TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON MONDAY, 16TH APRIL 2018 - DAY 66

66

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

## **APPEARANCES**

MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT **SOLE MEMBER:** 

**REGISTRAR:** MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR. DIARMAID MCGUINNESS SC

MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. KATHLEEN LEADER BL

MS. ELIZABETH MULLAN, SOLICITOR

FOR SGT. McCABE: MR. MICHAEL MCDOWELL SC

MR. PAUL MCGARRY SC MR. BREFFNI GORDON BL

**INSTRUCTED BY:** SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY

HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY

DUBLIN 7

FOR THE COMMISSIONER:

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC MR. NOEL WHELAN BL MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL MR. JOHN FITZGERALD BL

**INSTRUCTED BY:** MS. ALISON MORRISSEY

MS. EMMA GRIFFIN

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

MR. PATRICK McCANN SC FOR MR. BRIAN PURCELL:

MR. GERARD MEEHAN BL MR. CHARLES WALLACE INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

FOR SUPT. TAYLOR: MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS

MS. TARA BURNS SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL

MR. CARTHAGE CONLON M.E. HANAHOE SOLICITORS **INSTRUCTED BY:** 

SUNLIGHT CHAMBERS 21 PARLIAMENT STREET

DUBLIN 2

FOR MRS. MICHELLE TAYLOR:

**INSTRUCTED BY:** 

MR. FELIX MCENROY SC O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT 51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR MR. JOHN WILSON:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MARK HARTY SC PETER CONNOLLY COURT SOLICITORS 6 CAPEL STREET FIRST FLOOR DUBLIN 1

FOR JOHN McGUINNESS:

**INSTRUCTED BY:** 

MR. DARREN LEHANE BL

LAWLOR PARTNERS SOLICITORS

ARRAN SQUARE ARRAN QUAY DUBLIN 7

FOR ALISON O'REILLY:

**INSTRUCTED BY:** 

MR. FÍONÁN Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH BL AUGUSTUS CULLEN LAW SOLICITORS

18 BOW STREET **SMITHFIELD** DUBLIN 7

FOR MR. NOEL BRETT:

MR. SEÁN BARTON MCCANN FITZGERALD

RIVERSIDE ONE 37-42 SIR JOHN ROGERSON'S QUAY GRAND CANAL DOCK

DUBLIN 2

FOR MR. GERALD KEAN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DAVID BOUGHTON BL

KEAN SOLICITORS
NO. 2 UPPER PEMBROKE STREET
DUBLIN 2

FOR MR. JOHN KENNEDY:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC

MICHAEL HEGARTY

REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS

12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE

DUBLIN 2

FOR MR. MICHEÁL MARTIN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FEICHÍN MCDONAGH SC

MR. LIAM GUIDERA

MASON HAYES & CURRAN

BARROW STREET

DUBLIN 4

FOR MS. D:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. THOMAS P. HOGAN SC

FANNING & KELLY SOLICITORS

HATCH HALL

HATCH STREET LOWER SAINT KEVIN'S

DUBLIN 2

FOR MR. PAUL WILLIAMS: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JOHN FREEMAN BL FANNING & KELLY SOLICITORS HATCH HALL HATCH STREET LOWER SAINT KEVIN'S DUBLIN 2

## INDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
MR. MICHEÁL MARTIN	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS	33
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM	37
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE	56
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	57
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	59
MR. PAT RABBITTE	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	64
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. CONLON	77
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DOCKERY	77
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	88
MR. EOGHAN MURPHY	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER	94
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McGARRY	101
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM	103
MR. JOHN KENNEDY	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER	107
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	118
MR. BRIAN PURCELL	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	122
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McGARRY	147
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS	163
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE	168
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	178
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	180

Т			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON MONDAY, 16TH APRIL	
2			<u>2018:</u>	
3				
4			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, the first witness this	
5			morning is Deputy Micheál Martin, Teachta Dála.	10:29
6			MR. DOCKERY: Chairman, just before you take that	
7			evidence I wonder can I just formally apply for	
8			representation for John Kennedy, sir?	
9			CHAIRMAN: Yes, that is appropriate.	
10			MR. McDONAGH: And might I also, on behalf of	10:29
11			Mr. Martin, seek representation for the purpose of his	
12			evidence this morning?	
13			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
14				
15			MR. MICHEÁL MARTIN, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	10:29
16			EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS:	
17			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, for your information and	
18			that of my colleagues, Mr. Martin corresponded with the	
19			Tribunal at early stage after your call for relevant	
20			evidence and his letter is to be found at Volume 6,	10:30
21			page 1671.	
22	1	Q.	I think you have been a deputy in Dáil Éireann for some	
23			considerable time and you have held various ministries	
24			over the years.	
25		Α.	Correct.	10:30
26	2	Q.	And you are currently leader of the main opposition	
27			party in the Dáil at present?	
28		Α.	That is correct.	
29	3	0	And in February 2014 as you have set out in your	

Т			retter, you met with sergeant McCabe and could I just	
2			ask you to describe how that came about?	
3		Α.	My understanding, I think Deputy McGuinness asked would	
4			I meet Maurice McCabe and that there was, in addition	
5			to the penalty points issue, that there was substantive	10:30
6			other issues, and so I agreed to meet with Maurice	
7			McCabe and we would have made contact with him and	
8			agreed a venue and I travelled down to meet him.	
9	4	Q.	And had you been in touch with Sergeant McCabe directly	
10			or indirectly prior to that or he in touch with you?	10:31
11		Α.	No, I hadn't.	
12	5	Q.	You referred there to the penalty points issue and	
13			obviously at that point in time, in February 2014, it	
14			had been quite a live issue for some period, isn't that	
15			correct?	10:3
16		Α.	Correct.	
17	6	Q.	And had you followed the publicity that had been given	
18			to various allegations and/or leaks that were coming	
19			out appearing in the press about penalty points issues?	
20		Α.	Yes, in a general way, yes.	10:3
21	7	Q.	And presumably you had followed closely the examination	
22			by the Public Accounts Committee of the issue which had	
23			taken place over the previous month?	
24		Α.	Yes, I did, yeah, yeah.	
25	8	Q.	And	10:32
26		Α.	Although, yes, yes it was within the domain of the	
27			Public Accounts Committee.	
28	9	Q.	Yes.	

29

A. And since I became leader of the party I have been very

1			conscious of a demarcation role. I don't actually	
2			engage with the Chairman of Oireachtas committees	
3			per se, particularly the Public Accounts Committee, and	
4			have not and because I don't see it's a party issue,	
5			that is how	10:32
6	10	Q.	Yes. And I take it from that, that Deputy McGuinness	
7			doesn't act under your instruction nor would you ever	
8			seek to have him do so while Chairman of the PAC?	
9		Α.	That is absolutely the position.	
10	11	Q.	And you don't require him to account to you for his	10:32
11			stewardship of that, he does it all in public?	
12		Α.	Absolutely. And I think it's important that	
13			parliament, if you like, it's a bigger issue but I	
14			think it's important that parliament is a stronger	
15			actor in that regard.	10:32
16	12	Q.	Yes. But you had presumably been reasonably familiar	
17			with the Commissioner's stance in the Commission	
18			before the Accounts Committee about the issue and the	
19			way the controversy developed arising out of his	
20			appearance before the Committee?	10:33
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	13	Q.	And there was a lot of public commentary on his use of	
23			the phrase "disgusting" in relation to the actions of	
24			the whistleblower?	
25		Α.	Yes.	10:33
26	14	Q.	And you were all aware of that?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	15	Q.	what did you understand was the purpose of being asked	
29			to meet Sergeant McCabe then?	

1		Α.	well, the purpose was actually in relation to	
2			additional matters which ultimately was the matters	
3			contained and material contained in that dossier, that	
4			I subsequently received from Maurice McCabe and which I	
5			handed to the Taoiseach after raising it in Dáil	10:3
6			Éireann.	
7	16	Q.	Okay. May I just ask you about your state of knowledge	
8			about issues relating to Sergeant McCabe at that point	
9			in time. Did you know that there had been an	
10			allegation made earlier relating to Sergeant McCabe as	10:3
11			far back as 2006?	
12		Α.	I didn't know at that stage about that specific	
13			allegation.	
14	17	Q.	Okay. So you didn't know that there had been an	
15			investigation and a file submitted to the DPP	10:3
16		Α.	No.	
17	18	Q.	at any stage?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	19	Q.	Okay. And were you in and around this period prior to	
20			meeting Sergeant McCabe, were you aware of any adverse	10:3
21			rumours or negative commentary about him that is	
22			unrelated to the penalty points issue relating to other	
23			matters?	
24		Α.	I was aware of general comment. I think it became	
25			more it became more pronounced, I suppose, in the	10:3
26			aftermath of I raising it in the Dáil. There was a lot	
27			of rumour about the place, but also, you know, people	

28

29

close to me or the Press Officer would have received

queries as to whether your leader, in raising this

- issue, can he stand over the credibility of this
- 2 person, is he satisfied, that type of thing.
- 3 20 Q. Yes. Yes.
- 4 A. And if it's helpful, I did meet with Noel Brett, who
- 5 had been the former CEO of the Road Safety Authority,

10:35

10:35

- 6 in the aftermath, probably the week after I met with
- 7 Maurice McCabe, who took me through a lot of the issues
- 8 pertaining to the penalty points in particular and this
- 9 whole sequence of events there generally and had said
- that he had come across a lot of negative, a lot of
- 11 negative commentary from Garda sources and so on in
- 12 relation to Maurice McCabe, but --
- 13 21 Q. And did he attribute it to any one particular person --
- 14 A. No.
- 15 22 Q. -- or did he identify anyone?
- 16 A. No, no.
- 17 23 Q. And had you yourself heard from any other source any
- 18 negative rumours about sexual misconduct or alleged
- 19 offences?
- 20 A. Not specifically, but generally there was rumours about 10:35
- 21 the place.
- 22 24 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. Put it that way to you.
- 24 25 Q. Okay. So would it be fair to say that there were --
- 25 there were sort of amorphous vague issues concerning
- 26 his credibility or what he was up to?
- 27 A. Yeah, not reliable, credibility issues, yes.
- 28 26 Q. All right. And you met him, in any event, in February
- 29 2014, and he obviously produced a dossier and gave it

- 1 to you, is that right?
- 2 A. Well, at that stage he just told me his story.
- 3 27 Q. All right.
- A. Initially. And spoke about the penalty points and made a point to me that he understood discretion, for

10:36

10:37

- 6 example. I think he was endeavouring to convey that he
- 7 wasn't a zealot who was out to, you know, query every
- 8 single act of every single garda in terms of the
- 9 application of penalty points or the waiving of penalty
- points, and we went through that. But what he was
- 11 talking about, he made it clear to me, was systemic
- abuse of the penalty points system by people in -- for
- friends and so on like that. And that he felt it was a
- 14 systemic issue here. And then I said to him and there
- are other issues I understand as well, and he went
- through that catalogue of issues.
- 17 28 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. And I asked him could he then put together a dossier of
- those because they seemed very serious to me, not least
- the case dealing with Sylvia Roach Kelly, the murder of 10:37
- 21 Sylvia Roach Kelly, I was shocked at that. That is the
- issue that jumped out with me, along with other issues
- of serious assault. And that was issue that motivated
- 24 me more than anything to raise it in the Dáil.
- 25 29 Q. Yes. And do I understand then correctly that at the
- 26 meeting he didn't produce a dossier but did so
- 27 subsequently --
- 28 A. That is my understanding.
- 29 30 Q. -- forwarding it to you. Just one question about the

Т			meeting and any subsequent communication. Did ne	
2			complain to you at that stage that there was a smear	
3			campaign being conducted?	
4		Α.	He didn't at that meeting.	
5	31	Q.	Okay. And did he make any complaint about the Garda	10:37
6			authorities or senior Garda figures	
7		Α.	Sorry.	
8	32	Q.	running a campaign against him?	
9		Α.	His fundamental complaint was he felt this was a	
10			management failure.	10:38
11	33	Q.	Okay.	
12		Α.	Okay. He didn't accuse people of corruption, and he	
13			felt he hadn't got a fair hearing, but at that stage he	
14			didn't actually say there was a campaign against him.	
15	34	Q.	Okay. Would it be fair to say that the extent of his	10:38
16			concerns related to the issues he had raised, the way	
17			they had been met within the force and the lack of	
18			progress in having them dealt with in what he felt to	
19			be a proper way?	
20		Α.	Sorry?	10:38
21	35	Q.	The lack of progress in having them dealt with?	
22		Α.	Yes, absolute frustration in that regard. And again,	
23			I'm subject to correction in terms of, you know and	
24			this could have been at a later stage, he was	
25			particularly annoyed at references to the fact that he	10:38
26			didn't cooperate with the I think it was the	
27			O'Mahony investigation at the time.	
28	36	Q.	Yes, yes. But he wasn't coming to you	
29		Α.	He said he wasn't asked.	

- 1 37 Q. Yes. But he wasn't coming to you and didn't come to
  2 you for the purposes of, as it were, pointing the
  3 finger at any particular guard or the Commissioner or
  4 the deputy commissioner, saying there is a campaign
- 5 being run against me relating to this old allegation?

10:39

- 6 A. No, not at that stage, no.
- 7 38 Q. Okay. In any event, you raised the issues relating to
  8 the dossier, presumably you didn't see it as your
  9 function and you didn't yourself make any inquiry
  10 yourself into the issues that he had raised, wouldn't 10:39
- A. Well, I did seek a meeting with Noel Brett because
  Maurice McCabe would have referenced Noel Brett in his
  discussion with him, but I raised the issue in the
  context of seeking an inquiry.

be your business to do so?

16 39 Q. Yes.

11

- A. And then leaving it to the inquiry then to make up its
  mind. I think -- he impressed me as a witness. He had
  substantive material. He had made clear to me as well,
  by the way, that he wasn't leaking to the media, he
  wasn't at that stage looking for notoriety or anything
  like that; he wanted to get these issues heard.
- 23 40 Q. Okay.
- A. So my function, I saw it as, to raise the issues as a
  matter of genuine public interest and to seek a
  process, a commission of investigation.
- 27 41 Q. Yes. And you wrote to the Taoiseach obviously, and --
- 28 A. After raising it in the Dáil I wrote to the Taoiseach.
- To be fair, the then-Taoiseach responded fairly quickly

1 on the floor of the House and said can you send me the 2 dossier and I will give this serious consideration. 3 42 Q. Yes. And I did. 4 Α. 5 43 Yes. And he, I think, acted what appears to be Q. 10:40 6 reasonably quickly --7 Did he. Α. 8 44 -- in having the matter examined by an independent Q. counsel, Mr. Seán Guerin SC? 9 He did. 10 Α. 10 · 40 11 45 And that process then started? Q. 12 Yes. Α. 13 But you have referred in your second letter to the 46 Q. 14 Tribunal, at page 1674, recalling that Deputy 15 McGuinness came to your office, I think you say in late 10:41 16 February, and you record him as having thanked you for 17 raising the contents of the McCabe dossier in the Dáil 18 on 19th and having brought the matter to public attention. And he mentioned another matter to you on 19 20 that occasion, is that right? 10:41 That is correct. 21 Α. 22 47 And could you just describe in your own words to the Q. 23 best of your recollection what he told you? 24 Yeah. Just to explain that deputies drop into the Α. 25 office from time to time on the fourth floor. 10 · 41 26 48 Yes. Ο. 27 And he came in to say, thanking me and saying well done

in terms of raising this issue. He had expressed an

opinion that politicians or mainstream politicians

Α.

28

29

1			should be representing and supporting people like	
2			Maurice McCabe in the situations that they find	
3			themselves in, they feel marginalised, they feel people	
4			don't support them enough and towards the end of the	
5			meeting, at the very end of the meeting, he then said	10:42
6			to me that he had met the then Garda Commissioner,	
7			Martin Callinan, in a car park and that he had said to	
8			him that Maurice McCabe was not to be trusted and that	
9			he was a child abuser.	
10	49	Q.	And you say in your letter to the Tribunal he gave no	10:42
11			other details?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	50	Q.	But did you make any inquiry of him as to the	
14			circumstances in which the meeting took place?	
15		Α.	I didn't. Well, other than he referenced the fact that	10:42
16			in the context of public accounts that he would meet	
17			witnesses, but that was it. I mean, he was very	
18			assertive and definitive in saying I met Martin	
19			Callinan and this is what he said.	
20	51	Q.	Mm-hmm. And did you understand that it had happened at	10:43
21			what might be regarded as sort of a crucial period	
22			during those weeks in January; in other words, that	
23			they had heard the Commissioner's evidence and they had	
24			yet to decide whether or in what format to hear	
25			Sergeant McCabe's evidence?	10:43
26		Α.	Yeah, to be honest, to me, I had got a response from	
27			the Taoiseach on my the substantive issue that I had	
28			raised.	
29	52	Q.	Yes, yes?	

Τ		Α.	I held my counsel on this. I felt I can go on the	
2			concrete on the material, I can't go on hearsay. And	
3			notwithstanding, it did surprise me, I was taken aback	
4			by the fact first of all there was a meeting in the car	
5			park and secondly, the nature of it, but I took a	10:4
6			decision to proceed with material that, you know the	
7			concrete, and the tangible.	
8	53	Q.	Yes. You had no documentation or anything relating to	
9			what Deputy McGuinness said, obviously?	
10		Α.	No, no.	10:4
11	54	Q.	And is that something you made a note of or is it	
12			something you	
13		Α.	I didn't make a note of it.	
14	55	Q.	You wouldn't need to make a note of that?	
15		Α.	No, no. I was taken aback at the time and he left the	10:4
16			room and I reflected on that.	
17	56	Q.	And did he explain to you what the purpose of meeting	
18			the Commissioner was or who had sought the meeting?	
19		Α.	He didn't, no, no.	
20	57	Q.	Okay. In terms of what he was reporting the	10:4
21			Commissioner to have said, that Sergeant McCabe wasn't	
22			to be trusted and that he was a child abuser, was that	
23			the first time you had heard that allegation?	
24		Α.	I had heard rumour about child abuse but nothing	
25			specific, couldn't pin it down in a window, that kind	10:4
26			of thing, be careful, be careful how you are proceeding	
27			on this issue, but that would have been, you know,	

that was the -- you know, that was different.

28

29

coming from a Garda Commissioner saying it to a TD,

- 1 58 Q. Yes. In terms of hearing it, albeit indirectly from 2 that source, the Commissioner, and obviously taking it 3 at face value, Deputy McGuinness was accurately
- 4 reporting something that had been said to him, would
- that not be something that would have caused you to

10 · 45

10:45

10:46

10 · 46

- reflect on it and perhaps bring it to the attention of the Taoiseach or the Minister for Justice?
- A. I did reflect on it, but my fundamental point on that is, to accuse anyone of child abuse is probably the worst accusation you can make against any individual.
- 11 To subsequently rearticulate that is, whether one likes
- it or not, going to be very damaging to that
- individual. There is a dilemma there, in the context
- of a hearsay conversation, if you go off and blurt it
- to somebody else, they will talk to somebody else.
- 16 59 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. That person -- in my personal view, that person's
- reputation is damaged. Secondly, there is a reasonable
- assumption that if the Garda Commissioner is saying
- this, then surely he must have a basis for saying it,
- and if it's true and if there is substance to it, one
- could presume the Gardaí are going to investigate this
- and there will be an outcome. It wasn't for me really
- 24 to progress that issue --
- 25 60 Q. Yes.
- 26 A. -- any further, I would have thought. And thirdly, it
- was hearsay at the end of the day.
- 28 61 Q. Yes. No, of course, it's obviously not your function
- to investigate it and obviously the source it's coming

1			from is obviously an issue. Did Deputy McGuinness say	
2			anything along the lines as to whether there were	
3			investigations going on or	
4		Α.	No, he didn't.	
5	62	Q.	That this was a current issue or a past issue?	10:46
6		Α.	He didn't.	
7	63	Q.	Okay. All right. You do say in your first	
8			correspondence with the Tribunal that you had further	
9			contact and correspondence with Sergeant McCabe. What	
10			was that in connection with?	10:47
11		Α.	Well, actually, after I raised it in the Dáil and the	
12			Taoiseach had indicated a response that he was going	
13			now, there was a number of engagements, but that one	
14			was the first one afterwards and he thanked me and he	
15			said, this is the first time, he said, that I'm getting	10:47
16			some public acknowledgement of the issues that I have	
17			been raising for quite some time and he was there	
18			was a certain sense of, how would I put it, resolution	
19			for him, that this matter was getting traction, was	
20			getting serious consideration by the authorities.	10:47
21	64	Q.	Yes, yes?	
22		Α.	And he had asked me at the meeting, you know, his ask	
23			actually was a commission of investigation originally	
24			with me.	
25	65	Q.	Okay.	10:47
26		Α.	Guerin clearly was a scoping inquiry to make a judgment	
27			as to whether a commission of inquiry was merited or	
28			not. And then now, we didn't have frequent	
29			engagement. Then latterly, you know, in the aftermath	

1			of the which I think is the subject matter of my	
2			first letter, the Ms. D visit to me, I contacted him	
3			again in relation to that.	
4	66	Q.	Yes. And so, would it be fair to say that the	
5			correspondence you had or the contact you had with him	10:48
6			afterwards was not face-to-face, it was through	
7			correspondence?	
8		Α.	Oh, yes.	
9	67	Q.	And he was appreciative of the fact that you had raised	
10			it in the Dáil. And was that before Mr. Guerin had	10:48
11			been appointed then or afterwards?	
12		Α.	Before.	
13	68	Q.	Before. And obviously he hadn't, I don't know whether	
14			you had sought through the Taoiseach to have a	
15			commission established or not or just some form of	10:48
16			inquiry, had you expressed any preference	
17		Α.	My understanding and I stand to be corrected, it may be	
18			on the record of the House, that I actually called for	
19			a commission of investigation to be established.	
20	69	Q.	All right. In any event, you were presumably content	10:48
21			at that stage with the information available to have a	
22			scoping exercise?	
23		Α.	I may have articulated a brief impatience that let's	
24			get straight to a commission of investigation, but	
25			having been a former Minister and having set up some	10:49
26			inquiries I could understand and understood actually	
27			the purpose of Guerin.	
28	70	Q.	You mentioned Ms. D there, and the Tribunal has heard	
29			of a visit and an interview that Mr. Williams had with	

Т			MS. D IN relation to concerns that she had, but that	
2			became the subject matter of an article in relation to	
3			you about her willingness or her anxiety to meet you.	
4			Can I ask you to look at perhaps, if you take Volume 2	
5			of the volumes there, and at page 568 is the first of	10:49
6			those articles. And it's headed: "Alleged Garda sex	
7			victim wants to meet Martin." And then there is a	
8			picture of you and it starts off:	
9				
10			"A young woman who claims she was sexually abused by a	10:50
11			serving garda, and that the incident was covered up,	
12			has requested an urgent meeting with Micheál Martin.	
13				
14			The Fianna Fail leader"	
15		Α.	Can you hold one second?	10:50
16	71	Q.	Yes, I am sorry.	
17		Α.	568.	
18	72	Q.	I just read the headline and then the first short	
19			paragraph, and then it says:	
20				
21			"The Fianna Fail leader has already brought a dossier	
22			of alleged garda malpractice cases to the Taoiseach's	
23			attention.	
24				
25			Now the woman wants to meet Mr Martin in order to	
26			highlight her own case - and outline claims that her	
27			allegations of being sexually assaulted by the	
28			still-serving garda were not properly investigated.	

			resterday, contact was made with Mr. Martin 3 office in	
2			order to set up a meeting with him, and she is awaiting	
3			a response."	
4				
5			And then it goes to detail her complaints. At what	10:5
6			stage did you become aware of her desire to have a	
7			meeting with you?	
8		Α.	In or around the time of these articles. We received a	
9			phone call.	
10	73	Q.	Yes.	10:5
11		Α.	My chef de cabinet, Ms. Deirdre Gillane, received a	
12			phone call from Mr. Paul Williams asking would I be	
13			prepared to meet with this person.	
14	74	Q.	Yes. Obviously this is published, apparently in the	
15			context where the contact has been made with your	10:5
16			office, but, as it were, no commitment yet issued.	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	75	Q.	Would it be normal to indicate that such a contact has	
19			been made or a decision is waited? I mean, it seems to	
20			be a bit of advance publicity that the meeting might	10:5
21			happen?	
22		Α.	Correct.	
23	76	Q.	And at a time perhaps when it hadn't been agreed to?	
24		Α.	Yes, and I am not sure was there an earlier article?	
25	77	Q.	There had been an earlier article	10:5
26		Α.	From memory.	
27	78	Q.	but this is the first one that references you, and	
28			the meeting?	
29		Α.	And the meeting, okay. Yeah, there was a sense that, I	

- 1 mean, this certainly was in advance of we being asked,
- 2 if that's the question.
- 3 79 Q. Yes.
- 4 A. Yes. I think it's fair to say that this was advance
- 5 publicity, if you like, setting the scene.
- 6 80 Q. Yes. But would you have been happy to meet her whether

10:52

10:52

10:52

- 7 there was an article published or not --
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 81 Q. -- or whether there was any publicity?
- 10 A. I would have been, of course.
- 11 82 Q. And you did meet her. And do you recollect the date
- 12 you met her? It appears --
- 13 A. I can get that for you.
- 14 83 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. It's April time --
- 16 84 Q. Pardon?
- 17 A. It's sometime -- well, that date here --
- 18 85 Q. Well, the next article --
- 19 A. It's within a week of this.
- 20 86 Q. Yes, it is within a week of that. The next article
- 21 that we have is at 570.
- 22 A. That is page 570.
- 23 87 Q. It appears to be the following day, April 15th?
- 24 A. Yeah.
- 25 88 Q. Or perhaps even actually later the same day, perhaps.
- 26 But it recites an agreement to meet her next week. Do
- 27 you see the third paragraph of that?
- 28 A. I do, yeah.
- 29 89 Q. "Fianna Fail leader, Micheál Martin, has agreed to meet

her next week to discuss the latest disturbing 1 2 allegations of Garda malpractice to be made public." 3 And then there is details of what she apparently is 4 5 alleging. 10:53 6 Yes. Α. 7 So was the contact with Mr. Williams from your office? 90 Q. 8 Mr. Williams contacted my office. Α. Did Mr. Williams contacted your office? 9 91 Q. Yeah, he took the initiative. 10 Α. 10:53 11 92 Q. So the phone call to your chef de cabinet, Ms. Gillane, 12 that came from Mr. Williams as far as you understand? 13 Yes, yes. Α. And did she confirm to Mr. Williams then that the 14 93 0. 15 meeting would take place? 10:53 16 That I would be willing to meet. Α. 17 94 Yes. Okay. And was there any material sent to you in Q. 18 advance of the meeting or --19 No, no. Α. 20 95 Okay. Presumably you were aware of these reports at 0. 10:53 the time before you met her? 21 22 Of which reports? Α. 23 Of these newspaper reports. 96 Q. 24 I was, yeah, yeah. Sorry, yes, I did read the Α. 25 newspaper reports in advance, yes. 10:54 26 97 Yes. And is that all you knew about it? Q.

Well, about which now? I mean, there was a sense --

No, I didn't know the details or anything like that,

About what she was complaining about, as it were?

27

28

29

Α.

Q.

Α.

98

- 1 but there was a sense that this was about Maurice
- 2 McCabe.
- 3 99 Q. Well, that is what I was going to ask you. Had you
- 4 drawn the dots, as it were?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 100 Q. Had you reached that conclusion?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 101 Q. And what had caused you to reach that conclusion that

10:54

10:54

10:54

- 9 this was in fact --
- 10 A. Just intuition. The fact that the articles were -- as
- 11 you say, there was a bit of advance publicity attached
- to it, but I decided in any event, I had no difficulty
- in meeting with the individual.
- 14 102 Q. Yes. And did you meet her in your Dáil office?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 103 Q. Okay. And did she come alone or was she --
- 17 A. She came alone.
- 18 104 Q. Okay.
- 19 A. And I had Ms. Deirdre Gillane with me.
- 20 105 Q. And Mr. Williams wasn't there, for instance?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 106 Q. And she outlined her concerns to you?
- A. She did. Now, she didn't go into the detail of the
- abuse, but she said she had been abused and her main
- concern with me was that she felt that it had not been
- 26 investigated --
- 27 107 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. -- properly because it involved a garda, namely Maurice
- 29 McCabe, and that it was deficient, if you like, in

1 terms of the investigation. She did instance that it 2 had gone to the DPP and she felt it hadn't been investigated properly and therefore that it should be 3 included in the Guerin terms of reference, and that 4 5 would I write to the Taoiseach and would I seek to have 10:55 it included in the terms of reference of Guerin. 6 7 understand that Mr. Guerin at that stage had -- may 8 have had a communication from Ms. D and had declined to include it within his terms of reference. 9 Did that piece of information come from her? 10 108 Q. 10:55 11 Yes. Α. 12 Okay. And you mentioned obviously Sergeant McCabe 109 Ο. 13 there in the course of your answer, did she identify 14 him to you as a still-serving guard or did she identify 15 him as a sergeant in the same station as her father or 16 did she identify him by name? 17 My understanding is she did mention him by name because Α. 18 I think she mentioned that they were family friends 19 originally, or the two families were friendly. 20 110 Okay. Yeah. And what was your general response or did 10:56 Q. you respond at the meeting in any particular way? 21 22 Well, we resolved -- I took the matter very seriously. Α. 23 You know, when a young woman comes before you and makes 24 this presentation because I -- down through the years I 25 have met many victims and I take a very open mind when 10:56 26 these cases are brought to you and a very considered 27 approach. So, we resolved, I am not clear whether it was at the meeting, but myself and Ms. Gillane resolved 28 29 once the meeting concluded that we would forward this

Т			to the radiseach and would say to the radiseach that in	
2			our view it should be included in the terms of Guerin	
3			because Guerin dealt with Garda malpractice with a	
4			series of deficient investigations in the	
5			Cavan-Monaghan district, and there was a sense that	10:57
6			this could fall within that parameters and let's have	
7			everything dealt with.	
8	111	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	And just to add, I did ring, I then out of courtesy	
10			decided that I would inform Maurice McCabe that I was	10:57
11			going to proceed with this course of action.	
12	112	Q.	In advance of doing so, was it?	
13		Α.	Well, out of courtesy, I was going to do it anyway, but	
14			just to let him know I was doing it. And then he	
15			volunteered that he knew about it and he indicated the	10:57
16			DPP had dealt with the case comprehensively and had	
17			said not only was there no case to answer but it was	
18			questionable whether it merited you know, the actual	
19			nature of the allegation itself which Ms. D hadn't gone	
20			into with me.	10:58
21	113	Q.	He was able to tell you that and he did tell you that?	
22		Α.	He did tell me that. But he actually also advocated	
23			that it should go to Guerin, that he had no difficulty	
24			with it going to Guerin as well. He was of a view at	
25			that stage.	10:58
26	114	Q.	Is that right? The next article just in that same	
27			volume is at page 572 and it appears to be from the	
28			Saturday, May 3rd edition of the Irish Independent, and	
29			it says:	

1				
2			"Kenny to set up probe into Garda sex abuse claims.	
3				
4			Taoiseach Enda is expected to order an investigation	
5			into allegations that a young woman was sexually abused	
6			by a serving garda.	
7				
8			The woman's claims were passed to Mr. Kenny by Fianna	
9			Fail leader Micheál Martin who met her in his Dáil	
10			office earlier this week."	
11				
12			Does that accurately reflect the view you had expressed	
13			or the view you had come to, that you were going to be	
14			asking the Taoiseach to include it?	
15		Α.	Well, it says here it's expected to order an	10:58
16			investigation into allegations, yeah. We had the	
17			conclusion of our meeting is we would send it to the	
18			Taoiseach.	
19	115	Q.	Yes.	
20		Α.	We couldn't preempt what the Taoiseach was going to do	10:59
21			with it.	
22	116	Q.	No. But obviously you had decided to do that. And did	
23			you do that by writing to the Taoiseach?	
24		Α.	Yes, yes.	
25	117	Q.	Okay. And just in terms of the sequence of events and	10:59
26			this article, I mean presumably you didn't issue a	
27			statement to that effect, you wrote to the Taoiseach?	
28		Α.	I wrote to the Taoiseach.	

29 118 Q. You told Ms. D you were going to write to the

1 Taoiseach? 2 Now, I am not clear whether Paul Williams as a Α. 3 journalist would have contacted my office, presumably --4 5 119 To confirm whether you --Q. 10:59 6 -- to confirm what -- yeah. Α. 7 That is possible then, is it? 120 Yes. Q. Yeah, that is possible. 8 Α. 9 121 I mean, is it something that you would have --Q. That would be normal. 10 Α. 10:59 11 122 -- made known to the Dáil after you had done it? Q. 12 No, no. Α. 13 You didn't raise this in the Dáil then? 123 Q. 14 Α. Again it was an issue to do with an allegation of 15 sexual abuse and I am very careful. 10:59 16 And you didn't publish your letter. 124 Q. 17 Α. No. 18 125 You sent it to the Taoiseach and it was up to the Q. 19 Taoiseach --20 Yes. Α. 11:00 -- then to see would it or could it fit within the 21 126 Q. 22 Guerin? And obviously that Mr. Guerin himself would have 23 Yes. Α. 24 some input into that. 25 Yes. There is reference in the fourth-last paragraph 127 0. 11:00 26 on that page, it says: 27 "It's understood she is also due to meet with 28 investigators from the Garda Síochána Ombudsman 29

Commission and with a solicitor with a view to 1 2 commencing a civil action again the garda concerned." 3 was the issue of a GSOC referral, was that raised by 4 5 her or feature in the meeting with you at all? 11:00 6 It may have been. Generally GSOC gets raised. Α. 7 128 Yes. Q. 8 But with considerable degree of, how shall I put it, Α. lack of expectation, and that is no criticism as to --9 10 129 Q. Yes. 11:00 11 As to, you know, outcomes and delays. Α. 12 Is that just because of their workload --130 Q. 13 Yes. Α. 14 131 Q. -- and the time it can take sometimes? 15 Α. Yes. 11:00 16 But did she indicate it was something --132 Q. 17 To be straight up with you, she may have raised that. Α. 18 133 Yes. Q. 19 But that wasn't the substance of the meeting. Α. 134 I understand that. 20 But it sounds as if you're Q. 11:01 perhaps saying that you didn't advise that as a step, 21 that was something that she told you she was 22 23 contemplating, would that be fair, or were you not perhaps certain? 24 25 I don't want to be definitive on that --Α. 11:01 26 135 In any event, you became aware that the Taoiseach 0. 27 referred the issue of whether this should be included to the Minister? 28 29 Yes. Α.

- 1 136 Q. Who at that stage was then Minister Fitzgerald?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 137 Q. Minister Shatter had gone?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 138 Q. And then I think you were, as it were, informed by
- 6 Minister Fitzgerald that the issue was going to be
- 7 considered by the review mechanism set up, and had you

11 · 02

11:02

11:02

11.02

- 8 been consulted about that --
- 9 A. No.
- 10 139 Q. -- or was it just you were being informed of it?
- 11 A. I was just informed of it. To be fair, at the time of
- 12 all of the publicity around the Maurice McCabe issue,
- many more whistleblowers, many more people with issues
- came to the fore, came to politicians, and the
- independent panel of barristers was established by the
- 16 Minister to deal with, I think there may have been even
- 17 150 cases, I stand to be corrected on that. I would
- have received some of them. So there was an enormous
- 19 tranche of material coming to a number of politicians
- and to the Minister, no doubt, and I think that
- 21 mechanism then was used to try and deal with those
- issues.
- 23 140 Q. Yes. And presumably you were content that that was the
- proper way to deal with how these matters might be
- examined if they required to be examined further?
- 26 A. Well, I think it was -- I understood that mechanism as
- 27 being a reasonable response to that and to the issues
- that were arising.
- 29 141 Q. Yes. And obviously when the review mechanism process

Т			concruded, the Government took a decision to ray the	
2			draft terms of reference of the O'Higgins Commission	
3			before the Dáil and you supported the establishment of	
4			an inquiry?	
5		Α.	I did, yes.	11:03
6	142	Q.	All right. And at that stage, you presumably were	
7			aware that it was going to be following the areas	
8			identified by Mr. Guerin in his report?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	143	Q.	And no additional matters?	11:03
11		Α.	And no additional matters, yeah. In the end that was	
12			my main focus, the substantive material in the dossier	
13			that went to Guerin, that subsequently went to	
14			O'Higgins.	
15	144	Q.	Yes. In relation to the Tribunal's other terms of	11:03
16			reference, have you any other information or evidence	
17			concerning any negative briefing by any senior	
18			superintendent or higher-ranking officer throughout	
19		Α.	I don't. You mean in terms of	
20	145	Q.	In terms of Sergeant McCabe?	11:04
21		Α.	Only what subsequently emerged in terms of David Taylor	
22			and the protected disclosure and what he has said.	
23	146	Q.	Yes. So indirectly you became aware of that?	
24		Α.	Yes. But no garda ever directly spoke to me.	
25	147	Q.	And did you hear it reflected back through any	11:04
26			journalist, any political correspondents, any crime	
27			correspondents that Superintendent Taylor was briefing	
28			against Sergeant McCabe?	
29		Α.	Not directly, but some journalists, as I said earlier.	

- would have raised questions with my press office as to the extent that is your leader satisfied that he is dealing with a credible person here.
- 4 148 Q. But as vague and as general as that?
- A. It was general. They would have been aware of the rumour, that is all, rumours and that kind of thing.

  But there was that air about the place that your leader should be careful, that, you know, he is dealing with somebody here who is not that reliable, that sense.
- 10 149 Q. Okay. And did that, in fact, affect your judgment or decision-making in any respect, in any adverse way, as far as you were concerned?

11:05

11:05

It affected my course of actions in the sense that I 13 Α. dealt with the substantive materials. 14 I didn't -- I took a decision that I can't really deal with hearsay, 15 16 I can't deal with rumour. If I have a substantial 17 document put in front of me I can make a judgment call 18 on that and likewise, in the context of Ms. D as a 19 person coming to meet me, you know, physical meeting takes place. And yeah, does it sow doubt? It sows 20 some doubt, but one has to make one's own judgment on 21 22 In terms of, I had met Maurice McCabe, I was 23 taken by him at the first meeting because it wasn't all 24 bluster, it wasn't all talk, there was substantive 25 material there, and he had -- he is the type of individual who is very meticulous, it seems me, and he 26 27 had chapter and verse. And Noel Brett would have corroborated a lot of that for me and Noel Brett would 28 29 have told me, certainly in the context of the penalty

1 points, that he was on the button, that this guy should 2 be believed, that what he is saying is correct, and you 3 will be hearing negative stuff, he said to me, but I'm telling you what he is saying here stacks up. 4 5 150 All right. Thank you, Deputy Martin. Would you answer 11:06 Q. 6 any questions anyone else may have. 7

MR. McDOWELL: No questions, Chairman.

MS. BURNS: Yes, Chairman, I have some questions.

10

11

29

Α.

8

9

11:06

## THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS:

12 Good morning, Mr. Martin. My name is Tara 151 Ο. MS. BURNS: 13 Burns and I am appearing on behalf of Superintendent 14 Dave Taylor. Just in relation to the last portion of 15 the evidence that you have given to the Tribunal, in 11:06 16 your statement or in your letter to the Tribunal dated 17 22nd December 2017 where you refer to the information 18 that you received from Deputy McGuinness in relation to 19 the conversation he had with former Commissioner Martin 20 Callinan, you indicate that what you were told by him 11:07 in relation to what Mr. Callinan had said to him, that 21 22 that coincided with a rumour that you were aware of, 23 and specifically you refer in that letter to a rumour 24 which was in general circulation at the time in 25 political but also media circles you refer to. 11:07 26 information did you have at that time, so that is 27 February of 2014, in relation to a rumour in media circles? 28

I didn't have specific information. It was a rumour,

- 1 very difficult to pin it down.
- 2 152 Q. I see. And it was a rumour in relation to some kind of
- 3 a sexual allegation, is that correct?
- 4 A. Abuse -- you know, that -- not a specific allegation.

11:08

- 5 Child abuse, there may be issues there, but very
- 6 general, to be honest.
- 7 153 Q. I see. And can I ask you, how had that rumour within
- 8 media circles come to your attention?
- 9 A. Well, generally around Leinster House and my officials
- 10 would have picked up some of it. But again, not
- specific, so it was very hard to pin it down.
- 12 154 Q. I see. Because you specifically refer to a rumour
- 13 within two areas?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 155 Q. You refer to a rumour within the political arena --
- 16 A. And the media.
- 17 156 Q. -- and the media?
- 18 A. Well obviously, our press officer was in contact with
- media, but you know, he didn't get specific, to the
- 20 best of my knowledge, allegations in relation to abuse. 11:08
- 21 157 Q. I see. So in relation to that information in your
- letter, that was information that you had received from
- 23 your actual press officer?
- 24 A. Sorry? No, I am saying -- yeah, I think it was
- generally around Leinster House there was a rumour, but 11:08
- I can't pin down the rumour.
- 27 158 Q. And I completely understand that. But really what I'm
- asking you is, the reference to two specific areas,
- 29 both political and then separately media --

- 1 A. Media.
- 2 159 Q. -- the rumour was circulating within both of those
- 3 separate areas, your evidence appears to be that that
- 4 was something that had come to the attention of your

11 . 09

11:09

11:09

- 5 press officer?
- 6 A. I think it would have, yeah.
- 7 160 Q. I see. Do you recollect speaking to him about that?
- 8 A. Not specifically. There was general chitchat all of
- 9 the time, there was general discussion, I think he was
- 10 getting queries as to whether, you know, your leader
- could stand over the credibility of this witness.
- 12 161 Q. I see. Because you have certainly, in your evidence,
- relating to the meetings that you've had with Ms. D,
- 14 they are in April 2014 --
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 162 Q. -- but am I right that your evidence is that even
- 17 earlier than that, in February 2014, some form of a
- 18 rumour with a sexual connotation had come to the
- 19 attention of your press officer?
- 20 A. Yeah, the big difference being Ms. D was a very
- 21 specific case --
- 22 163 Q. Of course.
- 23 A. -- which I hadn't been aware of up to then?
- 24 164 Q. I see. So Ms. D is obviously -- that arises from your
- 25 perspective in April of 2014?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 165 Q. But in February of 2014, when Deputy McGuinness speaks
- to you, it seems to be your evidence that even at that
- 29 stage you were aware --

2 -- that within the media that there was a rumour? 166 Q. 3 Rumours, yeah. Α. And your evidence is that must have come to your 4 167 0. 5 attention from your press officer? 11:10 6 Not exclusively, no. It would have been general Α. 7 around. 8 168 But specifically in relation to a media rumour, okay. 0. 9 do I take it that that information to you is through vour Press Officer? 10 11 · 10 11 Α. I don't want to be that specific. I think it was a 12 very general rumour that was very difficult to pin down 13 as to the origin or source of. 14 169 Q. I see. 15 It was in the ether, so to speak. Α. 11:10 16 Well then in relation to any other information that you 170 Ο. 17 had from media personnel, was there anybody else that 18 you had discussed or heard a rumour from in relation to 19 Sergeant McCabe? In terms of specific individuals? 20 Α. 11:10 21 171 Yes. Q. 22 I can't say that here. In terms, I can't be specific Α. 23 in terms of a specific individual in the media who came 24 to me and said that, no. 25 172 Q. I see. Thank you very much. 11:11 26 27 MR. LEHANE: I have no questions.

1

28

29

Α.

A rumour.

MR. DIGNAM:

MR. DOCKERY: I have no questions, Chairman.

Chairman, I just have a number of

1			questions that I want to put to Deputy Martin.	
2				
3			THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM:	
4	173	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Deputy Martin, my name is Conor Dignam and	
5			I appear on behalf of An Garda Síochána, certain	11:11
6			members of An Garda Síochána, and in particular I want	
7			to put some questions to you on behalf of former	
8			Commissioner Callinan. And I want to explore with you	
9			your statements or your letters to the Tribunal and	
10			your evidence this morning for the purpose of putting	11:11
11			to you that you must have been mistaken	
12		Α.	Sorry?	
13	174	Q.	That you must be mistaken and perhaps understandably so	
14			in relation to your exchange with Deputy McGuinness in	
15			February 2014. And I suspect that we will be able to	11:11
16			get through it pretty quickly because there will	
17			probably be large agreement between us on many areas.	
18			I don't propose getting into your political career in	
19			any detail, I think your political career is well-known	
20			probably to everybody listening to you. You have held	11:12
21			four ministerial portfolios, I think, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	Correct.	
23	175	Q.	Health, education and skills or education and science	
24			or	
25		Α.	Science. We fought hard for it.	11:12
26	176	Q.	Yes. The Department of Foreign Affairs and the	
27			Department of Enterprise, Trade and Employment?	
28		Α.	And health.	
29	177	Q.	And health, yes. And I think you have been TD since	

- 1 1989, isn't that correct, yes.
- 2 A. Correct.
- 3 178 Q. You are currently uachtarán of one of the oldest
- 4 political parties in the State, and in short, you are
- 5 an extremely experienced politician and
- 6 parliamentarian, and I don't necessarily expect you to

11 · 12

11:13

11:13

- 7 blow your own trumpet.
- 8 A. Still learning.
- 9 179 Q. And while you were Minister for Education and Science
- 10 you were dealing with the Ryan Commission, and indeed
- and you might correct me if I am wrong, but issues such
- 12 as the Children First Guidelines, etcetera, were coming
- on-stream or were about to be introduced or had just
- 14 been introduced, and I am not going to ask you of the
- details of them, Deputy Martin, I am just putting them
- in a place in time, is that right?
- 17 A. I would have been responsible for -- with the Cabinet,
- obviously, in terms of the Ryan Commission, the
- 19 establishment of the Ryan Commission. Children First I
- 20 think would have been with the Department of Health at
- 21 that time, if I am not mistaken, and would have come
- forward a bit later than that.
- 23 180 Q. Okay. And I principally want to focus, as I say, on
- the exchange in February 2014 but also on the fact of
- apparently nothing being done on foot of this --
- A. Sorry?
- 27 181 Q. The fact of apparently nothing being done on foot of
- 28 this conversation with Deputy McGuinness after February
- 29 2014, but I might just ask you one or two questions

Т			about the evidence that you gave in response to	
2			Mr. McGuinness's evidence. He asked you whether	
3			Sergeant McCabe complained about a smear campaign or an	
4			alleged smear campaign being conducted by An Garda	
5			Síochána when you met him in February 2014.	11:1
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	182	Q.	And you said no, but I noted that you said "no, not at	
8			that stage", I think you used that phrase a couple of	
9			times. Could you expand on that: Was there a point in	
10			time where Sergeant McCabe raised with you his concerns	11:1
11			that there was a smear campaign or that he was being	
12			done down by members of An Garda Síochána?	
13		Α.	No, no, to be fair, and I wouldn't weigh too much on	
14			"at that stage" in my response, to be very fair, the	
15			purpose of that first meeting was to get traction on	11:1
16			the issues that he had.	
17	183	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	And particularly the issues to do with the dossier, the	

Cavan-Monaghan dossier. He didn't -- he didn't 19 20 complain about a smear campaign. And in my 21 conversations with him, we didn't delve into that at I think it would be a fair, and I stand to be 22 23 corrected in terms of recollection on that, but the 24 purposes my engagement with Maurice McCabe was always 25 on progressing the issues that he had raised with me. It was latterly, I suppose, ultimately when that Tusla 26 27 file emerged, you know, but generally speaking he was -- Guerin had been established, O'Higgins had been 28 29 established on foot of it, so he -- so he wasn't -- his

11:14

- engagement with me wasn't about a smear campaign.
- 2 184 Q. I want to be clear, Deputy Martin, I am not being
- 3 critical of Sergeant McCabe, if he was raising with you

11 · 15

11:16

11:16

11 · 16

- 4 that there was a smear campaign.
- 5 A. I am just trying to give an answer honestly.
- 6 185 Q. Yes. Just to be clear, did Sergeant McCabe raise with
- 7 you at any point in time his concern that there was a
- 8 smear campaign going on?
- 9 A. I don't think he did, I don't believe he did.
- 10 186 Q. Okay. Now, then turning to your conversation or your
- interaction with Deputy McGuinness in February 2014,
- obviously there are only two parties to that
- 13 conversation?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 187 Q. And only two parties can give evidence as to what was
- said or what was not said during the course of that,
- 17 you and Deputy McGuinness. I'm not sure how closely
- 18 you have been following the evidence over the past week
- or so, but you are probably aware that Deputy
- 20 McGuinness didn't in fact tell the Tribunal about this
- 21 conversation. He made a statement to the Tribunal and
- 22 didn't mention it and he said in evidence last Monday
- and Tuesday that he didn't remember the meeting that he
- had with you in February 2014 until he saw your
- statement or your letter rather, of the 22nd December
- 26 2017, and that's what recalled it for him. Were you
- 27 aware of that?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 188 Q. Yes. Were you aware that in fact he said in a radio

2 had not told you about his meeting with former 3 Commissioner Callinan in the car park in Bewley's Hotel or what was said during the course of that meeting? 4 5 Were you aware of -- first of all, are you aware that 11:17 he gave that evidence last week? 6 7 Sorry, just to be clear, I read the transcripts of what Α. 8 Mr. McGuinness said in the last 48 hours. That is helpful. 9 189 Q. So that creates a context there --10 Α. 11:17 11 190 Yes. Q. 12 -- as to when. Α. So you saw that he gave evidence? 13 191 Q. 14 Α. Yes. 15 192 Were you aware at the time that he told Richard Q. Yes. 11:17 16 Crowley that in his interview, that he, as far as he 17 was concerned, had not told you about his meeting with 18 former Commissioner Callinan? 19 I was aware that he had done an -- I didn't hear the Α. interview but subsequently would have heard the import 20 11:17 of that interview. 21 22 Yes. And that was in, I think that was the May 2016 193 Q. 23 interview, Deputy Martin. So you became aware of the 24 import of it, do I take it from that that you became 25 aware, at least in a general sense, that Deputy 11 · 18 McGuinness had said in the radio interview that he had 26

interview with Richard Crowley that he believed that he

1

27

28

29

So the first time that this Tribunal or indeed

not told you about this meeting?

Yes.

Yes.

Α.

Q.

- anyone else became aware of this conversation or this 1 2 exchange with Deputy McGuinness in February 2014 was 3 when you told the Tribunal in your letter of the 22nd December 2017? 4 5 Just to point out that I would have, in the aftermath Α. 11:18 6 of the conversation, would have said it to the chef de 7 cabinet and my press officer, that I have just heard 8 this comment. Okay. So you in fact told two people? 9 195 Q. 10 Yeah. Α. 11:18 11 196 Yes. Q. To the best of my recollection, certainly the chef de 12 Α. 13 cabinet. 14 197 Q. Okay. And the first time you told the Tribunal of it 15 was essentially ten months after the establishment of 11:18 16 the Tribunal and four years after the exchange itself, 17 isn't that right? 18 Yes. Α. 19 198 Now, I think we are probably agreed, Deputy Martin, and Q. 20 I don't need -- I don't propose to linger on the point, 11:19 21 but you didn't make any public statements about this 22 conversation in the context of a speech or a Dáil contribution --23 24 No. Α. 25 -- to any debate, isn't that right? 199 Q.

Α.

26

That's correct.

27 200 Yes. And I think it's probably fair to say and I don't 0. 28 see any dispute between us, Deputy Martin, that there 29 were many, many discussions in the Dáil in relation to

1			issues touching on concerns raised by Sergeant McCabe,	
2			whistleblowers, the way An Garda Síochána were said to	
3			have treated whistleblowers, they were referred to	
4			during the course of various debates and Leaders'	
5			Questions in the Dáil since 2014 onwards, isn't that	11:19
6			right?	
7		Α.	Yeah, there would have been many debates.	
8	201	Q.	Yes. And do you recall, Deputy Martin, that during the	
9			course of January to March, say, of 2014, there were	
10			particular key points, if I might put them that way;	11:19
11			there was former Commissioner Callinan's remark in the	
12			PAC, his "disgusting" comment, his "disgusting" remark,	
13			and that, I think we will agree also, attracted a very	
14			extensive media coverage and public commentary, isn't	
15			that right?	11:20
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	202	Q.	Yes. There was the occasion when you raised the matter	
18			of Sergeant McCabe's concerns that he had raised with	
19			you in the Dáil, I think on the 19th February, is that	
20			right, 2014? So you raised it in the Dáil and then you	11:20
21			subsequently forwarded the dossier to the Taoiseach,	
22			and then the Taoiseach put in train the steps which led	
23			to the establishment of the Guerin review, isn't that	
24			right?	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:20
26	203	Q.	Yes. And then we had, in March 2014, Minister	
27			Varadkar's description of Sergeant McCabe as being	
28			distinguished not disgusting, isn't that right?	
29		Α.	Correct.	

Yes. And then another key point is that in April 2014 1 204 Q. 2 you met Ms. D? 3 Yes. Α. And then just jumping toward, a further key point is 4 205 0. 5 that in May 2016 the O'Higgins Report was debated at 11:21 6 length in Dáil Éireann, isn't that right? 7 In May, yeah. Α. 8 206 May, 2016, sorry. I have jumped two years. Q. That is fine. 9 Α. Now, if I could then just turn to the letter of -- your 11:21 10 207 Q. 11 letter to the Tribunal of the 22nd December 2017, it's on page 1674, and I don't propose bringing you all the 12 way through the letter, Deputy Martin, but I think the 13 14 key paragraph that the Tribunal is inquiring into is 15 the first paragraph on the second page, which reads: 11:21 16 "When he --" Deputy McGuinness "-- was leaving my 17 18 office he mentioned that a short while previously he 19 had met the then Garda Commissioner Martin Callinan in I recall him mentioning that the 20 a hotel car park. 11:21 21 Commissioner had told him that Sergeant McCabe was not 22 to be trusted and that he was a child abuser. no other details." 23 24 25 Now, I think you have answered these two questions: 11 . 22 26 Firstly you didn't look for any more detail, isn't that 27 right?

And you didn't keep a note of that conversation?

28

29

Α.

Q.

208

No.

Т		Α.	I did not.	
2	209	Q.	No. Okay. Now, if I could just ask you, Ms. Leader	
3			might hand you day 62, which is Deputy McGuinness's	
4			evidence, page 60.	
5			[SAME HANDED]	11:22
6		Α.	Page 60?	
7	210	Q.	Yes. Page 60, sorry, Deputy Martin. And I am not	
8			going to read out these at length, Deputy Martin, the	
9			Tribunal has the evidence and indeed has the	
10			transcript, but you will see on page 60, going over on	11:23
11			to 61 in particular, that Deputy McGuinness is giving	
12			evidence in relation to the conversation that he had	
13			with former Commissioner Callinan in the car park, and	
14			he says that during the course of that conversation,	
15			just towards the end of page 60, Deputy Martin, line	11:23
16			24 he said	
17		Α.	Towards the end of?	
18	211	Q.	Page 60.	
19		Α.	24, is it?	
20	212	Q.	Yes, line 24. He said:	11:23
21				
22			"And it was at that stage that he said to me that no,	
23			it had gone beyond all of that and that there was	
24			issues to do with Maurice McCabe and his behaviour and	
25			he suggested that there was he had sexually abused	
26			his family and an individual, that he was not to be	
27			trusted, that I had made a grave error in relation to	
28			the Public Accounts Committee and the hearings because	
29			of this and that I would find myself in serious	

1	trouble.
2	Q. Did you tell him that these rumours were rumours
3	that you had already heard?
4	A. I said that they were some rumours that I had
5	already heard and I said we all know what goes on in
6	relation to these matters and that they were just in
7	fact rumours. And he said to me, no, that there was a
8	file there and that action would be taken against
9	Sergeant Maurice McCabe. He gave me the impression
10	that that would be the case and that I had, as I have
11	said, made a grave error and that, you know, because of
12	all of this he was not reliable and therefore the
13	Public Accounts Committee would find itself and me in
14	serious trouble.
15	Q. What did he say in relation to any investigation of
16	these allegations?
17	A. He gave me to believe that there was an
18	investigation ongoing in relation to the allegations
19	and that they were at an advanced stage and I
20	immediately presumed from that that Sergeant Maurice
21	McCabe would be charged with something or other.
22	Q. Was there any reference at the time to a criminal
23	file?
24	A. I believe that he said that there was a file, I
25	presumed that this was a file that was going to
26	whatever prosecutor would be involved in the case."
27	
28	So what Deputy McGuinness is saying there is that
29	former Commissioner Callinan said certain things which

1			led Deputy McGuinness to believe that there were	
2			investigations ongoing and that Sergeant McCabe would	
3			be charged with something. Did he give you any of that	
4			detail?	
5		Α.	No.	11:2
6	213	Q.	And did he lead you to believe that this was a live	
7			investigation and that Sergeant McCabe would be charged	
8			with some sort of criminal offence?	
9		Α.	No.	
10	214	Q.	Now, on page sorry, on day 62, so if you turn over	11:2
11			to the next page, day 62, page 62, Deputy McGuinness is	
12			being questioned at this stage by Mr. Marrinan, counsel	
13			for the Tribunal.	
14		Α.	Page 62, is it?	
15	215	Q.	Yes, of the same day. And Mr. Marrinan puts it to him	11:2
16			right at the bottom there, question 201:	
17				
18			"Q. And it would appear to be a meeting designed it	
19			try and influence you in any decision that you may	
20			personally have to make as to whether or not to call	
21			Sergeant Maurice McCabe to give evidence, isn't that	
22			right?	
23			A. Correct.	
24			Q. And it's entirely inappropriate what is being done	
25			by the Garda Commissioner?	
26			A. Yes.	
27			Q. It's not really something you need to hesitate	
28			over; it is very obviously, to any decent person, and	
29			law-abiding person, something that is absolutely wrong,	

1		isn't that right?	
2		A. Correct."	
3			
4		And Deputy McGuinness goes on to describe his reaction	
5		to it and he says that he could hardly remember driving	11:26
6		home. And then over the page on page 64, starting on	
7		line 17, sorry line 16, Mr. Marrinan makes it clear to	
8		Deputy McGuinness that he is talking about something	
9		entirely different and says:	
10			11:26
11		"Q. The fact that you are sitting in a car with the	
12		Garda Commissioner and he is actually imparting this	
13		information to you, that is what I am suggesting to you	
14		might be shocking?	
15		A. Again, I am agreeing with you. I said yes, it's	11:27
16		shocking and so is the information.	
17		Q. Well let's not water it down, will we. What is	
18		being imparted, whether it's true or not, is absolutely	
19		shocking, that the Garda Commissioner would be	
20		discussing an individual case and an allegation of	11:27
21		criminal wrongdoing with the Chairman of the Public	
22		Accounts Committee sitting in a car off the Naas dual	
23		carriageway, or it's a motorway now, isn't that right?	
24		A. Yes."	
25			11:27
26		Is that your view of things also, Deputy Martin, that	
27		it would be shocking that the Garda Commissioner would	
28		be taking this action and imparting this information?	
29	Α.	It would be my view that it would have been wrong.	

- 216 Now, and the -- I have put it to you, Deputy 1 Q. 2 Martin, and as I say I don't expect you to comment 3 necessarily but you are an extremely experienced politician and parliamentarian. You obviously, as a 4 5 politician, have to have an eye on the next election or 11:28 6 on various political considerations, but fundamentally, 7 the focus of your actions is the public interest, isn't 8 that right?
- 9 A. Yes.
- Now, I just want to put a series of measures or 10 217 Ο. Yes. 11 · 28 11 steps or things that could have been done when you 12 received this information, if you received this 13 information, from Deputy McGuinness. Firstly, you 14 could have asked for further details; secondly, you 15 could have kept a note of the conversation; thirdly, 11:28 16 you could have told the Taoiseach that Deputy 17 McGuinness had told you this. And at this stage, you 18 had already had interaction with the Taoiseach about 19 concerns that Sergeant McCabe had raised with you. You 20 could have told the Minister for Justice and the gist 11:28 of that conversation would have been, I'm suggesting to 21 22 you, that we now have a serious problem with the Garda 23 Commissioner, who is doing something, to borrow your 24 word, Deputy Martin, that is wrong?
- A. Sorry, in the context of Mr. McGuinness's evidence,
  Deputy McGuinness's evidence. At this stage I am
  receiving something that is hearsay.
- 28 218 Q. I will just come back to that. I just want to put 29 these steps to you and I certainly will afford you an

1 opportunity to explain why these steps weren't taken. 2 So you could have told the Taoiseach, we have of a serious problem with the Garda Commissioner because he 3 is doing something which, to use your phrase, is wrong; 4 5 you could have mentioned it in the Dáil; you could have 11:29 indeed told Sergeant McCabe that this was going on; you 6 7 could have mentioned it when Deputy McGuinness said on 8 radio that he hadn't in fact told you this; and you could have told the Tribunal in your first or second 9 letter to the Tribunal, okay. They are all steps that 10 11 · 29 11 could have been taken and I think you will agree with me they weren't taken? 12 13 Well, there is an alternative --Α. 14 219 Q. Just as a matter of fact they weren't taken, isn't that 15 right? 11:30 16 Oh, I didn't take those steps, yes, for reasons Α. 17 stated --18 220 Yes. Q. -- earlier in my evidence. 19 Α. I don't want to trammel you in way, Deputy Martin, so 20 221 Q. 11:30 if you would like to explain why those steps weren't 21 22 taken --23 Sorry? Α. 24 If you would like to explain why those steps weren't 222 Q. 25 taken I am more than happy to afford you an 11:30 26 opportunity. 27 Α. The steps weren't taken and I said at the outset -first of all, by the way, my experience said proceed 28

cautiously, having heard this, and experience taught

1 me, you don't -- on something like this, there's a lot of issues around this, there's a lot of issues around 2 why these issues didn't get traction, there's a lot 3 going on at the Public Accounts. So I resolved to deal 4 5 with substance and material, which was the dossier, 11:30 6 which was Ms. D physically coming into my office making 7 an allegation. My overriding concern when I heard 8 this -- and you are saying to me you could have imparted it to one other person, you tell another 9 person who tells another person; my real concern was 10 11 · 31 11 that this would have been very, very damaging to the 12 reputation of the person concerned. And that is 13 something that I was not prepared to do, because when a 14 person is accused of child abuse, if that gets into the 15 public domain, in the general public domain, it's very 11:31 16 hard to pull it back, very hard to pull it back. other point is, that it is the Garda Commissioner 17 18 saying this, and there was a reasonable, I put it to 19 you, assumption that if this is true, and it's a Garda 20 Commissioner is saying it, that it will emerge in the 11:31 form of a conviction or a case or whatever. And 21 22 thirdly, it's hearsay, it's what John McGuinness said 23 was said to him at a meeting. And I have no way of 24 standing --25 Firstly, can I agree with you that it is a matter on 223 Q. 11:32 which caution should be exercised and which should be 26 27 cautiously dealt with. So there is no disagreement 28 between us on that, for the very reasons that you outlined. But we move forward to April 2014 and we 29

1 have Ms. D in substance making an allegation of abuse 2 against Sergeant McCabe, but then going on to say that 3 her complaint was that that wasn't investigated correctly, and you passed that to the Taoiseach? 4

11:32

11:33

5 At her request. Α.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

6 224 Q. Yes, but it was still passed to the Taoiseach?

7 Because she asked me. She said I don't believe this Α. 8 was properly investigated because it involved a garda, you have already sent the dossier about malpractice, I 9 believe my case should be considered as well. That was 11:32 10 11 why. And it was, you know, there was -- she had 12 mentioned the DPP, so there was an actual case, it was 13 material, it was tangible, and therefore, there was 14 something to refer to the Taoiseach, other than rumour 15 and hearsay.

Yes. And at that stage did you then -- because at that 225 Q. stage you are now telling the Taoiseach that there is this allegation, at that stage did you think it may be important for the Taoiseach to know that the Commissioner is telling deputies or at least is alleged 11:33 to have told deputies that that Sergeant McCabe is not to be trusted because he is a child abuser? Did you think it was important to tell the Taoiseach at that stage? You are now disclosing -- and I am not saying there is anything improper or inappropriate about that, 11:33 you are now disclosing to the Taoiseach that this allegation has been made.

Well, it was a very specific allegation by a specific Α. person and I was confining myself to that, and I was

1 happy to do that.

2 226 Q. Now --

- A. And again, bear in mind Guerin is established, went to
  be established, let Guerin deal with it, deal with the
  first gamut of stuff that would come his way. I think
  it's interesting at the end of Guerin he speaks to the
  character of Maurice McCabe, and so -- and that then
  led to Higgins.
- Now, the reason I was asking you these guestions, 9 227 Q. Deputy Martin, is because I have to put it to you that 10 11 it is far more likely that you didn't take any of those 12 steps because, in fact, Deputy McGuinness didn't tell 13 you about the -- the contents of his conversation with 14 former Commissioner Callinan, and that you have made 15 what is an understandable mistake, that Deputy 11:34 16 McGuinness did so. And the reason I say it's 17 understandable, just to put that in context for you, 18 Deputy Martin, the reason I say it's understandable is, at that time there are rumours going around, and since 19 then, particularly since 2016, there has been a lot of 20 11:34 water under the bridge, there has been public 21 22 commentary and public statements by Deputy McGuinness 23 about what was said to him by former Commissioner 24 Callinan in the car park and that you mistakenly imbued 25 your conversation back in 2014 of which you have no 11:35 note with what you have subsequently learned, that is 26 27 an honest mistake and understandable mistake?
- A. No mistake has been made. That is very incorrect. Why would I send a letter to the Tribunal saying this? My

- only function here is to assist the Tribunal.
- 2 228 Q. Absolutely, and there is no --
- 3 A. So I am doing that by sending this information to the
- 4 Tribunal. It's not in my direct knowledge in the sense
- 5 that I wasn't at the car park, I didn't hear the
- 6 conversation that transpired, but Deputy McGuinness did

11:36

11:36

11:36

- 7 say this to me in my office. That is just a fact. I'm
- 8 not in any shape or form mistaken in relation to that
- 9 conversation, the fact that the meeting took place. I
- mean, for example, it's clear that there was a
- 11 meeting in the car park, I don't think you are
- 12 contesting that. So, it did happen.
- 13 229 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. I have to be very, very clear, that conversation
- happened.
- 16 230 Q. Well --
- 17 A. Otherwise I would not put it before the Tribunal.
- 18 231 Q. Yes. Well firstly, Deputy Martin, I hope I made it
- 19 clear that what I was suggesting to you was that this
- 20 was a mistaken memory --
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 232 Q. -- and no more than that, and I think the Tribunal and
- all parties will no doubt be very grateful for your
- 24 assistance to the Tribunal.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 233 Q. So, that is not what I am suggesting or questioning or
- querying in any way. What I am saying to you though,
- is that, and I think we have had the phrase in earlier
- 29 modules of the Tribunal, that people -- that it can be

1 unclear about when they first knew something, whether 2 they knew something back in 2014 or in 2016 or in 2017, 3 okay? And what I'm suggesting to you is that you are mistaken about Deputy McGuinness saying that former 4 5 Commissioner Callinan said that Sergeant McCabe was not 11:37 6 to be trusted and was a child abuser, in 2014, because 7 if he had said that, that would have raised alarm bells 8 for you about the conduct of the Commissioner and you would have taken all or some of the steps which I 9 outlined to you, to deal with the Commissioner's 10 11:37 11 conduct? 12 I don't agree with you actually. I don't agree with Α. you. And there was an aura around all of this, so

- 13 14 proceeding carefully was important and I'll just be 15 very clear about that. And you know, Noel Brett did 11:37 16 say to me you will get a lot of negative commentary, and so the best course of action for me was to go on 17 18 the substance, on material, and that is the -- and I am 19 glad I did, because I steered clear of hearsay talk, 20 rumour, I just kept to concrete tangible material, i.e. 11:38 the dossier, Ms. D coming to see me, Guerin being 21 22 established, the O'Higgins Commission of Investigation 23 being established. That was -- that is how I dealt 24 with this.
- 25 234 Q. Thank you, Deputy Martin.

MR. LEHANE: Mr. Chairman, just arising out of that I just have a short few questions. 11:38

28 CHAIRMAN: Yes. And would you mind explaining to 29 Deputy Martin who you are appearing for.

Τ				
2			THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE:	
3	235	Q.	MR. LEHANE: My name is Darren Lehane and I appear on	
4			behalf Deputy McGuinness and I just have a few	
5			questions arising out of Mr. Dignam's question of you.	11:38
6			First of all, deputies, senators and party staff would	
7			call into your office on a regular basis is that right?	
8		Α.	Oh yes. Very regular and very frequent.	
9	236	Q.	And you would have what might be described as an	
10			open-door policy?	11:38
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	237	Q.	No need to make an appointment?	
13		Α.	Well, some do make appointments if it's more	
14			substantive. What I mean by that is if I want to speak	
15			to a front bench spokesperson on a policy issue and so	11:39
16			on like that, but the nature of it is, particularly	
17			Tuesdays, Wednesdays, Thursday, you are in and out of	
18			questions and time and all of that, they grab a moment.	
19	238	Q.	And your interaction with Deputy McGuinness, the one	
20			you are testifying about today, that was a short	11:39
21			interaction, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	239	Q.	And it was primarily Mr. McGuinness or my client was	
24			thanking you for raising the issue of Mr. McGuinness in	
25			the Dáil?	11:39
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	240	Q.	And he made the statement to Commissioner Callinan at	
28			the end of that conversation, isn't that right?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

Т	241	Q.	And you then tord another party, a party your their	
2			de cabinet about the fact you had had this conversation	
3			with my client, is that right?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	242	Q.	And just following on from Mr. Dignam's, one of his	11:39
6			last questions, you are not here to do down	
7			Commissioner Callinan, isn't that right?	
8		Α.	No, I am not.	
9	243	Q.	And you are not acting in concert with Deputy	
10			McGuinness	11:40
11		Α.	Absolutely not.	
12	244	Q.	to do Commissioner Callinan. Thank you very much.	
13				
14			CHAIRMAN: Mr. McDonagh, did you want to ask	
15			MR. McDONAGH: No.	11:40
16				
17			THE WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS:	
18	245	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Just looking at what Deputy McGuinness	
19			said on radio, that he had not told you as his party	
20			leader of the meeting at the time, and can I ask you	11:40
21			this question in that context: Deputy McGuinness spoke	
22			with Sergeant McCabe and told him about the meeting in	
23			the car park in 2016, and I think it's fair to say that	
24			when Deputy McGuinness disclosed, as it were, publicly	
25			in the Dáil that he had had this meeting, there was	11:40
26			quite a great deal of commentary, politically and in	
27			the media, about the fact that he had met the	
28			Commissioner, do you recall that?	
29		Α.	I do.	

- 1 246 Q. And would it be fair to say that it came as quite a
- 2 surprise to many people that he had met the
- 3 Commissioner in those circumstances?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 247 Q. And can I ask you this: Did you in, fact, as it were,
- 6 disclose at that time, as it were, to stand behind
- 7 Deputy McGuinness, did you say to persons or the Dáil
- 8 that, well, in fact, look, this isn't quite a bombshell
- 9 to me because he told me back in 2014 that he had done
- 10 that?
- 11 A. No, I didn't. I think it moved on as far as I was
- 12 concerned, I think that was on the debate on O'Higgins.
- 13 248 Q. I am just wondering is there a possibility in fact that

11:41

- 14 he could have told you that in 2016 --
- 15 A. Oh, no.
- 16 249 Q. -- in and around the time of the O'Higgins debate --
- 17 A. No.
- 18 250 Q. -- the controversy about the Commissioner's
- 19 cross-examination of Sergeant McCabe at the Tribunal
- and then the debate on the report, that
- contemporaneously with Sergeant McCabe being told of it
- by Deputy McGuinness, that Deputy McGuinness told you
- in and around the same time, in 2016?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 251 Q. You exclude that definitively?
- 26 A. Yes, absolutely.
- 27 252 Q. And your chef de cabinet at the time was Ms. Gillane?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 253 Q. And your press officer at the time?

				_	_
1	Δ	Mas	Pa+	McPart -	land
L	$\neg$ .	was	IuL	ויועו עו נ	ı aııa.

- 2 254 Q. Thank you very much, deputy.
- 3 A. Thank you.

4

## THE WITNESS WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN:

11:42

11 · 42

11:43

11 · 43

- 6 255 Q. CHAIRMAN: Deputy Martin, I just have a few questions.
- 7 Really what we are looking into here is what was said,
- 8 if anything, to what journalist and by whom and at
- 9 whose behest or was the whole thing just a rumour that
- was going around and had nothing to do with Garda
- Headquarters or commissioners or whatever, so the terms
- of what was said, when, and since nothing happened to
- the effect that anyone published an article to the
- 14 effect that Sergeant McCabe was a child abuser, just
- 15 leaving the Paul Williams articles out of things which
- don't in fact say that but which allude to the
- investigation, what happened in consequence of it, so
- it's just, I am just interested in if you can give any
- more specificity about what was said to you about your
- 20 chef de cabinet in relation to this rumour and in
- 21 particular also your press officer?
- 22 A. I can't give any -- I mean, I think it was a general
- rumour at the time. I can't really put my finger on,
- you know, that -- there would have been a general view
- 25 that the leader was taking a risk in raising this
- 26 around the credibility of --
- 27 256 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes. You will appreciate, journalists have
- their jobs to do.
- 29 A. Absolutely.

257 Q. CHAIRMAN: And have to be respected for doing them as 1 2 well as they do. But if someone hears a rumour and 3 goes to somebody else and said is there anything to this rumour, unfortunately the net effect of that is to 4 5 actually spread the rumour to somebody else. Now, it 11:44 6 may be important as to the terms in which the question 7 is put, but are you clear in your own mind that what 8 was put to your Press Officer was whether you were 9 effectively barking up the wrong tree in backing an unreliable person or --10 11:44 11 In that sense, yes. Α. 12 CHAIRMAN: Yes. And --258 Ο. was he clear that -- or, you know, was he sure of the 13 Α. 14 reliability of the witness. 15 259 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Q. 11:44 16 If I use that phrase. Α. 17 CHAIRMAN: Did your press officer ever tell you where 260 Q. 18 any such question was coming from? 19 He has -- in terms of the journalists, is it? Α. 20 261 0. CHAIRMAN: Yes. 11:44 21 Generally, yes. Α. 22 Because it would be totally wrong obviously 262 CHAIRMAN: Q. 23 to leap to any conclusions or for me to say a 24 particular journalist knows something unless there is 25 evidence to suggest that is so. 11:44 Absolutely. 26 Α. 27 263 CHAIRMAN: And do you have information? Q.

I don't have specifics in terms of the actual

28

29

Α.

iournalists.

Т	264	Q.	CHAIRMAN: SO IT Was, Dasically at the time you would	
2			have a chat. And when they were saying, you know,	
3			unreliable questions about him was that the context in	
4			which your press officer was speaking to you about the	
5			child abuse allegations?	11:45
6		Α.	That was the general context. But to be fair, he	
7			didn't name any journalist to me that said he was	
8			guilty	
9	265	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And was it a question of one allegation of	
10			abuse or more than one?	11:45
11		Α.	It was just a general rumour to be frank. It's very	
12			difficult, to be honest with you, to pin down the	
13			source of the origins of this.	
14	266	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Can I ask you, in your office at the time	
15			through your chef de cabinet or though your press	11:45
16			officer did you the reason I am asking this question	
17			is as follows: Apparently if you ring RTÉ and make a	
18			complaint about a programme, certainly at one stage,	
19			what you said is noted down and then it goes to another	
20			officer and it's looked into, that for instance a	11:45
21			programme was biased or they didn't take into account	
22			such-and-such. So, the context in which I am asking	
23			you this question is: In your office at the time did	
24			you have a procedure or even a habit of writing down	
25			press queries or press warnings?	11:46
26		Α.	I don't deal with the press queries directly.	
27	267	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But was that part of the procedures in your	
28			office, do you think?	

A. Not necessarily, no.

- 1 268 Q. CHAIRMAN: But --
- 2 A. I mean, no, I think journalists ring all of the time,
- they talk, you meet people in corridors, you meet in
- 4 the restaurant, you know, so it's -- it's not that
- formal.
- 6 269 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, no, appreciating that, but this is an
- 7 instance where you are sticking your neck out and you
- 8 are sticking your neck out in circumstances where there

11 · 46

11:46

11:47

- 9 are warnings coming to you that you may be dealing with
- a child sex abuser and an unreliable person, in other
- words a person who is inherently of bad character and
- not a person who you can trust?
- 13 A. But then one has to rely on one's own judgment --
- 14 270 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, I appreciate that.
- 15 A. -- to be fair to everybody. I was the person who met
- Maurice McCabe in person, people would have been
- 17 concerned, are you sure of what you are doing.
- 18 271 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 19 A. And I had to at that stage -- primarily because of the
- 20 nature of the engagement I had with Maurice McCabe
- 21 initially.
- 22 272 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes. It's jumping out at me a bit here
- because to go so far as to actually impart information
- or to ask a question through a press officer to the
- 25 effect that are you sticking your neck out for the
- 26 wrong person because of child sex abuse and
- 27 unreliability may be something worth noting or
- something worth tracking the origin of?
- 29 A. Not necessarily, not necessarily, no. I mean, rumours

1			are I mean, I couldn't pin it down as to the source	
2			of the rumour.	
3	273	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. But it certainly came through your	
4			press officer?	
5		Α.	He was more general to be frank. I don't think he came	11:47
6			specifically the actual child abuse may not have	
7			come specifically through the press officer, but there	
8			was a general reference to it that there may be issues	
9			around child abuse. Nothing specific.	
10	274	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you have any recollection of your press	11:47
11			officer saying to you, look, I have a number of queries	
12			as to the reliability of this person from journalists	
13			or whatever?	
14		Α.	Yes, in terms of the reliability, yes.	
15	275	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And the sex abuse is perhaps something that	11:48
16			is just floating in the ether?	
17		Α.	That is floating in the ether, yes.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for your help.	
19		Α.	Thank you very much indeed.	
20				11:48
21			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
22				
23			CHAIRMAN: I am just going to take a five-minute break.	
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
29				

1			AFTER A SHORT ADJOURNMENT THE HEARING RESUMED	
2			AS FOLLOWS:	
3				
4			MR. MARRINAN: The next witness, sir, is Mr. Pat	
5			Rabbitte, please.	11:55
6				
7			MR. PAT RABBITTE, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	
8			EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
9	276	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Now, I think Mr. Rabbitte, after a very	
10			long and distinguished career as a politician you	11:56
11			decided not to stand in the General Election in 2016,	
12			isn't that right?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	277	Q.	And I think that you first came into contact with	
15			Sergeant Maurice McCabe, you think towards the end of	11:56
16			2006 or the beginning of 2007, isn't that right?	
17		Α.	It was probably 2007, I don't I have no note of it	
18			but it was probably 2007.	
19	278	Q.	I think at that time he sought out your confidential	
20			advice on matters of discipline that he wished to raise	11:57
21			in the first instance with you in Bailieboro Garda	
22			Station?	
23		Α.	Yes. He came to me in confidence about matters that	
24			were concerning him relating to the conduct of policing	
25			in the Bailieboro district.	11:57
26	279	Q.	Now, we are not actually concerned with the content of	
27			his concerns at that time, and they have been well	
28			canvassed before the Chairman in a previous module.	
29			But you gave him some advice in relation to the matter	

Т			and the advice that you gave him was to contact the	
2			confidential recipient, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	Yes, that's right. I mean, we were considerably	
4			constrained in terms of what the options were, but I	
5			helped him insofar as I could. I don't know to what	11:58
6			effect, but I tried to help him because I was persuaded	
7			of his honesty and the fact that, in my judgment, he	
8			was a conscientious policeman.	
9	280	Q.	Yes. And I think that you tried to locate the	
10			confidential or the identity of the confidential	11:58
11			recipient for him, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	Yes, I did.	
13	281	Q.	And I think that you were advised by the Department of	
14			Justice, you say in your letter, that they couldn't	
15			answer your query because the matter was confidential,	11:58
16			is that right?	
17		Α.	Well, eventually I was told by the Department of	
18			Justice that the matter was confidential, in other	
19			words it was open to matter of the Garda Síochána but	
20			the implication was only to them.	11:58
21	282	Q.	I think that subsequently you found out that the office	
22			of the confidential recipient was actually located in	
23			the Department of Justice and you queried the value of	
24			such an arrangement because it was unlikely that a	
25			member of An Garda Síochána would call in and avail of	11:59
26			the service if it was located in the Department of	
27			Justice, is that right?	
28		Α.	Yes, I had I had my own doubts from the beginning	
29			about the merits of that office, but the prospect of	

- Gardaí travelling from various parts of the country to
  make a complaint in the offices of the Department of
  Justice, I think were remote.
  Yes. Now, I think that, as you have indicated, you did
- Yes. Now, I think that, as you have indicated, you did
  your best to assist Sergeant McCabe with the concerns
  that he was then expressing. How did you find him as
  an individual?
- 8 I found him to be a very conscientious policeman who Α. was concerned about disciplinary issues that were 9 adversely affecting policing in his view in his area, 10 12:00 11 and he was also concerned about a pretty substantial 12 file he had in respect of the prosecution of justice by 13 some Gardaí under his control. The issues, I think, of 14 themselves were relatively minor, but what was 15 concerning him was that they were being prosecuted 12:00 16 vigorously in respect of certain matters and against 17 certain persons and being ignored apparently in other
- 19 284 Q. Now, I think that there was a general election in the
  20 summer of 2007 and you lost contact then with Sergeant 12:00
  21 McCabe, is that right?
- 22 A. Yeah, I don't -- I don't recall contact with him after that.
- 24 285 Q. And I think the next was in 2014, when you were 25 interviewed on RTÉ, is that right?

26 A. Yes, that's right.

cases.

- 27 286 Q. And there was a discussion about your dealings and encounter with Sergeant McCabe in 2007?
- 29 A. I was questioned about it on, I think, the 19th

- 1 February 2014.
- 2 287 Q. Yes. And I think that you spoke highly of Sergeant
- 3 McCabe at that point, is that right?
- 4 A. Yeah, I attested to what is his good character in my
- 5 judgment.
- 6 288 Q. And subsequent to the interview, you had arranged to

12:02

12:02

12.02

- 7 meet a friend, is that right?
- 8 A. Subsequent to the interview I was being driven by my
- 9 Garda driver.
- 10 289 Q. It was your Garda driver. Initially you referred to it 12:02
- as a meeting with a friend?
- 12 A. I did. I didn't especially want to point the finger at
- the particular person involved.
- 14 290 Q. And I think that is Mr. Kennedy, isn't that right?
- 15 A. That's right.
- 16 291 Q. When you say he was your driver, he was your driver at
- 17 the time, is that right?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 292 Q. And he was a retired member of An Garda Síochána --
- 20 A. Correct.
- 21 293 Q. -- is that right? Was he your driver from a pool of
- drivers or was he assigned full-time to you?
- A. He was assigned full-time to me, but not in the
- 24 traditional way of pool of drivers that ministers, that
- we have had in the past.
- 26 294 Q. Yes.
- 27 A. We surrendered State transport on election in 2011 to
- 28 Government.
- 29 295 Q. Yes.

1 And ministers, with the exception of the Minister for Α. 2 Justice, had to provide their own transport, and 3 therefore, it was in that capacity that I retained John 4 Kennedv. 5 296 Yes. And in 2014, how long had he been driving for Q. 12:03 6 was it for three years then? 7 Some three years, three-and-a-half years, maybe, yes. Α. 8 297 And I think that we know that he had retired from An Ο. 9 Garda Síochána in 2006, so he was well retired by the time he came to drive for you? 10 12:03 11 That's right. Α. 12 You had a conversation with him in relation to your 298 Ο. 13 radio interview, is that right? 14 Α. Not quite. He raised it with me, he said he hadn't 15 known that I knew Maurice McCabe, and he wanted to warn 12:03 16 me in my own best interests about wading into a 17 controversy when the rumours on the grapevine suggested 18 that he might not be a man of the character that I said 19 he was. And did he say why he may not be the man of the 20 299 Q. 12:04 character that you had stated that he was? 21 22 well, he did. He said that he couldn't be trusted, Α. 23 that his own colleagues believed that he couldn't be 24 trusted with children. The conversation wasn't very 25 prolonged after that, but the meaning was clear. 12:04 300 26 How did you react to what was being said to you? Q. 27 Silently, I think. On the one hand, I had to accept Α. 28 that Mr. Kennedy was drawing it to my attention in my 29 own best interests, to alert me to steer clear of a

Τ			controversy that might not be what it seemed, but on	
2			the other hand, I had to appreciate the import of it,	
3			there scarcely being an allegation more grave than that	
4			you can level against a man's character.	
5	301	Q.	And your impression, Mr. Rabbitte, at that time was	12:05
6			that he was merely saying this to you because he	
7			regarded you as a friend and somebody who ought to be	
8			advised of this as opposed to merely spreading gossip	
9			about Sergeant McCabe?	
10		Α.	No, no, in my opinion, he certainly wasn't in the	12:05
11			business of propagating the rumour; he was merely	
12			alerting me to knowledge that he had and that I didn't	
13			have and that I should perhaps be careful about	
14			testifying to Maurice McCabe's good character in	
15			public, given what was being said on the Garda network.	12:06
16	302	Q.	And because of the manner it was conveyed to you, you	
17			were reluctant to disclose his identity to the	
18			Tribunal, isn't that right, in the first instance?	
19		Α.	I was, yes. I didn't want to put him into the he	
20			was merely doing his job as a driver, where there is a	12:06
21			lot of confidential interaction between driver and	
22			Minister.	
23	303	Q.	Yes. At that time in 2014, apart from what Mr. Kennedy	
24			had said to you, and we have just heard from the leader	
25			of the Opposition, Mr. Martin, in relation to rumours	12:06
26			that were circulating at that time in Leinster House,	
27			had you heard any rumours in relation to Sergeant	
28			McCabe from any other quarter?	
29		Δ	Not at the time that not at the time up to my doing	

1			the interview. Yes, with the benefit of hindsight, you	
2			know, there were circumstances where not just publicly	
3			but privately I would give my impression of having	
4			dealt with Maurice McCabe, other Cabinet colleagues and	
5			other Dáil deputies wouldn't have had that opportunity,	12:07
6			and you know, sometimes the conversation was closed	
7			down or sometimes there were comments like, well, maybe	
8			it's not as straightforward as it seems, or, well,	
9			we'll see, maybe he is not all he's cracked up to be,	
10			that kind of shutting down. You noticed it, but it's	12:07
11			only with the benefit of what has come out since	
12	304	Q.	Yes.	
13		Α.	that one recognises that they were people who had	
14			some doubts in their minds but didn't want to propagate	
15			them or give them legs.	12:08
16	305	Q.	Indeed. Now, I think that on Tuesday the 14th February	
17			of 2017, you appeared on Prime Time, isn't that right?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	306	Q.	And we will just open up the relevant portion of the	
20			transcript because you discussed this very matter, and	12:08
21			it's at page 1468 of the materials. This is	
22			Mr. McCullagh:	
23				
24			"Seeing as you mentioned that, you were sitting in	
25			Cabinet for some of the period when all of this was	12:08
26			going on, did you hear rumours about Maurice McCabe,	
27			the smears about Maurice McCabe?"	
28				
29			And you reply:	

1				
2			"I did, yes. Maurice McCabe approached me at the end	
3			of 2006 or maybe early 2007 about policing difficulties	
4			and malfeasance and he had a major thorough file and I	
5			helped him or advised him on the confidential on the	12:09
6			confidential basis he sought as best I could. But when	
7			the incident blew up in 2013, 2014, probably early 2014	
8			I was asked on a programme like this that same question	
9			and I explained that I did indeed know Maurice McCabe	
10			as an upstanding and, in my view, an honest,	12:09
11			conscientious policeman. And I was approached that	
12			night by a friend of mine, who is a retired garda, to	
13			say that he didn't know that I had any knowledge of	
14			Maurice McCabe and that I had better be careful because	
15			did I not know what was going round? And he	12:09
16			graphically told me what was round."	
17				
18			Is that a reference to what you have told us today?	
19		Α.	It is, yes.	
20	307	Q.	And then Mr. McCullagh asks the question:	12:10
21				
22			"Did you tell anybody about that?"	
23				
24			And you replied.	
25				12:10
26			"No, nobody. I thought it was foul gossip. I didn't	
27			believe there was anything to it and I didn't think it	
28			should be given legs, but I did express my view	
29			publicly and privately about the probity and integrity	

1			of Maurice McCabe."	
2				
3			Was that a position that you have always adopted in	
4			relation to Sergeant McCabe?	
5		Α.	Yes, you know, your previous witness, Deputy Martin,	12:10
6			has explained why any responsible public representative	
7			wouldn't wantonly give legs to something like this	
8			unless they were certain of what they were saying.	
9	308	Q.	Okay. Just in relation to Mr. Kennedy, there should	
10			be we haven't been able to upload it, we received it	12:11
11			today, a statement from him, and it should be available	
12			to you.	
13			[SAME HANDED]	
14			You will appreciate that he is denying the content of	
15			this conversation with you, and if you just go to page	12:11
16			3, where he sets out his stall, he said that he had "no	
17			meeting, prearranged or otherwise, with Pat Rabbitte in	
18			relation to Sergeant McCabe." Is that correct? I	
19			mean, you didn't have a meeting with him specifically	
20			about Sergeant McCabe; he was your driver and, in that	12:11
21			context, he spoke to you?	
22		Α.	That's correct.	
23	309	Q.	Yes.	
24				
25			"I did not advise him in general terms or graphic terms	12:11
26			as to any rumours which had been circulating on the	
27			Garda grapevine or any other grapevine in relation to	
28			Sergeant McCabe."	
29				

1			That is his position, you say that is incorrect?	
2		Α.	Not true.	
3	310	Q.	"I have no knowledge as to what was said by Pat	
4			Rabbitte on the programme which he referenced as a	
5			precursor to our alleged meeting regarding Sergeant	12:12
6			McCabe."	
7				
8			He says that he didn't hear that programme and he had	
9			no knowledge of it.	
10		Α.	He told me it was the first time he learned that I had	12:12
11			known Maurice McCabe or had met him in the past.	
12	311	Q.	"The first time I became aware as to the contents of	
13			the Prime Time programme broadcast on the 14th	
14			February"	
15				12:12
16			That is the one I have just opened.	
17				
18			" was when I reviewed the transcript of the programme	
19			included in the letter dated 9th April which I received	
20			from Ms. Mullan, solicitor to the Tribunal."	12:12
21				
22			Then he goes on to say:	
23				
24			"I received an updated letter from Pat Rabbitte	
25			containing an extract from a document relating to the	12:13
26			alleged meeting with me, which he had presumably	
27			submitted to the Tribunal. I did not contact Pat	
28			Rabbitte in relation to this letter. A copy of this	
29			letter and extract is attached to paragraph 5."	

1				
2			And if you just turn over a few pages, this is a	
3			reference to a letter that you sent to Mr. Kennedy, is	
4			that right?	
5		Α.	Yes, I sent Mr. Kennedy the extract or the paragraphs	12:13
6			from my letter to the Tribunal for his information.	
7	312	Q.	Yes. And out of, presumably, courtesy to him	
8		Α.	Absolutely.	
9	313	Q.	since you were going to divulge his identity, is	
10			that right?	12:13
11		Α.	Correct.	
12	314	Q.	And it reads:	
13				
14			"John	
15			I hope you are keeping well. I just wanted to alert	12:13
16			you that the Charleton Tribunal contacted me for a	
17			statement about my contacts with Maurice McCabe. I	
18			attach herewith paragraphs that refer to you but not by	
19			name. I just wanted to alert you in the event of them	
20			coming back to me. I don't think that very much turns	12:14
21			on it.	
22			Best regards."	
23				
24			And you sign off on that as Pat. And I think at that	
25			stage you hadn't in fact identified him and it was	12:14
26			subsequent to that that you received a request from the	
27			Tribunal that would you identify the person told you	
28			this rumour.	
29		Α.	I only identified him after receiving a request from	

1			the Tribunal to do so.	
2	315	Q.	At paragraph F of his statement at page 3 he says:	
3				
4			"Since my retirement in 2006 I have had minimal contact	
5			with An Garda Síochána and in particular no access to	12:14
6			information regarding serving members. Obviously I am	
7			and would have been aware from media reports as to the	
8			controversy surrounding the alleged mistreatment of	
9			Sergeant McCabe by senior members of An Garda	
10			Síochána."	12:15
11				
12			He says that he did not know Sergeant McCabe.	
13				
14			"I have not been involved to in any attempt to	
15			undermine him or discredit him."	12:15
16				
17			I think that in that regard you are not suggesting that	
18			he was trying to undermine or discredit Sergeant	
19			McCabe, but was merely alerting you to the fact that	
20			these rumours were out there, is that right?	12:15
21		Α.	Yes, that's right. My concern was with the message,	
22			not with the messenger. Anybody, I think, would	
23			readily understand the import of the message being	
24			communicated, and of course in the immediate wake of	
25			that radio programme of 19th February 2014 it became	12:15
26			more general around Leinster House that there was more	
27			to this than met the eye, and even if people were	
28			reluctant to be specific it was clear that this had a	
29			wider audience than I knew at the time that I did the	

1			programme.	
2	316	Q.	Indeed. He puts it very starkly there:	
3				
4			"I had no meeting or conversation with Pat Rabbitte	
5			regarding Sergeant McCabe."	12:16
6				
7			So he has set out his stall very firmly there. What do	
8			you say in relation to that?	
9		Α.	Well, I suppose it's fair enough for my driver to say	
10			that he had no meeting with me in the sense that we	12:16
11			understand meetings, but he picked me up as usual and	
12			my memory is that I did the meeting from the Dáil	
13			studio and he picked me up as usual that night and	
14			that's when the interaction took place. So he may be	
15			correct that it's not a meeting, but it's the same	12:16
16			interaction, whether it was a meeting or some other	
17			kind of interaction.	
18	317	Q.	Thank you very much, would you answer any questions,	
19			Mr. Rabbitte.	
20		Α.	Thank you.	12:17
21				
22			MR. McGARRY: Chairman, we don't have any questions at	
23			this time.	
24			MR. CONLON: Chairman, just very briefly I have a few	
25			questions.	
26				
27				
28				
29				

1			THE WITNESS WAS THEN CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. CONLON:	
2	318	Q.	MR. CONLON: Cartage Conlon on behalf of Superintendent	
3			Taylor. You mentioned you understood Mr. Kennedy got	
4			his information from the Garda network, is that	
5			correct?	12:17
6		Α.	Yes, that's right.	
7	319	Q.	And did you take that to understand that this was being	
8			under discussion in An Garda Síochána or by members of	
9			An Garda Síochána?	
10		Α.	The phrase used was that it was on the grapevine.	12:17
11	320	Q.	Thank you.	
12				
13			THE WITNESS WAS THEN CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DOCKERY:	
14	321	Q.	MR. DOCKERY: Mr. Rabbitte, Desmond Dockery is my name,	
15			and I am just here to ask a few questions for	12:17
16			Mr. Kennedy that I am obliged to put to you. I think	
17			you accept in your evidence today, Mr. Rabbitte, that	
18			there was no meeting in the sense in which that word is	
19			ordinarily understood, no meeting with Mr. Kennedy, but	
20			of course you are aware that on Prime Time on the 14th	12:18
21			February 2017, and you have seen the transcript, you	
22			referred to Mr. Kennedy having approached you after the	
23			programme that you were on in 2014, but you have	
24			clarified that, as I understand it, by saying that that	
25			was simply to collect you in the ordinary way from the	12:18
26			Dáil studio and drive you to your next destination, is	
27			that so?	
28		Α.	Well, Mr. Dockery, when is a meeting	
29	322	Ο.	It's not a meeting.	

Т		Α.	when is a meeting not a meeting? I mean, we can have a	
2			semantical discussion about it. It is the gravamen of	
3			what was exchanged between the two of us that seems to	
4			me to be important.	
5	323	Q.	We will get to that in a minute, but just the	12:18
6			preliminaries I want to just explore with you for a	
7			moment. In other words, we agree now that he didn't	
8			approach you for the purpose of having a discussion	
9			with you about this?	
10		Α.	He approached me and broached the subject when he was	12:19
11			driving me that night.	
12	324	Q.	But he had to drive you anyway that night?	
13		Α.	Yes, of course.	
14	325	Q.	So he broached the subject, that is your evidence?	
15		Α.	Yes.	12:19
16	326	Q.	Yes. When you submitted a statement	
17		Α.	I mean, I didn't want to point the finger to the	
18			identity of my informant	
19	327	Q.	Yes. He appreciates that.	
20		Α.	which is why I referred to it as a meeting.	12:19
21	328	Q.	Yes. Perhaps that explains it, because a year later	
22			when you submitted a statement to this Tribunal, on the	
23			20th March, towards the end of that statement when you	
24			addressed these matters, you said that:	
25				12:19
26			"Sometime I think in 2014 my encounters in 2007 with	
27			Maurice McCabe were ventilated in an RTÉ interview, and	
28			that same evening, in a prearranged meeting with a	
29			friend of mine who is a former garda, he raised matters	

Τ			with me."	
2				
3			So, I mean, that is clearly not correct?	
4		Α.	Oh, it is correct. My meeting with him was prearranged	
5			or my encounter with him was prearranged in the sense	12:20
6			that he was to pick me up as customary.	
7	329	Q.	Yes. All right.	
8		Α.	Prearranged.	
9	330	Q.	So it was prearranged, but for an entirely different	
10			purpose, for an entirely routine purpose?	12:20
11		Α.	Oh, no, you are right, I had no notice from Mr. Kennedy	
12			that he wanted to meet me to discuss the subject matter	
13			of the interview.	
14	331	Q.	That is all I am trying to establish. And I think you	
15			were being driven by him when you say the matter came	12:20
16			up. Now, when you were on Prime Time that evening,	
17			Mr. Rabbitte, you will see from the transcript that has	
18			been shown to you there, that you used a very strong	
19			word to describe the conversation when you said that	
20			"he graphically told me what was going around". That	12:20
21			is the word you used, isn't that so?	
22		Α.	Yes, that's right.	
23	332	Q.	Yes, it's a very strong word. And I want to put it to	
24			you that just a month after that interview when you	
25			submitted your statement to the Tribunal on 20th March	12:2
26			2017, you didn't make any reference to being told	
27			graphically of rumours; I think you merely said that he	
28			had alerted you to "rumours on the grapevine", and you	
29			said "which I took to refer to allegations of child	

1			abuse". You say	
2		Α.	No, I don't think I said that.	
3	333	Q.	Well, let me just finish what you say:	
4				
5			"I took it that he was referring to the Garda grapevine	12:21
6			and the matter he wanted to warn me about was that	
7			there were rumours of alleged child abuse against	
8			Sergeant McCabe."	
9				
10			I am reading from your statement, Mr. Rabbitte. I	12:21
11			think it's the fourth-last paragraph. It commences	
12			with "Sometime I think in 2014".	
13		Α.	No, no, no, you are misrepresenting it, Mr. Dockerill.	
14	334	Q.	Sorry, it is Dockery.	
15		Α.	I beg your pardon. Excuse me. I beg your pardon,	12:22
16			Mr. Dockery. The sentence you are picking out relates	
17			to "on the grapevine", and I said I took it that he was	
18			referring to the Garda grapevine. I never said	
19			anywhere that I took it or that I deduced he was	
20			talking about child abuse. That was quite explicit in	12:22
21			the remark that his own colleagues	
22				
23			"His own colleagues say that he cannot be trusted with	
24			children."	
25	335	Q.	I wonder is that correct? I just want to tease this	12:22
26			out with you, because the sentence in its totality,	
27			taken with the preceding sentence, reads as follows:	
28				
29			"He said that he was unaware" that is	

Mr. Kennedy "-- that I had any involvement with 1 2 Sergeant McCabe but he thought that I should be aware 3 of what was being said on the grapevine. I took it that he was referring to the Garda grapevine and the 4 5 matter he wanted to warn me about was that there were 12:22 6 rumours of alleged child abuse against Sergeant 7 McCabe." 8 Yes. Α. I suggest to you that that is -- you are explicitly 9 336 Q. 10 stating in that statement that you took it that he was 12:23 11 referring to the Garda grapevine? 12 No, I am not. Α. 13 And you took it that the allegation -- the rumours 337 Q. referred to child abuse? 14 15 No, I am not. I took it refers to what was the Α. 12:23 16 grapevine being referred to. The advices that Maurice 17 McCabe couldn't be trusted with children was quite a 18 separate matter. 19 338 It's open to another interpretation --Q. Well, it may be, and I apologise if there is any 20 Α. 12:23 ambiguity about it, that is my fault. 21 But I know what 22 I intended, and what I intended is what I say now. 23 well, can I just tease out this point more generally 339 Q. 24 with you, because we have heard evidence from 25 Mr. Martin this morning that in or about early 2014, at 12:23 26 the time that he had, or is said to have had a meeting with Mr. McGuinness, he was aware of rumours in the 27 28 general sense in political and media circles, so I take 29 it, for a start, that he was referring to around

- 1 Leinster House, and, if that's correct, surely you were 2 aware of those rumours as well?
- No, I wasn't. That may well be that the routine of a 3 Α. minister is different. I would spend very little time 4 5 in Leinster House, I would spend time in my ministerial 12:24 office, and I have already referred you to the fact 6 7 that sometimes when this came up in a general chitchat 8 kind of way, you know, people would clamp up or would say maybe it's not what it seems, but I did not know 9 and that is why I was so forcibly hit by the allegation 12:24 10 that members of An Garda Síochána believed that Maurice 11 12 McCabe was somehow suspect in this particular regard.
- 13 340 During your long and distinguished career as a member Q. 14 of the Dáil, Mr. Rabbitte, I think you represented the constituency of Dublin Southwest? 15

- 16 I did, yes. Α.
- 17 341 And I think that constituency includes areas like 0. Tallaght and Killinarden and Jobstown and the like, and 18 19 I want to suggest to you that my instructions are that 20 you were, in the course of your work as a TD as well as 12:25 a minister, regularly calling in and out of Garda 21 22 stations in those areas, that you had many contacts 23 with the Gardaí, knew very many of them at all levels 24 and presumably would have been privy to all kinds of 25 information through your regular contacts with the Gardaí in that context? 26
- 27 Α. Yeah, I would have regular contact with the Garda 28 Síochána, of course, as a public representative. Yes, 29 I knew, and know, members of the force at all levels,

and I have great regard for the Garda Síochána, but I

don't recall members of the -- serving members of the

Garda Síochána, at whatever level, telling me what was

on the Garda grapevine. That doesn't happen.

- 5 342 Q. So you never heard that gossip?
- A. Not at the point of the radio interview of the 19th February.
- 8 343 Now, I want to suggest to you that there was a sort of Q. a further downgrading of your description of the force 9 in clarity of the conversation then after you submitted 12:26 10 First of all, your statement didn't 11 your statement. 12 refer to having being privy to a graphic description of 13 child abuse, but in a letter then you sent to the 14 Tribunal after that, on 12th of February 2018, first of 15 all you said that your use of the word "graphically" on 12:26 16 'Prime Time' had not been apposite.
- 17 A. I think I said, Mr. Dockery, that it may not have been apposite.
- 19 344 Q. It may not have been apposite. And that you might have
  20 just used it in order to deflect any further 12:27
  21 questioning about the details of it?
- A. Mm-hmm.
- 23 345 Q. And you really reiterated what you had said in your 24 statement to the Tribunal a year earlier, in 2017, to 25 the effect that you had been told there were rumours on 12:27 26 the grapevine relating to child abuse, isn't that so?
- 27 A. Yeah.
- 28 346 Q. In that letter, you also described the conversation you say you had with Mr. Kennedy "as nothing more than a

1 routine alert to me" -- "a routine alert to me", isn't

12:28

12:28

12:28

12:28

12.29

- 2 that so?
- 3 A. No, I don't think I stated that as a fact. The
- 4 Tribunal asked me to explain why did I think that
- 5 Mr. Kennedy said he couldn't recall.
- 6 347 Q. Yes.
- 7 A. And in my attempt to explain that to the Tribunal, I
- 8 said:
- 9 "Perhaps he does not recall because for him it was a
- 10 routine alert to me."
- 11 348 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. That is not the same, Mr. Dockery, as saying that I
- 13 said that --
- 14 349 Q. It was a routine alert?
- 15 A. -- it was a routine alert. I am trying to give your
- 16 client the benefit of the doubt.
- 17 350 Q. Yes, yes. But I think you have mentioned in your
- 18 evidence-in-chief that a lot of confidential matters
- may crop up from time to time in the ordinary course of
- conversation between a minister and a driver, isn't
- 21 that so?
- 22 A. That's right.
- 23 351 Q. So I suppose from the point of view of Mr. Kennedy, if
- he said anything about this, which he denies, you are
- accepting that it would have just been routine
- 26 conversation for him with you?
- 27 A. Yes, I am, yes, I am.
- 28 352 Q. All right. And as you have said today very fairly, you
- did not regard his remarks as dissemination of gossip,

1			but merely as a shot across your bows, a friendly	
2			warning, something that he thought perhaps you ought to	
3			be aware of. I mean, you were his boss, to all intents	
4			and purposes, isn't that right?	
5		Α.	Mm-hmm.	12:29
6	353	Q.	Yes. Now, when you referred to the conversation with a	
7			friend of yours, a retired garda, while speaking on	
8			Prime Time in 2017, you said that the conversation	
9			occurred after you had appeared on another similar	
10			programme "when the incident blew up in 2013/2014".	12:29
11			Are you able to remember the name of that programme?	
12		Α.	I think it was the News at One on the 19th February	
13			2014. It was a Wednesday.	
14	354	Q.	So it was an RTÉ Radio programme?	
15		Α.	Yes.	12:30
16	355	Q.	And in your statement to the Tribunal, you were in	
17			possession of a text message from a Mr. Colm Ó Mongáin,	
18			who I think is a journalist in the newsroom in RTÉ	
19			Radio, isn't that so?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:30
21	356	Q.	And I think he had just asked you to clarify if it was	
22			a radio programme in February 2014 that you had been	
23			on. So you are satisfied that was the programme. Do	
24			you remember the name of anyone else who participated	
25			in the discussion?	12:30
26		Α.	It was a one-on-one with a journalist called Jonathan	
27			Clynch.	
28	357	Q.	All right. And can I just say that I am asking you	
29			these questions just really to see what you remember of	

1			these details, because, as you know, Mr. Kennedy	
2			doesn't accept that you and he had this conversation.	
3			You do accept, I think, that he didn't know Maurice	
4			McCabe?	
5		Α.	Yeah, I do, yeah, if he says so.	12:30
6	358	Q.	And that he had retired from the guards on the 9th	
7			September 2006, and was, by then, almost eight years	
8			out of the force, isn't that so?	
9		Α.	Yeah, that is a fact.	
10	359	Q.	And that you were not so friendly that he was aware of	12:31
11			your earlier history with Sergeant McCabe in 2006 and	
12			2007, that is right too, isn't it?	
13		Α.	Maurice McCabe approached me in 2007, or around that	
14			time, on in confidence.	
15	360	Q.	Yes.	12:31
16		Α.	I offered to raise the issues he raised with me by way	
17			of parliamentary question. He didn't want that. We	
18			discussed whether I should go to the Minister for	
19			Justice. I told him, frankly, that I had a poor	
20			relationship with that particular occupant of that	12:31
21			office, and that I felt if I went to the Minister for	
22			Justice, it would be referred back to Mr. McCabe's	
23			superiors and that it wouldn't help his cause.	
24	361	Q.	Yes. Very pragmatic advice. But I suppose what I am	
25			just immediately interested in is in the fact that you	12:31
26			and he had never discussed Maurice McCabe in the past?	
27		Α.	Never.	
28	362	Q.	He wasn't aware of your efforts to assist Mr. McCabe,	
29			isn't that right?	

- 1 A. That's right.
- 2 363 Q. And, in fact, you had never discussed it at any stage?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 364 Q. Now, I take it that you have no note or record of this

12:32

12:32

- 5 alleged conversation with Mr. Kennedy, despite the
- 6 impact it had on you?
- 7 A. No, I never discussed it with anybody in authority or
- 8 anybody publicly, but I did discuss it before business
- 9 the next morning with the head of my private office.
- 10 365 Q. Yes. Well, is there any memo in existence or any
- 11 record or diary entry of yours recording this
- 12 conversation?
- 13 A. No, I think as my predecessor explained, my predecessor
- in this chair explained, you don't go writing down
- 15 notes about something like this.
- 16 366 Q. Now, Mr. Marrinan has already recited the essential
- assertions made by my client to the Tribunal in the
- 18 statement which he has submitted over the weekend, so I
- don't want to rehearse them, but there is clearly a
- complete conflict between you and he as to whether this 12:33
- 21 conversation took place or not, isn't that so?
- 22 A. Well, I think it's a difficulty with Mr. Kennedy's
- 23 memory.
- 24 367 Q. And yet we have no way of independently verifying the
- reliability of your memory either because, for the
- reason you have given, there is no note of it anywhere,
- 27 even a personal note --
- 28 A. That's right. The --
- 29 368 Q. -- even a personal note in your own --

1		Α.	That's right, there is no written note of it, but I	
2			presume the then-head of my private office will give	
3			evidence if the Tribunal requires him.	
4	369	Q.	And he will give evidence to say what, that you	
5			recounted the conversation to him?	12:33
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	370	Q.	Yes. And has that been disclosed at this point to the	
8			Tribunal, any statement from him?	
9		Α.	No, it hasn't come up until now.	
10	371	Q.	All right. Well, you did put in a statement in 2017 to	12:34
11			this Tribunal, and you wrote subsequently to the	
12			Tribunal explaining that you didn't understand why	
13			Mr. Kennedy couldn't recall the conversation that you	
14			are asserting took place. So I am just wondering,	
15			might it have been useful to say at that stage that,	12:34
16			well, if my recollection is in doubt, it can be	
17			verified by a relevant person to whom I felt obliged to	
18			speak the following morning?	
19		Α.	Maybe so, Mr. Dockery, maybe so, but, you know, I	
20			replied to the Tribunal as I thought proper at the	12:34
21			time.	
22			MR. DOCKERY: Very good. Thank you, Mr. Rabbitte.	
23		Α.	Not at all.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Is there anything in	
25			MR. MARRINAN: Nothing arising, sir.	12:35
26			CHAIRMAN: Yes. Mr. Rabbitte, there were just two	
27			things that were on my mind.	
28				
29			MR. RABBITTE WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN:	

25

- 2 CHAIRMAN: Appreciating that if you said on the 372 Q. national airwaves "my Garda driver", that would have 3 immediately put him in -- well, in the pot, and that 4 5 was the reason why you referred to it in Garda terms as 12:35 "a meeting", am I right in thinking that? 6
- 7 You are, Mr. Chairman. If I had thought that Α. 8 Mr. Kennedy was propagating a vile rumour, I don't think I would have hesitated from naming him or saying 9 it was my driver, but I don't believe that was his 10 12:35 11 purpose, and therefore, I didn't want to name him on a 12 public television programme.

12:35

12:36

- 13 That was the second question that I 373 CHAIRMAN: Sure. Ο. 14 had, which was the import of this. Now, appreciating 15 someone's driving you for three years and they are 16 bringing you from here to there or whatever, they know a lot about your family, you know, whether anyone is 17 18 ill or whether your aunt has just died, all of those 19 kind of things, and possibly more as well. presume that a kind of a -- you are working together so 12:36 20 you are friends in a way, but a relationship of seeing 21 22 someone even more perhaps than some of the closest 23 members of your family, tends to build, is that right? 24 It wouldn't endure, Chairman, if there wasn't a good Α.
- There has to be? 26 374 CHAIRMAN: Ο.

relationship.

- There has to be. 27 Α.
- 28 375 And I take it, as well, that if we Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes. 29 were in a different circumstance, and obviously I have

1 to hear Mr. Kennedy, but let's suppose for the moment 2 what you are saying is correct, and that is all I can 3 do, in the event that you hadn't been told this and it subsequently came back and hit you in some way in the 4 5 course of your work politically, you might well have 12:37 blamed him for not telling you at the time? 6 7 I don't know if I would have blamed him. I don't think Α. 8 I would have automatically assumed that he would know, and that was one of the things that impacted on me 9 most, that I drew the conclusion, properly or 10 12:37 11 otherwise, that it seemed to be widely on the Garda 12 network. 13 But the nature of the conversation was not 376 Q. CHAIRMAN: 14 such as, in the terms that you are putting it, I am now 15 going to besmirch the character of somebody in the 12:37 16 public eye? 17 Certainly not, certainly not, Chairman. Α. 18 Rather, it was to warn you that you should 377 Q. CHAIRMAN: 19 be on inquiry because of what he was hearing, which he 20 wasn't necessarily saying was true or not true, is that 12:37 correct? 21 22 Yes, I believe he was referring to the fact that I had Α. 23 fulsomely attested to Maurice McCabe's good character 24 and that I should be warv. 25 Yes. And in the event that it later emerged 12:38 378 0. CHAIRMAN: 26 that there were these question-marks here, that perhaps

you ought to put yourself on inquiry, if any such thing

was possible, as to whether there was anything to this

27

28

29

or not?

- 1 A. Yes, I think -- sorry, I am not sure, Chairman, what I am answering there.
- 3 379 Q. CHAIRMAN: In other words, could you have done anything with the information that you got?

12:39

12:39

12:39

- 5 A. Oh, well, in the established routine, I had a
  6 discussion the following morning with the head of my
  7 private office, and, to be honest, I would be trailing
  8 back over what Micheál Martin has told the Tribunal.
  9 It was dúirt bean liom go ndúirt bean léi, and I did
  10 not think that it was in anybody's interest that I
  11 should have sought to give legs to such a foul rumour.
- 12 So you confined it essentially to a 380 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Q. person you trusted, the head of your office, and you 13 14 discussed it. Now, in terms then of being asked 15 questions in the political arena, it may be that 16 access, as you say, to media personnel is different 17 when you are a minister than when you are a 18 representative, but was it the case that you were ever 19 approached with a view to seeing, given that you had been, I suppose, in the pro-McCabe camp, unfortunately 20 21 it had got to that at that stage, were you approached 22 by any journalist to be asked do you know anything 23 about this or are you perhaps sticking your neck out
  - man's character, what may be there, anything like that? 12:40

    A. I would, at one time or another, have been approached by several journalists asking me questions about what was my engagement with Maurice McCabe, but I don't ever recall a journalist asking me, "do you know about the

unnecessarily or wrongly with that knowledge of the

24

25

26

27

28

29

1			rumour?" I don't ever recall a journalist saying that	
2			to me.	
3	381	Q.	CHAIRMAN: All right. And then the reference that has	
4			been made to graphic terms, obviously graphic, when you	
5			talk about going to a film and say "graphic violence",	12:40
6			I presume it's what one sees, people's heads being	
7			chopped off, or whatever, but the nature of what was	
8			graphic here, to your mind, was the reference to his	
9			colleagues don't believe he can be trusted in the	
10			presence of children, which is a	12:40
11		Α.	That's right, sir, yes. It may not have been the most	
12			apposite word, but the impact it had on me was pretty	
13			graphic.	
14			CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you, Mr. Rabbitte.	
15		Α.	Thank you.	12:41
16				
17			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
18				
19			CHAIRMAN: Ladies and gentlemen, where are we going	
20			now? Do we want to carry on, because I think have we	12:41
21			indicated to someone that we are definitely going to	
22			take him at 2 o'clock, is that the position we have?	
23			What is the story? So is that what we are doing?	
24			Sorry, I am just asking counsel.	
25			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, I think we had indicated to	12:41
26			the next witness, Mr. Murphy, that we would take his	
27			evidence at half past one.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Well, then, let's break now, isn't that the	
29			right thing to do, until half past one.	

1	THE	HEARING	ADJOURNED	FOR	LUNCH
2					
3					
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					
29					

Τ			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, AFTER LUNCH:	
2				
3			MS. LEADER: The next witness, sir, is Minister Eoghan	
4			Murphy.	
5				13:30
6			MR. EOGHAN MURPHY, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	
7			EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER AS FOLLOWS:	
8				
9			MS. LEADER: Minister Murphy's correspondence with the	
10			Tribunal is in Volume 6, beginning at page 1451 of the	13:30
11			materials.	
12	382	Q.	Minister Murphy, you're now Minister for Housing,	
13			Planning and Local Government, isn't that correct?	
14		Α.	That is correct.	
15	383	Q.	When were you first elected to Dáil Éireann?	13:31
16		Α.	Sorry, I didn't hear the question.	
17	384	Q.	When were you first elected?	
18		Α.	In 2011.	
19	385	Q.	2011. And I think you were a member of the Public	
20			Accounts Committee, isn't that correct?	13:31
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	386	Q.	And when did that membership commence?	
23		Α.	That commenced in 2011, once the committees were	
24			established, and it ceased at some point in 2014 when I	
25			was appointed to the Banking Inquiry.	13:31
26	387	Q.	And you were a member of the Committee that was looking	
27			at the issue of fixed charge penalty notices, isn't	
28			that right?	
29		Δ	Vac	

1	388	Q.	Now, first of all, if you would clarify for the	
2			Tribunal, were you aware of Deputy McGuinness's	
3			dealings with Commissioner Callinan, in particular the	
4			conversations he had with him after the meeting of the	
5			23rd January 2014 and the meeting in the car park on	13:31
6			the 24th January 2014?	
7		Α.	No, at the time I was not.	
8	389	Q.	When did you become aware of those two interactions?	
9		Α.	From my best recollection, I became aware of the	
10			interaction in relation to the car park when he	13:32
11			mentioned it in the Dáil, which I think, from having	
12			read previous statements to the Tribunal, was in 2016,	
13			when he made that statement. And I'm not sure as to	
14			the conversation, was that prior to the PAC hearing or	
15			the conversation after the PAC	13:32
16	390	Q.	Directly afterwards.	
17		Α.	I wasn't aware of that conversation until I think I	
18			read about it in the Tribunal transcripts.	
19	391	Q.	Now, I think you yourself had a particular view in	
20			relation to the attendance of Sergeant McCabe before	13:32
21			the Committee, isn't that correct?	
22		Α.	That was correct.	
23	392	Q.	And if you would explain that, please, for the purposes	
24			of background.	
25		Α.	So, at the time, the Public Accounts Committee had a	13:32
26			number of issues before its agenda relating to	
27			different areas. And I had concerns, as did some of my	
28			colleagues on the Committee, that the Public Accounts	
29			Committee was beginning to act outside of its remit and	

that, in doing so, there was the potential to do serious harm to the Public Accounts Committee in that Now, some of those matters have been the subject of court cases, so I won't go into them. received a lot of legal opinion at the time, both in 13:33 relation to this matter but also to those matters, too. And I will try my best not to give any of that legal advice in terms of trying to recollect what was happening at the time. But as the Public Accounts Committee, our responsibility is to investigate the 13:33 spending of public money, to make sure that it is spent appropriately and to make sure that value for money is achieved, and we do that on the basis of reports compiled by the Comptroller & Auditor General, the He does annual accounts for each department and 13:33 agency and he also sometimes does special reports. the basis of those reports, we examine the numbers, we follow the money.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

In relation to Sergeant McCabe, and it was nothing at all to do with his character or who he was, I had never met him at that point in time, and it was not that I did not believe that there was merit to what he was trying to do or what he was saying, but as far as I was concerned, he was trying to bring matters either relating to illegality or criminality or even a practice in an organisation that shouldn't be happening and that the PAC did not have a remit to investigate those matters but also perhaps didn't have the

1	competencies, either. And as we delved further into	
2	the matter, that maybe became more obvious; for	
3	example, when we saw the papers in a protected	
4	disclosure and examined them ourselves in person in a	
5	private session. There were also more technical	13:34
6	matters in relation to whether a non-accounting officer	
7	could appear in front of the PAC, which had never	
8	happened before, and the negative precedent that that	
9	might establish, and also then when you looked at the	
10	detail of what was submitted by Sergeant McCabe,	13:34
11	whether or not we could actually draw any conclusions	
12	from that. And while they might seem like procedural	
13	matters to many people, from my point of view, having	
14	served on the Public Accounts Committee since 2011, I	
15	felt that it was the most important arm of the	13:34
16	Oireachtas in terms of holding the government of the	
17	day to account. It had a special status in the	
18	Constitution, it had special powers, and I was very	
19	worried in general at the time that what we were doing	
20	as a Committee might undermine that and that anything	13:34
21	that could undermine the Public Accounts Committee	
22	could undermine the ability of the Oireachtas to hold	
23	the government of the day to account, so I took that	
24	very, very seriously, and I was worried that what was	
25	happening in relation of Sergeant McCabe in terms of	13:35
26	his coming before the Committee was another, I suppose,	
27	aspect of the Committee perhaps losing sight or focus	
28	of what his actual mandate was.	

29 393 Q. Now, I think separately from the Public Accounts

Т		committee and Sergeant McCabe's appearance before it,	
2		you were aware of some rumours about Sergeant McCabe?	
3	Α.	So, you know, in the months preceding his appearance in	
4		front of the Public Accounts Committee in a private	
5		session but also the appearance of the Commissioner,	13:35
6		insofar as we were investigating the different aspects	
7		of that vote, there had been statements in the Dáil,	
8		and I think, from memory, certainly John Wilson had	
9		been in the vicinity of Leinster House, or indeed in	
10		Leinster House, maybe even in the visitors' gallery on	13:35
11		some occasion, and so I can't say any more than to say	
12		that people were saying that they were odd, that these	
13		were two odd individuals making claims and, as I say in	
14		my correspondence, that would not be unusual in	
15		Leinster House. I mean, it is, as I say, the	13:36
16		quintessential rumour mill, where you have politicians,	
17		you have civil servants, you have people working in the	
18		media, you have people or the public coming in for	
19		whatever reason, and rumours can spread quite quickly,	
20		and it sometimes can be difficult to remember where you	13:36
21		first heard that rumour and what the source of it was.	
22		But it certainly was a view that had, I think, spread	
23		around Leinster House, that these two people who were	
24		going up against the system were odd. And again, I	
25		didn't see that as being abnormal in the fact of what	13:36
26		they were trying to claim or what they were trying to	
27		do. The system in itself would resist that, you know,	
28		including individuals.	

29 394 Q. And were the rumours any more specific, and here I'm

1 talking about Sergeant McCabe specifically, other than 2 that he was an odd individual? 3 No, from my recollection, that was all I heard at the Α. 4 5 395 And specifically, was there -- did you hear any rumour Q. 13:36 6 about allegations of sexual assault made against 7 Sergeant McCabe? 8 No, not at the time. Α. And when did you first become aware of that allegation? 9 396 Q. Em, I can't recall when I first became aware of the 10 Α. 13:37 11 allegation, but it would have either been through the public domain. It wouldn't have been from any 12 13 particular individual. 14 397 Q. All right. Do you think it was a member of the media, 15 or can you say that? 13:37 16 In relation to the allegations of --Α. 17 Oddness, I suppose, in relation to Sergeant McCabe? 398 Q. I really can't, I'm afraid. I mean, there was just 18 Α. 19 this, I mean, a rumour or a view that the two people 20 who were making protected disclosures, the two 13:37 21 whistleblowers who were challenging the current 22 practices and trying to bring them to public light, were odd. 23 24 Okay. And just to be clear on the matter, did the 399 Q. 25 rumours in any way influence your attitude in relation 13:37 26 to Sergeant McCabe potentially giving evidence before 27 the Public Accounts Committee? 28 No. not at all. I mean, I discounted the rumours. Α. 29 felt it was quite obvious what people were trying to do

- with those rumours, which was to try and perhaps
  discredit their evidence, because it was uncomfortable
  evidence, as I say in my letter to the Tribunal.
- 4 400 Q. I think in or around that time, you also spoke to
  5 Mr. Varadkar, your party leader, in relation to the
  6 matter, did you?
- 7 Yes. I can't be certain of the time itself, but, from Α. 8 memory, I think it was a weekend, either a Saturday or a Sunday, in the afternoon. I was in the pub at the 9 time and I stepped out to either make a phone call or 10 13:38 11 take a phone call, and we might have spoken for maybe 12 15 minutes, from memory. Either I had gone seeking his 13 advice on the matter and he was coming back to me 14 subsequently, or he was calling me to see what was 15 happening in the Public Accounts Committee in relation 13:38 16 to whether or not Sergeant McCabe would appear in front 17 of us in private session. He was then the Minister for 18 Transport, Tourism and Sport.
- 19 401 Q. And I think he was encouraging -- he was in favour of Sergeant McCabe appearing, is that correct?

- A. Well, from memory, I think he was frustrated that Sergeant McCabe's claims were not being taken seriously.
- 24 402 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. I think he was frustrated that other arms of the State
  26 perhaps weren't giving it the necessary attention that
  27 it deserved, and I think, and again it's just my own
  28 feeling from the conversation, that he felt that the
  29 Oireachtas was the best chance now available to

_			sergeant Mccabe to get this property file the public	
2			domain, and the Public Accounts Committee being the	
3			Public Accounts Committee, being the strongest	
4			committee in the Oireachtas, was the best way to	
5			achieve this. And so we would have spoken, I would	13:39
6			have put my concerns around the risk that was inherent	
7			there for the ability for the PAC to continue to be the	
8			important committee that it was, and he put the case as	
9			to how, even though that may be the case, from my point	
10			of view, that this person needed to be heard. That	13:39
11			would have been, I suppose, the conversation that we	
12			had.	
13			MS. LEADER: Thanks very much, Minister Murphy. If you	
14			would answer any questions anybody else might have for	
15			you.	13:39
16		Α.	Thank you.	
17			MR. McGARRY: Just one matter, Chairman.	
18				
19			MR. MURPHY WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McGARRY:	
20				13:39
21	403	Q.	MR. McGARRY: Minister, Paul McGarry is my name. I'm	
22			one of the counsel for Sergeant McCabe. Just in	
23			relation to the contact that you had with Mr. Varadkar,	
24			can you recall if that was before or after Mr. Callinan	
25			had provided his evidence to the Tribunal, where he	13:40
26			used the "disgusting" remark?	
27		Α.	I can't recall. And actually, in my own memory, these	
28			events happened later in the year, if you like. I was	
29			surprised to see that we were talking about January,	

because I know from memory when I took that call it was quite a sunny afternoon, so I just assumed it was later in the year. Sorry, when I say I took the call, I either took or made the call, I can't remember who instigated the contact on that day. And I can't recall 13:40 if it was in between the decision -- I think, if I remember correctly and from reading the transcripts, sergeant Callinan appeared on a Thursday of one week and Sergeant McCabe appeared in private on the Thursday the following week.

11 404 Q. That's right.

Α.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

I think when Commissioner Callinan appeared, the decision had already been taken, if I remember the testimony from John McGuinness correctly. So it might have even been the weekend prior to Commissioner Callinan appearing in front of the Committee or the weekend in between. If it was the weekend in between the decision -- now, some of the testimony said the decision had already been taken that he would appear. That's not my recollection. My recollection is that perhaps that decision only became a decision when it was decided that it would be in private. I don't think that, from my recollection, that the Committee had actually taken a formal decision that Sergeant McCabe was appearing, now the only thing left to decide was whether or not it would be public or private, because I think there was still at that point resistance in the Committee from myself and perhaps others as to whether or not he should appear.

13:40

13:41

13 · 41

1	405	Q.	So you think it is more likely that the discussion that	
2			you had with Mr. Varadkar was before Mr. Callinan came,	
3			because a decision had, in principle, been taken, I	
4			think, to hear both?	
5		Α.	I really can't say if it was more or less likely. I	13:41
6			mean, it might have been more likely following	
7			Commissioner Callinan's appearance, given that that was	
8			then in the news, or, if it was being reported at the	
9			time that Sergeant McCabe was appearing, then there	
10			would be no need for us to have that discussion.	13:41
11	406	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	So either could be plausible.	
13	407	Q.	And can you just tell us what was your reaction as a	
14			member of the Committee when you heard the	
15			then-Commissioner use the word "disgusting"?	13:42
16		Α.	I can't remember.	
17			MR. McGARRY: Okay. Thank you.	
18			MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: No questions for the Minister.	
19			MR. DOCKERY: No questions.	
20			MR. LEHANE: No questions.	13:42
21			MR. DIGNAM: Chairman, I have one area, a very brief	
22			area, that I want to cover with the Minister.	
23				
24			MR. MURPHY WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM:	
25				13:42
26	408	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Minister, my name is Conor Dignam. I	
27			appear on behalf of An Garda Síochána, including former	
28			Commissioner Callinan. I just want to ask you about	
29			that line of questioning that Mr. McGarry canvassed	

1		with you. The decision to call Sergeant McCabe and,
2		more particularly, the decision that his evidence be
3		taken in private, do you remember when that decision or
4		those decisions were made and how they were made?
5	Α.	It's difficult now to try and go to my own memories and
6		not have them confused by what I've read subsequently
7		either in the media or through reading the transcripts
8		of two of my colleagues who appeared in front of you
9		already. All I can remember is that coming to this
10		decision was fraught with difficulty for the Committee.
11		There were a number of private meetings that were held
12		on this matter. There were tensions between Committee
13		members, not necessarily because of this issue but
14		because of other issues that we were investigating at
15		the time, and so it was a very difficult period, and I
16		really can't say much more than that, other than we
17		didn't arrive, I don't think, at a formal decision. I
18		mean, if I could take you back to a previous engagement
19		that we had, which was in relation to a private session
20		where we viewed documentation that was submitted under
21		a protected disclosure, that was laid out in front of
22		us in different piles on the table opposite us in the
23		Public Accounts Committee. Just to describe the room,
24		it then was, I think it still might be, a square or
25		rectangular table where the members of the PAC would
26		sit on one side and the witnesses coming in would sit
27		on the opposite side, and so the documents would be
28		laid out on either side. And there was a long debate
29		as to whether or not we could walk over and view those

13:42

13:43

13:43

1 So those -- every little bit of this was 2 being thrashed about by the Committee members in 3 private before we made the next step. But I suppose by the time that there was a decision or it came to be 4 5 that Sergeant McCabe was to appear in front of us, I 13:44 6 don't think that my position was holding any -- much 7 more sway any longer on the Committee, and then I do 8 remember there being some tense exchanges between Committee members towards the end of that, and then we 9 10 had the engagement with Sergeant McCabe when he came 13 · 44 11 in, and it was unlike any other engagement we'd had as 12 the Public Accounts Committee, because normally you go 13 into public session and the witnesses come in and they 14 sit down and they make their statement, they read their 15 names, and we go into questioning, whereas -- and they 13:44 16 come in with a group of people, you know, people come in and sit behind them. Whereas Sergeant McCabe kind 17 18 of came in on his own, with his bag over his shoulder 19 and sat down, and we immediately began into his 20 evidence, and then we asked our questions, and, when he 13:44 concluded, he got up and left, and we went back to 21 22 private business. And that had happened then. 23 then information as to what was said began to make its 24 way into the media. 25 Commissioner Callinan -- and I'm not going to ask you 409 Q. 13 · 45 26 about the car park meeting because, in fairness, you 27 weren't there and you weren't told about it until the 28 Dáil contribution by Deputy McGuinness in May 2016, but 29 Commissioner Callinan's understanding was that, at that

- stage, because he been told this in the PAC on the 23rd

  January, Sergeant McCabe was going to be called, and

  the remaining issue or the outstanding issue was

  whether he would be called in public or in private.
- 5 A. Okay.
- 6 410 Q. And his understanding was that the decision as to 7 whether it would be held in public or in private would 8 be taken at a PAC meeting on the following Tuesday, so this is the Tuesday after the 24th January and, as it 9 10 happened, two days before Sergeant McCabe, in fact, 13 · 45 11 came into the PAC. Do you remember any discussion on 12 that Tuesday about whether his evidence should be heard 13 in public or in private?
- 14 A. I don't.
- 15 411 Q. Okay. And do you remember any formal meeting to decide 13:46 that discrete issue?
- Not that particular -- I mean, we certainly discussed 17 Α. 18 it at a number of meetings, and I saw from, it might be 19 Deputy John Deasy's testimony, that I think then we were notified that he would like to appear in private. 20 13:46 and then that, I suppose, lifted any remaining 21 22 obstacles that there might have been to him appearing, 23 because certainly had it gone to a vote, and I don't 24 think it went to a vote and it wasn't normally the 25 practice of the PAC to go to a vote on anything, then 13 · 46 that vote would have been lost. 26
- 27 412 Q. Yes.
- A. So I imagine at that time myself and any others might have then, you know, had felt we had made our case and

Т			that this was happening and then to engage and do the	
2			best job we could do for the PAC in engaging with	
3			Sergeant McCabe when he came in.	
4	413	Q.	Yes. And do you know when Sergeant McCabe communicated	
5			his desire that it would be in private rather than in	13:46
6			public to the Committee, presumably through the clerk	
7			or through Deputy McGuinness?	
8		Α.	I can't remember.	
9			MR. DIGNAM: Thank you.	
10		Α.	Thank you.	13:47
11			MS. LEADER: Nothing further.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
13		Α.	Thank you.	
14				
15			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	13:47
16				
17			MS. LEADER: The next witness, sir, is Mr. John	
18			Kennedy.	
19				
20			MR. JOHN KENNEDY, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	13:47
21			EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER:	
22				
23	414	Q.	MS. LEADER: Mr. Kennedy's statement was circulated	
24			this morning, sir. Mr. Kennedy, I think you took up	
25			employment with Mr. Pat Rabbitte, who at that time was	13:48
26			the Minister for Communications, Energy and Natural	
27			Resources, in May 2011?	
28		Α.	Yeah, the 1st May, yeah.	
29	415	Q.	Prior to that, from 1972 to 2006 you were a member of	

1			An Garda Síochána, is that right?	
2		Α.	Yeah, I was in uniform for five years and I was a	
3			detective officer for 25.	
4	416	Q.	All right. And I think during that time you were	
5			attached to the Special Detective Unit?	13:48
6		Α.	Yeah.	
7	417	Q.	You were also assigned to protective duties, primarily	
8			with the Minister for Foreign Affairs, Mr. Peter Barry,	
9			you were attached to the Garda National Immigration	
10			Bureau, and you then retired in September 2006?	13:48
11		Α.	That's correct, your Honour.	
12	418	Q.	So by the time you took up working with	
13			Minister Rabbitte, you had left the guards five years,	
14			is that correct?	
15		Α.	That'd be correct, yeah.	13:49
16	419	Q.	All right. Now, you were here when Mr. Rabbitte was	
17			giving evidence this morning, isn't that right,	
18			Mr. Kennedy?	
19		Α.	That's correct, your Honour.	
20	420	Q.	And I think it's fair to say that, as far as you're	13:49
21			concerned, you had never had any conversation with him	
22			in relation to Sergeant McCabe?	
23		Α.	Absolutely. And on the basis this morning, which I	
24			have denied to the Tribunal, there was no special	
25			meeting that he, and he answered my question this	13:49
26			morning by saying that I was in my normal duties by	
27			bringing him home on the day in question.	
28	421	Q.	All right. So I suppose maybe I will start off. You	
29			worked with him for three years, is that correct?	

- A. I drove him for three years, but I knew him prior to that.
- 3 422 Q. You knew him prior to that?
- 4 A. Yeah, I was a member of the Labour Party from 2007.

13:50

13:50

- 5 423 Q. Right.
- 6 A. And would have canvassed for Mr. Rabbitte and the
- 7 usual, put up posters and all that stuff. And in
- 8 actual fact, your Honour, he sent me a nice letter;
- 9 prior to the election of 2011, there was three
- 10 candidates going for nomination in the constituency of
- 11 Dublin Southwest, and my vote actually saved the
- 12 embarrassment of having to be added to the ticket,
- because there was a Mr. Maloney, Mr. Duff and
- 14 Mr. Rabbitte who were going for two nominations for the
- 15 Labour Party. So it's ironic, he actually wrote me a
- letter to thank me because I specifically drove from my
- 17 home in Clontarf to Tallaght to vote for him.
- 18 424 Q. So you had a lot of time for Mr. Rabbitte as a
- 19 politician, and did you get on --
- 20 A. Oh, absolutely. That's why I suppose when you leave
- 21 that job after 30 years, it's kind of an escape, and I
- felt I was very -- I thought a lot of the Labour Party
- then, and of course Mr. Rabbitte, that's why I
- canvassed for him, and et cetera.
- 25 425 Q. And did you get on well with him while you were working 13:51
- 26 with him?
- 27 A. Very well. But he could be grumpy at times, you know.
- 28 426 Q. I suppose --
- 29 A. But that's his -- your Honour, I don't mean to be

- disrespectful, but, you know, in the morning time, you didn't talk too much.
- 3 427 Q. All right. Yes. I suppose, you spent a lot of time 4 with him as his driver, as a minister?
- 5 Well, absolutely. And I think as your Honour stated to 13:51 Α. Mr. Rabbitte, that he probably -- he saw more of me 6 7 than his wife, because, you know, we could be anywhere 8 around Ireland, or wherever. And, you know, for example, one particular time we drove from Dublin to 9 Limerick, Ardnacrusha, there was a big commemoration 10 13:51 11 there, and then we drove up to Donegal for the summer 12 school. So, like, we were very close. Now, whether --13 sometimes you get the impression you can be closer to 14 people than you really are, but as regards a working relationship, your Honour, I think it was quite good. 15 13:52
- 16 428 Q. Right. Did you have any contact with any guards during
  17 the time period when you were working with
  18 Mr. Rabbitte?

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

A. The only contact would be to say "hello" to the garda on duty at the front gate of Leinster House. I had absolutely no working contact with the Gardaí, Garda Síochána, absolutely no -- I'd have no -- I wouldn't have any privy to the workings of An Garda Síochána. I mean, you'd say "hello" to a guard at the gate and say "how are things?" or you might -- it could be -- there was one guy from my own county, maybe we might go for a coffee, but certainly nothing of a nature that this horrible thing that was allegedly said that I said about Sergeant McCabe, which, by the way, has upset my

- family deeply.
- 2 429 Q. Right. Well, did you go to any social events with any
- guards, say retirement functions or anything of that
- 4 nature?
- 5 A. Em, no, I'm not a member of -- I'm not a member of any

13:53

13:53

13:54

- 6 club that's run by An Garda Síochána for example, a
- 7 golf club. I'm a member of, a proud member of Sutton
- 8 Golf Club, so there's no Gardaí there at all. The only
- 9 contact I have with Gardaí, I think once a year, as we
- call 'old exers', we meet for a couple of pints and a
- 11 meal at Christmas, that's the only contact I would
- have, or maybe the odd ex-garda, I would play a game of
- golf with him. But as regards the Commissioner down
- 14 at -- I'd have absolutely no contact whatsoever. I
- never -- as I say, I never knew Maurice McCabe, and I
- have a lot of sympathy for him, because I was very
- 17 active in the Garda Representative Association and I
- 18 know what it's like when -- it's a very lonely perch
- when a garda is in a spot of bother.
- 20 430 Q. Now, do you know the former Commissioner, Martin
- 21 Callinan?
- 22 A. Never met him in my life.
- 23 431 Q. Okay. And what about his driver, Mr. Hynes, who gave
- 24 evidence here last week?
- 25 A. No, no. You see, being a civilian driver and being
- attached to Headquarters is completely different,
- because if you're attached to Headquarters as an
- official Garda driver, of course you have a lot of
- contact. But basically the role of a Garda driver,

- 1 like it sounds an easy job, but you drop the minister, 2 we'll say, at Leinster House at ten o'clock in the morning, and unless he has, say, a function down town 3 or going to the country, you wouldn't see him until 4 5 seven or eight o'clock or nine o'clock, depending on 13:55 what time An Dáil closes. 6 432 Right. Q.
- 7
- 8 So, to answer your question, I wouldn't have -- I would Α. have no contact really with -- because there's so few 9 of them now anyhow, because, as was explained, the 10 13:55 11 Tánaiste and the Taoiseach and the President are the 12 only people now that have Garda drivers, and the 13 Minister for Justice.
- 14 433 Q. If I could just go to 2014. Mr. Rabbitte gave 15 evidence this morning that you picked him up after his 13:55 16 day's work in Leinster House sometime in February 2014. That wouldn't be unusual in itself, is that correct? 17
- 18 It's the most normal thing in the day. But if you Α. 19 look -- I don't know, your Honour, you can direct me, 20 but there's a complete contradiction in his evidence. He specifically said I rang him and I had a special 21 22 meeting with him. Now this morning, which is a fact, I 23 picked him up as normal, your Honour. So there was no 24 premeditated meeting at all.

- 25 So it wouldn't have been unusual for you to have 434 0. been -- it would have been totally routine for you to 26 27 pick him up after his day's work in the Dáil, in Leinster House? 28
- 29 well, that was my job, you know. Α.

- 1 435 Q. Yes. And you said earlier on that you would probably
  2 have been waiting for him or hanging around all day, is
  3 that correct, or did you have other business to carry
  4 out --
- 5 No, I didn't hang around. Sometimes you'd go into the Α. 13:56 6 canteen for a coffee or maybe breakfast, or whatever, but, to be honest, it was his car. In fairness to the 7 8 man, he was very generous with the car, because we literally had the use of the car and we could go home 9 or you could maybe leave the car, go around Grafton 10 13:56 11 Street shopping or something, but you had your phone 12 on, you had a State phone, you couldn't be too far 13 away, you're on, say, beck and call, you were there to 14 serve the minister.
- 15 436 Q. And while I'm not suggesting that you'd be generally
  16 gossiping around Leinster House or anything like that,
  17 Mr. Kennedy, would you be aware of what's going on in
  18 Leinster House and the general chat and news around the
  19 Oireachtas?

- Not really, like, you know. I mean, I don't think a 20 Α. 13:57 Minister would have much to say to me, you know what I 21 22 I presume it did go on, like, you'd hear things 23 going on, yeah, but nothing of a specific nature, 24 nothing like what Mr. Rabbitte alleged I said, which I 25 find despicable, actually what I was supposed to have 13:57 said, absolutely despicable. 26
- 27 437 Q. Now, when you say you presume it did go on, what 28 exactly are you referring to there, Mr. Kennedy?
- 29 A. No, I'm talking in general terms.

- 1 438 Q. Yes, yes.
- 2 A. You know, I'm talking in general terms. But I wouldn't
- have, no more than with the officers of An Garda
- 4 Síochána, like, I mean, you drive a minister, you're
- 5 not kind of -- I mean, I don't think I could offer much 13:58
- 6 advice to a minister or a TD, or whatever. I mean,
- 7 they have all their secretaries, and all that. You
- 8 know, basically, you wouldn't really be -- you wouldn't
- 9 be participating in the gossip, like, as such.
- 10 439 Q. Well, maybe if I could ask you this, Mr. Kennedy: It's 13:58
- a long day waiting for people to come home from
- 12 Leinster House and you may not have other business to
- look after, isn't that right?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 440 Q. And in the normal way, you'd chat to other people, am I  $_{13:58}$
- correct about that, in the normal way of --
- 17 A. Of course, yeah. Of course, yeah.
- 18 441 Q. And is it true to say that you would be fairly well
- informed of what is going on around Leinster House, if
- you were spending that amount of time in Leinster House 13:59
- with a large amount of it not assigned to any
- 22 particular task?
- 23 A. Just to emphasise again, at the time I was a go for the

- 24 minister. Like, I wouldn't have -- and I think we
- touched on it, your Honour, earlier in the day;
- regarding confidentiality and all that, every time a
- 27 minister sat in the car, a lot of the time he'd have
- 28 his adviser, like every -- every single meeting, every
- time you sat in the car, it was confidential, and by

the way I did drive some judges at time, and, in the
same context, you're privy to very serious information,
and everything is confidential when it comes to a
minister of government and, we'll say, and the same
context of judges.

14:00

6 442 Q. All right. Well, were you aware of any rumours about 7 Sergeant McCabe or talk about him?

- 8 A. Em, Sergeant McCabe was common knowledge.
- 9 443 Q. Yes.

If you read the newspapers, if you listened to 10 Α. 14:00 11 television, if you look at the -- I was going to say 12 look at the radio, sorry, I beg your pardon -- look at 13 the television or listen to the radio, I mean, it just 14 goes on and on. But the one thing that I want to 15 emphasise, your Honour, is, there was things about 14:00 16 whistleblower -- about the penalty points and all that, that's the kind of conversation that I heard and 17 18 what -- people give an opinion. But certainly when it 19 comes to child abuse, which I think, and I know this word was used a lot in other context, disgusting, I 20 14:01 think, when that's levelled at any person, either by 21 22 the person allegedly said it or about Sergeant McCabe, 23 I think it is grotesque, I think it is horrible and I 24 certainly would not say it. Because if I did, if I was 25 aware even as a police officer or as a neighbour, I 14 · 01 26 would have to go to social welfare people or go to 27 nurses or -- sorry, HSE, or whatever. But to mention that about any individual I think is disgusting, it 28 29 really is. And it has upset me and my family.

1	444	Q.	All right. Well, just to be clear, Mr. Kennedy, were	
2			you aware of any rumours about Sergeant McCabe and	
3			allegations of sexual assault or sexual abuse or any	
4			criminal misconduct?	
5		Α.	No, no, none whatsoever.	14:01
6	445	Q.	When did you become aware of any such rumours?	
7		Α.	I didn't become aware of any such rumours. I'm after	
8			saying, I just didn't hear them.	
9	446	Q.	All right. Well, did you become aware of them say, for	
10			instance, in February 2017 when they were the subject	14:02
11			of a Prime Time programme?	
12		Α.	No. I didn't see the programme. I wasn't aware, no.	
13	447	Q.	So was it when the Tribunal forwarded Mr. Rabbitte's	
14			correspondence to you that you became aware of those	
15			type of rumours?	14:02
16		Α.	That was the first time that I saw that derogatory	
17			disgusting remark, the letter, that Mr. Rabbitte	
18			allegedly said I said.	
19	448	Q.	Okay.	
20		Α.	And I must, to recall again, he said I specifically	14:02
21			rang him for a special meeting, and as, your Honour,	
22			this morning, he says, no, no, there was no meeting, I	
23			was just picking him up normally from Leinster House.	
24	449	Q.	You see, if you look at it this way, Mr. Kennedy.	
25			Mr. Rabbitte doesn't say you did this because you were	14:03
26			spreading malicious rumours about Sergeant McCabe. He	
27			seems to say that you told him to watch himself in	
28			relation to Sergeant McCabe out of a sense, it would	
29			appear to me, of loyalty to Mr. Rabbitte. Do you	

1		understand the difference? It wasn't spreading	
2		malicious gossip about Sergeant McCabe.	
3	Α.	As I said to you already, I never discussed Sergeant	
4		McCabe with Mr. Rabbitte at all. Never. Secondly, the	
5		perception out there is that, oh, Kennedy said to	4:03
6		Mr. Rabbitte that Mr. McCabe was involved with sexual	
7		abuse, which is completely wrong, I didn't say it,	
8		never said it, nor never would say it. Now, if	
9		somebody came to me, and we're not talking about	
10		Sergeant McCabe here, we're just talking about just in 1	4:03
11		your neighbourhood or whatever, I'd be very slow to say	
12		to anybody, and I would go to the property authorities,	
13		meaning the Health Board, the Garda Síochána, or	
14		whoever, the people, and that's where I would go. I	
15		certainly wouldn't it's too sensitive, it's too	4:04
16		horrible to suggest that anybody, with no with	
17		absolutely no proof. And I know what you're saying,	
18		that you're led that I didn't specifically say it but I	
19		heard it from someone else. No, I never heard it from	
20		anyone else. I didn't hear it doing the rounds and I $_{\rm 1}$	4:04
21		certainly didn't say it.	
22		MS. LEADER: If you would answer any questions anybody	
23		else might have for you, Mr. Kennedy.	
24		MR. McGARRY: No, thank you, Chairman.	
25		MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: No questions for Mr. Kennedy,	4:04
26		Chairman.	
27		MR. DIGNAM: No questions, Chairman.	
28		CHAIRMAN: The AGSI isn't represented, is it? Are you	

represented?

29

Τ			MS. LEADER: Yes.	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Mr. Hegarty, yes. I'm sorry, where is	
4			Mr. Hegarty?	
5			MR. McGUINNESS: Mr. Dockery.	14:05
6			CHAIRMAN: Yes, you're there, of course you are,	
7			Mr. Hegarty, yes. But you're not representing	
8			Mr. Kennedy, as such, are you?	
9			MR. DOCKERY: Yes, Mr. Hegarty has instructed me to	
10			represent Mr. Kennedy.	14:05
11			CHAIRMAN: Yes. No, no, fine. But it doesn't seem	
12			there is any other questions, unless you wanted to	
13			ask	
14			MR. DOCKERY: No, I don't, Chairman, no.	
15			CHAIRMAN: And there's nothing else, obviously?	14:05
16			MS. LEADER: No, Chairman.	
17				
18			MR. KENNEDY WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN:	
19				
20	450	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Can I just go back on that. Ms. Leader, I	14:05
21			think, has made it very clear to you, as I understand	
22			the evidence at the moment, now my view could change on	
23			it, Mr. Rabbitte is never saying you were someone going	
24			around spreading rumours, and I know your view that,	
25			look, this thing, once somebody makes such an	14:05
26			allegation, the right thing to do is to go to the	
27			proper authorities	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	451	Q.	CHAIRMAN: as opposed to asking somebody else about	

Т			it. But I suppose what Mr. Rappitte was saying, this	
2			was a relationship of trust, he trusted you, you	
3			trusted him, and possibly up to the point where this	
4			controversy arose between you, you probably would agree	
5			with that?	14:06
6		Α.	Oh, totally, yeah.	
7	452	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. And as you say, it's a kind of a	
8			confidential relationship, people could be talking	
9			about all kinds of things and you get to learn all	
10			kinds of things about people's family	14:06
11		Α.	Absolutely.	
12	453	Q.	CHAIRMAN: and it is not for repeating, and so it is	
13			a very responsible job.	
14		Α.	Well, it is very sensitive, yeah.	
15	454	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. And it's not everyone who is discreet,	14:06
16			you know; I mean, there's lots of people who are always	
17			shooting their mouth off about everything?	
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	455	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But as I understand it, what he is saying is	
20			that you were giving him a heads-up, that you were not	14:06
21			spreading a malicious rumour, you weren't saying this	
22			was true, you were saying, look, on the grapevine, this	
23			is what is out there. Now, how can I see that as being	
24			different to a journalist, for instance, asking a	
25			politician a question of the same kind? It's just	14:06
26			informing them as to, I suppose, what the rumour mill	
27			has in its teeth this particular week or this	
28			particular month?	
29		Α.	Well, specifically on the child abuse, I never	

- 1 mentioned -- I never said anything to that nature. 2 No, I understand that. 456 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes. But the other 3 thing that I wanted to ask you about is this: vou mentioned contacts with the Gardaí and the drink 4 5 once a year and the --14:07 6 Yeah. Α. 7 CHAIRMAN: Was there two occasions, was it Christmas as 457 Q. 8 well, or was it just one? 9 We just meet once a year. It's like guys we worked Α. with over the --10 14 · 07 11 458 CHAIRMAN: This is just a kind of a Christmas thing? Q. 12 Yeah. Α. 13 Christmas tends to be very busy from that 459 Q. CHAIRMAN: 14 point of view. But I suppose just looking at this from 15 my point of view, I mean, I am effectively out of the 14:07 16 Law Library since 2002, so I had four years in the 17 Morris Tribunal and then the High Court. 18 Okay. Α. 19 460 CHAIRMAN: So that is a long time, that's 16 years, but Q. I know a great deal more than perhaps people realise. 20 14:07
- A. Well, from my perspective, your Honour, when I left An Garda Síochána, which I was very proud of being a

you say?

And how does one get that information, I suppose it's

just by talking to people, retaining a few friends, as

14 · 08

21

22

23

member of, I think a lot of us just like to plough a different furrow and we like to, not break ties completely, but I think after 30 years of it we have

enough and we like to make more friends in the local

- rugby club or the golf club, or whatever. Not that we don't want to meet, but it's just that we move on to other things.
- 4 461 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- A. And as a result, I certainly wouldn't be calling into
  my local station and having a bit of fun and what's
  going on. I have no interest.
- 8 462 Q. CHAIRMAN: Well, I wouldn't dream of calling into the
  9 Law Library, and I'm not sure I would get a very nice
  10 welcome in the event that I did, but there you are.
  11 Look, Mr. Kennedy, obviously I'm going to have to think

about what you said and what Mr. Rabbitte has said.

14 · 08

14:09

14:09

14 . 09

13 A. Okay.

12

27

- 14 463 Q. CHAIRMAN: But one thing I am certain of, and it may 15 set your mind at rest, that you are not a malicious 16 gossip and that you weren't going around spreading 17 rumours. If this happened, and obviously I will think 18 about this, it was on the basis of a confidential discussion where perhaps someone felt a need to know or 19 20 a need to ask.
- 21 A. Yeah.
- 22 464 Q. CHAIRMAN: Or a need to impart information. And, you know, we quite often in life blunder around in the dark, and the more light there is, even sometimes if it's from the source of rumours, at least if you know about them, you can check that out. So I want you to
- 28 A. I appreciate that, your Honour.

know that, all right?

29 465 Q. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

1		Α.	Thank you very much.	
2				
3			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
4				
5			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, the next witness is	14:09
6			Mr. Brian Purcell.	
7				
8			MR. BRIAN PURCELL, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	
9			EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS:	
10				14:10
11			MR. PURCELL: Excuse me, Judge, would it be okay if I	
12			remove my jacket?	
13			CHAIRMAN: Yes, certainly, if you want.	
14		Α.	Thank you.	
15			MR. McGUINNESS: Mr. Purcell's statement is to be	14:10
16			found	
17			CHAIRMAN: You're gearing up for a fight, Mr. Purcell.	
18		Α.	Sorry?	
19			CHAIRMAN: You're gearing up for a fight.	
20			MR. McGUINNESS: Page 1680.	14:10
21	466	Q.	Mr. Purcell, I think had you a long career in the	
22			public service, is that correct.	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	467	Q.	And I think you retired, am I correct, in October 2017?	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:10
26	468	Q.	And when did your career commence?	
27		Α.	1979.	
28	469	Q.	And what departments did you work in and what	
29		Α.	I worked in the department of the then-Department of	

- 1 Industry and Commerce from 1979 up until 1985. I think
- it would have had a number of different names during
- 3 that period, but it was Industry and Commerce when I
- 4 went into it. And then I was transferred -- sorry.
- 5 470 Q. Yes. Could I just ask you to move the microphone on
- 6 your left-hand side towards you, yes. Perhaps you will

14 · 11

14:11

- 7 just repeat that, Mr. Purcell.
- 8 A. From the beginning?
- 9 471 Q. Well, from where you last were. You were in Industry
- and Commerce from '79 to '85?
- 11 A. From '79 until '85, and at that stage I was transferred
- 12 to the Department of Social Welfare, I was promoted and
- moved to the Department of Social Welfare, and I worked
- in the Department of Social Welfare from 1985 until
- 15 1991, and again I was promoted and moved then to the
- Department of Justice. I would have worked -- I worked
- in the Department of Justice from '91, I worked
- initially in the prisons division.
- 19 472 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. And then I worked in the crime division, and then I
- 21 went back to the prisons, and I was appointed director
- of operations in the Irish Prison Service in 2001 and
- then I was appointed director general of the Irish
- 24 Prison Service in 2004, and I held that post for seven
- years until 2011 when I was appointed secretary general 14:12
- of the Department.
- 27 473 Q. Who did you succeed at that point as secretary general?
- 28 A. Seán Aylward.
- 29 474 Q. Mr. Aylward?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 475 Q. And I think you held the position as secretary general
- 3 until October 2014?
- 4 A. That's right.
- 5 476 Q. And I think on the 3rd October you moved to the HSE, is 14:12
- 6 that correct?
- 7 A. Yeah, I took up duty in the HSE at the end of October
- 8 2014. I finished in the Department of Justice on the
- 9 3rd October, but I had leave, and I took up my position

14 · 12

14:13

14 · 13

- in the HSE in the end of October 2014.
- 11 477 Q. All right. And I think you retired from the HSE then
- in October 2017, is that right?
- 13 A. That's right.
- 14 478 Q. Now, just dealing with that last period, what was your
- area of responsibility within the HSE at that point in
- 16 time?
- 17 A. I was the head of compliance.
- 18 479 Q. What did that involve?
- 19 A. It was -- there are what are known as Section 38 and 39
- organisations. They would be organisations that would
- 21 provide services on behalf of the HSE and would be
- funded either entirely or partially by the HSE. They
- 23 would cover -- you know, they would range from -- the
- 24 biggest of them in terms of funding would be
- 25 St. James's Hospital. They include all the voluntary
- hospitals.
- 27 480 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. And then a range of voluntary organisations that would
- 29 provide services on behalf of the HSE right across the

- full range of social and personal healthcare services.
- 2 481 Q. All right. The Tribunal has obviously heard about the
- opening of a file in Tusla relating to Ms. D and
- 4 implicating Sergeant McCabe. Had you any knowledge of

14:14

14:14

14:14

14 · 15

- or any dealings with any issue connected with that?
- 6 A. No, no. I would have -- I would have had no dealings
- 7 with Tusla during my period in the HSE. As I said, I
- 8 would have dealt with people within the HSE and I would
- 9 have dealt with the voluntary organisations, the
- Section 38 and 39 organisations. But during my period
- in the HSE I never had any details what -- any
- 12 engagement whatsoever with anybody from Tusla.
- 13 482 Q. Okay. Well, when you were secretary general of the
- Department of Justice, in any event, obviously the
- policing division came under your responsibility, and
- 16 who was the assistant secretary in charge of policing
- 17 at that point in time?
- 18 A. Michael Flahive.
- 19 483 Q. Michael Flahive. Now, were you ever made aware by
- anyone in the Department or through any inspection of
- any files or documents about any allegation that had
- been made against Sergeant McCabe and investigated by
- 23 An Garda Síochána?
- A. Not by anyone in the Department. I, at one point
- 25 during, I think it was -- it would have been sometime
- in 2013 when -- but at this distance I can't remember
- 27 precisely when it was, I did ask the then-Commissioner
- 28 was there anything in Sergeant McCabe's background that
- was unusual, I can't remember the exact words, words I

used, but I would say straight from the off it wasn't 1 2 as a result of having heard anything, but I asked him, you know, I was just, I suppose, curious as to was 3 there any anything out of the ordinary in the 4 5 background. And the then-Commissioner at the time told 14:15 6 me about the allegations that had been made by the 7 daughter of a colleague, he told me that it had been 8 investigated in the normal course of events by the guards, a file had gone to the DPP, the DPP had said 9 that there was no case, and that was it. It was --10 14 · 16 11 that was pretty much -- he told me about it in what I 12 would describe as a matter-of-fact way. There was 13 allegation, investigation, files to DPP, no case, case 14 closed. There was no, and I'd be crystal clear about 15 this, there was no attempt by the then-Commissioner to 14:16 16 say, you know, that's not the case or to imply that 17 there was anything other than what it was. 18 484 All right. Did he place that in time for you, in terms Q. of --19 20 I think he -- to be honest, I can't remember the exact Α. 14:16 thing, but I did think he said -- you know, it's a few 21 22 years ago, I can't remember did he tell me the year, 23 but my recollection is that he would have said it was a 24 number of years ago. 25 Now, just to try and help the Tribunal place that in 485 Q. 14 · 16 context, are you in a position to recall when he said 26 27 that to you?

28

29

Α.

Well, I think I just mentioned, to be honest, I can't

remember specifically. I think it was sometime during

			_	
1	+h^	course	$\sim$ +	2012
<b>1</b>	LIIE	Course	UΙ	ZUIJ.

- 2 486 Q. Was it during the currency of the penalty points controversy?
- A. Oh, yeah -- well, yes, because it was very much the
  penalty points issue that was out there, and, in terms of occupying our thoughts within the Department, it was the penalty points issue that was the issue.
- 8 487 Q. And I don't know if this might help you to try and
  9 place it, was it before or after Assistant Commissioner
  10 O'Mahony had reported and the report had come to the
  11 Minister?
- 12 A. It could have -- it might have certainly been around 13 that time, but again, I just can't -- at this remove, I 14 can't remember precisely.

14 · 18

- 15 488 Q. Yeah.
- A. But it could have been, it could have been around that time.
- 18 489 Q. Yes. Former Commissioner Callinan and former Minister
  19 Shatter have each confirmed that they had a
  20 conversation in which the Minister asked about Sergeant 14:18
  21 McCabe and the Commissioner gave a factual account,
  22 almost in line with how you've described it. Was there
  23 anyone else present when you had this conversation?
- A. No, I don't -- to be honest, it would have -- it's more than likely that it may have been over the phone, but it could have been -- to be honest, it could have been on one of the occasions when I would have met the Commissioner, not about that issue. But at that particular time, despite the way things were playing

out in the media, all throughout that period, the 1 2 biggest issue of concern for me as secretary general was in relation to resourcing and funding for the Garda 3 Síochána and, quite a number -- a lot of the engagement 4 5 I would have had with the Commissioner would have 14:18 6 covered issues as -- I was going to say as mundane, but 7 would have covered what are the bread and butter issues of Garda resources, both financial and other. 8 9 490 Yes. Q. So, no, I can't recall. I don't actually recall when 10 Α. 14 · 19 11 it was -- when it was said to me, and --12 You're not sure whether it was face-to-face or not? 491 Q. I'm not sure whether it was face-to-face or over the 13 Α. 14 I certainly don't remember, if you like, and if 15 this is any help to you, I don't recall a conversation 16 that involved anyone else other than myself and the Commissioner when I was told. 17 18 492 Right. Okay. Well, did you ask any follow-up Q. questions or did it cause you any concern, or how did 19 20 you react to that? 14:19 Well, it was -- the way he presented it was on a 21 Α. 22 factual basis. I didn't get into if -- I didn't get 23 into asking, well, is it, what do you think yourself? 24 Or -- I didn't have that conversation. My concern at 25 the time, and right throughout that period, wouldn't 14 · 19 26 have been why this was happening or why the whole 27 penalty points issue was there; it was what were the facts in relation to it and how it was being dealt 28

with.

29

- 1 493 Q. But was anything said to you or did you reach any
  2 conclusion in your own mind as to whether this might be
  3 explicable as part of the motivation for Sergeant
  4 McCabe raising issues relating to matters?
- 5 To be honest, the only thought I had in my own mind was 14:20 Α. 6 that, you know, Jesus, I'd hate -- sorry for using that 7 word -- but I would hate to find myself in a position 8 where that would happen to me. But as I've said, the issue here for me was whether -- whether the issues 9 10 that were being raised by Sergeant McCabe in relation 14 · 20 11 to the penalty points were correct or not and the related issues about information that was out in the 12 13 public domain and that, they were my concerns.
- 14 494 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. I wasn't interested in what motivated this. I was 14:20
  16 interested in what the actual case was in relation to the facts.
- 18 495 Q. Yes. You've mentioned there obviously the matters that
  19 were out in the public domain. Were there concerns of
  20 the Department that you had in relation to this?

  14:21
- 21 A. To the penalty points?
- 22 496 Q. Yes, and the matters being in the public domain?
- A. Yeah, I mean, it was -- this was a major -- this was a major concern, that people who had engaged with An Garda Síochána at the time through the issue of penalty -- you know, the tickets and that, there's an expectation, a justifiable expectation, that people who engage with the Garda Síochána in relation to this type of issue, not exclusively in relation to penalty

14 · 21

1			points, but this type of issue, have an expectation	
2			that those matters would be confidential between them	
3			and the Gardaí, and I had a major concern that this	
4			type of information, personal details of people who	
5			supposedly had penalty points, or not even supposedly,	14:22
6			who seem to have had tickets cancelled or terminated	
7			in fact, you know, the word, the phrase "ticket	
8			fixing", I think, was going around, so there was a	
9			twofold or there was, if you like, a double element to	
LO			it: one, that, you know, people who had an engagement	14:22
L1			with the guards in relation to penalty points, that	
L2			information was going out there to third parties, and	
L3			there was also some evidence that it had gone from	
L4			third parties and then was in the public domain, so	
L5			there was that issue of confidential information.	14:22
L6	497	Q.	Yes.	
L7		Α.	But there was also a second issue that was a cause of	
L8			grave concern, and that was the fact that those people	
L9			who would have had penalty points terminated or	
20			cancelled, whatever the word used was, there was	14:22
21			almost, I don't know how I would describe it, but there	
22			was almost, say, a presumption that they themselves had	
23			done something wrong.	
24	498	Q.	Yes.	
25		Α.	So it wasn't only it was twofold: it was the	14:23
26			confidential information being out there, you know,	
7			when it shouldn't he	

And secondly, the issue of a presumption or, you know,

28

29

499

Q.

Yes.

- 1 something in the ether that they were up to something.
- 2 500 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. Dodgy as well, it wasn't even -- it wasn't even that

14 · 23

14:23

14:24

14.24

- 4 accusations were being made. That the guards were
- 5 doing something that they shouldn't be doing.
- 6 501 Q. Yes.
- 7 A. But also the people themselves --
- 8 502 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. -- were doing it.
- 10 503 Q. Well, presumably you consult -- did you consult the
- 11 Commissioner about these matters or did he consult you
- 12 about them?
- 13 A. We would have -- we would have -- we would have had
- conversations about these issues and, in turn, the
- papers were referred to John O'Mahony for an
- investigation, and, arising from that investigation,
- 17 that the assistant commissioner carried out -- vou
- 18 know, there were findings from that. And I can't
- remember the exact sequence, but I think they were also
- 20 referred to the Professional Standards Unit, and
- subsequently I think they were referred to GSOC by the
- then-minister.
- 23 504 Q. Yes.
- A. But, you know, that what was out there in the ether in
- 25 terms of the media and politically in terms of the
- commentary on it.
- 27 505 Q. Yes. Well, we know obviously that one of the issues
- that emerged was whether or not Sergeant McCabe had
- cooperated or not or had been invited to furnish

1			information, and the Tribunal isn't especially	
2			concerned, I think, about that. But that obviously	
3			became part of a feature of the issues of controversy	
4			which were ventilated at the Public Accounts Committee	
5			hearing. Were you, in your position as secretary	14:25
6			general in the Department, keeping a close eye on the	
7			Public Accounts Committee and the possible appearance	
8			of Sergeant McCabe?	
9		Α.	well, look, obviously given the nature, given the	
10			nature of what was involved and also given the nature	14:25
11			of the commentary around it, of course I was concerned	
12			about this.	
13	506	Q.	Yes.	
14		Α.	You know, there was	
15	507	Q.	The Tribunal has seen letters that the Commissioner	14:25
16			wrote, inter alia, I think, to the Chairman of the	
17			Public Accounts Committee and the Data Commissioner.	
18			Was Commissioner Callinan concerned as in his	
19			position as data controller about issues relating to	
20			that and also the maintenance of discipline in the	14:25
21			Garda Síochána?	
22		Α.	Absolutely. This was a key, a key issue of concern.	
23			The Commissioner, as data controller, obviously had	
24			duties under the legislation that he had to you	
25			know, that he to abide by, and the issue of the	14:25
26			issue of his issue or concern as the head of the	
27			Garda Síochána and the possible implications of what I	
28			always would have loosely described it as the	
29			politicisation of this issue, he had a major concern	

- with this, in the context of control and maintenance of
- 2 discipline in what was a disciplined organisation. I
- mean, that was a matter for him, not me. But I also
- 4 had concerns. I mean, one of the -- I was very
- 5 concerned about the whole issue of the -- as I said,

14 · 26

14:27

14:27

- 6 what I regarded as confidential information and, in
- 7 particular, personal details of people who engaged
- being out there.
- 9 508 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. And at one point I can recall that there was a press
- 11 conference, or I'm not sure what it was described as,
- but essentially it was a press conference or a press
- call being -- was arranged for Buswells Hotel, and a
- 14 number of the TDs that were involved in this had called
- it, and there were rumours going around at the time,
- 16 because I think around the time there were names
- 17 floating about of people who supposedly had -- and I
- 18 was really concerned about this, that the people were
- 19 going to be named.
- 20 509 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. And that could have potential implications for the
- 22 Garda Commissioner but perhaps also for the Minister.
- 23 510 Q. Yes.
- 24 A. And I rang --
- 25 511 Q. Where they a number of independent TDs?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 512 Q. There's no need to name them.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 513 Q. But was there a threat to name and shame persons

identified in the dossier?

- A. I can't recall precisely, but certainly my recollection is that it was -- it was out there, that there was a likelihood that, you know, names were going -- I think at that stage, names, some names were actually out there in the ether. I can't remember was it -- CHAIRMAN: Mr. Purcell, I suppose that kind of things always happens. If you go back even as far as the Ansbacher controversy, people were assuming certain people were on lists etcetera, etcetera, and quite often they weren't.
- 12 A. Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- 13 CHAIRMAN: So that was, if you like, another rumour 14 mill. But you worried about that, in any event, it's 15 enough to say that.
  - Absolutely. But sorry, Chairman, the point I was going Α. to make is, I was so concerned at that point because of this rumour that names were going to be, that I actually rang the office of the Data Protection Commissioner looking to speak to the then-Data 14:28 Protection Commissioner, Billy Hawkes. Now, Billy Hawkes wasn't there, I can't remember, he just wasn't there on the day, and I spoke to my deputy and I expressed my concerns about this, and he said, look, leave it with me, and he subsequently rang me back and 14:28 told me that he had spoken to one of the people involved and had said what, you know, the concerns that they would have about this. But I just use that as a reference to indicate how my -- what my concerns were

1 at the time.

2 MR. McGUINNESS: All right. I mean, obviously the 514 Q. 3 Garda Commissioner is responsible under the Garda Síochána Act to the Minister in many ways and is 4 5 dependent upon the Department for the vote also, isn't 14:29 6 that correct? But did you see yourself having a 7 community of interest, as it were, with the concerns of 8 the Commissioner about these issues while the PAC hearings were going on? 9

- I was aware that the Commissioner's concerns were 14:29 10 Α. 11 very much parallel to my, or the same as my own, in relation to those issues of confidentiality. The 12 13 suggestion that the people who -- you know, I'm only 14 repeating myself. And also, also at the time of the 15 PAC hearing, the John O'Mahony report had been 14:29 16 completed at that stage, I also had concerns that a 17 number of the John O'Mahony report had shown that, 18 based on his examination of it, quite a considerable 19 number of the more serious complaints of what were 20 described as illegally and corruptly terminating 14:29 penalty point notices were not well-founded at all. 21 22 And that's, I suppose, putting it nicely.
- 23 515 Q. Yes, yes. Well, just in terms of the time-line of the 24 hearings, I think you were, as would be normal, is that 25 correct, often in touch with the Commissioner by phone

14:30

26 and by text, in relation to all sorts of issues 27 relating to him and the Garda Síochána and you and

28 Department?

29 A. Yes, yeah.

- 1 516 Q. And I think in the context of the Fennelly Commission,
- I think your phone was made available to the Fennelly
- 3 Commission --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 517 Q. -- to look at such contacts as there were between a

14:30

14:31

14:31

- 6 particular period?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 518 Q. I think it ranged from the beginning of November until
- 9 the end of March --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 519 Q. -- 2014. And they were made available obviously for a
- different purpose in the Fennelly Commission, but they
- have obviously been made available, pursuant to an
- order of the Tribunal, to us as well. But I think a
- number of them are to be found at page 1686, and I'm
- sure you have seen those before?
- 17 A. Are they in volume --
- 18 520 Q. Volume 6.
- 19 A. Sorry, which?
- 20 521 Q. Page 1686.
- 21 A. Yes, sorry, go ahead. I know the ones you are
- referring to.
- 23 522 Q. You know the ones, yes. The first one is from you, as
- I read it, to the Commissioner on 22nd January 2014?
- 25 A. Yeah.
- 26 523 Q. That's correct, when it says "me", that means that you
- 20 323 Q. That's correct, when it says me, that means that you
- 27 are sending it, is that right?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 524 Q. Okay. And it reads --

1	Α.	well,	I don't	know	where	the	"me"	was,	but,	yes,	that
2		was so	mething	I was	sendi	ing.					

"The clerk to the PAC was not available but I spoke to 3 525 0. another official of the PAC who was also dealing with 4 5 the issue. She confirmed that the whistleblower will not be there tomorrow." 6

7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Now, could you just explain the context in which that inquiry was made and why it was made and the upshot of it?

14:31

14:31

Α. The context in which that inquiry was made was that at that time we didn't actually know -- we believed that Sergeant McCabe was going to appear as a witness at the Public Accounts Committee. we didn't know whether that would be in public or in private, but 14:32 I knew that witnesses did not often appear in private before the Public Accounts Committee, if at all. not sure that I could recall any other instance where a witness appeared in private before the Public Accounts So there was almost an expectation that if Committee. Sergeant McCabe was going to appear before the Public Accounts Committee, it would be in public. The reason for that inquiry being made was, we had no idea when it was going to be.

25 526 Q. Yes.

14:32

14:32

I think the Commissioner was concerned, from the 26 Α. 27 perspective of his role as Commissioner, his position as Commissioner of the Gardaí, that there was a 28 29 possibility that a situation would arise where he'd be

1 there and Sergeant McCabe would also be there at the 2 Now, I think I had said to him that I don't same time. 3 think -- I doubt very much if that would happen. 4 527 Q. 5 But I said, look, I will see can I find out, it should Α. be relatively straightforward to find out who was going 6 7 to be actually appearing on the day you're going to be 8 there. So that's what happened. I contacted the office of the Public Accounts Committee. I think I was 9 10 looking to talk to the clerk of the Committee, but he 14:33 11 wasn't there, so I spoke to someone else --12 528 Yes. Q. -- who -- I can't remember who it was, and they just 13 Α. 14 said, no, it's only the Commissioner and his people 15 will be there. 14:33 16 All right. 529 Q. 17 So that is the context of that. Α. I mean, there had been some talk about whether 18 530 Q. 19 the Commissioner would take action, that is legal action, against the Committee in terms of either the 20 14:33 21 return of the papers or to prevent Sergeant McCabe 22 appearing, perhaps? 23 Yeah. Α. 24 were these matters that were raised with you by him? 531 Q. 25 I was aware, obviously this goes back to the whole Α. 14:33 issue of confidential information being taken from the 26 27 Garda system and given to third parties, and I was aware that the -- as I said, I was absolutely aware 28 that the Commissioner's views and mine on that were the 29

1 same. 2 532 Q. Yes. I think I was aware that he had written to the Public 3 Α. Accounts Committee following, I think, an engagement 4 5 that he had with the office of the Data Protection 14:34 Commissioner, but, to be honest, I can't be hundred 6 7 percent sure, but I think I was aware of that. 8 533 Yes. Presumably you -- do you recall speaking with the Q. Commissioner after that text --9 After that --10 Α. 14:34 11 534 -- and before he appeared the following day? Q. 12 I think -- em, I can't remember did I actually speak to Α. 13 him or was the text the last, the last conversation or 14 the last engagement with him before he actually 15 I think -- I don't think I spoke to him, I appeared. 14:34 16 don't recall speaking to him --17 Yeah. 535 Q. 18 -- say, the night before, or anything. Α. 19 536 well, certainly he thanks you for that just before five Q. to seven on that evening of the 22nd, and they turned 20 14:35 21 up obviously at an early hour in the Houses --22 Yes. Α. 23 -- to give evidence before the committee on the 23rd. 537 Q. 24 And then you appear to have sent a text just after two 25 minutes past three o'clock in the afternoon, very 14:35 shortly after the evidence had finished. Had you been 26 27 following the evidence?

have looked at some of it.

To be honest, I can't actually recall. I think I may

28

29

Α.

2 But I was dealing with other matters. It wouldn't be Α. 3 normal, it certainly would not be the norm to sit there looking at five hours of the Public Accounts Committee 4 5 on a screen. 14:35 6 539 Yes, it's hard. Q. 7 It certainly is. To be honest, at this remove I can't Α. remember whether I -- I certainly watched some of it. 8 9 540 Yes. Q. I didn't watch all of it. 10 Α. 14:35 11 541 Q. But did you hear the "disgusting" remark, as a matter of interest? 12 13 Do you know, I can't actually remember whether I heard Α. 14 that or whether it was afterwards I heard it. I really can't recall. 15 14:36 16 All right. 542 Q. 17 I could have heard it, but, you know, I couldn't say Α. 18 with certainty that yes, I did. 19 543 Well, in any event --Q. But I was aware of it then. If I hadn't seen it at the 14:36 20 Α. time, I was certainly aware of it relatively soon 21 22 afterwards. 23 544 There is a text then the next day saying: Yes. Q. 24 25 "Martin, know you are on route to Dundalk. Can you 14:36 26 call me possibly. Just wondering how you got on with Brian." 27 JMcG. 28

538

Q.

1

29

All right.

Now, that is sent at sixteen minutes to six that

1			evening. You obviously became aware at some stage that	
2			he had gone to meet Mr. McGuinness, is that right?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	545	Q.	And that he was now on his way back from having met	
5			him. Can you just explain the circumstances there?	14:36
6		Α.	I think I'd had a conversation on the phone with the	
7			Commissioner the night you know, the evening after	
8			he was there at the PAC, or I think it was the evening	
9			after he was there, and he told me that, during the	
10			course of the PAC, that he thought something that the	14:37
11			Chairman of the PAC, John McGuinness, had said during	
12			the course of the hearing seemed to open up to a	
13			possibility, at least in the Commissioner's mind, that	
14			this might be a route that could be followed and	
15			possibly would address the issue of whether or not	14:37
16			Sergeant McCabe would be appearing as a witness, but	
17	546	Q.	Well, what do you recall the Commissioner identifying	
18			as something that Deputy McGuinness had said which	
19			might have held out a possibility?	
20		Α.	What it was was, I think Deputy McGuinness said	14:37
21			something at the time, you know, if this was in my	
22			business or if I was in a private-sector company and	
23			there was a sorry, that there was a will I	
24			continue?	
25	547	Q.	Yes, go ahead.	14:38
26		Α.	And there was an issue such as this, I would seek to	
27			resolve it by sitting down and talking to the person	
28			concerned. And the Commissioner, the Commissioner	
29			seemed to think that this might be an 'in' in terms of	

1			trying to move this in a particular direction, part of	
2			which was the Commissioner still had major concerns	
3			about the appearance in public of Sergeant McCabe as a	
4			witness. I indeed shared those concerns about	
5	548	Q.	Yes.	14:38
6		Α.	Because the stuff was some of the things were	
7			already out there, as I described earlier. There was a	
8			concern that if this went on in public, God only knows	
9			what way it might have gone.	
10	549	Q.	Yes.	14:38
11		Α.	There was just an air of uncertainty about how this	
12			might go - would something else happen? Would other	
13			names be mentioned? Not necessarily by Sergeant	
14			McCabe, but we'd already, I think, at that stage had an	
15			episode where a deputy had put out names during a	14:39
16			session in the Dáil.	
17	550	Q.	Actually named them, yes.	
18		Α.	So there was that concern was there. The	
19			Commissioner saw this as his interpretation of it	
20			was that, look, this might be, might be something worth	14:39
21			pursuing.	
22	551	Q.	So is it fair then to say that the Commissioner was	
23			saying to you effectively, look, Deputy McGuinness has	
24			perhaps left the door open to an approach, that he	
25			suggested that this might be a way forward, meeting the	14:39
26			employee or putting some structure in place and the	
27			Commissioner was keen to build on that, is that how I	
28			interpret what you are saying?	
29		Α.	Yeah. I'm not sure if he used the phrase he's left the	

- door open.
- 2 552 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. But, yeah, the general sense of what you are saying
- 4 was, yes, my interpretation of what the Commissioner
- was saying to me, that there was perhaps an opportunity 14:40
- 6 here to engage and --
- 7 553 Q. A chink to explore, perhaps?
- 8 A. Yeah. And he told me that he was going to contact
- 9 Deputy McGuinness with that in mind. Now, I didn't --
- to be honest, I didn't really have a great deal of hope 14:40
- that that was going to result in the outcome that the
- 12 Commissioner thought.
- 13 554 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. But I suppose as well as that, I thought, well, look,

14:40

14 · 40

- 15 you've nothing to lose by putting it to him, and I
- 16 wasn't at the hearing.
- 17 555 Q. Did you suggest that to him?
- 18 A. Did I suggest?
- 19 556 Q. Did you say that to him, that you've nothing to lose by
- 20 putting it to him?
- 21 A. I can't remember, but I know -- I can't remember did I
- use that, but I possibly did: well, look, if you
- 23 think -- if you think that whatever it was that John
- 24 McGuinness had said, because I didn't actually know at
- 25 that point what he -- I didn't know beforehand what he
- had said, but it was when the Commissioner said it to
- 27 him, I said, well, look, you were there, you're best
- 28 placed to make a call on whether you thought that that
- was a realistic -- whether he was holding this out and

1 said I don't know, or did you feel that there might be 2 a prospect of moving it in a particular direction by 3 meeting with Deputy McGuinness and talking about it. I said, well, look, if you think there's anything to be 4 5 gained by that, I don't have a problem with it, I 14:41 6 wouldn't see a problem with it, not that he had --7 sorry, I should make it clear, he wasn't looking for my 8 permission --9 Yes. 557 Q. 10 -- or my approval. Α. 14 · 41 11 558 Yes. Q. 12 It was just that, it was as I said. Α. 13 In any event, you had an insight into the way he was 559 Q. 14 thinking, he had consulted you obviously to the extent 15 that he told you what he was thinking, why he was 14:41 16 thinking it and what he was going to do. He wasn't 17 concealing this in any way? 18 Yeah, and it was -- it goes back to the points I raised Α. 19 before about the whole issue about confidential and 20 personal details being out there. 14:41 CHAIRMAN: No, I actually have the picture now, I feel, 21 22 Mr. McGuinness. 23 Yeah. Α. 24 So, Mr. Purcell, I mean, presumably he 560 MR. McGUINNESS: Q. 25 didn't discuss where the meeting might take place, or 14 · 41 26 anything like that? 27 No, no.

And that wasn't a concern of yours. But did you have

any concerns as to whether it was proper or improper or

Α.

Q.

28

29

561

- 1 appropriate at the time for the Commissioner to speak to the Chairman? 2 3 Α. I didn't think it was inappropriate. 562 4 0. Okay. 5 I'm quite sure that if it was inappropriate, that Α. 14:42 6 Deputy McGuinness would have quickly said that. 7 Did you speak to the Commissioner after this 563 Okay. 0. 8 text? Yes, I'm pretty sure I did, because I do recall that --9 Α. 10 I do recall having a conversation with him, exactly 14 · 42 11 when, whether it was immediately after the text or at 12 some point, I had a --13 And can you recollect what he told you about the 564 Q. 14 meeting? 15 Yeah. He told me, look, pretty much that he raised the 14:42 Α. 16 issues he had discussed with me the day before and he 17 said, you know -- I think he said that John McGuinness 18 said, you know, something along the lines would you not 19 sit down -- he repeated perhaps what was said at the 20 hearing, but his sense of it was that, you know, he 14:43 wasn't, put it this way, I don't think he was 21 22 encouraged in the sense of getting the result he looked 23 for, but he was -- I think he was happy that he had put 24 the concerns out there.
- 25 565 Q. Okay.

26 A. Particularly the one about the maintenance, his

position as Commissioner and the whole thing about the

14 · 43

thing in public, etcetera.

29 566 Q. So he got an opportunity to make his case?

- 1 A. Yes, I think he was satisfied --
- 2 567 Q. But he was doubtful --
- 3 A. -- that he had made the case. I think it was almost a
- 4 case of, look, I've done whatever I can, and that's it.

14:44

14 · 44

- 5 568 Q. Okay. Did he say anything to you such as to convey
- 6 that he had said or done anything improper?
- 7 A. Absolutely not.
- 8 569 Q. Did you ever hear, while you were still secretary
- 9 general, that it was being alleged that the
- Commissioner had done anything improper on the occasion 14:43
- of meeting Deputy McGuinness?
- 12 A. While I was secretary general?
- 13 570 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. No, no. In fact, I had forgotten all about the meeting
- with Deputy McGuinness until it surfaced when, I can't
- 16 remember when it was, until it surfaced a couple of
- 17 years later, two or three, whenever it was.
- 18 571 Q. You obviously were involved to an extent then when
- 19 Commissioner Callinan resigned, and we don't need to go
- into that, in March 2014?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 572 Q. But did you have any knowledge or information relating
- to any smear campaign run by the former Commissioner or
- 24 the Deputy Commissioner --
- 25 A. No.
- 26 573 Q. -- throughout this period?
- 27 A. Absolutely not.
- MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you. Would you answer any
- 29 questions My Friend may have.

```
1
 2
              MR. PURCELL WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McGARRY:
 3
 4
    574 O.
              MR. McGARRY: Mr. Purcell, Paul McGarry is my name.
 5
              am one of the lawyers representing Sergeant McCabe.
                                                                          14:44
 6
              Can I ask you to look at page 1682.
              Sorry, 1682?
 7
         Α.
 8
    575
              Volume 6.
         Q.
 9
              Volume 6.
         Α.
10
    576
              Yes. This is your handwritten statement or letter to
         Q.
                                                                          14 · 44
              the Tribunal --
11
12
              Yes.
         Α.
13
              -- dated 20th December 2017?
    577
         Q.
14
         Α.
              Yes.
15
    578
              And is that the first communication that you had with
         Q.
                                                                          14:45
16
              the Tribunal --
17
              Yes.
         Α.
18
    579
              -- about the matters that are being investigated by it?
         Q.
19
         Α.
              Yes.
              But you know that one of the terms of reference of the
20
    580
         Q.
21
              Tribunal relates very specifically to the meeting
22
              between former Commissioner and Mr. McGuinness, the
23
              so-called car park meeting?
24
              Yes.
         Α.
25
              You did know about that, it's clear from your evidence
    581
         Q.
              today, isn't that right?
26
27
              Sorry, I did know about?
         Α.
28
    582
              You know about that meeting, didn't you?
         Q.
```

Yes, yeah.

Α.

29

- 1 583 Q. After it happened?
- 2 A. Yeah.
- 3 584 Q. Well, the Tribunal had been in existence for, well
- 4 certainly nearly a year, a long number of months by
- 5 December 2017. Why is this the first time that you

14 · 46

- 6 have produced information about what you knew about
- 7 that meeting?
- 8 A. Why was it in December '17?
- 9 585 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. Well, the reason being that obviously there were a
- 11 number of other terms of reference. The meeting with
- 12 Deputy McGuinness was just one of those. I thought the
- main body of the terms of reference of the Commission
- 14 were the other matters. I thought myself that the
- issue of term of reference (1), I think it was, was not 14:46
- likely to come up until much further down the road. In
- 17 hindsight, I probably should have put something in, and
- 18 I'm not offering this as an excuse, Chairman, but I had
- 19 been engaged -- I had been involved in both the
- 20 Fennelly and the O'Higgins Commission and, in those
- instances, I was asked for statements, and like, to be
- 22 honest, I'm not saying that that was the reason, but it
- was something there I thought I might have been asked
- for a statement. And again, I apologise if I didn't
- get this in at the time I should. But effectively, it
- is what it is, it says what I knew about it, and there
- 27 it is.
- 28 586 Q. Just look at that page, in fact just the previous page,
- you will see at the bottom of page 1680 you say:

Т				
2			"I was aware of the original allegation "	
3		Α.	Sorry, which page is this?	
4	587	Q.	At the bottom of 1680.	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:47
6	588	Q.	You see there at the bottom you say:	
7				
8			"I was aware of the 'original allegations' regarding	
9			Sergeant McCabe."	
10				14:47
11			And then you say:	
12				
13			"At some point during a conversation I was having with	
14			the then-Commissioner Martin Callinan regarding the	
15			McCabe disclosures allegations concerning An Garda	14:47
16			Síochána, the then-Commissioner told me that	
17			allegations had been made by the daughter of a garda	
18			colleague of Sergeant McCabe. These allegations were	
19			investigated and the DPP had directed no prosecution."	
20				14:47
21			Were you aware that articles were being written by	
22			Mr. Williams and the like about the D allegations?	
23		Α.	At which time was this?	
24	589	Q.	well	
25		Α.	Not at the time I would have had the conversation	14:48
26			with Commissioner about it?	
27	590	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	No. At the time that would have been back some time	
29			in September 2013. I wasn't aware that Mr. Williams	

Τ			was	
2	591	Q.	So the reference there to the conversation with the	
3			then-Commissioner is some time in 2013, is that right?	
4		Α.	Well, I think that is what I said to Mr. McGuinness. I	
5			think I said to Mr. McGuinness that I couldn't be	14:48
6			precise about that, but my recollection was that it was	
7			some time in 2013, maybe around the time of the	
8			O'Mahony investigation. But at this remove that's as	
9			good as I can do in terms of my recollection of it.	
10			CHAIRMAN: The articles of Paul Williams were three	14:48
11			months later.	
12			MR. McGARRY: Yes, they were, April/May 2014.	
13	592	Q.	You then say:	
14				
15			"The Commissioner told me this as a matter of fact."	14:49
16				
17			And there is a reference to:	
18				
19			"No attempt to smear Sergeant McCabe's reputation."	
20				14:49
21			He told you that there was no attempt to smear Sergeant	
22			McCabe's reputation in that conversation or in a	
23			conversation around that time?	
24		Α.	That's not what I have said, I don't think. Let me	
25			have a look at it there.	14:49
26	593	Q.	Okay. You say:	
27				
28			"The DPP had directed no prosecution as there is no	
29			case to answer. The then-Commissioner told me this in	

- 1 a matter-of-fact way."
- 2 A. Yeah, sorry.
- 3 594 Q. "He never suggested that the allegations were true."
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 595 Q. "And there was no attempt to smear Sergeant McCabe's 14:49 reputation."
- 7 A. Sorry, maybe it's the way I phrased it, but what I meant there was, the Commissioner told me about the
- 9 allegations, he told me about them in a matter-of-fact 10 way, and then, separately, he never suggested that it

14 · 49

14:50

- 11 was anything other than that, there was no attempt to
- smear him. It may be just the way it was written
- there. But, sorry, do you understand what I am saying?
- 14 596 Q. Well, just to be clear, are you suggesting that the
- reference to "no attempt to smear Sergeant McCabe's
- 16 reputation" is your insert, having regard to the terms
- of reference of the Tribunal now, or is it something
- that arose at the time in the conversation between you
- 19 and the then-Commissioner?
- 20 A. I'm not sure I fully understand where you're getting at.
- 22 597 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. What this is --
- 24 598 Q. You --
- 25 A. Sorry, if I can just say, and maybe then you can -- I
- don't know, maybe it'll be clearer. What I am saying
- 27 here is, the Commissioner told me about what I
- described as the original allegations. He told me
- about that in a matter-of-fact way; in other words,

Т			arregation, investigation, rife to DPP, no case. And	
2			then I'm saying because I'm aware that the Tribunal is	
3			looking at allegations of a smear campaign, I am making	
4			it clear that he did not attempt, during the course of	
5			that conversation, to in any way smear Sergeant	14:50
6			McCabe's reputation. Is that	
7	599	Q.	So the reference to "no attempt to smear Sergeant	
8			McCabe's reputation" is a reference to his conversation	
9			with you only? In other words, that he didn't attempt,	
10			in his conversation with you, to do down Sergeant	14:51
11			McCabe?	
12		Α.	Yes, that's what I am saying.	
13	600	Q.	Okay. And then you say at the start of the next	
14			page, you say:	
15				14:51
16			"The then-Commissioner told me about his meeting with	
17			the then-Chairman of the PAC, John McGuinness, TD."	
18				
19			Do you see that?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:51
21	601	Q.	Okay. From reading the statement, it looks like this	
22			is all part of the same conversation?	
23		Α.	Ah, no, no, no. Well, it clearly wasn't, given the	
24			time-lines.	
25	602	Q.	Sure. And did I understand your evidence earlier to be	14:51
26			that that is a reference to the discussions that	
27			Mr. McGuinness had with Mr. Callinan at the or on the	
28			margins of the PAC?	
29		Α.	No. no. no. What I was referring to was. I think it	

1 was actually -- it was actually something in relation, 2 some comment that -- or something that Mr. McGuinness had said during the course of the hearing, I think 3 Mr. McGuinness had said something about, you know, if 4 5 this was the way, if I was looking at this in another 14:52 way, I think the way to deal with it is to sit down and 6 7 talk it through, or whatever. That's what that is. 8 It's not -- this isn't a reference to the conversation, 9 any conversation that might have taken place after the hearing. 10 14 · 52 11 603 Q. Well, can we just examine this in a little bit more 12 detail, Mr. Purcell. You say there: 13 14 "The then-Commissioner told me about his meeting with 15 the then-Chairman. My recollection is he told me that 14:52 16 he spoke to him regarding concerns about sensitive data..." 17 18 19 And so on. 20 That's referring to the meeting that happened Α. 14:52 the day after the --21 22 The car park meeting? 604 Q. 23 Yeah. Α. 24 It's just that you don't say that you knew that 605 I see. Ο. 25 he was going to have the meeting in the car park the 14:52 26 following day? 27 I didn't know it was going to be in a car park. Α. 28 606 Okay. Q.

But I knew, as I've said to Mr. McGuinness, I knew that

29

Α.

- this was going to take place, or at least the
- 2 Commissioner intended that it would, at the point he
- 3 spoke to me.
- 4 607 Q. I see. So that's not a reference to, as you suggested
- a moment ago, a discussion at the PAC about something

14:53

14:53

14:54

14.54

- 6 that Mr. McGuinness was saying was a possibility, that
- 7 the -- the data issue, and so on?
- 8 A. Other than, as I said, something that Mr. McGuinness
- 9 said during the course of the hearing, not the
- 10 aftermath of the hearing.
- 11 608 Q. So you knew that Commissioner Callinan was going to
- have a separate meeting, for want of a better word,
- with Mr. McGuinness the following day?
- 14 A. Yes, yeah, or I knew he intended to.
- 15 609 Q. Well, it's more than that, isn't it, because you knew
- sometime afterwards that he had had the meeting --
- 17 A. Yes, I know.
- 18 610 Q. -- if you look at the text?
- 19 A. It was confirmed it took place then by the conversation
- I would have had when he told me. But at the time.
- look, yeah, I knew he was going to have a meeting and,
- you know, he told me about it afterwards.
- 23 611 Q. Well, just look at page 1686 for a moment, please.
- 24 These are the text messages.
- 25 A. Yeah.
- 26 612 Q. This is the following day. The last one there you will
- see at quarter to six on the 24th.
- 28 A. Yeah.
- 29 613 Q. This is you saying:

1				
2			"Martin, know you're on route to Dundalk. Call me if	
3			possible. Just wondering how you got on with JMcG."	
4				
5			That is a reference, I think, to Mr. McGuinness, isn't	14:54
6			it?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	614	Q.	Well, I'm suggesting to you that the conversation that	
9			you had about the meeting must have happened after this	
10			text message?	14:54
11		Α.	Yes, the conversation I would have had about what	
12			happened at the meeting would have taken place after,	
13			obviously, or I wouldn't be saying, what happened?	
14	615	Q.	So you knew that he was planning to have a separate	
15			meeting with Mr. McGuinness, isn't that right,	14:55
16			beforehand?	
17		Α.	I thought I've already sorry, I thought I've already	
18			said that and I thought I made that clear in terms of	
19			the questions that Mr. McGuinness put to me.	
20	616	Q.	Did you tell anybody else about the fact that he was	14:55
21			either going to have the meeting or that he did have	
22			the meeting?	
23		Α.	At the time, not that I can recall. I don't think so.	
24			I don't recall having the conversation with anyone	
25			else.	14:55
26	617	Q.	You didn't tell the Minister about it at the time?	
27		Α.	I don't recall having the conversation. I would	
28			have I would have sorry, no, answering your	
29			question, I don't recall having the conversation.	

- Okay. And when was then the first time that you became aware that detail of the meeting was in the public domain?
- Oh, not until -- as I said there earlier, I'd forgotten 4 Α. 5 entirely about that, you know, that particular meeting, 14:55 and it wasn't until, I don't know, some -- it was a 6 7 couple of years later, I think, that something came out 8 about it, but don't ask me when exactly, but, as I said, I had actually forgotten all about that meeting, 9 10 and it was only when it subsequently appeared in the 14:56 11 public domain, that was the next thing.
- 12 619 Q. Well, it was in the public domain reasonably quickly
  13 after that, because Mr. McGuinness made a statement in
  14 the Dáil about it.
- 15 A. When was that?
  16 CHAIRMAN: That was 2016.

- 17 MR. McGARRY: That was in 2016.
- 18 A. Well, that's two years later.
- 19 620 Q. Yes. And when you -- did you consciously decide not to
  20 say anything to Minister Shatter about it at the time? 14:56
- No, I don't actual recall thinking about it all that 21 Α. 22 I would have -- I would have generally, during 23 the course of my career, particularly in the latter 24 stages when I was the head of the prison service, when 25 I was at senior management positions in the prison service and in the Department, I would have -- on quite 26 27 a few occasions, politicians would have contacted me 28 about various, various issues, ministers, deputies, 29 senators, from all parties, and I would have always

1			regarded the conversations I had with them as	
2			confidential, that is just the way I operated, and I	
3			wouldn't have told people about them. So, you know, I	
4			would have taken I would have taken the same view.	
5			Now, I haven't given it a great deal of thought since	14:57
6			then. But that is the way I always operated. As I	
7			said, I would have, often enough, got phone calls from	
8			deputies, ministers, senators, about issues that they	
9			would have looked to speak to me about, and I spoke	
10			to I would have spoken to them about it, but I	14:57
11			always would have treated those conversations as	
12			confidential between them and me.	
13	621	Q.	Even though this was an issue with which you weren't	
14			talking to your own Minister, you were talking to the	
15			Garda Commissioner?	14:58
16		Α.	The Garda Commissioner told me about it. I don't	
17			recall talking to one thing perhaps, you know,	
18			when five years, four years on from it, people	
19			may well, some people may have forgotten about how	
20			the whole thing was things one thing was going	14:58
21			very quickly to another, and my when I looked at the	
22			time-lines of this, very soon after this we found	
23			ourselves embroiled with the whole issue with the	
24			confidential recipient, and I think even when that was	
25			going on, that whole farce about the bugging of GSOC	14:58
26			erupted and we were sort of we were absolutely	
27			submerged in that, and they were the circumstances.	
28			So	

29 622 Q. Just look at the previous text on the same page there.

1			This is, you said, immediately or not long after the	
2			hearing of the PAC.	
3		Α.	Sorry, which text is this?	
4	623	Q.	It is just the penultimate one on the same page at	
5			15:02, do you see that?	14:59
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	624	Q.	"Well done, exceptional performance under fire.	
8			Brian."	
9				
10			Do you see that?	14:59
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	625	Q.	And I think you said in your evidence that you didn't	
13			follow the lengthy evidence that had been given by the	
14			Commissioner?	
15		Α.	I didn't no, what I said was, I wouldn't have	14:59
16			followed it all. I would have followed some of it. I	
17			knew from the tone of what I had seen that the	
18			Commissioner was having a tough time. I knew that he	
19			had been in there for five hours. It's only people who	
20			have actually experienced that particular experience, I	14:59
21			have done it myself, you're on the floor for five	
22			hours, you're being buffeted and pummeled with	
23			questions from all sides. Every single other person at	
24			the Committee, members come and go as they wish, they	
25			ask questions for a few minutes and then they sit back,	15:00
26			then they come again, the chairman does what the	
27			chairman	
28			CHAIRMAN: I do get the picture.	
29		Α.	Yeah.	

			Chairman. And, you know, obviously they have then way	
2			of investigating things, and it seems to be a bit	
3			quicker than this, at least it has that advantage.	
4		Α.	I suppose the point, to get to the point I'm making,	
5			Judge, is that I knew the Commissioner, on the basis of	15:0
6			what I did know, that had a pretty tough time of it in	
7			there, and really this was an expression of solidarity,	
8			you know, well done, it's over and done with. That's	
9			what it was, no more no less.	
10	626	Q.	MR. McGARRY: So it wasn't necessarily your view that	15:0
11			the performance had been exceptional; you were more	
12			trying to be supportive?	
13		Α.	Well, I think when you've gone through that five-year	
14			run or, sorry, Jesus, it's only five hours but it	
15			seems like five years.	15:0
16			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. Purcell, I really wish you'd try	
17			and restrain yourself. It's only you and one other	
18			witness who has managed to lapse into that, you know.	
19		Α.	I apologise, Judge, I apologise.	
20			CHAIRMAN: I'm not sure you would thank me for knowing	15:0
21			who the other person was.	
22		Α.	I apologise. Yes. As I said, it's really just an	
23			expression of solidarity and, you know, look, you've	
24			had a tough time you've had a tough time in there,	
25			well done. No more, no less.	15:0
26	627	Q.	MR. McGARRY: Around that time, and over the subsequent	
27			weeks, would you agree with me that Commissioner	
28			Callinan appears to have exhibited an unhappiness with,	
29			in particular, Sergeant McCabe?	

Т		Α.	At that PAC meeting, and this is something that seems	
2			to have disappeared or was not generally well-covered,	
3			the then-Commissioner actually clarified what he meant	
4			during the course of the hearing itself. He also would	
5			have, during the course of that hearing, set out his	15:02
6			views in terms of, you know, whistleblowers and the	
7			service they provide and the fact that they should be	
8			supported. I can't remember the exact words, but that	
9			is the general tone of it. That didn't alter the fact	
10			that he had the serious concerns that I adverted to	15:02
11			earlier on and it didn't alter the fact that I had	
12			those concerns myself.	
13	628	Q.	Well, just look at the next page, there's three texts	
14			there in relation to	
15			CHAIRMAN: There's about 14 pages of these, I think,	15:02
16			Mr. McGarry.	
17			MR. McGARRY: 1687.	
18		Α.	Yes, I see it there.	
19	629	Q.	Just, there are three texts there in relation to people	
20			supporting McCabe at a or outside Mullingar station,	15:02
21			do you see that?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	630	Q.	And then you say at 21:06 to the Commissioner:	
24				
25			"You can judge a man by his friends."	15:03
26				
27			And the Commissioner says:	
28				
29			"Some shower, Brian."	

1 A. Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

CHAIRMAN: Indeed I read this. And, you know, this apparently was a protest meeting, and I'm not taking any view one way or the other.

MR. McGARRY: Sure.

CHAIRMAN: But I have expressed the view, I think more than once, that you're entitled to go into the restaurant off the State apartments in Dublin Castle and complain about me billy-o if you like, Mr. McGarry, and indeed anybody else, and I personally think that's 15:03 great, no problem at all whatsoever about it, and I take the same view about this. It's a private conversation. I'm not sure what you can make of it, but if you want to try and make something of it, then please do.

15:03

I wonder, Judge, could I just say something on that? Α. This wasn't, despite the way it looks, it wasn't actually a swipe at Sergeant McCabe. It was a swipe at the then-TD who was mentioned in the text who --CHAIRMAN: No, well, again, I would really prefer -- I look at my terms of reference and I say, what do I have to investigate? Now, I'm going to be very tiresome and I am not going to read them all out, but I'm not looking to see whether people were, for instance, expressing appropriate solidarity, were maybe going a 15:04 bit over the top in expressing appropriate solidarity, were not expressing appropriate solidarity, because I'm not asked to do that. If I were to do that, it would effectively be writing kind of an opinion piece for a

1			newspaper.	
2		Α.	I understand.	
3			CHAIRMAN: And I don't want to go there, and it's not	
4			appropriate I should.	
5		Α.	I understand.	15:04
6			CHAIRMAN: I'm sure all of the people mentioned there	
7			are well meaning and very decent people. That's my	
8			view. But I'm a well meaning, I hope, and decent	
9			person, but I can get things wrong and they might get	
10			things wrong or they might get things superbly right.	15:04
11			I have no view on it and don't want to express a view.	
12	631	Q.	MR. McGARRY: Just on a different issue, Mr. Purcell,	
13			did you favour the re-opening of the investigation of	
14			the Ms. D allegation as she was requesting?	
15		Α.	Did I favour the re-opening?	15:05
16	632	Q.	Yes.	
17		Α.	It wasn't something that I was ever involved with.	
18	633	Q.	You were aware that the department was, with the	
19			Gardaí, looking into a number of cases and that this	
20			was one of those cases, isn't that right?	15:05
21		Α.	Yeah. I mean, the timing of that I think was around	
22			the time when, it was around the time of when the	
23			Toland report appeared and I asked to be moved to	
24			another position in the public service. I was on leave	
25			for a month after that, and then I came back and I did	15:05
26			one month before I left the Department of Justice and	
27			that month was almost entirely taken up with the	
28			estimates process and I had, my recollection is that I	
29			had no involvement in that particular thing, particular	

Т			issue at the time at air.	
2	634	Q.	Thank you Mr. Purcell.	
3				
4			WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS AS	
5			FOLLOWS:	15:05
6	635	Q.	MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, good afternoon,	
7			Mr. Purcell, Michael O'Higgins for	
8			Superintendent Taylor. I have a small number of	
9			questions for you and I am hoping to be completed	
10			within a few minutes. Can I just ask you to confirm I	15:06
11			have the correct impression, was it on the night of the	
12			23rd or the evening of the 23rd that you spoke with	
13			Commissioner Callinan in which he indicated that Deputy	
14			McGuinness had said something which might prompt him to	
15			think they could have a meeting, is that correct?	15:06
16		Α.	I think it was. I can't at this distance I can't be	
17			hundred percent sure, but given the fact that it was a	
18			relatively short timeline, I think that is when it was.	
19	636	Q.	That is your estimate?	
20		Α.	Yes.	15:06
21	637	Q.	And again, some time has passed, you think that the	
22			chink of light that the Commissioner saw was that	
23			Deputy McGuinness had said something or something to	
24			the effect, could you not resolve it by sitting down	
25			with him and working it through?	15:07
26		Α.	Yeah. Yes. Yeah.	
27	638	Q.	And your view of that was well, you're the man on the	
28			ground, maybe if that's what you think that would be	
29			you wouldn't be second guessing him, so to speak?	

1		Α.	Yeah. I think what I felt about it was that, look, if	
2			you think that if your interpretation of what	
3			happened at the PAC was that the Chairman seemed to be	
4			suggesting that there might be a way of dealing with	
5			this, that might remove the need for a public	15:07
6	639	Q.	Go for it?	
7		Α.	Yes. Look, who knows. Maybe it'll work.	
8	640	Q.	Now the question has been put whether it would be	
9			appropriate for the Commissioner to meet Deputy	
10			McGuinness. I'm not asking, I'm not interested in	15:07
11			asking a question whether it was appropriate. There	
12			are other parties who are interested in that. But what	
13			I would ask you, because it seems to me, staying away	
14			from a value word like appropriate, it would be a bit	
15			unusual, would it not?	15:08
16		Α.	Unusual to meet yeah, but yes, it probably would	
17			be unusual, but I suppose this was an unusual set of	
18			circumstances.	
19	641	Q.	Yes, okay. And I appreciate fully you're emphasising,	
20			and I appreciate why, I think, that the Commissioner	15:08
21			wasn't seeking your permission or he wasn't seeking	
22			your approval or your validation as such and I accept	
23			that, but he was, it seems to me, again if I have got	
24			this right, looking for your view on the matter?	
25		Α.	Yeah, I suppose, yes.	15:08
26	642	Q.	And he was looking for your view, again if I am correct	
27			in this assumption, in your capacity as secretary to	
28			the Garda division in the Department of Justice?	

29

A. As secretary general of the Department of Justice, yes.

- Secretary general. That is the capacity he was looking 1 643 Q. 2 for your view?
- 3 Yeah. He was looking for my view as secretary general Α. of the department. 4
- 5 644 And given that it's an unusual development, given that Q. 6 he was talking to you in your official capacity, why is 7 there not a memo of this?
- I wouldn't have kept memos of every conversation or 8 Α. indeed, I don't know whether I would have kept memos of 9 hardly any telephone conversations I would have had. 10 15:09 11 If I spent my time keeping memos, you know yourself, 12 Mr. O'Higgins, that if you write down a memo, you write 13 it down, then you're saying oh, is that exactly what I 14 said, oh well, is this -- - you end up, the telephone 15 conversation lasts two minutes and it takes you half an 15:10 16 hour to write down the note. No, I wouldn't have kept 17 memos of conversations I would have had, even the ones 18 that would have been perhaps unusual or whatever.
- 19 645 Well --Q.
- Now maybe other people would, but I didn't. 20 Α.
- 15:10 I hear what your answer is. You spoke to 21 646 All right. Q. 22 him afterwards, after he had the meeting, the following 23 day, and this is only my note, which I stress is not a 24 transcript, your recollection is that he had raised the 25 issues and in particular the issue about sitting down 15:10 and talking to him? 26
- 27 Α. Yeah, yeah. That he would sit and -- sitting down, 28 whatever, yes.
- 29 You have a recollection of the Commissioner saying 647 Q.

1			that, that Deputy McGuinness had suggested this to him?	
2		Α.	Oh no, no, no. No, no. Sorry, no. And it's	
3			probably if that is what your opinion was, I hope no	
4			one else would share that view. What I was saying, it	
5			wasn't that Deputy McGuinness was suggesting that	15:11
6			the Commissioner thought that whatever it was that	
7			Deputy McGuinness said, something to do, as I said,	
8			about sitting down	
9	648	Q.	Sitting down?	
10		Α.	and talking to an employee, you know the boss and	15:11
11			the employee, that the Commissioner saw that as perhaps	
12			well, you know, maybe this is the way this could be	
13			dealt with.	
14	649	Q.	Okay?	
15		Α.	It wasn't, he didn't say to me Deputy McGuinness was	15:11
16			suggesting we sit down and talk.	
17	650	Q.	well, I will ask the question maybe in a better way:	
18			Given that the sit down together was, what I am	
19			describing perhaps as the chink of light or catalyst	
20			for going to meet him, what part, if any, on your	15:11
21			understanding of what transpired at the meeting, had	
22			sitting down and talking to Sergeant McCabe played?	
23		Α.	My understanding of what he was saying to me was that	
24			this whole thing was, well, look maybe if I had an idea	
25			about how I would deal with Sergeant McCabe going	15:12
26			forward this might obviate the need to, or this might	
27			mean that we wouldn't have to have the public	
28			accounts you know, the public appearance at the	
29			Public Accounts Committee. And my concerns in relation	

1			to this are, as I've already indicated the whole thing	
2			about confidential information being out there, the	
3			risk involved at a public hearing of the Public	
4			Accounts Committee, that that in turn will create or	
5			you will run the risk of the same thing happening	15:12
6			again, the fact that in a disciplined force as the	
7			Commissioner of An Garda Síochána having you know a	
8			sergeant in there saying one thing and members of the	
9			Committee throwing in their tuppence worth, etcetera,	
10			etcetera, where is this going to leave me? This is, my	15:12
11			own view of this is it was the politicisation of	
12			perhaps operational issues, and what would this mean in	
13			terms of well, the next person who has a problem goes	
14			off and demands a hearing with the Public Accounts	
15			Committee, you have already set a precedent by doing	15:13
16			this, etcetera.	
17	651	Q.	Based on your recollection, if you have one, did the	
18			Commissioner tell what he had said to Deputy	
19			McGuinness?	
20		Α.	He told me in broad terms, at least I can only remember	15:13
21			it in general terms as I outlined to Mr. McGuinness.	
22	652	Q.	I want to ask you this: Is it your evidence, is it an	
23			actual recollection or do you think that is what must	
24			have been said?	
25		Α.	No, no, no. It's my recollection is that that's	15:13
26			what he said.	
27	653	Q.	And what did Deputy McGuinness say in reply?	
28		Α.	What did he say? I think what he said to me was that,	

he said it to him and, you know, he listened but

28

29

_			something along the lines of 1 didn't think I was	
2			getting an awful lot of traction on it, something like	
3			that. In other words, in other words, I don't think	
4			this is necessarily going anywhere, but it may have	
5			given him food for thought. I think it was that sort	15:14
6			of line that he used.	
7	654	Q.	Did he mention to you that he had taken up this line	
8			about sitting down and talking to him?	
9		Α.	Sorry, did he mention to me that he had taken up	
10	655	Q.	Given that the catalyst was that	15:14
11		Α.	Yeah, I think he mentioned to me that, look, there's	
12			he had said to the deputy, look, there may be a way of	
13			dealing with this and I have an idea about appointing a	
14			superintendent, or something. But to be honest, I	
15			don't actually remember the details of what he was	15:14
16			putting forward, other than he told me that he had put	
17			something to the deputy that might be, you know, a	
18			solution to this. Or that he hoped might be part of a	
19			solution.	
20	656	Q.	And you have no notes of any of this.	15:14
21		Α.	Of the conversation, I refer to my previous answer in	
22			relation to that.	
23	657	Q.	Thank you very much.	
24				
25			WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE AS FOLLOWS:	15:15
26	658	Q.	MR. LEHANE: Mr. Chairman, I have some questions on	
27			behalf of Deputy McGuinness. Good afternoon,	
28			Mr. Purcell, my name is Darren Lehane and I appear for	
29			behalf of Deputy McGuinness.	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 659 Q. I have a few questions for you. I'm going to try and
- avoid repeating ground that has already been traversed.
- 4 You're here to give evidence in relation to term of
- 5 reference [1] of this Tribunal. And I suppose that
- 6 involves four issues: One, did this meeting in the car

15:15

15:15

15:16

- park take place? Secondly, what were the circumstances
- 8 that gave rise to that meeting? Thirdly, what was the
- 9 purpose of that meeting? And finally, what were the
- 10 matters discussed at the meeting? Isn't that right?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 660 Q. And you provided a statement in the form of a
- handwritten letter to the Tribunal, isn't that right?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 661 Q. And notwithstanding the fact that the Tribunal has
- broken down the relevant part of term of reference [1]
- 17 that we are all here about, there is nothing about any
- of those four matters in your statement, isn't that
- 19 right?
- 20 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Lehane, just tell me, what are the four
- 21 matters?
- 22 662 Q. MR. LEHANE: Sorry, the four matters again. In your
- 23 statement to the Tribunal you don't address the meeting
- in the car park, isn't that right?
- 25 A. Other than -- do I not say what the Commissioner told
- me had been said at the meeting?
- 27 663 Q. So you're saying that that statement in your -- that
- reference in your statement to what you say the
- 29 Commissioner told you, where he says, it's on page 3, I

1			think, "the then-Commissioner told me about his meeting	
2			with the then-Chairman of the PAC, John McGuinness, TD"	
3			you're saying that that reference is in relation to the	
4			car park, meeting in the car park?	
5		Α.	Sorry, if you can just tell me which page.	15:16
6	664	Q.	It's on the third page.	
7		Α.	What is the page number?	
8	665	Q.	It's page 1682.	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	666	Q.	You see at the top of the page on page 1682	15:16
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	667	Q.	you say: "The then-Commissioner told me about his	
13			meeting with the then-Chairman of the PAC, John	
14			McGuinness, TD. My recollection is that he told me	
15			that he spoke to him regarding his concerns that	15:17
16			sensitive data containing personal details had been	
17			on the Garda system."	
18				
19			Etcetera, right? Is your evidence now, because I must	
20			have taken you up incorrectly, your evidence is that	15:17
21			that reference in your statement is to the meeting in	
22			the car park and not to the conversation that you say	
23			you had with Deputy McGuinness on the 23rd?	
24		Α.	Yeah, that's but they're both, in a sense, if you	
25			like they're both the same, they cover both what was	15:17
26			said at the meeting but also what he would have said to	
27			me the night before.	
28	668	Q.	Okay. Just so I am crystal clear. That reference	
29			there relates to both the conversation of the 23rd	

Т		Α.	rean.	
2	669	Q.	January that you had with the Commissioner and then	
3			the conversation that you had with him on the 24th	
4			after the meeting?	
5		Α.	Yeah.	15:17
6	670	Q.	Is that right?	
7			CHAIRMAN: Just to be clear, as far as I can see there	
8			was nothing in relation to any alleged conversation on	
9			the 23rd that was reported back to Mr. Purcell, am I	
LO			right in thinking that?	15:18
L1		Α.	Sorry, in?	
L2			CHAIRMAN: You seem to have been in your office	
L3		Α.	Yes, sorry, yes.	
L4			CHAIRMAN: and nobody rang you up to say anything	
L5			like we discussed bees attacking cattle with the Garda	15:18
L6			Commissioner, I'm using that, I know it's ludicrous but	
L7			it was apparently there somewhere, or anything else to	
L8			do with Maurice McCabe before or after the PAC.	
L9		Α.	When he rang me on the evening of the 23rd?	
20			MR. LEHANE: Yes.	15:18
21			CHAIRMAN: Yeah.	
22			MR. LEHANE: That is the point; there is a conversation	
23			according to Mr. Purcell occurring on the night of the	
24			23rd.	
25			CHAIRMAN: Maybe you will help us in relation to that.	15:18
26			Do you see what Mr. Lehane is getting at?	
27		Α.	I thought I've already said that, I thought I've	
28			already covered that, the conversation I had on the	
29			night of the 23rd.	

1	671	Q.	MR. LEHANE: I know, but I am just trying to, on behalf	
2			of Mr. McGuinness because you will appreciate	
3			Mr. McGuinness has already given evidence to the	
4			Tribunal and as part of that process he was furnished	
5			with kind of statements and certain information in	15:18
6			advance and he was asked questions, and the first time	
7			that I on behalf of Mr. McGuinness is hearing about	
8			this conversation on the 23rd	
9		Α.	Yeah.	
10	672	Q.	is today from you. So it's news to me, I suppose is	15:19
11			probably the best way to put it.	
12		Α.	Sorry, I see what you are saying.	
13	673	Q.	So just that I am clear in my mind, if you can just	
14			outline the nature of that conversation that you had on	
15			the 23rd?	15:19
16		Α.	Have I already done that?	
17	674	Q.	I know, but I want you to tell me again.	
18			CHAIRMAN: I suppose what Mr. Lehane is asking you:	
19			Are we getting the two things mixed up?	
20		Α.	No.	15:19
21			CHAIRMAN: If I can be clear, and maybe it would help I	
22			suppose if I was clear about things, there was the PAC	
23			meeting and we all know it went on for a long time and	
24			we all know there was a word used that shouldn't have	
25			been used. Now, I'm not reporting as to whether how	15:19
26			bad that was or not, but apparently, some time that	
27			evening and it must have been after three o'clock in	
28			the afternoon, you spoke to the Garda Commissioner,	
29			just in the course, I suppose, of ordinary	

interactions, and then it would seem also that after
the meeting people keep saying it's the car park but
that is explained apparently by driving rain, it seems
a reasonable explanation as to why they didn't go into
the hotel, you had another conversation. So what
Mr. Lehane is trying to do is sort out the content of
each conversation insofar as you can remember both.

15:20

Isn't that fair, Mr. Lehane?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

MR. LEHANE: Yes, Chairman, thank you.

Yeah, and I suppose the content of both conversations Α. 15:20 was pretty much a before and after. The content of the conversation on the evening of the 23rd was look, this is what, this is what I am -- what I think I'm going to do, I'm going to -- this chink is there at least in terms of the Commissioner's interpretation of it. I'm 15:20 not for a moment saying that is what Deputy McGuinness was inferring or suggesting. But the conversation was opportunity here, I think, to maybe move this in a particular direction, my concerns are serious concerns about the confidentiality, the information being out 15:21 there, that's already happened, there's an increased risk of it happening in a public hearing and in addition to that, my position as Commissioner, I feel that there is a potential that my position in some way may be undermined by, if every member of the force who 15 · 21 feels they have an issue of concern is going in the direction of an appearance as a witness in a public session of the Public Accounts Committee what does that mean in terms of discipline in An Garda Síochána and

1			particularly in the event of it happening and then a	
2			precedent is now set. So that was the conversation the	
3			evening before and it was also then if you like, the	
4			conversation after the meeting was yeah, well, I said	
5			all this, he listened to what I had to say, I didn't	15:22
6			get any I got a sense that he knew what I was	
7			saying, but I didn't get any sense of traction, I don't	
8			have any great I don't have any great expectation	
9			now that there will be anything other than an	
10			appearance by Sergeant McCabe at the although I did,	15:22
11			you know but maybe it will give him food for	
12			thought.	
13	675	Q.	Okay.	
14		Α.	Does that make it	
15	676	Q.	Just staying with the first meeting. Do you agree it	15:22
16			would have been helpful if in your statement you'd kind	
17			of demarcated the two meetings, the two conversations?	
18		Α.	Perhaps, perhaps.	
19	677	Q.	Now, I think the man's name is Kevin Clarke from your	
20			department, he was the point man, if I can use that	15:22
21			expression, of your department at the PAC hearing,	
22			isn't that right??	
23		Α.	Yes, I think so.	
24	678	Q.	And just for my own reference, was he a principal	
25			officer or	15:22
26		Α.	He was a principal officer in the Garda division at the	
27			time.	
28	679	0.	Okay. And did you chart to Kevin Clarke after the	

conclusion of the PAC hearing that date?

29

- 1 A. No, I didn't.
- 2 680 Q. Okay. And did you keep Kevin Clarke in the loop, as it
- 3 were --
- 4 A. No, I didn't speak to Kevin Clarke at all either
- 5 before -- I wasn't actually aware that Kevin Clarke was 15:23
- 6 going to be at the PAC. I didn't speak to him after
- 7 the PAC and I didn't speak to him after about the
- 8 meeting.
- 9 681 Q. So he wasn't in any way --
- 10 A. No.
- 11 682 Q. -- aware of the fact that the Commissioner had rang on

15:23

15:23

15 · 24

- 12 the 23rd?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 683 Q. Okay, if we move forward a day now, if I may, to the
- 15 24th, and the second telephone conversation and again,
- 16 how did Commissioner Callinan contact you, if you
- 17 recall? We have seen -- sorry, if I just explain first
- before I ask you for an answer. We have seen in the
- 19 Tribunal thus far that the Tribunal legal team has been
- able to analyse telephone records of Commissioner
- 21 Callinan and other people to identify what calls were
- 22 made between what persons on what lines. Indeed, along
- the lines of the same exercise that was carried out in
- relation to your texts in the other investigation. So
- again, I think that Mr. Chairman your legal team will
- be able to extrapolate, I would have thought, from
- 27 Commissioner Callinan's telephone records any calls
- 28 made to Mr. Purcell.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: Well, it's possible, but I have looked at

_			this myseri and one of the things is that carrs from	
2			the department tend to come from a general number.	
3			MR. LEHANE: Very good.	
4			CHAIRMAN: And calls to the department may go to a	
5			general number and then be patched through to a	15:24
6			particular number.	
7			MR. LEHANE: I see. Very good.	
8			CHAIRMAN: So, no, there is not necessarily a record is	
9			the answer to that. Sometimes there is. And sometimes	
10			there is not.	15:24
11			MR. LEHANE: Okay.	
12	684	Q.	So in relation to the detail of what Commissioner	
13			Callinan said to you. And if we try and concentrate on	
14			what Commissioner Callinan was relaying to you about	
15			what Deputy McGuinness said to him. Can you just	15:25
16			again, just so I am crystal clear in my head, tell me	
17			what that was?	
18		Α.	Sure. As I have said, my recollection of it is that	
19			the Commissioner told me what he had told Deputy	
20			McGuinness and he said something along the lines of	15:25
21			yeah, he listened to what I had got to say, he didn't	
22			have I think he may have said something, he didn't	
23			have an awful lot to say about it himself but he	
24			listened to what I had he gave me you know it was	
25			along the lines of he gave me a fair hearing, he didn't	15:25
26			get any sense that Deputy McGuinness as Chairman of the	
27			PAC was going to go down the particular route that was	
28			being suggested by the Commissioner, but he felt, look,	
29			I gave it you know, I said I what I said I was going	

1 to say, I don't think it's going to get the result I 2 had hoped for, but I -- I think he may have used the 3 phrase, you know, it may give him food for thought or something like that. 4 5 685 Okay. And of course you were aware of this Q. 15:26 6 correspondence that was being drafted --7 I actually --Α. 8 686 -- in the Garda Commissioner --Q. 9 To be honest -- yeah, I know the correspondence you're Α. referring to, I've seen it in the papers. 10 15:26 11 actually recall seeing, you know, a draft of the letters that was there. I don't -- now it's quite 12 13 possible that during the course of it -- I think all 14 right that during the course of the conversation he was 15 talking in general terms about trying to set up a 15:26 16 mechanism by which they would engage with Sergeant 17 McCabe, but he never, he never -- I never saw the draft 18 letters that I saw when I got the documentation from 19 the Tribunal. And you know the, you're aware of what Deputy 20 687 Q. 15:26 McGuinness's evidence is to the Tribunal in relation to 21 22 what is said at that meeting, are you, Mr. Purcell? 23 Yes, I think so, yes. Α. 24 Do you have any recollection of Mr. Callinan in the 688 Q. 25 second phone call saying anything to you about him 15.27 26 imparting information or making an allegation of sexual 27 abuse? He most definitely didn't. 28 Α. 29 689 Thank you very much Mr. Purcell. Ο.

1				
2			MR. DIGNAM: No questions Chairman.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Nothing.	
4				
5			WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS AS FOLLOWS:	15:27
6	690	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Could I ask you Mr. Purcell just to	
7			look at page 1684? These are, as it were, in-house	
8			emails relating to the text from your phone, and you	
9			kept these texts on your phone, you didn't ever attempt	
10			to delete them or conceal them?	15:27
11		Α.	No. No. They would have gone, they would have gone	
12			forward to the Fennelly Commission.	
13	691	Q.	And they were being sought in the context of intended	
14			cooperation with the Fennelly Commission at an early	
15			stage even in August of 2014, isn't that correct?	15:28
16		Α.	I think so, yes.	
17	692	Q.	And that was at a stage obviously much earlier than May	
18			2016 when the first public revelations about the car	
19			park took place, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	Yes, yeah.	15:28
21	693	Q.	And these ones that we have looked at, the four in	
22			particular between the 22nd and the 24th, they're	
23			amongst many hundreds of ones that were on your phone,	
24			a myriad of issues, the texts to and from the	
25			Commissioner, between yourself and the Commissioner,	15:28
26			isn't that right?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	694	Q.	And you're, I think, perhaps being implicitly	
29			criticised for not keeping a note of the telephone	

_			carrs, but you had arr your texts with the commissioner	
2			and they were made available to the Fennelly Commission	
3			and then these four particular ones to this Tribunal?	
4		Α.	Yes, yeah.	
5	695	Q.	You had referred obviously in the context of your	15:29
6			conversation with the Commissioner about the signal	
7			that he thought he was getting from the Chairman during	
8			the course of the hearing of the proceedings, and could	
9			I ask you to look at page 1351 in Volume 5?	
10		Α.	Sorry, Volume 5?	15:29
11	696	Q.	Yes. 1351. Obviously the Public Accounts Committee	
12			does its business by allowing each of the members to	
13			ask questions of the witness and this is at a stage	
14			where it's the Chairman who is asking questions of	
15			Commissioner Callinan. But in the fourth substantive	15:30
16			paragraph down there, he's referring to some of the	
17			Commissioner's answer there, he says:	
18				
19			"I'm not saying these things to embarrass the	
20			Commissioner or the Gardaí in any way. I'm simply	15:30
21			saying that this is the type of information that is	
22			circulating around the Oireachtas. Would it not have	
23			been possible to bring in the two serving Garda before	
24			one of them retired and have a man-to-man discussion	
25			with them with regard to their duty, as they saw it, to	15:30
26			report what they considered wrongdoing and in some	
27			cases what was described as corruption under the	
28			definition we gave earlier? As proper members of the	
29			force willing to give this information they put their	

Т			jobs on the line. That is what happens to	
2			whistleblowers, they sometimes become the victim. Was	
3			it not possible within the force to create a situation	
4			where they were brought forward in order to give that	
5			information? They provided the information to the	15:30
6			committees of the Oireachtas because it was suggested	
7			that this was the proper way to do it. There is an	
8			issue here in terms of that the matter must be dealt	
9			with in some way, because it is damaging the reputation	
10			of the force and the people are wondering if what we	15:31
11			have heard is true or false. That is really what we	
12			are about here."	
13				
14			That appears to be the only passage where the Chairman	
15			was contemplating what would have been a better way to	15:31
16			go about addressing concerns.	
17		Α.	Yes, yeah.	
18	697	Q.	Does that resonate with what your recollection of the	
19			Commissioner said in any way?	
20		Α.	Yes. I mean, that is general what we are talking	15:31
21			about, yes.	
22	698	Q.	Okay. Thank you Mr. Purcell.	
23				
24			WITNESS WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN,	
25			AS FOLLOWS:	15:31
26	699	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Purcell, I just wanted to ask you a few	
27			things. You were concerned coming up to the PAC	
28			obviously about matters of principle and you know what	
29			the matters of principle were, disciplined force, the	

need to protect data and the responsibility of a data controller, all those kind of things, but fundamental to the whole thing did you have a view in relation to apparently there's supposed to be a system in relation to fixed charge penalties, that not being enforced, loss of revenue to the State, loss of discipline to motorists and basically a police force which is acting somewhat like a colander?

15:32

15:32

15:33

15:33

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Yes, I did have a view. Leaving aside the issues, you Α. know, of the confidential information getting out there, the view that I had was, it was based on, I suppose, a number of -- quite a significant number of allegations were made and I think in emails, in one particular email that Sergeant McCabe would have sent to Michael Flahive, I believe where Michael was saying, 15:32 look, you've made these allegations, Commissioner O'Mahony is carrying out an investigations, you know some of the things that you have alleged, even in an interim report, that Commissioner O'Mahony has been looking at them and they're not -- what he is finding out is certainly not in accordance with the allegations you're making. There was an issue as to whether or not the allegations made were correct. There was -- both in the interim report or the initial report, whatever it was called, and in the final report by Commissioner O'Mahony, there was, there appeared to me -- and I had no reason to doubt what Commissioner O'Mahony or Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony had come up with in the

report, he was an experienced investigator, he had been

1 formerly head of the Criminal Assets Bureau, etcetera. 2 Certainly a lot of the more serious allegations, such as, you know, fixing or terminating penalty points had 3 4 resulted indirectly or directly in deaths, etcetera, or 5 had contributed in some way, I can't remember, that he 15:33 had looked at all of them, they had been false. 6 7 had been a significant number of cases where a woman 8 who had four penalty points terminated it turned out when they looked at it, it was actually a Garda vehicle 9 with one digit different and when they looked at it 10 15:34 all -- and Michael Flahive in an email that he went to 11 12 Sergeant McCabe made it quite clear that, look, give 13 the report time, you know, to be concluded and --14 because like, there are some things there you have said 15 all along and you have said in your most recent email 15:34 16 that you fully stand over every bit of evidence and all the allegations made when it's patently clear that when 17 18 the investigation is being carried out that is not been 19 backed up. The issue in terms of lost revenue, I mean 20 there was always a discretion available there to the 15:34 Gardaí. 21 22 well, I mean the only aspect -- this is why CHAIRMAN: 23 I wanted to get on to this subject and just get a view 24 from you as to where things were going. I appreciate 25 all of that, but I'm taking the O'Higgins Commission as 15:34 being the last word on the subject. 26 27 Yes. Α.

28

29

700

Q.

Α.

Although --

CHAIRMAN: And the statistical analysis there --

Т	/01	Q.	CHAIRMAN: to put it military does not make nappy	
2			reading.	
3		Α.	Sorry, did Mr. O'Higgins look at the penalty points?	
4	702	Q.	CHAIRMAN: He looked at in relation to cancellation of	
5			notices, etcetera, etcetera and how it was done on a	15:35
6			statistical basis. And there's bar charts, etcetera.	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	703	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Let's not worry about the detail of that,	
9			all right.	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:35
11	704	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I know at the time the view was that the	
12			O'Mahony report has the last word on the matter. The	
13			discretion, now one of the things that was mentioned	
14			and it does stick in the mind, is this whole notion of	
15			were they telling you what the kind of thing that they	15:35
16			were going to come up with and say Gardaí have a	
17			discretion about this?	
18		Α.	well, I think the O'Mahony report actually does say	
19	705	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, no, forget about the O'Mahony report for	
20			a minute.	15:35
21		Α.	Sorry.	
22	706	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The Garda Commissioner or anyone in	
23			Headquarters telling you, coming up to the PAC, how do	

we justify this, in terms of a discretion?

I can't remember whether the conversation -- I don't

know whether the conversation would have taken place in

the immediate run up to the PAC, but I certainly know

that at some point it would have been said to me, you

know, there is this issue that Gardaí have discretion

15:36

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α.

1			in relation to how they would deal with the issues.	
2			They can you know, if someone makes an appeal or	
3			petitions to give a reason why a penalty point notice	
4			should be terminated that they have the discretion to	
5			consider the case and then act accordingly. And I	15:36
6			know, I'm not for a moment suggesting that, you know,	
7			in the aftermath of this, indeed the work done by, I	
8			suppose it was a combination of recommendations made by	
9			Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony, the Professional	
10			Standards Unit and subsequently the Garda	15:36
11			inspectorate	
12	707	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, I know all about that stuff. But, look,	
13			I mean, one of the things that was being brought up in	
14			Headquarters was the man whose cattle apparently were	
15			attacked by bees, and he is rushing, so, if you like,	15:37
16			it doesn't apply in those circumstances, no. That	
17			specifically mentioned in the course of notes. Were	
18			you being sold things like that as saying, look, it's	
19			very important	
20		Α.	I think I only saw the thing about the bees when the	15:37
21			final yeah, I have no recollection	
22	708	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Well, Mr. Purcell, the bees is something of	
23			a distraction.	
24		Α.	Sorry.	
25	709	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It really is something of a distraction.	15:37
26			What I am saying is, were they coming up with	
27		Α.	No, we didn't it was when we I think when we saw	
28			the interim report, we that gave an indication of,	

we've looked at these, certainly some of them on the

28

29

face of it, and I think what was being said quite 1 2 clearly, that when you actually look at it, that 3 Sergeant McCabe or indeed anyone else who was looking, who was looking at these, whatever they were getting 4 5 from the system, would not have had all the details 15:37 6 that you would actually get when you're having an 7 in-depth look at the cancellation of each individual 8 case, which Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony and his team were able to get. But it was only -- nobody was 9 ringing me up saying, Jesus -- sorry, sorry, apologies, 15:38 10 11 again. No one was ringing me up saying, we've come 12 across a number of cases, you know, that really blow 13 this out of the water. 14 710 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes, but the problem is, Mr. Purcell, I 15 mean, the Department of Justice can be kept in the dark 15:38 16 the same way as everybody else. Were you being kept in 17 the dark? 18 Well, look, I feel --Α. 19 711 CHAIRMAN: Because I suppose if you weren't being kept Q. 20 in the dark, you should have brought something to 15:38 light, so, in a way, it's a question that comes from a 21 22 double-edged sword? 23 You see, I have little doubt in -- given the nature of Α. the fixed charge processing system, the penalty points 24 25 system, as it was at the time, you were going to get 15:38 situations where, sometimes, Gardaí will show 26 27 discretion that perhaps when you look at it it might -and I think the then-Minister actually said that when 28 29 he got the report and he looked at some of the

1			instances, you know, it would cause raised eyebrows,	
2			and I remember the famous bees one, although I did have	
3			a conversation with a friend of mine with a farming	
4			background who described his response to me about	
5			that was, typical dub, you'd know nothing about the	15:39
6			impact something like that can happen and people seem	
7			to forget that farmers and people working on farms,	
8			it's the most dangerous occupation in the country, he	
9			said to me far more dangerous than being in the guards	
10			if you look at the number of deaths and serious	15:39
11			injuries. Anyway	
12	712	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Usually not from bee attacks?	
13		Α.	No. Anyway, but it can anyway, look I agree with	
14			you it's probably	
15	713	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Can I try and get us back on the subject a	15:39
16			little bit.	
17		Α.	Sure, yeah.	
18	714	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So if you were being told, look, there is a	
19			Garda discretion, if you're being told O'Mahony is	
20			right, the net result of that is, the person doing the	15:39
21			complaining must be a bit of a person who is taking an	
22			obsessive or wrong-headed view of matters, and that's	
23			putting it in polite terms. Now, was that said to you	
24			from Garda Headquarters? In other words, here we are	
25			again, it's another person complaining, they don't know	15:40
26			what they are talking about, we have looked into it,	
27			everything is hunky-dory, now it's the person, because	
28			the message is wrong?	
29		Α.	No.	

- The person giving the message has to be the 1 715 Q. CHAIRMAN: 2 person in the wrong? 3 Yeah, I know what you're --Α. 716 CHAIRMAN: Do you see what I am saying? 4 Ο. 5 I do see what you are saying. Α. 15:40 6 717 CHAIRMAN: All right. Q. 7 No, they weren't saying to me that, you know, the Α. person concerned is wrong there. What the report was 8 indicating was that it was showing that guite, you 9 know, far from being the case that every single 10 15:40 11 allegation was correct, a substantial number of them, 12 according to the information we were getting from 13 Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony's report, were not 14 correct, and there were all sorts of examples. 15 718 CHAIRMAN: No, and I appreciate that, but you're not Q. 15:41 16 really answering the question, Mr. Purcell. Maybe I'm putting it wrongly, so let me ask it again. The point 17 18 of this is: If someone makes allegations and the 19 official information indicates that they are wrong, 20 what I am asking you is, what is the emotional reaction 15:41
- 23 I think, I mean the reaction, I said it earlier on, I Α. 24 wasn't interested in what motivated Sergeant McCabe; I was interested in the facts. As far as I was 25 15 · 41 concerned, the facts were that he had done the Gardaí a 26 27 service by bringing this out. It's not something that 28 is going to be all that popular, I can understand, I can understand that, the whole --29

in Headquarters, what are they saying about that

person? That is what I am asking you.

21

22

1	CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, I'm not asking you about your
2	reaction, Mr. Purcell. I'm asking you about the Garda
3	reaction, Headquarters' reaction, that is what I am
4	asking you about, trying to ask you about for the last
5	five minutes.

15:41

A. Okay. I'm sorry, then, if I am not giving you the answer. Well, is the answer -- what I'm going to say is that there was -- they did accept that, you know, this was pointing out flaws in the system. Both the assistant commissioner's report and the Professional Standards Unit pointed to things that had to be done. There was a view that a lot of the allegations were not correct, but the process of looking at the allegations had outlined that there were flaws in the way that the system operated and that those flaws would have to be

15:42

15:42

15 · 43

15 · 42

dealt with.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

24

17 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Purcell, I'm not going to choose the 719 Q. 18 right word, I'm know I'm not going to choose the right 19 word, but in your conversations with the Garda 20 Commissioner, or anybody else high up in the Headquarters, were they saying that Maurice McCabe was 21 22 anything akin to a madman, someone who had no grounds 23 for saying anything?

A. No, the word "madman" was never used.

25 720 Q. CHAIRMAN: I know that, and I thought you would focus
26 in on that and give me that answer. What I am talking
27 about it, emotions are things that happen to people;
28 did you get an emotional charge in your conversations
29 with the Commissioner as to his attitude to Maurice

- 1 McCabe, that is what I am asking, and if you did get an 2 idea of an emotional charge, what was it?
- 3 Α. If there was any emotional charge, if that is the correct description, it was, you know, that the 4 5 Commissioner was unhappy because of the concerns he 15:43 6 shared, he shared with me, that I have outlined 7 already, and I won't repeat them there, and it was that 8 that he was concerned with. He wasn't -- it was the impact of that on the force and in terms of the route 9 that was taken by Sergeant McCabe --

15 · 43

15 · 44

11 721 CHAIRMAN: I know that. Q.

10

- 12 -- in bringing these things out, he was concerned Α. 13 about, as I've said, the impact.
- 14 722 Q. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Purcell, I appreciate that. These are 15 all logical matters, but we're not necessarily dealing, 15:44 16 when you're dealing with human beings, in the realm of 17 what is logic, what is subjective. It is clear from 18 the texts that you exchanged, and as I said I have no 19 problems with them, that you had the kind of relationship with the Garda Commissioner which admitted 15:44 20 of frank views being expressed. Now, in terms of the 21 22 expression of any frank view in relation to Sergeant 23 McCabe, can you assist me on that?
- 24 well, you know, he would have said that he didn't -- he Α. 25 did not think that this was -- or rather, he wasn't 26 happy that allegations were being made that perhaps 27 wouldn't stand up to close scrutiny, he wasn't happy about the manner in which it had come in public, he 28 29 wasn't happy about the policitisation of it, and

1			neither was I. But in terms of anything else, he	
2			didn't, in his dealings with me, attempt to smear	
3			Sergeant McCabe's reputation. This was, as I said, it	
4			was about the facts, I didn't I wasn't and, look,	
5			I know I'm saying it's me, not what the Commissioner	15:45
6			said, but I wasn't interested in the motivations. I	
7			was concerned about what was happening. I was	
8			concerned about the impact of that on the force. I was	
9			concerned about the impact of that on the	
10			Commissioner's ability to do his job as Commissioner.	15:45
11			I was also very concerned about the way this was all	
12			playing out in the public eye, the politicisation of	
13			it, you know, and all the rest, they were my concerns.	
14			The Commissioner's concerns in relation to those issues	
15			were very much parallel to what I had as well, you	15:45
16			know, and he wasn't I suppose he wasn't happy about	
17			it, any more than would I have been happy about it if I	
18			was the Commissioner, and I dare say perhaps any more	
19			than anyone else would have been in that particular	
20			position.	15:45
21	723	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Purcell.	
22			MR. DIGNAM: Chairman, I have no questions for	
23			Mr. Purcell, but I wonder if I could just address one	
24			issue of fact, just in the hope that it is of	
25			assistance to the Tribunal. It was put to	15:46
26			Mr. Purcell sorry, he was referred to a passage in	
27			the PAC hearings where the Chairman was contemplating	
28			what would have been a better way to go about	
29			addressing concerns and it was as the Tribunal	

1		knows, it's quite a long PAC hearing and the transcript	
2		is quite lengthy, but it was suggested to Mr. Purcell	
3		that that was the only passage, and I just ask the	
4		Tribunal, in the course of its deliberations, to look	
5		at page 1412 onwards in the PAC hearings.	15:46
6		CHAIRMAN: You might summarise it for me, if you	
7		wouldn't mind, Mr. Dignam.	
8		MR. DIGNAM: Yes, in effect, that is the passage where	
9		the Chairman, Deputy McGuinness, is referring to, if he	
10		was an employer and an employee was having difficulties	15:46
11		or raising issues, he would sit down with the employer	
12		to thrash through them. That is it in a nutshell.	
13		CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
14		MR. DIGNAM: And that is one of the passages that	
15		former Commissioner Callinan referred to.	15:46
16		CHAIRMAN: That is one of the potential chinks.	
17	Α.	Yes. Indeed it was that one that rang the bell, the	
18		employer/employee relationship. So yes, that is the	
19		one I was actually thinking of, I think, initially.	
20		CHAIRMAN: Right. Thank you, Mr. Purcell.	15:47
21	Α.	Thanks, Chairman.	
22			
23		THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
24			
25		MR. MARRINAN: Sir, the next witness is a lengthy	15:47
26		witness. It may be better to start it in the morning.	
27		CHAIRMAN: Just tell me who it is, Mr. Marrinan.	
28		MR. MARRINAN: It's former private secretary to both	
29		commissioners Commissioner Callinan and Commissioner	

1	Nóirín O'Sullivan, Detective Superintendent Frank	
2	walsh.	
3	CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry we have not got to Mr. Walsh. If	
4	we finish him tomorrow so he is not stuck here until	
5	the next day, let's do that.	15:47
6	MR. MARRINAN: He is available tomorrow.	
7	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.	
8		
9	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL TUESDAY, 17TH APRIL	
10	2018 AT 10:00AM	15:48
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

				_
,	<b>1921</b> [1] - 1:10	44:5, 44:8, 53:20,	5	absolute [1] - 12:22
	<b>1972</b> [1] - 107:29	55:2, 57:23, 58:14,	<u> </u>	absolutely [25] - 8:9,
	<b>1979</b> [2] - 122:27,	58:23, 64:11, 95:12,		8:12, 47:29, 48:18,
<b>'17</b> [1] - 148:8	123:1	105:28, 156:16,	<b>5</b> [3] - 73:29, 179:9,	54:2, 57:11, 58:26,
<b>'79</b> [2] - 123:10,	<b>1985</b> [2] - 123:1,	156:17, 178:18	179:10	59:29, 60:26, 74:8,
123:11	123:14	<b>2017</b> [18] - 1:6, 1:10,	<b>51</b> [1] - 3:3	108:23, 109:20,
<b>'85</b> [2] - 123:10,	<b>1989</b> [1] - 38:1	33:17, 40:26, 42:4,	<b>56</b> [1] - 5:7	110:5, 110:21,
123:11	<b>1991</b> [1] - 123:15	44:11, 55:2, 70:17,	<b>568</b> [2] - 20:5, 20:17	110:22, 111:14,
<b>'91</b> [1] - 123:17	19th [6] - 14:18,	77:21, 79:26, 83:24,	<b>57</b> [1] - 5:8	113:26, 117:17,
'in' [1] - 141:29	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	85:8, 88:10, 116:10,	<b>570</b> [2] - 22:21, 22:22	119:11, 132:22,
'old [1] - 111:10	43:19, 66:29, 75:25,	122:24, 124:12,	<b>572</b> [1] - 26:27	134:16, 138:28,
'original [1] - 149:8	83:6, 85:12	147:13, 148:5	<b>59</b> [1] - 5:9	146:7, 146:27, 157:26
'Prime [1] - 83:16	<b>1st</b> [1] - 107:28	<b>2018</b> [4] - 1:18, 6:2,	<b>39</b> [1] - 3.9	abuse [28] - 11:12,
1 Time [1] = 00.10		83:14, 192:10	6	16:24, 17:9, 24:24,
4	<del>-</del> 2		6	27:2, 28:15, 34:4,
1		<b>20th</b> [3] - 78:23,		
	<b>2</b> [9] - 2:30, 3:18,	79:25, 147:13	<b>6</b> [7] - 3:6, 5:4, 6:20,	34:5, 34:20, 51:14,
<b>1</b> [1] - 3:7	3:21, 3:21, 3:25, 3:32,	<b>21</b> [1] - 2:30	94:10, 136:18, 147:8,	52:1, 61:5, 61:10,
<b>101</b> [1] - 5:19	4:4, 20:4, 92:22	<b>21:06</b> [1] - 160:23	147:9	62:26, 63:6, 63:9,
<b>103</b> [1] - 5:20	· · ·	<b>22nd</b> [7] - 33:17,	<b>60</b> [6] - 45:4, 45:6,	63:15, 80:7, 80:20,
<b>107</b> [1] - 5:23	<b>2001</b> [1] - 123:22	40:25, 42:3, 44:11,	45:7, 45:10, 45:15,	81:6, 81:14, 83:13,
<b>10:00AM</b> [1] - 192:10	<b>2002</b> [1] - 120:16	136:24, 139:20,	45:18	83:26, 115:19, 116:3,
118 [1] - 5:24	<b>2004</b> [1] - 123:24	178:22	<b>61</b> [1] - 45:11	117:7, 119:29, 177:27
	<b>2006</b> [9] - 9:11,	<b>23rd</b> [15] - 95:5,	<b>62</b> [5] - 45:3, 47:10,	<b>abuse"</b> [1] - 80:1
<b>12</b> [1] - 3:24	64:16, 68:9, 71:3,	106:1, 139:23,	47:11, 47:14	<b>abused</b> [4] - 20:10,
<b>122</b> [1] - 5:27	75:4, 86:7, 86:11,	163:12, 170:23,		24:24, 27:5, 45:25
<b>12th</b> [1] - 83:14	107:29, 108:10	170:29, 171:9,	<b>64</b> [2] - 5:12, 48:6	<b>abuser</b> [7] - 15:9,
<b>1351</b> [2] - 179:9,	<b>2007</b> [10] - 64:16,	171:19, 171:24,	<b>66</b> [1] - 1:18	16:22, 44:22, 52:22,
179:11	64:17, 64:18, 66:20,	171:29, 172:8,	_	55:6, 59:14, 62:10
<b>14</b> [1] - 160:15	66:28, 71:3, 78:26,	172:15, 173:12,	7	accept [6] - 68:27,
<b>1412</b> [1] - 191:5	86:12, 86:13, 109:4	175:12		77:17, 86:2, 86:3,
<b>1451</b> [1] - 94:10	<b>201</b> [1] - 47:16	<b>24</b> [3] - 45:16, 45:19,	<b>7</b> [3] - 2:12, 3:11,	164:22, 188:8
<b>1468</b> [1] - 70:21	<b>2011</b> [8] - 67:27,	45:20	3:14	accepting [1] - 84:25
<b>147</b> [1] - 5:28	94:18, 94:19, 94:23,	<b>24th</b> [6] - 95:6,	<b>77</b> [2] - 5:13, 5:14	access [2] - 75:5,
<b>14th</b> [3] - 70:16,	97:14, 107:27, 109:9,	106:9, 154:27, 171:3,	77 [2] 0.10, 0.14	91:16
73:13, 77:20	123:25	175:15, 178:22	8	accordance [1] -
<b>15</b> [1] - 100:12	<b>2013</b> [6] - 71:7,	<b>25</b> [1] - 108:3	0	181:21
<b>150</b> [1] - 30:17	125:26, 127:1,		_	according [2] -
<b>15:02</b> [1] - 158:5	149:29, 150:3, 150:7	3	<b>8</b> [2] - 2:20, 2:25	171:23, 187:12
15th [1] - 22:23	2013/2014" [1] -		<b>88</b> [1] - 5:15	accordingly [1] -
<b>16</b> [3] - 1:6, 48:7,	85:10			184:5
120:19	<b>2014</b> [51] - 1:4, 6:29,	<b>3</b> [3] - 72:16, 75:2,	9	account [5] - 8:10,
<b>163</b> [1] - 5:29	7:13, 10:29, 33:27,	169:29		61:21, 97:17, 97:23,
<b>1671</b> [1] - 6:21	35:14, 35:17, 35:25,	<b>30</b> [2] - 109:21,		127:21
<b>1674</b> [2] - 14:14,	35:27, 37:15, 38:24,	120:28	<b>94</b> [1] - 5:18	accounting [1] - 97:6
44:12	38:29, 39:5, 40:11,	<b>32</b> [1] - 2:12	9th [2] - 73:19, 86:6	Accounts [36] - 7:22,
<b>168</b> [1] - 5:30	40:24, 42:2, 43:5,	<b>33</b> [1] - 5:5		7:27, 8:3, 45:28,
<b>1680</b> [3] - 122:20,	43:9, 43:20, 43:26,	<b>37</b> [1] - 5:6	Α	46:13, 48:22, 94:20,
148:29, 149:4	44:1, 51:29, 53:25,	<b>37-42</b> [1] - 3:17		95:25, 95:28, 96:2,
<b>1682</b> [4] - 147:6,	55:2, 55:6, 58:9,	<b>38</b> [2] - 124:19,		96:9, 97:14, 97:21,
147:7, 170:8, 170:10	66:24, 67:1, 68:5,	125:10	aback [2] - 16:3,	97:29, 98:4, 99:27,
<b>1684</b> [1] - 178:7	69:23, 71:7, 75:25,	<b>39</b> [2] - 124:19,	16:15	100:15, 101:2, 101:3,
<b>1686</b> [3] - 136:15,	77:23, 78:26, 81:25,	125:10	abide [1] - 132:25	104:23, 105:12,
,	85:13, 85:22, 94:24,	3rd [3] - 26:28,	abiding [1] - 47:29	132:4, 132:7, 132:17,
136:20, 154:23	95:5, 95:6, 112:14,	124:5, 124:9	ability [3] - 97:22,	137:14, 137:17,
1687 [1] - 160:17	112:16, 124:3, 124:8,		101:7, 190:10	137:14, 137:17,
<b>16TH</b> [2] - 1:18, 6:1	124:10, 136:11,	4	able [7] - 26:21,	138:9, 139:4, 140:4,
<b>17</b> [2] - 1:10, 48:7	136:24, 146:20,		37:15, 72:10, 85:11,	166:29, 167:4,
<b>178</b> [1] - 5:31	150:12, 178:15		175:20, 175:26, 185:9	
<b>17TH</b> [1] - 192:9	<b>2014"</b> [1] - 80:12	<b>4</b> [2] - 3:3, 3:28	abnormal [1] - 98:25	167:14, 173:28,
<b>18</b> [1] - 3:13	<b>2016</b> [14] - 41:22,	<b>48</b> [1] - 41:8	above-named [1] -	179:11
<b>180</b> [1] - 5:32	,		1:27	accounts [5] - 8:18,
	•	•	•	•

	1	<del></del>	1	1
15:16, 51:4, 96:15,	adverse [2] - 9:20,	alerted [1] - 79:28	analyse [1] - 175:20	application [1] - 11:9
166:28	32:11	alerting [2] - 69:12,	analysis [1] - 182:28	<b>apply</b> [2] - 6:7,
accurately [2] - 17:3,	adversely [1] - 66:10	75:19	<b>AND</b> [3] - 1:4, 1:5,	184:16
27:12	adverted [1] - 160:10	alia [1] - 132:16	1:9	appointed [5] -
accusation [1] -	advice [7] - 64:20,	<b>ALISON</b> [2] - 2:18,	annoyed [1] - 12:25	19:11, 94:25, 123:21,
17:10	64:29, 65:1, 86:24,	3:12	<b>annual</b> [1] - 96:15	123:23, 123:25
accusations [1] -	96:8, 100:13, 114:6	allegation [28] -	Ansbacher[1] -	appointing [1] -
131:4	advices [1] - 81:16	9:10, 9:13, 13:5,	134:9	168:13
accuse [2] - 12:12,	advise [2] - 29:21,	16:23, 26:19, 28:14,	answer [19] - 25:13,	appointment [1] -
17:9	72:25	34:3, 34:4, 48:20,	26:17, 33:5, 40:5,	56:12
accused [1] - 51:14	advised [3] - 65:13,	51:7, 52:1, 52:18,	65:15, 76:18, 101:14,	appointments [1] -
achieve [1] - 101:5	69:8, 71:5	52:27, 52:28, 61:9,	112:8, 117:22,	56:13
achieved [1] - 96:13	adviser[1] - 114:28	69:3, 81:13, 82:10,	146:28, 150:29,	apposite [4] - 83:16,
acknowledgement	advocated [1] -	99:9, 99:11, 118:26,	165:21, 168:21,	83:18, 83:19, 92:12
[1] - 18:16	26:22	125:21, 126:13,	175:18, 176:9,	appreciate [11] -
act [4] - 8:7, 11:8,	<b>Affairs</b> [2] - 37:26,	149:2, 152:1, 162:14,	179:17, 188:7, 188:26	59:27, 62:14, 69:2,
95:29, 184:5	108:8	177:26, 187:11	answered [2] -	72:14, 121:28,
<b>ACT</b> [2] - 1:4, 1:9	affect [1] - 32:10	allegations [32] -	44:25, 108:25	164:19, 164:20,
Act [1] - 135:4	affected [1] - 32:13	7:18, 20:27, 23:2,	answering [3] - 91:2,	172:2, 182:24,
acted [1] - 14:5	affecting [1] - 66:10	27:5, 27:16, 34:20, 46:16, 46:18, 61:5,	155:28, 187:16	187:15, 189:14
acting [2] - 57:9,	<b>afford</b> [2] - 49:29,	79:29, 99:6, 99:16,	anxiety [1] - 20:3	appreciates [1] - 78:19
181:7	50:25	116:3, 126:6, 149:15,	anyhow [1] - 112:10	
action [8] - 1:28,	<b>afraid</b> [1] - 99:18	149:17, 149:18,	anyway [5] - 26:13,	appreciating [3] - 62:6, 89:2, 89:14
26:11, 29:2, 46:8,	<b>AFTER</b> [2] - 64:1,	149:22, 151:3, 151:9,	78:12, 186:11, 186:13	i i
48:28, 55:17, 138:19,	94:1	151:28, 152:3,	apart [1] - 69:23	appreciative [1] - 19:9
138:20	aftermath [6] - 9:26,	181:13, 181:16,	apartments [1] -	
actions [3] - 8:23,	10:6, 18:29, 42:5,	181:21, 181:23,	161:8	<b>approach</b> [3] - 25:27, 78:8, 142:24
32:13, 49:7	154:10, 184:7	182:2, 182:17,	apologies [1] - 185:10	approached [8] -
active [1] - 111:17	afternoon [6] -	187:18, 188:12,		71:2, 71:11, 77:22,
actor [1] - 8:15 actual [10] - 26:18,	100:9, 102:2, 139:25,	188:13, 189:26	apologise [5] - 81:20, 148:24,	78:10, 86:13, 91:19,
34:23, 52:12, 60:28,	163:6, 168:27, 172:28	allegations' [1] -	159:19, 159:22	91:21, 91:26
63:6, 97:28, 109:8,	<b>afterwards</b> [9] - 18:14, 19:6, 19:11,	149:8	appeal [1] - 184:2	appropriate [9] - 6:9,
129:16, 156:21,	95:16, 140:14,	alleged [15] - 10:18,	appear [16] - 37:5,	145:1, 161:25,
167:23	140:22, 154:16,	20:6, 20:22, 39:4,	47:18, 56:3, 97:7,	161:26, 161:27,
add [1] - 26:9	154:22, 165:22	52:20, 73:5, 73:26,	100:16, 102:19,	162:4, 164:9, 164:11,
added [1] - 109:12	agency [1] - 96:16	75:8, 80:7, 81:6, 87:5,	102:29, 103:27,	164:14
addition [2] - 7:4,	agenda [1] - 95:26	113:24, 146:9, 171:8,	105:5, 106:20,	appropriately [1] -
173:23	ago [3] - 126:22,	181:18	116:29, 137:13,	96:12
additional [3] - 9:2,	126:24, 154:5	allegedly [3] -	137:16, 137:21,	approval [2] -
31:10, 31:11	agree [10] - 43:13,	110:28, 115:22,	139:24, 168:28	144:10, 164:22
address [3] - 141:15,	50:11, 51:25, 55:12,	116:18	appearance [10] -	<b>APRIL</b> [3] - 1:18, 6:1,
169:23, 190:23	78:7, 119:4, 159:27,	alleging [1] - 23:5	8:20, 98:1, 98:3, 98:5,	192:9
addressed [1] -	174:15, 186:13	allowing [1] - 179:12	103:7, 132:7, 142:3,	April [7] - 22:15,
78:24	agreed [5] - 7:6, 7:8,	allude [1] - 59:16	166:28, 173:27,	22:23, 35:14, 35:25,
addressing [2] -	21:23, 22:29, 42:19	almost [7] - 86:7,	174:10	44:1, 51:29, 73:19
180:16, 190:29	agreeing [1] - 48:15	127:22, 130:21,	APPEARANCES[1] -	April/May [1] -
ADJOURNED [2] -	agreement [2] -	130:22, 137:20,	2:1	150:12
93:1, 192:9	22:26, 37:17	146:3, 162:27	appeared [12] -	Ardnacrusha [1] -
ADJOURNMENT [1]	<b>AGSI</b> [1] - 117:28	alone [2] - 24:16,	70:17, 85:9, 102:8,	110:10
- 64:1	ahead [2] - 136:21,	24:17	102:9, 102:12, 104:8,	area [4] - 66:10,
admitted [1] - 189:20	141:25	alter [2] - 160:9,	137:19, 139:11,	103:21, 103:22,
adopted [1] - 72:3	air [2] - 32:7, 142:11	160:11	139:15, 156:10,	124:15
advance [8] - 21:20,	airwaves [1] - 89:3	alternative [1] -	162:23, 181:26	areas [8] - 31:7,
22:1, 22:4, 23:18,	<b>akin</b> [1] - 188:22	50:13	appearing [11] -	34:13, 34:28, 35:3,
23:25, 24:11, 26:12,	<b>alarm</b> [1] - 55:7	ambiguity [1] - 81:21	7:19, 33:13, 55:29,	37:17, 82:17, 82:22,
172:6	albeit [1] - 17:1	amorphous [1] -	100:20, 102:16,	95:27
advanced [1] - 46:19	alert [8] - 68:29,	10:25	102:25, 103:9,	arena [2] - 34:15,
advantage [1] -	74:15, 74:19, 84:1,	amount [2] - 114:20,	106:22, 138:7,	91:15
159:3	84:10, 84:14, 84:15	114:21	138:22, 141:16	arise [1] - 137:29

arises [1] - 35:24 attached [6] - 24:11, 113:17, 115:6, 64:7, 94:6, 107:20, Billy [2] - 134:21 arising [6] - 8:19, 73:29, 108:5, 108:9, 115:25, 116:2, 116:6, 122:8 billy-o [1] - 161:9 30:28, 55:26, 56:5, 111:26, 111:27 116:7, 116:9, 116:12, been.. [1] - 170:16 bit [13] - 21:20, attacked [1] - 184:15 116:14, 125:19, 88:25, 131:16 **bees** [5] - 171:15, 24:11, 38:22, 62:22, 184:15, 184:20. 135:10, 138:25, **arm** [1] - 97:15 attacking [1] -105:1, 121:6, 153:11, 138:28, 139:3, 139:7, arms [1] - 100:25 171:15 184:22, 186:2 159:2, 161:26, 140:20, 140:21, beforehand [2] arose [2] - 119:4, attacks [1] - 186:12 164:14, 182:16, 141:1, 149:2, 149:8, attempt [13] - 75:14, 143:25, 155:16 186:16, 186:21 151:18 149:21, 149:29, beg [3] - 80:15, **BL** [11] - 2:7, 2:10, around" [1] - 79:20 84:7, 126:15, 150:19, 152:2, 156:2, 162:18, 150:21, 151:5, 115:12 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, **ARRAN**[3] - 2:12, 151:11, 151:15, 175:5, 175:11, 177:5, began [2] - 105:19, 2:28, 3:9, 3:12, 3:20, 3:10, 3:10 152:4, 152:7, 152:9, 177:20 105:23 arranged [2] - 67:6, awful [2] - 168:2, 178:9, 190:2 beginning [6] blamed [2] - 90:6, 133:13 176:23 64:16, 65:28, 94:10, attendance [1] -90.7 arrangement [1] -Aylward [2] - 123:28, 95:20 95:29, 123:8, 136:8 blew [2] - 71:7, 85:10 65:24 123:29 attention [9] - 14:19, behalf [13] - 6:10, blow [2] - 38:7, arrive [1] - 104:17 17:6, 20:23, 34:8, 33:13, 37:5, 37:7, 185:12 article [9] - 20:2, В 35:4, 35:19, 36:5, 56:4, 77:2, 103:27, blunder [1] - 121:23 21:24, 21:25, 22:7, 124:21, 124:29, 68:28. 100:26 22:18, 22:20, 26:26, blurt [1] - 17:14 attested [2] - 67:4, 168:27, 168:29, bluster [1] - 32:24 27:26, 59:13 backed [1] - 182:19 172:1, 172:7 90:23 Board [1] - 117:13 articles [6] - 20:6, background [4] -21:8, 24:10, 59:15, attitude [2] - 99:25, behaviour[1] - 45:24 **body** [1] - 148:13 95:24, 125:28, 126:5, 188:29 behest [1] - 59:9 149:21, 150:10 **bombshell** [1] - 58:8 186:4 behind [2] - 58:6, borrow [1] - 49:23 articulated [1] attracted [1] - 43:13 backing [1] - 60:9 attribute [1] - 10:13 105:17 19:23 boss [2] - 85:3, bad [2] - 62:11, audience [1] - 75:29 beings [1] - 189:16 **AS**[8] - 6:1, 64:2, 166:10 172:26 94:1, 94:7, 163:4, Auditor[1] - 96:14 **bell** [1] - 191:17 bother [1] - 111:19 bag [1] - 105:18 168:25, 178:5, 180:25 August [1] - 178:15 bells [1] - 55:7 bottom [4] - 47:16, Bailieboro [2] aside [1] - 181:9 AUGUSTUS [1] bench [1] - 56:15 148:29, 149:4, 149:6 64:21, 64:25 benefit [3] - 70:1, aspect [2] - 97:27, 3:13 BOUGHTON [1] -Banking [1] - 94:25 aunt [1] - 89:18 70:11, 84:16 182:22 3:20 bar [1] - 183:6 besmirch [1] - 90:15 aspects [1] - 98:6 aura [1] - 55:13 **BOW**[1] - 3:13 barking [1] - 60:9 assault [3] - 11:23, authorities [4] best [16] - 14:23, bows [1] - 85:1 **barristers** [1] - 30:15 12:6, 18:20, 117:12, 34:20, 42:12, 55:17, 99:6. 116:3 bread [1] - 128:7 BARROW [1] - 3:28 assaulted [1] - 20:27 118:27 66:5, 68:16, 68:29, break [3] - 63:23, Barry [1] - 108:8 71:6, 74:22, 95:9, asserting [1] - 88:14 **Authority** [1] - 10:5 92:28, 120:27 **BARTON** [1] - 3:16 96:7, 100:29, 101:4, authority [1] - 87:7 assertions [1] breakfast [1] - 113:6 based [3] - 135:18, 107:2, 143:27, 172:11 87:17 automatically [1] -**BREFFNI** [1] - 2:10 167:17, 181:11 better [6] - 71:14, assertive [1] - 15:18 BRETT [1] - 3:16 basis [10] - 17:20, 154:12. 166:17. avail [1] - 65:25 Assets [1] - 182:1 Brett [6] - 10:4, 56:7, 71:6, 96:13, 180:15, 190:28, assigned [4] - 67:22, available [10] -13:12, 13:13, 32:27, 96:17, 108:23, 191:26 67:23, 108:7, 114:21 19:21, 72:11, 100:29, 32:28, 55:15 121:18, 128:22, 136:2, 136:11, between [21] - 37:17, assist [4] - 54:1, Brian [4] - 122:6, 159:5, 183:6 136:13, 137:3, 179:2, 42:28, 51:28, 69:21, 66:5, 86:28, 189:23 140:27, 158:8, 160:29 bean [2] - 91:9 78:3, 84:20, 87:20, assistance [2] -182:20, 192:6 BRIAN [3] - 2:22, bear [1] - 53:3 102:6, 102:17, 54:24, 190:25 avoid [1] - 169:3 5:26, 122:8 became [19] - 7:29, 104:12, 105:8, 119:4, awaiting [1] - 21:2 assistant [5] bridge [1] - 53:21 9:24, 9:25, 20:2, 130:2, 136:5, 147:22, aware [68] - 8:26, 125:16, 131:17, brief [2] - 19:23, 29:26, 31:23, 41:23, 151:18, 157:12, 9:20, 9:24, 21:6, 181:28, 184:9, 188:10 103.21 41:24, 42:1, 73:12, 175:22, 178:22, 23:20, 29:26, 31:7, Assistant [3] - 127:9, **briefing** [2] - 31:17, 75:25, 95:9, 97:2, 178:25 185:8, 187:13 31:23, 32:5, 33:22, 31:27 99:10. 102:21. **Bewley's** [1] - 41:3 Association [1] -35:23, 35:29, 40:19, briefly [1] - 76:24 116:14, 132:3, 141:1, beyond [1] - 45:23 40:27, 40:29, 41:5, 111.17 bring [4] - 17:6, 156:1 biased [1] - 61:21 41:15, 41:19, 41:23,  $\textbf{assumed} \ [2] - 90:8,$ 96:25, 99:22, 179:23 beck [1] - 113:13 big [2] - 35:20, 41:25, 42:1, 73:12, 102:2 **bringing** [5] - 44:12, become [7] - 21:6, 110:10 75:7, 77:20, 81:2, assuming [1] - 134:9 89:16. 108:27. 95:8, 99:9, 116:6, 81:27, 82:2, 85:3, bigger [1] - 8:13 assumption [3] -187:27, 189:12 116:7, 116:9, 180:2 biggest [2] - 124:24, 86:10, 86:28, 95:2, 17:19, 51:19, 164:27 broached [2] - 78:10, bee [1] - 186:12 95:8, 95:9, 95:17, 128:2 AT [1] - 192:10 78:14 BEEN [5] - 6:15, 98:2, 99:9, 99:10, billy [1] - 161:9 attach [1] - 74:18 broad [1] - 167:20

broadcast [1] - 73:13 broken [1] - 169:16 brought [6] - 14:18, 20:21, 25:26, 180:4, 184:13, 185:20 buffeted [1] - 158:22 bugging [1] - 157:25 build [2] - 89:23, 142:27 Bureau [2] - 108:10, 182:1 BURNS [5] - 2:27, 5:5, 33:9, 33:11, 33:12 **Burns** [1] - 33:13 business [8] - 13:11, 69:11, 87:8, 105:22, 113:3, 114:12, 141:22, 179:12 Buswells [1] -133:13 busy [1] - 120:13 butter [1] - 128:7 button [1] - 33:1 **BY** [58] - 1:5, 1:8, 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:28, 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:13, 3:20, 3:23, 3:27, 3:30, 4:2, 5:4, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:9, 5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:15, 5:18, 5:19, 5:20, 5:23, 5:24, 5:27, 5:28, 5:29, 5:30, 5:31, 5:32, 6:16, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 64:8, 77:1, 77:13, 88:29, 94:7, 101:19, 103:24, 107:21, 118:18, 122:9, 147:2, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24

#### C

C&AG [1] - 96:15
cabinet [8] - 21:11,
23:11, 42:7, 42:13,
57:2, 58:27, 59:20,
61:15
Cabinet [3] - 38:17,
70:4, 70:25
Callinan [41] - 15:7,
15:19, 33:20, 33:21,
37:8, 41:3, 41:18,
44:19, 45:13, 46:29,
53:14, 53:24, 55:5,
56:27, 57:7, 57:12,
95:3, 101:24, 102:8,
102:12, 102:16,

103:2, 103:28, 105:25, 111:21, 127:18, 132:18, 146:19, 149:14, 152:27, 154:11, 159:28, 163:13, 175:16, 175:21, 176:13, 176:14, 177:24, 179:15, 191:15, 191:29 Callinan's [4] -43:11, 103:7, 105:29, 175:27 camp [1] - 91:20 campaign [13] -12:3, 12:8, 12:14, 13:4, 39:3, 39:4, 39:11, 39:20, 40:1, 40:4, 40:8, 146:23, 152:3 CANAL[1] - 3:18 cancellation [2] -183:4, 185:7 cancelled [2] -130:6, 130:20 candidates [1] -109:10 cannot [1] - 80:23 canteen [1] - 113:6 canvassed [4] -64:28, 103:29, 109:6, 109:24 capacity [4] - 68:3, 164:27, 165:1, 165:6

CAPEL[1] - 3:6 car [31] - 15:7, 16:4, 41:3, 44:20, 45:13, 48:11, 48:22, 53:24, 54:5, 54:11, 57:23, 95:5, 95:10, 105:26, 113:7, 113:8, 113:9, 113:10, 114:27, 114:29, 147:23, 153:22, 153:25, 153:27, 169:6, 169:24, 170:4, 170:22, 173:2, 178:18 career [7] - 37:18, 37:19, 64:10, 82:13, 122:21, 122:26, 156:23 careful [6] - 16:26, 28:15, 32:8, 69:13, 71:14 carefully [1] - 55:14 carriageway [1] -48:23

carried [3] - 131:17,

175:23, 182:18

carry [2] - 92:20,

113:3 carrying [1] - 181:17 cartage [1] - 77:2 CARTHAGE[1] -2:28 case [28] - 11:20. 20:26, 26:16, 26:17, 35:21, 46:10, 46:26, 48:20, 51:21, 52:10, 52:12, 91:18, 101:8, 101:9, 106:29, 126:10, 126:13, 126:16, 129:16, 145:29, 146:3, 146:4, 150:29, 152:1, 184:5, 185:8, 187:10 cases [10] - 20:22, 25:26, 30:17, 66:18, 96:4, 162:19, 162:20, 179:27, 182:7, 185:12 Castle [1] - 161:8 CASTLE [1] - 1:17 **catalogue** [1] - 11:16 catalyst [2] - 166:19, 168:10 cattle [2] - 171:15, 184:14 caused [2] - 17:5, 24:8 caution [1] - 51:26 cautiously [2] -50:29, 51:27 Cavan [2] - 26:5, 39:19 Cavan-Monaghan [2] - 26:5, 39:19 ceased [1] - 94:24 **CEO** [1] - 10:5 certain [11] - 18:18, 29:24, 37:5, 46:29. 66:16, 66:17, 72:8, 100:7, 121:14, 134:9, 172:5 **CERTAIN** [1] - 1:4 certainly [34] - 22:1, 32:29, 35:12, 42:12, 49:29, 61:18, 63:3, 69:10, 90:17, 98:8, 98:22, 106:17, 106:23, 110:27, 115:18, 115:24, 117:15, 117:21, 121:5, 122:13, 127:12, 128:14, 134:2, 139:19, 140:3, 140:7, 140:8, 140:21, 148:4, 181:21, 182:2, 183:27, 184:29 certainty [1] - 140:18 certify [1] - 1:25

cetera [1] - 109:24 chair [1] - 87:14 chairman [2] -158:26, 158:27 Chairman [50] - 6:4, 6:6, 6:17, 8:2, 8:8, 33:8, 33:9, 36:28, 36:29, 48:21, 55:26, 64:28, 76:22, 76:24, 89:7, 89:24, 90:17, 91:1, 92:25, 101:17, 103:21, 117:24, 117:26, 117:27, 118:14, 118:16, 122:5, 132:16, 134:16, 141:11, 145:2, 148:18, 152:17, 153:15, 163:6, 164:3, 168:26, 170:2, 170:13, 173:9, 175:25, 176:26, 178:2, 179:7, 179:14, 180:14, 190:22, 190:27, 191:9, 191:21 CHAIRMAN [136] -5:9, 5:15, 5:24, 5:32, 6:9, 6:13, 55:28, 57:14, 59:5, 59:6, 59:27, 60:1, 60:12, 60:15, 60:17, 60:20, 60:22, 60:27, 61:1, 61:9, 61:14, 61:27, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 62:18. 62:22. 63:3. 63:10. 63:15. 63:18. 63:23, 88:24, 88:26, 88:29, 89:2, 89:13, 89:26, 89:28, 90:13, 90:18, 90:25, 91:3, 91:12, 92:3, 92:14, 92:19, 92:28, 107:12, 117:28, 118:3, 118:6, 118.11 118.15 118:18, 118:20, 118:29, 119:7, 119:12, 119:15, 119:19, 120:2, 120:7, 120:11, 120:13, 120:19, 121:4, 121:8, 121:14, 121:22, 121:29, 122:13, 122:17, 122:19, 134:7, 134:13, 144:21, 150:10, 156:16, 158:28, 159:1, 159:16, 159:20, 160:15, 161:2, 161:6, 161:20, 162:3, 162:6, 169:20, 171:7, 171:12,

171:14, 171:21, 171:25, 172:18, 172:21, 175:29, 176:4, 176:8, 178:3, 180:24, 180:26, 182:22, 182:28, 183:1, 183:4, 183:8, 183:11, 183:19, 183:22, 184:12, 184:22, 184:25, 185:14, 185:19, 186:12, 186:15, 186:18, 187:1, 187:4, 187:6, 187:15, 188:1, 188:17, 188:25, 189:11, 189:14, 190:21, 191:6, 191:13, 191:16, 191:20, 191:27, 192:3. 192:7 challenging [1] -99.21 CHAMBERS [1] **chance** [1] - 100:29 change [1] - 118:22 chapter [1] - 32:27 character [11] - 53:7, 62:11, 67:4, 68:18, 68:21, 69:4, 69:14, 90:15, 90:23, 91:25, 96:21 charge [7] - 94:27, 125:16, 181:5, 185:24, 188:28, 189:2, 189:3 charged [3] - 46:21, 47:3. 47:7 CHARLES [1] - 2:23 Charleton [1] - 74:16 CHARLETON [2] -1:12, 2:2 CHARLTON [1] -3:24 chart [1] - 174:28 **charts** [1] - 183:6 chat [3] - 61:2, 113:18, 114:15 check [1] - 121:26 chef [8] - 21:11, 23:11, 42:6, 42:12, 57:1, 58:27, 59:20, 61:15 CHIEF [2] - 2:19, 2:23 chief [1] - 84:18 **child** [24] - 15:9, 16:22, 16:24, 17:9, 34:5, 44:22, 51:14,

52:22, 55:6, 59:14,

	1		1	1
61:5, 62:10, 62:26,	155:18, 170:28,	comment [5] - 9:24,	150:3, 150:15,	103:14, 104:10,
63:6, 63:9, 79:29,	171:7, 172:13,	42:8, 43:12, 49:2,	150:29, 151:8,	104:12, 104:23,
80:7, 80:20, 81:6,	172:21, 172:22,	153:2	151:19, 151:27,	105:2, 105:7, 105:9,
81:14, 83:13, 83:26,	176:16, 182:12,	commentary [9] -	152:16, 153:14,	105:12, 107:6, 132:4,
115:19, 119:29	182:17, 189:17	8:22, 9:21, 10:11,	154:2, 154:11,	132:7, 132:17,
Children [2] - 38:12,	clearer [1] - 151:26	43:14, 53:22, 55:16,	157:15, 157:16,	137:14, 137:17,
38:19	clearly [5] - 18:26,	57:26, 131:26, 132:11	158:14, 158:18,	137:20, 137:22,
children [4] - 68:24,	79:3, 87:19, 152:23,	comments [1] - 70:7	159:5, 159:27, 160:3,	138:9, 138:10,
80:24, 81:17, 92:10	185:2	Commerce [3] -	160:23, 160:27,	138:20, 139:4, 140:4,
chink [4] - 143:7,	clerk [3] - 107:6,	123:1, 123:3, 123:10	163:13, 163:22,	158:24, 166:29,
163:22, 166:19,	137:3, 138:10	Commission [16] -	164:9, 164:20,	167:4, 167:15,
173:14	client [4] - 56:23,	8:17, 29:1, 31:2,	165:29, 166:6,	173:28, 179:11
chinks [1] - 191:16	57:3, 84:16, 87:17	38:10, 38:18, 38:19,	166:11, 167:7,	committee [5] - 8:18,
chitchat [2] - 35:8,	Clontarf [1] - 109:17	55:22, 136:1, 136:3,	167:18, 169:25,	101:4, 101:8, 139:23,
82:7	close [4] - 9:28,	136:12, 148:13,	169:29, 170:1,	167:9
choose [2] - 188:17,	110:12, 132:6, 189:27	148:20, 178:12,	170:12, 171:2,	committees [3] - 8:2,
188:18	closed [2] - 70:6,	178:14, 179:2, 182:25	171:16, 172:28,	94:23, 180:6
chopped [1] - 92:7	126:14	commission [6] -	173:23, 175:11,	common [1] - 115:8
Christmas [4] -	closely [2] - 7:21,	13:26, 18:23, 18:27,	175:16, 175:20,	communicated [2] -
111:11, 120:7,	40:17	19:15, 19:19, 19:24	175:27, 176:12,	75:24, 107:4
120:11, 120:13	closer [1] - 110:13	Commissioner [164]	176:14, 176:19,	communication [3] -
circles [4] - 33:25,	closes [1] - 112:6	- 13:3, 15:6, 16:18,	176:28, 177:8,	12:1, 25:8, 147:15
33:28, 34:8, 81:28	closest [1] - 89:22	16:21, 16:28, 17:2,	178:25, 179:1, 179:6,	Communications [1]
circulated [1] -	club [4] - 111:6,	17:19, 33:19, 37:8,	179:15, 179:20,	- 107:26
107:23	111:7, 121:1	41:3, 41:18, 43:11,	180:19, 181:16,	community [1] -
circulating [4] - 35:2,	Club [1] - 111:8	44:19, 44:21, 45:13,	181:19, 181:25,	135:7
69:26, 72:26, 179:22	Clynch [1] - 85:27	46:29, 47:25, 48:12,	181:27, 183:22,	COMPANY [1] - 2:11
circulation [1] -	coffee [2] - 110:27,	48:19, 48:27, 49:23,	185:8, 187:13,	company [1] -
33:24	113:6	50:3, 51:17, 51:20,	188:20, 188:29,	141:22
circumstance [1] -	coincided [1] - 33:22	52:20, 53:14, 53:23,	189:5, 189:20, 190:5, 190:10, 190:18,	competencies [1] -
89:29	colander [1] - 181:8	55:5, 55:8, 56:27,	191:15, 191:29	97:1
circumstances [9] -	colleague [2] -	57:7, 57:12, 57:28,	COMMISSIONER [1]	compiled [1] - 96:14
15:14, 58:3, 62:8,	126:7, 149:18	58:3, 95:3, 98:5,	- 2:14	complain [3] - 12:2,
70:2, 141:5, 157:27,	colleagues [8] -	102:12, 102:15, 103:7, 103:15,	commissioner [4] -	39:20, 161:9
164:18, 169:7, 184:16	6:18, 68:23, 70:4,	103:28, 105:25,	13:4, 131:17, 181:28,	complained [1] -
civil [2] - 29:2, 98:17	80:21, 80:23, 92:9,	105:29, 111:13,	184:9	39:3
civilian [1] - 111:25	95:28, 104:8	111:20, 125:27,	commissioner's [1] -	complaining [3] -
claim [1] - 98:26	collect [1] - 77:25	126:5, 126:15, 127:9,	188:10	23:28, 186:21, 186:25
claims [6] - 20:10,	Colm [1] - 85:17	127:18, 127:21,	Commissioner's [11]	complaint [5] - 12:5,
20:26, 27:2, 27:8,	combination [1] -	127:28, 128:5,	- 8:17, 15:23, 55:10,	12:9, 52:3, 61:18, 66:2
98:13, 100:22	184:8	128:17, 131:11,	58:18, 135:10,	
clamp [1] - 82:8	coming [21] - 7:18,	132:15, 132:17,	138:29, 141:13,	complaints [2] - 21:5, 135:19
clarified [2] - 77:24,	12:28, 13:1, 16:28,	132:18, 132:23,	173:15, 179:17,	complete [2] - 87:20,
160:3 <b>clarify</b> [2] - 85:21,	17:29, 30:19, 32:19, 38:12, 51:6, 55:21,	133:22, 134:20,	190:10, 190:14	112:20
95:1		134:21, 135:3, 135:8,	commissioners [2] -	completed [2] -
clarity [1] - 83:10	60:18, 62:9, 74:20, 97:26, 98:18, 100:13,	135:25, 136:24,	59:11, 191:29	135:16, 163:9
Clarke [5] - 174:19,	104:9, 104:26,	137:26, 137:27,	commitment [1] -	completely [4] -
174:28, 175:2, 175:4,	180:27, 183:23,	137:28, 138:14,	21:16	34:27, 111:26, 117:7,
175:5	184:26	138:19, 139:6, 139:9,	Committee [56] -	120:28
clear [36] - 11:11,	commemoration [1]	141:7, 141:17,	7:22, 7:27, 8:3, 8:20,	compliance [1] -
13:19, 25:27, 28:2,	- 110:10	141:28, 142:2,	45:28, 46:13, 48:22,	124:17
40:2, 40:6, 41:7, 48:7,	commence [2] -	142:19, 142:22,	94:20, 94:26, 95:21,	comprehensively [1]
54:10, 54:14, 54:19,	94:22, 122:26	142:27, 143:4,	95:25, 95:28, 95:29,	- 26:16
55:15, 55:19, 60:7,	commenced [1] -	143:12, 143:26,	96:2, 96:10, 97:14,	Comptroller [1] -
60:13, 68:25, 68:29,	94:23	145:1, 145:7, 145:27,	97:20, 97:21, 97:26,	96:14
75:28, 99:24, 116:1,	commences [1] -	146:10, 146:19,	97:27, 98:1, 98:4,	conceal [1] - 178:10
118:21, 126:14,	80:11	146:23, 146:24,	99:27, 100:15, 101:2,	concealing [1] -
144:7, 147:25,	commencing [1] -	147:22, 149:14,	101:3, 102:16,	144:17
151:14, 152:4,	29:2	149:16, 149:26,	102:23, 102:28,	concentrate [1] -

176:13 confidential [26] -65:4 69:1, 75:8, 119:4, 14:21, 21:22, 33:2, concern [18] - 24:25, 64:19, 65:2, 65:10, consult [3] - 131:10, 127:3, 132:3, 134:9 34:3, 37:22, 38:1, 40:7, 51:7, 51:10, 65:15, 65:18, 65:22, conversation [96] -38:2, 38:11, 42:26, 131:11 43:29, 64:13, 67:18, 17:14, 33:19, 38:28, 75:21, 128:2, 128:19, 69:21, 71:5, 71:6, consulted [2] - 30:8, 128:24, 129:24, 84:18, 114:29, 115:3, 40:10, 40:13, 40:21, 67:20, 72:18, 72:22, 144.14 74:11, 76:15, 77:5, 130:3, 130:18, 119:8, 121:18, 130:2, contact [27] - 7:7. 42:1, 42:6, 42:22, 132:22, 132:26, 130:15, 130:26, 44:29, 45:12, 45:14, 79:3, 79:4, 80:25, 18:9, 19:5, 21:1, 132:29, 142:8, 133:6. 138:26. 49:15, 49:21, 53:13, 82:1, 90:2, 90:21, 21:15, 21:18, 23:7, 142:18, 144:28, 144:19, 157:2, 53:25, 54:6, 54:9, 94:13, 94:14, 94:20, 34:18, 64:14, 65:1, 173:26 157:12, 157:24, 66:20, 66:22, 73:27, 54:14, 56:28, 57:2, 94:21, 95:21, 95:22, concerned [28] -167:2, 181:10 75:4, 82:27, 101:23, 68:12, 68:24, 70:6, 100:20, 108:11, 108:14, 108:15, 29:2, 32:12, 41:17, confidentiality [3] -102:5, 110:16, 72:15, 76:4, 79:19, 108:19, 108:29, 51:12, 58:12, 62:17, 114:26, 135:12, 83:10, 83:28, 84:20, 110:19, 110:21, 112:17, 113:3, 64:26, 66:9, 66:11, 173:20 111:9, 111:11, 84:26, 85:6, 85:8, 96:25, 108:21, 132:2, confined [1] - 91:12 86:2, 87:5, 87:12, 114:14, 114:16, 111:14, 111:29, 87:21, 88:5, 88:13, 122:22, 122:24, 132:11, 132:18, confining [1] - 52:29 112:9, 143:8, 175:16 133:5, 133:18, 90:13, 95:14, 95:15, 124:6, 129:11, 135:6, contacted [7] - 19:2, confirm [4] - 23:14, 135:25, 136:26, 134:17, 137:26, 95:17, 100:28, 28:5, 28:6, 163:10 23:8, 23:9, 28:3, 101:11, 108:21, 163:11, 163:15, 141:28, 180:27, 74:16, 138:8, 156:27 confirmed [3] -164:26, 178:15, 187:8, 187:26, 189:8, 115:17, 127:20, 127:19, 137:5, 154:19 contacts [5] - 74:17, 189:12, 190:7, 190:8, 127:23, 128:15, 181:23, 187:11, 82:22, 82:25, 120:4, conflict [1] - 87:20 190:9, 190:11 128:24, 139:13, 187:14, 188:13, 189:4 confused [1] - 104:6 136:5 concerning [5] -141:6, 145:10, Correct [2] - 47:23, **contained** [2] - 9:3 Conlon [1] - 77:2 149:13, 149:25, 48.2 10:25, 31:17, 64:24, containing [2] -CONLON [5] - 2:28, 150:2. 150:22. corrected [3] -66:15, 149:15 73:25, 170:16 5:13, 76:24, 77:1, 150:23, 151:18, 19:17, 30:17, 39:23 concerns [36] -77:2 contemplating [3] -152:5, 152:8, 152:10, 12:16, 20:1, 24:22, correction [1] connected [1] -29:23, 180:15, 190:27 152:22, 153:8, 153:9, 12:23 39:10, 43:1, 43:18, contemporaneousl 125:5 49:19, 64:27, 66:5, 154:19. 155:8. correctly [4] - 11:25, **y** [1] - 58:21 connection [1] -155:11, 155:24, 95:27, 101:6, 129:13, 52:4, 102:7, 102:14 content [7] - 19:20, 18:10 155:27, 155:29, 129:19, 133:4, 30:23, 64:26, 72:14, corresponded [1] -**CONNOLLY** [1] - 3:5 161:13, 165:8, 134:24, 134:27, connotation [1] -173:6, 173:10, 173:11 165:15, 168:21, 134:29, 135:7, correspondence [9] 35:18 contents [3] - 14:17, 135:10, 135:16, 170:22, 170:29, - 18:8, 18:9, 19:5, 53:13 73:12 **CONOR** [1] - 2:15 171:3, 171:8, 171:22, 142:2. 142:4. 144:29. 19:7. 94:9. 98:14. contesting [1] -Conor [2] - 37:4, 171:28, 172:8, 145:24, 153:16, 116:14, 177:6, 177:9 103:26 172:14, 173:5, 173:7, 160:10, 160:12, correspondents [2] context [27] - 13:15, conscientious [3] -173:12, 173:17, 166:29, 170:15, 31:26, 31:27 15:16, 17:13, 21:15, 65:8, 66:8, 71:11 174:2, 174:4, 175:15, 173:19, 180:16, corridors [1] - 62:3 32:18, 32:29, 41:10, conscious [1] - 8:1 177:14, 179:6, 189:5, 190:13, corroborated [1] -42:22, 49:25, 53:17, consciously [1] -190:14, 190:29 183:25, 183:26, 186:3 57:21, 61:3, 61:6, 32:28 156:19 conversations [11] concert [1] - 57:9 corruption [2] consequence [1] -61:22, 72:21, 82:26, 39:21, 95:4, 131:14, concluded [4] -12:12, 179:27 115:2, 115:5, 115:20, 59:17 25:29, 31:1, 105:21, 157:1, 157:11, corruptly [1] -126:26, 133:1, 136:1, consider [1] - 184:5 165:10, 165:17, 182:13 137:8, 137:11, 135:20 considerable [3] -173:10, 174:17, conclusion [6] -COSTELLO [1] -138:17, 178:13, 179:5 6:23, 29:8, 135:18 188:19, 188:28 24:6, 24:8, 27:17, continue [2] - 101:7, considerably [1] -90:10, 129:2, 174:29 convey [2] - 11:6, 141:24 counsel [5] - 14:9, 146:5 conclusions [2] -16:1, 47:12, 92:24, contradiction [1] consideration [2] conveyed [1] - 69:16 60:23, 97:11 112:20 101:22 14:2, 18:20 conviction [1] concrete [3] - 16:2, contributed [1] country [3] - 66:1, considerations [1] -51:21 16:7, 55:20 112:4, 186:8 182:5 cooperate [1] - 12:26 conduct [3] - 55:8, contribution [2] county [1] - 110:26 considered [4] -55:11, 64:24 cooperated [1] couple [4] - 39:8, 42:23, 105:28 25:26, 30:7, 52:10, conducted [2] - 12:3, 131:29 111:10, 146:16, 156:7 control [2] - 66:13, 179:26 39:4 cooperation [1] course [42] - 17:28, 133:1 constituency [3] -178:14 conference [2] -22:10, 25:13, 26:11, controller [3] -82:15. 82:17. 109:10 copy [1] - 73:28 133:11, 133:12 32:13, 35:22, 40:16, 132:19, 132:23, 181:2 Constitution [1] correct [60] - 6:25, confidence [2] controversy [9] -41:4, 43:4, 43:9, 97:18 6:28, 7:15, 7:16, 64:23, 86:14 8:19, 58:18, 68:17, 45:14, 55:17, 75:24, constrained [1] -

77:20, 78:13, 82:20, 168:25 62:9, 124:14, 137:4, 24:19 82:28, 84:19, 90:5, Crowley [2] - 41:1, 140:2, 164:4, 168:13, delays [1] - 29:11 109:23, 111:28, 41:16 189:15, 189:16 delete [1] - 178:10 114:17, 118:6, 126:8, dealings [5] - 66:27, crucial [1] - 15:21 deliberations [1] -127:1, 132:11, crystal [3] - 126:14, 95:3, 125:5, 125:6, 191.4 141:10, 141:12, 170:28, 176:16 delve [1] - 39:21 152:4, 153:3, 154:9, dealt [15] - 12:18, **CULLEN** [1] - 3:13 delved [1] - 97:1 156:23, 160:4, 160:5, curious [1] - 126:3 12:21, 26:3, 26:7, demands [1] -172:29, 177:5, 26:16, 32:14, 51:27, CURRAN [1] - 3:27 167:14 177:13, 177:14, 55:23, 70:4, 125:8, demarcated [1] currency [1] - 127:2 179:8, 184:17, 191:4 125:9, 128:28, 174:17 current [2] - 18:5, **court** [1] - 96:4 166:13, 180:8, 188:16 demarcation [1] -99:21 COURT [3] - 1:13, **Deasy's** [1] - 106:19 customary [1] - 79:6 2:3, 3:6 deaths [2] - 182:4, denied [1] - 108:24 Court [1] - 120:17 D denies [1] - 84:24 courtesy [3] - 26:9, debate [5] - 42:25, denying [1] - 72:14 26:13, 74:7 58:12, 58:16, 58:20, department [8] damaged [1] - 17:18 cover[3] - 103:22, 104.28 96:15, 122:29, damaging [3] -124:23, 170:25 debated [1] - 44:5 162:18, 165:4, 17:12, 51:11, 180:9 coverage [1] - 43:14 debates [2] - 43:4, 174:20, 174:21, dangerous [2] covered [5] - 20:11, 43:7 176:2, 176:4 186:8, 186:9 128:6, 128:7, 160:2, December [7] -Department [29] dare [1] - 190:18 171:28 33:17, 40:25, 42:4, 37:26, 37:27, 38:20, dark [4] - 121:24, 44:11, 147:13, 148:5, cracked [1] - 70:9 65:13, 65:17, 65:23, 185:15, 185:17, create [2] - 167:4, 65:26, 66:2, 122:29, 185:20 180:3 decent [3] - 47:28, 123:12, 123:13, **DARREN**[1] - 3:9 creates [1] - 41:10 162:7, 162:8 123:14, 123:16, Darren [2] - 56:3, decide [4] - 15:24, credibility [5] - 10:1, 123:17, 123:26, 168:28 10:26, 10:27, 35:11, 102:25, 106:15, 124:8, 125:14, Data [4] - 132:17, 59:26 156:19 125:20, 125:24, 134:19, 134:20, 139:5 decided [5] - 24:12, credible [1] - 32:3 127:6, 129:20, 132:6, data [6] - 132:19, crime [2] - 31:26, 26:10, 27:22, 64:11, 135:5, 135:28, 132:23, 154:7, 123:20 102:22 156:26, 162:26, 170:16, 181:1 164:28, 164:29, decision [21] - 16:6, criminal [4] - 46:22, data.. [1] - 153:17 21:19, 31:1, 32:11, 185:15 47.8 48.21 116.4 date [3] - 22:11, 32:15, 47:19, 102:6, Criminal [1] - 182:1 departments [1] -22:17, 174:29 102:13, 102:18, criminality [1] -122:28 dated [3] - 33:16, 102:19, 102:21, 96:26 dependent[1] -73:19, 147:13 102:24, 103:3, 104:1, 135:5 critical [1] - 40:3 daughter [2] - 126:7, 104:2, 104:3, 104:10, depth [1] - 185:7 criticised [1] -149.17 104:17, 105:4, 106:6 178:29 deputies [7] - 14:24, **Dave** [1] - 33:14 decision-making [1] criticism [1] - 29:9 52:20, 52:21, 56:6, David [1] - 31:21 - 32:11 crop [1] - 84:19 70:5, 156:28, 157:8 **DAVID**[1] - 3:20 decisions [1] - 104:4 **Deputy** [98] - 6:5, CROSS [20] - 5:5, **DAY**[1] - 1:18 declined [1] - 25:8 7:3, 8:6, 14:14, 16:9, 5:6, 5:7, 5:13, 5:14, day's [2] - 112:16, deduced [1] - 80:19 17:3, 18:1, 33:5, 5:19, 5:20, 5:28, 5:29, 112:27 deeply [1] - 111:1 33:18, 35:27, 37:1, 5:30, 33:11, 37:3, days [1] - 106:10 56:2, 77:1, 77:13, deficient [2] - 24:29, 37:4, 37:14, 38:15, de [8] - 21:11, 23:11, 38:28, 40:2, 40:11, 101:19, 103:24, 42:6, 42:12, 57:2, definitely [2] - 92:21, 40:17, 40:19, 41:23, 147:2, 163:4, 168:25 58:27, 59:20, 61:15 41:25, 42:2, 42:19, 177:28 cross [1] - 58:19 cross-examination **deal** [17] - 30:16, definition [1] -42:28, 43:8, 44:13, 30:21, 30:24, 32:15, 44:17, 45:3, 45:7, 179:28 111 - 58:19 **CROSS-EXAMINED** 32:16, 51:4, 53:4, 45:8, 45:11, 45:15, definitive [2] - 15:18, 55:10, 57:26, 61:26, 46:28, 47:1, 47:11, 29:25 [20] - 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 120:20, 143:10, 48:4. 48:8. 48:26. 5:13, 5:14, 5:19, 5:20, definitively [1] -153:6, 157:5, 166:25, 49:1, 49:13, 49:16. 58:25 5:28, 5:29, 5:30, 184:1 49:24, 49:26, 50:7, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, deflect [1] - 83:20 dealing [12] - 11:20, 50:20, 53:10, 53:12, 77:1, 77:13, 101:19. degree [1] - 29:8 103:24, 147:2, 163:4, 32:3, 32:8, 38:10, 53:15, 53:18, 53:22, Deirdre [2] - 21:11,

54:6, 54:18, 55:4, 55:25, 55:29, 56:4, 56:19, 57:9, 57:18, 57:21, 57:24, 58:7, 58:22, 59:6, 72:5, 95:2, 105:28, 106:19, 107:7, 141:18, 141:20, 142:23, 143:9, 144:3, 145:6, 146:11, 146:15, 146:24, 148:12, 163:13, 163:23, 164:9, 166:1, 166:5, 166:7, 166:15, 167:18, 167:27, 168:27, 168:29, 170:23, 173:16, 176:15, 176:19, 176:26, 177:20, 191:9 deputy [7] - 6:22, 13:4. 59:2. 134:23. 142:15, 168:12, 168:17 derogatory [1] -116:16 describe [7] - 7:2, 14:22, 48:4, 79:19, 104:23, 126:12, 130:21 described [10] -56:9, 83:28, 127:22, 132:28, 133:11, 135:20, 142:7, 151:28, 179:27, 186:4 describing [1] -166:19 description [4] -43:27, 83:9, 83:12, 189.4 deserved [1] -100:27 designed [1] - 47:18 desire [2] - 21:6, **DESMOND** [1] - 3:23 Desmond [1] - 77:14 despicable [2] -113:25, 113:26 despite [3] - 87:5, 127:29, 161:17 destination [1] -77:26 detail [10] - 21:5, 24:23, 37:19, 44:26, 47:4, 97:10, 153:12, 156:2, 176:12, 183:8 details [15] - 15:11, 23:4, 23:29, 38:15, 44:23, 49:14, 83:21, 86:1, 125:11, 130:4,

133:7, 144:20, 168:15, 170:16, 185:5 **detective** [1] - 108:3 **Detective** [2] - 108:5, 192.1 developed [1] - 8:19 development [1] -165:5 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diary [1] - 87:11 died [1] - 89:18 difference [2] -35:20, 117:1 different [16] - 16:29, 48:9, 79:9, 82:4, 89:29, 91:16, 95:27, 98:6, 104:22, 111:26, 119:24, 120:27, 123:2, 136:12, 162:12, 182:10 difficult [6] - 34:1, 36:12, 61:12, 98:20, 104:5, 104:15 difficulties [2] - 71:3, 191.10 difficulty [4] - 24:12, 26:23, 87:22, 104:10 digit [1] - 182:10 **DIGNAM** [15] - 2:15, 5:6, 5:20, 36:29, 37:3, 37:4, 103:21, 103:24, 103:26, 107:9, 117:27, 178:2, 190:22, 191:8, 191:14 **Dignam** [3] - 37:4, 103:26, 191:7 **Dignam's** [2] - 56:5, dilemma [1] - 17:13 direct [2] - 54:4, 112:19 directed [2] - 149:19, 150:28 direction [4] - 142:1, 144:2, 173:19, 173:27 **DIRECTLY** [10] - 5:4, 5:12, 5:18, 5:23, 5:27, 6:15, 64:7, 94:6, 107:20, 122:8 directly [6] - 7:9, 31:24, 31:29, 61:26, 95:16, 182:4 director [2] - 123:21, 123:23 disagreement [1] -51:27 disappeared [1] -160:2 disciplinary [1] -

66:9

discipline [5] -64:20, 132:20, 133:2, 173:29, 181:6 disciplined [3] -133:2, 167:6, 180:29 disclose [2] - 58:6, 69:17 disclosed [2] -57:24, 88:7 disclosing [2] -52:24, 52:26 disclosure [3] -31:22, 97:4, 104:21 DISCLOSURES [2] -1:3, 1:4 disclosures [2] -99:20, 149:15 discounted [1] -99:28 discredit [3] - 75:15, 75:18. 100:2 discreet [1] - 119:15 discrete [1] - 106:16 discretion [9] - 11:5, 182:20, 183:13, 183:17, 183:24, 183:29, 184:4, 185:27, 186:19 discuss [4] - 23:1, 79:12, 87:8, 144:25 discussed [12] -36:18, 70:20, 86:18, 86:26, 87:2, 87:7, 91:14, 106:17, 117:3, 145:16, 169:10, 171:15 discussing [1] -48:20 discussion [14] -13:14, 35:9, 66:27, 77:8, 78:2, 78:8, 85:25, 91:6, 103:1, 103:10, 106:11, 121:19, 154:5, 179:24 discussions [2] -42:29, 152:26 disgusting [10] -8:23, 43:12, 43:28, 101:26, 103:15, 115:20, 115:28, 116:17, 140:11 dispute [1] - 42:28 disrespectful [1] -

110.1

84.29

dissemination [1] -

distinguished [3] -

43:28, 64:10, 82:13

distance [2] -

125:26, 163:16

distraction [2] -184:23, 184:25 district [2] - 26:5, 64:25 disturbing [1] - 23:1 division [5] - 123:18, 123:20, 125:15, 164:28, 174:26 divulge [1] - 74:9 **DOCK** [1] - 3:18 dockerill [1] - 80:13 DOCKERY [10] -3:23, 5:14, 6:6, 36:28, 77:13, 77:14, 88:22, 103:19, 118:9, 118:14 **Dockery** [8] - 77:14, 77:28, 80:14, 80:16, 83:17, 84:12, 88:19, 118:5 document [2] -32:17. 73:25 documentation [3] -16:8, 104:20, 177:18 documents [3] -104:27, 105:1, 125:21 **dodgy** [1] - 131:3 domain [12] - 7:26, 51:15, 99:12, 101:2, 129:13, 129:19, 129:22, 130:14, 156:3, 156:11, 156:12 **DONAL** [1] - 2:16 done [24] - 14:27, 28:11, 38:25, 38:27, 39:12, 41:19, 47:24, 49:11, 58:9, 91:3, 130:23, 146:4, 146:6, 146:10, 158:7, 158:21, 159:8. 159:25, 172:16, 183:5, 184:7, 187:26, 188:11 Donegal [1] - 110:11 **door** [3] - 56:10, 142:24, 143:1 dory [1] - 186:27 dossier [16] - 9:3, 10:29, 11:18, 11:26, 13:8, 14:2, 14:17, 20:21, 31:12, 39:18, 39:19, 43:21, 51:5, 52:9, 55:21, 134:1 dots [1] - 24:4 double [2] - 130:9, 185:22 double-edged [1] -185:22 doubt [9] - 30:20,

181:27, 185:23 doubtful [1] - 146:2 doubts [2] - 65:28, 70:14 down [42] - 7:8, 16:25, 25:24, 34:1, 34:11, 34:26, 36:12, 39:12, 48:17, 57:6, 61:12, 61:19, 61:24, 63:1, 70:7, 70:10, 87:14, 105:14, 105:19, 111:13, 112:3, 141:27, 145:19, 148:16, 152:10, 153:6, 163:24, 165:12, 165:13, 165:16. 165:25, 165:27, 166:8, 166:9, 166:16, 166:18, 166:22, 168:8, 169:16, 176:27, 179:16, 191:11 downgrading[1] -**DPP** [10] - 9:15, 25:2, 26:16, 52:12, 126:9, 126:13, 149:19, 150:28, 152:1 draft [3] - 31:2, 177:11, 177:17 drafted [1] - 177:6 draw [1] - 97:11 drawing [1] - 68:28 drawn [1] - 24:4 dream [1] - 121:8 drew [1] - 90:10 drink [1] - 120:4 drive [5] - 68:10, 77:26, 78:12, 114:4, 115:1 driven [2] - 67:8, 79.15 driver [17] - 67:9, 67:10, 67:16, 67:21, 69:20, 69:21, 72:20, 76:9, 84:20, 89:3, 89:10. 110:4. 111:23. 111:25, 111:28,

79:15
 driver [17] - 67:9,
67:10, 67:16, 67:21,
69:20, 69:21, 72:20,
76:9, 84:20, 89:3,
89:10, 110:4, 111:23,
111:25, 111:28,
111:29
 drivers [3] - 67:22,
67:24, 112:12
 driving [5] - 48:5,
68:5, 78:11, 89:15,
173:3
 drop [2] - 14:24,
112:1
 drove [4] - 109:1,
109:16, 110:9, 110:11
 dual [1] - 48:22

dub [1] - 186:5 **DUBLIN** [15] - 1:17, 2:12, 2:20, 2:25, 2:30, 3:3, 3:7, 3:11, 3:14, 3:18, 3:21, 3:25, 3:28, 3:32 4:4 **Dublin** [4] - 82:15, 109:11, 110:9, 161:8 due [1] - 28:28 duff[1] - 109:13 Dundalk [2] - 140:25, during [28] - 15:22, 40:16, 41:4, 43:4, 43:8, 45:14, 82:13, 108:4, 110:16, 123:2, 125:7, 125:10, 125:25, 126:29, 127:2, 141:9, 141:11, 142:15, 149:13, 152:4, 153:3, 154:9, 156:22, 160:4, 160:5, 177:13, 177:14, 179:7 duties [3] - 108:7, 108:26, 132:24 duty [3] - 110:20, 124:7, 179:25 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:5 **Dáil** [36] - 6:22, 6:27, 9:5, 9:26, 11:24, 13:28, 14:17, 18:11, 19:10, 24:14, 27:9, 28:11, 28:13, 31:3, 42:22, 42:29, 43:5, 43:19, 43:20, 44:6, 50:5, 56:25, 57:25, 58:7, 70:5, 76:12, 77:26, 82:14, 94:15, 95:11, 98:7, 105:28, 112:6, 112:27, 142:16, 156:14 **Dála** [1] - 6:5

#### Ε

dúirt [1] - 91:9

early [6] - 6:19, 71:3, 71:7, 81:25, 139:21, 178:14
easy [1] - 112:1
edged [1] - 185:22
edition [1] - 26:28
education [2] - 37:23
Education [1] - 38:9
effect [9] - 27:27, 59:13, 59:14, 60:4, 62:25, 65:6, 83:25, 163:24, 191:8
effectively [5] - 60:9,

32:20. 32:21. 54:23.

84:16, 88:16, 138:3,

120:15, 142:23,
148:25, 161:29
efforts [1] - 86:28 eight [2] - 86:7,
112:5
-
<b>either</b> [16] - 87:25, 96:25, 97:1, 99:11,
100:8, 100:10,
100:12, 102:4,
103:12, 104:7, 104:28, 115:21,
124:22, 138:20,
155:21, 175:4
elected [2] - 94:15,
94:17
<b>election</b> [5] - 49:5, 64:11, 66:19, 67:27,
109:9
element [1] - 130:9 ELIZABETH [1] - 2:7
em [4] - 99:10, 111:5,
115:8, 139:12
email [3] - 181:14,
182:11, 182:15
<b>emails</b> [2] - 178:8,
181:13
embarrass [1] -
179:19
embarrassment [1] -
109:12
embroiled [1] - 157:23
emerge [1] - 51:20
<b>emerged</b> [4] - 31:21, 39:27, 90:25, 131:28
<b>EMMA</b> [1] - 2:18
emotional [4] -
187:20, 188:28, 189:2, 189:3
1
emotions [1] - 188:27
emphasise [2] -
114:23, 115:15
emphasising [1] -
164:19
employee [4] -
142:26, 166:10,
166:11, 191:10
employer [2] - 191·10 191·11
191:10, 191:11
191:10, 191:11 employer/
191:10, 191:11 employer/ employee[1] - 191:18
191:10, 191:11 employer/ employee [1] - 191:18 employment [2] -
191:10, 191:11 employer/ employee [1] - 191:18 employment [2] - 37:27, 107:25
191:10, 191:11 employer/ employee [1] - 191:18 employment [2] - 37:27, 107:25 encounter [2] -
191:10, 191:11 employer/ employee [1] - 191:18 employment [2] - 37:27, 107:25 encounter [2] - 66:28, 79:5
191:10, 191:11 employer/ employee [1] - 191:18 employment [2] - 37:27, 107:25 encounter [2] - 66:28, 79:5 encounters [1] -
191:10, 191:11 employer/ employee [1] - 191:18 employment [2] - 37:27, 107:25 encounter [2] - 66:28, 79:5 encounters [1] - 78:26
191:10, 191:11 employer/ employee [1] - 191:18 employment [2] - 37:27, 107:25 encounter [2] - 66:28, 79:5 encounters [1] -

encouraging [1] -100:19 end [16] - 15:4, 15:5, 17:27, 31:11, 45:15, 45:17, 53:6, 56:28, 64:15, 71:2, 78:23, 105:9, 124:7, 124:10, 136:9, 165:14 Enda [1] - 27:4 endeavouring[1] -11:6 endure [1] - 89:24 Energy [1] - 107:26 enforced [1] - 181:5 engage [5] - 8:2, 107:1, 129:28, 143:6, 177:16 engaged [3] -129:24, 133:7, 148:19 engagement [13] -18:29, 39:24, 40:1, 62:20, 91:28, 104:18, 105:10, 105:11, 125:12, 128:4, 130:10, 139:4, 139:14 engagements [1] engaging [1] - 107:2 enormous [1] -30:18 enterprise [1] -37:27 entirely [7] - 47:24, 48:9, 79:9, 79:10, 124:22, 156:5, 162:27 entitled [1] - 161:7 entry [1] - 87:11 EOGHAN[2] - 5:17, 94:6 **Eoghan** [1] - 94:3 episode [1] - 142:15 **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:9 error [2] - 45:27, 46:11 erupted [1] - 157:26 escape [1] - 109:21 especially [2] -67:12. 132:1 essential [1] - 87:16 essentially [3] -42:15, 91:12, 133:12 establish [2] - 79:14, 97.9

ESTABLISHED[1] -

established [11] -

19:15, 19:19, 30:15,

39:28, 39:29, 53:3.

53:4, 55:22, 55:23,

91:5, 94:24

establishment [4] -31:3, 38:19, 42:15, 43:23 estimate [1] - 163:19 estimates [1] -162:28 et [1] - 109:24 etcetera [13] - 38:12, 134:10, 145:28, 167:9, 167:10, 167:16, 170:19, 182:1, 182:4, 183:5, 183:6  $\pmb{\text{ether}\,} [6] - 36 : 15,$ 63:16, 63:17, 131:1, 131:24, 134:6 evening [11] - 78:28, 79:16, 139:20, 141:1, 141:7, 141:8, 163:12, 171:19, 172:27, 173:12, 174:3 event[14] - 10:28, 13:7, 19:20, 24:12, 29:26, 74:19, 90:3, 90:25, 121:10, 125:14, 134:14, 140:19, 144:13, 174:1 events [5] - 10:9, 27:25, 101:28, 111:2, 126:8 eventually [1] -65:17 evidence [62] - 6:7, 6:12, 6:20, 15:23, 15:25, 31:16, 33:15, 35:3, 35:12, 35:16, 35:28, 36:4, 37:10, 39:1, 39:2, 40:15, 40:18, 40:22, 41:6, 41:13, 45:4, 45:9, 45:12, 47:21, 49:25, 49:26, 50:19, 60:25, 77:17, 78:14, 81:24, 84:18, 88:3, 88:4, 92:27, 99:26, 100:2, 100:3, 101:25, 104:2, 105:20, 106:12, 108:17, 111:24, 112:15, 112:20, 118:22, 130:13, 139:23, 139:26, 139:27, 147:25, 152:25, 158:12, 158:13. 167:22. 169:4, 170:19, 170:20, 172:3, 177:21, 182:16 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:9 evidence-in-chief [1] - 84:18

ex [1] - 111:12 ex-garda [1] - 111:12 exact [4] - 125:29, 126:20, 131:19, 160:8 **exactly** [4] - 113:28, 145:10, 156:8, 165:13 examination [3] -7:21, 58:19, 135:18 examine [2] - 96:17, 153:11 examined [4] - 14:8, 30:25, 97:4 EXAMINED [34] -5:4, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:18, 5:19, 5:20, 5:23, 5:27, 5:28, 5:29, 5:30, 5:31, 6:16, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 64:8, 77:1, 77:13, 94:7, 101:19, 103:24, 107:21, 122:9, 147:2, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5 **example** [5] - 11:6, 54:10, 97:3, 110:9, 111:6 examples [1] -187:14 exception [1] - 68:1 exceptional [2] -158:7, 159:11 exchange [4] -37:14, 38:24, 42:2, 42.16 exchanged [2] -78:3, 189:18 exchanges [1] -105:8 exclude [1] - 58:25 exclusively [2] -36:6, 129:29 excuse [3] - 80:15, 122:11, 148:18 exercise [2] - 19:22, 175:23 exercised [1] - 51:26 exers' [1] - 111:10 exhibited [1] -159:28 existence [2] -87:10. 148:3 expand [1] - 39:9 expect [2] - 38:6, 49:2 expectation [6] -29:9, 129:27, 130:1, 137:20, 174:8

expected [2] - 27:4,

experience [3] -

27:15

50:28, 50:29, 158:20 experienced [4] -38:5, 49:3, 158:20, 181:29 explain [11] - 14:24, 16:17, 50:1, 50:21, 50:24, 84:4, 84:7, 95:23, 137:8, 141:5, 175:17 explained [6] - 71:9, 72:6, 87:13, 87:14, 112:10, 173:3 explaining [2] -55:28, 88:12 explains [1] - 78:21 explanation [1] -173.4 explicable [1] -129:3 explicit [1] - 80:20 explicitly [1] - 81:9 explore [3] - 37:8, 78:6, 143:7 express [2] - 71:28, 162.11 expressed [6] -14:28, 19:16, 27:12, 134:24, 161:6, 189:21 expressing [4] -66:6, 161:25, 161:26, 161:27 expression [4] -159:7, 159:23, 174:21, 189:22 **extensive** [1] - 43:14 extent [4] - 12:15, 32:2, 144:14, 146:18 extract [3] - 73:25, 73:29, 74:5 extrapolate [1] -175:26 extremely [2] - 38:5, **eye** [5] - 49:5, 75:27, 90:16, 132:6, 190:12 eyebrows [1] - 186:1

# F

face [8] - 17:3, 19:6, 128:12, 128:13, 185:1 face-to-face [3] -19:6, 128:12, 128:13 fact [56] - 12:25, 15:15, 16:4, 19:9, 24:9, 24:10, 32:10, 38:24, 38:27, 40:20, 40:29, 42:9, 46:7, 48:11, 50:8, 50:14,

53:12, 54:7, 54:9, 162:13, 162:15 fire [1] - 158:7 followed [5] - 7:17, forward [9] - 25:29, 57:2, 57:27, 58:5, feature [2] - 29:5, firmly [1] - 76:7 7:21, 141:14, 158:16 38:22, 51:29, 142:25, 58:8, 58:13, 59:16, 132:3 **FIRST** [1] - 3:7 FOLLOWING [1] -166:26, 168:16, 65:7, 74:25, 75:19, **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:6, 175:14, 178:12, 180:4 First [2] - 38:12, 1:5 82:6, 84:3, 86:9, 1.10 following [17] - 1:26, forwarded [2] -38:19 86:25, 87:2, 90:22, February [26] - 6:29, first [43] - 6:4, 16:4, 22:23, 31:7, 40:18, 43:21, 116:13 98:25, 106:10, 109:8, 57:5, 88:18, 91:6, forwarding [1] -7:13, 10:28, 14:16, 16:23, 18:7, 18:14, 112:22, 126:12, 33:27, 35:17, 35:27, 18:15, 19:2, 20:5, 102:10, 103:6, 106:8, 11:29 130:7, 130:18, 37:15, 38:24, 38:28, 139:4. 139:11. fought [1] - 37:25 20:18, 21:27, 32:23, 146:14, 148:28, 39:5, 40:11, 40:24, 139:27, 153:26, 39:15. 41:5. 41:29. foul [2] - 71:26, 150:15, 151:1, 151:9, 42:2, 43:19, 67:1, 42:14, 44:15, 50:9, 154:13, 154:26, 91:11 151:29, 155:20, 70:16, 73:14, 75:25, 50:28, 53:5, 55:1, 165:22 founded [1] - 135:21 160:7, 160:9, 160:11, **FOLLOWS** [8] - 6:1, 77:21, 83:7, 83:14, 56:6, 64:14, 64:21, four [11] - 37:21, 163:17, 167:6, 85:12, 85:22, 112:16, 64:2. 94:1. 94:7. 69:18, 73:10, 73:12, 42:16, 120:16, 169:15, 175:11, 163:5, 168:25, 178:5, 116:10 83:11, 83:14, 94:15, 157:18, 169:6, 190:24 FEICHÍN [1] - 3:26 94:17, 95:1, 98:21, 180:25 169:18, 169:20, facts [5] - 128:28, **FELIX** [1] - 3:2 99:9, 99:10, 116:16, follows [2] - 61:17, 169:22, 178:21, 129:17, 187:25, felt [17] - 11:13, 12:9, 136:23, 147:15, 80.27 179:3, 182:8 187:26, 190:4 148:5, 156:1, 172:6, 12:13, 12:18, 16:1, food [3] - 168:5, fourth [4] - 14:25, factual [2] - 127:21, 174:15, 175:17, 24:25, 25:2, 86:21, 174:11, 177:3 28:25, 80:11, 179:15 128.22 88:17, 97:15, 99:29, 178:18 foot [3] - 38:25, fourth-last [2] -Fail [4] - 20:14, 100:28, 106:29, **firstly** [4] - 44:26, 38:27, 39:29 28:25, 80:11 20:21, 22:29, 27:9 109:22, 121:19, 49:13, 51:25, 54:18 FOR [17] - 1:8, 2:6, Frank [1] - 192:1 failure [1] - 12:10 164:1, 176:28 fit [1] - 28:21 2:9, 2:14, 2:22, 2:27, frank [4] - 61:11, fair [21] - 10:24, Fennelly [7] - 136:1, Fitzgerald [2] - 30:1, 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12, 63:5, 189:21, 189:22 12:13, 12:15, 13:29, 136:2, 136:12, 3:16, 3:20, 3:23, 3:26, frankly [1] - 86:19 19:4, 22:4, 29:23, 148:20. 178:12. FITZGERALD[2] -3:30, 4:1, 93:1 fraught [1] - 104:10 30:11, 39:13, 39:14, 178:14, 179:2 force [13] - 12:17, 2:17. 3:16 FREEMAN [1] - 4:1 39:22, 42:27, 57:23, FERRY [1] - 2:28 FITZWILLIAM[1] -82:29, 83:9, 86:8, frequent [2] - 18:28, 58:1, 61:6, 62:15, few [14] - 55:27, 167:6, 173:25, 56:8 76:9, 108:20, 142:22, 56:4, 59:6, 74:2, five [12] - 63:23, 179:29, 180:3, friend [7] - 67:7, 173:8, 176:25 180:10, 180:29, 76:24, 77:15, 112:9, 108:2, 108:13, 67:11, 69:7, 71:12, fairly [3] - 13:29, 120:22, 126:21, 181:7, 189:9, 190:8 139:19, 140:4, 78:29, 85:7, 186:3 84:28, 114:18 156:27, 158:25, 157:18, 158:19, forcibly [1] - 82:10 Friend [1] - 146:29 fairness [2] - 105:26, fore [1] - 30:14 163:10, 169:2, 180:26 158:21, 159:13, friendly [3] - 25:19, 113:7 Fianna [4] - 20:14, 159:14, 159:15, 188:5 Foreign [2] - 37:26, 85:1, 86:10 fall [1] - 26:6 20:21, 22:29, 27:8 five-minute [1] -108:8 friends [6] - 11:13, false [2] - 180:11, fight [2] - 122:17, 63:23 forget [2] - 183:19, 25:18, 89:21, 120:22, 182:6 122:19 five-year [1] - 159:13 186:7 120:29, 160:25 **familiar** [1] - 8:16 figures [1] - 12:6 fixed [3] - 94:27, forgotten [4] front [10] - 32:17, families [1] - 25:19 file [11] - 9:15, 39:27, 181:5, 185:24 146:14, 156:4, 156:9, 56:15, 97:7, 98:4, family [7] - 25:18, 46:8, 46:23, 46:24, fixing [2] - 130:8, 157:19 100:16, 102:16, 45:26, 89:17, 89:23, 46:25, 66:12, 71:4, 182:3 **form** [5] - 19:15, 104:8, 104:21, 105:5, 111:1, 115:29, 119:10 125:3, 126:9, 152:1 Flahive [4] - 125:18, 35:17, 51:21, 54:8, 110:20 famous [1] - 186:2 files [2] - 125:21, 125:19, 181:15, 169:12 frustrated [2] -**FANNING** [2] - 3:30, 126:13 182.11 formal [4] - 62:5, 100:21, 100:25 4:2 102:24, 104:17, film [1] - 92:5 flaws [3] - 188:9, frustration [1] far [16] - 9:11, 23:12, final [2] - 181:25, 188:14, 188:15 106:15 12:22 32:12, 41:16, 53:11, 184:21 floating [3] - 63:16, formally [1] - 6:7 full [3] - 67:22, 58:11, 62:23, 96:24, finally [1] - 169:9 63:17, 133:17 format [1] - 15:24 67:23, 125:1 108:20, 113:12, financial [1] - 128:8 floor [3] - 14:1, former [21] - 10:5, full-time [2] - 67:22, 134:8, 171:7, 175:19, findings [1] - 131:18 14:25, 158:21 19:25, 33:19, 37:7, 67.23 186:9, 187:10, 187:25 fine [2] - 44:9, 41:2, 41:18, 43:11, **FLOOR** [1] - 3:7 fully [3] - 151:20, farce [1] - 157:25 118:11 45:13, 46:29, 53:14, focus [5] - 31:12, 164:19, 182:16 farmers [1] - 186:7 finger [4] - 13:3, 38:23, 49:7, 97:27, 53:23, 55:4, 78:29, **fulsomely** [1] - 90:23 farming [1] - 186:3 59:23, 67:12, 78:17 188:25 103:27, 111:20, **fun** [1] - 121:6 farms [1] - 186:7 127:18, 146:23, finish [2] - 80:3, follow [3] - 96:18, function [5] - 13:9, father [1] - 25:15 147:22, 191:15, 192.4 128:18, 158:13 13:24, 17:28, 54:1, fault [1] - 81:21 follow-up [1] -191:28 finished [2] - 124:8, 112:3 favour[3] - 100:19, 139:26 128:18 formerly [1] - 182:1 functions [1] - 111:3

fundamental [3] -78:29, 85:7, 110:19, God [1] - 142:8 guessing [1] -Headquarters [7] -12:9, 17:8, 181:2 111:12, 111:19, golf [3] - 111:7, 163:29 59:11, 111:26, fundamentally [1] -149:17 111:13, 121:1 Guidelines [1] -111:27, 184:14, 186:24, 187:21, 49.6 Gardaí [18] - 17:22, **Golf** [1] - 111:8 38.12 funded [1] - 124:22 66:1, 66:13, 82:23, GUIDERA [1] - 3:27 188:21 **GORDON** [1] - 2:10 guilty [1] - 61:8 funding [2] - 124:24, 82:26, 110:21, 111:8, gossip [7] - 69:8, Headquarters' [1] -111:9, 120:4, 130:3, 188:3 128:3 71:26, 83:5, 84:29, guy [2] - 33:1, 137:28, 162:19, furnish [1] - 131:29 114:9, 117:2, 121:16 heads [2] - 92:6, 110:26 179:20, 182:21, 119:20 furnished [1] - 172:4 gossiping [1] guys [1] - 120:9 183:16, 183:29, heads-up [1] furrow [1] - 120:27 113:16 **GWEN** [1] - 1:30 **FÍONÁN** [1] - 3:12 185:26, 187:26 Gwen [1] - 1:25 119:20 Government [3] gate [2] - 110:20, 31:1, 67:28, 94:13 health [4] - 37:23, 110.24 37:28, 37:29, 38:20 G government[3] -Н gearing [2] - 122:17, 97:16, 97:23, 115:4 Health [1] - 117:13 122:19 healthcare [1] **grab** [1] - 56:18 gained [1] - 144:5 habit [1] - 61:24 General [1] - 96:14 125:1 Grafton [1] - 113:10 half [4] - 68:7, 92:27, gallery [1] - 98:10 general [48] - 7:20, GRAND [1] - 3:18 hear [16] - 15:24, game [1] - 111:12 92:29, 165:15 9:24, 25:20, 32:4, 31:25, 41:19, 54:5, grapevine [15] gamut [1] - 53:5 **HALIDAY**[1] - 2:11 32:5, 33:24, 34:6, 70:26, 73:8, 90:1, 68:17, 72:27, 77:10, HALL<sub>[2]</sub> - 3:31, 4:2 Garda [98] - 10:11, 35:8, 35:9, 36:6, 94:16, 99:5, 103:4, 79:28, 80:5, 80:17, HANAHOE[1] - 2:29 12:5, 12:6, 15:6, 36:12, 41:25, 51:15, 113:22, 116:8, 80:18, 81:3, 81:4, 16:28, 17:19, 20:6, hand [4] - 45:3, 59:22, 59:24, 61:6, 81:11, 81:16, 83:4, 117:20, 140:11, 23:2, 26:3, 27:2, 61:11, 63:5, 63:8, 68:27, 69:2, 123:6 146:8, 165:21 83:26, 119:22 28:29, 37:5, 37:6, 64:11, 66:19, 72:25, handed [1] - 9:5 heard [31] - 10:17, graphic [7] - 72:25, 39:4. 39:12. 43:2. 75:26, 81:28, 82:7, **HANDED** [2] - 45:5, 13:22, 15:23, 16:23, 83:12, 92:4, 92:5, 44:19, 47:25, 48:12, 72:13 97:19. 113:18. 16:24, 19:28, 36:18, 92.8 92.13 48:19, 48:27, 49:22, 113:29, 114:2, handwritten [2] graphically [4] -41:20, 42:7, 46:3, 50:3, 51:17, 51:19, 123:23, 123:25, 147:10, 169:13 46:5. 50:29. 51:7. 71:16, 79:20, 79:27, 59:10, 64:21, 65:19, 123:27, 124:2, hang [1] - 113:5 69:24, 69:27, 81:24, 83:15 65:25, 67:9, 67:10, 125:13, 128:2, 132:6, hanging [1] - 113:2 83:5, 98:21, 99:3, grateful [1] - 54:23 67:19, 68:9, 69:15, 143:3, 146:9, 146:12, happy [10] - 22:6, 101:10, 103:14, gravamen [1] - 78:2 72:27, 75:5, 75:9, 160:9, 164:29, 165:1, 50:25, 53:1, 145:23, 106:12, 115:17, grave [4] - 45:27, 77:4, 77:8, 77:9, 80:5, 165:3, 167:21, 176:2, 183:1, 189:26, 117:19, 125:2, 126:2, 46:11, 69:3, 130:18 80:18, 81:4, 81:11, 176:5, 177:15, 180:20 189:27, 189:29, 140:13, 140:14, great [8] - 57:26, 82:11, 82:21, 82:27, generally [11] - 10:9, 190:16, 190:17 140:17, 180:11 83:1, 120:20, 143:10, 83:1, 83:3, 83:4, 89:3, 10:20, 29:6, 34:9, hard [5] - 34:11, **HEARING** [5] - 6:1, 157:5, 161:11, 174:8 89:5, 90:11, 103:27, 34:25, 39:27, 60:21, 37:25, 51:16, 140:6 64:1, 93:1, 94:1, **GRIFFIN** [1] - 2:18 108:1, 108:9, 110:21, 81:23, 113:15, hardly [2] - 48:5, 192:9 grotesque [1] -110:23, 111:6, 156:22, 160:2 165:10 hearing [26] - 12:13, 115:23 111:17, 111:28, generous [1] - 113:8 harm [1] - 96:2 17:1, 33:3, 90:19, ground [2] - 163:28, 111:29, 112:12, gentlemen [1] -95:14, 132:5, 135:15, HARTY [1] - 3:5 169:3 114:3, 117:13, 92:19 141:12, 143:16, **HATCH** [4] - 3:31, grounds [1] - 188:22 120:25, 125:23, genuine [1] - 13:25 145:20, 153:3, 3:31, 4:2, 4:3 group [1] - 105:16 128:3, 128:8, 129:25, **GERAGHTY**[1] - 3:2 153:10, 154:9, hate [2] - 129:6, grumpy [1] - 109:27 129:28, 132:21, GERALD[1] - 3:20 129:7 154:10, 158:2, 160:4, GSOC [4] - 29:4, 132:27, 133:22, **GERARD** [1] - 2:22 160:5, 167:3, 167:14, HAVING [5] - 6:15, 29:6, 131:21, 157:25 135:3, 135:27, Gillane [5] - 21:11, 64:7, 94:6, 107:20, 172:7, 173:22, guard [3] - 13:3, 138:27, 149:15, 23:11, 24:19, 25:28, 174:21, 174:29, 122:8 25:14, 110:24 157:15, 157:16, 58:27 176:25, 179:8, 191:1 Hawkes [2] - 134:21, quards [8] - 86:6, 164:28, 167:7, gist [1] - 49:20 134:22 hearings [5] - 45:28, 108:13, 110:16, 170:17, 171:15, 135:9, 135:24, given [22] - 7:17, HAYES[1] - 3:27 111:3, 126:9, 130:11, 172:28, 173:29, 190:27, 191:5 33:15, 69:15, 71:28, head [9] - 87:9, 88:2, 131:4. 186:9 174:26, 177:8, 87:26, 91:19, 103:7, hears [1] - 60:2 91:6, 91:13, 124:17, Guerin [21] - 14:9, 179:23, 182:9, 132:9, 132:10, hearsay [8] - 16:2, 132:26, 156:24, 18:26, 19:10, 19:27, 183:22, 184:10, 17:14, 17:27, 32:15. 138:27. 152:23. 176:16, 182:1 25:4, 25:6, 25:7, 26:2, 186:19, 186:24, 157:5, 158:13, 49:27, 51:22, 52:15, headed [2] - 20:6, 26:3, 26:23, 26:24, 188:2, 188:19, 189:20 163:17, 165:5, 55:19 186:22 28:22, 28:23, 31:8, garda [16] - 11:8, 166:18, 168:5, **HEGARTY**[1] - 3:23 headline [1] - 20:18 31:13, 39:28, 43:23, 20:11, 20:22, 20:28, 168:10, 172:3, 185:23 headquarters [1] -Hegarty [4] - 118:3, 53:3, 53:4, 53:6, 24:28, 27:6, 29:2, 118:4, 118:7, 118:9 glad [1] - 55:19 183:23 55:21 31:24, 52:8, 71:12,

identifying [1] held [8] - 6:23, 16:1, 166:3, 190:24 include [3] - 25:9, 49:13, 54:3, 60:27, 37:20, 104:11, 106:7, hoped [2] - 168:18, 141:17 27:14, 124:25 62:23, 74:6, 75:6, 123:24, 124:2, 141:19 177:2 identity [4] - 65:10, included [5] - 25:4, 77:4, 82:25, 91:4, 105:23, 115:2, hoping [1] - 163:9 **HELD** [1] - 1:17 69:17, 74:9, 78:18 25:6. 26:2. 29:27. hello [2] - 110:19, horrible [3] - 110:28, ignored [1] - 66:17 73.19 120:21, 121:22, 129:12, 130:4, 110:24 115:23, 117:16 ill [1] - 89:18 includes [1] - 82:17 130:12, 130:15, help [8] - 63:18, Hospital [1] - 124:25 illegality [1] - 96:26 including [2] - 98:28, 130:26, 132:1, 133:6, 65:6, 86:23, 126:25, hospitals [1] -103:27 illegally [1] - 135:20 138:26, 146:22, 127:8, 128:15, 124:26 imagine [1] - 106:28 incorrect [2] - 53:28, 148:6, 167:2, 172:5, 171:25, 172:21 73:1 hotel [2] - 44:20, imbued [1] - 53:24 helped [2] - 65:5, incorrectly [1] -173:20, 177:26, 173:5 immediate [2] -179:21, 179:29, Hotel [2] - 41:3, 75:24, 183:27 170:20 180:5, 181:10, helpful [3] - 10:4, 133:13 increased [1] immediately [6] -187:12, 187:19 41:9, 174:16 hour [2] - 139:21, 173:21 46:20, 86:25, 89:4, informed [4] - 30:5, herewith [1] - 74:18 165:16 105:19, 145:11, 158:1 indeed [17] - 38:10, 30:10, 30:11, 114:19 hesitate [1] - 47:27 41:29, 45:9, 50:6, hours [5] - 41:8, Immigration [1] informing [1] hesitated [1] - 89:9 63:19, 70:16, 71:9, 140:4, 158:19, 108.9 119:26 158:22, 159:14 76:2, 98:9, 142:4, Higgins [1] - 53:8 impact [7] - 87:6, inherent [1] - 101:6 161:2, 161:10, 165:9, high [1] - 188:20 House [22] - 14:1, 92:12, 186:6, 189:9, inherently [1] - 62:11 175:22, 184:7, 185:3, 19:18, 34:9, 34:25, High [1] - 120:17 189:13, 190:8, 190:9 initial [1] - 181:24 69:26, 75:26, 82:1, 191:17 impacted [1] - 90:9 higher [1] - 31:18 initiative [1] - 23:10 82:5, 98:9, 98:10, independent [3] higher-ranking [1] impart [2] - 62:23, injuries [1] - 186:11 98:15, 98:23, 110:20, 14:8, 30:15, 133:25 31:18 121:22 input [1] - 28:24 Independent [1] -112:2, 112:16, imparted [2] - 48:18, highlight [1] - 20:26 inquiries [1] - 19:26 112.28 113.16 26.28 51:9 **highly** [1] - 67:2 113:18, 114:12, independently [1] inquiring [1] - 44:14 himself [3] - 28:23, imparting [3] -114:19, 114:20, 87:24 **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:3, 48:12, 48:28, 177:26 116:27, 176:23 116:23 INDEX [1] - 5:1 1:9 hindsight [2] - 70:1, impatience [1] -HOUSE [3] - 2:11, Inquiry [1] - 94:25 148:17 indicate [4] - 21:18, 2:19, 2:24 29:16, 33:20, 134:29 inquiry [13] - 13:9, history [1] - 86:11 implicating [1] house [1] - 178:7 indicated [7] - 18:12, 13:15, 13:17, 15:13, hit [2] - 82:10, 90:4 125:4 Houses [1] - 139:21 26:15, 66:4, 92:21, 18:26, 18:27, 19:16, implication [1] **hmm** [3] - 15:20, Housing [1] - 94:12 92:25, 163:13, 167:1 31:4, 90:19, 90:27, 65:20 83:22, 85:5 137:9, 137:11, 137:23 **HSE** [12] - 115:27, indicates [1] implications [2] -**HOGAN**[1] - 3:30 124:5, 124:7, 124:10, insert [1] - 151:16 187:19 132:27, 133:21 hold [2] - 20:15, insight [1] - 144:13 124:11, 124:15, indicating [1] - 187:9 implicitly [1] -97:22 insofar [3] - 65:5, 124:21, 124:22, indication [1] -178:28 holding [3] - 97:16, 124:29, 125:7, 125:8, 184:28 98:6, 173:7 imply [1] - 126:16 105:6, 143:29 125:11 import [5] - 41:20, indirectly [4] - 7:10, inspection [1] home [5] - 48:6, human [1] - 189:16 17:1, 31:23, 182:4 125:20 41:24, 69:2, 75:23, 108:27, 109:17, hundred [2] - 139:6, individual [12] inspectorate [1] -89:14 113:9, 114:11 163:17 17:10, 17:13, 24:13, 184:11 honest [19] - 15:26, important [10] - 8:12, hundreds [1] -32:26, 36:23, 45:26, instance [10] - 24:20, 34:6, 53:27, 61:12, 8:14. 52:19. 52:23. 178:23 55:14, 60:6, 78:4, 48:20, 66:7, 99:2. 25:1, 61:20, 62:7, 71:10, 91:7, 113:7, hunky [1] - 186:27 64:21. 69:18. 116:10. 99:13, 115:28, 185:7 126:20, 126:28, 97:15, 101:8, 184:19 hunky-dory [1] individuals [3] -119:24, 137:18, 127:24, 127:26, impressed [1] -161:24 186:27 36:20, 98:13, 98:28 129:5, 139:6, 139:28, 13:18 Hynes [1] - 111:23 Industry [3] - 123:1, instances [2] impression [5] -140:7, 143:10, 123:3, 123:9 148:21, 186:1 148:22, 168:14, 177:9 46:9, 69:5, 70:3, I instigated [1] - 102:5 110:13, 163:11 inferring [1] - 173:17 honestly [1] - 40:5 INSTRUCTED [13] influence [2] - 47:19, honesty [1] - 65:7 improper[4] - 52:25, 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:28, 144:29, 146:6, 146:10 Honour [13] i.e [1] - 55:20 inform [1] - 26:10 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:13, 108:11, 108:19, IN [1] - 1:17 idea [4] - 137:23, 3:20, 3:23, 3:27, 3:30, **informant** [1] - 78:18 109:8, 109:29, 110:5, in-depth [1] - 185:7 166:24, 168:13, 189:2 4:2 information [49] -110:15, 112:19, in-house [1] - 178:7 identified [4] - 31:8, instructed [1] -6:17, 19:21, 25:10, 112:23, 114:25, inappropriate [4] -74:25, 74:29, 134:1 115:15, 116:21, 31:16, 33:17, 33:26, 47:24, 52:25, 145:3, identify [6] - 10:15, instruction [1] - 8:7 120:24, 121:28 33:29, 34:21, 34:22, 145.5 25:13, 25:14, 25:16, 36:9, 36:16, 48:13, instructions [1] hope [6] - 54:18, incident [3] - 20:11, 74:27, 175:21 82:19 48:16, 48:28, 49:12, 74:15, 143:10, 162:8, 71:7, 85:10

INSTRUMENT [1] -1:8 integrity [1] - 71:29 intended [5] - 81:22, 154:2, 154:14, 178:13 intents [1] - 85:3 inter [1] - 132:16 interaction [9] -40:11, 49:18, 56:19, 56:21, 69:21, 76:14, 76:16, 76:17, 95:10 interactions [2] -95:8. 173:1 interest [6] - 13:25, 49:7, 91:10, 121:7, 135:7, 140:12 interested [9] -59:18, 86:25, 129:15, 129:16, 164:10, 164:12, 187:24. 187:25, 190:6 interesting [1] - 53:6 interests [2] - 68:16, 68:29 **interim** [3] - 181:19, 181.24 184.28 interpret [1] - 142:28 interpretation [5] -81:19, 142:19, 143:4, 164:2, 173:15 interview [15] -19:29, 41:1, 41:16, 41:20, 41:21, 41:23, 41:26, 67:6, 67:8, 68:13, 70:1, 78:27, 79:13, 79:24, 83:6 interviewed [1] -66:25 **INTO** [1] - 1:3 introduced [2] -38:13, 38:14 intuition [1] - 24:10 investigate [5] -17:22, 17:29, 96:10, 96:28, 161:22 investigated [9] -20:28, 24:26, 25:3, 52:3, 52:8, 125:22, 126:8, 147:18, 149:19 investigating [3] -98:6, 104:14, 159:2 investigation [21] -9:15, 12:27, 13:26, 18:23, 19:19, 19:24, 25:1, 27:4, 27:16, 46:15, 46:18, 47:7, 59:17, 126:13, 131:16, 150:8, 152:1, 162:13, 175:24, 182:18

Investigation [1] -55:22 investigations [4] -18:3, 26:4, 47:2, 181.17 investigator[1] -181:29 investigators [1] -28:29 invited [1] - 131:29 involve [1] - 124:18 involved[14] - 24:28, 46:26, 52:8, 67:13, 75:14, 117:6, 128:16, 132:10, 133:14, 134:27, 146:18, 148:19, 162:17, 167:3 involvement [2] -81:1, 162:29 involves [1] - 169:6 Ireland [1] - 110:8 Irish [3] - 26:28, 123:22, 123:23 ironic [1] - 109:15 issue [71] - 7:5, 7:12, 7:14, 7:22, 8:4, 8:13, 8:18, 9:22, 10:1, 11:14, 11:22, 11:23, 13:14, 14:28, 15:27, 16:27, 17:24, 18:1, 18:5, 27:26, 28:14, 29:4, 29:27, 30:6, 30:12, 56:15, 56:24, 94:27, 104:13, 106:3, 106:16, 125:5, 127:5, 127:7, 127:28, 128:2, 128:27, 129:9, 129:25, 129:29, 130:1, 130:15, 130:17, 130:29, 132:22, 132:25, 132:26, 132:29, 133:5, 137:5, 138:26, 141:15, 141:26, 144:19, 148:15, 154:7. 157:13. 157:23, 162:12, 163:1, 165:25, 173:26, 180:8, 181:22, 182:19, 183:29, 190:24 issued [1] - 21:16 issues [57] - 7:6, 7:19, 9:8, 10:7, 10:25, 10:27, 11:15, 11:16, 11:22, 12:16, 13:7, 13:10, 13:22, 13:24, 18:16, 30:13, 30:22, 30:27, 34:5, 38:11,

39:16, 39:18, 39:25,

43:1, 45:24, 51:2, 51:3, 63:8, 66:9, 66:13, 86:16, 95:26, 104:14, 128:6, 128:7, 129:4, 129:9, 129:12, 131:14, 131:27, 132:3, 132:19, 135:8, 135:12, 135:26, 145:16, 156:28, 157:8, 165:25, 167:12, 169:6, 178:24, 181:9, 184:1, 190:14, 191:11 it'll [2] - 151:26, 164:7 itself [7] - 26:19, 42:16, 46:13, 98:27, 100:7, 112:17, 160:4

### J

jacket [1] - 122:12

James's [1] - 124:25

January [9] - 15:22,

43:9, 95:5, 95:6, 101:29, 106:2, 106:9, 136:24, 171:2 **Jesus** [3] - 129:6, 159:14 185:10 JMcG [2] - 140:27, 155:3 job [7] - 69:20, 107:2, 109:21, 112:1, 112:29, 119:13, 190:10 jobs [2] - 59:28, 180:1 Jobstown [1] - 82:18 John [17] - 6:8, 51:22, 68:3, 74:14, 98:8, 102:14, 106:19, 107:17, 131:15, 135:15, 135:17, 141:11, 143:23, 145:17, 152:17, 170:2, 170:13 **JOHN** [9] - 2:17, 2:28, 3:5, 3:9, 3:17, 3:23, 4:1, 5:22, 107:20 Jonathan [1] - 85:26 journalist [11] - 28:3, 31:26, 59:8, 60:24, 61:7, 85:18, 85:26, 91:22, 91:29, 92:1, 119:24 journalists [7] -31:29, 59:27, 60:19, 60:29, 62:2, 63:12, 91:27

JUDGE [2] - 1:12, 2:3 judges [2] - 115:1, 115:5 judgment [7] - 18:26, 32:10, 32:17, 32:21, 62:13, 65:7, 67:5 jumped [2] - 11:22, 44:8 jumping [2] - 44:4, 62:22 justice [1] - 66:12 Justice [19] - 17:7, 49:20, 65:14, 65:18, 65:23, 65:27, 66:3, 68:2, 86:19, 86:22, 112:13, 123:16, 123:17, 124:8, 125:14, 162:26, 164:28, 164:29, 185:15 JUSTICE [3] - 1:8, 1:12, 2:2 justifiable [1] -129:27 justify [1] - 183:24

Judge [4] - 122:11,

159:5, 159:19, 161:16

judge [1] - 160:25

## K

**KATHLEEN** [1] - 2:7

KAVANAGH[1] - 2:4

KEAN [2] - 3:20, 3:20 keen [1] - 142:27 keep [3] - 44:29, 173:2, 175:2 keeping [4] - 74:15, 132:6, 165:11, 178:29 **KELLY** [2] - 3:30, 4:2 Kelly [2] - 11:20, 11.21 Kennedy [36] - 6:8, 67:14, 68:4, 68:28, 69:23, 72:9, 74:3, 74:5, 77:3, 77:16, 77:19, 77:22, 79:11, 81:1, 83:29, 84:5, 84:23, 86:1, 87:5, 88:13, 89:8, 90:1, 107:18, 107:24, 108:18, 113:17, 113:28, 114:10, 116:1, 116:24, 117:5, 117:23, 117:25, 118:8, 118:10, 121:11 **KENNEDY** [4] - 3:23, 5:22, 107:20, 118:18

87:22, 107:23 Kenny [2] - 27:2, 27.8 kept [9] - 49:15, 55:20, 165:8, 165:9, 165:16, 178:9, 185:15, 185:16, 185.19 Kevin [5] - 174:19, 174:28, 175:2, 175:4, 175:5 **KEVIN'S** [2] - 3:32, key [6] - 43:10, 44:1, 44:4, 44:14, 132:22 Killinarden [1] -82:18 kind [22] - 16:25, 32:6, 34:2, 70:10, 76:17, 82:8, 89:19, 89:20, 105:17, 109:21, 114:5, 115:17, 119:7, 119:25, 120:11, 134:7, 161:29, 172:5, 174:16, 181:2, 183:15, 189:19 kinds [3] - 82:24, 119:9, 119:10 knowing [1] - 159:20 **knowledge** [11] - 9:7, 34:20, 54:4, 69:12, 71:13, 73:3, 73:9, 91:24, 115:8, 125:4, 146:22 known [5] - 28:11, 37:19, 68:15, 73:11, 124:19 knows [4] - 60:24, 142:8, 164:7, 191:1

Kennedy's [2] -

# L

Labour [3] - 109:4, 109:15, 109:22 lack [3] - 12:17, 12:21, 29:9 ladies [1] - 92:19 laid [2] - 104:21, 104:28 lapse [1] - 159:18 large [2] - 37:17, 114:21 last [17] - 28:25, 33:14, 40:22, 41:6, 41:8, 57:6, 80:11, 111:24, 123:9, 124:14, 139:13,

139:14, 154:26, 132:24 103:1, 103:5, 103:6, looked [15] - 61:20, 20:22, 23:2, 26:3, 182:26, 183:12, 188:4 legs [4] - 70:15, 127:25, 148:16 97:9, 139:29, 145:22, 52:9 lasts [1] - 165:15 71:28, 72:7, 91:11 likewise [1] - 32:18 157:9, 157:21, man [9] - 68:18, Limerick [1] - 110:10 68:20, 113:8, 160:25, late [1] - 14:15 **Lehane** [7] - 56:3, 175:29, 178:21, latest [1] - 23:1 168:28. 169:20. line [10] - 45:15, 182:6, 182:9, 182:10, 163:27, 174:20, latter [1] - 156:23 171:26, 172:18, 45:20, 48:7, 103:29, 183:4, 184:29, 179:24, 184:14 173:6, 173:8 127:22, 135:23, 185:29, 186:26 man's [3] - 69:4, latterly [2] - 18:29, looking [21] - 13:21, **LEHANE** [18] - 3:9, 168:6, 168:7, 180:1 91:25, 174:19 39:26 5:7, 5:30, 36:27, 57:18, 59:7, 94:26, lines [9] - 18:2, man-to-man [1] law [1] - 47:29 55:26, 56:2, 56:3, 145:18, 152:24, 120:14, 134:20, 179:24 **LAW**[1] - 3:13 **Law** [2] - 120:16, 103:20, 168:25, 157:22, 168:1, 138:10, 140:4, 144:7, managed [1] -168:26, 169:22, 175:22, 175:23, 152:3, 153:5, 161:24, 159:18 121:9 162:19, 164:24, 171:20, 171:22, 176:20, 176:25 management [2] law-abiding [1] -172:1, 173:9, 176:3, 164:26, 165:1, 165:3, 47:29 linger [1] - 42:20 12:10, 156:25 181:20, 185:3, 185:4, 176:7, 176:11 liom [1] - 91:9 mandate [1] - 97:28 **LAWLOR**[1] - 3:9 Leinster [20] - 34:9, 188:13 listen [1] - 115:13 manner [2] - 69:16, lawyers [1] - 147:5 looks [2] - 152:21, 34:25, 69:26, 75:26, listened [5] - 115:10, 189:28 lay [1] - 31:1 161:17 82:1, 82:5, 98:9, 167:29, 174:5, March [6] - 43:9, lead [1] - 47:6 98:10, 98:15, 98:23, loop [1] - 175:2 176:21, 176:24 43:26, 78:23, 79:25, **LEADER** [14] - 2:7, 110:20, 112:2, loosely [1] - 132:28 136:9, 146:20 listening [1] - 37:20 5:18, 5:23, 94:3, 94:7, 112:16, 112:28, lose [2] - 143:15, lists [1] - 134:10 marginalised [1] -94:9, 101:13, 107:11, 113:16, 113:18, literally [1] - 113:9 143:19 15:3 107:17, 107:21, 114:12, 114:19,  $\textbf{losing} \, [\textbf{1}] - 97 \vdots 27$ LITTLE [2] - 2:20, margins [1] - 152:28 107:23, 117:22, 114:20, 116:23 loss [2] - 181:6 2:25 **MARK** [1] - 3:5 118:1, 118:16 length [2] - 44:6, lost [3] - 66:20, marks [1] - 90:26 leader [16] - 6:26, live [2] - 7:14, 47:6 45.8 106:26, 182:19 Marrinan [5] - 47:12, local [2] - 120:29, 7:29. 9:29. 20:14. lengthy [3] - 158:13, 20:21, 22:29, 27:9, 121:6 **LOWER** [2] - 3:31, 47:15, 48:7, 87:16, 191:2, 191:25 32:2, 32:7, 35:10, Local [1] - 94:13 191:27 less [3] - 103:5, loyalty [1] - 116:29 45:2, 57:20, 59:25, locate [1] - 65:9 **MARRINAN** [9] - 2:6, 159:9, 159:25 ludicrous [1] -5:12, 64:4, 64:8, 64:9, 69:24, 100:5, 118:20 located [2] - 65:22,  $\textbf{letter}\, {\tt [31]} - 6{:}20,\, 7{:}1,$ 171:16 88:25, 191:25, Leaders' [1] - 43:4 65:26 14:13, 15:10, 19:2, leaking [1] - 13:20 **LUNCH** [2] - 93:1, 191:28, 192:6 logic [1] - 189:17 28:16, 33:16, 33:23, 94:1 Martin [44] - 6:5, leaks [1] - 7:18 logical [1] - 189:15 34:22, 40:25, 42:3, **léi** [1] - 91:9 6:11, 6:18, 15:7, leap [1] - 60:23 Ionely [1] - 111:18 44:10, 44:11, 44:13, 15:18, 20:7, 20:12, learn [1] - 119:9 look [58] - 20:4, 50:10, 53:29, 65:14, 20:25, 22:29, 27:9, М learned [2] - 53:26, 44:26, 58:8, 63:11, 73:19, 73:24, 73:28, 33:5, 33:12, 33:19, 112:19, 114:13, 73:10 73:29, 74:3, 74:6, 37:1, 37:4, 38:15, 115:11. 115:12. learning [1] - 38:8 **M.E** [1] - 2:29 83:13, 83:28, 100:3, 40:2, 41:23, 42:19, 116:24, 118:25, least [9] - 11:19, 109:8, 109:16, **MADE** [2] - 1:3, 1:8 42:28, 43:8, 44:13, 41:25, 52:20, 121:25, 119:22, 121:11, madman [2] -116:17, 147:10, 44:19, 45:7, 45:8, 132:9, 134:24, 136:5, 141:13, 154:1, 159:3, 188:22, 188:24 169:13 138:5, 142:20, 45:15, 48:26, 49:2, 167:20, 173:14 letters [4] - 37:9, main [4] - 6:26, 49:24, 50:20, 53:10, leave [6] - 109:20, 142:23, 143:14, 24:24. 31:12. 148:13 132:15, 177:12, 53:18, 54:18, 55:25, 113:10, 124:9, 143:22, 143:27, 177:18 mainstream [1] -55:29, 59:6, 69:25, 144:4, 145:15, 146:4. 134:25, 162:24, 14:29 level [2] - 69:4, 83:3 72:5, 81:25, 91:8, 147:6, 148:28, 167:10 levelled [1] - 115:21 maintenance [3] -111:20, 140:25, 150:25, 154:18, leaving [4] - 13:17, 132:20, 133:1, 145:26 levels [2] - 82:23, 149:14, 155:2 154:21, 154:23, 44:17, 59:15, 181:9 major [6] - 71:4, 82.29 MARTIN [3] - 3:26, 157:29, 159:23, led [4] - 43:22, 47:1, LIAM [1] - 3:27 129:23, 129:24, 5:3, 6:15 160:13, 161:21, 53:8, 117:18 130:3, 132:29, 142:2 **Library** [2] - 120:16, Martin's [1] - 21:1 164:1, 164:7, 166:24, left [9] - 16:15, malfeasance [1] -121.9 MASON [1] - 3:27 168:11, 168:12, 102:25, 105:21, 71.4 life [2] - 111:22, material [12] - 9:3, 173:12, 176:28, 108:13, 120:24, malicious [4] -121:23 178:7, 179:9, 181:16, 13:19, 16:2, 16:6, 123:6, 142:24, 116:26, 117:2, lifted [1] - 106:21 23:17, 30:19, 31:12, 182:12, 183:3, 142:29, 162:26 light [5] - 99:22, 119:21, 121:15 184:12, 184:18, 32:25, 51:5, 52:13, left-hand [1] - 123:6 121:24, 163:22, **MALONE**[1] - 1:30 55:18, 55:20 185:2, 185:7, 185:18, legal [5] - 96:5, 96:7, 166:19, 185:21 Malone [1] - 1:25 materials [3] - 32:14, 185:27, 186:10, 138:19, 175:19, Maloney [1] - 109:13 likelihood [1] - 134:4 186:13, 186:18, 70:21, 94:11 175:25 malpractice [4] likely [6] - 53:11, 190:4, 191:4 matter [38] - 13:25, legislation [1] -

				1
14:8, 14:18, 14:19,	43:27, 44:21, 45:24,	McCullagh [2] -	173:16, 176:15,	141:2, 164:9, 164:16,
18:19, 19:1, 20:2,	46:9, 46:21, 47:2,	70:22, 71:20	176:20, 176:26,	166:20
25:22, 43:17, 50:14,	47:7, 47:21, 49:19,	McDonagh [4] -	178:5, 178:6, 191:9	meeting [124] - 9:20,
51:25, 64:29, 65:15,	50:6, 52:2, 52:21,	3:26, 6:10, 57:14,	MCGUINNESS [3] -	11:26, 12:1, 12:4,
65:18, 65:19, 70:20,	53:7, 55:5, 57:22,	57:15	2:6, 2:16, 5:4	13:12, 15:5, 15:14,
79:12, 79:15, 80:6,	58:19, 58:21, 59:14,	McDOWELL [2] -	McGuinness's [6] -	16:4, 16:17, 16:18,
81:5, 81:18, 96:6,	62:16, 62:20, 64:15,	2:9, 33:8	39:2, 45:3, 49:25,	18:22, 20:12, 21:2,
97:2, 99:24, 100:6,	66:5, 66:21, 66:28,	McENROY [1] - 3:2	49:26, 95:2, 177:21	21:7, 21:20, 21:28,
100:13, 101:17,	67:3, 68:15, 69:9,	McGarry [23] - 2:10,	McPartland [1] -	21:29, 23:15, 23:18,
104:12, 126:12,	69:28, 70:4, 70:26,	5:19, 5:28, 76:22,	59:1	24:13, 25:21, 25:28,
133:3, 140:11,	70:27, 71:2, 71:9,	101:17, 101:19,	meal [1] - 111:11	25:29, 27:17, 29:5,
150:15, 151:1, 151:9,	71:14, 72:1, 72:4,	101:21, 103:17,	mean [53] - 15:17,	29:19, 32:19, 32:23,
151:29, 164:24,	72:18, 72:20, 72:28,	103:29, 117:24,	21:19, 22:1, 23:27,	39:15, 40:23, 41:2,
180:8, 183:12	73:6, 73:11, 74:17,	147:2, 147:4, 150:12,	27:26, 28:9, 31:19,	41:4, 41:17, 41:27,
matter-of-fact [4] -	75:9, 75:12, 75:19,	156:17, 159:10,	54:10, 56:14, 59:22,	47:18, 51:23, 54:9,
126:12, 151:1, 151:9,	76:5, 78:27, 80:8,	159:26, 160:16,	62:2, 62:29, 63:1,	54:11, 57:20, 57:22,
151:29	81:2, 81:7, 81:17,	160:17, 161:5, 161:9,	65:3, 72:19, 78:1,	57:25, 67:11, 72:17,
matters [36] - 9:2,	82:12, 86:4, 86:11,	162:12	78:17, 79:3, 85:3,	72:19, 73:5, 73:26,
9:23, 30:24, 31:10,	86:13, 86:26, 86:28,	McGuinness [119] -	98:15, 99:18, 99:19,	76:4, 76:10, 76:12,
31:11, 46:6, 64:20,	91:20, 91:28, 95:20,	3:9, 5:8, 5:27, 5:31,	99:28, 103:6, 104:18,	76:15, 76:16, 77:18, 77:19, 77:28, 77:29,
64:23, 66:16, 78:24,	96:20, 97:10, 97:25, 98:2, 99:1, 99:7,	6:4, 6:16, 6:17, 7:3,	106:17, 109:29,	78:1, 78:20, 78:28,
78:29, 84:18, 96:3, 96:6, 96:25, 96:29,	99:17, 99:26, 100:16,	8:6, 14:15, 16:9, 17:3,	110:24, 113:20,	79:4, 81:26, 89:6,
97:6, 97:13, 129:4,	100:20, 101:1,	18:1, 33:18, 35:27,	113:22, 114:4, 114:5, 114:6, 115:13,	95:4, 95:5, 105:26,
129:18, 129:22,	101:22, 102:9,	37:14, 38:28, 40:11, 40:17, 40:20, 41:8,	119:16, 120:3,	106:8, 106:15,
130:2, 131:11,	102:24, 103:9, 104:1,	41:26, 42:2, 44:17,	120:15, 129:23,	108:25, 112:22,
138:24, 140:2,	105:5, 105:10,	45:11, 46:28, 47:1,	133:3, 133:4, 135:2,	112:24, 114:28,
147:18, 148:14,	105:17, 106:2,	47:11, 48:4, 48:8,	138:18, 144:24,	116:21, 116:22,
169:10, 169:18,	106:10, 107:3, 107:4,	49:13, 49:17, 50:7,	162:21, 166:27,	142:25, 144:3,
169:21, 169:22,	108:22, 110:29,	51:22, 53:12, 53:16,	167:12, 173:29,	144:25, 145:14,
180:28, 180:29,	111:15, 115:7, 115:8,	53:22, 54:6, 55:4,	180:20, 182:19,	146:11, 146:14,
186:22, 189:15	115:22, 116:2,	56:4, 56:19, 56:23,	182:22, 184:13,	147:21, 147:23,
MATTERS [1] - 1:5	116:26, 116:28,	56:24, 57:10, 57:17,	185:15, 187:23	147:28, 148:7,
Maurice [45] - 7:4,	117:2, 117:4, 117:6,	57:18, 57:21, 57:24,	meaning [4] - 68:25,	148:11, 152:16,
7:6, 9:4, 10:7, 10:12,	117:10, 125:4, 125:22, 127:21,	58:7, 58:22, 81:27,	117:13, 162:7, 162:8	153:14, 153:20, 153:22, 153:25,
13:13, 15:2, 15:8,	129:4, 129:10,	92:25, 102:14,	means [1] - 136:26	153.22, 153.25,
24:1, 24:28, 26:10, 30:12, 32:22, 39:24,	131:28, 132:8,	105:28, 107:7, 118:5, 122:5, 122:9, 122:15,	meant [2] - 151:8,	154:21, 155:9,
45:24, 46:9, 46:20,	137:13, 137:21,	122:20, 135:2, 141:2,	160:3 measures [1] - 49:10	155:12, 155:15,
47:21, 53:7, 62:16,	138:1, 138:21,	141:11, 141:18,	mechanism [5] -	155:21, 155:22,
62:20, 64:15, 68:15,	141:16, 142:3,	141:20, 142:23,	30:7, 30:21, 30:26,	156:2, 156:5, 156:9,
69:14, 70:4, 70:26,	142:14, 147:5, 149:9,	143:9, 143:24, 144:3,	30:29, 177:16	160:1, 161:3, 163:15,
70:27, 71:2, 71:9,	149:15, 149:18,	144:22, 144:24,	media [24] - 13:20,	165:22, 166:21,
71:14, 72:1, 73:11,	152:11, 159:29,	145:6, 145:17,	33:25, 33:27, 34:8,	169:6, 169:8, 169:9,
74:17, 78:27, 81:16,	160:20, 161:18,	146:11, 146:15,	34:16, 34:17, 34:19,	169:10, 169:23,
82:11, 86:3, 86:13,	166:22, 166:25,	146:28, 147:22,	34:29, 35:1, 36:2,	169:26, 170:1, 170:4,
86:26, 90:23, 91:28,	171:18, 174:10,	148:12, 150:4, 150:5,	36:8, 36:17, 36:23,	170:13, 170:21,
111:15, 171:18,	177:17, 181:14,	152:17, 152:27,	43:14, 57:27, 75:7,	170:26, 171:4,
188:21, 188:29	182:12, 185:3, 187:24, 188:21,	153:2, 153:4, 153:29,	81:28, 91:16, 98:18,	172:23, 173:2, 174:4, 174:15, 175:8, 177:22
<b>McCabe</b> [164] - 2:9,	189:1, 189:10, 189:23	154:6, 154:8, 154:13,	99:14, 104:7, 105:24,	meetings [5] - 35:13,
7:1, 7:4, 7:7, 7:9, 8:29, 9:4, 9:8, 9:10,	McCabe's [15] -	155:5, 155:15, 155:19, 156:13,	128:1, 131:25	76:11, 104:11,
9:20, 10:7, 10:12,	15:25, 43:18, 69:14,	163:14, 163:23,	MEEHAN [1] - 2:22 meet [29] - 7:4, 7:6,	106:18, 174:17
13:13, 14:17, 15:2,	86:22, 90:23, 98:1,	164:10, 166:1, 166:5,	7:8, 8:29, 10:4, 15:16,	<b>MEMBER</b> [2] - 1:12,
15:8, 16:21, 18:9,	100:22, 125:28,	166:7, 166:15,	20:3, 20:7, 20:25,	2:2
24:2, 24:29, 25:12,	150:19, 150:22,	167:19, 167:21,	21:13, 22:6, 22:11,	member [15] - 65:25,
26:10, 30:12, 31:20,	151:5, 151:15, 152:6,	167:27, 168:27,	22:26, 22:29, 23:16,	67:19, 82:13, 94:19,
31:28, 32:22, 36:19,	152:8, 190:3	168:29, 170:2,	24:14, 28:28, 32:19,	94:26, 99:14, 103:14,
39:3, 39:10, 39:24,	McCANN [2] - 2:22,	170:14, 170:23,	62:3, 67:7, 79:12,	107:29, 109:4, 111:5,
40:3, 40:6, 43:1,	3:16	172:2, 172:3, 172:7,	111:10, 120:9, 121:2,	111:7, 120:26, 173:25
	McCOURT [1] - 3:2			

members [18] - 37:6, 39:12, 75:6, 75:9, 77:8, 82:11, 82:29, 83:2, 89:23, 104:13, 104:25, 105:2, 105:9, 158:24, 167:8, 179:12, 179:28 membership [1] -94:22 memo [3] - 87:10, 165:7, 165:12 memories [1] - 104:5 memory [11] - 21:26, 54:20, 76:12, 87:23, 87:25, 98:8, 100:8, 100:12, 100:21, 101:27, 102:1 memos [4] - 165:8, 165:9, 165:11, 165:17 mention [5] - 25:17, 40:22, 115:27, 168:7, 168:9 mentioned [22] -14:19, 19:28, 25:12, 25:18, 44:18, 50:5, 50:7, 52:12, 70:24, 77:3, 84:17, 95:11, 120:1, 120:4, 126:28, 129:18, 142:13, 161:19, 162:6, 168:11, 183:13, 184.17 mentioning[1] -44:20 merely [7] - 69:6, 69:8, 69:11, 69:20, 75:19, 79:27, 85:1 merit [1] - 96:23 merited [2] - 18:27, 26:18 merits [1] - 65:29 message [6] - 75:21, 75:23, 85:17, 155:10, 186:28, 187:1 messages [1] -154:24 messenger[1] -75:22 met [23] - 7:1, 10:6, 10:28, 12:17, 15:6, 15:18, 22:12, 23:21, 25:25, 27:9, 32:22, 39:5, 44:2, 44:19, 57:27, 58:2, 62:15, 73:11, 75:27, 96:22, 111:22, 127:27, 141:4 meticulous [1] -32:26 MICHAEL [8] - 2:9, 2:27, 3:23, 5:29,

103:18, 117:25, 163:4, 163:6 Michael [6] - 125:18, 125:19, 163:7, 181:15, 182:11 MICHELLE [1] - 3:2 MICHEÁL [2] - 3:26, Micheál [6] - 6:5, 6:15, 20:12, 22:29, 27:9, 91:8 microphone [1] -123:5 might [55] - 6:10, 15:21, 21:20, 30:24, 38:11, 38:29, 43:10, 45:3, 48:14, 56:9, 68:18, 69:1, 83:19, 88:15, 90:5, 97:9, 97:12, 97:20, 100:11, 101:14, 102:14, 103:6, 104:24, 106:18, 106:22, 106:28, 110:25, 110:26, 117:23, 127:8, 127:12, 129:2, 141:14, 141:19, 141:29, 142:9, 142:12, 142:20, 142:25, 144:1, 144:25. 148:23. 153:9, 162:9, 162:10, 163:14, 164:4, 164:5, 166:26, 168:17, 168:18, 185:27, 191:6 mildly [1] - 183:1 mill [3] - 98:16, 119:26, 134:14 mind [15] - 13:18, 25:25, 53:3, 55:28, 60:7, 88:27, 92:8, 121:15, 129:2, 129:5, 141:13, 143:9, 172:13, 183:14, 191:7 minds [1] - 70:14 mine [4] - 71:12, 78:29, 138:29, 186:3  $\boldsymbol{minimal}~[1]-75:4$ minister [13] - 82:4, 82:21, 84:20, 91:17, 110:4, 112:1, 113:14, 114:4, 114:6, 114:24, 114:27, 115:4, 131:22 Minister [39] - 17:7, 19:25, 29:28, 30:1. 30:3, 30:6, 30:16, 30:20, 38:9, 43:26, 49:20, 68:1, 69:22, 86:18, 86:21, 94:3, 94:9, 94:12, 100:17,

101:13, 101:21, 103:18, 103:22, 103:26, 107:26, 108:8, 108:13, 112:13, 113:21, 127:11, 127:18, 127:20, 133:22, 135:4, 155:26, 156:20, 157:14, 185:28 **MINISTER** [1] - 1:8 ministerial [2] -37:21 82:5 ministers [4] - 67:24, 68:1, 156:28, 157:8 ministries [1] - 6:23 minor [1] - 66:14 minute [3] - 63:23, 78:5, 183:20 minutes [7] - 100:12, 139:25, 140:29, 158:25, 163:10, 165:15, 188:5 misconduct [2] -10:18, 116:4 misrepresenting [1] - 80:13 mistake [4] - 53:15, 53:27, 53:28 mistaken [6] - 37:11, 37:13, 38:21, 54:8, 54:20, 55:4 mistakenly [1] -53:24 mistreatment [1] mixed [1] - 172:19 module [1] - 64:28 modules [1] - 54:29 moment [8] - 56:18, 78:7, 90:1, 118:22, 154:5, 154:23, 173:16, 184:6 Monaghan [2] - 26:5, 39:19 MONDAY [2] - 1:18, Monday [1] - 40:22 money [3] - 96:11, 96:12, 96:18 Mongáin [1] - 85:17 month [6] - 7:23, 79:24, 119:28, 162:25, 162:26, 162:27 months [4] - 42:15, 98:3, 148:4, 150:11 morning [18] - 6:5,

91:6, 107:24, 108:17, 108:23, 108:26, 110:1, 112:3, 112:15, 112:22. 116:22. 191:26 Morris [1] - 120:17 MORRISSEY [1] most [7] - 90:10, 92:11, 97:15, 112:18, 177:28, 182:15, 186:8 motivated [3] -11:23, 129:15, 187:24 motivation [1] -129:3 motivations [1] -190:6 motorists [1] - 181:7 motorway [1] - 48:23 mouth [1] - 119:17 move [6] - 51:29, 121:2, 123:5, 142:1, 173:18, 175:14 moved [5] - 58:11, 123:13, 123:15, 124:5, 162:23 moving[1] - 144:2 MR [151] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4, 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:10, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 2:15, 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, 2:22, 2:23, 2:27, 2:28, 2:28, 3:2, 3:5, 3:9, 3:12, 3:16, 3:20, 3:23, 3:26, 3:27, 3:30, 4:1, 5:3, 5:4, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:11, 5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:17, 5:19, 5:20, 5:22, 5:26, 5:27, 5:28, 5:29, 5:30, 5:31, 6:4, 6:6, 6:10, 6:15, 6:16, 6:17, 33:8, 36:27, 36:28, 36:29, 37:3, 37:4, 55:26, 56:2, 56:3, 57:15, 57:17, 57:18, 64:4, 64:7, 64:8, 64:9, 76:22, 76:24, 77:1, 77:2, 77:13, 77:14, 88:22, 88:25, 88:29, 92:25, 94:6, 101:17, 101:19, 101:21, 103:17, 103:18, 103:19, 103:20, 103:21, 103:24, 103:26, 107:9, 107:20, 117:24, 117:25, 117:27, 118:5, 118:9, 118:14, 118:18, 122:5, 122:8, 122:9,

122:11, 122:15, 122:20, 135:2, 144:24, 146:28, 147:2, 147:4, 150:12. 156:17, 159:10, 159:26, 160:17, 161:5, 162:12, 163:4, 163:6, 168:25, 168:26, 169:22, 171:20, 171:22, 172:1, 173:9, 176:3, 176:7, 176:11, 178:2, 178:5, 178:6, 190:22, 191:8, 191:14, 191:25, 191:28, 192:6 MRS [1] - 3:2 MS [23] - 2:7, 2:7, 2:18, 2:18, 2:27, 3:30, 5:5, 5:18, 5:23, 33:9, 33:11, 33:12, 94:3, 94:7, 94:9, 101:13, 107:11, 107:17, 107:21, 107:23, 117:22, 118:1, 118:16 MUIRCHEARTAIGH 111 - 3:12 Mullan [1] - 73:20 MULLAN [1] - 2:7 Mullingar [1] -160:20 mundane [1] - 128:6 murder [1] - 11:20 Murphy [4] - 92:26, 94:4, 94:12, 101:13 MURPHY [5] - 2:14, 5:17, 94:6, 101:19, 103:24 Murphy's [1] - 94:9 must [11] - 17:20, 36:4, 37:11, 37:13, 116:20, 155:9, 167:23, 170:19, 172:27, 180:8, 186:21 myriad [1] - 178:24 **MÍCHEÁL** [1] - 2:15

#### Ν

Naas [1] - 48:22
name [18] - 25:16,
25:17, 33:12, 37:4,
56:3, 61:7, 74:19,
77:14, 85:11, 85:24,
89:11, 101:21,
103:26, 133:27,
133:29, 147:4,
168:28, 174:19
named [3] - 1:27,
133:19, 142:17

6:12, 33:12, 37:10,

81:25, 87:9, 88:18,

namely [1] - 24:28 names [9] - 105:15, 123:2, 133:16, 134:4, 134:5, 134:18, 142:13, 142:15 naming [1] - 89:9 national [1] - 89:3 National [1] - 108:9 Natural [1] - 107:26 nature [15] - 16:5, 26:19, 56:16, 62:20, 90:13, 92:7, 110:27, 111:4, 113:23, 120:1, 132:9, 132:10, 172:14, 185:23 ndúirt [1] - 91:9 nearly [1] - 148:4 necessarily [12] -38:6, 49:3, 61:29, 62:29, 90:20, 104:13, 142:13, 159:10, 168:4, 176:8, 189:15 necessary [1] -100:26 neck~[4]-62:7,62:8,62:25 91:23 need [13] - 16:14, 42:20, 47:27, 56:12, 103:10, 121:19, 121:20, 121:22, 133:27, 146:19, 164:5, 166:26, 181:1 needed [1] - 101:10 negative [8] - 9:21, 10:10, 10:11, 10:18, 31:17, 33:3, 55:16, 97:8 neighbour[1] -115:25 neighbourhood[1] -117:11 net [2] - 60:4, 186:20 network [3] - 69:15, 77:4, 90:12 **never** [27] - 80:18, 83:5, 86:26, 86:27, 87:2, 87:7, 96:21, 97:7, 108:21, 111:15, 111:22, 117:3, 117:4, 117:8. 117:19. 118:23, 119:29, 120:1, 125:11, 151:3, 151:10, 177:17, 188:24 news [3] - 103:8, 113:18, 172:10 News [1] - 85:12 newspaper [3] -23:23, 23:25, 162:1 newspapers [1] -

115:10 newsroom [1] -85:18 next [23] - 22:18, 22:20, 22:26, 23:1, 26:26, 47:11, 49:5, 64:4, 66:24, 77:26, 87:9, 92:26, 94:3, 105:3, 107:17, 122:5, 140:23, 152:13, 156:11, 160:13, 167:13, 191:25, 192:5 **nice** [2] - 109:8, 121:9 nicely [1] - 135:22 night [10] - 71:12, 76:13, 78:11, 78:12, 139:18, 141:7, 163:11, 170:27, 171:23, 171:29 nine [1] - 112:5 **NO** [1] - 3:21 nobody [3] - 71:26, 171:14, 185:9 Noel [6] - 10:4, 13:12, 13:13, 32:27, 32:28, 55:15 NOEL [2] - 2:16, 3:16 nomination [1] -109:10 nominations [1] -109:14 non [1] - 97:6 non-accounting [1] -97.6 none [1] - 116:5 norm [1] - 140:3 normal [10] - 21:18, 28:10, 108:26, 112:18, 112:23, 114:15, 114:16, 126:8, 135:24, 140:3

normally [3] -

105:12, 106:24,

**NORTHUMBERLA** 

note [15] - 16:11,

16:13, 16:14, 44:29,

49:15, 53:26, 64:17,

87:4, 87:26, 87:27,

87:29, 88:1, 165:16,

165:23, 178:29

61:19

**noted** [2] - 39:7,

notes [4] - 1:27,

87:15, 168:20, 184:17

nothing [20] - 16:24,

38:25. 38:27. 59:10.

59:12, 63:9, 83:29,

116:23

ND [1] - 3:3

88:25, 96:20, 107:11, 110:27, 113:23, 113:24, 118:15, 143:15, 143:19, 169:17, 171:8, 178:3, 186:5 notice [2] - 79:11, 184:3 noticed [1] - 70:10 notices [3] - 94:27, 135:21, 183:5 notified [1] - 106:20 noting [1] - 62:27 notion [1] - 183:14 notoriety [1] - 13:21 notwithstanding [2] - 16:3, 169:15 November [1] -136:8 number [29] - 18:13, 30:19, 36:29, 63:11, 95:26, 104:11, 106:18, 123:2, 126:24, 128:4, 133:14, 133:25, 135:17, 135:19, 136:15, 148:4, 148:11, 162:19, 163:8, 170:7, 176:2, 176:5, 176:6, 181:12, 182:7, 185:12, 186:10, 187:11 numbers [1] - 96:17 nurses [1] - 115:27 nutshell [1] - 191:12 Nóirín [1] - 192:1 0

o'clock [6] - 92:22, 112:2, 112:5, 139:25, 172:27 O'Higgins [12] -31:2, 31:14, 39:28, 44:5, 55:22, 58:12, 58:16, 148:20, 163:7, 165:12, 182:25, 183:3 O'HIGGINS [7] -2:15, 2:27, 5:29, 103:18, 117:25, 163:4, 163:6 O'Mahony [17] -12:27, 127:10, 131:15, 135:15, 135:17, 150:8, 181:17, 181:19, 181:26, 181:27, 181:28, 183:12, 183:18, 183:19,

184:9, 185:8, 186:19 O'Mahony's [1] -187:13 **O'MARA**[1] - 3:2 O'REILLY [1] - 3:12 O'Sullivan [1] -192.1 obliged [2] - 77:16, 88:17 obsessive [1] -186:22 obstacles [1] -106:22 obviate [1] - 166:26 obvious [2] - 97:2, 99.29 obviously [49] - 7:13, 10:29, 13:27, 16:9, 17:2, 17:28, 17:29, 18:1, 19:13, 21:14, 25:12, 27:22, 28:23, 30:29, 34:18, 35:24, 38:18, 40:12, 47:28, 49:4, 60:22, 75:6, 89:29, 92:4, 118:15, 121:11, 121:17, 125:2, 125:14, 129:18, 131:27, 132:2, 132:9, 132:23, 135:2, 136:11, 136:13, 138:25, 139:21, 141:1, 144:14, 146:18, 148:10, 155:13, 159:1, 178:17, 179:5, 179:11, 180:28 occasion [4] - 14:20, 43:17, 98:11, 146:10 occasions [3] -120:7, 127:27, 156:27 occupant [1] - 86:20 occupation [1] -186:8 occupying [1] -127:6 occurred [1] - 85:9 occurring[1]-171:23 October [7] - 122:24, 124:3, 124:5, 124:7, 124:9, 124:10, 124:12 odd [6] - 98:12,

98:13, 98:24, 99:2,

**OF** [4] - 1:3, 1:9,

offence [1] - 47:8

offer [1] - 114:5

offences [1] - 10:19

oddness [1] - 99:17

99:23, 111:12

1:12, 2:3

offering [1] - 148:18 OFFICE [2] - 2:19, 2:24 office [30] - 14:15, 14:25. 21:1. 21:16. 23:7, 23:8, 23:9, 24:14, 27:10, 28:3, 32:1, 44:18, 51:6, 54:7, 56:7, 61:14, 61:23, 61:28, 65:21, 65:29, 82:6, 86:21, 87:9, 88:2, 91:7, 91:13, 134:19, 138:9, 139:5, 171:12 Officer [3] - 9:28, 36:10, 60:8 officer [22] - 31:18, 34:18, 34:23, 35:5, 35:19, 36:5, 42:7, 58:29, 59:21, 60:17, 61:4, 61:16, 61:20, 62:24, 63:4, 63:7, 63:11, 97:6, 108:3, 115:25, 174:25, 174:26 officers [1] - 114:3 offices [1] - 66:2 official [4] - 111:28, 137:4, 165:6, 187:19 officials [1] - 34:9 often [5] - 121:23, 134:11, 135:25, 137:16, 157:7 Oireachtas [8] - 8:2, 97:16, 97:22, 100:29, 101:4, 113:19, 179:22, 180:6 old [1] - 13:5 oldest [1] - 38:3 Ombudsman [1] -28:29 **ON** [4] - 1:6, 1:10, 1:18, 6:1 on-stream [1] once [7] - 25:29, 94:23, 111:9, 118:25. 120:5, 120:9, 161:7 ONE [1] - 3:17 One [1] - 85:12 one [76] - 10:13, 11:29, 17:11, 17:21, 18:13, 18:14, 20:15, 21:27, 32:21, 38:3. 38:29, 51:9, 56:19, 57:5, 61:9, 61:10, 61:18, 62:13, 68:27, 70:13, 73:16, 85:26, 90:9, 91:26, 92:6,

offered [1] - 86:16

92:27, 92:29, 101:17,	<b>opposition</b> [1] - 6:26	Р	153:22, 153:25,	PASSED [1] - 1:5
101:22, 102:8,	Opposition [1] -	•	153:27, 169:7,	past [8] - 18:5,
103:21, 104:26,	69:25		169:24, 170:4,	40:18, 67:25, 73:11,
110:9, 110:26,	options [1] - 65:4	PAC [41] - 8:8, 43:12,	170:22, 173:2, 178:19	86:26, 92:27, 92:29,
115:14, 120:8,	-	95:14, 95:15, 96:28,	parliament [2] - 8:13,	139:25
	order [7] - 20:25,	97:7, 101:7, 104:25,	-	
120:21, 121:14,	21:2, 27:4, 27:15,	106:1, 106:8, 106:11,	8:14	Pat [9] - 59:1, 64:4,
125:24, 127:27,	83:20, 136:14, 180:4		PARLIAMENT[1] -	72:17, 73:3, 73:24,
130:10, 131:27,	ordinarily [1] - 77:19	106:25, 107:2, 135:8,	2:30	73:27, 74:24, 76:4,
133:4, 133:10,	ordinary [4] - 77:25,	135:15, 137:3, 137:4,	parliamentarian [2] -	107:25
134:26, 136:23,	84:19, 126:4, 172:29	141:8, 141:10,	38:6, 49:4	<b>PAT</b> [2] - 5:11, 64:7
145:26, 147:5,	organisation [2] -	141:11, 152:17,	parliamentary [1] -	patched [1] - 176:5
147:20, 148:12,	96:27, 133:2	152:28, 154:5, 158:2,	86:17	patently [1] - 182:17
154:26, 157:17,	organisations [5] -	160:1, 164:3, 170:2,	part [9] - 61:27,	PATRICK[2] - 2:6,
157:20, 158:4,	124:20, 124:28,	170:13, 171:18,	129:3, 132:3, 142:1,	2:22
159:17, 161:4,	The state of the s	172:22, 174:21,	152:22, 166:20,	Paul [6] - 21:12,
162:20, 162:26,	125:9, 125:10	174:29, 175:6, 175:7,		
166:4, 167:8, 167:17,	origin [2] - 36:13,	176:27, 180:27,	168:18, 169:16, 172:4	28:2, 59:15, 101:21,
	62:28	183:23, 183:27,	partially [1] - 124:22	147:4, 150:10
169:6, 176:1, 179:24,	original [2] - 149:2,	190:27, 191:1, 191:5	participated [1] -	PAUL [2] - 2:10, 4:1
181:13, 182:10,	151:28		85:24	PEMBROKE [1] -
183:13, 184:13,	originally [2] - 18:23,	PAGE[1] - 5:2	participating [1] -	3:21
185:11, 186:2,	25:19	page [47] - 6:21,	114:9	penalties [1] - 181:5
190:23, 191:14,	origins [1] - 61:13	14:14, 20:5, 22:22,	particular [39] - 10:8,	penalty [29] - 7:5,
191:16, 191:17,	OSMOND [2] - 2:19,	26:27, 28:26, 44:12,	10:13, 13:3, 25:21,	7:12, 7:19, 9:22, 10:8,
191:19	2:24	44:15, 45:4, 45:6,	37:6, 43:10, 45:11,	11:4, 11:9, 11:12,
one's [2] - 32:21,		45:7, 45:10, 45:15,	59:21, 60:24, 67:13,	32:29, 94:27, 115:16,
62:13	OTHER [1] - 1:4	45:18, 47:10, 47:11,	75:5, 82:12, 86:20,	
one-on-one [1] -	otherwise [3] -	47:14, 48:6, 70:21,		127:2, 127:5, 127:7,
85:26	54:17, 72:17, 90:11	72:15, 75:2, 94:10,	95:3, 95:19, 99:13,	128:27, 129:11,
	ought [3] - 69:7,	122:20, 136:15,	106:17, 110:9,	129:21, 129:26,
ones [6] - 136:21,	85:2, 90:27	136:20, 147:6,	114:22, 119:27,	129:29, 130:5,
136:23, 165:17,	ourselves [2] - 97:4,	148:28, 148:29,	119:28, 127:29,	130:11, 130:19,
178:21, 178:23, 179:3	157:23		133:7, 136:6, 142:1,	135:21, 182:3, 182:8,
ongoing [2] - 46:18,	outcome [2] - 17:23,	149:3, 152:14,	144:2, 156:5, 158:20,	183:3, 184:3, 185:24
47:2	143:11	154:23, 157:29,	159:29, 162:29,	penultimate [1] -
onwards [2] - 43:5,	outcomes [1] - 29:11	158:4, 160:13,	165:25, 173:19,	158:4
191:5	outline [2] - 20:26,	169:29, 170:5, 170:6,	176:6, 176:27,	<b>people</b> [64] - 9:27,
open [8] - 25:25,	172:14	170:7, 170:8, 170:10,	178:22, 179:3,	11:12, 12:12, 15:1,
56:10, 65:19, 70:19,		178:7, 179:9, 191:5	181:14, 190:19	15:3, 30:13, 42:9,
81:19, 141:12,	outlined [6] - 24:22,	pages [2] - 74:2,	particularly [9] - 8:3,	
142:24, 143:1	51:29, 55:10, 167:21,	160:15	12:25, 39:18, 53:20,	54:29, 58:2, 62:3,
open-door [1] -	188:14, 189:6	panel [1] - 30:15		62:16, 70:13, 75:27,
56:10	outset [1] - 50:27	papers [4] - 97:3,	56:16, 104:2, 145:26,	82:8, 97:13, 98:12,
	outside [2] - 95:29,	131:15, 138:21,	156:23, 174:1	98:17, 98:18, 98:23,
opened [1] - 73:16	160:20	177:10	parties [9] - 38:4,	99:19, 99:29, 105:16,
opening [3] - 125:3,	outstanding [1] -		40:12, 40:15, 54:23,	110:14, 112:12,
162:13, 162:15	106:3	paragraph [9] -	130:12, 130:14,	114:11, 114:15,
operated [3] - 157:2,	overriding [1] - 51:7	20:19, 22:27, 28:25,	138:27, 156:29,	115:18, 115:26,
157:6, 188:15	own [25] - 14:22,	44:14, 44:15, 73:29,	164:12	117:14, 119:8,
operational [1] -	20:26, 32:21, 38:7,	75:2, 80:11, 179:16	<b>PARTNERS</b> [1] - 3:9	119:16, 120:20,
167:12		paragraphs [2] -	parts [1] - 66:1	120:22, 125:8,
operations [1] -	60:7, 62:13, 65:28,	74:5, 74:18	Party [3] - 109:4,	129:24, 129:27,
123:22	68:2, 68:16, 68:23,	parallel [2] - 135:11,	109:15, 109:22	130:4, 130:10,
opinion [6] - 14:29,	68:29, 80:21, 80:23,	190:15	party [8] - 6:27, 7:29,	130:18, 131:7, 133:7,
69:10, 96:5, 115:18,	87:29, 100:27,	parameters [1] -	8:4, 56:6, 57:1, 57:19,	133:17, 133:18,
161:29, 166:3	101:27, 104:5,	26:6		
· ·	105:18, 110:26,	pardon [4] - 22:16,	100:5	134:9, 134:10,
opportunity [6] -	129:2, 129:5, 135:11,	80:15, 115:12	passage [4] -	134:26, 135:13,
50:1, 50:26, 70:5,	157:14, 167:11,	park [23] - 15:7, 16:5,	180:14, 190:26,	138:14, 157:3,
143:5, 145:29, 173:18	174:24	• •	191:3, 191:8	157:18, 157:19,
<b>opposed</b> [2] - 69:8,		41:3, 44:20, 45:13,	passages [1] -	158:19, 160:19,
	1	53:24, 54:5, 54:11,	191:14	161:24, 162:6, 162:7,
118:29				
118:29 opposite [2] -		57:23, 95:5, 95:10,	passed [4] - 27:8,	165:20, 173:2,
		57:23, 95:5, 95:10, 105:26, 147:23,	<b>passed</b> [4] - 27:8, 52:4, 52:6, 163:21	165:20, 173:2, 175:21, 180:10,

186:6, 186:7, 188:27 personnel [2] played [1] - 166:22 132:29, 167:11, preference [1] people's [2] - 92:6, 36:17. 91:16 playing [2] - 127:29, 190:12 19:16 119:10 persons [4] - 58:7, 190:12 **pool** [2] - 67:21, preliminaries [1] **per** [1] - 8:3 66:17, 133:29, 175:22 **plough** [1] - 120:26 67:24 78.6 percent [2] - 139:7. perspective [3] premeditated [1] point [45] - 7:13, 9:8, **poor** [1] - 86:19 11:5, 17:8, 39:9, 40:7, 163:17 35:25, 120:24, 137:27 popular [1] - 187:28 112:24 perception [1] persuaded [1] - 65:6 42:5, 42:20, 44:1, portfolios [1] - 37:21 prepared [2] - 21:13, 117:5 pertaining [1] - 10:8 44:4, 51:17, 67:3, portion [2] - 33:14, 51:13 perch [1] - 111:18 **PETER** [4] - 1:12, 67:12, 78:17, 81:23, 70:19 presence [1] - 92:10 83:6, 84:23, 88:7, 2:2. 2:4. 3:5 position [17] - 8:9, performance [2] present [2] - 6:27, 94:24, 96:22, 97:13, 158:7. 159:11 Peter [1] - 108:8 72:3. 73:1. 92:22. 127:23 perhaps [42] - 17:6, petitions [1] - 184:3 101:9, 102:27, 119:3, 105:6, 124:2, 124:9, presentation [1] -20:4, 21:23, 22:25, 120:14, 120:15, 126:26, 129:7, 132:5, phone [17] - 21:9, 25:24 123:27, 124:15, 29:21, 29:24, 37:13, 21:12, 23:11, 100:10, 132:19, 137:27, presented [1] -125:17, 125:24, 145:27, 162:24, 63:15, 69:13, 78:21, 100:11, 113:11, 128:21 133:10, 134:16, 84:9, 85:2, 89:22, 173:23, 173:24, 113:12, 127:25, President [1] -134:17, 135:21, 90:26, 91:23, 96:29, 190:20 128:14, 135:25, 112:11 143:25, 145:12, 97:27, 100:1, 100:26, 136:2, 141:6, 157:7, positions [1] press [23] - 7:19, 149:13, 154:2, 159:4, 102:21, 102:28, 156:25 177:25, 178:8, 178:9, 32:1, 34:18, 34:23, 171:22, 174:20, 120:20, 121:19, 178:23 possession[1] -35:5, 35:19, 36:5, 183:28, 184:3, 187:17 123:6, 133:22, phrase [9] - 8:23, 85:17 42:7, 58:29, 59:21, 138:22, 142:24, 39:8, 50:4, 54:28, pointed [1] - 188:11 possibility [5] -60:17, 61:4, 61:15, 143:5, 143:7, 145:19, pointing [2] - 13:2, 60:16, 77:10, 130:7, 58:13, 137:29, 61:25, 61:26, 62:24, 157:17, 165:18, 188.9 141:13, 141:19, 154:6 63:4, 63:7, 63:10, 142:29, 177:3 166:11, 166:19, points [27] - 7:5, possible [10] - 28:7, 133:10, 133:12 phrased [1] - 151:7 167:12, 174:18, physical [1] - 32:19 7:12, 7:19, 9:22, 10:8, 28:8, 90:28, 132:7, Press [3] - 9:28, 178:28, 185:27, 11:4, 11:9, 11:10, physically [1] - 51:6 132:27, 155:3, 36:10, 60:8 189:26, 190:18 11:12, 33:1, 43:10, 175:29, 177:13, pick [2] - 79:6, presumably [16] period [14] - 7:14, 115:16, 127:2, 127:5, 179:23. 180:3 7:21, 8:16, 13:8, 112:27 9:19, 15:21, 70:25, 127:7, 128:27, possibly [5] - 89:19, 19:20, 23:20, 27:26, picked [5] - 34:10, 104:15, 110:17, 129:11, 129:21, 119:3, 140:26, 28:4, 30:23, 31:6, 76:11, 76:13, 112:15, 123:3, 124:14, 125:7, 130:1, 130:5, 130:11, 112:23 141:15, 143:22 73:26, 74:7, 82:24, 125:10, 128:1, 130:19, 144:18, post [1] - 123:24 107:6, 131:10, 139:8, picking [2] - 80:16, 128:25, 136:6, 146:26 182:3, 182:8, 183:3, posters [1] - 109:7 144.24 116:23 permission [2] -185.24 pot [1] - 89:4 presume [6] - 17:22, picture [3] - 20:8, police [2] - 115:25, 144:8. 164:21 88:2, 89:20, 92:6, 144:21, 158:28 potential [4] - 96:1, person [43] - 10:2, 181:7 133:21, 173:24, 113:22, 113:27 piece [2] - 25:10, 10:13, 17:17, 21:13, policeman [3] - 65:8, 191:16 presumed [2] -161:29 32:3, 32:19, 47:28, 66:8, 71:11 46:20, 46:25 potentially [1] piles [1] - 104:22 47:29, 51:9, 51:10, policing [5] - 64:24, 99:26 presumption [2] pin [7] - 16:25, 34:1, 66:10, 71:3, 125:15, 51:12, 51:14, 52:29, 130:22, 130:29 34:11, 34:26, 36:12, powers [1] - 97:18 60:10, 62:10, 62:11, 125:16 61:12, 63:1 practice [2] - 96:27, pretty [8] - 37:16, 62:12, 62:15, 62:16, policitisation [1] pints [1] - 111:10 106:25 66:11, 92:12, 126:11, 62:26, 63:12, 67:13, 189:29 145:9, 145:15, 159:6, **PLACE**[1] - 3:24 practices [1] - 99:22 74:27, 88:17, 91:13, **policy** [2] - 56:10, 173:11 pragmatic [1] - 86:24 place [24] - 7:23, 97:4, 101:10, 115:21, 56:15 prearranged [6] prevent[1] - 138:21 9:27, 10:21, 15:14, 115:22, 141:27, polite [1] - 186:23 previous [8] - 7:23, 23:15, 32:7, 32:20, 72:17, 78:28, 79:4, 158:23, 159:21, political [10] - 31:26, 64:28, 72:5, 95:12, 79:5, 79:8, 79:9 38:16, 54:9, 76:14, 162:9, 167:13, 33:25, 34:15, 34:29, 104:18, 148:28, 87:21, 88:14, 126:18, precedent [3] - 97:8, 186:20, 186:21, 37:18, 37:19, 38:4, 157:29, 168:21 126:25, 127:9, 167:15. 174:2 186:25, 186:27, 49:6, 81:28, 91:15 previously[1] -142:26, 144:25, preceding [2] -187:1, 187:2, 187:8, politically [3] -153:9, 154:1, 154:19, 80:27, 98:3 44:18 187:22 57:26, 90:5, 131:25 155:12, 169:7, **primarily** [3] - 56:23, precise [1] - 150:6 person's [1] - 17:17 politician [6] - 38:5, 62:19, 108:7 178:19, 183:26 precisely [3] personal [8] - 17:17, 49:4, 49:5, 64:10, Prime [6] - 70:17, placed [1] - 143:28 125:27, 127:14, 134:2 87:27, 87:29, 125:1, 109:19, 119:25 73:13, 77:20, 79:16, Planning [1] - 94:13 **precursor** [1] - 73:5 130:4, 133:7, 144:20, politicians [6] -85:8, 116:11 planning [1] - 155:14 predecessor [2] -170:16 14:29, 30:14, 30:19, principal [2] plausible [1] personally [2] -98:16, 156:27 174:24, 174:26 103:12 preempt [1] - 27:20 47:20, 161:10 politicisation [3] principally [1] play [1] - 111:12 prefer [1] - 161:20

38:23 principle [3] - 103:3, 180:28, 180:29  $\pmb{\text{Prison}}\,{}_{[2]} - 123{:}22,$ 123:24 prison [2] - 156:24, 156:25 prisons [2] - 123:18, 123:21 private [25] - 87:9, 88:2, 91:7, 97:5, 98:4, 100:17, 102:9, 102:22, 102:26, 104:3, 104:11, 104:19, 105:3, 105:22, 106:4, 106:7, 106:13, 106:20, 107:5, 137:15, 137:16, 137:19, 141:22, 161:12, 191:28 private-sector [1] -141.22 privately [2] - 70:3, 71:29 privy [4] - 82:24, 83:12, 110:23, 115:2 pro [1] - 91:20 pro-McCabe [1] -91:20 probe [1] - 27:2 probity [1] - 71:29 problem [7] - 49:22, 50:3, 144:5, 144:6, 161:11, 167:13, 185:14 problems [1] -189:19 procedural [1] -97:12 procedure [1] -61:24 procedures [1] -61:27 proceed [3] - 16:6, 26:11, 50:28 proceeding [2] -16:26, 55:14 proceedings [1] -179:8 process [7] - 13:26, 14:11, 30:29, 96:3, 162:28, 172:4, 188:13 processing [1] -185:24 produce [1] - 11:26 produced [2] -10:29, 148:6 Professional [2] -131:20, 188:10

professional [1] -184:9 programme [18] -61:18, 61:21, 71:8, 73.4 73.8 73.13 73:18, 75:25, 76:1, 77:23, 85:10, 85:11, 85:14, 85:22, 85:23, 89:12, 116:11, 116:12 progress [3] - 12:18, 12:21, 17:24 progressing[1] -39.25 prolonged[1] -68:25 promoted [2] -123:12, 123:15 prompt [1] - 163:14 pronounced[1]-9:25 proof [1] - 117:17 propagate [1] -70:14 propagating [2] -69:11, 89:8 proper [7] - 12:19, 30:24, 88:20, 118:27, 144:29, 179:28, 180:7 properly [6] - 20:28, 24:28, 25:3, 52:8, 90:10, 101:1 property [1] - 117:12 propose [3] - 37:18, 42:20, 44:12 prosecuted [1] -66:15 prosecution [3] -66:12, 149:19, 150:28 prosecutor [1] -46:26 prospect [2] - 65:29, 144:2 protect [1] - 181:1 protected [4] -31:22, 97:3, 99:20, 104.21 PROTECTED [2] -1:3, 1:4 Protection [3] -134:19, 134:21, 139:5 protective [1] - 108:7 protest [1] - 161:3

proud [2] - 111:7,

provide [4] - 68:2,

provided [3] -

pub [1] - 100:9

Public [36] - 7:22,

124:21, 124:29, 160:7

101:25, 169:12, 180:5

120:25

7:27, 8:3, 45:28, 46:13, 48:21, 94:19, 95:25, 95:28, 96:2, 96:9, 97:14, 97:21, 97:29, 98:4, 99:27, 100:15, 101:2, 101:3, 104:23, 105:12, 132:4, 132:7, 132:17, 137:14, 137:17, 137:19, 137:21, 138:9, 139:3, 140:4, 166:29, 167:3, 167:14, 173:28, 179:11 public [54] - 8:11, 8:22, 13:25, 14:18, 15:16, 18:16, 23:2, 42:21, 43:14, 49:7, 51:4, 51:15, 53:21, 53:22, 69:15, 72:6, 82:28, 89:12, 90:16, 96:11, 98:18, 99:12, 99:22, 101:1, 102:26, 105:13, 106:4, 106:7, 106:13. 107:6. 122:22, 129:13, 129:19, 129:22, 130:14, 137:15, 137:22, 142:3, 142:8, 145:28, 156:2, 156:11, 156:12, 162:24, 164:5, 166:27, 166:28, 167:3, 173:22, 173:27, 178:18, 189:28, 190:12 publicity [6] - 7:17, 21:20, 22:5, 22:9, 24:11, 30:12 publicly [4] - 57:24, 70:2, 71:29, 87:8 publish [1] - 28:16 published [3] -21:14, 22:7, 59:13 pull [2] - 51:16 pummeled [1] -158:22 Purcell [32] - 122:6, 122:17, 122:21, 123:7, 134:7, 144:24, 147:4, 153:12, 159:16, 162:12, 163:2. 163:7. 168:28. 171:9, 171:23, 175:28, 177:22, 177:29, 178:6, 180:22, 180:26, 184:22, 185:14,

190:21, 190:23, 190:26, 191:2, 191:20 **PURCELL** [5] - 2:22, 5:26, 122:8, 122:11, 147:2 Purcell's [1] - 122:15 purpose [13] - 6:11, 8:28, 9:1, 16:17, 19:27, 37:10, 39:15, 78:8, 79:10, 89:11, 136:12, 169:9 purposes [4] - 13:2, 39:24, 85:4, 95:23 pursuant [1] -136:13 pursuing [1] -142:21 put [39] - 10:23, 11:18, 18:18, 29:8, 32:17, 37:1, 37:7, 43:10, 43:22, 49:1, 49:10, 49:28, 51:18, 53:10, 53:17, 54:17, 59:23, 60:7, 60:8, 69:19, 77:16, 79:23, 88:10, 89:4, 90:27, 101:6, 101:8, 109:7, 142:15, 145:21, 145:23, 148:17, 155:19, 164:8, 168:16, 172:11, 179:29, 183:1, 190:25 puts [2] - 47:15, 76:2 putting [10] - 37:10, 38:15, 90:14, 135:22, 142:26, 143:15. 143:20, 168:16, 186:23, 187:17

Q

quarter [2] - 69:28,

154:27

QUAY [3] - 2:12, 3:10, 3:17 queried [1] - 65:23 queries [5] - 9:29, 35:10, 61:25, 61:26, 63:11 query [2] - 11:7, 65:15 querying [1] - 54:27 question-marks [1] -90:26 questionable [1] -26:18 questioned [2] -47:12, 66:29 QUESTIONED [8] -

5:9, 5:15, 5:24, 5:32, 59:5, 88:29, 118:18, 180:24 questioning [4] -54:26, 83:21, 103:29, Questions [1] - 43:5 questions [46] -32:1, 33:6, 33:8, 33:9. 36:27, 36:28, 37:1, 37:7, 38:29, 44:25, 53:9, 55:27, 56:5, 56:18, 57:6, 59:6, 61:3, 76:18, 76:22, 76:25, 77:15, 85:29, 91:15, 91:27, 101:14, 103:18. 103:19. 103:20, 105:20, 117:22, 117:25, 117:27, 118:12, 128:19, 146:29, 155:19, 158:23, 158:25, 163:9, 168:26, 169:2, 172:6, 178:2, 179:13, 179:14, 190:22 quicker[1] - 159:3 quickly [7] - 13:29, 14:6, 37:16, 98:19, 145:6, 156:12, 157:21 quintessential [1] -98:16 quite [25] - 7:14, 18:17, 57:26, 58:1, 58:8. 68:14. 80:20. 81:17, 98:19, 99:29, 102:2, 110:15, 121:23, 128:4, 134:10, 135:18, 145:5, 156:26, 177:12, 181:12, 182:12, 185:1, 187:9, 191:1. 191:2

# R

Rabbitte [36] - 64:5, 64:9, 69:5, 72:17, 73:4, 73:24, 73:28, 76:4, 76:19, 77:14, 77:17, 79:17, 80:10, 82:14, 88:22, 88:26, 92:14, 107:25, 108:13, 108:16, 109:6, 109:14, 109:18, 109:23, 110:6, 110:18, 112:14, 113:24, 116:17, 116:25, 116:29, 117:4, 117:6,

187:16, 188:2,

188:17, 189:14,

118:23, 119:1, 121:12 **RABBITTE** [3] - 5:11, 64:7, 88:29 Rabbitte's [1] -116.13 radio [10] - 40:29, 41:26, 50:8, 57:19, 68:13, 75:25, 83:6, 85:22, 115:12, 115:13 Radio [2] - 85:14, 85:19 rain [1] - 173:3 raise [6] - 11:24, 13:24, 28:13, 40:6, 64:20, 86:16 raised [28] - 12:16, 13:7, 13:10, 13:14, 15:28, 18:11, 19:9, 29:4, 29:6, 29:17, 32:1, 39:10, 39:25, 43:1, 43:17, 43:18, 43:20, 49:19, 55:7, 68:14, 78:29, 86:16, 129:10, 138:24, 144:18, 145:15, 165:24, 186:1 raising [12] - 9:5, 9:26, 9:29, 13:28, 14:17, 14:28, 18:17, 40:3, 56:24, 59:25, 129:4, 191:11 rang [9] - 112:21, 116:21, 133:24, 134:19, 134:25, 171:14, 171:19, 175:11, 191:17 range [3] - 124:23, 124:28, 125:1 ranged [1] - 136:8 ranking [1] - 31:18 rather [4] - 40:25, 90:18, 107:5, 189:25 **RE** [4] - 5:8, 5:31, 57:17, 178:5 re [2] - 162:13, 162:15 RE-EXAMINED [4] -5:8, 5:31, 57:17, 178:5 re-opening [2] -162:13, 162:15 reach [2] - 24:8, 129.1 reached [1] - 24:6 react [2] - 68:26, 128:20 reaction [7] - 48:4, 103:13, 187:20, 187:23, 188:2, 188:3 read [12] - 20:18,

23:24, 41:7, 45:8, 95:12, 95:18, 104:6, 105:14, 115:10, 136:24, 161:2, 161:23 readily [1] - 75:23 reading [5] - 80:10, 102:7, 104:7, 152:21, 183:2 reads [4] - 44:15, 74:12, 80:27, 136:29 real [1] - 51:10 realise [1] - 120:20 realistic [1] - 143:29 really [27] - 17:23, 32:15, 34:27, 47:27, 59:7, 59:23, 83:23, 85:29, 99:18, 103:5, 104:16, 110:14, 112:9, 113:20, 114:8, 115:29, 133:18, 140:14, 143:10, 159:7, 159:16, 159:22, 161:20, 180:11, 184:25, 185:12, 187:16 realm [1] - 189:16 rearticulate [1] -17:11 reason [12] - 53:9. 53:16, 53:18, 61:16, 87:26, 89:5, 98:19, 137:22, 148:10, 148:22, 181:27, 184:3 reasonable [4] -17:18, 30:27, 51:18, 173:4 reasonably [3] -8:16, 14:6, 156:12 reasons [2] - 50:16, 51:28 recalled [1] - 40:26 recalling [1] - 14:14 received [14] - 9:4, 9:28, 21:8, 21:11, 30:18, 33:18, 34:22, 49:12, 72:10, 73:19, 73:24, 74:26, 96:5 receiving [2] - 49:27, 74:29 recent [1] - 182:15 recipient [4] - 65:2,

65:11, 65:22, 157:24

recited [1] - 87:16

recites [1] - 22:26

recollect [4] - 22:11,

recognises [1] -

35:7, 96:8, 145:13

recollection [26] -

14:23, 39:23, 42:12,

63:10, 88:16, 95:9, 99:3, 102:20, 102:23, 126:23, 134:2, 150:6, 150:9, 153:15, 162:28, 165:24, 165:29, 167:17, 167:23, 167:25, 170:14, 176:18, 177:24, 180:18, 184:21 recommendations [1] - 184:8 record [5] - 14:16, 19:18, 87:4, 87:11, 176:8 recording [1] - 87:11 records [2] - 175:20, 175:27 recounted [1] - 88:5 rectangular [1] -104:25 **REDDY** [1] - 3:24 refer [10] - 33:17, 33:23, 33:25, 34:12, 34:15, 52:14, 74:18, 79:29, 83:12, 168:21 reference [37] - 25:4, 25:6. 25:9. 28:25. 31:2, 31:16, 34:28, 46:22, 63:8, 71:18, 74:3, 79:26, 92:3, 92:8, 134:29, 147:20, 148:11, 148:13, 148:15, 150:2, 150:17, 151:15, 151:17, 152:7, 152:8, 152:26, 153:8, 154:4, 155:5, 161:21, 169:5, 169:16, 169:28, 170:3, 170:21, 170:28, 174:24 referenced [3] -13:13, 15:15, 73:4 references [2] -12:25, 21:27 referral [1] - 29:4 referred [19] - 7:12, 14:13, 29:27, 43:3, 67:10, 77:22, 78:20, 81:14, 81:16, 82:6, 85:6, 86:22, 89:5, 131:15, 131:20, 131:21, 179:5, 190:26, 191:15 referring [13] - 80:5, 80:18, 81:4, 81:11, 81:29, 90:22, 113:28, 136:22, 152:29, 153:20. 177:10. 179:16, 191:9

refers [1] - 81:15 reflect [3] - 17:6, 17:8, 27:12 reflected [2] - 16:16, 31:25 regard [8] - 8:15. 12:22, 75:17, 82:12, 83:1, 84:29, 151:16, 179:25 regarded [4] - 15:21, 69:7, 133:6, 157:1 regarding [8] - 73:5, 75:6, 76:5, 114:26, 149:8, 149:14, 153:16, 170:15 regards [3] - 74:22, 110:14, 111:13 **REGISTRAR**[1] - 2:4 regular [4] - 56:7, 56:8, 82:25, 82:27 regularly [1] - 82:21 rehearse [1] - 87:19 reiterated [1] - 83:23 related [2] - 12:16, 129.12 relates [3] - 80:16, 147:21, 170:29 relating [18] - 9:8, 9:10, 9:22, 13:5, 13:7, 16:8, 35:13, 64:24, 73:25, 83:26, 95:26, 96:26, 125:3, 129:4, 132:19, 135:27, 146:22, 178:8 relation [79] - 8:23, 9:1, 10:12, 19:3, 20:1, 20:2, 31:15, 33:14, 33:18, 33:21, 33:27, 34:2, 34:20, 34:21, 36:8, 36:16, 36:18, 37:14, 42:29, 45:12, 45:27, 46:6, 46:15, 46:18, 54:8, 59:20, 64:29, 68:12, 69:25, 69:27, 72:4, 72:9, 72:18, 72:27, 73:28, 76:8, 95:10, 95:20, 96:6, 96:20, 97:6, 97:25, 99:16, 99:17, 99:25, 100:5, 100:15, 101:23, 104:19, 108:22, 116:28, 128:3, 128:28, 129:10, 129:16, 129:20, 129:28, 129:29, 130:11, 135:12, 135:26, 153:1, 160:14, 160:19, 166:29, 168:22, 169:4, 170:3,

171:8, 171:25, 175:24, 176:12, 177:21, 181:3, 181:4, 183:4, 184:1, 189:22, 190.14 relationship [8] -86:20, 89:21, 89:25, 110:15, 119:2, 119:8, 189:20, 191:18 relatively [4] - 66:14, 138:6, 140:21, 163:18 relaying [1] - 176:14 relevant [4] - 6:19, 70:19, 88:17, 169:16 reliability [4] - 60:14, 63:12, 63:14, 87:25 reliable [3] - 10:27, 32:9, 46:12 reluctant [2] - 69:17, 75:28 rely [1] - 62:13 remaining [2] -106:3, 106:21 remark [6] - 43:11, 43:12. 80:21. 101:26. 116:17, 140:11 remarks [1] - 84:29 remember [40] -40:23, 48:5, 85:11, 85:24, 85:29, 98:20, 102:4, 102:7, 102:13, 103:16, 104:3, 104:9, 105:8, 106:11, 106:15, 107:8, 125:26, 125:29, 126:20, 126:22, 126:29, 127:14, 128:14, 131:19, 134:6, 134:22, 138:13, 139:12, 140:8, 140:13, 143:21, 146:16, 160:8, 167:20, 168:15, 173:7, 182:5, 183:25, 186:2 remit [2] - 95:29, 96:28 remote [1] - 66:3 remove [5] - 122:12, 127:13, 140:7, 150:8, 164:5 repeat [2] - 123:7, repeated [1] - 145:19 repeating [3] -119:12, 135:14, 169:3 replied [2] - 71:24, 88:20 reply [2] - 70:29, 167:27

report [21] - 31:8, 58:20, 127:10, 135:15, 135:17, 162:23, 179:26, 181:19, 181:24, 181:25, 181:29, 182:13, 183:12, 183:18, 183:19, 184:28, 185:29, 187:8, 187:13, 188:10 Report [1] - 44:5 reported [3] - 103:8, 127:10, 171:9 reporting [3] - 16:20, 17:4, 172:25 reports [8] - 23:20, 23:22, 23:23, 23:25, 75:7, 96:13, 96:16, 96:17 represent [1] -118:10 representation [2] -6:8, 6:11 Representative [1] -111:17 representative [3] -72:6, 82:28, 91:18 represented [3] -82:14, 117:28, 117:29 representing [3] -15:1, 118:7, 147:5 reputation [10] -17:18, 51:12, 150:19, 150:22, 151:6, 151:16, 152:6, 152:8, 180:9, 190:3 request [3] - 52:5, 74:26, 74:29 requested [1] - 20:12 requesting [1] -162:14 require [1] - 8:10 required [1] - 30:25 requires [1] - 88:3 resigned [1] - 146:19 resist [1] - 98:27 resistance [1] -102:27 resolution [1] -18:18 **RESOLUTIONS** [1] resolve [2] - 141:27, 163:24  $\textbf{resolved}~ \texttt{[4]} - 25 \mathpunct{:} 22,$ 25:27, 25:28, 51:4 resonate [1] - 180:18 resources [1] - 128:8 Resources [1] -107:27

resourcing [1] -128:3 respect [3] - 32:11, 66:12.66:16 respected [1] - 60:1 respond [1] - 25:21 responded [1] -13:29 response [8] - 15:26, 18:12, 21:3, 25:20, 30:27, 39:1, 39:14, responsibility [4] -96:10, 124:15, 125:15, 181:1 responsible [4] -38:17, 72:6, 119:13, 135:3 rest [2] - 121:15, 190:13 restaurant [2] - 62:4, 161:8 restrain [1] - 159:17 result [6] - 121:5, 126:2, 143:11, 145:22. 177:1. 186:20 resulted [1] - 182:4 **RESUMED** [3] - 6:1, 64:1, 94:1 retained [1] - 68:3 retaining [1] - 120:22 retired [10] - 67:19, 68:8, 68:9, 71:12, 85:7, 86:6, 108:10, 122:24, 124:11, 179:24 retirement [2] - 75:4, return [1] - 138:21 revelations [1] -178:18 revenue [2] - 181:6, 182:19 review [3] - 30:7, 30:29, 43:23 reviewed [1] - 73:18 Richard [2] - 41:1, 41:15 ring [3] - 26:9, 61:17, 62:2 ringing [2] - 185:10, 185:11 rise [1] - 169:8 risk [5] - 59:25, 101:6, 167:3, 167:5,

173.22

3.17

RIVERSIDE [1] -

Roach [2] - 11:20,

road [1] - 148:16 Road [1] - 10:5 **ROAD** [1] - 3:3 ROGERSON'S [1] -3:17 role [3] - 8:1, 111:29, 137:27 room [2] - 16:16, 104:23 round [2] - 71:15, 71:16 rounds [1] - 117:20 route [5] - 140:25, 141:14, 155:2, 176:27, 189:9 routine [10] - 79:10, 82:3. 84:1. 84:10. 84:14, 84:15, 84:25, 91:5, 112:26 **RTÉ** [5] - 61:17, 66:25, 78:27, 85:14, 85:18 rugby [1] - 121:1 rumour [44] - 9:27, 16:24, 32:6, 32:16, 33:22, 33:23, 33:27, 33:29, 34:2, 34:7, 34:12, 34:15, 34:25, 34:26, 35:2, 35:18, 36:1, 36:2, 36:8, 36:12, 36:18, 52:14, 55:20, 59:9, 59:20, 59:23, 60:2, 60:4, 60:5, 61:11, 63:2, 69:11, 74:28, 89:8, 91:11, 92:1, 98:16, 98:21, 99:5, 99:19, 119:21, 119:26, 134:13, 134:18 rumours [41] - 9:21, 10:18, 10:20, 32:6, 36:3, 46:2, 46:4, 46:7, 53:19, 62:29, 68:17, 69:25, 69:27, 70:26, 72:26, 75:20, 79:27, 79:28. 80:7. 81:6. 81:13, 81:27, 82:2, 83:25, 98:2, 98:19, 98:29, 99:25, 99:28, 100:1, 115:6, 116:2, 116:6, 116:7, 116:15, 116:26, 118:24, 121:17, 121:25, 133:15 run [6] - 13:5, 111:6, 146:23, 159:14, 167:5, 183:27 running [1] - 12:8 rushing [1] - 184:15 Ryan [3] - 38:10,

38:18, 38:19 S Safety [1] - 10:5 **SAINT**[2] - 3:32, 4:3 **SAME** [2] - 45:5, 72:13 sat [3] - 105:19, 114:27, 114:29 satisfied [4] - 10:2, 32:2. 85:23. 146:1 Saturday [2] - 26:28, 100:8 saved [1] - 109:11 saw [15] - 13:24, 40:24, 41:13, 97:3, 106:18, 110:6, 116:16, 142:19, 163:22, 166:11, 177:17, 177:18, 179:25, 184:20, 184:27 SC [15] - 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 2:15, 2:22, 2:27, 3:2, 3:5, 3:23, 3:26, 3:30, scarcely [1] - 69:3 scene [1] - 22:5 school [1] - 110:12 science [3] - 37:23, 37:25, 38:9 scoping [2] - 18:26, 19:22 screen [1] - 140:5 scrutiny [1] - 189:27 se [1] - 8:3 **SEAN**[1] - 2:11 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:6 second [9] - 14:13, 20:15, 44:15, 50:9, 89:13, 130:17, 163:29. 175:15. 177:25 secondly [6] - 16:5, 17:18, 49:14, 117:4, 130:29, 169:7 secretaries [1] secretary [14] -123:25, 123:27, 124:2, 125:13, 125:16, 128:2, 132:5, 146:8, 146:12, 164:27, 164:29, 165:1, 165:3, 191:28 Section [2] - 124:19, 125:10

sector [1] - 141:22 see [49] - 8:4, 13:8, 22:27, 28:21, 34:2, 34:7, 34:12, 34:21, 35:7, 35:12, 35:24, 36:14, 36:25, 42:28, 45:10, 55:21, 70:9, 79:17, 85:29, 98:25, 100:14, 101:29, 111:25, 112:4, 116:12, 116:24, 119:23, 135:6, 138:5, 144:6, 148:29, 149:6, 152:19, 153:24, 154:4, 154:27, 158:5, 158:10, 160:18, 160:21, 161:24, 170:10, 171:7, 171:26, 172:12, 176:7, 185:23, 187:4, 187:5 seeing [4] - 70:24, 89:21, 91:19, 177:11 seek [6] - 6:11, 8:8, 13:12, 13:25, 25:5, 141:26 seeking [4] - 13:15, 100:12, 164:21 seem [6] - 97:12, 118:11, 130:6, 171:12, 173:1, 186:6 sees [1] - 92:6 semantical [1] - 78:2 senators [3] - 56:6, 156:29, 157:8 send [3] - 14:1, 27:17, 53:29 sending [3] - 54:3, 136:27, 137:2 senior [4] - 12:6, 31:17, 75:9, 156:25 sense [22] - 18:18, 21:29, 23:27, 24:1, 26:5, 32:9, 32:13, 41:25, 54:4, 60:11, 76:10, 77:18, 79:5, 81:28, 116:28, 143:3, 145:20, 145:22, 170:24, 174:6, 174:7, 176:26 sensitive [4] -117:15, 119:14, 153:16, 170:16 sent [10] - 23:17, 28:18, 52:9, 74:3, 74:5, 83:13, 109:8, 139:24, 140:29,

181:14

80:26, 80:27

sentence [3] - 80:16,

separate [4] - 35:3, 81:18, 154:12, 155:14 separately [3] -34:29, 97:29, 151:10 September 131 -86:7, 108:10, 149:29 **sequence** [3] - 10:9, 27:25, 131:19 Sergeant [130] - 7:1, 7:9, 8:29, 9:8, 9:10, 9:20, 15:25, 16:21, 18:9, 25:12, 31:20, 31:28, 36:19, 39:3, 39:10, 40:3, 40:6, 43:1, 43:18, 43:27, 44:21, 46:9, 46:20, 47:2, 47:7, 47:21, 49:19, 50:6, 52:2, 52:21, 55:5, 57:22, 58:19, 58:21, 59:14, 64:15, 66:5, 66:20, 66:28, 67:2, 69:9, 69:27, 72:4, 72:18, 72:20, 72:28, 73:5, 75:9, 75:12, 75:18, 76:5. 80:8. 81:2. 81:6. 86:11, 95:20, 96:20, 97:10, 97:25, 98:1, 98:2, 99:1, 99:7, 99:17, 99:26, 100:16, 100:20, 100:22, 101:1, 101:22, 102:9, 102:24, 103:9, 104:1, 105:5. 105:10. 105:17. 106:2. 106:10, 107:3, 107:4, 108:22, 110:29, 115:7, 115:8, 115:22, 116:2, 116:26, 116:28, 117:2, 117:3, 117:10, 125:4, 125:22, 125:28, 127:20, 129:3, 129:10, 131:28, 132:8, 137:13, 137:21, 138:1, 138:21, 141:16, 142:3, 142:13, 147:5, 149:9, 149:18, 150:19, 150:21, 151:5, 151:15, 152:5, 152:7, 152:10, 159:29, 161:18, 166:22, 166:25, 174:10, 177:16, 181:14, 182:12, 185:3, 187:24, 189:10, 189:22, 190:3 sergeant [3] - 25:15, 102:8, 167:8

series [2] - 26:4, 49:10 serious [15] - 11:19, 11:23, 14:2, 18:20, 45:29, 46:14, 49:22, 50:3, 96:2, 115:2, 135:19, 160:10, 173:19, 182:2, 186:10 seriously [3] - 25:22, 97:24, 100:23 servants [1] - 98:17 serve [1] - 113:14 served [1] - 97:14 **Service** [2] - 123:22, 123:24 service [7] - 65:26, 122:22, 156:24, 156:26, 160:7, 162:24. 187:27 Services [1] - 1:25 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:30 services [3] -124:21, 124:29, 125:1 serving [7] - 20:11, 20:28, 25:14, 27:6, 75:6, 83:2, 179:23 session [7] - 97:5, 98:5, 100:17, 104:19, 105:13, 142:16, 173:28 set [12] - 6:29, 19:25, 21:2, 27:2, 30:7, 76:7, 121:15, 160:5, 164:17, 167:15, 174:2, 177:15 sets [1] - 72:16 setting [1] - 22:5 seven [3] - 112:5, 123:24, 139:20 several [1] - 91:27 sex [5] - 20:6, 27:2, 62:10, 62:26, 63:15 sexual [9] - 10:18, 28:15, 34:3, 35:18, 99:6, 116:3, 117:6, 177:26 sexually [4] - 20:10, 20:27, 27:5, 45:25 **SEÁN** [1] - 3:16 Seán [2] - 14:9, 123:28 **SGT** [1] - 2:9 shall [1] - 29:8

shame [1] - 133:29

**SHANE** [1] - 2:14

**shape** [1] - 54:8

**share** [1] - 166:4

189:6

shared [3] - 142:4,

Shatter [3] - 30:3,

127:19, 156:20 SHIP [2] - 2:20, 2:25 shocked [1] - 11:21 shocking [4] - 48:14, 48:16, 48:19, 48:27 shooting [1] - 119:17 shopping [1] -113:11 SHORT [1] - 64:1 short [6] - 20:18, 38:4, 44:18, 55:27, 56:20, 163:18 shortly [1] - 139:26 shot [1] - 85:1 shoulder [1] - 105:18 **show** [1] - 185:26 shower [1] - 160:29 showing [1] - 187:9 shown [2] - 79:18, 135:17 shutting [1] - 70:10 side [4] - 104:26, 104:27, 104:28, 123:6 sides [1] - 158:23 sight [1] - 97:27 sign [1] - 74:24 signal [1] - 179:6 significant [2] -181:12, 182:7 silently [1] - 68:27 similar [1] - 85:9 simply [2] - 77:25, 179:20 single [5] - 11:8, 114:28, 158:23, 187:10 **SIR** [1] - 3:17 sit [12] - 104:26, 105:14, 105:17, 140:3, 145:19, 153:6, 158:25, 165:27, 166:16, 166:18, 191:11 sitting [11] - 48:11, 48:22, 70:24, 141:27, 163:24, 165:25, 165:27, 166:8, 166:9, 166:22, 168:8 situation [2] -137:29. 180:3 situations [2] - 15:2, 185:26 six [2] - 140:29, 154:27 sixteen [1] - 140:29 skills [1] - 37:23 slow [1] - 117:11 small [1] - 163:8

39:20, 40:1, 40:4, 40:8, 146:23, 150:19, 150:21, 151:5, 151:12, 151:15, 152:3, 152:5, 152:7, smears [1] - 70:27 SMITHFIELD [1] -3:14 so-called [1] -147:23 Social [3] - 123:12, 123:13, 123:14 social [3] - 111:2, 115:26, 125:1 sold [1] - 184:18 SOLE [2] - 1:12, 2:2 solicitor [2] - 29:1, 73:20 SOLICITOR[1] - 2:7 SOLICITOR'S [2] -2:19, 2:23 SOLICITORS [8] -2:29, 3:6, 3:9, 3:13, 3:20, 3:24, 3:30, 4:2 solidarity [5] - 159:7, 159:23, 161:25, 161:26, 161:27 solution [2] - 168:18, 168:19 someone [10] - 60:2, 89:22, 92:21, 117:19, 118:23, 121:19, 138:11, 184:2, 187:18, 188:22 sometime [6] -22:17, 78:26, 112:16, 125:25, 126:29, 154:16 Sometime [1] - 80:12 sometimes [13] -29:14, 70:6, 70:7, 82:7, 96:16, 98:20, 110:13, 113:5, 121:24, 176:9, 180:2, 185:26 somewhat [1] -181:8 somewhere [1] -171:17 soon [2] - 140:21, 157:22 sorry [60] - 12:7, 12:20, 20:16, 23:24, 34:24, 37:12, 38:26, 41:7, 44:8, 45:7, 47:10, 48:7, 49:25, 50:23, 80:14, 91:1,

92:24, 94:16, 102:3,

115:12, 115:27,

118:3, 122:18, 123:4, 129:6, 134:16, 136:19, 136:21, 141:23, 144:7, 147:7, 147:27, 149:3, 151:2, 151:7, 151:13, 151:25, 155:17, 155:28, 158:3, 159:14, 159:16, 166:2, 168:9, 169:22, 170:5, 171:11, 171:13, 172:12, 175:17, 179:10, 183:3, 183:21, 184:24, 185:10, 188:1, 188:6, 190:26, 192:3 sort [7] - 10:25, 15:21, 47:8, 83:8, 157:26, 168:5, 173:6 **sorts** [2] - 135:26, 187:14 sought [6] - 16:18, 19:14, 64:19, 71:6, 91:11, 178:13  $\pmb{sounds}\ [2]\ -\ 29{:}20,$ 112:1 source [8] - 10:17, 17:2, 17:29, 36:13, 61:13, 63:1, 98:21, 121:25 sources [1] - 10:11 Southwest [2] -82:15, 109:11 **sow** [1] - 32:20 sows [1] - 32:20 speaking [6] - 35:7, 39:27, 61:4, 85:7, 139:8, 139:16 speaks [2] - 35:27, 53:6 **Special** [1] - 108:5 special [6] - 96:16, 97:17, 97:18, 108:24, 112:21, 116:21 **specific** [18] - 9:12, 16:25, 33:29, 34:4, 34:11, 34:19, 34:28, 35:21, 36:11, 36:20, 36:22, 36:23, 52:28, 63:9, 75:28, 98:29, 113:23 specifically [18] -10:20, 33:23, 34:12, 35:8, 36:8, 63:6, 63:7, 72:19, 99:1, 99:5, 109:16, 112:21, 116:20, 117:18,

119:29, 126:29,

147:21, 184:17

smear [18] - 12:2,

39:3, 39:4, 39:11,

specificity [1] starts [1] - 20:8 59:19 state [1] - 9:7 **specifics** [1] - 60:28 State [6] - 38:4, **speech** [1] - 42:22 67:27, 100:25, 113:12, 161:8, 181:6 spend [2] - 82:4, 82.5 **STATE**[2] - 2:19, spending [2] - 96:11, statement [36] -114:20 spent [3] - 96:11, 27:27, 33:16, 40:21, 40:25, 56:27, 72:11, 110:3, 165:11 74:17, 75:2, 78:16, spoken [4] - 100:11, 101:5, 134:26, 157:10 78:22, 78:23, 79:25, 80:10, 81:10, 83:11, spokesperson[1] -83:24, 85:16, 87:18, 56:15 88:8, 88:10, 95:13, **Sport** [1] - 100:18 105:14, 107:23, **spot** [1] - 111:19 122:15, 147:10, spread [3] - 60:5, 148:24, 152:21, 98:19, 98:22 156:13, 169:12, spreading [6] - 69:8, 169:18, 169:23, 116:26, 117:1, 169:27, 169:28, 118:24. 119:21. 121:16 170:21, 174:16 statements [7] -**SQUARE**[1] - 3:10 37:9, 42:21, 53:22, **square** [1] - 104:24 95:12, 98:7, 148:21, St [1] - 124:25 172:5 stacks [1] - 33:4 stating [1] - 81:10 **staff** [1] - 56:6 station [3] - 25:15, stage [42] - 6:19, 121:6, 160:20 9:12, 9:17, 11:2, 12:2, Station [1] - 64:22 12:13, 12:24, 13:6, stations [1] - 82:22 13:21, 19:21, 21:6, statistical [2] -25:7, 26:25, 30:1, 182:28, 183:6 31:6, 35:29, 39:8, status [1] - 97:17 39:14, 45:22, 46:19, staying [2] - 164:13, 47:12, 49:17, 49:26, 174:15 52:16, 52:17, 52:18, steer [1] - 68:29 52:24, 61:18, 62:19, steered [1] - 55:19 74:25, 87:2, 88:15, stenographic [1] -91:21, 106:1, 123:11, 1.27 134:5, 135:16, 141:1, 142:14, 178:15, STENOGRAPHY[1] 178:17, 179:13 - 1:30 stages [1] - 156:24 stenography [1] stall [2] - 72:16, 76:7 1:25 step [2] - 29:21, stance [1] - 8:17 105:3 **stand** [9] - 10:1, 19:17, 30:17, 35:11, stepped [1] - 100:10 steps [11] - 43:22, 39:22, 58:6, 64:11, 182:16, 189:27 49:11, 49:29, 50:1, 50:10, 50:16, 50:21, Standards [2] -50:24, 50:27, 53:12, 131:20, 188:11 standards [1] -184:10 stewardship [1] **standing** [1] - 51:24 8:11 stick [1] - 183:14 **starkly** [1] - 76:2 sticking [4] - 62:7, start [4] - 81:29, 62:8, 62:25, 91:23 108:28. 152:13. still [8] - 20:28, 191:26 started [1] - 14:11 25:14, 38:8, 52:6, 102:27, 104:24, starting [1] - 48:6

142:2, 146:8 still-serving [2] -20:28, 25:14 **story** [2] - 11:2, 92.23 straight [3] - 19:24, 29:17, 126:1 straightforward [2] -70:8, 138:6 stream [1] - 38:13 STREET [9] - 2:20, 2:25, 2:30, 3:6, 3:13, 3:21, 3:28, 3:31, 4:3 Street [1] - 113:11 stress [1] - 165:23 strong [2] - 79:18, 79:23 stronger [1] - 8:14 strongest [1] - 101:3 structure [1] -142:26 stuck [1] - 192:4 studio [2] - 76:13, 77:26 stuff [5] - 33:3, 53:5, 109:7, 142:6, 184:12 subject [11] - 12:23, 19:1, 20:2, 78:10, 78:14, 79:12, 96:4, 116:10, 182:23, 182:26, 186:15 subjective [1] -189:17 submerged [1] -157:27 **submitted** [9] - 9:15, 73:27, 78:16, 78:22, 79:25, 83:10, 87:18, 97:10, 104:20 subsequent [5] -12:1, 67:6, 67:8. 74:26, 159:26 subsequently [17] -9:4, 11:27, 17:11, 31:13, 31:21, 41:20, 43:21, 53:26, 65:21, 88:11, 90:4, 100:14, 104:6, 131:21, 134:25, 156:10, 184:10 substance 151 -17:21, 29:19, 51:5, 52:1, 55:18 substantial 131 -32:16, 66:11, 187:11 substantive [8] - 7:5, 13:19, 15:27, 31:12, 32:14, 32:24, 56:14, 179.15

such-and-such [1] -61:22 suggest [7] - 60:25, 81:9, 82:19, 83:8, 117:16, 143:17. 143:18 suggested [10] -45:25, 68:17, 142:25, 151:3, 151:10, 154:4, 166:1, 176:28, 180:6, 191:2 suggesting [14] -48:13, 49:21, 54:19, 54:26, 55:3, 75:17, 113:15, 151:14, 155:8, 164:4, 166:5, 166:16, 173:17, 184:6 suggestion[1] -135:13 summarise [1] -191:6 summer [2] - 66:20, 110:11 **Sunday** [1] - 100:9 **SUNLIGHT** [1] - 2:29 sunny [1] - 102:2 superbly [1] - 162:10 superintendent [2] -31:18, 168:14 Superintendent [5] -31:27, 33:13, 77:2, 163:8, 192:1 **superiors** [1] - 86:23 **support** [1] - 15:4 **supported** [2] - 31:3, 160:8 supporting [2] -15:1, 160:20 supportive [1] -159:12 suppose [37] - 9:25, 39:26, 76:9, 84:23, 86:24, 90:1, 91:20, 97:26, 99:17, 101:11, 105:3 106:21 108:28, 109:20, 109:28, 110:3, 119:1, 119:26, 120:14, 120:21, 126:3, 134:7, 135:22, 143:14, 159:4, 164:17, 164:25, 169:5, 172:10, 172:18, 172:22, 172:29, 173:10, 181:12, 184:8, 185:19, 190:16 supposed [2] -113:25, 181:4 supposedly [3] -130:5, 133:17 succeed [1] - 123:27

**SUPREME** [2] - 1:13, **SUPT** [1] - 2:27 **surely** [2] - 17:20, 82:1 surfaced [2] -146:15, 146:16 surprise [2] - 16:3, 58:2 surprised [1] -101:29 surrendered [1] -67:27 surrounding[1]-75:8 suspect [2] - 37:15, 82:12 Sutton [1] - 111:7 sway [1] - 105:7 swipe [2] - 161:18 sword [1] - 185:22 SWORN [5] - 6:15, 64:7, 94:6, 107:20, 122:8 **Sylvia** [2] - 11:20, 11:21 sympathy [1] -111:16 system [11] - 11:12, 98:24, 98:27, 138:27, 170:17, 181:4, 185:5, 185:24, 185:25, 188:9, 188:15 systemic [2] - 11:11, 11:14 Síochána [37] -28:29, 37:5, 37:6, 39:5, 39:12, 43:2, 65:19, 65:25, 67:19, 68:9, 75:5, 75:10, 77:8, 77:9, 82:11, 82:28, 83:1, 83:3, 103:27, 108:1, 110:22, 110:23, 111:6, 114:4, 117:13, 120:25, 125:23, 128:4, 129:25, 129:28, 132:21, 132:27, 135:4, 135:27, 149:16, 167:7, 173:29 Т

table [2] - 104:22, 104:25 Tallaght [2] - 82:18, 109:17 tangible [3] - 16:7,

52:13, 55:20 31:20, 31:21, 32:22, 118:18, 122:3, ties [1] - 120:27 191:1 Taoiseach [35] - 9:5, 36:20, 36:22, 36:23, 180:24, 191:23, 192:9 Time' [1] - 83:16 transcripts [4] -13:27, 13:28, 13:29, 38:18, 39:23, 59:11, then-Chairman [4] time-line [1] - 135:23 41:7, 95:18, 102:7, 60:6, 60:19, 60:28, 15:27, 17:7, 18:12, 152:17, 153:15, time-lines [2] -104:7 170:2, 170:13 19:14, 25:5, 26:1, 63:14, 65:4, 72:25, 152:24, 157:22 transferred [2] -89:5, 90:14, 91:14, 27:4, 27:14, 27:18, thentimeline [1] - 163:18 123:4, 123:11 27:20, 27:23, 27:27, 92:4, 96:8, 97:16, Commissioner [14] transpired [2] - 54:6, timing [1] - 162:21 97:25, 113:29, 114:2, 27:28, 28:1, 28:18, 103:15, 125:27, 166:21 tiresome [1] - 161:22 28:19, 29:26, 43:21, 124:24, 126:18, 126:5, 126:15, today [7] - 56:20, Transport [1] -43:22, 49:16, 49:18, 127:5, 131:25, 149:14, 149:16, 100:18 71:18, 72:11, 77:17, 50:2, 52:4, 52:6, 135:23, 138:20, 150:3, 150:29, transport [2] - 67:27, 84:28, 147:26, 172:10 141:29, 147:20, 52:14, 52:17, 52:19, 151:19, 152:16, together [3] - 11:18, 148:11, 148:13, 52:23, 52:26, 112:11 153:14, 160:3, 170:1, travelled [1] - 7:8 89:20, 166:18 150:9, 151:16, Taoiseach's [1] -170:12 **travelling** [1] - 66:1 toland [1] - 162:23 155:18, 160:6, then-Data [1] tomorrow [3] traversed [1] - 169:3 161:21, 167:13, TARA[1] - 2:27 134:20 treated [2] - 43:3, 137:6, 192:4, 192:6 167:20, 167:21, **Tara** [1] - 33:12 then-Department [1] 157:11 tone [2] - 158:17, 173:15, 173:29, task [1] - 114:22 - 122:29 160:9 tree [1] - 60:9 177:15, 180:8, taught [1] - 50:29 then-head [1] - 88:2 Tribunal [82] - 6:19, took [29] - 10:7, 182:19, 183:24, **Taylor** [5] - 31:21, then-minister [2] -15:14, 16:5, 23:10, 14:14, 15:10, 18:8, 186:23, 189:9, 31:27, 33:14, 77:3, 131:22, 185:28 19:28, 33:15, 33:16, 25:22, 31:1, 32:15, 189:21, 190:1 163:8 then-Taoiseach [1] -37:9, 40:20, 40:21, 54:9, 76:14, 79:29, testifying [2] - 56:20, **TAYLOR**[2] - 2:27, 13:29 41:29, 42:3, 42:14, 80:5, 80:17, 80:19, 69:14 then-TD [1] - 161:19 3:2 81:3, 81:10, 81:13, 42:16, 44:11, 44:14, testimony [3] -**TD** [8] - 16:28, 37:29, therefore [5] - 25:3, 45:9, 47:13, 50:9, 81:15, 87:21, 88:14, 102:14, 102:18, 82:20, 114:6, 152:17, 46:12, 52:13, 68:3, 50:10, 53:29, 54:1, 97:23, 102:1, 102:3, 106:19 161:19, 170:2, 170:14 89:11 102:4, 107:24, 54:4, 54:17, 54:22, text [15] - 85:17, **TDs** [2] - 133:14, thinking [7] - 89:6, 108:12, 124:7, 124:9, 54:24, 54:29, 58:19, 135:26, 139:9, 133:25 144:14, 144:15, 69:18, 73:20, 73:27, 154:19, 178:19 139:13, 139:24, 144:16, 156:21, 74:6, 74:16, 74:27, Teachta [1] - 6:5 top [2] - 161:26, 140:23, 145:8, 171:10, 191:19 75:1, 78:22, 79:25, team [3] - 175:19, 170:10 145:11, 154:18, 175:25, 185:9 third [5] - 22:27, totality [1] - 80:26 83:14, 83:24, 84:4, 154:24, 155:10, 130:12, 130:14, 84:7, 85:16, 87:17, tease [2] - 80:25, totally [3] - 60:22, 157:29. 158:3. 88:3, 88:8, 88:11, 81.23 138:27, 170:6 112:26, 119:6 161:19, 178:8 88:12, 88:20, 91:8, technical [1] - 97:5 thirdly [4] - 17:26, touch [3] - 7:9, 7:10, texts [7] - 160:13, 49:15, 51:22, 169:8 94:10, 95:2, 95:12, teeth [1] - 119:27 135:25 160:19, 175:24, 95:18, 100:3, 101:25, **THOMAS**[1] - 3:30 touched [1] - 114:25 telephone [6] -178:9, 178:24, 179:1, 108:24, 116:13, 165:10, 165:14, thorough [1] - 71:4 touching [1] - 43:1 189:18 120:17, 125:2, 175:15, 175:20, thoughts [1] - 127:6 tough [4] - 158:18, thanked [2] - 14:16, 126:25, 132:1, 175:27, 178:29 thrash [1] - 191:12 159:6, 159:24 18:14 132:15, 136:14, television [3] thrashed [1] - 105:2 Tourism [1] - 100:18 thanking [2] - 14:27, 147:11, 147:16, 89:12, 115:11, 115:13 threat [1] - 133:29 toward [1] - 44:4 56:24 147:21, 148:3, ten [2] - 42:15, 112:2 three [13] - 68:6, towards [7] - 15:4, that'd [1] - 108:15 151:17, 152:2, 169:5, tend [1] - 176:2 68:7, 89:15, 108:29, 45:15, 45:17, 64:15, **THE** [32] - 1:4, 1:8, 169:13, 169:15, tends [2] - 89:23, 109:1, 109:9, 139:25, 78:23, 105:9, 123:6 1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6, 169:23, 172:4, 120:13 146:17, 150:10, town [1] - 112:3 2:14, 5:9, 5:15, 5:24, 175:19, 177:19, tense [1] - 105:8 160:13, 160:19, tracking [1] - 62:28 5:32, 6:1, 33:11, 37:3, 177:21, 179:3, tensions [1] - 104:12 172:27 traction [5] - 18:19, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 190:25, 190:29, 191:4 term [3] - 148:15, three-and-a-half [1] -39:15, 51:3, 168:2, 63:21, 64:1, 77:1, TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:3, 169:4, 169:16 174:7 77:13, 88:29, 92:17, throughout [4] terminated [4] trade [1] - 37:27 93:1, 94:1, 107:15, **Tribunal's** [1] - 31:15 130:6, 130:19, 182:8, 31:18, 128:1, 128:25, traditional [1] -118:18, 122:3, **TRIBUNALS** [1] - 1:9 146:26 184:4 67:24 180:24, 191:23, 192:9 tried [2] - 65:6, 65:9 terminating [2] **throwing** [1] - 167:9 trailing [1] - 91:7 themselves [4] trouble [2] - 46:1, Thursday [3] - 56:17, 135:20, 182:3 train [1] - 43:22 15:3, 66:14, 130:22, 46:14 terms [68] - 11:8, 102:8, 102:9 trammel [1] - 50:20 131:7 true [10] - 17:21, 12:23, 14:28, 16:20, ticket [2] - 109:12, tranche [1] - 30:19 **THEN** [12] - 59:5, 48:18, 51:19, 73:2, 17:1, 25:1, 25:4, 25:6, transcript [8] - 1:26, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 90:20, 114:18, 25:9, 26:2, 27:25, tickets [2] - 129:26, 45:10, 70:20, 73:18, 88:29, 92:17, 107:15, 119:22, 151:3, 180:11 31:2, 31:15, 31:19, 130:6 77:21, 79:17, 165:24,

79:6, 79:16, 82:7, trumpet [1] - 38:7 ultimately [2] - 9:2, victim [2] - 20:7, wantonly [1] - 72:7 trust [2] - 62:12, 39:26 82:8, 84:19, 85:10, 180:2 wants [2] - 20:7, 119:2 unaware [1] - 80:29 88:9, 98:24, 105:21, victims [1] - 25:25 20:25 107:24, 108:12, trusted [14] - 15:8, uncertainty [1] view [47] - 17:17, warn [4] - 68:15, 26:2, 26:24, 27:12, 109:7, 110:11, 16:22, 44:22, 45:27, 142:11 80:6, 81:5, 90:18 112:15, 112:23, 52:22, 55:6, 68:22, unclear [1] - 55:1 27:13, 29:1, 48:26, warning [1] - 85:2 68:24, 80:23, 81:17, 112:27, 116:23, 48:29, 59:24, 66:10, uncomfortable [1] warnings [2] - 61:25, 119:3, 119:20, 91:13, 92:9, 119:2, 71:10, 71:28, 84:23, 100:2 122:17, 122:19, 119:3 91:19, 95:19, 97:13, under [10] - 8:7, wary [1] - 90:24 123:1, 124:7, 124:9, 98:22, 99:19, 101:10, try [12] - 30:21, 53:21, 66:13, 77:8, **WAS**[21] - 6:15, 47:19, 96:7, 100:1, 128:18, 131:1, 104:29, 118:22, 104:20, 125:15, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 139:21, 141:12, 104:5, 126:25, 127:8, 132:24, 135:3, 158:7, 118:24, 120:14, 57:17, 59:5, 64:7, 148:16, 162:27, 159:16, 161:14, 120:15, 157:4, 77:1, 77:13, 88:29, 179:27 165:14, 168:7, 168:9, 159:10, 161:4, 161:6, 169:2, 176:13, 186:15 **UNDER** [2] - 1:3, 1:9 94:6, 101:19, 103:24, 170:20, 171:14, 161:12, 162:8, trying [17] - 40:5, undermine [5] -107:20. 118:18. 172:19, 177:15, 75:18, 79:14, 84:15, 75:15, 75:18, 97:20. 162:11, 163:27, 122:8, 147:2, 163:4, 180:27, 181:28, 164:24, 164:26, 96:8, 96:24, 96:25, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24 97:21, 97:22 182:19, 183:16, 165:2, 165:3, 166:4, 98:26, 99:22, 99:29, undermined [1] watch [2] - 116:27, 183:23, 183:27, 142:1, 159:12, 172:1, 167:11, 181:3, 181:9, 173:25 140:10 184:13, 184:26, 181:11, 182:23, 173:6, 177:15, 188:4 understandable [4] watched [1] - 140:8 185:10, 185:11, 183:11, 186:22, TUESDAY[1] - 192:9 water [3] - 48:17, 53:15, 53:17, 53:18, 188:20, 189:27 188:12, 189:22 Tuesday [5] - 40:23, 53:27 53:21, 185:13 updated [1] - 73:24 viewed [1] - 104:20 70:16, 106:8, 106:9, understandably [1] ways [1] - 135:4 106:12 upload [1] - 72:10 views [3] - 138:29, 37:13 Wednesday [1] -**UPPER** [1] - 3:21 Tuesdays [1] - 56:17 160:6, 189:21 understood [6] -85:13 upset [2] - 110:29, tuppence [1] - 167:9 11:5, 19:26, 28:28, vigorously[1] -Wednesdays [1] -115:29 66:16 turn [5] - 44:10, 30:26, 77:3, 77:19 56:17 upshot [1] - 137:9 vile [1] - 89:8 47:10, 74:2, 131:14, unfortunately [2] week [12] - 10:6, upstanding[1] violence [1] - 92:5 167:4 60:4, 91:20 22:19, 22:20, 22:26, 71:10 visit [2] - 19:2, 19:29 turned [2] - 139:20, unhappiness [1] -23:1. 27:10. 40:18. urgent [1] - 20:12 visitors' [1] - 98:10 182:8 159:28 41:6, 102:8, 102:10, useful [1] - 88:15 turning [1] - 40:10 unhappy [1] - 189:5 **Volume** [5] - 6:20, 111:24, 119:27 usual [3] - 76:11, 20:4, 94:10, 179:9, turns [1] - 74:20 uniform [1] - 108:2 weekend [5] - 87:18, 76:13, 109:7 179:10 Tusla [4] - 39:26, unit [1] - 184:10 100:8, 102:15, 102:17 125:3, 125:7, 125:12 volume [5] - 26:27, weeks [2] - 15:22, Unit [3] - 108:5, V 136:17, 136:18, two [28] - 25:19, 159:27 131:20, 188:11 147:8, 147:9 34:13, 34:28, 38:29, unless [4] - 60:24, weigh [1] - 39:13 volumes [1] - 20:5 40:12, 40:15, 42:9, 72:8, 112:3, 118:12 welcome [1] vague [2] - 10:25, 44:8, 44:25, 78:3, voluntary [3] unlike [1] - 105:11 121:10 32.4 88:26, 95:8, 98:13, 124:25, 124:28, 125:9 unlikely [1] - 65:24 welfare [1] - 115:26 validation[1] -98:23, 99:19, 99:20, volunteered [1] -Welfare [3] - 123:12, unnecessarily [1] -164.22 104:8, 106:10, 26:15 123:13, 123:14 91:24 value [4] - 17:3, 109:14, 120:7, unrelated [1] - 9:22 **vote** [8] - 98:7, well-covered [1] -65:23, 96:12, 164:14 139:24, 146:17, 106:23, 106:24, unreliability [1] -160:2 Varadkar [3] - 100:5, 156:18, 165:15, 106:25, 106:26, 62:27 well-founded [1] -101:23, 103:2 172:19, 174:17, 109:11, 109:17, 135:5 135:21 unreliable [3] -Varadkar's [1] -179.23 well-known [1] -60:10, 61:3, 62:10 twofold [2] - 130:9, W 37:19 UNTIL [1] - 192:9 various [7] - 6:23, 130:25 whatsoever [4] unusual [10] - 98:14, 7:18, 43:4, 49:6, 66:1, type [7] - 10:2, 112:17, 112:25, 111:14, 116:5, 156:28 wading [1] - 68:16 32:25, 116:15, 125:29, 164:15, 125:12, 161:11 vehicle [1] - 182:9 waited [1] - 21:19 129:28, 130:1, 130:4, WHELAN [1] - 2:16 164:16, 164:17, ventilated [2] waiting [2] - 113:2, 179:21 165:5, 165:18 whereas [2] -78:27, 132:4 114:11 typical [1] - 186:5 105:15, 105:17 up [68] - 10:26, venue [1] - 7:8 waiving [1] - 11:9 Tánaiste [1] - 112:11 13:17, 19:25, 20:11, whistleblower [3] verbatim [1] - 1:26 wake [1] - 75:24 21:2, 27:2, 28:18, 8:24, 115:16, 137:5 verified [1] - 88:17 walk [1] - 104:29 U 29:17, 30:7, 33:4, whistleblowers [6] -**WALLACE**[1] - 2:23 verifying[1] - 87:24 34:10, 35:23, 60:9, 30:13, 43:2, 43:3, verse [1] - 32:27 Walsh [2] - 192:2, 69:29, 70:9, 70:19, 99:21, 160:6, 180:2 uachtarán [1] - 38:3 vicinity [1] - 98:9 192:3 71:7, 76:11, 76:13, whole [15] - 10:9,

59:9, 128:26, 133:5,	103:15, 115:20,	159:17, 165:11,
138:25, 144:19,	129:7, 130:7, 130:20,	178:25
1		170.23
145:27, 157:20,	154:12, 164:14,	
157:23, 157:25,	172:24, 182:26,	Z
166:24, 167:1, 181:3,	183:12, 188:18,	
183:14, 187:29	188:19, 188:24	11.7
widely [1] - 90:11	words [14] - 14:22,	zealot [1] - 11:7
wider [1] - 75:29	15:22, 62:11, 65:19,	
wife [1] - 110:7	78:7, 91:3, 125:29,	_
WILLIAMS[1] - 4:1	151:29, 152:9, 160:8,	
Williams [13] - 19:29,	168:3, 186:24	20:26
21:12, 23:7, 23:8,	workings [1] -	<b>-</b> [1] - 20:26
23:9, 23:12, 23:14,	110:23	<u></u>
24:20, 28:2, 59:15,	workload [1] - 29:12	É
149:22, 149:29,	worried [3] - 97:19,	ÉIDEANN 4.5
150:10	97:24, 134:14	<b>EIREANN</b> [2] - 1:5,
willing [2] - 23:16,	worry [1] - 183:8	1:6
179:29	worst [1] - 17:10	<b>Éireann</b> [4] - 6:22,
willingness [1] -	worth [4] - 62:27,	9:6, 44:6, 94:15
20:3	62:28, 142:20, 167:9	
<b>Wilson</b> [1] - 98:8	write [5] - 25:5,	Ó
WILSON [1] - 3:5	27:29, 165:12, 165:16	
window [1] - 16:25	writing [4] - 27:23,	
wish [2] - 158:24,	61:24, 87:14, 161:29	<b>Ó</b> [2] - 3:12, 85:17
159:16	written [4] - 88:1,	
wished [1] - 64:20	139:3, 149:21, 151:12	
WITHDREW [5] -	wrong-headed [1] -	
63:21, 92:17, 107:15,	186:22	
122:3, 191:23	wrongdoing [2] -	
witness [19] - 6:4,	48:21, 179:26	
13:18, 35:11, 60:14,	wrongly [2] - 91:24,	
64:4, 72:5, 92:26,	187:17	
94:3, 107:17, 122:5,	wrote [7] - 13:27,	
137:14, 137:19,	13:28, 27:27, 27:28,	
	13.20, 21.21, 21.20,	
141:16, 142:4,	88:11, 109:15, 132:16	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27,	88:11, 109:15, 132:16	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25,		
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26	88:11, 109:15, 132:16	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 WITNESS [17] - 5:2,	88:11, 109:15, 132:16	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2,	88:11, 109:15, 132:16  Y  year <sub>[10]</sub> - 78:21,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21,	<b>Y year</b> [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17,	88:11, 109:15, 132:16  Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4,	<b>Y</b> year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5,	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 <b>witnesses</b> [4] -	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 <b>witnesses</b> [4] -	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 <b>witnesses</b> [4] - 15:17, 104:26,	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 <b>witnesses</b> [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 <b>WITNESS</b> [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 <b>witnesses</b> [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16 <b>woman</b> [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7	88:11, 109:15, 132:16  Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26	88:11, 109:15, 132:16  Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26  WITNESS [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23  witnesses [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16  woman [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7  woman's [1] - 27:8  wonder [4] - 6:7, 80:25, 161:16, 190:23	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17, 156:7, 156:18,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 WITNESS [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 witnesses [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16 woman [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7 woman's [1] - 27:8 wonder [4] - 6:7, 80:25, 161:16, 190:23 wondering [5] -	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17, 156:7, 156:18, 157:18, 159:15 Yesterday [1] - 21:1	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26  WITNESS [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23  witnesses [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16  woman [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7  woman's [1] - 27:8  wonder [4] - 6:7, 80:25, 161:16, 190:23  wondering [5] - 58:13, 88:14, 140:26,	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17, 156:7, 156:18, 157:18, 159:15 Yesterday [1] - 21:1 young [3] - 20:10,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 WITNESS [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 witnesses [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16 woman [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7 woman's [1] - 27:8 wonder [4] - 6:7, 80:25, 161:16, 190:23 wondering [5] - 58:13, 88:14, 140:26, 155:3, 180:10	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17, 156:7, 156:18, 157:18, 159:15 Yesterday [1] - 21:1 young [3] - 20:10, 25:23, 27:5	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 WITNESS [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 witnesses [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16 woman [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7 woman's [1] - 27:8 wonder [4] - 6:7, 80:25, 161:16, 190:23 wondering [5] - 58:13, 88:14, 140:26,	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17, 156:7, 156:18, 157:18, 159:15 Yesterday [1] - 21:1 young [3] - 20:10, 25:23, 27:5 yourself [10] - 10:17,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 WITNESS [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 witnesses [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16 woman [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7 woman's [1] - 27:8 wonder [4] - 6:7, 80:25, 161:16, 190:23 wondering [5] - 58:13, 88:14, 140:26, 155:3, 180:10	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17, 156:7, 156:18, 157:18, 159:15 Yesterday [1] - 21:1 young [3] - 20:10, 25:23, 27:5 yourself [10] - 10:17, 13:9, 13:10, 90:27,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26 WITNESS [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23 witnesses [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16 woman [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7 woman's [1] - 27:8 wonder [4] - 6:7, 80:25, 161:16, 190:23 wondering [5] - 58:13, 88:14, 140:26, 155:3, 180:10 word [20] - 49:24,	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17, 156:7, 156:18, 157:18, 159:15 Yesterday [1] - 21:1 young [3] - 20:10, 25:23, 27:5 yourself [10] - 10:17,	
141:16, 142:4, 159:18, 173:27, 179:13, 191:25, 191:26  WITNESS [17] - 5:2, 33:11, 37:3, 56:2, 57:17, 59:5, 63:21, 77:1, 77:13, 92:17, 107:15, 122:3, 163:4, 168:25, 178:5, 180:24, 191:23  witnesses [4] - 15:17, 104:26, 105:13, 137:16  woman [5] - 20:10, 20:25, 25:23, 27:5, 182:7  woman's [1] - 27:8  wonder [4] - 6:7, 80:25, 161:16, 190:23  wondering [5] - 58:13, 88:14, 140:26, 155:3, 180:10  word [20] - 49:24, 77:18, 79:19, 79:21,	Y  year [10] - 78:21, 83:24, 101:28, 102:3, 111:9, 120:5, 120:9, 126:22, 148:4, 159:13 years [26] - 6:24, 25:24, 42:16, 44:8, 68:6, 68:7, 86:7, 89:15, 108:2, 108:13, 108:29, 109:1, 109:21, 120:16, 120:19, 120:28, 123:25, 126:22, 126:24, 146:17, 156:7, 156:18, 157:18, 159:15 Yesterday [1] - 21:1 young [3] - 20:10, 25:23, 27:5 yourself [10] - 10:17, 13:9, 13:10, 90:27,	