TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON TUESDAY, 22ND MAY 2018 - DAY 80

80

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

MR. JUSTICE PETER CHARLETON, JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT SOLE MEMBER:

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL:

MR. DIARMAID MCGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. KATHLEEN LEADER BL MS. ELIZABETH MULLAN, SOLICITOR

FOR SGT. McCABE:

MR. MICHAEL McDOWELL SC MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. BREFFNI GORDON BL SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY

INSTRUCTED BY:

DUBLIN 7

FOR THE COMMISSIONER:

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC
MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC
MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. NOEL WHELAN BL
MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL
MR. JOHN FITZGERALD BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE
OSMOND HOUSE
LITTLE SHIP STREET
DUBLIN 8

INSTRUCTED BY:

FOR SUPT. TAYLOR: MR. MICHAEL O'HIGGINS

MS. TARA BURNS SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. CARTHAGE CONLON
M. E. HANAHOE SOLICITORS
SUNLIGHT CHAMBERS
21 PARLIAMENT STREET
DUBLIN 2

MR. FÍONÁN Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH BL MR. MICHAEL WALL BL AUGUSTUS CULLEN LAW SOLICITORS 18 BOW STREET SMITHFIELD FOR ALISON O'REILLY:

INSTRUCTED BY:

DUBLIN 7

MR. SEAN GILLANE SC MR. RONAN KENNEDY BL FOR RTÉ: PATRICIA HARRINGTON, RTÉ INSTRUCTED BY:

FOR INDEPENDENT NEWS AND MEDIA

MR. ROSSA FANNING SC MR. JOHN FREEMAN BL MR. KIERAN KELLY & PAUL WILLIAMS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

FANNING & KELLY SOLICITORS HATCH HALL

HATCH STREET LOWER SAINT KEVIN'S

DUBLIN 2

MR. ANTHONY THUILLIER BL MR. KIERAN KELLY FANNING & KELLY SOLICITORS HATCH HALL FOR MI CHAEL O' TOOLE:

HATCH STREET LOWER SALINT KEVIN'S

DUBLIN 2

FOR ASSOCIATED NEWSPAPERS LIMITED, DEBBIE McCANN, SEBASTIAN HAMILTON & CONOR O' DONNELL INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MICHAEL KEELEY DMG MEDIA IRELAND

FOR TIMES NEWSPAPERS LIMITED & NEWS GROUP NEWSPAPERS LIMITED:

MR. SIMON MCALEESE SIMON MCALEESE SOLICITORS CUNNINGHAM HOUSE

FRANCIS STREET MERCHANTS QUAY

DUBLIN 8

FOR THE IRISH EXAMINER, JUNO McENROE DANIEL MCCONNELL CORMAC O'KEEFFE, TIM VAUGHAN & MICK CLIFFORD:

MR. OISÍN QUINN SC MR. DARRYL BRODERICK RONAN DALY JERMYN SOLICITORS THE EXCHANGE GEORGE'S DOCK IFSC

DUBLIN 1

FOR THE IRISH TIMES

DESIGNATED ACTIVITY

COMPANY, THE IRISH

TIMES TRUST & CONOR LALLY:

MR. DAVID PHELAN HAYES SOLICITORS LAVERY HOUSE 2 EARLSFORT TERRACE

DUBLIN 2

FOR MRS. MICHELLE TAYLOR: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. FELIX MCENROY SC O'MARA GERAGHTY MCCOURT 51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR JOHN McGUINNESS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DARREN LEHANE BL

LAWLOR PARTNERS SOLICITORS ARRAN SQUARE ARRAN QUAY

DUBLI N 7

FOR GEMMA O' DOHERTY:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MARK HARTY SC MR. JOHN BERRY BL MR. DARRAGH MACKIN KRW LAW

THIRD FLOOR 9-15 QUEEN STREET BELFAST COUNTY ANTRIM

FOR ALAN SHATTER:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MS. EILEEN BARRINGTON SC MR. CATHAL MURPHY BL MR. BRIAN GALLAGHER GALLAGHER SHATTER SOLICITORS 4 UPPER ELY PLACE DUBLIN 2

FOR DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

AND BRIAN PURCELL: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. GERARD MEEHAN BL
MR. CHARLES WALLACE
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S
OFFICE

OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET DUBLIN 8

INDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
MR. MARTIN CALLINAN	
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCDOWELL	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS	77
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. GILLANE	131
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH	142
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. HARTY	145
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. FREEMAN	170
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE	174
EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM	199
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	249
QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	254

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON TUESDAY, 22ND MAY	
2			<u>2018:</u>	
3				
4			MR. MARTIN CALLINAN CONTINUED TO BE CROSS-EXAMINED BY	
5			MR. McDOWELL:	10:00
6	1	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: Mr. Callinan, good morning.	
7		Α.	Morning, Chairman.	
8	2	Q.	Are you did you follow the evidence that was given	
9			here by Mr. Noel Brett on day 64?	
10		Α.	Yes, I have read the evidence, yes.	10:01
11	3	Q.	And there are a number of issues that I want to ask you	
12			in relation to that, but one of them is that in the	
13			month of in the summer of 2013, he and Minister	
14			Varadkar met with Minister Shatter and other officials	
15			from the Department of Justice in relation to the	10:01
16			penalty points issue. And he has told the Chairman	
17			that Minister Shatter assured him that Sergeant McCabe	
18			had not cooperated with the O'Mahony investigation, the	
19			preparation of the O'Mahony report, and first of all,	
20			would that have been on the basis of information	10:02
21			supplied by you?	
22		Α.	Well, I was always careful, Chairman, when I was	
23			speaking about this issue and what I had indicated was	
24			that on the 14th December '12 when I issued the	
25			direction, first direction to Sergeant McCabe and	10:02
26			former Garda John Wilson, that the direction also	
27			contained an invitation that if they had any further	
28			concerns, they could raise those concerns with the	
29			Assistant Commissioner John O'Mahony, who was	

1			investigating these matters. That was the language	
2			that I used, and it is the case that Sergeant McCabe	
3			did not engage with that process.	
4	4	Q.	Now, we will come back to that in a moment, but you do	
5			recall that Mr. Brett informed this Tribunal that he	10:03
6			was very much of the view that, having spoken to	
7			Sergeant McCabe, that the Minister was misinformed and	
8			that he took the trouble to check out the facts again	
9			with Sergeant McCabe and contacted the Secretary	
10			General of the Department of Justice, Mr. Brian	10:03
11			Purcell, to ask him to inform the Commissioner that he	
12			was mistaken in this respect. You saw that?	
13		Α.	That he the last piece, sorry? That he was asked?	
14	5	Q.	That he telephoned Brian Purcell, who was the Secretary	
15			General of Justice, to ask him to to tell him that	10:04
16			the Minister was mistaken in this respect and that	
17			Sergeant McCabe had never been approached by the	
18			O'Mahony Commission?	
19		Α.	That may well be the position. I wouldn't have any	
20			issue with that.	10:04
21	6	Q.	Now, could I ask you to look at Volume 27, page 7356,	
22			if you would, please.	
23		Α.	I think, just in relation to your last question,	
24			Mr. McDowell, was it not the case that the former	
25			Minister dealt with this in his evidence also, in	10:04
26			relation to whether or not he heard that from me? I	
27			may be mistaken but I thought he did.	
28	7	Q.	When I say that it was from you, that information came	
29			from An Garda Síochána, isn't that right?	

- 1 A. No, no, it did not.
- 2 8 Q. That he hadn't cooperated?
- 3 A. No, no. No, no. I have just indicated that I was
- 4 always very, very careful in relation to what I'd said
- about that position. But I do accept, you know, I do

10:04

10:05

10:05

10:05

10.06

- 6 accept that, looking back now at what had happened, it
- 7 would be a very reasonable position, I think, to take.
- 8 The reality was, Sergeant McCabe did not engage with
- 9 the Assistant Commissioner and his inquiry. I mean,
- 10 you know, we may be splitting hairs here but that is
- 11 the situation.
- 12 9 Q. Well, we will come back to that in a moment.
- 13 A. Thank you.
- 14 10 Q. Could I ask you to look at a letter that was sent to
- Sergeant McCabe by Mr. Flahive in the Department of
- 16 Justice on the 20th September 2013.
- 17 A. Have you a page reference?
- 19 A. Thank you.
- 20 12 Q. And it's addressed to Sergeant McCabe at his home and
- 21 it reads:

- "Dear Mr. McCabe
- I refer to your email to the 1st of July to the office
- of Taoi seach regarding the report of the examination
- into the allegations on the operation of the fixed
- charge processing system which has been copied to this
- Department. As you are aware the Minister forwarded
- the allegations in respect of the cancellation of fixed

charge notices to the Garda Commissioner in October last. The Commissioner appointed Assistant Commissioner John O' Mahony to conduct an examination and to report on the allegations. A team of 28 Garda staff was engaged in the investigation, including five chief superintendents and six superintendents. The final report was submitted to the Minister by the Commissioner on 28th March 2013. The Minister is satisfied that all the allegations have been fully reviewed and analysed in the report prepared by Assistant Commissioner John O' Mahony. That report has been published and has also been referred to the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Justice, Defence and Equality for consideration.

10:06

10.06

10:07

10:07

10.07

With regard to your claim that you have evidence which contradicts the findings of Assistant Commissioner 0' Mahony's report, the Minister has advised that you were offered the opportunity by the Garda authorities to submit any evidence or other relevant information you had in support of your allegations to Assistant Commissioner 0' Mahony but did not do so. Indeed, this Department in its correspondence to you last December also advised that should you have further information in your possession which would be helpful to the investigation the proper approach would be to provide this to your authorities within the force but again it is understood that you did not do so.

1	Your comments in your email relating to the Assistant	
2	Commissioner O' Mahony's reports are therefore of grave	
3	concern. Firstly, as you have not provided Assistant	
4	Commissioner O' Mahony's investigation with whatever	
5	evidence you say you have, and secondly, as the person	10:07
6	you are referring to in such serious terms, including	
7	allegations of criminal offences, have not been given	
8	an opportunity to respond. If you have evidence	
9	contradicting the finding of Assistant Commissioner	
10	O' Mahony's report, it is your duty as a member of An	10:07
11	Garda Síochána to make this evidence available. It is	
12	not acceptable that a member of the Garda Síochána	
13	should repeatedly make such allegations, including in	
14	particular allegations that lives have been unavoidably	
15	lost without providing the evidence which he says he	10:08
16	has. By doing so you are without any apparent basis in	
17	fact undermining the confidence in the fixed charge	
18	penalty system and in the impartiality of the	
19	enforcement of law.	
20		10:08
21	You should accordingly immediately make available any	
22	evidence you may have which contradicts the findings of	
23	Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony's report to the Garda	

24

25

26

27

10:08

Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony's report to the Garda Commissioner, the confidential recipient or the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Justice, Defence and Equality which has been considering the report. Alternatively, you should acknowledge that you have no such evidence. "

28

29

Now, here he was being told that he could go to a Dáil

1			committee with his evidence. Were you aware that	
2			Mr. Flahive had stated that to him?	
3		Α.	No, I was not, Chairman, no.	
4	13	Q.	And would you have considered that compatible with your	
5			view of the discipline within the force?	10:09
6		Α.	Well, I was very clear in my position, Chairman, in	
7			relation to the documents being handed over to the	
8			Public Accounts Committee or any other third party, and	
9			that was the advice that I was following and indeed it	
10			was my affirmation as well.	10:09
11	14	Q.	So I think the answer to my question is that you would	
12			not have regarded that as appropriate for a member of	
13			An Garda Síochána to do that?	
14		Α.	My view is that if Sergeant McCabe had issues, that the	
15			rightful place to bring those issues was to his	10:09
16			authorities in An Garda Síochána in the first instance.	
17	15	Q.	Yes. And am I right in saying that you regard it as it	
18			would have been improper for him to give evidence to a	
19			Dáil committee, is that what you are saying?	
20		Α.	That was my position, Chairman, yes.	10:09
21	16	Q.	But nonetheless, he was invited by the Department of	
22			Justice, and presumably this was written with	
23			ministerial authority, to make his evidence available	
24			to an Oireachtas Committee?	
25		Α.	Well, I can't answer that question, Chairman, because I	10:10
26			wasn't aware of the document and I certainly wasn't	
27			consulted before it was written.	
28	17	Q.	And then the letter goes on:	

1			"There is a clear and compelling public interest in a	
2			definitive determination of the truth of your	
3			allegations, whether by an examination of the evidence	
4			which you say you have contradicts the findings of the	
5			report by Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony, or in the	10:10
6			alternative, by an acknowledgement that you have no	
7			such evidence. You will also understand failure by you	
8			to make such evidence available will inevitably invite	
9			the conclusion that there is in fact no such evidence."	
10				10:1
11			So this was a direct challenge, was it not, to Sergeant	
12			McCabe to use the colloquialism, to put up or shut up	
13			on this issue?	
14		Α.	Well, I think what it is, and what it appears to	
15			clearly demonstrate, Chairman, is that if the sergeant	10:1
16			was challenging the report of the assistant	
17			commissioner, these were the forums to bring those	
18			challenges to.	
19	18	Q.	And then it goes on:	
20				10:1
21			"Could I also ask you to note that there is no basis on	
22			which correspondence of this nature from a member of An	
23			Garda Síochána containing serious allegations relating	
24			to the enforcement of law and the conduct of named	
25			individuals and which is not being made to the	10:1
26			confidential recipient can or should be kept	
27			confidential and this Department must reserve the right	

29

to transmit such correspondence to other persons or

bodies where this is appropriate. A copy of this reply

Т			is being sent to the office of An Taoiseach."	
2				
3			Were you notified that that letter had been sent in	
4			September?	
5		Α.	I don't recall seeing this document before, no.	10:11
6	19	Q.	Does it surprise you that he was invited to communicate	
7			with an Oireachtas Committee?	
8		Α.	It does. But it seems to be in the context of	
9			challenging the report of the assistant commissioner,	
10			that's the point.	10:11
11	20	Q.	You do know, don't you, that the Garda Inspectorate was	
12			carrying out a parallel investigation, isn't that	
13			right?	
14		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
15	21	Q.	And that Sergeant McCabe was met with and was	10:12
16			interviewed by the Garda Inspectorate, isn't that	
17			right?	
18		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
19	22	Q.	And that he cooperated with that investigation and was	
20			publicly acknowledged as being a credible witness and	10:12
21			thanked for his cooperation by Robert Olson, the head	
22			of the Garda Inspectorate?	
23		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
24	23	Q.	Now, could I ask you to I think I mentioned	
25			earlier the evidence of Noel Brett to this Tribunal,	10:12
26			which is dealt with on day 64. And could I just bring	
27			you very briefly to page 166 of that, when it's made	
28			available to you.	
29		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	

1	24 Q.	Sorry, it may be at the bottom of page 165. There is a	
2		reference to well, on page 165 he said he met with	
3		Sergeant McCabe for the first time, and that he took	
4		him through the penalty point allegations and that he	
5		was satisfied from speaking with him this is on page	10:1
6		165:	
7			
8		" that there were very many, very serious issues and	
9		that he had all the back-up. And I went home that	
10		night and the very next morning I referred the matter	10:1
11		formally by registered post including the dossier, I	
12		sent it to the Comptroller & Auditor General because of	
13		the alleged loss of revenue to the State and I sent it	
14		to GSOC because I believed that GSOC had the statutory	
15		power to formally investigate it."	10:1
16			
17		And Ms. Leader said:	
18			
19		"So matters went on from there in relation to the fixed	
20		charge penalty system. I want to bring you to the	10:1
21		following year, July 2013, you had a meeting with the	
22		Department of Justice with regard to the fixed charge	
23		penalty notice system, is that correct?"	
24			
25		And he said:	10:1
26			
27		"Yes. That was held in late July 2013. I was asked by	

my then Minister, Minister Varadkar, who was Minister

for Transport to accompany him to a meeting with the

28

-	with ster for sustrice to discuss the penalty points	
2	i ssues.	
3	Q. Who was at that meeting?	
4	A. The meeting was attended by Mr. Shatter, who was	
5	then Minister for Justice, Mr. Varadkar, Brian Murphy, 10	0:14
6	who was the Minister's special adviser, Maurice Tracy,	
7	who was the principal officer at that point in the	
8	Department of Transport, by Brian Purcell, who was	
9	Secretary General of justice and by myself.	
10	Q. I think you, immediately after that meeting you	0:15
11	telephoned Sergeant McCabe and was that as a result of	
12	something you had heard in the meeting?	
13	A. Yes, that's correct. During the meeting Minister	
14	Shatter was having an exchange with myself and Minister	
15	Varadkar about whether or not Sergeant McCabe had	0:15
16	cooperated with the O'Mahony investigation. I knew	
17	from speaking to Sergeant McCabe that he hadn't been	
18	contacted and he hadn't been asked to participate. I	
19	explained that to Minister Shatter at the meeting and	
20	he was adamant that he hadn't. I was concerned, so	0:15
21	much so that straight after the meeting I parted	
22	company with Minister Varadkar, I immediately rang	
23	Sergeant McCabe and asked him and he reassured me that	
24	he had not been contacted and what he told me	
25	originally stood. I believe that at that point it was 10	0:15
26	important to immediately ring the Secretary General	
27	Brian Purcell and alert him to this because Minister	
28	Shatter seemed to believe the direct opposite."	

1	Now, 1	that's	the	poin	t where	Min	nister	Shatter	seems	to
2	have b	been ι	ınder	the	impress	sion	that :	Sergeant	McCabe	had
3	not co	oopera	ited v	vith	the O'M	ahon	y pro	cess.		

- A. Yes, I would accept that, Chairman, but I think he dealt with this matter in his evidence.
- 6 25 Now, I don't want to waste too much time about it, but Q. I think it is the case that Mr. Brett also gave 7 8 evidence here of an exchange between himself and yourself which became heated in respect of a different 9 10 matter, which was the tachograph material and Gay Byrne 10:16 11 was that and that they left the meeting as a result of 12 the heated exchanges, do you recall that?

10:16

10:17

10:17

- Yes, I do recall we had a fairly healthy discussion in 13 Α. 14 relation to -- the issue, Mr. McDowell, related to the 15 enforcement of the tachograph laws and there was 16 discussion around, generally around the amount of 17 commitment An Garda Síochána could give to the 18 enforcement of road traffic in the context of reducing 19 resources, particularly so in relation to the Garda 20 traffic unit, who essentially would deal with matters 21 of tachograph.
- 22 26 Q. Yes. You see, what I want to put to you is that at the 23 time -- after that, you rang Mr. Brett and apologised 24 to him and said that you were under pressure and that 25 you regretted the tone that the meeting had adopted, do 10:17 26 you recall that?
- A. Well, I recall the evidence of Mr. Brett and I
 certainly did ring him because, I was hearing all sorts
 of rumours back that there was a big dust up, I don't

1	think it was as bad as it was expressed but nonetheless $% \left(x\right) =\left(x\right) +\left(x\right) +\left($
2	we did have a fairly robust exchange, Chairman, that is
3	absolutely true. And I think I was speaking about
4	pressures on policing generally with all of the
5	competing interests and the various disciplines An
6	Garda Síochána has to deal with on a daily basis, that
7	was I wasn't speaking about myself being personally
8	under pressure.

10:18

10 · 18

10:18

10:19

10.20

- 9 Well, Mr. Brett also informed the Chairman here in his 27 Q. evidence at page 176 that it was a short number of 10 11 weeks or maybe a few months after he'd formally made 12 the referrals to GSOC and the Comptroller & Auditor 13 General and he said that he felt that there was a 14 hostility towards him because he had done that. What 15 do you say about that?
- A. Well, certainly not on my behalf, Chairman, and I
 believe he took the correct course of action.

 Mr. Brett is a very committed -- was a very committed
 member of the Road Safety Authority and we were
 certainly both on the same side. There was no issues
 there.
- 22 Now, could I bring you to the statement that Sergeant 28 Q. 23 McCabe made in February of 2014. I will come back to 24 that in a moment. You have given evidence here, 25 Mr. Callinan, that when you spoke to Philip 26 Boucher-Hayes in RTÉ in December of 2013, that you 27 never mentioned anything to him about Sergeant McCabe having psychological or psychiatric issues or that 28 29 there were other things you could tell him about

1			Sergeant McCabe, horrific things, that you never said	
2			any of that at all?	
3		Α.	That is correct, Chairman, yes.	
4	29	Q.	And you went on to advance the possibility that these	
5			remarks about Sergeant McCabe may not have been made by	10:21
6			you but could have been made by Superintendent Taylor	
7			on the same day, is that your view?	
8		Α.	Well, that is a possibility, Chairman, yes.	
9	30	Q.	You see	
10			CHAIRMAN: Just to make sure that I know where we stand	10:21
11			here, Mr. McDowell, if you don't mind the intervention.	
12			As I understand it Superintendent Taylor says he never	
13			heard the exchange with Philip Boucher-Hayes.	
14			MR. McDOWELL: Exactly.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Furthermore, he says he never weighed in at	10:21
16			the end and said now don't you know what the problem is	
17			with Sergeant McCabe and the penalty points.	
18			MR. McDOWELL: Exactly.	
19			CHAIRMAN: So, he said he never overheard it all. And	
20			as I understand your evidence, Commissioner, you don't	10:21
21			say that Superintendent Taylor actually said anything	
22			to Philip Boucher-Hayes, certainly that you overheard?	
23		Α.	I can't say that, Chairman, absolutely not, no, no.	
24			MR. McDOWELL: No, but I think it's a slightly	
25			different point. Chairman.	10:22
26	31	Q.	I think you advance the possibility that if those words	
27			were said by anybody to Mr. Boucher-Hayes, that they	
28			may have been addressed either earlier in the day or	
29			some time that evening to Mr. Boucher-Haves by	

1	Superintendent	Taylor?

- A. I cannot say that, but I did make the point, I think, yesterday, that the phraseology of Mr. Boucher-Hayes was somewhat opaque in the context of him saying there are other things I could tell you about, the worst kind 10:22 of things, horrific things, or whatever formula of words, and I did make the point, Chairman, that I couldn't see how an experienced journalist would let me off the hook with saying something like that without asking me to qualify it. So basically, what I'm trying 10:23 to say is, I had the sense that he had prior knowledge of some sort of information, and that was in his head.
- Well the point -- there are two points I want to put to Q. you in relation to that possibility which you raised in evidence here. One is that Superintendent Taylor was 10:23 cross-examined for more than five hours by counsel representing your interests, amongst others, and it was never suggested to him that he might have stated this to Mr. Boucher-Hayes or imparted that information to That is the first point. In fact, the exact 10:23 opposite was put to him, he was accused of inventing the negative briefing charge completely?
 - A. Just to be clear, Chairman, I'm not accusing
 Superintendent Taylor of informing Philip Boucher-Hayes
 about any element of an allegation of a sexual nature
 against Sergeant Maurice McCabe. I just don't know if
 that is the case. And I couldn't know, and if I did
 know, I certainly would have mentioned it in my
 statement.

10.24

1 33 Q. Yes. But the point I'm making is this: That great
2 efforts were made to suggest to Superintendent Taylor
3 that he had never, ever briefed any journalist
4 negatively against Sergeant McCabe and never raised the
5 issue of the sexual assault allegation in respect of

10:24

7 CHAIRMAN: But your point, Mr. McDowell, in that respect is?

6

him.

- I am suggesting to you when we come --9 34 MR. McDOWELL: Q. I'm putting this to you, that the notion that 10 10.25 11 Superintendent Taylor could have given this information 12 to Mr. Boucher-Hayes, either on that day or earlier on 13 that day or whatever, flies in the face of the case 14 that you have made so far, or has been made on your 15 behalf, and that is that he never negatively briefed 10:25 16 any journalist about Sergeant McCabe.
- Well, I think there is a distinction to be made here; I 17 Α. 18 say, Mr. McDowell, and I am very clear, that I never 19 gave any direction or any instruction to Superintendent Taylor to brief any journalist or any person in the 20 10:25 media negatively about Sergeant McCabe. 21 That's my 22 position, that was my position from the start and it's my position now, today, and will be in the future. 23 There was no campaign, as far as I'm concerned, 24 25 Chairman, absolutely not. And I certainly didn't 10.26 26 direct any campaign, and I certainly have no knowledge 27 of any such campaign in An Garda Síochána to brief 28 negatively against Sergeant McCabe. That's my 29 position, I think it's very clear, I think I have made

Τ			it very clear.	
2	35	Q.	You see, the point I'm making to you is that either	
3			Mr. Boucher-Hayes imagined that conversation or	
4			somebody gave him that information. It can't be that	
5			he just, out of his own that, somehow I take it	10:26
6			you are not suggesting he has invented a conversation?	
7		Α.	I'm not suggesting anything. I can only tell you,	
8			Chairman, that that wasn't said. those words were not	
9			said by me. I cannot be any clearer on the matter.	
10			They are not my words, I didn't say them.	10:27
11	36	Q.	I see.	
12		Α.	How Mr. Philip Boucher-Hayes came to be in possession	
13			of those comments, those words, I do not know. I	
14			cannot I cannot indicate to the Tribunal how that is	
15			SO.	10:27
16	37	Q.	Well, I think you yourself have said that he is a	
17			respected journalist?	
18		Α.	Absolutely.	
19	38	Q.	And I'm putting to you that unless this was a malicious	
20			invention on the part of Mr. Boucher-Hayes, somebody	10:27
21			must have spoken those words to him?	
22		Α.	I think that is a very realistic possibility, Chairman,	
23			yes, but it certainly wasn't me.	
24	39	Q.	And are you because this is a direct conflict of	
25			testimony between yourself and Mr. Boucher-Hayes, are	10:28
26			you advancing as a possibility that it was	
27			Superintendent Taylor who gave him the information	
28			about Sergeant McCabe having psychological and	
29			psychiatric difficulties and there being horrific	

1			things that could be said about him?	
2		Α.	No, I'm not, Chairman.	
3	40	Q.	You are not advancing that as a possibility?	
4		Α.	I don't know if it is a possibility, but I'm not	
5			advancing it.	10:28
6	41	Q.	I see. Well, can we take it in respect of that	
7			particular evidence, proposed evidence by	
8			Mr. Boucher-Hayes, that you know of no reason, malice,	
9			grudge, ill-will towards you, that could possibly just	
10			explain Mr. Boucher-Hayes either fabricating that or	10:29
11			misattributing information he got elsewhere to you?	
12		Α.	I cannot account for what Mr. Boucher-Hayes has said,	
13			Chairman. I can only account for myself, and what I	
14			know transpired in the corridor of RTÉ on that evening,	
15			the evening of the 17th December 2013.	10:29
16	42	Q.	Could I ask you to look at page 7256 in Volume 26.	
17		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
18	43	Q.	This is a statement which Maurice McCabe issued to RTÉ	
19			on the Monday the 24th February 2014. And on that day,	
20			it appears that Mr. Paul Reynolds had, in a number of	10:30
21			news bulletins, stated that Sergeant McCabe had failed	
22			to cooperate with the O'Mahony	
23			MR. GILLANE: I am very loath to interrupt, Chairman,	
24			just in relation to this aspect, it's something that	
25			has been repeated even though I did ask Sergeant McCabe	10:31
26			questions on this topic. The fact that it keeps	
27			getting repeated doesn't make it true. The story	
28			published doesn't contain the words refused to	
29			cooperate, and I think that should just be made clear.	

_			Everyone seems to be proceeding on the premise that it	
2			does, it doesn't and Sergeant McCabe accepted that.	
3			MR. McDOWELL: Sorry. That he was directed to	
4			cooperate in writing by with the O'Mahony inquiry.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Is that okay with you? Is that a better	10:31
6			wording, Mr. Gillane?	
7			MR. GILLANE: Yes. The wording is there for everyone	
8			to see, as long as it's the wording	
9			CHAIRMAN: I think as well that this was wasn't this	
10			a report by RTÉ as opposed to emanating from the	10:31
11			Commissioner's office?	
12			MR. McDOWELL: well, that is what I was going to come	
13			to.	
14	44	Q.	I was going to suggest to you that this story that	
15			Mr. Reynolds was putting out at the time came from An	10:31
16			Garda Síochána; it didn't come from any other source.	
17		Α.	Well, I have looked for that report, that statement,	
18			Chairman, and I cannot find it anywhere. So I don't	
19			know where it came from. You know, I don't know	
20			whether it's useful or not to put up the actual	10:32
21			direction that I gave on the 14th December, but I think	
22			it's very clear that it was a clear invitation to the	
23			sergeant to bring any concerns he had to the attention	
24			of the assistant commissioner who was dealing with	
25			these matters and the whole country were aware of his	10:32
26			investigation. That was the terms of the direction.	
27			But I have looked for this particular broadcast or	
28			statement or whatever is being referred here, and I	
29			cannot find it anywhere.	

1	45	Q.	Well, I don't know whether RTÉ has discovered the text	
2			of the broadcast?	
3		Α.	And I don't know either, Mr. McDowell, but I haven't	
4			seen it.	
5			MR. GILLANE: Chairman, just I don't want this hanging	10:33
6			in the air. This broadcast is, was and remains	
7			publicly available.	
8			CHAIRMAN: well, it is. I mean, there is no need for	
9			you to discover something that went out over the	
10			airwaves.	10:33
11			MR. McDOWELL: No, no, I am not suggesting there has	
12			been a failure to discover. I am just trying to pin	
13			down the text.	
14			CHAIRMAN: At the end of the day, Mr. McDowell, it's	
15			not within my terms of reference, but it could impact	10:33
16			in relation to what you may say is evidence of malice	
17			towards Sergeant McCabe. I mean, in other words, if	
18			they get a fact completely wrong and then promulgate	
19			that fact, that may be evidence to support the case of	
20			negative briefing in some way. I can see that. But I	10:33
21			could well just make a decision not to mention this at	
22			all.	
23			MR. McDOWELL: I appreciate that, Judge.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
25	46	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: The text, and I think that there is no	10:33
26			doubt about what the text is, of the broadcast, was:	
27				
28			"The Garda Commissioner wrote to the whistleblower	

Sergeant McCabe, Maurice McCabe, 14 months ago and told

1			him to cooperate with the investigation into	
2			allegations that penalty points had been cancelled.	
3			Martin Callinan issued a direction to the sergeant on	
4			the 14th December 2012 to cooperate with the	
5			investigation being carried out by the Assistant	10:34
6			Commissioner John O' Mahony and directing him to bring	
7			any information or concerns he had to the inquiry	
8			team."	
9				
10			Now, those propositions are false, aren't they?	10:34
11		Α.	Well, I think the direction speaks for itself,	
12			Mr. McDowell. It's very clear what I had invited the	
13			sergeant to do, and that was that if he had any	
14			concerns any further concerns, I think is the	
15			phraseology I used, and I know the Tribunal have the	10:34
16			document and if you want to peruse it, but I think the	
17			wording is very, very clear.	
18	47	Q.	I see. Yes. The next sentence is:	
19				
20			"The Garda Síochána is a disciplined force and members	10:35
21			are required to comply with directions issued by the	
22			Commi ssi oner."	
23			CHAIRMAN: What is this thing, by the way that, that we	
24			are all reading from now as if it is holy text?	
25			MR. McDOWELL: This is the text of the news item read	10:35
26			out by Mr. Reynolds on the day.	
27	48	Q.	And I have got to suggest to you that this was prompted	
28			by An Garda Síochána?	
29			MR. GILLANE: Chairman, what is in your hand is the	

1		script. It's the publicly available script.	
2		MR. McDOWELL: Yes.	
3		CHAIRMAN: I know, I know. It's like the famous	
4		composer said, we are drowning in a small pool at the	
5		moment.	10:35
6		MR. McDOWELL: Sorry, Judge. Well, Judge, I'm not	
7		trying to waste the Tribunal's time.	
8		CHAIRMAN: I know you are not, Mr. McDowell. I know	
9		you are not.	
10		MR. McDOWELL: I just want to get on with this.	10:35
11		CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that.	
12		MR. McDOWELL: I appreciate that the Tribunal wants me	
13		to be speedy and I am trying to get through this	
14		CHAIRMAN: No, no, Mr. McDowell, I fully appreciate	
15		that, but I mean, the wording is well, I'm saying	10:36
16		nothing.	
17		MR. McDOWELL: Yes.	
18		CHAIRMAN: We all know the Garda Síochána is supposed	
19		to be a disciplined force. I mean, why does RTÉ have	
20		to tell us that? I don't know.	10:36
21	49 Q.	MR. McDOWELL: What I'm suggesting to you is that this	
22		item suddenly appears in the news on that day, the 24th	
23		February 2014, prompted by An Garda Síochána telling	
24		RTÉ about these matters?	
25	Α.	I'm not aware of that, Mr. McDowell. The direction	10:36
26		that the article speaks to or the broadcast, whatever	
27		this document represents, was certainly something that	
28		I mentioned down at the Public Accounts Committee an	
29		the 23rd January '14 and it therefore was a matter of	

1			public record and I think it did get quite a piece of	
2			attendant publicity in the media subsequently. So it	
3			wasn't a fact that this is new material.	
4	50	Q.	You see, what I'm going to suggest to you is that there	
5			is no sense in which you wrote to Sergeant McCabe at	10:3
6			all; what actually happened was, he was called into a	
7			room and a document was read out to him and he asked	
8			for a copy of that document and it was refused to him,	
9			isn't that right?	
10		Α.	I've read that evidence, yes, or certainly read	10:3
11			transcript or something to indicate that is the	
12			situation, yes. And I don't have an argument with it,	
13			no.	
14	51	Q.	And did you give a direction that he was not to be	
15			given a copy of your direction?	10:3
16		Α.	I'm not entirely clear on that, but the situation was	
17			that these this direction should be brought to his	
18			attention.	
19	52	Q.	And it was in writing. Was there any reason why he	
20			couldn't be given a copy of it?	10:3
21		Α.	Not particularly.	
22	53	Q.	But I think it's not denied that he was refused a copy	
23			of it?	
24		Α.	I accept that, Chairman, yes.	
25	54	Q.	Yes. And then, I have got to suggest to you that the	10:3
26			news story that was broadcast that day, the text of	
27			which is in front of you there, was wholly misleading?	

The most misleading bit, if it is misleading

Well, I wouldn't --

CHAI RMAN:

28

29

Α.

1	at all, would seem to be the paragraph saying	
2	"Assistant Commissioner told the Public Accounts	
3	Committee that he asked the sergeant if he had any	
4	information, offered to sit down with him and give him	
5	a fair hearing." I mean, as I understand the evidence,	10:38
6	Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony and Maurice McCabe	
7	never communicated over this issue.	
8	MR. McDOWELL: No, what happened was, I think, Judge,	
9	there was Sergeant McCabe contacted the Commissioner	
10	after he heard the report was completed.	10:39
11	CHAIRMAN: Oh, that was later on. Yes.	
12	MR. McDOWELL: Yes. And it was at that stage that the	
13	Commissioner said well, you can come in and talk to me	
14	about it.	
15	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	10:39
16	MR. McDOWELL: But it was certainly not during the	
17	process itself.	
18	CHAIRMAN: No, no I appreciate that. And what I think	
19	what tends to fix it in one's mind is that we had this	
20	exchange in relation to the jury panel hearing, for	10:39
21	instance, the rape allegation and the name and	
22	Commissioner Callinan's evidence was, look, this was a	
23	protected disclosure, so therefore, I wasn't entitled	
24	to communicate with Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony.	
25	MR. McDOWELL: Yes.	10:39
26	CHAIRMAN: That's what I understand. So any	
27	communication that there was to be, whether Sergeant	
28	McCabe was expecting it, whether anyone wanted to do	
29	it they couldn't officially do it because the name was	

1			a secret even though it was extremely well-known within	
2			the Gardaí. That is what I understood the position. I	
3			mean, that may be silly, but it may be also true.	
4			MR. McDOWELL: well, Judge, maybe maybe we are at	
5			cross-purposes now.	10:40
6			CHAIRMAN: Maybe, yes.	
7	55	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: I am suggesting to you that the	
8			statement, Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony told the	
9			Public Accounts Committee that he was contacted on	
10			April 13th after he had forwarded his investigation to	10:40
11			the Minister for Justice; "The Assistant Commissioner	
12			said he asked the sergeant if he had any information	
13			for him and offered to sit down with him and give him a	
14			fair hearing." That was after he had completed his	
15			report, isn't that right?	10:40
16		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
17	56	Q.	And therefore, the impression given by that story is	
18			that Sergeant McCabe was a man who failed to cooperate	
19			with the O'Mahony investigation, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	well, he didn't take up the he didn't take up the	10:40
21			invitation to engage with	
22			CHAIRMAN: It's the way the two are put together. If I	
23			was reading that, coming to the whole thing completely	
24			fresh, I'd say oh and look, during the course of the	
25			investigation Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony actually	10:4
26			rang him up and offered to sit down with him and give	
27			him a fair hearing, but it wasn't, that was later on.	
28			You felt constricted, you said you couldn't communicate	
29			with Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony. Look, it may be	

- 1 a bit on the over-punctilious side but that is the 2 position you were in. But this seems to give the impression that Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony was 3 free to contact him which you say he wasn't and that he 4 5 did contact him, which he didn't, during the currency 10:41 of the preparation of the report, and instead, it put 6 7 something that happened afterwards when Sergeant McCabe 8 had, if you like, revealed himself into a context which doesn't fit. That seems to be what's happening there. 9 Yes, I think that is a fair summation, Chairman, yes. 10 Α. 10 · 41 11 57 Q. MR. McDOWELL: I have got to suggest to you that the 12 impression that that story creates is that Sergeant 13 McCabe had, for some reason of his own, withheld 14 cooperation from the O'Mahony inquiry? 15 No, he just didn't engage with it, Chairman. Α. 10:42 16 CHAI RMAN: No, but I think the story does create that impression, Mr. McDowell. I mean, it may be RTÉ have a 17 18 different view and it's only a preliminary view, that 19 is the view I take just reading the text on its own. 20 Well I'm sorry, that was your question. Α. 10:42 misunderstood. 21
- 22 CHAIRMAN: Yes. That was the question.
- A. Yeah. I misunderstood I am sorry, I am sorry. I would agree with that, yes.
- 25 58 Q. MR. McDOWELL: Well, fair enough. I mean, this was a 10:42 26 serious thing to say about Sergeant McCabe, to create 27 that impression, wasn't it?
- A. Well, it's a serious business when you are broadcasting on the airwaves, you like to be factually correct.

1	59 Q.	Yes. And I've got to suggest to you that that story	
2		can only have been broadcast on foot of a briefing	
3		given to Mr. Reynolds by An Garda Síochána?	
4		MR. GILLANE: Chairman, on what possible evidential	
5		basis can this question be put to this witness?	10:42
6		CHAIRMAN: well, on the basis that no one is ever going	
7		to tell me what the source was. I think that is the	
8		basis. And if people don't tell me the source I can	
9		actually put two and two together maybe, but maybe I	
10		can't because maybe there won't be two and two to make	10:43
11		four or there won't be anything else.	
12		MR. GILLANE: Yes. But I am just concerned that this	
13		particular broadcast, which was something that was not	
14		in fact a matter of any great significance as the	
15		Tribunal opened, indeed to my embarrassment when I	10:43
16		asked questions about it, Chairman, you interrupted me	
17		to say that you were lost because you thought we should	
18		have been talking about the 9th May, but I don't	
19		remember Mr. McDowell asking Sergeant McCabe a single	
20		question on this.	10:43
21		CHAIRMAN: what was the 9th of May?	
22		MR. GILLANE: The 9th May broadcast which is in the	
23		terms of reference.	
24		CHAIRMAN: Yes, it is. It is in the terms of	
25		reference, yes.	10:43
26		MR. GILLANE: I am just concerned that an area that	
27		Mr. McDowell asked no questions of Sergeant McCabe is	
28		not being something that he is elevating.	
29		CHAIRMAN: What could he ask him? How did you feel	

1	about this broadcast? I mean, the broadcast is a fact.	
2	What is the date of it, Mr. Gillane? What is the date	
3	of it?	
4	MR. GILLANE: The date of it is February of 2014. The	
5	24th February '14.	10:44
6	CHAIRMAN: And it's radio, is it?	
7	MR. GILLANE: It's originally on-line and then	
8	broadcast. But Sergeant McCabe himself accepted, and	
9	this is important because, Mr. Callinan wasn't here for	
10	his evidence, that Mr. Reynolds attempted to contact	10:44
11	Sergeant McCabe throughout that day and when he did	
12	eventually make contact Sergeant McCabe refused to put	
13	his side of this particular transaction to him. And	
14	ultimately released it later on the	
15	CHAIRMAN: No, I remember you saying that now,	10:44
16	Mr. Gillane. But look, you are making a fair point.	
17	But where Mr. McDowell is going, it seems to me, is	
18	legitimate. What he is saying is, not I am attacking	
19	RTÉ, but isn't the source of this, because it seems to	
20	be giving the ship a wrong steer, someone who clearly	10:44
21	has an animus against Sergeant McCabe and he is asking	
22	the Commissioner did it come from Headquarters, did it	
23	come from him. That is the point of the question.	
24	Now, it could be, I mean, journalists can be easily	
25	misled, unfortunately, just as I can be as well, and if	10:45
26	a journalist is misled and publishes something in the	
27	wrong, well there can be very unfortunate consequences	
28	for them in consequence of it, you know. But I'm not	
29	blaming RTÉ: all I'm seeing is whether or not there is	

1	a legitimate question. There is a legitimate question:	
2	Did the briefing material for this come from Garda	
3	Headquarters or the Commissioner? That is it. And you	
4	can come back of course, Mr. Gillane later.	
5	MR. DIGNAM: Chairman, I wonder could I raise a	0:45
6	slightly separate point but related to that question	
7	the Chairman put about the source? You will note from	
8	the beginning, the first paragraph, of Sergeant	
9	McCabe's statement that he refers to the source as	
10	being an unheaded Garda press statement or press	0:45
11	release. Now, I haven't seen that document, and I	
12	don't know whether Sergeant McCabe has a copy of it or	
13	whether he was simply mistaken in describing it as	
14	being a press release, but if he has it	
15	MR. McDOWELL: It's the latter, Judge. Sergeant McCabe 1	0:46
16	assumed that this text was actually composed by An	
17	Garda Síochána.	
18	CHAIRMAN: well, this is at a time that I am actually	
19	inquiring into, which is 1st July 2012 to 31st May	
20	2014, when Superintendent Taylor was the Garda Press	0:46
21	Officer. Now as I understand it, Mr. Dignam, you have	
22	given me all the press releases that can be of	
23	potential relevance and there is nothing which, if you	
24	like, fits with this.	
25	MR. DI GNAM: Yes.	0:46
26	CHAIRMAN: So therefore, if there was such a	
27	communication from the Garda Press Office or	
28	Headquarters or someone of Commissioner rank, it was	
29	done nursuant to under the cloak of iournalistic	

Т			privilege it would seem. But then again, maybe it	
2			never happened at all.	
3			MR. DIGNAM: And I am happy to take Mr. McDowell's	
4			confirmation that that was simply an assumption on	
5			Sergeant McCabe's part and that there is, in fact, no	10:46
6			document described as an unheaded press release or	
7			press statement, I am happy to take that confirmation.	
8			CHAIRMAN: At the moment there doesn't seem to be.	
9			MR. DIGNAM: Yes, thank you, Chairman.	
10	60	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: Could I ask you to go to page 4615 of	10:47
11			Volume 17?	
12		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Just remind me, if you wouldn't mind,	
14			Mr. Marrinan, what is SM1, or Ms. Leader, please?	
15			MR. MARRINAN: This is the Fennelly	10:48
16			CHAIRMAN: So that is the Fennelly phone, yes. So that	
17			is the Commissioner's phone.	
18	61	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: These are fragmentary extracts from your	
19			phone, as I understand it, which the Forensic Service	
20			of Northern Ireland have been able to identify.	10:48
21			CHAIRMAN: Yes, that's correct.	
22	62	Q.	And could I just bring you to item 18 there, an item on	
23			22nd March 2014. Somebody texts to you, I think:	
24				
25			"Yeah. Just thinking so much pressure being exerted	10:48
26			from Labour riding on Varadkar's opener."	
27				
28			And I have got to suggest to you that that is a	
29			reference to the distinguished rather	

1			than disgraceful or sorry, disgusting words. And	
2			then:	
3				
4			"Hope Kenny can control the PAC on Tuesday and you	
5			would need a plan B if needed in a hurry. I mean, what	10:4
6			you were putting together yesterday. Similarly if you	
7			were door-stepped or at an official function Reynolds	
8			would help out if an interview arose somewhere, just	
9			thoughts and not recommendations."	
10				10:4
11			Who would have written that to you, do you think?	
12		Α.	I have no idea, Chairman.	
13	63	Q.	But you see, the point is that, and I don't want to be	
14			unfair to Mr. Reynolds either, it does suggest that	
15			somebody was in a position to say that your position	10:4
16			would be assisted, Mr. Reynolds would be willing to	
17			help you out by a helpful interview at that stage when	
18			you were coming under political pressure.	
19		Α.	That may be so, I don't know. I just don't recall who	
20			sent that. I have no idea. But my experience with	10:4
21			Mr. Reynolds, he is well able to put very, very	
22			difficult questions to you, regardless of how convivial	
23			the setting may appear to be.	
24	64	Q.	Indeed.	
25			CHAIRMAN: This was the day before you resigned, or two	10:5
26			days.	
27		Α.	A couple of days earlier, three days, Chairman, yes.	

65 Q. MR. McDOWELL: So what I want to put to you is this: I

mean, you've come to this Tribunal to say that you had

28

1			no difficulty with Sergeant McCabe and no personal	
2			animus against him, is that right?	
3		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
4	66	Q.	And in fact, that you believed that he was somebody who	
5			was performing a valuable service?	10:5
6		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes. I have no difficulty with	
7			that.	
8	67	Q.	Could you I have got to suggest to you that you are	
9			retrospectively changing everything; in fact, that you	
10			believed that Sergeant McCabe was behaving very	10:5
11			improperly at the time?	
12		Α.	Only in the context and I have been very clear from	
13			the very beginning on this point, Mr. McDowell. Only	
14			in the context of the manner in which Sergeant McCabe	
15			was reporting what he was reporting. It was the manner	10:5
16			in which he was doing it. There were other avenues to	
17			go to first, i.e. his authorities. He is a sergeant in	
18			An Garda Síochána, a man of rank. These were very,	
19			very serious allegations that were being made. He had	
20			a duty to report those matters up through his	10:5
21			authorities in the first instance, wherever that	
22			journey may have taken him, but that was my belief.	
23	68	Q.	well, do you stand over a situation in which, for	
24			instance, when the O'Mahony report was established to	
25			look at allegations he had made, they never lifted the	10:5

Well, you see, if you look at the sequence of documents

that came from the Department of Justice in relation to

that matter, I was asked to inquire urgently into these

phone to him?

26

27

28

29

Α.

matters to see if there were any substantial weaknesses within the system that needed to be addressed.

3 69 Q. Yes.

29

And the documentation was unattributed and, as I have 4 Α. 5 indicated in my statement and here in evidence, there 10:52 6 was a confidentiality clause around that documentation. 7 So the assistant commissioner looked at the 8 documentation and satisfied himself that he was in a position to deal with all of those allegations through 9 looking through the Pulse system and through the fixed 10 10:53 11 charge penalty system and making whatever other inquiries he needed to make in relation to the 12 13 personnel that were identified in relation to the 14 allegations that were being made. So he proceeded on 15 that basis and he proceeded very, very carefully, and 10:53 16 he did it, in my view, with great clarity in the 17 context of trying to establish if there was any 18 criminality or disciplinary issues arising, and of 19 course he found a number of substantial disciplinary 20 issues that arose and substantial weaknesses within the 10:53 system, and a series of recommendations that were very 21 22 broadly in keeping with what the assistant 23 commissioner -- or I beg your pardon, the 24 inspectorate's report came up with subsequently and we 25 took immediate action on those recommendations and of 10:53 course there were others. 26 27 70 Q. You can't have it both ways, I suggest to you, 28 Mr. Callinan. You can't on the one hand say that you

gave him a direction in December 2012 to cooperate with

the inquiry and hold it against him that he didn't, on the one hand, while on the other hand saying that the inquiry could not lift a phone and ask him to have some input into the process, you can't have both; you can't have your cake and eat it on that point, I'm suggesting 10:54 to you?

A. And I am suggesting to you, Mr. McDowell, through the Chair, that is not the position I found myself in. I found I was in a position where there was a confidentiality clause, as I have said, I am only repeating myself here, and on that basis, the assistant commissioner conducted his investigation. He didn't feel constrained in the context of what he was asked to do, and it is very clearly the case that, in the middle

10:54

10:55

10:55

10:55

that without prejudice to the confidential reporting mechanism he could raise those concerns with the assistant commissioner, who at that time everybody was

Sergeant McCabe that if he had any further concerns,

of that investigation, I had sent a direction to

aware was engaged in the process of examining these

21 matters. It was crystal clear to me what the

22 invitation contained.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

28

29

23 71 Q. I see. I have got to suggest to you that, first of
24 all, what your direction said was that if he had any
25 further concerns he could contact Assistant
26 Commissioner O'Mahony, but he'd already made his
27 allegations, isn't that right?

A. Correct. But when we got the allegations they were unattributed. So, we could have all the suspicions in

Τ			the world we like but we were constrained in what we	
2			were doing at that particular time. But I do think,	
3			Mr. McDowell, and I think it's a very reasonable point,	
4			the Commissioner of An Garda Síochána was inviting the	
5			sergeant who had subsequently indicated he was the	10:56
6			author of those allegations, was being invited during	
7			the currency of the assistant commissioner's	
8			investigation, to bring any further concerns he had -	
9			it was an open invitation, as far as I was concerned -	
10			and the sergeant just didn't avail of that opportunity.	10:56
11			That's the position.	
12	72	Q.	He had made his report, isn't that right?	
13		Α.	We know that now.	
14	73	Q.	Sorry, you knew it then as well?	
15		Α.	We had suspicions that that was the case.	10:56
16	74	Q.	And you then put into the public domain, An Garda	
17			Síochána put into the public domain a story that he had	
18			not cooperated with the O'Mahony inquiry, that is what	
19			you did?	
20		Α.	Well, I certainly didn't do it, Mr. McDowell.	10:57
21			Absolutely not. RTÉ broadcast and I have seen the	
22			text you have given us, and I have read it.	
23	75	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	But I didn't give those that information to anybody.	
25	76	Q.	I see.	10:57
26		Α.	And the directions were a matter of public record, as	
27			I've said already.	
28	77	Q.	Now, could I I am suggesting to you that there was	

no reason in February of 2014 for anyone to make the

_			accusacion against sergeant mecabe that he had not	
2			cooperated with the O'Mahony investigation, no reason	
3			whatsoever.	
4		Α.	Well, all I can tell you, Mr. McDowell, is what I did.	
5	78	Q.	Yes.	10:58
6		Α.	And I wasn't involved in this matter.	
7	79	Q.	Now, when you were at the Public Accounts Committee, on	
8			a number of occasions the transcript shows that you	
9			spoke about reserving your position on disciplinary	
10			action?	10:58
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	80	Q.	Now, at this stage John Wilson had retired as a member	
13			of the force, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
15	81	Q.	So the only person you were talking about in this	10:58
16			context was Sergeant McCabe, is that right?	
17		Α.	Yes, that would be fair, Chairman, yes.	
18	82	Q.	And you were saying you were reserving your position	
19			about taking disciplinary action against him, isn't	
20			that right?	10:58
21		Α.	Well, it's not as direct as that. It was in the	
22			context of the matters that I was considering at that	
23			time. Chairman, just to try and put it in context,	
24			what I was looking at at that particular time was the	
25			fact that Sergeant Maurice McCabe had made these	10:59
26			allegations. They were allegations of wrongdoing, and	
27			I took a very fixed position, that it was inappropriate	
28			what was happening, passing on this printing off	
29			Pulse records and passing them on to third parties. I	

Т			took that, and I took a very serious view of it and my	
2			views are well-known and the exchange of correspondence	
3			and the evidence I gave to the Committee is there to	
4			amplify those points. So I was caught between, clearly	
5			it was wrong, as far as I was concerned, and in	10:59
6			ordinary circumstances there would be disciplinary	
7			action, but I balanced that against the fact that	
8			Sergeant McCabe earnestly believes he was reporting	
9			wrongdoing. So therefore, that wasn't a situation	
10			that or a road I could travel down very comfortably	11:00
11			as far as I was concerned.	
12	83	Q.	And you didn't know at that at that stage that in the	
13			previous September the Department of Justice had	
14			invited Sergeant McCabe to communicate with an	
15			Oireachtas Committee?	11:00
16		Α.	well, I think the document we read earlier,	
17			Mr. McDowell, speaks to objections that the Sergeant	
18			had with the assistant commissioner's investigation.	
19	84	Q.	Report. Yes.	
20		Α.	I mean, that is what that document appears to me to be	11:00
21			about and it's the first time I read it.	
22	85	Q.	Yes. Now, could I ask	
23		Α.	So it's a different point, with respect.	
24	86	Q.	Could I ask you to look at Volume 5, page 1347.	
25		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	11:01
26	87	Q.	First of all, halfway down the page, Deputy John Deasy	
27			says:	
28				

"What are the Commissioner's views on how this

_			committee is doing its business: Let us say i agree	
2			with the Commissioner and that I have a similar	
3			concern, I'm not questioning anyone's bona fides,	
4			whistleblowers, but I am getting to the nub of the	
5			issue. The Commissioner is saying that in his	11:01
6			information he cannot make a decision or an analysis	
7			based on a fragment of information."	
8				
9			Now, that shows Deputy Deasy being supportive of you,	
10			isn't that right?	11:01
11		Α.	To that point, yes. I mean, I accept what is here,	
12			yes, absolutely.	
13	88	Q.	And I've got to suggest to you in passing that that the	
14			other day yesterday, you advanced the possibility to	
15			Mr. Marrinan that somehow because Deputy Deasy and	11:02
16			McGuinness both served on the same committee that this	
17			would explain why Deputy Deasy would have attributed	
18			the remarks he did to you in your meeting before the	
19			PAC meeting, I have got to suggest to that you	
20			throughout the proceedings of the PAC, Deputy Deasy was	11:02
21			supportive of your position, not pursuing an agenda	
22			against you of any kind?	
23		Α.	Well, he certainly didn't pursue the point with me that	
24			I had indicated just prior to the meeting that I was	
25			saying things about Sergeant Maurice McCabe, about him	11:02
26			not to be trusted and that he had questions to answer,	
27			he certainly did not put those questions to me.	
28	89	Q.	No?	
29		Δ	Which I am quite surprised about in the context of what	

1	he	has	come	up	with	several	vears	later.

- 2 90 Q. And I have got to suggest to you that the most likely
 3 explanation was that he thought that you were warning
 4 him against the creditworthiness of Sergeant McCabe and
 5 that he thought it would be improper to raise these
 6 matters in public?
- A. Well, that's certainly not what I said to the deputy at the time. I certainly did indicate to him that not all of the allegations made by Sergeant McCabe were correct, and I cautioned on the need to be aware of the accuracy of some of the information, some of them were questionable. That is what I said to the deputy. And I was very clear about that.

11:03

11 · 04

14 91 Q. Can I bring you to page 1348, where you said in evidence to that committee:

16

29

17 "I should preface my remarks by indicating that one of 18 the people who was now engaged in this so-called 19 whistleblowing exercise is a person who is a serving 20 member of An Garda Síochána as I understand it. 21 that is the case then he or she is subject to the 22 disciplinary regulations. It is the case that at any 23 time, at any place, anywhere, a member of An Garda 24 Síochána can step outside the ordinary standards 25 expected of that member. If that is the case, then I would have to consider whether I would have access to 26 27 the disciplinary regulations to deal with that issue. 28 I am not for a moment suggesting that I will go down

the road of exercising discipline in this particular

Т			case, but it's certainly something on which I would	
2			have to reserve my position."	
3				
4			Now, I've got to suggest to you that those words were	
5			spoken about Sergeant McCabe and that you knew full	11:04
6			well what you meant by them on the occasion.	
7		Α.	There is no question about that, Chairman.	
8	92	Q.	You were threatening him with disciplinary action as a	
9			possibility?	
10		Α.	No, I certainly was not, Chairman. What I was doing	11:04
11			there was amplifying the point that, you know, we are a	
12			disciplined organisation. There is an expectation that	
13			people, if they are reporting wrongdoing, don't go off	
14			printing off hundreds and hundreds of documents off the	
15			Pulse computer and pass them on to third parties	11:05
16			without permission. That's what I was speaking about	
17			there.	
18	93	Q.	And you were stating that in relation to Sergeant	
19			McCabe?	
20		Α.	well, clearly he's the only member that's there at that	11:05
21			particular time, yes.	
22	94	Q.	And at the bottom of that page you say:	
23				
24			"I don't want it to be said that I am considering	
25			disciplinary action with regard to these people, I have	11:05
26			given it very careful consideration and I will continue	
27			to do so. However, there may come a point at which I	
28			will have to seriously consider this matter for all of	

the reasons I have indicated. I cannot allow a

situation to continue where information is being bandied around. I realise people are relying on a certain section of the law as authority."

4

5

6

29

96

Q.

You were talking about Sergeant McCabe at that stage, 11:05 isn't that right?

11:05

- A. Well, not exclusively about Sergeant McCabe, but
 certainly he's included in those remarks because there
 may have been others who contributed to the document as
 well, I don't know. But the point I'm making here is,
 beyond the documentation that we seem to have, there
 was more documentation out there.
- 13 95 Q. Yes.
- And that's what I was trying to deal with. 14 Α. We were --15 it was also the case, I suppose, Mr. McDowell, I should 11:06 16 mention, Chairman, there was a data protection audit 17 just a couple of months previous and they were very, 18 very clear in terms of cautioning the Commissioner and 19 management about the manner in which people were 20 trawling the system and looking for information that 11:06 they otherwise ought not to be engaged in looking at 21 22 that information. Now, I know it's Sergeant McCabe's 23 case that he was looking for material that he felt was 24 suspect because there were wrongdoing or there could be 25 a suggestion that there was wrongdoing, which probably 11:06 26 is a slightly different point. But nonetheless, my 27 concern was that these matters were being given to 28 third parties and wrongfully, in my view.

I have to suggest to you that Sergeant McCabe at no

1			time engaged in behaviour designed to have people	
2			identified in public as the recipient of favours under	
3			the fixed charge penalty system?	
4		Α.	I don't know if that is the position or not.	
5	97	Q.	And I've got to suggest to you, for instance, in	11:07
6			relation to the visit to your own house, that, I mean,	
7			the record of An Garda Síochána's computer system will	
8			clearly show that Sergeant McCabe had nothing to do	
9			with that incident?	
10		Α.	I don't know that and I don't know who printed off that	11:07
11			document, because I never followed that up and, you	
12			know, it could be the case it was passed on to him, I	
13			don't know.	
14	98	Q.	No, I have got to suggest to you that he had nothing	
15			whatever to do with that and that the Pulse records, if	11:08
16			consulted, would show that he had no connection, hand,	
17			act or part with that series of events?	
18		Α.	That may be so. That may be so.	
19	99	Q.	And I have also got to suggest to you that you made it	
20			clear to the Committee that you knew exactly who you	11:08
21			were dealing with because on page 1349 of that volume,	
22			you say:	
23				
24			"Wrongdoing by any member of An Garda Síochána will not	
25			be tolerated by me or by any member of my office or	11:08
26			corps. The committee can take that as a given. There	
27			is a difference between reporting wrongdoing and	
28			consistently putting about large volumes of material.	
29			These are parameters I must consider. When I became	

Т			aware of it it issued a very crear direction to the two	
2			members involved. We had a discussion with Deputy	
3			McDonald on the last occasion I was before the	
4			Committee when I became aware of the identities of	
5			these people and what they were saying. I have	11:09
6			carefully checked my records since then. In December,	
7			following on from the information that the retired	
8			member of the force and a serving member were working	
9			together to provide information and materials for an	
10			elected representative, I took advice and was advised	11:09
11			that this was wrong."	
12				
13			Now, you were talking about Sergeant McCabe there,	
14			isn't that right?	
15		Α.	I was. I was. And Garda former Garda John Wilson.	11:09
16			Both.	
17	100	Q.	And you knew who you were talking about?	
18		Α.	At that time, I knew there was material leaked in the	
19			public domain, Chairman, and I tried my best to put a	
20			stop to it. I took legal advice. And the advice I got	11:09
21			was to take action the way I did. I deal with the	
22			directions.	
23	101	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	And, you know, that happened again during a period when	
25			the assistant commissioner was dealing with the actual	11:10
26			investigation.	
27	102	Q.	I have got to suggest to you that the direction that	
28			was read out to Sergeant McCabe on the 14th December	

2012 was in the following terms:

1		
2	"The Commissioner understands that you have been	
3	searching and printing out from Pulse documents that	
4	contain sensitive personal data regarding the	
5	cancellation of a fixed charge notices. The	11:10
6	Commissioner further understands that it is your	
7	intention to provide a third party with that	
8	documentation. It is noted that sensitive personal	
9	data in relation to fixed charge cancellations have	
10	already appeared in the public domain. The	11:10
11	Commissioner has sought the advice of the Attorney	
12	General and has consulted with the Data Protection	
13	Commissioner in respect of this matter. You are aware	
14	that there is powers as set out in the Garda Policy	
15	Procedure and Guidelines for cancelling these fixed	11:10
16	charge notices in certain instances in such	
17	circumstances. Having consulted with the above	
18	mentioned authority, the Commissioner is satisfied that	
19	your continued access to Pulse data and disclosure of	
20	it and personal data to a third party is likely to be	11:11
21	in breach of the Data Protection Act and other	
22	legislation as well as being prejudicial to the current	
23	investigation being undertaken by Assistant	
24	Commissioner John O'Mahony."	
25		11:11
26	Now I stop there	
27	CHAIRMAN: You should maybe have given a page number	
28	for that, Mr. McDowell, if you wouldn't mind, please.	

29

MR. McDOWELL: I don't know whether it has been given a

Т			page number.	
2			CHAIRMAN: I think it has.	
3			MR. GILLANE: I think 3033 is the	
4			MR. McDOWELL: 3033, thanks, Judge. I have been	
5			hunting it for it in the index furiously for the last	11:11
6			while, Judge. I am grateful to my friends. What	
7			volume is that?	
8			MR. MARRINAN: Volume 11.	
9			CHAIRMAN: We can have it on the screen, anyway.	
10			That's it. Yes. But in any event, that is the	11:12
11			direction, Mr. McDowell, and you wanted to ask a	
12			question.	
13			MR. McDOWELL: Yes.	
14	103	Q.	This is in fact the tape-recording that Sergeant McCabe	
15			made of this occasion, because after the words "being	11:12
16			undertaken by Assistant Commissioner John O'Mahony"	
17			Sergeant McCabe says "okay, so that is" Sorry	
18			CHAIRMAN: Can you scroll down, please, Mr. Kavanagh?	
19	104	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: "Okay, that is the instructions to you	
20			in his direction."	11:12
21				
22			And then it continues:	
23				
24			"The direction is as follows: The Commissioner is now	
25			directing you to desist from the practice of accessing	11:12
26			Pulse and/or disclosing to third parties sensitive	
27			personal data regarding the cancellation of fixed	
28			charge notices by members of An Garda Síochána. If you	
29			have any further concerns and without prejudice to your	

1 rights under the Confidential Reporting Mechanism, such 2 matters can be brought to the attention of Assistant 3 Commissioner John O' Mahony, Crime and Security, who will fully investigate those matters." 4 5 11:13 6 Now, I have got to suggest to that you this could not 7 under any circumstance be construed as a direction to 8 cooperate. I think the direction speaks for itself, Chairman. 9 Α. mean, if you look at the final sentence - "If you've 10 11 · 13 11 any concerns and without prejudice to your rights under 12 the Confidential Reporting Mechanism -- " - I had to 13 provide that option; I couldn't not. 14 105 Q. Yes. 15 "-- such matters can be brought to the attention of the 11:13 Α. 16 Assistant Commissioner John O'Mahony, Crime and 17 Security, who will fully investigate these matters." 18 Chairman, I don't think I could be any clearer in terms 19 of what I was asking the sergeant to do on that 20 I think it's perfectly clear. occasion. 11:14 21 106 Well, I've got to suggest to you now, Mr. Callinan, Q. 22 that in those circumstances, it was completely 23 unreasonable for Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony's team 24 not to contact Sergeant McCabe during the compilation of the report, and secondly, during a period of time 25 11 · 14 26 when they did find it possible to go and speak to 27 Bernard McCabe about his unfounded charges against 28 Sergeant McCabe, I have got to suggest to you that it 29 is utterly unreasonable to charge Sergeant McCabe with

1			non-cooperation based on that document?	
2		Α.	Well, I certainly didn't charge Sergeant McCabe with	
3			anything.	
4	107	Q.	No, to make the charge against him.	
5		Α.	No, no, it's not unreasonable. It's certainly not	11:14
6			unreasonable. It's a simple invitation based on the	
7			facts as I knew them at that point, that if they had	
8			any further concerns or if he had any further concerns,	
9			that he could take those concerns to the assistant	
10			commissioner. Chairman, I don't think I could have	11:15
11			been any clearer, you know; there was a confidentiality	
12			clause in existence at the time and the assistant	
13			commissioner was dealing with matters that he felt he	
14			could deal with quite competently in the context of	
15			what he was asked to do.	11:15
16	108	Q.	And the note continues on the next page, the transcript	
17			of what happened. Maurice McCabe says:	
18				
19			"But I didn't do any of that.	
20			Chief superintendent: Well, I'm only telling you that	11:15
21			that is the direction from the Commissioner.	
22			Maurice McCabe: And what happens under the Garda	
23			Síochána Act when you are allowed hand over stuff under	
24			section 62 and the whistleblower charter, what about	
25			that?	11:15
26			Chief superintendent: I think you need to raise that	
27			with Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony. Honestly that	
28			might be the way you pursue it.	
29			Maurice McCabe: That he is a serious accusation.	

Τ	chief superintendent: The directions on it and just	
2	to make sure that we are both clear, I will read it out	
3	to you again.	
4	Maurice McCabe: No, I am very clear. He is accusing	
5	me of handing stuff over."	11:16
6		
7	The chief then reads out from the first paragraph,	
8	again to explain what the Commissioner is accusing	
9	Maurice McCabe of, and then reads out the whole lot	
10	again.	11:16
11		
12	"So he is saying I did that."	
13		
14	Says Maurice McCabe.	
15		11:16
16	"The Commissioner has facts on which he is basing these	
17	comments. I will read it out one more time so that you	
18	understand it."	
19		
20	He reads it all out again.	11:16
21		
22	"Maurice McCabe: He is basically saying that I gave	
23	information to somebody else so the whistleblower	
24	charter is gone, finished, because he is saying there	
25	is if the Data Protection Commissioner asked me for	11:16
26	stuff what do I do? Do I say no to him? He has asked	
27	for stuff."	
28		
29	And the chief says:	

T		
2	"No, no. Don't. If you want authority to do anything	
3	or you have an issue in relation to these matters you	
4	can talk to Assistant Commissioner John O' Mahony or you	
5	can send your concerns here in relation to that.	11:17
6	Maurice McCabe: So I can't go near the whistleblower	
7	charter anymore, obviously.	
8	Chief superintendent: You cannot.	
9	Maurice McCabe: I can. He reads out the report to me	
10	again. He is after accusing me of stuff there that I	11:17
11	didn't do and that is shocking. The only person I	
12	forward it to was An Taoiseach and so I will have to	
13	take it up with him because he must be the third party.	
14	Shocking stuff."	
15		11:17
16	And the chief says:	
17		
18	"I know, but that is his legal advice."	
19		
20	And he goes on:	11:17
21		
22	"But even the Data Protection Commissioner, he asked me	
23	for stuff so what do I say to him? No?"	
24		
25	And the chief says:	11:17
26		
27	"No. Well, that is the instruction and you will be in	
28	breach of discipline and any other possible acts if you	
29	ignore it.	

1	Maurice McCabe: So I am allowed email Enda Kenny about
2	that?
3	Chief superintendent: I can give you an answer, in my
4	own personal answer I think you should address it with
5	John O' Mahony. The direction is down there and he will 11:18
6	deal with your concerns.
7	Maurice McCabe: Shocking stuff. So basically I can do
8	nothi ng?
9	Chief superintendent: What you need to do is what you
10	are meant to do, your day-to-day duty.
11	Maurice McCabe: Oh, and not report anything which is
12	wrong, which
13	Chief superintendent: This is a direction from the
14	Commissioner. You are searching Pulse for a particular
15	reason.
16	Maurice McCabe: I got a complaint in relation to that
17	from a Garda, I carried out my duty.
18	Chief superintendent: Did you report that?
19	Maurice McCabe: I carried out my duty.
20	Chief superintendent: Did you report it here? 11:18
21	Maurice McCabe: I carried out my duty. I carried out
22	my duties in relation to that.
23	Chief superintendent: Did you report it through the
24	channel s?
25	Maurice McCabe: I carried out my duties in relation to 11:18
26	it.
27	Chi ef superi ntendent: Okay.
28	Maurice McCabe: I used the whistleblowing charter.

Let's not argue as regards the last paragraph. You

T		will have no issues with me any more.	
2		Chief superintendent: That is all I want to know.	
3		Maurice McCabe: You won't, chief, you won't, no. But	
4		it's just amazing, I did not think it was that, I	
5		thought it was it was something.	11:18
6		Chief superintendent: No, you should follow that, it	
7		is a direction.	
8		Maurice McCabe: Yes, it is, and I will follow that. I	
9		won't disobey any direction and you make note of that,	
10		Paddy. I won't disobey any directions in relation to	11:19
11		that. You have my full compliance and I am just	
12		amazed. But sure"	
13			
14		And he says there is small talk. And at the end he	
15		says:	11:19
16			
17		"Do I get a copy of that?	
18		Chief superintendent: No.	
19		Maurice McCabe: Well, okay, it won't happen anyway. I	
20		will give you my word. It's not your problem anyway,	11:19
21		you were sent to read it out to me."	
22			
23		Now, I have got to suggest to you that Sergeant McCabe	
24		was making it very clear that he had not misbehaved or	
25		broken the law.	11:19
26	Α.	You've read out the document to me and I have listened	
27		very carefully to it, but I wasn't involved in that.	
28		All I was involved in was providing the direction and	
29		asking for that knowledge to be imparted to Sergeant	

- McCabe. That was the extent of my involvement in the matter.
- 3 109 Q. And you see, I'm suggesting to you that to portray him
 4 as somebody who was uncooperative with the O'Mahony
 5 inquiry, in the face of all of that, is just wholly
 6 misleading to the public, and again, deeply insulting
- to Sergeant McCabe.
- A. Well, you see, the reality is, I had sent a direction and I had invited him to engage if he wished and he didn't. It's as simple as that from my perspective.

11 . 20

- 11 110 Q. You didn't ask him. You said if you have any further concerns you can express them?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 111 Q. Further concerns?
- 15 And I think that's a clear invitation, Chairman, with Α. 11:20 16 I think that is a very clear invitation. 17 mean, consider what is happening here: Sergeant McCabe 18 has produced two lists, list A and list B, came under 19 confidential cover to the Department or however they got it, it was sent to me and I was told there was this 11:20 20 confidentiality clause was in it, it contained list of 21 22 189 allegations which, when they were analysed, broke 23 down to something in the region 1,189 if I'm correct, 24 very, very serious allegations, very, very serious 25 allegations, and the assistant commissioner went about 11 · 21 26 his business then investigating those matters and 27 reporting back. Now, if that is attributed, as we now know, to Sergeant McCabe and there doesn't seem to be 28 29 any dispute about it, why in the name of God did he not

1			come to his authorities, Chairman? I mean, from where	
2			I'm sitting, it flies it flew in the face of logic	
3			that he wouldn't do that in the first instance. If he	
4			had difficulties thereafter and didn't agree, and we	
5			have seen the report that you read out, Mr. McDowell,	11:21
6			and Mr. Flahive writing back, challenging him basically	
7			that if he didn't agree with the assistant	
8			commissioner's report he should bring those matters to	
9			the various third parties. But the first step is, your	
10			own authorities. You are told as a young guard if you	11:22
11			see or observe wrongdoing, you deal with it if you can,	
12			and if you can't you report it.	
13	112	Q.	That would be all very well, Mr. Callinan, if you	
14			personally had not directed the deputy commissioner of	
15			An Garda Síochána, Nacie Rice, to write defending the	11:22
16			Rooney letter to Sergeant McCabe's solicitors. You	
17			personally directed that your Deputy Commissioner	
18			should defend what was done in that letter.	
19		Α.	Are you opening a document to me? I don't know whether	
20			you are.	11:22
21	113	Q.	We went through all of the correspondence in the	
22			document the other day.	
23		Α.	No	
24	114	Q.	Are you for one minute saying that you didn't depute to	
25			Deputy Commissioner Rice dealing with the Rooney	11:22
26			letter?	
27		Α.	I haven't seen the documentation, if you want to open	
28			it to me I will look at it.	

29

CHAIRMAN: Are we talking about the letter of the 4th

Τ			July 2011? Is that what we are talking about?	
2			MR. McDOWELL: Yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: There's no systemic failures, Byrne/McGinn	
4			has identified, just minor errors, Chief Superintendent	
5			Colm Rooney, that letter?	11:23
6		Α.	Oh, yes. And I have already agreed, Chairman, that	
7			that was an inappropriate letter to send.	
8	115	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: well, that was an inappropriate letter	
9			to send. You were made aware of it as Commissioner,	
10			and you deputed to Deputy Commissioner Nacie Rice the	11:23
11			job of defending the sending of that letter and	
12			indicating that any proceedings arising out of it would	
13			be defended, that is what you did?	
14		Α.	well, perhaps we could look at the documentation,	
15			because I don't know I don't really know what you	11:23
16			are talking about.	
17	116	Q.	Well, I can get you the documentation if you like.	
18		Α.	I think that would be	
19	117	Q.	But can I ask you	
20			CHAIRMAN: I think it may be on another computer system	11:24
21			because it may be not on the documents distributed here	
22			but it is what we are talking about is that letter	
23			of the 4th July 2011: No systemic failures as	
24			identified in Byrne/McGinn, just minor errors and then	
25			that was sent by Chief Superintendent Rooney to	11:24
26			Bailieboro.	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28			CHAIRMAN: And I suppose the idea was, what I had it in	
29			my head was, it was pinned up everywhere, like you are	

1			vindicated, guys, you didn't make any mistakes at all,	
2			which is completely off the wall.	
3		Α.	I agree 100 percent, Chairman, absolutely 100 percent	
4			with you, that was a complete nonsense as far as I'm	
5			concerned.	11:24
6	118	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: Could I ask you, I did draw to your	
7			attention yesterday	
8		Α.	You did, that letter.	
9	119	Q.	Yes, I did. And if I go to page 7237 in Volume 26. If	
10			you go to the bottom of the page, you will see the	11:25
11			materials which were summarised for you in that	
12			document about Sergeant McCabe, the file about Sergeant	
13			McCabe that was compiled sometime in 2013.	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15			CHAIRMAN: This is the PAC file we are talking about,	11:25
16			the one the FSNI found on the Garda system. Do we go	
17			to the relevant date, is that what we do?	
18			MR. McDOWELL: We are on page 7237, Judge.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Yes. And it's "supplementary issue.	
20			Chief Superintendent Rooney, letter of complaint of	11:25
21			Clare Daly TD." And it mentions just "4 July 2011,	
22			Chief Superintendent Rooney Letter" and then 29 July, a	
23			Deputy Daly complains to I presume that is Colm	
24			Rooney.	
25		Α.	Commissioner, I'd say, Chairman.	11:26
26			CHAIRMAN: Oh yes, maybe. "Commissioner re the Colm	
27			Rooney Letter."	
28	120	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: And you will see there is a series of	
29			letters in August, November and December of 2011, and	

1			it records, for instance, that on the 25th November	
2			2011, there was a message from your office to Deputy	
3			Commissioner Rice for attention, "reply to Costello and	
4			report developments". That's, your office is doing	
5			that.	11:26
6		Α.	But sure, I don't know what that correspondence relates	
7			to, Mr. McDowell. Nor do you, with respect.	
8	121	Q.	Well, I do know what it relates to. It relates to	
9			correspondence which Mr. Costello sent to the	
10			Commissioner of An Garda Síochána arguing that this	11:27
11			letter was defamatory and asking for it to be withdrawn	
12			and indicating that there would be legal action if it	
13			wasn't withdrawn.	
14			CHAIRMAN: well, there is a defamation action arising	
15			out of that.	11:27
16		Α.	That may well be what the correspondence is about as	
17			opposed yes, I would accept just to peddle	
18			backwards for a moment, if I may, Chairman. It does	
19			appear from looking at this summary document and, as I	
20			say, I don't recognise that document and I accept it	11:27
21			was, the forensic people indicated that it was compiled	
22			sometime in '13, but on the "4th July '11, Chief	
23			Superintendent Rooney Letter", and then "29th July,	
24			Clare Daly to Commissioner", and then "5th August,	
25			Acting Commissioner" and then "8th August, Acting	11:27
26			Commissioner" again, it does appear that I was away at	
27			that period.	
28	122	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: Yes.	

29

A. And the Acting Commissioner would have dealt with the

1			correspondence, just to make that point. Because all	
2			of the correspondence would be addressed to the	
3			Commissioner naturally enough.	
4	123	Q.	Yes. I appreciate that. But if we go to the 25th	
5			November, there is your office writing to the deputy	11:28
6			commissioner for the attention "to reply to Costello	
7			and report developments".	
8		Α.	Yes. But I really would like to see that	
9			correspondence, because I'm not entirely clear is it a	
10			response to litigation as the	11:28
11			CHAIRMAN: well no, I think there is a big point here	
12			and again it may be that the danger is to get bogged	
13			down in detail. The big point here is that the first	
14			draft of Byrne/McGinn came to the attention of Chief	
15			Superintendent Colm Rooney, so on the 4th July 2011,	11:28
16			having seen that, he decides to write to those	
17			involved - who, by the way, we know certainly from the	
18			O'Higgins Commission report, had made an absolute mess	
19			of several investigations	
20		Α.	Yes.	11:29
21			CHAIRMAN: that they were completely vindicated and	
22			that all that was uncovered was a few minor errors, and	
23			there was no evidence of corruption, there was no	
24			evidence of serious malpractice. Now, the big point	
25			being made here is that that upset Sergeant McCabe	11:29
26			because he was saying, look, the policing system in	
27			Bailieboro is a complete mess. He was, therefore,	

isolated effectively, bullied through this

correspondence by it being circulated. So effectively

28

- 1 everyone was laughing about him behind his back. That
- is probably what was happening on the ground. What
- 3 Mr. McDowell is asking you about is, given that that
- 4 was the case and given that Chief Superintendent Rooney
- has said, look, I was wrong to send the letter and I
- 6 apologise, given that you take the view that the letter

11:30

- 7 was a foolish letter --
- 8 A. I agree.
- 9 CHAIRMAN: Yes -- wasn't it the case that the
- 10 Commissioner's office and specifically you were backing 11:30
- 11 up Chief Superintendent Rooney in making these rather
- foolish points? That I think is the point that is
- being made to you.
- 14 A. I see. If that is --
- 15 124 Q. MR. McDOWELL: Exactly. To use the phrase the Chairman 11:30
- used yesterday, this wasn't Chief Superintendent Rooney
- simply on a frolic of his own; complaint was made about
- it to the highest level of An Garda Síochána, including
- 19 your own office, and nothing was done about it, it was
- left there uncorrected and Sergeant McCabe was left
- vilified in this way as a crank who was causing trouble
- to, unnecessarily to An Garda Síochána.
- 23 A. But it does appear that there was a sequence of
- 24 documentation over and back and there seems to be a
- chronological log there in that paragraph.
- 26 125 Q. Yes.
- 27 A. So it was being attended to in some shape or form.
- 28 126 Q. Yes. But it was never withdrawn until this Tribunal
- was established and Chief Superintendent Rooney had the

1			decency, belated decency to come and say he should	
2			never have sent that letter?	
3		Α.	And I would agree, that was absolutely correct.	
4	127	Q.	But it's not as if he just did it quietly because it	
5			was brought to your office's attention that this had	11:31
6			happened?	
7		Α.	When do you say	
8	128	Q.	And you gave the function of handling the	
9			correspondence from the solicitor to Deputy	
10			Commissioner Nacie Rice. So it's not a question of you	11:31
11			being unaware of the Rooney letter.	
12		Α.	When you say I gave the direction to The Deputy	
13			Commissioner Rice to deal with this matter, I don't	
14			know when that was. I am assuming that I was away from	
15			the office and the Deputy Commissioner was acting as	11:31
16			the Commissioner at the time. But I certainly don't	
17			recall giving any direction of that nature at all to	
18			the Deputy Commissioner. And I don't know what those	
19			letters contain.	
20	129	Q.	I see. Well okay, I am putting to you the proposition	11:32
21			that to say to somebody in Sergeant McCabe's position,	
22			make your reports through the usual channels up through	
23			the system and they will be fairly dealt with, in the	
24			light of how he was treated, in respect of the	
25			Byrne/McGinn report and the Rooney letter, was asking	11:32
26			him to be humiliated a second time around?	
27		Α.	I don't agree with that, Chairman. Certainly not. I	
28			know that Mr. O'Higgins, in his report, did make	
29			certain criticisms of the Byrne/McGinn investigation	

- but all of the substantial matters that Sergeant McCabe
 complained about were upheld --
- 3 130 Q. Yes.
- 4 A. -- to my recollection. I think that was the position.
- 5 131 Q. You see, the letter says that the Garda Commissioner,

11:33

11:33

11:33

- and that was yourself at the time, had approved the
- 7 findings of the Byrne/McGinn investigation.
- 8 A. Well, you see, it went beyond just the Byrne/McGinn
- 9 report. As you are aware, there was a sequel. The
- sergeant made a complaint of assault and false
- imprisonment against the Assistant Commissioner, you
- 12 are aware of that.
- 13 132 Q. I know about the fracas in the hotel. I know that,
- 14 yes.
- 15 A. Correct. So that was investigated quite speedily,
- running in parallel with the review that was carried
- out by The Deputy Commissioner and his team. So it was
- a combination of all of those things, coupled with the
- fact there was several disciplinary measures taken,
- people were transferred, all of those things, further
- corrections in relation to the system. That was my
- note on approval. It wasn't that I was agreeing
- precisely with every single aspect of the Byrne/McGinn
- report, that wasn't the case.
- 25 133 Q. I see.
- 26 A. I had the full picture in front of me at that time.
- 27 134 Q. So you are distancing yourself now from the
- 28 Byrne/McGinn report, is that right?
- 29 A. Of course I'm not. Why would I be doing that?

1 135 Q. Well, fair enough. Can I conclude by putting the
2 following propositions to you: That you have come here
3 to portray your relationship with Sergeant McCabe as
4 one which was one of great respect for Sergeant McCabe
5 and that you had no problems with him.

- A. I had no problems with Sergeant McCabe making any complaints that he wished to make, Chairman. That is his entitlement, as the same as any other member of An Garda Síochána.
- 10 136 Q. And I have got to suggest to you that the reality is quite different; that Sergeant McCabe spent a number of years in circumstances where, following the Rooney letter, he was regarded as an outcast in An Garda Síochána.
- 15 A. Well, I don't accept that is the case. And, you know, 11:35

 We have to be open, honest and reasonable here.
- 17 137 Q. Yes.
- A. The reality, Chairman, is, this man was making
 complaints against his colleagues, so of course there
 would be tensions there and of course there would be
 bad feelings.
- 22 138 Q. Yes. But if there were bad feelings between
 23 colleagues, the duty of people like Chief
 24 Superintendent Rooney was to be fair and to -- and to
 25 uphold Sergeant McCabe's right to make complaints
 26 instead of ridiculing them, isn't that right?
- 27 A. I agree, Chairman, yes.
- 28 139 Q. And I have got to suggest to you that far from being somebody who was respected by you, you never once made

1			it your business to talk to him about his issues, never	
2			once?	
3		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, no. I didn't, no.	
4	140	Q.	Why did you never once, as Deputy McGuinness asked you	
5			on one occasion, just lift the phone to the man?	11:36
6		Α.	Well, you see, there were many people interacting with	
7			Sergeant McCabe.	
8	141	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	I mean, we are a structured service, there is no doubt	
10			at all about it.	11:3
11	142	Q.	I am suggesting to you that you put a huge value on	
12			maintaining your distance from Sergeant McCabe, even to	
13			the point of drafting a letter suggesting that, instead	
14			of agreeing with Deputy McGuinness that you should just	
15			speak to the man, you wanted to interpose a chief	11:30
16			superintendent between you and him, you didn't want to	
17			speak to him.	
18		Α.	Well, if at any stage as I have already said to the	
19			Tribunal, Chairman, if at any stage either Sergeant	
20			McCabe or through his solicitors wished to have an	11:30
21			audience with me, my door would be open and you would	

- find that I would be very receptive.

 You see, you could pick up the phone and talk to Gerald

 Kean, the senior Gardaí could talk to Bernard McCabe,

 but you weren't willing to speak to Maurice McCabe

 because you believed the structure would be somehow
- A. Well, that is not quite true. First of all, in relation to Bernard McCabe, he came forward making an

offended if you spoke directly to him.

Τ			approach. In relation to Mr. Gerald Kean, he did	
2			something similar. As I said, Sergeant McCabe or	
3			indeed his solicitors, none of those entities made that	
4			request of me, to go and see him, or for him to come	
5			and see me, whichever. If that was the case I would	11:37
6			have dealt with the matter, of course I would.	
7	144	Q.	And I'm putting it to you that Sergeant McCabe I am	
8			putting it to you that the general reaction within An	
9			Garda Síochána was to close ranks against him?	
10		Α.	Well, as far as I'm concerned, that wasn't the case,	11:38
11			no.	
12	145	Q.	I see. And I have got to suggest to you that based on	
13			what Sergeant Molloy told the Tribunal, that that was	
14			the attitude that Superintendent Taylor conveyed to the	
15			Press Office; that this man was effectively the enemy	11:38
16			and those who supported him in the political process or	
17			in the media were to be shunned by the Press Office?	
18		Α.	Well, that's the evidence that the sergeant gave in the	
19			context of the image that Superintendent Taylor was	
20			portraying to him. But he wasn't acting on my	11:38
21			directions.	
22	146	Q.	I see. And I have got to suggest to you again that you	
23			and Superintendent Taylor were in daily contact and	
24			that it's not true that such hostility could have been	
25			kept secret from you?	11:38
26		Α.	That is not true. He may not have been in daily	
27			contact, he was certainly in very frequent contact with	

28

29

me. Of course he was, that was his job; to keep me

informed of matters. But no, I don't agree with you.

- 1 147 Q. And I'm suggesting to you as well that on one day, the
 2 24th January of 2014, that you personally spoke to
 3 three people, Deputy Deasy, Deputy McGuinness and the
 4 Comptroller & Auditor General, and that you very
 5 seriously disparaged Sergeant McCabe to their faces.
- A. That is not correct, Chairman. I've already indicated the interactions I had with each of those three people, and I've already indicated to this Tribunal what I said to them, and I'm here to tell the truth and as far as I'm concerned, I have told the truth. And I think certain issues have been misinterpreted by some of

11:39

11:40

13 148 Q. Well, I want to make -- I want to put the following
14 propositions to you: In respect of the evidence you
15 have given about Deputy John McGuinness, the Chairman
16 of the PAC, it's not a question of misunderstanding;
17 you are inviting this Tribunal to reject his evidence
18 as a complete malicious invention, isn't that right?

those parties.

12

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

- A. Well certainly in relation to the conversation that he alleges we had in the car park of Bewley's Hotel on 24th January '14, which is the day after I had the conversations with the other parties, certainly in the context of the crazy and very, very serious allegations that had been made against me. I absolutely refute them. They did not happen. I did not say those things, either about Sergeant McCabe or any other persons.
- 28 149 Q. And it follows from that that his evidence isn't a 29 matter of mistake, that the note in his diary and all

- of that is a deliberate systematic piece of falsehood
- and with the intent of lying about you in public, is
- 3 that right?
- 4 A. Well, it is very clear that Mr. McGuinness has a much
- 5 different version of the conversation that I had in the 11:41
- 6 car park with him.
- 7 150 Q. It's not just different versions; his version, on your
- 8 evidence, is a malicious invention against him?
- 9 A. You may say that if you wish.
- 10 151 Q. I am suggesting to you -- are you saying that it's not

11 · 41

11:42

- 11 a malicious invention?
- 12 A. I'm suggesting to you that the evidence that I have
- given here to the Tribunal has been open and honest in
- 14 every single detail, and I certainly didn't meet with
- any of the other important witnesses who have given
- 16 evidence here at this Tribunal prior to making my
- 17 statement. I made my statement of my own volition.
- 18 152 Q. And the evidence that he has given about the note he
- made in the lay-by that is a total fabrication,
- according to you, because he couldn't have made that
- 21 note if what you are saying is correct?
- 22 A. Well, it certainly didn't reflect the conversation I
- had, Chairman.
- 24 153 Q. I see. And --
- 25 A. I wonder, Chairman, is it possible to see that note? I $_{11:42}$
- don't know if it is available.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: Yes, I am sure it is, absolutely no --
- 28 154 Q. MR. McDOWELL: You have had access to it, haven't you?
- 29 A. I have had access to a photocopy, if I could, if it's

Τ			possible.	
2			CHAIRMAN: We kept the original diary, Mr. McDowell, so	
3			if you want to have a look at it. And you will bear in	
4			mind there's lots of stuff about dogs and constituents	
5			and that kind of stuff.	11:4
6		Α.	I saw that, Chairman. Thank you very much, Chairman.	
7	155	Q.	MR. McDOWELL: And I have got to suggest to you that	
8			your suggestion that, somehow, he and Deputy Deasy are	
9			not independent because they both serve on the same	
10			committee, is contrived, they aren't political allies,	11:4
11			and you have no reason to suggest that they have got	
12			together to blacken your name?	
13		Α.	I don't know I don't know what they have or haven't	
14			done, Chairman. All I can do is give my evidence	
15			openly and honestly and that's what I have done.	11:4
16	156	Q.	And I have got to suggest to you as well that the	
17			Comptroller & Auditor General had no motive to come in	
18			response to the Chairman's appeal with his evidence	
19		Α.	I agree, Chairman.	
20	157	Q.	other than a motive to assist the Tribunal in every	11:4
21			way he could.	
22		Α.	Well, I would hope that's every witness's intention	
23			coming in here, to speak openly and honestly and	
24			truthfully about what they know and believe is the	
25			case. But you know, it is the case that Mr. McGuinness	11:4
26			has met with one or two of the key witnesses at this	
27			Tribunal and I don't know what, if any, influence they	
28			had, but that is something that I was somewhat	
29			concerned about and had in the back of my mind.	

- 1 158 Q. You are not suggesting that --
- 2 A. No, I am not suggesting --
- 3 159 Q. You are not suggesting that Sergeant McCabe put him up
- 4 to inventing evidence against you, are you?
- 5 A. I don't know what the position is, Chairman, and I'm

11:45

11:45

- 6 not making any allegations; I am merely saying that
- 7 there was interaction between Mr. McGuinness and
- 8 Mr. McCabe and there's also interaction between
- 9 Mr. McGuinness --
- 10 160 Q. I just want you to reflect on that. Are you seriously
- 11 suggesting that somehow Sergeant McCabe put John
- 12 McGuinness up to telling lies about you?
- 13 A. No, I'm not suggesting that. I am just merely stating
- the fact. I mean, we have the evidence in front of us,
- 15 Mr. McDowell --
- 16 161 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. -- of those interactions, and it is very clear that
- those interactions took place at a time prior to the
- 19 statements forwarded to this Tribunal. They are the
- facts, so I don't know, and I cannot make any
- 21 allegations, of course I can't. But I do find it a
- 22 little bit disconcerting that that happened and matters
- 23 were discussed between Superintendent Taylor and
- Sergeant McCabe, for instance, and also in relation to
- 25 Deputy McGuinness and Superintendent Taylor.
- 26 162 Q. Do you not think it would be perfectly natural for
- 27 somebody in Deputy McGuinness's position to speak to
- the people involved?
- 29 A. I don't know. That is not my call, Mr. McDowell.

Т	163	Q.	I see. I am putting it to you as well that the	
2			criticisms that were made about Deputy McGuinness not	
3			coming out publicly with the nature of the allegations	
4			he said you had made, is easily explained, and I am	
5			putting this to you now, by the fact that he did not	11:46
6			want to damage the McCabe family in public by referring	
7			to the detail of the allegations that you had made	
8			about them?	
9		Α.	Well, I think it's an extraordinary position to adopt,	
10			Chairman. I mean, if Mr. McGuinness had the type of	11:46
11			very serious allegations that are being made now, if	
12			that is his position, this man is a public	
13			representative, surely he had a duty, surely he had a	
14			duty to report those matters at least to the O'Higgins	
15			Commission and perhaps even before that.	11:47
16	164	Q.	Well, I'm not going to get into a legal argument with	
17			you but I am going to suggest to you that that was	
18			completely outside the terms of reference of the	
19			O'Higgins Commission?	
20		Α.	How could it be? What Mr. O'Higgins was charged	11:47
21	165	Q.	Can we agree to leave it to the Chairman to decide that	
22			point because I am not going to have a legal argument.	
23		Α.	You have asked a very legitimate question and I'm	
24			trying to give you an answer. Part of what	
25			Mr. O'Higgins was dealing with, and I think he did an	11:47
26			expert job, was to discuss how An Garda Síochána and	
27			the Department of Justice handled the complaints of	
28			Sergeant McCabe and	

29 166 Q. How would it have been relevant to that?

- 1 A. Sure it's --
- 2 167 Q. That you had accused Sergeant McCabe of sexually
- 3 assaulting his own children?
- 4 A. Sure, would it not speak directly to attitude and to a
- 5 level of vindictiveness against Sergeant McCabe? Of

11 · 48

11:48

11 · 49

- 6 course it would have been relevant.
- 7 168 Q. On the part of whom? You?
- 8 A. On the part of the Commission of Investigation, who was
- 9 charged with dealing with these matters.
- 10 169 Q. Well, I will leave it to the Chairman to decide, but
- Mr. Justice O'Higgins point-blank refused to go back to
- the 2006 allegations, point-blank refused to travel
- there.
- 14 A. And I think rightly so, but if you look at --
- 15 CHAIRMAN: No, but I don't believe he was ever invited 11:48
- to go there by anybody.
- MR. McDOWELL: No. well, whenever it arose, whenever
- 18 it arose he said --
- 19 CHAIRMAN: I mean, it's hard to know how you could
- refuse to do something point-blank, Mr. McDowell, if
- 21 you are not asked to.
- MR. McDOWELL: Sorry, Chairman, point-blank he stopped,
- closed down all discussion of that matter every time it
- 24 arose, even tangentially.
- 25 CHAIRMAN: He closed down all discussion of any issue
- of a grudge and said I want to deal with the facts.
- 27 MR. McDOWELL: That's right.
- 28 CHAIRMAN: He said that could potentially be relevant,
- 29 but I have as much evidence now as I want or need. I

- 1 wish I could do that. Maybe I don't have the guts.
- 2 170 Q. MR. McDOWELL: The one last thing I want to suggest to you is --
- A. Sorry, before you leave the point, and this is an important point, I feel, Chairman: What Mr. McGuinness 11:49
- is alleging against me goes way beyond the 2006 allegations.
- 8 171 O. Of course it does.
- 9 A. You see, that is the point.
- 10 172 Q. Yes, of course. of course it does.
- 11 A. So why didn't he bring that information, why didn't he

11:49

11:50

- 12 bring that information to the attention of the
- O'Higgins Commission and beyond that or even to the
- 14 Government? The Commissioner of An Garda Síochána
- making these type of very serious complaints and he
- decides to sit on his hands? It's certainly beyond my
- 17 comprehension.
- 18 173 Q. I see. And I have got to suggest to you finally, that
- 19 the Comptroller & Auditor General in this matter had no
- 20 connection whatsoever with Sergeant McCabe?
- 21 A. Well, I do think, Chairman, and I have given this
- 22 evidence yesterday, I do think there was a
- 23 misunderstanding of sorts in the context of what
- Mr. McCarthy alleges that I have said and, you know, I
- agree with you, and I have the height of respect for
- the Comptroller & Auditor General, you know -- that is
- 27 what he heard if that is what he heard.
- 28 174 Q. How come that within one calendar month, four people
- who couldn't possibly have colluded, have evidence to

1			give to this trial to this Tribunal that you, very	
2			seriously, attacked the character, reputation of	
3			Sergeant McCabe? How come four people who couldn't	
4			have colluded have come up with that?	
5		Α.	Well, you see, it is the case, on the 26th May '16,	11:51
6			Chairman, that Mr. McGuinness in the Dáil, during the	
7			debate, spoke about the meeting in the car park and	
8			vile, vile allegations being made	
9	175	Q.	Yes.	
10		Α.	and that he wasn't to be trusted, and he had	11:51
11			questions to answer. And that seems to follow a	
12			pattern, but prior to that, you know	
13	176	Q.	What are you saying it seems to follow a pattern?	
14		Α.	I'm trying to answer the question	
15	177	Q.	What is the pattern?	11:51
16		Α.	if you give me a second. Prior to that, the	
17			conversations took place on the 23rd January '14, in or	
18			around the Public Accounts Committee, I think we are	
19			agreed on that, apart from the December conversation I	
20			had with Mr. Boucher-Hayes. So what happened between	11:51
21			that date and the 26th May '16 in relation to the other	
22			individuals who have a different version of the	
23			conversations that I had with them a couple of years	
24			earlier, what happened in the intervening period? It	
25			seems strange to me that nobody came out of the traps	11:52
26			essentially.	
27	178	Q.	well, can I just put one final suggestion to you: That	
28			they may have thought that your allegations were so	
29			untrue and unfair and damaging that making them public	

1			in any way possible was only adding to the damage that	
2			you had already attempted to bring about for Sergeant	
3			McCabe?	
4		Α.	Well, I couldn't possibly see how that could be the	
5			situation in respect of Mr. McGuinness, when clearly he	11:52
6			was making very specific allegations that were way	
7			outside of the 2006 allegations. I think very	
8			definitely he had a duty to bring that to the attention	
9			of Government. What this, after all, he is alleging is	
10			allegations being made by the Commissioner of An Garda	11:53
11			Síochána. In relation to Deputy Deasy, he speaks	
12			about, you know, not to be trusted, etcetera, but he	
13			doesn't seem to back that up with any great facts. And	
14			in relation to Mr. McCarthy, again we are at	
15			loggerheads in terms of what was said, but I do think	11:53
16			from looking at his statement and his original	
17			conclusion, I do think that he's mistaken in terms of	
18			the conclusion he drew that it was in relation to the	
19			missing computer and that there was a live allegation	
20			against Sergeant McCabe, because to my certain	11:53
21			knowledge, that was not the case, so how could I	
22			have I could have made it up, of course, but to my	
23			certain knowledge, that wasn't the case.	
24	179	Q.	I'm suggesting you did make it up and you did utter it.	
25		Α.	That is totally untrue, Chairman.	11:54
26			MR. McDOWELL: Thank you.	
27			CHAIRMAN: Thanks, Mr. McDowell. Ms. Burns, if you	
28			wouldn't mind explaining again, I am sure the	
29			Commissioner knows but, to the Commissioner who you are	

1			appearing for.	
2				
3			THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. BURNS:	
4	180	Q.	MS. BURNS: Yes, Chairman. Good morning, Mr. Callinan?	
5		Α.	Good morning, Ms. Burns.	11:54
6	181	Q.	As you are aware, I am appearing on behalf of	
7			Superintendent Taylor and I just have a few net areas	
8			that I wish to go through with you in relation to the	
9			evidence that you have given and also some of the	
10			documentation before the Tribunal. So firstly, perhaps	11:54
11			if I could focus on what your reaction was to the	
12			allegation that had been made against you by	
13			Superintendent Taylor. Now, as we are all aware,	
14			Superintendent Taylor made his protected disclosure on	
15			the 30th September 2016, and we are also aware that	11:54
16			there was some public commentary in relation to that	
17			over the airwaves, it would seem the following weekend.	
18			In the papers distributed by the Tribunal it seems that	
19			there were some newspaper or sorry, not newspaper,	
20			radio broadcasts on the 4th, 5th and 7th October that	11:55
21			involved Mr. Clifford and Ms. Clare Daly on interview	
22			on various radio stations. Were you aware of any of	
23			those broadcasts at the time?	
24		Α.	I don't recall them, no.	
25	182	Q.	I see. So we also know that you were written to by	11:55
26			Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill on the 26th October 2016	
27			and within that documentation he provided you with	
28			certain material, but one of the documents that was	
29			provided was the protected disclosure from	

1			Superintendent Taylor. Was that the first notice that	
2			you had in relation to the allegations being made by	
3			Superintendent Taylor?	
4		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
5	183	Q.	I see. So the earlier broadcasts, you weren't aware	11:56
6			of, and had heard nothing in relation to those up to	
7			the time that you received the letter from Mr. O'Neill,	
8			is that right?	
9		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
10	184	Q.	I see. Now, in relation to that, then, the letter, if	11:56
11			we put it up on the screen, just for your benefit, that	
12			can be found at page 574 of the documentation, it's in	
13			Volume 2. And within that, at the very end of the	
14			page, there is reference at that last paragraph, that	
15			there are two protected disclosures; one is in relation	11:56
16			to Sergeant Maurice McCabe, but the other then is	
17			obviously Superintendent Taylor's disclosure. And the	
18			reference there is that the two protected disclosures	
19			and the two section 41 reports contain very serious	
20			allegations against you whilst discharging the	11:56
21			functions of the office of Commissioner of An Garda	
22			Síochána. And then the various legislation that	
23			relates to protected disclosures is set out, but at the	
24			very bottom of the second page, which is page 575, you	
25			are asked:	11:57
26				
27			"I must ask you to respond to the allegations against	
28			you in the two protected disclosures."	
29				

So obviously, what is being set out there is the various documentation being brought to your attention, the legislation in relation to it, the fact that there are very serious allegations made against you, and then the request from Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill that you respond to those allegations. And if I then could have your response to that letter put up on the screen, and that can be found at page 577, Volume 2 of the papers, and that's your letter dated the 28th October 2016, and you set out the documentation that you have received, and then at the very last paragraph of the first page of your letter, so that is page 577, you ask:

"In these circumstances, you might kindly set out precisely the allegations to which you wish me to respond."

11:58

11:58

11:58

So I think it's clear from that letter that you've acknowledged receipt of the documentation, you acknowledged the fact that -- the second-last paragraph of the letter that there is a reference by Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill of very serious allegations having been made against you, but you don't in fact set out your response to those allegations, and instead what you request from Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill is that he would set out precisely the allegations to which he wishes you to respond.

A. That's correct, Chairman, yes.

- Now, I understand Mr. Callinan, that you have, in the 1 185 Q. 2 course of your evidence and also in the course of the letters that we will go through, that you've made the 3 complaint that Superintendent Taylor's allegation is 4 5 against you was very vague, and indeed it was, and I'm 11:59 6 not going to take issue with you in relation to that, 7 but could I ask you why, at that very early stage, 8 having received the letter from Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill, having been asked to set out your response, 9 the response that you give is not to deny the 10 11:59 11 allegations of Superintendent Taylor, but, instead, to ask Mr. Justice O'Neill for him to set out the 12 13 allegations to which he wishes you to respond; why did 14 you take that course of action? 15 Because the allegations, Chairman, weren't set out in Α. 11:59 16 sufficient detail, I felt, for them to be dealt with by
- sufficient detail, I felt, for them to be dealt with by
 me at that time. They were very general in nature.
 There was no specificity with any of the materials. So
 it would be difficult for me to deal with the
 allegations in any serious way without knowing
 precisely what was there against me.
- 22 186 Q. I see. But you could have denied the allegations that 23 had been set out in the protected disclosure?
- A. well, you'd be denying something that you didn't have the detail of, that was the difficulty I had.

26 187 Q. I see. Well, if we look at the protected disclosure 27 then and this can be found in Volume 1 at page 4 and 28 page 5. If, firstly, I could ask to look at page 4 and 29 in the third paragraph down, the paragraph beginning

1	with "I can confirm" and it goes on:	
2		
3	"That there was a campaign at the highest level of An	
4	Garda Síochána i nvolving the then-Commissioner Martin	
5	Callinan and the then-Deputy Commissioner, now	12:0
6	Commissioner, Nóirín O'Sullivan, to discredit Maurice	
7	McCabe. "	
8		
9	So that is the first allegation that is set out at page	
LO	4 of the protected disclosure of Superintendent Taylor.	12:0
L1	And then if we turn to page 5 and midway down that	
L2	page, the beginning of the paragraph that reads "I	
L3	recall", and we then have the allegation set out by	
L4	Superintendent Taylor in relation to what he alleges	
L5	was the direction received by him from you to	12:0
L6	negatively brief the press in relation to Sergeant	
L7	McCabe's motivations. So there is that paragraph, and	
L8	it reads:	
L9		
20	"I recall being instructed or directed to contact the	12:0
21	media to brief them on the particular line the	
22	Commissioner had instructed; namely, to brief	
23	negatively against Sergeant McCabe. In particular, I	
24	recall that I was to brief the media that Sergeant	
25	McCabe was motivated by maliciousness and revenge. I	12:0
26	was also to encourage media to write negatively about	

and found no substance to his allegations.

Sergeant McCabe, that his complaints had no substance,

and that the Garda had fully investigated his complaint

27

28

Т			I was to brief that sergeant wecabe was driven by	
2			agendas. "	
3				
4			And then the next paragraph:	
5				12:02
6			"I was also directed to draw journalists' attention to	
7			the complaint of sexual assault made against Sergeant	
8			McCabe and that this was the root cause of his agenda,	
9			revenge against the gardaí."	
10				12:02
11			Now, there, clearly, are the allegations against you,	
12			the first page referring to the fact that there was a	
13			campaign to discredit Maurice McCabe.	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	188	Q.	And then on the second page, page 5, the details of how	12:02
16			that direction was to be carried out, and, yes, I	
17			accept that there's no references to dates or times	
18			when these instructions were carried out, but surely,	
19			Mr. Callinan, in that very initial response from you to	
20			Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill, you could have set out	12:03
21			that you denied those allegations, but go on to make	
22			the point that the allegations were very vague?	
23		Α.	Accepted. But the issue for me was, I didn't have the	
24			detail to deal with them. You know, they are serious,	
25			very serious allegations, but they are really	12:03
26			statements about those allegations without the level of	
27			detail that would be required, given the seriousness of	
28			them. That was the point I was making back to the	
29			Mr. Justice O'Neill.	

_	10)	Q.	1 see. In any event, you accept that in that retter	
2			from you on the 28th October 2016, you didn't, in fact,	
3			deny the allegations set out by Superintendent Taylor?	
4		Α.	Well, I was hopeful that I would get more detail before	
5			I could respond.	12:03
6	190	Q.	I see. So then what occurs is, you having asked	
7			Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill if he could set out	
8			precisely the allegations to which he wished you to	
9			respond to, he then writes to you on the 31st October	
10			2016, and that letter can be found at Volume 2, page	12:04
11			579. And in that letter, on the second page of the	
12			letter, which is page 580, he sets out in the second	
13			paragraph down that:	
14				
15			"These allegations as set out in these four	12:04
16			documents"	
17				
18			Now, obviously the four documents relate to the	
19			protected disclosure of Sergeant McCabe and then the	
20			two Section 41 reports from Mr. John Barrett, but the	12:04
21			fourth document is Superintendent Taylor's protected	
22			disclosure. He goes on to say:	
23				
24			"These allegations as set out in these four documents	
25			are, in my opinion, capable of being addressed by you	12:04
26			and responded to by indicating whether you deny all of	
27			them or whether you do not dispute some of them or	
28			whether you wish to put forward some alternative	
29			explanation of them. This is all that is required at	

1			this stage."	
2				
3			So that's the letter that you then received from	
4			Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill.	
5		Α.	Yes.	12:05
6	191	Q.	But in response to that letter, which is your response	
7			dated the 6th November 2016 and can be found at page	
8			581, Volume 2 of the materials, rather than taking up	
9			that offer from Mr. Justice O'Neill and dealing with	
10			the allegations and setting out your view in relation	12:05
11			to them, as he has requested you to do in his second	
12			letter to you, your letter, instead, at paragraph 3 of	
13			the letter, says:	
14				
15			"I am advised that I should not enter into any process	12:05
16			until the very serious allegations to which I am	
17			requested to respond have been set out in appropriate	
18			detail, that the relevant underlying alleged facts have	
19			been set out in similar detail and that I have been	
20			given a reasonable opportunity and facilities to	12:06
21			conduct any necessary investigations and inquiries to	
22			enable me to rebut same."	
23				
24			Now, again, you don't take the opportunity in your	
25			second return letter to Mr. Justice O'Neill to deny the	12:06
26			allegations.	
27		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
28	192	Q.	I see. So arising from that, then, I think that	
29			Mr. Justice O'Neill again writes to you, and he writes	

1 to you on the 10th November 2016, and that letter can 2 be found at Volume 2, page 582. And in this letter, in 3 his second-last paragraph on that page, he states to 4 you: 5 12:06 6 "Once again, I ask you to reconsider the stance you 7 have adopted in response to my request to you in 8 previous correspondence. " 9 10 And then at page 583, in the second paragraph of that 12:07 11 letter, he states: 12 13 "As stressed by me in earlier correspondence, all that is required of you at this stage is to state whether 14 15 you dispute the allegations contained in these 12:07 16 I'm quite satisfied that the allegations in documents. 17 these documents against you are stated with sufficient 18 clarity to enable you to fully understand the content 19 of these allegations, so as to enable you to respond to 20 them by stating whether you dispute all of these 12:07 allegations or some of them." 21 22 23 So again, a request by Mr. Justice O'Neill for you to 24 deal with the allegations and state your position in 25 relation to them, and obviously an indication by him 12.07 that, as far as he's concerned, there is sufficient 26 27 clarity within the documentation furnished to you for 28 you to be able to be in a position to state your 29 position regarding them.

1	Α.	Correct.

And I think then, and this is your final response to 2 193 Q. 3 Mr. Justice O'Neill in relation to this specific issue, I think you write to him then on the 16th November 4 5 2016, which can be found at Volume 2, page 584 of the 12:08 6 documentation, and in the second-last paragraph of that 7 letter you state -- well, I will actually, sorry, for 8 your benefit I will read the third-last paragraph also. 9 You say:

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

25

26

27

28

29

10

"In the second page of your initial letter to me you

"In the second page of your initial letter to me you have confirmed that I have a constitutional right to natural justice and fair procedures regarding the matters arising under your terms of reference. Again, I am to inform you that I have been further advised that as a matter of law in furtherance of the protection of those rights, I am entitled to have the allegations clearly set out before I engage in the

12:08

12:08

12:08

12:09

process being undertaken by you. Notwithstanding the

foregoing and in light of your clear desire for me to

take a position on the allegations, I confirm, insofar as is possible, given the limited detail, that the

all and the second of the trim tea detail, that

23 allegations are denied."

So finally, on the 16th November 2016, Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill having written to you initially on the 26th October 2016, finally you state that you are denying the allegations contained in the documentation furnished.

1	Α.	That's correct, Chairman, on the Judge's insistence
2		that I make that call, but again, I did have
3		reservations that I didn't have any detail. That was
4		my concern and that was my concern from the very
5		beginning.

12:09

12:10

12:10

12:10

6 194 Q. Well, Mr. Callinan, would it not have been possible
7 from the offset, in light of the fact that you deny
8 these allegations and deny them vehemently, would it
9 not have been possible for you to set out that denial
10 from the offset with the caveat that there was very
11 little detail in terms of the allegations provided?

Well, the only point I'll make, Ms. Burns, is that I Α. was trying very hard to establish what precisely the allegations were so that I could respond to them, because, in fairness, Mr. Justice O'Neill was doing a scoping exercise to see whether or not -- what type of inquiry, if any, should be conducted. I think that was the -- as I understood it. So I was trying to amass as much information as I could to try and be of assistance, but there was a little bit of over and back, I accept that, of course I do. But, I mean, it's quite clear that I did deny it because this was going to be his final letter, so I did deny them such as they were, and, I mean, that caveat is there.

Q. You provide a statement to this Tribunal on the 13th March 2017, and that statement can be found at Volume 2, page 640 of the papers. And in your statement to the Tribunal, in the third paragraph down, you state:

29

28

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

1 "In circumstances where very little by way of specific 2 detail has been set out in relation to the allegations, 3 it is difficult to do any more at this stage than refute them by way of denial. Where possible or 4 5 relevant, I provide specific details in relation to 12:11 6 incidents that seem to me to be of relevance at this 7 point." 8 Now, would it have been that difficult, Mr. Callinan, 9 to have set out in your letters to Mr. Justice O'Neill 10 12 · 11 11 from the off, having been asked for your position from 12 the 26th October 2016, to provide Mr. Justice O'Neill 13 with that very paragraph that you ultimately provide to 14 the Tribunal, that you are denying, but you want to 15 draw attention to the fact that there is very little 12:11 16 specific detail? 17 Okay. Well, Chairman, clearly what I'm doing here is Α. 18 responding to the terms of reference as best I can, 19 accepting that I don't have all of the detail, whereas 20 with Mr. Justice O'Neill's letter I was trying to 12:12 respond to allegations that I really had very little 21 22 detail of in the first instance, so that was the difference there. 23 24 I see. Mr. Callinan, were you concerned that any 196 Q. 25 further information might come to light, that if you 12 · 12 put a denial in it would cause you problems at some 26 27 stage?

accepted or denied.

28

29

Α.

Absolutely not. The allegations were there to be

But it was also the case that you

might have something to say about those allegations,
and clearly I have got an awful lot of material from
the Tribunal that I wasn't in possession of at the time

Mr. Justice O'Neill was writing to me.

5 197 Q. I see. Now, just in terms of the responses that you
6 gave to Mr. Justice O'Neill, there is no reference in
7 conjunction with your denial that Superintendent Taylor
8 was engulfed with bitterness to Commissioner O'Sullivan
9 and that, in fact, he'd uttered words to you that he
10 was going to bring her down.

12:12

12:13

11 A. Correct.

0.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

198

I see. If I could then return to the next section of your correspondence with Mr. Justice O'Neill, because having indicated to him that you were denying the allegations, as we have referred to in your last letter 12:13 to him, he then writes to you again on the 18th November 2016 and indicates that his view was that an inquiry of some form will need to take place, and in the second-last paragraph of the letter, on page 585 of Volume 2, he asks you to set out the specific topics 12:13 you want included in any such inquiry and also whether you have a view as to what form of inquiry should take So I think that shows a consultation process being offered by Mr. Justice O'Neill to you in terms of what form of inquiry and what should, in fact, be 12.14 inquired into. And your response to that letter then is dated the 23rd November 2016 and can be found at page 586, Volume 2, of the documentation, and if I could just bring you to the last paragraph of that

letter, which is on page 587. And having set out your various concerns and issues, maybe most particularly in relation to the allegations of John McGuinness, you then set out that:

12:14

"Having regard to all of the matters and procedures which have taken place to date and with particular regard to the foregoing, I have been advised that any possible matter arising from the two protected disclosures should have been raised at the Commission of Investigation carried out by Mr. Justice O' Higgins and that the failure to do so is a bar to any further form of inquiry involving matters which ought to have been raised."

12:15

12:15

Now, Mr. McDowell has questioned you in relation to your views regarding the O'Higgins Commission, and I don't want to repeat those. I understand your position, that they should have been raised, not that I accept that position but I understand your evidence in 12:15 relation to it. But what I did want to ask you about, Mr. Callinan, is that these very serious allegations, having now been made in the public domain, and the fact that they hadn't been raised at the O'Higgins

Commission, did you not have a desire to set the record 12:15 straight and clear your name in relation to the allegations which had been made?

A. Well, I don't think I could have been in any doubt at any point that there wasn't going to be either a

1 commission of investigation or something similar 2 following, so it really didn't matter. I was making 3 the point that these matters, and I've -- as you quite rightly say, I have raised it in response to 4 5 Mr. McDowell's question earlier. I was of the view 12:16 very firmly that these matters should have been dealt 6 7 with by Mr. Justice O'Higgins, they should have been 8 brought to his attention.

12:16

12:16

But, Mr. Callinan, my question is slightly different to 9 199 Q. that, because while your first position is that they 10 11 should have been dealt with by Mr. Justice O'Higgins, 12 your second point is that, because there was an inquiry 13 before Mr. Justice O'Higgins, there is now a bar to any 14 further inquiry in relation to these matters. And my 15 question for you is: Is that not a strange position for you to have taken, in light of the fact that very 16 17 serious allegations had been made against you, and 18 would you not have had a desire to, in fact, have these

aired in the public arena?

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

A. I don't think I was under any illusions, as I said to you, that there would not be some form of inquiry. But just to clarify, the point is, these matters weren't brought to Mr. O'Higgins. Whether he choose to deal with them or not is a matter for himself, of course we'll all accept that, but that's the point I'm making, that these matters should have been brought to his table in the first instance.

28 200 Q. No, and I understand that, I understand that you are saying that this should have been dealt with by

1			Mr. Justice O'Higgins and that the interested parties	
2			should have complained there, but your answer to me in	
3			terms of the actual question that I'm asking regarding	
4			your views as to clearing your name, your answer seems	
5			to be that: Well, I may have answered that my view is	12:17
6			that there is a bar to any further form of inquiry, but	
7			nonetheless, I knew that was going to come?	
8		Α.	Yes, correct.	
9	201	Q.	But surely you had an interest in a further inquiry	
10			taking place in relation to these?	12:18
11		Α.	I had no doubt that that is what was going to happen at	
12			any rate, but I was making the point that they should	
13			have been raised earlier, and, I mean, I didn't make	
14			that point entirely on my own, as you can appreciate.	
15	202	Q.	Oh, I can see that, and clearly you were getting advice	12:18
16			in relation to these matters, it's clear from the	
17			correspondence. But if you were of the view that there	
18			would be some form of inquiry in due course, well why	
19			then did you make the point that there would be a bar	
20			to any further inquiry?	12:18
21		Α.	Well, that was the that was a point I was raising,	
22			you know, clearly that was a point I'm raising in the	
23			correspondence.	

- 24 203 Q. And that's exactly what I'm attempting to ask you
 25 about, Mr. Callinan; why did you want there to be a bar 12:18
 26 to any further inquiry?
- A. Well, you see, as far as I was concerned, there was going to be an inquiry one way or the other, but I'm
- 29 making the point, through my solicitor, I suppose, that

- 1 it is the case that I felt strongly that these matters, 2 because they were so serious, that they should have been brought to Mr. O'Higgins' table in the first 3 instance. That is the only point I was making there. 4 5 204 Well, I don't think that is the only point that you are 12:19 Q. 6 making there, Mr. Callinan. What you seem to be making 7 the point of is that there should be no further inquiry 8 because O'Higgins existed and these complaints weren't made. Now, your answer seems to be, well, I knew there 9 was going to be one in due course, but I'm just making 10 12 · 19 11 the point that the existence of O'Higgins and the 12 non-complaining at O'Higgins by interested parties was 13 a bar to any future inquiry? 14 Α. I see that, yes, I see that. I see the point you are 15 making, yes. 12:19 16 But surely you had a desire to clear your name in 205 Q. 17 relation to this? 18 Well, of course. That goes without saying. Α. 19 206 Well, then --Q. And, you know, I was -- as I said, I was under no 20 Α. 12:20 illusion that there would be some form of inquiry, and, 21 22 if that hadn't been the case, I would have gone another 23 direction, because I certainly wouldn't be letting 24 matters lie, if that is the question you are raising 25 with me, was I anxious to clear my name; you can be 12:20 26 100% guaranteed I was going to try to clear my name one
- 28 207 Q. Well, then, Mr. Callinan, two things: Firstly, why are you saying that there is a bar to any further inquiry

way or another.

1 if you did have an interest in clearing your name		T you	ата	nave	an	interest	111	crearing	your.	name
---	--	-------	-----	------	----	----------	-----	----------	-------	------

A. Because that was my belief, that these matters should have been brought there in the first case. I mean, I'm retired a couple of years at this stage; you know, is it fair that these matters weren't dealt with way

- before this particular process?
 208 O And you have indicated in your a
- 7 208 And you have indicated in your answer moments ago to me Q. 8 that you would have done something about this had there not been an inquiry, but is this not your opportunity 9 to set out to Mr. Justice O'Neill what form of inquiry 10 12.21 11 you think should take place, as opposed to you having 12 to personally go to somewhere else to seek to clear your name? 13
- 14 Α. No, because I genuinely believed that these matters 15 should have been dealt with previously, as I said, and 12:21 16 the fact that that didn't happen, I said is -- it's clearly in the letter, and I have stated it there and I 17 18 have signed my name to it, it is my belief at that 19 time, because that didn't happen, I didn't believe at this point in time that it should happen, regardless of 12:21 20 the seriousness of these matters, that is something 21 22 that I would have had to deal with further down the 23 line.
- 24 209 Q. How do those two answers marry then, Mr. Callinan, that
 25 on the one hand you think that there shouldn't be any 12:21
 26 further inquiry, but on the other hand you wanted to
 27 clear your name and would have had to do something
 28 personally about that yourself?
- 29 A. Well, if it was the case that this inquiry or a similar

- inquiry didn't take place, of course I would have had to deal with these matters. They were very serious matters.

 Well, then, why didn't you say that in your letter to
- 4 210 Q. Well, then, why didn't you say that in your letter to
 5 Mr. Justice O'Neill, that you most certainly, while you 12:22
 6 had objections and annoyance that they weren't dealt
 7 with at O'Higgins, that, nonetheless, you most
 8 certainly wanted these things inquired into?
- 9 A. Well, I see the point you are making, but I was
 10 certainly going to make every effort to clear my name 12:22
 11 in relation to these most serious allegations, that
 12 aren't true, by the way.
- 13 211 Q. And I know that you are denying them, Mr. Callinan.

 14 But your letter certainly doesn't read like that; your

 15 letter certainly seems to read that they now should not 12:22

 16 be inquired into because the time has come and gone?
- 17 well, I accept, yes, I accept that is what I said and Α. that was my thinking at the time, that this should have 18 been dealt with way before now and that it was very 19 unfair on me in particular that these matters were 20 12:23 21 being raised now, when there was an awareness way back 22 and at a time before and during when Mr. O'Higgins was 23 dealing with these matters --

- 24 212 Q. I see.
- 25 A. -- or related matters.
- 26 213 Q. But you accept that the letter reads that you did not
 27 want these matters inquired into in light of the fact
 28 that the complaint hadn't been made at O'Higgins?
- 29 A. Well, I believed that -- yes, I believed that these

1			were matters that should have been inquired into	
2			earlier and I believed that it was unfair, that is	
3			certainly my view, that it was unfair for this process	
4			to take place, but that wasn't going to be just the	
5			question you asked, trying to reconcile the two things,	12:23
6			I certainly wouldn't be leaving it at that, not that I	
7			ever felt that there wouldn't be some form of inquiry,	
8			but, beyond that, I would certainly be making very	
9			strong moves to protect my reputation and clear my	
10			name.	12:24
11	214	Q.	I see. In any event, arising from Mr. Justice	
12			O'Neill's review, and obviously this inquiry has now	
13			come to pass so you didn't have to do anything further	
14			about it?	
15		Α.	Correct.	12:24
16	215	Q.	I see. In relation to the that letter that I have	
17			just brought you through, again there is no reference	
18			in that letter to this information that you had	
19			regarding Superintendent Taylor's grievance as against	
20			Nóirín O'Sullivan and specific utterances that he'd	12:24
21			made about wanting to bring her down, there is no	
22			reference to that in the letter?	
23		Α.	There is no reference to very many things that now form	
24			part of the terms of reference and matters that I feel	
25			were relevant to the terms of reference.	12:24
26	216	Q.	I see.	
27		Α.	And the reason that there isn't is, I didn't have the	
28			detail on which I could respond.	

29 217 Q. Well, just in relation to that, Mr. Callinan, you are

Т			the person who says you had the detail in relation to	
2			what Superintendent Taylor said to you one day in your	
3			house, and that isn't something that you had to wait	
4			for somebody else to tell you; that comes from your own	
5			evidence and your own observations in terms of a	12:25
6			discussion that you say you had with Superintendent	
7			Taylor?	
8		Α.	That's a fair question, yes, and that's that's a	
9			fair point.	
10	218	Q.	So you could have set that out in any of the letters	12:25
11			that you had with Mr. Justice O'Neill, that you had	
12			direct knowledge of an agenda that Superintendent	
13			Taylor had in relation to this protected disclosure of	
14			his?	
15		Α.	Well, there are many things, I think, that I could have	12:25
16			set out at that time, but obviously I wanted to have	
17			clear a clear roadmap as to what I'm expected to	
18			answer. That's the point.	
19	219	Q.	Well, is it not vitally important that something that	
20			you yourself had witnessed, an utterance you say made	12:25
21			to you by Superintendent Taylor, that that should have	
22			been brought to somebody's attention at a very early	
23			stage, that this man said to me certain things, was	
24			that not an important thing to have raised with	
25			Mr. Justice O'Neill?	12:26
26		Α.	well, it's important, but there are many other	
27			important things that would need to have been raised	
28			with Mr. Justice Iarfhlaith O'Neill's letter if I had	
29			sufficient detail to allow me to say those things, but	

1			I didn't at that time. But here we have a situation	
2			now where we have terms of reference, and I'm trying to	
3			respond clearly, as clearly as I can, with a blank	
4			sheet in front of me, sitting at home when I get the	
5			terms of reference, with no materials in front of me.	12:26
6			I'm trying to respond as best I can to the request from	
7			the Chairman to supply a letter, a statement.	
8	220	Q.	I see. But just to, I suppose, make the point again;	
9			in terms of any of the detail of the conversation that	
10			you say you had with Superintendent Taylor, which he	12:27
11			denies, you had all that detail, you didn't have to	
12			wait for any more detail in relation to that specific	
13			issue because that was the conversation you say that	
14			you had between himself and yourself, you are present,	
15			you know what was said, you surely could have brought	12:27
16			that to somebody's attention?	
17		Α.	There is lots of things I could have done, absolutely	
18			there is lots of things I could have done.	
19	221	Q.	I see. Because the first time I think, and maybe I'm	
20			wrong about this and I am sure I will be corrected if I	12:27
21			am, but the first reference that I see by you to any	
22			agenda that Superintendent Taylor had as against Nóirín	
23			O'Sullivan is in that statement that you make to the	
24			Tribunal on the 13th March 2017 and can be found at	
25			Volume 2, page 648. And at the very end of your	12:27
26			statement, there is reference to Superintendent	
27			Taylor and sorry, page 648 of Volume 2.	

A. Thank you, Chairman. Yes.

29 222 Q. And what you set out is:

Т				
2			"The principal allegations against me"	
3				
4			So an acknowledgement by you that they are the	
5			principal allegations.	12:28
6				
7			" have been made by Superintendent Taylor. I have	
8			already commented on the vague"	
9		Α.	"Terms of same".	
10	223	Q.	I just can't see that.	12:28
11				
12			" terms of same. It is also relevant to make the	
13			Tribunal aware that subsequent to my retirement from An	
14			Garda Síochána, Superintendent Taylor came to visit me	
15			in my house on a number of occasions, and in particular	12:28
16			following his transfer from Garda HQ to the traffic	
17			section. He had not previously been a visitor to my	
18			home. He expressed anger and disappointment over his	
19			transfer. I advised him to get on with his job and	
20			make a success of it."	12:29
21				
22			Now, in relation to that, I can see there is no	
23			reference to Nóirín O'Sullivan. Perhaps it shows a	
24			view in relation to his point regarding her or his	
25			thought process in relation to her, but there is	12:29
26			nothing specific that you might bring to anybody's	
27			attention. But then the next paragraph states:	
28				
29			"On a further occasion following his suspension and	

1		arrest, Superintendent Taylor called to my home to	
2		describe how badly he had been treated when in custody.	
3		He blamed the Commissioner for having him arrested and	
4		stated that he would bring her down because of what she	
5		did to him. While I sympathised with him on a human	12:29
6		level because his suspension had financial implications	
7		for him, I did not engage with him in relation to the	
8		views he was expressing about Commissioner O'Sullivan,	
9		nor did I endorse his sentiments."	
10			12:29
11		So that is the first reference I can see in March 2017	
12		when you reply to the terms of reference from this	
13		Tribunal, to you actually stating that Superintendent	
14		Taylor had said to you that he would bring Nóirín	
15		O'Sullivan down. Why did you wait so long before you	12:30
16		made anybody aware of that?	
17	Α.	Well, I don't think there is any particular reason. I	
18		mean, what I tried to do was go through the actual	
19		terms of reference and frame my answers as best I could	
20		in that context, and, you know, when you go down	12:30
21		through them, it talks about this campaign and	
22		malicious campaign against Sergeant McCabe and this was	
23		a campaign that was at the highest directed at from	

27 224 Q. I see.

of those points.

24

25

26

28

29

CHAIRMAN: Right. This is an important point. Maybe we will take it up in an hour, wouldn't that be a good

the highest level of An Garda Síochána and the deputy

commissioner was aware, so I was trying to address all

1	idea? Thank you.		
2			
3	THE HEARING ADJOURNED	FOR	LUNCH
4			
5			
6			
7			
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
29			

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, AFTER LUNCH:	
2				
3	225	Q.	MS. BURNS: Good afternoon, Mr. Callinan.	
4		Α.	Good afternoon, Ms. Burns.	
5	226	Q.	I think then that we had just left off where I drew	13:36
6			attention to the first reference that I can see in the	
7			papers to you indicating that you had this conversation	
8			with Superintendent Taylor at your house and what you	
9			say, which he denies, what he said about Nóirín	
10			O'Sullivan.	13:36
11		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
12	227	Q.	Now, in your interview with the Tribunal, and if I	
13			could ask that page 601, Volume 2, of the papers be	
14			brought up, and this obviously occurs sorry, I will	
15			get the date for you now it occurs after you have	13:37
16			given your statement to the Tribunal; it's on the, I	
17			understand, the 20th October 2017 that you're	
18			interviewed by the Tribunal. And at the very end of	
19			page 601, you're asked the question:	
20				13:37
21			"I have been asked whether I can offer any explanation	
22			for Superintendent David Taylor's assertions which he	
23			has detailed in his statements to the Disclosure	
24			Tribunal; namely, that I instructed him to brief the	
25			media that Sergeant McCabe was motivated by	13:37
26			maliciousness and revenge; (b) encouraged the media to	
27			write negatively about Sergeant McCabe; and (c)	
28			informed the media that the Garda had fully	
29			investigated his complaints and found no substance to	

1			his allegations."	
2				
3			And your answer to that question as to whether you	
4			could offer any explanation regarding Superintendent	
5			Taylor's allegations, your answer was:	13:38
6				
7			"No, I can't. The allegations have come as a complete	
8			surprise to me."	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	228	Q.	Now, we know obviously, Mr. Callinan, that you were	13:38
11			asked a somewhat similar question by Mr. Marrinan at	
12			the commencement of your evidence last Friday.	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	229	Q.	And you gave an explanation as to why you thought that	
15			Superintendent Taylor had invented, as you say, these	13:38
16			allegations against you, which related back to that	
17			conversation that you say occurred in your house when	
18			he made the comments in relation to Nóirín O'Sullivan,	
19			about he was going to bring her down, and that your	
20			explanation to Mr. Marrinan, or your thought process,	13:38
21			was that this was him acting on foot of that comment	
22			and that to add credence to allegations that he was	
23			going to make against Nóirín O'Sullivan, that he added	
24			you into it. Had that not come to mind when you were	
25			interviewed by the Tribunal investigators?	13:39
26		Α.	Yes, well, clearly it was there. They had had access	
27			to my statement, so clearly that was there. I suppose	
28			I was particularly focused on myself and in relation to	
29			the allegations that I was directing this operation. I	

1	suppose that's the context there. But certainly the
2	Tribunal investigators had my statement and had what I
3	had written in the statement.

You see, you'd already, as I've just before lunch gone 4 230 Ο. 5 through, you'd already mentioned in your interview with 13:39 the Tribunal on the 30th March 2017, the conversation 6 7 that you say occurred at your house between yourself 8 and Superintendent Taylor, but, again, there's no reference in the interview with the Tribunal to the 9 terms of that conversation. 10

13:40

- 11 Α. Well, I was responding to particular questions. Ι 12 mean, that was the composition of the interview, if you 13 There were certain questions put to me and I was 14 providing answers. That's the way that interview 15 worked.
- 16 I see. And I suppose, in fairness, questions are being 231 0. 17 asked, and you're obviously providing answers, but 18 reading the interview that took place with the Tribunal 19 investigators, it seems that that was an appropriate time when you're asked that question, as to whether you 13:40 20 have any explanation for Superintendent Taylor's 21 22 allegations, that you might have raised the issue of 23 his attitude towards Nóirín O'Sullivan and your view 24 that you're then put into that to add credence to his 25 actions as against her. So I suppose my question is, 13:40 why didn't you mention it there? 26
- 27 Α. well, again, I can only repeat what I've told you already, that my focus on the question, you know, 28 29 can I give any explanation as to why he's saying that I

- directed, so the focus at that time for me was on myself.
- You see, in relation to the allegations that

 Superintendent Taylor has made against you, it's quite

 clear that Nóirín O'Sullivan isn't the principal actor

 in relation to what he says he was directed to do; you

 are.
- 8 A. I accept that, Chairman, yes.
- 9 233 Q. And the height of his allegation as against Nóirín
 10 O'Sullivan is that, as deputy commissioner of
 11 operations, she would have been aware of the direction
 12 given to him by you and aware of what he did on foot of
 13 that?

13 · 41

13 · 42

14 A. That's correct, Chairman, yes.

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 15 234 So in terms of your explanation that you proffered to Q. 13:41 16 the Tribunal when asked by Mr. Marrinan as to where has all this come from and what is Superintendent Taylor's 17 18 motivation, the allegation that he has come forward 19 with to the Tribunal doesn't bear out that grudge as 20 against Nóirín O'Sullivan and you simply being thrown 13:42 into it, to add credence to it. 21
 - A. Well, I think it's very clearly the case, and the terms of reference set it out quite clearly, that both the then-Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan and the former Commissioner O'Sullivan and I, both of us were complicit in this enterprise, although I do agree that the balance of the complaint seems to be more against me. But there's no question but that my colleague, the then-Deputy Commissioner, was part of that enterprise.

- 1 235 Q. Well, that is absolutely clear, and I am not seeking to
 2 demur from that, Mr. Callinan, but it is equally clear
 3 that what Superintendent Taylor is alleging is that you
 4 were the person who directed him in relation to what he
 5 says was the negative campaign that he was to carry out 13:42
- 6 as against Sergeant McCabe?
- 7 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.
- 8 236 Q. And he doesn't place Nóirín O'Sullivan in that category?
- 10 A. No, no, other than precisely what he is saying, is that 13:43

 11 she was aware of the campaign, but -- I mean, I'm aware

 12 of the allegation, absolutely.
- 13 237 Q. I mean, I suppose if he was doing what you have
 14 suggested he was doing, he might well have said that
 15 both yourself and Nóirín O'Sullivan had directed him in 13:43
 16 relation to this, as opposed to simply saying that it's
 17 you who directed him but that Nóirín O'Sullivan was
 18 aware of it?
- 19 A. That's a possibility, yes.
- And also in terms of other evidence that the Tribunal 20 238 Q. 13:43 has heard, and specifically I'm referring to the text 21 22 message that's contained on your phone from Dave Taylor 23 that we referred to in evidence yesterday, that's the 24 text message, it can be found at Volume 17, page 4616, 25 and I'm sure you know what I'm referring to, 13 · 44 Mr. Callinan, it refers to -- it's after you've retired 26 27 and Dave Taylor sends you a message wishing you well for the future. 28
- 29 A. Oh, yes, yes.

- 1 239 Q. And that if he can do anything to help "please let me 2 know". I mean, your suggestions as regards Dave Taylor 3 don't seem to add up with that text message?
- 4 A. What particular suggestions are you --
- The suggestions that this is all to back up his story
 as against Nóirín O'Sullivan. I mean, his allegations
 as against you are very much focused on you, and, in my
 submission to you, would find it hard to marry with the
 text message that we're now referring to?
- 10 A. Well, I absolutely agree with you, based on what we are 13:44
 11 reading here and based on what we now know are his
 12 allegations and the detail of those allegations, you
 13 know, they don't bear any resemblance in any way, shape
 14 or form.

13:45

13 · 45

15 241 And the other thing that has emerged in the course of Q. 16 evidence, which I'd suggest to you doesn't add up with your suggestion that this is a campaign as against 17 18 Nóirín O'Sullivan, which you've simply thrown in to add 19 credence to it, is the fact that Dave Taylor is at odds 20 with Sergeant McCabe in relation to their discussions regarding this very issue, because I'm sure you're 21 22 aware that Sergeant McCabe alleges that Superintendent 23 Taylor said to him that Nóirín O'Sullivan was the 24 pusher in relation to this campaign. That obviously 25 would equate with what your explanation of Dave Taylor's actions are, but yet Dave Taylor takes 26 27 vehement denial in relation to that and denies that he Now, surely if 28 said any such thing to Sergeant McCabe. you were right, that dispute between ourselves and 29

- 1 Sergeant McCabe wouldn't, in fact, exist.
- 2 A. Well, I mean, I can't account for what Superintendent
- 3 Taylor is saying, you know. That is a matter for
- 4 himself. I can only deal with the allegations as I see
- 5 them.

13:46

13:46

13 · 47

- 6 242 Q. And I accept that, Mr. Callinan. I suppose the reason
- 7 why I'm pursuing this with you is that you're the
- 8 person who introduced it in the course of evidence, and
- 9 my suggestion to you is that evidence that's been heard
- by the Tribunal doesn't marry with that suggestion made 13:46
- by you in terms of what Superintendent Taylor was up to
- in relation to these allegations?
- 13 A. Again, I can only -- I can only tell you what
- 14 Superintendent Taylor said to me in my home.
- 15 243 Q. I see. Well, in relation to that then, when he said
- this to you, what was your reaction to it?
- 17 A. I didn't engage. I told the superintendent that I
- 18 wasn't going to go there.
- 19 244 Q. I see. Were you alarmed?
- 20 A. I was a little bit annoyed, yes.
- 21 245 Q. Well, 'alarmed' is what I asked, rather than 'annoyed'.
- 22 So you were a little bit annoyed, but were you alarmed
- 23 also?
- A. Well, I didn't think it was proper, I really didn't
- 25 think it was proper for a superintendent in An Garda
- 26 Síochána to be speaking about his Commissioner in those
- terms, certainly not.
- 28 246 Q. I see. Did you do anything about that, that he said to
- 29 you?

- A. No, I did not, apart from telling him I wasn't going to engage, and left it at that.
- 3 247 Q. I see. Did you inform Nóirín O'Sullivan about his comments?
- 5 A. I don't believe I did. I don't believe I did.
- 6 248 Q. Would that not have been an appropriate thing to do?

- 7 A. Well, perhaps. But I don't believe I did, that is my answer.
- 9 249 Q. Well, why wouldn't you have done that?
- No particular reason. You know, to be fair to 10 Α. 13 · 47 11 Superintendent Taylor, he was moved to the traffic 12 department. He saw that as a huge slight on him 13 personally, he thought his peers would be taking a 14 particular view, being moved sideways, that it wasn't a 15 good move and that perhaps he wasn't doing his job 13:48 16 correctly, and he did have a grievance, there is no 17 doubt at all. And then laterally when he was arrested 18 and suspended, he was in a difficult place, there is no 19 doubt at all about that, absolutely no doubt at all about that, and, you know, you take these things into 20 13:48 consideration. I tried to advise him as best I could 21 22 along the lines get on with your job, you're a superintendent in the guards, it's a good position to 23 24 have, try and make a career of yourself, and the 25 challenges that are in there in the traffic department are of enormous importance to An Garda Síochána. 26 27 those -- that was the type of discussion I had with 28 I tried to give him advice, basically, to get on with his business. 29

- 250 Q. And, Mr. Callinan, I think that seems like a very fair 1 2 account of what may well have transpired in terms of 3 your initial meetings with Superintendent Taylor when he was moved from the Press Office to the Traffic Unit 4 5 and nothing specifically said by him in terms of any 13:49 grievance that he had with Nóirín O'Sullivan. 6 7 a specific issue is said, as you allege, after his 8 arrest and suspension, and a specific threat in relation to Nóirín O'Sullivan, did you not think it 9 appropriate to bring that to Nóirín O'Sullivan's 10 13 · 49 11 attention?
- 12 A. Well, I felt really he was just hitting out at what had
 13 happened, you know, which is an understandable human
 14 reaction. I wasn't going to get involved in the detail
 15 of the arrest or the inquiry because I think that would 13:49
 16 be regarded as interfering. So I took the decision
 17 simply not to go there.
- 18 251 Q. But, with respect, his arrest had occurred, so that's
 19 over with, he is now suspended and he is making a
 20 threat as against Nóirín O'Sullivan, that he is going to bring her down. Did you not think that that was an important thing to bring to somebody 's attention?
- A. Well, I think, you know, people say things in the heat
 of battle, so to speak, and there is no doubt the man
 was suffering, so I didn't add to his woes. I just
 advised him to get on with his job, the same as I had
 previously. That was the extent of it.
- 28 252 Q. Well, as you're aware, Mr. Callinan, Superintendent 29 Taylor takes issue with that conversation having taken

1			place between you. But if we move from that slightly	
2			for a moment. You didn't, on your evidence, do	
3			anything about that when the comment was said. You've	
4			explained why you didn't do anything about it. When	
5			Superintendent Taylor's allegations then became known	13:51
6			to you, and your evidence earlier today was they became	
7			known on receipt of the letter from Mr. Justice O'Neill	
8			on the 26th October 2016, at that stage did you think	
9			to do anything about that conversation that you had had	
10			with Superintendent Taylor, on your evidence?	13:51
11		Α.	Not particularly, no. Not at that time, no.	
12	253	Q.	Well, aside from bringing to the attention of	
13			Mr. Justice O'Neill, which we know you didn't, did you	
14			not think it important to bring it to anybody else's	
15			attention at that stage?	13:51
16		Α.	No.	
17	254	Q.	You didn't speak to Nóirín O'Sullivan about it at that	
18			stage?	
19		Α.	Well, I can't be absolutely sure on that point, but I	
20			don't have a recollection.	13:51
21	255	Q.	I see.	
22		Α.	I don't	
23	256	Q.	Could you think about that for a moment because it	
24			seems that this may well have been the key to what	
25			Superintendent Taylor was all about. Did you or did	13:51
26			you not speak to Nóirín O'Sullivan about this when you	
27			became aware of the allegation?	
28		Α.	I've just explained to you, I can't be sure whether I	
29			did or I didn't. I have no recollection.	

2	25/	Q.	about it?	
3		Α.	No, I don't believe I did, no. As I said, this was a	
4		,	conversation from Superintendent Taylor to me. He was	
5			in a very difficult period and I advised him to get on	13:5
6			with his life, basically, and I left it at that.	10.0
7	258	Q.	Yes. No, and I understand that that was your position	
8	230	۷.	at the time of the conversation, you're putting that	
9			conversation after the time of his arrest, which we	
10			know would have been May 2015.	13:5
11		Α.	Yes.	13.3
12	259	Q.	Your notification of these allegations is in October	
13		·	2016, so it's perhaps a year and a bit after you've had	
14			this conversation. It's not a huge length of time that	
15			has passed.	13:5
16		Α.	I agree.	
17	260	Q.	You're the person who is now in a very difficult	
18			position because these allegations have been made and	
19			your position is that these are untrue allegations.	
20			Surely that was the time to think of this conversation	13:5
21			and to think of doing something about this alleged	
22			conversation?	
23		Α.	Well, you see, as I said earlier on before lunch,	
24			Ms. Burns, the situation at that time was, I was	
25			looking for more detail and I didn't have that detail,	13:5
26			and, you know, that's factually the position. I had	

28

29

taken legal advice, I acted on that legal advice, and

we entered into communication between Mr. Justice

O'Neill and myself based on that legal advice. And

1	then when the Tribunal was set up and we got the terms
2	of reference and I sat down to try and address each and
3	every one of these points, I felt that that was the
4	appropriate time to mention this issue, because I'm now
5	armed with some of the detail, only some of the detail
6	of what is alleged against me.

13:55

7 261 well, in terms of all that has transpired, in terms of Q. 8 the whole affair with Sergeant McCabe, all of the allegations that have been made, your central, and I 9 will say defence, but in reality what I am, I suppose, 10 13:54 11 saying is, your central response to Superintendent 12 Taylor's allegation is this view that he had in 13 relation to Nóirín O'Sullivan, his stated animosity 14 towards her, his stated future modus operandi as to 15 what he would do against her and him dragging you into 13:54 16 that to add credence, as you say, to the allegations he made. Surely when all of this raises its head, that 17 18 very simple conversation that you say occurred with 19 Superintendent Taylor, surely that should have been 20 told to somebody at that stage and notified to 13:55 somebody? 21

A. Well, I think, just to be clear, what I stated the other day was an opinion, when I was asked for an opinion, as to why these matters were being alleged. But I certainly addressed all of the allegations as best I could. So, you know, just nominating this particular passage, the couple of paragraphs at the end of my statement of the 13th March, it would be very unfair to suggest that that's all I was doing in terms

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1			of trying to address the allegations. I mean, for	
2			instance, I could do little more than deny some of	
3			them, because they're still fairly opaque. But	
4			certainly when it came to conversations I had with	
5			individuals, for instance, and certainly in relation to	13:55
6			the circumstances leading up to the meeting with	
7			Mr. McGuinness in the car park and what transpired at	
8			that car park, in addition to the time-line of events	
9			that occurred that particular day, the 24th January	
10			'14, all of those matters are addressed in my	13:56
11			statement. So it's not just a question of speaking	
12			about these two paragraphs in relation to the	
13			conversation I had with Superintendent Taylor and	
14			saying, sure that's the be-all and end-all, and, by the	
15			way, that is your defence to this catalogue of	13:56
16			complaints.	
17	262	Q.	But in relation to Superintendent Taylor's allegations	
18			against you, which are obviously contained within his	
19			protected disclosure, that is your case, that is what	
20			was put by your counsel to Superintendent Taylor, and	13:56
21			it was repeated by you in the course of evidence.	
22		Α.	Well, I was asked for an opinion and, you know, that is	
23			my opinion.	

- 24 263 Q. And it was also put to Superintendent Taylor, obviously
 25 on your instructions, in terms of his motivation. It
 26 is a central plank to your case in relation to the
 27 allegations that have been made by Superintendent
 28 Taylor against you?
- 29 A. Well, the central plank to the allegations that have

1			been made against me is that they are absolutely untrue	
2			and I'm dealing with those on that basis, that they are	
3			absolutely untrue, they are false, they should never	
4			have been made, I never directed any campaign, there	
5			was no smear campaign, and the former Commissioner	13:57
6			certainly wasn't complicit in that campaign, nor was	
7			any other member of An Garda Síochána. And I certainly	
8			didn't get I know that a number of things are now	
9			withdrawn from Superintendent Taylor in the context of	
10			the original complaints he's made, and, you know, that	13:57
11			is the position. There were no derogatory text	
12			messages, there was no verbal instructions given by me	
13			to brief the media negatively against Sergeant McCabe.	
14			All of those things are false, absolutely false.	
15	264	Q.	I see. But your case just simply isn't that, well,	13:58
16			what Superintendent Taylor says is untrue and false,	
17			your case goes a little bit further than that, it goes	
18			as far as: and not only is it all false, I can	
19			actually point to an animus that Superintendent Taylor	
20			had and these are the words that were spoken to me.	13:58
21			And my point is, with that extra part of your case, the	
22			extra element to his allegations are false, why wasn't	
23			that raised by you at an earlier stage?	
24		Α.	Well, at what point would you have wished me to have	
25			raised it?	13:58
26	265	Q.	well, my point is it should have been raised	
27			straightaway with Nóirín O'Sullivan, but giving you the	
28			benefit of, well, I didn't think anything would come of	
29			this, certainly by the time that you're notified of the	

protected disclosure, that you should have been doing
something in relation to that element of the proof that
you say that you have in relation to Superintendent
Taylor's animus?

Okay, I see where you're coming from. Well, the Α. 13:59 reality, Ms. Burns, is this: Superintendent Taylor had embarked on a course of action that I and I don't think anybody else in An Garda Síochána was aware of. when he was hitting out based on his reaction to his arrest and his suspension, I took the view that the man 13:59 was just hitting out at the Commissioner and, you know, I took it at face value on that basis and I tried to advise him, slow down, go back, do your job, all of those sort of paternal advices that you would give to somebody. That was my reaction to it. I mean, that's 13:59 the context. I wasn't aware that he was in a position. Am I making sense?

Yes. I think we will move on from that aspect that I wanted to ask you about. The next thing I wanted to ask you about, Mr. Callinan, is in relation to the evidence that you've given regarding Ms. Debbie McCann, Ms. Eavan Murray and then Mr. Paul Williams. And in relation to that, your position is that you were never informed by Superintendent Taylor that these three journalists had any involvement at the Ms. D house?

14:00

14:00

A. That's correct, Chairman.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

266

Q.

27 267 Q. And Superintendent Taylor's evidence is to the complete 28 opposite, that he says he did inform you in relation to 29 all three journalists and their involvement at the

```
1
              Ms. D house?
 2
              I see.
         Α.
 3
    268
         0.
              I see.
 4
              Yes.
         Α.
 5
    269
              Now, just two things in relation to that.
                                                           I think that 14:00
         Q.
 6
              you accepted, when questioned by Mr. Marrinan
 7
              yesterday, that Superintendent Taylor did keep you
 8
              updated in relation to all of the Maurice McCabe issues
              that were in the media at the time and were ongoing in
 9
              the political establishment also?
10
                                                                         14 · 01
11
              Quite a good few of the issues that were arising, yes.
         Α.
12
              I don't think you take any issue --
    270
         Q.
13
              No.
         Α.
14
    271
         0.
              -- in terms of his information to you in relation to
15
              Sergeant McCabe?
                                                                          14:01
16
              No, no, Superintendent Taylor was an avid texter.
         Α.
17
              sent me many, many texts about operational matters and
18
              articles appearing and various other matters that he
19
              felt I should be apprised of.
              And I think that you also accepted to Mr. Marrinan
20
    272
         Q.
                                                                         14:01
              yesterday that, regardless of the issue between you as
21
22
              to whether there was a direction to negatively brief
              the media, that, regardless of that, Superintendent
23
24
              Taylor still should have told you in the normal course
25
              of his information regarding Debbie McCann, Eavan
                                                                         14.02
26
              Murray and Paul Williams being at Ms. D's house?
27
         Α.
              I would have thought that that would have been
28
              appropriate, yes.
```

So that is exactly what Superintendent Taylor

29

273

Q.

I see.

- 1 says he did do, that he did inform you in relation to 2 that.
- No. he didn't. 3 Α.
- Well, it will be a matter for the Chairman to determine 4 274 0. 5 in relation to that. Earlier today, Mr. McDowell 14:02 6 questioned you in relation to your meeting with Philip Boucher-Hayes, and I take it that your end position in 7 8 terms of any involvement that Superintendent Taylor had in relation to informing Philip Boucher-Hayes of the 9 matters which Philip Boucher-Hayes alleges he was told 10 14 · 02
- 11 on the day by you, you're not actively pursuing a case 12 that Superintendent Taylor was involved in relation to
- 13 that?

Q.

- 14 Α. I have no evidence to suggest he was.
- 15 275 Yes. And no questions were put by your counsel to him Q. 16 in relation to that?
- 17 That's fine. I merely pointed out that the manner in Α. 18 which Mr. Boucher-Hayes used the expressions he used, I 19 found somewhat opaque, in that he must have had some 20 sort of knowledge. Otherwise, as an experienced

14:03

- reporter, I would have expected him to ask me what I 21
- 22 was talking about. That's the only point I make. 23 I see.
- 24 And my staff were over there earlier on in the day,
- 25 including Superintendent Taylor.
- Other staff as well? 26 277 Ο.
- Other staff as well, of course. 27 Α.
- And in relation then to a comment that you made to 28 278 Ο. 29 Mr. McDowell this morning in relation to Superintendent
 - 118

1			Taylor meeting with John McGuinness, again I assume	
2			that you're not actively pursuing a case that	
3			Superintendent Taylor is behind John McGuinness's	
4			evidence to the Tribunal?	
5		Α.	No, I'm not saying that. But I do make the point,	14:03
6			because I would be less than honest for thinking it and	
7			not saying it, the fact that a number of key witnesses	
8			to this Tribunal have been engaging with one another	
9			prior to making their statements, was on my mind, and	
10			that's what I stated this morning. I don't go beyond	14:04
11			that, Chairman, but, you know, that is a fact.	
12	279	Q.	Mr. Callinan, just then in relation to Sergeant McCabe,	
13			and we heard evidence from yourself and also from Alan	
14			Shatter in relation to the various issues that Sergeant	
15			McCabe was raising, it's obviously not just the fixed	14:04
16			charge notices, there obviously had been all of the	
17			investigations that had come from the Byrne/McGinn	
18			report, then Assistant Commissioner Rice had to also	
19			engage in an investigation; Sergeant McCabe had caused	
20			a lot of investigations to have to be conducted by An	14:05
21			Garda Síochána?	
22		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
23	280	Q.	Now, in terms of the difficulties that all of that	
24			caused and the continuing nature of Sergeant McCabe's	
25			raising of issues, it seems that your position is that	14:05
26			you are of a view that it is possible that the sexual	
27			assault allegations in 2006 may have been a driving	
28			feature in relation to those allegations?	
29		Α.	I never said they were a driving feature.	

1	281	Q.	I see. Well, just in terms of your evidence to Mr.	
2			Marrinan last Friday, and that's Day 78 at page 35, you	
3			were asked about whether you felt that there was some	
4			improper motive that Sergeant McCabe had for making his	
5			allegations in relation to the fixed charge penalty	14:06
6			notice, and you go on to say that you were aware from	
7			reading the executive summary in the McGinn report of	
8			the sexual assault allegations in 2006, and you go on	
9			to make a comment:	
10				14:06
11			"Nor did I believe that it was the conduit"	
12				
13			And that's referring to the sexual assault allegations.	
14				
15			" for Sergeant McCabe to make the complaints he was	14:06
16			maki ng. "	
17				
18			And then sorry, I might just wait for the transcript	
19			to come up. So it's page 35 of Day 78. So just the	
20			first answer that's referred to at the top of the page,	14:06
21			you say:	
22				
23			"But I did read, of course I read in the executive	
24			summary the observation of the assistant commissioner.	
25			It's there in black and white. But I certainly wasn't	14:06
26			linking it"	
27				
28			Now, that is referring to the sexual assault	
29			allegations.	

Т				
2			" or nor did I believe that it was the conduit for	
3			Sergeant McCabe to make the complaints he was making."	
4				
5			And then Mr. Marrinan says:	14:07
6				
7			"Well, it clearly wasn't a conduit. But, I mean, did	
8			you think that this was influencing Sergeant McCabe in	
9			some way in making false and spurious accusations	
10			against his colleagues?"	14:07
11				
12			And your answer is:	
13				
14			"It's very, very difficult to tell whether that was a	
15			motivation."	14:07
16				
17			So I certainly interpreted your evidence as it being	
18			something that you thought was a possibility, that the	
19			sexual assault allegations in 2006 were a motivating	
20			factor for Sergeant McCabe to make the allegations he	14:07
21			was making?	
22		Α.	Well, of course, I can't I can't answer that. I	
23			simply don't know.	
24	282	Q.	And that's I'm not asking you whether that is the	
25			reason that Sergeant McCabe was raising these issues.	14:07
26			What I instead am asking you is what your view was of	
27			why Sergeant McCabe was raising these accusations.	
28		Α.	Again, I cannot answer that. The sergeant is entitled	
29			to make any allegations he wishes. My job is to make	

1			sure that they were investigated and investigated	
2			properly.	
3	283	Q.	I see. Well, I will just bring you then down to a	
4			little bit further on that page, the last question	
5			that's asked at the bottom of the page:	14:08
6				
7			"Did you consider that the 2006 allegation was in some	
8			way behind Sergeant McCabe making false accusations	
9			against his colleagues?"	
10				14:08
11			And the answer is:	
12				
13			"Yeah, I suppose, Chairman."	
14				
15			And then you go on to recount the conversation that you	14:08
16			had with Alan Shatter on the next page, in relation to	
17			him asking you about this.	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	284	Q.	So again, just to make it clear, Mr. Callinan, I'm not	
20			asking you whether Sergeant McCabe was motivated by	14:08
21			revenge in terms of the sexual assault allegation in	
22			2006, what I'm specifically asking you is what was your	
23			view in relation to what was Sergeant McCabe's	
24			motivating factor?	
25		Α.	Well, the response to the Minister there was in	14:09
26			response to a question I was asked, a specific question	
27			I was asked; you know, is there something behind this	
28			that he should be informed of? And I felt obliged, as	
29			I am statutory obliged to do anyway, to answer the	

Τ			question. And I was aware of this allegation of	
2			sexual I think in the Byrne/McGinn report it's	
3			referred to as an indecent assault. But anyway, that's	
4			semantics, I suppose. So I did mention very briefly	
5			this particular issue and I had indicated that the	14:09
6			matter had been investigated and the DPP had decided	
7			there would be no prosecution, and that was the end of	
8			the matter. The Minister didn't question me on it, we	
9			didn't have a discussion on it. He just moved on.	
10	285	Q.	I'm not being remotely critical that you discussed this	14:10
11			with Mr. Shatter at all. Really what I'm asking you,	
12			and I thought it was clear in your evidence, that you	
13			were of a view that there was a possibility that	
14			Sergeant McCabe was motivated to make the various	
15			accusations he was making arising from the	14:10
16			investigation in 2006?	
17		Α.	No. I think that, you know, that is there. It's an	
18			inescapable fact. But I cannot say that that was the	
19			motivating factor.	
20	286	Q.	And again, perhaps I'm not being clear, and my	14:10
21			apologies if I am not.	
22		Α.	Sorry, no	
23	287	Q.	I'm not asking whether Sergeant McCabe was making	
24			accusations because of the 2006 allegation; what I am	
25			asking you is what your view was as to whether as to	14:10
26			why Sergeant McCabe was making allegations arise and	
27			whether that was because of the 2006 allegation, in	

A. Well, I don't know, is the answer, but he is certainly

your mind?

28

1 entitled to make any allegation he likes.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2 No, and I understand that, too. But apart from the 288 Q. 3 answers that you gave to Mr. Marrinan on Friday that I've just referred you to, I have to suggest to you 4 5 that it does seem that when you were asked about this 14:11 by Mr. Shatter, and also by Mr. Purcell, that they 6 7 raised the issue as to whether there was anything in the background of Sergeant McCabe, and to both 8 Mr. Shatter and to Mr. Purcell, you raised the issue of 9 the 2006 allegation. So it seems to me that there's an 14:11 10 11 inescapable conclusion that you thought there was the 12 possibility that this was a motivating factor for 13 Sergeant McCabe?

A. And again, I don't know, I don't know. I've given you the circumstance in relation to which the former

Minister asked me the question and my response. I don't recall the particular conversation I had with the secretary general in relation to this matter, but it is the case that he is one of the office holders that is mentioned under the Garda Síochána Act, Section 41, that there is a requirement on me to keep them briefed of matters. But I don't recall the specific conversation, whereas I do with the minister, the former minister.

14 · 12

25 289 Q. And again, Mr. Callinan, I'm not for a second saying
26 that you acted outside Section 41. My only interest in
27 terms of the questions that I'm putting is what your
28 attitude was as to why Sergeant McCabe may have been
29 doing the things he was doing, and, apart from the

- evidence that you gave on Friday, my suggestion to you
- is that, in light of the answers that you gave to
- 3 Mr. Shatter and to Mr. Purcell, the implication must be
- 4 that your view was that the 2006 allegation was
- 5 influencing Sergeant McCabe in bringing his allegations 14:13
- 6 forward?
- 7 A. Well, I mean, I cannot simply say that that is the
- 8 case. But I have read the Byrne/McGinn report. The
- 9 executive summary, in particular, makes mention of the

14 · 13

- 10 reaction from Sergeant McCabe in response to the
- allegation that was made way back then, he indicated in
- terms that he was a changed person, etcetera. So, you
- 13 know, there it is. I have read that.
- 14 290 Q. I see.
- 15 A. But I cannot say that that is the catalyst for Sergeant $_{14:13}$
- 16 McCabe to raise all these issues.
- 17 291 Q. Okay. Well, just to probe that then a little bit
- further in light of your answer. In terms of what you
- said to Mr. Shatter, we have his evidence specifically
- in relation to this issue at Day 77, and in the entire
- 21 paragraph that will be on screen in a moment -- sorry,
- 22 did I give a page? Page 144, my apologies if I didn't.
- That paragraph is Mr. Shatter's evidence in relation to
- that conversation that he had with you. But it is
- quite clear from that, and if I could specifically draw 14:14
- your attention to line 22 of the page, that not only
- 27 did you impart the information to Mr. Shatter that
- 28 there had been a previous investigation in relation to
- allegations of a sexual nature in 2006 regarding

Т			sergeant McCabe, but you then went on to specurate, and	
2			it's at line 22:	
3				
4			"And he then speculated that perhaps Sergeant McCabe	
5			was upset at the manner in which the matter was dealt	14:14
6			with."	
7				
8			Now, I've to suggest to you, Mr. Callinan, that that	
9			shows a thought process by you that the 2006	
10			allegations were an influencing factor on Sergeant	14:15
11			McCabe?	
12		Α.	Well, I read that and I don't recall saying that.	
13	292	Q.	I see.	
14		Α.	But I think it would be a natural reaction, you know,	
15			when people think about what I said, that maybe it was	14:15
16			the catalyst for doing all of these things, i.e. making	
17			the complaints. But I don't recall saying that.	
18	293	Q.	I see. Well, Mr. Shatter says that that is what you	
19			informed him of. And Mr. Purcell then gave evidence on	
20			Day 66, and at page 125 he also gives evidence, from	14:15
21			125 on to 126, in relation to you informing him of	
22			anything in the background in relation to Sergeant	
23			McCabe.	
24		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
25	294	Q.	Now, both Mr. Shatter and Mr. Purcell thought that	14:16
26			these conversations happened on the phone, so it isn't	
27			that they were in each other's presence, with you, when	
28			these conversations happened. They were two separate	
29			conversations.	

Т		Α.	werr, I certainty, in the context of the message I gave	
2			to the former minister, that was certainly on the	
3			phone.	
4	295	Q.	And Mr. Shatter didn't think there was anything	
5			inappropriate in terms of him asking this question of	14:16
6			you. Did you think there was anything inappropriate	
7			about it?	
8		Α.	Inappropriate, you say?	
9	296	Q.	Yes.	
10		Α.	No.	14:16
11	297	Q.	Him asking about anything in the background of Sergeant	
12			McCabe?	
13		Α.	Well, there was certainly nothing inappropriate from me	
14			responding.	
15	298	Q.	well, he thought neither was there anything	14:16
16			inappropriate in him asking or in your responding?	
17		Α.	I would think that is fair.	
18	299	Q.	I see. I just wonder, Mr. Callinan, in terms of two	
19			very senior significant persons who had dealings with	
20			Sergeant McCabe, wondering whether there was something	14:17
21			in his background that was causing him to air the	
22			grievances that he had, did that have any effect on you	
23			in terms of your dealings with Sergeant McCabe?	
24		Α.	No, no. Why would it?	
25	300	Q.	Well, here were two people who very much knew exactly	14:17
26			the difficulties that Sergeant McCabe's allegations	
27			were causing, they had firsthand knowledge of all of	
28			the complaints that had been made, and they're	
29			wondering is there something more here. And your	

- information to them is that, well, there's an investigation in 2006, perhaps that's why he's upset.
- 3 A. Yes.

4 301 Q. Did that have any effect on you in terms of how you

5 would deal with Sergeant McCabe and perhaps the

6 unfairness of the media and the public not realising

7 the situation that actually was in existence?

No. Certainly not, no. I mean, I mean, I said it 8 Α. several times: Sergeant McCabe was entitled to make 9 whatever allegations he wished and those matters need 10 11 to be attended to. He made very serious allegations about me, but I didn't hold that against him. 12 13 with it because I knew the truth of the matter at that 14 point and I got on with the business of dealing with 15 his allegations. But I certainly didn't dig down to 16 personalise any of these matters to the extent that I 17 was engaging in a personal campaign directing 18 Superintendent Taylor to brief negatively against the

14 · 18

14:19

14 · 19

20 302 Q. Well, were you frustrated that a minister and a
21 secretary general were suspicious as to whether there
22 was something more behind Sergeant McCabe and you
23 weren't in a position to inform people of that?

That's not what I am about.

- A. No. I mean, all I was doing was giving the facts that were in my possession when I was asked, nothing more.
- 26 303 Q. Did you think about what they had asked you after either of those conversations?
- 28 A. Not particularly, no.

media.

29 304 Q. Did you think that, well, perhaps if people realised

1			that there's a bit more to Sergeant McCabe, things	
2			might be easier from our perspective in terms of	
3			management in An Garda Síochána?	
4		Α.	Not at all, certainly not.	
5	305	Q.	Really?	14:20
6		Α.	Really and truly, Chairman. That's not what I was	
7			about. I'm not in the business of personalising these	
8			matters. I mean, the Garda Síochána is a huge	
9			organisation, as we all know. Members of An Garda	
10			Síochána have difficulties with their Commissioner and	14:20
11			their senior officers every single day of the week,	
12			whether it's over transfer, whether it's over	
13			promotion, whether it's over a variety of things, but	
14			you don't take it out on the individual that's making	
15			the complaint; you try and manage these situations and	14:20
16			deal with the matters that come in front of you.	
17	306	Q.	You see, as you know, Mr. Callinan, obviously	
18			Superintendent Taylor and yourself differ in this	
19			respect, and my suggestion to you has to be that	
20			whether it be arising from the conversations that you	14:21
21			had with Mr. Shatter and Mr. Purcell, or whether it be	
22			in terms of just considering Sergeant McCabe and the	
23			previous issues that you were aware of, that you did	
24			determine that a negative briefing campaign should	
25			occur in relation to Sergeant McCabe and you briefed	14:21
26			David Taylor accordingly?	
27		Α.	No, Chairman, that's not correct.	
28	307	Q.	Can I just ask you one further thing, Mr. Callinan.	
29			When it came to your knowledge that there had been the	

1			possibility of questioning Sergeant McCabe at the	
2			O'Higgins Tribunal in relation to the 2006 allegation,	
3			what was your view in relation to that?	
4		Α.	I wasn't aware of that.	
5	308	Q.	Well, when you did become aware of it I assume that	14:21
6			you became aware of it, as all of us did, in the media	
7			at some stage or other. When you did become aware of	
8			it, what was your view?	
9		Α.	well, I didn't have a particular view. I mean, I doubt	
10			very much if that was ever going to arise. I couldn't	14:22
11			see how it would arise and I couldn't see how - the	
12			Chairman has adverted to it earlier on this morning - I	
13			couldn't see how Mr. Justice O'Higgins would allow	
14			something of that nature to arise in the context of the	
15			complaints.	14:22
16			CHAIRMAN: This hare has been raised again and really	
17			at this point I'm absolutely sick of it. Now, the	
18			point is, it was never raised. Nobody raised it. I've	
19			said that a dozen times. It's clear on the transcript.	
20			People can make press statements to the contrary if	14:22
21			they wish, but it never happened.	
22			MS. BURNS: That isn't really the question I was	
23			asking, Chairman.	
24			CHAIRMAN: So, I mean, what's the point? Did it ever	
25			go through his mind?	14:22
26			MS. BURNS: Yes.	
27			CHAIRMAN: well, that is a good question. Did it ever	
28			go through your mind, we'll get him in the witness-box	
29			and we will ask him about sexually abusing Ms. D?	

1		Α.	Not at all, absolutely not, Chairman, no, no, no, no.	
2			Sure that'd be a terrible no, absolutely not. I	
3			won't go any further. No is the answer, Chairman.	
4			MS. BURNS: Thank you very much, Mr. Callinan.	
5		Α.	Thank you, Ms. Burns.	14:23
6				
7			MR. CALLINAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. GILLANE:	
8				
9	309	Q.	MR. GILLANE: Good afternoon, Mr. Callinan. Séan	
10			Gillane is my name. I appear for RTÉ,	14:23
11			Mr. Boucher-Hayes, Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Burke.	
12		Α.	Mr. Gillane, yes.	
13	310	Q.	I will be no more than ten minutes, or possibly less.	
14			I have a small number of questions for you. In the	
15			first instance, if I can just ask you a number of	14:23
16			questions about the Crimecall programme broadcast in	
17			December 2013. Now, I'm not going to ask you any	
18			questions about the PAC, or anything of that nature;	
19			that was very much on the horizon or in the future at	
20			that stage.	14:23
21		Α.	Thank you.	
22	311	Q.	Running up to the Crimecall programme, I think you will	
23			accept that it had been a very, very difficult year for	
24			An Garda Síochána?	
25		Α.	Absolutely, yes.	14:23
26	312	Q.	And there were, at that stage, a number of issues	
27			converging in terms of public concern about certain	
28			things in respect of An Garda Síochána, isn't that	
29			right?	

1		Α.	Well, there was the GSOC offices, yes, certainly, yeah.	
2	313	Q.	Yes. I mean, An Garda Síochána, one way or the other,	
3			was in the news, if not every day, every other day?	
4		Α.	That would be correct, more so than usual. It's in the	
5			news almost every day, anyway.	14:24
6	314	Q.	And perhaps two or three things in particular coming up	
7			to December 17th were perhaps of special relevance.	
8			Firstly, in broad terms, the ticketing issue or the	
9			penalty points issue	
10		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	14:24
11	315	Q.	had become a problem, if I can put it this way, in	
12			broad terms, that just wouldn't go away. It had gained	
13			significant traction as a story, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
15	316	Q.	It had also become a story which was very much in the	14:24
16			popular consciousness because certain aspects of it	
17			were being personalised, in that various personalities	
18			were either being named or hinted at as having been the	
19			beneficiaries of inappropriate quashing of tickets,	
20			isn't that right?	14:25
21		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
22	317	Q.	And indeed you have instanced a specific example of it	
23			being personalised and your specific connection in	
24			respect, I think, of a story to be written by	
25			Ms. O'Doherty, isn't that right?	14:25
26		Α.	Yes, that's correct, Chairman, yes.	
27	318	Q.	Now, another storm cloud at the time, if I can put it	
28			that way, was also the recently-published Smithwick	
29			report, isn't that right?	

- 1 A. Yes, Chairman.
- 2 319 Q. And in relation to that, while it was dealing with
- 3 something unconnected with what we are concerned with,
- 4 there was some phraseology in the report that had also
- 5 received a considerable amount of attention, I think to 14:25
- 6 do with this question of loyalty trumping honesty, is
- 7 that right?
- 8 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.
- 9 320 Q. Now, in relation to that then, that was the context
- building up to December 17th, and the intended
- broadcast of an interview with you by Ms. Seoige, isn't

14 · 25

14:26

14:26

14 . 26

- 12 that right?
- 13 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.
- 14 321 Q. Now, in relation to that then, I just want to ask you
- some specific questions about your arrival at RTÉ and
- 16 your conversation with Mr. Boucher-Hayes.
- 17 A. Yes, Chairman.
- 18 322 Q. He requested to speak to you alone, isn't that right?
- 19 A. We met in the corridor of RTÉ. I think we just
- happened on one another.
- 21 323 Q. All right.
- 22 A. I don't know whether he had suggested earlier, but that
- 23 wasn't brought to my attention.
- 24 324 Q. You may be unaware of that, but I think he was
- 25 intending on speaking to you alone.
- 26 A. Okay.
- 27 325 Q. And I think you were in or around the doorway, I think,
- to studio 4 at the time.
- 29 A. Yes, he was talking to a young lady at a doorway when I

1			walked down the corridor.	
2	326	Q.	Now, what I want to suggest to you, and just think	
3			about this, is that Mr. Boucher-Hayes wanted to bring,	
4			I'm going to say three things to your attention?	
5		Α.	Correct, Chairman.	14:26
6	327	Q.	Firstly, he wanted to make it clear to you that the	
7			programme that was to be broadcast had to be relevant,	
8			that it had to be relevant to his viewers, do you	
9			remember that?	
10		Α.	That was his view, Chairman, yes.	14:27
11	328	Q.	Secondly, he wanted to make it clear to you that he	
12			couldn't tolerate the agenda, if I can put it that way,	
13			being set by An Garda Síochána?	
14		Α.	Yes, Chairman, that was his view.	
15	329	Q.	And thirdly, he also wanted to make it clear to you	14:27
16			that there couldn't be any question of An Garda	
17			Síochána deciding what questions would be asked?	
18		Α.	That's a fair representation, Chairman, yes.	
19	330	Q.	And in respect of all that, you accept that that's so?	
20		Α.	Absolutely, Chairman, yes.	14:27
21	331	Q.	And I'm going to put it to you that it's not that he's	
22			an incurious journalist, as might have been suggested	
23			by you earlier; it's just that he had a particular bit	
24			of business in mind in approaching you to set all of	
25			these things out to you in crystal-clear terms?	14:27
26		Α.	Yes, I accept that, Chairman, totally.	
27	332	Q.	And effectively I think he was communicating to you	
28			that to have an interview with the Commissioner of An	
29			Garda Síochána at this particular time of times that	

1			didn't treat of issues such as the penalty points or	
2			the Smithwick report, or the closure of rural stations	
3			I think was also mentioned, would be like ignoring the	
4			elephant in the room, if I can put it that way, that	
5			these were matters with which the public was concerned?	14:28
6		Α.	Yes, that was his view, Chairman, yes.	
7	333	Q.	And it's in that context in terms of his conversation	
8			with you I'm going to suggest to you that he wasn't, in	
9			fact, looking for information from you or questioning	
10			you with a view to getting information; he was, in	14:28
11			fact, seeking to get your agreement to allow questions	
12			to be asked by his colleague, Ms. Seoige?	
13		Α.	Yes, Chairman, except I had been told earlier by the	
14			Press Officer that those two items in particular, the	
15			Smithwick Tribunal report	14:28
16	334	Q.	Yes.	
17		Α.	I beg your pardon.	
18	335	Q.	I understand.	
19		Α.	The Smithwick report and the fixed charge penalty	
20			notice system and particular reference to the	14:29
21			whistleblowers controversy and naming the two	
22			individuals, Sergeant McCabe and John Wilson, clearly	
23			that was said to me.	
24	336	Q.	No, that's what I'm coming to. I'm putting it to you	
25			clearly that what he was trying to get across to you	14:29
26			was that the agenda couldn't be driven by An Garda	
27			Síochána. He wasn't at that stage seeking any	
28			information from you. And that, in fact, you then	
29			responded in the terms which Mr. Marrinan has already	

- 1 taken you through?
- A. Well, I think there was a little bit more to it really,
- you know, in fairness. I absolutely agree with you
- 4 that all of those things were spoken about and that
- 5 that was his view and that we shouldn't be setting --

14 - 29

14:30

14:30

- 6 sorry.
- 7 337 Q. And you introduced these topics and the detail which
- 8 you introduced, again which Mr. Marrinan has already
- 9 taken you through?
- 10 A. No, no, I mean --
- 11 338 Q. I'm going to suggest to you that, far from being
- opaque, there's a degree of technicolour to you, and,
- as I say, Mr. Marrinan has read all of that out to you.
- 14 A. Okay.
- 15 339 Q. And do you remember saying to him, for example, that
- 16 Sergeant McCabe was famous within An Garda Síochána for
- 17 being motivated by grievance?
- 18 A. No, I did not say that.
- 19 340 Q. And that, whether or which, that was something that he
- 20 couldn't have known unless it was said to him?
- 21 A. I don't know what he could have known, Mr. Gillane.
- 22 I'm not trying to be awkward --
- 23 341 Q. All right. I understand. And if, Chairman, you allow
- 24 me to adopt Mr. Marrinan's questioning in respect of
- 25 the detail, I think Mr. Marrinan read the entirety of
- that conversation.
- 27 A. Absolutely.
- 28 342 Q. And you've made your position clear on that.
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 343 Q. Can I then just ask you briefly in relation to another
- issue that I don't want to give more oxygen than it
- deserves and it may be the subject of submission in due
- 4 course, but you were questioned about it; that on-line
- 5 story published by Mr. Reynolds which became a
- 6 subsequent broadcast on the 24th February, I think that

14:31

14:31

- 7 was handed up to you in a particular form there. Do
- 8 you have that?
- 9 A. I have that, thank you, Chairman.
- 10 344 Q. Can you just confirm in relation to the middle
- paragraph there and the reference to the assistant
- commissioner saying he'd sit down and give Sergeant
- McCabe a fair hearing, that the first part of that
- 14 paragraph indicates that this was after he had
- forwarded the investigation report to the Minister for
- 16 Justice?
- 17 A. Yes. The report was forwarded to the Minister on the
- 18 28th March '13, Chairman.
- 19 345 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. And this refers to the 13th April, which is a fortnight 14:31
- 21 later
- 22 346 Q. I think it's clear on the face of the document you see
- 23 there?
- A. Absolutely, Chairman, yes.
- 25 347 Q. And you can also confirm that, on that document,
- there's nothing there suggesting that Sergeant McCabe
- 27 refused to do anything?
- 28 A. I don't believe so, Chairman, no.
- 29 348 Q. And you may be unaware, but seeing as it was put to

1			you, that this story which subsequently became the	
2			substance of a broadcast on that day, was thereafter	
3			amended as soon as Sergeant McCabe let his views be	
4			known, and that, ultimately, the story as carried on	
5			RTÉ, carried a picture of Sergeant McCabe and every	14:32
6			cough and splutter from his own statement; you may be	
7			unaware of that?	
8		Α.	I'm sorry, I beg your pardon?	
9	349	Q.	In other words, the story that was handed to you was	
10			the original story, and I'm just putting it to you, you	14:32
11			may be unaware of it, that later that night and into	
12			the following morning, when Sergeant McCabe's account	
13			of that event was released, it was incorporated into	
14			the story and quoted extensively as part of it?	
15		Α.	Yes. I beg your pardon, I just didn't understand your	14:32
16			earlier point. Yes.	
17	350	Q.	That is my fault.	
18			CHAIRMAN: well, Mr. Gillane, Commissioner Callinan is	
19			not saying that he ever issued a direction to the	
20			sergeant to cooperate with the O'Mahony investigation.	14:32
21			MR. GILLANE: That is my last question, in fact.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Right. Okay. Well, I mean, that is wrong,	
23			basically.	
24			MR. GILLANE: well	
25			CHAIRMAN: It seems to be wrong at the moment.	14:32
26			MR. GILLANE: Yes. We will hear more in respect of	
27			that in due course.	
28			CHAIRMAN: well, no, I am here to listen, I am here to	
29			listen, yes.	

351 Q. MR. GILLANE: What I wanted to ask you in respect of 1 2 this direction, that I know yourself and Mr. McDowell have discussed earlier, and I don't, as it were, have a 3

14:33

14:33

- dog in that fight, I don't know whether it is a good 4
- 5 direction or a bad direction and I know what Sergeant
- 6 McCabe says about it.
- 7 Yes. Α.
- 8 352 But when you say direction as quoted, what is one to 0. 9 understand by that phrase 'direction'? Is that an instruction or order or what is it, as phrased in the 10 14:33 11 document that's been handed up?
- Well, it was intended a direction to desist from what 12 Α. 13 was going on at the time, printing off Pulse records 14 that were subsequently disclosed to third parties, and the last sentence of that direction dealt with an 15 16 invitation to Sergeant McCabe and John Wilson, if they 17 had any further concerns regarding the fixed charge 18 penalty issue, that they should take them up with the 19 assistant commissioner, without any -- you know, 20 without their entitlement to the confidential reporting 14:34
- 22 353 Yes. Q.

21

- 23 I mean, I couldn't tell them not to do that, if that's Α. 24 the way they wished to go.
- 25 No, I understand. As I say, I'm not interested in the 354 Q. 14:34 merits, or otherwise, of it, but does the word 26 27 'direction' cover the paragraph or just the first
- 28 sentence?
- 29 The full paragraph, yes. Α.

mechanism system.

355 Can I just ask you, does 'direction' mean instruction, 1 Q. 2 order, or what does it mean? 3 Α. Well, to my mind, and what I was thinking of at the time was, this was a direction to stop what they were 4 5 doing in the first instance and if they had any issues 14:34 at all around the system, that they could bring those 6 7 to either the assistant commissioner or work through 8 the confidential reporting mechanism. essentially the direction, Judge. 9 All right. I think understand. 10 356 Q. 14:34 11 CHAI RMAN: The first was a direction, certainly --12 It is. Α. 13 CHAI RMAN: -- because there was a block on Sergeant 14 McCabe accessing Pulse. The second was like an 15 invitation to dinner, which is not a compulsion, you 14:35 16 will come to my house for dinner tonight, it was an invitation that if you wished to raise anything, well 17 then you have your channel, it's assistant 18 19 commissioner. MR. GILLANE: And that is why, in fairness, Chairman, I 14:35 20 was asking the former commissioner what he meant by it 21 22 and whether 'direction' covered the paragraph, and he 23 has given his answer in that regard. 24 On the plain wording of the text, it CHAI RMAN: 25 doesn't, but that doesn't mean that Mr. Reynolds was 14:35 out to mislead the Irish public. 26 27 MR. GILLANE: No, I understand. 28 If you wish, you may wish to ask a question CHAI RMAN:

as to whether the Commissioner, who has been accused of

Τ		being the source of this somewhat misleading paragraph,	
2		was indeed the source or inspiration or indeed gave a	
3		briefing on the record that we don't know about, to	
4		Mr. Reynolds, or through his Press Officer,	
5		Superintendent Taylor, to the effect that there was	14:35
6		non-cooperation with the O'Mahony investigation.	
7		MR. GILLANE: I think the former Commissioner has	
8		already responded to Mr. McDowell directly in that	
9		regard, so I don't want to, in my particular position,	
10		trespass on that aspect of the	14:36
11		CHAIRMAN: I'm not sure that is the point, Mr. Gillane.	
12	Α.	I have	
13		CHAIRMAN: The point, Mr. Gillane, is, if you have	
14		instructions to the effect that the Commissioner was	
15		the source of that, let us say, on the record	14:36
16		MR. GILLANE: No, I don't have instructions to put to	
17		the Commissioner in that regard.	
18		CHAIRMAN: All right. Okay, that is fine.	
19		MR. GILLANE: Thank you very much, Mr. Callinan.	
20	Α.	Thank you, Mr. Gillane.	14:36
21		CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harty, you're for Alison O'Reilly, isn't	
22		that right?	
23		MR. HARTY: I'm for Gemma O'Doherty.	
24		CHAIRMAN: Gemma O'Doherty, yes. I'm sorry,	
25		Mr. Ó Muircheartaigh, would you like to go then for	14:36
26		Alison O'Reilly?	
27			
28			

1			MR. CALLINAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY	
2			Mr. Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH:	
3				
4	357	Q.	MR. Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH: My name is Fíonán Ó	
5			Muircheartaigh and I represent the journalist Alison	14:36
6			O'Reilly. My questions concern your contacts with	
7			Debbie McCann. You will recall she was the first	
8			journalist to call to the home of Ms. D early in 2014.	
9			And you told the Tribunal yesterday, I think around	
10			lunchtime, you were not advised on a current basis that	14:37
11			Debbie McCann was going to Ms. D's house, you were	
12			surprised by that. But that is not really what I want	
13			to ask you about. Do you know the journalist Debbie	
14			McCann personally?	
15		Α.	Yes, I have met her, yes. She is the daughter of a	14:37
16			colleague that I worked with in the past, many years	
17			ago.	
18	358	Q.	And did you have many contacts with Ms. McCann in the	
19			line of your duty?	
20		Α.	No, very little. She would have appeared probably at a	14:37
21			couple of public appearances that I would have made,	
22			but little or no contact.	
23	359	Q.	And did Debbie McCann speak to you about Maurice McCabe	
24			at all in the period let's say December 2013 to March	
25			2014, this is just before the	14:37
26		Α.	No.	
27	360	Q.	PAC, for example, and then just after her visit to	
28			Ms. D's house, that period?	
29		Α.	The answer is no, Chairman.	

2 that period, that Debbie McCann did not ask you to 3 confirm anything about Maurice McCabe's character? Correct, Chairman, yes. 4 Α. And would it be fair to say that Debbie McCann didn't 5 362 Q. 14:38 6 ask you to confirm that Maurice McCabe was a 7 paedophile? 8 Correct, Chairman. Α. So you never had any conversation with 9 CHAI RMAN: Debbie McCann about Maurice McCabe at all? 10 14:38 11 Α. No, Chairman. 12 CHAI RMAN: You seem to be confining your conversations 13 with her to social interactions? 14 Α. That's all, Chairman, yeah, yeah, absolutely. 15 363 MR. Ó MUI RCHEARTAI GH: And was any question ever put to 14:38 Q. 16 you by Debbie McCann about Maurice McCabe's character? 17 No. Chairman. Α.

Very good. So would it be fair to say then that, in

361 Q.

1

18

19

364

Q.

you by Debbie McCann about Maurice McCabe?

A. No, Chairman.

Did you ever have any discussion about Maurice

McCabe or were you ever -- any questions ever put to

- 22 365 Q. Just a couple of other short questions. Your report,
 23 it's reported that after the events of the PAC and
 24 there was this talk about a remark you made, a phrase
 25 used by you that caused a terrible furore and it seems 14:39
 26 to go out of all proportion to the whole issue, but did
 27 you ever speak to Debbie McCann about that?
- A. No, Chairman. I've no memory whatsoever.

 Were you aware that she wrote an article two years

1			later, on the 15th May 2016, in the Irish Mail on	
2			Sunday? And the two paragraphs read as follows:	
3				
4			"Retired Garda Commissioner Martin Callinan wanted to	
5			withdraw the 'quite disgusting' remark he made before	14:39
6			the Public Accounts Committee, but was stopped by the	
7			government from doing so, the Irish Mail on Sunday has	
8			I earned.	
9				
10			Sources said it was all agreed the weekend before he	14:40
11			retired that he would withdraw this remark but he was	
12			stopped in his tracks."	
13				
14			Now, were you aware that that article was written?	
15		Α.	I don't recall it. But if you read it out, of course I	14:40
16			accept it was written, but it's not true, that's not	
17			true, the contents of that article is not true.	
18	367	Q.	Is not true?	
19		Α.	No, no.	
20	368	Q.	You didn't intend to	14:40
21		Α.	No, not at all, certainly not.	
22	369	Q.	So Debbie McCann didn't approach you about that?	
23		Α.	No.	
24	370	Q.	So the sources that she quotes are not you in that	
25			regard?	14:40
26		Α.	Correct, Chairman.	
27			CHAIRMAN: well, I don't know if there is a source at	
28			all. I mean, it seems like an opinion piece, doesn't	
29			it. Mr. Ó Muircheartaigh? And the other thing is. I	

1			suppose, paper doesn't refuse ink, does it? I mean,	
2			the government, the government made a decision that you	
3			weren't to apologise to Sergeant McCabe? I mean, that	
4			seems one of the more bizarre things I have heard.	
5		Α.	Totally untrue, Chairman.	14:41
6			MR. Ó MUIRCHEARTAIGH: Thank you very much. Those are	
7			my questions.	
8		Α.	Thank you.	
9				
10			MR. CALLINAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. HARTY:	14:41
11				
12	371	Q.	MR. HARTY: Mr. Callinan, my name is Mark Harty and I'm	
13			instructed on behalf of Gemma O'Doherty.	
14		Α.	Thank you.	
15	372	Q.	You will recall the circumstances in which you came to	14:41
16			have an involvement with Ms. O'Doherty. She received	
17			from a source a copy of a Pulse printout which	
18			indicated that you had had a fixed penalty notice	
19			rescinded or removed, that that fixed penalty notice	
20			was in relation to an incident where the vehicle wasn't	14:41
21			stopped, which took place in July 2007?	
22		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
23	373	Q.	And the information that she would have received from	
24			her source in relation to that would have been the name	
25			and address of the person who owned the vehicle, the	14:42
26			vehicle registration, where it was stopped and the date	
27			on which the notice was issued or, sorry, not where	
28			it was stopped, but where it was noted to have been	
29			speeding?	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 374 Q. And it would have noted on the face of it simply that
- 3 the fixed penalty notice had been retracted, isn't that

14 · 42

14:42

14:43

- 4 right?
- 5 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.
- 6 375 Q. No other information was given in relation to it?
- 7 A. Pardon me?
- 8 376 Q. There was no real other information given as to how
- 9 these circumstances arose. For example, because the
- 10 car was never stopped, the identity of the driver
- 11 wasn't contained in that, isn't that correct?
- 12 A. Well, it was my vehicle and I was attending to an
- 13 urgent operational matter, and that's what appears on
- the Pulse entry.
- 15 377 Q. No --
- 16 A. And that Pulse entry has appeared on social media on
- 17 several occasions.
- 18 378 Q. Well, yes. It doesn't appear on the Pulse entry that
- 19 you were attending an urgent -- it doesn't make any
- reference to who was driving the vehicle, isn't that
- 21 correct?
- 22 A. No, no, it does, it refers to me and that I was
- attending to an urgent operational matter, because
- otherwise how could I apply to have the matter
- 25 cancelled? It wouldn't make sense.
- 26 379 Q. Who did you apply to?
- 27 A. The member in charge of the fixed charge notice office
- at the time.
- 29 380 Q. You were the Deputy Commissioner at the time?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 381 Q. Do you have that application in relation to that --
- 3 A. At this remove.
- 4 382 Q. -- issuing that paper?
- 5 A. At this remove, I don't know whether I have it or not.
- 6 383 Q. You see, the Pulse printout that I've seen doesn't make
- 7 any reference to who the driver of the vehicle was.
- 8 A. I don't know what you have seen.
- 9 384 Q. I have simply seen one. It's contained in the -- page

14 · 44

14:45

- 10 7382, the most recent documentation which was handed
- out -- 7384. Unfortunately, it is a rather poor copy.
- [Same handed]
- 13 A. Thanks very much. Thank you.
- 14 385 Q. Did you get that?
- 15 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. Harty, it seems to be a tweet, is 14:44
- that right?
- 17 MR. HARTY: It was a tweet, it was tweeted. But that
- is the printout.
- 19 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Can we make anything out of this at
- 20 all? I don't know.
- MR. HARTY: No.
- 22 CHAIRMAN: No.
- 23 MR. HARTY: The difficulty is that because it actually
- doesn't give any further details as to who the -- it
- says "exceeding the speed limit" and it simply says
- "terminated". It doesn't say who is driving the car.
- 27 A. Yes, I wouldn't think that is the complete entry, I
- 28 wouldn't think it is.
- 29 386 Q. If that was the complete entry that Ms. O'Doherty had,

1 it gives rise to a number of questions, doesn't it? 2 I beg your pardon? Α. 3 387 Q. If that was the complete entry that Ms. O'Doherty had, it gives rise to a number of guestions, doesn't it? 4 5 Such as? Α. 14:45 6 388 Such as who was driving the car on the day in question? Q. I was driving the car on the day in question. 7 Α. 8 389 It doesn't tell you that, Commissioner --Q. 9 CHAI RMAN: Ah, yes. No, the surname is there, 10 Mr. Hartv. 14 · 45 11 MR. HARTY: No, that is in terms of the owner of the 12 car, but not in terms of the driver of the car. 13 Well, I would hope the owner would be CHAI RMAN: 14 driving the car. 15 MR. HARTY: NO. 14:46 16 How many -- there's a number of people in your 390 Q. 17 household, I take it, Mr. Callinan, who would be 18 entitled to drive your car in 2007? 19 There would be one, yes. Α. Yes. Your wife? 20 391 Q. 14:46 My wife, yes. 21 Α. 22 So there would be two people, in theory, could be 392 Q. 23 driving your car on that day? 24 In theory, yes. Α. 25 In theory, but one might be wearing a skirt CHAI RMAN: 14 · 46 26 SO --27 MR. HARTY: well, this is somebody who is not stopped. 28 This is taken by a camera. The car is never stopped. 29 CHAI RMAN: All right. I thought you said stopped.

- 1 MR. HARTY: No, no, sorry, I did use the word
- 'stopped', but I corrected myself.
- 3 CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, thank you for correcting
- 4 yourself.
- 5 393 Q. MR. HARTY: Detected. So the driver of the vehicle had 14:46

14 · 46

- 6 never been stopped. If it had been stopped, it would
- 7 have been very easy to have sorted the matter out,
- 8 isn't that correct?
- 9 A. Absolutely.
- 10 394 Q. But the driver of the vehicle was not, in fact,
- detected. And on the printout that was received by
- Ms. O'Doherty, there's no explanation as to why the
- fixed penalty notice was terminated?
- A. Well, I mean, I can only tell you that there is a Pulse
- entry indicating those facts, so I don't think what you 14:47
- see here -- I know it's a very poor copy, but I don't
- 17 think you have -- or historically --
- 18 395 Q. You see, I'm coming to a situation whereby
- Ms. O'Doherty is given this information, this is some
- time after the points, penalty points issue has arisen
- as a matter of public concern.
- 22 A. Right.
- 23 396 Q. Certainly towards the end of 2011 -- 2012, sorry, the
- 24 matter was very much live and in the public
- consciousness. This is now April 2013, and --
- 26 A. Sorry, what's April --
- 27 397 Q. This is received by Ms. O'Doherty in around April 2013.
- A. The Pulse?
- 29 398 Q. Yes, the Pulse entry.

- 1 A. I see.
- 2 399 Q. And the question does arise as to how it is that a
- 3 Deputy Commissioner of An Garda Síochána may have a
- fixed penalty notice on his car terminated. And that's
- a relevant question, isn't it? It's your private
- 6 car --
- 7 A. You're asking the question --
- 8 400 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. -- how does it arise that I had my fixed charge penalty
- 10 cancelled?
- 11 401 Q. Yes. I'm not asking how, it's a matter of public
- 12 interest that you did.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 402 Q. A matter of some considerable public interest that
- 15 you did --

14:48

14:48

- 16 A. And your question?
- 17 403 Q. No. Do you agree that it is a matter of considerable
- 18 public interest?
- 19 A. Yes, it is, of course.
- 20 404 Q. Whether you did it for yourself or whoever else might
- 21 have been driving the car at the time, as a matter
- 22 of --
- A. Well, I've just told you I'm driving the car at the
- time, you know, that is a matter of fact as far as I'm
- concerned, and I was attending to an urgent operational 14:48
- 26 matter at the time.
- 27 405 Q. Right.
- 28 A. I was recorded as exceeding the speed limit and I
- subsequently applied to the member in charge of the

fixed penalty notice office, who was a designated 1 2 authority for cancellation, on the basis that I was 3 driving the car attending to an urgent operational matter. That is the circumstances. 4 5 406 So what did you use to back up that version of events? Q. 14:49 6 What was necessary for you to show to that person, the 7 member in charge, in order to have those points cancelled? 8 well, that's as much as was necessary to produce. 9 Α. For you just simply to say that? 10 407 Q. 14 · 49 11 Pardon me? Α. 12 For you to assert that, is it? 408 Q. That is was what I indicated, yes. 13 Α. 14 409 0. But you didn't reveal anything to explain why you were 15 going there; you didn't show rosters, nothing else in 14:49 16 relation to proof of you driving? 17 Well, I was working certainly on the day and I was Α. 18 going to meet -- as it turned out, I was going to -- it 19 was a security issue, it was a source, actually, that I 20 was going to deal with some information that was passed 14:50 to me in relation to something that was happening, and 21 22 it was particularly urgent. 23 And you didn't have your own, an official car? 410 Q. 24 I jumped into my own car and I attended to the matter. Α. The situation is that the information had -- the 25 411 Ο. 14:50 26 penalty points story having been a story at this stage 27 for at least six or seven months, if not more, was that the now-Commissioner of An Garda Síochána had arranged 28 29 to have a fixed penalty notice in relation to his car

- 1 terminated and that was the story that was advised to
- 2 Ms. O'Doherty and that will be her evidence.
- 3 A. Okay.
- 4 412 Q. One thing that isn't clear from that Pulse record,
- because it's your private car, is that the man named in 14:51
- 6 that Pulse record is, in fact, Martin Callinan, the
- 7 Commissioner of An Garda Síochána, isn't that correct?
- 8 A. I don't think you have the full information there.
- 9 413 Q. Are you saying to me that that Pulse record makes it
- 10 clear that you're the Commissioner of An Garda
- 11 Síochána?
- 12 A. Well, I think it's very clear that -- my name is on it,

14:51

14:51

- I take it, and I cannot quite make it out, but I accept
- 14 my name is there somewhere.
- 15 414 Q. Your name is on it.
- 16 A. Okay.
- 17 415 Q. And are you the only Martin Callinan in the island of
- 18 Ireland?
- 19 A. I wouldn't think so, no, no, but --
- 20 416 Q. No. And you appreciate that if Martin Callinan, the
- 21 Garda Commissioner, never had penalty points notices
- terminated, that would be a very serious thing to say
- 23 about him?
- A. It would, but, I mean, I accept as fact that this
- 25 particular incident happened.
- 26 417 Q. Yes.
- 27 A. There's no question at all about that.
- 28 418 Q. That is not where we are coming from, Mr. Callinan.
- The point about it is, it would be very serious and

- defamatory of you to (inaudible) that you had a fixed
- 2 penalty notice if, in fact, it was an entirely
- 3 different Martin Callinan, isn't that correct?
- 4 A. Oh, I accept that, yes, of course.
- 5 419 Q. So a responsible journalist, regardless of the quality
- of their source, will go and check the information?
- 7 A. I accept that, yes.
- 8 420 Q. Now, it's 2007. There are two ways that Ms. O'Doherty
- 9 can link this incident to you personally, because
- 10 nowhere does it say Commissioner of An Garda Síochána

14:52

14:53

- or Deputy Commissioner of An Garda Síochána.
- 12 A. All right.
- 13 421 Q. It's either the car or the address, isn't that correct?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 422 Q. And Ms. O'Doherty went to the address, isn't that
- right?
- 17 A. Em, called to my home?
- 18 423 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. She did, yes.
- 20 424 Q. Yes. And she had a very brief conversation with the
- lady who answered the door, who turns out to be your
- 22 wife?
- 23 A. Correct.
- 24 425 Q. And she introduced herself as Gemma O'Doherty, isn't
- 25 that correct?
- 26 A. Correct, yes.
- 27 426 Q. She pointed out she was a journalist for the
- 28 Independent Newspapers?
- 29 A. So I understand, yes.

- And she said, 'is this the Commissioner's home?', isn't 1 427 Q.
- 2 that correct?
- 3 Yes, so I believe, yes. Α.
- 428 And your wife responded that it was indeed your home 4 0.
- 5 but that you were away?
 - 14:53

14:54

14:54

14.54

- 6 Correct. Α.
- And that was that. Nothing further was said? 7 429 Q.
- 8 I don't believe so, Chairman. Α.
- 9 430 So why did that get you so angry? Q.
- well, the journalist called to my home late in the 10 Α.
- 11 evening and at a time when I was away and I felt that
- these were matters that would have been dealt with 12
- 13 properly in the Garda Press Office, which is open from
- 14 seven in the morning until eleven at night, and I felt
- 15 that that was the appropriate way of conducting her
- 16 business rather than calling to my home. This is most
- 17 unusual, most unusual.
- 18 Are you saying to me that in relation to your personal 431 Q.
- 19 affairs, that a journalist should contact the Garda
- 20 Press Office in relation to your personal affairs?
- Well, I mean, she was legitimately making an inquiry 21 Α.
- 22 about Martin Callinan, at that time the Garda
- 23 Commissioner, so of course it was legitimate for her to
- 24 make that inquiry.
- 25 I'm asking in relation to your personal affairs? 432 Q.
- well --26 Α.
- 27 433 Are you saying that the appropriate thing to do in Q.
- respect of your driving of your personal car is to make 28
- inquiries through the Garda Press Office? 29

1	Α.	Well, I think the point that's being made here is that
2		it is Martin Callinan, the Garda Commissioner, that
3		she's inquiring about, not any other Martin Callinan,
4		and therefore

- Are you saying that if Gemma O'Doherty rang the Garda
 Press Office and asked for the address of either Martin
 Callinan, the Garda Commissioner, or the current acting
 Garda Commissioner, that the Garda Press Office would
 be instructed to give that out to a journalist?
- 10 A. It's highly unlikely. But what she would certainly be 14:55
 11 entitled to do was to make the inquiry as to whether or 12 not I had been issued with a penalty points fixed 13 charge notice back in 2007, some six years, or whatever 14 it was, earlier. She'd certainly be entitled to make 15 that inquiry. 14:55
- 16 435 Q. And who in the Garda Press Office would know that? Was
 17 that a matter which was in the knowledge of people in
 18 the Garda Press Office?
- A. Well, I'm sure that would be -- well, it could have been examined on the Pulse system if she had the information.

- 22 436 Q. And would they reveal it?
- A. Well, I'm quite sure they would, yes. I'm sure it would have been --
- 25 437 Q. Would that not have been a breach of the data 26 protection that the whistleblowers have all engaged 27 in --
- 28 A. You see --
- 29 438 Q. -- feeding Pulse entries to the press?

- 1 Well, you see it brings into question why Ms. O'Doherty Α. 2 had my Pulse -- or the Pulse record in the first 3 instance, but, going beyond that, I am a public official and she was entitled to make that inquiry. 4 5 439 All she asked your wife was was that your home and then 14:56 Q. 6 she left, isn't that correct? 7 As I understand it, yes. Α. 8 440 And it was approximately 8:30/9:00 in the evening? Q. 9 I thought it was later, but maybe you're correct. Α. Her recollection is that she went out for dinner with 10 441 Ο. 14:56 11 her husband afterwards, so -- on the other side of 12 town, so that was the time that she puts it at. 13 I don't know whether that is correct or not. Α. 14 442 0. So did you contact Ms. O'Doherty to complain about 15 this? 14:57 16 No, no. Α. 17 443 Why not? Q. 18 I spoke to the Press Officer. Α. 19 444 well, did you ask him to contact Ms. O'Doherty to Q. 20 complain about it? 14:57
- 21 A. No, I asked him to contact the newspaper and to
- indicate that the correct approach would be to address

- her concerns, if she had any, to the Press Office.
- 24 445 Q. And is that all?
- 25 A. That was it.
- 26 446 Q. All? Nothing else said? You didn't express your
- 27 disapproval?
- 28 A. Oh, I absolutely did, yes, of course I did.
- 29 447 Q. Anger?

- 1 A. Well, I wasn't pleased.
- 2 448 Q. Upset?
- 3 A. Yes, certainly.
- 4 449 Q. And you asked Mr. Taylor to make that call. Now,
- 5 Ms. O'Doherty had been in contact with your office on a 14:57
- 6 regular basis at that stage by both email and had
- 7 attempted to contact by phone in relation to cases that
- 8 she had been investigating, isn't that correct? There
- 9 was a number of matters which would have been -- she
- 10 would have cc'd you on many emails around that time in

14:58

- relation to matters that she was investigating,
- 12 unrelated to these issues?
- 13 A. I'm sure that is correct, yes.
- 14 450 Q. And you didn't think to send an email to Ms. O'Doherty
- saying 'next time you have a query like that, why don't 14:58
- you just email me and ask?'?
- 17 A. No, I did not. I contacted the Press Officer who deals
- with the press and I asked him to make known my views,
- that I didn't think this was the appropriate manner in
- 20 which to conduct that type of inquiry, calling to my
- 21 home.
- 22 451 Q. And that is all you asked?
- 23 A. I have already said that that is the position, yes.
- 24 452 Q. Okay. So how did Assistant Commissioner Twomey end up
- being at a meeting to which two editors of Independent
- News and Media were summonsed?
- 27 A. Presumably -- Assistant Commissioner Twomey at that
- time was in charge of the city, and part of that
- responsibility would be security around my home, and

1			I'm sure it was in that context, but I don't have that	
2			detail.	
3	453	Q.	Well, surely you should have that detail?	
4		Α.	Why?	
5	454	Q.	Well, I'm assuming that directions are not given by	14:59
6			Superintendent Taylor to Assistant Commissioner Twomey	
7			to attend meetings with editors of newspapers?	
8		Α.	Well, I don't know what the particular arrangements for	
9			that meeting were. I just don't have that detail.	
10	455	Q.	Did you know that meeting was happening?	14:59
11		Α.	No. I read about it in the papers that were delivered	
12			to me.	
13	456	Q.	So how did Assistant Commissioner Twomey end up there?	
14		Α.	I don't have that detail. I don't know who arranged	
15			the meeting.	14:59
16	457	Q.	You don't know who arranged the meeting?	
17		Α.	No.	
18	458	Q.	So you just said to Mr. Taylor that he was to contact	
19			the editor of Independent News and ask that the	
20			journalist not come to your address again, and that's	14:59
21			all?	
22		Α.	I'd asked the superintendent to make contact with the	
23			newspaper and inform them that if there was queries of	
24			that nature, that they should be addressed to the Press	
25			Office, the Press Office opening early in the morning,	15:00
26			closing late at night, and if there were queries to be	
27			raised, to either raise them by phone or email, and	
28			that that was the appropriate manner in which to	
29			address those matters.	

- 1 459 Q. What queries were you talking about?
- 2 A. Pardon me?
- 3 460 Q. What queries were you talking about?
- 4 A. Any queries.
- 5 461 Q. No, you said 'queries of that nature', so what queries

15:00

15:01

15:01

- 6 were you talking about? Was it about your address or
- 7 about the question of the fixed penalty notice?
- 8 A. Any queries, any queries.
- 9 462 Q. Do you recall whether it was about the address or about the fixed penalty notice?
- 11 A. Well, I think it was about both.
- 12 463 Q. So who told you it was about a fixed penalty notice?
- 13 Who told you that the story that Ms. O'Doherty was
- researching was about a fixed penalty notice?
- 15 A. I didn't know at that particular point. I know that
- she was calling to verify the address, and that's as
- much as I knew. So I'd indicated the correct procedure
- for dealing with those issues; that if there were
- 19 queries, that she should go to the Press Office and
- 20 deal with them. That's as much as --
- 21 464 Q. The address of the Garda Commissioner isn't a news
- story, so did you -- surely you enquired as to what the
- 23 news story was?
- A. No, I simply asked the superintendent to contact the
- 25 newspaper and indicate to them that if there are any
- queries from any journalist in relation to me or
- anybody else, the appropriate fashion is to address
- those issues with the Garda Press Office, which is open
- from early in the morning to late at night, that that

- is the standard operating procedure and that is the understanding with the media, that that's the way
- business is conducted.
- 4 465 Q. I see.
- 5 A. That is what I was asking.
- 6 466 Q. What did you understand Ms. O'Doherty's story to be
 7 about when you gave that instruction to Mr. Taylor, or
 8 Superintendent Taylor?

- 9 A. I don't know, I don't know. I didn't know at the time.
- 10 467 Q. So how can it be a legitimate query simply to ask, is this the Garda Commissioner's address? That can't be a story. They can't go around publishing your address as the front-page story, can they?
- 14 A. I can only tell you what I did. I don't really have 15 the detail that you're asking me about, and didn't have 15:02 16 it at that particular time.
- 17 468 Q. You understand that Ms. O'Doherty was effectively
 18 rained down on like a ton of bricks by editorial staff
 19 in Independent News and Media?
- 20 A. I have read that in the correspondence I received from 15:02 21 the Tribunal, yes.
- 22 469 Q. And that she was told that she had ruined things, that 23 she was a rogue journalist, there had been suggestions 24 made by you as to her bona fides, she'd been told all 25 of this. Are you aware of that?
- 26 A. I've read that in the correspondence, yes.
- 27 470 Q. I'm just wondering how editorial staff in Independent
 28 News and Media might have come up with that particular
 29 version of events on the basis of your -- if there's to

1			be any further queries as to where the Commissioner	
2			resides, they should be directed through the Garda	
3			Press Office?	
4		Α.	I don't know that.	
5	471	Q.	Right. And if there are any further queries as to	15:03
6			where the Commissioner resides, they should be	
7			addressed to the Garda Press Office, also required the	
8			attendance of an assistant commissioner at a meeting	
9			with two editorial staff of Independent News and Media?	
10		Α.	Yes. Is there a question?	15:03
11	472	Q.	I'm just saying, is that what you are saying? That	
12			that simple issue that you had, which was nothing more	
13			than it should be directed through the Press Office,	
14			required two editorial staff of Independent News and	
15			Media to travel across town, to Harcourt Square, to	15:04
16			attend a meeting with Superintendent Taylor and	
17			Assistant Commissioner Twomey, is that what you are	
18			saying?	
19		Α.	Well, as I say, I don't know the detail and didn't have	
20			the detail of the arrangements for that meeting so I	15:04
21			can't answer that question for you.	
22	473	Q.	When did you ask what the story was about?	
23		Α.	I don't know when I heard about it. It was some time	
24			subsequent to it. I don't have a particular date.	
25	474	Q.	Some time subsequent about it. So Superintendent	15:04
26			Taylor has been directed to contact staff, editorial	
27			staff. Some days later there's a meeting with two	
28			editorial staff, assistant commissioner and	
29			Superintendent Taylor, and none of you asked what the	

- 1 story was about?
- 2 A. I'm sure, and maybe it wasn't, I don't know, I mean
- this is several years ago, I just didn't involve myself

15:05

15:05

- 4 in any of that, so it may well have been discussed at
- 5 that meeting, what she was trying to establish. I
- 6 don't know.
- 7 475 Q. And was there any input or direction? When was that
- 8 put back to you? When were you told that?
- 9 A. Well, I didn't recall it until I saw it in the
- documentation, but I couldn't say that perhaps somebody 15:05
- did indicate to me at the time, I just don't know. I
- just can't recall that.
- 13 476 Q. Are there other stories about penalty points notices
- 14 being cancelled on your behalf?
- 15 A. Certainly not, no. That's the one -- that's --
- 16 477 Q. Why don't you remember the specifics of this one?
- 17 A. Pardon me?
- 18 478 Q. I'm just wondering why you don't remember the specifics
- of this one?
- 20 A. Well, I don't recall who arranged the meeting, that's
- all I can say to you, and I don't recall what was said,
- I don't recall any of that.
- 23 479 Q. Did you get a report back?
- 24 A. I don't recall that I did. If I did, it would be a
- 25 matter of record up in Headquarters and I'm sure it
- could be made available at pretty short notice.
- 27 480 Q. Do you know did that come from Assistant Commissioner
- Twomey or Superintendent Taylor?
- 29 A. Which?

- 1 481 Q. The report back?
- 2 A. I don't know, I just don't know whether it was reported
- 3 back. I just don't know at this stage. But if it was,
- 4 there should be a report on it.
- 5 482 Q. Ms. O'Doherty is of the view, having followed all of

15:06

15:07

15:07

- 6 these stories, that the animosity towards Sergeant
- 7 McCabe increased following the publication of that
- 8 story?
- 9 CHAIRMAN: Have you a date of publication for me,
- Mr. Harty, if you wouldn't mind, please?
- 11 MR. HARTY: 19th April 2013.
- 12 483 Q. Ms. O'Doherty is of the view that animosity towards
- 13 Sergeant McCabe increased following that, isn't that
- 14 correct?
- 15 A. That's what I read in the correspondence, yes.
- 16 484 Q. And certainly it is a situation, you will accept, that
- 17 the penalty points arguments or debacle had become
- 18 personal following the publication of that article,
- isn't that correct?
- 20 A. No, that is not true. Absolutely not true.
- 21 485 Q. Well, for the first time it's directly related to you,
- isn't that correct?
- 23 A. In relation to the query and the story that
- Ms. O'Doherty had, that relates to me, yes.
- 25 486 Q. So it's personal at that stage?
- A. Well, it involves me personally, yes.
- 27 487 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. But I didn't take it personal against Sergeant McCabe
- 29 to start some sort of vendetta, which is what is

Т		suggested in the correspondence that I have seen. That	
2		is not true.	
3	488 Q.	But it did at this point become personal to you, the	
4		issue of the fixed penalty points debacle. It became	
5		about you. The story became more about you than it	15:08
6		ever had before, isn't that correct?	
7	Α.	Well, Ms. O'Doherty had a story in relation to a fixed	
8		charge notice that was cancelled on my behalf,	
9		that's	
10		CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, it is just in terms of the	15:08
11		chronology, Mr. Harty, I mean, okay, April 2013, it's	
12		the 19th April 2013	
13		MR. HARTY: Yes.	
14		CHAIRMAN: this story about Commissioner Callinan	
15		having a fixed charge penalty notice published. On the	15:08
16		15th May, Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony reported that	
17		there was no evidence of crime, corruption, deception	
18		or falsification in relation to the Pulse matter. On	
19		the 6th August, Ms. D returned to counselling with	
20		Rian. On the 6th August, similarly, the discipline	15:09
21		proceedings against Maurice McCabe were terminated in	
22		the case of the Molloy computer. And that's what is	
23		happening at that time. I mean, where is the evidence	
24		of a sudden escalation of ire or disapproval against	
25		Sergeant McCabe? It would seem to be the opposite.	15:09
26		And I have no evidence to suggest that, vis-à-vis	
27		Ms. D, that anyone in Garda Headquarters is controlling	
28		that. I don't mean perhaps visits to her house, but	
29		certainly anything in relation to whether she makes a	

1 choice to go back to counselling with Rian or not. 2 The situation is that I'm mindful of the Tribunal's direction in relation to matters being put 3 to witnesses without answer, and that is certainly what 4 5 is contained in Ms. O'Doherty's statement before the 15:09 Tribunal, and I felt it was important that it be put to 6 7 the Commissioner in relation to her view in relation to it, and it is expressed simply as a view in her 8 9 statement. Well, it is a view, yes. But is there 10 CHAI RMAN: 15:10 11 anything to back it up? 12 I don't have anything before me, any 13 specific item before me now. 14 CHAI RMAN: All right. If you wanted to mention 15 anything, such as the particular points that I've 15:10 16 mentioned --17 MR. HARTY: Yes. No, there are no specific matters 18 which I feel require -- is necessary for me to put. 19 CHAI RMAN: Yes. 20 Mr. Callinan, did you speak to any other 489 MR. HARTY: Q. 15:10 editors in Independent News and Media or did you have 21 22 any communication with any other editors in Independent News and Media in relation to this article? 23 24 Not that I recall. Α. In relation to the amended version of the article which 15:10 25 490 0. was published, how did that come about? There was an 26 27 altered version of the article from the version that originally -- was Superintendent Taylor briefed in 28 relation to the circumstances in which the fixed 29

Т			penalty notice was issued?	
2		Α.	I'm sure he would have been aware, yes.	
3	491	Q.	By whom?	
4		Α.	I presume I would have made him aware. But as I say, I	
5			don't recall these details you're asking me about at	15:11
6			this remove.	
7			MR. HARTY: All right. Thank you very much,	
8			Mr. Callinan.	
9			MR. GORDON: There is one matter, just before Mr. Harty	
10			leaves the room, Chairman, that I've been instructed to	15:11
11			bring to the Tribunal's attention. Mr. Harty, while	
12			he's in the room	
13			CHAIRMAN: Did you say he's leaving the room? Sorry?	
14			MR. GORDON: I'm just saying that if he does leave the	
15			room.	15:11
16			CHAIRMAN: Oh, sorry, he may be leaving the room.	
17			MR. GORDON: My client has just asked me to bring to	
18			your attention, Judge, that Mr. Harty has examined the	
19			witness in relation to	
20			CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, Mr. Gordon, I'm just finding it	15:11
21			very hard to hear you. Thank you.	
22			MR. GORDON: I beg your pardon, Judge. Mr. Harty has	
23			examined this witness from a point where a document was	
24			shown on the screen up to a suggestion that there was	
25			some escalation in an animus towards my client, Maurice	15:11
26			McCabe. The source of that particular document on the	
27			screen has never been revealed and my client has given	
28			specific instructions a moment ago to say that it was	
29			not him, and I just wanted to point that out while	

1		Mr. Harty is still in the room, if he wants to say	
2		something about that.	
3		CHAIRMAN: well, that is one aspect. And then I	
4		suppose it could have been assumed that the source of	
5		it was did you assume the source was Sergeant	15:12
6		McCabe?	
7	Α.	It's a possibility, but I don't know.	
8		CHAIRMAN: well, I mean	
9	Α.	I don't know, Chairman.	
10		CHAIRMAN: As a criminal detective, it might have gone	15:12
11		through your mind, if you were looking for suspects he	
12		would have been one of them, I suppose	
13	Α.	I would think so, Chairman. I think that would be	
14		fairly logical.	
15		CHAIRMAN: I'm certainly not saying that he was the	15:12
16		source of that. But can I just see the thing, would	
17		you mind opening it? Is there anything else apart from	
18		that?	
19		MR. GORDON: No.	
20		MR. HARTY: No.	15:12
21	Α.	But it is the case, Chairman, just to mention, this	
22		particular document was outside the set of complaints	
23		that the Assistant Commissioner John O'Mahony was	
24		dealing with. That timescale was from the 1st January	
25		2009 to June of '12, and this is two years earlier.	15:13
26		Wherever the journalist got her hands on it, I don't	
27		know, but it's certainly outside that time-line.	
28		CHAIRMAN: Yes. I mean, it says you have a Renault, a	
29		particular kind of Renault.	

1	Α.	Yes.	
2		CHAIRMAN: I beg your pardon for just one second. And	
3		it gives an insurance expiry date for January 2008 and	
4		the incident is supposed to have happened on the 9th	
5		July 2007, somewhere around about the North Circular	15:14
6		Road kind of area, and then it claims that the purchase	
7		date for your car is the 15th May 2008, which seems to	
8		be looking into the future. That's what it says	
9		anyway.	
10	Α.	I've no idea, Chairman. No, I can't make out any	15:14
11		detail whatsoever here.	
12		CHAIRMAN: When you put in like somebody's registration	
13		number, and I'm not going to read it out even if it is	
14		there, I can't see it - yes, it is there, but it's	
15		blanked out on this one, does all of this stuff get	15:14
16		generated automatically?	
17	Α.	It should do, Chairman.	
18		CHAIRMAN: Yes, like, what is the date of expiry of the	
19		insurance?	
20	Α.	Yes.	15:14
21		CHAIRMAN: Where do you live? When did you buy your	
22		car? Well, that is clearly wrong because they could	
23		hardly be predicting you are going to buy your car into	
24		the future.	
25	Α.	No, I agree, Chairman, yeah.	15:15
26		CHAIRMAN: Yes. And then you may have reason to use	
27		your own car, but, at Commissioner level, your car	
28		isn't is it registered as an official vehicle, I	
29		don't know, for expenses purpose, or anything like	

1		that?	
2	Α.	No, no, it's not Chairman, no.	
3		CHAIRMAN: And would you have a car as a commissioner?	
4	Α.	Well, you could get a car from the pool, certainly,	
5		Chairman, yes.	15:15
6		CHAIRMAN: So if you wanted to be driven some place in	
7		particular?	
8	Α.	Exactly, yes.	
9		CHAIRMAN: But you don't have a I mean, the	
10		commissioner has a dedicated driver?	15:15
11	Α.	Exactly, Chairman. On this occasion it wouldn't be	
12		suitable to get an official car for the particular	
13		matter I was dealing with.	
14		CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry to interrupt people now. I	
15		thought there was a theory that gardaí are always on	15:15
16		duty?	
17	Α.	Well, I suppose you could technically say that. I	
18		suppose the obvious answer, or an answer to your	
19		question, Chairman, would be that if a garda who is off	
20		duty and spotted something, there'd be an expectation	15:16
21		that he or she would react if it was something that was	
22		happening unlawfully, and indeed it has been the case	
23		on time out of number, particularly in rural areas,	
24		where members of An Garda Síochána have used their own	
25		vehicles to deal with matters that they saw happening	15:16
26		before them.	
27		CHAIRMAN: Yes. But I think everybody knows that the	
28		road traffic general bylaws states that it does not	
29		apply to the gardaí who are acting in the course of	

1			duty, isn't that	
2		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: All right. Okay. Thanks. Sorry, was there	
4			any further questions from anybody?	
5			MR. HARTY: I am finished.	15:16
6			CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harty, you're finished.	
7			MR. HARTY: Thank you, Mr. Callinan.	
8		Α.	Thank you.	
9				
10			MR. CALLINAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. FREEMAN:	15:16
11				
12	492	Q.	MR. FREEMAN: Yes, Mr. Callinan, I am John Freeman. I	
13			appear for Independent News and Media. I've just two	
14			very net matters to put to you, Mr. Callinan. We just	
15			might have the transcript for Day 77 up, please, and	15:17
16			this is Superintendent Taylor was under examination by	
17			counsel for Ms. O'Doherty, and it's at page 67. Just	
18			while we wait for that to come up, Superintendent	
19			Taylor was dealing with the events following the visit	
20			to your home by Ms. O'Doherty on the 11th April 2013,	15:17
21			or on the night of the 11th April 2013, and I don't	
22			know is that	
23			CHAIRMAN: It just takes a minute. There it is coming	
24			now.	
25			MR. FREEMAN: That was page 67, Mr. Kavanagh.	15:17
26	493	Q.	Yes, I think that should be on screen now,	
27			Mr. Callinan. So this is Superintendent Taylor being	
28			questioned by Mr. Berry for Ms. O'Doherty, and he is	
29			dealing with Superintendent Taylor's communication with	

1			Independent News and Media on foot of an instruction	
2			from yourself, and he indicates that he made phone	
3			contact. And then at question 264,	
4			Superintendent Taylor is asked if he wrote on your	
5			behalf to Independent News and Media. And I think, in	15:18
6			fairness, Superintendent Taylor wasn't sure, but he	
7			thinks there may have been a letter to Independent News	
8			and Media and that you may have dealt with that through	
9			your legal advisers, but, in fairness to him, he's not	
10			sure, I think. I just want to put to you that my	15:18
11			instructions are that no such letter was received by	
12			Independent News and Media relating to this incident	
13			either from yourself or from solicitors on your behalf?	
14		Α.	I would think that is the case, but I simply don't know	
15			at this remove. I would accept what you are saying is	15:19
16			correct, but I can't recall.	
17	494	Q.	So that deals with the form of the communication. And	
18			just very briefly on the substance of the communication	
19			between Superintendent Taylor, on your instruction, and	
20			Independent News and Media, and if we might just have	15:19
21			up page 3670 of Volume 14 of the materials,	
22			Mr. Kavanagh. Yes, Mr. Callinan, this is a letter of	
23			the 31st July 2017 from solicitors for Ms. O'Doherty to	
24			the Tribunal, and just on the first paragraph on the	
25			page, "She" so that is Ms. O'Doherty:	15:19
26				
27			"She maintains that her wrongful dismissal was	
28			significantly contributed to by former Commissioner	
29			Callinan who had communicated his anger to Independent	

1			News and Media management about her modus operandi and	
2			her support for Sergeant McCabe and Garda John Wilson	
3			in their endeavours to reveal malpractice in the Garda	
4			Sí ochána. "	
5				15:20
6			Now, I don't think it was put to Superintendent Taylor	
7			that he was instructed to convey the latter part of	
8			that sentence, and my instructions, and I just want	
9			to	
10			CHAIRMAN: Maybe just it's a long sentence. Just	15:20
11			give us the last bit of the sentence, instructed to do	
12			what exactly?	
13			MR. FREEMAN: Yes, Chairman.	
14	495	Q.	So this is that you communicated your anger about her	
15			support for Sergeant McCabe and Garda John Wilson in	15:20
16			their endeavours to reveal malpractice in the Garda	
17			Síochána. And just what I am putting to you is that my	
18			instructions are that the meeting with Assistant	
19			Commissioner Twomey and Superintendent Taylor concerned	
20			the appropriateness or otherwise of an INM journalist	15:21
21			attending at the home of the Garda Commissioner and had	
22			nothing to do with your support or, sorry,	
23			Ms. O'Doherty's support, or perceived support, for	
24			Sergeant McCabe or Garda John Wilson?	
25		Α.	I would agree with that completely, Chairman.	15:21
26			MR. FREEMAN: Thank you, Mr. Callinan.	
27			CHAIRMAN: In other words, all you can say is you never	
28			gave instructions	
29		Α.	Correct.	

1		CHAIRMAN: to David Taylor, 'you're to go and give	
2		out buckets to Independent News and Media that a	
3		journalist is supporting Maurice McCabe'?	
4	Α.	Absolutely, Chairman.	
5		CHAIRMAN: All right. Okay. And, Mr. Freeman, is	15:21
6		there a denial that the editorial staff came down on	
7		Gemma O'Doherty like a ton of bricks and told her that	
8		she was a rogue journalist who had ruined everything?	
9		Is that accepted?	
10		MR. FREEMAN: An unequivocal denial, Chairman, and that	15:21
11		will be dealt with in detail.	
12		CHAIRMAN: All right. I don't know. Will it be dealt	
13		with in detail? Are we calling	
14		MR. FREEMAN: well, it is absolutely essential to a	
15		matter of credit.	15:22
16		CHAIRMAN: Issues as to credit are final, so that's the	
17		last I've heard of that, unless it's relevant to a term	
18		of reference. I mean, if you want to call somebody,	
19		please write a letter to the Tribunal. I mean, I don't	
20		know where this is going, Mr. Freeman. But I	15:22
21		appreciate it is perfectly proper to deal with that,	
22		and you've dealt with it, but am I to make a decision	
23		on it one way or the other? I don't think that I can.	
24		I think, again, it is a matter of credit.	
25		MR. FREEMAN: I gather Ms. O'Doherty, if she gives	15:22
26		evidence in accordance with her statement, that is the	
27		area she intends to cover, and insofar as editors or	
28		management at Independent News and Media are impugned	
29		or implicated then there may be issues arising	

1			Chairman.	
2			CHAIRMAN: All right. Well, let's see how it goes.	
3			MR. FREEMAN: May it please you.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
5				15:22
6			MR. CALLINAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. LEHANE:	
7				
8			MR. LEHANE: Mr. Chairman, Mr. Callinan, my name is	
9			Darren Lehane. I'm down here at the back on your	
10			right.	15:23
11		Α.	Thank you very much.	
12	496	Q.	I'm counsel for Deputy John McGuinness and I have a	
13			number of questions for you arising out of your various	
14			interactions with Deputy McGuinness. Now, Mr. Marrinan	
15			has covered a lot of this ground yesterday, so I'm	15:23
16			going to adopt his questions in relation to putting my	
17			client's statement and note of interview to you.	
18				
19			Mr. Callinan, I want to deal first with your	
20			relationship with Deputy McGuinness in the period prior	15:23
21			to the meeting of the PAC on the 23rd January 2014, if	
22			that is okay. Now, Deputy McGuinness has given	
23			evidence to the Tribunal that he had a good working	
24			relationship with you during his time as chairman of	
25			the PAC; would you agree with that evidence?	15:23
26		Α.	I think that would be fair, yes, Chairman, yes.	
27	497	Q.	And, Mr. Callinan, was there anything in Deputy	
28			McGuinness's attitude to you or anything you heard that	
29			would have led you to believe that he had a negative	

L	attitude	towards	you?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

A. Well, certainly in the context of Sergeant McCabe's appearance or proposed appearance before the Public Accounts Committee and particularly in the exchange of correspondence from November '13 onwards, I think it's safe to assume that we were locking horns in relation to whether or not the Public Accounts Committee had an entitlement to have possession of the Pulse documents.

15:24

15:24

- Mr. Callinan, I think we'd all agree that different 9 498 Q. parties can take different views on legal issues, and 10 11 data protection is unfortunately one of those issues 12 that people can have different views on, but aside from 13 that difference of view between you and your officials and Deputy McGuinness and the PAC in relation to data 14 15 protection issues, was there anything negative or was 16 there anything in his attitude towards you personally 17 which showed that he had a negative attitude to you 18 prior to your appearance at the PAC?
 - A. Well, I think up to that point, I think, Mr. Lehane, until we started to exchange documentation in relation to the matter, I don't believe there were any particular issues. You know, Deputy McGuinness is a very outspoken politician. He has been critical of An Garda Síochána in the past, but so were many other people. So I didn't have a particular issue or a particular problem or I wasn't aware of any particular issue in that context.
- 28 499 Q. Thank you, Mr. Callinan. I now want to turn to the 29 events leading up to the meeting of the PAC on the 23rd

Т			January 2014. Now, we know from the documentation and	
2			the evidence to date that the motivation of the	
3			whistleblowers and the 2006 allegation of sexual	
4			assault had been referenced during meetings that senior	
5			gardaí had in the run-up to that hearing, isn't that	15:26
6			right?	
7		Α.	Well, there is a reference in two of the notes that I	
8			saw to 2006, yes.	
9	500	Q.	And we know that you were very keen that Sergeant	
10			McCabe should not give evidence to the PAC and that any	15:26
11			documentation that had been provided by whistleblowers	
12			to the PAC should be returned to the gardaí, isn't that	
13			correct?	
14		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
15	501	Q.	And you've referred to the extensive exchange of	15:26
16			correspondence between your office and the PAC, and	
17			it's been opened to this Tribunal on a number of	
18			occasions so I'm not going to open it again; suffice to	
19			say that you agree with me that there had been a	
20			hardening of views between the two sides?	15:26
21		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
22	502	Q.	Now, we know on the morning of the 23rd January, just	
23			before the start of the hearing, you had an interaction	
24			with Deputy John Deasy, and that Deputy Deasy maintains	
25			that you told him that Maurice McCabe was not to be	15:27
26			believed or trusted. Now, you deny saying that, isn't	
27			that right?	
28		Α.	That's absolutely the case, Chairman.	
29	503	Q.	Now, why do you think that Deputy Deasy would make that	

1 up?

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

2 I've no idea, Chairman. I mean, we've been through Α. 3 this ground before. I'm very clear in what I said to the deputy. I said -- I cautioned on the need to be 4 5 aware of the information being imparted and that not 6 all of the allegations made by Sergeant McCabe turned 7 out to be correct. Some of them turned out to be 8 questionable, in that they were subsequently proved to be incorrect, and that the O'Mahony investigation file 9 was there in front of the Committee which they had at 10 11 the time.

15:27

15:27

15:28

12 504 Q. Now, the reason I'm asking you about this again today
13 is that yesterday and this morning you appeared to
14 suggest that Deputy McGuinness might have had something
15 to do with the fact that Deputy Deasy is giving this
16 evidence to the Tribunal?

A. Well, I don't know if that is the case or not, but I think it is the situation when Deputy Deasy was asked by the Tribunal investigators if he had spoken to any other member of the Committee, he indicated that he thought about six months earlier he had a conversation with Deputy McGuinness, and the character of that conversation seemed to be tallying with what I had said to him on the morning of the Public Accounts Committee meeting, except that it didn't, because we know that Mr. McGuinness has gone further now and he started speaking about very serious sexual allegations that I claimed were against Sergeant McCabe.

29 505 Q. Well, if we can just stick with Deputy Deasy. Are you

1			suggesting as a possibility to the Tribunal that	
2			Mr. McGuinness somehow contaminated Deputy McGuinness?	
3		Α.	No, I'm simply drawing attention to the material that I	
4			saw in front of me. I can't go any further.	
5	506	Q.	Well, I'm going to have to take issue with you on that,	15:29
6			Mr. Callinan, because	
7		Α.	That's fine.	
8	507	Q.	your evidence yesterday is that, on the one hand,	
9			you accept that Deputy McGuinness and Deputy Deasy	
10			acted independently, you said that, and you also said	15:29
11			that you had no evidence to suggest that they did not	
12			act independently, isn't that right?	
13		Α.	Well, I'm saying that each of the interactions that I	
14			had with the parties were independent of one another.	
15	508	Q.	Well, in any case, the Chairman has the evidence of	15:29
16			Mr. Deasy and your evidence and he can draw his own	
17			conclusions. But we know that after your exchange with	
18			Deputy Deasy, you had a further interaction with the	
19			Comptroller & Auditor General, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	15:29
21	509	Q.	And you've accepted that there is a complete divergence	
22			between your evidence as to what transpired in that	
23			conversation and Mr. McCarthy's, isn't that right?	
24		Α.	Insofar as Mr. McCarthy is stating that I had indicated	
25			that there were sexual offences against him, and my	15:30
26			position is, I was never aware of any other	
27			allegations, let alone sexual offences, against him at	
28			all, and that is my position.	
29	510	Q.	Now, the reason I am asking you again about this today	

1	is that yesterday you were asked by Mr. Marrinan
2	whether there was any link that you could establish
3	between Deputy Deasy, Deputy McGuinness and the
4	Comptroller & Auditor General, and you gave evidence to
5	the Tribunal that, and this is on page 48, line 5, I
6	will just read it to you, which is probably quicker:
7	
8	"Q. With very much opposing views as to whether or not
9	Sergeant McCabe would give evidence, but I'm talking
10	about, can you establish any link between any of these 15:3
11	i ndi vi dual s?"
12	
13	Answer, and this is you:
14	
15	"Well, I mean, there is a certain amount of commonality 15:3
16	in relation to the business that they are doing on a
17	very regular basis down at the Public Accounts
18	Committee and they interact with one another. I mean,
19	it would be nonsensical to suggest, for instance, that
20	there wasn't some form of discussion about Sergeant 15:3
21	McCabe appearing before the Public Accounts Committee.
22	So that level of discussion at least had to go on.
23	Beyond that, I don't know what was spoken about and I
24	cannot make any allegations against the individuals you
25	have spoken about. All I can do is give you an account 15:3
26	of the conversations and the interactions that I had
27	with those individuals. That is as far as I can go."

Now, just in relation to that, you're not suggesting to

28

29

Т			the Tribunal, are you, that Mr. McGuinness in some way	
2			contaminated Mr. McCarthy's evidence to the Tribunal,	
3			are you?	
4		Α.	No, I'm not saying that, Chairman.	
5	511	Q.	Now, if I can move on to the actual PAC hearing itself.	15:31
6			I mean, it's clear from the transcript that it was a	
7			fairly robust meeting; I think you'd agree with that?	
8		Α.	well, the nature of those hearings are such.	
9	512	Q.	They're designed to be robust?	
10		Α.	They are.	15:32
11	513	Q.	Now, Deputy McGuinness has given to the Tribunal that,	
12			in his view, you were angry and frustrated during the	
13			hearing; would you agree with that assessment?	
14		Α.	Not at all. Why would I be angry and frustrated? I	
15			mean, I was there for a long period of time and we were	15:32
16			answering questions from a number of politicians, and	
17			it was challenging in its own right, but, you know,	
18			that's the nature of the business.	
19	514	Q.	Yes. And yesterday, in fairness to you, at page 151,	
20			lines 8 to 9, you said that you had "strong feelings"	15:32
21			during the course of the hearing, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	About?	
23	515	Q.	About the questioning and the actions of the various	
24			individuals you were being asked about, leading up to	
25			your use of the word 'disgusting'?	15:32
26		Α.	Strong feelings about the manner in which the	
27			whistleblowers were bringing dealing with the	
28			allegations. It was the manner in which they were	
29			dealing with them that I had the issue, and that was	

1			the only issue. I think that is what I had said.	
2	516	Q.	And would you agree with me that those strong feelings,	
3			they wouldn't be on the happy end of the spectrum of	
4			feelings; they'd be on the rather unhappy end of the	
5			spectrum?	15:33
6		Α.	well, that is absolutely the case, Chairman.	
7	517	Q.	Now, after the hearing you agree that Deputy McGuinness	
8			came down from his podium and walked towards you, as	
9			was his normal practice?	
10		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	15:33
11	518	Q.	And after that there is a total divergence between your	
12			account and Deputy McGuinness's account in relation to	
13			what happened, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	Absolutely, Chairman.	
15	519	Q.	Now, Mr. Marrinan put to you at length yesterday what	15:33
16			Mr. McGuinness says. But the first aspect I want to	
17			ask you about is: Mr. McGuinness says, or has said,	
18			that you launched into this famous story about John	
19			Wilson and the horse, and you deny telling that story,	
20			don't you?	15:33
21		Α.	well, the first time I heard about that was subsequent	
22			to my making my statement and indicating to	
23			Mr. McGuinness I asked the question, are you going	
24			to call former Garda John Wilson? And his response	
25			was	15:34
26			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I thought you were going to say, are	
27			you going to call the horse? But in any event.	
28		Α.	So that was my first	
29			MR. LEHANE: Yes.	

- 1 A. That was the first time I heard mention of the horse 2 story. Certainly, it wasn't mentioned previously.
- 3 520 Q. And you, in your evidence, have attributed the nickname
- John 'Jockey' Wilson to the fact that there is a darts
- player who looked nothing like John Wilson and his only 15:34

15:35

- 6 similarity with John Wilson is that they shared the
- 7 same name?
- 8 A. Yes, that is correct.
- 9 CHAIRMAN: He was world darts champion in 1981, if I
- 10 remember correctly, and he had a great fondness for
- sweets, in consequence of which he had no teeth. I
- don't know if there was any resemblance with John
- 13 Wilson in that respect?
- 14 A. I think I'd better keep away from that one, Judge.
- 15 521 Q. MR. LEHANE: Now, I have to put it to you that you did, 15:35
- in fact, recount that story in front of John
- 17 McGuinness?
- 18 A. No, I did not, absolutely not.
- 19 522 Q. And that it is simply not credible to say to the
- Tribunal that you never heard that story before?
- 21 A. Well, that is my evidence, you know.
- 22 523 Q. And that your denial of any knowledge of the story is
- an attempt to distance yourself from the fact that you
- told the story in a particular context?
- 25 A. Chairman, I didn't know about the story. That's my
- position. I can't change that, I can't alter it. And
- 27 I'm not doing it for a particular reason. As I say --
- 28 524 Q. Sorry --
- 29 A. -- I was the person to mention former Garda John Wilson

1	to the chairman of the PAC in the first instance. I
2	was the person who brought it up.

3 525 Q. Can you offer any view to the Chairman, as a very
4 experienced policeman, former policeman, as to how
5 Deputy McGuinness would have heard the story of this
6 famous horse independently of you or a guard?

- 7 Well, to be fair, Mr. Lehane, you know, Mr. McGuinness Α. 8 is also a very experienced politician. He would have interaction with many, many gardaí over the years; in 9 fact, he has been critical on more than one occasion 10 15:36 11 about An Garda Síochána and how it did its business. 12 But leaving that aside, there could be any amount of 13 avenues in which Mr. McGuinness would have been aware 14 of that story.
- Now, your evidence is that Deputy McGuinness introduced this story to detract from the fact that you say he described whistleblower John Wilson as 'a fucking header', pardon my use of language, when you asked whether he was going to be called to give evidence to the Tribunal, isn't that right?
- A. I mean, that's not language that I would involve myself
 in. I don't get involved in that type of language, and
 particularly in the context of where we were and
 speaking with a politician. It's not in my nature to
 use that type of language, Chairman. It's as simple as 15:37
 that.
- 27 527 Q. Now, in the context of where you were, you were in a 28 situation where the Public Accounts Committee had 29 indicated it was going to call a whistleblower to give

1			evidence before it. There was a second whistleblower,	
2			John Wilson, on the scene. You have asked, according	
3			to your account, whether the second whistleblower, John	
4			Wilson, is going to be called to give evidence, and the	
5			chairman of the PAC has said no. Now, did you take a	15:37
6			note of what Deputy McGuinness said about Wilson?	
7		Α.	Well, I didn't think there was any need to take a note	
8			of what his reply was. It wasn't 'no'. It was 'you	
9			must be joking, he's an f-ing header'. That is what he	
10			said, and I can still remember it to this day.	15:37
11	528	Q.	Now, you didn't tell Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan, as	
12			she then was, about what Deputy McGuinness had said	
13			about Mr. Wilson, did you?	
14		Α.	No.	
15	529	Q.	You didn't tell anyone else, did you?	15:38
16		Α.	Well, I don't know. People were in the vicinity,	
17			Mr. Lehane, I don't know whether they may have picked	
18			up any portion of the short conversation we had. I	
19			just don't know.	
20	530	Q.	Why didn't you tell anyone?	15:38
21		Α.	Well, why would I? I wouldn't have a particular	
22			reason.	
23	531	Q.	But surely this would have been a ray of light in an	
24			otherwise dull day, that the chair of the PAC had a	
25			negative view of Mr. Wilson?	15:38
26		Α.	Well, I mean, that's a comment. I don't know. That's	
27			a comment. And it's not something that I even thought	
28			about.	
29	532	Q.	I have to put it to you that the fact that you didn't	

- take a note of Mr. McGuinness's comment or the fact
- that you didn't tell anyone about it is because it
- 3 simply didn't happen.
- 4 A. Well, that's not true, Chairman.
- 5 533 Q. And I have to put it to you that Deputy McGuinness most 15:38
- 6 certainly did not call John Wilson an f-ing header?
- 7 A. Well, that --
- 8 534 Q. Sorry.
- 9 A. Sorry, that's my evidence on oath, Chairman.
- 10 535 Q. And that you introduced this allegation into the mix
- simply to discredit John McGuinness, fully conscious of

15:39

- the fact that he had very damaging evidence to give
- about you at this Tribunal?
- 14 A. Well, as I said previously, Chairman, I was the one to
- introduce the question about former Garda John Wilson,
- I was the person to introduce it, not Mr. McGuinness.
- 17 It was only subsequent to me making my statement that
- we heard this story about the horse and what I am
- 19 supposed to have said.
- 20 536 Q. Now, turning to what Mr. McGuinness says you said about 15:39
- 21 Sergeant McCabe on the floor of the Committee.
- Mr. McGuinness has told the Tribunal that you said that
- 23 Mr. McCabe fiddles with kids, and you deny that?
- 24 A. That is correct, Chairman.
- 25 537 Q. And yesterday, and I want to be very fair to you on
- this point because perhaps I have taken you up wrong,
- but at page 37, line 15, of the transcript, you said
- that you had never heard the expression 'kiddie
- 29 fiddler' before, is that right?

- 1 A. Yes, Chairman.
- 2 538 Q. I have to put it to you that it is simply not credible
- 3 that you, as a former commissioner of An Garda
- 4 Síochána, would not have heard the expression 'kiddie

15:40

15:40

15:41

15 · 41

- fiddler'?
- 6 A. I wonder why that would be so. I have heard lots of
- 7 expletives of all variety, shapes and sizes, but that
- 8 is certainly something I am not familiar with, that
- 9 particular phrase.
- 10 539 Q. So I didn't take you up wrong. Your evidence to the
- 11 Tribunal is that you'd never, ever heard the expression
- 'kiddie fiddler' used in any context before?
- 13 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.
- 14 540 Q. Now, it's your evidence -- now, you've drawn attention
- to the fact that the difference between Superintendent
- 16 Taylor's account of what was said and Mr. McGuinness's
- and the distinction between 'fiddles with kids' and
- 18 'kiddie fiddler', isn't that right?
- 19 A. Well, there is a distinction, of course. They're
- 20 different words.
- 21 541 Q. Well, what is the difference between somebody who
- fiddles with kids and is a kiddie fiddler?
- 23 A. Well --
- 24 542 Q. They're the same thing.
- 25 A. They're different words, you know. If you and I are
- having a conversation and the Chairman overhears part
- of that conversation, you know, why would there be
- issues around the wording? I recall, I think, what
- Mr. McGuinness said in his original statement,

1			something to the effect that I had said, when he	
2			approached, this man fiddles with children, this is	
3			outrageous, or the other fella fiddles with children,	
4			this is outrageous, and then there's a kiddie fiddler	
5			expression as related by Superintendent Taylor.	15:42
6	543	Q.	Well, I have to put it to you, Mr. Callinan, I'm trying	
7			to put this as delicately as I can, but you'd want to	
8			be living under a rock, they're the same thing, a	
9			kiddie fiddler and a person who fiddles with kids. But	
10			in any case, your evidence is that you'd never heard	15:42
11			the expression 'kiddie fiddler' prior to the events	
12			that led to the establishment of this Tribunal?	
13		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
14	544	Q.	Can I now move on to the events in the car park. Now,	
15			it's common case that you asked for the meeting?	15:42
16		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
17	545	Q.	And your evidence is that the purpose of you asking for	
18			the meeting was to try and dissuade the Public Accounts	
19			Committee from calling Mr. McCabe and that you had	
20			various suggestions as to how the situation might be	15:42
21			dealt with as set out in draft correspondence, isn't	
22			that right?	
23		Α.	Yes. It was in response to something that the Chairman	
24			had mentioned towards the end of the meeting, the day	
25			before, that where issues arise between an employer and	15:42
26			employee, efforts would be made to try and resolve	
27			those matters, and I took that to be a suggestion that	
28			I should directly involve myself and try to resolve	
29			these issues. And that sorry	

- 1 546 Q. Sorry, Mr. Callinan. Go on.
- 2 A. And that is why I had the draft letter prepared.
- 3 547 Q. But you didn't bring the draft letters with you?
- 4 A. No, I didn't, no.
- 5 548 Q. And the draft letters have been opened, and I'll adopt, 15:43
- 6 with respect, Mr. Marrinan's questions in relation to
- 7 that.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 549 Q. But again, you chose the venue because it suited both
- of you?
- 11 A. Correct Chairman, yes. The Chairman had indicated to
- me that he was in a hurry back to Kilkenny, that he had

15 · 43

15:43

15 · 44

- a pressing appointment, and I said perhaps we could
- 14 meet somewhere on the outskirts of the city to
- facilitate that journey and to expedite his journey.
- And he had suggested -- he had asked me to suggest a
- 17 location, and what sprung to mind was Bewley's Hotel
- car park there, just beyond Newlands Cross, I thought
- that might be a convenient place to meet. After all,
- two or three minutes would have done my business. But
- 21 it turned out to be a little bit longer 15/20 minutes
- 22 perhaps.
- 23 550 Q. Now, it was always your intention that the meeting
- should take place in the car park, isn't that right?
- A. Well, it didn't matter particularly to me. I mean, if
- it's the case Mr. McGuinness had said plans have
- changed, I've managed to put back the meeting, or
- 28 whatever, I would have been quite prepared to go into
- the hotel and buy him a cup of tea, or whatever. I

1			would have had no difficulty with that whatsoever.	
2	551 Q) .	The only reason I ask, Mr. Callinan, is, when	
3			Mr. McGuinness was giving evidence, we had a there	
4			was a lengthy exchange in relation to the weather and	
5			it was raining and the Chairman referenced some	15:44
6			Japanese film in relation to moving at speed, I can't	
7			recall what it was, but in any case, you were always	
8			intent on having the meeting in the car in the car	
9			park?	
10			CHAIRMAN: All right. The weather. The director was	15:44
11			Kurosawa, who famously was noted by Spielberg as liking	
12			rain. Rain is in all of his films. I don't just mean	
13			rain, I mean torrential rain. That is what I was	
14			referring to. I am sorry if people are not as up to	
15			date on film as I am. Kurosawa is dead about twenty	15:45
16			years at this point. We have actually got a weather	
17			report, is that what you are going to start	
18			referencing?	
19			MR. LEHANE: Sorry, no, Chairman	
20			CHAIRMAN: Are you going to start referencing a weather	15:45
21			report?	
22			MR. LEHANE: No, Chairman	
23			CHAIRMAN: well, it wasn't raining on that day, except	
24			the odd bit of drizzle, just by the way, so Kurosawa is	
25			out of this equation.	15:45
26			MR. LEHANE: The only reason I raise it was, there was	
27			an exchange in relation to it and there were various	
28			questions put on the basis that they could have gone	
29			into the hotel to have a coffee but people were in a	

_			nuity. That was the evidence yesterday.	
2				
3			"It was confirmed to me by Mr. Callinan that it was	
4			always his intention to have a meeting in the car park	
5			I'm moving off it."	15:45
6			CHAIRMAN: well, the weather report, in any event,	
7			indicates a couple of millimetres of rain.	
8		Α.	Yes, Chairman, yes.	
9	552	Q.	MR. LEHANE: And again, Mr. Callinan, just returning to	
10			the meeting in the car park, there is a complete	15:45
11			divergence between you and Mr. McGuinness in relation	
12			to what was said during the course of that meeting,	
13			isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes. I mean, when I	
15			approached Mr. McGuinness's car, he had papers on the	15:46
16			front seat and he moved them into the back, so I took	
17			that to be an invitation to sit into the car and I sat	
18			into the car. If he had said, come on, let's go in for	
19			a cup of coffee, I have time, or whatever, I'd have	
20			been delighted.	15:46
21	553	Q.	No. And Mr. McGuinness doesn't dispute moving his	
22			documents from the front seat to the back seat of the	
23			car.	
24		Α.	Okay.	
25	554	Q.	That is the evidence he gave in relation to that. Now,	15:46
26			Deputy McGuinness's evidence has been put to you at	
27			least twice, I think, in relation to the content of the	
28			conversation that he says that he had with you, isn't	
29			that right?	

- 1 A. I accept that, Chairman, yes.
- 2 555 Q. Yeah. And it boils down to this: Simply that you said
- there were issues to do with Maurice McCabe and his
- 4 behaviour and that you said that Sergeant McCabe had
- sexually abused his family and an individual and that

15 · 47

15:47

- 6 you threatened him, isn't that, Mr. McGuinness's
- 7 evidence?
- 8 A. Yes. Well, I mean, that's a matter of record. If you
- 9 want me to go through it again, I can, no problem.
- 10 556 Q. No. And you say that that is false evidence that
- 11 Deputy McGuinness has given to this public inquiry?
- 12 A. Well, in relation to the very serious allegations made
- against me in the context of what I am alleged to have
- said about Sergeant McCabe, it is false, totally false.
- 15 557 Q. Now, you say in your evidence that it was Deputy
- 16 McGuinness who introduced the issues around Sergeant
- 17 McCabe, isn't that right?
- 18 A. That is correct, Chairman, yes.
- 19 558 Q. And you say that Deputy McGuinness asked the question,
- 20 why was it that Sergeant McCabe was raising all of
- 21 these issues and that he queried was it because of the
- file that went to the DPP, isn't that right?
- 23 A. That's correct, Chairman, yes.
- 24 559 Q. And you say you looked at him with some surprise and
- 25 that he said to you that he knew all about the criminal 15:48
- investigation underlying this allegation?
- 27 A. Correct, Chairman.
- 28 560 Q. And you say that you simply replied by saying to
- Mr. McGuinness, well, if you're aware of the file that

1			went to the DPP, you must be aware of the directions	
2			that issued on foot of it, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
4	561	Q.	Now, was that not a very significant intervention by	
5			the Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee just	15:4
6			before Sergeant McCabe was going to give evidence?	
7		Α.	well, it's factually correct. That's what happened,	
8			Chairman.	
9	562	Q.	No, but leaving aside the fact that you say that it is	
10			factually correct, which Mr. McGuinness obviously	15:4
11			disputes, do you not agree that it is fairly	
12			significant that the chairman of the PAC, when he's	
13			meeting you at your request to discuss these data	
14			protection issues and employment issues, if I can use	
15			that expression, has introduced this information into	15:4
16			the mix?	
17		Α.	well, you see, the precursor to that was, he asked the	
18			question why was it that Sergeant McCabe was raising	
19			all of these issues.	
20	563	Q.	I suppose, Mr. Callinan, and I don't want to be rude,	15:4
21			but would you answer the question. Would you agree	
22			that it's a significant intervention by the Chairman of	
23			the Public Accounts Committee to be introducing these	
24			issues?	

27 Why won't you answer my question, Mr. Callinan, as to 564 Q.

well, I mean, that's what happened. Significant or

15:49

whether it was a significant intervention or not? 28 29

Well, it was a significant intervention. Α.

otherwise, that is what happened.

25

26

Α.

- 1 565 Q. Okay. Thank you. Did you take a note of this significant intervention?
- 3 A. No.

18

- 4 566 Q. Sorry, Mr. Callinan, I didn't catch that? No?
- 5 A. No, I did not, Chairman, no.
- 6 567 Q. Did you tell anybody else about this significant
 7 intervention?
- 8 A. I don't believe so, Chairman, no.
- 9 568 Q. Not even Mr. Brian Purcell, who knew about the fact

 10 that you were going to the meeting and inquired how you 15:50

 11 got on?

15:49

15:50

15:50

- 12 A. I believe I spoke to him in the context -- he knew what
 13 I was doing, putting the proposals of the letters to
 14 Mr. McGuinness.
- 15 569 Q. But you didn't tell him that there had been this

 16 significant intervention where the chairman of the PAC

 17 had asked, well, is all of this about this old
- 19 A. I don't believe that was -- this was something that
 20 came and went very, very quickly. There was no long
 21 discussion on it. Mr. McGuinness has already
- indicated, I think, on a number of occasions, and indeed it's in his statements, that he was aware of these allegations, so there was nothing new in what was
- 25 mentioned here.

allegation?

26 570 Q. I have to put it to you that the fact that you didn't
27 take a note of this significant intervention or tell
28 anybody else about the significant intervention is
29 because it simply didn't happen?

1	Α.	No, no, it certainly did happen, Chairman. And it
2		happened in the context and in the manner and the
3		detail in which I have described, and it is the case
4		that Deputy McGuinness then went on to describe further
5		what happened on the occasion. But it was a very brief 15:5
6		reference on the meeting we had on the 24th January, it
7		was a very, very brief reference to the fact that he
8		was aware that Sergeant McCabe had been the subject of
9		a criminal investigation.

- 10 571 Q. I have to put it to you that you asked for the meeting 15:51

 11 in the car park with Deputy McGuinness because all of
 12 your previous efforts to stop Sergeant McCabe from
 13 giving evidence had failed?
- A. That is absolutely correct, Chairman. That is
 precisely why I was there, to try and see if the
 proposals that he had been suggesting the evening
 before would be workable. That was the whole purpose
 of the car park meeting, nothing else.

- 19 572 Q. Yes. And that this was your last-chance saloon, that
 20 this was the last opportunity, as you've just agreed 15:52
 21 with me there, that you could stop Sergeant McCabe from
 22 giving evidence and that's why you told Deputy
 23 McGuinness these things about Sergeant McCabe?
- A. You're correct in the first piece of your question.
 You're absolutely incorrect in the second piece.
- 26 573 Q. And I've to put it to you that the importance of this
 27 meeting from your perspective is reflected from the
 28 fact that you ended your interaction on this point with
 29 Deputy McGuinness by threatening him?

- 1 A. Under no circumstances, Chairman, did I threaten Deputy
 2 McGuinness.
- 3 574 Q. Well, you've heard or read Deputy McGuinness's evidence
- 4 that he said there would be grave consequences both for

15:53

15:53

- 5 him and the Committee if they proceeded along the
- 6 course of action which they had indicated they were
- 7 going on?
- 8 A. I've heard -- I've read that evidence, I should say,
- 9 Chairman, and it's totally incorrect. How could I
- 10 cause the Public Accounts Committee that type of grief? 15:53
- 11 It would be impossible.
- 12 575 Q. You were the Garda Commissioner, Mr. Callinan.
- 13 A. I might have certain control over the organisation, but
- 14 I certainly can't control the Public Accounts Committee
- or the politicians contained within it.
- 16 576 Q. Now, you have described Deputy McGuinness's evidence in
- 17 relation to what transpired at the car park yesterday
- as outrageous and this morning as crazy, isn't that
- 19 right?
- 20 A. In relation to the car park?
- 21 577 Q. Yes. And the conversation, his evidence as to what
- occurred during the conversation in the car park,
- you've described that as outrageous and crazy?
- 24 A. That is correct, Chairman, yes.
- 25 578 Q. Okay. Now, you're aware of the note that Deputy
- 26 McGuinness prepared following the meeting. It was
- 27 handed up to you, his big A4 notebook.
- 28 A. Yes, Chairman, I have seen that.
- 29 579 Q. Now, are you suggesting that that note was fabricated?

1	Α.	Chairman, I can only tell you what I know. I know	
2		there was no note taken there and then. I am aware	
3		that Deputy McGuinness was on the national airwaves,	
4		that he indicated that he didn't take any note of the	
5		meeting, either at the time or later, he said that. He $_{ m 1}$	5:54
6		also said that he didn't inform Sergeant McCabe about	
7		the meeting between the pair of us and what I am	
8		alleged to have said about Sergeant McCabe, and then he	
9		was asked was it before or after and he said both	
10		before and after. And the reaction from Sergeant	5:54
11		McCabe in the context of what Sergeant McCabe said here	
12		in his evidence and the statement he gave to the	
13		Committee.	

14 580 Ο. Now, your counsel cross-examined Mr. McGuinness at 15 length in relation to the preparation of that note, 16 asking him why he'd written the note by leaning it against the steering wheel, I think, of the car -- or, 17 18 sorry, why he wrote it while the book was on the seat 19 as opposed to the steering wheel of the car, and the 20 Chairman can make his own assessment as to the veracity 15:55 21 of the note. But, in essence, your evidence is that 22 Mr. McGuinness, a Dáil deputy and the former chairman 23 of the Public Accounts Committee, not only is coming 24 here to give false evidence but has fabricated a diary 25 entry to give credence to that false evidence? 26

15:55

15:55

Well, I'm not accusing him of fabricating a note. Α. only relaying to you what I heard the deputy speak about on the national airwaves, and he certainly indicated he didn't make any note, either then or

27

28

1			later.	
2	581	Q.	But, Mr. Callinan, what is preparing a false account of	
3			what transpired at a meeting, what is it other than a	
4			fabrication? That is what you are accusing	
5			Mr. McGuinness of?	15:56
6		Α.	No, I'm not accusing him. I'm stating the facts as I	
7			know them.	
8	582	Q.	What's Mr. McGuinness's motive for doing all of this,	
9			for falsifying or preparing this false entry and for	
10			giving this false evidence to the Tribunal?	15:56
11		Α.	I cannot answer that, Chairman. That's between him and	
12			his maker. And I'm happy to go to mine knowing that I	
13			am telling the truth here.	
14	583	Q.	Mr. Callinan, I have to put it to you that it's been a	
15			feature of your evidence, particularly today, that you	15:56
16			have sought to cast a further doubt over	
17			Mr. McGuinness's integrity in the course of his	
18			interactions with you?	
19		Α.	In what way?	
20	584	Q.	That you have suggested today that Mr. McGuinness had	15:56
21			interactions with Deputy Deasy, that you say just	
22			you put out there, you say to the Chairman, look, there	
23			are these meetings going on and I'm not going to draw	
24			any conclusion, but, you know, you might as well draw a	
25			conclusion, that you've put that out there in respect	15:57
26			of Mr. Deasy, haven't you?	
27		Α.	Well, I'm only indicating what's on my mind. I mean, I	
28			cannot possibly make allegations of that nature. But,	
29			you know, from reading the materials, I've seen what's	

Т			in the materials and I ve seen who was in contact with	
2			who, prior to making their statements. But that's it.	
3			I wasn't interacting with anybody before I made my	
4			statement.	
5	585	Q.	And that's the point I wanted to put to you, because	15:57
6			you introduced that today, and you've read Deputy	
7			McGuinness's evidence and I don't want to get into the	
8			instructions or the interactions between you and your	
9			legal advisers, but you're aware that Deputy McGuinness	
10			was cross-examined by your counsel for five-and-a-half	15:58
11			hours?	
12		Α.	Well, I'm aware of the yes, I have read the	
13			material. I wasn't sure of the precise time, but I	
14			accept what you are saying is correct.	
15	586	Q.	And if you have read it, you will see that your counsel	15:58
16			never put it, and I'm sure I will be corrected if I am	
17			wrong in this, but your counsel never put it to Deputy	
18			McGuinness that he had these interactions with Deputy	
19			Deasy that might have contaminated his evidence, I mean	
20			that is a	15:58
21		Α.	Well, I mean, I'm not saying that, Chairman, but all	
22			I'm saying is, I have read the materials and I have	
23			read the various interactions and interplay between	
24			some of the key witnesses in this Tribunal and	
25	587	Q.	And just sorry, Mr. Callinan.	15:58
26		Α.	And I can't go beyond that. But it's on my mind, so	
27			there you have it.	
28	588	Q.	And in relation to one of those key individuals, are	
29			you suggesting that Mr. McGuinness and Superintendent	

1			Taylor colluded in relation to their recollections of	
2			what Mr. McGuinness said?	
3		Α.	I'm not saying that. But there were conversations. I	
4			don't know what the detail of those conversations were,	
5			that is between them. I cannot make those accusations,	15:59
6			of course I can't.	
7	589	Q.	I have to put it to you, Mr. Callinan, that you have	
8			spun a web of lies around your interaction with people	
9			about Sergeant McCabe and that your evidence to this	
10			Tribunal has been an attempt to entrap Deputy	15:59
11			McGuinness within that web of lies?	
12		Α.	That is absolutely untrue, Chairman.	
13			MR. LEHANE: Thank you very much.	
14			CHAIRMAN: All right. well, it's four o'clock.	
15			Mr. Dignam, are you taking on the reins? You are?	15:59
16			MR. DIGNAM: I am, Chairman, and I hope not to be very	
17			long.	
18			CHAIRMAN: How long do you think you will be?	
19			MR. DIGNAM: I should be able to do it within half an	
20			hour.	15:59
21			CHAIRMAN: All right. well, then, let's take a break	
22			for ten minutes, it's only fair.	
23				
24			AFTER A SHORT ADJOURNMENT THE HEARING RESUMED	
25			AS FOLLOWS:	16:00
26				
27			MR. CALLINAN WAS EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM:	
28				
29	590	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Mr. Callinan, I just want to cover a few	

Т			themes with you just to charify some points and bring	
2			you back over some of the points that have been raised	
3			with you. I don't propose referring you to any great	
4			extent to documentation, but if you feel you want to	
5			see a document that I'm referring to, then we can	16:12
6			certainly open it to you.	
7		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
8	591	Q.	Just to begin with, you've already given evidence that	
9			you didn't know Superintendent Taylor before you	
10			appointed him as Press Officer, isn't that right?	16:13
11		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
12	592	Q.	And I think you've explained to the Tribunal that you	
13			had met him at least once, you're not limiting it to	
14			once but at least once that you remember at an airport	
15			somewhere abroad, as you were travelling back from some	16:13
16			official duty, is that right?	
17		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
18	593	Q.	Can I just ask you, was it unusual for a commissioner	
19			to have appointed a person who had no media	
20			qualification or media background to the role of Press	16:13
21			Officer of An Garda Síochána?	
22		Α.	No, Chairman, that wouldn't be unusual.	
23	594	Q.	And then in terms of your relationship with Mr. Taylor,	
24			having appointed him, I think you worked you accept	
25			that you worked closely with him?	16:13
26		Α.	I did, Chairman, yes.	
27	595	Q.	I think in your evidence today you said that you may	
28			not have had daily contact, but you certainly had very,	
29			very frequent contact and sometimes daily contact, is	

1 that right? 2 Correct, Chairman, yes. Α. And I think that's not unusual. We've heard the 3 596 Ο. evidence of members of the Press Office and indeed 4 5 other gardaí who have said that the Commissioner and 16:14 6 the Press Officer do work together, work very closely together, is that right? 7 8 That would be the nature of the job, Chairman, yes. Α. Now, people have expressed their perception in the 9 597 Q. witness-box as being that you and he were particularly 10 16 · 14 11 close; you've read that evidence? 12 I have, Chairman, yes. Α. 13 Yes. And I think you accept that you would have been 598 Q. 14 together a lot, working together, and that could be 15 where that perception comes from? 16:14 16 I would expect that is reasonable, Chairman, yes. Α. 17 And could I just ask you, did you become personally 599 Q. 18 close from your point of view? 19 No, Chairman. We did have a working relationship, Α. 20 obviously that is the nature of the job, but we weren't 16:14 close socially or on a personal level, no. 21 22 Yes. You didn't socialise together? 600 Q. No, we didn't, Chairman, no. 23 Α. 24 I think there's a reference somewhere in the papers, 601 Q.

No, that's not correct, Chairman, no.

your wife being friendly?

Did you socialise as couples?

and nothing really turns on it, but there's some

reference to you -- to Superintendent Taylor's wife and

16:15

25

26

27

28

29

602

Α.

Q.

1 No, Chairman, certainly not. Α. 2 603 Would you describe Superintendent Taylor as having Q. 3 become a confidante of yours? No. Chairman. 4 Α. 5 604 In relation to visits to your house, you've already Q. 16:15 6 given evidence, but just to clarify, is it your 7 position that Superintendent Taylor had never visited 8 your house before the occasions after your retirement? That's correct, Chairman, yes. 9 Α. Now, can I then just --10 605 Q. 16:15 11 CHAI RMAN: Just to clarify, is there a problem with him 12 perhaps calling and dropping in a document? would there be a problem? 13 Α. 14 CHAI RMAN: No, I mean did that happen? Obviously your reference is to social visits, he made a reference to 15 16:15 16 calling in because it was necessary to give you 17 something, or something like that. 18 Oh, I see. I don't recall that happening, Chairman. Α. 19 But if it did it --20 CHAI RMAN: It didn't stick in your mind? 16:16 No, it did not, Chairman, no. 21 Α. 22 Now, if I can then just ask you about your 606 MR. DI GNAM: Q. attitude to Sergeant McCabe, and if I could begin by 23

202

asking you about the impression that has been given of

Superintendent Taylor. He has sought to convey that

you appear to have been consumed by Sergeant McCabe and

the issues that he was raising. He has described you

as being, on various occasions, angry, upset, down

16:16

your attitude to Sergeant McCabe, principally by

24

25

26

27

28

1			about Maurice McCabe, and particularly his allegations,	
2			and he has put that in dramatic terms on occasions. If	
3			I can just ask you to look at page 207, which is Volume	
4			1.	
5		Α.	Sorry, Volume 1?	16:16
6	607	Q.	Volume 1, page 207.	
7		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
8	608	Q.	This is one of Superintendent Taylor's interviews with	
9			the Tribunal investigators, and you'll see his answer	
10			on the third line of the text on that page, and three	16:17
11			lines down, he says:	
12				
13			"The former Commissioner Callinan always expressed his	
14			deep frustration at what was going on and he often said	
15			if the people only knew, meaning his motives, and the	16:17
16			sexual assault allegation."	
17				
18			And then if you turn over to the next page, you'll see,	
19			just below halfway down through that paragraph, a line:	
20				16:17
21			"The man was deeply frustrated."	
22				
23			Do you see that?	
24		Α.	I see that, Chairman. Sorry, I beg your pardon.	
25	609	Q.	Line 66. What Superintendent Taylor says is:	16:18
26				
27			"The man was deeply frustrated. The longer it went on,	
28			the more worn down he became by the weight of history	
29			on him and that he was not going to be the first man to	

Т			rose his position as commissioner. He was the horder	
2			of the Commissioner's office and it was unprecedented	
3			that a sergeant was putting it up to him. He was	
4			burdened by this and that he would be the first	
5			Commissioner to let this happen. I cannot add anything	16:18
6			further than I have in respect of the dates I received	
7			these instructions."	
8				
9			Now, is that a fair description of how you felt and	
10			were reacting to Sergeant McCabe and his raising of	16:18
11			these issues?	
12		Α.	No, Chairman, that is not the case.	
13	610	Q.	Now, this may seem like a foolish question,	
14			Mr. Callinan, but you were Commissioner of An Garda	
15			Síochána at the time; can I take it, and can the	16:19
16			Tribunal take it, that there were many other things on	
17			your plate in that role	
18		Α.	Absolutely	
19	611	Q.	at that time?	
20		Α.	Chairman, I had a lot of very serious issues to deal	16:19
21			with at a time of competing interests in relation to a	
22			whole range of subjects, both policing and security,	
23			that we were dealing with, and at a time of reduced	
24			resources, both human and financial.	
25	612	Q.	Yes. I think you've referred to the resources issue in	16:19
26			the context of your description of when you were	
27			apologising to Mr. Brett of the Road Safety Authority,	
28			your description of being under pressure, and I think	
29			Mr. McDowell was teasing that out with you today, and	

1 you referred to the pressure arising from resources.

2 We don't -- I think everybody is aware of the economic

difficulties and the particular difficulties that were

4 being faced by An Garda Síochána, but, very briefly,

5 can you describe to the Tribunal the type of pressures

that that was putting on the force around that period

16:20

16 · 21

7 of 2012, 2013 and 2014?

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Thank you, Chairman. I suppose it is the situation Α. that everybody knew the position the country was in financially, and in terms of An Garda Síochána at that 16:20 time, we had an attrition rate, personnel, I suppose roughly 300 or so every year, we had a fleet that was aging, patrol cars were literally breaking down on the side of the road, so we had a lot of difficulties. was also the case that An Garda Síochána didn't escape 16:20 the requirement to try and streamline its activities, and we had station closures and all of the difficulties that that created for An Garda Síochána and a change of roster to try and keep apace of some of the restructuring we were putting in place at that time, to 16:21 keep what we hoped would have been an adequate policing and security service in place. There were a lot of difficulties.
- 24 613 Q. Now, I suppose it's easy for some of us when -- the
 25 issues surrounding Sergeant McCabe are central to the
 26 work of this Tribunal obviously, but is it fair to say
 27 that it was one of the many issues that you had to deal
 28 with and one of the important and big issues, but one
 29 of those important and big issues that you had to deal

1 with?

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

2 Yes, absolutely, Chairman. I mean, it is the case Α. gangland crime was a huge issue for us, as well as 3 volume crime, burglaries, larcenies, all of the 4 5 attendant business that you have to try and deal with 16:21 in terms of solving those issues. So they were there. 6 7 There was also the various factions of the IRA that 8 were causing problems, and they had to be dealt with as So there were huge issues to be dealt with in 9 relation to, particularly along the border where we had 16:22 10 11 particular issues and particular commitments that I felt had to be maintained at a time when we really 12 13 didn't have all of the resources we should have had, but that work continued. 14

15 614 Q. Now, if you had become consumed to the extent that has 16:22
16 been sought to be conveyed by Superintendent Taylor, by
17 this one issue, could you have carried out your
18 functions as Commissioner?

A. No, certainly not, Chairman. If you were -- I think I have mentioned previously that the work of the Garda

Commissioner, it's a very highly pressurised role. And if you weren't in a position to handle those pressures and deal with them on a daily basis, then I made mention of the fact that you wouldn't come into work, and that is my belief. You were expected, the people of Ireland and the government expected that you would deal with those pressures. After all, that is what you were put in there to do in the first instance.

29 615 Q. Now, you dealt with your attitude or your view of

1			members who raised wrongdoing when you were giving	
2			evidence to the PAC on the 23rd January. If I can just	
3			ask you to look at page 1346, which is in Volume 5.	
4		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
5	616	Q.	Now, the first the top of the text there, this is	16:23
6			you speaking, I think, is that correct	
7		Α.	Correct, Chairman.	
8	617	Q.	Mr. Callinan, where you say:	
9				
10			"My position is very clear. Anyone who makes any	16:23
11			report of wrongdoing to me, I will deal with it very	
12			seriously. I am sure I speak for my officers beside me	
13			and elsewhere when I say that is the case. We will not	
14			be isolating anyone who makes a complaint of wrongdoing	
15			against another member of the force. We have many	16:24
16			examples within the disciplinary process where we deal	
17			with people who transgressed every year. We are	
18			certainly not perfect, nor would I ever profess to come	
19			before this Committee and say so. We have difficult	
20			problems, as one can imagine in a force of over 13,000	16:24
21			dealing with such complex issues, of course we have	
22			difficulties. However, the deputy should be very clear	
23			that, from my perspective as Commissioner of An Garda	
24			Síochána, I will not allow anyone reporting wrongdoing	
25			to be bullied, harassed, intimidated, or whatever	16:24

will not happen on my watch.

adverb or adjective the deputy chooses to use.

procedure for reporting wrongdoing, which should not be

going off to a third party with a whole raft of serious

There is a mechanism and

26

27

28

1			allegations, criminal and otherwise, and producing them	
2			el sewhere. "	
3				
4			Now, am I correct to say, Mr. Callinan, that that was	
5			in reply to a question, I think a question from Deputy	16:24
6			Ross, is that right?	
7		Α.	Yes, I believe that's the situation, Chairman, yes,	
8			from recollection.	
9	618	Q.	And then if I could just ask you to look at page 1402.	
10		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	16:25
11	619	Q.	Sorry, I think I have given you the wrong page,	
12			Mr. Callinan. Now, just in relation to that question	
13			that I've just asked you, Mr. Callinan, was that a	
14			scripted response?	
15		Α.	What you've just read out?	16:25
16	620	Q.	What I've just read out, yes, was that a scripted	
17			response?	
18		Α.	No, it wasn't, Chairman, no.	
19	621	Q.	Does that reflect your attitude and approach to members	
20			who bring forward allegations and incidents of	16:25
21			wrongdoing?	
22		Α.	Absolutely, Chairman, yes.	
23	622	Q.	Now, presumably those comments also apply to Sergeant	
24			McCabe	
25		Α.	Yes.	16:26
26	623	Q.	specifically?	
27		Α.	Absolutely, Chairman, that's correct, yes.	
28	624	Q.	Now, yesterday or Friday, but while you were being	
29			questioned by Mr. Marrinan, he was correctly exploring	

1	with you whether you had an anger towards Sergeant
2	McCabe that caused you to brief negatively against him
3	or to desire to brief negatively against him, and
4	Mr. Marrinan grounded that in the story that had
5	appeared and had been written by Ms. O'Doherty, who we $_{ m 16:2}$
6	heard from earlier on, and your belief or suspicion
7	that Sergeant McCabe may have been the source for her
8	information. Now, it appears, I think, that
9	Ms. O'Doherty is claiming journalistic privilege and is
10	refusing to disclose her source, but the question that 16:2
11	I wanted to come to was, if I can just ask you to look
12	at page 7382 in the documents that are furnished today.
13	I'm not sure if they are in a separate folder. Yes, I
14	just want to put this in context, Mr. Callinan.
15	Mr. Marrinan was exploring that issue with you and
16	giving you an opportunity to address it, quite
17	correctly and properly. The document is at page 7382,
18	and the next two pages are tweets from Ms. O'Doherty,
19	and the first of them she pins her colours to the mast
20	and seems to prefer Mr. McGuinness's account of things $_{16:2}$
21	than yours, but the one I wanted to ask you about was
22	the one overleaf which I understand was tweeted by
23	Ms. O'Doherty as a witness to the Tribunal on the 16th
24	May 17th May, so five days ago, where she posted the
25	snapshot or the screenshot of your Pulse entry dealing 16:2
26	with the squashing of your penalty points and says in
27	her tweet:

28 29

"Martin Callinan's hatred for 'hashtag Maurice McCabe'

1			became personal after it was revealed 'hashtag	
2			Callinan' had his own speed points wiped. The public	
3			still haven't been given the full facts about this	
4			dubious point termination as the media turn a blind	
5			eye, 'hashtag Di sclosures Tri bunal'."	16:28
6				
7			Now, that was tweeted five days ago, just immediately	
8			before you started giving evidence. Is the first part	
9			of that correct, Mr. Callinan; did your hatred for	
10			Maurice McCabe become personal after it was revealed	16:29
11			that you had your own speed points wiped?	
12		Α.	Absolutely not, Chairman. Nothing do with it.	
13	625	Q.	Do you harbour feelings of hatred towards Sergeant	
14			McCabe?	
15		Α.	No, I certainly do not.	16:29
16	626	Q.	No doubt we will hear from Ms. O'Doherty. Then just	
17			related to those questions, I think you've given	
18			evidence, and very clear evidence, about your attitude	
19			to serving members of giving evidence to the PAC, and	
20			it's been dealt with in correspondence, the Tribunal	16:29
21			has seen all of the documentation, it's been opened to	
22			them several times, and I don't propose to open any of	
23			those letters to and from the PAC in relation to that.	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	627	Q.	But can I summarise it, and correct me if I am not	16:29
26			summarising it correctly, Mr. Callinan. Your	
27			opposition to a serving member, and in this case	
28			Sergeant McCabe, giving evidence before a Dáil	
29			committee was twofold, I think there was two limbs to	

Т			it. Firstly, you felt that it was damaging to a	
2			disciplined force for a serving member to be going	
3			outside the force to give evidence to a third-party	
4			body. And the second limb is that it risked him	
5			doing so risked disclosure of confidential information	16:30
6			about members of the public, which obviously is	
7			precluded by statute under the data protection	
8			legislation and you were data controller for the force,	
9			is that a fair summary of your concerns?	
10		Α.	That is a good summary, Chairman, yes.	16:30
11	628	Q.	Now, the second one of those, I think, is it fair to	
12			say that there's two parts to that also. Firstly, you	
13			had a concern about the delivery of documents to a	
14			third party of information, rather, to third	
15			parties, in itself was a concern of yours, isn't that	16:30
16			right?	
17		Α.	It was, Chairman, yes.	
18	629	Q.	And secondly, you seem to have had a concern that more	
19			information about the members of the public who were	
20			the subject of that information would come out at any	16:31
21			hearing in the PAC and that that might be in a public	
22			forum, is that a fair	
23		Α.	Correct, Chairman, that was one of my primary	
24			considerations, absolutely.	
25	630	Q.	Now, as part of the interaction that you had with the	16:31
26			PAC about those issues, I think they suggested or	
27			offered some comfort on that by saying, sure the	
28			documents are going to be redacted so there'll be no	
29			information about members of the public, no information	

- 1 about members of the public will get out, will be 2 Now, I don't think that allayed all of your 3 concerns, is that fair to say? No, Chairman. My difficulty, and this is what I tried 4 Α. 5 to impress again on Mr. McGuinness when I met him in 16:31 6 the car park on the 24th January, was that I couldn't 7 see how it would be possible for Sergeant McCabe to raise the issues he was raising without mentioning 8 individuals. I think I used the expression 9 'benefactors' and the people who had cancelled them and 16:32 10 11 the relationship or the correlation between the two. 12 couldn't see how effectively you could deal with those 13 complaints otherwise. That was my point. Because if there was to be a consideration about 14 631 Q. 15 whether, in a particular case, it was legitimate to 16:32 16 quash the penalty points, there would have to be some discussion of the circumstances and the merits of that 17 18 case, is that --
- A. Absolutely, Chairman, yes. I mean, it is the case that
 one of the repeat offenders that was complained about
 was a person delivering blood to hospitals, you know,
 there's those type of issues.
- 23 632 Q. And I think your concerns in relation to the data issue 24 or the data protection issue were very much shared by 25 the statutory officer in relation to data protection, 16:32 26 the Data Protection Commissioner, isn't that right?
- 27 A. That's right.
- 28 633 Q. And he wrote to the PAC in relation to the issues, 29 isn't that right?

- 1 A. That's correct, Chairman, yes.
- 2 634 Q. Do I take it from that that you'd agree, and really
- 3 it's a matter for the Tribunal insofar as it is
- 4 relevant, that this wasn't a mad idea on your part, it
- wasn't some sort of bizarre notion or concern that you

16:33

16:33

16:34

- 6 had; it was shared by the relevant statutory
- 7 office-holder, isn't that right?
- 8 A. Absolutely, Chairman, yes.
- 9 635 Q. Now, you also -- I think it's fair to say that you have
- been absolutely open and transparent and frank about
- 11 your concerns in this regard. It's been raised in
- 12 correspondence and it's been raised in testimony before
- the PAC, isn't that right?
- 14 A. I don't think there's any doubt about that, Chairman.
- 15 But absolutely, I agree.
- 16 636 Q. And similarly, your point of view, and I don't want to
- 17 get into the merits or the correctness or otherwise of
- it, the Tribunal has heard extensive evidence of it,
- 19 but your point of view that Sergeant McCabe had not
- 20 engaged with the O'Mahony investigation was something
- 21 which you dealt with openly and stated publicly, is
- that correct?
- 23 A. Yes, Chairman, that is correct.
- 24 637 Q. Yes. As a matter of fact, Sergeant McCabe did not
- engage with the O'Mahony investigation, but we've
- traversed that territory and his explanation as to why
- 27 and your perception in relation to that. But the point
- is that you have stated that at all stages openly and
- 29 publicly, isn't that right?

- 1 A. I have, Chairman, yes.
- 2 638 Q. Now, if I can then just turn to the interactions that
- you had with Mr. Boucher-Hayes in the first instance.
- 4 That was leading up to Christmas time, it was the
- 5 Crimecall Christmas broadcast. And just for the
- 6 avoidance of doubt, Crimecall is the successor to the

16:35

- 7 old Garda Patrol programme, isn't that right?
- 8 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 9 639 Q. And it is, in essence, a partnership between
- independent production companies, An Garda Síochána and 16:35
- 11 RTÉ, isn't that right?
- 12 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.
- 13 640 Q. And the purpose of the programme from the Garda
- perspective is to provide information to the public in
- the hope of receiving information to tackle crimes and
- 16 crime prevention?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 641 Q. Isn't that fair?
- 19 A. That is it, Chairman, yes.
- 20 642 Q. And it's not a current affairs programme?
- 21 A. No, Chairman, no.
- 22 643 Q. And on the day in question when you went to RTÉ, I
- think you're generally aware that there had been
- interactions during the course of the day about
- 25 questions that you should be asked, etcetera. And some 16:35
- of those questions I think dealt with Garda-specific
- issues, but current affairs issues, isn't that right?
- 28 A. Yes, Chairman.
- 29 644 Q. So there was a desire to talk about the FCPS, the

1			Smithwick Inquiry, current affairs issues such as	
2			those, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
4	645	Q.	And I think you became aware sorry,	
5			Mr. Boucher-Hayes says in his statement that he wanted	16:36
6			to speak to you in private about his desire to have	
7			these issues discussed on that Christmas Crimecall	
8			programme, isn't that right?	
9		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
10	646	Q.	Now, Mr. Boucher-Hayes is a presenter on the programme;	16:36
11			he's not the producer, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	Correct, Chairman, that's correct.	
13	647	Q.	Now, when you got to RTÉ, I think you've said in your	
14			evidence earlier on today that you weren't made aware	
15			that Mr. Boucher-Hayes wanted to meet you, he'd	16:36
16			expressed that desire to somebody else, but that you	
17			did meet him when you got there and you describe that	
18			meeting and indeed Mr. Boucher-Hayes also describes the	
19			meeting as happening in a corridor, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	That's the position, Chairman, yes.	16:36
21	648	Q.	And you say that when you met him, he was there was	
22			a woman with him, who I think you surmise, although you	
23			don't know, was maybe a make-up artist?	
24		Α.	I thought that was the situation. I could be wrong	
25			there, Chairman, but I thought that was the situation.	16:36
26	649	Q.	Yes. So when you met him, there was somebody with him.	
27			That person presumably left and you had your	
28			conversation then, is that right?	
29		Α.	That's right, Chairman, yes.	

1	650	Q.	Now, the conversation you met him in the corridor,	
2			and, if I understand matters correctly, the	
3			conversation happened in the corridor, isn't that	
4			right?	
5		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	16:37
6	651	Q.	It didn't happen in a private room?	
7		Α.	No.	
8	652	Q.	He or you didn't take the other party off to somewhere	
9			secluded or private where nobody could come across you	
10			or hear your conversation, isn't that right?	16:37
11		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
12	653	Q.	And you were quite happy to have your conversation with	
13			Mr. Boucher-Hayes in the corridor where people could	
14			have walked by or come across you, is that right?	
15		Α.	Yes, absolutely, Chairman, yes.	16:37
16	654	Q.	Now, we have your evidence in relation to the	
17			conversations, and I don't propose to go over that	
18			again, and no doubt we will hear from Mr. Boucher-Hayes	
19			in the coming weeks.	
20		Α.	Yeah.	16:37
21	655	Q.	But just to be absolutely clear, and I don't think	
22			there is any dispute between you on this, when you	
23			told or when at the end of the conversation when	
24			Mr. Boucher-Hayes describes you as having told him this	
25			information about Mr. Wilson and Sergeant McCabe, is it	16:38
26			correct to say that Mr. Boucher-Hayes asked no	
27			questions whatsoever about it?	
28		Α.	That's correct.	

29 656 Q. Now, can I then just ask you to turn to the 23rd

_			January, wirren was your visit to the barr, to the FAC.	
2			And you I think the Tribunal has heard of three	
3			interactions that had you on that day: one with Deputy	
4			Deasy; one with Mr. McCarthy, the Comptroller & Auditor	
5			General; and the third with Deputy McGuinness. If I	16:38
6			can just deal with Deputy Deasy's conversation with you	
7			in the first instance. I think it's agreed that that	
8			happened in the coffee dock, isn't that right?	
9		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
10	657	Q.	And that has been described, and I think the	16:39
11			Tribunal the Chair has seen the location of it, is	
12			at the top of the stairs and seems to be a busy hub of	
13			activity, is that fair?	
14		Α.	That's fair, Chairman, yes.	
15	658	Q.	And, in fact, Deputy Deasy, on page 204 of Day 63, Day	16:39
16			63, page 206, describes it as being sorry.	
17		Α.	Thank you, Chairman, yes.	
18	659	Q.	At page 206, at the very top of the page, he describes	
19			it as being:	
20				16:40
21			"A very public place, very noisy, people milling about.	
22			It wasn't a place where it wasn't a car park or a	
23			corridor, it was a public area."	
24				
25			Okay. Is that your memory of it?	16:40
26		Α.	I agree with that, Chairman.	
27	660	Q.	And you've been in Leinster House on a number of	
28			occasions, and indeed addressing various Dáil	
29			committees, you've been in that place. Would you agree	

1			with that description?	
2		Α.	I would, Chairman, yes.	
3	661	Q.	Now, if I can just ask you to look then at page 1470,	
4			which is Deputy Deasy's account, his first ever account	
5			of his conversation with you, and this is a broadcast	16:4
6			on the 14th February 2017, page 1470, Volume 6.	
7		Α.	Thank you.	
8	662	Q.	And you see halfway down that page sorry, this was a	
9			larger broadcast, but I think there was a recorded	
10			interaction with Deputy Deasy by Ms. O'Callaghan, and	16:4
11			on page 16 of the transcript of that broadcast, halfway	
12			down the page, Deputy Deasy is dealing with his	
13			revelation that he had a conversation with you on the	
14			morning of the PAC hearing. Sorry, I should have said	
15			this broadcast took place on the 14th February 2017.	16:4
16		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
17	663	Q.	So three years after the PAC hearing, and he is	
18			revealing and describes meeting you, and he says:	
19				
20			"Before the meeting, I was approached by a very senior	16:4
21			guard and he proceeded to make some very derogatory	
22			comments about Maurice McCabe, the nature of which	
23			were, you know, Maurice McCabe couldn't be believed and	
24			couldn't be trusted on anything. They were very, very	
25			derogatory. It was, you know, a serious attack and	16:4
26			very strongly worded."	
27				
28			Now, he then deals with this meeting in his statement	
29			to the Tribunal on page 1503, in a two-paragraph email,	

1			I think, to the Tribunal, dated 10th March 2017, and he	
2			says:	
3				
4			"I was a member of the Oireachtas Public Accounts	
5			Committee."	16:43
6				
7			So this is a month after his broadcast, or his	
8			interview with Miriam O'Callaghan that I've just read	
9			out you. He says:	
10				16:43
11			"I was a member of the Oireachtas Public Accounts	
12			Committee from 2011 to 2016. On January 23rd 2014,	
13			prior to a PAC Committee meeting regarding fixed notice	
14			penalties, I spoke with the then-Garda Commissioner,	
15			Martin Callinan. Mr. Callinan made reference to	16:43
16			Sergeant Maurice McCabe. He referred to Sergeant	
17			McCabe as being someone who could not be believed or	
18			trusted."	
19				
20			Now, he doesn't say in that email who approached whom,	16:43
21			but what he says is that you refer to Sergeant McCabe	
22			as being someone who could not be believed or trusted.	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	664	Q.	Now, he said in his radio interview that what you said	
25			was that he couldn't be believed and couldn't be	16:43
26			trusted on anything. Now, are either of those two	
27			descriptions of what you said correct?	
28		Α.	No, they're not, Chairman.	
29	665	Q.	Now, he was then interviewed by the Tribunal	

1			investigators, and the transcript of that interview is	
2			at page 1490.	
3		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
4	666	Q.	And if you just turn to page 1491, at the very bottom	
5			of the page, there's a question on line 21:	16:44
6				
7			"I have been referred to my statement and have been	
8			asked to provide a complete and detailed account of the	
9			conversation I had with the former Garda Commissioner	
10			Martin Callinan prior to the Public Accounts Committee	16:44
11			as referred."	
12				
13			And answer:	
14				
15			"The former Commissioner was attending a PAC meeting	16:44
16			and the Commissioner and several other senior gardaí	
17			were in the coffee dock one floor above the Committee	
18			room. I spoke to Martin Callinan in the coffee dock	
19			standing in an informal manner and the former	
20			Commissioner made reference to Maurice McCabe as	16:44
21			someone that could not be believed or trusted."	
22				
23			And he omits the words "on anything".	
24				
25			"It was a very quick conversation after saying 'hello',	16:45
26			and that is my recollection. I did not reply to the	
27			comment, the reason being I was surprised at it. One	
28			element I have thought about since is, was there anyone	
29			else in earshot, and I can't say if there was anyone	

1	else in earshot of the former Commissioner.	
2		
3	Question: I have been asked how this conversation with	
4	the former Garda Commissioner Martin Callinan came	
5	about and to detail all attendant circumstances,	16:45
6	including where and at what time the conversation took	
7	place, were there any other persons present who may	
8	have witnessed and/or overheard the conversation."	
9		
10	And his answer to a question asking for the particular	16:45
11	circumstances of how the conversation came about is	
12	that:	
13		
14	"The conversation took place prior to the PAC meeting.	
15	I can't be absolutely certain of the time the	16:45
16	conversation took place due to the passage of time. I	
17	think Committee meetings took place at 11:00am on a	
18	Thursday. I just can't be sure of the time the	
19	conversation took place.	
20		16:45
21	The conversation took place just prior to the public	
22	session that day. I recall I approached the	
23	Commissioner in the coffee dock and there were other	
24	senior guards present. It was a very basic 'hello',	
25	and then the conversation took place as I have	16:46
26	descri bed al ready."	
27		
28	So he confirms in his interview that, in fact, it was	
29	he who approached you is that your recollection of	

1			your interaction with him?	
2		Α.	My recollection is the former Commissioner Nóirín	
3			O'Sullivan introduced us.	
4	667	Q.	Yes. And he deals with that on Day 63, page 205. And	
5			in the middle of that page sorry, beginning on page	16:46
6			204, he says:	
7				
8			"The guards were already in the coffee dock."	
9				
10			Sorry, I will let you find it, Mr. Callinan. Line 17.	16:47
11		Α.	Thank you.	
12	668	Q.	Sorry, line 13, I should say.	
13		Α.	I have it, yes. Thank you, Chairman.	
14	669	Q.	Sorry, if I just go back. Line 12, I should say, is	
15			the question, Mr. Callinan:	16:47
16				
17			"And could you just describe how he approached you?"	
18				
19			Now, that's how you, Mr. Callinan, approached Deputy	
20			Deasy, and presumably that question is based on the	16:47
21			radio broadcast description of the interaction. And he	
22			says:	
23				
24			"The guards were already in the coffee dock and I was	
25			on my way to the Committee. I stopped off to get a	16:47
26			coffee and he was standing"	
27				
28			That is you.	
29				

1		" I believe with Nóirín O'Sullivan, former	
2		Commi ssi oner.	
3			
4		Question: Had you met him before?	
5		Answer: Yeah, I had, maybe once, you know, once or	16:47
6		twice, but I knew Nóirín better, former Commissioner	
7		O'Sullivan. She tapped him on the arm and I think he	
8		just turned around and put his hand out."	
9			
10		Now, if you then go down to page 205, question at line	16:47
11		11:	
12			
13		"And it's your recollection that Deputy Commissioner	
14		tapped him on the	
15		Answer: Yeah. I think Nóirín O'Sullivan, former	16:48
16		Commissioner, she tapped him. I was on my way to them.	
17		I suppose I knew former Commissioner O'Sullivan and I	
18		think it was me approaching them and him turning around	
19		and just we shook hands. It was just a meeting like	
20		that."	16:48
21			
22		Now, can you reconcile Deputy Deasy's description of	
23		who approached whom, given on the radio broadcast in	
24		February 2017 with his later descriptions of how the	
25		conversation was initiated and how it then took place?	16:48
26	Α.	Well, I think what you've just read out is an accurate	
27		description of what happened in the context of Deputy	
28		Commissioner, as she was then, former Commissioner	
29		O'Sullivan introducing us And T agree the	

1			conversation was very brief. He just gave me the	
2			indication, as I've said in my statement, as to what he	
3			was going the subject he was going to ask me about,	
4			and he also asked me about whistleblowers and what was	
5			my view on the whistleblowers, and I indicated sure you	16:49
6			already know my views, I've written to you on two	
7			occasions, and that was pretty much the extent of it,	
8			except to say that to bear in mind that not all of	
9			the allegations that Sergeant McCabe had made were	
10			correct. Some of them were questionable and it turned	16:49
11			out to be some of them turned out to be untrue and that	
12			he had Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony's report which	
13			the Committee had at the time	
14	670	Q.	Yes.	
15		Α.	to guide them on that process. And that's	16:49
16			consistent with what I said to the others as well.	
17	671	Q.	Yes. So you've never denied or disputed that you would	
18			have said to Deputy Deasy that some of the allegations	
19			which are being made by Sergeant McCabe are	
20			questionable because some of them turned out to be	16:49
21			untrue?	
22		Α.	That is absolutely correct, yes, Chairman.	
23	672	Q.	And I take it from your description and your	
24			confirmation of Deputy Deasy's later description of who	
25			approached who, that Deputy Deasy was wrong in his	16:50
26			first revelation of this conversation given in the	
27			radio broadcast that you approached him, is that right?	
28		Α.	I agree, Chairman, absolutely, that is correct, yes.	
29	673	Q.	Now, it's my understanding, Mr. Callinan, that Deputy	

Т			Deasy has never suggested that you mentioned sexual	
2			offence or offences or allegations or historic	
3			allegations that had been made against Sergeant McCabe	
4			and of which he had been cleared by the DPP?	
5		Α.	No, Chairman, that never entered the conversation at	16:50
6			all.	
7	674	Q.	Yes. The most that Deputy Deasy says is contained at	
8			page 211 on Day 63, and at the very bottom of that page	
9			he's describing how long the conversation took	
10			sorry, on line 12 he is asked:	16:51
11				
12			"Q. You've no recollection, therefore, of referring to	
13			files or sexual abuse allegations?	
14			A. No.	
15			Q. And how long did you perhaps spend? I know it is a	16:51
16			bri ef peri od.	
17			A. I'd say less than a minute.	
18			Q. Less than a minute, all right. But is the height	
19			of it then, as you have stated in your statement and to	
20			the investigators, was that he simply referred to him	16:51
21			as someone who couldn't be believed or trusted?	
22			A. Yes.	
23			Q. But did you understand that that related to the	
24			penal ty points issue?	
25			A. Em	16:51
26			Q. Or did it go further in your mind?"	
27				
28			And Deputy Deasy says:	
29				

1			"In my mind it went further."	
2				
3			And then he says:	
4				
5			"And I suppose, maybe I'm putting this together after	16:51
6			the fact."	
7				
8			Now, I take that to understand - you might confirm if	
9			this is also your understanding, Mr. Callinan - that	
10			Deputy Deasy, having thought about it at some point	16:52
11			after this conversation, and he doesn't say when or how	
12			long after the conversation, he imported into your	
13			conversation something that he accepts wasn't said or	
14			wasn't even suggested.	
15		Α.	I agree, Chairman, yes.	16:52
16	675	Q.	Now, if I can then ask you to on page	
17			CHAIRMAN: What is the bit that he accepts wasn't said?	
18			MR. DIGNAM: I think Deputy Deasy confirms, Judge, that	
19			there was never any reference to sexual allegations or	
20			sexual offence having been made against Sergeant	16:52
21			McCabe. I think he accepted that in evidence. I just	
22			can't find the passage. But he has never suggested	
23			that Mr. Callinan suggested or alleged or implied that	
24			there was a sexual allegation.	
25			CHAIRMAN: I knew that. But, I'm sorry, I thought	16:53
26			there was a new point being made?	
27			MR. DIGNAM: Oh, no, simply that Deputy Deasy, what he	
28			says is that he thinks he read more into the	
29			conversation, but that was after the fact, not at the	

1 time, so he didn't understand. 2 Knowing everything else --CHAI RMAN: 3 MR. DI GNAM: Yes. -- I suppose. No, I do understand the 4 CHAI RMAN: 5 point. And your point is that this would have been 16:53 another ideal opportunity? 6 7 MR. DI GNAM: Yes. 8 CHAI RMAN: All right. I take the point. Thank you, Chairman. 9 MR. DI GNAM: Now, then, just to finish with Deputy Deasy -- perhaps 10 676 Q. 16:53 11 I will move on to Mr. McCarthy, Mr. Callinan. 12 I'm not going to ask you to recite your version of the 13 conversation again, the Tribunal has that, Mr. Marrinan 14 has brought you through that and Mr. McCarthy has given 15 evidence. But one -- your memory of where this 16:53 16 conversation took place was that it was, as you walked down the stairs from, I think the coffee dock area into 17 18 the Committee room area downstairs, isn't that right? 19 Yes, Chairman. Α. I think Mr. McCarthy's memory of it is that it took 20 677 Q. 16:54 21 place in the lobby outside the Committee room. 22 wherever it took place, is it fair to say that it was a 23 public place and that it was a place where other people 24 were congregating and moving around or milling around? 25 That's absolutely correct, Chairman, yes. Α. 16:54 26 Yes. And would you describe it as busy location? 678 Ο. 27 Yes, there's always people moving about, particularly Α. at that hour of the day, yes. 28

29

679

Q.

Presumably there are quite a number of members of An

Τ			Garda Siochana, there's people from the Department of	
2			Justice, there are the members of the Committee, at the	
3			very least, and, I don't know, there may have been	
4			other committee hearings going on in other rooms. So	
5			there are people around?	16:55
6		Α.	Correct, Chairman, including staff.	
7	680	Q.	Yes. And I think Mr. McCarthy, in his statement,	
8			fairly qualifies his descriptions of what was said by	
9			use of phrases of words were used "to the effect	
10			that", and then he recounts what he says happened. And	16:55
11			I think he accepted in his evidence that he used that	
12			phrase to convey that he wasn't purporting to quote	
13			exactly what was said. You have probably seen that	
14			evidence, have you?	
15		Α.	I haven't seen that piece, but I accept that is	16:55
16			correct, yes.	
17	681	Q.	Now, again, I think this was a Mr. McCarthy was	
18			attending the same hearing as you and you just happened	
19			to be going down the stairs or happened to be in the	
20			lobby at the same time, is that right?	16:55
21		Α.	Absolutely.	
22	682	Q.	Did you set out to meet Mr. McCarthy?	
23		Α.	No, I did not, Chairman, no.	
24	683	Q.	And I think it's your view, and again I don't think we	
25			need to trouble the Tribunal with getting into the	16:56
26			conversation, I think it was your view that	
27			Mr. McCarthy is mistaken in his interpretation of what	
28			you're saying, is that a fair summary?	
29		Α.	Well, that is what I believed. That is truly what I	

1			believe is the situation, based on his conclusion that	
2			it related to the missing computer, etcetera. I think	
3			that is the position, and I can't put it any further.	
4	684	Q.	Yes. If I can then just ask you to deal with the	
5			interactions with Mr. McGuinness, which happened on the	16:56
6			23rd and then the 24th January, and I am going to ask	
7			you to deal with the different accounts given by	
8			Mr. McGuinness, because I think you're conscious and	
9			aware that Mr. McGuinness has, in fact, given different	
10			accounts, particularly of his conversation with you on	16:56
11			the 23rd, immediately after the PAC hearing. And	
12			you're aware that the first time he mentioned you doing	
13			anything improper or inappropriate was in his Dáil	
14			speech in May, isn't that right?	
15		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	16:57
16	685	Q.	Yes. And then I think he gave some radio broadcasts in	
17			the months the days and then months after	
18		Α.	Following.	
19	686	Q.	After that Dáil speech?	
20		Α.	Yes.	16:57
21	687	Q.	And I think it's fair to say that he didn't mention in	
22			either his Dáil speech or indeed in those broadcasts	
23			anything about the allegation that you had said	
24			something improper to him at the conclusion of the PAC	
25			hearing, isn't that right?	16:57
26		Α.	Is that the Dáil speech?	
27	688	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	Other than indicating that vile allegations were	
29			repeated, but they were non-specific.	

- 1 689 Q. Yes. But I think it's fair to say that that is in reference to your meeting in the car park?
- 3 A. Oh, that's correct, yes.

8

9

4 690 Q. Yes. So he didn't say, and you may correct me if I am wrong, but he didn't say in either his Dáil speech or

16:57

16:58

16:58

16:58

6 in the radio broadcast that not only had you said

7 something inappropriate or improper in the car park,

but, in fact, the very day before that you had said

that Sergeant McCabe interfered with children, or

10 whatever phrase he feels was used?

- 11 A. Correct, Chairman, yes, that is the position.
- 12 691 Q. Then just dealing with the shorthand, the 'kiddie 13 fiddler' allegation, and, in fact, it's correct to say 14 that Deputy McGuinness never used the words 'kiddie

fiddler', isn't that right?

- 16 A. No, he didn't, Chairman.
- 17 692 Q. And that that, in fact, comes from Superintendent
 18 Taylor's account of the conversation, not Deputy
 19 McGuinness's account?
- 20 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.
- 21 693 Q. Now, it was put to you by Mr. Lehane that, sure they're
- the same thing. So Deputy McGuinness, I think, says
- 23 that -- claims to have said -- sorry, claims you said
- 'this man fiddles with children, this is outrageous',
- and in Dave Taylor's he heard you saying that 'this man 16:59
- is a kiddie fiddler'?
- 27 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.
- 28 694 Q. Now, it was put to you that they're one and the same 29 thing. Now, I think you'll agree that the substance of

Т			those two phrases is one and the same, isn't that	
2		Α.	There are certain similarities, I would have to concede	
3			that, of course.	
4	695	Q.	But I think the point you're making in response to	
5			Mr. Lehane is that the words are different?	16:59
6		Α.	They are, they're certainly different.	
7	696	Q.	And I think the Tribunal obviously will be reading the	
8			evidence and the documents very carefully, but both	
9			Deputy McGuinness and indeed Superintendent Taylor give	
10			those words, give their respective words as quotes, not	16:59
11			qualified in the way that that Mr. McCarthy has	
12			qualified his description of the conversation, but	
13			actually as quotations of what you have said, and	
14			they're different?	
15		Α.	Well, I think that is the point, Chairman, yes.	17:00
16	697	Q.	Now, the first time that Deputy McGuinness said that	
17			you said 'this man fiddles with children, this is	
18			outrageous' was in his statement to the Tribunal on the	
19			28th March 2017, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	17:00
21	698	Q.	And then a full year later to the very day, the 28th	
22			March 2018, just under two months ago, Deputy	
23			McGuinness then gave in an interview with the Tribunal	
24			his longer description of what you're alleged to have	
25			said, and if I can just ask you to look at page 2165	17:00
26			very briefly, you'll see, and I'm not going to read it	
27			all out to you again Mr. Callinan, but you will see	
28			that the quote is considerably longer and the contents	
29			are considerably different to what Deputy McGuinness	

1			had attributed to you in his first statement to the	
2			Tribunal and the only piece that it has in common with	
3			Deputy McGuinness's first statement, you'll agree, is	
4			"and the other fella fiddles with kids", isn't that	
5			right?	17:01
6		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
7	699	Q.	And I think it is correct to say that that statement	
8			was given a number of months or that account was given	
9			a number of months after you had dealt with Deputy	
10			McGuinness's original allegation and original quotation	17:02
11			of what you said and that's to be found at page 690,	
12			but I don't need you to look at it	
13		Α.	Okay.	
14	700	Q.	Mr. Callinan, and that is where you described Deputy	
15			McGuinness coming to you and you asking him whether he	17:02
16			was going to call Mr. Wilson and you describing to the	
17			Tribunal what Deputy McGuinness's response to that was,	
18			and a number of months after that, Deputy McGuinness	
19			put this statement in, isn't that the chronology?	
20		Α.	That's correct, Chairman. That is the chronology, yes.	17:02
21	701	Q.	And we then have a number of accounts given by Deputy	
22			McGuinness as to exactly what happened and again I	
23			don't need to get into them in any detail, just for the	
24			purpose of the Tribunal, they are to be found an day	
25			62, pages 35, 43 and 45 of the transcripts. But Deputy	17:02
26			McGuinness is describing at various stages how he	
27			approached the group and whether you were in the middle	
28			of the story or just commencing the story or had just	
29			started talking about Mr. Wilson. Now, are any of the	

1	accounts, either the first one that Deputy McGuinness
2	gave in his first statement or the enlarged one that he
3	gave in his second statement or the accounts that he
4	gave in his evidence, which I think you have read
5	carefully, correct?

17:04

17:04

17:04

17:05

6 A. No, they are not, Chairman.

24

25

26

27

7 702 Now, Superintendent Taylor's evidence has been that he Q. heard you say that "this man is a kiddie fiddler". 8 this is his account of the exact same conversation that 9 10 Deputy McGuinness has given. And what Superintendent 11 Taylor describes you as saying is that "this man is a kiddie fiddler" and that is all he describes you as 12 13 Because he says he missed the opening because saying. 14 he was getting your hat and satchel. And he then says 15 what he says he heard, but he doesn't and didn't hear 16 the final bit of the conversation, which is "these are 17 the type of fucking headbangers that I've to deal 18 with", which is recounted by Deputy McGuinness. Now, 19 can you offer any explanation as to how Superintendent 20 Taylor, having come into the conversation before you allegedly said "this man is a kiddie fiddler", would 21 22 have missed that last part of the conversation? 23

A. I think it would be extraordinarily difficult for him if he had heard the remark he's alleged to have said I had uttered on the occasion for him not to have heard at least a portion of what Mr. McGuinness was subsequently describing, Chairman.

28 703 Q. Now on day 77, page 36, and again I don't need you to open the transcript but, Superintendent Taylor said in

1			his evidence that he never heard you using bad	
2			language, that it wasn't part of your vocabulary?	
3		Α.	He is correct there, Chairman.	
4	704	Q.	But Deputy McGuinness has you in fact using bad	
5			language on an occasion when Superintendent Taylor was	17:05
6			there. Do you take it from that that Superintendent	
7			Taylor definitely didn't hear you saying what you're	
8			alleged to have said to Deputy McGuinness?	
9		Α.	I can only go by what he is saying to me.	
10	705	Q.	Now, if I can then just turn to the car park when you	17:06
11			met Deputy McGuinness at Bewley's hotel on the 24th.	
12			I'm just going to try and summarise your evidence	
13			rather than going through it again, Mr. Callinan,	
14			because I think the Tribunal has again heard this at	
15			great length. But your purpose of trying to see Deputy	17:06
16			McGuinness was to present some proposals that you had	
17			come up with to him, isn't that right?	
18		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
19	706	Q.	And you've explained to the Tribunal that how you came	
20			up or how you came to come up with those proposals was	17:06
21			that the previous evening towards the end I think of	
22			the hearing before the PAC, Deputy McGuinness had said	
23			well look, if I was having trouble with an employee or	
24			having an issue with an employee I'd sit down and talk	
25			or I'd call him in and talk to him and you had	17:06
26			reflected on that and you thought that there was a	
27			possibility that you could ward off the necessity for	
28			the PAC to call Sergeant McCabe by adopting a version,	
29			and only a version, of that suggestion by Deputy	

1			McGuinness, is that right?	
2		Α.	That's correct. Or at least postpone the proposed	
3			meeting	
4	707	Q.	Yes?	
5		Α.	on the basis that I would deal with it along the	17:07
6			steps I was suggesting.	
7	708	Q.	If I understand the chronology correctly, you took	
8			legal advice on the evening of the 23rd and the two	
9			draft letters that we have seen that weren't in fact	
10			sent were drafted up on the evening of the 23rd?	17:07
11		Α.	They were. They were, Chairman.	
12	709	Q.	Mr. Marrinan has pointed out to you some difficulties	
13			with language where on one occasion you're referring to	
14			the 23rd as yesterday evening	
15		Α.	Yes.	17:07
16	710	Q.	and on another occasion you're referring to it as	
17			the day that the letter had been written?	
18		Α.	Yes. I think if "today" had been corrected to	
19			"yesterday" I think that probably would have	
20			straightened out the issue.	17:07
21	711	Q.	You've been asked why you didn't send those letters to	
22			the PAC, why you didn't simply send them, rather than	
23			seeking to meet Mr. McGuinness. And would you correct	
24			me, correct my understanding of your evidence, that you	

28 A. That is correct, Chairman. That was my sole purpose.

25

26

27

speak?

29 712 Q. Yes. So I think you were of the view that there was no

wanted to see Deputy McGuinness, who was the Chairman

of the committee, to see if they were a runner, so to

Τ			point in sending them unless you were getting the	
2			recommendation or endorsement or agreement of the	
3			Chairman of the committee, is that right?	
4		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes. That's the position.	
5	713	Q.	Now it's been repeatedly said in evidence that all of	17:08
6			the issues had already been dealt with and decided, so	
7			there was no point in you coming to Deputy McGuinness	
8			saying all of this. From your point of view I think	
9			this has been described, I think you would accept this,	
10			that this was you having a last go, having another go	17:09
11			at achieving the result that you wanted to achieve?	
12		Α.	Absolutely, Chairman. That is the position, yes.	
13	714	Q.	Is it correct to say that all of the issues had been	
14			dealt with and decided at that stage?	
15		Α.	No, no, Chairman. The committee were meeting on the	17:09
16			Tuesday, as I understood it, to decide whether the	
17			meeting would be in public or private and that was a	
18			particularly big issue for me.	
19	715	Q.	One of the things, if I understand your evidence	
20			correctly, that the way the meeting I think concluded	17:09
21			was you wanted Deputy McGuinness to let you know if it	
22			was going to be in public or private, isn't that right?	
23		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes. And also, of course, some	
24			reassurance about personalising some of the	
25			documentation or at least identifying individuals	17:09
26			within the documentation and how that could be	
27			overcome. And again, I repeated the fact I didn't	
28			believe it was possible for Sergeant McCabe to raise	
29			those issues without actually dealing with individuals,	

Т			private individuals, and indeed Gardai, and their	
2			relationships.	
3	716	Q.	I think it was put to you that your efforts to date	
4			hadn't borne fruit and I think you'd accept that, that	
5			up to that day your efforts hadn't borne fruit, but in	17:10
6			fact the decision was made, and I don't think you're	
7			claiming credit for this but a decision was made the	
8			following week that it would be a private hearing and	
9			not a public hearing?	
10		Α.	Correct.	17:10
11	717	Q.	Yes. And that was one of the fruits that you wanted,	
12			one of the fruits of your labours that you were hoping	
13			would be achieved?	
14		Α.	It was, Chairman. And I was trying to claim a bit of	
15			credit but obviously it didn't work, apparently.	17:10
16	718	Q.	It wasn't an ideal solution. It didn't allay all your	
17			concerns. But it went some way towards allaying your	
18			concerns.	
19		Α.	It was a compromise, yes. As far as I was concerned,	
20			Chairman.	17:10
21	719	Q.	You've given your account of the conversation in the	
22			car, am I correct in my understanding that he didn't	
23			mention at any stage, Deputy McGuinness didn't mention	
24			at any stage during that conversation the comments	
25			which he now accuses you of having made on 23rd	17:11
26			January, either form of them?	
27		Α.	Correct.	
28	720	Q.	Yes. So he alleges that in this conversation you	
29			brought up with sexual allegations and he didn't refer	

1			back and say 'You told me about this yesterday, Martin,	
2			I'm not interested', there was no reference at all, is	
3			that right, to what you had allegedly said the day	
4			before?	
5		Α.	That is correct, Chairman, yes.	17:1
6	721	Q.	On day 62, page 60, I might ask you to look very	
7			briefly at that, Mr. Callinan, day 62, page 60, if I	
8			can ask Mr. Kavanagh to scroll down slightly, you will	
9			see on line 15 he describes you getting into the car	
10			and then he says:	17:1
11				
12			"And then he immediately got into the conversation to	
13			do with the Maurice McCabe and the issues. I suggested	
14			to him at the beginning of this conversation, as I did	
15			the day before, that like any other employer that	
16			perhaps the best way out of this was for him to talk	
17			directly to Sergeant Maurice McCabe and to determine	
18			what exactly the issues were and resolve it that way,	
19			without it having to, you know, go into the public	
20			realm and him dealing trying to deal with it that	
21			way. And it was at that stage that he said to me"	
22				
23			That is, that you said to Deputy McGuinness.	
24				
25			" that no, it had gone beyond all of that and that	
26			there was issues to do with Maurice McCabe and his	
27			behaviour and he suggested that there was"	
28				
29			Then he goes on to describe what you say about the	

- sexual allegations. Now, the previous evening you had
 gone to the trouble of getting legal advice and ask
 people to draft up two proposal letters which was an
 adoption by you of a version of what Deputy McGuinness
 had said at the end of the PAC and what he refers to in 17:13
 that passage.
- 7 A. Correct, Chairman, yes.

20

- 8 722 Q. Does it make any sense to you, Mr. Callinan, that
 9 having gone to that trouble, that if he had suggested,
 10 if he'd referred again to the employer/employee issue 17:13
 11 that you would have simply dismissed it, having gone to
 12 the trouble of drafting the two letters and taken legal
 13 advice the previous evening?
- 14 Α. That was my attempt to resolve matters, as 15 suggested by the Chairman at that particular point. 17:13 16 Finally in relation to Deputy McGuinness, Mr. Callinan, 723 Q. you have been accused by Deputy McGuinness of accusing 17 18 or seeking to brief negatively or suggest that there was something untoward about Sergeant McCabe because of 19

you, at that stage Commissioner of An Garda Síochána,

a sexual allegation about him in the past. What would

17:14

17 · 14

22 have expected a responsible public representative to

have done if those conversations took place?

A. Well, if they had taken place, Chairman, as I indicated
earlier on, I would have expected that those
allegations would have been laid at the feet of the
Minister for Justice or the Taoiseach or both. And I
also believe that they should have been brought to the

also believe that they should have been brought to the

O'Higgins Commission. I think it was very appropriate

1			that that would have happened.	
2	724	Q.	It has been said that the reason didn't tell anybody in	
3			authority, so to speak, about this conversation or	
4			these conversations was that he didn't want to add to	
5			the hurt of Sergeant McCabe and indeed of his family by	17:15
6			making this public. Were there ways in which a public	
7			representative could bring inappropriate improper	
8			behaviour by the Commissioner of An Garda Síochána to	
9			the attention of relevant authorities without making it	
10			public?	17:15
11		Α.	Well, I think GSOC would be another option I suppose,	
12			that that could have been done. But certainly, I'd	
13			strong views about the O'Higgins Commission being	
14			you know, that they should have been consulted.	
15	725	Q.	So finally in relation to those conversations,	17:15
16			Mr. Callinan, it's been suggested that's	
17			Mr. Boucher-Hayes, Deputy Deasy, Deputy McGuinness, and	
18			Mr. McCarthy it has been suggested to you that we	
19			had four people who within a calendar month are	
20			accusing you of saying more or the less the same thing.	17:16
21			Now, I think it's more correct to say, would you agree,	
22			that in face we have four people who between two and	
23			four years after the relevant time period are saying	
24			that you said similar things; would you agree with	
25			that?	17:16
2.0		_		

- 26 A. I would absolutely agree with that, Chairman, yes.
- 27 726 Q. And would you agree that there are in fact striking 28 differences between the accounts of what the four 29 people give of what they allege you said?

- 1 A. Yes, there are, Chairman.
- 2 727 Q. And would you agree that all of these meetings and
- interactions bar the car park one happened in public
- 4 places, and by that I mean places that are accessible
- 5 to other people and that people could have come across

17:17

17:17

17 · 17

- 6 you and could have entered at any point in time?
- 7 A. Absolutely, Chairman. That is the -- that is factually
- 8 correct.
- 9 728 Q. Did any journalist -- just moving to a different topic.
- 10 Did any journalist ask you any questions, any follow-up 17:17
- questions to anything that they had ever been told by
- 12 Superintendent Taylor?
- 13 A. No, never, Chairman.
- 14 729 Q. And I think, again I don't need to you go to them, but
- there are occasions described at page 595, which is
- 16 your interview with the Tribunal investigators, I don't
- 17 need you to look at it Mr. Callinan, where you explain
- occasions when you would have met journalists. Nobody
- 19 ever asked you at those type of occasions what's this
- about Sergeant McCabe, Dave has been telling us
- something, can he give us any more information?
- 22 A. No, that never happened, Chairman, no.
- 23 730 Q. Just turning then to Ms. O'Doherty's visit to your
- home. Is it fair to say, Mr. Callinan, that your
- concern and annoyance and upset about that was at the
- idea of a journalist knocking on the Garda
- 27 Commissioner's door late in the evening to follow up a
- 28 story?
- 29 A. That's essentially it, Chairman, yes.

1	731	Q.	And could you see it as being an acceptable or
2			tolerable situation that a person in the public eye,
3			such as the Commissioner of An Garda Síochána, could be
4			placed in a situation and a scenario where journalists
5			can feel free to pursue their stories by knocking on 17:
6			the Commissioner's door rather than making official
7			contact with the Commissioner's office or with the
8			Press Office?

- 9 A. Well, I didn't think it was appropriate, Chairman.

 10 And, you know, it has always been the case that the

 11 interaction between the media and the Gardaí are

 12 through the Press Office.
- 13 732 Now it's been put to you that this was about your Q. Yes. personal affairs so it shouldn't have gone through the 14 15 Press Office, but I think it is fair to say, and you 17:18 16 might differ with me if your understanding is different, that the gist of this story that ultimately 17 18 was published was that it was newsworthy because the 19 Commissioner of the Garda Commissioner had had penalty 20 points quashed whilst he was Deputy Commissioner of the 17:19 guards, isn't that right? 21
- 22 A. That's correct, Chairman, yes.
- 23 733 Q. Now I understand from what Mr. Harty put to you that in 24 fact Ms. O'Doherty was in frequent enough, it seems, 25 email contact with you about other matters, is that 26 right?

- 27 A. I would expect that was the position, certainly, yes.
- 28 734 Q. Did she ever send you an email to say, listen, I have 29 this Pulse entry, would you confirm that this is you?

_		Α.	No, certainty not, charrillan, no.	
2	735	Q.	You've agreed that you did ask Superintendent Taylor to	
3			take up the issue of a nighttime visit by a journalist	
4			to your private home with Ms. O'Doherty's employers,	
5			isn't that right?	17:19
6		Α.	I did indeed, Chairman.	
7	736	Q.	As far as you were aware that took place by a phone	
8			call that Superintendent Taylor placed to	
9			Ms. O'Doherty's employers, isn't that right?	
10		Α.	I believe that was the situation, Chairman, yes.	17:20
11	737	Q.	Did you direct or instruct him to also set up a meeting	
12			or have a meeting with Ms. O'Doherty's employers?	
13		Α.	No, Chairman.	
14	738	Q.	Now I just have a few areas that I want to cover very	
15			briefly, and I am conscious that I have gone	17:20
16			considerably over	
17			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18			MR. DIGNAM: the estimate.	
19			CHAIRMAN: 40 minutes over 30 minutes. One hour and	
20			ten minutes. But let's carry on.	17:20
21	739	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Mr. Callinan, it was, your phone contact	
22			log from your mobile phone, it was put to you that	
23			certain people's addresses or phone numbers rather were	
24			in your contact log, I don't know whether any point is	
25			being made about that, would you confirm and I don't	17:20
26			propose to open it up, would you confirm I think the	
27			FSNI have said that there were about 1200 contacts in	
28			your phone, would you confirm that amongst those there	
29			are very very many superintendents and chief	

1			superintendents of An Garda Síochána?	
2		Α.	Absolutely, Chairman, yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Honestly, I would expect that.	
4		Α.	Mr. Chairman.	
5	740	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Now, Mr. McDowell yesterday suggested that	17:21
6			history would have been very different but for the	
7			letter of the 4th July 2011, the Chief Superintendent	
8			Rooney letter, and that in those circumstances it was	
9			unreasonable to expect Sergeant McCabe to have engaged	
10			with the internal processes. To your knowledge has	17:21
11			Sergeant McCabe ever offered that as a reason for not	
12			having engaged with the O'Mahony investigation?	
13		Α.	Not to my knowledge, Chairman, no.	
14	741	Q.	Mr. McDowell opened the transcript of his meeting with	
15			Superintendent Curran when the direction/invitation	17:22
16			letter or circular was read out to him, there's nothing	
17			in that where Sergeant McCabe says, well, you can't	
18			expect me to go through the internal processes because	
19			of the way I was treated by Chief Superintendent	
20			Rooney's letter or indeed the Commissioner's response	17:22
21			to that, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
23	742	Q.	You suggested yesterday that the head of the National	
24			Bureau of Criminal Investigation sorry, whose name	
25			just escapes me?	17:22
26		Α.	Padraig Kenny, chief superintendent.	
27	743	Q.	Yes, thank you, Mr. Callinan may have been part of	
28			the O'Mahony investigation team and that may have been	
29			why he ended up interviewing Mr. Bernard McCabe?	

1		Α.	I think that might be the position, Chairman. I'm not	
2			a hundred percent sure but I think that is the	
3			situation.	
4	744	Q.	I don't need to you look at this	
5		Α.	Okay.	17:2
6	745	Q.	but on page 7155, Assistant Commissioner O'Mahony	
7			confirms that Chief Superintendent Kennedy was in fact	
8			a member of the investigation team.	
9		Α.	I thought so, yes. Thank you.	
10	746	Q.	Now just in relation to some of the questions that you	17:2
11			were asked by Ms. Burns about not bringing it to	
12			anybody's attention at an earlier stage that	
13			Superintendent Taylor had said that he would bring	
14			Nóirín O'Sullivan down, isn't it correct to say that	
15			that was referred to in your very first statement	17:2
16		Α.	It is, Chairman, yes.	
17	747	Q.	to the Tribunal. Yes. So on foot of the invitation	
18			and the call made by the Chairman for relevant	
19			information to be given you responded with a statement	
20			and in that statement you told the Tribunal of that	17:2

23 A. I did, Chairman, yes.

isn't that right?

21

22

24 748 Q. And that was on the 13th March 2017. In relation to
25 the penalty points and the quashing of your penalty
26 points issues, much was made of the fact that the Pulse
27 printout, which was attached to Ms. O'Doherty's tweet
28 of five days ago, didn't show who the driver of the car
29 was. You might correct me if I am wrong, Mr. Callinan,

conversation and that Superintendent Taylor said that,

1			but certainly in those days I think, probably still the	
2			same now, that the default position is that the owner	
3			of a car is fixed with the penalty points and it's up	
4			to the owner	
5		Α.	Nominate.	17:24
6	749	Q.	to nominate somebody else if they happen to be	
7			driving the car?	
8		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Or even if they don't happen to be driving	
10			the car. I'm making a joke. Right. I'm not saying	17:24
11			you would. But it has happened.	
12		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
13	750	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Then finally, just these issues,	
14			Mr. Callinan, Mr. Shatter gave evidence of him having	
15			asked you for information and I think he put it in	17:25
16			terms that he asked you whether there was any	
17			background information to explain why it was so	
18			difficult to deal with Sergeant McCabe about these	
19			issues, and Mr. Shatter gave some colourful	
20			descriptions of how he perceived those interactions to	17:25
21			be. And I think you've given today that, and indeed	
22			over the last few days, that you felt obliged to tell	
23			Mr. Shatter, who was your Minister at that time,	
24			anything that was in Sergeant McCabe's background that	
25			you felt he should know about, isn't that right?	17:25
26		Α.	I think I was obliged, statutorily obliged to do that,	
27			Chairman.	
28	751	Q.	Just in closing, Mr. Callinan, I think you'd accept	
29			that Superintendent Taylor is your principal accuser T	

1			mean is paragraph 1 of the terms of reference of this	
2			Tribunal, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	He is, Chairman, yes.	
4	752	Q.	The title of the Tribunal is the Disclosures Tribunal	
5			because it is into the protected disclosure made by	17:26
6			Superintendent Taylor, isn't that right?	
7		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
8	753	Q.	And from the outset, even before this Tribunal was	
9			established, you had denied any wrongdoing of the type	
10			that had been alleged against you by Superintendent	17:26
11			Taylor, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	I had, Chairman, yes.	
13	754	Q.	Ms. Burns pointed out that you didn't give that denial	
14			in the first two letters in response to Judge O'Neill.	
15			I think is it fair to say that Judge O'Neill was doing	17:26
16			a scoping exercise, so he needed to know whether there	
17			was a dispute between you or not, but you were focused	
18			on dealing with the substance of the allegations that	
19			are made against you, so that you could put your	
20			position, is that fair?	17:27
21		Α.	That's fair, Chairman. And with considerable legal	
22			advice as well.	
23	755	Q.	And then when it became clear that Judge O'Neill needed	
24			to know from the point of view of a scoping exercise	
25			that there was a dispute that couldn't be resolved you	17:27
26			said you fully deny any of the wrongdoing of the type	
27			alleged by Superintendent Taylor, isn't that right?	
28		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	

29 756 Q. And the Tribunal has that correspondence and can see

1			the terms of your denial and indeed the fact that you	
2			repeatedly say in your correspondence with Judge	
3			O'Neill that you need to know the specifics and details	
4			of the allegations against you, you repeat that over	
5			and over again in that correspondence?	17:27
6		Α.	Correct, Chairman, yes.	
7	757	Q.	And indeed you repeated that to this Tribunal on the	
8			first page of your statement on page 640 of the booklet	
9			where you say it's very difficult to deal with this	
10			because it's all so vague and unspecific and lacking in	17:28
11			detail, but here, here's my account of things to the	
12			best that I can do in the absence of any details?	
13		Α.	Chairman.	
14	758	Q.	Is it fair to say that you expected, Mr. Callinan, that	
15			if there was any truth to the allegations made by	17:28
16			Superintendent Taylor that he would have provided some	
17			minimum level of detail to this Tribunal?	
18		Α.	That would be a minimum expectation, Chairman.	
19	759	Q.	And I think you will have no difficulty agreeing that	
20			this Tribunal has gone to enormous lengths to provide	17:28
21			Superintendent Taylor with every opportunity to give a	
22			shred of detail about his interactions or alleged	
23			interactions with journalists which formed the basis of	
24			his allegations against you, would you agree with that?	
25		Α.	I saw that, Chairman, absolutely, yes, and I agree	17:28
26			fully with it.	
27	760	Q.	Mr. McGuinness, indeed the Chair and other parties	
28			repeatedly asked Superintendent Taylor for details or	
29			specifics and the closest that Superintendent Taylor	

1			came to giving detail was to say that when he was	
2			briefing on the phone, his location was at the other	
3			end of the phone, and when he was asked whether	
4			briefings took place during the day or night he	
5			couldn't answer save to say that it was some time	17:29
6			within the 24 hour clock. So they are the only	
7			specifics that Superintendent Taylor gave and	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes. That was a memorable answer,	
9			certainly. The 24 hour cycle in fact I think is what	
10			he said.	17:29
11	761	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: So in the absence of that detail and	
12			specifics, Mr. Callinan, allowing for that continuing	
13			lack of detail or information are you still comfortable	
14			telling this Tribunal that you didn't participate or	
15			engage in any of the or direct any of the wrongdoing	17:29
16			which is alleged against you by Superintendent Taylor?	
17		Α.	Absolutely, Chairman. There was no campaign and I did	
18			not direct any campaign to negatively brief against	
19			Sergeant McCabe.	
20			MR. DIGNAM: Thanks, Mr. Callinan.	17:30
21			CHAIRMAN: Thank, you. Is there anything,	
22			Mr. Marrinan?	
23			MR. MARRINAN: Yes, just one matter, sir.	
24				
25			THE WITNESS WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN AS FOLLOWS:	17:30
26	762	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Mr. Callinan, obviously you're in	
27			conflict with a large number of witnesses who have	
28			given evidence already to the Tribunal but perhaps just	
29			if I can deal with one area where there doesn't appear	

to be any conflict at all, indeed you commented on it
in your evidence on the first day you were giving
evidence when I brought you to the draft letter or
notes or whatever you wish to call it, in relation the
private dispute between Gerald Kean and Maurice McCabe
and you said that it wasn't your finest hour.

7 A. Yes, Chairman.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 8 763 That being so, and I think that Superintendent Frank Ο. 9 walsh and yourself both identified that this was wholly inappropriate, to be sending this or to be drafting it 10 17:31 11 in the first instance and then in the second instance to be sending it to Mr. Kean, even though it 12 13 subsequently did make its way to Mr. Kean and formed part of his letter in defence that he sent to Sergeant 14 15 McCabe, but that being not your finest hour, what do 17:31 16 you think caused you to behave inappropriately at that 17 time in relation to Sergeant McCabe? 18
 - A. Well, it was just the matter of the way the correspondence, it came to me, and my initial thoughts and my thought process and then I decided this isn't the way to go and I stopped. I had that discussion with the private secretary, Frank Walsh, and we both agreed it wasn't the way to go. And he subsequently went to see Mr. Kean and I was aware of that. I was absolutely aware of that.

17:31

17:32

26 764 Q. I'm not going to go back over it again, we've dealt
27 with the issue of the non-disclosure of the discussion
28 with Mr. Kean on Saturday 24th and also your
29 non-disclosure to Superintendent Frank Walsh of that

- earlier conversation. We have been through all that.
- 2 A. Yes, Chairman.
- 3 765 Q. One could discern from that, that you were slightly
- 4 embarrassed to tell Superintendent Frank Walsh that you
- 5 had had the discussion that you had with Gerald Kean
- 6 prior to him going on the Marian Finucane show, is that

17:32

17:33

- 7 right?
- 8 A. Well, I can see where that point might be raised but
- 9 that wasn't the case, Chairman.
- 10 766 Q. Well, it was either that or what Gerald Kean says;
- 11 namely, that you said that you wanted to keep the
- conversation between yourselves, that Superintendent
- 13 Frank Walsh wasn't told?
- 14 A. No, Chairman. That's not correct.
- 15 767 Q. All right.
- 16 A. I certainly didn't say that.
- 17 768 Q. Well regardless, I mean the Tribunal has been
- confronted, for example, with Diarmuid O'Sullivan
- coming in, when clearly he had phone contact with
- 20 Gerald Kean, and clearly had phone contact with you,
- 21 not only on the Saturday but also on the Sunday --
- 22 A. No, sorry, chief superintendent -- retired Chief
- 23 Superintendent O'Sullivan didn't have contact with me
- 24 until the Sunday evening.
- 25 769 Q. Yeah. Well, whatever. I mean, he's coming in here and 17:33
- he claims that he has no recollection at all of
- 27 Saturday or Sunday. Did you speak to Diarmuid
- 28 O'Sullivan in the recent past?
- 29 A. No. Chairman.

Т	//0	Q.	Did you speak to Mr. Kean either at the end of last	
2			year or the beginning of 2017 or this year?	
3		Α.	I don't have any recollection at all of speaking	
4	771	Q.	Well, did you or didn't you? Whether you have	
5			recollection now or not, did you or didn't you?	17:34
6		Α.	I'm sorry, I did not have any contact with Mr. Kean.	
7	772	Q.	All right, that is fine. So Mr. Kean didn't contact	
8			you and advise you that he was going to refer to you in	
9			his defence to the civil action being brought by	
10			Maurice McCabe?	17:34
11		Α.	In the recent past?	
12	773	Q.	well, at all.	
13			CHAIRMAN: It's a good while ago, but it is in the	
14			defence. It's a public interest defence, a defence to	
15			libel. The public had a legitimate interest and he	17:34
16			checked his sources prior to making a comment. So that	
17			is what Mr. Marrinan is asking: At any time did he	
18			tell you look, you're going to be in the defence?	
19		Α.	No, certainly not, Chairman. Sorry, I beg your pardon.	
20			I just didn't pick you up properly there.	17:35
21	774	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Or his solicitors didn't contact you to	
22			advise you of that?	
23		Α.	No, no. Certainly not, Chairman, no. Certainly not.	
24	775	Q.	When you communicated with the Tribunal with your first	
25			statement, which was your third supplemental statement	17:35
26			to the Tribunal, you weren't aware of the fact that	
27			Gerald Kean was stating that he had received this	
28			information from you?	
29		Α.	No, I was not, Chairman.	

- 1 776 Q. And of course we know that you didn't include any
 2 reference to the Saturday conversation in that
 3 statement, that you initially provided to the Tribunal.
- A. No, because initially, as I've said already, Chairman,

 I didn't even remember the letter in the first place

 until I got it and I didn't remember the sequence of

 phone calls. I knew I had spoken to Mr. Kean but I

 didn't remember the series of phone calls.
- well, you see, that may feed into the suggestion that 9 777 Q. could be made that you and Mr. Kean had agreed not to 10 17:35 11 refer to this, to this conversation and that that's why 12 we weren't told about it and that is why you didn't 13 tell Superintendent Frank Walsh about it and that is 14 why Diarmuid O'Sullivan has no recollection of this at 15 all. Do you see how a lot of that could possibly be 17:36 16 seen to fit together?
- 17 I take the point you're making, Mr. Marrinan, Α. 18 absolutely. But I have indicated at the first 19 available opportunity when I saw those records that the chief superintendent, retired chief superintendent 20 17:36 spoke to me on the Sunday and he did indicate to me 21 22 that he was aware that I had been speaking with 23 Mr. Kean but we didn't discuss what we had been talking 24 about and he went on to deal with something, a very 25 sensitive issue, an operational issue which he had 17:36 dealt with me on a number of occasions subsequent to 26 27 that phone call.
- 28 778 Q. Well, in any event, if we just down to this not being 29 your finest hour, I mean, you've just given evidence to

Τ			the Chairman, talking about the responsibilities of the	
2			Garda Commissioner, and all the weighty issues that had	
3			to be dealt with on a daily basis, and indeed the	
4			number of crises that were plaguing the Gardaí at this	
5			time, I mean the notion of you sitting down and	17:37
6			drafting this letter in the first person for Mr. Kean	
7			might suggest that you were doing it to do down Maurice	
8			McCabe and to join with Mr. Kean in responding to	
9			Maurice McCabe's legitimate concerns that he had about	
10			the radio broadcast?	17:38
11		Α.	No, Chairman. That isn't true. That is not true.	
12	779	Q.	Well, when you said that it wasn't your finest hour,	
13			you meant that in the narrow sense that you've	
14			explained a few moments ago, is that so?	
15		Α.	Well, it wasn't the appropriate thing to do. I have	17:38
16			said that.	
17			MR. MARRINAN: Okay, thank you very much.	
18		Α.	Thank you very much.	
19				
20			THE WITNESS WAS THEN QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN,	17:38
21			AS FOLLOWS:	
22	780	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I have just got a couple of questions, I	
23			don't mean to delay people. Did you ever hear any	
24			reference to any other offences and Maurice McCabe, any	
25			other alleged offences and Maurice McCabe?	17:38
26		Α.	No, Chairman.	
27	781	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Because in the D household there was talk	
28			about him stopping around outside secondary schools and	
29			odling school girls. I mean none of this is true	

1			There was reference to a girl who was sexually	
2			assaulted by him in Cootehill, again talked about in	
3			the D household. And then when Laura Brophy rang to	
4			say, look, I have made a mistake and this is what I	
5			have written down and it's incorrect, the first	17:39
6			question asked by Ms. D was, oh, is that another	
7			allegation made against Maurice McCabe? So, did you	
8			have any communication with the D family of any kind?	
9		Α.	No, Chairman, no. And you're investigators asked me	
10			about that	17:39
11	782	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
12		Α.	and I clarified.	
13	783	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sure, okay. While you were Garda	
14			Commissioner, this is the second question, was there	
15			anyone within the force or outside the force to whom	17:39
16			you could actually pour out your innermost thoughts, be	
17			they deeply politically incorrect or perhaps another a	
18			friend, someone who would actually listen to you?	
19		Α.	No, Chairman, I didn't consult anybody in that period,	
20			no.	17:39
21	784	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, I don't mean consult anybody. I meant	
22			maybe there's somebody the odd time could you have	
23			lunch with whatever, and tell that person I'm having a	
24			dreadful time and mention a whole load of things,	
25			whatever you like, and I'm not saying politicians are	17:39
26			dreadful, journalists are dreadful, and it's a witch	
27			hunt, etcetera, that kind of thing, I am not saying any	
28			of that might be true but you might feel that or a	
29			person in a position of authority might feel that and	

1			might feel the need to get that off their chest?	
2		Α.	Yes. No. I didn't have those conversations, Chairman.	
3	785	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. I'm still puzzled as to how you chose	
4			David Taylor because whatever way you look at it must	
5			have been one of the worst mistakes of your life.	17:40
6		Α.	I absolutely agree, Chairman.	
7	786	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is there something I don't know about?	
8			Because I can't for the life of me imagine why you	
9			decided to pick him, speaking only from the point of	
10			view of potential qualification or competence?	17:40
11		Α.	Well, Chairman, I looked at the list, the available	
12			superintendents at that time on the list, and I saw	
13			that he was someone, as I said, that had a background	
14			internationally and nationally and I thought he would	
15			be a good choice and that's why I put him in there.	17:40
16			And you know, the rest, as they say, is history in	
17			relation to what has unfolded. But that wasn't the	
18			perception I had of Superintendent Taylor and I had	
19			absolutely no inkling about what he was at.	
20	787	Q.	CHAIRMAN: All right. Did you ever visit Drayton	17:41
21			Manor?	
22		Α.	No, I did not, Chairman.	
23	788	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is there a possibility or are you raising	
24			this as a possibility or do you consider it is a	
25			possibility, because unfortunately I'm in the position,	17:41
26			it's not like a normal civil case, I have to actually	
27			give an account of what I believe as a probability	
28			happened, whether people are telling me the truth or	
29			not telling me the truth, that is actually my job, I	

1 have to report on that, and clearly it has to be based 2 on something, but is there any possibility that David Taylor went about this expedition entirely on his own 3 without any consultation with you and without ever 4 5 telling you about it or without you ever getting an 17:41 inkling of what he was up to, whatever that was? 6 7 well, that's absolutely the case, Chairman. Α. 8 knowledge whatsoever in relation to the campaign or the briefing, if that is the case. I have no knowledge. 9 certainly didn't direct anything. Absolutely not. 10 17 · 42 11 There was no campaign as far as I was concerned. And I 12 have no knowledge of anybody being involved in a 13 campaign of that nature. 14 789 Q. CHAI RMAN: well then the supplemental is: well, let's 15 suppose he did it on his own what possible benefit 17:42 16 could it have been to him? How would it possibly 17 advance him within the Garda organisation unless, and 18 the possibility is, one possibility, the Garda 19 organisation was hostile to Sergeant McCabe and by 20 being hostile and doing bad things vis-à-vis Sergeant 17:42 McCabe he was going to curry favour, is he that 21 devious? 22 23 I don't know, Chairman. I certainly don't know. Α. 24 didn't know about his activities until I read the 25 material that's presented to me. But it certainly a 17:42 side of superintendent McCabe -- or, I beg your pardon, 26

same position.

of Superintendent Taylor that I knew nothing about.

And I know a number of other colleagues that are in the

27

28

29

Т	/90	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You will understand that by asking that	
2			question I'm not saying that Superintendent Taylor was	
3			devious or deceitful or was engaged in bad things, I	
4			haven't made my mind up on anything at all, I am simply	
5			putting these propositions out there so that you can	17:43
6			perhaps give me some assistance and if you're not in a	
7			position to, and you have indicated you can't, I'm	
8			going to make my mind up obviously later on, but thank	
9			you for your help.	
10		Α.	I understand. Thank you very much, Chairman.	17:43
11			CHAIRMAN: It's been a long day and we can go off	
12			transcript. Mr. McGuinness, just tell us, please, what	
13			is happening next.	
14				
15			THE TRIBUNAL THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL TUESDAY, 29TH MAY	17:43
16			2018 AT 10: 00AM	
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
29				

	406 m 400:04	07:27 00:20 00:20	207 to 200-0 000-0	_
<u> </u>	126 [1] - 126:21 13 [1] - 222:12	87:27, 89:20, 89:28, 98:25, 98:27, 102:13	207 [2] - 203:3, 203:6 20th [2] - 8:16,	4
	13 [1] - 222.12 13,000 [1] - 207:20	2006 [19] - 73:12,	102:17	
'11 [1] - 60:22	131 [1] - 5:6	74:6, 76:7, 119:27,	21 [2] - 2:25, 220:5	4 [7] - 4:8, 4:21,
'12 [2] - 6:24, 167:25		120:8, 121:19, 122:7,	211 [1] - 225:8	59:21, 80:27, 80:28,
'13 [3] - 60:22,	1346 [1] - 207:3	120:0, 121:19, 122:7,		81:10, 133:28
137:18, 175:5	1347 [1] - 41:24	123:24, 123:27,	2165 [1] - 231:25	40 [1] - 243:19
'14 [5] - 26:29, 32:5,	1348 [1] - 43:14	123:24, 123:27,	22 [2] - 125:26, 126:2	41 [4] - 78:19, 83:20,
68:21, 75:17, 114:10	1349 [1] - 46:21	125:29, 126:9, 128:2,	22nd [1] - 34:23	124:20, 124:26
'16 [2] - 75:5, 75:21	13th [6] - 29:10,	130:2, 176:3, 176:8	22ND [2] - 1:18, 6:1	43 [1] - 232:25
'alarmed' [1] -	87:25, 98:24, 113:28,	2007 [5] - 145:21,	23rd [15] - 26:29,	45 [1] - 232:25
108:21	137:20, 245:24		75:17, 89:27, 174:21,	4615 [1] - 34:10
'benefactors' [1] -	14 [2] - 24:29, 171:21	148:18, 153:8,	175:29, 176:22,	4616 [1] - 106:24
• •	1402 [1] - 208:9	155:13, 168:5	207:2, 216:29,	
212:10	142 [1] - 5:7	2008 [2] - 168:3,	219:12, 229:6,	48 [1] - 179:5
'direction' [4] -	144 [1] - 125:22	168:7	229:11, 235:8,	4th [6] - 57:29,
139:9, 139:27, 140:1,	145 [1] - 5:8	2009 [1] - 167:25	235:10, 235:14,	58:23, 60:22, 61:15,
140:22	1470 [2] - 218:3,	2011 [9] - 58:1,	237:25	77:20, 244:7
'disgusting' [1] -	218:6	58:23, 59:21, 59:29,	24 [2] - 249:6, 249:9	F
180:25	1490 [1] - 220:2	60:2, 61:15, 149:23,	249 [1] - 5:12	5
'fiddles [1] - 186:17	1491 [1] - 220:4	219:12, 244:7	24th [12] - 22:19,	
'hashtag [3] -	14th [6] - 6:24,	2012 [6] - 25:4,	26:22, 32:5, 68:2,	5 [6] - 41:24, 80:28,
209:29, 210:1, 210:5	23:21, 25:4, 47:28,	33:19, 37:29, 47:29,	68:21, 114:9, 137:6,	81:11, 82:15, 179:5,
'hello' [2] - 220:25,	218:6, 218:15	149:23, 205:7	194:6, 212:6, 229:6,	207:3
221:24	15 [2] - 185:27, 238:9	2013 [18] - 6:13,	234:11, 250:28	51 [1] - 4:7
'is [1] - 154:1	15/20 [1] - 188:21	8:16, 9:8, 14:21,	254 [1] - 5:13	574 [1] - 78:12
'Jockey' [1] - 182:4	1503 [1] - 218:29	14:27, 17:26, 22:15,	25th [2] - 60:1, 61:4	574 [1] - 78:12 575 [1] - 78:24
'kiddie [7] - 185:28,	151 [1] - 180:19	59:13, 131:17,	26 [2] - 22:16, 59:9	577 [2] - 79:8, 79:12
186:4, 186:12,	15th [3] - 144:1,	142:24, 149:25,	264 [1] - 171:3	1
186:18, 187:11,	164:16, 168:7	149:27, 163:11,	26th [6] - 75:5,	579 [1] - 83:11
230:12, 230:14	16 [2] - 1:6, 218:11	164:11, 164:12,	75:21, 77:26, 86:27,	580 [1] - 83:12
'next [1] - 157:15	165 [3] - 14:1, 14:2,	170:20, 170:21, 205:7	88:12, 111:8	581 [1] - 84:8
'queries [1] - 159:5	14:6	2014 [15] - 1:4,	27 [2] - 7:21, 8:18	582 [1] - 85:2
'quite [1] - 144:5	166 [1] - 13:27	17:23, 22:19, 26:23,	28 [1] - 9:4	583 [1] - 85:10
'stopped' [1] - 149:2	16th [3] - 86:4,	32:4, 33:20, 34:23,	28th [6] - 9:8, 79:9,	584 [1] - 86:5
'this [3] - 230:24,	86:25, 209:23	39:29, 68:2, 142:8,	83:2, 137:18, 231:19,	585 [1] - 89:19
230:25, 231:17	17 [4] - 1:10, 34:11,	142:25, 174:21,	231:21	586 [1] - 89:28
'you [2] - 184:8,	106:24, 222:10	176:1, 205:7, 219:12	29 [1] - 59:22	587 [1] - 90:1
238:1	170 [1] - 5:9	2015 [1] - 112:10	29TH [1] - 258:15	595 [1] - 241:15
'you're [1] - 173:1	174 [1] - 5:10	2016 [17] - 77:15,	29th [1] - 60:23	5th [2] - 60:24, 77:20
	174 [1] - 5.10 176 [1] - 17:10	77:26, 79:10, 83:2,		
1		83:10, 84:7, 85:1,	3	6
-	17th [4] - 22:15,	86:5, 86:25, 86:27,		
	132:7, 133:10, 209:24	88:12, 89:17, 89:27,		6 rol 5:4 240:0
1 [6] - 3:31, 80:27,	18 [2] - 2:29, 34:22	111:8, 112:13, 144:1,	3 [1] - 84:12	6 [2] - 5:4, 218:6
203:4, 203:5, 203:6,	189 [1] - 56:22	219:12	30 [1] - 243:19	60 [2] - 238:6, 238:7
247:1	18th [1] - 89:16	2017 [15] - 1:6, 1:10,	300 [1] - 205:12	601 [2] - 102:13,
1,189 [1] - 56:23	1921 [1] - 1:10	87:26, 98:24, 100:11,	3033 [2] - 49:3, 49:4	102:19
100 [2] - 59:3	1981 [1] - 182:9	102:17, 104:6,	30th [2] - 77:15,	62 [4] - 51:24,
100% [1] - 93:26	199 [1] - 5:11	171:23, 218:6,	104:6	232:25, 238:6, 238:7
10:00AM [1] - 258:16	19th [2] - 163:11,	218:15, 219:1,	31st [3] - 33:19, 83:9,	63 [4] - 217:15,
10th [2] - 85:1, 219:1	164:12	223:24, 231:19,	171:23	217:16, 222:4, 225:8
11 [2] - 49:8, 223:11	1st [3] - 8:24, 33:19,	245:24, 252:2	32 [1] - 2:12	64 [2] - 6:9, 13:26
11:00am [1] - 221:17	167:24	2018 [4] - 1:18, 6:2,	35 [3] - 120:2,	640 [2] - 87:27, 248:8
11th [2] - 170:20,		231:22, 258:16	120:19, 232:25	648 [2] - 98:25, 98:27
170:21	2	204 [2] - 217:15,	36 [1] - 233:28	66 [2] - 126:20,
12 [2] - 222:14,		222:6	3670 [1] - 171:21	203:25
225:10	2 1401 2:25 2:0	205 [2] - 222:4,	37 [1] - 185:27	67 [2] - 170:17,
1200 [1] - 243:27	2 [18] - 2:25, 3:8,	223:10	J. [1] 100.21	170:25
1200 1 - 243.21	3:13, 4:4, 4:4, 4:22,		1	690 [1] - 232:11
		206 [2] - 217:16.		000 [1] LOL.11
125 [2] - 126:20, 126:21	78:13, 79:8, 83:10, 84:8, 85:2, 86:5,	206 [2] - 217:16, 217:18		6th [3] - 84:7,

164:19, 164:20	156:28, 163:20,	10:21, 129:26	60:29	advance [3] - 18:4,
	173:4, 173:14,	account [22] - 22:12,	action [15] - 1:28,	18:26, 257:17
7	176:28, 181:6,	22:13, 108:2, 110:2,	17:17, 37:25, 40:10,	advanced [1] - 42:14
	181:14, 182:18,	138:12, 179:25,	40:19, 41:7, 44:8,	advancing [3] -
7 0.40 0:00	194:14, 194:25,	181:12, 184:3,	44:25, 47:21, 60:12,	21:26, 22:3, 22:5
7 [3] - 2:12, 2:30,	199:12, 204:18,	186:16, 197:2,	60:14, 80:14, 116:7,	adverb [1] - 207:26
4:12	206:2, 208:22,	209:20, 218:4, 220:8,	195:6, 252:9	adverted [1] - 130:12
7155 [1] - 245:6	208:27, 210:12,	230:18, 230:19,	actions [3] - 104:25,	advice [15] - 11:9,
7237 [2] - 59:9, 59:18	211:24, 212:19,	232:8, 233:9, 237:21,	107:26, 180:23	47:10, 47:20, 48:11,
7256 [1] - 22:16	213:8, 213:10,	248:11, 256:27	actively [2] - 118:11,	53:18, 92:15, 109:28,
7356 [2] - 7:21, 8:18	213:15, 216:15,	accounts [6] - 229:7,	119:2	112:27, 112:29,
7382 [3] - 147:10,	216:21, 221:15,	229:10, 232:21,	activities [2] -	235:8, 239:2, 239:13,
209:12, 209:17	224:22, 224:28,	233:1, 233:3, 240:28	205:16, 257:24	247:22
7384 [1] - 147:11	227:25, 228:21,	Accounts [22] - 11:8,	activity [1] - 217:13	advices [1] - 116:14
77 [4] - 5:5, 125:20,	236:12, 240:26,	26:28, 28:2, 29:9,	ACTIVITY [1] - 4:1	advise [4] - 109:21,
170:15, 233:28	241:7, 244:2, 248:25,	40:7, 75:18, 144:6,	actor [1] - 105:5	116:13, 252:8, 252:22
78 [2] - 120:2, 120:19	249:17, 250:25,	175:4, 175:7, 177:24,	1	
7th [1] - 77:20	253:18, 256:6,	179:17, 179:21,	acts [1] - 53:28	advised [11] - 9:18,
[:] - : · ·	256:19, 257:7, 257:10	183:28, 187:18,	actual [5] - 23:20,	9:24, 47:10, 84:15,
8	abuse [1] - 225:13	192:5, 192:23,	47:25, 92:3, 100:18,	86:15, 90:8, 99:19,
U	abused [1] - 191:5	195:10, 195:14,	180:5	110:26, 112:5,
	abusing [1] - 130:29	196:23, 219:4,	adamant [1] - 15:20	142:10, 152:1
8 [4] - 2:20, 3:23,	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		add [10] - 103:22,	adviser [1] - 15:6
4:27, 180:20	accept [37] - 8:5, 8:6,	219:11, 220:10	104:24, 105:21,	advisers [2] - 171:9,
80 [1] - 1:18	16:4, 27:24, 42:11,	accuracy [1] - 43:11	107:3, 107:16,	198:9
8:30/9:00 [1] - 156:8	60:17, 60:20, 65:15,	accurate [1] - 223:26	107:18, 110:25,	affair [1] - 113:8
8th [1] - 60:25	82:17, 83:1, 87:21,	accusation [2] -	113:16, 204:5, 240:4	affairs [7] - 154:19,
	90:20, 91:25, 95:17,	40:1, 51:29	added [1] - 103:23	154:20, 154:25,
9	95:26, 105:8, 108:6,	accusations [6] -	adding [1] - 76:1	214:20, 214:27,
	131:23, 134:19,	121:9, 121:27, 122:8,	addition [1] - 114:8	215:1, 242:14
	134:26, 144:16,	123:15, 123:24, 199:5	address [19] - 54:4,	affirmation [1] -
9 [1] - 180:20	152:13, 152:24,	accused [4] - 19:21,	100:25, 113:2, 114:1,	11:10
9-15 [1] - 4:16	153:4, 153:7, 163:16,	73:2, 140:29, 239:17	145:25, 153:13,	AFTER [2] - 102:1,
9th [4] - 31:18,	171:15, 178:9, 191:1,	accuser [1] - 246:29	153:15, 155:6,	199:24
31:21, 31:22, 168:4	198:14, 200:24,	accuses [1] - 237:25	156:22, 158:20,	afternoon [3] -
	201:13, 228:15,	accusing [9] - 19:23,	158:29, 159:6, 159:9,	102:3, 102:4, 131:9
Α	236:9, 237:4, 246:28	52:4, 52:8, 53:10,	159:16, 159:21,	afterwards [2] -
	acceptable [2] -	196:26, 197:4, 197:6,	159:27, 160:11,	30:7, 156:11
44 405.07	10:12, 242:1	239:17, 240:20	160:12, 209:16	agenda [6] - 42:21,
A4 [1] - 195:27	accepted [10] - 23:2,	achieve [1] - 236:11	addressed [9] - 8:20,	82:8, 97:12, 98:22,
able [4] - 34:20,	32:8, 82:23, 88:29,	achieved [1] -	40.00 07.0 04.0	, - , ,
0= 04 0= 06 : :-			18:28, 37:2, 61:2,	134:12, 135:26
35:21, 85:28, 199:19	117:6, 117:20, 173:9,	237:13	83:25, 113:25,	
above-named [1] -	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21,	237:13 achieving [1] -		134:12, 135:26
above-named [1] - 1:27	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11	237:13	83:25, 113:25,	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19	237:13 achieving [1] -	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] -	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13,	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] -	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] -	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] -	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26,	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] -	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29,	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] -	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26,	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] -	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] -	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] -	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] -	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] -	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21,	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] -	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] - 241:4	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21, 51:23, 124:20	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] - 101:3, 258:15	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27, 65:27, 67:29, 70:19,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24, 69:27, 88:28, 98:17,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] - 241:4 accessing [2] -	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21, 51:23, 124:20 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] - 101:3, 258:15 ADJOURNMENT [1]	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27, 65:27, 67:29, 70:19, 72:21, 74:25, 105:26,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24, 69:27, 88:28, 98:17, 106:1, 106:12,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] - 241:4 accessing [2] - 49:25, 140:14	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21, 51:23, 124:20 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9 act [2] - 46:17, 178:12	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] - 101:3, 258:15 ADJOURNMENT [1] - 199:24	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27, 65:27, 67:29, 70:19, 72:21, 74:25, 105:26, 107:10, 112:16,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24, 69:27, 88:28, 98:17, 106:1, 106:12, 107:10, 109:19,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] - 241:4 accessing [2] - 49:25, 140:14 accompany [1] -	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21, 51:23, 124:20 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9 act [2] - 46:17, 178:12 acted [3] - 112:27,	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] - 101:3, 258:15 ADJOURNMENT [1] - 199:24 adopt [4] - 72:9,	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27, 65:27, 67:29, 70:19, 72:21, 74:25, 105:26, 107:10, 112:16, 136:3, 150:17,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24, 69:27, 88:28, 98:17, 106:1, 106:12, 107:10, 109:19, 111:19, 115:1, 115:3,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] - 241:4 accessing [2] - 49:25, 140:14 accompany [1] - 14:29	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21, 51:23, 124:20 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9 act [2] - 46:17, 178:12 acted [3] - 112:27, 124:26, 178:10	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] - 101:3, 258:15 ADJOURNMENT [1] - 199:24 adopt [4] - 72:9, 136:24, 174:16, 188:5	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27, 65:27, 67:29, 70:19, 72:21, 74:25, 105:26, 107:10, 112:16, 136:3, 150:17, 168:25, 172:25,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24, 69:27, 88:28, 98:17, 106:1, 106:12, 107:10, 109:19, 111:19, 115:1, 115:3, 115:14, 130:17,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] - 241:4 accessing [2] - 49:25, 140:14 accompany [1] - 14:29 accordance [1] - 173:26	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21, 51:23, 124:20 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9 act [2] - 46:17, 178:12 acted [3] - 112:27, 124:26, 178:10 acting [5] - 63:15,	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] - 101:3, 258:15 ADJOURNMENT [1] - 199:24 adopt [4] - 72:9, 136:24, 174:16, 188:5 adopted [2] - 16:25,	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27, 65:27, 67:29, 70:19, 72:21, 74:25, 105:26, 107:10, 112:16, 136:3, 150:17, 168:25, 172:25, 174:25, 175:9,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24, 69:27, 88:28, 98:17, 106:1, 106:12, 107:10, 109:19, 111:19, 115:1, 115:3, 115:14, 130:17, 131:1, 131:2, 131:25,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] - 241:4 accessing [2] - 49:25, 140:14 accompany [1] - 14:29 accordance [1] -	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21, 51:23, 124:20 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9 act [2] - 46:17, 178:12 acted [3] - 112:27, 124:26, 178:10 acting [5] - 63:15, 67:20, 103:21, 155:7,	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] - 101:3, 258:15 ADJOURNMENT [1] - 199:24 adopt [4] - 72:9, 136:24, 174:16, 188:5 adopted [2] - 16:25, 85:7	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27, 65:27, 67:29, 70:19, 72:21, 74:25, 105:26, 107:10, 112:16, 136:3, 150:17, 168:25, 172:25, 174:25, 175:9, 176:19, 180:7,
above-named [1] - 1:27 abroad [1] - 200:15 absence [2] - 248:12, 249:11 absolute [1] - 61:18 absolutely [70] - 17:3, 18:23, 20:25, 21:18, 39:21, 42:12, 59:3, 63:3, 68:24, 69:27, 88:28, 98:17, 106:1, 106:12, 107:10, 109:19, 111:19, 115:1, 115:3, 115:14, 130:17, 131:1, 131:2, 131:25, 134:20, 136:3,	117:6, 117:20, 173:9, 178:21, 226:21, 228:11 accepting [1] - 88:19 accepts [2] - 226:13, 226:17 access [5] - 43:26, 48:19, 69:28, 69:29, 103:26 accessible [1] - 241:4 accessing [2] - 49:25, 140:14 accompany [1] - 14:29 accordance [1] - 173:26 according [2] -	237:13 achieving [1] - 236:11 acknowledge [1] - 10:27 acknowledged [3] - 13:20, 79:20, 79:21 acknowledgement [2] - 12:6, 99:4 Act [3] - 48:21, 51:23, 124:20 ACT [2] - 1:4, 1:9 act [2] - 46:17, 178:12 acted [3] - 112:27, 124:26, 178:10 acting [5] - 63:15,	83:25, 113:25, 114:10, 158:24, 161:7 addresses [1] - 243:23 addressing [1] - 217:28 adequate [1] - 205:21 adjective [1] - 207:26 ADJOURNED [2] - 101:3, 258:15 ADJOURNMENT [1] - 199:24 adopt [4] - 72:9, 136:24, 174:16, 188:5 adopted [2] - 16:25,	134:12, 135:26 agendas [1] - 82:2 aging [1] - 205:13 ago [11] - 24:29, 94:7, 142:17, 162:3, 166:28, 209:24, 210:7, 231:22, 245:28, 252:13, 254:14 agree [46] - 30:24, 42:1, 57:4, 57:7, 59:3, 62:8, 63:3, 63:27, 65:27, 67:29, 70:19, 72:21, 74:25, 105:26, 107:10, 112:16, 136:3, 150:17, 168:25, 172:25, 174:25, 175:9,

213:2, 213:15,	72:7, 72:11, 73:12,	233:21, 238:3	75:14, 92:2, 92:4,	147:2
217:26, 217:29,	74:7, 75:8, 75:28,	alleges [6] - 68:20,	93:9, 94:7, 97:18,	applied [1] - 150:29
223:29, 224:28,	76:6, 76:7, 76:10,	74:24, 81:14, 107:22,	103:3, 103:5, 109:8,	applied [1] = 130:23
226:15, 230:29,	78:2, 78:20, 78:27,	118:10, 237:28	120:20, 121:12,	146:26, 169:29,
232:3, 240:21,	79:4, 79:6, 79:16,	·	121:22, 121:28,	208:23
240:24, 240:26,	79:23, 79:25, 79:27,	alleging [3] - 74:6, 76:9, 106:3	122:11, 122:29,	
240:27, 241:2,	80:11, 80:13, 80:15,	· ·	123:29, 125:18,	appointed [4] - 9:2,
248:24, 248:25, 256:6	80:20, 80:22, 81:29,	allies [1] - 70:10	131:3, 140:23,	200:10, 200:19,
	82:11, 82:21, 82:22,	allow [6] - 44:29,	142:29, 161:21,	200:24
agreed [8] - 58:6, 75:19, 144:10,	82:25, 82:26, 83:3,	97:29, 130:13,	165:4, 169:18,	appointment [1] -
· ·	83:8, 83:15, 83:24,	135:11, 136:23,	179:13, 192:21,	188:13
194:20, 217:7, 243:2, 250:23, 253:10	84:10, 84:16, 84:26,	207:24	192:27, 197:11,	appreciate [9] -
agreeing [3] - 64:22,	85:15, 85:16, 85:19,	allowed [2] - 51:23,	203:9, 220:13,	24:23, 26:11, 26:12,
66:14, 248:19	85:21, 85:24, 86:18,	54:1	221:10, 249:5, 249:8	26:14, 28:18, 61:4,
	86:21, 86:23, 86:28,	allowing [1] - 249:12	answered [2] - 92:5,	92:14, 152:20, 173:21
agreement [2] - 135:11, 236:2	87:8, 87:11, 87:14,	almost [1] - 132:5	153:21	apprised [1] - 117:19
air [2] - 24:6, 127:21	88:2, 88:21, 88:28,	alone [3] - 133:18,	answering [1] -	approach [5] - 9:26,
aired [1] - 91:19	89:1, 89:15, 90:3,	133:25, 178:27	180:16	67:1, 144:22, 156:22,
	90:22, 90:27, 91:17,	alter [1] - 182:26	answers [6] - 94:24,	208:19
airport [1] - 200:14	95:11, 99:2, 99:5,	altered [1] - 165:27	100:19, 104:14,	approached [13] -
airwaves [5] - 24:10,	103:1, 103:5, 103:7,	alternative [2] - 12:6,	100:19, 104:14,	7:17, 187:2, 190:15,
30:29, 77:17, 196:3,	103:16, 103:22,	83:28	ANTHONY [1] - 3:10	218:20, 219:20,
196:28	103:29, 104:22,	alternatively [1] -	ANTRIM [1] - 4:17	221:22, 221:29,
ALAN[1] - 4:19	105:3, 107:6, 107:12,	10:26	anxious [1] - 93:25	222:17, 222:19,
Alan [2] - 119:13,	108:4, 108:12, 111:5,	amass [1] - 87:19	anything" [1] -	223:23, 224:25,
122:16	112:12, 112:18,	amazed [1] - 55:12	220:23	224:27, 232:27
alarmed [2] - 108:19,	112:19, 113:9,	amazing [1] - 55:4		approaching [2] -
108:22	113:16, 113:25,	amended [2] - 138:3,	anyway [7] - 49:9,	134:24, 223:18
alert [1] - 15:27	114:1, 114:17,	165:25	55:19, 55:20, 122:29, 123:3, 132:5, 168:9	appropriate [16] -
ALISON [2] - 2:17,	114:27, 114:29,	amount [4] - 16:16,	apace [1] - 205:19	11:12, 12:29, 84:17,
2:27	115:22, 119:27,	133:5, 179:15, 183:12	•	104:19, 109:6,
Alison [3] - 141:21,	119:28, 120:5, 120:8,	amplify [1] - 41:4	apart [5] - 75:19,	110:10, 113:4,
141:26, 142:5	120:13, 120:29,	amplifying [1] -	109:1, 124:2, 124:29, 167:17	117:28, 154:15, 154:27, 157:19,
allay [1] - 237:16	121:19, 121:20,	44:11		158:28, 159:27,
allayed [1] - 212:2	121:29, 123:26,	analysed [2] - 9:10,	apologies [2] - 123:21, 125:22	239:29, 242:9, 254:15
allaying [1] - 237:17	125:5, 125:29,	56:22	apologise [2] - 62:6,	appropriateness [1]
allegation [34] -	126:10, 127:26,	analysis [1] - 42:6	145:3	- 172:20
19:25, 20:5, 28:21,	128:10, 128:11,	AND [5] - 1:4, 1:5,		approval [1] - 64:22
76:19, 77:12, 80:4,	128:15, 177:6,	1:9, 3:4, 4:24	apologised [1] - 16:23	approved [1] - 64:6
81:9, 81:13, 105:9,	177:27, 178:27,	anger [5] - 99:18,	apologising [1] -	April [10] - 29:10,
105:18, 106:12,	179:24, 180:28,	156:29, 171:29,	204:27	137:20, 149:25,
111:27, 113:12,	191:12, 193:24,	172:14, 209:1	apparent [1] - 10:16	149:26, 149:27,
122:7, 122:21, 123:1, 123:24, 123:27,	197:28, 203:1, 208:1,	angry [4] - 154:9,	appeal [1] - 70:18	163:11, 164:11,
124:1, 124:10, 125:4,	208:20, 224:9,	180:12, 180:14,	appear [9] - 35:23,	164:12, 170:20,
125:11, 130:2, 176:3,	224:18, 225:2, 225:3,	202:29	60:19, 60:26, 62:23,	170:21
185:10, 191:26,	225:13, 226:19,	animosity [3] -	131:10, 146:18,	area [7] - 31:26,
193:18, 203:16,	229:28, 237:29,	113:13, 163:6, 163:12	170:13, 202:27,	168:6, 173:27,
226:24, 229:23,	239:1, 239:26,	animus [5] - 32:21,	249:29	217:23, 227:17,
230:13, 232:10,	247:18, 248:4,	36:2, 115:19, 116:4,	appearance [3] -	227:18, 249:29
239:20, 255:7	248:15, 248:24	166:25	175:3, 175:18	areas [3] - 77:7,
allegations [156] -	allege [2] - 110:7,	annoyance [2] -	appearances [1] -	169:23, 243:14
8:26, 8:29, 9:4, 9:9,	240:29	95:6, 241:25	142:21	arena [1] - 91:19
9:21, 10:7, 10:13,	alleged [16] - 14:13,	annoyed [2] -	APPEARANCES[1] -	argue [1] - 54:29
10:14, 12:3, 12:23,	84:18, 112:21, 113:6,	108:20, 108:22	2:1	arguing [1] - 60:10
14:4, 25:2, 36:19,	113:24, 191:13,	annoyed' [1] -	appeared [5] - 48:10,	argument [3] -
36:25, 37:9, 37:14,	196:8, 226:23,	108:21	142:20, 146:16,	27:12, 72:16, 72:22
38:27, 38:28, 39:6,	231:24, 233:24,	Answer [2] - 223:5,	177:13, 209:5	arguments [1] -
40:26, 43:9, 56:22,	234:8, 247:10,	223:15	appearing [4] - 77:1,	163:17
56:24, 56:25, 68:23,	247:27, 248:22,	answer [40] - 11:11,	77:6, 117:18, 179:21	arise [7] - 123:26,
71:6, 71:21, 72:3,	249:16, 254:25	11:25, 42:26, 54:3,	application [1] -	130:10, 130:11,
, , -,	allegedly [2] -	54:4, 72:24, 75:11,	-pp.ioacion[i]	,,

120:14 150:2 150:0
130:14, 150:2, 150:9, 187:25
arisen [1] - 149:20
arising [13] - 37:18, 58:12, 60:14, 84:28,
86:14, 90:9, 96:11,
117:11, 123:15,
129:20, 173:29,
174:13, 205:1
arm [1] - 223:7
armed [1] - 113:5
arose [6] - 35:8,
37:20, 73:17, 73:18,
73:24, 146:9
ARRAN[3] - 2:12,
4:11, 4:11
arranged [4] -
151:28, 158:14,
158:16, 162:20
arrangements [2] -
158:8, 161:20
arrest [6] - 100:1,
110:8, 110:15,
110:18, 112:9, 116:10
arrested [2] - 100:3,
109:17
arrival [1] - 133:15
article [8] - 26:26,
143:29, 144:14,
144:17, 163:18,
165:23, 165:25,
165:27
articles [1] - 117:18
artist [1] - 215:23
AS [5] - 6:1, 102:1,
199:25, 249:25,
254:21
aside [4] - 111:12,
175:12, 183:12, 192:9
aspect [6] - 22:24,
64:23, 116:18,
141:10, 167:3, 181:16
aspects [1] - 132:16
assault [12] - 20:5,
64:10, 82:7, 119:27,
120:8, 120:13,
120:28, 121:19,
122:21, 123:3, 176:4,
203:16
assaulted [1] - 255:2
assaulting [1] - 73:3
assert [1] - 151:12
assertions [1] -
102:22
assessment [2] -
180:13, 196:20
assist [1] - 70:20
assistance [2] -
87:20, 258:6
Assistant [36] - 6:29,
1

9:2, 9:11, 9:17, 9:21, 10:1, 10:3, 10:9, 10:23, 12:5, 25:5, 28:6, 28:24, 29:25, 29:29, 30:3, 38:25, 48:23, 49:16, 50:2, 50:16, 50:23, 51:27, 53:4, 119:18, 157:24, 157:27, 158:6, 158:13, 161:17, 162:27, 164:16, 167:23, 172:18, 224:12, 245:6 assistant [26] - 8:9, 12:16, 13:9, 23:24, 28:2, 29:8, 29:11, 37:7, 37:22, 38:11, 38:19, 39:7, 41:18, 47:25, 51:9, 51:12, 56:25, 57:7, 64:11, 120:24, 137:11, 139:19, 140:7, 140:18, 161:8, 161:28 assisted [1] - 35:16 ASSOCIATED[1] -3:15 assume [4] - 119:1, 130:5, 167:5, 175:6 assumed [2] - 33:16, 167:4 assuming [2] -63:14, 158:5 assumption [1] assured [1] - 6:17 AT [1] - 258:16 attached [1] - 245:27 attack [1] - 218:25 attacked [1] - 75:2 attacking [1] - 32:18 attempt [3] - 182:23, 199:10, 239:14 attempted [3] -32:10, 76:2, 157:7 attempting [1] -92.24 attend [2] - 158:7, 161:16 attendance [1] -161:8 attendant [3] - 27:2, 206:5, 221:5 attended [4] - 15:4, 62:27, 128:11, 151:24 attending [8] -146:12, 146:19, 146:23, 150:25, 151:3, 172:21,

220:15, 228:18

attention [33] -

23:23, 27:18, 50:2, 50:15, 59:7, 60:3, 61:6, 61:14, 63:5, 74:12, 76:8, 79:2, 82:6, 88:15, 91:8, 97:22, 98:16, 99:27, 102:6, 110:11, 110:22, 111:12, 111:15, 125:26, 133:5, 133:23, 134:4, 166:11, 166:18, 178:3, 186:14, 240:9, 245:12 attitude [13] - 67:14, 73:4, 104:23, 124:28, 174:28, 175:1, 175:16, 175:17, 202:23, 202:25, 206:29, 208:19, 210:18 Attorney[1] - 48:11 attributed [4] -42:17, 56:27, 182:3, 232:1 attrition [1] - 205:11 audience [1] - 66:21 audit [1] - 45:16 Auditor [9] - 14:12, 17:12, 68:4, 70:17, 74:19, 74:26, 178:19, 179:4, 217:4 August [5] - 59:29, 60:24, 60:25, 164:19, 164:20 AUGUSTUS[1] -2.28 author [1] - 39:6 authorities [8] -9:19, 9:27, 11:16, 36:17, 36:21, 57:1, 57:10, 240:9 $\boldsymbol{authority} \ [7] - 11:23,$ 45:3, 48:18, 53:2, 151:2, 240:3, 255:29 **Authority** [2] - 17:19, 204:27 automatically [1] -168:16 avail [1] - 39:10 available[11] -10:11, 10:21, 11:23, 12:8, 13:28, 24:7, 26:1, 69:26, 162:26, 253:19, 256:11 avenues [2] - 36:16, 183:13 avid [1] - 117:16 avoidance [1] -

11:1, 11:26, 23:25, 26:25, 38:20, 43:10, 47:1, 47:4, 48:13, 58:9, 64:9, 64:12, 77:6, 77:13, 77:15, 77:22, 78:5, 99:13, 100:16, 100:25, 105:11, 105:12, 106:11, 106:18, 107:22, 110:28, 111:27, 116:8, 116:16, 120:6, 123:1, 129:23, 130:4, 130:5, 130:6, 130:7, 143:29, 144:14, 160:25, 166:2, 166:4, 175:26, 177:5, 178:26, 183:13, 191:29, 192:1, 193:23, 194:8, 195:25, 196:2, 198:9, 198:12, 205:2, 214:23, 215:4, 215:14, 229:9, 229:12, 243:7, 250:24, 250:25. 252:26, 253:22 awareness [1] -95:21 awful [1] - 89:2 awkward [1] -136:22

В

back-up [1] - 14:9

background [8] -124.8 126.22 127:11, 127:21, 200:20, 246:17, 246:24, 256:13 backing [1] - 62:10 backwards [1] bad [8] - 17:1, 65:21, 65:22, 139:5, 234:1, 234:4, 257:20, 258:3 badly [1] - 100:2 Bailieboro [2] -58:26, 61:27 balance [1] - 105:27 balanced [1] - 41:7 bandied [1] - 45:2 bar [8] - 90:12, 91:13, 92:6, 92:19, 92:25, 93:13, 93:29, 241:3 Barrett [1] - 83:20 BARRINGTON[1] -4:19

209:6

based [11] - 42:7, 51:1, 51:6, 67:12, 107:10, 107:11, 112:29, 116:9, 222:20, 229:1, 257:1 basic [1] - 221:24 basing [1] - 52:16 basis [21] - 6:20, 10:16, 12:21, 17:6, 31:5, 31:6, 31:8, 37:15, 38:11, 115:2, 116:12, 142:10, 151:2, 157:6, 160:29, 179:17, 189:28, 206:23, 235:5, 248:23, 254:3 battle [1] - 110:24 **BE**[1] - 6:4 be-all [1] - 114:14 bear [4] - 70:3, 105:19, 107:13, 224:8 became [15] - 16:9, 46:29, 47:4, 111:5, 111:6, 111:27, 130:6, 137:5, 138:1, 164:4, 164:5, 203:28, 210:1, 215:4, 247:23 become [10] - 130:5, 130:7, 132:11, 132:15, 163:17, 164:3, 201:17, 202:3, 206:15, 210:10 beg [10] - 37:23, 135:17, 138:8, 138:15, 148:2, 166:22, 168:2, 203:24, 252:19, 257:26 begin [2] - 200:8, 202:23 beginning [8] - 33:8, 36:13, 80:29, 81:12, 87:5, 222:5, 238:14, 252:2 behalf [8] - 17:16, 20:15, 77:6, 145:13, 162:14, 164:8, 171:5, 171:13 behave [1] - 250:16 behaving [1] - 36:10 behaviour [4] - 46:1, 191:4, 238:27, 240:8 behind [5] - 62:1, 119:3, 122:8, 122:27, 128:22 belated [1] - 63:1 **BELFAST**[1] - 4:17 belief [5] - 36:22, 94:2, 94:18, 206:25,

aware [66] - 8:28,

214:6

believes [1] - 41:8 below [1] - 203:19 beneficiaries [1] -132:19 benefit [4] - 78:11, 86:8. 115:28. 257:15 Bernard [4] - 50:27, 66:24, 66:29, 244:29 **BERRY** [1] - 4:14 Berry [1] - 170:28 beside [1] - 207:12 best [8] - 47:19, 88:18, 98:6, 100:19, 109:21, 113:26, 238:16, 248:12 $\textbf{better} \ [3] - 23.5,$ 182:14, 223:6 between [43] - 16:8, 21:25, 41:4, 46:27, 65:22, 66:16, 71:7, 71:8, 71:23, 75:20, 98:14, 104:7, 107:29, 111:1. 112:28. 117:21, 171:19, 175:13, 176:16, 176:20, 178:22, 179:3, 179:10, 181:11, 186:15, 186:17, 186:21, 187:25, 190:11, 196:7, 197:11, 198:8, 198:23, 199:5, 212:11, 214:9, 216:22, 240:22, 240:28, 242:11, 247:17, 250:5, 251:12 **Bewley's** [3] - 68:20, 188:17, 234:11 beyond [12] - 45:11, 64:8, 74:6, 74:13, 74:16, 96:8, 119:10, 156:3, 179:23, 188:18, 198:26, big [8] - 16:29, 61:11, 61:13, 61:24, 195:27, 205:28, 205:29, 236:18 bit [19] - 27:29, 30:1, 71:22, 87:20, 108:20, 108:22, 112:13, 115:17, 122:4, 125:17, 129:1, 134:23, 136:2, 172:11, 188:21, 189:24, 226:17, 233:16, 237:14 bitterness [1] - 89:8 bizarre [2] - 145:4, 213:5

BL [15] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:23, 2:27, 2:28, 3:1, 3:5, 3:10, 4:10, 4:14, 4:20, 4:24 black [1] - 120:25 blacken [1] - 70:12 blamed [1] - 100:3 blaming [1] - 32:29 blank [5] - 73:11, 73:12, 73:20, 73:22, blanked [1] - 168:15 **blind** [1] - 210:4 **block** [1] - 140:13 blood [1] - 212:21 bodies [1] - 12:29 body [1] - 211:4 bogged [1] - 61:12 boils [1] - 191:2 bona [2] - 42:3, 160:24 **book** [1] - 196:18 booklet [1] - 248:8 border [1] - 206:10 borne [2] - 237:4, 237:5 **bottom** [7] - 14:1, 44:22, 59:10, 78:24, 122:5, 220:4, 225:8 Boucher [34] - 17:26, 18:13, 18:22, 18:27, 18:29, 19:3, 19:19, 19:24, 20:12, 21:3, 21:12, 21:20, 21:25, 22:8, 22:10, 22:12, 75:20, 118:7, 118:9, 118:10. 118:18. 131:11, 133:16, 134:3, 214:3, 215:5, 215:10, 215:15, 215:18, 216:13, 216:18, 216:24, 216:26, 240:17 Boucher-Hayes [34] - 17:26, 18:13, 18:22, 18:27, 18:29, 19:3, 19:19, 19:24, 20:12, 21:3, 21:12, 21:20, 21:25, 22:8, 22:10, 22:12, 75:20, 118:7, 118:9, 118:10, 118:18, 131:11, 133:16, 134:3, 214:3, 215:5, 215:10, 215:15, 215:18,

216:13, 216:18,

216:24, 216:26,

BOW [1] - 2:29

240:17

box [2] - 130:28, 201:10 breach [3] - 48:21, 53:28. 155:25 break [1] - 199:21 breaking [1] - 205:13 BREFFNI [1] - 2:10 Brett [9] - 6:9, 7:5, 13:25, 16:7, 16:23, 16:27, 17:9, 17:18, 204:27 Brian [6] - 7:10, 7:14, 15:5, 15:8, 15:27, 193.9 BRIAN [2] - 4:20, 4.24 bricks [2] - 160:18, brief [20] - 20:20, 20:27, 81:16, 81:21, 81:22, 81:24, 82:1, 102:24, 115:13, 117:22, 128:18, 153:20, 194:5, 194:7, 209:2. 209:3. 224:1. 225:16, 239:18, 249:18 briefed [5] - 20:3, 20:15, 124:21, 129:25, 165:28 briefing [8] - 19:22, 24:20, 31:2, 33:2, 129:24, 141:3, 249:2, 257.9 briefings [1] - 249:4 briefly [8] - 13:27, 123:4, 137:1, 171:18, 205:4, 231:26, 238:7, 243:15 bring [36] - 11:15, 12:17, 13:26, 14:20, 17:22, 23:23, 25:6, 34:22, 39:8, 43:14. 57:8, 74:11, 74:12, 76:2, 76:8, 89:10, 89:29, 96:21, 99:26, 100:4, 100:14, 103:19, 110:10, 110:21, 110:22, 111:14, 122:3, 134:3, 140:6, 166:11, 166:17, 188:3, 200:1, 208:20, 240:7, 245:13 bringing [4] -111:12, 125:5, 180:27, 245:11 brings [1] - 156:1 broad [2] - 132:8, 132:12

23:27, 24:2, 24:6, 24:26, 26:26, 27:26, 31:2, 31:13, 31:22, 32:1, 32:8, 39:21, 131:16, 133:11, 134:7, 137:6, 138:2, 214:5, 218:5, 218:9, 218:11, 218:15, 219:7, 222:21, 223:23, 224:27, 230:6, 254:10 broadcasting[1] -30:28 broadcasts [5] -77:20, 77:23, 78:5, 229:16, 229:22 broadly [1] - 37:22 BRODERICK [1] -3:28 broke [1] - 56:22 broken [1] - 55:25 **Brophy** [1] - 255:3 brought [21] - 27:17, 50:2. 50:15. 63:5. 79:2, 91:8, 91:23, 91:26, 93:3, 94:3, 96:17, 97:22, 98:15, 102:14, 133:23, 183:2, 227:14, 237:29, 239:28, 250:3. 252:9 buckets [1] - 173:2 building [1] - 133:10 bulletins [1] - 22:21 bullied [2] - 61:28, 207:25 burglaries [1] -206:4 Burke [1] - 131:11

burdened [1] - 204:4 bureau [1] - 244:24

burns [8] - 76:27, 87:12, 102:4, 112:24, 116:6, 131:5, 245:11, 247:13 BURNS [8] - 2:22,

5:5, 77:3, 77:4, 102:3,

130:22, 130:26, 131:4 Burns [1] - 77:5 business [15] -30:28, 42:1, 56:26, 66:1, 109:29, 128:14, 129:7, 134:24, 154:16, 160:3, 179:16, 180:18, 183:11, 188:20, 206:5

busy [2] - 217:12, 227:26 buy [3] - 168:21, 168:23, 188:29

BY [35] - 1:5, 1:8, 2:11, 2:17, 2:23, 2:28, 3:2, 3:6, 3:17, 4:7, 4:10, 4:15, 4:20, 4:25, 5:4, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:9, 5:10, 5:11, 5:12, 5:13, 6:4, 77:3, 131:7, 142:1, 145:10, 170:10, 174:6, 199:27, 249:25, 254:20 **bylaws** [1] - 169:28 Byrne [1] - 16:10 Byrne/McGinn [12] -58:3, 58:24, 61:14, 63:25, 63:29, 64:7,

C

119:17, 123:2, 125:8

64:8, 64:23, 64:28,

cake [1] - 38:5 calendar [2] - 74:28, 240:19 **CALLINAN**[8] - 5:3, 6:4, 131:7, 142:1, 145:10, 170:10, 174:6, 199:27 Callinan [122] - 6:6, 17:25 25:3 32:9 37:28, 50:21, 57:13, 77:4, 80:1, 81:5, 82:19, 87:6, 88:9, 88:24, 90:22, 91:9, 92:25, 93:6, 93:28, 94:24, 95:13, 96:29, 102:3, 103:10, 106:2, 106:26, 108:6, 110:1, 110:28, 116:20, 119:12, 122:19, 124:25, 126:8, 127:18, 129:17, 129:28, 131:4, 131:9, 138:18, 141:19, 144:4, 145:12, 148:17, 152:6, 152:17, 152:20, 152:28, 153:3, 154:22, 155:2, 155:3, 155:7, 164:14, 165:20, 166:8, 170:7, 170:12, 170:14, 170:27, 171:22, 171:29, 172:26, 174:8, 174:19, 174:27, 175:9, 175:28, 178:6, 187:6, 188:1, 189:2, 190:3, 190:9. 192:20. 192:27, 193:4,

broadcast [29] -

195:12, 197:2, 197:14, 198:25, 199:7, 199:29, 203:13, 204:14, 207:8, 208:4, 208:12, 208:13, 209:14, 210:9, 210:26, 219:15, 220:10, 220:18, 221:4, 222:10, 222:15, 222:19, 224:29, 226:9, 226:23, 227:11, 231:27, 232:14, 234:13, 238:7, 239:8, 239:16, 240:16, 241:17, 241:24, 243:21, 244:27, 245:29, 246:14, 246:28, 248:14, 249:12, 249:20, 249:26 Callinan' [1] - 210:2 Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancellations [1] - 48:9 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 21:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancellod [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 148:9	
240:16, 241:17, 241:24, 243:21, 244:27, 245:29, 246:14, 246:28, 248:14, 249:12, 249:20, 249:26 Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancellations [1] - 48:9 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	197:14, 198:25, 199:7, 199:29, 203:13, 204:14, 207:8, 208:4, 208:12, 208:13, 209:14, 210:9, 210:26, 219:15, 220:10, 220:18, 221:4, 222:10, 222:15, 222:19, 224:29, 226:9, 226:23, 227:11, 231:27, 232:14, 234:13,
241:24, 243:21, 244:27, 245:29, 246:14, 246:28, 248:14, 249:12, 249:20, 249:26 Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	240:16, 241:17,
244:27, 245:29, 246:14, 246:28, 248:14, 249:12, 249:20, 249:26 Callinan' [1] - 210:2 Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	241:24, 243:21
246:14, 246:28, 248:14, 249:12, 249:20, 249:26 Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancellations [1] - 48:9 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	244:27, 245:29.
248:14, 249:12, 249:20, 249:26 Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25	
249:20, 249:26 Callinan' [1] - 210:2 Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	
Callinan' [1] - 210:2 Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	
Callinan's [2] - 28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	
28:22, 209:29 camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	
camera [1] - 148:28 campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	
20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15 cannot [21] - 19:2, 21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	
23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,	campaign [22] - 20:24, 20:26, 20:27, 81:3, 82:13, 100:21, 100:22, 100:23, 106:5, 106:11, 107:17, 107:24, 115:4, 115:5, 115:6, 128:17, 129:24, 249:17, 249:18, 257:8, 257:11, 257:13 cancellation [4] - 8:29, 48:5, 49:27, 151:2 cancellations [1] - 48:9 cancelled [7] - 25:2, 146:25, 150:10, 151:8, 162:14, 164:8, 212:10 cancelling [1] - 48:15
	21:9, 21:14, 22:12, 23:18, 23:29, 42:6, 44:29, 53:8, 71:20, 121:28, 123:18, 125:7, 125:15, 152:13, 179:24, 197:11, 197:28, 199:5, 204:5 capable [1] - 83:25 car [64] - 68:20, 69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 146:10, 147:26,

148:14, 148:18, 148:23, 148:28, 150:4, 150:6, 150:21, 150:23, 151:3, 151:23, 151:24, 151:29, 152:5, 153:13, 154:28, 168:7, 168:22, 168:23, 168:27, 169:3, 169:4, 169:12, 187:14, 188:18, 188:24, 189:8, 190:4. 190:10, 190:15, 190:17, 190:18, 190:23, 194:11, 194:18, 195:17, 195:20, 195:22, 196:17. 196:19. 212:6, 217:22, 230:2, 230:7, 234:10, 237:22, 238:9, 241:3, 245:28, 246:3, 246:7, 246:10 career [1] - 109:24 careful [3] - 6:22, 8:4, 44:26 carefully [5] - 37:15, 47:6, 55:27, 231:8, 233:5 carried [13] - 25:5, 54:17, 54:19, 54:21, 54:25, 64:16, 82:16, 82:18, 90:11, 138:4, 138:5, 206:17 carry [2] - 106:5, 243:20 carrying [1] - 13:12 cars [1] - 205:13 CARTHAGE[1] -2.23 **case** [67] - 7:2, 7:24, 16:7, 19:27, 20:13, 24:19, 38:14, 39:15, 43:21, 43:22, 43:25, 44:1. 45:15. 45:23. 46:12, 62:4, 62:9, 64:24, 65:15, 67:5, 67:10, 70:25, 75:5, 76:21, 76:23, 88:29,

93:1, 93:22, 94:3,

94:29, 105:22,

114:19, 114:26,

115:15, 115:17,

115:21, 118:11,

164:22, 167:21,

169:22, 171:14,

176:28, 177:17,

178:15, 181:6,

187:10, 187:15,

119:2, 124:19, 125:8,

188:26, 189:7, 194:3, 204:12, 205:15, 206:2, 207:13, 210:27, 212:15, 212:18, 212:19, 242:10, 251:9, 256:26, 257:7, 257:9 cases [1] - 157:7 cast [1] - 197:16 CASTLE [1] - 1:17 catalogue [1] -114:15 catalyst [2] - 125:15, 126:16 catch [1] - 193:4 category [1] - 106:9 CATHAL[1] - 4:20 caught [1] - 41:4 caused [5] - 119:19, 119:24, 143:25, 209:2, 250:16 causing [4] - 62:21, 127:21, 127:27, 206:8 cautioned [2] -43:10, 177:4 cautioning [1] -45:18 caveat [2] - 87:10, 87:24 cc'd [1] - 157:10 central [5] - 113:9, 113:11, 114:26, 114:29, 205:25 certain [16] - 45:3, 48:16, 63:29, 68:11, 76:20, 76:23, 77:28, 97:23, 104:13, 131:27, 132:16, 179:15, 195:13, 221:15, 231:2, 243:23 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:4 certainly [98] - 11:26, 16:28, 17:16, 17:20, 18:22, 19:28, 20:25, 20:26, 21:23, 26:27, 27:10, 28:16, 39:20, 42:23, 42:27, 43:7, 43:8, 44:1, 44:10, 45:8, 51:2, 51:5, 61:17, 63:16, 63:27, 67:27, 68:19, 68:22, 69:14, 69:22, 74:16, 93:23, 95:5, 95:8, 95:10, 95:14, 95:15, 96:3, 96:6, 96:8, 104:1, 108:27, 113:25, 114:4, 114:5, 115:6, 115:7, 115:29, 120:25, 121:17, 123:29, 127:1, 127:2,

127:13, 128:8, 128:15, 129:4, 132:1, 140:11, 144:21, 149:23, 151:17, 155:10, 155:14, 157:3, 162:15, 163:16, 164:29, 165:4, 167:15, 167:27, 169:4, 175:2, 182:2, 185:6, 186:8, 194:1, 195:14, 196:28, 200:6, 200:28, 202:1, 206:19, 207:18, 210:15, 231:6, 240:12, 242:27, 243:1, 246:1, 249:9, 251:16, 252:19, 252:23, 257:10, 257:23, 257:25 certify [1] - 1:25 Chair [3] - 38:8, 217:11, 248:27 chair [1] - 184:24 chairman [8] - 33:5, 174:24, 183:1, 184:5, 192:12, 193:16, 196:22, 252:19 CHAIRMAN[160] -5:13, 18:10, 18:15, 18:19, 20:7, 23:5, 23:9, 24:8, 24:14, 24:24, 25:23, 26:3, 26:8. 26:11. 26:14. 26:18, 27:29, 28:11, 28:15, 28:18, 28:26, 29:6, 29:22, 30:16, 30:22, 31:6, 31:21, 31:24, 31:29, 32:6, 32:15, 33:18, 33:26, 34:8, 34:13, 34:16, 34:21, 35:25, 48:27, 49.2 49.9 49.18 57:29, 58:3, 58:20, 58:28, 59:15, 59:19, 59:26, 60:14, 61:11, 61:21. 62:9. 69:27. 70:2, 73:15, 73:19, 73:25, 73:28, 76:27, 100:28, 130:16, 130:24, 130:27, 138:18, 138:22, 138:25, 138:28, 140:11, 140:13, 140:24, 140:28, 141:11, 141:13, 141:18, 141:21, 141:24, 143:9, 143:12, 144:27, 147:15, 147:19,

147:22, 148:9, 148:13, 148:25, 148:29, 149:3, 163:9, 164:10, 164:14, 165:10, 165:14, 165:19, 166:13, 166:16, 166:20, 167:3, 167:8, 167:10, 167:15, 167:28, 168:2, 168:12, 168:18, 168:21, 168:26, 169:3, 169:6, 169:9, 169:14, 169:27, 170:3, 170:6, 170:23, 172:10, 172:27, 173:1, 173:5, 173:12, 173:16, 174:2, 174:4, 181:26, 182:9, 189:10, 189:20, 189:23, 190:6, 199:14, 199:18, 199:21, 202:11, 202:14, 202:20, 226:17, 226:25, 227:2, 227:4, 227:8, 243:17, 243:19, 244:3, 246:9, 249:8, 249:21, 252:13, 254:20, 254:22, 254:27, 255:11, 255:13, 255:21, 256:3, 256:7, 256:20, 256:23, 257:14, 258:1, 258:11 Chairman [372] - 6:7, 6:16, 6:22, 11:3, 11:6, 11:20, 11:25, 12:15, 13:14, 13:18, 13:23, 13:29, 16:4, 17:2, 17:9, 17:16, 18:3, 18:8, 18:23, 18:25, 19:7, 19:23, 20:25, 21:8, 21:22, 22:2, 22:13, 22:17, 22:23, 23:18, 24:5, 25:29, 27:24, 29:16, 30:10, 30:15, 31:4, 31:16, 33:7, 34:9, 34:12, 35:12, 35:27, 36:3, 36:6, 40:14, 40:17, 40:23, 41:25, 44:7, 44:10, 45:16, 47:19, 50:9, 50:18, 51:10, 56:15, 57:1, 58:6, 59:3, 59:25, 60:18, 62:15, 63:27, 65:7, 65:18, 65:27, 66:3, 66:19, 68:6, 68:15. 69:23, 69:25, 70:6, 70:14, 70:19, 71:5, 72:10, 72:21, 73:10,

			1	1
73:22, 74:5, 74:21,	200:26, 201:2, 201:8,	253:4, 254:1, 254:11,	55:2, 55:3, 55:6,	27:16, 36:12, 38:21,
75:6, 76:25, 77:4,	201:12, 201:16,	254:26, 255:9,	55:18, 58:4, 59:20,	43:13, 45:18, 46:20,
78:4, 78:9, 79:29,	201:19, 201:23,	255:19, 256:2, 256:6,	59:22, 60:22, 62:4,	47:1, 50:20, 52:2,
80:15, 84:27, 87:1,	201:28, 202:1, 202:4,	256:11, 256:22,	66:15, 243:29,	52:4, 55:24, 56:15,
88:17, 98:7, 98:28,	202:9, 202:18,	257:7, 257:23, 258:10	244:26, 245:7,	56:16, 61:9, 69:4,
102:11, 105:8,	202:21, 203:7,	Chairman's [1] -	251:22, 253:20	71:17, 79:19, 86:20,
105:14, 106:7,	203:24, 204:12,	70:18	CHIEF [2] - 2:18,	87:22, 90:26, 92:16,
116:26, 118:4,	204:20, 205:8, 206:2,	challenge [1] - 12:11	4:25	93:16, 93:25, 93:26,
119:11, 119:22,	206:19, 207:4, 207:7,	challenges [2] -	children [6] - 73:3,	94:12, 94:27, 95:10,
122:13, 126:24,	208:7, 208:10,	12:18, 109:25	187:2, 187:3, 230:9,	96:9, 97:17, 105:5,
129:6, 129:27,	208:18, 208:22,	challenging [4] -	230:24, 231:17	106:1, 106:2, 113:22,
130:12, 130:23,	208:27, 210:12,	12:16, 13:9, 57:6,	choice [2] - 165:1,	122:19, 123:12,
131:1, 131:3, 132:10,	211:10, 211:17,	180:17	256:15	123:20, 125:25,
132:14, 132:21,	211:23, 212:4,	CHAMBERS [1] -	choose [1] - 91:23	130:19, 134:6,
132:26, 133:1, 133:8,	212:19, 213:1, 213:8,	2:24	chooses [1] - 207:26	134:11, 134:15,
133:13, 133:17,	213:14, 213:23,	champion [1] - 182:9	chose [2] - 188:9,	134:25, 136:28,
134:5, 134:10,	214:1, 214:12,	chance [1] - 194:19	256:3	137:22, 152:4,
134:14, 134:18,	214:19, 214:21,	change [2] - 182:26,	Christmas [3] -	152:10, 152:12,
134:20, 134:26,	214:28, 215:3, 215:9,	205:18	214:4, 214:5, 215:7	177:3, 180:6, 207:10,
135:6, 135:13,	215:12, 215:20,	changed [2] -	chronological [1] -	207:22, 210:18,
136:23, 137:9,	215:25, 215:29,	125:12, 188:27	62:25	216:21, 247:23
137:18, 137:24,	216:5, 216:11,	changing [1] - 36:9	chronology [4] -	cleared [1] - 225:4
137:28, 140:20,	216:15, 217:9,	channel [1] - 140:18	164:11, 232:19,	clearer [3] - 21:9,
142:29, 143:4, 143:8, 143:11, 143:14,	217:14, 217:17, 217:26, 218:2,	channels [2] - 54:24,	232:20, 235:7	50:18, 51:11
143:17, 143:21,	218:16, 219:28,	63:22	Circular [1] - 168:5	clearing [2] - 92:4,
143:28, 144:26,	220:3, 222:13,	character [4] - 75:2,	circular [1] - 244:16	94:1 clearly [27] - 12:15,
145:5, 145:22, 146:5,	224:22, 224:28,	143:3, 143:16, 177:22	circulated [1] - 61:29	32:20, 38:14, 41:4,
154:8, 166:10, 167:9,	225:5, 226:15, 227:9,	charge [28] - 8:27,	circumstance [2] -	44:20, 46:8, 76:5,
167:13, 167:21,	227:19, 227:25,	9:1, 10:17, 14:20,	50:7, 124:15	82:11, 86:18, 88:17,
168:10, 168:17,	228:6, 228:23,	14:22, 19:22, 37:11,	circumstances [16] - 41:6, 48:17, 50:22,	89:2, 92:15, 92:22,
168:25, 169:2, 169:5,	229:15, 230:11,	46:3, 48:5, 48:9, 48:16, 49:28, 50:29,	65:12, 79:15, 88:1,	94:17, 98:3, 103:26,
169:11, 169:19,	230:16, 230:20,	51:2, 51:4, 119:16,	114:6, 145:15, 146:9,	103:27, 105:22,
170:2, 172:13,	230:27, 231:15,	120:5, 135:19,	151:4, 165:29, 195:1,	105:23, 121:7,
172:25, 173:4,	231:20, 232:6,	139:17, 146:27,	212:17, 221:5,	135:22, 135:25,
173:10, 174:1, 174:8,	232:20, 233:6,	150:9, 150:29, 151:7,	221:11, 244:8	168:22, 251:19,
174:26, 176:14,	233:27, 234:3,	155:13, 157:28,	city [2] - 157:28,	251:20, 257:1
176:21, 176:28,	234:18, 235:11,	164:8, 164:15	188:14	client [3] - 166:17,
177:2, 178:15,	235:25, 235:28,	charged [2] - 72:20,	civil [2] - 252:9,	166:25, 166:27
178:20, 180:4, 181:6,	236:3, 236:4, 236:12,	73:9	256:26	client's [1] - 174:17
181:10, 181:14, 182:25, 183:3,	236:15, 236:23, 237:14, 237:20,	charges [1] - 50:27	claim [2] - 9:16,	CLIFFORD [1] - 3:28
183:25, 185:4, 185:9,	238:5, 239:7, 239:15,	CHARLES [1] - 4:25	237:14	Clifford [1] - 77:21
185:14, 185:24,	239:24, 240:26,	CHARLETON [2] -	claimed [1] - 177:28	cloak [1] - 33:29
186:1, 186:13,	241:1, 241:7, 241:13,	1:12, 2:2	claiming [2] - 209:9,	clock [1] - 249:6
186:26, 187:13,	241:22, 241:29,	charter [4] - 51:24,	237:7	close [4] - 67:9,
187:16, 187:23,	242:9, 242:22, 243:1,	52:24, 53:7, 54:28	claims [4] - 168:6,	201:11, 201:18,
188:11, 189:5,	243:6, 243:10,	check [2] - 7:8, 153:6	230:23, 251:26	201:21 closed [2] - 73:23,
189:19, 189:22,	243:13, 244:2, 244:4,	checked [2] - 47:6,	Clare [3] - 59:21,	73:25
190:8, 190:14, 191:1,	244:13, 244:22,	252:16	60:24, 77:21	closely [2] - 200:25,
191:18, 191:23,	245:1, 245:16,	chest [1] - 256:1	clarified [1] - 255:12	201:6
191:27, 192:3, 192:5,	245:18, 245:23,	Chief [9] - 58:25,	clarify [4] - 91:22,	closest [1] - 248:29
192:8, 192:22, 193:5,	246:8, 246:12,	61:14, 62:11, 62:16, 62:29, 65:23, 244:7,	200:1, 202:6, 202:11	closing [2] - 158:26,
193:8, 194:1, 194:14,	246:27, 247:3, 247:7,	244:19, 251:22	clarity [3] - 37:16, 85:18, 85:27	246:28
195:1, 195:9, 195:24,	247:12, 247:21,	chief [32] - 9:6,	clause [4] - 37:6,	closure [1] - 135:2
195:28, 196:1,	247:28, 248:6,	51:20, 51:26, 52:1,	38:10, 51:12, 56:21	closures [1] - 205:17
196:20, 197:11,	248:13, 248:18,	52:7, 52:29, 53:8,	clear [66] - 11:6,	cloud [1] - 132:27
197:22, 198:21,	248:25, 249:17,	53:16, 53:25, 54:3,	12:1, 19:23, 20:18,	coffee [10] - 189:29,
199:12, 199:16,	250:7, 251:2, 251:9,	54:9, 54:13, 54:18,	20:29, 21:1, 22:29,	190:19, 217:8,
200:7, 200:11, 200:17, 200:22,	251:14, 251:29, 252:23, 252:29,	54:20, 54:23, 54:27,	23:22, 25:12, 25:17,	220:17, 220:18,
200.11, 200.22,	,,,			
	i		ì	ì

221:23, 222:8,	23:24, 28:2, 29:8,	195:12, 201:5,	13:6, 28:24, 29:28,	complex [1] - 207:21
222:24, 222:26,	29:11, 37:7, 37:23,	203:13, 204:1, 204:5,	41:14	compliance [1] -
227:17	38:12, 38:19, 47:25,	204:14, 206:18,	communicated [4] -	55:11
colleague [3] -	51:10, 51:13, 56:25,	206:21, 207:23,	28:7, 171:29, 172:14,	complicit [2] -
105:28, 135:12,	57:14, 57:17, 58:10,	212:26, 219:14,	252:24	105:26, 115:6
142:16	61:6, 63:10, 63:15,	220:9, 220:15,	communicating [1] -	comply [1] - 25:21
colleagues [5] -	63:18, 64:11, 100:25,	220:16, 220:20,	134:27	composed [1] -
65:19, 65:23, 121:10,	105:10, 120:24,	221:1, 221:4, 221:23,	communication [8] -	33:16
122:9, 257:28	137:12, 139:19,	222:2, 223:2, 223:6,	28:27, 33:27, 112:28,	composer [1] - 26:4
colloquialism [1] -	140:7, 140:19,	223:13, 223:16,	165:22, 170:29,	composition [1] -
12:12	140:21, 161:8,	223:17, 223:28,	171:17, 171:18, 255:8	104:12
colluded [3] - 74:29,	161:28, 169:3,	224:12, 239:21,	companies [1] -	comprehension [1] -
75:4, 199:1	169:10, 186:3, 200:18	240:8, 242:3, 242:19,	214:10	74:17
Colm [4] - 58:5,	Commissioner [163]	242:20, 245:6, 254:2,	company [1] - 15:22	compromise [1] -
59:23, 59:26, 61:15	- 6:29, 7:11, 9:1, 9:2,	255:14	COMPANY [2] - 2:11,	237:19
colourful [1] -	9:3, 9:8, 9:11, 9:17,	Commissioner's [11]	4:2	Comptroller [9] -
246:19	9:22, 10:2, 10:4, 10:9,	- 23:11, 34:17, 41:29,	compatible [1] - 11:4	14:12, 17:12, 68:4,
colours [1] - 209:19	10:23, 10:24, 12:5,	62:10, 154:1, 160:11,	compelling [1] - 12:1	70:17, 74:19, 74:26,
combination [1] -	18:20, 24:28, 25:6,	204:2, 241:27, 242:6,	competence [1] -	178:19, 179:4, 217:4
64:18	25:22, 28:6, 28:9,	242:7, 244:20	256:10	compulsion [1] -
comfort [1] - 211:27	28:13, 28:22, 28:24,	commissioner's [3] -	competently [1] -	140:15
comfortable [1] -	29:25, 29:29, 30:3,	39:7, 41:18, 57:8	51:14	computer [6] -
249:13	32:22, 33:3, 33:28,	commitment [1] -	competing [2] - 17:5,	44:15, 46:7, 58:20,
comfortably [1] -	38:26, 39:4, 42:2,	16:17	204:21	76:19, 164:22, 229:2
41:10	42:5, 45:18, 48:2,	commitments [1] -	compilation [1] -	concede [1] - 231:2
coming [16] - 29:23,	48:6, 48:11, 48:13,	206:11	50:24	concern [13] - 10:3,
35:18, 70:23, 72:3,	48:18, 48:24, 49:16,	committed [2] -	compiled [2] - 59:13,	42:3, 45:27, 87:4,
116:5, 132:6, 135:24,	49:24, 50:3, 50:16,	17:18	60:21	131:27, 142:6,
149:18, 152:28,	50:23, 51:21, 51:27,	committee [12] -	complain [2] -	149:21, 211:13,
170:23, 196:23,	52:8, 52:16, 52:25, 53:4, 53:22, 54:14,	11:1, 11:19, 42:1,	156:14, 156:20	211:15, 211:18,
216:19, 232:15,	57:25, 58:9, 59:25,	42:16, 43:15, 46:26,	complained [3] -	213:5, 241:25
236:7, 251:19, 251:25	59:26, 60:3, 60:10,	70:10, 210:29, 228:4,	64:2, 92:2, 212:20	concerned [20] -
commencement [1]	60:24, 60:25, 60:26,	235:26, 236:3, 236:15	complaining [1] -	15:20, 20:24, 31:12,
- 103:12	60:29, 61:3, 63:13,	Committee [44] -	93:12	31:26, 39:9, 41:5,
commencing [1] -	63:16, 64:5, 64:17,	9:13, 10:25, 11:8,	complains [1] -	41:11, 59:5, 67:10,
232:28	74:14, 76:10, 76:29,	11:24, 13:7, 26:28,	59:23	68:10, 70:29, 85:26,
comment [9] -	78:21, 81:4, 81:5,	28:3, 29:9, 40:7, 41:3,	complaint [11] -	88:24, 92:27, 133:3,
103:21, 111:3,	81:6, 81:22, 89:8,	41:15, 46:20, 47:4,	54:16, 59:20, 62:17,	135:5, 150:25,
118:28, 120:9,	100:3, 100:8, 105:24,	75:18, 144:6, 175:4,	64:10, 80:4, 81:28,	172:19, 237:19,
184:26, 184:27,	105:25, 105:29,	175:7, 177:10,	82:7, 95:28, 105:27,	257:11
185:1, 220:27, 252:16	108:26, 115:5,	177:20, 177:24,	129:15, 207:14	concerns [29] - 6:28,
commentary [1] -	116:11, 119:18,	179:18, 179:21,	complaints [17] -	23:23, 25:7, 25:14,
77:16	129:10, 134:28,	183:28, 185:21,	65:7, 65:19, 65:25,	38:16, 38:18, 38:25,
commented [2] -	138:18, 140:29,	187:19, 192:5, 192:23, 195:5,	72:27, 74:15, 81:27,	39:8, 49:29, 50:11,
99:8, 250:1	141:7, 141:14,	195:10, 195:14,	93:8, 102:29, 114:16,	51:8, 51:9, 53:5, 54:6,
comments [8] - 10:1,	141:17, 144:4,	196:13, 196:23,	115:10, 120:15,	56:12, 56:14, 90:2,
21:13, 52:17, 103:18,	146:29, 148:8, 150:3,	207:19, 219:5,	121:3, 126:17,	139:17, 156:23,
109:4, 208:23,	151:28, 152:7,	219:12, 219:13,	127:28, 130:15,	211:9, 212:3, 212:23,
218:22, 237:24	152:10, 152:21,	220:10, 220:17,	167:22, 212:13	213:11, 237:17,
commission [1] -	153:10, 153:11,	221:17, 222:25,	complete [11] - 59:4,	237:18, 254:9
91:1	154:23, 155:2, 155:7,	224:13, 227:18,	61:27, 68:18, 103:7,	conclude [1] - 65:1
Commission [11] -	155:8, 157:24,	227:21, 228:2	116:27, 147:27,	concluded [1] -
7:18, 61:18, 72:15,	157:27, 158:6,	committees [1] -	147:29, 148:3,	236:20
72:19, 73:8, 74:13,	158:13, 159:21,	217:29	178:21, 190:10, 220:8	conclusion [8] -
90:10, 90:17, 90:25,	161:1, 161:6, 161:17,		completed [2] -	12:9, 76:17, 76:18,
239:29, 240:13	162:27, 164:14,	common [2] - 187:15, 232:2	28:10, 29:14	124:11, 197:24,
COMMISSIONER [1]	164:16, 165:7,	commonality [1] -	completely [8] -	197:25, 229:1, 229:24
- 2:14	167:23, 168:27,	179:15	19:22, 24:18, 29:23,	conclusions [1] -
commissioner [37] -	171:28, 172:19,	communicate [4] -	50:22, 59:2, 61:21,	178:17
8:9, 12:17, 13:9,	172:21, 184:11,	Communicate [4]	72:18, 172:25	conduct [4] - 9:3,
	·			

12:24, 84:21, 157:20 conducted [4] -38:12, 87:17, 119:20, 160:3 conducting [1] -154:15 conduit [3] - 120:11, 121:2, 121:7 confidante [1] -202:3 confidence [1] -10:17 confidential [10] -10:24, 12:26, 12:27, 38:17, 50:1, 50:12, 56:19, 139:20, 140:8, 211.5 confidentiality [4] -37:6, 38:10, 51:11, 56:21 confining [1] -143:12 confirm [11] - 81:1, 86:21, 137:10, 137:25, 143:3, 143:6, 226:8, 242:29, 243:25, 243:26, 243:28 confirmation [3] -34:4, 34:7, 224:24 confirmed [2] -86:12, 190:3 confirms [3] -221:28, 226:18, 245:7 conflict [3] - 21:24, 249:27, 250:1 confronted [1] -251:18 congregating [1] -227:24 conjunction [1] -89:7 **CONLON** [1] - 2:23 connection [3] -46:16, 74:20, 132:23 **CONOR** [3] - 2:15, 3:17, 4:2 conscious [3] -185:11, 229:8, 243:15 consciousness [2] -132:16, 149:25 consequence [2] -32:28, 182:11 consequences [2] -32:27. 195:4 consider [6] - 43:26, 44:28, 46:29, 56:17, 122:7, 256:24 considerable [4] -133:5, 150:14,

150:17, 247:21 considerably [3] -231:28, 231:29, 243:16 consideration [4] -9:14, 44:26, 109:21, 212.14 considerations [1] -211.24 considered [1] - 11:4 considering [4] -10:26, 40:22, 44:24, 129:22 consistent [1] -224.16 consistently [1] constituents [1] -70.4 constitutional [1] -86:12 constrained [2] -38:13, 39:1 constricted [1] -29.28 construed [1] - 50:7 consult [2] - 255:19, 255:21 consultation [2] -89:23, 257:4 consulted [5] -11:27, 46:16, 48:12, 48:17, 240:14 consumed [2] -202:27, 206:15 contact [36] - 30:4, 30:5, 32:10, 32:12, 38:25, 50:24, 67:23 67:27, 81:20, 142:22, 154:19, 156:14, 156:19, 156:21, 157:5, 157:7, 158:18, 158:22, 159:24, 161:26, 171:3, 198:1, 200:28, 200:29, 242:7, 242:25, 243:21, 243:24, 251:19, 251:20, 251:23, 252:6, 252:7, contacted [6] - 7:9, 15:18, 15:24, 28:9, 29:9, 157:17 contacts [3] - 142:6, 142:18, 243:27 contain [4] - 22:28, 48:4, 63:19, 78:19

contained [12] -

6:27, 38:22, 56:21,

85:15, 86:28, 106:22,

114:18, 146:11, 147:9, 165:5, 195:15, 225:7 containing [1] -12:23 contaminated [3] -178:2, 180:2, 198:19 content [2] - 85:18, 190.27 contents [2] -144:17, 231:28 context [38] - 13:8, 16:18, 19:4, 30:8, 36:12, 36:14, 37:17, 38:13, 40:16, 40:22, 40:23, 42:29, 51:14, 67:19, 68:23, 74:23, 100:20, 104:1, 115:9, 116:16, 127:1, 130:14, 133:9, 135:7, 158:1, 175:2, 175:27, 182:24, 183:23, 183:27, 186:12, 191:13, 193:12, 194:2, 196:11, 204:26, 209:14, 223:27 continue [2] - 44:26, CONTINUED [1] continued [2] -48:19, 206:14 continues [2] -49:22, 51:16 continuina [2] -119:24, 249:12 contradicting [1] -10:9 contradicts [3] -9:17, 10:22, 12:4 contrary [1] - 130:20 contributed [2] -45:9, 171:28 contrived [1] - 70:10 control [3] - 35:4, 195:13, 195:14 controller [1] - 211:8 controlling [1] -164:27 controversy [1] -135:21 convenient [1] -188:19 converging [1] -131:27 conversation [90] -21:3, 21:6, 68:19, 69:5, 69:22, 75:19,

103:17, 104:6, 104:10, 110:29, 111:9, 112:4, 112:8, 112:9, 112:14. 112:20, 112:22, 113:18, 114:13, 122:15, 124:17, 124:23, 125:24, 133:16, 135:7, 136:26, 143:9, 153:20, 177:21, 177:23, 178:23, 184:18, 186:26, 186:27, 190:28, 195:21, 195:22, 215:28, 216:1, 216:3, 216:10, 216:12, 216:23, 217:6, 218:5, 218:13, 220:9, 220:25, 221:3, 221:6, 221:8, 221:11, 221:14, 221:16, 221:19, 221:21, 221:25, 223:25, 224:1, 224:26, 225:5, 225:9, 226:11, 226:12, 226:13, 226:29, 227:13, 227:16, 228:26, 229:10, 230:18, 231:12, 233:9, 233:16, 233:20, 233:22, 237:21, 237:24, 237:28, 238:12, 238:14, 240:3, 245:21, 251:1, 251:12, 253:2, 253:11 conversations [18] -68:22, 75:17, 75:23, 114:4, 126:26, 126:28, 126:29, 128:27, 129:20, 143:12, 179:26, 199:3, 199:4, 216:17, 239:23, 240:4, 240:15, 256:2 convey [3] - 172:7, 202:26, 228:12 conveyed [2] -67:14, 206:16 convivial [1] - 35:22 cooperate [9] -22:22, 22:29, 23:4, 25:1, 25:4, 29:18, 37:29, 50:8, 138:20 cooperated [7] -6:18, 8:2, 13:19,

15:16, 16:3, 39:18,

cooperation [4] -

40:2

13:21, 30:14, 51:1, 141:6 Cootehill [1] - 255:2 copied [1] - 8:27 copy [10] - 12:29, 27:8, 27:15, 27:20, 27:22, 33:12, 55:17, 145:17, 147:11, 149.16 CORMAC [1] - 3:27 corps [1] - 46:26 correct [163] - 13:23, 14:23, 15:13, 17:17, 18:3, 29:16, 30:29, 34:21, 36:3, 36:6, 38:28, 40:14, 43:10, 56:13, 56:23, 63:3, 64:15, 66:3, 68:6, 69:21, 78:4, 78:9, 79:29, 84:27, 86:1, 87:1, 89:11, 92:8, 96:15, 105:14, 106:7, 116:26, 119:22, 126:24, 129:27, 132:4, 132:14, 132:21, 132:26, 133:8, 133:13, 134:5, 143:4, 143:8, 144:26, 145:22, 146:5, 146:11, 146:21, 149:8, 152:7, 153:3, 153:13, 153:14, 153:23, 153:25, 153:26, 154:2, 154:6, 156:6, 156:9, 156:13, 156:22, 157:8, 157:13, 159:17, 163:14, 163:19, 163:22, 164:6, 170:2, 171:16, 172:29, 176:13, 176:14, 176:21, 177:7, 178:20, 181:10, 182:8. 185:24. 186:13, 187:13, 188:11, 190:14, 191:18, 191:23, 191:27, 192:3, 192:7, 192:10, 194:14, 194:24, 195:24, 198:14, 200:11, 200:17. 201:2. 201:28, 202:9, 207:6, 207:7, 208:4, 208:27, 210:9, 210:25, 211:23, 213:1, 213:22, 213:23, 214:8, 214:12, 215:3, 215:9, 215:12, 216:11, 216:26,

98:9, 98:13, 102:7,

216:28, 217:9, counsel [9] - 19:16, 219:27, 224:10, 114:20, 118:15, - 43:4 224:22, 224:28, 170:17, 174:12, 227:25, 228:6, 196:14, 198:10, 50.16 228:16, 229:15, 198:15, 198:17 230:3, 230:4, 230:11, counselling [2] -230:13, 230:20, 164:19, 165:1 230:27, 231:20, country [2] - 23:25, 232:6, 232:7, 232:20, 205.9 233:5, 234:3, 234:18, **COUNTY** [1] - 4:17 235:2, 235:23, couple [9] - 35:27, 235:24, 235:28, 45:17, 75:23, 94:4, 236:4, 236:13, 113:27, 142:21, 236:23, 237:10, 143:22, 190:7, 254:22 237:22, 237:27, coupled [1] - 64:18 37.18 238:5, 239:7, 240:21, couples [1] - 201:29 241:8, 242:22, course [52] - 17:17, 244:22, 245:14, 29:24, 33:4, 37:19, 245:29, 246:8, 37:26, 64:29, 65:19, 247:28, 248:6, 251:14 65:20, 67:6, 67:28, corrected [4] -71:21, 73:6, 74:8, 98:20, 149:2, 198:16, 74:10, 76:22, 80:2, 235:18 80:14, 87:21, 91:24, correcting [1] -92:18, 93:10, 93:18, 149:3 95:1, 107:15, 108:8, corrections [1] -114:21, 116:7, 64:21 117:24, 118:27, correctly [8] -120:23, 121:22, 109:16, 182:10, 137:4, 138:27, 208:29, 209:17, 144:15, 150:19, 210:26, 216:2, 235:7, 153:4, 154:23, 236:20 156:28, 169:29, correctness [1] -180:21, 186:19, 213:17 190:12, 195:6, correlation [1] -197:17, 199:6, 212:11 207:21, 214:24, 198:10 correspondence 231:3, 236:23, 253:1 [31] - 9:23, 12:22, COURT [2] - 1:13, 29:5 12:28, 41:2, 57:21, 2:3 60:6, 60:9, 60:16, cover [5] - 56:19, 134:25 61:1, 61:2, 61:9, 139:27, 173:27, 61:29, 63:9, 85:8, 199:29, 243:14 134:25 85:13, 89:13, 92:17, covered [2] - 140:22, 92:23, 160:20, 174:15 160:26, 163:15, crank [1] - 62:21 3:22 164:1, 175:5, 176:16, crazy [3] - 68:23, 187:21, 210:20, 195:18, 195:23 190.19 213:12, 247:29, create [2] - 30:16, 248:2, 248:5, 250:19 30:26 corridor [8] - 22:14, created [1] - 205:18 133:19, 134:1, creates [1] - 30:12 215:19, 216:1, 216:3, credence [6] -216.13 217.23 103:22, 104:24, corruption [2] -105:21, 107:19, curry [1] - 257:21 61:23, 164:17 113:16, 196:25 custody [1] - 100:2 Costello [3] - 60:3, credible [3] - 13:20, cycle [1] - 249:9 60:9.61:6 182:19, 186:2 COSTELLO[1] credit [5] - 173:15, 2:11 173:16, 173:24, cough [1] - 138:6 237:7, 237:15

creditworthiness [1] Crime [2] - 50:3, crime [4] - 164:17, 206:3, 206:4, 214:16 Crimecall [5] -131:16, 131:22, 214:5, 214:6, 215:7 crimes [1] - 214:15 criminal [6] - 10:7, 167:10, 191:25, 194:9, 208:1, 244:24 criminality [1] crises [1] - 254:4 critical [3] - 123:10, 175:23, 183:10 criticisms [2] -63:29. 72:2 Cross [1] - 188:18 CROSS [14] - 5:4, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:9, 5:10, 6:4, 77:3, 131:7, 142:1, 145:10, 170:10 174:6 cross [4] - 19:16, 29:5, 196:14, 198:10 **CROSS-EXAMINED** [14] - 5:4, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:9, 5:10, 6:4, 77:3, 131:7, 142:1, 145:10, 170:10, 174:6 cross-examined [3] - 19:16, 196:14. cross-purposes [1] crystal [2] - 38:21, crystal-clear [1] -**CULLEN** [1] - 2:28 CUNNINGHAM [1] cup [2] - 188:29, Curran [1] - 244:15 currency [2] - 30:5, current [6] - 48:22, 142:10, 155:7, 214:20, 214:27, 215:1

246:1, 246:22 D d's [3] - 117:26, 142:11, 142:28 daily [7] - 17:6, 67:23, 67:26, 200:28, 200:29, 206:23, 254:3 **DALY**[1] - 3:29 Daly [4] - 59:21, 59:23, 60:24, 77:21 damage [2] - 72:6, damaging [3] -75:29, 185:12, 211:1 danger [1] - 61:12 **DANIEL** [1] - 3:26 **DARRAGH**[1] - 4:15 Darren [1] - 174:9 **DARREN**[1] - 4:10 DARRYL[1] - 3:28 darts [2] - 182:4, 182:9 data [16] - 45:16, 48:4, 48:9, 48:19, 48:20, 48:21, 49:27, 155:25, 175:11, 175:14, 192:13, 211:7, 211:8, 212:23, 212:24, 212:25 Data [4] - 48:12, 52:25, 53:22, 212:26 date [16] - 32:2, 32:4, 59:17, 75:21, 90:7, 102:15, 145:26, 161:24, 163:9, 168:3, 168:7, 168:18, 176:2, 189:15, 237:3 dated [4] - 79:9, 84:7, 89:27, 219:1 dates [2] - 82:17, 204.6 daughter [1] -142:15 Dave [8] - 106:22, 106:27, 107:2, 107:19, 107:25, 107:26, 230:25, 241:20 David [5] - 102:22, 129:26, 173:1, 256:4, 257:2 **DAVID**[1] - 4:2 **DAY**[1] - 1:18 day-to-day [1] -

dead [1] - 189:15 deal [44] - 16:20, 17:6, 37:9, 43:27, 45:14, 47:21, 51:14, 54:6, 57:11, 63:13, 73:26, 80:19, 82:24, 85:24, 91:23, 94:22, 95:2, 108:4, 128:5, 129:16, 151:20, 159:20, 169:25, 173:21, 174:19, 204:20, 205:27. 205:29, 206:5, 206:23, 206:27, 207:11, 207:16, 212:12, 217:6, 229:4, 229:7, 233:17, 235:5, 238:20, 246:18, 248:9, 249:29, 253:24 dealing [27] - 23:24, 46:21, 47:25, 51:13, 57:25, 72:25, 73:9, 84:9, 95:23, 115:2, 128:14, 133:2, 159:18, 167:24, 169:13, 170:19, 170:29, 180:27, 180:29, 204:23, 207:21, 209:25, 218:12, 230:12, 236:29, 238:20, 247.18 dealings [2] -127:19. 127:23 deals [4] - 157:17, 171:17, 218:28, 222:4 dealt [34] - 7:25, 13:26, 16:5, 60:29, 63:23, 67:6, 80:16, 91:6, 91:11, 91:29, 94:5, 94:15, 95:6, 95:19, 126:5, 139:15, 154:12. 171:8. 173:11, 173:12, 173:22, 187:21, 206:8, 206:9, 206:29, 210:20, 213:21, 214:26, 232:9, 236:6, 236:14, 250:26, 253:26, 254:3 dear [1] - 8:23 Deasy [36] - 41:26, 42:9, 42:15, 42:17, 42:20, 68:3, 70:8, 76:11, 176:24, 176:29, 177:15, 177:18, 177:29, 178:9, 178:16, 178:18, 179:3,

54:10

days [10] - 35:26,

35:27, 161:27,

209:24, 210:7,

229:17, 245:28,

174:20, 174:22, 197:21, 197:26, defending [2] described [11] -88:5, 147:24, 166:5, 198:19, 217:4, 57:15, 58:11 174:27, 175:14, 34:6, 183:17, 194:3, 248:3, 248:12, 248:28 217:15, 218:10, definitely [2] - 76:8, 175:22, 176:24, 195:16, 195:23, detected [2] - 149:5, 218:12, 222:20, 176:29, 177:14, 202:28, 217:10, 234:7 149:11 224:18, 224:25, definitive [1] - 12:2 177:15, 177:18, 221:26, 232:14, detective [1] -225:1, 225:7, 225:28, 177:22, 177:29, 236:9, 241:15 degree [1] - 136:12 167:10 178:2, 178:9, 178:18, 226:10, 226:18, describes [8] determination [1] delay [1] - 254:23 226:27, 227:10, 179:3, 180:11, 181:7, 215:18, 216:24, 12:2 deliberate [1] - 69:1 240:17 181:12, 183:5, 217:16, 217:18, determine [3] delicately [1] - 187:7 Deasy's [4] - 217:6, 183:15, 184:6, 218:18, 233:11, 118:4, 129:24, 238:17 delighted [1] -218:4, 223:22, 224:24 184:11, 184:12, 233:12, 238:9 detract [1] - 183:16 190.20 185:5, 190:26, **debacle** [2] - 163:17, delivered [1] describing [5] developments" [2] -191:11, 191:15, 164.4 33:13, 225:9, 232:16, 60:4, 61:7 158:11 debate [1] - 75:7 191:19, 194:4, 232:26, 233:27 devious [2] - 257:22, delivering[1] -194:11, 194:22, **DEBBIE** [1] - 3:16 description [11] -258:3 212:21 194:29, 195:1, 195:3, Debbie [13] - 116:21, 204:9, 204:26, **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 delivery [1] - 211:13 195:16, 195:25, 204:28, 218:1, 117:25, 142:7, Diarmuid [3] demonstrate [1] -196:3, 197:21, 198:6, 142:11, 142:13, 222:21, 223:22, 251:18, 251:27, 12:15 198:9, 198:17, 142:23, 143:2, 143:5, 223:27, 224:23, demur [1] - 106:2 253:14 198:18, 199:10, 143:10, 143:16, 224:24, 231:12, diary [3] - 68:29, denial [10] - 87:9, 208:5, 217:3, 217:5, 143:20, 143:27, 231:24 70:2, 196:24 88:4, 88:26, 89:7, 217:6, 217:15, 218:4, 144:22 107:27, 173:6, descriptions [4] differ [2] - 129:18, 218:10, 218:12, 219:27, 223:24, deceitful [1] - 258:3 242:16 173:10, 182:22, 222:19, 223:13, December [15] -228:8, 246:20 difference [5] -247:13, 248:1 223:22, 223:27. 6:24, 9:23, 17:26, deserves [1] - 137:3 46:27, 88:23, 175:13, denied [7] - 27:22, 224:18, 224:24, 22:15, 23:21, 25:4, DESIGNATED[1] -186:15. 186:21 80:22, 82:21, 86:23, 224:25, 224:29, 37:29, 47:6, 47:28, 4:1 88:29, 224:17, 247:9 differences [1] -225:7, 225:28, 59:29, 75:19, 131:17, designated [1] denies [3] - 98:11, 240:28 226:10, 226:18, 132:7, 133:10, 142:24 151:1 102:9. 107:27 different [25] - 16:9, 226:27, 227:10, decency [2] - 63:1 designed [2] - 46:1, 18:25, 30:18, 41:23, deny [13] - 80:10, 230:14, 230:18, deception [1] -180:9 45:26, 65:11, 69:5, 83:3, 83:26, 84:25, 230:22, 231:9. 164:17 **desire** [8] - 86:20, 69:7, 75:22, 91:9, 87:7, 87:8, 87:22, 231:16. 231:22. 90:25, 91:18, 93:16, decide [3] - 72:21, 153:3, 175:9, 175:10, 87:23, 114:2, 176:26, 231:29, 232:3, 232:9, 209:3, 214:29, 215:6, 73:10, 236:16 175:12, 186:20, 181:19, 185:23, 232:14, 232:17, decided [5] - 123:6, 215:16 186:25, 229:7, 229:9, 247:26 232:18, 232:21, 236:6, 236:14, desist [2] - 49:25, 231:5, 231:6, 231:14, denying [5] - 80:24, 232:25, 233:1, 250:20, 256:9 139.12 231:29, 241:9, 86:28, 88:14, 89:14, 233:10, 233:18, decides [2] - 61:16, detail [51] - 61:13, 242:17, 244:6 234:4, 234:8, 234:11, 69:14, 72:7, 80:16, 74:16 difficult [13] - 35:22, Department [14] -234:15, 234:22, deciding [1] - 134:17 80:25, 82:24, 82:27, 80:19, 88:3, 88:9, 6:15, 7:10, 8:15, 8:28, 234:29, 235:25, decision [7] - 24:21, 9:23, 11:21, 12:27, 83:4, 84:18, 84:19, 109:18, 112:5, 236:7, 236:21, 86:22, 87:3, 87:11, 42:6, 110:16, 145:2, 14:22, 15:8, 36:28, 112:17, 121:14, 237:23, 239:4, 173:22, 237:6, 237:7 88:2, 88:16, 88:19, 131:23, 207:19, 41:13, 56:19, 72:27, 239:16, 239:17, 88:22, 96:28, 97:1, dedicated [1] -233:23, 246:18, 248:9 228:1 240:17 169:10 97:29, 98:9, 98:11, difficulties [12] -DEPARTMENT[1] deputy [21] - 41:26, 98:12, 107:12, deep [1] - 203:14 21:29, 57:4, 119:23, 4:24 42:17, 43:7, 43:12, 110:14, 112:25, deeply [4] - 56:6, 127:26, 129:10, department [2] -47:2, 57:14, 57:17, 113:5, 136:7, 136:25, 203:21, 203:27, 205:3, 205:14, 109:12, 109:25 58:10, 61:5, 63:9, 158:2, 158:3, 158:9, 255:17 205:17, 205:23, depute [1] - 57:24 63:15, 63:18, 100:24, 158:14, 160:15, defamation [1] -207:22, 235:12 deputed [1] - 58:10 105:10, 177:4, 161:19, 161:20, 60:14 difficulty [7] - 36:1, **Deputy** [127] - 42:9, 196:22, 196:27, 168:11, 173:11, 36:6, 80:25, 147:23, defamatory [2] -42:15, 42:20, 57:25, 207:22, 207:26, 173:13, 194:3, 199:4, 60:11, 153:1 189:1, 212:4, 248:19 59:23, 60:2, 63:12, 238:23, 242:20 221:5, 232:23, default [1] - 246:2 dig [1] - 128:15 64:17, 66:4, 66:14, derogatory [3] -248:11, 248:17, **DIGNAM** [22] - 2:15, defence [10] - 9:13, 68:3, 68:15, 70:8, 115:11, 218:21, 248:22, 249:1, 10:25, 113:10, 5:11, 33:5, 33:25, 71:25, 71:27, 72:2, 218:25 249:11, 249:13 34:3, 34:9, 199:16, 114:15, 250:14, 76:11, 81:5, 105:24, describe [8] - 100:2, detailed [2] - 102:23, 199:19, 199:27, 252:9, 252:14, 252:18 105:29, 146:29, 194:4, 202:2, 205:5, 220:8 defend [1] - 57:18 199:29, 202:22, 150:3. 153:11. 215:17, 222:17, details [7] - 82:15, defended [1] - 58:13 174:12, 174:14, 226:18, 226:27, 227:26, 238:29

227:3, 227:7, 227:9, discipline [4] - 11:5, dispute [10] - 56:29, dogs [1] - 70:4 dragging [1] -243:18, 243:21, 43:29, 53:28, 164:20 83:27, 85:15, 85:20, domain [5] - 39:16, 113:15 244:5, 246:13, disciplined [4] -107:29, 190:21, 39:17, 47:19, 48:10, dramatic [1] - 203:2 249:11, 249:20 25:20, 26:19, 44:12, 216:22, 247:17, 90.23 draw [7] - 59:6, 82:6, **Dignam** [2] - 33:21, 211.2 247:25, 250:5 **DONAL**[1] - 2:16 88:15, 125:25, done [13] - 17:14, disciplines [1] - 17:5 disputed [1] - 224:17 178:16, 197:23, dinner [3] - 140:15, disputes [1] - 192:11 33:29, 57:18, 62:19, 197:24 disclose [1] - 209:10 140:16, 156:10 disclosed [2] dissuade [1] -70:14, 70:15, 94:8, drawing [1] - 178:3 direct [10] - 12:11, 187:18 139:14, 212:2 98:17, 98:18, 109:9, drawn [1] - 186:14 15:28, 20:26, 21:24, distance [2] - 66:12, 188:20, 239:23, disclosing [1] -**Drayton** [1] - 256:20 40:21, 97:12, 243:11, 182:23 240:12 dreadful [3] - 255:24, 49:26 249:15, 249:18, Disclosure [1] distancing [1] door [5] - 35:7, 255:26 257:10 102:23 64:27 66:21, 153:21, drew [2] - 76:18, directed [15] - 23:3, disclosure [17] distinction [3] -241:27, 242:6 102:5 57:14, 57:17, 81:20, 20:17, 186:17, 186:19 door-stepped [1] -28:23, 48:19, 77:14, **drive** [1] - 148:18 82:6, 100:23, 105:1, 77:29, 78:17, 80:23, distinguished [1] driven [3] - 82:1, 105:6, 106:4, 106:15, 80:26, 81:10, 83:19, doorway [2] -135:26. 169:6 106:17, 115:4, 161:2, 83:22, 97:13, 114:19, distributed [2] -133:27, 133:29 driver [7] - 146:10, 161:13, 161:26 116:1, 211:5, 247:5, dossier [1] - 14:11 58:21, 77:18 147:7, 148:12, 149:5, directing [4] - 25:6, 250:27, 250:29 doubt [14] - 24:26, divergence [3] -149:10, 169:10, 49:25, 103:29, 128:17 Disclosures [1] -178:21, 181:11, 66:9, 90:28, 92:11, 245:28 direction [48] - 6:25, 210:5 190:11 109:17, 109:19, driving [15] - 119:27, 6:26, 20:19, 23:21, disclosures [6] -**DMG** [1] - 3:18 110:24, 130:9, 119:29, 146:20, 23:26, 25:3, 25:11, 78:15, 78:18, 78:23, 197:16, 210:16, dock [7] - 217:8, 147:26, 148:6, 148:7, 26:25, 27:14, 27:15, 213:14, 214:6, 216:18 78:28 90:10 247:4 220:17, 220:18, 148:14, 148:23, 27:17, 37:29, 38:15, DISCLOSURES [2] -221:23, 222:8, down [55] - 24:13, 150:21, 150:23, 38:24, 47:1, 47:27, 1:3, 1:4 222:24, 227:17 26:28, 28:4, 29:13, 151:3, 151:16, 49:11, 49:20, 49:24, 29:26, 41:10, 41:26, disconcerting[1] -**DOCK** [1] - 3:30 154:28, 246:7, 246:9 50:7, 50:9, 51:21, 71.22 43:28, 49:18, 54:5, document [29] drizzle [1] - 189:24 54:5, 54:13, 55:7, 56:23, 61:13, 73:23, discover [2] - 24:9, 11:26, 13:5, 25:16, dropping[1] -55:9, 55:28, 56:8, 73:25, 80:29, 81:11, 24:12 26:27, 27:7, 27:8, 202:12 63:12, 63:17, 81:15, discovered [1] - 24:1 33:11, 34:6, 41:16, 83:13, 87:28, 89:10, drowning [1] - 26:4 82:16, 93:23, 105:11, 94:22, 96:21, 100:4, discredit [3] - 81:6, 41:20, 45:9, 46:11, dubious [1] - 210:4 117:22, 138:19, 100:15, 100:20, 82:13, 185:11 51:1, 55:26, 57:19, **DUBLIN** [14] - 1:17, 139:2, 139:5, 139:8, 103:19, 110:21, discuss [4] - 15:1, 57:22 59:12 60:19 2:12, 2:20, 2:25, 2:30, 139:12, 139:15, 113:2, 116:13, 122:3, 72:26, 192:13, 253:23 60:20, 83:21, 137:22, 3:8, 3:13, 3:23, 3:31, 140:4, 140:9, 140:11, 128:15, 134:1, 137:25, 139:11, discussed [5] -4:4, 4:8, 4:12, 4:22, 162:7, 165:3 166:23, 166:26, 137:12, 160:18, 71:23, 123:10, 139:3, 4:27 direction/invitation 173:6, 174:9, 179:17, 167:22, 200:5, 162:4, 215:7 due [5] - 92:18, [1] - 244:15 181:8, 191:2, 202:29, 202:12, 209:17 93:10, 137:3, 138:27, discussion [16] directions [8] -203:11, 203:19, documentation [29] -16:13, 16:16, 47:2, 221:16 25:21, 39:26, 47:22, 203:28, 205:13, 73:23, 73:25, 97:6, 37:4, 37:6, 37:8, dull [1] - 184:24 52:1, 55:10, 67:21, 218:8, 218:12, 45:11, 45:12, 48:8, 109:27, 123:9, during [19] - 15:13, 158:5, 192:1 223:10, 227:17, 57:27, 58:14, 58:17, 143:18, 179:20, 28:16, 29:24, 30:5, directly [6] - 66:27. 62:24, 77:10, 77:27, 228:19, 234:24, 179:22, 193:21, 39:6, 47:24, 50:24, 73:4, 141:8, 163:21, 238:8, 245:14, 212:17, 250:21, 78:12, 79:2, 79:10, 50:25, 75:6, 95:22, 187:28, 238:17 253:28, 254:5, 254:7, 250:27, 251:5 79:20, 85:27, 86:6, 174:24, 176:4, director [1] - 189:10 255:5 86:28, 89:28, 147:10, discussions [1] -180:12, 180:21, disappointment [1] downstairs [1] -162:10, 175:20, 107:20 190:12, 195:22, 99:18 227:18 176:1, 176:11, 200:4, disgraceful [1] - 35:1 214:24, 237:24, 249:4 disapproval [2] dozen [1] - 130:19 210:21, 236:25, disgusting [1] - 35:1 dust [1] - 16:29 156:27, 164:24 236:26 **DPP**[4] - 123:6, disgusting' [1] duties [2] - 54:22, discern [1] - 251:3 191:22, 192:1, 225:4 documents [17] -144:5 54:25 discharging [1] -11:7, 36:27, 44:14, draft [8] - 61:14, dismissal [1] duty [15] - 10:10, 78:20 187:21, 188:2, 188:3, 48:3, 58:21, 77:28, 171.27 36:20, 54:10, 54:17, disciplinary [11] -188:5, 235:9, 239:3, 83:16, 83:18, 83:24, dismissed [1] -54:19, 54:21, 65:23, 37:18, 37:19, 40:9, 85:16, 85:17, 175:8, 250:3 72:13, 72:14, 76:8, 239:11 40:19, 41:6, 43:22, 190:22, 209:12, drafted [1] - 235:10 142:19, 169:16, disobey [2] - 55:9, 43:27, 44:8, 44:25, 211:13, 211:28, 231:8 drafting [4] - 66:13, 169:20, 170:1, 200:16 55:10 64:19, 207:16 239:12, 250:10, 254:6 **dog** [1] - 139:4 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:5 disparaged [1] - 68:5

236:2 Dáil [12] - 10:29, 115:22, 116:2, 220:28 196:21, 214:9 111:6, 111:10, 11:19, 75:6, 196:22, elephant [1] - 135:4 enemy [1] - 67:15 essential [1] -114:21, 116:21, 210:28, 217:1, elevating [1] - 31:28 enforcement [4] -173:14 116:27, 118:14, 119:4, 119:13, 120:1, 217:28, 229:13, eleven [1] - 154:14 10:19, 12:24, 16:15, essentially [4] -229:19, 229:22, 16.18 16:20, 75:26, 140:9, 121:17, 123:12, **ELIZABETH**[1] - 2:7 229:26, 230:5 engage [12] - 7:3, 125:1, 125:19, 241.29 elsewhere 131 -8:8, 29:21, 30:15, establish [5] - 37:17, 125:23, 126:19, 22:11, 207:13, 208:2 126:20, 152:2, Ε 56:9, 86:18, 100:7, 87:13, 162:5, 179:2, ELY [1] - 4:21 108:17, 109:2, 164:17, 164:23, 179:10 em [1] - 153:17 119:19, 213:25, ESTABLISHED[1] -164:26, 173:26, em.. [1] - 225:25 EARLSFORT[1] -249:15 174:23, 174:25, email [11] - 8:24, 4.4 176:2, 176:10, engaged [10] - 9:5, established [3] -10:1, 54:1, 157:6, early [5] - 80:7, 177:16, 178:8, 38:20, 43:18, 45:21, 36:24, 62:29, 247:9 157:14, 157:16, 97:22, 142:8, 158:25, 178:11, 178:15, 46:1, 155:26, 213:20, establishment [2] -158:27, 218:29, 159:29 178:16, 178:22, 244:9, 244:12, 258:3 117:10. 187:12 219:20, 242:25, earnestly [1] - 41:8 179:4, 179:9, 180:2, engaging [2] - 119:8, estimate [1] - 243:18 242:28 earshot [2] - 220:29, 182:3, 182:21, 128:17 emails [1] - 157:10 etcetera [5] - 76:12, 221:1 183:15, 183:19, engulfed [1] - 89:8 125:12, 214:25, emanating [1] easier [1] - 129:2 184:1, 184:4, 185:9, enlarged [1] - 233:2 229:2, 255:27 easily [2] - 32:24, 185:12, 186:10, evening [14] - 18:29, enormous [2] embarked [1] - 116:7 72:4 186:14, 187:10, 109:26, 248:20 22:14, 22:15, 154:11, embarrassed [1] easy [2] - 149:7, 187:17, 189:3, 190:1, enquired [1] - 159:22 251:4 156:8, 194:16, 205:24 190:25, 190:26, enter [1] - 84:15 234:21, 235:8, embarrassment [1] eat [1] - 38:5 191:7, 191:10, 235:10, 235:14, entered [3] - 112:28, 31:15 Eavan [2] - 116:22, 191:15. 192:6. 239:1, 239:13, 225:5, 241:6 emerged [1] - 107:15 117:25 194:13, 194:22, enterprise [2] -241:27, 251:24 **EMMA**[1] - 2:18 economic [1] - 205:2 195:3, 195:8, 195:16, 105:26, 105:29 event [7] - 49:10, employee [3] -195:21, 196:12, editor [1] - 158:19 83:1, 96:11, 138:13, 187:26, 234:23, entire [1] - 125:20 editorial [7] - 160:18, 196:21, 196:24, 181:27, 190:6, 253:28 234:24 entirely [5] - 27:16, 160:27, 161:9, 196:25, 197:10, events [9] - 46:17, 61:9, 92:14, 153:2, employer [2] -161:14, 161:26, 197:15, 198:7, 114:8, 143:23, 151:5, 257:3 187:25, 238:15 198:19, 199:9, 200:8, 161:28, 173:6 entirety [1] - 136:25 160:29, 170:19, emplover/ editors [5] - 157:25, 200:27, 201:4. 175:29, 187:11, employee [1] - 239:10 entities [1] - 67:3 201:11, 202:6, 207:2, 158:7. 165:21. 187:14 entitled [9] - 28:23, employers [3] -165:22, 173:27 210:8, 210:18, eventually [1] -86:17, 121:28, 124:1, 243:4, 243:9, 243:12 effect [6] - 127:22, 210:19, 210:28, 32:12 128:9, 148:18, employment[1] -211:3, 213:18, 128:4, 141:5, 141:14, 155:11, 155:14, 156:4 everywhere [1] -192.14 215:14, 216:16, 187:1, 228:9 58:29 entitlement [3] enable [3] - 84:22, 226:21, 227:15, effectively [6] evidence [166] - 6:8, 65:8, 139:20, 175:8 85:18. 85:19 61:28, 61:29, 67:15, 228:11, 228:14. 6:10, 7:25, 9:16, 9:20, entrap [1] - 199:10 encourage [1] -231:8. 233:4. 233:7. 134:27, 160:17, 10:5, 10:8, 10:11, entries [1] - 155:29 81:26 234:1, 234:12, 212.12 entry [12] - 146:14, 10:15, 10:22, 10:27, encouraged [1] -235:24, 236:5, effort [1] - 95:10 11:1, 11:18, 11:23, 146:16, 146:18, 102:26 236:19, 246:14, efforts [5] - 20:2. 12:3, 12:7, 12:8, 12:9, end [21] - 18:16, 147:27, 147:29, 249:28, 250:2, 250:3, 187:26, 194:12, 13:25, 16:5, 16:8, 24:14, 55:14, 78:13, 148:3, 149:15, 253:29 237:3, 237:5 16:27, 17:10, 17:24, 149:29. 196:25. 98:25, 102:18, **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:9 **EILEEN** [1] - 4:19 18:20, 19:15, 22:7, 197:9, 209:25, 242:29 113:27, 114:14, evidential [1] - 31:4 either [25] - 18:28, 24:16, 24:19, 27:10, **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:9 118:7, 123:7, 149:23, exact [2] - 19:20, 20:12, 21:2, 22:10, 28:5, 28:22, 32:10, equality [2] - 9:13, 157:24, 158:13, 233.9 24:3, 35:14, 66:19, 37:5, 41:3, 43:15, 181:3, 181:4, 187:24, 10:25 exactly [13] - 18:14, 68:26, 90:29, 128:27, 61:23, 61:24, 67:18, 216:23, 234:21, equally [1] - 106:2 18:18, 46:20, 62:15, 132:18, 140:7, 68:14, 68:17, 68:28, equate [1] - 107:25 239:5, 249:3, 252:1 153:13. 155:6. 92:24, 117:29, 69:8, 69:12, 69:16, end-all [1] - 114:14 equation [1] - 189:25 158:27, 171:13, 127:25, 169:8, 69:18, 70:14, 70:18, Enda [1] - 54:1 errors [3] - 58:4, 169:11, 172:12, 196:5, 196:29, 71:4, 71:14, 73:29, 58:24, 61:22 endeavours [2] -228:13, 232:22, 219:26, 229:22, 74:22, 74:29, 77:9, 172:3, 172:16 escalation [2] -238:18 230:5, 233:1, 237:26, 80:2, 90:20, 97:5, 164:24, 166:25 ended [2] - 194:28, examination [4] -251:10, 252:1 103:12, 106:20, escape [1] - 205:15 244.29 8:25, 9:3, 12:3, elected [1] - 47:10 106:23. 107:16. endorse [1] - 100:9 escapes [1] - 244:25 170:16 element [4] - 19:25,

essence [3] - 81:29,

endorsement [1] -

108:8, 108:9, 111:2,

examined [6] -168:29 factually [5] - 30:29, 92:27, 115:18, F 19:16, 155:20, experience [1] -112:26, 192:7, 136:11, 150:24, 166:18, 166:23, 35:20 192:10, 241:7 179:27, 237:19, f-ing [2] - 184:9, 243:7, 257:11 196:14, 198:10 failed [3] - 22:21, experienced [4] -185.6 EXAMINED [18] -19:8, 118:20, 183:4, 29:18. 194:13 fashion [1] - 159:27 fabricated [2] -5:4, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, failure [3] - 12:7, fault [1] - 138:17 195:29, 196:24 5:9, 5:10, 5:11, 5:12, 24:12, 90:12 favour [1] - 257:21 expert [1] - 72:26 fabricating [2] -6:4, 77:3, 131:7, expiry [2] - 168:3, failures [2] - 58:3, **favours** [1] - 46:2 22:10, 196:26 142:1, 145:10, 58:23 168:18 FCPS [1] - 214:29 170:10, 174:6, fabrication [2] fair [44] - 28:5, 29:14, explain [6] - 22:10, feature [3] - 119:28, 199:27, 249:25 42:17, 52:8, 151:14, 69:19. 197:4 29:27, 30:10, 30:25, 119:29, 197:15 face [7] - 20:13, 56:5, **EXAMINER** [1] - 3:25 241:17, 246:17 32:16, 40:17, 65:1, February [10] -57:2, 116:12, 137:22, examining [1] explained [7] -65:24, 86:13, 94:5, 17:23, 22:19, 26:23, 146:2, 240:22 38:20 15:19, 72:4, 111:4, 97:8, 97:9, 109:10, 32:4, 32:5, 39:29, 111:28, 200:12. faced [1] - 205:4 110:1, 127:17, example [5] -137:6, 218:6, 218:15, faces [1] - 68:5 134:18, 137:13, 132:22, 136:15, 234:19, 254:14 223:24 facilitate [1] - 188:15 142:27, 146:9, 251:18 explaining [1] -143:1, 143:5, 174:26, **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:6, facilities [1] - 84:20 examples [1] -183:7, 185:25, 76:28 fact [82] - 10:17, 199:22, 204:9, 207:16 explanation [13] feed [1] - 253:9 12:9, 19:20, 22:26, 205:26, 211:9, exceeding [2] -43:3, 83:29, 102:21, feeding [1] - 155:29 147:25, 150:28 24:18, 24:19, 27:3, 211:11, 211:22, 103:4, 103:14, feelings [7] - 65:21, 31:14, 32:1, 34:5, 212:3, 213:9, 214:18, except [4] - 135:13, 103:20, 104:21, 65:22, 180:20, 36:4, 36:9, 40:25, 217:13, 217:14, 177:25, 189:23, 224:8 104:29, 105:15, 180:26, 181:2, 181:4, 41:7, 49:14, 64:19, 227:22, 228:28, EXCHANGE[1] -107:25, 149:12, 210:13 3:29 213:26, 233:19 71:14, 72:5, 79:3, 229:21, 230:1, feet [1] - 239:26 79:21, 79:24, 82:12, 241:24, 242:15. exchange [12] expletives [1] -**FELIX** [1] - 4:6 83:2, 87:7, 88:15, 247:15, 247:20, 15:14, 16:8, 17:2, 186:7 fella [2] - 187:3, 89:9, 89:25, 90:23, 247:21, 248:14 18:13, 28:20, 41:2, exploring [2] -232:4 91:16, 91:18, 94:16, fairly [8] - 16:13, 175:4. 175:20. 208:29, 209:15 felt [20] - 17:13, 95:27, 107:19, 108:1, 17:2, 63:23, 114:3, 176:15, 178:17, express [2] - 56:12, 29:28, 45:23, 51:13, 119:7, 119:11, 189:4, 189:27 167:14, 180:7, 156:26 80:16, 93:1, 96:7, 123:18, 135:9, 192:11, 228:8 exchanges [1] expressed [6] - 17:1, 110:12, 113:3, 135:11, 135:28, fairness [7] - 87:15, 99:18, 165:8, 201:9, 16:12 117:19, 120:3, 138:21, 149:10. 104:16, 136:3, exclusively [1] - 45:7 203:13 215:16 122:28, 154:11, 150:24. 152:6. 140:20, 171:6, 171:9, 154:14, 165:6, 204:9, executive [3] expressing [1] -152:24, 153:2, 180:19 120:7, 120:23, 125:9 206:12, 211:1, 177:15, 182:4, false [18] - 25:10, exercise [4] - 43:19, expression [7] -246:22, 246:25 182:16, 182:23, 64:10, 115:3, 115:14, 87:16, 247:16, 247:24 185:28, 186:4, Fennelly [2] - 34:15, 183:10, 183:16, exercising [1] -115:16, 115:18, 186:11, 187:5, 34:16 184:29, 185:1, 115:22, 121:9, 122:8, 43:29 187:11, 192:15, 212:9 FERRY [1] - 2:23 185:12, 186:15, 191:10, 191:14, exerted [1] - 34:25 expressions [1] few [8] - 17:11, 192:9, 193:9, 193:26, 196:24, 196:25, exist [1] - 108:1 118:18 61:22, 77:7, 117:11, 194:7. 194:28. 197:2, 197:9, 197:10 existed [1] - 93:8 extensive [2] -199:29, 243:14, 206:24, 213:24, falsehood [1] - 69:1 176:15, 213:18 246:22, 254:14 existence [3] -217:15, 221:28, falsification [1] extensively [1] fiddler [5] - 186:22, 51:12, 93:11, 128:7 226:6, 226:29, 229:9, 164:18 187:4, 187:9, 233:12, expect [5] - 201:16, 138:14 230:8, 230:13, falsifying [1] - 197:9 242:27, 244:3, 244:9, extent [6] - 56:1, 233:21 230:17, 234:4, 235:9, familiar [1] - 186:8 110:27, 128:16, 244:18 fiddler" [1] - 233:8 236:27, 237:6, family [4] - 72:6, 200:4, 206:15, 224:7 expectation [3] fiddler' [8] - 185:29, 240:27, 242:24, 191:5, 240:5, 255:8 extra [2] - 115:21, 44:12, 169:20, 248:18 186:5, 186:12, 245:7. 245:26. 248:1. famous [4] - 26:3, 115:22 expected [8] - 43:25, 186:18, 187:11, 249:9, 252:26 136:16, 181:18, 183:6 97:17, 118:21, extracts [1] - 34:18 230:13, 230:15, factions [1] - 206:7 famously [1] -206:25, 206:26, extraordinarily [1] -230:26 factor [5] - 121:20, 189:11 233.23 239:22, 239:25, fiddles [8] - 185:23, 122:24, 123:19, **FANNING** [3] - 3:5, 248:14 extraordinary [1] -186:22, 187:2, 187:3, 124:12, 126:10 3:6, 3:11 187:9, 230:24, expecting [1] - 28:28 facts [11] - 7:8, 51:7, far [18] - 20:14, expedite [1] - 188:15 extremely [1] - 29:1 231:17, 232:4 52:16, 71:20, 73:26, 20:24, 39:9, 41:5, expedition [1] eye [2] - 210:5, 242:2 fides [2] - 42:3, 76:13, 84:18, 128:24, 41:11, 59:4, 65:28, 160:24 257:3 149:15, 197:6, 210:3 67:10, 68:9, 85:26, fight [1] - 139:4 expenses [1] -

file [5] - 59:12, 59:15, 177:9, 191:22, 191:29 files [1] - 225:13 **film** [2] - 189:6, 189:15 films [1] - 189:12 final [7] - 9:7, 50:10, 75:27, 86:2, 87:23, 173:16, 233:16 finally [6] - 74:18, 86:25, 86:27, 239:16, 240:15, 246:13 financial [2] - 100:6, 204:24 financially [1] -205:10 findings [4] - 9:17, 10:22, 12:4, 64:7 fine [4] - 118:17, 141:18, 178:7, 252:7 finest [4] - 250:6, 250:15, 253:29, 254:12 finish [1] - 227:10 finished [3] - 52:24, 170:5, 170:6 Finucane [1] - 251:6 firmly [1] - 91:6 first [72] - 6:19, 6:25, 11:16, 14:3, 19:20, 33:8, 36:17, 36:21, 38:23, 41:21, 41:26, 52:7, 57:3, 57:9, 61:13, 66:28, 78:1, 79:12, 81:9, 82:12, 88:22, 91:10, 91:27, 93:3, 94:3, 98:19, 98:21, 100:11, 102:6, 120:20, 131:15, 137:13, 139:27, 140:5, 140:11, 142:7, 156:2, 163:21, 171:24, 174:19, 181:16, 181:21, 181:28, 182:1, 183:1, 194:24, 203:29, 204:4, 206:28, 207:5, 209:19, 210:8, 214:3, 217:7, 218:4, 224:26, 229:12, 231:16, 232:1, 232:3, 233:1, 233:2, 245:15, 247:14, 248:8, 250:2, 250:11, 252:24, 253:5, 253:18, 254:6, 255:5 firsthand [1] -127:27 firstly [8] - 10:3,

77:10, 80:28, 93:28,

132:8, 134:6, 211:1, 211:12 fit [2] - 30:9, 253:16 fits [1] - 33:24 FITZGERALD[1] -2:17 five [6] - 9:5, 19:16, 198:10, 209:24, 210:7, 245:28 five-and-a-half [1] -198:10 fix [1] - 28:19 fixed [37] - 8:26, 8:29, 10:17, 14:19, 14:22, 37:10, 40:27, 46:3, 48:5, 48:9, 48:15, 49:27, 119:15, 120:5, 135:19, 139:17, 145:18, 145:19, 146:3, 146:27, 149:13, 150:4, 150:9, 151:1, 151:29, 153:1, 155:12, 159:7, 159:10, 159:12, 159:14, 164:4, 164:7, 164:15, 165:29, 219:13, 246:3 Flahive [3] - 8:15, 11:2, 57:6 fleet [1] - 205:12

flew [1] - 57:2

220:17

flies [2] - 20:13, 57:2

floor [2] - 185:21,

FLOOR [1] - 4:16

focus [3] - 77:11,

focused [3] - 103:28,

follow [7] - 6:8, 55:6,

followed [2] - 46:11,

following [20] - 1:26,

FOLLOWING [1] -

11:9, 14:21, 47:7,

47:29, 65:2, 65:12,

68:13, 77:17, 91:2,

163:7, 163:13,

68:28, 144:2

163:18, 170:19,

99:16, 99:29, 138:12,

195:26, 229:18, 237:8

follows [3] - 49:24,

folder [1] - 209:13

55:8, 75:11, 75:13,

241:10, 241:27

241.10

163:5

follow-up [1] -

104:28, 105:1

107:7, 247:17

foolish [3] - 62:7, 62:12, 204:13 foot [6] - 31:2, 103:21, 105:12, 171:1, 192:2, 245:17 **FOR** [19] - 1:8, 2:6, 2:9, 2:14, 2:22, 2:27, 3:1, 3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:20, 3:25, 4:1, 4:6, 4:10, 4:14, 4:19, 4:24, 101:3 force [14] - 9:27, 11:5, 25:20, 26:19, 40:13, 47:8, 205:6, 207:15, 207:20, 211:2, 211:3, 211:8, 255:15 foregoing [2] -86:20, 90:8 forensic [1] - 60:21 Forensic [1] - 34:19 form [17] - 62:27, 89:18, 89:22, 89:25, 90:13, 91:21, 92:6, 92:18, 93:21, 94:10, 96:7, 96:23, 107:14, 137:7, 171:17, 179:20, 237:26 formally [3] - 14:11, 14:15, 17:11 formed [2] - 248:23, 250:13 former [29] - 6:26, 7:24, 47:15, 105:24, 115:5, 124:15, 124:24, 127:2, 140:21, 141:7, 171:28, 181:24, 182:29, 183:4, 185:15, 186:3, 196:22, 203:13, 220:9, 220:15, 220:19, 221:1, 221:4, 222:2, 223:1, 223:6, 223:15, 223:17, 223:28 formula [1] - 19:6 fortnight [1] - 137:20 forum [1] - 211:22 forums [1] - 12:17 forward [6] - 53:12,

240:19, 240:22, 240:23, 240:28 fourth [1] - 83:21 fracas [1] - 64:13 fragment [1] - 42:7 fragmentary [1] -34:18 frame [1] - 100:19 FRANCIS [1] - 3:22 Frank [6] - 250:8, 250:22, 250:29, 251:4, 251:13, 253:13 frank [1] - 213:10 free [2] - 30:4, 242:5 FREEMAN [11] - 3:5, 5:9, 170:10, 170:12, 170:25, 172:13, 172:26, 173:10, 173:14, 173:25, 174:3 Freeman [1] - 170:12 freeman [2] - 173:5, 173:20 frequent [3] - 67:27, 200:29, 242:24 fresh [1] - 29:24 Friday [5] - 103:12, 120:2, 124:3, 125:1, 208:28 friend [1] - 255:18 friendly [1] - 201:27 friends [1] - 49:6 frolic [1] - 62:17 front [12] - 27:27, 64:26. 71:14. 98:4. 98:5, 129:16, 160:13, 177:10, 178:4, 182:16, 190:16, 190:22 front-page [1] -160:13 fruit [2] - 237:4, 237.5 fruits [2] - 237:11, 237:12 frustrated [5] -128:20, 180:12, 180:14, 203:21, 203:27 frustration [1] -203:14 FSNI [2] - 59:16, 243:27 fucking [2] - 183:17, 233:17 full [7] - 44:5, 55:11, 64:26, 139:29, 152:8,

137:17

four [11] - 31:11,

74:28, 75:3, 83:15,

83:18, 83:24, 199:14,

FOLLOWS [5] - 6:1,

102:1, 199:25,

249:25, 254:21

182:10

fondness [1] -

210:3, 231:21 fully [10] - 9:9, 26:14, 50:4, 50:17, 81:28, 85:18, 102:28, 185:11, 247:26, 248:26 function [2] - 35:7, 63:8 functions [2] - 78:21, 206:18 furiously [1] - 49:5 furnished [3] -85:27, 86:29, 209:12 furore [1] - 143:25 furtherance [1] -86:16 furthermore [1] -18:15 future [7] - 20:23, 93:13, 106:28, 113:14, 131:19, 168:8, 168:24 **FÍONÁN** [1] - 2:27 Fíonán [1] - 142:4 G

gained [1] - 132:12 GALLAGHER[2] -4:20, 4:21 gangland [1] - 206:3 **Garda** [144] - 6:26, 7:29, 9:1, 9:4, 9:19, 10:11, 10:12, 10:23, 11:13, 11:16, 12:23, 13:11, 13:16, 13:22, 16:17, 16:19, 17:6, 20:27, 23:16, 24:28, 25:20, 25:28, 26:18, 26:23, 31:3, 33:2, 33:10. 33:17. 33:20. 33:27, 36:18, 39:4, 39:16, 43:20, 43:23, 46:7, 46:24, 47:15, 48:14, 49:28, 51:22, 54:17, 57:15, 59:16, 60:10, 62:18, 62:22, 64:5, 65:9, 65:13, 67:9, 72:26, 74:14, 76:10, 78:21, 81:4, 81:28, 99:14, 99:16, 100:24, 102:28, 108:25, 109:26, 115:7, 116:8, 119:21, 124:20, 129:3, 129:8, 129:9, 131:24, 131:28, 132:2, 134:13, 134:16, 134:29, 135:26, 136:16, 144:4, 150:3,

66:29, 83:28, 105:18,

forwarded [5] - 8:28,

29:10, 71:19, 137:15,

125:6, 208:20

151:28, 152:7, **GERAGHTY** [1] - 4:7 grateful [1] - 49:6 handled [1] - 72:27 244:23 152:10, 152:21, Gerald [7] - 66:23, grave [2] - 10:2, handling [1] - 63:8 headbangers [1] -153:10, 153:11, 67:1, 250:5, 251:5, 195:4 hands [3] - 74:16, 233:17 154:13, 154:19, 251:10, 251:20, great [8] - 20:1, 167:26, 223:19 **header** [1] - 185:6 154:22, 154:29, 252:27 header' [2] - 183:18, 31:14, 37:16, 65:4, hanging [1] - 24:5 155:2, 155:5, 155:7, GERARD [1] - 4:24 76:13, 182:10, 200:3, happy [5] - 34:3, 184:9 155:8, 155:16, 234:15 GILLANE [24] - 3:1, 34:7, 181:3, 197:12, Headquarters [5] -155:18, 159:21, 5:6, 22:23, 23:7, 24:5, grief [1] - 195:10 216:12 32:22, 33:3, 33:28, 159:28, 160:11, 162:25, 164:27 25:29, 31:4, 31:12, grievance [4] harassed [1] -161:2, 161:7, 164:27, healthy [1] - 16:13 31:22, 31:26, 32:4, 96:19, 109:16, 110:6, 207:25 169:24, 172:2, 172:3, 32:7, 49:3, 131:7, 136:17 hear [8] - 138:26, harbour [1] - 210:13 172:15, 172:16, 131:9, 138:21, grievances [1] -Harcourt [1] - 161:15 166:21, 210:16, 172:21, 172:24, 138:24, 138:26, 127:22 216:10, 216:18, hard [4] - 73:19, 175:24, 181:24, 139:1, 140:20, 233:15, 234:7, 254:23 **GRIFFIN** [1] - 2:18 87:13, 107:8, 166:21 182:29, 183:11, 140:27, 141:7, ground [3] - 62:2, heard [38] - 7:26, hardening [1] -185:15, 186:3, 141:16, 141:19 174:15. 177:3 15:12, 18:13, 28:10, 176:20 195:12, 200:21, Gillane [11] - 23:6, 74:27, 78:6, 106:21, grounded [1] - 209:4 hardly [1] - 168:23 204:14, 205:4, 32:2, 32:16, 33:4, **GROUP** [1] - 3:20 108:9, 119:13, 145:4, hare [1] - 130:16 205:10, 205:15, 131:10, 131:12, 161:23, 173:17, group [1] - 232:27 HARRINGTON[1] -205:18, 206:20, 136:21, 138:18, 174:28, 181:21, grudge [3] - 22:9, 207:23, 214:7, 141:11, 141:13, 182:1, 182:20, 183:5, 73:26, 105:19 Harty [13] - 141:21, 214:10, 214:13, 141:20 GSOC [5] - 14:14, 185:18, 185:28, 145:12, 147:15, 214:26, 219:14, girl [1] - 255:1 186:4, 186:6, 186:11, 17:12, 132:1, 240:11 148:10, 163:10, 220:9, 221:4, 228:1, girls [1] - 254:29 187:10, 195:3, 195:8, guaranteed [1] -164:11, 166:9, 239:21. 240:8. gist [1] - 242:17 196:27, 201:3, 209:6, 93:26 166:11, 166:18, 241:26, 242:3, given [61] - 6:8, 10:7, 166:22, 167:1, 170:6, 213:18, 217:2, guard [3] - 57:10, 242:19, 244:1, 254:2, 230:25. 233:8. 17:24, 20:11, 27:15, 242:23 183:6, 218:21 255:13, 257:17, 27:20, 29:17, 31:3, 233:15, 233:24, quards [5] - 109:23, HARTY [23] - 4:14, 257:18 233:25, 234:1, 234:14 33:22, 39:22, 44:26, 221:24, 222:8, 5:8, 141:23, 145:10, garda [1] - 169:19 45:27, 46:26, 48:27, **HEARING** [4] - 6:1, 145:12, 147:17, 222:24, 242:21 Garda-specific [1] -48:29, 62:3, 62:4, 101:3, 102:1, 199:24 147:21, 147:23, guide [1] - 224:15 214:26 62:6, 68:15, 69:13, hearing [21] - 16:28, 148:11, 148:15, guidelines [1] -Gardaí [5] - 29:2, 69:15, 69:18, 74:21, 28:5, 28:20, 29:14, 148:27, 149:1, 149:5, 48:15 66:24, 237:1, 242:11, 77:9, 82:27, 84:20, 29:27, 137:13, 176:5, 163:11, 164:13, guts [1] - 74:1 254:4 86:22, 102:16, 176:23, 180:5, 165:2, 165:12, guys [1] - 59:1 gardaí [8] - 82:9, 105:12. 115:12. 180:13. 180:21. 165:17, 165:20, GWEN [1] - 1:30 169:15, 169:29, 116:21, 124:14, 181:7, 211:21, 166:7, 167:20, 170:5, Gwen [1] - 1:25 176:5, 176:12, 183:9, 140:23, 146:6, 146:8, 218:14, 218:17, 170:7 201:5, 220:16 149:19, 158:5, 228:18, 229:11, hat [1] - 233:14 Н gather [1] - 173:25 229:25, 234:22, 166:27, 174:22, **HATCH**[4] - 3:7, 3:7, Gay [1] - 16:10 180:11, 191:11, 237:8, 237:9 3:12, 3:12 **GEMMA**[1] - 4:14 200:8, 202:6, 202:24, hearings [2] - 180:8, hairs [1] - 8:10 hatred [3] - 209:29, Gemma [6] - 141:23, 208:11, 210:3, 228.4 half [2] - 198:10, 210:9, 210:13 141:24, 145:13, 210:17, 223:23, 199:19 heat [1] - 110:23 Hayes [34] - 17:26, 153:24, 155:5, 173:7 224:26, 227:14. heated [2] - 16:9, halfway [4] - 41:26, 18:13, 18:22, 18:27, 229:7, 229:9, 232:8, General [14] - 7:10, 16:12 203:19, 218:8, 218:11 18:29, 19:3, 19:19, 7:15, 14:12, 15:9, 232:21, 233:10, height [3] - 74:25, HALIDAY[1] - 2:11 19:24, 20:12, 21:3, 15:26, 17:13, 48:12, 237:21, 245:19, 105:9, 225:18 HALL[2] - 3:7, 3:12 21:12, 21:20, 21:25, 68:4, 70:17, 74:19, 246:21, 249:28, **HELD** [1] - 1:17 **HAMILTON**[1] - 3:16 22:8, 22:10, 22:12, 74:26, 178:19, 179:4, 253:29 HANAHOE[1] - 2:24 held [1] - 14:27 75:20, 118:7, 118:9, 217:5 God [1] - 56:29 hand [10] - 25:29, 118:10, 118:18, help [4] - 35:8, general [5] - 67:8, GORDON [6] - 2:10, 35:17, 107:1, 258:9 37:28, 38:2, 46:16, 131:11, 133:16, 80:17, 124:18, 166.9 166.14 51:23, 94:25, 94:26, 134:3, 214:3, 215:5, helpful [2] - 9:25, 128:21, 169:28 166:17. 166:22. 178:8, 223:8 215:10, 215:15, generally [3] - 16:16, 167:19 handed [7] - 11:7, 215:18, 216:13, herself [1] - 153:24 17:4, 214:23 Gordon [1] - 166:20 137:7, 138:9, 139:11, 216:18, 216:24, highest [4] - 62:18, generated [1] -Government [2] -147:10, 147:12, 216:26, 240:17 81:3, 100:23, 100:24 168:16 74:14, 76:9 195:27 HAYES[1] - 4:3 highly [2] - 155:10, genuinely [1] - 94:14 government [4] handing [1] - 52:5 head [5] - 13:21, 206:21 144:7, 145:2, 206:26 GEORGE'S [1] - 3:30 handle [1] - 206:22 19:12, 58:29, 113:17, himself [7] - 16:8,

178:24, 183:29, 30:8, 32:8, 37:8, 198:11 illusions [1] - 91:20 incident [6] - 46:9, 91:24, 98:14, 108:4 HOUSE [5] - 2:11, image [1] - 67:19 145:20, 152:25, 188:11, 193:22, 195:6, 196:4, 196:29, hinted [1] - 132:18 2:19, 3:22, 4:3, 4:26 imagine [2] - 207:20, 153:9, 168:4, 171:12 256:8 224.5 239.24 historic [1] - 225:2 incidents [2] - 88:6, House [1] - 217:27 historically [1] house [15] - 46:6, 208:20 253:18, 258:7 imagined [1] - 21:3 indicates [4] - 89:17, 149:17 97:3, 99:15, 102:8, immediate [1] include [1] - 253:1 137:14, 171:2, 190:7 history [3] - 203:28, 103:17, 104:7, included [2] - 45:8, 37:25 indicating [9] -244:6, 256:16 116:25, 117:1, immediately [7] -89:21 117:26, 140:16, 43:17, 58:12, 60:12, hitting [3] - 110:12, 10:21, 15:10, 15:22, including [8] - 9:5, 142:11, 142:28, 83:26, 102:7, 149:15, 116:9, 116:11 15:26, 210:7, 229:11, 10:6, 10:13, 14:11, hold [2] - 38:1, 164:28, 202:5, 202:8 62:18, 118:25, 221:6, 181:22, 197:27, 238:12 128:12 household [3] impact [1] - 24:15 228:6 229:28 holder [2] - 204:1, 148:17, 254:27, 255:3 impart [1] - 125:27 incorporated [1] indication [2] -85:25, 224:2 **HQ**[1] - 99:16 213:7 imparted [3] - 19:19, 138:13 hub [1] - 217:12 individual [2] incorrect [5] - 177:9, holders [1] - 124:19 55:29. 177:5 129:14, 191:5 huge [6] - 66:11, 194:25, 195:9, 255:5, holy [1] - 25:24 impartiality [1] -109:12, 112:14, 255:17 individuals [13] home [19] - 8:20, 10:18 12:25, 75:22, 114:5, 129:8, 206:3, 206:9 increased [2] -14:9, 98:4, 99:18, implicated [1] human [3] - 100:5, 135:22, 179:11, 163:7, 163:13 100:1, 108:14, 142:8, 173:29 179:24, 179:27, 110:13, 204:24 incurious [1] -153:17, 154:1, 154:4, implication [1] -180:24, 198:28, humiliated [1] -134:22 154:10, 154:16, 125:3 212:9, 236:25, 156:5, 157:21, 63:26 indecent [1] - 123:3 implications [1] -236:29, 237:1 157:29, 170:20, hundred [1] - 245:2 indeed [27] - 9:22, 100:6 172:21, 241:24, 243:4 inescapable [2] hundreds [2] - 44:14 implied [1] - 226:23 11:9, 31:15, 35:24, honest [3] - 65:16, 67:3, 80:5, 132:22, 123:18, 124:11 hunt [1] - 255:27 importance [2] -69:13, 119:6 hunting [1] - 49:5 141:2, 154:4, 169:22, inevitably [1] - 12:8 109:26, 194:26 influence [1] - 70:27 honestly [4] - 51:27, hurry [3] - 35:5, 193:23, 201:4, important [14] influencing [3] -70:15, 70:23, 244:3 188:12, 190:1 15:26, 32:9, 69:15, 215:18, 217:28, 121:8, 125:5, 126:10 229:22, 231:9, 237:1, honesty [1] - 133:6 hurt [1] - 240:5 74:5, 97:19, 97:24, 240:5, 243:6, 244:20, inform [8] - 7:11, hook [1] - 19:9 husband [1] - 156:11 97:26, 97:27, 100:28, 246:21, 248:1, 248:7, 86:15, 109:3, 116:28, hope [5] - 35:4, 110:22. 111:14. 70:22, 148:13, 165:6, 205:28, 205:29 248:27, 250:1, 254:3 118:1, 128:23, I Independent [18] -158:23, 196:6 199:16, 214:15 imported [1] -153:28. 157:25. informal [1] - 220:19 hoped [1] - 205:21 226:12 i.e [2] - 36:17, 126:16 158:19, 160:19, information [62] hopeful [1] - 83:4 impossible [1] larfhlaith [10] -160:27, 161:9, 6:20, 7:28, 9:20, 9:24, hoping [1] - 237:12 195:11 77:26, 79:5, 79:23, 161:14, 165:21, 19:12, 19:19, 20:11, horizon [1] - 131:19 impress [1] - 212:5 79:26, 80:8, 82:20, 165:22, 170:13, 21:4, 21:27, 22:11, horns [1] - 175:6 impression [7] -83:7, 84:4, 86:26, 171:1, 171:5, 171:7, 25:7, 28:4, 29:12, 16:2, 29:17, 30:3, horrific [3] - 18:1, 97:28 171:12, 171:20, 39:24, 42:6, 42:7, 19:6, 21:29 30:12, 30:17, 30:27, idea [8] - 35:12, 171:29, 173:2, 173:28 43:11, 45:1, 45:20, horse [5] - 181:19, 202:24 35:20, 58:28, 101:1, INDEPENDENT[1] -45:22, 47:7, 47:9, 181:27, 182:1, 183:6, imprisonment [1] -168:10, 177:2, 213:4, 52:23, 74:11, 74:12, 185:18 64:11 241.26 87:19, 88:25, 96:18, independent [3] improper [7] - 11:18, hospitals [1] ideal [2] - 227:6, 70:9, 178:14, 214:10 117:14, 117:25, 212:21 43:5, 120:4, 229:13, 125:27, 128:1, 135:9, 237:16 independently [3] -229:24, 230:7, 240:7 hostile [2] - 257:19, identified [5] - 37:13, 178:10, 178:12, 183:6 135:10, 135:28, improperly [1] -257:20 46:2, 58:4, 58:24, 145:23, 146:6, 146:8, index [1] - 49:5 36:11 hostility [2] - 17:14, 250.9 149:19, 151:20, **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 impugned [1] -67:24 identify [1] - 34:20 151:25, 152:8, 153:6, indicate [7] - 21:14, 173:28 Hotel [2] - 68:20, identifying [1] -155:21, 177:5, 27:11, 43:8, 156:22, IN [1] - 1:17 188:17 236:25 192:15, 209:8, 211:5, 159:25, 162:11, inappropriate [13] hotel [4] - 64:13, identities [1] - 47:4 211:14, 211:19, 253:21 188:29, 189:29, 40:27, 58:7, 58:8, 211:20, 211:29, identity [1] - 146:10 indicated [28] - 6:23, 127:5, 127:6, 127:8, 234:11 214:14, 214:15, IFSC [1] - 3:30 8:3, 37:5, 39:5, 42:24, hour [10] - 100:29, 127:13, 127:16, ignore [1] - 53:29 216:25, 241:21, 44:29, 60:21, 68:6, 132:19, 229:13, 199:20, 227:28, ignoring [1] - 135:3 245:19, 246:15, 68:8, 89:14, 94:7, 243:19, 249:6, 249:9, 230:7, 240:7, 250:10 246:17, 249:13, ill [1] - 22:9 123:5, 125:11, 250:6, 250:15, inappropriately [1] -252:28 ill-will [1] - 22:9 145:18, 151:13, 253:29, 254:12 250:16 informed [7] - 7:5, illusion [1] - 93:21 159:17, 177:20, hours [2] - 19:16, inaudible [1] - 153:1

17:9, 67:29, 102:28, 116:24, 122:28, 126:19 informing [3] -19:24, 118:9, 126:21 ing [2] - 184:9, 185:6 initial [4] - 82:19, 86:11, 110:3, 250:19 initiated [1] - 223:25 ink [1] - 145:1 inkling [2] - 256:19, 257:6 INM [1] - 172:20 innermost [1] -255:16 input [2] - 38:4, 162:7 inquire [1] - 36:29 inquired [6] - 89:26, 95:8, 95:16, 95:27, 96:1, 193:10 inquiries [3] - 37:12, 84:21, 154:29 inquiring [2] - 33:19, 155:3 **Inquiry** [1] - 215:1 inquiry [42] - 8:9, 23:4, 25:7, 30:14, 38:1, 38:3, 39:18, 56:5, 87:17, 89:18, 89:21, 89:22, 89:25, 90:13, 91:12, 91:14, 91:21, 92:6, 92:9, 92:18, 92:20, 92:26, 92:28, 93:7, 93:13, 93:21, 93:29, 94:9, 94:10, 94:26, 94:29, 95:1, 96:7, 96:12, 110:15, 154:21, 154:24, 155:11, 155:15, 156:4, 157:20, 191:11 **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:3, 1.9 insistence [1] - 87:1 insofar [4] - 86:21, 173:27, 178:24, 213:3 Inspectorate [3] -13:11, 13:16, 13:22 inspectorate's [1] -37:24 inspiration [1] -141:2 instance [23] - 11:16, 28:21, 36:21, 36:24, 46:5, 57:3, 60:1, 71:24, 88:22, 91:27, 93:4, 114:2, 114:5, 131:15, 140:5, 156:3, 179:19, 183:1,

206:28, 214:3, 217:7, 250:11 instanced [1] -132:22 instances [1] - 48:16 instead [7] - 30:6, 65:26, 66:13, 79:25, 80:11, 84:12, 121:26 instruct [1] - 243:11 INSTRUCTED [12] -2:11, 2:17, 2:23, 2:28, 3:2, 3:6, 3:17, 4:7, 4:10, 4:15, 4:20, 4:25 instructed [8] -81:20. 81:22. 102:24. 145:13, 155:9, 166:10, 172:7, 172:11 instruction[7] -20:19, 53:27, 139:10, 140:1, 160:7, 171:1, 171:19 instructions [13] -49:19, 82:18, 114:25, 115:12, 141:14, 141:16, 166:28, 171:11, 172:8, 172:18, 172:28, 198:8, 204:7 INSTRUMENT [1] insulting [1] - 56:6 insurance [2] -168:3, 168:19 integrity [1] - 197:17 intend [1] - 144:20 intended [2] -133:10, 139:12 intending[1] -133:25 intends [1] - 173:27 intent [2] - 69:2, 189:8 intention [4] - 48:7, 70:22, 188:23, 190:4 interact [1] - 179:18 interacting [2] -66:6, 198:3 interaction [12] -

71:7, 71:8, 176:23,

178:18, 183:9,

194:28, 199:8,

211:25, 218:10,

222:1, 222:21, 242:11

interactions [20] -

68:7, 71:17, 71:18,

143:13, 174:14,

178:13, 179:26,

197:18, 197:21,

198:8, 198:18,

198:23, 214:2,

214:24, 217:3, 229:5, 241:3, 246:20, 248:22, 248:23 interest [9] - 12:1, 92:9, 94:1, 124:26, 150:12, 150:14, 150:18, 252:14, 252:15 interested [3] - 92:1, 93:12, 139:25 interested' [1] -238:2 interests [3] - 17:5, 19:17, 204:21 interfered [1] - 230:9 interfering [1] -110:16 internal [2] - 244:10, 244.18 internationally [1] -256:14 interplay [1] - 198:23 interpose [1] - 66:15 interpretation [1] -228:27 interpreted [1] -121:17 interrupt [2] - 22:23, 169:14 interrupted [1] -31:16 intervening[1] intervention [10] -18:11, 192:4, 192:22, 192:28, 192:29, 193:2, 193:7, 193:16, 193:27, 193:28 interview [18] - 35:8, 35:17, 77:21, 102:12, 104:5, 104:9, 104:12, 104:14, 104:18, 133:11, 134:28, 174:17, 219:8, 219:24, 220:1, 221:28, 231:23, 241:16 interviewed [4] -13:16, 102:18, 103:25, 219:29 interviewing [1] -244:29 interviews [1] -203:8 intimidated [1] -207:25 **INTO** [1] - 1:3 introduce [2] -

108:8, 136:7, 136:8, 153:24, 183:15, 185:10, 191:16, 192:15, 198:6, 222:3 introducing [2] -192:23, 223:29 invented [2] - 21:6, 103:15 inventing [2] - 19:21, 71:4 invention [4] - 21:20, 68:18, 69:8, 69:11 investigate [3] -14:15, 50:4, 50:17 investigated [6] -64:15, 81:28, 102:29, 122:1, 123:6 investigating [4] -7:1, 56:26, 157:8, 157:11 Investigation [2] -73:8, 90:11 investigation [39] -6:18, 9:5, 9:26, 10:4, 13:12, 13:19, 15:16, 23:26, 25:1, 25:5, 29:10, 29:19, 29:25, 38:12, 38:15, 39:8, 40:2, 41:18, 47:26, 48:23, 63:29, 64:7, 91:1, 119:19, 123:16, 125:28, 128:2, 137:15, 138:20, 141:6, 177:9, 191:26, 194:9, 213:20, 213:25, 244:12, 244:24, 244:28, 245:8 investigations [4] -61:19, 84:21, 119:17, 119:20 investigators [9] -103:25, 104:2, 104:19, 177:19, 203:9, 220:1, 225:20, 241:16, 255:9 invitation [13] - 6:27, 23:22, 29:21, 38:22, 39:9, 51:6, 56:15, 56:16, 139:16, 140:15, 140:17, 190:17, 245:17 invite[1] - 12:8 invited [7] - 11:21, 13:6, 25:12, 39:6, 41:14, 56:9, 73:15 inviting [2] - 39:4, 68:17 involve [3] - 162:3, 183:21, 187:28 involved [11] - 40:6,

47:2, 55:27, 55:28, 61:17, 71:28, 77:21, 110:14, 118:12, 183:22, 257:12 involvement [5] -56:1, 116:25, 116:29, 118:8, 145:16 involves [1] - 163:26 involving [2] - 81:4, 90:13 IRA[1] - 206:7 ire [1] - 164:24 IRELAND[1] - 3:18 Ireland [3] - 34:20, 152:18. 206:26 Irish [3] - 140:26, 144:1, 144:7 IRISH [3] - 3:25, 4:1, 4:2 island [1] - 152:17 isolated [1] - 61:28 isolating [1] - 207:14 issue [56] - 6:16, 6:23, 7:20, 12:13, 16:14, 20:5, 28:7, 42:5, 43:27, 53:3, 59:19, 73:25, 80:6, 82:23, 86:3, 98:13, 104:22, 107:21, 110:7, 110:29, 113:4, 117:12, 117:21, 123:5, 124:7, 124:9, 125:20, 132:8, 132:9, 137:2, 139:18, 143:26, 149:20, 151:19, 161:12, 164:4, 175:25, 175:27, 178:5, 180:29, 181:1, 204:25, 206:3, 206:17, 209:15, 212:23, 212:24, 225:24, 234:24, 235:20, 236:18, 239:10, 243:3, 250:27, 253:25 issued [10] - 6:24, 22:18, 25:3, 25:21, 47:1, 138:19, 145:27, 155:12, 166:1, 192:2 issues [71] - 6:11, 11:14, 11:15, 14:8, 15:2, 17:20, 17:28, 37:18, 37:20, 55:1, 66:1, 68:11, 90:2, 117:8, 117:11, 119:14, 119:25, 121:25, 125:16, 129:23, 131:26, 135:1, 140:5, 157:12,

introduced [10] -

185:15, 185:16

159:18, 159:28, 173:16, 173:29, 175:10, 175:11, 175:15, 175:22, 186:28, 187:25, 187:29, 191:3, 191:16, 191:21, 192:14, 192:19, 192:24, 202:28, 204:11, 204:20, 205:25, 205:27, 205:28, 205:29, 206:6, 206:9, 206:11, 207:21, 211:26, 212:8, 212:22, 212:28, 214:27, 215:1, 215:7, 236:6, 236:13, 236:29, 238:13, 238:18, 238:26, 245:26, 246:13, 246:19, 254:2 issuing [1] - 147:4 item [5] - 25:25, 26:22, 34:22, 165:13 items [1] - 135:14 itself [5] - 25:11, 28:17, 50:9, 180:5, 211:15

J

January [17] - 26:29, 68:2, 68:21, 75:17, 114:9, 167:24, 168:3, 174:21, 176:1, 176:22, 194:6, 207:2, 212:6, 217:1, 219:12, 229:6, 237:26 **Japanese** [1] - 189:6 **JERMYN** [1] - 3:29 job [12] - 58:11, 67:28, 72:26, 99:19, 109:15, 109:22, 110:26, 116:13, 121:29, 201:8, 201:20, 256:29 John [43] - 6:26. 6:29, 9:3, 9:11, 25:6, 40:12, 41:26, 47:15, 48:24, 49:16, 50:3, 50:16, 53:4, 54:5, 68:15, 71:11, 83:20, 90:3, 119:1, 119:3, 135:22, 139:16, 167:23, 170:12, 172:2, 172:15, 172:24, 174:12, 176:24, 181:18, 181:24, 182:4, 182:5, 182:6, 182:12,

182:16, 182:29, 183:17, 184:2, 184:3, 185:6, 185:11, 185:15 **JOHN** [5] - 2:17, 2:23, 3:5, 4:10, 4:14 join [1] - 254:8 joint [2] - 9:12, 10:24 joke [1] - 246:10 joking [1] - 184:9 journalist [26] - 19:8, 20:3, 20:16, 20:20, 21:17, 32:26, 134:22, 142:5, 142:8, 142:13, 153:5, 153:27, 154:10. 154:19. 155:9, 158:20, 159:26, 160:23, 167:26, 172:20, 173:3, 173:8, 241:9, 241:10, 241:26, 243:3 journalistic [2] -33:29, 209:9 journalists [7] -32:24. 116:25.

JUDGE [2] - 1:12, 2:3 judge [4] - 247:14, 247:15, 247:23, 248:2 Judge [14] - 24:23, 26:6, 28:8, 29:4, 33:15, 49:4, 49:6, 59:18, 140:9, 166:18, 166:22, 182:14, 226:18

Judge's [1] - 87:1

116:29, 241:18,

188:15

242:4, 248:23, 255:26

journey [3] - 36:22,

journalists' [1] - 82:6

July [15] - 8:24,
14:21, 14:27, 33:19,
58:1, 58:23, 59:21,
59:22, 60:22, 60:23,
61:15, 145:21, 168:5,
171:23, 244:7
jumped [1] - 151:24
June [1] - 167:25
JUNO [1] - 3:26
jury [1] - 28:20
JUSTICE [4] - 1:8,
1:12, 2:2, 4:24
justice [43] - 7:15,
9:13, 10:25, 15:9,

77:26, 79:5, 79:22, 79:26, 80:8, 80:12, 82:20, 82:29, 83:7, 84:4, 84:9, 84:25, 84:29, 85:23, 86:3, 86:13, 86:25, 87:15,

88:10, 88:12, 88:20, 89:4, 89:6, 89:13, 89:24, 90:11, 91:7, 91:11, 91:13, 92:1, 94:10, 95:5, 96:11, 97:11, 97:25, 97:28, 111:7, 111:13, 112:28

Justice [16] - 6:15, 7:10, 8:16, 11:22, 14:22, 15:1, 15:5, 29:11, 36:28, 41:13, 72:27, 73:11, 130:13, 137:16, 228:2, 239:27

K

KATHLEEN [1] - 2:7

KAVANAGH[1] - 2:4

Kavanagh [4] -

49:18. 170:25.

171:22, 238:8

Kean [19] - 66:24, 67:1, 250:5, 250:12, 250:13, 250:24, 250:28, 251:5, 251:10, 251:20, 252:1, 252:6, 252:7, 252:27, 253:7, 253:10. 253:23. 254:6, 254:8 **KEELEY** [1] - 3:17 keen [1] - 176:9 keep [7] - 67:28, 117:7, 124:21, 182:14, 205:19, 205:21, 251:11 keeping [1] - 37:22 keeps [1] - 22:26 **KELLY** [4] - 3:6, 3:6, 3:11, 3:11 Kennedy [1] - 245:7 **KENNEDY** [1] - 3:1 Kenny [3] - 35:4, 54:1, 244:26 kept [3] - 12:26, 67:25, 70:2 **KEVIN'S** [2] - 3:8, 3:13 key [5] - 70:26, 111:24, 119:7, 198:24, 198:28 kiddie [7] - 186:22, 187:4, 187:9, 230:26, 233:8, 233:12, 233:21 kids [4] - 185:23, 186:22, 187:9, 232:4 kids' [1] - 186:17 KIERAN [2] - 3:6,

Kilkenny [1] - 188:12 kind [7] - 19:5, 42:22, 70:5, 167:29, 168:6, 255:8, 255:27 kindly [1] - 79:15 knocking [2] -241:26, 242:5 know" [1] - 107:2 knowing [3] - 80:20, 197:12, 227:2 knowledge [16] -19:11, 20:26, 55:29, 76:21, 76:23, 97:12, 118:20, 127:27, 129:29, 155:17, 182:22, 244:10, 244:13, 257:8, 257:9, 257:12 **known** [8] - 29:1, 41:2, 111:5, 111:7, 136:20, 136:21, 138:4, 157:18 knows [2] - 76:29, 169:27 KRW [1] - 4:15 Kurosawa [3] -

L

labour [1] - 34:26

labours [1] - 237:12

189:11, 189:15,

189:24

lack [1] - 249:13 lacking [1] - 248:10 lady [2] - 133:29, 153:21 laid [1] - 239:26 **LALLY**[1] - 4:2 language [8] - 7:1, 183:18, 183:21, 183:22, 183:25, 234:2, 234:5, 235:13 larcenies [1] - 206:4 large [2] - 46:28, 249:27 larger [1] - 218:9 last [30] - 7:13, 7:23, 9:2, 9:23, 47:3, 49:5, 54:29, 74:2, 78:14, 79:11, 79:21, 85:3, 86:6. 86:8. 89:15. 89:19, 89:29, 103:12, 120:2, 122:4, 138:21, 139:15, 172:11, 173:17, 194:19, 194:20, 233:22, 236:10, 246:22, 252:1 last-chance [1] -

late [5] - 14:27, 154:10, 158:26, 159:29, 241:27 laterally [1] - 109:17 latter [2] - 33:15, 172:7 laughing [1] - 62:1 launched [1] -181.18 Laura [1] - 255:3 LAVERY [1] - 4:3 **LAW**[2] - 2:28, 4:15 law [5] - 10:19, 12:24, 45:3, 55:25, 86:16 **LAWLOR**[1] - 4:10 laws [1] - 16:15 lay [1] - 69:19 lay-by [1] - 69:19 **LEADER** [1] - 2:7 leader [2] - 14:17, 34:14 leading [4] - 114:6, 175:29, 180:24, 214:4 leaked [1] - 47:18 leaning [1] - 196:16 learned [1] - 144:8 least [10] - 72:14, 151:27, 179:22, 190:27, 200:13, 200:14, 228:3, 233:26, 235:2, 236:25 leave [4] - 72:21, 73:10, 74:4, 166:14 leaves [1] - 166:10 leaving [5] - 96:6, 166:13, 166:16, 183:12, 192:9 led [2] - 174:29, 187:12 left [8] - 16:11, 62:20, 102:5, 109:2, 112:6, 156:6, 215:27 legal [15] - 47:20, 53:18, 60:12, 72:16, 72:22, 112:27, 112:29, 171:9, 175:10, 198:9, 235:8, 239:2, 239:12, 247:21 legislation [4] -48:22, 78:22, 79:3, 211:8 legitimate [9] -32:18, 33:1, 72:23, 154:23, 160:10, 212:15, 252:15, 254:9 legitimately [1] -154:21

LEHANE [11] - 4:10,

194:19

3:11

5:10, 174:6, 174:8, 181:29, 182:15, 189:19, 189:22, 189:26, 190:9, 199:13 Lehane [6] - 174:9, 175:19, 183:7, 184:17, 230:21, 231:5 Leinster [1] - 217:27 length [4] - 112:14, 181:15, 196:15, 234:15 lengths [1] - 248:20 lengthy [1] - 189:4 less [5] - 119:6, 131:13, 225:17, 225:18, 240:20 letter [81] - 8:14, 11:28, 13:3, 57:16, 57:18, 57:26, 57:29, 58:5, 58:7, 58:8, 58:11, 58:22, 59:8, 59:20, 59:22, 59:27, 60:11, 60:23, 62:5, 62:6, 62:7, 63:2, 63:11, 63:25, 64:5, 65:13, 66:13, 78:7, 78:10, 79:7, 79:9, 79:12, 79:19, 79:22, 80:8, 83:1, 83:10, 83:11, 83:12, 84:3, 84:6, 84:12, 84:13, 84:25, 85:1, 85:2, 85:11, 86:7, 86:11, 87:23, 88:20, 89:15, 89:19, 89:26, 90:1, 94:17, 95:4, 95:14, 95:15, 95:26, 96:16, 96:18, 96:22, 97:28, 98:7, 111:7, 171:7, 171:11, 171:22, 173:19, 188:2, 235:17, 244:7, 244:8, 244:16, 244:20, 250:3, 250:14, 253:5, 254:6 letters [14] - 59:29, 63:19, 80:3, 88:10, 97:10, 188:3, 188:5, 193:13, 210:23, 235:9, 235:21, 239:3, 239:12, 247:14 letting [1] - 93:23 level [10] - 62:18, 73:5, 81:3, 82:26, 100:6, 100:24, 168:27, 179:22, 201:21, 248:17 libel [1] - 252:15 lie [1] - 93:24

lies [3] - 71:12,

199:8, 199:11 life [3] - 112:6, 256:5, 256:8 lift [2] - 38:3, 66:5 lifted [1] - 36:25 light [9] - 63:24, 86:20, 87:7, 88:25, 91:16, 95:27, 125:2, 125:18, 184:23 likely [2] - 43:2, 48:20 limb [1] - 211:4 limbs [1] - 210:29 limit [2] - 147:25, 150:28 limited [1] - 86:22 **LIMITED** [3] - 3:16, 3:20, 3:21 limiting [1] - 200:13 line [21] - 32:7, 81:21, 94:23, 114:8, 125:26, 126:2, 137:4, 142:19, 167:27, 179:5, 185:27, 203:10, 203:19, 203:25, 220:5. 222:10, 222:12, 222:14, 223:10, 225:10, 238:9 lines [3] - 109:22,

linking [1] - 120:26 list [5] - 56:18, 56:21, 256:11, 256:12 listen [4] - 138:28, 138:29, 242:28, 255:18 listened [1] - 55:26 lists [1] - 56:18 literally [1] - 205:13 litigation [1] - 61:10 LITTLE [2] - 2:19,

180:20, 203:11

179:2, 179:10

link [3] - 153:9,

4:27 live [3] - 76:19, 149:24. 168:21 lives [1] - 10:14 living [1] - 187:8 load [1] - 255:24 loath [1] - 22:23

228:20 location [4] - 188:17, 217:11, 227:26, 249:2 locking [1] - 175:6

lobby [2] - 227:21,

log [3] - 62:25, 243:22, 243:24 loggerheads [1] -

logic [1] - 57:2 logical [1] - 167:14 look [34] - 7:21, 8:14, 22:16, 28:22, 29:24, 29:29, 32:16, 36:25, 36:27, 41:24, 50:10, 57:28, 58:14, 61:26, 62:5, 70:3, 73:14, 80:26, 80:28, 197:22, 203:3, 207:3, 208:9, 209:11, 218:3, 231:25, 232:12, 234:23, 238:6, 241:17, 245:4, 252:18, 255:4, 256:4 looked [6] - 23:17, 23:27, 37:7, 182:5, 191:24, 256:11 looking [12] - 8:6, 37:10, 40:24, 45:20, 45:21, 45:23, 60:19, 76:16, 112:25, 135:9, 167:11, 168:8 lose [1] - 204:1 loss [1] - 14:13 lost [2] - 10:15, 31:17 **LOWER** [2] - 3:7, loyalty [1] - 133:6 **LUNCH** [2] - 101:3,

M

lunch [3] - 104:4,

112.23 255.23

lunchtime [1] -

lying [1] - 69:2

102:1

142:10

M.E [1] - 2:24 MACKIN [1] - 4:15 mad [1] - 213:4 **MADE**[2] - 1:3, 1:8 Mail [2] - 144:1, 144:7 maintained [1] -206:12 maintaining [1] -66:12 maintains [2] -171:27, 176:24 make-up [1] - 215:23 maker [1] - 197:12 malice [2] - 22:8, 24:16 malicious [5] -21:19, 68:18, 69:8, 69:11, 100:22

maliciousness [2] -81:25, 102:26 **MALONE**[1] - 1:30 Malone [1] - 1:25 malpractice [3] -61:24, 172:3, 172:16 man [21] - 29:18, 36:18, 65:18, 66:5, 66:15, 67:15, 72:12, 97:23, 110:24, 116:10, 152:5, 187:2, 203:21, 203:27, 203:29, 230:24, 230:25, 231:17, 233:8, 233:11, 233:21 manage [1] - 129:15 managed [1] -188:27 management [4] -45:19, 129:3, 172:1, 173:28 manner [11] - 36:14,

36:15, 45:19, 118:17, 126:5, 157:19, 158:28, 180:26, 180:28, 194:2, 220:19 Manor [1] - 256:21 March [13] - 9:8, 34:23, 87:26, 98:24, 100:11, 104:6, 113:28, 137:18, 142:24, 219:1, 231:19, 231:22, 245:24

Marian [1] - 251:6 Mark [1] - 145:12 MARK [1] - 4:14 MARRINAN[9] - 2:6, 5:12, 34:15, 49:8, 249:23, 249:25, 249:26, 252:21, 254:17

Marrinan [25] -34:14, 42:15, 103:11, 103:20, 105:16, 117:6, 117:20, 120:2, 121:5, 124:3, 135:29, 136:8, 136:13, 136:25, 174:14, 179:1, 181:15, 208:29, 209:4, 209:15, 227:13, 235:12, 249:22, 252:17, 253:17 Marrinan's [2] -136:24. 188:6 marry [3] - 94:24, 107:8, 108:10 Martin [17] - 25:3, 81:4, 144:4, 152:6,

152:17, 152:20, 153:3, 154:22, 155:2, 155:3, 155:6, 209:29, 219:15, 220:10. 220:18, 221:4, 238:1 **MARTIN** [2] - 5:3, 6:4 mast [1] - 209:19 material [11] - 16:10, 27:3. 33:2. 45:23. 46:28, 47:18, 77:28, 89:2, 178:3, 198:13, 257:25 materials [9] - 47:9, 59:11. 80:18. 84:8. 98:5, 171:21, 197:29, 198:1, 198:22 matter [56] - 14:10, 16:5, 16:10, 21:9, 26:29, 31:14, 36:29, 39:26, 40:6, 44:28, 48:13, 56:2, 63:13, 67:6, 68:29, 73:23, 74:19, 86:16, 90:9, 91:2, 91:24, 108:3, 118:4, 123:6, 123:8, 124:18. 126:5. 128:13, 146:13, 146:23, 146:24, 149:7, 149:21, 149:24, 150:11, 150:14, 150:17, 150:21, 150:24, 150:26, 151:4, 151:24, 155:17, 162:25. 164:18. 166:9, 169:13, 173:15, 173:24, 175:21, 188:25, 191:8, 213:3, 213:24, 249:23, 250:18 matters [70] - 7:1, 14:19, 16:20, 23:25, 26:24, 36:20, 37:1, 38:21, 40:22, 43:6. 45:27, 50:2, 50:4, 50:15, 50:17, 51:13, 53:3, 56:26, 57:8, 64:1, 67:29, 71:22, 72:14, 73:9, 86:14, 90:6, 90:13, 91:3, 91:6, 91:14, 91:22, 91:26. 92:16. 93:1. 93:24, 94:2, 94:5, 94:14, 94:21, 95:2, 95:3, 95:20, 95:23, 95:25, 95:27, 96:1, 96:24, 113:24, 114:10, 117:17, 117:18, 118:10,

124:22, 128:10,

128:16, 129:8,	45:29, 46:8, 47:13,	191:3, 191:4, 191:14,	McDonald [1] - 47:3	185:20, 185:22,
129:16, 135:5,	47:28, 49:14, 49:17,	191:17, 191:20,	MCDOWELL [1] - 5:4	186:29, 188:26,
154:12, 157:9,	50:24, 50:27, 50:28,	192:6, 192:18, 194:8,	McDowell [89] - 2:9,	189:3, 190:11,
157:11, 158:29,	50:29, 51:2, 51:17,	194:12, 194:21,	6:5, 6:6, 7:24, 16:14,	190:21, 191:11,
165:3, 165:17,	51:22, 51:29, 52:4,	194:23, 196:6, 196:8,	18:11, 18:14, 18:18,	191:16, 191:19,
169:25, 170:14,	52:9, 52:14, 52:22,	196:11, 199:9,	18:24, 20:7, 20:9,	191:29, 192:10,
187:27, 216:2,	53:6, 53:9, 54:1, 54:7,	202:23, 202:25,	20:18, 23:3, 23:12,	193:14, 193:21,
239:14, 242:25	54:11, 54:16, 54:19,	202:27, 203:1,	24:3, 24:11, 24:14,	194:4, 194:11,
MATTERS [1] - 1:5	54:21, 54:25, 54:28,	204:10, 205:25,	24:23, 24:25, 25:12,	194:23, 194:29,
Maurice [61] - 15:6,	55:3, 55:8, 55:19,	208:24, 209:2, 209:7,	25:25, 26:2, 26:6,	195:2, 195:26, 196:3,
19:26, 22:18, 24:29,	55:23, 56:1, 56:7,	210:10, 210:14,	26:8, 26:10, 26:12,	196:14, 196:22,
28:6, 40:25, 42:25,	56:17, 56:28, 59:12,	210:28, 212:7,	26:14, 26:17, 26:21,	197:5, 197:20, 198:9,
51:17, 51:22, 51:29,	59:13, 61:25, 62:20,	213:19, 213:24,	26:25, 28:8, 28:12,	198:18, 198:29,
52:4, 52:9, 52:14,	64:1, 65:3, 65:4, 65:6,	216:25, 218:22,	28:16, 28:25, 29:4,	199:2, 199:11, 212:5,
52:22, 53:6, 53:9,	65:11, 66:7, 66:12,	218:23, 219:16,	29:7, 30:11, 30:17,	217:5, 229:5, 229:8,
54:1, 54:7, 54:11,	66:20, 66:24, 66:25,	219:17, 219:21,	30:25, 31:19, 31:27,	229:9, 230:14,
54:16, 54:19, 54:21,	66:29, 67:2, 67:7,	220:20, 224:9,	32:17, 33:15, 34:10,	230:22, 231:9,
54:25, 54:28, 55:3,	68:5, 68:26, 71:3,	224:19, 225:3,	34:18, 35:28, 36:13,	231:16, 231:23,
55:8, 55:19, 66:25,	71:8, 71:11, 71:24,	226:21, 230:9,	38:7, 39:3, 39:20,	231:29, 232:15,
78:16, 81:6, 82:13,	72:6, 72:28, 73:2,	234:28, 236:28,	40:4, 41:17, 45:15,	232:18, 232:22,
117:8, 142:23, 143:3,	73:5, 74:20, 75:3,	238:13, 238:17,	48:28, 48:29, 49:4,	232:26, 233:1,
143:6, 143:10,	76:3, 76:20, 78:16,	238:26, 239:19,	49:11, 49:13, 49:19,	233:10, 233:18,
143:16, 143:18,	81:7, 81:23, 81:25,	240:5, 241:20, 244:9,	57:5, 58:2, 58:8, 59:6,	233:26, 234:4, 234:8,
143:20, 164:21,	81:27, 82:1, 82:8,	244:11, 244:17,	59:18, 59:28, 60:7,	234:11, 234:16,
166:25, 173:3,	82:13, 83:19, 100:22,	244:29, 246:18,	60:28, 62:3, 62:15,	234:22, 235:1,
176:25, 191:3, 203:1,	102:25, 102:27, 106:6, 107:20,	249:19, 250:5, 250:15, 250:17,	69:28, 70:2, 70:7,	235:23, 235:25, 236:7, 236:21,
209:29, 210:10, 218:22, 218:23,	107:22, 107:28,	252:10, 254:8,	71:15, 71:29, 73:17, 73:20, 73:22, 73:27,	237:23, 238:23,
219:16, 220:20,	108:1, 113:8, 115:13,	254:24, 254:25,	74:2, 76:26, 76:27,	239:4, 239:16,
238:13, 238:17,	117:8, 117:15,	255:7, 257:19,	90:16, 118:5, 118:29,	239:17, 240:17,
238:26, 250:5,	119:12, 119:15,	257:21, 257:26	139:2, 141:8, 204:29,	248:27, 258:12
252:10, 254:7, 254:9,	119:19, 120:4,	McCabe' [2] - 173:3,	244:5, 244:14	McGuinness's [19] -
254:24, 254:25, 255:7	120:15, 121:3, 121:8,	209:29	McDowell's [2] -	71:27, 119:3, 174:28,
MAY [3] - 1:18, 6:1,	121:20, 121:25,	McCabe's [16] - 33:9,	34:3, 91:5	181:12, 185:1,
258:15	121:27, 122:8,	34:5, 45:22, 57:16,	McENROE [1] - 3:26	186:16, 190:15,
McALEESE [2] -	122:20, 123:14,	63:21, 65:25, 81:17,	McENROY [1] - 4:6	190:26, 191:6, 195:3,
3:21, 3:21	123:23, 123:26,	119:24, 122:23,	McGARRY [1] - 2:10	195:16, 197:8,
McCabe [295] - 2:9,	124:8, 124:13,	127:26, 138:12,	McGinn [1] - 120:7	197:17, 198:7,
6:17, 6:25, 7:2, 7:7,	124:28, 125:5,	143:3, 143:16, 175:2,	MCGUINNESS [2] -	209:20, 230:19,
7:9, 7:17, 8:8, 8:15,	125:10, 125:16,	246:24, 254:9	2:6, 2:16	232:3, 232:10, 232:17
8:20, 8:23, 11:14,	126:1, 126:4, 126:11,	McCann [15] - 3:16,	McGuinness [116] -	mean [94] - 8:9, 24:8,
12:12, 13:15, 14:3,	126:23, 127:12, 127:20, 127:23,	116:21, 117:25,	4:10, 42:16, 66:4,	24:17, 26:15, 26:19,
15:11, 15:15, 15:17, 15:23, 16:2, 17:23,	128:5, 128:9, 128:22,	142:7, 142:11, 142:14, 142:18,	66:14, 68:3, 68:15,	28:5, 29:3, 30:17, 30:25, 32:1, 32:24,
17:27, 18:1, 18:5,	129:1, 129:22,	142:23, 143:2, 143:5,	69:4, 70:25, 71:7,	35:5, 35:29, 41:20,
18:17, 19:26, 20:4,	129:25, 130:1,	143:10, 143:16,	71:9, 71:12, 71:25, 72:2, 72:10, 74:5,	42:11, 46:6, 50:10,
20:16, 20:21, 20:28,	135:22, 136:16,	143:20, 143:27,	75:6, 76:5, 90:3,	56:17, 57:1, 66:9,
21:28, 22:18, 22:21,	137:13, 137:26,	144:22	114:7, 119:1, 174:12,	71:14, 72:10, 73:19,
22:25, 23:2, 24:17,	138:3, 138:5, 139:6,	McCarthy [12] -	174:14, 174:20,	87:21, 87:24, 92:13,
24:29, 27:5, 28:6,	139:16, 140:14,	74:24, 76:14, 178:24,	174:22, 175:14,	94:3, 100:18, 104:12,
28:9, 28:28, 29:18,	142:23, 143:6,	217:4, 227:11,	175:22, 177:14,	106:11, 106:13,
30:7, 30:13, 30:26,	143:10, 143:19,	227:14, 228:7,	177:22, 177:26,	107:2, 107:6, 108:2,
31:19, 31:27, 32:8,	143:20, 145:3, 163:7,	228:17, 228:22,	178:2, 178:9, 179:3,	114:1, 116:15, 121:7,
32:11, 32:12, 32:21,	163:13, 163:28,	228:27, 231:11,	180:1, 180:11, 181:7,	125:7, 128:8, 128:24,
33:12, 33:15, 36:1,	164:21, 164:25,	240:18	181:16, 181:17,	129:8, 130:9, 130:24,
36:10, 36:14, 38:16,	166:26, 167:6, 172:2,	McCarthy's [3] -	181:23, 182:17,	132:2, 136:10,
40:1, 40:16, 40:25,	172:15, 172:24,	178:23, 180:2, 227:20	183:5, 183:7, 183:13,	138:22, 139:23,
41:8, 41:14, 42:25,	176:10, 176:25,	McCONNELL [1] -	183:15, 184:6,	140:1, 140:2, 140:25,
43:4, 43:9, 44:5,	177:6, 177:28, 179:9,	3:26	184:12, 185:5,	144:28, 145:1, 145:3,
44:19, 45:5, 45:7,	179:21, 185:21,	McCOURT [1] - 4:7	185:11, 185:16,	149:14, 152:24,
	185:23, 187:19,			154:21, 162:2,

		T		
164:11, 164:23,	161:8, 161:16,	165:16, 182:2,	167:11, 167:17,	misunderstanding
164:28, 167:8,	161:20, 161:27,	187:24, 193:25,	188:17, 197:27,	[2] - 68:16, 74:23
167:28, 169:9,	162:5, 162:20,	206:20, 225:1, 229:12	198:26, 202:20,	misunderstood [2] -
173:18, 173:19,	172:18, 174:21,	mentioning [1] -	224:8, 225:26, 226:1,	30:21, 30:23
177:2, 179:15,	175:29, 177:25,	212:8	258:4, 258:8	mix [2] - 185:10,
179:18, 180:6,	180:7, 187:15,	mentions [1] - 59:21	mindful [1] - 165:2	192:16
180:15, 183:21,	187:18, 187:24,	MERCHANTS [1] -	mine [1] - 197:12	mobile [1] - 243:22
184:26, 188:25,	188:23, 188:27,	3:23	minimum [2] -	modus [2] - 113:14,
189:12, 189:13,	189:8, 190:4, 190:10,	merely [3] - 71:6,	248:17, 248:18	172:1
190:14, 191:8,	190:12, 192:13,	71:13, 118:17	MINISTER [1] - 1:8	Molloy [2] - 67:13,
192:25, 197:27,	193:10, 194:6,	merits [3] - 139:26,	minister [4] - 124:23,	164:22
198:19, 198:21,	194:10, 194:18,	212:17, 213:17	124:24, 127:2, 128:20	moment [12] - 7:4,
202:14, 206:2,	194:27, 195:26,	mess [2] - 61:18,	Minister [29] - 6:13,	8:12, 17:24, 26:5,
212:19, 241:4, 247:1,	196:5, 196:7, 197:3,	61:27	6:14, 6:17, 7:7, 7:16,	34:8, 43:28, 60:18,
251:17, 251:25,	215:18, 215:19,	message [7] - 60:2,	7:25, 8:28, 9:7, 9:8,	111:2, 111:23,
253:29, 254:5,	218:18, 218:20,	106:22, 106:24,	9:18, 14:28, 15:1,	125:21, 138:25,
254:23, 254:29,	218:28, 219:13,	106:27, 107:3, 107:9,	15:5, 15:13, 15:14,	166:28
255:21	220:15, 221:14,	127:1	15:19, 15:22, 15:27,	moments [2] - 94:7,
meaning [1] - 203:15 meant [5] - 44:6,	223:19, 230:2, 235:3, 236:15, 236:17,	messages [1] -	16:1, 29:11, 122:25,	254:14
	236:20, 243:11,	115:12	123:8, 124:16,	Monday [1] - 22:19
54:10, 140:21, 254:13, 255:21	243:12, 244:14	met [14] - 6:14,	137:15, 137:17,	month [4] - 6:13,
measures [1] - 64:19	meetings [6] - 110:3,	13:15, 14:2, 70:26,	239:27, 246:23	74:28, 219:7, 240:19
mechanism [6] -	158:7, 176:4, 197:23,	133:19, 142:15,	Minister's [1] - 15:6	months [11] - 17:11,
38:18, 50:1, 50:12,	221:17, 241:2	200:13, 212:5, 215:21, 215:26,	ministerial [1] - 11:23	24:29, 45:17, 151:27,
139:21, 140:8, 207:27	member [26] - 10:10,	216:1, 223:4, 234:11,	minor [3] - 58:4,	177:21, 229:17, 231:22, 232:8, 232:9,
Media [16] - 157:26,	10:12, 11:12, 12:22,	241:18	58:24, 61:22	231.22, 232.6, 232.9,
160:19, 160:28,	17:19, 40:12, 43:20,	MICHAEL [5] - 2:9,	minute [4] - 57:24,	morning [17] - 6:6,
161:9, 161:15,	43:23, 43:25, 44:20,	2:22, 2:28, 3:10, 3:17	170:23, 225:17,	6:7, 14:10, 77:4, 77:5,
165:21, 165:23,	46:24, 46:25, 47:8,	MICHELLE [1] - 4:6	225:18	118:29, 119:10,
170:13, 171:1, 171:5,	65:8, 115:7, 146:27,	MICK [1] - 3:28	minutes [7] - 131:13,	130:12, 138:12,
171:8, 171:12,	150:29, 151:7,	middle [4] - 38:14,	188:20, 188:21,	154:14, 158:25,
171:20, 172:1, 173:2,	177:20, 207:15,	137:10, 222:5, 232:27	199:22, 243:19,	159:29, 176:22,
173:28	210:27, 211:2, 219:4,	midway [1] - 81:11	243:20	177:13, 177:24,
MEDIA [2] - 3:4, 3:18	219:11, 245:8	might [35] - 19:18,	Miriam [1] - 219:8	195:18, 218:14
media [21] - 20:21,	MEMBER [2] - 1:12,	51:28, 79:15, 88:25,	misattributing [1] -	MORRISSEY [1] -
27:2, 67:17, 81:21,	2:2	89:1, 99:26, 104:22,	22:11	2:17
81:24, 81:26, 102:25,	members [15] - 25:20, 47:2, 49:28,	106:14, 120:18,	misbehaved [1] -	most [11] - 27:29,
102:26, 102:28,	129:9, 169:24, 201:4,	129:2, 134:22,	55:24	43:2, 90:2, 95:5, 95:7,
115:13, 117:9, 117:23, 128:6,	207:1, 208:19,	148:25, 150:20,	misinformed [1] -	95:11, 147:10,
128:19, 130:6,	210:19, 211:6,	160:28, 167:10,	7:7	154:16, 154:17,
146:16, 160:2,	211:19, 211:29,	170:15, 171:20,	misinterpreted [1] -	185:5, 225:7
200:19, 200:20,	212:1, 227:29, 228:2	177:14, 187:20, 188:19, 195:13,	68:11 mislead [1] - 140:26	motivated [5] - 81:25, 102:25,
210:4, 242:11	memorable [1] -	197:24, 198:19,	misleading [5] -	122:20, 123:14,
MEEHAN [1] - 4:24	249:8	211:21, 226:8, 238:6,	27:27, 27:29, 56:6,	136:17
meet [8] - 69:14,	memory [4] - 143:28,	242:16, 245:1,	141:1	motivating [4] -
151:18, 188:14,	217:25, 227:15,	245:29, 251:8, 254:7,	misled [2] - 32:25,	121:19, 122:24,
188:19, 215:15,	227:20	255:28, 255:29, 256:1	32:26	123:19, 124:12
215:17, 228:22,	mention [15] - 24:21,	millimetres [1] -	missed [2] - 233:13,	motivation [4] -
235:23	45:16, 104:26, 113:4,	190:7	233:22	105:18, 114:25,
meeting [70] - 14:21,	123:4, 125:9, 165:14,	milling [2] - 217:21,	missing [2] - 76:19,	121:15, 176:2
14:29, 15:3, 15:4,	167:21, 182:1,	227:24	229:2	motivations [1] -
15:10, 15:12, 15:13,	182:29, 206:24, 229:21, 237:23,	mind [26] - 18:11,	mistake [2] - 68:29,	81:17
15:19, 15:21, 16:11,	229:21, 237:23, 255:24	28:19, 34:13, 48:28,	255:4	motive [4] - 70:17,
16:25, 42:18, 42:19, 42:24, 75:7, 114:6,	mentioned [15] -	70:4, 70:29, 76:28,	mistaken [6] - 7:12,	70:20, 120:4, 197:8
118:6, 119:1, 157:25,	13:24, 17:27, 19:28,	103:24, 119:9,	7:16, 7:27, 33:13,	motives [1] - 203:15
158:9, 158:10,	26:28, 48:18, 104:5,	123:28, 130:25,	76:17, 228:27	move [6] - 109:15,
158:15, 158:16,	124:20, 135:3,	130:28, 134:24, 140:3, 163:10,	mistakes [2] - 59:1,	111:1, 116:18, 180:5,
, ,	·	170.0, 100.10,	256:5	187:14, 227:11
				1

moved [5] - 109:11, 109:14, 110:4, 123:9, 190:16 **moves** [1] - 96:9 moving [6] - 189:6, 190:5, 190:21, 227:24, 227:27, 241:9 MR [199] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4, 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:10, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 2:15, 2:16, 2:16, 2:17, 2:22, 2:23, 2:23, 2:27, 2:28, 3:1, 3:1, 3:5, 3:5, 3:6, 3:10, 3:11, 3:17, 3:21, 3:28, 3:28, 4:2, 4:6, 4:10, 4:14, 4:14, 4:15, 4:20, 4:20, 4:24, 4:25, 5:3, 5:4, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:9, 5:10, 5:11, 5:12, 6:4, 6:5, 6:6, 18:14, 18:18, 18:24, 20:9, 22:23, 23:3, 23:7, 23:12, 24:5, 24:11, 24:23, 24:25, 25:25, 25:29, 26:2, 26:6, 26:10, 26:12, 26:17, 26:21, 28:8, 28:12, 28:16, 28:25, 29:4, 29:7, 30:11, 30:25, 31:4, 31:12, 31:22, 31:26, 32:4, 32:7, 33:5, 33:15, 33:25, 34:3, 34:9, 34:10, 34:15, 34:18. 35:28. 48:29. 49:3, 49:4, 49:8, 49:13, 49:19, 58:2, 58:8. 59:6. 59:18. 59:28, 60:28, 62:15, 69:28, 70:7, 73:17, 73:22, 73:27, 74:2, 76:26, 131:7, 131:9, 138:21, 138:24, 138:26, 139:1, 140:20, 140:27, 141:7, 141:16, 141:19, 141:23, 142:1, 142:4, 143:15, 145:6, 145:10, 145:12, 147:17, 147:21, 147:23, 148:11, 148:15, 148:27, 149:1, 149:5, 163:11, 164:13, 165:2, 165:12, 165:17, 165:20, 166:7, 166:9, 166:14, 166:17, 166:22, 167:19, 167:20, 170:5, 170:7, 170:10, 170:12, 170:25,

172:13, 172:26, 173:10, 173:14, 173:25, 174:3, 174:6, 174:8, 181:29, 182:15, 189:19, 189:22, 189:26, 190:9, 199:13, 199:16, 199:19, 199:27, 202:22, 226:18, 226:27, 227:3, 227:7, 227:9, 243:18, 243:21, 244:5, 246:13, 249:11, 249:20, 249:23, 249:25, 249:26, 252:21, 254:17 MRS [1] - 4:6 MS [13] - 2:7, 2:7, 2:17, 2:18, 2:22, 4:19, 5:5, 77:3, 77:4, 102:3, 130:22, 130:26, 131:4 Muircheartaigh [3] -141:25, 142:5, 144:29 MUIRCHEARTAIGH [6] - 2:27, 5:7, 142:2, 142:4, 143:15, 145:6 MULLAN[1] - 2:7 Murphy [1] - 15:5 MURPHY [2] - 2:14, 4:20 Murray [2] - 116:22, 117:26 must [10] - 12:27, 21:21, 46:29, 53:13, 78:27. 118:19. 125:3. 184:9, 192:1, 256:4

MÍCHEÁL [1] - 2:15

Nacie [3] - 57:15, 58:10.63:10 name [25] - 28:21, 28:29, 56:29, 70:12, 90:26, 92:4, 93:16, 93:25, 93:26, 94:1, 94:13, 94:18, 94:27, 95:10, 96:10, 131:10, 142:4, 145:12, 145:24, 152:12, 152:14, 152:15, 174:8, 182:7, 244:24 named [4] - 1:27, 12:24, 132:18, 152:5 namely [3] - 81:22, 102:24, 251:11 naming [1] - 135:21 narrow [1] - 254:13

national [3] - 196:3, 196:28, 244:23 nationally [1] -256:14 natural [3] - 71:26, 86:13, 126:14 naturally [1] - 61:3 nature [18] - 12:22, 19:25, 63:17, 72:3, 80:17, 119:24, 125:29, 130:14, 131:18, 158:24, 180:8, 180:18, 183:24, 197:28, 201:8, 201:20, 218:22, 257:13 nature' [1] - 159:5 near [1] - 53:6 necessary [5] -84:21, 151:6, 151:9, 165:18, 202:16 necessity [1] -234:27 $\boldsymbol{need}\ [20]\ -\ 24:8,$ 35:5. 43:10. 51:26. 54:9, 73:29, 89:18, 97:27, 128:10, 177:4, 184:7, 228:25, 232:12, 232:23, 233:28, 241:14, 241:17, 245:4, 248:3, 256:1 needed [5] - 35:5, 37:2, 37:12, 247:16, 247:23 negative [8] - 19:22, 24:20, 106:5, 129:24, 174:29, 175:15, 175:17, 184:25 negatively [15] -20:4, 20:15, 20:21, 20:28, 81:16, 81:23, 81:26, 102:27, 115:13, 117:22, 128:18, 209:2, 209:3, 239:18, 249:18 net [2] - 77:7, 170:14 never [50] - 7:17, 17:27, 18:1, 18:12, 18:15, 18:19, 19:18, 20:3, 20:4, 20:15, 20:18, 28:7, 34:2, 36:25, 46:11, 62:28, 63:2, 65:29, 66:1, 66:4, 115:3, 115:4, 116:23, 119:29, 130:18, 130:21, 143:9, 146:10,

172:27, 178:26, 182:20, 185:28, 186:11, 187:10, 198:16, 198:17, 202:7, 224:17, 225:1, 225:5. 226:19. 226:22, 230:14, 234:1, 241:13, 241:22 new [3] - 27:3, 193:24, 226:26 Newlands [1] -188.18 News [17] - 157:26, 158:19, 160:19, 160:28, 161:9, 161:14, 165:21, 165:23, 170:13, 171:1, 171:5, 171:7, 171:12, 171:20, 172:1, 173:2, 173:28 news [8] - 22:21, 25:25, 26:22, 27:26, 132:3, 132:5, 159:21, 159:23 NEWS [2] - 3:4, 3:20 newspaper [5] -77:19, 156:21, 158:23, 159:25 Newspapers [1] -153:28 NEWSPAPERS[3] -3:15, 3:20, 3:20 newspapers [1] newsworthy [1] -242:18 next [11] - 14:10, 25:18, 51:16, 82:4, 89:12, 99:27, 116:19, 122:16, 203:18, 209:18, 258:13 nickname [1] - 182:3 night [7] - 14:10, 138:11, 154:14, 158:26, 159:29, 170:21, 249:4 **nighttime** [1] - 243:3 no' [1] - 184:8 nobody [4] - 75:25, 130:18, 216:9, 241:18 **NOEL** [1] - 2:16 **Noel** [2] - 6:9, 13:25 noisy [1] - 217:21 nominate [2] - 246:5, 246.6 nominating [1] -113:26 non [6] - 51:1, 93:12, 141:6, 229:29, 250:27, 250:29

non-complaining [1] 93:12 non-cooperation [2] 51:1, 141:6 non-disclosure [2] -250:27, 250:29 non-specific [1] -229:29 none [3] - 67:3, 161:29, 254:29 nonetheless [5] -11:21, 17:1, 45:26, 92:7, 95:7 **nonsense** [1] - 59:4 nonsensical [1] -179.19 normal [3] - 117:24, 181:9, 256:26 North [1] - 168:5 Northern [1] - 34:20 **NORTHUMBERLA** ND [1] - 4:7 note [24] - 12:21, 33:7, 51:16, 55:9, 64:22, 68:29, 69:18, 69:21, 69:25, 174:17, 184:6, 184:7, 185:1, 193:1, 193:27, 195:25, 195:29, 196:2, 196:4, 196:15, 196:16, 196:21, 196:26, 196:29 notebook [1] -195:27 noted [4] - 48:8, 145:28, 146:2, 189:11 notes [3] - 1:27, 176:7, 250:4 nothing [24] - 26:16, 33:23, 46:8, 46:14, 54:8, 62:19, 78:6, 99:26, 110:5, 127:13, 128:25, 137:26, 151:15, 154:7, 156:26, 161:12, 172:22, 182:5, 193:24, 194:18, 201:25, 210:12, 244:16, 257:27 notice [24] - 14:23, 78:1, 120:6, 135:20, 145:18, 145:19, 145:27, 146:3, 146:27, 149:13, 150:4, 151:1, 151:29, 153:2, 155:13, 159:7, 159:10, 159:12, 159:14, 162:26, 164:8, 164:15, 166:1, 219:13

148:28, 149:6,

152:21, 166:27,

notices [7] - 9:1, 48:5, 48:16, 49:28, 119:16, 152:21, 162:13 notification [1] -112:12 notified [3] - 13:3, 113:20, 115:29 notion [3] - 20:10, 213:5, 254:5 notwithstanding [1] - 86:19 November [10] -59:29. 60:1. 61:5. 84:7. 85:1. 86:4. 86:25, 89:17, 89:27, 175.5 now-Commissioner [1] -151:28 nowhere [1] - 153:10 nub [1] - 42:4 number [34] - 6:11, 17:10, 22:20, 37:19, 40:8, 48:27, 49:1, 65:11, 99:15, 115:8, 119:7, 131:14, 131:15, 131:26, 148:1, 148:4, 148:16, 157:9, 168:13, 169:23, 174:13, 176:17, 180:16, 193:22, 217:27, 227:29, 232:8, 232:9, 232:18, 232:21, 249:27, 253:26, 254:4, 257:28 numbers [1] - 243:23 Nóirín [32] - 81:6, 96:20, 98:22, 99:23, 100:14, 102:9, 103:18, 103:23, 104:23, 105:5, 105:9, 105:20, 106:8, 106:15, 106:17, 107:6, 107:18, 107:23, 109:3, 110:6, 110:9, 110:10, 110:20, 111:17, 111:26, 113:13, 115:27, 222:2, 223:1, 223:6, 223:15, 245:14

0

O'Callaghan [2] -218:10, 219:8 o'clock [1] - 199:14 O'Doherty [39] -132:25, 141:23,

141:24, 145:13, 145:16, 147:29, 148:3, 149:12, 149:19, 149:27, 152:2, 153:8, 153:15, 153:24, 155:5, 156:1, 156:14, 156:19, 157:5, 157:14, 159:13, 160:17, 163:5, 163:12, 163:24, 164:7, 170:17, 170:20, 170:28, 171:23, 171:25, 173:7, 173:25, 209:5, 209:9, 209:18, 209:23, 210:16, 242:24 O'DOHERTY [1] -4:14 O'Doherty's [8] -160:6, 165:5, 172:23, 241:23, 243:4, 243:9, 243:12, 245:27 O'DONNELL [1] -3.17 O'Higgins [26] -61:18, 63:28, 72:14, 72:19, 72:20, 72:25, 73:11, 74:13, 90:11, 90:17, 90:24, 91:7, 91:11, 91:13, 91:23, 92:1, 93:8, 93:11, 93:12, 95:7, 95:22, 95:28, 130:2, 130:13, 239:29. 240:13 O'HIGGINS [2] -2:15, 2:22 O'Higgins' [1] - 93:3 O'KEEFFE [1] - 3:27 O'Mahony [43] -6:18, 6:19, 6:29, 7:18, 9:3, 9:11, 9:22, 12:5, 15:16, 16:3, 22:22, 23:4, 25:6, 28:6, 28:24, 29:8, 29:19,

29:25, 29:29, 30:3, 30:14, 36:24, 38:26, 39:18, 40:2, 48:24, 49:16, 50:3, 50:16, 51:27, 53:4, 54:5, 56:4, 138:20, 141:6, 164:16, 167:23, 177:9. 213:20. 213:25, 244:12, 244:28, 245:6 O'Mahony's [7] -9:18, 10:2, 10:4, 10:10, 10:23, 50:23, 224:12

O'MARA[1] - 4:7

O'Neill [35] - 77:26, 78:7, 79:5, 79:23, 79:26, 80:9, 80:12, 82:20, 82:29, 83:7, 84:4, 84:9, 84:25, 84:29, 85:23, 86:3, 86:26, 87:15, 88:10, 88:12, 89:4, 89:6, 89:13, 89:24, 94:10, 95:5, 97:11, 97:25, 111:7, 111:13, 112:29, 247:14, 247:15, 247:23, 248:3 O'Neill's [3] - 88:20, 96:12, 97:28 O'Reilly [3] - 141:21, 141:26, 142:6 O'REILLY [1] - 2:27 O'Sullivan [42] -81:6, 89:8, 96:20, 98:23, 99:23, 100:8, 100:15, 102:10, 103:18, 103:23, 104:23, 105:5, 105:10, 105:20, 105:24. 105:25. 106:8, 106:15, 106:17, 107:6, 107:18, 107:23, 109:3, 110:6, 110:9, 110:20, 111:17, 111:26, 113:13, 115:27, 184:11, 222:3, 223:1, 223:7, 223:15. 223:17. 223:29, 245:14, 251:18, 251:23, 251:28, 253:14 O'Sullivan's [1] -110:10 O'TOOLE [1] - 3:10 oath [1] - 185:9 objections [2] -41:17, 95:6 obliged [5] - 122:28, 122:29, 246:22, 246:26 observation[1] -120:24 observations [1] observe [1] - 57:11 obvious [1] - 169:18 obviously [25] - 53:7, 78:17 79:1 83:18 85:25, 96:12, 97:16, 102:14, 103:10, 104:17, 107:24,

129:17, 192:10, 201:20, 202:14, 205:26, 211:6, 231:7, 237:15, 249:26, 258:8 occasion [13] - 44:6, 47:3, 49:15, 50:20, 66:5, 99:29, 169:11, 183:10. 194:5. 233:25, 234:5, 235:13, 235:16 occasions [14] -40:8, 99:15, 146:17, 176:18, 193:22, 202:8, 202:29, 203:2, 217:28, 224:7, 241:15, 241:18, 241:19, 253:26 occur [1] - 129:25 occurred [6] -103:17, 104:7, 110:18, 113:18, 114:9, 195:22 occurs [3] - 83:6, 102:14, 102:15 October [11] - 9:1, 77:20, 77:26, 79:9, 83:2, 83:9, 86:27, 88:12, 102:17, 111:8, 112:12 odd [2] - 189:24, 255:22 odds [1] - 107:19 **OF** [5] - 1:3, 1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 4:24 offence [2] - 225:2, 226:20 offences [6] - 10:7, 178:25, 178:27, 225:2, 254:24, 254:25 offended [1] - 66:27 offenders [1] -212:20 offer [5] - 84:9, 102:21, 103:4, 183:3, 233:19 offered [7] - 9:19, 28:4, 29:13, 29:26, 89:24, 211:27, 244:11 Office [23] - 33:27, 67:15, 67:17, 110:4, 154:13, 154:20, 154:29, 155:6, 155:8, 155:16, 155:18,

156:23, 158:25,

159:19, 159:28,

242:15

161:3, 161:7, 161:13,

201:4, 242:8, 242:12,

office [19] - 8:24,

13:1, 23:11, 46:25,

60:2, 60:4, 61:5, 62:10, 62:19, 63:15, 78:21, 124:19, 146:27, 151:1, 157:5, 176:16, 204:2, 213:7, **OFFICE** [2] - 2:18, 4.26 office's [1] - 63:5 office-holder [1] -213:7 Officer [7] - 135:14, 141:4, 156:18, 157:17, 200:10, 200:21, 201:6 officer [3] - 15:7, 33:21, 212:25 officers [2] - 129:11, 207:12 offices [1] - 132:1 official [7] - 35:7, 151:23, 156:4, 168:28, 169:12, 200:16, 242:6 officially [1] - 28:29 officials [2] - 6:14, 175:13 offset [2] - 87:7, 87:10 often [1] - 203:14 ogling [1] - 254:29 Oireachtas [7] -9:13, 10:25, 11:24, 13:7, 41:15, 219:4, 219.11 **OISÍN** [1] - 3:28 old [2] - 193:17, 214:7 Olson [1] - 13:21 omits [1] - 220:23 **ON** [4] - 1:6, 1:10, 1:18, 6:1 on-line [2] - 32:7, 137:4 once [9] - 65:29, 66.2 66.4 85.6 200:13, 200:14, 223:5 one [84] - 6:12, 19:15, 31:6, 37:28, 38:2, 43:17, 52:17, 57:24, 59:16, 65:4, 66:5, 68:1, 70:26, 74:2, 74:28, 75:27, 77:28, 78:15, 92:28, 93:10, 93:26, 94:25, 97:2, 113:3, 119:8, 124:19, 129:28, 132:2, 133:20, 139:8, 145:4, 147:9, 148:19,

148:25, 152:4,

114:18, 114:24,

119:15, 119:16,

162:15, 162:16, 162:19, 166:9, 167:3, 167:12, 168:2, 168:15, 173:23, 175:11, 178:8, 178:14, 179:18, 182:14, 183:10, 185:14, 198:28, 203:8, 205:27, 205:28, 206:17, 207:20, 209:21, 210:27 209:22, 211:11, 211:23, 212:20, 240:11 217:3, 217:4, 220:17, 220:27, 227:15, 230:28, 231:1, 233:1, 233:2, 235:13, 236:19, 237:11, 237:12, 241:3, 243:19, 249:23, 249:29, 251:3, 256:5, 257:18 one's [1] - 28:19 ongoing [1] - 117:9 232:10 **onwards** [1] - 175:5 opaque [4] - 19:4, 114:3, 118:19, 136:12 open [13] - 39:9, 4:26 57:27, 65:16, 66:21, 69:13, 154:13, 159:28, 176:18, 200:6, 210:22, 213:10, 233:29, 243:26 opened [5] - 31:15, 176:17, 188:5, 210:21, 244:14 90:13 opener [1] - 34:26 opening [4] - 57:19, 107:29 158:25, 167:17, openly [4] - 70:15, 70:23, 213:21, 213:28 195:23 operandi [2] outrageous' [2] -113:14, 172:1 operating [1] - 160:1 operation [2] - 8:26, 103:29 operational [6] -117:17, 146:13, 146:23, 150:25, 151:3, 253:25 operations [1] -105:11 175:23 opinion [6] - 83:25, 113:23, 113:24, 114:22, 114:23, 144:28 236:27 opportunity [11] -9:19, 10:8, 39:10,

84:20, 84:24, 94:9, 194:20, 209:16, 227:6, 248:21, 253:19 opposed [5] - 23:10, 60:17, 94:11, 106:16, opposing [1] - 179:8 opposite [4] - 15:28, 19:21, 116:28, 164:25 opposition [1] option [2] - 50:13,

order [3] - 139:10, 140:2. 151:7 ordinary [2] - 41:6,

organisation [5] -44:12, 129:9, 195:13, 257:17, 257:19 original [7] - 70:2, 76:16, 115:10, 138:10, 186:29,

originally [3] - 15:25, 32:7, 165:28 **OSMOND** [2] - 2:19,

OTHER [1] - 1:4 otherwise [10] -45:21, 118:20, 139:26, 146:24, 172:20, 184:24, 192:26, 208:1. 212:13, 213:17 ought [2] - 45:21,

ourselves [1] outcast [1] - 65:13

outrageous [4] -187:3, 187:4, 195:18,

230:24, 231:18 outset [1] - 247:8 outside [10] - 43:24, 72:18, 76:7, 124:26, 167:22, 167:27, 211:3, 227:21, 254:28, 255:15

outskirts [1] - 188:14 outspoken [1] -

over-punctilious [1] overcome[1] -

overheard [3] -18:19, 18:22, 221:8

overhears [1] -186:26 overleaf [1] - 209:22 own [25] - 21:5, 30:13, 30:19, 46:6, 54:4, 57:10, 62:17, 62:19, 69:17, 73:3, 92:14, 97:4, 97:5, 138:6, 151:23, 151:24, 168:27, 169:24, 178:16,

257:15 owned [1] - 145:25 owner [4] - 148:11, 148:13, 246:2, 246:4 oxygen [1] - 137:2

210:2, 210:11, 257:3,

180:17, 196:20,

Р

PAC [41] - 35:4, 42:19, 42:20, 59:15, 68:16, 131:18, 142:27, 143:23, 174:21, 174:25, 175:14, 175:18, 175:29, 176:10, 176:12, 176:16, 180:5, 183:1, 184:5, 184:24, 192:12, 193:16, 207:2, 210:19, 210:23, 211:21, 211:26, 212:28, 213:13, 217:1, 218:14, 218:17, 219:13, 220:15. 221:14. 229:11, 229:24, 234:22, 234:28, 235:22, 239:5 Paddy [1] - 55:10 Padraig [1] - 244:26 paedophile [1] -143:7 **PAGE**[1] - 5:2 page [112] - 7:21, 8:17, 8:18, 13:27, 14:1, 14:2, 14:5, 17:10, 22:16, 34:10, 41:24, 41:26, 43:14, 44:22, 46:21, 48:27, 49:1, 51:16, 59:9, 59:10, 59:18, 78:12, 78:14, 78:24, 79:8, 79:12, 80:27, 80:28, 81:9, 81:11, 81:12, 82:12, 82:15, 83:10, 83:11, 83:12, 84:7, 85:2, 85:3, 85:10,

86:5, 86:11, 87:27, 89:19, 89:28, 90:1, 98:25, 98:27, 102:13, 102:19, 106:24, 120:2, 120:19, 120:20, 122:4, 122:5, 122:16, 125:22, 125:26, 126:20, 147:9, 160:13, 170:17, 170:25, 171:21, 171:25, 179:5, 180:19, 185:27, 203:3, 203:6, 203:10, 203:18, 207:3, 208:9, 208:11, 209:12, 209:17, 217:15, 217:16, 217:18, 218:3, 218:6, 218:8, 218:11, 218:12, 218:29, 220:2, 220:4, 220:5, 222:4, 222:5, 223:10, 225:8, 226:16, 231:25, 232:11, 233:28, 238:6, 238:7, 241:15, 245:6, 248:8 pages [2] - 209:18, 232:25

pair [1] - 196:7 panel [1] - 28:20 paper [2] - 145:1, papers [8] - 77:18, 79:9, 87:27, 102:7, 102:13. 158:11. 190:15, 201:24 paragraph [36] -28:1, 33:8, 52:7,

54:29, 62:25, 78:14, 79:11, 79:21, 80:29, 81:12, 81:17, 82:4, 83:13, 84:12, 85:3, 85:10, 86:6, 86:8, 87:28. 88:13. 89:19. 89:29, 99:27, 125:21, 125:23, 137:11, 137:14, 139:27, 139:29, 140:22, 141:1, 171:24, 203:19, 218:29, 247:1 paragraphs [3] -113:27. 114:12. 144:2 parallel [2] - 13:12, 64:16 parameters [1] -

46:29 pardon [15] - 37:23, 135:17, 138:8, 138:15, 146:7, 148:2,

151:11, 159:2,

168:2, 183:18, 203:24, 252:19, 257:26 park [22] - 68:20,

162:17, 166:22,

69:6, 75:7, 114:7, 114:8, 187:14, 188:18, 188:24, 189:9, 190:4, 190:10, 194:11, 194:18, 195:17, 195:20, 195:22, 212:6, 217:22, 230:2, 230:7, 234:10, 241:3

PARLIAMENT[1] -

part [21] - 21:20, 34:5, 46:17, 72:24, 73:7, 73:8, 96:24, 105:29, 115:21, 137:13, 138:14, 157:28, 172:7, 186:26, 210:8, 211:25, 213:4, 233.22 234.2 244:27, 250:14 parted [1] - 15:21

participate [2] -15:18, 249:14 particular [60] -10:14, 22:7, 23:27, 31:13, 32:13, 39:2, 40:24, 43:29, 44:21, 54:14, 81:21, 81:23, 90:7, 94:6, 95:20, 99:15, 100:17, 104:11, 107:4,

109:10, 109:14, 113:27, 114:9, 123:5, 124:17, 125:9, 130:9, 132:6, 134:23, 134:29, 135:14, 135:20, 137:7, 141:9, 152:25. 158:8. 159:15, 160:16, 160:28, 161:24, 165:15, 166:26, 167:22, 167:29, 169:7, 169:12,

186:9, 205:3, 206:11, 212:15, 221:10, 239:15 particularly [18] -16:19, 27:21, 90:2, 103:28, 111:11, 128:28, 151:22,

169:23, 175:4,

175:22, 175:25,

175:26, 182:24,

182:27. 184:21.

183:23, 188:25, 197:15, 201:10, 203:1, 206:10, 227:27, 229:10, 236:18 parties [14] - 40:29, 44:15, 45:28, 49:26, 57:9, 68:12, 68:22, 92:1, 93:12, 139:14, 175:10, 178:14, 211:15, 248:27 PARTNERS[1] -4.10 partnership [1] parts [1] - 211:12 party [8] - 11:8, 48:7, 48:20, 53:13, 207:29, 211:3, 211:14, 216:8 pass [2] - 44:15, 96:13 passage [4] -113:27, 221:16, 226:22, 239:6 passed [3] - 46:12, 112:15, 151:20 PASSED[1] - 1:5 passing [3] - 40:28, 40:29, 42:13 past [5] - 142:16, 175:24, 239:20, 251:28, 252:11 paternal [1] - 116:14 PATRICIA[1] - 3:2 **PATRICK**[1] - 2:6 patrol [1] - 205:13 Patrol [1] - 214:7 pattern [3] - 75:12, 75:13, 75:15 **PAUL** [2] - 2:10, 3:5 Paul [3] - 22:20, 116:22, 117:26 peddle [1] - 60:17 peers [1] - 109:13 penalties [1] -219:14 penalty [44] - 6:16, 10:18, 14:4, 14:20, 14:23, 15:1, 18:17, 25:2, 37:11, 46:3, 120:5, 132:9, 135:1, 135:19, 139:18, 145:18, 145:19, 146:3, 149:13, 149:20, 150:4, 150:9, 151:1, 151:26, 151:29, 152:21, 153:2, 155:12, 159:7, 159:10, 159:12, 159:14, 162:13,

163:17, 164:4, 164:15, 166:1, 209:26, 212:16, 225:24, 242:19, 245:25, 246:3 people [52] - 31:8, 43:18, 44:13, 44:25, 45:2, 45:19, 46:1, 47:5, 60:21, 64:20, 65:23, 66:6, 68:3, 68:7, 71:28, 74:28, 75:3, 110:23, 126:15, 127:25, 128:23, 128:29, 130:20, 148:16, 148:22, 155:17, 169:14, 175:12, 175:25, 184:16, 189:14, 189:29, 199:8, 201:9, 203:15, 206:25, 207:17, 212:10, 216:13, 217:21, 227:23, 227:27, 228:1, 228:5, 239:3, 240:19. 240:22. 240:29, 241:5, 254:23, 256:28 people's [1] - 243:23 perceived [2] -172:23, 246:20 percent [3] - 59:3, perception [4] -201:9, 201:15. 213:27, 256:18 perfect [1] - 207:18 perfectly [3] - 50:20, 71:26, 173:21 performing [1] - 36:5 perhaps [26] - 58:14, 72:15, 77:10, 99:23, 109:7, 109:15, 112:13, 123:20, 126:4, 128:2, 128:5, 128:29. 132:6. 132:7. 162:10, 164:28, 185:26, 188:13, 188:22, 202:12, 225:15, 227:10,

238:16, 249:28,

period [14] - 47:24,

50:25, 60:27, 75:24,

255:17, 258:6

112:5, 142:24,

142:28, 143:2,

174:20, 180:15,

205:6. 225:16.

240:23, 255:19

44:16

permission [1] -

person [23] - 10:5, 20:20, 40:15, 43:19, 53:11, 97:1, 106:4, 108:8, 112:17, 125:12, 145:25, 151:6, 182:29, 183:2, 185:16, 187:9, 200:19, 212:21, 215:27, 242:2, 254:6, 255:23, 255:29 personal [19] - 36:1, 48:4, 48:8, 48:20, 49:27, 54:4, 128:17, 154:18, 154:20, 154:25, 154:28, 163:18, 163:25, 163:28, 164:3, 201:21, 210:1, 210:10, 242:14 personalise [1] -128:16 personalised [2] -132:17, 132:23 personalising [2] -129:7, 236:24 personalities [1] -132:17 personally [12] -17:7, 57:14, 57:17, 68:2, 94:12, 94:28, 109:13, 142:14, 153:9, 163:26, 175:16, 201:17 personnel [2] -37:13, 205:11 persons [4] - 12:28, 68:27, 127:19, 221:7 perspective [5] -56:10, 129:2, 194:27, 207:23, 214:14 **peruse** [1] - 25:16 **PETER** [3] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:4 PHELAN [1] - 4:2 Philip [8] - 17:25, 18:13, 18:22, 19:24, 21:12, 118:6, 118:9, 118:10 phone [25] - 34:16, 34:17, 34:19, 36:26, 38:3, 66:5, 66:23, 106:22, 126:26, 127:3, 157:7, 158:27, 171:2, 243:7, 243:21, 243:22, 243:23, 243:28, 249:2, 249:3, 251:19, 251:20, 253:7, 253:8, 253:27 photocopy[1] -

phrase [6] - 62:15, 139:9, 143:24, 186:9, 228:12, 230:10 phrased [1] - 139:10 phraseology [3] -19:3, 25:15, 133:4 phrases [2] - 228:9, 231:1 pick [3] - 66:23, 252:20, 256:9 picked [1] - 184:17 picture [2] - 64:26, 138:5 piece [8] - 7:13, 27:1, 69:1, 144:28, 194:24, 194:25, 228:15, 232:2 pin [1] - 24:12 pinned [1] - 58:29 pins [1] - 209:19 place [43] - 11:15, 43:23, 71:18, 75:17, 89:18, 89:23, 90:7, 92:10, 94:11, 95:1, 96:4, 104:18, 106:8, 109:18, 111:1, 145:21. 169:6. 188:19, 188:24, 205:20, 205:22, 217:21, 217:22, 217:29, 218:15, 221:7, 221:14, 221:16, 221:17, 221:19, 221:21, 221:25, 223:25, 227:16, 227:21, 227:22, 227:23, 239:23, 239:24, 243:7, 249:4, 253:5 PLACE [1] - 4:21 placed [2] - 242:4, 243:8 places [2] - 241:4 **plaguing** [1] - 254:4 plain [1] - 140:24 plan [1] - 35:5 plank [2] - 114:26, 114:29 plans [1] - 188:26 plate [1] - 204:17 player [1] - 182:5 pleased [1] - 157:1 podium [1] - 181:8 point [117] - 13:10, 14:4, 15:7, 15:25, 16:1, 18:25, 19:2, 19:7, 19:13, 19:20, 20:1, 20:7, 21:2, 32:16, 32:23, 33:6,

35:13, 36:13, 38:5,

39:3, 41:23, 42:11,

42:23, 44:11, 44:27, 45:10, 45:26, 51:7, 61:1, 61:11, 61:13, 61:24, 62:12, 66:13, 72:22, 73:11, 73:12, 73:20, 73:22, 74:4, 74:5, 74:9, 82:22, 82:28, 87:12, 88:7, 90:29, 91:3, 91:12, 91:22, 91:25, 92:12, 92:14, 92:19, 92:21, 92:22, 92:29, 93:4, 93:5, 93:7, 93:11, 93:14, 94:20, 95:9, 97:9, 97:18, 98:8, 99:24. 100:28. 111:19, 115:19, 115:21, 115:24, 115:26, 118:22, 119:5. 128:14. 130:17, 130:18, 130:24, 138:16, 141:11, 141:13, 152:29, 155:1, 159:15. 164:3. 166:23, 166:29, 175:19, 185:26, 189:16, 194:28, 198:5, 201:18, 210:4, 212:13, 213:16, 213:19, 213:27, 226:10, 226:26, 227:5. 227:8. 231:4. 231:15, 236:1, 236:7, 236:8, 239:15, 241:6, 243:24, 247:24, 251:8, 253:17, 256:9 point-blank [4] -73:11, 73:12, 73:20, 73.22 pointed [4] - 118:17, 153:27, 235:12, 247:13 points [32] - 6:16, 15:1, 18:17, 19:13, 25:2, 41:4, 62:12, 100:26, 113:3, 132:9, 135:1, 149:20, 151:7, 151:26, 152:21, 155:12, 162:13, 163:17, 164:4, 165:15, 200:1, 200:2, 209:26, 210:2, 210:11, 212:16, 225:24, 242:20, 245:25, 245:26, 246:3 policeman [2] -183.4 policing [4] - 17:4, 61:26, 204:22, 205:21

69.29

policy [1] - 48:14 political [4] - 35:18, 67:16, 70:10, 117:10 politically [1] -255:17 politician [3] -175:23, 183:8, 183:24 politicians [3] -180:16, 195:15, 255:25 pool [2] - 26:4, 169:4 poor [2] - 147:11, 149:16 popular [1] - 132:16 portion [2] - 184:18, 233:26 portray [2] - 56:3, portraying [1] -67:20 position [73] - 7:19, 8:5, 8:7, 11:6, 11:20, 20:22, 20:23, 20:29, 29:2, 30:2, 35:15, 37:9, 38:8, 38:9, 39:11. 40:9. 40:18. 40:27, 42:21, 44:2, 46:4, 63:21, 64:4, 71:5, 71:27, 72:9, 72:12, 85:24, 85:28, 85:29, 86:21, 88:11, 90:19, 90:20, 91:10, 91:15, 109:23, 112:7, 112:18, 112:19, 112:26, 115:11, 116:16, 116:23, 118:7, 119:25, 128:23, 136:28, 141:9, 157:23, 178:26, 178:28, 182:26, 202:7, 204:1, 30:18 205:9, 206:22, premise [1] - 23:1 207:10, 215:20, preparation [3] -229:3, 230:11, 236:4, 6:19, 30:6, 196:15 236:12, 242:27, prepared [4] - 9:10, 245:1, 246:2, 247:20, 188:2, 188:28, 195:26 255:29, 256:25, preparing [2] -257:29, 258:7 197:2. 197:9 possession [5] presence [1] -9:25, 21:12, 89:3, 126:27 128:25, 175:8 present [4] - 98:14, possibility [24] -221:7, 221:24, 234:16 18:4, 18:8, 18:26, presented [1] -19:14, 21:22, 21:26, 257.25 22:3. 22:4. 42:14. presenter [1] -44:9, 106:19, 121:18, 215:10 123:13, 124:12, press [11] - 33:10, 130:1, 167:7, 178:1, 33:14, 33:20, 33:22, 234:27, 256:23. 34:6, 34:7, 81:16, 256:24, 256:25, 130:20, 155:29,

257:2, 257:18 possible [15] - 31:4, 50:26, 53:28, 69:25, 70:1, 76:1, 86:22, 87:6, 87:9, 88:4, 90:9, 119:26, 212:7, 236:28, 257:15 possibly [7] - 22:9, 74:29, 76:4, 131:13, 197:28, 253:15, 257:16 post [1] - 14:11 posted [1] - 209:24 postpone [1] - 235:2 potential [2] - 33:23, 256:10 potentially [1] -73:28 pour [1] - 255:16 power [1] - 14:15 powers [1] - 48:14 practice [2] - 49:25, 181:9 precise [1] - 198:13 precisely [8] - 64:23, 79:16, 79:27, 80:21, 83:8, 87:13, 106:10, 194:15 precluded [1] - 211:7 precursor [1] -192:17 predicting [1] -168:23 preface [1] - 43:17 prefer [1] - 209:20 prejudice [3] - 38:17, 49:29 50:11 prejudicial [1] -48:22 preliminary [1] -

204:28, 205:1 pressures [4] - 17:4, 205:5, 206:22, 206:27 pressurised [1] -206:21 presumably [6] -11:22, 157:27, 208:23, 215:27, 222:20, 227:29 presume [2] - 59:23, pretty [2] - 162:26, 224:7 prevention[1] -214:16 previous [9] - 41:13, 45:17, 85:8, 125:28, 129:23, 194:12, 234:21, 239:1, 239:13 previously [6] -94:15, 99:17, 110:27, 182:2, 185:14, 206:20 primary [1] - 211:23 principal [5] - 15:7, 99:2, 99:5, 105:5, 246:29 principally [1] -202:25 printed [1] - 46:10 printing [4] - 40:28, 44:14, 48:3, 139:13 printout [5] - 145:17, 147:6, 147:18, 149:11, 245:27 **private** [12] - 150:5, 152:5, 215:6, 216:6. 216:9, 236:17, 236:22, 237:1, 237:8, 243:4, 250:5, 250:22 privilege [2] - 34:1, 209:9 probability [1] -256:27

157:18

Press [30] - 33:27,

67:15, 67:17, 110:4,

154:29, 155:6, 155:8,

159:28, 161:3, 161:7,

200:20, 201:4, 201:6,

242:8, 242:12, 242:15

pressing[1] - 188:13

pressure [6] - 16:24,

17:8. 34:25. 35:18.

135:14, 141:4,

154:13, 154:20,

155:16, 155:18,

156:18, 156:23,

157:17, 158:24,

158:25, 159:19,

161:13, 200:10,

probe [1] - 125:17 problem [7] - 18:16, 55:20, 132:11, 175:26, 191:9, 202:11, 202:13 problems [5] - 65:5, 65:6, 88:26, 206:8, 207:20 procedure [4] -48:15, 159:17, 160:1, 207:28 procedures [2] -86:13. 90:6 proceeded [4] -37:14, 37:15, 195:5, 218:21 proceeding[1]-23:1 proceedings [3] -42:20, 58:12, 164:21 process [17] - 7:3, 16:3, 28:17, 38:4, 38:20, 67:16, 84:15, 86:19, 89:23, 94:6, 96:3, 99:25, 103:20, 126:9. 207:16. 224:15, 250:20 processes [2] -244:10, 244:18 processing [1] - 8:27 produce [1] - 151:9 produced [1] - 56:18 producer[1] -215:11 producing [1] -208:1 production [1] -214:10 profess [1] - 207:18 proffered [1] -105:15 programme [8] -131:16, 131:22, 134:7, 214:7, 214:13, 214:20, 215:8, 215:10 promotion [1] -129.13 prompted [2] -25:27, 26:23 promulgate [1] -24:18 proof [2] - 116:2, 151:16 **proper** [4] - 9:26, 108:24, 108:25,

143:26 proposal [1] - 239:3 proposals [4] -193:13, 194:16, 234:16, 234:20 propose [4] - 200:3, 210:22, 216:17, 243:26 proposed [3] - 22:7, 175:3. 235:2 proposition [1] -63:20 propositions [4] -25:10, 65:2, 68:14, 258:5 prosecution [1] protect [1] - 96:9 protected [17] -28:23, 77:14, 77:29, 78:15, 78:18, 78:23, 78:28, 80:23, 80:26, 81:10, 83:19, 83:21, 90:9, 97:13, 114:19, 116:1, 247:5 PROTECTED [2] -1:3, 1:4 protection [10] -45:16. 48:21. 86:17. 155:26, 175:11, 175:15, 192:14, 211:7, 212:24, 212:25 Protection [4] -48:12, 52:25, 53:22, 212:26 proved [1] - 177:8 provide [11] - 9:26, 47:9, 48:7, 50:13, 87:25, 88:5, 88:12, 88:13, 214:14, 220:8, 248:20 **provided** [7] - 10:3, 77:27, 77:29, 87:11, 176:11, 248:16, 253:3 providing [4] - 10:15, 55:28, 104:14, 104:17 psychiatric [2] -17:28, 21:29 psychological [2] -17:28, 21:28 Public [22] - 11:8, 26:28, 28:2, 29:9, 40:7, 75:18, 144:6, 175:3, 175:7, 177:24, 179:17, 179:21, 183:28, 187:18, 192:5, 192:23, 195:10, 195:14, 196:23, 219:4, 219:11, 220:10

173:21

252:20

properly [4] - 122:2,

154:13, 209:17,

proportion[1] -

public [52] - 12:1, 187:17, 194:17, Q 27:1, 39:16, 39:17, 214:13, 232:24, 39:26, 43:6, 46:2, 234:15, 235:28 qualification [2] -47:19, 48:10, 56:6, purposes [1] - 29:5 200:20, 256:10 69:2, 72:6, 72:12, pursuant [1] - 33:29 qualified [2] -75:29, 77:16, 90:23 pursue [3] - 42:23, 231:11, 231:12 51:28, 242:5 91:19, 128:6, 131:27, qualifies [1] - 228:8 135:5, 140:26, 227:29 pursuing [4] - 42:21, 142:21, 149:21, qualify [1] - 19:10 108:7, 118:11, 119:2 149:24, 150:11, pusher [1] - 107:24 quality [1] - 153:5 232:10 150:14, 150:18, put [84] - 12:12, quash [1] - 212:16 156:3, 191:11, 210:2, 231:13 16:22, 19:13, 19:21, quashed [1] - 242:20 211:6, 211:19, 23:20, 29:22, 30:6, quashing [2] -211:21, 211:29, 132:19, 245:25 231:28 31:5, 31:9, 32:12, 212:1, 214:14, **QUAY** [3] - 2:12, 33:7, 35:21, 35:28, 217:21, 217:23, 3:23, 4:11 139.8 39:16, 39:17, 40:23, 221:21, 227:23, 42:27, 47:19, 66:11, **QUEEN** [1] - 4:16 236:17, 236:22, queried [1] - 191:21 231.10 68:13, 71:3, 71:11, 237:9, 238:19, 75:27, 78:11, 79:7, queries [12] -239:22, 240:6, 83:28, 88:26, 104:13, 158:23, 158:26, 240:10, 241:3, 242:2, 104:24, 114:20, 159:1, 159:3, 159:4, 252:14, 252:15 114:24, 118:15, 159:5, 159:8, 159:19, publication [3] -132:11, 132:27, 159:26, 161:1, 161:5 163:7, 163:9, 163:18 134:12, 134:21, query [3] - 157:15, **publicity** [1] - 27:2 135:4, 137:29, 160:10, 163:23 publicly [6] - 13:20, 141:16, 143:15, questionable [4] -24:7, 26:1, 72:3, 143:19, 162:8, 165:3, 43:12, 177:8, 224:10, 213:21, 213:29 165:6, 165:18, 224:20 published [7] - 9:12, 168:12, 170:14, questioned [6] -22:28, 132:28, 137:5, 171:10, 172:6, 90:16, 117:6, 118:6, 164:15, 165:26, 181:15, 182:15, 137:4, 170:28, 208:29 242:18 184:29, 185:5, 186:2, QUESTIONED [2] -189:23 publishes [1] - 32:26 187:6, 187:7, 188:27, 5:13, 254:20 publishing [1] -189:28, 190:26, questioning [5] -193:26, 194:10, 160.12 42:3, 130:1, 135:9, Pulse [30] - 37:10, 194:26, 197:14, 136:24, 180:23 197:22, 197:25, 40:29, 44:15, 46:15, questions [38] -48:3, 48:19, 49:26, 198:5, 198:16, 22:26, 31:16, 31:27, 198:17, 199:7, 203:2. 54:14, 139:13, 35:22, 42:26, 42:27, 206:28, 209:14, 140:14, 145:17, 75:11, 104:11, 146:14, 146:16, 223:8, 229:3, 230:21, 104:13, 104:16, 230:28, 232:19, 146:18, 147:6, 118:15, 124:27, 149:14, 149:28, 237:3, 242:13, 131:14, 131:16, 242:23, 243:22, 149:29, 152:4, 152:6, 131:18, 133:15, 246:15, 247:19, 152:9, 155:20, 134:17, 135:11, 256:15 155:29, 156:2, 142:6, 143:19, 164:18, 175:8, **puts** [1] - 156:12 143:22, 145:7, 148:1, 209:25, 242:29, putting [23] - 20:10, 148:4, 170:4, 174:13, 245:26 21:19, 23:15, 35:6, 174:16, 180:16, 46:28, 63:20, 65:1, punctilious [1] - 30:1 188:6, 189:28, Purcell [11] - 7:11, 67:7, 67:8, 72:1, 72:5, 210:17, 214:25, 112:8. 124:27. 7:14, 15:8, 15:27, 214:26, 216:27, 135:24. 138:10. 124:6, 124:9, 125:3, 241:10, 241:11, 126:19, 126:25, 172:17, 174:16, 245:10, 254:22 129:21, 193:9 193:13, 204:3, 205:6, quick [1] - 220:25 205:20, 226:5, 258:5 PURCELL [1] - 4:24 quicker [1] - 179:6 puzzled [1] - 256:3 purchase [1] - 168:6 quickly [1] - 193:20 255:3 purporting[1]quietly [1] - 63:4 range [1] - 204:22 228:12 QUINN [1] - 3:28 rank [2] - 33:28, purpose [7] - 168:29, quite [19] - 27:1,

42:29, 51:14, 64:15, 36:18 65:11, 66:28, 85:16, ranks [1] - 67:9 87:22, 91:3, 105:4, rape [1] - 28:21 105:23, 117:11, rate [2] - 92:12, 125:25, 152:13, 205:11 155:23, 188:28, rather [12] - 34:29, 209:16, 216:12, 62:11, 84:8, 108:21, 147:11, 154:16, quotation [1] -181:4, 211:14, 234:13, 235:22, quotations [1] -242:6, 243:23 ray [1] - 184:23 quote [2] - 228:12, **RE** [2] - 5:12, 249:25 **re** [1] - 59:26 quoted [2] - 138:14, RE-EXAMINED [2] -5.12 249.25 quotes [2] - 144:24, react [1] - 169:21 reacting [1] - 204:10 reaction [9] - 67:8, R 77:11, 108:16, 110:14, 116:9, 116:15, 125:10, radio [10] - 32:6, 126:14, 196:10 77:20, 77:22, 219:24, read [49] - 6:10, 222:21, 223:23, 25:25, 27:7, 27:10, 224:27, 229:16, 39:22, 41:16, 41:21, 230:6, 254:10 47:28, 52:2, 52:17, raft [1] - 207:29 55:21, 55:26, 57:5, rain [5] - 189:12, 86:8, 95:14, 95:15, 189:13, 190:7 120:23, 125:8, rained [1] - 160:18 125:13, 126:12, raining [2] - 189:5, 136:13, 136:25, 144:2, 144:15, raise [11] - 6:28, 158:11, 160:20, 33:5, 38:18, 43:5, 160:26, 163:15, 51:26, 125:16, 168:13, 179:6, 195:3, 140:17, 158:27, 195:8, 198:6, 198:12, 189:26, 212:8, 236:28 198:15, 198:22, raised [26] - 19:14, 198:23, 201:11, 20:4, 90:10, 90:14, 208:15, 208:16, 90.19 90.24 91.4 219:8, 223:26, 92:13, 95:21, 97:24, 226:28, 231:26, 97:27, 104:22, 233:4, 244:16, 257:24 115:23, 115:25, reading [8] - 25:24, 115:26, 124:7, 124:9, 29:23, 30:19, 104:18, 130:16, 130:18, 107:11. 120:7. 158:27, 200:2, 207:1, 197:29, 231:7 213:11, 213:12, 251:8 reads [8] - 8:21, raises [1] - 113:17 52:7, 52:9, 52:20, raising [13] - 92:21, 53:9, 81:12, 81:18, 92:22, 93:24, 119:15, 95:26 119:25, 121:25, real [1] - 146:8 121:27, 191:20, realise [1] - 45:2 192:18, 202:28, realised [1] - 128:29 204:10, 212:8, 256:23 realising [1] - 128:6 rang [5] - 15:22, realistic [1] - 21:22 16:23, 29:26, 155:5, reality [6] - 8:8, 56:8,

65:10, 65:18, 113:10,

really [18] - 58:15,

116:6

61:8, 82:25, 88:21, 91:2, 108:24, 110:12, 123:11, 129:5, 129:6, 130:16, 130:22, 136:2, 142:12, 160:14, 201:25, 206:12, 213:2 realm [1] - 238:20 reason [22] - 22:8, 27:19, 30:13, 39:29, 40:2, 54:15, 70:11, 96:27, 100:17, 108:6, 109:10. 121:25. 168:26, 177:12, 178:29, 182:27, 184:22, 189:2, 189:26, 220:27, 240:2, 244:11 reasonable [5] - 8:7, 39:3, 65:16, 84:20, 201:16 reasons [1] - 44:29 reassurance [1] -236:24 reassured [1] - 15:23 rebut [1] - 84:22 receipt [2] - 79:20, 111:7 received [14] - 78:7, 79:11, 80:8, 81:15, 84:3, 133:5, 145:16, 145:23, 149:11, 149:27, 160:20, 171:11, 204:6, 252:27 receiving[1] -214:15 recent [3] - 147:10, 251:28, 252:11 recently [1] - 132:28 recently-published [1] - 132:28 receptive [1] - 66:22 recipient [3] - 10:24, 12:26, 46:2 recite [1] - 227:12 recognise [1] - 60:20 recollection [15] -64:4, 111:20, 111:29, 112:1, 156:10, 208:8, 220:26, 221:29, 222:2, 223:13, 225:12, 251:26, 252:3, 252:5, 253:14 recollections [1] recommendation [1] - 236.2 recommendations [3] - 35:9, 37:21, 37:25 reconcile [2] - 96:5,

223:22 reconsider [1] - 85:6 record [12] - 27:1, 39:26, 46:7, 90:25, 141:3, 141:15, 152:4, 152:6, 152:9, 156:2, 162:25, 191:8 recorded [2] -150:28. 218:9 recording [1] - 49:14 records [6] - 40:29, 46:15, 47:6, 60:1, 139:13, 253:19 recount [2] - 122:15, 182.16 recounted [1] -233:18 recounts [1] - 228:10 redacted [1] - 211:28 reduced [1] - 204:23 reducing [1] - 16:18 refer [5] - 8:24, 219:21, 237:29, 252:8, 253:11 reference [51] - 8:17, 14:2, 24:15, 31:23, 31:25, 34:29, 72:18, 78:14, 78:18, 79:22, 86:14, 88:18, 89:6, 96:17, 96:22, 96:23, 96:24, 96:25, 98:2, 98:5, 98:21, 98:26, 99:23, 100:11, 100:12, 100:19, 102:6, 104:9, 105:23, 113:2, 135:20, 137:11, 146:20, 147:7, 173:18, 176:7, 194:6, 194:7, 201:24, 201:26, 202:15, 219:15, 220:20, 226:19, 230:2, 238:2, 247:1, 253:2, 254:24, referenced [2] -176:4. 189:5 references [1] -82:17 referencing [2] -189:18, 189:20 referrals [1] - 17:12 referred [17] - 9:12, 14:10, 23:28, 89:15, 106:23, 120:20, 123:3, 124:4, 176:15, 204:25, 205:1, 219:16, 220:7, 220:11, 225:20,

239:10, 245:15

referring [14] - 10:6,

72:6, 82:12, 106:21, 106:25, 107:9, 120:13, 120:28, 189:14, 200:3, 200:5, 225:12, 235:13, 235:16 refers [5] - 33:9, 106:26, 137:20, 146:22, 239:5 reflect [3] - 69:22, 71:10, 208:19 reflected [2] -194:27, 234:26 refuse [2] - 73:20, 145.1 refused [7] - 22:28, 27:8, 27:22, 32:12, 73:11, 73:12, 137:27 refusing [1] - 209:10 refute [2] - 68:24, 88:4 regard [11] - 9:16, 11:17, 14:22, 44:25, 90.6 90.8 140.23 141:9, 141:17, 144:25, 213:11 regarded [3] - 11:12, 65:13. 110:16 regarding [16] - 8:25, 48:4, 49:27, 85:29, 86:13, 90:17, 92:3, 96:19, 99:24, 103:4, 107:21, 116:21, 117:25, 125:29, 139:17, 219:13 regardless [6] -35:22, 94:20, 117:21, 117:23, 153:5, 251:17 regards [2] - 54:29, 107:2 region [1] - 56:23 registered [2] -14:11, 168:28 **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:4 registration [2] -145:26, 168:12 regretted [1] - 16:25 regular [2] - 157:6, 179:17 regulations [2] -43:22, 43:27 reins [1] - 199:15 reject [1] - 68:17 relate [1] - 83:18 related [9] - 16:14, 33:6, 95:25, 103:16, 163:21, 187:5, 210:17, 225:23, 229:2 relates [5] - 60:6,

relating [3] - 10:1, 12:23, 171:12 relation [183] - 6:12, 6:15, 7:23, 7:26, 8:4, 11:7, 14:19, 16:14, 16:19, 19:14, 22:24, 24:16, 28:20, 36:28, 37:12, 37:13, 44:18, 46:6, 48:9, 53:3, 53:5, 54:16, 54:22, 54:25, 55:10, 64:21, 66:29, 67:1, 68:19, 71:24, 75:21. 76:11. 76:14. 76:18, 77:8, 77:16, 78:2, 78:6, 78:10, 78:15, 79:3, 80:6, 81:14, 81:16, 84:10, 85:25, 86:3, 88:2, 88:5, 90:3, 90:16, 90:21, 90:26, 91:14, 92:10. 92:16. 93:17. 95:11, 96:16, 96:29, 97:1, 97:13, 98:12, 99:22, 99:24, 99:25, 100:7, 103:18, 103:28, 105:3, 105:6, 106:4, 106:16, 107:20, 107:24, 107:27, 108:12, 108:15, 110:9, 113:13, 114:5, 114:12, 114:17, 114:26, 116:2, 116:3, 116:20. 116:23. 116:28, 117:5, 117:8, 117:14, 118:1, 118:5, 118:6, 118:9, 118:12, 118:16, 118:28, 118:29, 119:12, 119:14, 119:28, 120:5, 122:16, 122:23, 124:15, 124:18, 125:20, 125:23, 125:28, 126:21, 126:22, 129:25, 130:2, 130:3, 133:2, 133:9, 133:14, 137:1, 137:10, 145:20, 145:24, 146:6. 147:2. 151:16. 151:21, 151:29, 154:18, 154:20, 154:25, 157:7, 157:11, 159:26, 163:23, 164:7, 164:18, 164:29, 165:3, 165:7, 165:23, 165:25, 165:29, 166:19, 174:16, 175:6, 175:14, 175:20, 179:16,

179:29, 181:12, 188:6, 189:4, 189:6, 189:27, 190:11, 190:25, 190:27, 191:12, 195:17, 195:20, 196:15, 198:28, 199:1, 202:5, 204:21, 206:10, 208:12, 210:23, 212:23, 212:25, 212:28, 213:27, 216:16, 239:16, 240:15, 245:10, 245:24, 250:4, 250:17, 256:17, 257:8 relationship [6] -65:3, 174:20, 174:24, 200:23, 201:19, 212:11 relationships [1] -237.2 relaying [1] - 196:27 release [3] - 33:11, 33:14, 34:6 released [2] - 32:14, 138.13 releases [1] - 33:22 relevance 131 -33:23, 88:6, 132:7 relevant [18] - 9:20, 59:17, 72:29, 73:6, 73:28, 84:18, 88:5, 96:25, 99:12, 134:7, 134:8, 150:5, 173:17, 213:4, 213:6, 240:9, 240:23, 245:18 relying [1] - 45:2 remains [1] - 24:6 remark [4] - 143:24, 144:5, 144:11, 233:24 remarks [4] - 18:5, 42:18, 43:17, 45:8 remember [12] -31:19, 32:15, 134:9, 136:15, 162:16, 162:18, 182:10, 184:10, 200:14, 253:5, 253:6, 253:8 remind [1] - 34:13 remotely [1] - 123:10 remove [4] - 147:3, 147:5, 166:6, 171:15 removed [1] - 145:19 Renault [2] - 167:28, 167:29 repeat [4] - 90:18, 104:27, 212:20, 248:4 repeated [6] - 22:25, 22:27, 114:21, 229:29, 236:27, 248:7

60:8, 78:23, 163:24

repeatedly [4] -10:13, 236:5, 248:2, 248:28 repeating [1] - 38:11 replied [1] - 191:28 reply [7] - 12:29, 60:3, 61:6, 100:12, 184:8, 208:5, 220:26 report [62] - 6:19, 8:25, 9:4, 9:7, 9:10, 9:11, 9:18, 10:10, 10:23, 10:26, 12:5, 12:16, 13:9, 23:10, 23:17, 28:10, 29:15, 30:6, 36:20, 36:24, 37:24, 39:12, 41:19, 50:25, 53:9, 54:11, 54:18, 54:20, 54:23, 57:5, 57:8, 57:12, 60:4, 61:7, 61:18, 63:25, 63:28, 64:9, 64:24, 64:28, 72:14, 119:18, 120:7, 123:2, 125:8, 132:29, 133:4, 135:2, 135:15, 135:19, 137:15, 137:17, 143:22, 162:23, 163:1, 163:4, 189:17, 189:21, 190:6, 207:11, 224:12, 257:1 reported [3] -143:23, 163:2, 164:16 reporter [1] - 118:21 reporting [13] -36:15, 38:17, 41:8, 44:13, 46:27, 50:1, 50:12, 56:27, 139:20, 140:8, 207:24, 207:28 reports [4] - 10:2, 63:22, 78:19, 83:20 represent [1] - 142:5 representation [1] -134:18 representative [4] -47:10, 72:13, 239:22, 240:7 representing[1] -19:17 represents [1] -26:27 reputation [2] - 75:2, request [7] - 67:4, 79:5, 79:26, 85:7, 85:23, 98:6, 192:13 requested [3] -84:11, 84:17, 133:18 require [1] - 165:18 required [6] - 25:21,

82:27, 83:29, 85:14, 161:7, 161:14 requirement [2] -124:21, 205:16 rescinded [1] -145.19 researching [1] -159:14 resemblance [2] -107:13. 182:12 reservations [1] -87:3 reserve [2] - 12:27, 44.2 reserving [2] - 40:9, 40:18 resides [2] - 161:2, 161:6 resigned [1] - 35:25 RESOLUTIONS [1] resolve [4] - 187:26, 187:28, 238:18, 239:14 resolved [1] - 247:25 resources [5] -16:19, 204:24, 204:25, 205:1, 206:13 respect [29] - 7:12, 7:16, 8:29, 16:9, 20:5, 20:8, 22:6, 41:23, 48:13, 56:16, 60:7, 63:24, 65:4, 68:14, 74:25, 76:5, 110:18, 129:19. 131:28. 132:24, 134:19, 136:24, 138:26, 139:1, 154:28, 182:13, 188:6, 197:25, 204:6 respected [2] -21:17, 65:29 respective [1] -231.10 respond [15] - 10:8, 78:27, 79:6, 79:17, 79:28, 80:13, 83:5, 83:9, 84:17, 85:19, 87:14, 88:21, 96:28, 98:3. 98:6 responded [5] -83:26, 135:29, 141:8, 154:4, 245:19 responding [5] -88:18, 104:11, 127:14, 127:16, 254:8

response [26] -

61:10, 70:18, 79:7,

79:25, 80:9, 80:10,

82:19, 84:6, 85:7,

86:2, 89:26, 91:4, 113:11, 122:25, 122:26, 124:16, 125:10, 181:24, 187:23, 208:14, 208:17, 231:4, 232:17, 244:20, 247:14 responses [1] - 89:5 responsibilities [1] -254:1 responsibility [1] -157:29 responsible [2] -153:5, 239:22 rest [1] - 256:16 restructuring [1] -205:20 result [3] - 15:11, 16:11, 236:11 **RESUMED** [3] - 6:1, 102:1, 199:24 retired [8] - 40:12, 47:7, 94:4, 106:26, 144:4, 144:11, 251:22, 253:20 retirement [2] -99:13. 202:8 retracted [1] - 146:3 retrospectively [1] return [2] - 84:25, 89:12 returned [2] -164:19, 176:12 returning [1] - 190:9 reveal [4] - 151:14, 155:22, 172:3, 172:16 revealed [4] - 30:8, 166:27, 210:1, 210:10 revealing [1] -218:18 revelation [2] -218:13, 224:26 revenge [4] - 81:25, 82:9, 102:26, 122:21 revenue [1] - 14:13 review [2] - 64:16, 96:12 reviewed [1] - 9:10 Reynolds [13] -22:20, 23:15, 25:26, 31:3, 32:10, 35:7, 35:14, 35:16, 35:21, 131:11, 137:5, 140:25, 141:4 Rian [2] - 164:20,

63:10, 63:13, 119:18 ridiculing [1] - 65:26 riding [1] - 34:26 rightful [1] - 11:15 rightly [2] - 73:14, 91.4 rights [3] - 50:1, 50:11, 86:17 ring [2] - 15:26, 16:28 rise [2] - 148:1, 148.4 risked [2] - 211:4, 211:5 **road** [5] - 16:18, 41:10, 43:29, 169:28, 205:14 **ROAD**[1] - 4:7 Road [3] - 17:19, 168:6, 204:27 roadmap [1] - 97:17 Robert [1] - 13:21 robust [3] - 17:2, 180:7, 180:9 rock [1] - 187:8 rogue [2] - 160:23, 173:8 role [3] - 200:20, 204:17, 206:21 **RONAN**[2] - 3:1, 3:29 room [12] - 27:7, 135:4, 166:10, 166:12, 166:13, 166:15, 166:16, 167:1, 216:6, 220:18, 227:18, 227:21 rooms [1] - 228:4 Rooney [19] - 57:16, 57:25, 58:5, 58:25, 59:20, 59:22, 59:24, 59:27, 60:23, 61:15, 62:4, 62:11, 62:16, 62:29, 63:11, 63:25, 65:12, 65:24, 244:8 Rooney's [1] -244:20 root [1] - 82:8 Ross [1] - 208:6 **ROSSA**[1] - 3:5 roster [1] - 205:19 rosters [1] - 151:15 roughly [1] - 205:12 RTÉ [20] - 3:1, 3:2, 17:26, 22:14, 22:18, 23:10, 24:1, 26:19, 26:24, 30:17, 32:19, 32:29. 39:21. 131:10. 133:15, 133:19,

138:5, 214:11,

214:22, 215:13
rude [1] - 192:20
ruined [2] - 160:22,
173:8
rumours [1] - 16:29
run [1] - 176:5
run-up [1] - 176:5
runner [1] - 235:26
running [2] - 64:16,
131:22
rural [2] - 135:2,
169:23

S

safe [1] - 175:6 Safety [2] - 17:19, 204:27 **SAINT** [2] - 3:8, 3:13 **saloon** [1] - 194:19 same" [1] - 99:9 sat [2] - 113:2, 190:17 satchel [1] - 233:14 satisfied [5] - 9:9, 14:5, 37:8, 48:18, 85:16 Saturday [4] -250:28, 251:21, 251:27, 253:2 save [1] - 249:5 saw [10] - 7:12, 70:6, 109:12, 162:9, 169:25, 176:8, 178:4. 248:25, 253:19, 256:12 **SC** [14] - 2:6, 2:6, 2:9, 2:10, 2:14, 2:15, 2:15, 2:22, 3:1, 3:5, 3:28, 4:6, 4:14, 4:19 scenario [1] - 242:4 scene [1] - 184:2 school [1] - 254:29 schools [1] - 254:28 scoping [3] - 87:16, 247:16, 247:24 screen [7] - 49:9, 78:11, 79:7, 125:21, 166:24, 166:27, 170:26 screenshot [1] -209:25 script [2] - 26:1 scripted [2] - 208:14, 208:16 scroll [2] - 49:18, 238:8 **SEAN**[2] - 2:11, 3:1 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:6

Rice [7] - 57:15,

57:25, 58:10, 60:3,

searching [2] - 48:3, 54:14 seat [4] - 190:16, 190:22. 196:18 SEBASTIAN[1] -3:16 secluded [1] - 216:9 second [26] - 63:26, 75:16, 78:24, 79:21, 82:15, 83:11, 83:12, 84:11, 84:25, 85:3, 85:10, 86:6, 86:11, 89:19, 91:12, 124:25, 140:14, 168:2, 184:1, 184:3, 194:25, 211:4, 211:11, 233:3, 250:11, 255:14 second-last [4] -79:21, 85:3, 86:6, 89:19 secondary [1] -254:28 **secondly** [4] - 10:5, 50:25, 134:11, 211:18 secret [2] - 29:1, 67:25 Secretary [4] - 7:9, 7:14, 15:9, 15:26 secretary [3] -124:18, 128:21, 250:22 section [5] - 45:3, 51:24, 78:19, 89:12, 99.17 Section [3] - 83:20, 124:20, 124:26 Security [2] - 50:3, 50:17 security [4] - 151:19, 157:29, 204:22, 205:22 see [130] - 16:22, 18:9, 19:8, 21:2, 21:11, 22:6, 23:8, 24:20, 25:18, 27:4, 35:13, 36:27, 37:1, 38:23, 39:25, 56:3, 56:8, 57:11, 59:10, 59:28, 61:8, 62:14, 63:20, 64:5, 64:8, 64:25, 66:6, 66:23, 67:4, 67:5, 67:12, 67:22, 69:24, 69:25, 72:1, 74:9, 74:18, 75:5, 76:4, 77:25, 78:5, 78:10, 80:22, 80:26, 83:1, 83:6, 84:28, 87:16, 88:24, 89:5, 89:12, 92:15,

92:27, 93:14, 95:9,

95:24, 96:11, 96:16, 96:26, 98:8, 98:19, 98:21, 99:10, 99:22, 100:11 100:27 102:6, 104:4, 104:16, 105:3, 108:4, 108:15, 108:19, 108:28, 109:3, 111:21, 112:23, 115:15, 116:5, 117:2, 117:3, 117:29, 118:23, 120:1, 122:3, 125:14, 126:13, 126:18, 127:18, 129:17, 130:11, 130:13, 137:22, 147:6, 149:16, 149:18, 150:1, 155:28, 156:1, 160:4, 167:16, 168:14, 174:2, 192:17, 194:15, 198:15, 200:5, 202:18, 203:9, 203:18, 203:23, 203:24, 212:7. 212:12, 218:8, 231:26, 231:27, 234:15, 235:25, 235:26, 238:9, 242:1, 247:29, 250:24, 251:8, 253:9, 253:15 seeing [3] - 13:5, 32:29. 137:29 seek [1] - 94:12 seeking [5] - 106:1, 135:11, 135:27, 235:23, 239:18 seem [15] - 28:1, 34:1, 34:8, 45:11, 56:28, 76:13, 77:17, 88:6, 93:6, 107:3, 124:5. 143:12. 164:25, 204:13, 211:18 semantics [1] -123:4 send [8] - 53:5, 58:7, 58:9, 62:5, 157:14, 235:21, 235:22, 242:28 sending [4] - 58:11,

236:1, 250:10, 250:12

sends [1] - 106:27

senior [7] - 66:24,

sense [6] - 19:11,

27:5, 116:17, 146:25,

127:19, 129:11,

176:4, 218:20,

220:16, 221:24

239:8, 254:13

sensitive [4] - 48:4, 48:8, 49:26, 253:25 sent [16] - 8:14, 13:1, 13:3, 14:12, 14:13, 35:20, 38:15, 55:21, 56:8, 56:20, 58:25, 60:9, 63:2, 117:17, 235:10, 250:14 sentence [7] - 25:18, 50:10, 139:15, 139:28, 172:8, 172:10, 172:11 sentiments [1] -100.9 **Seoige** [2] - 133:11, separate [3] - 33:6, 126:28, 209:13 September [4] -8:16, 13:4, 41:13, 77:15 **sequel** [1] - 64:9 sequence [3] -36:27, 62:23, 253:6 sergeant [16] -12:15, 23:23, 25:3, 25:13, 28:3, 29:12, 36:17, 39:5, 39:10, 50:19, 64:10, 67:13, 67:18, 121:28, 138:20, 204:3 Sergeant [249] -6:17, 6:25, 7:2, 7:7, 7:9, 7:17, 8:8, 8:15, 8:20, 11:14, 12:11, 13:15, 14:3, 15:11, 15:15, 15:17, 15:23. 16:2, 17:22, 17:27, 18:1, 18:5, 18:17, 19:26, 20:4, 20:16, 20:21, 20:28, 21:28, 22:21, 22:25, 23:2, 24:17, 24:29, 27:5, 28:9, 28:27, 29:18, 30:7, 30:12, 30:26, 31:19, 31:27, 32:8, 32:11, 32:12, 32:21, 33:8, 33:12, 33:15, 34:5, 36:1, 36:10, 36:14, 38:16, 40:1, 40:16, 40:25, 41:8, 41:14, 41:17, 42:25, 43.4 43.9 44.5 44:18, 45:5, 45:7, 45:22, 45:29, 46:8, 47:13, 47:28, 49:14, 49:17, 50:24, 50:28, 50:29, 51:2, 55:23, 55:29, 56:7, 56:17, 56:28, 57:16, 59:12,

61:25, 62:20, 63:21, 64:1, 65:3, 65:4, 65:6, 65:11, 65:25, 66:7, 66:12, 66:19, 67:2, 67:7, 68:5, 68:26, 71:3, 71:11, 71:24, 72:28, 73:2, 73:5, 74:20, 75:3, 76:2, 76:20, 78:16, 81:16, 81:23, 81:24, 81:27, 82:1, 82:7, 83:19, 100:22, 102:25, 102:27, 106:6, 107:20, 107:22, 107:28, 108:1, 113:8, 115:13, 117:15, 119:12, 119:14, 119:19, 119:24, 120:4, 120:15, 121:3, 121:8. 121:20. 121:25, 121:27, 122:8, 122:20, 122:23, 123:14, 123:23, 123:26, 124:8. 124:13. 124:28, 125:5, 125:10, 125:15, 126:1, 126:4, 126:10, 126:22, 127:11. 127:20, 127:23, 127:26, 128:5, 128:9, 128:22, 129:1, 129:22. 129:25. 130:1, 135:22, 136:16, 137:12, 137:26, 138:3, 138:5, 138:12, 139:5, 139:16, 140:13, 145:3, 163:6, 163:13, 163:28. 164:25. 167.5 172.2 172.15 172:24, 175:2, 176:9, 177:6, 177:28, 179:9, 179:20, 185:21, 191:4, 191:14, 191:16, 191:20, 192:6, 192:18, 194:8, 194:12, 194:21, 194:23, 196:6, 196:8, 196:10, 196:11, 199:9, 202:23, 202:25, 202:27, 204:10, 205:25, 208:23, 209:1, 209:7, 210:13, 210:28, 212:7, 213:19, 213:24, 216:25, 219:16, 219:21, 224:9, 224:19, 225:3, 226:20, 230:9, 234:28, 236:28,

238:17, 239:19, 240:5, 241:20, 244:9, 244:11, 244:17, 246:18, 246:24, 249:19, 250:14, 250:17, 257:19, 257:20 series [4] - 37:21, 46:17, 59:28, 253:8 serious [34] - 10:6, 12:23, 14:8, 30:26, 30:28, 36:19, 41:1, 51:29, 56:24, 61:24, 68:23, 72:11, 74:15, 78:19, 79:4, 79:23, 80:20, 82:24, 82:25, 84:16, 90:22, 91:17, 93:2, 95:2, 95:11, 128:11, 152:22, 152:29, 177:27, 191:12, 204:20, 207:29, 218:25 seriously [5] - 44:28, 68:5, 71:10, 75:2, 207:12 seriousness [2] -82:27, 94:21 serve [1] - 70:9 served [1] - 42:16 Service [1] - 34:19 **service** [3] - 36:5, 66.9 205.22 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:30 Services [1] - 1:25 serving [5] - 43:19, 47:8, 210:19, 210:27, 211:2 session [1] - 221:22 set [40] - 48:14, 78:23, 79:1, 79:10, 79:15, 79:24, 79:27, 80:9, 80:12, 80:15, 80:23, 81:9, 81:13, 82:20, 83:3, 83:7, 83:15, 83:24, 84:17, 84:19, 86:18, 87:9, 88:2, 88:10, 89:20, 90:1, 90:4, 90:25, 94:10, 97:10, 97:16, 98:29, 105:23, 113:1, 134:13, 134:24, 167:22, 187:21, 228:22, 243:11 sets [1] - 83:12 setting [3] - 35:23, 84:10, 136:5 seven [2] - 151:27, 154:14 several [8] - 43:1,

61:19, 64:19, 128:9,

	1		T	1
146:17, 162:3,	sick [1] - 130:17	177:18, 183:28,	118:19, 141:1	253:22, 256:9
210:22, 220:16	side [6] - 17:20, 30:1,	187:20, 205:8, 208:7,	somewhere [8] -	speaks [5] - 25:11,
sexual [24] - 19:25,	32:13, 156:11,	215:24, 215:25,	35:8, 94:12, 152:14,	26:26, 41:17, 50:9,
20:5, 82:7, 119:26,	205:14, 257:26	229:1, 242:2, 242:4,	168:5, 188:14,	76:11
120:8, 120:13,	sides [1] - 176:20	243:10, 245:3	200:15, 201:24, 216:8	special [2] - 15:6,
120:28, 121:19,	sideways [1] -	situations [1] -	soon [1] - 138:3	132:7
122:21, 123:2,	109:14	129:15	sorry [62] - 7:13,	specific [21] - 76:6,
125:29, 176:3,	signed [1] - 94:18	six [4] - 9:6, 151:27,	14:1, 23:3, 26:6,	86:3, 88:1, 88:5,
177:27, 178:25,	significance [1] -	155:13, 177:21	30:20, 30:23, 35:1,	88:16, 89:20, 96:20,
178:27, 203:16,	31:14	sizes [1] - 186:7	39:14, 49:17, 73:22,	98:12, 99:26, 110:7,
225:1, 225:13,	significant [13] -	skirt [1] - 148:25	74:4, 77:19, 86:7,	110:8, 122:26,
226:19, 226:20,	127:19, 132:13,	slight [1] - 109:12	98:27, 102:14,	124:22, 132:22,
226:24, 237:29,	192:4, 192:12,	slightly [7] - 18:24,	120:18, 123:22,	132:23, 133:15,
239:1, 239:20	192:22, 192:25,	33:6, 45:26, 91:9,	125:21, 136:6, 138:8,	165:13, 165:17,
sexually [4] - 73:2,	192:28, 192:29,	111:1, 238:8, 251:3	141:24, 145:27,	166:28, 214:26,
130:29, 191:5, 255:1	193:2, 193:6, 193:16,	slow [1] - 116:13	147:15, 149:1,	229:29
SGT [1] - 2:9	193:27, 193:28	SM1 [1] - 34:14	149:23, 149:26,	specifically [7] -
SHANE [1] - 2:14	significantly [1] -	small [3] - 26:4,	166:13, 166:16,	62:10, 106:21, 110:5,
shape [2] - 62:27,	171:28	55:14, 131:14	166:20, 169:14,	122:22, 125:19,
107:13	silly [1] - 29:3		170:3, 172:22,	125:25, 208:26
shapes [1] - 186:7	similar [7] - 42:2,	smear [1] - 115:5	181:26, 182:28,	specificity [1] -
shared [3] - 182:6,	67:2, 84:19, 91:1,	SMITHFIELD [1] -	185:8, 185:9, 187:29,	80:18
212:24, 213:6		2:29	188:1, 189:14,	specifics [6] -
SHATTER [2] - 4:19,	94:29, 103:11, 240:24	Smithwick [5] -	189:19, 193:4,	162:16, 162:18,
4:21	similarities [1] - 231:2	132:28, 135:2,	196:18, 198:25,	248:3, 248:29, 249:7,
Shatter [22] - 6:14,		135:15, 135:19, 215:1	203:5, 203:24,	249:12
6:17, 15:4, 15:14,	similarity [1] - 182:6	snapshot [1] -	208:11, 215:4,	spectrum [2] - 181:3,
	similarly [3] - 35:6,	209:25	217:16, 218:8,	181:5
15:19, 15:28, 16:1, 119:14, 122:16,	164:20, 213:16	so-called [1] - 43:18	218:14, 222:5,	speculate [1] - 126:1
123:11, 124:6, 124:9,	SIMON [2] - 3:21,	social [3] - 143:13,	222:10, 222:12,	speculated [1] -
125:3, 125:19,	3:21	146:16, 202:15	222:14, 225:10,	126:4
125:27, 126:18,	simple [5] - 51:6,	socialise [2] -	226:25, 230:23,	speech [5] - 229:14,
126:25, 127:4,	56:10, 113:18,	201:22, 201:29	244:24, 251:22,	229:19, 229:22,
129:21, 246:14,	161:12, 183:25	socially [1] - 201:21	252:6, 252:19	229:26, 230:5
246:19, 246:23	simply [31] - 33:13,	sole [1] - 235:28	sort [5] - 19:12,	•
Shatter's [1] -	34:4, 62:17, 105:20,	SOLE [2] - 1:12, 2:2	116:14, 118:20,	speed [5] - 147:25,
125:23	106:16, 107:18,	solicitor [2] - 63:9,	163:29, 213:5	150:28, 189:6, 210:2,
	110:17, 115:15,	92:29	sorted [1] - 149:7	210:11
sheet [1] - 98:4	121:23, 125:7, 146:2,	SOLICITOR [1] - 2:7	sorts [2] - 16:28,	speedily [1] - 64:15
SHIP [2] - 2:19, 4:27	147:9, 147:25,	SOLICITOR'S [2] -	74:23	speeding [1] -
ship [1] - 32:20	151:10, 159:24,	2:18, 4:25	sought [4] - 48:11,	145:29
shocking [3] - 53:11,	160:10, 165:8,	SOLICITORS [9] -	197:16, 202:26,	speedy [1] - 26:13
53:14, 54:7	171:14, 178:3,	2:24, 2:28, 3:6, 3:11,	206:16	spend [1] - 225:15
shook [1] - 223:19	182:19, 185:3,	3:21, 3:29, 4:3, 4:10,	source [20] - 23:16,	spent [1] - 65:11
SHORT [1] - 199:24	185:11, 186:2, 191:2,	4:21	31:7, 31:8, 32:19,	Spielberg [1] -
short [4] - 17:10,	191:28, 193:29,	solicitors [6] - 57:16,	33:7, 33:9, 141:1,	189:11
143:22, 162:26,	225:20, 226:27,	66:20, 67:3, 171:13,	141:2, 141:15,	splitting [1] - 8:10
184:18	235:22, 239:11, 258:4	171:23, 252:21	144:27, 145:17,	splutter [1] - 138:6
shorthand [1] -	single [4] - 31:19,	solution [1] - 237:16	145:24, 151:19,	spoken [9] - 7:6,
230:12	64:23, 69:14, 129:11	solving [1] - 206:6	153:6, 166:26, 167:4,	21:21, 44:5, 115:20,
show [6] - 46:8,	sit [7] - 28:4, 29:13,	someone [8] - 32:20,	167:5, 167:16, 209:7,	136:4, 177:19,
46:16, 151:6, 151:15,	29:26, 74:16, 137:12,	33:28, 219:17,	209:10	179:23, 179:25, 253:7
245:28, 251:6	190:17, 234:24	219:22, 220:21,	sources [3] - 144:10,	spotted [1] - 169:20
showed [1] - 175:17	sitting [3] - 57:2,	225:21, 255:18,		sprung [1] - 188:17
shown [1] - 166:24	98:4, 254:5	256:13	144:24, 252:16	spun [1] - 199:8
shows [5] - 40:8,	situation [26] - 8:11,	sometime [2] -	speaking [16] - 6:23,	spurious [1] - 121:9
42:9, 89:23, 99:23,	27:12, 27:16, 36:23,	59:13, 60:22	14:5, 15:17, 17:3,	SQUARE [1] - 4:11
126:9	41:9, 45:1, 76:5, 98:1,	sometimes [1] -	17:7, 44:16, 108:26,	Square [1] - 161:15
shred [1] - 248:22	112:24, 128:7,	200:29	112:1, 114:11,	squashing [1] -
shunned [1] - 67:17	149:18, 151:25,	somewhat [5] - 19:4,	133:25, 177:27,	209:26
shut [1] - 12:12	163:16, 165:2,	70:28, 103:11,	183:24, 207:6, 252:3,	staff [13] - 9:5,
L		1	1	1

118:24, 118:26, 118:27, 160:18, 160:27, 161:9, 161:14, 161:26, 161:27, 161:28, 173:6, 228:6
STATE [2] - 2:18, 4:25 state [6] - 85:14, 85:24, 85:28, 86:7, 86:27, 87:28 State [1] - 14:13 statement [55] - 17:22, 19:29, 22:18, 23:17, 23:28, 29:8, 33:9, 33:10, 34:7, 37:5, 69:17, 76:16, 87:25, 87:26, 87:27, 98:7, 98:23, 98:26, 102:16, 103:27, 104:2, 104:3, 113:28, 114:11, 138:6, 165:5, 165:9, 173:26, 174:17, 181:22, 185:17, 186:29, 196:12, 198:4, 215:5, 218:28, 220:7, 224:2, 225:19, 228:7, 231:18, 232:1, 232:3, 232:7, 232:19, 233:2,

233:3, 245:15, 245:19, 245:20, 248:8, 252:25, 253:3 statements [7] -71:19, 82:26, 102:23, 119:9, 130:20, 193:23, 198:2 states [4] - 85:3, 85:11, 99:27, 169:28 stating [7] - 44:18, 71:13, 85:20, 100:13, 178:24, 197:6, 252:27 station [1] - 205:17 stations [2] - 77:22, 135:2 statute [1] - 211:7 statutorily [1] -246:26 statutory [4] - 14:14, 122:29, 212:25, 213:6 steer [1] - 32:20 steering [2] - 196:17, 196:19 stenographic [1] -1.27 STENOGRAPHY [1] - 1:30 stenography [1] -1:25 step [2] - 43:24, 57:9 stepped [1] - 35:7 steps [1] - 235:6 stick [2] - 177:29, 202:20 **still** [8] - 114:3, 117:24, 167:1, 184:10, 210:3, 246:1, 249:13, 256:3 stood [1] - 15:25 stop [5] - 47:20, 48:26, 140:4, 194:12, 194:21 stopped [14] - 73:22, 144:6, 144:12, 145:21, 145:26, 145:28, 146:10, 148:27, 148:28, 148:29, 149:6, 222:25, 250:21

stopping [1] - 254:28

stories [3] - 162:13,

storm [1] - 132:27

story [51] - 22:27,

23:14, 27:26, 29:17,

39:17, 107:5, 132:13,

137:5, 138:1, 138:4,

30:12, 30:16, 31:1,

132:15, 132:24,

138:9, 138:10,

163:6, 242:5

138:14, 151:26, 152:1, 159:13, 159:22, 159:23, 160:6, 160:12, 160:13, 161:22, 162:1, 163:8, 163:23, 164:5, 164:7, 164:14, 181:18, 181:19, 182:2, 182:16, 182:20, 182:22, 182:24, 182:25, 183:5, 183:14, 183:16, 185:18, 209:4, 232:28, 241:28, 242:17 straight [2] - 15:21, 90:26 straightaway [1] -115:27 straightened [1] -235:20 strange [2] - 75:25, 91:15 streamline [1] -205:16 **STREET** [8] - 2:19, 2:25, 2:29, 3:7, 3:12, 3:22, 4:16, 4:27 stressed [1] - 85:13 striking [1] - 240:27 strong [5] - 96:9, 180:20, 180:26, 181:2, 240:13 strongly [2] - 93:1, 218:26 structure [1] - 66:26 **structured** [1] - 66:9 studio [1] - 133:28 stuff [11] - 51:23, 52:5, 52:26, 52:27, 53:10, 53:14, 53:23, 54:7, 70:4, 70:5, 168:15 subject [5] - 43:21, 137:3, 194:8, 211:20, 224:3 subjects [1] - 204:22 submission [2] -107:8, 137:3 submit [1] - 9:20 submitted [1] - 9:7 subsequent [7] -99:13, 137:6, 161:24, 161:25, 181:21, 185:17, 253:26 subsequently [10] -27:2, 37:24, 39:5, 138:1, 139:14, 150:29, 177:8,

250:23 substance [7] -81:27, 81:29, 102:29, 138:2, 171:18, 230:29, 247:18 substantial [4] -37:1, 37:19, 37:20, 64:1 success [1] - 99:20 successor [1] -214:6 sudden [1] - 164:24 suddenly [1] - 26:22 suffering [1] -110.25 suffice [1] - 176:18 sufficient [4] - 80:16, 85:17, 85:26, 97:29 suggest [50] - 20:2, 23:14, 25:27, 27:4, 27:25, 30:11, 31:1, 34:28, 35:14, 36:8, 37:27, 38:23, 42:13, 42:19, 43:2, 44:4, 45:29, 46:5, 46:14, 46:19, 47:27, 50:6, 50:21, 50:28, 55:23, 65:10, 65:28, 67:12, 67:22, 70:7, 70:11, 70:16, 72:17, 74:2, 74:18, 107:16, 113:29, 118:14, 124:4, 126:8, 134:2, 135:8, 136:11, 164:26, 177:14, 178:11, 179:19, 188:16, 239:18, 254:7 suggested [20] -19:18, 106:14, 133:22, 134:22, 164:1, 188:16, 197:20, 211:26, 225:1, 226:14, 226:22, 226:23, 238:13, 238:27, 239:9, 239:15, 240:16, 240:18, 244:5, 244:23 suggesting [29] -20:9, 21:6, 21:7, 24:11, 26:21, 29:7, 38:5, 38:7, 39:28, 43:28, 56:3, 66:11, 66:13, 68:1, 69:10. 69:12, 71:1, 71:2, 71:3, 71:11, 71:13, 76:24, 137:26, 178:1, 179:29. 194:16. 195:29, 198:29, 235:6 suggestion [12] -

45:25, 70:8, 75:27, 107:17, 108:9, 108:10, 125:1, 129:19, 166:24, 187:27, 234:29, 253:9 suggestions [5] -107:2, 107:4, 107:5, 160:23, 187:20 suitable [1] - 169:12 suited [1] - 188:9 summarise [2] -210:25, 234:12 summarised [1] -59:11 summarising [1] -210:26 **summary** [7] - 60:19, 120:7, 120:24, 125:9, 211:9, 211:10, 228:28 summation [1] -30:10 **summer** [1] - 6:13 summonsed [1] -157:26 Sunday [6] - 144:2, 144:7, 251:21, 251:24, 251:27, 253:21 **SUNLIGHT** [1] - 2:24 superintendent [31] - 51:20, 51:26, 52:1, 53:8, 54:3, 54:9, 54:13, 54:18, 54:20, 54:23, 54:27, 55:2, 55:6, 55:18, 58:4, 59:20, 59:22, 60:23, 62:4, 66:16, 108:17, 108:25, 109:23. 158:22, 159:24, 244:26, 245:7, 251:22, 253:20, 257:26 Superintendent [155] - 18:6, 18:12, 18:21, 19:1, 19:15, 19:24, 20:2, 20:11, 20:19, 21:27, 33:20, 58:25, 61:15, 62:11, 62:16, 62:29, 65:24, 67:14, 67:19, 67:23, 71:23, 71:25, 77:7, 77:13, 77:14, 78:1, 78:3, 78:17, 80:4, 80:11, 81:10, 81:14, 83:3, 83:21, 89:7, 96:19, 97:2, 97:6, 97:12, 97:21, 98:10, 98:22, 98:26, 99:7, 99:14, 100:1, 100:13, 102:8, 102:22, 103:4,

233:27, 250:13,

r	1			I
103:15, 104:8,	172:22, 172:23	46:7, 58:20, 59:16,	223:14, 223:16	102:22, 103:5,
104:21, 105:4,	supported [1] -	61:26, 63:23, 64:21,	TARA[1] - 2:22	104:21, 105:17,
105:17, 106:3,	67:16	135:20, 139:21,	Taylor [134] - 18:6,	107:26, 111:5,
107:22, 108:2,	supporting [1] -	140:6, 155:20	18:12, 18:21, 19:1,	113:12, 114:17,
108:11, 108:14,	173:3	systematic [1] - 69:1	19:15, 19:24, 20:2,	116:4, 116:27,
109:11, 110:3,	supportive [2] -	systemic [2] - 58:3,	20:11, 20:20, 21:27,	170:29, 186:16,
110:28, 111:5,	42:9, 42:21	58:23	33:20, 67:14, 67:19,	201:26, 203:8,
111:10, 111:25,	suppose [27] -	Séan [1] - 131:9	67:23, 71:23, 71:25,	230:18, 230:25, 233:7
112:4, 113:11,	45:15, 58:28, 92:29,	Síochána [80] - 7:29,	77:7, 77:13, 77:14,	TD [1] - 59:21
113:19, 114:13,	98:8, 103:27, 104:1,	10:11, 10:12, 11:13,	78:1, 78:3, 80:11,	tea [1] - 188:29
114:17, 114:20,	104:16, 104:25,	11:16, 12:23, 16:17,	81:10, 81:14, 83:3,	team [6] - 9:4, 25:8,
114:24, 114:27,	106:13, 108:6,	17:6, 20:27, 23:16,	89:7, 97:2, 97:7,	50:23, 64:17, 244:28,
115:9, 115:16,	113:10, 122:13,	25:20, 25:28, 26:18,	97:13, 97:21, 98:10,	245:8
115:19, 116:3, 116:6,	123:4, 145:1, 167:4,	26:23, 31:3, 33:17,	98:22, 98:27, 99:7,	teasing [1] - 204:29
116:24, 116:27,	167:12, 169:17,	36:18, 39:4, 39:17,	99:14, 100:1, 100:14,	technically [1] -
117:7, 117:16,	169:18, 192:20,	43:20, 43:24, 46:24,	102:8, 103:15, 104:8,	169:17
117:23, 117:29,	205:8, 205:11,	49:28, 51:23, 57:15,	105:4, 106:3, 106:22,	technicolour [1] -
118:8, 118:12,	205:24, 223:17,	60:10, 62:18, 62:22,	106:27, 107:2,	136:12
118:25, 118:29,	226:5, 227:4, 240:11,	65:9, 65:14, 67:9,	107:19, 107:23,	teeth [1] - 182:11
119:3, 128:18,	257:15	72:26, 74:14, 76:11,	107:26, 108:3,	telephoned [2] -
129:18, 141:5, 158:6,	supposed [3] -	78:22, 81:4, 99:14,	108:11, 108:14,	7:14, 15:11
160:8, 161:16,	26:18, 168:4, 185:19	100:24, 108:26,	109:11, 110:3,	ten [3] - 131:13,
161:25, 161:29, 162:28, 165:28,	SUPREME [2] - 1:13,	109:26, 115:7, 116:8,	110:29, 111:10, 111:25, 112:4,	199:22, 243:20
170:16, 170:18,	2:3	119:21, 124:20,	113:19, 114:13,	tends [1] - 28:19
170:10, 170:10,	SUPT [1] - 2:22	129:3, 129:8, 129:10,	114:20, 114:24,	tensions [1] - 65:20
171:4, 171:6, 171:19,	sure [1] - 55:12	131:24, 131:28,	114:28, 115:9,	term [1] - 173:17
172:6, 172:19,	surely [13] - 72:13,	132:2, 134:13, 134:17, 134:29,	115:16, 115:19,	terminated [5] -
186:15, 187:5,	82:18, 92:9, 93:16, 98:15, 107:28,	135:27, 136:16,	116:6, 116:24, 117:7,	149:13, 150:4, 152:1,
198:29, 200:9,	112:20, 113:17,	150:3, 151:28, 152:7,	117:16, 117:24,	152:22, 164:21
201:26, 202:2, 202:7,	113:19, 158:3,	152:11, 153:10,	117:29, 118:8,	terminated" [1] -
202:26, 203:8,	159:22, 184:23	153:11, 169:24,	118:12, 118:25,	147:26
203:25, 206:16,	surmise [1] - 215:22	172:4, 172:17,	119:1, 119:3, 128:18,	termination [1] - 210:4
230:17, 231:9, 233:7,	surname [1] - 148:9	175:24, 183:11,	129:18, 129:26,	terms [70] - 10:6,
233:10, 233:19,	surprise [3] - 13:6,	186:4, 200:21,	141:5, 157:4, 158:6,	23:26, 24:15, 31:23,
233:29, 234:5, 234:6,	103:8, 191:24	204:15, 205:4,	158:18, 160:7, 160:8,	31:24, 45:18, 47:29,
241:12, 243:2, 243:8,	surprised [3] -	205:10, 205:15,	161:16, 161:26,	50:18, 72:18, 76:15,
244:7, 244:15,	42:29, 142:12, 220:27	205:18, 207:24,	161:29, 162:28,	76:17, 86:14, 87:11,
244:19, 245:13,	surrounding [1] -	214:10, 228:1,	165:28, 170:16,	88:18, 89:5, 89:24,
245:21, 246:29,	205:25	239:21, 240:8, 242:3,	170:19, 170:27,	92:3, 96:24, 96:25,
247:6, 247:10,	suspect [1] - 45:24	244:1	171:4, 171:6, 171:19,	97:5, 98:2, 98:5, 98:9,
247:27, 248:16,	suspects [1] -	Síochána's [1] - 46:7	172:6, 172:19, 173:1,	99:9, 99:12, 100:12,
248:21, 248:28,	167:11	_	187:5, 199:1, 200:9,	100:19, 104:10,
248:29, 249:7,	suspended [2] -	T	200:23, 202:2, 202:7,	105:15, 105:22,
249:16, 250:8, 250:29, 251:4,	109:18, 110:19		- 202:26, 203:25, 206:16, 231:9,	106:20, 108:11,
251:12, 251:23,	suspension [4] -	table [2] - 91:27,		108:27, 110:2, 110:5,
251.12, 251.23, 253:13, 256:18,	99:29, 100:6, 110:8,	93:3	233:11, 233:20, 233:29, 234:5, 234:7,	113:1, 113:7, 113:29,
257:27, 258:2	116:10	tachograph [3] -	241:12, 243:2, 243:8,	114:25, 117:14,
superintendents [5]	suspicion [1] - 209:6	16:10, 16:15, 16:21	245:13, 245:21,	118:8, 119:23, 120:1,
- 9:6, 243:29, 244:1,	suspicions [2] -	tackle [1] - 214:15	246:29, 247:6,	122:21, 124:27,
256:12	38:29, 39:15	talks [1] - 100:21	247:11, 247:27,	125:12, 125:18,
supplemental [2] -	suspicious [1] -	tallying [1] - 177:23	248:16, 248:21,	127:5, 127:18,
252:25, 257:14	128:21	tangentially [1] -	248:28, 248:29,	127:23, 128:4, 129:2,
supplementary [1] -	sweets [1] - 182:11	73:24	249:7, 249:16, 256:4,	129:22, 131:27, 132:8, 132:12,
59:19	sympathised [1] -	Taoiseach [4] - 8:25,	256:18, 257:3,	· ·
supplied [1] - 6:21	100:5	13:1, 53:12, 239:27	257:27, 258:2	134:25, 135:7, 135:29, 148:11,
supply [1] - 98:7	system [20] - 8:27,	tape [1] - 49:14	TAYLOR [2] - 2:22,	148:12, 164:10,
support [7] - 9:21,	10:18, 14:20, 14:23,	tape-recording [1] -	4:6	200:23, 203:2,
24:19, 172:2, 172:15,	37:2, 37:10, 37:11,	49:14	Taylor's [21] - 78:17,	205:10, 206:6,
	37:21, 45:20, 46:3,	tapped [3] - 223:7,	80:4, 83:21, 96:19,	,
1		1	1	

116:12, 145:21, 246:16, 247:1, 248:1 third-last [1] - 86:8 **TERRACE** [1] - 4:4 third-party [1] -187:27, 190:16, terrible [2] - 131:2, 211:3 218:15, 221:6, 221:14, 221:16, 143:25 thirdly [1] - 134:15 territory [1] - 213:26 221:17, 221:19, thoughts [3] - 35:9, 221:21, 221:25, testimony [2] -250:19. 255:16 223:25, 225:9, 21:25, 213:12 threat [2] - 110:8, 227:16, 227:20, text [18] - 24:1, 110:20 227:22, 235:7, 24:13, 24:25, 24:26, threaten [1] - 195:1 239:23, 243:7, 249:4 25:24, 25:25, 27:26, threatened [1] -30:19, 33:16, 39:22, top [4] - 120:20, 191:6 207:5, 217:12, 217:18 106:21, 106:24, threatening [2] topic [2] - 22:26, 107:3, 107:9, 115:11, 44:8, 194:29 241.9 140:24, 203:10, 207:5 three [11] - 35:27, topics [2] - 89:20, texter [1] - 117:16 68:3, 68:7, 116:24, 136.7 texts [2] - 34:23, 116:29, 132:6, 134:4, torrential [1] -117:17 188:20, 203:10, 189:13 thanked [1] - 13:21 217:2, 218:17 total [2] - 69:19, that'd [1] - 131:2 throughout [2] -**THE** [21] - 1:4, 1:8, 181:11 32:11, 42:20 totally [5] - 76:25, 1:9, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6, thrown [2] - 105:20, 2:14, 3:25, 3:29, 4:1, 107:18 134:26, 145:5, 191:14, 195:9 4:2, 5:13, 6:1, 77:3, THUILLIER [1] - 3:10 towards [17] - 17:14, 101:3, 102:1, 199:24, Thursday [1] -22:9, 24:17, 104:23, 249:25 254:20 221:18 258:15 113:14, 149:23, ticketing [1] - 132:8 163:6, 163:12, themes [1] - 200:1 tickets [1] - 132:19 166:25, 175:1, THEN [2] - 254:20, TIM [1] - 3:27 175:16, 181:8, 258:15 time-line [2] - 114:8, 187:24, 209:1, then-167:27 210:13, 234:21, Commissioner [1] -**TIMES** [3] - 3:20, 4:1, 237:17 town [2] - 156:12, then-Deputy [3] timescale [1] -161:15 81:5, 105:24, 105:29 167:24 tracks [1] - 144:12 then-Garda [1] title [1] - 247:4 traction [1] - 132:13 219:14 TO [1] - 6:4 Tracy [1] - 15:6 theory [4] - 148:22, today [14] - 20:23, Traffic [1] - 110:4 148:24, 148:25, 111:6, 118:5, 177:12, traffic [6] - 16:18, 169:15 178:29, 197:15, 16:20, 99:16, 109:11, there'd [1] - 169:20 197:20, 198:6, 109:25, 169:28 there'll [1] - 211:28 200:27, 204:29, transaction [1] thereafter [2] - 57:4, 209:12, 215:14, 32.13 138:2 235:18, 246:21 transcript [14] - 1:26, therefore [9] - 10:2, together [12] - 29:22, 27:11, 40:8, 51:16, 26:29. 28:23. 29:17. 31:9, 35:6, 47:9, 33:26, 41:9, 61:27, 120:18, 130:19, 70:12, 201:6, 201:7, 170:15, 180:6, 155:4, 225:12 201:14. 201:22. 185:27, 218:11, thinking [4] - 34:25, 226:5, 253:16 220:1, 233:29, 95:18, 119:6, 140:3 tolerable [1] - 242:2 244:14, 258:12 thinks [2] - 171:7, tolerate [1] - 134:12 transcripts [1] -226:28 tolerated [1] - 46:25 232.25 THIRD [1] - 4:16 ton [2] - 160:18, transfer [3] - 99:16, third [20] - 11:8, 173:7 99:19, 129:12 40:29, 44:15, 45:28, tone [1] - 16:25 transferred [1] -48:7, 48:20, 49:26, tonight [1] - 140:16 64:20 53:13, 57:9, 80:29, took [35] - 7:8, 14:3, transgressed [1] -86:8, 87:28, 139:14, 17:17, 37:25, 40:27, 207:17 203:10, 207:29, 41:1, 47:10, 47:20, transmit [1] - 12:28 211:3, 211:14, 217:5, 71:18, 75:17, 104:18, transparent [1] -252:25 110:16, 116:10,

213:10 transpired [7] -22:14, 110:2, 113:7, 114:7, 178:22, 195:17, 197:3 Transport [2] -14:29, 15:8 traps [1] - 75:25 travel [3] - 41:10, 73:12, 161:15 travelling [1] -200:15 traversed [1] -213:26 trawling [1] - 45:20 treat [1] - 135:1 treated [3] - 63:24, 100:2, 244:19 trespass [1] - 141:10 trial [1] - 75:1 **TRIBUNAL**[3] - 1:3, 2:6, 258:15 **Tribunal** [109] - 7:5, 13:25, 21:14, 25:15, 26:12, 31:15, 35:29, 62:28, 66:19, 67:13, 68:8, 68:17, 69:13, 69:16, 70:20, 70:27, 71:19, 75:1, 77:10, 77:18, 87:25, 87:28, 88:14, 89:3, 98:24, 99:13, 100:13, 102:12, 102:16, 102:18, 102:24, 103:25, 104:2, 104:6, 104:9, 104:18, 105:16, 105:19, 106:20, 108:10, 113:1, 119:4, 119:8, 130:2, 135:15, 142:9, 160:21, 165:6, 171:24, 173:19, 174:23, 176:17, 177:16, 177:19, 178:1, 179:5, 180:1, 180:2. 180:11. 182:20, 183:20, 185:13, 185:22, 186:11, 187:12, 197:10, 198:24, 199:10, 200:12, 203:9, 204:16, 205:5, 205:26, 209:23, 210:20, 213:3, 213:18, 217:2. 217:11, 218:29, 219:1, 219:29, 227:13, 228:25, 231:7, 231:18, 231:23, 232:2,

232:17, 232:24, 234:14, 234:19, 241:16, 245:17, 245:20, 247:2, 247:4, 247:8, 247:29, 248:7, 248:17, 248:20, 249:14, 249:28, 251:17, 252:24, 252:26, 253:3 **Tribunal'** [1] - 210:5 Tribunal's [3] - 26:7, 165:3, 166:11 **TRIBUNALS** [1] - 1:9 tried [6] - 47:19, 100:18, 109:21, 109:28, 116:12, 212:4 trouble [7] - 7:8, 62:21, 228:25, 234:23, 239:2, 239:9, 239:12 true [19] - 17:3, 22:27, 29:3, 66:28, 67:24, 67:26, 95:12, 144:16, 144:17, 144:18, 163:20, 164:2, 185:4, 254:11, 254:29, 255:28 truly [2] - 129:6, 228:29 trumping [1] - 133:6 TRUST [1] - 4:2 $\pmb{\text{trusted}} \ [10] - 42:\!26,$ 75:10, 76:12, 176:26, 218:24, 219:18, 219:22, 219:26, 220:21, 225:21 truth [8] - 12:2, 68:9, 68:10, 128:13, 197:13, 248:15, 256:28, 256:29 truthfully [1] - 70:24 try [14] - 40:23, 87:19, 93:26, 109:24, 113:2, 129:15, 187:18, 187:26, 187:28, 194:15, 205:16, 205:19, 206:5, 234:12 trying [23] - 19:10, 24:12, 26:7, 26:13, 37:17, 45:14, 72:24, 75:14, 87:13, 87:18, 88:20, 96:5, 98:2, 98:6, 100:25, 114:1, 135:25, 136:22, 162:5, 187:6, 234:15, 237:14, 238:20 TUESDAY [3] - 1:18, 6:1, 258:15

Tuesday [2] - 35:4,

236:16 246:3, 252:20, 257:6, Unit [1] - 110:4 venue [1] - 188:9 U turn [8] - 81:11, unlawfully [1] -258:4, 258:8 veracity [1] - 196:20 175:28, 203:18, 169:22 **updated** [1] - 117:8 verbal [1] - 115:12 ultimately [4] -210:4, 214:2, 216:29, **upheld** [1] - 64:2 unless [5] - 21:19, verbatim [1] - 1:26 32:14, 88:13, 138:4, 220:4, 234:10 uphold [1] - 65:25 136:20, 173:17, verify [1] - 159:16 242:17 turned [8] - 151:18, 236:1, 257:17 **UPPER** [1] - 4:21 version [12] - 69:5, unattributed [2] -177:6, 177:7, 188:21, unlikely [1] - 155:10 upset [6] - 61:25, 69:7. 75:22. 151:5. 37:4, 38:29 223:8, 224:10, unnecessarily [1] -126:5, 128:2, 157:2, 160:29, 165:25, unavoidably[1] -224:11, 224:20 62:22 202:29, 241:25 165:27, 227:12, turning [3] - 185:20, 10:14 234:28, 234:29, 239:4 unprecedented [1] urgent [6] - 146:13, unaware [5] - 63:11, 223:18, 241:23 204:2 146:19, 146:23, versions [1] - 69:7 133:24, 137:29, turns [2] - 153:21, unreasonable [5] -150:25, 151:3, 151:22 vicinity [1] - 184:16 138:7, 138:11 201:25 50:23, 50:29, 51:5, urgently [1] - 36:29 view [57] - 7:6, 11:5, unconnected [1] tweet [4] - 147:15, 51:6, 244:9 useful [1] - 23:20 11:14, 18:7, 30:18, 133:3 147:17, 209:27, unrelated [1] usual [2] - 63:22, 30:19, 37:16, 41:1, uncooperative[1] -245:27 157:12 132.4 45:28, 62:6, 84:10, 56:4 tweeted [3] - 147:17, unspecific [1] utter [1] - 76:24 89:17, 89:22, 91:5, uncorrected [1] -209:22, 210:7 92:5, 92:17, 96:3, 248:10 utterance [1] - 97:20 62:20 tweets [1] - 209:18 UNTIL [1] - 258:15 utterances [1] -99:24, 104:23, uncovered[1] twenty [1] - 189:15 109:14, 113:12, untoward [1] -96:20 61.22 twice [2] - 190:27, 116:10, 119:26, 239:19 uttered [2] - 89:9, **UNDER** [2] - 1:3, 1:9 223:6 untrue [10] - 75:29, 121:26, 122:23, 233:25 under [22] - 16:2, two [54] - 19:13, 123:13, 123:25, 76:25, 112:19, 115:1, utterly [1] - 50:29 16:24, 17:8, 33:29, 125:4, 130:3, 130:8, 29:22, 31:9, 31:10, 115:3, 115:16, 145:5, 35:18, 46:2, 50:1, 130:9, 134:10, 35:25, 47:1, 56:18, 199:12, 224:11, V 50:7, 50:11, 51:22, 70:26, 78:15, 78:18, 224:21 134:14, 135:6, 51:23, 56:18, 86:14, 135:10, 136:5, 163:5, 78:19, 78:28, 83:20, unusual [5] - 154:17, 91:20, 93:20, 124:20, vague [4] - 80:5, 163:12, 165:7, 165:8, 90:9, 93:28, 94:24, 200:18, 200:22, 201:3 170:16, 187:8, 195:1, 82:22, 99:8, 248:10 165:10, 175:13, 96:5, 114:12, 117:5, **up** [84] - 12:12, 14:9, valuable [1] - 36:5 204:28, 211:7, 231:22 180:12, 183:3, 126:28, 127:18, 16:29, 23:20, 29:20, value [2] - 66:11, 127:25, 132:6, underlying [2] -184:25, 201:18, 29:26, 36:20, 37:24, 84:18, 191:26 116:12 206:29, 213:16, 135:14, 135:21, 43:1, 46:11, 53:13, undermining [1] -Varadkar [5] - 6:14, 213:19, 224:5, 143:29, 144:2, 58:29, 62:11, 63:22, 10:17 14:28, 15:5, 15:15, 228:24, 228:26, 148:22, 153:8, 66:23, 71:3, 71:12, 15:22 understandable [1] -157:25, 161:9, 235:29, 236:8, 75:4, 76:13, 76:22, 110:13 Varadkar's [1] -161:14, 161:27, 247:24, 256:10 76:24, 78:6, 78:11, 167:25, 170:13, understood [4] -34:26 viewers [1] - 134:8 79:7, 84:8, 100:29, 9:28, 29:2, 87:18, 176:7, 176:20, 102:14, 107:3, 107:5, variety [2] - 129:13, views [13] - 41:2, 188:20, 209:18, 236:16 107:16, 108:11, 186:7 41:29, 90:17, 92:4, 210:29, 211:12, undertaken [3] -113:1, 114:6, 120:19, various [19] - 17:5, 100:8, 138:3, 157:18, 48:23, 49:16, 86:19 57:9, 77:22, 78:22, 212:11. 218:29. 131:22, 132:6, 175:10, 175:12, 219:26, 224:6, 231:1, unequivocal [1] -79:2, 90:2, 117:18, 176:20, 179:8, 224:6, 133:10, 137:7, 231:22, 235:8, 239:3, 173:10 119:14, 123:14, 240:13 139:11, 139:18, 132:17, 174:13, 239:12, 240:22, unfair [6] - 35:14, vile [3] - 75:8, 229:28 151:5, 157:24, 247:14 180:23. 187:20. 75:29 95:20 96:2 158:13, 160:28, vilified [1] - 62:21 96:3, 113:29 189:27, 198:23, two-paragraph [1] -162:25, 165:11, vindicated [2] - 59:1, 202:29, 206:7, 218:29 unfairness [1] -166:24, 170:15, twofold [1] - 210:29 217:28, 232:26 128:6 170:18, 171:21, vindictiveness[1] unfolded [1] - 256:17 **VAUGHAN**[1] - 3:27 Twomey [7] -175:19, 175:29, 176:5, 177:1, 180:24, vehement [1] -157:24, 157:27, unfortunate [1] vis-à-vis [2] - 164:26, 183:2, 184:18, 158:6, 158:13, 32.27 107:27 257:20 vehemently[1] -161:17, 162:28, unfortunately [4] -185:26, 186:10, visit [8] - 46:6, 99:14, 172:19 189:14, 195:27, 87:8 32:25, 147:11, 142:27, 170:19, vehicle [9] - 145:20, **type** [14] - 72:10, 175:11, 256:25 204:3, 214:4, 215:23, 217:1, 241:23, 243:3, 234:17, 234:20, 145:25, 145:26, 74:15, 87:16, 109:27, unfounded [1] -256:20 157:20, 183:22, 235:10, 237:5, 146:12, 146:20, 50:27 visited [1] - 202:7 183:25, 195:10, unhappy [1] - 181:4 237:29, 239:3, 147:7, 149:5, 149:10, visitor [1] - 99:17 205:5, 212:22, unheaded [2] -241:10, 241:27, 168:28 visits [3] - 164:28, 233:17, 241:19, 243:3. 243:11. vehicles [1] - 169:25 33:10, 34:6 202:5, 202:15

243:26, 244:29,

unit [1] - 16:20

vendetta [1] - 163:29

vitally [1] - 97:19

247:9, 247:26

vocabulary [1] -234:2 volition [1] - 69:17 **volume** [7] - 7:21, 8:18, 22:16, 46:21, 49:7, 59:9, 206:4 Volume [23] - 34:11, 41:24, 49:8, 78:13, 79:8, 80:27, 83:10, 84:8, 85:2, 86:5, 87:26, 89:20, 89:28, 98:25, 98:27, 102:13, 106:24, 171:21, 203:3, 203:5, 203:6, 207:3, 218:6 volumes [1] - 46:28

W

wait [5] - 97:3, 98:12, 100:15, 120:18, 170:18 walked [4] - 134:1, 181:8, 216:14, 227:16 wall [1] - 59:2 WALL[1] - 2:28 WALLACE[1] - 4:25 Walsh [6] - 250:9, 250:22, 250:29, 251:4, 251:13, 253:13 wants [2] - 26:12, 167:1 ward [1] - 234:27 warning [1] - 43:3 WAS [9] - 77:3, 131:7, 142:1, 145:10, 170:10, 174:6, 199:27, 249:25, 254:20 waste [2] - 16:6, 26:7 watch [1] - 207:27 ways [3] - 37:27, 153:8. 240:6 weaknesses [2] -37:1, 37:20 wearing [1] - 148:25 weather [5] - 189:4, 189:10, 189:16, 189:20, 190:6 web [2] - 199:8, 199:11 week [2] - 129:11, 237.8 weekend [2] - 77:17, 144:10 weeks [2] - 17:11, 216:19 weighed [1] - 18:15

weight [1] - 203:28

weighty [1] - 254:2 well-known [2] -29:1, 41:2 whatsoever [7] -40:3, 74:20, 143:28, 168:11, 189:1, 216:27, 257:8 wheel [2] - 196:17, 196:19 WHELAN [1] - 2:16 whereas [2] - 88:19, 124:23 whereby [1] - 149:18

124:23 whereby [1] - 149:18 whichever [1] - 67:5 whilst [2] - 78:20, 242:20

whistleblower [8] -24:28, 51:24, 52:23, 53:6, 183:17, 183:29, 184:1, 184:3 whistleblowers [8] -

42:4, 135:21, 155:26, 176:3, 176:11, 180:27, 224:4, 224:5 **whistleblowing** [2] - 43:19, 54:28 **white** [1] - 120:25 **whole** [2] - 22:75

whole [9] - 23:25, 29:23, 52:9, 113:8, 143:26, 194:17, 204:22, 207:29, 255:24

wholly [3] - 27:27, 56:5, 250:9 wife [7] - 148:20, 148:21, 153:22, 154:4, 156:5, 201:26, 201:27

Williams [2] -116:22, 117:26 WILLIAMS [1] - 3:5 willing [2] - 35:16, 66:25

Wilson [26] - 6:26, 40:12, 47:15, 135:22, 139:16, 172:2, 172:15, 172:24, 181:19, 181:24, 182:4, 182:5, 182:6, 182:13, 182:29, 183:17, 184:2, 184:4, 184:6, 184:13,

184:25, 185:6, 185:15, 216:25, 232:16, 232:29 wiped [2] - 210:2, 210:11 wish [9] - 69:9, 74:1,

77:8, 79:16, 83:28, 130:21, 140:28, 250:4 wished [8] - 56:9, 65:7, 66:20, 83:8, 115:24, 128:10, 139:24, 140:17 wishes [3] - 79:28, 80:13, 121:29 wishing [1] - 106:27 witch [1] - 255:26 withdraw [2] - 144:5,

withdrawn [4] - 60:11, 60:13, 62:28, 115:9

144.11

withheld [1] - 30:13 witness [7] - 13:20, 31:5, 130:28, 166:19, 166:23, 201:10, 209:23

WITNESS [4] - 5:2, 77:3, 249:25, 254:20 witness's [1] - 70:22 witness-box [2] -130:28, 201:10

130:28, 201:10 witnessed [2] -97:20, 221:8

witnesses [6] -69:15, 70:26, 119:7, 165:4, 198:24, 249:27 woes [1] - 110:25

woman [1] - 215:22 wonder [4] - 33:5, 69:25, 127:18, 186:6

wondering [4] - 127:20, 127:29, 160:27, 162:18 word [4] - 55:20,

139:26, 149:1, 180:25 worded [1] - 218:26 wording [7] - 23:6,

wording [/] - 23.0, 23:7, 23:8, 25:17, 26:15, 140:24, 186:28 words [23] - 18:26, 19:7, 21:8, 21:10,

21:13, 21:21, 22:28, 24:17, 35:1, 44:4, 49:15, 89:9, 115:20, 138:9, 172:27, 186:20, 186:25

186:20, 186:25, 220:23, 228:9, 230:14, 231:5, 231:10

workable [1] -194:17 world [2] - 39:1,

182:9 worn [1] - 203:28 worst [2] - 19:5,

write [6] - 57:15, 61:16, 81:26, 86:4, 102:27, 173:19 writes [4] - 83:9, 84:29, 89:16 writing [5] - 23:4, 27:19, 57:6, 61:5,

89:4 written [14] - 11:22, 11:27, 35:11, 77:25, 86:26, 104:3, 132:24, 144:14, 144:16, 196:16, 209:5, 224:6, 235:47, 255:5

235:17, 255:5 wrongdoing [17] -40:26, 41:9, 44:13, 45:24, 45:25, 46:24, 46:27, 57:11, 207:1, 207:11, 207:14, 207:24, 207:28, 208:21, 247:9, 247:26, 249:15

wrongful [1] - 171:27 wrongfully [1] -45:28

wrote [6] - 24:28, 27:5, 143:29, 171:4, 196:18, 212:28

Υ

year [8] - 14:21, 112:13. 131:23. 205:12, 207:17, 231:21, 252:2 years [13] - 43:1, 65:12, 75:23, 94:4, 142:16, 143:29, 155:13, 162:3, 167:25, 183:9, 189:16, 218:17, 240:23 yesterday [25] - 19:3, 35:6, 42:14, 59:7, 62:16, 74:22, 106:23, 117:7, 117:21, 142:9, 174:15, 177:13, 178:8, 179:1, 180:19, 181:15, 185:25, 190:1, 195:17, 208:28, 235:14, 235:19, 238:1, 244:5, 244:23 young [2] - 57:10, 133:29 yourself [20] - 16:9, 21:16, 21:25, 64:6, 64:27, 94:28, 97:20, 98:14, 104:7, 106:15, 109:24, 119:13, 129:18, 139:2, 149:4, 150:20, 171:2,

171:13, 182:23, 250:9

yourselves [1] - 251:12

É

ÉIREANN [2] - 1:5, 1:6

Ó

Ó [9] - 2:27, 5:7, 141:25, 142:2, 142:4, 143:15, 144:29, 145:6