TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON FRIDAY, 13TH APRIL 2018 - DAY 65

65

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT **SOLE MEMBER:**

REGISTRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR. DIARMAID MCGUINNESS SC

MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. KATHLEEN LEADER BL

MS. ELIZABETH MULLAN, SOLICITOR

FOR SGT. McCABE: MR. MICHAEL MCDOWELL SC

MR. PAUL MCGARRY SC MR. BREFFNI GORDON BL

INSTRUCTED BY: SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY

HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY

DUBLIN 7

FOR THE COMMISSIONER:

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC MR. NOEL WHELAN BL MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL MR. JOHN FITZGERALD BL

INSTRUCTED BY: MS. ALISON MORRISSEY

MS. EMMA GRIFFIN

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

MR. PATRICK McCANN SC FOR MR. BRIAN PURCELL:

MR. GERARD MEEHAN BL MR. CHARLES WALLACE INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

FOR SUPT. TAYLOR: MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS

MS. TARA BURNS SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL

INSTRUCTED BY: M.E. HANAHOE SOLICITORS

SUNLIGHT CHAMBERS 21 PARLIAMENT STREET

DUBLIN 2

FOR MRS. MICHELLE TAYLOR: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FELIX MCENROY SC O'MARA GERAGHTY MCCOURT 51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR MR. JOHN WILSON:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MARK HARTY SC PETER CONNOLLY **COURT SOLICITORS** 6 CAPEL STREET FIRST FLOOR DUBLIN 1

FOR JOHN McGUINNESS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DARREN LEHANE BL

LAWLOR PARTNERS SOLICITORS

ARRAN SQUARE ARRAN QUAY DUBLIN 7

FOR ALISON O'REILLY:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FÍONÁN Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH BL AUGUSTUS CULLEN LAW SOLICITORS

18 BOW STREET **SMITHFIELD** DUBLIN 7

FOR MR. NOEL BRETT:

MR. SEÁN BARTON MCCANN FITZGERALD

RIVERSIDE ONE 37-42 SIR JOHN ROGERSON'S QUAY GRAND CANAL DOCK

FOR MR. GERALD KEAN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DAVID BOUGHTON BL

KEAN SOLICITORS
NO. 2 UPPER PEMBROKE STREET
DUBLIN 2

INDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
MR. SÉAMUS MCCARTHY	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM24	4
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN4	1
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN42	2
MR. ANDREW MCLINDON	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER	8
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS	38
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE	14
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	21
RE-EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER	36
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	37

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON FRIDAY, 13TH APRIL	
2			<u>2018:</u>	
3				
4			MR. MARRINAN: The first witness this morning, sir, is	
5			Mr. Séamus McCarthy, please. His statement is to be	10:0
6			found at page 1504 of the materials.	
7				
8			MR. SÉAMUS MCCARTHY, HAVING AFFIRMED, WAS DIRECTLY	
9			EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN AS FOLLOWS:	
10	1	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Mr. McCarthy, I think that you hold the	10:0
11			post of Comptroller & Auditor General, isn't that	
12			right?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	2	Q.	And as such, you have a number of responsibilities in	
15			relation to auditing of accounts of monies administered	10:0
16			under the authority of the Oireachtas, is that right?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	3	Q.	And part of that remit includes the audit of the annual	
19			appropriation account prepared in relation to the vote	
20			for An Garda Síochána, is that right?	10:0
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	4	Q.	And that is carried out and reported on by you in a	
23			manner provided for in section 3 of the 1993 Act, isn't	
24			that right?	
25		Α.	Correct.	10:0
26	5	Q.	Now, by way of background, I think on three occasions	
27			prior to you taking up the role when was it you took	
28			up the role?	
29		Α.	In 2012, May 2012.	

2			occasions between 2000 and 2007 your predecessor had	
3			examined and reported on aspects of the controls	
4			operated by An Garda Síochána in relation to the fixed	
5			charge notice system or what was then its predecessor,	10:04
6			the fine on the spot system, isn't that right?	
7		Α.	Correct.	
8	7	Q.	I think that did those examinations uncover anything?	
9		Α.	They did. They found weaknesses in the control system	
10			operated by An Garda Síochána and there would have been	10:04
11			hearings of public accounts to deal with the reports on	
12			those occasions.	
13	8	Q.	Now, I think that in July of 2012, Sergeant Maurice	
14			McCabe contacted your office by phone, seeking a	
15			meeting to discuss concerns he had about the operation	10:05
16			of the fixed charge notice system, is that right?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	9	Q.	I think that at your direction, Mary Henry, who is the	
19			deputy director of the audit, met with Sergeant McCabe	
20			on the 7th August of 2012, and received a file of	10:05
21			information from him, isn't that right?	

Yes. I think that you were aware that on three

22 A. That's correct.

1

6 Q.

- 23 10 Q. You didn't yourself meet with Sergeant McCabe, is that right?
- 25 A. I didn't on that occasion.
- 26 11 Q. Now, I think in late October of 2012, you received a 27 similar file of information from Mr. Noel Brett, who we 28 heard from yesterday, who is the Chief Executive 29 Officer of the Road Safety Authority, is that right?

1	۹. Th	at's	correct,	it	arrived	by	post.
---	-------	------	----------	----	---------	----	-------

- 2 12 Q. And it was indicated that he had received that from a member of An Garda Síochána, is that right?
- 4 A. Correct, specifically a garda sergeant.

individuals, is that right?

- 5 13 Now, I think that the information that had Q. 10:06 6 been -- that was presented in the file prepared by 7 Sergeant Maurice McCabe related to around about 4,000 8 cases which have been extracted from An Garda Síochána Pulse system, where it appeared that fixed charge 9 notices issued had subsequently been cancelled, 10 10.06 11 including multiple notices cancelled by some
- 13 A. That's correct.

12

- 14 14 Q. I think it was also alleged in the file that in certain
 15 cases the notices selected had been cancelled corruptly 10:06
 16 and illegally by senior garda officers and in a number
 17 of cases the drivers whose notices had been cancelled
 18 inappropriately had subsequently committed more serious
 19 driving offences, isn't that so?
- 20 A. That is my recollection of a scan of the material that 10:06 21 was supplied.
- 22 15 Q. I think that the information presented to your office
 23 by Sergeant McCabe appeared to indicate that matters
 24 raised in the previous Comptroller & Auditor General's
 25 reports had not resulted in an improved or sufficiently 10:07
 26 improved operation of the relevant control systems in
 27 An Garda Síochána?
- A. That was my conclusion from surveying the material that had been supplied.

- 1 16 Q. Now, I think that you decided to carry out a further
- 2 examination of the operation of the fixed charge notice
- 3 system, is that right?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 17 Q. And that was to be undertaken as part of the audit of

10.07

10:08

10:08

10.08

- 6 the 2012 Garda Síochána appropriation account?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 18 Q. I think that your report on that examination was
- 9 presented to Dáil Éireann on the 30th September 2013,
- and you have kindly provided us with a copy of that
- 11 report?
- 12 A. I have, and it's a publicly available document.
- 13 19 Q. Yes. You will appreciate that is not a matter that we
- 14 are actually considering?
- 15 A. I'm quite aware, yeah.
- 16 20 O. I think that --
- 17 CHAIRMAN: Well, Mr. Marrinan, it certainly is a
- background to the thing which I think I am entitled to
- 19 take notice of at the same time.
- MR. MARRINAN: Yes, yes.
- 21 21 Q. I think in the preparation of that report, I think that
- you did not meet or speak with Sergeant Maurice McCabe,
- is that right?
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 22 Q. I think the examination by your office was focusing on
- the adequacy of the systems and procedures and
- 27 practices that were implemented by the bodies that you
- audit, isn't that right?
- 29 A. Correct. That's the only focus I can really have in

1			relation to a matter such as this.	
2	23	Q.	And as a result of that, the examination that you	
3			carried out did not attempt to address or investigate	
4			the allegations of corruption, illegality or the	
5			offences outlined in the file that had been presented	10:08
6			by Sergeant McCabe?	
7		Α.	No, those would not be matters that I can inquire into	
8			or should inquire into.	
9	24	Q.	Now, the file that you had received from Sergeant	
10			McCabe was reviewed only by yourself and by your	10:09
11			colleague, Ms. Mary Henry, is that right?	
12		Α.	That's correct.	
13	25	Q.	I think at all times it was securely stored in a locked	
14			safe while in possession of your office, isn't that	
15			right?	10:09
16		Α.	It was. We were very concerned that individuals	
17			identifiable individuals were named in the file of	
18			material and we would regard that as highly sensitive	
19			information.	
20	26	Q.	And indeed, the cases that you identified in the files	10:09
21			did not form part of the evidence that you examined or	
22			relied upon, isn't that right?	
23		Α.	No, we did not.	
24	27	Q.	So there was no reference to any individuals?	

who at the time was Commissioner Martin Callinan, that

Not a single one.

25

26

27

28

29

Α.

Q.

28

office notified the accounting officer for the vote,

I think by letter of the 18th February 2013, your

focus on, isn't that right? 2 Yes, that is the standard procedure. Α. Fieldwork for that examination was conducted by your 3 29 0. 4 staff between mid-February and mid-May of 2013? 5 Correct. Α. 10:10 6 30 Q. I think that representative samples of notices that had 7 been cancelled were extracted from the Pulse system as 8 the basis for your examination, is that right? Yes, there was computer-assisted examination of the 9 Α. whole file for two years but we extracted samples in 10 10 · 10 11 six districts to examine in more detail. 12 I think analysis of the data and the report drafting 31 Q. 13 was carried out between mid-May and the end of July 14 2013, isn't that right? 15 Yes, and I would have been more directly involved in Α. 10:11 16 the drafting process. 17 And as already indicated, that report was presented to 32 Q. 18 Dáil Éireann on the 30th September? 19 Correct. Α. 20 of 2013. I think the draft report as presented 33 Ο. 10:11 indicated and disclosed that information had been 21 22 received from a whistleblower, is that right? 23 That's correct. Α. 24 And that that had prompted your examination? 34 Q. 25 Α. Yes. 10:11 However, the identity of the whistleblower was not 26 35 0. 27 revealed in the draft report and was not made known to

1

28

29

Α.

An Garda Síochána during your examination?

That's correct.

1	36	Q.	Now, I think that prior when the report was	
2			completed, a draft report was sent to An Garda Síochána	
3			on the 31st July 2013, is that right?	
4		Α.	That's correct, again standard procedure.	
5	37	Q.	And a formal response received from that report was	10:12
6			received in relation to that report on 6th September	
7			2013?	
8		Α.	Correct.	
9	38	Q.	I think there were appropriate amendments to reflect	
10			the comments that had been received, where you deemed	10:12
11			appropriate?	
12		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
13	39	Q.	And a second draft was issued to An Garda Síochána on	
14			12th September 2013, is that right?	
15		Α.	Correct.	10:12
16	40	Q.	And a reply was again received from An Garda Síochána	
17			on 18th September, and then considering the comments	
18			that you had received from the Gardaí, the report was	
19			ultimately published on 30th September 2013, which,	
20			again, had taken into account the comments and	10:12
21			representations that had been made by the Garda	
22			Commissioner in relation to that report, isn't that	
23			right?	
24		Α.	That's correct. I might just point out that the report	
25			was published as one of a series in an annual report	10:13
26			that I present to the Oireachtas at the end of	
27			September each year.	

41 Q. Yes. Was the report in Chapter 7 of that?

A. It's Chapter 7, yeah.

28

29

Т	42	Q.	Now, I think that after the publication of the report,	
2			your office sought the views of the Data Protection	
3			Commissioner, is that right?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	43	Q.	What was that in relation to?	10:13
6		Α.	It was in relation to how we should dispose of the	
7			material that we had from Sergeant McCabe. The office	
8			policy, first of all, is not to take information from	
9			any data source that identifies individuals other than	
10			what is strictly necessary for the purposes of an	10:13
11			examination, and our policy then is to dispose of it,	
12			any material we do take, in a controlled fashion, but	
13			because we were concerned about the data protection	
14			issues specifically that arose in this case, we	
15			contacted the Data Protection Commissioner.	10:14
16	44	Q.	And I think the advice that you received from the	
17			Commissioner was that the files should be returned	
18			securely to An Garda Síochána, is that right?	
19		Α.	That's correct, by way of letter from a member of the	
20			staff of the Commissioner on the 22nd November 2013.	10:14
21	45	Q.	And I think on the 17th January of 2014, the material	
22			that had been received directly from Sergeant Maurice	
23			McCabe was handed over to An Garda Síochána, is that	
24			right?	
25		Α.	Yes, delivered to Garda Headquarters on the 17th, and	10:14
26			receipted.	
27	46	Q.	And I think the file that had been received from	

January 2014, is that right?

28

29

Mr. Brett was handed over to An Garda Síochána on 22nd

1	Α.	That's	correct.
_	/ N .	illac 3	

- CHAIRMAN: Mr. Marrinan, I know you have adopted, if

 you like, a perfectly railroaded system of not

 mentioning Sergeant McCabe in relation to the dossier

 to Mr. Brett, but we had the evidence yesterday and we

 know it was Sergeant McCabe, and I just want to make

 sure that it's not anybody else we are talking about.

 MR. MARRINAN: Yes, all right.
- 9 47 Q. The material that was in Mr. Brett's file that had been supplied to you effectively mirrored the material that had been handed in by Sergeant Maurice McCabe, is that right?
- A. The appearance of the material was similar. We didn't have any identification that would indicate it was the same, and our sense was, from scanning it, we didn't do a paragraph-by-paragraph match, but our sense was that there were some different cases.

 CHAIRMAN: They may be different, but I am concluding

18 CHAIRMAN: They may be different, but I am concluding 19 it's Sergeant McCabe unless someone wants to contradict 20 me.

10:16

10.16

MR. MARRINAN: I think that seems to be common case, sir.

23 But in any event, to summarise the position up until 48 Q. 24 that point in time, it appears that the material had 25 been sent in by Sergeant Maurice McCabe. You had 26 examined it, you had -- because it wasn't within your 27 remit you hadn't examined any of the allegations that accompanied it of corruption or otherwise, and you had 28 29 focused on the system that was being operated.

Т			aran c use any or the personal data contained therein	
2			in the Pulse records, but merely focused on the fact	
3			that the record existed, isn't that right?	
4		Α.	Yes. Our focus we didn't examine the material that	
5			was presented by Sergeant McCabe. Our focus was to	10:17
6			look at the matters that were alleged to have happened,	
7			to identify what control weaknesses would have had to	
8			occur in order for those events that were alleged to	
9			have happened, the point being that we then set out a	
10			programme of work to test and see if Garda systems	10:17
11			could have allowed instances such as were reported	
12			by or documented by Sergeant McCabe to have	
13			occurred.	
14	49	Q.	I think in or around about autumn of 2012, you had	
15			become aware of statements in Dáil Éireann and media	10:17
16			reports about whistleblower allegations of improper	
17			cancellation by members of An Garda Síochána of fixed	
18			charge notices for motoring offences, isn't that right?	
19		Α.	That's correct.	
20	50	Q.	And you were also aware of the fact obviously that	10:18
21			there had been a Garda internal examination of alleged	
22			improper cancellation of fixed charge notices which had	
23			been undertaken by Assistant Commissioner John	
24			O'Mahony, isn't that so?	
25		Α.	That's correct.	10:18
26	51	Q.	I think as part of your examination, you reviewed the	
27			assistant commissioner's report when it was published	
28			in May of 2013?	
29		Α.	That's correct.	

- 1 52 Q. I think that following the publication of your own
- 2 report, you became aware, again through media reports,
- of a complicated story in relation to a paedophile case

10 · 19

10:19

10.20

- 4 in the Cavan-Monaghan Garda district, is that right?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- 6 53 Q. Will you just tell us what you had heard in that regard.
- 8 A. My recollection of it was that a computer had gone
- 9 missing, a computer that was in the control of An Garda
 10 Síochána, that it was potentially evidential or had
- 11 evidential material in relation to allegations against
- a priest of paedophile activity, that the computer had
- gone missing and there was some reference to a role
- 14 played by a station sergeant in relation to the loss.
- 15 54 Q. And the station sergeant, was that in a context of that 10:19
- that's the station sergeant being a whistleblower?
- 17 A. I don't recall from the stories -- actually, yes, in
- 18 January, there was a reference to the station sergeant
- 19 being a whistleblower.
- 20 55 Q. And did you link that in any way to Sergeant Maurice
- 21 McCabe, that story that you had heard?
- 22 A. The circumstances that I was aware of suggested that it
- 23 might be related to Sergeant McCabe but I certainly had
- no knowledge that it was related to him.
- 25 56 Q. And had you heard any other rumours in relation to
- 26 Sergeant McCabe that may have been circulating?
- 27 A. No, I had not.
- 28 57 Q. Now, I think that you were -- you attended a meeting of
- the Committee of Public Accounts on the 23rd January

1			2014, isn't that right?	
2		Α.	That's correct.	
3	58	Q.	I think that you are a permanent witness at the	
4			Committee, isn't that right?	
5		Α.	That's correct. I attend most of the meetings of	10:20
6			Committee of Public Accounts.	
7	59	Q.	And your appropriation accounts and your reports to	
8			Dáil Éireann are formally examined at the meetings of	
9			that Committee, is that right?	
10		Α.	That's correct.	10:21
11	60	Q.	And I think that the accounting officer for the vote is	
12			the primary witness and on this occasion it was to	
13			examine the vote of the Garda Commissioner, is that	
14			right?	
15		Α.	That's correct. The vote of An Garda Síochána and the	10:21
16			chapter from my report.	
17	61	Q.	Yes. Now, will you just tell us in your own words	
18			then, before you went in to the chamber, do you recall	
19			meeting Commissioner Callinan?	
20		Α.	Yes, I do.	10:21
21	62	Q.	Where did you meet him?	
22		Α.	I met him in the lobby at the the meeting room is in	
23			a basement of one of the buildings that form the	
24			complex of Leinster House, and when I arrived at the	
25			level where the meeting was being held, there were a	10:21
26			group of senior people from An Garda Síochána at the	
27			bottom of the stairs and I met the Commissioner at that	
28			point.	

29 63 Q. Where is this in relation to the coffee dock, I think

1			it's	
2		Α.	The coffee dock is on the level above.	
3	64	Q.	Above. And there were a group of people there you	
4			say	
5		Α.	Correct.	10:22
6	65	Q.	do you recall how many?	
7		Α.	A significant number, six, seven.	
8	66	Q.	And were they members of An Garda Síochána, that you	
9			could see?	
10		Α.	They were. Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan was with	10:22
11			Commissioner Callinan, Assistant Commissioner Twomey	
12			was with him, Superintendent Dave Taylor was there and	
13			somebody who I subsequently identified as Assistant	
14			Commissioner O'Mahony, who had carried out the report,	
15			the internal report.	10:22
16	67	Q.	And had you previously been acquainted with all those	
17			people?	
18		Α.	I was acquainted with Assistant Commissioner Twomey	
19			from an investigation that he carried out into issues	
20			around 2000. It was related to a report that my	10:23
21			predecessor had carried out and which I was deeply	
22			heavily involved in myself. So he was the one I was	
23			most familiar with. I would recognise the others from	
24			maybe previous meetings of public accounts, where	
25			representatives of Garda Síochána would have appeared.	10:23
26	68	Q.	And previously, had you spoken to the Garda	
27			Commissioner?	
28		Α.	I might have nodded to him on one occasion when he	
29			appeared at public accounts with his predecessor as	

1			Commissioner, but that would have been many years	
2			before. I have never had a conversation with him	
3			before.	
4	69	Q.	And on this occasion, did you engage in conversation	
5			with him?	10:23
6		Α.	I did.	
7	70	Q.	Will you just tell us about that.	
8		Α.	As I was accompanied by two colleagues, two team	
9			members who had worked on the report, as we arrived at	
10			the bottom of the stairs, the Garda Síochána	10:24
11			representatives were there. My recollection is that	
12			the Commissioner came forward to have a word with me.	
13	71	Q.	Right. And did he have a word with you then?	
14		Α.	Yes, yes.	
15	72	Q.	And will you tell us the conversation?	10:24
16		Α.	We my recollection is that we were apart from both	
17			groups, so my colleagues were not party to the	
18			conversation and the colleagues with Commissioner	
19			Callinan were not party to the conversation. We began	
20			just with sort of normal greetings and but very	10:24
21			quickly the Commissioner raised Sergeant McCabe's name	
22			in the conversation, along the lines that Sergeant	
23			McCabe is not to be trusted, that he had questions to	
24			answer and that there were sexual offence allegations	
25			against him.	10:25
26	73	Q.	Were you surprised by this?	
27		Α.	I was surprised, certainly. My immediate concern was	
28			Sergeant McCabe's name being raised in the	
29			conversation, because, as far as I was concerned, that	

1			was not a name that we had shared with the Garda	
2			Síochána at any stage during the examination and I had	
3			already, on occasions, in Public Accounts, resisted	
4			revealing who the whistleblower was.	
5	74	Q.	And how did you react to the suggestion that he wasn't	10:25
6			to be trusted and that he had questions to answer and	
7			that there were allegations of sexual offences against	
8			him?	
9		Α.	My immediate response was that the whistleblower	
10			that I hadn't relied at all on the whistleblower	10:26
11			information, so there was no aspect of the report that	
12			depended on the character effectively of any	
13			whistleblower. But I didn't confirm that Sergeant	
14			McCabe was the whistleblower in question.	
15	75	Q.	In terms of the suggestion that there were allegations	10:26
16			of sexual offences against him, your recollection is	
17			that, is it, that this was plural?	
18		Α.	Yes, yes, sexual offences is my recollection of it.	
19	76	Q.	And that there were they were allegations as opposed	
20			to past allegations that had been investigated?	10:26
21		Α.	Yes, my recollection was that it was tied very closely	
22			to, that he has questions to answer.	
23	77	Q.	And how did you respond to what was being said to you?	
24		Α.	As I said, I immediately made the point that my report	
25			was not dependent on material supplied by any	10:27
26			whistleblower and then we continued to talk about the	
27			matters that were in the report rather than about the	
28			allegations that he had made.	
29	78	Q.	And how did the conversation end then?	

1	Α.	We talked about the some of the control issues, we	
2		talked about the importance of An Garda Síochána having	
3		the ability to exercise discretion in relation to the	
4		issuing of penalty not penalty points, fixed charge	
5		notices. We talked about reliance An Garda	10:27
6		Síochána's operational reliance on goodwill of the	
7		community and what that would mean in terms of the	
8		manner in which a fixed charge notice regime would be	
9		applied and there was a reference to one specific case	
10		in the report which we had drawn attention to, where	10:28
11		somebody had petitioned to have a speeding ticket	
12		quashed, effectively, because he was, as was recorded	
13		in the papers we had seen, that he was rushing back to	
14		his farm because bees were attacking livestock.	

- 15 79 Q. I think that he indicated that it was important to have 10:28

 16 discretion in those circumstances because --
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 80 Q. -- the civilian in question had assisted An Garda 19 Síochána in other respects, is that right?
- 20 A. That's correct. That he was regularly somebody who was 10:28 21 of assistance to An Garda Síochána.
- 22 81 Q. And then did you part company and go into the chamber 23 for the meeting?
- A. We did. The normal procedure is that when the meeting
 starts, I am in attendance to assist the Committee
 while they go through correspondence and consider
 financial statements and so on that have been presented
 and once that process is over, the chief witnesses for
 the day are called.

- 1 82 Q. And during the subsequent Committee meeting, did you 2 have cause to reflect on what had been said to you by 3 Commissioner Callinan?
- Yes, I had. Obviously, once the conversation with the 4 Α. 5 Commissioner had finished, I went into the meeting --10:29 into the room where the meeting was happening. 6 7 a very busy few minutes while correspondence was taken, 8 so I was engaged with that. The opening part of the meeting is where I present my report and my conclusions 9 on the audit of the financial statements, or the 10 10:30 11 appropriation accounts in this case, and I give the introduction, and after that, I have an opportunity to 12 13 reflect on matters.
- 14 83 Q. And having reflected on the matter in terms of what you 15 had been told, did you link it to anything?

- 16 I suppose I was thinking about the statements that Α. Commissioner Callinan had made to me. 17 I was trying to 18 recollect what they might have referred to and what 19 they might have been connected with. The only thing 20 that I could think of was the issue that I was aware of 10:31 where a whistleblower had been alleged to be involved 21 22 in the disappearance or the loss of a computer and I concluded that the matters that the Commissioner was 23 referring to were in fact that situation. 24
- 25 84 Q. So I think that the Commissioner then gave evidence, 10:31 isn't that right?
- 27 A. That's correct.
- 28 85 Q. And you were present throughout that?
- 29 A. I was.

- 1 86 Q. And then later on that afternoon the meeting of the 2 Public Accounts Committee concluded, isn't that so?
- A. That's correct, my recollection is at around three o'clock in the afternoon.
- 5 87 You'll appreciate that Commissioner Callinan, when Q. 10:32 confronted with your allegation in relation to this 6 7 matter, has completely denied that he said anything in 8 relation to Sergeant McCabe not being somebody who, in the first instance, or suggestion that he shouldn't be 9 trusted, and the second instance, that he was somebody 10 10:32 11 who had serious questions to answer or that he had been 12 involved in any sexual assault or paedophile case or 13 otherwise, you appreciate that he is denying this?
- 14 A. I appreciate that, and I certainly don't suggest that 15 the word paedophile was used in the conversation.

- 16 88 Q. Right. But sexual assault was, you say?
- 17 A. Oh -- sexual assault offences, yeah -- allegations of 18 sexual assault. I am sorry, allegations of sexual 19 offences, I think was the formula.
- 20 89 Q. Was the words that you used, yes. You didn't mention 10:33 this to anybody at the time, is that right?
- A. No, I didn't.
- 23 90 Q. When was the first time that you alluded to this to anybody?
- A. Following the Tribunal's appeal for anybody with
 information relevant to the matters of inquiry to come
 forward.
- 28 91 Q. And that was on the 13th March when you made your statement to the Tribunal, is that right?

- 1 A. Well, I think the appeal was made earlier.
- 2 92 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. So I prepared the statement following the appeal.
- 4 93 Q. Well, you'll appreciate that Mr. Callinan will have a
- 5 view in relation to this matter and his view would be

10:34

10:34

10:35

- 6 that this allegation comes very late. You'll
- 7 appreciate that it couldn't -- no matter how you view
- 8 it, it would be entirely inappropriate for the Garda
- 9 Commissioner to make the comment that he did,
- specifically in relation to sexual offences being
- investigated in relation to Sergeant McCabe, isn't that
- 12 right?
- 13 A. Well, I presume that that is a matter for the Tribunal
- to determine, whether it was appropriate.
- 15 94 Q. But your own view in relation to it?
- 16 A. Well, I would certainly find it highly unusual, yes.
- 17 95 Q. Well, you see, I suppose that he would advance the
- argument to say, well, you know, if it was said and
- somebody in your position, the natural reaction would
- 20 be perhaps to report what had been said or to confront
- 21 him at the time and to say, you know, hang on a minute,
- should you be saying this to me? Is this appropriate
- as part of our conversation?
- 24 A. It didn't occur to me to say that.
- 25 96 Q. It didn't occur to you. Okay. Would you answer any
- questions, please.
- 27 A. I will indeed.

28

MR. McDOWELL: No questions, Chairman.

Т				
2			THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM:	
3	97	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Hello, Mr. McCarthy, my name is Conor	
4			Dignam. I appear on behalf of members of An Garda	
5			Síochána, and in particular in relation to former	10:35
6			Commissioner Callinan, I have a number of questions to	
7			put to you.	
8				
9			The purpose of the questions, Mr. McCarthy, just to	
10			clarify, or confirm to you where I am coming from, is	10:35
11			to explore mainly the information given in your	
12			statement and now given in evidence to the Tribunal, to	
13			look at where there is agreement between yourself	
14			your account of the conversation with Commissioner	
15			Callinan former Commissioner Callinan and to look at	10:36
16			where there are differences and disagreements between	
17			the two, and to put to you Mr. Callinan's account of	
18			the conversation to give you an opportunity to reply to	
19			that	
20		Α.	Of course.	10:36
21	98	Q.	And the other purpose for doing that is to explore what	
22			I will be suggesting to you is differences in the	
23			accounts arising from a mistake or misunderstanding	
24			between yourself and Mr. Callinan, so that's where I am	
25			coming from, if I might put it that way?	10:36
26		Α.	I understand.	
27	99	Q.	I won't be looking at the detail of the very important	
28			report that you did into the fixed penalty points	
29			system herause T think as the Chair has said that is	

Т			the background to it, but it isn't the rocus of your	
2			evidence, but just to confirm, I think you have very	
3			fairly said in response to Mr. Marrinan's questions you	
4			didn't look at the substance of these allegations and	
5			in particular you didn't look at the complaints or	10:36
6			charges that there was corruption or unlawfulness at	
7			hand here, isn't that right?	
8		Α.	That's correct.	
9	100	Q.	Yes. You have had the benefit, I think, of	
10			Mr. Callinan's statements to the Tribunal, and in	10:37
11			particular his statement where he deals with your	
12			statement to the Tribunal and your account of this	
13			conversation. So I don't think anything I will be	
14			saying to you will come as any surprise.	
15		Α.	That's fine.	10:37
16	101	Q.	You will in fact know, I think, that there is broad	
17			agreement about a lot of conversation or a lot of the	
18			interaction you had with former Commissioner Callinan	
19			but also some key differences also.	
20		Α.	Yes.	10:37
21	102	Q.	In your evidence to Mr. Marrinan, you indicated that	
22			you didn't know former Commissioner Callinan	
23			particularly well at all, I think your memory is you	
24			met him perhaps once in passing when he was attending	
25			the PAC with his predecessor?	10:37
26		Α.	That is my memory, yeah.	
27	103	Q.	I think you describe yourself as a permanent witness to	
28			the PAC, that is completely understandable given the	
29			role of the PAC and your role; what does that involve?	

1			How often do you attend before the PAC? How often does	
2			the PAC sit?	
3		Α.	Weekly during parliamentary sessions. So, in total, 30	
4			to 35 weeks a year.	
5	104	Q.	So you would be in and around Leinster House	10:38
6			frequently?	
7		Α.	I would be very frequently in Leinster House, yes.	
8	105	Q.	Yes. If you then just turn to the events of the 23rd	
9			January and your interactions with former Commissioner	
10			Callinan. As I said, there are certain matters of	10:38
11			agreement and I just want to get those out of the way,	
12			so to speak. The first is, you describe yourself as	
13			not having had any direct personal communication or	
14			conversation with Mr. Callinan about your report. He	
15			agrees with that.	10:38
16		Α.	Correct.	
17	106	Q.	The second is that you describe the conversation as	
18			being a brief conversation, and about not more than	
19			five minutes?	
20		Α.	That is my recollection.	10:39
21	107	Q.	And he also agrees with that also, it was a brief	
22			conversation. You said that there was no one else	
23			either from your office or indeed from An Garda	
24			Síochána were a party to the conversation, and former	
25			Commissioner Callinan agrees with that also. You	10:39
26			described the conversation as having commenced and	
27			taken place in the lobby outside the Committee room?	
28		Α.	Correct.	
29	108	Q.	There is a degree of agreement but there is one	

difference which I am not sure that anything really 1 2 turns on but former Commissioner Callinan describes the conversation as starting at the top of the stairs 3 leading down to the lobby and then continuing as you 4 5 went down the stairs and continuing in the lobby. 10:39 6 No, that is not my memory of it. Α. 7 109 Yes. Q. 8 I distinctly remember arriving at the bottom of the Α. stairs and there was a group. 9 He also agrees that he did refer to Sergeant McCabe by 10 110 Q. 11 name when he was conversing with you and he also agrees 12 that you spoke about some of the report content and in 13 fact --14 Α. Correct. 15 -- he has a distinct memory as well of discussing the 111 Q. 10:40 16 case that you mentioned, which is the bees? 17 It's very memorable. Α. 18 112 Yes, it's quite a colourful account. I think you Q. 19 describe it in the report, and I'm not going to get 20 into an individual case for obvious reasons, 10:40 Mr. McCarthy, but you describe it as a case where the 21 22 person provided assistance or service to An Garda 23 I am not sure whether you are aware of the 24 specific assistance that is provided? 25 I am aware, but the reason I didn't specify it in the Α. 10 · 40 26 statement was because it could identify the individual. 27 Well, it is better not to because --And I didn't think it was relevant. 28 Α. 29 CHAIRMAN: -- I don't know how often bees attack cows,

1			but in itself it is highly memorable. And, you know,	
2			there is a rule about if this is what we are dealing	
3			with, I don't know if it is?	
4	113	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Yes. No, no, there is no row at all. I	
5			just want to put to you, and again I don't want to get	10:41
6			into for the same reason as you, Mr. McCarthy, but	
7			in fact it was a service that was provided to the wider	
8			community as well as An Garda Síochána.	
9		Α.	Well, that may be, yeah, yeah.	
10	114	Q.	Now	10:41
11		Α.	I mean, I am perfectly willing to supply a written	
12			statement in relation to it, if it helps in	
13			corroboration but I don't believe it does.	
14	115	Q.	I don't think it is necessary.	
15			CHAIRMAN: No, it doesn't. We have had enough about	10:41
16			bees, horses and cattle.	
17	116	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Mr. McCarthy, as you say in your	
18			statement, you didn't keep a contemporaneous note and	
19			you didn't discuss this conversation with anyone, isn't	
20			that right?	10:41
21		Α.	Yeah, and I neither made a note nor kept a note.	
22	117	Q.	Fair enough. And you said that you didn't discuss it	
23			with anyone until the Tribunal was established. Could	
24			I just ask you	
25		Α.	That's correct.	10:41
26	118	Q.	Could I just ask but that last portion? Do I	
27			understand directly to mean that when the Tribunal was	
28			established you discussed it with the Tribunal or did	
29			you discuss it with other people?	

- A. When the Tribunal was established, I was aware of the
 general purpose of the Tribunal, so I watched the
 opening statement by the Chairman, and it was quite
 clear to me that I was obliged to come forward and make
- 5 a statement in that context.
- 6 119 Q. And did you discuss it with anyone after that point?
- 7 A. At that point I discussed it with the senior managers of my office.
- 9 120 Q. In relation to the necessity to provide a statement 10 rather than the substance of the statement, I presume, 10:42 11 is that right?
- 12 Oh, certainly not in regard to the substance because Α. 13 clearly, nobody else would have -- would have known. Ι 14 felt it was important because I was going to have to 15 spend some time researching the matter, I was going to 10:42 16 have to seek files, there was inevitably a potential 17 reputational concern around it, so I felt it was 18 important to -- that they would be aware of what was 19 happening.
- Yes. And to be clear, Mr. McCarthy, I am not 20 121 Ο. 10:43 criticising you for having that discussion. 21 22 just a point that I was interested to get clarification But that being the case, your memory of this 23 24 conversation is entirely based on -- sorry, your 25 account of this conversation is entirely based on your 10 · 43 memory, isn't that right? 26
- 27 A. Correct.
- 28 122 Q. Yes. And that being the case, your account of the conversation and the interactions with Commissioner

1 Callinan, and I will come back to the details of it in 2 just a moment, but it's not a verbatim account of the 3 conversation you had with Commissioner Callinan? No, it's not a quotation, I am not representing it as a 4 Α. 5 quotation. 10:43 6 123 No. And you don't in any way in your report. Q. 7 Α. No. 8 124 And in fact, you also qualify your account in Ο. 9 paragraphs 23 and 24 of your original statement to the Tribunal by the use of the phrase "to the effect" when 10 10 · 44 11 you are describing the remarks that Commissioner 12 Callinan made to you and indeed the remarks that you 13 made to Commissioner Callinan? 14 Α. Yes. 15 125 And can I take it that that is an indication that you Q. 10:44 16 are conveying the substance of the conversation but not 17 the precise words that were used? 18 That is my belief. Α. 19 126 Yes. Can I just ask you about paragraphs 17, 19 and 26 Q. 20 of your original statement to the Tribunal? They are 10:44 21 on page 1506 and 1507. 22 I have them. Α. 23 And Mr. Marrinan has asked you about this already, 127 Q. 24 Mr. McCarthy. As I understand what you are saying 25 there, that once you had received this material from, 10.44 26 who we now know to be Sergeant McCabe, you were then 27 keeping an eye on the media and monitoring the media to see if there was anything of relevance and again that 28

is not said in any critical way.

29

Τ		Α.	No. And I think just to be crear, I would be	
2			monitoring the media anyway in my role as C&AG.	
3	128	Q.	Yes. And I would expect nothing less, Mr. McCarthy.	
4		Α.	So it would be one of many things that I would be	
5			scanning media reports for.	10:45
6	129	Q.	So you are in essence keeping an eye out for anything	
7			that is relevant to your work in general?	
8		Α.	Absolutely.	
9	130	Q.	And this being part of your work you are keeping an eye	
10			out to see if there is anything of relevance to that	10:45
11			piece	
12		Α.	Correct.	
13	131	Q.	And you say in paragraph 19 that following publication	
14			of the audit report you became aware of what you	
15			describe as media reports of a complicated story of an	10:45
16			historic paedophile case in the Cavan-Monaghan Garda	
17			district and subsequent disappearance of a computer,	
18			etcetera, and I take it that that was sometime after	
19			September 2013?	
20		Α.	Correct.	10:45
21	132	Q.	And that raised the possibility in your mind that this	
22			may refer to the whistleblower who we now know to be	
23			Sergeant McCabe?	
24		Α.	That's correct. There were various references to	
25			whistleblowers having produced evidence to various	10:46
26			public representatives and so on, or in the media,	
27			which I found I wasn't sure I knew that there was	
28			another whistleblower at a point in time, but my	
29			understanding was that what he was alleging was	

- something different, but then it began to be apparent
- 2 that he may have been making representations about the
- quashing of fixed charge notices as well, but I had no
- 4 evidence of that.
- 5 133 Q. Yes. I think you say in your statement to the
- 6 Tribunal, sorry your -- yes, your statement to the
- 7 Tribunal, that this story entered your mind then on the

10:47

- 8 23rd January after you had this conversation with
- 9 former Commissioner Callinan?
- 10 A. That's correct. From my scanning of media, I felt that 10:47
- 11 while there were matters of substance involved in
- 12 reference to that case, it wasn't something that
- impinged on my report. I didn't take a copy of any of
- the media reports at the time. By comparison, if there
- had been a reference to matters that touched on
- 16 procedures or systems in An Garda Síochána, I would
- 17 probably have copied that and sent it to the team, who
- 18 would be preparing a brief for me for the public
- 19 accounts. But the records that we have did not contain
- any media reports or copies of media reports in
- 21 relation to this specific case.
- 22 134 Q. Yes. I don't think there is any dispute but that there
- 23 were some media reports --
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 135 Q. -- in -- and in fact, two of them I think have already
- been handed in to the Tribunal but I don't need to get
- into that. I think it's not in dispute that there were
- some media reports in relation to that case.
- 29 A. Yes. There is one matter that I can point out, I

- 1 remember Mr. Clifford's report which was just a few 2 days before public accounts, and the reason it was 3 memorable was because he used the abbreviation WB, which I first thought, who is WB, that is not Maurice 4 5 McCabe, but obviously WB is whistleblower. 10:48 6 136 Yes. Q. Sorry, I didn't get it. 7 okay. CHAIRMAN: 8 And I didn't first either. Α. I didn't see those, Mr. Dignam. 9 CHAIRMAN: I mean, I have seen the GRA publication and I have seen all the 10 10 · 48 11 articles vis-á-vis Ms. D published in The Irish Independent but I haven't seen those. 12 I am not sure 13 they are terribly relevant, once it's agreed that there 14 was some reference to the Fr. Molloy computer case. 15 And his name is out in the open, by the way, as well. 10:49 16 MR. DIGNAM: Yes. Chairman, they were in the booklet 17 of media articles that were handed in during Deputy McGuinness's evidence, but I agree, that I don't need 18 19 to get into the contents or any detail. 20 That is fine. CHAIRMAN: 10:49 It was simply to ask Mr. McCarthy how he 21 MR. DIGNAM: 22 became aware or how this came to his attention. 23 And I think, Mr. McCarthy, in fact you had mentioned an 137 Q. 24 article that had appeared --Days before. 25 Α. 10 · 49
- 29 139 Q. -- dealing with this in some detail, it's at tab 2 of

-- days before.

That's correct.

26

27

28

138

Ο.

Α.

I think it was the 20th January, so

three days before you went into the PAC on the 23rd --

Т			the book of articles. If I can just then come to the	
2			interaction that you had with former Commissioner	
3			Callinan and just to explore the areas where there is	
4			perhaps less agreement or disagreement between your two	
5			accounts.	10:50
6		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
7	140	Q.	Mr. Callinan will say that he didn't say that Sergeant	
8			McCabe was not to be trusted or that he had questions	
9			to be answered, and of course, you don't ascribe those	
10			specific words to Mr. Callinan because you qualify it	10:50
11			by saying it was words to that effect, okay, I am going	
12			to put this to you and then give you an opportunity to	
13			reply.	
14		Α.	Okay.	
15	141	Q.	He will say that he did use the word "question" but	10:50
16			that that was in the context of saying that some of the	
17			allegations that were made by Sergeant McCabe were	
18			questionable, and you have seen that from his	
19			statement, because he will say that, as we know, some	
20			of the allegations had in fact turned out to be	10:50
21			incorrect. He also accepts that what he was trying to	
22			convey was that care should be taken about the	
23			assessment or consideration of the allegations that are	
24			being made by Sergeant McCabe, okay? So that is his	
25		Α.	I understand.	10:51
26	142	Q.	account of the use of the word of how the word	
27			"question" or "questions to be answered" or	
28			"questionability" came into the conversation.	
20		۸	T undonstand	

- 1 143 Q. And can you comment on that?
- A. I understand that is his position, but it's not my memory of what was said.
- Yes. And I have to put it to you then, Mr. McCarthy, 4 144 Ο. 5 that it flows from that that you would reply, well 10:51 look, my report had nothing to do with an assessment of 6 the allegations or indeed of the credibility of the 7 8 whistleblower, it was simply, that is what prompted my audit, I conducted the audit but without reference to 9 assessing the truth or correctness of any of the 10 10:51 11 allegations that are made, it would naturally flow from Commissioner Callinan's account that you might say 12 13 that?
- A. I think it also flows that, because I had not relied in
 any way on the material presented to me, I hadn't
 engaged with Sergeant McCabe, that nothing in my report
 relied on anything that had been provided by Sergeant
 McCabe.
- 19 145 Yes. Then in relation to the reference to allegations Q. of sexual offences, again you say, in your statement, 20 that it was words to that effect, okay? And in fact, 21 22 when you were being questioned by Mr. Marrinan on page 23 18 line 15, you said that it was sexual assault and 24 then you said sexual assault offences and then in 25 fairness to yourself you corrected yourself to say sexual offences? 26

- 27 A. Yes, allegations of sexual offences.
- 28 146 Q. Yes. But I have to put it to you that you are not 29 entirely clear on what exactly was said by former

1 Commissioner Callinan? 2 No. I think I am. Α. Yes. And Mr. Callinan's account of that conversation 3 147 Ο. 4 will be, again as you have seen from the statement. 5 that he didn't raise the question of sexual 10:53 6 allegations, but that you told -- you said to him that you had heard rumours about Sergeant McCabe being 7 8 investigated over an allegation of a sexual nature. that is Mr. Callinan's account? 9 And that is incorrect. I didn't raise Sergeant 10 Α. 10:53 11 McCabe's name. I was on guard not to do that. 12 Sorry, no --148 Q. And I didn't raise any question of allegations of 13 Α. sexual offences. 14 15 149 I didn't mean to suggest that you raised Sergeant Q. 10:53 16 McCabe's name. 17 No. I didn't. Α. 18 150 Mr. Callinan has said that he raised Sergeant McCabe's Q. 19 name, so that's how his name came into the 20 conversation, okay? At this stage you were aware of 10:53 the Molloy case? 21 22 So the conversation, just to be clear, CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dignam, went something like, Commissioner Callinan 23 24 says be careful in relation to Sergeant McCabe and the 25 problem with whistleblowers is that they are not always 10:54 right, or something to that effect, and some indeed 26 27 allegations have proved to be incorrect, and that you chimed in and I believe he has sexual offence 28 29 allegations against him, something to that effect, that

Τ			is what is being put to you, am I right?	
2		Α.	And that is not correct.	
3	151	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: What Mr. Callinan will say is that	
4			Mr. McCarthy said oh, I have heard rumours about sexual	
5			allegations. Mr. McCarthy quite properly didn't say	10:54
6			and there are allegations against him, he simply said	
7			that he had heard rumours.	
8		Α.	I did not say that.	
9			CHAIRMAN: You chimed in with I've heard all right.	
10		Α.	I didn't.	10:54
11	152	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: And that Mr. Callinan and what I have	
12			to put to you, Mr. McCarthy, is that it is possible	
13			that that occurred and indeed I will come on to say	
14			it's more likely that it occurred in that way.	
15			Firstly, it's possible that that occurred because it's	10:55
16			entirely logical that if Mr. Callinan said something	
17			which caused you to interpret him as saying that there	
18			were questions to be answered or it was questionable,	
19			that you would then say well, I have heard rumours, but	
20			in fact I didn't look at the whistleblower or the	10:55
21			individual at all, or the allegations he was making,	
22			it's simply what prompted my audit report and I have	
23			made my findings completely independent of anything	
24			that might be said about the whistleblower or anything	
25			about the allegations?	10:55
26		Α.	That's sort of rather complicated, but I certainly did	
27			not my intention was immediately Sergeant McCabe's	
28			name was mentioned, to retort that that is not	
29			something that concerns me, my report does not rely on	

1			that in any way. And then I took the conversation into	
2			the space of what the report was about: Systems,	
3			procedures and practices. And that we had drawn our	
4			own samples and relied only on our own samples.	
5	153	Q.	And then just to go to the final couple of points,	10:56
6			Mr. McCarthy. I have to put it to that you that it's a	
7			perfectly understandable disagreement in two accounts	
8			where a conversation like this happens, and that your	
9			recollection is simply mistaken in circumstances where	
10			you didn't keep a note where it was a brief	10:56
11			conversation?	
12		Α.	I don't believe that's the case. I would never have	
13			associated the idea of sexual offence allegations	
14			against Sergeant McCabe, even with the newspaper	
15			reports. My understanding of it was that it was a	10:56
16			disciplinary matter, had a computer or had evidential	
17			matter gone missing, and the idea that it would be	
18			sexual offences against Sergeant McCabe was puzzling.	
19	154	Q.	Yes. Now, it's a matter for the Chairman at the end of	
20			the day, Mr. McCarthy, but just to give you an	10:57
21			opportunity	
22		Α.	I appreciate that.	
23	155	Q.	I just want to give you an opportunity comment on two	
24			points on one point broken down into two parts.	
25		Α.	No, that is fine.	10:57
26	156	Q.	I have to put it to you that Mr. Callinan's account is	
27			the more likely correct account of how the conversation	
28			flowed, or his memory of how the conversation flowed is	
29			the more likely memory, more likely correct memory and	

1 I say that for two reasons. Firstly, Mr. Marrinan has 2 already touched on this, here you have the Commissioner 3 of An Garda Síochána coming to you doing something which is improper, okay? 4

5 I am sorry, what is that word. Α.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

6 157 Q. He is coming to you doing something which is improper, 7 in other words making an allegation of sexual offences 8 or whispering in your ear about sexual offences in order to do down Sergeant McCabe in your eyes, okay? 9 And you, I suggest to you, would have known that that 10 10:58 11 was improper, it would have caused you unease and 12 concern and you would have noted it and possibly even 13 taken it further and taken some action on it.

10:57

10:58

10:59

Α. I certainly thought about it afterwards. I suppose it did occur to me that there was something I didn't know, 10:58 perhaps that the Commissioner did. I would have been aware of An Garda Síochána's resistance, perhaps, to some of the suggestions, or the implications of what was in Sergeant McCabe's file -- or the material provided to us, because we had had an engagement about My understanding or my interpretation of what had transpired was that it was somehow an attempt to maybe shake my convictions about my -- the findings in my own report, but of course it was completely moot at that stage. The report was presented and I stood over it and I still do, as a report.

27 158 Q. And the second reason why I say that it's more likely that former Commissioner Callinan's memory of the 28 29 conversation is correct, is that you have said in

evidence you didn't know each other, in fact you

didn't -- you barely knew each other at all, that you

had met once -- paths had crossed once?

4 A. That's correct.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

5 159 In those circumstances, Mr. McCarthy, I have to put it Q. 10:59 6 to you that, and as I said, ultimately it's a matter 7 for the Tribunal, but I just want to give you an opportunity comment, that you have Mr. Callinan going 8 to a constitutional office holder, who he doesn't know, 9 doing something which is very, very wrong, and that 10 10:59 11 would carry with it the very obvious risk that you 12 could report it, you could take some action on it, he 13 had no idea of your form, how such a comment would be 14 received, I have to say to you that in those 15 circumstances it would be very unlikely for him to have 11:00 16 done that?

> That's a matter of opinion I think. I would sav. Α. though that the relationship between an accounting officer and the Comptroller & Auditor General is -- you know, there is a background to it. There is a process 11:00 of engagement. Staff from my office would have been engaging with him and with other members of management in An Garda Síochána, and I think it -- I would not accept -- it's a professional engagement. I think anyone who is looking at the report, they know they are 11:00 looking at my report, they know how I got to it, so I wouldn't characterise it as somebody effectively meeting a stranger on the street.

29 160 Q. No, I appreciate that.

		Α.	it's quite a different refactionship.	
2	161	Q.	And then finally, Mr. McCarthy, just whatever you	
3			recall Commissioner Callinan saying to you, what it led	
4			you to believe he was referring to was the lost	
5			computer case?	11:01
6		Α.	That is what I concluded that the matter had related	
7			to.	
8	162	Q.	Thank you, Mr. McCarthy.	
9		Α.	You are welcome.	
10				11:01
11			THE WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
12	163	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Sorry, just I left it to Mr. Dignam to	
13			put Mr. Callinan's case to you, but there is a second	
14			limb to it. Just that the first limb to it is that he	
15			is suggesting that it was you who introduced a	11:01
16			reference to an offence or an allegation of a sexual	
17			nature, do you understand?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	164	Q.	So, in other words, he didn't introduce it to the	
20			conversation, you introduced it to the conversation?	11:02
21		Α.	I understand that that is his position.	
22	165	Q.	What do you have to say?	
23		Α.	That is not true. I had no idea that there were	
24			that there was any suggestion of sexual offences	
25			against Sergeant McCabe at that point.	11:02
26	166	Q.	But then there is a second limb to it, because he says	
27			that you didn't elaborate or specify what the rumours	
28			were that you had heard, but he then goes on to say at	
29			nage 693 in a statement that he made to the Tribunal:	

1				
2			"I indicated to Mr. McCarthy that that was several	
3			years ago and that the Director of Public Prosecutions	
4			directed no prosecution."	
5		Α.	I don't recall anything of that nature being said.	11:02
6	167	Q.	Well, he is asserting that he is linking this rumour	
7			that you introduced into the conversation to an actual	
8			investigation that had occurred, one presumes, in 2006,	
9			that resulted in	
10		Α.	I don't believe that those points were made in the	11:03
11			conversation.	
12	168	Q.	Yes.	
13		Α.	And I was certainly not aware of any allegations from	
14			2006 or the involvement of the Director of Public	
15			Prosecutions. The sense I had was that it was a matter	11:03
16			currently being investigated.	
17	169	Q.	Thank you very much.	
18				
19			THE WITNESS WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN:	
20			CHAIRMAN: Just a couple of things, Mr. McCarthy.	11:03
21		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
22	170	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You hold office under Article 33 of the	
23			Constitution?	
24		Α.	That's correct.	
25	171	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And the protections around your office are	11:03
26			the same as a judge; you can't be removed except by	
27			resolution of both Houses of the Oireachtas, isn't that	
28			right?	
29		Α.	That's correct.	

1 172 Q. CHAIRMAN: As I understand it, your job under the
Constitution is to audit account for, inquire into
monies being spent by the State, value for money,
whether money is being wasted, that's the kind of remit
you have, isn't that right?

11:04

11:05

11 · 05

- The Article in the Constitution is quite 6 Α. specific. It's to control all disbursements and to 7 audit all accounts of funds under the control of 8 Oireachtas Eireann. If you like, the broader remit and 9 the broader structure within which I operate is the 10 11 · 04 11 1993 Comptroller & Auditor General Amendment Act, which 12 specifies that I can carry out audits of financial 13 statements of various kinds and examinations of value 14 for money. I don't have any general remit to inquire 15 into any other matters. Specifically I must operate by 11:04 16 means of an audit or what is called a section 9 17 examination.
- 18 173 Q. CHAIRMAN: Did that change from the 1923 Act then?
- 19 A. Yes, certainly, it was a broadening of the powers under 20 the 1923 Act.
- 21 174 Q. CHAIRMAN: But what you don't have is you don't have
 22 any decision over economic policy or whether a vote is
 23 a good idea, just to take an instance, if someone
 24 decides to run a railway line from Tralee to Limerick,
 25 you may think that is a terrible idea, I am not saying
- 26 anything one way or the other --
- 27 A. And I am certainly not.
- 28 175 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- no, but you can't -- you can't intervene 29 and say look, that is a terrible waste of money or

- 1 anything like that?
- 2 A. No. If there were a question of value for money, I can
- 3 look at the process whereby a decision was made, but I
- 4 can't question the decision itself. So it's the
- 5 underpinnings that I would be looking at rather than

11:05

11:06

11:06

- 6 the merits.
- 7 176 Q. CHAIRMAN: In that instance, and I certainly don't
- 8 intend to say anything in relation to -- it's only an
- 9 example because I know there is a railway line between,
- isn't it, is it Ennis and Limerick which is --
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 177 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- subject of some controversy, I am just
- 13 taking that as an example --
- 14 A. I understand.
- 15 178 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- you would look at the procurement, for
- instance, of track, of stone, of labour and whether the
- best value had been obtained, that is basically your
- 18 remit?
- 19 A. Yes. I mean, obviously if a railway is being procured,
- let's say it was being done by CIE, that would be
- outside my remit, so I wouldn't examine in that
- 22 situation, but I could look at the economic case and
- 23 how an economic case was built up, to merit the -- or
- for the Government to make a decision to commit to a
- 25 project of a scale.
- 26 179 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes. But they would ask you that, I think
- is the case?
- 28 A. Sorry.
- 29 180 Q. CHAIRMAN: They would ask you to do that?

1 No, they would not ask me to do it, I suggest. Α. 2 am completely independent. 3 181 CHAIRMAN: You know and I don't, I am sorry --Q. 4 I am completely independent in what I choose to Α. 5 examine. It's my decision and mine alone. 11:07 6 182 CHAIRMAN: So, if the decision is to extend the M3 all Q. the way to Donegal, you would be entitled once that 7 8 decision is floated or once that decision is under 9 examination, at white paper stage maybe, or green paper stage to look at it? 10 11:07 11 Economic assessment to look at it. Α. 12 And would that make -- and this is why I am 183 CHAIRMAN: Ο. asking you this. 13 14 Α. Okay. 15 184 Does that cause a certain tension between Q. CHAIRMAN: 11:07 16 you and politicians in consequence? 17 I mean, certainly the relationship is -- well, I Α. 18 suppose it's well-tried at this stage. Modes of 19 operation have been very well set down over 60 --20 nearly a hundred years at this stage. Everybody 11:07 understands -- everybody who is operating in the system 21 22 understands the role that the other fulfils. I think there have been tensions and nobody would welcome an 23 24 examination by the Comptroller & Auditor General, but I 25 think the system generally is prepared for it, is 11:08

well-geared to deal with it and so on.

procedures which stand us in good stead, I think.

said earlier in your evidence, that in consequence of

If you move on from there to something you

So we have

26

27

28

29

185

Q.

CHAIRMAN:

1			examining the fixed charge penalty system you had	
2			suggested a number of improvements to the Garda	
3			Síochána, was that correct?	
4		Α.	In my report or in the earlier ones?	
5	186	Q.	CHAIRMAN: In the earlier ones now.	11:08
6		Α.	At the time the practice was not to make specific	
7			recommendations in the earlier reports. Because the	
8			reports are examined by the Committee of Public	
9			Accounts, it was normally left to the Committee of	
10			Public Accounts to examine the information presented by	11:08
11			the Comptroller and then to make their recommendations,	
12			which the Minister for Finance would respond to.	
13	187	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Please understand that this is a completely	
14			open question, there is no resonance behind it at	
15			all	11:09
16		Α.	Okay.	
17	188	Q.	CHAIRMAN: but, is there any sense in your mind of a	
18			Sisyphus-like exercise of trying to get the Gardaí to	
19			do things but the inertia being such as to perhaps	
20			frustrate you or anything like that?	11:09
21		Α.	Yes. And I think it's a matter that was canvassed with	
22			the Commissioner by Deputy Deasy in the course of the	
23			examination. He was quite pressing of the Commissioner	
24			on the point, when is this going to change? And so on.	
25			And I think that was part of my thinking when we saw	11:09
26			the dossier that had been prepared by Sergeant McCabe:	
27			This hasn't changed, it merits looking at again.	
28	189	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And given that you didn't know the	
29			Commissioner, there is obviously no reason for you to	

1			have any particular view about him one way or the	
2			other, as to whether in the realm of whether he is a	
3			nice man or anything like that	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	190	Q.	CHAIRMAN: but is it the case that perhaps what you	11:10
6			have spoken about can lead to a certain degree of	
7			tension between the person responsible for accounting	
8			for the vote and the Comptroller & Auditor General,	
9			whose job is to ensure that money voted by the	
10			Oireachtas is well used?	11:10
11		Α.	Yes. I mean, it certainly does arise from time to	
12			time. As I said, nobody welcomes an examination an	
13			in-depth examination like this because it's going to be	
14			in the public arena and debated in the public arena.	
15	191	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And then I suppose the last thing is	11:10
16			vis-á-vis, I don't I am not aware of any Comptroller	
17			& Auditor General, former Comptroller & Auditor General	
18			being appointed to the Court of Auditors of the	
19			European Union, for instance?	
20		Α.	No, that hasn't happened.	11:11
21	192	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is that because, perhaps, of the tension	
22			between the political system and perhaps understandable	
23			desires within the political system to have certain	
24			projects and perhaps the cold water holders of your	
25			office maybe sloshing on top of them?	11:11
26		Α.	Yeah. I suppose it raises interesting questions around	
27			the malleability and the independence of a C&AG if	
28			there are plums or appointments that could be held out	
29			as being attractive. So I think it's probably better	

Т			in the scheme of things that that not be canvassed or	
2			talked about.	
3	193	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So it's like the old thing, you have nothing	
4			to gain and nothing to lose?	
5		Α.	That is exactly the point.	11:11
6			CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, unless there is anything	
7			arising out of that, thank you.	
8				
9			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
10				11:12
11			MS. LEADER: The next witness, sir, is Mr. Andrew	
12			McLindon. His statement is at Volume 6 of the	
13			materials at page 1564.	
14				
15			MR. ANDREW MCLINDON, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	11:12
16			EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER:	
17	194	Q.	MS. LEADER: Mr. McLindon, I think you joined the Garda	
18			Síochána in September 2013 as a civilian recruit, is	
19			that correct?	
20		Α.	That's correct.	11:13
21	195	Q.	And you were specifically appointed Director of	
22			Communications at that time, is that correct?	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	196	Q.	And if you could outline in brief your career up to	
25			that time, please.	11:13
26		Α.	After college I spent ten years, nearly ten years as a	
27			technology and business journalist and editor. I then	
28			moved into public PR, worked for one of the biggest PR	
29			consultancy firms in the country in the corporate	

1 sector advising many major organisations in relation to 2 the public relations. I then went to work for Bus 3 Eireann as the Head of PR and Marketing for five years, and then following that role I took up my role in An 4 5 Garda Síochána. 11:13 6 197 Had you any previous involvement with An Garda Síochána Q. 7 in an employment context? 8 No. Α. So your involvement with the guards before that 9 198 Q. No. 10 would be like anybody else in the country? 11:14 11 Yes. Α. 12 Am I right about that? 199 Q. 13 Yes, yes. Α. 14 200 Q. Did you know the then-Commissioner Callinan prior to 15 your joining the organisation? 11:14 16 No, I didn't. But he sat on my final interview board, Α. 17 that is the only time I met him previous to my taking 18 up my role. 19 201 All right. And what about the then-Deputy Commissioner Q. o'sullivan? 20 11:14 21 NO. Α. 22 And did you know Superintendent Taylor? 202 Q. No. Superintendent Taylor, I met Superintendent Taylor 23 Α. 24 about a week before I was to take up my position, he 25 invited me in to have a chat about the role, I met them 11:14 26 then and obviously on my first day then was the kind of 27 first official meeting with Superintendent Taylor. 28 And in September 2013, did you have any awareness of 203 Q. 29 Sergeant McCabe?

1 A. No.

7

11

- 2 204 Q. Right. Now, what did you understand you were meant to be doing as director of communications in the guards?
- 4 A. My role is to provide strategic communication advice

5 principally to the Commissioner, who is my line

6 manager, but also to senior officers and senior

managers within the organisation in order to enhance

8 and protect the reputation of the organisation.

9 CHAIRMAN: There is one thing that I am not clear

about, which is vis-á-vis David Taylor, is he answering 11:15

to David Taylor or is he working in the same office?

11:15

11:15

11:15

11 · 16

12 It may be totally different.

MS. LEADER: I was going to --

14 CHAIRMAN: I am sorry for jumping in.

15 MS. LEADER: That is all right.

16 205 Q. So you are communications adviser to the guards, is that correct?

- 18 A. Effectively, yes.
- 19 206 Q. And I don't come from a PR background, so I don't know

if you could explain that a little bit more for the

21 benefit of the Tribunal, please.

22 A. Yes. Effectively my role was to provide advice

effectively around, if you like, the corporate image of

the organisation and then, to answer the Chair's

question, the press officer in the reporting structure

26 would report to me and they would be in charge of, if

you like, the day-to-day operation of the Press Office,

so they would be dealing with queries in relation to

investigations, ongoing operations, matters like that.

- 1 That was, I suppose, the technical reporting structure.
- 2 When I joined the organisation there hadn't been a
- director of communications for a number -- I think it
- 4 was about 18 months. Superintendent Taylor had been
- press officer for a number of months previous to that,

11:17

11:17

- 6 so effectively he was kind of taking both roles, and he
- 7 had established a good working relationship with
- 8 Commissioner Callinan. So effectively he had a direct
- 9 reporting line to the Commissioner as well.
- 10 207 Q. And in relation to the hierarchy, if I can put it that
- 11 way, Mr. McLindon, there was the Commissioner obviously
- in charge of the Guards and then the deputy
- 13 commissioner?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 208 Q. And are you on the same level as an assistant
- 16 commissioner?
- 17 A. No, I am on the same level as chief superintendent.
- 18 But I suppose my role is unusual, in that I do report
- 19 directly to the Garda Commissioner but that was a
- 20 recommendation from a report into civilianisation a
- 21 number of years ago.
- 22 209 Q. All right. And Superintendent Taylor then is a rank
- underneath you, albeit you are a civilian, is that
- 24 correct?
- 25 A. That's correct.
- 26 210 Q. Okay. Superintendent Taylor's job was to deal with the
- 27 day-to-day Press Office queries --
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 211 Q. -- as you understand it. Just in relation to the

1	physical	layout	of	offices,	were	you	part	of	the	Press
2	Office?									

There is one kind of small -- there is a block I 3 Α. suppose, if you like, called the Commissioner's block, 4 5 and we are at the one end of the Commissioner's block. My office is beside the press officer's and there is a 6 7 deputy press officer, but at that time Dave Taylor had 8 the office to himself, so he was in the office adjacent to me, and then, above us, up the stairs, is the Press 9 Office where the Press Office staff work. 10

11:17

11:18

11:18

11:18

- 11 212 Q. So you were part of the general Press Office part of 12 Garda Headquarters in Phoenix Park?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 213 Q. And was the Commissioner's office and the deputy commissioner's office apart from that area?
- A. They are in what is called the Commissioner's block but that is -- there's actually divisions between them, so you would have to walk into -- you would have to come out of my office, walk a minute and then go into a separate office even though they are all part of the same block. So there is a good separation between us.
- 22 214 Q. Okay. So is it fair to say by reason of physical 23 proximity alone, if nothing else, that you would have, 24 one would expect, a fairly close working relationship 25 with the press officer, who was at that time 26 Superintendent David Taylor?
- 27 A. Yes, that wouldn't be unusual. Like, I have an 28 open-door policy and so did Superintendent Taylor, so 29 we would regularly walk into each other's offices to

- discuss the matters of the day. That is not unusual.

 I do that with all my other press officers that have

 been there in that role since Superintendent Taylor.

 Obviously when you are in the middle of controversial

 circumstances and issues are breaking on a daily,

 sometimes hourly basis, you are in regular contact. So
- yes, I would have spoken daily to Superintendent
 Taylor.
- 9 215 Q. All right. And in relation to your dealings with the 10 then-Commissioner Callinan, would that have been on a daily basis, a weekly basis?

- 12 A. No, it would have on a much more irregular basis, 13 Superintendent Taylor was the main conduit to 14 Commissioner Callinan.
- 15 216 Q. Okay. And how did that happen?
- 16 Well, it would depend on what was happening on a Α. 17 particular day, but on a more structured basis, what 18 would happen in the Press Office is you receive a lot 19 of queries on, particularly on a Friday afternoon, from 20 Sunday newspapers and in that circumstances 11:20 Superintendent Taylor would meet with Commissioner 21 22 Callinan to go through those queries and to agree a 23 response to those queries and then if something 24 controversial was breaking Superintendent Taylor would 25 usually be speaking to Commissioner Callinan on it and 11:20 then I would only have a conversation with Commissioner 26 27 Callinan if there was a formal meeting.
- 28 217 Q. Okay. So as I understand it now, the Press Office 29 deals with day-to-day press queries, is that correct?

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 218 Q. So they could be anything from a breaking investigation

11 . 20

11:21

11:21

11 · 21

- or recent high profile arrest or any arrest that are
- 4 heard of in the media, is that right?
- 5 A. That's correct, yes.
- 6 219 Q. And the press would make queries in relation to same
- 7 via the Press Office, is that correct?
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 220 Q. And is that happening on a daily basis?
- 10 A. That is happening on a daily basis. The Press Office
- operates from 7:00 in the morning to 11:00 at night.
- 12 It's probably the busiest press office in the country
- in terms of handling level of queries and putting out
- 14 press releases.
- 15 221 Q. And those routine queries are dealt with by the Press
- 16 Office under the supervision of the superintendent in
- 17 the Press Office?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 222 Q. Do you have any, and did you at the time, have any
- input into routine queries, if I can put it that way?
- 21 A. Not into routine queries, no.
- 22 223 Q. So you let the Press Office get on with their job in
- dealing with day-to-day queries?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 224 Q. We then have the Friday queries, if I can categorise
- them that way, coming from Sunday newspapers, is that
- 27 correct?
- 28 A. That's correct.
- 29 225 Q. And when you joined the Press Office, when

Т			Superintendent Taylor was superintendent, he dealt with	
2			those on his own with Commissioner Callinan, is that	
3			correct?	
4		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
5	226	Q.	And did you understand that to be different from the	11:21
6			formal reporting procedure?	
7		Α.	No, that was as far as I was concerned that was	
8			established practice, and it seemed to work well in	
9			terms of being an efficient and effective way of	
10			handling those kind of media queries. Most of those	11:22
11			kind of queries are not of an operational nature, they	
12			tend to be around the organisation, so I felt it was	
13			fine for that to be done. My main issue was to make	
14			sure that we had the Commissioner's position on those	
15			queries by the deadline for the Sunday newspapers so	11:22
16			that we would have our side of the story in those	
17			articles.	
18	227	Q.	Okay. And you were happy that was a system that	
19			worked?	
20		Α.	I was, yes.	11:22
21	228	Q.	It was an efficient system?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	229	Q.	Do you have an input into those type of queries at this	
24			time under the present press officer?	
25		Α.	Yes, I would, yes.	11:22
26	230	Q.	Yes. Do you deal with them yourself?	
27		Α.	I generally deal with most of them myself now, yes.	
28	231	Q.	And do you consult with the current Commissioner in	
29			relation to those kind of queries?	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 232 Q. So the current superintendent of the Press Office
- defers to you and the Commissioner without his
- 4 particular involvement, do I understand the situation
- 5 correctly?
- 6 A. Yes. Well, unfortunately there is a vacancy there at

11:23

11:23

11 · 24

- 7 the moment, but there is a deputy press officer who is
- 8 an inspector, but yes, I would deal with all the
- 9 corporate matters for the organisation now.
- 10 233 Q. Okay. And when did that change?
- 11 A. That changed when Nóirín O'Sullivan became interim
- 12 Commissioner.
- 13 234 Q. Okay. And that was in March 2014 --
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 235 Q. -- is that correct? Now, in relation to other matters, 11:23
- 16 what other matters do you deal with that have media
- 17 sensitivity?
- 18 A. Well, any kind of controversial issues that the
- organisation is facing, which has been a number of -- a
- fair number over the last number of years. I would
- 21 generally be the main person who would be dealing with
- those from a public relations point of view.
- 23 236 Q. In conjunction with the Commissioner, is it?
- 24 A. In conjunction with the Commissioner or assistant
- commissioner or deputy commissioner, depending on what
- the particular issue was.
- 27 237 Q. All right. And do you attend a monthly meetings in the
- Commissioner's office, of the management team?
- 29 A. Yes, I am a member of the senior management team so I

Т			attend all the senior management team meetings and we	
2			meet twice a month.	
3	238	Q.	And that has been the case since you joined the	
4			organisation in 2013?	
5		Α.	Yes.	11:24
6	239	Q.	All right. And the press officer, I understand,	
7			doesn't attend those management meetings?	
8		Α.	No.	
9	240	Q.	Is that correct?	
10		Α.	That's correct.	11:24
11	241	Q.	And that was no different when Superintendent Taylor	
12			was in situ in the Press Office?	
13		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
14	242	Q.	Now, in relation to you starting off in your role in	
15			2013, did you receive any particular guidance from	11:24
16			anybody, insofar as you hadn't worked in the guards	
17			before?	
18		Α.	Well, before I started I met with Superintendent Taylor	
19			for kind of a briefing meeting, he provided me with	
20			kind of a briefing pack that was that showed kind of	11:25
21			the speeches that would have been provided to the	
22			Commissioner, press releases that would have gone out,	
23			they would have had, as far as I can recall, the Garda	
24			Code, the Data Protection Act and general information	
25			in relation to the organisation. So that was very	11:25
26			beneficial. And then Superintendent Taylor would have	
27			assisted me in terms of informing about how the	
28			hierarchy works, how you even address, you know,	
29			certain senior officers or officers who are more senior	

Τ			to you. And then, you also have to learn yourself in	
2			relation to the culture of the organisation and how it	
3			works and the different units within the organisation.	
4	243	Q.	All right. And I think there is a specific chapter of	
5			the Garda Code dealing with Press Office matters, is	11:25
6			that correct?	
7		Α.	That's correct.	
8	244	Q.	I think it might be Chapter 17 or	
9		Α.	That is my memory, yes, but I might be wrong on that.	
10	245	Q.	Yes. Now, you say in your statement that within a	11:26
11			short period of you joining the organisation it became	
12			apparent to you that Superintendent Taylor and	
13			Commissioner Callinan enjoyed a close working	
14			relationship?	
15		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	11:26
16	246	Q.	And I wonder could you expand on that a little bit,	
17			please.	
18		Α.	Well, I suppose because they had been working together	
19			and Superintendent Taylor had effectively been running	
20			all press operations for a number I can't recall the	11:26
21			length of time, but certainly it appeared to me that he	
22			had been having close contact with Commissioner	
23			Callinan. I think they had gone through a number of	
24			kind of controversial issues together, so that kind of	
25			forms a bond. And then in general I felt as well that	11:26
26			Commissioner Callinan, just the culture or nature of	
27			the organisation was more lent to listening to advice	
28			from members of the organisation rather than civilians.	

29 247 Q. Okay. Was that something that caused a difficulty

1			between yourself and Commissioner Callinan?	
2		Α.	No, it was never, as far as there was never anything	
3			in terms of, he was never rude or dismissive or	
4			anything like that or unprofessional to me, and I would	
5			hope not vice versa either. I just took that as the	11:27
6			culture of the organisation, and that was something	
7			that I had to work with and work around, if I could.	
8	248	Q.	Okay. And did that differ insofar as Deputy	
9			Commissioner O'Sullivan's attitude to civilians and	
10			advice from outside, or can you help me on that?	11:27
11		Α.	Yeah, I think in general, I think it would be fair to	
12			say that Commissioner O'Sullivan was more readily	
13			would more readily listen to advice from civilian	
14			members of An Garda Síochána and also external advice.	
15	249	Q.	Okay. And your work practices changed when she became	11:27
16			Acting Commissioner, is that correct?	
17		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
18	250	Q.	And the change, one of the changes, how it manifested	
19			itself was the Friday meetings, is that correct?	
20		Α.	Well, I wouldn't have had Friday meetings necessarily	11:28
21			with Commissioner O'Sullivan, but I would have had	
22			regular, again particularly in controversial	
23			circumstances I would have had daily contact with	
24			Commissioner O'Sullivan, and then if we needed to meet	
25			we would meet, it wouldn't have been as kind of	11:28
26			scheduled as every Friday, but if issues were breaking	
27			we would sit down or talk or we would be talking on the	
28			phone.	
29	251	Q.	All right. Now, I think a few months after you joined	

1			the organisation one of the high-profile matters you	
2			had to deal with was the Public Accounts Committee and	
3			the fixed charge penalty notice matters?	
4		Α.	Yes. That was a significant matter of public interest	
5			and a significant controversy that the organisation was	11:28
6			facing.	
7	252	Q.	How did you familiarise yourself with that issue?	
8		Α.	Well, I tried to read as much of the press coverage as	
9			I could in advance and obviously I read the O'Mahony	
10			report as well. So that is how I did that.	11:29
11	253	Q.	And did you have any meetings with Assistant	
12			Commissioner O'Mahony in relation to the matter?	
13		Α.	No, not directly. The only meetings I attended in	
14			relation to that were the pre PAC formal meetings where	
15			there was a number of senior officers in attendance.	11:29
16	254	Q.	All right. And going up to the Public Accounts	
17			Committee meeting, was that what you did on a daily	
18			basis, prepare for that and help the Commissioner deal	
19			with the matter?	
20		Α.	Yes, my role in relation to preparing for the PAC	11:29
21			meeting was to draft the opening submission for the	
22			Commissioner, his opening address, and then also to	
23			prepare for any particular questions that I think may	
24			be asked based on media coverage by the members of the	
25			PAC to the Commissioner and the members of the team	11:29
26			attending.	
27	255	Q.	All right. So you've mentioned in your statement that	
28			you met with the assistant commissioner of traffic on	
29			the 11th December 2013?	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 256 Q. Is that correct?
- 3 A. That's correct.
- 4 257 Q. And at that stage you'd read the O'Mahony report and
- 5 you'd followed up on the media coverage of the matter,
- 6 is that correct?
- 7 A. Yes. That was kind of a technical meeting in terms of
- 8 actually -- because I was familiarising myself with the

11:30

11:31

11:31

- 9 how the penalty points system actually worked.
- 10 258 Q. All right. Did you know at that time who the
- 11 whistleblowers were?
- 12 A. Not to the best of my recollection at that time, no.
- 13 259 Q. When do you think you found out that Sergeant McCabe
- was one of the whistleblowers?
- 15 A. I think that was in early January as we came into --
- started to come into the pre PAC meetings, that name
- 17 was circulating.

Callinan?

- 18 260 Q. All right. And did you speak to Superintendent Taylor
- 19 about Sergeant McCabe at that stage or Commissioner
- 21 A. No, not in relation to Sergeant McCabe, on a personal
- 22 basis.

20

- 23 261 Q. All right. Now, prior to going into the meetings in
- preparation to the Public Accounts Committee, I think
- 25 you had reason to accompany Commissioner Callinan to
- 26 RTÉ prior to Christmas, is that correct?
- 27 A. That's correct, yes. He was doing a kind of --
- annually we do an interview with the Commissioner, the
- 29 Commissioner does an interview with Crimecall to

- basically give a public safety message and to thank the public for their support during year and to thank the Garda members for their work.
- 4 262 Q. And it's more I suppose, not to put it down in any way,

 but it's more a publicity thing for the organisation

 and to encourage people to cooperate with the guards

 and so forth, is that correct? Is that the idea of

 that?
- 9 A. Yeah, that is effectively the idea, yes.
- 10 263 Q. And did a controversy or a disagreement arise as to what should be covered in that programme?

11:32

11:32

12 Generally what happens is that there is a Α. It did. 13 production meeting of the morning of the programme. Ι attended it that time because the Commissioner was 14 15 I wouldn't attend them on a monthly basis going on. 16 but I felt, just to be sure, it was my first time, the 17 Commissioner doing a Crimecall interview so I wanted to 18 make sure it went well, so I attended the production 19 meeting. At that production meeting the presenters --20 there's generally an agreed area of topics that is going to be covered within the two- to three-minute 21 22 interview and the presenters brought forward a proposal that Commissioner Callinan should be asked about 23 24 matters raised at the Smithwick Tribunal or following 25 the Smithwick Tribunal's final report. I had an issue with that because I didn't feel it was in fitting with 26 27 the Crimecall style format of interview, and also the Commissioner had done a press conference for the media 28 29 in relation to the Smithwick Tribunal report and had

1			dealt with those matters then. And so, I didn't feel	
2			that it was appropriate for it to be dealt with in	
3			Crimecall.	
4	264	Q.	All right. I think ultimately the differences were	
5			resolved, is that correct?	11:33
6		Α.	They were, yes.	
7	265	Q.	Right. And insofar as the Commissioner may have had a	
8			conversation with Mr. Boucher-Hayes, were you party to	
9			any such conversation?	
10		Α.	No. I recall them having a conversation. Generally	11:33
11			what happens is the Commissioner arrives, he is met by	
12			executives from RTÉ, sometimes the Director General,	
13			sometimes people of that stature, and talks to the	
14			presenters as well and he talks to people who are	
15			Garda members who have appeared on the programme, and	11:33
16			certainly I recall him leaving the green room, walking	
17			to the studio and as he was doing so, having a	
18			conversation with Mr. Boucher-Hayes, but I wasn't party	
19			to that conversation or heard that conversation.	
20	266	Q.	When you say the green room, is that the room where	11:34
21			people wait before they go on air?	
2.2		^	Voc it is yes yes	

- 22 A. Yes, it is, yes, yes.
- 23 267 Q. And do you remember the penalty points ever having been 24 raised by Mr. Boucher-Hayes as a subject that should be 25 dealt with on the programme?

- A. I don't. My recollection is that it was, the main issue was the Smithwick issue.
- 28 268 Q. Okay. The main issue was -- were whistleblowers in any 29 way to be discussed in any way?

- 1 I don't recall that being mentioned, no. Α.
- 2 269 So then, there were a series of meetings in preparation Q.
- 3 for the Public Accounts Committee meetings, and I think
- we have been given the minutes of those meetings, which 4
- 5 appears in Volume 5, starting at page 1202. It might
- 6 be of assistance to you.
- 7 Thank you. Α.
- 8 270 It's at the very beginning. Q.
- 9 Yes. Α.
- Now, I suppose generally if I can just do an overview. 10 271 Q.

11:35

11:35

11:36

- 11 I think there was a meeting on the 6th January 2014,
- the 9th January 2014, the 14th January 2014, the 16th 12
- 13 January 2014, the 21st January 2014, and the 22nd
- 14 January 2014.
- 15 Yes, that is my recollection. Α.
- 16 And it doesn't appear that you were at the meetings on 272 Ο.
- 17 the 6th January 2014 and the 22nd January 2014, do you
- 18 think that could be correct or --
- 19 That is my recollection, that I think there was an Α.
- oversight in the Commissioner's office and I wasn't 20
- invited to the 6th January meeting. The 22nd January
- 22 meeting I am not too sure why I wasn't invited to
- 23 attend that.

21

- 24 But do you think you were at it or not? 273 Q.
- 25 I don't have -- from my recollection, I don't have any Α.
- notes of attending that meeting. 26
- 27 274 Q. All right. Okay. Now, in relation to the other
- attendees at those meetings, I think the Commissioner 28
- 29 always attended, is that correct, Commissioner

- Callinan?
 A. That's correct.
- 3 275 Q. And Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan attended at all of 4 them as well, it would appear?

11:36

11:36

- 5 A. The ones that I attended, yes.
- 6 276 Q. Yes. And thereafter, it would appear Assistant
 7 Commissioner O'Mahony attended at a good few of those
 8 meetings?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 277 Q. As one would expect, he had prepared the report?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 278 Q. And then there were various other people who attended, 13 including Mr. Ruane, the Head of Legal Affairs, and
- Detective Chief Superintendent Clavin, was he involved in traffic or something of that nature at the time?
- A. My recollection is that he was the head of the Garda
 Professional Standards Unit.
- 18 279 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 280 Q. And Deputy Commissioner Twomey had an involvement in 11:37
 21 matters at that stage as well, and the assistant to the
- 22 Commissioner?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 281 Q. And I think Chief Superintendent Healy also attended at some of those meetings?
- A. He did as kind of Head of Policing Law and Policy.
- 27 282 Q. Now, it doesn't appear that Superintendent Taylor, from 28 those notes, attended at any of the meetings, is that 29 your recollection of matters, or could he have attended

- 1 at some of the meetings?
- 2 A. I thought he had attended at least one, but I'll accept
- 3 the --
- 4 283 Q. They may not be accurate?
- 5 A. They may not be, but I couldn't be certain either way
- 6 to be honest with you.
- 7 284 Q. Yes. You think he attended at one, at least?
- 8 A. I thought he had, yes.
- 9 285 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. But I may be -- my memory mightn't be correct on that.

11:38

- 11 286 Q. All right. Now, so I think you have said in your
- 12 evidence already that your job for the Public Accounts
- 13 Committee was to prepare Commissioner Callinan's
- address to the Committee, is that correct?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 287 Q. And also to point to particular areas that might be
- 17 asked of him in the Public Accounts Committee?
- 18 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 19 288 Q. And I think you prepared a draft of potential questions
- from the Public Accounts Committee re the fixed charge
- 21 penalty notices, is that right?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- 23 289 Q. And if you could turn to page 1286 of the materials
- 24 which is in that volume, are they the questions that
- 25 you prepared for Commissioner Callinan?
- 26 A. They are.
- 27 290 Q. Yes. They are Commissioner Callinan's set of
- 28 questions, with his notes written beside them.
- 29 A. Okay.

2 questions in relation to the fixed charge penalty 3 notice itself, isn't that right? That's correct. 4 Α. 5 292 As one would expect. And then you ask a number of Q. 11:39 6 questions directed at whistleblowers, those being: 7 8 "Does An Garda Síochána have sufficient protection for whistleblowers? 9 What is your reaction to allegations of intimidation of 11:39 10 11 the whistleblowers by senior management?" 12 13 Questions involving had these matters been 14 investigated. And then down the page you have: 15 11:39 16 "What is the Commissioner's view of the character, 17 integrity of the whistleblowers?" 18 Yes, that's correct. Α. 19 293 Yes. They are your questions? Q. I felt that the whistleblowers and our attitude. 20 Α. or the organisation's attitude to whistleblowers would 21 22 be one of the several of potential questions that could be asked of the Commissioner at the PAC. 23 24 And also his view of the whistleblowers themselves? 294 Q. 25 Yes. Α. 11:40 Did anybody prompt you to include those questions 26 295 Yes. Ο. 27 or was that from your studying of media coverage of the

Now, first of all, there is a list of potential

291 Q.

1

28

29

Α.

That was my -- from my study of media matters.

matters to date?

296 All right. To date. Now, while the notes of the 1 Q. 2 preparation meetings for the most part deal with the 3 fixed charge penalty notice system, as one would expect, the system itself, any weaknesses in it, 4 5 statistics around the system, it would appear that 11:40 6 Sergeant McCabe was dealt with in some way during the 7 preparation for the Committee meeting. Do you think 8 you drafted those questions before all of the meetings or was it as a result of the meetings? 9 My recollection is that I drafted those questions 10 Α. 11 · 40 11 for -- in early January and provided them to Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan and then Assistant Commissioner 12 13 Twomey as part of my initial thoughts. 14 recollection is that before the meetings I had drafted 15 these kind of questions already. 11:41 16 All right. So if we just turn to some notes of the 9th 297 Q. 17 January --18 Ms. Leader, this particular draft on 1286, CHAIRMAN: 19 that, although it went, I suppose, to get feedback from 20 Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan and Assistant 11:41 Commissioner Twomey, it did eventually get to 21 22 Commissioner Callinan, I am presuming that? 23 MS. LEADER: Well, my understanding was, you drafted it 298 Q. 24 for Commissioner Callinan, is that correct? 25 Yes, I would have provided -- presented this to the Α. 11 · 41 26 meetings, to the pre PAC meetings so as we went through 27 the meetings and went through the issues that we could take into account these questions may arise. 28

And you are happy Commissioner Callinan got it?

29

299

Q.

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	300	Q.	And if you would just turn to page 1286, is that	
3			Commissioner Callinan's writing?	
4		Α.	I don't know, to be honest with you.	
5	301	Q.	You don't know. Well, maybe we could solve it this	11:42
6			way. 1285, it would appear that those notes as	
7			supplied to us were handwritten notes believed to be of	
8			former Commissioner Callinan?	
9		Α.	Okay. I wasn't familiar with the Commissioner's	
10			handwriting.	11:42
11	302	Q.	Yes. All right. So if we could just I want to take	
12			you to the references to Sergeant McCabe in the pre PAC	
13			meetings, and the first one as far as I can see appears	
14			on 9th January meeting and you were present at that	
15			meeting, isn't that right?	11:42
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	303	Q.	And at that meeting, if we could just go to	
18			Superintendent McPartlin's notes at 1220, you see there	
19			"ST". Is that Sunday Times, do you think?	
20		Α.	Yes, I would I believe it is, because I think that	11:43
21			should read rather than "Justice McCarthy", it should	
22			read Justine McCarthy.	
23	304	Q.	Yes. And "Article ST"?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	305	Q.	And underneath it you see:	11:43
26				
27			"McCabe, Mick O'Sullivan's investigation, informed Mick	
28			O'Sullivan he had handed them over."	

1 Now you must have understood at that stage that 2 Sergeant McCabe was the whistleblower, am I correct in 3 saying that? Yes. 4 Α. 5 306 when do you think that information was first given to Q. 6 you? 7 I would say it was just either at that meeting or just Α. 8 before that meeting. 9 307 Okay. And then you see: Q. 10 11:44 11 "Letter of 24/12/2013 to PAC, okay." 12 13 And that related to alleged data breaches, you are 14 familiar with that letter, are you, to the --I am not familiar with the contents of it but I am 15 Α. 11:44 16 familiar with the issue that Commissioner Callinan had 17 in relation to data breaches and potential, his -- as 18 data controller. Right. Okay. And they were certainly discussed at the 19 308 Q. 20 meeting, it would appear from that note? 11:44 Yes, it would, yes. 21 Α. 22 Now, if you could just turn over the 309 Q. All right. 23 page --24 Sorry, Ms. Leader, would you mind going back CHAIRMAN: 25 please to 1220? There is probably a handwritten 11:45 version of that some place. 26 27 MS. LEADER: Yes. 28 CHAIRMAN: But how do we know that it is anything to do with Maurice McCabe? Is it because of the reference to 29

1 Justine McCarthy and The Sunday Times, is it? 2 MS. LEADER: It immediately underneath it, it looks 3 like --CHAIRMAN: Oh, yeah, "McCabe, Mick O'Sullivan 4 5 investigation", so it has to be that McCabe. 11:45 6 310 MS. LEADER: Do you understand that to be the case? Q. 7 Based on that note, I understand that to be the case, Α. 8 ves. And I think Mick O'Sullivan, was he an assistant 9 311 Q. commissioner in the guards, Michael O'Sullivan? 10 11 · 45 11 I think at the time he was a chief superintendent. Α. 12 312 And I think he may have conducted some sort of review Ο. of the penalty points or traffic system? 13 14 Α. That is my understanding, yes. 15 Is that correct? 313 Q. 11:45 16 Yes, that is my understanding. Α. 17 And the letter of the 24/12/2013 to PAC related to 314 Q. 18 alleged data breaches in relation to the matter, and 19 that related to Sergeant McCabe providing information 20 to the Public Accounts Committee, is that correct? 11:46 21 Yes. Α. 22 All right. And if we just turn over the page then to 315 Q. 23 If we just go to: 24 "No interview by JOM." 25 11:46 26 27 You see that? 28 Yes, I see that. Α. 29 316 Q. Yes.

1				
2			"AD docs, unsigned, anonymous, examined on that basis.	
3			Because of nature was suspicious of who it was."	
4				
5			And then there is a reference to another whistleblower.	11:46
6			And then there is "MMcC", do you understand that to	
7			relate to Sergeant McCabe?	
8		Α.	The "MMcC", I would imagine so, yes.	
9	317	Q.	And then it says:	
10				11:46
11			"Commissioner instructed both 14/12/ and 28/12."	
12				
13			Was that in relation to cooperation or do you know what	
14			that reference is to?	
15		Α.	I would say it does because that was a concern of	11:47
16			Commissioner Callinan's, that he felt that the two	
17			individuals had been instructed to comply with the	
18			O'Mahony investigation and that they had not. That was	
19			Commissioner Callinan's view.	
20	318	Q.	And was that your understanding of where matters were	11:47
21			at that stage?	
22		Α.	That, as far as I was concerned, that was the	
23			Commissioner's view and therefore it was the	
24			organisational organisation's view.	
25	319	Q.	Okay. And it was something that was discussed in	11:47
26			preparation for the Public Accounts Committee meetings?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	320	Q.	And then you see:	

Τ			"McCabe went sick at Christmas. Paddy McMenamin."	
2				
3			Paddy McMenamin I think was a superintendent or chief	
4			superintendent who was in charge of Sergeant McCabe at	
5			that time in Mullingar, is that right?	11:47
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	321	Q.	Okay. So certainly there was discussion about Sergeant	
8			McCabe and, as the Commissioner then saw it, his	
9			non-cooperation with Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony?	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:48
11	322	Q.	All right. And that was how that matter was to be	
12			dealt with in the Public Accounts Committee hearing, is	
13			that correct?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	323	Q.	Was that your understanding of it?	11:48
16		Α.	Yes, without reference to individuals.	
17	324	Q.	Without reference to named individuals?	
18		Α.	Named individuals, yes.	
19	325	Q.	All right. And then if we look at Assistant	
20			Commissioner Nolan's notes of that meeting of the 9th	11:48
21			January, they start at page 1244. If you scroll down	
22			to the next page, there is a handwritten page, which if	
23			we turn to the next page because it's slightly	
24			difficult to read that.	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:49
26	326	Q.	Maybe on the 9th on 1245, and the $9/1/2014$, it would	
27			appear that he has listed a number of issues that were	
28			dealt with at that meeting and he also, included in	
29			that list are the name of a whistlehlower and then	

Т			"Sergeant McCabe issues". If we just scroll down a	
2			little bit. Sorry, that is 1245, I think, sorry,	
3			Mr. Kavanagh.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Does it say "Wilson McCabe issues"?	
5			MS. LEADER: Yes, "Wilson McCabe issues", yes, is dealt	11:49
6			with. There is the beginning of the meeting and we	
7			scroll down a little bit we have:	
8				
9			"Wilson McCabe issues and John O'Mahony's	
10			investigation."	11:50
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	327	Q.	It would seem again to be consistent with Chief	
13			Superintendent McPartlin's investigation.	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	328	Q.	Now, on the 14th January, you were	11:50
16			CHAIRMAN: Well, is there a reference in that to the	
17			bee keeping story? Am I perhaps imagining have I	
18			got bees on the brain? If one looks at page 1245, just	
19			under "1.46 million notices in three years", "bees" or	
20			"beekeeper story???" As I understand it, bees very	11:50
21			rarely attack cattle.	
22			MS. LEADER: Yes. What it says is "beekeeper story???"	
23			CHAIRMAN: I mean, if this is the best and they are	
24			supposed to be fenced in anyway.	
25		Α.	Yeah, I seem to recall that	11:51
26			CHAIRMAN: They can fly, after all.	
27		Α.	Yes. I seem to recall that Jack Nolan didn't think	
28			that we should be using that beekeeper story.	
29			CHATRMAN: He didn't think much of it?	

- 1 A. No.
- 2 329 Q. MS. LEADER: And we see a typed version of those notes
- at 1245A, they are slightly redacted?
- 4 CHAIRMAN: The bees are cut out of that, Ms. Leader.
- 5 MS. LEADER: The bees are cut out.

6 CHAIRMAN: I don't know why.

7 330 Q. MS. LEADER: That is 1245. Then if we could go, on the

11:51

11:51

11:52

- 8 14th January, you were at that meeting as well, I
- 9 think, Mr. McLindon?
- 10 A. Yes, I think so.
- 11 331 Q. And at 1255 of the materials, there is a note by Chief
- 12 Superintendent Clavin, I think, and it would suggest
- that, it refers to Sergeant McCabe there. It's
- 14 slightly difficult to read. But I think there is a
- typed version of his notes at page 1259 which will come 11:52
- up on the screen in front of you.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 332 Q. And you will see there that he has recorded:
- 19
- "Commissioner's office, prepare for PAC meeting, find
- out when Sergeant Maurice McCabe was informed of
- 22 Commissioner's direction about data disclosure. Next
- 23 meeting Thursday morning."
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 333 Q. So that was his job out of the meeting, to nail that
- 26 down in relation to --
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 334 Q. -- in relation to data disclosure matters, is that
- 29 correct?

- 1 A. That would appear to be the case, yes.
- 2 335 Q. All right. And then the next meeting of relevance
- insofar as Sergeant McCabe is concerned, would appear
- 4 to be the 21st January 2014, and if we just look at
- 5 assistant commissioner -- your notes, first of all,

11:53

11:53

11:54

11 · 54

- 6 which are at page 1282 of the materials.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 336 Q. That is your handwritten note, is that correct?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 337 Q. And you see there you have something about "personal
- injuries claim 2009, 2007, 2008 defamation". And then
- 12 "2006 first incident, sergeant serving".
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 338 Q. What do you think that relates to?
- 15 A. I can't recall exactly but I -- given the kind of
- time-lines we are talking about, I imagine it does
- 17 reference Sergeant McCabe.
- 18 339 Q. All right.
- 19 CHAIRMAN: But in what context?
- 20 340 Q. MS. LEADER: Yes, that is what I wanted to ask you
- about, Mr. McLindon.
- 22 A. I think the context was, in case we got a question in
- relation to -- from the PAC members on how the sergeant
- 24 who brought forward the issues, what was their
- 25 background, what was their current status within the
- organisation. Now, in answering that question I would
- imagine that we would have had to be very mindful, I
- 28 would have hoped, of the fact that that was made under
- a confidential recipient process, that is my

2			process, so the confidentiality of that would have had	
3			to have been respected.	
4	341	Q.	All right. Well, I don't know if I quite understand	
5			your answer, Mr. McLindon. You see, it relates to the	11:54
6			whistleblowers, is that correct, that paragraph?	
7		Α.	Yes, that would appear to be the case.	
8	342	Q.	You are happy with that?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	343	Q.	All right. And do you think it relates to Sergeant	11:55
11			McCabe in particular?	
12		Α.	I don't have a note that it actually refers to Sergeant	
13			McCabe by name. So but my I could say, by	
14			looking by the time-lines, I can say that it probably	
15			related to Sergeant McCabe but I can't say definitively	11:55
16			that it related to Sergeant McCabe.	
17	344	Q.	All right. Well, if we look at Assistant Commissioner	
18			Nolan's note of that meeting, it's the handwritten	
19			version is at page 1246	
20		Α.	Yes.	11:55
21	345	Q.	we will see there the first thing that he records,	
22			which is funnily enough more or less the first thing	
23			you recorded is:	
24				
25			"Start Sergeant McCabe 2006. Shift of emphasis from	11:55
26			fixed charge penalty notice to whistleblowers."	
27				
28			And then:	
29				

understanding, or at least it was under a whistleblower

1 "where internal system was used, all allegations were 2 investigated." 3 The typed copy appears at page 1246A. 4 5 Yes. Α. 11:56 6 346 0. So are you happy your note refers to Sergeant McCabe having had the benefit of Assistant Commissioner 7 8 Nolan's note? 9 Yes, I am. Α. 10 347 All right. Q. 11:56 11 Ms. Leader, one must be puzzled, I suppose, CHAIRMAN: 12 as to what was supposed to have started in 2006? 13 mean, I am aware of the chronology, you are aware of 14 the chronology, and the context is really kind of what I'm wondering about. 15 11:56 16 MS. LEADER: Yes. Yes. 17 Now, if we just go on to the second page of Assistant 348 Q. 18 Commissioner Nolan's notes, and I appreciate -- the handwritten page is at 1247. 19 20 Α. Yes. 11:57 So the first thing we have is the first page with the 21 349 Q. 22 reference to "Sergeant McCabe 2006" and then at the top 23 of the next page, which is 1247, we have "motivation of 24 whistleblowers"? 25 Α. Yes. 11:57 26 350 Do you see that? Ο. 27 I do. Α. 28 351 And I just find hard to read the handwritten note. Q. So

if you could turn to the next page, 1247A of the

- 1 materials.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 352 Q. You see underneath that "Sergeant McCabe, 2010" and
- 4 then "Derek Byrne investigation, four complaints about
- 5 Bailieboro" and there are three superintendents named

11:58

11:58

- 6 and "confidential recipient x 2."
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 353 Q. So I presume, Mr. McLindon, you were aware that a
- 9 complaint was made by a daughter of a sergeant, Ms. D,
- of an alleged sexual assault which she said had been
- committed by Sergeant McCabe, and that goes back to
- 12 2006, you understand -- are you aware of that?
- 13 A. I am.
- 14 354 Q. Okay. So do you think your note, and you are free to
- disagree or agree with me, but the note you have in
- relation to the 2006 matter, and it's at page 1282,
- just bring it up in front of you.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 355 Q. You see "2006 first incident, sergeant serving"?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 356 Q. Do you think it's likely that refers to the D
- investigation, considering the complaint was made in
- 23 2006?
- 24 A. I think it's likely, but I don't recall in those
- 25 meetings that incident being discussed in that level of 11:59
- 26 detail.
- 27 357 Q. All right. Well, can you point to anything else in
- relation to "sergeant serving 2006 first incident"?
- 29 And you will appreciate you have agreed with me that

- that refers to Sergeant McCabe, that general note of
- 2 yours?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 358 Q. Can you point to anything else that it could be?
- 5 A. No, that is -- that is why I say the likelihood is high $_{11:59}$
- 6 that is in relation to Sergeant McCabe.
- 7 359 Q. And in relation to the investigation, the D
- 8 investigation in 2006?
- 9 A. It would certainly seem to be likely but, as I said, I

11:59

12:00

- don't recall that being discussed in detail at those
- 11 meetings.
- 12 360 Q. Well, I suppose it's one thing to discuss something in
- detail because you were there to actually discuss the
- fixed charge penalty notice system, isn't that correct?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 361 Q. And at this particular meeting, the motivation of
- 17 whistleblowers would seem to have been something on the
- 18 table and you have seen that from Assistant
- 19 Commissioner Nolan's notes?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 362 Q. And the background of the various whistleblowers, is
- that right?
- 23 A. Yes, that's correct, yes.
- 24 363 Q. So was this something that was discussed, do you think,
- 25 having had regard to the notes and Assistant
- 26 Commissioner's Nolan's notes, in relation to something
- in the background of Sergeant McCabe?
- 28 A. Yes, I think that is a fair comment, yes.
- 29 364 Q. All right. And do you think the investigation file was

- 1 produced at any time or anything like that?
- 2 A. No, I don't recall that.
- 3 365 Q. Okay. So it was definitely something that was opened up, though? Are you happy to say that at this stage?
- 5 A. I think it's fair to say that that was discussed in
- case it became a matter that had to be discussed at the PAC.

12:01

12:01

12.01

- 8 366 Q. Well, how would it ever become a matter that had to be discussed at PAC?
- well, you have to look at all the potential questions, 10 Α. 11 even if they are left field questions that may be asked 12 by the members of PAC, and Oireachtas Committees can go 13 in significantly different directions than the issue in 14 hand, based on what a deputy or a senator wishes to bring to the Commissioner's attention. 15 So in those 16 meetings part of the process is to examine all 17
- potential angles so the Commissioner and the team representing the organisation is well-prepared to answer questions even if they may be slightly left
- 20 field questions.
- 21 367 Q. But everybody was dealing with it on the basis of anonymity at that stage, isn't that correct?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- 24 368 Q. All right. And this investigation had been thoroughly
- investigated by Superintendent Cunningham, who had
- recommended no prosecution, isn't that correct?
- 27 A. That's correct.
- 28 369 Q. You are aware of that now?
- 29 A. Yes, I am aware of that.

1	370	Q.	And the DPP had directed no prosecution in	
2			circumstances where they were of the view that no crime	
3			had been committed?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	371	Q.	So how would it have ever have been something to have	12:01
6			been dealt with at PAC?	
7		Α.	Well, that is a good question, I suppose, I recall	
8			looking at it again, I think we looked at all the	
9			different issues that may arise but, as I said I think	
10			in an earlier answer to one of your questions, we would	12:02
11			have had to bear in mind or certainly those giving	
12			evidence at PAC would have had to bear in mind the fact	
13			that this was a confidential process and respected the	
14			confidentiality. And I think that was done at PAC.	
15	372	Q.	All right.	12:02
16		Α.	From my recollection.	
17	373	Q.	So as far as you were concerned, the discussion of the	
18			2006 allegation, it doesn't stick out in your mind, is	
19			that correct?	
20		Α.	That's correct, yes.	12:02
21	374	Q.	And you regard it as part of proper preparation for the	
22			Public Accounts Committee meeting?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	375	Q.	In relation to the fixed charge penalty notice system?	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:02
26			CHAIRMAN: Could I just ask one question, Ms. Leader,	
27			arising out of what you have asked just there. Were	
28			references to Sergeant McCabe warm, cold or what?	

Chair, I think it would be fair to say that

29

Α.

Commissioner Callinan's view on Sergeant McCabe was that Sergeant McCabe effectively hadn't cooperated with the O'Mahony investigation and that was his strong view. I think I reference in my statement that Chief Superintendent Fergus Healy, I can't recall the date of 12:03 the meeting, and I don't have a note of the meeting because I wasn't the secretary of the meeting, but he did bring forward a suggestion at one stage that the whistleblowers should be complimented for bringing forward their issues and Nóirín O'Sullivan supported 12:03 that and as did I, but Commissioner Callinan had a contrary view to that and I think that was expressed at PAC.

CHAIRMAN: But what Ms. Leader is asking you, and I know your answer has been, look, you have to prepare for everything because left field questions can come, but I still don't understand why anyone is dragging up the 2006 allegation in relation to Sergeant McCabe. I really don't understood that it at all and I wonder can you help me at all in relation to that.

12:03

12:04

A. I don't -- I am sorry, Chair, all I can say is that all matters were discussed and I can't recall who actually brought up that matter. I just took a note of it.

CHAIRMAN: That is fine. But policemen are lawyers just as I am a lawyer, okay, it's a different aspect of 12:04 the work but it's still the same thing. There is a thing called the presumption of innocence and, as

Ms. Leader put to you, if somebody makes a complaint, if the DPP rules on it, look, there wasn't even a crime

- committed here, I am mystified as to why this should be on the table at all at a high-level meeting of An Garda Síochána, I really need your help on it.
- A. Yes, Chair, I fully accept the situation in relation to

 Sergeant McCabe and the DPP directions and the lack of 12:04

 evidence in that regard or no evidence in that regard,

 and I would have fully --
- 8 CHAIRMAN: It's not a question of no evidence -- said
 9 there was no crime, "if what happened occurred it did
 10 not amount to a sexual assault or indeed to an assault
 11 at all" I quote.
- 12 Yes, absolutely. Fully accepted, Chair. I'd like to Α. 13 be of assistance but all I can say is I took a note of 14 what was said, and I can't recall who brought the 15 matter up and why the matter was brought up. My role 12:05 16 was to prepare the Commissioner in relation to any 17 potential questions that he may have and to draft his 18 submission to the PAC.
- 19 376 Q. MS. LEADER: Now, I think in all, you drafted six
 20 speeches, one after the other, for Commissioner 12:05
 21 Callinan?

- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 377 Q. Which was to be his opening statement to the Public Accounts Committee?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 378 Q. And he signed off on the sixth one, it was a process 27 that you went through --
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 379 Q. -- between Commissioner Callinan and the attendees at

- 1 the meetings, is that correct?
- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 380 Q. And you also at some stage prepared the list of
- 4 possible questions that could be put to Superintendent
- 5 Callinan so he would be prepared to deal with possible

12:07

- 6 questions?
- 7 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 8 381 Q. And you have referred to, you think it was Chief
- 9 Superintendent Healy suggesting that whistleblowers
- should be supported and a public acknowledgment of same 12:06
- should be made by the Commissioner, isn't that right,
- 12 at one of the meetings?
- 13 A. Yes. Well, I suppose Commissioner Callinan would have
- supported whistleblowers coming forward with
- information. I think Chief Superintendent Healy wanted 12:06
- to be more specific in terms of without naming the
- individuals, giving some thanks to those specific
- 18 whistleblowers for bringing forward their information
- and the fact that that had had some positive impact in
- relation to how we operated the FCPN process.
- 21 382 Q. All right. And that was a suggestion to be included in
- 22 Commissioner Callinan's opening address, is that
- 23 correct?
- A. Yes, that's correct.
- 25 383 Q. But it never made it because Commissioner Callinan
- vetoed that idea, is that correct?
- 27 A. That's correct.
- 28 384 Q. And had Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan a view on the
- 29 matter, can you remember?

1		Α.	Yes. My recollection is the deputy commissioner would	
2			have supported Chief Superintendent Healy's view on the	
3			matter.	
4	385	Q.	Okay. And I think a direction was figured out as to	
5			how to deal with the PAC meetings, and you have set	12:07
6			that set at page 1566 of your statement, that the	
7			direction on the matter was:	
8				
9			" not to name Sergeant McCabe so as to protect his	
10			identity, even after he was named publicly by others,	12:07
11			point out support for whistleblowers in bringing	
12			forward issues of concern, and that the O'Mahony report	
13			had found no evidence of criminality, and most of the	
14			allegations had not been correct as per Commissioner	
15			Callinan's evidence."	12:08
16				
17			Is that right?	
18		Α.	That's correct.	
19	386	Q.	Okay. And was that figured out before or after PAC	
20			meeting or as a result of it?	12:08
21		Α.	As a result of the meetings. But effectively, the	
22			Commissioner, Commissioner Callinan's view was that the	
23			O'Mahony report was effectively the bible that we were	
24			going to operate from in relation to PAC. So, kind of,	
25			every answer should refer back to the O'Mahony report	12:08
26			because the O'Mahony report was the official position	
27			of the organisation.	
28	387	Q.	Okay. Now, in relation to the D investigation or the D	
29			allegations, was that something which, to your	

1 knowledge, was spoken about in Garda Headquarters? 2 Obviously we know there was mention of it in that meeting on the 9th January, but I don't know if you 3 could help the Tribunal with regard to it being spoken 4 5 about other than by that --12:09 6 I think it was spoke -- yeah. Α. 7 And I am particularly asking you in view of your 388 Q. 8 working relationship with Superintendent Taylor, Commissioner Callinan, Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan. 9 10 It was spoken about in general in Garda HQ, it wasn't Α. 12:09 11 -- I don't recall, apart from the note there of that 12 meeting, of it being discussed in general by those 13 individuals. 14 389 Q. All right. So when you say it was discussed in 15 general, what do you mean by that? 12:09 16 well, there was a general -- there was a general kind Α. 17 of rumour mill within Garda HQ, so it was part that 18 have kind of rumour mill. 19 390 Okay. And is that unspecified people were talking Q. 20 about it? 12:09 21 Yes. Α. 22 All right. And were the Commissioners -- Assistant 391 Q. Commissioner O'Sullivan and Commissioner Callinan 23 24 talking about it? 25 I don't recall them talking about it, no. Α. 12:09 Are you sure about that? 26 392 0. 27 well, all I can say is I don't recall them talking Α. about it. 28 29 Okay. And what about Superintendent Taylor? 393 Q.

- A. I don't recall Superintendent Taylor talking about it either.
- 3 394 Q. Okay. Did you yourself want to figure out what was at 4 the bottom of this, considering you must have known 5 something about it and in view of the high-profile of 12:10
- the whistleblowers, the PAC at the time, what was going on generally with regard to Garda issues?
- 8 A. Well, the information that I had, and I took it on face
 9 value, was that the matter had been investigated and
 10 there was effectively nothing to it. So, as far as I 12:10
 11 was concerned, that was it. It was a rumour. But I
 12 didn't take any credence of it or take it into account
 13 because it was a groundless matter.
- 14 395 Q. Well, how does that fit in with it coming up at a
 15 high-level meeting in preparation for the Public 12:10
 16 Accounts Committee meeting? Do you understand, it
 17 would seem to be a conflict between your --
- 18 A. Well, I understand that --
- 19 396 Q. -- what you are telling the Tribunal.
- A. Well, I understand that, but again, those are my notes
 of the meeting of someone speaking. I didn't raise the
 issue. All I am doing is taking a note of that being
 raised at the meeting.
- 24 397 Q. All right. Well, I suppose on one -- and this is only
 25 one view of matters, you did draft a list of questions
 26 for Commissioner Callinan and one of them refers to the
 27 integrity of the whistleblowers?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 398 Q. So you were definitely asking some questions about the

1 whistleblowers at that stage and their integrity? 2 Yes. Α. To be of assistance to Commissioner Callinan? 3 399 Ο. 4 Α. 5 400 Yes. But did the D matter come into that question at Q. 12:11 6 a11? 7 Not that -- not that I recall, no. But from my Α. 8 perspective it didn't, because from my perspective there wasn't anything in that so I didn't feel that 9 that was a matter -- and I didn't think it was going to 12:11 10 be discussed at PAC in itself. I couldn't imagine 11 12 politicians bringing that up in a public forum and the 13 appropriateness of that, and vice versa for the Garda 14 Commissioner to do likewise either would be, I would 15 have thought, highly inappropriate. So I didn't see 12:12 16 that being a matter. But I think in general there is 17 always issues, and this is not personal to any 18 individual whistleblowers, but if you look at 19 whistleblower coverage in general, and not just in this 20 country but in other countries, there is always 12:12 potentially negative issues around whistleblowers and 21 22 question-marks raised against them, whether that is --

25 401 Q. Okay. So if I could just come to the 23rd January.

happen in a whistle-blowing process.

You were present in the Dáil that day, is that right?

12 · 12

whether that actually has grounds or not, that can

27 A. That's correct. I was sitting in the back row with 28 Superintendent Taylor as the Commissioner gave his

evidence.

23

24

- 1 402 Q. And the deputy commissioner was there, Ms. O'Sullivan, and Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony, isn't that right?
- A. And Assistant Commissioner Twomey, Ken Ruane and
 Michael Culhane as well, and there may have been
- others. There was a significant team, and then there

12:13

12:13

- was also, as far as I recall, someone from the
 Department of Justice as well.
- 8 403 Q. All right. And if I could just, first of all, deal
 9 with the "disgusting" remark made by Commissioner
 10 Callinan on that day. Do you remember it being made
 11 during the course of the hearings?
- 12 A. Yes, I do.

29

- 13 404 Q. And what was your reaction to it?
- 14 A. I was shocked and surprised and concerned.
- 15 405 Q. And if could you explain to me why that is the case?
- 16 well, we had done a lot of preparation, as you have Α. 17 gone through there, we had done a lot of meetings, it 18 was never discussed at the meeting that that kind of 19 approach would be taken to whistleblowers. I also felt 20 that it was a very strong term, very strong language to 12:14 Now I can understand in terms of the meeting had 21 22 been going on for quite some time, the Commissioner had 23 been under -- under sustained questioning and pressure, 24 but I certainly I felt, even though I could see where 25 the Commissioner was coming from in relation to his 12.14 26 concerns about information entering into the public 27 domain, I felt that that was too strong a term to use 28 and I felt it was open to misinterpretation or a

perception would be created that he was attacking

1 individual whistleblowers and calling them individually 2 disgusting, and I thought that would be a significant issue for him as Commissioner and for the organisation. 3 Okay. Well, I suppose, you were there at the time, so 4 406 0. 5 do you remember any reaction from the Garda Síochána 12:14 6 team at the meeting? 7 well, no, one of the issues -- now --Α. 8 407 At the meeting itself, I am asking you. Ο. 9 -- at the meeting itself was that we didn't have a Α. break, and it went on for, I think, I stand to be 10 12:15 11 corrected on this, five hours continuously. I felt if 12 we had actually had a break that we could have 13 addressed the issue, but there was no break, so you couldn't address the issue in the actual PAC situation. 14 15 All right. Well, I suppose you were there to support 408 Q. 12:15 16 Commissioner Callinan, isn't that correct? 17 That's correct, yes. Α. 18 409 So there are different ways of providing or Q. 19 taking remedial action immediately and one of them 20 might be trying to get his attention and say something 12:15 to him, was that considered at all? 21 22 Yes. I suppose that would have been open to me all Α. 23 right, yes, and I could have taken that course of 24 action. I felt from the Commissioner's demeanour that 25 he wouldn't necessarily listen to advice at that stage. 12:15 That was my perception at the time. 26 27 410 And did you think of speaking to an intermediary like Q. 28 Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony and maybe prompt him to

say something to Commissioner Callinan?

I can't recall the line-up. I know Deputy Commissioner 1 Α. 2 O'Sullivan was sitting beside him on one side, I can't recall who was sitting on the other side, but yes, I 3 could have taken that option, but I didn't. 4 All right. Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan has said she 12:16 5 411 Q. passed a note to Commissioner Callinan? 6 7 Yes. Α. 8 412 Did you see that? Q. 9 I saw her writing a note, I saw her passing a note but Α. I couldn't see what was on the note. 10 12:16 11 413 Okay. But you are happy you saw that happen? Q. 12 Yes. Α. 13 414 Okay. Did Commissioner Callinan read it, do you think? Q. 14 Α. I can't recall. I think -- sorry, I think he might 15 have taken a quick glance at it and kind of maybe 12:16 16 pushed it slightly to the side and then continued on. 17 Okay. And do you know what happened the note? 415 Q. 18 No. Α. 19 416 Okay. Did you ever see it? Q. 20 Α. No. 12:17 Did you discuss the matter with Deputy Commissioner 21 417 Q. 22 O'Sullivan afterwards? 23 I did, yes, I would have -- we would have -- I can't Α. 24 remember was it later on that day or the next day, we would have had a conversation where I would have 25 12.17 expressed my concern about "disgusting" I would have 26 27 also expressed my concern in relation to that to Assistant Commissioner Twomey and Assistant 28

Commissioner O'Mahony in the hope that they could maybe

- persuade the Commissioner to move off the "disgusting" 1 2 term. 3 Did you discuss the matter with 418 Q. All right. 4 Superintendent Taylor at all?
- 5 Yes, I did, yes, and I think the date is the -- it's Α. 12:17 6 maybe a week after --
- 7 Not immediately? 419 Q.
- 8 -- the PAC. Myself and Superintendent Taylor would Α. have discussed it, yes, immediately after PAC, yes, and 9 we both would have had a concern in relation to 10 12 · 17 11 "disgusting", yes.

- 12 And a week afterwards, what happened in relation to it? 420 Q.
- A week afterwards it was obvious that the "disgusting" 13 Α. 14 term was -- there was significant negative media and 15 political commentary in relation to it. It was, I 16 felt, causing -- undermining the Commissioner's 17 position and undermining the organisation. I felt that 18 it was important for him to move off that "disgusting" 19 term. I discussed it with Superintendent Taylor. 20 agreed. We felt it was best if we went to Commissioner 12:18 Callinan personally, so we arranged to meet him on a 21 22 We went and discussed it with him. 23 open to the suggestion of doing something about it. 24 I sent him a proposal later on that day that he would 25 do a radio interview and basically move off the "disgusting" term and basically I would hope ultimately 26 27 withdraw it, but certainly move back from it and say that it was too strong a word to use. 28
- 29 All right. And I think that proposal is attached to 421 Ο.

1			your statement, is that right?	
2		Α.	That's correct.	
3	422	Q.	It appears at tab C to your statement, which is at	
4			page sorry, it's 1628 it starts at. 1629, sorry,	
5			Mr. Kavanagh.	12:19
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	423	Q.	So it would appear you sent an email to the	
8			Commissioner and Superintendent Taylor	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	424	Q.	setting out, you were proposing that there would be	12:20
11			an interview between the Commissioner and Seán O'Rourke	
12			to address issues in relation to the fixed charge	
13			penalty notices and also to put out a message about the	
14			good work An Garda Síochána do every day of the week	
15			and all of the members of An Garda Síochána?	12:20
16		Α.	Yes. I felt that the, kind of, the "disgusting" issue	
17			had taken away from that and I felt there was a need to	
18			bring that back into context and demonstrate that there	
19			is a lot more going on in the organisation than just	
20			that one issue.	12:20
21	425	Q.	All right. And then, at the same time, that a press	
22			release be sent to the national media announcing	
23			various initiatives in relation to the fixed charge	
24			penalty notice process?	
25		Α.	Yes. I felt that by being more open and transparent	12:20
26			around how we handled the FCPN process that that would	
27			gradually build trust among the public and politicians	
28			that we had made the required changes needed to the	
29			FCPN process.	

2	426	Q.	Commissioner?	
3		۸	Yes. We sat down and we met with him and we discussed	
		Α.		
4			it for approximately, I would say, 30 to 45 minutes.	
5	427	Q.	And what came of that?	12:21
6		Α.	The Commissioner said he would consider it and so I	
7			said I will send you a proposal in writing, which I	
8			sent at later on that day. He said he would	
9			consider it over the weekend. He rang me on the Monday	
10			morning at approximately 9:00am to say that he had	12:21
11			considered it but he wasn't prepared to change his	
12			position at this time.	
13	428	Q.	All right. Did you leave the matter rest there?	
14		Α.	I did, yes.	
15	429	Q.	You had done your bit. In relation to the day of the	12:21
16			PAC meeting, 23rd January, no doubt you are aware of	
17			the evidence that Deputy McGuinness has given to the	
18			Tribunal?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	430	Q.	Did you hear anything of that conversation?	12:22
21		Α.	No, my I was aware that they had a conversation	
22			because that's kind of the standard practice that the	
23			Chair of the PAC or Chair of Justice or an	
24			Oireachtas Committee would come down and speak to the	
25			Commissioner.	12:22
26	431	Q.	Yes.	
27		Α.	But my focus at the end of such occasions is actually	
28			speaking to the media, to get kind of their perception	
29			or their view of how it went, what particular issues	

1 they were going to focus in on and whether they had any 2 questions that needed clarifying. 3 432 Q. So you didn't hear any comments made by Commissioner Callinan --4 5 Α. No. 12:22 6 433 -- to Deputy McGuinness? Q. 7 Α. No. 8 434 Did Superintendent Taylor tell you about any of them? Q. 9 Α. No. Okay. And in relation to Mr. McCarthy's 10 All right. 435 Q. 12.22 11 evidence this morning and Mr. Deasy's evidence as well 12 on Monday, were you aware of any of those comments 13 allegedly made by -- because they are disputed by 14 Commissioner Callinan -- to those people, prior to the 15 Disclosures Tribunal being set up? 12:23 16 No, I wasn't party to those or privy to those Α. 17 conversations. 18 okay. Had you heard anything about them? 436 Q. 19 Α. No. 20 437 Now, if we can go to the next day, the 24th Q. Okay. 12:23 21 January, the Commissioner had an engagement in Dundalk 22 that day. 23 That's correct. Α. 24 And you were there as well, is that correct? 438 Q. 25 It would be standard practice that the 12:23 Α. That's correct. 26 director of communications and generally the press 27 officer would attend with the Commissioner when he is

doing major media briefings or interviews.

All right. And I think at some stage Commissioner

28

29

439

Ο.

- Callinan spoke about Deputy McGuinness, is that correct?
- 3 Α. That's correct. There was -- we were preparing for the media briefing in the superintendent's office and 4 5 Commissioner Callinan, I can't remember did he get a 12:24 phone call or did he make a phone call, but following 6 from the end of the phone call he said that he had an 7 8 offer from Deputy McGuinness or there was an 9 opportunity meet Deputy McGuinness as the Chair of PAC 10 to discuss whether Sergeant McCabe would appear at PAC 12.24 11 or not.
- 12 440 Q. Okay. And what was your reaction to this?
- well, the Commissioner kind of basically opened it up 13 Α. 14 to the room and said what do you think? My view at the 15 time was that the organisation's view was that Sergeant 12:24 16 McCabe shouldn't be appearing at PAC because it may undermine the Commissioner's ability to oversee a 17 18 hierarchical command and control organisation and then 19 there was also concerns over data protection issues as 20 So, taking on board the organisation's view I 12:24 felt that if there was an opportunity to meet the Chair 21 22 of the PAC, to have a discussion with him on that 23 basis, that it was worthwhile doing even if it was a 24 bit of a last chance saloon scenario but it was worth 25 trying. My concern was that given the sensitive nature 12:25 of the media briefing and then also events -- an event 26 27 later on that night, my concern was primarily that the Commissioner did -- that there was time to do the media 28 29 briefing and then get him back in time for that event

1			later on this evening. Because if he'd have missed or	
2			been late to that event in particular it would have had	
3			significant reputational damage to the Commissioner.	
4	441	Q.	All right. Where did you understand that meeting was	
5			to happen, the meeting with Deputy McGuinness?	12:25
6		Α.	Somewhere in a hotel in Dublin. I don't think the	
7			actual location was mentioned at that meeting.	
8	442	Q.	And did anybody at any time think it would be an idea	
9			for somebody to accompany the Commissioner at that	
10			meeting to that meeting?	12:26
11		Α.	No.	
12	443	Q.	All right. Were you I know you hadn't been working	
13			with the guards for that long, but had you come across	
14			a situation before where a meeting was arranged at very	
15			short notice between the Commissioner and the Chairman	12:26
16			of PAC, which was at that time considering the fixed	
17			charge penalty notices, without any minutes being kept	
18			or anything of that nature?	
19		Α.	No.	
20	444	Q.	And do you think in retrospect it was a terribly good	12:26
21			idea for the Commissioner to go to that meeting?	
22		Α.	Not on the basis that it was going to be I wasn't	
23			aware it was going to be held, for instance, in a car	
24			park or anything else like that. I think it would have	
25			been of benefit to all parties if there had have been	12:26
26			secretaries from both sides at such a meeting.	
27	445	Q.	All right. But you stand over that it was a good idea	
28			for the Commissioner to discuss the matter with Deputy	
29			McGuinness in relation to	

		Α.	on the basis that it was in relation to the appearance	
2			of Sergeant McCabe at PAC in terms of the concern that	
3			the Commissioner had in relation to being able to	
4			control a command and control organisation and the	
5			potential for sensitive data to be provided to an	12:27
6			Oireachtas Committee and that potentially to be in	
7			breach of data protection.	
8	446	Q.	And were you aware that the Commissioner had been	
9			thinking about writing to the Committee with regard to	
10			setting up an alternative way for Sergeant McCabe to	12:27
11			deal with the fixed charge penalty notice matters	
12			otherwise than by way of appearing before the	
13			Committee?	
14		Α.	I was aware of correspondence between the Commissioner	
15			and the Committee in terms of Sergeant McCabe	12:27
16			appearing, but I wasn't aware of the detail of that	
17			correspondence.	
18	447	Q.	Yes. All right. And were you aware that it had been	
19			proposed that he send further correspondence in	
20			relation to nominating a chief superintendent to deal	12:28
21			with the matter?	
22		Α.	I don't recall being aware of that.	
23	448	Q.	Okay. Was it something that had been brought to your	
24			attention by Superintendent Taylor or Commissioner	
25			Callinan at all?	12:28
26		Α.	No, I don't recall that.	
27	449	Q.	Okay.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Ms. Leader, I wonder could we leave it until	
29			half past one.	

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, AFTER LUNCH:	
2				
3	450	Q.	MS. LEADER: If I can just take you back to the 24th	
4			January 2014, you said Commissioner Callinan put it out	
5			to the room about meeting Deputy McGuinness, is that	13:33
6			right?	
7		Α.	That's correct.	
8	451	Q.	And as far as you know, there had been some telephone	
9			communication between Deputy McGuinness and	
10			Commissioner Callinan just prior to that, is that	13:33
11			right?	
12		Α.	That's correct.	
13	452	Q.	And you're not sure who initiated the telephone	
14			contact?	
15		Α.	No.	13:33
16	453	Q.	Had there been any discussion between the Commissioner	
17			and yourself or maybe between you and	
18			Superintendent Taylor prior to the 24th about meeting	
19			Deputy McGuinness or meeting Sergeant McCabe, as	
20			suggested, do you remember Deputy McGuinness suggested	13:33
21			meeting with an employee who had a difficulty?	
22		Α.	No, I don't recall that being a matter of conversation	
23			between us.	
24	454	Q.	When you say you don't recall it, is it possible that	
25			you did have some sort of conversation along those	13:34
26			lines?	
27		Α.	It's possible when we were in Dundalk it may have been	
28			mentioned that there is a potential for that, depending	
29			on phone calls, but I can't recall exactly.	

- 1 455 Q. All right. And when it was put out to the room in
 2 Dundalk about whether the Commissioner should meet with
- Deputy McGuinness, who was in the room?
- 4 A. Myself, Superintendent Taylor, there were other
- officers there, but I'm not a hundred percent on who

13:34

- 6 they may be.
- 7 456 Q. All right. Well, Superintendent Taylor in his
- 8 interview, it's at page 140 of the materials, and it
- 9 would appear that Assistant Commissioner Kenny was
- there at the time, does that sound right to you?
- 11 A. That does, yes.
- 12 457 Q. He names you. Detective Superintendent Clyne, does
- that sound right?
- 14 A. Yes, that is potentially right, yes.
- 15 458 Q. I think he was involved in the particular investigation 13:35
- 16 that was under consideration?
- 17 A. Particular investigation, yes.
- 18 459 Q. And what about Superintendent Gerry Curley?
- 19 A. That sounds right, yes.
- 20 460 Q. Can you think of anybody else who may have been there?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 461 Q. Was it ever suggested that the matter should be
- considered by the deputy commissioner prior to a
- 24 decision being taken?
- 25 A. I don't remember the deputy commissioner coming up in
- conversation at all.
- 27 462 Q. And what did you understand from the Commissioner at
- 28 that time the purpose of the meeting with Deputy
- 29 McGuinness?

- 1 I suppose the purpose of the meeting was to try and Α. 2 persuade the chair of PAC not to call Sergeant McCabe because of the concerns that the Commissioner had, that 3 it would undermine his ability to lead a hierarchical 4 5 command and control organisation if Garda members could 13:36 6 be invited in, without his knowledge and permission, 7 into an Oireachtas committee, and also the concern that 8 sensitive information in relation to individuals might
- 10 463 Q. Okay. So you think the primary purpose was to try and 13:36

 11 persuade Deputy McGuinness not to call Sergeant McCabe

 12 as a witness to PAC?

be provided by a public means via the PAC.

9

- 13 A. Yes. Or, failing that, to find a mechanism so that it 14 wouldn't be held in public.
- 15 464 Q. And was that discussed at all between the members in the room when the Commissioner said, should I meet
 17 Deputy McGuinness?
- 18 I think the discussion -- well, it wasn't really -- it Α. 19 was a very short discussion, from my memory. It was 20 kind of more, whether I should meet -- whether Commissioner Callinan should meet Deputy McGuinness 21 22 there and then, within the -- in the immediate, within the next hour or two. I don't think there was really 23 24 that level of discussion in terms of the nature of the 25 meeting or the appropriateness of the meeting. That wasn't really discussed, as far as I can recall. 26

13:36

13:37

27 465 Q. When the Commissioner came back from the meeting, was 28 there a further discussion as to what had transpired, 29 keeping in mind that he'd already discussed the meeting

1	•			
	nrıor	ŤΩ	٦Ť	happening?
-	P O .	-0		

- 2 No, the last time that I saw -- the time that I saw the Α. 3 Commissioner next was just before that significant event that he had to attend. We didn't have a 4 5 conversation in relation to it. He went -- I was 13:37 standing outside the venue, he went -- I could see him 6 7 and he went past me, and we might have nodded to each 8 other, but I didn't have a conversation with him in relation to it or the outcome of it, then or 9 afterwards. 10 13:37
- 11 466 Q. Were you not a bit curious as to what had transpired, 12 keeping in mind how high profile the Public Accounts 13 Committee matter was at that time and the mention of 14 the word "disgusting" and your concern about that?
- 15 A. Yes, I was curious, but, at the same time, it's the
 16 Commissioner's decision, so whatever had decided
 17 between the Commissioner and the chair of PAC was a
 18 matter between them.

13:38

- 19 467 Q. Did you discuss the matter with Superintendent Taylor at any time?
- I think Superintendent Taylor, the next day, confirmed 21 Α. 22 that they had actually met, because at that stage there was talk of them meeting, but, actually, it hadn't been 23 24 confirmed to me that they had actually met. So I think 25 it was the next day that Superintendent Taylor 26 confirmed to me that they had met. But I don't think 27 he had any details of the actual nature of the meeting or the outcome of the meeting. 28
- 29 468 Q. Now, we know from yesterday's evidence that Mr. Kean

1 made certain comments about the whistleblowers on the 2 Marian Finucane show, which was on the following day, 3 isn't that right? That appears to be the case, yes. 4 Α. 5 469 And you're familiar with the evidence of Q. 13:39 6 yesterday? 7 Yes, I am. Α. 8 470 Now, it was put to Mr. Kean that he was referred to the Ο. 9 Press Office when he made -- when he raised the matter with Chief Superintendent O'Sullivan. Are you familiar 13:39 10 11 with that? 12 I'm familiar with that, yes. Α. 13 And do you know anything about that? 471 Q. 14 Α. No, I don't. 15 472 well, in the normal course, if a reference had been Q. 13:39 16 made to the Press Office in relation to an upcoming 17 media programme, and I'm not sure what the -- how many 18 people listen to Marian Finucane on a Sunday, but it's 19 a lot, isn't it? Yes, it is. 20 Α. 13:39 Would you hear about it? 21 473 Ο. 22 Yes, I would be -- well, not in advance, not in that Α. 23 nature. It would be very unusual for the Garda Press 24 Office to be informed of an independent person 25 appearing on a programme, unless that programme felt 13:39 26 that that person was going to put certain information 27 into the public domain that they had to provide balance 28 So it would be very, very unusual for the Press 29 Office to be contacted in that manner by an independent

1 person. 2 well, isn't that the point, really, that he was, on one 474 Q. 3 version of events, that he was contacting the Press Office for information in relation to the 4 5 whistleblowers --13:40 6 Yes. Α. 7 475 -- so he'd be properly briefed about it, as he looked Q. 8 at matters, when the programme was to be aired on the 9 Sunday? 10 Yes, that would be very unusual. Α. 13:40 11 476 And did Superintendent Taylor speak to you about it? Q. 12 Α. No. 13 when did you first hear about it? 477 Q. 14 Α. The first I heard of that was in the evidence that 15 Mr. Kean gave. 13:40 16 And his statement? 478 Q. 17 And his statement that I would have read in advance of Α. this, yes. 18 19 479 Okay. Was it discussed in any way when RTÉ were sued Q. 20 in relation to the matter and Mr. Kean? 13:40 21 No. As far as I was concerned or aware at that time. Α. 22 that was a matter between Mr. Kean and RTÉ. 23 Now, if we can just -- the official response to 480 Q. 24 Sergeant McCabe's cooperation with the O'Mahony inquiry 25 was that he hadn't cooperated, isn't that the case? 13 · 41 Yes, I believe Commissioner Callinan kind of outlined 26 Α. 27 that at PAC. All right. And then it turned out that there had been 28 481 Q.

a recording of a particular conversation in relation to

_			being interviewed by Assistant Commissioner o Manony,	
2			isn't that right?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	482	Q.	And could you tell the Tribunal about that, please?	
5		Α.	There seemed to be an issue coming through in the media	13:41
6			that the Commissioner was of the view that Sergeant	
7			McCabe hadn't cooperated with the O'Mahony	
8			investigation. As far as I recall, Sergeant McCabe put	
9			out a press release or made a comment that included a	
10			transcript of the conversation between him and the	13:42
11			chief superintendent who had been sent to supposedly	
12			give the instruction to cooperate with the O'Mahony	
13			Tribunal.	
14	483	Q.	Yes.	
15		Α.	Or the O'Mahony investigation, excuse me. And it	13:42
16			showed a bit of a variance in terms of whether that	
17			instruction was necessarily as clear-cut as	
18			Commissioner Callinan felt.	
19	484	Q.	Yes. Did you take any steps on foot of that media	
20			controversy?	13:42
21		Α.	Well, I suppose I did consider whether there would be	
22			queries in relation to it. As part of that, that	
23			wouldn't be unusual, I'd look at situations, individual	
24			situations or controversies as they arise and I have to	
25			look at all the different potential media questions	13:42
26			that we may get and potential responses to it.	
27			Generally, my process is that I kind of have a think	
28			about it, jot down either in my notebook or send myself	
29			an email so it is kind of fresh in my mind the next	

Т			morning, kind of infilial thoughts, and then have a fook	
2			at it and start to draft potential statements or	
3			responses to queries.	
4	485	Q.	And I think you did that on the 26th February 2014 in	
5			relation to this one, is that correct?	13:43
6		Α.	I did, yes.	
7	486	Q.	And you sent an email to yourself, which went no	
8			further than that, is that right?	
9		Α.	That's correct.	
10	487	Q.	And that's at page 1637.	13:43
11		Α.	Yes. So that was my consideration at the time and I	
12			considered it then. I sent it to myself at two minutes	
13			to eleven o'clock at night. And when I looked at it	
14			the next morning, I decided it wasn't a good idea in	
15			terms of or it wasn't a good approach in terms of a	13:43
16			response to a potential media query, so I did nothing	
17			further with it.	
18	488	Q.	Okay. Insofar as there is a reference to the 13,000	
19			colleagues and one member of the force being able to	
20			break the rules, it resonates with the, I suppose,	13:43
21			"disgusting" comment made by the Commissioner at the	
22			PAC on the 23rd January?	
23		Α.	Yes. Well, I suppose as part of my responsibilities, I	
24			have to reflect the organisation's position.	
25	489	Q.	Yes.	13:44
26		Α.	And that was the organisation's position at that time,	
27			in not those exact words, but it was the organisation's	
28			position, particularly Commissioner Callinan's	
29			position, that Sergeant McCabe had not cooperated with	

- 1 the O'Mahony investigation.
- 2 490 Q. Okay. So I suppose, Mr. McLindon, it's fair enough to
- 3 say that, on your evidence and the information you've

13 · 44

13:45

- 4 provided to the Tribunal, that Commissioner Callinan
- 5 had a certain hostility towards Sergeant McCabe --
- 6 A. Well --
- 7 491 Q. -- it would appear from what you have said today?
- 8 A. I don't know about the word "hostility", but certainly
- 9 he had a strong viewpoint in relation to the fact that
- 10 he felt that Sergeant McCabe had not cooperated with
- the O'Mahony investigation.
- 12 492 Q. Right. And that was the message that was to be sent
- out, is that --
- 14 A. Well, that was the message that the Commissioner said
- 15 himself.
- 16 493 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. As far as I can recall.
- 18 494 Q. All right.
- 19 A. Now, I suppose I would have a different position in
- relation to that, without the specifics of it, without
- 21 necessarily the specifics of it, because I wasn't aware
- vis-à-vis what the relationship was in terms of the
- cooperation element or not, but I suppose if you want a
- 24 more reflective position of my view at the time, it was
- of the next day, that was sent on the 26th, and the
- next day I sent an email to the Deputy Commissioner
- 27 Nóirín O'Sullivan on the 27nd/2nd where I outlined what
- I felt should be our media strategy in relation to the
- 29 Garda Inspectorate report, where I felt that the

1			whistleblowers should be complimented on bringing	
2			forward issues. So that was more reflective of what I	
3			felt our PR strategy should be.	
4	495	Q.	Yes. And I will just come to that. It's at page 1369	
5			of the materials.	13:46
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	496	Q.	So it's an email addressed to Ms. O'Sullivan, saying:	
8				
9			"Subject to seeing the final version of the report, I	
10			feel that our best approach is to take the criticism on	13:46
11			the chin by welcoming the Inspectorate's analysis of	
12			how further enhancements can be made and committing to	
13			their implementation, while noting that we have already	
14			made improvements to the system that we are working	
15			with."	13:46
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	497	Q.	"It may also be a useful opportunity to flag the	
18			positive contribution made by the confidential	
19			reporters without conceding on the central points of no	
20			criminality and that most of the allegations did not	13:46
21			stand up to scrutiny."	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	498	Q.	Now, that was addressed to the deputy commissioner at	
24			the time. Was there any reason for that, that it was	
25			the deputy commissioner and not the Commissioner that	13:46
26			it was sent to?	
27		Α.	My recollection is that I think the deputy commissioner	
28			asked me for a potential media strategy to prepare for	
29			this. My recollection is, the Inspectorate report and	

1			our response to the Inspectorate report would fall to	
2			the deputy commissioner, who at the time was deputy	
3			commissioner Operations, and, as far as I can recall,	
4			deputy commissioner Governance and Strategy. So she	
5			held two portfolios. So, under those portfolios, she	13:47
6			would have been dealing with the Inspectorate report.	
7	499	Q.	Well, would you expect that email would have been	
8			forwarded to the Commissioner to deal with the matter	
9			ultimately, or maybe you wouldn't? I don't know.	
10		Α.	I don't know, to be honest with you, quite frankly.	13:47
11	500	Q.	Right. Okay. In any event, the acknowledgment of the	
12			confidential reporter's role in the fixed charge	
13			penalty notices saga did not make it into the final	
14			press release, isn't that correct?	
15		Α.	That's correct.	13:47
16	501	Q.	And did you draft the final press release?	
17		Α.	I did, yes.	
18	502	Q.	And I think that is dated 12th March 2014?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	503	Q.	And it's just been distributed now. It's at page 3003	13:47
21			of the materials, and it will be seen there in its	
22			entirety, but there was no praise of whistleblowers or	
23			confidential reporters in it, is that right?	
24		Α.	No, there was not.	
25	504	Q.	And this was another occasion where a suggestion had	13:48
26			been put forward by somebody of acknowledging the	
27			positive contribution by whistleblowers or confidential	
28			reporters that hadn't been taken on board, isn't that	
29			right?	

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 505 Q. You've referred to one earlier on made by Chief
- 3 Superintendent Healy?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 506 Q. Isn't that right?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 507 Q. And there was also -- you had suggested to Commissioner

13 · 48

13:49

- 8 Callinan that maybe he should do a media event to deal
- 9 with the "disgusting" comment, and that wasn't taken up
- 10 either?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 508 Q. So you see what I mean, Mr. McLindon, that there is a
- pattern emerging there, isn't there, on your evidence,
- in relation to the attitude of Commissioner Callinan to
- the whistleblowers?
- 16 A. Well, certainly I think it's fair to say, yes, that
- 17 there was -- Commissioner Callinan had a position and
- 18 he wasn't moving from that position.
- 19 509 Q. Okay. And was that a position, to your knowledge,
- shared by Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan and thereafter 13:49
- 21 Acting Commissioner O'Sullivan?
- 22 A. No, it wasn't shared, as far as I was aware.
- 23 510 Q. If we could go on to March. Later on in March of that
- year, I think it's the 20th March, the now-Taoiseach,
- Mr. Varadkar, had at that stage said Mr. McCabe was
- 26 distinguished and not disgusting?
- 27 A. That's my recollection, yes.
- 28 511 Q. Yes. And then we see a media release in relation to
- that matter on the 20/3/2014, and that's at page 2999

Τ			of the materials. It should have been just circulated	
2			to you, Mr. McLindon.	
3		Α.	Okay. Sorry, yes.	
4	512	Q.	So earlier on in the month in relation to the press	
5			release of the 12th, the "disgusting" remark was	13:50
6			clarified, and that's at page 3004 of the materials, it	
7			had already been done?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	513	Q.	"And there is one other matter, I'll just read it out,	
10			that I would like to address and which has been in the	13:51
11			public domain for some time and which refers to the use	
12			of the term 'disgusting' at my recent Public Accounts	
13			Committee appearance on the 23rd January 2014. I want	
14			to clarify that my use of that term was not in	
15			reference to the character of either Sergeant McCabe or	13:51
16			former Garda Wilson, but the manner in which personal	
17			and sensitive data was inappropriately appearing in the	
18			public domain without regard to due process and fair	
19			procedures."	
20				13:51
21			And then it's stated:	
22				
23			"I stated at the PAC, and reiterate now, my absolute	
24			support and commitment to any member of An Garda	
25			Síochána who reports wrongdoing of any kind."	13:51
26				
27			And then he says:	
28				
29			"In conclusion, I am conscious that an examination of	

Т			some of these matters is currently being undertaken by	
2			GSOC and it would not be appropriate to comment further	
3			until GSOC is finished its work."	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	514	Q.	And then on the you drafted that	13:51
6		Α.	I did.	
7	515	Q.	for the Commissioner. And was it the result of both	
8			of you working together on it, perhaps, with	
9			Superintendent Taylor or did you just present it to the	
10			Commissioner?	13:52
11		Α.	Generally, the process is that I would do a draft.	
12			Depending on the circumstances, there would be a	
13			meeting in relation to it. I don't recall there being	
14			a meeting in relation to this. So I would draft it,	
15			send it to the Commissioner's office and the	13:52
16			Commissioner's office then would talk to the	
17			Commissioner about it and make any changes that the	
18			Commissioner wanted and then confirm that it was the	
19			final version to be distributed and when it was to be	
20			distributed.	13:52
21	516	Q.	Okay. And then later on in that month, on the 20th	
22			March, there was a briefing which emanates from the	
23			Press Office, and that's at page 2999 of the materials.	
24				
25			"Briefing text on the record. Line to be used against	13:52
26			Minister Varadkar's comments today, 20/3/2014."	
27				
28			And it refers back to the clarification of his use of	
29			the word "disgusting".	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 517 Q. And it would seem that's accredited to you. Did you
- 3 draft that?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 518 Q. Did you discuss the matter with former Commissioner

13:53

13:53

13:54

13:54

- 6 Callinan --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 519 Q. -- prior?
- 9 A. I would have done -- prior to releasing anything in the
- 10 Commissioner's name, I would have to discuss it with
- them to make sure they were happy with that position.
- 12 So it was basically a reiteration of the previous
- 13 statement, but obviously given the then-Minister
- 14 Varadkar's comments had heightened media interest in
- that issue, so I felt that it was important that we
- 16 reiterated our stance and the organisation's stance on
- 17 that matter.
- 18 520 Q. And I think in actual fact the Commissioner had
- 19 actually left the organisation at that time, is that
- 20 correct, four days after?
- 21 A. Four days after, yes.
- 22 521 Q. Now, I think it's apparent from your own evidence that
- you regard the word "disgusting" as -- it's fairly
- 24 emotive language, isn't that right?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 522 Q. It's strong?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 523 Q. And it was unscripted?
- 29 A. Yes.

1	524	Q.	Yes. And it's something that the Commissioner was	
2			obviously happy to say in public, and it was a while	
3			afterwards that he clarified it in any way, isn't that	
4			right?	
5		Α.	Yes. Well, I suppose, and I'm not here to speak on	13:54
6			behalf of Commissioner Callinan, but	
7	525	Q.	Yes. Well, there was some clarification on the day	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	526	Q.	but thereafter you had advised him, isn't that	
10			right	13:55
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	527	Q.	to attend a media event?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	528	Q.	Particularly with reference to that word?	
15		Α.	Yes. That to move off that word and to kind of	13:55
16			basically say that he regretted using that word and it	
17			was too strong a term to use.	
18	529	Q.	Okay. So it would suggest that there was a very	
19			emotional response to the whistleblowers by former	
20			Commissioner Callinan?	13:55
21		Α.	Well, certainly I think you could say that Commissioner	
22			Callinan was exercised by the situation. He felt that	
23			his position was that the O'Mahony report was the true	
24			position and that the media reports that were	
25			suggesting otherwise, he found that that was kind of	13:55
26			undermining of the organisation. I think he felt that	
27			it was potentially undermining of his position. And I	
28			think as portrayed by his public comments, he felt that	
29			certain members of An Garda Síochána weren't behaving	

1 in line with what you -- what was expected of them. Ι 2 think that is a fair summation of his view. 3 530 Q. And he was happy to publicly state that, isn't that riaht? 4 5 Yes, he stated that publicly, yes. Α. 13:56 6 531 So I suppose the next thing I wanted to ask you, Q. Mr. McLindon: If he was happy to go that far in 7 8 public, one would wonder was he going much further in private in relation to the whistleblowers, on a less 9 public forum or a less public stage? 10 13:56 11 Α. Well, certainly not in any conversation that I have 12 ever had with Commissioner Callinan did he go down that 13 route. 14 532 Q. well, you understand that we have had a series 15 of people come in, one of them this morning, which 13:56 16 attribute Commissioner Callinan with saying that 17 Sergeant McCabe was accused of sexual assault matters? 18 Yes. Α. 19 533 You understand that? Q. 20 I do. Α. 13:56 We have had Deputy McGuinness in relation to the 21 534 0. 22 matter. 23 Yes. Α. 24 And we have had Mr. McCarthy in relation to the matter. 535 Q. 25 We've looked at your own notes this morning in relation 13:56 26 to preparing for the PAC. 27 Mm-hmm. Α. 28 536 So I would have to suggest to you that these were

things, taking that side of the case for the moment,

Ο.

29

2 Mm-hmm. Α. 3 537 -- that would suggest that he was happy to put a Ο. 4 message out there that Sergeant McCabe was other than a 5 person who was bringing things forward in the public 13:57 interest? 6 well, all I can say in relation to that is that he 7 Α. 8 never said anything to me in relation to such matters insofar as that I should put those matters into the 9 public domain. 10 13:57 11 538 All right. Did Superintendent Taylor say anything to Q. 12 you about it? 13 Α. In terms of? Sorry, excuse me, I don't quite 14 understand. 15 A campaign --539 Q. 13:57 16 Α. No. 17 540 -- if I can put it in those terms? Q. 18 Α. No. 19 541 You will appreciate that Superintendent Taylor has a Q. 20 different view of that? 13:57 21 Yes. Α. 22 If can I just maybe open up parts of his statement to 542 Q. 23 you. What he says at page 118 of the materials is 24 that -- it might be -- it's Volume 1, yes. 25 come up in front of you. 13:58 26 Α. Okay. 27 543 "My role as Garda Press Officer was mainly reactionary Q. and included keeping the Commissioner briefed on what 28

not deciding anything --

1

29

was happening day to day. I was the public face of An

Т			Garda Stochana. Again, I would Classify my role as	
2			being reactionary and the director role was, I have	
3			said, to be more strategic. However, the director	
4			would also be fully briefed as to what was going on at	
5			all times. The director would have dealt with press	13:58
6			queries if there were any set interviews and would have	
7			dealt with these solely."	
8				
9			So he is suggesting that you knew what he says was	
10			going on, that he was told by former Commissioner	13:59
11			Callinan to brief negatively against Sergeant McCabe.	
12		Α.	I wasn't aware of any campaign of any such nature.	
13	544	Q.	Well, you worked closely with Superintendent Taylor,	
14			isn't that right?	
15		Α.	That's correct.	13:59
16	545	Q.	You were in close physical proximity office-wise, isn't	
17			that right?	
18		Α.	That's correct.	
19	546	Q.	And you were also present at very many public	
20			occasions, isn't that right?	13:59
21		Α.	Correct.	
22	547	Q.	And there was no reason, really, to keep you out of the	
23			loop, from Superintendent Taylor's point of view, in	
24			relation to what was going on?	
25		Α.	Well, all I can say is that Superintendent Taylor never	13:59
26			discussed anything of that nature with me.	
27	548	Q.	You see, on page 1119 of the materials, again we have	
28			Superintendent Taylor:	

Τ			"when Andrew McLindon took up the position, following a	
2			public appointments competition for a five-year term, I	
3			briefed him fully on the office, on the roles and	
4			responsibilities and parameters we were working to. I	
5			prepared a briefing document for him at that time."	14:00
6				
7			You agree with all of that, isn't that right?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	549	Q.	And then:	
10				14:00
11			"From then on, I always briefed Andrew in the same way	
12			as I did the Commissioner and Deputy Commissioner."	
13				
14			And what he is referring to there is in relation to	
15			media queries about Sergeant McCabe, you understand	14:00
16			that?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	550	Q.	And what he would do in response to those media	
19			queries, i.e. brief negatively if he got the	
20			opportunity to do so?	14:01
21		Α.	No.	
22	551	Q.	You understand?	
23		Α.	No, sorry, that's yes, he was quite that was what	
24			he was doing in his role, was to keep me, the deputy	
25			commissioner and the Commissioner briefed on media	14:01
26			queries relating to any issue in relation to the FCPN	
27			or any controversial matter, but, no, he never would	
28			have briefed me on, this is the line that I'm putting	
29			out in a negative manner in relation to Sergeant	

- 1 McCabe. I was not aware of anything of that nature.
- 2 552 Q. But, I mean, Mr. McLindon, it wasn't entirely
- inconsistent with what you were doing, say, for
- 4 instance, when you sent off that email reminder to
- 5 yourself in relation to the taping of conversations and 14:01
- 6 the response to it, that it's not entirely inconsistent
- 7 with --
- 8 A. Well, that was a passing thought that I sent to myself.
- 9 553 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. And I didn't do anything with it further. So I think

14 · 01

14:02

14.02

- there's a significant difference between a passing
- thought that you send to yourself and then actively
- engaging in a so-called smear campaign against somebody
- else. Also, I think my record, track record in terms
- of what I suggested as a PR strategy throughout the
- 16 process demonstrates that I felt that the organisation
- 17 should have been more vocally supportive of
- 18 whistleblowers and the fact that they had made a
- 19 positive contribution to the organisation.
- 20 554 Q. Yes. That was your thoughts on the matter, isn't that
- correct, your personal thoughts on the matter?
- 22 A. In relation to the email that I wrote to myself?
- 23 555 Q. No, no, in relation to how the organisation should deal
- 24 with whistleblowers?
- A. Well, that was my professional communications advice.
- 26 556 O. Your professional advice?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 557 Q. In relation to -- and that advice wasn't followed,
- isn't that correct --

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 558 Q. -- insofar as Commissioner Callinan dealt with matters?
- 3 A. Yes, on the key matters it wasn't followed, no.
- 4 559 Q. And when you went to prepare an email, and I'm just
- 5 taking this as an instance, for instance, in relation

14 · 03

14:03

14:03

- 6 to a potential reaction to Sergeant McCabe taping
- 7 conversations, you understand what I am saying?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 560 Q. You prepared it in line with what you understood the
- 10 Commissioner's reaction would be?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 561 Q. That's right. So what I'm suggesting to you is: What
- 13 Superintendent Taylor says here, in relation to you
- 14 being aware of taking any opportunity that was
- available to the Gardaí to brief negatively against
- 16 Sergeant McCabe, do you understand that --
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 562 Q. -- that the email you sent in February is consistent
- with that, because that was an opportunity to brief
- 20 negatively against -- I know you thought twice about
- 21 it?
- 22 A. Well, I did more than think twice about it, I didn't
- actually do anything with it.
- 24 563 Q. You didn't send it?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 564 Q. But it would suggest that you knowledge that this was
- an opportunity to brief negatively against Sergeant
- 28 McCabe?
- 29 A. I had knowledge that that -- my consideration was that

1			this was a potential opportunity to defend the	
2			organisation.	
3	565	Q.	Yes.	
4		Α.	And to establish the organisation's position in	
5			relation to the cooperation, or otherwise, of Sergeant	14:03
6			McCabe.	
7	566	Q.	Okay. But you had no knowledge of a campaign?	
8		Α.	Absolutely not.	
9	567	Q.	Okay. If I can just turn then to page 127 of the	
10			materials, and if we go down to line 186, you were	14:04
11			asked Superintendent Taylor was asked:	
12				
13			"Whether any other person was present when these	
14			instructions, the instructions being to brief	
15			negatively against Sergeant McCabe, were given to me,	14:04
16			or whether any other person was aware of these	
17			instructions given to me by Commissioner Callinan."	
18				
19			He says:	
20				14:04
21			"I can confirm that nobody else was present when I	
22			received these verbal instructions. However, I can say	
23			Andrew McLindon was aware of these instructions as I	
24			discussed them with him."	
25		Α.	No.	14:05
26	568	Q.	All right. If I could just go to April 2014, and you	
27			will be aware that that month has a particular	
28			significance as Mr. Williams had gone to interview	
29			Ms. D and decided he was going to write an article	

Т			about it, and he actually did.	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	569	Q.	And Superintendent Taylor told you about this, isn't	
4			that right?	
5		Α.	Yes, he came into my office, I can't remember the	14:05
6			specific date unfortunately, but he came into the	
7			office and, quite rightly, as in his role as the	
8			press officer, told me about a media query that he had	
9			received that might have an impact on the	
10			organisation's reputation.	14:05
11	570	Q.	What did he tell you about the media query?	
12		Α.	He basically said that Paul Williams was going up to	
13			interview Ms. D, that was about the extent of it, in	
14			relation to the allegations that she had in relation to	
15			Sergeant McCabe.	14:05
16	571	Q.	Continue on. Did he say anything else?	
17		Α.	No. I kind of got the impression from his demeanour	
18			that he felt that that would be significant and that	
19			this might that this might be of benefit to the	
20			organisation insofar as it might show that there was an	14:06
21			issue in relation to Sergeant McCabe.	
22	572	Q.	Okay. So he thought it was of benefit to the	
23			organisation that an article would be published with	
24			regard to an interview with Ms. D, that that was	
25			Superintendent Taylor's take on it, is that right?	14:06
26		Α.	Well, I think my take on what his version of it was,	
27			that there was potential for that. Now, he wasn't I	

that there was the potential for that.

28

29

wouldn't say he was definitive on it, but he was saying

- 1 573 Q. And what was your reaction to that?
- 2 A. Well, my reaction in general was that I didn't think
- 3 that that, without knowing the -- necessarily I hadn't
- 4 talked to Paul Williams in relation to it, so I didn't

14 · 07

14:07

14.08

- 5 know the direction that he was going to take or not
- 6 take in relation to it, but, in general, I felt that
- 7 the article would not name Sergeant McCabe or would not
- 8 necessarily allude or make any direct allegations
- 9 against Sergeant McCabe because of libel laws.
- 10 574 Q. And are you sure what Superintendent Taylor was saying
- to you was that Mr. Williams was going to interview
- 12 Ms. D?
- 13 A. My recollection was that he said Paul Williams has a
- 14 query here, he's going -- I think he said he's going to
- interview Ms. D. Now, I could be wrong, he could have
- said Paul Williams has interviewed Ms. D. But my
- 17 recollection was that he was going to, but I could be
- 18 wrong on that.
- 19 575 Q. Okay. Did you think this was something significant?
- 20 A. Em, I didn't really, to be honest with you. Basically,
- I didn't think that it would put Sergeant McCabe in a
- spotlight because of the libel laws and obviously
- because of the groundless nature of the matter in the
- first place, so I didn't feel that there was anything
- 25 there from that perspective. And I think basically
- from my recollection of it, the articles focused more
- on the fact that Ms. D felt that the Garda
- investigation hadn't been sufficient and actually the
- criticism was more towards the Garda organisation than

1			to anybody else. That is my recollection of the	
2			articles.	
3	576	Q.	Yes. But surely that was something which was in your	
4			department, protecting the reputation of the guards,	
5			and here was somebody saying that an allegation of	14:08
6			sexual assault hadn't been properly investigated?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	577	Q.	Did you take any steps on foot of that?	
9		Α.	On foot of the article, is it?	
10	578	Q.	Yes. Or on foot of the knowledge that Mr. Williams was	14:08
11			going up to meet Ms. D?	
12		Α.	Well, as far as I was aware, Deputy Commissioner	
13			O'Sullivan was aware of it, and, as far as I was aware,	
14			Commissioner Callinan was aware of it, so if they	
15			wished me to do something in relation to it in terms of	14:09
16			putting out a comment or a statement, then they could	
17			have done so. I suppose the issue was, that on a	
18			sensitive matter like that, we would not comment on it	
19			anyway in general.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Ms. Leader, it's a bit more than	14:09
21			that. The Garda, as an organisation, had officially	
22			been involved on foot of a complaint. The matter had	
23			been investigated very thoroughly by Inspector	
24			Cunningham. It had been sent to the DPP, with a	
25			recommendation from the State solicitor and from	14:09
26			Inspector Cunningham that there should be no	
27			prosecution. The DPP had ruled there was no offence.	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Yet you were being made aware that a	

1		journalist was about to make a fuss in relation to	
2		this. So was it not your duty to step in and say	
3		"stop"?	
4	Α.	Well, as far as I was aware, Superintendent Taylor told	
5		him in relation to the DPP matter.	14:09
6		CHAIRMAN: How do you know that?	
7	Α.	Well, that's what superintendent told Superintendent	
8		Taylor went back to Paul Williams. My understanding	
9		is, that is what he said to Paul Williams.	
10		CHAIRMAN: Well, they certainly have a dispute as to	14:10
11		what they said to each other.	
12	Α.	Well, my understanding from what Superintendent Taylor	
13		told me in terms of how he was going to respond to Paul	
14		Williams, that he was going to respond along those	
15		lines, Chairman.	14:10
16		CHAIRMAN: And now there is a further dispute as to	
17		whether he was going up or had gone up and was raising	
18		queries. How do you feel? Do you think you should	
19		have intervened?	
20	Α.	Maybe, in hindsight, I should have intervened and maybe	14:10
21		we should have looked at putting some kind of stronger	
22		statement in relation to the matter. I suppose it was	
23		a very sensitive matter for both parties and I suppose	
24		that was a concern.	
25		CHAIRMAN: Well, a sensitive matter for both parties	14:10
26		isn't necessarily helped by an airing in the press.	
27	Α.	Yes. But I can't stop Mr. Williams interviewing an	
28		individual if he feels that there's a potential media	
29		story in doing that.	

1		CHAIRMAN: Well, according to himself, he was he had	
2		an unawareness of the file or the DPP ruling	
3	Α.	Yes.	
4		CHAIRMAN: which was within the procurement of An	
5		Garda Síochána, certainly, for which you work, so	14:11
6	Α.	Yes. And as far as I was aware, Superintendent Taylor	
7		provided that information to Mr. Williams.	
8		CHAIRMAN: Well, that is what you might expect.	
9	Α.	Yes.	
10		CHAIRMAN: But, on his own account, he's not exactly	14:11
11		showing a huge friendship towards Sergeant McCabe.	
12	Α.	Sorry, Chair, is that Mr. Williams or	
13		Superintendent Taylor?	
14		CHAIRMAN: You might actually pick either, but it is	
15		certainly Superintendent Taylor on this.	14:11
16	Α.	Well, the information that I had was Superintendent	
17		Taylor was dealing with the media query and his	
18		response to Mr. Williams on that matter was, he	
19		informed him of the DPP directions. Potentially, in	
20		hindsight, maybe I should have sent an official	14:11
21		statement to Mr. Williams to put it on the record.	
22		Maybe that would have been much more clearer.	
23		CHAIRMAN: How would it help for anyone to interview	
24		Ms. D?	
25	Α.	I don't	14:12
26		CHAIRMAN: How would that help, from a PR point of	
27		view?	
28	Α.	Well, it wasn't helpful, it wasn't helpful for the	
29		organisation in any way, shape or form, and I wasn't	

			I wash c, so to speak, Jumping up and down that	
2			Mr. Williams was going to be covering this story in any	
3			way, shape or form.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Well, that doesn't seem to be what Garda	
5			Headquarters thought at the time, to use a collective	14:12
6			term.	
7		Α.	Well, it wasn't I can't speak to that, Chair. But	
8			all I can is, from my perspective, that wasn't my	
9			viewpoint.	
10	579	Q.	MS. LEADER: I just want to go back to your statement,	14:12
11			Mr. McLindon, at page 1569. What you say in relation	
12			to this matter is that:	
13				
14			"In late March or early April 2014, Superintendent	
15			Taylor quite rightly brought it to my attention	14:12
16			information that Mr. Paul Williams of the Irish	
17			Independent had interviewed Sergeant McCabe's alleged	
18			victim."	
19				
20			Do you see that?	14:13
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	580	Q.	"This was the right thing to do by Superintendent	
23			Taylor, as this could potentially have an impact on the	
24			organisation's reputation. Superintendent Taylor made	
25			no claim to me that he had been instrumental in getting	14:13
26			one of the country's most well-known journalists to	
27			talk to Sergeant McCabe's alleged victim."	
28				
29			That is a matter that is not settled you understand	

1			that?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	581	Q.	Yes, that particular line. But did you understand that	
4			Superintendent Taylor was instrumental in doing it?	
5		Α.	I have no knowledge of that. All I took from it, that	14:13
6			Paul Williams had rang Superintendent Taylor to inform	
7			him that he had either done the interview or was	
8			planning to do the interview, and that Superintendent	
9			Taylor was informing me of that. I had no knowledge of	
10			any interaction before in relation to that.	14:13
11	582	Q.	Sorry, you had no knowledge of any interaction in	
12			relation to what?	
13		Α.	In relation to how Paul Williams came to interview	
14			Ms. D.	
15	583	Q.	Okay. But you, in your statement, would seem to	14:14
16			suggest that Superintendent Taylor was instrumental in	
17			it?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	584	Q.	That he had not been instrumental	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:14
21	585	Q.	in getting one of the country's so you seem to be	
22			definite about that?	
23		Α.	Well, certainly that was the impression that I got from	
24			Superintendent Taylor, that this phone call from Paul	
25			Williams and the fact that there was going to be an	14:14
26			interview with Ms. D or there had been an interview	
27			with Ms. D, I got the impression from Superintendent	
28			Taylor that that was a surprise to him.	
29	586	Q.	A surprise to him?	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 587 Q. And you say you recall saying to Superintendent Taylor:
- 3 Despite Mr. Williams' reputation as a highly credible
- 4 journalist, that in your professional opinion "no
- 5 article would appear naming Sergeant McCabe in relation 14:14
- 6 to this allegation because of libel laws."
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 588 Q. "When the article did appear on the 12th April 2014, it
- 9 did not refer to Sergeant McCabe by name and
- 10 concentrated on allegations by the alleged victim that

14 · 15

14:15

14:15

- 11 her complaint had not been properly investigated by An
- 12 Garda Síochána."
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 589 Q. All right. So how did you know the matter had been
- 15 brought to the Commissioner's attention?
- 16 A. I think Superintendent Taylor told me that he had
- informed the Commissioner about it.
- 18 590 Q. All right. And you were happy to leave it at that?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 591 Q. You see, that might also suggest, Mr. McLindon, that
- 21 you were aware that this was the line that was to be
- taken in relation to Sergeant McCabe: make the best
- use of any opportunity you can get to downgrade him,
- that might suggest that that was actually the case
- because you didn't do anything on foot of your
- 26 knowledge of this article's publication, despite you
- being in a major way responsible for the organisation's
- 28 reputation?
- 29 A. Well, as I said, Superintendent Taylor, as far as I was

- 1 aware and concerned, had provided Mr. Williams with the 2 information in relation to the DPP's directions and, as 3 far as I was concerned, that that was the fair thing to do in relation to Sergeant McCabe. 4 5 592 But what about the reputation of the Q. 14:16 6 organisation, about not investigating matters properly? 7 Yes, absolutely, but we wouldn't comment -- we don't Α. 8 comment on individual investigations. And again, I don't recall, but maybe it was, that maybe, I don't 9 know if Ms. D had made an allegation to GSOC and that 10 14 · 16 11 was under investigation by GSOC. If that was the case, 12 we don't comment on GSOC investigations. 13 So this, and you were happy to leave it at that, at 593 Q. 14 that stage, on that basis? 15 I was. Α. 14:16 16 594 That might be difficult to believe when we have heard Ο. 17 the evidence that we have heard this week in relation 18 to people being told by Commissioner Callinan about 19 Sergeant McCabe and an alleged sexual assault. Well, Commissioner Callinan never discussed that matter 14:17 20 Α. with me. 21 22 595 I should ask you, did you ever receive any queries in Q. 23 relation to any anonymous communication that may have 24 been sent to any media groups in relation to Sergeant
- 26 A. I don't recall anything of that nature.

McCabe, can you remember?

25

27 596 Q. But it could have happened, perhaps, or are you ruling it out totally?

14 · 17

29 A. I don't quite understand the question, Ms. Leader,

- sorry.
- 2 597 Q. Did you ever receive a query via the Press Office in
- 3 relation to any anonymous communication relating to
- 4 Sergeant McCabe that may have been received by any

14 · 18

14:18

14:18

- 5 media organisations?
- 6 A. No, not that I recall, no.
- 7 598 Q. All right. And just in relation to your own
- 8 interactions with journalists, did you ever speak to
- 9 any journalists yourself about Sergeant McCabe?
- 10 A. No, not particularly, no.
- 11 599 Q. How do you mean "not particularly"?
- 12 A. Well, obviously Sergeant McCabe would come up in conversation.
- 14 600 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. You can't have a conversation if someone rings you and
- says these are the latest allegations being made by
- 17 Sergeant McCabe on X, Y and Z, but my focus was on
- dealing with the allegations, and obviously I'm very
- 19 constrained and the organisation is very constrained on
- what we can comment on in relation to anything that is
- 21 made public or not or comes into the public domain, I
- don't know how they come into the public domain, that
- is made under either the confidential recipient process
- or whistleblower process or protected disclosures. We
- 25 have a very strict policy that we do not comment on
- 26 matters that have been brought forward into the public
- domain, however they came into the public domain, via
- 28 protected disclosures, whistleblower processes. So I
- wouldn't be in a position to comment on them, other

1			than to say that they are being examined or being	
2			looked at or we have dealt with those issues in the	
3			past.	
4	601	Q.	And is that an on-the-record comment?	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:19
6	602	Q.	And are you aware of any off-the-record briefing that	
7			journalists may be given?	
8		Α.	Not in relation to Sergeant McCabe, no.	
9	603	Q.	Does it happen in the Garda generally?	
10		Α.	Off-the-record briefings do happen on certain issues,	14:19
11			yes.	
12	604	Q.	And do you participate in them?	
13		Α.	You see, if you like, there's an off-the-record	
14			briefings that may happen on official matters, but	
15			unfortunately An Garda Síochána is a very leaky	14:19
16			organisation, so there are lots of, unfortunately,	
17			briefings done by lots of people who should not be	
18			involved in briefings, providing information to the	
19			media, and that's an issue for the organisation.	
20	605	Q.	Okay. Well, what I asked you is you've acknowledged	14:20
21			that there are off-the-record briefings, and I have	
22			asked you, do you participate in those off-the-record	
23			briefings?	
24		Α.	Very occasionally, depending on the circumstances, if I	
25			feel that it is necessary to do so.	14:20
26	606	Q.	And when might it be necessary to do so?	
27		Α.	It might be necessary to do so, to provide the media	
28			and the public with the perspective of the organisation	
29			without being seen to get into a confrontational	

- 1 position with another organisation.
- 2 607 Q. All right. So am I correct in saying what that
- actually means is, you want to get a message out there,
- 4 but -- on behalf of An Garda Síochána, but you want to
- 5 avoid a row with another person as a result of putting
- 6 a particular message out there?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 608 Q. Okay. So this could very well be an instance of, where
- 9 people in An Garda Síochána might want to put a message

14 · 21

14:21

14:21

- out about Sergeant McCabe but not attribute it to An
- 11 Garda Síochána?
- 12 A. That potentially could happen, but it has never
- happened with my knowledge.
- 14 609 Q. Okay. Well, Superintendent Taylor, for his part, says
- it did happen with your knowledge?
- 16 A. Well, I don't agree.
- 17 610 Q. But you do agree that you are aware of off-the-record
- 18 briefings and sometimes you participate in them?
- 19 A. Yeah, well, off-the-record briefings are relatively
- 20 standard practice in lots of different areas of
- 21 communications and public relations.
- 22 CHAIRMAN: Are they really? Are you seriously telling
- 23 me that the police force of the State would actually go
- to a journalist and say something to them off the
- record on the basis that the journalist would then have 14:22
- to assert journalistic privilege, perhaps at the price
- of going to jail in consequence of it, and the Garda
- 28 Síochána would be able to actually deny that any such
- comment came from them? Are you actually seriously

1		telling me that?	
2	Α.	Em, I'm not saying we deny the comment came from us,	
3		Chair.	
4		CHAIRMAN: No, just please focus on the question	
5	Α.	Yes.	14:22
6		CHAIRMAN: because you've picked a bit of it now as	
7		not exactly helpful. Are you really telling me that	
8		the Garda Síochána goes to journalists and makes	
9		off-the-record comments on the basis that the	
10		journalist will then have to assert journalistic	14:22
11		privilege? Are you seriously telling me that?	
12	Α.	Em, well, it's not done with the intention that they	
13		will have to assert journalistic privilege.	
14		CHAIRMAN: You know as well as I do there's	
15		journalistic privilege, you know as well as I do that,	14:22
16		barring exceptional circumstances, it applies to	
17		off-the-record comments, which means that the source is	
18		not to be revealed. Are you saying An Garda Síochána	
19		actually does that?	
20	Α.	I'm saying in certain circumstances we provide	14:23
21		background information on matters.	
22		CHAIRMAN: All right, you're not prepared to answer my	
23		question then.	
24	Α.	Well, sorry, Chair, if I am not answering your question	
25		directly, I'm trying to. I am obviously not meeting	14:23
26		your requirements. We provide information on a	
27		background basis. It's not done in the nature of to	
28		handcuff journalists in relation to	
29		CHATRMAN: Well that is a very important question	

1			asked by Ms. Leader. Does the Garda Press Office do	
2			that?	
3		Α.	Not it's very it's not regular, no.	
4			CHAIRMAN: It doesn't matter if it is regular. Does it	
5			do it or does it not, yes or no?	14:23
6		Α.	On occasion it does, yes.	
7	611	Q.	MS. LEADER: I want to finish off by asking you	
8			directly, did the Garda Press Office provide	
9			information off the record in relation to Sergeant	
10			McCabe?	14:23
11		Α.	No.	
12	612	Q.	And you're happy with that?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14			MS. LEADER: If you would answer any questions anybody	
15			else might have.	14:24
16		Α.	Thank you.	
17			MR. McDOWELL: Mr. McLindon, Michael McDowell is my	
18			name, and I'm one of Sergeant McCabe's barristers here.	
19			Just in relation to the	
20			CHAIRMAN: I will just take a break.	14:24
21			MR. McDOWELL: Sorry, Judge.	
22				
23			AFTER A SHORT ADJOURNMENT THE HEARING RESUMED	
24			AS FOLLOWS:	
25				14:30
26			CHAIRMAN: You will appreciate, Mr. McDowell, if	
27			possible, I would like to get Mr. McLindon away for the	
28			weekend. Will you be very long?	
29			MR. McDOWELL: In fact. Judge. I have changed my mind.	

Т			I don t want to ask nim a question.	
2			CHAIRMAN: You're entitled to change your mind.	
3			Mr. O'Higgins, how long will you take?	
4			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: This is a witness, Judge,	
5			who	14:30
6			CHAIRMAN: I just asked you how long will you take.	
7			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: About 45 minutes.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Is there any other questions?	
9			MR. LEHANE: Mr. Chairman, I have about five minutes.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	14:31
11			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I have a few questions as well.	
12			CHAIRMAN: And how long do you think you will take?	
13			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Not long. Maybe five, ten	
14			minutes.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you. So Mr. O'Higgins.	14:31
16				
17			MR. MCLINDON WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL	
18			O'HIGGINS:	
19				
20	613	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Good afternoon, Mr. McLindon.	14:31
21			Michael O'Higgins is my name, I'm counsel on behalf of	
22			Superintendent David Taylor. Now, your position that	
23			you took up in September 2013 had not been filled for	
24			the previous 18 months, isn't that so?	
25		Α.	Approximately so, yes.	14:31
26	614	Q.	And in the 14 months previous to you taking up the	
27			post, Superintendent Taylor was the Garda head of the	
28			Press Office, he had taken over from superintendent	
29			Gilligan, isn't that so?	

1	Α.	Correct,	ves.

- 2 615 Q. Now, how did you -- how was your working relationship with Superintendent Taylor?
- we had a good working relationship. I felt that we 4 Α. 5 worked well together. He a very good grasp and 14:32 6 knowledge of the organisation and he was very good in 7 helping me understand what is a different organisation 8 that I had ever worked in before, with its own peculiarities and culture. He appeared to have a very 9 good working relationship with the media. Certainly, 10 14:32 11 any media people who I talked to when I came into the 12 organisation as part of my familiarisation process felt 13 that Superintendent Taylor was doing a good job as the Garda Press Officer. 14

15 616 Q. Was he welcoming towards you?

16 Em, I don't know necessarily if he was welcoming Α. initially, and I didn't take that necessarily 17 18 personally. I think he felt that there may not 19 necessarily have been a need for a director of 20 communications, that he was sufficiently filling that 14:32 role. Again, I didn't take that personally. 21 22 gone into new organisations before where you have to 23 prove yourself. So I felt that my role in that was to 24 kind of prove myself to Superintendent Taylor, that I 25 had a purpose and a function and that if we worked 14:33 together it would be for the benefit of the 26 27 organisation, and I think after a while we both saw the benefits of that approach. 28

29 617 Q. Well, would it be a fair summary to say then that your

Т			impression was that there was perhaps an initial degree	
2			of resistance towards you, but that neutralised and	
3			flourished into a good professional working	
4			relationship?	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:33
6	618	Q.	Was he open with you?	
7		Α.	Generally, yes.	
8	619	Q.	I mean, you mentioned, and we might look at it in just	
9			a little bit of detail in your statement, that you felt	
10			that Commissioner Callinan saw you as a civilian, and	14:33
11			might, for that reason, have been a bit more cautious	
12			or wary with you in his dealings. I take it that was	
13			not a feature of your relationship with Superintendent	
14			Taylor once the initial phase had settled down?	
15		Α.	Yes, I think that's fair, yes.	14:34
16	620	Q.	And would it be the case, and I'm trying to ask the	
17			questions as openly as possible and not in a leading	
18			manner because to try and make the answers more	
19			efficient, but was it your impression that when an	
20			event occurred which Superintendent Taylor thought was	14:34
21			important, he would relay it to you?	
22		Α.	Yes, he would.	
23	621	Q.	Now, on his relationship with Commissioner Callinan, I	
24			just want I wonder could we open your statement at	
25			page 1564, going on to page 1565, please. And if we go	14:34
26			to the final paragraph on that page, you note:	
27				
28			"The formal whatever the formal structure, the	
29			reality was that the Garda press officer has a direct	

1			line to the Commissioner." Isn't that right?	
2		Α.	Yes, at that time, yes.	
3	622	Q.	And you say on the next page then:	
4				
5			"Within a short time of joining, it was apparent to"	14:35
6			you " that Superintendent Taylor and Commissioner	
7			Callinan enjoyed a close working relationship."	
8				
9			Isn't that right?	
10		Α.	That's correct.	14:35
11	623	Q.	And you instance the Friday meetings for the Sunday	
12			papers?	
13		Α.	Correct.	
14	624	Q.	You would note on urgent matters he would report	
15			directly to the Commissioner?	14:35
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	625	Q.	But always reverting back to you if there was anything	
18			to say?	
19		Α.	Yes. Or he would keep me certainly keep me informed	
20			of particular queries.	14:35
21	626	Q.	And you formed the view, the impression, that	
22			Commissioner Callinan was more inclined to listen to	
23			advice from uniform members rather than civilians; that	
24			was a cultural thing, isn't that right?	
25		Α.	Correct.	14:36
26	627	Q.	Now, first of all, my instructions, I should indicate,	
27			are that my client did enjoy a good working	
28			relationship with Commissioner Callinan and also	
29			enioved a good working relationship with vourself. But	

1 as you yourself pointed out to me in your initial 2 responses, you are director of communications, isn't 3 that right? 4 Correct. Α. 5 628 On a ranking system, you are the equivalent of a chief Q. 14:36 6 superintendent, higher up the scale than my client? 7 Correct. Α. 8 629 And if a person listening to your evidence were to form 0. 9 an impression that you were acting in a passive role or inertly in your position, I suggest that would be a 10 14:36 11 false impression; that you weren't passive, you're not 12 inert, you were the director of communications and you 13 were holding the reins, would that be fair? 14 Α. Well, I suppose you have to take into account that I 15 had just joined the organisation in September, so I was 14:37 16 still effectively within a probation period. civil servant, you're in a probation period of a 17 18 one-year process. Obviously then there was an 19 established relationship there between the Commissioner 20 and Superintendent Taylor. I said, coming into the 14:37 organisation, in fact I said it to Commissioner 21 22 Callinan during my interview, that one of the key 23 things that I wanted to do was to establish myself 24 within the organisation, but that process takes time. 25 I felt that if I went into an organisation as a 14:37 civilian and started effectively, if you like, throwing 26 27 my weight around, that there would be an adverse reaction to that within the organisation, which is 28

heavily uniformed and officer-based.

29

- 1 630 Q. I understand that fully. But would you agree with me that to establish your presence firmly within any organisation, you can achieve that without throwing your weight around?
- A. Yes, I agree, and I felt that I did that over a period of time by providing professional communications advice
- 7 to the Commissioner and senior officers.
- 8 631 Q. I mean, I suppose the point I'm anxious to emphasise is
 9 this: you're not, I will use this phrase, you are not
 10 a cat's paw, you're not anybody's cat's paw, isn't that 14:38
 11 right?
- 12 A. Sorry, I don't understand the phrase.
- 13 632 Q. You're independent in your thinking, you know what your
 14 functions are, you know what your obligations and
 15 responsibilities are and you are ready to discharge
 16 them, isn't that right?
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 633 Q. You're not a person who simply goes with the flow?
- A. Well, it's my job to provide, I suppose, if you like, independent communication advice to a commissioner or senior officers. After that, it's a matter for that

14:39

- officer or that commissioner to accept, reject or modify that advice.
- 24 634 Q. And you're a person, I would suggest, that would be involved in a fairly micro level with all the live issues of the day?
- A. Not necessarily, no. I would be involved in strategic issues. But if there was, for instance, an arrest in Cavan today for a drugs seizure, I would not be aware

Т			of that. There's no need for me to be aware of that	
2			unless it was a multimillion euro drugs seizure.	
3	635	Q.	And you're not suggesting, I take it, by reference to	
4			the culture of the force and Commissioner Callinan's	
5			natural bias towards uniform members, you're not	14:39
6			suggesting that you were squeezed out or that you were	
7			out on a limb or that you were out of the loop	
8			generally or anything of that sort, isn't that so?	
9		Α.	No, I'm not suggesting that.	
10	636	Q.	I didn't think so. Now, there was a document produced	14:40
11			earlier which indicated that at a meeting which was set	
12			up to consider the strategic approach of the	
13			Commissioner and the force to the forthcoming PAC	
14			inquiries, and Sergeant McCabe's difficulties in 2006	
15			were noted, isn't that right?	14:40
16		Α.	That appears to be the case, yes.	
17	637	Q.	Well, you seem to be qualifying the answer. It appears	
18			to be the case, it seems to me to be absolutely the	
19			case; is there any doubt about it?	
20		Α.	Well, certainly given the information, all I can say is	14:40
21			that, yes, it certainly does appear to be the case, but	
22			I don't I didn't mark the fact that Sergeant	
23			McCabe this is information related to Sergeant	
24			McCabe, so but certainly based on the information	
25			and other notes of other persons who were present at	14:40
26			the meeting, that does appear to be the case, yes.	
27	638	Q.	And I take it the shorthand note "Sergeant McCabe 2006"	
28			would be fully adequate for you to know the full	
29			context of what that meant?	

- A. Based on that note. But that wasn't my note. But yes, based on that note, yes.
- And may I equally take it that the two words or three
 words "Sergeant McCabe 2006" would be enough to put the
 context of the information together, that that suggests 14:41
- 6 prior knowledge?
- 7 A. Sorry, prior knowledge of?
- 8 640 Q. Well, if you look at the note and it says "Sergeant
 9 McCabe 2006 start", whatever the phrase was, and you
 10 understood that to mean -- that to be a reference to
 11 Sergeant McCabe being the subject of an investigation
 12 and a file to the DPP with regard to an alleged sexual
 13 assault on a minor, isn't that so?

14 · 41

14:41

- 14 A. Well, I don't recall that level of detail being
 15 discussed at that meeting.
- 16 641 Q. No, I'm not suggesting for the present that it was.
- But what I am suggesting is: those three words were enough for you to impart that level of information?
- 19 A. I'm sorry, I don't understand the question.
- 20 642 Q. Well, I am sorry, I will do it again. The note -
 perhaps we'd better put it up on screen.
- 22 MS. LEADER: 1282.
- MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: It's 208. If we can go down.
- It isn't this witness's note, it's the superintendent's
- note I'm looking for. 1282, I beg your pardon.
- MS. LEADER: The assistant commissioner's note is 1246.
- MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I beg your pardon, 1246.
- 28 MS. LEADER: The typed version.
- MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Typed version, please.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 643 Q. Is the typed version of that perhaps on the next page,
- 3 is it?
- 4 A. It's 1246A.
- 5 MS. LEADER: A, yes.
- 6 644 Q. MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Just while we're waiting for it

14:44

14:44

- 7 to -- there it is now, please. Now, do you see "start
- 8 Sergeant McCabe 2006".
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 645 Q. There are three words there, and, as someone looking at 14:43
- that note, you would be able to know that that is a
- 12 reference to the fact that Sergeant McCabe was
- investigated in respect to an alleged sexual assault
- and the subject of a file to the Director of Public
- 15 Prosecutions and you would have been able to extract
- that at the time of the meeting, which was the 21st
- 17 January 2014, if you were reviewing that note the next
- day, isn't that so?
- A. Well, no, because as far as I can recall, that level of
- 20 detail was not discussed at that meeting.
- 21 646 Q. Again, we're at cross-purposes.
- 22 A. Sorry.
- 23 647 Q. That reference is enough for you to know that that is
- to what it refers, the events to which it refers?
- 25 A. Yes. But are you talking about now, having seen this
- 26 note, because certainly it's not my note, or are you
- 27 talking about at the time.
- 28 648 Q. I'm talking about at the time.
- 29 A. No, because I wasn't aware of the detail of that at the

1 time, because, as far as I was aware, it wasn't 2 discussed at the time, at that particular time. 3 649 Q. Well, maybe I will skip through everything, and just tell us in your own words when you became aware that 4 5 Sergeant McCabe had been investigated in 2006 in 14:45 6 respect of an alleged sexual assault, roughly? 7 Roughly, it was -- roughly it was in and around that Α. 8 time, but I --Yeah. Well, who told you? 9 650 Q. It was a rumour that was going around or information 10 Α. 14 · 45 11 that was going around Garda HQ at the time. 12 But you work in the Garda Press Office, isn't that 651 Ο. right? 13 14 Α. Correct. 15 652 And the Garda Press Office is anxious to get material Q. 14:45 16 out accurately? 17 Correct. Α. 18 So rumours are not something that you would let rest; 653 Q. 19 you would presumably follow it up? 20 well, there was -- the rumours were basically that Α. 14:45 there had been an allegation, that it had been 21 22 investigated. 23 well, who did you follow up those rumours with? 654 Q. 24 Well, sorry, just so I could finish. The rumours were Α. 25 that there was an allegation that it had been 14 · 45 26 investigated and that there was nothing to it. 27 far as I was concerned, there was nothing to be done

So let me understand this. You heard that rumour and

about it.

28

29

655

Q.

- 1 you made no inquiry of anybody?
- 2 A. No, I did not make any inquiry of anybody.
- 3 656 Q. Of anybody? Did you even say to Superintendent Taylor,
- 4 this man, Sergeant McCabe, who is getting a lot of
- press coverage and is someone who is damaging, to adopt 14:46

14 · 46

14:46

14:47

- 6 your phraseology, the corporate image of An Garda
- 7 Síochána, and I have heard a rumour that he was the
- 8 subject of a sexual abuse allegation, what's that
- 9 about, is it your evidence that you never made that
- inquiry of Superintendent Taylor or anybody else?
- 11 A. Well, first of all, I don't think, and I stand to be
- 12 corrected on this, I don't think I said that Sergeant
- McCabe was damaging the organisation. I can't recall
- 14 having a conversation with Superintendent Taylor in
- relation to it, because, as I say, as far as I was
- 16 concerned, there was nothing in that matter. Now, if
- people want to go and talk rumour and talk gossip, that
- is a matter for them, but I try not to engage in that.
- 19 And if someone says to me that an individual has
- 20 been -- that it's been looked into and there's nothing
- to do it, then I will leave the matter rest.
- 22 657 Q. Well, that would depend, I suppose, on the person
- telling you. If they told you about something of that
- nature and dismissed it as there being nothing in it,
- perhaps if it was a very senior member of the guards
- you might be inclined to accept that, but can you even
- tell us from where you heard this rumour?
- 28 A. No, it was just generally circulating around Garda HQ.
- 29 658 Q. So there was more than one person talking about it?

- 1 A. That's my recollection, yes.
- 2 659 Q. Would it be the case that it was the sort of thing that
- 3 everybody was talking about?
- 4 A. I don't know about everybody, but certainly I think you

14 · 48

14:48

14:48

- 5 could say that there was a good few people talking
- 6 about it.
- 7 660 Q. There was an awful lot of people talking about it?
- 8 A. I think --
- 9 661 Q. And as they repeated the rumour, you just simply
- digested it and made no comment or inquiry, good, bad
- or indifferent?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 662 Q. Does that strike you as odd?
- 14 A. Well, as I said, as far as I was aware, the information
- that had been told to me, and I can't recall who told
- it to me, was that the allegation was groundless, so I
- did not -- there was nothing for me, as far as I could
- see, to do in relation to it.
- 19 663 Q. When it came up at the meeting on the 21st January, did
- anybody say that was groundless?
- 21 A. I don't recall, because as far as I recall the detail
- of it wasn't discussed.
- 23 664 Q. Well, something was discussed.
- 24 A. Yes, I just can't recall exactly the nature of that
- 25 discussion.
- 26 665 Q. Well, I mean, it is some time ago, and it would be
- 27 unreasonable of me to expect you to have it on the tip
- of your tongue, or anywhere near that, but could I just
- ask you just to think for a moment, put yourself back

Т			there on the 21st January and see, from your	
2			recollection, whether you can pull anything. Rather	
3			than just tell me you don't remember, just think about	
4			it for a moment. Can you think of anything, any	
5			reason, why that might be a topic for discussion?	14:49
6		Α.	Well, the only reason I can think it was a topic for	
7			discussion was that it was starting to circulate into	
8			the public domain about Sergeant McCabe and that it may	
9			become may be brought up by a member of PAC	
10	666	Q.	Yeah.	14:49
11		Α.	without mentioning Sergeant McCabe's name, but that	
12			issue may be brought up. That's the only reason I can	
13			think of.	
14	667	Q.	Can I just highlight something to you there. We've	
15			had, I'm not sure how many witnesses, three now, maybe	14:49
16			four, who allegedly or who are alleging that they	
17			were told things about Sergeant McCabe, and in each	
18			case it's been put to the witnesses that it was them	
19			that introduced the concept of Sergeant McCabe, not the	
20			guards, not the Commissioner. Is your evidence	14:50
21			essentially going the same direction, that this is a	
22			reference to what the politicians might say and not	
23			what the guards were talking about?	
24		Α.	Well, I think it's fair to say that An Garda	
25			Síochána that we were having a discussion about	14:50
26			this. But my recollection was, we were having a	
27			discussion about this because we were trying to prepare	
28			for all eventualities in relation to PAC. I don't	
29			think it was an intention to discuss it in relation to	

Т			putting it into the public domain or bringing it to the	
2			fore in PAC.	
3	668	Q.	But do you see that your emphasis is falling on the	
4			politicians talking about it and not the guards? Do	
5			you see your answer going in that direction?	14:50
6		Α.	well, again, all I can say is that that was the nature	
7			of that discussion, because we were preparing for PAC,	
8			so therefore you're preparing for what questions may	
9			come from politicians who are members of PAC and what,	
10			as an organisation, what the organisation's response to	14:51
11			those questions might be.	
12	669	Q.	Why, if there was a concern that the politicians might	
13			raise this, would the note reflect that the origin of	
14			it was in 2006? I don't see an obvious connection	
15			between the two.	14:51
16		Α.	I don't know, to be honest with you.	
17	670	Q.	Does it make any sense to you?	
18		Α.	It seems strange to me that there was a discussion of	
19			that nature, but I wasn't in charge of the meeting, I	
20			was just taking a note in relation to it and my	14:51
21			focus	
22	671	Q.	You were there, you were director of communications,	
23			you were there formulating strategy and strategically	
24			how the guards were going to communicate their	
25			position?	14:51
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	672	Q.	Did the question of Sergeant McCabe's motivation for	
28			making complaints arise during these discussions?	
29		Α.	Em, I can't recall exactly, but I would think it would	

1			be fair to say from the notes that potentially was	
2			discussed, but just because something was discussed at	
3			a meeting did not necessarily mean that we were going	
4			to actually discuss that within the confines of PAC,	
5			and I don't think necessarily well, apart from the	14:52
6			"disgusting" comment, which was not planned as far as I	
7			was concerned, that that was not the intention going in	
8			to PAC, that we would get into that, but just in case	
9			that issue arose.	
10	673	Q.	So do I infer from your answer my question,	14:52
11			incidentally, wasn't directed to what would be	
12			discussed at PAC at all. Do I infer from your answer	
13			that his motivation was discussed?	
14		Α.	I don't recall if his motivation was discussed, no.	
15	674	Q.	Well, would it seem likely when the Commissioner, whose	14:52
16			nose was clearly out of joint that he was being called	
17			to account on the basis of allegations generated by	
18			Sergeant McCabe that the reason why Sergeant McCabe	
19			might be doing this, would that be a topic for	
20			discussion, a likely topic?	14:53
21		Α.	It was a potential topic for discussion, but I can't	
22			recall if it was, that motivation was discussed in	
23			relation to Sergeant McCabe.	
24	675	Q.	Well, you see, a few moments ago you introduced, as I	
25			understood it, as an actual recollection as opposed to	14:53
26			a surmise, that there was some concern that politicians	
27			might bring up Sergeant McCabe. Well, if you have that	
28			particular recollection, do you have any other	
29			recollection about his motivation for doing this?	

1		Α.	In terms of what was discussed, in terms of what was	
2			discussed	
3	676	Q.	In terms of why he was I mean, I use this in a	
4			neutral term, a neutral way: Sergeant McCabe had an	
5			agenda, the agenda was that there were things within An	14:5
6			Garda Síochána he was unhappy with and he wanted to	
7			highlight them. Now, was there any discussion as to	
8			what was driving that agenda?	
9		Α.	Well, I think that is why the 2006 was referenced and I	
10			think in my notes there was a reference to 2007/2008,	14:5
11			so you could be quite correct, that that was a	
12			discussion based on motivation, et cetera.	
13	677	Q.	Okay.	
14		Α.	I just don't recall the exact nature of that	
15			discussion.	14:5
16	678	Q.	Let's look at that then. How was the 2006 event	
17			informing his motivation?	
18		Α.	I can't recall that.	
19	679	Q.	Well, just, I mean, again, I don't want to be	
20			unreasonable, some time has passed, but I would like	14:5
21			you to be reasonable with me and not rush in and say "I	
22			just don't remember". Please just pause for a moment	

the 2006 events. Is that correct?

Because you have deduced, either as an

14:54

inevitable inference or from a recollection, that his

motivation in making these events was connected with

29 680 Q. Yes.

and think.

23

24

25

26

Т		Α.	In preparing for this, and obviously in making my	
2			original statement, so I'm not just saying this off the	
3			cuff	
4	681	Q.	I understand.	
5		Α.	when I say those things. I don't recall the nature	14:55
6			of the discussion in relation to Sergeant McCabe.	
7	682	Q.	Well, let me suggest a possibility. We have heard of	
8			attempts to suggest that Sergeant McCabe had abused	
9			minors, do you understand that?	
10		Α.	Yes.	14:55
11	683	Q.	That would be a form of negative briefing against	
12			Sergeant McCabe, do you understand?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	684	Q.	But there are other forms of negative briefing which	
15			bear some comparison with that, but which are also	14:56
16			different in some respects, and one possible motivation	
17			might be that Sergeant McCabe had been the subject of a	
18			Garda investigation with respect to a particular nasty	
19			offence and must have been more difficult for him,	
20			because he was a member of An Garda Síochána, do you	14:56
21			follow that?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	685	Q.	And we are also aware, I wasn't present for this	
24			evidence and I hope I am not in any way misquoting it,	
25			but we're also aware that he was very anxious, after	14:56
26			the Director had come back with the directions of no	
27			prosecution, that the complainant's family would be	
28			apprised with the specific terms of the direction, do	
29			vou understand that?	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 686 Q. And apparently I don't need to go in to follow on
- 3 this that was not done, and that that might be
- 4 another reason why Sergeant McCabe was put out with An
- 5 Garda Síochána, for want of a better description. Does
- 6 that make sense?
- 7 A. Well, I can understand what are you saying, yes.
- 8 687 Q. Yeah. Was anybody saying in terms, look, this man was
- 9 the subject of an investigation in 2006, he didn't like
- it, he didn't like it that he was left with mud on his

14:58

- shoe, he's very angry about it and this is informing
- his latest activities? Did anyone say anything like
- 13 that?
- 14 A. Not that I can recall specifically, no.
- 15 688 Q. Well, when you say "not that I can recall", if you will 14:57
- 16 excuse my comment, that's a rather equivocal response.
- 17 Could someone have said that?
- 18 A. Well, they could have, yes.
- 19 689 Q. Yeah. Why do you think they could have said that?
- 20 A. Well, they could have said it based on the notes, the
- 21 reference to 2006, 2007, 2008, et cetera. So they
- could have said that, yes.
- 23 690 Q. Well, it is -- I mean, I'm going to deal with it in a
- little bit more detail. I mean, Sergeant McCabe was a
- very big story, isn't that right?
- 26 A. Correct.
- 27 691 Q. And it was -- he was causing, potentially, ongoing
- reputational damage to An Garda Síochána, isn't that
- 29 so?

1		Α.	Correct.	
2	692	Q.	And this is, in terms of the work you do, a very big	
3			issue, isn't that right?	
4		Α.	Yes, that's correct. Can I just clarify a remark I	
5			just made there two seconds ago? I wouldn't want to	14:59
6			personalise that to Sergeant McCabe, causing	
7			reputational damage to the organisation. That would	
8			not be fair to Sergeant McCabe. But it was the	
9			allegations	
10	693	Q.	I understand.	14:59
11		Α.	and the handling of those allegations that were	
12			causing reputational damage to the organisation.	
13	694	Q.	I understand fully the distinction. It's not him per	
14			se; it's the allegations that are being aired?	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:59
16	695	Q.	So this is a very big part of your job. You're not	
17			actually in it that long. I would have thought that	
18			the areas which I'm asking questions about and which	
19			Ms. Leader was asking questions about, are matters	
20			which would be to the fore in your mind?	14:59
21		Α.	Yes, they but you've also got to take into account	
22			that you we had a succession of those meetings	
23			preparing for PAC, we were under constant media	
24			spotlight, every day there was a new story emerging.	
25			It was a very difficult, all-consuming, stressful time.	15:00
26	696	Q.	Yes.	
27		Α.	So the ability to recall every single comment at every	
28			single meeting, I'm afraid, is beyond me in that	
29			capacity.	

well, I would be the first to endorse that would be 697 Q. 1 2 wholly unrealistic, but I'm actually going to the other 3 extreme: it seems to me you have no memory bank at all. 4 5 well, I have to disagree. I have taken notes, I have Α. 15:00 6 provided a statement, I have provided emails to the 7 Tribunal. 8 698 Well, how is it that your note made no reference to Q. '06? 9 Em, I think it does. I don't have it in front of me. 10 Α. 15:00 11 If I could be allowed to have a look at it. 12 If we could put it up, "'06 start". Well, we will see 699 Q. what you did say, I beg your pardon. 13 1282. "2006 first incident". 14 Α. "Personal injuries claim 2007", is that right? 15 700 Q. 15:01 16 MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Before that happens, Judge, I 17 do think the question should be withdrawn. MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: 18 If I can just see what is on 19 the screen for a moment, please. 20 Let's keep it nice and calm. CHAIRMAN: I am not sure 15:01 where the question is going, Mr. O'Higgins, and maybe 21 22 you don't want to say for reasons but --23 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Sorry, I see it there. "2006 24 first incident", isn't that right? 25 Correct. Α. 15:01 CHAIRMAN: What are we talking about now? 26 27 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I am incorrect. His note did recall "2006 first incident", then it says -- I beg 28

your pardon, just to the right of that --

29

1			CHAIRMAN: It says "sergeant serving". Sorry, is there	
2			a problem, Mr. O'Higgins?	
3			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: No, there's not.	
4			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I was simply suggesting that	
5			the question	15:02
6			CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, it is the other Mr. O'Higgins.	
7			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sorry, Chairman, I was	
8			suggesting simply that the question should be	
9			withdrawn. It was built on the premise that the note	
10			didn't make any reference to 2006.	15:02
11			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: It is withdrawn. It is	
12			accepted.	
13			CHAIRMAN: It does say that. I have noted it. And the	
14			personal injuries claim, I don't know what that was.	
15			Was that the bullying claim, was it?	15:02
16			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I have no idea. Can you	
17			enlighten us as to what	
18			MR. McDOWELL: I think it was the bullying claim,	
19			Judge.	
20			CHAIRMAN: It wasn't the altercation in the hotel,	15:02
21			anyway. Right, it was, there was a bullying claim.	
22	701	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Can you enlighten us as to	
23			whether you have a single memory of any incident, any	
24			discussion with any colleagues, at a meeting or	
25			otherwise, as to whether Sergeant McCabe's driving of	15:02
26			the agenda might be informed by the treatment, as he	
27			perceived it, he received arising out of the complaint	
28			in 2006?	
20		٨	Wall I think those was a grain those wasn't	

Т			far as I can recall, it wasn't discussed at those	
2			meetings, but there was a general talk that that was	
3			part of Sergeant McCabe bringing forward the penalty	
4			points issues, but it was a I wouldn't be able to	
5			say officer X had that view or officer Y had that view.	15:03
6			And it wasn't necessarily, I would call it, a	
7			generally-held view. It was a view held by certain	
8			people. But I can't, to be honest with you, recall the	
9			individuals.	
10	702	Q.	well, let's, before we get analysing how widely held	15:03
11			the view was, let's isolate just one individual who	
12			held it. Give us a name, please.	
13		Α.	I don't have a name, I'm afraid.	
14	703	Q.	Does that strike you as odd?	
15		Α.	Not particularly, because there was lots of	15:03
16			conversations. As you said, it was a significant major	
17			topic for the organisation, it was the topic for the	
18			organisation. There was lots of conversations going on	
19			about it and around it, there was lots of people in the	
20			organisation talking about it.	15:04
21	704	Q.	well, let's, as a working premise, take a starting	
22			point, that the people who are generating this	
23			discussion were not people who would be deemed to be	
24			well-informed, let's look at it coming from the bottom	
25			up, so to speak. Would that not have been something	15:04
26			you would have been anxious to bring to Commissioner	
27			Callinan's attention, that this is what people are	
28			saying?	
29		Δ	My impression was and as you say I was relatively new	

1			to the organisation, but my impression was that it was	
2			relatively well-known at the upper echelons of the	
3			organisation, because that's the way kind of the rumour	
4			mill works in Garda HQ, that it goes up the chain, if	
5			you like.	15:05
6	705	Q.	Yes. But the notes of the meeting would seem to	
7			indicate that the rumour mill doesn't just float, it	
8			specifically attaches, we know, to that particular	
9			meeting.	
10		Α.	Well, again, I can't recall the specifics of it. And	15:05
11			whether you call them rumours or whether you call them	
12			incidents that actually happened. It certainly appears	
13			from my notes and notes of others who were in	
14			attendance at that meeting that certainly matters	
15			relating to Sergeant McCabe were discussed at that	15:05
16			meeting, yes.	
17	706	Q.	I mean, as director of communications of the Garda	
18			Press Office, it is your testimony that you never	
19			attempted to inquire of these rumours, to see whether	
20			they had any substance, where they emanated, and to	15:05
21			consider legitimately whether, in fact, there was a	
22			case to be made that Sergeant McCabe was informed by	
23			virtue of his disappointment over what had occurred?	
24		Α.	Sorry, I don't understand the last part of your	
25			question.	15:06
26	707	Q.	Sorry, I will put the question in more simple terms.	
27			Obviously An Garda Síochána wanted to know what was	
28			driving the agenda, isn't that right?	
29		Α.	Yes. That would be fair point, ves.	

1	708	Q.	Yeah. And would it not be fair to at least discuss the	
2			matter, this man is driven by the fact that he's	
3			embittered as a result of him being the subject of a	
4			police investigation, would it be legitimate to discuss	
5			that?	15:06
6		Α.	Sorry, are you saying, I'm just not quite	
7			understanding, are you saying legitimate to discuss	
8			that in a meeting as in a pre-PAC meeting or discuss	
9			that directly with Sergeant McCabe?	
10	709	Q.	Any or both?	15:06
11			CHAIRMAN: Well, if I could just intervene,	
12			Mr. McLindon, it may help.	
13		Α.	Yes. Sorry, Chair.	
14			CHAIRMAN: I don't know whether you were around for	
15			Italia 90, but there used to be a football manager in	15:07
16			this country who had a similar name to my own, and he	
17			referred to a particular journalist as being a bitter	
18			little man.	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Now, that is on the public record, I'm not	15:07
21			telling you probably anything you don't know. But what	
22			Mr. O'Higgins is asking you is: Was that the whole	
23			attitude of the Garda organisation, he's a bitter	
24			little man in consequence of A, B and C, or whatever it	
25			was? Would it be fair to put it that way,	15:07
26			Mr. O'Higgins?	
27			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, it's that plus this	
28			CHAIRMAN: Maybe just answer that first and then you	
29			can put in a plus, so that is a simple way of putting	

- 1 it.
- 2 A. Yeah, I think that that'd be -- that would be the view
- held among some, but again, I couldn't say if that was the view held generally across the organisation.
- 5 710 Q. MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: All right. Well, take that as

15:08

15:08

15:08

- a starting point, there is a view in existence that
- 7 part of his agenda is driven by the fact that he is
- 8 embittered. Now, An Garda Síochána have to deal with
- 9 the issues which are raised by Sergeant McCabe, isn't
- the issues which are raised by Sergeant McCabe, isn't that right?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 711 Q. And they have to understand them, isn't that right?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 712 Q. Would it not be legitimate to discuss whether or not
- his agenda was driven by that?
- 16 A. Yes, potentially, and I think you could say that
- 17 potentially, if you look at those notes, my notes, that
- that could be part of that. But I suppose if you look
- 19 at the notes later on, sickness and absence policy,
- visits to the family home, you could also say that then 15:08
- 21 what measures are being taken to ensure that Sergeant
- 22 McCabe is being looked after.
- 23 713 Q. Yes.
- A. In case there was a question again from members of PAC
- in relation to that, without identifying any
- individuals.
- 27 714 Q. You see, you accept that, but you seem to be accepting
- it more or less on the basis of drawing inferences as
- to what is more or less inevitable. You don't seem to

- 1 be accepting it on the basis you remember that actually 2 happened. No --3 Α. 715 Is that fair comment? 4 0. 5 Well, I don't recall the exact nature of that Α. 15:09 conversation and I don't want to provide misleading 6 7 information to the Tribunal. I don't recall. 8 716 Could I suggest to you that although I'm putting to Q. 9 you, and putting it to you genuinely, that that is a discussion which An Garda Síochána management could 10 15:09 11 genuinely enter upon and not be doing anything wrong, 12 I'm suggesting that, nonetheless, it's a hot potato to 13 concede that such discussions took place, and had they 14 taken place they would be forged in your mind clearly 15 and perpetually; do you follow what I am putting to 15:09 16 you? 17 Well, I don't recall the exact nature of that Α. 18 conversation. I'm sorry I can't be more helpful.
- 19 717 Well, I will put it to you like this: It's as plain, I Q.
- 20 respectfully suggest, it's as plain as day that that kind of discussion, and probably other discussions of a 21 22 similar, perhaps more dark nature, took place. 23 did take place, you remember them very clearly, but you 24 are reluctant to speak about them because you are 25 concerned that it will implicate yourself in them; does 15:10 26 that make any sense?
- 27 No. Α.
- 28 718 All right. Q.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: Well, perhaps another way of putting it -

forgive the interruption, Mr. O'Higgins, it may help -I don't know whether the statement of Superintendent Taylor is to be construed as saying you were part of, and I'm going to use the word, it means to breathe together the conspiracy against Sergeant 15:10 McCabe, but it certainly is saying that you were aware of it and that it was going on around you, and it may be that you felt appalled by the whole thing, I don't know, but your answer seems to be to that, well, I can't be appalled by something I don't know about, and 15:11 the close relationship between the Commissioner and David Taylor and the fact that I was a garda might make it understandable that perhaps I didn't know, that seems to be your answer to that. But what is being put to you squarely by Mr. O'Higgins is, he is saying, 15:11 look, you were part of all of this and maybe you would be so kind as to address that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Yes, Chair, well that is a summation of my position Α. that you have outlined there. I was not aware of any of those discussions, I was not aware -- particularly 15:11 not aware of any briefings and anything else like that, and I would have absolutely been appalled if that was the attitude being adopted by the Garda Commissioner. I joined An Garda Síochána because of my high regard for the organisation. I felt I could make a difference 15:11 If I had arrived into an within the organisation. organisation three or four months into that time and found that the head of the organisation was engaged in significant briefings against a Garda member using

1 allegations of a sexual nature, I would have been 2 absolutely appalled. 3 719 Q. MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, I'm going to be putting to you in very stark terms what my client's 4 5 instructions are in due course, but they're in line 15:12 6 certainly with what the Chairman suggests; that far 7 from learning of this after the event, you were very, 8 very aware of it during the currency. But we will come to that in due course. 9 Does it go so far, Mr. O'Higgins, as to say 10 11 that Mr. McLindon was actually part of it, was involved in it? 12 13 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: No, he was not present when the 14 Commissioner gave my client instructions, but my client 15 relayed to Mr. McLindon what those instructions were, 15:12 16 and I will be putting it in very clear terms in due 17 course. 18 So there was an occasion when he actually CHAIRMAN: 19 came out of the Commissioner's office, went into 20 Mr. McLindon's office? 15:13 21 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: And told him what the position 22 was. 23 And said, the Commissioner has told me to do CHAIRMAN: 24 the following. MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yes, absolutely. And I will be 15:13 25 26 putting it in specific terms. 27 CHAIRMAN: Right. Yes. 28 720 Q. MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: But just before I get to that, 29 I want to clarify something in my own mind. What level

			or filteraction and you have with journalists:	
2		Α.	At the time I didn't have a significant level of	
3			interaction with journalists because I was	
4			familiarising myself with the role. I would have met	
5			some journalists for a cup of coffee, just again to	15:13
6			because I wouldn't have had a huge working relationship	
7			with crime correspondents before I joined An Garda	
8			Síochána, so just to kind of figure out exactly how	
9			they work and what their requirements were from us as a	
10			press organisation.	15:13
11	721	Q.	I notice that the press release which was drafted by	
12			you dated March 2014, to whom would that press release	
13			have been circulated?	
14		Α.	That would have been circulated to all members of the	
15			media. It's on our if it was gone out through our	15:14
16			press release, it goes to, I think it's about 800	
17			members of the media on that press list.	
18			CHAIRMAN: This is 3004 you're referring to?	
19			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: 14.	
20			CHAIRMAN: I know. The page number is 3004, is that	15:14
21			the one?	
22			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: 2999-3000. It was just	
23			circulated after lunch, Chairman.	
24	722	Q.	It was the press release put out with respect to the	
25			Commissioner's clarification of the use of the word	15:14
26			"disgusting", isn't that right?	
27		Α.	Yes, I don't have it in front of me, unfortunately, but	
28			yes.	
29	723	0	So that would go to all news desks all crime corns	

2 right? 3 Α. That's correct. And your mobile telephone number is on it? 4 724 0. 5 That's correct. Α. 15:14 6 725 So, as of March 2014, the journalists were given your 0. mobile telephone number? 7 Yes, and they probably had it earlier than that. 8 Α. I don't doubt that. And they also had your extension 9 726 Q. line in the office, isn't that right? 10 15:15 11 Correct. Α. 12 Did you have any discussions with any journalists about 727 Q. 13 Sergeant McCabe? 14 Α. Not of a detailed nature, no. 15 728 well, we will get to the detail in a moment. Did you Q. 15:15 16 have any discussions with any journalists?

all -- any journalist who is on the list, isn't that

18 729 Q. Yeah.

Α.

17

1

A. Well, in relation to Sergeant McCabe's allegations in relation to the FCPN issues, yes.

15:15

In relation to Sergeant McCabe's --

- 21 730 Q. Well, we will just start with Sergeant McCabe. Did you have any discussions with journalists?
- 23 A. Generally, no, because the journalists, as far as I 24 could -- the journalists who spoke to me anyway,
- weren't actually necessarily that interested in
 Sergeant McCabe's issues because they were more
- concerned with whether his allegations that he was
- 28 bringing forward were correct or not.
- 29 731 Q. I see. So you're drawing a distinction between a call

1 from a journalist who says "tell me about Sergeant 2 McCabe" and a journalist phoning about the penalty 3 points issue? Yes. 4 Α. 5 732 Let's take that distinction out of it. Q. How many 15:16 6 iournalists did you talk to about 7 Sergeant-McCabe-related issues? 8 I can't recall, because I would have received a number Α. of phone calls, but --9 A lot? 10 733 Q. 15:16 11 Over a period of time, if you are talking about -- it Α. 12 depends what particular area of time you're -- or 13 length of time you're talking about. 14 734 Q. '13, late '13 to '14? 15 well, late '13, not so much, because again, I was only Α. 15:16 16 familiarising myself with the role. Into 2014 I would 17 have been speaking to journalists guite regularly as 18 the FCPN issue cropped up. 19 735 Did any journalist raise the sexual assault allegation? Q. Not insofar as that it was -- no, not that I recall, 20 Α. 15:17 21 No, not that I recall, no. 22 736 well, again, it may be my comment, but you seem Q. 23 somewhat equivocal. Do you have an actual recollection 24 one way or the other? 25 Well, Paul Williams certainly did. CHAIRMAN: 15.17 26 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yes. Although -- did 27 Mr. Williams speak to you?

Or to Superintendent Taylor?

28

29

737

Α.

Q.

No.

Т		Α.	To Superintendent Taytor	
2			CHAIRMAN: There is nothing to suggest that	
3			Mr. Williams spoke to Mr. McPartlin.	
4		Α.	I can't recall who, but maybe one or two journalists	
5			would have mentioned the background to Sergeant McCabe,	15:17
6			but considering I already knew it, it wasn't relevant	
7			to me.	
8	738	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: What did you say to them about	
9			it?	
10		Α.	I said to them what I knew in relation to the DPP and	15:17
11			that there wasn't anything in it and that it was	
12			groundless, and that is all I knew, and that I wasn't	
13			interested in that, I was interested in	
14	739	Q.	Well, did you tell him that?	
15		Α.	Well, I don't necessarily think from my	15:17
16			recollection, I don't necessarily think I had to tell	
17			them that because they already knew that.	
18	740	Q.	well, you see	
19			CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, just before you go on, I just	
20			need to be clear. You don't have a specific	15:18
21			recollection of any journalist in any way talking to	
22			you, on the phone or otherwise, and saying, look, what	
23			about this thing about Sergeant McCabe and child sex	
24			abuse, or anything of that kind of generic ballpark?	
25		Α.	No, no.	15:18
26			CHAIRMAN: But you think that if it could have been	
27			mentioned because of the wide nature of the circulation	
28			of the echos going around about this	
29		Δ.	Yes.	

1			CHAIRMAN: in the event that it had been raised, and	
2			this is only speculation on your part, you would have	
3			said, well, look, that was cleared up, it went to the	
4			DPP and he said this it was she actually, she said	
5			there was nothing to it, or whatever?	15:18
6		Α.	Yes, Chair.	
7	741	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Can I just ask, arising from	
8			that clarification, I mean initially I understood your	
9			answer to be that you had no recollection of anybody;	
10			then it appeared to me, I may have misheard you, that	15:18
11			you may have had discussions, one or two?	
12		Α.	Well, I wouldn't call them discussions. I would say it	
13			was mentioned, but it wasn't	
14	742	Q.	Mentioned by one or two?	
15		Α.	One or two, but it wasn't	15:18
16	743	Q.	And you apparently gave no comment at all because in	
17			the course of them discussing it, they ran around a	
18			circle outlining what it was, concluding there was	
19			nothing it, and you said nothing?	
20			CHAIRMAN: No, I don't think so, Mr. O'Higgins. I	15:19
21			think what he said was well, for a start, I	
22			appreciate we're trying to recover memory here, but I	
23			think Mr. McLindon's belief in relation to this is, if	
24			that happened, he would have said, look, the matter	
25			went to the DPP, as far as I'm concerned that is the	15:19
26			end of it, or something to that effect.	
27		Α.	Yes, Chair.	
28	744	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, I understood you to say	
29			that you didn't need to say anything to them because	

1			they already knew, is that what you said to me?	
2		Α.	Yes, that was generally again, without recalling	
3			individual conversations because I can't recall	
4			individual conversations unfortunately, most of the	
5			journalists knew that the issue was groundless in	15:19
6			relation to Sergeant McCabe, that was my that was	
7			the impression that I got from speaking to from	
8			journalists.	
9	745	Q.	You see, again, Mr. McLindon, I don't and couldn't	
10			seriously expect you to have all this at the tip of	15:20
11			your tongue, but the answers I'm getting, I'm	
12			characterising them as somebody with literally no	
13			memory bank whose answer is crafted in the following	
14			way: I have no specific recollection, it does appear	
15			from your questioning, however, it's likely that a	15:20
16			conversation of some sort would have taken place, not	
17			very often, and here's what I expect would have	
18			occurred in the conversation. Is that a fair	
19			summation?	
20		Α.	Well, I wouldn't agree with the comment that I have no	15:20
21			memory bank, but em	
22	746	Q.	well, the facts as I allege them, is that correct?	
23		Α.	well, as I said, I refer to my previous answer in	
24			relation to in relation to my dealings with the	
25			media.	15:20
26	747	Q.	I understand that you knew some of the journalists, you	
27			had been to college with them, is that right?	
28		Α.	Eh, no, not the journalists I would have been dealing	

with on a regular basis, no.

29

- 1 748 Q. No.
- 2 A. Unless there's anyone specific that I can't recall, but
- none of the crime correspondents, for instance, I would

15.21

15:21

15:21

15:22

- 4 have gone to college with.
- 5 749 Q. I would like -- do you know all the crime
- 6 correspondents now?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 750 Q. Have you met them all?
- 9 A. I'd meet them, yes.
- 10 751 Q. Regularly?
- 11 A. Well, I'd meet them at press briefings and media 12 briefings. We do quite regular media briefings and
- press briefings and they're the main people who attend.
- 14 752 Q. I'd like to run through briefly with you how the Garda
- 15 Press Office works, or at least how I understand it
- 16 works. In the first instance, the front line in the
- 17 Garda Press Office is to provide information, isn't
- 18 that right?
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 753 Q. And when we turn on the radio in the morning and we
- 21 hear there's a fatal road traffic accident down in
- Tipperary, that is information that typically will have
- been released by the Garda Press Office?
- 24 A. Correct.
- 25 754 Q. Other information which would be released by the Garda
- 26 Press Office would be that a particular unit of An
- 27 Garda Síochána, it could be the SDU, it could be the
- 28 Criminal Assets Bureau, executed a series of warrants
- at specific address, arrests had been made, items had

1			been seized, and so forth, isn't that right?	
2		Α.	Correct.	
3	755	Q.	Again, it is a purely information distribution	
4			exercise, isn't that right?	
5		Α.	Correct.	15:22
6	756	Q.	Next, you might have a specific event, like a murder of	
7			perhaps an elderly person living alone, or some other	
8			murder that would attract particular attention, isn't	
9			that right?	
10		Α.	Correct, yes.	15:23
11	757	Q.	And in those instances, in the first couple of days,	
12			you would have what I would describe as rolling press	
13			conferences, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	Correct, yes.	
15	758	Q.	And again, they are information-distribution exercises	15:23
16			where the media are informed that the pathologist has	
17			arrived, the information is obviously given out very	
18			sparingly because there are trial issues down the line,	
19			but it is the imparting of information, isn't that	
20			right?	15:23
21		Α.	Correct.	
22	759	Q.	Now, what those features all have in common, and that	
23			is, they are all what I would describe as	
24			above-the-water-line Garda Press Office activities,	
25			isn't that right?	15:23
26		Α.	Correct.	
27	760	Q.	Now, I want to ask you about another aspect of the	
28			Garda Press Office, where there are one-to-one	
29			briefings with journalists. First of all, I would like	

Τ			to confirm and invite you to comment on this, that is	
2			not new; that has been going on for decades?	
3		Α.	Correct.	
4	761	Q.	And some of the briefings are what is known as	
5			off-the-record briefings or unattributable briefings,	15:24
6			isn't that right?	
7		Α.	On occasion, yes.	
8	762	Q.	Yes. Is there a distinction between an off-the-record	
9			briefing or an unattributable briefing, or are they, in	
10			practice, the same thing?	15:24
11		Α.	Well, I haven't really heard the phrase	
12			"unattributable", to be honest with you.	
13	763	Q.	I mean, you were explaining to us, and I invite you to	
14			enlarge upon it, they are not uncommon in large	
15			organisations, isn't that right?	15:24
16		Α.	That'd be correct, yes.	
17	764	Q.	And before I ask a couple of questions about it, in	
18			your own words would you tell us how off-the-record	
19			briefings work and why they are in place?	
20		Α.	Well, it depends on the it depends on the	15:25
21			circumstances. You might want to impart information on	
22			a background basis that I'm just trying to think of	
23			an example, to be honest with you, Chair, so if I might	
24			just take a second, if that is okay.	
25			CHAIRMAN: Please do.	15:25
26		Α.	Say, for instance, if you're in the middle of a, and	
27			I'm taking it outside the Garda element, but if you	
28			were in the middle of an industrial relations dispute	
29			and there are ongoing discussions with trade unions,	

Т			you may want to inform correspondents of the progress	
2			of those discussions and if they are going well, but,	
3			you know, you don't want to get into a situation where	
4			you're saying that publicly with a public face in case	
5			it upsets the trade unions.	15:26
6	765	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: All right. Perhaps if I could	
7			give an example within the Garda context. We have	
8			regrettably been plagued in recent years by what have	
9			been referred to as gangland feuds, isn't that right?	
10		Α.	Correct.	15:26
11	766	Q.	And there have been a number of very well reported	
12			feuds, with a body count arising on each side of the	
13			divide, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct, unfortunately.	
15	767	Q.	And it would not be uncommon after the latest atrocity	15:26
16			that a newspaper might report which side was striking	
17			against the other and perhaps give some information as	
18			to who had perpetrated the offence and why and why the	
19			particular victim had been selected. That's something	
20			that would occur in an off-the-record briefing, isn't	15:26
21			that right?	
22		Α.	No.	
23	768	Q.	It's not?	
24		Α.	No.	
25	769	Q.	Where does that information come from when you read it	15:27
26			in the newspaper?	
27		Α.	Well, crime correspondents have very good sources	
28			within An Garda Síochána and they are able to use those	
29			sources and that's from their perspective, that is a	

1			legitimate exercise, to gain information that I, as	
2			director of communications, would prefer was not in the	
3			public domain because it involves sensitive personal	
4			data and victims of crimes.	
5	770	Q.	What off-the-record information have you imparted in	15:27
6			your time?	
7			CHAIRMAN: Well, now, Mr. O'Higgins.	
8	771	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, can you give us the type	
9			of information?	
10			CHAIRMAN: Well, I mean, the European Convention on	15:27
11			Human Rights as interpreted by the European Court of	
12			Human Rights is perfectly clear. The exceptions to	
13			journalistic privilege are extremely limited, and I am	
14			not going to make any decision as to whether someone	
15			is	15:28
16			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I won't press it, Chairman.	
17			CHAIRMAN: No, no, no, a witness is obliged to answer a	
18			question without looking into the detail of it in	
19			considerable detail, and it can't do that because it's	
20			a balancing exercise and the exceptions are very	15:28
21			limited. I mean, you're asking him just to let's	
22			divulge all the secrets you've ever told the press. I	
23			mean	
24			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, I won't pursue it.	
25	772	Q.	You have given off-the-record briefings, isn't that so?	15:28
26		Α.	I have given off-the-record briefings throughout my	
27			career in public relations.	
28	773	Q.	I'm not suggesting that there's anything necessarily	
29			wrong with it. The purpose of an off-the-record	

1			briefing, I would suggest to you, is as follows: it	
2			allows one party to put a version of events out without	
3			having to be identified with it, isn't that so?	
4		Α.	Potentially. Again, it depends on the circumstances,	
5			but potentially.	15:29
6	774	Q.	That is the usual advantage to be gained; you get your	
7			side out without having to stand over it publicly?	
8		Α.	Well, without it being publicly, if you like, publicly	
9			attributable to the organisation in question, yes.	
10	775	Q.	That's the advantage. So, in terms of a story, you get	15:29
11			to influence if without having to put your head above	
12			the parapet?	
13		Α.	Again, depending on the circumstances, yes.	
14	776	Q.	That, I would suggest, is most, if not all,	
15			circumstances, isn't that so?	15:29
16		Α.	Again, it would depend on the circumstances.	
17	777	Q.	I want to put to you my client's instructions with	
18			regard to his interaction with you and the nature of	
19			the relationship he enjoyed with you and the	
20			information he shared with you, and it is his	15:30
21			instruction that he shared what he knew with you	
22			consistently throughout his dealings with you. Now, I	
23			am putting that as a general proposition. I think as a	
24			general proposition, you wouldn't demur from it?	
25		Α.	In general, no, I wouldn't.	15:30
26	778	Q.	Specifically, he instructs that when you took up the	
27			post, he gave you a full briefing of all of the issues	
28			which were boiling or simmering away, including the	
29			Sergeant McCabe whistleblower issue. First of all, did	

1			he give you any briefing on the Sergeant McCabe issue?	
2		Α.	He gave me a briefing on issues in general, and that	
3			would have included the fact that there was starting to	
4			come through in the media an issue around penalty	
5			points. But I don't recall him referencing Sergeant	15:3
6			McCabe by name.	
7	779	Q.	Well, am I correct in thinking that Assistant	
8			Commissioner O'Mahony appointment was the 31st October	
9			2012?	
10		Α.	It was before my time, I'm afraid.	15:3
11	780	Q.	And I understand he reported to the Commissioner in the	
12			last week of March, perhaps the 28th March 2013?	
13		Α.	That could well have been the case, but again, it was	
14			before my time.	
15	781	Q.	And you arrived in September?	15:3
16		Α.	September 2013.	
17	782	Q.	And the PAC meetings were - we've had them up on	
18			screen - they were happening in late 2012/early 20	
19			sorry, late 2013/early 2014, is that correct?	
20		Α.	There was one technical meeting with the traffic bureau	15:3
21			in December 2013 and then the main meetings began in	
22			early January.	
23	783	Q.	And would it be fair to say that Sergeant McCabe's	
24			earlier set of complaints were what one might say were	
25			confined to local issues; in other words, issues that	15:3
26			had happened in the Cavan-Monaghan division, but this	

national issue.

27

28

29

Α.

was a horse of a different colour in the sense it was a

Well, I don't know the detail of the previous

_			issues, but certainly the allegations that sergeant	
2			McCabe was bringing forward in relation to FCPN was a	
3			national issue.	
4	784	Q.	And what did precisely, as best as you can recollect,	
5			what did Superintendent Taylor tell you all about it?	15:32
6		Α.	My recollection is that he informed me that there was	
7			allegations that basically penalty points that Garda	
8			members had struck off penalty points outside of	
9			procedure, that there was allegations. I can't recall	
10			did he give an opinion on whether the allegations were	15:33
11			correct or not. As far as I was concerned, it was a	
12			top-line briefing on the issues that the organisation	
13			was facing.	
14	785	Q.	But what did he say about Sergeant McCabe's motivation	
15			for making or highlighting these matters?	15:33
16		Α.	I don't recall at that time Superintendent Taylor	
17			bringing forward anything in relation to Sergeant	
18			McCabe's motivations.	
19	786	Q.	Well, just think about this now. You're new in the	
20			job, you're working your way in, this is a significant	15:33
21			issue coming down the tracks, it's beginning to	
22			formulate at your end on a formal basis in	
23			December/January '13/'14; do you think it is possible	
24			that you could have had discussions with	
25			Superintendent Taylor about this matter where his	15:34
26			motivation was not discussed?	
27		Α.	Well, it's entirely possible that we could have had a	
28			conversation at some stage where his motivation was	
29	787	Q.	Right. What did he say?	

2 entirely possible that motivation could have been	
discussed, but, to be honest with you, my concern was	
4 not Sergeant McCabe's motivation, my concern was, was	
5 Sergeant McCabe's allegations in relation to FCPN	15:34
6 correct or not and were we in a position to defend the	!
7 organisation and protect the reputation of the	

9 788 Q. But I take it, we will talk for a moment generically, I

10 take it you're not making the case that if a person is 15:34

11 complaining about how something functions, that their

organisation in relation to the FCPN allegations.

motivation for making the complaint is irrelevant?

organisation is: are their actual allegations correct

- A. No, I'm not making that case in general, but that's not -- it's not -- their motivation is not -- from my point of view in terms of communicating information and 15:35
- issues, their motivation is not really of relevance to
 me. What is of relevance to me in trying to defend the
- 19 or not?

8

12

18

- 20 789 Q. But surely you cannot determine whether a person's 15:35 motivation is relevant without first ascertaining what
- their motivation was?
- A. Well, again, again, all I can say is, from my
 perspective, and this is my perspective, is that
 motivation is not particularly relevant, what they are bringing forward is the allegation --
- 27 790 Q. The question I asked you, and I'm sorry to interrupt 28 you, but the question I asked you was: You've agreed 29 with me in some instances a person's motivation can be

1			relevant, and I'm asking you how can you determine	
2			whether it is one of those instances or not without	
3			ascertaining firstly what their motivation was?	
4		Α.	Well, what I said was, their motivation may be relevant	
5			in the general terms in terms of how the organisation	15:36
6			handled them, but they're not relevant to me from a	
7			communications perspective. What is relevant to me	
8			from a communications perspective is, are the	
9			allegations correct, false or somewhere in between? If	
10			I know that information, then I can help defend the	15:36
11			organisation, or at least advise on how best to protect	
12			and enhance the reputation of the organisation.	
13	791	Q.	So it never occurred to you that if the man was	
14			embittered, as the rumour machine seemed to suggest,	
15			that that is a factor, one way or another, which you	15:36
16			should consider or even discuss with Superintendent	
17			Taylor?	
18		Α.	I may well have discussed it, but it wasn't from a	
19			consideration point of view in terms of what that meant	
20			for our PR strategy, that wasn't a consideration.	15:37
21	792	Q.	All right. Well, we will leave the strategy for a	
22			moment. You may well have; did you?	
23		Α.	I don't recall, but it's entirely possible, as Sergeant	
24			McCabe's name filtered through into the media	
25	793	Q.	You see, I would suggest two things: First of all,	15:37
26			it's obviously, I would respectfully suggest, clear	
27			that a person with even the smallest level of	
28			curiosity, never mind a director of communications in a	
29			press office, would inquire about that, and, number	

1		two, given where we are today and given that where we	
2		are today didn't just happen last week, that you would	
3		remember it, and this is another example, I suggest, of	
4		an empty memory bank?	
5		CHAIRMAN: Well, I'm not sure that reiteration of empty	15:37
6		memory bank is actually helping at this stage.	
7		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I take your point.	
8		CHAIRMAN: What Mr. O'Higgins is basically asking you	
9		is, and I go back and it's if something is being	
10		said that is unpleasant about, let us say, the	15:38
11		organisation you are wokring for, the person that you	
12		are working for, obviously there's two approaches, the	
13		first and the obvious approach is to see is it true or	
14		is it not. Perhaps another approach is: what is	
15		motivating this person? And, you know, there can be	15:38
16		two responses: destroy the facts because they're not	
17		correct, or destroy the person if the facts are	
18		correct. Now, as I get Mr. O'Higgins's drift, you were	
19		being briefed that the Garda organisation was out to	
20		destroy the person on the basis that, forgive me for	15:38
21		using the phrase again but it does stick, he was a	
22		bitter little man, as in the Jack Charlton comment, and	
23		I don't know if you can remember conversations with	
24		David Taylor to that effect? Maybe that's the best way	
25		of putting it, I don't know.	15:38
26		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
27	Α.	Well, certainly I would imagine, and I don't recollect	
28		them in detail, I'm afraid, Chair, but I imagine that	
29		we did talk about Sergeant McCabe and the issues that	

Т			ne was naving and that he had had, but they weren't	
2			influencing me in relation to my role as the director	
3			of communications in terms of advising, which is my key	
4			role, which is advising on the communications strategy	
5			for the organisation to the Garda Commissioner.	15:39
6	794	Q.	You see, you said to us that you were unaware of any	
7			policy in operation about briefing negatively against	
8			Sergeant McCabe, isn't that right?	
9		Α.	Correct.	
10	795	Q.	And I am just curious as to how you can make that	15:39
11			statement when, in the very next breath, you	
12			acknowledge you may have had discussions with	
13			Superintendent Taylor about his views about Sergeant	
14			McCabe and his motivation but don't remember any of	
15			them?	15:39
16		Α.	Well, I don't remember them in detail, but I would	
17			imagine that we did discuss it. I didn't note down	
18			those kind of conversations, they were casual	
19			conversations.	
20	796	Q.	I'm not suggesting you should note them down. But do	15:40
21			you think it's odd, in the position you're in here	
22			today, you're giving an answer saying, I imagine, I	
23			imagine there must have been a discussion, does that	
24			strike you as odd?	
25		Α.	Em, no, I have to say no, because it was every day	15:40
26			there was more revelations, more issues. It was a	
27			fairly stressful time, there was lots of meetings going	
28			on, there was lots of issues to be resolved, there was	
29			lots of statements to be drafted, everything else like	

- that, it was an credibly busy, stressful time, and I can't recall specific conversations, no.
- 3 797 Q. You see, your training is to separate wheat from chaff, do you know what I mean by that?
- 5 A. Yes.
- You're not someone who can take it in the round. 6 798 Q. 7 the contrary, your training, it's a little bit like a 8 lawyer's training or a journalist's training, is to sit down and say, what have we got here that is established 9 10 and what have we got here that is not established and 15 · 41 11 what are we left with? That is your training, isn't 12 that right?
- 13 A. Yes, in part.
- 14 799 Q. But certainly the impression your evidence is creating
 15 here is, there are all sorts of things that might have 15:41
 16 been said, could have been said, may have been said,
 17 but you have no specific recollection of any of them or
 18 any analysis of them. Does that make any sense?
- Well, it makes sense to me because I was in the middle 19 Α. of a significant major media maelstrom where, you know, 15:41 20 things were changing on a daily and sometimes on an 21 22 hourly basis. You're having lots of conversations with 23 lots of different people on these issues, and, as I 24 said, you know, they weren't formal meetings so you 25 didn't have them minuted, or anything else like that, 15.42 so it makes sense to me. 26
- 27 800 Q. When things are changing rapidly like that, don't you have to stay on top of it --
- 29 A. Absolutely.

1	801	Q.	and keep asking questions as to what the latest	
2			state of play is?	
3		Α.	Yes. But the main	
4	802	Q.	Because you get left behind if you don't do that?	
5		Α.	Yes, but	15:42
6	803	Q.	How did you function without making those inquiries?	
7		Α.	But I go back to my previous answers in relation to	
8			that. My focus again was on: were the allegations	
9			correct or not? Could we defend the allegations made	
10			by Sergeant McCabe in relation to the penalty points	15:42
11			issue? That was my focus.	
12	804	Q.	I want to suggest to you that Superintendent Taylor	
13			told you in categoric terms that the Garda	
14			Commissioner, Commissioner Callinan, had instructed him	
15			to draw to journalists' attention the allegation of	15:42
16			sexual assault, that there had been an investigation	
17			and that no prosecution was directed, but that he was	
18			disillusioned or embittered by that, and that was what	
19			was partly driving his agenda, he told you that in	
20			crystal-clear terms?	15:43
21		Α.	No.	
22	805	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Have you an occasion, Mr. O'Higgins? Is	
23			there specificity about a particular occasion leaving	
24			the Commissioner's office having	
25			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: No. It was an on it was a	15:43
26			rolling instruction that was in place.	
27			CHAIRMAN: I understood Superintendent Taylor to deny	
28			that there was any conversation with Mr. Williams as to	
29			any direction from the Director of Public Prosecutions.	

Т			MR. MICHAEL O HIGGINS: That is specifically so.	
2			CHAIRMAN: But nonetheless, it was to be mentioned to	
3			journalists even though he wouldn't mention it, denies	
4			mentioning it to Mr. O'Higgins.	
5			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I'm going to deal with the	15:43
6			Mr. Williams thing in just one moment and maybe we can	
7			tease that out then.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
9	806	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: But I'm suggesting to you that	
10			insofar as Superintendent Taylor had a riding	15:44
11			instruction from Commissioner Callinan, he imparted	
12			that to you in clear terms?	
13		Α.	No.	
14	807	Q.	You have mentioned instances that the Commissioner	
15			spoke in your presence about Sergeant McCabe, and I	15:44
16			understood you to say he was not sparing in his	
17			comments, is that right?	
18		Α.	Em, I wouldn't necessarily use the phrase "not	
19			sparing", but certainly, as I said previously,	
20			Commissioner Callinan had a very strong view in terms	15:44
21			of, his view at the time was that Sergeant McCabe had	
22			not cooperated with the O'Mahony investigation.	
23	808	Q.	When Mr. Williams contacted the Press Office, the first	
24			person my client spoke to was you, isn't that right?	
25		Α.	I'm not too sure if that was the case, but I know he	15:45
26			brought it to me fairly quickly after he got it.	
27	809	Q.	Sorry, in fact, when I say the first person, I'm not	
28			absolutely sure you were necessarily the first person.	
29			He brought it to your attention, isn't that right?	

- 1 A. He did, and that was the correct thing to do.
- 2 810 Q. And again just to be clear about this, because you say
- 3 words in your statement to the effect that you didn't
- 4 get the impression that my client had generated the
- 5 Paul Williams interest in Ms. D. Just to be clear
- 6 about that, he had nothing to do with it, good, bad or

15:45

15 · 45

15:46

15:46

15:46

- 7 indifferent. In fact, I believe there was evidence
- 8 here previously that some superintendent in Cavan or
- 9 Monaghan set it up or encouraged it. But his first
- 10 knowledge of it was when the phone rang in the Press
- 11 Office, same as yours, isn't that so?
- 12 A. That was my understanding of it, yes.
- 13 811 Q. And was Superintendent Taylor saying that Mr. Williams
- intended to write a story which would put Sergeant
- 15 McCabe in a bad light?
- 16 A. I don't recall him saying those exact words, no.
- 17 812 Q. Well, think about it now, because earlier you were
- saying in response to what you had been told that the
- 19 article wouldn't appear because it would be a libel?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 813 Q. So what do you think was told to you that left you with
- the impression that if it was printed it would be a
- 23 libel?
- A. Well, I would have thought that because he was going,
- 25 Mr. Williams this is again relayed to me by
- Superintendent Taylor that because Mr. Williams was
- going up to interview Ms. D, I would have thought there
- was potential for Ms. D to reference Sergeant McCabe,
- and my view on that was that that was -- that there

- would be no reference to Sergeant McCabe in that article because of the libel laws.
- 3 814 Q. Well, just on that point, just to be clear about this, 4 a Joe public picking up the article and reading it,

15:47

15 · 48

- 5 that there was an unnamed woman complaining that a
- 6 complaint she made against a guard wasn't properly
- 7 investigated, Joe public wouldn't make much of that,
- 8 isn't that right?
- 9 A. No, I wouldn't have thought so, no.
- 10 815 Q. But you would immediately pick up on what it was about, 15:47
 11 isn't that right?
- 12 A. I would -- well, I suppose I would, because I was aware 13 of the media query, I suppose --
- 14 816 Q. Yes, but you and anyone else who was well-informed

 15 would very quickly read between the lines and see what 15:47

 16 it was about, isn't that so?
- 17 I suppose it's very difficult for me to give an opinion Α. 18 I'm not trying to -- it's very difficult for 19 me to give an opinion on that, because I was aware of the situation, so I was aware of it, so I couldn't 20 15:48 looked at that, if you like, in a -- from the view of 21 22 the -- to use your phrase, the Joe public's view, I 23 couldn't give an opinion on that.
- 24 817 Q. You see, I have to suggest to you it's significant that
 25 when Mr. Williams rang, that Superintendent Taylor was
 26 anxious to bring it to your attention, because I
 27 suggest that what Mr. Williams was doing, i.e. writing
 28 a negative story about Sergeant McCabe, was consistent
 29 with what he had already told you the Garda Press

l Office	was	happy	to	promote?
----------	-----	-------	----	----------

- A. No, I don't think so. Like, it was a surprise to me that Paul Williams had put forward or was going to do this interview. That was the first that I had heard of it. As far as I was aware, Mr. Williams hadn't covered 15:48 much of this issue up until now, so I was surprised that Paul Williams was ringing us up, ringing up the Press Office in relation to this matter.

 CHAIRMAN: I think Mr. O'Higgins is probably putting it in this term: That it's like this our agenda is to 15:49 undermine Sergeant McCabe, we have been fishing all
 - undermine Sergeant McCabe, we have been fishing all night, or for the last week, and oh, look, there's something in our net, it's Paul Williams type thing, isn't that a great idea, isn't that wonderful news type stuff, and I don't know, can you help us as to the context or emotion of that?

15:49

15 · 49

A. Yeah, well, the impression that I got from Superintendent Taylor, that this was a surprise to him, that Paul Williams was going to be advancing this interview or that he was undertaking or going -- or had undertaken this interview, that the process that Paul Williams was engaged in was news to him, that was the impression I got.

CHAIRMAN: Could I just ask, Mr. O'Higgins, in the event it's been very helpful, obviously, that you put your client's case, which was that after having a discussion with Commissioner Callinan in clear terms, that Mr. McPartlin was told that he, namely Superintendent Taylor, had been instructed by Martin

Т			Callinan to draw journalists attention that there had	
2			been an allegation of sexual assault, that the DPP	
3			directed no prosecution, and that, in consequence of	
4			all of that, Sergeant McCabe was embittered and was	
5			partly driven, at least partly driven by that agenda.	15:50
6			Do you have any instructions as to what the alleged	
7			reaction was of Mr. McPartlin? I mean, it could be	
8			anything from, well, that is wonderful, or you must be	
9			off your head.	
10	818	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: No, I know you deny it was said	15:50
11			to you, but I'm suggesting it was said to you and I'm	
12			suggesting there was no adverse reaction from you	
13			whatsoever.	
14		Α.	No, my reaction to it was, was, I didn't think that	
15			that was going to be a story that would name Sergeant	15:50
16			McCabe.	
17			CHAIRMAN: No, don't worry about it.	
18		Α.	Sorry, Chair.	
19			CHAIRMAN: We're on a different thing now. Forget	
20			about Paul Williams for a second.	15:50
21	819	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: The Chairman has asked me to	
22			refresh you, to go back, that when my client told you	
23			what Commissioner Callinan wanted the manner in	
24			which Commissioner Callinan wanted the matter handled,	
25			you say you were never told that?	15:51
26		Α.	That's correct.	
27	820	Q.	But it is my case that you were. But the Chairman has	
28			inquired as to whether I have any instructions as to	
29			what your reaction was, and I don't, other than there	

1		was no adverse reaction from you when you were told.	
2	Α.	Well, I will refer to a previous answer, I wasn't told,	
3		and, if I had have been told, I would have been	
4		absolutely appalled about the suggestion of such a	
5		it's anathema to me to be involved as a public	15:51
6		relations professional, to be involved would be	
7		involved in such a smear campaign.	
8		CHAIRMAN: Would one not expect some kind of a	
9		reaction, Mr. O'Higgins? I mean, it's not every day	
10		that one is told by one's the person who is	15:51
11		answering to one that a person who is an officer of the	
12		police force of the State is going to be destroyed by	
13		that person. One might expect some kind of a reaction	
14		from Mr. McLindon.	
15		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Perhaps so, Chairman. I can't	15:52
16		put the matter further.	
17		CHAIRMAN: But it might help if we had some such	
18		instruction. I don't know whether	
19		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, I will certainly make	
20		inquiries over the weekend, but I don't have it on	15:52
21		CHAIRMAN: Is it possible for your solicitor to make an	
22		inquiry in relation to that?	
23		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yes, it is. We will do that.	
24		CHAIRMAN: Because it strikes me as being, at the	
25		moment, very odd.	15:52
26		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: We will do that, we will do	
27		that.	
28		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I wonder, Chairman, as part of	
29		that exercise, could I respectfully ask that it be put	

1	to the witness, once the opportunity arises to get the	
2	instruction, when this conversation is said to have	
3	taken place.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, that would help, too. But in	
5	any event, yes.	15:52
6	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: My solicitor will make	
7	inquiries in that regard.	
8	CHAIRMAN: But, I mean, everyone else who allegedly had	
9	such a thing said to them has reacted in some kind of	
10	way, either internally/externally, by saying something	15:52
11	or by walking away or terminating the conversation or	
12	changing the subject, or whatever it was, but there's	
13	nothing about that here.	
14	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, we will take	
15	instructions on it.	15:53
16	CHAIRMAN: Because one appreciates how serious this	
17	allegation is against Mr. McLindon.	
18	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: One does, one does. I mean,	
19	I'm putting it on my client's instructions. I have no	
20	alternative.	15:53
21	CHAIRMAN: No, I know that, I know that. I appreciate	
22	that. But, I mean, just so it's just floated and he	
23	says nothing, he doesn't reach for a bottle of water or	
24	for a bottle of whiskey.	
25	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, could I just say,	15:53
26	Chairman, we received the instruction. In the event	
27	that there wasn't a supplementary inquiry of my client,	
28	that's our omission, not necessarily his, but we will	
29	make the inquiry now.	

1		CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
2	821 Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Could I ask you to look at page	
3		1635, please. Can you talk us through what that	
4		document means?	
5	Α.	Yes. This was a media query that we received allegedly	15:54
6		of a so-called meeting between a Garda a new Garda	
7		whistleblower allegedly meeting - can I say the name,	
8		Chair?	
9		CHAIRMAN: I would prefer you wouldn't, if you wouldn't	
10		mind. Let's just call him Garda B, or whatever.	15:54
11	Α.	It's a private citizen who may have been involved in	
12		issues, I think that's why he was saying that's why	
13		someone might have	
14		CHAIRMAN: Well, then let's not put it up. I am sorry,	
15		maybe you would just give me the page reference again	15:55
16		and if you wouldn't mind not moving anything,	
17		Mr. Kavanagh, so I can just get it up, please,	
18		Mr. O'Higgins. What page number are we on?	
19		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: 1635, Chairman.	
20		CHAIRMAN: Just let me have a quick look at it if you	15:55
21		wouldn't mind, please.	
22		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: We read it from the bottom	
23		CHAIRMAN: If you just give me a moment, Mr. O'Higgins.	
24		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Of course, Chairman.	
25		CHAIRMAN: Right, let's not put actually, let's	15:55
26		if you read it out, please, without putting it on the	
27		screen, and if there's a point to the question	
28		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I don't need the identities of	
29		any parties. I mean, it starts with sending in a	

1 photograph at the bottom of the page at 17:29, isn't 2 that right. 3 Α. Yes. 822 And my client sends it to you at 17:34? 4 0. 5 Α. 15:56 6 823 Q. And it's reference to the photograph possibly 7 highlighting a new Garda whistleblower, is all I need 8 to say to you, isn't that right? 9 Yes. Α. 10 824 And you reply at 17:37? Q. 15:56 11 Yes. Α. 12 825 And then there's 17:41, you ask -- he says: 0. 13 "One of the males looks familiar." 14 15 15:56 16 Asks you to bring it to the attention of the Commissioner. 17 18 Yes. Α. 19 826 And you acknowledge that will be done, at 17:42? Q. 20 Α. Yes. 15:56 Does that not suggest that Superintendent Taylor was 21 827 Q. 22 working very closely with you on the issue of whistleblowers? 23 24 Yes. Α. 25 But yet when it came to indicating that Sergeant McCabe 15:56 828 0. may well be driven by an agenda because he felt hard 26 27 done by, he didn't share that with you? Well, that's a query that could potentially open up a 28 Α. 29 new front, if you like, on the whistleblower issue.

1			that's a query that would potentially has a	
2			significant impact on the reputation of the	
3			organisation. Superintendent Taylor absolutely did the	
4			right thing in bringing that to my attention and then	
5			we had to follow the process of bringing that to the	15:57
6			attention of the Commissioner, and then, when we did	
7			so, it actually turned out that it wasn't actually a	
8			whistleblower, it was a garda going about their normal	
9			business.	
10	829	Q.	I appreciate that, but is it not indicative of, as far	15:57
11			as a whistleblower is concerned, he's working hand in	
12			glove with you?	
13			CHAIRMAN: It may be, but obviously there is a	
14			legitimate aspect to whistleblowers.	
15			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Of course.	15:57
16			CHAIRMAN: And there is an illegitimate aspect, and it	
17			may be that some whistleblowers have agendas of their	
18			own and it may be that some whistleblowers are really	
19			public-minded people.	
20			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Very good.	15:58
21			CHAIRMAN: So can we draw any inference from	
22			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I won't press the matter any	
23			further.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Yes, I'm not sure one really could,	
25			Mr. O'Higgins.	15:58
26			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: It's only a straw in the wind,	
27			Judge, and it may be a small straw and the wind may be	
28			very light. That is all I will say.	
29	830	Q.	I want to ask you some questions about Commissioner	

Τ			Callinan and Sergeant McCabe. Superintendent Taylor	
2			says that Commissioner Callinan was almost obsessed	
3			with Sergeant McCabe and that Superintendent Taylor was	
4			to watch every television programme, every newspaper	
5			and to bring it to his attention. Does that ring any	15:58
6			bells with you?	
7		Α.	It doesn't necessarily ring any bells, that	
8			specificity, but certainly that wouldn't surprise me	
9			either.	
10	831	Q.	And can I ask you when the Commissioner Callinan I	15:59
11			mean, as you say yourself, in fairness, you're there to	
12			give advice, but people can heed it or elect not to	
13			heed it, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	832	Q.	And understandably, you felt at the PAC the approach	15:59
16			was to keep the dust down?	
17		Α.	Sorry, can you just repeat that question to me again?	
18	833	Q.	Your strategy at the Public Accounts Committee was to	
19			keep the dust down, so to speak? You know what I mean	
20			by that?	15:59
21		Α.	Are you talking about kind of damage limitation,	
22			effectively?	
23	834	Q.	Yes. Not be confrontational or not say things that	
24			would	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:59
26			CHAIRMAN: Let's not escalate everything, it's	
27			escalated enough.	
28		Α.	Yes, Chair.	
29			MR MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Or say something colourful that	

1 might come back to bite you. 2 Yes. And also, as I said previously, I would have Α. 3 preferred -- I would have strongly preferred if we had paid tribute to the whistleblowers for bringing forward 4 5 the information. 16:00 6 835 Can I ask you a question, and Commissioner Q. 7 Callinan had been, as you were explaining to us, I 8 think he had been in the witness box for almost five hours, is that right? 9 10 That is my recollection, yes. Α. 16:00 11 836 Without a break? Q. Without a break. 12 Α. 13 It's a long time? 837 Q. 14 Α. Yes. 15 838 Towards the end of that --Q. 16:00 16 CHAIRMAN: It's kind of merciless, really, because one 17 might need to go to the toilet, for instance. 18 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yes, that is true. 19 839 Towards the end of it, he came out with the outbreak of Q. "disgusting"? 20 16:00 21 Yes. Α. 22 That was bad news, as far as you were concerned? 840 Q. 23 Yes. Α. 24 Can I ask you, at the time that that was said, did you 841 Q. 25 make any connection with what he had said and the 2006 16:00 allegation? 26 27 Α. My understanding of what the Commissioner was 28 saying was that what he found disgusting was the way 29 the --

1			CHAIRMAN: We have been through it before, but the	
2			subtleties of comments are very often lost in the	
3			public discourse.	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5			CHAIRMAN: One can say it is well, look, let's not	16:01
6			go into it, but I know the distinction and I know	
7			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Could I say this, Mr. McLindon:	
8			You instanced a statement, I think, which was issued on	
9			the 16th March, I just want to get the date right	
10			the 20th March, perhaps, cleared on the 20th March,	16:01
11			four days after he had resigned and eight days after it	
12			was drafted, in which he explained why he had used the	
13			word "disgusting", isn't that so?	
14		Α.	Well, sorry, I think that's four days before he	
15			resigns, or retires, as it was technically.	16:01
16	842	Q.	Well, I don't want to spend getting bogged down on	
17			our valuable time, but this statement says it was	
18			created on the 12th March 2014, it was described as	
19			being cleared on the 20th March and I think was it	
20			released on the 20th March, is that right?	16:02
21		Α.	Well, you wouldn't have put out a statement from	
22			Commissioner Callinan unless he was in situ.	
23	843	Q.	So he resigned on the 16th, isn't that right?	
24			CHAIRMAN: He didn't. He resigned on the 24th.	
25			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: 24th, sorry, I beg your pardon.	16:02
26			So this was four days before he resigned?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	844	Q.	So, and again I don't want to spend any more time on	
29			this than it deserves, but it took him from the 24th of	

1			or 23rd January to the 20th March to acknowledge	
2			that the words were not the best words and there was	
3			another explanation?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5			MS. LEADER: I think it was actually sent out on the	16:02
6			12th, if you look at page 3004, which was just	
7			circulated. There are two different statements.	
8		Α.	Yes, there was a statement in relation to the 12th	
9			March one was in relation to the Garda Inspectorate.	
10	845	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: All right, we will work on the	16:03
11			12th, we will work on the 12th. It took from the 24th	
12			January to the 12th March for him to be persuaded that	
13			it would be better to make a public statement	
14			explaining "disgusting", isn't that right?	
15		Α.	That's correct.	16:03
16	846	Q.	And I don't mean this in any disparaging way, it's part	
17			of your job to try and put the best explanation on	
18			something, in much the same way it's part of my job on	
19			behalf of my client, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	That's correct.	16:03
21	847	Q.	But leaving all that aside, how, months later, this	
22			interpretation was placed on it, did it occur to you on	
23			the 23rd January, when he had used that word, that it	
24			was a subliminal reference, or otherwise, to the 2006	
25			events?	16:03
26		Α.	Sorry, could you repeat that question to me?	
27			CHAIRMAN: In other words, in using the word	
28			"disgusting", which is a kind of a strong word	
29			indicating repulsion as, for instance, I don't know,	

1		finding a dead mouse in your fridge or something like	
2		that.	
3	Α.	Yes.	
4		CHAIRMAN: It seems to indicate a powerful emotion.	
5		And if that is to be interpreted not in reference to	16:04
6		procedure but in reference to people, did it occur to	
7		you that perhaps there was a resonance there referable	
8		to child sex abuse or something of that variety, that	
9		is what you are being asked?	
10	Α.	No, I didn't take it in that.	16:04
11		CHAIRMAN: You didn't take it in that?	
12	Α.	In that vein, no.	
13		CHAIRMAN: Do you want to take a break? I am going to	
14		let Mr. McLindon take a break. I'm just going to stay	
15		here, Mr. O'Higgins. I'm sure you have instructions	16:05
16		to Mr. O'Higgins, will you be much longer?	
17		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: No, I won't. Just on the last	
18		lap. And the matter you have asked for clarification,	
19		I will be putting that to the witness.	
20		CHAIRMAN: And, Mr. O'Higgins, you will be	16:05
21		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, I had said up to ten	
22		minutes. I think that is still accurate.	
23		CHAIRMAN: That is grand.	
24		MR. LEHANE: Sorry, Chairman, I have questions.	
25		CHAIRMAN: No, that is fine, I'm sure they are not very	16:05
26		long. I doubt it.	
27			
28		[Short pause in proceedings]	

1	848	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Hello, Mr. McLindon. I just	
2			have four things to finish with. One of them is just a	
3			very quick matter. As far as the Paul Williams story	
4			is concerned, do you know did Deputy Commissioner	
5			Nóirín O'Sullivan have knowledge of that article before	16:07
6			it was published?	
7		Α.	Em, I don't know for definite, but certainly	
8			Superintendent Taylor told me that he was going to	
9			communicate with Nóirín O'Sullivan. That was again in	
10			line with policy and procedure.	16:07
11	849	Q.	But do you know when he spoke to Deputy Commissioner	
12			O'Sullivan what the response was?	
13		Α.	No.	
14	850	Q.	All right, I won't press it. Now I want to deal with	
15			the issue which the Chairman has raised about your	16:07
16			reaction when this was imparted to you. Mr. Taylor's	
17			instructions are that approximately two to three weeks	
18			after you were in your new position, you got a full	
19			briefing on all major and live issues, of which	
20			Sergeant McCabe was one, and this briefing occurred in	16:08
21			his office. Okay? Do you have any recollection of a	
22			briefing occurring in his office?	
23		Α.	No.	
24	851	Q.	You had already been given a briefing document on your	
25			arrival with regard to the workings of the office, and	16:08
26			so forth?	
27		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
28	852	Q.	He indicated to you what Commissioner Callinan's	

direction was with respect to Sergeant McCabe. He says

1			your reaction was matter of fact, sanguine, noted that	
2			that was the position adopted, you didn't show any	
3			outward sign of being shocked or appalled. Does that	
4			have any resonance for you, one way or the other?	
5		Α.	No.	16:09
6	853	Q.	You didn't raise any questions, you didn't attempt to	
7			end the meeting, and the matter moved on to other	
8			issues. Does that have any resonance for you?	
9		Α.	No.	
10	854	Q.	All right.	16:09
11			CHAIRMAN: In fact, sorry, Mr. O'Higgins, in the event	
12			that someone had said something like that to you,	
13			you're working in a police organisation and it's	
14			announced to you by the person who is reporting to you	
15			that the Garda Commissioner has, well, it's apparently	16:09
16			over your head, instructed him to destroy a serving	
17			officer, how would you have reacted?	
18		Α.	I would have been I would have been appalled and	
19			highly concerned and I would have felt the need to do	
20			something in relation to that in terms of reporting	16:09
21			that, whatever way that restructure I could report	
22			within, but I would have been seriously concerned, it	
23			would have been completely anathema to me as a	
24			communications professional and completely against my	
25			ethical mindset.	16:10
26	855	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Now, there are just two other	
27			matters I want to deal with. Assistant Commissioner	
28			O'Mahony had been given the brief of investigating the	
29			allegations which were raised by virtue of a protected	

1			disclosure, isn't that right?	
2		Α.	That is my understanding, yes.	
3	856	Q.	And the protected disclosure regime involves a level of	
4			confidentiality with regard to the complainant, isn't	
5			that so?	16:10
6		Α.	Yes. I think my, I stand to be corrected on this, but	
7			I suppose it's a slightly different regime. At the	
8			time it was the confidential recipient procedure rather	
9			than the protected disclosure procedure.	
10	857	Q.	Now, as Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony explains in his	16:10
11			statement, obviously they looked at the Pulse entries	
12			and it became very quickly apparent to them that the	
13			two people who were accessing the relevant Pulse files	
14			were Sergeant McCabe and Garda John Wilson, do you	
15			follow me?	16:11
16		Α.	I follow, yes.	
17	858	Q.	And moreover, it was reported that Garda John Wilson	
18			had told a garda sergeant that he had downloaded	
19			material from the Pulse system and had disseminated it	
20			and was entitled to do so because it didn't infringe	16:11
21			Section 62 of the Garda Síochána Act 2005 and that	
22			Sergeant McCabe had also done this. So even though the	
23			identity of the protected disclosure was confidential,	
24			there were strong indications as to what the origin	
25			was, do you follow me?	16:11
26		Α.	I follow you, yes.	
27	859	Q.	But as Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony explained, and	
28			indeed as you partly explained in your answer earlier,	
29			out of respect for the confidence the confidentiality	

Т			which the complainants are allowed, even though the	
2			guards were clearly well aware what the source of this	
3			was, they weren't going to out either of the	
4			individuals, do you follow me?	
5		Α.	Yes. I believe it's a bit more stronger than that now	16:12
6			certainly under the Protected Disclosures Act, which	
7			I'm more familiar with, but certainly I think the legal	
8			advice that we had was that we could not comment on	
9			that	
10	860	Q.	Exactly.	16:12
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	861	Q.	Now, it would appear that the Commissioner wanted to	
13			circumvent that by issuing a direction in terms that	
14			said, without prejudice to your rights under the	
15			confidential disclosure mechanism, if you have anything	16:12
16			to say to Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony, you should	
17			say it, isn't that right?	
18		Α.	I wasn't necessarily aware of the detail of that.	
19	862	Q.	Well, perhaps that makes my question redundant, because	
20			what I was really wanting to inquire was: did it occur	16:13
21			to you that it was in any way unfair that Garda	
22			management was taking a line that Sergeant McCabe and	
23			Garda Wilson were not cooperating with Assistant	
24			Commissioner O'Mahony?	
25			CHAIRMAN: Well, let's leave Garda Wilson out of it.	16:13
26			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Oh, sorry, just Sergeant	
27			McCabe.	
28			CHAIRMAN: I'm not reporting on Garda Wilson at all.	
29			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Just Sergeant McCabe.	

863 Did it occur to you that Garda management was acting in 1 Q. 2 any way unfairly? 3 Α. well, em, being new to the organisation and not being fully familiar with all the policies and procedures, 4 5 notwithstanding, you know, making sure that 16:13 confidentiality within the confidential recipient 6 7 element was respected. I could understand the 8 Commissioner's concerns if he felt that there was an explicit direction to a Garda member to comply with a 9 lawful order and then that Garda member had not 10 16:13 11 complied with that lawful order, and that was the 12 position of Commissioner Callinan at the time. 13 All right. 864 Q. 14 CHAIRMAN: As I understand the narrative on this, 15 Mr. O'Higgins, was, certainly that was what 16:14 16 Commissioner Callinan felt, but he may have been 17 incorrect. At one point, certainly, Mr. McLindon was 18 prepared to accept that as being correct, as it seemed 19 to be based on the O'Mahony report, but as he looked 20 into the matter further as time went on, he began to 16:14 feel that maybe the basis for saying that was less than 21 22 certain, and I think that's what you have told me. Yes, Chair. 23 Α. 24 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Now, I just want to turn to a 865 Q. 25 final issue. Now, on the day that Commissioner 16 · 14 26 Callinan resigned, on the morning, he rang my client to 27 inform him of what had occurred and my client instructs me that you were the first person he spoke to 28 29 thereafter.

- 1 Yes, I believe that Superintendent Taylor was basically Α. 2 upstairs, and there's a small kitchen in the Press Office, he was upstairs, he took the phone call. I had 3 just literally come into the office having been in 4 5 Manchester the day before, Greater Manchester Police, I 16:15 6 think it was early enough anyway, between 9:00 and 7 9:30, Superintendent Taylor came down and basically 8 said something along the lines, it may have been stronger than this, but you won't believe what is after 9 happening. 10 16:15 11 866 Q. I know this is a big question in one line, but I hope you know what I mean by it: Do office politics feature 12 13 much in your work environment? 14 Α. Em, the Garda organisation is a highly political, with 15 a small 'p', organisation, yes. 16:15 16 It's only small 'p' I'm talking about. 867 Q. 17 Yes, small, yes. Α. 18 Do you recall anything that happened later that same 868 Q. 19 day, an action performed by Superintendent Taylor --20 Eh... Α. 16:16 -- as a result of a request received from Commissioner 21 869 Q. 22 Callinan, who had earlier resigned that day? Superintendent Taylor, I believe, provided Mr. Paul 23 Α. 24 Reynolds of RTÉ with certain -- with a letter, I think,
- 27 870 Q. I think you were present when he received the call?

written.

25

26

A. No, I wasn't present when he received the call from the Commissioner, no.

from -- that had been -- that Commissioner Callinan had 16:16

Did he tell you before he leaked this letter that he 1 871 Q. 2 had been requested to do so by Commissioner Callinan? 3 No, he told me afterwards. Α. 872 Afterwards? 4 0. 5 CHAIRMAN: Is it a leak or is it a letter --16:16 6 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: A leak. CHAIRMAN: -- because I understood that --7 8 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: The letter in guestion was --9 CHAIRMAN: I understood that it was a phone call, get 10 Paul Reynolds and then --16:17 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: That is a different call. 11 12 Is it? CHAIRMAN: 13 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: That call, just to clarify, 14 Chairman, was, speak to Paul Reynolds to indicate I've 15 resigned, I'm out. 16:17 16 CHAIRMAN: Yes. MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: This is a different call --17 18 CHAIRMAN: Okay. 19 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: -- later in the day, where 20 Commissioner Callinan, I don't suppose one could use 16:17 the word "directed" because he was no longer in 21 22 employment, but asked my client to leak a letter to 23 Paul Reynolds. The letter was a letter that had been 24 sent a couple of weeks previously to the Department of 25 Justice alerting the Department that a number of phone 16:17 calls to Garda stations had been recorded as a result 26 27 of certain telephone systems that had been installed, isn't that so? 28 29 That's my understanding, yes. Α.

Т	8/3	Q.	And that retter or the reaking of that retter, which	
2			had been sitting on the Minister's desk for some time,	
3			was not the leaking of that letter, for obvious	
4			reasons, didn't go down well with the Department of	
5			Justice, because it had been sitting on their desk with	16:18
6			no action taken, isn't that right?	
7		Α.	Well, I can't speak to their reaction, the Department.	
8			CHAIRMAN: I suppose the Department of Justice is	
9			represented, Mr. McCann is here, but I don't know	
10			I'm not going to make any finding as to whether the	16:18
11			Department of Justice was proactive or reactive but	
12			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, I will just tease it	
13			through. I don't have a lot more on this,	
14			Mr. Chairman.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Well, one can put it in neutral terms. Was	16:18
16			there a letter leaked? Was it about gardaí apparently	
17			recording things in Garda stations? And, you know,	
18			whether anybody in the Department was over the moon or	
19			under the moon is neither here nor there.	
20	874	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Let me put it from a Garda	16:18
21			perspective. It would appear that the leak was driven	
22			by Commissioner Callinan, who was anxious to put the	
23			spotlight on the Department of Justice on the day,	
24			would that be fair?	
25		Α.	I can't speak to Commissioner Callinan's conversation.	16:19
26	875	Q.	Wouldn't that seem no, but let me just tease this	
27			through now. I'm not asking you to say definitively.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Again, Mr. O'Higgins, it's difficult for	
29			Mr. McLindon to say what was on Commissioner Callinan's	

1 mind. 2 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I understand that, Judge. 3 CHAIRMAN: Because he didn't have an interaction. On the other hand --4 5 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Let me --16:19 6 On the other hand, if it's something to do with David Taylor and him doing something and 7 8 Mr. McLindon is aware of it or is talked to about it by your client, that is fine. 9 I have only, Chairman, a few 10 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: 16:19 11 questions, and I do think the relevance will become 12 clear. 13 CHAIRMAN: Fine. I'm not stopping you, Mr. O'Higgins, 14 even though 45 minutes has turned into two hours. 15 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: I'm sorry about that. 16:19 16 Does it look like that the motive for leaking the 876 Ο. 17 letter might have been to steal a march on the 18 Department of Justice; as a press officer, did that 19 cross your mind? 20 I suppose it would have crossed my mind, yes. Α. 16:20 21 877 Were you shocked? Q. 22 I was --Α. 23 Were you appalled? 878 Q. 24 I was --Α. 25 Did you do anything about it? 879 Q. 16:20 26 I was surprised. Α. 27 088 Did you do anything about it? Q. No, I didn't. 28 Α. 29 881 Did you ever go to anybody and say what had happened? Q.

1 No, I didn't. Α. 2 882 Is it the case that Deputy 0. No, you didn't. 3 Commissioner O'Sullivan, who was now taking up the reins on an interim basis, received a lot of flak from 4 5 the Department of Justice about the leaking of that 16:20 letter? 6 7 I'm not too sure about that now, to be honest with you. Α. 8 883 Well, my instructions are that, in the aftermath, she Ο. was very annoyed. 9 I recollect, I recollect her being concerned, all 10 Α. 16:20 11 right, yes. 12 CHAIRMAN: Well, I suppose I'm hearing now about leaks 13 that people mean to happen and leaks that people don't 14 mean to happen, and I would presume that whether the 15 rights or wrongs of any leaks or abuse of journalists 16:21 16 and their obligation of confidence, if it's leaks that 17 people don't mean to happen, they would be annoyed 18 about it. 19 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Well, I think it was a 20 deliberate leak on my client's part. I don't think 16:21 there was anything accidental about it. 21 22 I don't know, is that what -- am I supposed CHAIRMAN: 23 to take something from that? Am I supposed to think 24 good things about him in consequence of that, 25 Mr. O'Higgins or --16 · 21 26 MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: No, no, no, you're not. You're 27 not being invited to do that, Mr. Chairman. You mentioned in your statement that my client had a 28 884 Q. 29 close working relationship with Commissioner Callinan,

1			isn't that so?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	885	Q.	Could it be that he would be perceived as Commissioner	
4			Callinan's man	
5		Α.	Em	16:21
6	886	Q.	by a new entrant?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	887	Q.	On office politics, might a new person coming in want	
9			their own person in my client's position?	
10		Α.	I suppose it depends on what they how they view how	16:22
11			effective that person is. I suppose all I can say in	
12			relation to that is that, kind of, my understanding of	
13			it is, it's kind of traditional in An Garda Síochána	
14			that when people take up senior roles, they kind of	
15			bring certain people who they worked with over a period	16:22
16			of time, with them, through the process, and I don't	
17			think it's unreasonable, either at Commissioner or CEO	
18			level or anything else like that, for people to decide	
19			that they want people around them that they have a good	
20			working relationship with.	16:22
21	888	Q.	If it's established that Superintendent Taylor was	
22			briefing negatively in the manner described and if it	
23			is established or it was even going to be suggested	
24			that that was done with the direction and approval of	
25			Commissioner Callinan, would he be a huge liability to	16:22
26			keep in that position?	
27			CHAIRMAN: In other words, if Nóirín O'Sullivan knew	
28			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yes, was aware.	
20			CHATRMAN, that he had been instructed on behalf of	

Т			Commissioner Callinan	
2			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: to do something that was, to put it	
4			mildly	
5			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Embarrassing at the most	16:23
6			minimal level. Was he a potential liability.	
7			CHAIRMAN: I wouldn't say embarrassing, I would just	
8			say wrong.	
9			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Wrong.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Well, you probably won't have much	16:23
11			difficulty agreeing with that?	
12		Α.	No, I don't. Yes, I agree.	
13			CHAIRMAN: But as to whether that was the motivation,	
14			can you help? That's basically Mr. O'Higgins's	
15			question.	16:23
16		Α.	Em	
17			CHAIRMAN: As to whether that, that was the motivation.	
18		Α.	Just so I am clear, that was the are you asking is	
19			that the motivation for Nóirín O'Sullivan when she took	
20			over as Interim Commissioner for transferring	16:23
21			Superintendent Taylor?	
22	889	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Yes, that he could be perceived	
23			as a liability.	
24		Α.	All I can say in relation to that is that I met	
25			Commissioner O'Sullivan in May, I have the date in my	16:23
26			diary, I can provide that to the Tribunal, 19th or 20th	
27			May, to do a handover before I went on annual leave for	
28			a couple of weeks, because the Commissioner is my line	
29			manager. It was to talk about a wide variety of	

Τ			issues, it wasn't to talk about any individual in	
2			question. During the conversation, Commissioner	
3			O'Sullivan asked me for my opinion on whether	
4			Superintendent Taylor she was considering	
5			transferring Superintendent Taylor from the Press	16:24
6			Office because she felt that he would benefit from an	
7			operational role, which he hadn't had as a	
8			superintendent. I said that I had a good working	
9			relationship with Superintendent Taylor and that I	
10			would be happy if he remained as press officer.	16:24
11	890	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	And then and we didn't, sorry, just to finish, we	
13			didn't come to a conclusion on that matter, and the	
14			Commissioner didn't give me her final position on the	
15			matter. My understanding leaving the meeting was that	16:24
16			it would be finalised when I came back from leave in	
17			two weeks' time. In the middle of my leave, I received	
18			a phone call from Superintendent Taylor to inform me	
19			that he had been transferred.	
20			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Thank you very much.	16:25
21			CHAIRMAN: Just before you go to the other	
22			Mr. O'Higgins, that he had been transferred, and how	
23			did he feel about that?	
24		Α.	Eh, he the impression that I got from him was that	
25			he wasn't necessarily happy about being transferred	16:25
26			because he was very happy and he had expressed that to	
27			me previously, that he was quite happy to stay on as	
28			press officer under Commissioner O'Sullivan, but at the	
29			same time the way he kind of I can't remember the	

1			exact way he put it, but it was kind of, well, that's	
2			the nature of An Garda Síochána; when the Commissioner	
3			says you have to move, you have to move.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins. Sorry, Mr. Lehane, would you	
5			like to go first?	16:25
6			MR. LEHANE: That might make more sense.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Yes, it probably would. And we are	
8			really the time is really I will rise at 4:30 for	
9			ten minutes just to deal with stenography matters, but	
10			I really do want to finish Mr. McLindon today.	16:26
11				
12			MR. MCLINDON WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE:	
13				
14	891	Q.	MR. LEHANE: Mr. McLindon, I appear for Deputy John	
15			McGuinness, and my name is Darren Lehane. I want to	16:26
16			ask you some questions in relation to two matters that	
17			relate to my client. The first matter relates to the	
18			PAC meeting on the 23rd January and the second matter	
19			relates to what was discussed in Dundalk on the	
20			following day. So if I can turn to the PAC meeting	16:26
21			first. They were fairly robust exchanges between	
22			Mr. Callinan and the Committee, isn't that right?	
23		Α.	That would be fair to say, yes.	
24	892	Q.	And would it be correct for me to describe Mr.	
25			Callinan's demeanour as angry and frustrated towards	16:26
26			the end of the hearing?	
27		Α.	I wouldn't necessarily angry, but certainly I would say	
28			frustrated, yes.	
29	893	0.	Which led him to use the word "disgusting"?	

Т		Α.	werr, again, I can t speak to what was going through	
2			his mind.	
3			CHAIRMAN: It's possible, Mr. McLindon, but	
4			Commissioner Callinan will certainly be here to	
5			indicate how he felt about things.	16:27
6			MR. LEHANE: Yes.	
7	894	Q.	Now, just in relation to the mechanics of the meeting,	
8			you sat behind Commissioner Callinan during the course	
9			of the hearing, didn't you?	
10		Α.	Yes.	16:27
11	895	Q.	So you were only a few feet from him. Superintendent	
12			Taylor was sitting next to you and I think Deputy	
13			Commissioner O'Sullivan was directly in front of you,	
14			is that right?	
15		Α.	Yes.	16:27
16	896	Q.	And when the hearing was finished, you saw John	
17			McGuinness approach the Commissioner, isn't that right?	
18		Α.	That's correct.	
19	897	Q.	And Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan and Mr. Taylor were	
20			all still there, isn't that right?	16:27
21		Α.	I can't recall necessarily who was around the	
22			Commissioner and Deputy McGuinness.	
23	898	Q.	Yes. But you were still in close proximity to the	
24			Commissioner at that stage, were you?	
25		Α.	I was at the start of at the start of their	16:27
26			conversation, but not or as they met, but I wasn't	
27			for the rest of it. As far as I can recall, I was out	
28			talking to the media in the lobby area just outside.	
20	000	0	Voob And if I can focus on the start of their	

Т			conversation. My citent, Deputy McGuinness, has given	
2			evidence to the Chairman that when he approached	
3			Commissioner Callinan, Commissioner Callinan was in	
4			conversation with persons around him?	
5		Α.	That could well be the case, but I don't recall, to be	16:28
6			honest with you.	
7	900	Q.	Okay. But you're not disputing Deputy McGuinness's	
8			account, if that is his evidence?	
9		Α.	It could be the case, but I can't recall one hundred	
10			percent.	16:28
11	901	Q.	And your evidence is you can't remember anything that	
12			was said between Deputy McGuinness and Commissioner	
13			Callinan, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	902	Q.	Okay. And just for the sake of clarity in relation to	16:28
16			this famous horse story involving Mr. Wilson, had you	
17			ever heard that before?	
18		Α.	I had heard a version kind of a very small version	
19			of it, if you like, in kind of general conversation,	
20			but I hadn't heard the detail of it as outlined by	16:29
21			Deputy McGuinness earlier this week.	
22	903	Q.	But again, you're not disputing Mr. McGuinness's	
23			evidence or you're not in a position to dispute	
24			Mr. McGuinness's evidence that he heard it?	
25		Α.	No, I'm not, no.	16:29
26	904	Q.	Okay. If I can move now to the events of the following	
27			day in Dundalk. When Commissioner Callinan received	
28			the call, did Commissioner Callinan tell the room, if I	
29			can describe it in those terms, that he had telephoned	

1	Mr.	McGuinness	the	previous	evening?

- A. I don't recall him mentioning that. I think he said something along the lines of that he had been in contact with Deputy McGuinness, but I don't know if he actually said it was phone conversations or whether it had been gone through the Committee, the secretariat to the Committee, I can't recall.
- 8 905 Q. So were you aware that Mr. Callinan had initiated the contact with Deputy McGuinness?
- 10 A. The impression I got was that it had been an initiative 16:29
 11 of Commissioner Callinan, yes.
- 12 906 Q. And did Commissioner Callinan, when he took soundings
 13 from those of you who were in the room in relation to
 14 the purpose of the meeting, did the discussion that
 15 ensued in any way focus on what he was going to say to
 16:30
 Deputy McGuinness?
- 17 A. It focused on the fact that he was going to outline the
 18 organisation's position in relation to the concern that
 19 he had about the impact that it would have on his
 20 ability to direct and control the organisation and also 16:30
 21 then the risk of personal data being released into the
 22 public domain by the PAC.

16:30

- 23 907 Q. Okay. And his purpose was to dissuade Sergeant
 24 McCabe -- or the Committee from taking evidence from
 25 Sergeant McCabe, isn't that right?
- A. Primarily, but also possibly then to maybe, if you
 like, kick the can down the road a little bit with the
 whole process.
- 29 908 Q. Now, during the course of your evidence, you've seen

_			the draft fetter that was prepared internally to be	
2			sent to PAC outlining the various concerns, haven't	
3			you?	
4		Α.	No, I haven't seen that, no.	
5	909	Q.	Were you aware that a draft letter was prepared?	16:31
6		Α.	I was aware that there was correspondence between the	
7			Commissioner and the PAC in relation to the concerns	
8			that the organisation had.	
9	910	Q.	Do you think it's strange that if there was this	
10			correspondence between the Garda Commissioner and the	16:31
11			PAC, that the Commissioner would go to a meeting with	
12			the Chairman of the Committee on his mind?	
13		Α.	In hindsight, yes. At the time I suppose we were in	
14			the middle of a maelstrom and we were in a very	
15			difficult position, so all options, I suppose, had to	16:31
16			be considered. But in hindsight, yes, I would agree	
17			with that.	
18	911	Q.	That it was strange. And just finally, were you here	
19			for Deputy McGuinness's evidence?	
20		Α.	No.	16:32
21	912	Q.	During the course of Deputy McGuinness's evidence a	
22			series of text messages were opened to the Tribunal	
23			between the Commissioner, Commissioner Callinan, and	
24			the former Secretary General of the Department of	
25			Justice, Mr. Purcell, and I won't open them given the	16:32
26			time constraints that I am operating under, but are you	
27			aware that after the meeting between Mr. McGuinness and	
28			Commissioner Callinan, that Mr. Purcell texted	
29			Mr. Callinan to ask him how he got on at the meeting?	

1 Α. No, I was not aware. 2 Well, it was different to that. It was: CHAIRMAN: 3 fabulous performance this afternoon, or something to that effect. Not: how did you get on? 4 5 MR. LEHANE: There were a number of texts, 16:32 6 Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN: No. I have read them. 8 MR. LEHANE: Yes. No, that's in relation to the Committee. I'm asking after the meeting with 9 10 Mr. McGuinness. 16:32 11 CHAIRMAN: Yes. You know, I take the view that just as 12 barristers are entitled to complain about judges as 13 bitterly as they like in the coffee room, people are 14 entitled to say things to each other in text. 15 doesn't necessarily indicate a state of mind. 16:33 16 MR. LEHANE: Well, Mr. Chairman, the reason I am -- if 17 I perhaps ask the next question and then I will address 18 the relevance of my question. 19 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 20 913 MR. LEHANE: Were you aware that there was contact Q. 16:33 21 between Mr. Callinan and the Secretary General of the 22 Department of Justice in relation to the possibility of 23 meeting him? 24 Α. No. 25 Meeting Mr. McGuinness? 914 0. 16:33 No, I wouldn't be kind of privy to that kind of 26 Α. 27 correspondence, by text or phone call or any other 28 means. 29 would you be in a position to offer any view as to 915 Ο.

1		whether you would regard it as strange that the	
2		Commissioner would be keeping the Secretary General of	
3		the Department of Justice in the loop?	
4	Α.	If you are talking about in general, no, I don't think	
5		so, because that happens on a very regular basis around	16:33
6		lots of different issues in order to potentially inform	
7		the Minister if the Minister is required to either	
8		address the issue in the Dáil or at a media event.	
9		MR. LEHANE: Okay. Thank you, Mr. McLindon.	
10		And, Chairman, just in relation to that, the reason I	16:33
11		was asking that question, Mr. Purcell sent two texts,	
12		one after the Committee hearing and the second after	
13		Mr. McGuinness's meeting with the Commissioner, and you	
14		will see, Chairman, that he says: I know you're en	
15		route to Dundalk, and I'm paraphrasing here, but how	16:34
16		did you get on with JMcG. And I wanted to ask the	
17		witness whether or not he was aware of it, given that	
18		the Commissioner, at the meeting, seemed to open it to	
19		the room, should I meet this guy, is it a good idea to	
20		do it?	16:34
21		CHAIRMAN: In other words, was the Department of	
22		Justice in the loop in relation to strategy or	
23		MR. LEHANE: That is exactly it.	
24		CHAIRMAN: or helping to formulate a strategy?	
25		MR. LEHANE: Absolutely.	16:34
26		CHAIRMAN: Okay. No, I see your point. At the moment,	
27		though, it's not quite getting there, I think.	
28		MR. LEHANE: Sorry?	
29		CHAIRMAN: I couldn't I am not sure I am in a	

Т			position to I can t reach a conclusion on it anyway,	
2			but I see what the idea you're floating is.	
3			MR. LEHANE: Well, Mr. Purcell will be giving evidence	
4			on Monday.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, and again I'm not trying to	16:34
6			put pressure on you, but if you can give me a definite	
7			time, can you, do you think?	
8			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I hope to stay within the	
9			estimate.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Yes, all right.	16:35
11				
12			MR. MCLINDON WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL	
13			O'HIGGINS:	
14				
15	916	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Can I start I think	16:35
16			chronologically, Mr. McLindon, with the Crimecall	
17			production meeting	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	917	Q.	which is now in the reference to the conversation	
20			between Commissioner Callinan that is said to have	16:35
21			happened between Commissioner Callinan and	
22			Mr. Boucher-Hayes, the RTÉ journalist. I am trying to	
23			just nail down some facts for the Chairman's benefit.	
24			Am I correct in my understanding that there were two	
25			meetings, in fact, a production meeting and a later	16:35
26			meeting on the 17th December 2013	
27		Α.	That's correct.	
28	918	Q.	in relation to the Crimecall programme?	
29		Α.	That's correct, ves.	

1	919	Q.	Is that right? All right. So the first one was, am I	
2			correct in saying, a production meeting. Were you at	
3			that?	
4		Α.	Yes, that would be a standard meeting before the	
5			morning of every programme, to go through the kind	16:36
6			of what the programme was going to cover and for	
7			people to prepare for that, so that was a standard.	
8			The only reason I was in attendance was because the	
9			Commissioner was appearing on the programme later that	
10			night.	16:36
11	920	Q.	Yes. And at that meeting, am I correct in my	
12			understanding, an issue had arisen in that RTÉ	
13			presenters were apparently insisting that the	
14			Commissioner might be asked something about the	
15			Smithwick Tribunal?	16:36
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	921	Q.	Which had been recently published?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	922	Q.	I think the position of An Garda Síochána and yourself,	
20			broadly speaking, was that wouldn't be in keeping with	16:36
21			the normal tone of the Christmas Crimecall	
22			presentation?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	923	Q.	All right. Am I correct in my understanding that that	
25			issue, even though you might have thought it was	16:37
26			resolved at the production meeting, it, in fact, hadn't	
27			been resolved, is that right?	
28		Α.	That's correct. As myself and Superintendent Taylor	
29			were travelling over to the programme that evening for	

- 1 the live broadcast, an issue arose where it appeared 2 that the presenters were not happy with the position 3 that we had reached at the end of the production meetina. 4 5 924 Yes. Q. 16:37 6 And they had brought that to the attention -- or my Α. 7 understanding was they had brought it to the attention 8 of the production company, the independent production company and also the head of RTÉ Factual. So another 9 meeting was required when we arrived at the RTÉ 10 16:37 11 building between myself, representatives of Garda 12 community relations, who have the control, if you like, 13 so to speak, of Crimecall or are responsible for the 14 Crimecall programme, the presenters, the production 15 company and, as far as I can recall, the head of RTÉ 16:38 16 Factual. 17 Right. And from your -- were you at that second 925 Q. 18 meeting? 19 I was. Α. 20 926 Was Mr. Boucher-Hayes? Q. 16:38 21 He was, as far as I can recall, yes. Α.
- A. Yes, as far as I can recall, yes.

co-presenter?

- 25 928 Q. And was it that meeting that was heated?
- 26 A. There was, I suppose, strong views on both sides.
- 27 929 Q. Yes.

Q.

22

23

927

A. I had a certain position, and I wasn't moving off that position in terms of the appropriateness of that

Do you remember was Gráinne Seoige, who I think was the

16:38

Т			question to be asked of the Garda Commissioner in that	
2			particular format of an interview, and we reached an	
3			amicable and constructive agreement in relation to	
4			that.	
5	930	Q.	Right. And you've indicated in your statement that	16:38
6			subsequently the Commissioner attended the filming and	
7			was greeted by RTÉ executives and you recall the	
8			Commissioner speaking to Mr. Boucher-Hayes on the way	
9			from the green room to the Crimecall studio, but you	
10			weren't, in fact, party to that conversation?	16:39
11		Α.	No.	
12	931	Q.	All right. And just in terms of how polarised or not	
13			it was, was the position of An Garda Síochána's side of	
14			the house that if RTÉ insisted on questions being asked	
15			about the Smithwick Tribunal report, that, in fact,	16:39
16			Commissioner Callinan would, in fact, not appear on the	
17			programme, was that the was it as stark as that?	
18		Α.	Yes, that was my position.	
19	932	Q.	And that wasn't going down terribly well, was it, with,	
20			broadly speaking, the RTÉ side of the house?	16:39
21		Α.	No, it wasn't. But once we a discussion and we came to	
22			an amicable agreement in terms of we would go ahead	
23			with the Crimecall interview as originally scheduled,	
24			but in fairness to all parties we would then look at	
25			the format of the interview in future years.	16:40
26	933	Q.	Right. Can I move then to Dundalk then and the 23rd	
27			January 2014?	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	934	0	And it is the case is it not you've already given	

1			evidence that you're not sure who rang who, but that	
2			Commissioner Callinan, I think you used the expression,	
3			opened it to the room or made some remark to the room	
4			or remarks raising this issue as to whether the	
5			possibility of him going down to meet with the head,	16:40
6			the chair of the PAC in Dublin?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	935	Q.	And I think you've indicated that so far as the	
9			impression you obtained from what was said was that it	
10			was twofold. The purpose was to have another go at	16:40
11			persuading the chair not to call Sergeant McCabe in	
12			evidence, is that right?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	936	Q.	And with the secondary position, if that was to go	
15			ahead, that at least it would be in private?	16:41
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	937	Q.	Right. And is that something were you aware that	
18			that was amongst leaving aside Commissioner	
19			Callinan, was that a position amongst other people	
20			within An Garda Síochána, that that would be a last	16:41
21			hope?	
22		Α.	Well certainly, there was certainly a feeling that this	
23			was a very difficult situation and we had to try and do	
24			something to try and avoid that happening within the	
25			limits of what we could do.	16:41
26	938	Q.	Yes. And was it the view of those present that it	
27			would be a good idea to try and find some sort of	
28			mechanism to ensure that it wouldn't be held in	
29			private public, excuse me?	

A. Generally, yes. As I said, there wasn't a huge level of discussion on it because of the time constraints that everyone was under, particularly the Commissioner, but there was no one basically disagreeing with that, I would say.

16:42

16:43

- 6 939 Q. Right. So the view was it would be a good idea for that meeting to go ahead, to see if the train could be turned around?
- 9 A. Yes.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- Now just in terms of the timing then of the press 10 940 Q. 16 · 42 11 conference that took place, that was scheduled to take 12 place, can you assist the Tribunal with that? 13 Mr. Taylor -- excuse me, Superintendent Taylor, as I 14 understand it from the papers, was of the view that the press conference was held up by dint of and as a result 16:42 15 16 of Commissioner Callinan having to go down to Dublin to meet with the PAC chair, do you agree with that? 17
 - A. No. My recollection of it is that the press conference was scheduled to take place at about 3:00pm, we put out a notice the day before to invite the media to come to Dundalk Garda station at 3:00pm. It may have been slightly delayed given the phone calls but we started in and around, I would say, 3:10, 3:15. Those kind of media briefings generally last somewhere in the region of ten to 15 minutes. At 3:28 we released a statement from the Press Office which basically outlined what Commissioner Callinan at said at the press briefing. It would be very unusual for us to put out such remarks

unless it was under embargo. So, my recollection of

1 that is that the press conference went ahead and then 2 Commissioner Callinan departed for his meeting with 3 Deputy McGuinness. 4 Now, are you aware that the press conference and 941 0. 5 the Commissioner's remarks at it, were carried in the 16:43 6 headlines on RTÉ news at four o'clock, as I understand 7 it during the course of the Mooney Goes Wild Programme on RTÉ? 8 Well, I suppose, that would make sense insofar as we 9 Α. had held the press briefing in time for the journalists 16:44 10 11 present to make a four o'clock deadline and we put out a lot of information in the terms of the comments of 12 13 Commissioner Callinan at 3:28, so the media would have 14 had time to report on it by four o'clock, yes. 15 942 Right. So you're clearcut that even putting it at its Q. 16:44 16 latest, the press conference had occurred, been and 17 dusted, some time before four o'clock? 18 I would be fairly certain that it would have happened 19 in around 3:10, 3:15. 20 943 Thank you. If I could ask you then to just turn to an Q. 21 issue that --22 Mr. O'Higgins, it helps me in what way? CHAIRMAN: 23 where is it going? 24 MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: In this way -- the relevance of 25 that, I'm sorry I didn't spell that out. 16 · 44 26 CHAIRMAN: Well, I know that the meeting in the hotel 27 was in around the six mark, isn't that right?

CHAIRMAN: Okay.

28

29

MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Five. A little bit after five.

That is fine.

Т			MR. MICHEAL O HIGGINS: Yes.	
2			CHAIRMAN: And we have had timings, it would take an	
3			hour and 20 minutes to get down, so there was no delay	
4			after that, he didn't wait until four o'clock to leave,	
5			he would have left in around the half three mark and	16:45
6			been there in around the five mark, is that the point?	
7			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS, yes.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Sure. But let's suppose that is so, I mean	
9			the timing of that is going to help me in any way, is	
10			it?	16:45
11			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Well, it's relevant to this:	
12			To the claim by Superintendent Taylor, it seems, the	
13			incorrect claim by Superintendent Taylor that the press	
14			conference was delayed and didn't occur until the	
15			Commissioner came back from Dublin back to Dundalk.	16:45
16			CHAIRMAN: I see your point now, thank you.	
17	944	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Just turning then, mention has	
18			already been made, Mr. McLindon, of the email that you	
19			sent yourself, do you recall that?	
20		Α.	Yes.	16:45
21	945	Q.	And this related obviously to the much disputed	
22			question as to whether Sergeant McCabe did or did not	
23			breach data protection laws, isn't that so, broadly	
24			speaking?	
25		Α.	Broadly speaking, yes.	16:46
26	946	Q.	I think you have indicated that represented of a, you	
27			may not have used these words, but a momentary snapshot	
28			thought that you had?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 947 Q. And ultimately it is agreed you didn't send any press
- 2 release or issue any press release --
- 3 A. No.
- 4 948 Q. -- or even draft any press release --
- 5 A. NO.
- 6 949 Q. -- reflective of that wording?
- 7 A. No. And in fact we didn't, as far as I can recall, we
- 8 never actually received any kind of press query of that
- 9 nature anyway.
- 10 950 Q. Yes. In relation to the minutes that were gone into of 16:46
- the pre PAC minutes, you recall those?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 951 Q. Ms. Leader brought you through those, and the one from
- 14 yourself, your own minutes and then one from an
- assistant commissioner, can I just ask you in relation 16:46
- to that, insofar as it has been suggested -- perhaps it
- hasn't even been suggested, but insofar as it might be
- 18 suggested that somehow those minutes reflect a
- discussion in the room at which you were present of an
- 20 intention to -- either a decision or a determination to 16:47
- smear Sergeant McCabe, what do you say were any such
- 22 suggestion to be made?
- 23 A. That there was no suggestion at that meeting that I can

16 · 47

- recall of doing any such thing.
- 25 952 Q. Right. Would you have participated in any such
- 26 exercise?
- 27 A. No.
- 28 953 Q. In relation to the product, as it were, of those
- 29 discussions in the pre PAC meetings, you I think

1			drafted a number we went through a number of drafts	
2			but finalised what you were putting forward as the	
3			opening statement for Commissioner Callinan to make at	
4			the PAC meeting itself?	
5		Α.	Yes.	16:47
6	954	Q.	Am I correct in my understanding from your recollection	
7			of what was in that document, that you prepared, did it	
8			include any suggestion that Sergeant McCabe was	
9			motivated out of an improper motivation for bringing	
10			forward the penalty points?	16:48
11		Α.	No.	
12	955	Q.	Or did it include any suggestion of a smear campaign of	
13			any sort?	
14		Α.	No.	
15	956	Q.	Can I ask you then in relation to the Paul Williams	16:48
16			article, articles, of which mention has been made, you	
17			have told the Tribunal that Superintendent Taylor told	
18			you that Mr. Williams had called him, it seems, some	
19			time before or after he was in Ms. D's house?	
20		Α.	Yes.	16:48
21			CHAIRMAN: Or during.	
22			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Or during the time.	
23			CHAIRMAN: That is another version of it.	
24	957	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: When he was in Ms. D's house.	
25			I think you indicated to the Tribunal that what you	16:48
26			could pick up from what was said to you by	
27			Superintendent Taylor, this was a surprise to	
28			Superintendent Taylor, it was news to him effectively.	
29		Α.	Yes.	

Т	958	Q.	can we just was there any suggestion from	
2			Superintendent Taylor that he was involved in any way	
3			in setting up that meeting?	
4		Α.	No.	
5	959	Q.	The issue that was being dealt with, am I correct in	16:49
6			thinking, was Ms. D's concern or complaint that the	
7			2006 allegation had not been properly investigated?	
8		Α.	Well, that was the output of the article, yes.	
9	960	Q.	Sorry, that is what my question. That was the gist of	
10			the article, in terms of what Ms. D was complaining	16:49
11			about?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13			CHAIRMAN: There was another intention, however, in	
14			going up.	
15			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Pardon? Judge, sorry.	16:49
16			CHAIRMAN: There was another intention, however, in	
17			going up. Mr. Williams said that he wasn't going to	
18			actually publish it as an actual allegation, but that	
19			was in his mind as one of the possibilities in going	
20			up.	16:49
21			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
22			CHAIRMAN: And he changed his mind and said the story	
23			should now be there is a complaint about how good this	
24			investigation was.	
25			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes. But in the context of it	16:50
26			having been organised by the D family not through	
27			Mr. McLindon's office in any sense.	
28			CHAIRMAN: No. But there was a chief superintendent	
29			involved as well.	

1 MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: That is so. And the Tribunal 2 has heard his evidence --3 CHAIRMAN: I have. MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: -- in relation to that, which I 4 5 suggest to you, Chairman, does not in any sense involve 16:50 6 a suggestion the Press Office were involved good, bad 7 or indifferent. 8 CHAIRMAN: I haven't been told that. 9 961 MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Just returning then to that Q. 10 theme, Mr. McLindon. That allegation or complaint by 16:50 11 Ms. D that her allegation had not been properly 12 investigated, was that something that would be a 13 welcome news story for An Garda Síochána? 14 Α. No. 15 962 I think you've indicated that the second issue was that 16:50 Q. 16 there might -- you felt that the libel laws would mean 17 that Mr. Williams -- it would be unlikely and 18 irresponsible that anybody would be named specifically? 19 Yes. Α. From your perspective was there anything you could do 20 963 Q. 16:51 to intervene in relation to preventing Paul Williams 21 22 meeting with Ms. D or inhibit him from actually 23 reporting on the meeting that may have taken place, if 24 it was in the past tense? 25 Absolutely not. It would be highly inappropriate for Α. 16:51 me to do that. 26 27 964 Q. Just for the avoidance of any doubt about the issue, 28 did you or anybody of whom you're aware in the Press 29 Office ask superintendent John Reilly to contact Paul

1			Williams or put Paul Williams in touch with Ms. D or	
2			her family?	
3		Α.	No. No one from my office or that I am aware of,	
4			certainly not from me or anybody else in my office made	
5			or set up a meeting with between Paul Williams and	16:52
6			Ms. D.	
7	965	Q.	Yes. Were you aware in any respect of anything were	
8			you aware of anything that would enable one to say	
9			Garda Headquarters were effectively happy that Paul	
10			Williams was meeting Ms. D and following up on her	16:52
11			complaint as to an inadequate investigation?	
12		Α.	No.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Well, the evidence has been that according	
14			to Superintendent Taylor and what he said in	
15			consequence of the Paul Williams visit, whether in the	16:52
16			future, in the past or actually taking place, was that	
17			Mr. McLindon got the impression from him that he,	
18			Superintendent Taylor, thought that this might have	
19			potential benefit for the organisation. That is what	
20			he said.	16:52
21			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I beg your pardon, sorry,	
22			Judge?	
23			CHAIRMAN: Maybe you will just have a look at the	
24			transcript. I am too exhausted to repeat it.	
25			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Well, you will appreciate,	16:52
26			Chairman	
27			MR. McDOWELL: You're correct, Judge.	
28			CHAIRMAN: I know I am correct. Yes. I am not always	
29			correct.	

1			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I am asking you just to repeat	
2			it, sorry, I didn't catch what you said, Chairman.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Oh God. Well, on one occasion he seemed	
4			surprise, Superintendent Taylor said "Paul Williams was	
5			going up to interview Ms. D and my impression was that	16:53
6			he thought this might have potential benefit for the	
7			organisation".	
8			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Right.	
9			CHAIRMAN: That is what the witness said. Not to you.	
10			But maybe some time today. It's been a long day.	16:53
11			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes. And, Chairman, you have	
12			heard what Mr. McLindon has said, this was not	
13			something organised by Garda Headquarters to his	
14			knowledge, good, bad or indifferent.	
15			CHAIRMAN: I have Paul Williams' evidence on that, I	16:53
16			have Chief Superintendent O'Reilly's evidence on that,	
17			I have Ms. D's evidence on that, I have Mr. D's	
18			evidence on that, I have Mrs. D's evidence on that,	
19			unless I can raise an inference out of all of that to	
20			that effect that is the evidence, you know.	16:54
21	966	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I will deal with it this way:	
22			Were you aware of anybody else, Mr. McLindon, in Garda	
23			Headquarters, that came to your ears, who was happy	
24			that there was to be a meeting or there had been a	
25			meeting between Paul Williams and Ms. D and articles	16:54
26			followed?	
27		Α.	No.	
28	967	Q.	Now just then moving then and we can be	
29			CHAIRMAN: Moving swiftly on.	

1	968	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: We can deal with this fairly	
2			quickly. Superintendent Taylor's overall charge, as	
3			you're aware, which has been looked into and	
4			investigated most thoroughly by this Tribunal, is that	
5			An Garda Síochána, that Commissioner Callinan and	16:54
6			subsequently Commissioner O'Sullivan, organised it to	
7			get him to conduct a smear campaign against Sergeant	
8			McCabe, all right?	
9			CHAIRMAN: Well, I'm not sure you're putting the	
10			Commissioner O'Sullivan thing correctly. That was	16:55
11			certainly in the first statement, but it's been very,	
12			very much watered down since then, to mere awareness of	
13			what was going on. That is the Taylor allegation now	
14			as it stands. It was different when it started off.	
15			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	16:55
16	969	Q.	Did you, in your role as director of communications,	
17			when you did come in, did you have journalists coming	
18			up to you saying what is the story about the smear	
19			campaign?	
20		Α.	No.	16:55
21	970	Q.	You've indicated	
22			CHAIRMAN: In other words, Mr. O'Higgins, were	
23			journalists inquiring, look, are you trying to smear	
24			this fella?	
25			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	16:55
26			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
27		Α.	No.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Was that	
29		Δ	No Chairman	

1			CHAIRMAN: No.	
2	971	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Finally can I ask you this,	
3			Mr. McLindon: Are you beholden to any culture, police	
4			culture that might be said to have existed, to stand	
5			over or conceal in any way any smear campaign against a	16:56
6			serving officer?	
7		Α.	Absolutely not. I am bound by professional and ethical	
8			obligations to provide as independent communication	
9			advice as I can. And certainly, as I have said	
10			previously, a smear campaign is completely anathema to	16:56
11			that.	
12	972	Q.	Thank you.	
13				
14			MS. LEADER: Yes, there are a few questions.	
15				16:56
16			WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER AS FOLLOWS:	
17	973	Q.	MS. LEADER: Superintendent Taylor, was aware that two	
18			other journalists were calling to the D family in 2014,	
19			those being Debbie McCann and Eavan Murray and he said,	
20			he knew they went up there and he presumed they were	16:57
21			he assumed that they were going to write an article,	
22			did he tell you about that?	
23		Α.	No.	
24	974	Q.	Did you ever hear about it from either of the two	
25			Commissioners?	16:57
26		Α.	No.	
27	975	Q.	Superintendent Taylor said he is almost positive, he	
28			believes that he would have texted, contacted the	
29			former Commissioner Callinan at the time about calling	

1			up, you didn't hear anything about it?	
2		Α.	I didn't hear. But that was his, the form, so that	
3			could well have happened, yes.	
4	976	Q.	It could have happened?	
5		Α.	It could have happened, but I wouldn't have knowledge	16:57
6			of texts necessarily being exchanged between the	
7			Commissioner and Superintendent Taylor.	
8	977	Q.	I suppose in view of you being contacted about the Paul	
9			Williams visit and the story that was going to be	
10			written, are you surprised that you weren't told about	16:58
11			the Debbie McCann and Eavan Murray visit?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	978	Q.	Thanks very much.	
14				
15			WITNESS WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN,	16:58
16			AS FOLLOWS:	
17	979	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Just a few questions for you, if you don't	
18			mind, Mr. McLindon. First of all, there may be a	
19			misunderstanding here, because what you are being asked	
20			about is not whether you participated in a series of	16:58
21			events, the net effect of which was to get the	
22			messenger, as opposed to deal with the message on a	
23			factual basis, but what you know about it. Now there's	
24			a number of possibilities that arise. Firstly, that	
25			there was no such campaign at all. Are you in a	16:58
26			position to tell me one way or another anything to do	
27			with that?	
28		Α.	I can say from my perspective that as far as I can see	
29			there was no campaign.	

1	980	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And then the second thing is that perhaps	
2			there was a campaign but that it was one run between	
3			David Taylor and Commissioner Callinan and given the	
4			very close nature of their relationship and you being a	
5			newcomer to the organisation, you knew absolutely	16:59
6			nothing about it and were deliberately kept out of the	
7			loop?	
8		Α.	That's a possibility, chair, yes.	
9	981	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The third possibility is that emotions were	
10			spilling over in relation to Sergeant McCabe and that	16:59
11			perhaps there were inappropriate remarks, but it was	
12			the kind of human interaction that you will perhaps	
13			expect in people under pressure and doesn't necessarily	
14			mean anything beyond the expression of their views or	
15			emotions?	16:59
16		Α.	That's a possibility, chair. I didn't hear any kind of	
17			specific remarks in terms of some of the remarks that	
18			have been outlined earlier in the week in terms of	
19			evidence. That would have stuck with me if those	
20			phrases had been used by Commissioner Callinan.	17:00
21	982	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Okay. You have been accused of being	
22			a cat's paw, which I understand, from the relevant	
23			fairytale, means someone who is persuaded to take	

238

MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Sorry, I would like to clarify, 17:00

I put it to him that he wasn't a cat's paw, not that he

paw actually is, Mr. O'Higgins. The cat's paw from the

CHAIRMAN: Well, I don't think you know what a cat's

chestnuts out of the fire --

was.

24

25

26

27

28

29

1			legend of a monkey and a cat, and the monkey makes the	
2			cat take the chestnuts out of the fire so the monkey	
3			can eat them, but the monkey is the one who ends up	
4			with the burned paws. There is a poem by Daniel	
5			O'Connell apparently about that.	17:00
6	983	Q.	Now, were you in any sense, do you think, being used to	
7			do anything at the behest of anyone, perhaps	
8			unwittingly, in relation to Sergeant McCabe that was	
9			less than completely honest, less than completely above	
10			board?	17:01
11		Α.	No, I don't think so, chair. At all times I tried to	
12			provide independent advice to the Commissioner in terms	
13			of what I thought was the best direction or approach by	
14			the organisation. So I don't feel I was being used in	
15			that manner. I always had a professional working	17:01
16			relationship with Commissioner Callinan. He might not	
17			necessarily have accepted always my advice but he was	
18			never unprofessional, dismissive or rude or anything	
19			like that to me.	
20	984	Q.	CHAIRMAN: One tends to wonder, Mr. McLindon, that if	17:01
21			they were all under such strain in relation to penalty	
22			points, loss of revenue, whistleblowers, etcetera, why	
23			there was no explosion of emotion within Garda	
24			Headquarters. As Ms. Leader put to you, if there was	
25			an explosion of emotion on the television why was there	17:01
26			no explosion of emotion in the atmosphere of office	
27			politics where people know they can get away with	
28			things and it is just grist to the mill, it doesn't	
29			mean very much? Are you saying there was no explosion	

1			of emotion by anyone or inappropriate things said?	
2		Α.	Well, I'd say, look, I think everyone was under	
3			significant pressure at the time, myself included, it	
4			was a very pressurised environment, people were very	
5			frustrated, we were constantly on the back foot from a	17:02
6			public relations point of view and from an	
7			organisational and reputational point of view, so I	
8			think people were frustrated, but I only ever discussed	
9			those kind of matters in formal meetings and maybe	
10			within a formal meeting setting explosions of emotions	17:02
11			didn't manifest themselves. Maybe in more private	
12			settings they did, chair, but I wasn't witness to that.	
13	985	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But you know the whole Ms. D in 2006 did	
14			come up at one of those meetings.	
15		Α.	That appears to be the case, chair, yes.	17:02
16	986	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean, just looking at it from the point of	
17			view of a complete outsider, you come in to do a new	
18			job, you're supposed to be the boss of David Taylor,	
19			but David Taylor is bypassing you the whole time and	
20			going in and out of the Commissioner's office and	17:03
21			they're having all these great chats apparently and the	
22			only thing the only time you ever get to see him is	
23			at the twice-monthly meetings where things are on an	
24			agenda and things are supposed to be discussed in a	
25			formal way, I mean if that is so it must have been very	17:03
26			frustrating for you?	
27		Α.	It was slightly frustrating, but I had to recognise	
28			that was kind of the situation that was present when I	
29			came into the organisation and that's as far as I	

Т			could see that's the way Commissioner Callinan wanted	
2			to operate. And if that is the way my, effectively my	
3			boss wants to operate well then I have to respect that	
4			and over time change that process. But I can't I	
5			don't think I can come in from day one and tell the	17:03
6			Garda Commissioner that he's wrong in the way he's	
7			doing his business. I don't think	
8	987	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So what you are saying is you were going to	
9			play the long game?	
10		Α.	Yes, chair.	17:04
11	988	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Were you ever a journalist, Mr. McLindon?	
12		Α.	I was, yes. For nine years, approximately.	
13	989	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And what kind of area did you cover and for	
14			what media outlets?	
15		Α.	I was well, I started off my career as a provincial	17:04
16			journalist then I went into editing a business	
17			magazine, then I edited an internet magazine and then I	
18			was a freelance journalist working across business and	
19			technology for the likes of, say, business and finance.	
20	990	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So it was a kind of business journalism type	17:04
21			of career?	
22		Α.	Business and technology, primarily, yes, chair.	
23	991	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Let's suppose journalists were actually used	
24			in any context, take a business context, for instance,	
25			in the event that there were, let's say a, takeover	17:04
26			which is the kind of thing, or proposed takeover, which	
27			is the kind of thing that generates pages in the	
28			financial press, and you as a journalist were	
29			approached and told a very, very unpleasant but also	

Τ			demonstrably untrue story by somebody, with a view to	
2			having it published, so that their takeover bid would	
3			lose strength, first of all can I ask you how would you	
4			react to that?	
5		Α.	Well, you'd be very depending on the level of	17:05
6			contact you had with the person who was giving you the	
7			information, if they were a trusted source of	
8			information to you and then suddenly they're providing	
9			you with false information then that's going to	
10			completely upset any relationship you have with that	17:05
11			source.	
12	992	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sure.	
13		Α.	And then second of all, well, if it is demonstrably	
14			untrue well you're not going to do anything with that	
15			information, I would have thought.	17:05
16	993	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I appreciate you wouldn't publish it, but if	
17			it be the case that people are coming up to you on an	
18			apparently confidential basis and telling you	
19			completely negative and completely untrue things, such	
20			as so and so is a child sex abuser	17:06
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	994	Q.	CHAIRMAN: do you feel bound by journalistic	
23			confidence in that respect? In other words, that	
24			you're being used not as a genuine source of informing	
25			the public, but of a source of disinforming the public	17:06
26			and destroying someone's character?	
27		Α.	I suppose this would be my personal opinion, chair, and	
28			other journalists may have different views and the NUJ	
29			may have a different view, it is a long time since I	

1			was I'm still a member of the NUJ, but it's a long	
2			time since I was involved in journalism. But certainly	
3			I wouldn't regard that I would have any means or	
4			necessarily would have to protect that source if that	
5			source is providing me with incorrect information;	17:06
6			effectively they are not a source, that would be my	
7			view. A source is someone who provides you with	
8			information that you can work with, it may not always	
9			be correct but there may be something in it that you	
10			can work with it, or maybe they gave you the	17:07
11			information and they genuinely felt it was true, but if	
12			they did it in such a way to use you for their own	
13			advantage and to put you at jeopardy of potentially	
14			publishing false information then I would not regard	
15			that person as a source for me to protect any longer.	17:07
16	995	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And in terms of that, the public interest is	
17			obviously a very important aspect of it,	
18			Mr. McLindon	
19		Α.	Yes, chair.	
20	996	Q.	CHAIRMAN: could that ever be in the public	17:07
21			interest, that a journalist should be abused as a tool	
22			of calumny?	
23		Α.	Absolutely not, chair.	
24			CHAIRMAN: It's been a long day, thank you very much,	
25			Mr. McLindon.	17:07
26		Α.	Thank you chair.	
27				
28			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL MONDAY, 16TH APRIL	
29			2018 AT 10:30AM	

	1	<u> </u>	-	
•	140 [1] - 102:8	153:16, 153:26,	236 [1] - 4:16	48 [1] - 4:12
	14th [3] - 64:12,	155:9, 155:21,	237 [1] - 4:17	4:30 [1] - 214:8
	74:15, 75:8	157:14, 157:23,	23rd [12] - 15:29,	
'06 [2] - 157:9,	15 [2] - 35:23, 226:25	157:28, 158:10,	26:8, 32:8, 33:27,	5
157:12	1504 [1] - 5:6	158:28, 197:25,	89:25, 95:16, 108:22,	
'13 [3] - 168:14,	1506 [1] - 30:21	199:24, 231:7, 240:13	113:13, 199:1,	
168:15		2006" [1] - 146:8		5 [2] - 4:5, 64:5
'13/'14 [1] - 179:23	1507 [1] - 30:21		199:23, 214:18,	51 [1] - 3:2
'14 [1] - 168:14	1564 [2] - 48:13,	2007 [4] - 6:2, 76:11,	224:26	01(:) 0.2
	140:25	155:21, 157:15	24 [2] - 4:6, 30:9	6
'disgusting' [1] -	1565 [1] - 140:25	2007/2008 [1] -	24/12/2013 [2] -	0
113:12	1566 [1] - 86:6	153:10	70:11, 71:17	
'p' [2] - 206:15,	1569 [1] - 129:11	2008 [2] - 76:11,	24th [7] - 96:20,	6 [2] - 3:6, 48:12
206:16	16 [1] - 1:6	155:21	101:3, 101:18,	60 [1] - 45:19
	1628 [1] - 94:4	2009 [1] - 76:11	198:24, 198:25,	62 [1] - 203:21
1	1629 [1] - 94:4	2010 [1] - 79:3	198:29, 199:11	
_	1635 [2] - 193:3,	2012 [8] - 5:29, 6:13,	26 [1] - 30:19	65 [1] - 1:18
		6:20, 6:26, 8:6, 14:14,	26th [2] - 108:4,	693 [1] - 41:29
1 [2] - 3:7, 118:24	193:19	178:9	109:25	6th [4] - 11:6, 64:11,
1.46 [1] - 74:19	1637 [1] - 108:10			64:17, 64:21
10:30AM [1] - 243:29	16th [3] - 64:12,	2012/early [1] -	27nd/2nd [1] -	
1119 [1] - 119:27	198:9, 198:23	178:18	109:27	7
118 [1] - 118:23	16TH [1] - 243:28	2013 [22] - 8:9, 9:26,	28/12 [1] - 72:11	-
11:00 [1] - 54:11	17 [3] - 1:10, 30:19,	10:4, 10:14, 10:20,	28th [1] - 178:12	
	58:8	11:3, 11:7, 11:14,	2999 [2] - 112:29,	7 [5] - 2:12, 3:10,
11th [1] - 60:29 1202 [1] - 64:5	17:29 [1] - 194:1	11:19, 12:20, 14:28,	114:23	3:14, 11:28, 11:29
	17:34 [1] - 194:4	31:19, 48:18, 49:28,	2999-3000 [1] -	7:00 [1] - 54:11
1220 [2] - 69:18,	17:37 [1] - 194:10	57:4, 57:15, 60:29,	166:22	7th [1] - 6:20
70:25		138:23, 178:12,		
1221 [1] - 71:23	17:41 [1] - 194:12	178:16, 178:21,	3	8
1244 [1] - 73:21	17:42 [1] - 194:19	221:26	3	0
1245 [4] - 73:26,	17th [3] - 12:21,	2013/early [1] -		
74:2, 74:18, 75:7	12:25, 221:26	178:19	3 [1] - 5:23	8 [2] - 2:20, 2:25
1245A [1] - 75:3	18 [4] - 3:13, 35:23,		30 [2] - 26:3, 95:4	800 [1] - 166:16
1246 [3] - 77:19,	51:4, 138:24	2014 [29] - 1:4,	3003 [1] - 111:20	000[1] = 100.10
145:26, 145:27	186 [1] - 123:10	12:21, 12:29, 16:1,		0
	18th [2] - 9:26, 11:17	56:13, 64:11, 64:12,	3004 [4] - 113:6,	9
1246A [2] - 78:4,	19 [2] - 30:19, 31:13	64:13, 64:14, 64:17,	166:18, 166:20, 199:6	
146:4	1921 [1] - 1:10	76:4, 101:4, 108:4,	30th [3] - 8:9, 10:18,	9 [1] - 43:16
1247 [2] - 78:19,		111:18, 113:13,	11:19	9/1/2014 [1] - 73:26
78:23	1923 [2] - 43:18,	123:26, 129:14,	31st [2] - 11:3, 178:8	
1247A [1] - 78:29	43:20	131:8, 146:17,	32 [1] - 2:12	90 [1] - 161:15
1255 [1] - 75:11	1993 [2] - 5:23, 43:11	166:12, 167:6,	33 [1] - 42:22	9:00 [1] - 206:6
1259 [1] - 75:15	19th [1] - 212:26	168:16, 178:19,	35 [1] - 26:4	9:00am [1] - 95:10
127 [1] - 123:9		198:18, 224:27,	37-42 [1] - 3:17	9:30 [1] - 206:7
1282 [5] - 76:6,	2	236:18	3:00pm [2] - 226:19,	9th [6] - 64:12,
79:16, 145:22,		2017 [2] - 1:6, 1:10	226:21	68:16, 69:14, 73:20,
145:25, 157:13				73:26, 87:3
	2 [6] - 2:30, 3:18,	2018 [3] - 1:18, 5:2,	3:10 [2] - 226:23,	
1285 [1] - 69:6	3:20, 3:21, 33:29,	243:29	227:19	Α
1286 [3] - 66:23,	79:6	208 [1] - 145:23	3:15 [2] - 226:23,	
68:18, 69:2	20 [2] - 178:18, 228:3	20th [9] - 33:26,	227:19	
		112:24, 114:21,	3:28 [2] - 226:25,	abbreviation [1] -
12th [10] - 11:14,	20/3/2014 [2] -	, ,		
12th [10] - 11:14, 111:18, 113:5, 131:8,	20/3/2014 [2] - 112:29, 114:26	198:10, 198:19,	227:13	33:3
	112:29, 114:26		227:13	33:3 ability (5) - 20:3
111:18, 113:5, 131:8,	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26		ability [5] - 20:3,
111:18, 113:5, 131:8, 198:18, 199:6, 199:8, 199:11, 199:12	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20 2005 [1] - 203:21	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26 21 _[1] - 2:29	227:13 4	ability [5] - 20:3, 97:17, 103:4, 156:27,
111:18, 113:5, 131:8, 198:18, 199:6, 199:8, 199:11, 199:12 13,000 [1] - 108:18	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20 2005 [1] - 203:21 2006 [34] - 42:8,	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26 21 [1] - 2:29 214 [1] - 4:14		ability [5] - 20:3, 97:17, 103:4, 156:27, 217:20
111:18, 113:5, 131:8, 198:18, 199:6, 199:8, 199:11, 199:12 13,000 [1] - 108:18 1369 [1] - 110:4	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20 2005 [1] - 203:21 2006 [34] - 42:8, 42:14, 76:12, 77:25,	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26 21 [1] - 2:29 214 [1] - 4:14 21st [5] - 64:13, 76:4,		ability [5] - 20:3, 97:17, 103:4, 156:27, 217:20 able [7] - 99:3,
111:18, 113:5, 131:8, 198:18, 199:6, 199:8, 199:11, 199:12 13,000 [1] - 108:18 1369 [1] - 110:4 138 [1] - 4:13	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20 2005 [1] - 203:21 2006 [34] - 42:8, 42:14, 76:12, 77:25, 78:12, 78:22, 79:12,	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26 21 [1] - 2:29 214 [1] - 4:14 21st [5] - 64:13, 76:4, 146:16, 149:19, 150:1	4 [1] - 3:3	ability [5] - 20:3, 97:17, 103:4, 156:27, 217:20 able [7] - 99:3, 108:19, 135:28,
111:18, 113:5, 131:8, 198:18, 199:6, 199:8, 199:11, 199:12 13,000 [1] - 108:18 1369 [1] - 110:4 138 [1] - 4:13 13TH [2] - 1:18, 5:1	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20 2005 [1] - 203:21 2006 [34] - 42:8, 42:14, 76:12, 77:25, 78:12, 78:22, 79:12, 79:16, 79:19, 79:23,	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26 21 [1] - 2:29 214 [1] - 4:14 21st [5] - 64:13, 76:4, 146:16, 149:19, 150:1 221 [1] - 4:15	4 4 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	ability [5] - 20:3, 97:17, 103:4, 156:27, 217:20 able [7] - 99:3, 108:19, 135:28, 146:11, 146:15,
111:18, 113:5, 131:8, 198:18, 199:6, 199:8, 199:11, 199:12 13,000 [1] - 108:18 1369 [1] - 110:4 138 [1] - 4:13 13TH [2] - 1:18, 5:1 13th [1] - 22:28	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20 2005 [1] - 203:21 2006 [34] - 42:8, 42:14, 76:12, 77:25, 78:12, 78:22, 79:12,	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26 21 [1] - 2:29 214 [1] - 4:14 21st [5] - 64:13, 76:4, 146:16, 149:19, 150:1 221 [1] - 4:15 22nd [5] - 12:20,	4 [1] - 3:3 4,000 [1] - 7:7 41 [1] - 4:7	ability [5] - 20:3, 97:17, 103:4, 156:27, 217:20 able [7] - 99:3, 108:19, 135:28,
111:18, 113:5, 131:8, 198:18, 199:6, 199:8, 199:11, 199:12 13,000 [1] - 108:18 1369 [1] - 110:4 138 [1] - 4:13 13TH [2] - 1:18, 5:1 13th [1] - 22:28 14 [2] - 138:26,	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20 2005 [1] - 203:21 2006 [34] - 42:8, 42:14, 76:12, 77:25, 78:12, 78:22, 79:12, 79:16, 79:19, 79:23,	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26 21 [1] - 2:29 214 [1] - 4:14 21st [5] - 64:13, 76:4, 146:16, 149:19, 150:1 221 [1] - 4:15 22nd [5] - 12:20, 12:28, 64:13, 64:17,	4 [1] - 3:3 4,000 [1] - 7:7 41 [1] - 4:7 42 [1] - 4:8	ability [5] - 20:3, 97:17, 103:4, 156:27, 217:20 able [7] - 99:3, 108:19, 135:28, 146:11, 146:15,
111:18, 113:5, 131:8, 198:18, 199:6, 199:8, 199:11, 199:12 13,000 [1] - 108:18 1369 [1] - 110:4 138 [1] - 4:13 13TH [2] - 1:18, 5:1 13th [1] - 22:28	112:29, 114:26 2000 [2] - 6:2, 17:20 2005 [1] - 203:21 2006 [34] - 42:8, 42:14, 76:12, 77:25, 78:12, 78:22, 79:12, 79:16, 79:19, 79:23, 79:28, 80:8, 82:18,	198:10, 198:19, 198:20, 199:1, 212:26 21 [1] - 2:29 214 [1] - 4:14 21st [5] - 64:13, 76:4, 146:16, 149:19, 150:1 221 [1] - 4:15 22nd [5] - 12:20,	4 [1] - 3:3 4,000 [1] - 7:7 41 [1] - 4:7	ability [5] - 20:3, 97:17, 103:4, 156:27, 217:20 able [7] - 99:3, 108:19, 135:28, 146:11, 146:15, 159:4, 175:28

line [1] - 173:24 absence [1] - 162:19 absolute [1] - 113:23 absolutely [17] -31:8, 84:12, 123:8, 132:7, 144:18, 164:22, 165:2, 165:25, 184:29, 186:28, 191:4, 195:3, 220:25, 232:25, 236:7, 238:5, 243:23 abuse [4] - 148:8, 169:24, 200:8, 210:15 abused [2] - 154:8, 243:21 abuser [1] - 242:20 accept [7] - 40:24, 66:2, 84:4, 143:22, 148:26. 162:27. 205:18 accepted [3] - 84:12, 158:12, 239:17 accepting [2] -162:27, 163:1 accepts [1] - 34:21 accessing [1] -203:13 accident [1] - 172:21 accidental [1] -210.21 accompanied [2] -13:28, 18:8 accompany [2] -61:25, 98:9 according [2] -128:1, 233:13 account [25] - 5:19, 8:6, 11:20, 24:14, 24:17, 25:12, 27:18, 29:25, 29:28, 30:2, 30:8, 34:26, 35:12, 36:3, 36:9, 38:26, 38:27, 43:2, 68:28, 88:12, 128:10, 142:14, 152:17, 156:21, 216:8 accounting [4] -9:27, 16:11, 40:18, 47:7 Accounts [18] - 16:6, 22:2, 60:2, 60:16, 61:24, 64:3, 66:12, 66:17, 66:20, 71:20, 72:26, 73:12, 82:22, 84:24, 88:16, 104:12, 113:12, 196:18 accounts [16] - 5:15, 6:11, 15:29, 16:7, 17:24, 17:29, 19:3, 21:11, 24:23, 32:19,

33:2, 34:5, 38:7, 43:8, 46:9, 46:10 accredited [1] -115:2 accurate [2] - 66:4, 200:22 accurately [1] -147:16 accused [2] -117:17, 238:21 achieve [1] - 143:3 acknowledge [3] -183:12, 194:19, 199:1 acknowledged [1] -134.20 acknowledging [1] -111:26 acknowledgment [2] - 85:10, 111:11 acquainted [2] -17:16, 17:18 act [4] - 5:23, 43:11, 43:18, 43:20 Act [3] - 57:24, 203:21, 204:6 **ACT**[2] - 1:4, 1:9 acting [2] - 142:9, 205.1 Acting [2] - 59:16, 112:21 action [7] - 1:28, 39:13, 40:12, 91:19, 91:24, 206:19, 208:6 actively [1] - 121:12 activities [2] -155:12, 173:24 activity [1] - 15:12 actual [9] - 42:7, 91:14, 98:7, 104:27, 115:18, 152:25, 168:23, 180:18, 231:18 **AD** [1] - 72:2 address [12] - 9:3, 57:28, 60:22, 66:14, 85:22, 91:14, 94:12, 113:10, 164:17, 172:29, 219:17, 220:8 addressed [3] -91:13, 110:7, 110:23 adequacy [1] - 8:26 adequate [1] -144:28 adjacent [1] - 52:8

ADJOURNED [2] -

ADJOURNMENT [1]

administered [1] -

100.2 243.28

- 137:23

5:15

adopt [1] - 148:5 adopted [3] - 13:2, 164:23, 202:2 advance [4] - 23:17, 60:9, 105:22, 106:17 advancing[1] advantage [3] -177:6, 177:10, 243:13 adverse [3] - 142:27, 190:12. 191:1 advice [20] - 12:16, 50:4, 50:22, 58:27, 59:10, 59:13, 59:14, 91:25, 121:25, 121:26, 121:28, 141:23, 143:6, 143:20, 143:23, 196:12, 204:8, 236:9, 239:12, 239:17 advise [1] - 181:11 advised [1] - 116:9 adviser[1] - 50:16 advising [3] - 49:1, 183:3. 183:4 **affairs** [1] - 65:13 **AFFIRMED**[1] - 5:8 afraid [4] - 156:28, 159:13, 178:10, 182.28 **AFTER**[2] - 101:1, 137:23 aftermath [1] - 210:8 afternoon [5] - 22:1, 22:4, 53:19, 138:20, 219:3 afterwards [8] -39:14, 92:22, 93:12, 93:13, 104:10, 116:3, 207:3, 207:4 agenda [12] - 153:5, 153:8, 158:26, 160:28, 162:7, 162:15, 185:19, 189:10, 190:5, 194:26, 240:24 agendas [1] - 195:17 ago [5] - 42:3, 51:21, 149:26, 152:24, 156:5 agree [12] - 33:18, 53:22, 79:15, 120:7, 135:16, 135:17, 143:1, 143:5, 171:20, 212:12, 218:16, 226:17 agreed [6] - 33:13, 62:20, 79:29, 93:20, 180:28, 229:1

24:13, 25:17, 26:11, 26:29, 34:4, 224:3, 224:22 agrees [5] - 26:15, 26:21, 26:25, 27:10, ahead [4] - 224:22, 225:15, 226:7, 227:1 air [1] - 63:21 aired [2] - 106:8, 156:14 airing [1] - 127:26 albeit [1] - 51:23 alerting [1] - 207:25 **ALISON**[2] - 2:18, 3:12 all-consuming [1] -156:25 allegation [25] -22:6, 23:6, 36:8, 39:7, 41:16, 82:18, 83:18, 126:5, 131:6, 132:10, 147:21, 147:25, 148:8, 149:16, 168:19, 180:26, 185:15, 190:2, 192:17, 197:26, 231:7, 231:18, 232:10, 232:11, 235:13 allegations [58] -9:4, 13:27, 14:16, 15:11, 18:24, 19:7, 19:15, 19:19, 19:20, 19:28, 22:17, 22:18, 25:4, 34:17, 34:20, 34:23, 35:7, 35:11, 35:19, 35:27, 36:6, 36:13, 36:27, 36:29, 37:5, 37:6, 37:21, 37:25, 38:13, 42:13, 67:10, 78:1, 86:14, 86:29, 110:20, 124:14, 125:8, 131:10, 133:16, 133:18, 152:17, 156:9, 156:11, 156:14, 165:1, 167:19, 167:27, 179:1, 179:7, 179:9, 179:10, 180:5, 180:8, 180:18, 181:9, 185:8, 185:9. 202:29 allege [1] - 171:22 alleged [16] - 7:14. 14:6, 14:8, 14:21,

21:21, 70:13, 71:18,

79:10, 129:17,

129:27, 131:10,

132:19, 145:12,

146:13, 147:6, 190:6 allegedly [5] - 96:13, 150:16, 192:8, 193:5, 193:7 alleging [2] - 31:29, 150:16 allowed [3] - 14:11, 157:11, 204:1 allows [1] - 177:2 allude [1] - 125:8 alluded [1] - 22:23 almost [3] - 196:2, 197:8, 236:27 alone [3] - 45:5, 52:23, 173:7 altercation [1] -158:20 alternative [2] -99:10, 192:20 amendment [1] -43:11 amendments [1] -11:9 amicable [2] - 224:3, 224:22 **amount** [1] - 84:10 analysing [1] -159:10 analysis [3] - 10:12, 110:11, 184:18 anathema [3] -191:5, 202:23, 236:10 **AND**[3] - 1:4, 1:5, **ANDREW**[2] - 4:10, 48.15 Andrew [4] - 48:11, 120:1, 120:11, 123:23 angles [1] - 81:17 angry [3] - 155:11, 214:25, 214:27 announced [1] -202:14 announcing [1] -94:22 annoyed [2] - 210:9, 210:17 annual [3] - 5:18, 11:25, 212:27 annually [1] - 61:28 anonymity [1] -81:22 anonymous [3] -72:2. 132:23. 133:3 answer [27] - 18:24, 19:6, 19:22, 22:11, 23:25, 50:24, 77:5, 81:19, 82:10, 83:15, 86:25, 136:22, 137:14, 144:17,

agreement [7] -

agreeing [1] - 212:11

151:5, 152:10, 152:12, 161:28, 164:9, 164:14, 170:9, 171:13. 171:23. 176:17, 183:22, 191:2, 203:28 answered [3] - 34:9, 34:27, 37:18 answering [4] -50:10, 76:26, 136:24, 191:11 answers [3] -192:16 140:18, 171:11, 185:7 **anxious** [6] - 143:8, 147:15, 154:25, 159:26, 188:26, 208:22 anyway [8] - 31:2, 74:24, 126:19, 158:21, 167:24, 206:6, 221:1, 229:9 **apart** [4] - 18:16, 52:15, 87:11, 152:5 182:12 appalled [8] - 164:8, 164:10, 164:22, 165:2, 191:4, 202:3, 202:18, 209:23 apparent [5] - 32:1, 58:12, 115:22, 141:5, 223:29 203:12 appeal [3] - 22:25, 23:1, 23:3 appear [26] - 24:4, 64:16, 65:4, 65:6, 65:27, 68:5, 69:6, 70:20, 73:27, 76:1, 243:28 76:3, 77:7, 94:7, 97:10, 102:9, 109:7, 131:5, 131:8, 144:21, 144:26, 171:14, 187:19, 204:12, 208:21, 214:14, 224:16 appearance [3] -13:13, 99:1, 113:13 APPEARANCES[1] -2:1 237:24 appeared [10] - 7:9, 7:23, 17:25, 17:29, 33:24, 58:21, 63:15, 139:9, 170:10, 223:1 appearing [6] -97:16, 99:12, 99:16, 105:25, 113:17, 222:9 152:9, 223:1 applied [1] - 20:9 ARRAN[3] - 2:12, applies [1] - 136:16 3:9, 3:10 appointed [2] arranged [2] - 93:21, 47:18, 48:21 98:14 appointment [1] arrest [3] - 54:3, 178:8 143:28

appointments [2] -47:28, 120:2 appreciate [17] -8:13, 22:5, 22:13, 22:14, 23:4, 23:7, 38:22, 40:29, 78:18, 79:29, 118:19, 137:26, 170:22, 192:21, 195:10, 233:25, 242:16 appreciates [1] apprised [1] - 154:28 approach [10] -90:19, 108:15, 110:10, 139:28, 144:12, 182:13, 182:14, 196:15, 215:17, 239:13 approached [2] -216:2, 241:29 approaches [1] appropriate [6] -11:9, 11:11, 23:14, 23:22, 63:2, 114:2 appropriateness [3] - 89:13, 103:25, appropriation [4] -5:19, 8:6, 16:7, 21:11 approval [1] - 211:24 April [3] - 123:26, 129:14 131:8 **APRIL**[3] - 1:18, 5:1, area [5] - 52:15, 62:20, 168:12, 215:28, 241:13 areas [4] - 34:3, 66:16, 135:20, 156:18 arena [2] - 47:14 argument [1] - 23:18 arise [7] - 47:11, 62:10, 68:28, 82:9, 107:24, 151:28, arisen [1] - 222:12 arises [1] - 192:1 arising [6] - 24:23, 48:7, 82:27, 158:27, 170:7, 175:12 arose [3] - 12:14,

arrests [1] - 172:29 arrival [1] - 201:25 arrived [7] - 7:1, 16:24, 18:9, 164:26, 173:17, 178:15, 223:10 arrives [1] - 63:11 arriving [1] - 27:8 Article [1] - 42:22 article [17] - 33:24, 43:6, 69:23, 123:29, 124:23, 125:7, 126:9, 131:5, 131:8, 187:19, 188:2, 188:4, 201:5, 230:16, 231:8, 231:10, 236:21 article's [1] - 131:26 articles [8] - 33:11, 33:17, 34:1, 55:17, 125:26, 126:2, 230:16, 234:25 **AS** [6] - 5:1, 5:9, 101:1, 137:24, 236:16, 237:16 ascertaining [2] -180:21, 181:3 ascribe [1] - 34:9 aside [2] - 199:21, 225:18 aspect [6] - 19:11, 83:25, 173:27, 195:14, 195:16, 243:17 **aspects** [1] - 6:3 assault [18] - 22:12, 22:16, 22:17, 22:18, 35:23, 35:24, 79:10, 84:10, 117:17, 126:6, 132:19. 145:13. 146:13, 147:6, 168:19, 185:16, 190:2 assert [3] - 135:26, 136:10, 136:13 asserting [1] - 42:6 assessing [1] assessment (3) -34:23, 35:6, 45:11 Assets [1] - 172:28 assist [2] - 20:25, 226:12 assistance [6] -20:21, 27:22, 27:24, 64:6, 84:13, 89:3 Assistant [21] -14:23, 17:13, 17:18, 60:11, 65:6, 68:12, 68:20, 73:9, 90:2, 90:3. 91:28. 92:28.

202:27, 203:10, 203:27, 204:16, 204:23 assistant [17] -14:27, 17:11, 51:15, 56:24, 60:28, 65:21, 71:9, 73:19, 76:5, 77:17, 78:7, 78:17, 80:18, 80:25, 87:22, 145:26, 229:15 assisted [3] - 10:9, 20:18. 57:27 associated [1] -38:13 assumed [1] -236:21 AT[1] - 243:29 atmosphere [1] -239:26 atrocity [1] - 175:15 attached [1] - 93:29 attaches [1] - 160:8 attack [2] - 27:29, 74:21 attacking [2] - 20:14, 90:29 attempt [3] - 9:3, 39:22, 202:6 attempted [1] -160:19 attempts [1] - 154:8 attend [11] - 16:5, 26:1, 56:27, 57:1, 57:7, 62:15, 64:23, 96:27, 104:4, 116:12, 172:13 attendance [4] -20:25, 60:15, 160:14, 222.8 attended [15] -15:28, 60:13, 62:14, 62:18, 64:29, 65:3, 65:5, 65:7, 65:12, 65:24, 65:28, 65:29, 66:2, 66:7, 224:6 attendees [2] -64:28, 84:29 attending [3] - 25:24, 60:26, 64:26 attention [19] -20:10, 33:22, 81:15, 91:20, 99:24, 129:15, 131:15, 159:27, 173:8, 185:15, 186:29, 188:26, 190:1, 194:16, 195:4, 195:6, 196:5, 223:6, 223:7

attitude [6] - 59:9,

67:20, 67:21, 112:14,

161:23, 164:23 attract [1] - 173:8 attractive [1] - 47:29 attributable [1] -177.9 attribute [2] -117:16, 135:10 audit [12] - 5:18, 6:19, 8:5, 8:28, 21:10, 31:14. 35:9. 37:22. 43:2, 43:8, 43:16 auditing [1] - 5:15 Auditor[8] - 5:11, 7:24, 40:19, 43:11, 45:24, 47:8, 47:17 auditors [1] - 47:18 audits [1] - 43:12 August [1] - 6:20 AUGUSTUS [1] -3:12 **Authority**[1] - 6:29 authority [1] - 5:16 autumn [1] - 14:14 available [2] - 8:12, 122:15 avoid [2] - 135:5, 225:24 avoidance [1] -232:27 aware [89] - 6:1, 8:15, 14:15, 14:20, 15:2, 15:22, 21:20, 27:23, 27:25, 29:1, 29:18, 31:14, 33:22, 36:20, 39:17, 42:13, 47:16, 78:13, 79:8, 79:12, 81:28, 81:29, 95:16, 95:21, 96:12, 98:23, 99:8, 99:14, 99:16. 99:18. 99:22. 106:21, 109:21, 112:22, 119:12, 121:1, 122:14, 123:16, 123:23, 123:27, 126:12, 126:13, 126:14, 126:29, 127:4, 128:6, 131:21, 132:1, 134:6, 135:17, 143:29, 144:1, 146:29, 147:1, 147:4, 149:14, 154:23, 154:25, 164:6, 164:19, 164:20, 164:21, 165:8, 188:12, 188:19, 188:20, 189:5, 204:2, 204:18, 209:8, 211:28, 217:8, 218:5, 218:6, 218:27, 219:1, 219:20,

102:9, 107:1, 178:7,

220:17, 225:17, 81:8, 150:9, 209:11 107:10, 121:11, 3:19 81:15, 83:8, 94:18, 227:4, 232:28, 233:3, bee [1] - 74:17 142:19, 151:15, bound [2] - 236:7, 152:27, 159:26, 233:7, 233:8, 234:22, beekeeper[3] -164:11, 167:29, 242:22 188:26, 194:16, 174:8, 181:9, 188:15, **BOW** [1] - 3:13 235:3. 236:17 196:5. 211:15 74:20, 74:22, 74:28 awareness [2] -**BEEN** [1] - 48:15 193:6, 206:6, 214:21, **box** [1] - 197:8 bringing [16] - 83:9, 49:28, 235:12 216:12, 218:6, 85:18, 86:11, 89:12, bees [9] - 20:14, brain [1] - 74:18 awful [1] - 149:7 218:10, 218:23, 110:1, 118:5, 151:1, 27:16, 27:29, 28:16, breach [2] - 99:7, 218:27, 219:21, 159:3, 167:28, 179:2, 74:18, 74:19, 74:20, 228:23 221:20, 221:21, 179:17, 180:26, В 75:4, 75:5 breaches [3] - 70:13, 223:11, 233:5, 195:4, 195:5, 197:4, beg [6] - 145:25, 70:17, 71:18 234:25, 237:6, 238:2 145:27, 157:13, 230:9 break [9] - 91:10, background [12] -157:28, 198:25, beyond [2] - 156:28, 91:12, 91:13, 108:20, **broad** [1] - 25:16 5:26, 8:18, 25:1, 238:14 233:21 137:20, 197:11, broadcast [1] - 223:1 40:20, 50:19, 76:25, bias [1] - 144:5 began [4] - 18:19, 197:12, 200:13, broadening [1] -80:21, 80:27, 136:21, bible [1] - 86:23 32:1, 178:21, 205:20 200:14 136:27, 169:5, 174:22 bid [1] - 242:2 broader [2] - 43:9, beginning [3] - 64:8, breaking [4] - 53:5, bad [6] - 149:10, 74:6, 179:21 big [4] - 155:25, 43.10 53:24, 54:2, 59:26 187:6, 187:15, 156:2, 156:16, 206:11 broadly [4] - 222:20, behalf [6] - 24:4, breath [1] - 183:11 197:22, 232:6, 234:14 224:20, 228:23, 116:6, 135:4, 138:21, biggest [1] - 48:28 breathe [1] - 164:5 **Bailieboro** [1] - 79:5 bit [17] - 50:20, 228:25 199:19. 211:29 BREFFNI [1] - 2:10 balance [1] - 105:27 58:16, 74:2, 74:7, broken [1] - 38:24 behaving [1] -BRETT [1] - 3:15 balancing [1] -116:29 95:15, 97:24, 104:11, brought [16] - 62:22, Brett [3] - 6:27, 176:20 behest [1] - 239:7 107:16, 126:20, 76:24, 83:23, 84:14, 12:28, 13:5 ballpark [1] - 169:24 136:6, 140:9, 140:11, 84:15, 99:23, 129:15, behind [3] - 46:14, Brett's [1] - 13:9 bank [5] - 157:3, 155:24, 184:7, 204:5, 131:15, 133:26, 185.4 215.8 BRIAN [1] - 2:22 171:13, 171:21, beholden [1] - 236:3 217:27, 227:28 150:9, 150:12, **brief** [12] - 26:18, 182:4, 182:6 bite [1] - 197:1 belief [2] - 30:18, 186:26, 186:29, 26:21, 32:18, 38:10, barely [1] - 40:2 bitter [3] - 161:17, 223:6, 223:7, 229:13 170:23 48:24, 119:11, barring [1] - 136:16 161:23, 182:22 build [1] - 94:27 believes [1] - 236:28 120:19, 122:15, barristers [2] bitterly [1] - 219:13 building [1] - 223:11 bells [2] - 196:6, 122:19, 122:27, 137:18, 219:12 BL [10] - 2:7, 2:10, buildings [1] - 16:23 196:7 123:14, 202:28 **BARTON**[1] - 3:15 beneficial [1] - 57:26 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, built [2] - 44:23, briefed [8] - 106:7, based [12] - 29:24, 2:28, 3:8, 3:12, 3:19 158.9 benefit [11] - 25:9, 118:28, 119:4, 120:3, 29:25. 60:24. 71:7. block [5] - 52:3, **bullying** [3] - 158:15, 50:21, 78:7, 98:25, 120:11, 120:25, 81:14, 142:29, 52:4, 52:5, 52:16, 158:18, 158:21 124:19, 124:22, 120:28, 182:19 144:24, 145:1, 145:2, 52:21 bureau [1] - 178:20 139:26, 213:6, briefing [27] - 57:19, 153:12, 155:20, 221:23, 233:19, 234:6 blowing [1] - 89:24 Bureau [1] - 172:28 57:20, 97:4, 97:26, 205:19 benefits [1] - 139:28 board [4] - 49:16, burned [1] - 239:4 97:29, 114:22, basement [1] - 16:23 97:20, 111:28, 239:10 beside [3] - 52:6, 114:25, 120:5, 134:6, BURNS [1] - 2:27 basis [33] - 10:8, bodies [1] - 8:27 154:11, 154:14, Bus [1] - 49:2 66:28, 92:2 53:6, 53:11, 53:12, best [12] - 44:17, **body** [1] - 175:12 174:9, 175:20, 177:1, busiest [1] - 54:12 53:17, 54:9, 54:10, 61:12, 74:23, 93:20, bogged [1] - 198:16 177:27, 178:1, 178:2, business [9] - 48:27, 60.18 61.22 62.15 110:10, 131:22, boiling [1] - 177:28 179:12, 183:7, 195:9, 241:7, 241:16, 72:2, 81:21, 97:23, 201:19, 201:20, 179:4, 181:11, **bond** [1] - 58:25 241:18, 241:19, 98:22, 99:1, 132:14, 201:22, 201:24, 182:24, 199:2, book [1] - 34:1 241:20, 241:22, 135:25, 136:9, 199:17, 239:13 booklet [1] - 33:16 211:22, 226:27, 241:24 136:27, 152:17, 227:10 better [5] - 27:27, boss [2] - 240:18, busy [2] - 21:7, 162:28, 163:1, 47:29, 145:21, 155:5, 241:3 briefings [23] -184:1 171:29, 174:22, 96:28, 134:10, 199:13 bottle [2] - 192:23, BY [32] - 1:5, 1:8, 179:22, 182:20, 134:14, 134:17, 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:28, between [53] - 6:2, 192:24 184:22, 205:21, 134:18, 134:21, 10:4, 10:13, 24:13, 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12, bottom [7] - 16:27, 210:4, 220:5, 237:23, 24:16, 24:24, 34:4, 18:10, 27:8, 88:4, 134:23, 135:18, 3:20, 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 242:18 135:19, 164:21, 40:18, 44:9, 45:15, 159:24, 193:22, 194:1 4:8, 4:12, 4:13, 4:14, bear [3] - 82:11, 164:29, 172:11, 47:7, 47:22, 52:17, 4:15, 4:16, 4:17, 5:9, Boucher [6] - 63:8, 82:12, 154:15 172:12, 172:13, 52:21, 59:1, 84:29, 24:2, 41:11, 42:19, 63:18, 63:24, 221:22, became [9] - 15:2, 173:29, 174:4, 174:5, 88:17, 94:11, 98:15, 223:20, 224:8 48:16, 138:17, 31:14, 33:22, 56:11, 174:19, 176:25, 99:14, 101:9, 101:16, 214:12, 221:12, Boucher-Haves [6] -58:11, 59:15, 81:6, 101:17, 101:23, 176:26, 226:24 236:16, 237:15 63:8, 63:18, 63:24, 147:4, 203:12 103:15, 104:17, briefly [1] - 172:14 bypassing [1] -221:22, 223:20, 224:8

BOUGHTON [1] -

bring [10] - 79:17,

240:19

become [4] - 14:15,

104:18, 106:22,

Byrne [1] - 79:4	218:28, 218:29,	90:15, 105:4, 106:25,	109:8, 112:16,	234:11, 235:29
	219:21, 221:20,	117:29, 131:24,	116:21, 117:11,	CHAIRMAN [241] -
C	221:21, 224:16,	132:11, 140:16,	127:10, 128:5,	4:8, 4:17, 8:17, 13:2,
	225:2, 225:19,	144:16, 144:18,	128:15, 130:23,	13:18, 27:27, 27:29,
C&AG [2] - 31:2,	226:16, 226:27,	144:19, 144:21,	139:10, 141:19,	28:15, 33:7, 33:9,
47:27	227:2, 227:13, 230:3,	144:26, 149:2,	144:20, 144:21,	33:20, 36:22, 37:9,
Callinan [158] - 9:28,	235:5, 236:29, 238:3,	150:18, 152:8,	144:24, 146:26,	42:19, 42:20, 42:22,
16:19, 17:11, 18:19,	238:20, 239:16, 241:1	160:22, 162:24,	149:4, 160:12,	42:25, 43:1, 43:18,
21:3, 21:17, 22:5,	Callinan's [25] -	175:4, 178:13,	160:14, 164:6, 165:6,	43:21, 43:28, 44:7,
23:4, 24:6, 24:15,	24:17, 25:10, 35:12,	180:10, 180:13, 186:25, 189:26,	168:25, 179:1, 182:27, 184:14,	44:12, 44:15, 44:26, 44:29, 45:3, 45:6,
24:24, 25:18, 25:22,	36:3, 36:9, 38:26, 39:28, 41:13, 66:13,	190:27, 210:2, 216:5,	186:19, 191:19,	45:12, 45:15, 45:28,
26:10, 26:14, 26:25,	66:27, 69:3, 72:16,	216:9, 224:29,	196:8, 201:7, 204:6,	46:5, 46:13, 46:17,
27:2, 30:1, 30:3,	72:19, 83:1, 85:22,	240:15, 242:17	204:7, 205:15,	46:28, 47:5, 47:15,
30:12, 30:13, 32:9,	86:15, 86:22, 108:28,	cases [5] - 7:8, 7:15,	205:17, 214:27,	47:21, 48:3, 48:6,
34:3, 34:7, 34:10,	144:4, 159:27,	7:17, 9:20, 13:17	215:4, 225:22, 233:4,	50:9, 50:14, 68:18,
36:1, 36:18, 36:23,	201:28, 208:25,	CASTLE[1] - 1:17	235:11, 236:9, 243:2	70:24, 70:28, 71:4,
37:3, 37:11, 37:16,	208:29, 211:4, 214:25	casual [1] - 183:18	certify [1] - 1:25	74:4, 74:16, 74:23,
40:8, 41:3, 49:14,	calm [1] - 157:20	cat [2] - 239:1, 239:2	cetera [2] - 153:12,	74:26, 74:29, 75:4,
51:8, 53:10, 53:14,	calumny [1] - 243:22	cat's [6] - 143:10,	155:21	75:6, 76:19, 78:11,
53:22, 53:25, 53:27,	campaign [13] -	238:22, 238:26,	chaff [1] - 184:3	82:26, 83:14, 83:24,
55:2, 58:13, 58:23,	118:15, 119:12,	238:28, 238:29	chain [1] - 160:4	84:8, 99:28, 126:20,
58:26, 59:1, 61:20,	121:13, 123:7, 191:7,	catch [1] - 234:2	Chair [23] - 24:29,	126:29, 127:6,
61:25, 62:23, 65:1,	230:12, 235:7,	categoric [1] -	82:29, 83:21, 84:4,	127:10, 127:16,
66:25, 68:22, 68:24, 68:29, 69:8, 70:16,	235:19, 236:5,	185:13	84:12, 95:23, 97:9,	127:25, 128:1, 128:4,
83:11, 84:21, 84:29,	236:10, 237:25,	categorise [1] -	97:21, 128:12, 129:7,	128:8, 128:10,
85:5, 85:13, 85:25,	237:29, 238:2	54:25	136:3, 136:24,	128:14, 128:23,
87:9, 87:23, 88:26,	CANAL[1] - 3:17	cattle [2] - 28:16,	161:13, 164:18,	128:26, 129:4,
89:3, 90:10, 91:16,	cancellation [2] -	74:21	170:6, 170:27,	135:22, 136:4, 136:6,
91:29, 92:6, 92:13,	14:17, 14:22	caused [3] - 37:17,	174:23, 182:28,	136:14, 136:22,
93:21, 96:4, 96:14,	cancelled [5] - 7:10,	39:11, 58:29	190:18, 193:8,	136:29, 137:4, 137:20, 137:26,
97:1, 97:5, 99:25,	7:11, 7:15, 7:17, 10:7	causing [4] - 93:16,	196:28, 205:23	138:2, 138:6, 138:8,
101:4, 101:10,	cannot [1] - 180:20	155:27, 156:6, 156:12	chair [16] - 103:2, 104:17, 225:6,	138:10, 138:12,
103:21, 106:26,	canvassed [2] - 46:21, 48:1	cautious [1] - 140:11	225:11, 226:17,	138:15, 157:20,
107:18, 109:4, 112:8,	capacity [1] - 156:29	Cavan [5] - 15:4,	238:8, 238:16,	157:26, 158:1, 158:6,
112:14, 112:17,	CAPEL[1] - 3:6	31:16, 143:29,	239:11, 240:12,	158:13, 158:20,
115:6, 116:6, 116:20,	car [1] - 98:23	178:26, 187:8 Cavan-Monaghan	240:15, 241:10,	161:11, 161:14,
116:22, 117:12,	care [1] - 34:22	[3] - 15:4, 31:16,	241:22, 242:27,	161:20, 161:28,
117:16, 119:11,	career [4] - 48:24,	178:26	243:19, 243:23,	163:29, 165:10,
122:2, 123:17,	176:27, 241:15,	central [1] - 110:19	243:26	165:18, 165:23,
126:14, 132:18,	241:21	CEO [1] - 211:17	Chair's [1] - 50:24	165:27, 166:18,
132:20, 140:10,	careful [1] - 36:24	certain [20] - 7:14,	chairman [1] - 33:16	166:20, 168:25,
140:23, 141:7,	carried [8] - 5:22,	26:10, 45:15, 47:6,	Chairman [37] -	169:2, 169:19,
141:22, 141:28, 142:22, 185:14,	9:3, 9:29, 10:13,	47:23, 57:29, 66:5,	23:29, 29:3, 38:19,	169:26, 170:1,
186:11, 186:20,	17:14, 17:19, 17:21,	105:1, 105:26, 109:5,	42:21, 98:15, 127:15,	170:20, 174:25,
189:27, 190:1,	227:5	116:29, 134:10,	138:9, 158:7, 165:6,	176:7, 176:10,
190:23, 190:24,	carry [3] - 8:1, 40:11,	136:20, 159:7,	166:23, 176:16,	176:17, 182:5, 182:8,
196:1, 196:2, 196:10,	43:12	205:22, 206:24,	190:21, 190:27,	185:22, 185:27, 186:2, 186:8, 189:9,
197:7, 198:22,	case [61] - 12:14,	207:27, 211:15,	191:15, 191:28,	189:24, 190:17,
205:12, 205:16,	13:21, 15:3, 20:9,	223:28, 227:18	192:14, 192:26,	190:19, 191:8,
205:26, 206:22,	21:11, 22:12, 27:16,	CERTAIN [1] - 1:4	193:19, 193:24, 200:21, 200:24,	191:17, 191:21,
206:25, 207:2,	27:20, 27:21, 29:23,	certainly [61] - 8:17,	200.21, 200.24, 201:15, 207:14,	191:24, 192:4, 192:8,
207:20, 208:22,	29:28, 31:16, 32:12,	15:23, 18:27, 22:14,	208:14, 209:10,	192:16, 192:21,
210:29, 211:25,	32:21, 32:28, 33:14,	23:16, 29:12, 37:26,	210:27, 216:2,	193:1, 193:9, 193:14,
212:1, 214:22, 215:4,	36:21, 38:12, 41:5,	39:14, 42:13, 43:19,	218:12, 219:6,	193:20, 193:23,
215:8, 216:3, 216:13,	41:13, 44:22, 44:23, 44:27, 47:5, 57:3,	43:27, 44:7, 45:17,	219:16, 220:10,	193:25, 195:13,
216:27, 216:28,	71:6, 71:7, 76:1,	47:11, 58:21, 63:16, 70:19, 73:7, 80:9,	220:14, 232:5,	195:16, 195:21,
217:8, 217:11,	76:22, 77:7, 81:6,	82:11, 90:24, 93:27,	233:26, 234:2,	195:24, 196:26,
217:12, 218:23,	10.22, 11.1, 01.0,	02.11, 00.24, 00.21,		197:16, 198:1, 198:5,

200:4, 200:11,	Chapter [2] - 11:28, 11:29	circulation [1] 169:27
200:13, 200:20,	chapter [3] - 16:16,	circumstance
200:23, 200:25,	58:4, 58:8	15:22, 20:16, 3
202:11, 204:25,	character [4] - 19:12,	40:5, 40:15, 53
204:28, 205:14,	67:16, 113:15, 242:26	53:20, 59:23, 8
207:5, 207:7, 207:9,	characterise [1] -	114:12, 134:24
207:12, 207:16,	40:27	136:16, 136:20
207:18, 208:8,	characterising [1] -	174:21, 177:4,
208:15, 208:28,	171:12	177:13, 177:15
209:3, 209:6, 209:13,	charge [27] - 6:5,	177:16
210:12, 210:22,	6:16, 7:9, 8:2, 14:18,	circumvent [1
211:27, 211:29,	14:22, 20:4, 20:8,	204:13
212:3, 212:7, 212:10,	32:3, 46:1, 50:26,	citizen [1] - 19
212:13, 212:17,	51:12, 60:3, 66:20,	civil [1] - 142:
213:21, 214:4, 214:7,	67:2, 68:3, 73:4,	civilian [6] - 20
215:3, 219:2, 219:7,	77:26, 80:14, 82:24,	48:18, 51:23, 5
219:11, 219:19,	94:12, 94:23, 98:17,	140:10, 142:26
220:21, 220:24,	99:11, 111:12,	civilianisatio
220:26, 220:29,	151:19, 235:2	51:20
221:5, 221:10,	charges [1] - 25:6	civilians [3] -
227:22, 227:26,	CHARLES [1] - 2:23	59:9, 141:23
227:29, 228:2, 228:8,	CHARLETON [2] -	claim [9] - 76:
228:16, 230:21,	1:12, 2:2	129:25, 157:15
230:23, 231:13,	Charlton [1] - 182:22	158:14, 158:15
231:16, 231:22,	chat [1] - 49:25	158:18, 158:21
231:28, 232:3, 232:8,	chats [1] - 240:21	228:12, 228:13
233:13, 233:23,	chestnuts [2] -	clarification
233:28, 234:3, 234:9,	238:24, 239:2	29:22, 114:28,
234:15, 234:29,	CHIEF [2] - 2:19,	166:25, 170:8,
235:9, 235:22,	2:23	clarified [2] - 1
235:26, 235:28,	Chief [11] - 6:28,	116:3
236:1, 237:15,	65:14, 65:24, 74:12,	clarify [6] - 24
237:17, 238:1, 238:9,	75:11, 83:4, 85:8,	113:14, 156:4,
238:21, 238:28,	85:15, 86:2, 105:10,	165:29, 207:13
239:20, 240:13,	112:2	238:25
240:16, 241:8,	chief [9] - 20:28,	clarifying [1] -
241:11, 241:13,	51:17, 71:11, 73:3,	clarity [1] - 21
241:20, 241:23,	99:20, 107:11, 142:5,	classify [1] - 1
242:12, 242:16,	231:28, 234:16	Clavin [2] - 65
242:22, 243:16,	child [3] - 169:23,	75:12
243:20, 243:24	200:8, 242:20	clear [19] - 29:
Chairman's [1] -	chimed [2] - 36:28,	29:20, 31:1, 35
221:23	37:9	36:22, 50:9, 10
chamber [2] - 16:18,	chin [1] - 110:11	165:16, 169:20
20:22	choose [1] - 45:4	176:12, 181:26
CHAMBERS [1] -	Christmas [3] -	185:20, 186:12
2:29	61:26, 73:1, 222:21	187:2, 187:5, 1
chance [1] - 97:24	chronologically [1] -	189:27, 209:12
change [7] - 43:18,	221:16	212:18
46:24, 56:10, 59:18,	chronology [2] -	clear-cut [1] -
95:11, 138:2, 241:4	78:13, 78:14	clearcut [1] - 2
changed [5] - 46:27,	CIE [1] - 44:20	cleared [3] - 1
56:11, 59:15, 137:29,	circle [1] - 170:18	198:10, 198:19
231:22	circulate [1] - 150:7	clearer [1] - 12
changes [3] - 59:18,	circulated [5] -	clearly [5] - 29
04.00 444.47	113:1, 166:13,	152:16, 163:14
•	, ,	
94:28, 114:17 changing [3] -	166:14, 166:23, 199:7	163:23, 204:2
•	166:14, 166:23, 199:7 circulating [3] -	163:23, 204:2 client [17] - 14

ılation [1] ımstances [18] -20:16, 38:9, 10:15, 53:5, 59:23, 82:2, 2, 134:24, 5, 136:20, , 177:4, 3, 177:15, Imvent [1] en [1] - 193:11 [1] - 142:17 an [6] - 20:18, 51:23, 59:13,), 142:26 anisation [1] ans [3] - 58:28, 141:23 **n** [9] - 76:11, 5, 157:15, 1, 158:15, 3, 158:21, 2, 228:13 fication [6] -114:28, 116:7, 5, 170:8, 200:18 fied [2] - 113:6, **fy** [6] - 24:10, , 156:4. 9, 207:13, fying [1] - 96:2 **ty** [1] - 216:15 sify [1] - 119:1 in [2] - 65:14, [19] - 29:4, 31:1, 35:29, 50:9, 107:17, 5, 169:20, 2, 181:26,), 186:12, 187:5, 188:3, , 209:12, r-cut [1] - 107:17 rcut [1] - 227:15 red [3] - 170:3,), 198:19 rer [1] - 128:22 rly [5] - 29:13, 6, 163:14, 3, 204:2 t [17] - 141:27,

186:24, 187:4, 190:22, 192:27, 194:4, 199:19, 205:26, 205:27, 207:22, 209:9, 210:28, 214:17, 216:1 client's [6] - 165:4, 177:17, 189:26, 192:19, 210:20, 211:9 Clifford's [1] - 33:1 close [9] - 52:24, 58:13, 58:22, 119:16, 141:7, 164:11, 210:29, 215:23, 238:4 closely [3] - 19:21, 119:13, 194:22 Clyne [1] - 102:12 **co**[1] - 223:23 co-presenter [1] -223:23 Code [2] - 57:24, 58:5 **coffee** [4] - 16:29, 17:2, 166:5, 219:13 cold [2] - 47:24, 82.28 colleague [1] - 9:11 colleagues [5] -18:8, 18:17, 18:18, 108:19, 158:24 collective [1] - 129:5 college [3] - 48:26, 171:27, 172:4 colour [1] - 178:27 colourful [2] - 27:18, 196:29 coming [17] - 24:10, 24:25, 39:3, 39:6, 54:26, 85:14, 88:14, 90:25, 102:25, 107:5, 142:20, 153:28, 159:24, 179:21, 211:8, 235:17, 242:17 command [3] -97:18, 99:4, 103:5 commenced [1] -26:26 comment [32] - 23:9, 35:1, 38:23, 40:8, 40:13, 80:28, 107:9, 108:21, 112:9, 114:2, 126:16, 126:18, 132:7, 132:8, 132:12, 133:20, 133:25, 133:29, 134:4, 135:29, 136:2, 149:10, 152:6, 155:16, 156:27, 163:4, 168:22,

170:16, 171:20,

174:1, 182:22, 204:8 commentary [1] -93:15 comments [14] -11:10, 11:17, 11:20, 96:3, 96:12, 105:1, 114:26, 115:14, 116:28, 136:9, 136:17, 186:17, 198:2, 227:12 commissioner [28] -17:11, 51:13, 51:16, 56:25, 60:28, 71:10, 73:20, 76:5, 77:17, 78:7, 78:18, 80:19, 86:1, 87:23, 90:1, 102:23, 102:25, 110:23, 110:25, 110:27, 111:2, 111:3, 111:4, 120:25, 143:20, 143:22, 229:15 Commissioner [353] - 9:28, 11:22, 12:3, 12:15, 12:17, 12:20, 14:23, 16:13, 16:19, 16:27, 17:10, 17:11, 17:14, 17:18, 17:27, 18:1, 18:12, 18:18, 18:21, 21:3, 21:5, 21:17, 21:23, 21:25, 22:5, 23:9, 24:6, 24:14, 24:15, 25:18, 25:22, 26:9, 26:25, 27:2. 29:29. 30:3. 30:11, 30:13, 32:9, 34:2, 35:12, 36:1, 36:23, 39:2, 39:16, 39:28, 41:3, 46:22, 46:23, 46:29, 49:14, 49:19, 50:5, 51:8, 51:9, 51:11, 51:19, 53:10 53:14 53:21 53:25, 53:26, 55:2, 55:28, 56:3, 56:12, 56:23, 56:24, 57:22, 58:13, 58:22, 58:26, 59:1, 59:9, 59:12, 59:16, 59:21, 59:24, 60:12, 60:18, 60:22, 60:25, 61:19, 61:25, 61:28, 61:29, 62:14, 62:17, 62:23, 62:28, 63:7, 63:11, 64:28, 64:29, 65:3, 65:7, 65:20, 65:22, 66:13, 66:25, 66:27, 67:23, 68:12, 68:20, 68:21,

68:22. 68:24. 68:29.

72:11, 72:16, 72:19,

69:3, 69:8, 70:16,

73:8, 73:9, 81:17,	201:28, 202:15,	79:11, 82:3, 84:1	180:11, 188:5, 231:10	147:27, 148:16,
83:1, 83:11, 84:16,	202:27, 203:10,	Committee [36] -	complaint [12] -	152:7, 163:25,
84:20, 84:29, 85:11,	203:27, 204:12,	15:29, 16:6, 20:25,	79:9, 79:22, 83:28,	167:27, 170:25,
85:13, 85:22, 85:25,	204:16, 204:24,	22:2, 26:27, 46:8,	126:22, 131:11,	179:11, 195:11,
85:28, 86:14, 86:22, 87:9, 87:23, 88:26,	205:12, 205:16,	46:9, 60:2, 60:17,	158:27, 180:12,	197:22, 201:4,
	205:25, 206:21,	61:24, 64:3, 66:13,	188:6, 231:6, 231:23,	202:19, 202:22, 210:10
89:3, 89:14, 89:28,	206:25, 206:29,	66:14, 66:17, 66:20,	232:10, 233:11	
90:2, 90:3, 90:9, 90:22, 90:25, 91:3,	207:2, 207:20, 208:22, 208:25,	71:20, 72:26, 73:12, 82:22, 84:24, 88:16,	complaints [4] - 25:5, 79:4, 151:28,	concerns [8] - 6:15, 37:29, 90:26, 97:19,
91:16, 91:28, 91:29,	208:29, 210:3,	95:24, 99:6, 99:9,	178:24	103:3, 205:8, 218:2,
92:1, 92:5, 92:6,	210:29, 211:3,	99:13, 99:15, 104:13,	complete [1] -	218:7
92:13, 92:21, 92:28,	211:17, 211:25,	113:13, 196:18,	240:17	concluded [3] -
92:29, 93:1, 93:20,	212:1, 212:20,	214:22, 217:6, 217:7,	completed [1] - 11:2	21:23, 22:2, 41:6
94:8, 94:11, 95:2,	212:25, 212:28,	217:24, 218:12,	completely [15] -	concluding [2] -
95:6, 95:25, 96:4,	213:2, 213:14,	219:9, 220:12	22:7, 25:28, 37:23,	13:18, 170:18
96:14, 96:21, 96:27,	213:28, 214:2, 215:4,	committee [5] - 16:4,	39:24, 45:2, 45:4,	conclusion [4] -
96:29, 97:5, 97:13,	215:8, 215:13,	16:9, 21:1, 68:7,	46:13, 202:23,	7:28, 113:29, 213:13,
97:28, 98:3, 98:9,	215:17, 215:19,	103:7	202:24, 236:10,	221:1
98:15, 98:21, 98:28,	215:22, 215:24,	committees [1] -	239:9, 242:10, 242:19	conclusions [1] -
99:3, 99:8, 99:14,	216:3, 216:12,	81:12	complex [1] - 16:24	21:9
99:24, 101:4, 101:10,	216:27, 216:28,	committing [1] -	complicated [3] -	conduct [1] - 235:7
101:16, 102:2, 102:9,	217:11, 217:12,	110:12	15:3, 31:15, 37:26	conducted [3] - 10:3,
102:27, 103:3,	218:7, 218:10,	common [2] - 13:21,	complied [1] -	35:9, 71:12
103:16, 103:21,	218:11, 218:23,	173:22	205:11	conduit [1] - 53:13
103:27, 104:3,	218:28, 220:2,	communicate [2] -	complimented [2] -	conference [8] -
104:17, 106:26,	220:13, 220:18,	151:24, 201:9	83:9, 110:1	62:28, 226:11,
107:1, 107:6, 107:18,	221:20, 221:21,	communicating [1] -	comply [2] - 72:17,	226:15, 226:18,
108:21, 108:28,	222:9, 222:14, 224:1,	180:15	205:9	227:1, 227:4, 227:16,
109:4, 109:14, 109:26, 110:25,	224:6, 224:8, 224:16,	communication [7] -	comptroller [1] -	228:14
111:8, 112:7, 112:14,	225:2, 225:18, 226:3, 226:16, 226:27,	26:13, 50:4, 101:9,	46:11	conferences [1] -
112:17, 112:20,	227:2, 227:13,	132:23, 133:3,	Comptroller [8] -	173:13
112:21, 114:7,	228:15, 230:3, 235:5,	143:20, 236:8	5:11, 7:24, 40:19,	confidence [3] -
114:10, 114:17,	235:6, 235:10,	communications [21] - 48:22, 50:3,	43:11, 45:24, 47:8,	203:29, 210:16,
114:18, 115:5,	236:29, 237:7, 238:3,	50:16, 51:3, 96:26,	47:16, 47:17 computer [9] - 10:9,	242:23 confidential [13] -
115:18, 116:1, 116:6,	238:20, 239:12,	121:25, 135:21,	15:8, 15:9, 15:12,	76:29, 79:6, 82:13,
116:20, 116:21,	239:16, 241:1, 241:6	139:20, 142:2,	21:22, 31:17, 33:14,	110:18, 111:12,
117:12, 117:16,	COMMISSIONER [1]	142:12, 143:6,	38:16, 41:5	111:23, 111:27,
118:28, 119:10,	- 2:14	151:22, 160:17,	computer-assisted	133:23, 203:8,
120:12, 120:25,	commissioner's [4] -	176:2, 181:7, 181:8,	[1] - 10:9	203:23, 204:15,
122:2, 123:17,	14:27, 52:15, 80:26,	181:28, 183:3, 183:4,	conceal [1] - 236:5	205:6, 242:18
126:12, 126:14,	145:26	202:24, 235:16	concede [1] - 163:13	confidentiality [5] -
131:17, 132:18,	Commissioner's [28]	community [3] -	conceding [1] -	77:2, 82:14, 203:4,
132:20, 140:10,	- 52:4, 52:5, 52:14,	20:7, 28:8, 223:12	110:19	203:29, 205:6
140:23, 141:1, 141:6,	52:16, 55:14, 56:28,	company [4] - 20:22,	concentrated [1] -	confined [1] - 178:25
141:15, 141:22, 141:28, 142:19,	64:20, 67:16, 69:9,	223:8, 223:9, 223:15	131:10	confines [1] - 152:4
142:21, 143:7, 144:4,	72:23, 75:20, 75:22, 81:15, 91:24, 93:16,	COMPANY[1] - 2:11	concept [1] - 150:19	confirm [6] - 19:13,
144:13, 150:20,	97:17, 104:16,	comparison [2] -	concern [20] - 18:27,	24:10, 25:2, 114:18,
152:15, 159:26,	114:15, 114:16,	32:14, 154:15	29:17, 39:12, 72:15,	123:21, 174:1
164:11, 164:23,	115:10, 122:10,	competition [1] -	86:12, 92:26, 92:27,	confirmed [3] -
165:14, 165:23,	131:15, 165:19,	120:2	93:10, 97:25, 97:27,	104:21, 104:24,
178:8, 178:11, 183:5,	166:25, 185:24,	complain [1] - 219:12	99:2, 103:7, 104:14,	104:26
185:14, 186:11,	205:8, 227:5, 240:20	complainant [1] -	127:24, 151:12,	conflict [1] - 88:17 confront [1] - 23:20
186:14, 186:20,	Commissioners [2] -	203:4	152:26, 180:3, 180:4, 217:18, 231:6	confront[1] - 23.20
189:27, 190:23,	87:22, 236:25	complainant's [1] -	concerned [25] -	134:29, 196:23
190:24, 194:17,	commit [1] - 44:24	154:27	9:16, 12:13, 18:29,	confronted [1] - 22:6
195:6, 195:29, 196:2,	commitment [1] -	complainants [1] -	55:7, 72:22, 76:3,	conjunction [2] -
196:10, 197:6,	113:24	204:1	82:17, 88:11, 90:14,	56:23, 56:24
197:27, 198:22, 201:4, 201:11,	committed [4] - 7:18,	complaining [3] -	106:21, 132:1, 132:3,	connected [2] -
201.7, 201.11,				

21:19, 153:25 12:15, 105:29, 30:16, 32:8, 34:28, 11:24, 12:4, 12:19, 179:11, 180:6, connection [2] -186:23, 236:28, 237:8 36:3, 36:20, 36:22, 13:1, 14:19, 14:25, 180:18, 181:9, 151:14, 197:25 contacting [1] -38:1, 38:8, 38:11, 14:29, 15:5, 16:2, 182:17, 182:18, 38:27, 38:28, 39:29, 16:5, 16:10, 16:15, 183:9, 185:9, 187:1, **CONNOLLY** [1] - 3:5 106:3 41:20, 42:7, 42:11, 17:5, 20:17, 20:20, 190:26, 196:14, **CONOR** [1] - 2:15 contain [1] - 32:19 21:27, 22:3, 25:8, 199:15, 199:20, Conor [1] - 24:3 contained [1] - 14:1 53:26, 63:8, 63:9, 63:10, 63:18, 63:19, 26:16, 26:28, 27:14, 201:27, 205:18, conscious [1] contemporaneous 28:25, 29:27, 31:12, 92:25, 95:20, 95:21, 214:24, 215:18, [1] - 28:18 113:29 101:22, 101:25, 31:20, 31:24, 32:10, 216:14, 221:24, consequence [7] content [1] - 27:12 102:26, 104:5, 104:8, 32:24, 33:28, 37:2, 221:27, 221:29, 45:16, 45:29, 135:27, contents [2] - 33:19, 106:29, 107:10, 38:27, 38:29, 39:29, 222:2, 222:11, 161:24, 190:3. 70:15 117:11, 133:13, 40:4, 42:24, 42:29, 222:24, 222:28, 210:24, 233:15 context [15] - 15:15, 133:15, 148:14, 46:3, 48:19, 48:20, 225:13, 230:6, 231:5, consider [7] - 20:26, 29:5, 34:16, 49:7, 163:6, 163:18, 48:22, 48:23, 50:17, 233:27, 233:28, 95:6, 95:9, 107:21, 76:19, 76:22, 78:14, 171:16, 171:18, 51:24, 51:25, 53:29, 233:29, 243:9 144:12, 160:21, 94:18, 144:29, 145:5, 54:1, 54:5, 54:7, 54:8, 179:28, 185:28, 175:7, 189:16, corrected [4] -181:16 192:2, 192:11, 54:18, 54:27, 54:28, 35:25, 91:11, 148:12, considerable [1] -231:25, 241:24 208:25, 213:2, 55:3, 55:4, 56:14, 203:6 176:19 continue [1] - 124:16 215:26, 216:1, 216:4, 56:15, 57:9, 57:10, correctly [2] - 56:5, consideration [6] continued [2] -216:19, 221:19, 57:13, 58:6, 58:7, 235:10 34:23. 102:16. 19:26. 92:16 224:10 58:15, 59:16, 59:17, correctness [1] -108:11, 122:29, continuing [2] conversations [13] -59:19, 61:2, 61:3, 35:10 181:19, 181:20 27:4, 27:5 96:17, 121:5, 122:7, 61:6, 61:26, 61:27, correspondence [8] considered [5] continuously [1] -62:7, 63:5, 64:18, 159:16. 159:18. - 20:26, 21:7, 99:14, 91:21, 95:11, 102:23, 91:11 171:3. 171:4. 182:23. 64:29. 65:2. 66:10. 99:17, 99:19, 218:6, 108:12, 218:16 contradict [1] -183:18, 183:19, 66:14, 66:15, 66:18, 218:10, 219:27 considering [7] -13.19 184:2, 184:22, 217:5 66:22, 67:4, 67:18, correspondents [5] -8:14, 11:17, 79:22, contrary [2] - 83:12, conversing [1] -68:24, 69:16, 70:2, 166:7, 172:3, 172:6, 88:4, 98:16, 169:6, 184:7 71:15, 71:20, 73:13, 27:11 175:1, 175:27 213.4 contribution [3] -75:29, 76:8, 76:9, convey[1] - 34:22 corroboration [1] consistent (3) -110:18, 111:27, 77:6, 80:14, 80:15, conveying [1] -28.13 74:12, 122:18, 188:28 121:19 80:23. 81:22. 81:23. 30:16 **corruption** [3] - 9:4, consistently [1] control [13] - 6:9, 81:26. 81:27. 82:4. convictions [1] -13:28, 25:6 177:22 7:26, 14:7, 15:9, 20:1, 82:19, 82:20, 85:1, 39.23 corruptly [1] - 7:15 conspiracy [1] -43:7, 43:8, 97:18, 85:2, 85:7, 85:23, cooperate [2] - 62:6, COSTELLO[1] -164:5 99:4, 103:5, 217:20, 85:24, 85:26, 85:27, 107:12 2:11 constant [1] - 156:23 223:12 86:14, 86:18, 89:27, cooperated [6] counsel [1] - 138:21 controlled [1] constantly [1] -91:16, 91:17, 94:2, 83:2, 106:25, 107:7, count [1] - 175:12 240:5 12:12 96:23, 96:24, 96:25, 108:29, 109:10, countries [1] - 89:20 Constitution [3] controller [1] - 70:18 97:2, 97:3, 101:7, 186:22 42:23, 43:2, 43:6 country [5] - 48:29, controls [1] - 6:3 101:12 108:5 108:9 cooperating [1] -49:10, 54:12, 89:20, constitutional [1] controversial 61 -111:14, 111:15, 204:23 40:9 53:4, 53:24, 56:18, 161:16 112:1, 112:6, 112:11, cooperation [5] country's [2] constrained [2] -58:24, 59:22, 120:27 115:20, 119:15, 72:13, 73:9, 106:24, 129:26, 130:21 133:19 controversies [1] -119:18, 119:21, 109:23. 123:5 couple [6] - 38:5, 107:24 constraints [2] -121:21, 121:29, copied [1] - 32:17 42:20, 173:11, 218:26, 226:2 controversy [4] -135:2, 139:1, 141:10, copies [1] - 32:20 174:17, 207:24, constructive [1] -44:12, 60:5, 62:10, 141:13, 141:25, copy [3] - 8:10, 212:28 107:20 224:3 142:4, 142:7, 143:17, 32:13, 78:4 course [17] - 24:20, construed [1] -Convention [1] -147:14, 147:17, corporate [4] -34:9, 39:24, 46:22, 164:3 176:10 153:11, 153:26, 48:29, 50:23, 56:9, 90:11, 91:23, 105:15, consult [1] - 55:28 conversation [80] -155:26, 156:1, 156:4, 148:6 165:5, 165:9, 165:17, 18:2, 18:4, 18:15, consultancy [1] -157:25, 167:3, 167:5, corps [1] - 166:29 170:17, 193:24, 18:18, 18:19, 18:22, 48:29 167:11, 167:28, correct [224] - 5:13, 195:15, 215:8, consuming [1] -18:29, 19:29, 21:4, 171:22, 172:19, 5:17. 5:21. 5:25. 6:7. 217:29, 218:21, 227:7 22:15. 23:23. 24:14. 156:25 172:24, 173:2, 173:5, 6:17, 6:22, 7:1, 7:4, court [1] - 47:18 24:18, 25:13, 25:17, **contact** [9] - 53:6, 173:10. 173:14. 7:13, 8:4, 8:7, 8:24, Court [1] - 176:11 26:14, 26:17, 26:18, 58:22, 59:23, 101:14, 173:21, 173:26. 8:29, 9:12, 10:5, COURT [3] - 1:13, 217:4, 217:9, 219:20, 26:22, 26:24, 26:26, 174:3, 174:16, 10:19, 10:23, 10:29, 2:3. 3:5 27:3, 28:19, 29:24, 232:29, 242:6 175:10, 175:14, 29:25, 29:29, 30:3, 11:4, 11:8, 11:15, cover [2] - 222:6, $\boldsymbol{contacted}~[6]-6:14,$ 178:7, 178:19,

241:13 81:25, 126:24, 126:26 115:20, 115:21, defend [5] - 123:1, 103:11, 103:17, coverage [6] - 60:8, cup[1] - 166:5 173:11, 198:11, 180:6, 180:17, 103:21, 109:26, 60:24, 61:5, 67:27, curiosity [1] - 181:28 198:14, 198:26 181:10, 185:9 112:20, 117:21, dead [1] - 200:1 120:12, 126:12, 89:19, 148:5 curious [3] - 104:11, **defers** [1] - 56:3 covered [3] - 62:11, deadline [2] - 55:15, definite [3] - 130:22, 201:4, 201:11, 210:2, 104:15, 183:10 62:21, 189:5 Curley [1] - 102:18 227.11 201:7, 221:6 214:14, 215:12, 215:19, 215:22, covering [1] - 129:2 currency [1] - 165:8 deal [27] - 6:11, definitely [2] - 81:3, 216:1, 216:7, 216:12, cows [1] - 27:29 45:26, 51:26, 55:26, 88:29 current [3] - 55:28, 216:21, 217:4, 217:9, 55:27, 56:8, 56:16, crafted [1] - 171:13 56:2, 76:25 definitive [1] -60:2, 60:18, 68:2, 217:16, 218:19, 124.28 created [2] - 90:29, cut [3] - 75:4, 75:5, 85:5, 86:5, 90:8, definitively [2] -218:21, 227:3 198:18 107:17 creating [1] - 184:14 99:11, 99:20, 111:8, 77:15, 208:27 **deputy** [19] - 6:19, 46:22, 51:12, 52:7, 112:8, 121:23, degree [3] - 26:29, credence [1] - 88:12 D 155:23, 162:8, 186:5, 52:14, 56:7, 56:25, credibility [1] - 35:7 47:6, 140:1 201:14, 202:27, 81:14, 86:1, 90:1, delay [1] - 228:3 credible [1] - 131:3 d's [4] - 230:19, 102:23, 102:25, 214:9, 234:21, 235:1, delayed [2] - 226:22, credibly [1] - 184:1 230:24, 231:6, 234:17 110:23, 110:25, 237:22 228:14 crime [8] - 82:2, **D's** [2] - 234:17, 110:27, 111:2, 111:4, dealing [11] - 28:2, 83:29, 84:9, 166:7, deliberate [1] -234.18 120:24 33:29, 50:28, 54:23, 166:29, 172:3, 172:5, 210:20 daily [8] - 53:5, 53:7, 56:21, 58:5, 81:21, Derek [1] - 79:4 deliberately [1] -175:27 53:11, 54:9, 54:10, describe [10] -111:6, 128:17, 238:6 crimecall [4] - 61:29, 59:23, 60:17, 184:21 25:27, 26:12, 26:17, 133:18, 171:28 delivered [1] - 12:25 62:17, 62:27, 63:3 damage [5] - 98:3, dealings [4] - 53:9, 27:19, 27:21, 31:15, Crimecall [7] demeanour[3] -155:28, 156:7. 140:12, 171:24, 173:12, 173:23, 91:24, 124:17, 214:25 221:16, 221:28, 156:12, 196:21 214:24, 216:29 177.22 222:21, 223:13, demonstrably [2] damaging [2] described [3] deals [2] - 25:11, 223:14, 224:9, 224:23 242:1, 242:13 148:5, 148:13 26:26, 198:18, 211:22 53:29 crimes [1] - 176:4 demonstrate [1] -Daniel [1] - 239:4 dealt [15] - 54:15, describes [1] - 27:2 Criminal [1] - 172:28 94.18 dark [1] - 163:22 55:1, 63:1, 63:2, describing [1] criminality [2] demonstrates [1] -Darren [1] - 214:15 63:25, 68:6, 73:12, 30:11 86:13, 110:20 121:16 **DARREN**[1] - 3:8 73:28, 74:5, 82:6, description [1] critical [1] - 30:29 demur [1] - 177:24 Data [3] - 12:2, 119:5, 119:7, 122:2, 155:5 criticising [1] - 29:21 denied [1] - 22:7 12:15, 57:24 134:2, 231:5 deserves [1] denies [1] - 186:3 criticism [2] data [17] - 10:12, Deasy [1] - 46:22 198:29 110:10, 125:29 deny [4] - 135:28, 12:9, 12:13, 14:1, **Deasy's** [1] - 96:11 desires [1] - 47:23 136:2, 185:27, 190:10 cropped [1] - 168:18 70:13, 70:17, 70:18, debated [1] - 47:14 desk [2] - 208:2, cross [2] - 146:21, denying [1] - 22:13 71:18, 75:22, 75:28, Debbie [2] - 236:19, 208:5 209:19 departed [1] - 227:2 97:19, 99:5, 99:7, 237:11 desks [1] - 166:29 CROSS [8] - 4:6, Department [15] -113:17, 176:4, decades [1] - 174:2 despite [2] - 131:3, 90:7. 207:24. 207:25. 4.13 4.14 4.15 24.2 217:21, 228:23 131:26 December [3] -208:4, 208:7, 208:8, 138:17, 214:12, date [7] - 67:28, 60:29, 178:21, 221:26 destroy [4] - 182:16, 221:12 208:11, 208:18, 68:1, 83:5, 93:5, December/January 182:17, 182:20, **CROSS-EXAMINED** 208:23, 209:18, 124:6, 198:9, 212:25 [1] - 179:23 202:16 210:5, 218:24, [8] - 4:6, 4:13, 4:14, dated [2] - 111:18, decide [1] - 211:18 destroyed [1] -4:15, 24:2, 138:17, 219:22, 220:3, 220:21 166:12 decided [4] - 8:1, 191:12 214:12, 221:12 department [1] daughter [1] - 79:9 104:16, 108:14, destroying[1] cross-purposes [1] -126:4 Dave [2] - 17:12, 123:29 242:26 depended [1] - 19:12 146:21 52:7 detail [22] - 10:11, decides [1] - 43:24 dependent[1] crossed [2] - 40:3, David [10] - 50:10, deciding [1] - 118:1 24:27, 33:19, 33:29, 209:20 19:25 50:11, 52:26, 138:22, 79:26, 80:10, 80:13, decision [12] - 43:22, crystal [1] - 185:20 depth [1] - 47:13 164:12, 182:24, 44:3, 44:4, 44:24, 99:16, 140:9, 145:14, crystal-clear [1] -Deputy [51] - 17:10, 209:7, 238:3, 240:18, 146:20, 146:29, 45:5, 45:6, 45:8, 185:20 33:17, 49:19, 59:8, 240.19 149:21, 155:24, 102:24, 104:16, 65:3, 65:20, 68:11, cuff [1] - 154:3 **DAVID**[1] - 3:19 167:15, 176:18, 176:14, 229:20 68:20, 85:28, 87:9, Culhane [1] - 90:4 **DAY**[1] - 1:18 176:19, 178:29, deduced [1] - 153:23 92:1, 92:5, 92:21, **CULLEN** [1] - 3:12 day-to-day [4] -182:28, 183:16, deemed [2] - 11:10, 95:17, 96:6, 97:1, cultural [1] - 141:24 50:27, 51:27, 53:29, 204:18, 216:20 159:23 97:8, 97:9, 98:5, culture [7] - 58:2, 54:23 detailed [1] - 167:14 deeply [1] - 17:21 98:28, 101:5, 101:9, 58:26, 59:6, 139:9, days [11] - 33:2, details [2] - 30:1, defamation" [1] -101:19, 101:20, 144:4, 236:3, 236:4 33:25, 33:26, 33:27, 76:11 104:27 102:3, 102:28, Cunningham [3] -

detective [2] - 65:14, 102:12 determination[1] -229:20 determine 131 -23:14, 180:20, 181:1 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diary [1] - 212:26 differ [1] - 59:8 difference [3] - 27:1, 121:11, 164:25 differences [4] -24:16, 24:22, 25:19, 63:4 different [30] - 13:17, 13:18, 32:1, 41:1, 50:12, 55:5, 57:11, 58:3, 81:13, 82:9, 83:25, 91:18, 107:25, 109:19, 118:20, 135:20, 139:7, 154:16, 178:27, 184:23, 190:19, 199:7, 203:7, 207:11, 207:17, 219:2, 220:6, 235:14, 242:28, 242:29 difficult [10] - 73:24, 75:14, 132:16, 154:19, 156:25, 188:17, 188:18, 208:28, 218:15, 225:23 difficulties [1] -144:14 difficulty [3] - 58:29, 101:21, 212:11 digested [1] - 149:10 **DIGNAM** [10] - 2:15, 4:6, 24:2, 24:3, 28:4, 28:17, 33:16, 33:21, 37:3, 37:11 **Dignam** [4] - 24:4, 33:9, 36:23, 41:12 dint [1] - 226:15 direct [5] - 26:13, 51:8, 125:8, 140:29, 217:20 directed [7] - 42:4, 67:6, 82:1, 152:11, 185:17, 190:3, 207:21 direction [14] - 6:18, 75:22, 86:4, 86:7, 125:5, 150:21, 151:5, 154:28, 185:29, 201:29, 204:13, 205:9, 211:24, 239:13 directions 151 -81:13, 84:5, 128:19, 132:2, 154:26

DIRECTLY [4] - 4:5, 4:12, 5:8, 48:15 directly [10] - 10:15, 12:22, 28:27, 51:19, 60:13, 136:25, 137:8, 141:15, 161:9, 215:13 director [17] - 6:19, 48:21, 50:3, 51:3, 96:26. 119:2. 119:3. 119:5, 139:19, 142:2, 142:12, 151:22, 160:17, 176:2, 181:28, 183:2, 235:16 Director [6] - 42:3, 42:14, 63:12, 146:14, 154:26, 185:29 disagree [2] - 79:15, 157:5 disagreeing [1] -226:4 disagreement [3] -34:4, 38:7, 62:10 disagreements [1] -24:16 disappearance [2] -21:22, 31:17 disappointment [1] -160.23 disbursements [1] -43.7 discharge [1] -143:15 disciplinary [1] -38:16 disclosed [1] - 10:21 disclosure [7] -75:22, 75:28, 203:1, 203:3, 203:9, 203:23, 204:15 disclosures [2] -133:24, 133:28 DISCLOSURES [2] -1:3, 1:4 Disclosures [2] -96:15, 204:6 discourse [1] - 198:3 discretion [2] - 20:3, 20:16 discuss [25] - 6:15, 28:19, 28:22, 28:29, 29:6, 53:1, 80:12, 80:13, 92:21, 93:3, 95:1, 97:10, 98:28, 104:19, 115:5. 115:10, 150:29, 152:4, 161:1, 161:4,

161:7, 161:8, 162:14,

181:16, 183:17

discussed [48] -

28:28, 29:7, 63:29,

70:19, 72:25, 79:25, 80:10, 80:24, 81:5, 81:6, 81:9, 83:22, 87:12, 87:14, 89:11, 90:18, 93:9, 93:19, 93:22, 95:3, 103:15, 103:26, 103:29, 106:19, 119:26, 123:24, 132:20, 145:15, 146:20, 147:2, 149:22, 149:23, 152:2, 152:12, 152:13, 152:14, 152:22, 153:1, 153:2, 159:1, 160:15, 179:26, 180:3, 181:18, 214:19, 240:8, 240:24 discussing [2] -27:15, 170:17 discussion [32] -29:21, 73:7, 82:17, 97:22, 101:16, 103:18, 103:19, 103:24, 103:28, 149:25, 150:5, 150:7, 150:25, 150:27, 151:7, 151:18, 152:20, 152:21, 153:7, 153:12, 153:15, 154:6, 158:24, 159:23, 163:10, 163:21, 183:23. 189:27. 217:14, 224:21, 226:2, 229:19 discussions [14] -151:28, 163:13, 163:21, 164:20, 167:12, 167:16, 167:22, 170:11, 170:12, 174:29, 175:2, 179:24, 183:12, 229:29 disgusting [23] -90:9, 91:2, 92:26, 93:1, 93:11, 93:13, 93:18, 93:26, 94:16, 104:14, 108:21, 112:9, 112:26, 113:5, 115:23 152:6 166:26, 197:20, 197:28, 198:13, 199:14, 199:28, 214:29 disgusting" [1] -114:29 disillusioned [1] -185.18

242:25 dismissed [1] -148:24 dismissive [2] -59:3, 239:18 disparaging [1] -199:16 dispose [2] - 12:6, 12:11 dispute [6] - 32:22, 32:27, 127:10, 127:16, 174:28, 216:23 disputed~[2]-96:13,228:21 disputing [2] - 216:7, disseminated [1] -203:19 dissuade [1] -217:23 distinct [1] - 27:15 distinction [5] -156:13, 167:29, 168:5, 174:8, 198:6 distinctly [1] - 27:8 distinguished [1] -112:26 distributed [3] -111:20, 114:19, 114:20 distribution [2] -173:3, 173:15 district [2] - 15:4, 31:17 districts [1] - 10:11 divide [1] - 175:13 division [1] - 178:26 divisions [1] - 52:17 divulge [1] - 176:22 **DOCK** [1] - 3:17 dock [2] - 16:29, 17:2 docs [1] - 72:2 document [6] - 8:12, 120:5, 144:10, 193:4, 201:24, 230:7 documented [1] -14:12 domain [13] - 90:27, 105:27, 113:11, 113:18, 118:10, 133:21, 133:22, 133:27, 150:8, 151:1, 176:3, 217:22 **DONAL**[1] - 2:16 done [21] - 40:16, 44:20, 55:13, 62:28, 82:14, 90:16, 90:17, 95:15, 113:7, 115:9,

126:17, 130:7, 134:17, 136:12, 136:27, 147:27, 155:3, 194:19. 194:27, 203:22, 211:24 Donegal [1] - 45:7 door [1] - 52:28 dossier [2] - 13:4, doubt [5] - 95:16, 144:19, 167:9, 200:26, 232:27 down [38] - 27:4, 27:5, 38:24, 39:9, 45:19, 59:27, 62:4, 67:14, 73:21, 74:1, 74:7, 75:26, 95:3, 95:24, 107:28, 117:12, 123:10, 129:1, 140:14, 145:23, 172:21, 173:18, 179:21, 183:17, 183:20, 184:9, 196:16, 196:19, 198:16, 206:7, 208:4, 217:27, 221:23, 224:19, 225:5, 226:16, 228:3, 235:12 downgrade [1] -131:23 downloaded [1] -203:18 **DPP** [13] - 82:1, 83:29, 84:5, 126:24, 126:27, 127:5, 128:2, 128:19, 145:12, 169:10, 170:4, 170:25, 190:2 **DPP's** [1] - 132:2 draft [17] - 10:20, 10:27, 11:2, 11:13, 60:21, 66:19, 68:18, 84:17, 88:25, 108:2, 111:16, 114:11, 114:14, 115:3, 218:1, 218:5, 229:4 drafted [10] - 68:8, 68:10, 68:14, 68:23, 84:19, 114:5, 166:11, 183:29, 198:12, 230:1 drafting [2] - 10:12, 10.16 drafts [1] - 230:1 dragging [1] - 83:17 draw [3] - 185:15, 190:1, 195:21 drawing [2] - 162:28, 167:29

disinforming [1] -

drawn [2] - 20:10, 38:3 drift [1] - 182:18 driven [7] - 161:2, 162:7, 162:15, 190:5, 194:26, 208:21 drivers [1] - 7:17 driving [5] - 7:19, 153:8, 158:25, 160:28, 185:19 drugs [2] - 143:29, 144:2 **Dublin** [4] - 98:6, 225:6, 226:16, 228:15 **DUBLIN** [11] - 1:17, 2:12. 2:20. 2:25. 2:30. 3:3, 3:7, 3:10, 3:14, 3:18, 3:21 due [4] - 113:18, 165:5, 165:9, 165:16 Dundalk [9] - 96:21, 101:27, 102:2, 214:19, 216:27, 220:15, 224:26, 226:21, 228:15 during [18] - 10:28, 19:2, 21:1, 26:3, 33:17, 62:2, 68:6, 90:11, 142:22, 151:28, 165:8, 213:2, 215:8, 217:29, 218:21, 227:7, 230:21, 230:22 dust [2] - 196:16, 196:19 dusted [1] - 227:17 duty [1] - 127:2 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:5 **Dáil** [6] - 8:9, 10:18, 14:15, 16:8, 89:26, 220:8

Ε

ear [1] - 39:8 early [5] - 61:15, 68:11, 129:14, 178:22, 206:6 ears [1] - 234:23 eat [1] - 239:3 Eavan [2] - 236:19, 237:11 echelons [1] - 160:2 echos [1] - 169:28 economic [4] -43:22, 44:22, 44:23, 45:11 edited [1] - 241:17

editing [1] - 241:16

editor [1] - 48:27 effect [11] - 30:10, 34:11, 35:21, 36:26, 36:29, 170:26, 182:24, 187:3, 219:4, 234:20, 237:21 effective [2] - 55:9, 211:11 effectively [22] -13:10, 19:12, 20:12, 40:27, 50:18, 50:22, 50:23, 51:6, 51:8, 58:19, 62:9, 83:2, 86:21, 86:23, 88:10, 142:16, 142:26, 196:22, 230:28, 233:9, 241:2, 243:6 efficient [3] - 55:9. 55:21, 140:19 eh.. [1] - 206:20 eight [1] - 198:11 Eireann [2] - 43:9, 49:3 either [21] - 26:23, 33:8, 59:5, 66:5, 70:7, 88:2, 89:14, 107:28, 112:10, 113:15, 128:14, 130:7, 133:23, 153:23, 192:10, 196:9, 204:3, 211:17, 220:7, 229:20, 236:24 elaborate [1] - 41:27 elderly [1] - 173:7 elect [1] - 196:12 element [3] - 109:23, 174:27, 205:7 **eleven** [1] - 108:13 **ELIZABETH**[1] - 2:7 em [11] - 125:20, 136:2, 136:12, 139:16, 151:29, 157:10, 183:25, 186:18, 201:7, 205:3, 206:14 em.. [3] - 171:21, 211:5, 212:16 email [11] - 94:7,

107:29, 108:7,

122:18, 228:18

109:26, 110:7, 111:7,

121:4, 121:22, 122:4,

emails [1] - 157:6

emanated [1] -

emanates [1] -

embargo [1] - 226:29

embarrassing [2] -

160.20

114:22

212:5, 212:7

embittered [5] -161:3, 162:8, 181:14, 185:18, 190:4 emerging [2] -112:13, 156:24 EMMA[1] - 2:18 emotion [6] - 189:16, 200:4, 239:23, 239:25, 239:26, 240:1 emotional [1] -116:19 emotions [3] - 238:9, 238:15, 240:10 emotive [1] - 115:24 emphasis [2] -77:25 151:3 emphasise [1] -143:8 employee [1] -101:21 employment [2] -49:7, 207:22 empty [2] - 182:4, 182:5 en [1] - 220:14 enable [1] - 233:8 encourage [1] - 62:6 encouraged [1] -187:9 end [14] - 10:13, 11:26, 19:29, 38:19, 52:5, 95:27, 97:7, 170:26, 179:22, 197:15, 197:19, 202:7, 214:26, 223:3 endorse [1] - 157:1 ends [1] - 239:3 engage [2] - 18:4, 148:18 engaged [4] - 21:8, 35:16, 164:28, 189:22 engagement [4] -39:20, 40:21, 40:24, 96:21 engaging [2] - 40:22, 121:13 enhance [2] - 50:7, 181:12 enhancements [1] -110:12 enjoy [1] - 141:27 enjoyed [4] - 58:13, 141:7, 141:29, 177:19 enlarge [1] - 174:14 enlighten [2] -158:17, 158:22 **Ennis** [1] - 44:10 ensued [1] - 217:15 ensure [3] - 47:9,

enter [1] - 163:11 entered [1] - 32:7 entering [1] - 90:26 entirely [10] - 23:8, 29:24, 29:25, 35:29, 37:16, 121:2, 121:6, 179:27, 180:2, 181:23 entirety [1] - 111:22 entitled [6] - 8:18, 45:7, 138:2, 203:20, 219:12. 219:14 entrant [1] - 211:6 entries [1] - 203:11 environment[2] -206:13. 240:4 **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:9 equally [1] - 145:3 equivalent [1] -142:5 equivocal [2] -155:16, 168:23 escalate [1] - 196:26 escalated [1] -196:27 essence [1] - 31:6 essentially [1] -150.21 establish [3] - 123:4, 142:23, 143:2 established [10] -28:23, 28:28, 29:1, 51:7, 55:8, 142:19, 184:9, 184:10, 211:21, 211:23 ESTABLISHED[1] estimate [1] - 221:9 et [2] - 153:12, 155:21 etcetera [2] - 31:18, 239:22 ethical [2] - 202:25, 236.7 euro [1] - 144:2 European [3] -47:19, 176:10, 176:11 evening [3] - 98:1, 217:1, 222:29 event [19] - 13:23, 97:26, 97:29, 98:2, 104:4, 111:11, 112:8, 116:12, 140:20, 153:16, 165:7, 170:1, 173:6, 189:25, 192:5, 192:26, 202:11, 220:8. 241:25

events [11] - 14:8,

26:8. 97:26. 106:3.

146:24, 153:25,

153:26, 177:2,

199:25, 216:26, 237:21 eventualities [1] -150:28 eventually [1] -68:21 evidence [56] - 9:21, 13:5, 21:25, 24:12, 25:2. 25:21. 31:25. 32:4, 33:18, 40:1, 45:29, 66:12, 82:12, 84:6, 84:8, 86:13, 86:15, 89:29, 95:17, 96:11, 104:29, 105:5, 106:14, 109:3, 112:13, 115:22, 132:17, 142:8, 148:9, 150:20, 154:24, 184:14, 187:7, 216:2, 216:8, 216:11, 216:23, 216:24, 217:24, 217:29, 218:19, 218:21, 221:3, 225:1, 225:12, 232:2, 233:13, 234:15, 234:16, 234:17, 234:18, 234:20, 238:19 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:9 evidential [3] -15:10, 15:11, 38:16 exact [6] - 108:27, 153:14, 163:5, 163:17, 187:16, 214:1 exactly [11] - 35:29, 48:5, 76:15, 101:29, 128:10, 136:7, 149:24, 151:29, 166:8, 204:10, 220:23 examination [21] -8:2, 8:8, 8:25, 9:2, 9:29, 10:3, 10:8, 10:9, 10:24, 10:28, 12:11, 14:21, 14:26, 19:2, 43:17, 45:9, 45:24, 46:23, 47:12, 47:13, 113:29 examinations [2] -6:8. 43:13 examine [7] - 10:11, 14:4, 16:13, 44:21, 45:5, 46:10, 81:16 **examined** [8] - 6:3, 9.21 13.26 13.27 16:8, 46:8, 72:2, 134:1 EXAMINED [16] -4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 4:12, 4:13, 4:14, 4:15, 4:16,

5:9, 24:2, 41:11,

162:21, 225:28

139:29, 140:15, 48:16, 138:17, 239:26, 239:29 feature [2] - 140:13, filtered [1] - 181:24 214:12, 221:12, explosions [1] -142:13, 150:24, 206:12 final [10] - 38:5, 236:16 240:10 152:1, 156:8, 160:29, features [1] - 173:22 49:16, 62:25, 110:9, 161:1, 161:25, 163:4, examining [1] - 46:1 **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:6, expressed [4] -111:13, 111:16, 83:12, 92:26, 92:27. example [5] - 44:9, 171:18, 178:23, 114:19, 140:26, 1:10 44:13, 174:23, 175:7, 208:24, 214:23 213:26 February [4] - 9:26, 205:25, 213:14 182:3 expression [2] fairly [9] - 25:3, finalised [2] -10:4, 108:4, 122:18 52:24, 115:23, except [1] - 42:26 225:2, 238:14 feedback [1] - 68:19 213:16, 230:2 143:25, 183:27, finally [3] - 41:2, exceptional [1] extend [1] - 45:6 feet [1] - 215:11 186:26, 214:21, 136:16 extension [1] - 167:9 218:18. 236:2 FELIX [1] - 3:1 exceptions [2] extent [1] - 124:13 227:18, 235:1 finance [2] - 46:12, fella [1] - 235:24 $\textbf{fairness} \ [3] - 35{:}25,$ 176:12, 176:20 external [1] - 59:14 felt [53] - 29:14, 241:19 196:11, 224:24 exchanged [1] financial [4] - 20:27, extract [1] - 146:15 29:17, 32:10, 55:12, fairytale [1] - 238:23 237:6 extracted [3] - 7:8, 58:25, 62:16, 67:20, 21:10, 43:12, 241:28 fall [1] - 111:1 findings [2] - 37:23, exchanges [1] -10:7, 10:10 72:16, 90:19, 90:24, falling [1] - 151:3 39:23 214:21 90:27, 90:28, 91:11, **extreme** [1] - 157:3 false [4] - 142:11, fine [10] - 6:6, 25:15, excuse [5] - 107:15, 91:24, 93:16, 93:17, extremely [1] -118:13, 155:16, 181:9, 242:9, 243:14 93:20, 94:16, 94:17, 33:20, 38:25, 55:13, 176:13 225:29, 226:13 familiar [11] - 17:23, 83:24, 200:25, 209:9, 94:25, 97:21, 105:25, eye [3] - 30:27, 31:6, 69:9, 70:14, 70:15, executed [1] -107:18, 109:10, 209:13, 227:29 31:9 70:16, 105:5, 105:10, 172:28 109:28, 109:29, finish [6] - 137:7, eyes [1] - 39:9 Executive [1] - 6:28 105:12, 194:14, 110:3, 115:15, 147:24, 180:1, 201:2, 204:7, 205:4 116:22, 116:26, 213:12, 214:10 executives [2] -F familiarisation [1] finished [3] - 21:5, 116:28, 121:16, 63:12, 224:7 139.12 124:18, 125:6, 114:3. 215:16 exercise [7] - 20:3, fabulous [1] - 219:3 46:18, 173:4, 176:1, familiarise [1] - 60:7 125:27, 139:4, Finucane [2] - 105:2, face [3] - 88:8, 176:20, 191:29, familiarising [3] -139:12, 139:18, 105:18 118:29, 175:4 139:23, 140:9, 61:8, 166:4, 168:16 229:26 fire [2] - 238:24, facing [3] - 56:19, 142:25, 143:5, 164:8, family [5] - 154:27, 239.2 exercised [1] -60:6, 179:13 164:25, 194:26, 162:20, 231:26, 116:22 firmly [1] - 143:2 fact [41] - 14:2, 233:2, 236:18 196:15, 202:19, firms [1] - 48:29 exercises [1] -14:20, 21:24, 25:16, 205:8, 205:16, 213:6, 173:15 famous [1] - 216:16 **FIRST** [1] - 3:6 27:13, 28:7, 30:8, 215:5, 232:16, 243:11 **far** [49] - 18:29, 55:7, first [53] - 5:4, 12:8, exhausted [1] -32:25, 33:23, 34:20, fenced [1] - 74:24 57:23, 59:2, 69:13, 233:24 22:9, 22:23, 26:12, 35:21, 37:20, 40:1, 72:22, 82:17, 88:10, Fergus [1] - 83:5 33:4, 33:8, 41:14, existed [2] - 14:3, 76:28, 82:12, 85:19, 90:6, 101:8, 103:26, FERRY [1] - 2:28 49:26, 49:27, 62:16, 236:4 109:9, 115:18, 106:21, 107:8, feuds [2] - 175:9, existence [1] - 162:6 67:1, 69:13, 70:5, 121:18, 125:27, 109:17, 111:3, 175:12 expand [1] - 58:16 76:5, 76:12, 77:21, 130:25, 137:29, 112:22, 117:7, few [11] - 21:7, 33:1, 77:22, 78:21, 79:19, expect [13] - 31:3, 142:21, 144:22, 126:12, 126:13, 59:29, 65:7, 138:11, 79:28, 90:8, 106:13, 52:24, 65:10, 67:5, 146:12, 160:21, 127:4, 128:6, 131:29, 149:5, 152:24, 68:4, 111:7, 128:8, 106:14, 125:24, 161:2, 162:7, 164:12, 149:27, 171:10, 132:3, 146:19, 147:1, 209:10, 215:11, 141:26, 148:11, 178:3, 186:27, 187:7, 147:27, 148:15, 236:14, 237:17 171:17, 191:8, 157:1, 157:14, 202:1, 202:11, 149:14, 149:17, field [3] - 81:11, 157:24, 157:28, 191:13, 238:13 217:17, 221:25, 149:21, 152:6, 159:1, 81:20, 83:16 161:28, 172:16, expected [1] - 117:1 222:26, 224:10, 165:6, 165:10, fieldwork [1] - 10:3 173:11, 173:29, explain [2] - 50:20, 224:15, 224:16, 229:7 167:23, 170:25, figure [2] - 88:3, 177:29, 180:21, 90.15 factor [1] - 181:15 179:11, 189:5, 166:8 181:25, 182:13, explained [3] facts [4] - 171:22, 195:10, 197:22, figured [2] - 86:4, 186:23, 186:27, 198:12, 203:27, 182:16, 182:17, 201:3, 215:27, 186:28, 187:9, 189:4, 86:19 203:28 221:23 223:15, 223:21, file [15] - 6:20, 6:27, 205:28, 214:5, explaining [3] - $\textbf{Factual} \ [2] \textbf{ - 223:9},$ 223:24, 225:8, 229:7, 214:17, 214:21, 174:13, 197:7, 199:14 7:6, 7:14, 9:5, 9:9, 223:16 9:17, 10:10, 12:27. 237:28, 240:29 222:1, 235:11, explains [1] - 203:10 factual [1] - 237:23 farm [1] - 20:14 237:18, 242:3 13:9, 39:19, 80:29, explanation [2] failing [1] - 103:13 fashion [1] - 12:12 128:2, 145:12, 146:14 firstly [4] - 37:15, 199:3. 199:17 fair [26] - 28:22, fatal [1] - 172:21 39:1, 181:3, 237:24 files [4] - 9:20, 12:17, explicit [1] - 205:9 52:22, 56:20, 59:11, FCPN [9] - 85:20, fishing [1] - 189:11 29:16, 203:13 explore [3] - 24:11, 80:28, 81:5, 82:29, 94:26, 94:29, 120:26, fit [1] - 88:14 filled [1] - 138:23 24:21, 34:3 109:2, 112:16, 167:20, 168:18, filling [1] - 139:20 fitting [1] - 62:26 explosion [4] -113:18, 117:2, 132:3, 179:2, 180:5, 180:8 filming [1] - 224:6 FITZGERALD[2] -239:23, 239:25,

207:26, 208:17, 2:17, 3:16 126:22, 131:25, 240:5 111:8 garda [6] - 7:4, 7:16, five [10] - 26:19, football [1] - 161:15 four [14] - 79:4, 31:16, 164:12, 195:8, 208:20, 211:13, 49:3, 91:11, 120:2, **FOR** [13] - 1:8, 2:6, 115:20, 115:21, 203:18 214:2, 218:10, Garda [163] - 5:20, 222:19, 223:11, 138:9, 138:13, 197:8, 2:9, 2:14, 2:22, 2:27, 150:16, 164:27, 227:28, 228:6 3:1, 3:4, 3:8, 3:12, 198:11, 198:14, 6.4 6.10 7.3 7.8 224:1, 224:13, 198:26, 201:2, 227:6, 225:20, 226:21, five-year [1] - 120:2 3:15, 3:19, 100:2 7:27, 8:6, 10:28, 11:2, fixed [23] - 6:4, 6:16, force [5] - 108:19, 227:11, 227:14, 11:13, 11:16, 11:21, 232:13, 233:9, 227:17, 228:4 234:13, 234:22, 7:9, 8:2, 14:17, 14:22, 135:23, 144:4, 12:18, 12:23, 12:25, 235:5, 239:23, 241:6 144:13, 191:12 Fr[1] - 33:14 12:28, 14:10, 14:17, 20:4. 20:8. 24:28. 32:3, 46:1, 60:3, frankly [1] - 111:10 14:21, 15:4, 15:9, Gardaí [3] - 11:18, fore [2] - 151:2, 66:20, 67:2, 68:3, 156:20 free [1] - 79:14 16:13, 16:15, 16:26, 46:18, 122:15 77:26, 80:14, 82:24, forged [1] - 163:14 freelance [1] -17:8, 17:25, 17:26, gardaí [1] - 208:16 18:10, 19:1, 20:2, 94:12, 94:23, 98:16, forget [1] - 190:19 241:18 geared [1] - 45:26 99:11, 111:12 20:5, 20:18, 20:21, General [11] - 5:11, forgive [2] - 164:1, frequently [2] - 26:6, 23:8, 24:4, 26:23, flag [1] - 110:17 40:19, 43:11, 45:24, 26.7 182:20 flak [1] - 210:4 27:22, 28:8, 32:16, 47:8, 47:17, 63:12, form [8] - 9:21, fresh [1] - 107:29 39:3, 39:17, 40:23, float [1] - 160:7 16:23, 40:13, 128:29, 218:24, 219:21, 220:2 Friday [7] - 53:19, 46:2, 48:17, 49:5, general [27] - 29:2, floated [2] - 45:8, 129:3, 142:8, 154:11, 54:25, 59:19, 59:20, 49:6, 51:19, 52:12, 31:7, 43:14, 52:11, 192.22 237:2 59:26, 93:22, 141:11 57:23, 58:5, 59:14, 57:24, 58:25, 59:11, floating [1] - 221:2 FRIDAY [2] - 1:18, formal [11] - 11:5, 62:3, 63:15, 65:16, 80:1, 87:10, 87:12, FLOOR [1] - 3:6 53:27, 55:6, 60:14, 67:8, 84:2, 87:1, flourished [1] -140:28, 179:22, fridge [1] - 200:1 87:15, 87:16, 89:16, 87:10, 87:17, 88:7, 89:19, 125:2, 125:6, friendship [1] -140:3 184:24, 240:9, 89:13, 91:5, 94:14, 126:19, 159:2, 240:10, 240:25 flow [2] - 35:11, 128:11 94:15, 103:5, 105:23, formally [1] - 16:8 177:23, 177:24, 143.18 front [8] - 75:16, 109:29, 113:16, 177:25, 178:2, flowed [2] - 38:28 format [3] - 62:27, 79:17, 118:25, 113:24, 116:29, 180:13, 181:5, flows [2] - 35:5, 224:2, 224:25 157:10, 166:27, 118:27, 119:1, 216:19, 220:4 35:14 formed [1] - 141:21 172:16, 194:29, 125:27, 125:29, General's [1] - 7:24 former [19] - 24:5, 215:13 fly [1] - 74:26 126:21, 128:5, 129:4, generally [21] -24:15, 25:18, 25:22, frustrate [1] - 46:20 focus [14] - 8:29, 131:12, 134:9, 45:25, 55:27, 56:21, 26:9, 26:24, 27:2, frustrated [4] -10:1, 14:4, 14:5, 25:1, 134:15, 135:4, 135:9, 62:12, 62:20, 63:10, 95:27, 96:1, 133:17, 32:9, 34:2, 35:29, 214:25, 214:28, 135:11, 135:27, 64:10, 88:7, 96:26, 136:4, 151:21, 185:8, 39:28, 47:17, 69:8, 240:5, 240:8 136:8. 136:18. 137:1. 107:27, 114:11, 113:16, 115:5, 185:11, 215:29, frustrating [2] -137:8, 138:27, 134:9, 140:7, 144:8, 116:19, 119:10, 217:15 240:26, 240:27 139:14, 140:29, 148:28, 159:7, 162:4, 218:24, 236:29 fulfils [1] - 45:22 focused [4] - 13:29, 147:11, 147:12, 167:23, 171:2, 226:1, 14:2, 125:26, 217:17 forms [2] - 58:25, full [3] - 144:28, 147:15, 148:6, 226:24 focusing [1] - 8:25 154:14 177:27, 201:18 148:28, 150:24, generally-held [1] formula [1] - 22:19 follow [11] - 147:19, fully [9] - 84:4, 84:7, 153:6, 154:18, 159.7 formulate [2] -147:23, 154:21, 84:12, 119:4, 120:3, 154:20, 155:5, generated [2] -155:2, 163:15, 195:5, 179:22, 220:24 143:1, 144:28, 155:28. 160:4. 152:17, 187:4 formulating [1] -203:15, 203:16, 156:13, 205:4 160:17, 160:27, generates [1] -203:25, 203:26, 204:4 151:23 function [2] - 139:25, 161:23, 162:8, 241:27 $\ \ \, \mbox{forth}\, {\tt [3]} - 62.7,$ **followed** [4] - 61:5, 185:6 163:10, 164:23, generating [1] -173:1, 201:26 121:28 122:3 234:26 functions [2] -164:24, 164:29, 159:22 FOLLOWING [1] forthcoming [1] -143:14, 180:11 166:7, 172:14, generic [1] - 169:24 144:13 funds [1] - 43:8 172:17, 172:23, generically [1] following [15] - 1:26, forum [2] - 89:12, funnily [1] - 77:22 172:25, 172:27, 180:9 15:1, 22:25, 23:3, 117:10 fuss [1] - 127:1 173:24, 173:28, genuine [1] - 242:24 31:13, 49:4, 62:24, forward [23] - 18:12, future [2] - 224:25, 174:27, 175:7, genuinely [3] -97:6, 105:2, 120:1, 22:27, 29:4, 62:22, 233:16 175:28, 179:7, 163:9, 163:11, 243:11 165:24, 171:13, 76:24, 83:8, 83:10, **FÍONÁN** [1] - 3:12 182:19, 183:5, **GERAGHTY**[1] - 3:2 214:20, 216:26, 85:14, 85:18, 86:12, 185:13, 188:29, 233:10 110:2, 111:26, 118:5, GERALD[1] - 3:19 G 193:6, 193:10, 194:7, follows [1] - 177:1 GERARD [1] - 2:22 133:26, 159:3, 199:9, 202:15, 167:28, 179:2, Gerry [1] - 102:18 FOLLOWS [6] - 5:1, 203:14, 203:17, gain [2] - 48:4, 176:1 Gilligan [1] - 138:29 5:9, 101:1, 137:24, 179:17, 180:26, 203:21, 204:21, gained [1] - 177:6 189:3, 197:4, 230:2, gist [1] - 231:9 236:16, 237:16 204:23, 204:25, 230:10 game [1] - 241:9 given [28] - 24:11, foot [7] - 107:19, 204:28, 205:1, 205:9, 126:8, 126:9, 126:10, forwarded [1] gangland [1] - 175:9 24:12, 25:28, 46:28, 205:10, 206:14,

64:4, 70:5, 76:15, 112:3 57:28 26:5, 26:7 Н 95:17, 97:25, 115:13, Healy's [1] - 86:2 high [8] - 54:3, 60:1, Houses [1] - 42:27 123:15, 123:17, hear [9] - 95:20, 80:5, 84:2, 88:5, **HQ** [5] - 87:10, half [2] - 99:29, 134:7, 144:20, 167:6, 96:3, 105:21, 106:13, 88:15, 104:12, 164:24 87:17, 147:11, 228.5 173:17, 176:25, 172:21, 236:24, high-level [2] - 84:2, 148:28, 160:4 HALIDAY[1] - 2:11 176:26, 182:1, 237:1, 237:2, 238:16 88:15 huge [4] - 128:11, HANAHOE[1] - 2:28 201:24, 202:28, heard [28] - 6:28, high-profile [2] -166:6, 211:25, 226:1 hand [5] - 25:7, 216:1, 218:25, 15:6, 15:21, 15:25, 60:1, 88:5 Human [2] - 176:11, 220:17, 224:29, 81:14, 195:11, 209:4, higher [1] - 142:6 36:7, 37:4, 37:7, 37:9, 176:12 226:22, 238:3 209:6 37:19, 41:28, 54:4, highlight [2] **human** [1] - 238:12 handcuff [1] - 136:28 glance [1] - 92:15 63:19, 96:18, 106:14, 150:14, 153:7 hundred [3] - 45:20, handed [6] - 12:23, glove [1] - 195:12 132:16, 132:17, highlighting [2] -102:5, 216:9 12:28, 13:11, 32:26, God [1] - 234:3 147:29, 148:7, 179:15, 194:7 33:17, 69:28 148:27, 154:7, goodwill [1] - 20:6 **highly** [8] - 9:18, handled [3] - 94:26, 174:11, 189:4, **GORDON** [1] - 2:10 23:16, 28:1, 89:15, 181:6, 190:24 216:17, 216:18, gossip [1] - 148:17 131:3, 202:19, i.e [2] - 120:19, handling [3] - 54:13, 216:20, 216:24, Governance [1] -206:14, 232:25 188:27 55:10, 156:11 232:2, 234:12 111:4 himself [3] - 52:8, idea [19] - 38:13, handover[1] hearing [6] - 73:12, $\textbf{Government}\, [1] - \\$ 109:15. 128:1 38:17, 40:13, 41:23, 212:27 210:12, 214:26, hindsight [4] -44:24 43:23, 43:25, 62:7, handwriting [1] -215:9, 215:16, 220:12 **GRA**[1] - 33:10 127:20, 128:20, 62:9. 85:26. 98:8. 69:10 gradually [1] - 94:27 **HEARING** [5] - 5:1, 218:13, 218:16 98:21. 98:27. 108:14. 100:2, 101:1, 137:23, handwritten [7] grand [1] - 200:23 historic [1] - 31:16 158:16, 189:14, 69:7, 70:25, 73:22, 243:28 **GRAND** [1] - 3:17 **hmm** [4] - 11:12, 220:19, 221:2, 76:8, 77:18, 78:19, hearings [2] - 6:11, 34:6, 117:27, 118:2 grasp [1] - 139:5 225:27, 226:6 78:28 90:11 hold [2] - 5:10, 42:22 great [2] - 189:14, identifiable [1] - 9:17 hang [1] - 23:21 heated [1] - 223:25 240:21 holder [1] - 40:9 identification [1] happy [22] - 55:18, heavily [2] - 17:22, Greater [1] - 206:5 holders [1] - 47:24 68:29, 77:8, 78:6, 142:29 green [4] - 45:9, holding [1] - 142:13 identified [3] - 9:20, 81:4, 92:11, 115:11, heed [2] - 196:12, 63:16, 63:20, 224:9 home [1] - 162:20 17:13, 177:3 116:2, 117:3, 117:7, 196:13 greeted [1] - 224:7 honest [12] - 66:6, **identifies** [1] - 12:9 118:3, 131:18, heightened [1] -69:4, 111:10, 125:20, greetings [1] - 18:20 identify [2] - 14:7, 132:13, 137:12, 115.14 GRIFFIN [1] - 2:18 151:16, 159:8, 27:26 189:1, 213:10, held [14] - 16:25, 174:12, 174:23, grist [1] - 239:28 identifying [1] -213:25, 213:26, 47:28, 98:23, 103:14, 180:3, 210:7, 216:6, groundless [6] -162:25 213:27, 223:2, 233:9, 111:5, 159:7, 159:10, 239.9 88:13, 125:23, identities [1] -234:23 159:12, 162:3, 162:4, hope [7] - 59:5, 149:16, 149:20, 193:28 hard [2] - 78:28, 225:28, 226:15, 92:29, 93:26, 154:24, 169:12 171:5 identity [3] - 10:26, 194:26 227:10 206:11, 221:8, 225:21 grounds [1] - 89:23 86:10, 203:23 **HARTY**[1] - 3:4 **HELD** [1] - 1:17 hoped [1] - 76:28 group [3] - 16:26, **illegality** [1] - 9:4 HAVING [2] - 5:8, hello [1] - 201:1 horse [2] - 178:27, 17:3, 27:9 illegally [1] - 7:16 48:15 **Hello** [1] - 24:3 216:16 groups [2] - 18:17, illegitimate [1] -Hayes [6] - 63:8, help [15] - 59:10, horses [1] - 28:16 132.24 195:16 63:18, 63:24, 221:22, 60:18, 83:20, 84:3, Gráinne [1] - 223:22 hostility [2] - 109:5, image [2] - 50:23, 223:20, 224:8 87:4, 128:23, 128:26, GSOC [5] - 114:2, 109:8 148:6 head [12] - 49:3, 161:12, 164:1, hot [1] - 163:12114:3, 132:10, imagine [9] - 72:8, 65:13, 65:16, 65:26, 181:10, 189:15, hotel [3] - 98:6, 132:11, 132:12 138:27, 164:28, 76:16, 76:27, 89:11, 191:17, 192:4, 158:20, 227:26 guard [2] - 36:11, 182:27, 182:28, 177:11, 190:9, 212:14, 228:9 hour [2] - 103:23, 188:6 202:16, 223:9, 183:17, 183:22, helped [1] - 127:26 228:3 guards [15] - 49:9, 183:23 223:15, 225:5 helpful [5] - 128:28, 50:3, 50:16, 51:12, hourly [2] - 53:6, headlines [1] - 227:6 136:7, 163:18, 189:25 imagining [1] - 74:17 184:22 57:16, 62:6, 71:10, Headquarters [4] immediate [3] helping [3] - 139:7, 98:13, 126:4, 148:25, hours [3] - 91:11, 18:27, 19:9, 103:22 12:25, 52:12, 87:1, 182:6, 220:24 197:9, 209:14 150:20, 150:23, immediately [7] -129:5 helps [2] - 28:12, 151:4, 151:24, 204:2 HOUSE [3] - 2:11, 19:24, 37:27, 71:2, headquarters [4] -227:22 guidance [1] - 57:15 2:19, 2:24 233:9, 234:13, 91:19, 93:7, 93:9, Henry [2] - 6:18, 9:11 guy [1] - 220:19 house [4] - 224:14, 188:10 234:23, 239:24 hierarchical [2] -224:20, 230:19, Gwen [1] - 1:25 impact [5] - 85:19, Healy [5] - 65:24, 97:18, 103:4 **GWEN** [1] - 1:30 230:24 124:9, 129:23, 195:2, 83:5, 85:9, 85:15, hierarchy [2] - 51:10, House [3] - 16:24,

217:19 173:16, 179:6, 188:14 inclined [2] - 141:22, 73:17, 73:18, 85:17, instanced [1] - 198:8 impart [2] - 145:18, 148:26 87:13, 103:8, 159:9, informing [5] instances [5] -174:21 include [3] - 67:26, 162:26, 204:4 57:27, 130:9, 153:17, 14:11, 173:11, imparted [3] - 176:5, 230:8, 230:12 industrial [1] -180:29, 181:2, 186:14 155:11, 242:24 186:11, 201:16 included [6] - 73:28, 174:28 infringe [1] - 203:20 instructed [6] imparting [1] -85:21, 107:9, 118:28, inert [1] - 142:12 inhibit [1] - 232:22 72:11, 72:17, 185:14, 178:3, 240:3 inertia [1] - 46:19 189:29, 202:16, 173:19 initial [5] - 68:13, impinged [1] - 32:13 includes [1] - 5:18 inertly [1] - 142:10 108:1, 140:1, 140:14, 211:29 INSTRUCTED [9] implementation [1] including [3] - 7:11, inevitable [2] -142:1 110.13 153:24, 162:29 initiated [2] - 101:13, 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:28, 65:13. 177:28 implemented [1] inconsistent [2] inevitably [1] - 29:16 217.8 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12, 121:3, 121:6 infer [2] - 152:10, initiative [1] - 217:10 3:20 implicate [1] incorrect [7] - 34:21, 152:12 initiatives [1] - 94:23 instruction [8] -163:25 36:10, 36:27, 157:27, inference [3] injuries [3] - 76:11, 107:12, 107:17, 177:21, 185:26, implications [1] -205:17, 228:13, 243:5 153:24, 195:21, 157:15, 158:14 186:11, 191:18, 39:18 indeed [9] - 9:20, 234:19 innocence [1] -23:27, 26:23, 30:12, 192:2, 192:26 importance [1] inferences [1] -83.27 35:7, 36:26, 37:13, instructions [17] -20:2 162:28 input [2] - 54:20, 84:10, 203:28 123:14, 123:17, important [9] influence [1] -55:23 123:22, 123:23, 20:15, 24:27, 29:14, independence [1] -177:11 inquire [7] - 9:7, 9:8, 141:26, 165:5, 29:18, 93:18, 115:15, 47.27 43:2, 43:14, 160:19, influencing [1] -165:14, 165:15, 136:29, 140:21, Independent [2] -183:2 181:29, 204:20 177:17, 190:6, 243:17 33:12, 129:17 inform [5] - 130:6, inquired [1] - 190:28 190:28, 192:15, impression [21] independent [10] -175:1, 205:27, inquiries [4] -192:19, 200:15, 124:17, 130:23, 37:23, 45:2, 45:4, 213:18, 220:6 144:14, 185:6, 130:27, 140:1, 105:24, 105:29, 201:17, 210:8 information [64] -191:20, 192:7 instructs [2] -140:19, 141:21, 143:13, 143:20, 6:21, 6:27, 7:5, 7:22, inquiring [1] -177:26, 205:27 223:8, 236:8, 239:12 142:9, 142:11, 9:19, 10:21, 12:8, 235:23 159:29, 160:1, 171:7. **INSTRUMENT** [1] -INDEX [1] - 4:1 19:11, 22:26, 24:11, **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:3, 184:14, 187:4, indicate [8] - 7:23, 46:10, 57:24, 70:5, 187:22, 189:17, instrumental [4] -13:14, 141:26, 160:7, 71:19, 85:15, 85:18, inquiry [9] - 22:26, 129:25, 130:4, 189:23, 213:24, 200:4, 207:14, 215:5, 88:8, 90:26, 103:8, 106:24, 148:1, 148:2, 130:16, 130:19 217:10, 225:9, 219:15 105:26, 106:4, 109:3, 148:10, 149:10, 233:17, 234:5 integrity [3] - 67:17, indicated [14] - 7:2, 128:7, 128:16, 191:22, 192:27, 10:17, 10:21, 20:15. 88:27, 89:1 improper [6] - 14:16, 129:16, 132:2, 192:29 14:22, 39:4, 39:6, 134:18, 136:21, intend [1] - 44:8 25:21, 42:2, 144:11, insisted [1] - 224:14 39:11, 230:9 intended [1] - 187:14 201:28, 224:5, 225:8, 136:26, 137:9, insisting [1] - 222:13 $\textbf{improved} \ [2] - 7:25,$ 144:20, 144:23, intention [7] - 37:27, 228:26, 230:25, insofar [13] - 57:16, 7:26 232:15, 235:21 144:24, 145:5, 136:12, 150:29, 59:8, 63:7, 76:3, 145:18, 147:10, 152:7, 229:20, improvements [2] indicating [2] -108:18, 118:9, 122:2, 46:2, 110:14 194:25, 199:29 149:14, 163:7, 231:13, 231:16 124:20, 168:20, 172:17, 172:22, interaction [9] -IN [1] - 1:17 indication [1] - 30:15 186:10, 227:9, 172:25, 173:3, 25:18. 34:2. 130:10. in-depth [1] - 47:13 indications [1] -229:16, 229:17 173:15, 173:17, 130:11, 166:1, 166:3, inadequate [1] -203:24 Inspector [2] -173:19, 174:21, 177:18, 209:3, 238:12 indicative [1] -233:11 126:23, 126:26 175:17. 175:25. inappropriate [5] interactions [3] -195:10 inspector[1] - 56:8 176:1, 176:5, 176:9, 23:8, 89:15, 232:25, indifferent [4] -26:9, 29:29, 133:8 Inspectorate [5] -177:20, 180:15, interest [6] - 60:4, 238:11, 240:1 149:11, 187:7, 232:7, 109:29, 110:29, 181:10, 197:5, 234:14 115:14, 118:6, 187:5, inappropriately [2] -111:1, 111:6, 199:9 227:12, 242:7, 242:8, 243:16, 243:21 7:18, 113:17 individual [13] -Inspectorate's [1] -242:9, 242:15, 243:5, incident [7] - 76:12, interested [4] -27:20, 27:26, 37:21, 110:11 243:8, 243:11, 243:14 29:22, 167:25, 169:13 79:19, 79:25, 79:28, 89:18, 91:1, 107:23, installed [1] - 207:27 informationinteresting [1] -157:24, 157:28, 127:28, 132:8, instance [19] - 22:9, distribution [1] -158:23 148:19, 159:11, 47.26 22:10, 43:23, 44:7, 173:15 interim [2] - 56:11, incident" [1] -171:3, 171:4, 213:1 44:16, 47:19, 98:23, informed [12] individually[1] -210:4 157:14 121:4, 122:5, 135:8, 69:27, 75:21, 105:24, Interim [1] - 212:20 incidentally [1] -141:11, 143:28, 128:19, 131:17, intermediary [1] -152:11 individuals [15] -172:3, 172:16, 7:12, 9:16, 9:17, 9:24, 141:19, 158:26, 91.27 incidents [1] -174:26, 197:17, 159:24, 160:22, 160:12 12:9, 72:17, 73:16, internal [3] - 14:21, 199:29, 241:24

17:15, 78:1 internally [1] - 218:1 internally/ externally [1] - 192:10 internet [1] - 241:17 interpret [1] - 37:17 interpretation [2] -39:21, 199:22 interpreted [2] -176:11, 200:5 interrupt [1] - 180:27 interruption [1] -164.1 intervene [3] - 43:28, 161:11, 232:21 intervened [2] -127:19 127:20 interview [30] -49:16, 61:28, 61:29, 62:17, 62:22, 62:27, 71:25, 93:25, 94:11, 102:8, 123:28, 124:13, 124:24, 125:11, 125:15, 128:23, 130:7, 130:8, 130:13, 130:26, 142:22, 187:27, 189:4, 189:20, 189:21, 224:2, 224:23, 224:25, 234:5 interviewed [3] -107:1, 125:16, 129:17 interviewing [1] -127:27 interviews [2] -96:28, 119:6 intimidation [1] -67:10 **INTO** [1] - 1:3 introduce [1] - 41:19 introduced [5] -41:15, 41:20, 42:7, 150:19, 152:24 introduction [1] -21:12 investigate [1] - 9:3 investigated [19] -19:20, 23:11, 36:8, 42:16, 67:14, 78:2, 81:25, 88:9, 126:6, 126:23, 131:11, 146:13, 147:5, 147:22, 147:26, 188:7, 231:7, 232:12, 235:4 investigating [2] -132:6, 202:28 investigation [32] -17:19. 42:8. 54:2. 69:27, 71:5, 72:18,

74:10, 74:13, 79:4, 79:22, 80:7, 80:8, 80:29, 81:24, 83:3, 86:28, 102:15, 102:17, 107:8, 107:15, 109:1, 109:11, 125:28, 132:11, 145:11, 154:18, 155:9, 161:4, 185:16, 186:22, 231:24, 233:11 investigations [3] -50:29, 132:8, 132:12 invite [3] - 174:1, 174:13, 226:20 invited [5] - 49:25, 64:21, 64:22, 103:6, 210:27 involve [2] - 25:29, 232:5 involved [20] - 10:15, 17:22, 21:21, 22:12, 32:11, 65:14, 102:15, 126:22, 134:18, 143:25, 143:27, 165:11, 191:5, 191:6, 191:7, 193:11, 231:2,

42:14, 49:6, 49:9, 56:4, 65:20 involves [2] - 176:3, 203:3 involving [2] - 67:13, 216:16 Irish [2] - 33:11,

231:29, 232:6, 243:2

involvement[5] -

129:16 irregular [1] - 53:12 irrelevant [1] -180:12

irresponsible [1] - 232:18 isolate [1] - 159:11 issue [50] - 21:20,

isolate [1] - 159:11 issue [50] - 21:20, 55:13, 56:26, 60:7, 62:25, 63:27, 63:28, 70:16, 81:13, 88:22, 91:3, 91:13, 91:14, 94:16, 94:20, 107:5, 115:15, 120:26, 124:21, 126:17, 134:19, 150:12, 152:9, 156:3, 168:3, 168:18, 171:5, 177:29, 178:1, 178:4, 178:28, 179:3, 179:21, 185:11, 189:6, 194:22,

194:29, 201:15,

205:25, 220:8,

222:12, 222:25, 223:1, 225:4, 227:21, 229:2, 231:5, 232:15, 232:27 issued [3] - 7:10, 11:13, 198:8 issues [50] - 12:14, 17:19, 20:1, 53:5, 56:18, 58:24, 59:26, 68:27, 73:27, 74:4, 74:5, 74:9, 76:24, 82:9, 83:10, 86:12, 88:7, 89:17, 89:21, 91:7, 94:12, 95:29, 97:19, 110:2, 134:2, 134:10, 143:26, 143:28, 159:4, 162:9, 167:20, 167:26, 168:7, 173:18, 177:27, 178:2, 178:25, 179:1, 179:12, 180:16, 182:29, 183:26, 183:28, 184:23, 193:12, 201:19, 202:8, 213:1, 220:6 issues" [1] - 74:1 issuing [2] - 20:4, 204:13 Italia [1] - 161:15 items [1] - 172:29 itself [9] - 28:1, 44:4, 59:19, 67:3, 68:4, 89:11, 91:8, 91:9, 230.4

J

Jack [1] - 182:22 jack [1] - 74:27 jail [1] - 135:27 January [41] - 12:21, 12:29, 15:18, 15:29, 26:9, 32:8, 33:26, 61:15, 64:11, 64:12, 64:13, 64:14, 64:17, 64:21, 68:11, 68:17, 69:14, 73:21, 74:15, 75:8, 76:4, 87:3, 89:25, 95:16, 96:21, 101:4, 108:22, 113:13, 146:17, 149:19, 150:1, 178:22, 199:1, 199:12, 199:23, 214:18, 224:27 jeopardy [1] - 243:13 JMcG [1] - 220:16 job [13] - 43:1, 47:9, 51:26, 54:22, 66:12,

75:25, 139:13, 143:19, 156:16, 179:20, 199:17, 199:18, 240:18 Joe [3] - 188:4, 188:7, 188:22 JOHN [5] - 2:17, 2:28, 3:4, 3:8, 3:17 John [7] - 14:23, 74:9, 203:14, 203:17, 214:14, 215:16, 232:29 **joined** [8] - 48:17, 51:2, 54:29, 57:3, 59:29, 142:15, 164:24, 166:7 joining [3] - 49:15, 58:11, 141:5 joint[1] - 152:16 **JOM** [1] - 71:25 jot [1] - 107:28 journalism [2] -241:20, 243:2 journalist [18] -48:27, 127:1, 131:4, 135:24, 135:25, 136:10, 161:17, 167:1, 168:1, 168:2, 168:19, 169:21, 221:22, 241:11, 241:16, 241:18, 241:28, 243:21 journalist's [1] -

136:13, 136:15, 176:13, 242:22 journalists [31] -129:26, 133:8, 133:9, 134:7, 136:8, 136:28, 166:1, 166:3, 166:5, 167:6, 167:12, 167:16, 167:22, 167:23, 167:24, 168:6, 168:17, 169:4, 171:5, 171:8, 171:26, 171:28, 173:29, 186:3, 210:15, 227:10, 235:17, 235:23, 236:18, 241:23, 242:28 journalists' [2] -185:15, 190:1 JUDGE [2] - 1:12, 2:3 judge [1] - 42:26

Judge [10] - 137:21,

137:29, 138:4,

157:16, 158:19,

184:8

journalistic [6] -

135:26, 136:10,

233:27 judges [1] - 219:12 July [3] - 6:13, 10:13, 11:3 jumping [2] - 50:14, 129:1 justice [1] - 95:23 Justice [13] - 69:21, 90:7, 207:25, 208:5, 208:8, 208:11, 208:23, 209:18, 210:5, 218:25, 219:22, 220:3, 220:22 JUSTICE [3] - 1:8, 1:12, 2:2 Justine [2] - 69:22, 71:1 Κ

195:27, 209:2,

231:15, 233:22,

KATHLEEN[1] - 2:7 Kavanagh [3] - 74:3, 94:5, 193:17 **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:4 Kean [5] - 104:29, 105:8, 106:15, 106:20, 106:22 **KEAN** [2] - 3:19, 3:20 keep [11] - 28:18, 38:10, 119:22, 120:24, 141:19, 157:20, 185:1, 196:16, 196:19, 211:26 keeping [9] - 30:27, 31:6, 31:9, 74:17, 103:29, 104:12, 118:28, 220:2, 222:20 Ken [1] - 90:3 Kenny [1] - 102:9 kept [3] - 28:21, 98:17, 238:6 key [4] - 25:19, 122:3, 142:22, 183:3 kick [1] - 217:27 kind [72] - 43:4, 49:26, 51:6, 52:3, 55:10, 55:11, 55:29, 56:18, 57:19, 57:20, 58:24, 59:25, 61:7. 61:27, 65:26, 68:15, 76:15, 78:14, 86:24, 87:16, 87:18, 90:18, 92:15, 94:16, 95:22, 95:28, 97:13, 103:20, 106:26, 107:27, 107:29, 108:1,

113:25, 116:15, 116:25, 124:17, 127:21, 139:24, 160:3, 163:21, 164:17, 166:8, 169:24, 183:18, 191:8, 191:13, 192:9, 196:21, 197:16, 199:28, 211:12, 211:13, 211:14, 213:29, 214:1, 216:18, 216:19, 219:26, 222:5, 226:23, 229:8, 238:12, 238:16, 240:9, 240:28, 241:13, 241:20, 241:26, 241:27 kindly [1] - 8:10 kinds [1] - 43:13 kitchen [1] - 206:2 knowing [1] - 125:3 knowledge [21] -15:24, 87:1, 103:6, 112:19, 122:26, 122:29, 123:7, 126:10, 130:5, 130:9, 130:11, 131:26, 135:13, 135:15, 139:6, 145:6, 145:7, 187:10, 201:5, 234:14, 237:5 known [7] - 10:27, 29:13, 39:10, 88:4, 129:26, 160:2, 174:4

L

labour [1] - 44:16 lack [1] - 84:5 language [2] - 90:20, 115:24 lap [1] - 200:18 large [1] - 174:14 last [12] - 28:26, 47:15, 56:20, 97:24, 104:2, 160:24, 178:12, 182:2, 189:12, 200:17, 225:20, 226:24 late [8] - 6:26, 23:6, 98:2, 129:14, 168:14, 168:15, 178:18, 178:19 latest [5] - 133:16, 155:12, 175:15, 185:1, 227:16 law [1] - 65:26

LAW [1] - 3:12

lawful [2] - 205:10, 205:11 **LAWLOR**[1] - 3:9 laws [6] - 125:9, 125:22, 131:6, 188:2, 228:23, 232:16 lawyer [1] - 83:25 lawyer's [1] - 184:8 lawyers [1] - 83:24 layout [1] - 52:1 lead [2] - 47:6, 103:4 **LEADER** [32] - 2:7, 4:12, 4:16, 48:11, 48:16, 48:17, 50:13, 50:15, 68:23, 70:27, 71:2, 71:6, 74:5, 74:22, 75:2, 75:5, 75:7, 76:20, 78:16, 84:19, 101:3, 129:10, 137:7, 137:14, 145:22, 145:26, 145:28, 146:5, 199:5, 236:14, 236:16, 236:17 leader [13] - 68:18, 70:24, 78:11, 82:26, 83:14, 83:28, 99:28, 126:20, 132:29, 137:1. 156:19. 229:13, 239:24 Leader [1] - 75:4 leading [2] - 27:4, 140:17 leak [5] - 207:5, 207:6, 207:22, 208:21, 210:20 leaked [2] - 207:1, 208:16 leaking [4] - 208:1, 208:3, 209:16, 210:5 leaks [4] - 210:12, 210:13, 210:15, 210:16 leaky [1] - 134:15 learn [1] - 58:1 learning [1] - 165:7 least [8] - 66:2, 66:7, 77:1, 161:1, 172:15, 181:11, 190:5, 225:15

leave [11] - 95:13, leaving [5] - 63:16, led [2] - 41:3, 214:29 left [11] - 41:12, 46:9,

99:28, 131:18,

132:13, 148:21,

181:21, 204:25,

212:27, 213:16,

185:23, 199:21,

213:15, 225:18

213:17, 228:4

81:11, 81:19, 83:16, 115:19, 155:10, 184:11, 185:4, 187:21, 228:5 legal [2] - 65:13, legend [1] - 239:1 legitimate [5] -161:4, 161:7, 162:14. 176:1, 195:14 legitimately [1] -160:21 **LEHANE** [17] - 3:8, 4:14, 138:9, 200:24, 214:6, 214:12, 214:14, 215:6, 219:5, 219:8, 219:16, 219:20, 220:9, 220:23, 220:25, 220:28, 221:3 Lehane [2] - 214:4, 214:15 Leinster [3] - 16:24, 26:5, 26:7 length [2] - 58:21, 168:13 lent [1] - 58:27 less [10] - 31:3, 34:4, 77:22, 117:9, 117:10, 162:28, 162:29, 205:21, 239:9 letter [20] - 9:26, 12:19, 70:11, 70:14, 71:17, 206:24, 207:1, 207:5, 207:8, 207:22, 207:23, 208:1, 208:3, 208:16, 209:17, 210:6, 218:1, 218:5 level [21] - 16:25, 17:2, 51:15, 51:17, 54:13, 79:25, 84:2, 88:15, 103:24, 143:25, 145:14, 145:18, 146:19, 165:29, 166:2, 181:27, 203:3, 211:18, 212:6, 226:1, 242:5 liability [3] - 211:25, 212:6, 212:23 libel [7] - 125:9, 125:22, 131:6, 187:19, 187:23, 188:2, 232:16 light [2] - 187:15, 195:28 likelihood [1] - 80:5 likely [11] - 37:14, 38:27, 38:29, 39:27, 79:21, 79:24, 80:9,

Limerick [2] - 43:24, 44:10 limitation [1] -196:21 limited [2] - 176:13, 176:21 limits [1] - 225:25 line [24] - 35:23, 43:24, 44:9, 50:5, 51:9, 92:1, 114:25, 117:1, 120:28, 122:9, 123:10, 130:3, 131:21, 141:1, 165:5, 167:10, 172:16, 173:18, 173:24, 179:12, 201:10, 204:22, 206:11, 212:28 line-up [1] - 92:1 lines [8] - 18:22, 76:16, 77:14, 101:26, 127:15, 188:15, 206:8, 217:3 link [2] - 15:20, 21:15 linking [1] - 42:6 list [6] - 67:1, 73:29, 85:3, 88:25, 166:17, 167:1 listed [1] - 73:27 listen [4] - 59:13, 91:25, 105:18, 141:22 listening [2] - 58:27, 142:8 literally [2] - 171:12, 206:4 **LITTLE** [2] - 2:20, 2:25 live [3] - 143:25, 201:19, 223:1 livestock [1] - 20:14 living [1] - 173:7 lobby [5] - 16:22, 26:27, 27:4, 27:5, 215:28 local [1] - 178:25 location [1] - 98:7 locked [1] - 9:13 logical [1] - 37:16 look [45] - 14:6, 24:13, 24:15, 25:4, 25:5, 35:6, 37:20, 43:29, 44:3, 44:15, 44:22, 45:10, 45:11, 73:19, 76:4, 77:17, 81:10, 83:15, 83:29,

152:15, 152:20,

likewise [1] - 89:14

limb [4] - 41:14,

41:26, 144:7

171:15

89:18, 107:23, 107:25, 108:1, 140:8, 145:8, 153:16, 155:8, 157:11, 159:24, 162:17, 162:18, 164:16, 169:22, 170:3, 170:24, 189:12, 193:2, 193:20, 198:5, 199:6, 209:16, 224:24, 233:23, 235:23, 240:2 looked [12] - 82:8, 106:7, 108:13, 117:25, 127:21, 134:2, 148:20, 162:22, 188:21, 203:11, 205:19, 235:3 looking [11] - 24:27, 40:25, 40:26, 44:5, 46:27, 77:14, 82:8, 145:25, 146:10, 176:18, 240:16 looks [3] - 71:2, 74:18, 194:14 loop [5] - 119:23, 144:7, 220:3, 220:22, 238:7 lose [2] - 48:4, 242:3 loss [3] - 15:14, 21:22, 239:22 lost [2] - 41:4, 198:2 lunch [1] - 166:23 **LUNCH** [2] - 100:2, 101:1

М

M.E [1] - 2:28 M3 [1] - 45:6 machine [1] - 181:14 **MADE** [2] - 1:3, 1:8 maelstrom [2] -184:20, 218:14 magazine [2] -241:17 main [8] - 53:13, 55:13, 56:21, 63:26, 63:28, 172:13, 178:21, 185:3 major [6] - 49:1, 96:28, 131:27, 159:16, 184:20, 201:19 males [1] - 194:14 malleability [1] -47:27 Malone [1] - 1:25 MALONE [1] - 1:30 man [9] - 47:3,

148:4, 155:8, 161:2, 110:5, 111:21, 113:1, 202:27, 214:9, 154:17, 155:4, McGuinness [32] -161:18, 161:24, 113:6, 114:23, 214:16, 240:9 155:24, 156:6, 156:8, 3:8, 95:17, 96:6, 97:1, 181:13, 182:22, 211:4 118:23, 119:27, Maurice [10] - 6:13, 159:3, 160:15, 97:8, 97:9, 98:5, 123:10 160:22, 161:9, 162:9, 98:29, 101:5, 101:9, management [9] -7:7, 8:22, 12:22, 40:22, 56:28, 56:29, matter [94] - 8:13, 13:11, 13:25, 15:20, 162:22, 164:6, 101:19, 101:20, 102:3, 102:29, 9:1, 21:14, 22:7, 23:5, 57:1, 57:7, 67:11, 33:4, 70:29, 75:21 167:13, 167:21, 163:10, 204:22, 205:1 23:7, 23:13, 29:15, McCabe [204] - 2:9, 168:2, 168:7, 169:5, 103:11, 103:17, 32:29, 38:16, 38:17, 169:23, 171:6, 103:21, 117:21, manager [3] - 50:6, 6:14, 6:19, 6:23, 7:7, 38:19, 40:6, 40:17, 177:29, 178:1, 178:6, 214:15, 215:17, 7:23, 8:22, 9:6, 9:10, 161:15, 212:29 41:6, 42:15, 46:21, 12:7, 12:23, 13:4, 179:2, 182:29, 183:8, 215:22, 216:1, managers [2] - 29:7, 50:7 60:4, 60:12, 60:19, 13:6, 13:11, 13:19, 183:14, 185:10, 216:12, 216:21, 186:15, 186:21, 217:1, 217:4, 217:9, Manchester [2] -61:5, 71:18, 73:11, 13:25, 14:5, 14:12, 187:15, 187:28, 79:16, 81:6, 81:8, 15:21, 15:23, 15:26, 217:16, 218:27, 206:5 manifest [1] - 240:11 83:23, 84:15, 85:29, 18:23, 19:14, 22:8, 188:1, 188:28, 219:10, 219:25, 227:3 86:3, 86:7, 88:9, 23:11, 27:10, 30:26, 189:11, 190:4, MCGUINNESS [2] manifested [1] -88:13, 89:5, 89:10, 190:16, 194:25, 31:23, 33:5, 34:8, 2:6, 2:16 59.18 196:1, 196:3, 201:20, 89:16. 92:21. 93:3. 34:17, 34:24, 35:16, McGuinness's [7] manner [9] - 5:23, 201:29, 203:14, 95:1, 95:13, 98:28, 35:18, 36:7, 36:24, 33:18, 216:7, 216:22, 20:8, 105:29, 113:16, 99:21, 101:22, 38:14, 38:18, 39:9, 203:22, 204:22, 216:24, 218:19, 120:29. 140:18. 204:27, 204:29, 102:22, 104:13, 41:25, 46:26, 49:29, 218:21, 220:13 190:23, 211:22, 217:24, 217:25, 104:18, 104:19, 61:13, 61:19, 61:21, McLindon [52] -239:15 105:9, 106:20, 68:6, 69:12, 69:27, 225:11, 228:22, 4:10, 48:12, 48:15, March [21] - 22:28, 106:22, 111:8, 70:2, 70:29, 71:4, 229:21, 230:8, 235:8, 48:17, 51:11, 75:9, 56:13, 111:18, 112:29, 113:9, 115:5, 238:10, 239:8 71:5, 71:19, 72:7, 76:21, 77:5, 79:8, 112:23, 112:24, 115:17, 117:22. McCabe's [24] -73:1, 73:4, 73:8, 74:1, 114:22, 129:14, 109:2, 112:12, 113:2, 117:24, 120:27, 74:4, 74:5, 74:9, 18:21, 18:28, 36:11, 117:7, 120:1, 121:2, 166:12, 167:6, 121:20, 121:21, 36:16, 36:18, 37:27, 75:13, 75:21, 76:3, 123:23, 129:11, 178:12, 198:9, 125:23, 126:18, 76:17, 77:11, 77:13, 39:19, 106:24, 131:20, 137:17, 198:10, 198:18, 126:22, 127:5, 77:15, 77:16, 77:25, 129:17, 129:27, 137:27, 138:17, 198:19, 198:20, 138:20, 161:12, 127:22, 127:23, 137:18, 144:14, 199:1, 199:9, 199:12 78:6, 78:22, 79:3, 127:25, 128:18, 150:11, 151:27, 79:11, 80:1, 80:6, 165:11, 165:15, march [1] - 209:17 129:12, 129:29, 158:25, 167:17, 80:27, 82:28, 83:1, 171:9, 191:14, **Marian** [2] - 105:2, 131:14, 132:20, 167:19, 167:26, 83:2, 83:18, 84:5, 192:17, 198:7, 105.18 137:4, 143:21, 86:9. 97:10. 97:16. 178:23, 179:14, 200:14, 201:1, MARK[1] - 3:4 148:16, 148:18, 179:18, 180:4, 180:5, 99:2, 99:10, 99:15, 205:17. 208:29. mark [4] - 144:22, 148:21, 161:2, 101:19, 103:2, 181:24 209:8, 214:10, 227:27, 228:5, 228:6 170:24, 179:25, 103:11, 107:7, 107:8, McCann [5] - 2:22, 214:12, 214:14, marketing [1] - 49:3 189:8, 190:24, 108:29, 109:5, 3:16, 208:9, 236:19, 215:3. 220:9. 221:12. marks [1] - 89:22 191:16, 195:22, 109:10, 112:25, 237:11 221:16, 228:18, MARRINAN[11] -200:18, 201:3, 202:1, 113:15, 117:17, mcCarthy [1] - 24:3 232:10, 233:17, 2:6, 4:5, 4:7, 5:4, 5:9, 202:7. 205:20. 118:4, 119:11, McCarthy [28] - 4:3, 234:12, 234:22, 5:10, 8:20, 13:8, 213:13, 213:15, 120:15. 121:1. 122:6. 5:5, 5:8, 5:10, 24:9, 236:3, 237:18, 13:21, 41:11, 41:12 214:17, 214:18 122:16, 122:28, 27:21 28:6 28:17 239:20 241:11 **Marrinan** [6] - 8:17, MATTERS [1] - 1:5 123:6, 123:15, 29:20, 30:24, 31:3, 243:18, 243:25 13:2, 25:21, 30:23, matters [50] - 7:23, 124:15, 124:21, 33:21, 33:23, 35:4, McLindon's [3] -35:22, 39:1 9:7, 14:6, 19:27, 125:7, 125:9, 125:21, 37:4, 37:5, 37:12, 165:20, 170:23, Marrinan's [1] - 25:3 21:13, 21:23, 22:26, 128:11, 131:5, 131:9, 38:6, 38:20, 40:5, 231.27 Martin [2] - 9:28, 26:10, 32:11, 32:15, 131:22, 132:4, 41:2, 41:8, 42:2, McMenamin [2] -189.29 132:19, 132:25, 43:15, 50:29, 53:1, 42:20, 69:21, 69:22, 73:1, 73:3 Mary [2] - 6:18, 9:11 133:4. 133:9. 133:12. 56:9, 56:15, 56:16, 71:1. 117:24 McPartlin [3] - 169:3, match [1] - 13:16 58:5, 60:1, 60:3, 133:17, 134:8, McCarthy's [1] -189:28, 190:7 material [18] - 7:20, 62:24, 63:1, 65:21, 135:10, 137:10, 96:10 McPartlin's [2] -7:28, 9:18, 12:7, 65:29, 67:13, 67:28, 144:23, 144:24, McCOURT [1] - 3:2 69:18 74:13 12:12, 12:21, 13:9, 144:27, 145:4, 145:9, 67:29, 72:20, 75:28, McDowell [9] - 2:9, mean [49] - 20:7, 13:10, 13:13, 13:24, 83:22, 88:25, 99:11, 145:11, 146:8, 23:29, 137:17, 28:11, 28:27, 33:9, 14:4. 15:11. 19:25. 106:8, 114:1, 117:17, 146:12, 147:5, 148:4, 137:21, 137:26, 36:15, 44:19, 45:17, 30:25, 35:15, 39:19, 118:8, 118:9, 122:2, 148:13, 150:8, 137:29, 158:18, 47:11, 74:23, 78:13, 147:15, 203:19 122:3, 132:6, 133:26, 150:17, 150:19, 233:27 87:15, 112:12, 121:2, materials [15] - 5:6, 134:14, 136:21, 152:18, 152:23, McENROY [1] - 3:1 133:11, 140:8, 143:8, 48:13, 66:23, 75:11, 152:27, 153:4, 154:6, 141:14, 156:19, McGARRY [1] - 2:10 145:10, 149:26, 76:6, 79:1, 102:8, 160:14, 179:15, 154:8, 154:12,

152:3, 153:3, 153:19,	meet [20] - 6:23,	233:5, 233:10,	mentioning [4] -	207:11, 207:13,
155:23, 155:24,	8:22, 16:21, 53:21,	234:24, 234:25,	13:4, 150:11, 186:4,	207:17, 207:19,
160:17, 170:8,	57:2, 59:24, 59:25,	240:10	217:2	208:12, 208:20,
174:13, 176:10,	93:21, 97:9, 97:21,	meetings [51] - 16:5,	merciless [1] -	209:2, 209:5, 209:10,
176:21, 176:23,	102:2, 103:16,	16:8, 17:24, 56:27,	197:16	209:15, 210:19,
184:4, 190:7, 191:9,	103:20, 103:21,	57:1, 57:7, 59:19,	mere [1] - 235:12	210:26, 211:28,
192:8, 192:18,	126:11, 172:9,	59:20, 60:11, 60:13,	merely [1] - 14:2	212:2, 212:5, 212:9,
192:22, 193:29,	172:11, 220:19,	60:14, 61:16, 61:23,	merit [1] - 44:23	212:22, 213:20,
196:11, 196:19,	225:5, 226:17	64:2, 64:3, 64:4,	merits [2] - 44:6,	238:25
199:16, 206:12,	meeting [142] - 6:15,	64:16, 64:28, 65:8,	46:27	Michael [4] - 71:10,
210:13, 210:14,	15:28, 16:19, 16:22,	65:25, 65:28, 66:1,	message [9] - 62:1,	90:4, 137:17, 138:21
210:17, 228:8,	16:25, 20:23, 20:24,	68:2, 68:8, 68:9,	94:13, 109:12,	MICHELLE [1] - 3:1
232:16, 238:14,	21:1, 21:5, 21:6, 21:9,	68:14, 68:26, 68:27,	109:14, 118:4, 135:3,	Mick [4] - 69:27,
239:29, 240:16,	22:1, 40:28, 49:27,	69:13, 72:26, 79:25,	135:6, 135:9, 237:22	71:4, 71:9
240:25	53:27, 57:19, 60:17,	80:11, 81:16, 85:1,	messages [1] -	micro [1] - 143:25
means [9] - 43:16,	60:21, 61:7, 62:13,	85:12, 86:5, 86:21,	218:22	mid [3] - 10:4, 10:13
103:9, 135:3, 136:17,	62:19, 64:11, 64:21,	90:17, 141:11,	messenger [1] -	mid-February [1] -
164:4, 193:4, 219:28,	64:22, 64:26, 68:7,	156:22, 159:2,	237:22	10:4
238:23, 243:3	69:14, 69:15, 69:17,	178:17, 178:21,	met [19] - 6:19,	mid-May [2] - 10:4,
meant [3] - 50:2,	70:7, 70:8, 70:20,	183:27, 184:24,	16:22, 16:27, 25:24,	10:13
144:29, 181:19	73:20, 73:28, 74:6,	221:25, 229:29,	40:3, 49:17, 49:23,	middle [6] - 53:4,
measures [1] -	75:8, 75:20, 75:23,	240:9, 240:14, 240:23	49:25, 57:18, 60:28,	174:26, 174:28,
162:21	75:25, 76:2, 77:18,	MEMBER [2] - 1:12,	63:11, 95:3, 104:22,	184:19, 213:17,
mechanics [1] -	80:16, 82:22, 83:6,	2:2	104:24, 104:26,	218:14
215:7	83:7, 84:2, 86:20,	member [12] - 7:3,	166:4, 172:8, 212:24,	might [65] - 11:24,
mechanism [3] -	87:3, 87:12, 88:15,	12:19, 56:29, 108:19,	215:26	15:23, 17:28, 21:18,
103:13, 204:15,	88:16, 88:21, 88:23,	113:24, 148:25,	MICHAEL [92] - 2:9,	21:19, 24:25, 35:12,
225:28	90:18, 90:21, 91:6,	150:9, 154:20,	2:27, 4:13, 138:4,	37:24, 58:8, 58:9,
media [73] - 14:15,	91:8, 91:9, 95:16,	164:29, 205:9,	138:7, 138:17,	64:5, 66:16, 91:20,
15:2, 30:27, 31:2,	98:4, 98:5, 98:7,	205:10, 243:1	138:20, 145:23,	92:14, 103:8, 104:7,
31:5, 31:15, 31:26,	98:10, 98:14, 98:21,	members [24] -	145:27, 145:29,	118:24, 124:9,
32:10, 32:14, 32:20,	98:26, 101:5, 101:18,	14:17, 17:8, 18:9,	146:6, 157:18,	124:19, 124:20,
32:23, 32:28, 33:17,	101:19, 101:21,	24:4, 40:22, 58:28,	157:23, 157:27,	128:8, 128:14,
54:4, 55:10, 56:16,	102:28, 103:1,	59:14, 60:24, 60:25,	158:3, 158:11,	131:20, 131:24,
60:24, 61:5, 62:28,	103:25, 103:27,	62:3, 63:15, 76:23,	158:16, 158:22,	132:16, 134:26,
67:27, 67:29, 93:14,	103:29, 104:23,	81:12, 94:15, 103:5,	161:27, 162:5, 165:3,	134:27, 135:9,
94:22, 95:28, 96:28,	104:27, 104:28,	103:15, 116:29,	165:13, 165:21,	137:15, 140:8,
97:4, 97:26, 97:28,	114:13, 114:14,	141:23, 144:5, 151:9,	165:25, 165:28,	140:11, 148:26,
105:17, 107:5,	136:25, 144:11,	162:24, 166:14,	166:19, 166:22,	150:5, 150:22,
107:19, 107:25,	144:26, 145:15,	166:17, 179:8	168:26, 169:8, 170:7,	151:11, 151:12,
108:16, 109:28,	146:16, 146:20,	memorable [3] -	170:28, 175:6, 176:8,	152:19, 152:27,
110:28, 112:8,	149:19, 151:19,	27:17, 28:1, 33:3	176:16, 176:24,	154:17, 155:3,
112:28, 115:14,	152:3, 156:28, 158:24 160:6 160:9	memory [21] - 25:23,	182:7, 182:26,	158:26, 164:12,
116:12, 116:24,	158:24, 160:6, 160:9, 160:14, 160:16,	25:26, 27:6, 27:15,	185:25, 186:1, 186:5,	173:6, 174:21,
120:15, 120:18,	161:8, 178:20, 193:6,	29:23, 29:26, 35:3,	186:9, 190:10,	174:23, 175:16,
120:25, 124:8,	193:7, 202:7, 213:15,	38:28, 38:29, 39:28,	190:21, 191:15,	178:24, 184:15,
124:11, 127:28,	214:18, 214:20,	58:9, 66:10, 103:19,	191:19, 191:23,	191:13, 191:17,
128:17, 132:24, 133:5, 134:19,	215:7, 217:14,	157:3, 158:23, 170:22, 171:13,	191:26, 192:6,	193:13, 197:1,
, ,	218:11, 218:27,	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	192:14, 192:18,	197:17, 209:17,
134:27, 139:10, 139:11, 156:23,	218:29, 219:9,	171:21, 182:4, 182:6	192:25, 193:2,	211:8, 214:6, 222:14,
166:15, 166:17,	219:23, 219:25,	mention [6] - 22:20, 87:2, 104:13, 186:3,	193:19, 193:22,	222:25, 229:17,
171:25, 172:11,	220:13, 220:18,	228:17, 230:16	193:24, 193:28,	232:16, 233:18,
171.25, 172.11, 172:12, 173:16,	221:17, 221:25,	mentioned [15] -	195:15, 195:20,	234:6, 236:4, 239:16
178:4, 181:24,	221:26, 222:2, 222:4,	27:16, 33:23, 37:28,	195:22, 195:26,	mightn't [1] - 66:10
184:20, 188:13,	222:11, 222:26,		196:29, 197:18,	mildly [1] - 212:4
193:5, 215:28, 220:8,	223:4, 223:10,	60:27, 64:1, 98:7,	198:7, 198:25,	mill [5] - 87:17,
226:20, 226:24,	223:18, 223:25,	101:28, 140:8, 169:5, 169:27, 170:13,	199:10, 200:17,	87:18, 160:4, 160:7,
227:13, 241:14	226:7, 227:2, 227:26,	170:14, 186:2,	201:1, 202:26,	239:28
MEEHAN [1] - 2:22	229:23, 230:4, 231:3,	186:14, 210:28	204:26, 204:29,	million [1] - 74:19
	232:22, 232:23,	100.17, 210.20	205:24, 207:6, 207:8,	mind [28] - 31:21,
	,,			
L	1	1	I .	1

20.7 40.47 70.04
32:7, 46:17, 70:24,
82:11, 82:12, 82:18,
103:29, 104:12,
107:29, 137:29,
138:2, 156:20,
163:14, 165:29,
181:28, 193:10,
193:16, 193:21,
193.10, 193.21,
209:1, 209:19,
209:20, 215:2,
218:12, 219:15,
231:19, 231:22,
237:18
minded [1] - 195:19
mindful [1] - 76:27
mindset [1] - 202:25
mine [1] - 45:5
minimal [1] - 212:6
Minister [5] - 46:12,
114:26, 115:13, 220:7
MINISTER [1] - 1:8
Minister's [1] - 208:2
minor [1] - 145:13
minors [1] - 154:9
minute [3] - 23:21,
52:19, 62:21
minuted [1] - 184:25
minutes [18] - 21:7,
26:19, 64:4, 95:4,
98:17, 108:12, 138:7,
100 0 100 11
138:9, 138:14,
200:22, 209:14,
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3,
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11,
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1]
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] -
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] -
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] -
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9,
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistake [1] - 38:9
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistake [1] - 38:9
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistaken [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistaken [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6,
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistaken [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6, 72:8
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistaken [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6, 72:8 mobile [2] - 167:4,
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistaken [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6, 72:8 mobile [2] - 167:4, 167:7
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistake [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6, 72:8 mobile [2] - 167:4, 167:7 modes [1] - 45:18
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistaken [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6, 72:8 mobile [2] - 167:4, 167:7
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistake [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6, 72:8 mobile [2] - 167:4, 167:7 modes [1] - 45:18
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistaken [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6, 72:8 mobile [2] - 167:4, 167:7 modes [1] - 45:18 modify [1] - 143:23
200:22, 209:14, 214:9, 226:25, 228:3, 229:10, 229:11, 229:14, 229:18 mirrored [1] - 13:10 misheard [1] - 170:10 misinterpretation [1] - 90:28 misleading [1] - 163:6 misquoting [1] - 154:24 missed [1] - 98:1 missing [3] - 15:9, 15:13, 38:17 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistake [1] - 24:23 mistaken [1] - 38:9 misunderstanding [2] - 24:23, 237:19 MMcC [2] - 72:6, 72:8 mobile [2] - 167:4, 167:7 modes [1] - 45:18 modify [1] - 143:23 Molloy [2] - 33:14,

153:25, 154:16, 56:7, 117:29, 149:29, 150:4, 153:22, 179:14, 179:26, 179:28, 180:2, 180:4, 157:19, 167:15, 180:9, 181:22, 186:6, 180:12, 180:14, 191:25, 193:23, 180:16, 180:21, 220:26 180:22, 180:25, 180:29, 181:3, 181:4, momentary [1] -183:14, 212:13, 228:27 212:17, 212:19, 230:9 moments [1] -152:24 motivations [1] -Monaghan [4] - 15:4, 179:18 31:16, 178:26, 187:9 motive [1] - 209:16 MONDAY[1] **motoring** [1] - 14:18 243:28 mouse [1] - 200:1 Monday [3] - 95:9, move [10] - 45:28, 93:1, 93:18, 93:25, 96:12, 221:4 money [6] - 43:3, 93:27, 116:15, 214:3, 216:26, 224:26 43:4, 43:14, 43:29, moved [2] - 48:28, 44:2. 47:9 monies [2] - 5:15, 202:7 moving [5] - 112:18, 43:3 monitoring [2] -193:16, 223:28, 30:27, 31:2 234:28, 234:29 monkey [4] - 239:1, MR [202] - 1:12, 2:2, 239:2, 239:3 2:4, 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, month [4] - 57:2, 2:10, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 113:4, 114:21, 123:27 2:15, 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, 2:22, 2:23, 2:27, monthly [3] - 56:27, 2:28, 3:1, 3:4, 3:8, 62:15, 240:23 3:12, 3:15, 3:19, 4:3, months [7] - 51:4. 4:5, 4:6, 4:7, 4:10, 51:5, 59:29, 138:24, 4:13, 4:14, 4:15, 5:4, 138:26, 164:27, 5:8, 5:9, 5:10, 8:20, 199:21 13:8, 13:21, 23:29, moon [2] - 208:18, 24:2, 24:3, 28:4, 208:19 28:17, 33:16, 33:21, Mooney [1] - 227:7 37:3, 37:11, 41:11, moot [1] - 39:24 41:12, 48:15, 137:17, moreover[1] -137:21, 137:29, 203:17 138:4, 138:7, 138:9, morning [13] - 5:4, 138:11, 138:13, 54:11, 62:13, 75:23, 138:17, 138:20, 95:10, 96:11, 108:1, 145:23, 145:27, 108:14, 117:15, 145:29, 146:6, 117:25, 172:20, 157:16, 157:18, 205:26, 222:5 157:23, 157:27, MORRISSEY [1] -158:3, 158:4, 158:7, 2:18 158:11, 158:16, most [12] - 16:5, 158:18, 158:22, 17:23, 55:10, 55:27, 161:27, 162:5, 165:3, 68:2, 86:13, 110:20, 165:13, 165:21, 129:26, 171:4, 165:25, 165:28, 177:14, 212:5, 235:4 166:19, 166:22, motivated [1] - 230:9 168:26, 169:8, 170:7, motivating [1] -170:28, 175:6, 176:8, 182:15 176:16, 176:24, motivation [30] -182:7, 182:26, 78:23, 80:16, 151:27, 185:25, 186:1, 186:5, 152:13, 152:14,

191:19, 191:23, 191:26, 191:28, 192:6, 192:14, 192:18, 192:25, 193:2, 193:19, 193:22, 193:24, 193:28, 195:15, 195:20, 195:22, 195:26, 196:29, 197:18, 198:7, 198:25, 199:10, 200:17, 200:21, 200:24, 201:1, 202:26, 204:26, 204:29, 205:24, 207:6, 207:8, 207:11, 207:13, 207:17, 207:19, 208:12, 208:20, 209:2, 209:5, 209:10, 209:15, 210:19, 210:26, 211:28, 212:2, 212:5, 212:9, 212:22, 213:20, 214:6. 214:12, 214:14, 215:6, 219:5, 219:8, 219:16, 219:20, 220:9, 220:23, 220:25, 220:28, 221:3, 221:8, 221:12, 221:15, 227:24, 227:28, 228:1, 228:7, 228:11. 228:17. 230:22, 230:24, 231:15, 231:21, 231:25, 232:1, 232:4, 232:9, 233:21, 233:25, 233:27, 234:1, 234:8, 234:11, 234:21, 235:1. 235:15 235:25 236:2, 238:25 MRS [1] - 3:1 **MS** [36] - 2:7, 2:7, 2:18, 2:18, 2:27, 4:12, 4:16, 48:11, 48:16, 48:17, 50:13, 50:15, 68:23, 70:27, 71:2, 71:6, 74:5, 74:22, 75:2. 75:5. 75:7. 76:20, 78:16, 84:19, 101:3, 129:10, 137:7, 137:14, 145:22, 145:26, 145:28,

146:5, 199:5, 236:14,

MUIRCHEARTAIGH

mud [1] - 155:10

MULLAN [1] - 2:7

236:16, 236:17

111 - 3:12

Mullingar [1] - 73:5 multimillion [1] -144:2 multiple [1] - 7:11 murder [2] - 173:6, 173.8 MURPHY [1] - 2:14 Murray [2] - 236:19, 237:11 must [8] - 43:15, 70:1. 78:11. 88:4. 154:19, 183:23, 190:8, 240:25 mystified [1] - 84:1 **MÍCHEÁL** [36] - 2:15, 4:15, 138:11, 138:13, 157:16, 158:4, 158:7, 191:28, 200:21, 221:8, 221:12, 221:15, 227:24, 227:28, 228:1, 228:7, 228:11, 228:17, 230:22, 230:24, 231:15, 231:21, 231:25, 232:1, 232:4, 232:9, 233:21, 233:25, 234:1, 234:8, 234:11, 234:21, 235:1, 235:15, 235:25, 236:2

Ν

nail [2] - 75:25, 221:23 name [29] - 18:21, 18:28, 19:1, 24:3, 27:11, 33:15, 36:11, 36:16, 36:19, 37:28, 61:16, 73:29, 77:13, 86:9, 115:10, 125:7, 131:9, 137:18, 138:21, 150:11, 159:12, 159:13, 161:16, 178:6, 181:24, 190:15, 193:7, 214:15 named [7] - 1:27. 9:17, 73:17, 73:18, 79:5, 86:10, 232:18 namely [1] - 189:28 names [1] - 102:12 naming [2] - 85:16, 131:5 narrative [1] - 205:14 nasty [1] - 154:18 national [3] - 94:22, 178:28, 179:3 **natural** [2] - 23:19,

186:9, 190:10,

190:21, 191:15,

152:22, 152:29,

153:12, 153:17,

144:5 neutralised [1] -163:12, 186:2 94:13, 98:17, 111:13 193:28, 195:15, naturally [1] - 35:11 140:2 normal [5] - 18:20, notified [1] - 9:27 195:20, 195:22, nature [34] - 36:8, never[19] - 18:2, 20:24, 105:15, 195:8, **noting** [1] - 110:13 195:26, 196:29, 197:18, 198:7, 38:12, 59:2, 59:3, 41:17, 42:5, 55:11, 222:21 notwithstanding [1] 85:25, 90:18, 118:8. 58:26, 65:15, 72:3, 198:25, 199:10, **normally** [1] - 46:9 - 205:5 200:17, 200:21, 97:25, 98:18, 103:24, 119:25, 120:27, **NORTHUMBERLA** November [1] -104:27, 105:23, 132:20, 135:12, 201:1, 202:26, **ND** [1] - 3:2 12.20 204:26, 204:29, 119:12, 119:26, 148:9, 160:18, now-Taoiseach [1] nose [1] - 152:16 205:24, 207:6, 207:8, 121:1, 125:23, 181:13, 181:28, note [48] - 28:18, 112:24 132:26, 136:27, 190:25, 229:8, 239:18 207:11, 207:13, 28:21, 38:10, 70:20, NUJ [2] - 242:28, 148:24, 149:24, new [13] - 139:22, 207:17, 207:19, 71:7, 75:11, 76:8, 243:1 208:12, 208:20, 151:6, 151:19, 156:24, 159:29, 77:12, 77:18, 78:6, number [28] - 5:14, 153:14, 154:5, 163:5, 209:2, 209:5, 209:10, 174:2, 179:19, 193:6, 78:8, 78:28, 79:14, 7:16, 17:7, 24:6, 46:2, 194:7, 194:29, 209:15, 210:19, 163:17, 163:22, 79:15, 80:1, 83:6, 51:3, 51:5, 51:21, 210:26, 211:28, 165:1, 167:14, 201:18, 205:3, 211:6, 83:23, 84:13, 87:11, 56:19, 56:20, 58:20, 212:2, 212:5, 212:9, 169:27, 177:18, 211:8, 240:17 88:22, 92:6, 92:9, 58:23, 60:15, 67:5, 212:22, 213:20, 214:2, 229:9, 238:4 newcomer [1] -92:10, 92:17, 140:26, 73:27, 166:20, 167:4, near [1] - 149:28 221:8, 221:13, 238:5 141:14, 144:27, 167:7, 168:8, 175:11, 221:15, 227:24, nearly [2] - 45:20, news [7] - 166:29, 145:1, 145:2, 145:8, 181:29, 193:18, 227:28, 228:1, 228:7, 48:26 189:14, 189:22, 145:20, 145:24, 207:25, 219:5, 230:1, 228:11, 228:17, necessarily [31] -197:22, 227:6, 145:25, 145:26, 237:24 230:22, 230:24, 59:20, 91:25, 107:17, 230:28, 232:13 146:11, 146:17, Nóirín [7] - 56:11, 231:15, 231:21, 109:21, 125:3, 125:8, 146:26, 151:13, newspaper [4] -83:10, 109:27, 201:5, 231:25, 232:1, 232:4, 127:26, 139:16, 38:14, 175:16, 151:20, 157:8, 201:9, 211:27, 212:19 232:9. 233:21. 139:17, 139:19, 175:26, 196:4 157:27, 158:9, 233:25, 234:1, 234:8, 143:27, 152:3, 152:5, 183:17, 183:20 newspapers [3] -O 234:11, 234:21, 159:6, 167:25, notebook [1] -53:20, 54:26, 55:15 235:1. 235:15. 169:15, 169:16, 107:28 next [25] - 48:11, o'clock [7] - 22:4, 235:25, 236:2, 238:25 176:28, 186:18, 73:22, 73:23, 75:22, noted [4] - 39:12, 108:13, 227:6, O'Higgins [36] -186:28, 192:28, 76:2, 78:23, 78:29, 144:15, 158:13, 202:1 227:11, 227:14, 138:3, 138:15, 196:7, 204:18, 92:24, 96:20, 103:23, notes [30] - 1:27, 227:17, 228:4 138:21, 157:21, 213:25, 214:27, 104:3, 104:21, 64:26, 65:28, 66:28, O'Connell [1] - 239:5 158:2, 158:6, 161:22, 215:21, 219:15, 104:25, 107:29, 68:1, 68:16, 69:6, O'HIGGINS [127] -237:6, 238:13. 161:26, 164:1, 108:14, 109:25, 69:7, 69:18, 73:20, 2:15, 2:27, 4:13, 4:15, 164:15, 165:10, 239:17. 243:4 109:26, 117:6, 141:3, 75:2, 75:15, 76:5, 138:4, 138:7, 138:11, 170:20, 176:7, 182:8, necessary [5] -146:2, 146:17, 173:6, 78:18, 80:19, 80:25, 138:13, 138:18, 185:22, 186:4, 189:9, 12:10, 28:14, 134:25, 183:11, 215:12, 80:26, 88:20, 117:25, 138:20, 145:23, 189:24, 191:9, 134:26, 134:27 219:17 144:25, 152:1, 145:27, 145:29, 193:18, 193:23, necessity [1] - 29:9 nice [2] - 47:3, 153:10, 155:20, 146:6, 157:16, 195:25, 200:15, 157:5, 160:6, 160:13, need [13] - 32:26, 157:20 157:18, 157:23, 200:16, 200:20, 33:18, 84:3, 94:17, 162:17, 162:19 **night** [5] - 54:11, 157:27, 158:3, 158:4, 202:11, 205:15, 97:27, 108:13, 139:19, 144:1, 155:2, nothing [22] - 31:3, 158:7, 158:11, 208:28, 209:13, 169:20, 170:29, 189:12, 222:10 35:6, 35:16, 48:3, 158:16, 158:22, 210:25, 213:22, 193:28, 194:7. nine [1] - 241:12 48:4, 52:23, 88:10, 161:27, 162:5, 165:3, 214:4, 221:5, 227:22, 197:17, 202:19 **NO**[1] - 3:20 108:16, 147:26, 165:13, 165:21, 235:22, 238:29 needed [3] - 59:24, nobody [4] - 29:13, 147:27, 148:16, 165:25, 165:28, O'Higgins's [2] -94:28, 96:2 148:20, 148:24, 45:23, 47:12, 123:21 166:19, 166:22, 182:18, 212:14 149:17, 169:2, 170:5, negative [7] - 89:21, NOEL [2] - 2:16, 3:15 168:26, 169:8, 170:7, O'Mahony [32] -93:14, 120:29, 170:19. 187:6. Noel [1] - 6:27 170:28, 175:6, 176:8, 14:24, 17:14, 60:9, 154:11, 154:14, 192:13, 192:23, 238:6 Nolan [1] - 74:27 176:16, 176:24, 60:12, 61:4, 65:7, 188:28, 242:19 notice [16] - 6:5, Nolan's [6] - 73:20, 182:7, 182:26, 72:18, 73:9, 83:3, negatively [8] -6:16, 8:2, 8:19, 20:8, 77:18, 78:8, 78:18, 185:25, 186:1, 186:5, 86:12, 86:23, 86:25, 119:11, 120:19, 60:3. 67:3. 68:3. 80:19, 80:26 186:9, 190:10, 86:26. 90:2. 91:28. 122:15, 122:20. 77:26 80:14 82:24 nominating [1] -190:21, 191:15, 92:29, 106:24, 107:1, 122:27, 123:15, 94:24, 98:15, 99:11, 99.20 191:19, 191:23, 107:7, 107:12, 183:7, 211:22 166:11, 226:20 non [1] - 73:9 191:26, 191:28, 107:15, 109:1, net [2] - 189:13, notices [14] - 7:10, non-cooperation [1] 192:6, 192:14, 109:11, 116:23, 237:21 7:11, 7:15, 7:17, 10:6, - 73:9 192:18, 192:25, 178:8, 186:22, neutral [3] - 153:4, 14:18, 14:22, 20:5, none [1] - 172:3 193:2, 193:19, 202:28, 203:10, 208:15 32:3, 66:21, 74:19, nonetheless [2] -193:22, 193:24, 203:27, 204:16,

201:25, 206:4, 204:24, 205:19 6:2, 6:12, 19:3, 95:27, 1:18, 5:1 open [13] - 33:15, O'Mahony's [1] -119:20, 153:28 206:12, 211:8, on-the-record [1] -46:14, 52:28, 90:28, 231:27, 233:3, 233:4, 74:9 occur [10] - 14:8, 134:4 91:22, 93:23, 94:25, 23:24, 23:25, 39:15, 239:26, 240:20 **O'MARA**[1] - 3:2 **once** [12] - 20:28, 118:22, 140:6, O'REILLY [1] - 3:12 175:20, 199:22, Office [45] - 50:27, 21:4, 25:24, 30:25, 140:24, 194:28, 200:6, 204:20, 205:1, 51:27, 52:2, 52:10, 218:25, 220:18 O'Reilly's [1] -33:13, 40:3, 45:7, 228:14 52:11, 53:18, 53:28, 45:8, 140:14, 192:1, open-door[1] -234:16 54:7, 54:10, 54:16, O'Rourke [1] - 94:11 occurred [13] -224:21 52:28 54:17, 54:22, 54:29, 14:13, 37:13, 37:14, one [110] - 9:25, opened [4] - 81:3, O'Sullivan [40] -37:15, 42:8, 84:9, 56:2, 57:12, 58:5, 11:25, 16:23, 17:22, 97:13, 218:22, 225:3 17:10, 49:20, 56:11, 59:12, 59:21, 59:24, 140:20, 160:23, 105:9, 105:16, 17:28, 20:9, 26:22, opening [7] - 21:8, 105:24, 105:29, 65:3, 68:12, 68:20, 171:18, 181:13, 26:29, 31:4, 32:29, 29:3, 60:21, 60:22, 201:20, 205:27, 106:4, 114:23, 133:2, 69:28, 71:4, 71:9, 38:24, 42:8, 43:26, 84:23, 85:22, 230:3 227:16 137:1, 137:8, 138:28, 47:1, 48:28, 50:9, openly [1] - 140:17 71:10, 83:10, 85:28, 147:12, 147:15, 52:3, 52:5, 52:24, occurring[1]-87:9, 87:23, 90:1, operate [5] - 43:10, 160:18. 172:15. 201:22 59:18, 60:1, 61:14, 43:15, 86:24, 241:2, 92:2, 92:5, 92:22, 172:17, 172:23, October [2] - 6:26, 65:10, 66:2, 66:7, 105:10, 109:27, 241:3 172:26, 173:24, 67:5, 67:22, 68:3, 178:8 110:7, 112:20, operated [4] - 6:4, 173:28, 186:23, odd [5] - 149:13, 69:13, 74:18, 78:11, 112:21, 126:13, 6:10, 13:29, 85:20 187:11, 189:1, 189:8, 80:12, 82:10, 82:26, 201:5, 201:9, 201:12, 159:14, 183:21, operates [1] - 54:11 206:3, 213:6, 226:26, 210:3, 211:27, 183:24, 191:25 83:8, 84:20, 84:26, operating [2] -232:6, 232:29 85:12. 88:24. 88:25. 212:19, 212:25, **OF** [4] - 1:3, 1:9, 45:21, 218:26 **OFFICE** [2] - 2:19, 88:26, 91:7, 91:19, 213:3, 213:28, 1.12 2.3 operation [6] - 6:15, 215:13, 215:19, off-the-record [17] -92:2, 94:20, 99:29, 7:26, 8:2, 45:19, office-wise [1] -106:2, 108:5, 108:19, 235:6, 235:10 134:6, 134:10, 50:27, 183:7 112:2, 113:9, 117:8, 119:16 O'Sullivan's [2] -134:13, 134:21, operational [3] -Officer [3] - 6:29, 117:15, 129:26, 134:22, 135:17, 59:9. 69:27 20:6, 55:11, 213:7 118:27, 139:14 130:21, 137:18, obligation [1] -135:19, 136:9, operations [2] -136:17, 174:5, 174:8, officer [23] - 9:27, 142:18, 142:22, 210:16 50:29. 58:20 148:29, 154:16, 174:18, 175:20, 16:11, 40:19, 50:25, obligations [2] -Operations [1] -51:5, 52:7, 52:25, 159:11, 166:21, 143:14, 236:8 176:5, 176:25, 111:3 168:24, 169:4, 55:24, 56:7, 57:6, 176:26, 176:29 **obliged** [2] - 29:4, opinion [8] - 40:17, 170:11, 170:14, 96:27, 124:8, 140:29, offence [7] - 18:24, 176:17 131:4, 179:10, 170:15. 173:28. 142:29, 143:22, 36:28, 38:13, 41:16, obsessed [1] - 196:2 188:17, 188:19, 159:5. 191:11. 177:2, 178:20, 126:27, 154:19, obtained [2] - 44:17, 188:23, 213:3, 242:27 178:24, 181:2, 202:17, 209:18, 175:18 225.9 opportunity [16] -181:15, 186:6, 191:8, 213:10, 213:28, 236:6 offences [18] - 7:19, obvious [6] - 27:20, 21:12, 24:18, 34:12, 191:10, 191:11, officer's [1] - 52:6 40:11, 93:13, 151:14, 9:5, 14:18, 19:7, 38:21, 38:23, 40:8, 191:13, 192:16, 19:16, 19:18, 22:17, officer-based [1] -182:13, 208:3 97:9, 97:21, 110:17, 192:18, 194:14, 142:29 22:19, 23:10, 35:20, obviously [27] -120:20, 122:14, 195:24, 197:16, officers [9] - 7:16, 35:24, 35:26, 35:27, 14:20, 21:4, 33:5, 122:19, 122:27, 198:5, 199:9, 201:2, 36:14, 38:18, 39:7, 50:6, 53:2, 57:29, 44:19, 46:29, 49:26, 123:1, 131:23, 192:1 201:20, 202:4, 39:8, 41:24 60:15, 102:5, 143:7, 51:11, 53:4, 60:9, **opposed** [3] - 19:19, 205:17, 206:11, offer [2] - 97:8, 143.21 87:2, 115:13, 116:2, 152:25 237:22 207:20, 208:15, 219:29 offices [2] - 52:1, 125:22, 133:12, option [1] - 92:4 216:9, 220:12, 222:1, office [49] - 6:14, 133:18, 136:25, options [1] - 218:15 226:4, 229:13, 7:22, 8:25, 9:14, 9:27, official [5] - 49:27, 142:18, 154:1, order [6] - 14:8, 39:9, 229:14, 231:19, 12:2, 12:7, 26:23, 86:26, 106:23, 160:27, 173:17, 50:7, 205:10, 205:11, 233:3, 233:8, 234:3, 128:20, 134:14 181:26, 182:12, 29:8, 40:9, 40:21, 220:6 237:26, 238:2, 239:3, 42:22, 42:25, 47:25, officially [1] - 126:21 189:25, 195:13, organisation [93] -239:20, 240:14, 241:5 203:11, 228:21, 50:11, 52:6, 52:8, often [5] - 26:1, 49:15, 50:7, 50:8, **ONE** [1] - 3:16 52:14, 52:15, 52:19, 27:29, 171:17, 198:2 243:17 50:24, 51:2, 55:12, one's [1] - 191:10 52:20, 54:12, 56:28, Oireachtas [9] occasion [11] - 6:25, 56:9, 56:19, 57:4, one-to-one [1] -64:20 75:20 97:4 5:16, 11:26, 42:27, 16:12, 17:28, 18:4, 57:25, 58:2, 58:3, 114:15, 114:16, 43:9. 47:10. 81:12. 173:28 111:25, 137:6, 58:11, 58:27, 58:28, one-year [1] - 142:18 165:18, 174:7, 119:16, 120:3, 124:5, 95:24, 99:6, 103:7 59:6, 60:1, 60:5, 62:5, ones [3] - 46:4, 46:5, 185:22, 185:23, 234:3 124:7, 165:19, old [1] - 48:3 76:26, 81:18, 86:27, 165:20, 167:10, occasionally [1] omission[1] -91:3, 93:17, 94:19, ongoing [3] - 50:29, 181:29, 185:24, 134:24 192:28 97:18, 99:4, 103:5, 201:21, 201:22, 155:27, 174:29 occasions [7] - 5:26, **ON** [4] - 1:6, 1:10, 115:19, 116:26,

121:16, 121:19, outbreak [1] - 197:19 226:17, 229:11, 81:16, 82:21, 87:17, **PATRICK**[2] - 2:6, 121:23, 123:2, outcome [2] - 104:9, 229:29, 230:4 107:22, 108:23, 124:20, 124:23, 104:28 pack [1] - 57:20 135:14, 139:12, pattern [1] - 112:13 125:29, 126:21, 156:16, 159:3, outlets [1] - 241:14 Paddy [2] - 73:1, Paul [35] - 124:12, 128:29, 132:6, 160:24, 162:7, outline [2] - 48:24, 73:3 125:4, 125:13, 162:18, 164:4, 133:19, 134:16, 217.17 paedophile [5] -125:16, 127:8, 127:9, 134:19, 134:28, 164:16, 165:11, outlined [7] - 9:5, 15:3, 15:12, 22:12, 127:13, 129:16, 170:2, 184:13. 135:1, 139:6, 139:7, 106:26, 109:27, 22:15, 31:16 130:6, 130:13, 139:12, 139:27, 191:28, 199:16, **PAGE**[1] - 4:2 130:24, 168:25, 164:19, 216:20, 142:15, 142:21, 199:18, 210:20 187:5, 189:3, 189:7, 226:26, 238:18 page [50] - 5:6, 142:24, 142:25, outlining [2] -30:21, 35:22, 41:29, participate [3] -189:13, 189:19, 142:28, 143:3, 170:18, 218:2 48:13, 64:5, 66:23, 134:12, 134:22, 189:21, 190:20, 148:13, 151:10, 135:18 output [1] - 231:8 67:14, 69:2, 70:23, 201:3, 206:23, 156:7, 156:12, 71:22, 73:21, 73:22, participated [2] -207:10, 207:14, outside [7] - 26:27, 159:17, 159:18, 229:25, 237:20 207:23, 230:15, 73:23, 74:18, 75:15, 44:21, 59:10, 104:6, 159:20, 160:1, 160:3, 174:27, 179:8, 215:28 76:6, 77:19, 78:4, particular [33] - 24:5, 232:21, 232:29, 161:23, 162:4, 25:5, 25:11, 47:1, 233:1, 233:5, 233:9, 78:17, 78:19, 78:21, outsider [1] - 240:17 164:25, 164:26, 53:17, 56:4, 56:26, 78:23, 78:29, 79:16, 233:15, 234:4, outward [1] - 202:3 164:27, 164:28, 234:15, 234:25, 237:8 86:6, 94:4, 102:8, 57:15, 60:23, 66:16, overall [1] - 235:2 166:10, 177:9, 68:18, 77:11, 80:16, **PAUL**[1] - 2:10 108:10, 110:4, oversee [1] - 97:17 179:12, 180:7, 180:8, 111:20, 112:29, 95:29, 98:2, 102:15, pause [2] - 153:22, oversight[1] - 64:20 180:18, 181:5, 102:17, 106:29, overview [1] - 64:10 113:6, 114:23, 200:28 181:11, 181:12, 118:23, 119:27, 123:27, 130:3, 135:6, paw [6] - 143:10, own [20] - 15:1, 182:11, 182:19, 123:9, 129:11, 141:20, 147:2, 238:22, 238:26, 16:17, 23:15, 38:4, 183:5. 195:3. 202:13. 152:28, 154:18, 140:25, 140:26, 238:29 39:24, 55:2, 115:22, 205:3, 206:14, 160:8. 161:17. 141:3. 146:2. 166:20. paws [1] - 239:4 117:25, 128:10, 206:15, 217:20, 193:2, 193:15, 168:12, 172:26, 133:7, 139:8, 147:4. peculiarities [1] -218:8, 233:19, 238:5, 173:8, 175:19, 193:18, 194:1, 199:6 139:9 161:16, 165:29, 239:14, 240:29 pages [1] - 241:27 185:23, 224:2 PEMBROKE [1] -174:18, 195:18, organisation" [1] paid [1] - 197:4 particularly [12] -211:9, 229:14, 243:12 234:7 25:23, 53:19, 59:22, paper [2] - 45:9 penalty [27] - 20:4, organisation's [14] -87:7, 108:28, 116:14, papers [3] - 20:13, P 24:28, 46:1, 60:3, 67:21, 72:24, 97:15, 133:10, 133:11, 141:12, 226:14 61:9, 63:23, 66:21, 97:20. 108:24. 159:15, 164:20, paragraph [5] -67:2, 68:3, 71:13, 108:26, 108:27, PAC [74] - 25:25. 180:25, 226:3 13:16, 31:13, 77:6, 77:26, 80:14, 82:24, 115:16, 123:4, 25:28, 25:29, 26:1, parties [5] - 98:25, 140:26 94:13, 94:24, 98:17, 124:10, 129:24, 26:2, 33:27, 60:14, 127:23, 127:25, paragraph-by-99:11, 111:13, 159:3, 131:27, 151:10, 60:20, 60:25, 61:16, 193:29, 224:24 paragraph [1] - 13:16 168:2, 178:4, 179:7, 217:18 partly [4] - 185:19, 67:23, 68:26, 69:12, 179:8, 185:10, paragraphs [2] organisational [2] -70:11, 71:17, 75:20, 190:5, 203:28 230:10, 239:21 30:9. 30:19 72:24, 240:7 76:23, 81:7, 81:9, **PARTNERS**[1] - 3:9 parameters [1] **people** [46] - 16:26, organisations [4] -81:12, 82:6, 82:12, parts [2] - 38:24, 17:3, 17:17, 28:29, 120:4 49:1, 133:5, 139:22, 82.14 83.13 84.18 118:22 62:6, 63:13, 63:14, parapet [1] - 177:12 174:15 86:5, 86:19, 86:24, party [8] - 18:17, 63:21, 65:12, 87:19, paraphrasing [1] -88:6, 89:11, 91:14, organised [3] -18:19. 26:24. 63:8. 96:14, 105:18, 220:15 231:26, 234:13, 235:6 93:8, 93:9, 95:16, 63:18, 96:16, 177:2, 117:15, 132:18, pardon [7] - 145:25, origin [2] - 151:13, 95:23, 97:9, 97:10, 224:10 134:17, 135:9, 145:27, 157:13, 203:24 97:16, 97:22, 98:16, passed [2] - 92:6, 139:11, 148:17, 157:29, 198:25, 99:2, 103:2, 103:9, original [3] - 30:9, 149:5, 149:7, 159:8, 153:20 231:15, 233:21 103:12, 104:17, 30:20, 154:2 PASSED[1] - 1:5 159:19, 159:22, Park [1] - 52:12 106:27. 108:22. originally [1] passing [4] - 25:24, 159:23, 159:27, park [1] - 98:24 113:23, 117:26, 224:23 92:9, 121:8, 121:11 172:13, 184:23, PARLIAMENT[1] -**OSMOND** [2] - 2:19, 144:13, 150:9, 195:19, 196:12, passive [2] - 142:9, 2:29 2:24 150:28, 151:2, 151:7, 200.6 203.13 142.11 parliamentary [1] -151:9, 152:4, 152:8, OTHER [1] - 1:4 210:13, 210:17, past [6] - 19:20, 26:3 152:12, 156:23, otherwise [8] -99:29, 104:7, 134:3, 211:14, 211:15, part [36] - 5:18, 8:5, 161:8, 162:24, 13:28, 22:13, 99:12, 232:24, 233:16 211:18, 211:19, 9:21, 14:26, 20:22, 178:17, 196:15, 116:25, 123:5, 219:13, 222:7, pathologist[1] -21:8. 23:23. 31:9. 214:18, 214:20, 158:25, 169:22, 225:19, 238:13, 46:25, 52:1, 52:11, 173:16 217:22, 218:2, 218:7, 199:24 239:27, 240:4, 240:8, 52:20, 68:2, 68:13, paths [1] - 40:3 218:11, 225:6,

242:17 personal [12] - 14:1, 226:19, 232:23, politics [3] - 206:12, 108:16, 110:28, per [2] - 86:14, 26:13, 61:21, 76:10, 233:16 211:8, 239:27 122:6, 123:1, 124:27, 156:13 89:17, 113:16, placed [1] - 199:22 portfolios [2] - 111:5 124:29, 127:28, plagued [1] - 175:8 152:21, 187:28, perceived [3] -121:21, 157:15, portion [1] - 28:26 158:14, 176:3, 158:27, 211:3, 212:22 plain [2] - 163:19, 212:6, 233:19, 234:6 portrayed [1] -217:21, 242:27 percent [2] - 102:5, 163:20 116:28 potentially [18] personalise [1] -15:10, 89:21, 99:6, planned [1] - 152:6 position [53] - 13:23, 102:14. 116:27. perception [3] planning [1] - 130:8 23:19, 35:2, 41:21, 128:19, 129:23, personally [3] -90:29, 91:26, 95:28 play [2] - 185:2, 49:24, 55:14, 86:26, 93:21, 139:18, 139:21 135:12, 152:1, 93:17, 95:12, 108:24, perfectly [4] - 13:3, 241:9 28:11, 38:7, 176:12 persons [2] - 144:25, 108:26, 108:28, 155:27, 162:16, played [1] - 15:14 162:17, 177:4, 177:5, performance [1] -216:4 plums [1] - 47:28 108:29, 109:19, 194:28, 195:1, 220:6, 219:3 perspective [13] -109:24, 112:17, plural [1] - 19:17 243:13 performed [1] -89:8, 125:25, 129:8, plus [2] - 161:27, 112:18, 112:19, powerful [1] - 200:4 134:28, 175:29, 115:11, 116:23, 206:19 161:29 180:24, 181:7, 181:8, 116:24, 116:27, powers [1] - 43:19 perhaps [36] - 23:20. poem [1] - 239:4 PR [8] - 48:28, 49:3, 208:21, 232:20, 120:1, 123:4, 133:29, 25:24, 34:4, 39:16, point [38] - 11:24, 237:28 135:1, 138:22, 50:19, 110:3, 121:15, 39:17, 46:19, 47:5, 13:24, 14:9, 16:28, 142:10, 151:25, 128:26, 181:20 47:21, 47:22, 47:24, persuade [3] - 93:1, 19:24, 29:6, 29:7, 164:18, 165:21, 74:17, 114:8, 132:27, 103:2, 103:11 practice [6] - 46:6, 29:22, 31:28, 32:29, 180:6, 183:21, 55:8, 95:22, 96:25, 135:26, 140:1, persuaded [2] -38:24, 41:25, 46:24, 201:18, 202:2, 145:21, 146:2, 199:12, 238:23 48:5, 56:22, 66:16, 135:20, 174:10 205:12, 211:9, practices [3] - 8:27, 148:25, 163:22, persuading [1] -79:27, 80:4, 86:11, 211:26, 213:14, 38:3, 59:15 163:29, 164:13, 225.11 106:2, 119:23, 173:7, 175:6, 175:17, PETER [4] - 1:12, 216:23, 217:18, praise [1] - 111:22 128:26, 143:8, 218:15, 219:29, 178:12, 182:14, 2:2, 2:4, 3:5 159:22. 160:29. pre [7] - 60:14, 221:1, 222:19, 223:2, 191:15, 198:10, petitioned [1] - 20:11 162:6, 180:15, 61:16, 68:26, 69:12, 223:28, 223:29, 200:7, 204:19, 181:19, 182:7, 188:3, 161:8, 229:11, 229:29 phase [1] - 140:14 224:13, 224:18, 219:17, 229:16, pre-PAC [1] - 161:8 Phoenix [1] - 52:12 193:27, 205:17, 238:1, 238:11, 225:14, 225:19, phone [17] - 6:14, precise [1] - 30:17 220:26, 228:6. 238:12, 239:7 237:26 59:28, 97:6, 97:7, 228:16, 240:6, 240:7, precisely [1] - 179:4 positive [5] - 85:19, period [6] - 58:11, 101:29, 130:24, 240:16 predecessor [5] -110:18, 111:27, 142:16, 142:17, 168:9, 169:22, pointed [1] - 142:1 6:2, 6:5, 17:21, 17:29, 187:10, 206:3, 207:9, 121:19, 236:27 143:5, 168:11, 211:15 points [17] - 20:4, 25:25 permanent [2] -24:28, 38:5, 38:24, possession [1] -207:25, 213:18, prefer [2] - 176:2, 9:14 16:3, 25:27 217:5, 219:27, 226:22 42:10, 61:9, 63:23, possibilities [2] permission [1] phoning [1] - 168:2 71:13, 110:19, 159:4, preferred [2] - 197:3 103:6 231:19, 237:24 168:3, 178:5, 179:7, photograph [2] prejudice [1] possibility [7] perpetrated [1] -179:8, 185:10, 204:14 194:1, 194:6 31:21, 154:7, 219:22, 175:18 phrase [8] - 30:10, 230:10, 239:22 premise [2] - 158:9, 225:5, 238:8, 238:9, perpetually [1] -143:9, 143:12, 145:9, polarised [1] -159:21 238:16 163:15 174:11, 182:21, 224:12 preparation [9] possible [15] - 37:12, person [35] - 27:22, 186:18, 188:22 **police** [5] - 135:23, 8:21, 61:24, 64:2, 37:15, 85:4, 85:5, 47:7, 56:21, 105:24, 161:4, 191:12, phraseology [1] -68:2. 68:7. 72:26. 105:26, 106:1, 118:5, 101:24, 101:27, 148:6 202:13, 236:3 82:21, 88:15, 90:16 137:27, 140:17, 123:13, 123:16, phrases [1] - 238:20 Police [1] - 206:5 prepare [10] - 60:18, 154:16, 179:23, 135:5, 142:8, 143:18, physical [3] - 52:1, policemen [1] -60:23, 66:13, 75:20, 179:27, 180:2, 143:24, 148:22, 52:22, 119:16 83:24 83:15, 84:16, 110:28, 181:23, 191:21, 215:3 148:29, 173:7, 122:4, 150:27, 222:7 policies [1] - 205:4 pick [3] - 128:14, possibly [3] - 39:12, 180:10, 181:27, 188:10, 230:26 policing [1] - 65:26 prepared [19] - 5:19, 182:11, 182:15. 194:6, 217:26 7:6, 23:3, 45:25, picked [1] - 136:6 policy [9] - 12:8, post [4] - 5:11, 7:1, 182:17, 182:20, picking [1] - 188:4 12:11, 43:22, 52:28, 46:26, 65:10, 66:19, 186:24, 186:27, 138:27, 177:27 66:25, 81:18, 85:3, piece [1] - 31:11 65:26, 133:25, potato [1] - 163:12 186:28, 191:10, 162:19, 183:7, 201:10 85:5, 95:11, 120:5, place [16] - 26:27, 191:11, 191:13, potential [25] -122:9, 136:22, political [4] - 47:22, 70:26, 125:24, 202:14, 205:28, 29:16, 66:19, 67:1, 205:18, 218:1, 218:5, 163:13, 163:14, 47:23, 93:15, 206:14 211:8, 211:9, 211:11, 67:22, 70:17, 81:10, 230:7 163:22, 163:23, politicians [8] -242:6, 243:15 81:17, 84:17, 99:5, preparing [8] -171:16, 174:19, 45:16, 89:12, 94:27, 101:28, 107:25, person's [2] -32:18, 60:20, 97:3, 185:26, 192:3, 150:22, 151:4, 151:9, 180:20, 180:29 107:26, 108:2, 226:11, 226:12, 151:12, 152:26 117:26, 151:7, 151:8,

154:1, 156:23	137:8, 138:28,	158:2	properly [8] - 37:5,	241:15
presence [2] - 143:2,	139:14, 147:12,	procedure [9] - 10:2,	106:7, 126:6, 131:11,	proximity [3] - 52:23,
186:15	147:15, 160:18,	11:4, 20:24, 55:6,	132:6, 188:6, 231:7,	119:16, 215:23
present [20] - 11:26,	172:15, 172:17,	179:9, 200:6, 201:10,	232:11	Public [22] - 16:6,
21:9, 21:28, 55:24,	172:23, 172:26,	203:8, 203:9	proposal [4] - 62:22,	22:2, 42:3, 42:14,
69:14, 89:26, 114:9,	173:24, 173:28,	procedures [6] -	93:24, 93:29, 95:7	60:2, 60:16, 61:24,
119:19, 123:13,	186:23, 187:10,	8:26, 32:16, 38:3,	proposed [2] -	64:3, 66:12, 66:17,
123:21, 144:25,	188:29, 189:8, 206:2,	45:27, 113:19, 205:4	99:19, 241:26	66:20, 71:20, 72:26,
145:16, 154:23,	213:5, 226:26, 232:6,	proceedings [1] -	proposing [1] -	73:12, 82:22, 84:23,
165:13, 206:27,	232:28	200:28	94:10	88:15, 104:12,
206:28, 225:26,	pressing [1] - 46:23	process [28] - 10:16,	proposition [2] -	113:12, 146:14,
227:11, 229:19,	pressure [4] - 90:23,	20:28, 40:20, 44:3,	177:23, 177:24	185:29, 196:18
240:28	221:6, 238:13, 240:3	76:29, 77:2, 81:16,	prosecution [7] -	public [63] - 6:11,
presentation [1] -	pressurised [1] -	82:13, 84:26, 85:20,	42:4, 81:26, 82:1,	15:29, 17:24, 17:29,
222:22	240:4	89:24, 94:24, 94:26,	126:27, 154:27,	19:3, 31:26, 32:18,
presented [12] - 7:6,	presumably [1] -	94:29, 107:27,	185:17, 190:3	33:2, 46:8, 46:10,
7:22, 8:9, 9:5, 10:17,	147:19	113:18, 114:11,	Prosecutions [4] -	47:14, 48:28, 49:2,
10:20, 14:5, 20:27,	presume [4] - 23:13,	121:16, 133:23,	42:3, 42:15, 146:15,	56:22, 60:4, 62:1,
35:15, 39:25, 46:10,	29:10, 79:8, 210:14	133:24, 139:12,	185:29	62:2, 85:10, 89:12,
68:25	presumed [1] -	142:18, 142:24,	protect [6] - 50:8,	90:26, 94:27, 103:9,
presenter [1] -	236:20	189:21, 195:5,	86:9, 180:7, 181:11,	103:14, 105:27,
223:23	presumes [1] - 42:8	211:16, 217:28, 241:4	243:4, 243:15	113:11, 113:18,
presenters [6] -	presuming [1] -	processes [1] -	protected [6] -	116:2, 116:28, 117:8,
62:19, 62:22, 63:14,	68:22	133:28	133:24, 133:28,	117:10, 118:5,
222:13, 223:2, 223:14	presumption [1] -	procured [1] - 44:19	202:29, 203:3, 203:9,	118:10, 118:29,
press [59] - 50:25,	83:27	procurement [2] -	203:23	119:19, 120:2,
51:5, 52:6, 52:7,	preventing [1] -	44:15, 128:4	PROTECTED [2] -	133:21, 133:22,
52:25, 53:2, 53:29,	232:21	produced [3] -	1:3, 1:4	133:26, 133:27,
54:6, 54:12, 54:14,	previous [13] - 7:24,	31:25, 81:1, 144:10	Protected [1] - 204:6	134:28, 135:21,
55:24, 56:7, 57:6,	17:24, 49:6, 49:17,	product [1] - 229:28	protecting [1] -	150:8, 151:1, 161:20,
57:22, 58:20, 60:8,	51:5, 115:12, 138:24,	production [11] -	126:4	175:4, 176:3, 176:27,
62:28, 94:21, 96:26,	138:26, 171:23,	62:13, 62:18, 62:19,	Protection [3] - 12:2,	188:4, 188:7, 191:5,
107:9, 111:14,	178:29, 185:7, 191:2,	221:17, 221:25,	12:15, 57:24	195:19, 198:3,
111:16, 113:4, 119:5,	217:1	222:2, 222:26, 223:3,	protection [5] -	199:13, 217:22,
124:8, 127:26,	previously [8] -	223:8, 223:14	12:13, 67:8, 97:19,	225:29, 240:6,
140:29, 148:5,	17:16, 17:26, 186:19,	Professional [1] -	99:7, 228:23	242:25, 243:16,
166:10, 166:11,	187:8, 197:2, 207:24,	65:17	protections [1] -	243:20
166:12, 166:16,	213:27, 236:10	professional [10] -	42:25	public's [1] - 188:22
166:17, 166:24,	price [1] - 135:26	40:24, 121:25,	prove [2] - 139:23,	public-minded [1] -
172:11, 172:13,	priest [1] - 15:12	121:26, 131:4, 140:3,	139:24	195:19
173:12, 176:16,	primarily [3] - 97:27,	143:6, 191:6, 202:24,	proved [1] - 36:27	publication [5] -
176:22, 181:29,	217:26, 241:22	236:7, 239:15	provide [14] - 29:9,	12:1, 15:1, 31:13,
195:22, 201:14,	primary [2] - 16:12,	profile [4] - 54:3,	50:4, 50:22, 105:27,	33:10, 131:26
209:18, 213:10,	103:10	60:1, 88:5, 104:12	134:27, 136:20,	publicity [1] - 62:5
213:28, 226:10,	principally [1] - 50:5	programme [18] -	136:26, 137:8,	publicly [8] - 8:12,
226:15, 226:18,	printed [1] - 187:22	14:10, 62:11, 62:13,	143:19, 163:6,	86:10, 117:3, 117:5,
226:27, 227:1, 227:4,	private [5] - 117:9,	63:15, 63:25, 105:17,	172:17, 212:26,	175:4, 177:7, 177:8
227:10, 227:16,	193:11, 225:15,	105:25, 106:8, 196:4,	236:8, 239:12	publish [2] - 231:18,
228:13, 229:1, 229:2,	225:29, 240:11	221:28, 222:5, 222:6,	provided [19] - 5:23,	242:16
229:4, 229:8, 241:28	privilege [5] -	222:9, 222:29,	8:10, 27:22, 27:24,	published [8] -
Press [47] - 50:27,	135:26, 136:11,	223:14, 224:17, 227:7	28:7, 35:17, 39:20,	11:19, 11:25, 14:27,
51:27, 52:1, 52:9,	136:13, 136:15,	progress [1] - 175:1	57:19, 57:21, 68:11,	33:11, 124:23, 201:6,
52:10, 52:11, 53:18,	176:13	project [1] - 44:25	68:25, 99:5, 103:9,	222:17, 242:2
53:28, 54:7, 54:10,	privy [2] - 96:16,	projects [1] - 47:24	109:4, 128:7, 132:1,	publishing [1] -
54:15, 54:17, 54:22,	219:26	promote [1] - 189:1	157:6, 206:23	243:14
54:29, 56:2, 57:12,	proactive [1] -	prompt [2] - 67:26,	provides [1] - 243:7	pull [1] - 150:2
58:5, 105:9, 105:16,	208:11	91:28	providing [6] - 71:19,	Pulse [6] - 7:9, 10:7,
105:23, 105:28,	probation [2] -	prompted [3] -	91:18, 134:18, 143:6,	14:2, 203:11, 203:13,
106:3, 114:23,	142:16, 142:17	10:24, 35:8, 37:22	242:8, 243:5	203:19
118:27, 133:2, 137:1,	problem [2] - 36:25,	proper [1] - 82:21	provincial [1] -	PURCELL [1] - 2:22

Purcell [4] - 218:25, qualifying [1] quickly [5] - 18:21, react [2] - 19:5, 192:26, 193:5, 218:28, 220:11, 221:3 144:17 186:26, 188:15, 242:4 206:21, 206:27, purely [1] - 173:3 quashed [1] - 20:12 203:12, 235:2 reacted [2] - 192:9, 206:28, 210:4, 213:17, 216:27, 229:8 purpose [11] - 24:9, quashing [1] - 32:3 quite [21] - 8:15, 202:17 **QUAY**[3] - 2:12, 27:18, 29:3, 37:5, recent [3] - 54:3, 24:21, 29:2, 102:28, reaction [20] - 23:19, 113:12, 175:8 103:1, 103:10, 3:10 3:17 41:1, 43:6, 46:23, 67:10, 90:13, 91:5, 139:25, 176:29, 77:4, 90:22, 111:10, 97:12, 122:6, 122:10, recently [1] - 222:17 queries [27] - 50:28, 217:14, 217:23, 51:27, 53:19, 53:22, 118:13, 120:23, 125:1, 125:2, 142:28, recipient [5] - 76:29, 124:7, 129:15, 190:7, 190:12, 79:6, 133:23, 203:8, 225:10 53:23, 53:29, 54:6, 132:29, 153:11, 190:14, 190:29, 205:6 purposes [2] - 12:10, 54:13. 54:15. 54:20. 146:21 54:21, 54:23, 54:25, 161:6, 168:17, 191:1, 191:9, 191:13, recognise [2] pursue [1] - 176:24 55:10, 55:11, 55:15, 172:12, 213:27, 201:16, 202:1, 208:7 17:23, 240:27 pushed [1] - 92:16 55:23, 55:29, 107:22, 220.27 reactionary [2] recollect [5] - 21:18, 118:27, 119:2 quotation [2] - 30:4, put [68] - 24:7, 24:17, 108:3, 119:6, 120:15, 179:4, 182:27, 210:10 reactive [1] - 208:11 120:19, 120:26, recollection [47] -24:25, 28:5, 34:12, 127:18, 132:22, quote [1] - 84:11 35:4, 35:28, 37:1, read [16] - 60:8, 60:9, 7:20, 15:8, 18:11, 141:20 61:4, 69:21, 69:22, 18:16, 19:16, 19:18, 37:12, 38:6, 38:26, query [11] - 108:16, R 40:5, 41:13, 51:10, 73:24, 75:14, 78:28, 19:21, 22:3, 26:20, 54:20, 62:4, 83:28, 124:8, 124:11, 92:13, 106:17, 113:9, 38:9, 61:12, 63:26, 85:4, 94:13, 101:4, 125:14, 128:17, 175:25, 188:15, 64:15, 64:19, 64:25, radio [2] - 93:25, 133:2, 188:13, 193:5, 193:22, 193:26, 219:7 65:16, 65:29, 68:10, 102:1, 105:8, 105:26, 172:20 107:8, 111:26, 118:3, 194:28, 195:1, 229:8 readily [2] - 59:12, 68:14, 82:16, 86:1, railroaded [1] - 13:3 110:27, 110:29, question-marks [1] -118:9, 118:17, 59:13 railway [3] - 43:24, 125:21, 128:21, 89:22 112:27, 125:13, reading [1] - 188:4 44:9, 44:19 135:9, 145:4, 145:21, questionability [1] ready [1] - 143:15 125:17, 125:26, raise [8] - 36:5, 149:29, 150:18, 34:28 reality [1] - 140:29 126:1, 149:1, 150:2, 36:10, 36:13, 88:21, 150:26, 152:25, 155:4, 157:12, questionable [2] really [22] - 8:29, 151:13, 168:19, 160:26, 161:25, 152:28, 152:29, 34:18. 37:18 27:1, 78:14, 83:19, 202:6, 234:19 153:24, 168:23, 161:29, 163:19, QUESTIONED [4] -84:3, 103:18, 103:23, raised [15] - 7:24, 164:14, 166:24, 169:16, 169:21, 4:8, 4:17, 42:19, 103:26, 106:2, 18:21, 18:28, 31:21, 177:2, 177:11, 237:15 119:22, 125:20, 170:9, 171:14, 179:6, 36:15, 36:18, 62:24, 184:17, 197:10, 177:17, 187:14. questioned [1] -135:22, 136:7, 63:24, 88:23, 89:22, 189:3, 189:25, 201:21, 226:18, 35:22 174:11, 180:16, 105:9, 162:9, 170:1, 191:16, 191:29, 226:29, 230:6 195:18, 195:24, questioning [2] -201:15, 202:29 193:14, 193:25, recommendation [2] 90:23, 171:15 197:16, 204:20, raises [1] - 47:26 198:21, 199:17, - 51:20, 126:25 214:8, 214:10 questions [58] raising [2] - 127:17, 208:15, 208:20, recommendations realm [1] - 47:2 18:23, 19:6, 19:22, 208:22, 212:3, 214:1, [2] - 46:7, 46:11 reason [18] - 27:25, 22:11, 23:26, 23:29, ran [1] - 170:17 221:6, 226:19, recommended [1] -24:6, 24:9, 25:3, 34:8, 28:6, 33:2, 39:27, rang [6] - 95:9, 226:28, 227:11, 46:29, 52:22, 61:25, 81:26 34:27, 37:18, 47:26, 130:6, 187:10, 233:1, 238:26, 60:23, 66:19, 66:24, 110:24, 119:22, record [26] - 14:3, 188:25, 205:26, 225:1 239:24, 243:13 114:25, 121:14, 140:11, 150:5, 150:6, 66:28, 67:2, 67:6, rank [1] - 51:22 putting [23] - 54:13, 128:21, 134:4, 134:6, 67:13, 67:19, 67:22, 150:12, 152:18, ranking [1] - 142:5 120:28, 126:16, 134:10, 134:13, 67:26, 68:8, 68:10, 155:4, 219:16, rapidly [1] - 184:27 127:21, 135:5, 151:1, 134:21, 134:22, 68:15, 68:28, 81:10, 220:10, 222:8 rarely [1] - 74:21 161:29, 163:8, 163:9, 135:17, 135:19, 81:11, 81:19, 81:20, reasonable [1] rather [10] - 19:27, 163:15, 163:29, 135:25, 136:9, 82:10, 83:16, 84:17, 153:21 165:3, 165:16, 29:10, 37:26, 44:5, 136:17, 137:9, 85:4, 85:6, 88:25, reasons [4] - 27:20, 165:26, 177:23, 58:28, 69:21, 141:23, 161:20, 174:5, 174:8, 88:29, 96:2, 107:25, 39:1, 157:22, 208:4 150:2, 155:16, 203:8 182:25, 189:9, 174:18, 175:20, 137:14, 138:8, recalling [1] - 171:2 192:19, 193:26, **RE** [4] - 4:7, 4:16, 138:11, 140:17, 176:5, 176:25, receipted [1] - 12:26 41:11, 236:16 200:19, 227:15, 176:26, 176:29 151:8, 151:11, receive [4] - 53:18, 230.2 235.9 re [1] - 66:20 recorded [4] - 20:12, 156:18, 156:19, 57:15, 132:22, 133:2 puzzled [1] - 78:11 RE-EXAMINED [4] -75:18, 77:23, 207:26 174:17, 185:1, received [29] - 6:20, puzzling [1] - 38:18 195:29. 200:24. 4:7, 4:16, 41:11, recording [2] -6:26, 7:2, 9:9, 10:22, 202:6, 209:11, 236:16 106:29, 208:17 11:5, 11:6, 11:10, Q 214:16, 224:14, reach [2] - 192:23, records [3] - 14:2, 11:16, 11:18, 12:16, 221:1 236:14, 237:17 12:22, 12:27, 30:25, 32:19, 77:21 reached [2] - 223:3, quick [3] - 92:15, recover [1] - 170:22 40:14, 123:22, 124:9, qualify [2] - 30:8, 193:20, 201:3 224:2 recruit [1] - 48:18 133:4, 158:27, 168:8, 34:10

redacted [1] - 75:3 175:8 112:14, 112:28, relay [1] - 140:21 199:26, 233:24, 234:1 redundant [1] regretted [1] -113:4, 114:13, relayed [2] - 165:15, repeated [1] - 149:9 204:19 116:16 114:14, 117:9, 187:25 reply [5] - 11:16, 117:21, 117:24, refer [6] - 27:10, **regular** [7] - 53:6, release [13] - 94:22, 24:18, 34:13, 35:5, 59:22, 137:3, 137:4, 117:25, 118:7, 118:8, 194.10 31:22, 86:25, 131:9, 107:9, 111:14, 119:24, 120:14, 171:23, 191:2 171:29, 172:12, 220:5 111:16, 112:28, report [74] - 8:8, regularly [4] - 20:20, 120:26, 120:29, referable [1] - 200:7 113:5, 166:11, 8:11, 8:21, 10:12, 121:5, 121:22, reference [40] - 9:24, 52:29, 168:17, 172:10 166:12, 166:16, 10:17, 10:20, 10:27, 121:23, 121:28, Reilly [1] - 232:29 166:24, 229:2, 229:4 11:1, 11:2, 11:5, 11:6, 15:13, 15:18, 20:9, reins [2] - 142:13, 122:5, 122:13, 123:5, 11:18, 11:22, 11:24, 32:12, 32:15, 33:14, released 151 -35:9, 35:19, 41:16, 210:4 124:14, 124:21, 172:23, 172:25, 11:25, 11:28, 12:1, 125:4, 125:6, 126:15, 70:29, 72:5, 72:14, reiterate [1] - 113:23 198:20, 217:21, 14:27, 15:2, 16:16, 127:1, 127:5, 127:22, 73:16, 73:17, 74:16, 226:25 17:14, 17:15, 17:20, reiterated [1] -129:11, 130:10, 18:9, 19:11, 19:24, 76:17, 78:22, 83:4, 115:16 releases [2] - 54:14. 130:12, 130:13, 19:27, 20:10, 21:9, 105:15, 108:18, 57:22 reiteration [2] -131:5, 131:22, 132:2, 23:20, 24:28, 26:14, 113:15, 116:14, releasing [1] - 115:9 115.12 182.5 132:4, 132:17, 27:12, 27:19, 30:6, 144:3, 145:10, reject [1] - 143:22 relevance [8] -132:23, 132:24, 31:14, 32:13, 33:1, 146:12, 146:23, relate [2] - 72:7, 30:28, 31:10, 76:2, 133:3, 133:7, 133:20, 150:22, 153:10, 180:16, 180:17, 35:6, 35:16, 37:22, 214:17 134:8, 136:28, 137:9, 37:29, 38:2, 39:24, 155:21, 157:8, 209:11, 219:18, related [13] - 7:7, 137:19, 148:15, 158:10, 187:28, 39:25, 39:26, 40:12, 227:24 15:23, 15:24, 17:20, 149:18, 150:28, 40:25, 40:26, 46:4, 188:1, 193:15, 194:6, 41:6, 70:13, 71:17, relevant [15] - 7:26, 199:24, 200:5, 200:6, 150:29, 151:20, 50:26, 51:18, 51:20, 71:19, 77:15, 77:16, 22:26, 27:28, 31:7, 152:23, 154:6, 221:19 60:10, 61:4, 62:25, 33:13, 169:6, 180:21, 144:23, 168:7, 228:21 162:25. 167:17. 62:29, 65:10, 86:12, referenced [1] -180:25, 181:1, 181:4, relates [5] - 76:14, 167:19, 167:20, 86:23, 86:25, 86:26, 153:9 77:5, 77:10, 214:17, 181:6, 181:7, 203:13, 169:10, 170:23, 109:29, 110:9, references [3] -214.19 228:11, 238:22 171:6, 171:24, 179:2, 110:29, 111:1, 111:6, 31:24, 69:12, 82:28 reliance [2] - 20:5, relating [3] - 120:26, 179:17, 180:5, 180:8, 116:23, 141:14, referencing [1] -133:3, 160:15 183:2, 185:7, 185:10, 175:16, 202:21, 178:5 relied [5] - 9:22, relation [191] - 5:15, 189:8, 191:22, 199:8, 205:19, 224:15, referred [6] - 21:18, 19:10, 35:14, 35:17, 5:19, 6:4, 9:1, 11:6, 199:9, 202:20, 227:14 85:8, 105:8, 112:2, 11:22, 12:5, 12:6, 38:4 211:12. 212:24. reported [6] - 5:22, 161:17, 175:9 reluctant [1] - 163:24 13:4, 15:3, 15:11, 214:16, 215:7, 6:3, 14:11, 175:11, referring [4] - 21:24, rely [1] - 37:29 15:14, 15:25, 16:29, 216:15, 217:13, 178:11. 203:17 41:4, 120:14, 166:18 20:3, 22:6, 22:8, 23:5, remained [1] -217:18, 218:7, 219:8, reporter's [1] refers [10] - 75:13, 213:10 23:10, 23:11, 23:15, 219:22, 220:10, 111:12 77:12, 78:6, 79:21, 24:5, 28:12, 29:9, remark [4] - 90:9, 220:22, 221:28, reporters [3] -80:1, 88:26, 113:11, 32:21, 32:28, 35:19, 113:5, 156:4, 225:3 224:3, 229:10, 110:19, 111:23, remarks [8] - 30:11, 114:28, 146:24 36:24, 44:8, 49:1, 229:15, 229:28, 111:28 reflect [6] - 11:9, 50:28, 51:10, 51:29, 30:12, 225:4, 226:28, 230:15. 232:4. reporting [8] - 50:25, 21:2, 21:13, 108:24, 53:9, 54:6, 55:29, 227:5, 238:11, 238:17 232:21, 238:10, 51:1, 51:9, 55:6, 151:13, 229:18 56:15, 57:14, 57:25, remedial [1] - 91:19 239:8, 239:21 202:14, 202:20, reflected [1] - 21:14 58:2, 60:12, 60:14, remember [22] relations [8] - 49:2, 204:28. 232:23 reflective [3] -60:20, 61:21, 62:29, 27:8, 33:1, 63:23, 56:22, 135:21. reports [17] - 6:11, 109:24, 110:2, 229:6 64:27, 67:2, 70:17, 85:29, 90:10, 91:5, 174:28, 176:27, 7:25, 14:16, 15:2, refresh [1] - 190:22 71:18, 72:13, 75:26, 92:24, 97:5, 101:20, 191:6, 223:12, 240:6 16:7, 31:5, 31:15, regard [22] - 9:18, 75:28, 76:23, 79:16, 102:25, 124:5, relationship [27] -32:14, 32:20, 32:23, 79:28, 80:6, 80:7, 15:7, 29:12, 80:25, 132:25, 150:3, 163:1, 40:18, 41:1, 45:17, 32:28, 38:15, 46:7, 80:26, 82:24, 83:18, 82:21, 84:6, 87:4, 163:23, 182:3, 51:7, 52:24, 58:14, 46:8, 113:25, 116:24 88:7, 99:9, 113:18, 83:20, 84:4, 84:16, 182:23, 183:14, 87:8, 109:22, 139:2, representations [2] -85:20, 86:24, 86:28, 115:23, 124:24, 183:16, 213:29, 139:4, 139:10, 140:4, 11:21, 32:2 90:25, 92:27, 93:10, 216:11, 223:22 145:12, 164:24, 140:13, 140:23, representative [1] -93:12, 93:15, 94:12, 177:18, 192:7, remember" [1] -141:7, 141:28, 10:6 201:25, 203:4, 220:1, 94:23, 95:15, 96:10, 153:22 141:29, 142:19, representatives [4] -98:29, 99:1, 99:3, 243:3, 243:14 reminder [1] - 121:4 164:11, 166:6, 99:20, 103:8, 104:5, 17:25, 18:11, 31:26, regime [3] - 20:8, remit [7] - 5:18, 177:19, 210:29, 104:9, 105:16, 106:4, 223:11 203:3. 203:7 13:27, 43:4, 43:9, 211:20, 213:9, 238:4, represented [2] region [1] - 226:24 106:20, 106:29, 43:14, 44:18, 44:21 239:16, 242:10 208:9, 228:26 107:22, 108:5, 109:9, REGISTRAR[1] - 2:4 removed [1] - 42:26 relatively [3] -109:20, 109:28, representing [2] regrettably [1] repeat [4] - 196:17, 135:19, 159:29, 160:2

30:4, 81:18 87:17, 87:18, 88:11, 155:16, 187:18, RIVERSIDE [1] -22:10, 26:17, 39:27, repulsion[1] -201:12 3:16 147:10, 147:29, 41:13, 41:26, 78:17, 199:29 responses [4] -Road [1] - 6:29 148:7, 148:17, 174:24, 190:20, 148:27, 149:9, 160:3, 214:18, 220:12, 107:26, 108:3, 142:2, reputation [10] -**ROAD** [1] - 3:2 50:8, 124:10, 126:4, 182:16 160:7, 181:14 223:17, 232:15, road [2] - 172:21, responsibilities [4] rumours [12] - 15:25, 238:1, 242:13 129:24, 131:3, 217:27 131:28, 132:5, 180:7, 5:14, 108:23, 120:4, 36:7, 37:4, 37:7, secondary [1] robust [1] - 214:21 37:19, 41:27, 147:18, 225.14 181:12, 195:2 143:15 ROGERSON'S [1] -147:20, 147:23, reputational [6] seconds [1] - 156:5 responsible [3] -3:17 29:17, 98:3, 155:28, 47:7, 131:27, 223:13 147:24, 160:11, secretariat [1] - $\pmb{\text{role}}\ [33]\ \textbf{-}\ 5\text{:}27,\ 5\text{:}28,$ 156:7, 156:12, 240:7 rest [4] - 95:13, 160:19 217:6 15:13, 25:29, 31:2, request [1] - 206:21 147:18, 148:21, 45:22, 49:4, 49:18, run [3] - 43:24, secretaries [1] -172:14, 238:2 requested [1] - 207:2 215:27 49:25, 50:4, 50:22, 98:26 running [1] - 58:19 Secretary [3] required [3] - 94:28, restructure [1] -51:18, 53:3, 57:14, 202:21 rush [1] - 153:21 218:24, 219:21, 220:2 220:7, 223:10 60:20, 84:15, 111:12, rushing [1] - 20:13 requirements [2] result [10] - 9:2, 118:27, 119:1, 119:2, secretary [1] - 83:7 68:9, 86:20, 86:21, 120:24, 124:7, secrets [1] - 176:22 136:26, 166:9 114:7, 135:5, 161:3, 139:21, 139:23, S researching [1] -Section [1] - 203:21 206:21, 207:26, 29:15 142:9, 166:4, 168:16, section [2] - 5:23, 226:15 183:2, 183:4, 213:7, resigned [7] -43.16 **safe** [1] - 9:14 resulted [2] - 7:25, 198:11, 198:23, 235:16 sector [1] - 49:1 Safety [1] - 6:29 198:24, 198:26, 42:9 roles [3] - 51:6, securely [2] - 9:13, safety [1] - 62:1 RESUMED~[3]-5:1,205:26, 206:22, 120:3, 211:14 12:18 saga [1] - 111:13 $\pmb{\text{rolling}}\,{}_{[2]} - 173:12,$ 101:1, 137:23 207:15 see [62] - 14:10, sake [1] - 216:15 resigns [1] - 198:15 retires [1] - 198:15 185:26 17:9, 23:17, 30:28, saloon [1] - 97:24 resistance [2] retort [1] - 37:28 room [19] - 16:22, 31:10. 33:9. 69:13. samples [4] - 10:6, 39:17, 140:2 retrospect [1] -21:6, 26:27, 63:16, 69:18, 69:25, 70:9, 10:10, 38:4 63:20, 97:14, 101:5, resisted [1] - 19:3 98:20 71:27, 71:28, 72:28, sanguine [1] - 202:1 102:1, 102:3, 103:16, returned [1] - 12:17 75:2, 75:18, 76:10, resolution [1] sat [3] - 49:16, 95:3, 216:28, 217:13, 42:27 returning [1] - 232:9 77:5, 77:21, 78:26, 219:13, 220:19, RESOLUTIONS [1] revealed [2] - 10:27, 79:3, 79:19, 89:15, saw [10] - 46:25, 224:9, 225:3, 229:19 90:24, 92:8, 92:10, 73:8. 92:9. 92:11. roughly [3] - 147:6, 92:19, 104:6, 112:12, resolved [4] - 63:5, revealing [1] - 19:4 104:2, 139:27, 112:28, 119:27, 147:7 183:28, 222:26, revelations [1] -140:10, 215:16 183:26 round [1] - 184:6 129:20, 131:20, 222.27 SC [11] - 2:6, 2:6, route [2] - 117:13, 134:13, 146:7, resonance [4] revenue [1] - 239:22 2:9, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 149:18, 150:1, 151:3, 220:15 46:14, 200:7, 202:4, reverting [1] -2:15, 2:22, 2:27, 3:1, 151:5, 151:14, routine [3] - 54:15, 202:8 141:17 3:4 54:20, 54:21 152:24, 157:12, resonates [1] review [1] - 71:12 scale [2] - 44:25, 157:18, 157:23, 108:20 row [3] - 28:4, 89:27, reviewed [2] - 9:10, 142:6 135:5 160:19, 162:27, respect [9] - 146:13, 14:26 scan [1] - 7:20 167:29, 169:18, 147:6, 154:18, reviewing [1] -RTÉ [15] - 61:26, scanning [3] - 13:15, 171:9, 181:25, 166:24, 201:29, 146:17 63:12, 106:19, 31:5, 32:10 182:13, 183:6, 184:3, 106:22, 206:24, 203:29, 233:7, 241:3, Reynolds [4] scenario [1] - 97:24 188:15, 188:24, 221:22, 222:12, 242:23 206:24, 207:10, scheduled [4] -220:14, 220:26, 223:9, 223:10, respected [3] - 77:3, 207:14, 207:23 59:26, 224:23, 221:2, 226:7, 228:16, 82:13, 205:7 223:15, 224:7, riding [1] - 186:10 226:11, 226:19 237:28, 240:22, 241:1 224:14, 224:20, respectfully [3] rightly [2] - 124:7, scheme [1] - 48:1 seeing [1] - 110:9 163:20, 181:26, 227:6, 227:8 129:15 screen [5] - 75:16, Ruane [2] - 65:13, seek [1] - 29:16 191:29 rights [2] - 204:14, 145:21, 157:19, 90:3 seeking [1] - 6:14 respects [2] - 20:19, 210:15 178:18, 193:27 seem [17] - 74:12, 154:16 rude [2] - 59:3, Rights [2] - 176:11, scroll [3] - 73:21, 74:25, 74:27, 80:9, 239.18 respond [4] - 19:23, 176:12 74:1, 74:7 80:17, 88:17, 115:2, rule [1] - 28:2 46:12, 127:13, 127:14 ring [2] - 196:5, scrutiny [1] - 110:21 ruled [1] - 126:27 129:4, 130:15, response [15] - 11:5, 196:7 SDU [1] - 172:27 130:21, 144:17, rules [2] - 83:29, 19:9, 25:3, 53:23, ringing [2] - 189:7 se [1] - 156:14 152:15, 160:6, 106:23, 108:16, 108:20 rings [1] - 133:15 **SEAN**[1] - 2:11 162:27, 162:29, ruling [2] - 128:2, 111:1, 116:19, rise [1] - 214:8 120:18, 121:6, 132:27 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:6 168:22, 208:26 risk [2] - 40:11, 128:18, 151:10, rumour [13] - 42:6, second [15] - 11:13, seized [1] - 173:1 217:21

				r
seizure [2] - 143:29,	19:13, 22:8, 23:11,	178:23, 179:1,	22:12, 22:16, 22:17,	195:2, 240:3
144:2	27:10, 30:26, 31:23,	179:14, 179:17,	22:18, 23:10, 35:20,	significantly [1] -
selected [2] - 7:15,	34:7, 34:17, 34:24,	180:4, 180:5, 181:23,	35:23, 35:24, 35:26,	81:13
175:19	35:16, 35:17, 36:7,	182:29, 183:8,	35:27, 36:5, 36:8,	similar [4] - 6:27,
senator [1] - 81:14	36:10, 36:15, 36:18,	183:13, 185:10,	36:14, 36:28, 37:4,	13:13, 161:16, 163:22
send [7] - 95:7,	36:24, 37:27, 38:14,	186:15, 186:21,	38:13, 38:18, 39:7,	simmering [1] -
99:19, 107:28,	38:18, 39:9, 39:19,	187:14, 187:28,	39:8, 41:16, 41:24,	177:28
114:15, 121:12,	41:25, 46:26, 49:29,	188:1, 188:28,	79:10, 84:10, 117:17,	simple [2] - 160:26,
122:24, 229:1	61:13, 61:19, 61:21,	189:11, 190:4,	126:6, 132:19,	161:29
sending [1] - 193:29	68:6, 69:12, 70:2,	190:15, 194:25,	145:12, 146:13,	simply [9] - 33:21,
sends [1] - 194:4	71:19, 72:7, 73:4,	196:1, 196:3, 201:20,	147:6, 148:8, 165:1,	35:8, 37:6, 37:22,
senior [15] - 7:16,	73:7, 74:1, 75:13,	201:29, 203:14,	168:19, 185:16, 190:2	38:9, 143:18, 149:9,
16:26, 29:7, 50:6,	75:21, 76:3, 76:17,	203:22, 204:22,	SEÁN [1] - 3:15	158:4, 158:8
56:29, 57:1, 57:29,	77:10, 77:12, 77:15,	204:26, 204:29,	Seán [1] - 94:11	single [4] - 9:25,
60:15, 67:11, 143:7,	77:16, 77:25, 78:6,	217:23, 217:25,	SGT [1] - 2:9	156:27, 156:28,
143:21, 148:25,	78:22, 79:3, 79:11,	225:11, 228:22,	shake [1] - 39:23	158:23
211:14	80:1, 80:6, 80:27,	229:21, 230:8, 235:7,	SHANE [1] - 2:14	SIR [1] - 3:17
sense [16] - 13:15,	82:28, 83:1, 83:2,	238:10, 239:8	shape [2] - 128:29,	Sisyphus [1] - 46:18
13:16, 42:15, 46:17,	83:18, 84:5, 86:9,	sergeant [12] - 7:4,	129:3	Sisyphus-like [1] -
151:17, 155:6,	97:10, 97:15, 99:2,	15:14, 15:15, 15:16,	share [1] - 194:27	46:18
163:26, 178:27,	99:10, 99:15, 101:19,	15:18, 76:12, 76:23,	shared [5] - 19:1,	sit [3] - 26:2, 59:27,
184:18, 184:19,	103:2, 103:11,	79:9, 79:19, 79:28,	112:20, 112:22,	184:8
184:26, 214:6, 227:9,	106:24, 107:6, 107:8,	158:1, 203:18	177:20, 177:21	sitting [6] - 89:27,
231:27, 232:5, 239:6	108:29, 109:5,	Sergeant-McCabe-	shift [1] - 77:25	92:2, 92:3, 208:2,
sensitive [9] - 9:18,	109:10, 113:15,	related [1] - 168:7	SHIP [2] - 2:20, 2:25	208:5, 215:12
97:25, 99:5, 103:8,	117:17, 118:4,	series [6] - 11:25,	shocked [3] - 90:14,	situ [2] - 57:12,
113:17, 126:18,	119:11, 120:15,	64:2, 117:14, 172:28,	202:3, 209:21	198:22
127:23, 127:25, 176:3	120:29, 122:6,	218:22, 237:20	shoe [1] - 155:11	situation [11] -
sensitivity [1] -	122:16, 122:27,	serious [3] - 7:18,	SHORT [1] - 137:23	21:24, 44:22, 56:4,
56:17	123:5, 123:15,	22:11, 192:16	short [5] - 58:11,	84:4, 91:14, 98:14,
sent [25] - 11:2,	124:15, 124:21,	seriously [5] -	98:15, 103:19, 141:5,	116:22, 175:3,
13:25, 32:17, 93:24,	125:7, 125:9, 125:21,	135:22, 135:29,	200:28	188:20, 225:23,
94:7, 94:22, 95:8,	128:11, 129:17,	136:11, 171:10,	shorthand [1] -	240:28
107:11, 108:7,	129:27, 131:5, 131:9,	202:22	144:27	situations [2] -
108:12, 109:12,	131:22, 132:4,	servant [1] - 142:17	show [3] - 105:2,	107:23, 107:24
109:25, 109:26,	132:19, 132:24,	service [2] - 27:22,	124:20, 202:2	six [4] - 10:11, 17:7,
110:26, 121:4, 121:8,	133:4, 133:9, 133:12,	28:7	showed [2] - 57:20,	84:19, 227:27
122:18, 126:24,	133:17, 134:8,	Services [1] - 1:25	107:16	sixth [1] - 84:26
128:20, 132:24,	135:10, 137:9,	SERVICES [1] - 1:30	showing [1] - 128:11	skip [1] - 147:3
199:5, 207:24, 218:2,	137:18, 144:14,	serving [4] - 79:19,	sick [1] - 73:1	slightly [8] - 73:23,
220:11, 228:19	144:22, 144:23,	79:28, 202:16, 236:6	sickness [1] - 162:19	75:3, 75:14, 81:19,
Seoige [1] - 223:22	144:27, 145:4, 145:8,	serving" [2] - 76:12,	side [10] - 55:16,	92:16, 203:7, 226:22,
separate [2] - 52:20,	145:11, 146:8, 146:12, 147:5, 148:4,	158:1	92:2, 92:3, 92:16,	240:27
184:3	148:12, 150:8,	sessions [1] - 26:3	117:29, 175:12,	sloshing [1] - 47:25
separation [1] -	150:11, 150:17,	set [11] - 14:9, 45:19,	175:16, 177:7,	small [7] - 52:3,
52:21	150:11, 150:17,	66:27, 86:5, 86:6,	224:13, 224:20	195:27, 206:2,
September [14] - 8:9,	150:19, 151:27,	96:15, 119:6, 144:11,	sides [2] - 98:26,	206:15, 206:16,
10:18, 11:6, 11:14,	152:10, 152:23,	178:24, 187:9, 233:5	223:26	206:17, 216:18
11:17, 11:19, 11:27,	154:8, 154:12,	setting [4] - 94:10,	sign [1] - 202:3	smallest [1] - 181:27
31:19, 48:18, 49:28,	154:17, 155:4,	99:10, 231:3, 240:10	signed [1] - 84:26	smear [9] - 121:13,
138:23, 142:15,	155:24, 156:6, 156:8,	settings [1] - 240:12	significance [1] -	191:7, 229:21,
178:15, 178:16	158:25, 159:3,	settled [2] - 129:29,	123:28	230:12, 235:7,
Sergeant [217] -	160:25, 160:3,	140:14	significant [19] -	235:18, 235:23,
6:13, 6:19, 6:23, 7:7,	161:9, 162:9, 162:21,	seven [1] - 17:7	17:7, 60:4, 60:5, 90:5,	236:5, 236:10
7:23, 8:22, 9:6, 9:9,	164:5, 167:13,	several [3] - 42:2,	91:2, 93:14, 98:3,	SMITHFIELD [1] -
12:7, 12:22, 13:4,	167:17, 167:19,	67:22, 153:28	104:3, 121:11,	3:13
13:6, 13:11, 13:19,	167:21, 167:26,	sex [3] - 169:23,	124:18, 125:19,	Smithwick [6] -
13:25, 14:5, 14:12,	168:1, 168:7, 169:5,	200:8, 242:20	159:16, 164:29,	62:24, 62:25, 62:29,
15:20, 15:23, 15:26,	169:23, 171:6,	sexual [39] - 18:24,	166:2, 179:20,	63:27, 222:15, 224:15
18:21, 18:22, 18:28,	177:29, 178:1, 178:5,	19:7, 19:16, 19:18,	184:20, 188:24,	snapshot [1] -
	1			

228:27 so-called [2] - 121:13, 193:6 so [1] - 128:5 SOLE [2] - 1:12, 2:2 solely [1] - 119:7 SOLICITOR [1] - 2:7 solicitor [3] - 126:25, 191:21, 192:6 SOLICITOR'S [2] - 2:19, 2:23 SOLICITORS [5] - 2:28, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12, 3:20 solve [1] - 69:5 someone [15] - 13:19, 43:23, 88:21, 90:6, 133:15, 146:10, 148:5, 148:19, 155:17, 176:14, 184:6, 193:13, 202:12, 238:23, 243:7 sometime [1] - 31:18	37:26, 71:12, 101:25, 144:8, 149:2, 171:16, 225:27, 230:13 sorts [1] - 184:15 sought [1] - 12:2 sound [2] - 102:10, 102:13 soundings [1] - 217:12 sounds [1] - 102:19 source [12] - 12:9, 136:17, 204:2, 242:7, 242:11, 242:24, 242:25, 243:4, 243:5, 243:6, 243:7, 243:15 sources [2] - 175:27, 175:29 space [1] - 38:2 sparing [2] - 186:16, 186:19 sparingly [1] - 173:18 speaking [11] -	spoken [6] - 17:26, 47:6, 53:7, 87:1, 87:4, 87:10 spot [1] - 6:6 spotlight [3] - 125:22, 156:24, 208:23 SQUARE [1] - 3:9 squarely [1] - 164:15 squeezed [1] - 144:6 ST [1] - 69:23 ST" [1] - 69:19 staff [4] - 10:4, 12:20, 40:21, 52:10 stage [26] - 19:2, 36:20, 39:25, 45:9, 45:10, 45:18, 45:20, 61:4, 61:19, 65:21, 70:1, 72:21, 81:4, 81:22, 83:8, 85:3, 89:1, 91:25, 96:29, 104:22, 112:25, 117:10, 132:14,	2:23 state [3] - 117:3, 185:2, 219:15 statement [56] - 5:5, 22:29, 23:3, 24:12, 25:11, 25:12, 27:26, 28:12, 28:18, 29:3, 29:5, 29:9, 29:10, 30:9, 30:20, 32:5, 32:6, 34:19, 35:20, 36:4, 41:29, 48:12, 58:10, 60:27, 83:4, 84:23, 86:6, 94:1, 94:3, 106:16, 106:17, 115:13, 118:22, 126:16, 127:22, 128:21, 129:10, 130:15, 140:9, 140:24, 154:2, 157:6, 164:2, 183:11, 187:3, 198:8, 198:17, 198:21, 199:8, 199:13, 203:11, 210:28, 224:5	stopping [1] - 209:13 stored [1] - 9:13 stories [1] - 15:17 story [24] - 15:3, 15:21, 31:15, 32:7, 55:16, 74:17, 74:20, 74:22, 74:28, 127:29, 129:2, 155:25, 156:24, 177:10, 187:14, 188:28, 190:15, 201:3, 216:16, 231:22, 232:13, 235:18, 237:9, 242:1 strain [1] - 239:21 strange [4] - 151:18, 218:9, 218:18, 220:1 stranger [1] - 40:28 strategic [4] - 50:4, 119:3, 143:27, 144:12 strategically [1] - 151:23 Strategy [1] - 111:4
sometimes [5] -	53:25, 88:21, 91:27, 95:28, 168:17, 171:7,	179:28, 182:6, 215:24	210:28, 224:5, 226:25, 230:3, 235:11	strategy [11] -
53:6, 63:12, 63:13, 135:18, 184:21	222:20, 224:8,	stairs [6] - 16:27, 18:10, 27:3, 27:5,	statements [9] -	109:28, 110:3, 110:28, 121:15,
somewhat [1] -	224:20, 228:24,	27:9, 52:9	14:15, 20:27, 21:10, 21:16, 25:10, 43:13,	151:23, 181:20,
168:23	228:25	stance [2] - 115:16	108:2, 183:29, 199:7	181:21, 183:4, 196:18, 220:22,
somewhere [3] - 98:6, 181:9, 226:24	specific [20] - 20:9, 27:24, 32:21, 34:10,	stand [8] - 45:27, 91:10, 98:27, 110:21,	station [5] - 15:14,	220:24
sorry [65] - 22:18,	43:7, 46:6, 58:4,	148:11, 177:7, 203:6,	15:15, 15:16, 15:18,	straw [2] - 195:26,
29:24, 32:6, 33:7,	85:16, 85:17, 124:6,	236:4	226:21	195:27
36:12, 39:5, 41:12,	154:28, 165:26,	standard [7] - 10:2,	stations [2] - 207:26, 208:17	street [1] - 40:28
44:28, 45:3, 50:14,	169:20, 171:14, 172:2, 172:29, 173:6,	11:4, 95:22, 96:25,	statistics [1] - 68:5	STREET [6] - 2:20,
70:24, 74:2, 83:21, 92:14, 94:4, 113:3,	184:2, 184:17, 238:17	135:20, 222:4, 222:7 Standards [1] -	stature [1] - 63:13	2:25, 2:29, 3:6, 3:13, 3:20
118:13, 120:23,	specifically [10] -	65:17	status [1] - 76:25	strength [1] - 242:3
126:20, 128:12,	7:4, 12:14, 23:10,	standing [1] - 104:6	stay [4] - 184:28,	stressful [3] -
130:11, 133:1,	43:15, 48:21, 155:14,	stands [1] - 235:14	200:14, 213:27, 221:8	156:25, 183:27, 184:1
136:24, 137:21,	160:8, 177:26, 186:1,	stark [2] - 165:4,	stead [1] - 45:27	strict [1] - 133:25
143:12, 145:7, 145:19, 145:20,	232:18 specificity [2] -	224:17	steal [1] - 209:17 stenographic [1] -	strictly [1] - 12:10
146:22, 147:24,	185:23, 196:8	start [11] - 73:21, 77:25, 108:2, 145:9,	1:27	strike [3] - 149:13, 159:14, 183:24
157:23, 158:1, 158:6,	specifics [3] -	146:7, 167:21,	STENOGRAPHY[1]	strikes [1] - 191:24
158:7, 160:24,	109:20, 109:21,	170:21, 215:25,	- 1:30	striking [1] - 175:16
160:26, 161:6,	160:10	215:29, 221:15	stenography [2] -	strong [12] - 83:3,
161:13, 163:18, 169:19, 178:19,	specifies [1] - 43:12 specify [2] - 27:25,	start" [1] - 157:12	1:25, 214:9 step [1] - 127:2	90:20, 90:27, 93:28,
180:1, 180:27,	specify [2] - 27.25,	started [7] - 57:18, 61:16, 78:12, 142:26,	step [1] - 127.2 steps [2] - 107:19,	109:9, 115:26, 116:17, 186:20,
186:27, 190:18,	speculation [1] -	226:22, 235:14,	126:8	199:28, 203:24,
193:14, 196:17,	170:2	241:15	stick [2] - 82:18,	223:26
198:14, 198:25,	speeches [2] -	starting [7] - 27:3,	182:21	stronger [3] -
199:26, 200:24, 202:11, 204:26,	57:21, 84:20	57:14, 64:5, 150:7,	still [8] - 39:26,	127:21, 204:5, 206:9
209:15, 213:12,	speeding [1] - 20:11 spell [1] - 227:25	159:21, 162:6, 178:3	83:17, 83:26, 142:16, 200:22, 215:20,	struck (4) 170:8
214:4, 220:28,	spend [3] - 29:15,	starts [3] - 20:25, 94:4, 193:29	215:23, 243:1	struck [1] - 179:8 structure [4] - 43:10,
227:25, 231:9,	198:16, 198:28	State [4] - 43:3,	stone [1] - 44:16	50:25, 51:1, 140:28
231:15, 233:21,	spent [2] - 43:3,	126:25, 135:23,	stood [1] - 39:25	structured [1] -
234:2, 238:25	48:26	191:12	stop [2] - 127:3,	53:17
sort [9] - 18:20,	spilling [1] - 238:10	STATE [2] - 2:19,	127:27	stuck [1] - 238:19
	1	30	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

studio [2] - 63:17, 224:9 **study** [1] - 67:29 **studying** [1] - 67:27 **stuff** [1] - 189:15 style [1] - 62:27 subject [10] - 44:12, 63:24, 110:9, 145:11, 146:14, 148:8, 154:17, 155:9, 161:3, 192:12 subliminal [1] -199:24 submission [2] -60:21, 84:18 subsequent [2] -21:1, 31:17 subsequently [5] -7:10, 7:18, 17:13, 224:6, 235:6 substance [6] - 25:4, 29:10, 29:12, 30:16, 32:11, 160:20 **subtleties** [1] - 198:2 succession [1] -156:22 suddenly [1] - 242:8 sued [1] - 106:19 sufficient [2] - 67:8, 125:28 sufficiently [2] -7:25, 139:20 suggest [30] - 22:14, 36:15, 39:10, 45:1, 75:12, 116:18, 117:28, 118:3, 122:26, 130:16, 131:20, 131:24, 142:10, 143:24, 154:7, 154:8, 163:8, 163:20, 169:2, 177:1, 177:14, 181:14, 181:25, 181:26, 182:3, 185:12, 188:24, 188:27, 194:21, 232:5 suggested [11] -15:22, 46:2, 101:20, 102:22, 112:7, 121:15, 211:23, 229:16, 229:17, 229:18 suggesting [19] -24:22, 41:15, 85:9, 116:25, 119:9, 122:12, 144:3, 144:6, 144:9, 145:16, 145:17, 158:4, 158:8, 163:12, 176:28, 183:20, 186:9,

190:11, 190:12 suggestion [15] -19:5, 19:15, 22:9, 41:24, 83:8, 85:21, 93:23, 111:25, 191:4, 229:22, 229:23, 230:8, 230:12, 231:1, 232:6 suggestions [1] suggests [2] - 145:5, 165:6 summarise [1] -13:23 summary [1] -139:29 summation [3] -117:2, 164:18, 171:19 **Sunday** [8] - 53:20, 54:26, 55:15, 69:19, 71:1, 105:18, 106:9, 141:11 **SUNLIGHT** [1] - 2:29 superintendent [18] - 51:17, 54:16, 55:1, 56:2, 69:18, 71:11, 73:3, 73:4, 99:20, 107:11, 127:7, 138:28, 142:6, 187:8, 213:8, 231:28, 232:29, 234:16 Superintendent [145] - 17:12, 49:22, 49:23, 49:27, 51:4, 51:22, 51:26, 52:26, 52:28, 53:3, 53:7, 53:13, 53:21, 53:24, 55:1, 57:11, 57:18, 57:26, 58:12, 58:19, 61:18, 65:14, 65:24, 65:27, 74:13, 75:12, 81:25, 83:5, 85:4, 85:9, 85:15, 86:2, 87:8, 87:29, 88:1, 89:28, 93:4, 93:8, 93:19. 94:8, 96:8, 99:24, 101:18, 102:4, 102:7, 102:12, 102:18, 104:19, 104:21, 104:25, 105:10, 106:11, 112:3, 114:9, 118:11, 118:19, 119:13, 119:23, 119:25, 119:28, 122:13, 123:11, 124:3, 124:25,

125:10, 127:4, 127:7,

127:12, 128:6,

128:13, 128:15,

128:16, 129:14,

129:22, 129:24, 130:4, 130:6, 130:8, 130:16, 130:24, 130:27, 131:2, 131:16, 131:29, 135:14, 138:22, 138:27, 139:3, 139:13, 139:24, 140:13, 140:20, 141:6, 142:20, 148:3, 148:10, 148:14, 164:3, 168:29, 169:1. 179:5, 179:16, 179:25, 181:16, 183:13, 185:12, 185:27, 186:10, 187:13, 187:26, 188:25, 189:18, 189:29, 194:21, 195:3, 196:1, 196:3, 201:8, 206:1, 206:7, 206:19, 206:23, 211:21, 212:21, 213:4, 213:5, 213:9, 213:18. 215:11. 222:28, 226:13, 228:12, 228:13, 230:17, 230:27, 230:28, 231:2. 233:14, 233:18, 234:4, 235:2, 236:17, 236:27, 237:7 superintendent's [2] - 97:4, 145:24 superintendents [1] - 79:5 supervision [1] -54:16 supplementary [1] -192:27 supplied [5] - 7:21, 7:29, 13:10, 19:25, 69:7 **supply** [1] - 28:11 support [4] - 62:2, 86:11, 91:15, 113:24 supported [4] -83:10, 85:10, 85:14, 86.2 supportive[1] -121:17 **suppose** [56] -21:16, 23:17, 39:14, 45:18, 47:15, 47:26, 51:1, 51:18, 52:4, 58:18, 62:4, 64:10, 68:19, 78:11, 80:12, 82:7, 85:13, 88:24, 91:4, 91:15, 91:22,

108:20, 108:23, 109:2, 109:19, 109:23, 116:5, 117:6, 126:17, 127:22, 127:23, 142:14, 143:8, 143:19, 148:22, 162:18, 188:12, 188:13, 188:17, 203:7, 207:20, 208:8, 209:20, 210:12, 211:10, 211:11, 218:13, 218:15, 223:26, 227:9, 228:8, 237:8, 241:23, 242:27 supposed [6] -74:24, 78:12, 210:22, 210:23, 240:18, 240:24 supposedly [1] -107:11 **SUPREME** [2] - 1:13, **SUPT** [1] - 2:27 surely [2] - 126:3, 180.20 surmise [1] - 152:26 surprise [8] - 25:14, 130:28, 130:29, 189:2, 189:18, 196:8, 230:27, 234:4 surprised [6] system [28] - 6:5, 6:6, 6:9, 6:16, 7:9,

18:26, 18:27, 90:14, 189:6, 209:26, 237:10 surveying [1] - 7:28 **suspicious** [1] - 72:3 sustained [1] - 90:23 swiftly [1] - 234:29 **SWORN** [1] - 48:15 8:3, 10:7, 13:3, 13:29, 24:29, 45:21, 45:25, 46:1, 47:22, 47:23, 55:18, 55:21, 61:9, 68:3, 68:4, 68:5, 71:13, 78:1, 80:14. 82:24, 110:14, 142:5, 203:19 systems [6] - 7:26, 8:26, 14:10, 32:16, 38:2. 207:27

SÉAMUS[2] - 4:3, **Séamus** [1] - 5:5 Síochána [74] - 5:20. 6:4, 6:10, 7:3, 7:8, 7:27, 8:6, 10:28, 11:2, 11:13, 11:16, 12:18, 12:23, 12:28, 14:17,

15:10, 16:15, 16:26, 17:8, 17:25, 18:10, 19:2, 20:2, 20:19, 20:21, 24:5, 26:24, 27:23, 28:8, 32:16, 39:3, 40:23, 46:3, 48:18, 49:5, 49:6, 59:14, 67:8, 84:3, 91:5, 94:14, 94:15, 113:25, 116:29, 119:1, 128:5, 131:12, 134:15, 135:4, 135:9, 135:11, 135:28, 136:8, 136:18, 148:7, 150:25, 153:6, 154:20, 155:5, 155:28, 160:27, 162:8, 163:10, 164:24, 166:8, 172:27, 175:28, 203:21, 211:13, 214:2, 222:19, 225:20, 232:13, 235:5 Síochána's 131 -20:6. 39:17. 224:13

Т

tab [2] - 33:29, 94:3 table [2] - 80:18, 84:2 takeover [3] -241:25, 241:26, 242:2 talks [2] - 63:13, 63:14 Taoiseach [1] -112:24 taping [2] - 121:5, 122.6 TARA[1] - 2:27 Taylor [139] - 17:12, 49:22, 49:23, 49:27, 50:10, 50:11, 51:4, 51:22, 52:7, 52:26, 52:28, 53:3, 53:8, 53:13, 53:21, 53:24, 55:1, 57:11, 57:18, 57:26, 58:12, 58:19, 61:18, 65:27, 87:8, 87:29, 88:1, 89:28, 93:4, 93:8, 93:19, 94:8, 96:8, 99:24, 101:18, 102:4, 102:7, 104:19, 104:21, 104:25, 106:11, 114:9, 118:11, 118:19, 119:13, 119:25, 119:28, 122:13, 123:11, 124:3, 125:10, 127:4,

103:1, 107:21,

127:8, 127:12, 128:6,	216:29	174:16	182:1, 182:2, 183:22,	94:25
128:13, 128:15,	television [2] -	THE [20] - 1:4, 1:8,	214:10, 234:10	transpired [3] -
128:17, 129:15,	196:4, 239:25	1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6,	together [7] - 58:18,	39:22, 103:28, 104:11
129:23, 129:24,	ten [6] - 48:26,	2:14, 4:8, 4:17, 5:1,	58:24, 114:8, 139:5,	travelling [1] -
130:4, 130:6, 130:9,	138:13, 200:21,	24:2, 41:11, 42:19,	139:26, 145:5, 164:5	222:29
130:16, 130:24,	214:9, 226:25	48:9, 100:2, 101:1,	toilet [1] - 197:17	treatment [1] -
130:28, 131:2,	tend [1] - 55:12	137:23, 237:15,	tone [1] - 222:21	158:26
131:16, 131:29,	tends [1] - 239:20	243:28	tongue [2] - 149:28,	trial [1] - 173:18
135:14, 138:22,	tense [1] - 232:24	theme [1] - 232:10	171:11	TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:3,
138:27, 139:3,	tension [3] - 45:15,	themselves [2] -	took [19] - 5:27, 38:1,	2:6
139:13, 139:24,	47:7, 47:21	67:24, 240:11	49:4, 59:5, 83:23,	Tribunal [38] - 22:29,
140:14, 140:20,	tensions [1] - 45:23	THEN [4] - 42:19,	84:13, 88:8, 120:1,	23:13, 24:12, 25:10,
141:6, 142:20, 148:3,	term [13] - 90:20,	48:9, 237:15, 243:28	130:5, 138:23,	25:12, 28:23, 28:27,
148:10, 148:14,	90:27, 93:2, 93:14,	then-	163:13, 163:22,	28:28, 29:1, 29:2,
164:3, 164:12,	93:19, 93:26, 113:12,	Commissioner [2] -	177:26, 198:29,	30:10, 30:20, 32:6,
168:29, 169:1, 179:5,	113:14, 116:17,	49:14, 53:10	199:11, 206:3,	32:7, 32:26, 40:7,
179:16, 179:25,	120:2, 129:6, 153:4,	then-Deputy [1] -	212:19, 217:12,	41:29, 50:21, 62:24,
181:17, 182:24,	189:10	49:19	226:11	62:29, 87:4, 88:19,
183:13, 185:12,	terminating [1] -	then-Minister [1] -	tool [1] - 243:21	95:18, 96:15, 107:4,
185:27, 186:10,	192:11	115:13	top [5] - 27:3, 47:25,	107:13, 109:4, 157:7,
187:13, 187:26,	terms [57] - 19:15,	thereafter [4] - 65:6,	78:22, 179:12, 184:28	163:7, 212:26,
188:25, 189:18, 189:29, 194:21,	20:7, 21:14, 54:13,	112:20, 116:9, 205:29	top-line [1] - 179:12	218:22, 222:15,
195:3, 196:1, 196:3,	55:9, 57:27, 59:3,	therefore [2] - 72:23,	topic [7] - 150:5,	224:15, 226:12,
201:8, 206:1, 206:7,	61:7, 85:16, 90:21,	151:8	150:6, 152:19,	230:17, 230:25,
206:19, 206:23,	99:2, 99:15, 103:24,	therein [1] - 14:1	152:20, 152:21,	232:1, 235:4
209:7, 211:21,	107:16, 108:15,	thinking [6] - 21:16,	159:17	Tribunal's [2] -
212:21, 213:4, 213:5,	109:22, 118:13, 118:17, 121:14,	46:25, 99:9, 143:13,	topics [1] - 62:20	22:25, 62:25 TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:9
213:9, 213:18,	126:15, 127:13,	178:7, 231:6 third [1] - 238:9	total [1] - 26:3 totally [2] - 50:12,	tribute [1] - 197:4
215:12, 215:19,	153:1, 153:3, 154:28,	thoroughly [3] -	132:28	tried [3] - 45:18,
222:28, 226:13,	155:8, 156:2, 160:26,	81:24, 126:23, 235:4	touch [1] - 233:1	60:8, 239:11
228:12, 228:13,	165:4, 165:16,	thoughts [4] - 68:13,	touched [2] - 32:15,	true [5] - 41:23,
230:17, 230:27,	165:26, 177:10,	108:1, 121:20, 121:21	39:2	116:23, 182:13,
230:28, 231:2,	180:15, 181:5,	three [14] - 5:26, 6:1,	towards [9] - 109:5,	197:18, 243:11
233:14, 233:18,	181:19, 183:3,	22:4, 33:27, 62:21,	125:29, 128:11,	trust [1] - 94:27
234:4, 235:13,	185:13, 185:20,	74:19, 79:5, 145:3,	139:15, 140:2, 144:5,	trusted [5] - 18:23,
236:17, 236:27,	186:12, 186:20,	145:17, 146:10,	197:15, 197:19,	19:6, 22:10, 34:8,
237:7, 238:3, 240:18, 240:19	189:27, 202:20,	150:15, 164:27,	214:25	242:7
TAYLOR[2] - 2:27,	204:13, 208:15,	201:17, 228:5	track [2] - 44:16,	truth [1] - 35:10
3:1	216:29, 223:29,	three-minute [1] -	121:14	try [8] - 103:1,
Taylor's [5] - 51:26,	224:12, 224:22,	62:21	tracks [1] - 179:21	103:10, 140:18,
119:23, 124:25,	226:10, 227:12, 231:10, 238:17,	throughout [4] -	trade [2] - 174:29,	148:18, 199:17,
201:16, 235:2	238:18, 239:12,	21:28, 121:15,	175:5	225:23, 225:24,
team [9] - 18:8,	243:16	176:26, 177:22	traditional [1] -	225:27
32:17, 56:28, 56:29,	terrible [2] - 43:25,	throwing [2] -	211:13	trying [15] - 21:17, 34:21, 46:18, 91:20,
57:1, 60:25, 81:17,	43:29	142:26, 143:3 Thursday [1] - 75:23	traffic [5] - 60:28,	97:25, 136:25,
90:5, 91:6	terribly [3] - 33:13,	ticket [1] - 20:11	65:15, 71:13, 172:21, 178:20	140:16, 150:27,
tease [3] - 186:7,	98:20, 224:19	tied [1] - 19:21	train [1] - 226:7	170:22, 174:22,
208:12, 208:26	test [1] - 14:10	time-lines [2] -	training [5] - 184:3,	180:17, 188:18,
technical [3] - 51:1,	testimony [1] -	76:16, 77:14	184:7, 184:8, 184:11	221:5, 221:22, 235:23
61:7, 178:20	160:18	timing [2] - 226:10,	Tralee [1] - 43:24	turn [13] - 26:8,
technically [1] -	text [4] - 114:25,	228:9	transcript [3] - 1:26,	66:23, 68:16, 69:2,
198:15	218:22, 219:14,	timings [1] - 228:2	107:10, 233:24	70:22, 71:22, 73:23,
technology [3] -	219:27	tip [2] - 149:27,	transferred [3] -	78:29, 123:9, 172:20,
48:27, 241:19, 241:22 telephone [5] -	texted [2] - 218:28,	171:10	213:19, 213:22,	205:24, 214:20,
101:8, 101:13, 167:4,	236:28	Tipperary [1] -	213:25	227:20
167:7, 207:27	texts [3] - 219:5,	172:22	transferring [2] -	turned [5] - 34:20,
telephoned [1] -	220:11, 237:6 that'd [2] - 162:2,	today [8] - 109:7,	212:20, 213:5	106:28, 195:7, 209:14, 226:8
	a. u [2] - 102.2,	114:26, 143:29,	transparent [1] -	203.17, 220.0

turning [1] - 228:17 turns [1] - 27:2 twice [4] - 57:2, 122:20, 122:22, 240:23 twice-monthly [1] -240:23 two [37] - 10:10, 18:8, 24:17, 32:25, 34:4, 38:7, 38:23, 38:24, 39:1, 62:21, 72:16, 103:23, 108:12, 111:5, 145:3, 151:15, 156:5, 169:4, 170:11, 170:14, 170:15, 181:25, 182:1, 182:12, 182:16, 199:7, 201:17, 202:26, 203:13, 209:14, 213:17, 214:16, 220:11, 221:24, 236:17, 236:24 twofold [1] - 225:10 Twomey [7] - 17:11, 17:18, 65:20, 68:13, 68:21, 90:3, 92:28 type [5] - 55:23, 176:8, 189:13, 189:14, 241:20 typed [6] - 75:2, 75:15, 78:4, 145:28, 145:29, 146:2 typically [1] - 172:22

U

ultimately [6] -11:19, 40:6, 63:4, 93:26, 111:9, 229:1 unattributable [3] -174:5, 174:9, 174:12 unaware [1] - 183:6 unawareness [1] -128:2 uncommon [2] -174:14, 175:15 uncover[1] - 6:8 **UNDER** [2] - 1:3, 1:9 under [28] - 5:16, 42:22, 43:1, 43:8, 43:19, 45:8, 54:16, 55:24, 74:19, 76:28, 77:1, 90:23, 102:16, 111:5, 132:11, 133:23, 156:23, 204:6, 204:14, 208:19, 213:28, 218:26, 226:3,

226:29, 238:13, 239:21, 240:2 undermine [3] -97:17, 103:4, 189:11 undermining [4] -93:16, 93:17, 116:26, 116:27 underneath [4] -51:23, 69:25, 71:2, 79:3 underpinnings [1] -44:5 understandable [4] -25:28, 38:7, 47:22, 164:13 understandably [1] -196:15 understood [11] -70:1, 83:19, 122:9, 145:10, 152:25, 170:8, 170:28, 185:27, 186:16, 207:7, 207:9 undertaken [4] - 8:5, 14:23, 114:1, 189:21 undertaking [1] -189:20 unease [1] - 39:11 unfair [1] - 204:21 unfairly [1] - 205:2 unfortunately [7] -56:6, 124:6, 134:15, 134:16, 166:27, 171:4, 175:14 unhappy [1] - 153:6 uniform [2] - 141:23, 144:5 uniformed [1] -142:29 **Union** [1] - 47:19

unions [2] - 174:29,

175:5

Unit [1] - 65:17 unit [1] - 172:26 units [1] - 58:3 unlawfulness [1] -25:6 unless [8] - 13:19, 48:6, 105:25, 144:2, 172:2, 198:22, 226:29, 234:19 unlikely [2] - 40:15,

232:17 unnamed [1] - 188:5 unpleasant [2] -182:10, 241:29 unprofessional [2] -59:4, 239:18 unrealistic [1] -

157:2

unreasonable [3] -149:27, 153:20, 211:17

unscripted [1] -115:28

unsigned [1] - 72:2 unspecified [1] -87:19

UNTIL [1] - 243:28

untrue [3] - 242:1, 242:14, 242:19 unusual [9] - 23:16, 51:18, 52:27, 53:1, 105:23, 105:28, 106:10, 107:23,

unwittingly [1] -239:8

226:28

up [82] - 5:27, 5:28, 13:23. 44:23. 48:24. 49:4, 49:18, 49:24, 52:9, 60:16, 61:5, 75:16, 79:17, 81:4, 83:17, 83:23, 84:15, 88:14, 89:12, 92:1, 96:15, 97:13, 99:10,

102:25, 110:21, 112:9, 118:22, 118:25, 120:1, 124:12, 126:11, 127:17, 129:1, 133:12, 138:23, 138:26, 142:6, 144:12, 145:21,

147:19, 147:23, 149:19, 150:9, 150:12, 152:27, 157:12, 159:25, 160:4, 168:18, 170:3, 177:26, 178:17,

187:9, 187:27, 188:4, 188:10, 189:6, 189:7, 193:14, 193:17, 194:28, 200:21, 210:3. 211:14. 226:15, 230:26,

231:3, 231:14, 231:17, 231:20, 233:5, 233:10, 234:5, 235:18, 236:20, 237:1, 239:3, 240:14,

242:17 upcoming[1]-105:16

upper[1] - 160:2 **UPPER** [1] - 3:20 upset [1] - 242:10

upsets [1] - 175:5 upstairs [2] - 206:2, 206:3

urgent [1] - 141:14 useful [1] - 110:17 usual [1] - 177:6

V

vacancy [1] - 56:6

value 151 - 43:3.

43:13, 44:2, 44:17,

Varadkar [1] -

88:9

valuable [1] - 198:17

112.25 Varadkar's [2] -114:26, 115:14 variance [1] - 107:16 variety [2] - 200:8, 212:29 various [7] - 31:24, 31:25, 43:13, 65:12, 80:21, 94:23, 218:2 vein [1] - 200:12 venue [1] - 104:6 verbal [1] - 123:22 verbatim [2] - 1:26, versa [2] - 59:5, 89:13 version [15] - 70:26, 75:2, 75:15, 77:19, 106:3, 110:9, 114:19, 124:26, 145:28, 145:29, 146:2, 177:2, 216:18, 230:23 vetoed [1] - 85:26 via [4] - 54:7, 103:9, 133:2, 133:27 vice [2] - 59:5, 89:13 victim [4] - 129:18, 129:27, 131:10, 175:19 victims [1] - 176:4 view [60] - 23:5, 23:7, 23:15, 47:1, 56:22, 67:16, 67:24, 72:19, 72:23, 72:24, 82:2, 83:1, 83:4, 83:12, 85:28, 86:2, 86:22, 87:7, 88:5, 88:25, 95:29, 97:14, 97:15, 97:20, 107:6, 109:24, 117:2, 118:20, 119:23, 128:27, 141:21, 159:5, 159:7, 159:11, 162:2, 162:4, 162:6, 180:15, 181:19,

186:20, 186:21,

187:29, 188:21,

188:22, 211:10, 219:11, 219:29, 225:26, 226:6, 226:14, 237:8, 240:6, 240:7, 240:17, 242:1, 242:29, 243:7 viewpoint [2] -109:9, 129:9 views [5] - 12:2, 183:13, 223:26, 238:14, 242:28 virtue [2] - 160:23, 202:29 vis-à-vis [1] - 109:22 vis-á-vis [3] - 33:11, 47:16, 50:10 visit [3] - 233:15, 237:9, 237:11 visits [1] - 162:20 vocally [1] - 121:17 volume [1] - 66:24 Volume [3] - 48:12, 64:5, 118:24 **vote** [7] - 5:19, 9:27, 16:11, 16:13, 16:15, 43:22, 47:8 voted [1] - 47:9

W

wait [2] - 63:21, 228.4 waiting [1] - 146:6 walk [3] - 52:18, 52:19, 52:29 walking [2] - 63:16, 192:11 **WALLACE**[1] - 2:23 wants [2] - 13:19, 241:3 warm [1] - 82:28 warrants [1] - 172:28 wary [1] - 140:12 **WAS**[10] - 5:8, 24:2, 41:11, 42:19, 48:15, 138:17, 214:12, 221:12, 236:16, 237:15 waste [1] - 43:29 wasted [1] - 43:4 watch [1] - 196:4 watched [1] - 29:2 water [3] - 47:24, 173:24, 192:23 watered [1] - 235:12 ways [1] - 91:18 **WB** [3] - 33:3, 33:4, 33:5 weaknesses [3] -

		T	
6:9, 14:7, 68:4	77:6, 77:26, 78:24,	wise [1] - 119:16	worth [1] - 97:24
week [11] - 49:24,	80:17, 80:21, 83:9,	wished [1] - 126:15	worthwhile [1] -
93:6, 93:12, 93:13,	85:9, 85:14, 85:18,	wishes [1] - 81:14	97:23
94:14, 132:17,	86:11, 88:6, 88:27,	withdraw [1] - 93:27	write [3] - 123:29,
178:12, 182:2,	89:1, 89:18, 89:21,	withdrawn [3] -	187:14, 236:21
189:12, 216:21,	90:19, 91:1, 105:1,	157:17, 158:9, 158:11	writing [5] - 69:3,
238:18	106:5, 110:1, 111:22,	WITHDREW [1] -	92:9, 95:7, 99:9,
weekend [3] - 95:9,	111:27, 112:15,	48:9	188:27
137:28, 191:20	116:19, 117:9,	WITNESS [7] - 4:2,	written [4] - 28:11,
weekly [2] - 26:3,	121:18, 121:24,	24:2, 41:11, 42:19,	66:28, 206:26, 237:10
53:11	194:23, 195:14,	48:9, 236:16, 237:15	wrongdoing [1] -
weeks [4] - 26:4,	195:17, 195:18,	witness [14] - 5:4,	113:25
201:17, 207:24,	197:4, 239:22 white [1] - 45:9	16:3, 16:12, 25:27,	wrongs [1] - 210:15
212:28	whole [6] - 10:10,	48:11, 103:12, 138:4,	wrote [1] - 121:22
weeks' [1] - 213:17	161:22, 164:8,	176:17, 192:1, 197:8,	
weight [2] - 142:27,	217:28, 240:13,	200:19, 220:17,	Υ
143:4 welcome [3] - 41:9,	240:19	234:9, 240:12	
45:23, 232:13	wholly [1] - 157:2	witness's [1] - 145:24	year [6] - 11:27,
welcomes [1] -	wide [2] - 169:27,	witnesses [3] -	26:4, 62:2, 112:24,
47:12	212:29	20:28, 150:15, 150:18	120:2, 142:18
welcoming [3] -	widely [1] - 159:10	wokring [1] - 182:11	years [13] - 10:10,
110:11, 139:15,	wider [1] - 28:7	woman [1] - 188:5	18:1, 42:3, 45:20,
139:16	wild [1] - 227:7	wonder [7] - 58:16,	48:26, 49:3, 51:21,
well-geared [1] -	Williams [54] -	83:19, 99:28, 117:8,	56:20, 74:19, 175:8,
45:26	123:28, 124:12,	140:24, 191:28,	224:25, 241:12
well-informed [2] -	125:4, 125:11,	239:20	yesterday [3] - 6:28,
159:24, 188:14	125:13, 125:16,	wonderful [2] -	13:5, 105:6
well-known [2] -	126:10, 127:8, 127:9,	189:14, 190:8	yesterday's [1] -
129:26, 160:2	127:14, 127:27,	wondering [1] -	104:29
well-prepared [1] -	128:7, 128:12,	78:15	yourself [27] - 6:23,
81:18	128:18, 128:21,	word [23] - 18:12,	9:10, 24:13, 24:24, 25:27, 26:12, 35:25,
well-tried [1] - 45:18	129:2, 129:16, 130:6,	18:13, 22:15, 34:15,	55:26, 58:1, 59:1,
whatsoever [1] -	130:13, 130:25,	34:26, 39:5, 93:28,	60:7, 88:3, 101:17,
190:13	132:1, 168:25, 168:27, 169:3,	104:14, 109:8,	108:7, 121:5, 121:12,
wheat [1] - 184:3	185:28, 186:6,	114:29, 115:23,	133:9, 139:23,
WHELAN [1] - 2:16	186:23, 187:5,	116:14, 116:15,	141:29, 142:1,
whereby [1] - 44:3	187:13, 187:25,	116:16, 164:4, 166:25, 198:13,	149:29, 163:25,
whiskey [1] - 192:24	187:26, 188:25,	199:23, 199:27,	196:11, 222:19,
whispering [1] - 39:8 whistle [1] - 89:24	188:27, 189:3, 189:5,	199:28, 207:21,	228:19, 229:14
	189:7, 189:13,	214:29	
whistle-blowing [1] - 89:24	189:19, 189:22,	wording [1] - 229:6	È
whistleblower [31] -	190:20, 201:3,	words [26] - 16:17,	
10:22, 10:26, 14:16,	230:15, 230:18,	22:20, 30:17, 34:10,	Éireann [4] - 8:9,
15:16, 15:19, 19:4,	231:17, 232:17,	34:11, 35:21, 39:7,	10:18, 14:15, 16:8
19:9, 19:10, 19:13,	232:21, 233:1, 233:5,	41:19, 108:27, 145:3,	ÉIREANN [2] - 1:5,
19:14, 19:26, 21:21,	233:10, 233:15,	145:4, 145:17,	1:6
31:22, 31:28, 33:5,	234:4, 234:25, 237:9	146:10, 147:4,	
35:8, 37:20, 37:24,	Williams' [2] - 131:3,	174:18, 178:25,	Ó
70:2, 72:5, 73:29,	234:15	187:3, 187:16, 199:2,	
77:1, 89:19, 133:24,	willing [1] - 28:11	199:27, 211:27,	4
133:28, 177:29,	Wilson [10] - 74:4,	220:21, 228:27,	Ó [1] - 3:12
193:7, 194:7, 194:29,	74:5, 74:9, 113:16, 203:14, 203:17,	235:22, 242:23	
195:8, 195:11	203:14, 203:17, 204:25,	workings [1] -	
whistleblowers [45]	204:23, 204:25, 204:28, 216:16	201:25	
- 31:25, 36:25, 61:11,	WILSON [1] - 3:4	works [5] - 57:28,	
61:14, 63:28, 67:6,	wind [2] - 195:26,	58:3, 160:4, 172:15,	
		172:16	i
67:9, 67:11, 67:17, 67:20, 67:21, 67:24,	195:27	worry [1] - 190:17	