TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON WEDNESDAY, 16TH OCTOBER 2019 - DAY 101

101

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PHILIP BARNES

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR.

DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC PATRICK MARRINAN SC SINÉAD McGRATH BL JOHN DAVIS, SOLICITOR MR. MS.

MR.

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET

INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY

SOLI CI TORS HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMI THFI ELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY

& GARDA DAVID TÜRNER:

INSTRUCTED BY:

R: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC MR. JAMES KANE BL MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS 13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURDAY 12. 13. SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT AI DAN MI NNOCK 14. 15. SUPERINTENDENT AIDAN MINNOCK
INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
MONICA CARR. HEAD OF DIRECTORATE. HUMAN RESOURCES AI 17. 18. 19. 20. 21. 22. 23. 24. 25. 26. 27. MONI CA CARR, H PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT 28. MR. BRI AN SAVA HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND MR. BRIAN SAVAGE
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O'REARDON
INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN 30. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MICHAEL FLYNN 33. 34.

SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN ã5. 36. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 37.

SHANE MURPHY SC MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC MR. MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC

CONOR DIGNAM SC

DONAL MCGUINNESS BL

SHELLEY HORAN BL

KATE EGAN BL

ALISON MORRISSEY

EMMA GRIFFIN

FE STATE SOLLOLTOR'S MR. MR. MS. MS. MS.

INSTRUCTED BY: MS.

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL MR. PAUL CONNELLAN T&N MCLYNN FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

BASTION COURT 11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR.

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. SINÉAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

I NDEX

WI TNESS	PAGE
GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH	
OUESTTONED BY MD MCCUTNNESS	6

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON WEDNESDAY, 16TH	
2			OCTOBER 2019:	
3				
4			CHAIRMAN: Morning. Now, Mr. McGuinness.	
5			MR. McGUINNESS: Good morning, Chairman. Garda Keogh,	10:32
6			please.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
8				
9			GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH CONTINUED TO BE QUESTIONED BY	
10			MR. MCGUINNESS, AS FOLLOWS:	10:32
11				
12			CHAIRMAN: Morning.	
13	1	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Good morning, Garda Keogh?	
14		Α.	Good morning.	
15	2	Q.	Yesterday, when the Tribunal rose, you had made	10:32
16			reference to a document in the Tribunal papers that you	
17			have noted?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	3	Q.	I think you immediately found your note and you	
20			immediately brought it to our attention?	10:32
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	4	Q.	It related to	
23			CHAIRMAN: Just a bit closer to the microphone I think,	
24			Mr. McGuinness.	
25			MR. McGUINNESS: Me, is it? Sorry.	10:32
26			CHAIRMAN: No, it's all right. I am just checking that	
27			people can hear what you say.	
28			MR. McGUINNESS: sorry, Chairman.	
29	5	Q.	Yes, you immediately brought that to our attention and	

T	that refated to page 2185 of our papers, which was in
2	Volume 8. In your evidence yesterday, at page 145 of
3	the transcript, you said:
4	
5	"I see that Superintendent Murray is in contact with
6	Chief Superintendent Scanlan from the Laois-Offaly
7	division in relation to my car tax, not through my own
8	chief. He veers off to the chief of the Laois-Offaly
9	division in relation to my car tax. And then of course
10	as it transpires, I have explained the targeting."
11	
12	You may recall I had just asked you about what you were
13	saying about that contact. And you say:
14	
15	"He's in contact with Chief Superintendent Scanlan in 10:
16	relation to car tax."
17	
18	This is back in 2015. And you go on to say:
19	
20	"Well, I don't know what was said, but it's only in the
21	notes it caught my eye. But, you know, again, why
22	would a superintendent from one division contact a
23	chief superintendent from another division about where
24	a guard, not that they had no tax, but just had it in a
25	different tax bracket category. That is a really kind
26	of minor thing."
27	
28	I ask:
29	

1			"Q. What document are you referring to particularly?	
2			A. I think it's written down, if I can look for it, if	
3			you want."	
4				
5			You said you had a note of it somewhere and then	10:34
6			provided us with that reference.	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	6	Q.	Just to inform you, that's at page 2185, which is on	
9			the screen there. I think that's the note you are	
10			referring to, in particular the middle entry?	10:34
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	7	Q.	We provided that note to your solicitor and counsel	
13			just now. I have no objection if they want to hand	
14			that?	
15			MR. KELLY: Chairman, I thought before we raised this	10:35
16			issue that I would have a chance to look at it.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18			MR. KELLY: And an opportunity to speak to Garda Keogh	
19			about it.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	10:35
21			MR. KELLY: I would like to avail of that opportunity.	
22			CHAIRMAN: That seems perfectly reasonable,	
23			Mr. McGuinness, does it?	
24			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. I don't want to take anyone	
25			short. Perhaps we will take five minutes, Chairman.	10:35
26			CHAIRMAN: Would you like five minutes at this point?	
27			Is it convenient to have it at this point? You seem to	
28			be indicating you would prefer to do it at this point,	
29			Mr. Kelly. is that correct?	

1			MR. KELLY: I would.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
3			MR. KELLY: Since the matter has now been raised, I	
4			want to deal with it now.	
5			CHAIRMAN: This is on this particular issues, so that	
6			it will give us an opportunity then of closing off this	
7			particular issue by reference to this. That's really	
8			the only remaining matter, is that right?	
9			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Okay, that seems very convenient. What will	
11			I say? 10:50? Let's say not before 10:50, so 15	
12			minutes, let me know if you need further.	
13			Mr. McGuinness, keep in touch, let me know, let	
14			Mr. Barnes know if you need longer.	
15			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, Chairman. That's probably my	10:36
16			fault, I should have	
17			CHAIRMAN: No, no, sorry, there is no question of	
18			fault, we will sort it out, that's not a problem for	
19			anyone. Thanks very much.	
20				10:36
21			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED, AS	
22			FOLLOWS:	
23				
24	8	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you, Garda Keogh. I think you	
25			have seen the original of that document we were looking	10:5
26			at unredacted?	
27		Α.	Yes, I did.	
28	9	0.	I am not going to mention the name, because it seems to	

be --

29

Т		Α.	i understand. I suppose, i accept that point two is	
2			not related to me. The reason it jumped off the page,	
3			point 1 is in relation to me, point 3 is related to me	
4			and point 2 is a conversation with a former	
5			superintendent of mine, but I accept point two is not	10:51
6			relating to me.	
7	10	Q.	Yes. No, I can accept obviously that in the setting it	
8			looked as if it might relate to you and it's	
9			appropriate to enquire whether it did or not?	
10		Α.	Yes.	10:52
11	11	Q.	So, I think we will leave that issue. The Chairman	
12			yesterday obviously mentioned that this issue of the	
13			car tax was related, interrelated with the payment or	
14			the delay in payment of your subsistence, travelling	
15			expenses, which is Issue 14. That's one of the issues	10:52
16			that you complain about. So I was going to move on to	
17			that, to finish off that, if that is convenient. I	
18			have told my Friend I was going to do that.	
19				
20			I think this related to a complaint that you made in	10:52
21			relation to the delay of travel expenses related to	
22			four particular dates; 18th June 2014, which was the	
23			occasion I think of one of your appointments with	
24			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy; 14th July of 2014, I	
25			think that was a visit to Judge McMahon; 30th July	10:52
26			2014, which was I think an appointment with Deputy Daly	
27			and Wallace, I think you noted that in your diary as a	
28			Section 62 issue?	

Α.

Yes.

1 The fourth one was I think an appointment I think with 12 Q. 2 Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin on 13th August 2014. 3 All of those claims are contained in Volume 4, at pages 728 to 742. I don't need to look at them. You 4 5 submitted those in an original form. I think you 10:53 6 weren't able to recall who you had submitted them to at 7 the time? I would have submitted them through the normal 8 Α. channels, as I would have always done. 9 10 13 Q. Yes. 10:53 11 And as I said, it was never an issue ever before. Α. 12 14 Yes. Ο. These appeared to go missing. 13 Α. 14 15 Q. Yes. 15 Then I had to, I think roughly a year later or some Α. 10:54 16 months later, I have to resubmit them and I write "resubmissions" on the second batch. 17 18 16 Yes, that is obviously correct in that regard. Q.

terms of the procedure for processing them, Inspector

Minnock, I think Superintendent Minnock now, describes

10.54

the procedures at page 680 to 682 of this statement. I 22 don't intend to open it, but you have probably seen it. 23 He describes it, certainly up to a certain stage, as an 24 entirely manual process. Normally a quard seeks 25 approval if they are using a private car in advance. The expenses incurred are then claimed for on a 26 prescribed claim form. It's submitted, verified, 27 28 checked and goes on up the system in a particular way,

19

20

21

29

arriving into the finance office. Then it's sent, if

- it's found to be correct, put on the oracle system and
- is scheduled for payment then in Killarney, isn't that
- 3 correct?
- 4 A. Yes, yes. Now in relation to the seeking for approval.
- 5 17 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. That's something that in general has become, let's say,

10:55

10:56

10:56

- 7 tighter in years. I would never normally over the
- 8 years, nor did anyone, it's just you would hand in,
- 9 send forward the sub claims and that was it. It would
- 10 usually be something like travelling to court or
- 11 something like that.
- 12 18 Q. Yes. But obviously reference has been made to a
- 13 Directive of 2009, to ensure that only travel that's
- 14 absolutely necessary be undertaken and that claims for
- travelling expenses be closely monitored as well?
- 16 A. Yeah. As I said, it was more liberal, that's probably
- 17 correct.
- 18 19 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. Yeah.
- 20 20 Q. Superintendent McBrien, you will recall or heard of a
- 21 discussion yesterday, she refers to having discussed
- the matter in September with Cathriona Quirke and she
- requested the finance officer to produce a sample list
- of members who claim travel and subsistence expenses
- 25 for the purpose of an audit, did you see that?
- 26 A. Yeah, I have read something there.
- 27 21 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. Yeah, I read it somewhere, yeah.
- 29 22 Q. Yes. She describes this at page 842 and 843 of her

statement	and	she	said:

3

4

5

6

1

"During these checks it was identified there was an issue with Garda Keogh's travel expenses. I advised that Garda Keogh's outstanding claims be withheld until 10:57 I investigated this matter."

7

8

9

You accept her assertion that she was responsible for that?

- The difficulty just with this particular thing, because 10:57 10 Α. 11 I'm already aware that it was Detective Superintendent Mulcahy instigated this, let's say, at the very start, 12 13 but unfortunately he would have been on the 14 investigation team, so investigating into my 15 complaints. I mean, look, I would also say that is 10:57 16 targeting from the very start. But having said that, 17 in time myself and Detective Superintendent Mulcahy at 18 the start don't -- there's mistrust there, but as 19 things move on we build up trust. But that is how I 20 understand it, the car tax emanates from that. 10:58 think, and I could be corrected, that in order to veer 21 22 into my car tax, he used the sub claims as a 23 smokescreen, kind of as an excuse to go in to look at 24 the car tax.
- 25 23 Q. Well, Superintendent McBrien has sort of clearly
 26 identified in her statement that she did direct this
 27 audit, there was a list prepared. It's exhibited as
 28 M McB 7, at pages 1112 to 1128, which was the printouts
 29 of all the checks done in relation to, not just yours

Т			but other members?	
2		Α.	There is a difference. My car was checked first. It	
3			was checked by Garda Gerry white in the district	
4			office. And in the explanation it had clearly "called	
5			to super's office". He was the district clerk in the	10:59
6			superintendent's office. When Superintendent McBrien	
7			made checks, my car again, with the other cars, it's to	
8			do with audit in Athlone. So it's slightly different	
9			to everyone else's.	
10	24	Q.	It would appear that whatever happened those original	10:59
11			claim forms, they were processed. You brought this to	
12			I think Sergeant Minnock's attention at one particular	
13			stage, but in the interim you have resubmitted the	
14			claims, isn't that correct?	
15		Α.	Yes.	10:59
16	25	Q.	What Sergeant Minnock says was that in early 2015 you	
17			received a minute from Garda Keogh querying a delay in	
18			paying his claims. That's at page 722 of the papers.	
19			You have seen this?	
20		Α.	I am aware of that.	11:00
21	26	Q.	Yes. He says, at page 681 and 682 of the Tribunal	
22			papers, that:	
23				
24			"Having conducted enquiries into Garda Keogh's claims,	
25			the finance officer reported to me that claims were not	11:00
26			with her for processing on the oracle system of making	
27			payment. The finance officer prepared a minute for	
28			him, a copy of which is appended at ANS3. The finance	
29			officer advised that Garda Keogh submitted claims on	

1			the 11th December 2014 and they were returned by	
2			Inspector Farrell for further attention."	
3				
4			Is that correct?	
5		Α.	I'm not sure, because I have submitted to the Tribunal	11:01
6			a handwritten document from Ms. Quirke, who, as I said,	
7			deceased now and she in her note to me said she never	
8			received handed in to the Tribunal, she never	
9			received those subsistence claims.	
10	27	Q.	But did you not become aware that they had to be	11:01
11			reprocessed by you to include the cost of public	
12			transport? Is that not a requirement to see whether	
13			that was an alternative?	
14		Α.	That part is true, but that's a general thing.	
15	28	Q.	Yes.	11:01
16		Α.	To compare which is the cheapest option private or	
17			public.	
18	29	Q.	Yes.	
19		Α.	Whichever is the cheapest. Generally that's the one	
20			that will be paid. My point is, Ms. Quirke informed me	11:02
21			herself and has a written note that she didn't receive	
22			any of this. So I think this is just a smokescreen in	
23			relation to a reason to go in. I really never got to	
24			the bottom as to who the person was who called the	
25			superintendent's office on the day my car was checked	11:02
26			by Garda Gerry white.	
27	30	Q.	Yes. But the finance officer, Ms. Quirke, she was able	
28			to tell you that the claims hadn't been submitted to	
29			her?	

- 1 A. Oh yeah.
- 2 31 Q. And had not been processed on the oracle payment system?
- 4 A. From my recollection, she knew nothing about that.
- 5 32 Q. Yes. That was in December. Is that not the reason why 11:02 you resubmitted the claims at that point in time?

11 · 03

11:03

11:04

- 7 A. The fact that she was the finance officer, when I was 8 asking and writing to her about, you know, is there a 9 problem with these claims, is there a problem. She
- said she knows something about them. As I said, I

 never had an issue with issuing claims before, and my
- 12 car was taxed the same way and a previous car was
- 13 exactly the same. So that we're talking about a number
- of years with a similar issue, and it was never an
- issue like before with anything like this.
- 16 33 Q. But did you not learn that also Sergeant Haran had to re-sign the claim forms as well?
- 18 A. Some sergeant would have to sign the claim forms.
- 19 34 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. So my claim forms, I would imagine, would have to be
- 21 signed twice, because the original ones I submitted
- ones went missing and then there's the resubmitted
- ones. So they would have both have to have been
- 24 countersigned.
- 25 35 Q. Superintendent McBrien returned them for signature and
- 26 certification by Sergeant Haran and also required
- 27 certification by you of the cost of public transport
- 28 expense?
- 29 A. Okay. I presume we're talking about -- are we talking

- about this second set of sub forms?
- 2 36 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 37 Q. The first set were never sent back to you with any

11 · 04

11:05

- 5 query, isn't that correct?
- 6 A. As I said, they just go missing.
- 7 38 Q. Yeah.
- 8 A. It's years later, when I am reading the Tribunal
- 9 documents, they just reappear.
- 10 39 Q. Yes. Superintendent McBrien says that she met
- 11 Superintendent Murray on the 4th March. She has her
- notes of that at page 1731. That she informed him of
- the situation regarding the car tax and she arranged
- 14 with him that she would forward the resubmitted claims
- to Inspector Minnock and that Inspector Minnock would
- discuss the claims with Superintendent Murray. Are you
- 17 aware that he did that?
- 18 A. I would accept that. But again, could someone, at this
- point, if I'm driving around now for a year, where they
- 20 know there's an issue with the car tax, which I clearly 11:05
- 21 have said I didn't even contemplate the thing with the
- commercial -- as I said, I knew the car would be the
- first thing they'd look at, because I distinctly
- remember having the tyres and everything correct on the
- 25 car. But -- sorry I have lost my --
- 26 40 Q. Yes. Well, perhaps we will just look at what
- 27 Superintendent Minnock, Inspector Minnock as he was at
- the time, stated on page 682 of the papers. He says
- there on the second paragraph:

1				
2			"On 4th March 2015 I received a file from	
3			Superintendent McBrien regarding claims submitted by	
4			Garda Keogh. Superintendent McBrien file stated that	
5			she had addressed the matter with the new incoming	11:06
6			chief Superintendent Murray, that he would discuss the	
7			matter with me following his arrival. I attach the	
8			minute as AMS4."	
9				
10			That shows that the file claims re-signed by Sergeant	11:06
11			Haran and the certification by you of the public	
12			expense, would you agree with that?	
13		Α.	I would. But again, common sense here: They knew	
14			there is a problem with the car tax, I didn't about it,	
15			but I am writing in to Ms. Quirke, you know, is there a	11:07
16			problem?	
17	41	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	Wouldn't the handiest thing and they let me drive	
19			around with the car in the incorrect tax bracket for	
20			about a year. Wouldn't the handiest thing for someone	11:07
21			to just say to me at the start, Nick, there's a problem	
22			with your car tax, will you just go and get it sorted?	
23	42	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	That would have saved all this.	
25	43	Q.	Just going down that page, scrolling down a little bit.	11:07
26			This is what Superintendent Minnock says he did:	
27				
28			"I relayed this information to Chief Superintendent	
29			Murray and discussed the matter with him briefly.	

1 Chief Superintendent Murray appeared anxious to deal 2 appropriately, swiftly and fairly with the matter. The 3 following week I was going on a course, so I asked 4 Ms. McKenny to CC Superintendent Murray on the reply 5 e-mail. Superintendent Murray Later advised me that 11:08 6 the Garda Keogh was asked to regularise the tax 7 classification of his vehicle. I am aware his claims were paid and he received a Regulation 10 of Garda 8 Síochána from disciplinary regulation 2007, for using a 9 vehicle which was incorrectly taxed. 10 11 . 08 11 consistent with matters of this nature coming to the 12 attention of district management team and to my 13 attenti on. " 14 15 We have already looked at Superintendent Murray note of 11:08 16 his discussion with you on the 26th February, where he made it clear that he would deal with the claims once 17 18 the tax was dealt with and he did that, isn't that 19 correct? 20 But he did that after he had been on to He did that. Α. 11:08 the motor tax office looking for declarations, and if 21 22 they got declarations there they would have done me for 23 fraud. 24 44 Well --Q. 25 On something that they could have very easily cleared Α. 11:08 up a long time ago. 26

and taxation position with regard to --

27

28

29

45

Q.

well, he directed Inspector Minnock to contact the

county council to get the details of the registration

1	Α.	And g	get declar	ations.	I	am	pretty	sure,	Ι	think	there
2		was s	something	about de	ecla	rat	ions.				

11 · 10

- 3 46 Q. Well, it came back from the county council with no declaration made by you, isn't that correct?
- 5 A. That's just from what I remember, yeah.

6 47 Q. Yes.

- 7 That's my point, that they could have got -- this is Α. 8 probably why they were holding on. You know, it was a very simple thing, that they could have just said, 9 listen, sort it out, end of story. But, you know, they 11:09 10 11 go looking, digging for declarations here on this. 12 course, as I said, I am not the only person that had a 13 problem with, let's say, the car, my car in the 14 station. And mine was a very minute thing. 15 that it wasn't taxed, it was just in a different 11:09 16 bracket.
- 17 48 Q. Yes. Well, perhaps we will look then at the notes of
 18 Chief Murray at 2042 and 2043. This is the statement
 19 here, where, towards the bottom of the page -- well,
 20 perhaps we should start maybe in the middle of the top: 11:10

2122

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

"The primary objectivity of the meeting insofar as I was concerned was to discuss with Garda Keogh a file left for me by my predecessor Superintendent Noreen McBrien relating to financial claims Garda Keogh made in 2014 for travelling expenses involving the use of his personal jeep for travel to and from Galway. My predecessor had explained to me that on 4th March 2015 she had been informed by Detective Superintendent

1			Mulcahy that Garda Keogh's private vehicle was not	
2			correctly taxed. She felt his claims for travelling	
3			expenses were in breach of financial code regulations	
4			and could not therefore be paid in those circumstances.	
5			She made me aware that Garda Keogh had been querying	11:11
6			the nonpayment of his claims in writing, but that no	
7			one had spoken to him about the matter."	
8				
9			I think that is correct?	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:11
11	49	Q.		
12			"From my perspective, Garda Keogh and I had an amicable	
13			conversation and he told me about his career and time	
14			in Bray. He reminded that we met before in court when	
15			he was a garda in Bray and I and inspector in Wicklow	11:11
16			but I unfortunately had no recollection of the meeting.	
17				
18			I discussed his sickness record with him and his ad hoc	
19			appearances at work. He explained in a vague way the	
20			investigation that he was part of and the fact that he	11:11
21			didn't like to be at work when certain people were	
22			there. It's a cause of stress to him, resulting in his	
23			si ckness. "	
24				
25			He goes on about that. Then he say:	11:12
26				
27			"I spoke to him about his car tax, he got slightly	
28			annoyed and he felt people were getting at him. I	
29			showed him the results of enquiries I had Inspector	

1			Minnock made at a tax office and told him they were in	
2			relation to jeep, it showed it was taxed in wrong	
3			category, commercial instead of private, resulting in a	
4			loss of revenue to the State. I spoke about the effect	
5			on his claims for travel expenses.	11:12
6				
7			I offered a solution to deal with the matter, which was	
8			that he would correct his tax, pay arrears to cover the	
9			period of the travelling claims and when he showed me	
10			proof of same, I would approve his travel claimsI	11:12
11			explained that would conclude the matter and it would	
12			never be mentioned again. He agreed to that course of	
13			action."	
14				
15			We discussed what you did then yesterday on foot of	11:12
16			that. He approved the claims on the same day or	
17			thereabouts, isn't that right?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	50	Q.	Once you produced the documents. And you were paid	
20			those monies then; isn't that correct?	11:13
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	51	Q.	He then reported the matter to the chief	
23			superintendent. If we look at page 2194 and 2195.	
24			It's described there. He signed off on it. We have	
25			seen the letter at 2195 of the 7th April. He describes	11:14
26			how he had approved the claims for payment on page 2	
27			there, 2196. All of the documentation relating to the	
28			claims then are in the papers up to page 2217. I don't	
29			know whether you have looked at them there, but 2205,	

Τ			which is the note left by Superintendent McBrien. It's	
2			endorsed by Superintendent McBrien there. To the	
3			finance officer:	
4				
5			"Attached forms are approved for payment. Do you mind	11:15
6			noting a copy of this file for me please."	
7				
8			Is that right? Page 2206 is the form that was sent	
9			back to you, through Sergeant Baker and Sergeant Haran	
10			and you submitted:	11:15
11				
12			"Amended as requested."	
13				
14			In January, is that right?	
15		Α.	Yes.	11:15
16	52	Q.	2207 is the direction earlier given by Superintendent	
17			McBrien that that should be done and provide the cost	
18			of public transport.	
19				
20			Insofar as Superintendent Murray's position is	11:15
21			concerned, wouldn't it be fair to say that he did deal	
22			with the matter swiftly and fairly and ensured that	
23			this issue was put to bed and you were paid the claims	
24			that you were entitled?	
25		Α.	The word swiftly is look, perhaps, a bit too	11:16
26			swiftly. Because, as I said, he says the first day I	
27			meet him, there's an issue with your car tax, get it	
28			sorted. And I did, the very next day. He never	
29			mentioned anything about discipline. I, of course, had	

1			never been disciplined before. It was the next day, or	
2			the next day I meet him that he disciplines me. That's	
3			on, if I am correct, the 3rd April 2015 he disciplines	
4			me for the first time on the car tax. And	
5			interestingly, that's the same date there's a series of	11:16
6			text messages between him to Chief Superintendent	
7			Scanlan to Nóirín O'Sullivan and back from Nóirín	
8			O'Sullivan to Chief Superintendent Scanlan to Pat	
9			Murray. I have seen the contacts, it doesn't say what	
10			was in the text messages of course, but on that	11:17
11			particular day.	
12	53	Q.	You don't know what being texted about?	
13		Α.	Look, it could have been whether the fact that I	
14			know Nóirín O'Sullivan (Inaudible), this is my first	
15			discipline tax matter. There is a lot of stuff going	11:17
16			politically at the time to do with whistleblowers.	
17			Forgive me for thinking that it was quite possible they	
18			could have been texting in relation to me.	
19	54	Q.	That's obviously speculation on your part?	
20		Α.	Unfortunately, I can't get to read text messages.	11:17
21	55	Q.	Yes.	
22		Α.	And just again for clarification, when the text	
23			messages were handed in to the Tribunal, the gardaí	
24			didn't twig that, they didn't spot it. It was spotted,	
25			of course, ultimately in the end. But they're here,	11:18
26			they're somewhere in the Tribunal safe, I understand.	
27	56	Q.	Text messages?	
28		Α.	No, not the text messages. As I said, the text	
29			messages are it just shows that there was text	

1			messages sent, received on two three between	
2			Superintendent Murray, Chief Superintendent Scanlan and	
3			then Chief Superintendent Scanlan to Commissioner	
4			O'Sullivan and the very same back with Commissioner	
5			O'Sullivan to Chief Superintendent Scanlan to Murray on	11:18
6			that day. What's interesting as well, in those, the	
7			billing records that I got you, there's no other series	
8			or pattern of text messages anywhere else between them	
9			in the records that I viewed. It just happens to be on	
10			that day, 3rd April 2015, the day I have to be	11:19
11			disciplined over this tax matter.	
12	57	Q.	Have you any evidence to suggest that anyone else was	
13			consulted about your discipline?	
14		Α.	Well, I don't know. In relation to that, as I said,	
15			those records are here.	11:19
16	58	Q.	In any event, the origin of it, in a sense, related to	
17			your own car and the taxation regime that it was in. I	
18			mean, you can't suggest that that was in any way	
19			created by any of the officers concerned or that they	
20			weren't entitled to have regard to it in considering	11:20
21			whether expenses payment should be claimed or certified	
22			or actually be paid. These are all legitimate issues	
23			within the scope of the expenses regime?	
24		Α.	Like, if I had known I was going to be disciplined in	
25			relation to that, I probably would have challenged it.	11:20
26	59	Q.	Well, that's as may be. I was going to pass on from	
27			that and go back to the sequence of events then of your	
28			other complaints. It does relate to another	

disciplinary investigation. This is Issue number 7,

1			the disciplinary investigation in relation to Garda	
2			Keogh in July 2015. You recall what that relates to?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	60	Q.	At pages 135 to 136 of your statement, your original	
5			statement to the Tribunal, you say:	11:21
6				
7			"There was an issue of a mix-up about my signing off	
8			sick and then not reporting for duty."	
9				
10			You say:	11:21
11				
12			"I had apparently rung in off sick. I was on the	
13			contrary sick. It was at most a mistake. The medical	
14			certificate materialised retrospectively to certify my	
15			sickness during the period. In any case, this	11:21
16			medically certified absence was irrationally turned by	
17			Superintendent Murray into a charge of being absent	
18			without leave."	
19				
20			I think this commenced with a message or a call to your	11:21
21			unit sergeant at the time, a report made to Sergeant	
22			Moylan, isn't that correct?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	61	Q.	If we perhaps look at that, at page 607. He was your	
25			unit sergeant at the time. If we just scroll down the	11:22
26			page. He says:	
27				
28			"I was Garda Keogh's unit sergeant at the time of his	
29			sick report on 9th July 2015 and subsequent call to	

1	report off sick on 10th July 2015. However, I was on	
2	annual leave on the 10th and 11th July and rested the	
3	12th July. I returned to work on Monday, the 13th	
4	July, when I became aware that Garda Keogh had not	
5	shown up for duty on the previous two days. I tried to	11:22
6	call him to no avail. I subsequently reported his	
7	absence to the district officer, Athlone, and	
8	Superintendent Murray by e-mail.	
9		
10	The e-mail was sent to the district office inbox at	11:23
11	3:15 on 14th July 2015 and was as follows:	
12	"Superintendent, I'm not sure if you are aware that	
13	Nick Keogh has not been in work all weekend. He went	
14	sick last Thursday and Friday, reported fit for duty on	
15	Friday night but has not attended yet. I was on leave	11:23
16	on Saturday and it appears he did not appear into work	
17	on that night. He was not on Leave on Sunday or Monday	
18	night either and did not turn up for work. I have	
19	tried calling him but he is not answering or returning	
20	my calls.	11:23
21		
22	Just said I'd let you know. I meant to say it earlier	
23	as wasn't sure if you knew. It appears from others	
24	that he has "broken out" and is drinking in Tullamore."	
25		11:23
26	Then he details a Facebook message that he got from you	
27	at 00:29:	
28		
29	"Sorry about this week, Cormac, I missed your call and	

1 didn't have credit to call you back. 2 3 I did not acknowledge this message." 4 5 Just in terms of procedure, when you are off and sick, is it normal procedure to ring in and say, I'm now 6 7 better, that is off sick and, I will be back in for 8 duty? 9 Yes. Α. So it would appear then that you obviously knew you 10 62 Q. 11:24 11 were meant to be in duty then on the 9th -12 Yes. Α. 13 - 10th, 11th, 12th. The four days or so that we're 63 Q. 14 talking about? 15 Yes. Α. 11:24 16 I think you noted that in your diary yourself, isn't 64 Q. 17 that right? 18 Yes. Α. 19 65 Perhaps we will just look at Volume 47, page 13319. Q. 20 13319, I beg your pardon. Just while we are waiting 11:25 21 for that to come up, to get to the consequence of it 22 for you. You were, indeed, disciplined and you were find €300 I think? 23 24 They tried to discipline me on two breaches and Α. 25 on one of them I pleaded not guilty and on the other 11:26 one I pleading guilty and I was find €300. 26 27 66 Yes. You sought to review that by way of an appeal? Q. 28 Correct. Α. 29 67 And it went --Ο.

1	Α.	Sorry, just for clarification, I was given a notice
2		from Chief Superintendent Wheatley that I was entitled
3		to appeal it if I so wished.

4 68 Q. Yes.

- 5 There was discrepancies in relation to certainly the Α. 11:27 6 date of the phone call with Superintendent Murray and 7 in relation to that text message or the message that I 8 had sent to Cormac Movlan, there was an issue to do with that date, which was wrong. It would have implied 9 I wasn't -- or wasn't, let's say, was deliberately not 10 11 · 27 11 answering my sergeant's phone calls or anything like 12 I would have good time for any of those 13 sergeants at work but wasn't like that. The date that 14 Superintendent Murray had on that was incorrect. 15 has, in his own version of events, that then he brings 11:28 16 in I wouldn't answer the sergeants and that, which was 17 not the case. The date that he stated on what I am to 18 be disciplined for, was incorrect. It was actually the 19 next date. The next date, which I had it in my note, which is the correct date that phone call was made. It 11:28 20 also then would have covered that I did actually text 21 22 the sergeant to say I am sorry about this week. We will tease that out in a minute. But in any event, 69 Q.
- 23 69 Q. We will tease that out in a minute. But in any event, 24 the entry there, just under the line on the left-hand 25 side, it actually seems to be for the 7th July, it 11:28 26 says:

2728

"16:15 ring Nick Quinn, told him was going drinking."

29

1			Then it says:	
2				
3			"Tuesday rest day."	
4				
5			Is RD rest day?	11:29
6		Α.	RD rest day.	
7	70	Q.	RD rest day?	
8		Α.	Yeah.	
9	71	Q.	And then:	
10				11:29
11			"Wednesday RD drink."	
12				
13			And then:	
14				
15			"Thursday drink sick."	11:29
16				
17			And then:	
18				
19			"Friday: Sick. Rang off sick while drinking."	
20				11:29
21			Is that right?	
22		Α.	That's correct. I rang off sick while I was drinking.	
23			Obviously at the time it was a great idea and I	
24			thought, oh I'll be fine in the morning. I didn't	
25			remember the next morning. Like, I did put my hands up	11:29
26			to that. I just notice in these diary entries as well,	
27			there's names of guards that are talking to me and	
28			that, and a lot of them should be blacked out under the	
29			circumstances of the Tribunal T think	

1	72	Q.	Well, we redacted those that we thought were obviously	
2			appropriate, but we will hear representations. The	
3			days we're concerned with, Saturday the 11th then, you	
4			have put in:	
5				11:30
6			"AWOL drink."	
7				
8		Α.	Yeah.	
9	73	Q.	Then Sunday 12th:	
10				11:30
11			"AWOL drink."	
12				
13			Then down the next page, some trial starts over there.	
14			And then:	
15				11:30
16			"AWOL. Stop drinking."	
17				
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	74	Q.	And then Tuesday 14th:	
20				11:30
21			"AWOL. "	
22				
23			Then there'S reference to D/Superintendent Mulcahy.	
24			Then the 15th it says:	
25				11:30
26			"RD. "	
27				
28			And then in the side it says:	
29				

1			"Rang off sick 11:45."	
2				
3			Is that right?	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5	75	Q.	And then 12:08, and there's phone numbers:	11:30
6				
7			"Superintendent Pat Murray rang me re above, above	
8			AWOL. "	
9				
10		Α.	That's absent without leave.	11:30
11	76	Q.	Yes.	
12				
13			"I told him I had been drinking. Didn't realise I rang	
14			off sick. He said sending me to CMO and holding a case	
15			conference to do with me."	11:31
16				
17		Α.	The CMO is the chief medical officer.	
18	77	Q.	Yes. Then there is reference on the 16th:	
19				
20			"Got cert from doctor to cover me re AWOL but they	11:31
21			still will come after me."	
22				
23			Is that right?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	78	Q.	The entries you made about you being AWOL, obviously	11:31
26			they're in your own handwriting?	
27		Α.	Oh yeah.	
28	79	Q.	I mean, the first part of the complaint you made is	
29			that Superintendent Murray turned your absence	

1			irrationally into a charge of being AWOL, but that's	
2			the way you seemed to have characterised it yourself in	
3			your own diary at the time?	
4		Α.	Yes. Well, obviously those notes would have been	
5			written I wouldn't have wrote them while I was	11:31
6			drinking. They would have been I would have written	
7			them after the sequence of events, yeah.	
8	80	Q.	Okay. You did produce a doctor's certificate on the	
9			16th, from Dr. Bartlett, isn't that right?	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:32
11	81	Q.	Superintendent Murray sought an explanation from you,	
12			isn't that correct?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	82	Q.	Perhaps we will just look at page 243. That's signed	
15			by him and sent down to the sergeant in charge.	11:32
16				
17			"Garda Keogh reported fit for duty on Friday, the 10th	
18			July. However, he failed to report on either Saturday	
19			11th, Sunday 12th, Monday 13th, Tuesday 14th."	
20				11:33
21			That would seem to reflect you having phoned in sick on	
22			that Friday night, is that right?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	83	Q.	Superintendent Murray had notes of the phone call at	
25			PM, his exhibit PM35, which is Volume 8, page 2220.	11:33
26			Perhaps we will just look at those. He has this	
27			headed:	
28				
29			"Tuesday, the 14th."	

1				
2			Now, I know your diary refers to a phone call, 12:08.	
3			Could that have been 12:08 on the 14th?	
4		Α.	No. No. My diary was correct here. Just, if you want	
5			to look at Superintendent Murray's statement to the	11:3
6			Tribunal, he has that the phone call was made on the	
7			15th in his statement to the Tribunal.	
8	84	Q.	Just a curiosity is that you made the hadn't invoked	
9			claim for the phone call on the basis that it did take	
10			place on the 14th; isn't that correct?	11:3
11		Α.	Probably that was a heat of the moment thing, I would	
12			imagine. I don't know did I read that, you see. If	
13			you just give me a second.	
14	85	Q.	Yeah.	
15		Α.	Sorry, the month again?	11:3
16	86	Q.	CHAIRMAN: July 2015.	
17		Α.	Yes, because I have the note made on the 14th, where I	
18			had a conversation with Detective Superintendent	
19			Mulcahy about obviously the main investigation, what's	
20			going on with the main investigation. So my note was	11:3
21			on the 15th of July, 12:08, Superintendent Murray rang	
22			me. I have recorded the number that he rang me from as	
23			well. So I was in no doubt that my version is correct.	
24			I accept there's certain parts, notes and all the rest.	
25	87	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	11:3
26		Α.	But you see, it was also the side note as well, where I	

2829

rang off sick, because I rang off sick on the date that

he did -- he rang me at 12:08, about roughly, what, an

hour and a half or something after I had rang off sick.

- 1 So his note here of Tuesday 14th is not accurate.
- 2 and --
- 3 88 Q. Sorry if, you wanted to finish.
- 4 A. I'm okay.
- 5 89 Q. I think you told us in relation to the entries "AWOL"

11:36

11:37

11:37

- 6 that you would have put them in later. I think you've
- 7 told us some of the other entries we discussed earlier
- 8 in the week, you put them on days after they had
- 9 occurred, relating back to those days?
- 10 A. Yeah. I would have gone on a binge, Judge, so I
- 11 wouldn't -- straight out, I wouldn't have been
- 12 concentrating on my diary and AWOL at the time.
- 13 90 Q. But would you agree with me that you're using the diary
- as record of things that have happened?
- 15 A. Yes.
 - 16 91 Q. And you're putting events into days that you think they
 - 17 happen on?
 - 18 A. On this one I'm a hundred percent certain, there is no
 - think in this.
 - 20 92 Q. Well, that's my point?
 - 21 A. I am then prosecuted internally for something on the
 - 22 14th and I made an issue about this. Because the
 - reason it's important on the date is, if that 14th was
 - correct, it means then I deliberately made no effort to
 - contact any sergeant or anything like that, which
 - 26 wasn't the case. I didn't have phone credit and I did
 - 27 manage to be able to send a text to the sergeant.
 - That's the issue.
 - 29 93 Q. Well, I am not sure whether it is, that's what I am

1			trying to explore.	
2		Α.	Sorry, yes.	
3	94	Q.	I am not quite clear, myself.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, do you mind, would you just explain	
5			that again?	11:3
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	95	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, would you mind explaining that again?	
8			You say the date is important?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	96	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Because?	11:3
11		Α.	Because Superintendent Murray is trying to say that I	
12			did not respond to any sergeant's calls or anything	
13			like that. I would not have done that deliberately. I	
14			would have got on well with those sergeants. The	
15			reality is, I was probably asleep or whatever when the	11:3
16			phone calls happened.	
17	97	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So you say you didn't deliberately refuse	
18			to answer calls from sergeants?	

21 that the point?

That's the basic point you're making.

IS

11:38

11:38

19

20

25

Yes.

CHAI RMAN:

Α.

Q.

98

- 22 But there's more to it because then, someone Α. 23 from my unit contacts me and says, better get in
- 24 contact some way with Cormac, you know, there's going to be an issue out of this. So I then got onto
- 26 Facebook, where I texted Sergeant Moylan and explained.
- 27 I never even thought of doing that prior to it, but I
- 28 texted him to say that, as I stated, I am sorry about
- this week and that was it. But Superintendent Murray 29

- 1 tries to pursue this on the 14th and he includes in
- 2 part of the charge.
- 3 99 Q. CHAIRMAN: Just go slowly. Go on?
- 4 A. As part of the accusation that I am not answering the
- 5 phones to sergeants deliberately. Ironically, I do

11:39

11:40

- 6 answer superintendent --
- 7 100 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, don't get lost for a second?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 101 Q. CHAIRMAN: Don't mind ironically for a second?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 102 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, you're saying the date is important
- 12 because?
- 13 A. The date is important in relation to I do contact the
- 14 sergeant and I do apologise. If his date was correct,
- it would mean I didn't do that or I did it after, after 11:39
- his phone call. He's saying he phoned me on the 15th.
- 17 103 Q. CHAIRMAN: Right. And if he is correct?
- 18 A. If he's correct, then I didn't make any effort to
- 19 contact the sergeant in that period of time.
- 20 104 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Whereas if he's not correct and if
- 21 your date is correct?
- 22 A. Then I did make an effort to contact the sergeant.
- 23 105 Q. CHAIRMAN: That is the Facebook contact?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 106 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Are we clear on that?
- MR. McGUINNESS: I'm not quite sure, Chairman.
- 27 107 Q. CHAIRMAN: I think I am understanding. You say the
- fact that you contacted your sergeant on Facebook on
- 29 the 14th --

1		Α.	It was actually very early, just after midnight on the	
2			15th.	
3	108	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay, early hours, very early hours on the	
4			15th, before Superintendent Murray, as you say,	
5			describes if his date is correct, you only did that	11:40
6			after your conversation with Superintendent Murray?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	109	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is that right?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	110	Q.	CHAIRMAN: If his date is correct?	11:41
11		Α.	If his date is correct, yes.	
12	111	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Whereas you say you are sure that your date	
13			is correct and that shows that you did so before your	
14			conversation on the phone with him?	
15		Α.	Yes.	11:41
16			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. That's the point you	
17			want to make. Okay, thank you. Now, I am sorry,	
18			Mr. McGuinness.	
19	112	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: We were looking at the note and the	
20			evidence is the evidence. We will see. So, he says	11:41
21			there on the second line:	
22				
23			"Phoned member at 12 noon. Spoke to him until 12:15.	
24			Admitted being AWOL. Said reported off sick 10/7 in a	
25			fit of drinking after a few days, said he forgot he had	11:41
26			reported off sick, didn't go to work. Admitted had a	
27			drink problem and had stopped going to AA.	
28				
29			Said he gets it hard to sleep before earlies. Drinks	

1 beer and wine, mostly cans of beer. Brought up his 2 whistleblower case and says is worried about Garda A 3 and (blank), that they will get him...one and half years ago, done nothing since Garda A was informed and 4 5 questioned on all the allegations. Challenged him why 6 he didn't answer sergeant trying to contact him over 7 Said he had no credit. AWOL weekend. Agreed credit not required to answer the call." 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

Do you remember saying that?

11:42

11:43

- A. I wouldn't have said that. I mean, of course I would have answered the sergeant. As I said, I would have only seen -- when I stopped drinking, I would have seen the missed call. I mean there would have been a lot of missed calls from different people, but I did see -- 11:42 from recollection, I think there was only one missed and that was from Sergeant Cormac Moylan. But there was a missed call, I accept that. The phone could have been on the table and I could be panned out on the couch. It's not that I deliberately wouldn't answer the sergeant. That's being honest about it.
- 22 113 Q. At a later stage, when Mr. de Bruir was considering as 23 part of the appeal, it seems to have been submitted 24 that your phone simply wasn't charged at the time and 25 had run out of charge?
- A. Oh, that's quite possible also. But I know I certainly didn't have credit on that thing. But that would be a common thing too, you know.
- 29 114 Q. Okay.

- A. Again, Mr. de Bruir's report, it's based on Mick Finn's
- 2 investigation, so...
- 3 115 Q. This is apparently based on your solicitor's submission
- 4 that the phone wasn't charged and that's the reason you
- 5 didn't answer it? 11:43

11:44

11:44

11 · 44

- 6 A. Right. Well look, my recollection is that I just
- 7 didn't have credit, you know.
- 8 116 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. It's quite possible the phone -- I just don't even
- 10 remember that part.
- 11 117 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. But I didn't have credit anyway.
- 13 118 Q. I am just exploring this issue of the date because you
- made an issue of it in the appeal to chief
- 15 superintendent Wheatley?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 119 Q. She tried to enquire about what the relevance of it
- 18 was. You were seen to try and persuade her that she
- should get the superintendent's records and you didn't
- produce any records of your own about a call or any of
- 21 that. But you had said that the call was on the 14th
- in your application for the Haddington Road allowance?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 120 Q. If you look at page --
- 25 A. I accept that. They based on that on what obviously
- Superintendent Murray had written. I do know my notes
- are accurate on this.
- 28 121 Q. Okay. Well perhaps we will just look at those two
- 29 documents. 2247:

Т				
2			"3 hours Haddington Road 14/7/15."	
3				
4			This was an application to get some payment, as it	
5			were, for taking the phone call.	11:45
6		Α.	I was sort of annoyed with I would have been annoyed	
7			with what Superintendent Murray was up to and that, and	
8			I'd say I wrote that in the station. So I wouldn't	
9			even have had my diary with me. I went off the used	
10			his version of it, so that is incorrect.	11:45
11	122	Q.	Okay. Then that's supported by a document on 2248,	
12			again you specify the date and the time there, and it	
13			says:	
14				
15			"Received phone call from Superintendent Murray."	11:45
16				
17			There's a query of what was the duration of it. The	
18			Haddington Road allowed members to receive payment for	
19			being contacted when they're off duty, isn't that	
20			right?	11:46
21		Α.	Yeah. I see here the time on that is incorrect.	
22			Obviously I saw something down from Superintendent	
23			Murray and I am fuming and I get a little bit bold, I	
24			suppose, and say right. I am using his date and time.	
25			I don't have access to my own diary. So the time is	11:46
26			from between two and five. I can say here the time is	
27			at 12:08 on the 15th.	
28	123	Q.	Yes.	
29		Α.	As I said, Superintendent Murray himself has changed	

1			his version from what he has gone by, by way of, where	
2			he is trying to get the disciplinary thing. The	
3			statement that he has made to the Tribunal, he now puts	
4			in that it was the 15th.	
5	124	Q.	Yes.	11:46
6		Α.	That he was in Dublin or something on the 14th and	
7			couldn't have done it.	
8	125	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	That's from recollection really.	
LO	126	Q.	Yes. Then you switched yourself to the 15th, if we	11:47
L1			look at page 2252, isn't that right?	
L2		Α.	Yes. I have obviously gone back, looked at I see	
L3			what's going on there in that period of time. I go	
L4			back to my notes.	
L5				11:47
L6			"I believe Superintendent Pat Murray has made a mistake	
L7			regarding the date of said phone call. I believe this	
L8			call was made on the 15th July, not the 14th July	
L9			2015. "	
20				11:47
21	127	Q.	You had previously requested the call log, on the next	
22			page, on the 3rd October, for the call log for the	
23			14th, isn't that right?	
24		Α.	That's correct.	
25	128	Q.	In order to ascertain the length of time?	11:48
26		Α.	I don't if I connect it. Oh yeah, I did. No, you are	
27			correct.	
28	129	Q.	Yes. If the application for Haddington Road related to	

the 14th, you would be obviously seeking to claim an

1			allowance for duty performed on a day that you were in	
2			fact AWOL, as it were. Now, I don't know whether that	
3			could be done or not. But in any event, the claim, you	
4			modified it to the 15th, isn't that right, because you	
5			think the phone call happened on the 15th?	11:48
6		Α.	Well, I'm a hundred percent certain the phone call	
7			happened on the 15th.	
8	130	Q.	You'd rung in off duty on the 15th then as well, is	
9			that right? The side note on the page we were looking	
10			at.	11:49
11		Α.	Oh yeah. I rang in off duty at 10:45. Like I	
12			shouldn't have wrote that Haddington Road stuff. As I	
13			said, I was annoyed over stuff that had gone down, the	
14			way Superintendent Murray was approaching it with the	
15			reporting and the thing, the other stuff obviously with	11:49
16			the sergeants and all the rest. I shouldn't have put	
17			in that Haddington Road stuff. When I wrote that, I	
18			obviously wrote it in the heat of the moment because I	
19			am using his version, which is incorrect, of the date.	
20			As I said, I hadn't my diaries in work with me?	11:49
21	131	Q.	Yes. Originally we had been looking at the request for	
22			Superintendent Murray to you to provide an explanation.	
23			I think you provide an explanation, which is in your	
24			papers at page 245, isn't that correct? If we just	
25			look at that. Perhaps if we go to page 245 of the	11:50
26			Tribunal's documents.	
27		Α.	Yeah. Oh yeah, that's correct. And it has:	
28				

"On Tuesday, the 14th December, contacted the member by

1			phone. He agreed he was absent without leave and	
2			indicated he reported off sick on the 10/7 while he was	
3			drunk but had forgotten he had done so. He no excuse	
4			for not returning Sergeant Moylan's calls."	
5				11:50
6	132	Q.	That's the report that Superintendent Murray wrote,	
7			that we will come to in a minute.	
8		Α.	Again, the issue with that date, you know, it implies	
9			that I was being that I just was ignoring my	
10			sergeants, essentially. And that's not what happened.	11:51
11	133	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	No deliberate thing there.	
13	134	Q.	He includes tab D there. Perhaps we will just look at	
14			that. Bear with me. If we look at page 2227. That's	
15			the explanation you sent him at the time.	11:52
16				
17			"With reference to overleaf, made mistake regarding	
18			reporting unfit for duty. I was still on sick these	
19			days. I apologise for same. Sick cert attached.	
20			Forwarded for your information."	11:52
21				
22			On the 10th August then, the chief superintendent	
23			decided to appoint Superintendent Alan Murray, is that	
24			correct?	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:52
26	135	Q.	Superintendent Murray conducted an investigation and	
27			you met him?	
28		Α.	Yeah.	
29	136	0.	You pleaded quilty to the first charge and you were	

- 1 acquitted of the second charge?
- 2 A. I pleaded not guilty to the second charge.
- 3 137 Q. Yes. I am sorry, did I misstate that, I beg your
- 4 pardon. You pleaded guilty to the first charge, you

11:53

11:53

11:54

- 5 not guilty to the second charge?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 138 Q. You were acquitted of that, as it were?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 139 Q. You didn't make an issue, I think, of the importance of the phone call at the time?
- 11 A. Yeah, I didn't --
- 12 140 Q. Am I right or wrong?
- 13 A. I had so much going on at the time, all that's going on
- with the investigation and everything else, I didn't.
- But then, of course, when it becomes apparent to me
- 16 what Superintendent Murray is up to there with this,
- 17 you know, sticking the boot in to do with the thing
- 18 with the sergeants, that I'm not -- that annoys me. So
- chief superintendent Wheatley then affords me the
- 20 entitlement of appeal, I then on, let's say, legal
- grounds, request to appeal that. Firstly I looked for
- a copy of my statement. They wouldn't give it to me.
- 23 And the second thing was the date of the phone call and
- again, I was completely ignored with that.
- 25 141 Q. Well, you acknowledged receipt of the report from
- 26 Superintendent Alan Murray. You included a copy of
- 27 your statement in it, did you not?
- 28 A. No, I never got a copy of my -- I didn't get a copy of
- 29 that statement. I didn't actually read -- get a copy

Т			of that statement until I seen it, I think it's in the	
2			Tribunal documents there. I was writing to them	
3			looking for a copy of that statement.	
4	142	Q.	Could we look at page 254. This is the report of the	
5			appointing officer to the member concerned. If you	11:55
6			just scroll down there. Continue down the page.	
7				
8			"I acknowledge receipt of this notice."	
9				
10			If we continue down.	11:55
11		Α.	That pretty much just backs up what I just said, what I	
12			am looking at on the screen.	
13	143	Q.	Yes, but in Superintendent Murray's report, which was	
14			given to you, was your own statement not part of that	
15			report?	11:56
16		Α.	No, I had never got a copy of the statement I made to	
17			Superintendent Alan Murray. If I may read this out, as	
18			to what I wrote to Chief Superintendent Wheatley.	
19			CHAIRMAN: I can see it there, yeah.	
20		Α.		11:56
21			"The decision is not justified having regard to the	
22			information given by me.	
23				
24			Part of the sanction relates to a phone call which I	
25			received from Superintendent Pat Murray, which he	11:56
26			states was on the 14/7. I believe this phone call was	
27			made at 12:08 on the 15/7."	
28				
29			We're talking about 2015.	

1				
2			"And it is relevant to my defence.	
3				
4			I would be obliged if a call log can be obtained	
5			regarding this and I request a copy of the statement I	11:57
6			made to Superintendent Alan Murray for the purpose of	
7			l egal advi ce. "	
8				
9			Because I mean, I knew somewhere this is	
10			interesting, I knew somewhere I had in that statement	11:57
11			it was work related stress or I was under a lot of	
12			stress, or something like that. And of course, at that	
13			period of time, they're marking me out with the flu. I	
14			did not get a copy of that statement.	
15	144	Q.	Chief superintendent Wheatley says in her statement at	11:57
16			page 6112:	
17				
18			"Garda Keogh was provided with a copy of the statement	
19			when the report of interview was served on him. In	
20			relation to the phone records, nothing turned on them	11:57
21			in relation to the core issues under consideration."	
22				
23			But a copy of your statement is included in Volume 31,	
24			at page 8846.	
25		Α.	Okay. I'm not agreeing with you, I'm just saying okay.	11:58
26	145	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You are understanding what he's saying, yes.	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	146	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Just to be clear about what we are	
29			referring to as your statement. This is the statement	

- of explanation and/or defence that you gave in
- 2 interview with Superintendent Murray?
- 3 A. With Superintendent Alan Murray.
- 4 147 Q. Alan Murray, yes.
- 5 A. That's the statement I am saying I never got a copy and 11:58
- I was looking for a copy of that statement in order to
- 7 appeal it, and I never got a copy of that statement.
- 8 148 Q. Did I say 8846? This is the typewritten version of it.

11:59

11:59

- 9 A. My recollection is he had a hand -- he wrote it in
- 10 longhand.
- 11 149 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. As I said, I read this, I read this in the Tribunal
- documents.
- 14 150 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. But I never got a copy of either longhand or a typed
- version.
- 17 151 Q. Well, my understanding is that you signed an
- 18 acknowledgment of the receipt of the report of
- 19 Superintendent Murray's inquiry, which included this?
- 20 A. I got the report with the other documents, but not the
- 21 statement.
- 22 152 Q. Most likely the handwritten version, which, if we just
- 23 scroll down two pages?
- 24 A. I am under oath.
- 25 153 Q. Yes.
- 26 A. There was other documents there.
- 27 154 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. But not the statement, either longhand or typed.
- 29 155 Q. If we go to the top of that, of that page, scroll back

1		up to the top, and the top of the next page. This is	
2		the handwritten record of Superintendent Murray's	
3		interview with you. The typed version of which we have	
4		seen in two pages previously. Is it your evidence that	
5		you didn't get that or you have no recollection of ever 12:	00
6		getting that?	
7	Α.	I never got a copy, either typed or the longhand	
8		version. Sorry, not version, the original. No, I	
9		never. That's why I was writing looking for it, in	
10		order to appeal the thing. The appeal then, of course, 12:	00
11		just is upheld without me getting a copy of that. And	
12		the other thing, the other thing, those are the two	
13		issues, the statement and the phone call. When you	
14		have a guard and a superintendent, let's say, have a	
15		different version of events in this, the chief should 12:	00

That's one issue. I never got a copy of that statement and I looked for it.

have been impartial and just checked the phone records,

very simple, sort out the date of the phone call.

MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, I see it's just 12 o'clock. I wonder would it be appropriate to take a very short break.

12:01

12:01

CHAIRMAN: Yes. Have you much more on this topic? I was wondering if we could conveniently -- we will adopt Mr. Kelly's suggestion that we will take a break mid morning and mid afternoon. I think that's a good idea, Mr. Kelly. Is this a convenient time or have you some significant --

MR. McGUINNESS: I have some little time more, but I

Т			tnink pernaps	
2			CHAIRMAN: You are right, if we don't take a break now,	
3			we will be too close to lunchtime. So we will take a	
4			little break now and we will come back in 15 minutes,	
5			okay. Very good, thanks very much.	12:01
6				
7			THE HEARING ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS FOLLOWS	
8				
9	156	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Garda Keogh, can I direct your	
10			attention to a document, just it may clear up confusion	12:14
11			on my part. It's at 2258, which is in volume 31,	
12			volume 8. This appears to be the report of the	
13			appointing officer to the member concerned. So you are	
14			meant to get it, as it were. Just on the line	
15			underneath your name, it says:	12:15
16				
17			"Please find attached a copy of the report of interview	
18			pursuant to regulation 19(1)."	
19				
20			Now, if we just go down to the bottom. You appear to	12:15
21			have signed that, acknowledging receipt of that. If	
22			the report of interview included your interview, I may	
23			be wrong about that, it would appear that you were	
24			perhaps meant to have got it, get it at that time. You	
25			don't recollect getting it anyway?	12:15
26		Α.	I don't recollect reading that statement. I know I	
27			looked for it and I don't recollect reading it until in	
28			the Tribunal documents.	
29	157	Q.	Okay.	

1		Α.	I can only go off memory on this, but I am sure I would	
2			have spotted it in a document like this.	
3	158	Q.	Yes. In Superintendent Murray's statement	
4			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, can we go down a bit further? Can we	
5			scroll down further?	12:16
6			MR. McGUINNESS: That's a different, new	
7			CHAIRMAN: Yes, I'm sorry, you refer to that. Thanks	
8			very much.	
9	159	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: In any event, could we look at page	
10			2045? This is from Superintendent Murray's statement.	12:16
11			At the end of the first paragraph, four lines from the	
12			end of that paragraph, he says:	
13				
14			"On the 4th August I reported the matter to chief	
15			superintendent Westmeath, recommending the matter be	12:17
16			dealt with as a less serious breach of discipline. I	
17			attach a copy of my notes relating to the matter and a	
18			copy of my report to the chief superintendent marked	
19			PM 35. "	
20				12:17
21			He says then, further down that page, with reference to	
22			the 30th, he said he met you on the 30th to serve on	
23			behalf of superintendent Mullingar, that's	
24			Superintendent Alan Murray:	
25				12:17
26			"who had been appointed by the chief superintendent	
27			to inquiry into Garda Keogh's absence without leave	
28			under Regulation 14 of the discipline regulations."	
29				

Т			You acknowledge receipt of that.	
2				
3			"It was clear he was annoyed with me. I indicated to	
4			him I had explained this might happen. At his request	
5			I explained to him how Regulation 14 worked and that it	12:17
6			was a way of dealing with less serious breaches of	
7			di sci pl i ne. "	
8				
9			Then he goes on to a discussion in relation to that.	
10			Is that accurate in your recollection?	12:18
11		Α.	On the 30th August. I am looking at point 14,	
12			apologies?	
13	160	Q.	I think you do have a note in your diary of him calling	
14			at 9pm.	
15		Α.	Okay. Yeah, I have a note, 9pm, that's on a Sunday:	12:18
16				
17			"9pm, superintendent arrives into the station and	
18			serves Regulation 15 papers on me."	
19				
20	161	Q.	Yes.	12:19
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	162	Q.	Do you recall what he recounts there in that paragraph?	
23		Α.	I have a vague I don't particularly. I remember it	
24			was a Sunday night and it was unusual for a	
25			superintendent to arrive in on a Sunday night. I	12:20
26			vaguely remember. I don't particularly remember	
27			just if you can clarify what exactly, what part?	
28	163	Q.	Well, it's just that he's describing it in a statement	
29			and his account of the meeting, recommending a less	

T			serious breach of discipline being put against you	
2			there?	
3		Α.	Right. I don't think it was I think that was I	
4			don't think it was a section that wasn't dealt with	
5			by way of a Section 10, that was a more serious breach.	12:20
6			Regulation 14, I see here.	
7	164	Q.	Yes. But in any event, what he recommended to the	
8			chief superintendent, according to one report of the	
9			4th August 2015, at page 2222. I think it starts:	
10				12:20
11			"In this case I would consider the member's history of	
12			absence and his blatant disregard to responsibilities	
13			to the organisation, which appears to stem from his	
14			over indulgence of alcohol. I respectfully recommend	
15			that the member be dealt with by Relation 14 of	12:21
16			discipline regulations for his absence without leave	
17			amounting to four days."	
18				
19			That's the charge you pleaded guilty to?	
20		Α.	Yeah.	12:21
21	165	Q.	Do you follow what happened then? Chief superintendent	
22			Wheatley appointed Superintendent Alan Murray to	
23			enquiry into that?	
24		Α.	Oh yeah, I have no issue with Alan Murray's part at	
25			all.	12:21
26	166	Q.	That chief superintendent formulated two charges, do	
27			you follow that?	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	167	Q.	And what I want to suggest to you is that your concern	

Т			about the date of the phone call and your concern about	
2			when it happened was only really relevant to the second	
3			charge and it had nothing to do with the first charge	
4			of being AWOL. You were AWOL, you agreed you were	
5			AWOL. You've noted your AWOL yourself?	12:22
6		Α.	Yeah.	
7	168	Q.	The issue that you have made about it date of the phone	
8			call, chief superintendent Wheatley teased that out in	
9			correspondence with you, she enquired why you wanted	
10			them and she made her decision that they were in large	12:22
11			part irrelevant to the appeal against the charge that	
12			you pleaded guilty to?	
13		Α.	You see, they tried to charge me with two different	
14			things.	
15	169	Q.	CHAIRMAN: They did charge you with two different	12:22
16			thing.	
17		Α.	They did, yeah.	
18	170	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
19		Α.	Sorry.	
20	171	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Superintendent Alan Murray acquitted	12:22
21			you, Alan Murray acquitted you of the second one and	
22			your appeal was only, therefore, against the first one,	
23			isn't that right? And in relation to the penalty.	
24		Α.	Just for clarification, can you just give me the two	
25			charges again? Because one was neglect of duty, but I	12:23
26			can't remember which was one and which is	
27	172	Q.	CHAIRMAN: One was AWOL.	
28		Α.	Yeah, but that wasn't the actual charge, it had some	

other wording on it.

29

- 1 173 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. The other concerned the medical certificate.
- A. Discreditable.
- 4 174 Q. CHAIRMAN: The other concerned the medical certificate
 5 that retrospectively declared you to have been ill, to 12:23
 6 have been sick, do you understand?
- 7 A. Yeah. The first one then is the --

I understand.

- 8 175 Q. CHAIRMAN: Hold on, just so we know where we are going.
- 9 A. Yeah.

Α.

15

10 176 Q. CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness is inviting you to comment,
11 he's inviting you to comment on this point: That the
12 question you raise about the 14th/15th is relevant only
13 to the second charge, of which you are found not
14 guilty. Do you understand? Do you know what I mean?

- 16 CHAI RMAN: It's a bit complicated, I understand, but we 177 Q. 17 have two charges. You were not guilty of number 2, you 18 were found guilty of number 1 because you pleaded 19 guilty to number 1. And he says this material about the date, it relates only to question number 2. What 20 12:24 21 do you say to that? What's your position? He says it appears that that's the case, and what do you say to 22 23 that?
- A. As I said, I was given the opportunity to appeal it and
 I went to appeal on just the two grounds. One was in
 relation to the phone call, as I said, neglect of duty
 I think is the first one, which I pleaded guilty to, I
 think that that's right, and not guilty to the
 discreditable.

- 1 178 Q. CHAIRMAN: Correct. The second one concerned the medical certificate, if you know what I mean?
- 3 A. Yeah.
- 4 179 Q. CHAIRMAN: It was somewhat complicated language and
- 5 it's not entirely easy to understand exactly what it's

12:25

12:26

12:26

- 6 saying, but it concerned it. Now what do you say?
- 7 Don't mind about that, he says the point about the
- 8 dates only referred to the second charge that you were
- 9 found not guilty of?
- 10 A. I have a difficulty, a slight difficulty, in that in
- 11 neglect of duty, like part of Superintendent Pat
- Murray's thing brings in the thing about the sergeants
- and, it would appear, deliberately not answering the
- sergeants and that. The fact that I was entitled to
- the appeal, if they had done it fairly in the appeal,
- they could have dealt with all that fairly, given me a
- 17 copy of the statement, checked out the phone records
- and they could have then dealt with it.
- 19 180 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 20 A. They didn't deal with the appeal, the mechanism they
- 21 didn't deal with.
- 22 181 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 23 A. Is my argument.
- 24 182 Q. CHAIRMAN: You say, rightly or wrongly, relevantly or
- irrelevantly, you raised it on the appeal and you
- didn't get a satisfactory outcome. That's really what
- it comes down to?
- 28 A. What I'm saying is, I didn't actually get -- I was
- afforded the opportunity to appeal. Having said yes,

- for my defence in the appeal I need these two things, iust the clarification on the phone call, a copy of m
- just the clarification on the phone call, a copy of my
- 3 statement, and I didn't get either of those.
- 4 CHAIRMAN: Very good. Okay. Now, Mr. McGuinness.
- 5 183 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: Just in the context of later events,

12 · 27

- 6 Mr. de Bruir's observations seem to accord with what
- 7 Chief Superintendent Wheatley had -- her state of mind,
- 8 that the date of the call didn't change the fact that
- 9 you were AWOL, nor the fact that you had pleaded to the
- 10 charge. So he didn't see the date of the call to be
- that relevant. Do you want to say anything else about
- the relevance of it to the appeal?
- 13 A. Again, in relation to Mr. de Bruir's thing, it's based
- on Assistant Commissioner Mick Finn's investigation. I
- have huge problems with everything in that, a lot of
- that investigation.
- 17 184 Q. CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness is just putting the same
- 18 point to you essentially.
- 19 A. Yeah.
- 20 185 Q. CHAIRMAN: That Mr. de Bruir, again rightly or wrongly,
- seems to have focused on the point about relevance or
- relevancy, do you understand?
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 186 Q. CHAIRMAN: I think you have said what you said about
- 25 that?
- 26 A. Yeah.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: Okay, I think we will move on from,
- Mr. McGuinness, because Garda Keogh says look, here is
- 29 my case on that.

It's just that part of the bundle of 1 187 Q. MR. McGUI NNESS: 2 allegations in relation to Superintendent Murray was 3 that you say in your statement to the Tribunal, the original statement: 4

5 6

7

8

9

10

11

12:28

12:28

12:29

12.29

"Pat Murray then vindictively requested an acknowledgment of this finding to him, in circumstances where it was a contest between my version and that of Pat Murray, he had acted as formulator of the charge, judge, witness, giving untrue testimony and now enforcer of a cap in hand acknowledgment."

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

You repeat that assertion a number of times in relation to Superintendent Murray.

That's in the statement, isn't it, that I made prior -- 12:29 Α. the statement I made to get it in before the deadline, in to the Tribunal. I accept that statement was very a rushed statement, in that I hadn't received all from Tribunal, like everybody else, statements. sure, I know there's mistakes in that statement. think I have Superintendent Alan Murray and Pat Murray mixed up in that. I do remember reading that and seeing there's a mix-up in things there with the two Superintendent Murrays. Just on the statement, that particular statement that I made, the one that had to be in for the deadline, which I think I just got in on the deadline of the Tribunal, was an extremely rushed That statement, I think it was clarified in statement. the statement I made to the Tribunal, just that

_			Statement, there were I didn't have the same I am	
2			not even sure how much time I had, I don't think I even	
3			got to read over that particular statement because it	
4			had to be in by the deadline for the Tribunal.	
5	188	Q.	But the statement to the Tribunal is in large part a	12:30
6			repetition of it's not quite verbatim, there are	
7			additions in your statement to the Tribunal, but it's	
8			almost a verbatim repetition of your statement of	
9			complaint to Assistant Commissioner Finn?	
10		Α.	Yeah, it's similar, but there are I think there are	12:30
11			mistakes, some slight mistakes in the statement I put	
12			in for the deadline, which I say and there was a	
13			reason that was rushed, because that's to do with a	
14			Tribunal order that wasn't served on me on	
15	189	Q.	It's just that it seemed to remain in the appeal, even	12:30
16			up until the time that chief superintendent Finn had	
17			dealt with it and when came to it Mr. de Bruir, because	
18			even he pointed out that there was two different	
19			Murrays and that Superintendent Murray wasn't the	
20			assignor of the charge to you, it was Chief	12:3
21			Superintendent Wheatley?	
22		Α.	Yes. Yeah, I accept there's a mix-up in that statement	
23			there that I sent and I am aware, I know what you are	
24			trying to say, yeah.	
25	190	Q.	I am just wondering. Obviously you served under	12:3
26			Superintendent Murray and you have obviously complained	
27			him in the way that we have heard about so far. But	
28			you knew and you came face-to-face with Superintendent	
29			Alan Murray?	

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 191 Q. Who conducted the discipline?
- A. Yes.
- 4 192 Q. I am just wondering, how do you think you got it mixed

12:32

12:32

12:32

- 5 up between the two of them and that you accused
- 6 Superintendent Murray of being prosecutor, witness,
- judge, jury, executioner?
- 8 A. Yeah.
- 9 193 Q. And that persisting over a number of years in the
- documents, until it was corrected in the investigation
- interview with our investigators in 2018?
- 12 A. Yes. As is stated, I didn't get the Tribunal order, I
- didn't get the Tribunal order actually from
- 14 recollection until after the deadline. But luckily I
- had heard that a statement needed to be in for the
- 16 Tribunal.
- 17 194 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. And I had to --
- 19 195 Q. CHAIRMAN: Garda Keogh, do you mind if I ask you,
- we're going around in circles here.
- 21 A. Sorry.
- 22 196 Q. CHAIRMAN: This has nothing to do -- you have another
- complaint, which we will get to in due course, about
- 24 not getting the Tribunal order?
- 25 A. Right, okay.
- 26 197 Q. CHAIRMAN: Look, Mr. McGuinness is saying, at some
- 27 point it became obvious that it was Superintendent Alan
- 28 Murray and not Superintendent Pat Murray who was the
- 29 relevant person for these charges?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 198 Q. CHAIRMAN: All right.
- 3 A. Yeah.
- 4 199 Q. CHAIRMAN: And he is saying, why didn't you drop the
- 5 allegations against Superintendent Pat Murray? Why
- 6 didn't you go to your solicitor and say, please write

12:33

12:33

12:33

- 7 to the Tribunal and say I was mistaken about those, I
- 8 was wrong, he wasn't the prosecutor, executioner,
- 9 everything else, I was wrong about that.
- 10 A. I think I clarified that, just from recollection.
- 11 200 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, listen, keep a simple conversation here.
- Don't mind about clarifying anything, why didn't do you
- 13 that?
- 14 A. I think I did.
- 15 201 Q. CHAIRMAN: You think you did it?
- 16 A. In the statement to the Tribunal, when I sat down to
- make my statement to the Tribunal. That's just from
- 18 recollection, Judge.
- 19 202 Q. CHAIRMAN: When you went to your solicitor to make your
- statement to the Tribunal, is that correct?
- 21 A. No, this was here in Dublin Castle, when I met the
- 22 Tribunal.
- 23 203 Q. CHAIRMAN: You were interviewed. That's the very point
- that Mr. McGuinness is asking you. When you were
- interviewed -- I mean, I don't want to be difficult
- about this, I just want to save us wasting time,
- 27 running around in circles about who clarified what on
- the 25th. I just want to get it simple. Do you
- 29 understand me?

- 1 A. Yeah.
- 2 204 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, there is nothing sort of hostile
- about this, I just want to get it clear?
- 4 A. I am a bit confused myself.
- 5 205 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Let's go back to basics?
- 6 A. Mm-hmm.
- 7 206 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do you agree, I am not concerned whether you

12:34

12:34

- 8 say yes or no, do you agree that you seem to have got
- 9 it wrong and blamed Superintendent Pat Murray in this
- particular instance, do you think you made a mistake
- 11 about that?
- 12 A. I'm sorry.
- 13 207 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 14 A. In which particular?
- 15 208 Q. CHAIRMAN: Saying that he was the prosecutor,
- 16 executioner, charge hand, general investigator and he
- was to have blame for all the things that happened?
- 18 A. No, he initiated, he wasn't the investigator.
- 19 209 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 20 A. I accept he wasn't the investigator.
- 21 210 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, now that we know what we are talking
- 22 about?
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 211 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry I started this?
- MR. KELLY: Chairman, if I can help, I think at Volume
- 26 1, page 73 you will find clarification.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Volume 1, page 63.
- 28 MR. KELLY: 73.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: 73. Thank you very much. What's in Volume

1			1, page 73.	
2			MR. KELLY:	
3				
4			"I wish to clarify that Superintendent Pat Murray was	
5			not the prosecutor and enforcer in this matter and that	12:35
6			this is an error in my statement."	
7				
8			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
9			MR. KELLY:	
10				12:35
11			"Superintendent Alan Murray was the deciding officer."	
12				
13			CHAIRMAN: Okay, that's in the interview. Now what	
14			Mr. McGuinness says to you is: Why didn't do you that	
15			earlier? Why did it wait until that's the question	12:35
16			he's asking you. I am not saying it's a good question	
17			or a bad question or am important question, but that's	
18			a simple question, why didn't do you it earlier?	
19		Α.	I just don't know, is the answer.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Okay. All right. Now I think that was your	12:35
21			question.	
22			MR. McGUINNESS: well, that is part of it, Chairman.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Oh, I'm sorry.	
24	212	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: The other half of it was, I am just	
25			concerned to know how could you have made a mistake and	12:36
26			how could the mistake persist for so long? That's	
27			really what I'm interested in.	
28		Α.	When I had handed in the it was a lot of volumes and	

it got it on the night of the deadline. As I said, I

- don't think I got to read over it. But I was aware,
- there's more than just one mistake in that particular
- 3 large statement that I had made. I was aware I was
- 4 going to be coming up to the Tribunal investigators at
- some point and I kind of just said, right, we'll deal

12:36

12:37

12:37

- 6 with all that when -- the mistakes, we'll address them
- 7 as we go along.
- 8 213 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. I think I did as best I could.
- 10 214 Q. Can I ask you, was that the first time the mistake was
- drawn to your attention, by the Tribunal investigators,
- when they were interviewing you last summer in 2018?
- 13 A. I can't just recall.
- 14 215 Q. Okay, can you recollect anyone having brought it to
- 15 your attention prior to that?
- 16 A. I can't.
- 17 216 Q. All right.
- 18 A. I can't recall, because there was a lot of
- investigations.
- 20 217 Q. Of course, I understand, yes.
- MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, I think I am going to leave
- that issue.
- 23 218 Q. CHAIRMAN: Very good. Anything else you want to say
- 24 about that?
- 25 A. No, Judge, no.
- 26 CHAIRMAN: Thanks.
- 27 MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, the next issue is issue
- number 8.
- MR. MURPHY: Chairman, before we move on to that issue,

1	I wonder if I could renew the submission I made the
2	other day, which you very kindly indicated you would
3	adopt today.
4	CHAIRMAN: Yes.
5	MR. KELLY: Let me respond. I have made an arrangement 12:3
6	with the Tribunal, the documents are being looked at
7	now.
8	CHAIRMAN: Right.
9	MR. KELLY: I want to see the outcome of that.
10	CHAIRMAN: Should we pass over from this for the moment 12:3
11	and we will move to the next item, leaving this one so
12	your team can do whatever they want to do.
13	MR. KELLY: I would suggest, if it doesn't
14	inconvenience my Friend too much, that we leave it over
15	until tomorrow.
16	CHAIRMAN: Happy with that, Mr. Murphy?
17	MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chair. I just have a slight concern
18	that the issue is a very specific one, which is whether
19	former Commissioner O'Sullivan intervened by telephone
20	to Superintendent Patrick Murray in April 12:3
21	CHAIRMAN: I understand.
22	MR. MURPHY: It's a very specific allegation. It's not
23	clear exactly to me what exactly has taken place at
24	this stage, because, as I have indicated in my
25	submission, the complainant himself has indicated he 12:3
26	has no direct evidence.
27	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Mr. McGuinness.
28	MR. McGUINNESS: I was only going to suggest, Chairman,
29	that via media, might be to take Garda Keogh on the

1	facts.	
2	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
3	MR. McGUINNESS: In the sense that that might be	
4	relevant to a substratum of evidence upon which people	
5	might be basing their submissions rather than	12:38
6	hypothetically hypothesise.	
7	CHAIRMAN: What do you say to that, Mr. Murphy?	
8	MR. MURPHY: Judge, I respectfully object to that	
9	because that would undermine the entire basis of my	
10	submission.	12:39
11	CHAIRMAN: That's all right, I just wanted to clarify.	
12	MR. MURPHY: Can I just say, insofar as my concerns are	
13	highlighted in the submission, just what has happened	
14	in the last few minutes has indicated the wisdom of	
15	conducting a witness with a need to withdraw	12:39
16	allegations on which there is no evidence.	
17	CHAIRMAN: Hold on, Mr. Murphy, hold on, I would prefer	
18	to deal with it when we are dealing with it.	
19	MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
20	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Mr. Murphy, it doesn't seem	12:39
21	unreasonable where Mr. Kelly's team wishes to look or	
22	look again, whatever it is, I am sympathetic to the	
23	idea that they should have that opportunity and then	
24	reflect on the matter and come back. Whatever it is	
25	that's going to happen, we can discuss that at a	12:39
26	convenient time tomorrow.	
27	MR. MURPHY: May it please you, Chairman.	
28	CHAIRMAN: Obviously there is no question of anybody	
29	having to make decisions or do anything until such	

- time. So, we will do that, Mr. Kelly and
- 2 Mr. McGuinness, we will leave that over until tomorrow.
- 3 MR. McGUINNESS: Very good, Chairman.
- 4 MR. KELLY: Yes, Chairman.
- 5 CHAIRMAN: In light of that, we will see where we are

12:40

12:41

12 · 41

- 6 going.
- 7 MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.
- 8 CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.
- 9 219 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: Garda Keogh, I am going to skip that
- issue and look at issue number 9, which relates to four 12:40
- different investigation files that you were involved in
- that were the subject of scrutiny and query and so
- forth and about which you have made complaints. It's
- issue number 9. I am going to go through them in
- sequence obviously. The first one relates to a theft
- at a Custom Place, Athlone, on 4th July 2015. You deal
- 17 with this in your statement, in Volume 1, at pages 129,
- 18 30 and 31 and the papers relating to it are in appendix
- 19 8, at page 189 onwards. But just looking at the first
- one there, I'm afraid we will have to look at these in
- 21 some detail?
- 22 220 Q. CHAIRMAN: These are, you say, unreasonable criticisms
- of your police work?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 CHAIRMAN: That's the heading under this. Okay.
- 26 221 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: This related to a report by you. If
- 27 we look at page 190 of the documents. I don't know if
- you want to take the paper copy or not. If you want to
- 29 look at it on screen there. There are various

Т			different matters entered there. But you signed it,	
2			your supervisor is Sergeant Moylan. There are remarks	
3			of the supervisor in relation to:	
4				
5			"CCTV viewed but no evidential value as camera panning,	12:42
6			qui ckl y passed premi ses."	
7				
8			Then there's:	
9				
10			"The identity of somebody collated at Custom Place at	12:42
11			the time of offence, possible suspect, statement of	
12			injured party enclosed."	
13				
14			There's a second page on that about additional	
15			enquiries conducted. Presumably they are subsequent to	12:42
16			the original report, is that right?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	222	Q.	There's comments then under the heading "13":	
19				
20			"Blank in area around time of crime. No other	12:43
21			evi dence. "	
22				
23			Did you submit that file along with I think there's	
24			a second file, this relates to two files, isn't that	
25			correct?	12:43
26		Α.	Yeah. Sorry, just clarify, two files. If I can just	
27			be of assistance here?	
28	223	Q.	Yes.	
29		Α.	Two persons arriving at the same time to report an	

1 incident of theft. The difficulty is, one, it was 2 obviously, I presume, the same suspect that took the 3 two items. One item was a phone I think belonging to one person, the other was a wallet or a purse and 4 5 belonged to the other. Which meant they had two 12:44 different incidents recorded on Pulse. It wasn't just 6 7 dealing with one, there it was two, just the way it 8 happened. 9 224 CHAI RMAN: Two injured parties? Q. 10 Two injured parties, sorry, yes. Α. 12.44 11 225 CHAI RMAN: Who were the victims of thefts? Q. 12 Yes. Α. 13 CHAI RMAN: 226 It seems that the same suspect was Q. 14 applicable to both, is that right? 15 I understand the wallet and the phone were beside 12:44 Α. 16 each other and the same, let's say, incident but the --CHAI RMAN: 17 Oh, I see what you mean? 227 Q. 18 For recording the incident. Α. 19 228 CHAI RMAN: Yes. Q. Because there were two different parties. 20 Α. 12:44 21 229 CHAI RMAN: So somebody left his or her wallet down and Q. 22 somebody else left his or her phone down and the two 23 went missing? 24 Correct. Α. 25 Okay. Right, thank you very much. CHAI RMAN: 12.44 26 230 MR. McGUI NNESS: In relation to this, Superintendent Ο. 27 Murray raised a query, I don't think we need to look at 28 the second initial report, but if you go on to page

197, Superintendent Murray raised the query:

29

2			"The attached two crime files are returned for further	
3			attention as follows.	
4				
5			The suspect has been identified in both cases. What	12:45
6			efforts have been made to deal with them?"	
7				
8			And the second one is that:	
9				
10			"Why is it that both injured parties who are witnesses	12:45
11			appear to have written out their own statements on form	
12			C8 rather than investigating member taking down the	
13			statement?	
14				
15			Each and every reported crime must be brought to	12:45
16			investigative conclusion so the injured parties and the	
17			public in general can have confidence in the police	
18			servi ce we provi de.	
19				
20			For report by 10/8/15."	12:45
21				
22			Now, in this case you were the investigating member?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	231	Q.	You didn't, as it were, and we will come to the whether	
25			or why of it, but you didn't take the statements of the	12:46
26			witness in the form of an interview that might normally	
27			be done when you're taking a statement of complaint?	
28		Α.	Not in the usual way, correct, yeah.	
29	727	Ο	All right. They were presumably then simply provided	

1			with the relevant forms that we see the statements in	
2			and they wrote them out themselves?	
3		Α.	Yes, they wrote them out themselves, which I then read	
4			over to them, read over to them and I wrote on the	
5			bottom part, the relevant part, where "this statement	12:46
6			has been read over to me and is correct" and they	
7			signed their statements and I witnessed their	
8			signature.	
9	233	Q.	Yes.	
10		Α.	Just for clarification, as I said, both of these	12:46
11			injured parties arrived in to me at the same time and ${\tt I}$	
12			was at the public office and I was busy. Just	
13			procedurally, it's a thing I wouldn't normally do, but	
14			I have often done it in the past. They are perfectly	
15			balanced statements, legally, would be my argument,	12:47
16			legally balanced.	
17	234	Q.	Yes. In the sense that there's no doubt that they	
18			would be regarded as having been made and signed in	
19			your presence?	
20		Α.	Yeah, it was done in accordance with law.	12:47
21	235	Q.	Yes. But without you having, as it were, teased it out	
22			by question and answer and maybe trying to develop	
23			detail?	
24		Α.	Oh, well I would have	
25	236	Q.	Possible detail?	12:47
26		Α.	When we were doing that, I would have told them,	
27			listen, you need the date, the time and the relevant	
28			parts in, what was taken. I think I have the two	
29			statement forms. I was present while they made their	

1			statements in front of me, if you know what I mean,	
2			while I was answering the phones. The relevant parts	
3			to put into the statement.	
4	237	Q.	Are there desks in the public office that they can sit	
5			at?	12:48
6		Α.	No, it's a hatch. But there is they could write,	
7			they were able to write. There's two hatches, one,	
8			let's say, would've where I was or just in front of me	
9			at the desk, and the other one was just beside me, to	
10			the left.	12:48
11	238	Q.	Yes. Anyway, the documents I think sought a report for	
12			the 10th August. I think Sergeant Monaghan sent that	
13			down to you, it would appear. I don't think you made a	
14			report by 10th August, but Sergeant Monaghan wrote to	
15			you on the 11th August then, asking for a reply to	12:49
16			that, isn't that right?	
17		Α.	A reply to Superintendent Murray's.	
18	239	Q.	Yes.	
19		Α.	Yeah.	
20	240	Q.	At page 201, you wrote a reply there, which seems to	12:49
21			have been received or sent to the public office on the	
22			28th. "This was the day of triathlon, hundreds of	
23			people in the area. That's the suspect.	
24				
25			"There is no evidence to link (blank) to the crime. In	12:49
26			relation to why both statements were taken the way they	
27			were, is because I was on my own in the public office	
28			during the triathlon. It was very busy when the two	
29			injured parties arrived in, so I did the best I could	

1			under the circumstances. Forwarded for your	
2			information."	
3				
4			That made it clear that although X was seen there,	
5			there was, in your view, perhaps no reason to or	12:50
6			evidence to connect them to the crime	
7		Α.	It was myself that nominated X. Because I actually	
8			brought one of the injured parties in to view the CCTV	
9			with me. I was going through the CCTV with the injured	
10			party and X was in the area all right, but X didn't	12:50
11			actually go into the building on the cameras. That was	
12			as far as I could go, he was in the area. He did not	
13			go in or out on the camera into the building.	
14			Therefore, I had no evidence then to put to X .	
15	241	Q.	Was that one of the additional enquiries you made?	12:50
16		Α.	Well, that would have been done when you watch the	
17			CCTV. That's as far as I could go, let's say, X was in	
18			the area, the problem was X didn't go in or out of the	
19			building. It was an open house to do with the	
20			triathlon, Judge, it would be like a St. Patrick's Day	12:51
21			event in Dublin, I'd say, it'd be a big event in	
22			Athlone. There was an open house on this particular	
23			occasion for something and I think these ladies were	
24			working and that in the open house. There was a door,	
25			there was loads of people going in and out of this	12:51
26			house, and on the camera X was around the area all	
27			right, but he didn't go in or out of that house. That	
28			was really as far as it progressed.	
29	242	Q.	Am I right in thinking that the viewing of the CCTV	

1 didn't take place on that night? 2 I'm not sure. I just can't remember. Α. 3 243 0. It seems to be entered on the file as an additional 4 inquiry conducted? 5 As I say, I know I was busy that particular night. Α. 12:52 6 244 Q. Yes. So that wouldn't have surprised me. 7 Α. 8 245 In any event, Superintendent Murray, on page 302, Ο. 9 sent down a further memo, he said: 10 12:52 11 "The explanation given in this case for what I see is a 12 laissez faire attitude towards an investigation of 13 these two crimes is far from satisfactory. Garda Keogh 14 appears to need advice in relation to the purpose and the scope of interviewing witnesses and in that regard 12:52 15 16 should be advised in relation..." 17 18 CHAI RMAN: Sorry we have 302. 19 MR. McGUI NNESS: I'm sorry, did I say --20 CHAI RMAN: You said 302. 12:52 21 MR. McGUI NNESS: Sorry, I beg your pardon, 202. 22 Well, that explains that. Thank you. CHAI RMAN: 202. 23 Have you got that on the screen? Yes. 24 Yeah. Α. 25 CHAI RMAN: Okay. Now, Mr. McGuinness. 12:53 MR. McGUINNESS: You saw this at the time, isn't that 26 246 0. 27 right? Yeah. 28 Α.

29

247

Q.

1			"The explanation given in this case for what I see as a	
2			laissez faire attitude towards the investigation of	
3			this these two crimes is far from satisfactory. Garda	
4			Keogh appears to need advice in relation to the purpose	
5			and the scope of interviewing witnesses and in that	12:53
6			regard should be advised in relation to existing	
7			instructions of chapter 3 of the crime instructions	
8			manual. The manner in which these statements form of	
9			an investigation is contrary to the training and ethos	
10			of members of An Garda Síochána and does not allow for	12:53
11			this organisation to assure the victims in this case	
12			that the best possible effort was put into	
13			investigating the crimes reported."	
14				
15			Now, just on that point, that is the chapter that gives	12:53
16			sort of instructions and objectives about how it is	
17			best for a guard to interview and what they should be	
18			seeking to achieve when taking a statement?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	248	Q.	As a matter of best practice, I suppose?	12:54
21		Α.	Yes. And now it calls for clarification. When I	
22			received this document, from recollection, that	
23			chapter, whatever, 3 of the crime investigations manual	
24			is attached to the report. So obviously I read that	
25			chapter 3 and at the very bottom part of it, it has:	12:54
26			On occasion a witness may wish to make something	
27			like, a witness can make a statement themselves and the	
28			guard then have to read it over to them, sign it and	
29			that's it. So I was even covered under their own	

1			investigation manual in relation to that.	
2	249	Q.	Yes. It says in the second paragraph:	
3				
4			"The basis of any investigation is the injured parties	
5			statement and in these cases the injured parties	12:55
6			nominate a suspect. The issue must be explored in a	
7			proper fashion with them. Garda Keogh has also	
8			nominated the same suspect on the crime tacking file.	
9			It is incumbent on us to ensure we explore the various	
10			available options to assist in gathering evidence. The	12:55
11			case of DPP v. Ready indicates the low threshold in	
12			relation to reasonable suspicion that exists in order	
13			to assist investigations. The tools available to Garda	
14			Keogh to assist him in his work are not used in this	
15			case. In order to bring the matters to a acceptable	12:55
16			conclusion for the victims, please address the	
17			following:	
18				
19			Garda Keogh should be given formal advice regarding the	
20			investigation of crime and the importance of	12:55
21			interviewing witnesses	
22				
23			What efforts have been made to include or exclude the	
24			suspect identified? As two months have passed, this	
25			matter needs urgent attention.	12:55
26				
27			Sergeant Monaghan should ensure that Garda Keogh is	
28			supervised in bringing this matter to a conclusion so	
29			that the victims office can advised injured parties of	

1 the efforts An Garda Síochána put into solving their 2 crimes." 3 That would appear to be consistent perhaps with the 4 5 injured parties not having viewed the CCTV at that 12:56 point in time? 6 7 Oh, oh no, I would have had the injured parties in Α. 8 earlier to view it, because the camera system I think doesn't retain -- I am not sure how long it retains 9 footage, I am not sure if it's a month period or what 10 12:56 11 it is. But, no, I would have had them in fairly --12 there was one lady that came in view, from 13 recollection, the CCTV. She was under no doubt that it 14 was being followed up because she was sitting beside 15 me, viewing the CCTV with me. 12:56 16 250 Yes. Q. 17 So there was no issue there either. Α. 18 It's just that it doesn't appear in their original 251 Q. 19 statements, so it would have seemed logical that it must have been on some subsequent date. 20 Have you any 12:57

23 A. It could have been either that evening or the next day, 24 I'm not sure, but it would have been fairly lively. I 25 know I was busy when they came in to report the thing, 26 but it would have been -- it would have been -- it

note of the date on which they came in?

statement from them on that date?

21

22

27

28

29

would have been -- again, I'm working off memory, it would have been very -- either that evening, I presume, or the next day. But I do recall one of the witnesses

Did you take a

12:57

		came in and we went through the whole thing. For	
		clarification as well, it was me that nominated the	
		suspect, because I don't think in the statements that	
		they wrote themselves, I don't think they actually	
		nominated a suspect themselves.	12:5
252	Q.	Yes. Well, it's perhaps not clear who nominated them	
		in the original report. But this memo of the 3rd	
		September, I think that was sent down to you through	
		Sergeant Monaghan. Sergeant Monaghan seems to have	
		sent it to you on the 7th September, and then you, I	12:5
		think, send the reply back up on the 22nd September and	
		that's to be seen at page 208. That says:	
		"Sergeant Monaghan. With reference to the above, I	
		have already written on this and explained verbally to	12:5
		Superintendent Pat Murray regarding the statements	
		which are legally binding and valid made by the injured	
		parties on C8 forms, which were read over, both	
		witnesses have signed the same. When I got a chance, I	
		brought (somebody) into the CCTV room and viewed the	12:5
		footage with her but it did not show the suspect enter	
		or leave the building. I also wish to point out that	
		neither of the witnesses named a suspect in the	
		statement."	
			12:5
		So you clear that up. You nominated:	
		"the suspect who was in the area at the time, along	
	252	252 Q.	suspect, because I don't think in the statements that they wrote themselves, I don't think they actually nominated a suspect themselves. 252 Q. Yes. Well, it's perhaps not clear who nominated them in the original report. But this memo of the 3rd September, I think that was sent down to you through Sergeant Monaghan. Sergeant Monaghan seems to have sent it to you on the 7th September, and then you, I think, send the reply back up on the 22nd September and that's to be seen at page 208. That says: "Sergeant Monaghan. With reference to the above, I have already written on this and explained verbally to Superintendent Pat Murray regarding the statements which are legally binding and valid made by the injured parties on C8 forms, which were read over, both witnesses have signed the same. When I got a chance, I brought (somebody) into the CCTV room and viewed the footage with her but it did not show the suspect enter or leave the building. I also wish to point out that neither of the witnesses named a suspect in the statement." So you clear that up. You nominated:

with hundreds of other people for the triathlon. There

Т			is no evidence to fink him to this crime. Forwarded	
2			for your information."	
3				
4			Then Sergeant Monaghan then sends that up to the	
5			superintendent on the 5th, if we look at page 207. It	12:59
6			says:	
7				
8			"With reference to the above, please find attached	
9			report from Garda Keogh. Chapter 3 of the crime	
10			investigation manual has been brought to the attention	12:59
11			of Garda Keogh. Garda Keogh nominated (blank) for	
12			these thefts but since then has been unable to link him	
13			with the crimes. All CCTV was viewed and this gives no	
14			leads in the investigation. This case cannot be	
15			progressed at this time and any developments will be	13:00
16			reported to your office as they arise."	
17				
18			That seems to be endorsed by Superintendent Murray's	
19			handwriting, do you recognise is as that?	
20		Α.	Yeah.	13:00
21	253	Q.	It says:	
22				
23			"I note your views. The crime file has been sent to	
24			the victims office, who will inform the injured parties	
25			of the efforts made and the result. I do not expect to	13:00
26			see a repeat of the situation by the member involved."	
27				
28			Can we take it that that relates to you?	
29		Α.	Mm-hmm.	

1	254	Q.	Okay. Would you expect then to be required to take the	
2			statements yourself in accordance with the	
3			superintendent's wishes in that regard? Is that what	
4			you took from that?	
5		Α.	Is that the end? Is there not more in relation to	13:00
6			this?	
7	255	Q.	No, that's it, as I understand it?	
8	256	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you think there is more?	
9		Α.	I am just not sure, you see.	
10	257	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	13:01
11		Α.	There's a couple of these investigations.	
12			CHAIRMAN: That can be checked.	
13			MR. McGUINNESS: In relation to this one.	
14			CHAIRMAN: That can be checked out.	
15			MR. KELLY: I see that it's page 208.	13:01
16			CHAIRMAN: Just go to 208, Philip, thanks very much.	
17			MR. McGUINNESS: I think we've read page 208.	
18			CHAIRMAN: They don't appear in chronological sequence.	
19			We have had 208.	
20			MR. McGUINNESS: we have had 208.	13:01
21			CHAIRMAN: And then you went on to 202. Well, we will	
22			take a break here and we will return. Basically,	
23			obviously Superintendent Murray was making criticism	
24			very clear and presumably you will be asking Garda	
25			Keogh for his response to those, is that right? So we	13:02
26			will take it up then at two o'clock. Thanks very much.	
27				
28				
29			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH	

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS:	
2				
3	258	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Garda Keogh, we saw there just before	
4			the break the report that went back up to	
5			Superintendent Murray and his handwritten note. He	14:02
6			said, you know, when the file came back to him on the	
7			6th October, he closed it off, realising there was	
8			nothing more that could be done with it?	
9		Α.	Right.	
10	259	Q.	In a sense, you were able to provide that information	14:02
11			to him, about what was done, that allowed him to close	
12			it off?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	260	Q.	I am not adopting this as a criticism in any way of	
15			your investigation, he seems to have been approaching	14:02
16			matters quite differently from when he came in as chief	
17			superintendent, or superintendent, in terms of	
18			organising matters. I referred to it yesterday, but	
19			maybe it's appropriate just to look at it. Page 2039.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Do you mean when he came in as	14:03
21			superintendent?	
22			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Yes. So he was the new superintendent,	
24			replacing Superintendent McBrien?	
25			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	14:03
26			CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thanks.	
27	261	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Here, on this page, going into the	
28			next page, there's an A to V of initiatives. We will	
29			just start maybe at the top of 2039. He says he set	

1	about evaluating things and introducing initiatives for	
2	the purpose stated. He sets them out there. I am not	
3	going to debate any of them with you. But down at I	
4	was this instruction relating to the reporting of	
5	critical serious incidents, on the 18th August. That	4 : C
6	is his Exhibit PM 10. If we look at that on the	
7	screen. Just down the screen to I. That's it there.	
8	Just to continue on over the page, it shows all of the	
9	other things he produced or was in charge of at the	
10	time. L to V. Now I am not asking you to comment on	4:0
11	any of those. But he says in his statement to the	
12	Tribunal, in relation to this: He didn't feel that	
13	there was anything overly critical:	
14		
15	"but I intended to allow people to see the standard 14	4:0
16	I was setting. It was not a personal criticism of	
17	Garda Keogh in any way. I took the file as an example	
18	of the new framework and how it could assist in upping	
19	the game with that time of volume crime."	
20		

14:04

- Now, you didn't see it that way?
- A. No. I'm sorry, can we just look at the previous report that he wrote in relation to that theft at Custom Place.
- 25 262 Q. Yes.

14:05

- A. It was on the screen earlier, I just wanted to just have a quick glance at it.
- 28 263 Q. Yes, of course. It is at 202 to 203. He doesn't, in fact, refer to the instruction in it, which is a

- 1 curiosity, maybe an omission on his part. This file 2 started on the 4th July, and he introduces the instruction in the middle of August. 3 It's there obviously prior to him writing this memo to you of the 4 5 3rd September. But it seems to perhaps illustrate his 14:05 thinking, that he was trying to up the standard in 6 7 relation to what should be in a file. That this wasn't directed at anyone personally, this is what he was 8
- 10 A. You see, I'm not so sure about that. I think he has -- 14:06
 11 is it okay if we can just go back to the report he
 12 wrote in relation to the Custom Place.
- 13 264 Q. Yes. Let's go back to that, it's at page 202 to 203?

 14 A. Yeah.

asking all people to strive towards.

9

- 15 265 Q. This is the one you're talking about? This is the one 14:06 of the 3rd of --
- 17 A. Yeah. I mean, without even going into the contents of
 18 the report, I mean it's a really long report on a very,
 19 very -- on a non-issue essentially, in relation to the
 20 taking of statements. It's a very lengthy report. It 14:06
 21 took quite some time to do that report.
- 22 266 Q. Yes. Well, Inspector Minnock expressed a view in his 23 statement at page 691, asking parties, injured parties 24 or witness to write their own statement would not be 25 normal practice and in his view not best practice?

14 · 07

A. As I previously said, I have on numerous occasions over my career not -- not, sorry, numerous, on occasions over whatever, the last 20 years, in circumstances like that, where it's just a difficulty and it's awkward, I

- 1 would have, the odd time, got persons to do the
- 2 statement, make their own statements in that fashion.
- It was never questioned before. As I said, they are

14 · 07

14:08

14:08

- 4 perfectly legal and valid statements.
- 5 267 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. Was never ever questioned before by any previous
- 7 superintendent, ever.
- 8 268 Q. That is what I was going to ask you.
- 9 A. Oh yeah, sorry.
- 10 269 Q. Had any superintendent sent a file back to you in the
- 11 past?
- 12 A. Oh never, never. As I said, it would have been --
- we're talking perhaps once a year an incident would
- crop up, where one would be busy or there's an awkward
- situation or something or if you have to take a lot of
- statements, a number of statements together and you're
- on your own, in circumstances that where it's just
- awkward, the norm that I always would have done would
- be take the statement, sit down with someone, write out
- the statement, but in exceptional circumstances, and
- 21 this is one of them. But they were never ever
- questioned before any anyone else. They were always
- just accepted, fair enough, there's a statement there,
- it's valid, legally valid and that's it.
- 25 270 Q. May I say, I have made my own statements in my own
- 26 words to the guards on occasions, so it can be done
- 27 obviously?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 271 Q. But in circumstances where it is acknowledged not to be

1			best practice, is there anything wrong in the	
2			superintendent calling your attention to the fact that	
3			it isn't best practice?	
4		Α.	I completely I have to disagree with that.	
5	272	Q.	Okay.	14:09
6		Α.	I mean, how many over the years, in different court	
7			cases there's always where people would say, I didn't	
8			put that into my statement, the guard put that into my	
9			statement and I didn't. It actually probably is best	
10			practice, if one was to look at it. As I say, it's not	14:09
11			the norm in the Guards, but no one can accuse me of	
12			saying, oh, this particular thing, oh, you got so and	
13			so to or you put something in that wasn't they've	
14			written their own statement, it's their statement, I	
15			read it over to them, they signed it.	14:09
16	273	Q.	I am not going to ask you any more about that. Can I	
17			ask you to look at the instructions that had issued in	
18			the sort of interim period, at page 198 of the	
19			documents. It's dated 18th August, it's addressed to	
20			each sergeant, each member in the Athlone district. It	14:09
21			relates to the document referred to earlier, obviously	
22			it is the document.	
23				
24			"All incidents of a critical or serious nature must be	
25			subject of a short, concise report in addition to any	14:10
26			entry made on Pulse. A report in addition to the Pulse	
27			entry is necessary in order that local and divisional	
28			management are aware of the background surrounding all	

critical or serious incidents either reported or

1	discovered by members. There have been some excellent	
2	detections recorded in the district which displays	
3	outstanding police work by all members involved. It is	
4	important that the outstanding police work displayed is	
5	highlighted at a divisional and regional level to show	14:10
6	the commitment and dedication of the district force to	
7	the communities we serve and the organisation's goals	
8	and values."	
9		
10	Then he continues:	14:10
11		
12	"To ensure the reporting system works swiftly, the	
13	sergeant on duty at the time the incident is heard by	
14	either being reported or discovered, or in the	
15	sergeant's absence, the station orderly or Member in	14:10
16	Charge will prepare a short concise report, e-mail it	
17	to the district office e-mail, CC it to myself,	
18	Inspector Farrell, D/Sergeant Curley and Sergeant	
19	Baker.	
20		14:11
21	Reports are required for allserious and likely to	
22	generate the communityIn addition, this reporting	
23	system should be used to highlight excellent police	
24	work carried out."	
25		14:11
26	Then it continues on the next page	
27		
28	"The details that should be included are: Date, time,	

29

place of occurrence, brief and concise narrative

1			outlining the occurrence, details of all victims,	
2			includingdetails of any arrests made or planned to	
3			include power of assist used, detention used, name, age	
4			and gender of person, detail of investigative steps	
5			taken and those planned or suggested. Any other	14:11
6			information deemed necessary to provide a complete	
7			pi cture.	
8				
9			Please bring to the attention of each member for	
10			immediate implementation and for strict compliance."	14:11
11				
12			Now, I suppose you wouldn't quarrel with that, as it	
13			seems to be focusing everyone's mind on getting and	
14			recording, the details being available for all to see	
15			in an audit or in the report if they pick up the	14:12
16			investigation file or whatever?	
17		Α.	Yeah. I mean, I'm not disputing anything in that.	
18	274	Q.	Okay. Were you not really characterising it as a sort	
19			of retrospective attempt to, as it were, call you to	
20			account?	14:12
21		Α.	In relation to the taking of statements.	
22	275	Q.	Yes.	
23		Α.	Yes, he makes an issue of pretty much a non-issue.	
24	276	Q.	Okay.	
25		Α.	Like, he put a lot of time into that report over	14:12
26			statements that were perfectly legal. Now, correct me	
27			if I'm wrong, I am not a legal expert.	
28	277	Q.	Yes.	
29		Α.	But I don't think it would be an issue in any court if	

- there were to be a prosecution in relation to those statements.
- 3 278 Q. Yes. I am not sure that he is addressing that in the
- 4 report to you, but he seems to be envisaging under this
- and perhaps implicitly in his report, that the initial

14:13

14:13

- 6 investigation file should, as it were, contain as much
- 7 as possible in relation to the offence that's being
- 8 investigated. You couldn't disagree with that in
- 9 principle?
- 10 A. No, no. But just for clarification like, I would have
- put those two incidents on Pulse as well. So I had two
- 12 separate incidents on Pulse.
- 13 279 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. Because there are two separate thefts, which I
- previously explained. All that information in there
- 16 would have been recorded on Pulse. So I would have
- 17 complied with all those.
- 18 280 Q. No, I understand that. Perhaps the thing could have
- 19 been avoided if all the details in your final report
- 20 had been included in the initial investigation file,
- 21 would that be a fair comment or not?
- 22 A. Sorry, I am just not -- I am a little bit unclear on
- that.
- 24 281 Q. You see, the matter closed off when you sent your final
- reply to the superintendent?
- 26 A. Yeah.
- 27 282 Q. In September, isn't that right?
- 28 A. Yeah.
- 29 283 Q. We've already looked at that. I mean you were

- furnishing the details then of how it was that the
 person had become nominated as the suspect if possible
 and then how they had been then ruled out?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 284 Q. That there was, in fact, nothing to connect the suspect 14:14 to the crime?
- 7 A. Yes.

8 285 Q. I mean, he seemed to think, it would seem, that there
9 could have been more detail in your investigation file
10 report at the beginning, that those might have been

14 · 14

14:15

12 A. Like what?

included?

- 13 286 Q. Well, the fact that you had nominated the suspect and
 14 outlining any steps to try and connect him via the
 15 injured parties?
- A. Well, I think that's addressed in the crime file. I
 think I say I looked at the CCTV, nominated this fella.
 I think. I am just going from that, this is what,
- 20 2015. But I think I did address those on the crime file. So there's two incidents on Pulse; there's a crime file as well gone in also.
- 22 287 Q. Do you see this as Superintendent Murray getting at you?
- A. Oh absolutely. Like, that's a big long report on something that really is a non-issue. That is my take on it. I could be -- I'm in your hands there, but that's the way I took at it.
- 28 288 Q. It's just, I am anxious obviously to give you every opportunity to voice your criticisms?

1 Α. Yes. 2 Mr. Marrinan is going to be dealing with Superintendent 289 Q. 3 Murray, he will be making obviously the same sort of enquiries of Superintendent Murray about what he did. 4 5 We want to be sure we have it chapter and verse from 14:16 6 you? 7 Yeah. Α. You follow that? 8 290 Q. 9 Mmm Α. Well, moving on to the second incident, this was a 10 291 Q. 14 · 16 11 theft at Dublin Road on the 7th/8th August, which was 12 given a Pulse ID. That's dealt with by you in your 13 statement, at page 131 to 133, and at documents from 14 Perhaps we will just look at the first page of 15 that. It says: 14:16 16 "Theft." 17 18 19 Page 213. It says there: 20 14:17 21 "CCTV viewed to no avail as it is poor quality." 22 23 Yeah. Α. 24 292 Is that "no ID for suspect"? Then, there was an Q. 25 additional inquiry recorded on the next page at item 14:17 26 12, I think that's your handwriting? 27 Yeah, it is. Α. So was that done later? 28 293 Q. 29 I just have to read it first, sorry. Α.

1	294	Q.	Yes. It says:	
2			"Carda CCTV vi awad ari ma accurred 4, 21 4, 24 9/9 Poor	
			"Garda CCTV viewed, crime occurred 4:31-4:34 8/8. Poor	
4			quality footage of car moving with stolen trailer	
5			hi tched.	14:18
6 7				
7			Comments: Unable to make out registration number,	
8			colour or type of car."	
9				
10			This is one of the crime files that Superintendent	14:18
11			Murray raised a query about. If we look at page 215,	
12			on the 14th August:	
13				
14			"In relation to the stolen trailer, who supplied CCTV?	
15			J	14:18
16			been made to enhance the CCTV? Should it be circulated	
17			anyway? Where is the CCTV now?"	
18				
19			So, it would seem obvious but I want to give you an	
20			opportunity to comment on this	14:19
21		Α.	Just for clarification, the first line there:	
22				
23			"Who wrote the statements on attached C8s?"	
24				
25	295	Q.	That relates to one of the other ones?	14:19
26		Α.	Yeah, I knew there was more when I said, is that all.	
27			I wasn't trying to be smart.	
28	296	Q.	Yes.	
29		Α.	Just from recollection, I thought you see, when the	

Т			paper starts coming down to me, it seems to go a	
2			couple of these we will see in this one also,	
3			connected with another one, where he is questioning me	
4			on a couple of different investigations. Then he rolls	
5			them all into like this. That first line is related	14:19
6			to the previous one.	
7	297	Q.	Yes, that's right.	
8		Α.	Yeah, sorry.	
9	298	Q.	These are files that are all currently ongoing and	
10			live.	14:19
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	299	Q.	And being dealt with at different levels at different	
13			times, in different ways obviously. So, it would	
14			appear that the additional enquiry hadn't occurred	
15			before wrote this?	14:20
16		Α.	Sorry, just looking at this. Actually he's writing	
17			down to me now, I think, on three separate incidents.	
18	300	Q.	Yes.	
19		Α.	These are three separate incidents. The first one is	
20			what we've already dealt with. The second one,	14:20
21			Mulligan's, I think it's some way in this, but he	
22			writes down with this and the theft of the trailer, the	
23			two of them in kind of the one correspondence. The	
24			third one, yes, is the theft of the trailer, yes.	
25	301	Q.	Yes. So he has obviously got the file without the	14:20
26			additional enquiries recorded on it, they were done	
27			later by you?	
28		Α.	That incident occurred at 4 to 4:30am in the morning,	
29			which we have just seen.	

- 1 302 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. When that incident occurred, I went to Kilmartin's
- 3 petrol station. Sorry, I know I named the location,
- 4 but it's actually not relevant, Judge, for anything
- here anyway. I went to a 24-hour petrol station that

14:21

- 6 night, and I asked to view the CCTV at the petrol
- 7 station.
- 8 303 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. The young lad at 4am, 4:30, 5, whatever, that night,
- the early hours of the morning I called down to him, he 14:21
- couldn't work -- he wasn't able to operate the CCTV.
- 12 So he had to wait for someone to -- basically about a
- 13 week later I get the CCTV footage in relation to that
- 14 incident. But I had requested it that night, but I
- don't get it. So I can't really advance anything until 14:21
- I get the CCTV from that petrol station.
- 17 304 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. So that's sort of out of my hands there.
- 19 305 Q. Yes. But the entry then wasn't put in on that night,
- 20
- "CCTV viewed to no avail."
- 22
- 23 Is that right?
- A. You see, I got a number of CCTV, I did a petrol
- 25 station, a pub. Oh yeah, I viewed -- I am able to see
- a car from CCTV from some pub in relation to -- but I
- can't make out the details. It's not until we get the
- footage from the petrol station that I make out the
- identification on the car, which is later.

- 1 306 Q. Yes.
- 2 CHAIRMAN: Take your time.
- 3 A. Sorry.
- 4 307 Q. CHAIRMAN: Don't get confused. No, no, no. There's a
- 5 number of different incidents and there's a number of
- 6 different CCTVs. Now, you were just talking, as I
- 7 understand, about Mulligan's filling station.
- 8 A. No, we haven't got to that one yet, Judge.
- 9 308 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay, very good.
- 10 A. That's separate.
- 11 309 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, that's all right. This was the trailer
- 12 question?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 310 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. The trailer question was on 17th
- 15 August '15, is that correct?

14:23

14 · 23

14:22

14 · 23

- 16 A. I just --
- 17 311 Q. CHAIRMAN: I don't expect you to remember the date.
- 18 Whenever it was, the trailer issue. The trailer
- 19 question, you obviously wanted to view the CCTV?
- 20 A. Yes.
 -
- 21 312 Q. CHAIRMAN: In regard to the trailer question. And as I
- 22 understand, it wasn't sufficiently clear to --
- 23 A. On.
- 24 313 Q. CHAIRMAN: Go on, on?
- 25 A. The first CCTV I viewed we can make out, we can make
- out, let's say, something passing by.
- 27 314 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 28 A. The trailer. But can't --
- 29 315 Q. CHAIRMAN: Nice and slowly.

- 1 A. It's not clear.
- 2 316 Q. CHAIRMAN: Does that mean there's two CCTVs?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 317 Q. CHAIRMAN: No more than two?
- 5 A. There could have been even -- I'm not sure if there was 14:23

14 · 24

14:24

- 6 a third.
- 7 318 Q. CHAIRMAN: A number. More than one, there was more
- 8 than one?
- 9 A. From recollection, I don't think there was anything on
- one. There was a blurry --
- 11 319 Q. CHAIRMAN: Don't worry, you're going too far ahead of
- 12 me.
- 13 A. Sorry.
- 14 320 Q. CHAIRMAN: I just want to make sure, this is the
- 15 trailer theft that's reported to you?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 321 Q. CHAIRMAN: You go to the scene, is that right?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 322 Q. CHAIRMAN: You visit the scene?
- 20 A. I can't remember, the injured party, yes, he comes in,
- I think he comes in and reports it, just from
- 22 recollection.
- 23 323 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's all right, as best you can. If it
- turns out that that's wrong, that's okay, but you for
- the moment you think he came in and he reported it?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 324 Q. CHAIRMAN: Does that mean that you went out?
- 28 A. I would have gone out, yes. The pub, from
- recollection, I think was closed that night. I called

1			then to the 24-hour station, a different petrol station	
2			from	
3	325	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Because they had CCTV?	
4		Α.	Yes, they had excellent CCTV but the guy couldn't work	
5			the CCTV.	14:24
6	326	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
7		Α.	I asked for whenever they could.	
8	327	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So it took some time?	
9		Α.	It took about a week.	
10	328	Q.	CHAIRMAN: To get at least one of the CCTVs, is that	14:25
11			right?	
12		Α.	To get the good CCTV, yes.	
13	329	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. But you had seen the no so good	
14			CCTVs?	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:25
16	330	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Possibly two of them, possibly two, one	
17			certainly?	
18		Α.	I don't think there was anything on it.	
19	331	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And it took you some time to get the good	
20			one?	14:25
21		Α.	About a week.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Okay, all right. Sorry, I am just trying to	
23			get this clear in my head.	
24	332	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. The questions that he raised in	
25			relation to the trailer there, on page 215:	14:25
26				
27			"Who supplied the CCTV? No statement taken from that	
28			person? Has any effort been made to enhance the CCTV?	
29			Should it be circulated in any way? Where is the CCTV	

Т			NOW?	
2				
3			That query must have arisen because it's the only	
4			reference to CCTV. There is a tick at number 7, where	
5			it says there is CCTV. The supervisor puts in on the	14:26
6			page later, is it later? Is that your writing?	
7		Α.	Is this page 215.	
8	333	Q.	That's page 215. If we go back to page 213. Your name	
9			is there, Nick Keogh?	
10		Α.	Yes.	14:26
11	334	Q.	And then the supervisor. Then whose writing is that?	
12		Α.	That's sergeant I can't make out the signature.	
13			It's one of the sergeants anyway.	
14	335	Q.	Yes.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Sergeant Moylan?	14:26
16		Α.	I presume it's Sergeant Moylan.	
17	336	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's to be clarified in due course, okay.	
18			Anyway, yes.	
19	337	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: That entry was only put in obviously	
20			after the CCTV had been viewed?	14:27
21		Α.	Yeah, this would be the first, this would be the poor	
22			quality CCTV, CCTV given to no avail. I couldn't	
23			progress the matter with the particular CCTV that I got	
24			from that bar.	
25	338	Q.	I suppose two separate issues, just to be clear. You	14:27
26			didn't write this, this wasn't a CCTV that you viewed,	
27			because I thought you told us you couldn't view it on	
28			the night?	
29		Α.	Correct. Yeah, I don't think I get the good quality	

Τ			CCTV until someone can download, someone can work the	
2			thing, download it. I think that's left in the	
3			station. I just vaguely remember I arrived in to work	
4			and it was left in an envelope for me and then I get, I	
5			am able to what I do then is, I contact the	14:27
6			injured from recollection, contact the injured	
7			party, he comes down and views the CCTV with me in the	
8			station. Sorry, I am getting mixed up. That's the	
9			poor quality one, is where I view it with the injured	
10			party. We see a car with the trailer but we just can't	14:28
11			make out the car. We get then the same car later on at	
12			the petrol station. But I don't know that at this	
13			point.	
14	339	Q.	No, you don't. The point I am making here is that this	
15			entry is unlikely to have been made on this file that	14:28
16			night. It was only made after the poor quality CCTV	
17			DVD was viewed by you later?	
18		Α.	I presume. I think, I am not sure if I am	
19			understanding the question, that's all. But I think	
20			the date that I wrote that should be on it, on the	14:29
21			report, I presume.	
22	340	Q.	There's a signature of	
23			CHAIRMAN: The sergeant.	
24	341	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: the sergeant there, on 11/8, which	
25			is sort of four days later. I am trying to ask a	14:29
26			question which if you look at the next page, this	
27			says?	
28				
29			"Additional inquiries conducted. Garda CCTV viewed.	

Т			Crime occurred at 4:31."	
2				
3			That is the CCTV referred to on the first page as being	
4			of poor quality.	
5		Α.	Correct, yes.	14:29
6	342	Q.	So that was not on the form originally. All the	
7			indication of the CCTV on the form originally was the	
8			tick that you put in box number 7 on the next page,	
9			further up that page, I beg your pardon.	
10		Α.	Can we just go back to that?	14:30
11	343	Q.	Do you want to take a paper copy in case it's easier?	
12		Α.	Please, could I?	
13			CHAIRMAN: Yes, that might be a good idea.	
14			MR. McGUINNESS: Volume 1, page 213. You may be able	
15			to flick backward and forward. As I understand your	14:30
16			narrative	
17			CHAIRMAN: Just give him a chance to have a look,	
18			Mr. McGuinness.	
19	344	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, of course.	
20		Α.	Yeah, okay.	14:30
21	345	Q.	As I understand it, you knew there was CCTV on the	
22			night, isn't that right, of the incident, but you	
23			weren't able to view it, that's what you told us?	
24		Α.	No, sorry. I am sorry, I am working from recollection	
25			from a number of years ago as well. So bear with me.	14:31
26			I mightn't explain it great.	
27	346	Q.	Take your time.	
28		Α.	I may not explain it great, but I'll try and get it.	
29			When the injured party reported this to me, with him I	

- view the poor quality CCTV. On the night of the theft
 I had gone to Kilmartin's petrol station, where I had
 asked -- where I have already said, I've asked, the
 young lad couldn't work it. So I don't get the good -we don't know there is CCTV on the Kilmartin's thing at 14:31
 all.
- 7 347 Q. Yes.
- 8 I had left the details with the operator, with the Α. young lad to pass it on to whoever could monitor the 9 CCTV, look at the CCTV and he actually found a car with 14:31 10 11 a trailer pulling up to fill petrol in it. 12 didn't actually know there was anything, it was just I 13 had looked for CCTV, but we didn't know until --14 luckily it turned out there was that car. The car, after they swiped the trailer, pulled in for petrol 15 14:32 16 down the road into that petrol station. I get the CCTV a week later, let's say, after I write this document. 17
- 18 348 Q. Well, you see, that doesn't help me, because I am

 19 trying to find out what bits of the document you wrote

 20 when. I think you have told us that the entry on the

 21 first page wasn't written by you on the night, "CCTV

 22 viewed", isn't that correct?
- 23 A. That's the sergeant.
- 24 349 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. The sergeant has dated this the 11/8/15. So I presume 14:32
 26 that's -- I can only presume that's the date I sent it
 27 to the sergeant. I am just presuming, obviously I
 28 don't know.
- 29 350 Q. The entry that is yours on the next page, could I

1			suggest, if we stop there at 7, slightly up, did you	
2			tick that box, marking CCTV on the night, because you	
3			knew there was CCTV which you hadn't either seen or	
4			downloaded on the night in question?	
5		Α.	That's correct. But that CCTV, we didn't know if there	14:33
6			was anything on it.	
7	351	Q.	Indeed.	
8		Α.	It was only poor chance -	
9	352	Q.	Indeed.	
10		Α.	- that I had enquired.	14:33
11	353	Q.	Indeed.	
12		Α.	I wasn't even expecting that these criminals would	
13			steal a trailer and then pull in to a petrol station	
14			down the road with the trailer.	
15	354	Q.	Yes.	14:33
16		Α.	I just asked, is there a chance I could view the CCTV,	
17			the car pulls in at such and such a time, and I get	
18			that CCTV roughly a week later.	
19	355	Q.	Yes. But can we just then look at the next entry,	
20			which I think is your handwriting, is it? Number 12?	14:34
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	356	Q.	This says:	
23				
24			"Garda CCTV viewed, crime occurred at 4:31-4:34, 8/8,	
25			poor quality footage of car moving with stolen trailer	14:34
26			hi tched."	
27				
28			That is not the Kilmartin's one	
29		Α.	Correct, actually, yeah. Garda CCTV, I knew there was	

Т			another CCTV. Yean, on the Garda CCTV was the one	
2			actually that I had the injured party in that we viewed	
3			and again we couldn't, just couldn't he was able to	
4			spot where he lived and that the car had pulled out.	
5			We seen the car pulling out with the trailer but that	14:34
6			was and the direction of travel it went. That was	
7			all we could ascertain at that point in time.	
8	357	Q.	The remarks then underneath, that's your remark:	
9				
10			"Unable to make out registration number, colour of	14:34
11			car."	
12				
13		Α.	Correct.	
14	358	Q.	You were only able to make those entries and put them	
15			on here, as you say, perhaps a week later, after you	14:35
16			had viewed that CCTV?	
17		Α.	Yes. Like I would have this is after I viewed the	
18			CCTV, of course.	
19	359	Q.	Yes.	
20		Α.	I would have had to have viewed the CCTV to write what	14:35
21			I wrote there.	
22	360	Q.	Yes. Superintendent Murray gets the investigation file	
23			with whatever is recorded on it by the date he writes	
24			his query of the 14th August, at page 215?	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:35
26	361	Q.	He is raising these questions:	
27				
28			"In relation to the stolen trailer, who supplied CCTV?	

No statement from that person on file. Has any effort

Т			been made to enhance the CCTV? Should it be circulated	
2			in any way? Where is it now?"	
3				
4			So he is raising those issues. You reply to him, if we	
5			look at 216, which appears to be the 28th August, to	14:36
6			Sergeant Monaghan. It's the third entry that we are	
7			concerned with:	
8				
9			"It is Garda CCTV which is stored on computer. The	
10			incident happened at night and the quality is poor."	14:36
11				
12			So, perhaps the additional remarks didn't relate to the	
13			trailer actually being towed away, is that possible?	
14		Α.	I'm sorry, I'm lost.	
15	362	Q.	Well, here is a question, and I hope it's as clear as I	14:36
16			intend it to be: Was it the Garda CCTV that showed the	
17			trailer being towed away or was it Kilmartin's?	
18		Α.	No, no, it was the Garda CCTV that showed the trailer	
19			being towed away. Kilmartin's is approximately a week	
20			later. I have already requested the CCTV from	14:37
21			Kilmartin's, but I don't get it till a week later. But	
22			that's good quality.	
23	363	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That shows a vehicle, a car and trailer?	
24		Α.	A car and trailer and the injured party	
25	364	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Somewhat carelessly robbing a trailer and	14:37
26			then having to pull in for petrol?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	365	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But there it is. Well, who knows.	
29		Α.	Exactly.	

1	366	Q.	CHAIRMAN: What's to explain what people do. But it	
2			does seem curious and somewhat inefficient. But that's	
3			what it looks like.	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	14:37
6	367	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Sergeant Monaghan sends that up,	
7			saying that:	
8				
9			"The only CCTV footage available to cover the location	
10			of the theft is Garda CCTV and on viewing it the	14:37
11			quality is poor, as it was nighttime. This CCTV is	
12			stored on the hard drive in the station."	
13				
14			So he is able to tell the superintendent where that	
15			CCTV is. Then it's recorded here for the first time	14:38
16			that:	
17				
18			"Garda Keogh has since obtained CCTV footage from	
19			Kilmartin's N6 Centre, this shows two possible suspect	
20			vehicles which has updated the incident with. Is that	14:38
21			on Pulse? Enquiries are ongoing in this case and any	
22			progress will be reported."	
23				
24			Superintendent Murray then, on the 3rd September, sends	
25			a memo back down to the sergeant in charge, it's at	14:38
26			page 219. He says as follows on the 3rd September:	
27				
28			"The incident regarding the theft of the trailer	
29			requires further explanation in relation to the CCTV.	

1	It appears the crime file was submitted prematurely,	
2	indicating no evidence was available and now evidence	
3	has come to light following a request for further	
4	i nformati on.	
5		14:39
6	The following issues have not been dealt with:	
7		
8	1. My question in relation to CCTV in correspondence	
9	dated 14/8 has not been answered;	
10		14:39
11	2. The car identified was involved in a burglary in	
12	Ballinasloe on the 9th May. What liaison has occurred	
13	with the investigating member of that incident?	
14		
15	3. How is it proposed to allow the CCTV harvested to	14:39
16	assist the investigation?	
17		
18	4. Where is the CCTV now from an evidential point of	
19	vi ew?	
20		14:39
21	Sergeant Monaghan should supervise the proper	
22	investigation of this crime so that we can show to the	
23	victim we were thorough and professional in our	
24	approach to solving the crime."	
25		14:39
26	That had been then followed up by Sergeant Monaghan to	
27	you on the 8th September, where you clarified, in	
28	answer to the four points there:	
29		

1			"Sergeant Monaghan. Garda CCTV of poor quality saved,	
2			Kilmartin CCTV downloaded. Statement regarding same	
3			attached to file. Garda Keogh has spoken with Garda X	
4			and supplied garda with as copy of the Kilmartin CCTV	
5			of car and suspect. Both incidents connected on Pulse.	14:40
6			Warning attached to the car registration, which is	
7			registered to a false address."	
8				
9			Under 3:	
10				14:40
11			"CCTV forwarded with a request to be put on G Tube on	
12			10/9.	
13				
14			Garda Keogh has original CCTV. Copies of same	
15			forwarded to garda (blank) at Ballinasloe Garda station	14:40
16			and G Tube. "	
17				
18			That's signed by you then on that date. That would	
19			appear to answer the questions obviously	
20		Α.	Mm-hmm.	14:41
21	368	Q.	Now, that is sent up with a statement from Kilmartin's,	
22			page 221. Then on page 222, Sergeant Monaghan sends	
23			your report to the superintendent and says in the text	
24			of it there, in the middle:	
25				14:41
26			"All the CCTV saved. Originals in the possession of	
27			Garda Keogh. A copy of CCTV has been forwarded to	
28			Garda in Ballinasloe. Garda Keogh has been in contact	
29			with this member in relation to possible suspects for	

Т			both case. Another copy has been forwarded to the	
2			collator in Mullingar to be uploaded on G Tube. Garda	
3			Keogh has put a warning on Pulse in relation to the	
4			suspected offending vehicle, has made contact with	
5			Gardaí in Kildare where the car is registered to. This	14:41
6			address is false. This crime is still under	
7			investigation and any further progress will be reported	
8			as it arises."	
9				
10			Superintendent Murray seemed to have noted there:	14:42
11				
12			"Noted. I appreciate the additional enquiries carried	
13			out, which ensure the organisation is achieving its	
14			goals in relation to the investigation of crime.	
15			Report on the efforts at identification by the 1st	14:42
16			November."	
17				
18			So he appears to be expressing appreciation of what you	
19			had done there. Were you aware of that at the time?	
20		Α.	I think there's more.	14:42
21	369	Q.	It appears that you probably were, because there is a	
22			document at page 223?	
23		Α.	There's nothing really like again, there's nothing	
24			for him to criticise really at this point. I thought	
25			this was the one where at some point he implies that	14:43
26			it's only where he gets involved in the thing that	
27			there's progress made. We skipped page 221, which is	
28			the statement at Kilmartin's, which kind of is what I	
29			said, where I go down the night of the crime and I look	

_	2 = 2	_	110	
2	370	Q.	Well?	
3		Α.	Sorry.	
4	371	Q.	You're contacted on the 8th. But he views it on the	
5			10th and he downloaded and handed it over then, it	14:43
6			would appear, isn't that right? But if we look at 223,	
7			Sergeant Monaghan appears to send on the minute from	
8			Superintendent Murray to you and then asking you to	
9			report any developments as required by the 1st	
10			November. Now you've included this as an aspect of	14:44
11			targeting, is that because of the initial request from	
12			Superintendent Murray?	
13		Α.	No. Again, I think, like the previous thing, I think	
14			this is then rolled into is this not rolled into	
15			more (Inaudible), like what we saw in that previous	14:44
16			page, where I am questioned about three different	
17			investigations on one sheet. I think that this doesn't	
18			just I could be wrong, but I think there is an end	
19			there. I am not sure.	
20	372	Q.	Well, I mean, what Superintendent Murray says in his	14:44
21			statement, page 2049, is that:	
22				
23			"Queries generated in this case were not in any way	
24			directed to Garda Keogh personally but were intended to	
25			ensure the investigations were carried out to a high	14:44
26			standard to fulfil his obligations as district	
27			offi cer. "	
28				
29			Inspector Minnock, in a sense, goes further and says at	

for the CCTV.

1			690:	
2				
3			"These further investigations undertaken by Garda Keogh	
4			resulted in good work and the successful identification	
5			of the suspect vehicle on CCTV footage. The good work	14:45
6			was highlighted to me as part of the ongoing oversight	
7			of incidents on Pulse."	
8				
9			He also expresses the view that:	
10				14:45
11			"It is clear to me that the queries kept the	
12			investigation open and there was a successful outcome	
13			to the investigation. It appears Chief Superintendent	
14			Murray was also complimentary in relation to the	
15			further work conducted by Garda Keogh in stating that	14:45
16			he appreciated the additional inquiries."	
17				
18			They in fact identified suspects who were arrested for	
19			this, isn't that correct?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:46
21	373	Q.	I think you made an application for overtime to attend	
22			I think for the purpose of the court proceedings in	
23			relation to that?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	374	Q.	That was granted by Superintendent Murray?	14:46
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	375	Q.	I think you reported in on the basis of a relapse a	
28			couple of days before that?	
29		Δ	Ves T couldn't attend T wasn't veah	

- Okay. I think you certainly phoned at some stage on the day of the arrest to say that you wouldn't be there and told people were the file was? A. Yeah, I did. I knew, I just couldn't -- but I did
- A. Yeah, I did. I knew, I just couldn't -- but I did

 leave it in a position that others were able to -- the 14:46

 State wasn't at any disadvantage, another guard was able to deal with it.
- 8 377 Q. I think there was a conviction actually secured in the case then as well?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 378 Q. You became aware of that also. Do you regard yourself
 12 as having been sort of prodded to make the enquiries
 13 which led to the breakthrough, or is that something you
 14 were doing yourself in relation to the investigation?
- 15 A. The breakthrough was made essentially by taking a
 14:47
 16 chance of going around to Kilmartin's petrol station
 17 that night and asking them, can you just check your
 18 CCTV to see did a car arrive in between such and such a
 19 time and such a such a time with a trailer. Like
 20 because the car had gone in that direction, pure
 14:47
- 22 379 Q. Yes.

chance.

21

- A. And as it happened, the car did pull in. And that's how we got the footage.
- 25 380 Q. Yes.

26 A. In relation to the injured party in any doubt, the
27 injured party I was working with and, as I said, was in
28 the station, viewing the original Garda CCTV. I am
29 sure I would have had to have shown the other CCTV

14 · 48

Τ			obviously to say, is this your trailer and take a	
2			statement or whatever way it went from there, I just	
3			can't recall. But I was in regular touch with the	
4			injured party myself in relation to that. So the	
5			injured party knew that we were doing our bit.	14:48
6	381	Q.	Yes. But in terms of the requirement made of you by	
7			Superintendent Murray in his memo of the 14th August	
8			that we have seen at page 215, do they not appear to be	
9			sort of reasonable requests in relation to the	
10			information that would have been available to him on	14:49
11			the investigation file?	
12		Α.	This is page 219.	
13	382	Q.	215, the third paragraph.	
14		Α.	Sorry, what's your question in relation to that?	
15	383	Q.	The question was: Are those sort of enquiries or	14:49
16			queries not reasonable perhaps in the light of the	
17			limited enough information that would have been	
18			available to him on the investigation file as submitted	
19			to him at that time?	
20		Α.	That's fair enough, but again, on this document, you	14:49
21			see, he's rolling three separate investigations into	
22			one on this document.	
23	384	Q.	Is that sorry go ahead?	
24		Α.	Like, you know. There's the C8s, then there's the	
25			Mulligan's, sorry then there's the yeah, Mulligan's	14:50
26			and then there is what we are dealing with now, the	
27			stolen trailer. So these are all rolled in to one. I	
28			am not sure, but I think that crops up again, where	
29			there's more queries down the line, where they are	

- rolled in again together. So I'm not sure if this just ends here or not.
- 3 385 Q. Well, I think I have opened all the documents. But do 4 you think there are other documents?
- 5 I'm not sure. But as I said previously, when I was Α. 14:50 6 giving evidence before we broke, that, was that it? 7 had a feeling that what he starts to do then is, he 8 rolls all these investigations, where -- on this single sheet of paper, he is now writing down effectively on 9 three separate investigations, three totally different 10 14:51 11 investigations with different things.
- 12 386 Q. I mean, I know you won't be keen for me to mention
 13 Assistant Commissioner Finn's investigation, but I mean
 14 he seemed to have viewed it as not an inappropriate use
 15 of his authority to ensure that all reasonable 14:51
 16 enquiries were pursued and that you had in fact been
 17 praised for following it through?
- A. Yeah. No, this part, as it is now, it's fair enough.

 But I mean, do we not -- perhaps, you see this might

 crop up again in further sheets in relation to other

 stuff. I'm not sure.
- 22 387 Q. All right. I know you have told us previously that no 23 other superintendent had sent down queries on sort of 24 investigation files, that you took as criticism?

14 · 52

- 25 A. Not on this level. Not on this level.
- 26 388 Q. But do you take this one as criticism? Do you take 27 this as targeting and discrediting?
- A. Well I do, because here we have on the first one is
 C8s, is on the very first line, which we've dealt with.

- 1 The second thing, Mulligan's thing, are we getting on 2 to that, because that's criticism there.
- 3 389 Q. we are dealing with all of them but we are dealing with 4 them one at a time.

14:53

- 5 Sorry. Α.
- 6 390 I am not trying to stop you making a general comment, Q. 7 please do.
- 8 Yeah. I mean, in relation to that, I mean, there's no Α. issue there. The only issue I have is, somewhere, from 9 recollection, I think he writes something down which 10 14:52 11 implies that I only going to get the CCTV, the relevant CCTV because he had written down to me. I recollect 12 13 reading something and it might be further on down in 14 another paper, which I am not sure of.
- 15 Well, I mean, I am not criticising you at all, I am 391 Q. 16 just trying to establish what the facts are. There 17 doesn't appear to have been any mention or distinction 18 between the two types of CCTV that you were aware of on 19 the night and no information such that he raised 20 queries about what CCTV you were talking about. That's 14:53 what all those questions are relating to. But on its 21 22 own, I don't want to misinterpret it, but just looking at that query, the third query on that page, do you see 23 24 that as targeting?
- 25 Just on those two lines, he's entitled to ask those Α. 14:53 26 questions, on those.
- 27 392 we will pass on to the next one and then we will come Q. 28 back to the sort of combined effect, as it were, if you 29 want to on that. The next one is criminal damage.

1			Mulligan's filling station on the 7th and the 8th	
2			August. This was one that was reported on by you also,	
3			isn't that correct?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	393	Q.	I will just get the page. This arose out of a report	14:54
6			put in by you. If we look at page 215, he has raised a	
7			query in relation to your report, which had named a	
8			particular family, isn't that correct? We don't need	
9			to name them now here?	
10		Α.	Well I won't be naming them but I know the family,	14:55
11			yeah.	
12	394	Q.	Yes.	
13		Α.	Yeah. Sorry what page are you on now?	
14	395	Q.	Yes, just bear with me.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Is that a convenient time to take a little	14:56
16			break?	
17			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, Chairman. I have just lost my	
18			place on this document.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Anyway, we usually break mid afternoon. So	
20			that's as convenient a time. I am sure you'd probably	14:56
21			appreciate a break. So we will do that and then we	
22			clarify. So, if I said ten minutes, is that fair?	
23			MR. McGUI NNESS: Thank you.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thank you very much.	
25				14:56
26			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS	
27			FOLLOWS:	
28				

MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you, Chairman. The document was

1			not where I expected it to be.	
2			CHAIRMAN: That's all right.	
3	396	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: In any event, the original file	
4			investigation that we are concerned here with,	
5			Mulligan's filling station, it doesn't appear to be in	15:0
6			your papers, but we have located that at page 8942,	
7			which is in Volume 31. For whatever reason it's a poor	
8			copy, it says:	
9				
10			"Criminal damage Mulligan's filling station, Roscommon	15:0
11			Road, Sunday, 3rd August. Nick Keogh, supervisor	
12			Dermot Monaghan. No suspects to date."	
13				
14			Is that your handwriting there?	
15		Α.	Not the "no suspects to date", the rest of it is mine.	15:0
16	397	Q.	Okay, there is an entry on the next page:	
17				
18			"Additional inquiries, area searched for culprits."	
19				
20			It would appear that that file went up to	15:1
21			Superintendent Murray and he considered it on the 14th.	
22			If we go back to page 215 in Volume 1, that we were	
23			looking at there, he says there in the middle sentence:	
24				
25			"In relation to Mulligan's, it appears (blank) may be	15:1
26			suspect. Was this put to them in any way?"	
27				
28			You describe the queries in general from Superintendent	
29			Murray as onnressive and irrational You said that	

1			this was oppressive in the sense of Superintendent	
2			Murray, you put it, colourfully, is:	
3				
4			"Pie out of the sky nominating these suspects"."	
5				15:10
6			And criticising you for not having nominating them	
7			because they lived two miles away, you said, and had no	
8			transport. The query is sent to you and you answer it	
9			then on the 20th August, page 216. It's the second	
10			query that you reply to on that page. It says:	15:11
11				
12			"In relation to (blank) being suspect, there is no	
13			evidence to suggest this and when I spoke to	
14			(bl ank)"	
15				15:11
16			Who is, I think, the owner?	
17		Α.	The injured party and the owner.	
18	398	Q.		
19			"he did not feel it could be as they could not	
20			frequent this area."	15:11
21				
22			Sergeant Monaghan reported that up later that day to	
23			the superintendent and in the second paragraph there,	
24			Sergeant Monaghan sort of conveyed that:	
25				15:12
26			"In relation to that, Garda Keogh indicates there is no	
27			evidence to suspect the (blanks) of this damage. On	
28			speaking with the owner, he is happy it was not the	
29			(blanks) as they do not frequent this area. Any	

Т			developments will be reported.	
2				
3			It goes to Superintendent Murray and on the 3rd	
4			September, in the letter that we have already seen, but	
5			the final paragraph of that:	15:12
6				
7			"The crime file in relation to Mulligan's has been sent	
8			to the victims office so they can inform the injured	
9			party of our lack of progress due to the unavailability	
10			of avenues of inquiry to progress the case."	15:12
11				
12			I think that was the extent of any query that was	
13			raised and your response that dealt with it. The	
14			investigation file that we have looked at, I am not	
15			sure there is any reference to speaking to the owner,	15:13
16			the injured party on it, but you hadn't identified any	
17			suspects yourself?	
18		Α.	No. Actually, just on that incident, we were actually	
19			very close to the scene when we got the call.	
20	399	Q.	Right.	15:13
21		Α.	So we immediately went down, just from recollection, I	
22			think it was a door they broke into, there was glass.	
23			Again, I think it was cigarettes or whatever, but we	
24			searched the scene immediately because we were so close	
25			to the area. I do recall searching just the area,	15:13
26			looking to see if we could find anyone around. I think	
27			the owner came that night, just from recollection. I'm	
28			not certain, I think, perhaps, but I was talking to the	
29			owner at some stage. Yeah.	

400 Superintendent Murray, in his statement to the 1 Q. 2 Tribunal, says at page 304/5 that his nomination of 3 this family group, as it were, as potential suspects may have written at a PAF meeting. He sees no issue 4 5 with given their profile and said that the fact that 6 someone doesn't have access to transport wouldn't 7 preclude them from committing a crime a couple of miles 8 away.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

So, he was happy, he says in his statement, with your reply on this and he was happy to have it sent to the victims office because it was clear that there didn't seem to be any other available avenue of investigation. Presumably you agreed with that; there was no other avenue to go down? But do you regard it as inappropriate that he should, as it were, sort of have an overview as to whether that step that you then reported to him had been taken and that he could then be sure, in fact, that the owner had no reason to suspect these people as well.

15:14

15:14

15:14

15:15

15:15

21222324252627

28

29

A. I mean, I said in my original statement, pie out in the sky. I was going to say I couldn't put it better myself. But like, the persons that are nominated by Superintendent Murray live the other side of the town, Athlone, the river Shannon goes through it. I mean, there's plenty of other suspects on the Connaught side of the town that could have been -- I don't see any rationale for nominating those people as suspects for this crime.

- 1 401 Q. But certainly your reply was able to give him the
- 2 reassurance that the matter had been discussed with the
- owner and that was an additional, as it were, check on
- 4 the non-availability of actual suspects?
- 5 A. Yeah.
- 6 402 Q. CHAIRMAN: Did you go back to the owner, following the

15:16

15:16

15:16

- 7 query from the superintendent?
- 8 A. I think so.
- 9 403 Q. CHAIRMAN: And say, did you see the XYs and he said, ah no, they don't frequent this area?
- 11 A. Yes, I did, because it was the owner that said they 12 don't frequent the area.
- 13 404 Q. CHAIRMAN: The logic says that you probably would have.
- 14 If I understand, on the night you did a sort of search
- of the area generally, didn't see anything to lead you
- to any conclusion, so you probably went back after this
- and said, what about that and they said, no question?
- 18 A. I just can't recall.

Yes.

CHAI RMAN:

19 405 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, but that's what it looks like.

Okay.

Α.

20

- 22 406 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: So, I mean, in a sense his requirement
- of you might have prompted you to conduct that inquiry
- then? It probably did, I suppose.
- A. But I mean, it was a needless inquiry. I can't really
- 26 comment on it.
- 27 407 Q. All right.
- 28 408 Q. CHAIRMAN: You didn't think there was any basis for it,
- and on further investigation the owner also ruled it

- 1 out, to confirm that view?
- 2 A. Yeah.
- 3 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 4 409 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: But did you regard that at the time
- 5 you got that query as targeting or bullying or
- 6 harassment?
- 7 A. Again, the previous page, is it 215, where he starts
- 8 writing down a number of these issues together and some

15 · 17

15:18

- 9 of them were rolled up in -- and again, with this, I'm
- not sure does this crop up somewhere else in further
- correspondence again. I'm not sure until we will get
- to it.
- 13 410 Q. Well, he certainly appears to be, you know, reviewing
- the files certainly and raising queries where he thinks
- it's necessary. You think it is going further, is that 15:18
- 16 right?
- 17 A. I mean, I had said there was no suspects.
- 18 411 Q. Okay.
- 19 A. Superintendent Murray is then nominating suspects
- 20 himself, like, suspects are not from that area, they
- are from a good bit away and there's plenty of, let's
- say, local criminals until that area that are well
- capable of carrying out that crime.
- 24 412 Q. Did you nominate any of those?
- 25 A. I didn't, I didn't, because, I'm not sure, I think -- I 15:18
- am not sure even about the CCTV or whatever, but I
- 27 think if -- I am actually not sure but I think -- just
- this is in my head and I could be totally wrong, I
- think there were two individuals and they were well

1			covered up. But even at that, I can't stand over that	
2			because I just think perhaps, but I'm not sure.	
3	413	Q.	Perhaps we will pass on to the last of the four files	
4			that you raised concerns about. This was a robbery on	
5			13th September 2015. It has got a particular Pulse	15:19
6			number. You wrote a report on it and it's at page 229	
7			of our documents. It's a handwritten report.	
8				
9			"With reference to the above, robbery from the person	
10			was reported 4am, 13/9, the injured party"	15:19
11				
12			The details are given.	
13				
14			"was intoxicated and after pointing out the scene	
15			was brought home by gardaí. Garda Keogh is going onto	15:20
16			rest days and has two days annual leave booked and is	
17			not due to work until 19/9/15. This was a serious	
18			incident and the injured party may have injuries.	
19			Could this be forwarded to D/Branch for favour of	
20			immediate investigation? Forwarded for your	15:20
21			information please."	
22				
23			Superintendent Murray, in his statement to the	
24			Tribunal, at page 2049, says that this was discussed at	
25			the PAF meeting, it would appear the next day, and that	15:20
26			Sergeant Baker brought it to his attention that the	
27			report was far from satisfactory, that Inspector	
28			Minnock felt the same and that D/Sergeant Curley	
29			assigned a member to carry out enquiries. Following	

1			enquiries, the matter was reviewed and that doubts	
2			existed as to whether the incident occurred at all.	
3			Were you aware of any of that at that time?	
4		Α.	I'm not sure at the time. I have read, obviously, the	
5			documents, so I am obviously aware of it now and I	15:2
6			would have been yeah, as Superintendent Murray was	
7			writing out with all these queries in relation to this,	
8			obviously I become aware of it because I have to	
9			respond in writing to what he's sending me down on	
10			paper, questions in relation to it.	15:2
11	414	Q.	Yes. I mean, he did write a minute dated the 23rd	
12			September, which is at page 230, relating to this	
13			incident. That was endorsed over to you. But that	
14			said, in the middle paragraph:	
15				15:2
16			"In this case the incident on its face was serious.	
17			The scant report submitted does not give any indication	
18			of what investigative steps were taken at the initial	
19			reporting stage regarding the scene, searches of it,	
20			CCTV, injured parties, account of events, descriptions	15:2
21			of assailants, what was taken, what violence was used,	
22			what injuries were received, whether photographs were	
23			taken etc. These issues are the basic steps required	
24			at a commencement of any investigation. The duties of	
25			the first member at the scene are also set out clearly	15:2
26			in the CIT manual but are not recorded in this report.	
27				
28			I require an explanation, please, as to why this matter	
29			was dealt with in the fashion chosen."	

1				
2			Now, he is raising several different issues about	
3			components of what might have been done and what might	
4			be expected to be done. Your report is on a short page	
5			rather than being on a form. Is that a common way to	15:22
6			report an offence?	
7		Α.	If I can explain this.	
8	415	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	When that incident occurred, I put the incident onto	
10			Pulse, where I detailed everything. I particularly	15:23
11			remember even something about McKenzie clothing or	
12			something going into the report, into the Pulse report.	
13			At the very top line:	
14				
15			"Re robbery from person, Pulse incident number	15:23
16			12207121".	
17				
18			All those questions are answered in that Pulse detail.	
19			The purpose of the report that arose there, the scant	
20			report, was simply, I am not going to be around, this	15:23
21			is serious, because I am going on leave this, this is a	
22			serious incident, can you get someone from D/Branch to	
23			deal with this? That was all. That was the purpose of	
24			that report. I am not going to be around to	
25			investigate this, I am gone for I think the next six	15:23
26			days, it's a serious robbery from a person, can you get	
27			someone else please in the next few days to look at	
28			this?	
29	416	Q.	Yes.	

Т		Α.	the details of everything, virtually every question he	
2			asks on page 230 are in Pulse, on the Pulse incident	
3			report.	
4	417	Q.	Yes. So this wasn't intended to be the sort of detail	
5			that would otherwise go in a report, if you are making	15:2
6			a report?	
7		Α.	Oh no, this is just to say, look, I'm not going to be	
8			around here, this is a serious incident, can you pass	
9			it on to D/Branch, because it's a robbery from a	
10			person, where a young man was mugged. You know, all	15:2
11			the details of the actual incident are in the Pulse	
12			report on the computer, which I've referred to at the	
13			very top line.	
14	418	Q.	Well, there's certainly a Pulse entry referred to.	
15			Anyway, Superintendent Murray's request was sent to you	15:2
16			and you are asked to report by $15/10$, isn't that right?	
17			One can see at page 231, Sergeant Monaghan sends it	
18			down to you. You reply then in a handwritten report at	
19			page 232, isn't that correct?	
20		Α.	232, yeah.	15:2
21	419	Q.	232. You say:	
22				
23			"With reference to the attached report, the incident	
24			was reported to the gardaí at 4am, 13/9/15. The	
25			injured party was brought to the scene where it was	15:2
26			searched. The injured party was driven around the area	
27			in an effort to identity the suspects. There is no	
28			CCTV in the area the incident occurred. The injured	

party was then brought home and placed in the care of

his mother. When I returned to work on 19/9, having already written a report on the incident and put it on Pulse, I rang the injured party, who informed me that he had made a statement to a detective to the effect that he did not want the matter pursued by gardaí. The 15:26 attached report from Superintendent Murray is nothing short of a form of harassment towards myself. Forwarded for your information please."

15:26

15:26

15:27

15:27

8

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

17

18 19

20

Α.

21 22

23 24

25 26

27

28 29 I mean, if it is the case that Sergeant Baker and Inspector Minnock shared Superintendent Murray's view that the report was far from satisfactory, it would appear that they may not have checked the Pulse or if they checked the Pulse, they also expected to have a report with the same detail in it perhaps. Would that be common, to do that when you're sort of a guard who is called to the scene, or bringing the facts of the offence back to the station; that you put it on Pulse but you also write a report

You see, I didn't have to write a report. The Pulse report is on the system. So when they type in, log into Pulse, whatever, every morning, to look at what has happened and crimes and things like that, they would see the purpose of the report is, this is serious, I'm not going to be around the next few days to deal with this. For clarification, is the actual Pulse reported in this, that we can see what I inputted into Pulse, which would've been available. didn't look at Pulse, that's negligence on their

- behalf.
- 2 420 Q. Well, I am not suggesting that they didn't. But I am
- just wondering, is what is required under
- 4 Superintendent Murray's system of reporting, is it goes
- on Pulse and there's also a paper file, starting with a 15:27
- 6 report?
- 7 A. Sorry, I couldn't hear the last part.
- 8 421 Q. I am sorry, I beg your pardon. Is what's required
- 9 under Superintendent Murray's regime, is it that it
- should be put on Pulse and that there should also be a

15:28

15:28

- paper report? Am I misunderstanding it?
- 12 A. Well, no, there would be a crime file I assume with
- this as well. The Pulse incident and a crime file were
- what was required. What I did here, as I have already
- said, I'm not going to be around, this is serious, can
- 16 you get a detective branch to -- it's a robbery from a
- 17 person, it is serious.
- 18 422 Q. I mean, all the Pulse entries seem to be there, from
- 19 page 225, 226, 227, 228.
- 20 A. 22... sorry?
- 21 423 Q. 225 is the first one.
- 22 A. If I may read this out and I won't read anything
- identifiable.
- 24 424 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. Like this is the Pulse report, I report what was taken, 15:29
- I put the location on it, the investigating garda,
- 27 supervisor, the assisting garda that's with me, the
- occurred date and time and all the rest.

1 "Injured party walking home through (a certain area) to 2 (another certain area) and under a bridge was mugged by 3 two males, €20 stolen. Patrol of area. Injured party pointed out scene with negative results. Suspects were 4 5 Irish, in their 20s. One wearing a white Air Max top 6 and black tracksuit bottoms. Two wearing Blue McKenzie 7 wing sheet top. Both fled towards waste ground behind 8 the Location. No CCTV. " 9 Of course, that ultimately then is updated on the 10 15:30 11 23rd of -- do you want me to go into that or do you 12 want to get on to something there? 13 No, you have read out, haven't you, the entirety of the 425 Q. 14 narrative? 15 Of the narrative, yes. Α. 15:30 16 426 Ο. Yes. 17 It's updated then and there's another part of this Α. 18 which we will have to get to. But that's -- so I have 19 everything in that Pulse report. 20 427 Now, in your statement you sort of queried why, Q. 15:30 when he seemed to regard it as serious, it got 21 reclassified? 22 That's correct. 23 Α. 24 Have you seen the evidence as to -- the basis upon 428 Q. which was reclassified and who reclassified it. That 25 15:30 it was done as a result of a conference? 26 27 And it's nonsense. I have seen it. Α.

28

29

429

Q.

Α.

Yes.

It's actually very wrong. That should never have been

1			reclassified.	
2	430	Q.	Okay. Superintendent Murray says that:	
3				
4			"They all felt reclassification was the best course of	
5			action."	15:3
6				
7		Α.	Sorry, just for clarification again here, this is the	
8			guards, one person will make the decision and everyone	
9			else will agree.	
10	431	Q.	well, I mean we will hear evidence from anyone else	15:3
11			involved, but the decision to reclassify was apparently	
12			made at a PAF meeting, it was included in the Pulse	
13			narrative and that the rationale for it was included	
14			too?	
15		Α.	I am going to dispute everything in relation to this.	15:3
16	432	Q.	Pardon?	
17		Α.	I am going to dispute everything in relation to this.	
18			What was done here was wrong from start to finish.	
19			There's a couple of correspondence in it, whichever way	
20			you want to deal with it.	15:3
21	433	Q.	Well, what do you want to say about the correspondence?	
22		Α.	No, there's a lot of correspondence, I suppose, I was	
23			just wondering, if we read through that and then we can	
24			go	
25	434	Q.	Inspector Minnock was present obviously at the first	15:3
26			PAF but he said that decision was made to recategorise	
27			it in line with the Crime Counting Rules. That's what	
28			he says at page 683.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Can you see that? I am not sure I am seeing	

1			it, Mr. McGuinness.	
2		Α.	683.	
3			MR. McGUINNESS: It's towards the bottom. It's the	
4			last paragraph on that.	
5			CHAI RMAN:	15:33
6				
7			"At a later state the incident was again discussed."	
8				
9			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. As I understand it, it was	
10			Sergeant Curley who wrote the letter recommending the	15:33
11			recategorisation on the 16th September. Were you aware	
12			of that?	
13		Α.	Just one moment, sorry. Okay.	
14	435	Q.	The history of the Pulse recategorisation is contained	
15			in Inspector Curran, as he is now, in his appendix,	15:34
16			commencing at page 507. Because you will no doubt have	
17			understood that when the detective went back to the	
18			injured party, he wouldn't provide any more details, he	
19			wouldn't make a statement about the matter, as I	
20			understand it, and didn't want the matter to be pursued	15:35
21			in any way further by the Gardaí.	
22		Α.	You're correct in the last part, but I don't think	
23			you're correct in the rest. I read the injured party's	
24			statement in this documents, and the injured party	
25			confirms, to my recollection, I could be wrong, that he	15:35
26			was mugged but he doesn't want to pursue it. He	
27			doesn't say that there was no	
28	436	0	Be that as it may, it's is recorded that he didn't want	

to pursue it and this says that he refused to cooperate

1	with	Gardaí?
_		

A. Correct. He refused to cooperate. This person had made a statement confirming the incident happened. He just says he doesn't want to make a statement. Theirs is a big difference, I think.

15:36

6 437 Q. What else do you want to say about that?

7 A. Well, I was going to say like --

8 438 Q. CHAIRMAN: You don't agree with the reclassification?

9 A. No.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

10 439 Q. CHAIRMAN: Your position as I understand it is,
11 irrespective of whether the injured party wanted to
12 proceed or didn't want to proceed, the facts were the
13 facts, there was a crime?

Α. There was, Judge. I won't go into the details, I will just make it very quick. I was on in patrol car on 15:36 church Street in Athlone, the main street, whatever time of the night, this injured party was walking home, let's say, that direction and the incident occurred approximately half a mile away in that direction. The injured party got into a taxi on his way to the Garda 15:36 station to report this crime. The taxi driver let the injured party out when they saw the patrol car, took details of the crime and obviously we went to the scene with the injured party and that. If this crime never occurred, I mean, the injured party was very close to 15:37 his house, why did he jump into a taxi to come back, all the way back into the town.

28 440 Q. CHAIRMAN: The difference, if I understand, on this issue, the difference is, you say the fact that he

Т			dian t want to pursue it is not relevant to the level	
2			of seriousness of the crime?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	441	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So you disagree with the reclassification,	
5			you say that should not have happened, that was wrong?	15:37
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	442	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. I have that. That's what I	
8			understood you to be saying?	
9		Α.	Judge, I have no problem if they all want to line up	
10			and say, oh, it should have been reclassified. I was	15:37
11			standing my ground on this one.	
12			CHAIRMAN: I understand, yes.	
13	443	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Sergeant Curley's recommendation made	
14			to the superintendent, which was apparently all	
15			discussed and agreed upon, dated 16/9, is at page 495,	15:37
16			Volume 4. Volume 3, sorry. There's a report Garda	
17			Divilly attached:	
18				
19			"Incident cannot be investigated without the	
20			cooperation of the victim. The credibility of the	15:38
21			victim has to be questioned as it is not normally a	
22			victim would refuse to cooperate and pursue a robbery	
23			complaint. Consequently, I recommend this incident be	
24			recategorised to attention and complaints following the	
25			outcome of the interview with the victim.	15:38
26				
27			Forwarded for your information and attention please."	
28				

That is what he has written.

1		Α.	Would it help to look at the what the injured party	
2			said in their short statement?	
3	444	Q.	I am not reviewing the crime, I am not even reviewing	
4			the process?	
5		Α.	Oh sorry.	15:38
6	445	Q.	I am just bringing to your attention that the way this	
7			was initiated was by the gardaí being sent out to	
8			interview the victim, who apparently refused to	
9			cooperate?	
10		Α.	Declined.	15:39
11	446	Q.	A report was made by Garda Divilly and it led to this	
12			recommendation which was discussed. You may disagree	
13			about the crime counting rules, you may disagree about	
14			how and when something should be recategorised. Is	
15			this regarded by you as a form of bullying and	15:39
16			harassment?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	447	Q.	That they have downgraded this from serious to	
19			attention and complaints?	
20		Α.	Yes. On the day, the updated Pulse version is updated	15:39
21			at 23/9/2015. "Incident recategorised by" and it's	
22			registration number as the member:	
23				
24			"as per directions from district officer Athlone"	
25				15:39
26			That's the superintendent Athlone.	
27				
28			"Injured party refused to cooperate with investigation	
29			and refused to make a statement of complaint. No	

1			evi dence. "	
2				
3			MR. KELLY: Page 228, Judge.	
4		Α.	227 is what I read. Oh, 228, yes, as well, yes, that	
5			has the Pulse narrative.	15:40
6	448	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And?	
7		Α.	Very quick to say how the injured party refused. The	
8			injured party didn't refuse. If the injured party said	
9			no, I am not making a statement whatsoever, fair	
10			enough. The injured party makes a statement and says,	15:40
11			yes, this happened, but I just don't want to pursue it.	
12			The injured party didn't refuse to cooperate. He said,	
13			yes, it happened, I just don't want to pursue this.	
14	449	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: well, I am only going on the reports	
15			to suggest that they certainly appeared to believe they	15:40
16			had a reason to do it and they did do it?	
17		Α.	That's called	
18	450	Q.	I want to understand how that reflects discreditably on	
19			you in terms of either bullying or harassment or	
20			targeting. That's where I am anxious to see where your	15:41
21			reputation etcetera comes in as a result of that?	
22		Α.	Two things. One, in reclassifying it, essentially	
23			they're fiddling with the crime figures there. That's	
24			essentially what they're up to. In relation to the	
25			second part of this, where we go through the to-ing and	15:41
26			fro-ing, the to-ing and fro-ing back in the	
27			correspondence between, let's say, myself and	
28			Superintendent Murray, if we can root that out, I think	
29			that will answer all the questions.	

_	471	Q.	I am sorry, darda keogn, courd I ask you to repeat	
2			that?	
3			CHAIRMAN: The to-ing and fro-ing in the correspondence	
4			between you and Superintendent Murray.	
5		Α.	Should clarify everything.	15:42
6			CHAIRMAN: That's all right, okay.	
7			MR. McGUINNESS: well, that's where we have come to.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Right.	
9	452	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Your handwritten report, we have	
10			opened it there. That was enter up to the	15:42
11			superintendent by Sergeant Monaghan. Perhaps we will	
12			look at that, at page 233, first. This is from	
13			Sergeant Monaghan up to the superintendent. It's after	
14			your report of the 2nd October, forwarding it.	
15				15:43
16			"With reference to the above, please find attachment	
17			from Garda Keogh in relation to your report on the	
18			23/9/15. He reports that the injured party was brought	
19			to the scene and that the area was searched. The	
20			injured party was driven in the patrol car around town	15:43
21			in an attempt to identity any suspects. There was no	
22			CCTV in the area where the incident took place. He was	
23			then brought home and placed in the custody of his	
24			mother. On returning to work on 19/9, he make contact	
25			with the injured party to obtain a statement and the	15:43
26			injured party informed him that he had already made a	
27			statement to the detective garda in Athlone,	
28			withdrawing the complaint."	

1			So, does that reflect what you did? You contacted the	
2			injured party? Am I wrong in that?	
3		Α.	When I come back to work, I think I contact the injured	
4			party, yes.	
5	453	Q.	Yes. Okay.	15:44
6			CHAIRMAN: And is that correct?	
7	454	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: And is that correct?	
8		Α.	Pardon?	
9	455	Q.	Is this sentence correct in terms of what the injured	
10			party said to you?	15:44
11		Α.	That he made a statement to the guards, was it, and	
12			didn't want to	
13	456	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No withdrawing his complaint?	
14		Α.	Oh, yes.	
15	457	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Can I read it to you again?	15:44
16		Α.	Yes, please, sorry.	
17	458	Q.	Have you got a good view of that, sorry? It says:	
18				
19			"On returning to work on 19/9/15, he made contact with	
20			the injured party"	15:44
21				
22			That's you he's talking about?	
23		Α.	Yes, correct.	
24	459	Q.		
25			"to obtain a statement and the injured party	15:44
26			informed him that he already made a statement to the	
27			detective garda in Athlone, withdrawing his complaint."	
28				

A. That part is correct, yeah.

- 1 460 Q. So, I just want to be clear, are you telling me that
- the injured party, in fact, did make a statement
- 3 outlining the robbery from his person on the night?
- 4 A. No. Not on the night.
- 5 461 Q. When did he make it?
- 6 A. I read his statement, I don't know what date, but it is

15:45

15:45

15:46

15:46

- 7 in there somewhere.
- 8 462 Q. Ms. McGrath is showing me a handwritten statement made
- 9 on the 14/9, is that the statement you're talking
- 10 about?
- 11 A. I think, Garda A takes his statement.
- 12 463 Q. Garda A, yes.
- 13 A. Yes, that's the statement, yes.

vaguely --

- 14 464 Q. What did you take from, "informed by the injured party
- himself that he was withdrawing the complaint"?
- 16 A. He's entitled to, if he doesn't want to pursue the
- 17 matter. He has reported the complaint, he doesn't want
- to pursue it. He is a young lad, I am not sure if he
- 19 was sitting exams or whatever at the time. I just
- 21 465 Q. Yes.

- 22 A. I can't even remember, but I think it was just he
- didn't need the hassle of court, let's say, or anything
- 24 like that.
- 25 466 Q. Okay. So you had put it on Pulse originally yourself?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 467 Q. Now, is putting something on Pulse something that
- stands to your credit, such that if it's changed, does
- that affect your position as an officer in any way?

- A. Like all these incidents have to go on, that's just standard, it has to go onto Pulse.
- 3 468 Q. Yes.
- A. There's more stuff, I think there's more documents, is there not, here, in relation to --

15:47

- 6 469 Q. We are just stopping at this point in time, you had 7 been told on the 19th that the complainant wants to 8 withdraw his complaint?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 470 Q. In fact, for good or ill, you are the officer at the scene on the night, with your colleague obviously, and you did what you did on the night. Nobody is criticising you for that at all. But you have now
- learned what the injured party's attitude is. He doesn't want to take it any further.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 471 Q. Whatever way you call it.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 472 Q. Does that affect in any way what you put on Pulse
 20 yourself? How does it affect your credit in any way,
 21 if it remains on Pulse or if it gets changed?
- A. Well, at that point, you know, there's no issue, that
 person doesn't want to make a statement. It doesn't
 affect Pulse. It's reported as a robbery from a
 person. I mean, that's fine. Again, I think as you go
 further on into the thing, they are self explanatory.
- 27 473 Q. I am trying to understand, before we look at what
 28 Superintendent Murray did in principle, whether some
 29 entry that you make, if it's changed and changed

Т			apparent, and I say apparent in accordance with the	
2			regulations, how can that sort of inure to your	
3			discredit or your reputation? Before we go on to look	
4			at the document, is there anything you want to say in	
5			answer?	15:48
6		Α.	I recall reading where there's a question mark whether	
7			this crime occurred at all. Of course, I am the	
8			investigating officer, so am I wasting time essentially	
9			me investigating something that I should have had the	
10			cop on to know never even occurred? That's the way I	15:48
11			perceived it. Then, of course, the day it's	
12			reclassified or do you want to move on?	
13	474	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Tell us, go on, yes.	
14		Α.	The date it's reclassified, I think on the 23/9, to	
15			attention and complaints:	15:49
16				
17			"As per directions from district officer Athlone."	
18				
19			Superintendent Murray continues to write down to me, he	
20			had it reclassified to attention of complaints, and he	15:49
21			continues to write down to me for a number of, I can't	
22			remember, let's say weeks.	
23	475	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
24		Α.	About this serious incident, a robbery from a person,	
25			which he has already reclassified into something that	15:49
26			there is no investigation into. They're the two, the	
27			documents that I am referring in the correspondence	
28			between myself and Superintendent Murray.	
29	476	0	MR McGUINNESS Let's look at them as senarate issues	

1 and then we can join them together, as it were? 2 Yes. Α. 3 477 You have written your handwritten report of the 2nd Q. October? 4 5 Yeah. Α. 15:49 6 478 Q. Saying: 7 8 "It's nothing short of harassment." 9 10 Towards yourself, when you set out all details that 15:50 11 weren't in your first handwritten report? 12 Because they were on the Pulse. Α. 13 We know that. But what I am coming to is simply this, 479 Q. 14 he then gets this back, which accuses him of harassment 15 and he maintains the correspondence and he writes a 15:50 16 letter of the 13th October. That's at page 234 of our 17 I think this is the one you wanted to get to, is Do you have that in front of you? 18 19 I was just going to say as well, like, this incident, Α. somewhere between 3 and 4am or so. 20 15:50 21 480 Yes. 0. 22 Whatever time, the early hours of the morning. Α. 23 481 Yes. Q. 24 So after we conducted our search of the area, take Α. 25 details, put it on Pulse, drop that young lad home, 15:50 26 it's nearly time to finish work as well. So, I mean, I 27 am just writing the report in addition to what's on the I just leave it I think on the sergeant's tray 28 Pulse.

29

and that's it like, as in, this is a serious thing, can

1			someone just look at this, I'll be gone for the next	
2			few days. The details, it's all detailed on Pulse.	
3			All they have to do is turn on the Pulse, which they	
4			would be doing anyway.	
5	482	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Did you put that in your statement: Please	15:51
6			see all the details because I didn't have enough time.	
7		Α.	I am not sure, I don't know if I put that in it, I just	
8			don't know.	
9	483	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. But you say it was there anyway to be	
10			seen?	15:51
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	484	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Garda Keogh, I am asking these	
13			questions because I don't know what is meant to be	
14			done. I mean, I appreciate these matters, everyone	
15			working at night, coming off duty and they come from a	15:51
16			crime scene, attending to a victim, as you were	
17			obviously, but what is the procedure? Are you meant to	
18			write up a report in relation to that night, even if	
19			you are going off duty?	
20		Α.	Yeah.	15:51
21	485	Q.	Or is it customary for members to stay on and do it?	
22			Is there any rule or practice?	
23		Α.	No. The report, everything has to go onto Pulse.	
24			Pulse contains the report with all the information.	
25			The so-called scant report that I wrote was just a	15:52
26			note, look, this is serious. At the very top line of	
27			this, I refer to Pulse incident such and whatever	
28			number, this is a serious incident, I won't be around,	
29			can you get someone else, someone from the detective	

1			branch to deal with this. This is serious. All the	
2			details that Superintendent Murray is on about, are all	
3			on the Pulse incident number. But again, of course, he	
4			then reclassifies has it reclassified, sorry, to	
5			attention and complaints and he continues to write down	15:52
6			to me for a period of time about, I think, we will be	
7			getting on to them about the serious robbery from a	
8			person, where he has already reclassified it to	
9			non-crime.	
10	486	Q.	Now, he did write to you on this date, I invite you to	15:53
11			look at it, page 234, he says:	
12				
13			"I note Garda Keogh's response to date, which is far	
14			from satisfactory. In order that I can be assured the	
15			organisation's objectives regarding the investigation	15:53
16			of crime are met in this case, Garda Keogh would be	
17			well advised to take careful note of his statutory	
18			obligation to account, as set out in Section 39 of An	
19			Garda Síochána Act 2005, which applies to every member	
20			of An Garda Síochána equally and its inextricable link	15:53
21			to An Garda Síochána discipline regulations. If the	
22			member feels he is in some way removed from his	
23			statutory obligations, then there may be remedy open to	
24			him under the policy document 'Working Together to	
25			Create a Positive Working Environment'."	15:53
26				
27			I think that is a reference to a bullying and	
28			harassment procedures document. It has got a long	
29			title like that, hasn't it?	

Т		Α.	sorry, I just want to draw your attention to a line you	
2			left out. I am not being critical of you or anything,	
3			but the top line he has here:	
4				
5			"Robbery from the person."	15:54
6				
7			The date is what, 13th October '15. Superintendent's	
8			office. I mean, we are here on an update on the	
9			23/9/2015:	
10				15:54
11			"Incident recategorised, as per directions of district	
12			officer Athlone."	
13				
14			It is reclassified to attention and complaints. There	
15			is no crime. There is no crime. He has it to	15:54
16			attention and complaints, where it's closed off, it's	
17			finished. But he continues to write down to me under	
18			the heading "robbery from the person".	
19	487	Q.	I see. What do you take from that?	
20		Α.	Here it is, if you reclassify the thing as case closed,	15:54
21			it's over, it's finished, there is no investigation.	
22			He is writing down to me in relation to a robbery from	
23			a person, which I originally had put on. He is the one	
24			that had it closed down to attention and complaints.	
25			Apart from the fact that it should never have been	15:55
26			closed off as attention and complaints, it is closed.	
27			But he continues then to write down to me about robbery	
28			from person.	
20	100	^	T soo that Everyone sees that Carda Keegh T am not	

1			sure it's your best point. We will come to what may be	
2			a stronger point, or maybe not. But he says in the	
3			second paragraph:	
4				
5			"In the meantime, I await for a proper response"	15:55
6				
7			CHAIRMAN: I am not sure it's for you to say.	
8			MR. McGUINNESS: No, it's the heading.	
9			CHAIRMAN: If you don't mind, a minor asterisk beside	
10			that comment.	15:55
11			MR. KELLY: If you look at page 234, the very last	
12			paragraph.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
14			MR. KELLY: And linking that to the question which	
15			Mr. McGuinness asked.	15:55
16			CHAIRMAN: Hold on a second, 234.	
17			MR. McGUINNESS: we have it, I was going to ask the	
18			witness about it.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much, Mr. Kelly. No, no, I just	
20			thought your commentary on the value of his point, I	15:56
21			thought	
22			MR. McGUINNESS: It's the heading of document and we	
23			understand	
24			CHAIRMAN: It's a minor matter.	
25	489	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: "In the meantime" and this is	15:56
26			perhaps important to you, obviously:	
27				
28			"In the meantime, I await a proper response as to the	
29			actions taken on the night this matter was reported."	

1				
2			I take it that you regarded your entry on Pulse as a	
3			proper account of it. And also the letter, the	
4			handwritten letter report that we just looked at before	
5			as also a proper response?	15:56
6		Α.	That was just a note to let them know I'm not going to	
7			be around, this is serious, you know.	
8	490	Q.	He goes on:	
9				
10			"I also expect to see some written record as to what	15:56
11			the injured party alleged, to include a description	
12			etcetera of his assailants and an answer as to why my	
13			instructions of the 18th August were not complied	
14			with."	
15				15:57
16			Now what did you take from that?	
17		Α.	You see, a lot of the time I don't think I even knows	
18			this is closed. I don't find this is closed off even	
19			until later on as we go down through the thing. So I	
20			am still replying to a thing I think is an open	15:57
21			investigation to a robbery from a person. He keeps	
22			writing down to me and it's only at some stage when I	
23			have to go on to Pulse to look at the incident in order	
24			to reply to all these things, that I actually see I am	
25			replying to stuff that has been closed off I think	15:57
26			nearly a month previously.	
27	491	Q.	Yes. But what he seems to be saying there is, you	
28			know, he wants to see a written record. From your	
29			point of view, the document at 232, would you regard	

- that as an appropriate written record of the incident sent to the superintendent?

 A. 232 was a reply to whatever he was looking for. All
- A. 232 was a reply to whatever he was looking for. All that's on 232 is pretty much all on the Pulse report.
- Okay. Well, I mean, the other way of looking at it is perhaps to ask this question: In terms of what you have recorded in 232, was there anything else you could have added to it?
- 9 A. I'm not sure. I think injuries I think or something
 10 like that, perhaps something -- I think, perhaps
 11 injury. I'm not sure. I mean, I can't remember. No,
 12 I don't think there's any major -- there was no major
 13 injury or if there was or whatever, I can't even
 14 remember.
- 15 493 Q. On the medical side, what injuries had he got or what had happened?
- 17 A. I don't know did he say his leg hurt or something. No,
 18 I don't think there was any visible injuries or
 19 anything like that.
- 20 494 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. It wasn't a robbery by way of force -- sorry, I think 22 there was a knife or something used.

15:59

15:59

- 23 495 Q. CHAIRMAN: Threats.
- 24 A. Threatened, there was a knife held.
- 25 496 O. CHAIRMAN: He was threatened.
- 26 A. Pointed at him or something.
- 27 497 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: It's just, I am wondering, would you
 28 like to say or can you say, is there anything else that
 29 you could have added apart from that?

1		Α.	I don't think so. I think I had everything in it.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
3	498	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: You then wrote back on the 29th	
4			October, some 16 days later. We see that response at	
5			page 235. You must have written this as a sort of back	15:59
6			sheet on the page.	
7				
8			"With reference to overleaf, I have complied in full	
9			with Section 39 of the Garda Síochána Act 2005 I note	
10			with the exception of how it was reported the	16:00
11			i nj uri es. "	
12				
13		Α.	"And injuries", sorry, that's my writing.	
14	499	Q.		
15			"Garda Mc[inaudible] and I were in the patrol car at	16:00
16			Church Street at 4am when a taxi parked beside which	
17			had come from the direction of the injured party got	
18			out of this taxi and reported the incident to me. The	
19			injured party did not want medical treatment and stated	
20			he would go to the doctor in the morning if his leg was	16:00
21			still at him. After pointing out the scene, he	
22			requested to be brought home, which we duly obliged. I	
23			also wish to point out that this incident was	
24			recategorised by Superintendent Murray from robbery	
25			from persons to attention and complaints on 23/9.	16:00
26			Forwarded for your information please."	
27				
28			That's the only extent to which you could add to	
29			everything you had already said?	

1	Α.	That's correct. Actually, as I say, it's only then	
2		when I am replying to all this reams of stuff, like	
3		this is going on months, roughly, where it had been	
4		reclassified into a non-investigation. There is all	
5		these reams of paper coming down with this sort of	16:01
6		stuff. It was in reply to the previous thing, it's	
7		going to Pulse, and then I find out this is already	
8		reclassified to attention and complaints, to	
9		non-investigation. And, of course, what I'm replying	
10		to in this, and this is on the 13th October, the letter	16:01
11		at page 234, which again Superintendent Murray, again	
12		headed "robbery from the person". He has closed it	
13		off. He has it closed off, it's officially attention	
14		and complaints, but he's still writing that to me as	
15		robbery from the person.	16:01

Garda Keogh, I don't think the Chairman want to get 16 500 Q. involved into an overview of the wisdom of rules about 17 18 categorisation or when they should be done or why they 19 should be done. We know it was done here and we have 20 drawn attention to it, particularly here, when it came 21 to your knowledge. But can you just help me in this 22 regard: How did the recategorisation in your mind 23 affect you or how do you say it constituted either 24 targeting or discrediting or do you say that? 25

16:02

16:02

A. It's targeting, it's discrediting. You've three in this, you've targeting, discrediting and, of course, as a result when I find this being reclassified, I then look at some of the other incidents that I put on Pulse and I realise they're reclassified.

26

27

28

29

501 Just sticking with this one for the moment? 1 Q. CHAI RMAN: 2 Yes. Α. 3 502 0. CHAI RMAN: If I understand, correct me if I am wrong, 4 if I understand, your point is (a) it shouldn't have 5 been reclassified? 16:02 6 Yes. Α. 7 You had given the information; (b) you 503 CHAI RMAN: Q. 8 shouldn't be criticised for not giving sufficient 9 information because you had put everything on Pulse? 10 Α. Yes. 16:02 11 504 Q. CHAI RMAN: (c) it is inconsistent irrational and wrong 12 for the superintendent to continue to challenge you 13 about your reporting of the incident when it has 14 already been reclassified as in effect a non-crime? 15 Correct. Α. 16:03 16 CHAI RMAN: Is that about the size of it? 505 Q. 17 Yes. Α. 18 506 CHAI RMAN: You say those are the complaints. Q. 19 doesn't mean that they are right, we have to hear 20 everybody else on it but essentially that's the case 16:03 21 you make? 22 That's my case, Judge. Α. 23 CHAI RMAN: 507 Okay. Q. 24 Just to have dates, like this is reclassified, I have Α. 25 here, 23/9/2015. 16:03 CHAI RMAN: 26 508 Yes. Ο. 27 My last correspondence --Α.

Is October?

28

29

509

Q.

Α.

CHAI RMAN:

It's months.

Т	210	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's the very point I am inviting you to	
2			agree with. I am trying to summarise what I understand	
3			to be your real complaint in respect of this episode.	
4			Is that right?	
5		Α.	Correct.	16:03
6			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Are we happy with	
7			that, Mr. McGuinness? Have you much more to go?	
8			MR. McGUINNESS: Little enough on this.	
9	511	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Could you stick it out for a few more	
10			minutes?	16:04
11		Α.	I will.	
12	512	Q.	CHAIRMAN: We will finish one this item. If you are	
13			okay and you are comfortable with it, that would be	
14			great assistance because we would then be able to tick	
15			off another one for the moment. Okay.	16:04
16	513	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: In relation to that reclassification,	
17			what effect do you see that it has on you?	
18		Α.	I mean, he's belittling my police work. You know, he	
19			is going out of his way to belittle I mean when you	
20			look at it with, when you go back to some of the	16:04
21			previous things, the thefts and whatever, there seems	
22			to be a build up here of, and lengthy reports and a lot	
23			of time and effort put into a lot of these reports, and	
24			essentially none of them are going anywhere from, let's	
25			say, his point of view. You know, he is discrediting,	16:05
26			he's discrediting my police work. Whereas, you know,	
27			incidents now I am dealing with he is effectively	
28			saying they never happened, obviously that has to	
29			affect me as a policeman. What am I doing in work? Am	

1			I am wasting police time, going around I mean it is	
2			nearly as if I just brought the young lad home or	
3			something. I don't know. But in fairness as well,	
4			this is a very difficult period, because again this is	
5			October 2015. October is a significant month as well	16:05
6			in what is going on, in the elephant in the room, with	
7			the investigation. Because at some point in October	
8			Garda A suspended. And that whole investigation is	
9			cooking as well. And every day I am coming into work I	
10			am met with all these reams of, you know, exclamations	16:05
11			into, you know, the taking of the statements, is	
12			ridiculous, up to this robbery from a person where I	
13			mean it really for me, I am aware, as well, that my	
14			time in An Garda Síochána is coming to an end very	
15			quickly, because I can't no matter what I deal with	16:06
16			at work I am going to be pinned in on, it is going to	
17			be scrutinised to such an extent that, you know, it	
18			simply won't be and then	
19	514	Q.	Sorry, I didn't want to cut across you, but in terms of	
20			the effect of the recategorisation, I mean I can	16:06
21			understand how perhaps a victim would be fairly sore if	
22			they felt they were badly treated. But a	
23			recategorisation of some entry that you put on Pulse,	
24			it doesn't go on your record in any way.	
25		Α.	No.	16:07
26	515	Q.	Or, there is no procedure relating to either notifying	
27			you of it or it having any effect on you in your	
28			career, is that not right?	

29

A. Well essentially what is being said here is that this

1			crime never happened. I mean, that's what's in the	
2			official thing. And then I read in the Tribunal	
3			documents that the injured party actually confirms,	
4			that, you know, made a statement to say yes, look, I	
5			was robbed but I just don't want to pursue it. And you	16:07
6			mentioned there about the injured party, and his	
7			parents do not know that this is on Pulse, he	
8			effectively is logged onto Pulse as effectively a liar,	
9			that he falsely reported something as well. I mean	
10	516	Q.	Again I don't want to cut across you. I am not sure	16:07
11			that whilst you're the investigating or the original	
12			officer at the scene, I am not sure whether you can	
13			stand in the shoes of a victim to claim to be affected	
14			by a recategorisation. I mean, the recategorisation	
15			isn't published within the force as something that you	16:08
16			have done wrong or were careless about. Nobody is	
17			challenging you on this, are they, the fact that it was	
18			properly categorisation initially as a robbery from the	
19			person, is that not right?	
20		Α.	It was a robbery from a person. It can't be classified	16:08
21			as anything other than a robbery from a person.	
22	517	Q.	Again, I don't know about these rules because we're not	
23			inquiring into the rules. But you I think brought this	
24			to the attention of Deputy Wallace, isn't that right?	
25		Α.	Yes.	16:08
26	518	Q.	And your views were aired in Dáil Éireann in relation	
27			to this, according to Superintendent Murray's	
28			statement, isn't that right?	

29

A. It would have been in general, in general, this -- as

1			all this, I perceive is clear harassment at this point	
2			and I would have yes, I did go to Deputy Wallace.	
3	519	Q.	And he raised the matter in the Dáil in December of	
4			2015, airing effectively your views on it, is that	
5			right?	16:09
6		Α.	He would have. I just can't be he aired a number of	
7			things, so I can't remember exactly which one. But	
8			yes.	
9	520	Q.	That's according to the chronology. You're obviously	
10			correct to point out that as of the date of this	16:09
11			correspondence you had been confined to indoor duties.	
12		Α.	You see, am I still out on outdoor duties? I am in the	
13			patrol car when the incident is reported. You see,	
14			some period in the first to the second week of October	
15			I think Garda A is suspended so	16:09
16	521	Q.	He is suspended on the 15th?	
17		Α.	Okay.	
18	522	Q.	You are just put on indoor duties on the 22nd.	
19		Α.	Yeah. There's about a week between.	
20			CHAIRMAN: 22nd October.	16:10
21		Α.	Roughly a week. So yes.	
22	523	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: so whatever about any of these events,	
23			and I am not commenting on them, but certainly as of	
24			the time	
25		Α.	Just for clarification	16:10
26	524	Q.	Superintendent Murray is writing to you, you hadn't	
27			yet been confined to indoor duties and Garda A had been	
28			suspended. But that was the position when you were	
29			replying to him on the 29th October?	

- 1 A. Yeah.
- 2 CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 3 A. Yeah. As I said, there's a lot going on.
- 4 CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 5 A. At this stage, 18 months working alongside someone who
- 6 was accused of such serious things. So it is not an
- 7 easy place in work. Then when Superintendent Murray is
- 8 firing all this stuff. I am coming in every day to
- 9 have all these, everything I send up, everything is
- 10 coming back questioned. That never happened before and 16:11

16:11

16:11

16 · 11

- certainly not on the scale of this.
- 12 525 Q. CHAIRMAN: Were you suggesting there was something
- 13 corrupt about changing the classification?
- 14 A. I don't think he's entitled to change the
- 15 classification.
- 16 526 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, I understand that. That's: You know,
- 17 you're wrong, and I don't agree with you.
- 18 A. Yeah. Corrupt, I don't know -- I don't think I could
- say corrupt in relation to that.
- 20 527 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 21 A. I would say just fiddling the crime figures.
- 22 528 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand. But you think that was
- fiddling with the crime figures?
- 24 A. Yeah, but again, I wouldn't go into corruption.
- 25 529 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, forget that. That is what I was
- 26 understanding. And I don't want to use too extreme a
- 27 word, but you were saying that represented fiddling
- with the crime figures. Okay?
- 29 A. Just a clarification. You see, it's when you spot that

Т			I then go on to Pulse and see there's other stuff which	
2			he has reclassified, and a lot of it is to do with me.	
3			And then, that of course like, we are bringing this	
4			to Deputy Wallace's attention, just to clarify the	
5			question that I was asked previously.	16:12
6	530	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand. Just let me explain. We're	
7			pursuing these things, as we have to do, individually.	
8			But Mr. McGuinness will ask you more generally about	
9			the atmosphere, so you won't be You know what I	
10			mean? The fact that we are concentrating discretely	16:12
11			because we have identified these and everybody has	
12			agreed these are specific issues, okay?	
13			MR. McGUINNESS: One question.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
15	531	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Just at this point in time it becomes	16:12
16			apparent from Superintendent Murray's statement that he	
17			is being made aware of information relating to the	
18			Ó Cualáin investigation concerning Garda A and he takes	
19			steps to bring a number of matters to the attention of	
20			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy to assist him in his	16:12
21			investigation into Garda A. Presumably you wouldn't	
22			think that was aimed at discrediting you?	
23		Α.	No, no, I read that in the documents. Of course not.	
24			But again, it's another garda that actually brings that	
25			to Superintendent Murray's attention and obviously	16:13
26			Superintendent Murray does what he has to do. There's	
27			no great heroic thing in that. He passes it on to	
28			it's his job, yes.	
29	532	Q.	And brings a number of other matters to his attention	

1	as we have seen in the statement. Does that change
2	your view as to Superintendent Murray's attention
3	towards you, that he was taking these other steps to
4	assist?

You see, again it reads like that when you read the Α. But like, when that, I think there's a disciplinary investigation or something in relation to that, that is kept away again from my main, the criminality that the investigation team -- for some reason it's not included in it, it's kept a separate thing away from all of that all, and there's missing drugs allegations, they should all have gone into that main investigation. And you see, they start dividing all this stuff and it weakens the strand, in an attempt to weaken -- instead, if they all went into the main allegation it would have strengthened the evidence, all the other evidence in strands, but they don't. keep it separate for some reason. Curiously as well, I mentioned about another report --

16:13

16:13

16:14

16:14

16 · 14

- 20 CHAIRMAN: Can I bring you back for one second?
- 21 A. Oh, yeah. Sorry, Judge.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

29

- 22 I understand and, as I said, in a general we 533 CHAI RMAN: Q. 23 can understand and we may well like to know what it 24 felt like and so on, but Mr. McGuinness is just asking 25 you do any of these pieces of information affect your 26 view of Superintendent Murray or do you stick to the 27 fact that in all these respects he was gunning for you? 28
 - A. My view is still the same and it is very simple. He was sent in there to get me out of Athlone, so

Т			Assistant Commissioner O Cualain could investigate	
2			in let's say, do the investigation whatever way he	
3			wanted to investigate. That is my feeling.	
4	534	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. And he carried out that instruction.	
5		Α.	Yes.	16:15
6			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Very good. So that's the end of that	
7			item.	
8			MR. McGUINNESS: I will review it overnight but I	
9			wouldn't think there is anything else.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Thank you for holding	16:15
11			on a little bit longer than normal. Okay. Thanks very	
12			much Philip. Right.	
13				
14			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL THURSDAY, 17TH OCTOBER	-
15			2019 AT 10: 30AM	16:16
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
29				

•	136 [1] - 26:4	2	22 [1] - 3:12	28 [1] - 3:16
<u> </u>	13th [7] - 11:2, 27:3,	_	22 [1] - 126:20	28th [2] - 72:22,
	33:19, 121:5, 139:16,		2205 [1] - 22:29	103:5
'15 [2] - 94:15, 142:7	142:7, 147:10	2 [8] - 2:31, 3:2, 4:5,	2206 [1] - 23:8	29 [1] - 3:16
'Working [1] - 141:24	14 [7] - 3:8, 10:15,	10:4, 22:26, 55:17,	2207 [1] - 23:16	29th [2] - 146:3,
	51:28, 52:5, 52:11,	55:20, 105:11	221 [2] - 106:22,	152:29
0	53:6, 53:15	20 [2] - 3:11, 83:28	107:27	2nd [2] - 134:14,
	14/7 [1] - 46:26	2005 [2] - 141:19,	2217 [1] - 22:28	139:3
00:29 [1] - 27:27	14/7/15 [1] - 41:2	146:9	222 [1] - 106:22	
00120[1] 27.121	14/8 [1] - 105:9	2007 [1] - 19:9	2220 [1] - 33:25	3
1	14/9 [1] - 136:9	2009 [1] - 12:13	2222 [1] - 53:9	
•	145 [1] - 7:2	201 [1] - 72:20	2227 [1] - 44:14	3 [11] - 3:3, 10:3,
	14th [23] - 10:24,	2014 [7] - 1:3, 10:22,	223 [2] - 107:22,	41:2, 75:7, 75:23,
1 [11] - 3:2, 10:3,	27:11, 31:19, 33:19,	10:24, 10:26, 11:2,	108:6	75:25, 79:9, 105:15,
55:18, 55:19, 62:26,	33:29, 34:3, 34:10,	15:1, 20:26 2015 [19] - 7:18,	2247 [1] - 40:29	106:9, 131:16, 139:20
62:27, 63:1, 67:17,	34:17, 35:1, 35:22,	14:16, 18:2, 20:28,	2248 [1] - 41:11	30 [2] - 3:17, 67:18
99:14, 105:8, 115:22	35:23, 37:1, 37:29,	24:3, 25:10, 26:2,	225 [2] - 126:19,	302 [3] - 74:8, 74:18,
10 [4] - 3:6, 19:8,	40:21, 42:6, 42:18,	26:29, 27:1, 27:11,	126:21	74:20
53:5, 82:6	42:23, 42:29, 43:29, 91:12, 102:24, 111:7,	34:16, 42:19, 46:29,	2252 [1] - 42:11	304/5 [1] - 118:2
10/7 [2] - 38:24, 44:2	115:21	53:9, 67:16, 89:19,	2258 [1] - 50:11	30th [4] - 10:25,
10/8/15 [1] - 70:20	14th/15th [1] - 55:12	121:5, 150:5, 152:4	226 [1] - 126:19	51:22, 52:11
10/9 [1] - 106:12	15 [4] - 3:9, 9:11,	2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9	227 [2] - 126:19,	31 [5] - 3:17, 47:23,
101 [1] - 1:18 10:30AM [1] - 156:15	50:4, 52:18	2018 [3] - 1:9, 60:11,	133:4	50:11, 67:18, 115:7
10:35 [1] - 43:11	15/10 [1] - 124:16	64:12	228 [3] - 126:19,	32 [2] - 2:23, 3:18
10:43 [1] - 43.11 10:50 [2] - 9:11	15/7 [1] - 46:27	2019 [3] - 1:18, 6:2,	133:3, 133:4	33 [1] - 3:18
10th [8] - 27:1, 27:2,	15th [15] - 31:24,	156:15	229 [1] - 121:6 22nd [3] - 78:11,	34 [1] - 3:19
28:13, 33:17, 44:22,	34:7, 34:21, 37:16,	202 [5] - 74:21,	152:18, 152:20	35 [2] - 3:19, 51:19
72:12, 72:14, 108:5	38:2, 38:4, 41:27,	74:22, 80:21, 82:28,	23 [1] - 3:13	36 [1] - 3:20
11 [1] - 3:7	42:4, 42:10, 42:18,	83:13	23/9 [2] - 138:14,	37 [1] - 3:20
11-13 [1] - 3:31	43:4, 43:5, 43:7, 43:8,	203 [2] - 82:28, 83:13	146:25	38 [1] - 3:21
11/8 [1] - 98:24	152:16	2039 [2] - 81:19,	23/9/15 [1] - 134:18	39 [3] - 3:21, 141:18,
11/8/15 [1] - 100:25	16 [3] - 1:5, 3:9,	81:29	23/9/2015 [3] -	146:9
1112 [1] - 13:28	146:4	2042 [1] - 20:18	132:21, 142:9, 148:25	3:15 [1] - 27:11
1128 [1] - 13:28	16/9 [1] - 131:15	2043 [1] - 20:18	230 [2] - 122:12,	3rd [10] - 24:3, 25:10,
11:45 [1] - 32:1	16:15 [1] - 29:28	2045 [1] - 51:10	124:2	42:22, 78:7, 83:5,
11th [6] - 15:1, 27:2,	16th [3] - 32:18,	2049 [2] - 108:21,	231 [1] - 124:17	83:16, 104:24,
28:13, 31:3, 33:19,	33:9, 129:11	121:24	232 [7] - 124:19,	104:26, 115:11, 117:3
72:15	16TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1	207 [1] - 79:5 208 [6] - 78:12,	124:20, 124:21,	4
12 [6] - 3:7, 4:4,	17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10	80:15, 80:16, 80:17,	144:29, 145:3, 145:4,	4
38:23, 49:20, 90:26,	1731 [1] - 17:12	80:19, 80:20	145:7	
101:20	17TH [1] - 156:14	20s [1] - 127:5	233 [1] - 134:12	4 [6] - 2:19, 3:3, 11:3,
12207121" [1] -	17th [1] - 94:14	20th [1] - 116:9	234 [5] - 139:16,	92:28, 105:18, 131:16
123:16	18 [2] - 3:10, 153:5	21 [1] - 3:12	141:11, 143:11,	47 [1] - 28:19
129 [1] - 67:17	189 [1] - 67:19 18th [4] - 10:22,	213 [4] - 90:14,	143:16, 147:11	495 [1] - 131:15
12:08 [7] - 32:5, 34:2,	82:5, 85:19, 144:13	90:19, 97:8, 99:14	235 [1] - 146:5	4:30 [1] - 93:9
34:3, 34:21, 34:28,	19 [1] - 3:11	215 [10] - 91:11,	23rd [2] - 122:11,	4:30am [1] - 92:28
41:27, 46:27 12:15 [1] - 38:23	19 [1] - 3.11 19(1) [1] - 50:18	96:25, 97:7, 97:8,	127:11	4:31 [1] - 99:1
12th [4] - 27:3,	19/9 [2] - 125:1,	102:24, 111:8,	24 [1] - 3:13 24-hour [2] - 93:5,	4:31-4:34 [2] - 91:3,
28:13, 31:9, 33:19	134:24	111:13, 114:6,	96:1	101:24
13 [3] - 2:30, 3:8,	19/9/15 [2] - 121:17,	115:22, 120:7	243 [1] - 33:14	4am [5] - 93:9,
68:18	135:19	216 [2] - 103:5, 116:9	245 [1] - 33.14 245 [2] - 43:24, 43:25	121:10, 124:24,
13/9 [1] - 121:10	190 [1] - 67:27	2185 [2] - 7:1, 8:8	25 [1] - 3:14	139:20, 146:16 4th [7] - 17:11, 18:2,
13/9/15 [1] - 124:24	1921 [1] - 1:9	219 [2] - 104:26,	254 [1] - 46:4	20:28, 51:14, 53:9,
131 [1] - 90:13	197 [1] - 69:29	111:12	25th [1] - 61:28	67:16, 83:2
133 [1] - 90:13	198 [1] - 85:18	2194 [1] - 22:23	26 [1] - 3:14	,
13319 [2] - 28:19,	19th [1] - 137:7	2195 [2] - 22:23,	26th [1] - 19:16	
28:20	1st [2] - 107:15,	22:25	27 [1] - 3:15	
135 [1] - 26:4	108:9	2196 [1] - 22:27		

		·		,
5	52:15, 52:17	acquitted [4] - 45:1,	ago [3] - 19:26, 39:4,	ANNE [2] - 3:7, 3:16
5	9th [3] - 26:29,	45:7, 54:20, 54:21	99:25	annoyed [5] - 21:28,
	28:11, 105:12	ACT [2] - 1:3, 1:8	agree [8] - 18:12,	41:6, 43:13, 52:3
5 [2] - 3:4, 93:9	20.11, 100.12	Act [2] - 141:19,	35:13, 62:7, 62:8,	annoys [1] - 45:18
507 [1] - 129:16	^			• • • •
51 [1] - 2:18	Α	146:9	128:9, 130:8, 149:2,	annual [2] - 27:2,
		acted [1] - 58:9	153:17	121:16
5th [1] - 79:5	AA [1] - 38:27	ACTING [2] - 3:6,	agreed [7] - 22:12,	ANS3 [1] - 14:28
	able [17] - 11:6,	3:12	39:7, 44:1, 54:4,	answer [15] - 29:16,
6	15:27, 35:27, 72:7,	action [3] - 1:27,	118:14, 131:15,	36:18, 37:6, 39:6,
		22:13, 128:5	154:12	39:8, 39:20, 40:5,
6 rol 2:4 5:5	81:10, 93:11, 93:25,	actions [1] - 143:29	agreeing [1] - 47:25	63:19, 71:22, 105:28,
6 [2] - 3:4, 5:5	98:5, 99:14, 99:23,	actual [4] - 54:28,	AGSI [1] - 4:1	106:19, 116:8,
607 [1] - 26:24	102:3, 102:14,	119:4, 124:11, 125:26	ahead [2] - 95:11,	133:29, 138:5, 144:12
6112 [1] - 47:16	104:14, 110:5, 110:7,	ad [1] - 21:18	111:23	answered [3] -
62 [1] - 10:28	119:1, 149:14	add [1] - 146:28	AIDAN [2] - 3:9, 4:2	39:12, 105:9, 123:18
63 [1] - 62:27	above-named [1] -	added [2] - 145:8,	aimed [1] - 154:22	answering [5] -
680 [1] - 11:21	1:26	145:29	Air [1] - 127:5	27:19, 29:11, 37:4,
681 [1] - 14:21	absence [7] - 26:16,		aired [2] - 151:26,	56:13, 72:2
682 [3] - 11:21,	27:7, 32:29, 51:27,	addition [4] - 85:25,	152:6	ANTHONY [1] - 3:5
14:21, 17:28	53:12, 53:16, 86:15	85:26, 86:22, 139:27		
683 [2] - 128:28,	absent [3] - 26:17,	additional [12] -	airing [1] - 152:4	anxious [3] - 19:1,
129:2	32:10, 44:1	68:14, 73:15, 74:3,	AISLING [2] - 2:11,	89:28, 133:20
690 [1] - 109:1	absolutely [2] -	90:25, 92:14, 92:26,	3:21	anyway [11] - 40:12,
691 [1] - 83:23	12:14, 89:24	98:29, 103:12,	Alan [15] - 44:23,	50:25, 72:11, 91:17,
6th [1] - 81:7	accept [11] - 10:1,	107:12, 109:16,	45:26, 46:17, 47:6,	93:5, 97:13, 97:18,
GLI [i] - 61.7	10:5, 10:7, 13:8,	115:18, 119:3	48:3, 48:4, 51:24,	114:19, 124:15,
	17:18, 34:24, 39:18,	additions [1] - 59:7	53:22, 53:24, 54:20,	140:4, 140:9
7		address [5] - 64:6,	54:21, 58:21, 59:29,	apart [2] - 142:25,
	40:25, 58:17, 59:22,	76:16, 89:19, 106:7,	60:27, 63:11	145:29
7 [8] - 1:9, 2:24, 3:5,	62:20	107:6	ALAN [2] - 3:8, 3:12	apologies [1] - 52:12
13:28, 25:29, 97:4,	acceptable [1] -	addressed [3] - 18:5,	alcohol [1] - 53:14	apologise [2] -
	76:15	85:19, 89:16	ALISON [1] - 3:25	37:14, 44:19
99:8, 101:1	accepted [1] - 84:23	addressing [1] - 88:3	allserious [1] -	apparent [4] - 45:15,
722 [1] - 14:18	access [2] - 41:25,	ADJOURNED [5] -	86:21	138:1, 154:16
728 [1] - 11:4	118:6	9:21, 50:7, 80:29,	allegation [2] -	appeal [21] - 28:27,
73 [4] - 62:26, 62:28,	accord [1] - 57:6			29:3, 39:23, 40:14,
62:29, 63:1	accordance [3] -	114:26, 156:14	65:22, 155:16	45:20, 45:21, 48:7,
742 [1] - 11:4	71:20, 80:2, 138:1	ADMINISTRATIVE	allegations [5] -	
7th [4] - 22:25,	according [3] - 53:8,	[1] - 3:13	39:5, 58:2, 61:5,	49:10, 54:11, 54:22,
29:25, 78:10, 114:1	151:27, 152:9	admitted [2] - 38:24,	66:16, 155:12	55:24, 55:25, 56:15,
7th/8th [1] - 90:11	account [5] - 52:29,	38:26	alleged [1] - 144:11	56:20, 56:25, 56:29,
	87:20, 122:20,	adopt [2] - 49:24,	allow [3] - 75:10,	57:1, 57:12, 59:15
8	141:18, 144:3	65:3	82:15, 105:15	APPEAL [2] - 1:13,
	, · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	adopting [1] - 81:14	allowance [2] -	2:3
	accurate [3] - 35:1, 40:27, 52:10	advance [2] - 11:25,	40:22, 43:1	appear [20] - 14:10,
8 [7] - 3:5, 3:28, 7:2,		93:15	allowed [2] - 41:18,	27:16, 28:10, 50:20,
33:25, 50:12, 64:28,	accusation [1] - 37:4	advice [4] - 47:7,	81:11	50:23, 56:13, 70:11,
67:19	accuse [1] - 85:11	74:14, 75:4, 76:19	almost [1] - 59:8	72:13, 77:4, 77:18,
8/8 [2] - 91:3, 101:24	accused [2] - 60:5,	advised [7] - 13:4,	alongside [1] - 153:5	80:18, 92:14, 106:19,
842 [1] - 12:29	153:6	14:29, 19:5, 74:16,	alternative [1] -	108:6, 111:8, 113:17,
843 [1] - 12:29	accuses [1] - 139:14	75:6, 76:29, 141:17	15:13	115:5, 115:20,
8846 [2] - 47:24, 48:8	achieve [1] - 75:18	affect [7] - 136:29,	amended [1] - 23:12	121:25, 125:13
8942 [1] - 115:6	achieving [1] -	137:19, 137:20,	AMENDED[1] - 1:9	APPEARANCES[1] -
8th [3] - 105:27,	107:13	137:24, 147:23,		2:1
108:4, 114:1	acknowledge [3] -	149:29, 155:25	amicable [1] - 21:12	appearances [1] -
100.4, 114.1	28:3, 46:8, 52:1		amounting [1] -	21:19
	acknowledged [2] -	affected [1] - 151:13	53:17	appeared [3] - 11:13,
9	45:25, 84:29	afforded [1] - 56:29	AMS4 [1] - 18:8	19:1, 133:15
	acknowledging [1] -	affords [1] - 45:19	AN [1] - 3:2	
9 [3] - 3:6, 67:10,	50:21	afraid [1] - 67:20	AND [7] - 1:3, 1:4,	appended [1] - 14:28
67:14	acknowledgment [3]	afternoon [2] -	1:8, 3:15, 9:21, 50:7,	appendix [2] - 67:18,
9pm [3] - 52:14,	- 48:18, 58:7, 58:11	49:26, 114:19	114:26	129:15
Jpini [0] = 02.14,	-0.10, 00.1, 00.11	age [1] - 87:3	ANDREW [1] - 4:2	applicable [1] -
	1			1

69:14 75:24, 79:8, 91:23, 27:12, 59:23, 64:1, 74:21, 99:9, 126:8 arrest [1] - 110:2 application [4] arrested [1] - 109:18 106:3, 106:6, 124:23, 64:3, 85:28, 107:19, beginning [1] - 89:10 40:22, 41:4, 42:28, arrests [1] - 87:2 125:6, 131:17 110:11, 113:18, behalf [2] - 51:23, 122:3, 122:5, 122:8, attachment [1] -109:21 arrival [1] - 18:7 126.1 applies [1] - 141:19 134:16 129:11, 150:13, behind [1] - 127:7 arrive [2] - 52:25, 154:17 appoint [1] - 44:23 attempt [3] - 87:19, belittle [1] - 149:19 110:18 appointed [2] -134:21, 155:14 awkward [3] - 83:29, arrived [3] - 71:11, **belittling** [1] - 149:18 84:14. 84:18 51:26, 53:22 attend [2] - 109:21, 72:29, 98:3 belonged [1] - 69:5 **AWOL** [19] - 31:6, 109:29 appointing [2] arrives [1] - 52:17 belonging [1] - 69:3 31:11, 31:16, 31:21, 46:5, 50:13 attended [1] - 27:15 arriving [2] - 11:29, beside [5] - 69:15, appointment [2] attending [1] -32:8, 32:20, 32:25, 72:9, 77:14, 143:9, 68:29 10:26, 11:1 140:16 33:1, 35:5, 35:12, 146:16 **AS**[7] - 1:9, 6:1, 38:24, 39:7, 43:2, appointments [1] attention [37] - 6:20, 6:10, 9:21, 50:7, 81:1, best [12] - 64:9, 54:4, 54:5, 54:27, 10:23 6:29, 14:12, 15:2, 72:29, 75:12, 75:17, 114:26 19:12, 19:13, 50:10, 57:9 75:20, 83:25, 85:1, appreciate [3] ascertain [2] - 42:25, 64:11, 64:15, 70:3, 107:12, 114:21, 102.7 85:3, 85:9, 95:23, В 76:25, 79:10, 85:2, 140.14 128:4, 143:1 asleep [1] - 36:15 87:9, 121:26, 131:24, appreciated [1] aspect [1] - 108:10 better [3] - 28:7, 131:27, 132:6, 109:16 assailants [2] -36:23, 118:22 background [1] -132:19, 138:15, appreciation [1] between [13] - 24:6, 122:21, 144:12 85:28 138:20, 141:5, 142:1, 25:1, 25:8, 41:26, 107:18 assertion [2] - 13:8, backs [1] - 46:11 approach [1] -142:14, 142:16, 58:8, 60:5, 110:18, 58:13 backward [1] - 99:15 142:24, 142:26, 113:18, 133:27, 105:24 assigned [1] bad [1] - 63:17 146:25, 147:8, approaching [2] -134:4, 138:28, 121:29 badly [1] - 150:22 147:13, 147:20, 139:20, 152:19 43:14, 81:15 assignor [1] - 59:20 Baker [4] - 23:9, 151:24, 154:4, big [3] - 73:21, appropriate [5] assist [8] - 76:10, 86:19, 121:26, 125:10 154:19, 154:25, 10:9, 31:2, 49:21, 89:24, 130:5 76:13, 76:14, 82:18, balanced [2] - 71:15, 154:29, 155:2 81:19, 145:1 87:3, 105:16, 154:20, billing [1] - 25:7 attitude [3] - 74:12, appropriately [1] **binding** [1] - 78:17 Ballinasloe [3] -75:2, 137:14 19:2 assistance [2] binge [1] - 35:10 105:12, 106:15, audit [4] - 12:25, bit [11] - 6:23, 18:25, approval [2] - 11:25, 68:27. 149:14 106:28 13:27, 14:8, 87:15 23:25, 41:23, 51:4, Assistant [5] - 11:2, bar [1] - 97:24 August [21] - 11:2, approve [1] - 22:10 57:14, 59:9, 112:13, 55:16, 62:4, 88:22, BAR [1] - 2:31 44:22, 51:14, 52:11, approved [3] - 22:16, 111:5, 120:21, 156:11 **BARNES**[1] - 2:5 53:9, 72:12, 72:14, 22:26, 23:5 ASSISTANT[6] **bits** [1] - 100:19 Barnes [1] - 9:14 72:15, 82:5, 83:3, April [4] - 22:25, BL [12] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, Bartlett [1] - 33:9 85:19, 90:11, 91:12, 24:3, 25:10, 65:20 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 3:18, 3:20 based [4] - 40:1, 94:15, 102:24, 103:5, area [25] - 68:20, assisting [1] -2:28, 3:24, 3:24, 3:25, 40:3, 40:25, 57:13 111:7, 114:2, 115:11, 72:23, 73:10, 73:12, 3:29, 4:3 126:27 basic [2] - 36:20, 116:9, 144:13 73:18, 73:26, 78:28, assume [1] - 126:12 black [1] - 127:6 122:23 authority [1] -115:18, 116:20, blacked [1] - 30:28 assure [1] - 75:11 **basics** [1] - 62:5 112:15 116:29, 117:25, blame [1] - 62:17 assured [1] - 141:14 avail [5] - 8:21, 27:6, **basing** [1] - 66:5 asterisk [1] - 143:9 119:10, 119:12, blamed [1] - 62:9 basis [6] - 34:9, 66:9, 90:21, 93:21, 97:22 119:15, 120:20, **AT** [1] - 156:15 blank [7] - 39:3, 76:4, 109:27, 119:28, availability [1] -120:22, 124:26, Athlone [13] - 14:8, 68:20, 72:25, 79:11, 127:24 119:4 124:28, 127:1, 127:2, 106:15, 115:25, 27:7, 67:16, 73:22, **BASTION**[1] - 3:31 available [9] - 76:10, 127:3, 134:19, 116:12 85:20, 118:25, 76:13, 87:14, 104:9, batch [1] - 11:17 134:22, 139:24 blank).. [1] - 116:14 130:16, 132:26, 105:2, 111:10, **BE** [1] - 6:9 argument [2] -134:27, 135:27, blanks [2] - 116:27, 111:18, 118:13, bear [3] - 44:14, 56:23, 71:15 138:17, 142:12, 116:29 125:28 99:25, 114:14 arise [1] - 79:16 155:29 **blatant** [1] - 53:12 avenue [2] - 118:13, became [3] - 27:4, arisen [1] - 97:3 Blue [1] - 127:6 **ATHLONE** [1] - 3:32 118:15 60:27, 110:11 arises [1] - 107:8 **blurry** [1] - 95:10 Athlone.. [1] avenues [1] - 117:10 become [4] - 12:6, arose [2] - 114:5, **bold** [1] - 41:23 132:24 avoided [1] - 88:19 15:10, 89:2, 122:8 123:19 atmosphere [1] book [1] - 139:17 becomes [2] - 45:15, await [2] - 143:5, **ARRAN**[1] - 2:23 154:9 booked [1] - 121:16 143:28 154:15 arranged [1] - 17:13 attach [2] - 18:7, boot [1] - 45:17 aware [21] - 13:11, bed [1] - 23:23 arrangement [1] -51.17 bottom [6] - 15:24, 14:20, 15:10, 17:17, beer [2] - 39:1 65:5 attached [12] - 23:5. 20:19, 50:20, 71:5, 19:7, 21:5, 27:4, beg [5] - 28:20, 45:3, arrears [1] - 22:8 44:19, 50:17, 70:2, 75:25, 129:3

bottoms [1] - 127:6 **box** [2] - 99:8, 101:2 bracket [3] - 7:25, 18:19, 20:16 branch [2] - 126:16, 141.1 Bray [2] - 21:14, 21:15 breach [4] - 21:3, 51:16, 53:1, 53:5 breaches [2] - 28:24, break [9] - 49:22, 49:25, 50:2, 50:4, 80:22, 81:4, 114:16, 114:19, 114:21 breakthrough [2] -110:13, 110:15 BRIAN [2] - 3:14, 3.16 bridge [1] - 127:2 brief [1] - 86:29 briefly [1] - 18:29 BRIEFLY [3] - 9:21, 50:7, 114:26 bring [4] - 76:15, 87:9, 154:19, 155:20 bringing [4] - 76:28, 125:17, 132:6, 154:3 brings [4] - 29:15, 56:12, 154:24, 154:29 broke [2] - 112:6, 117:22 broken [1] - 27:24 brought [18] - 6:20, 6:29, 14:11, 39:1, 64:14, 70:15, 73:8, 78:20, 79:10, 121:15, 121:26, 124:25, 124:29, 134:18, 134:23, 146:22, 150:2, 151:23 Bruir [3] - 39:22, 57:20, 59:17 **Bruir's** [3] - 40:1, 57:6, 57:13 build [2] - 13:19, 149:22 building [4] - 73:11, 73:13, 73:19, 78:22 bullying [4] - 120:5, 132:15, 133:19, 141:27 bundle [1] - 58:1 burglary [1] - 105:11 **busy** [5] - 71:12, 72:28, 74:5, 77:25, 84:14 **BY** [12] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29,

3:25, 3:30, 4:4, 5:5, 6:9

C

C8 [2] - 70:12, 78:18 C8s [3] - 91:23, 111:24, 112:29 **CAGNEY** [1] - 3:16 camera [4] - 68:5, 73:13, 73:26, 77:8 cameras [1] - 73:11 cannot [2] - 79:14, 131:19 cans [1] - 39:1 cap [1] - 58:11 capable [1] - 120:23 car [55] - 7:7, 7:9, 7:16, 10:13, 11:25, 13:20, 13:22, 13:24, 14:2, 14:7, 15:25, 16:12, 17:13, 17:20, 17:22, 17:25, 18:14. 18:19, 18:22, 20:13, 21:27, 23:27, 24:4, 25:17, 91:4, 91:8, 93:26, 93:29, 98:10, 98:11, 100:10, 100:14, 101:17, 101:25, 102:4, 102:5, 102:11. 103:23. 103:24, 105:11, 106:5, 106:6, 107:5, 110:18, 110:20, 110:23, 130:15, 130:22, 134:20, 146:15, 152:13 care [1] - 124:29 career [3] - 21:13, 83:27 150:28 careful [1] - 141:17 careless [1] - 151:16 carelessly [1] -103:25 **CARR** [1] - 3:15 **CARRICK**[1] - 2:13 CARRICK-ON-**SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 carried [4] - 86:24, 107:12, 108:25, 156:4 **CARROLL** [1] - 2:16 carry [1] - 121:29 carrying [1] - 120:23 cars [1] - 14:7 CARTHAGE[1] -2:17

case [27] - 26:15,

29:17. 32:14. 35:26.

39:2, 53:11, 55:22,

57:29, 70:22, 74:11, 75:1, 75:11, 76:11, 76:15, 79:14, 99:11, 104:21, 107:1, 108:23, 110:9, 117:10, 122:16, 125:10, 141:16, 142:20, 148:20, 148:22 cases [3] - 70:5, 76:5, 85:7 **CASTLE** [1] - 1:17 Castle [1] - 61:21 categorisation [2] -147:18, 151:18 category [2] - 7:25, Cathriona [1] - 12:22 caught [1] - 7:21 CC [2] - 19:4, 86:17 CCTV [101] - 68:5, 73:8, 73:9, 73:17, 73:29, 77:5, 77:13, 77:15, 78:20, 79:13, 89:17, 90:21, 91:3, 91:14, 91:16, 91:17, 93:6, 93:11, 93:13, 93:16, 93:21, 93:24, 93:26, 94:19, 94:25, 96:3, 96:4, 96:5, 96:12, 96:27, 96:28, 96:29, 97:4, 97:5, 97:20, 97:22, 97:23, 97:26, 98:1, 98:7, 98:16, 98:29, 99:3, 99:7, 99:21, 100:1, 100:5, 100:10, 100:13, 100:16, 100:21, 101:2, 101:3, 101:5, 101:16, 101:18, 101:24, 101:29, 102:1, 102:16, 102:18, 102:20, 102:28, 103:1. 103:9. 103:16. 103:18, 103:20, 104:9, 104:10, 104:11, 104:15, 104:18, 104:29, 105:8, 105:15, 105:18, 106:1, 106:2, 106:4, 106:11, 106:14. 106:26. 106:27, 108:1, 109:5, 110:18, 110:28, 110:29, 113:11, 113:12, 113:18, 113:20, 120:26, 122:20, 124:28, 127:8, 134:22

CCTVs [4] - 94:6, 95:2, 96:10, 96:14 **Centre** [1] - 104:19 cert [2] - 32:20, 44 19 certain [8] - 11:23, 21:21, 34:24, 35:18, 43:6, 117:28, 127:1, 127:2 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 certainly [12] - 11:23, 29:5, 39:26, 96:17, 110:1, 119:1, 120:13, 120:14, 124:14, 133:15, 152:23, 153:11 certificate [5] -26:14, 33:8, 55:2, 55:4. 56:2 certification [3] -16:26, 16:27, 18:11 certified [2] - 25:21, 26:16 certify [2] - 1:24, 26.14 Chair [1] - 65:17 Chairman [21] - 6:5, 6:28, 8:15, 8:25, 9:15, 10:11, 37:26, 49:20, 62:25, 63:22, 64:21, 64:27, 64:29, 65:28, 66:27, 67:3, 67:4, 67:7, 114:17, 114:29, 147.16 CHAIRMAN [223] -1:12, 6:4, 6:7, 6:12, 6:23, 6:26, 8:17, 8:20, 8:22, 8:26, 9:2, 9:5, 9:10, 9:17, 34:16, 36:4, 36:7, 36:10, 36:17, 36:20, 37:3, 37:7, 37:9, 37:11, 37:17, 37:20, 37:23, 37:25, 37:27, 38:3, 38:8, 38:10, 38:12, 38:16, 46:19, 47:26, 49:23, 50:2, 51:4, 51:7, 54:15, 54:18, 54:27, 55:1, 55:4, 55:8, 55:10, 55:16, 56:1, 56:4, 56:19, 56:22, 56:24, 57:4, 57:17, 57:20, 57:24, 57:27, 60:19, 60:22, 60:26. 61:2. 61:4. 61:11, 61:15, 61:19, 61:23, 62:2, 62:5, 62:7, 62:13, 62:15, 62:19, 62:21, 62:24,

62:27, 62:29, 63:8,

63:13, 63:20, 63:23, 64:23, 64:26, 65:4, 65:8, 65:10, 65:16, 65:21, 65:27, 66:2, 66:7, 66:11, 66:17, 66:20, 66:28, 67:5, 67:8, 67:22, 67:25, 69:9, 69:11, 69:13, 69:17, 69:19, 69:21, 69:25, 74:18, 74:20, 74:22, 74:25, 80:8, 80:10, 80:12, 80:14, 80:16, 80:18, 80:21, 81:20, 81:23, 81:26, 94:2, 94:4, 94:9, 94:11, 94:14, 94:17, 94:21, 94:24, 94:27, 94:29, 95:2, 95:4, 95:7, 95:11, 95:14, 95:17, 95:19, 95:23, 95:27, 96:3, 96:6, 96:8, 96:10, 96:13, 96:16, 96:19, 96:22, 97:15, 97:17, 98:23, 99:13. 99:17. 103:23. 103:25, 103:28, 104:1, 104:5, 114:15, 114:19, 114:24, 115:2, 119:6, 119:9, 119:13, 119:19, 119:21, 119:28, 120:3, 128:29, 129:5, 130:8. 130:10. 130:28, 131:4, 131:7, 131:12, 133:6, 134:3, 134:6, 134:8, 135:6, 135:13, 138:13, 138:23, 140:5, 140:9, 143:7, 143:9, 143:13, 143:16, 143:19, 143:24, 145:23, 145:25, 146:2, 148:1, 148:3, 148:7, 148:11, 148:16, 148:18, 148:23, 148:26, 148:28, 149:1, 149:6, 149:9, 149:12, 152:20, 153:2, 153:4, 153:12, 153:16, 153:20, 153:22, 153:25, 154:6, 154:14, 155:20, 155:22, 156:4, 156:6, 156:10 challenge [1] -148:12 challenged [2] -25:25 39:5 challenging [1] -151:17 chance [7] - 8:16,

78:19, 99:17, 101:8, 101:16, 110:16, 110:21 change [3] - 57:8, 153:14, 155:1 changed [5] - 41:29, 136:28, 137:21, 137:29 changing [1] -153:13 channels [1] - 11:9 chapter [6] - 75:7, 75:15, 75:23, 75:25, 79:9, 90:5 characterised [1] characterising [1] -87:18 charge [25] - 26:17, 33:1, 33:15, 37:2, 39:25, 44:29, 45:1, 45:2, 45:4, 45:5, 53:19, 54:3, 54:11, 54:13, 54:15, 54:28, 55:13, 56:8, 57:10, 58:9, 59:20, 62:16, 82:9, 104:25 Charge [1] - 86:16 charged [2] - 39:24, charges [4] - 53:26, 54:25, 55:17, 60:29 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:4 CHEALLACHÁIN [1] - 2:29 cheapest [2] - 15:16, 15:19 check [2] - 110:17, 119:3 checked [10] - 11:28, 14:2, 14:3, 15:25, 49:16, 56:17, 80:12, 80:14, 125:13, 125:14 **checking** [1] - 6:26 checks [3] - 13:3, 13:29, 14:7 **CHIEF** [14] - 3:2, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:18, 3:19, 3:20, 3:26 Chief [15] - 7:6, 7:15, 18:28, 19:1, 20:18, 24:6, 24:8, 25:2, 25:3, 25:5, 29:2, 46:18, 57:7, 59:20, 109:13 chief [20] - 7:8, 7:23, 18:6, 22:22, 32:17, 40:14, 44:22, 45:19, 47:15, 49:15, 51:14, 51:18, 51:26, 53:8,

53:21, 53:26, 54:8, 59:16, 81:16 chosen [1] - 122:29 chronological [1] -80.18 chronology [1] -152:9 Church [1] - 146:16 church [1] - 130:16 cigarettes [1] -117:23 circles [2] - 60:20, 61:27 circulated [3] -91:16, 96:29, 103:1 circumstances [8] -21:4, 30:29, 58:7, 73:1, 83:28, 84:17, 84:20, 84:29 CIT [1] - 122:26 claim [10] - 11:27, 12:24, 14:11, 16:17, 16:18, 16:20, 34:9, 42:29, 43:3, 151:13 claimed [2] - 11:26, 25:21 claims [30] - 11:3, 12:9, 12:14, 13:5, 13:22, 14:14, 14:18, 14:24, 14:25, 14:29, 15:9, 15:28, 16:6, 16:9, 16:11, 17:14, 17:16, 18:3, 18:10, 19:7, 19:17, 20:25, 21:2, 21:6, 22:5, 22:9, 22:16, 22:26, 22:28, 23:23 claims....I [1] - 22:10 clarification [14] -24:22, 29:1, 54:24, 57:2, 62:26, 71:10, 75:21, 78:2, 88:10, 91:21, 125:26, 128:7, 152:25, 153:29 clarified [5] - 58:28, 61:10, 61:27, 97:17, 105:27 clarify [7] - 52:27, 63:4, 66:11, 68:26, 114:22, 134:5, 154:4 clarifying [1] - 61:12 classification [3] -19:7, 153:13, 153:15 classified [1] -151:20 clear [21] - 19:17, 36:3, 37:25, 47:28,

50:10, 52:3, 62:3,

65:23, 73:4, 78:6,

78:26, 80:24, 94:22,

95:1, 96:23, 97:25, 103:15, 109:11, 118:12, 136:1, 152:1 **cleared** [1] - 19:25 clearly [4] - 13:25, 14:4, 17:20, 122:25 clerk [1] - 14:5 close [5] - 50:3, 81:11, 117:19, 117:24, 130:25 closed [13] - 81:7, 88:24, 95:29, 142:16, 142:20, 142:24, 142:26, 144:18, 144:25, 147:12, 147:13 closely [1] - 12:15 **closer** [1] - 6:23 closing [1] - 9:6 clothing [1] - 123:11 CMO [2] - 32:14, 32:17 **CO**[2] - 2:13, 3:32 code [1] - 21:3 collated [1] - 68:10 collator [1] - 107:2 colleague [1] -137:11 colour [2] - 91:8, 102:10 colourfully [1] -116:2 combined [1] -113:28 comfortable [1] -149.13 coming [10] - 19:11, 64:4, 92:1, 139:13, 140:15, 147:5, 150:9, 150:14, 153:8, 153:10 commenced [1] -26:20 commencement [1] - 122:24 commencing [1] -129:16 comment [8] - 55:10, 55:11, 82:10, 88:21, 91:20, 113:6, 119:26, 143:10 commentary [1] -143:20 commenting [1] -152:23 comments [2] -68:18. 91:7 commercial [2] -17:22, 22:3 Commissioner [8] -

57:14, 59:9, 65:19, 112:13, 156:1 **COMMISSIONER** [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:18, 3:20 commitment [1] -86:6 committing [1] -118:7 common [4] - 18:13, 39:28, 123:5, 125:16 communities [1] -86:7 community....In [1] -86.22 **COMPANY**[1] - 2:22 compare [1] - 15:16 complain [1] - 10:16 complainant [2] -65:25. 137:7 complained [1] -59:26 complaint [14] -10:20, 32:28, 59:9, 60:23, 70:27, 131:23, 132:29, 134:28, 135:13, 135:27, 136:15, 136:17, 137:8. 149:3 complaints [16] -13:15, 25:28, 67:13, 131:24, 132:19, 138:15, 138:20, 141:5, 142:14, 142:16, 142:24, 142:26, 146:25, 147:8, 147:14, 148:18 complete [1] - 87:6 completely [2] -45:24, 85:4 compliance [1] -87:10 complicated [2] -55:16, 56:4 complied [3] - 88:17, 144:13, 146:8 complimentary [1] -109:14 components [1] -123:3 computer [2] -103:9, 124:12 concentrating [2] -35:12, 154:10 concern [3] - 53:29, 54:1, 65:17 concerned [14] -20:23. 23:21. 25:19. 31:3, 46:5, 50:13,

55:1, 55:4, 56:1, 56:6, 62:7, 63:25, 103:7, 115:4 concerning [1] -154:18 concerns [2] - 66:12, 121:4 concise [3] - 85:25, 86:16.86:29 conclude [1] - 22:11 conclusion [4] -70:16, 76:16, 76:28, 119:16 **conduct** [1] - 119:23 conducted [8] -14:24, 44:26, 60:2, 68:15, 74:4, 98:29, 109:15, 139:24 conducting [1] -66:15 conference [2] -32:15, 127:26 confidence [1] -70:17 confined [2] -152:11, 152:27 confirm [1] - 120:1 confirming [1] -130:3 confirms [2] -129:25, 151:3 confused [2] - 62:4, **confusion** [1] - 50:10 **CONLON** [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT[1] -Connaught [1] -118:26 connect [4] - 42:26, 73:6, 89:5, 89:14 connected [2] - 92:3, 106:5 CONNELLAN [2] -3:29, 3:30 **CONOR** [1] - 3:23 consequence [1] -28:21 consequently [1] -131:23 consider [1] - 53:11 consideration [1] -47:21 considered [1] -115:21 considering [2] -25:20, 39:22 consistent [2] -19:11, 77:4

constituted [1] -

11:2, 25:3, 25:4,

147:23 16:24 46:16, 47:5, 47:14, crimes [6] - 74:13, date [51] - 24:5, 29:6, 75:3, 75:13, 77:2, consulted [1] - 25:13 47:18, 47:23, 48:5, counting [1] - 132:13 29:9, 29:13, 29:17, contact [19] - 7:5, 48:6, 48:7, 48:15, Counting [1] -79:13, 125:23 29:19, 29:20, 34:27, 49:7, 49:11, 49:18, criminal [2] - 113:29, 35:23, 36:8, 37:11, 7:13, 7:15, 7:22, 128:27 19:27, 35:25, 36:24. 50:17, 51:17, 51:18, county [2] - 19:28, 37:13, 37:14, 37:21, 115:10 56:17, 57:2, 67:28, 37:13, 37:19, 37:22, 20:3 criminality [1] -38:5, 38:10, 38:11, 37:23, 39:6, 98:5, 99:11, 106:4, 106:27, 155:9 38:12, 40:13, 41:12, couple [6] - 80:11, 41:24, 42:17, 43:19. 107:1, 115:8 98:6, 106:28, 107:4, 92:2, 92:4, 109:28, criminals [2] core [1] - 47:21 44:8, 45:23, 49:17, 134:24, 135:3, 135:19 118:7, 128:19 101:12, 120:22 contacted [5] -Cormac [4] - 27:29, 54:1, 54:7, 55:20, course [26] - 7:9, critical [5] - 82:5, 37:28, 41:19, 43:29, 29:8, 36:24, 39:17 19:3, 20:12, 22:12, 82:13, 85:24, 85:29, 57:8, 57:10, 71:27, 108:4, 135:1 correct [71] - 8:29, 23:29, 24:10, 24:25, 142:2 77:20, 77:21, 77:22, 86:28, 94:17, 98:20, contacts [2] - 24:9, 11:18, 12:1, 12:3, 39:11, 45:15, 47:12, criticise [1] - 107:24 12:17, 14:14, 15:4, 100:26, 102:23, 36.23 49:10, 60:23, 64:20, criticised [1] - 148:8 106:18, 115:12, 17:5, 17:24, 19:19, 82:28, 97:17, 99:19, contain [1] - 88:6 criticising [3] -115:15, 126:28, 20:4, 21:9, 22:8, 102:18, 127:10, contained [2] - 11:3, 113:15, 116:6, 137:13 136:6, 138:14, 22:20, 24:3, 26:22, 129:14 128:4, 138:7, 138:11, criticism [6] - 80:23, 28:28, 29:20, 30:22, 141:10, 141:13, 141:3, 147:9, 147:26, contains [1] - 140:24 81:14, 82:16, 112:24, 33:12, 34:4, 34:10, 142:7, 152:10 154:3, 154:23 contemplate [1] -112:26, 113:2 34:23, 35:24, 37:14, dated [5] - 85:19, COURT [3] - 1:13, 17:21 criticisms [2] -100:25, 105:9, 37:17, 37:18, 37:20, 2:3, 3:31 contents [1] - 83:17 67:22. 89:29 37:21, 38:5, 38:10, 122:11, 131:15 contest [1] - 58:8 court [6] - 12:10, crop [3] - 84:14, 38:11, 38:13, 42:24, dates [3] - 10:22, 21:14, 85:6, 87:29, context [1] - 57:5 112:20, 120:10 42:27, 43:24, 43:27, 109:22, 136:23 56:8, 148:24 continue [4] - 46:6, crops [1] - 111:28 44:24, 56:1, 60:1, cover [3] - 22:8, **DAVID** [2] - 2:27, 46:10, 82:8, 148:12 **CUALÁIN** [1] - 3:6 61:20, 68:25, 69:24, 3:18 32:20, 104:9 CONTINUED [1] -Cualáin [3] - 11:2, 70:28, 71:6, 87:26, **DAVIS**[1] - 2:8 covered [3] - 29:21, 154:18, 156:1 94:15, 97:29, 99:5, **DAY**[1] - 1:18 75:29. 121:1 continues [7] -**CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 100:22, 101:5, Create [1] - 141:25 days [18] - 27:5, 86:10, 86:26, 138:19, culprits [1] - 115:18 101:29, 102:13, 28:13, 31:3, 35:8, created [1] - 25:19 138:21. 141:5. curiosity [2] - 34:8, 109:19, 114:3, 114:8, 35:9, 35:16, 38:25, 142:17, 142:27 credibility [1] -124:19, 127:23, 44:19, 53:17, 98:25, contrary [2] - 26:13, 131:20 **curious** [1] - 104:2 129:22, 129:23, 109:28, 121:16, credit [9] - 28:1, curiously [1] -130:2. 135:6. 135:7. 123:26, 123:27, 35:26, 39:7, 39:27, convenient [7] -155:18 135:9, 135:23, 125:25, 140:2, 146:4 40:7, 40:12, 136:28, 8:27, 9:10, 10:17, Curley [3] - 86:18, 135:29, 147:1, 148:3, de [6] - 39:22, 40:1, 49:27, 66:26, 114:15, 137:20 121:28, 129:10 148:15, 149:5, 152:10 57:6, 57:13, 57:20, Crime [2] - 99:1, 114.20 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:9 corrected [2] -59:17 128:27 conveniently [1] -Curley's [1] - 131:13 13:21, 60:10 deadline [7] - 58:16, crime [51] - 68:20, 49:24 **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 correctly [1] - 21:2 58:26, 58:27, 59:4, 70:2, 70:15, 72:25, conversation [6] -Curran [1] - 129:15 correspondence [13] 59:12, 60:14, 63:29 73:6, 75:7, 75:23, 10:4, 21:13, 34:18, custody [1] - 134:23 - 54:9, 92:23, 105:8, deal [17] - 9:4, 19:1, 38:6, 38:14, 61:11 76:8, 76:20, 79:1, Custom [4] - 67:16, 120:11, 128:19, 19:17, 22:7, 23:21, 79:9, 79:23, 82:19, conveyed [1] -68:10, 82:23, 83:12 128:21, 128:22, 56:20, 56:21, 64:5, 89:6, 89:16, 89:19, 116:24 customary [1] -133:27, 134:3, 89:21, 91:3, 91:10, 66:18, 67:16, 70:6, conviction [1] -140:21 138:27, 139:15, 110:7, 123:23, 101:24, 105:1, 110:8 cut [2] - 150:19, 148:27, 152:11 105:22, 105:24. 125:26, 128:20, cooking [1] - 150:9 151:10 corrupt [3] - 153:13, 141:1, 150:15 107:6, 107:14, cooperate [6] -153:18, 153:19 107:29, 117:7, 118:7, dealing [8] - 52:6, 129:29, 130:2, D corruption [1] -66:18, 69:7, 90:2, 118:29, 120:23, 131:22, 132:9, 153:24 111:26, 113:3, 149:27 126:12, 126:13, 132:28, 133:12 cost [3] - 15:11, dealt [14] - 19:18, 130:13, 130:21, D/Branch 131 cooperation [1] -16:27. 23:17 130:23, 130:24, 51:16, 53:4, 53:15, 121:19, 123:22, 124:9 131:20 COSTELLO [1] -56:16, 56:18, 59:17, 131:2, 132:3, 132:13, D/Sergeant [2] **cop** [1] - 138:10 90:12, 92:12, 92:20, 133:23, 138:7, 86:18, 121:28 Copies [1] - 106:14 couch [1] - 39:20 140:16, 141:9, 105:6, 112:29, D/Superintendent COPPINGER [1] council [2] - 19:28, 141:16, 142:15, 117:13, 122:29 [1] - 31:23 3:3 20.3 debate [1] - 82:3 148:14, 151:1, Daly [1] - 10:26 copy [31] - 14:28, counsel [1] - 8:12 deceased [1] - 15:7 153:21, 153:23, damage [3] - 113:29, 23:6, 45:22, 45:26, countersigned [1] -**DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 153:28 115:10, 116:27 45:28, 45:29, 46:3,

December [4] - 15:1, 16:5, 43:29, 152:3 decided [1] - 44:23 deciding [1] - 63:11 decision [5] - 46:21, 54:10, 128:8, 128:11, 128:26 decisions [1] - 66:29 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:4 declaration [1] - 20:4 declarations [5] -19:21, 19:22, 20:1, 20:2, 20:11 declared [1] - 55:5 declined [1] - 132:10 dedication [1] - 86:6 deemed [1] - 87:6 defence [3] - 47:2, 48:1, 57:1 delay [3] - 10:14, 10:21, 14:17 deliberate [1] - 44:12 deliberately [7] -29:10, 35:24, 36:13, 36:17, 37:5, 39:20, 56:13 **Deputy** [4] - 10:26, 151:24, 152:2, 154:4 **Dermot** [1] - 115:12 describe [1] - 115:28 described [1] - 22:24 describes [5] -11:20, 11:23, 12:29, 22:25, 38:5 describing [1] -52:28 description [1] -144.11 descriptions [1] -122:20 desk [1] - 72:9 desks [1] - 72:4 **DESMOND**[1] - 4:3 detail [8] - 67:21, 71:23, 71:25, 87:4. 89:9, 123:18, 124:4, 125:15 detailed [2] - 123:10, 140:2 details [20] - 19:28, 27:26, 86:28, 87:1, 87:14, 88:19, 89:1, 93:27, 100:8, 121:12, 124:1, 124:11, 129:18, 130:14, 130:23, 139:10, 139:25, 140:2, 140:6, 141.2 **detections** [1] - 86:2 **DETECTIVE** [5] - 3:3,

3:4, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17 Detective [6] - 10:24, 13:11, 13:17, 20:29, 42:2, 155:7 34:18, 154:20 detective [6] - 125:4, 126:16, 129:17, 134:27, 135:27, 140:29 60:2, 141:21 detention [1] - 87:3 develop [1] - 71:22 DEVELOPMENT [1] 28:22, 29:18 developments [3] -24:2. 24:3 79:15, 108:9, 117:1 1:2. 1:3 diaries [1] - 43:20 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 86:1, 86:14 diary [11] - 10:27, 28:16, 30:26, 33:3, 34:2, 34:4, 35:12, 35:13, 41:9, 41:25, 55:3. 55:29 52:13 difference [4] - 14:2, 133:18 130:5, 130:28, 130:29 different [25] - 7:25, 14:8, 20:15, 39:15, 49:15, 51:6, 54:13, 149:25, 149:26, 54:15, 59:18, 67:11, 154:22 68:1, 69:6, 69:20, 29.5 85:6, 92:4, 92:12, 92:13, 94:5, 94:6, 96:1, 108:16, 112:10, 112:11, 123:2 differently [1] -81.16 difficult [2] - 61:25, 150:4 difficulty [5] - 13:10, 121:24, 129:7, 131:15, 132:12 56:10, 69:1, 83:29 digging [1] - 20:11 **DIGNAM**[1] - 3:23 direct [3] - 13:26, 50:9, 65:26 directed [3] - 19:27, 83:8, 108:24 128:17 direction [6] - 23:16, 102:6, 110:20, 130:18, 130:19, 146:17 113:17 directions [3] -132:24, 138:17, 142:11 Directive [1] - 12:13 **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:12 DIRECTORATE[1] -3.15

disadvantage [1] -

disagree [5] - 85:4,

88:8, 131:4, 132:12,

132:13

disciplinary [5] -19:9, 25:29, 26:1, discipline [11] -23:29, 24:15, 25:13, 28:24, 51:16, 51:28, 52:7, 53:1, 53:16, disciplined [5] -24:1, 25:11, 25:24, disciplines [2] -DISCLOSURES [2] discovered [2] discredit [1] - 138:3 discreditable [2] discreditably [1] discrediting [7] -112:27, 147:24, 147:25, 147:26, discrepancies [1] discretely [1] discuss [4] - 17:16, 18:6, 20:23, 66:25 discussed [10] -12:21, 18:29, 21:18, 22:15, 35:7, 119:2, discussion [3] -12:21, 19:16, 52:9 displayed [1] - 86:4 displays [1] - 86:2 dispute [2] - 128:15, disputing [1] - 87:17 disregard [1] - 53:12 distinction [1] distinctly [1] - 17:23 district [13] - 14:3, 14:5, 19:12, 27:7, 27:10, 85:20, 86:2, 86:6, 86:17, 108:26, 132:24, 138:17, 142.11 dividing [1] - 155:13 **Divilly** [2] - 131:17, 132:11 division [4] - 7:7,

DIVISION [1] - 1:12 divisional [2] -85:27, 86:5 **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:3 doctor [2] - 32:20, 146:20 doctor's [1] - 33:8 document [22] -6:16, 8:1, 9:25, 15:6, 41:11, 50:10, 51:2, 75:22, 85:21, 85:22, 100:17, 100:19, 107:22, 111:20, 111:22, 114:18, 114:29, 138:4, 141:24, 141:28, 143:22, 144:29 documentation [1] -22.27 documents [25] -17:9, 22:19, 40:29, 43:26, 46:2, 48:13, 48:20, 48:26, 50:28, 60:10, 65:6, 67:27, 72:11, 85:19, 90:13, 112:3, 112:4, 121:7, 122:5, 129:24, 137:4, 138:27, 151:3, 154:23, 155:6 **DONAL** [2] - 3:6, 3:24 **done** [30] - 11:9, 13:29, 19:22, 23:17, 36:13, 39:4, 42:7, 43:3, 44:3, 56:15, 70:27, 71:14, 71:20, 73:16, 81:8, 81:11, 84:18, 84:26, 90:28, 92:26, 107:19, 123:3, 123:4, 127:26, 128:18, 140:14, 147:18, 147:19, 151:16 door [2] - 73:24, 117.22 doubt [5] - 34:23, 71:17, 77:13, 110:26, 129:16 doubts [1] - 122:1 down [57] - 8:2, 18:25, 26:25, 31:13, 33:15, 41:22, 43:13, 46:6, 46:10, 48:23, 50:20, 51:4, 51:5, 51:21, 56:27, 61:16, 69:21, 69:22, 70:12, 72:13, 74:9, 78:8, 82:3, 82:7, 84:19, 92:1, 92:17, 92:22,

93:10, 98:7, 100:16,

101:14, 104:25, 107:29, 111:29, 112:9, 112:23, 113:10, 113:12, 113:13, 117:21, 118:15, 120:8, 122:9, 124:18, 138:19, 138:21, 141:5, 142:17, 142:22, 142:24, 142:27, 144:19, 144:22, 147:5 **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:14, downgraded [1] -132:18 download [2] - 98:1, 98.2 downloaded [3] -101:4, 106:2, 108:5 **DPP**[1] - 76:11 Dr [1] - 33:9 **DR** [1] - 3:11 draw [1] - 142:1 drawn [2] - 64:11, 147:20 drink [5] - 30:11, 30:15, 31:6, 31:11, 38.27 drinking [9] - 27:24, 29:28, 30:19, 30:22, 31:16, 32:13, 33:6, 38:25, 39:13 $\boldsymbol{drinks}\, [1] \boldsymbol{-} 38:29$ drive [2] - 18:18, 104:12 driven [2] - 124:26, 134:20 driver [1] - 130:21 driving [1] - 17:19 drop [2] - 61:4, 139:25 drugs [1] - 155:12 drunk [1] - 44:3 **DUBLIN** [6] - 1:17, 2:19, 2:24, 2:31, 3:28, **Dublin** [4] - 42:6, 61:21, 73:21, 90:11 due [4] - 60:23, 97:17, 117:9, 121:17 duly [1] - 146:22 duration [1] - 41:17 during [3] - 13:3, 26:15, 72:28 duties [5] - 122:24, 152:11, 152:12, 152:18, 152:27 duty [17] - 26:8, 27:5, 27:14, 28:8, 28:11,

33:17, 41:19, 43:1,

7:9, 7:22, 7:23

43:8, 43:11, 44:18, 54:25, 55:26, 56:11, 86:13, 140:15, 140:19 **DVD**[1] - 98:17 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 Dáil [2] - 151:26, 152:3 Ε e-mail [5] - 19:5, 27:8. 27:10. 86:16. 86:17 **EAMON**[1] - 3:9 earlies [1] - 38:29 early [6] - 14:16, 38:1, 38:3, 93:10, 139:22 easier [1] - 99:11 easily [1] - 19:25 easy [2] - 56:5, 153:7 effect [7] - 22:4, 113:28, 125:4. 148:14, 149:17, 150:20, 150:27 effectively [5] -112:9, 149:27, 151:8, 152:4 effort [9] - 35:24, 37:18, 37:22, 75:12, 91:15, 96:28, 102:29, 124:27, 149:23 efforts [5] - 70:6. 76:23, 77:1, 79:25, 107:15

EGAN[1] - 3:25 either [15] - 27:18, 33:18, 48:15, 48:28, 49:7, 57:3, 77:17, 77:23, 77:28, 85:29, 86:14, 101:3, 133:19, 147:23 150:26 elephant [1] - 150:6 ELIZABETH[1] -2:29 emanates [1] - 13:20 EMMA [1] - 3:26 enclosed [1] - 68:12 end [8] - 20:10, 24:25, 51:11, 51:12, 80:5, 108:18, 150:14, 156.6 endorsed [3] - 23:2, 79:18, 122:13 ends [1] - 112:2 enforcer [2] - 58:11, 63:5 enhance [3] - 91:16,

96:28, 103:1

enquire [2] - 10:9, 40:17 enquired [2] - 54:9, 101:10 enquiries [13] -14:24, 21:29, 68:15, 73:15, 90:4, 92:26, 104:21, 107:12, 110:12, 111:15, 112:16, 121:29, 122:1 enquiry [2] - 53:23, 92:14 ensure [7] - 12:13, 76:9, 76:27, 86:12, 107:13, 108:25, 112:15 ensured [1] - 23:22 enter [2] - 78:21, 134.10 entered [2] - 68:1, 74:3 entire [1] - 66:9 entirely [2] - 11:24, 56:5 entirety [1] - 127:13 entitled [7] - 23:24, 25:20, 29:2, 56:14, 113:25, 136:16, 153.14 entitlement [1] -45:20 entries [6] - 30:26, 32:25, 35:5, 35:7, 102:14, 126:18 entry [16] - 8:10, 29:24, 85:26, 85:27, 93:19, 97:19, 98:15, 100:20, 100:29, 101:19. 103:6.

115:16, 124:14, envelope [1] - 98:4 Environment' [1] -141.25 envisaging [1] - 88:4 **EOIN** [1] - 2:28

episode [1] - 149:3 **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:8 equally [1] - 141:20 error[1] - 63:6 essentially [10] -44:10, 57:18, 83:19, 110:15, 133:22, 133:24, 138:8, 148:20, 149:24,

150:29 establish [1] -113:16

ESTABLISHED[1] -

etc [1] - 122:23 etcetera [2] - 133:21, 144:12 **ethos** [1] - 75:9 evaluating [1] - 82:1 evening [2] - 77:23, 77:28 event [9] - 25:16, 29:23, 43:3, 51:9, 53:7, 73:21, 74:8,

137:29, 144:2, 150:23

existed [1] - 122:2 existing [1] - 75:6 exists [1] - 76:12 expect [4] - 79:25, 80:1, 94:17, 144:10

expected [3] - 115:1, 123:4, 125:14 expecting [1] -

expense [2] - 16:28,

expenses [11] -10:15, 10:21, 11:26, 12:15, 12:24, 13:4, 20:26, 21:3, 22:5, 25:21, 25:23 expert [1] - 87:27

123:7, 154:6 events [8] - 25:27,

29:15, 33:7, 35:16, 49:15, 57:5, 122:20, 152.22 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8

115:3

evidence [24] - 7:2, 25:12, 38:20, 49:4, 65:26, 66:4, 66:16, 68:21, 72:25, 73:6, 73:14, 76:10, 79:1, 105:2, 112:6, 116:13, 116:27, 127:24, 128:10, 133:1,

155:16, 155:17 evidential [2] - 68:5, 105:18

exactly [7] - 16:13, 52:27, 56:5, 65:23, 103:29, 152:7 example [1] - 82:17

exams [1] - 136:19 excellent [3] - 86:1, 86:23, 96:4

exception [1] -146:10

exceptional [1] -84:20 exclamations [1] -

150:10 exclude [1] - 76:23 excuse [2] - 13:23,

44:3 executioner [3] -60:7, 61:8, 62:16

EXECUTIVE [1] exhibit [1] - 33:25

Exhibit [1] - 82:6 exhibited [1] - 13:27 18:12

explain [6] - 36:4, 99:26, 99:28, 104:1,

explained [9] - 7:10, 20:28, 21:19, 22:11, 36:26, 52:4, 52:5, 78:15 88:15 explaining [1] - 36:7

explains [1] - 74:22 explanation [10] -14:4, 33:11, 43:22, 43:23, 44:15, 48:1, 74:11, 75:1, 104:29, 122:28

explanatory [1] -137:26 explore [2] - 36:1, 76:9

explored [1] - 76:6 exploring [1] - 40:13 expressed [1] -83.22

expresses [1] -109.9 expressing[1]-107:18 **extent** [3] - 117:12,

146:28, 150:17 extreme [1] - 153:26 extremely [1] - 58:27

eye [1] - 7:21

F

face [3] - 59:28, 122:16 face-to-face [1] -59:28 Facebook [4] -27:26, 36:26, 37:23, 37.28 fact [23] - 16:7, 21:20, 24:13, 37:28, 43:2, 56:14, 57:8, 57:9, 82:29, 85:2, 89:5. 89:13. 109:18. 112:16, 118:5,

118:19, 130:29, 136:2, 137:10, 142:25, 151:17, 154:10, 155:27

facts [5] - 66:1,

130:12, 130:13 failed [1] - 33:18 fair [7] - 23:21, 84:23, 88:21, 111:20, 112:18, 114:22, 133:9 faire [2] - 74:12, 75:2 fairly [7] - 19:2, 23:22, 56:15, 56:16, 77:11, 77:24, 150:21

113:16, 125:17,

fairness [1] - 150:3 false [2] - 106:7, 107:6 **falsely** [1] - 151:9

family [3] - 114:8, 114:10, 118:3 **FANNING** [1] - 2:21 far [10] - 59:27, 73:12, 73:17, 73:28, 74:13, 75:3, 95:11,

121:27, 125:12, 141:13 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:1

Farrell [2] - 15:2, 86:18 fashion [3] - 76:7,

84:2, 122:29 fault [2] - 9:16, 9:18 favour [1] - 121:19 February [1] - 19:16 **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:5,

fella [1] - 89:17 felt [6] - 21:2, 21:28, 121:28, 128:4, 150:22, 155:24 **FERGAL** [1] - 2:26

FERRY [1] - 2:16

1:9

few [6] - 38:25, 66:14, 123:27, 125:25, 140:2, 149:9 fiddling [4] - 133:23, 153:21, 153:23, 153:27

figures [4] - 133:23, 153:21, 153:23, 153:28 file [39] - 18:2, 18:4, 18:10, 20:23, 23:6,

68:23, 68:24, 74:3, 76:8, 79:23, 81:6, 82:17, 83:1, 83:7, 84:10, 87:16, 88:6, 88:20, 89:9, 89:16, 89:20. 89:21. 91:15. 92:25, 98:15, 102:22, 102:29, 105:1, 106:3, 110:3, 111:11, 111:18, 115:3, 115:20, 117:7,

117:14, 126:5, 126:12, 126:13 files [9] - 67:11, 68:24, 68:26, 70:2, 91:10, 92:9, 112:24, 120:14, 121:3 fill [1] - 100:11 filling [4] - 94:7, 114:1, 115:5, 115:10 final [3] - 88:19, 88:24, 117:5 finance [8] - 11:29, 12:23, 14:25, 14:27, 14:28, 15:27, 16:7, 23:3 financial [2] - 20:25, 21:3 fine [2] - 30:24, 137:25 finish [5] - 10:17, 35:3, 128:18, 139:26, 149:12 finished [2] - 142:17, 142:21 **FINN** [1] - 3:5 Finn [2] - 59:9, 59:16 Finn's [3] - 40:1, 57:14, 112:13 **FINTAN** [1] - 2:21 firing [1] - 153:8 first [35] - 14:2, 17:4, 17:23, 23:26, 24:4, 24:14, 32:28, 44:29, 45:4, 51:11, 54:3, 54:22, 55:7, 55:27, 64:10, 67:15, 67:19, 90:14, 90:29, 91:21, 92:5, 92:19, 94:25, 97:21, 99:3, 100:21, 104:15, 112:28, 112:29, 122:25, 126:21, 128:25, 134:12, 139:11, 152:14 firstly [1] - 45:21 fit [3] - 27:14, 33:17, 38:25 FITZWILLIAM [1] -4:4 five [3] - 8:25, 8:26, 41:26 fled [1] - 127:7 flick [1] - 99:15 flu [1] - 47:13 **FLYNN**[1] - 3:19 focused [1] - 57:21 focusing [1] - 87:13 follow [3] - 53:21, 53:27, 90:8 followed [2] - 77:14,

105:26 FOLLOWING [1] -1:4 **following** [10] - 1:25, 18:7, 19:3, 76:17. 105:3, 105:6, 112:17, 119:6, 121:29, 131:24 follows [3] - 27:11, 70:3. 104:26 **FOLLOWS** [6] - 6:1, 6:10, 9:22, 50:7, 81:1, 114:27 **foot** [1] - 22:15 footage [10] - 77:10, 78:21, 91:4, 93:13, 93:28, 101:25, 104:9, 104:18, 109:5, 110:24 FOR [10] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:26, 3:1, 3:29, 4:1, 80:29 force [3] - 86:6, 145:21, 151:15 forget [1] - 153:25 forgive [1] - 24:17 forgot [1] - 38:25 forgotten [1] - 44:3 form [11] - 11:5, 11:27, 23:8, 70:11, 70:26, 75:8, 99:6, 99:7, 123:5, 125:7, 132:15 formal [1] - 76:19 **FORMER** [2] - 1:13, 2.3 former [2] - 10:4, 65:19 forms [9] - 14:11, 16:17, 16:18, 16:20, 17:1, 23:5, 71:1, 71:29, 78:18

formulated [1] -53:26 formulator [1] - 58:9 **forth** [1] **-** 67:13 forward [3] - 12:9, 17:14 99:15 forwarded [12] -44:20, 73:1, 79:1, 106:11, 106:15, 106:27, 107:1, 121:19, 121:20, 125:8, 131:27, 146:26 forwarding [1] -134:14 four [8] - 10:22, 28:13, 51:11, 53:17, 67:10, 98:25, 105:28, 121:3 fourth [1] - 11:1 framework [1] -

82:18 fraud [1] - 19:23 frequent [4] -116:20, 116:29, 119:10, 119:12 Friday [5] - 27:14, 27:15, 30:19, 33:17, 33:22 Friend [2] - 10:18, 65:14 fro [3] - 133:26, 134:3 fro-ing [3] - 133:26, 134:3 front [3] - 72:1, 72:8, 139:18 fulfil [1] - 108:26 full [1] - 146:8 fuming [1] - 41:23 furnishing [1] - 89:1

G

Galway [1] - 20:27 game [1] - 82:19 GARDA [11] - 2:10, 2:26, 2:27, 2:27, 3:2, 3:10, 3:10, 3:11, 3:21, 5:3. 6:9 Garda [94] - 6:5, 6:13, 8:18, 9:24, 13:4, 13:5, 14:3, 14:17, 14:24, 14:29, 15:26, 18:4, 19:6, 19:8, 20:23, 20:25, 21:1, 21:5, 21:12, 26:1, 26:28, 27:4, 33:17, 39:2, 39:4, 47:18, 50:9, 51:27, 57:28, 60:19, 65:29, 67:9, 74:13, 75:3, 75:10, 76:7, 76:13, 76:19, 76:27, 77:1, 79:9, 79:11, 80:24, 81:3, 82:17. 91:3. 98:29. 101:24, 101:29, 102:1, 103:9, 103:16, 103:18, 104:10, 104:18, 106:1, 106:3, 106:14, 106:15, 106:27, 106:28, 107:2, 108:24, 109:3, 109:15, 110:28, 116:26, 121:15, 130:20, 131:16, 132:11, 134:1, 134:17, 136:11, 136:12, 140:12, 141:13, 141:16,

141:21, 142:29, 146:9, 146:15, 147:16, 150:8, 150:14, 152:15, 152:27, 154:18, 154:21 garda [8] - 21:15, 106:4, 106:15, 126:26, 126:27, 134:27, 135:27, 154:24 gardaí [5] - 24:23, 121:15, 124:24, 125:5, 132:7 Gardaí [3] - 107:5, 129:21, 130:1 gathering [1] - 76:10 gender [1] - 87:4 general [9] - 12:6, 15:14, 62:16, 70:17, 113:6, 115:28,

151:29, 155:22 generally [3] - 15:19, 119:15, 154:8 generate [1] - 86:22 generated [1] -108:23 GERAGHTY [1] -

2:17

GERARD [1] - 2:11

GERRY [1] - 3:10

Gerry [2] - 14:3,
15:26

given [14] - 23:16, 29:1, 46:14, 46:22, 55:24, 56:16, 74:11, 75:1, 76:19, 90:12, 97:22, 118:5, 121:12, 148:7

glance [1] - 82:27 glass [1] - 117:22 GLEESON [1] - 4:3 goals [2] - 86:7, 107:14 GOODE [1] - 3:21

GRALTON [1] - 3:14 granted [1] - 109:25 great [5] - 30:23, 99:26, 99:28, 149:14, 154:27

GREENE [1] - 2:26 GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26 ground [2] - 127:7, 131:11

grounds [2] - 45:21, 55:25 group [1] - 118:3

guard [8] - 7:24, 11:24, 49:14, 75:17, 75:28, 85:8, 110:6, 125:16
guards [4] - 30:27,
84:26, 128:8, 135:11
Guards [1] - 85:11
guilty [15] - 28:25,
28:26, 44:29, 45:2,
45:4, 45:5, 53:19,
54:12, 55:14, 55:17,
55:18, 55:19, 55:27,
55:28, 56:9
gunning [1] - 155:27
guy [1] - 96:4
GWEN [1] - 1:29
Gwen [1] - 1:24

Н

Haddington [6] -40:22, 41:2, 41:18, 42:28, 43:12, 43:17 **half** [4] - 34:29, 39:3, 63:24. 130:19 HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 hand [6] - 8:13, 12:8, 29:24, 48:9, 58:11, 62:16 handed [4] - 15:8, 24:23, 63:28, 108:5 handiest [2] - 18:18, 18:20 hands [3] - 30:25, 89:26 93:18 handwriting [5] -32:26, 79:19, 90:26, 101:20, 115:14 handwritten [11] -15:6, 48:22, 49:2, 81:5, 121:7, 124:18, 134:9, 136:8, 139:3, 139:11, 144:4 **happy** [5] **-** 65:16, 116:28, 118:10, 118:11, 149:6 HARAN[1] - 4:2 Haran [4] - 16:16, 16:26, 18:11, 23:9 harassment [8] -120:6, 125:7, 132:16, 133:19, 139:8, 139:14, 141:28, 152:1 hard [2] - 38:29, 104.12 harvested [1] -105:15 hassle [1] - 136:23 hatch [1] - 72:6 hatches [1] - 72:7 head [2] - 96:23, 120:28

141:19, 141:20,

43:6 104:28, 105:13, 154:7 135:20, 135:25, **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 headed [2] - 33:27, hundreds [2] -117:18, 121:18, individuals [1] -136:2, 136:14, 147:12 72:22, 78:29 122:2, 122:13, 120:29 137:14, 144:11, hurt [1] - 145:17 122:16, 123:9, 146:17, 146:19, indoor [3] - 152:11, heading [5] - 67:25, 68:18, 142:18, 143:8, hypothesise[1] -123:15, 123:22, 152.18 152.27 151:3, 151:6 124:2, 124:8, 124:11, Injured [1] - 132:28 143:22 66:6 indulgence [1] hear [5] - 6:27, 31:2, 124:23, 124:28, 53:14 injuries [7] - 121:18, hypothetically [1] -125:2, 126:13, 129:7, 122:22, 145:9, 126:7, 128:10, 148:19 66:6 inefficient [1] - 104:2 130:3, 130:18, 145:15, 145:18, heard [4] - 12:20, inextricable [1] -131:19, 131:23, 146:11, 146:13 59:27, 60:15, 86:13 141.20 **HEARING** [7] - 6:1, 132:21, 134:22, inform [3] - 8:8, injury [2] - 145:11, 138:24, 139:19, 9:21, 50:7, 80:29, 79:24, 117:8 145:13 ID [2] - 90:12, 90:24 140:27, 140:28, 81:1, 114:26, 156:14 information [21] inputted [1] - 125:27 idea [4] - 30:23. 141:3, 142:11, inquiries [3] - 98:29, heat [2] - 34:11, 18:28, 44:20, 46:22, 49:26, 66:23, 99:13 144:23, 145:1, 109:16, 115:18 43:18 73:2, 79:2, 81:10, identifiable [1] -146:18, 146:23, HELD_[1] - 1:17 87:6, 88:15, 105:4, inquiring [1] -126:23 148:13, 152:13 111:10, 111:17, 151:23 held [1] - 145:24 identification [3] incidents [15] - 69:6, help [4] - 62:25, 113:19, 121:21, inquiry [7] - 48:19, 93:29, 107:15, 109:4 82:5, 85:24, 85:29, 125:8. 131:27. 51:27, 74:4, 90:25, 100:18, 132:1, 147:21 identified [8] - 13:3, 88:11, 88:12, 89:20, 140:24, 146:26, 117:10, 119:23, heroic [1] - 154:27 13:26, 70:5, 76:24, 92:17, 92:19, 94:5, 148:7, 148:9, 154:17, herself [1] - 15:21 119:25 105:11, 109:18, 106:5, 109:7, 137:1, high [1] - 108:25 155:25 **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:2, 117:16, 154:11 147:28, 149:27 informed [8] - 15:20, 1:8 highlight [1] - 86:23 identity [3] - 68:10. include [4] - 15:11, 17:12. 20:29. 39:4. insofar [3] - 20:22, highlighted [3] -124:27, 134:21 76:23, 87:3, 144:11 125:3, 134:26, 23:20, 66:12 66:13, 86:5, 109:6 ignored [1] - 45:24 included [11] -135:26, 136:14 INSPECTOR [7] him...one [1] - 39:3 ignoring [1] - 44:9 45:26, 47:23, 48:19, ing [6] - 133:25, 3:3, 3:9, 3:14, 3:17, himself [4] - 41:29, ill [2] - 55:5, 137:10 50:22, 86:28, 88:20, 133:26, 134:3 3:17, 3:21, 4:1 65:25, 120:20, 136:15 illustrate [1] - 83:5 89:11, 108:10, initial [5] - 69:28, inspector [1] - 21:15 history [2] - 53:11, imagine [2] - 16:20, 128:12, 128:13, 88:5, 88:20, 108:11, Inspector [14] -129:14 34:12 155:10 122:18 11:19, 15:2, 17:15, hitched [2] - 91:5, immediate [2] includes [2] - 37:1, initiated [2] - 62:18, 17:27, 19:27, 21:29, 101:26 87:10, 121:20 44:13 132:7 83:22, 86:18, 108:29, hmm [3] - 62:6, including....details immediately [5] initiatives [2] -121:27, 125:11, 79:29, 106:20 6:19, 6:20, 6:29, 111 - 87:2 81:28, 82:1 128:25, 129:15 hoc [1] - 21:18 117:21, 117:24 incoming [1] - 18:5 injured [73] - 68:12, instance [1] - 62:10 hold [4] - 55:8, impartial [1] - 49:16 inconsistent [1] -69:9, 69:10, 70:10, instead [2] - 22:3, 66:17, 143:16 implementation [1] -148:11 70:16, 71:11, 72:29, 155:15 holding [3] - 20:8, 87:10 inconvenience [1] -73:8, 73:9, 76:4, 76:5, instigated [1] - 13:12 32:14, 156:10 implicitly [1] - 88:5 65.14 76:29, 77:5, 77:7, INSTRUCTED [7] home [8] - 121:15, **implied** [1] - 29:9 incorrect [6] - 18:19, 78:17, 79:24, 83:23, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 124:29, 127:1, implies [3] - 44:8, 29:14, 29:18, 41:10, 89:15, 95:20, 98:6, 3:25, 3:30, 4:4 130:17, 134:23, 107:25, 113:11 41:21, 43:19 98:9, 99:29, 102:2, instruction [4] -139:25, 146:22, 150:2 importance [2] incorrectly [1] -103:24, 110:26, 82:4, 82:29, 83:3, honest [1] - 39:21 19:10 45:9, 76:20 110:27, 111:4, 111:5, 156:4 hope [1] - 103:15 incumbent [1] - 76:9 important [7] -116:17, 117:8, instructions [5] -HORAN [1] - 3:24 35:23, 36:8, 37:11, incurred [1] - 11:26 117:16, 121:10, 75:7, 75:16, 85:17, hostile [1] - 62:2 37:13, 63:17, 86:4, indeed [4] - 28:22, 121:18, 122:20, 144.13 hour [1] - 34:29 143:26 101:7, 101:9, 101:11 124:25, 124:26, INSTRUMENT[1] hours [5] - 38:3, **IN** [1] - 1:17 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 124:28, 125:3, 127:1, 1.7 41:2, 93:10, 139:22 inappropriate [2] indicated [6] - 44:2, 127:3, 129:18, intend [2] - 11:22, HOUSE [2] - 2:23, 129:23, 129:24, 112:14, 118:16 52:3, 65:2, 65:24, 103:16 Inaudible [2] - 24:14, 130:11, 130:17, 65:25, 66:14 intended [3] - 82:15, house [6] - 73:19, 130:20, 130:22, 108:15 indicates [2] - 76:11, 108:24, 124:4 73:22, 73:24, 73:26, 130:24, 130:25, inbox [1] - 27:10 116:26 interested [1] - 63:27 73:27, 130:26 132:1, 133:7, 133:8, indicating [2] - 8:28, incident [49] - 69:1, interesting [2] huge [1] - 57:15 69:16, 69:18, 84:13, 105:2 133:10, 133:12, 25:6, 47:10 HUGHES [2] - 2:29, 86:13, 90:10, 92:28, indication [2] - 99:7, 134:18, 134:20, interestingly [1] -134:25, 134:26, 93:2, 93:14, 99:22, 122:17 24.5 **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15 135:2, 135:3, 135:9, 103:10, 104:20, individually [1] interim [2] - 14:13, hundred [2] - 35:18,

85:18 108:25, 109:3, 47:18, 50:9, 57:28, Laois-Offaly [2] -J internally [1] - 35:21 111:21, 112:8, 60:19, 65:29, 67:9, 7:6, 7:8 interrelated [1] -112:10, 112:11 74:13, 75:4, 76:7, large [3] - 54:10, **JACK**[1] - 3:6 76:14, 76:19, 76:27, 10.13 investigative [3] -59:5, 64:3 **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 intervened [1] -70:16, 87:4, 122:18 79:9, 79:11, 80:25, last [10] - 27:14, January [1] - 23:14 81:3, 82:17, 97:9, 65:19 investigator [3] -64:12, 66:14, 83:28, jeep [2] - 20:27, 22:2 104:18, 106:3, 62:16, 62:18, 62:20 121:3, 126:7, 129:4, interview [12] job [1] - 154:28 106:14, 106:27, 47:19, 48:2, 49:3, investigators [3] -129:22, 143:11, **JOE** [1] - 3:13 106:28, 107:3, 60:11, 64:4, 64:11 148.27 50:17, 50:22, 60:11, 63:13, 70:26, 75:17, invite [1] - 141:10 **JOHN** [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 108:24, 109:3, law [1] - 71:20 131:25, 132:8 inviting [3] - 55:10, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 109:15, 115:11, **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:28 116:26, 121:15, interviewed [2] -55:11, 149:1 **join** [1] - 139:1 lead [1] - 119:15 **JUDGE** [1] - 3:12 134:1, 134:17, 61:23, 61:25 invoked [1] - 34:8 leads [1] - 79:14 140:12, 141:16, Judge [13] - 10:25, interviewing [4] involved [7] - 67:11, learn [1] - 16:16 142:29, 147:16 35:10, 61:18, 64:25, 64:12, 74:15, 75:5, 79:26, 86:3, 105:11, learned [1] - 137:14 **KEOGH** [3] - 2:10, 66:8, 73:20, 93:4, 76:21 107:26, 128:11, least [1] - 96:10 5:3, 6:9 94:8, 130:14, 131:9, **INTO** [1] - 1:2 147:17 leave [17] - 10:11, 133:3, 148:22, 155:21 Keogh's [7] - 13:4, intoxicated [1] involving [1] - 20:26 26:18, 27:2, 27:15, 13:5, 14:24, 21:1, judge [2] - 58:10, 121:14 Irish [1] - 127:5 27:17, 32:10, 44:1, 26:28, 51:27, 141:13 60:7 introduces [1] - 83:2 ironically [2] - 37:5, 51:27, 53:16, 64:21, July [17] - 10:24, **kept** [3] - 109:11, introducing [1] -37:9 65:14, 67:2, 78:22, 155:8, 155:10 10:25, 26:2, 26:29, 82:1 irrational [2] -110:5, 121:16, **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 27:1, 27:2, 27:3, 27:4, inure [1] - 138:2 115:29, 148:11 123:21, 139:28 27:11, 29:25, 33:18, KIERAN [1] - 3:19 investigate [3] irrationally [2] leaving [1] - 65:11 34:16, 34:21, 42:18, Kildare [1] - 107:5 123:25, 156:1, 156:3 26:16, 33:1 **led** [2] - 110:13, irrelevant[1] - 54:11 67:16, 83:2 Killarney [1] - 12:2 132:11 investigated [3] -Kilmartin [2] - 106:2, jump [1] - 130:26 13:6, 88:8, 131:19 irrelevantly [1] left [10] - 20:24, 23:1, 106:4 jumped [1] - 10:2 investigating [9] -56:25 29:24, 69:21, 69:22, June [1] - 10:22 Kilmartin's [11] -13:14, 70:12, 70:22, irrespective [1] -72:10, 98:2, 98:4, 93:2, 100:2, 100:5, jury [1] - 60:7 100:8, 142:2 75:13, 105:13, 130:11 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 101:28, 103:17, 126:26, 138:8, 138:9, left-hand [1] - 29:24 issue [46] - 8:16, 9:7, 103:19, 103:21, 10:11, 10:12, 10:28, 1:12, 2:2 leg [2] - 145:17, 104:19, 106:21, justified [1] - 46:21 investigation [59] -11:11, 13:4, 16:11, 146:20 107:28, 110:16 13:14, 21:20, 25:29, 16:14, 16:15, 17:20, legal [5] - 45:20, kind [5] - 7:25, 26:1, 34:19, 34:20, K 23:23, 23:27, 26:7, 47:7, 84:4, 87:26, 13:23, 64:5, 92:23, 40:2, 44:26, 45:14, 29:8, 35:22, 35:28, 87:27 107:28 57:14, 57:16, 60:10, 36:25, 40:13, 40:14, legally [4] - 71:15, KANE [1] - 2:28 kindly [1] - 65:2 67:11, 74:12, 75:2, 44:8, 45:9, 49:18, 71:16, 78:17, 84:24 **KATE**[1] - 3:25 75:9, 76:1, 76:4, 53:24, 54:7, 64:22, KIRWAN [1] - 3:13 legitimate [1] - 25:22 **KEANE** [1] - 4:3 knife [2] - 145:22, 76:20, 79:10, 79:14, 64:27, 64:29, 65:18, **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13 keen [1] - 112:12 81:15, 87:16, 88:6, 145:24 67:10, 67:14, 76:6, length [1] - 42:25 keep [3] - 9:13, knowledge [1] -88:20, 89:9, 102:22, 77:17, 83:19, 87:23, lengthy [2] - 83:20, 61:11, 155:18 105:16, 105:22, 147.21 87:29, 89:25, 94:18, 149:22 keeps [1] - 144:21 107:7, 107:14, 113:9, 118:4, 130:29, known [1] - 25:24 less [3] - 51:16, 52:6, **KELLY** [19] - 2:10, 109:12, 109:13, knows [3] - 16:10, 137.22 52:29 3:11, 8:15, 8:18, 8:21, 110:14, 111:11, Issue [2] - 10:15, 103:28, 144:17 **letter** [7] - 22:25, 9:1, 9:3, 62:25, 62:28, 111:18, 112:13, 25:29 117:4, 129:10. 63:2, 63:9, 65:5, 65:9, 112:24, 115:4, issued [1] - 85:17 L 139:16, 144:3, 144:4, 65:13, 67:4, 80:15, 117:14, 118:13, issues [13] - 9:5, 147:10 133:3, 143:11, 143:14 119:29, 121:20, 10:15, 25:22, 47:21, level [4] - 86:5, lack [1] - 117:9 Kelly [4] - 8:29, 122:24, 132:28, 49:13, 97:25, 103:4, 112:25, 131:1 lad [6] - 93:9. 100:4. 49:27, 67:1, 143:19 138:26, 141:15, 105:6, 120:8, 122:23, levels [1] - 92:12 **Kelly's** [2] - 49:25, 100:9, 136:18, 142:21, 144:21, 123:2, 138:29, 154:12 liaison [1] - 105:12 66:21 139:25, 150:2 147:4, 147:9, 150:7, issuing [1] - 16:11 **LIAM**[1] - 3:17 ladies [1] - 73:23 Keogh [53] - 6:5, 150:8, 154:18, it'd [1] - 73:21 liar [1] - 151:8 lady [1] - 77:12 154:21, 155:7, 155:9, 6:13, 8:18, 9:24, item [5] - 65:11, liberal [1] - 12:16 laissez [2] - 74:12, 155:13, 156:2 14:17, 14:29, 18:4, 69:3, 90:25, 149:12, light [3] - 67:5, 19:6, 20:23, 20:25, 75.2 investigations [12] -156.7 105:3, 111:16 21:5, 21:12, 26:2, language [1] - 56:4 64:19, 75:23, 76:13, items [1] - 69:3 likely [2] - 48:22, 27:4, 27:13, 33:17, Laois [2] - 7:6, 7:8 80:11, 92:4, 108:17, 86:21

limited [1] - 111:17 line [14] - 29:24, 38:21, 50:14, 91:21, 92:5, 111:29, 112:29, 123:13, 124:13, 128:27, 131:9, 140:26, 142:1, 142:3 lines [2] - 51:11, 113:25 link [4] - 72:25, 79:1, 79:12, 141:20 linking [1] - 143:14 list [2] - 12:23, 13:27 listen [3] - 20:10, 61:11, 71:27 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:27 live [2] - 92:10, 118:24 lived [2] - 102:4, 116:7 lively [1] - 77:24 loads [1] - 73:25 local [2] - 85:27, 120:22 located [1] - 115:6 location [4] - 93:3, 104:9, 126:26, 127:8 log [4] - 42:21, 42:22, 47:4, 125:21 logged [1] - 151:8 logic [1] - 119:13 logical [1] - 77:19 longhand [4] - 48:10, 48:15, 48:28, 49:7 look [67] - 8:2, 8:16, 11:4, 13:15, 13:23, 17:23, 17:26, 20:17, 22:23, 23:25, 24:13, 26:24, 28:19, 33:14, 33:26, 34:5, 40:6, 40:24, 40:28, 42:11, 43:25, 44:13, 44:14, 46:4, 51:9, 57:28, 60:26, 66:21, 66:22, 67:10, 67:20, 67:27, 67:29, 69:27, 79:5, 81:19, 82:6, 82:22, 85:10, 85:17, 90:14, 91:11, 98:26, 99:17, 100:10, 101:19, 103:5, 107:29, 108:6, 114:6, 123:27, 124:7, 125:22, 125:29, 132:1, 134:12, 137:27, 138:3, 138:29, 140:1, 140:26, 141:11, 143:11, 144:23, 147:28, 149:20, 151:4 looked [13] - 10:8,

19:15, 22:29, 42:12, 45:21, 49:19, 50:27, 65:6, 88:29, 89:17, 100:13, 117:14, 144:4 looking [18] - 9:25, 19:21, 20:11, 38:19, 43:9, 43:21, 46:3, 46:12, 48:6, 49:9, 52:11, 67:19, 92:16, 113:22, 115:23, 117:26, 145:3, 145:5 **looks** [2] - 104:3, 119.19 **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 loss [1] - 22:4 lost [4] - 17:25, 37:7, 103:14, 114:17 low [1] - 76:11 luckily [2] - 60:14, 100:14 LUNCH [1] - 80:29 lunchtime [1] - 50:3 **LYONS** [1] - 4:2

M

MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7 mail [5] - 19:5, 27:8, 27:10, 86:16, 86:17 MAIN [1] - 2:12 main [6] - 34:19, 34:20, 130:16, 155:8, 155:13. 155:15 maintains [1] -139:15 major [2] - 145:12 males [1] - 127:3 Malone [1] - 1:24 MALONE [1] - 1:29 man [1] - 124:10 manage [1] - 35:27 management [2] -19:12, 85:28 manner [1] - 75:8 manual [6] - 11:24, 75:8, 75:23, 76:1, 79:10, 122:26 March [3] - 17:11, 18:2, 20:28 MARGARET[1] -MARIE [2] - 3:7, 3:16 mark [1] - 138:6 MARK[1] - 3:3 marked [1] - 51:18 marking [2] - 47:13, 101:2 Marrinan [1] - 90:2 MARRINAN[1] - 2:7

material [1] - 55:19 materialised [1] -26:14 **MATT**[1] - 3:18 matter [36] - 9:3, 9:8, 12:22, 13:6, 18:5, 18:7, 18:29, 19:2, 21:7, 22:7, 22:11, 22:22, 23:22, 24:15, 25:11, 51:14, 51:15, 51:17, 63:5, 66:24, 75:20, 76:25, 76:28, 88:24, 97:23, 119:2, 122:1, 122:28, 125:5, 129:19, 129:20, 136:17, 143:24, 143:29, 150:15, 152:3 matters [8] - 19:11, 68:1, 76:15, 81:16, 81:18, 140:14, 154:19, 154:29 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:4 **MATTHIAS**[1] - 2:10 Max [1] - 127:5 Mc[inaudible [1] -146:15 McB [1] - 13:28 McBrien [13] - 2:16, 12:20. 13:25. 14:6. 16:25, 17:10, 18:3, 18:4, 20:25, 23:1, 23:2, 23:17, 81:24

McGARRY [1] - 2:21 McGrath [3] - 2:7, 2:27, 136:8 MCGUINNESS [2] -5:5, 6:10 McGuinness [97] -2:6, 3:24, 6:4, 6:5, 6:13, 6:24, 6:25, 6:28, 8:23, 8:24, 9:9, 9:13, 9:15, 9:24, 34:25, 37:26, 38:18, 38:19, 47:28, 49:20, 49:29, 50:9, 51:6, 51:9, 54:20, 55:10, 57:4, 57:5, 57:17, 57:28, 58:1, 60:26, 61:24, 63:14, 63:22, 63:24, 64:21, 64:27, 65:27, 65:28 66:3 67:2 67:3, 67:9, 67:26, 69:26, 74:19, 74:21, 74:25, 74:26, 80:13, 80:17, 80:20, 81:3, 81:22, 81:25, 81:27, 96:24, 97:19, 98:24, 99:14, 99:18, 99:19, 104:6, 114:17,

McCOURT[1] - 2:17

114:23, 114:29, 115:3, 119:22, 120:4, 129:1, 129:3, 129:9, 131:13, 133:14, 134:7, 134:9, 135:7, 135:15, 138:29, 140:12, 143:8, 143:15, 143:17, 143:22, 143:25, 145:27, 146:3, 149:7, 149:8, 149:16, 152:22, 154:8, 154:13, 154:15, 155:24, 156:8 mcKenny[1] - 19:4 McKenzie [2] -123:11. 127:6 MCLOUGHLIN [1] -

McLYNN [1] - 3:30 McMahon [1] - 10:25 MCMAHON [1] - 3:7 MCPARTLIN[1] -3:20 mean [54] - 13:15, 25:18, 32:28, 37:15, 39:11, 39:14, 47:9, 55:14, 56:2, 61:25, 62:2, 69:17, 72:1, 81:20, 83:17, 83:18, 85:6, 87:17, 88:29, 89:8, 95:2, 95:27, 108:20, 112:12, 112:13, 112:19, 113:8, 113:15, 118:21, 118:25, 119:22, 119:25, 120:17, 122:11, 125:10, 126:18, 128:10, 130:25, 137:25, 139:26, 140:14, 142:8, 145:5, 145:11, 148:19, 149:18, 149:19, 150:1, 150:13, 150:20, 151:1, 151:14, 154:10 mean.. [1] - 151:9 means [1] - 35:24 meant [7] - 27:22, 28:11, 50:14, 50:24, 69:5, 140:13, 140:17 meantime [2] -143:5, 143:28 meantime.. [1] -143:25

mechanism [1] -

media [1] - 65:29

medical [7] - 26:13,

56:20

32:17, 55:1, 55:4, 56:2, 145:15, 146:19 **MEDICAL**[1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 26:16 meet [2] - 23:27, 24:2 meeting [6] - 20:22, 21:16, 52:29, 118:4, 121:25, 128:12 member [17] - 38:23, 43:29, 46:5, 50:13, 53:15, 70:12, 70:22, 79:26, 85:20, 87:9, 105:13, 106:29, 121:29, 122:25, 132:22, 141:19, 141:22 **MEMBER** [1] - 2:2 Member [1] - 86:15 member's [1] - 53:11 members [7] - 12:24, 14:1, 41:18, 75:10, 86:1, 86:3, 140:21 memo [5] - 74:9, 78:7, 83:4, 104:25, 111.7 memory [2] - 51:1, 77:27 mention [3] - 9:28, 112:12, 113:17 mentioned [5] -10:12, 22:12, 23:29, 151:6, 155:19 message [5] - 26:20, 27:26. 28:3. 29:7 messages [9] - 24:6, 24:10, 24:20, 24:23, 24:27, 24:28, 24:29, 25:1, 25:8 met [7] - 17:10, 21:14, 44:27, 51:22, 61:21, 141:16, 150:10 MICHAEL [4] - 3:3, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 Mick [2] - 40:1, 57:14 microphone [1] -6:23 mid [3] - 49:25, 49:26, 114:19 middle [6] - 8:10, 20:20, 83:3, 106:24, 115:23, 122:14 midnight [1] - 38:1 might [13] - 10:8, 52:4, 65:29, 66:3, 66:5, 70:26, 89:10, 99:13, 112:19, 113:13, 119:23, 123:3

mightn't [1] - 99:26

mile [1] - 130:19

miles [2] - 116:7, 118:7 mind [11] - 23:5, 36:4, 36:7, 37:9, 56:7, 57:7, 60:19, 61:12, 87:13, 143:9, 147:22 mine [3] - 10:5, 20:14, 115:15 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 Minnock [15] - 11:20, 14:16, 17:15, 17:27, 18:26, 19:27, 22:1, 83:22, 108:29, 121:28, 125:11, 128:25 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 Minnock's [1] -14:12 minor [3] - 7:26, 143:9, 143:24 minute [8] - 14:17, 14:27, 18:8, 20:14, 29:23, 44:7, 108:7, 122:11 minutes [7] - 8:25. 8:26, 9:12, 50:4, 66:14, 114:22, 149:10 misinterpret [1] -113:22 missed [5] - 27:29, 39:14, 39:15, 39:16, 39:18 missing [5] - 11:13, 16:22, 17:6, 69:23, 155:11 misstate [1] - 45:3 mistake [8] - 26:13, 42:16, 44:17, 62:10, 63:25, 63:26, 64:2, 64:10 mistaken [1] - 61:7 mistakes [4] - 58:20, 59:11, 64:6 mistrust [1] - 13:18 misunderstanding [1] - 126:11 mix [3] - 26:7, 58:23, 59:22 mix-up [3] - 26:7, 58:23, 59:22 mixed [3] - 58:22, 60:4. 98:8 modified [1] - 43:4 moment [7] - 34:11, 43:18, 65:10, 95:25, 129:13, 148:1, 149:15 Monaghan [20] -72:12, 72:14, 76:27, 78:9, 78:14, 79:4, 103:6, 104:6, 105:21,

105:26, 106:1, 106:22, 108:7, 115:12, 116:22, 116:24, 124:17, 134:11, 134:13 Monday [3] - 27:3, 27:17, 33:19 MONICA [1] - 3:15 monies [1] - 22:20 monitor [1] - 100:9 monitored [1] -12:15 month [4] - 34:15, 77:10, 144:26, 150:5 months [5] - 11:16, 76:24, 147:3, 148:29, 153:5 morning [13] - 6:4, 6:5, 6:12, 6:13, 6:14, 30:24, 30:25, 49:26, 92:28, 93:10, 125:22, 139:22, 146:20 **MORONEY** [1] - 3:17 MORRISSEY [1] -3.25 most [2] - 26:13, 48:22 mostly [1] - 39:1 mother [2] - 125:1, 134:24 motor [1] - 19:21 move [6] - 10:16, 13:19, 57:27, 64:29, 65:11, 138:12 moving [3] - 90:10, 91:4, 101:25 Moylan [7] - 26:22, 29:8, 36:26, 39:17, 68:2, 97:15, 97:16 Moylan's [1] - 44:4 MR [126] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:8, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:27, 2:28, 2:28, 3:12, 3:13, 3:16, 3:22, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:29, 3:30, 4:3, 5:5, 6:5, 6:10, 6:13, 6:25, 6:28, 8:15, 8:18, 8:21, 8:24, 9:1, 9:3, 9:9, 9:15, 9:24, 34:25, 37:26, 38:19, 47:28, 49:20, 49:29, 50:9, 51:6, 51:9, 54:20, 57:5, 58:1, 62:25, 62:28, 63:2, 63:9,

63:22, 63:24, 64:21,

64:27, 64:29, 65:5,

65:9, 65:13, 65:17,

65:22, 65:28, 66:3,

66:8, 66:12, 66:19, 66:27, 67:3, 67:4, 67:7, 67:9, 67:26, 69:26, 74:19, 74:21, 74:26, 80:13, 80:15, 80:17, 80:20, 81:3, 81:22, 81:25, 81:27, 96:24, 97:19, 98:24, 99:14, 99:19, 104:6, 114:17, 114:23, 114:29, 115:3, 119:22, 120:4, 129:3, 129:9, 131:13, 133:3, 133:14, 134:7, 134:9, 135:7, 135:15, 138:29, 140:12, 143:8, 143:11, 143:14, 143:17, 143:22, 143:25, 145:27, 146:3, 149:8, 149:16, 152:22, 154:13, 154:15, 156:8 MS [10] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:29, 4:3 mugged [3] - 124:10, 127:2, 129:26 MULCAHY [1] - 3:4 Mulcahy [7] - 10:24, 13:12, 13:17, 21:1, 31:23, 34:19, 154:20 MULLIGAN [2] -2:11, 3:12 Mulligan's [10] -92:21, 94:7, 111:25, 113:1, 114:1, 115:5, 115:10, 115:25, 117:7 Mullingar [2] - 51:23, 107:2 Murphy [4] - 65:16, 66:7, 66:17, 66:20 MURPHY [10] - 2:30, 3:22, 64:29, 65:17, 65:22, 66:8, 66:12, 66:19, 66:27, 67:7 Murray [108] - 7:5, 17:11, 17:16, 18:6, 18:29, 19:1, 19:4, 19:5, 19:15, 20:18, 24:9, 25:2, 25:5, 26:17, 27:8, 29:6, 29:14, 32:7, 32:29, 33:11, 33:24, 34:21, 36:11, 36:29, 38:4, 38:6, 40:26, 41:7, 41:15, 41:23, 41:29, 42:16, 43:14, 43:22,

48:3, 48:4, 51:24, 53:22, 54:20, 54:21, 58:2, 58:6, 58:9, 58:14, 58:21, 59:19, 59:26, 59:29, 60:6, 60:28, 61:5, 62:9, 63:4, 63:11, 65:20, 69:27, 69:29, 74:8, 78:16, 80:23, 81:5, 89:22, 90:3, 90:4, 91:11, 102:22, 104:24, 107:10, 108:8, 108:12, 108:20, 109:14, 109:25, 111:7, 115:21, 115:29, 116:2, 117:3, 118:1, 118:24, 120:19, 121:23, 122:6, 125:6, 128:2, 133:28, 134:4, 137:28, 138:19, 138:28, 141:2, 146:24, 147:11, 152:26, 153:7, 154:26. 155:26 MURRAY [2] - 3:2, Murray's [19] - 23:20, 34:5, 46:13, 48:19, 49:2. 51:3. 51:10. 53:24, 56:12, 72:17, 79:18, 124:15, 125:11, 126:4, 126:9, 151:27. 154:16. 154:25, 155:2 Murrays [2] - 58:24, 59:19

Ν

MÍCHEÁL [1] - 3:23

must [6] - 70:15,

76:6, 77:20, 85:24,

97:3, 146:5

N6 [1] - 104:19 name [5] - 9:28, 50:15, 87:3, 97:8, 114:9 named [4] - 1:26, 78:23, 93:3, 114:7 names [1] - 30:27 naming [1] - 114:10 narrative [6] - 86:29, 99:16, 127:14, 127:15, 128:13, 133:5 nature [2] - 19:11, 85:24 nearly [3] - 139:26, 144:26, 150:2 necessary [4] -

12:14, 85:27, 87:6, 120:15 **need** [11] - 9:12, 9:14, 11:4, 57:1, 66:15, 69:27, 71:27, 74:14, 75:4, 114:8, 136:23 needed [1] - 60:15 needless [1] -119:25 needs [1] - 76:25 negative [1] - 127:4 neglect [3] - 54:25, 55:26, 56:11 negligence [1] -125:29 never [32] - 11:11, 12:7, 15:7, 15:8, 15:23, 16:11, 16:14, 17:4, 22:12, 23:28, 24:1, 36:27, 45:28, 46:16, 48:5, 48:7, 48:15, 49:7, 49:9, 49:18, 84:3, 84:6, 84:12, 84:21, 127:29, 130:24, 138:10, 142:25, 149:28, 151:1, 153:10 new [4] - 18:5, 51:6, 81:23, 82:18 next [28] - 23:28, 24:1, 24:2, 29:19, 30:25, 31:13, 42:21, 49:1, 64:27, 65:11, 77:23, 77:29, 81:28, 86:26, 90:25, 98:26, 99:8, 100:29, 101:19, 113:27, 113:29, 115:16, 121:25, 123:25, 123:27, 125:25, 140:1 nice [1] - 94:29 NICHOLAS [4] -2:10, 4:1, 5:3, 6:9 Nick [5] - 18:21, 27:13, 29:28, 97:9, 115:11 night [35] - 27:15, 27:17, 27:18, 33:22, 52:24, 52:25, 63:29, 74:1, 74:5, 93:6, 93:9, 93:14, 93:19, 95:29, 97:28, 98:16, 99:22, 100:1, 100:21, 101:2, 101:4, 103:10, 107:29, 110:17, 113:19, 117:27, 119:14, 130:17, 136:3, 136:4, 137:11,

137:12, 140:15,

44:6, 44:23, 44:26,

45:16, 45:26, 46:17,

46:25, 47:6, 48:2,

140:18, 143:29 nighttime [1] -104:11 **no..** [1] - 129:27 nobody [2] - 137:12, 151:16 **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 nominate [2] - 76:6, 120:24 nominated [11] -73:7, 76:8, 78:2, 78:5, 78:6, 78:26, 79:11, 89:2, 89:13, 89:17, 118:23 nominating [4] -116:4, 116:6, 118:28, 120:19 nomination [1] -118:2 non [8] - 83:19, 87:23, 89:25, 119:4, 141:9, 147:4, 147:9, 148:14 non-availability [1] -119.4 non-crime [2] -141:9, 148:14 non-investigation [2] - 147:4, 147:9 non-issue [3] -83:19, 87:23, 89:25 **none** [1] - 149:24 nonpayment [1] -21:6 nonsense [1] -127:27 noon [1] - 38:23 NOREEN [1] - 2:16 Noreen [1] - 20:24 norm [2] - 84:18, 85.11 normal [4] - 11:8, 28:6, 83:25, 156:11 normally [5] - 11:24, 12:7, 70:26, 71:13, 131:21 **NORTHUMBERLAN D**[1] - 2:18 note [25] - 6:19, 8:5, 8:9, 8:12, 15:7, 15:21,

19:15, 23:1, 29:19,

34:17, 34:20, 34:26,

52:13, 52:15, 77:21,

79:23, 81:5, 140:26,

35:1, 38:19, 43:9,

141:13, 141:17,

noted [6] - 6:17,

10:27, 28:16, 54:5,

107:10, 107:12

144:6, 146:9

notes [10] - 1:26, 7:21, 17:12, 20:17, 33:4, 33:24, 34:24, 40:26, 42:14, 51:17 nothing [12] - 16:4, 39:4, 47:20, 54:3, 60:22, 62:2, 81:8, 89:5, 107:23, 125:6, 139:8 notice [3] - 29:1, 30:26, 46:8 notifying [1] - 150:26 **noting** [1] - 23:6 November [2] -107:16 108:10 NUGENT [2] - 3:13, number [33] - 16:13, 25:29, 34:22, 55:17, 55:18, 55:19, 55:20, 58:13, 60:9, 64:28, 67:10, 67:14, 84:16, 91:7, 93:24, 94:5, 95:7, 97:4, 99:8, 99:25, 101:20, 102:10, 120:8, 121:6, 123:15, 132:22, 138:21. 140:28. 141:3, 152:6, 154:19, 154:29 numbers [1] - 32:5 numerous [2] -83:26, 83:27 **NYLAND**[1] - 3:18 **NÍ**[1] - 2:29 **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7

0

O'BRIEN [1] - 2:10

Nóirín [3] - 24:7,

24:14

o'clock [2] - 49:20, 80:26 O'CONNOR [1] -2.21 O'HIGGINS [1] - 3:23 O'MARA[1] - 2:17 O'NEILL [1] - 3:29 O'REARDON[1] -O'Sullivan [6] - 24:7, 24:8. 24:14. 25:4. 25:5. 65:19 O'SULLIVAN[1] -3:7 oath [1] - 48:24 object [1] - 66:8 objection [1] - 8:13

objectives [2] -75:16, 141:15 objectivity [1] -20:22 obligation [1] -141:18 obligations [2] -108:26, 141:23 obliged [2] - 47:4, 146:22 observations [1] obtain [2] - 134:25, 135:25 obtained [2] - 47:4, 104.18 obvious [2] - 60:27, obviously [47] - 10:7, 10:12, 11:18, 12:12, 24:19, 28:10, 30:23, 31:1, 32:25, 33:4, 34:19, 40:25, 41:22, 42:12, 42:29, 43:15, 43:18, 59:25, 59:26, 66:28, 67:15, 69:2, 75:24, 80:23, 83:4, 84:27, 85:21, 89:28, 90:3, 92:13, 92:25, 94:19, 97:19, 100:27, 106:19, 111:1, 122:4, 122:5, 122:8, 128:25, 130:23, 137:11, 140:17, 143:26, 149:28, 152:9, 154:25 occasion [3] - 10:23, 73:23, 75:26 occasions [3] -83:26, 83:27, 84:26 occurred [16] - 35:9, 91:3, 92:14, 92:28, 93:2, 99:1, 101:24, 105:12, 122:2, 123:9, 124:28, 126:28, 130:18, 130:25, 138:7. 138:10 occurrence [2] -86:29, 87:1 October [15] - 42:22, 81:7, 134:14, 139:4, 139:16, 142:7, 146:4, 147:10, 148:28, 150:5, 150:7, 152:14, 152:20, 152:29 OCTOBER [3] - 1:18, 6:2, 156:14 odd [1] - 84:1 **OF** [9] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2,

of.. [1] - 146:17 Offaly [2] - 7:6, 7:8 offence [4] - 68:11, 88:7, 123:6, 125:18 offending [1] - 107:4 offered [1] - 22:7 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:26 office [18] - 11:29, 14:4, 14:6, 15:25, 19:21, 22:1, 27:10, 71:12, 72:4, 72:21, 72:27, 76:29, 79:16, 79:24, 86:17, 117:8, 118:12, 142:8 office" [1] - 14:5 officer [20] - 12:23, 14:25, 14:27, 14:29, 15:27, 16:7, 23:3, 27:7, 32:17, 46:5, 50:13, 63:11, 108:27, 132:24, 136:29, 137:10, 138:8, 138:17, 142:12, 151:12 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, officers [1] - 25:19 official [1] - 151:2 officially [1] - 147:13 often [1] - 71:14 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:11, omission [1] - 83:1 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [3] - 19:17, 22:19, 84:13 one [91] - 7:22, 10:15, 10:23, 11:1, 14:12, 15:19, 21:7, 28:25, 28:26, 35:18, 39:16, 49:18, 53:8, 54:21, 54:22, 54:25, 54:26, 54:27, 55:7, 55:25, 55:27, 56:1, 58:25, 64:2, 65:11, 65:18, 67:15, 67:20, 69:1, 69:3, 69:4, 69:7, 70:8, 72:7, 72:9, 73:8, 73:15, 77:12, 77:29, 80:13, 83:15, 84:14, 84:21, 85:10, 85:11, 91:10, 91:25, 92:2, 92:3, 92:6, 92:19, 92:20, 92:23, 92:24, 94:8, 95:7, 95:8, 95:10, 96:10, 96:16, 96:20, 97:13, 98:9,

107:25, 108:17, 111:22, 111:27, 112:26, 112:28, 113:4, 113:27, 113:29, 114:2, 124:17, 126:21, 127:5, 128:8, 129:13, 131:11, 133:22, 139:17, 142:23, 148:1, 149:12, 149:15, 152:7, 154:13, 155:20 ones [4] - 16:21, 16:22, 16:23, 91:25 ongoing [3] - 92:9, 104:21, 109:6 onwards [1] - 67:19 open [7] - 11:22, 73:19, 73:22, 73:24, 109:12, 141:23, 144:20 opened [2] - 112:3, 134:10 operate [1] - 93:11 operator [1] - 100:8 opportunity [8] -8:18, 8:21, 9:6, 55:24, 56:29, 66:23, 89:29, 91:20 oppressive [2] -115:29, 116:1 **option.** [1] - 15:16 options [1] - 76:10 oracle [3] - 12:1, 14:26, 16:2 order [13] - 13:21, 42:25, 48:6, 49:10, 59:14, 60:12, 60:13, 60:24, 76:12, 76:15, 85:27, 141:14, 144:23 orderly [1] - 86:15 organisation [3] -53:13, 75:11, 107:13 organisation's [2] -86:7, 141:15 organising [1] -81:18 origin [1] - 25:16 original [15] - 9:25, 11:5, 14:10, 16:21, 26:4, 49:8, 58:4, 68:16, 77:18, 78:7, 106:14, 110:28, 115:3, 118:21, 151:11 originally [5] - 43:21, 99:6, 99:7, 136:25, 142:23 originals [1] - 106:26 **ORLA** [1] - 3:20 **OSMOND** [1] - 3:27

3:15

101:28, 102:1,

OTHER [1] - 1:3 otherwise [1] - 124:5 outcome [4] - 56:26, 65:9, 109:12, 131:25 outdoor [1] - 152:12 outlining [3] - 87:1, 89:14, 136:3 outstanding [3] -13:5, 86:3, 86:4 overleaf [2] - 44:17, 146:8 overly [1] - 82:13 overnight [1] - 156:8 oversight [1] - 109:6 overtime [1] - 109:21 overview [2] -118:17, 147:17 own [18] - 7:7, 25:17, 29:15, 32:26, 33:3, 40:20, 41:25, 46:14, 70:11, 72:27, 75:29, 83:24, 84:2, 84:17, 84:25, 85:14, 113:22 owner [11] - 116:16, 116:17, 116:28, 117:15, 117:27, 117:29, 118:19, 119:3, 119:6, 119:11, 119:29

Р

PAF[4] - 118:4, 121:25, 128:12, 128:26 **PAGE**[1] - 5:2 page [116] - 7:1, 7:2, 8:8, 10:2, 11:21, 12:29, 14:18, 14:21, 17:12, 17:28, 18:25, 20:19, 22:23, 22:26, 22:28, 23:8, 26:24, 26:26, 28:19, 31:13, 33:14, 33:25, 40:24, 42:11, 42:22, 43:9, 43:24, 43:25, 44:14, 46:4, 46:6, 47:16, 47:24, 48:29, 49:1, 51:9, 51:21, 53:9, 62:26, 62:27, 63:1, 67:19, 67:27, 68:14, 69:28, 72:20, 74:8, 78:12, 79:5, 80:15, 80:17, 81:19, 81:27, 81:28, 82:8, 83:13, 83:23, 85:18, 86:26, 90:13, 90:14, 90:19, 90:25, 91:11, 96:25, 97:6, 97:7, 97:8,

98:26, 99:3, 99:8, 99:9, 99:14, 100:21, 100:29, 102:24, 104:26, 106:22, 107:22, 107:27, 108:16, 108:21, 111:8, 111:12, 113:23, 114:5, 114:6, 114:13, 115:6, 115:16, 115:22, 116:9, 116:10, 118:2, 120:7, 121:6, 121:24, 122:12, 123:4, 124:2, 124:17, 124:19, 126:19, 128:28, 129:16, 131:15, 133:3, 134:12, 139:16, 141:11, 143:11, 146:5, 146:6, 147.11 pages [6] - 11:3, 13:28, 26:4, 48:23, 49:4, 67:17 paid [6] - 15:20, 19:8, 21:4, 22:19, 23:23, 25:22 panned [1] - 39:19

23:23, 25:22
panned [1] - 39:19
panning [1] - 68:5
paper [9] - 67:28,
92:1, 99:11, 112:9,
113:14, 122:10,
126:5, 126:11, 147:5
papers [10] - 6:16,
7:1, 14:18, 14:22,
17:28, 22:28, 43:24,
52:18, 67:18, 115:6
paragraph [12] 17:29, 51:11, 51:12,
52:22, 76:2, 111:13,
116:23, 117:5,
122:14, 129:4, 143:3,
143:12

122:14, 129:4, 143:3, 143:12

pardon [7] - 28:20, 45:4, 74:21, 99:9, 126:8, 128:16, 135:8

parents [1] - 151:7

parked [1] - 146:16

part [29] - 15:14, 21:20, 24:19, 32:28, 37:2, 37:4, 39:23, 40:10, 46:14, 46:24, 50:11, 52:27, 53:24, 54:11, 56:11, 58:1, 59:5, 63:22, 71:5, 75:25, 83:1, 109:6, 112:18, 126:7,

127:17, 129:22,

133:25, 135:29

particular [19] - 8:10,

9:5, 9:7, 10:22, 11:28,

13:10, 14:12, 24:11, 58:25, 59:3, 62:10, 62:14, 64:2, 73:22, 74:5, 85:12, 97:23, 114:8, 121:5

particularly [5] - 8:1, 52:23, 52:26, 123:10, 147:20

parties [19] - 69:9, 69:10, 69:20, 70:10,

69:10, 69:20, 70:10, 70:16, 71:11, 72:29, 73:8, 76:4, 76:5, 76:29, 77:5, 77:7, 78:18, 79:24, 83:23, 89:15, 122:20 parts [3] - 34:24,

71:28, 72:2
party [52] - 68:12,
73:10, 95:20, 98:7,
98:10, 99:29, 102:2,
103:24, 110:26,
110:27, 111:4, 111:5,

116:17, 117:9, 117:16, 121:18, 124:25, 124:26, 124:29, 125:3, 127:1, 127:3, 129:18, 129:24, 130:11,

130:17, 130:20,

130:22, 130:24, 130:25, 132:1, 132:28, 133:7, 133:8, 133:10, 133:12, 134:18, 134:20,

134:25, 134:26, 135:2, 135:4, 135:10, 135:25, 136:2, 136:14, 144:11, 146:17, 146:19,

151:3, 151:6 **party's** [2] - 129:23, 137:14

party.. [2] - 121:10, 135:20 **pass** [6] - 25:26,

65:10, 100:9, 113:27, 121:3, 124:8

passed [2] - 68:6, 76:24 **PASSED** [1] - 1:4

passes [1] - 1.4 passes [1] - 154:27 passing [1] - 94:26 past [2] - 71:14, 84:11

Pat [13] - 24:8, 32:7, 42:16, 46:25, 56:11, 58:6, 58:9, 58:21, 60:28, 61:5, 62:9, 63:4, 78:16

Patrick [1] - 65:20

PATRICK [4] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:27, 3:2

Patrick's [1] - 73:20 patrol [6] - 127:3, 130:15, 130:22, 134:20, 146:15, 152:13

pattern [1] - 25:8 PAUL [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 3:30 pay [1] - 22:8

paying [1] - 14:18 payment [10] - 10:13, 10:14, 12:2, 14:27,

16:2, 22:26, 23:5, 25:21, 41:4, 41:18 penalty [1] - 54:23 PEOPLE [1] - 3:15

people [15] - 6:27, 21:21, 21:28, 39:15, 66:4, 72:23, 73:25,

78:29, 82:15, 83:9, 85:7, 104:1, 110:3, 118:20, 118:28

per [3] - 132:24, 138:17, 142:11

perceive [1] - 152:1 perceived [1] -138:11

percent [2] - 35:18, 43:6

perfectly [4] - 8:22, 71:14, 84:4, 87:26 performed [1] - 43:1 perhaps [36] - 8:25, 17:26, 20:17, 20:20, 23:25, 26:24, 28:19.

33:14, 33:26, 40:28, 43:25, 44:13, 50:1, 50:24, 73:5, 77:4,

78:6, 83:5, 84:13, 88:5, 88:18, 90:14, 102:15, 103:12,

111:16, 112:19, 117:28, 121:2, 121:3,

117:28, 121:2, 121: 125:15, 134:11,

143:26, 145:6, 145:10, 150:21 **period** [10] - 22:9,

26:15, 37:19, 42:13, 47:13, 77:10, 85:18, 141:6, 150:4, 152:14

persist [1] - 63:26 persisting [1] - 60:9 person [30] - 15:24,

20:12, 60:29, 69:4, 87:4, 89:2, 91:15, 96:28, 102:29, 121:9,

123:15, 123:26, 124:10, 126:17, **'**,

128:8, 130:2, 136:3, 137:23, 137:25, 138:24, 141:8, 142:5, 142:23, 142:28, 144:21, 147:15, 150:12, 151:19,

151:20, 151:21 **person"** [2] - 142:18, 147:12

personal [2] **-** 20:27, 82:16

personally [2] - 83:8, 108:24

persons [4] - 68:29, 84:1, 118:23, 146:25 perspective [1] -21:12

persuade [1] - 40:18 PETER [1] - 3:13 petrol [15] - 93:3, 93:5, 93:6, 93:16, 93:24, 93:28, 96:1, 98:12, 100:2, 100:11, 100:15, 100:16, 101:13, 103:26,

PHILIP [1] - 2:5 **Philip** [2] - 80:16, 156:12

110:16

phone [38] - 29:6, 29:11, 29:20, 32:5, 33:24, 34:2, 34:6, 34:9, 35:26, 36:16, 37:16, 38:14, 39:18, 39:24, 40:4, 40:9, 41:5, 41:15, 42:17, 43:5, 43:6, 44:1, 45:10, 45:23, 46:24, 46:26, 47:20, 49:13, 49:16, 49:17, 54:1, 54:7, 55:26, 56:17, 57:2, 69:3, 69:15,

phoned [4] - 33:21, 37:16, 38:23, 110:1 **phones** [2] - 37:5, 72:2

69:22

photographs [1] -122:22 pick [1] - 87:15

picture [1] - 87:7 Pie [1] - 116:4 pie [1] - 118:21 pieces [1] - 155:25 pinned [1] - 150:16 PLACE [1] - 4:4

Place [4] - 67:16, 68:10, 82:24, 83:12 place [7] - 34:10, 65:23, 74:1, 86:29,

114:18, 134:22, 153:7 placed [2] - 124:29, 134:23 planned [2] - 87:2, 87.5 pleaded [9] - 28:25, 44:29, 45:2, 45:4, 53:19, 54:12, 55:18, 55:27. 57:9 pleading [1] - 28:26 plenty [2] - 118:26, 120:21 PM [3] - 33:25, 51:19, 82:6 PM35 [1] - 33:25 point [47] - 8:26, 8:27, 8:28, 10:1, 10:3, 10:4, 10:5, 15:20, 16:6, 17:19, 20:7, 35:20, 36:20, 36:21, 38:16, 52:11, 55:11, 56:7, 57:18, 57:21, 60:27, 61:23, 64:5, 75:15, 77:6, 78:22. 98:13, 98:14, 102:7, 105:18, 107:24, 107:25, 137:6, 137:22, 143:1, 143:2, 143:20, 144:29, 146:23, 148:4, 149:1, 149:25, 150:7, 152:1, 152:10, 154:15 pointed [3] - 59:18. 127:4, 145:26 pointing [2] - 121:14, 146:21 points [1] - 105:28 police [8] - 67:23, 70:17, 86:3, 86:4, 86:23, 149:18, 149:26, 150:1 policeman [1] -149:29 policy [1] - 141:24 **politically** [1] - 24:16 poor [13] - 90:21, 91:3, 97:21, 98:9, 98:16, 99:4, 100:1, 101:8, 101:25, 103:10, 104:11, 106:1, 115:7 position [7] - 19:29, 23:20, 55:21, 110:5, 130:10, 136:29, 152:28 Positive [1] - 141:25 possession [1] -106:26 possible [11] - 24:17, 39:26, 40:9, 68:11,

71:25, 75:12, 88:7, 89:2, 103:13, 104:19, 106:29 possibly [2] - 96:16 potential [1] - 118:3 power [1] - 87:3 practice [7] - 75:20, 83:25, 85:1, 85:3, 85:10, 140:22 praised [1] - 112:17 preclude [1] - 118:7 predecessor [2] -20:24, 20:28 prefer [2] - 8:28, 66:17 prematurely [1] -105:1 premises [1] - 68:6 prepare [1] - 86:16 prepared [2] - 13:27, 14:27 prescribed [1] -11:27 presence [1] - 71:19 present [2] - 71:29, 128:25 PRESIDENT [2] -1:13, 2:3 presumably [5] -68:15, 70:29, 80:24, 118:14, 154:21 presume [8] - 16:29, 69:2, 77:28, 97:16, 98:18, 98:21, 100:25, 100:26 presuming [1] -100:27 pretty [4] - 20:1, 46:11, 87:23, 145:4 previous [10] -16:12, 27:5, 82:22, 84:6, 92:6, 108:13,

108:15, 120:7, 147:6, 42:21, 49:4, 83:26, 88:15, 112:5, 112:22, primary [1] - 20:22 principle [2] - 88:9, printouts [1] - 13:28 private [4] - 11:25, problem [10] - 9:18, 16:9, 18:14, 18:16, 18:21. 20:13. 38:27. 72:4, 72:21, 72:27 problems [1] - 57:15 procedurally [1] -

149:21

137.28

previously [8] -

144:26, 154:5

15:16, 21:1, 22:3

73:18, 131:9

71:13 procedure [5] -11:19, 28:5, 28:6, 140:17, 150:26 procedures [2] -11:21, 141:28 proceed [2] - 130:12 proceedings [1] -109:22 process [2] - 11:24, 132:4 processed [2] -14:11, 16:2 processing [2] -11:19. 14:26 prodded [1] - 110:12 produce [3] - 12:23, 33:8. 40:20 produced [2] -22:19, 82:9 professional [1] -105:23 profile [1] - 118:5 progress [6] - 97:23, 104:22, 107:7, 107:27, 117:9, 117:10 progressed [2] -73:28, 79:15 prompted [1] -119:23 proof [1] - 22:10 proper [6] - 76:7, 105:21, 143:5, 143:28, 144:3, 144:5 properly [1] - 151:18 proposed [1] -105.15 prosecuted [1] prosecution [1] -88.1 prosecutor [4] -60:6, 61:8, 62:15, 63:5 PROTECTED[2] -1:2. 1:3 provide [7] - 23:17, 43:22, 43:23, 70:18, 81:10, 87:6, 129:18 provided [4] - 8:6, 8:12, 47:18, 70:29 **pub** [3] - 93:25, 93:26, 95:28 **public** [10] - 15:11, 15:17, 16:27, 18:11, 23:18, 70:17, 71:12,

pulled [2] - 100:15, 102:4 **pulling** [2] - 100:11, 102:5 pulls [1] - 101:17 Pulse [65] - 69:6, 85:26, 88:11, 88:12, 88:16, 89:20, 90:12, 104:21, 106:5, 107:3, 109:7, 121:5, 123:10, 123:12, 123:15, 123:18, 124:2, 124:11, 124:14, 125:3, 125:13, 125:14, 125:18, 125:20, 125:22, 125:27, 125:28, 125:29, 126:5, 126:10, 126:13, 126:18, 126:25, 127:19, 128:12, 129:14, 132:20, 133:5, 136:25, 136:27, 137:2, 137:19, 137:21, 137:24, 139:12, 139:25, 139:28, 140:2, 140:3, 140:23, 140:24. 140:27. 141:3, 144:2, 144:23, 145:4, 147:7, 147:28, 148:9, 150:23, 151:7, 151:8, 154:1 pure [1] - 110:20 purpose [9] - 12:25, 47:6, 74:14, 75:4, 82:2, 109:22, 123:19, 123:23, 125:24 purse [1] - 69:4 pursuant [1] - 50:18 pursue [10] - 37:1, 129:26, 129:29, 131:1, 131:22. 133:11, 133:13, 136:16, 136:18, 151:5 pursued [3] - 112:16, 125:5, 129:20 pursuing [1] - 154:7 put [44] - 12:1, 23:23, 30:25, 31:4, 35:6, 35:8, 43:16, 53:1, 59:11, 72:3, 73:14, 75:12, 77:1, 85:8, 85:13, 87:25, 88:11, 93:19, 97:19, 99:8, 102:14, 106:11, 107:3, 114:6, 115:26, 116:2, 118:22, 123:9,

125:2, 125:18,

103:26, 110:23

126:10, 126:26, 136:25, 137:19, 139:25, 140:5, 140:7, 142:23, 147:28, 148:9, 149:23, 150:23, 152:18 puts [2] - 42:3, 97:5 putting [3] - 35:16, 57:17, 136:27

Q

quality [13] - 90:21, 91:4, 97:22, 97:29, 98:9, 98:16, 99:4, 100:1, 101:25, 103:10, 103:22, 104:11, 106:1 quarrel [1] - 87:12 **QUAY** [2] - 2:23, 2:30 queried [1] - 127:20 queries [9] - 108:23, 109:11, 111:16, 111:29, 112:23, 113:20, 115:28, 120:14, 122:7 query [16] - 17:5, 41:17, 67:12, 69:27, 69:29. 91:11. 97:3. 102:24, 113:23, 114:7, 116:8, 116:10, 117:12, 119:7, 120:5 querying [2] - 14:17, 21:5 questioned [7] -39:5, 84:3, 84:6, 84:22, 108:16, 131.21 153.10 QUESTIONED [2] -5.5 6.9 questioning [1] -92:3 questions [9] -96:24, 102:26, 106:19, 113:21, 113:26, 122:10, 123:18, 133:29, 140:13 quick [3] - 82:27, 130:15, 133:7 quickly [2] - 68:6, 150:15 **QUINN** [1] - 3:10 Quinn [1] - 29:28 Quirke [5] - 12:22, 15:6, 15:20, 15:27, 18:15

quite [8] - 24:17,

published [1] -

pull [3] - 101:13,

151:15

36:3, 37:26, 39:26, 40:9, 59:6, 81:16, 83:21

R

raise [1] - 55:12 raised [12] - 8:15, 9:3, 56:25, 69:27, 69:29, 91:11, 96:24, 113.19 114.6 117:13, 121:4, 152:3 raising [4] - 102:26, 103:4, 120:14, 123:2 rang [13] - 30:19, 30:22, 32:1, 32:7, 32:13, 34:21, 34:22, 34:27, 34:28, 34:29, 43:11, 125:3 rather [3] - 66:5, 70:12. 123:5 rationale [2] -118:28, 128:13 **RD** [5] - 30:5, 30:6, 30:7, 30:11, 31:26 re [4] - 16:17, 18:10, 32:7, 32:20 Re[1] - 123:15 re-sign [1] - 16:17 re-signed [1] - 18:10 read [31] - 12:26, 12:28. 24:20. 34:12. 45:29, 46:17, 48:12, 59:3, 64:1, 71:3, 71:4, 71:6, 75:24, 75:28, 78:18, 80:17, 85:15, 90:29, 122:4, 126:22, 127:13, 128:23, 129:23, 133:4. 135:15, 136:6, 151:2, 154:23, 155:5 reading [6] - 17:8, 50:26, 50:27, 58:22, 113:13, 138:6 reads [1] - 155:5 Ready [1] - 76:11 real [1] - 149:3 realise [2] - 32:13, 147:29 realising [1] - 81:7 reality [1] - 36:15 really [16] - 7:25, 9:7, 15:23, 42:9, 54:2, 56:26, 63:27, 73:28, 83:18, 87:18, 89:25, 93:15, 107:23, 107:24, 119:25, 150:13 reams [3] - 147:2,

147:5, 150:10 reappear [1] - 17:9 reason [12] - 10:2, 15:23, 16:5, 35:23, 40:4, 59:13, 73:5, 115:7, 118:19, 133:16, 155:10, 155:18 reasonable [5] -8:22, 76:12, 111:9, 111:16, 112:15 reassurance[1] -119:2 recategorisation [7] - 129:11, 129:14, 147:22, 150:20, 150:23, 151:14 recategorise [1] -128:26 recategorised [5] -131:24, 132:14, 132:21, 142:11, 146:24 receipt [5] - 45:25, 46:8, 48:18, 50:21, 52.1 receive [2] - 15:21, 41:18 received [12] - 14:17, 15:8, 15:9, 18:2, 19:8, 25:1, 41:15, 46:25, 58:18, 72:21, 75:22, 122.22 reclassification [4] -128:4, 130:8, 131:4, 149:16 reclassified [20] -127:22, 127:25, 128:1, 131:10, 138:12, 138:14, 138:20, 138:25, 141:4, 141:8, 142:14, 147:4, 147:8, 147:27, 147:29, 148:5, 148:14, 148:24, 154:2 reclassifies [1] -141:4 reclassify [2] -128:11, 142:20 reclassifying [1] -133:22 recognise [1] - 79:19

recollect [5] - 50:25,

50:26, 50:27, 64:14,

recollection [23] -

16:4, 21:16, 39:16,

40:6, 42:9, 48:9, 49:5,

52:10, 60:14, 61:10,

61:18, 75:22, 77:13,

113:12

91:29, 95:9, 95:22, 95:29, 98:6, 99:24, 113:10, 117:21, 117:27, 129:25 recommend [2] -53:14, 131:23 recommendation [2] - 131:13, 132:12 recommended [1] recommending [3] -51:15, 52:29, 129:10 record [7] - 21:18, 35:14, 49:2, 144:10, 144:28, 145:1, 150:24 recorded [11] -34:22, 69:6, 86:2, 88:16, 90:25, 92:26, 102:23, 104:15, 122:26, 129:28, 145:7 recording [2] -69:18, 87:14 records [8] - 25:7, 25.9 25.15 40.19 40:20, 47:20, 49:16, 56.17 recounts [1] - 52:22 redacted [1] - 31:1 **REDDY** [1] - 4:4 refer [3] - 51:7, 82:29, 140:27 reference [17] - 6:16, 8:6, 9:7, 12:12, 31:23, 32:18, 44:17, 51:21, 78:14, 79:8, 97:4, 117:15, 121:9, 124:23, 134:16, 141:27, 146:8 referred [6] - 56:8, 81:18, 85:21, 99:3, 124:12, 124:14 referring [4] - 8:1, 8:10, 47:29, 138:27 refers [2] - 12:21, 34.2 reflect [3] - 33:21, 66:24, 135:1 reflects [1] - 133:18 refuse [4] - 36:17, 131:22, 133:8, 133:12 refused [6] - 129:29, 130:2, 132:8, 132:28, 132:29, 133:7 regard [14] - 11:18, 19:29, 25:20, 46:21, 74:15, 75:6, 80:3, 94:21, 110:11, 118:15, 120:4, 127:21, 144:29, 147:22

regarded [3] - 71:18, 132:15, 144:2 regarding [11] -17:13, 18:3, 42:17, 44:17, 47:5, 76:19, 78:16, 104:28, 106:2, 122:19, 141:15 regime [3] - 25:17, 25:23, 126:9 regional [1] - 86:5 registered [2] -106:7, 107:5 **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:5 registration [5] -19:28, 91:7, 102:10, 106:6, 132:22 regular [1] - 111:3 regularise [1] - 19:6 Regulation [5] -19:8, 51:28, 52:5, 52:18. 53:6 regulation [2] - 19:9, 50:18 regulations [5] -21:3, 51:28, 53:16, 138:2, 141:21 relapse [1] - 109:27 relate [3] - 10:8, 25:28, 103:12 related [12] - 6:22, 7:1, 10:2, 10:3, 10:13, 10:20, 10:21, 25:16, 42:28, 47:11, 67:26, 92:5 relates [9] - 26:2, 46:24, 55:20, 67:10, 67:15, 68:24, 79:28, 85:21, 91:25 relating [11] - 10:6, 20:25, 22:27, 35:9, 51:17, 67:18, 82:4, 113:21, 122:12, 150:26, 154:17 **Relation** [1] - 53:15 relation [80] - 7:7, 7:9, 7:16, 10:3, 10:21, 12:4, 13:29, 15:23, 22:2, 24:18, 25:14, 25:25, 26:1, 29:5, 29:7, 35:5, 37:13, 47:20, 47:21, 52:9, 54:23, 55:26, 57:13, 58:2, 58:13, 68:3, 69:26, 72:26, 74:14, 75:4, 75:6, 76:1, 76:12, 80:5, 80:13, 82:12, 82:23, 83:7, 83:12, 83:19, 87:21, 88:1, 88:7, 91:14, 93:13, 93:26, 96:25,

102:28, 104:29, 105:8, 106:29, 107:3, 107:14, 109:14, 109:23, 110:14, 110:26, 111:4, 111:9, 111:14, 112:20, 113:8, 114:7, 115:25, 116:12, 116:26, 117:7, 122:7, 122:10, 128:15, 128:17, 133:24, 134:17, 137:5, 140:18, 142:22, 149:16, 151:26, 153:19, 155:7 relation.. [1] - 74:16 relayed [1] - 18:28 relevance [3] -40:17, 57:12, 57:21 relevancy[1] - 57:22 relevant [13] - 47:2, 54:2, 55:12, 57:11, 60:29, 66:4, 71:1, 71:5, 71:27, 72:2, 93:4, 113:11, 131:1 relevantly [1] - 56:24 remain [1] - 59:15 remaining [1] - 9:8 remains [1] - 137:21 remark [1] - 102:8 remarks [3] - 68:2, 102:8, 103:12 remedy [1] - 141:23 remember 1201 -17:24, 20:5, 30:25, 39:10, 40:10, 52:23, 52:26, 54:26, 58:22, 74:2, 94:17, 95:20, 98:3, 123:11, 136:22. 138:22, 145:11, 145:14, 152:7 reminded [1] - 21:14 removed [1] - 141:22 renew [1] - 65:1 repeat [3] - 58:13, 79:26, 134:1 repetition [2] - 59:6, 59:8 replacing [1] - 81:24 reply [14] - 19:4, 72:15, 72:17, 72:20, 78:11, 88:25, 103:4, 116:10, 118:11, 119:1, 124:18, 144:24, 145:3, 147:6 replying [5] - 144:20, 144:25, 147:2, 147:9, 152:29 report [100] - 26:21, 26:29, 27:1, 33:18, 40:1, 44:6, 45:25,

46:4, 46:13, 46:15, represented [1] results [2] - 21:29, Roscommon [1] scheduled [1] - 12:2 47:19, 48:18, 48:20, 153:27 127:4 115:10 scope [3] - 25:23, 50:12, 50:17, 50:22, reprocessed [1] -**RESUMED** [5] - 6:1, rose [1] - 6:15 74:15, 75:5 51:18, 53:8, 67:26, 9:21, 50:7, 81:1, 15:11 roughly [5] - 11:15, screen [7] - 8:9, 68:16, 68:29, 69:28, 114.26 34:28, 101:18, 147:3, 46:12, 67:29, 74:23, reputation [2] -70:20, 72:11, 72:14, 133:21, 138:3 retain [1] - 77:9 152:21 82:7, 82:26 75:24, 77:25, 78:7, request [8] - 43:21, scroll [5] - 26:25, retains [1] - 77:9 rule [1] - 140:22 79:9, 81:4, 82:22, 45:21, 47:5, 52:4, **RETIRED** [7] - 3:4, ruled [2] - 89:3, 46:6, 48:23, 48:29, 83:11, 83:18, 83:20, 51:5 105:3, 106:11, 3:6, 3:6, 3:7, 3:10, 119:29 83:21, 85:25, 85:26, scrolling [1] - 18:25 108:11, 124:15 3:12, 3:13 rules [4] - 132:13, 86:16, 87:15, 87:25, requested [7] retrospective [1] -147:17, 151:22, scrutinised [1] -88:4, 88:5, 88:19, 12:23, 23:12, 42:21, 87:19 151:23 150:17 89:10, 89:24, 98:21, 58:6, 93:14, 103:20, retrospectively [2] -Rules [1] - 128:27 scrutiny [1] - 67:12 106:23, 107:15, 146:22 26:14, 55:5 run [1] - 39:25 **SEAN** [4] - 1:12, 2:2, 108:9, 114:5, 114:7, requests [1] - 111:9 return [1] - 80:22 rung [2] - 26:12, 43:8 2:22, 3:17 121:6, 121:7, 121:27, returned [5] - 15:1, require [1] - 122:28 running [1] - 61:27 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 122:17, 122:26, required [9] - 16:26, 16:25, 27:3, 70:2, rushed [3] - 58:18, search [2] - 119:14, 123:4, 123:6, 123:12, 39:8, 80:1, 86:21, 125:1 58:27, 59:13 139:24 123:19, 123:20, 108:9, 122:23, 126:3, returning [4] - 27:19, RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 searched [4] -123:24, 124:3, 124:5, 126:8, 126:14 44:4, 134:24, 135:19 115:18, 117:24, 124:6, 124:12, requirement [3] revenue [1] - 22:4 124:26, 134:19 S 124:16, 124:18, 15:12, 111:6, 119:22 review [2] - 28:27, searches [1] -124:23, 125:2, 125:6, requires [1] - 104:29 156:8 122:19 125:12, 125:15, **safe** [1] - 24:26 RESOLUTIONS [1] reviewed [1] - 122:1 searching[1] -125:19. 125:20. sample [1] - 12:23 1.4 reviewing [3] -117:25 125:21, 125:24, sanction [1] - 46:24 RESOURCES [1] -120:13, 132:3 second [31] - 11:17, 126:6, 126:11, **SANDRA**[1] - 4:3 ridiculous [1] -17:1, 17:29, 34:13, 126:25, 127:19, sat [1] - 61:16 respect [1] - 149:3 150.12 37:7, 37:9, 38:21, 130:21, 131:16, satisfactory [6] respectfully [2] rightly [2] - 56:24, 45:1, 45:2, 45:5, 132:11, 134:9, 56:26, 74:13, 75:3, 53:14, 66:8 45:23, 54:2, 54:21, 57:20 134:14, 134:17, 121:27, 125:12, respects [1] - 155:27 55:13, 56:1, 56:8, ring [2] - 28:6, 29:28 139:3, 139:11, 141:14 respond [3] - 36:12, 68:14, 68:24, 69:28, river [1] - 118:25 139:27. 140:18. **Saturday** [3] - 27:16, 70:8, 76:2, 90:10, 65:5, 122:9 road [2] - 100:16, 140:23, 140:24, 31:3, 33:18 92:20, 113:1, 116:9, response [6] - 80:25, 101:14 140:25, 144:4, 145:4, **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 116:23 133:25 117:13, 141:13, Road [8] - 40:22, 155:19 save[1] - 61:26 143:3, 143:16, 143:28, 144:5, 146:4 41:2, 41:18, 42:28, reported [34] - 14:25, saved [3] - 18:24, 152:14, 155:20 response.. [1] -43:12, 43:17, 90:11, 22:22, 27:6, 27:14, 106:1, 106:26 section [1] - 53:4 115:11 33:17, 38:24, 38:26, Section [4] - 10:28. saw [5] - 41:22, responsibilities [1] -**ROAD**[1] - 2:18 44:2, 51:14, 70:15, 74:26, 81:3, 108:15, 53:5, 141:18, 146:9 53:12 robbed [1] - 151:5 75:13. 79:16. 85:29. 130:22 secured [1] - 110:8 responsible [1] robbery [24] - 121:4, 86:14, 95:15, 95:25, SC [10] - 2:6, 2:7, 13:8 see [64] - 7:5, 12:25, 121:9, 123:15, 99:29, 104:22, 107:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:27, rest [10] - 30:3, 30:5, 123:26, 124:9, 15:12, 34:12, 34:26, 109:27, 114:2, 3:22, 3:23, 3:23, 4:3 38:20, 39:15, 41:21, 30:6, 30:7, 34:24, 126:16, 131:22, 116:22, 117:1, scale [1] - 153:11 42:12, 46:19, 49:20, 43:16, 115:15, 136:3, 137:24, 118:18, 121:10, Scanlan [7] - 7:6. 121:16. 126:28. 138:24, 141:7, 142:5, 53:6, 54:13, 57:10, 124:24, 125:27, 7:15, 24:7, 24:8, 25:2, 65:9, 67:5, 69:17, 129.23 142:18, 142:22, 136:17, 137:24, 25:3, 25:5 71:1, 74:11, 75:1, rested [1] - 27:2 142:27, 144:21, 143:29, 146:10, **SCANLAN**[1] - 3:8 79:26, 80:9, 80:15, resubmissions [1] -145:21, 146:24, 146:18, 151:9, 152:13 scant [3] - 122:17, 82:15, 82:21, 83:10, 147:12, 147:15, 11:17 reporting [9] - 26:8, 123:19, 140:25 87:14, 88:24, 89:22, 150:12, 151:18, resubmit [1] - 11:16 43:15, 44:18, 82:4, scene [16] - 95:17, 91:29, 92:2, 93:24, resubmitted [4] -151:20, 151:21 86:12, 86:22, 122:19, 95:19, 117:19, 93:25, 98:10, 100:18, robbing [1] - 103:25 14:13, 16:6, 16:22, 126:4, 148:13 117:24, 121:14, 110:18, 111:21, 17:14 rolled [5] - 108:14, reports [6] - 86:21, 122:19, 122:25, 112:19, 113:23, result [4] - 79:25, 111:27, 112:1, 120:9 95:21, 133:14, 124:25, 125:17, 117:26, 118:27, 127:26, 133:21, rolling [1] - 111:21 134:18, 149:22, 127:4, 130:23, 119:9, 119:15, 147:27 rolls [2] - 92:4, 112:8 149.23 134:19, 137:11, 124:17, 125:20, resulted [1] - 109:4 room [2] - 78:20, representations [1] -140:16, 146:21, 125:24, 125:27, resulting [2] - 21:22, 150:6 31.2 151:12 128:29, 133:20, 22:3 root [1] - 133:28

140:6, 142:19, 139:10, 141:18 16:26, 18:10, 23:9, signing [1] - 26:7 somewhere [9] - 8:5, 142:29, 144:10, 26:21, 36:26, 39:17, sets [1] - 82:2 similar [2] - 16:14, 12:28, 24:26, 47:9, 144:17, 144:24, 44:4, 68:2, 72:12, setting [2] - 10:7, 59:10 47:10, 113:9, 120:10, 144:28, 146:4, 72:14, 78:9, 78:14, 136:7, 139:20 82:16 **simple** [6] - 20:9, 149:17, 152:12, 79:4, 86:18, 97:15, 49:17, 61:11, 61:28, sore [1] - 150:21 **several** [1] - 123:2 152:13, 153:29, 97:16, 103:6, 104:6, **SHANE** [1] - 3:22 63:18, 155:28 sorry [66] - 6:25, 154:1, 155:5, 155:13 105:21, 105:26, 6:28, 9:17, 17:25, **SHANKEY** [1] - 3:21 simply [5] - 39:24, 106:1, 106:22, 108:7, **seeing** [2] - 58:23, SHANKEY-SMITH 70:29, 123:20, 27:29, 29:1, 29:22, 128:29 116:22, 116:24, 139:13, 150:18 34:15, 35:3, 36:2, [1] - 3:21 seeking [3] - 12:4, 121:26, 124:17, 36:4, 36:7, 36:28, single [1] - 112:8 **SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 42:29, 75:18 125:10, 129:10, **SINÉAD**[1] - 4:3 38:17, 45:3, 49:8, Shannon [1] seeks [1] - 11:24 134:11, 134:13 SINéAD[1] - 2:7 51:4, 51:7, 54:19, 118:25 SERGEANT [5] seem [10] - 8:27, sit [2] - 72:4, 84:19 60:21, 62:12, 62:24, shared [1] - 125:11 33:21, 57:6, 62:8, 3:12, 3:19, 4:2, 4:2, 63:23, 68:26, 69:10, SHEAHAN[1] - 3:18 sitting [2] - 77:14, 4:3 74:18, 74:19, 74:21, 66:20, 89:8, 91:19, sheet [4] - 108:17, 136.19 104:2, 118:13, 126:18 sergeant [26] -82:22, 83:27, 84:9, $\textbf{situation}~\text{\small{[3]}-17:13},$ 112:9, 127:7, 146:6 16:18, 26:21, 26:25, 88:22. 90:29. 92:8. sees [2] - 118:4, 79:26. 84:15 sheets [1] - 112:20 26:28, 29:22, 33:15, 92:16, 93:3, 94:3, 142:29 SHELLEY [1] - 3:24 six [1] - 123:25 35:25, 35:27, 37:14, 95:13, 96:22, 98:8, self [1] - 137:26 size [1] - 148:16 SHIP [1] - 3:27 37:19, 37:22, 37:28, 99:24, 103:14, 108:3, send [5] - 12:9, shoes [1] - 151:13 skip [1] - 67:9 39:6, 39:12, 39:21, 35:27, 78:11, 108:7, 111:14, 111:23, short [8] - 8:25, skipped [1] - 107:27 76:27, 85:20, 86:13, 111:25, 113:5, 153:9 49:21, 85:25, 86:16, **sky** [2] - 116:4, 97:12, 98:23, 98:24, 114:13, 126:7, 126:8, **sending** [2] - 32:14, 123:4, 125:7, 132:2, 118:22 100:23, 100:25, 126:20, 128:7, 122.9 139:8 sleep [1] - 38:29 100:27, 104:25, 129:13, 131:16, sends [5] - 79:4. show [3] - 78:21, slight [3] - 56:10, 131:13 132:5, 134:1, 135:16, 104:6, 104:24, 86:5, 105:22 59:11, 65:17 sergeant's [4] -135:17, 141:4, 142:1, 106:22, 124:17 showed [5] - 21:29, slightly [3] - 14:8, 29:11, 36:12, 86:15, 145:21, 146:13, sense [8] - 18:13, 22:2, 22:9, 103:16, 21:27, 101:1 139:28 150:19, 153:25, 25:16, 66:3, 71:17, 103:18 slowly [2] - 37:3, sergeants [11] -155:21 81:10, 108:29, 116:1, showing [1] - 136:8 94:29 29:13, 29:16, 36:14, sort [26] - 9:18, 119:22 shown [2] - 27:5, smart [1] - 91:27 36:18, 37:5, 43:16, 13:25, 20:10, 41:6, sent [27] - 11:29, 110:29 **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 44:10, 45:18, 56:12, 49:17, 62:2, 75:16, 17:4, 23:8, 25:1, shows [6] - 18:10, SMITHFIELD [1] -85:18, 87:18, 90:3, 56:14. 97:13 27:10, 29:8, 33:15, 24:29, 38:13, 82:8, 2.24 series [2] - 24:5, 93:18. 98:25. 110:12. 44:15, 59:23, 72:12, 103:23, 104:19 smokescreen [2] -111:9, 111:15, 72:21, 74:9, 78:8, sick [24] - 26:8, 13:23, 15:22 serious [26] - 51:16, 112:23, 113:28, 78:10, 79:23, 84:10, 26:12, 26:13, 26:29, so-called [1] -116:24, 118:16, 52:6, 53:1, 53:5, 82:5, 88:24, 100:26, 27:1, 27:14, 28:5, 140.25 119:14, 124:4, 85:24, 85:29, 121:17, 106:21, 112:23, 28:7, 30:15, 30:19, **so..** [1] **-** 40:2 122:16, 123:21, 125:16, 127:20, 116:8, 117:7, 118:11, 30:22, 32:1, 32:14, **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 123:22, 123:26, 138:2, 146:5, 147:5 124:15, 132:7, 145:2, 33:21, 34:27, 34:29, solicitor [3] - 8:12, 124:8, 125:25, sorted [2] - 18:22, 155:29 38:24, 38:26, 44:2, 61:6, 61:19 126:15, 126:17, 23:28 sentence [2] -44:18, 44:19, 55:6 **SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:8 127:21, 132:18, sought [3] - 28:27, 115:23, 135:9 sickness [3] - 21:18, SOLICITOR'S [1] -138:24, 139:29, 33:11, 72:11 separate [11] - 88:12, 21:23, 26:15 140:26, 140:28, speaking [2] -88:14. 92:17. 92:19. side [7] - 29:25, solicitor's [1] - 40:3 141:1, 141:7, 144:7, 116:28, 117:15 94:10, 97:25, 111:21, 31:28, 34:26, 43:9, SOLICITORS [5] -153:6 **specific** [3] - 65:18, 112:10, 138:29, 118:24, 118:26, 2:11, 2:18, 2:22, 2:30, seriousness [1] -65:22, 154:12 155:10, 155:18 145:15 4:4 131:2 **specify** [1] - 41:12 September [13] sign [3] - 16:17, solution [1] - 22:7 speculation [1] -12:22, 78:8, 78:10, **serve** [2] - 51:22, 16:18, 75:28 solving [2] - 77:1, 86.7 24:19 78:11, 83:5, 88:27, signature [4] - 16:25, 105:24 served [3] - 47:19, 104:24, 104:26, **spoken** [2] - 21:7, 71:8, 97:12, 98:22 someone [14] -59:14, 59:25 106:3 105:27, 117:4, 121:5, signed [12] - 16:21, 17:18, 18:20, 36:22, serves [1] - 52:18 spot [3] - 24:24, 122:12, 129:11 18:10, 22:24, 33:14, 84:19, 93:12, 98:1, sequence [4] service [1] - 70:18 102:4, 153:29 48:17, 50:21, 68:1, 118:6, 123:22, 25:27, 33:7, 67:15, Services [1] - 1:24 spotted [2] - 24:24, 71:7. 71:18. 78:19. 123:27, 140:1, 80:18 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 51:2 85:15, 106:18 140:29, 153:5 set [6] - 17:1, 17:4, **St** [1] - 73:20 Sergeant [36] significant [2] somewhat [3] - 56:4, stage [9] - 11:23, 81:29, 122:25, 14:12, 14:16, 16:16, 49:28, 150:5 103:25, 104:2

14:13, 39:22, 65:24, 110:1, 117:29, 122:19, 144:22, 153:5 stand [2] - 121:1, 151:13 standard [4] - 82:15, 83:6, 108:26, 137:2 **standing** [1] - 131:11 **stands** [1] - 136:28 start [8] - 13:12, 13:16, 13:18, 18:21, 20:20, 81:29, 128:18, 155:13 **started** [2] - 62:24, 83.2 starting [1] - 126:5 starts [5] - 31:13, 53:9, 92:1, 112:7, 120:7 state [2] - 57:7, 129:7 **STATE**[1] - 3:26 **State** [2] - 22:4, 110:6 statement [125] -11:21, 13:1, 13:26, 20:18, 26:4, 26:5, 34:5, 34:7, 42:3, 45:22, 45:27, 45:29, 46:1, 46:3, 46:14, 46:16, 47:5, 47:10, 47:14, 47:15, 47:18, 47:23, 47:29, 48:5, 48:6, 48:7, 48:21, 48:28, 49:13, 49:18, 50:26, 51:3, 51:10, 52:28, 56:17, 57:3, 58:3, 58:4, 58:15, 58:16, 58:17, 58:18, 58:20, 58:24, 58:25, 58:28, 58:29, 59:1, 59:3, 59:5, 59:7, 59:8, 59:11, 59:22, 60:15, 61:16, 61:17, 61:20, 63:6, 64:3, 67:17, 68:11, 70:13, 70:27, 71:5, 71:29, 72:3, 75:18, 75:27, 76:5, 77:22, 78:24, 82:11, 83:23, 83:24, 84:2, 84:19, 84:20, 84:23, 85:8, 85:9, 85:14, 90:13, 91:15, 96:27, 102:29, 106:2. 106:21, 107:28, 108:21, 111:2, 118:1, 118:10, 118:21, 121:23, 125:4, 127:20, 129:19,

129:24, 130:3, 130:4,

132:2, 132:29, 133:9, 133:10, 134:25, 134:27, 135:11, 135:25, 135:26, 136:2, 136:6, 136:8, 136:9, 136:11, 136:13, 137:23, 140:5, 151:4, 151:28, 154:16, 155:1 statements [24] -58:19, 70:11, 70:25, 71:1, 71:7, 71:15, 72:1, 72:26, 75:8, 77:19, 78:3, 78:16, 80:2, 83:20, 84:2, 84:4, 84:16, 84:25, 87:21, 87:26, 88:2, 91:23, 150:11 states [1] - 46:26 stating [1] - 109:15 station [28] - 20:14, 41:8, 52:17, 86:15, 93:3, 93:5, 93:7, 93:16, 93:25, 93:28 94:7, 96:1, 98:3, 98:8, 98:12, 100:2, 100:16, 101:13, 104:12, 106:15, 110:16, 110:28, 114:1, 115:5, 115:10, 125:18, 130:21 statutory [2] -141:17, 141:23 stay [1] - 140:21 steal [1] - 101:13 stem [1] - 53:13 stenographic [1] -1:26 stenography [1] -1:24 STENOGRAPHY[1] -1:29step [1] - 118:17 STEPHANIE[1] -**STEPHEN** [1] - 2:21 steps [6] - 87:4, 89:14, 122:18, 122:23, 154:19, 155:3 stick [2] - 149:9,

155:26

148:1

sticking [2] - 45:17,

44:18, 107:6, 144:20,

still [8] - 32:21,

146:21, 147:14,

152:12, 155:28

91:14. 101:25.

stolen [6] - 91:4,

102:28, 111:27, 127:3

stop [3] - 31:16, 101:1, 113:6 stopped [2] - 38:27, 39:13 **stopping** [1] - 137:6 stored [2] - 103:9, 104.12 story [1] - 20:10 straight [1] - 35:11 strand [1] - 155:14 strands [1] - 155:17 Street [2] - 130:16, 146:16 **STREET** [3] - 2:12, 3:27, 3:31 **street** [1] - 130:16 strengthened [1] -155:16 stress [3] - 21:22, 47:11, 47:12 strict [1] - 87:10 strive [1] - 83:9 stronger [1] - 143:2 stuff [13] - 24:15, 43:12, 43:13, 43:15, 43:17, 112:21, 137:4, 144:25, 147:2, 147:6, 153:8, 154:1, 155:14 **sub** [3] - 12:9, 13:22, subject [2] - 67:12, 85:25 submission [5] -40:3, 65:1, 65:25, 66:10, 66:13 submissions [1] submit [1] - 68:23 submitted [14] -11:5, 11:6, 11:8, 11:27, 14:29, 15:5, 15:28, 16:21, 18:3, 23:10, 39:23, 105:1, 111:18, 122:17 subsequent [3] -26:29, 68:15, 77:20 subsequently [1] -27.6 subsistence [3] -10:14, 12:24, 15:9 substratum [1] successful [2] -109:4, 109:12 sufficient [1] - 148:8 sufficiently [1] -94:22 suggest [8] - 25:12,

133:15 suggested [1] - 87:5 suggesting [2] -126:2, 153:12 suggestion [1] -49:25 summarise [1] -149:2 summer [1] - 64:12 **Sunday** [7] - 27:17, 31:9, 33:19, 52:15, 52:24, 52:25, 115:11 **super's** [1] - 14:5 superintendent [42] **-** 7:22, 7:23, 10:5, 22:23, 27:12, 37:6, 40:15, 44:22, 45:19, 47:15, 49:14, 51:15, 51:18, 51:23, 51:26, 52:17, 52:25, 53:8, 53:21, 53:26, 54:8, 59:16, 79:5, 81:17, 81:21, 81:23, 84:7, 84:10, 85:2, 88:25, 104:14, 106:23, 112:23, 116:23, 119:7, 131:14, 132:26, 134:11, 134:13, 145:2, 148:12 Superintendent [151] - 7:5, 7:6, 7:15, 10:24, 11:20, 12:20, 13:11, 13:17, 13:25, 14:6, 16:25, 17:10, 17:11, 17:16, 17:27, 18:3, 18:4, 18:6, 18:26, 18:28, 19:1, 19:4, 19:5, 19:15, 20:24, 20:29, 23:1, 23:2, 23:16, 23:20, 24:6, 24:8, 25:2, 25:3, 25:5, 26:17, 27:8, 29:2, 29:6, 29:14, 32:7, 32:29, 33:11, 33:24, 34:5. 34:18. 34:21. 36:11, 36:29, 38:4, 38:6, 40:26, 41:7, 41:15, 41:22, 41:29, 42:16, 43:14, 43:22, 44:6, 44:23, 44:26, 45:16, 45:26, 46:13, 46:17, 46:18, 46:25, 47:6. 48:2. 48:3. 48:19, 49:2, 51:3, 51:10, 51:24, 53:22, 54:20, 56:11, 57:7, 58:2, 58:14, 58:21, 58:24, 59:19, 59:21, 59:26, 59:28, 60:6, 60:27, 60:28, 61:5,

62:9, 63:4, 63:11, 65:20, 69:26, 69:29, 72:17, 74:8, 78:16, 79:18, 80:23, 81:5, 81:24, 89:22, 90:2, 90:4, 91:10, 102:22, 104:24, 107:10, 108:8, 108:12, 108:20, 109:13, 109:25, 111:7, 115:21, 115:28, 116:1, 117:3, 118:1. 118:24, 120:19, 121:23, 122:6, 124:15, 125:6, 125:11, 126:4, 126:9, 128:2, 133:28, 134:4, 137:28, 138:19, 138:28, 141:2, 146:24, 147:11, 151:27, 152:26, 153:7, 154:16, 154:20, 154:25, 154:26, 155:2, 155:26 **SUPERINTENDENT** [15] - 2:15, 3:2, 3:3, 3:4, 3:4, 3:5, 3:8, 3:8, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:18. 3:19. 3:20 superintendent's [5] · 14:6, 15:25, 40:19, 80:3, 142:7 supervise [1] -105:21 supervised [1] -76:28 supervisor [6] -68:2, 68:3, 97:5, 97:11, 115:11, 126:27 **supplied** [4] - 91:14, 96:27, 102:28, 106:4 supported [1] -41:11 suppose [7] - 10:1, 41:24, 75:20, 87:12, 97:25, 119:24, 128:22 surprised [1] - 74:7 surrounding [1] -85.28 suspect [24] - 68:11, 69:2, 69:13, 70:5, 72:23, 76:6, 76:8, 76:24, 78:3, 78:5, 78:21, 78:23, 78:28, 89:2, 89:5, 89:13, 90:24, 104:19, 106:5, 109:5, 115:26, 116:12, 116:27, 118:20 suspected[1]-

25:18. 53:29. 65:13.

65:28, 101:1, 116:13,

107:4 suspects [15] -106:29, 109:18, 115:12, 115:15, 117:17, 118:3, 118:26, 118:28, 119:4, 120:17, 120:19, 120:20, 124:27, 127:4, 134:21 suspects" [1] - 116:4 suspended [4] -150:8, 152:15, 152:16, 152:28 **suspicion** [1] - 76:12 swiftly [5] - 19:2, 23:22, 23:25, 23:26, 86.12 swiped [1] - 100:15 switched [1] - 42:10 sympathetic [1] -66:22 system [9] - 11:28, 12:1, 14:26, 16:3, 77:8, 86:12, 86:23, 125:21, 126:4 **SÍOCHÁNA**[1] - 3:2 Síochána [8] - 19:9, 75:10, 77:1, 141:19, 141:20, 141:21, 146:9, 150:14

Т

T&N [1] - 3:30 tab [1] - 44:13 table [1] - 39:19 tacking [1] - 76:8 **TARA**[1] - 3:21 targeting [10] - 7:10, 13:16, 108:11, 112:27, 113:24, 120:5, 133:20, 147:24, 147:25, 147:26 tax [24] - 7:7, 7:9, 7:16, 7:24, 7:25, 10:13, 13:20, 13:22, 13:24, 17:13, 17:20, 18:14, 18:19, 18:22, 19:6, 19:18, 19:21, 21.27 22.1 22.8 23:27, 24:4, 24:15, 25:11 taxation [2] - 19:29, 25.17 taxed [5] - 16:12, 19:10, 20:15, 21:2, 22:2 taxi [5] - 130:20,

130:21, 130:26, 146:16, 146:18 team [5] - 13:14, 19:12, 65:12, 66:21, 155:9 tease [1] - 29:23 teased [2] - 54:8, 71:21 telephone [1] - 65:19 **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 ten [1] - 114:22 terms [8] - 11:19, 28:5, 81:17, 111:6, 133:19, 135:9, 145:6, 150:19 testimony [1] - 58:10 text [13] - 24:6, 24:10, 24:20, 24:22, 24:27, 24:28, 24:29, 25:8, 29:7, 29:21, 35:27, 106:23 texted [3] - 24:12, 36:26, 36:28 texting [1] - 24:18 THE [13] - 1:3, 1:7, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 6:1, 9:21, 50:7, 80:29, 81:1, 114:26, 156:14 theft [11] - 67:15, 69:1, 82:23, 90:11,

90:17, 92:22, 92:24, 95:15, 100:1, 104:10, 104:28 thefts [4] - 69:11, 79:12, 88:14, 149:21 theirs [1] - 130:4 themselves [5] -71:2, 71:3, 75:27,

78:4. 78:5 **THEN** [4] - 9:21, 80:29, 114:26, 156:14 thereabouts [1] -

22:17 therefore [3] - 21:4, 54:22, 73:14 they've [1] - 85:13 thinking [3] - 24:17, 73:29, 83:6

thinks [1] - 120:14 third [5] - 92:24, 95:6, 103:6, 111:13,

113:23 thorough [1] -105:23 threatened [2] -145:24. 145:25 threats [1] - 145:23 three [8] - 25:1,

92:17, 92:19, 108:16, 111:21, 112:10,

147:25 threshold [1] - 76:11 Thursday [2] - 27:14, 30:15

THURSDAY [1] -156:14

tick [4] - 97:4, 99:8, 101:2, 149:14 tighter [1] - 12:7

title [1] - 141:29 **TO**[1] - 6:9 to-ing [3] - 133:25,

133:26, 134:3 today [1] - 65:3 Together [1] -

141:24

tomorrow [3] -

134:22

together [4] - 84:16, 112:1, 120:8, 139:1 **TOM** [1] - 3:12

65:15, 66:26, 67:2 took [11] - 69:2, 80:4. 82:17, 83:21, 89:27, 96:8, 96:9, 96:19, 112:24, 130:22,

tools [1] - 76:13 top [11] - 20:20, 48:29, 49:1, 81:29, 123:13, 124:13, 127:5, 127:7, 140:26, 142:3

topic [1] - 49:23 totally [2] - 112:10, 120:28

touch [2] - 9:13, 111.3

towards [9] - 20:19, 74:12, 75:2, 83:9, 125:7, 127:7, 129:3, 139:10, 155:3

towed [3] - 103:13, 103:17, 103:19 town [4] - 118:24,

118:27, 130:27, 134:20 TOWNPARKS[1] -

tracksuit [1] - 127:6 trailer [30] - 91:4, 91:14, 92:22, 92:24,

94:11, 94:14, 94:18, 94:21, 94:28, 95:15, 96:25, 98:10, 100:11, 100:15, 101:13, 101:14, 101:25, 102:5, 102:28, 103:13, 103:17, 103:18, 103:23,

31:19, 33:19, 33:29,

104:28, 110:19, 111:1, 111:27 **training** [1] - 75:9 transcript [2] - 1:25, transpires [1] - 7:10

transport [5] - 15:12, 16:27, 23:18, 116:8, 118:6 travel [8] - 10:21, 12:13, 12:24, 13:4,

20:27, 22:5, 22:10, 102.6 travelling [6] - 10:14,

12:10, 12:15, 20:26, 21:2, 22:9 tray [1] - 139:28

TREACY [1] - 2:27 treated [1] - 150:22 treatment [1] -146:19

trial [1] - 31:13 triathlon [4] - 72:22, 72:28, 73:20, 78:29 Tribunal [41] - 6:15, 6:16, 14:21, 15:5, 15:8, 17:8, 24:23,

34:6, 34:7, 42:3, 46:2, 48:12, 50:28, 58:3, 58:17, 58:19, 58:27, 58:29, 59:4, 59:5, 59:7, 59:14, 60:12,

24:26, 26:5, 30:29,

60:13, 60:16, 60:24, 61:7, 61:16, 61:17, 61:20, 61:22, 64:4, 64:11, 65:6, 82:12,

118:2, 121:24, 151:2 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2,

Tribunal's [1] - 43:26 **TRIBUNALS**[1] - 1:8 tried [5] - 27:5, 27:19, 28:24, 40:17,

54:13 tries [1] - 37:1 true [1] - 15:14 trust [1] - 13:19 try [3] - 40:18, 89:14,

99:28 trying [15] - 36:1, 36:11, 39:6, 42:2, 59:24, 71:22, 83:6, 91:27, 96:22, 98:25, 100:19, 113:6, 113:16, 137:27, 149:2 **Tube** [3] - 106:11, 106:16, 107:2

Tuesday [6] - 30:3,

Tullamore [1] - 27:24 turn [2] - 27:18, 140.3 turned [4] - 26:16, 32:29, 47:20, 100:14 TURNER [1] - 2:27 turns [1] - 95:24 twice [1] - 16:21 twig [1] - 24:24 two [58] - 10:1, 10:5, 25:1, 27:5, 28:24, 40:28, 41:26, 48:23, 49:4, 49:12, 53:26, 54:13, 54:15, 54:24, 55:17, 55:25, 57:1, 58:23, 59:18, 60:5, 68:24, 68:26, 68:29, 69:3, 69:5, 69:7, 69:9, 69:10, 69:20, 69:22, 70:2, 71:28, 72:7, 72:28, 74:13, 75:3, 76:24, 80:26, 88:11, 88:14, 89:20, 92:23, 95:2, 95:4, 96:16, 97:25, 104:19, 113:18, 113:25, 116:7, 120:29, 121:16, 127:3, 127:6, 133:22, 138:26 type [2] - 91:8, 125:21 typed [4] - 48:15,

35:1, 43:29

U

48:28, 49:3, 49:7

types [1] - 113:18

tyres [1] - 17:24

typewritten [1] - 48:8

ultimately [2] -24:25, 127:10 unable [3] - 79:12, 91:7, 102:10 unavailability [1] -117:9 unclear [1] - 88:22 under [20] - 29:24, 30:28, 47:11, 47:21, 48:24, 51:28, 59:25, 67:25. 68:18. 73:1. 75:29, 77:13, 88:4, 106:9, 107:6, 126:3, 126:9, 127:2, 141:24, 142:17 **UNDER** [2] - 1:2, 1:8 **undermine** [1] - 66:9 underneath [2] -50:15, 102:8

103:24, 103:25,

understood [2] -129:17, 131:8 undertaken [2] -12:14. 109:3 unfit [1] - 44:18 unfortunately [3] -13:13, 21:16, 24:20 unit [4] - 26:21, 26:25, 26:28, 36:23 unlikely [1] - 98:15 unreasonable [2] -66:21, 67:22 unredacted [1] -9:26 UNTIL [1] - 156:14 untrue [1] - 58:10 unusual [1] - 52:24 up [53] - 11:23, 11:28, 13:19, 19:26, 22:28, 26:7, 27:5, 27:18, 28:21, 30:25, 39:1, 41:7, 45:16, 46:11, 49:1, 50:10, 58:22, 58:23, 59:16, 59:22, 60:5, 64:4, 77:14. 78:11. 78:26. 79:4, 80:26, 81:4, 83:6, 84:14, 87:15, 98:8, 99:9, 100:11, 101:1, 104:6, 105:26, 106:21, 111:28, 112:20, 115:20, 116:22, 120:9, 120:10, 121:1, 131:9, 133:24, 134:10, 134:13, 140:18, 149:22, 150:12, 153:9 update [1] - 142:8 updated [5] - 104:20, 127:10, 127:17, 132:20 **upheld** [1] - 49:11 uploaded [1] - 107:2 upping [1] - 82:18 urgent [1] - 76:25 usual [1] - 70:28

vague [2] - 21:19, 52.23 vaguely [3] - 52:26, 98:3, 136:20 valid [4] - 78:17, 84:4, 84:24 value [2] - 68:5, 143:20 values [1] - 86:8 various [2] - 67:29,

76:9 veer [1] - 13:21 veers [1] - 7:8 vehicle [6] - 19:7, 19:10, 21:1, 103:23, 107:4, 109:5 vehicles [1] - 104:20 verbally [1] - 78:15 verbatim [3] - 1:25, 59:6. 59:8 verified [1] - 11:27 verse [1] - 90:5 version [14] - 29:15, 34:23, 41:10, 42:1, 43:19, 48:8, 48:16, 48:22, 49:3, 49:8, 49:15, 58:8, 132:20 via [2] - 65:29, 89:14 victim [9] - 105:23, 131:20, 131:21, 131:22, 131:25, 132:8, 140:16, 150:21, 151:13 victims [8] - 69:11, 75:11, 76:16, 76:29, 79:24, 87:1, 117:8, 118.12 view [23] - 73:5, 73:8, 77:8, 77:12, 83:22, 83:25, 93:6, 94:19, 97:27, 98:9, 99:23, 100:1, 101:16, 105:19, 109:9, 120:1, 125:11, 135:17, 144:29, 149:25, 155:2, 155:26, 155:28 viewed [21] - 25:9, 68:5, 77:5, 78:20, 79:13, 90:21, 91:3, 93:21, 93:25, 94:25, 97:20, 97:26, 98:17, 98:29, 100:22, 101:24, 102:2. 102:16, 102:17, 102:20, 112:14 viewing [4] - 73:29, 77:15, 104:10, 110:28

views [5] - 79:23, 98:7, 108:4, 151:26, 152:4 vindictively [1] -58.6 violence [1] - 122:21 virtually [1] - 124:1 visible [1] - 145:18 visit [2] - 10:25, 95:19 voice [1] - 89:29 volume [3] - 50:11, 50:12, 82:19

Volume [14] - 7:2, 11:3, 28:19, 33:25, 47:23, 62:25, 62:27, 62:29, 67:17, 99:14, 115:7, 115:22, 131:16 volumes [1] - 63:28

W

wait [2] - 63:15, 93.12 waiting [1] - 28:20 walking [2] - 127:1, 130:17 Wallace [3] - 10:27, 151:24, 152:2 Wallace's [1] - 154:4 wallet [3] - 69:4, 69:15, 69:21 wants [2] - 137:7, 144:28 warning [2] - 106:6, 107:3 waste [1] - 127:7 wasting [3] - 61:26, 138:8, 150:1 watch [1] - 73:16 ways [1] - 92:13 weaken [1] - 155:15 weakens [1] - 155:14 wearing [2] - 127:5, 127:6 Wednesday [1] -30:11 WEDNESDAY [2] -1:18, 6:1 week [16] - 19:3, 27:29, 29:22, 35:8, 36:29, 93:13, 96:9, 96:21, 100:17, 101:18, 102:15, 103:19, 103:21, 152:14, 152:19, 152:21 weekend [2] - 27:13, weeks [1] - 138:22 WELLINGTON [1] -Westmeath [1] -51:15 WESTMEATH[1] -3.32 whatsoever [1] -133:9 **WHEATLEY**[1] - 3:4 Wheatley [9] - 29:2,

57:7, 59:21 whereas [3] - 37:20, 38:12, 149:26 whichever [2] -15:19. 128:19 whilst [1] - 151:11 whistleblower [1] whistleblowers [1] -24.16 white [3] - 14:3, 15:26, 127:5 WHITE [1] - 3:10 whole [2] - 78:1, 150:8 Wicklow [1] - 21:15 wine [1] - 39:1 wing [1] - 127:7 wisdom [2] - 66:14, 147:17 wish [4] - 63:4, 75:26, 78:22, 146:23 wished [1] - 29:3 wishes [2] - 66:21, 80:3 withdraw [2] - 66:15, 137:8 withdrawing [4] -134:28, 135:13, 135:27, 136:15 withheld [1] - 13:5 witness [8] - 58:10, 60:6, 66:15, 70:26, 75:26, 75:27, 83:24, 143:18 **WITNESS** [1] - 5:2 witnessed [1] - 71:7 witnesses [6] -

70:10, 74:15, 75:5, 77:29, 78:19, 78:23

witnesses.... [1] -76:21 wonder [2] - 49:21, 65:1

wondering [6] -49:24, 59:25, 60:4, 126:3, 128:23, 145:27 word [2] - 23:25, 153:27

wording [1] - 54:29 words [1] - 84:26 works [1] - 86:12 worried [1] - 39:2 worry [1] - 95:11 would've [2] - 72:8, 125:28 write [19] - 11:16,

61:6, 72:6, 72:7, 83:24, 84:19, 97:26, 100:17, 102:20,

122:11, 125:19, 125:20, 138:19, 138:21, 140:18, 141:5, 141:10. 142:17, 142:27 writes [4] - 92:22, 102:23, 113:10, 139.15 writing [19] - 16:8, 18:15, 21:6, 46:2, 49:9, 83:4, 92:16, 97:6, 97:11, 112:9, 120:8, 122:7, 122:9, 139:27, 142:22, 144:22, 146:13, 147:14, 152:26 written [18] - 8:2, 15:21, 33:5, 33:6, 40:26, 70:11, 78:15, 85:14, 100:21, 113:12, 118:4, 125:2, 131:29, 139:3, 144:10, 144:28, 145:1, 146:5 wrongly [2] - 56:24, 57:20 wrote [25] - 33:5, 41:8, 43:12, 43:17, 43:18, 44:6, 46:18, 48:9, 71:2, 71:3, 71:4, 72:14, 72:20, 78:4, 82:23, 83:12, 91:23, 92:15, 98:20, 100:19, 102:21. 121:6. 129:10. 140:25. 146:3

X

XYs[1] - 119:9

year [4] - 11:15, 17:19, 18:20, 84:13 years [9] - 12:7, 12:8, 16:14, 17:8, 39:4, 60:9, 83:28, 85:6, 99.25 yesterday [6] - 6:15, 7:2, 10:12, 12:21, 22:15, 81:18 young [7] - 93:9, 100:4, 100:9, 124:10, 136:18, 139:25, 150:2 yourself [11] - 28:16, 33:2, 42:10, 54:5, 80:2, 110:11, 110:14, 117:17, 136:25, 137:20, 139:10

40:15, 45:19, 46:18,

47:15, 53:22, 54:8,

€	
€20 [1] - 127:3 €300 [2] - 28:23, 28:26	
É	

ÉABHALL[1] - 2:29 **Éireann**[1] - 151:26 **ÉIREANN**[2] - 1:4, 1:5

Ó

Ó [4] - 3:6, 11:2, 154:18, 156:1