TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT

<u>HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE</u>

ON WEDNESDAY, 9TH MAY 2018 - DAY 71

71

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT SOLE MEMBER:

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL:

MR. DIARMAID MCGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. KATHLEEN LEADER BL MS. ELIZABETH MULLAN, SOLICITOR

FOR SGT. McCABE:

MR. MICHAEL McDOWELL SC MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. BREFFNI GORDON BL SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY

INSTRUCTED BY:

DUBLIN 7

FOR THE COMMISSIONER:

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC
MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC
MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. NOEL WHELAN BL
MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL
MR. JOHN FITZGERALD BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE
OSMOND HOUSE
LITTLE SHIP STREET
DUBLIN 8

INSTRUCTED BY:

FOR SUPT. TAYLOR: MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS

INSTRUCTED BY:

MS. TARA BURNS SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL

MR. CARTHAGE CONLON
M. E. HANAHOE SOLICITORS
SUNLIGHT CHAMBERS
21 PARLIAMENT STREET
DUBLIN 2

FOR ALISON O'REILLY: INSTRUCTED BY: MR. FÍONÁN Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH BL

AUGUSTUS CULLEN LAW SOLICITORS
18 BOW STREET
SMITHFIELD
DUBLIN 7

FOR RTÉ: MR. RONAN KENNEDY BL

INSTRUCTED BY: PATRICIA HARRINGTON, RTÉ FOR INDEPENDENT NEWS

AND MEDIA & PAUL WILLIAMS: MR. ROSSA FANNING SC MR. JOHN FREEMAN BL

FANNING & KELLY SOLICITORS INSTRUCTED BY:

HATCH HALL
HATCH STREET LOWER
SAINT KEVIN'S
DUBLIN 2

FOR MI CHAEL O' TOOLE: MR. KIERAN KELLY

FANNING & KELLY SOLICITORS

HATCH HALL
HATCH STREET LOWER
SAINT KEVIN'S

DUBLIN 2

FOR ASSOCIATED NEWSPAPERS LIMITED, DEBBIE McCANN, SEBASTIAN HAMILTON & CONOR O' DONNELL

INSTRUCTED BY: MR. MI CHAEL KEELEY DMG MEDIA IRELAND

FOR TIMES NEWSPAPERS LIMITED & NEWS GROUP NEWSPAPERS

LIMITED:

MR. SIMON McALEESE SIMON MCALEESE SOLICITORS

CUNNI NGHAM HOUSE FRANCIS STREET MERCHANTS QUAY

DUBLIN 8

FOR THE IRISH EXAMINER,

JUNO McENROE DANIEL McCONNELL & CORMAC O'KEEFFE:

MR. DARRYL BRODERICK RONAN DALY JERMYN SOLICITORS THE EXCHANGE GEORGE'S DOCK

IFSC DUBLIN 1

FOR THE IRISH TIMES

DESIGNATED ACTIVITY COMPANY, THE IRISH TIMES TRUST & CONOR LALLY:

MR. DAVID PHELAN HAYES SOLICITORS LAVERY HOUSE 2 EARLY SORT TERRACE

DUBLIN 2

INDEX

WI TNESS	PAGE
MS. DEIRDRE MOONEY	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS	9
DETECTIVE SERGEANT ALAN FRAWLEY	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	9
EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	14
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	17
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	18
SERGEANT DAMI EN HOGAN	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCDOWELL	37
EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	39
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	63
SERGEANT ANTHONY CONNAUGHTON	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	68
SERGEANT JAMES MOLLOY	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	73
EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	
SERGEANT ALAN FRAWLEY	
FURTHER EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	86
SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK RYAN	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER	87
EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS	107
RE-EXAMINED RV MS LEADER	110

SERGEANT DECLAN MONAGHAN
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS
EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS
GARDA DARINA O'BRIEN
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS120

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON WEDNESDAY, 9TH MAY	
2			<u>2018:</u>	
3				
4			CHAIRMAN: Sincere apologies for keeping everybody	
5			waiting. As usual, I haven't got over barristers'	11:06
6			habit of underestimating things, and there it is.	
7			MR. MARRINAN: The first witness this morning, sir, is	
8			Deirdre Mooney, please.	
9				
10			MS. DEIRDRE MOONEY, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	11:06
11			EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
12	1	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think you started to work in An Garda	
13			Síochána in 2007 in the administrative office for the	
14			Special Detective Unit in Harcourt Square, is that	
15			right?	11:08
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	2	Q.	And I think that you moved from there to the Press	
18			Office in March of 2008?	
19		Α.	That's correct.	
20	3	Q.	And you remained in the Press Office until August of	11:08
21			2013, is that right?	
22		Α.	That's correct.	
23	4	Q.	And I think that you met with our investigators on the	
24			19th September of 2017, and you made a statement in the	
25			form of question and answer to them, and that's at page	11:08
26			2837 of the materials. What was your role in the Press	
27			Office?	
28		Α.	I was on the news desk team.	
29	5	Q.	What does that mean?	

1		Α.	That means my main role was taking calls from	
2			journalists and members of the public and in the	
3			morning I would have went through the papers, prepared	
4			the clippings, sent them on the distribution list.	
5	6	Q.	And during your period of time there, obviously there	11:0
6			were a number of Press Officers but do you remember	
7			Superintendent Taylor	
8		Α.	I do.	
9	7	Q.	in particular. I think that he came a year before	
10			you left, is that right?	11:0
11		Α.	That's right, yes.	
12	8	Q.	So he was there for a year. How did you find working	
13			with him?	
14		Α.	Very, very nice. He was a fine boss, yeah.	
15	9	Q.	And was the system of work in the Press Office, did it	11:0
16			remain the same throughout the period of time that you	
17			were there?	
18		Α.	It did, yeah.	
19	10	Q.	All right. And the reporting structures remained the	
20			same, is that right?	11:0
21		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
22	11	Q.	So I think you describe in your statement that you were	
23			sort of shadowing the sergeants who were primarily	
24			dealing with the queries that were coming in?	
25		Α.	That's correct, we would if we would prepare a line,	11:0
26			it would be approved by a sergeant or management.	

reference to your attention, is that right?

12 Q.

27

28

29

I think the investigators, during the period of time

that they were with you, drew the Tribunal's terms of

2	13	Q.	And in particular, a protected disclosure that has been	
3			made by Superintendent Taylor in relation to a campaign	
4			which he claims was initiated against Sergeant McCabe.	
5			Were you aware of any such campaign during your period	11:10
6			of time there?	
7		Α.	I wasn't, no.	
8	14	Q.	You left obviously in August of 2013?	
9		Α.	Yeah.	
10	15	Q.	Is that right?	11:10
11		Α.	That's correct.	
12	16	Q.	At that time, had Sergeant McCabe come into the public	
13			eye, do you recall?	
14		Α.	I can't remember, to be honest with you. Perhaps.	
15	17	Q.	Do you remember dealing with any queries that came into	11:1
16			the Press Office?	
17		Α.	I think there was a line on the Spotlight but it would	
18			have been kind of a standard line that we wouldn't	
19			comment on named individuals.	
20	18	Q.	Yes. I think that most of the activity in the Press	11:1
21			Office took place after you left, in August of 2013?	
22		Α.	Yeah.	
23			MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much.	
24		Α.	Thank you.	
25				11:1
26			MR. McDOWELL: No questions.	
27				
28				

A. They did, yeah.

1

1			THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS:	
2	19	Q.	MS. BURNS: Morning Ms. Mooney. My name is Tara Burns	
3			and I appear on behalf of Superintendent Taylor. Just	
4			in relation to the interview that you conducted with	
5			the Tribunal interviewers, when you were asked about	11:11
6			your interactions with Superintendent Taylor I think	
7			that you described it as very positive and that he was	
8			a very good boss?	
9		Α.	Yeah, I never had any problems with him.	
10	20	Q.	Thank you very much.	11:11
11		Α.	You are welcome.	
12				
13			MR. MARRINAN: Thank you.	
14			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: No questions, Chairman.	
15				11:11
16			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
17				
18			MR. MARRINAN: The next witness is Sergeant Alan	
19			Frawley, please.	
20				11:11
21			DETECTIVE SERGEANT ALAN FRAWLEY, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	-
22			DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
23	21	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think, Sergeant Frawley, that you made	
24			a statement on the 9th November of 2017 for the benefit	
25			of the Tribunal, is that right?	11:12
26		Α.	That's correct.	
27	22	Q.	It's at page 2869, for the benefit of the parties, and	
28			it's a relatively short statement. When did you first	
29			arrive in the Press Office?	

1	۸	Tho	21c+	71100	2013.
T	Α.	HHE	215 L	Julie	ZUID.

- 2 23 Q. And where had you come from?
- 3 A. Crumlin.
- 4 24 Q. Crumlin. And what was your role when you arrived in the Press Office?

11:13

11 · 14

- A. I would have been sergeant in the Press Office working in the -- I suppose, in the newsroom where the telephone calls and the emails would come in from the media.
- 10 25 Q. And were you dealing directly with the media?
- 11 A. Yeah. You would be answering telephone calls and 12 answering emails and queries directly.
- 13 26 Q. And you might be able to help us in terms of queries
 14 that would come in from the media; if a query came in
 15 from the media in relation to a particular case or
 11:13
 16 named individual that the Gardaí were dealing with, how
 17 would you respond to that query?
- A. There were -- there were set responses, if a person is
 named the answer would be, you know, 'We do not comment
 on named individuals', 'We do not comment on third
 party statements', that kind of thing. So, yeah, that
 would be a standard response once a person --
- 23 27 Q. Is that a sort of golden rule in the Press Office, that 24 the Press Officers who were there and the staff, don't 25 discuss individual cases with the media?
- A. You could talk about a case about once it goes -- when
 it goes to court, you don't, we don't generally comment
 on it, on cases. And when there is a person named, be
 it over the phone or on the email, you would respond

- that An Garda Síochána do not comment on named individuals.
- Just anecdotally, the Tribunal has information that has 3 28 Q. 4 come in from journalists in relation to their contact 5 with the Press Office and, for instance, queries that 11:14 6 may have been raised, for example, in relation to 7 Sergeant Maurice McCabe, that there would be a standard response from the Press Office, namely that you 8 wouldn't engage in making any comment in relation to a 9 named individual, is that your experience? 10 11:14
- 11 A. That would be my experience, yeah.
- 12 29 Q. And in terms of queries coming in, in relation to, for 13 example, a Garda file or directions from the DPP in any 14 given case, would you comment on that?

- If an incident occurs and it's deemed that there 15 Α. 16 would be media interest in it, you would put it on 17 Spotliaht. Now, if there are arrests that may be part 18 of a press release. If you put the incident out on a 19 press release, if there were arrests you may say 'three 20 people arrested'. If those people are charged, be it straight after being detained or further down the line, 21 22 depending on the seriousness of the incident, you would 23 inform the media that the person or the persons have 24 been charged.
- 25 30 Q. Now, I think there were six other sergeants working in the Press Office at the time, is that right?
- 27 A. That's correct, seven in total, yeah.
- 28 31 Q. And we know that there was Inspector Finan and also superintendent -- sorry, Inspector Ferris and also

- 1 Superintendent Taylor, isn't that correct?
- 2 A. That's correct, yeah.
- 3 32 Q. How did you get on with Superintendent Taylor?
- 4 A. Very well, yeah, yeah.
- 5 33 Q. You had a good working relationship with him, did you?
- 6 A. Yeah.
- 7 34 Q. And how did he appear to relate to the other members of staff?
- 9 A. Yeah, very well. It was my first experience in an
 10 office kind of environment during my time, so I saw no 11:16
 11 real problems in the office, yeah.

- 12 35 Q. Did he appear to be open?
- 13 A. To me anyhow, yeah, he did.
- 14 36 Q. It's just we have some other evidence the Tribunal is going to hear this morning that on occasions he appeared to be quite secretive in his dealings with members of the media and would perhaps leave a room if he was on the phone and move to another room if he was talking to a journalist?
- 20 A. Possibly, yeah.
- 21 37 Q. You didn't notice anything like that?
- 22 A. I didn't notice it, but probably, if I was on the phone 23 myself, depending on the call, if it was a personal
- call I would probably leave the room.
- 25 38 Q. Okay. And so, as far as you were concerned

 Superintendent Taylor appeared to be quite open in his
- dealings with people. You are aware of the terms of
- reference of the Tribunal, aren't you?
- 29 A. Yes.

1 39 Q. And in particular, a protected disclosure that has been 2 made by Superintendent Taylor of a campaign that he 3 said that he was engaged in to brief journalists about Sergeant Maurice McCabe, you are aware of that? 4 5 Α. Yes. 11:17 6 40 Q. Yes. Did you hear anything of that? Did he say 7 anything to you about that when he was there? 8 No. Chair. Α. Did you hear any mutterings or discussions about it in 9 41 Q. the Press Office? 10 11:18 11 No, Chair. Α. 12 42 In terms of Sergeant Maurice McCabe at the time, when 0. 13 did -- are you still in the Press Office? 14 Α. No. 15 43 No. When did you leave? Q. 11:18 16 The 12th December just gone. Α. 17 Just gone? 44 Q. 18 2017, yeah. Α. 19 45 But during your period of time in the Press Office and Q. 20 in particular up until the summer of 2014, had you 11:18 heard anything about Sergeant McCabe's background, in 21 22 particular an allegation of sexual assault that had 23 been made many years earlier? 24 No, no. Α. 25 were you totally unaware of that? 46 Q. 11:18 Judge, I think I became -- sorry, Chair, I think I 26 Α. 27 became aware of it generally when it became kind of

news, I suppose, for want of a better word.

in the office, no, I wasn't aware. Later on in the

In my time

28

1			office, I think there was a Spotlight a line put on	
2			Spotlight about protected disclosure and that.	
3	47	Q.	Yes, but that is in	
4		Α.	That was further down the line, yeah.	
5	48	Q.	Yes. But certainly as of and up until the summer of	11:19
6			2014, Sergeant McCabe just simply wasn't on the radar,	
7			as it were, in the Press Office at all, is that right?	
8		Α.	Sorry, yeah, personally, yeah, as far as I was aware,	
9			yes.	
10			MR. MARRINAN: Would you answer any questions, please.	11:19
11				
12			MR. McDOWELL: No questions, Chairman.	
13			MS. BURNS: No questions, Chairman.	
14				
15			THE WITNESS WAS EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS:	11:19
16	49	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Just one question, if I may. I	
17			wonder if we could have page 116 of the materials on	
18			screen, please, Volume 1. And this is the commencement	
19			of Superintendent David Taylor's interview with	
20			investigators, with Tribunal investigators, that was	11:20
21			provided on the 5th May 2017. And actually, if we	
22			could move down to page 127 of that, of the materials,	
23			which is page 12 of that document. Do you see there on	
24			page 127, there is a question-and-answer between	
25			Superintendent Taylor and the Tribunal investigator,	11:20
26			and he is asked well, actually, perhaps, the lead-in	
7			is significant:	

"I have been asked who instructed me to contact the

1			media and brief them as detailed above and when the	
2			instruction occurred."	
3				
4			And then, at the top of page 127 he gives the answer:	
5				11:21
6			"Commissioner Callinan just to clarify I wish to	
7			state that Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan never	
8			instructed me to brief the media as detailed above.	
9			However, as far as I am concerned, she was aware of the	
10			instruction by Commissioner Callinan."	11:21
11				
12			Do you see that there?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	50	Q.	And then a little bit further on he is asked:	
15				11:21
16			" to provide to the Disclosures Tribunal any	
17			evidence, documentary notes, letters, diary entries,	
18			reports, statements, emails or otherwise, electronic,	
19			tel ephonic or otherwise, to substantiate this	
20			allegation, and I have been asked if I can signpost for	11:21
21			the Tribunal where these communications can be	
22			located."	
23				
24			And then there is an answer given:	
25				11:21
26			"I refer to my earlier answer in relation to	
27			documentary evidence that may assist the Tribunal.	
28			Just to clarify again, the instruction by Commissioner	
29			Callinan in this regard was always verbal. The	

1			instruction was never documented in writing, text or	
2			email."	
3				
4			And then he is asked:	
5				11:22
6			"I have also been asked whether any other person was	
7			present when these instructions were given to me or	
8			whether any other person was aware of these	
9			instructions given to me by Commissioner Callinan."	
10				11:22
11			And the following answer is recorded:	
12				
13			"I can confirm nobody else was present when I received	
14			these verbal instructions. However, I can say Andrew	
15			McLindon was aware of these instructions as I discussed	11:22
16			them with him."	
17				
18			All right. Now, that is a long introduction into the	
19			question I am going to ask you. My question is this:	
20			Did Andrew McLindon, the Director of Communications of	11:22
21			An Garda Síochána, did he ever instruct you to brief	
22			negatively against Sergeant McCabe in any way?	
23		Α.	No, Chair.	
24	51	Q.	Or did he in any way give you information for the	
25			purpose of discrediting Sergeant McCabe?	11:22
26		Α.	No.	
27			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you.	
28			MR. MARRINAN: Sorry, sir, just one matter.	

1			THE WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
2	52	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think, sergeant, we are just concerned	
3			about one aspect that I neglected to ask you about. In	
4			late February/early March of 2014, Eavan Murray, who is	
5			a journalist, and Debbie McCann both visited the home	11:23
6			of Ms. D, and I just want to ask you, were you aware of	
7			that at the time?	
8		Α.	Of their visit?	
9	53	Q.	Yes.	
10		Α.	No.	11:23
11	54	Q.	Do you recall any inquiries into the Press Office in	
12			relation to Ms. D or	
13		Α.	No.	
14	55	Q.	her family?	
15		Α.	No, I don't recall.	11:23
16	56	Q.	And then in February of 2014, of the same year, Gerald	
17			Kean, solicitor, apparently phoned the Press Office.	
18			Do you recall any interaction with him at all?	
19		Α.	No.	
20			MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much.	11:24
21		Α.	Thank you.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Just one thing. Sorry, Mr. Marrinan, if I	
23			may just ask you first. I may have lost attention but	
24			did we ask Andrew McLindon about the question that	
25			Mr. O'Higgins put to him?	11:24
26			MR. MARRINAN: Yes.	
27			CHAIRMAN: I am sure we probably did, yes. And the	
28			answer was no, definitely	
29			MR. MARRINAN: He has denied it completely.	

1			CHAIRMAN: I know. And we know in another place he has	
2			been referred to by Superintendent Taylor by an	
3			unpleasant appellation.	
4				
5			THE WITNESS WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	11:24
6	57	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I just want to get an idea, if you wouldn't	
7			mind, I know about the 12-hour shifts and I'm just kind	
8			of struggling to kind an idea, if you don't mind, as to	
9			how many rooms are in the Press Office; there was	
10			mention of an upstairs, there has been mention of	11:24
11			Superintendent Taylor sharing a room with the	
12			inspector, forget about all of that, maybe you would	
13			just give me and then the other thing, although I	
14			know there is seven sergeants, one inspector, one	
15			superintendent, four civilians, you are not all working	11:25
16			every single day so maybe you would just help me on	
17			that, on Monday and then maybe Saturday, Sunday, what	
18			happens there.	
19		Α.	Yes. The layout, Chair, is - from when I started	
20			anyhow - when you go in the door, the main door to your	11:25
21			left would have been Superintendent Taylor's office.	
22	58	Q.	CHAIRMAN: where are we talking about?	
23		Α.	On the ground floor.	
24	59	Q.	CHAIRMAN: If you are talking about the car park in	
25			Garda Headquarters?	11:25
26		Α.	As you look at the centre block building, it's to your	
27			right as you look at it and it is the gable end, there	
28			is a big blue door at the end of that, at the gable	
29			end. When you go in the door, to the left	

Superintendent Taylor's office straight in front of vou. Andrew McLindon's office. Down the stairs was toilets and shower facilities. Up the stairs, when you get to the top of the stairs, straight in front of you is the main office. There's six desks with computers 11:25 and telephones, that was the news desk area where the sergeants and the news desk -- as Deirdre put it, the news desk staff, civilian staff worked. At the top of the stairs when you turn right, there is an office, which was commonly referred to as the back office where 11:26 Brenda O'Grady would work, and at the time I started that is where Inspector Ferris was. There's two desks there, there's three now. And then beyond that, at the end of the corridor there is a kitchen area where we'd make our tea or have our lunch there. And that is 11:26 basically the layout.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

On any given tour, on a Monday, if it was myself -- the seven sergeants were split, there were two sergeants, say, there was three groups of two sergeants, I was the 11:26 So if I was working at 7:00, I sergeant on my own. would have probably a member, a civilian member with me at 7:00, and then possibly at 10:00 a sergeant would come on. At 9:00 a civilian may come on, 9:00 to 5:00, they worked a shorter day, they were working eight hours. At 11:00 a civilian may come on and work until And then the late tour would start at 1:00, 1:00 until 11:00 was the late tour. So you may have one or two sergeants coming on late. There were days when you

11 · 27

Τ			may be the only sergeant working early, and only one	
2			other sergeant would come in late. In general, they	
3			were the times: 7:00 to 5:00, 1:00 until 11:00 and	
4			then the civilians were 7:00 to 3:00, 9:00 to 5:00 and	
5			11:00 to 7:00, but you may not have five people	11:27
6			working	
7	60	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. And on a Saturday and Sunday the hours	
8			are shorter, isn't that right?	
9		Α.	On a Sunday they are shorter, yes.	
10	61	Q.	CHAIRMAN: They are what?	11:27
11		Α.	They would be 3:00 to 11:00, would be the late, and	
12			7:00 to 3:00 would be the early.	
13	62	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So it's still a full day, though?	
14		Α.	Yeah, yeah, a full tour, yeah.	
15	63	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. And you know the way how long did	11:27
16			you actually spend in the Press Office? Forgive me, I	
17			know Mr. Marrinan led you through that detail.	
18		Α.	I started in on 21st June 2013 and I officially	
19			transferred out on 12th December 2017.	
20	64	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. To detective branch, I take it?	11:28
21		Α.	Yes, in Garda Headquarters, yes.	
22	65	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Was it normal for the superintendent	
23			in charge just to be in an office on his own?	
24		Α.	Yeah, I have	
25	66	Q.	CHAIRMAN: During your time anyway?	11:28
26		Α.	During my time there, when I started Superintendent	
27			Taylor was the Press Officer.	
28	67	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	

29

A. And as most of the Press Officers, he spent a lot of

1			time in the office, in his own office. Out of the four	
2			Press Officers I would say Superintendent Taylor was up	
3			in the news desk office more than the others, but that	
4			was just to keep to be informed of what was going	
5			on. That would be my opinion on it anyway.	11:29
6	68	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And did he have a secretary?	
7		Α.	No, no.	
8	69	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And did anybody? Did anybody fill that	
9			role? I know nowadays people are expected to do their	
10			own typing and answer their emails and all that kind of	11:29
11			thing, so it's a rare thing to have a personal	
12			assistant of any kind.	
13		Α.	There was no as far as I am aware or concerned,	
14			there was no personal assistant assigned to	
15			Superintendent Taylor	11:29
16	70	Q.	CHAIRMAN: As such.	
17		Α.	as such. Brenda would do a good bit of work for	
18			both Inspector Ferris and on occasion Superintendent	
19			Taylor.	
20	71	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. And then there was some drafting as	11:29
21			well of, let's say, position papers or someone needed	
22			to make a speech, or there was that kind of thing going	
23			on as well?	
24		Α.	Yeah. That was, generally it was Ciaran Wren, who	
25			would have been a civilian member, he would draft the	11:29
26			speeches. Generally it was himself who would do that	
27			that.	
28	72	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Okay. The other thing I want your	
29			help on: I know there has been mention of going	

1			upstairs and corridors and all the rest of it, but if	
2			you are occupying that gable end for two stories, what	
3			is above you on the third storey?	
4		Α.	There is nothing there. It's an attic space.	
5	73	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I was trying to remember, I know it's a low	11:30
6			slung building, but that is the attic, is it?	
7		Α.	That is the attic.	
8	74	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So where is the Commissioner then if you are	
9			on the first floor?	
10		Α.	Yeah. If you come in the main gates of the Park, if	11:30
11			you look at the centre block again, the Commissioner I	
12			think is the last door as you look on the right, that	
13			is actually facing you. Her office I think is	
14			upstairs. As far as I am aware, I was never in the	
15			Commissioner's office.	11:30
16	75	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You were never privileged to be there. But	
17			I'm sorry, again, if necessary I will go down and have	
18			a look because I just want to get this into my head,	
19			the Officers' Club is on the left as you go in the	
20			gate?	11:31
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	76	Q.	CHAIRMAN: All right. Then you have?	
23		Α.	Then you have	
24	77	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Then you have the courtyard with all the car	
25			parks parked?	11:31
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	78	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And if I am just standing at the monument	
28			inside the gate, where is the Commissioner's office,	
29			where would I noint?	

1		Α.	Just kind of [INDICATING].	
2	79	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Diagonally across?	
3		Α.	Just diagonally across, yeah.	
4	80	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And it's in the same block?	
5		Α.	It's in the same block, yeah.	11:31
6	81	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And how easy, if you were granted access, is	
7			it to go along the corridor, say, from the newsroom	
8			upstairs, the news desk upstairs to the Commissioner's	
9			office?	
10		Α.	Easy enough. You can either come out the blue door at	11:31
11			the gable and walk around to the front, go through, or	
12			there's a if you come out of, say, the Director's	
13			office and turn left, there is a back corridor leading	
14			to a small kitchen area and that will take you into the	
15			Commissioner's office area.	11:31
16	82	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You go through the kitchen?	
17		Α.	You can go through the kitchen without going out into	
18			the front if you wish to, yeah.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.	
20				11:32
21			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
22				
23			MR. MARRINAN: Sergeant Damien Hogan, please.	
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
29				

1			SERGEANT DAMIEN HOGAN, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	
2			EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
3	83	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Sergeant Hogan, you have provided a	
4			statement for the Tribunal, and it's at page 2872 of	
5			the materials, for the benefit of the parties. It's a	11:32
6			relatively short statement. But you also provided a	
7			statement to the Clerkin investigation dated the 28th	
8			May of 2015, which was taken by Sergeant John Brady,	
9			and that's at page 2391 of the materials.	
10		Α.	That's correct.	11:33
11	84	Q.	That is in Volume 9. Now, I think that you have a lot	
12			of experience in the Press Office, isn't that right?	
13		Α.	I have.	
14	85	Q.	I think that you were originally in the Press Office in	
15			1984, was	11:33
16		Α.	1994.	
17	86	Q.	1994, sorry. It's a typographical error then in your	
18			statement that you made to Clerkin. So it's 1994 to	
19			2004, is that right?	
20		Α.	Correct, Chair.	11:33
21	87	Q.	And that was your first stint in there. And then you	
22			were promoted in 2004, is that right?	
23		Α.	That's correct, Chair.	
24	88	Q.	And then you went to work in the Commissioner's office?	
25		Α.	Correct.	11:33
26	89	Q.	And you were in the Commissioner's office until 2009?	
27		Α.	Correct.	
28	90	Q.	And then you returned to the Press Office?	
29		Δ	That's correct was	

- 1 91 Q. And do you remain in the Press Office?
- 2 A. I'm still there to this day, Chair, yes.
- 3 92 Q. So you have seen a lot of comings and goings over the
- 4 years --
- 5 A. I have.
- 6 93 Q. -- in terms of staff and personnel. We know that in
- 7 2013, that Superintendent Taylor arrived in the Press

11:34

- 8 Office -- 2012, sorry. How did you get on with him?
- 9 A. I got on fine with Superintendent Taylor. I mean, I
- 10 had worked with many Press Officers of Superintendent
- rank prior to that so I mean, these were new people in
- the office and it was a case of getting to know the
- personality and the person and I didn't have any issues
- initially with Superintendent Taylor.
- 15 94 Q. I think that all the staff in the Press Office are
- subject to the Garda Press and Public Relations
- 17 Guidelines, is that right?
- 18 A. Correct, Chair, yes.
- 19 95 Q. That is a print --
- 20 A. It's a book that is available to every member of staff. 11:35
- 21 96 Q. -- to all members of the Press Office. And are those
- instructions on how you interact with members of the
- public and the media?
- A. Correct, yes.
- 25 97 Q. And that is available to everybody in the office, and I 11:35
- suppose they are all encouraged to read it, is that
- 27 right?
- 28 A. They are, Chair, yes.
- 29 98 Q. And most of that in any event is covered in the Garda

1			Code?	
2		Α.	It is, Chair, correct, yeah.	
3	99	Q.	I think that initially when Superintendent Taylor	
4			arrived, did you notice any changes in the Press	
5			Office?	11:35
6		Α.	Insofar as decoration-wise, Chair, yes, there was work	
7			embarked upon to improve the standard of the office in	
8			general terms, like a refurbishment and decoration and	
9			that, so he embarked on quite a large project in	
10			relation to that matter, which hadn't been done for a	11:36
11			number of years.	
12	100	Q.	I think you say in your statement to Clerkin that he	
13			replaced almost everything in the office, is that	
14			right?	
15		Α.	Correct, Chair, yes.	11:36
16	101	Q.	You also say that his relationship became a little bit	
17			strained with a lot of the personnel and that he was	
18			involved in personal vendettas against members of the	
19			staff, is that right?	
20		Α.	I mean, it didn't impact on myself, but I did notice	11:36
21			that there was an atmosphere created in the office	
22			which had never been there before because it was always	
23			a very good place to work, there was a good rapport	
24			between every member of staff regardless of rank, but	
25			you know, this atmosphere, as far as I could see, had	11:36
26			crept in between certain members of staff, that he	
27			either didn't get on with or didn't like. It didn't	
28			include me, but it wasn't comfortable.	

29 102 Q. Yes. You say that he was absolutely and totally

1 obsessed with timekeeping, which may not be a bad 2 thing, but certainly that was one of the traits that he 3 had? 4 Α. Correct. 5 103 In terms of his interaction with the media, can you Q. 11:37 iust describe what you observed? 6 7 I suppose it was more intensive than I would have Α. 8 noticed with previous Press Officers in the past. because, like, as my colleague earlier on, Alan, said, 9 we are there seven days a week from 7:00am until 11:00 10 11:37 11 a night, so a Press Officer becomes under, you know, 12 immense stress and pressure during the day because 13 there's stories developing on an hourly basis. 14 that is why we are there; we are there to take that, 15 you know, take that away from the work schedule or the work pressure that a Press Officer would be under. 16 in Superintendent Taylor's case, he seemed to take on a 17 18 lot of that work himself, so he would deal with 19 journalists, you know, on a one-to-one basis whereas even to this day, like, Press Officers there will say 20 11:38 the office have the information and you contact the 21

23 104 Q. So he had a very hands-on approach?

office.

22

- A. Very hands-on, in my opinion, yes, yes.
- 25 105 Q. And you make comment in relation to your observations
 26 of how he interacted directly with journalists on the
 27 phone and you say that when he would have one-to-one
 28 conversations with journalists that they would be done
 29 out of earshot of the other Press Officers, is that

1 right?

Well, in a lot of cases, Chair, like we are there to 2 Α. help the Press Officer if -- because there's so many 3 stories developing -- I mean, I was working this 4 5 morning, I am not going into the detail, but like four or five different cases I have dealt with before I came 6 7 in here this morning. So sometimes a Press Officer is 8 there and he is trying to get a picture of a particular story and he is looking for us to help him as well, so 9 in a lot of cases we would be there and he might just 10 11:39 11 cover the phone, as you would do, what was that or 12 where was I going with that, or whatever, so we would 13 help him in relation to that matter. Whereas in Superintendent Taylor's -- I found that he didn't, I 14 15 suppose, ask us the information; he would go outside 11:39 16 the office and speak -- maybe that was his way of 17 dealing with it, but certainly it was something I 18 noticed.

19 106 Q. Well, it was obviously something that was very evident 20 and that you didn't approve of, is that right?

11:39

11:39

A. Well, I mean, if I approved or not, it probably wasn't for me to say but I didn't like the idea that we weren't part of what the daily work was because everybody's involved in what we do in there.

25 107 Q. Well, let's not understate this because I don't know 26 how this reflects on Superintendent Taylor, whether it 27 reflects well or badly on him is irrelevant but we want 28 to get a flavour of the atmosphere in the Press Office, 29 and you have been working there for a very long period

Т			of time and you tord the Crerkin investigation that	
2			matters were so bad with Superintendent Taylor that you	
3			were thinking of leaving the Press Office, isn't that	
4			right?	
5		Α.	Well, I suppose, I mean, I am at a stage where I can, I	11:40
6			can retire, so I could have gone and I felt at that	
7			time towards the end, just before Superintendent Taylor	
8			left, I felt that I probably had enough of this. the	
9			atmosphere just wasn't the way I mean, I get up in	
10			the morning and I enjoy going to work. At that stage I	11:40
11			wasn't. And that is just	
12	108	Q.	All right. You noticed that he was talking to one	
13			journalist in particular on a very regular basis?	
14		Α.	Correct, Chair.	
15	109	Q.	That was Eavan Murray?	11:40
16		Α.	Correct.	
17	110	Q.	Who works for the Irish Sun, is that right?	
18		Α.	Correct.	
19	111	Q.	And she was phoning the Press Office quite frequently	
20			looking for him, is that right?	11:40
21		Α.	That's correct, Chair.	
22	112	Q.	And was it always he that she was looking for?	
23		Α.	Yes. She would ring the landline, the main office	
24			number and she would, if I answered the phone, she	
25			would ask me to speak and ask me to speak to	11:41
26			Superintendent Taylor, and I said he is either in his	
27			office, not answering his phone or I would try and	
28			transfer her through, but she wasn't whereas most	
29			journalists would ring and whoever they reach in the	

1	office	they	speak	to	that	person.

I think you told the Clerkin investigation that you had suspicions at the time in relation to Eavan Murray and Superintendent Taylor. Could you just develop that a little bit for us?

11:41

11:42

- 6 well, my suspicions were, I suppose, prompted by the Α. articles that I would read in the paper the following 7 8 Because I know it's been explained to the Tribunal before how the press clippings work, etcetera. 9 So, we analyse them before they go to their various 10 11 · 41 11 departments in the morning, and on many occasions I was quite surprised at the content of the article that 12 13 appeared in the paper. Because, like, we would be 14 privy to a lot of very sensitive information regarding 15 an investigation, but for lots of reasons, you know, 11:42 16 you can't give that information out but you analyse it 17 and you have a way of, as we call it, as press 18 releasing it and the media are happy enough with that, 19 but the articles I was reading by that particular 20 journalist seemed to have a lot more content than I 11:42 would have given or any of the other staff that I 21
- 23 114 Q. Now, I think that the office, there was a process of 24 dealing with critical incident reports, is that right?

worked with would have given, and that surprised me.

22

25

Α.

Yes.

- 26 115 Q. And that's an overnight report that the Press Office qet?
- A. Correct. We get that every morning at around quarter past seven, yeah.

- 1 116 Q. And that is a synopsis of incidents for the entire country --
- 3 A. For the entire country, Chair, yes.
- 4 117 Q. -- relating to serious incidents nationwide. Did some 5 of the articles that were written reflect what was in 11:42
- 6 the critical incident reports?
- 7 A. Yes, Chair.
- 8 118 Q. It did. And was that also giving rise to the suspicion 9 that you had, it was obvious that Superintendent Taylor
- was in some way feeding this to Eavan Murray, is that 11:43 right?

11 · 43

- 12 A. Somebody who had access to that critical incident 13 report overnight was, yes, Chair.
- 14 119 Q. Well, we are talking about Superintendent Taylor --
- 15 A. Yes, we are.
- 16 120 O. -- aren't we?
- 17 A. We are.
- 18 121 Q. And would that have been improper for him to be doing that?
- A. Well, absolutely. Because I mean, as I said, there is a lot of sensitivity issues attached to a lot of the
- incidents that we would see in the morning from, you
- 23 know, from murders to fatal traffic collisions to
- suicides, to drownings, there is a lot of sensitivities
- 25 there and you have to be aware of that. And you also
- 26 have to be aware of compromising an investigation as
- 27 well down the line, as my colleague mentioned earlier
- on. I mean, it's not something we are going to get
- into because there is -- you know, as I say, you don't

1			want to compromise an investigation. So there's	
2			certain details you can and certain details you	
3			can't	
4	122	Q.	Yes.	
5		Α.	release.	11:44
6	123	Q.	What sort of relationship, working relationship did you	
7			have with Mr. McLindon?	
8		Α.	An excellent working relationship.	
9	124	Q.	And as far as Mr. McLindon and Superintendent Taylor,	
10			what were you able to observe there?	11:44
11		Α.	It wasn't a very friendly relationship at all, I could	
12			see that from, actually from day one.	
13	125	Q.	Perhaps the impression, I don't know, and this is just	
14			an impression one gets, that Mr. McLindon arrived in	
15			and was a civilian, became a civilian member of An	11:44
16			Garda Síochána?	
17		Α.	Correct.	
18	126	Q.	And at that time Superintendent Taylor, Mr. McLindon	
19			told us, seemed to be very close to the Commissioner,	
20			Commissioner Callinan, is that right; Commissioner	11:45
21			Callinan and Superintendent Taylor appeared to be very	
22			close?	
23		Α.	Yes. Well, I mean, a Press Officer would be in	
24			daily from my experience and I have over 20 years'	
25			experience in there, would be in daily contact with the	11:45
26			Commissioner of the day. So they would have a lot of	
27			interaction, whether it be on a one-to-one in his	
28			office in, in the Commissioner's office, or by	
29			telephone. So I mean, I would be aware of the	

- 1 Commissioner ringing Superintendent Taylor or any
- 2 superintendent on an regular basis in the office.
- 3 127 Q. Right. So I think that over the period of time that
- 4 you observed Superintendent Taylor and his interactions

11 · 45

11:46

11:46

- with the media, you were able to assist the Clerkin
- 6 investigation into a number of incidents, isn't that
- 7 right?
- 8 A. Correct, Chair.
- 9 128 Q. And I don't intend to go through them, they are there
- set out in your statement. But there are two matters
- that the Tribunal would like your assistance in
- relation to. First of all, we know that Eavan Murray
- and Debbie McCann, they were two journalists obviously
- that you were familiar with, particularly Eavan Murray
- in relation to her interactions with Superintendent
- 16 Taylor, but what about Debbie McCann, do you know her?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 129 Q. You didn't?
- 19 A. No. I spoke to her I'd say in my time half a dozen
- times on the phone and that was all.
- 21 130 Q. We know that they, I think they call it door-stepping
- 22 Mrs. D in her home and in late February/early March of
- 23 2014, were you aware of that at the time?
- A. I wasn't, Chair, no.
- 25 131 Q. Did you subsequently become aware that Paul Williams
- had done an interview with Ms. D?
- 27 A. Certainly through reading it myself in the media but
- prior to that, I wasn't aware of that, no.
- 29 132 Q. And your reading, was that the reading of the articles?

- 1 A. In the newspapers.
- 2 133 Q. In April of 2014?
- 3 A. I can't remember the exact time but that's when I was
- 4 aware of it, so it obviously was around that time.
- 5 134 Q. Did you link that to, those articles to Sergeant
- 6 Maurice McCabe because he wasn't named?
- 7 A. Possibly not at the time. I maybe was made aware of it

11:47

11:47

- 8 in the office, but it wasn't something -- to use an
- 9 expression that we use in the office, it wasn't
- something that was flagged by us at any stage.
- 11 135 Q. Well, you know, having worked in the Commissioner's
- office -- you were in the Commissioner's office
- 13 until --
- 14 A. Well, I worked in the Officers' Club which was part of
- the Commissioner's office but, it's -- yeah.
- 16 136 Q. Yes. Were you aware of Sergeant McCabe and the issues
- 17 surrounding Sergeant McCabe?
- 18 A. I was only aware of what I was reading in the
- 19 newspapers. I mean, my colleague earlier on explained
- 20 that we had a line in the office which we kept --
- certainly I kept and my colleagues kept, as far as I am
- aware, that we wouldn't mention named individuals, and
- people are quite entitled to make a protected
- 24 disclosure.
- 25 137 Q. And in terms of the terms of reference of the Tribunal, 11:48
- 26 you have read through those --
- 27 A. I have, Chair.
- 28 138 Q. -- prior to you making a statement to the Tribunal, and
- 29 you say that you have no information that you can give

Т			to the Tribunal that could be of assistance. But you	
2			are aware of Superintendent Taylor's protected	
3			disclosure	
4		Α.	I am aware of that, Chair, yes.	
5	139	Q.	in relation to the campaign against Sergeant Maurice	11:48
6			McCabe. Did you get any inkling at all at the time of	
7			such a campaign?	
8		Α.	Absolutely not, Chair.	
9	140	Q.	Were you advised by Superintendent Taylor at any time	
10			to ask	11:48
11		Α.	Not once, Chair.	
12	141	Q.	speak negatively to journalists about Sergeant	
13			McCabe?	
14		Α.	Absolutely not, never. It was never discussed.	
15	142	Q.	And did you hear any talk amongst staff, the other	11:48
16			sergeants and civilian staff in the office?	
17		Α.	The only talk that would have again, it would have	
18			been down to what we read in the papers and you might	
19			just discuss it over a cup of tea or coffee or somebody	
20			might mention 'We are getting in a query about that'	11:49
21			but, you know, we don't know anything about it because	
22			it wasn't part of the conversation in the office and it	
23			wasn't something that we were asked to do at any stage.	
24	143	Q.	Just what you have advised the Tribunal and indeed the	
25			evidence from Sergeant Whelan and how you deal with the	11:49
26			press when they have queries, would they normally come	
27			over the phone or would they be emailed into the	
28			office, queries from the media?	
29		Δ	In general terms I suppose email is probably the most	

- 1 popular medium, but if there is a breaking story, they
- 2 ring. And I mean a breaking story, if they are five,
- 3 ten minutes to a news bulletin they will ring. But
- 4 they do still ring on a daily basis, yes, they do.
- 5 144 Q. I think just again, we can see it, if we have up on the 11:50
- 6 screen 3892 of the materials. These are interactions,
- 7 this relates to the loss of a computer, but you see
- there there is a query from, it's a response to a query

11:51

- 9 from Colm Kenny who is a journalist?
- 10 A. Yes.
 - 11 145 Q. Do you see that?
 - 12 A. Yes.
 - 13 146 Q. And you see that you in fact respond to that in a very
 - formal way.
 - 15 A. I just can't --
 - 16 147 Q. If we just scroll down.
 - 17 A. Thank you.
 - 18 148 Q. It is 27th September of 2013.
 - 19 A. Yes.
- 20 149 Q. It shows perhaps the formality of the response in your
- 21 dealings with the Press Office. I don't intend to open
- 22 it --
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 150 Q. -- because it doesn't, in fact, add anything. But it
- does demonstrate, if you look through there, that you
- deal in a fairly formal way with members of the press,
- is that right?
- 28 A. Yes, Chair. That's correct, Chair.
- 29 151 Q. And from your observations, did Superintendent Taylor

1			appear to deal in that formal way that other members of	
2			the staff dealt with the media?	
3		Α.	Well, I wouldn't have seen many or possibly any of his	
4			email communication but certainly on the phone, I	
5			wouldn't I wouldn't have been in earshot, Chair.	11:5
6			MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much, would you answer	
7			any questions.	
8				
9			THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McDOWELL:	
10	152	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: Sergeant Hogan, Michael McDowell is my	11:5
11			name and I am one of the counsel for Sergeant McCabe.	
12			Could I ask you, we know from the evidence of Mr. Paul	
13			Williams that after he had interviewed Ms. D and before	
14			he published his article, series of articles in the	
15			paper, that he contacted Superintendent Taylor and	11:5
16			asked him to confirm that Sergeant McCabe had been the	
17			subject of an investigation arising out of allegations	
18			by Ms. D and asking him to confirm whether a file had	
19			been sent to the DPP. From your knowledge of Garda	
20			procedure, would it be normal in respect of, first of	11:5
21			all, a civilian with no connection with An Garda	
22			Síochána, for An Garda Síochána to confirm that they	
23			have been the subject of a criminal investigation of a	
24			sexual assault some ten years earlier?	
25		Α.	To confirm to who, sorry?	11:5
26	153	Q.	To a journalist who asked. If the journalist said 'Was	
27			Joe Bloggs the subject of a Garda investigation	
28			alleging sexual assault against a minor ten years ago?'	

would that kind of inquiry be dealt with or would they

1			be given any information to confirm or deny such a	
2			story?	
3		Α.	If I could just explain it to you very quickly. In	
4			that particular incident, if it was a historical	
5			investigation certainly it's still there so we would be	11:5
6			obliged to have a look at it ourselves to see where	
7			it's coming from, but from my point of view, location,	
8			name and other pertinent information to the	
9			investigation would not be given to a journalist.	
10	154	Q.	It's just I find it surprising that an individual who	11:5
11			had been investigated and, I use the word, cleared of	
12			such a charge would be the subject of a confirmation	
13			that such an investigation had taken place at the	
14			request of a member of the press some ten years	
15			afterwards?	11:5
16		Α.	Again, it's not something that I have probably done.	
17			If there is no investigation into it, well then, the	
18			reply would be there is no investigation into it	
19			because it's finished.	
20	155	Q.	No, but this was, according to Mr. Williams, he said	11:5

that he contacted Superintendent Taylor and had it 21 22 confirmed that Sergeant McCabe had been the subject of 23 allegations, that they had been investigated and that a file had been sent to the Director of Public 24 25 Prosecutions; I am just wondering, forget first of all 11:55 26 that Sergeant McCabe was a sergeant, surely An Garda 27 Síochána doesn't provide that kind of information --28 No, we don't provide that information. Α.

29 156 Q. -- to members of the press?

1		Α.	No, no.	
2	157	Q.	It would be highly unusual to do so, wouldn't it?	
3		Α.	Absolutely, yes.	
4	158	Q.	And I mean, just take an example, if a person who you	
5			knew had been cleared of an assault, you would be, I	11:55
6			take it, pretty shocked if An Garda Síochána told a	
7			reporter 'Oh, yes, that person was the subject of a	
8		Α.	Well, we would never I certainly would never do	
9			that, because that is, from my experience, and I am	
10			over 20 years in there, I would never, ever do that.	11:55
11			That is not	
12			MR. McDOWELL: Thanks very much.	
13				
14			MS. BURNS: No questions, Chairman.	
15			CHAIRMAN: No questions.	11:55
16				
17			THE WITNESS WAS EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS:	
18	159	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sergeant Hogan, in terms of	
19			Superintendent Taylor's management style as Press	
20			Officer, you are in a position, I think, to comment;	11:56
21			you experienced and acted under other Press Officers	
22			considering the length of your	
23		Α.	That's correct, Chair. I think five, if not six, yeah.	
24	160	Q.	Right. Can I just ask you about that, then. In terms	
25			of discussing sensitive matters within earshot of, say,	11:56
26			for want of a better expression, junior personnel, what	
27			was Superintendent Taylor's methodology?	
28		Α.	Like, my colleagues, the sergeants, we are sworn	
29			members of An Garda Síochána so we come under the	

1			Official Secrets Act as well when it comes to reading	
2			sensitive issues and that. I didn't like some of the	
3			way that Superintendent Taylor would discuss matters of	
4			a very sensitive nature in the general office, when the	
5			office was full of sergeants and or members of An	11:57
6			Garda Síochána and civilian members of the office.	
7	161	Q.	Yes.	
8		Α.	And it was, I found it uncomfortable, I found it	
9			embarrassing sometimes that these matters were being	
10			discussed in open court, for want of a better	11:57
11			expression, but I was uncomfortable with it.	
12	162	Q.	And you are referring to sensitive information there?	
13		Α.	As in, you know, matters that would possibly	
14			be sensitive, confidential information.	
15	163	Q.	Yes. And in your experience, when Superintendent	11:57
16			Taylor was having direct conversations with	
17			journalists, generally speaking would that be done	
18			within or without the earshot of you or your	
19			colleagues?	
20		Α.	Without. He would leave the office.	11:57
21	164	Q.	And conduct the phone conversation effectively in	
22			private?	
23		Α.	Yes. Whether that was his style or not I don't know	
24			but that's the way he operated, yeah.	
25	165	Q.	Mr. Marrinan mentioned the issue of timekeeping and it	11:58
26			is a coin with two sides; some people regard it as	
27			if it reaches obsessional levels perhaps it's not so	
28			positive, but in terms of Superintendent Taylor, how	
29			did his strong interest in timekeeping manifest itself?	

- 1 Because of the very nature of the work we do there, I Α. 2 mean, if -- you know, we could finish, as Alan Frawley said earlier on, we'd finish at 11:00 but there are 3 incidents that require you to stay on in the office and 4 5 you don't even think of that, you just do it, because 11:58 that is part of your job; you want to be professional, 6 7 you want to be able to provide a service as well. 8 have often left the office at a late hour or be it in early, but you get it back in other ways because people 9 appreciate the fact that you are doing what you are 10 11:58 11 doing for the office and you are dedicated to it. 12 in that particular case, he just became obsessed with 13 people being in at a particular time. And like, we are 14 all adults, we are all responsible people and we all 15 know what we are doing, but I found that issue quite 11:59 16 uncomfortable as well, as did my colleagues.
- 17 166 Q. What steps did he take to monitor colleagues' timekeeping?
- 19 Well, he introduced, I don't know whether it was a full Α. security system that was introduced into Garda 20 11:59 Headquarters but from our office he swipe card 21 22 everywhere, including the toilets, and I don't know 23 whether that was necessary or not. But it was done. 24 So like, to enter the bathrooms facilities downstairs you had to swipe card to get in, like, and if you were 25 11:59 in a hurry it was kind of difficult. 26
- 27 167 Q. You mentioned reference to critical incident reports in 28 your evidence to Mr. Marrinan. I think the Tribunal 29 has already heard that a critical incident report is

1			effectively a synopsis of incidents	
2		Α.	Correct.	
3	168	Q.	perhaps in the entire country in relation to serious	
4			incidents that may occur nationwide?	
5		Α.	That's correct, Chair.	12:00
6	169	Q.	And in relation to those, were you ever asked to print	
7			off critical incident reports?	
8		Α.	By?	
9	170	Q.	By Superintendent Taylor?	
10		Α.	Yes. While he was working in the office, which	12:00
11			wouldn't have been an unusual request because maybe a	
12			printer wasn't working or a computer wasn't working,	
13			but that wouldn't have been an unusual request, Chair.	
14	171	Q.	But you did have, did you not, certain concerns arising	
15			out of the disclosure of critical incident reports?	12:00
16		Α.	I did, yes. But I mean, if he asked me, he was my	
17			superior, he was my superintendent, if he asked me to	
18			do it I would do it. He had access to it anyway,	
19			Chair, so it made no difference really. He could	
20			access it, he could read it on a screen or it could be	12:00
21			printed out, so like	
22	172	Q.	Yes. Now, Inspector John Ferris has already given	
23			evidence before the Tribunal and he gave evidence	
24			concerning, from his perspective, his being treated in	
25			a disrespectful fashion, as he saw it, by	12:01
26			Superintendent Taylor. Broadly speaking, were you	
27			aware of that?	
28		Α.	I was, Chair, yes. Again, I found it very	
29			uncomfortable, the atmosphere that was being created	

1			between Superintendent Taylor and Inspector Ferris at	
2			the time. And then that particular weekend, I know	
3			Superintendent Ferris has given evidence in relation to	
4			that, he came back to work on a Monday morning and his	
5			desk, his chair, his property, everything had been	12:0
6			moved out of quite a large office, because the	
7			office I was trying to Sergeant Frawley was	
8			explaining to you, Chair, about the size of the office.	
9			Superintendent Taylor's office is probably the biggest	
10			office of the four offices we have, and he had moved	12:0
11			that weekend, over the weekend, over the Saturday and	
12			Sunday.	
13	173	Q.	As you saw it, what was the purpose of removing	
14			Inspector Ferris's belongings?	
15		Α.	As I saw it, just from the outside looking in, I just	12:0

- thought he wants to be in the office on his own, he
 wants to be able to deal with the issues on his own. I
 couldn't see the point because every other Press
 officer that had worked there had worked with his
 inspector in the office, because effectively the
 inspector is a Deputy Press Officer, so he delegates.
- 22 174 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. This wasn't happening in this case.
- 24 175 Q. Leaving aside then the abrupt nature of his belongings 25 being removed from the office, Inspector Ferris, did 26 Superintendent Taylor involve him in a sort of a 27 cooperative way in his Press Office dealings or was he 28 somebody who was kept on the fringes?

12.02

29 A. The latter.

1	176	Q.	And w	vas t	hat	something	you	were	cons	cious	of?
2		۸	T was		na h	Pocauso	2021	1 WO	200	3]] +	horo

A. I was, yeah. Because again, we are all there to do a job and we all assist and help each other to the best of our ability and, you know, especially an inspector's point of view, he is the Deputy Press Officer, so information and jobs can be handed down. In that case

12:03

12:03

12:03

12:03

12.04

it wasn't happening, there was very little interaction,

8 from my point of view and from what I could see.

9 177 Q. Yes. You mention in your statement that I think was
10 provided to the Clerkin investigation, that in and
11 around August or September of 2014 you recall being
12 contacted by a particular journalist about a particular
13 incident which was the subject of a critical incident
14 report?

15 A. Correct, Chair, yeah.

16 178 Q. And I think you were on your way home from Tipperary back to Dublin when you received the call?

18 A. Correct, Chair.

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

19 179 Q. Broadly speaking what did that relate to?

It was a certain journalist who would have had my number, which wasn't unusual, because again, to assist the smooth running of the office, I didn't have a problem with my personal mobile number being given and a cry alert, which is an alert for when a child goes missing, Chair, and it's -- it gets blanket media coverage and it goes up on the signs over motorways and it's flashed across news flashes very quickly. So it's a huge event when it happens. It doesn't happen very often, thank God. But anyway, the journalist asked me

1			for information and I told her. I said, I am not	
2			actually working today, have you tried the office? And	
3			she said no, it's busy. And I said, obviously because	
4			of that. And then her next line was, I'm getting	
5			enough at the moment from Superintendent Taylor. And	12:04
6			this was four months after Superintendent Taylor had	
7			left the office, and that's the day I decided that	
8			everybody was being compromised. I was protecting the	
9			integrity of the office and I rang the Director of	
10			Communications, Andrew McLindon and I rang then	12:04
11			Superintendent Paul Moran to make them aware of that	
12			fact, because we were being compromised because you	
13			know, it wasn't his in his new role, that wasn't his	
14			role, to be briefing the media.	
15	180	Q.	And around this time, as far as you are concerned,	12:05
16			Superintendent Taylor, did he appear to be calling for	
17			information that perhaps you didn't think he should be	
18			looking for?	
19		Α.	As in calling me in the office?	
20	181	Q.	Yes.	12:05
21		Α.	Correct, he was, yes.	
22	182	Q.	And you conveyed these concerns to senior management?	
23		Α.	I did, yes.	
24	183	Q.	And were steps taken to act on foot of that?	
25		Α.	They were, almost immediately. Superintendent Moran,	12:05
26			who was the Press Officer at the time, issued a memo to	
27			all staff members indicating that no information was to	
28			be released to any person apart from persons that would	
29			have been cleared by Superintendent Moran or Andrew	

- 1 McLindon.
- 2 184 Q. Yes. You mention in your statement that Superintendent
- 3 Taylor placed a number of calls concerning, looking for
- 4 information relating to serious incidents or at least
- 5 there were requests for information relating to serious 12:05
- 6 incidents?
- 7 A. This was after his departure?
- 8 185 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 186 Q. And accompanying his requests to you for information, I 12:06
- think you indicated he would provide an excuse, that
- his Gardaí email was completely backed up?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 187 Q. Can you elaborate upon that?
- 15 CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, I am not quite following that

- 16 end and that is my fault.
- 17 MR. MÍ CHEÁL O' HI GGINS: Sorry, Chairman, I suspect it's
- my fault, I have not introduced it in a coherent way.
- 19 188 Q. You have mentioned that around about this time where
- 20 you had concerns, this is now a period after, a good
- 21 bit after Superintendent Taylor has left the Press
- Office, he seemed to be asking you for information that
- 23 you felt he shouldn't be looking for?
- 24 A. Correct, Chair.
- 25 189 Q. And there were a number of calls seeking information in 12:06
- relation to serious incidents, you say in your
- 27 statement?
- 28 A. Correct, Chair.
- 29 190 Q. And he would ring you minutes after serious incidents

1	had	actually	occurred?
_	au	accaaii,	000011001

2 A. Correct.

192

Q.

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

3 191 Q. What did he look for? And, did he provide any reason 4 for looking for the information?

5 well, he'd look for the detail in relation to the Α. 12:07 6 He didn't give a reason as to why he wanted 7 I wasn't in a position to pass on this information 8 to him because I didn't think it was relevant to the job he was in at the moment. However, I was very aware 9 of the fact that he was a superior officer, he was a 10 12:07 11 superintendent, so I couldn't really be saying no to 12 him, so I just -- I made excuses and I just didn't send 13 the -- or I went off duty or I was incontactable or 14 uncontactable, sorry, and that was it. But it was only after all of that, that is when I decided that kind of 15 16 enough was enough as regards everybody being 17 compromised, including myself, and that is why I 18 brought these matters to the attention of the then 19 Press Officer and the Director of Communications.

offered an excuse that his Garda email was backed up?

A. Yeah. I think basically what that line was, Chair, was that he would be getting certain emails of an official nature on his email, on his Garda email anyway but he was asking me to forward emails to a private email address, which was something I wouldn't have done anyway.

You mention in your statement that on one occasion he

12:07

12:08

28 193 Q. Yes. You were aware, were you not, at this time, that 29 there were other people in the office having similar

Τ			problems with Superintendent Taylor?	
2		Α.	I knew there were certain colleagues that were having,	
3			yeah, that were getting phone calls	
4			CHAIRMAN: This thing about the Garda email being	
5			backed up, I am just not familiar with that concept.	12:08
6			Emails being delayed or the server is down?	
7		Α.	I think the server is either down or there is not	
8			enough space available on the server to accept more	
9			emails. So it just	
10			CHAIRMAN: You mean on his personal computer?	12:08
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12			CHAIRMAN: I would have thought they would just get rid	
13			of one.	
14		Α.	That is probably what they should have done, Chair, but	
15			that wasn't done at the time. Because it can happen,	12:09
16			not on a regular basis but it can happen. Maybe not	
17			now because technology has moved on.	
18			CHAIRMAN: All right. We are not talking about a	
19			fictional thing?	
20		Α.	No.	12:09
21			CHAIRMAN: This could be a real thing and you have	
22			experienced it?	
23		Α.	I have seen it, yeah.	
24			CHAIRMAN: All right. well, that's fine.	
25	194	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Now, elsewhere in your	12:09
26			statement you make reference, I think it's on the final	
27			page of your statement on page 2395, you make reference	
28			to requests that Superintendent Taylor made of you in	
29			relation to a SIM card that he had provided to you?	

while he was attached to the office he approached Α. me one day and he asked me would I be, as it's termed in our job, the sergeant in charge of the office. late mother had just been diagnosed with dementia and I wasn't in a position to commit to -- I had enough going 12:09 on in my private life and I explained that to him and he said sure, take it anyway and it's a State phone, which means it's an official phone. I already have my own private number. So I think, as the conversation went on that afternoon, I just said look it, I will 12:10 take it anyway. Now literally, it was a SIM card in a There was no handset with it. And I sealed package. have a locker, I have a number of lockers, I had one locker that I put it into, I opened the door of it and I cellotaped it to the inside and I left it there and I 12:10 thought no more about it. And every so often while he is still attached to the office, he'd ask me did I go to what is known as our telecoms section, did I get a phone, and I said no. I didn't actually want the phone, I didn't want to use it, I didn't want to be in 12:10 communication, because I felt that would be too close. So then, Superintendent Taylor left the office and I think it was in the October of 2014, when he had left us a number of months or so, he contacted me by phone one day in the office and asked me did I still have the 12:10 SIM card and I said -- or the phone, as he thought I probably was using, I said no, I said I still have the SIM card, I have never put it into a handset. Will you send it down to me, he said, in my new role, I need it

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- 1 here for somebody else. And I posted it that day to
- 2 him. And that was the last I saw of the SIM card.
- 3 195 Q. Yes.
- 4 A. I never used it in a phone.
- 5 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, just before we move off that
- 6 particular topic. With a very amateur knowledge of
- 7 telecommunications and that kind of thing, I don't know

12.11

12:11

- 8 if I am expected to read something into this, I
- 9 honestly am mystified as to what could be going on or
- if it could possibly be sinister in any way and maybe
- 11 Sergeant Hogan is not saying something, and I am not
- saying you are holding anything back, but I just don't
- 13 know what this is about.
- 14 196 Q. MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sergeant, this is a matter that
- is covered in your statement to the Clerkin
- investigation, isn't that so?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 197 Q. And you provided the detail in relation to you being
- 19 urged to obtain the handset, you didn't do so?
- 20 A. Which I didn't, no.
- 21 198 Q. You put into your locker the SIM card?
- 22 A. Correct, Chair.
- 23 199 Q. Which you didn't put into any handset?
- 24 A. Correct.
- 25 200 Q. And on a subsequent date you were asked for -- you were 12:12
- about it a few times by Superintendent Taylor, and
- eventually he asked you for the item back, isn't that
- 28 so?
- 29 A. Correct, Chair.

- 201 And you provided that back to him? 1 Q. 2 I did. On, in fact the day he rang me, I put it in the Α. 3 internal post that day and posted it to him, the same 4 dav. 5 202 You are not making any sinister -- you are not Q. 12:12 6 attaching any sinister connotation to that, but --7 No, no, absolutely not. Α. 8 203 -- that was a matter you were asked to deal with in Q. 9 your statement? 10 Absolutely. I was asked that question. Α. 12.12 11 CHAI RMAN: I know, but again, I am mystified. Because 12 I mean, the information that I have is, having had a mobile phone maybe longer than most people when they 13 14 were the size of a breeze block, I kind of took some 15 interest into how they work, etcetera, but I am 12:13 16 informed yesterday that now normally you can't store 17 stuff onto your SIM card, there certainly was an option 18 in the past to do that, so I mean, having a SIM card, 19 I'm sure I have got a few knocking around my room in the Four Courts, I don't know, certainly old phones I 20 12:13 have got a few which I give back to technology, but I 21 22 don't think I'm doing anything sinister, and why would 23 Superintendent Taylor -- I mean, apart from the taping 24 to the locker and all the rest of it, which is colourful detail, what is this all about, 25 12:13
- MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: well, just the sergeant has given the context of it, he has explained from his

Mr. O'Higgins? I am sorry, I am completely lost.

26

point of view there is nothing sinister attaching to it

- but it formed part of the Clerkin investigation.
- 2 204 Q. Isn't that so?
- 3 A. That's correct, Chair.
- 4 CHAIRMAN: Well, it was a lead that went nowhere, in

12 · 14

12:14

12:14

12.14

- 5 any event.
- 6 MR. MÍ CHEÁL O' HI GGINS: Pardon, Chairman?
- 7 CHAIRMAN: It was a lead which went nowhere, I would
- 8 say, Mr. O'Higgins.
- 9 205 Q. MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes. Finally then towards the
- 10 end of your statement, Sergeant, there is a detail
- concerning phone calls and a journalist who appeared to
- 12 be getting -- a journalist would have information on a
- topic and then contact the office when you would
- 14 answer, isn't that so?
- 15 A. That's correct, Chair.
- 16 206 Q. And that is again a matter that caused you concern and
- 17 that you mentioned to the Clerkin investigation?
- 18 A. That's correct, Chair, yeah.
- 19 207 Q. And you indicate that some of the stories published by
- the journalists would have a lot more detail than you
- 21 yourself would have given out, and again that is
- 22 something that caused you ongoing concern?
- 23 A. That's correct, Chair. Because I couldn't see what the
- relevance was in the certain journalists contacting our
- office when they already had more than enough
- information. There are certain journalists actually,
- 27 crime journalists, that never contact the Garda Press
- office.
- 29 208 Q. Yes.

- A. Which I find bizarre, like, they are crime journalists.

 MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thanks very much.
 - A. Thank you.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

3

MR. MARRINAN: No questions.

12:15

There is something that I need to briefly discuss, if I may, at this point. And that is all of the evidence -- I am going to detain you for a moment, Sergeant, if you don't mind. All of the evidence that we have heard, which I am not investigating because 12:15 it's not within the confines of the terms of reference, but which, if it is true, and I'm not saying that it is, I am taking no view, does not reflect well on a very central witness to this inquiry. Now, the normal rule in relation to cross-examination as to credit, and 12:15 we have of course been through this before, is that if a witness is giving evidence about cutting ivy off a wall and the whole issue is as between neighbours, for instance, as to whether a wall was destroyed or damaged, and if the witness is asked 'Did you not serve 12:16 a prison sentence for fraud?' and therefore your evidence is not to be believed is the inference which comes from that, those questions can be asked but the judge is entitled to control them on the basis that they may be so removed from the fact in issue, which is 12:16 what happened to the wall, and may be so denigrating of the person in question that a halt needs to be called. Now, what follows from that is, evidence cannot be led as to that person's background because it's not a fact

in issue. That is the rule.

2

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

The second matter is, that the witness can deny the allegation and the allegation in terms of the way it is denied or in terms, as I say, of the shiftiness of the witness in dealing with it, may have an impact in terms of the judge or the jury deciding whether this is a credible witness. So those are the rules as I now understand them. They have been operated for very many years.

12:17

12 · 17

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

The other thing is of course, I'm not bound by the Rules of Evidence, I am not bound by the hearsay rule, I am not bound by the rule against self-corroboration, which has been broken endless times before the 12:17 Tribunal, or any exception to it, but unpleasant things are being said about David Taylor and no doubt in due course those questions will be put by counsel for the Garda Commissioner, as is responsible, but I will of course abide by my entitlement, if necessary, to call a 12:17 halt in terms of relevancy and in terms of decorum. But what I would ask for submissions on from my own counsel and from Ms. Burns is: Is it necessary to just leave this evidence go as a given at this particular point in time? Is there to be a challenge to it? Or 12:18 do I wait until Mr. O'Higgins - and I don't think you have behaved in any way irresponsibly, Mr. O'Higgins, can I just make that absolutely clear - until Mr. O'Higgins or Mr. Dignam puts those questions to

Superintendent Taylor and he will answer them whatever	
way he wishes and I will get a view in relation to his	
general credibility from that? So what is the	
situation, I wonder? I wonder either, Mr. Marrinan or	
Mr. McGuinness, do you want to give me any view on it?	12:18
Because, as you can see, what is happening is, the	
evidence is passing unchallenged and I just have a wee	
bit of worry about that and as to where I stand on it.	
MR. MARRINAN: well, I think the normal rule would	
apply, that if there is an issue in relation to	12:19
relevancy it should be raised when the evidence is	
being given. And the evidence has been given by a	
number of witnesses now in relation to a number of	
incidents involving Superintendent Taylor, and they	
haven't been challenged, and this is the time to	12:19
challenge them. And should Superintendent Taylor	
Superintendent Taylor will be giving evidence, and the	
fact that there hasn't been a challenge at this	
juncture it seems to leave it open to the parties to	
challenge Superintendent Taylor on the evidence that	12:19
has already been given, the foundation having been	
laid.	
CHAIRMAN: well, could it be said, Mr. Marrinan, given	
that this is a matter as to credit, that the evidence	
was given unchallenged that, and then you add on the	12:19
narrative as to what has been left unchallenged?	
Because if I'm following the rule, and there is an if	
underneath that and forgive me for embarking on this	
discussion but I didn't expect to do so, I wasn't	

1	anticipating it, but if it be the case that the normal
2	rule in relation to cross-examination as to credit,
3	Mr. A is giving evidence and is asked about the
4	following unpleasant facts which have nothing to do
5	with the fact in issue but which impact on his credit, 12:20
6	let us say that he, whatever it may be, regularly pays
7	for sexual services, that kind of thing, normally
8	evidence as to that wouldn't come up but it is
9	certainly coming up here because the Clerkin
10	investigation is very much part of the background, the $_{ m 12:20}$
11	suspension is very much part of the background, the
12	context in which the protected disclosure is made is
13	very much part of the background, so it's
14	understandable how it comes up here, but is it
15	necessary to challenge it, I suppose is the question I $_{12:2}$
16	have?
17	MR. MARRINAN: In my respectful submission, it would
18	be.
19	CHAIRMAN: Yes.
20	MR. MARRINAN: Once the evidence is sought to be 12:2
21	introduced the question naturally arises for any of the
22	parties, is this relevant to the case that is being
23	made or advanced by any of the parties to the Tribunal?
24	Quite clearly, some of this evidence is relevant in
25	itself without going to credit, in terms of showing 12:2
26	Superintendent Taylor's interaction with the media and
27	it's highly significant in terms of his protected
28	disclosure and what he says in relation to his
29	interaction with the media. So therefore, a great deal

of this evidence is relevant. Some of it is also relevant in terms of reflecting on the general character of Superintendent Taylor, and some of it is relevant in terms of showing prior misconduct by Superintendent Taylor in his role as Press Officer, which arguably could also be relevant to whether or not his protected disclosure is correct, because of course his protected disclosure would demonstrate a Press Officer who was acting inappropriately and improperly.

1011

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

12:22

12:22

12:23

12:23

12:22

Insofar as it reflects entirely on the credit of Superintendent Taylor, without going to a fact in issue, it seems to me that some of the evidence that I have excised from some of the witness statements and haven't pursued in examination, perhaps goes over and above what certainly Tribunal counsel would consider would be relevant. That has been explored in cross-examination by counsel for the Garda Commissioner, as is his entitlement, and if there is an issue in relation to that, then, in my respectful submission, for the proper running of the business of the Tribunal, it would be necessary to raise an objection, because if an objection is subsequently raised in relation to this matter and if you, Chairman, were to rule against the argument being advanced by Superintendent Taylor on the issue of relevancy, then are we going to have an application to have all these witnesses recalled so that they can then be challenged? CHAI RMAN: Well, yes, but I suppose, Mr. Marrinan,

Sergeant Hogan is, if you like, the witness giving the fullest account of this, and I suppose if he was challenged, taking a reasonable view that would be enough, the others could be regarded perhaps in the same way, just from the point of view of length. 12:24 of course it is proper under the rule in Browne v. Dunn if there is a fact in issue which comes up and which, on the other hand, may even lead to an inference which impacts on a fact in issue, I think you are absolutely right to say that that needs to be dealt with in some 12.24 way.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

Now, Ms. Burns, if I can turn to you, and you will know that I have said previously that you are getting the star in terms of application to the rule in Browne v. 12:24 I don't want to know what your instructions are, but I do think a lot of what is being said and has been led has been led responsibly, not from the point of view of attempting to blacken your client because you will also be aware of, for instance, what has been said 12:24 about the first investigation, the second investigation, what has been led with a view to giving me a background against which facts in issue can be judged, the main fact in issue being: What was the relationship with Commissioner Callinan? instructions given by Commissioner Callinan? Andrew McLindon, for instance, aware of that? Was Nóirín O'Sullivan aware of that? Were emails or texts sent in that regard giving instructions? This may all

12 - 25

impact, as may the whole notion of how straightforward	
or sane any statement made by Superintendent Taylor may	
be. That is, of course, taking it that I take his	
evidence at face value, but there have been certain	
things that have been put forward as perhaps	12:25
undermining the soundness of the objective ground on	
which he may walk. So I don't know whether you would	
like to take instructions on that or do you have them	
already or where do we stand?	
MS. BURNS: Firstly could I say, Chairman, that	12:25
obviously this portion of evidence that we are hearing	
last week and this week, I obviously was aware that the	
Clerkin investigation would arise and in that regard I	
did make inquiries as to what the Tribunal's interest	
would be in relation to that. I was obviously informed	12:26
and could see that an issue would arise regarding my	
client's credit and that there would be an interest in	
relation to that, to credit. Now, having regard to	
that, I also took account of the very careful analysis	
of law that the Tribunal previously outlined, counsel	12:26
for the Tribunal outlined, and took great account of	
that in terms of how the evidence would be led in	
relation to Clerkin. I can see that the Tribunal team	
took very careful care in relation to the evidence that	
has been led, and I can completely see that that	12:26
evidence is appropriate in terms of a separate analysis	
in relation to the credibility of my client and how	
that might, on a stand-alone basis, be assessed in	
terms of his evidence in relation to his protected	

1	disclosure.	
2	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Can I just stop you for a second, and	
3	I don't mean to, but again, I'm observing the	
4	distinction between credibility and credit.	
5	Credibility means what goes to a fact in issue in terms 12	2:27
6	of, for instance, could a witness properly see, does	
7	the witness wear glasses, is the witness the kind of	
8	person who, on an objective sense, tends to see things	
9	as they are as opposed to engaging in perhaps a more	
LO	fantastic view; and then credit, which is something	2:27
L1	unrelated in any way to any fact in issue or any	
L2	inference that might lead to a conclusion on a fact in	
L3	issue, but is entirely separate and is bad conduct	
L4	alleged in respect of something utterly outside the	
L5	ambit of anything that is in issue before the court or	2:27
L6	the Tribunal in this case.	
L7	MS. BURNS: And my submission to the Tribunal at this	
L8	stage is in relation to cross-examination as to credit	
L9	because that indeed is what the Tribunal team focused	
20	on. I'm not referring to credibility issues. I stated 12	2:27
21	that it was my focus on a cross-examination in relation	
22	to credit and I haven't mixed up those two terms and I	
23	can see why there would be an interest in relation to	
24	the Clerkin investigation. Clearly, the Garda	
25	Commissioner's team has gone further and adduced	2:28
26	further detail in relation to matters. We are	
27	presently taking instructions in relation to issues but	
28	what I would say, Chairman, is that matters that have	
29	been adduced, particularly today, it seems to me that	

1	they are issues that I'm not regardless of whether I	
2	should or I shouldn't, I certainly don't have	
3	instructions, and I have obviously been careful about	
4	that, I don't have instructions to challenge this	
5	witness in relation to matters that are in his	2:2
6	statement. Issues in relation to whether a SIM card	
7	was provided and the effect of that one way or	
8	another	
9	CHAIRMAN: we can leave that out. I mean, that's	
10	look, things come up and every court has to hear things 1	2:2
11	that are entertaining but utterly irrelevant, and that	
12	is one of them. But the other stuff we are talking	
13	about, the close relationships with journalists,	
14	walking out of the room to talk to journalists	
15	MS. BURNS: I am not taking issue with that, Chairman. 1	2:2
16	CHAIRMAN: giving journalists information that they	
17	shouldn't be given because of the Garda press and	
18	public relations office manual, and then giving out	
19	information after he was no longer Press Officer, is	
20	any issue being taken with any of that?	2:2
21	MS. BURNS: They are factual matters which have been	
22	established in the course of the Clerkin investigation	
23	and I certainly don't have instructions presently to	
24	challenge any of that. They are factual, they are	
25	contained in the Clerkin investigation. I do have to	2:2
26	finalise instructions in relation to it, but as matters	
27	stand I don't have instructions to challenge any of	
28	that. They are clearly set out. They, in the Clerkin	
29	investigation, seem to relate to a real hard evidence	

1	in terms of inferences, that is what I am taking	
2	instructions on. But in terms of the actual	
3	established facts, I am not challenging those nor can I	
4	in reality.	
5	CHAIRMAN: Well, I know you are somewhat handicapped,	2:30
6	Ms. Burns, because I don't think Superintendent Taylor	
7	is here.	
8	MS. BURNS: No.	
9	CHAIRMAN: Well, wouldn't it be a good idea for him to	
10	actually be here?	2:30
11	MS. BURNS: well, we are in constant contact with him,	
12	Chairman.	
13	CHAIRMAN: well, I don't know how that is happening.	
14	MS. BURNS: My solicitor is in contact.	
15	CHAIRMAN: Yes, I know. But I mean, we are not doing a	2:30
16	relay to I mean, the Morris Tribunal did a relay	
17	through outer space into a hotel room across Donegal	
18	Diamond, in Donegal Town, but that's not happening, we	
19	are not broadcasting, so how can he be aware? I mean,	
20	he can only be getting snippets or bits and pieces.	2:30
21	MS. BURNS: well, there are Twitter feeds coming from	
22	this room in relation to	
23	CHAIRMAN: I am going to show off and make a fool of	
24	myself probably by saying I thought you were limited to	
25	20 words on a Twitter feed.	2:31
26	MS. BURNS: I will make more of a fool of myself	
27	because I have no idea is the answer, but I can assure	
28	the Chairman that there is regular contact with	
29	Superintendent Taylor. If the Chairman would prefer if	

Τ	he was present there is obviously no difficulty in	
2	relation to that.	
3	CHAIRMAN: No, no. The rule in Re Haughey is that I	
4	have to give the rights. People don't have to receive	
5	the rights, no more than if there is a meal offered,	12:31
6	nobody has to eat it.	
7	MS. BURNS: well, if I could put it this way, Chairman:	
8	I think that the Tribunal's concern is whether a	
9	situation will arise that Superintendent Taylor will	
10	come and give evidence and put at issue matters that	12:31
11	have been perhaps specifically referred to by the	
12	Tribunal team, obviously matters have gone somewhat	
13	further with the Garda Commissioner's team; I certainly	
14	don't have instructions to do that, and Superintendent	
15	Taylor is very aware that we needed instructions in	12:31
16	relation to this issue.	
17	CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, that clarifies matters,	
18	and thank you very much for that clarification,	
19	Ms. Burns. That is where we stand. So there it is.	
20		12:32
21	Unless you have any further questions, there was just a	
22	few things that are on my mind.	
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
29	THE WITNESS WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	

- 1 209 Q. CHAIRMAN: You have seen loads of changes of Garda
- 2 Press Officer.
- 3 A. That's correct, Chair.
- 4 210 Q. CHAIRMAN: You would have seen five, six, seven or
- 5 eight, I suppose?
- 6 A. Press Officers?
- 7 211 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 8 A. Absolutely.
- 9 212 Q. CHAIRMAN: And is it, as I was told, normal that if the

12:32

12:32

- 10 Garda Press Officer -- sorry, the Garda Commissioner
- changes, the Garda Press Officer also changes?
- 12 A. Not -- no, it hasn't been a stated fact. Like, the
- 13 Press Officer can stay with a new Commissioner because
- I have worked under a number of different Commissioners
- as well and I have seen the older Press Officers stay
- for a length of time, possibly until he got promoted or
- 17 whatever.
- 18 213 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes. So it's not like apparently when --
- it's not automatic?
- 20 A. A government -- no, no.
- 21 214 Q. CHAIRMAN: You have seen it happen and not happen?
- 22 A. Correct, both sides. Yeah.
- 23 215 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Your evidence is that the
- relationship between Superintendent Taylor and Andrew
- McLindon was not a warm one, you said I think less than 12:33
- friendly, could you perhaps expand on that just a
- 27 little bit.
- 28 A. Well, I mean, we had a -- we only ever had one other
- 29 Director of Communications prior to Andrew McLindon,

1			and that relationship with the Press Officer, I think	
2			there might have been two, was an excellent working	
3			relationship and one complemented the other because	
4			experience and Garda experience and that, and in this	
5			case I would have thought that's why the Director of	12:33
6			Communications is there, but from day one it was very	
7			estranged, I suppose. It just wasn't working; there	
8			was very little or no communication between them. And	
9			I mean, a Director and Communications and a Press	
10			Officer by the very nature of their work I mean, they	12:33
11			should be having regular meetings, they should be in	
12			touch on a daily basis but that wasn't happening in	
13			this case and I could see that.	
14	216	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The evidence that I had from Andrew McLindon	
15			was that he was being bypassed?	12:34
16		Α.	Absolutely. Yeah. And from what I could see, from	
17			where I am, because I wouldn't be privy to top	
18			management meetings and that but from my point of view	
19			and where I could see, I could see that happening,	
20			yeah.	12:34
21	217	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Now, there is a conflict of evidence	
22			between Paul Williams and David Taylor in relation to	
23			what was or wasn't said, how many phone calls,	
24			etcetera, and I think David Taylor's instructions were	
25			that there was no conversation about getting	12:34
26			confirmation of the details in relation to Sergeant	
27			McCabe and any allegation that was made or any ruling	
28			by the DPP clearing him, but merely that Paul Williams	
29			rang up in order to say that he had spoken to a girl	

Т			whose thre had been destroyed affegedly by Maurice	
2			McCabe and that he was going to write about it, he was	
3			simply giving information to the Garda Press Officer.	
4			Had you ever come across a situation where a journalist	
5			would ring up and give information to you as opposed	12:35
6			to	
7		Α.	I would be aware, Chair, of a journalist who would have	
8			possibly more information than I would like them to	
9			have, if you know where I am coming from? So I would	
10			clarify the Press Office line on it and it could be	12:35
11			very short and concise, and I would be pushed and I'd	
12			say 'That's the line, that's what we are saying, we are	
13			not saying any more', but I would be aware that the	
14			journalist would have more information because that	
15			would have been communicated to me.	12:35
16	218	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You must have been shocked when the	
17			journalist, over the phone, revealed his or her source	
18			to you, being Superintendent Taylor?	
19		Α.	I possibly was shocked.	
20	219	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean, shocked on two levels: Firstly,	12:35
21			that the information was being given out by someone who	
22			wasn't the Garda Press Officer and secondly, that a	
23			journalist would break confidence in circumstances	
24			where no one had ever waived the privilege?	
25		Α.	Absolutely, Chair, yes.	12:36
26	220	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And the last thing I wanted to ask you	
27			about, did Superintendent Taylor have the army sweep	
28			the office for bugs?	
29		Α.	Not that I am aware of.	

1	221 Q	•	
2		obviously.	
3	А	, ,	
4		CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Was there something on your	
5		mind?	12:36
6		MR. MARRINAN: No.	
7		CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
8			
9		THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
10			12:36
11		CHAIRMAN: I am sorry for being late, Mr. Marrinan.	
12		What do you want to do in relation to going on or not	
13		going on? What have we got left? We have a number	
14		of	
15		MR. MARRINAN: we have witnesses to occupy the	12:36
16		afternoon, sir.	
17		CHAIRMAN: All right. Well then can we break for an	
18		hour then. Thank you.	
19			
20		THE HEARING ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH	12:38
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
29			

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, AFTER LUNCH:	
2				
3			MR. MARRINAN: Sergeant Anthony Connaughton, please.	
4				
5			SERGEANT ANTHONY CONNAUGHTON, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	13:39
6			DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
7				
8	222	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think, Sergeant Connaughton, that you	
9			have been attached to the Garda Press Office since	
10			2008, is that right?	13:40
11		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
12	223	Q.	I think you provided a statement to the Tribunal on the	
13			6th November of last year, it's at page 2866. It's	
14			fairly brief, it's only eight lines long. But you	
15			point out that you have no information to give the	13:40
16			Tribunal in relation to Superintendent Taylor's	
17			protected disclosure. I will just return to that in a	
18			moment. But I think that you also made a statement to	
19			the Clerkin investigation on the 25th July of 2015, to	
20			Sergeant Brian Kavanagh, and that's to be found in	13:40
21			Volume 9, at page 2388 of the materials. And in that,	
22			I think that by reference to the Spotlight computer	
23			system, you were able to identify four journalists'	
24			telephone numbers, isn't that right?	
25		Α.	Yes, Chair. There was certain requests made by the	13:4
26			investigation team at the time and I happened to be the	
27			particular sergeant who was working that particular	
28			shift and I assisted him with accessing the information	
29			that was on the Spotlight system.	

- 1 224 Q. And I think that we needn't have this up on the screen,
- just to protect the privacy of the journalists and
- 3 their phone numbers. But the numbers that you gave
- 4 were in relation to Eavan Murray, and was a number
- ending 760, and then the other one was Mick O'Toole's

13 · 42

13:42

13:42

13 · 42

- 6 number, ending in 470, and then Juno McEnroe was a
- 7 number ending in 371; isn't that right?
- 8 A. Well, I wouldn't know the numbers off by heart, but
- 9 whatever was on the system would be what was --
- 10 225 Q. Yes. Right. It's in your statement.
- 11 A. Yeah.
- 12 226 Q. And the ones that are in your statement are correct, is
- 13 that right?
- 14 A. That would reflect the numbers we have, yeah.
- 15 227 Q. Now, if we could just come back to your time in the
- 16 Press Office, you --
- 17 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Marrinan, that seems to be three
- iournalists, and the reason there isn't a fourth is?
- MR. MARRINAN: I think there's only three, sir.
- 20 CHAIRMAN: Yes. You did say four, however.
- MR. MARRINAN: Yes, I know. I made an error in saying
- 22 that.
- 23 CHAIRMAN: All right.
- 24 228 Q. MR. MARRINAN: I think that, Sergeant Connaughton, in
- 25 your time in the Press Office, I think that
- Superintendent Taylor arrived there in 2012, is that
- 27 right?
- 28 A. That's correct, yes.
- 29 229 Q. And what sort of working relationship did you have with

4	
	him?
	1111111

A. I had a professional working relationship with him, as
I had with my other supervisors previous to him and
after him. Every supervisor is different and their
personality comes out in their management style and

13:43

13 · 43

13 · 44

- he'd a different style to his predecessors and people that have been press officers since as well.
- 8 230 Q. Well, you were here in relation to the evidence, or
 9 heard the evidence from Sergeant Damien Hogan, the last
 10 witness, did you?
- 11 A. I did, yes.
- 12 231 Q. Yeah. Were any suspicions aroused in your mind in relation to how he was interacting with journalists?
- A. No, not from my experience. And just, I might, just by
 way of clarification, revisit what was mentioned by
 Damien there; like, we don't all work in the same
 office at the same time.
- 18 232 Q. Right.
- A. And any given time, there is a different dynamic going
 on in the office due to the different staff members
 working there.
- 22 233 Q. Yes.
- A. So I wasn't aware of -- nothing came to my attention that I would have concerns of in my time, working my shifts.
- 26 234 Q. And you found Superintendent Taylor somebody who was 27 good to work with and you had no complaints at all to 28 make in relation to him?
- 29 A. Well, personally, I had no complaints with him, no.

- 2 And in terms of Sergeant McCabe and issues concerning Sergeant McCabe, certainly in early 2014 the Sergeant McCabe story was very much in the media, isn't that
- 4 right?
- 5 A. I believe so, yeah.
- 6 236 Q. I mean, there was his appearance before the Public
- Accounts Committee in January. Were you getting a lot

13 · 44

13:45

13:45

- 8 of media requests at that time in relation to Sergeant
- 9 McCabe?
- 10 A. We would have -- if it was topical we'd get, I can't
- recall exactly, but if it was topical I'd imagine we
- would get requests, the same way as we would get
- requests in relation to other operational matters that
- would be going around the country as well. So if they
- were, they would be in the context of the normal
- 16 routine gueries that you get on any given day within
- 17 the office, which is a busy office.
- 18 237 Q. Do you recall any requests coming in from Ms. Debbie
- 19 McCann, who is a journalist, and Ms. Eavan Murray --
- 20 A. I don't recall any particular one, no.
- 21 238 Q. -- in relation to --
- 22 A. Personally, no.
- 23 239 Q. In particular in late February/early March in relation
- 24 to Ms. D --
- 25 A. No.
- 26 240 Q. -- and her family?
- 27 A. No, I definitely don't, no.
- 28 241 Q. Were you aware in 2013 or 2014 of an allegation that
- 29 had been made against Sergeant McCabe going back to

1			2006?	
2		Α.	I can't remember the timeframe, but just whatever would	
3			have been the fact that we would read the papers in	
4			the morning, whatever would be covered in the papers is	
5			the depth of my knowledge in relation to it.	13:45
6	242	Q.	Was there any talk in the Press Office at all about	
7			Sergeant McCabe and his motivation for	
8		Α.	Not as once again, as I pointed out earlier, within	
9			my role in the office it's you know, you are dealing	
10			with a large volume of queries and requests coming in	13:46
11			via email and phone, and other projects were involved	
12			in relation to press briefings, etcetera, as well, so	
13			it is a very busy office. And there's different	
14			sergeants, different dynamics there any given time.	
15			But personally I wasn't aware of any conversations of	13:46
16			that nature.	
17			MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much.	
18			MS. WARD: No questions.	
19			MS. BURNS: No questions, Chairman.	
20			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: No questions, Chairman.	13:46
21		Α.	Thank you, Chair.	
22				
23			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
24				
25			MR. MARRINAN: Sergeant James Molloy, please.	13:46
26				
27				
28				
29				

1			SERGEANT JAMES MOLLOY, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	
2			EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
3				
4	243	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think, Sergeant Molloy, that you're a	
5			member attached to the Garda Press Office since	13:47
6			December 2000, is that correct?	
7		Α.	That's correct.	
8	244	Q.	Is that up until the present time?	
9		Α.	For a short period on promotion I was in HRM.	
10	245	Q.	I think that you made a very brief statement to the	13:47
11			Tribunal on the 11th October 2017, which is at page	
12			2865, indicating effectively that you had no	
13			information to give to the Tribunal, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	246	Q.	However, you were you are aware of the fact that the	13:47
16			Tribunal is examining a protected disclosure made by	
17			Superintendent Taylor?	
18		Α.	Yes, Chair.	
19	247	Q.	And you're also familiar with the allegation that there	
20			was, effectively that he was told by Commissioner	13:48
21			Callinan to embark on a campaign to discredit Sergeant	
22			McCabe by spreading rumours about him, in particular in	
23			relation to a historical sexual abuse case. Were you	
24			aware of that going on at the time?	
25		Α.	No, in no way was I aware of that.	13:48
26	248	Q.	You made a statement then to the Clerkin investigation,	
27			and this is at page 2339 of the materials, and it would	
28			appear from that that you didn't have a particularly	
29			good working relationship with Superintendent Taylor,	

1			is that right?	
2		Α.	That would be accurate, Chair.	
3	249	Q.	And I think that you were, amongst other things, that	
4			you were concerned when he left the Press Office that	
5			he was in contact with Chrissie Fitzpatrick, is that	13:49
6			right?	
7		Α.	That's right, Judge. On a particular Sunday that I was	
8			working after Superintendent Taylor had left the Press	
9			Office, Chrissie Fitzpatrick received a call on her	
10			private mobile and she showed me the phone and it	13:49
11			was the call was from Superintendent Taylor. She	
12			took the call, but at the time I felt it wasn't	
13			appropriate for Superintendent Taylor to be ringing a	
14			civilian member of staff on her private phone while she	
15			was in work. He could have rang the office number or	13:49
16			he could have rang me on my mobile, which he had.	
17	250	Q.	Yes. And what was your concern in relation to the	
18			contact with Chrissie Fitzpatrick?	
19		Α.	Well, I was also aware of, generally in the office,	
20			that other people were receiving calls from	13:50
21			Superintendent Taylor since he'd been transferred to	
22			Traffic, and it just made people uncomfortable.	
23	251	Q.	Was it that you thought that he had too close a	
24			relationship with members of the media?	
25		Α.	No, it wasn't at the time, that's not what I thought.	13:50
26	252	Q.	It's just you say in your statement:	
27				
28			"When Dave Taylor arrived here first, I had concerns	
29			about him. I was not happy about the way he was	

1 acting."

2 A. Yeah.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

3 253 Q. And that you went to Andrew McLindon and sharing concerns with Mr. McLindon?

5 That was more to do with his style of management than Α. 13:50 6 any concerns about inappropriate contacts with the 7 I mean, to be fair to him, some of the things media. 8 that he did were correct, but he a tendency to gossip and chitchat in the general office. When he'd return 9 from the scene of an incident, he would -- he would 10 13:51 11 speak about everything that he had heard when he was 12 out at a press briefing, and I thought it was dangerous 13 to be saying that in the Press Office because that 14 could bleed into the media and some of it mightn't be accurate. It was more of a professionalism problem 15 13:51 16 that I had.

254 Q. Okay. You considered that he had a loose tongue?

A. Well, when you go to a briefing at a serious crime, you'll hear a lot of stories, a lot of talk from guards, from detectives, from superintendents. It isn't always accurate. So we must deal in the facts in the Press Office, we should only be dealing in the facts of the particular case. So my fear with that type of gossip was that it would be bleeding into the media, it would become part of the story. And people shouldn't be reading about maybe injuries to victims and, you know, the gruesome nature of crime in the media, or at least we shouldn't be providing that

13:51

13:51

information to them.

1	255	Q.	Yes. And I think after he left, he was taken off the	
2			press clippings list, is that right?	
3		Α.	That's right.	
4	256	Q.	And his name reappeared on it on three occasions and he	
5			had to be taken off each time?	13:52
6		Α.	Yeah, I mean, I heard all that. I knew he was on and	
7			he was off. I wasn't sure who was putting him on. I	
8			actually didn't know who was taking him off. The press	
9			clippings thing wouldn't have greatly concerned me, to	
10			be honest	13:52
11	257	Q.	Yeah.	
12		Α.	but	
13	258	Q.	Now, in terms of Sergeant McCabe and what was known	
14			about him in the Press Office or what may have been	
15			discussed in the Press Office concerning Sergeant	13:53
16			McCabe in late 2013 up until June of 2014, can you help	
17			us in that regard?	
18		Α.	Well, I can't say that I heard Superintendent Taylor	
19			say anything and I can't say who said things, but, I	
20			mean, obviously the case would be discussed.	13:53
21	259	Q.	Well, one would have thought so.	
22		Α.	Yeah.	
23	260	Q.	But every witness so far has told us, and I think	
24			you're the last witness from the Press Office, has said	

Yeah, discussed in the sense that I would hear from

clear, if there was a side to be taken in this, which

other staff what -- let's put it this way: I was

side David Taylor was on, and it wasn't on Maurice

13:53

it was never discussed?

25

26

27

28

29

Α.

- 1 McCabe's side, let's put it that way.
- 2 261 Q. Can you just expand on that a little bit?
- 3 A. My difficulty is that I can't point to a particular day

13:54

- 4 and time and say Superintendent Taylor said this, and
- therefore I just want to be careful.
- 6 262 Q. It's an impression that you had?
- 7 A. It's that, married with the fact that other staff
- 8 members would tell me something that was said as well,
- 9 possibly by Superintendent Taylor or -- not in the
- sense that they were repeating the gossip, but in the
- sense that, guess what he said, and it would be
- 12 uncomplimentary about Maurice McCabe, it would be
- uncomplimentary about any journalist who was writing in
- favour of Maurice McCabe and it wouldn't be very
- 15 complimentary about any members of the Oireachtas who
- 16 were taking Maurice McCabe's side.
- 17 263 Q. And from what period of time was this?
- 18 A. It's difficult to say. What people must understand is,
- 19 like others in the Press Office have said, it's busy.
- 20 When a story gets really big, it's kind of, it's beyond 13:54
- 21 the Press Office, it's happening in another political
- world. It doesn't really concern us. We're not
- getting calls every day about Maurice McCabe. It
- doesn't really impinge on the work of the office. But
- when certain elements, the PAC, for instance, that does 13:55
- create a little bit of a fuss in the office, obviously.
- 27 264 Q. All right. Well, prior to the PAC meeting, which was,
- I think, the 23rd January of 2014, prior to that, was
- 29 Sergeant McCabe discussed in the Press Office or were

1			you getting any feedback in relation to Superintendent	
2			Taylor's attitude to Sergeant McCabe?	
3		Α.	Prior to the PAC, yeah, probably all the time that	
4			Sergeant McCabe's case was on the radar.	
5	265	Q.	Did that have anything to do with the prior allegation	13:55
6			that had been made against Sergeant McCabe?	
7		Α.	No. I mean, I wasn't aware of that. I was vaguely	
8			aware of a rumour of a sexual assault and possibly that	
9			Maurice McCabe felt that this shouldn't be on the Pulse	
10			system and management weren't taking it off the	13:56
11			that's the rumour that I heard.	
12	266	Q.	And was this in 2013	
13		Α.	well, I can't	
14	267	Q.	2014?	
15		Α.	I would say 2013, but it would be very early 2014 if it	13:56
16			wasn't, but I can't be certain.	
17	268	Q.	And I know you're and this is helpful, that you are	
18			giving us the impression that you had at the time, but	
19			the impression that you had at the time, was it that	
20			Sergeant McCabe was somebody that perhaps	13:56
21			Superintendent Taylor would have held in very low	
22			regard because of the investigation, the prior	
23			investigation, or was it because he was simply somebody	
24			who was speaking out in relation to issues concerning	
25			An Garda Síochána?	13:57
26		Α.	More so because he was speaking out, I would have	
27			thought.	
28	269	Q.	Yes. And do you recall the appearance of Commissioner	
29			Callinan before the Public Accounts Committee and	

- 1 giving evidence?
- 2 A. Yes, I do.
- 3 270 Q. And you recall the controversy over the remark --
- 4 A. Of course.
- 5 271 Q. -- that was made by Commissioner Callinan?
- 6 A. Of course.
- 7 272 Q. After that, do you recall any discussion in the Press

13:57

13:57

13:58

- 8 Office or between you and Superintendent Taylor?
- 9 A. No, no, there was no discussion, not between me and
- 10 Superintendent Taylor. I am pretty sure John Ferris,
- 11 Superintendent John Ferris, director of communications,
- 12 Andrew McLindon, would have been thinking along the
- lines that I would have been thinking: could we maybe
- go back and apologise for that or could we change
- something about that, could we -- you know, this story
- didn't look good.
- 17 273 Q. Shortly after that, do you have any recollection of
- 18 Gerald Kean, solicitor, contacting the Press Office?
- 19 A. No, absolutely no recollection.
- 20 274 Q. Or indeed Debbie McCann or Eavan Murray contacting the
- 21 Press Office and asking or looking for any information
- in relation to Ms. D and her family?
- 23 A. No, definitely not, Chairman.
- 24 275 Q. So this impression that you got from discussing the
- 25 matter with other staff in the Press Office was that
- 26 Superintendent Taylor didn't approve of what Sergeant
- 27 McCabe was doing, is that right?
- 28 A. That was my impression.
- 29 276 Q. And was there any question-mark over Sergeant McCabe's

1		motivation	for	doing	what	he	was (doing?
2	Α.	No. bevond.	as	I said	d. thi	s (other	rumour

A. No, beyond, as I said, this other rumour that was in the ether and there was a -- it involved a sexual case, but possibly he was upset because it was on the Pulse system and he didn't feel it should be on the Pulse

13:59

14.00

- system. That is the extent that I knew about any sexual allegation.
- 8 277 Q. And you said that this arose out of discussions that 9 had you with other staff?
- 10 A. Well, when I say discussions, I mean, you know, because 13:59
 11 of the nature of the office and shift work and people
 12 moving in and out, it might be along the lines of, you
 13 know what somebody said this morning --
- 14 278 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. -- or did you hear what -- you know, so I don't know 13:59

 16 who said what to who, and that's why I need to be careful.
- 18 279 Q. But it was repeating what Superintendent Taylor had said?
- A. And it may not have been. To be fair, it may not have
 been repeating what Superintendent Taylor said either.

 That is the problem I have.
- 23 280 Q. But from working in the office, your impression was 24 that Superintendent Taylor did not think well of 25 Sergeant McCabe?
- 26 A. That would be a strong impression that I had.
- 27 281 Q. And you have no evidence to offer us that he was being 28 prompted in that regard by the Garda Commissioner or by 29 the Deputy Commissioner, Nóirín O'Sullivan?

Τ		Α.	No, absolutely not, no evidence.	
2	282	Q.	And when the protected disclosure broke and you heard	
3			what Superintendent Taylor was alleging, did you	
4			reflect back then yourself on your dealings with	
5			Superintendent Taylor at that particular time?	14:00
6		Α.	Sorry, in terms of?	
7	283	Q.	Did you reflect back and say, well, you know, he's	
8			saying that there was an orchestrated campaign here	
9			against Sergeant McCabe? You were there in the Press	
10			Office	14:01
11		Α.	Yeah, yeah.	
12	284	Q.	at the relevant period of time.	
13		Α.	Yeah.	
14	285	Q.	Did you have cause to reflect back?	
15		Α.	Well, it didn't require much reflection, to be honest,	14:01
16			Chair. I wasn't aware, nobody ever said anything to me	
17			about a campaign. I never witnessed a campaign. I	
18			never saw any other member of staff, the Press Office,	
19			brief the media negatively about Maurice McCabe.	
20			MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much.	14:01
21			MS. WARD: No questions.	
22			MS. BURNS: No questions, Chairman.	
23				
24			SERGEANT MOLLOY WAS EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS:	
25				14:01
26	286	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sergeant Molloy, just a few	
27			questions, if I may. Could I ask you, first of all, in	
28			relation to Superintendent Taylor's approach or	
29			methodology within the Press Office. I think you	

Τ			mentioned in your statement that was provided for the	
2			purposes of the Clerkin investigation that you had	
3			observed or noticed that David Taylor would sometimes	
4			drive to scenes of serious incidents and would sort of	
5			have a presence on the ground there at those incidents.	14:02
6			That would be one aspect, one way in which he would	
7			carry out his functions as Press Officer?	
8		Α.	Yeah, and that wasn't unusual, except that he went to	
9			every one, every scene himself and stood in front of	
10			the camera himself at every one. We had kind of	14:02
11			changed the ethos prior to that, where the local	
12			superintendent, somebody who was hands-on on the	
13			investigation would represent the investigation, but he	
14			went to every scene and brought somebody from the	
15			office with him to every serious incident and did a	14:02
16			piece to the camera at all of them.	
17	287	Q.	Did a piece to camera?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	288	Q.	And did you get from him or did you sense that he	
20			enjoyed the television side of it?	14:02
21		Α.	well, there is always a danger, and I have been in the	
22			Press Office a long time, of enjoying it, of loving	
23			being in part of the media and getting the buzz from	
24			that, and I thought he'd fallen into that trap,	
25			unfortunately.	14:03
26	289	Q.	You yourself worked with a number of different press	
27			officers, isn't that right?	
28		Α.	That's correct.	
29	290	Q.	And in contrast with those other press officers, what	

1			was your view in relation to how professional	
2			Superintendent Taylor discharged his role as Press	
3			officer?	
4		Α.	I mean, these are differences that he had between	
5			himself, and I'm not saying that they're wrong, I'm	14:03
6			just saying this is how he did business, but he was	
7			much more controlling in the office. He wanted to have	
8			control of every aspect.	
9	291	Q.	Yes. And how would that show itself?	
10		Α.	Well, in terms of, Sergeant Hogan mentioned earlier,	14:03
11			even time-keeping, you just got the impression, and	
12			perhaps it was paranoia in the end, but you were	
13			getting a call at five past seven when you were	
14			starting at seven, and you felt it was to see if you	
15			in, you were getting a call at ten to eleven when you	14:04
16			were closing the office at eleven and you felt and,	
17			you know, every time you needed a day off or to swap a	
18			shift, you had to go to him; you couldn't go to	
19			Inspector Ferris, who had been in charge of the	
20			day-to-day management of the office up to that point.	14:04
21			So there was a sense that he wanted to control	
22			everything.	
23	292	Q.	Yes. A previous witness, I think it was Chief	
24			Superintendent Clerkin himself, made reference to a	
25			number of different incidents of alleged disclosure, of	14:04
26			inappropriate disclosure to media of important stories.	
27			You yourself, I think, had a knowledge or a limited	
28			role in relation to a request that a journalist made -	

we needn't go into the journalist's name - but I think

1			for the purpose of getting a photograph, was it, of a	
2			homeless man who was found dead near Dáil Éireann?	
3		Α.	Yeah, but I think also to be fair, I did get a call. I	
4			don't think Superintendent Taylor had anything to do	
5			I didn't get a call from Superintendent Taylor.	14:05
6	293	Q.	Right.	
7		Α.	I got a call from a journalist, wanting me he had	
8			found a mugshot from the US and it was the same name as	
9			a man who had a homeless man who had died, and he	
10			wanted me to just have a look and see if it was the	14:05
11			same person. I couldn't 100 percent say it was the	
12			same person, so we left it at that. Now, subsequently,	
13			the photograph from the Garda Pulse system did appear	
14			in the media. This is why this particular piece of	
15			it was being investigated.	14:05
16	294	Q.	And that would not be appropriate, would it?	
17		Α.	Absolutely not.	
18	295	Q.	Yes. Now, in relation to the core matter that the	
19			Tribunal is investigating into, namely the existence,	
20			or otherwise, of what was said to have been a smear	14:06
21			campaign that Superintendent Taylor maintains he was	
22			directed to carry out by Commissioner Callinan, and	
23			which he alleges was also done in the knowledge of or	
24			perhaps connivance of former Commissioner O'Sullivan	
25			and also the director of communications, Andrew	14:06
26			McLindon, is a latter, is an allegation made latterly.	
27			Can I ask you, did you ever receive any feedback from	
28			journalists saying, what is the story with the smear	
29			campaign?	

1		Α.	Absolutely not, Chairman.	
2	296	Q.	Not even an impression or a sense of that from the	
3			ether?	
4		Α.	No.	
5			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you.	14:0
6			CHAIRMAN: I'm taking from that, Mr. O'Higgins, what	
7			the journalists weren't talking to other people in the	
8			Press Office about a smear campaign, if there was a	
9			smear campaign, and if they weren't talking, that is	
10			evidence that there wasn't a smear campaign, is that	14:0
11			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I think so, Chairman, yes.	
12			CHAIRMAN: All right. No, once I understand that,	
13			thank you.	
14	297	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: In other words, for the	
15			Chairman's benefit, perhaps it wasn't clearly asked;	14:0
16			whether directly from any journalist or from feedback	
17			from colleagues in the Press Office, did you pick up	
18			any scintilla of a hint even of a smear campaign?	
19		Α.	None whatsoever, Chairman.	
20			CHAIRMAN: So there was no sense of that in any	14:0
21			conversations that you had?	
22		Α.	Absolutely not.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Were you close to journalists at all?	

A. Well, with a small number you'd be on very good terms

And you would be on, you know, reasonably

14:07

with, yeah. And no, absolutely not.

good terms with them?

MR. MÍ CHEÁL O' HI GGI NS: Thank you.

24

25

26

Α.

Yes.

CHAI RMAN:

1			MR. MARRINAN: Nothing, sir.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
3				
4			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
5				14:07
6			MR. MARRINAN: Sir, if I can just recall Sergeant Alan	
7			Frawley, please. He wants to correct something he	
8			said.	
9				
10			SERGEANT ALAN FRAWLEY, HAVING BEEN PREVIOUSLY SWORN,	14:08
11			WAS FURTHER EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN:	
12				
13	298	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think, Sergeant Frawley, in answer to	
14			the Chairman, you were describing how one gets access	
15			from the Press Office to the Garda Commissioner's	14:08
16			office, and you wanted to correct an impression that	
17			you had given, is that right?	
18		Α.	Yeah. That's correct. Apologies, Chair.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Don't worry about it, it's fine, thanks.	
20			Just tell me what	14:08
21		Α.	You have to come out of the blue door at the gable end	
22			and walk to the centre, the centre of the block that is	
23			facing you when you walk in the main door or the gates.	
24			CHAIRMAN: You have to go out in the open air?	
25		Α.	You have to go out in the open air, and it's the door	14:08
26			in the centre of the block that leads you to the	
27			Commissioner's office. There is no direct access.	
28			That is an assistant commissioner's office that I	
29			described earlier with the actual	

1			CHAIRMAN: Right. No, that is fine. Thank you for	
2			telling me.	
3		Α.	Apologies again.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
5			MR. MARRINAN: Thank you.	14:09
6			MS. LEADER: The next witness, sir, is Superintendent	
7			Patrick Ryan. His statement is at page 4314 in Volume	
8			16.	
9				
10			SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK RYAN, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	14:09
11			DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER:	
12				
13	299	Q.	MS. LEADER: Superintendent Ryan, I understand that	
14			you're now assigned to the Information Technology	
15			Centre in Garda Headquarters?	14:09
16		Α.	That is correct.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Just, I think I need to say that I met	
18			Superintendent Ryan up in Garda Headquarters in the	
19			context of me looking at computer systems and doing	
20			searches in relation to the allegation that there was	14:10
21			the Oisín-type file in relation to Sergeant McCabe, so	
22			as people know that.	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	300	Q.	MS. LEADER: If you can outline your career path to	
25			that assignment, Superintendent, please?	14:10
26		Α.	Yes, indeed. I joined An Garda Síochána in May 1994	
27			and I was a student guard in Tallaght Garda Station.	
28	301	Q.	I'm sorry, I just can't hear you at the moment.	
29		Α.	Oh, sorry, my apologies. As I said, I joined An Garda	

Τ			Siochana in 1994, I was a student guard in Tallaght	
2			Garda Station. On attestment then I was transferred to	
3			Sundrive Road Garda Station, where I was community	
4			guard for the Drimnagh area for about two years. I was	
5			transferred to the IT section in January 1997, and I	14:10
6			have worked in various different roles and sections	
7			within the IT centre over them years and I have	
8			received a number of promotions to different sections,	
9			and I was promoted to superintendent in March 2015 and	
10			I am now responsible for IT operations and security.	14:11
11	302	Q.	Do you have any particular training in IT matters?	
12		Α.	Well, I would have studied; prior to joining An Garda	
13			Síochána, I went to college, and I have electronic I	
14			studied electronic engineering. I also worked in	
15			industry prior to joining An Garda Síochána in the IT	14:11
16			sector, and then I would have a number of	
17			qualifications as well, and I also completed my degree	
18			as well in IT management since joining An Garda	
19			Síochána, Chair.	
20	303	Q.	If you will outline what, in particular, you have	14:11
21			responsibility for in your role as head of the	
22			Information Technology Centre?	
23		Α.	Yes, as I said, I am responsible for IT operations. So	
24			basically, to put it at a very high level, we have a	
25			head of IT planning who would be responsible for all of	14:12
26			the development work of all our systems, our	
27			applications. Once these have been developed, then it	
28			is handed over to my section and we are responsible	
29			then for deploying, maintaining and making sure that	

- that system is available to the operational force.
- 2 304 Q. And in relation to IT hardware, do you have a
- 3 responsibility in relation to that?
- 4 A. That would be correct, yes. As part of that
- 5 responsibility, I'm also responsible for the
- 6 infrastructure to support all them systems. That would

14 · 12

14:13

14 · 13

- 7 also include the data centres, it would also include
- 8 then hardware at station levels, so PCs, printers,
- 9 laptops, etcetera.
- 10 305 Q. All right. In your statement, you say that the
- responsibility in relation to the hardware matters
- includes but is not limited to Pulse computers, laptops
- and tablet computer devices, and I want you to explain
- to the Tribunal what you mean by Pulse computers?
- 15 A. Pulse computers, I suppose the fact that I have been in 14:13
- 16 IT a long time, initially when the Pulse system was
- 17 developed we had --
- 18 306 Q. Maybe if you would explain what the Pulse system is, in
- 19 very summary format.
- 20 A. It would be the main incident management system for An
- 21 Garda Síochána.
- 22 307 Q. Right.
- 23 A. Pulse was developed back prior to the year 2000 and it
- 24 was deployed to meet the -- I suppose going back to the
- year 2000, we were all aware of the Y2K issues, and
- 26 Pulse was deployed prior to the year 2000.
- 27 Historically, on the PCs that were deployed throughout
- the organisation, the only thing that was available was
- 29 Pulse, so it was basically known as a Pulse computer.

- 1 Over time, that has changed, I suppose dramatically.
- 2 We have a big catalogue of applications now, and Pulse
- is basically one of those applications. So when a user

14 · 14

14:14

14.14

- 4 in a Garda station logs on to our network through, we
- 5 call it a Garda IS network, there is a number of
- 6 applications made available to them based on their, I
- 7 suppose their roles, responsibilities and permissions
- 8 that are set for them, or that they have.
- 9 308 Q. So am I correct in saying that Pulse is a data
- 10 retention system, basically?
- 11 A. It is a database, yes, it is indeed. But again, as I
- specified, it's an application, one application that is
- 13 available to our members.
- 14 309 Q. All right.
- 15 A. Another example would be word processing applications,
- 16 etcetera, and email applications.
- 17 310 Q. And email applications, for instance?
- 18 A. Exactly, yes.
- 19 311 Q. And a Pulse computer then is what you refer to as the
- 20 physical computer, is that correct --
- 21 A. It is.
- 22 312 Q. -- in the Garda station?
- 23 A. That's correct. It's a physical desktop computer.
- 24 313 Q. Computer. And the reason you call it a Pulse computer
- is, when computers were first introduced in An Garda
- 26 Síochána, the only purpose for them was to access
- 27 Pulse?
- 28 A. That is correct, Mr. Chairman.
- 29 314 Q. All right. So it's almost like an acronym for a

1 computer --2 That is correct. Α. 3 315 -- in An Garda Síochána. Now, I think when the 0. 4 Tribunal was first set up, there was an order served on An Garda Síochána in relation to all matters touching 5 14:15 6 on matters which we had to look into, is that correct? 7 That is correct. Α. 8 316 And arising out of that you were tasked with certain Q. jobs, is that correct? 9 That is correct. 10 Α. 14:15 11 317 And I think the first one related to Commissioner Q. 12 Nóirín O'Sullivan's computers, is that correct? 13 That is correct. Α. 14 318 Q. And what were you asked in relation to that? 15 At the time going back, I think it was the 13th March Α. 14:15 16 2017, I was requested to provide details of all hardware that former Nóirín O'Sullivan had access to. 17 18 All right. And I think later on in the year you 319 Q. 19 received a similar request in respect of former 20 Commissioner Callinan's hardware, is that correct? 14:16 That is correct. 21 Α. 22 And that didn't in any way deal with phones, is that 320 Q. 23 correct? 24 That is correct. Α. 25 Now, I think there was a -- the time limit for that 321 0. 14 · 16 26 request related to the time period when Superintendent 27 Taylor was in the Press Office, is that correct?

reference time dates --

well, what we worked on was the -- during the terms of

28

29

Α.

- 1 322 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. -- from the 1st July 2012 to the 31st May 2014.
- 3 323 Q. Okay. So you were looking for the former
- 4 Commissioner's computers in between July 2012 and the

14:17

14:17

- 5 31st May 2014, is that correct?
- 6 A. That is correct.
- 7 324 Q. Now, I think there was a significant event that
- 8 happened in 2014 which impacted on the information you
- 9 were able to give to the Tribunal, is that correct?
- 10 A. Well, we had a very large-scale IT project during 2014, 14:17
- and basically that was the replacing of all the
- 12 computers throughout the organisation. We had an XP
- operating system which had become end of life and was
- also a security risk to us and we had to replace all
- machines with a Windows 7 PC.
- 16 325 Q. And that wasn't just confined to Garda Headquarters?
- 17 A. No, that was a national -- national deployment that we
- 18 had to do, upgrade.
- 19 326 Q. And just to give the Tribunal some idea of the scale of
- the project, how many computers are we talking about,
- in very round figures?
- 22 A. Approximately seven-and-a-half thousand.
- 23 327 Q. All right. Now, because everybody's -- as I understand
- it, everybody's computer had to be replaced, is that
- 25 correct?
- 26 A. That is correct.
- 27 328 Q. And what steps did you take, as heading up that
- project, in order to ensure that all data was retained,
- 29 which was contained in each of those computers?

1		Α.	Yes. At the time in question I was inspector in charge	
2			of operations and I know as I said, it was a very	
3			large scale IT project. I suppose one of the biggest	
4			risks to the organisation was the loss of data. And by	
5			the very nature of the deployment we have had, I was	14:18
6			a lot of divisional headquarters, district	
7			headquarters, would have had access to our central file	
8			shares, whereas some other stations wouldn't have had	
9			the appropriate bandwidth at the time to be able to use	
10			our centrally-managed file shares, and I can discuss	14:18
11			that in a minute, if need be. So we had a	
12			comprehensive communications plan issued to the	
13			organisation and as part of that was very clearly	
14			defined, I suppose, and outlined the processes around	
15			data migration from the old PCs to the new PCs.	14:19
16	329	Q.	Right. So did you ask everybody to back up their	
17			computers onto your file share system?	
18		Α.	Yes. Those that had access, we had asked them to	
19			remove any locally-stored files on the PCs to the	
20			central file share. If this wasn't available to them	14:19
21			at the time, we had supplied encrypted external storage	
22			for them to ensure that they had access or they were	
23			able to back up their files.	
24	330	Q.	All right. So, as I understand it, and my	
25			understanding of these things is very basic,	14:19
26			Superintendent, but information on a computer can be	
27			stored on the hard drive of a computer and also can be	
28			stored on a file share system, is that correct?	

A. That is correct. If, as I said, you had access and the

1			appropriate bandwidth at the time, you could you had	
2			facilities to save centrally on our central file share.	
3	331	Q.	And if you could explain to the computer [sic] about	
4			your central file share system, please to the	
5			Tribunal, sorry.	14:20
6		Α.	Basically, it's an enterprise storage solution that we	
7			have and users will have access to it. They may have	
8			personal shares and also office shares, so basically if	
9			there was office files, they would be saved up to this	
10			group file share, as we would call it, but users also	14:20
11			had limited storage personal space as well on the	
12			enterprise storage solution.	
13	332	Q.	All right. And both Commissioner O'Sullivan and	
14			Commissioner Callinan, did they have access to the	
15			central file shares?	14:20
16		Α.	As far as I can recall, yes, they would have had. Now,	
17			they would have had personal shares, and I am not too	
18			sure, I would have to confirm if they had access to	
19			group shares as well, but I can only assume that they	
20			had.	14:21
21	333	Q.	So what did you discover when you asked when you	
22			tasked some of your employees or people who worked to	
23			you in relation to details of former Commissioner	
24			O'Sullivan's computers over the time period which we're	
25			looking at, July 2012 to May 2014?	14:21
26		Α.	Actually, if you wouldn't mind, maybe I should just	
27			clarify as well just in relation to the previous, just	
28			when we talked about removing	
29	334	Q.	Yes.	

- A. -- old hard drives, and I don't know if that is something you would like to cover or not, but there was two reasons we did retain old hard drives during the upgrade, I suppose, of all the computers.
- 5 335 Q. I don't think you actually explained about retaining old hard drives. Everybody was encouraged to back up their old computers?

14 · 21

14:22

14:22

14.22

- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 336 Q. And separately from that --
- Yes, as I said, there was a comprehensive 10 Α. 11 communications plan as part of that. However, we did 12 retain the hard drives from the old PCs, I suppose for 13 two reasons, Mr. Chairman. One was to, I suppose an 14 insurance policy more than anything else. If anyone 15 had come back and said that there was data missing, we 16 had the ability to be able to look at the hard drive. 17 Second of all was to ensure that we were able to do a 18 secure disposal of the drives when the time came. At 19 the time in question, we had only planned on keeping the hard drives for a limited period, for between four 20 to six weeks, but we never actually got to the point 21 22 where we were able to securely dispose of them all. 23 And then the preservation orders came in place and we 24 have what we have today still located in the IT centre. 25 I think it's also important to note that I am aware that we would have given instructions at the time that 26 27 if a certain time period had lapsed and no one had come 28 to us, we would have possibly reused some of them hard 29 drives. At the end of the day, they cost money and

- 1 they are an asset. And in the event that we'd received 2 no calls for a reported -- or someone reported any data 3 loss, we may have used that hard drive. I'm glad to say that we had no calls whatsoever after the 4 5 completion of the project, that there was any data loss 14:23 6 across the organisation. 7 Well, superintendent, I don't mean to hold CHAI RMAN: 8 you up in using your hard drives. It's only what's relevant to Maurice McCabe that needs to be retained, 9 and I would say we have narrowed the field very 10 14 · 23 11 considerably since the preservation order in February 2017. 12 13 Yes, Chairman. Α. 14 337 Q. MS. LEADER: Superintendent, I suppose if you got no 15 complaints about missing data, it would give you good 14:23 16 grounds for believing that everybody had backed up 17 their computer to the file share system? 18 That is correct. Α. 19 338 Yes. Q. 20 well, as I said, if not the file share system, also 14:23 they were satisfied that they had a copy that they were 21 22 able to --23 A personal copy? 339 Q. 24 A personal. And again, I would be acutely aware that, Α.
- 27 340 Q. Would there have been particular emphasis placed on 28 senior officers that everything --
- 29 A. Well, it was across the organisation, but, yes,

26

especially with our senior officers, that we would have 14:24

ensured that that job was done correctly at the time.

1	specifically I suppose all our senior officers, the
2	last thing that I wanted, anyway, definitely, was to be
3	told that there was any data lost as a result of us
4	upgrading computers.

Okay. So if we can just go on to the specific commissioners then. In relation to former Commissioner O'Sullivan, what did you find out about her computers during the relevant time period, July 2012 to May 2014?

- I had tasked Sergeant Monaghan with identifying, I 9 Α. suppose, all IT hardware that former Commissioner 10 14 · 24 11 O'Sullivan would have used. And I know that he was 12 able to, through some of the toolsets that we have, he 13 was able to identify what PCs former Commissioner 14 O'Sullivan had logged on to. So we had identified a 15 number of PCs, and basically these would have been 14:25 16 replaced during that Windows 7 upgrade that we 17 completed, that project.
- 18 342 Q. Yes. And Inspector Monaghan is to give evidence
 19 immediately following you so he can deal with that.
 20 But I think there were two Pulse computers identified,
 21 and the hard drive for one of them was located, is that
 22 correct?
- 23 That is correct. One was located in a storeroom, a Α. 24 secure storeroom that we had. If I can just add to 25 that, Mr. Chairman, as well; I know, for completeness, 26 we had also rechecked our audit logs as well, and there 27 was one further PC that was also logged on to during 28 the terms of reference at the time, during the terms of reference. 29

- 1 343 Q. All right.
- 2 CHAIRMAN: So does that make three?
- 3 A. That would have been three PCs that former Commissioner
- 4 O'Sullivan would have logged on to using her account.
- 5 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, go on, Ms. Leader.
- 6 344 Q. MS. LEADER: And in relation to the logging on of a PC,

14 · 26

14:26

14:26

- 7 I think it may be the case that it may not have been
- 8 her computer, is that correct, or are you satisfied it
- 9 was?
- 10 A. No, I think any -- from my understanding, I think
- definitely one or two of them would have been during
- her time as Deputy Commissioner and they may have been
- in the Deputy Commissioner's office.
- 14 345 Q. In the Deputy Commissioner's office. And in relation
- to logging on to a computer, I think every individual
- guard is assigned a Pulse identity, which they use when
- 17 they log on to a computer?
- 18 A. They would have a user name and password, that is
- 19 correct.
- 20 346 Q. And that is how it is established that a computer is
- assigned and a person is logged on?
- 22 A. Well, not assigned. It's pretty much where a user
- name -- we were able to identify what computers a user
- name logged on to.
- 25 347 Q. All right.
- 26 A. If that makes sense.
- 27 348 Q. Okay. Now, I think you also established that a number
- of laptops had been assigned to former Commissioner
- 29 O'Sullivan, is that correct?

- 1 A. That is correct.
- 2 349 Q. And you identified what these laptops were but you
- don't have any record of them being returned to the
- 4 Garda IT section, is that correct?
- 5 A. I think what we have provided was a full list of
- 6 everything that we had located on our asset registers.

14 · 27

14:28

14:28

14 . 28

- 7 We also -- we had a number, I suppose, of different
- 8 data sources that we used. I think the policy that's
- 9 in place at the moment is that we allocate devices to
- regional commissioners and to directors, but there is
- no return policy in place at the moment. That is
- something that is being worked on at present.
- 13 350 Q. So I think there were five laptops issued to former
- 14 Commissioner O'Sullivan since 2006: one issued on the
- 15 6th January 2016, one issued on the 30th May 2017, one
- issued in 2009, one issued in 2010 and one issued later
- in 2010, in September 2010, is that correct?
- 18 A. That appears correct, yes.
- 19 351 Q. And they haven't been accounted for, is that correct?
- 20 A. That is correct.
- 21 352 Q. All right. And along with the laptops, I think there
- 22 were two particular iPad devices that had been assigned
- to former Commissioner O'Sullivan, is that correct?
- 24 A. That is correct.
- 25 353 Q. Now, in relation to one of those laptops, there was a
- fault in it, and that was returned to your section for
- 27 repair?
- 28 A. That's correct, yes.
- 29 354 Q. And as matters turned out, it couldn't be repaired, am

1			I correct in saying that?	
2		Α.	It was too badly damaged.	
3	355	Q.	Yes. But prior to it being sent away, it had actually	
4			been re-set, in any event?	
5		Α.	That is correct.	14:29
6	356	Q.	And as I understand it, that would mean that there	
7			would be no information on it?	
8		Α.	That is correct.	
9	357	Q.	Is that correct? And the other iPad has subsequently	
10			been given to the Tribunal, is that correct?	14:29
11		Α.	I understand that is correct.	
12	358	Q.	All right. Now, in relation to Commissioner Callinan,	
13			what can you tell us about the computers which he had	
14			accessed which he's accessed during his time, during	
15			the relevant time period?	14:29
16		Α.	Yes. I think we had reported on a number of PCs.	
17			However, I can confirm that there is one PC that former	
18			Commissioner Callinan had logged on to during the terms	
19			of reference. The other ones we reported on,	
20			Mr. Chairman, are actually outside of the terms of	14:29
21			reference, so it's only one that we are talking about.	
22			This would have been replaced again as part of our	
23			Windows 7 project on the 11th November '14. It would	
24			have been replaced with a Windows 7 PC at that time.	
25	359	Q.	All right. In relation to that hard drive, I	14:30
26			understand it hasn't been located?	
27		Α.	No. And, you know, we from our investigations, we	
28			were able to determine that the particular model	
29			there was some models. I think, of computers at the	

1			time that were capable of taking a Windows 10 image.	
2			The majority of our estate wouldn't have been able to	
3			take a Windows 10 image, and that is why we had to	
4			replace them. But this particular computer was	
5			capable, it was a fairly more up-to-date model, and	14:3
6			we believe that this PC may have been rebuilt and	
7			reallocated, but we cannot confirm.	
8	360	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So, in other words, it may have been	
9			returned?	
10		Α.	I would be amazed if it hasn't. I would say it was	14:3
11			rebuilt and redeployed out operationally, because it	
12			would have been a perfectly working Pulse PC, or there	
13			I go again, Pulse PC, but PC.	
14	361	Q.	MS. LEADER: I also think you established that six	
15			laptops and one iPad had been issued to Commissioner	14:3
16			Callinan since 2001?	
17		Α.	Yes. And that's going back a very long time. I have	
18			no doubt that a laptop that is 17 years old, 17 years	
19			at this stage, would not be wanted by anybody. But	
20			that is from what our records tell us, and they would	14:3
21			have been on issue to former Commissioner Callinan, I	
22			suppose, through the various ranks as well over the	
23			last since 2001.	
24	362	Q.	And, of those laptops, one was issued on the 15th	
25			February 2001, that was not recorded as being returned	14:3
26			to the IT centre; there is another issued on the 6th	
27			January 2006, not recorded as being returned to the IT	
28			centre; another one issued in 2007, not recorded as	
29			being returned to the IT centre; a laptop issued on the	

1			16th June 2009, this was returned during 2012 and	
2			allocated elsewhere, is that correct?	
3		Α.	That is correct, yes.	
4	363	Q.	So would that have been factory re-set before	
5			allocation?	14:32
6		Α.	It would, yeah. No, it's a term, what we call	
7			re-imaged, so the device would have been re-imaged	
8			prior to allocation. It was allocated to the Ashbourne	
9			incident room on the $6/11/2012$.	
10	364	Q.	A laptop issued on the 23rd September 2009, not	14:32
11			recorded as being returned to the IT centre; a laptop	
12			issued on the 29th August 2011, and the former	
13			Commissioner Callinan bought this on his retirement	
14			from An Garda Síochána, he made arrangements to have it	
15			valued and buy it, is that correct?	14:32
16		Α.	That is correct, yes.	
17	365	Q.	And the records reflect that?	
18		Α.	They do, indeed.	
19	366	Q.	And in relation to that laptop, can you tell us	
20			anything about the process that it underwent on his	14:33
21			retirement from An Garda Síochána?	
22		Α.	Basically, the device would have been re-imaged prior	
23			to leaving the organisation. Basically that, at a very	
24			high level, it means bringing the device pretty much	
25			back to a factory default, and we ensure that there is	14:33
26			no Garda that this is to ensure that there is no	
27			Garda data or Garda associated licences left on the	
28			device.	
29	367	Q.	And I think that was being, you may be aware or may not	

- be aware, that has been made available to the Tribunal in order to go through it?
- 3 A. I'm not aware.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

That is the case. Now, in relation to the information that's on laptops, first of all, during the 2012-2014 period, or the access that it gives to the user of the iPad, can you tell the Tribunal about that, please?

14:33

Well, I know iPads, specifically when they were first Α. allocated, they were pretty much allocated to the executive team for following up on news feeds, 14:34 etcetera. My understanding is that there was no access to any, as I would call it, corporate Garda services on first allocation, when they were first allocated out. However, with the, I suppose, advances in technology, we have been able to provide secure remote access to 14:34 our corporate systems. This is done through a VDI instance, which means Virtual Desktop Infrastructure, which establishes a secure connection. Basically, VDI, it would give the end-user access to a virtual PC which they could log on to. I think it would be important to 14:35 note, though, that whilst this is securely available through secure connections, the device on which we provide this access through, the virtual client does not interact with the local device at all, so basically the laptop or iPad would essentially become a dumb 14:35 terminal. And once the connection is established with our central systems, it's the very same as sitting down

in front of one of our computers in one of the

stations, it will give you -- so it is fully centrally

1			managed,	if that	makes	sense.
2	369	0.	All righ	t. Now.	I thir	nk in r

2 369 Q. All right. Now, I think in relation to Commissioner
3 Callinan's iPad, it would appear that this developed
4 some fault. is that correct?

5 A. I can't confirm that --

14:35

14:37

6 370 Q. Yes.

- -- bar what, through my own search of my own records, I 7 Α. 8 had checked my own email archive, and I was able to locate one or two emails which I had been copied on by 9 the previous former superintendent in IT. 10 14:36 11 basically, that was just to say that there was one particular email which I think our ICT executive 12 13 director had asked about the location of devices that were on issue to former Commissioner Martin Callinan, 14 15 and the previous superintendent had reported, 14:36 16 basically, that the laptop had been purchased by former 17 Commissioner Callinan and the iPad had been reported 18 damaged and was to be returned.
- 19 371 Q. Now, in relation to email systems in An Garda Síochána,
 20 I understand that, is it every individual member of the 14:37
 21 guards or some guards are assigned an email account
 22 which is their name and garda.ie thereafter?
- 23 A. That is correct.
- 24 372 Q. And in relation to archiving that email system, what 25 can you tell the Tribunal about that?
- A. Well, we employ an archiving solution, it has been in place since July 2010, and basically every email that would be sent or received by any of our staff would be captured by this email archiving solution.

1	373	Q.	All right. So, for instance, if an individual guard	
2			deletes emails from his Garda account, what can you say	
3			in relation to that in relation to the archived	
4			account?	
5		Α.	Again, the archiving solution doesn't delete. A user	14:3
6			may be able to delete at a local level on the PC. This	
7			would be from their client, their email client, but	
8			this would not be deleted from the archiving solution.	
9	374	Q.	Okay. I think you can confirm that former Commissioner	
10			Callinan, former Commissioner O'Sullivan and	14:3
11			Superintendent Taylor all had Garda email accounts?	
12		Α.	That is correct.	
13	375	Q.	Now, in relation to what the last witness said about	
14			backing up emails or emails to be backed up, can you	
15			tell the Tribunal anything about that? There is a	14:3
16			suggestion that there isn't enough room to store	
17			emails?	
18		Α.	Sorry, I don't understand.	
19	376	Q.	There's some suggestion that, from time to time, a	
20			situation may develop where there isn't room	14:3
21		Α.	Oh, sorry, I understand.	
22	377	Q.	in an individual email account?	
23		Α.	No, basically, every user of our email system is given	
24			a storage amount, if that makes sense. It's enterprise	

26

27

28

29

storage, it's expensive, so we can't -- it's not like

cloud technology, we can't just say keep working away.

So we provide enough storage to allow our members to, I

suppose, have instant access to approximately one year

of emails, going back one year. They do have to manage

Τ			their email accounts. If they don't delete them after	
2			a certain time period, then their limits start to	
3			exceed. And once their limits exceed, they are given	
4			warnings about their they need to clean down their	
5			email mailbox, but if they don't do that after a	14:39
6			certain time period, well then it will basically block	
7			them from sending emails. They can still receive	
8			emails, but they won't be able to send. Every member	
9			has access to the archiving solution, to their own	
10			personal archive, so they can go in and retrieve email,	14:40
11			if required.	
12	378	Q.	Now, in relation to a laptop computer which was	
13			assigned to Superintendent Taylor, you gave assistance	
14			to the Tribunal in relation to details so as that could	
15			be accessed, is that correct?	14:40
16		Α.	That is correct, yes.	
17	379	Q.	I think it was encrypted and you assisted the Tribunal	
18			insofar as details on how to get into the system?	
19		Α.	Yes, that is correct.	
20	380	Q.	If you would answer any questions anybody else might	14:40
21			have, please.	
22			MS. WARD: No questions.	
23			MS. BURNS: No questions, Chairman.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, did you?	
25				14:40
26				
27				
28				

1			SUPERINTENDENT RYAN WAS EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL	
2			McGUI NNESS:	
3				
4	381	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Just a few quick questions,	
5			Superintendent. Just in relation to the identity of	14:40
6			the third computer that you mentioned to the Chairman	
7			just now, I have a reference number just for the record	
8			in relation to that; it's HQCBOB-XPC-004. That is the	
9			computer you're referring to?	
10		Α.	That is correct, yes.	14:41
11	382	Q.	And just the second-last set of abbreviations, XPC, can	
12			you identify what that refers to?	
13		Α.	XPC?	
14	383	Q.	Yes.	
15		Α.	Basically, it would be part of our naming convention	14:41
16			that we have for computers. So XP means it was an XP	
17			older operating system that we had on the computers.	
18	384	Q.	And that is one of the ones that was replaced in 2014?	
19		Α.	That would be correct.	
20	385	Q.	In relation to computers that were in existence in 2014	14:41
21			and the migration of data, could you indicate where	
22			data can be stored on, I wouldn't say not standalone	
23			desktops, but on computers, physical computers, where	
24			is data actually stored?	
25		Α.	Yeah. No, there would have been only three locations	14:41
26			on the PCs, which would have been on the desktop, under	
27			'my documents', and on the D drive. So there would	
28			have been a C and a D drive on the partitions, or that	
29			is the way the drive is partitioned back then.	

Т	386	Q.	so the user can choose to save either to the shared	
2			drive or to the 'my documents' or to the other	
3			locations?	
4		Α.	Again, if they at the time, if they had appropriate	
5			bandwidth, they would have been provided access to our	14:42
6			central file shares. If they didn't, they wouldn't	
7			basically have the access, so they'd only be able to	
8			save locally on the device.	
9	387	Q.	And in relation to the migration of data, was	
10			locally-stored information migrated to the new	14:42
11			computer?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	388	Q.	In the transfer over to the new operating system?	
14		Α.	As I said, we had a very comprehensive communications	
15			plan and a migration plan. The safeguarding of our	14:42
16			data is paramount to An Garda Síochána and, as I said,	
17			there would have been very clear instructions and	
18			procedures at that particular time which needed to be	
19			followed, and basically that's what happened at the	
20			time.	14:43
21			CHAIRMAN: Yes, well, Mr. McGuinness, emails are all	
22			archived, so I've got that, but in terms of any data	
23			you create on your own computer, let us say a witness	
24			statement, or whatever, that certainly would be	
25			migrated across if the policy was followed, but you	14:43
26			could always delete it, I suppose, prior to doing that,	
27			in which case there would be nothing to migrate, is	
28			that correct?	
29			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: I understand that, Chairman,	

_			yes.	
2		Α.	That would be correct.	
3	389	Q.	Insofar, therefore, as one of the three hard drives in	
4			relation to the three computers, one of the hard drives	
5			has been handed over to the Tribunal?	14:43
6		Α.	That is correct.	
7	390	Q.	The other two are not available. Subject to what the	
8			Chairman has said, are you satisfied that the	
9			information that was stored on those computers as of	
10			those times has been is available to the Tribunal?	14:43
11		Α.	Yes. Anything that's centrally managed is still	
12			available.	
13	391	Q.	In relation to laptops, there is a fairly high degree	
14			of obsolescence in relation to them, isn't that	
15			correct?	14:44
16		Α.	That is correct.	
17	392	Q.	In relation to laptops issued to Nóirín O'Sullivan,	
18			most of them were issued while she was Deputy	
19			Commissioner of Operations, isn't that correct?	
20		Α.	That would be correct.	14:44
21	393	Q.	Are you familiar with the practice that specific	
22			laptops might be issued for specific projects or	
23			incidents?	
24		Α.	It's possible, yes, that would be possible. Again, I	
25			can only go by our asset register. It wouldn't be	14:44
26			unusual for devices to also be looked for, for, I	
27			suppose, as you said, particular projects or a	
28			particular job.	
29	394	Ο	And they might in fact he used by other members of	

1			the team?	
2		Α.	That is correct.	
3	395	Q.	And in relation to Commissioner O'Sullivan, or former	
4			Commissioner O'Sullivan, there weren't any laptops	
5			issued during her time as Commissioner, isn't that	14:44
6			correct?	
7		Α.	That is correct.	
8	396	Q.	They all preceded that appointment. Thank you,	
9			Superintendent.	
10		Α.	Thank you.	14:45
11			CHAIRMAN: was there anything else, Ms. Leader?	
12				
13			SUPERINTENDENT RYAN WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MS. LEADER:	
14				
15	397	Q.	MS. LEADER: The reference to the computer you gave	14:45
16			ending in 004, that was, as I understand it, a computer	
17			assigned to former Commissioner O'Sullivan, is that	
18			correct?	
19		Α.	Sorry, can you repeat that again?	
20	398	Q.	The XPC-004	14:45
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	399	Q.	the one you just gave evidence about, that related	
23			to a computer attached to former Commissioner	
24			O'Sullivan, is that correct?	
25		Α.	That's	14:45
26			CHAIRMAN: One of the three then?	
27		Α.	Yes, that is correct.	
28			MS. LEADER: Yes. It's one of the three. And just	
29			finally, in relation to the attendance of the Chairman	

1			at Garda Headquarters, I think it was under the	
2			supervision of Chief Superintendent Brunton, who is	
3			scheduled to give evidence this week, is that correct?	
4		Α.	That is correct.	
5	400	Q.	Yes. Thanks. And that was at the end of July 2017?	14:45
6		Α.	That is correct.	
7			CHAIRMAN: I think just during that time, I presume you	
8			would have had very close interaction with the Forensic	
9			Service of Northern Ireland, who I think have visited,	
10			it's almost on dozens of occasions, to Garda	14:46
11			Headquarters to look at things?	
12		Α.	That is correct, Mr. Chairman.	
13			CHAIRMAN: And I certainly have no hint that you have	
14			done anything except give your full cooperation, and	
15			thank you very much for that.	14:46
16		Α.	Hopefully. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.	
17			MS. LEADER: Thank you very much.	
18		Α.	Thank you.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Unless you want to stay there,	
20			Superintendent.	14:46
21		Α.	No, that's it? Thank you.	
22				
23			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
24				
25			MR. McGUINNESS: The next witness, Chairman, is	14:46
26			Inspector Monaghan.	
27				
28				
29				

Т			SERGEANT DECLAN MUNAGHAN, HAVING BEEN SWURN, WAS	
2			DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS AS FOLLOWS:	
3	401	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Sergeant Monaghan, I think you were	
4			improperly promoted by Ms. Leader there.	
5		Α.	That'll do.	14:47
6	402	Q.	You are Sergeant Monaghan?	
7		Α.	That's correct.	
8	403	Q.	Can you just outline your qualifications, you have	
9			qualifications in the IT field?	
10		Α.	I have, yeah. Prior to joining An Garda Síochána, I	14:47
11			was studying in the University of Ulster, for a BSc in	
12			computing and after joining I was seconded to the	
13			Garda IT sectio in 1999, and on having taken on a	
14			Degree in Information Technology, through the Institute	
15			of Public Administration and since then I have also	14:47
16			completed a Master's in Criminal Justice Management,	
17			through the same place as well.	
18	404	Q.	Yes. I think you have been sergeant in charge of IT	
19			Live Operations in An Garda Síochána in Headquarters,	
20			is that correct?	14:48
21		Α.	I'm attached to the Live Operations in the IT section	
22			in Garda Headquarters. I have been there since,	
23			September 2011 is when I took on that role.	
24	405	Q.	September 2011, yes. I think you received a request	
25			through the previous witness from the private secretary	14:48
26			of the Commissioner to do a search, to identify all	
27			computers used by the Commissioner in a specified time	
28			period, being the relevant time period we're concerned	
29			with?	

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 406 Q. And that came from Commissioner O'Sullivan office
- 3 through her private secretary?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 407 Q. And she was directing that this be done --
- 14:48

14 · 48

14:49

14:49

14 · 49

- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 408 Q. -- for the purposes of the Tribunal?
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 409 Q. And I think can you confirm what the previous witness
- said, that each member would have a username and
- password for logging on to any desktop PCs?
- 12 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 13 410 Q. And I think you maintain or An Garda Síochána maintains
- an audit log so that you can check log-in details?
- 15 A. Well, any member who logs onto the Garda IS domain,
- 16 their log-in is tracked through -- they must
- 17 authenticate with domain controller and that keeps a
- log of all log-in requests made to that at any time.
- 19 411 Q. Yes. And I think you were able to verify the log-ins
- or log-ons engaged in by Commissioner Callinan and
- Commissioner O'Sullivan which gave you the details of
- the PC names and the virtual infrastructure desktop
- 23 laptops, etcetera?
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 412 Q. I think you were able to check that against the
- configuration management data base, which lists all the
- 27 assets for networked PCs?
- 28 A. That, it keeps a track of all assets on the Garda IS
- domain and it plugs into our service desktop that we

1 have locally. So I can verify the details that I'd get 2 from the audit. 3 413 And between the two checks you can verify the PCs, the Q. serial name, the manufacturer and the model? 4 5 That's correct. Α. 14:50 6 414 And then you can also verify the location of those? Q. That's correct. The location details was got from the 7 Α. 8 Windows 7 migration logs --Yes? 9 415 Q. -- which showed me the machine name and also what it 10 Α. 14:50 11 was replaced by, but also gave me details on the 12 location as well. 13 Yes. And unsurprisingly they were in the 416 Q. Commissioner's office --14 15 Absolutely. Α. 14:50 16 -- isn't that right? 417 Q. 17 Yeah. Α. 18 Now, we've heard from the previous witness about the 418 Q. 19 replacement or the migration of systems and I think in 20 November of 2014 Commissioner Callinan's previous 14:50 desktop was replaced, is that correct? 21 22 That is correct. Α. 23 And Commissioner O'Sullivan's desktop was also replaced 419 Q. 24 on the 30th November, is that right? That's correct. 25 Α. 14:51 Or 13th November 2014. 26 420 Ο.

has been provided to the Tribunal?

And I think the hard drive from that was located and

That's correct.

27

28

29

421

Α.

Q.

1		Α.	I personally located one of the hard drives for	
2			HQCBOBXPC003.	
3	422	Q.	Yes?	
4		Α.	And I located that and I gave that to Superintendent	
5			Ryan for safekeeping.	14:51
6	423	Q.	Yes. But the laptops then that are relevant, we've	
7			heard from the previous witness about them and I think	
8			were you able to verify that Commissioner Callinan had	
9			purchased the laptop that he had been using on his	
10			retirement?	14:51
11		Α.	I don't think I got the details regarding to the	
12			purchase of the laptop	
13	424	Q.	Yes?	
14		Α.	but I verified from the asset register the list of	
15			devices that had been assigned to Commissioner Callinan	14:51
16			and Commissioner O'Sullivan.	
17	425	Q.	Yes. And that's actually a fairly standard procedure?	
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	426	Q.	It wasn't a special procedure for Commissioner	
20			Callinan?	14:51
21		Α.	No, no.	
22	427	Q.	And the laptop, as I understand it, was valued by An	
23			Garda Síochána and he paid for it	
24		Α.	That would be correct.	
25	428	Q.	at the valuation. Okay. I think you made a second	14:52
26			statement on the 6th November 2017 and you were able to	
27			identify log-on dates for Commissioner Callinan's	
28			computer, two particular dates, one of the 26th	
29			November 2013 and another on the 23rd August 2013, on	

1 the Dell OptiPlex which had been one of the replaced 2 ones. is that correct? 3 Em... This is in the additional statement? Α. Your statement of the 6th November. 429 4 0. 5 So basically my first statement I provided, the Α. 14:52 6 initial query it was very broad in that it said, it 7 related to computers used by -- details of computers used by the Commissioner from the period 1st July 2012 8 to 31st May 2014, but it didn't specify whether it 9 pertained to Commissioner Callinan or Commissioner 10 14:53 O'Sullivan. 11 12 Yes? 430 Q. I got that further clarified, that it was Commissioner 13 Α. 14 O'Sullivan that it pertained to --15 431 Yes? Q. 14:53 16 -- and I provided the details at the time --Α. 17 432 Yes? Q. -- pertaining to Commissioner O'Sullivan. 18 Α. 19 433 Yes? Q. Subsequent to that, when I was on leave, a further 20 Α. 14:53 statement was provided in relation to Commissioner 21 22 Callinan and on returning from leave and I when was 23 preparing my statement Superintendent Ryan asked me to 24 verify the details of the second report and that's what 25 I have done in my second statement. 14:53 Yes. And the details showing Commissioner Callinan's 26 434 Q. 27 log-on to the computer --28 Α. Yes. -- is one of the Pulse enabled computers? 29 435 Ο.

Т		Α.	They're all on the Garda IS domain, yes, that's	
2			correct.	
3	436	Q.	But it doesn't follow that he was logged onto Pulse	
4			necessarily?	
5		Α.	No, no.	14:53
6	437	Q.	There are a number of other applications in addition to	
7			it being a normal desktop computer?	
8		Α.	Yeah. So like, the name Pulse workstation is a generic	
9			term	
10	438	Q.	Yes?	14:54
11		Α.	for a Garda, yes, a client that's attached to the	
12			Garda IS domain. There's an awful lot of different	
13			systems. Like, there's a service catalogue of many	
14			different applications there now, of which Pulse is	
15			just one of them. And the likes of email, word	14:54
16			processing and there's other systems that are	
17			available, not just Pulse.	
18	439	Q.	Yes. Just in terms of the migration, obviously and	
19			presumably neither Commissioner Callinan or	
20			Commissioner O'Sullivan would have had any actual	14:54
21			personal involvement in migrating data from their	
22			computer, either onto the new system, is that right?	
23		Α.	I don't know if that is kind of technically right. The	
24			way I would see is it is that they would be informed	
25			that they could take their own data and back it up for	14:54
26			themselves onto the new PC. But certainly any	
27			personnel from my IT section that would have called to	
28			their office would have assisted them in any migration	
29			of data that needed to take place	

Т	440	Q.	Yes. But you have no evidence or no reason to suggest	
2			that either Commissioner Callinan in 2014 or	
3			Commissioner O'Sullivan since migrated any data that	
4			isn't in the file share system?	
5		Α.	No.	14:55
6	441	Q.	And just going back to the issue of Pulse computers,	
7			the Tribunal raised a further query with you as to	
8			whether Commissioner Callinan's log-ons in 2013	
9			necessarily meant that he was using Pulse and the	
10			answer was no?	14:55
11		Α.	No.	
12	442	Q.	Thank you.	
13		Α.	Just for completeness there, I did discover that extra	
14			PC that Superintendent Ryan	
15	443	Q.	Superintendent Ryan is talking about.	14:55
16		Α.	was talking about earlier on, so	
17	444	Q.	Yes, thank you.	
18				
19			MS. WARD: No questions, Chairman.	
20			MS. BURNS: No questions, Chairman.	14:55
21				
22			WITNESS WAS EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL McGUINNESS AS	
23			FOLLOWS:	
24	445	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Just two questions sergeant. In	
25			relation to log-ons, when someone logs on to a computer	14:55
26			they can remain logged on for a period of time, isn't	
27			that correct?	
28		Α.	That's correct.	
29	446	Q.	And that's because they don't log off?	

1		Α.	If they don't log off, they can lock their work	
2			station, leave for the day, come back the next day and	
3			unlock the PC and it will not be recorded in the audit	
4			logs.	
5	447	Q.	In relation to former Commissioner Callinan he also	14:56
6			logged on using VDI access	
7		Α.	That's correct.	
8	448	Q.	isn't that right?	
9		Α.	That's correct.	
10	449	Q.	And just for the purposes of explanation, a VDI log-on	14:56
11			is what exactly?	
12		Α.	The VDI	
13			CHAIRMAN: We have it in the courts. It's called	
14			Sirius in the courts, would that be the right thing?	
15		Α.	I would think so. Basically what it is, is it provides	14:56
16			access to a desktop and infrastructure that is sitting	
17			centrally up in Garda Headquarters.	
18			CHAIRMAN: But you're not changing the system that you	
19			are logging into, are you?	
20		Α.	No.	14:56
21			CHAIRMAN: You're only changing your own PC?	
22		Α.	It's a standard generic Pulse log-on, Garda IS log-on.	
23			CHAIRMAN: It is a package.	
24		Α.	Yeah. It's a Garda IS workstation for all terms and	
25			purposes on a dumb terminal. So, it provides people	14:57
26			with the ability to access a Garda IS terminal from a	
27			remote location.	
28			CHAIRMAN: So, you could be sending emails from your	
29			home	

Τ		Α.	You can be, yes.	
2			CHAIRMAN: it looks as if they are being sent from	
3			Garda Headquarters but they're not?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Like, you could say you're looking at one	14:57
6			o'clock in the morning by virtue of your emails	
7		Α.	Yeah.	
8			CHAIRMAN: but it's not proof you were there.	
9		Α.	No, no.	
10			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Thank you, sergeant.	14:57
11			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
12			MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you, sergeant.	
13		Α.	Thank you.	
14				
15			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	14:57
16				
17			MR. McGUINNESS: Could we have Garda Darina O'Brien	
18			please.	
19				
20			GARDA DARINA O'BRIEN, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	14:57
21			EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS AS FOLLOWS:	
22	450	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Garda O'Brien, I think you're attached	
23			to the IT section in Garda Headquarters and you're	
24			attached to the IT Live Operations side as well, isn't	
25			that correct?	14:58
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	451	Q.	And how long have you been working there?	
28		Α.	I transferred into Garda IT in January '99 and have	
29			been working in several departments since then, but	

- have most recently and for the longest period of time
- been working in IT Operations.
- 3 452 Q. Yes. And I think you were tasked in August of last
- 4 year of preparing a report for queries that were raised

14:58

14 · 58

14:59

14:59

- 5 in relation to former Commissioner Callinan and his
- 6 computers --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 453 O. -- isn't that correct?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 454 Q. And I think you performed a number of searches which
- determined, as per your statement of the 9th November,
- 12 the PC names and details --
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 455 Q. -- that Commissioner Callinan had been using?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 456 Q. I think the desktop that he had been using, which was
- 17 replaced in 2014, that's ending in 003, I think you
- 18 searched for that hard drive and it couldn't be
- 19 located?
- 20 A. It couldn't be located, no.
- 21 457 Q. It couldn't be located. And there's no reason to think
- that there is anything unusual about its either removal
- or storage as such?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 458 Q. Okay. In relation to the log-ons, I think you were
- able to confirm the log-on dates that the previous
- 27 witness has referred to also, for Commissioner
- 28 Callinan?
- 29 A. That's correct, yes.

- 1 459 Q. And so, that data was still available notwithstanding
- the inability to locate the previous hard drive?
- 3 A. No, that was --
- 4 460 Q. You were able to check the log-on?
- 5 A. Yeah, that is stored on the audit logs, which is on -- 14:5
- 6 yeah.
- 7 461 Q. That is stored on the audit log.
- 8 CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness, I'm puzzled as to the
- 9 relevance, if any, of the log-ons. How do the log-ons
- help me? Because, one of them seems to have been 2017. 15:00

15:00

15:00

- 11 MR. McGUINNESS: No, I don't think so, Chairman.
- 12 CHAIRMAN: I think somebody said that and I was
- immediately puzzled.
- 14 MR. McGUINNESS: They were both 2013, a date in
- November and a date in August 2013.
- 16 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 17 CHAIRMAN: Okay, I probably misheard.
- 18 462 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: They're the dates in your statement,
- isn't that correct?
- 20 A. That's correct.
- 21 463 Q. August and November 2013, when the Commissioner was
- 22 still in place?
- 23 A. Yes, 2013.
- 24 464 Q. And do you agree with the evidence of the previous
- witness, it doesn't follow that Commissioner Callinan
- was logged on to Pulse as such, on those dates?
- 27 A. Yes, that's correct. It's a single sign log-on.
- 28 465 Q. It's a single sign log-on?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 466 Q. With a variety of applications that could be accessed,
- 2 if desired?
- 3 A. Yes, depending on your --
- 4 467 Q. And there are separate audit logs for actual use of
- 5 Pulse, isn't that correct?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 468 Q. Okay. I think in relation to the laptops that were
- 8 issued to former Commissioner, I think you were able to

15:00

15:01

15:01

15:01

- 9 determine the sequence and identity of the various
- laptops that had been issued to him. And I think the
- last one that he had been issued to him was purchased
- by him following his retirement?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 469 Q. And have you seen the original documentation in
- relation to that? The re-imaging documentation?
- 16 A. The re-imaging.
- 17 470 Q. Yes?
- 18 A. No, I haven't seen documentation --
- 19 471 Q. Yes?
- 20 A. -- but it would have been done as a matter of course,
- 21 that --
- 22 472 Q. We have a statement from Mr. Bannon, are you familiar
- with Mr. Bannon?
- 24 A. Simon Bannon, yes.
- 25 473 Q. All right. His previous laptop was, according to the
- records, re-imaged and re-allocated to Ashbourne
- incident room, is that correct?
- 28 A. That's correct.
- 29 474 Q. I think there are no records relating to the previous

1		laptops which precede the period of interest to the	
2		Tribunal, isn't that correct?	
3	Α.	No.	
4		MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you.	
5			15:01
6		MS. WARD: No, questions Chairman.	
7		CHAIRMAN: Anybody have any questions?	
8		MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: No questions, Chairman.	
9		CHAIRMAN: Again, the same as everybody working in IT,	
10		thank you very much for your help.	15:02
11	Α.	Thank you very much, Chairman.	
12			
13		THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
14			
15		MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, that is the list of	15:02
16		witnesses for today.	
17		CHAIRMAN: Sure. Would you mind going through the	
18		witness list then for tomorrow, Mr. McGuinness, if	
19		possible, please.	
20		MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. We have the two FSNI witnesses,	15:02
21		Ms. Elaine Strachan and Mr. Mark McConnell from the	
22		FSNI.	
23		CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
24		MR. McGUINNESS: Then on Friday we have former Chief	
25		Superintendent Peter Kirwan and Detective	15:02
26		Superintendent Brian Brunton.	
27		CHAIRMAN: Yes. And then next week, have we settled on	
28		a witness list, more or less indicatively?	
29		MR McGULNNESS: Next week we're commencing with	

1	Superintendent David Taylor and then we also hope to	
2	start former Commissioner Callinan on perhaps Thursday,	
3	continuing on to Friday.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Yes. All right. Thank you very much.	
5	Sorry vis-à-vis tomorrow I just might say after having 15:0)3
6	again I just apologise, I am embarrassed by keeping	
7	everyone hanging around this morning, thoughtlessness	
8	on my part is part of it. But tomorrow, I have	
9	something else to do at 9:30 across the courtyard, so	
10	it will be 10:30, but I promise to be here. There it 15:0)3
11	is.	
12		
13	THE TRIBUNAL THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL THURSDAY, 10TH MAY	
14	2018 AT 10: 30AM	
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
29		

	1		1	
	88:1	14:21, 20:19, 73:11,	99:15, 101:26,	51:10, 54:28, 58:9,
	1997 [1] - 88:5	91:16, 96:12, 99:15,	115:26, 116:4	64:8, 65:16, 66:25,
	1999 [1] - 112:13	111:5, 115:26, 122:10		79:19, 81:1, 84:17,
'14 [1] - 100:23	19th [1] - 6:24	2018 [3] - 1:18, 6:2,	7	85:1, 85:22, 85:28,
'99 [1] - 120:28	1:00 [3] - 19:27, 20:3	125:14		114:15
'did [1] - 53:20	1st [2] - 92:2, 116:8	21 [1] - 2:25		abuse [1] - 73:23
'my [2] - 107:27,	150 [2] - 92.2, 110.6		7 [7] - 2:12, 2:29,	accept [1] - 48:8
108:2		21st [2] - 10:1, 20:18	92:15, 97:16, 100:23,	access [27] - 23:6,
'oh [1] - 39:7	2	2339 [1] - 73:27	100:24, 114:8	
'three [1] - 11:19		2388 [1] - 68:21	71 [1] - 1:18	31:12, 42:18, 42:20,
'was [1] - 37:26	2 [5] - 2:25, 3:6, 3:10,	2391 [1] - 24:9	73 [1] - 4:23	86:14, 86:27, 90:26,
	3:31, 3:32	2395 [1] - 48:27	760 [1] - 69:5	91:17, 93:7, 93:18,
'we [3] - 10:19,	20 [3] - 32:24, 39:10,	23rd [3] - 77:28,	7:00 [7] - 19:21,	93:22, 93:29, 94:7,
10:20, 35:20	62:25	102:10, 115:29	19:23, 19:27, 20:3,	94:14, 94:18, 103:6,
	2000 [4] - 73:6,	24 [1] - 4:14	20:4, 20:5, 20:12	103:11, 103:15,
0		25th [1] - 68:19	7:00am [1] - 27:10	103:19, 103:23,
	89:23, 89:25, 89:26	26th [1] - 115:28	7.00aiii[i] - 27.10	105:28, 106:9, 108:5,
003 [1] - 121:17	2001 [3] - 101:16,	27th [1] - 36:18		108:7, 119:6, 119:16,
	101:23, 101:25	2837 [1] - 6:26	8	119:26
004 [1] - 110:16	2004 [2] - 24:19,	2865 [1] - 73:12		accessed [4] -
	24:22	2866 [1] - 68:13	8 [2] - 2:20, 3:20	100:14, 106:15, 123:1
1	2006 [3] - 72:1,	2869 [1] - 9:27	81 [1] - 4:24	accessing [1] -
	99:14, 101:27	2872 [1] - 24:4	86 [1] - 4:27	68:28
1 [2] - 3:26, 14:18	2007 [2] - 6:13,	28th [1] - 24:7	87 [1] - 4:30	accompanying [1] -
10 [2] - 101:1, 101:3	101:28	29th [1] - 102:12	01 [1] - 4.30	46:10
10 [2] - 101:1, 101:3	2008 [2] - 6:18, 68:10	29(11[1] - 102.12		according [2] -
	2009 [4] - 24:26,	2	- 9	38:20, 123:25
107 [1] - 4:31	99:16, 102:1, 102:10	3		account [8] - 58:2,
10:00 [1] - 19:23	2010 [4] - 99:16,		9 [4] - 4:5, 4:8, 24:11,	59:19, 59:21, 98:4,
10:30 [1] - 125:10	99:17, 104:27	30th [2] - 99:15,	68:21	104:21, 105:2, 105:4,
10:30AM [1] - 125:14	2011 [3] - 102:12,	114:24	9:00 [3] - 19:24, 20:4	105:22
10TH [1] - 125:13	112:23, 112:24	31st [3] - 92:2, 92:5,		accounted [1] -
110 [1] - 4:32	2012 [8] - 25:8,	116:9	9:30 [1] - 125:9	99:19
112 [1] - 5:2	69:26, 92:2, 92:4,	32 [1] - 2:12	9th [2] - 9:24, 121:11	
116 [1] - 14:17	94:25, 97:8, 102:1,		9TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1	accounts [2] -
118 [1] - 5:3	116:8	37 [1] - 4:15	_	105:11, 106:1
11:00 [7] - 19:26,	2012-2014 [1] -	371 [1] - 69:7	Α	Accounts [2] - 71:7,
19:28, 20:3, 20:5,		3892 [1] - 36:6		78:29
20:11, 27:10, 41:3	103:5	39 [1] - 4:16	abbroviations	accurate [3] - 74:2,
11th [2] - 73:11,	2013 [18] - 6:21, 8:8,	3:00 [3] - 20:4, 20:11,	abbreviations [1] -	75:15, 75:21
100:23	8:21, 10:1, 20:18,	20:12	107:11	acronym [1] - 90:29
12 [1] - 14:23	25:7, 36:18, 71:28,		abide [1] - 54:20	Act [1] - 40:1
12 [i] - 14.23 12-hour [i] - 18:7	76:16, 78:12, 78:15,	4	ability [3] - 44:4,	ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9
	115:29, 118:8,		95:16, 119:26	act [1] - 45:24
120 [1] - 5:6	122:14, 122:15,	1011	able [30] - 10:13,	acted [1] - 39:21
127 [3] - 14:22,	122:21, 122:23	4314 [1] - 87:7	32:10, 33:5, 41:7,	acting [2] - 57:9,
14:24, 15:4	2014 [28] - 1:4,	470 [1] - 69:6	43:17, 68:23, 92:9,	75:1
12th [2] - 13:16,	13:20, 14:6, 17:4,		93:9, 93:23, 95:16,	action [1] - 1:28
20:19	17:16, 33:23, 34:2,	5	95:17, 95:22, 96:22,	activity [1] - 8:20
13th [2] - 91:15,	44:11, 49:23, 71:2,		97:12, 97:13, 98:23,	ACTIVITY[1] - 3:29
114:26	71:28, 76:16, 77:28,	F-00 40:04 00 0	100:28, 101:2,	actual [4] - 62:2,
14 [1] - 4:9	78:14, 78:15, 92:2,	5:00 [3] - 19:24, 20:3,	103:15, 104:8, 105:6,	86:29, 117:20, 123:4
15th [1] - 101:24	92:5, 92:8, 92:10,	20:4	106:8, 108:7, 113:19,	
16 [2] - 1:6, 87:8	94:25, 97:8, 107:18,	5th [1] - 14:21	113:25, 115:8,	acutely [1] - 96:24
16th [1] - 102:1	107:20, 114:20,		115:26, 121:26,	add [3] - 36:24,
17 [4] - 1:10, 4:10,	114:26, 116:9, 118:2,	6	122:4, 123:8	55:25, 97:24
101:18	121:17		above-named [1] -	addition [1] - 117:6
18 [2] - 2:28, 4:11	2015 [3] - 24:8,	C 4.4	1:27	additional [1] - 116:3
1921 [1] - 1:10	68:19, 88:9	6 [1] - 4:4	abrupt [1] - 43:24	address [1] - 47:26
1984 [1] - 24:15	2016 [1] - 99:15	6/11/2012 [1] - 102:9	absolutely [19] -	adduced [2] - 60:25,
1994 [5] - 24:16,		63 [1] - 4:17	26:29, 31:20, 35:8,	60:29
	2017 [14] - 1:6, 1:10,	68 [1] - 4:20		ADJOURNED [2] -
24:17, 24:18, 87:26,	6:24, 9:24, 13:18,	6th [5] - 68:13,	35:14, 39:3, 51:7,	67:20, 125:13
	i	1	i	i .

administration [1] -112:15 administrative [1] -6:13 adults [1] - 41:14 advanced [2] -56:23, 57:25 advances [1] -103:14 advised [2] - 35:9, 35:24 **AFTER** [1] - 68:1 afternoon [2] -49:10, 67:16 afterwards [1] -38:15 ago [1] - 37:28 agree [1] - 122:24 air [2] - 86:24, 86:25 **ALAN**[4] - 4:7, 4:26, 9:21, 86:10 Alan [4] - 9:18, 27:9, 41:2, 86:6 alert [2] - 44:24 **ALISON**[2] - 2:17, 2:27 allegation [11] -13:22, 15:20, 54:4. 65:27, 71:28, 73:19, 78:5, 80:7, 84:26, 87:20 allegations [2] -37:17, 38:23 alleged [2] - 60:14, 83:25 allegedly [1] - 66:1 alleges [1] - 84:23 alleging [2] - 37:28, allocate [1] - 99:9 allocated [6] - 102:2, 102:8, 103:9, 103:13, 123:26 allocation [3] -102:5, 102:8, 103:13 allow [1] - 105:27 almost [4] - 26:13, 45:25, 90:29, 111:10 alone [1] - 59:28 amateur [1] - 50:6 amazed [1] - 101:10 ambit [1] - 60:15 amount [1] - 105:24 analyse [2] - 30:10, 30.16 analysis [2] - 59:19, 59:26 AND [4] - 1:4, 1:5, 1:9, 3:2 Andrew [13] - 16:14,

16:20, 17:24, 19:2, 45:10, 45:29, 58:27, 64:24, 64:29, 65:14, 75:3, 79:12, 84:25 anecdotally [1] -11:3 answer [17] - 6:25, 10:19, 14:10, 14:24, 15:4, 15:24, 15:26, 16:11, 17:28, 21:10, 37:6, 52:14, 55:1, 62:27, 86:13, 106:20, 118.10 answered [1] - 29:24 answering [3] -10:11, 10:12, 29:27 **Anthony**[1] - 68:3 **ANTHONY** [2] - 4:19, 68:5 anticipating [1] -56:1 anyhow [2] - 12:13, 18:20 anyway [9] - 20:25, 21:5, 42:18, 44:29, 47:24, 47:27, 49:7, 49:11, 97:2 apart [2] - 45:28, 51:23 apologies [4] - 6:4, 86:18, 87:3, 87:29 apologise [2] -79:14, 125:6 appear [8] - 9:3, 12:7, 12:12, 37:1, 45:16, 73:28, 84:13, 104:3 appearance [2] -71:6, 78:28 APPEARANCES[1] -2:1 appeared [5] - 12:16, 12:26, 30:13, 32:21, 52.11 appellation [1] - 18:3 application [4] -57:27, 58:15, 90:12 applications [10] -88:27, 90:2, 90:3, 90:6, 90:15, 90:16, 90:17, 117:6, 117:14, 123:1 **apply** [1] - 55:10 appointment [1] -

110:8

41:10

81:28

appreciate [1] -

approach [2] - 27:23,

approached [1] -

49:1 appropriate [6] -59:26, 74:13, 84:16, 93:9, 94:1, 108:4 approve [2] - 28:20, 79.26 approved [2] - 7:26, 28:21 April [1] - 34:2 archive [2] - 104:8, 106:10 archived [2] - 105:3, 108:22 archiving [6] -104:24, 104:26, 104:29, 105:5, 105:8, area [5] - 19:6, 19:14, 23:14, 23:15, 88:4 arguably [1] - 57:6 argument [1] - 57:25 arise [3] - 59:13, 59:16. 63:9 arises [1] - 56:21 arising [3] - 37:17, 42:14, 91:8 army [1] - 66:27 arose [1] - 80:8 aroused [1] - 70:12 **ARRAN**[1] - 2:12 arrangements [1] -102:14 arrested' [1] - 11:20 arrests [2] - 11:17, 11:19 **arrive** [1] - 9:29 arrived [6] - 10:4, 25:7, 26:4, 32:14, 69:26, 74:28 article [2] - 30:12, 37:14 articles [6] - 30:7, 30:19, 31:5, 33:29, 34:5, 37:14 **AS**[5] - 6:1, 68:1, 112:2, 118:22, 120:21 Ashbourne [2] -102:8, 123:26 aside [1] - 43:24 aspect [3] - 17:3, 82:6, 83:8 assault [5] - 13:22, 37:24, 37:28, 39:5, assessed [1] - 59:28 asset [4] - 96:1, 99:6, 109:25, 115:14 assets [2] - 113:27,

assigned [11] -21:14, 87:14, 98:16, 98:21, 98:22, 98:28, 99:22, 104:21, 106:13, 110:17, 115:15 assignment [1] -87:25 assist [4] - 15:27, 33:5, 44:3, 44:21 assistance [3] -33:11, 35:1, 106:13 assistant [3] - 21:12, 21:14. 86:28 assisted [3] - 68:28, 106:17, 117:28 ASSOCIATED[1] -3:12 associated [1] -102:27 assume [1] - 94:19 assure [1] - 62:27 AT[1] - 125:14 atmosphere [5] -26:21, 26:25, 28:28, 29.9 42.29 attached [10] -31:21, 49:1, 49:17, 68:9, 73:5, 110:23, 112:21, 117:11, 120:22, 120:24 attaching [2] - 51:6, 51:29 attempting [1] -58:19 attendance [1] -110:29 attention [4] - 7:29, 17:23, 47:18, 70:23 attestment [1] - 88:2 attic [3] - 22:4, 22:6, attitude [1] - 78:2 audit [7] - 97:26, 113:14, 114:2, 119:3,

122:5, 122:7, 123:4

August [9] - 6:20,

121:3, 122:15, 122:21

AUGUSTUS[1] -

authenticate [1] -

available [15] -

89:1, 89:28, 90:6,

103:21, 109:7,

25:20, 25:25, 48:8,

90:13, 93:20, 103:1,

automatic [1] - 64:19

8:8, 8:21, 44:11,

102:12, 115:29,

2:28

113:17

34:7, 34:16, 34:18, 34:22, 35:2, 35:4, 42:27, 45:11, 47:9, 47:28, 58:20, 58:27, 58:28, 59:12, 62:19, 63:15, 66:7, 66:13, 66:29, 67:3, 70:23, 71:28, 72:15, 73:15, 73:24, 73:25, 74:19, 78:7, 78:8, 81:16, 89:25, 95:25, 96:24, 102:29, 103:1, 103:3 awful [1] - 117:12 В backed [5] - 46:12, 47:21, 48:5, 96:16, 105:14 background [6] -13:21, 53:29, 56:10, 56:11, 56:13, 58:23 backing [1] - 105:14 bad [3] - 27:1, 29:2, 60:13 badly [2] - 28:27, 100:2 bandwidth [3] - 93:9, 94.1 108.5 bannon [3] - 123:22, 123:23, 123:24 bar [1] - 104:7 barristers' [1] - 6:5 base [1] - 113:26 based [1] - 90:6 basic [1] - 93:25 basis [9] - 27:13, 27:19, 29:13, 33:2, 36:4, 48:16, 53:24, 59:28. 65:12 bathrooms [1] -41.24 became [6] - 13:26, 13:27, 26:16, 32:15, 41:12 become [4] - 33:25,

75:25, 92:13, 103:25

BEEN [9] - 6:10,

becomes [1] - 27:11

9:21, 24:1, 68:5, 73:1,

109:10, 109:12,

aware [55] - 8:5,

12:27, 13:4, 13:27,

21:13, 22:14, 31:25,

31:26, 32:29, 33:23.

33:25, 33:28, 34:4,

13:29, 14:8, 15:9, 16:8, 16:15, 17:6,

117:17, 122:1

86:10, 87:10, 112:1, 120:20 **behalf** [1] - 9:3 behaved [1] - 54:27 belongings [2] -43:14, 43:24 benefit [4] - 9:24, 9:27, 24:5, 85:15 best [1] - 44:3 better [3] - 13:28, 39:26. 40:10 between [15] - 14:24, 26:24, 26:26, 43:1, 53:18, 60:4, 64:24, 65:8, 65:22, 79:8, 79:9, 83:4, 92:4, 95:20, 114:3 beyond [3] - 19:13, 77:20, 80:2 big [3] - 18:28, 77:20, 90:2 biggest [2] - 43:9, 93:3 **bit** [9] - 15:14, 21:17, 26:16, 30:5, 46:21, 55:8, 64:27, 77:2, 77:26 bits [1] - 62:20 bizarre [1] - 53:1 **BL** [9] - 2:7, 2:10. 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:23, 2:27, 2:31, 3:3 blacken [1] - 58:19 blanket [1] - 44:25 **bleed** [1] - 75:14 bleeding [1] - 75:24 block [8] - 18:26, 22:11, 23:4, 23:5, 51:14, 86:22, 86:26, 106:6 Bloggs [1] - 37:27 blue [3] - 18:28, 23:10, 86:21 **book** [1] - 25:20 boss [2] - 7:14, 9:8 **bought** [1] - 102:13 bound [3] - 54:12, 54:13. 54:14 BOW [1] - 2:28 Brady [1] - 24:8 branch [1] - 20:20 break [2] - 66:23, 67:17 breaking~[2] - 36:1,breeze [1] - 51:14 BREFFNI [1] - 2:10 Brenda [2] - 19:11, 21:17

Brian [2] - 68:20,

124:26 brief [7] - 13:3, 15:1, 15:8, 16:21, 68:14, 73:10, 81:19 briefing [3] - 45:14, 75:12, 75:18 briefings [1] - 72:12 briefly [1] - 53:6 bringing [1] - 102:24 broad [1] - 116:6 broadcasting[1] -62:19 broadly [2] - 42:26, 44:19 BRODERICK [1] -3.24 broke [1] - 81:2 broken [1] - 54:15 brought [2] - 47:18, 82:14 Browne [2] - 58:6, 58:15 Brunton [2] - 111:2, 124:26 BSc [1] - 112:11 bugs [1] - 66:28 building [2] - 18:26, 22:6 bulletin [1] - 36:3 Burns [1] - 9:2 BURNS [20] - 2:22, 4:5, 9:1, 9:2, 14:13, 39:14, 59:10, 60:17, 61:15, 61:21, 62:8, 62:11, 62:14, 62:21, 62:26, 63:7, 72:19, 81:22, 106:23, 118:20 burns [4] - 54:23, 58:13, 62:6, 63:19 business [2] - 57:21, 83.6 busy [4] - 45:3, 71:17, 72:13, 77:19 buy [1] - 102:15 buzz [1] - 82:23 BY [50] - 1:5, 1:8, 2:11, 2:17, 2:23, 2:28, 2:32, 3:4, 3:14, 4:4,

4:5, 4:8, 4:9, 4:10,

5:2, 5:3, 5:6, 6:11,

18:5, 24:2, 37:9,

39:17, 63:29, 68:6,

73:2, 81:24, 86:11,

87:11, 107:1, 110:13,

112:2, 118:22, 120:21

bypassed [1] - 65:15

4:11, 4:14, 4:15, 4:16,

4:17, 4:20, 4:23, 4:24,

4:27, 4:30, 4:31, 4:32,

9:1, 9:22, 14:15, 17:1,

C Callinan [35] - 15:6, 15:10, 15:29, 16:9, 32:20, 32:21, 58:25, 58:26, 73:21, 78:29, 79:5, 84:22, 94:14, 100:12, 100:18, 101:16, 101:21, 102:13, 104:14, 104:17, 105:10, 113:20, 115:8, 115:15, 115:20, 116:10, 116:22, 117:19, 118:2, 119:5, 121:5, 121:14, 121:28, 122:25, 125:2 Callinan's [6] -91:20, 104:3, 114:20, 115:27, 116:26, 118:8 camera [3] - 82:10, 82:16, 82:17 campaign [15] - 8:3, 8:5, 13:2, 35:5, 35:7, 73:21, 81:8, 81:17, 84:21, 84:29, 85:8, 85:9, 85:10, 85:18 cannot [2] - 53:28, 101:7 capable [2] - 101:1, 101:5 captured [1] - 104:29 car [2] - 18:24, 22:24 card [11] - 41:21, 41:25, 48:29, 49:11, 49:26, 49:28, 50:2, 50:21, 51:17, 51:18, 61:6 care [1] - 59:24 career [1] - 87:24 careful [5] - 59:19, 59:24, 61:3, 77:5, 80:17 carry [2] - 82:7, 84:22 CARTHAGE[1] case [21] - 10:15, 10:26, 11:14, 25:12, 27:17, 41:12, 43:23, 44:6, 56:1, 56:22, 60:16, 65:5, 65:13, 73:23, 75:23, 76:20, 78:4, 80:3, 98:7, 103:4, 108:27 cases [5] - 10:25, 10:28, 28:2, 28:6,

117:13 caused [2] - 52:16, 52:22 cellotaped [1] -49:15 central [8] - 53:14, 93:7, 93:20, 94:2, 94:4, 94:15, 103:27, 108:6 centrally [5] - 93:10, 94:2, 103:29, 109:11, 119:17 centrally-managed [1] - 93:10 Centre [2] - 87:15, centre [11] - 18:26, 22:11, 86:22, 86:26, 88:7, 95:24, 101:26, 101:28, 101:29, 102:11 centres [1] - 89:7 **CERTAIN** [1] - 1:4 certain [17] - 26:26, 32:2, 42:14, 44:20, 47:23, 48:2, 52:24, 52:26, 59:4, 68:25, 77:25, 78:16, 91:8, 95:27, 106:2, 106:6 certainly [19] - 14:5, 27:2, 28:17, 33:27, 34:21, 37:4, 38:5, 39:8, 51:17, 51:20, 56:9, 57:16, 61:2, 61:23, 63:13, 71:2, 108:24, 111:13, 117:26 certify [1] - 1:25 chair [2] - 43:5, 64:3 Chair [57] - 13:8, 13:11, 13:26, 16:23, 18:19, 24:20, 24:23, 25:2, 25:18, 25:28, 26:2, 26:6, 26:15, 28:2, 29:14, 29:21, 31:3, 31:7, 31:13, 33:8, 33:24, 34:27, 35:4, 35:8, 35:11, 36:28, 37:5, 39:23, 42:5, 42:13, 42:19, 42:28, 43:8, 44:15, 44:18, 44:25, 46:24, 46:28, 47:22, 48:14, 50:22, 50:29, 52:3, 52:15, 52:18, 52:23, 66:7, 66:25, 67:3, 68:25, 72:21, 73:18, 74:2, 81:16, 86:18, 88:19

catalogue [2] - 90:2,

chairman [1] - 61:15 Chairman [41] - 9:14, 14:12, 14:13, 39:14, 46:17, 52:6, 57:24, 59.10 60.28 62.12 62:28, 62:29, 63:7, 72:19, 72:20, 79:23, 81:22, 85:1, 85:11, 85:19, 86:14, 90:28, 95:13, 96:13, 97:25, 100:20, 106:23, 107:6, 108:29, 109:8, 110:29, 111:12, 111:16, 111:25, 118:19, 118:20, 122:11, 124:6, 124:8, 124:11, 124:15 CHAIRMAN[121] -4:11, 4:17, 6:4, 17:22, 17:27, 18:1, 18:5, 18:6, 18:22, 18:24, 20:7, 20:10, 20:13, 20:15, 20:20, 20:22, 20:25, 20:28, 21:6, 21:8. 21:16. 21:20. 21:28, 22:5, 22:8, 22:16, 22:22, 22:24, 22:27, 23:2, 23:4, 23:6, 23:16, 23:19, 39:15, 46:15, 48:4, 48:10, 48:12, 48:18, 48:21, 48:24, 50:5, 51:11, 52:4, 52:7, 53:6, 55:23, 56:19, 57:29, 60:2, 61:9, 61:16, 62:5, 62:9, 62:13, 62:15, 62:23, 63:3. 63:17. 63:29. 64:1, 64:4, 64:7, 64:9, 64:18, 64:21, 64:23, 65:14, 65:21, 66:16, 66:20, 66:26, 67:1, 67:4, 67:7, 67:11, 67:17, 69:17, 69:20, 69:23, 85:6, 85:12, 85:20, 85:23, 85:25, 86:2, 86:19, 86:24, 87:1, 87:4, 87:17, 96:7, 98:2, 98:5, 101:8, 106:24, 108:21, 110:11, 110:26, 111:7, 111:13, 111:19, 119:13, 119:18, 119:21, 119:23, 119:28, 120:2, 120:5, 120:8, 120:11, 122:8, 122:12, 122:17, 124:7, 124:9, 124:17, 124:23, 124:27, 125:4 Chairman's [1] -

CASTLE[1] - 1:17

85:15 challenge [8] -54:25, 55:16, 55:18, 55:20, 56:15, 61:4, 93:13 61:24, 61:27 challenged [3] -55:15, 57:28, 58:3 challenging [1] -62:3 CHAMBERS [1] -2:24 change [1] - 79:14 82:2, 83:24 changed [2] - 82:11, 117:11 **changes** [4] - 26:4, 64:1, 64:11 changing [2] -119:18, 119:21 **character** [1] - 57:3 charge [6] - 20:23, 38:12, 49:3, 83:19, 93:1, 112:18 charged [2] - 11:20, 11:24 34:14 CHARLETON [2] -1.12 2.2 check [3] - 113:14, 113:25, 122:4 checked [1] - 104:8 **checks** [1] - 114:3 31:27, 34:19 Chief [2] - 83:23, 111:2 **CHIEF** [1] - 2:18 chief [1] - 124:24 child [1] - 44:24 41.17 chitchat [1] - 75:9 choose [1] - 108:1 Chrissie [3] - 74:5, 74:9, 74:18 Ciaran [1] - 21:24 circumstances [1] -26:28 66:23 civilian [11] - 19:8, 19:22, 19:24, 19:26, 21:25, 32:15, 35:16, 37:21, 40:6, 74:14 71:18, 72:10 civilians [2] - 18:15, 20.4 - 14:18 **claims** [1] - 8:4 clarification [2] -63:18, 70:15 124:29 clarified [1] - 116:13 clarifies [1] - 63:17 clarify [4] - 15:6, 27:25, 39:20 15:28, 66:10, 94:27 clean [1] - 106:4 - 2.14 clear [3] - 54:28, Commissioner [86] -76:28, 108:17 15:6, 15:7, 15:10, cleared [3] - 38:11, 15:28, 16:9, 22:8, 39:5, 45:29

clearing [1] - 65:28 22:11, 32:19, 32:20, clearly [5] - 56:24, 32:26, 33:1, 54:19, 60:24, 61:28, 85:15, 57:19, 58:25, 58:26, 64:10, 64:13, 73:20, Clerkin [21] - 24:7, 78:28, 79:5, 80:28, 80:29, 84:22, 84:24, 24:18, 26:12, 29:1, 30:2, 33:5, 44:10, 91:11, 91:20, 94:13, 94:14, 94:23, 97:6, 50:15, 52:1, 52:17, 97:10, 97:13, 98:3, 56:9, 59:13, 59:23, 60:24, 61:22, 61:25, 98:12, 98:28, 99:14, 61:28, 68:19, 73:26, 99:23, 100:12, 100:18, 101:15, 101:21, 102:13, **client** [6] - 58:19, 104:2, 104:14, 59:27, 103:23, 105:7, 104:17, 105:9, 105:10, 109:19, client's [1] - 59:17 110:3, 110:4, 110:5, clippings [4] - 7:4, 110:17, 110:23, 30:9, 76:2, 76:9 112:26, 112:27, close [7] - 32:19, 113:2, 113:20, 32:22, 49:21, 61:13, 113:21, 114:20, 74:23, 85:23, 111:8 114:23, 115:8, closing [1] - 83:16 115:15, 115:16, cloud [1] - 105:26 115:19, 115:27, club [2] - 22:19, 116:8. 116:10. 116:13, 116:18, Code [1] - 26:1 116:21, 116:26, coffee [1] - 35:19 117:19, 117:20, coherent [1] - 46:18 118:2, 118:3, 118:8, coin [1] - 40:26 119:5, 121:5, 121:14, colleague [3] - 27:9, 121:27, 122:21, 122:25, 123:8, 125:2 colleagues [6] commissioner's [1] -34:21, 39:28, 40:19, 86:28 41:16, 48:2, 85:17 Commissioner's [18] colleagues' [1] -- 22:15, 22:28, 23:8, 23:15, 24:24, 24:26, college [1] - 88:13 32:28, 34:11, 34:12, collisions [1] - 31:23 34:15, 60:25, 63:13, Colm [1] - 36:9 86:15, 86:27, 92:4, colourful [1] - 51:25 98:13, 98:14, 114:14 comfortable [1] commissioners [3] -64:14, 97:6, 99:10 coming [9] - 7:24, commit [1] - 49:5 11:12, 19:29, 38:7, Committee [2] -56:9, 62:21, 66:9, 71:7, 78:29 commonly [1] comings [1] - 25:3 19:10 commencement [1] communicated [1] commencing [1] communication [3] -37:4, 49:21, 65:8 comment [9] - 8:19, communications 10:19, 10:20, 10:27, [12] - 15:21, 16:20, 11:1, 11:9, 11:14, 45:10, 47:19, 64:29, 65:6, 65:9, 79:11, COMMISSIONER [1]

3:29 complaints [3] -70:27, 70:29, 96:15 complemented [1] -65:3 completed [3] -88:17, 97:17, 112:16 completely [4] -17:29, 46:12, 51:26, 59:25 completeness [2] -97:25, 118:13 completion [1] - 96:5 complimentary [1] -77:15 comprehensive [3] -93:12, 95:10, 108:14 compromise [1] -32:1 compromised [3] -45:8. 45:12. 47:17 compromising [1] -31:26 computer [36] - 36:7, 42:12, 48:10, 68:22, 87:19 89:13 89:29 90:19, 90:20, 90:23, 90:24, 91:1, 92:24, 93:26, 93:27, 94:3, 96:17, 98:8, 98:15, 98:17, 98:20, 101:4, 106:12, 107:6, 107:9, 108:11, 108:23, 110:15, 110:16, 110:23, 115:28, 116:27, 117:7, 117:22, 118:25 computers [34] -19:5, 89:12, 89:14, 89:15, 90:25, 91:12, 92:4, 92:12, 92:20, 92:29, 93:17, 94:24, 95:4, 95:7, 97:4, 97:7, 97:20, 98:23, 100:13, 100:29, 103:28, 107:16, 107:17. 107:20, 107:23, 109:4, 109:9, 112:27, 116:7, 116:29, 118:6, 121:6 computing [1] -112:12 concept [1] - 48:5 concern [5] - 52:16, 52:22, 63:8, 74:17, 77:22 84:25, 93:12, 95:11, concerned [8] -108:14 12:25, 15:9, 17:2,

concerning [6] -60:12 60:13 66:23 40.14 113:26 38:12, 65:26 38:22 - 4:19, 68:5 103:22 84:24 51:6 3:14, 3:30 96:11 75:17 39.22

42:24, 46:3, 52:11, 71:1, 76:15, 78:24 concerns [7] - 42:14, 45:22, 46:20, 70:24, 74:28, 75:4, 75:6 concise [1] - 66:11 conclusion [1] conduct [2] - 40:21, conducted [1] - 9:4 confidence [1] confidential [1] configuration [1] confined [1] - 92:16 confines [1] - 53:11 confirm [13] - 16:13, 37:16, 37:18, 37:22, 37:25, 38:1, 94:18, 100:17, 101:7, 104:5, 105:9, 113:9, 121:26 confirmation [2] confirmed [1] conflict [1] - 65:21 **CONLON** [1] - 2:23 CONNAUGHTON [2] Connaughton [3] -68:3, 68:8, 69:24 connection [3] -37:21, 103:18, 103:26 connections [1] connivance[1] connotation [1] -**CONOR** [3] - 2:15, **conscious** [1] - 44:1 consider [1] - 57:16 considerably [1] considered [1] considering [1] constant [1] - 62:11 contact [11] - 11:4, 14:29, 27:21, 32:25, 52:13, 52:27, 62:11, 62:14, 62:28, 74:5, 74:18

contacted [4] -

community [1] - 88:3

COMPANY [2] - 2:11,

21:13, 45:15, 74:4,

76:9, 112:28

37:15, 38:21, 44:12, 82:28, 86:7, 86:16, 57:7, 58:6, 59:3, 81:4 D 49:24 86:18, 87:16, 89:4, 61:22, 79:4, 79:6, dealt [4] - 28:6, 37:2, contacting [3] -90:9, 90:20, 90:23, 123:20 37:29, 58:10 daily [5] - 28:23, 52:24, 79:18, 79:20 90:28, 91:2, 91:6, **DEBBIE** [1] - 3:13 **court** [4] - 10:27, 32:24, 32:25, 36:4, **Debbie** [5] - 17:5, contacts [1] - 75:6 91:7, 91:9, 91:10, 40:10, 60:15, 61:10 65:12 91:12, 91:13, 91:20, contained [2] -**COURT** [2] - 1:13, 33:13, 33:16, 71:18, **DALY**[1] - 3:24 61:25, 92:29 91:21, 91:23, 91:24, 79:20 damaged [3] - 53:20, 91:27, 92:5, 92:6, content [2] - 30:12, courts [2] - 119:13, December [3] -92:9, 92:25, 92:26, 100:2, 104:18 30:20 119.14 13:16, 20:19, 73:6 93:28, 93:29, 96:18, Damien [3] - 23:23, context [4] - 51:28, decided [2] - 45:7, Courts [1] - 51:20 56:12, 71:15, 87:19 97:22, 97:23, 98:8, courtyard [2] -70:9. 70:16 47.15 **DAMIEN** [2] - 4:13, 98:19, 98:29, 99:1, continuing [1] -22:24, 125:9 deciding [1] - 54:7 99:4, 99:17, 99:18, 125:3 cover [2] - 28:11, **DECLAN**[2] - 5:1, 99:19, 99:20, 99:23, danger [1] - 82:21 contrast [1] - 82:29 95.2 112:1 99:24, 99:28, 100:1, dangerous [1] control [3] - 53:24, coverage [1] - 44:26 decoration [2] -100:5, 100:8, 100:9, 75:12 covered [3] - 25:29, 83.8 83.21 26.6 26.8 100:10, 100:11, **DANIEL**[1] - 3:23 controller [1] -50:15, 72:4 decoration-wise [1] 102:2, 102:3, 102:15, **DARINA**[2] - 5:5, create [2] - 77:26, 113:17 102:16, 104:4, 120:20 controlling [1] - 83:7 108:23 decorum [1] - 54:21 104:23, 105:12, Darina [1] - 120:17 $\pmb{\text{created}}\ [2]\ -\ 26:21,$ controversy [1] dedicated [1] - 41:11 106:15, 106:16, DARRYL[1] - 3:24 79:3 42:29 deemed [1] - 11:15 106:19, 107:10, default [1] - 102:25 convention[1] credibility [5] - 55:3, data [24] - 89:7, 90:9, 107:19, 108:28, 92:28, 93:4, 93:15, 59:27, 60:4, 60:5, 107:15 defined [1] - 93:14 109:2, 109:6, 109:15, 95:15, 96:2, 96:5, conversation [4] -60:20 definitely [5] - 17:28, 109:16. 109:19. 96:15, 97:3, 99:8, $\boldsymbol{\text{credible}}\, [\text{1}] - 54\text{:}8$ 35:22, 40:21, 49:9, 71:27, 79:23, 97:2, 109:20, 110:2, 110:6, 65:25 102:27, 107:21, credit [12] - 53:15, 98:11 110:7, 110:18, 107:22, 107:24, conversations [4] -55:24, 56:2, 56:5, degree [3] - 88:17, 110:24, 110:27, 108:9, 108:16, 27:28, 40:16, 72:15, 56:25, 57:11, 59:17, 109:13, 112:14 111:3, 111:4, 111:6, 108:22, 113:26, 85:21 59:18, 60:4, 60:10, **Deirdre** [2] - 6:8, 111:12, 112:7, 117:21, 117:25, 60:18, 60:22 conveyed [1] - 45:22 112:20, 113:1, 113:4, 117:29, 118:3, 122:1 crept [1] - 26:26 cooperation [1] -DEIRDRE~[2]-4:3,113:6, 113:8, 113:12, database [1] - 90:11 111:14 crime [4] - 52:27, 113:24, 114:5, 114:7, date [4] - 50:25, 53:1, 75:18, 75:27 cooperative [1] delayed [1] - 48:6 114:21, 114:22, 101:5, 122:14, 122:15 criminal [2] - 37:23, 43:27 delegates [1] - 43:21 114:25, 114:27, dated [1] - 24:7 copied [1] - 104:9 112:16 delete [4] - 105:5, 115:24, 116:2, 117:2, dates [6] - 91:29, critical [8] - 30:24, **copy** [2] - 96:21, 105:6, 106:1, 108:26 118:27, 118:28, 115:27, 115:28, 31:6, 31:12, 41:27, 96:23 **deleted** [1] - 105:8 119:7, 119:9, 120:25, 121:26, 122:18, 41:29, 42:7, 42:15, core [1] - 84:18 deletes [1] - 105:2 121:8, 121:9, 121:15, 122:26 44:13 CORMAC [1] - 3:24 **Dell** [1] - 116:1 121:29, 122:16, Dave [1] - 74:28 CROSS [4] - 4:5, corporate [2] dementia [1] - 49:4 122:19, 122:20, **DAVID**[1] - 3:30 4:15, 9:1, 37:9 103:12, 103:16 demonstrate [2] -122:27, 123:5, 123:6, David [7] - 14:19, cross [5] - 53:15, correct [171] - 6:16, 36:25, 57:8 123:13, 123:27, 54:17, 65:22, 65:24, 6:19, 6:22, 7:21, 7:25, 56:2, 57:18, 60:18, denied [2] - 17:29, 123:28, 124:2 76:29, 82:3, 125:1 8:11, 9:26, 11:27, 60:21 54.5 correctly [1] - 96:26 **DAY**[1] - 1:18 cross-examination 12:1, 12:2, 24:10, denigrating [1] corridor [3] - 19:14, day-to-day [1] -[5] - 53:15, 56:2, 24:20, 24:23, 24:25, 53:26 23:7, 23:13 83.20 57:18. 60:18. 60:21 24:27, 24:29, 25:18. deny [2] - 38:1, 54:3 corridors [1] - 22:1 **CROSS-EXAMINED** days [2] - 19:29, 25:24, 26:2, 26:15, departments [2] corroboration [1] -27:10 27:4, 29:14, 29:16, [4] - 4:5, 4:15, 9:1, 30:11, 120:29 54.14 dead [1] - 84:2 37:9 29:18, 29:21, 30:28, departure [1] - 46:7 cost [1] - 95:29 deal [10] - 27:18, 32:17, 33:8, 36:28, Crumlin [2] - 10:3, deployed [3] - 89:24, COSTELLO [1] -35:25, 36:26, 37:1, 39:23, 42:2, 42:5, 89:26. 89:27 43:17, 51:8, 56:29, 44:15, 44:18, 45:21, cry [1] - 44:24 deploying[1] - 88:29 counsel [6] - 37:11, 75:21, 91:22, 97:19 46:13, 46:24, 46:28, **CULLEN** [1] - 2:28 deployment [2] -54:18, 54:23, 57:16, dealing [9] - 7:24, 47:2, 50:22, 50:24, **CUNNINGHAM**[1] -92:17, 93:5 57:18. 59:20 8:15, 10:10, 10:16, 50:29, 52:3, 52:15, depth [1] - 72:5 country [4] - 31:2, 28:17, 30:24, 54:6, 52:18, 52:23, 57:7, cup [1] - 35:19 **Deputy** [8] - 15:7, 31:3, 42:3, 71:14 72:9, 75:22 64:3, 64:22, 68:11, cutting [1] - 53:17 43:21, 44:5, 80:29, course [11] - 53:16, dealings [5] - 12:16, 69:12, 69:28, 73:6, 98:12, 98:13, 98:14, 54:12, 54:18, 54:20, 73:7, 73:14, 75:8, 12:27, 36:21, 43:27, 109:18

describe [2] - 7:22, 27:6 described [2] - 9:7, 86:29 describing [1] -86:14 DESIGNATED[1] -3:29 desired [1] - 123:2 desk [7] - 6:28, 19:6, 19:7, 19:8, 21:3, 23:8, desks [2] - 19:5, 19:12 Desktop [1] - 103:17 desktop [10] - 90:23, 107:26, 113:11, 113:22, 113:29, 114:21, 114:23, 117:7, 119:16, 121:16 desktops [1] -107:23 destroyed [2] -53:19, 66:1 detail [8] - 20:17, 28:5. 47:5. 50:18. 51:25, 52:10, 52:20, 60:26 detailed [2] - 15:1, 15:8 details [18] - 32:2, 65:26, 91:16, 94:23, 106:14, 106:18, 113:14, 113:21, 114:1, 114:7, 114:11, 115:11, 116:7, 116:16, 116:24, 116:26, 121:12 detain [1] - 53:8 detained [1] - 11:21 **DETECTIVE** [2] - 4:7, 9:21 detective [3] - 6:14, 20:20, 124:25 detectives [1] -75:20 determine [2] -100:28, 123:9 determined [1] -121:11 develop [2] - 30:4, 105:20 developed [4] -88:27, 89:17, 89:23, 104:3 developing [2] -27:13, 28:4 development [1] -88:26 device [7] - 102:7,

102:22, 102:24, 102:28, 103:22, 103:24, 108:8 devices [6] - 89:13, 99:9, 99:22, 104:13, 109:26, 115:15 diagnosed [1] - 49:4 diagonally [2] - 23:2, 23:3 diamond [1] - 62:18 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diary [1] - 15:17 died [1] - 84:9 difference [1] - 42:19 differences [1] - 83:4 different [15] - 28:6, 64:14. 70:4. 70:6. 70:19, 70:20, 72:13, 72:14, 82:26, 83:25, 88:6, 88:8, 99:7, 117:12. 117:14 difficult [2] - 41:26, 77:18 difficulty [2] - 63:1, 77:3 Dignam [1] - 54:29 **DIGNAM**[1] - 2:15 direct [2] - 40:16, 86:27 directed [1] - 84:22 directing [1] - 113:5 directions [1] - 11:13 directly [4] - 10:10, 10:12, 27:26, 85:16 **DIRECTLY** [16] - 4:4, 4:8, 4:14, 4:20, 4:23, 4:30, 5:2, 5:6, 6:10, 9:22, 24:1, 68:6, 73:1, 87:11, 112:2, 120:20 director [9] - 16:20, 45:9, 47:19, 64:29, 65:5, 65:9, 79:11, 84:25, 104:13 Director [1] - 38:24 director's [1] - 23:12 directors [1] - 99:10 discharged [1] - 83:2 disclosure [16] - 8:2, 13:1, 14:2, 34:24, 35:3, 42:15, 56:12, 56:28, 57:7, 57:8, 60:1, 68:17, 73:16, 81:2, 83:25, 83:26 Disclosures [1] -15:16 DISCLOSURES [2] -1:3. 1:4 discover [2] - 94:21,

discredit [1] - 73:21

discrediting [1] -16:25 discuss [5] - 10:25, 35:19, 40:3, 53:7, 93:10 discussed [8] -16:15, 35:14, 40:10, 76:15, 76:20, 76:25, 76:26, 77:29 discussing [2] -39:25, 79:24 discussion [3] -55:29, 79:7, 79:9 discussions [3] -13:9. 80:8. 80:10 disposal [1] - 95:18 dispose [1] - 95:22 disrespectful [1] -42:25 distinction [1] - 60:4 distribution [1] - 7:4 district [1] - 93:6 divisional [1] - 93:6 **DMG** [1] - 3:15 **DOCK** [1] - 3:25 document [1] - 14:23 documentary [2] -15:17, 15:27 documentation [3] -123:14, 123:15, 123:18 documented [1] documents' [2] -107:27, 108:2 domain [5] - 113:15, 113:17, 113:29, 117:1, 117:12 **DONAL** [10] - 2:16, 4:31, 5:3, 107:1, 107:4, 108:29, 118:22, 118:24, 120:10, 124:8 done [16] - 26:10, 27:28, 33:26, 38:16, 40:17, 41:23, 47:26, 48:14, 48:15, 84:23, 96:26, 103:16, 111:14, 113:5, 116:25, 123:20 Donegal [2] - 62:17, 62:18 door [11] - 18:20, 18:28, 18:29, 22:12, 23:10, 33:21, 49:14, 86:21, 86:23, 86:25 door-stepping [1] -

down [14] - 11:21, 14:4, 14:22, 19:2, 22:17, 31:27, 35:18, 36:16, 44:6, 48:6, 48:7, 49:29, 103:27, 106:4 downstairs [1] -41:24 dozen [1] - 33:19 dozens [1] - 111:10 **DPP**[3] - 11:13, 37:19, 65:28 draft [1] - 21:25 drafting [1] - 21:20 dramatically [1] -90.1 drew [1] - 7:28 Drimnagh [1] - 88:4 drive [13] - 82:4, 93:27, 95:16, 96:3, 97:21, 100:25, 107:27, 107:28, 107:29, 108:2, 114:28, 121:18, 122:2 drives [11] - 95:1, 95:3. 95:6. 95:12. 95:18, 95:20, 95:29, 96:8, 109:3, 109:4, 115.1 drownings [1] -31:24 **DUBLIN** [10] - 1:17, 2:12, 2:20, 2:25, 2:29, 3:6, 3:10, 3:20, 3:26, 3:32 **Dublin** [1] - 44:17 due [2] - 54:17, 70:20 dumb [2] - 103:25, 119:25 Dunn [2] - 58:6, 58:16 during [23] - 7:5, 7:27, 8:5, 12:10, 13:19, 20:25, 20:26, 27:12, 91:28, 92:10, 95:3, 97:8, 97:16, 97:27, 97:28, 98:11, 100:14. 100:18. 102:1, 103:5, 110:5, 111:7 duty [1] - 47:13 **dynamic** [1] - 70:19 dynamics [1] - 72:14 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:5 Dáil [1] - 84:2

Ε EARLSFORT[1] early [5] - 20:1, 20:12, 41:9, 71:2, 78:15 earshot [4] - 27:29, 37:5, 39:25, 40:18 easy [2] - 23:6, 23:10 eat [1] - 63:6 Eavan [9] - 17:4, 29:15, 30:3, 31:10, 33:12, 33:14, 69:4, 71:19, 79:20 effect [1] - 61:7 effectively [5] -40:21, 42:1, 43:20, 73:12, 73:20 eight [3] - 19:25, 64:5, 68:14 either [10] - 23:10, 26:27, 29:26, 48:7, 55:4, 80:21, 108:1, 117:22, 118:2, 121:22 elaborate [1] - 46:14 Elaine [1] - 124:21 electronic [3] -15:18, 88:13, 88:14 elements [1] - 77:25 eleven [2] - 83:15, 83:16 **ELIZABETH**[1] - 2:7 elsewhere [2] -48:25, 102:2 em.. [1] - 116:3 email [28] - 10:29, 16:2, 35:29, 37:4, 46:12, 47:21, 47:24, 47:25, 48:4, 72:11, 90:16, 90:17, 104:8, 104:12, 104:19, 104:21, 104:24, 104:27, 104:29, 105:7, 105:11, 105:22, 105:23, 106:1, 106:5, 106:10, 117:15 emailed [1] - 35:27 emails [20] - 10:8, 10:12, 15:18, 21:10, 47:23, 47:25, 48:6, 48:9, 58:28, 104:9, 105:2 105:14 105:17, 105:29, 106:7, 106:8, 108:21,

119:28, 120:6

embark [1] - 73:21

embarked [2] - 26:7,

doubt [2] - 54:17,

	1			
26:9	especially [2] - 44:4,	68:6, 73:2, 81:24,	41:24, 94:2	43:1, 43:3, 43:25,
embarking [1] -	96:25	86:11, 87:11, 107:1,	facing [2] - 22:13,	79:10, 79:11, 83:19
55:28	essentially [1] -	110:13, 112:2,	86:23	Ferris's [1] - 43:14
embarrassed [1] -	103:25	118:22, 120:21	fact [23] - 36:13,	FERRY [1] - 2:23
125:6	established [6] -	EXAMINER [1] - 3:22	36:24, 41:10, 45:12,	few [6] - 50:26,
embarrassing [1] -	61:22, 62:3, 98:20,	examining [1] -	47:10, 51:2, 53:25,	51:19, 51:21, 63:22,
40:9	98:27, 101:14, 103:26	73:16	53:29, 55:18, 56:5,	81:26, 107:4
EMMA [1] - 2:18	ESTABLISHED[1] -	example [4] - 11:6,	57:12, 58:7, 58:9,	fictional [1] - 48:19
emphasis [1] - 96:27	1:8	11:13, 39:4, 90:15	58:24, 60:5, 60:11,	field [2] - 96:10,
employ [1] - 104:26	establishes [1] -	exceed [2] - 106:3	60:12, 64:12, 72:3,	112:9
employees [1] -	103:18	excellent [2] - 32:8,	73:15, 77:7, 89:15,	figures [1] - 92:21
94:22	estate [1] - 101:2	65:2	109:29	file [17] - 11:13,
enabled [1] - 116:29	estranged [1] - 65:7	except [2] - 82:8,	factory [2] - 102:4,	37:18, 38:24, 87:21,
encouraged [2] -	etcetera [8] - 30:9,	111:14	102:25	93:7, 93:10, 93:17,
25:26, 95:6	51:15, 65:24, 72:12,	exception [1] - 54:16	facts [5] - 56:4,	93:20, 93:28, 94:2,
encrypted [2] -	89:9, 90:16, 103:11,	EXCHANGE [1] -	58:23, 62:3, 75:21,	94:4, 94:10, 94:15,
93:21, 106:17	113:23	3:25	75:23	96:17, 96:20, 108:6,
end [14] - 18:27,	ether [2] - 80:3, 85:3	excised [1] - 57:14	factual [2] - 61:21,	118:4
18:28, 18:29, 19:14,	ethos [1] - 82:11	excuse [2] - 46:11,	61:24	files [3] - 93:19,
22:2, 29:7, 46:16,	event [6] - 25:29,	47:21	fair [3] - 75:7, 80:20,	93:23, 94:9
52:10, 83:12, 86:21,	44:28, 52:5, 92:7,	excuses [1] - 47:12	84:3	fill [1] - 21:8
92:13, 95:29, 103:19,	96:1, 100:4	executive [2] -	fairly [5] - 36:26,	final [1] - 48:26
111:5	eventually [1] -	103:10, 104:12	68:14, 101:5, 109:13,	finalise [1] - 61:26
end-user [1] - 103:19	50:27	existence [2] -	115:17	finally [2] - 52:9,
ending [5] - 69:5,	everywhere [1] -	84:19, 107:20	fallen [1] - 82:24	110:29
69:6, 69:7, 110:16,	41:22	expand [2] - 64:26,	familiar [5] - 33:14,	Finan [1] - 11:28
121:17	evidence [49] -	77:2	48:5, 73:19, 109:21,	fine [5] - 7:14, 25:9,
endless [1] - 54:15	12:14, 15:17, 15:27,	expect [1] - 55:29	123:22	48:24, 86:19, 87:1
engage [1] - 11:9	35:25, 37:12, 41:28,	expected [2] - 21:9,	family [3] - 17:14,	finish [2] - 41:2, 41:3
engaged [2] - 13:3,	42:23, 43:3, 53:8,	50:8	71:26, 79:22	finished [1] - 38:19
113:20	53:9, 53:17, 53:22,	expensive [1] -	FANNING [3] - 3:3,	first [20] - 6:7, 9:28,
engaging [1] - 60:9	53:28, 54:24, 55:7,	105:25	3:4, 3:8	12:9, 17:23, 22:9,
engineering [1] -	55:11, 55:12, 55:17,	experience [11] -	fantastic [1] - 60:10	24:21, 33:12, 37:20,
88:14	55:20, 55:24, 56:3,	11:10, 11:11, 12:9,	far [11] - 12:25, 14:8,	38:25, 58:21, 74:28,
enjoy [1] - 29:10	56:8, 56:20, 56:24,	24:12, 32:24, 32:25,	15:9, 21:13, 22:14,	81:27, 90:25, 91:4,
enjoyed [1] - 82:20	57:1, 57:13, 59:4,	39:9, 40:15, 65:4,	26:25, 32:9, 34:21, 45:15, 76:23, 94:16	91:11, 103:5, 103:8,
enjoying [1] - 82:22	59:11, 59:22, 59:24, 59:26, 59:29, 61:29,	70:14	fashion [1] - 42:25	103:13, 116:5
ensure [5] - 92:28,	63:10, 64:23, 65:14,	experienced [2] -	fatal [1] - 31:23	firstly [2] - 59:10,
93:22, 95:17, 102:25,	65:21, 70:8, 70:9,	39:21, 48:22	fault [4] - 46:16,	66:20
102:26	79:1, 80:27, 81:1,	explain [4] - 38:3,	46:18, 99:26, 104:4	FITZGERALD [1] - 2·17
ensured [1] - 96:26	85:10, 97:18, 110:22,	89:13, 89:18, 94:3	favour [1] - 77:14	
enter [1] - 41:24	111:3, 118:1, 122:24	explained [5] - 30:8, 34:19, 49:6, 51:28,	fear [1] - 75:23	Fitzpatrick [3] - 74:5, 74:9, 74:18
enterprise [3] - 94:6,	Evidence [1] - 54:13	95:5	FEBRUARY [2] - 1:6,	five [7] - 20:5, 28:6,
94:12, 105:24	EVIDENCE [1] - 1:9	explaining [1] - 43:8	1:10	36:2, 39:23, 64:4,
entertaining [1] - 61:11	evident [1] - 28:19	explanation [1] -	February [3] - 17:16,	83:13, 99:13
entire [3] - 31:1,	exact [1] - 34:3	119:10	96:11, 101:25	flagged [1] - 34:10
31:3, 42:3	exactly [3] - 71:11,	explored [1] - 57:17	February/early [3] -	flashed [1] - 44:27
entirely [2] - 57:11,	90:18, 119:11	expression [3] -	17:4, 33:22, 71:23	flashes [1] - 44:27
60:13	examination [6] -	34:9, 39:26, 40:11	feed [1] - 62:25	flavour [1] - 28:28
entitled [2] - 34:23,	53:15, 56:2, 57:15,	extent [1] - 80:6	feedback [3] - 78:1,	floor [2] - 18:23, 22:9
53:24	57:18, 60:18, 60:21	external [1] - 93:21	84:27, 85:16	focus [1] - 60:21
entitlement [2] -	EXAMINED [36] -	extra [1] - 118:13	feeding [1] - 31:10	focused [1] - 60:19
54:20, 57:19	4:4, 4:5, 4:8, 4:9,	eye [1] - 8:13	feeds [2] - 62:21,	follow [2] - 117:3,
entries [1] - 15:17	4:10, 4:14, 4:15, 4:16,	.,	103:10	122:25
environment [1] -	4:20, 4:23, 4:24, 4:27,	F	felt [8] - 29:6, 29:8,	followed [2] -
12:10	4:30, 4:31, 4:32, 5:2,	•	46:23, 49:21, 74:12,	108:19, 108:25
EQUALITY [1] - 1:9	5:3, 5:6, 6:11, 9:1,		78:9, 83:14, 83:16	FOLLOWING [1] -
error [2] - 24:17,	9:22, 14:15, 17:1,	face [1] - 59:4	Ferris [10] - 11:29,	1:5
69:21	24:2, 37:9, 39:17,	facilities [3] - 19:3,	19:12, 21:18, 42:22,	following [9] - 1:26,
	L	1	I .	I .

16:11, 30:7, 46:15, friendly [2] - 32:11, 120:22, 120:23, guess [1] - 77:11 112:19, 112:22, 55:27, 56:4, 97:19, 64:26 120:28 guidelines [1] -119:17, 120:3, 120:23 103:10, 123:12 fringes [1] - 43:28 garda.ie [1] - 104:22 25:17 headquarters [2] -**FOLLOWS** [5] - 6:1, Gardaí [2] - 10:16, 93:6. 93:7 front [6] - 19:1, 19:4, **GWEN** [1] - 1:30 68:1, 112:2, 118:23, 23:11, 23:18, 82:9, 46.12 Gwen [1] - 1:25 hear [9] - 12:15, 13:6, 13:9, 35:15, 103:28 gate [2] - 22:20, follows [1] - 53:28 FSNI [2] - 124:20, 22:28 61:10, 75:19, 76:26, Н fool [2] - 62:23, 124:22 gates [2] - 22:10, 80:15, 87:28 62:26 heard [11] - 13:21, full [6] - 20:13, 86:23 habit [1] - 6:6 20:14, 40:5, 41:19, general [7] - 20:2, 41:29, 53:10, 70:9, foot [1] - 45:24 half [2] - 33:19, FOR [14] - 1:8, 2:6, 99:5, 111:14 26:8, 35:29, 40:4, 75:11, 76:6, 76:18, 92:22 2:9, 2:14, 2:22, 2:27, fullest [1] - 58:2 55:3, 57:2, 75:9 78:11, 81:2, 114:18, HALIDAY[1] - 2:11 2:31, 3:2, 3:8, 3:12, fully [1] - 103:29 generally [6] - 10:27, 115:7 HALL_[2] - 3:4, 3:9 hearing [1] - 59:11 3:17, 3:22, 3:28, functions [1] - 82:7 13:27, 21:24, 21:26, halt [2] - 53:27, 67:20 **HEARING** [3] - 6:1, 40:17, 74:19 FURTHER [2] - 4:27, 54:21 67:20, 68:1 force [1] - 89:1 86:11 generic [2] - 117:8, **HAMILTON**[1] - 3:13 Forensic [1] - 111:8 hearsay [1] - 54:13 fuss [1] - 77:26 119:22 HANAHOE[1] - 2:24 forget [2] - 18:12, FÍONÁN [1] - 2:27 GEORGE'S [1] - 3:25 heart [1] - 69:8 hand [1] - 58:8 38:25 held [1] - 78:21 Gerald [2] - 17:16, $\boldsymbol{handed}~[3]-44:\!6,$ forgive [2] - 20:16, 79.18 **HELD** [1] - 1:17 G 88:28. 109:5 55:28 girl [1] - 65:29 help [10] - 10:13, handicapped [1] form [1] - 6:25 given [31] - 11:14, 18:16, 21:29, 28:3, gable [5] - 18:27, formal [3] - 36:14, 15:24, 16:7, 16:9, 28:9, 28:13, 44:3, 18:28, 22:2, 23:11, hands [3] - 27:23, 76:16, 122:10, 124:10 36:26, 37:1 19:18, 30:21, 30:22, 86:21 27:24 82:12 38:1, 38:9, 42:22, helpful [1] - 78:17 formality [1] - 36:20 GARDA[2] - 5:5, hands-on [3] - 27:23, 43:3, 44:23, 51:28, high [3] - 88:24, format [1] - 89:19 120:20 27:24, 82:12 formed [1] - 52:1 52:21, 54:24, 55:12, 102:24, 109:13 Garda [91] - 6:12, handset [4] - 49:12, former [28] - 84:24, 55:21, 55:23, 55:25, highly [2] - 39:2, 11:1, 11:13, 16:21, 49:28, 50:19, 50:23 58:26, 61:17, 66:21. 91:17, 91:19, 92:3, 56:27 18:25, 20:21, 25:16, hanging [1] - 125:7 70:19, 71:16, 72:14, himself [6] - 21:26, 94:23, 97:6, 97:10, 25:29, 32:16, 37:19, 86:17, 95:26, 100:10, happy [2] - 30:18, 27:18, 82:9, 82:10, 97:13, 98:3, 98:28, 37:21, 37:22, 37:27, 74:29 99:13, 99:23, 100:17, 105:23, 106:3 83:5, 83:24 38:26, 39:6, 39:29, Harcourt [1] - 6:14 **glad** [1] - 96:3 101:21, 102:12, hint [2] - 85:18, 40:6. 41:20. 47:21. hard [19] - 61:29, glasses [1] - 60:7 104:10, 104:14, 111:13 47:24, 48:4, 52:27, 93:27, 95:1, 95:3, God [1] - 44:29 104:16, 105:9, historical~[2] - 38:4,54:19, 57:18, 60:24, 95:6, 95:12, 95:16. 105:10, 110:3, goings [1] - 25:3 73:23 61:17, 63:13, 64:1, 95:20, 95:28, 96:3, 110:17, 110:23, golden [1] - 10:23 historically [1] -64:10, 64:11, 65:4, 96:8, 97:21, 100:25, 119:5, 121:5, 123:8, GORDON [1] - 2:10 66:3, 66:22, 68:9, 109:3, 109:4, 114:28, 124:24, 125:2 gossip [3] - 75:8, Hogan [8] - 23:23, 73:5, 78:25, 80:28, 115:1, 121:18, 122:2 forward [2] - 47:25, 24:3, 37:10, 39:18, 75:24, 77:10 84:13, 86:15, 87:15, hardware [6] - 89:2, 59:5 government[1] -50:11, 58:1, 70:9, 87:18, 87:26, 87:27, 89:8, 89:11, 91:17, foundation [1] -64:20 83:10 87:29, 88:2, 88:3, 91:20, 97:10 55:21 granted [1] - 23:6 **HOGAN**[2] - 4:13, 88:12, 88:15, 88:18, HARRINGTON[1] four [8] - 18:15, 21:1, great [2] - 56:29, 24:1 89:21, 90:4, 90:5, 2:32 28:5, 43:10, 45:6, hold [1] - 96:7 59:21 90:22, 90:25, 91:3, **HATCH**[4] - 3:4, 3:5, 68:23, 69:20, 95:20 holding [1] - 50:12 greatly [1] - 76:9 91:5, 92:16, 99:4, 3:9, 3:9 Four [1] - 51:20 home [4] - 17:5, **GRIFFIN** [1] - 2:18 102:14, 102:21, Haughey [1] - 63:3 fourth [1] - 69:18 33:22, 44:16, 119:29 ground [3] - 18:23, 102:26, 102:27, **HAVING** [9] - 6:10, **FRANCIS** [1] - 3:19 59:6, 82:5 homeless [2] - 84:2, 103:12. 104:19. 9:21, 24:1, 68:5, 73:1, fraud [1] - 53:21 grounds [1] - 96:16 84.9 105:2, 105:11, 86:10, 87:10, 112:1, FRAWLEY [4] - 4:7, **GROUP** [1] - 3:17 honest [3] - 8:14, 108:16, 111:1, 120:20 4:26, 9:21, 86:10 76:10, 81:15 group [2] - 94:10, 111:10, 112:10, HAYES[1] - 3:30 Frawley [6] - 9:19, 94:19 honestly [1] - 50:9 112:13, 112:19, head [3] - 22:18, 9:23, 41:2, 43:7, 86:7, groups [1] - 19:20 hope [1] - 125:1 112:22, 113:13, 88:21, 88:25 86:13 hopefully [1] gruesome [1] - 75:27 113:15, 113:28, heading [1] - 92:27 FREEMAN [1] - 3:3 guard [5] - 87:27, 111:16 115:23, 117:1, Headquarters [13] frequently [1] hotel [1] - 62:17 88:1, 88:4, 98:16, 117:11, 117:12, 18:25, 20:21, 41:21, 29:19 105:1 hour [2] - 41:8, 67:18 119:17, 119:22, 87:15, 87:18, 92:16, Friday [2] - 124:24, guards [3] - 75:20, hourly [1] - 27:13 119:24, 119:26, 111:1, 111:11, 125:3 104:21 hours [2] - 19:26, 120:3, 120:17,

20:7 11:18, 11:22, 30:24, 66:5, 66:8, 66:14, insurance [1] - 95:14 iPad [7] - 99:22, HOUSE [4] - 2:11, 31:6, 31:12, 38:4, 66:21, 68:15, 68:28, integrity [1] - 45:9 100:9, 101:15, 103:7, 2:19, 3:19, 3:31 41:27, 41:29, 42:7, 73:13, 75:29, 79:21, intend [2] - 33:9, 103:25, 104:3, 104:17 **HQCBOB-XPC-004** 42:15, 44:13, 47:6, 92:8, 93:26, 100:7, 36:21 **iPads** [1] - 103:8 111 - 107:8 75:10, 82:15, 89:20, 103:4, 108:10, 109:9, intensive[1] - 27:7 Ireland [1] - 111:9 **HQCBOBXPC003** 102:9, 123:27 112:14 interact [2] - 25:22, **IRELAND**[1] - 3:15 incidents [16] - 31:1, informed [4] - 21:4, [1] - 115:2 103:24 IRISH [3] - 3:22, 31:4, 31:22, 33:6, 51:16, 59:15, 117:24 **HRM** [1] - 73:9 interacted [1] - 27:26 3:28, 3:29 41:4, 42:1, 42:4, 46:4, Infrastructure [1] huge [1] - 44:28 interacting [1] -Irish [1] - 29:17 46:6, 46:26, 46:29, hurry [1] - 41:26 70:13 irrelevant [2] - 28:27, 55:14, 82:4, 82:5, infrastructure [3] -61:11 interaction [7] -83:25, 109:23 89:6, 113:22, 119:16 17:18, 27:5, 32:27, irresponsibly [1] include [3] - 26:28, initial [1] - 116:6 44:7, 56:26, 56:29, 54:27 initiated [1] - 8:4 111:8 **IS** [8] - 90:5, 113:15, ICT [1] - 104:12 includes [1] - 89:12 injuries [1] - 75:26 interactions [4] -113:28, 117:1, idea [6] - 18:6, 18:8, including [2] - 41:22, 117:12, 119:22, inkling [1] - 35:6 9:6, 33:4, 33:15, 36:6 28:22, 62:9, 62:27, 47:17 inquiries [2] - 17:11, interest [7] - 11:16, 119:24, 119:26 92:19 incontactable [1] -59:14 40:29, 51:15, 59:14, issue [26] - 40:25, identified [3] - 97:14, 47:13 **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:3, 59:17, 60:23, 124:1 41:15, 53:18, 53:25, 97:20, 99:2 indeed [6] - 35:24, 54:1, 55:10, 56:5, internal [1] - 51:3 identify [6] - 68:23, 60:19, 79:20, 87:26, 57:13, 57:20, 57:26, inquiry [2] - 37:29, interview [3] - 9:4, 97:13, 98:23, 107:12, 90:11, 102:18 53:14 14:19, 33:26 58:7, 58:9, 58:23, 112:26, 115:27 INDEPENDENT [1] inside [2] - 22:28, 58:24, 59:16, 60:5, interviewed [1] identifying [1] - 97:9 3:2 60:11, 60:13, 60:15, 49:15 37:13 identity [3] - 98:16. INDEX [1] - 4:1 61:15, 61:20, 63:10, insofar [4] - 26:6, interviewers [1] - 9:5 107:5. 123:9 indicate [2] - 52:19, 57:11, 106:18, 109:3 63:16, 101:21, **INTO** [1] - 1:3 IFSC [1] - 3:26 107:21 Inspector [11] -104:14, 118:6 introduced [5] image [2] - 101:1, indicated [1] - 46:11 11:28, 11:29, 19:12, 41:19, 41:20, 46:18, issued [22] - 45:26, 101:3 indicating [2] -93:12, 99:13, 99:14, 21:18, 42:22, 43:1, 56:21, 90:25 imaged [4] - 102:7, 45:27, 73:12 99:15, 99:16, 101:15, 43:14, 43:25, 83:19, introduction [1] -102:22, 123:26 101:24, 101:26, INDICATING] [1] -97:18, 111:26 16:18 imagine [1] - 71:11 23:1 inspector [5] - 18:12, 101:28, 101:29, investigated [3] imaging [2] - 123:15, 102:10, 102:12, indicatively [1] -18:14, 43:20, 43:21, 38:11, 38:23, 84:15 123:16 109:17, 109:18, 124:28 93:1 investigating [2] immediately [3] -109:22, 110:5, 123:8, individual [8] inspector's [1] - 44:4 53:10, 84:19 45:25, 97:19, 122:13 123:10, 123:11 10:16, 10:25, 11:10, instance [9] - 11:5, investigation [35] immense [1] - 27:12 issues [12] - 25:13, 38:10, 98:15, 104:20, 53:19, 58:20, 58:27, 24:7, 29:1, 30:2, impact [4] - 26:20, 31:21, 34:16, 40:2, 105:1, 105:22 60:6, 77:25, 90:17, 30:15, 31:26, 32:1, 54:6, 56:5, 59:1 individuals [3] -103:17, 105:1 43:17, 60:20, 60:27, 33:6, 37:17, 37:23, impacted [1] - 92:8 61:1, 61:6, 71:1, 8:19, 11:2, 34:22 instant [1] - 105:28 37:27, 38:5, 38:9, **impacts** [1] - 58:9 individuals' [1] -78:24, 89:25 institute [1] - 112:14 38:13, 38:17, 38:18, impinge [1] - 77:24 **IT** [30] - 88:5, 88:7, 10:20 instruct [1] - 16:21 44:10, 50:16, 52:1, important [3] -88:10, 88:11, 88:15, industry [1] - 88:15 instructed [2] -52:17, 56:10, 58:21, 83:26, 95:25, 103:20 88:18, 88:23, 88:25, inference [3] - 53:22, 14:29, 15:8 58:22, 59:13, 60:24, impression [12] -89:2, 89:16, 92:10, 58:8, 60:12 INSTRUCTED [7] -61:22, 61:25, 61:29, 32:13, 32:14, 77:6, 93:3, 95:24, 97:10, inferences [1] - 62:1 68:19, 68:26, 73:26, 2:11, 2:17, 2:23, 2:28, 78:18, 78:19, 79:24, 99:4, 101:26, 101:27, inform [1] - 11:23 2:32, 3:4, 3:14 78:22, 78:23, 82:2, 101:29, 102:11, 79:28, 80:23, 80:26, Information [2] instruction [4] -82:13 83:11, 85:2, 86:16 104:10, 112:9, 87:14, 88:22 15:2, 15:10, 15:28, investigations [1] **improper** [1] - 31:18 112:13, 112:18, 100:27 information [46] -16.1 112:21, 117:27, improperly [2] -11:3, 16:24, 27:21, investigator [1] instructions [21] -57:9, 112:4 120:23, 120:24, 28:15, 30:14, 30:16, 16:7, 16:9, 16:14, 14:25 120:28, 121:2, 124:9 improve [1] - 26:7 34:29, 38:1, 38:8, 16:15, 25:22, 58:16, investigators [4] item [1] - 50:27 IN [1] - 1:17 38:27, 38:28, 40:12, 6:23, 7:27, 14:20 58:26, 58:29, 59:8, itself [3] - 40:29, inability [1] - 122:2 40:14, 44:6, 45:1, 60:27, 61:3, 61:4, involve [1] - 43:26 56:25, 83:9 inappropriate [2] -45:17, 45:27, 46:4, 61:23, 61:26, 61:27, involved [4] - 26:18, ivy[1] - 53:17 75:6. 83:26 46:5, 46:10, 46:22, 62:2, 63:14, 63:15, 28:24, 72:11, 80:3 46:25, 47:4, 47:7. inappropriately [1] -65:24, 95:26, 108:17 involvement [1] -57:9 51:12, 52:12, 52:26, INSTRUMENT [1] -117:21 incident [19] - 11:15,

 $involving \hbox{\small [1]}-55{:}14$

61:16, 61:19, 66:3,

J
James [1] - 72:25 JAMES [2] - 4:22, 73:1 January [6] - 71:7, 77:28, 88:5, 99:15, 101:27, 120:28 JERMYN [1] - 3:24
job [6] - 41:6, 44:3, 47:9, 49:3, 96:26, 109:28 jobs [2] - 44:6, 91:9 Joe [1] - 37:27 John [4] - 24:8, 42:22, 79:10, 79:11 JOHN [3] - 2:17,
2:23, 3:3 joined [2] - 87:26, 87:29 joining [5] - 88:12, 88:15, 88:18, 112:10, 112:12
journalist [23] - 12:19, 17:5, 29:13, 30:20, 36:9, 37:26, 38:9, 44:12, 44:20, 44:29, 52:11, 52:12, 66:4, 66:7, 66:14, 66:17, 66:23, 71:19, 77:13, 83:28, 84:7, 85:16
journalist's [1] - 83:29 journalists [24] - 7:2, 11:4, 13:3, 27:19,
27:26, 27:28, 29:29, 33:13, 35:12, 40:17, 52:20, 52:24, 52:26, 52:27, 53:1, 61:13, 61:14, 61:16, 69:2, 69:18, 70:13, 84:28, 85:7, 85:23
journalists' [1] - 68:23 Judge [2] - 13:26, 74:7 JUDGE [2] - 1:12,
2:3 judge [2] - 53:24, 54:7 judged [1] - 58:24 July [8] - 68:19, 92:2,
92:4, 94:25, 97:8, 104:27, 111:5, 116:8 juncture [1] - 55:19 June [4] - 10:1,

20:18, 76:16, 102:1

junior [1] - 39:26

JUNO [1] - 3:23 Juno [1] - 69:6 jury [1] - 54:7 justice [1] - 112:16 JUSTICE [3] - 1:8, 1:12, 2:2 KATHLEEN [1] - 2:7 Kavanagh [1] - 68:2 KAVANAGH [1] - 2: Kean [2] - 17:17,

KATHLEEN[1] - 2:7 Kavanagh [1] - 68:20 KAVANAGH[1] - 2:4 79:18 **KEELEY** [1] - 3:14 keep [2] - 21:4, 105:26 keeping [4] - 6:4, 83:11, 95:19, 125:6 keeps [2] - 113:17, 113:28 **KELLY** [3] - 3:4, 3:8, **KENNEDY** [1] - 2:31 Kenny [1] - 36:9 kept [4] - 34:20, 34:21, 43:28 **KEVIN'S** [2] - 3:5, 3:10 **KIERAN** [1] - 3:8 kind [21] - 8:18, 10:21, 12:10, 13:27, 18:7, 18:8, 21:10, 21:12, 21:22, 23:1, 37:29, 38:27, 41:26, 47:15, 50:7, 51:14, 56:7, 60:7, 77:20, 82:10, 117:23 Kirwan [1] - 124:25

L

known [3] - 49:18,

kitchen [4] - 19:14,

knocking [1] - 51:19

23:14, 23:16, 23:17

knowledge [5] -

37:19, 50:6, 72:5,

83:27, 84:23

76:13, 89:29

laid [1] - 55:22 LALLY [1] - 3:30 landline [1] - 29:23 lapsed [1] - 95:27 laptop [12] - 101:18, 101:29, 102:10, 102:11, 102:19, 103:25, 104:16,

106:12, 115:9, 115:12, 115:22, 123:25 laptops [19] - 89:9, 89:12, 98:28, 99:2, 99:13, 99:21, 99:25, 101:15, 101:24, 103:5, 109:13, 109:17, 109:22, 110:4, 113:23, 115:6, 123:7, 123:10, 124:1 large [5] - 26:9, 43:6, 72:10, 92:10, 93:3 large-scale [1] -92:10 last [13] - 22:12, 50:2, 59:12, 66:26, 68:13, 70:9, 76:24, 97:2, 101:23, 105:13, 107:11, 121:3, 123:11 late [12] - 17:4, 19:27, 19:28, 19:29, 20:2, 20:11, 33:22, 41:8, 49:4, 67:11, 71:23, 76:16 latter [2] - 43:29, 84:26 latterly [1] - 84:26 LAVERY [1] - 3:31 law [1] - 59:20 LAW [1] - 2:28 layout [2] - 18:19, 19:16 lead [5] - 14:26, 52:4, 52:7, 58:8, 60:12 lead-in [1] - 14:26 leader [3] - 98:5, 110:11, 112:4 **LEADER** [14] - 2:7, 4:30, 4:32, 87:6, 87:11, 87:13, 87:24, 96:14, 98:6, 101:14, 110:13, 110:15, 110:28, 111:17 leading [1] - 23:13 leads [1] - 86:26 least [2] - 46:4, 75:28 leave [10] - 12:17, 12:24, 13:15, 40:20, 54:24, 55:19, 61:9, 116:20, 116:22, 119:2 leaving [3] - 29:3, 43:24, 102:23 led [7] - 20:17, 53:28, 58:18, 58:22, 59:22, 59:25 left [21] - 7:10, 8:8, 8:21, 18:21, 18:29,

49:15, 49:22, 49:23, 55:26, 67:13, 74:4, 74:8, 76:1, 84:12, 102:27 legs [1] - 67:1 length [3] - 39:22, 58:5, 64:16 less [2] - 64:25, 124:28 letters [1] - 15:17 level [3] - 88:24, 102:24, 105:6 levels [3] - 40:27, 66:20 89:8 licences [1] - 102:27 life [3] - 49:6, 66:1, 92.13 limit [1] - 91:25 **LIMITED** [3] - 3:13, 3:17, 3:18 limited [5] - 62:24, 83:27, 89:12, 94:11, 95:20 limits [2] - 106:2, 106:3 line [12] - 7:25, 8:17, 8:18, 11:21, 14:1, 14:4, 31:27, 34:20, 45:4, 47:22, 66:10, 66:12 lines [3] - 68:14, 79:13, 80:12 link [1] - 34:5 list [7] - 7:4, 76:2, 99:5, 115:14, 124:15, 124:18, 124:28 lists [1] - 113:26 literally [1] - 49:11 **LITTLE** [1] - 2:19 **Live** [3] - 112:19, 112:21, 120:24 loads [1] - 64:1 local [3] - 82:11, 103:24, 105:6 locally [4] - 93:19, 108:8, 108:10, 114:1 locally-stored [2] -93:19, 108:10 locate [2] - 104:9, 122:2 located [12] - 15:22, 95:24, 97:21, 97:23, 99:6, 100:26, 114:28, 115:1, 115:4, 121:19, 121:20, 121:21 location [6] - 38:7, 104:13, 114:6, 114:7, 114:12, 119:27 locations [2] -107:25, 108:3

lock [1] - 119:1 locker [4] - 49:13, 49:14, 50:21, 51:24 lockers [1] - 49:13 log [26] - 98:17, 103:20. 113:14. 113:16, 113:18, 113:19, 113:20, 115:27, 116:27, 118:8, 118:25, 118:29, 119:1, 119:10, 119:22, 121:25, 121:26, 122:4, 122:7, 122:9, 122:27, 122:28 log-in [3] - 113:14, 113:16, 113:18 log-ins [1] - 113:19 log-on [9] - 115:27, 116:27, 119:10, 119:22, 121:26, 122:4, 122:27, 122:28 log-ons [6] - 113:20, 118:8. 118:25. 121:25, 122:9 logged [10] - 97:14, 97:27, 98:4, 98:21, 98:24, 100:18, 117:3, 118:26, 119:6, 122:26 logging [4] - 98:6, 98:15, 113:11, 119:19 logs [8] - 90:4, 97:26, 113:15, 114:8, 118:25, 119:4, 122:5, longest [1] - 121:1 look [16] - 18:26, 18:27, 22:11, 22:12, 22:18, 36:25, 38:6, 47:3, 47:5, 49:10, 61:10, 79:16, 84:10, 91:6, 95:16, 111:11 looked [1] - 109:26 looking [13] - 28:9, 29:20, 29:22, 43:15, 45:18, 46:3, 46:23, 47:4, 79:21, 87:19, 92:3, 94:25, 120:5 looks [1] - 120:2 loose [1] - 75:17 loss [4] - 36:7, 93:4, 96:3, 96:5 lost [3] - 17:23, 51:26, 97:3 loving[1] - 82:22 low [2] - 22:5, 78:21 **LOWER** [2] - 3:5, 3:9 lunch [1] - 19:15 **LUNCH** [2] - 67:20, 68:1

22:19, 23:13, 29:8,

41:8, 45:7, 46:21,

M.E [1] - 2:24 machine [1] - 114:10 machines [1] - 92:15 MADE [2] - 1:3, 1:8 mailbox [1] - 106:5 main [8] - 7:1, 18:20, 19:5, 22:10, 29:23, 58:24, 86:23, 89:20 maintain [1] - 113:13 maintaining [1] - 88:29 maintains [2] - 84:21, 113:13 majority [1] - 101:2 Malone [1] - 1:25 MALONE [1] - 1:30 man [3] - 84:2, 84:9 manage [1] - 105:29 managed [3] - 93:10, 104:1, 109:11 management [12] - 7:26, 39:19, 45:22, 65:18, 70:5, 75:5, 78:10, 83:20, 88:18, 89:20, 112:16, 113:26 manifest [1] - 40:29 manual [1] - 61:18 manufacturer [1] - 114:4 March [6] - 6:18, 17:4, 33:22, 71:23, 88:9, 91:15 mark [2] - 79:29, 124:21 married [1] - 77:7 MARRINAN [49] - 2:6, 4:4, 4:8, 4:10, 4:14, 4:20, 4:23, 4:27, 6:7, 6:11, 6:12, 8:23, 9:13, 9:18, 9:22, 9:23, 14:10, 16:28, 17:1, 17:2, 17:20, 17:26, 17:29, 23:23, 24:2, 24:3, 37:6, 53:5, 55:9, 56:17, 56:20, 67:6, 67:15, 68:3, 68:6, 68:8, 69:19, 69:21, 69:24, 72:17, 72:25, 73:2, 73:4, 81:20, 86:1, 86:6, 86:11, 86:13, 87:5 Marrian [9] - 17:22,	M
88:29 maintains [2] - 84:21, 113:13 majority [1] - 101:2 Malone [1] - 1:25 MALONE [1] - 1:30 man [3] - 84:2, 84:9 manage [1] - 105:29 managed [3] - 93:10, 104:1, 109:11 management [12] - 7:26, 39:19, 45:22, 65:18, 70:5, 75:5, 78:10, 83:20, 88:18, 89:20, 112:16, 113:26 manifest [1] - 40:29 manual [1] - 61:18 manufacturer [1] - 114:4 March [6] - 6:18, 17:4, 33:22, 71:23, 88:9, 91:15 mark [2] - 79:29, 124:21 married [1] - 77:7 MARRINAN [49] - 2:6, 4:4, 4:8, 4:10, 4:14, 4:20, 4:23, 4:27, 6:7, 6:11, 6:12, 8:23, 9:13, 9:18, 9:22, 9:23, 14:10, 16:28, 17:1, 17:2, 17:20, 17:26, 17:29, 23:23, 24:2, 24:3, 37:6, 53:5, 55:9, 56:17, 56:20, 67:6, 67:15, 68:3, 68:6, 68:8, 69:19, 69:21, 69:24, 72:17, 72:25, 73:2, 73:4, 81:20, 86:1, 86:6, 86:11, 86:13, 87:5 Marrinan [9] - 17:22,	machine [1] - 114:10 machines [1] - 92:15 MADE [2] - 1:3, 1:8 mailbox [1] - 106:5 main [8] - 7:1, 18:20, 19:5, 22:10, 29:23, 58:24, 86:23, 89:20 maintain [1] - 113:13
managed [3] - 93:10, 104:1, 109:11 management [12] - 7:26, 39:19, 45:22, 65:18, 70:5, 75:5, 78:10, 83:20, 88:18, 89:20, 112:16, 113:26 manifest [1] - 40:29 manual [1] - 61:18 manufacturer [1] - 114:4 March [6] - 6:18, 17:4, 33:22, 71:23, 88:9, 91:15 mark [2] - 79:29, 124:21 married [1] - 77:7 MARRINAN [49] - 2:6, 4:4, 4:8, 4:10, 4:14, 4:20, 4:23, 4:27, 6:7, 6:11, 6:12, 8:23, 9:13, 9:18, 9:22, 9:23, 14:10, 16:28, 17:1, 17:2, 17:20, 17:26, 17:29, 23:23, 24:2, 24:3, 37:6, 53:5, 55:9, 56:17, 56:20, 67:6, 67:15, 68:3, 68:6, 68:8, 69:19, 69:21, 69:24, 72:17, 72:25, 73:2, 73:4, 81:20, 86:1, 86:6, 86:11, 86:13, 87:5 Marrinan [9] - 17:22,	88:29 maintains [2] - 84:21, 113:13 majority [1] - 101:2 Malone [1] - 1:25 MALONE [1] - 1:30 man [3] - 84:2, 84:9
manufacturer [1] - 114:4 March [6] - 6:18, 17:4, 33:22, 71:23, 88:9, 91:15 mark [2] - 79:29, 124:21 married [1] - 77:7 MARRINAN [49] - 2:6, 4:4, 4:8, 4:10, 4:14, 4:20, 4:23, 4:27, 6:7, 6:11, 6:12, 8:23, 9:13, 9:18, 9:22, 9:23, 14:10, 16:28, 17:1, 17:2, 17:20, 17:26, 17:29, 23:23, 24:2, 24:3, 37:6, 53:5, 55:9, 56:17, 56:20, 67:6, 67:15, 68:3, 68:6, 68:8, 69:19, 69:21, 69:24, 72:17, 72:25, 73:2, 73:4, 81:20, 86:13, 87:5 Marrinan [9] - 17:22,	managed [3] - 93:10, 104:1, 109:11 management [12] - 7:26, 39:19, 45:22, 65:18, 70:5, 75:5, 78:10, 83:20, 88:18, 89:20, 112:16, 113:26 manifest [1] - 40:29
MARRINAN [49] - 2:6, 4:4, 4:8, 4:10, 4:14, 4:20, 4:23, 4:27, 6:7, 6:11, 6:12, 8:23, 9:13, 9:18, 9:22, 9:23, 14:10, 16:28, 17:1, 17:2, 17:20, 17:26, 17:29, 23:23, 24:2, 24:3, 37:6, 53:5, 55:9, 56:17, 56:20, 67:6, 67:15, 68:3, 68:6, 68:8, 69:19, 69:21, 69:24, 72:17, 72:25, 73:2, 73:4, 81:20, 86:1, 86:6, 86:11, 86:13, 87:5 Marrinan [9] - 17:22,	manufacturer [1] - 114:4 March [6] - 6:18, 17:4, 33:22, 71:23, 88:9, 91:15 mark [2] - 79:29, 124:21
56:17, 56:20, 67:6, 67:15, 68:3, 68:6, 68:8, 69:19, 69:21, 69:24, 72:17, 72:25, 73:2, 73:4, 81:20, 86:1, 86:6, 86:11, 86:13, 87:5 Marrinan [9] - 17:22,	MARRINAN [49] - 2:6, 4:4, 4:8, 4:10, 4:14, 4:20, 4:23, 4:27, 6:7, 6:11, 6:12, 8:23, 9:13, 9:18, 9:22, 9:23, 14:10, 16:28, 17:1, 17:2, 17:20, 17:26, 17:29, 23:23, 24:2,
1 2011/ 40125 41128	56:17, 56:20, 67:6, 67:15, 68:3, 68:6, 68:8, 69:19, 69:21, 69:24, 72:17, 72:25, 73:2, 73:4, 81:20, 86:1, 86:6, 86:11, 86:13, 87:5

55:4, 55:23, 57:29,

Martin [1] - 104:14

master's [1] - 112:16

67:11, 69:17

materials [8] - 6:26, 14:17, 14:22, 24:5, 24:9, 36:6, 68:21, 73:27 matter [12] - 16:28, 26:10, 28:13, 50:14, 51:8, 52:16, 54:3, 55:24, 57:24, 79:25, 84:18, 123:20 matters [21] - 29:2, 33:10, 39:25, 40:3, 40:9, 40:13, 47:18, 60:26, 60:28, 61:5, 61:21, 61:26, 63:10, 63:12, 63:17, 71:13, 88:11, 89:11, 91:5, 91:6. 99:29 MATTERS[1] - 1:5 Maurice [14] - 11:7, 13:4, 13:12, 34:6, 35:5, 66:1, 76:29, 77:12, 77:14, 77:16, 77:23, 78:9, 81:19, **MAY**[3] - 1:18, 6:1, 125:13 Mcalese [2] -3:18. 3:18 McCabe [43] - 2:9, 8:4, 8:12, 11:7, 13:4, 13:12, 14:6, 16:22, 16:25, 34:6, 34:16, 34:17, 35:6, 35:13, 37:11, 37:16, 38:22, 38:26, 65:27, 66:2, 71:1, 71:2, 71:3, 71:9, 71:29, 72:7, 73:22, 76:13, 76:16, 77:12, 77:14, 77:23, 77:29, 78:2, 78:6, 78:9, 78:20, 79:27, 80:25, 81:9, 81:19, 87:21, 96:9 McCabe's [5] -13:21. 77:1. 77:16. 78:4, 79:29 McCann [6] - 3:13, 17:5, 33:13, 33:16,

71:19. 79:20

37:10. 39:12

124:21

69:6

McConnell [2] - 3:23,

McDowell [7] - 2:9,

8:26, 14:12, 37:9,

MCDOWELL [1] -

McEnroe [2] - 3:23,

McGARRY [1] - 2:10

McGuinness [26] -

55:5, 107:2, 107:4, 108:21, 108:29, 111:25, 112:2, 112:3, 118:22, 118:24, 120:10, 120:12, 120:17, 120:21, 120:22, 122:8, 122:11, 122:14, 122:18, 124:4, 124:8, 124:15, 124:18, 124:20, 124:24, 124.29 MCGUINNESS [6] -2:6, 2:16, 4:31, 5:2, 5:3, 5:6 McLindon [17] -16:15, 16:20, 17:24, 32:7, 32:9, 32:14, 32:18, 45:10, 46:1, 58:27, 64:25, 64:29, 65:14, 75:3, 75:4, 79:12, 84:26 McLindon's [1] -19.2 meal [1] - 63:5 mean [41] - 6:29, 25:9, 25:11, 26:20, 28:4, 28:21, 29:5, 29:9, 31:20, 31:28, 32:23, 32:29, 34:19, 36:2, 39:4, 41:2, 42:16, 48:10, 51:12, 51:18, 51:23, 60:3, 61:9. 62:15. 62:16. 62:19, 64:28, 65:9, 65:10, 66:20, 67:1, 71:6, 75:7, 76:6, 76:20, 78:7, 80:10, 83:4, 89:14, 96:7, 100:6 means [6] - 7:1, 49:8, 60:5, 102:24, 103:17, 107:16 meant [1] - 118:9 MEDIA [2] - 3:2, 3:15 media [32] - 10:9, 10:10, 10:14, 10:15, 10:25, 11:16, 11:23, 12:17, 15:1, 15:8, 25:23, 27:5, 30:18, 33:5, 33:27, 35:28, 37:2, 44:25, 45:14, 56:26, 56:29, 71:3, 71:8, 74:24, 75:7, 75:14, 75:25, 75:28, 81:19, 82:23, 83:26, 84:14 medium [1] - 36:1 meet [1] - 89:24 meeting [1] - 77:27

meetings [2] - 65:11, 65:18 **MEMBER** [2] - 1:12, 2:2 member [14] - 19:22, 21:25, 25:20, 26:24, 32:15, 38:14, 73:5, 74:14, 81:18, 104:20, 106:8, 113:10, 113:15 members [21] - 7:2, 12:7, 12:17, 25:21, 25:22, 26:18, 26:26, 36:26, 37:1, 38:29, 39:29, 40:5, 40:6, 45:27, 70:20, 74:24, 77:8, 77:15, 90:13, 105:27, 109:29 memo [1] - 45:26 mention [8] - 18:10, 21:29, 34:22, 35:20, 44:9, 46:2, 47:20 mentioned [9] -31:27, 40:25, 41:27, 46:19, 52:17, 70:15, 82:1, 83:10, 107:6 MERCHANTS [1] -3:20 merely [1] - 65:28 met [2] - 6:23, 87:17 methodology [2] -39:27, 81:29 Michael [1] - 37:10 MICHAEL [4] - 2:9, 2:22, 3:8, 3:14 Mick [1] - 69:5 might [13] - 10:13, 28:10, 35:18, 35:20, 59:28, 60:12, 65:2, 70:14, 80:12, 106:20, 109:22, 109:29, 125:5 mightn't [1] - 75:14 migrate [1] - 108:27 migrated [3] -108:10, 108:25, 118:3 migrating [1] -117:21 migration [8] -93:15, 107:21, 108:9, 108:15, 114:8. 114:19, 117:18, 117:28 mind [8] - 18:7, 18:8, 53:9, 63:22, 67:5, 70:12, 94:26, 124:17 MINISTER [1] - 1:8 minor [1] - 37:28 minute [1] - 93:11 minutes [2] - 36:3, 46:29 misconduct [1] -

57:4 misheard [1] -122:17 $\boldsymbol{missing}\, [3] - 44:\!25,$ 95.15 96.15 mixed [1] - 60:22 mobile [4] - 44:23, 51:13, 74:10, 74:16 model [3] - 100:28, 101:5. 114:4 models [1] - 100:29 Molloy [3] - 72:25, 73:4, 81:26 **MOLLOY** [3] - 4:22, 73:1, 81:24 moment [7] - 45:5, 47:9, 53:8, 68:18, 87:28, 99:9, 99:11 Monaghan [5] - 97:9, 97:18, 111:26, 112:3, 112:6 MONAGHAN[2] -5:1, 112:1 Monday [3] - 18:17, 19:18, 43:4 money [1] - 95:29 monitor [1] - 41:17 months [2] - 45:6, 49:24 monument [1] -22.27 Mooney [2] - 6:8, 9:2 **MOONEY** [2] - 4:3, 6:10 Moran [3] - 45:11, 45:25, 45:29 more' [1] - 66:13 Morning [1] - 9:2 morning [14] - 6:7, 7:3, 12:15, 28:5, 28:7, 29:10, 30:11, 30:28, 31:22, 43:4, 72:4, 80:13, 120:6, 125:7 Morris [1] - 62:16 MORRISSEY [1] -2.17 most [8] - 8:20, 20:29, 25:29, 29:28, 35:29, 51:13, 109:18, 121:1 mother [1] - 49:4 motivation [2] - 72:7, motorways [1] -44:26 move [3] - 12:18, 14:22, 50:5 moved [4] - 6:17,

43:6, 43:10, 48:17

moving[1] - 80:12

MR [128] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4, 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:10, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 2:15, 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, 2:23, 2:23, 2:27, 2:31, 3:3, 3:3, 3:8, 3:14, 3:18, 3:24, 3:30, 4:4, 4:8, 4:9, 4:10, 4:14, 4:15, 4:16, 4:20, 4:23, 4:24, 4:27, 4:31, 5:2, 5:3, 5:6, 6:7, 6:11, 6:12, 8:23, 8:26, 9:13, 9:14, 9:18, 9:22, 9:23, 14:10, 14:12, 14:15, 14:16, 16:27, 16:28, 17:1, 17:2, 17:20, 17:26, 17:29, 23:23, 24:2, 24:3, 37:6, 37:9, 37:10, 39:12, 39:17, 39:18, 46:17, 48:25, 50:14, 51:27, 52:6, 52:9, 53:2, 53:5, 55:9, 56:17, 56:20, 67:6, 67:15, 68:3, 68:6, 68:8, 69:19, 69:21, 69:24, 72:20, 72:25, 73:2, 73:4, 81:20, 81:24, 81:26, 85:5, 85:11, 85:14, 85:29, 86:1, 86:6, 86:11, 86:13, 87:5, 107:1, 107:4, 108:29, 111:25, 112:2, 112:3, 118:22, 118:24, 120:10, 120:12, 120:17, 120:21, 120:22, 122:11, 122:14, 122:18, 124:4, 124:8, 124:15, 124:20, 124:24, 124:29 **MS** [44] - 2:7, 2:7, 2:17, 2:18, 2:22, 4:3, 4:5, 4:30, 4:32, 6:10, 9:1, 9:2, 14:13, 39:14, 59:10, 60:17, 61:15, 61:21, 62:8, 62:11, 62:14, 62:21, 62:26, 63:7, 72:18, 72:19, 81:21, 81:22, 87:6, 87:11, 87:13, 87:24, 96:14, 98:6, 101:14, 106:22, 106:23, 110:13, 110:15, 110:28, 111:17, 118:19, 118:20, 124:6 **mugshot** [1] - 84:8 MUIRCHEARTAIGH [1] - 2:27

MULLAN [1] - 2:7 murders [1] - 31:23 MURPHY [1] - 2:14 Murray [9] - 17:4, 29:15, 30:3, 31:10, 33:12, 33:14, 69:4, 71:19, 79:20 must [4] - 66:16, 75:21, 77:18, 113:16 mutterings [1] - 13:9 mystified [2] - 50:9, 51:11 MÍCHEÁL [24] - 2:15, 4:9, 4:16, 4:24, 9:14, 14:15, 14:16, 16:27, 39:17, 39:18, 46:17, 48:25, 50:14, 51:27, 52:6, 52:9, 53:2, 72:20, 81:24, 81:26, 85:5, 85:11, 85:14, 85:29

Ν

name [13] - 9:2, 37:11, 38:8, 76:4, 83:29, 84:8, 98:18, 98:23, 98:24, 104:22, 114:4, 114:10, 117:8 named [10] - 1:27, 8:19. 10:16. 10:19. 10:20, 10:28, 11:1, 11:10, 34:6, 34:22 namely [2] - 11:8, 84.19 names [2] - 113:22, 121:12 naming [1] - 107:15 narrative [1] - 55:26 narrowed [1] - 96:10 national [2] - 92:17 nationwide [2] -31:4, 42:4 naturally [1] - 56:21 nature [9] - 40:4, 41:1, 43:24, 47:24, 65:10, 72:16, 75:27, 80:11, 93:5 near [1] - 84:2 necessarily [2] -117:4, 118:9 necessary [6] -22:17. 41:23. 54:20. 54:23, 56:15, 57:22 need [6] - 49:29, 53:6, 80:16, 87:17, 93:11, 106:4 needed [5] - 21:21, 63:15, 83:17, 108:18,

117:29 needn't [2] - 69:1, 83:29 **needs** [3] - 53:27, 58:10 96:9 negatively [3] -16:22, 35:12, 81:19 neglected [1] - 17:3 neighbours [1] -53:18 network [2] - 90:4. networked [1] -113:27 never [18] - 9:9, 15:7, 16:1, 22:14, 22:16, 26:22, 35:14, 39:8, 39:10, 49:28, 50:4, 52:27, 76:25, 81:17, 81:18, 95:21 new [9] - 25:11, 45:13, 49:29, 64:13, 93:15, 108:10, 108:13, 117:22, 117:26 news [10] - 6:28, 13:28, 19:6, 19:7, 19:8, 21:3, 23:8, 36:3, 44:27, 103:10 NEWS [2] - 3:2, 3:17 newspapers [2] -34:1, 34:19 NEWSPAPERS[3] -3:12, 3:17, 3:17 newsroom [2] - 10:7,

3:12, 3:17, 3:17
newsroom [2] - 10:7
23:7
next [7] - 9:18, 45:4,
87:6, 111:25, 119:2,
124:27, 124:29
nice [1] - 7:14
night [1] - 27:11
nobody [3] - 16:13,
63:6, 81:16
NOEL [1] - 2:16
none [1] - 85:19

normal [8] - 20:22,

37:20, 53:14, 55:9,

56:1, 64:9, 71:15,

117:7 normally [3] - 35:26, 51:16, 56:7 Northern [1] - 111:9 note [2] - 95:25, 103:21 notes [2] - 1:27,

15:17 **nothing** [6] - 22:4, 51:29, 56:4, 70:23, 86:1, 108:27 **notice** [4] - 12:21, 12:22, 26:4, 26:20 noticed [4] - 27:8, 28:18, 29:12, 82:3 **notion** [1] - 59:1 notwithstanding [1] - 122:1 November [12] -9:24, 68:13, 100:23, 114:20, 114:24, 114:26, 115:26, 115:29, 116:4, 121:11, 122:15, 122:21 nowadays [1] - 21:9 nowhere [2] - 52:4, number [32] - 7:6, 26:11, 29:24, 33:6, 44:21, 44:23, 46:3, 46:25, 49:9, 49:13, 49:24, 55:13, 64:14, 67:13, 69:4, 69:6, 69:7, 74:15, 82:26, 83:25, 85:27, 88:8, 88:16, 90:5, 97:15, 98:27, 99:7, 100:16, 107:7, 117:6, 121:10 numbers [5] - 68:24,

0

O'Brien [2] - 120:17,

69:3, 69:8, 69:14

109:17

Nóirín [5] - 58:28,

80:29, 91:12, 91:17,

120:22 O'BRIEN [2] - 5:5, 120:20 o'clock [1] - 120:6 O'DONNELL [1] -O'Grady [1] - 19:11 O'HIGGINS [25] -2:15, 2:22, 4:9, 4:16, 4:24, 9:14, 14:15, 14:16, 16:27, 39:17, 39:18, 46:17, 48:25, 50:14, 51:27, 52:6, 52:9, 53:2, 72:20, 81:24, 81:26, 85:5, 85:11, 85:14, 85:29 O'Higgins [8] -17:25, 51:26, 52:8, 54:26, 54:27, 54:29, 85:6. 106:24 O'KEEFFE [1] - 3:24 O'REILLY [1] - 2:27 O'Sullivan [27] -

15:7, 58:28, 80:29, 84:24, 91:17, 94:13, 97:7, 97:11, 97:14, 98:4, 98:29, 99:14, 99:23, 105:10, 109:17, 110:3, 110:4, 110:17, 110:24, 113:2, 113:21, 115:16, 116:11, 116:14, 116:18, 117:20, 118:3 O'Sullivan's [3] -91:12, 94:24, 114:23 O'TOOLE [1] - 3:8 O'Toole's [1] - 69:5 **objection** [2] - 57:23 objective [2] - 59:6, 60.8 obliged [1] - 38:6 observations [2] -27:25, 36:29 observe [1] - 32:10 **observed** [3] - 27:6, 33:4. 82:3 **observing** [1] - 60:3 obsessed [2] - 27:1, obsessional [1] -40.27 obsolescence [1] -109:14 obtain [1] - 50:19 obvious [1] - 31:9 obviously [16] - 7:5, 8:8, 28:19, 33:13, 34:4, 45:3, 59:11, 59:12, 59:15, 61:3, 63:1, 63:12, 67:2, 76:20, 77:26, 117:18 occasion [2] - 21:18, 47:20 occasions [4] -12:15, 30:11, 76:4, 111:10 occupy [1] - 67:15 occupying [1] - 22:2 occur [1] - 42:4 occurred [2] - 15:2, 47:1 occurs [1] - 11:15 October [2] - 49:23, 73:11 **OF** [4] - 1:3, 1:9, 1:12, 2:3 offer [1] - 80:27 offered [2] - 47:21, office [106] - 6:13, 12:10, 12:11, 13:29,

14:1, 18:21, 19:1,

19:2, 19:5, 19:9,
19:10, 20:23, 21:1,
21:3, 22:13, 22:15,
22:28, 23:9, 23:13,
23:15, 24:24, 24:26,
20.10, 24.24, 24.20,
25:12, 25:25, 26:7,
23.12, 23.23, 20.1,
26:13, 26:21, 27:21,
27:22, 28:16, 29:23,
29:27, 30:1, 30:23,
29.27, 30.1, 30.23,
32:28, 33:2, 34:8,
32.20, 33.2, 34.0,
34:9, 34:12, 34:15,
34.8, 34.12, 34.13,
34.20 35.16 35.22
34:20, 35:16, 35:22,
35:28, 40:4, 40:5,
33.26, 40.4, 40.3,
40.6 40.20 41.4
40:6, 40:20, 41:4,
41:8, 41:11, 41:21,
41.0, 41.11, 41.21,
42:10, 43:6, 43:7,
40.0 40.0 40.40
43:8, 43:9, 43:10,
43:16, 43:20, 43:25,
44:22, 45:2, 45:7,
45:9, 45:19, 47:29,
49:1, 49:3, 49:17,
49:22, 49:25, 52:13,
52:25, 61:18, 66:28,
70:17, 70:20, 71:17,
72:9, 72:13, 74:15,
_ , , , , , , , ,
74:19, 75:9, 77:24,
77:26, 80:11, 80:23,
82:15, 83:7, 83:16,
83:20, 86:16, 86:27,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27, 27:11, 27:16, 28:3,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27, 27:11, 27:16, 28:3, 28:7, 32:23, 39:20,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27, 27:11, 27:16, 28:3, 28:7, 32:23, 39:20, 43:19, 43:21, 44:5,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27, 27:11, 27:16, 28:3, 28:7, 32:23, 39:20, 43:19, 43:21, 44:5,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27, 27:11, 27:16, 28:3, 28:7, 32:23, 39:20,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27, 27:11, 27:16, 28:3, 28:7, 32:23, 39:20, 43:19, 43:21, 44:5, 45:26, 47:19, 57:5,
86:28, 94:8, 94:9, 98:13, 98:14, 113:2, 114:14, 117:28 OFFICE [1] - 2:18 Office [65] - 6:18, 6:20, 6:27, 7:15, 8:16, 8:21, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:8, 25:15, 25:21, 26:5, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 36:21, 43:27, 46:22, 52:28, 66:10, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:9, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:8, 79:18, 79:21, 79:25, 81:10, 81:18, 81:29, 82:22, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 Officer [25] - 20:27, 27:11, 27:16, 28:3, 28:7, 32:23, 39:20, 43:19, 43:21, 44:5,

64:10, 64:11, 64:13, 65:1, 65:10, 66:3, 66:22, 82:7, 83:3 officer [1] - 47:10 officers [6] - 70:7, 82:27, 82:29, 96:25, 96:28, 97:1 Officers [11] - 7:6, 10:24, 20:29, 21:2, 25:10, 27:8, 27:20, 27:29, 39:21, 64:6, 64:15 officers' [2] - 22:19, 34.14 offices [1] - 43:10 Official [1] - 40:1 official [2] - 47:23, 49:8 officially [1] - 20:18 often [3] - 41:8, 44:29, 49:16 Oireachtas [1] -77:15 Oisín [1] - 87:21 Oisín-type [1] -87:21 old [8] - 51:20, 93:15, 95:1, 95:3, 95:6, 95:7, 95:12, 101:18 older [2] - 64:15, 107:17 **ON** [4] - 1:6, 1:10, 1:18. 6:1 once [9] - 10:22, 10:26, 35:11, 56:20, 72:8, 85:12, 88:27, 103:26, 106:3 one [80] - 14:16, 16:28, 17:3, 17:22, 18:14, 19:28, 20:1, 27:2, 27:19, 27:27, 29:12, 32:12, 32:14, 32:27, 37:11, 47:20, 48:13, 49:2, 49:13, 49:25, 61:7, 61:12, 64:25, 64:28, 65:3, 65:6, 66:24, 69:5, 71:20, 76:21, 82:6, 82:9, 82:10, 86:14, 90:3, 90:12, 91:11, 93:3, 95:13, 95:27, 97:21, 97:23, 97:27, 98:11, 99:14, 99:15, 99:16, 99:25, 100:17, 100:21, 101:15, 101:24, 101:28,

103:28, 104:9,

104:11, 105:28,

105:29, 107:18,

109:3, 109:4, 110:22, 110:26, 110:28, 115:1, 115:28, 116:1, 116:29, 117:15, 120:5, 122:10, 123:11 one-to-one [3] -27:19, 27:27, 32:27 ones [5] - 67:1, 69:12. 100:19. 107:18, 116:2 ongoing [1] - 52:22 ons [6] - 113:20, 118:8, 118:25, 121:25, 122:9 open [7] - 12:12, 12:26, 36:21, 40:10, 55:19, 86:24, 86:25 opened [1] - 49:14 operated [2] - 40:24, 54:9 operating [3] -92:13, 107:17, 108:13 operational [2] -71:13, 89:1 operationally [1] -101:11 operations [4] -88:10, 88:23, 93:2, 121.2 Operations [4] -109:19, 112:19, 112:21, 120:24 **opinion** [2] - 21:5, 27.24 opposed [2] - 60:9, option [1] - 51:17 optiplex [1] - 116:1 orchestrated [1] -81:8 order [5] - 65:29, 91:4, 92:28, 96:11, 103:2 **orders** [1] - 95:23 organisation [7] -89:28, 92:12, 93:4, 93:13, 96:6, 96:29, 102:23 original [1] - 123:14 originally [1] - 24:14 OSMOND [1] - 2:19 OTHER [1] - 1:4 otherwise [3] -15:18, 15:19, 84:20 ourselves [1] - 38:6 outer [1] - 62:17 outline [3] - 87:24, 88:20, 112:8 outlined [3] - 59:20,

outside [4] - 28:15, 43:15, 60:14, 100:20 overnight [2] -30:26, 31:13 own [15] - 19:21, 20:23, 21:1, 21:10, 43:16, 43:17, 49:9, 54:22, 104:7, 104:8, 106:9, 108:23, 117:25, 119:21

Р

PAC [3] - 77:25,

77:27, 78:3

package [2] - 49:12, 119:23 page [16] - 6:25, 9:27, 14:17, 14:22, 14:23, 14:24, 15:4, 24:4, 24:9, 48:27, 68:13, 68:21, 73:11, 73:27, 87:7 **PAGE**[1] - 4:2 paid [1] - 115:23 paper [3] - 30:7, 30:13, 37:15 papers [5] - 7:3, 21:21, 35:18, 72:3, 72.4 paramount [1] -108:16 paranoia [1] - 83:12 pardon [1] - 52:6 park [2] - 18:24, 22:10 parked [1] - 22:25 parks [1] - 22:25 PARLIAMENT[1] -2:25 part [18] - 11:17, 28:23, 34:14, 35:22, 41:6. 52:1. 56:10. 56:11, 56:13, 75:25, 82:23, 89:4, 93:13, 95:11, 100:22, 107:15, 125:8 particular [38] - 7:9, 8:2, 10:15, 13:1, 13:20, 13:22, 28:8, 29:13, 30:19, 38:4, 41:12, 41:13, 43:2, 44:12, 50:6, 54:24, 68:27, 71:20, 71:23, 73:22, 74:7, 75:23, 77:3, 81:5, 84:14, 88:11, 88:20, 96:27, 99:22, 100:28, 101:4,

104:12, 108:18,

particularly [3] -33:14, 60:29, 73:28 parties [5] - 9:27, 24:5, 55:19, 56:22, 56:23 partitioned [1] -107:29 partitions [1] -107:28 party [1] - 10:21 pass [1] - 47:7 **PASSED**[1] - 1:5 passing [1] - 55:7 password [2] -98:18, 113:11 past [4] - 27:8, 30:29, 51:18, 83:13 path [1] - 87:24 **PATRICIA**[1] - 2:32 **PATRICK**[3] - 2:6, 4:29, 87:10 Patrick [1] - 87:7 **PAUL**[2] - 2:10, 3:3 **Paul** [5] - 33:25, 37:12, 45:11, 65:22, 65:28 pays [1] - 56:6 PC [17] - 92:15, 97:27, 98:6, 100:17, 100:24, 101:6, 101:12, 101:13, 103:19, 105:6, 113:22, 117:26, 118:14, 119:3, 119:21, 121:12 PCs [14] - 89:8, 89:27, 93:15, 93:19, 95:12, 97:13, 97:15, 98:3, 100:16, 107:26, 113:11, 113:27, 114:3 people [24] - 11:20, 12:27, 20:5, 21:9, 25:11, 34:23, 40:26, 41:9, 41:13, 41:14, 47:29, 51:13, 63:4, 70:6, 74:20, 74:22, 75:25. 77:18. 80:11. 85:7, 87:22, 94:22, 119:25 per [1] - 121:11 percent [1] - 84:11 perfectly [1] - 101:12 performed [1] -121:10 perhaps [19] - 8:14, 12:17, 14:26, 32:13, 36:20, 40:27, 42:3,

45:17, 57:15, 58:4,

109:27, 109:28,

115:28

59:21, 93:14

59:5, 60:9, 63:11, 64:26, 78:20, 83:12, 84:24, 85:15, 125:2 period [26] - 7:5, 7:16, 7:27, 8:5, 13:19, 28:29, 33:3, 46:20, 73:9, 77:17, 81:12, 91:26, 94:24, 95:20, 95:27, 97:8, 100:15, 103:6, 106:2, 106:6, 112:28, 116:8, 118:26, 121:1, 124:1 permissions [1] person [16] - 10:18, 10:22, 10:28, 11:23, 16:6, 16:8, 25:13, 30:1, 39:4, 39:7, 45:28, 53:27, 60:8, 84:11, 84:12, 98:21 person's [1] - 53:29 personal [13] -12:23, 21:11, 21:14, 26:18, 44:23, 48:10, 94:8, 94:11, 94:17, 96:23, 96:24, 106:10, 117:21 personality [2] -25:13. 70:5 personally [5] - 14:8, 70:29, 71:22, 72:15, 115:1 personnel [4] - 25:6, 26:17, 39:26, 117:27 persons [2] - 11:23, 45.28 perspective [1] -42:24 pertained [2] -116:10, 116:14 pertaining [1] -116.18 pertinent [1] - 38:8 Peter [1] - 124:25 **PETER** [3] - 1:12, 2:2. 2:4 PHELAN[1] - 3:30 phone [27] - 10:29, 12:18, 12:22, 27:27, 28:11, 29:24, 29:27, 33:20, 35:27, 37:4, 40:21, 48:3, 49:7, 49:8, 49:19, 49:20, 49:24, 49:26, 50:4, 51:13, 52:11, 65:23, 66:17, 69:3, 72:11, 74:10. 74:14 phoned [1] - 17:17 phones [2] - 51:20, 91:22

phoning [1] - 29:19 photograph [2] -84:1, 84:13 physical [3] - 90:20, 90:23, 107:23 pick [1] - 85:17 picture [1] - 28:8 piece [3] - 82:16, 82:17, 84:14 pieces [1] - 62:20 place [11] - 8:21, 18:1, 26:23, 38:13, 95:23, 99:9, 99:11, 104:27, 112:17, 117:29, 122:22 placed [2] - 46:3, plan [4] - 93:12, 95:11, 108:15 planned [1] - 95:19 planning[1] - 88:25 plugs [1] - 113:29 point [15] - 22:29, 38:7, 43:18, 44:5, 44:8, 51:29, 53:7, 54:25, 58:5, 58:18, 65:18, 68:15, 77:3, 83:20, 95:21 pointed [1] - 72:8 policy [4] - 95:14, 99:8, 99:11, 108:25 political [1] - 77:21 popular [1] - 36:1 portion [1] - 59:11 position [4] - 21:21, 39:20, 47:7, 49:5 positive [2] - 9:7, 40.28 possible [3] -109:24, 124:19 possibly [13] - 12:20, 19:23, 34:7, 37:3, 40:13, 50:10, 64:16, 66:8, 66:19, 77:9, 78:8, 80:4, 95:28 post [1] - 51:3 posted [2] - 50:1, 51:3 practice [1] - 109:21 precede [1] - 124:1 preceded [1] - 110:8 predecessors [1] -

70.6

prefer [1] - 62:29

prepare [1] - 7:25

prepared [1] - 7:3

presence [1] - 82:5

present [5] - 16:7,

preparing [2] -

116:23, 121:4

16:13, 63:1, 73:8, 99:12 presently [2] - 60:27, 61:23 preservation [2] -95:23, 96:11 press [17] - 11:18, 11:19, 25:16, 30:9, 30:17, 35:26, 36:26, 38:14, 38:29, 61:17, 70:7, 72:12, 75:12, 76:2, 76:8, 82:26, 82.29 Press [101] - 6:17, 6:20, 6:26, 7:6, 7:15, 8:16, 8:20, 9:29, 10:5, 10:6, 10:23, 10:24, 11:5, 11:8, 11:26, 13:10, 13:13, 13:19, 14:7, 17:11, 17:17, 18:9, 20:16, 20:27, 20:29, 21:2, 24:12, 24:14, 24:28, 25:1, 25:7, 25:10, 25:15, 25:21, 26:4, 27:8, 27:11, 27:16, 27:20, 27:29, 28:3, 28:7, 28:28, 29:3, 29:19, 30:26, 32:23, 36:21, 39:19, 39:21, 43:18, 43:21, 43:27, 44:5, 45:26, 46:21, 47:19, 52:27, 57:5, 57:8, 61:19, 64:2, 64:6, 64:10. 64:11. 64:13. 64:15, 65:1, 65:9, 66:3, 66:10, 66:22, 68:9, 69:16, 69:25, 72:6, 73:5, 74:4, 74:8, 75:13, 75:22, 76:14, 76:15, 76:24, 77:19, 77:21, 77:29, 79:7, 79:18. 79:21. 79:25. 81:9, 81:18, 81:29, 82:7, 82:22, 83:2, 85:8, 85:17, 86:15, 91:27 pressure [2] - 27:12, 27:16 presumably [1] -117:19 presume [1] - 111:7 pretty [5] - 39:6, 79:10, 98:22, 102:24, 103:9 previous [16] - 27:8, 70:3, 83:23, 94:27, 104:10, 104:15, 112:25, 113:9, 114:18, 114:20,

123:29 86.10 113:3 65:17 108:18 102:20 93:14 75:15 100:23 112:4 80:28 58.6

properly [1] - 60:6

property [1] - 43:5

115:7, 121:26, 122:2, Prosecutions [1] -122:24, 123:25, 38:25 previously [2] -58:14, 59:20 1:3, 1:4 PREVIOUSLY [1] primarily [1] - 7:23 print [2] - 25:19, 42:6 printed [1] - 42:21 printer [1] - 42:12 printers [1] - 89:8 prison [1] - 53:21 privacy [1] - 69:2 private [8] - 40:22, 105:27 47:25, 49:6, 49:9, 74:10, 74:14, 112:25, privilege [1] - 66:24 privileged [1] - 22:16 **privy** [2] - 30:14, problem [3] - 44:23, 75:15, 80:22 problems [3] - 9:9, 12:11, 48:1 procedure [3] -37:20, 115:17, 115:19 112:15 procedures [1] -71:6, 78:29 process [2] - 30:23, 37:14, 52:19 processes [1] processing [2] -90:15, 117:16 professional [3] -41.6 70.2 83.1 professionalism [1] project [8] - 26:9, 92:10, 92:20, 92:28, 93:3, 96:5, 97:17, projects [3] - 72:11, 109:22, 109:27 115:12 promise [1] - 125:10 promoted [4] -24:22, 64:16, 88:9, promotion [1] - 73:9 promotions [1] prompted [2] - 30:6, proof [1] - 120:8 proper [2] - 57:21,

protect [1] - 69:2 PROTECTED [2] protected [13] - 8:2, 13:1, 14:2, 34:23, 35:2, 56:12, 56:27, 57:7, 57:8, 59:29, 68:17, 73:16, 81:2 protecting [1] - 45:8 provide [10] - 15:16, 38:27, 38:28, 41:7, 46:11, 47:3, 91:16, 103:15, 103:23. provided [16] -14:21, 24:3, 24:6, 44:10, 48:29, 50:18, 51:1, 61:7, 68:12, 82:1, 99:5, 108:5, 114:29, 116:5, 116:16, 116:21 provides [2] -119:15, 119:25 providing [1] - 75:28 public [6] - 7:2, 8:12, 25:16, 25:23, 61:18, Public [3] - 38:24, published [2] -Pulse [32] - 78:9, 80:4, 80:5, 84:13, 89:12, 89:14, 89:15, 89:16, 89:18, 89:23, 89:26, 89:29, 90:2, 90:9, 90:19, 90:24, 90:27, 97:20, 98:16, 101:12, 101:13, 116:29, 117:3, 117:8, 117:14, 117:17, 118:6, 118:9, 119:22, 122:26, 123:5 purchase [1] purchased [3] -104:16, 115:9, 123:11 purpose [4] - 16:25, 43:13, 84:1, 90:26 purposes [4] - 82:2, 113:7, 119:10, 119:25 pursued [1] - 57:15 pushed [1] - 66:11 put [17] - 11:16, 11:18, 14:1, 17:25, 19:7, 49:14, 49:28, 50:21, 50:23, 51:2, 54:18, 59:5, 63:7,

63:10, 76:27, 77:1, 88:24 **puts** [1] - 54:29 **putting** [1] - 76:7 puzzled [2] - 122:8, 122:13 Q qualifications [3] -88:17, 112:8, 112:9 quarter [1] - 30:28 QUAY [2] - 2:12, 3:20 queries [11] - 7:24, 8:15, 10:12, 10:13, 11:5, 11:12, 35:26, 35:28, 71:16, 72:10, 121:4 query [7] - 10:14, 10:17, 35:20, 36:8, 116:6, 118:7 question-andanswer [1] - 14:24 question-mark [1] -79:29 QUESTIONED [4] -4:11, 4:17, 18:5, 63:29 questions [29] -8:26, 9:14, 14:10, 14:12, 14:13, 37:7, 39:14, 39:15, 53:5, 53:23, 54:18, 54:29, 63:21, 72:18, 72:19, 72:20, 81:21, 81:22, 81:27, 106:20, 106:22, 106:23, 107:4, 118:19, 118:20, 118:24, 124:6, 124:7, 124:8 quick [1] - 107:4 quickly [2] - 38:3, 44:27 quite [10] - 12:16, 12:26, 26:9, 29:19, 30:12, 34:23, 41:15, 43:6, 46:15, 56:24

R

radar [2] - 14:6, 78:4 raise [1] - 57:22 raised [5] - 11:6, 55:11, 57:24, 118:7, 121:4 rang [6] - 45:9, 45:10, 51:2, 65:29, 74:15. 74:16 rank [2] - 25:11,

26:24 ranks [1] - 101:22 rapport [1] - 26:23 rare [1] - 21:11 RE [4] - 4:10, 4:32, 17.1 110.13 re [10] - 63:3, 100:4, 102:4, 102:7, 102:22, 123:15, 123:16, 123:26 re-allocated [1] -123:26 RE-EXAMINED [4] -4:10, 4:32, 17:1, 110:13 re-imaged [4] -102:7, 102:22, 123:26 re-imaging [2] -123:15, 123:16 re-set [2] - 100:4, 102:4 reach [1] - 29:29 reaches [1] - 40:27 read [7] - 25:26, 30:7, 34:26, 35:18, 42:20, 50:8, 72:3 reading [7] - 30:19, 33:27, 33:29, 34:18, 40:1, 75:26 real [3] - 12:11, 48:21, 61:29 reality [1] - 62:4 reallocated [1] -101:7 really [5] - 42:19, 47:11, 77:20, 77:22, 77:24 reappeared [1] reason [6] - 47:3, 47:6. 69:18. 90:24. 118:1, 121:21 reasonable [1] - 58:3 reasonably [1] -85:25 reasons [3] - 30:15, 95:3 95:13 rebuilt [2] - 101:6, 101:11 recalled [1] - 57:28 receive [3] - 63:4, 84:27. 106:7

received [8] - 16:13, 44:17, 74:9, 88:8, 91:19, 96:1, 104:28, 112.24 receiving [1] - 74:20 recently [1] - 121:1 rechecked [1] -97:26

recollection [2] -79:17, 79:19 record [2] - 99:3, 107:7 recorded [6] - 16:11, 101:25, 101:27, 101:28, 102:11, 119:3 records [5] - 101:20, 102:17, 104:7, 123:26, 123:29 redeployed [1] -101:11 refer [2] - 15:26, 90.19 reference [16] - 7:29, 12:28, 34:25, 41:27, 48:26, 48:27, 53:11, 68:22, 83:24, 91:29, 97:28, 97:29, 100:19, 100:21, 107:7, 110:15 referred [4] - 18:2, 19:10, 63:11, 121:27 referring [3] - 40:12, 60:20, 107:9 refers [1] - 107:12 reflect [7] - 31:5, 53:13, 69:14, 81:4, 81:7, 81:14, 102:17 reflecting [1] - 57:2 reflection [1] - 81:15 reflects [3] - 28:26, 28:27, 57:11 refurbishment [1] -26.8 regard [8] - 15:29, 40:26, 58:29, 59:13, 59:18, 76:17, 78:22, 80:28 regarded [1] - 58:4 regarding [3] -30:14, 59:16, 115:11 regardless [2] -26:24, 61:1 regards [1] - 47:16 regional [1] - 99:10 register [2] - 109:25, 115:14 registers [1] - 99:6 **REGISTRAR**[1] - 2:4 regular [5] - 29:13, 33:2, 48:16, 62:28, 65:11 regularly [1] - 56:6 relate [3] - 12:7, 44:19, 61:29 related [4] - 91:11, 91:26, 110:22, 116:7 relates [1] - 36:7

relation [113] - 8:3, 9:4, 10:15, 11:4, 11:6, 11:9, 11:12, 15:26, 17:12, 26:10, 27:25, 28:13, 30:3, 33:12, 33:15, 35:5, 42:3, 42:6, 43:3, 46:26, 47:5, 48:29, 50:18, 53:15, 55:2, 55:10, 55:13, 56:2, 56:28, 57:20, 57:24, 59:15, 59:18, 59:23, 59:24, 59:27, 59:29, 60:18, 60:21, 60:23, 60:26, 60:27, 61:5, 61:6, 61:26, 62:22, 63:2. 63:16, 65:22, 65:26, 67:12, 68:16, 69:4, 70:8, 70:13, 70:28, 71:8, 71:13, 71:21, 71:23, 72:5, 72:12, 73:23, 74:17, 78:1, 78:24, 79:22, 81:28, 83:1, 83:28, 84:18, 87:20, 87:21, 89:2, 89:3, 89:11, 91:5, 91:14, 94:23, 94:27, 97:6, 98:6, 98:14, 99:25, 100:12, 100:25, 102:19, 103:4, 104:2, 104:19, 104:24, 105:3, 105:13, 106:12, 106:14, 107:5, 107:8, 107:20, 108:9, 109:4, 109:13, 109:14, 109:17, 110:3, 110:29, 116:21, 118:25, 119:5, 121:5, 121:25, 123:7, 123:15 relations [2] - 25:16, 61:18 relationship [14] -12:5, 26:16, 32:6, 32:8, 32:11, 58:25, 64:24, 65:1, 65:3, 69:29, 70:2, 73:29, 74:24 relationships [1] -61.13 relatively [2] - 9:28, 24:6 relay [2] - 62:16 release [3] - 11:18, 11:19, 32:5 released [1] - 45:28

releasing [1] - 30:18

relevance [2] -

relevancy [3] -

52:24, 122:9

54:21, 55:11, 57:26 relevant [14] - 47:8, 56:22, 56:24, 57:1, 57:2, 57:4, 57:6, 57:17, 81:12, 96:9, 97:8, 100:15, 112:28, 115.6 remain [3] - 7:16, 25:1, 118:26 remained [2] - 6:20, 7:19 remark [1] - 79:3 remember [6] - 7:6, 8:14, 8:15, 22:5, 34:3, 72:2 remote [2] - 103:15, 119:27 removal [1] - 121:22 remove [1] - 93:19 removed [2] - 43:25, 53.25 removing [2] - 43:13, 94:28 repair [1] - 99:27 repaired [1] - 99:29 repeat [1] - 110:19 repeating [3] - 77:10, 80.18 80.21 replace [2] - 92:14, 101:4 replaced [11] -26:13, 92:24, 97:16, 100:22, 100:24, 107:18, 114:11, 114:21, 114:23, 116:1, 121:17 replacement [1] -114:19 replacing [1] - 92:11 reply [1] - 38:18 report [6] - 30:26, 31:13, 41:29, 44:14, 116:24, 121:4 reported [6] - 96:2, 100:16, 100:19, 104:15, 104:17 reporter [1] - 39:7 reporting [1] - 7:19 reports [6] - 15:18, 30:24, 31:6, 41:27, 42:7, 42:15 represent [1] - 82:13 request [7] - 38:14, 42:11, 42:13, 83:28, 91:19, 91:26, 112:24 requested [1] - 91:16 requests [10] - 46:5, 46:10, 48:28, 68:25, 71:8, 71:12, 71:13, 71:18, 72:10, 113:18

relating [4] - 31:4,

46:4, 46:5, 123:29

require [2] - 41:4, 81:15 required [1] - 106:11 RESOLUTIONS [1] -1:5 respect [3] - 37:20, 60:14, 91:19 respectful [2] -56:17, 57:20 respond [3] - 10:17, 10:29. 36:13 response [4] - 10:22, 11:8, 36:8, 36:20 responses [1] -10:18 responsibilities [1] -90.7 responsibility [4] -88:21, 89:3, 89:5, 89.11 responsible [7] -41:14, 54:19, 88:10, 88:23, 88:25, 88:28, 89:5 responsibly [1] -58:18 rest [2] - 22:1, 51:24 result [1] - 97:3 **RESUMED** [2] - 6:1, 68.1 retain [2] - 95:3, 95:12 retained [2] - 92:28, 96:9 retaining [1] - 95:5 **retention** [1] - 90:10 retire [1] - 29:6 retirement [4] -102:13, 102:21, 115:10, 123:12 retrieve [1] - 106:10 return [3] - 68:17, 75:9. 99:11 returned [10] - 24:28, 99:3, 99:26, 101:9, 101:25, 101:27, 101:29, 102:1, 102:11, 104:18 returning [1] -116:22 reused [1] - 95:28 revealed [1] - 66:17 revisit [1] - 70:15 rid [1] - 48:12 rights [2] - 63:4, 63:5 ring[7] - 29:23, 29:29, 36:2, 36:3, 36:4, 46:29, 66:5 ringing [2] - 33:1, 74:13

rise [1] - 31:8 risk [1] - 92:14 risks [1] - 93:4 Road [1] - 88:3 role [13] - 6:26, 7:1, 10:4, 21:9, 45:13, 45:14, 49:29, 57:5, 72:9, 83:2, 83:28, 88:21, 112:23 roles [2] - 88:6, 90:7 **RONAN** [2] - 2:31, room [12] - 12:17, 12:18, 12:24, 18:11, 51:19, 61:14, 62:17, 62:22. 102:9. 105:16. 105:20, 123:27 rooms [1] - 18:9 ROSSA [1] - 3:3 round [1] - 92:21 routine [1] - 71:16 RTÉ [2] - 2:31, 2:32 rule [12] - 10:23, 53:15, 54:1, 54:13, 54:14, 55:9, 55:27, 56:2, 57:25, 58:6, 58:15, 63:3 rules [1] - 54:8 Rules [1] - 54:13 ruling [1] - 65:27 rumour [3] - 78:8, 78:11. 80:2 rumours [1] - 73:22 running [2] - 44:22, 57:21 Ryan [7] - 87:7, 87:13, 87:18, 115:5, 116:23. 118:14. 118:15

S

RYAN [4] - 4:29,

87:10, 107:1, 110:13

safeguarding [1] 108:15
safekeeping [1] 115:5
SAINT [2] - 3:5, 3:10
sane [1] - 59:2
satisfied [3] - 96:21,
98:8, 109:8
Saturday [3] - 18:17,
20:7, 43:11
save [3] - 94:2,
108:1, 108:8
saved [1] - 94:9
saw [6] - 12:10,
42:25, 43:13, 43:15,

50:2, 81:18 **SC** [9] - 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 2:15, 2:22, 3:3 scale [3] - 92:10, 92:19, 93:3 scene [3] - 75:10, 82:9, 82:14 scenes [1] - 82:4 schedule [1] - 27:15 scheduled [1] scintilla [1] - 85:18 screen [4] - 14:18, 36:6, 42:20, 69:1 scroll [1] - 36:16 sealed [1] - 49:12 SEAN[1] - 2:11 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:6 search [2] - 104:7, 112:26 searched [1] -121:18 searches [2] - 87:20, 121:10 SEBASTIAN[1] -3:13 second [8] - 54:3, 58:21, 60:2, 95:17, 107:11, 115:25, 116:24, 116:25 second-last [1] -107:11 seconded [1] -112:12 secondly [1] - 66:22 secretary [3] - 21:6, 112:25. 113:3 secretive [1] - 12:16 Secrets [1] - 40:1 sectio [1] - 112:13 section [8] - 49:18, 88:5, 88:28, 99:4, 99:26, 112:21, 117:27, 120:23 sections [2] - 88:6, 88.88 sector [1] - 88:16 secure [5] - 95:18, 97:24, 103:15, 103:18, 103:22 securely [2] - 95:22, 103:21 security [3] - 41:20, 88:10, 92:14 see [27] - 14:23, 15:12, 26:25, 31:22, 32:12, 36:5, 36:7, 36:11. 36:13. 38:6. 43:18, 44:8, 52:23,

55:6, 59:16, 59:23, 59:25, 60:6, 60:8, 60:23, 65:13, 65:16, 65:19, 83:14, 84:10, 117:24 seeking [1] - 46:25 seem [1] - 61:29 self [1] - 54:14 self-corroboration [1] - 54:14 send [3] - 47:12, 49:29, 106:8 sending [2] - 106:7, 119.28 senior [4] - 45:22, 96:25, 96:28, 97:1 sense [11] - 60:8, 76:26, 77:10, 77:11, 82:19, 83:21, 85:2, 85:20, 98:26, 104:1, 105:24 sensitive [6] - 30:14, 39:25, 40:2, 40:4, 40:12, 40:14 sensitivities [1] -31.24 sensitivity [1] -31:21 sent [7] - 7:4, 37:19, 38:24, 58:29, 100:3, 104:28, 120:2 sentence [1] - 53:21 separate [3] - 59:26, 60:13, 123:4 separately [1] - 95:9 September [7] -6:24, 36:18, 44:11, 99:17, 102:10, 112:23, 112:24 sequence [1] - 123:9 SERGEANT[13] -4:7, 4:13, 4:19, 4:22, 4:26, 5:1, 9:21, 24:1, 68:5, 73:1, 81:24, 86:10. 112:1 sergeant [29] - 7:26, 9:18, 9:23, 10:6, 17:2, 19:21, 19:23, 20:1, 20:2, 24:3, 24:8, 35:25, 37:10, 38:26, 39:18, 43:7, 49:3, 50:11, 50:14, 51:27, 58:1, 68:3, 68:27, 72:25, 81:26, 112:18, 118:24, 120:10, 120:12 **Sergeant** [52] - 8:4, 8:12, 11:7, 13:4, 13:12, 13:21, 14:6,

16:22, 16:25, 23:23,

34:5, 34:16, 34:17, 35:5, 35:12, 37:11, 37:16, 38:22, 38:26, 52:10, 53:9, 65:26, 68:8, 68:20, 69:24, 70:9, 71:1, 71:2, 71:8, 71:29, 72:7, 73:4, 73:21, 76:13, 76:15, 77:29, 78:2, 78:4, 78:6, 78:20, 79:26, 79:29, 80:25, 81:9, 83:10, 86:6, 86:13, 87:21, 97:9, 112:3, 112:6 sergeants [12] -7:23, 11:25, 18:14, 19:7, 19:19, 19:20, 19:29, 35:16, 39:28, 40:5, 72:14 serial [1] - 114:4 series [1] - 37:14 serious [9] - 31:4, 42:3, 46:4, 46:5, 46:26, 46:29, 75:18, 82:4, 82:15 seriousness [1] -11:22 serve [1] - 53:20 served [1] - 91:4 server [3] - 48:6, 48:7. 48:8 **service** [3] - 41:7, 113:29, 117:13 Service [1] - 111:9 Services [1] - 1:25 services [2] - 56:7, 103:12 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:30 set [8] - 10:18, 33:10, 61:28, 90:8, 91:4, 100:4, 102:4, 107:11 settled [1] - 124:27 seven [9] - 11:27, 18:14. 19:19. 27:10. 30:29, 64:4, 83:13, 83:14, 92:22 seven-and-a-half [1] - 92:22 several [1] - 120:29 sexual [8] - 13:22, 37:24, 37:28, 56:7, 73:23, 78:8, 80:3, 80.7 **SGT**[1] - 2:9 **shadowing** [1] - 7:23 **SHANE** [1] - 2:14 share [9] - 93:17, 93:20, 93:28, 94:2, 94:4. 94:10. 96:17. 96:20, 118:4

89:10, 108:24, shared [1] - 108:1 63:9, 66:4, 105:20 63:11, 97:1, 103:8 shares [8] - 93:8, six [7] - 11:25, 19:5, specified [2] - 90:12, 115:26, 116:3, 116:4, strained [1] - 26:17 93:10, 94:8, 94:15, 39:23, 64:4, 67:1, 112:27 116:5, 116:21, **STREET** [6] - 2:19, 95:21, 101:14 116:23, 116:25, 94:17, 94:19, 108:6 **specify** [1] - 116:9 2:25, 2:28, 3:5, 3:9, size [2] - 43:8, 51:14 **sharing** [2] - 18:11, speech [1] - 21:22 121:11, 122:18, 3.19 123:22 75:3 slung [1] - 22:6 speeches [1] - 21:26 stress [1] - 27:12 shift [3] - 68:28, statements [2] small [2] - 23:14, spend [1] - 20:16 strong [2] - 40:29, 15:18, 57:14 80:11, 83:18 85:27 80:26 spent [1] - 20:29 statements' [1] **shiftiness** [1] - 54:5 smear [6] - 84:20, split [1] - 19:19 **structures** [1] - 7:19 10:21 84:28, 85:8, 85:9, **shifts** [2] - 18:7, **struggling** [1] - 18:8 spoken [1] - 65:29 85:10, 85:18 Station [3] - 87:27, 70:25 student [2] - 87:27, **Spotlight** [6] - 8:17, **SHIP** [1] - 2:19 SMITHFIELD [1] -88:2, 88:3 11:17, 14:1, 14:2, 2:29 **station** [4] - 89:8, shocked [4] - 39:6, 68:22, 68:29 studied [2] - 88:12, 90:4, 90:22, 119:2 66:16, 66:19, 66:20 **smooth** [1] - 44:22 spreading [1] - 73:22 88:14 stations [2] - 93:8, **short** [4] - 9:28, 24:6, snippets [1] - 62:20 Square [1] - 6:14 **studying** [1] - 112:11 66:11. 73:9 **SOLE** [2] - 1:12, 2:2 103:29 staff [23] - 10:24, stuff [2] - 51:17, shorter [3] - 19:25, stay [4] - 41:4, 64:13, solicitor [3] - 17:17, 61.12 12:8. 19:8. 25:6. 64:15, 111:19 20:8, 20:9 62:14, 79:18 25:15, 25:20, 26:19, style [5] - 39:19, stenographic [1] shortly [1] - 79:17 **SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:7 26:24, 26:26, 30:21, 40:23, 70:5, 70:6, 1:27 **show** [2] - 62:23, SOLICITOR'S [1] -35:15, 35:16, 37:2, 75:5 STENOGRAPHY[1] 83.9 2.18 45:27, 70:20, 74:14, subject [9] - 25:16, SOLICITORS [7] -76:27, 77:7, 79:25, - 1:30 37:17, 37:23, 37:27, showed [2] - 74:10, stenography [1] -114:10 2:24, 2:28, 3:4, 3:8, 80:9, 81:18, 104:28 38:12, 38:22, 39:7, 3:18, 3:24, 3:30 stage [6] - 29:5, 1:25 44:13, 109:7 **shower** [1] - 19:3 29:10, 34:10, 35:23, stepping [1] - 33:21 showing [3] - 56:25, solution [7] - 94:6, submission [3] -60:18, 101:19 steps [3] - 41:17, 56:17, 57:21, 60:17 94:12. 104:26. 57:4, 116:26 104:29, 105:5, 105:8, stairs [4] - 19:2, 45:24, 92:27 submissions [1] **shows** [1] - 36:20 106.9 19:3, 19:4, 19:9 still [13] - 13:13, 54.22 sic [1] - 94:3 20:13, 25:2, 36:4, side [6] - 76:28, someone [4] - 21:21, stand [5] - 55:8, subsequent [2] -38:5, 49:17, 49:25, 50:25, 116:20 76:29, 77:1, 77:16, 66:21, 96:2, 118:25 59:9, 59:28, 61:27, 49:27, 95:24, 106:7, 63:19 subsequently [4] sometimes 131 -82:20, 120:24 28:7, 40:9, 82:3 stand-alone [1] -109:11, 122:1, 122:22 33:25, 57:23, 84:12, $\textbf{sides} \ [2] - 40:26,$ **stint** [1] - 24:21 64:22 somewhat [2] - 62:5, 59:28 stood [1] - 82:9 63:12 standalone [1] substantiate [1] sign [2] - 122:27, stop [1] - 60:2 15:19 **sorry** [25] - 11:29, 107:22 122:28 storage [8] - 93:21, 13:26, 14:8, 16:28, standard [6] - 8:18, significant [3] suggest [1] - 118:1 94:6, 94:11, 94:12, 17:22, 22:17, 24:17, 10:22, 11:7, 26:7, suggestion [2] -14:27, 56:27, 92:7 115:17, 119:22 105:24, 105:25, 105:16, 105:19 25:8, 37:25, 46:15, signpost [1] - 15:20 105:27, 121:23 signs [1] - 44:26 46:17, 47:14, 50:5, standing [1] - 22:27 suicides [1] - 31:24 store [2] - 51:16, 51:26, 64:10, 67:11, star [1] - 58:15 **summary** [1] - 89:19 SIM [9] - 48:29, 81:6, 87:28, 87:29, start [3] - 19:27, 105:16 summer [2] - 13:20, 49:11, 49:26, 49:28, 94:5, 98:5, 105:18, 106:2, 125:2 stored [9] - 93:19, 14.5 50:2, 50:21, 51:17, 105:21, 110:19, 125:5 started [5] - 6:12, 93:27, 93:28, 107:22, Sun [1] - 29:17 51:18, 61:6 107:24, 108:10, similar [2] - 47:29, **sort** [6] - 7:23, 10:23, 18:19, 19:11, 20:18, Sunday [5] - 18:17, 32:6, 43:26, 69:29, 109:9, 122:5, 122:7 91:19 20:26 20:7, 20:9, 43:12, storeroom [2] **starting** [1] - 83:14 Simon [1] - 123:24 74.7 97:23, 97:24 sought [1] - 56:20 **STATE**[1] - 2:18 **Sundrive**[1] - 88:3 **SIMON** [2] - 3:18, soundness [1] - 59:6 state [1] - 15:7 storey [1] - 22:3 **SUNLIGHT** [1] - 2:24 3:18 source [1] - 66:17 stories [6] - 22:2, **simply** [3] - 14:6, State [1] - 49:7 SUPERINTENDENT 27:13, 28:4, 52:19, sources [1] - 99:8 statement [43] -66:3, 78:23 [4] - 4:29, 87:10, 75:19, 83:26 space [4] - 22:4. 6:24, 7:22, 9:24, 9:28, 107:1, 110:13 sincere [1] - 6:4 48:8, 62:17, 94:11 story [9] - 28:9, 36:1, single [3] - 18:16, 24:4, 24:6, 24:7, superintendent [15] 36:2, 38:2, 71:3, speaking [5] - 40:17, 24:18, 26:12, 33:10. - 11:29, 18:15, 20:22, 122:27, 122:28 75:25, 77:20, 79:15, 42:26, 44:19, 78:24, 34:28, 44:9, 46:2, 33:2, 42:17, 45:25, sinister [5] - 50:10, 84:28 78:26 46:27, 47:20, 48:26, 45:29, 47:11, 82:12, 51:5, 51:6, 51:22, Strachan [1] **special** [2] - 6:14, 48:27, 50:15, 51:9, 88:9, 96:7, 104:10, 51:29 115:19 52:10. 59:2. 61:6. 124:21 104:15, 124:25, **Sirius** [1] - 119:14 straight [3] - 11:21, specific [3] - 97:5, 68:12, 68:18, 69:10, 124:26 sitting [2] - 103:27, 19:1. 19:4 109:21, 109:22 69:12, 73:10, 73:26, Superintendent [130] 119:16 straightforward [1] specifically [3] -74:26, 82:1, 87:7, - 7:7, 8:3, 9:3, 9:6, situation [4] - 55:4,

12:1, 12:3, 12:26,
13:2, 14:19, 14:25,
18:2, 18:11, 18:21,
19:1, 20:26, 21:2,
21:15, 21:18, 25:7,
25:9, 25:10, 25:14,
26:3, 27:17, 28:14,
28:26, 29:2, 29:7,
29:26, 30:4, 31:9,
31:14, 32:9, 32:18,
32:21, 33:1, 33:4,
33:15, 35:2, 35:9,
36:29, 37:15, 38:21,
39:19, 39:27, 40:3,
40:15, 40:28, 42:9,
42:26, 43:1, 43:3,
43:9, 43:26, 45:5,
45:6, 45:11, 45:16,
46:2, 46:21, 48:1,
48:28, 49:22, 50:26,
51:23, 55:1, 55:14,
55:16, 55:17, 55:20,
56:26, 57:3, 57:5,
57:12, 57:26, 59:2,
62:6, 62:29, 63:9,
63:14, 64:24, 66:18,
66:27, 68:16, 69:26,
70:26, 73:17, 73:29,
74:8, 74:11, 74:13,
74:21, 76:18, 77:4,
77:9, 78:1, 78:21,
79:8, 79:10, 79:11,
79:26, 80:18, 80:21,
80:24, 81:3, 81:5,
81:28, 83:2, 83:24,
84:4, 84:5, 84:21,
87:6, 87:13, 87:18,
87:25, 91:26, 93:26,
96:14, 105:11,
106:13, 107:5, 110:9,
111:2, 111:20, 115:4,
116:23, 118:14,
118:15, 125:1
superintendents [1]
- 75:20
superior [2] - 42:17,
47:10
Supervision 11 -
supervision [1] -
111:2
•
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] -
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] -
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3 supplied [1] - 93:21 support [1] - 89:6
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3 supplied [1] - 93:21 support [1] - 89:6 suppose [31] - 10:7,
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3 supplied [1] - 93:21 support [1] - 89:6 suppose [31] - 10:7, 13:28, 25:26, 27:7,
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3 supplied [1] - 93:21 support [1] - 89:6 suppose [31] - 10:7,
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3 supplied [1] - 93:21 support [1] - 89:6 suppose [31] - 10:7, 13:28, 25:26, 27:7, 28:15, 29:5, 30:6,
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3 supplied [1] - 93:21 support [1] - 89:6 suppose [31] - 10:7, 13:28, 25:26, 27:7, 28:15, 29:5, 30:6, 35:29, 56:15, 57:29,
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3 supplied [1] - 93:21 support [1] - 89:6 suppose [31] - 10:7, 13:28, 25:26, 27:7, 28:15, 29:5, 30:6, 35:29, 56:15, 57:29, 58:2, 64:5, 65:7,
111:2 supervisor [1] - 70:4 supervisors [1] - 70:3 supplied [1] - 93:21 support [1] - 89:6 suppose [31] - 10:7, 13:28, 25:26, 27:7, 28:15, 29:5, 30:6, 35:29, 56:15, 57:29,

90:7, 93:3, 93:14, 95:4, 95:12, 95:13, 96:14, 97:1, 97:10, 99:7, 101:22, 103:14, 105:28, 108:26, 109:27 **SUPREME** [2] - 1:13, SUPT [1] - 2:22 surely [1] - 38:26 surprised [2] -30:12, 30:22 surprising[1] -38:10 surrounding [1] -34.17 suspect [1] - 46:17 suspension [1] -56:11 suspicion [1] - 31:8 suspicions [3] -30:3, 30:6, 70:12 **swap** [1] - 83:17 sweep [1] - 66:27 swipe [2] - 41:21, 41.25 **SWORN** [9] - 6:10, 9:21, 24:1, 68:5, 73:1, 86:10, 87:10, 112:1, 120.20 sworn [1] - 39:28 synopsis [2] - 31:1, system [28] - 7:15, 41:20, 68:23, 68:29, 69:9, 78:10, 80:5. 80:6, 84:13, 89:1, 89:16, 89:18, 89:20, 90:10, 92:13, 93:17, 93:28, 94:4, 96:17, 96:20, 104:24,

105:23, 106:18, 107:17, 108:13, 117:22, 118:4, 119:18 systems [9] - 87:19, 88:26, 89:6, 103:16, 103:27, 104:19, 114:19, 117:13, 117:16 Síochána [28] - 6:13, 11:1, 16:21, 32:16, 37:22, 38:27, 39:6, 39:29, 40:6, 78:25, 87:26, 88:1, 88:13, 88:15, 88:19, 89:21, 90:26, 91:3, 91:5, 102:14, 102:21, 104:19, 108:16, 112:10, 112:19, 113:13, 115:23

Т

tablet [1] - 89:13 Tallaght [2] - 87:27, taping [1] - 51:23 Tara [1] - 9:2 **TARA**[1] - 2:22 tasked [4] - 91:8, 94:22, 97:9, 121:3 **Taylor** [103] - 7:7, 8:3, 9:3, 9:6, 12:1, 12:3, 12:26, 13:2, 14:25, 18:2, 18:11, 20:27, 21:2, 21:15, 21:19, 25:7, 25:9. 25:14, 26:3, 28:26, 29:2, 29:7, 29:26, 30:4, 31:9, 31:14, 32:9, 32:18, 32:21, 33:1, 33:4, 33:16, 35:9, 36:29, 37:15, 38:21, 40:3, 40:16, 40:28, 42:9, 42:26, 43:1, 43:26, 45:5, 45:6, 45:16, 46:3, 46:21, 48:1, 48:28, 49:22, 50:26, 51:23, 54:17, 55:1, 55:14, 55:16, 55:17, 55:20, 57:3, 57:5, 57:12, 57:26, 59:2, 62:6. 62:29, 63:9, 63:15, 64:24, 65:22, 66:18, 66:27, 69:26, 70:26, 73:17, 73:29, 74:8, 74:11, 74:13, 74:21, 74:28, 76:18, 76:29, 77:4, 77:9, 78:21, 79:8, 79:10, 79:26, 80:18, 80:21, 80:24, 81:3, 81:5, 82:3, 83:2, 84:4, 84:5, 84:21, 91:27, 105:11, 106:13, 125:1 **TAYLOR**[1] - 2:22 **Taylor's** [14] - 14:19, 18:21, 19:1, 27:17, 28:14, 35:2, 39:19, 39:27, 43:9, 56:26, 65:24, 68:16, 78:2, 81:28 tea [2] - 19:15, 35:19 team [9] - 6:28, 59:23, 60:19, 60:25, 63:12, 63:13, 68:26,

technology [5] -48:17, 51:21, 103:14, 105:26, 112:14 Technology [2] -87:14, 88:22 telecommunication s [1] - 50:7 telecoms [1] - 49:18 telephone [4] - 10:8, 10:11, 32:29, 68:24 telephones [1] - 19:6 telephonic [1] -15:19 television [1] - 82:20 ten [5] - 36:3, 37:24, 37:28, 38:14, 83:15 tendency [1] - 75:8 tends [1] - 60:8 term [2] - 102:6, 117:9 termed [1] - 49:2 terminal [3] - 103:26, 119:25. 119:26 terms [46] - 7:28, 10:13, 11:12, 12:27, 13:12, 25:6, 26:8, 27:5, 34:25, 35:29, 39:18, 39:24, 40:28, 53:11, 54:4, 54:5, 54:6, 54:21, 56:25, 56:27, 57:2, 57:4, 58:15, 59:22, 59:26, 59:29, 60:5, 60:22, 62:1, 62:2, 71:1, 76:13, 81:6, 83:10, 85:26, 85:27, 91:28, 97:28, 100:18, 100:20, 108:22, 117:18, 119:24 TERRACE[1] - 3:31 text [1] - 16:1 texts [1] - 58:28 that' [1] - 35:20 that'll [1] - 112:5 **THE** [34] - 1:4, 1:8, 1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6, 2:14, 3:22, 3:25, 3:28, 3:29, 4:11, 4:17, 6:1, 9:1, 9:16, 14:15, 17:1, 18:5. 23:21. 37:9. 39:17, 63:29, 67:9, 67:20, 68:1, 72:23, 86:4, 111:23, 120:15, 124:13, 125:13 themselves [1] -117:26 THEN [11] - 9:16, 18:5, 23:21, 63:29, 67:9, 72:23, 86:4,

111:23, 120:15,

124:13, 125:13 thereafter [1] -104:22 therefore [4] - 53:21, 56:29, 77:5, 109:3 thinking [3] - 29:3, 79:12, 79:13 third [3] - 10:20, 22:3, 107:6 thoughtlessness [1] - 125:7 thousand [1] - 92:22 three [12] - 19:13, 19:20, 69:17, 69:19, 76:4. 98:2. 98:3. 107:25, 109:3, 109:4, 110:26, 110:28 throughout [3] -7:16, 89:27, 92:12 Thursday [1] - 125:2 THURSDAY [1] -125:13 time-keeping [1] -83:11 timeframe [1] - 72:2 timekeeping [4] -27:1, 40:25, 40:29, 41:18 **TIMES** [3] - 3:17, 3:28. 3:30 **Tipperary** [1] - 44:16 today [4] - 45:2, 60:29, 95:24, 124:16 toilets [2] - 19:3, 41.22 tomorrow [3] -124:18, 125:5, 125:8 tongue [1] - 75:17 took [7] - 8:21, 51:14, 59:19, 59:21, 59:24, 74:12, 112:23 toolsets [1] - 97:12 top [4] - 15:4, 19:4, 19:8, 65:17 topic [2] - 50:6, 52:13 topical [2] - 71:10, 71:11 total [1] - 11:27 totally [2] - 13:25, 26:29 touch [1] - 65:12 touching [1] - 91:5 tour [4] - 19:18, 19:27, 19:28, 20:14 towards [2] - 29:7, 52.9 Town [1] - 62:18 track [1] - 113:28

tracked [1] - 113:16

103:10, 110:1

117:23

technically [1] -

traffic [1] - 31:23 Traffic [1] - 74:22 training [1] - 88:11 traits [1] - 27:2 transcript [1] - 1:26 transfer [2] - 29:28, 108:13 transferred [5] -20:19, 74:21, 88:2, 88:5, 120:28 trap [1] - 82:24 treated [1] - 42:24 Tribunal [55] - 9:5, 9:25, 11:3, 12:14, 12:28, 14:20, 14:25, 15:16, 15:21, 15:27, 24:4. 30:9. 33:11. 34:25, 34:28, 35:1, 35:24, 41:28, 42:23, 54:16, 56:23, 57:16, 57:22, 59:20, 59:21, 59:23, 60:16, 60:17, 60:19, 62:16, 63:12, 68:12, 68:16, 73:11, 73:13, 73:16, 84:19, 89:14, 91:4, 92:9, 92:19, 94:5, 100:10, 103:1, 103:7, 104:25, 105:15, 106:14, 106:17, 109:5, 109:10, 113:7, 114:29, 118:7, 124:2 TRIBUNAL [3] - 1:3, 2:6. 125:13 Tribunal's [3] - 7:28, 59:14, 63:8 **TRIBUNALS**[1] - 1:9 tried [1] - 45:2 true [1] - 53:12 TRUST [1] - 3:30 try [1] - 29:27 trying [3] - 22:5, 28:8, 43:7 turn [3] - 19:9, 23:13, 58:13 turned [1] - 99:29 Twitter [2] - 62:21, 62:25 two [23] - 19:12, 19:19, 19:20, 19:29, 22:2, 33:10, 33:13, 40:26, 60:22, 65:2, 66:20, 88:4, 95:3, 95:13, 97:20, 98:11, 99:22, 104:9, 109:7, 114:3, 115:28, 118:24, 124:20 type [2] - 75:24, 87:21

typing [1] - 21:10

typographical [1] - 24:17

U

Ulster [1] - 112:11

unaware [1] - 13:25

unchallenged [3] -

55:7, 55:25, 55:26

uncomfortable [5] -40:8, 40:11, 41:16, 42:29. 74:22 uncomplimentary [2] - 77:12, 77:13 uncontactable [1] -47:14 under [8] - 27:11, 27:16, 39:21, 39:29, 58:6, 64:14, 107:26, 111:1 UNDER [2] - 1:3, 1:9 underestimating [1] - 6:6 undermining [1] -59:6 underneath [1] -55:28 understandable [1] -56:14 understate [1] -28:25 underwent [1] -102:20 unfortunately [1] -82:25 unit [1] - 6:14 university [1] -112.11 unless [2] - 63:21, 111:19 unlock [1] - 119:3 unpleasant [3] -18:3, 54:16, 56:4 unrelated [1] - 60:11 unsurprisingly [1] -114:13 **UNTIL** [1] - 125:13 unusual [7] - 39:2, 42:11, 42:13, 44:21, 82:8, 109:26, 121:22 up [38] - 13:20, 14:5, 19:3, 21:2, 29:9, 36:5, 44:26, 46:12, 47:21, 48:5, 56:8, 56:9, 56:14, 58:7, 60:22, 61:10, 65:29, 66:5, 69:1, 73:8, 76:16,

83:20, 85:17, 87:18,

91:4, 92:27, 93:16,

96:8, 96:16, 101:5, 103:10, 105:14, 117:25, 119:17 up-to-date [1] -101:5 upgrade [3] - 92:18, 95:4, 97:16 upgrading [1] - 97:4 upset [1] - 80:4 upstairs [5] - 18:10, 22:1, 22:14, 23:8 urged [1] - 50:19 **US** [1] - 84:8 user [9] - 90:3, 98:18. 98:22. 98:23. 103:6, 103:19, 105:5, 105:23, 108:1 username [1] -113:10 users [2] - 94:7, 94:10 usual [1] - 6:5 utterly [2] - 60:14, 61:11

93:23, 94:9, 95:6,

V

vaguely [1] - 78:7 valuation [1] -115:25 value [1] - 59:4 valued [2] - 102:15, 115:22 variety [1] - 123:1 various [4] - 30:10, 88:6, 101:22, 123:9 **VDI** [5] - 103:16, 103:18, 119:6, 119:10, 119:12 vendettas [1] - 26:18 verbal [2] - 15:29, 16:14 verbatim [1] - 1:26 verified [1] - 115:14 verify [6] - 113:19, 114:1, 114:3, 114:6, 115:8, 116:24 via [1] - 72:11 victims [1] - 75:26 view [14] - 38:7, 44:5, 44:8, 51:29, 53:13, 55:2, 55:5, 58:3 58:5 58:19 58:22, 60:10, 65:18, 83:1 virtual [3] - 103:19, 103:23, 113:22 Virtual [1] - 103:17

virtue [1] - 120:6 vis-à-vis [1] - 125:5 visit [1] - 17:8 visited [2] - 17:5, 111:9 volume [1] - 72:10 Volume [4] - 14:18, 24:11, 68:21, 87:7

W

wait [1] - 54:26

waiting [1] - 6:5

walk [4] - 23:11,

59:7, 86:22, 86:23

wall [3] - 53:18,

53:19, 53:26

walking [1] - 61:14

waived [1] - 66:24

wants [3] - 43:16, 43:17, 86:7 WARD [5] - 72:18, 81:21, 106:22, 118:19, 124:6 warm [1] - 64:25 warnings [1] - 106:4 **WAS**[20] - 6:10, 9:1, 9:21, 14:15, 17:1, 18:5, 24:1, 37:9, 39:17, 63:29, 68:5, 73:1, 81:24, 86:11, 87:10, 107:1, 110:13, 112:1, 118:22, 120:20 ways [1] - 41:9 wear [1] - 60:7 WEDNESDAY [2] -1:18.6:1 wee [1] - 55:7 week [6] - 27:10, 59:12, 111:3, 124:27, 124.29 weekend [3] - 43:2, 43:11 weeks [1] - 95:21 **welcome** [1] - 9:11 whatsoever [2] -85:19, 96:4 Whelan [1] - 35:25 WHELAN [1] - 2:16 whereas [4] - 27:19, 28:13, 29:28, 93:8 whilst [1] - 103:21 whole [2] - 53:18, Williams [5] - 33:25, 37:13, 38:20, 65:22, 65:28 **WILLIAMS**[1] - 3:3 Windows [7] - 92:15, 100:24, 101:1, 101:3, 114:8 wise [1] - 26:6 wish [2] - 15:6, 23:18 wishes [1] - 55:2 WITHDREW [8] -9:16, 23:21, 67:9, 72:23, 86:4, 111:23, 120:15, 124:13 witness [30] - 6:7, 9:18, 53:14, 53:17, 53:20, 54:3, 54:6, 54:8, 57:14, 58:1, 60:6, 60:7, 61:5, 70:10, 76:23, 76:24, 83:23, 87:6, 105:13, 108:23, 111:25, 112:25, 113:9, 114:18, 115:7, 121:27, 122:25, 124:18, 124:28 WITNESS [17] - 4:2, 9:1, 9:16, 14:15, 17:1, 18:5, 23:21, 37:9, 39:17, 63:29, 67:9, 72:23, 86:4, 111:23, 118:22, 120:15, 124:13 witnessed [1] -81:17 witnesses [5] -55:13, 57:28, 67:15, 124:16, 124:20 wonder [3] - 14:17, 55.4 wondering [1] -38:25 word [4] - 13:28, 38:11, 90:15, 117:15 words [3] - 62:25, 85:14, 101:8 works [1] - 29:17 workstation [2] -117:8, 119:24 world [1] - 77:22 worry [2] - 55:8, 86:19 Wren [1] - 21:24 write [1] - 66:2 writing [2] - 16:1, 77:13

97:16, 100:23,

X

written [1] - 31:5

XP [3] - 92:12, 107:16 **XPC** [2] - 107:11, 107:13 **XPC-004** [1] - 110:20

Υ

Y2K [1] - 89:25 year [11] - 7:9, 7:12, 17:16, 68:13, 89:23, 89:25, 89:26, 91:18, 105:28, 105:29, 121:4 years [12] - 13:23, 25:4, 26:11, 37:24, 37:28, 38:14, 39:10, 54:10, 88:4, 88:7, 101:18 years' [1] - 32:24 yesterday [1] - 51:16 yourself [4] - 52:21, 81:4, 82:26, 83:27

É

ÉIREANN [2] - 1:5, 1:6 **Éireann** [1] - 84:2

Ó

Ó [1] - 2:27