:4	58:15	2005 [1] - 162:29	149:24, 207:1	
13 [6] - 13:12, 18:3,	177 [1] - 4:16	2006 [2] - 203:24,	21 [1] - 2:29	4 [5] - 3:3, 10:12,
18:28, 33:20, 224:6,	1770 [1] - 39:8	211:27	210 [1] - 4:20	83:7, 104:18, 187:11
230:13	1771 [4] - 39:11,	2007 [1] - 37:13	217 [1] - 4:23	40 [2] - 85:11, 224:9
13,000 [1] - 117:18	59:8, 60:12, 62:5	2011 [1] - 236:13	22nd [1] - 123:16	47 [1] - 229:9
1348 [3] - 112:28,	1773 [4] - 57:20,	2012 [15] - 26:26,	233 [1] - 4:24	49 [1] - 51:25
114:5, 114:15	61:12, 63:23, 63:24	119:27, 120:18,	234 [1] - 4:25	4th [6] - 57:15,
13:09 [1] - 46:27	1774 [2] - 52:2, 57:17	120:27, 121:2, 163:9,	235 [1] - 4:26	57:17, 57:18, 123:8,
13th [1] - 37:19	1777 [1] - 64:12	164:29, 174:4, 185:4,	236 [1] - 4:27	157:5
13TH [1] - 239:17	1779 [1] - 67:8	199:27, 207:1,	23rd [4] - 113:20,	
14 [4] - 13:12, 18:3,	1782 [3] - 76:1,	207:18, 207:21,	122:5, 219:21, 221:16	5
18:28, 33:20	78:18, 78:19	218:20, 236:14	248 [1] - 84:12	
145 [1] - 4:9	1783 [1] - 74:24	2013 [31] - 32:27,	24th [8] - 40:28,	5 M - A-A 10-12
14th [8] - 37:12,	1784 [1] - 40:20	110:28, 120:28,	113:23, 160:3,	5 _[4] - 4:4, 10:13, 10:22, 83:7
48:16, 62:4, 119:20,	1789 [1] - 40:26	121:17, 121:18,	221:27, 223:25,	
,,		121.11, 121.10,	,,	51 [2] - 3:2, 224:24

		-		
52 [1] - 224:29	absolutely [50] -	221:15, 223:13	adjective [1] -	110:7, 143:6, 224:23
57 [1] - 51:25	5:15, 7:1, 7:3, 25:21,	accurate [4] - 43:27,	113:26	agenda [2] - 6:29,
	29:22, 30:29, 31:13,	45:8, 58:2, 64:8	ADJOURNED [2] -	190:28
6	50:5, 87:10, 90:7,	accusations [4] -	111:22, 239:17	agent [2] - 87:18,
	100:14, 127:17,	54:7, 54:15, 54:20,	adjudicated [1] -	107:3
	127:19, 129:13,	55:6	66:26	Agent [3] - 217:29,
6 [3] - 3:6, 11:8,	130:29, 138:11,	accused [1] - 53:13	administration [3] -	218:9, 218:10
162:8	145:9, 145:12, 159:5,	acknowledge [1] -	163:17, 189:27,	agents [1] - 218:18
6/2/2014 [1] - 91:23	160:26, 173:18,	8:20	211:29	aggrieved [2] -
64 [1] - 1:18	173:26, 175:7,	acquaintance [3] -	admiration [1] - 65:3	143:12, 143:16
6:45 [1] - 105:13	175:27, 177:3,	34:14, 126:5, 236:10	admirer [2] - 11:24,	agitated [1] - 228:12
6th [5] - 57:13, 63:3,	179:15, 179:16,	1		
82:7, 82:9, 91:8	180:17, 184:27,	acquaintances [1] -	15:1	ago [8] - 35:10, 63:3,
32.11, 32.13, 3.113	186:3, 186:10,	139:21	adopt [1] - 82:2	80:18, 80:22, 136:29,
7		Act [15] - 20:12, 23:7,	adopted [2] - 67:14,	231:24
1	186:28, 193:5, 193:7,	23:10, 24:23, 26:19,	220:6	agree [13] - 21:18,
	193:11, 197:26,	47:22, 54:1, 54:12,	adults [1] - 208:28	21:19, 29:18, 68:23,
7 [6] - 2:12, 3:10,	201:26, 202:2,	65:26, 66:25, 93:11,	advance [6] - 6:19,	77:12, 107:26,
3:14, 5:21, 11:11,	209:23, 211:27,	109:17, 115:20,	60:3, 67:28, 80:8,	109:19, 116:15,
217:7	223:3, 223:14, 226:8,	115:22, 188:14	91:15, 99:5	124:17, 131:23,
7:51 [1] - 73:16	227:16, 229:19,	ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9	adverse [2] - 56:12,	133:24, 138:28,
7.51[1] - 73.10 7th [1] - 124:2	230:3, 234:11, 237:22	act [6] - 20:14, 26:2,	56:14	140:27
/ UI [1] * 124.2	abuse [5] - 93:12,	80:21, 125:22,	adversely [1] - 56:16	agreed [9] - 21:4,
	100:28, 135:3,	211:24, 211:27	advice [14] - 34:22,	21:9, 26:10, 38:16,
8	208:27, 234:6	acted [8] - 14:28,	35:9, 69:27, 87:14,	45:4, 80:3, 91:11,
	accept [18] - 11:22,	28:5, 28:16, 80:17,	115:17, 115:19,	150:15, 158:5
8 [3] - 2:20, 2:25,	27:21, 27:24, 28:23,	84:1, 84:3, 84:24,	118:27, 147:24,	agreement [2] -
11:12	29:28, 42:5, 43:23,	89:6	156:14, 184:22,	45:27, 89:1
88 [1] - 88:17	47:5, 60:5, 92:16,	acting [5] - 32:15,	202:7, 202:12,	agrees [2] - 69:25,
	106:13, 129:10,	- · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	182:10
8:00 [1] - 105:14	137:25, 152:16,	33:16, 34:6, 73:13,	238:16, 238:18	
8:26 [1] - 83:22	194:9, 197:27, 198:2,	134:11	advise [2] - 227:13,	ahead [2] - 31:13
	207:10	Acting [3] - 170:27,	227:20	air [2] - 31:11, 52:24
9	accepted [4] - 15:12,	181:11, 181:12	advised [11] - 38:1,	aired [8] - 53:2,
	29:19, 96:27, 186:13	action [11] - 1:28,	38:6, 53:16, 65:18,	53:11, 54:20, 54:24,
9 [1] - 229:7	accepts [1] - 185:19	30:14, 32:6, 33:5,	65:21, 65:23, 65:25,	68:5, 68:22, 102:1,
92 [1] - 218:1	access [6] - 32:21,	59:28, 60:28, 91:10,	66:24, 68:7, 118:28,	109:14
	I	115:23, 117:28,	238:6	airing [2] - 55:5,
95 [1] - 4:5	114:27, 117:23,	143:18, 231:22	adviser[1] - 165:29	55:14
99 [1] - 4:6	120:20, 147:6, 207:1	actions [2] - 7:25,	advising [2] - 89:3,	airwaves [1] - 53:26
99.9 [1] - 41:22	accessed [1] - 25:10	29:14	238:13	alarm [2] - 49:21,
9:43 [1] - 224:21	accessible [1] -	active [1] - 77:22	advocated [2] -	50:6
	213:23	actively [1] - 199:3	13:25, 19:24	alert [1] - 166:21
Α	accessing [2] -	activities [1] - 28:16	affair [2] - 169:10,	alerted [1] - 209:1
	25:18, 120:1	activity [1] - 176:29	227:22	alia [1] - 56:6
0 m (0) 02.22	accompany [1] -	acts [2] - 14:23,	affairs [3] - 126:21,	ALISON [2] - 2:18,
a.m [3] - 83:22,	165:22	14:24	146:21, 163:20	3:12
91:13, 91:20	accomplished [1] -	actual [4] - 75:24,	affecting [1] - 56:17	allegation [9] -
AA [3] - 163:20,	126:11	79:8, 159:16, 204:16	affidavit [6] - 45:19,	65:27, 100:28,
184:19, 189:20	accordance [1] -	adamant [2] - 22:15,	76:26, 87:11, 109:23,	145:11, 188:13,
aback [1] - 200:29	133:28	166:14		
ability [3] - 147:17,	according [5] -		150:25, 150:28	189:10, 190:4,
229:6, 234:13	46:28, 47:4, 50:21,	adamantly [1] -	affirmed [2] - 53:19,	193:15, 204:19
able [12] - 19:12,	190:21, 238:17	53:28	53:28	allegations [17] -
31:8, 44:2, 46:15,	accordingly [1] -	add [3] - 51:23,	aforementioned [1] -	12:10, 17:13, 54:24,
50:26, 126:10, 133:8,	81:14	108:6, 229:7	37:20	65:7, 66:2, 93:13,
143:1, 155:27,	account [3] - 149:15,	addition [4] - 30:17,	AFTER [1] - 112:1	115:7, 115:29, 117:5,
183:24, 201:6, 208:20		68:14, 106:17, 111:11	afternoon [10] - 47:7,	121:13, 122:15,
above-named [1] -	155:9, 198:26	additional [2] -	50:22, 99:14, 111:8,	123:12, 142:7,
1:27	Accounts [12] - 7:11,	107:28, 123:26	112:14, 152:4,	163:23, 165:5, 171:4,
absent [1] - 104:3	7:17, 11:25, 13:4,	additions [1] - 87:12	177:10, 228:14,	171:8
absolute [1] - 234:16	45:6, 53:6, 54:26,	address [2] - 70:14,	231:12, 235:19	alleged [7] - 50:4,
ubsciate [i] - 204.10	57:4, 69:12, 94:5,	174:26	afterwards [4] - 8:9,	164:5, 165:11,
	i	1	l	i .

167:10, 174:3, 229:11 231:2 ascertained [1] -AT [1] - 239:18 189:14, 193:22 answers [1] - 143:1 approach [3] - 82:2, 152:6 attachment [1] - 92:9 alleges [1] - 55:22 anti [1] - 123:9 123:24, 133:25 ascertaining [1] attachments [1] **allow** [2] - 117:17, anti-fraud [1] - 123:9 approached [3] -128:24 88.20 118:3 66:10, 123:21, 211:18 assertions [3] - 38:9, antifraud [1] - 30:18 attempt [3] - 33:6, almost [4] - 75:23, anxious [5] - 44:1, approaches [1] -39:26, 55:21 33:7. 65:15 96:1, 116:16, 190:23 assist [10] - 66:11, 79:23, 102:14, 95:3 attempted [1] - 91:15 alone [1] - 213:1 107:13, 108:14 approaching [1] -92:5, 100:29, 103:22, attempting [1] alongside [1] anyway [7] - 17:18, 110:19 103:23, 105:25, 56:26 19:17, 52:29, 58:16. 135:6, 168:9, 227:1, 196:10 appropriate [16] attend [3] - 8:28, alterations [1] - 75:7 16:27, 60:28, 65:12, 236:8 58:19, 80:19, 138:25 103:21 altercation [3] apart [1] - 126:16 65:17, 80:3, 97:29, assistance [18] attendance [2] -175:19, 175:23, 108:28, 115:4, 142:6, 39:4, 58:2, 58:22, apologies [5] -9:10, 84:21 58:27, 60:21, 60:24, 175:24 172:26, 172:27, 222:28, 227:6, attendances [1] -227:12, 230:16, 61:2, 62:22, 64:8, altogether [4] -182:7, 210:16, 216:26 107:1 230:18, 230:21, 77:18, 82:12, 103:23, 49:25, 133:14, apologise 131 attended [3] -133:15, 133:16 232:27 106:1, 128:24, 66:15, 85:26, 185:21 165:26, 174:24, 237:6 appropriateness [1] 202:28, 207:9, amended [2] - 81:1, apologised [1] attending [3] - 8:15, 218:29, 219:17 - 88:21 81:5 39:28 84:24, 103:28 approval [1] - 148:26 Assistant [17] amending [1] - 81:14 apology [2] - 38:28, attention [5] - 104:9, 15:17, 68:7, 120:12, April [3] - 120:28, amendments [2] -40:1 120:12, 225:21, 75:7, 87:11 apparent [1] - 103:24 122:5, 124:2 124:1, 124:22, 164:1, 226:2, 233:21 164:19, 172:4, 174:2, APRIL[3] - 1:18, 5:2, amends [1] - 55:7 appear [18] - 21:1, attitude [3] - 28:14, 181:6, 181:11, 239:17 amount [3] - 51:25, 33:24, 42:28, 45:15, 82:5, 214:28 area [3] - 139:22, 181:26, 194:1, 45:26, 47:23, 69:29, 51:26, 173:14 attributed [1] -236:28, 238:25 201:12, 203:6, 203:9, 104:15, 121:24, 143:12 amounted [1] -222:5 237:28 146:20, 152:9, 162:8, areas [3] - 98:7, attributing [1] assistant [13] -AND [3] - 1:4, 1:5, 183:17, 223:29, 234:12, 237:26 215:20 10:17, 13:8, 20:20, argued [1] - 116:5 225:14, 231:28, attribution [1] -27:22, 28:24, 117:4, 234:23, 235:20 arise [5] - 102:2, anger [5] - 205:12, 44:12 117:6, 122:7, 162:23, 102:8, 132:23, 205:25, 205:27, appearance [3] -Auditor[5] - 111:2, 162:27, 171:10, 206:4, 206:7 38:3, 221:14, 225:15 132:26, 205:5 164:23, 164:26, 180:6, 193:17 APPEARANCES[1] arising [3] - 7:16, angrily [3] - 184:14, 165:11, 239:13 assistants [1] -124:3, 236:26 185:28, 187:20 AUGUSTUS[1] armed [1] - 13:5 87.25 appeared [9] - 6:10, angry [5] - 174:16, 3:12 assisted [4] - 81:13, 7:12, 38:20, 39:15, arose [6] - 26:15, 175:16, 184:16, **author** [3] - 119:14, 84:18, 216:22, 232:9 105:18, 143:11, 92:19, 130:17, 187:22, 206:2 122.13 123.13 assisting [3] - 62:13, 203:16, 225:11, 171:27, 182:12, angst [2] - 170:26, authorised [2] -62:18, 85:8 226:17 235:26 215:27 123:11, 172:19 **ARRAN**[3] - 2:12, associated [1] - 72:5 appearing [6] animosity [1] - 55:26 authorities [1] associates [1] -**Ann** [2] - 53:15, 14:14, 61:27, 125:15, 3:9, 3:10 65:17 152:11, 177:11, 234:3 156:13 53:16 arrange [1] - 9:9 Authority [16] association [1] annoyance[1] appendices [1] arranged [3] - 85:13, 163:2, 163:7, 163:11, 163:20 72:29 121:19 91:12, 201:19 163:15, 163:27, assume [5] - 80:5, application [2] - 5:7, annoyed [7] - 28:8, arrest [4] - 170:1, 169:2, 177:16, 81:29, 119:3, 213:16, 112:5 170:29, 194:13, 54:24, 55:29, 56:1, 184:14, 187:20, 233:17 174:28, 175:6, 200:12 apply [1] - 5:12 215:22 190:14, 193:9, 194:3, assumed [2] appointed [4] arrested [6] - 169:19, 211:23, 211:25, annoys [1] - 29:21 106:26, 213:23 65:13, 65:19, 121:12, 178:1, 181:21, 211:27, 211:28 anonymous [7] assuming [10] -163:1 215:12, 216:4, 216:6 96:20, 96:22, 101:22, authority [7] -50:27, 50:28, 67:26, appointment [2] arrived [1] - 198:1 107:20, 117:22, 117:10, 121:13, 78:24, 78:26, 80:15, 74:7, 201:19 article [1] - 178:5 118:6, 163:16, 164:8, 122:12, 123:12 80:22, 91:5, 100:2, appreciate [10] articles [1] - 44:20 189:15, 190:17 answer [12] - 34:23, 125:3 119:7, 124:4, 125:25, 86:10, 90:6, 95:12, articulated [1] **avail** [2] - 131:4, assumption [2] -126:15 154:18 131:6 104:3, 124:28, 117.8 174:21, 176:28 198:6, 202:21, available [6] - 5:24, 132:28, 174:6, **AS**[10] - 5:1, 112:1, assurance [3] -205:21, 219:5, 225:8 181:15, 199:24, 205:9, 208:15, 85:29, 116:25, 121:8, 181:28, 209:13, 201:6, 214:11 appreciated [3] -210:25, 217:10, 137:2, 150:25 209:21 58:3, 64:9, 191:5 answered [3] -233:28, 234:22, availed [1] - 124:21 assured [1] - 38:15 appreciating [1] -235:18, 236:5 availing [1] - 190:17 109:20, 220:19,

avoided [1] - 234:13 await [1] - 55:17 aware [34] - 7:27, 16:4, 17:13, 30:11, 31:3, 43:9, 68:6, 70:26, 74:6, 77:6, 91:25, 113:17, 114:2, 115:14, 116:4, 118:17, 118:20, 119:20, 119:27, 122:12, 122:15, 123:16, 184:12, 187:18, 189:24, 199:24, 200:28, 201:3, 201:7, 201:11, 201:12, 201:20, 208:25 aware" [1] - 119:18 awareness [1] -199:29 В

back-up [2] - 97:6, 165:7 backed [1] - 72:25 background [3] -100:5, 102:15, 103:2 bad [2] - 36:12, 104.5 badly [3] - 14:27, 31:5, 216:15 Balbriggan [1] -215:13 **baldly** [1] - 194:20 bandied [1] - 118:4 **bank** [2] - 113:1, 131:7 Banking [1] - 163:4 barrister [5] - 112:3, 194:11, 197:10, 197:28 Barton [2] - 5:10, 108:22 **BARTON** [5] - 3:15, 5:6, 5:10, 108:24, 183:9 barton [1] - 183:8 based [16] - 15:23, 20:27, 21:11, 22:1, 24:12, 25:13, 30:15, 32:8, 39:23, 56:15, 69:27, 73:5, 78:4, 101:22, 148:29, 163:27 **basis** [7] - 38:1, 98:16, 103:19, 134:26, 157:21,

216:2, 228:8

bear [2] - 99:21, 103:8 bearing [4] - 17:6, 51:18, 80:5, 94:19 became [14] - 35:19, 38:29, 106:2, 113:22, 118:17, 118:20, 121:20, 122:12, 162:23, 174:28, 174:29, 181:25, 189:28, 208:25 become [4] - 102:9, 174:16, 175:5, 175:16 becoming [1] -212:22 **BEEN** [3] - 5:17, 162:11, 217:9 **beforehand** [6] - 6:9, 6:22, 6:23, 13:2, 33:26, 82:16 beg [2] - 159:27, 235:29 beginning [2] -67:18, 197:1 behalf [15] - 21:28, 67:25, 84:18, 86:26, 87:26, 95:10, 99:15, 108:27, 111:16, 112:17, 112:18, 177:11, 183:17, 183:18, 234:24 behaving [1] -176:23 behaviour [6] -172:1, 180:24, 184:15, 187:21, 193:25, 193:28 behest [4] - 13:18, 28:7, 34:7, 68:15 behind [2] - 90:14, 220:21 behold [1] - 229:27 belief [2] - 103:15, 231:26

believer [1] - 234:16 believes [1] - 128:14

bell [6] - 142:17, 143:8, 152:15, 153:4, 153:28, 174:17 bells [2] - 49:21, 50:6 belonging [2] -

125:17, 145:4 below [1] - 54:18 benefit [5] - 13:17, 77:18. 77:19. 217:19. 223.4

bereavement [4] -184:18, 187:24, 188:19

best [10] - 36:9,

36:13, 69:20, 92:1, 92:4, 115:17, 143:23, 223:22, 234:13, 236:9 **better** [9] - 5:8, 11:6, 51:2, 65:2, 101:5, 154:7, 200:15, 216:28, 219:9

> between [28] - 7:17, 11:9, 47:5, 51:24, 89:26, 103:10, 103:13, 116:13, 118:14, 134:5, 134:7, 135:12, 136:1, 136:3,

136:6, 173:24, 175:24, 177:27, 182:3, 183:3, 185:2, 187:28, 196:26, 219:29, 224:28,

225:13, 232:26 Bewley's [1] -

113:23 beyond [10] - 24:18, 32:22, 32:29, 44:25, 94:12, 94:16, 102:10,

107:21, 137:6, 213:12 big [1] - 215:1 billing [2] - 155:6, 161:13

bit [10] - 7:9, 79:2, 96:17, 114:14, 118:9, 119:16, 122:26, 130:28, 212:22

bite [1] - 36:15 bits [1] - 52:5

BL [10] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, 2:28, 3:8, 3:12, 3:19

blame [1] - 215:21 blanket [1] - 21:9 blocked [1] - 154:28

blond [1] - 10:20 **blue** [2] - 178:19, 197:11

blurt [1] - 131:26 board [28] - 164:8,

164:22, 164:25, 189:11, 189:14, 189:15, 189:16, 189:23, 189:28,

189:29, 190:3, 190:4, 190:11, 190:14,

190:15, 190:24, 190:27, 190:28, 191:5, 191:6, 191:10, 191:15, 191:19, 191:23, 191:25.

191:26, 192:23, 193:8 Board [3] - 162:28,

163:6, 163:7

bodies [2] - 65:17,

147:24

70:26

bolster [1] - 32:17 bones [1] - 144:3 book [1] - 29:10

bore [1] - 55:25 boring [1] - 48:23

borough [1] - 162:24

81:19 BOUGHTON [6] -

145:16, 145:18, 151:23

bound [5] - 178:9, 197:8, 197:11, 197:18, 197:26

BOW [1] - 3:13 Branch [3] - 35:16,

bravery [1] - 65:4 breach [8] - 23:7, 23:10, 24:23, 26:18, 47:21, 65:26, 115:20, 115:22

20:14, 24:29, 26:2, 54:1, 54:12, 109:15, 109:17, 188:14 breaches [7] - 48:5,

66:24, 93:10, 97:10, 119:9, 119:10, 141:9 break [1] - 111:17

Brett [33] - 5:11, 162:14, 167:27, 174:12, 177:10, 180:29, 182:29,

183:23, 184:13, 184:15, 185:15, 185:18, 185:25,

190:26, 192:12, 192:29, 193:14,

195:4, 198:7, 198:27, 199:5, 200:23,

201:23, 202:27, 208:17, 216:15

BRETT [6] - 3:15, 4:13, 162:11, 174:10,

body [2] - 65:6,

booklet [1] - 184:5

bottom [8] - 10:8, 10:21, 12:27, 19:18, 29:15, 44:3, 81:16,

3:19, 4:9, 112:3,

Boughton [1] - 112:3

bow [1] - 35:7

217:23, 222:13

breached [9] - 20:11,

BREFFNI [1] - 2:10 108:24, 162:5, 162:6, 183:11, 183:16,

187:19, 187:21,

177:8, 183:14

Brian [4] - 165:28,

166:2, 166:21, 239:14 BRIAN [1] - 2:22

brief [5] - 112:6, 131:4, 162:14, 204:24, 217:18 briefed [12] - 42:7, 42:11, 42:14, 92:7,

99:29, 100:23, 101:16, 135:2, 164:24, 191:28, 204:27, 238:5

briefing [8] - 100:5, 101:17, 109:5, 131:3, 160:2, 209:10,

209:19, 210:13 briefly [3] - 170:4, 174:12, 192:29

BRIEFLY [1] -101:11

bring [4] - 119:17, 139:28, 145:10,

165:16 bringing [2] - 70:8, 182.18

brings [1] - 110:13 broad [1] - 71:12

broadcast [5] -23:29, 81:17, 145:23, 158:27, 224:17

broadcasts [1] -

broadly [8] - 98:8, 98:9, 113:18, 114:2, 114:4, 119:1, 142:15, 237:18

broken [1] - 54:23 brought [13] - 26:23, 40:6, 60:17, 71:15, 94:10, 104:8, 119:13, 120:11, 168:1, 182:13, 225:21,

Brussels [3] -195:21. 203:29 buckram [1] - 197:11

226:2, 233:20

236:26

bulging [1] - 176:8 burglary [4] - 126:1, 137:10, 156:16,

BURNS [10] - 2:27, 4:16, 4:25, 177:8, 177:10, 182:29, 183:4, 183:6, 234:22,

234:23 Burns [1] - 177:11 burns [2] - 183:2, 234:23

bury [4] - 27:23, 27:24, 28:26, 170:12 business [8] -

114:11, 115:18, 150:29, 153:1, Carr [1] - 12:3 148:10, 148:20, 137:10, 137:13, 125:29, 138:2, 153:13, 153:18, carried [3] - 38:8, 163:11, 163:17, 137:16, 137:22, 174:24, 223:10, 153:23, 154:24, 92:14, 119:24 167:9, 176:27, 138:1, 138:5, 138:8, 177:18, 178:6, 179:3, 236:27, 236:29 157:5. 157:11. 138:12. 138:14. carry [3] - 101:1, BY [52] - 1:5, 1:8, 160:25, 170:11, 179:4, 180:8, 198:21, 138:17, 138:24, 138:25, 148:12 170:24, 173:23, 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:28, carrying [2] - 85:6, 213:26, 219:22 154:3, 154:12, 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12, 174:15, 174:28, certainly [55] - 11:26, 154:24, 154:27, 197.8 175:9, 179:29, 21:16, 26:20, 28:19, 155:1, 159:22, 3:20, 4:4, 4:5, 4:6, case [46] - 24:2, 4:7, 4:8, 4:9, 4:10, 183:19, 184:3, 32:25, 37:26, 41:29, 159:27, 167:22, 26:21, 28:13, 39:27, 4:11, 4:14, 4:15, 4:16, 184:12, 184:16, 42:10, 45:20, 46:2, 168:23, 168:29, 40:3. 40:11. 68:20. 4:17, 4:18, 4:19, 4:20, 184:26, 185:1, 69:28, 72:6, 74:20, 46:8, 49:13, 52:17, 172:19, 172:24, 185:18, 185:29, 172:28, 176:8, 4:23, 4:24, 4:25, 4:26, 77:15, 77:25, 78:3, 55:25, 59:26, 64:9, 4:27, 5:18, 95:21, 187:4, 187:18, 66:28, 74:28, 75:11, 176:11, 176:13, 99:27, 103:25, 187:22, 201:25, 176:17, 176:21, 99:12, 109:1, 112:12, 80:16, 80:29, 81:10, 104:20, 104:23, 145:16, 152:1, 155:3, 202:1, 204:22, 220:1, 82:17, 84:5, 85:20, 177:1, 177:4, 177:6, 110:2, 110:24, 183:2, 183:5, 183:7, 162:12, 174:10, 221:2, 221:15, 223:2, 87:15, 87:20, 87:29, 114:22, 114:23, 96:11, 97:19, 102:17, 177:8, 183:14, 205:9, 224:10, 224:20, 183:12, 196:25, 114:26, 115:2, 224:25, 225:6, 208:15, 210:24, 115:2, 117:2, 124:29, 196:29, 197:11, 115:18, 116:23, 217:10, 233:28, 225:11, 225:12, 129:24, 135:5, 135:8, 197:13, 197:16, 116:24, 126:22, $234{:}22,\,235{:}18,\,236{:}5$ 225:14, 226:26, 197:20, 197:23, 135:9, 137:20, 136:11, 136:15, 161:26, 166:25, 198:3, 198:5, 202:17, 227:2. 227:21. **bye** [1] - 128:9 142:27, 143:3, 228:11, 228:17, 178:10, 179:13, 202:20, 205:7, Byrne [4] - 164:25, 143:24, 150:12, 174:25, 176:10, 228:24, 229:4, 229:8, 150:15, 152:19, 188:17, 201:29, 206:29, 207:6, 229:28, 230:1. 207:16, 207:20, 206:12 172:7, 179:27, 208:8. 215:25. 230:22, 230:24, 223:21, 228:22, 207:23, 207:29. 179:28, 182:21, 230:29, 231:14, 229:17, 232:15, 208:4, 208:8, 208:11, C 182:23, 189:7, 190:1, 233:12, 233:14, 232:18, 232:27, 209:24, 210:10, 190:15, 202:24, 233:24, 235:22 232:29, 233:17 210:17, 210:21, 206:15 C&AG [4] - 185:4, 210:24, 210:26, Callinan's [4] - 92:1, cases [3] - 14:25, certainty [1] - 84:4 187:3, 195:26, 211:16 116:6, 135:9, 153:6 211:21, 211:23, 123:17, 147:20 certify [1] - 1:25 Callinan [135] - 7:12, 212:2, 212:8, 212:13, calm [1] - 232:13 chain [1] - 135:7 **CASTLE**[1] - 1:17 8:1, 23:9, 24:26, 212:16, 212:20, calming [2] - 50:25, Chair [4] - 168:26, Castle [2] - 217:24, 35:10, 38:4, 38:7, 213.13 213.17 50.28 172:21, 176:24, 237:25 38:14, 39:14, 39:20, 213:21, 213:27, campaign [1] - 169:4 202:23 Castlebar [2] -39:26, 46:11, 46:25, CANAL[1] - 3:17 214:6, 214:10, chair [2] - 214:8, 162:27, 188:27 47:6, 47:9, 47:14, 214:14, 214:17, cancellation [3] -216:3 casual [2] - 169:10, 47:18, 47:24, 50:9, 214:26, 215:16, 120:3, 140:5, 164:6 chaired [1] - 11:3 169:11 51:5. 51:11. 51:25. 215:24, 215:29, cancellations [1] -CHAIRMAN[164] casually [1] - 113:9 52:7, 69:4, 73:15, 216:2, 216:8, 216:12, 111:4 4:20, 5:8, 5:14, 6:13, catch [1] - 8:11 83:20, 84:18, 86:25, 216:15. 216:17. cancelled [1] -6:16, 12:21, 12:25, caused [4] - 7:23, 86:28, 88:26, 89:9, 216:25 216:28 151:21 51:22, 51:29, 63:5, 55:11, 66:15, 203:21 93:6, 93:21, 95:25, 225:28, 229:1, cancelling [1] -63:14, 63:19, 63:21, **causing** [1] - 55:5 98:14, 98:28, 99:19, 229:24, 230:4, 231:2, 225:23 69:24, 76:10, 76:21, caution [2] - 192:19, 100:1, 100:4, 100:8, 231:5, 232:12, cannot [5] - 118:3, 76:23, 76:25, 76:28, 192:27 101:16, 102:5, 232:17, 232:22, 77:4, 77:8, 79:2, 85:4, 195:19, 195:22, Cavan [1] - 238:25 112:18, 113:14, 234:1, 235:29, 204:10, 214:3 87:28, 88:8, 95:14, Cavan-Monaghan 113:19, 114:10, 236:18, 236:20, 99:20, 99:26, 100:9, capable [1] - 116:4 [1] - 238:25 114:13, 114:16, 236:22, 239:2, 100:13, 100:17, capacity [1] - 89:7 Ceann [1] - 27:1 116:14, 116:27, 239:11, 239:15 100:22, 101:5, 101:8, CAPEL[1] - 3:6 celebrity [1] - 146:24 119:2. 119:28. chairman [4] -101:13, 101:26, car [5] - 18:7, 50:8, cell [1] - 170:2 124:18, 127:14, 164:24, 174:25, 108:9, 108:14, 113:22, 152:18, 236:3 centre [1] - 53:5 128:16, 129:3, 186:6, 187:19 108:19, 108:22, cards [1] - 8:11 centred [1] - 88:23 129:18, 130:12, 111:14, 111:20, Chairman [75] - 5:5, career [6] - 35:14, CEO [3] - 163:1, 132:13, 133:13, 5:6, 5:20, 5:29, 6:15, 112:8, 124:3, 134:2, 162:15, 162:19, 163:2, 191:11 134:7, 134:19, 9:24, 25:24, 79:14, 134:9, 134:22, 217:14, 217:18, 231:6 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:4 135:17, 135:21, 89:24, 95:18, 99:23, 134:28, 135:8, careful [2] - 107:14, certain [24] - 14:7, 136:3, 136:17, 100:21, 101:14, 135:24, 135:28, 117:29 16:25, 20:16, 26:4, 138:28, 140:2, 108:24, 108:26, 136:5, 136:11, carefully [1] - 118:22 112:15, 113:25, 141:28, 142:23, 111:13, 112:3, 136:20, 136:23, Carmel [1] - 164:16 118:5, 125:28, 145:10, 146:3, 146:5,

141:27, 148:6,

carpet [1] - 65:15

147:10, 147:29,

115:11, 115:12,

117:9, 134:7, 134:17,

136:27, 137:3, 137:6,

136:26, 138:16, 151:24, 154:2, 154:6, 154:11, 154:26, 154:29, 162:1, 176:12, 176:16, 183:1, 183:6, 183:9, 183:10, 184:13, 190:23, 191:24, 191:27, 195:19, 198:4, 202:19, 205:4, 205:6, 206:23, 207:9, 207:25, 208:5, 213:6, 217:13, 217:19, 217:20, 219:2, 219:10, 220:21, 221:6, 221:18, 223:4, 223:14. 223:16. 225:2, 225:7, 225:18, 229:17, 231:18, 232:24, 234:28, 235:15, 237:8, 237:17, 237:22, 239:4, 239:8 CHAMBERS [1] -2:29 chance [2] - 73:11, 237:12 change [1] - 218:12 changed [8] - 11:6, 34:29, 45:8, 98:24, 180:23, 182:3, 193:28 changes [1] - 43:27 channel [1] - 128:7 channels [1] - 31:12 **chap** [1] - 104:10 character [1] - 54:16 charge [19] - 36:24, 111:4, 120:3, 122:10, 127:29, 128:27, 134:21, 135:22, 136:13, 137:18, 163:13, 164:11, 165:1, 165:16, 165:19, 174:4, 210:28, 217:28, 218:10 charities [2] - 8:18, 10:26 charity [8] - 8:5, 8:13, 128:3, 128:18, 139:19, 157:19, 227:22, 227:25 **CHARLES** [1] - 2:23 CHARLETON [2] -1:12, 2:2 chart [1] - 50:21 chase [1] - 212:4 chasing [1] - 161:20 chat [2] - 126:20, 132:19

chats [1] - 128:15 chatting [1] - 127:15 check [9] - 84:13, 131:8, 131:10, 131:12, 192:2, 192:9, 199:21, 203:15, 204:1 checked [7] - 71:24, 72:1, 84:9, 84:15, 118:22, 160:17, 195:23 checking [2] - 11:27, 134:24 checkpoints [1] -176:22 Chief [6] - 112:19, 125:23, 126:5, 163:3, 163:10, 163:14 chief [10] - 120:5, 122:19, 123:14, 162:27, 217:15, 218:20, 229:1, 233:29, 234:1, 238:1 **CHIEF** [2] - 2:19, 2:23 child [1] - 162:19 children [3] - 170:1, 208:29, 215:14 chime [1] - 29:15 chimes [1] - 31:15 chin [1] - 200:7 chose [4] - 94:22, 160:10, 215:11, 216:14 chosen [1] - 69:7 Christmas [5] -59:20 150:18 150:19, 150:20, 169:4 chronology [3] -58:6, 113:18, 191:1 circle [1] - 232:22 circulating [1] -14:12 circumstance [2] -107:4. 107:5 circumstances [2] -106:14, 146:29

citizens [2] - 125:17,

City [1] - 5:28

211:11, 231:22

60:17, 189:10

48:11, 48:12

civil [3] - 209:29,

claim [3] - 40:6,

claimed [1] - 184:2

claims [1] - 38:9

clarification [3] -

35:12, 81:18, 183:23

clarifications [2] -

clarified [5] - 38:12,

145:4

clarifies [1] - 40:15 **clarify** [23] - 17:20, 34:25, 36:10, 37:8, 43:26, 48:21, 48:22, 51:29, 63:5, 64:28, 76:16, 79:1, 107:16, 133:8, 137:28, 147:25, 154:17, 154:21, 155:23, 167:27, 170:23, 185:8, 188:3 clarifying [4] - 36:28, 66:27, 89:24, 96:15 clarity [1] - 91:17 clear [63] - 11:22, 12:2, 14:15, 14:26. 20:12, 20:13, 23:7, 23:20, 24:12, 24:24, 38:29, 42:7, 43:13, 46:26, 48:7, 52:2, 67:24, 79:15, 80:25, 81:2, 86:24, 87:21, 89:23, 94:17, 96:4, 97:18, 103:11, 106:2, 112:22, 112:24, 112:25, 118:17, 124:20, 124:23, 124:29, 130:11, 132:20, 144:23, 145:9, 154:17, 155:19, 155:20, 159:13, 160:3, 160:13. 170:6. 173:18, 175:6, 176:5, 177:29, 179:6, 185:6, 186:3, 186:28, 188:27, 189:28, 195:19, 200:4, 200:23, 200:28, 201:23, 206:3 cleared [1] - 17:15 clearly [10] - 97:18, 105:12, 106:18, 115:23, 117:6, 190:18, 191:10, 197:9, 206:14, 219:27 clicked [1] - 104:7 client [8] - 99:25, 108:13, 134:19, 134:26, 138:20, 138:23. 140:29. 153:23 client's [6] - 99:27, 100:7, 135:8, 139:6, 140:25, 152:6 clients [1] - 28:17 clipped [1] - 118:9

39:29, 47:15, 48:18,

192:5

closing [1] - 223:7 clumsily [1] - 108:16 coffee [3] - 136:23, 145:29, 178:23 coherent [1] - 216:9 coincidence [1] -229:2 collaborate [1] -169:6 colleagues [1] - 68:7 College [1] - 162:16 comfort [3] - 225:4, 228:15, 228:22 comfortable [2] -94:19, 129:18 Comhairle [1] - 27:1 coming [18] - 19:15, 29:9, 29:12, 43:8, 46:18, 46:20, 48:11, 56:6, 76:15, 79:3, 104:10, 107:24, 115:27, 132:11, 168:10, 179:12, 211:13, 215:8 commenced [1] -103:19 commences [1] -123:1 commencing [1] -70:10 comment [13] - 34:2, 38:13, 55:21, 71:4, 94:29, 95:14, 107:7, 107:8, 107:9, 113:26, 147:15, 157:16, 187:13 commentary [2] -110:27, 132:9 commentators [1] -12:6 commented [1] -17:14 commenting [5] -44:20, 56:11, 56:14, 110:21 comments [6] -43:11, 43:26, 66:15, 91:24, 142:19, 143:12 commission [1] -143.13 Commission [1] -163:8 Commissioner [325] - 7:11, 7:12, 8:1, 8:4, 8:7, 9:12, 9:13, 11:29, 12:29, 13:7, 15:17, 17:28, 19:4, 19:13, 19:24, 20:19, 20:28,

21:2, 21:15, 21:28,

22:3, 22:7, 23:21,

23:23, 24:13, 24:15, 24:18, 24:20, 25:2, 25:15, 25:25, 26:9, 26:14, 26:16, 27:4, 27:22, 27:27, 27:29, 28:6, 28:23, 31:5, 32:10, 32:16, 34:9, 34:10, 34:11, 35:11, 36:6, 37:2, 37:7, 38:5, 44:7, 44:11, 44:24, 44:28, 45:12, 51:20, 51:24, 52:12, 52:19, 56:8, 56:16, 57:19, 60:2, 60:29, 61:28, 62:11, 62:13, 62:26, 62:28, 63:4, 63:15, 63:23, 64:13, 65:24, 66:6, 67:21, 67:25, 67:27, 68:8, 68:16, 69:2, 69:3, 69:10, 69:11, 70:3, 70:18, 70:24, 71:2, 71:5, 71:16, 71:25, 72:1, 72:4, 72:8, 72:25, 73:3. 73:14. 73:18. 79:26, 79:29, 80:2, 80:6, 81:18, 81:26, 82:9, 82:12, 83:15, 83:18, 83:25, 84:17, 85:5, 85:7, 85:21, 86:25, 86:28, 87:7, 87:13, 88:11, 88:19, 88:20, 88:25, 89:2, 89:9, 89:15, 90:8, 90:13, 91:6, 91:11, 91:14, 92:1, 92:8, 92:26, 93:5, 93:21, 94:5, 94:7, 94:12, 94:16, 94:28, 95:6, 95:9, 95:10, 95:25, 96:29, 97:23, 98:28, 99:19, 100:1, 100:4, 100:8, 101:16, 102:5, 102:27, 103:10, 103:12, 105:8, 106:3, 106:9, 106:15, 106:26, 107:14, 107:20, 107:25, 107:29, 108:6, 108:15, 108:20, 109:6, 112:18, 116:22, 117:21, 119:28, 120:12, 120:17, 120:29, 121:13, 121:19, 122:17, 123:28, 124:2, 124:18, 124:19, 124:22, 128:16, 129:3, 129:18, 131:15, 131:18, 132:5, 133:5,

close [1] - 55:2

	1		1	T
133:8, 133:26, 135:9,	10:17, 117:4, 117:6,	228:9, 228:24, 229:8,	concern [11] - 82:1,	confined [1] - 91:24
135:17, 135:21,	171:11, 173:11,	232:23, 233:21	86:4, 88:23, 103:1,	confirm [6] - 34:13,
136:17, 137:17,	193:17	communications [3]	117:8, 171:26, 181:5,	39:20, 84:15, 133:29,
137:29, 140:1,	COMMISSIONER [1]	- 10:15, 42:18, 234:29	203:3, 203:21,	
141:17, 142:4,	- 2:14		212:18, 233:23	138:19, 151:26 confirmation [1] -
142:23, 143:21,	commissioner's [1] -	COMPANY [1] - 2:11	· ·	
		company [2] - 65:6,	concerned [25] -	159:7
145:10, 153:1,	180:6	166:16	14:22, 24:11, 51:1,	confirmed [2] -
153:13, 153:18,	Commissioner's [38]	compensation [3] -	52:23, 52:24, 52:27,	84:10, 199:18
153:23, 157:11,	- 7:22, 18:14, 18:15,	38:28, 40:2, 150:14	52:28, 59:5, 81:21,	confirms [1] - 160:8
157:19, 157:29,	35:27, 35:29, 36:2,	complainant [2] -	81:24, 88:21, 91:7,	confront [1] - 130:8
158:4, 158:9, 158:20,	44:22, 60:21, 60:24,	56:22, 161:1	105:20, 107:27,	confused [3] - 79:2,
159:18, 160:17,	62:22, 68:21, 68:28,	complained [1] -	159:8, 160:15,	190:9, 212:22
160:18, 160:22,	69:4, 70:3, 73:2,	102:24	166:14, 167:6,	connect [1] - 205:27
160:24, 164:1,	74:29, 75:4, 75:16,	complaint [11] -	180:26, 180:27,	connected [1] -
164:19, 164:21,	77:22, 77:28, 80:12,	14:20, 15:2, 39:22,	184:21, 185:10,	206:16
170:11, 170:24,	87:22, 88:1, 88:12,	61:2, 90:9, 123:8,	186:15, 189:3, 220:29	connection [7] -
170:26, 170:27,	91:28, 94:24, 95:2,	192:13, 192:24,	concerning [4] -	63:8, 137:13, 137:14,
172:4, 172:11,	105:9, 105:19,	192:25, 202:3, 238:2	121:14, 142:12,	137:15, 206:18,
172:29, 173:3, 173:8,	113:26, 120:7, 121:1,	complaints [10] -	157:25, 237:15	235:20, 238:19
173:10, 173:16,	122:23, 153:7,	23:1, 23:2, 65:20,	concerns [14] -	connections [1] -
173:19, 173:23,	153:27, 154:4,	68:9, 98:27, 102:3,	11:26, 38:21, 40:6,	108:3
174:2, 174:15,	158:26, 161:5	117:19, 122:10,	60:17, 65:16, 102:1,	CONNOLLY [6] - 3:5,
174:25, 174:28,	Commissioners [1] -	123:13, 201:8	115:13, 120:9,	4:7, 108:26, 109:1,
175:5, 175:9, 175:16,	13:8	complete [3] - 9:24,	122:18, 180:18,	109:3, 111:12
175:18, 175:25,	commissioners [8] -	10:1, 197:17	186:12, 186:13,	Connolly [1] -
179:27, 179:29,	13:8, 20:19, 20:20,	completed [8] -	200:3, 201:8	108:26
181:6, 181:11,	27:22, 27:23, 28:24,	102:1, 168:20,	concerns' [1] -	CONOR [1] - 2:15
181:12, 181:27,	28:25, 147:11	177:15, 178:5,	120:14	Conor [8] - 163:19,
182:5, 183:19, 184:3,	committed [4] -	178:11, 178:29, 197:9	concise [1] - 95:16	163:25, 164:4,
184:12, 184:25,	53:13, 53:26, 54:10,	completely [5] -	concisely [1] - 101:1	183:16, 185:9,
184:29, 185:7,	138:5	50:1, 69:26, 202:17,	concluded [1] -	185:12, 189:19,
185:13, 185:18,	committee [4] -	226:9, 232:11	121:16	189:23
185:28, 186:1,	11:26, 20:9, 54:27,	completing [1] -	concludes [2] -	conscious [6] -
186:18, 187:4,	114:11	197:1	118:9, 239:8	56:25, 57:12, 72:21,
187:18, 192:19,	Committee [24] -	compliment [1] -	conclusion [3] -	91:8, 91:17, 96:19
192:21, 192:26,	7:11, 7:18, 11:25,	151:17	107:10, 199:5, 201:23	consequences [1] -
194:2, 194:28,	13:4, 23:25, 23:28,	complimentary [1] -	condone [2] - 20:20,	57:10
195:14, 195:18,	45:6, 53:7, 69:12,	151:12	28:21	consider [6] -
196:21, 199:26,	94:5, 115:5, 115:9,	complimented [1] -	conduct [1] - 100:11	114:15, 114:27,
201:12, 201:25,	115:14, 115:16,	66:6	conducted [1] -	115:10, 118:2,
202:1, 203:6, 203:9,	115:17, 115:28,	compliments [1] -	123:10	118:16, 188:9
203:14, 203:21,	117:2, 117:10,	151:13	conduit [1] - 99:5	consideration [4] -
203:23, 204:5, 204:6,	117:14, 118:13,	comprehensive [1] -	conference [1] - 27:3	64:21, 117:29,
204:14, 204:22,	118:20, 221:15,	116:24	conferences [1] -	123:15, 157:27
204:23, 205:19,	223:13	Comptroller [5] -	169:4	considered [2] -
220:1, 221:2, 221:14,	Committee's [2] -	111:2, 164:23,	confidence [4] -	73:7, 86:29
221:20, 222:5, 223:1,	29:13, 57:4	164:26, 165:10,	12:7, 12:9, 29:20,	considering [1] -
223:9, 224:10,	common [2] -	239:13	212:6	117:27
224:20, 224:25,	218:25, 225:8	computer [16] -	confident [8] - 43:7,	consistent [1] -
225:5, 225:11,	communicate [1] -	46:19, 171:7, 171:9,	72:28, 75:9, 75:11,	47:19
226:19, 226:26,	120:25	179:19, 180:5,	87:26, 140:7, 141:6,	consistently [1] -
227:3, 227:10,	communicated [1] -	180:10, 180:12,	148:18	118:15
227:17, 227:21,	120:29	182:10, 182:15,	confidential [6] -	consulted [4] -
227:25, 227:28,	communicating [3] -	193:12, 193:18,	68:10, 101:18,	67:27, 82:15, 159:20,
227:29, 228:11,	121:3, 227:2, 231:26	196:17, 212:23,	101:25, 103:20,	160:21
228:17, 228:24,	communication [14]	213:1, 213:4, 213:13	120:10, 211:9	consumer [1] -
229:4, 229:8, 232:1,	- 62:27, 154:28,	computers [3] -	confidential' [1] -	163:19
232:3, 232:8, 232:12,	160:29, 200:10,	171:1, 193:3, 209:16	157:23	contact [55] - 9:2,
232:21, 233:12,	207:20, 219:6,	concentrating [1] -	confidentiality [1] -	34:11, 39:5, 41:3,
233:13, 233:20, 238:3	219:10, 223:8, 227:6,	86:2	201:10	41:4, 41:14, 58:23,
commissioner [6] -				,, 00.20,
	1			

			l	
68:7, 92:25, 105:8,	contemplation [1] -	132:23, 132:27,	69:22, 83:14, 86:6,	181:4, 181:24,
121:12, 122:1,	71:2	133:27, 134:5,	97:11, 125:11,	185:23, 187:26,
122:18, 122:20,	contemporaneous	135:12, 136:1, 136:6,	151:11, 157:26,	191:1, 191:9, 191:17,
125:21, 129:10,	[1] - 191:4	138:29, 139:19,	161:24, 166:24,	192:12, 193:28,
129:23, 133:19,	contend [2] - 99:24,	139:20, 140:25,	167:10, 167:11,	194:15, 198:15,
138:21, 138:27,	100:6	141:16, 141:29,	167:24	204:25, 204:29,
150:17, 151:26,	content [4] - 43:4,	143:2, 144:19,	cooperative [2] -	217:13, 217:17,
151:27, 154:8,	43:20, 123:11, 208:26	148:25, 176:19,	58:27, 97:21	219:2, 219:19,
154:16, 157:20,	contents [2] - 88:19,	179:21, 180:27,	copy [17] - 9:21,	219:26, 220:2,
159:11, 164:16,	104:15	182:9, 182:13, 183:2,	9:23, 57:19, 57:26,	220:10, 220:21,
186:11, 193:26,	context [32] - 13:21,	184:2, 195:6, 198:8,	63:29, 75:10, 84:10,	221:6, 221:18,
194:1, 195:13,	33:19, 68:22, 88:16,	199:23, 203:22,	84:15, 91:18, 92:3,	224:12, 224:27,
204:14, 214:18,	92:19, 94:4, 98:10,	212:27, 215:18,	121:25, 121:26,	225:2, 225:7, 226:20,
219:29, 220:18,	109:8, 114:7, 114:14,	221:27, 222:1, 222:3,	148:13, 149:3,	234:27, 234:28,
221:1, 221:19,	119:12, 119:22,	230:7, 230:9, 230:11,	206:25, 206:27, 208:2	235:4, 235:5, 237:11,
221:24, 221:26,	126:4, 127:12,	230:13, 230:27,	core [3] - 69:8,	237:17
223:1, 224:14,	129:17, 142:28,	231:15, 232:6, 233:1,	71:11, 71:13	corrected [2] -
224:28, 225:10,	168:11, 169:8,	233:4, 235:25,	Cork [3] - 8:6,	39:29, 117:15
225:13, 226:22,	170:17, 170:23,	236:16, 238:12	139:22, 227:22	correction [1] - 92:4
226:24, 228:28,	170:25, 170:28,	conversations [16] -	cork [2] - 128:3,	correctly [2] -
230:29, 231:17,	171:11, 175:16,	23:18, 25:14, 38:6,	128:17	194:13, 195:28
231:28, 232:5,	181:9, 182:20,	39:14, 47:18, 51:24,	correct [137] - 5:29,	correlate [1] - 216:10
232:28, 233:4	189:26, 203:20,	69:6, 71:10, 97:8,	6:4, 8:2, 14:3, 15:12,	correspondence
contacted [42] -	213:26, 215:15,	97:18, 113:14,	32:24, 35:17, 35:29,	[16] - 58:11, 60:25,
13:11, 18:25, 41:6,	216:7, 219:12	139:26, 144:15,	36:3, 38:23, 41:1,	62:11, 64:27, 72:22,
41:8, 41:10, 41:27,	continually [2] -	170:20, 195:3, 195:29	41:2, 50:17, 50:18,	79:28, 79:29, 85:8,
53:9, 55:2, 60:2,	97:18, 97:19	convey [2] - 24:24,	52:4, 56:1, 60:6,	90:12, 91:22, 91:27,
87:15, 100:18,	continue [7] - 12:26,	51:11	60:23, 64:14, 67:8,	93:22, 106:4, 151:9,
121:15, 122:4,	19:17, 20:4, 100:22,	conveyed [3] -	67:9, 67:16, 67:18,	158:17, 161:10
129:11, 143:5, 152:9,	117:29, 118:4, 163:5	125:8, 133:20, 205:23	67:20, 72:24, 74:8,	corridor [1] - 101:9
152:23, 163:18,	continued [3] -	cooperate [27] -	77:26, 79:25, 80:5,	COSTELLO [1] -
163:21, 166:12,	159:7, 160:24, 187:9	15:8, 20:7, 20:10,	80:22, 82:9, 82:10,	2:11
166:18, 166:29, 167:2, 167:8, 169:18,	continuity [2] -	21:13, 22:4, 22:8,	82:20, 82:21, 83:18,	costs [3] - 38:28,
178:22, 188:21,	152:22, 153:16	23:4, 24:16, 26:17,	88:11, 96:6, 96:8,	40:3, 150:13
188:22, 190:23,	contracts [1] -	30:10, 31:23, 31:24,	96:25, 97:4, 97:5,	Council [1] - 162:22
191:26, 194:27,	162:22	31:28, 38:8, 38:15, 45:9, 45:10, 48:26,	99:8, 101:23, 102:4,	counsel [9] - 95:24,
196:21, 199:20,	contradict [1] -	54:13, 61:29, 65:21,	102:6, 102:25, 108:7, 110:19, 113:16,	99:15, 106:29, 107:1,
201:16, 210:28,	32:25	65:24, 71:13, 131:20,	116:25, 124:12,	112:15, 145:8, 161:9,
211:4, 222:14,	contribute [2] - 29:9,	143:28, 153:24,	125:18, 126:7,	174:13, 234:4
223:17, 225:12,	38:27	200:20	126:29, 128:19,	country [5] - 9:8,
231:21, 235:9, 237:25	contribution [6] -	cooperated [10] -	129:13, 138:11,	13:11, 15:14, 211:2,
contacting [8] - 9:3,	11:8, 19:18, 40:2,	14:17, 34:27, 39:21,	140:12, 144:28,	238:24
122:21, 122:24,	40:12, 150:13	43:10, 45:21, 47:20,	145:5, 145:12,	County [3] - 35:20, 162:22, 163:27
138:20, 138:23,	contributions [2] -	53:29, 66:22, 166:10,	149:22, 149:27,	county [4] - 18:26,
193:26, 199:7, 235:7	85:29, 237:15	199:22	150:3, 150:6, 151:2,	18:27, 192:7
contacts [11] -	control [4] - 117:20, 117:21, 117:23,	cooperating [23] -	151:5, 152:16, 153:5,	coup [1] - 13:9
124:17, 126:18,	117.21, 117.23,	15:3, 15:15, 16:24,	156:15, 158:28,	couple [11] - 76:16,
147:12, 147:23,	controversial [1] -	17:9, 22:16, 24:9,	159:1, 159:3, 159:10,	95:18, 96:11, 109:3,
203:4, 214:21, 219:8,		35:4, 38:22, 43:28,	159:13, 159:21,	132:7, 132:8, 152:5,
225:19, 236:25,	113:22	45:25, 46:6, 57:9,	160:26, 161:7,	155:5, 157:18,
237:19	controversy [5] -	98:19, 140:11,	163:14, 164:3, 164:4,	210:22, 217:28
contain [1] - 82:28	7:15, 7:23, 7:27, 114:1, 221:16	140:20, 141:10,	165:1, 165:3, 165:19,	course [32] - 7:24,
contained [2] -	convenience [1] -	141:15, 141:16,	166:7, 167:1, 167:12,	9:19, 13:18, 16:14,
115:15, 191:20	5:19	143:14, 146:13,	167:13, 168:2, 168:3,	17:1, 23:8, 29:8,
contains [1] - 150:28	conversation [55] -	146:15, 199:9, 199:17	169:17, 169:18,	30:16, 65:29, 66:26,
contemplate [1] -	8:10, 8:12, 24:26,	cooperation [21] -	173:2, 173:3, 173:29,	68:20, 85:17, 102:7,
41:26	27:6, 43:15, 45:15,	14:21, 15:22, 21:21,	174:1, 174:5, 176:24,	113:13, 113:17,
contemplated [1] -	82:11, 91:21, 91:23,	22:11, 32:3, 52:26,	177:16, 177:17,	116:12, 123:20,
	JE. 11, J 1.61, J 1.60,	L EC.00 E7.C C0.44	177:25, 177:26,	
88:24	95:27, 131:18,	56:22, 57:6, 68:11,	177.25, 177.26,	128:15, 138:8,

173:14, 173:15, 158:27, 161:20, 235:18, 236:5 115:13, 115:15, 214:21 169:27, 170:20, cross [2] - 100:12, 116:17, 119:9, 237:29 definitively[1] -171:2, 174:16, 238:20 119:10, 120:2, deals [1] - 212:25 226:29 178:24, 181:19, 120:20, 141:2, 141:9, dealt [13] - 12:11, cross-examination degree [5] - 113:25, 15:26, 66:18, 116:17, 195:29, 209:10, [1] - 100:12 145:4, 157:25, 192:14 131:3, 139:20, 210:29, 215:2, 238:11 170:16, 170:18, **CROSS-EXAMINED** date [29] - 7:6, 37:26, 141:27, 162:17 Court [5] - 59:27, 40:28, 45:7, 54:16, 171:5, 180:3, 180:4, delay [1] - 112:6 [26] - 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 4:8, 86:3, 172:19, 172:26, 57:14, 57:17, 59:21, 4:10, 4:15, 4:16, 4:17, 182:21, 190:28, delete [2] - 46:17, 73:17, 120:6, 120:7, 195:1 194:22, 238:9 4:18, 4:24, 4:25, 4:26, **COURT** [3] - 1:13, 4:27, 95:21, 99:12, 120:24, 121:23, dear [1] - 64:25 deliberating [1] -2:3, 3:5 109:1, 112:12, 152:1, 157:9, 162:15, Dear [3] - 37:18, 54.27 **courts** [1] - 89:4 174:10, 177:8, 177:26, 181:13, 57:24, 63:27 delighted [8] - 32:29, 194:8, 195:10, cover[1] - 237:26 183:14, 205:9, dearly [1] - 131:14 37:6, 47:3, 84:28, 195:20, 197:27, coverage [3] - 10:25, 233:28, 234:22, **Deasy** [3] - 114:8, 84:29, 85:14, 85:18, 198:17, 199:28, 235:18, 236:5 10:26, 171:16 116:19, 116:22 92.23 202:15, 202:18, crossed [1] - 206:14 debate [5] - 11:9, covered [3] - 7:28, delivered [1] - 150:1 202:29, 204:11, 144:20, 167:15 Crumlin [1] - 218:4 32:1, 56:5, 56:27 demonstrated [2] crystal [2] - 160:3, 204:16, 216:29 covering [1] - 98:6 December [21] -100:4, 205:13 date-stamped [2] credibility [3] -160:13 37:13, 37:19, 48:16, denied [1] - 54:7 57:14, 57:17 190:19, 191:7, 191:12 cue [1] - 238:16 58:7, 62:7, 62:8, denotes [2] - 13:10, dated [6] - 37:19, credit [2] - 190:20, **CULLEN** [1] - 3:12 77:29, 118:22, 182:22 71:1, 84:19, 86:21, 191:21 culture [1] - 31:28 119:27, 120:27, denounce [1] -124:2, 157:5 122:17, 149:4, 149:9, crime [4] - 170:16, cup [5] - 169:13, 184:26 dates [3] - 169:21, 169:24, 178:23, 237:4 149:19, 149:24, 212:25, 212:26, denounced [5] -214:14, 216:27 177:28, 199:27, 218:16 Curran [1] - 121:7 184:14, 185:28, David [23] - 112:3, Crime [21] - 120:13, currency [1] - 175:3 207:1, 207:18, 186:1. 187:20. 201:29 133:25, 134:5, 170:14, 171:5, current [5] - 146:21, 207:21, 208:18 denouncement [1] -134:11, 134:13, December.. [1] -171:12, 179:20, 163:3, 168:17, 187:29 135:11, 135:13, 119:20 180:4, 180:7, 181:9, 168:27, 177:18 deny [1] - 54:15 135:14, 135:18, 182:22, 182:24, decent [1] - 28:20 cut [1] - 180:29 denying [2] - 30:8, 136:4, 136:6, 136:11, 193:3, 194:22, decide [1] - 29:14 cutting [1] - 212:4 133:21 136:15, 136:16, 194:25, 196:9, decided [1] - 56:9 Department [10] -137:13, 137:17, 196:11, 196:15, deciding [1] - 115:17 D 28:6, 98:2, 165:18, 137:24, 138:12, 196:18, 213:3, 213:8, decision [3] - 23:28, 166:1, 166:3, 172:25, 167:20. 168:6. 213:11, 213:24 72:21. 132:26 199:11, 199:25, d'état [1] - 13:9 168:10, 169:7, 213:28 crimes [2] - 138:5, defamation [7] -200:25, 201:9 D/sergeant [1] -**DAVID**[1] - 3:19 222:21 40:11, 72:10, 86:3, department [3] -217:28 **DAY**[1] - 1:18 criminal [11] - 20:14, 149:26, 150:10, 211:10, 211:12 dad [2] - 94:11, day-to-day [1] -26:3, 30:20, 53:13, 151:9, 151:10 Deputy [6] - 92:25, 188:20 213:10 53:27, 54:10, 54:11, defamatory 131 -98:24, 114:8, 116:19, damage [2] - 54:21, days [12] - 6:8, 6:22, 55:6, 93:6, 143:13 50:2, 53:10, 55:12 118:19, 235:23 42:3, 85:12, 92:13, criminality [8] - 12:1, defamatory/ deputy [7] - 13:7, damaged [1] - 33:11 148:15, 149:8, 12:4, 12:10, 12:11, slanderous [1] - 54:25 20:19, 27:22, 28:24, 149:19. 163:28. danger [2] - 29:12, 14:24, 16:15, 28:13, defence [18] - 17:27, 98:16, 116:22, 173:11 94:6 191:22, 231:24 93:10 59:10, 59:15, 60:1, derogatory [1] -Darren [1] - 235:19 deal [15] - 12:5, 31:8, critical [6] - 21:16, 60:5, 60:22, 61:13, 144:26 33:7, 114:28, 115:25, **DARREN**[1] - 3:8 28:15, 144:24, 61:23, 62:19, 62:23, describe [4] - 45:29, Data [23] - 20:11, 124:10, 129:7, 147:19, 200:23, 212:5 62:27, 64:15, 72:11, 175:23, 179:26, 234:9 130:15, 130:24, 23:7, 23:10, 24:23, criticism [4] - 13:3, 72:17, 82:14, 86:12, described [3] -139:16, 145:6, 171:7, 31:7, 34:3, 145:1 26:19, 47:22, 54:12, 150:2, 150:14 187:29, 188:1, 194:15 199:10, 203:2, 203:3 65:26, 66:25, 68:20, crooked [1] - 28:9 defend [3] - 29:13, describes [1] - 159:6 dealing [15] - 17:4, CROSS [26] - 4:5, 68:28, 69:4, 69:10, 52:20, 89:21 describing [2] -24:7, 24:8, 35:16, 70:2, 93:11, 109:17, 4:6, 4:7, 4:8, 4:10, Defendant [1] -179:23, 182:20 44:23, 90:22, 117:6, 115:20, 115:22, 4:15, 4:16, 4:17, 4:18, 61:26 description [1] -188:14. 192:18. 161:1, 191:24, 4:24, 4:25, 4:26, 4:27, defendant [1] -236.9 192:21, 192:26, 238:3 196:19, 213:17, 95:21, 99:12, 109:1, 105:24 deserve [1] - 29:20 data [22] - 14:11, 218:7, 222:20, 112:12, 152:1, defending [1] - 59:27 desire [3] - 119:8, 222:21, 237:15 174:10, 177:8, 24:29, 27:3, 48:5, definite [1] - 216:29 126:17, 160:24 dealings [6] - 28:20, 54:1, 68:22, 69:23, 183:14, 205:9, definitely [4] - 15:1, desist [1] - 119:29 71:15, 97:10, 115:8, 103:20, 138:2, 233:28, 234:22, 104:13, 179:15, despite [1] - 72:29

destination [1] -10:19 destroyed [2] -54:17, 54:22 detail [12] - 25:5, 26:28, 43:20, 45:17, 88:27, 91:29, 98:18, 150:8, 164:27, 168:23, 189:26, 200:6 detailed [3] - 199:28, 204:15, 221:10 details [9] - 39:9, 98:26, 125:28, 140:3, 151:15, 188:11, 189:8, 190:26, 208:28 detective [3] - 122:6, 188:21, 218:13 determined [3] -157:28, 170:6, 170:12 devastated [1] -53:11 Development [1] -163:8 diametrically [1] -116:16 diaried [1] - 169:23 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 Diarmuid [41] -34:16, 34:18, 34:20, 35:7, 35:13, 36:13, 36:16, 36:19, 41:1, 42:29, 43:8, 43:23, 47:12, 50:26, 51:10, 112:20, 125:22, 125:23, 125:24, 127:13, 128:11, 128:23, 129:1, 133:15, 135:10, 137:9, 137:10, 137:26, 137:27, 138:9, 146:2, 154:6, 154:9, 154:12, 154:13, 155:24, 155:25, 155:26, 156:23, 217:5 **DIARMUID** [2] - 4:22, 217:9 diary [5] - 74:6, 177:26, 194:17, 195:23, 195:24 dictaphone [3] -104:20, 104:22, 104:25 dictate [3] - 78:7, 104:22, 148:26 dictated [8] - 78:4, 78:25, 81:9, 90:2, 104:20, 104:24, 104:27, 148:28 dictating [3] - 37:25,

79:7, 88:2 differ [3] - 44:29, 131:23, 139:22 difference [5] -118:14. 130:12. 176:2, 183:3, 196:26 different [19] - 19:8, 49:25, 55:20, 102:29, 104:16, 107:6, 156:4, 161:1, 171:29, 180:25, 187:27, 192:26, 193:27, 202:17, 203:5, 221:11, 222:14, 236:16 differs [1] - 67:10 difficult [13] - 22:14, 24:29, 28:10, 28:11, 45:22, 46:4, 46:9, 87:28, 87:29, 97:21, 131:21, 144:11, 231:2 difficulties [1] -98.19 difficulty [1] - 194:11 Dignam [2] - 183:16, 206:20 **DIGNAM** [13] - 2:15, 4:17. 183:10. 183:14. 183:16, 196:28, 198:7, 202:27, 207:9, 207:19, 207:22, 208:5, 208:10 dignitaries [1] - 8:16 dinner [2] - 8:27, 9:4 direct [3] - 121:15, 166:22, 193:4 directed [4] - 65:23, 100:7, 123:17, 170:26 directing [3] -120:18, 200:1, 215:22 direction [15] -36:20, 100:1, 113:29, 118:17, 119:28, 120:5, 120:8, 120:23, 121:1, 121:4, 122:23, 135:17, 142:16, 200:2, 200:10 directions 131 -34:22, 141:2, 142:10 directive [8] -120:17, 120:25, 120:29, 206:25, 206:26, 206:27, 206:29, 207:28

directives [1] -

4:14, 4:23, 5:17,

162:11. 217:10

DIRECTLY [6] - 4:4,

directly [1] - 44:11

121:16

director [2] - 162:23, 163:19 **DIRT** [1] - 11:4 disagree [6] -129:20, 129:22, 140:27, 144:4, 144:6, 144:17 disagreement [1] -201:14 disappearing [1] -212:11 disband [1] - 28:14 disciplinary [8] -30:13, 32:6, 33:5, 53:14, 97:12, 114:23, 114:28, 117:27 discipline [2] -115:1, 211:1 disciplined [2] -16:10. 117:17 disciplining [2] -66:7, 98:12 disclose [9] - 19:15, 58:10, 62:11, 71:24, 71:29, 80:7, 144:22, 144:26, 159:11 disclosing [3] -94:26, 120:1, 145:4 disclosure [10] -77:27, 157:15, 160:16, 160:19, 175:12, 184:1, 189:5, 189:7, 192:14, 193:16 Disclosures [1] -184.8 DISCLOSURES [2] -1:3. 1:4 discovered [3] -77:28, 157:15, 226:5 discovery [1] - 76:26 discrete [1] - 152:6 discuss [7] - 89:10, 90:29, 91:3, 165:23, 174:23, 185:7, 229:24 discussed [23] -38:2, 43:10, 88:19, 88:26, 91:4, 154:8, 158:3, 164:29, 169:26. 176:6. 178:12, 180:18, 182:11, 184:29, 187:6, 190:6, 201:24, 201:27, 204:25, 220:26, 228:23, 232:26, 233:19 discussing [6] -27:2, 198:22, 200:6, 200:8, 225:15, 226:16 discussion (30) -

118:18, 129:28, 173:16, 173:24, 173:27, 175:9, 175:17, 175:29, 178:19, 181:1, 181:2, 181:19, 181:21, 181:26, 182:17, 185:2, 186:4, 192:10, 199:15, 199:16, 213:20, 215:1, 221:10, 222:8, 222:9, 229:22, 230:20 discussions [6] -127:13, 170:25, 171:28, 179:17, 223:23, 237:1 disgusted [1] - 55:4 disgusting [5] - 7:25, 7:26, 13:20, 21:18, 113:27 disposal [2] - 117:2, 117:4 disposition [2] -119:8, 126:9 disprove [1] - 170:7 dispute [6] - 124:27, 154:24, 175:14, 179:10, 220:19, 220:26 disrespect [1] - 59:4 dissemination [3] -25:20, 120:19, 142:11 distance [1] - 14:1 distant [1] - 234:14 distinctly [1] -238:12 distinguished [7] -7:15. 35:14. 35:18. 125:26, 217:14, 231:5, 231:6 distributed [1] - 9:24 district [3] - 120:7, 120:24, 121:1 districts [2] - 217:28, 217:29 division [7] - 35:19, 35:20, 196:12, 218:6, 218:23, 223:5 **DOCK** [1] - 3:17 document [12] -77:11, 77:19, 77:20, 77:24, 78:3, 78:5, 79:5, 79:6, 140:4, 148:12, 149:25 documentary [1] -207:16 documentation [10] -39:9, 39:13, 40:5, 60:16, 63:8, 63:10, 63:12, 63:17, 82:29,

149:21 documented [1] -38:23 documents [6] -37:11, 37:14, 76:13, 104:4, 150:24, 184:20 domain [21] - 14:15, 16:2, 16:16, 22:1, 26:8, 26:13, 34:26, 43:9, 44:15, 68:5, 92:6, 99:6, 111:11, 113:4, 130:19, 141:22, 141:23, 144:3, 144:9, 144:11, 221:17 **DONAL**[1] - 2:16 done [36] - 14:10, 14:11, 15:4, 15:5, 15:7, 15:16, 22:10, 25:1, 25:4, 25:5, 29:24, 31:1, 33:28, 35:28, 51:12, 51:13, 51:14, 54:6, 54:20, 55:8, 55:10, 69:5, 79:9, 110:10, 111:2, 117:15, 125:12. 176:27, 180:26, 192:8, 195:1, 197:24, 207:29, 216:1, 238:14 Donegal [3] - 27:15, 28:16, 28:21 Donnellan [1] door[1] - 101:9 dossier [6] - 26:26, 165:10. 189:13. 189:25, 191:20, 212:15 double [4] - 131:10, 131:12, 192:2, 192:9 double-check [4] -131:10, 131:12, 192:2, 192:9 doubt [18] - 14:22, 30:3, 30:8, 32:29, 41:19, 41:20, 45:24, 51:12, 65:28, 70:11, 70:13, 75:15, 83:24, 86:5, 139:26, 159:4, 159:5, 159:6 down [22] - 5:8, 10:12, 18:9, 50:13, 55:20, 67:17, 72:25, 73:3, 78:10, 88:2, 115:1. 119:16. 151:14, 161:24, 173:19, 177:1, 196:2, 224:16, 226:6, 227:22, 229:3, 232:14 **DOWN** [1] - 101:11

6:29, 7:10, 91:22,

downloading [1] -166:6, 166:7, 169:27, embarrassed [1] -197:3 exactly [9] - 64:20, 200:1 170:20, 171:2, 214:3 escalating [1] -83:29, 84:5, 90:17, **DPP** [5] - 30:20, 174:27, 195:28, embrace [1] - 16:17 211:18 191:27, 228:25, 196:6, 220:3 230:7, 230:28, 237:26 66:8, 93:19, 123:15, emerged [3] - 23:25, essence [1] - 99:28 essentially [1] -123:16 duty [2] - 169:19, examination [8] -190:11, 191:13 draft [27] - 57:27, EMMA[1] - 2:18 54:22 100:12, 120:14, 58:1, 64:1, 64:7, dwell [1] - 183:24 121:3, 121:16, 123:6, emphasise [1] establish [2] -64:12, 64:15, 64:17, dying [1] - 188:20 117:16 107:15, 219:28 123:20, 123:22, 64:18, 67:5, 67:14, **DÁIL** [1] - 1:5 123:23 established [1] emphasising [1] -67:26, 75:8, 77:23, Dáil [13] - 15:10, examine [2] - 70:14, 24.15 108:17 79:26, 85:21, 86:27, 15:20, 16:26, 20:16, employees [1] -ESTABLISHED[1] -121:13 105:20, 105:21, 21:11, 26:4, 26:22, 92:14 **examined** [1] - 123:7 106:28, 107:1, 40:1, 71:18, 98:18, establishing[1] -EXAMINED [38] enable [1] - 128:25 150:29, 157:12, 113:6, 125:7, 200:19 4:4, 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 4:8, enabled [3] - 78:15, 220:29 157:23, 158:15, 4:9, 4:10, 4:11, 4:14, 141:20, 141:27 Etcetera [1] - 39:7 159:15, 160:11, 197:2 4:15, 4:16, 4:17, 4:18, Ε etcetera [7] - 40:17, enclose [2] - 57:26, drafted [4] - 87:25, 4:19, 4:23, 4:24, 4:25, 63:29 47:20, 47:21, 167:24, 105:26, 106:8, 106:25 4:26, 4:27, 5:18, 203:5, 211:26 enclosing [2] early [3] - 17:27, drafting [6] - 62:13, 95:21, 99:12, 109:1, 57:27, 64:1 evasive [1] - 197:5 158:20, 178:29 112:12, 145:16, 62:18, 81:13, 84:19, evening [6] - 70:24, end [8] - 25:29, 31:9, ease [1] - 228:19 86:26, 160:22 152:1, 155:3, 162:12, 112:7, 161:11, 185:6, 165:4. 185:20. easily [2] - 156:1, 174:10, 177:8, drafts [1] - 84:7 207:14, 211:16, 190:25, 235:1, 235:2 214:7 183:14, 205:9, dragged [1] - 231:3 event [10] - 8:7, 8:14, 218:22 east [1] - 162:24 208:15, 217:10, drawn [1] - 187:28 ended [2] - 103:17, 8:18, 105:5, 128:3, Easter [1] - 186:21 Drayton [2] - 8:27, 233:28, 234:22, 128:17, 128:18, 190:3 editor [2] - 10:18, 235:18. 236:5 36:12 214:17, 227:25. endured [2] - 184:16, 10:19 examining [1] drink [1] - 169:4 237:21 187:22 educated [2] - 47:17, drip[1] - 66:1 energetic [1] - 157:2 events [13] - 7:2, 7:4, 83:26 example [6] - 12:19, drip-feeds [1] - 66:1 energy [1] - 10:15 8:24, 14:1, 62:12, effect [11] - 38:18, 36:11, 132:13, 63:9, 94:3, 157:19, drivers [3] - 33:28, enforce [1] - 54:22 68:15, 71:19, 83:28, 147:16, 154:15, 176:23, 212:1 169:5, 169:6, 169:23, enforced [1] - 65:9 93:11, 96:16, 97:22, 155:24 driving [1] - 169:4 221:22, 231:25 enforcement [2] -103:7, 144:14, **exception** [1] - 75:23 dropped [6] - 38:26, eventually [1] -173:12, 185:24 184:24, 231:29 excerpt [1] - 203:2 39:28, 40:11, 150:12, 211:21 enforcing [1] effectively [1] excerpts [1] - 237:14 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:9 150:15, 150:16 212:10 128:24 exchange [7] dry [2] - 131:28, evidence [52] - 7:19, engage [2] - 123:5, effort [1] - 161:21 152:26, 166:8, 7:22, 7:24, 21:7, 132:16 123.6 efforts [1] - 120:24 175:24, 176:9, **DUBLIN** [11] - 1:17, 23:23, 24:4, 35:8, engaged [3] - 62:12, eight [1] - 163:2 185:19, 185:21, 206:2 45:5, 51:27, 54:14, 2:12, 2:20, 2:25, 2:30, 114:19, 188:11 either [12] - 76:17, 3:3, 3:7, 3:10, 3:14, exchanged [2] -54:27, 56:7, 56:10, engagement [3] -81:11, 94:26, 116:5, 8:11, 8:25 3:18, 3:21 70:23, 82:18, 82:20, 195:11, 204:12, 206:4 134:11, 149:1, excluded [1] - 41:7 **Dublin** [12] - 5:28, 82:28, 83:17, 87:2, engagements [1] -155:16, 168:18. excuse [3] - 134:6, 90:13, 95:25, 97:7, 162:16, 163:26, 139:20 199:25. 212:16. 134:9, 150:24 97.13 97.16 99.22 163:28, 168:24, enlighten [1] -230:28, 232:8 168:27, 177:19, 100:26, 103:27, executive [1] -208:21 elaborating [2] -109:28, 110:26, 162:27 179:4, 188:23, enlightenment [1] -69:8, 69:19 197:29, 217:23, 113:15, 113:19, Executive [3] -185:25 elective [1] - 118:27 149:16, 177:14, 163:3, 163:10, 163:14 237:25 enlist [2] - 82:12, element [1] - 16:15 177:22, 179:13, exercise [5] due [7] - 8:29, 9:19, 90:21 **ELIZABETH**[1] - 2:7 184:28, 194:13, 114:20, 115:7, 13:5, 58:25, 65:28, enlisted [1] - 69:10 elucidate [1] - 109:8 66:26, 120:26 196:4, 199:19, 117:20, 117:26, entertained [1] em [5] - 45:18, 58:18, 205:17, 206:19, 211:26 Dun [8] - 35:19, 32:14 60:24, 136:29, 179:22 206:22, 207:16, exercising [2] -35:20, 218:21, entirely [1] - 79:11 email [3] - 149:24, 215:2, 221:4, 221:5, 233:15, 236:27, 115:1, 115:6 entry [2] - 74:6, 163:18. 163:21 221:23, 228:6. exhaustive [2] -236:29, 238:2, 238:4 195:24 emailed [1] - 76:8 234:18, 234:25, 239:9 duration [1] - 43:2 92:14, 148:15 **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:9 emanated [1] exact [8] - 18:19, **Exhibit** [1] - 84:16 during [18] - 23:8, equally [1] - 205:23 182:17 22:23, 22:24, 37:26, expand [1] - 222:11 24:25, 38:1, 85:17, erased [1] - 17:26 102:7, 110:5, 122:8, emanating [1] -50:5, 50:12, 59:21, expect [5] - 44:28, erasure [1] - 15:25 107:29 141:28, 157:19, 96:10 83:8, 83:11, 83:16, error [2] - 85:26,

83:27 expected [5] - 45:2, 83:4, 83:5, 87:1, 114:26 experience [2] -222:20, 223:12 explain [4] - 180:2, 192:8, 222:11, 225:18 explained [3] - 43:7, 166:13, 206:8 explaining [6] -130:2, 179:23, 179:25, 194:20, 196:7, 234:1 explicitly [1] - 60:2 explore [1] - 196:28 explored [1] - 117:13 expose [2] - 65:5, 115:28 exposed [1] - 115:29 exposing [1] - 66:5 exposition [1] -44:29 express [2] - 81:29, 103:1 expressed [3] -38:17, 38:21, 45:1 expressing [1] -105:27 expression [1] -126:28 expressly [1] -143:26 extent [7] - 15:13, 45:3, 112:19, 117:3, 148:7, 148:10, 219:28 extra [2] - 84:8, 107:25 extract [1] - 184:7 extremely [4] -161:5, 188:28, 190:20 F

face [2] - 173:7, 215:25 faced [1] - 157:29 fact [76] - 8:15, 8:26, 19:22, 20:6, 24:4, 28:21, 29:2, 29:27, 31:21, 32:5, 38:5, 44:6, 44:27, 45:11, 46:23, 48:4, 56:9, 56:26, 62:10, 65:23, 69:10, 71:24, 72:16, 73:15, 73:25, 77:27, 81:23, 85:16, 88:23, 90:7, 97:3, 97:13, 102:21, 104:8,

107:23, 121:24, 122:11, 130:12, 130:15, 130:17, 133:1, 133:14, 133:17, 133:18, 153:12, 159:19, 160:9, 161:3, 161:4, 170:1, 178:29, 180:7, 184:28, 185:20, 190:26, 191:13, 191:14, 191:23, 193:15, 193:17, 193:19, 194:21, 194:23, 202:21, 205:14, 206:12, 217:24, 224:13, 226:21, 230:14, 231:12, 237:12, 237:22 facts [9] - 29:21, 39:24, 48:4, 107:15, 130:18, 144:1, 144:2, 146:7, 234:17 factual [2] - 44:22, 55:21 factually [2] - 58:2, fail [1] - 54:13 failed [5] - 65:21, 65:24, 120:25, 124:15, 124:24

fair [38] - 17:5, 18:18, 19:4, 21:5, 21:8, 25:23, 28:1, 45:29, 51:1, 61:13, 62:17, 81:28, 84:17, 86:1, 92:16, 93:5, 97:1, 106:8, 108:2, 116:10, 124:18, 124:27, 125:17, 126:8, 126:25, 130:3, 130:28, 131:4, 132:1, 142:1, 142:2, 142:3, 149:17. 151:3. 156:21, 156:22, 177:4, 202:27 fairly [3] - 29:1, 129:10, 186:11 fairness [6] - 17:19, 86:9, 88:14, 128:12, 192:3, 193:23 false [4] - 54:6, 54:24, 83:14, 127:7 familiar [10] - 76:25,

98:5, 98:8, 98:9,

156:19, 172:21,

familiarity [1] -

211:24

113:21

124:8, 150:7, 150:10,

family [6] - 55:2, 108:3, 184:18, 187:24, 188:18, 188:19 far [6] - 105:20, 107:27, 154:1, 159:8, 183:5, 221:1 fashion [2] - 115:28, 211.18 father [2] - 29:2, 128:2 Faughnan [9] -163:12, 163:19, 163:25, 164:4, 184:18, 185:9, 185:12, 189:19, 189:23 fault [2] - 79:11, 94:14 favour[1] - 115:26 faxed [1] - 76:9 FCN [1] - 123:10 FCNs [1] - 120:3 FCPS [3] - 68:4, 75:13 121:14 feature [3] - 6:28, 72:10, 106:17 featuring [1] - 139:3 **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:6, 1.10 February [22] -57:14, 63:3, 73:16, 73:20, 73:23, 74:14, 77:14, 78:13, 79:19, 82:8, 82:9, 91:8, 93:23, 148:4, 157:10, 158:21, 161:15, 166:28, 167:24, 168:2, 168:3, 219:21 fed [1] - 54:3 Federation [1] -163:4 feed [3] - 20:15, 26:4, 54:14 feeding [2] - 26:12, 26:21 feeds [1] - 66:1 **FELIX** [1] - 3:1 fella [1] - 46:4 felt [34] - 14:21, 14:22, 15:3, 16:10, 16:15, 16:26, 17:6, 19:12, 21:14, 21:20, 32:22, 33:1, 33:2, 55:29, 56:14, 94:10, 94:18, 102:2, 130:18, 161:7, 161:8, 167:5,

205:17, 210:3, 211:16, 212:13 **FERRY** [1] - 2:28 few [10] - 23:5, 63:2, 89:13, 112:6, 163:28, 176:25, 185:16, 186:21, 191:22, 195:16 fierce [1] - 20:1 fight [2] - 150:14, 196:2 figure [1] - 85:9 figures [2] - 16:19, 25.22 file [24] - 31:6, 37:24, 58:16, 58:19, 59:1, 59:9, 59:12, 59:13, 59:15, 59:23, 84:10, 84:11, 84:15, 84:16, 86:23, 93:19, 106:5, 106:6, 123:15, 149:12, 149:25, 149:29, 151:9 filed [3] - 59:10, 61:13, 92:10 files [4] - 25:10, 25:11, 30:20, 66:8 fill [2] - 119:6, 233:24 final [6] - 110:13, 121:25, 123:24, 228:2, 231:10, 237:5 finalised [1] - 121:17 finally [1] - 151:19 findings [1] - 21:24 fine [7] - 5:15, 11:26, 144:11, 176:17, 188:25, 207:14, 236:3 fines [1] - 218:3 finish [4] - 45:5, 99:17, 164:13, 170:12 finished [3] - 49:22, 195:25, 210:22 Finucane [41] - 6:3, 9:25. 10:8. 11:9. 12:13, 19:28, 27:13, 30:3, 30:23, 33:24, 37:23, 37:28, 38:14, 38:20, 39:15, 39:24, 41:11, 41:24, 53:4, 82:19, 82:23, 91:25, 94:27, 139:3, 139:12, 152:11, 152:14, 152:27, 153:22, 220:13, 220:23, 225:12, 225:16, 225:20, 226:8, 226:18, 228:27, 230:15, 231:20, 232:25, 237:9 fire [5] - 13:9, 28:25,

28:27, 31:13 firing [1] - 103:18 firing-line [1] -103:18 firmly [3] - 27:26, 27:29, 232:24 FIRST [1] - 3:6 first [71] - 5:4, 10:7, 11:1, 13:2, 16:29, 20:7, 26:17, 36:4, 37:3, 40:19, 40:28, 41:17, 44:15, 45:2, 46:9, 48:8, 62:3, 64:16, 65:11, 66:19, 67:17, 67:29, 68:2, 75:18, 75:19, 86:28, 105:13, 105:26, 107:3, 107:4, 122:11, 129:9, 132:4, 135:29, 140:8, 143:2, 150:21, 150:24, 154:8, 154:25, 160:27, 160:28, 165:4, 168:16, 169:11, 177:22, 179:1, 180:9, 180:13. 181:5. 181:25, 182:2, 186:12, 188:1, 189:20, 190:21, 197:7, 198:14, 201:7, 205:18, 210:26, 210:27, 211:4, 211:6, 211:20, 214:18, 219:4, 227:7, 228:21, 231:15. 237:27 firstly [6] - 113:4, 120:5, 158:19, 181:18, 183:28, 188:7 fite [1] - 10:28 Fitzgerald [3] - 5:11, 238:5, 238:13 FITZGERALD[2] -2:17, 3:16 Fitzgibbon [1] -217:26 five [9] - 6:8, 7:22, 105:15, 139:18, 221:28, 223:26, 224:21, 230:8, 231:24 fixed [17] - 111:4, 120:3, 122:10, 127:29, 128:27, 134:20, 135:21, 136:13, 137:18, 163:12, 164:11, 165:1, 165:15, 165:18, 174:4, 186:14, 210:28 floating [2] - 209:24, 234:9

167:7, 169:24,

176:26, 186:29,

199:4, 200:13,

FLOOR [1] - 3:6 forces [1] - 13:6 121:18, 121:21, 217:22, 217:26, G flow [4] - 57:10, foreground [1] -121:22, 123:14, 218:4, 218:12, 109:29, 113:25, 103:3 123:27 218:21, 218:26, gained [3] - 104:4, 219:29, 223:7, foundation[1] -131:27 foresee [2] - 132:4, 161:27, 175:2 226:19, 232:1, 232:3, flow-back [1] -216:5 132:10 games [2] - 156:5, 113:25 forget [5] - 18:5, four [22] - 6:8, 9:14, 234:5 237:6 71:9, 95:8, 102:12, 15:9, 16:9, 17:8, Gardaí [9] - 10:27, focus [3] - 71:10, gaps [1] - 233:24 31:28, 41:15, 41:16, 196:13, 219:27 187:8 19:14, 22:6, 22:15, garda [3] - 53:5, 97:12, 138:9, 196:1, 30:12, 30:19, 32:26, focused [1] - 144:16 forgive [2] - 135:28, 84:8, 98:12, 107:16, 173:18, 173:19 200:26, 202:4 168:23 folder [2] - 9:27, 9:29 Foley [1] - 164:17 forgot [2] - 156:7, 149:19, 150:20, Garda [141] - 7:17, gardaí [6] - 98:7, 11:29, 12:5, 12:7, follow [11] - 16:7, 156:10 151:14, 157:13, 145:26, 184:22, 12:9, 12:29, 14:23, 157:14, 161:3, 226:7, 185:11, 187:11 form [11] - 15:15, 16:28, 21:6, 24:25, 16:16, 16:29, 20:21, 231:24 garnered [1] - 113:5 26:19, 45:3, 45:5, 20:8, 22:8, 38:27, 21:14, 24:10, 27:18, 40:12, 69:21, 79:27, Frank [5] - 73:25, gay [1] - 164:24 81:23, 102:22, 238:17 28:4, 28:5, 28:6, 104:7, 104:10, Gay [3] - 174:25, 101:24, 101:26, follow-on [2] - 24:25, 112:20, 158:3 28:16, 28:17, 29:20, 117:20, 160:3 176:10, 206:12 26:19 29:24, 30:20, 31:7, fraud [1] - 123:9 General [9] - 111:2, formal [2] - 172:10, follow-up [2] - 81:23 34:6, 34:15, 35:14, free [2] - 82:14, 181:10 162:26. 164:23. followed [7] - 7:4, 38:5, 38:9, 38:22, 169:12 164:26, 165:11, formally [14] - 5:12, 14:1, 46:10, 47:9, 39:22, 41:9, 41:11, Friday [2] - 34:13, 166:3, 166:21, 67:7, 90:11, 224:22 122:12, 165:9, 44:2, 44:10, 44:24, FOLLOWING [1] -165:13, 172:12, 34:24 200:17, 239:13 FRIDAY [1] - 239:17 44:28, 54:9, 56:21, general [24] - 27:8, 176:25, 181:13, 1:5 61:28, 63:15, 65:5, 182:5, 185:4, 194:27, 43:4, 43:6, 56:19, friend [1] - 34:13 following [26] - 1:26, 65:11, 65:18, 66:7, 195:1, 203:15, friendlier [1] - 147:9 69:22, 91:21, 115:4, 16:10, 22:2, 23:20, 66:11, 66:19, 70:3, 211:15, 211:20 friendly [1] - 147:10 115:25, 126:17, 24:5, 33:4, 38:13, 85:5, 85:7, 88:1, 131:5, 132:9, 133:26, 39:24, 42:27, 66:2, format [3] - 46:16, friends [2] - 55:2, 88:25, 89:2, 89:5, 138:29, 139:11, 192:26, 197:25 114:16, 116:28, 156:14 95:4, 95:11, 96:29, 139:19, 141:1, formed [8] - 14:4, front [9] - 8:17, 9:21, 118:23, 119:25, 97:25, 98:5, 98:6, 141:28, 142:19, 14:6, 14:9, 15:1, 121:29, 131:19, 37:25, 58:16, 58:19, 98:12, 100:18, 98:16, 132:24, 142:20, 145:23, 134:9, 142:29, 78:3, 104:28, 105:18, 107:24, 107:29, 146:13, 162:26, 152:25, 165:17, 146:16, 185:26 149:12 108:4, 108:5, 108:15, 174:26, 237:18 former [40] - 10:17, 217:21, 224:1, frontline [1] - 147:21 108:19, 112:16, generality [1] - 25:16 10:18, 38:5, 81:18, 228:12, 230:12, fuaite [1] - 10:28 114:21, 114:24, generally [1] - 209:5 230:16, 235:3 84:17, 86:25, 86:28, full [7] - 65:8, 65:19, 115:5, 115:26, generic [3] - 140:15, 109:6, 109:9, 112:18, follows [3] - 52:29, 120:14, 149:15, 117:18, 118:11, 113:25, 124:19, 140:19, 141:7 64:23, 123:3 150:14, 236:11 119:14, 120:4, 120:6, 157:11, 173:15, gentleman [1] -FOLLOWS [10] - 5:1, fully [3] - 68:23, 120:23, 121:15, 112:1, 205:10, 173:23, 183:18, 153:9 70:13, 191:5 123:6, 123:9, 125:21, 184:3, 184:12, genuinely [9] -208:15, 210:25, function [3] - 8:5, 128:4, 129:11, 217:10, 233:28, 184:13, 187:18, 17:17, 33:2, 94:10, 13:24, 19:24 132:12, 134:11, 234:22, 235:18, 236:6 187:19, 195:14, 95:9, 124:26, 134:3, functions [3] - 11:27, 134:13, 136:24, 195:17, 201:24, 154:13, 180:21, 197:6 **foot** [5] - 87:27, 211:26, 211:29 136:27, 142:23, 201:29, 203:20, Ger[1] - 122:7 133:24, 138:28, fundamental [1] -145:22, 145:28, 203:23, 204:5, 204:6, **GERAGHTY**[1] - 3:2 171:24, 181:23 145.2 146:7, 147:6, 147:13, 204:14, 204:22, footballer[1] - 156:8 **GERALD** [3] - 3:19, fundamentally [3] -148:4, 152:9, 156:26, 204:23, 218:26, **FOR** [13] - 1:8, 2:6, 4:3. 5:17 116:1, 125:14, 125:16 157:20, 163:22, 219:29, 221:2, 2:9, 2:14, 2:22, 2:27, Gerald 1561 - 5:5. furious [1] - 54:24 164:17, 164:21, 221:14, 221:20, 3:1, 3:4, 3:8, 3:12, 11:17, 27:15, 31:27, furnish [2] - 39:8, 169:2, 170:2, 170:5, 224:20, 224:25, 41:23, 49:28, 50:14, 3:15, 3:19, 111:22 63.7 170:10, 170:19, 239:14 force [28] - 12:11, 89:5, 89:8, 89:10, furnished [2] -173:5, 173:13, forming [1] - 187:1 89:11. 91:1. 91:26. 12:13, 12:15, 13:4, 73:10, 121:26 174:23, 175:26, formulate [1] - 75:16 135:2, 136:6, 136:12, 13:10, 13:12, 13:15, **FURTHER** [4] - 4:10, 176:21, 176:29, forth [2] - 32:6, 157:18, 219:24, 14:23, 18:3, 18:11, 4:18, 152:1, 205:9 180:8, 183:17, 103:22 221:26, 222:23, 18:16, 18:28, 19:1, furthermore [1] -186:24, 188:26, forum [4] - 115:27, 222:26, 224:10, 28:10, 28:14, 28:19, 55.4 192.18 192.22 30:13, 34:3, 34:5, 117:11, 142:7, 185:6 224:21, 224:28, **FÍONÁN** [1] - 3:12 196:7, 196:10, 198:9, 65:12, 66:7, 117:17, forward [3] - 30:13, 225:26, 226:7, 227:2, 209:4, 212:24, 117:22, 117:23, 33:5. 227:29 227:18, 227:20, 215:13, 217:12, 227:27, 228:9, 118:25, 146:18, 212:9 forwarded [5] -217:19, 217:20,

180:15, 186:27, 228:27, 229:2, 229:7, 193:18, 193:19 Handling [3] - 218:1, 32:5 grateful [3] - 57:29, 229:19, 229:26, 218:9, 218:10 193:13, 207:23, highly [1] - 156:25 229:28, 229:29, 58:28, 64:6 handwriting [8] -208:26, 208:27, himself [5] - 33:11, 230:6, 230:9, 230:14, 209:5, 221:23, 74:29, 75:4, 88:3, 50:26, 103:13, 122:9, great [18] - 11:23, 230:27, 231:13, 11:25, 14:29, 15:13, 88.4 88.5 88.7 225:19, 226:10, 163:25 231:16, 231:23, 231:19, 234:7, 234:9 24:19, 29:29, 36:27, 88:12, 157:6 hindsight [9] - 24:19, 231:26, 232:4, 232:8, 43:23, 47:13, 54:6, handwritten [14] -**HEARING** [4] - 5:1, 47:1, 89:27, 94:9, 111:22, 112:1, 239:17 232:21, 232:26, 66:4, 77:18, 85:15, 74:26, 75:18, 77:11, 103:11, 103:14, 233:2, 233:7, 233:9, 85:16, 91:29, 94:9, hearing [2] - 55:17, 106:24, 110:18, 125:4 78:20, 79:5, 79:6, 233:21 98:18, 157:3 85:6, 86:14, 86:16, 135:29 history [1] - 219:12 GERARD [1] - 2:22 grievances [1] -91:19, 147:28, hearings [1] - 11:3 hold [2] - 161:2, Gerry [1] - 224:25 31:11 148:12, 151:1, 157:14 hearsay [2] - 152:21, 163:5 **GRIFFIN** [1] - 2:18 gist [1] - 128:23 hang [1] - 222:25 153:16 holding [1] - 107:24 given [59] - 8:16, happily [1] - 81:3 heated [6] - 174:29, ground [3] - 73:4, holidays [1] - 128:2 8:19, 22:2, 23:23, 73:5, 214:4 175:24, 176:9, happy [19] - 16:29, home [5] - 13:7, 25:11, 50:19, 51:2, 35:12, 39:23, 42:5, 185:19, 185:21, 186:6 GSOC [15] - 70:13, 165:8. 184:17. 51:19, 54:27, 56:15, 70:20, 70:26, 71:6, 44:7, 73:5, 77:21, heavily [1] - 46:21 187:23, 188:18 69:1, 72:24, 75:6, 71:7, 164:17, 164:26, Hegarty [3] - 10:18, 105:18, 106:27, honest [3] - 21:6, 131:17, 137:25, 75:10, 75:15, 76:11, 165:12, 165:13, 31:15, 31:26 32:28, 233:18 81:12, 85:15, 86:7, 185:4, 187:3, 195:26, 168:3, 172:7, 177:5, HELD [1] - 1:17 honestly [3] - 48:13, 86:8, 92:17, 92:20, 205:15, 206:9, 211:16 194:9, 197:27, 198:2, held [7] - 14:19, 176:12. 195:19 95:14, 95:25, 97:26, guard [7] - 24:14, 209:22, 229:19 21:10, 27:3, 124:26, honesty [1] - 66:14 98:2, 101:17, 104:13, Harcourt [1] - 217:22 108:5, 108:17, 109:9, 165:20, 174:22, honour[1] - 72:3 104:15, 109:28, 144:24, 145:3, 209:22 hard [5] - 85:9, 212:19 hope [9] - 9:21, 110:12, 110:15, guards [24] - 13:11, 155:28, 167:5, hello [1] - 41:22 40:15, 99:17, 141:5, 111:9, 111:10, 13:13, 16:6, 16:9, 196:26, 232:17 help [21] - 41:24, 154:6, 155:22, 200:6, 117:28, 118:13, 16:11, 17:9, 17:24, harder [1] - 213:14 61:2, 75:16, 76:10, 202:28 131:15, 132:17, 18:25, 28:2, 28:7, harm [3] - 54:7, 77:23, 85:29, 89:18, hoped [1] - 152:17 133:7, 146:23, 149:1, 28:9, 28:10, 28:12, 54:21, 55:11 90:21, 92:12, 104:11, hopefully [1] -149:16, 154:14, 29:2, 29:5, 33:4, HARTY [1] - 3:4 106:28, 108:9, 188:23 156:2, 160:6, 164:14, 33:11, 34:1, 84:4, 131:13, 140:22, HAVING [3] - 5:17, hoping [2] - 82:20, 169:14, 180:22, 95:8, 126:2, 156:23, 162:11, 217:9 141:12, 156:29, 100:2 184:20, 189:13, 173:27, 192:24 161:26, 214:1, Hawkes [2] - 69:11, horrendous [1] -201:1, 206:26, 208:3, guess [2] - 47:18, 214:26, 219:9, 225:18 69:26 53:12 208:23, 208:27. 83:26 head [6] - 13:5, 19:1, helped [6] - 87:23, Hospital [1] - 162:26 209:13, 209:20, guessing [1] - 80:18 35:3, 35:19, 98:25, 126:1, 154:9, 160:11, hosted [2] - 6:2, 53:3 213:27, 228:10 guests [2] - 10:13, 161:24. 216:28 222:25 hostile [2] - 184:15, **GK5** [2] - 84:16, 10:16 helpful [8] - 35:7, heading [1] - 9:7 187:21 86:22 guidance [2] - 43:13, 40:21, 92:24, 98:20, headings [1] - 55:20 hostility [1] - 176:27 gladly [1] - 19:11 91:15 106:10, 151:18, headlines [2] hosting [2] - 8:6, glass [1] - 28:26 guise [1] - 31:5 161:5, 198:5 10:11, 17:10 8.26 globally [1] - 113:3 helpfully [1] - 219:11 guns [1] - 50:16 headquarters [2] -Hotel [1] - 113:23 God [3] - 28:2, 29:6, **guy** [1] - 46:9 helping [4] - 66:3, 212:24, 218:13 hour [5] - 96:2, 196:15 **GWEN** [1] - 1:30 97:22, 105:19, 161:28 Headquarters [2] -100:13, 111:20, good-bye [1] - 128:9 Gwen [1] - 1:25 Hereunder [1] -142:24, 174:23 122:6, 219:22 **GORDON** [1] - 2:10 53:19 health [1] - 162:21 hours [1] - 7:22 gosh [4] - 182:24, Н herring [1] - 133:16 Health [1] - 162:28 house [6] - 80:19, 194:25, 196:15, hear [15] - 6:13, 28:8, hesitate [3] - 39:5, 89:7, 94:11, 126:1, 196:18 58:22, 146:23 32:29, 56:9, 56:27, 156:17, 171:13 half [2] - 100:13, governance [1] hesitation [2] -57:1. 74:5. 94:1. **HOUSE** [3] - 2:11, 122.6 191:10 33:12, 146:27 139:2, 176:20, 2:19, 2:24 HALIDAY[1] - 2:11 Government [1] -209:29, 210:1, hierarchy [1] - 95:6 **HQ**[1] - 238:18 hall [1] - 208:11 15:14 231:19, 234:4, 236:14 **high** [2] - 156:25, HSE [3] - 33:25, HANAHOE[1] - 2:28 government[1] -164.5 heard [31] - 29:29, 147:16, 147:19 hand [2] - 5:24, 54.26 53:9, 53:12, 55:3. High [5] - 59:27, huge [2] - 156:24, 160:22 graduated [1] -70:23, 76:6, 82:1, 86:3, 172:19, 172:26, 190:18 handed [4] - 10:3, 162:16 93:25, 93:27, 114:8, 195:1 human [1] - 177:1 104:25, 105:25, GRAND [1] - 3:17 143:22, 148:3, 166:6, highlighted [1] humiliation.. [1] -168:20 grandson [4] -175:4. 180:10. 12:18 handled [1] - 181:9 171:10, 180:6, 180:12, 180:14, highlighting [1] hundred [2] - 161:7,

234:8 26:21 98:26, 98:28, 99:5, 129:4, 129:23, 161:6, 219:27, 234:26 hundreds [1] - 84:3 166:20, 211:2, **INDEX** [1] - 4:1 101:21, 105:21, inquiry [12] - 15:25, 214:28, 219:3, 222:16 **hymn** [1] - 10:29 indicate [6] - 76:13, 106:15, 106:16, 24:10, 24:15, 24:16, 106:17, 110:11, impossible [1] hymn-sheet [1] -99:23, 138:16, 139:5, 53:29, 122:14, 158:9, 225:9 10:29 117:7 110:14, 110:15, 141:11, 143:15, 167:11, 215:22, impress [1] - 107:13 indicated [22] -111:6, 113:1, 113:3, impression [6] -101:17, 101:20, 113:4, 113:8, 113:13, 222:6, 238:7 ı 115:13, 115:21, Inquiry [1] - 11:4 45:23, 176:18, 115:11, 117:13, 116:24, 117:9, 118:4, **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:3, 185:27, 187:27, 118:3, 125:25, 139:1, idea [7] - 51:9, 88:5, 194:7, 212:29 139:7, 142:23, 118:23, 118:26, 108:20, 125:4, imprint [2] - 105:10, 143:27, 145:7, 123:22, 123:27, inserted [2] - 70:17, 199:23, 226:8, 229:15 123:28, 125:17, 105:17 152:12, 158:7, 106:19 identical [1] - 78:28 127:1, 127:7, 128:26, impropriety [2] -158:13, 177:12, inside [1] - 36:21 identification [1] -129:16, 129:19, 194:18, 201:18, insignificant [2] -163:23, 164:6 26:12 220:22, 234:24, 131:3, 131:15, 109:11, 109:13 improve [1] - 131:7 identified [1] -131:27, 131:29, 236:23, 236:25, 237:8 improved [1] insisted [1] - 201:10 191:14 132:19, 133:4, 133:7, indicates [4] -221:22 insofar [8] - 125:8, identify [3] - 159:17, 137:20, 139:13, 130:12, 140:29, IN [1] - 1:17 127:24, 144:29, 159:19, 189:9 140:18, 141:20, 207:16, 219:17 160:26, 163:29, inappropriate [11] identities [1] -141:27, 144:22, indicating [4] - 9:26, 171:22, 174:2, 216:17 14:10, 17:3, 44:10, 118:20 146:24, 149:5, 114:18, 142:4, 177:14 89:2, 89:16, 89:18, inspector [9] - 13:13, identity [2] - 122:12, 151:25, 153:26, 98:4, 157:28, 158:5, indifferent [1] -20:9, 29:27, 31:22, 190.8 159:19, 160:5, 104:5 188:8, 188:10 31:24, 218:2, 218:4, 163:11, 164:14, ignore [1] - 91:9 individual [6] include [4] - 16:21, 218:5, 218:10 171:25. 180:22. ignoring [1] - 46:7 41:10, 107:2, 121:2 190:10, 191:8, 192:3, Inspector [5] - 65:19, illegality [1] - 20:21 181:16, 188:15, included [5] - 68:26, 192:11, 192:13, 65:22, 66:22, 133:22, illustrate [1] - 180:2 192:9, 196:5, 213:22, 192:17 75:24, 81:5, 86:22, 201:18 imagine [4] - 36:9, 218:28, 219:15, individualised [1] -165:10 inspectors [7] -227:13, 228:19, 47:12, 86:2, 87:29 123:10 40:21, 84:28, 86:6, includes [1] - 239:12 233:7, 233:10 immediacy [1] individually [1] -151:13, 161:22, including [2] - 65:20, information-flow [1] 210:19 191:28 174:18, 229:12 221:11 - 131:27 immediate [2] individuals [3] inclusions [1] instance [11] - 41:17, informed [17] -51:20, 60:28 98:12, 100:6, 189:9 65:12, 66:19, 86:28, 74:21 61:27, 120:4, 120:6, immediately [22] inferred [1] - 136:9 111:1, 117:9, 167:13, inconsistent [3] -120:8, 120:23, 51:5, 82:4, 82:8, influence [2] - 56:26, 48:1, 48:3, 48:7 189:20, 223:11, 122:16, 122:17, 126:25, 149:10, 57:3 231:11, 233:20 incorporated [2] -122:21, 152:24, 162:17, 164:18, influencing [2] instanced [1] -104:13, 123:23 153:19, 164:22, 166:4, 166:16, 56:26. 57:3 128:17 incorporating [1] -164:23, 164:25, 166:20, 190:23, inform [5] - 121:10, instances [3] -78:8 174:15, 204:1, 208:19 199:21, 222:24, 138:22, 145:20, 191:14, 192:17, incorrect [12] infuriated [1] -225:5, 226:18, 152:21, 164:21 202:24 29:23, 39:2, 39:27, 229.25 228:16, 229:3, 50:1, 51:3, 90:20, information [122] instead [2] - 16:23, initial [10] - 41:3, 229:28, 229:29, 15:24, 16:18, 16:25, 20:17 99:1, 99:2, 99:5, 41:4, 110:8, 157:21, 231:13, 232:1, 232:3 19:7, 19:15, 20:13, instinctively [1] -103:17, 110:12, 159:15, 160:20, impact [1] - 191:7 20:16, 20:27, 22:1, 130:22 196:18 181:15, 191:2, impacted [1] -22:2, 22:21, 24:12, institutions [2] indeed [15] - 74:25, 217:21, 223:21 212:13 25:11, 25:13, 25:18, 100:17, 100:28, 147:14, 147:23 initiate [1] - 34:11 impacts [1] - 210:29 25:28, 26:4, 32:23, INSTRUCTED [9] -127:24, 191:10, initiated [1] - 41:13 **imperative** [1] - 90:8 32:24, 35:1, 37:4, 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:28, 199:6, 199:25, initiating [1] - 47:17 implied [1] - 172:8 38:29, 39:2, 45:7, 200:25, 200:26, 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12, **initiatives** [1] - 169:3 imply [1] - 205:20 200:27, 200:29, 49:11, 50:18, 51:2, 3:20 innuendo [1] implying [1] - 62:25 51:18, 52:12, 54:2, 202:27, 219:11, instructed [1] -208:19 import [1] - 134:10 221:19, 221:21 56:15, 57:8, 61:1, 204.23 input [3] - 73:2, importance [6] -69:1, 71:17, 72:6, independent [6] instruction [2] -86:24, 106:28 13:25, 13:26, 19:25, 72:24, 73:4, 73:6, 26:26, 57:8, 69:26, 22:18, 132:27 19:26, 65:1, 177:2 78:14, 80:7, 82:21, inquire [2] - 111:1, 71:18, 192:22, 211:25 instructions [11] important [17] - 6:24, 83:12, 83:13, 83:14, 130:1 independently [1] -107:1, 134:23, inquiries [8] - 61:26, 13:16, 29:18, 49:4, 96:5, 96:16, 96:21, 172:16 135:25, 136:16, 72:12, 98:13, 125:28, 54:17, 59:4, 66:13, independents [4] -96:24, 97:3, 97:6, 138:22, 140:23, 142:22, 171:24, 117:16, 117:21, 97:24, 97:27, 98:11, 20:16, 26:4, 26:13, 142:20, 143:26,

152:7, 178:10, 182:12 instructs [1] - 144:15 INSTRUMENT [1] -1:8 insulin [2] - 101:3 integrity [1] - 66:14 intend [3] - 8:24, 100:11, 183:24 intended [1] - 94:23 intending [1] - 24:24 intention [4] - 73:1, 106:19, 161:2, 161:27 inter[1] - 56:6 interaction [3] -167:16, 177:1, 186:20 interactions [1] -203:19 intercept [1] - 202:11 intercepted [19] -171:14, 171:23, 171:27, 172:10, 172:13, 173:5, 173:6, 180:28, 182:19, 193:24, 193:29, 194:19, 194:26, 195:1, 202:8, 203:12. 204:3, 204:8 interception [2] -172:15, 193:23 interceptions [1] -203:16 interest [7] - 12:19, 17:21, 33:3, 100:16, 101:2, 198:23, 236:29 interested [9] -18:10, 45:6, 56:18, 56:19, 101:27, 102:19, 134:4, 137:18, 178:25 interests [2] -130:27, 183:26 internal [11] - 21:14, 22:8, 38:8, 39:22, 57:9, 97:24, 98:11, 119:14, 140:11, 140:21, 200:9 internally [1] - 87:14 international [1] -213:21 interpreted [1] -113:29 interrelated [1] -10:27 intervals [1] - 97:20 intervene [1] - 51:23 intervened [1] - 27:4 interview [25] -183:21, 184:4, 184:6, 184:18, 185:12, 185:16, 187:11,

187:12, 187:24, 187:28, 188:4, 188:9, 188:10, 192:18, 195:7, 195:16, 199:6, 199:8, 202:5, 203:1, 204:18, 204:26, 217:6, 220:4 interviewed [11] -74:4, 122:14, 162:7, 184:13, 187:19, 192:24, 192:27, 201:1, 202:3, 219:20, 228:4 interviewing [1] -192:19 intimated [1] -196:13 INTO [1] - 1:3 intricacies [1] - 72:9 introduced [4] - 8:9, 10:14, 122:9, 139:10 introduces [1] -10:13 introducing [1] -10.8 introduction [2] -9:25, 47:17 investigate [9] -14:23, 16:7, 16:11, 30:1, 31:23, 65:13, 65:19, 120:13, 165:14 investigated [10] -29:25, 31:17, 31:22, 65:8, 65:11, 65:28, 123:13, 223:6, 234:8, 238:4 investigating [4] -12:13, 28:13, 117:19, 202:4 investigation [66] -15:16, 20:8, 21:14, 21:21, 21:22, 21:24, 22:9, 22:20, 22:29, 23:4, 30:10, 30:12, 33:4, 36:15, 36:25, 45:21, 53:6, 54:14, 56:20, 57:10, 62:1, 65:22, 66:22, 68:11, 70:13, 70:21, 93:7, 97:11, 97:15, 119:15, 119:25, 123:14, 124:14, 125:9, 129:16, 130:2, 134:21, 135:22,

136:19. 140:2.

142:21, 144:16,

146:17, 146:18,

153:25, 157:27,

166:10, 192:21,

150:21, 151:4, 151:7,

199:10, 199:18, 200:3, 201:10, 213:7, 213:8, 213:25, 218:15, 222:6, 222:21, 225:23, 232:29, 238:6, 238:7, 238:17 investigations [9] -38:8, 38:16, 39:22, 140:12, 140:17, 140:20, 140:21, 146:15, 238:24 investigative [7] -20:9, 34:28, 44:4, 96:20, 98:21, 110:20, 132:6 investigators [23] -5:21, 17:20, 29:4, 41:5, 73:12, 74:4, 84:9, 161:12, 162:7, 169:15, 174:20, 174:21, 183:22, 184:7, 195:7, 199:6, 203:1, 217:6, 219:21, 226:1, 228:5, 229:13, 237:25 invite [1] - 8:21 invited [7] - 6:6, 8:13, 8:24, 67:19, 130:27, 139:2, 145:19 inviting [2] - 8:27, 116:12 involve[1] - 160:24 involved [15] - 12:2, 25:6, 66:21, 88:24, 89:17, 93:10, 118:18, 142:22, 158:5, 158:10, 158:14, 159:9, 222:8, 228:14 involvement[4] -37:22, 92:22, 102:8, 160:12 involving[5] - 11:29, 89:5, 94:4, 148:16, 222:5 Ireland [3] - 19:2, 162:25, 163:4 irregularities [2] -163:12, 174:3 irrelevant [1] -193:20 irrespective [2] -44:8, 74:1 ISIS [1] - 218:8

113:10, 114:29, 115:16, 116:4, 116:5, 116:13, 116:16, 119:9, 119:10, 119:15, 123:13, 124:12, 130:11, 130:15, 138:18, 138:21, 143:7, 152:6, 158:16, 160:15, 170:12, 170:13, 175:26, 179:1, 180:1, 185:25, 188:17, 190:13, 190:18, 196:8, 203:10, 203:18, 205:16, 206:9, 209:9, 216:23 issued [10] - 22:18, 38:25, 70:24, 85:24, 86:20, 86:23, 118:17, 119:28, 120:17, 159:17 issues [24] - 33:7, 47:15, 66:27, 76:16, 88:29, 117:14, 121:11, 127:22, 141:1, 165:7, 165:24, 170:3, 170:7, 173:20, 174:27, 175:7, 179:25, 180:3, 181:4, 193:3, 201:8, 223:6, 232:28, 233:15 issues' [1] - 210:3 it" [1] - 178:25 it'd [1] - 45:29 item [1] - 215:1 items [1] - 190:28 itself [2] - 103:7, 112:27

J

January [25] - 6:1,

6:17, 40:28, 53:3, 70:25, 87:3, 109:14, 113:24, 135:19, 142:29, 143:5, 150:21 155:14 157:6, 218:24, 220:8, 220:24, 221:3, 221:16, 221:27, 223:25, 224:17, 235:2, 235:4 jigsaw [1] - 230:1 Jim [1] - 11:4 job [4] - 11:25, 162:29, 168:17, 177:19 jogged [2] - 148:6, 148:9 John [20] - 11:24,

20:9, 29:27, 30:12, 108:27, 109:5, 109:9, 113:2, 116:22, 119:13, 119:23, 119:29, 120:12, 124:1, 142:15, 207:2, 222:6, 225:22, 232:29, 235:20 **JOHN** [5] - 2:17, 2:28, 3:4, 3:8, 3:17 joined [2] - 10:20, 217:20 **joint** [1] - 169:3 journalist [6] - 34:28, 44:4, 96:21, 98:21, 110:20, 132:6 journalists [2] -209:7, 222:19 Judge [9] - 5:10, 108:12, 124:6, 134:25, 183:4, 195:2, 207:7, 207:14, 220:10 judge [2] - 172:20, 172:26 JUDGE [2] - 1:12, judging [1] - 126:9 judgment [1] - 117:7 judicial [1] - 203:17 July [3] - 165:17, 165:20, 210:15 jumping [1] - 232:19 June [4] - 123:8, 215:4, 217:20 jurisdiction [1] -218:17 Justice [12] - 94:20, 97:27, 98:3, 165:18, 165:23, 165:27, 166:3, 172:25, 199:12, 199:25, 200:26, 201:9 justice [4] - 172:14, 172:16, 172:22, 172:24 JUSTICE [3] - 1:8,

Κ

1:12, 2:2

KATHLEEN[1] - 2:7 Kavanagh[1] -119:16 KAVANAGH[1] - 2:4 KEAN[11] - 3:19, 3:20, 4:3, 5:17, 95:21, 99:12, 109:1, 112:12, 145:16, 152:1, 155:3 Kean[135] - 5:5, 5:6,

issue [52] - 17:23,

19:8, 24:7, 24:8,

24:11, 26:9, 69:8,

71:11, 71:13, 82:13,

92:25, 93:12, 102:8,

112:26, 113:3,

237:15 5:20, 5:22, 5:27, 9:26, 98:25, 109:27, left-hand [1] - 5:24 level [9] - 86:6, 11:17, 12:15, 27:17, keep [8] - 7:5, 112:10, 118:19, legal [7] - 40:13, 95:11, 97:24, 117:3, 30:27, 32:15, 41:23, 102:12, 102:28, 121:17, 122:28, 88:29, 89:3, 115:17, 164:5, 202:12, 51:24, 60:1, 63:5, 153:16, 176:23, 131:24, 139:4, 211:11, 217:15, 229:6 115:19, 143:18, 70:2, 74:24, 76:11, 200:7, 234:19 150:17, 162:6, 226:4, 184.22 libel [1] - 72:9 76:12, 76:21, 79:14, keeping [1] - 103:20 liberty [1] - 214:1 228:21 legislation [1] - 98:6 85:4, 88:22, 89:5, keeps [2] - 46:18, lasted [3] - 224:6, legitimate [2] licence [1] - 212:1 224:21, 224:24 89:8, 89:10, 89:11, 46:20 31:11, 221:12 life [3] - 93:2, 237:20, 91:1, 91:11, 91:12, lasting [2] - 223:26, Kent [1] - 162:22 legitimately [1] -237:21 91:17, 91:19, 91:26, kept [6] - 47:3, 224:29 116.5 light [5] - 50:26, 92:2, 95:23, 99:14, 101:18, 101:25, lasts [1] - 225:6 **LEHANE** [5] - 3:8, 102:21, 131:3, 100:3, 101:13, 140:15, 186:15, late [15] - 8:29, 4:26, 235:15, 235:18, 148:17, 155:27 101:15, 106:12, 188:16 26:26, 29:2, 77:29, 235:19 likelihood [1] -108:17, 109:3, 128:2. 165:20. kind [20] - 24:10, **Lehane** [2] - 235:19, 171:13 111:20, 112:4, 77:4, 85:4, 87:28, 168:18, 177:27, likely [17] - 52:20, 235:29 112:14, 112:29, 170:3, 176:11, 195:5, 195:18, length [1] - 38:4 171:15, 171:23, 119:23, 129:5, 134:5, 196:24, 202:13, 176:22, 180:7, 172:9, 181:9, 182:4, lengthy [6] - 38:6, 134:8, 134:12, 202:14, 203:23, 182:23, 194:25, 39:14, 45:15, 69:6, 182:18, 182:25, 134:19, 135:2, 214:23 197:11, 207:21, 194:27, 195:5, 195:8, 71:9, 100:12 135:13, 135:14, launched [1] - 17:27 209:3, 209:25, 210:3, 195:12, 196:20, lesser [1] - 112:19 135:20, 136:7, 212:26, 215:16, LAW [1] - 3:12 letter [98] - 37:12, 202:12, 202:13, 136:12, 136:17, 216:9, 216:19, 234:14 law [6] - 54:23, 65:9, 37:19, 37:25, 48:15, 203:11, 204:12 136:21, 138:20, Kingdom [1] -69:27, 72:9, 88:27, 52:3, 52:29, 55:23, limited [4] - 128:14, 140:22, 145:18, 162:18 118:6 173:14, 236:10, 55:24, 57:13, 57:20, 151:19. 151:23. knowing [1] - 136:20 **LAWLOR**[1] - 3:9 236:12 57:26, 57:29, 58:10, 151:27, 152:4, 155:5, knowledge [19] lawyer [1] - 77:4 58:19, 58:26, 59:8, line [23] - 44:3, 157:18, 158:8, 26:7, 27:7, 32:12, lead [1] - 96:2 60:9, 60:26, 60:27, 67:17, 72:22, 75:19, 158:11, 158:17, 69:21. 70:20. 104:4. 84:12, 86:13, 88:17, lead-up [1] - 96:2 61:6, 61:10, 62:4, 161:29, 219:6. 117:3, 121:20, 131:7, 103:18, 179:7, leader [7] - 13:15, 62:5, 63:3, 63:6, 63:9, 219:24, 219:29, 193:1, 193:4, 193:10, 167:22, 177:12, 63:22, 63:29, 64:6, 179:10, 182:7, 184:6, 220:7, 220:22, 221:5, 200:24, 201:22, 200:9, 201:22, 203:2, 205:4, 208:12, 64:11, 71:20, 71:29, 221:26, 222:26, 209:16, 213:11, 210:10, 210:21 74:12, 75:8, 77:23, 210:8, 211:8, 211:9, 223:17. 223:22. 228:23, 234:11, 78:4, 78:7, 78:15, 211:19, 225:25, **LEADER** [14] - 2:7, 223:26, 224:10, 238:20 78:25, 79:27, 81:1, 225:27, 226:2, 238:10 4:14, 4:19, 162:5, 224:21, 224:25, knowledgeably [1] lines [6] - 22:28, 162:12, 162:14, 81:5, 81:9, 82:3, 224:28, 225:3, 141:21 167:26, 169:1, 82:15, 82:25, 82:26, 83:25, 103:4, 195:16, 225:10, 225:11, known [14] - 28:3, 83:9, 83:11, 84:19, 219:16, 237:28 172:29, 174:6, 225:13, 225:26, 36:18, 68:21, 84:24, 208:15, 208:16. 85:21, 87:27, 88:20, link [5] - 89:26, 226:7, 226:25, 90:1, 90:3, 90:9, 89:6, 89:8, 99:1, 209:28, 210:15 103:10, 103:13, 226:26, 227:2, 160:28, 172:5, 90:23, 91:7, 91:9, 135:7, 187:28 leader's [1] - 199:19 227.18 227.20 173:10, 186:23, 92:9, 104:14, 104:16, list [9] - 5:12, 8:16, leaf [1] - 197:12 227:27, 228:9, 218:1, 218:8, 218:18 104:17, 105:1, 106:7, 8:19, 8:20, 122:15, leakage [1] - 16:25 228:11, 228:12, knows [2] - 77:4, 106:20, 107:2, 107:4, 172:13, 172:18, leaking [3] - 16:18, 228:22, 228:27, 234:2 117:8, 148:27, 173:4, 203:16 16:21 57:8 229:2, 229:7, 229:19, 148:28. 149:8. learned [1] - 113:13 listed [1] - 86:22 229:26, 229:28, 149:11, 149:12, L listen [13] - 34:24, least [2] - 14:1, 55:10 229:29, 230:6, 230:9, 149:17, 150:28, 47:13, 83:5, 83:26, leave [5] - 120:27, 230:14, 230:27, 157:12, 157:22, 90:19, 96:13, 140:9, 153:2, 153:14, 231:13, 231:16, lads [1] - 18:17 157:29, 158:12, 141:8, 141:12, 206:12, 231:8 231:23, 231:26, landline [1] - 180:24 158:20, 159:16, 143:23, 156:29, leaving [2] - 49:25, 232:4, 232:8, 232:21, Laoghaire [8] -160:1, 160:10, 207:7. 238:13 232:26, 233:2, 233:7, 35:20, 218:21, 160:11, 160:19, listened [4] - 172:3, led [7] - 16:22, 17:7, 233:9, 233:22, 235:1, 233:16, 236:28, 199:27, 199:29, 196:20, 216:7, 237:9 46:5, 61:1, 181:6, 235:6, 236:10, 236:29, 238:2, 238:4 206:21, 206:24, listening [3] -192:17, 201:9 236:13, 236:23, laptop [1] - 46:19 207:27, 208:17, 103:27, 182:25, left [15] - 5:24, 12:4, 237:19 large [3] - 118:15, 208:22, 209:13, 216:19 18:6, 45:23, 45:24, Kean's [10] - 101:28, 236:25, 237:20 210:5, 210:6, 229:11 literally [9] - 104:4, 52:6, 90:18, 90:26, 157:22, 220:16, largely [1] - 6:28 letters [5] - 57:28, 169:23, 195:24, 161:11, 168:21, 221:1, 221:19, last [17] - 29:6, 37:2, 59:24, 64:2, 73:20, 175:1, 176:10, 186:7, 200:6, 209:19, 221:23, 222:23, 42:20, 62:27, 77:1, 106:4 194:3, 218:7 209:29, 214:8, 225:15, 228:19,

152:27, 153:22, 66:18, 70:25, 71:5, 215:23, 216:1 128:9 34:2, 34:26, 35:2, litigation [1] - 88:23 lucky [1] - 127:1 220:13, 220:23, 72:28, 80:1, 89:4, 36:10, 36:17, 36:29, **LITTLE** [2] - 2:20, LUNCH [2] - 111:22, 225:11, 225:16, 89:11, 89:17, 90:29, 37:22, 38:3, 38:7, 225:19, 226:8, 100:26, 100:28, 38:15, 38:21, 38:25, 2:25 112:1 live [3] - 59:9, 59:12, lunch [5] - 9:7, 226:18, 228:27, 101:24, 103:16, 39:21, 39:27, 40:1, 230:15, 231:20, 109:24, 115:23, 40:13, 42:9, 42:15, 149:29 99:18, 101:6, 111:18, 128:6 232:25, 237:9 118:2, 143:14, 43:9, 43:28, 45:8, lo [1] - 229:27 mark [1] - 139:18 145:10, 145:29, 45:20, 45:24, 47:20, loaded [1] - 46:21 lunchtime [1] - 45:14 154:2, 157:28, 158:3, 49:29, 52:3, 52:16, MARK [1] - 3:4 local [3] - 8:18, 18:6, marked [1] - 157:22 158:15, 163:29, 52:25, 55:19, 55:26, 156:20 M Marrinan [5] - 77:29, 165:9, 170:17, 56:12, 57:27, 59:13, locate [1] - 202:23 175:20, 178:20, 60:27, 62:14, 63:29, located [1] - 142:21 157:15, 230:5, 231:9, M.E [1] - 2:28 187:9, 191:24, 64:16, 64:25, 71:13, 234:25 London [2] - 162:24 MADE [2] - 1:3, 1:8 191:25, 198:23, 71:21, 71:29, 74:13, MARRINAN [9] - 2:6, Lonely [1] - 10:19 mail [1] - 12:3 213:5, 217:24, 75:17, 75:25, 79:24, 4:23, 217:5, 217:10, long-winded [1] main [6] - 11:27, 231:29, 232:25, 81:6, 81:22, 82:3, 217:11, 226:12, 126:27 73:1, 86:4, 169:28, 237:22 83:12, 86:21, 86:23, 231:10, 233:24, 239:3 look [33] - 16:14, 215:4, 215:8 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:5 86:26, 87:6, 89:21, martin [2] - 13:2, 23:1, 37:10, 40:19, maintains [1] matters [52] - 12:4, 90:9, 90:20, 93:8, 230:24 52:10, 57:20, 57:29, 143:29 93:26. 95:24. 97:14. 12:10, 13:29, 35:16, Martin [54] - 10:16, 61:15, 64:6, 78:17, major [1] - 175:13 97:20, 98:19, 98:25, 37:8, 40:15, 55:22, 24:26, 35:10, 38:4, 82:26, 84:12, 86:9, majority [2] - 28:18, 58:5, 64:28, 70:14, 99:7, 99:29, 100:24, 103:1, 110:14, 38:7, 38:14, 39:14, 29:19 71:7, 72:1, 89:14, 102:21, 102:23, 46:24, 47:6, 47:14, 110:21, 110:22, MALONE [1] - 1:30 102:24, 106:7, 47:18, 50:8, 51:5, 91:29, 92:6, 92:27, 111:6, 132:3, 136:12, 109:28. 114:13. Malone [1] - 1:25 93:22, 95:19, 105:27, 51:10, 57:24, 63:27, 146:11, 157:4, 116:14, 119:29, man [9] - 13:23, 117:12, 120:11, 113:14, 113:19, 161.22 167.18 20:10, 29:29, 37:7, 120:4, 120:25, 123:7, 127:16, 114:9, 114:13, 187:7, 187:8, 188:22, 95:26, 137:29, 157:3, 128:22, 129:1, 129:4, 121:11, 121:15, 114:16, 116:6, 191:29, 209:3, 122:2, 122:4, 122:9, 180:21, 232:13 116:14, 116:27, 129:14, 132:9, 214:26, 216:1, 232:13 122:13, 123:5, 133:18, 139:6, manage [1] - 117:22 119:2, 124:18, looked [6] - 62:5, 123:26, 124:11, managed [2] - 196:9, 139:15, 141:20, 127:14, 130:12, 64:11, 77:12, 84:7, 124:21, 125:15, 143:4, 143:25, 152:5, 237:14 132:13, 133:13, 212:23, 225:26 131:20, 131:21, 155:5. 157:24. management [8] -134:7, 134:18, looking [21] - 44:21, 160:25. 165:15. 132:12, 133:2, 95:11, 170:5, 170:10, 134:19, 136:3, 44:22, 44:26, 60:9, 140:11, 140:20, 179:26, 211:8, 138:27, 141:28, 193:1, 200:1, 205:5, 63:2, 74:12, 82:17, 218:15, 221:11, 141:10, 141:15, 211:19, 218:12, 146:3, 146:5, 147:9, 92:15, 94:3, 114:5, 143:7, 143:11, 218:17 221:12, 221:13, 147:29, 150:29, 114:12, 136:18, 223:5, 234:8, 234:10, 143:15, 143:28, manager [2] -153:6, 154:24, 157:5, 139:13, 148:16, 144:9, 144:23, 236:8, 236:24, 237:2 162:22, 162:26 184:16, 187:22, 152:12, 152:28, Maurice [30] - 37:22, 144:27, 145:2, 146:6, managers [1] -224:9, 227:2, 229:27, 153:21, 156:1, 146:7. 146:12. 38:3, 38:7, 38:15, 213:24 230:1, 230:22, 164:11, 199:15 38:21, 38:25, 39:21, 150:29, 159:16, 230:29, 231:14, 238:5 managing [1] - 10:19 looks [5] - 20:14, 159:17, 159:26, 39:27, 52:3, 55:19, manner [3] - 158:1, Mary [1] - 12:3 26:2, 103:2, 228:7, 57:27, 63:29, 119:29, 160:14, 160:20, 193:26, 202:4 match [1] - 237:4 228:15 164:27, 164:28, 123:25, 146:12, material [11] -Manor [1] - 36:12 loom [1] - 237:20 165:3, 166:5, 166:9, 165:29, 179:19, manor[1] - 8:27 105:25, 115:28, loop [1] - 134:26 200:15, 207:17, 166:11, 166:17, 118:15, 118:26, March [8] - 120:28, loose [4] - 6:29, 213:2, 215:9, 225:24, 166:29, 167:2, 121:17, 121:18, 123:27, 123:28, 9:21, 9:23, 197:12 169:26, 170:4, 170:8, 229:24, 229:25, 125:9, 141:23, 121:19, 121:21, lose [1] - 124:5 170:24, 171:4, 171:8, 231:21, 231:23, 162:6, 162:25, 184:9 142:11, 149:6, 220:5 loss [2] - 165:11, 234:3, 237:29, 171:17, 171:28, materials [5] marginalised [1] -210:29 238:21, 238:27 173:17, 173:21, 112:28, 162:8, 162:9, 167:7 lost [3] - 60:7, 92:15, 173:25, 173:28, Mayo [6] - 162:26, 167:29, 168:8 Marian [34] - 6:2, 121:8 174:14, 175:3, 175:6, 163:27, 168:24, mathematics [1] -33:24, 37:23, 37:28, **Louth** [2] - 35:20, 175:10, 175:11, 188:24, 188:25, 229:6 38:14, 38:20, 39:15, 218:23 175:17, 175:27, 214:19 39:24, 41:11, 41:23, matter [50] - 16:6, love [1] - 133:7 175:28, 175:29, McCabe [249] - 2:9, 49:23, 53:4, 82:19, 26:29, 29:25, 29:27, loved [5] - 131:14, 176:6, 176:18, 14:16, 16:24, 18:12, 82:23, 91:25, 94:26, 39:29, 40:6, 46:16, 131:22, 132:29, 179:19, 179:28, 19:9, 22:7, 23:2, 23:3, 139:3. 139:12. 53:17, 55:2, 55:17, 133:2. 133:6 180:3, 180:15, 24:4, 24:28, 25:10, 152:11, 152:14, 60:17, 61:14, 65:16, luck [2] - 49:10, 180:18, 180:21,

	1		1	T
181:2, 181:6, 181:18,	233:29, 234:3	188:3, 191:9, 194:26,	210:13, 210:18,	212:21, 215:1, 236:2
181:26, 182:21,	MCDOWELL [3] -	196:19, 197:13,	210:20, 236:3	mentioned [29] -
184:8, 184:26,	4:15, 4:18, 4:24	200:28, 209:29,	meetings [17] -	48:5, 79:21, 88:24,
184:29, 185:5,	McENROY [1] - 3:1	213:17, 214:6,	150:20, 168:6,	109:5, 128:15,
185:26, 185:28,	McGarry [8] - 2:10,	216:15, 216:17,	169:16, 169:27,	130:17, 133:1,
186:4, 186:10,	95:17, 95:18, 95:21,	227:11, 229:5,	169:28, 171:3,	134:18, 135:12,
186:12, 186:27,	95:23, 96:10, 99:9	229:15, 230:1,	171:19, 171:21,	135:19, 135:20,
187:14, 187:16,	MCGARRY [1] - 4:5	230:23, 231:11,	177:13, 178:1, 179:5,	139:1, 141:19,
188:1, 188:14, 189:3,	McGuinness [33] -	232:20	179:14, 179:16,	147:16, 170:19,
189:6, 189:21,	3:8, 5:4, 5:18, 5:19,	meaning [1] - 199:14	179:22, 194:4,	170:24, 175:8,
189:25, 191:18,	6:14, 6:18, 11:24,	means [4] - 92:13,	194:16, 198:12	187:10, 189:23,
192:2, 192:4, 193:23,	12:21, 12:24, 12:26,	125:20, 131:6, 196:11	MEMBER [2] - 1:12,	193:13, 197:29,
194:21, 195:12,	51:22, 52:2, 63:22,	meant [4] - 25:7,	2:2	206:6, 225:22,
196:2, 196:8, 196:14,	69:24, 70:1, 76:10,	64:4, 92:5, 109:20	member [37] - 11:2,	225:24, 225:28,
198:9, 199:8, 199:17,	76:15, 77:11, 79:11,	measure [1] - 236:25	35:23, 41:9, 54:9,	225:29, 226:1,
199:21, 199:26,	85:20, 95:12, 135:23,	mechanism [3] -	66:11, 88:25, 89:3,	228:26, 230:14
199:27, 200:5,	145:8, 155:3, 155:5,	30:18, 68:13, 120:11	89:5, 114:21, 114:24,	mentioning [4] -
200:19, 200:20,	159:22, 159:25,	media [10] - 12:6,	114:26, 115:5,	93:9, 126:16, 142:9,
200:27, 201:3, 201:7,	159:29, 161:29,	12:18, 101:22,	115:26, 118:11,	235:23
201:15, 201:16, 201:20, 201:24,	235:20, 235:23,	141:14, 167:5, 167:9,	118:12, 118:24,	merely [3] - 227:9,
201:20, 201:24, 201:28, 203:10,	239:8, 239:12	167:16, 171:16,	118:25, 119:11,	227:26, 233:12
203:19, 204:12,	MCGUINNESS [5] -	210:1, 222:15	123:21, 163:6, 163:7, 163:22, 189:10,	message [2] - 139:5,
204:20, 204:24,	2:6, 2:16, 4:4, 4:11, 79:12	MEEHAN [1] - 2:22	189:23, 189:29,	224:22
204:28, 205:24,		meet [5] - 9:7, 42:23,	190:3, 190:4, 190:15,	messages [3] - 73:15, 73:17, 83:19
205:27, 206:10,	MCing [1] - 8:6 McLindon [1] -	91:11, 158:8, 163:25	191:6, 191:15,	met [42] - 8:1, 8:3,
206:16, 206:22,	239:13	meeting [81] - 8:8, 42:25, 73:22, 76:6,	191:19, 191:23,	8:4, 13:23, 29:29,
207:11, 207:17,	me [1] - 67:28	76:7, 78:2, 78:12,	192:23, 193:9, 201:20	35:10, 42:23, 74:18,
208:20, 209:2, 209:8,	Mealy [1] - 122:7	85:13, 91:12, 91:16,	members [24] -	77:13, 79:17, 79:23,
209:12, 209:20,	mean [101] - 7:5,	92:8, 104:2, 105:13,	13:12, 16:25, 18:3,	84:5, 91:19, 93:4,
211:7, 213:2, 213:7,	12:16, 13:5, 13:6,	105:14, 105:22,	18:28, 28:19, 30:12,	95:26, 128:16, 137:6,
215:9, 216:23,	13:9, 13:20, 14:13,	113:22, 125:8,	30:19, 31:6, 32:6,	137:8, 137:28, 147:9,
225:24, 228:13,	14:28, 16:13, 17:5,	136:23, 148:3, 148:7,	33:20, 66:7, 112:16,	147:11, 148:29,
229:25, 231:21,	20:12, 21:25, 22:12,	148:9, 148:20,	117:18, 118:18,	151:4, 153:9, 156:11,
231:23, 234:4, 234:5,	23:22, 35:26, 37:2,	148:23, 150:24,	120:3, 120:8, 120:18,	157:18, 163:28,
237:29, 238:21,	37:6, 41:21, 42:18,	156:5, 158:10,	123:11, 164:8,	164:26, 164:28,
238:27	42:22, 42:23, 43:6,	165:17, 165:20,	189:14, 191:26,	165:3, 167:20,
McCabe's [16] - 40:7,	43:22, 44:2, 45:19,	165:22, 165:25,	218:25, 218:26,	168:10, 181:29,
56:10, 60:18, 60:26, 64:11, 72:29, 102:2,	46:16, 47:1, 48:10,	165:26, 166:4, 166:6,	222:15	189:21, 189:24,
129:27, 166:24,	48:23, 50:7, 51:7,	166:7, 166:13,	memorable [1] -	190:5, 190:24,
180:11, 181:16,	52:15, 59:3, 62:25,	166:15, 168:16,	237:21	191:28, 227:21,
182:14, 183:29,	69:5, 69:6, 71:4, 71:8,	169:9, 169:11,	memory [13] - 58:18, 104:5, 104:6, 154:7,	235:23, 237:3, 238:26
184:10, 191:21, 203:4	71:9, 72:2, 81:24,	174:16, 174:22, 174:24, 174:27,	155:18, 155:19,	methods [2] - 113:27, 156:5
McCann [3] - 2:22,	84:4, 84:8, 84:26, 85:11, 85:14, 86:17	175:1, 175:4, 175:8,	155:20, 155:21,	Michael [2] - 99:15,
3:16, 5:11	85:11, 85:14, 86:17, 87:13, 94:8, 94:13,	175:1, 175:4, 175:8,	170:21, 178:7,	174:12
McCarthy [1] -	105:10, 105:12,	177:22, 184:19,	203:20, 220:17,	MICHAEL [27] - 2:9,
239:12	105:10, 105:12,	184:21, 185:10,	231:27	2:27, 4:6, 4:10, 99:12,
McCOURT [1] - 3:2	106:23, 106:25,	185:13, 186:5,	men [2] - 30:3, 30:4	99:14, 99:23, 99:27,
McDonald [1] -	106:29, 124:29,	186:18, 186:20,	men" [1] - 13:6	100:11, 100:16,
118:19	126:8, 126:29,	190:27, 196:6, 197:6,	mental [1] - 162:21	100:21, 101:2,
McDowell [21] - 2:9,	127:19, 127:20,	198:11, 198:14,	mention [27] - 19:5,	101:15, 101:29,
174:10, 174:12,	131:27, 132:13,	199:11, 199:15,	71:6, 79:3, 79:4, 79:5,	108:8, 108:11,
174:13, 176:7,	133:5, 134:2, 136:23,	199:17, 199:21,	79:7, 93:6, 96:14,	108:15, 108:21,
176:15, 176:18,	136:24, 137:6, 137:8,	199:25, 200:11,	127:24, 130:13,	134:24, 135:5,
177:5, 183:29,	137:24, 140:12,	201:19, 201:27,	130:20, 132:14,	138:16, 138:18,
184:25, 205:4, 205:9,	141:4, 144:8, 147:19,	202:1, 205:13,	132:15, 133:12,	151:24, 152:1, 152:4,
205:11, 207:4, 207:7,	151:13, 154:13,	205:18, 206:12,	143:19, 147:3, 147:4,	154:1, 154:20
207:14, 207:25,	160:27, 172:24,	206:24, 207:5,	147:26, 158:26,	MICHELLE [1] - 3:1
208:2, 233:28,	172:26, 179:16,	207:11, 208:7,	159:29, 207:26,	Micheál [1] - 112:15
	•	•	•	•

microphone [1] - 5:9 mid [1] - 109:29 mid-flow [1] - 109:29 midday [1] - 42:28 middle [5] - 10:13, 11:12, 27:12, 32:2, 53:24 might [79] - 6:22, 8:24, 29:14, 32:14, 33:15, 33:17, 34:22, 35:9, 36:18, 36:19, 36:25, 41:13, 46:15, 47:12, 48:3, 48:4, 48:13, 48:28, 51:1, 63:6, 69:28, 70:2, 71:1, 71:18, 72:6, 72:26, 76:10, 76:13, 81:22, 83:24, 87:17, 92:15, 96:19, 97:4, 102:2, 102:9, 102:11, 102:22, 102:23, 103:2, 106:29, 107:1, 107:4, 111:18, 112:6, 119:12, 119:16, 122:26, 124:15, 126:23, 128:25, 131:13, 131:25, 132:10, 137:22, 140:16, 140:22, 146:18, 147:5, 154:7, 154:9, 155:23, 155:25, 155:27, 156:28, 158:1, 167:27, 168:9, 174:7, 178:25, 187:26, 189:3, 200:10, 206:7, 224:13, 225:3, 230:20, 236:12, 236:15 mightn't [3] - 29:12, 50:8, 236:14 mildly [1] - 211:2 million [1] - 47:13 mind [28] - 16:21, 17:6, 51:18, 80:5, 94:19, 98:23, 99:21, 101:28, 103:8, 105:17, 110:9, 113:1, 124:19, 130:9, 132:15, 132:20, 138:10, 141:27, 182:22, 187:1, 205:12, 206:7, 206:17, 227:18, 228:19, 232:11, 232:14, 234:1 minded [1] - 220:27 mine [4] - 34:14, 75:12, 75:13, 154:7 Minister [44] - 10:15,

11:22, 15:9, 15:19, 17:7, 20:18, 21:12, 21:15, 27:21, 32:25, 43:11, 94:20, 97:27, 98:3, 98:17, 110:26, 113:5, 121:21, 141:14, 165:21, 165:22, 165:23, 165:26, 165:27, 165:28, 166:7, 166:8, 166:13, 166:16, 166:22, 191:29, 199:12, 200:12, 200:13, 209:1, 209:10, 209:11, 209:18, 210:4, 210:7, 210:8, 210:14 minister [2] - 200:18, 201:17 MINISTER [1] - 1:8 Minister's [4] -21:11, 43:26, 165:29, 210.5 minute [9] - 6:6, 7:9, 20:18, 28:21, 50:7, 72:26, 105:21, 153:8, 222:25 minutes [22] - 23:5, 40:29, 51:25, 63:3, 105:15, 127:25, 127:29, 133:27, 221:28, 223:26, 224:6, 224:9, 224:22, 224:24, 224:29, 225:6, 229:5, 229:7, 229:10, 230:8, 230:13, 233:6 mirrors [1] - 117:5 misfiled [1] - 92:16 mislead [1] - 15:14

misleading [1] - 57:2 misputting[1]-182:7 missed [1] - 122:5 misspoke [1] -207:10 misstatement [2] -207:13, 208:6 mistake [3] - 21:26, 102:22, 102:23 mistaken [1] -132:22 mistakenly [1] -24:17 misunderstand [1] -58.6 misunderstanding

[2] - 69:28, 176:3

Mitchell [1] - 11:4

mix [1] - 107:17

mix-up [1] - 107:17 mobile [5] - 153:6, 155:9, 155:12, 155:16, 227:15 moment [10] - 11:1, 13:16, 20:21, 35:5, 52:6, 56:13, 60:25, 114:29, 130:4, 133:14 moments [3] - 51:7, 53:9. 185:16 Monaghan [2] -120:24, 238:25 monies [1] - 11:28 monitor [1] - 12:23 monitored [2] -172:16. 181:17 month [1] - 62:26 months [10] - 15:9, 17:8, 32:26, 34:26, 35:2, 43:11, 94:21, 97:28, 98:17, 176:25 mood [1] - 182:3 morning [26] - 5:4, 6:3, 6:20, 6:27, 9:11, 18:5, 39:25, 46:17, 47:25, 49:6, 52:6, 73:16, 73:19, 83:20, 83:22, 105:13, 112:5, 151:20, 165:8, 188:26, 211:15, 224:1, 224:21, 235:3, 235:8 MORRISSEY [1] -2.18 most [11] - 39:1, 60:28, 109:4, 128:7, 156:19, 170:25, 220:11, 220:15. 222:13, 222:27, 230:18 mostly [2] - 13:13, 140:5 motive [1] - 57:11 motoring [1] -163:20 mouth [3] - 33:1, 33:16, 234:19 mouthpiece [2] -33:9, 33:16 move [2] - 28:27, 209:21 moved [3] - 162:17, 163:3, 168:24 moving [2] - 105:22, 129:3 MR [177] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4, 2:6, 2:6, 2:9,

4:4, 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 4:8, 4:9, 4:10, 4:11, 4:13, 4:15, 4:17, 4:18, 4:22, 4:23, 4:24, 4:26, 4:27, 5:4, 5:6, 5:10, 5:17, 5:18, 5:19, 6:14, 6:18, 12:24, 12:26, 52:2, 63:22, 70:1, 76:15, 77:11, 79:12, 85:20, 95:12. 95:18. 95:21. 95:23, 99:9, 99:12, 99:14, 99:23, 99:27, 100:11, 100:16, 100:21, 101:2, 101:15, 101:29, 108:8, 108:11, 108:15, 108:21, 108:24, 108:26, 109:1, 109:3, 111:12, 111:19, 112:3, 112:12, 112:14, 124:6, 134:6, 134:17, 134:24, 135:5. 135:16, 135:23, 135:27, 136:3, 136:8, 136:14, 136:22, 138:16, 138:18, 138:26, 145:13, 145:16, 145:18, 151:23, 151:24, 152:1, 152:4, 154:1, 154:20, 155:3, 155:5, 159:25, 159:29, 161:29, 162:11, 174:10, 174:12, 176:7, 176:15, 176:18, 177:5, 177:8, 183:9, 183:10, 183.14 183.16 196:28, 198:7, 202:27, 205:4, 205:9, 205:11, 207:4, 207:7, 207:9, 207:14, 207:19, 207:22, 207:25, 208:2, 208:5, 208:10, 217:5, 217:9, 217:10, 217:11, 226:12, 231:10, 233:24, 233:28, 233:29, 234:3, 235:15, 235:18, 235:19, 236:5, 236:7, 236:23, 239:3, 239:8, 239:12 MRS [1] - 3:1

MS [27] - 2:7, 2:7,

4:16, 4:19, 4:25,

162:5, 162:12,

2:18, 2:18, 2:27, 4:14,

2:28, 3:1, 3:4, 3:8,

3:12, 3:15, 3:19, 4:3,

162:14, 167:26, 169:1, 172:29, 174:6, 177:8, 177:10, 182:29, 183:4, 183:6, 208:15, 208:16, 209:28, 210:15, 234:22, 234:23 **MUIRCHEARTAIGH** 111 - 3:12 Mullan [1] - 37:18 MULLAN [1] - 2:7 Mullingar [1] - 207:6 murmuring [1] -209:3 Murphy [1] - 165:28 MURPHY [1] - 2:14 must [6] - 8:11, 59:23, 99:1, 118:16, 175:6, 196:25 mutual [1] - 139:21 mystified [2] - 87:16, 87:20 **MÍCHEÁL** [19] - 2:15, 4:8, 4:27, 111:19, 112:12, 112:14, 124:6, 134:6, 134:17, 135:16, 135:27, 136:3, 136:8, 136:14, 136:22. 138:26. 236:5, 236:7, 236:23

N

nail [1] - 78:10 naive [1] - 28:23 name [31] - 95:23, 102:12, 102:28, 112:15, 130:13, 130:17, 130:20, 132:14, 132:15, 132:24, 132:25, 133:12, 147:3, 147:4, 147:26, 147:27, 158:26, 170:20, 172:17, 174:13, 177:10, 183:16, 190:2, 191:15, 191:16, 192:5, 192:6, 193.19 203.15 213:4, 235:19 Named [1] - 61:26 named [7] - 1:27, 123:9, 171:10, 180:6, 191:26, 193:17, 193:18 names [3] - 212:14, 212:17, 238:8 naming [4] - 26:29, 27:5, 29:12, 146:29

2:10, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15,

2:15, 2:16, 2:16, 2:17,

2:22, 2:22, 2:23, 2:27,

narrative [1] - 216:9 233:20, 234:14, 223:10, 234:25, 59:11, 59:17, 61:17, 100:21, 101:2, 238:9, 238:11 Nassau [6] - 168:27, 235:25 61:18, 120:18, 121:2, 101:15, 101:29, 169:9, 177:19, nevertheless [1] normally [8] - 6:8, 123:16, 236:13, 108:8, 108:11, 236:14, 236:20, 108:15, 108:21, 91:8 214:20, 214:22, 6:20, 6:27, 8:19, 214:25 new [5] - 30:14, 32:7. 33:24, 49:26, 104:22, 236:21 111:19, 112:12, 112:14, 124:6, 134:6, natural [2] - 10:15, 134:28, 138:24, 163:1 154:22 nowhere [1] - 211:13 134:17, 134:24, 222:18 Newham [1] - 162:24 **NORTHUMBERLA** number [65] - 6:11, 135:5, 135:16, naturally [1] - 123:23 news [5] - 6:25, **ND** [1] - 3:2 8:23, 8:26, 8:29, 10:7, 135:27, 136:3, 136:8, 10:11, 20:28, 25:8, note [32] - 40:24, nature [9] - 130:20, 113:11, 113:24, 74:27, 74:28, 84:29, 33:4, 34:1, 35:27, 136:14, 136:22, 134:13, 144:27, 180:13, 186:19 145:11, 202:4, 206:3, newspaper [2] -85:1, 85:6, 85:15, 36:1, 36:2, 37:20, 138:16, 138:18, 138:26, 145:13, 206:11, 232:15, 237:5 44:20, 199:8 86:14, 86:17, 86:21, 38:12, 39:18, 44:20, 151:24, 152:2, 152:4, 44:21, 44:23, 47:15, nearly [3] - 46:12, newspapers [2] -89:26, 91:23, 92:1, 48:19, 50:19, 55:20, 154:1, 154:20, 236:5, 92:15, 92:21, 92:24, 219:22, 226:7 66:1, 113:9 236:7, 236:23 next [21] - 10:12, 103:29, 104:12, 64:28, 65:3, 65:14, necessarily [2] -O'Higgins [19] -104:15, 104:24, 67:10, 67:14, 97:9, 21:6, 105:29 19:17, 47:25, 53:24, 99:15, 99:20, 100:9, 104:25, 104:27, 104:26, 104:28, 67:23, 68:18, 76:28, necessary [3] - 65:9, 105:1, 107:19, 100:18, 101:19, 104:28, 147:28, 122:28, 176:23 105:21, 113:21, 127:25, 127:28, 101:23, 108:10, 148:1, 149:1, 151:1, 122:29, 131:28, neck [2] - 175:19, 153:12, 161:4, 163:6, 131:5, 132:4, 137:2, 111:14, 111:15, 162:5, 163:25, 165:8, 176.8 111:17, 112:6, 195:27, 209:13 143:27, 145:22, need [16] - 34:25, 169:18, 188:23, 146:1, 152:25, 153:2, 112:15, 124:3, 134:3, 41:24, 58:1, 64:7, 190:24, 190:27, noted [2] - 46:23, 153:6, 153:28, 154:4, 134:22, 135:1, 135:8, 116:27 64:28, 65:8, 90:25, 201:4, 211:15, 217:5 notes [14] - 1:27, 154:14, 154:27, 145:14, 177:6 nice [4] - 8:10, 8:12, 91:9, 101:3, 115:23, O'Mahony [40] -155:10, 155:16, 19:12, 28:26 49:1, 69:20, 91:14, 129:4, 138:9, 190:25, 155:26, 155:29, 15:17, 16:8, 20:9, 192:2, 200:7, 200:18 night [3] - 105:14, 91:18, 91:24, 92:2, 29:28, 33:4, 53:29, 156:4, 158:8, 167:20, 92:3, 92:5, 92:9, needed [4] - 30:15, 165:8, 185:19 169:3, 175:2, 176:24, 54:13, 65:19, 68:8, 148:19, 157:23, nilly [1] - 212:11 37:26, 117:15, 210:3 97:11, 113:2, 119:14, 177:13, 227:15, 171:19, 191:4 nine [2] - 219:16, needn't [4] - 114:7, 230:25, 238:14, 119:24, 120:12, nothing [28] - 13:14, 237:28 125:27, 164:9, 238:8 238:15 124:1, 124:14, 34:29, 41:25, 48:1, needs [2] - 65:16, NO [1] - 3:20 number" [1] - 153:13 124:22, 125:9, 48:3, 48:7, 49:12, 131:6 nobody [11] - 13:6, 128:26, 129:16, 49:13, 93:27, 99:21, numbers [8] - 8:25, negatively [7] - 42:8, 30:16, 31:3, 31:17, 39:10, 40:23, 142:22, 130:2. 140:2. 140:15. 100:14, 106:5, 41:20, 41:22, 130:7, 42:11, 42:14, 100:23, 109:21, 109:23. 142:25, 193:27, 140:17, 141:11, 135:2, 204:24, 204:27 132:1, 137:5, 204:21, 143:14, 144:16, 161:27, 193:11, 203:5, 227:23 nephew [2] - 156:5, 209:4 153:24, 157:26, nurses [2] - 33:26, 194:24, 205:19, Noel [6] - 5:11, 237:4 166:10, 167:11, 216:10, 216:18, 147:22 162:5, 184:13, nephew's [1] - 237:6 Nóirín [23] - 10:17, 199:9, 199:18, 200:2, 216:21, 216:23, 184:15, 187:19, net [3] - 24:6, 24:7, 201:1, 201:9, 201:13, 13:2, 20:1, 29:22, 227:16, 231:25, 187:20 24:11 201:18, 225:22, 232:7, 233:19 92:29, 93:1, 170:26, NOEL [4] - 2:16, network [2] - 147:7, 232:29 notice [11] - 8:29, 170:27, 172:11, 147:17 3:15, 4:13, 162:11 O'Mahony's [5] -61:7, 85:13, 134:21, 182:6, 195:14, non [9] - 32:3, 57:6, never [47] - 17:15, 203:14. 204:5. 204:6. 30:12, 65:22, 66:22, 161:25, 163:13, 88:29 108:17 29:28, 54:10, 54:12, 142:15, 222:6 164:11, 165:1, 204:14, 214:29, 160:16, 160:19, 54:23, 66:9, 78:5, **O'MARA**[1] - 3:2 165:16, 165:19, 174:4 215:5, 215:6, 215:17, 167:10, 167:11, 89:25, 92:16, 104:12, 215:18, 215:21, **O'REILLY** [1] - 3:12 notice' [1] - 120:21 127:7, 130:17, 167:24 215:28, 215:29 O'SULLIVAN[2] noticed [1] - 180:23 non-cooperation [5] 148:18, 148:25, 4:22, 217:9 notices [7] - 111:4, - 32:3, 57:6, 167:10, 175:8, 175:29, 120:3, 135:22, O'Sullivan [66] -0 167:11, 167:24 180:12, 184:28, 34:17, 34:18, 35:13, 136:13, 137:19, 184:29, 185:2, 185:7, non-disclosure [2] -41:1, 42:29, 43:19, 142:16, 210:28 186:23, 187:6, 200:5, 160:16, 160:19 o'clock [4] - 139:18, 47:6, 50:22, 51:4, notified [1] - 164:1 200:21, 201:24, non-guard [1] -221:29, 226:7, 235:2 51:10, 92:26, 92:29, notify [1] - 164:17 201:26, 204:17, 108:17 O'Donovan [1] -93:2, 112:20, 125:22, notifying [1] - 174:3 204:21, 204:22, non-professional [1] 34:16 125:23, 125:24, notion [3] - 124:27, 204:25, 204:26, - 88:29 O'HIGGINS [46] -126:6, 127:13, 144:24, 145:3 204:27, 208:27, none [5] - 18:16, 2:15, 2:27, 4:6, 4:8, 128:11, 128:23, 209:17, 225:19, 85:25, 94:1, 183:5, notwithstanding [1] 4:10, 4:27, 99:12, 133:15, 135:10, 231:19, 231:20, - 123:24 202:6 99:14, 99:23, 99:27, 137:9, 137:10, 231:22, 231:24, normal [5] - 138:8, November [11] -100:11, 100:16,

137:26, 138:10,	143:28, 157:18,	105:19, 106:9,	95:24, 95:27, 96:1,	198:9
146:3, 154:12,	167:21, 168:11,	106:27, 118:12,	99:29, 104:26, 105:2,	option [1] - 235:7
154:14, 155:24,	169:20, 189:17,	122:4, 122:8, 123:15,	109:4, 114:18,	or [1] - 103:7
156:3, 170:26,	190:5, 190:7, 222:14,	136:15, 148:16,	117:19, 117:20,	order [1] - 87:1
170:27, 172:12,	236:17, 237:7	153:7, 160:9, 161:5,	127:25, 129:4, 130:7,	ordinary [2] -
173:1, 173:3, 173:8,	occur [2] - 105:28,	168:17, 168:19,	133:9, 146:16, 153:8,	114:25, 136:20
173:10, 173:16,	117:17	168:28, 169:9,	156:23, 160:15,	organisation [3] -
179:27, 181:11,	occurred [6] - 66:9,	169:20, 177:18,	164:7, 172:2, 174:13,	13:17, 66:5, 117:24
181:12, 182:6,	93:7, 177:15, 181:19,	179:2, 179:12,	175:15, 179:22,	organisations' [1] -
195:14, 195:18,	235:1, 235:26	195:21, 197:7,	181:8, 189:16,	169:5
203:14, 203:21,	occurring [3] - 94:4,	203:29, 215:3,	189:17, 189:23,	organised [1] -
203:23, 204:5, 204:7,	177:23	217:23, 218:3, 238:4	190:3, 191:13,	212:26
204:14, 204:23,	October [15] - 21:12,	OFFICE [2] - 2:19,	191:28, 194:5,	original [12] - 68:14,
214:29, 215:5, 215:6,	22:2, 32:27, 35:1,	2:24	201:28, 205:11,	72:4, 85:20, 85:21,
215:17, 215:18,	110:28, 163:4, 163:9,	office's [1] - 88:7	207:23, 208:16,	122:10, 129:15,
215:21, 215:28,	164:29, 168:17,	officer [5] - 120:7,	210:26, 213:1,	148:14, 190:22,
215:29, 217:5,	177:20, 177:27,	120:24, 121:1, 166:1,	214:27, 217:28,	192:24, 198:27,
217:11, 234:23, 236:7	194:4, 194:6, 210:11,	170:19	221:25, 229:27,	199:7, 199:10
O'Sullivan's [2] -	214:19	Officer [2] - 134:12,	233:29, 234:12,	originally [3] -
129:1, 154:7	odd [8] - 6:21, 34:21,	134:13	235:15, 236:7, 238:14	166:19, 232:10,
objective [1] - 43:25	42:19, 96:17, 97:23,	officers [5] - 117:25,	One [1] - 37:29	237:24
obliged [2] - 63:7,	105:23, 105:28, 106:1	123:9, 184:17,	one's [1] - 85:6	OSMOND [2] - 2:19,
197:16	OF [4] - 1:3, 1:9,	187:23, 187:29	one-on-one [1] -	2:24
oblivious [1] - 226:9	1:12, 2:3	offices [1] - 169:6	133:9	OTHER [1] - 1:4
obscure [1] - 108:12	of [1] - 12:29	official [6] - 91:7,	one-way [1] - 31:6	otherwise [5] -
obstructing [1] -	offence [5] - 20:15,	95:3, 146:25, 210:27,	onwards [2] -	24:17, 42:16, 49:14,
98:13	26:3, 54:10, 66:16,	211:6, 211:11	155:14, 168:14	97:4, 124:4
obstructive [12] -	66:28	officials [2] - 147:18,	open [5] - 6:5, 92:4,	outcome [2] - 17:1,
24:28, 45:22, 45:25,	offences [3] - 53:14,	211:17	110:27, 127:5, 214:29	31:26
46:1, 46:5, 71:15,	53:27, 143:13	often [2] - 47:16,	opened [2] - 106:5,	outgoing [2] -
97:14, 97:15, 97:21,	offer [5] - 38:28,	49:27	109:25	126:11, 127:9
131:21, 141:6, 144:10	167:1, 185:25,	Oisin [7] - 182:15,	opening [1] - 106:6	outing [1] - 128:4
obtained [1] - 238:10	186:15, 223:12	193:2, 193:12,	openly [1] - 144:3	outline [3] - 140:22,
obvious [2] - 103:9,	offered [4] - 89:10,	196:17, 212:21,	operates [1] - 211:2	164:5, 219:3
109:4	90:29, 158:8, 231:7	212:24, 213:4	operating [2] -	outlined [3] - 66:29,
obviously [27] - 7:9,	offering [2] - 116:3,	Oisín [5] - 171:9,	44:15, 44:18	69:19, 129:24
10:6, 15:16, 15:28,	216:19	180:5, 180:11,	operation [1] -	outrageous [1] -
25:4, 33:19, 51:7,	offhand [1] - 127:22	180:12, 182:10	121:14	30:23
52:7, 52:27, 65:28,	Office [26] - 41:6,	omission [1] -	operational [1] -	outset [1] - 64:28
66:25, 70:29, 71:23,	41:9, 41:28, 42:20,	160:27	218:15	outside [5] - 65:18,
72:9, 86:12, 88:8,	100:19, 135:11,	omitted [1] - 46:24	operations [2] -	101:8, 109:23,
93:5, 105:18, 109:27,	136:21, 136:25,	ON [4] - 1:6, 1:10,	97:25, 173:11	114:25, 218:16
154:28, 158:25,	136:27, 152:10,	1:18, 5:1	opinion [14] - 12:2,	outspoken [2] -
160:15, 213:13,	152:23, 153:20,	once [8] - 8:4, 13:23,	15:15, 21:9, 24:27,	28:22, 33:25
226:6, 226:16, 228:3,	154:14, 155:21,	46:25, 76:29, 95:26,	28:19, 38:17, 66:3,	overall [1] - 94:3
235:8	155:26, 155:29,	96:13, 146:27, 147:10	66:18, 77:21, 88:29,	overseeing [2] -
occasion [13] - 6:21,	222:11, 222:16,	ONE [1] - 3:16	103:17, 116:8,	172:15, 190:16
42:19, 95:27, 118:19,	222:29, 223:19,	one [88] - 6:2, 9:27,	146:16, 147:24	overseen [2] -
131:1, 167:8, 172:4,	223:23, 224:1, 227:8,	9:29, 10:29, 12:19,	opportune [1] -	172:14, 203:16
172:7, 175:15, 182:1,	230:19, 234:27, 235:7	13:13, 13:16, 13:22,	111:18	oversight [3] -
189:18, 237:20,	office [52] - 35:3,	13:24, 16:8, 19:14,	opportunity [7] -	172:23, 173:12,
238:23	59:24, 75:16, 77:22,	19:24, 20:18, 20:20,	55:7, 124:13, 124:21,	203:17
occasionally [2] -	77:28, 78:12, 80:16,	23:5, 25:9, 28:21,	129:7, 130:14,	
167:2, 180:20	80:23, 84:25, 85:6,	31:6, 38:1, 44:21,	130:24, 131:22	own [23] - 14:4, 14:6,
occasions [25] -	87:22, 88:1, 89:26,	45:14, 46:12, 46:18,	opposed [4] -	21:27, 21:29, 26:7,
6:11, 22:15, 38:12,	89:27, 91:13, 91:20,	47:24, 53:4, 56:13,	116:16, 167:14,	32:12, 55:23, 66:3,
39:20, 42:20, 48:19,	91:28, 92:7, 92:14,	67:17, 72:26, 73:21,	196:11, 208:11	86:12, 88:3, 103:15,
	98:26, 103:11,	75:23, 76:23, 78:21,	opposite [2] - 31:21,	108:12, 125:29, 164:22, 164:24,
50:19, 64:29, 65:3.				
50:19, 64:29, 65:3, 65:14, 85:28, 96:11,				
50:19, 64:29, 65:3, 65:14, 85:28, 96:11, 96:12, 107:19,	103:13, 103:22, 103:28, 105:9,	78:27, 80:26, 81:4, 87:15, 87:25, 88:6,	166:22 opposition [1] -	169:29, 170:28, 179:23, 179:27,

205:12, 211:18, 163:17 29:15, 29:21, 30:17, 137:3, 138:10, paragraph [13] -215:10 19:21, 61:21, 67:29, party [4] - 9:4, 32:15, 33:23, 34:7, 146:24, 146:25, 68:2, 68:18, 70:10, 111:16, 115:8, 123:20 39:1, 42:24, 53:4, 146:26, 156:19, Ρ 56.6 65.4 85.12 156:28, 185:3, 72:19, 75:18, 76:29, pass [1] - 179:21 189:17, 190:6, 190:8, 104:17, 104:18, 88:8, 94:12, 95:16, passage [2] -96:19, 104:3, 114:19, 122:29, 199:15 184:24, 188:2 190:9, 191:14, **PAC** [26] - 10:28, paragraphs [8] -117:28, 118:5, 191:15, 191:16, passed [5] - 35:2, 11:2, 14:4, 14:7, 191:29, 192:5, 201:2, 118:21, 127:1, 67:14, 74:21, 75:12, 115:14, 134:14, 16:14, 21:4, 56:5, 147:21, 156:23, 202:7, 210:28, 211:4, 75:22, 84:8, 157:13, 141:17, 192:9 56:7, 56:8, 56:19, 157:14, 161:4 175:2, 176:5, 186:19, 211:20, 227:6, PASSED[1] - 1:5 56:27, 112:27, parameters [1] past [10] - 40:29, 190:1, 197:16, 210:1, 227:12, 227:29, 113:19. 113:20. 230:16, 230:18, 118:16 42:18, 46:12, 64:29, 211:1. 212:9. 212:18. 114:6, 114:12, 213:24, 233:23 230:21, 232:27 paraphrasing [1] -89:8, 125:27, 138:2, 115:12, 119:11, people's [1] - 211:3 person" [2] - 61:8 154:20 199:2, 222:10, 222:12 125:8, 125:14, per [1] - 73:4 person's [1] - 204:7 pardon [7] - 27:28, Pat [1] - 11:2 125:15, 141:2, 142:5, 49:19, 51:16, 112:23, perceived [1] persona [1] - 12:6 paths [1] - 238:20 144:17, 144:25, 145:3 225.17 148:8, 159:27, 235:29 PATRICK [2] - 2:6, personable [1] pack [1] - 208:22 park [2] - 113:23, percent [3] - 41:22, 127:4 **PAGE**[1] - 4:2 161:7, 234:9 personal [14] -236:3 pattern [2] - 160:24, page [76] - 5:21, parking [1] - 218:3 perfect [1] - 112:8 17:20, 66:28, 68:22, 230:5 10:7, 10:11, 10:12. perform [1] - 117:24 85:5, 103:15, 115:8, parlance [1] - 180:8 Paul [1] - 95:23 10:13, 10:22, 11:8, PARLIAMENT[1] -**PAUL**[1] - 2:10 performance [3] -120:2, 120:20, 122:7, 11:11, 11:12, 12:22, 125:16, 144:22, 174:27, 175:26, 2:29 pause [3] - 13:28, 12:24, 12:27, 18:21, 144:27, 145:29, 147:7 176:22 part [32] - 8:27, 20:24, 121:6 19:19, 25:29, 27:13, perhaps [40] - 6:11, personality [1] -23.12 49.23 56.18 pay [2] - 151:13, 29:10, 29:16, 31:19, 68:4, 72:11, 72:16, 10:1, 12:22, 25:5, 126:12 179:24 32:2, 37:13, 39:7, personally [8] - 7:26, 85:27, 86:22, 89:15, 29:11, 37:10, 40:19, Payments [1] - 163:4 39:11, 40:19, 40:25, 13:23, 59:6, 85:7, 40:25, 44:9, 57:14, 98:14, 98:20, 114:6, payroll [1] - 170:2 48:17, 52:2, 53:24, 57:20, 61:14, 69:9, 89:6, 122:1, 189:22, 117:7, 119:13, peculiar [1] - 106:13 57:17, 57:20, 58:12, 71:1, 76:20, 79:12, 238:20 119:23, 129:27, pejoratively[1] -59:8, 60:7, 60:11, 134:23, 141:19, 83:9, 84:11, 86:9, personnel [1] - 65:13 126:8 61:12, 61:14, 61:21, 88:16, 91:15, 92:18, persons [1] - 29:12 144:19, 151:6, 161:2, PEMBROKE [1] -62:5, 64:12, 67:8, 95:12, 107:6, 113:6, 161:27, 173:5, 188:1, perspective [4] -67:23, 67:29, 74:24, 119:12, 127:14, 189:5, 201:1, 207:13, 116:7, 119:1, 222:24 penalties [5] -75:19, 75:24, 75:29, 208:6, 218:19, 226:6, 136:24, 167:26, pertaining [2] -122:11, 127:29, 81:16, 81:19, 84:11, 175:2, 176:25, 179:2, 228:21 229:23, 232:28 128:27, 212:10 86:10, 88:15, 112:28, parted [1] - 166:16 202:8, 214:27, pertinent [2] - 23:19, penalty [42] - 12:20, 114:5, 114:15, 118:8, 216:29, 220:18, participate [2] -108:28 15:26, 17:15, 17:23, 119:12, 122:29, 223:12, 227:16, 124:13, 166:12 Peter [1] - 108:26 53:6, 55:1, 111:4, 157:4, 162:8, 167:29, 228:10. 228:18 participated [1] - 6:1 **PETER** [4] - 1:12, 113:2, 119:15, 184:4, 184:5, 187:11, period [6] - 113:15, participating [2] -2:2, 2:4, 3:5 134:21, 135:22, 187:12. 199:16. 155:7, 157:19, 124:14, 222:4 136:13, 137:19, **Phillip** [1] - 10:20 202:29, 203:3, 217:7, 158:12, 219:22, 220:3 philosopher" [1] participation [1] -151:20, 163:13, 219:13, 220:5, 223:15 periodic [1] - 174:24 125:11 10.21 163:18, 163:24, pages [1] - 220:4 peripheral [1] particular [17] - 6:24, 164:7, 164:11, 165:1, phone [86] - 8:23, paid [1] - 40:2 238:19 82:13, 105:27, 107:5, 9:14, 33:29, 34:12, 165:5, 165:16, panelist [5] - 34:28, permissible [1] -115:2, 124:11, 39:18, 40:17, 42:26, 165:19, 165:23, 44:5, 44:18, 98:22, 98:14 127:23, 131:26, 46:20, 50:21, 50:25, 170:7, 174:4, 175:7, 110:20 permission[1] -170:15, 170:19, 50:28, 51:10, 51:23, 186:14, 189:11, panic [2] - 49:18, 171:7, 171:12, 132:17 189:16, 189:27, 70:4, 81:22, 83:10, 49.20 174:29, 182:23, persecute [1] - 14:26 87:2, 95:26, 122:4, 190:5, 190:11, paper [2] - 17:11, 189:7, 189:10, 196:13 person [50] - 33:2, 131:5, 146:3, 151:6, 190:17, 191:6, 96:22 particularly [5] -36:9, 36:14, 37:3, 151:8, 151:15, 203:18, 205:15, papers [18] - 5:22, 42:9, 55:1, 57:28, 152:17, 152:18, 10:6, 101:21, 102:19, 206:8, 210:28, 6:21, 6:28, 7:6, 7:28, 64:4, 97:2, 105:26, 179:28, 183:18 152:25, 153:26, 211:29, 222:7, 237:16 10:25, 10:26, 29:27, 107:3, 107:5, 107:24, 153:27, 155:9, parties [6] - 5:19, people [48] - 8:17, 37:23, 37:28, 49:9, 25:12, 56:22, 120:2, 107:27, 108:4, 155:22, 160:8, 167:3, 11:4, 11:23, 14:12, 58:17, 67:7, 106:29, 120:19, 142:11 114:20, 115:21, 171:14, 171:23, 18:9, 19:2, 26:29, 157:4, 215:25, 219:7, **PARTNERS**[1] - 3:9 27:4, 27:5, 28:6, 122:9, 125:26, 171:27, 171:29, 237:14 126:10, 130:26, parts [2] - 10:5, 28:20, 29:8, 29:12, 172:1, 172:9, 172:12, paraded [1] - 22:19

	r			
172:17, 173:6,	196:16, 197:6,	163:18, 163:24,	128:20, 128:21,	136:27, 152:9,
179:19, 180:11,	222:28, 223:22	164:7, 183:23,	128:28, 130:21, 235:6	152:23, 153:19,
180:19, 181:5,	places [1] - 197:24	183:24, 186:14,	possible [18] - 93:9,	154:14, 155:21,
181:16, 182:14,	plaintiff [1] - 86:3	189:11, 189:16,	97:10, 115:21,	155:26, 155:28,
182:16, 182:19,	Planet [1] - 10:19	189:27, 190:5,	116:23, 127:12,	222:11, 222:16,
182:25, 193:22,	planning [1] - 13:9	190:11, 190:17,	133:14, 133:15,	222:28, 223:19,
194:19, 194:26,	_	191:6, 203:18,	141:26, 155:22,	223:23, 223:29,
194:29, 196:19,	platform [1] - 115:6	205:16, 206:8,	155:23, 172:3, 181:7,	227:7, 230:19,
199:3, 202:7, 202:11,	player [1] - 55:5	211:29, 222:7	205:23, 206:17,	234:27, 235:7
203:12, 203:13,	playing [1] - 237:7	police [2] - 212:9,	222:9, 227:9, 230:22,	pressed [1] - 107:15
203:15, 203:16,	plead [1] - 60:1	213:21	238:26	pressure [1] - 187:8
204:3, 204:7, 219:6,	pleaded [1] - 72:16	policeman [2] -	possibly [15] - 5:7,	presumably [10] -
219:8, 220:7, 221:19,	Pleadings [2] -	157:2, 231:6	81:12, 95:26, 96:12,	7:13, 23:22, 23:26,
223:18, 223:25,	63:13, 63:14	policing [4] - 117:24,	105:16, 136:22,	33:22, 49:6, 52:22,
226:19, 227:23,	pleasant [1] - 169:24	178:26, 221:12, 237:1	158:1, 181:17, 182:1,	55:23, 59:19, 83:29,
228:13, 229:3,	pleasantries [1] -	Policing [1] - 163:6	190:25, 191:6, 222:2,	163:10
229:14, 230:10,	146:9	policy [1] - 123:9	226:28, 227:8, 233:2	presume [4] -
230:24, 230:25,	pleasantry [1] -	polite [1] - 188:28	post [5] - 71:1,	115:15, 136:24,
231:14, 237:19	91:21	political [4] - 10:21,	163:5, 165:9, 211:15,	211:23, 213:17
phoned [18] - 51:4,	pleased [6] - 11:5,	12:5, 94:4, 209:6	214:19	pretences [1] - 127:8
52:7, 52:16, 109:28,	37:9, 45:10, 77:24,	politicians [1] - 66:1	post-dated [1] - 71:1	pretty [3] - 108:21,
110:3, 164:19,	78:9, 131:17	port [1] - 51:20	posted [1] - 76:9	113:3, 196:25
185:20, 187:6, 200:5,	pleasure [2] - 85:15,	portion [5] - 81:15,	postgraduate [1] -	prevent [1] - 142:10
200:11, 203:29,	85:17	119:17, 122:28,	162:18	previous [10] - 14:2,
221:3, 223:11, 224:1,	plural [1] - 109:15	123:2, 125:7	potential [4] - 14:24,	19:21, 20:28, 23:13,
224:10, 228:9,	point [62] - 12:21,	portions [1] - 139:28	65:26, 66:24, 105:24	45:1, 122:17, 147:11,
228:16, 231:13	17:15, 26:17, 26:24,	position [44] - 13:29,	potentially [1] -	199:1, 212:5, 216:23
phones [5] - 46:18,	33:3, 36:19, 57:5,	18:14, 18:15, 27:26,	189:29	previously [3] - 8:1,
171:1, 172:1, 173:4,	57:12, 61:6, 62:3,	32:17, 35:5, 36:29,	powers [1] - 165:13	68:6, 86:17
193:24	66:10, 68:10, 68:24,	43:14, 43:26, 44:23,	practice [5] - 20:17,	pride [1] - 13:10
phoning [5] - 41:1,	69:18, 70:8, 71:15, 77:17, 79:10, 89:24,	55:23, 56:7, 56:15,	54:4, 222:10, 222:12,	primarily [4] -
49:16, 83:23, 226:13,	95:1, 108:9, 108:12,	56:17, 94:18, 96:15,	234:26	112:17, 176:28,
228:14	110:1, 118:1, 124:10,	97:2, 98:24, 100:7,	practising [2] - 5:28,	218:15, 222:13
photocopy [1] -	126:25, 127:21,	103:16, 115:3,	44:16	primary [1] - 229:5
197:12	129:23, 130:3,	115:10, 115:24,	preceding [2] - 7:2,	principal [1] - 166:1
photocopying[1] -	130:11, 131:13,	116:3, 117:26, 129:9,	7:4	principle [1] - 56:20
118:8	132:2, 145:19,	130:14, 135:15,	precipitated [3] -	printed [1] - 178:9
phrase [4] - 13:19,	148:13, 162:29,	139:16, 140:13,	233:9, 233:11, 233:13	prisoners [2] -
46:3, 65:2, 196:3	163:1, 163:15,	142:15, 144:4, 145:9,	predicament [3] -	222:22
phraseology [2] -	164:18, 164:24,	151:24, 157:24,	170:29, 179:24,	private [10] - 24:5,
75:12, 107:22	165:5, 165:24, 166:1,	158:14, 159:8,	215:21	44:11, 56:10, 57:1,
physically [1] -	166:19, 170:7, 175:7,	162:25, 219:9,	preface [1] - 114:18	73:14, 80:12, 105:9,
167:14	194:5, 212:8, 219:2,	220:27, 223:16,	prefer [1] - 111:17	125:27, 158:4, 236:24
pick [2] - 23:12,	219:29, 220:18,	228:2, 231:10	prejudice [2] - 68:9,	privy[1] - 51:7
90:26	220:27, 221:1,	positioned [1] -	120:9	pro [2] - 28:4
picked [3] - 23:22,	221:16, 221:24,	156:26	premises [1] -	probability [1] -
145:1, 236:21	221:25, 224:13,	possession [8] -	236:27	41:27
picture [1] - 200:24	225:9, 226:22,	76:29, 77:1, 151:3,	preparing [2] -	probe [1] - 70:1
piece [4] - 72:22,	226:24, 230:10,	188:16, 188:17,	60:22, 150:14	problem [21] - 17:4,
131:26, 171:24, 185:9	237:9, 237:16	189:25, 218:29,	present [8] - 13:22,	22:14, 24:9, 24:14,
pinpoint [1] - 195:4	pointed [1] - 194:29	219:23	122:8, 175:2, 176:5,	28:8, 33:29, 52:11,
place [24] - 20:21,	pointing [3] - 95:1,	possession" [1] -	186:19, 196:23,	56:23, 66:27, 72:26,
30:15, 30:19, 32:8,	95:3, 200:2	76:28	198:28, 206:7	79:16, 90:19, 90:22,
37:24, 43:15, 43:17,	points [34] - 12:20,	possibilities [4] -	press [3] - 27:3,	98:15, 103:6, 124:9,
43:18, 66:3, 78:12,	13:1, 15:26, 17:12,	25:9, 104:26, 105:1,	169:5, 169:6	129:6, 129:8, 130:10,
104:2, 114:24,	17:23, 53:6, 55:1,	105:4	Press [28] - 41:6,	145:2, 226:12
117:12, 121:8,	69:22, 86:22, 94:21,	possibility [14] -	41:9, 41:28, 42:20,	problems [3] - 33:27,
158:11, 160:7,	113:3, 116:15,	41:7, 41:26, 42:1,	100:18, 134:11,	59:27, 111:3
177:18, 178:1,	119:15, 144:20,	81:8, 89:25, 89:28,	134:13, 135:11,	procedure [2] -
188:26, 192:23,	151:20, 158:15,	90:2, 90:4, 102:11,	136:21, 136:24,	20:17, 106:21

nuo o o di uno o roi
procedures [3] -
16:28, 54:4, 66:2
proceed [1] - 40:3
proceeded [1] -
134:25
proceeding [2] -
22:20, 105:24
proceedings [15] -
7:10, 11:10, 20:29,
38:25, 38:26, 40:10,
59:10, 59:19, 60:10,
60:22, 85:18, 97:12,
149:26, 150:4, 150:11
process [9] - 101:4,
120:14, 140:5,
172:14, 172:21,
178:6, 188:10,
188:12, 203:17
processes [1] - 65:9
produce [1] - 77:19
produced [2] -
78:11, 104:23
producer [3] - 49:27,
52:19, 53:14
producers [1] -
52:10
profession [3] -
5:27, 44:8, 89:4
professional [8] -
42:16, 88:29, 89:7,
138:3, 147:7, 157:21,
188:28, 204:6
professionally [2] -
80:17, 197:17
programme [93] -
6:2, 6:7, 6:10, 6:15,
6:19, 9:18, 9:20, 9:23,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3, 139:3, 139:12,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3, 139:3, 139:12, 140:10, 141:13,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3, 139:3, 139:12, 140:10, 141:13, 143:7, 143:22,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3, 139:3, 139:12, 140:10, 141:13, 143:7, 143:22, 152:14, 152:28,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3, 139:3, 139:12, 140:10, 141:13, 143:7, 143:22, 152:14, 152:28, 153:22, 160:29,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3, 139:3, 139:12, 140:10, 141:13, 143:7, 143:22, 152:14, 152:28, 153:22, 160:29, 220:14, 220:24,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3, 139:3, 139:12, 140:10, 141:13, 143:7, 143:22, 152:14, 152:28, 153:22, 160:29, 220:14, 220:24, 220:27, 222:4,
10:9, 12:8, 16:6, 17:28, 19:18, 23:29, 27:12, 29:8, 33:20, 38:14, 43:8, 47:19, 47:26, 48:9, 49:8, 49:17, 49:22, 50:20, 53:2, 53:3, 53:15, 54:21, 55:9, 56:6, 60:3, 68:5, 70:9, 71:25, 73:19, 90:18, 91:26, 96:2, 96:5, 102:1, 109:22, 111:8, 129:26, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:11, 133:1, 133:3, 139:3, 139:12, 140:10, 141:13, 143:7, 143:22, 152:14, 152:28, 153:22, 160:29, 220:14, 220:24,

225:26, 226:3, 226:5, 226:9, 228:27, 229:18, 229:21, 229:23, 229:24, 229:26, 230:15, 231:19, 231:20, 231:21, 231:29, 232:6, 232:7, 232:9, 232:25, 233:5, 233:11, 233:18, 233:22, 233:23, 237:10, 237:13 programmes [2] -28:4, 130:27 prominent [2] -59:23, 59:26 promote [1] - 103:15 promoted [6] -162:21, 162:27, 217:25, 218:2, 218:11, 218:20 prompted [7] -181:10, 182:27, 194:1, 194:27, 195:13, 204:13 **proof** [1] - 54:15 proper [5] - 20:17, 31:12, 54:3, 66:2, 97:29 properly [2] -117:13, 145:7 **property** [1] - 80:19 proposal [1] - 114:12 propose [2] - 151:26, proposed [4] - 58:1, 64:7, 87:12, 157:12 proposing [1] -64:21 propounding [2] -20:25, 20:26 prosecute [1] - 189:2 prosecuted [1] -189.4 prosecution [1] -30:21 prosecutions [1] -123:18 protect [1] - 87:1 PROTECTED [2] -1:3, 1:4 protected [3] -175:11, 184:1, 193:16 protecting [3] -13:26, 19:26, 65:1 protection [10] -24:29, 48:5, 54:1,

69:23, 71:15, 97:10,

141:2. 157:26.

162:20, 218:19

Protection [20] -20:12, 23:7, 23:10, 24:23, 26:19, 47:22, 54:12, 65:26, 66:25, 68:21, 68:28, 93:11, 109:17, 115:20, 115:22, 188:14, 192:18, 192:21, 192:26, 238:3 protections [1] -141:9 protocol [1] - 222:18 **prove** [1] - 82:20 proved [1] - 38:22 proven [1] - 190:13 proves [1] - 77:20 provide [12] - 22:21, 35:26, 40:17, 76:17, 82:18, 91:10, 115:8, 118:26, 143:1, 151:25, 211:24, 211:28 provided [15] -49:11, 77:13, 96:5, 99:6, 106:15, 123:26, 140:3, 159:18, 160:4, 173:1, 177:24, 178:12, 201:13, 201:15, 201:17 provides [1] - 181:20 providing[7] - 98:10, 98:26, 106:17, 117:11, 129:18, 178:4, 178:18 provision [1] - 16:19 prudent [1] - 92:18 Public [12] - 7:10, 7:17, 11:24, 13:3, 45:6. 53:6. 54:26. 57:4, 69:12, 94:5, 221:15, 223:13 public [40] - 11:27, 14:15, 16:2, 16:19, 22:1, 23:24, 25:22, 26:8, 26:13, 34:26, 43:9, 45:1, 55:9, 56:5, 56:10. 56:27. 68:5. 68:23, 85:8, 92:6, 94:27, 99:6, 102:9, 111:11, 113:4, 117:11, 121:20, 125:13, 130:19, 140:4, 141:22, 141:23, 142:7, 144:2, 144:9, 144:11, 158:16, 186:22, 186:25, 221:17 publicity [1] - 113:6 publicly [6] - 53:26, 54:20, 56:11, 61:23,

94:7, 157:25 publicly.. [1] - 53:19 published [5] -121:23, 121:24, 129:17, 129:20, 201:17 pulled [1] - 130:4 Pulse [8] - 16:18, 120:1, 120:19, 120:20, 200:1, 207:2, 207:17, 213:9 pup [1] - 110:16 Purcell [4] - 166:2, 166:21. 166:23. 239.14 PURCELL [1] - 2:22 purchase [2] - 80:19, 89.7 purpose [10] - 79:23, 86:27, 87:9, 112:29, 124:23, 126:22, 139:11, 183:22, 215:8, 216:12 purse [1] - 11:28 pursue [2] - 11:27, 17:2 pursuit [1] - 43:24 put [45] - 12:16, 13:21, 28:26, 30:14, 32:8, 39:18, 52:15, 55:4, 68:15, 78:3, 88:14, 88:16, 117:1, 124:15, 126:18, 129:4, 133:17, 137:16, 144:2, 144:8, 151:26, 152:5, 154:2, 159:26, 175:12, 176:15, 177:1, 181:17, 184:7, 187:15, 194:8, 198:10, 202:22, 211:1, 213:3, 219:22, 220:10, 220:17, 227:29, 228:6, 228:15, 228:18, 229:3, 230:4, 231:8 puts [1] - 55:19 putting [11] - 94:23, 106:12, 106:20, 118:15, 143:29, 144:21, 202:29, 211:29, 219:12, 230:2, 236:9 puzzle [1] - 230:2 Q

quad [1] - 8:6 quarter [1] - 229:27

quashed [6] -151:21, 189:11, 189:16, 190:5, 190:12, 191:6 quashing [2] -190:17, 222:7 QUAY [3] - 2:12, 3:10, 3:17 query [4] - 18:8, 134:14, 135:10, 152:24 querying [1] - 203:18 questioned [2] -184:19, 213:29 QUESTIONED [2] -4:20, 210:24 questioning [3] -97:4, 99:4, 108:1 questions [22] -95:13, 99:17, 100:3, 108:25, 108:28, 109:4, 111:13, 112:7, 112:17, 141:28, 142:21, 142:25, 174:6, 177:6, 183:8, 183:10, 183:18, 199:20, 200:22, 201:4, 210:22, 231:9 quick [1] - 33:3 quickly [4] - 58:29, 183:20, 183:25, 201:4 quite [19] - 7:9, 96:21, 109:10, 130:27, 136:22, 141:6, 145:7, 174:28, 174:29, 175:5, 183:20, 198:1, 198:8, 198:11, 200:12, 200:14, 222:9, 229:19, 235:25 quotation [2] -53:21, 90:27 quote [3] - 159:2, 184:9, 187:15 quoted [3] - 11:19, 187:16, 219:23

R

Rabbitte [5] - 10:14. 11:2, 11:8, 11:10, 29:10 radio [19] - 6:2, 19:2, 33:19, 68:24, 69:18, 91:25, 128:7, 130:25, 130:27, 131:2, 131:25, 131:28, 132:7, 141:21, 146:20, 160:16,

160:28, 160:29 reading [8] - 7:6, receiving [1] recording [2] refreshing [1] -Radio [1] - 37:29 29:26, 49:9, 98:11, 158:12 148:23, 206:27 58:18 raise [1] - 164:16 103:29, 124:7, recent [1] - 64:27 records [30] - 9:14, refuse [1] - 54:13 raised [13] - 26:9, 141:13, 238:1 recently [3] - 39:28, 9:17. 16:18. 33:26. refused [1] - 15:8 reads [4] - 10:11, 33:29, 34:12, 40:17, 71:16, 89:24, 93:12, 150:1, 162:7 refusing [1] - 21:13 regard [15] - 21:17, 141:1, 158:15, 52:29, 64:23, 123:2 reception [1] - 137:7 46:26, 47:4, 118:22, 173:20, 186:13, ready [2] - 178:7, 133:28, 133:29, recipient [1] - 211:9 32:17, 65:25, 81:21, 201:8, 203:3, 203:6, 194:10 139:5, 145:27, 151:6, 109:9, 115:24, recognise [3] reaffirmed [1] -151:8, 151:15, 209.17 40:23, 42:22, 42:24 117:28, 125:25, 152:17, 152:18, 50:18 165:18, 219:10, raising [2] - 130:19, recollect [46] - 8:8, 203:10 reaffirming [1] - 85:2 155:6, 155:12, 225:22, 227:13, 9:3. 22:12. 22:23. rang [32] - 33:29, realise [2] - 118:5, 22:25, 24:1, 24:6, 155:23, 160:8, 230:17, 230:26, 237:2 161:13, 219:23, 34:10, 34:20, 34:24, 137:16 27:2, 36:16, 42:4, regarding [6] - 38:9, 228:7, 228:8, 228:17, 36:9, 41:20, 41:22, reality [1] - 99:4 42:6, 42:13, 42:21, 55:14, 120:2, 122:10, 46:25, 46:26, 46:27, 43:4, 46:12, 46:22, 229:14 182:9. 203:22 really [19] - 12:8, 47:12, 50:8, 90:18, red [1] - 133:16 24:10, 35:12, 59:5, 47:11, 47:29, 48:6, regards [1] - 100:26 refer [13] - 37:19, 130:1, 134:12, 71:10, 74:2, 124:10, 48:21, 52:13, 69:9, registered [2] -136:29, 137:25, 53:2, 60:10, 64:27, 125:11, 128:29, 69:14, 69:16, 70:5, 165:9, 211:15 139:15, 143:7, 169:22, 183:3. 140:8, 167:28, 73:21, 73:24, 74:3, REGISTRAR[1] - 2:4 145:27, 152:26, 185:13, 199:7, 196:26, 202:19, 76:6, 81:28, 84:26, regular [4] - 38:1, 153:18, 154:15, 102:27, 104:1, 222:10, 222:15, 213:16, 214:3, 214:8, 97:19, 157:20, 223:1 166:17, 167:17, 222:18, 223:29, 216:3, 216:8 109:11, 137:15, regularly [2] -181:26, 195:21, 234:26 realms [1] - 102:10 142:19, 176:9, 146:20, 238:26 200:17, 209:8, 226:7, 176:12, 176:13, referee [1] - 119:9 reason [24] - 31:2, regulations [2] -230.6 48:28. 71:26. 71:28. 177:23, 178:17, reference [11] -114:23, 114:28 37:20, 69:9, 70:25, range [3] - 128:8, 72:2, 83:5, 90:18, 179:20, 220:12, regulator [1] - 33:27 146:21, 214:14 121:2, 122:23, 149:6, 220:16 91:6, 126:16, 133:12, reiterated [1] - 94:21 rank [8] - 31:6, 54:9, recollected [1] -167:29, 185:9, 157:10, 159:15, reiteration [1] - 48:3 107:24, 173:19, 205:15, 206:8, 214:24 161:23, 177:17, related [13] - 7:10, 217:25, 218:11, referenced [1] -197:29, 198:17, recollection [57] -38:2, 56:6, 127:23, 218:26 205:25, 206:5, 8:3, 8:10, 18:11, 24:3, 110:26 157:19, 213:1, 222:3, rarely [1] - 42:21 26:15, 26:25, 34:12, references [1] -220:19, 220:25, 222:5, 228:25, 34:24, 35:8, 36:7, 54:18 rate [1] - 124:19 223:8, 227:24, 231:27, 233:4, referral [1] - 187:2 rather [4] - 69:8, 227:26, 233:8 37:1, 43:21, 45:28, 233:14, 237:27 129:11, 187:12, 213:9 46:2, 46:8, 52:17, referrals [1] - 176:26 reasonable [3] relating [4] - 14:11, 52:18, 73:29, 78:11, **RE** [4] - 4:11, 4:19, 72:11, 221:10, 233:17 referred [20] - 19:21, 17:10, 129:16, 129:19 78:14, 78:23, 81:3, 155:3, 208:15 21:7. 29:1. 65:17. reasonably [7] - 7:5, relation [120] - 13:29, RE-EXAMINED [4] -43:7, 140:7, 147:12, 86:16, 88:22, 91:4, 67:1, 70:26, 97:20, 14:24, 17:23, 18:8, 92:2, 92:5, 128:12, 100:27, 156:13, 4:11, 4:19, 155:3, 183:25, 236:10, 18:10, 25:11, 28:15, 208:15 236:12 128:13, 128:14, 157:25, 165:9, 170:7, 36:29, 40:5, 41:11, 129:15, 140:25, reach [1] - 147:17 reasoning [1] -180:23, 185:4, 42:14, 43:14, 52:26, 142:8, 142:13, 195:25, 201:28, 220:21 reaching [1] - 147:6 55:22, 56:8, 60:16, reasons [3] - 105:7, 143:10, 146:8, 148:6, 211:14, 211:20, reaction [3] - 110:8, 61:3, 62:21, 63:13, 148:9, 158:22, 222:27, 223:19 157:22, 223:21 118:3, 132:4 66:1, 66:11, 80:1, 174:14, 175:18, reassurance [3] referring [11] - 7:24, read [34] - 7:22, 82:13, 83:13, 92:26, 179:12, 179:14, 13:20, 15:16, 18:22, 15:18, 15:19, 34:5, 173:2, 181:7, 194:2 93:7, 93:10, 94:29, 206:6, 215:20, 220:7, 66:8, 93:27, 179:29, 61:8, 81:7, 81:11, reassured [4] -97:10, 100:23, 220:17, 221:22, 196:22, 201:2, 210:6, 94:2, 104:24, 113:9, 166:17, 172:6, 110:16. 113:2. 221:24, 223:18, 236:18 116:19, 122:27, 200:16, 209:8 113:17, 113:27, 226:23, 229:10, 125:7, 141:24, **refers** [3] - 156:16, receipt [1] - 63:29 121:29, 123:7, 229:11, 229:13, 174:22, 185:11 142:14, 149:2, receive [6] - 39:2, 124:20, 125:28, 229:22, 235:22, 149:11, 167:16, reflected [1] - 12:3 125:29, 126:1, 126:2, 86:18, 157:29, 238:27 185:8, 187:26, 178:21, 206:25, reflecting [1] -128:11, 128:26, record [11] - 42:26, 187:27, 197:14, 157:24 238:18 132:9, 132:22, 62:21, 66:9, 81:12, reflects [1] - 31:5 199:14, 203:2, received [15] - 20:27, 134:20, 135:21, 109:24, 125:13, 206:25, 207:11, reforms [2] - 30:14, 136:18, 138:27, 25:14, 39:1, 50:21, 134:4, 148:25, 207:27, 207:28, 52:3, 57:26, 58:1, 140:3, 140:23, 158:16, 160:9, 225:8 208:7, 208:9, 208:22, 64:7, 64:27, 69:28, refrain [1] - 146:29 142:25, 145:1, recorded [2] - 29:9, 236:1, 237:13, 237:14 91:27, 109:6, 157:9, refreshed [1] -145:29, 146:21, 30.6 readily [1] - 137:2 163:11, 225:4 148:10 147:28, 148:20,

102:14 149:5, 149:25, 151:9, 149:23, 161:19 67:10, 183:20 217:27, 218:4, 218:13 158:14, 163:12, remained [1] - 91:6 report [18] - 15:18, respond [3] - 79:24, reveal [2] - 71:23, 163:23, 165:15, remarks [4] - 55:12, 32:8, 111:2, 113:2, 90:25, 158:1 160:21 166:23, 171:1, 121:17, 121:18, revealing [1] -114:18, 144:16, responded [2] -171:17, 173:20, 144.26 121:20, 121:22, 58:29, 149:10 160:17 173:22, 173:24, 121:23, 121:26, remedies [2] - 17:1, response [52] revenue [2] - 165:11, 123:24, 124:23, 173:28, 177:21, 21:23 18:19, 37:12, 38:12, 210:29 128:26, 129:20, 178:10, 178:28, remember [74] - 6:8, 48:18, 57:27, 58:1, revert [1] - 204:1 179:17, 179:18, 167:15, 201:1, 61:3, 62:13, 64:1, 7:5, 8:5, 8:8, 8:26, reverted [1] - 122:5 180:9, 180:19, 181:3, 11:3, 16:8, 18:19, 201:13, 201:15 64:7, 64:16, 64:17, review [6] - 6:24, 181:16, 181:22, 22:24, 22:28, 23:3, reported [2] - 55:1, 64:18, 74:13, 75:7, 37:23, 37:28, 58:17, 182:9, 182:13, 23:16, 23:18, 24:1, 120:26 75:17, 75:25, 77:22, 73:11, 113:15 183:28, 187:10, 26:27, 27:6, 27:15, reporting [5] - 21:11, 83:16, 84:19, 85:22, reviewed [2] - 6:21, 188:8, 190:8, 193:22, 68:10, 118:14, 85:24, 86:20, 86:23, 36:12, 41:25, 41:29, 219:8 198:9, 203:18, 120:10, 189:15 86:26, 86:27, 86:29, 42:2, 42:10, 42:24, revisit [2] - 79:12, 204:28, 206:5, 214:2, 43:6, 48:14, 48:29, reports [2] - 167:9, 87:5, 87:23, 87:26, 227.5 220:17, 221:11, 49:12, 49:22, 50:5, 88:22. 91:7. 91:10. 199:8 rights [3] - 65:1, 223:6, 223:16, 50:12, 50:27, 59:21, 105:25, 106:8, representation [3] -119:10, 120:10 223:23, 228:2, 228:6, 106:28, 115:16, 73:27, 76:4, 77:6, 5:7, 5:13, 112:5 rigours [1] - 65:8 228:19, 228:22, 77:7, 79:21, 80:21, 141:18, 148:28, representations [2] ring [29] - 34:10, 229:9, 230:8, 230:19, 80:27, 80:29, 81:10, 39:23, 39:26 150:29, 157:13, 36:5, 36:13, 36:14, 231:10, 231:15, 158:15, 158:16, 85:3, 85:9, 85:14, representative [1] -44:10, 46:25, 92:18, 232:6, 232:9, 232:25, 92:22, 96:10, 96:12, 159:16, 159:20, 118:27 136:24, 142:17, 232:28, 233:15, 100:19, 102:13, 159:24, 159:25, 143:8, 152:14, 153:3, represented [3] -234:7. 234:12. 236:8. 160:11, 160:20, 103:26, 104:8, 104:9, 98:7, 111:16, 112:9 153:28, 154:10, 237:1, 238:1, 238:5, 160:23, 199:19, 104:10, 105:2, representing [5] -155:28, 166:20, 238:8, 238:24 133:21, 133:22, 219:14 21:27, 21:29, 95:24, 167:14, 172:11, relations [2] - 29:5, 136:26, 137:1, 137:9, responses [2] -112:4, 222:22 174:17, 180:20, 213:21 137:26, 137:27, 161:10, 220:15 reproach [6] - 24:18, 180:24, 181:10, relationship [4] -141:8, 154:16, responsibility [12] -32:22, 44:25, 94:12, 203:14, 209:2, 229:3, 42:16, 89:9, 108:13, 155:25, 161:22, 163:16, 163:17, 94:17, 107:21 229:28, 229:29, 234:16 167:13, 178:20, 164:2, 189:27, reputation [2] -232:13, 233:2 relative [1] - 238:7 195:22, 203:28, 217:29, 218:6, 218:7, 54:16, 54:22 ringing [14] - 36:4, relatively [3] - 30:19, 230:28, 238:12 218:9, 218:14. 36:5, 36:13, 36:16, request [8] - 8:19, 156:25. 194:5 remembered [1] -218:17. 218:19. 72:4, 82:28, 92:20, 52:25, 81:29, 132:5, relaxed [1] - 44:7 49:14 218:23 121:27, 128:23, 137:1, 137:26, relay [1] - 97:3 remind [1] - 206:23 rest [3] - 28:2, 29:6, 129:15, 199:12 153:19, 154:25, relayed [5] - 136:16, reminded [1] - 104:1 233:1 required [2] - 5:25, 155:21, 227:18, reminder [1] -136:17, 143:10, restricted [2] -118:23 231:12 153:26, 166:26 161:16 207:1, 207:17 rings [2] - 229:25, reserve [2] - 115:3, relaying [1] - 82:23 restricting [1] remits [1] - 117:25 115:24 229:27 release [1] - 125:16 repeat [10] - 32:20, 120:20 RIVERSIDE [1] resisting [2] relevance [5] - 60:8, 39:23, 44:2, 44:12, result [5] - 30:11, 226:21, 226:23 3.16 70:7, 123:22, 219:5, 48:24, 84:28, 89:22, 55:8, 81:5, 121:15, resolution [2] -Road [15] - 163:1, 166:5 237:23 92:23, 105:12, 143:27 163:10, 163:15, 150:5, 150:8 relevant [15] - 10:6, repeated [1] - 102:28 **RESUMED** [2] - 5:1, RESOLUTIONS [1] -163:26, 169:2, 39:9, 40:8, 40:22, repeatedly [1] -177:16, 184:13, 51:19, 60:19, 63:8, 171:29 retain [1] - 149:2 187:19, 190:14, resonated [1] -99:24, 100:2, 100:3, repeating [2] - 32:2, retained [3] - 77:25, 193:9, 194:3, 211:23, 232:16 113:18, 119:17, 148:13, 149:3 33:13 211:25, 211:27, resources [1] - 10:16 retired [7] - 112:19, 123:2, 126:18, 139:28 replied [6] - 39:10, 211:28 respect [6] - 66:4, reliable [1] - 125:26 118:24, 119:24, 58:9, 79:27, 149:8, road [7] - 115:1, 123:10, 147:2, 147:6, relied [1] - 91:29 161:16, 196:15 125:22, 217:12, 174:23, 174:26, 156:24, 158:17 relook [1] - 227:5 217:15, 218:23 replies [1] - 220:12 175:25, 176:29, respected [3] reply [17] - 58:11, rely [2] - 97:2, retrieve [1] - 46:15 212:3, 212:7 34:15, 133:11, 172:6 117:10 retrieved [1] - 74:6 58:12, 58:13, 58:14, **ROAD**[1] - 3:2 respectful [2] relying [4] - 9:28, 63:10, 67:7, 73:2, return [3] - 58:28, roads [1] - 211:1 20:10, 126:20 108:12, 108:13, 118:5 75:20, 80:4, 81:6, 92:7, 208:12 Roadwatch [1] respectfully [2] remade [1] - 192:25 81:13, 81:14, 105:20, returned [5] -184:19 99:24, 132:21 105:21, 106:7, remain [2] - 96:19, respects [3] - 13:5, 120:27, 162:25, robbery [1] - 36:12

robust [1] - 200:14 163:10, 163:15, rocky [1] - 117:12 163:26, 169:2, ROGERSON'S [1] -177:16, 184:14, 187:20, 190:14, 3:17 193:9, 194:3, 211:23, **role** [11] - 12:29, 211:25, 211:27, 112:22, 112:24, 211:28 125:29, 129:1, 163:3, 163:10, 168:27, sat [1] - 18:9 satisfied [5] - 21:23, 177:15, 193:8, 212:18 81:11, 165:6, 180:22, room [3] - 49:9, 186:19, 208:12 235:25 rosa [1] - 94:26 **Saturday** [12] - 9:15, 38:3, 38:6, 39:15, round [1] - 129:12 41:12, 41:13, 41:28, rounds [3] - 209:1, 42:27, 102:18, 111:8, 209:6, 209:7 135:18, 221:21 routine [4] - 173:5, save [2] - 66:29, 174:23, 213:10, 144:23 238:10 saw [8] - 7:23, 40:24, row [3] - 7:16, 8:17, 45:11, 78:25, 78:26, 23:12 78:28, 107:15, 215:28 RSA [5] - 179:8, 189:11, 191:8, **SC** [11] - 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 191:19, 191:23 2:15, 2:22, 2:27, 3:1, **RTÉ** [20] - 6:2, 9:10, 38:25, 40:10, 49:6, 3.4 scenario [1] - 129:27 52:6, 52:7, 52:10, schedule [1] - 77:2 53:9, 53:11, 54:20, scheduled [4] -54:25, 55:4, 55:5, 169:9, 190:27, 239:9, 55:9, 55:14, 59:13, 239:10 229:25, 231:23 school [1] - 156:9 RTé [2] - 37:29, 53:2 rTé's [1] - 53:14 science [1] - 162:17 rugby [3] - 156:5, screen [3] - 5:25, 114:7. 223:15 156:8, 237:3 scroll [2] - 119:16, **ruled** [1] - 26:29 122:27 ruling [2] - 138:14, SDU [4] - 217:27, 138:15 218:5, 218:13, 218:15 rumour [7] - 208:25, Seamus [1] - 239:12 208:26, 208:29, SEAN [1] - 2:11 209:19. 209:22. 209:24, 234:14 SEANAD[1] - 1:6 rumours [6] - 93:25, search [2] - 148:13, 93:29, 208:19, 234:5, 161:13 234:7, 234:10 searches [1] -148:15 **run** [1] - 169:3 rung [4] - 136:21, searching [1] -136:27, 137:17, 120:19 232:12 Second [1] - 61:26 rushing [1] - 72:7 second [30] - 8:4, 48:5. 49:23. 58:14. 59:7, 60:9, 62:5, S 101:4, 120:17, 120:28, 122:28, safeguarding [1] -153:26, 178:1, 179:5, 65:1 179:22, 181:7, 182:1, 189:17, 189:24,

212:20, 216:4, 221:25 second-last [1] -122:28 Second-Named [1] -61.26 secondly [5] - 30:14, 112:9, 160:9, 206:20, 227:14 seconds [8] - 51:25, 223:26, 224:6. 224:22, 224:24, 224:29, 225:6, 229:7 Secretary [3] -166:2, 166:20, 200:17 secretary [6] - 73:14, 80:12, 85:5, 105:9, 158:4, 239:14 section [3] - 118:5, 170:14, 171:6 security [3] - 117:25, 181:10, 212:25 Security [20] -120:13, 170:14, 171:5, 171:12, 179:20, 180:4, 180:7, 182:22, 182:24, 193:3, 194:22, 194:25, 196:9, 196:11, 196:15, 196:18, 213:3, 213:8, 213:11, 213:24 **see** [67] - 5:23, 7:9, 10:9, 11:13, 18:5, 18:21, 24:22, 32:14, 32:18, 32:20, 36:5, 36:9, 40:7, 48:15, 54:18, 56:11, 56:13, 59:9, 60:18, 60:25, 74:24, 82:2, 82:6, 83:19, 84:29, 89:17, 90:23, 92:20, 94:6, 94:15, 97:2, 103:6, 119:5, 130:23, 131:23, 132:12, 148:13, 157:7, 157:10, 176:7, 177:21, 178:3, 178:8, 179:9, 180:9, 181:15, 182:7, 182:26, 183:5, 184:5, 192:7, 197:2, 215:8, 216:14, 222:23, 223:27, 224:2, 224:7, 224:11, 224:14, 224:18, 224:26, 224:29, 226:12, 229:14, 233:6, 234:29 seeing [4] - 78:23, 79:8, 85:11, 86:16

seeking [6] - 44:10, 48:10, 48:21, 89:18, 94:6, 189:2 seem [11] - 17:26, 41.7 41.26 44.1 62:25, 90:11, 105:5, 110:16, 125:18, 194:12, 210:27 self [1] - 65:20 semi [1] - 147:23 semi-State [1] -147:23 send [7] - 60:29, 71:6, 78:15, 106:3, 106:29. 160:10. 238:16 sending [2] - 86:27, 88:21 senior [14] - 30:19, 43:25, 147:6, 147:17, 157:2, 170:5, 170:9, 179:26, 184:17, 184:22, 185:10, 187:23, 187:28, 213:23 sense [13] - 7:16, 61:24, 100:9, 112:8, 115:25, 119:8, 126:9, 137:4, 139:11, 145:23, 156:20, 197:4, 225:9 sensitive [8] - 68:22, 115:8. 120:2. 120:20. 125:16, 142:11, 145:4, 223:5 sensitivity [1] -222.17 sent [43] - 30:13, 30:19, 32:6, 33:5, 49:5, 57:19, 57:28, 60:27, 64:1, 64:12, 67:8, 71:20, 73:15, 74:13, 74:14, 74:18, 79:26, 82:8, 85:25, 87:6, 90:24, 139:5, 149:23, 157:11, 157:12, 157:16, 158:20, 165:10, 165:12, 184:17, 187:23, 188:15, 199:26, 199:29, 206:21, 206:24, 207:10, 207:12, 208:6, 208:8, 208:17, 238:10 sentence [1] - 103:8 separate [4] -143:14, 168:11, 181:4. 192:21 sequence [4] - 58:5,

62:12, 79:8, 104:16 Sergeant [231] -14:16, 16:24, 18:12, 19:8, 22:7, 23:2, 23:3, 24:4. 24:28. 25:10. 34:2, 34:26, 35:2, 36:17, 42:8, 42:14, 43:9. 43:28. 45:8. 45:20, 45:24, 47:20, 49:29, 52:16, 52:25, 55:26, 56:9, 56:11, 60:25, 60:26, 62:14, 64:11, 64:16, 71:13, 71:20, 71:29, 72:29, 74:13, 75:17, 75:25, 79:24, 81:6, 81:22, 82:3, 83:12, 86:21, 86:23, 86:26, 87:6, 89:21, 90:9, 90:19, 93:7, 93:25, 95:24, 97:14, 97:20, 99:6, 99:29, 100:24, 102:2, 102:21, 102:23, 102:24, 106:7, 109:28. 114:12. 116:13, 119:29, 120:4, 120:25, 121:11, 121:14, 122:1, 122:4, 122:7. 122:8, 122:13, 123:5, 123:25, 124:11, 124:21, 125:14, 129:26, 129:27, 131:19, 131:20, 131:21, 132:11, 133:2, 140:11, 140:20, 141:10, 141:15, 143:6, 143:11, 143:15, 143:28, 144:9, 144:22, 144:27, 145:2, 146:6, 146:11, 150:29, 159:16, 159:17, 159:26, 160:14, 160:20, 164:27, 164:28, 165:3, 166:5, 166:9, 166:11, 166:17, 166:23, 166:29, 167:2, 169:26, 170:4, 170:8, 170:23, 171:4, 171:8, 171:17, 171:28, 173:17, 173:20, 173:24, 173:28, 174:14, 175:3, 175:6, 175:9, 175:11, 175:17, 175:27, 175:28, 175:29, 176:5, 176:18, 179:28, 180:3, 180:11,

safeguarding [1] 65:1
safety [7] - 174:23,
174:26, 175:25,
176:29, 211:3, 212:3,
212:7
Safety [15] - 163:2,

189:28, 189:29,

191:29, 194:12,

196:6, 198:10,

198:11, 207:23,

seek [1] - 129:15

180:15, 180:18, services [1] - 162:23 72:11, 80:28, 82:19, six [4] - 40:29, 85:12, 19:20, 20:1, 20:18, 180:20, 181:1, 181:5, serving [8] - 35:23, 82:24, 109:14, 221:29, 235:2 22:29, 27:18, 27:21, 181:16, 181:18, 114:20, 118:25, 109:28, 110:5, **skip** [1] - 10:5 34:18, 42:13, 43:17, 131:14, 133:6, 143:6, 181:26, 182:14, 45:24, 46:29, 48:17, 119:11, 144:24, slanderous [1] -182:21, 183:29, 145:3, 163:22, 218:25 146:10, 152:11, 50:14, 51:22, 60:11, 55:12 184:8, 184:9, 184:26, 152:19, 155:9, slightly [7] - 19:8, 61:10, 67:9, 67:24, set [9] - 21:21, 23:1, 184:29, 185:5, 30:1, 31:22, 56:21, 155:15, 160:10, 71:27, 73:21, 75:3, 46:11, 102:29, 185:26, 185:28, 161:6, 225:12, 76:21, 77:17, 79:14, 59:13, 63:9, 119:22, 104:16, 119:6, 186:4, 186:9, 186:12, 225:16, 226:18, 92:28, 98:17, 99:20, 191.1 138:19, 222:12 186:27, 187:14, 232:18 108:23, 109:20, SMITHFIELD [1] sets [1] - 64:20 187:16, 188:1, setting [1] - 8:12 showed [1] - 80:29 111:14, 118:24, 188:14, 189:3, 189:6, 121:8, 123:2, 124:6, settled [1] - 59:19 **showing** [3] - 9:25, so-called [1] -189:21, 189:25, 124:7, 130:6, 133:3, 74.6 229.5 seven [1] - 224:24 114:19 134:2, 134:6, 134:28, 191:18, 191:21, shown [5] - 81:4, several [6] - 39:20, **so..** [2] - 52:19, 192:2, 192:4, 193:23, 81:7, 81:11, 104:27, 150:9, 152:29, 48:25, 62:23, 92:13, 135:26 194:21, 195:12, 156:25, 159:22, 94:21, 148:15 149.1 social [11] - 8:12, 196:2, 196:8, 196:14, 159:27, 160:10, **shows** [1] - 160:12 127:15, 132:8, sex [2] - 135:3, 162:29, 167:22, 198:9, 199:7, 199:17, shut [1] - 234:19 208:26 139:19, 157:21, 199:20, 199:26, 168:8, 168:26, shy [1] - 229:9 162:17, 162:20, sexual [5] - 93:12, 199:27, 200:5, 169:22, 170:23, sick [2] - 120:26, 100:28, 145:10, 162:21, 162:23, 200:19, 200:20, 172:21, 172:26, 120:27 234:6, 234:10 168:20, 221:13 200:27, 201:3, 201:7, 174:21, 182:15, **SEÁN** [1] - 3:15 side [7] - 5:24, 92:25, socially [2] - 147:11, 201:15, 201:16, 186:2, 187:7, 187:14, Seán [1] - 5:10 116:5, 116:13, 156:11 201:20, 201:24. 126:17, 171:12. 192:20, 195:3, 198:4, SGT [1] - 2:9 **society** [2] - 66:14, 201:28, 203:4. 202:19, 204:16, 173:13 212.19 **shadow** [1] - 41:20 203:10, 203:19, 207:9, 209:29, 214:3, sight [4] - 60:4, sold [1] - 110:16 **shall** [1] - 211:25 204:12, 204:20, 214:8, 235:29, 236:2, 200:9, 201:22, 215:27 sole [1] - 86:4 **SHANE** [1] - 2:14 204:24, 204:28, 236:19. 236:21 sign [1] - 107:4 **shape** [7] - 20:8, SOLE [2] - 1:12, 2:2 205:24, 205:27, **Sorry** [1] - 100:22 signed [2] - 55:19, 22:8, 38:27, 40:12, solely [1] - 213:2 206:10, 206:15, sort [18] - 6:28, 124:1 69:21, 72:25, 160:2 solicitor [14] - 5:27, 206:21, 207:11, 11:12, 14:11, 16:17, significance [3] -40:2, 44:9, 44:16, shared [1] - 186:9 208:20, 209:2, 209:8, 17:10, 22:13, 23:24, 105:6, 191:5, 220:11 89:6, 105:23, 106:21, Shatter [14] - 15:12, 209:12. 209:20. 36:21, 49:10, 73:13, significant [5] -106:29, 107:2, 15:19, 21:12, 32:25, 211:6, 213:7, 216:22, 106:28. 110:13. 49:13, 109:19, 190:9, 108:26, 110:23, 98:17, 98:24, 110:27, 228:13, 234:3, 234:5, 111:3, 112:29, 190:14 138:19, 138:23, 113:5, 165:26, 166:8, 238:21 131:25, 140:13, similar [3] - 24:28, 219:25 166:13, 166:22, sergeant [11] -142:22, 156:20 108:17, 123:12 SOLICITOR[1] - 2:7 200:12, 210:14 13:13, 28:2, 29:7, sorted [1] - 101:13 simple [2] - 24:7, **solicitor's** [1] - 107:3 Shatter's [1] - 43:11 42:11, 53:5, 54:9, sought [2] - 60:21, 85:11 SOLICITOR'S [2] sheet [1] - 10:29 94:11, 118:25, simply [15] - 8:4, 2:19. 2:23 SHIP [2] - 2:20, 2:25 152:12, 152:22, souls [1] - 236:18 29:22, 29:25, 39:2, solicitors [4] - 40:7, shock [1] - 81:16 217:25 sound [1] - 30:23 82:26, 98:22, 110:20, 60:18, 222:20, 222:22 shocked [2] - 50:6, series [2] - 168:5, **sounding** [3] - 29:11, 81.25 130:22, 131:28, SOLICITORS [5] -237:18 33.23 36.15 132:23, 132:26, shop [1] - 197:20 2:28, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12, serious [14] - 12:8, source [4] - 131:26, 133:5, 191:15, 201:6, 3:20 short [8] - 85:13, 33:7. 54:21. 60:26. 141:19, 154:3, 186:28 219:12 someone [5] - 28:12, 109:4, 128:29, 65:15, 81:29, 115:12, sources [5] - 96:22, sincerely [1] - 67:3 34:4, 88:1, 146:23, 158:12, 161:25, 142:6, 165:7, 179:26, 101:22, 110:14, singing [1] - 10:29 197:2 176:24, 230:11, 191:25, 196:7, 111:6, 132:16 singular [1] - 105:6 sometime [1] - 37:24 235:24 196:16, 212:2 southern [1] - 218:6 SIR [1] - 3:17 shortly [6] - 10:20, sometimes [2] seriously [6] speaker [1] - 126:11 sit [1] - 5:8 48:23, 88:28 184:17, 187:23, 101:27, 115:9, 118:2, speaking [25] sitting [5] - 8:16, somewhat [3] -188:18, 194:6, 224:22 180:1, 190:21, 229:16 21:27, 42:2, 47:14, 13:8, 27:23, 28:25, 108:11, 108:16, 214:3 Show [1] - 94:27 seriousness [2] -62:26, 94:7, 95:10, 87:29 somewhere [1] show [40] - 9:17, 170:17, 213:26 107:2, 113:18, 114:2, situation [12] -33:6, 33:25, 33:26, 156.1 servants [1] - 211:11 114:4, 114:16, 119:1, 11:29, 36:10, 66:13, **son** [3] - 28:2, 156:8, 33:29, 37:23, 37:29, service [4] - 54:11, 130:18, 137:18, 117:17, 118:3, 237:7 38:4, 38:20, 39:16, 186:25, 210:1, 231:7 141:7, 142:16, 133:10, 146:6, 146:7, 39:24, 40:29, 41:12, son's [1] - 237:3 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:30 155:18, 158:11, 169:29, 170:28, 41:24, 45:13, 53:5, sorry [77] - 5:10, **Services** [1] - 1:25 158:19, 165:6, 191:11, 220:25 54:15, 61:27, 68:4, 15:7, 16:20, 18:15,

166:11, 196:23, 167:10, 168:25, 55:9, 55:12, 55:15, 3:20 sued [4] - 39:27, 86:3, 105:8, 110:7 200:26, 229:29, 178:5, 194:18, 196:1, 94:18, 135:23, 219:5, street [2] - 197:20, 237:18 196.4 238:10 217:26 suffered [2] - 28:7, **Station** [1] - 145:28 Street [6] - 168:27, **Special** [3] - 35:16, stamped [2] - 57:14, 236:27 217:23, 222:13 57:17 station [10] - 18:6, 169:10. 177:19. sufficiently [1] special [3] - 165:29, 214:20, 214:22, stance [5] - 18:1, 29:7, 53:9, 188:27, 184:21 213:8, 213:10 21:4, 103:16, 220:3, 215:13, 217:22, 214:25 suggest [13] - 16:13, 220:5 strike [5] - 105:28, specific [16] -217:26, 218:4, 16:14, 72:26, 109:12, 218:21, 223:7 102:13, 109:21, stand [6] - 23:24, 106:1 106:11 127:28, 128:12, 126:22, 130:19, 73:5, 105:6, 187:3, statistics [1] -106:22, 106:24 130:23, 132:21, 134:25, 141:10, 213:1 117:11 strokes [1] - 71:12 214:10, 224:13, 167:13, 169:21, stand-off [1] - 23:24 status [1] - 180:8 strong [9] - 65:7, 228:17, 230:21 170:9, 173:22, 194:8, standalone [1] statutory [5] -69:15, 81:8, 89:25, suggested [16] -195:10, 195:23, 163:15, 163:16, 180:5 89:28, 90:2, 128:21, 17:16, 17:17, 33:9, 204:10, 222:2, 223:3 165:13, 190:16, 128:28, 147:12 45:27, 67:21, 68:14, standards [1] specifically [14] -114:25 211:28 strongly [3] - 21:10, 68:26, 73:12, 87:17, 16:3, 23:14, 23:15, standing [3] - 69:2, stay [2] - 49:23, 69:13, 105:11 88:6, 139:23, 147:5, 23:16, 47:11, 93:28, 149:29. 206:15. 73:4, 110:23 49:27 struck [1] - 189:2 132:17, 140:8, stayed [1] - 49:24 227:8, 228:7 star.. [1] - 17:12 structures [1] -140:14, 141:4, stark [1] - 196:27 staying [1] - 133:13 suggesting [18] -178:27 142:18, 172:17, 13:6, 13:16, 14:23, start [11] - 10:24, steer [5] - 36:28, stuck [1] - 50:16 179:18, 187:15 45:5, 58:17, 85:16, 152:13, 152:28, studied [1] - 88:27 30:16, 34:4, 83:26, specifics [5] - 25:13, 106:16, 107:6, 86:7, 112:26, 117:18, 153:21, 154:18 studio [2] - 49:26, 142:18, 234:11, 114:29, 125:6, steer" [1] - 154:23 127:20, 136:1, 160:12 110:6 234:15, 234:17 started [7] - 45:8, 127:10, 130:4, steering [1] - 160:5 **stuff** [4] - 12:18, **speed** [1] - 86:7 106:6, 141:7, 146:8, stem [1] - 155:14 141:21, 141:22, 131:24, 132:25, 140:1, 141:14, speeding [1] -168:17, 177:19, 179:7 stenographic [1] -215:16 225:23 144:29, 206:14 starts [3] - 49:8, sub [1] - 94:26 speedy [3] - 58:27, suggestion[8] - 9:6, 119:18, 220:5 STENOGRAPHY[1] subject [7] - 68:4, 58:28, 151:11 32:2, 32:14, 37:7, **STATE** [2] - 2:19, 75:13, 97:12, 114:22, - 1:30 spent [2] - 98:25, 70:17, 188:7, 226:21, 176:19, 177:2, 178:20 stenography [1] -226:24 212:4 State [5] - 34:7, 1.25 submit [2] - 178:7, suggestions [2] spoken [14] - 9:11. 147:23, 165:12, step [2] - 22:26, 194:10 140:10, 141:13 9:13, 19:5, 42:28, 216:5, 231:7 114:25 submitted [2] -64:29, 93:1, 94:27, suggestive[1] state [4] - 13:18, Stepaside [1] - 223:7 123:25, 178:11 160:23 104:29, 135:13, 49:20, 65:29, 200:24 stick [3] - 69:7, subsequent [11] -135:14, 146:25, suing [2] - 40:10, 103:20, 147:29, statement [51] -232:14, 237:21 173:9, 201:14, 209:12 59:13 5:20, 5:23, 7:29, 44:6, 169:16, 203:12, still [14] - 35:23, summary [2] - 40:22, spokesman [1] -44:26, 45:26, 70:23, 43:27, 52:23, 72:3, 219:4, 219:20, 220:8, 32:16 217:18 73:8, 81:15, 84:9, 221:21, 224:23, 72:23, 72:27, 73:4, spoon [6] - 20:15, **Sunday** [16] - 6:3, 88:16, 99:28, 107:10, 135:25, 153:5, 228:24, 235:10 6:28, 9:11, 10:18, 26:3, 26:12, 26:21, 119:13, 119:23, 161:20, 167:18, subsequently [23] -54:3, 54:14 41:24, 53:3, 56:3, 121:7, 124:1, 135:24, 226:10, 226:21, 231:7 8:26, 38:20, 39:25, sports [1] - 146:24 102:17, 102:19, 156:3, 157:5, 160:2, 72:18, 82:19, 82:23, **stood** [4] - 21:16, spread [1] - 186:20 129:26, 139:4, 161:12, 162:6, 91:12, 92:8, 98:29, 103:5, 166:19, 175:18 221:22, 226:14, **SQUARE**[1] - 3:9 167:28, 183:21, STOOD [1] - 101:11 121:20, 123:7, **squaring** [1] - 164:6 231:12, 231:16, 233:3 184:1, 184:7, 184:10, 125:13, 139:6, stop [3] - 89:13, **SUNLIGHT** [1] - 2:29 185:27, 187:12, squashed [2] -194:24, 200:1 158:10, 162:20, superintendent [20] 17:16, 66:10 187:13, 188:29, 163:27, 189:21, stopping [1] - 212:9 staff [1] - 148:16 190:21, 190:22, - 104:23, 120:5, 190:1, 193:9, 204:2, stories [1] - 17:11 191:2, 199:7, 199:10, 121:4, 121:10, stage [33] - 5:24, 226:2, 238:1 story [4] - 36:17, 199:13, 219:4, 122:20, 123:14, 15:8, 16:8, 17:28, substantiated [1] -36:22, 146:11, 216:3 181:23, 188:22, 18:9, 24:19, 43:24, 219:13, 219:16, 116.1 straight [6] - 40:25, 219:24, 220:4, 228:4, 216:5, 217:15, 44:25, 47:10, 49:7, substantive [1] -51:15, 51:17, 127:21, 218:11, 218:14. 52:18, 59:3, 59:12, 232:10, 237:24, 164:18, 166:15 237:27, 238:14, 218:20, 218:27, 60:28, 72:3, 72:8, subversive [3] **strange** [5] - 18:16, 238:15, 238:22 229:1, 233:29, 234:2, 72:27, 76:23, 83:15, 218:16, 222:21, 18:18, 18:20, 96:17, 84:1, 84:21, 85:27, statements [13] -238:2, 238:5, 238:13 238:24 96:23 Superintendent [98] 88:6, 93:17, 103:26, 45:11, 53:10, 53:12, subversives [1] -STREET [6] - 2:20, - 42:3, 42:4, 42:8, 146:17, 150:16, 54:6, 54:25, 55:3, 35:16 2:25, 2:29, 3:6, 3:13,

42:12, 42:13, 42:17, 152:24, 152:25, 173:22, 180:29, 38:9, 38:22, 41:9, terms [28] - 8:23, 73:7, 73:13, 73:22, 210:26, 221:14, 235:6 41:11, 44:24, 54:9, 152:26, 153:2, 13:25, 15:4, 19:25, 74:4, 74:18, 76:3, **supposed** [1] - 30:25 56:21, 61:28, 65:6, 153:12, 153:14, 58:5, 69:15, 72:4, 76:7, 77:14, 78:12, **SUPREME** [2] - 1:13, 65:11, 65:18, 66:7, 153:18, 167:20, 94:3, 100:3, 108:5, 78:19, 79:1, 79:4, 2.3 66:11, 66:19, 88:25, 168:6, 168:10, 169:1, 110:15, 113:19, 89:2, 89:5, 95:4, 79:17, 80:2, 80:9, 169:7, 169:17, 172:8, SUPT [1] - 2:27 114:11, 115:4, 83:21, 83:27, 84:1, 95:11, 97:25, 98:5, 173:29, 177:12, 125:13, 125:20, surmised [1] -84:22, 88:15, 89:16, 98:12, 108:4, 112:16, 177:13, 177:24, 141:8, 150:7, 150:8, 205:12 90:3, 90:27, 91:3, 114:21, 114:25, 179:18, 181:3, 181:8, 150:10, 177:22, surprise [3] - 52:13, 92:19, 99:16, 99:22, 115:5, 115:27, 181:20, 181:22, 178:28, 179:11, 88:13 138:19 100:15, 100:23, surprised [2] - 34:4, 117:18, 118:11, 182:1, 182:10, 193:2, 179:24, 183:2, 191:9, 120:4, 123:6, 125:21, 194:5, 195:6, 195:11, 103:21, 103:28, 152:18 196:7, 234:29 112:19, 112:20, 128:4, 129:11, 195:29, 196:22, Terrace [1] - 217:22 surprising [1] -121:7, 125:23, 126:5, 145:22, 147:13, 198:18, 202:8, terribly [2] - 5:10, 101:21 156:26, 157:20, 133:19, 134:18, 203:11, 203:13, 139:4 surrogate [1] - 32:16 163:22, 164:18, 135:1, 135:18, 203:22, 204:11, terrorism [2] surrounding [3] -135:19, 136:16, 169:3, 170:5, 170:10, 204:17, 212:28, 212:25, 213:18 113:6, 114:2, 116:17 137:3, 148:29, 173:13, 175:26, 213:28, 214:28, text [23] - 46:11, suspect [2] - 210:13, 152:23, 152:24, 183:17, 186:24, 234:24 46:13, 46:15, 46:22, 210:19 152:25, 152:26, 192:22, 196:7, Taylor's [5] - 155:6, 46:23, 46:28, 46:29, suspended [7] -153:2, 153:12, 196:10, 209:5, 155:15, 169:29, 47:9, 49:5, 49:10, 169:19, 178:2, 153:14, 153:18, 217:12, 217:19, 193:16, 197:28 73:15, 73:17, 73:28, 198:19, 198:24, 217:20, 218:26, 234:5 155:6, 155:15, 158:3, **TD**[1] - 54:15 75:22, 79:3, 83:19, 202:15, 213:28, 158:7, 167:20, 168:6, **TDs** [5] - 25:22, 83:24, 139:5, 167:3, 215:12 26:26, 54:3, 57:9, 169:1. 169:7. 169:17. T 167:15, 178:22, suspension [9] -169:29, 172:8, 71:18 180:20, 224:22 169:29. 170:29. 173:29, 177:11, tea [4] - 169:13, texted [2] - 169:12, 179:6, 182:4, 194:14, table [1] - 208:11 177:13, 177:24, 169:24, 178:23, 200:4 202:16, 202:25, tachographs [4] -179:18, 181:3, 181:8, 216:12 texts [4] - 46:17, 202:26, 215:3 185:24, 205:14, 181:20, 181:22, team [9] - 40:13, 47:3, 74:1, 151:15 swear [1] - 81:3 206:6, 206:10 182:1, 182:10, 193:2, 68:8, 122:14, 123:21, thanked [2] - 85:28, sweep [1] - 65:15 Taoiseach [2] -193:16, 194:5, 195:6, 150:21, 151:4, 156:9, 151:11 SWORN [3] - 5:17, 209:18, 211:12 195:11. 195:29. 174:26, 201:20 thankful [1] - 151:16 162:11, 217:9 Taoiseach's [3] -196:22, 197:28, teased [1] - 117:13 thanking [2] - 58:26, sympathy [1] -208:22, 209:13, 210:5 198:18, 202:8, technology [1] -161:23 216:12 tape [1] - 206:27 203:11, 203:13, 193:1 that'd [1] - 131:27 synopsis [1] -**TARA**[1] - 2:27 203:22, 204:11, telephone [14] -THE [17] - 1:4, 1:8, 162.14 Tara [2] - 177:10, 204:17, 212:28, 25:14, 39:9, 47:4, 1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6, system [32] - 68:10, 234:23 214:28, 234:24 113:14, 127:15, 2:14, 4:20, 5:1, 68:13, 117:14, task [1] - 37:29 supplemental [1] -127:26, 134:4, 101:11, 111:22, 163:18, 163:24, tasked [1] - 190:15 160.1 158:11, 167:23, 112:1, 162:3, 210:24, 164:12, 165:1, tax [1] - 18:7 supplied [2] -172:15, 228:6, 228:8, 217:3, 239:6, 239:17 165:16, 165:19, taxi [2] - 33:27, 33:28 115:21, 228:20 235:21, 235:24 themselves [2] -171:7, 171:9, 174:4, **TAYLOR**[2] - 2:27, support [11] - 27:27, telephoned [4] -29:13, 176:23 179:19, 180:5, 27:29, 29:20, 97:7, 34:13, 133:26. **THEN** [6] - 101:11, 180:11, 180:12, **Taylor** [79] - 42:3, 128:3. 151:17. 139:17, 166:5 162:3, 210:24, 217:3, 182:10, 182:15, 166:29, 167:1, 42:4, 42:8, 42:11, telephoning[1] -239:6. 239:17 186:14, 193:12, 186:16, 223:12, 42:12, 42:13, 42:17, 81:17 then-chairman [2] -193:18, 196:17, 99:16, 99:22, 100:15, 234:19 television[1] -174:25, 186:6 209:7, 212:6, 212:23, 100:23, 133:19, supported [1] -146:20 then-213:1, 213:3, 213:4, 133:23, 133:25, 103:16 ten [2] - 45:14, 46:12 213:9, 213:10, Commissioner [6] supporting[1]-134:5, 134:11, tend [3] - 128:6, 23:21, 61:28, 119:28, 213:11, 213:13 134:13, 134:18, 237:4 147:21, 154:22 Síochana [1] - 98:6 172:11, 172:29, 135:1, 135:11, supportive [1] tendency [2] - 48:23, Síochána [77] - 7:17, 174:28 135:13, 135:14, 100:6 131:5 12:1, 12:5, 12:7, 12:9, then-Minister [2] -135:18, 135:19, suppose [15] tenor [1] - 97:17 165:21, 209:18 13:1, 16:16, 16:29, 136:4, 136:6, 136:11, 11:21, 17:5, 32:28, tense [4] - 196:23, theoretical [1] -20:22, 27:19, 28:17, 136:15. 136:17. 59:5, 71:23, 76:10, 198:28, 199:2, 205:17 105.4 29:20, 29:24, 30:20, 137:3, 137:13, 108:16, 109:4, 31:7, 31:8, 34:6, terminations [1] thereafter [3] - 17:2, 137:17, 137:24, 109:12, 124:5, 34:15, 35:14, 38:5, 123:10 21:23, 214:1 138:12, 152:23,

therefore [6] - 44:25, 89:14, 91:28, 104:3, 133:10, 141:26 thesis [28] - 168:19, 168:21, 168:28, 169:14, 177:25, 178:4, 178:9, 178:11, 178:12, 178:16, 178:18, 178:21, 178:25, 178:29, 181:20, 182:3, 194:10, 197:1, 197:2, 197:8, 197:9, 197:14, 197:17, 197:26 thinking [5] - 69:22, 167:23, 168:24, 211:3, 227:24 thinks [1] - 95:9 third [19] - 25:12, 26:23, 67:17, 70:10, 75:19, 115:8, 120:1, 120:19, 123:20, 142:11, 160:1, 160:27, 182:2, 194:12, 196:6, 198:10. 198:11. 203:2, 213:27 thirdly [1] - 160:13 thoroughly [3] -31:17, 31:22, 95:15 threat [1] - 105:7 threatening [1] -143:18 three [34] - 16:9, 17:8, 19:14, 22:6, 22:15, 30:12, 34:26, 35:1, 40:29, 42:19, 44:23, 53:28, 63:1, 75:22, 96:12, 97:16, 97:28, 98:17, 98:25, 104:29, 107:16, 108:27, 123:8, 123:11, 151:14, 168:11, 171:21, 177:17, 190:7, 192:17, 194:4, 197:3, 236:16, 238:15 throughout [3] -186:24, 186:25 throw [2] - 50:26, 155:27 thrust [2] - 169:28, 215:4 THURSDAY [2] -1:18. 5:1 Thursday [1] -113:20 tickets [1] - 225:23 time-line [2] - 179:7,

179:10

timeframe [3] -197:27, 198:2, 198:21 today [11] - 10:25, 10:27, 12:3, 47:2, 148:17, 149:16, 150:25, 207:23, 208:23, 228:6, 239:9 together [6] -118:26, 157:13, 202:22, 230:2, 230:4, tolerated [1] - 118:12 tomorrow [1] -239:10 tone [5] - 145:1, 184:21, 185:10, 186:5, 202:5 too.. [1] - 30:4 took [29] - 8:25, 24:14, 26:13, 37:24, 69:26, 78:12, 118:27, 132:26, 158:10, 163:29, 165:4, 168:21, 172:10, 173:6, 177:18, 178:1, 182:5, 188:26, 189:25, 192:23, 197:6, 199:2, 211:14, 213:19, 213:25, 217:23, 218:22, 235:7, 238:11 top [13] - 11:12, 18:21, 18:22, 31:19, 48:15, 51:15, 51:17, 57:17, 67:29, 75:24, 95:11, 131:6, 174:26 topic [4] - 6:24, 49:25, 127:23, 174:29 topics [8] - 6:18, 6:20, 9:26, 38:2, 56:19, 128:7, 146:21, 147:15 total [4] - 28:11, 96:2, 127:25, 127:28 totally [4] - 11:21, 11:22, 29:22, 144:6 tots [1] - 127:25 touch [1] - 186:15 tourism [1] - 199:13 towards [8] - 19:18, 38:27, 40:3, 55:26, 57:4, 85:1, 176:27, 214:29 traffic [3] - 164:2,

172:15, 173:12

217:21

train [1] - 124:5

training [2] - 162:19,

tranche [1] - 124:7

transcript [9] - 1:26,

6:5, 9:20, 53:22, 103:9, 114:6, 125:8, 226:5, 237:13 transferred [6] -217:21, 217:23, 217:26, 218:3, 218:12, 218:21 transparent [1] -127:6 transpired [1] -39:25 transport [3] -199:12, 210:7, 211:10 Transport [3] -165:22, 165:28, 166:2 travel [1] - 238:23 Treacy [1] - 165:29 treat [1] - 195:26 treated [11] - 14:27, 170:5, 170:14, 171:12, 186:6, 186:29, 190:20, 194:21, 213:7, 213:26, 215:6 treatment [1] - 187:2 Tribunal [79] - 5:20, 16:9, 22:29, 37:11, 39:8, 40:8, 48:16, 57:2, 58:7, 58:26, 59:4, 59:8, 59:25, 60:19, 61:5, 61:7, 62:4, 63:6, 63:7, 70:23, 73:8, 74:5, 76:13, 76:17, 78:9, 78:19, 85:25, 85:27, 92:20, 99:28, 107:10, 109:25, 114:8, 119:8, 121:25, 135:6, 138:22, 140:15, 145:8, 149:4, 149:16, 149:20, 150:17, 151:7, 151:25, 156:4, 157:9, 159:24, 160:1, 160:6, 160:21, 161:2, 161:10, 161:15. 162:15, 169:15, 174:19, 174:21, 183:22, 184:8, 184:10, 190:22, 202:29, 208:18, 208:21, 218:28, 219:1, 219:7, 219:9, 219:13, 219:14, 219:16. 219:18. 223:4, 228:4, 228:5, 236:8, 237:13 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:3, 2.6 Tribunal's [1] - 5:22

Tribune [1] - 10:18 trick [1] - 130:5 tried [1] - 186:17 troublemaker[1] -144.10 troublesome [1] -45:22 true [5] - 122:19, 133:5, 146:12, 146:14, 192:1 trust [1] - 210:2 trusted [2] - 172:6, 181:27 truth [3] - 24:20, 25:2, 32:28 try [11] - 10:5, 22:10, 27:4, 55:7, 79:12, 91:9, 145:21, 154:17, 183:19, 195:4, 231:8 trying [20] - 21:25, 22:13. 31:4. 65:5. 70:1, 71:10, 72:3, 80:25, 87:21, 146:14, 196:2, 197:5, 198:5, 202.22 202.23 206:1, 212:5, 214:10, 219:28 turn [5] - 13:19, 36:11, 39:7, 50:14, 95:7 turned [7] - 35:9, 56:16, 168:28, 169:12, 169:23, 190:1, 190:6 turning [1] - 36:21 turns [2] - 11:11, Tusla [3] - 94:1, 100:26, 100:28 TV [1] - 132:7 twice [3] - 46:25, 54:1, 97:16 two [52] - 6:22, 13:1, 19:14, 42:19, 44:21, 47:23, 62:27, 75:12, 76:18, 85:28, 99:28, 99:29, 100:5, 101:4, 103:8, 104:28, 108:27, 116:15, 118:18, 129:4,

139:21, 149:8,

160:27, 160:28,

169:16, 169:20,

179:5, 179:15,

179:22, 181:4,

185:11, 187:11,

187:28, 189:13,

189:14, 189:17,

190:1, 190:5, 201:4,

170:20, 171:2, 178:1,

202:4, 205:5, 206:16, 206:29, 219:22, 224:29, 233:6, 236:7, 236:16, 238:15 two-hour[1] -219:22 two-second [1] -101:4 two.. [1] - 31:23 Twomey [10] - 164:1, 164:19, 172:5, 174:2, 181:6, 181:24, 181:27, 194:2, 203:6, 203.9 type [3] - 117:23, 117:26, 200:8 typed [11] - 78:20, 78:24, 78:27, 86:14, 86:17, 91:16, 91:25, 92:3, 147:29, 148:12, 151:1 **types** [2] - 170:15, 212:17 **typescript** [1] - 79:6 tvpewritten [3] -75:29, 78:16, 157:13 typo [2] - 61:5, 61:7 U

UCC [1] - 8:6 ulterior [1] - 57:11 ultimate [1] - 107:20 ultimately [2] -77:28, 119:7 unable [1] - 8:28 unauthorised [1] -142:10 unavailability [1] -120:26 unblemished [1] -54:11 uncertain [2] - 13:25, 19:25 uncle [1] - 29:6 unclear [3] - 76:20, 87:5, 103:27 uncles [1] - 128:2 unconnected [1] -206:16 under [15] - 20:9, 31:4, 37:19, 65:15, 100:1, 105:7, 113:15, 120:10. 123:9. 127:7. 176:18, 187:8, 192:19, 192:27, 213:4 **UNDER** [2] - 1:3, 1:9 undermining [2] -20:1, 20:6

TRIBUNALS[1] - 1:9

understandably [3] -112:28, 114:7, vested [1] - 33:3 82:2, 90:23 well-respected [1] -55:29, 107:13, 113:10 119:13, 124:13, view [48] - 14:4, waited [1] - 90:22 34:15 understood [6] -127:25, 130:1, 14:7, 14:9, 14:17, waiting [1] - 139:2 Western [2] - 162:28, 131:28, 132:16, 15:28. 25:16. 77:12. 14:18, 15:2, 21:1, **WALLACE**[1] - 2:23 163.8 136:21, 145:1, 24:11, 24:14, 28:15, Wexford [1] - 197:20 144:1. 168:14. 213:6 Walsh [34] - 73:13, 145:10, 155:28, 73:23, 73:25, 74:4, undertake [1] - 37:29 28:29, 36:4, 44:2, whatsoever [4] -162:25, 163:29, 44:5, 44:22, 44:26, undertook [1] -74:19, 76:3, 76:7, 44:13, 139:26, 165:7, 167:14, 164:17 46:6, 69:25, 69:26, 77:14, 78:13, 78:19, 220:26, 237:23 167:17, 168:1, 69:27, 70:8, 85:8, undo [1] - 55:11 79:1, 79:4, 79:17, WHELAN [1] - 2:16 168:10, 168:26, 89:14, 94:6, 94:24, 80:3, 80:9, 83:21, undoubtedly [2] whilst [1] - 221:4 168:27, 168:28, 95:2, 98:16, 101:24, 83:27, 84:1, 84:22, 116:14, 144:23 whistleblower 131 -169:12, 169:23, unfair [2] - 17:18, 101:26, 106:22, 88:15, 89:16, 90:3, 14:27, 24:9, 65:16 182:13, 182:18, 108:4, 108:18, 111:9, 59:29 90:27, 91:3, 92:19, whistleblowers [23] 185:6, 190:3, 200:8, 111:10, 116:15, 103:21, 103:28, unfortunate [1] -- 7:18, 7:25, 13:26, 210:11, 211:19, 124:11, 124:16, 104:7, 112:20, 148:4, 156:16 14:10, 14:29, 15:6, 214:23, 215:1, 124:20, 124:23, 148:29, 158:3, 158:7 19:25, 20:7, 21:13, unhappiness [1] -217:23, 218:22, 124:24, 124:26, Walsh's [1] - 73:8 51:11 23:26, 29:23, 31:10, 223:15, 232:12, 125:1, 132:24, 142:5, wants [1] - 79:14 61:29, 65:2, 109:16, Unit [3] - 218:1, 232:13, 235:7, 144:24, 187:1, 225:9 warn [1] - 27:4 113:28, 114:1, 141:3, 218:9, 218:10 238:10, 238:15, viewed [2] - 86:20, warned [2] - 195:11, 152:13, 152:29, United [1] - 162:18 238:16 219:7 204:11 153:21, 153:24, 213:2 University [1] update [1] - 43:12 views [26] - 11:21, 162:16 warning [3] - 29:11, whistleblowing [1] upfront [2] - 180:25, 14:8, 18:10, 20:25, 203:11, 203:13 114:20 unlegalistic [1] -181:13 20:26, 21:17, 21:27, whitewash [2] -222:24 **WAS** [20] - 5:17, uphold [1] - 66:14 21:29, 44:11, 44:29, 95:21, 99:12, 109:1, 31:3 65:15 unless [6] - 83:9, **UPPER** [1] - 3:20 57:4, 65:7, 66:29, 112:12, 145:16, whole [7] - 9:25, 86:5, 117:12, 117:23, upset [5] - 51:1, 68:21, 68:23, 68:29, 148:25, 154:27 152:1, 155:3, 162:11, 21:7, 86:27, 98:7, 54:23, 55:24, 55:26, 69:4, 70:3, 95:3, 174:10, 177:8, 105:7, 116:16, 146:21 unlike [1] - 137:9 105:27, 114:10, 55:27 183:14, 205:9, unnecessary [1] wholly [3] - 44:9, urgency [1] - 55:17 114:13, 125:10, 208:15, 210:24, 127:18. 206:16 236:24 133:12, 146:6, 147:22 usual [4] - 13:10, 217:9, 233:28, Wicklow [2] - 18:6, unprecedented [1] -18:23, 33:22, 148:23 village [3] - 190:2, 234:22, 235:18, 236:5 145:28 107:7 191:16, 192:6 wash [1] - 103:7 wide [1] - 130:26 unrelated [1] -V virtue [2] - 24:19, wasting [1] - 105:3 wife [2] - 8:8, 8:28 127:18 94:9 watch [2] - 7:21, willfully [1] - 120:13 unsigned [1] - 67:5 vis-à-vis [1] - 138:5 willing [1] - 161:25 193:24 unsubstantiated [1] vague [3] - 78:14, vis-á-vis [3] - 59:6, watching [1] - 20:29 willy [1] - 212:11 - 115:7 210:2, 214:22 59:26. 69:24 ways [1] - 6:29 WILSON [1] - 3:4 UNTIL [1] - 239:17 vagueness [1] visit [2] - 215:14, weave [1] - 216:8 Wilson [11] - 108:27, untrue [1] - 167:17 216:27 238:25 wee [2] - 79:2, untrustworthiness 109:5, 109:9, 109:21, value [1] - 173:7 visited [1] - 170:2 212:22 119:29, 120:6, [1] - 135:3 Varadkar [5] visiting [1] - 179:11 week [14] - 7:2, 7:4, 120:23, 121:15, untruthful [1] - 110:2 165:21, 165:27, vital [3] - 66:13, 7:12, 7:15, 12:6, 14:2, 129:27, 132:12, 207:2 unusual [15] - 17:6, 166:9, 166:16, 208:17 89:20, 89:22 23:13, 24:5, 45:1, winded [1] - 126:27 78:2. 78:7. 81:9. variety [4] - 98:7, voice [1] - 106:18 85:12, 121:17, 83:16, 90:7, 106:11, wine [1] - 28:26 105:7, 130:26, 138:3 volume [1] - 217:7 188:23, 226:4, 231:24 wing [1] - 218:7 106:13, 106:14, various [1] - 161:9 Volume [2] - 5:21, week's [1] - 20:29 wiped [1] - 17:26 106:16, 106:21, vast [2] - 28:18, weekend [2] wiped' [1] - 17:12 106:23, 106:25, 29.19 volumes [1] - 118:15 152:10. 237:10 147:5, 147:8 wires [1] - 206:14 veins [2] - 175:18, volunteer [1] - 29:4 weeks [8] - 98:25. **up** [74] - 7:5, 8:11, wise [1] - 36:5 176:8 volunteered [5] -128:7, 132:7, 132:8, 17:15, 21:21, 23:1, wish [3] - 123:5, venue [2] - 142:6, 25:27, 25:28, 26:18, 23:12, 23:22, 26:20. 176:24, 186:21, 132:21, 134:20 186:22 151:6, 151:8 188:20, 202:16 26:23, 30:1, 31:22, wished [1] - 135:20 verbatim [3] - 1:26, weight [3] - 107:25, 45:7, 46:10, 46:18, wishes [1] - 115:6 75:23, 128:13 W 107:28, 108:5 46:20, 47:18, 49:28, wishing [1] - 124:10 verified [1] - 36:22 weird [1] - 229:2 56:21, 78:20, 81:23, with.. [1] - 136:2 verifying[1] - 110:15 well-documented [1] 85:6, 90:11, 90:16, WITHDREW [3] version [7] - 9:24, wait [3] - 82:2, 82:6, - 38:23 90:26, 91:16, 91:25, 162:3, 217:3, 239:6 10:1, 75:29, 78:16, 90:23 94:10, 96:2, 97:6, well-known [2] -WITNESS [12] - 4:2, 78:20, 78:24, 91:19 wait-and-see [2] -68:21, 186:23 103:18, 107:17, 101:11, 162:3, 205:9,

208:15, 210:24, 66:5, 66:8 217:3, 233:28, wrongs [2] - 28:7, 234:22, 235:18, 119:11 236:5, 239:6 wrote [9] - 37:12, witness [13] - 5:4, 57:19, 63:23, 82:25, 5:12, 79:13, 126:17, 87:23, 149:4, 149:20, 134:7, 134:27, 161:15, 161:23 135:20, 162:5, 207:8, 207:27, 217:5, Υ 218:19, 235:16 witnesses [1] year [8] - 6:13, 8:18, 239:9 38:1, 128:4, 162:6, woes [2] - 215:10 165:17, 194:6, 219:21 wonder [5] - 5:6, years [19] - 35:17, 112:27, 206:1, 36:11, 42:20, 54:11, 210:11, 227:25 62:23, 63:1, 73:25, wonderful [2] -80:10, 80:18, 89:8, 29:28, 30:4 110:23, 136:29, wondering [1] -158:8, 163:2, 196:10, 178:3 197:3, 199:1, 212:5, word [14] - 21:18, 221:7 51:2, 64:15, 68:13, yesterday [5] -75:23, 96:27, 97:15, 13:11, 18:23, 114:9, 106:18, 141:22, 131:19 154:18, 154:22, you" [3] - 153:3, 154:23, 164:6 153:15, 186:23 wording [3] - 22:23, young [1] - 156:8 22:24, 96:10 yourself [21] - 14:9, words [20] - 21:3, 21:1, 27:7, 47:5, 47:6, 21:18, 24:27, 38:18, 51:13, 52:20, 65:4, 50:3, 50:6, 50:12, 66:6, 70:27, 89:21, 50:17, 53:27, 93:11, 93:5, 93:25, 132:26, 96:16, 97:22, 103:6, 145:20, 171:24, 108:19, 116:6, 216:9, 219:3, 223:4, 139:10, 144:14, 237:8, 238:19 198:29, 212:8, 216:20 worker [1] - 162:20 workers [1] - 147:21 worried [5] - 110:7, 110:8, 110:10, ÉIREANN [2] - 1:5, 110:12, 205:24 worry [2] - 50:29, Éireann [2] - 20:16, 83:6 worrying [1] - 163:23 worse [1] - 11:6 Ó writing [5] - 59:24, 63:15, 63:16, 88:2, **Ó**[1] - 3:12 90:12 written [18] - 37:11, 39:13, 45:9, 55:14, 58:6, 63:10, 63:12, 63:16, 69:12, 78:27, 85:7, 87:7, 87:9, 88:22, 91:14, 147:29, 158:16, 218:27 wrongdoing [6] -27:18, 31:1, 65:7, 70:15, 118:11, 118:14 wrongdoings [5] -30:17, 65:5, 65:10,