TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE

ON THURSDAY, 17TH OCTOBER 2019 - DAY 102

102

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PHILIP BARNES

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR.

DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC PATRICK MARRINAN SC SINÉAD McGRATH BL JOHN DAVIS, SOLICITOR MR. MS.

MR.

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET

INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY

SOLI CI TORS HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMI THFI ELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY

& GARDA DAVID TÜRNER:

INSTRUCTED BY:

R: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC MR. JAMES KANE BL MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS 13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURDAY 12. 13. SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT AI DAN MI NNOCK 14. 15. SUPERINTENDENT AIDAN MINNOCK
INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
MONICA CARR. HEAD OF DIRECTORATE. HUMAN RESOURCES AI 17. 18. 19. 20. 21. 22. 23. 24. 25. 26. 27. MONI CA CARR, H PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT 28. MR. BRI AN SAVA HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND MR. BRIAN SAVAGE
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O'REARDON
INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN 30. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MICHAEL FLYNN 33. 34.

SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN ã5. 36. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 37.

SHANE MURPHY SC MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC MR. MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC

CONOR DIGNAM SC

DONAL MCGUINNESS BL

SHELLEY HORAN BL

KATE EGAN BL

ALISON MORRISSEY

EMMA GRIFFIN

FE STATE SOLLOLTOR'S MR. MR. MS. MS. MS.

INSTRUCTED BY: MS.

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL MR. PAUL CONNELLAN T&N MCLYNN FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

BASTION COURT 11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR.

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. SINÉAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

INDEX

WI TNESS	PAGE
GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH	
QUESTIONED BY MR. MCGUINNESS	7

1	THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON THURSDAY, 17TH	
2	OCTOBER 2019:	
3		
4	CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Kelly. Take your time.	
5	MR. KELLY: Chairman, thank you very much for having $_{10}$: 54
6	given us the time. Having re-examined the relevant	
7	documents and taken instructions of Garda Keogh, we are	
8	of the view now that we don't wish to pursue that	
9	issue, Issue 8.	
10	CHAIRMAN: Very good.	: 55
11	MR. KELLY: The view I personally take is, it's a	
12	matter for the Tribunal of Inquiry.	
13	CHAIRMAN: Yes, but as far as you and your client are	
14	concerned, you are not pursuing that part of Garda	
15	Keogh's complaint.	: 55
16	MR. KELLY: Correct.	
17	CHAIRMAN: okay.	
18	MR. MURPHY: I am very grateful to my Friend for that	
19	clarification.	
20	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you very much. Well, it seems 10	: 55
21	to me that the proper course for the inquiry to take is	
22	to note that. Mr. McGuinness will, therefore, not ask	
23	Garda Keogh any questions arising out of that. Any	
24	submissions that anybody wants to make as a consequence	
25	of that are another day's work. But witnesses will not $_{ exttt{10}}$: 55
26	now be asked, subject to any application or whatever in	
27	due course, but for the present all we need do is	
28	simply to pass over issue number 8 as not being	
29	proceeded with in evidence by Garda Keogh. Isn't that	

1			the appropriate thing?	
2			MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chairman.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Is everybody happy with that?	
4			MR. McGUINNESS: I think so, Chairman.	
5			CHAIRMAN: That seems the right thing to do.	10:56
6			MR. McGUINNESS: I am grateful to Mr. Kelly for	
7			confirming the position.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes, thanks very much, Mr. Kelly.	
9			MR. McGUINNESS: It assists the Tribunal.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Very good. So that's the way we will leave	10:56
11			it. That's the only thing we need to do, we don't need	
12			to debate anything else; any implications, consequences	
13			or anything of that kind. All right. Thank you very	
14			much. Okay.	
15				10:56
16			GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH CONTINUED TO BE QUESTIONED BY	
17			MR. MCGUI NNESS:	
18				
19			CHAIRMAN: Next business, Mr. McGuinness, then is	
20			which?	10:56
21			MR. McGUINNESS: It is issue number 10, Chairman.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
23	1	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Good morning, Garda Keogh?	
24		Α.	Good morning.	
25	2	Q.	Issue number 10 relates to a complaint concerning the	10:56
26			denial of a request made by you for the cancellation of	
27			annual leave?	
28		Α.	Yes.	

29 3 Q. At the end of August of 2015. I think we looked

1			yesterday in a different context, Superintendent Murray	
2			came to your house or sorry, was it your house or	
3			the station, on the night of the 30th August. I think	
4			you noted, he served a regulation notice, a discipline	
5			notice on you, is that right? We looked at	10:57
6			Superintendent Murray's note of that meeting, you	
7			recall that?	
8		Α.	Yes. Yes, that's correct.	
9	4	Q.	Yes, you recall that. In your statement to the	
10			Tribunal, which is at page 131, and we might look at	10:58
11			that on the screen, you say in your statement:	
12				
13			"I applied to cancel an annual leave day, namely	
14			31/8/2014, for the purpose of attending a GSOC	
15			appointment"	10:58
16				
17			If we just scroll down the screen there a little bit.	
18				
19			"under the protected disclosures. My line manager,	
20			Sergeant Monaghan, approved my request. Superintendent	10:58
21			Murray, who was aware of the confidentiality of GSOC	
22			communications with members, countermanded this	
23			approval, citing absence of a proper explanation, in	
24			circumstances where I could not provide any more	
25			specific explanation, given the confidential nature of	10:58
26			GSOC di scl osures. "	
27				
28			You refer to appendix 9. Perhaps we should look at	
29			that Page 211 in the namers	

1			CHAIRMAN: Am I just being stupid or should that be	
2			2015?	
3			MR. McGUINNESS: I'm sorry.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Because Superintendent Murray didn't come	
5			until March '15. He came on the 9th March '15, is that	10:59
6			right.	
7			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, that's correct.	
8			WI TNESS: Yeah.	
9			CHAIRMAN: So that really should be '15.	
10		Α.	You're correct.	10:59
11	5	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And the leave in question was 31st August	
12			2015?	
13		Α.	'15, yes, Judge.	
14	6	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Am I right in that?	
15		Α.	Yes.	10:59
16			CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you very much. I wrote down	
17			'15.	
18	7	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: So page 211, I think relates to your	
19			application. That's addressed by to Sergeant Monaghan?	
20				11:00
21			"Re annual Leave 31/8. Garda Keogh. With reference to	
22			above, I took annual Leave on 31/8/2015; however, I was	
23			required to meet GSOC that day in Portlaoise and I	
24			requested to have the annual Leave cancelled for that	
25			day, Monday 31/8/2015. Forwarded for your	11:00
26			consi derati on, pl ease."	
27				
28			If you go down the page slightly there. It says:	

1			"Garda Keogh application approved. Sergeant Monaghan."	
2				
3			It's date stamped the 2nd September. I am sure you	
4			noticed that Superintendent Murray in his statement	
5			said a sergeant can't approve that under the	11:00
6			regulations. I don't know if you agree with that or	
7			not?	
8		Α.	I'm just not aware of that.	
9	8	Q.	Okay. If we just go back up to the top then. It seems	
10			to be endorsed by Superintendent Murray there.	11:00
11				
12			"Application refused in the absence of any proper	
13			expl anati on. "	
14				
15			That was I think communicated to you. Just perhaps if	11:01
16			we look at it, at page 210. Sent down to you then by	
17			Sergeant Monaghan.	
18				
19			"Re: Application for cancellation. With reference to	
20			the above, Superintendent Murray has refused	11:01
21			cancellation of this day's leave in the absence of	
22			proper explanation. If you still wish to have this day	
23			considered for cancellation, can you forward a	
24			comprehensive report as to the reasons and attach same	
25			to your D9 and resubmit.	11:01
26				
27			Forwarded for your information and consideration."	
28				
29			That is signed by Sergeant Monaghan. I think it's	

Т			correct to say that you didn't, as it were, take that	
2			further in the sense of submitting any further report,	
3			factually, at that point in time?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	9	Q.	Okay. Now, I just want to understand the position.	11:02
6			Obviously in your statement you say you applied to	
7			cancel an annual leave day for the purpose of attending	
8			a GSOC appointment. You had, in fact, attended before	
9			you made the application that we're looking at here, is	
10			that correct?	11:02
11		Α.	It's probably correct, I can't remember the sequence of	
12			events.	
13	10	Q.	Yes. Well, I may be misreading the statement that we	
14			looked at on page 131. If we just go back to page 131.	
15			Down the page there, at number 10.	11:02
16				
17			"I applied to cancel an annual leave day for the	
18			purpose of attending a GSOC"	
19				
20			As I understand the position, and this is why I am	11:03
21			asking you to correct me if I am wrong, you hadn't	
22			applied in advance of the appointment, isn't that	
23			right?	
24		Α.	It would appear to be.	
25	11	Q.	Yes. So is it the position then that you had the 31st	11:03
26			August scheduled as an annual leave say, on that day?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	12	Q.	This is one of the points made, I am sure you have seen	
29			Superintendent Murray's statement: When you met him on	

- the 30th, as it stood at that at that point in time, it
- 2 appeared that you were going off duty and wouldn't be
- in the next day because of your annual leave?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 13 Q. In fact, unbeknownst to him, if I am correct, and I may 11:04
- 6 not be correct, unbeknownst to him, you had a GSOC
- 7 appointment, is that correct?
- 8 A. That's correct. I can't recall just exactly how that
- 9 GSOC appointment -- I think, just from recollection, I

11 · 04

11:04

11:05

11 · 05

- think the appointment was not a long-term, it wasn't
- 11 preplanned long-term. I think it cropped up fairly
- soon prior to the meeting. The meeting was arranged.
- 13 14 Q. CHAIRMAN: It wasn't a long arranged meeting?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 15 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 16 A. I think it was a very short period of time that the
- 17 that the meeting was arranged. Just from recollection.
- 18 16 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. It's a curiosity just, in terms
- of the regulations. Having taken the day of annual
- leave and obviously not done regular duty, can you
- apply to cancel that retrospectively?
- 22 A. I don't think there's anything wrong with applying to
- 23 cancel it retrospectively.
- 24 17 Q. Okay.
- 25 A. Under the circumstances, as I said, it wasn't a thing
- that I knew, let's say, a month or two months in
- 27 advance.
- 28 18 Q. CHAIRMAN: It came up pretty quickly, you say.
- 29 A. Just from my memory, yes.

2			you attended GSOC?	
3		^	I did.	
	20	Α.		
4	20	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And then you applied to say, look, did I	
5			that on a day of leave and I should be entitled to undo	11:06
6			the leave so I save myself a day. That was it?	
7		Α.	That's correct.	
8	21	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It wasn't refused on the ground that it was	
9			retrospective?	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:06
11	22	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So it looks like there doesn't seem to be a	
12			logical reason why you couldn't do it. So either way,	
13			assuming that that's what happened. Anyway that's	
14	23	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: In relation to the memo that we had	
15			looked at from Sergeant Monaghan back to you, I think	11:06
16			you agreed with me a few minutes ago, you didn't take	
17			it further and you were asked by our investigators	
18			about this, if you may recall, in the course of their	
19			enquiries with you. At page 58 and 59 of that. We may	
20			not need to see it, unless you want to. You said:	11:06
21				
22			"No. They knew I was going to meet GSOC, as per my	
23			handwritten letter dated 1/9/2015. But Superintendent	
24			Murray was looking for a comprehensive report of what I	
25			was going to meet GSOC about. The protected disclosure	11:07
26			process is supposed to be protected and confidential.	
27			Former Garda Commissioner O'Sullivan was saying	
28			publicly she supported whistleblowers, but I feel	
29			Superintendent Murray was looking to ascertain	

1 19 Q. CHAIRMAN: You went and you made the -- it looks like

1			confidential information about my meeting with GSOC. I	
2			felt I had given an explanation and I did not feel I	
3			needed to give a further explanation that I had already	
4			set out that I had to with GSOC.	
5				11:07
6			The superintendent would have been aware that there	
7			were no papers served on me by GSOC in relation to any	
8			work related investigation and that I was not a witness	
9			to any investigation being conducted by GSOC, as this	
10			paperwork is always dealt with through the ranks.	11:07
11				
12			As I have said, I believe that Superintendent Murray	
13			was aware that this meeting with GSOC related to my	
14			protected disclosure and given the protection as in	
15			that legislation, I felt that I had outlined as much as	11:08
16			I could in my initial explanation in writing."	
17				
18			Can I just ask you a couple of questions about that	
19		Α.	Sure.	
20	24	Q.	It's not evident from anything we have seen that	11:08
21			Superintendent Murray knew in advance that you were	
22			going to meet GSOC on the 31st. Would you agree with	
23			that?	
24		Α.	I would agree with that, yeah.	
25	25	Q.	Okay. In terms of what you have said there, that the	11:08
26			superintendent would have been aware that there were no	
27			papers served on you by GSOC, that's correct, isn't	
28			that right?	
29		Δ	Vas	

- 2 So you weren't being, as it were, to his knowledge required as part of a GSOC investigation?
- 3 A. That's my understanding, yeah.
- 4 27 Q. He, for his part, said in a statement that he wasn't aware that there was a GSOC involvement in your

11 · 09

11:09

- 6 protected disclosure. Is there anything that you can
- point to which shows that he was or should have been
- 8 aware that your attendance at GSOC related to your
- 9 protected disclosure?
- 10 A. It would be common knowledge that I made a protected
- disclosure. He would be very well aware I made a
- 12 protected disclosure.
- 13 28 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. I mean, I can't speak for him.
- 15 29 Q. Yes.
- 16 A. For Superintendent Murray.
- 17 30 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. But, the way it would work was, if a complaint, for
- 19 example, had been made against me and GSOC were
- investigating, it would come through the super's office 11:10
- and then come down to me. I'd be served papers. There
- was nothing like that. So my meeting with GSOC, I
- mean, it would have been common sense, it was something
- to do with protected disclosures.
- 25 31 Q. Yes. But as I understand it, you hadn't made a
- 26 protected disclosure to GSOC, nor had you made a
- 27 statement to them until the 2nd October 2015?
- A. Just one moment. You see, I had been in contact with
- 29 GSOC for a while.

- 1 32 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. Because in 2014 the law changes from the Garda
- 3 Síochána Act to the protected disclosure thing.
- 4 33 Q. Yes.
- 5 A. As I stated earlier, at the very start, I had actually
- 6 tried to make my complaint originally to GSOC via
- 7 Deputy Luke Flanagan and retired Garda John Wilson at
- 8 that point. They couldn't deal with it. So I had to
- go through the Garda Síochána Act. The Guards had
- started their investigation and I think at some stage,

11:11

11:11

11 · 12

- is it six months later, the law changes.
- 12 34 Q. Yes.
- 13 A. In 2014. But I had been in contact with GSOC in
- relation to problems with the Garda investigation.
- 15 Basically, at certain points I would have put GSOC on
- 16 notice, this is what's going on.
- 17 35 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. And at some point I am possibly going to report this
- matter to ye, and just to put ye on notice of that?
- 20 36 Q. Yes. I don't know, would you accept that -- I mean,
- 21 you are obviously completely correct that
- 22 Superintendent Murray was aware of your protected
- 23 disclosure made originally?
- 24 A. Yeah.
- 25 37 Q. But would you accept that he wouldn't have been aware
- of any contact that you had with GSOC about complaints
- concerning the investigation or your intention to make
- a complaint to them?
- 29 A. Well he shouldn't have been.

- 1 38 Q. He shouldn't have been?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 39 Q. Had he any reason --
- 4 A. I hope he wasn't.
- 5 40 Q. Have you any reason to suggest that he was in fact
- aware that you were going to GSOC yourself or that you

11:12

11:13

- 7 had been in contact with them about different aspects
- 8 of the investigation?
- 9 A. I don't think he was aware and, as I said, I hope he
- wasn't.
- 11 41 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. I hope at the time, obviously is what I am trying to
- say, yes.
- 14 42 Q. Yes. I mean, we're obviously going to hear from
- Superintendent Murray, but he, for his part, having met 11:12
- you on the night of the 30th, he didn't know you were
- 17 going to GSOC. Then, when he got the explanation that
- you had been to GSOC, he thought it was sort of,
- 19 slightly vague is the way he put it in his statement.
- 20 He wasn't sure if it was genuine or not. I am
- 21 wondering, would you have been able to produce any note
- of a letter or an appointment or anything to him, if he
- had taken it further, in a further report?
- A. Well, if that were the case. And I understand exactly
- what you are saying.
- 26 43 Q. Yes.
- 27 A. If that were the case, it would be very simple for him
- to just write to GSOC and say, here, GSOC, there's an
- issue here.

- 1 44 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. Can you just confirm whether you have business with
- 3 this guard or not. End of story. It would have been
- 4 very simple.
- 5 45 Q. Yes. That is absolutely one possible route. I suppose 11:13
- 6 the other route would be for you to ask -- was it
- 7 Mr. Butler you were meeting?
- 8 A. Sorry, what date?
- 9 46 Q. It doesn't really matter, perhaps.
- 10 A. Ken Isac and Mr. Butler. Either way, I think it was

11 · 14

11:14

11:14

11 · 14

- 11 Ken Isac, he was the head investigator with GSOC, and
- 12 Mr. Butler. I had a good few meetings with GSOC. If
- you give me the date, I can -- if it's relevant.
- 14 47 Q. Well, it's this date?
- 15 CHAIRMAN: 31st August.
- MR. McGUINNESS: 31st August.
- 17 CHAIRMAN: But it doesn't really matter who it was.
- 18 MR. McGUINNESS: It doesn't probably matter.
- 19 48 Q. CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness is asking you about --
- 20 A. Ken Isac and Ronan butler.
- 21 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 22 49 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: The suggestion that you made about the
- 23 Guards writing to GSOC, equally, on receipt of Sergeant
- 24 Monaghan's notification of refusal, you might perhaps
- 25 might have gone to GSOC and said, look, will you
- confirm that you met me on that day. Maybe that would
- 27 have solved the whole problem. I am wondering, did you
- think of that? I am not criticising you if you didn't,
- but is it something you did think of?

- 1 A. That I should have gone to GSOC.
- 2 50 Q. You could have, yes. You could have, possibly, you
- 3 could have gone to GSOC and said, look, my super
- 4 doesn't seem to be certain that that's a good enough
- reason, but would you confirm that I did go to GSOC?

11:15

11:16

- 6 A. That's kind of six of one and half a dozen of the
- 7 other.
- 8 51 Q. I suppose it is?
- 9 A. He could have equally written to GSOC.
- 10 52 Q. Then you might well have complained that he was, in
- fact, trying to find out, if he had written behind your
- 12 back I mean?
- 13 CHAIRMAN: I don't think GSOC would have told him.
- MR. McGUINNESS: well, they probably wouldn't.
- 15 53 Q. CHAIRMAN: If he wrote and said, did Garda Keogh -- but 11:15
- I suppose you would say, I am just guessing,
- 17 speculating, if Superintendent Murray's concern was,
- did Garda Keogh really go to GSOC on the 31st, or was
- 19 he somewhere else and using this as an excuse. If that
- was the case, I suppose you would say, he could have
- come back to you and said, listen, please give me some
- confirmation that you were with GSOC. Is that a
- reasonable point of view? Would that reflect your sort
- of point of view more or less? You didn't say that,
- but I'm sort of assuming that that's what you're...
- 26 A. Yes. Just, the notice that we had just on the screen
- to do with the -- it's gone off the screen.
- 28 54 Q. CHAIRMAN: Proper explanation, is it?
- 29 A. Yeah, proper explanation, yeah. The last thing that

- 1 came up on the screen.
- 2 55 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 3 A. I think it has comprehensive, is it not comprehensive?
- 4 56 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: No, "any proper explanation".
- 5 A. But on the screen --
- 6 57 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sergeant Monaghan required a comprehensive,

11:17

11:17

11 · 17

- 7 you are right he, wanted full details?
- 8 A. A comprehensive report.
- 9 58 Q. CHAIRMAN: But Superintendent Murray, he said "proper 10 explanation". Okay. And we are exploring that. Okay. 11:16
- 11 59 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: So did you take that, I don't want to 12 put words in your mouth, as Superintendent Murray
- requiring you to explain why you had gone to GSOC?
- 14 A. That's the way it appears, comprehensive report is what
- I received. I don't know, like, I am not sure, it's a
- long time since I read the protected disclosures bill,
- 17 I am not sure if it is even lawful that a person could
- 18 -- that a senior officer would ask for a proper -- for
- comprehensive report, you know, as to a meeting with
- 20 GSOC, when it is very apparent it is something to do
- 21 with protected disclosures.
- 22 60 Q. One factual submission made on your behalf to
- 23 Mr. de Bruir, and I only raise it in that context, is
- that it was asserted that you were prohibited from
- saying more to him, more to Superintendent Murray in
- terms of the matter. Did you consider that you
- couldn't tell him any details about the fact of the
- appointment or that it stopped you going to GSOC and
- looking for a letter to say, look, I did meet you?

1		Α.	Any dealings with me and GSOC is supposed to be	
2			confidential. Just from recollection, that is a fairly	
3			big thing in their	
4	61	Q.	Yes, in terms of any content obviously.	
5		Α.	Yes.	11:18
6	62	Q.	But you, in order to recoup the day that you had taken	
7			for annual leave, I presume did have financial	
8			consequences if you were going to get it back, although	
9			not having been on duty, you had to yourself explain	
10			that you had gone to GSOC. That's the only context in	11:18
11			which I raise the issue. Do you follow that?	
12		Α.	Yes. And again, like, it is not that again I was	
13			looking for annual leave and they might have been down	
14			on manpower or anything like that. It was just to	
15			cancel a day's annual leave. It wasn't a major thing	11:19
16			operational wise on the ground or anything, it didn't	
17			affect anything there.	
18	63	Q.	Yes. But is it your evidence that what Superintendent	
19			Murray did in the circumstances was targeting you	
20			because of your original protected disclosure?	11:19
21		Α.	I am just trying to just one moment, targeting	
22			discrediting, I am trying to get which category it	
23			falls under.	
24	64	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Victimising.	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:19
26	65	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Either, or whatever?	
27		Α.	Yes, the sergeant approves the thing. As I said, it's	

2829

not a major deal because it's just to cancel a day's

annual leave. The sergeant approves it and then

1			Superintendent Murray doesn't approve it and he's	
2			looking for explanations.	
3	66	Q.	Okay. You are saying it's targeting for that reason,	
4			is that right?	
5		Α.	I think so.	11:20
6	67	Q.	Did you feel that way at the time?	
7		Α.	Oh yeah. Well I wouldn't put it in my stuff if I	
8			didn't feel it was proper.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Okay, very good.	
10			MR. McGUINNESS: I am going to pass on from that.	11:20
11	68	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Nothing else you want to	
12			say about that?	
13		Α.	No.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
15	69	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: The next issue, Garda Keogh, is issue	11:21
16			number 11, which complains that you were confined to	
17			indoor duty.	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	70	Q.	On 22nd October 2015.	
20		Α.	Yes.	11:21
21	71	Q.	I am sure you recall that indeed. You say in your	
22			statement, page 135, perhaps we might look at that:	
23				
24			"During this period"	
25				11:21
26			It's there on the screen.	
27				
28			"I was reduced to indoor duty and confined to desk	
29			bound duties in the public office, carrying out,	

therefore, the most stressful job in the station, in circumstances where it was known to management I was suffering from work related stress. Thus, on 22nd October 2015, Superintendent Pat Murray simply, with immediate effect, reduced me to indoor duties. There was no analysis or right of representation. He said that he will review the matter again on 1st November 2015. He never did."

11:21

11 . 22

9

10

11

12

13

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

Now, I think you elaborated on that in your statement to the investigators. Perhaps we should look at that, page 68 and 69 of your interview. You say there, in answer there, commencing on line 976:

1415

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

It was up in the superintendent's office. 11:22 Sergeant Monaghan said to me on the 22/10/2015 that Superintendent Murray was looking to speak with me. There was nobody else present. Superintendent Murray said he was putting me on as permanent on the public office and he appeared to be using my sick record as a 11:22 At that time they (Garda management) were initially recording me out sick with the flu, while in fact I was out on intermittent work related stress. is my belief that they put me into the most stressful position within the Garda station, which is the public 11 · 23 office. I suspect the real reason I was put on indoor duties at that time was it was just after Garda A had been suspended and he was the subject of my complaint in October 2015. It was a message for everyone in the

1			station (a circular was issued to every sergeant in the	
2			district by Superintendent Murphy)"	
3				
4			And you refer to the page.	
5				11:23
6			"so that every other guard could see they were	
7			making an example of me. Everyone in the station that	
8			I was desk bound and I believe that was a message for	
9			everyone. That's my belief."	
10				11:23
11		Α.	That is my belief.	
12	72	Q.	You were then asked whether the issue of work related	
13			stress was raised or discussed at that meeting on the	
14			22nd. At line 997 you say:	
15				11:24
16			"A. No, there was no mention of me suffering work	
17			related stress at this meeting but it would have been	
18			dealt with at a previous meeting. At a previous	
19			meeting Superintendent Murray said to me, you're under	
20			no stress, as referred to in my statement."	11:24
21				
22			You were asked then, going to page 70, whether you were	
23			informed of the reasons, etcetera and you answer at	
24			line 1004:	
25				11:24
26			"No. He never gave me specific reasons.	
27			Superintendent Murray mentioned it was in relation to	
28			my sick record but he did not give me any specific	
29			reason for putting me on indoor duties. He said he was	

1			going to have a case conference in relation to my sick	
2			record also. My view is that the real reason for me	
3			being put on indoor duties, if you look at the timing,	
4			was because Garda A had been suspended. That is why I	
5			was put on indoor duties in my view. It was a message	11:24
6			or other guards in the station as well. That's my	
7			belief."	
8				
9			Is there anything else you want to add to that yourself	
10			at this point?	11:25
11		Α.	Yes, one thing, it caught my eye yesterday. It fits	
12			into this. You see, this is shortly after Garda A is	
13			suspended. Now, I had been working along pretty much,	
14			not constantly but pretty much on the same shift as	
15			Garda A for 18 months at this stage, which is very	11:25
16			difficult. That's putting it mildly. So Garda A is	
17			suspended. But if you can just something that	
18			caught my eye on page 220, which is related to this, if	
19			it could be I can just point it out.	
20	73	Q.	Yes.	11:25
21		Α.	Page 2220.	
22	74	Q.	Middle paragraph.	
23				
24			"Brought up his whistleblower"	
25				11:26
26			This is to do with oh this is to do with the phone	
27			call	
28	75	Q.	Yes.	
29		Α.	The phone call we referred to yesterday.	

1	76	Q.	Yes.	
2		Α.	It's the only phone call between myself and	
3			Superintendent Murray.	
4				
5			"Brought up his whistleblower case and says he's	11:26
6			worried about Garda A and (blank), that they will get	
7			him. Has no answer when challenged."	
8				
9			Just on that part there, the Garda A and (blank)	
10			informed Superintendent Murray	11:26
11	77	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	When I am put as permanent PO, Garda A is just gone.	
13			Like, as I said, I'm working 18 months like there in	
14			the station, with him, with Garda A. But	
15			Superintendent Murray, around the same time he puts me	11:27
16			as permanent PO, he puts the garda that's marked blank	
17			onto the same shift as me. There's five units on the	
18			station, as we already confirmed, A, B, C and D. I'm	

attached to unit C at the time. And puts that other

quard, he didn't put him on A, B, D or E, he puts him

on unit C, on the same unit as I have already pointed

out, you know, I have clearly pointed out what I have

said in relation to that paragraph. So Superintendent

11:27

11 · 28

Murray was fully aware that the guard that is in that
part blank, that I have concerns about that guard.
Superintendent Murray puts him on to my unit. Garda A
is gone at this stage, so he puts that guard on to my
unit. Then, of course, I am permanent PO, like public
officer. I twigged that yesterday when it popped up on

19

20

21

22

23

1			the screen. Actually I had forgotten all about it,	
2			because there's a lot of stuff in all this.	
3	78	Q.	But you never complained about that before obviously?	
4		Α.	Correct, yeah.	
5	79	Q.	And as I understand it	11:28
6		Α.	I know.	
7	80	Q.	any guard on the unit would be out, whereas under	
8			this new direction, you were going to be in the public	
9			office rather than out on a unit, is that not right?	
10		Α.	Yeah. But every guard that is coming on duty at some	11:28
11			point is going in and out of the public office. I mean	
12			it's where you sign on and sign off.	
13	81	Q.	Yes. But one aspect of the direction that you are	
14			complaining about is that you were being put on duty	
15			here while you were suffering from work related stress.	11:29
16			But these were days when you were fit for duty. When	
17			you were being certified off, you were being certified	
18			on the basis of work related stress by your doctor.	
19			But you're not suggesting Superintendent Murray was	
20			scheduling you for duty on days that you had been	11:29
21			certified for work related stress?	
22		Α.	I'm sorry? In relation to being a permanent public	
23			officer?	
24	82	Q.	Yes. The way you put it in your statement was that it	
25			was the most stressful job in the station?	11:29
26		Α.	Yes.	

you were suffering from work related stress?

27

28

29

83 Q.

Α.

Yes.

In circumstances where it was known to management that

- 1 84 Q. But the certification for work related stress related 2 to days that you were out sick from duty, isn't that 3 right?
- A. Yes. But I am under constant work related stress for

 -- this is, what -- for the last -- I mean, since -- I

 mean, even prior to making a protected disclosure I

 made back in 2014, which is not part of this module,

 but I am under constant serious work related stress all

 through, all throughout this.
- We will obviously come to what happened in relation to 10 85 Q. 11 the suspension of Garda A in terms of the management of 12 I alluded to it yesterday. Superintendent Murray 13 had received a report from a quard relating to 14 suspicions which seemed to, on their face, increase the 15 level of concern in relation to perhaps whether Garda A 11:31 16 should be on duty. They were acted upon and he was suspended on the 15th, including on the basis of a 17 18 report from Superintendent Murray, isn't that right?
- 19 A. That's correct. Just to clarify one point, and I don't want to sound cheeky on this.

- 21 86 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. But I just want to get a point across.
- 23 87 Q. Yes.
- A. In one of the documents behind me, it refers to Garda A
 suspended in that, but I don't recall reading any
 document there that says what specifically Garda A was
 suspended for. I have said on the first day giving
 evidence that I do believe there is a report that
 should be in there.

- 1 88 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. Garda A is suspended but nobody knows what Garda A is

11:32

11:32

11:32

- 3 suspended for. I don't think it's is in anything
- 4 there.
- 5 89 Q. I think you are actually wrong about that.
- 6 A. Okay
- 7 90 Q. We will come to that in due course. In the previous
- 8 year, had you been approached for a consent to the
- 9 disclosure of your protected disclosures, for local
- 10 management, so they could discuss the issue of
- suspension back in 2014? Do you remember being
- 12 approached to consent to a disclosure statement?
- 13 A. Oh yes, by detective superintendent Mulcahy.
- 14 91 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. To the head of HR, who was Assistant Commissioner
- 16 Fanning at the time, I think.
- 17 92 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 93 Q. In the summer of 2014?
- 20 A. That would be right.
- 21 94 Q. I think you refused to consent?
- 22 A. Yes. Just to clarify.
- 23 95 Q. Yes.
- A. When I made my protected disclosure originally, I knew
- 25 nothing about -- I didn't know, I suppose, really
- anything about senior management. I might have known
- 27 the name of my own chief, super, own chief. I would
- say that's all through my career, I wouldn't have even
- known the names of assistant commissioners or anything

- like that. I didn't know, it was just that this was to
 go to HR, I didn't know who Assistant Commissioner
 Fanning or anything like that was. I knew nothing
 about them. Because I knew nothing about them, I
 obviously would be mistrustful of Garda management. I
 didn't want the statement to go to HR. In hindsight,
 of course, you know, what I am later to know as things
- of course, you know, what I am later to know as things
 go on, of course I made a huge mistake there. But at
 the time, what you have said is correct, yes.
- 10 96 Q. Yes. You may not have known it, but there was, in fact, a sort of conference of all the stakeholders at that time to address the issue as to whether a suspension was either justified or appropriate at that point in time?
- 15 Now just to clarify, I recall Detective Α. 11:33 16 Superintendent Mulcahy saying to me, will you consent to give your statement to HR, and I wouldn't. 17 18 don't recall him saying the issue of suspension hinges I don't remember that. I don't think that 19 was explained properly to me, that. Perhaps he thought 11:34 20 I knew that it has to -- the suspension -- I didn't 21 22 know that the suspension hinged on the statement going 23 I didn't know again at the time. I was less 24 knowledgeable than I would be now.

- 25 97 Q. Okay.
- 26 A. Yeah.
- 27 98 Q. We will come back to it in a different context, but you had, in fact, been agitating, and I use that is a neutral way, because it was something you wanted to

1	have	achieved,	the	suspension	of	Garda	Α	at	that	point
2	in t	ime?								

- 3 I think that's wrong, I had achieved is not fair Α. 4 wording.
- 5 99 Well, consideration. You wanted more active Q. 11:35 6 consideration to be given to it at that earlier point in time? 7
- 8 Yes. In relation to the suspension, you see, there's a Α. huge issue in that when statements were taken, Garda A 9 was present, you know, in the station while the 10 11:35 11 investigation team were taking the statements, you 12 He was able to see every guard that was making 13 statements, it was insane. I had given enough evidence 14 back in 2014, where there was enough evidence to make a suspension and a start. As I said, I didn't realise it 11:35 15 16 hinged on my statement going to HR. I didn't know 17 that.
- 18 Okay. Well, I am just coming round to ask you about 100 Q. your assertion here that we have looked at, that, in 19 20 fact, you were put in a more stressful and the most stressful job in the station, where in the 21 22 circumstances Garda A was now off the pitch, if I can 23 use that colloquialism. Would that not have, in fact, 24 tended to perhaps alleviate the ongoing concerns that 25 you have recorded in your diary and were talking about? 11:36

26 That's what I thought. When I got the word that Garda Α. 27 A had been suspended, I thought, right, they'll back off from me now and things will get better and, you 28 29 know, they'll just leave me alone now. But, of course,

1			that's not what happens. I then get station bound into	
2			the public office. I got station bound into the public	
3			office. As I said, then there is Garda A's friend,	
4			let's say, is moved on to my unit. So it's a double	
5			whammy.	11:37
6	101	Q.	He was always on duty as well, in Athlone too, that	
7			other guard?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	102	Q.	You had never raised any concern about him either?	
10		Α.	I am only after reading now where I had raised concern.	11:37
11			That's why I referred to page 2220, which I spotted	
12			yesterday.	
13	103	Q.	But I have to obviously draw to your attention	
14			Superintendent Murray's account of the meeting he had	
15			on the 22nd October with you. It's at page 2046 of our	11:37
16			papers. It's the bottom half of that page. You see	
17			the reference to PM39 and then it starts:	
18				
19			"I met Garda Keogh again in my office in relation to	
20			this matter on the 22nd October 2015 to serve a form	11:37
21			IA14 on him at the request of chief superintendent,	
22			Westmeath. I noticed that Garda Keogh had deteriorated	
23			in that he didn't seem well to me."	
24				
25			Do you agree with that?	11:38
26		Α.	You see, I can't agree with Superintendent Murray's	
27			notes, in that some parts are true, some parts are half	
28			truth and other parts are false.	
29	104	Q.	We will go through this and then we will look at his	

2			yourself?	
3		Α.	Oh in general, I was under serious stress. I mean,	
4		۸.	again, I was just we're in October now, Garda A is	
5			suspended, you know, there are people in the station as	44.00
6			well that think I made everything up, you know, it is a	11:30
7			difficult time.	
8	105	Q.	No, I understand that. I understand that. But he	
9	103	Q.	said:	
10			saiu.	
11			"I asked him about his health and his drinking and he	11:38
12			wouldn't answer."	
13			wouldn't answer.	
14			Is that right?	
15		Α.	That would be correct.	11.20
16	106	Q.	Okay.	11:39
17	100	Q.	okay.	
18			"I noticed his hand shaking a lot, to the degree that	
19			he could barely sign his name while acknowledging	
20			receipt of form A114."	11:39
21			receipt of Torm Alla.	11.39
22		Α.	That's very interesting, because nobody else makes	
23		,	that people, let's say, I'm regularly working with	
24			or whatever don't make that allegation. What's	
25			interesting is, like, why would you put the person who	11:39
26			has the shakiest hands in the station at the public	11.00
27			counter, that's signing all the passports and	
28			everything else for the public. Like it makes no	
29			common sense to do that.	

1			CHAIRMAN: well, he might be hoping that you wouldn't	
2			be, that the person's hands wouldn't be shaking. He	
3			might be hoping that the reasons why they were shaking	
4			would have been removed.	
5		Α.	You see, as I said	11:39
6	107	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you what I mean?	
7		Α.	I can't say my hands	
8	108	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I don't know whether that's right or wrong?	
9		Α.	As I said, if anyone else said if certain other	
10			persons said that, I would probably have said, fair	11:40
11			enough or that. But with Superintendent Murray,	
12			there's so much, let's say, stuff that I cannot agree	
13			with in his notes, that I just have difficulty with	
14			that.	
15	109	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	11:40
16		Α.	Then, as I said, to put that person in pull public view	
17			and everything, if this is the case, why would you do	
18			that?	
19	110	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: well, he says:	
20				11:40
21			"I discussed with him his frequent sickness absence and	
22			his impact on his ability to follow up on work related	
23			matters."	
24				
25			Did he do that?	11:40
26		Α.	Sorry, just	
27	111	Q.	It's after the reference to the form A114?	
28		Α.	I will just glance at my own notes. It's very short.	
29	112	Q.	Yes.	

Yes, he spoke to me about sick leave, yeah. 2 113 Q. 3 "I explained that I had discussed the lack of progress and some matters involving Garda Keogh with Sergeant 4 5 Monaghan while going through his incident list at a PAF 11:41 6 meeting with Sergeant Monaghan on 19th October 2015. 7 Garda Keogh didn't seem with it to me and I asked him 8 if he felt fit enough to be in work." 9 Do you recall that? 10 11:41 11 Α. I don't recall that. 12 114 Ο. 13 "He said he did." 14 15 I can tell you for a fact that "he said he did", I not Α. 16 alone have a note of it -- oh sorry, sorry. Excuse me, 17 sorry. I am not sure just about that but I do recall 18 in that meeting, I didn't even look at Superintendent 19 So I don't know even -- I remember just 20 looking out the window while he was talking away, he 11:41 obviously has his own notes and a version of the 21 22 conversation. I wasn't very chatty to him. 23 Yes. On this point, did you say that you were fit to 115 Q. 24 do the job? 25 I just can't recall on that. Α. 11:41 Just in terms of what you are describing about your 26 116 0. 27 demeanour in the meeting, were you sort of not bothering to pay attention to what he was saying? 28

1

29

Α.

Α.

Oh no, it's not that I wasn't bothered. Like, I had

Т			stated fully Superintendent Murray's agenda. So, I	
2			mean, to put it mildly, he's not in my circle of trust.	
3	117	Q.	Okay.	
4				
5			"As a result of what I saw, I explained to him that I	11:42
6			would have to assign him to indoor duty. I discussed	
7			that with him, explaining the reasons why and referring	
8			to our conversation of the 30th August, where we had	
9			discussed the possibility of this happening."	
10				11:42
11			We looked at that note, I think, yesterday. Did he	
12			make reference to that?	
13		Α.	Sorry, where is that?	
14	118	Q.	It's five lines up from the bottom there.	
15		Α.	He did, he said he was assigning me, putting me on	11:42
16			indoor duty. He said that. "Explained the reasons", I	
17			am not sure about that. "Possibility of this	
18			happening", that part I think is true. Oh:	
19				
20			"He appeared to me to agree with the course of	11:43
21			action"	
22				
23			I don't know how he could have just:	
24				
25			"He appeared to me to agree with the course of action I	11:43
26			was taking".	
27				
28			Like I would have been just looking out the window.	
29	119	Q.	well, he's not purporting to say that you said, yes,	

- that's fine, but he's saying you seemed to be taking
- it. I mean, did you raise any issue with it, from your

11:44

11:44

- 3 side?
- 4 A. From my recollection again, I don't think I spoke
- 5 really at all at that meeting. I think I just sat
- 6 down, looked out the window and that was it.
- 7 120 Q. You neither expressly agreed or disagreed?
- 8 A. Yes.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- 9 121 Q. Okay. So that might have conveyed to him that you were going along with it, as it were?
- 11 A. I suppose anyone could interpret it in any different way.
- 13 122 Q. All right. It's just in your complaint, you seem to be
 14 sort of implying that you should have been given a
 15 hearing or charges or some right of representation in
 16 relation to the matter. I mean, you're not suggesting
 17 that he should have indulged in any greater degree of

formality of procedure, or are you?

A. Oh, my view is that he put me, as I said, in the public office, it is the most stressful job in the station, there's no question, you're answering the phones,, you're dealing with the prisoners and dealing with all the members of the public that are coming in. It is by far the most stressful job in the station, and equally, for me, after all we have gone through yesterday, it's the place where you're most likely to get landed with complaints and things like that from members of the public. At that stage, of course, any interactions I am having with the public or investigations or anything

1			that's reported to me is scrutinised to such a level	
2			that, you know, I know my career is pretty much	
3			finished once I am put PO, because essentially I am	
4			trapped there. You know, I'm a sitting duck in that	
5			position, because there's going to be people coming in	11:45
6			reporting stuff to me and, you know, I am going to be	
7			under intense scrutiny of anything that's reported to	
8			me. So that's I think, we at the end of October.	
9			There's November. So yeah, I am on the way, let's say,	
10			I think I have two months left in my career.	11:46
11	123	Q.	Well, that's as it turned out, of course, you went	
12			permanently?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	124	Q.	On work related stress.	
15		Α.	Yes.	11:46
16	125	Q.	We will come to that in the next issue. His note at	
17			page 2256 effectively reflects what I put in the	
18			paragraph there to you, except the last three lines	
19			aren't included. He has you recorded there as saying	
20			okay.	11:46
21				
22			"He said okay."	
23				
24			Do you see the third last line? You don't recollect	
25			saying okay?	11:46
26		Α.	I don't, but I may have said okay. I may have said	
27			that. I just can't dispute whether I said okay or not.	
28	126	Q.	He has this in the note, it's not in the later	
29			statement. Nothing probably turns on that:	

1	ı
_	_

"I asked him if suspension of Garda A would allow him come to work more, as he used Garda A's presence up to now as an excuse for going sick. He made no answer."

5

11:47

- Was there any discussion about that, what had happened the week before?
- A. I just don't recall that. But again, I can't dispute it. I just can't recall that part.
- 10 127 Q. Okay. The document that he presented to you for
 11 signature is at page 2259, perhaps we might just look
 12 at that. Your signature appears to be down there at
 13 the bottom of the page.
- 14 A. That's my normal signature. There's nothing wrong with
 15 that. That is my normal signature, so I don't see 11:47
 16 anything wrong with that.
- 17 128 Q. His report up to the chief super is at page 2260, which sort of briefly describes what he says happened there.

 19 Then the instruction that he gave is at 2261, this is in your own set of papers as well.
- A. Just on the signature, if you wish to compare it with any other signature, I have no objection to that. That signature is perfectly fine.
- 24 129 Q. I am not going to turn myself into a witness or offer a
 view one way or another?
- 26 A. Right, sorry.
- 27 130 Q. We don't want to start down that course.
- 28 131 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, but you say that if it was as bad as is recorded, there should be some obvious differences.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 132 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's what you say.
- 3 A. Yes. I don't see any --
- 4 133 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, it's not a question of a handwriting

11 · 49

11:49

- 5 expert, but you say it should be obvious?
- 6 A. He definitely didn't say anything to me, like, oh your
- 7 hand's shaking or anything like that. I know he didn't
- 8 say that but I read it in other stuff.
- 9 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 10 134 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: You're saying it wasn't reviewed, to
- 11 your knowledge anyway, there was sort of a note there
- that it would be reviewed by the 1st November?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 135 Q. You weren't aware of any review?
- 15 A. I wasn't aware, but I have since read in documents that 11:49
- there was a review. I certainly want informed, from my
- 17 recollection, about being reviewed.
- 18 136 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. Sorry, I'm aware he said it will be reviewed, just for
- 20 clarification, but I wasn't aware of anything after
- that, whether the matter was reviewed or not.
- 22 137 Q. Yes. That issue then, you consider that targeting
- obviously, is that right?
- A. Yes, yes.
- 25 138 Q. On what basis did you consider it targeting?
- A. Because for me, Garda A is suspended and it appears
- 27 that Garda management are now going to -- as I stated,
- I thought, great, they'll be off my back now, I'll be
- able to go in and they'll just leave me alone and I

Τ			will be able to get back, you know, working and	
2			whatever and things might get better. But when Garda A	
3			is suspended, they don't do that. In fact, it's like	
4			as if the way I perceived it is, we are not going to	
5			allow this so-called whistleblower to be winning, is	11:50
6			the way I think they viewed it. That they were not	
7			going to allow this guy to be seen as he is winning.	
8			Therefore, we are in charge and we're going to show	
9			we're in charge, you know, and therefore we're putting	
10			this guy in the public office. It's circulated to	11:51
11			everybody else around the place that the whistleblower	
12			is going in to the public office. I think that's	
13			now I may have that wrong but that's my belief.	
14	139	Q.	Okay. I mean in the ordinary events, if people are	
15			changing units, you expect to see a circular saying	11:51
16			that Garda X is now being assigned to this, and	
17			everybody be made aware of it?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	140	Q.	There's nothing in the circular itself. It's the	
20			decision that you're complaining about. I don't know	11:51
21			if you noticed it in Inspector Minnock's, as he was at	
22			the time. He said that:	
23				
24			"Pat Murray was trying to ensure high standards which	
25			gave confidence to public in policing and that the	11:51
26			rationale for this decision appeared unrelated to other	
27			matters."	
28				

29

A. I don't agree with that. Again, I could be wrong but

1 in relation to what was circulated about me going on to 2 indoor duties, that just refers to me. I think around 3 that time other members were moved units. Thev mav have been on another sheet of paper. It was very clear 4 5 what was circulated about me was me alone, what is 11:52 circulated on indoor duties. 6 7 141 It would appear that Inspector Minnock, in the papers Ο. 8 that were sent to Mr. de Bruir, said that he thought this was done in your best interest, to confine you to 9 indoor duties. You don't agree with that point? 10 11:52 11 I absolutely would reject that. Absolutely. Α. 12 CHAI RMAN: Can I clarify something? 142 Ο. 13 Yes. Α. 14 143 Q. CHAI RMAN: As I understand your point, your point, as I 15 understand it, is: If I was in the condition that 11:52 16 Superintendent Murray was talking about, then it was 17 inappropriate, trying to use as neutral a word as 18 possible, to put such a person as the station officer? 19 Yes. Α. Because it's visible, highly visible, people 11:53 20 144 CHAI RMAN: Q. coming in and out, there's a lot of things about -- we 21 22 would things about arrests and everything else and so 23 on, presumably. 24 Of course. Α. 25 Would you have to do those things? 145 0. CHAI RMAN: 11:53 Custody records, I would have been the one dealing with 26 Α.

27

28

29

all the custody records. I mean, even for the purpose

of evidence in court, where custody records are written

and all the rest, why would you put the person that --

- 1 146 Q. CHAIRMAN: Somebody being arrested would have to go to 2 the -- are you the officer in charge in the station, is
- 3 that the position?
- A. I would have been over prisoners that would have come in, in that period.

11:54

11:54

- 6 147 Q. CHAIRMAN: An arresting guard would have to have you endorse the decision to keep the person in custody, is
- 8 that right?
- 9 A. And detention, Section 4 detentions and all that.
- 10 148 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's what I am thinking of?
- 11 A. There would be a lot of legal stuff there. And again,
- 12 like, I mean, if I was in that condition --
- 13 149 Q. CHAIRMAN: Just let me follow for a second. You are
- saying, if I was in that condition, if a person was in
- that condition, it would not be a sensible thing to put 11:54
- such a person in that position?
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 150 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 151 Q. CHAIRMAN: You're not saying that that position is
- 21 necessarily a kind of punishment job? I mean, there
- 22 must be somebody on duty in the station. Your point
- is, if you were in the condition as reported, is that
- 24 right?
- 25 A. Yes. Yes. But on the other bit, the first matter you
- brought up, usually the way it is done is, let's say
- there's eight on the unit, someone would usually be
- landed with the public office. You might have two more
- in patrol cars.

- 1 152 Q. CHAIRMAN: It wouldn't be the most enviable job?
- 2 A. Correct. The next day they would put somebody else
- into the public office and it would rotate again. But
- 4 I am put on permanent.
- 5 153 Q. CHAIRMAN: It's regarded as a difficult job?
- 6 A. Oh, it's by far the most difficult. By far. In every

11:55

11:55

11:56

- 7 station in the country.
- 8 154 Q. CHAIRMAN: You also say stressful and so on?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 CHAIRMAN: So there's two points. Okay, I have that.
- 11 Thank you. Do you want to ask anything arising out of
- that, Mr. McGuinness?
- 13 155 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: Just a couple of matters. Sergeant
- 14 Haran in his statement said he wasn't consulted in
- relation to the decision. I am not sure whether
- 16 (Inaudible) or not. Sergeant Sergeant Monaghan said
- 17 that the general minute was circulated there and he
- detailed you for duty in the public office. That yo
- 19 took annual leave on the 9th November. But he said you
- 20 didn't raise any query in relation to this direction
- 21 with him.
- 22 A. Sorry?
- 23 156 Q. Sergeant Monaghan.
- 24 A. Yeah. I mean, what do I raise? It's common sense
- 25 what's going on. There's nothing to raise. We have
- heard, what we have gone through yesterday, all the
- 27 paperwork would have been coming down through Sergeant
- Monaghan or Sergeant Haran. There's no point in me
- raising an issue, it's something that's so common

- 1 sense.
- 2 157 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. I mean in what's going on in general there, yeah.
- 4 158 Q. Well, Sergeant Haran has said that, you know, he was
- 5 aware that you were unhappy with it and that he offered 11:56
- 6 support and encouragement. He said you struggled to be
- 7 on time for early shifts and talked about going on
- 8 long-term leave. He tried to discourage you from doing

11:57

11:57

- 9 that. But you thought this was a ploy at that stage,
- is that right, the confinement?
- 11 A. Yeah, yeah. As I previously said, once they had me in
- there, pretty much had me trapped in a place where I
- know I'm going to get nailed inevitably on something.
- I know that. That's inevitable. Yeah.
- 15 159 Q. But in your own mind then, your belief, you relate it
- to the protected disclosure. You think that's why it
- 17 happened, is that right?
- 18 A. Oh sure it's all linked, like, the whole thing is all
- 19 linked.
- 20 160 Q. Why do you say it's linked, just to be clear. Could
- 21 you just, as it were, encapsulate why you say it's
- 22 linked and it's targeting and discrediting?
- 23 A. The whole chain of everything that we've gone through
- so far, it's all linked. I never had any of this prior
- to making the protected disclosure. Nothing on --
- pretty much anything we have gone through or discussed,
- I had nothing. Once a year, perhaps, a sergeant might
- pull me in and say, listen, there's something to do
- with a file, or there's something not right or

			whatever, roughly. I mean roughly once a year. This	
2			is just what happens here, I just can't think of a	
3			word for it. It just avalanches after 2014, and, of	
4			course, into '15 and that, yeah.	
5	161	Q.	Okay. There's nothing more I want to ask you about	11:58
6			this issue. Chairman, do you want to take a break?	
7			CHAIRMAN: Yes. I think that's probably a good idea.	
8			I know we started a little bit later but I think we	
9			will stick with our original. That's all very well,	
10			but Garda Keogh has been sitting here, either waiting	11:59
11			to give evidence or giving his evidence or consulting	
12			or whatever it was. We will take a break. Just give	
13			me two minutes, two seconds. Okay. Thank you very	
14			much. We will take a break and then we will move on to	
15			the next issue. Thank you very much.	11:59
16				
17			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS	
18			FOLLOWS:	
19				
20	162	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Garda Keogh, this complaint is	12:18
21			encapsulated in issue number 12, which is complaints in	
22			relation to the misrecording of your sick leave and the	
23			reduction in salary. You make a point, which is	
24			obviously well made in the context of your early	
25			history of absences, that you had in fact very little,	12:18
26			in fact no absences for a very considerable period of	
27			your career through illness?	
28		Α.	I think 11 and a half years as a straight run, let's	
29			say, as a civil servant of the state, without taking a	

1			single sick day.	
2	163	Q.	Perhaps if we just look at Volume 38, page 10725. You	
3			have probably seen these, they're manual records in the	
4			paper disclosure?	
5		Α.	Yeah.	12:19
6	164	Q.	If we go down to the bottom there, it should start at	
7			10725. At the top there, that's year ending March '01,	
8			nil; year ending March '02; nil, the same for '03, '04.	
9			Then if we go up to the previous page, 10724, going	
10			down the page: '05 nil; '06 nil; '07 nil; Athlone three	12:20
11			years there, '08, '0 9, '10, nil, nil, nil. Then if we	
12			go up to the preceding page, 10723?	
13		Α.	Well, the year 2000 is missing, that was nil as well.	
14	165	Q.	well, the first one runs from 2000 up to 2001?	
15		Α.	Sorry.	12:21
16	166	Q.	Then the first sick day is 5th October 2011. There	
17			were then eight six days between then and the end of	
18			the year. Then if we go to what is in reality a	
19			departure from the system of manual record keeping, to	
20			page 10721, where it picks it up from the tail end of	12:21
21			2011. If we go to the bottom of the page. We may have	
22			to magnify that slightly, to make it easier to read on	
23			the screen. But it shows six lines up then is	
24			the it goes into 2012 with sick days out, which	
25			finish on the sixth line up from the bottom, an	12:22
26			extended period there of 51 days, isn't that right?	
27		Α.	That's, yeah.	
28	167	Q.	Nothing to do with the protected disclosures or stress,	

is that right?

29

- 1 well, you see, I don't think I even tell my doctor Α. 2 what's going on at the time.
- 3 168 It's probably drink related, is it, to cover it in that Q. 4 broad category?
- 5 Yes. Yeah, it would be. But, equally, I don't know Α. 12:22 6 exactly when I even tell my doctor what's going on. 7 Because I break confidence in 2011 with a solicitor for 8 the first time about just stuff that's going on, that's very mad, in Athlone. Yeah.
- In any event, we're not directly concerned with that. 10 169 Q. 12:23 11 Going up the year then in 2012, there's another substantial chunk there of missing days obviously? 12
- 13 Yes. Α.

9

14 170 Q. we don't need to go into that. Then there's a lot of 15 single days. Sort of halfway up the page we get to the 12:23 16 end of December 2013, do you see that, in the middle of the page there? The cursor is on the right-hand side 17 of the page, indicating where it is. 18

12:24

12.24

- 19 Yeah. Α.
- Now, in fact, all of these are in the category 20 171 Q. "illness". They're all classified as "flu viral". We 21 22 will hear more from the relevant witnesses about the 23 system and what options are open on the system. 24 just going into 2014 then, we see it's "flu viral" 25 I am going to switch pages and come back to 26 this one in a moment, but if we go to the same volume, 27 at 10649, we will see a summary from your doctor which related to a specific period, really going into August 28 and into July 2015. If we scroll down a little bit. 29

1 There's three sick certs there, two viral there, in 2 August and September, and then in December '14, that's 3 the first work related stress one. I think every cert that you produce from your doctor, Dr. Bartlett, he has 4 5 been dealing with you for quite a long time, you 12:25 obviously have great confidence in him. 6 7 Yes. Α. 8 172 From there to date and continuing, it's all work 0. 9 related stress. There is no argument about that, we don't need to look at them at all. But just back then 10 12:25 11 to the page we had been on, 10721, and putting the 12 finger on the same end of year, that is the year 13, 13 the categorisation of it under the system, doesn't 14 I mean, the viral gastroenteritis, it makes no 15 difference to the categorisation, it would seem, at the 12:26 16 The witnesses will presumably bear that out. 17 And the fact that work related stress certificates come 18 in, they are not resulting in any change in the system. 19 Yeah. Α. 20 12:26

They're both categorised then as an ordinary illness. 173 Q. 21 Just keeping my finger, so I know where I am here, from 22 the beginning of 2014 onwards. If we go up to a date, which is a date in 2015 there, 22/3/2015. I will just 23 24 take that date there because as at the time 25 Superintendent Murray is writing his letter of the 2nd 26 April, following the meeting with you on the 26th March 27 that we have seen. Do you remember that meeting of the 26th March, his first meeting with you? 28

A. Mm-hmm, yes.

29

1	174	Q.	He sends a letter that we have already looked at, in	
2			fact, up to the chief superintendent, noting that at	
3			this point in time you had 48 days of illness since	
4			January, since the beginning of January '14, up until	
5			that period of time. I have added up the days and it	12:28
6			does seem to add up to 48. He said that in total there	
7			were 184 days lost through illness over the past four	
8			years. One can add up all the previous days, going	
9			back four years. He may have underestimated it by five	
10			days, I make it at 141 rather than 136, but whether	12:28
11			it's the lower or the greater of those figures, it	
12			brought you over a crucial tipping point, from 183 days	
13			into 184 days. I think you understand the significance	
14			of that.	
15		Α.	I do now, yeah. I wouldn't have had at the time	12:29
16			because I didn't go sick. But yeah, I understand it	
17			now.	
18	175	Q.	I think you probably will agree, if it's a matter for	
19			argument that's fine, but under the relevant Garda	

finance and sickness day scheme, as it were, once you

tip over 183 days and you are subsequently absent, you

go onto a lower rate of remuneration called TRR?

12:29

12:29

23 A. Yes.

20

21

22

- 24 176 Q. That's the system?
- 25 A. It is, yeah.
- 26 177 Q. You got caught by that system on days that you were absence subsequent to this?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 178 Q. You would accept that?

- 1 A. Oh yeah.
- 2 179 Q. You would accept, therefore, that any pay related
- 3 reductions directly arising from your absences were
- 4 dealt with in terms of a reduction in pay on the basis

12:30

12:30

12:30

- of the regime in place rather than any individual
- 6 decision-making that was punishing you for the
- 7 absences?
- 8 A. Sorry, can you just rephrase that?
- 9 180 Q. Yes, perhaps it's slightly convoluted. I am suggesting
- that from that day onwards, when you were medically
- certified for absence, it had the automatic effect that
- each absence you were being paid on the reduced rate?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 181 Q. As a result of the system rather than anyone deciding
- they're going to reduce your pay. There was no
- individual deciding, now I'm going to get at you by
- 17 reducing your pay because you are out sick. Do you
- take the point?
- 19 A. Your point, I am not sure, is your point that the
- 20 computer is making a mistake?
- 21 182 Q. No.
- 22 A. I am not sure.
- 23 183 Q. It's nothing to do with the category. We will come to
- the category. I am sorry.
- 25 A. Right.
- 26 184 Q. I should have said that. My question is relating to
- 27 the rate of pay?
- 28 A. Yeah.
- 29 185 Q. The amount of pay that you're getting?

- 1 A. Right.
- 2 186 Q. Is determined then by the system.
- 3 A. Oh yeah.
- 4 187 Q. Once you're over?
- 5 A. Yes, yes, correct.
- 6 188 Q. As it were, the rate of pay then isn't decided upon by

12:32

- 7 any individual. I mean Super Murray had nothing to do
- 8 with deciding your rate of pay?
- 9 A. The system, I accept, yes.
- 10 189 Q. All right. Or Chief Superintendent Wheatley, the rate
- of pay?
- 12 A. Just on the rate of pay.
- 13 190 Q. That's all we are talking about at the moment.
- 14 A. Okay.
- 15 191 Q. Just looking at this now, going back up to the top, the 12:31
- category stays the same except for there's another one
- there, do you see that, 2nd June '15. I am not quite
- clear that would have happened, but that's a drop down
- option on the SAMS system. You have probably seen the
- screen shots which includes that as an option. It
- seemed to allow you to specify what the other illness
- 22 was. I don't know if you agree with that?
- 23 A. You see, unfortunately I am not au fait with the SAMS
- 24 system.
- 25 192 Q. Yes.
- A. For me to explain this, I am on...
- 27 193 Q. I am just taking you through this overall picture and
- then I am going to ask you to look at the SAMS
- 29 printouts?

- A. Right.
 194 Q. If you
- 2 194 Q. If you don't mind. It comes up then at this stage to 3 26th December 2015, and then it says:

4

5 "SAMS, mental health."

12:33

12:33

6

- A. Yes.
- 8 195 Q. As I understand it, that reflects a change that was 9 made arising from you learning at a consultation with
- the CMO in December 2015 -- if you just wait for the

11 question?

- 12 A. I couldn't hear you.
- 13 196 Q. I beg your pardon.
- 14 A. Just someone coughed, I missed one word, that's all.
- 15 197 Q. I am suggesting, that seems to represent a change in the way it was recorded as a result of you becoming aware that your illness was being put on the system as
- 18 flu viral, and raising an issue because your
- 19 certificates had work related stress, isn't that right?
- 20 A. It was with the CMO, is when I discovered it.
- 12:33

- 21 198 Q. You discovered it?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 199 Q. As a result, when 2015 turned into 2016, you brought
- that as a concern obviously to your solicitor and the
- Garda authorities, in particular the new protected
- 26 disclosures manager, Chief Superintendent Anthony
- 27 McLoughlin?
- 28 A. Yeah.
- 29 200 Q. You raised that directly with him?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 201 Q. And he said he would look at it?
- 3 A. He did, he did say that to me, yes.
- 4 202 Q. Yes. He was responsible for that change then I think,

12:34

12:35

12:35

- 5 as you understand it?
- 6 A. He kept his word, he did look at it. Yes, he did,
- yeah.
- 8 203 Q. Correct me if I am wrong, you may or may not agree with
- 9 it, but certainly it appeared to be the case that
- correcting it has no effect on your rate of pay, isn't
- 11 that right?
- 12 A. When he corrected it, I then go back onto a basic wage.
- 13 204 Q. CHAIRMAN: It brought you back up?
- 14 A. Yes, it did.
- 15 CHAIRMAN: Isn't that right, Mr. McGuinness, the
- 16 correction brought it back up?
- 17 MR. McGUINNESS: It's sequential.
- 18 CHAIRMAN: Sorry.
- 19 MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.
- 20 CHAIRMAN: That's what I thought.
- 21 205 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: When he corrects it and it gets
- corrected in May as a categorisation, in fact your pay,
- your TRR didn't change, you were on the reduced pay.
- 24 A. I was on the reduced pay.
- 25 206 Q. Isn't that right?
- 26 A. Yes, I don't think it changes until October.
- 27 207 Q. Indeed, that's what I am coming to.
- 28 CHAIRMAN: Sorry.
- 29 208 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: I am hoping we can agree the sequence

1			through. Because it's important. I hope, I don't want	
2			to mislead anyone. The status or classification got	
3			changed on the system from mental health in May and	
4			that didn't change your reduced rate of pay at that	
5			point in time. Your pay changed subsequently in	12:36
6			October, when the issue of your being out on work	
7			related stress, as it affected your pay, melded	
8			together. Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, with whom	
9			you raised the issue, secured a result by enabling you	
10			to be restored to full pay, although there were public	12:36
11			service regulations that came into effect and I am not	
12			going to say anything about whether they were	
13			applicable or how they should have operated, but he	
14			recommended that you be restored to full pay?	
15		Α.	Yeah.	12:37
16	209	Q.	Although your absences were continuing, they were	
17			exceeding the plateau by which ordinarily you would	
18			have been reduced to TRR rate, isn't that right?	
19		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
20	210	Q.	You're not subject then that was then backdated to	12:37
21			this date at the top of the column there?	
22		Α.	That's correct. He did backdate it, yes, he did. In	
23			fairness to him, he said he was going to look at it, he	
24			did. He backdated it. He did, he did everything he	
25			said he would do, yes.	12:37
26	211	Q.	Yes. I think he has made a very long statement, I am	
27			not sure that I need to put any of it.	
28		Α.	My recollection is, I couldn't find anything in his	

statement that I have an issue with.

28

29

- 1 212 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. Just from recollection.
- 3 213 Q. He has put in before the Tribunal, they're all before
- 4 the Tribunal, a large number of appendices which detail
- 5 his interaction with you. As you would expect,
- 6 obviously a very delicate position he's in, in terms of

12:38

12:38

12:38

- 7 managing the process and all the different
- 8 stakeholders?
- 9 A. The first thing I said to him when I met him, I said,
- 10 you might think it's the handiest job, but it's far --
- it's probably the most difficult job in An Garda
- 12 Síochána.
- 13 214 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. Yeah.
- 15 215 Q. He appears to have followed through on -- he made the
- recommendation on your behalf. I am not going to
- 17 express any view as to whether it was a pragmatic one,
- but it was a very practical solution which executive
- 19 hierarchy took on, as it were, and followed through to
- put you back on full pay, backdated to the 26th, which
- is the date you went out fully on work related stress?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 216 Q. I suppose the upshot, I want to suggest to you, is that
- 24 you -- and the rationale appears to be that, in fact,
- it was because you were in this, as it were, new
- category of a protected disclosure and the issue
- appears to have been resulting in a concern, a worry
- 28 that it might be seen as penalisation and that they
- 29 didn't you to feel penalised. And they haven't

- penalised you, I suppose is the upshot of my question;
- that you have been in fact restored to full pay on that

12:40

12:40

- 3 basis?
- 4 A. You see, for me, the pay and that was not my focus
- really, it was my complaint was my focus.
- 6 217 Q. I'm sorry?
- 7 A. The complaint was the thing that would have been
- 8 circulating in my mind. I would have obviously known,
- g just from other, let's say, guards whistleblowers, pay
- is a thing you're going get hit on. So I had actually
- saved up money, I was ready for the reduced pay rate,
- if you know what I mean, I had saved up.
- 13 218 Q. I don't want to enquire into your financial --
- 14 A. Just one other thing as well, in October of 2015,
- another issue is, as I previously reported, a report,
- there was a report in the Sunday Times on 2nd October
- 17 2015, which appeared on the front page, to do with my
- main complaint as well. That probably -- it was in the
- public domain again for a while. But that's not taking
- away from Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, way prior to 12:40
- 21 that, he took to do what he said he would do, he was a
- 22 hundred percent on that.
- 23 219 Q. Yes. The upshot of my last long question, preceded by
- lots of statements, I should have asked a shorter
- 25 question, which is this: Would you agree with me now
- that firstly the misrecording of your illness doesn't
- appear to have been as a result of any decision to
- target you, it was the operation of the system insofar
- as it related to a reduction in pay at the time you had

- reduced pay?

 2 A. I couldn't agree with that.
- 3 220 O. Pardon.
- A. I couldn't -- if I am taking -- if I am understanding
 your question correctly, I couldn't agree with that.

 12:41
 It's as if -- now, I may have mistaken or misunderstood
- your question. It would be as if they didn't know that

 I was going out with work related stress and it was

12 · 42

- 9 just the system kind of and it was a mistake. I
 wouldn't agree with that.
- 11 221 Q. Well, perhaps I confused you as well as maybe myself.
- I thought we had got to maybe a stage where you had
 agreed that the misrecording of it as such didn't
 affect your rate of pay, once you tripped over the 183?
- 15 A. I had gone down at some stage to 220 a week or something like that. Chief Superintendent
- 17 McLoughlin -- I've already said this.
- 18 222 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. I'm sorry.
- 20 223 Q. CHAIRMAN: Here's the point, if I am understanding, and 12:42
 21 I am sorry to interrupt, Mr. McGuinness. If I
 22 understand: At the beginning, now I am not saying I
- agree with this, but here's what I think is the issue, at the beginning it doesn't seem to have mattered
- whether it was flu viral or work related stress for
- your pay. At the beginning, isn't that right?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 224 Q. CHAIRMAN: For whatever reason, whether somebody did it deliberately, accidentally or for benign or malevolent

1			motives, it didn't make any difference to your pay	
2			until you reached the threshold whereby your pay	
3			dropped?	
4		Α.	Yes. There are two categories on the SAMS system for	
5			recording.	12:4
6	225	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
7		Α.	And one is there is a category	
8	226	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Let's keep it simple for a moment?	
9		Α.	Okay.	
10	227	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Before we get to categories, let's keep it	12:4
11			very simple. Up to the point I'm sorry, I just want	
12			to get it absolutely clear. Up to the point where you	
13			met the threshold, it didn't matter, it didn't matter	
14			what it was called. But the question seems to have	
15			been that at a certain point it was considered, this	12:4
16			isn't just ordinary illness, which would get my pay	
17			reduced, this is work related, which, in fairness, may	
18			be in law as well, but anyway, it shouldn't affect my	
19			work because it happened due to work. It's not just	
20			that I was, you know, suffering from something that	12:4
21			unfortunately hit me, if that was the case I would get	
22			reduced but in this case ultimately it seems to have	
23			been recognised. Is that essentially the position?	
24		Α.	Yes. Yes. I think that's I think.	
25	228	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Now, what we are on go and what	12:4
26			Mr. McGuinness is enquiring about, if I understand, is	
27			that at the beginning, whether somebody wrote down flu	
28			viral or whatever else they wrote, didn't actually make	
29			any difference. There came a point when it did make a	

1		difference, but until it got to that point, it didn't	
2		matter what it said?	
3	Α.	I think so, yeah	
4		CHAIRMAN: A sore neck, you know, bad back, whatever it	
5		was, it didn't matter. Am I understanding you	12:45
6		correctly, Mr. McGuinness? Have I got it halfway right	
7		or am I correct so far?	
8		MR. McGUINNESS: well, Chairman, I think the issue is	
9		as follows, which I hope is correct: Once something is	
10		recorded on the ordinary illness category, whether it's	12:45
11		described as anything, it makes no difference at all.	
12		But the only way it becomes an issue for a member is	
13		that once you go over 183 days.	
14		CHAIRMAN: You're reduced.	
15		MR. McGUINNESS: You're reduced. But that doesn't have	12:45
16		a categorisation of	
17		CHAIRMAN: No, it doesn't matter what it's called, sore	
18		neck, bad back, headaches, it doesn't matter.	
19		MR. McGUINNESS: It's based upon the categorisation of	
20		it as an ordinary illness.	12:46
21		CHAIRMAN: Right.	
22		MR. McGUINNESS: The fact that it was being put on the	
23		SAMS system as flu viral under ordinary illness, meant	
24		that once he tripped over the 183 day, the reduction	
25		came in as a result of the system. And the same	12:46
26		reduction	
27		CHAIRMAN: And Garda Keogh, as I understand, agrees.	
28		MR. McGUI NNESS: Pardon?	
29		CHAIRMAN: Garda Keogh agrees that, indeed, it operates	

- automatically on the computer, assuming it is one of those ordinary things.
- MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. And the same reduction applies
 whether if the classification is changed from flu viral
 to work related stress, as long as it's obviously
 entered under the category of ordinary illness. So his
 nay, as I understand it, wasn't changed as a result of

12 · 47

12:47

- pay, as I understand it, wasn't changed as a result of the reclassification in May, but the events that then overtook that.
- 10 CHAIRMAN: Were Chief Superintendent McLoughlin's.
- MR. McGUINNESS: were Chief Superintendent McLoughlin.
- 12 CHAI RMAN: Okav. That's the issue then. We're agreed 229 Q. 13 so up to this point, the automatic we're agreed on. As 14 I understand, and Mr. McGuinness has now very helpfully 15 clarified it, that it didn't matter whether it was work 12:47 16 related stress, if that had been written down all along 17 from the beginning, your pay would still have been
- reduced. That's what he's saying. I don't know
 whether you agree. Now, do you agree with that or not
- agree with it? Obviously that can be explored with
- other witnesses and so on.
- 22 A. In work related stress, under the garda regulations as 23 I understand it, they're supposed to mount an 24 investigation to see if there is work related stress 25 and if tere was, then they class it as injury on duty.
- 26 CHAIRMAN: That's what I thought.
- 27 230 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: I was going to come to that, because 28 you did make a complaint in your statements that that 29 was something that should have been done. I am going

- 1 to come on to that. What I am going to suggest to you
- on this, the categorisation of it in May 2015 as mental
- health, it didn't effect the operation of the system,
- 4 reducing it to TRR, because it was still categorised as

12 · 48

12:49

12:49

- 5 an ordinary illness?
- 6 A. As I did say at the very start, I'm not au fait with
- 7 the SAMS system. So this is something that -- forgive
- 8 me if I am stumbling on that.
- 9 231 Q. Not at all.
- 10 A. Yeah.
- 11 232 Q. We're going to hear, we hope, from the experts in
- 12 charge of the system too.
- 13 233 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do I understand that your essential
- 14 complaint is this: That the authorities put you down
- as flu viral when they should have been putting you
- down as an injury at work?
- 17 A. Work related, yes.
- 18 234 Q. CHAIRMAN: In a sense, I know it's work related stress.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 235 Q. CHAIRMAN: But they should have been saying, it's not
- an ordinary thing that he just got, this is something
- that happened to him at work?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 236 Q. CHAIRMAN: Don't worry about the details for the
- 25 moment, but that's essentially your complaint?
- 26 A. You see, what they should have done is --
- 27 237 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, leave aside what they should have done?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 238 Q. CHAIRMAN: Just to get a clear, I am sorry, but just to

1			get it clear. For the simple person like myself, I	
2			just want to get this clear. They should have alerted	
3			themselves, they should have realised and written down	
4			work related?	
5		Α.	Yes.	12:49
6	239	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. The time when this hit in to you was	
7			when you reached the threshold. It didn't matter up to	
8			a certain point what it was, but at a certain point, if	
9			it had been put down as work related, whatever	
10			processes would have taken place, you wouldn't have	12:49
11			automatically dropped in salary, is that right? You	
12			say they should have done it, they targeted me,	
13			victimised me or prejudiced me by putting down the	
14			wrong thing?	
15		Α.	Yes, yes.	12:50
16	240	Q.	CHAIRMAN: In a word?	
17		Α.	Yes. My thing is they knew it was work related stress	
18			on my sick certs.	
19	241	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes, they put down the wrong thing. They	
20			knowingly, you say, put down the wrong thing with the	12:50
21			result that ultimately, after half a year or whenever	
22			it was, it came to bite you?	
23		Α.	I suppose my point would be, if I can be of help, I	
24			think what you're trying to say, there may have been a	
25			mistake with the computer carrying that would be	12:50
26			acceptable for, let's say, a period of time or that,	
27			but I think this goes on for over a year.	
28	242	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, I hope I haven't muddied the	
29			waters, confused everything. That's my understanding	

- for what it's worth and you may as well know it, my
- 2 understanding is that your complaint is, the
- 3 authorities wrote down a wrong thing?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 243 Q. CHAIRMAN: They did it knowingly.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 244 Q. CHAIRMAN: And it didn't come to hit you until such

12:51

- 8 time as the normal process of the computer realised.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 245 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Had they put down the right thing,
- whatever else might have happened, it wouldn't have
- resulted in that. Is that the essence of it?
- 13 A. Yes. I think I am on the same page.
- 14 246 Q. CHAIRMAN: I think I am understanding that?
- 15 A. Judge, as I said, this is not a (Inaudible) of mine, as 12:51
- in the SAMS system and that. Like, when I meet the
- 17 CMO.
- 18 247 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 19 A. That's where I find out what they're up to. But they
- 20 have already held a case conference to do with me with
- 21 the CMO. But he himself is not aware of work related
- 22 stress. The Garda CMO is not aware of work related
- 23 stress.
- 24 CHAIRMAN: I am understanding that. Okay. Now, I am
- sorry, Mr. McGuinness. Well, I'm not that sorry but I
- 26 may as well explain to you what I'm thinking.
- 27 MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you, Chairman.
- 28 CHAIRMAN: I hope that's helpful, I'm not certain.
- 29 248 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you, Chairman. It's always

1 useful to know. Just going back to that meeting with 2 I mean, the CMO doesn't get the certs and 3 classify you on the basis of certs from your doctor. Ι think you know that. 4 5 I didn't know that. Α. 12:52 6 249 Q. Yes. 7 There were already case conferences in relation to me Α. 8 and my sickness. Somebody forgot to inform the CMO that I was going sick with work related stress. 9 Because I meet him after these cases conference and he 10 12:52 11 seems to have no idea about work related stress 12 whatsoever and they've held case conferences to do with 13 my sick. When I met him, he still seems to be in the 14 dark. He doesn't know anything about work related 15 So they have held case conferences to do with stress. 12:53 16 my sick records and absences and they don't inform the 17 CMO anything about work related stress. 18 We are going to hear from the parties who were at the 250 Q. 19 meeting, but the purpose of the meeting wasn't to 20 review your classification or, as I understand it, to 12:53 look at the issue of how your pay would be dealt with, 21 22 whether it was classified one way or another. will come to that in a due course. 23 24 But one would imagine someone would have to inform the Α. 25 CMO, if they are discussing sick, what's on the sick 12:53 26 certs he's going sick with. 27 251 Q. what I wanted to ask you to look at is these screen

28

29

shots of the SAMS system, the sickness absent

management system. They're at Volume 42, page 11789 to

Т		11/94. If we start at the first one. My understanding	
2		is that these are in sequence and what you see is	
3		options when you click on the ordinary illness	
4		categories. So the screen comes up, you are being	
5		asked to categorise it and you can choose these	12:54
6		options, four different options. Then, if you choose	
7		the ordinary illness category, which is the one	
8		selected in the box there on the top, it gives you four	
9		options, if you turn the page then, if we go on to the	
10		next page?	12:55
11	Α.	Just, I see there is another category there, just if	
12		you go back up, you will see, if you go onto the	
13		ordinary illness, you see at the top, if one is to	
14		click on the occupation injury, what categories	
15		CHAIRMAN: No, follow him for the moment.	12:55
16		Mr. McGuinness says, assume, he has highlighted one	
17		we will do it slowly. He has highlighted one, now here	
18		are the options under ordinary injury. He is not	
19		forgetting the other point.	
20		MR. McGUINNESS: This is presented to us on a	12:55
21		step-by-step basis, what happens when you choose each	
22		or other of them.	
23		CHAIRMAN: This is ordinary illness category now.	
24		MR. McGUINNESS: When you select the ordinary illness	
25		category, you go onto the next page and it gives you a	12:55
26		sub drop down list and there's flu/viral, mental	
27		health, musculoskeletal, not provided, other - please	
28		specify, post pregnancy, pregnancy related,	
29		surgery/post op. Those are the ones on the system at	

1	the time certainly, it may well still be the same	
2	system, the options that are available. Then, if we go	
3	onto the next page, it shows you what happens in terms	
4	of the screen that comes up. If you have chosen the	
5	flu viral reason, it gives you, you know, the	12:56
6	information that you're meant to include there on that.	
7	If we scroll over to the left-hand side of the page, to	
8	see the way it's meant to operate. These are meant to	
9	be included. It's quite a long page. So the next page	
LO	shows the, the far right-hand corner of it, if we	12:57
L1	scroll over the page, taking it fully to the right.	
L2	That gives you a full view of what's meant to be put on	
L3	the system for sickness absence management if you	
L4	select flu viral under ordinary illness. Now, if we go	
L5	back then to, or further on, to the next page, if you	12:57
L6	have selected the critical illness category, you just	
L7	get a single	
L8	CHAIRMAN: Just give us a second.	
L9	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, I am sorry.	
20	CHAIRMAN: To bring it around.	12:58
21	MR. McGUINNESS: You just get a single option if you	
22	get critical illness, covers a multitude I am sure.	
23	Then the next page, anticipating the question you were	
24	answering there, 11794, if you select the occupational	
25	injury/illness arising from duty, you get these drop	12:58
26	downs. It would appear that there's no option at that	
27	point in time for putting in work related stress, if	
28	that has been the diagnosis obviously following	
29	investigation, I presume. So that's the way the SAMS	

_			system operates. Now, as it was done in your station,	
2			I think you know that Olivia Kelly was the clerk	
3			responsible for the operation of the system, isn't that	
4			right?	
5		Α.	Yeah. I only read that in the documents, yeah.	12:59
6	252	Q.	Yes.	
7		Α.	Sorry, I just find that incredible. There is no tab	
8			for work related stress. If I have read this correct,	
9			it's nearly as if I was the first guard in the history	
10			of the State to have gone out with work related stress.	12:59
11			If I am reading this correctly, they don't actually	
12			have a tab for work related stress.	
13	253	Q.	well, it appears that they did not have such at the	
14			time, isn't that right? That is right, I am told. We	
15			can explore that, if necessary. Just coming on to what	12:59
16			Ms. Kelly said in her statement?	
17			CHAIRMAN: I think maybe we will leave it at that	
18			point, is that convenient? Is that a good point,	
19			before we move on to Ms. Kelly? Thank you. Okay.	
20			Very good. Right, two o'clock.	13:00
21				
22			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED, AS	
23			FOLLOWS:	
24				
25			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Sit down there for a	14:12
26			moment, Garda Keogh, resume your normal position just	
27			for the moment, your unofficial position. As people	
28			will have known, we have had a somewhat longer time for	
29			lunch. I have been consulting counsel, not about the	

-	evidence but about some of the processes that we have.	
2	People will realise that some of the material,	
3	specifically the subject that we're exploring today, is	
4	technical and complicated, requiring a very impressive	
5	analysis and mastery of the subject by Mr. McGuinness.	14:1
6	But he has to put that material and everybody concerned	
7	relevantly with it has to follow these documents.	
8		
9	We also have some other topics where the same issue	
10	arises. So, what I was discussing with counsel was	14:1
11	what was the best way to proceed with that. It seems	
12	to me that it would be useful to give people an	
13	opportunity, give everybody, which includes obviously,	
14	Garda Keogh, but not simply Garda Keogh, everybody an	
15	opportunity of exploring, looking at, acquainting	14:1
16	themselves with this material. And that, if we did	
17	that, the process would move forward more smoothly,	
18	even more smoothly than it has been progressing so far.	
19	I also think it's fair and reasonable that people	
20	should have that opportunity.	14:1
21		
22	So, in the circumstances I am very pleased that we have	
23	made so much progress in our inquiry to date, in areas	
24	that cover a huge amount of ground. So that's why I	
25	have decided that we will suspend our proceedings at	14:1
26	this point today and we will resume at 10:30 in the	
27	morning.	
28		

29

So anybody who wants then to consult Mr. McGuinness as

1	to where he is going next or what materials might	
2	well I am sure that Mr. McGuinness will be happy to	
3	let people know. People can have a look at the	
4	material and it will make it easier for us to progress	
5	tomorrow with the other issues.	14:15
6	MR. KELLY: Thank you very much, Chairman. I will	
7	certainly will be making, I hope, a relatively short	
8	submission to you when we resume, on this very topic of	
9	the sick pay classification and so on.	
10	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	14:16
11	MR. KELLY: I want to do a bit of further research.	
12	CHAIRMAN: I can quite understand. I mean, frankly I	
13	think, if I may say so, we are all learning more about	
14	the SAMS system and the options and methods. I have to	
15	say, it's material that's new to me, if I can make that	14:16
16	confession. So, thanks very much. That's what we will	
17	do. All right. Thank you very much.	
18		
19	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL FRIDAY, 18TH OCTOBER	
20	2019 AT 10: 30AM	14:16
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
29		

		-		
1	26:13	25 [1] - 3:14	5:5	action [1] - 36:21
	183 [5] - 50:12,	26 [1] - 3:14	70 [1] - 24:22	active [1] - 31:5
	50:21, 58:14, 60:13,	26th [4] - 49:26,		add [3] - 25:9, 50:6,
'01 [1] - 47:7	60:24	49:28, 53:3, 56:20	8	50:8
'02 [1] - 47:8	184 [2] - 50:7, 50:13	27 [1] - 3:15		added [1] - 50:5
'03 [1] - 47:8	18TH [1] - 70:19	28 [1] - 3:16		address [1] - 30:12
'04 [1] - 47:8			8 [4] - 3:5, 3:28, 6:9,	
'05 [1] - 47:10	19 [1] - 3:11	29 [1] - 3:16	6:28	addressed [1] - 9:19
	1921 [1] - 1:9	2nd [5] - 10:3, 15:27,	0.20	ADJOURNED [3] -
'06 [1] - 47:10	19th [1] - 35:6	49:25, 52:17, 57:16	9	46:17, 68:22, 70:19
'07 [1] - 47:10	1st [2] - 23:7, 40:12		9	ADMINISTRATIVE
'08 [1] - 47:11		3		[1] - 3:13
'10 [1] - 47:11	2		9 [3] - 3:6, 8:28,	advance [3] - 11:22,
'14 [2] - 49:2, 50:4		<u>_</u>	47:11	12:27, 14:21
'15 [7] - 9:5, 9:9,		3 [1] - 3:3		affect [3] - 21:17,
9:13, 9:17, 46:4,	2 [3] - 2:31, 3:2, 4:5	30 [1] - 3:17	976 [1] - 23:13	
52:17	20 [1] - 3:11	30th [4] - 8:3, 12:1,	997 [1] - 24:14	58:14, 59:18
32.17	2000 [2] - 47:13,	17:16, 36:8	9th [2] - 9:5, 44:19	affected [1] - 55:7
	47:14	· ·		agenda [1] - 36:1
0		31 [1] - 3:17	Α	agitating [1] - 30:28
	2001 [1] - 47:14	31/8 [1] - 9:21		ago [1] - 13:16
0 47.44	2011 [3] - 47:16,	31/8/2014 [1] - 8:14		agree [22] - 10:6,
0 [1] - 47:11	47:21, 48:7	31/8/2015 [2] - 9:22,	A's [2] - 32:3, 39:3	14:22, 14:24, 32:25,
	2012 [2] - 47:24,	9:25	A114 [2] - 33:20,	32:26, 34:12, 36:20,
1	48:11	31st [6] - 9:11, 11:25,	34:27	36:25, 41:29, 42:10,
	2013 [1] - 48:16	14:22, 18:15, 18:16,	ability [1] - 34:22	
	2014 [10] - 1:3, 16:2,	19:18	able [4] - 17:21,	50:18, 52:22, 54:8,
1 [1] - 3:2	16:13, 28:7, 29:11,	32 [2] - 2:23, 3:18		54:29, 57:25, 58:2,
1/9/2015 [1] - 13:23	29:19, 31:14, 46:3,		31:12, 40:29, 41:1	58:5, 58:10, 58:23,
10 [4] - 3:6, 7:21,		33 [1] - 3:18	above-named [1] -	61:19, 61:20
7:25, 11:15	48:24, 49:22	34 [1] - 3:19	1:26	agreed [5] - 13:16,
1004 [1] - 24:24	2015 [18] - 7:29, 9:2,	35 [1] - 3:19	absence [8] - 8:23,	37:7, 58:13, 61:12,
102 [1] - 1:18	9:12, 15:27, 22:19,	36 [1] - 3:20	10:12, 10:21, 34:21,	61:13
10649 [1] - 48:27	23:4, 23:8, 23:29,	37 [1] - 3:20	50:27, 51:11, 51:12,	agrees [2] - 60:27,
1	32:20, 35:6, 48:29,	38 [2] - 3:21, 47:2	67:13	60:29
10721 [2] - 47:20,	49:23, 53:3, 53:10,	39 [1] - 3:21	absences [6] -	AGSI [1] - 4:1
49:11	53:23, 57:14, 57:17,	00[1] 0.21	46:25, 46:26, 51:3,	
10723 [1] - 47:12	62:2	4		AIDAN[2] - 3:9, 4:2
10724 [1] - 47:9	2016 [1] - 53:23	4	51:7, 55:16, 65:16	AISLING [2] - 2:11,
10725 [2] - 47:2, 47:7			absent [2] - 50:21,	3:21
10:30 [1] - 69:26	2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9	4 [3] - 2:19, 3:3, 43:9	65:28	ALAN [2] - 3:8, 3:12
10:30AM [1] - 70:20	2018 [1] - 1:9		absolutely [4] - 18:5,	alerted [1] - 63:2
11 [3] - 3:7, 22:16,	2019 [3] - 1:18, 6:2,	42 [1] - 65:29	42:11, 59:12	ALISON [1] - 3:25
	70:20	48 [2] - 50:3, 50:6	accept [5] - 16:20,	allegation [1] - 33:24
46:28	2046 [1] - 32:15		16:25, 50:29, 51:2,	alleviate [1] - 31:24
11-13 [1] - 3:31	21 [1] - 3:12	5	52:9	
11789 [1] - 65:29	210 [1] - 10:16		acceptable [1] -	allow [4] - 39:2, 41:5,
11794 [2] - 66:1,	211 [2] - 8:29, 9:18	 	63:26	41:7, 52:21
67:24	22 [1] - 3:12	5 [1] - 3:4		alluded [1] - 28:12
12 [3] - 3:7, 4:4,	22/10/2015 [1] -	51 [2] - 2:18, 47:26	accidentally [1] -	alone [4] - 31:29,
46:21		58 [1] - 13:19	58:29	35:16, 40:29, 42:5
13 [3] - 2:30, 3:8,	23:16	59 [1] - 13:19	account [1] - 32:14	AMENDED [1] - 1:9
49:12	22/3/2015 [1] - 49:23	5th [1] - 47:16	achieved [2] - 31:1,	amount [2] - 51:29,
131 [3] - 8:10, 11:14	220 [2] - 25:18, 58:15		31:3	69:24
	2220 [2] - 25:21,	6	acknowledging [1] -	AN [1] - 3:2
135 [1] - 22:22	32:11	O	33:19	
136 [1] - 50:10	2256 [1] - 38:17		acquainting [1] -	analysis [2] - 23:6,
14 [1] - 3:8	2259 [1] - 39:11	6 [1] - 3:4	69:15	69:5
141 [1] - 50:10	2260 [1] - 39:17	68 [1] - 23:12		AND [6] - 1:3, 1:4,
15 [1] - 3:9			ACT [2] - 1:3, 1:8	1:8, 3:15, 46:17,
15th [1] - 28:17	2261 [1] - 39:19	69 [1] - 23:12	Act [2] - 16:3, 16:9	68:22
16 [2] - 1:5, 3:9	22nd [5] - 22:19,		acted [1] - 28:16	ANDREW [1] - 4:2
	23:3, 24:14, 32:15,	7	ACTING [2] - 3:6,	ANNE [2] - 3:7, 3:16
17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10	32:20		3:12	annual [15] - 7:27,
17TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1	23 [1] - 3:13		action [2] - 1:27,	
18 [3] - 3:10, 25:15,	24 [1] - 3:13	7 [4] - 1:9, 2:24, 3:5,	36:25	8:13, 9:21, 9:22, 9:24,
			53.25	11:7, 11:17, 11:26,
			35.25	11:7, 11:17, 11:26,

12:3, 12:19, 21:7, 21:13, 21:15, 21:29, 44.19 answer [5] - 23:13, 24:23, 26:7, 33:12, 39:4 answering [2] -37:21, 67:24 Anthony [1] - 53:26 **ANTHONY** [1] - 3:5 anticipating [1] anyway [3] - 13:13, 40:11, 59:18 apparent [1] - 20:20 APPEAL[2] - 1:13, appear [4] - 11:24, 42:7, 57:27, 67:26 APPEARANCES[1] -2:1 appeared [7] - 12:2, 23:20, 36:20, 36:25, 41:26, 54:9, 57:17 appendices [1] -56:4 appendix [1] - 8:28 applicable [1] -55:13 application [6] -6:26, 9:19, 10:1, 10:12, 10:19, 11:9 applied [5] - 8:13, 11:6, 11:17, 11:22, 13:4 applies [1] - 61:3 apply [1] - 12:21 applying [1] - 12:22 appointment [7] -11:8, 11:22, 12:7, 12:9, 12:10, 17:22, 20:28 appointment.. [1] -8:15 approached [2] -29:8, 29:12 appropriate [2] - 7:1, 30:13 approval [1] - 8:23 approve [2] - 10:5, 22:1 approved [2] - 8:20, approves [2] - 21:27, 21:29 **April** [1] - 49:26 areas [1] - 69:23 argument [2] - 49:9, 50:19 arises [1] - 69:10

arising [5] - 6:23, 44:11, 51:3, 53:9, 67:25 ARRAN[1] - 2:23 arranged [3] - 12:12, 12:13, 12:17 arrested [1] - 43:1 arresting [1] - 43:6 arrests [1] - 42:22 **AS**[4] - 1:9, 6:1, 46:17, 68:22 ascertain [1] - 13:29 aside [1] - 62:27 aspect [1] - 27:13 aspects [1] - 17:7 asserted [1] - 20:24 assertion [1] - 31:19 assign [1] - 36:6 assigned [1] - 41:16 assigning [1] - 36:15 Assistant [2] - 29:15, 30.2 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:18, 3:20 assistant [1] - 29:29 assists [1] - 7:9 assume [1] - 66:16 assuming [3] -13:13, 19:25, 61:1 AT [1] - 70:20 Athlone [3] - 32:6, 47:10, 48:9 **ATHLONE** [1] - 3:32 attach [1] - 10:24 attached [1] - 26:19 attendance [1] - 15:8 attended [2] - 11:8, attending [3] - 8:14, 11:7, 11:18 attention [2] - 32:13, au [2] - 52:23, 62:6 August [9] - 7:29, 8:3, 9:11, 11:26, 18:15, 18:16, 36:8, 48:28, 49:2 authorities [3] -53:25, 62:14, 64:3 automatic [2] -51:11. 61:13 automatically [2] -61:1. 63:11

available [1] - 67:2

avalanches [1] -

aware [22] - 8:21,

10:8, 14:6, 14:13,

14:26, 15:5, 15:8,

46:3

15:11, 16:22, 16:25, 17:6, 17:9, 26:24, 40:14, 40:15, 40:19, 40:20, 41:17, 45:5, 53:17, 64:21, 64:22 В backdate [1] - 55:22 backdated [3] -55:20, 55:24, 56:20 bad [3] - 39:28, 60:4, 60:18 BAR [1] - 2:31 barely [1] - 33:19 **BARNES**[1] - 2:5 Bartlett [1] - 49:4 based [1] - 60:19 basic [1] - 54:12 basis [7] - 27:18, 28:17, 40:25, 51:4, 57:3, 65:3, 66:21 BASTION [1] - 3:31 **BE** [1] - 7:16 bear [1] - 49:16 becomes [1] - 60:12 becoming [1] - 53:16 **beg** [1] - 53:13 beginning [7] -61:17 56:16

49:22, 50:4, 58:22, 58:24, 58:26, 59:27, behalf [2] - 20:22, behind [2] - 19:11, 28:24 belief [6] - 23:24, 24:9, 24:11, 25:7, 41:13. 45:15 benign [1] - 58:29 best [2] - 42:9, 69:11 better [2] - 31:28, between [2] - 26:2, 47:17 big [1] - 21:3 bill [1] - 20:16 bit [5] - 8:17, 43:25, 46:8, 48:29, 70:11 bite [1] - 63:22 **BL** [12] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:28, 3:24, 3:24, 3:25, 3:29, 4:3 blank [4] - 26:6, 26:9, 26:16, 26:25 bothered [1] - 35:29 bothering [1] - 35:28 bottom [6] - 32:16,

36:14, 39:13, 47:6, 47:21, 47:25 bound [4] - 22:29, 24:8, 32:1, 32:2 **box** [1] - 66:8 break [4] - 46:6, 46:12, 46:14, 48:7 BRIAN [2] - 3:14, BRIEFLY [1] - 46:17 briefly [1] - 39:18 bring [1] - 67:20 broad [1] - 48:4 brought [7] - 25:24, 26:5, 43:26, 50:12, 53:23, 54:13, 54:16 Bruir [2] - 20:23, business [2] - 7:19, 18:2 butler [4] - 18:7, 18:10, 18:12, 18:20 **BY** [12] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:25, 3:30, 4:4, 5:5, 7:16

С

CAGNEY [1] - 3:16

cancel [7] - 8:13,

11:7, 11:17, 12:21, 12:23, 21:15, 21:28 cancellation [4] -7:26, 10:19, 10:21, 10:23 cancelled [1] - 9:24 cannot [1] - 34:12 career [4] - 29:28, 38:2, 38:10, 46:27 **CARR** [1] - 3:15 **CARRICK** [1] - 2:13 CARRICK-ON-**SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 CARROLL [1] - 2:16 carrying [2] - 22:29, 63:25 cars [1] - 43:29 CARTHAGE[1] case [13] - 17:24, 17:27, 19:20, 25:1, 26:5, 34:17, 54:9, 59:21, 59:22, 64:20, 65:7, 65:12, 65:15 cases [1] - 65:10 CASTLE[1] - 1:17 categories [4] - 59:4, 59:10, 66:4, 66:14

categorisation [6] -49:13, 49:15, 54:22, 60:16, 60:19, 62:2 **categorise** [1] - 66:5 categorised [2] -49:20, 62:4 category [15] -21:22, 48:4, 48:20, 51:23, 51:24, 52:16, 56:26, 59:7, 60:10, 61:6, 66:7, 66:11, 66:23, 66:25, 67:16 caught [3] - 25:11, 25:18, 50:26 cert [1] - 49:3 certain [7] - 16:15, 19:4, 34:9, 59:15, 63:8, 64:28 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 certainly [4] - 40:16, 54:9, 67:1, 70:7 certificates [2] -49:17, 53:19 certification [1] -28.1 certified [4] - 27:17, 27:21, 51:11 certify [1] - 1:24 certs [5] - 49:1, 63:18, 65:2, 65:3, 65:26 chain [1] - 45:23 Chairman [9] - 6:5, 7:2, 7:4, 7:21, 46:6, 60:8, 64:27, 64:29, 70:6 CHAIRMAN [107] -1:12, 6:4, 6:10, 6:13, 6:17, 6:20, 7:3, 7:5, 7:8, 7:10, 7:19, 7:22, 9:1, 9:4, 9:9, 9:11, 9:14, 9:16, 12:13, 12:15, 12:28, 13:1, 13:4, 13:8, 13:11, 18:15, 18:17, 18:19, 18:21, 19:13, 19:15, 19:28, 20:2, 20:6, 20:9, 21:24, 22:9, 22:11, 22:14, 34:1, 34:6, 34:8, 34:15, 39:28, 40:2, 40:4, 40:9, 42:12, 42:14, 42:20, 42:25, 43:1, 43:6, 43:10, 43:13, 43:18, 43:20, 44:1, 44:5, 44:8, 44:10, 46:7, 54:13, 54:15, 54:18, 54:20, 54:28, 58:20, 58:28, 59:6,

59:8, 59:10, 59:25,

60:4, 60:14, 60:17, 60:21, 60:27, 60:29, 61:10, 61:12, 61:26, 62:13, 62:18, 62:20, 62:24, 62:27, 62:29, 63:6, 63:16, 63:19, 63:28, 64:5, 64:7, 64:10, 64:14, 64:18, 64:24, 64:28, 66:15, 66:23, 67:18, 67:20, 68:17, 68:25, 70:10, 70.12 challenged [1] - 26:7 change [7] - 49:14, 49:18, 53:8, 53:15, 54:4, 54:23, 55:4 changed [4] - 55:3, 55:5, 61:4, 61:7 changes [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 54:26 changing [1] - 41:15 **charge** [4] - 41:8, 41:9, 43:2, 62:12 charges [1] - 37:15 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:4 chatty [1] - 35:22 CHEALLACHÁIN [1] - 2.29 cheeky [1] - 28:20 **CHIEF** [14] - 3:2, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:18, 3:19, 3:20, 3:26 **chief** [5] - 29:27, 32:21, 39:17, 50:2 Chief [7] - 52:10, 53:26, 55:8, 57:20, 58:16, 61:10, 61:11 choose [3] - 66:5, 66:6, 66:21 chosen [1] - 67:4 chunk [1] - 48:12 circle [1] - 36:2 circular [3] - 24:1, 41:15, 41:19 circulated [5] -41:10, 42:1, 42:5, 42:6, 44:17 circulating [1] - 57:8 circumstances [7] -8:24, 12:25, 21:19, 23:2, 27:27, 31:22, 69:22 citing [1] - 8:23 civil [1] - 46:29 clarification [2] -6:19, 40:20 clarified [1] - 61:15 clarify [4] - 28:19,

29:22, 30:15, 42:12

class [1] - 61:25 classification [4] -55:2, 61:4, 65:20, 70:9 classified [2] -48:21, 65:22 **classify** [1] - 65:3 clear [7] - 42:4, 45:20, 52:18, 59:12, 62:29, 63:1, 63:2 clearly [1] - 26:22 clerk[1] - 68:2 click [2] - 66:3, 66:14 client [1] - 6:13 CMO [10] - 53:10, 53:20, 64:17, 64:21, 64:22, 65:2, 65:8, 65:17, 65:25 **CO**[2] - 2:13, 3:32 colloquialism [1] -31:23 column [1] - 55:21 coming [8] - 27:10, 31:18, 37:23, 38:5, 42:21, 44:27, 54:27, 68:15 commencing [1] -23:13 **COMMISSIONER** [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:18, 3:20 Commissioner [3] -13:27, 29:15, 30:2 commissioners [1] -29.29 common [5] - 15:10, 15:23, 33:29, 44:24,

communicated [1] communications [1] COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compare [1] - 39:21 complaining [2] -16:6, 16:28, 23:28, 37:13, 46:20, 57:5, 57:7, 57:18, 61:28, 62:14, 62:25, 64:2 16:26, 37:27, 46:21

44:29

10:15

- 8:22

complained [2] -

complains [1] -

complaint [15] -

6:15, 7:25, 15:18,

complaints [3] -

completely [1] -

19:10, 27:3

27:14, 41:20

22:16

16:21 complicated [1] -69:4 comprehensive [8] -10:24, 13:24, 20:3, 20:6, 20:8, 20:14, 20:19 computer [4] -51:20, 61:1, 63:25, 64:8 concern [6] - 19:17, 28:15, 32:9, 32:10, 53:24, 56:27 concerned [3] - 6:14, 48:10, 69:6 concerning [2] -7:25, 16:27 concerns [2] - 26:25, 31:24 condition [5] - 42:15, 43:12, 43:14, 43:15, 43:23 **conducted** [1] - 14:9 conference [4] -25:1, 30:11, 64:20, 65:10 conferences [3] -65:7, 65:12, 65:15 confession [1] -70:16 confidence [3] -41:25, 48:7, 49:6 confidential [4] -8:25, 13:26, 14:1, 21.2 confidentiality [1] confine [1] - 42:9 confined [2] - 22:16, 22:28 confinement [1] -45:10 confirm [3] - 18:2, 18:26, 19:5 confirmation [1] -19:22 confirmed [1] confirming [1] - 7:7 $\boldsymbol{\text{confused}}\ [2]\textbf{ - }58\text{:}11,$ 63:29 CONLON [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT[1] -CONNELLAN [2] -

6:24 consequences [2] -7:12, 21:8 consider [3] - 20:26, 40:22, 40:25 considerable [1] -46:26 consideration [4] -9:26, 10:27, 31:5, 31:6 considered [2] -10:23, 59:15 constant [2] - 28:4, 28.8 constantly [1] -25:14 consult [1] - 69:29 consultation [1] consulted [1] - 44:14 consulting [2] -46:11, 68:29 contact [4] - 15:28, 16:13, 16:26, 17:7 content [1] - 21:4 context [5] - 8:1, 20:23, 21:10, 30:27, 46:24 CONTINUED [1] -7:16 continuing [2] -49:8, 55:16 convenient [1] -68:18 conversation [2] -35:22. 36:8 conveyed [1] - 37:9 convoluted [1] - 51:9 COPPINGER [1] corner [1] - 67:10 correct [28] - 6:16, 8:8, 9:7, 9:10, 11:1, 11:10, 11:11, 11:21, 12:5, 12:6, 12:7, 12:8, 13:7, 14:27, 16:21, 27:4, 28:19, 30:9, 33:15, 43:17, 44:2, 52:5, 54:8, 55:19, 55:22, 60:7, 60:9, 68:8 corrected [2] -54:12, 54:22

correcting [1] -

correction [1] -

correctly [3] - 58:5,

corrects [1] - 54:21

54:10

54:16

60:6, 68:11

COSTELLO [1] coughed [1] - 53:14 counsel [2] - 68:29, 69:10 counter [1] - 33:27 countermanded [1] country [1] - 44:7 couple [2] - 14:18, 44:13 course [16] - 6:21, 6:27, 13:18, 26:28, 29:7, 30:7, 30:8, 31:29, 36:20, 36:25, 37:28, 38:11, 39:27, 42:24, 46:4, 65:23 **COURT** [3] - 1:13, 2:3, 3:31 court [1] - 42:28 cover [2] - 48:3, 69:24 **covers** [1] - 67:22 critical [2] - 67:16, 67:22 **criticising** [1] - 18:28 cropped [1] - 12:11 crucial [1] - 50:12 **CUALÁIN**[1] - 3:6 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 curiosity [1] - 12:18 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:9 **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 cursor [1] - 48:17 custody [4] - 42:26, 42:27, 42:28, 43:7

D

D9 [1] - 10:25 dark [1] - 65:14 date [11] - 10:3, 18:8, 18:13, 18:14, 49:8, 49:22, 49:23, 49:24, 55:21, 56:21, 69:23 dated [1] - 13:23 **DAVID** [2] - 2:27, 3:18 **DAVIS**[1] - 2:8 **DAY**[1] - 1:18 day's [4] - 6:25, 10:21, 21:15, 21:28 days [18] - 27:16, 27:20, 28:2, 47:17, 47:24, 47:26, 48:12, 48:15, 50:3, 50:5, 50:7, 50:8, 50:10, 50:12, 50:13, 50:21, 50:26, 60:13

CONOR [1] - 3:23

consent [4] - 29:8,

29:12, 29:21, 30:16

consequence [1] -

3:29. 3:30

de [2] - 20:23, 42:8 deal [2] - 16:8, 21:28 dealing [4] - 37:22, 42:26, 49:5 dealings [1] - 21:1 dealt [4] - 14:10, 24:18, 51:4, 65:21 debate [1] - 7:12 December [4] -48:16, 49:2, 53:3, 53:10 **DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 decided [2] - 52:6, 69:25 deciding [3] - 51:14, 51:16, 52:8 decision [6] - 41:20, 41:26, 43:7, 44:15, 51:6, 57:27 decision-making [1] - 51:6 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:4 **definitely** [1] - 40:6 degree [2] - 33:18, 37:17 deliberately [1] -58:29 delicate [1] - 56:6 demeanour [1] -35:27 denial [1] - 7:26 departure [1] - 47:19 **Deputy** [1] - 16:7 described [1] - 60:11 describes [1] - 39:18 describing [1] -35:26 desk [2] - 22:28, 24:8 **DESMOND**[1] - 4:3 detail [1] - 56:4 detailed [1] - 44:18 details [3] - 20:7, 20:27, 62:24 detective [1] - 29:13 **DETECTIVE** [5] - 3:3, 3:4, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17 **Detective** [1] - 30:15 **detention** [1] - 43:9 detentions [1] - 43:9 deteriorated [1] -32:22 determined [1] -52:2 **DEVELOPMENT**[1] - 3:15 diagnosis [1] - 67:28 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diary [1] - 31:25 difference [5] -

39:8

district [1] - 24:2

DIVISION [1] - 1:12

DOCKERY [1] - 4:3

doctor [6] - 27:18,

48:1, 48:6, 48:27,

document [2] -

documents [5] - 6:7,

28:24, 40:15, 68:5,

domain [1] - 57:19

49:4, 65:3

28:26, 39:10

69:7

49:15, 59:1, 59:29, **DONAL** [2] - 3:6, 60:1, 60:11 3:24 differences [1] done [8] - 12:20, 42:9, 43:26, 61:29, 39.29 different [6] - 8:1, 62:26, 62:27, 63:12, 17:7, 30:27, 37:11, 56:7, 66:6 double [1] - 32:4 difficult [5] - 25:16, down [29] - 8:17, 33:7, 44:5, 44:6, 9:16, 9:28, 10:16, 56:11 11:15, 15:21, 21:13, difficulty [1] - 34:13 37:6, 39:12, 39:27, **DIGNAM** [1] - 3:23 44:27, 47:6, 47:10, direction [3] - 27:8, 48:29, 52:18, 58:15, 59:27, 61:16, 62:14, 27:13, 44:20 62:16, 63:3, 63:9, directly [3] - 48:10, 63:13, 63:19, 63:20, 51:3, 53:29 **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:12 64:3, 64:10, 66:26, 68:25 DIRECTORATE[1] -3:15 disagreed [1] - 37:7 discipline [1] - 8:4 disclosure [18] dozen [1] - 19:6 **Dr** [1] - 49:4 13:25, 14:14, 15:6, DR [1] - 3:11 15:9, 15:11, 15:12, draw [1] - 32:13 15:26, 16:3, 16:23, drink [1] - 48:3 21:20, 28:6, 29:9, 29:12, 29:24, 45:16, 45:25, 47:4, 56:26 drop [3] - 52:18, DISCLOSURES [2] -66:26, 67:25 1:2. 1:3 disclosures [8] -63:11 8:19, 8:26, 15:24, 20:16, 20:21, 29:9, 47:28, 53:26 4:5 discourage [1] - 45:8 **duck** [1] - 38:4 discovered [2] -53:20, 53:21 59:19, 65:23 discrediting [2] during [1] - 22:24 21:22, 45:22 discuss [1] - 29:10 23:5, 23:27, 24:29, discussed [6] -24:13, 34:21, 35:3, 42:10 duty [18] - 12:2, 36:6, 36:9, 45:26 discussing [2] -12:20, 21:9, 22:17, 22:28, 27:10, 27:14, 65:25, 69:10 discussion [1] - 39:6 27:16, 27:20, 28:2, dispute [2] - 38:27,

enabling [1] - 55:9 encapsulate [1] -45:21 encapsulated [1] -**DOWNEY** [2] - 3:14, 46:21 encouragement [1] downs [1] - 67:26 end [7] - 7:29, 18:3, 38:8, 47:17, 47:20, 48:16, 49:12 ending [2] - 47:7, 47.8 drinking [1] - 33:11 endorse [1] - 43:7 endorsed [1] - 10:10 enquire [1] - 57:13 dropped [2] - 59:3, enquiries [1] - 13:19 enquiring [1] - 59:26 **DUBLIN** [6] - 1:17, ensure [1] - 41:24 2:19, 2:24, 2:31, 3:28, entered [1] - 61:6 entitled [1] - 13:5 enviable [1] - 44:1 due [4] - 6:27, 29:7, **EOIN** [1] - 2:28 **EQUALITY** [1] - 1:8 equally [4] - 18:23, duties [9] - 22:29, 19:9, 37:24, 48:5 essence [1] - 64:12 25:3, 25:5, 42:2, 42:6, essential [1] - 62:13 essentially [3] -38:3, 59:23, 62:25 ESTABLISHED[1] -1.7 etcetera [1] - 24:23 28:16, 32:6, 36:6, event [1] - 48:10 36:16, 43:22, 44:18, events [3] - 11:12, 61:25, 67:25 41:14, 61:8 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 evidence [9] - 6:29, Ε 21:18, 28:28, 31:13, 31:14, 42:28, 46:11, **EAMON**[1] - 3:9 evident [1] - 14:20 early [2] - 45:7, 46:24 exactly [3] - 12:8, easier [2] - 47:22, 17:24, 48:6 **examined** [1] - 6:6 effect [5] - 23:5, example [2] - 15:19, 51:11, 54:10, 55:11, 24:7

62:3

38:17

47:17

23:10

2:29

32:9. 46:10

effectively[1] -

EGAN[1] - 3:25

eight [2] - 43:27,

either [6] - 13:12,

18:10, 21:26, 30:13,

elaborated [1] -

ELIZABETH[1] -

EMMA[1] - 3:26

exceeding [1] -55:17 except [2] - 38:18, 52:16 **excuse** [3] - 19:19, 35:16, 39:4 **executive** [1] - 56:18 EXECUTIVE [1] expect [2] - 41:15, 56:5 expert [1] - 40:5 experts [1] - 62:11 explain [4] - 20:13, 21:9, 52:26, 64:26 explained [4] -30:20. 35:3. 36:5. 36.16 **explaining** [1] - 36:7 explanation [10] -8:23, 8:25, 10:13, 10:22, 14:2, 14:3, 14:16, 17:17, 19:28, 19:29 explanation" [2] -20:4, 20:10 explanations [1] -22.2 **explore** [1] - 68:15 **explored** [1] - 61:20 **exploring** [3] - 20:10, 69:3. 69:15 express [1] - 56:17 **expressly** [1] - 37:7 extended [1] - 47:26 eye [2] - 25:11, 25:18

F

face [1] - 28:14 fact [21] - 11:8, 12:5, 17:5, 19:11, 20:27, 23:23, 30:11, 30:28, 31:20, 31:23, 35:15, 41:3, 46:25, 46:26, 48:20, 49:17, 50:2, 54:22, 56:24, 57:2, 60:22 factual [1] - 20:22 factually [1] - 11:3 fair [3] - 31:3, 34:10, 69:19 fairly [2] - 12:11, 21.2 $\textbf{fairness} \ [2] \textbf{ - } 55{:}23,$ 59:17 fait [2] - 52:23, 62:6 falls [1] - 21:23 false [1] - 32:28

70.4

FANNING [1] - 2:21 **FOR** [10] - 1:7, 2:6, gastroenteritis [1] -17:12, 55:1, 60:9, Н Fanning [2] - 29:16, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:26, 49:14 62:11, 63:28, 64:28, 70.7 30:3 3:1, 3:29, 4:1, 68:22 general [3] - 33:3, half [5] - 19:6, 32:16, forgetting [1] - 66:19 hoping [3] - 34:1, **far** [9] **-** 6:13, 37:24, 44:17, 45:3 32:27, 46:28, 63:21 forgive [1] - 62:7 genuine [1] - 17:20 34:3, 54:29 44:6, 45:24, 56:10, halfway [2] - 48:15, 60:7, 67:10, 69:18 forgot [1] - 65:8 GERAGHTY [1] -HORAN [1] - 3:24 house [2] - 8:2 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:1 forgotten [1] - 27:1 HALIDAY[1] - 2:23 FEBRUARY [2] - 1:5, form [3] - 32:20, GERARD [1] - 2:11 **HOUSE** [2] - 2:23, hand [4] - 33:18, 33:20, 34:27 **GERRY** [1] - 3:10 48:17, 67:7, 67:10 felt [3] - 14:2, 14:15, HR [6] - 29:15, 30:2, formality [1] - 37:18 given [7] - 6:6, 8:25, hand's [1] - 40:7 30:6, 30:17, 30:23, 35:8 former [1] - 13:27 14:2, 14:14, 31:6, handiest [1] - 56:10 FERGAL [1] - 2:26 **FORMER** [2] - 1:13, 31:13, 37:14 31:16 hands [3] - 33:26, huge [3] - 30:8, 31:9, **FERRY** [1] - 2:16 glance [1] - 34:28 34:2, 34:7 few [2] - 13:16, 18:12 forward [2] - 10:23, **GLEESON** [1] - 4:3 69:24 handwriting [1] -**HUGHES** [2] - 2:29, figures [1] - 50:11 69:17 GOODE [1] - 3:21 40:4 file [1] - 45:29 forwarded [2] - 9:25, **GRALTON** [1] - 3:14 handwritten [1] -**HUMAN**[1] - 3:15 finance [1] - 50:20 10:27 grateful [2] - 6:18, 13:23 hundred [1] - 57:22 four [4] - 50:7, 50:9, financial [2] - 21:7, happy [2] - 7:3, 70:2 66:6, 66:8 great [2] - 40:28, HARAN[1] - 4:2 I fine [3] - 37:1, 39:23, frankly [1] - 70:12 Haran [3] - 44:14, 50:19 frequent [1] - 34:21 greater [2] - 37:17, 44:28, 45:4 FRIDAY [1] - 70:19 50:11 finger [2] - 49:12, **IA14** [1] - 32:21 have.. [1] - 36:23 49:21 Friend [1] - 6:18 **GREENE** [1] - 2:26 idea [2] - 46:7, 65:11 **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 finish [1] - 47:25 friend [1] - 32:3 GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26 illness [21] - 46:27. head [2] - 18:11, finished [1] - 38:3 front [1] - 57:17 ground [3] - 13:8, 49:20, 50:3, 50:7, 29:15 FINN [1] - 3:5 full [6] - 20:7, 55:10, 21:16, 69:24 52:21, 53:17, 57:26, headaches [1] -**FINTAN** [1] - 2:21 55:14, 56:20, 57:2, **GSOC** [49] - 8:14, 59:16, 60:10, 60:20, 60:18 8:21, 8:26, 9:23, 11:8, 67:12 **first** [10] - 28:27, 60:23, 61:6, 62:5, health [5] - 33:11, 43:25, 47:14, 47:16, 12:6, 12:9, 13:2, fully [4] - 26:24, 66:3, 66:7, 66:13, 53:5, 55:3, 62:3, 48:8, 49:3, 49:28, 36:1, 56:21, 67:11 13:22, 13:25, 14:1, 66:23, 66:24, 67:14, 66:27 56:9, 66:1, 68:9 14:4, 14:7, 14:9, 67:16, 67:22 hear [5] - 17:14, 14:13, 14:22, 14:27. firstly [1] - 57:26 G illness" [1] - 48:21 48:22, 53:12, 62:11, 15:2, 15:5, 15:8, fit [3] - 27:16, 35:8, imagine [1] - 65:24 65.18 15:19, 15:22, 15:26, 35.23 **immediate** [1] - 23:5 GARDA[11] - 2:10, heard [1] - 44:26 15:29, 16:6, 16:13, fits [1] - 25:11 2:26, 2:27, 2:27, 3:2, impact [1] - 34:22 **HEARING** [4] - 6:1, 16:15, 16:26, 17:6, FITZWILLIAM [1] implications [1] -3:10, 3:10, 3:11, 3:21, 46:17, 68:22, 70:19 17:17, 17:18, 17:28, 7:12 5:3, 7:16 hearing [1] - 37:15 18:11, 18:12, 18:23, five [3] - 26:17, **implying** [1] - 37:14 Garda [61] - 6:7, HELD [1] - 1:17 18:25, 19:1, 19:3, 36:14, 50:9 **important** [1] - 55:1 6:14, 6:23, 6:29, 7:23, held [3] - 64:20, 19:5, 19:9, 19:13, Flanagan [1] - 16:7 9:21, 10:1, 13:27, **impressive** [1] - 69:4 19:18, 19:22, 20:13, 65:12, 65:15 flu [11] - 23:22, 16:2, 16:7, 16:9, IN [1] - 1:17 20:20, 20:28, 21:1, help[1] - 63:23 48:21, 48:24, 53:18, inappropriate [1] -16:14, 19:15, 19:18, 21:10 helpful [1] - 64:28 58:25, 59:27, 60:23, 22:15, 23:21, 23:25, 42:17 **GSOC..** [1] - 11:18 helpfully [1] - 61:14 61:4, 62:15, 67:5, Inaudible [2] - 44:16, 23:27, 25:4, 25:12, guard [13] - 18:3, 67:14 hierarchy [1] - 56:19 25:15, 25:16, 26:6, 64:15 24:6, 26:20, 26:24, high [1] - 41:24 flu/viral [1] - 66:26 26:9, 26:12, 26:14, incident [1] - 35:5 highlighted [2] -26:25, 26:27, 27:7, **FLYNN** [1] - 3:19 26:26, 28:11, 28:15, include [1] - 67:6 27:10, 28:13, 31:12, 66:16, 66:17 focus [2] - 57:4, 57:5 28:24, 28:26, 29:2, included [2] - 38:19, 32:7, 43:6, 68:9 highly [1] - 42:20 follow [5] - 21:11, 30:5, 31:1, 31:9, 67:9 guards [2] - 25:6, himself [1] - 64:21 34:22, 43:13, 66:15, 31:22, 31:26, 32:3, includes [2] - 52:20, 57:9 hindsight [1] - 30:6 32:19, 32:22, 33:4, 69:13 Guards [2] - 16:9, hinged [2] - 30:22, followed [2] - 56:15, 35:4, 35:7, 39:2, 39:3, including [1] - 28:17 18:23 31:16 56:19 40:26, 40:27, 41:2, increase [1] - 28:14 **guessing** [1] - 19:16 hinges [1] - 30:18 FOLLOWING [1] -41:16, 46:10, 46:20, incredible [1] - 68:7 guy [2] - 41:7, 41:10 history [2] - 46:25, 1.4 50:19, 53:25, 56:11, indeed [3] - 22:21, GWEN [1] - 1:29 68:9 following [3] - 1:25, 60:27, 60:29, 64:22, 54:27, 60:29 Gwen [1] - 1:24 hit [4] - 57:10, 59:21, 49:26, 67:28 68:26, 69:14 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 63:6. 64:7 follows [1] - 60:9 garda [2] - 26:16, indicating [1] - 48:18 **hmm** [1] - 49:29 FOLLOWS [3] - 6:1, 61:22 individual [3] - 51:5, hope [9] - 17:4, 17:9, 46:18, 68:23

51:16, 52:7	67:29	keeping [2] - 47:19,	45:8, 46:22, 62:27,	М
indoor [12] - 22:17,	investigations [1] -	49:21	68:17	
22:28, 23:5, 23:26,	37:29	Kelly [6] - 6:4, 7:6,	left [2] - 38:10, 67:7	
24:29, 25:3, 25:5,	investigator [1] -	7:8, 68:2, 68:16,	left-hand [1] - 67:7	mad [1] - 48:9
36:6, 36:16, 42:2,	18:11	68:19	legal [1] - 43:11	MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7
42:6, 42:10	investigators [2] -	KELLY [7] - 2:10,	legislation [1] -	magnify [1] - 47:22
indulged [1] - 37:17	13:17, 23:11	3:11, 6:5, 6:11, 6:16,	14:15	main [1] - 57:18
inevitable [1] - 45:14	involvement [1] -	70:6, 70:11	LEITRIM [1] - 2:13	MAIN [1] - 2:12
inevitably [1] - 45:13	15:5	Ken [3] - 18:10,	less [2] - 19:24,	major [2] - 21:15,
inform [3] - 65:8,	involving [1] - 35:4	18:11, 18:20	30:23	21:28
65:16, 65:24	Isac [3] - 18:10,	Keogh [20] - 6:7,	letter [5] - 13:23,	malevolent [1] -
information [3] -	18:11, 18:20	6:23, 6:29, 7:23, 9:21,	17:22, 20:29, 49:25,	58:29
10:27, 14:1, 67:6	issue [32] - 6:9, 6:28,	10:1, 19:15, 19:18,	50:1	Malone [1] - 1:24
informed [3] - 24:23,	7:21, 7:25, 17:29,	22:15, 32:19, 32:22,	level [2] - 28:15, 38:1	MALONE [1] - 1:29
26:10, 40:16	21:11, 22:15, 24:12,	35:4, 35:7, 46:10,	LIAM [1] - 3:17	management [10] -
initial [1] - 14:16	29:10, 30:12, 30:18,	46:20, 60:27, 60:29,	likely [1] - 37:26	23:2, 23:21, 27:27,
injury [4] - 61:25,	31:9, 37:2, 38:16,	68:26, 69:14	line [6] - 8:19, 23:13,	28:11, 29:10, 29:26,
62:16, 66:14, 66:18	40:22, 44:29, 46:6,	KEOGH [3] - 2:10,	24:14, 24:24, 38:24,	30:5, 40:27, 65:29,
injury/illness [1] -	46:15, 46:21, 53:18,	5:3, 7:16	47:25	67:13
67:25	55:6, 55:9, 55:29,	Keogh's [1] - 6:15	lines [3] - 36:14,	manager [2] - 8:19,
INQUIRY [2] - 1:2,	56:26, 57:15, 58:23,	kept [1] - 54:6	38:18, 47:23	53:26
1:8	60:8, 60:12, 61:12,	KEVIN [1] - 3:14	linked [5] - 45:18,	managing [1] - 56:7
Inquiry [1] - 6:12	65:21, 69:9	KIERAN [1] - 3:19	45:19, 45:20, 45:22,	manpower [1] -
inquiry [2] - 6:21,	Issue [1] - 6:9	kind [4] - 7:13, 19:6,	45:24	21:14
69:23	issued [1] - 24:1	43:21, 58:9	list [2] - 35:5, 66:26	manual [2] - 47:3,
insane [1] - 31:13	issues [1] - 70:5	KIRWAN [1] - 3:13	listen [2] - 19:21,	47:19
insofar [1] - 57:28	itself [1] - 41:19	knowingly [2] -	45:28	March [6] - 9:5, 47:7,
Inspector [2] - 41:21,		63:20, 64:5	LITTLE [1] - 3:27	47:8, 49:26, 49:28
42:7	J	knowledge [3] -	local [1] - 29:9	MARGARET[1] -
INSPECTOR [7] -		15:1, 15:10, 40:11	logical [1] - 13:12	3:20
3:3, 3:9, 3:14, 3:17,		knowledgeable [1] -	long-term [3] -	MARIE [2] - 3:7, 3:16
3:17, 3:21, 4:1	JACK [1] - 3:6	30:24	12:10, 12:11, 45:8	MARK[1] - 3:3
INSTRUCTED[7] -	JAMES [1] - 2:28	known [7] - 23:2,		marked [1] - 26:16
III TO TILO OT LD [/]				I IIIai keu - 20.10
2.11 2.17 2.22 2.29	January [2] - 50:4	I .	look [22] - 8:10, 8:28,	
2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:25, 3:30, 4:4	January [2] - 50:4 job [11] - 23:1, 27:25,	27:27, 29:26, 29:29,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7
3:25, 3:30, 4:4	-	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] -	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25,	27:27, 29:26, 29:29,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29,	MARRINAN _[1] - 2:7 mastery _[1] - 69:5 material _[5] - 69:2,
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20,	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2,	MARRINAN _[1] - 2:7 mastery _[1] - 69:5 material _[5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] -	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11,	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3	MARRINAN[1] - 2:7 mastery[1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT[1] - 3:18
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29,	MARRINAN[1] - 2:7 mastery[1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT[1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12,
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15,	MARRINAN[1] - 2:7 mastery[1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT[1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17,
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7,
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] -	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21,
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7,
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17,
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] -	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interactions [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] -	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7,	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11 interrupt [1] - 58:21	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28 learning [2] - 53:9,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13 MATTHIAS [1] - 2:10
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11 interrupt [1] - 58:21 interview [1] - 23:12	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 justified [1] - 30:13	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28 learning [2] - 53:9, 70:13	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 lost [1] - 50:7	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13 MATTHIAS [1] - 2:10 MCBRIEN [1] - 2:16
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11 interrupt [1] - 58:21 interview [1] - 23:12 INTO [1] - 1:2	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 justified [1] - 30:13	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28 learning [2] - 53:9, 70:13 leave [27] - 7:10,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 lost [1] - 50:7 lower [2] - 50:11,	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13 MATTHIAS [1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:16 McCOURT [1] - 2:17
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11 interrupt [1] - 58:21 interview [1] - 23:12 INTO [1] - 1:2 investigating [1] -	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 justified [1] - 30:13	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28 learning [2] - 53:9, 70:13 leave [27] - 7:10, 7:27, 8:13, 9:11, 9:21,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 lost [1] - 50:7 lower [2] - 50:11, 50:22	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13 MATTHIAS [1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:10 McGARRY [1] - 2:17 McGARRY [1] - 2:21
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interaction [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11 interrupt [1] - 58:21 interview [1] - 23:12 INTO [1] - 1:2 investigating [1] - 15:20	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 justified [1] - 30:13	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28 learning [2] - 53:9, 70:13 leave [27] - 7:10, 7:27, 8:13, 9:11, 9:21, 9:22, 9:24, 10:21,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 lost [1] - 50:7 lower [2] - 50:11, 50:22 Luke [1] - 16:7	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13 MATTHIAS [1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:16 McCOURT [1] - 2:17 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 McGRATH [2] - 2:7,
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interactions [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11 interrupt [1] - 58:21 interview [1] - 23:12 INTO [1] - 1:2 investigating [1] - 15:20 investigation [10] -	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 justified [1] - 30:13 K KANE [1] - 2:28 KATE [1] - 4:3	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28 learning [2] - 53:9, 70:13 leave [27] - 7:10, 7:27, 8:13, 9:11, 9:21, 9:22, 9:24, 10:21, 11:7, 11:17, 11:26,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 lost [1] - 50:7 lower [2] - 50:11, 50:22 Luke [1] - 16:7 LUNCH [1] - 68:22	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13 MATTHIAS [1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:10 McGARRY [1] - 2:17 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 McGRATH [2] - 2:7, 2:27
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interactions [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11 interrupt [1] - 58:21 interview [1] - 23:12 INTO [1] - 1:2 investigating [1] - 15:20 investigation [10] - 14:8, 14:9, 15:2,	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 justified [1] - 30:13 K KANE [1] - 2:28 KATE [1] - 3:25 KEANE [1] - 4:3 keep [3] - 43:7, 59:8,	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28 learning [2] - 53:9, 70:13 leave [27] - 7:10, 7:27, 8:13, 9:11, 9:21, 9:22, 9:24, 10:21, 11:7, 11:17, 11:26, 12:3, 12:20, 13:5,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 lost [1] - 50:7 lower [2] - 50:11, 50:22 Luke [1] - 16:7 LUNCH [1] - 68:29	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13 MATTHIAS [1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:16 McCOURT [1] - 2:17 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 McGRATH [2] - 2:7, 2:27 MCGUINNESS [2] -
3:25, 3:30, 4:4 instruction [1] - 39:19 instructions [1] - 6:7 INSTRUMENT [1] - 1:7 intense [1] - 38:7 intention [1] - 16:27 interactions [1] - 56:5 interactions [1] - 37:28 interest [1] - 42:9 interesting [2] - 33:22, 33:25 intermittent [1] - 23:23 interpret [1] - 37:11 interrupt [1] - 58:21 interview [1] - 23:12 INTO [1] - 1:2 investigating [1] - 15:20 investigation [10] -	job [11] - 23:1, 27:25, 31:21, 35:24, 37:20, 37:24, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 56:10, 56:11 JOE [1] - 3:13 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:29 John [1] - 16:7 judge [1] - 64:15 Judge [1] - 9:13 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [1] - 48:29 June [1] - 52:17 just [1] - 34:26 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 justified [1] - 30:13 K KANE [1] - 2:28 KATE [1] - 4:3	27:27, 29:26, 29:29, 30:10, 57:8, 68:28 knows [1] - 29:2 L lack [1] - 35:3 landed [2] - 37:26, 43:28 large [1] - 56:4 last [5] - 19:29, 28:5, 38:18, 38:24, 57:23 law [3] - 16:2, 16:11, 59:18 lawful [1] - 20:17 LAWLOR [1] - 2:28 learning [2] - 53:9, 70:13 leave [27] - 7:10, 7:27, 8:13, 9:11, 9:21, 9:22, 9:24, 10:21, 11:7, 11:17, 11:26, 12:3, 12:20, 13:5, 13:6, 21:7, 21:13,	10:16, 13:4, 18:25, 19:3, 20:29, 22:22, 23:11, 25:3, 32:29, 35:18, 39:11, 47:2, 49:10, 52:28, 54:2, 54:6, 55:23, 65:21, 65:27, 70:3 looked [8] - 7:29, 8:5, 11:14, 13:15, 31:19, 36:11, 37:6, 50:1 looking [11] - 11:9, 13:24, 13:29, 20:29, 21:13, 22:2, 23:17, 35:20, 36:28, 52:15, 69:15 looks [2] - 13:1, 13:11 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 lost [1] - 50:7 lower [2] - 50:11, 50:22 Luke [1] - 16:7 LUNCH [1] - 68:22	MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 mastery [1] - 69:5 material [5] - 69:2, 69:6, 69:16, 70:4, 70:15 materials [1] - 70:1 MATT [1] - 3:18 matter [20] - 6:12, 16:19, 18:9, 18:17, 18:18, 20:26, 23:7, 32:20, 37:16, 40:21, 43:25, 50:18, 59:13, 60:2, 60:5, 60:17, 60:18, 61:15, 63:7 mattered [1] - 58:24 MATTERS [1] - 1:4 matters [4] - 34:23, 35:4, 41:27, 44:13 MATTHIAS [1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:10 McGARRY [1] - 2:17 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 McGRATH [2] - 2:7, 2:27

0.0 0.04 0.00 7.4
2:6, 3:24, 6:22, 7:4,
7:6, 7:9, 7:19, 7:21,
7:23, 9:3, 9:7, 9:18,
12:18, 13:14, 18:16,
12.10, 10.14, 10.10,
18:18, 18:19, 18:22, 19:14, 20:4, 20:11,
19:14, 20:4, 20:11,
21:26, 22:10, 22:15,
34:19, 40:10, 44:12,
44:13, 46:20, 54:15,
54:17, 54:19, 54:21,
54:29, 58:21, 59:26,
60:6, 60:8, 60:15,
60:19, 60:22, 60:28,
61:3, 61:11, 61:14,
61:27, 64:25, 64:27,
64:29, 66:16, 66:20,
66:24, 67:19, 67:21,
69:5, 69:29, 70:2
McLoughlin [5] -
53:27, 55:8, 57:20,
58:17, 61:11
MCLOUGHLIN [1] -
3:5
McLoughlin's [1] -
61:10
McLYNN [1] - 3:30
MCMAHON [1] - 3:7
MCPARTLIN[1] -
3:20
mean (26) - 15:14.
mean [26] - 15:14,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1,
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1, 65:19
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1, 65:19 meetings [1] - 18:12
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1, 65:19
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1, 65:19 meetings [1] - 18:12 melded [1] - 55:7
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1, 65:19 meetings [1] - 18:12 melded [1] - 55:7 MEMBER [1] - 2:2
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1, 65:19 meetings [1] - 18:12 melded [1] - 55:7 MEMBER [1] - 2:2 member [1] - 60:12
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1, 65:19 meetings [1] - 18:12 melded [1] - 55:7 MEMBER [1] - 2:2
15:23, 16:20, 17:14, 19:12, 27:11, 28:5, 28:6, 33:3, 34:6, 36:2, 37:2, 37:16, 40:4, 41:14, 42:27, 43:12, 43:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:1, 49:14, 52:7, 57:12, 65:2, 70:12 meant [5] - 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:12 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medically [1] - 51:10 meet [7] - 9:23, 13:22, 13:25, 14:22, 20:29, 64:16, 65:10 meeting [25] - 8:6, 12:12, 12:13, 12:17, 14:1, 14:13, 15:22, 18:7, 20:19, 24:13, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 32:14, 35:6, 35:18, 35:27, 37:5, 49:26, 49:27, 49:28, 65:1, 65:19 meetings [1] - 18:12 melded [1] - 55:7 MEMBER [1] - 2:2 member [1] - 60:12

memo [1] - 13:14 memory [1] - 12:29 mental [4] - 53:5, 55:3, 62:2, 66:26 mention [1] - 24:16 mentioned [1] -24:27 message [3] - 23:29, 24:8, 25:5 met [7] - 11:29, 17:15, 18:26, 32:19, 56:9, 59:13, 65:13 methods [1] - 70:14 MICHAEL [4] - 3:3, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 middle [2] - 25:22, 48:16 might [18] - 8:10, 18:24, 18:25, 19:10, 21:13, 22:22, 29:26, 34:1, 34:3, 37:9, 39:11, 41:2, 43:28, 45:27, 56:10, 56:28, 64:11, 70:1 $\boldsymbol{mildly}~[2] \boldsymbol{-} 25:16,$ 36.2 mind [3] - 45:15, 53:2, 57:8 mine [1] - 64:15 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 Minnock [1] - 42:7 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 Minnock's [1] -41:21 minute [1] - 44:17 minutes [2] - 13:16, 46.13 mislead [1] - 55:2 misreading [1] -11:13 misrecording [3] -46:22, 57:26, 58:13 missed [1] - 53:14 missing [2] - 47:13, 48:12 mistake [4] - 30:8,

mistake [4] - 30:8, 51:20, 58:9, 63:25 mistaken [1] - 58:6 mistrustful [1] - 30:5 misunderstood [1] -58:6 module [1] - 28:7 moment [9] - 15:28, 21:21, 48:26, 52:13, 59:8, 62:25, 66:15, 68:26, 68:27 Monaghan [13] -8:20, 9:19, 10:1, 10:17, 10:29, 13:15, 20:6, 23:16, 35:5,

35:6, 44:16, 44:23, 44:28 Monaghan's [1] -18:24 Monday [1] - 9:25 money [1] - 57:11 MONICA [1] - 3:15 month [1] - 12:26 months [5] - 12:26, 16:11, 25:15, 26:13, 38:10 morning [3] - 7:23, 7:24, 69:27 **MORONEY** [1] - 3:17 MORRISSEY [1] most [10] - 23:1. 23:24, 27:25, 31:20, 37:20, 37:24, 37:26, 44:1, 44:6, 56:11 motives [1] - 59:1 mount [1] - 61:23 mouth [1] - 20:12 move [3] - 46:14, 68:19, 69:17 moved [2] - 32:4, 42.3 MR [75] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:8, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:27, 2:28, 2:28, 3:12, 3:13, 3:16, 3:22, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:29, 3:30, 4:3, 5:5, 6:5, 6:11, 6:16, 6:18, 7:2, 7:4, 7:6, 7:9, 7:17, 7:21, 7:23, 9:3, 9:7, 9:18, 12:18, 13:14, 18:16, 18:18, 18:22, 19:14, 20:4, 20:11, 21:26, 22:10, 22:15, 34:19, 40:10, 44:13, 46:20, 54:17, 54:19, 54:21, 54:29, 60:8, 60:15, 60:19, 60:22, 60:28, 61:3, 61:11, 61:27, 64:27, 64:29, 66:20, 66:24, 67:19, 67:21, 70:6, 70:11 **MS**[10] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:29, 4:3 muddied [1] - 63:28 Mulcahy [2] - 29:13,

MURPHY [4] - 2:30, 3:22, 6:18, 7:2 Murphy).. [1] - 24:2 Murray [37] - 8:1, 8:21, 9:4, 10:4, 10:10, 10:20, 13:24, 13:29, 14:12, 14:21, 15:16, 16:22, 17:15, 20:9, 20:12, 20:25, 21:19, 22:1, 23:4, 23:17, 23:18, 24:19, 24:27, 26:3, 26:10, 26:15, 26:24, 26:26, 27:19, 28:12, 28:18, 34:11, 35:19, 41:24, 42:16, 49:25, 52:7 MURRAY [2] - 3:2, 3:8 Murray's [6] - 8:6, 11:29, 19:17, 32:14, 32:26, 36:1 musculoskeletal [1] - 66:27 must [1] - 43:22 MÍCHEÁL [1] - 3:23

Ν

nailed [1] - 45:13
name [2] - 29:27,
33:19
named [1] - 1:26
namely [1] - 8:13
names [1] - 29:29
nature [1] - 8:25
nearly [1] - 68:9
necessarily [1] 43:21
necessary [1] 68:15
neck [2] - 60:4, 60:18
need [7] - 6:27, 7:11,
13:20, 48:14, 49:10,

55:27 needed [1] - 14:3 neutral [2] - 30:29, 42:17 never [5] - 23:8,

24:26, 27:3, 32:9,

45:24 **new** [4] - 27:8, 53:25, 56:25, 70:15 **next** [13] - 7:19, 12:3, 22:15, 38:16, 44:2, 46:15, 66:10, 66:25, 67:3, 67:9, 67:15,

NICHOLAS [4] - 2:10, 4:1, 5:3, 7:16

67:23. 70:1

night [2] - 8:3, 17:16 **nil** [9] - 47:8, 47:10, 47:11, 47:13 nobody [3] - 23:18, 29:2, 33:22 **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 **NOREEN** [1] - 2:16 normal [4] - 39:14, 39:15, 64:8, 68:26 **NORTHUMBERLAN D**[1] - 2:18 note [8] - 6:22, 8:6, 17:21, 35:16, 36:11, 38:16, 38:28, 40:11 noted [1] - 8:4 notes [6] - 1:26, 32:27, 33:1, 34:13, 34:28, 35:21 nothing [15] - 15:22, 22:11, 29:25, 30:3, 30:4, 38:29, 39:14, 41:19, 44:25, 45:25, 45:27, 46:5, 47:28, 51:23, 52:7 **notice** [5] - 8:4, 8:5, 16:16, 16:19, 19:26 noticed [4] - 10:4, 32:22, 33:18, 41:21 notification [1] -18:24 noting [1] - 50:2 November [4] - 23:7, 38:9, 40:12, 44:19 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:13, 3:20 **number** [7] - 6:28, 7:21 7:25 11:15 22:16, 46:21, 56:4 **NYLAND**[1] - 3:18 **NÍ** [1] - 2:29 **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7

0

O'BRIEN [1] - 2:10
o'clock [1] - 68:20
O'CONNOR [1] 2:21
O'HIGGINS [1] - 3:23
O'MARA [1] - 2:17
O'NEILL [1] - 3:29
O'REARDON [1] 3:17
O'Sullivan [1] 13:27
O'SULLIVAN [1] 3:7
objection [1] - 39:22
obvious [2] - 39:29,

MULCAHY[1] - 3:4

multitude [1] - 67:22

MULLIGAN [2] -

30:16

2:11, 3:12

40:5 ones [1] - 66:29 obviously [22] - 11:6, 12:20, 16:21, 17:12, 17:14, 21:4, 27:3, 51:10 28:10, 30:5, 32:13, **op** [1] - 66:29 35:21, 40:23, 46:24, open [1] - 48:23 48:12, 49:6, 53:24, operate [1] - 67:8 56:6. 57:8. 61:5. 61:20, 67:28, 69:13 occupation [1] -68:1 66:14 operation [3] occupational [1] -57:28, 62:3, 68:3 67:24 operational [1] -OCTOBER [3] - 1:18, 6:2, 70:19 opportunity [3] -October [14] - 15:27, 69:13, 69:15, 69:20 22:19, 23:4, 23:29, option [4] - 52:19, 32:15, 32:20, 33:4, 52:20, 67:21, 67:26 35:6, 38:8, 47:16, 54:26, 55:6, 57:14, 66:3, 66:6, 66:9, 57:16 66:18, 67:2, 70:14 **OF** [9] - 1:2, 1:8, order [1] - 21:6 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, 3.15 offer [1] - 39:24 49:20, 59:16, 60:10, offered [1] - 45:5 60:20, 60:23, 61:2, **OFFICE** [1] - 3:26 61:6, 62:5, 62:21, office [16] - 15:20, 66:3, 66:7, 66:13, 22:29, 23:15, 23:20, 66:18, 66:23, 66:24, 23:26, 27:9, 27:11, 67:14 32:2, 32:3, 32:19, 37:20, 41:10, 41:12, 43:28, 44:3, 44:18 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, 16:23, 29:24 ORLA [1] - 3:20 officer [5] - 20:18, 26:29, 27:23, 42:18, **OTHER** [1] - 1:3 43:2 OGHUVBU [1] - 3:11 overall [1] - 52:27 Olivia [1] - 68:2 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:11, own [6] - 29:27, 3:29 34:28, 35:21, 39:20, **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 45.15 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 on.. [1] - 52:26 once [10] - 38:3, 45:11, 45:27, 46:1, 50:20, 52:4, 58:14, 60:9, 60:13, 60:24 one [29] - 11:28, 15:28, 18:5, 19:6, 20:22, 21:21, 25:11, 27:13, 28:19, 28:24, 39:25, 42:26, 47:14, 48:26, 49:3, 50:8, 52:16, 53:14, 56:17, 57:14, 59:7, 61:1, 65:22, 65:24, 66:1, 66:7, 66:13, 66:16, 66:17

ongoing [1] - 31:24 onwards [2] - 49:22, operated [1] - 55:13 operates [2] - 60:29, options [8] - 48:23, ordinarily [1] - 55:17 ordinary [17] - 41:14, original [2] - 21:20, originally [3] - 16:6, **OSMOND** [1] - 3:27 outlined [1] - 14:15 overtook [1] - 61:9

Ρ

PAF[1] - 35:5 **PAGE**[1] - 5:2 page [45] - 8:10, 8:29, 9:18, 9:28, 10:16, 11:14, 11:15, 13:19, 22:22, 23:12, 24:4, 24:22, 25:18, 25:21, 32:11, 32:15, 32:16, 38:17, 39:11, 39:13, 39:17, 47:2, 47:9, 47:10, 47:12, 47:20, 47:21, 48:15, 48:17, 48:18, 49:11,

57:17, 64:13, 65:29, 66:9, 66:10, 66:25, 67:3, 67:7, 67:9, 67:11, 67:15, 67:23 pages [1] - 48:25 paid [1] - 51:12 paper [2] - 42:4, 47:4 papers [7] - 8:29, 14:7, 14:27, 15:21, 32:16, 39:20, 42:7 paperwork [2] -14:10, 44:27 paragraph [3] -25:22, 26:23, 38:18 pardon [3] - 53:13, 58:3, 60:28 part [9] - 6:14, 15:2, 15:4, 17:15, 26:9, 26:25, 28:7, 36:18, 39:9 particular [1] - 53:25 parties [1] - 65:18 parts [3] - 32:27, 32:28 pass [2] - 6:28, 22:10 **PASSED**[1] - 1:4 passports [1] - 33:27 past [1] - 50:7 Pat [2] - 23:4, 41:24 **PATRICK** [4] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:27, 3:2 patrol [1] - 43:29 **PAUL** [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 3:30 pay [36] - 35:28, 51:2, 51:4, 51:15, 51:17, 51:27, 51:29, 52:6, 52:8, 52:11, 52:12, 54:10, 54:22, 54:23, 54:24, 55:4, 55:5, 55:7, 55:10, 55:14, 56:20, 57:2, 57:4, 57:9, 57:11, 57:29, 58:1, 58:14, 58:26, 59:1, 59:2, 59:16, 61:7, 61:17, 65:21, 70:9 penalisation [1] -56:28 penalised [2] -56:29. 57:1 **PEOPLE** [1] - 3:15 people [11] - 33:5, 33:23, 38:5, 41:14, 42:20, 68:27, 69:2, 69:12, 69:19, 70:3 per [1] - 13:22 perceived [1] - 41:4 percent [1] - 57:22

perhaps [14] - 8:28, 10:15, 18:9, 18:24, 22:22, 23:11, 28:15, 30:20, 31:24, 39:11, 45:27, 47:2, 51:9, period [7] - 12:16, 43:5, 46:26, 47:26, 48:28, 50:5, 63:26 period.. [1] - 22:24 permanent [6] -23:19, 26:12, 26:16, 26:28, 27:22, 44:4 permanently [1] -38:12 person [9] - 20:17, 33:25, 34:16, 42:18, 42:29, 43:7, 43:14, 43:16, 63:1 person's [1] - 34:2 personally [1] - 6:11 persons [1] - 34:10 **PETER** [1] - 3:13 **PHILIP** [1] - 2:5 phone [3] - 25:26, 25:29. 26:2 phones [1] - 37:21 picks [1] - 47:20 picture [1] - 52:27 pitch [1] - 31:22 **PLACE** [1] - 4:4 place [5] - 37:26, 41:11, 45:12, 51:5, 63:10 plateau [1] - 55:17 **pleased** [1] - 69:22 **ploy** [1] - 45:9 PM39 [1] - 32:17 PO [4] - 26:12, 26:16, 26:28. 38:3 point [44] - 11:3, 12:1, 15:7, 16:8, 16:18, 19:23, 19:24, 25:10, 25:19, 27:11, 28:19, 28:22, 30:14, 31:1, 31:6, 33:1, 35:23. 42:10. 42:14. 43:22, 44:28, 46:23, 50:3, 50:12, 51:18, 51:19, 55:5, 58:20, 59:11, 59:12, 59:15, 59:29, 60:1, 61:13, 63:8, 63:23, 66:19, 67:27, 68:18, 69:26 pointed [2] - 26:21, 26.22 points [3] - 11:28, 16:15, 44:10 policing [1] - 41:25

popped [1] - 26:29

Portlaoise [1] - 9:23 position [13] - 7:7, 11:5, 11:20, 11:25, 23:25, 38:5, 43:3, 43:16, 43:20, 56:6, 59:23, 68:26, 68:27 possibility [2] - 36:9, 36:17 **possible** [2] - 18:5, 42:18 possibly [2] - 16:18, post [1] - 66:28 practical [1] - 56:18 pragmatic [1] - 56:17 preceded [1] - 57:23 preceding [1] - 47:12 pregnancy [2] prejudiced [1] -63.13 preplanned [1] -12.11 **presence** [1] - 39:3 present [3] - 6:27, 23:18, 31:10 presented [2] -39:10, 66:20 PRESIDENT [2] -1:13, 2:3 presumably [2] -42:23, 49:16 $\textbf{presume} \ [2] \textbf{ - 21:7},$ 67:29 pretty [6] - 12:28, 25:13, 25:14, 38:2, 45:12, 45:26 previous [5] - 24:18, 29:7, 47:9, 50:8 previously [2] -45:11, 57:15 **printouts** [1] - 52:29 prisoners [2] -37:22, 43:4 problem [1] - 18:27 problems [1] - 16:14 procedure [1] -37:18 proceed [1] - 69:11 proceeded [1] - 6:29 proceedings [1] process [4] - 13:26, 56:7, 64:8, 69:17 processes [2] -63:10, 69:1 produce [2] - 17:21, 49:4 progress [3] - 35:3, 69:23. 70:4

perfectly [1] - 39:23

26:16, 26:19, 26:20, 18:17, 19:18, 29:25, refers [2] - 28:24, 11:2, 13:24, 16:18, progressing [1] -69:18 26:26, 26:27 37:5, 48:28, 57:5 42:2 17:23, 20:8, 20:14, prohibited [1] **putting** [9] - 23:19, reason [11] - 13:12, reflect [1] - 19:23 20:19, 28:13, 28:18, 28:28, 39:17, 57:15, 24:29, 25:16, 36:15, 20:24 17:3, 17:5, 19:5, 22:3, reflects [2] - 38:17, 41:9, 49:11, 62:15, 23:21, 23:26, 24:29, 57:16 proper [10] - 6:21, 53:8 8:23, 10:12, 10:22, 63:13, 67:27 25:2, 58:28, 67:5 refusal [1] - 18:24 reported [4] - 38:1, 19:28, 19:29, 20:4, reasonable [2] -38:7, 43:23, 57:15 refused [4] - 10:12, Q 20:9, 20:18, 22:8 19:23, 69:19 10:20, 13:8, 29:21 reporting [1] - 38:6 reasons [6] - 10:24, represent [1] - 53:15 **properly** [1] - 30:20 regarded [1] - 44:5 24:23, 24:26, 34:3, protected [23] - 8:19, representation [2] **regime** [1] - 51:5 **QUAY** [2] - 2:23, 13:25, 13:26, 14:14, 36:7. 36:16 23:6, 37:15 **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:5 2:30 15:6, 15:9, 15:10, receipt [2] - 18:23, regular [1] - 12:20 request [3] - 7:26, query [1] - 44:20 15:12, 15:24, 15:26, 33:20 8:20, 32:21 regularly [1] - 33:23 QUESTIONED [2] -16:3, 16:22, 20:16, received [2] - 20:15, requested [1] - 9:24 regulation [1] - 8:4 5:5, 7:16 20:21, 21:20, 28:6, 28:13 required [3] - 9:23, regulations [4] questions [2] - 6:23, 29:9, 29:24, 45:16, reclassification [1] -15:2, 20:6 10:6, 12:19, 55:11, 14:18 45:25, 47:28, 53:25, 61.8 requiring [2] - 20:13, 61:22 quickly [1] - 12:28 56:26 recognised [1] -69:4 reject [1] - 42:11 **QUINN** [1] - 3:10 PROTECTED [2] -59:23 research [1] - 70:11 relate [1] - 45:15 quite [4] - 49:5, 1:2, 1:3 recollect [1] - 38:24 RESOLUTIONS [1] related [51] - 14:8, 52:17, 67:9, 70:12 protection [1] recollection [7] -1:4 14:13, 15:8, 23:3, 14:14 12:9, 12:17, 21:2, RESOURCES [1] -23:23, 24:12, 24:17, R **provide** [1] - 8:24 37:4, 40:17, 55:28, 25:18, 27:15, 27:18, 3:15 provided [1] - 66:27 56:2 responsible [2] -27:21, 27:28, 28:1, public [24] - 22:29, recommendation [1] 28:4, 28:8, 34:22, 54:4, 68:3 raise [6] - 20:23, 23:19, 23:25, 26:28, - 56:16 rest [1] - 42:29 38:14, 48:3, 48:28, 21:11, 37:2, 44:20, 27:8, 27:11, 27:22, recommended [1] -49:3. 49:9. 49:17. restored [3] - 55:10, 44:24, 44:25 32:2, 33:26, 33:28, 55:14 51:2, 53:19, 55:7, 55:14 57:2 raised [5] - 24:13, 34:16, 37:19, 37:23, record [4] - 23:20, 56:21, 57:29, 58:8, resubmit [1] - 10:25 32:9, 32:10, 53:29, 37:28, 37:29, 41:10, 24:28, 25:2, 47:19 58:25, 59:17, 61:5, result [9] - 36:5, 55:9 41:12, 41:25, 43:28, recorded [5] - 31:25, 61:16, 61:22, 61:24, 51:14, 53:16, 53:23, raising [2] - 44:29, 44:3, 44:18, 55:10, 38:19, 39:29, 53:16, 62:17, 62:18, 63:4, 55:9, 57:27, 60:25, 53:18 57:19 60:10 63:9, 63:17, 64:21, 61:7, 63:21 ranks [1] - 14:10 publicly [1] - 13:28 recording [2] -64:22, 65:9, 65:11, resulted [1] - 64:12 rate [12] - 50:22, pull [2] - 34:16, 23:22 59:5 65:14, 65:17, 66:28, resulting [2] - 49:18, 51:12, 51:27, 52:6, 45:28 records [5] - 42:26, 67:27, 68:8, 68:10, 56:27 52:8, 52:10, 52:12, **punishing** [1] - 51:6 42:27, 42:28, 47:3, 68:12 resume [3] - 68:26, 54:10, 55:4, 55:18, punishment [1] -65:16 relates [2] - 7:25, 69:26, 70:8 57:11, 58:14 43:21 recoup [1] - 21:6 9:18 **RESUMED**[3] - 6:1, rather [4] - 27:9, purporting [1] -**REDDY** [1] - 4:4 relating [2] - 28:13, 46:17, 68:22 50:10. 51:5. 51:14 36:29 reduce [1] - 51:15 51:26 **RETIRED** [7] - 3:4, rationale [2] - 41:26, purpose [5] - 8:14, reduced [14] - 22:28, relation [17] - 13:14, 3:6, 3:6, 3:7, 3:10, 56:24 11:7, 11:18, 42:27, 23:5, 51:12, 54:23, 14:7, 16:14, 24:27, 3:12, 3:13 re [3] - 6:6, 9:21, 65:19 retired [1] - 16:7 54:24, 55:4, 55:18, 25:1, 26:23, 27:22, 10:19 pursue [1] - 6:8 57:11, 58:1, 59:17, 28:10. 28:15. 31:8. retrospective[1] re-examined [1] - 6:6 pursuing [1] - 6:14 59:22, 60:14, 60:15, 32:19, 37:16, 42:1, 13:9 reached [2] - 59:2, put [37] - 16:15, 44:15, 44:20, 46:22, 61:18 retrospectively [2] -63.7 16:19, 17:19, 20:12, reducing [2] - 51:17, 65.7 12:21, 12:23 read [6] - 20:16, 22:7, 23:24, 23:26, 62.4 relatively [1] - 70:7 review [4] - 23:7, 40:8, 40:15, 47:22, 25:3, 25:5, 26:12, relevant [4] - 6:6, reduction [6] -40:14, 40:16, 65:20 68:5. 68:8 26:20, 27:14, 27:24, 46:23, 51:4, 57:29, 18:13, 48:22, 50:19 reviewed [5] - 40:10, reading [3] - 28:25, 31:20, 33:25, 34:16, 60:24, 60:26, 61:3 relevantly [1] - 69:7 40:12, 40:17, 40:19, 32:10, 68:11 36:2, 37:19, 38:3, **reductions** [1] - 51:3 remember [5] -40.21 ready [1] - 57:11 38:17, 42:18, 42:29, 11:11, 29:11, 30:19, refer [2] - 8:28, 24:4 right-hand [2] real [2] - 23:26, 25:2 43:15, 44:2, 44:4, 35:19. 49:27 reference [5] - 9:21, 48:17, 67:10 realise [2] - 31:15, 53:17, 55:27, 56:3, 10:19, 32:17, 34:27, removed [1] - 34:4 **ROAD** [1] - 2:18 69.2 56:20, 60:22, 62:14, remuneration [1] -36:12 Ronan [1] - 18:20 realised [2] - 63:3, 63:9, 63:19, 63:20, referred [3] - 24:20, 50:22 rotate [1] - 44:3 64:10, 67:12, 69:6 25:29, 32:11 rephrase [1] - 51:8 roughly [2] - 46:1 reality [1] - 47:18 puts [6] - 26:15, referring [1] - 36:7 report [14] - 10:24, round [1] - 31:18 really [8] - 9:9, 18:9,

route [2] - 18:5, 18:6 37:13, 49:15, 50:6, shorter [1] - 57:24 2:11, 2:18, 2:22, 2:30, 68:16 run [1] - 46:28 58:24 shortly [1] - 25:12 4:4 statements [5] runs [1] - 47:14 **select** [3] - 66:24, **shots** [2] - 52:20, **solution** [1] - 56:18 31:9, 31:11, 31:13, RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 67:14, 67:24 65:28 solved [1] - 18:27 57:24, 61:28 selected [2] - 66:8, someone [3] - 43:27, station [22] - 8:3, **show** [1] - 41:8 23:1, 23:25, 24:1, 67:16 shows [4] - 15:7, 53:14, 65:24 S 24:7, 25:6, 26:14, sends [1] - 50:1 47:23, 67:3, 67:10 somewhat [1] senior [2] - 20:18, 68:28 26:18, 27:25, 31:10, sick [22] - 23:20, **salary** [2] - 46:23, 31:21, 32:1, 32:2, 29:26 23:22, 24:28, 25:1, somewhere [1] -63:11 33:5, 33:26, 37:20, sense [6] - 11:2, 28:2, 35:1, 39:4, 19.19 **SAMS**[11] - 52:19, 15:23, 33:29, 44:24, soon [1] - 12:12 37:24, 42:18, 43:2, 46:22, 47:1, 47:16, 52:23, 52:28, 53:5, 45:1. 62:18 47:24, 49:1, 50:16, sore [2] - 60:4, 60:17 43:22, 44:7, 68:1 59:4, 60:23, 62:7, sensible [1] - 43:15 51:17, 63:18, 65:9, **status** [1] - 55:2 sorry [27] - 8:2, 9:3, 64:16, 65:28, 67:29, stays [1] - 52:16 sent [2] - 10:16, 42:8 65:13, 65:16, 65:25, 18:8, 27:22, 34:26, 70:14 stenographic [1] -65:26, 70:9 September [2] -35:16, 35:17, 36:13, **SANDRA**[1] - 4:3 sickness [5] - 34:21, 10.3 49.2 39:26, 40:19, 44:22, sat [1] - 37:5 50:20, 65:8, 65:28, stenography [1] sequence [3] -47:15, 51:8, 51:24, **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 11:11, 54:29, 66:2 67:13 54:18, 54:28, 57:6, **save** [1] - 13:6 side [3] - 37:3, 48:17, 58:19, 58:21, 59:11, STENOGRAPHY [1] sequential [1] saved [2] - 57:11, 54.17 62:29, 63:28, 64:25, - 1:29 57:12 67:19, 68:7 step [2] - 66:21 Sergeant [17] - 8:20, sign [3] - 27:12, saw [1] - 36:5 9:19, 10:1, 10:17, 33:19 sort [9] - 17:18, step-by-step [1] -SC [10] - 2:6, 2:7, 10:29, 13:15, 18:23, signature [7] - 39:11, 19:23, 19:25, 30:11, 66:21 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:27, 39:12, 39:14, 39:15, 35:27, 37:14, 39:18, STEPHANIE [1] -20:6, 23:16, 35:4, 3:22, 3:23, 3:23, 4:3 40:11, 48:15 35:6, 44:13, 44:16, 39:21, 39:22, 39:23 2.27 **SCANLAN**[1] - 3:8 44:23, 44:27, 44:28, signed [1] - 10:29 sound [1] - 28:20 **STEPHEN**[1] - 2:21 scheduled [1] -45:4 significance [1] specific [4] - 8:25, stick [1] - 46:9 11:26 SERGEANT [5] -50:13 24:26, 24:28, 48:28 still [5] - 10:22, scheduling [1] -3:12, 3:19, 4:2, 4:2, specifically [2] signing [1] - 33:27 61:17, 62:4, 65:13, 27.20 4:3 28:26. 69:3 67:1 simple [5] - 17:27, scheme [1] - 50:20 sergeant [6] - 10:5, 18:4, 59:8, 59:11, specify [2] - 52:21, stood [1] - 12:1 screen [13] - 8:11, 21:27, 21:29, 24:1, 66:28 stopped [1] - 20:28 8:17, 19:26, 19:27, 44:16, 45:27 speculating [1] **simply** [3] - 6:28, story [1] - 18:3 20:1, 20:5, 22:26, **serious** [2] - 28:8, 23:4, 69:14 19:17 straight [1] - 46:28 27:1, 47:23, 52:20, 33.3 single [4] - 47:1, spotted [1] - 32:11 **STREET** [3] - 2:12, 65:27, 66:4, 67:4 48:15, 67:17, 67:21 servant [1] - 46:29 stage [8] - 16:10, 3:27, 3:31 scroll [4] - 8:17, SINÉAD [1] - 4:3 25:15, 26:27, 37:28, serve [1] - 32:20 stress [39] - 23:3, 48:29, 67:7, 67:11 served [4] - 8:4, SINéAD[1] - 2:7 45:9, 53:2, 58:12, 23:23, 24:13, 24:17, scrutinised [1] - 38:1 14:7, 14:27, 15:21 58:15 sit [1] - 68:25 24:20, 27:15, 27:18, scrutiny [1] - 38:7 service [1] - 55:11 stakeholders [2] sitting [2] - 38:4, 27:21, 27:28, 28:1, SEAN [4] - 1:12, 2:2, Services [1] - 1:24 30:11, 56:8 28:4, 28:8, 33:3, 46.10 2:22, 3:17 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 six [4] - 16:11, 19:6, stamped [1] - 10:3 38:14, 47:28, 49:3, **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 set [2] - 14:4, 39:20 47:17, 47:23 standards [1] - 41:24 49:9, 49:17, 53:19, second [2] - 43:13, shakiest [1] - 33:26 sixth [1] - 47:25 start [6] - 16:5, 55:7, 56:21, 58:8, 67:18 58:25, 61:5, 61:16, 31:15, 39:27, 47:6, shaking [4] - 33:18, slightly [4] - 9:28, seconds [1] - 46:13 62:6, 66:1 61:22, 61:24, 62:18, 34:2, 34:3, 40:7 17:19, 47:22, 51:9 **Section** [1] - 43:9 63:17, 64:22, 64:23, started [2] - 16:10, **SHANE** [1] - 3:22 **slowly** [1] - 66:17 secured [1] - 55:9 **SHANKEY**[1] - 3:21 **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 65:9, 65:11, 65:15, see [27] - 13:20, 65:17, 67:27, 68:8, starts [1] - 32:17 SHANKEY-SMITH SMITHFIELD [1] -15:28, 24:6, 25:12, 68:10, 68:12 State [1] - 68:10 [1] - 3:2131:8, 31:12, 32:16, **STATE** [1] - 3:26 stressful [8] - 23:1, **SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 smoothly [2] - 69:17, 32:26, 34:5, 38:24, 23:24, 27:25, 31:20, state [1] - 46:29 **SHEAHAN**[1] - 3:18 69.18 39:15, 40:3, 41:15, 31:21, 37:20, 37:24, so-called [1] - 41:5 statement [23] - 8:9, sheet [1] - 42:4 48:1, 48:16, 48:24, 44:8 8:11, 10:4, 11:6, **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:24 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 48:27, 52:17, 52:23, **struggled** [1] - 45:6 11:13, 11:29, 15:4, shift [2] - 25:14, solicitor [2] - 48:7, 57:4, 61:24, 62:26, stuff [7] - 22:7, 27:2, 15:27, 17:19, 22:22, 66:2, 66:11, 66:12, 34:12, 38:6, 40:8, 23:10, 24:20, 27:24, shifts [1] - 45:7 **SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:8 66:13, 67:8 43:11, 48:8 29:12, 30:6, 30:17, SHIP [1] - 3:27 SOLICITOR'S [1] seem [8] - 13:11, stumbling [1] - 62:8 30:22, 31:16, 38:29, 3:26 **short** [3] - 12:16, 19:4, 32:23, 35:7, stupid [1] - 9:1 44:14, 55:26, 55:29, 34:28, 70:7 SOLICITORS [5] -

sub [1] - 66:26 subject [5] - 6:26, 23:28, 55:20, 69:3, 69:5 submission [2] -20:22, 70:8 submissions [1] -6:24 **submitting** [1] - 11:2 subsequent [1] -50:27 subsequently [2] -50:21, 55:5 substantial [1] -48:12 suffering [5] - 23:3, 24:16, 27:15, 27:28, 59:20 suggest [3] - 17:5, 56:23, 62:1 suggesting [4] -27:19, 37:16, 51:9, 53:15 suggestion [1] -18:22 **summary** [1] - 48:27 summer [1] - 29:19 **Sunday** [1] - 57:16 super [3] - 19:3, 29:27, 39:17 Super [1] - 52:7 **super's** [1] - 15:20 **SUPERINTENDENT** [15] - 2:15, 3:2, 3:3, 3:4, 3:4, 3:5, 3:8, 3:8, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:18, 3:19, 3:20 superintendent [5] -14:6, 14:26, 29:13, 32:21, 50:2 Superintendent [50] - 8:1, 8:6, 8:20, 9:4, 10:4, 10:10, 10:20, 11:29, 13:23, 13:29, 14:12, 14:21, 15:16, 16:22, 17:15, 19:17, 20:9, 20:12, 20:25, 21:18, 22:1, 23:4, 23:17, 23:18, 24:2, 24:19, 24:27, 26:3, 26:10, 26:15, 26:23, 26:26, 27:19, 28:12, 28:18, 30:16, 32:14, 32:26, 34:11, 35:18, 36:1, 42:16, 49:25, 52:10, 53:26, 55:8, 57:20, 58:16, 61:10, 61:11 superintendent's [1] - 23:15

supported [1] -13:28 **suppose** [9] - 18:5, 19:8, 19:16, 19:20, 29:25, 37:11, 56:23, 57:1, 63:23 supposed [3] -13:26, 21:1, 61:23 surgery/post [1] -66:29 suspect [1] - 23:26 suspend [1] - 69:25 suspended [13] -23:28, 25:4, 25:13, 25:17, 28:17, 28:25, 28:27, 29:2, 29:3, 31:27, 33:5, 40:26, 41:3 suspension [10] -28:11, 29:11, 30:13, 30:18, 30:21, 30:22, 31:1, 31:8, 31:15, 39:2 suspicions [1] -28.14 switch [1] - 48:25 system [31] - 47:19, 48:23, 49:13, 49:18, 50:24, 50:26, 51:14, 52:2, 52:9, 52:19, 52:24, 53:17, 55:3,

support [1] - 45:6

Т

SÍOCHÁNA [1] - 3:2

Síochána [3] - 16:3,

57:28, 58:9, 59:4,

60:23, 60:25, 62:3,

62:7, 62:12, 64:16,

67:2, 67:13, 68:1,

68:3. 70:14

16:9, 56:12

65:28, 65:29, 66:29,

T&N [1] - 3:30
tab [2] - 68:7, 68:12
tail [1] - 47:20
taking" [1] - 36:26
TARA [1] - 3:21
target [1] - 57:28
targeted [1] - 63:12
targeting [6] - 21:19,
21:21, 22:3, 40:22,
40:25, 45:22
team [1] - 31:11
technical [1] - 69:4
TEMPLE [1] - 2:31
tended [1] - 31:24
tere [1] - 61:25

term [3] - 12:10, 12:11, 45:8 terms [9] - 12:18, 14:25, 20:26, 21:4, 28:11, 35:26, 51:4, 56:6, 67:3 that's.. [1] - 13:13 **THE** [10] - 1:3, 1:7, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 6:1, 46:17, 68:22, 70:19 their.. [1] - 21:3 themselves [2] -63:3. 69:16 **THEN** [3] - 46:17, 68:22, 70:19 therefore [5] - 6:22, 23:1, 41:8, 41:9, 51:2 they've [1] - 65:12 thinking [2] - 43:10, 64:26 third [1] - 38:24 three [3] - 38:18, 47:10, 49:1 threshold [3] - 59:2, 59:13 63:7 throughout [1] - 28:9 THURSDAY [2] -1:18, 6:1 timing [1] - 25:3 tip [1] - 50:21 tipping [1] - 50:12 **TO**[1] - 7:16 today [2] - 69:3, 69:26 together [1] - 55:8 **TOM** [1] - 3:12 tomorrow [1] - 70:5 took [4] - 9:22,

52:15, 55:21, 66:8, 66:13 topic [1] - 70:8 topics [1] - 69:9 total [1] - 50:6 TOWNPARKS [1] -2:12 transcript [1] - 1:25

44:19, 56:19, 57:21

top [6] - 10:9, 47:7,

transcript [1] - 1:26 trapped [2] - 38:4, 45:12 TREACY [1] - 2:27 Tribunal [5] - 6:12

Tribunal [5] - 6:12, 7:9, 8:10, 56:3, 56:4 **TRIBUNAL** [2] - 1:2, 2:6

TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8 tried [2] - 16:6, 45:8 tripped [2] - 58:14, 60:24 TRR [4] - 50:22,
54:23, 55:18, 62:4
true [2] - 32:27,
36:18
trust [1] - 36:2
truth [1] - 32:28
trying [7] - 17:12,
19:11, 21:21, 21:22,
41:24, 42:17, 63:24
turn [2] - 39:24, 66:9
turned [2] - 38:11,
53:23
TURNER [1] - 2:27
turns [1] - 38:29

TURNER [1] - 2:27 turns [1] - 38:29 twigged [1] - 26:29 two [9] - 12:26, 38:10, 43:28, 44:10, 46:13, 49:1, 59:4, 68:20

U

unbeknownst [2] -

under [17] - 8:19,

ultimately [2] -

59:22. 63:21

12:5, 12:6

10:5, 12:25, 21:23, 24:19, 27:7, 28:4, 28:8, 33:3, 38:7, 49:13, 50:19, 60:23, 61:6, 61:22, 66:18, 67.14 **UNDER** [2] - 1:2, 1:8 underestimated [1] -50:9 **undo** [1] - 13:5 unfortunately [2] -52:23. 59:21 unhappy [1] - 45:5 unit [9] - 26:19, 26:21, 26:26, 26:28, 27:7, 27:9, 32:4, 43:27 units [3] - 26:17, 41:15, 42:3 unless [1] - 13:20 unofficial [1] - 68:27 unrelated [1] - 41:26 **UNTIL** [1] - 70:19 **up** [42] - 10:9, 12:11, 12:28, 20:1, 23:15, 25:24, 26:5, 26:29, 33:6, 34:22, 36:14, 39:3, 39:17, 43:26, 47:9, 47:12, 47:14, 47:20, 47:23, 47:25, 48:11. 48:15. 49:22.

50:2, 50:4, 50:5, 50:6,

50:8, 52:15, 53:2, 54:13, 54:16, 57:11, 57:12, 59:11, 59:12, 61:13, 63:7, 64:19, 66:4, 66:12, 67:4 **upshot** [3] - 56:23, 57:1, 57:23 **useful** [2] - 65:1, 69:12

٧

vague [1] - 17:19

verbatim [1] - 1:25 version [1] - 35:21 **via** [1] - 16:6 victimised [1] -63:13 victimising [1] -21:24 view [11] - 6:8, 6:11, 19:23, 19:24, 25:2, 25:5, 34:16, 37:19, 39:25, 56:17, 67:12 viewed [1] - 41:6 **viral** [11] - 48:24, 49:1, 49:14, 53:18, 58:25, 59:28, 60:23, 61:4, 62:15, 67:5, 67:14 viral" [1] - 48:21 visible [2] - 42:20 Volume [2] - 47:2, 65:29 volume [1] - 48:26

W

wage [1] - 54:12 wait [1] - 53:10 waiting [1] - 46:10 wants [2] - 6:24, waters [1] - 63:29 week [2] - 39:7, 58:15 WELLINGTON [1] -2:30 WESTMEATH[1] -3:32 Westmeath [1] -32:22 whammy [1] - 32:5 whatsoever [1] -65:12 Wheatley [1] - 52:10 WHEATLEY [1] - 3:4 whereas [1] - 27:7

whereby [1] - 59:2 you're.. [1] - 19:25 whistleblower [3] yourself [4] - 17:6, 26:5, 41:5, 41:11 21:9, 25:9, 33:2 whistleblower... [1] -25:24 É whistleblowers [2] -13:28, 57:9 **ÉABHALL**[1] - 2:29 **WHITE** [1] - 3:10 **ÉIREANN**[2] - 1:4, whole [3] - 18:27, 45:18, 45:23 Wilson [1] - 16:7 Ó window [3] - 35:20, 36:28, 37:6 winning [2] - 41:5, **Ó** [1] - 3:6 41:7 wise [1] - 21:16 wish [3] - 6:8, 10:22, 39:21 witness [2] - 14:8, 39:24 **WITNESS** [2] - 5:2, 9:8 witnesses [4] - 6:25, 48:22, 49:16, 61:21 wondering [2] -17:21, 18:27 word [6] - 31:26, 42:17, 46:3, 53:14, 54:6, 63:16 wording [1] - 31:4 words [1] - 20:12 worried [1] - 26:6 worry [2] - 56:27, 62:24 worth [1] - 64:1 write [1] - 17:28 writing [3] - 14:16, 18:23, 49:25 written [5] - 19:9, 19:11, 42:28, 61:16, 63:3 wrote [5] - 9:16, 19:15, 59:27, 59:28, 64:3 Y **ye** [2] - 16:19 year [12] - 29:8, 45:27, 46:1, 47:7, 47:8, 47:13, 47:18, 48:11, 49:12, 63:21, 63:27 years [4] - 46:28, 47:11, 50:8, 50:9 yesterday [9] - 8:1, 25:11, 25:29, 26:29, 28:12, 32:12, 36:11, 37:25, 44:26