TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE

ON FRIDAY, 25TH OCTOBER 2019 - DAY 108

108

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR.

DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC PATRICK MARRINAN SC SINÉAD McGRATH BL JOHN DAVIS, SOLICITOR MR. MS. MR.

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY

& GARDA DAVID TURNER: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY

RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURRAY 10. 11.

13.

SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15.

INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16.

16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE

BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON
INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN

30.

31.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN

34.

35.

SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 36. 37.

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL PAUL CONNELLAN

T&N McLYNN BASTION COURT

11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR.

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. SINÉAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

I NDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH	
CDOSS_EVANTNED BY MD MIDDLY	6

1	THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON FRIDAY, 25TH	
2	OCTOBER 2019:	
3		
4	MR. MURPHY: Good morning, Chair.	
5	CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Just before we start, I 10:	36
6	would like to welcome our registrar, Mr. Peter	
7	Kavanagh, and to acknowledge the sterling service	
8	offered by Mr. Philip Barnes, our office officer, in	
9	his absence. So take a bow, Mr. Barnes, and welcome,	
10	Mr. Kavanagh. Thanks very much.	37
11	MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chair.	
12	CHAIRMAN: Now, where were we? Yes, I think you were	
13	cross-examining Garda Keogh.	
14		
15	GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH CONTINUED TO BE CROSS-EXAMINED BY 10:	37
16	MR. MURPHY, AS FOLLOWS:	
17		
18	MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chairman. I propose this morning to	
19	move into issue number 12.	
20	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	37
21	MR. MURPHY: Issue number 12 is the issue raised by	
22	Garda Keogh by way of complaint in relation to the	
23	alleged misrecording of his sick leave and reduction in	
24	salary.	
25	CHAIRMAN: Yes, misrecording of sick leave, yes, 10:	37
26	certainly, we have been touching on that once or twice.	
27	Yes, okay, you know where we are, Garda Keogh.	
28	WI TNESS: Yes.	
29	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	

1	1 Q.	MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, just to try and shorten
2		matters, I think Mr. McGuinness took you through a lot
3		of documents last week in relation to the question of
4		sick pay related documents and sick related documents,
5		and, in particular, he put to you in part some of the
6		evidence of Garda Olivia Kelly of Athlone Garda
7		Station. Can I just ask you at the outset, do you
8		accept that Garda Olivia Kelly was the person
9		responsible for making the relevant inputs in relation
10		to the SAMS system, relative to this issue?

10:38

10:38

A. I can't answer that, because I don't know, but I understand that. Judge, just for your information, I understand there is load of Volumes, 53 and 54 are after arriving. I see them behind me. I understand there's stuff in Volume 53 to do with this particular matter, which I have not or my legal team had an opportunity to read.

CHAIRMAN: Very good.

Q. MR. MURPHY: well, insofar as I am going to ask you questions this morning, I will confine them for moment to the documents that don't exist in that folder and we will see where we stand thereafter. But can I say to you, in terms of Olivia Kelly's document, you've had this one for a long time. Can you be given Volume 12, page 3640, please. Can you be given that, please?

MR. O'BRIEN: Chairman, I hate to interrupt Mr. Murphy. CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. O'Brien.

MR. O'BRIEN: I just notice that my leader and the rest of my team are just not present at the moment. I

1	wonder could we ask you for perhaps two minutes to	
2	allow them to arrive.	
3	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Barnes is going to check up, they	
4	possibly are having a cup of coffee or something like	
5	that, assuming that I am going to be a bit later.	0:39
6	MR. O'BRIEN: I think they are here	
7	CHAIRMAN: All is well, Mr. O'Brien, all is well. Not	
8	that Garda Keogh wasn't extremely well served,	
9	nevertheless, it's perfectly understandable Mr. Kelly,	
10	you were right to assume probably that I would be later $_{ ext{10}}$	0:39
11	than I am. So, no problem.	
12	WITNESS: Judge, can I just point out to my legal team	
13	as well, just for clarification, that there is Volumes	
14	53 and 54, which none of us well, I certainly	
15	haven't got to read and they do relate to this	0 : 40
16	particular topic that I am due to be cross-examined on.	
17	CHAIRMAN: Let me stop for a moment. Mr. McGuinness,	
18	do you know anything about this?	
19	MR. McGUINNESS: well, I am obviously concerned that	
20	there is a complaint from the witness in relation to	0 : 40
21	material which he says he hasn't seen. There is	
22	material in Volume 53 relating to Ms. Carr and a series	
23	of e-mails. I had opened most of them. I think	
24	there's only one or two	
25	CHAIRMAN: Say again, Mr. McGuinness.	0 : 40
26	MR. McGUINNESS: There's only one or two perhaps extra	
27	relevant documents. I would be perhaps unhappy to	
28	proceed with this issue, particularly if there's a	
29	protest or a disadvantage being felt.	

CHAIRMAN: Yes, I understand. If I understand it, just	
so we are all in the clear about where we go, the	
Tribunal seeks information from everywhere that it	
thinks there might possibly be relevant material. But,	
as will have been noticed in the opening statement, we	10:41
do, of course, depend on other people to provide it.	
Which is not to say that I am critical of the provision	
of materials, because I don't know what the	
circumstances are which led to delays in supplying	
material and people have other things to do and so on.	10:41
So, I am not getting into a finger wagging exercise.	
But, we do get in material as the inquiry progresses.	
Would I like it to be otherwise? Well, take a guess!	
I had hoped that we would have served all material, in	
fact, I naively gave, I suppose you could call it, an	10:42
instruction that nothing was to be served after the	
31st July. Well, we live and learn. Material comes in	
that comes in later and that may or may not be relevant	
as I see it or as we see it, but somebody else may say	
that has a different relevance. So, in this situation,	10:42
after that little introduction to explain how the	
situation happens; if somebody wants to make a	
complaint, they can do so in writing and I will	
consider that as to whether rebukes ought to be	
delivered. But I am not going to do so on the blind or	10:42
I am not going to do so without having information as	
to the reason for any late furnishing of materials. I	
am dealing with the fact, and Garda Keogh says, look	
here, there's stuff coming in and I think there's	

1	material relevant to it and I think it is irresistible	
2	that he is entitled to look at that.	
3		
4	So, I think, Mr. Murphy, we will move on. We can come	
5	back to issue 12 on the assumption that the next	10:43
6	issue if it is convenient for you to do so,	
7	Mr. Murphy.	
8	MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chairman.	
9	CHAIRMAN: We will leave issue 12, come back to issue	
10	12 when everybody has had an opportunity of taking	10:43
11	account of the materials in Volumes 51 and 52. For a	
12	final comment: One of the issues that every Tribunal	
13	wrestles with is the spectra of disclosure and the	
14	apprehension that it might happen, that it has been	
15	sitting on some piece of paper somewhere in its	10:43
16	archives, that it hasn't disclosed to somebody and then	
17	a party, rightly or whatever, a party alleges that that	
18	material should have been disclosed. So, we live under	
19	a cloud of concern about disclosure. Should it be so?	
20	I don't know. That's another day's work that we might	10:44
21	address at the very end of the Tribunal, but we don't	
22	need to do it now.	
23		
24	So, with those, some necessary, some unnecessary	
25	remarks	10:44
26	MR. MURPHY: Chairman, in those circumstances, could I	
27	ask the indulgence of five minutes just to take	
28	instructions. I intended to proceed in relation to the	
29	commendation issue but I need to discuss with	

1	Mr. Kelly, to make the certain that he not going to	
2	make point in relation to that issue.	
3	CHAIRMAN: Certainly. If you want to check out so	
4	that we want to cover an issue that isn't troubled by	
5	this particular point, okay.	10:44
6	MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
7	CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness, are we happy with that?	
8	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, Chairman, no objection at all.	
9	CHAIRMAN: Okay, very good. That gives me an	
10	opportunity to go back to the speeches. Thank you.	10:45
11		
12	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED, AS	
13	FOLLOWS:	
14		
15	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	10:55
16	MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman. I have had an	
17	opportunity to speak to Mr. Kelly and, having reviewed	
18	the issues, what is proposed is that we will deal with	
19	number 15, which is complaints in relation to the	
20	alleged denial of commendations.	10:55
21	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
22	MR. MURPHY: And, if time permits, we will then move to	
23	deal with number 17, which relates to the allegations	
24	in relation to the Ó Cualáin investigation.	
25	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Very good. If it at all possible, I	10:55
26	think we will proceed to lunchtime without a break.	
27	But equally, let me know if, you know, if you really	
28	can't manage. Okay, thanks. So, we are on number 17,	
29	is that right? Commendations.	

1			MR. MURPHY: No, 15.	
2			CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, 15, commendations. Sorry.	
3	3	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I think, Garda Keogh, you gave evidence	
4			last week in relation to these issues. Can I just deal	
5			with the first of the three issues, which is the	10:56
6			question of the incident involving the stabbing of the	
7			taxi driver on 3/8/2015?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	4	Q.	With that in mind, could you be shown Volume 1, please,	
10			page 137. This is your statement made to the Tribunal.	10:56
11			Can I draw your attention, please, to paragraph 17,	
12			under the heading "denial of commendations", which is	
13			the last paragraph on the page. Thank you. There, I	
14			think, your complaint is summarised in the following	
15			terms, you say	10:57
16		Α.	Sorry, just the last paragraph on this page relates	
17			to	
18	5	Q.	The paragraph heading is "17. Denial of	
19			commendations", your statement?	
20		Α.	Yes, but you said the last paragraph under	10:57
21	6	Q.	No, I said the last paragraph marked "Denial of	
22			Commendations" 17. Do you see that?	
23		Α.	Are we on the next page, 138.	
24	7	Q.	137. Do you see that, Garda Keogh?	
25		Α.	Is's the paragraph to do with taxi driver under "Denial	10:57
26			of commendations" or the next paragraph on the page?	
27	8	Q.	It's the paragraph under "Denial of commendations". I	
28			will just read it to you.	

"A taxi driver was stabbed in Athlone on 3rd August 2015. I was involved in the case. I had seized the bloodstained clothes and the car for technical investigation. It was regarded as a success in that inter alia the crime was detected, the scene was preserved and suspects were apprehended. However, I was taken off the Pulse report. I was taken off the case completely. It was as if any successful operation in which I was involved was to be airbrushed."

10:57

10:58

10:58

10:59

Now, that's the complaint you made to the Tribunal at the outset in relation to this matter. You had been involved, you had done something of practical impact, that you were taken off the case completely and because it was a successful operation, it appeared to you that you were being airbrushed out of history in relation to the conduct of that investigation.

Now, in terms of the investigation itself, I think you have told us in your evidence, and there is no need to review that particular point, that you were present on the night in question and you carried out certain activities. Now, can I ask you to be shown Volume 48 please, at page 13455. This is a report prepared after the event and after the successful completion of the investigation. You will see that in section 2, at the top right-hand column of the page, it says:

"Description."

1				
2			And there are two Pulse numbers; is that right?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	9	Q.	I think you will agree they were two separate incidents	
5			but they were similar in nature?	10:59
6		Α.	That's correct.	
7	10	Q.	There was a common link between those incidents as	
8			well?	
9		Α.	I understand that.	
10	11	Q.	Yes. Not only was there a common link with the	10:59
11			accused, it also appeared that the victims were both	
12			elderly people and business people who were targeted	
13			because of their age and vulnerability?	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	12	Q.	I think it's common case and there is no disagreement,	10:59
16			that the victims in both cases received serious	
17			injuries, including stab wounds and head injuries, and	
18			these robberies occurred 15 hours apart on the same	
19			date and were committed by four juveniles?	
20		Α.	Yes, Judge, yes.	11:00
21	13	Q.	I think one offender was common to both crimes and all	
22			offenders were considered to be part of the same gang,	
23			it involved an antisocial and criminal activity in the	
24			Athlone area at the time?	
25		Α.	I understand so.	11:00
26	14	Q.	So, in the aftermath of the incident, I think you have	
27			given evidence about what you did. Can I just suggest	
28			to you that this report details material, some of which	
29			would you not have been aware of at the time, but it	

1			reflects the work done by your colleagues, in	
2			particular your colleagues in the detective unit, after	
3			you ceased to have an active role in this particular	
4			investigation.	
5				11:00
6			So, first of all, can I draw your attention, please, to	
7			section 3. I think that's a section that has been	
8			completed by Inspector Eamon Curley, who was then a	
9			detective sergeant. Do you see that?	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:00
11	15	Q.	I think in the first two paragraphs he details the	
12			facts of the assaults and robberies. There is no need	
13			for us to progress with those. One assault took place,	
14			a robbery took place at 1:40am and the second took	
15			place at 17:45 hours.	11:01
16				
17			Could I just draw your attention, please, to the next	
18			paragraph? Because what the evidence will suggest is	
19			this: That the new investigation commenced following	
20			the first robbery and expanded to include the second	11:01
21			robbery. Do you accept that?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	16	Q.	It also was indicated that when some elements indicated	
24			that the crimes may be the work of the one group of	
25			offenders, CCTV examination conducted by your	11:01
26			colleagues, Detective Garda Divilly and Cogavin,	
27			identified two potential suspects for the robbery of	
28			the taxi driver?	
29		Α.	I understand so. ves.	

1	17	_	T think it a fair to say you warmen't involved in that	
1	17	Q.	I think it's fair to say, you weren't involved in that	
2			detection issue?	
3		Α.	Correct.	
4	18	Q.	Then consequently, a search under warrant was conducted	
5			on 5/8/2016 at a house [inaudible], and that resulted	11:02
6			in the recovery of clothing worn one-by-one of the	
7			robbers and the arrest of a suspect, Mr. Blank. I	
8			think you will agree with me, you weren't involved in	
9			that either?	
10		Α.	Correct.	11:02
11	19	Q.	So, following from that advancement of the detection	
12			process in the investigation, enquiries were conducted	
13			during the detention of the first suspect, which led to	
14			the identification of the other two suspects and that	
15			led your colleagues to call to a home in Athlone and	11:02
16			that resulted in the arrest of two further suspects. I	
17			think you weren't involved in that either?	
18		Α.	Correct.	
19	20	Q.	The report then goes on to say:	
20				11:02
21			"The investigations continued throughout 5/8/2016 and	
22			into 6/8/2016 and led to the identification and arrest	
23			of two further suspects, namely blank and blank. And	
24			by early morning of the 6/8/2016, all the suspects were	
25			in custody. Continued interviews in the day resulted	11:02
26			in the recovery of firearm, an imitation firearm, and a	
27			baseball bat. Four offenders made extensive admission	

28

29

to their involvement in the robberies that occurred.

One male was released without charge, namely blank, but

1			his arrest was instrumental to the success of the	
2			i nvesti gati on. "	
3				
4			I think it's fair to say you weren't involved in that	
5			work either?	11:03
6		Α.	That's correct.	
7	21	Q.	So, insofar as the searches, the detection, the	
8			identification, the arrest, the detention, the	
9			management of the investigation, you weren't involved	
10			in that at all?	11:03
11		Α.	That's correct. I was involved at the very start of	
12			it, at the scene.	
13	22	Q.	I think it's fair to say you also weren't involved in	
14			the prosecution and you weren't involved in the	
15			recovery of weapons?	11:03
16		Α.	I was never even asked to make a statement in relation	
17			to being at the scene or in relation to the evidence	
18			that I seized at the scene.	
19	23	Q.	I wonder if I could ask you, please, to take out your	
20			diary for 5/8/2016, please.	11:03
21		Α.	'16?	
22	24	Q.	Yes, please. Your diary, please, for the 5th August	
23			and 6th August 2016, please.	
24		Α.	'16?	
25			CHAIRMAN: Are you sure it's 2016? The incident	11:04
26			happened in '15.	
27			MR. MURPHY: Sorry.	
28			CHAIRMAN: No, it's okay. If are you moving to	
29			something else, well and good.	

- MR. MURPHY: I beg your pardon, this may be a 2 typographical error. 3 CHAI RMAN: It's all right. MR. MURPHY: Yes, 2015, Chairman. 4 5 CHAI RMAN: 5th August '15, is that right? 11:04 6 MR. MURPHY: Yes. 7 CHAI RMAN: Thanks. 8 That, Chairman, can be seen at page 13323, MR. MURPHY: 9 please, of the materials. 13323. Thank you. 10 CHAI RMAN: Thank you. 11:04 11 25 Q. MR. MURPHY: So, just to be clear, on the 5th, which 12 was the day referred to in the report, I think you have 13 the letters RD in your diary, which I think we 14 understand to be rest day. 15 That's correct. Α. 11:05 16 On the next day, the 6th, you have also rest day? 26 Q. 17 Α. Yes. 18 And on the day before, the 4th you have rest day? 27 Q. 19 The day before the 4th. Α. No the day before, the 4th, rest day. 20 CHAI RMAN: 11:05
- 24 That's correct. Α.

Yes.

MR. MURPHY:

Α.

Q.

28

1

21

22

23

28

25 During those days, would you agree with me, that the 29 0. 11:05 26 report indicates that all of the significant

search, arrest, interrogation, identification of

So on the 4th, the 5th and 6th, these were

27 developments in terms of detection, identification,

rest days, you weren't on duty at all?

29 suspects, decisions to prosecute, communications to the

			• •	
2			by your colleagues in the detective unit and not by	
3			you?	
4		Α.	That's correct. They did great work and there is no	
5			issue there.	11:0
6	30	Q.	Just turning over the page, please, to page 13456.	
7			Matters progress even better, because it turned out, in	
8			the third paragraph, that all four offenders were	
9			charged with robbery and each of them pleaded guilty	
10			and all were remanded in custody for sentence. Do you	11:0
11			see that?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	31	Q.	Yes. Then, if I can ask you to look at the last half	
14			of the page, under the heading "Summary of involvement	
15			of members in the investigation". Do you see that the	11:0
16			identification of Detective Garda Cogavin, Garda	

DPP, prosecution and arrival in court, were dealt with

right-hand column. Do you agree with me that it says,
for example, Detective Gard Cogavin identifies
suspects, arrested suspects, charged, court attendance. 11:06
Do you see that?

Divilly, and let's look at what they were doing, on the

11:07

22 A. Yes.

1

- 23 32 Q. Garda Divilly identified suspects, arrested suspects, charged, court attendance. Do you see that?
- 25 A. That's correct.
- 26 33 Q. Garda Sharon McMeeting was responsible for arresting a suspect?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 34 Q. Garda Brian Keane was involved in arresting a suspect?

- 1 Α. Yes.
- 2 Sergeant Yvonne Martin was involved in executing the 35 Q.
- 3 search warrant and assisting the investigation?
- 4 Α.
- 5 36 Garda Turner was involved in file preparation? Q.
 - 11:07

11:07

- 6 Α.
- 7 Garda Connolly was involved in interviewing the 37 Q.
- 8 prisoner?
- 9 Yes. Α.
- 10 38 Detective Sergeant Curley was coordinating the Q.
- 11 investigation?
- 12 Yes. Α.
- 13 Garda Shankley was interviewing suspects and attended 39 Q.
- 14 at court for the charging?
- 15 Yes. Α. 11:07
- 16 Garda Shane O'Connell was there for the arrest of the 40 Q.
- 17 suspect?
- 18 Yes. Α.

Α.

- 19 41 Garda Damien O'Rourke was an interviewer? Q.
- And also involved in the recovery of weapons? 21 42 Q.
- 22 Yes. And there's no issue, Judge, with any of that. Α.
- 23 well, can I just suggest to you that there is also no 43 Q.
- 24 issue that you didn't play any part in the actions that
- 25 were identified as being material, important and
- excellent in relation to the investigation, detection 26
- 27 and apprehension of these offenders, because you were
- 28 on your rest day when both of these investigations were
- 29 taking place?

1	Α.	Judge, I have to dispute that, because at the scene, at	
2		the scene and I think it's the first robbery where we	
3		go to, where we get the blood stained clothing and take	
4		in the car, we can't see into the future that there's	
5		going to be another robbery or more evidence or	11:08
6		anything. So, I mean, at that point in time, we don't	
7		know who like, obviously the blood from the taximan,	
8		but there potentially could have been blood from one of	
9		the perpetrators. And equally, in the car, they were	
10		in the car, so, I mean, potentially there could have	11:08
11		been evidence in the car. So, for that argument to be	
12		put, that I had nothing to do with anything, me or my	
13		colleagues that were with me that night, and preserving	
14		the scene and all the work we had done, I have to	
15		dispute this part of it. Because we were there from	11:08
16		the start, Judge, and there's a continuity on the whole	
17		thing. And I totally accept, after the second robbery,	
18		more progress, more evidence and all the rest comes to	
19		light. But at the time we did things right and that's	
20		my case.	11:09
21	44 Q.	You see, Garda Keogh, you also have accepted that none	

21 44 Q. You see, Garda Keogh, you also have accepted that none 22 of the members of your unit who were there at the 23 beginning received a commendation either, isn't that 24 right?

25 A. That's my case.

26 45 Q. So I have suggest to you that that indicates that you weren't singled out for any specific targeting, but rather the commendation went for the quality of the detection and investigation, identification and

1			apprehension of the suspects, as the documents	
2			indicate?	
3		Α.	I dispute that, Judge. I believe and what would	
4			what has happened previously, where I am aware of, is,	
5			that the persons that would arrive at the scene would	11:09
6			all get a commendation. My point is that the members	
7			on the unit didn't get my unit get a commendation	
8			because I was there. If I wasn't there	
9	46	Q.	CHAIRMAN: They'd have got a commendation if you hadn't	
10			been there. That's your case?	11:10
11		Α.	Yes, Judge.	
12			CHAIRMAN: That's your case.	
13	47	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Have you any evidence to suggest that that	
14			was why the decision was made by your superiors? Yes	
15			or no?	11:10
16		Α.	I mean, I have been totally removed off the Pulse	
17			system.	
18	48	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Your case, if I understand, is that in	
19			normal circumstances when commendations were going,	
20			they would go to everybody from top to bottom involved	11:10
21			in the case.	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	49	Q.	CHAIRMAN: However, senior people or people preserving	
24			the scene or whatever it was. And in this case, as you	
25			said, the others suffered because you were involved and	11:10
26			you say there was a decision taken. Who took that	
27			decision, do you say?	
28		Α.	Judge, from reading the documents	

50 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, are you in a position to say that?

2 I don't want you to speculate. If you don't 51 Q. CHAI RMAN: 3 know, say you don't know. Just from recollection and quoting, Superintendent 4 Α. 5 Murray, I think in his statement or somewhere, says I 6 took a hands on approach to this case. 7 That he took a hands on approach? 52 CHAI RMAN: Q. 8 Α. Yes. MR. MURPHY: Did you also see the next sentence, after 9 53 Q. 10 the one you've just quoted, where he says, and this is 11:11 11 at page 3093: 12 13 "I had no knowledge of Garda Keogh's involvement." 14 15 CHAI RMAN: Just respond to Mr. Murphy. 11:11 16 The following words, that you have chosen 54 MR. MURPHY: Q. 17 to ignore, are that he said: 18 19 "I had no knowledge of Garda Keogh's involvement. I 20 don't think he supplied a statement to the 11:11 21 investigation file which went to the DPP." 22 Is that correct? 23 24 Judge, I was down at the time originally. I rang on Α. 25 the incident onto GISC, I put it onto Pulse. 11:11 CHAI RMAN: 26 55 Yes. Ο. 27 Judge, I was down originally as the investigating Α.

1

Α.

Yes, I think so.

member.

CHAI RMAN:

Yes.

28

29

56

Q.

- 1 A. Now, as I said, I've no issue with the detective branch
- coming in and taking over the case, that's the norm.
- But I should have been removed from investigating
- 4 member to assisting member with everybody, all the rest
- of my unit. But I actually get removed completely off 11:12
- 6 the Pulse system for that particular incident.
- 7 57 Q. MR. MURPHY: You see, Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to
- 8 you that what is clear from the evidence of
- 9 Superintendent Murray is that a file was done and
- 10 completed through the incident room, is that right?
- 11 A. Sorry?
- 12 58 Q. Line 1306, please at page 3093. It's the file you have

11 · 12

11:12

- just been given.
- 14 A. Judge, I was never asked to give a statement.
- 15 59 Q. Superintendent Murray will say that he didn't think you 11:12
- supplied a statement, I think you have confirmed you
- didn't, and he will also say that the file was done and
- 18 completed through the incident room and that he and the
- 19 chief superintendent visited one of the victims the
- evening after it happened, that he had no knowledge
- 21 that you were involved in this incident?
- 22 A. I can't accept that, for the fact I was down on Pulse
- as investigating member. So, my name would have been
- 24 at the very top when whoever clicked onto Pulse to view
- 25 the actual incident, they could not have but seen my
- name as investigating member at the start.
- 27 60 Q. CHAIRMAN: What does it mean to say the file was done
- and completed through the incident room? What does
- that mean?

1	Α.	The	incident	room	would	be	tor	a	serious	incident,

2 Judge. For example, in my original heroin case, the

- incident room, we said was Oranmore in Galway, where
- 4 there is a book where they mark out all the job sheets
- for the purpose of taking statements and all the rest.

11:13

11:13

11:13

11:13

11 · 14

- 6 61 Q. CHAIRMAN: The centre, in other words?
- 7 A. Yes, Judge.
- 8 62 Q. CHAIRMAN: There would be a specific room if it's a
- 9 serious crime?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 63 Q. CHAIRMAN: And that's called the incident room?
- 12 A. Yes. Every murder, for example, would have an incident
- 13 room.
- 14 64 Q. CHAIRMAN: When he says it was done through the
- incident room, what does he mean? He is saying that
- means that he had nothing to do with it? Is that what
- 17 he's saying?
- 18 A. I don't know what he's saying.
- 19 65 Q. CHAIRMAN: You don't know?
- 20 A. I don't know what he's is saying.
- 21 CHAIRMAN: Okay, that is all right.
- 22 66 Q. MR. MURPHY: But were you involved in the incident
- 23 room?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 67 Q. Thank you. So what he is indicating is, the incident
- room, the persons involved in that room were
- coordinating and organising the investigation; isn't
- 28 that correct?
- 29 A. Judge, the incident room, as I said, like I should have

- been asked to make a statement. I was at the scene and for gathering evidence and continuity, all that side of things.
- We do know, Garda Keogh, from the file we read out a
 minute ago, that part of the success of this operation
 was that all of the accused pleaded guilty at the first
 opportunity, before any Book of Evidence had been
 prepared, isn't that right?
- 9 A. I accept that.
- 10 69 Q. So in other words, part of the success of this swift, thorough, excellent investigation, was that the defendants faced reality straightaway, pleaded guilty and went into custody within a very short time?
- 14 A. No dispute.
- 15 70 Q. I appreciate that there had been a trial on indictment, 11:14

 16 a larger advice of proofs might have required more

 17 statements, but would you agree with me, Garda, that

 18 also none of the members of your unit made statements

 19 either?

- 20 A. I'm not aware, Judge, of that.
- 21 71 Q. Okay
- 22 A. Then again, Judge, for purposes of continuity, you see, 23 it was me that seized the --
- 24 72 Q. CHAIRMAN: If the matter had gone to trial.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 73 Q. CHAIRMAN: You would have been asked to make a 27 statement for the Book of Evidence, to link up the 28 evidence, isn't that right?
- 29 A. Yes. Well, you see, I'm removed off the Pulse system,

1			so	
2	74	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But irrespective of the Pulse system, if you	
3			took possession of the clothing, you would have had to	
4			make a statement?	
5		Α.	Correct.	11:15
6	75	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You would need that for the Book of	
7			Evidence?	
8		Α.	Correct, Judge.	
9	76	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Just turning, if you would, please, to	
10			page 3094. You see in the second line, Superintendent	11:15
11			Murray will say that he will interpret the fact that	
12			there was no statement on the file as indicating that	
13			you had very little or no involvement in the case and	
14			that he believes from subsequent enquiries that he	
15			discovered that you handed in a piece of clothing to	11:16
16			the exhibits officer, is that correct?	
17		Α.	That's what Superintendent Murray has stated. So he	
18			does know there's that I have some involvement then	
19			in the case.	
20	77	Q.	Based on	11:16
21		Α.	A minute ago, Judge, I had no involvement in the case	
22			and now we're coming to this part where I handed in a	
23			piece of clothing to the exhibits officer.	
24	78	Q.	Sorry, based on	
25		Α.	So	11:16
26	79	Q.	Based on his response to your complaint, he becomes	
27			aware of that fact. He also says, at line 1310, that	

28

29

anyone who accesses Pulse leaves a footprint, there is

an audit trail of anyone who entered the incident and

- he can't see anyone having any reason to do what you allege?
- A. Judge, it's in the documents that I was clearly removed
 from the Pulse system. It was me that put the incident
 onto Pulse. I've read the transcript, there's a
 recording on the transcript where I put the incident
 onto Pulse and put all the details onto Pulse. I put
 all the guards that were at the scene with me, Sergeant
- 9 Monaghan was in charge then at that scene. He had done a great job in that part of it.

11:17

- 11 80 Q. CHAI RMAN: I understand. But let me see if I 12 understand and please correct me, this could be 13 important, I don't know. We don't know, at the end of 14 My understanding is not that you said he 15 played an important part in the investigation. 16 accept, if I understand, that you played no part in the
- investigation. You were the first officer on the scene and you did what was proper for an officer, a first
- 19 attender at the scene, which is to -
- 20 A. Gather evidence.
- 21 81 Q. CHAIRMAN: preserve evidence. I suppose make sure 22 that the victim was all right and preserve evidence and 23 do all those things?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 82 Q. CHAIRMAN: You did, with your colleagues you attended to those things and you say you did so properly and
- 27 competently?
- 28 A. Yes, Judge.
- 29 83 Q. CHAIRMAN: But you accept that in the scale of an

- 1 investigation that is only the first part of it, you
- were going off duty, the matter was then take every
- over by the detectives and they did very good work?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 84 Q. CHAIRMAN: Everybody seems to agree. Sorry, your case
- is simple, in those cases in other circumstances where

11:18

- 7 a commendation is made, it's given to everybody
- 8 involved from start to finish?
- 9 A. Yes, Judge.
- 10 85 Q. CHAIRMAN: Top to toe.
- 11 A. Yes, Judge.
- 12 86 Q. CHAIRMAN: In this case, the first responders were
- 13 excluded because you were among them?
- 14 A. That's my case.
- 15 87 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's your case.
- 16 A. That's what I believe.
- 17 88 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's what you are saying.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 89 Q. CHAIRMAN: So, who ever decided not to give
- commendations, you say deliberately decided not to give 11:18
- 21 the others commendations because they wanted to make
- sure that you didn't get one?
- 23 A. Yes, Judge. I have often got commendations in the past
- 24 for far less.
- 25 90 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's the case?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: That is the case. Thank you.
- 28 91 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, do you agree that view is
- based on your perception, not on any evidence that you

Т			have, that a decision was taken to exclude from	
2			commendations or to exclude you from any recognition in	
3			this case? Do you have any evidence?	
4		Α.	Judge, there is evidence, there's evidence in the	
5			documents. I mean we've just heard, a question that	11:19
6			was put to me, if I recollect correctly, I had nothing	
7			to do with it at all. And then it transpires that I	
8			may have found a piece of clothing. We now know I put	
9			the incident onto Pulse. We now know that I was	
10			removed from Pulse. Superintendent Murray says he took	11:19
11			a hands on approach to the incident. Judge, I believe	
12			all that is evidence in relation to this particular	
13			matter.	
14	92	Q.	I have to suggest to you that it's not. And again this	
15			is more speculation and supposition on your part and	11:19
16			more fixation with Superintendent Murray, seeking to	
17			blame him for everything about which you make	
18			complaint. Can I ask you to turn, please, to 14706 in	
19			Volume 52? So, this is a note sent by Detective	
20			Sergeant Monaghan at 4:33am. That's for the attention	11:20
21			of the superintendent, that's Superintendent Murray,	
22			and it's on the morning of 4th August 2015. It makes	
23			reference to the incident which occurred at 1:35am. Do	
24			you see that?	
25		Α.	I see that.	11:21
26	93	Q.	Do you see in the middle of the line there is a	
27			description of the offence and then it says this:	
28				
29			"Garda CCTV was viewed. Further enquiries have to be	

1			carried out in relation to local CCTV. Family members	
2			were contacted. Garda Keogh's investigating member	
3			will attend to further enquiries when he returns from	
4			rest days. A search was carried out by members under	
5			the blank and in the general area where the incident	11:21
6			happened and nothing was found. Forwarded for your	
7			information please. Sergeant Derek Monaghan."	
8				
9		Α.	I see.	
10	94	Q.	So, Sergeant Monaghan is recognising your role in the	11:21
11			early part of that investigation but is also	
12			acknowledging that you have gone on rest days?	
13		Α.	I have no dispute. Bear in mind, Judge, we don't know	
14			at the time there is going to be a second robbery.	
15	95	Q.	It will be Superintendent Murray's evidence that he	11:21
16			didn't see this e-mail at the time and this is	
17			something which that been brought to light only in more	
18			recent times?	
19		Α.	Sorry, can you just repeat that, please?	
20	96	Q.	Yes. Superintendent Murray will indicate that he did	11:21
21			not see this e-mail, which is sent at four o'clock in	
22			the morning, but this has been brought to his attention	
23			in more recent times, through the discovery process.	
24				
25			Would you agree with me, what that indicates is that	11:22
26			you were off on rest days, that's common case, but what	
27			happened after you went off duty was that all the	
28			investigation morphed, became more complicated,	
29			connected with a second investigation, brought in the	

1			detective unit and the entire thing transformed into a	
2			much, much larger investigation, isn't that true?	
3		Α.	That's correct.	
4	97	Q.	Just one of the points that you have been to the	
5			Chairman throughout the process of your evidence this	11:22
6			morning is that it's standard practice or almost an	
7			entitlement that if you are part of an investigation	
8			team, you're entitled to a commendation. Could I ask	
9			if the witness could please be shown	
10		Α.	Sorry, I didn't that's over stretching it a bit.	11:22
11	98	Q.	Okay. Please indicate how far you'd stretch it, how	
12			far you'd say there's an entitlement to an award?	
13		Α.	Judge, in relation to a case like this where there was	
14			a successful outcome, like a big case like this, this	
15			is a robbery, a violent robbery, you know, where there	11:23
16			is a successful outcome.	
17	99	Q.	The success then, is what you say, of the entire	
18			operation is that every person involved in any role	
19			whatsoever in the process is automatically entitled to	
20			a commendation, is that your case?	11:23
21		Α.	No, I didn't say that. I have often been involved in	
22			cases where, for example, I was Member in Charge and I	
23			didn't receive a commendation. That's fair enough, and	
24			in certain roles. But for the purposes of at the	
25			scene, at the scene it's different, because you are	11:23
26			there from the start.	
27	100	Q.	Okay. If I can ask you to be shown book 26 and 27,	
28			please, at page 7973. This is chapter 13 of the	
29			relevant element of the Garda Code, which deals with	

			commendations. Can I just draw your attention to	
2			clause 13.1. Perhaps I can just read that into the	
3			record, it says:	
4				
5			"A commendation shall be awarded to members of An Garda	11:24
6			Síochána not above the rank of inspector who, in the	
7			opinion of the divisional commendation committee, has	
8			made a particular contribution beyond what is expected	
9			in the course of their normal duty or in respect of an	
10			occasion where the member performed excellent police	11:24
11			work. The commendation system is applicable to all	
12			areas of policing and support work."	
13				
14			Just breaking that down, would you agree with me, that	
15			indicates that the decision to award is based on the	11:25
16			opinion of a divisional commendation committee?	
17		Α.	I don't dispute that. But Judge, just the last line of	
18			that paragraph, just to bring to your attention:	
19				
20			"The commendation system is applicable to all areas of	11:25
21			policing and support work."	
22				
23	101	Q.	Yes. And in terms of the commendation that's based on	
24			the information that's made available to the divisional	
25			commendation committee, isn't that right?	11:25
26		Α.	I understand. I don't know.	
27	102	Q.	And you have seen the information that was made	
28			available to them, isn't that right? You have seen the	
29			form that Inspector Curley filled out that we went	

			through a rew minutes ago:	
2		Α.	Which? Can we go back to that?	
3	103	Q.	Yes. Volume 48, page 13456, please. Just to start	
4			with, can you turn over to the next page, you will see	
5			a box, section 6, to be completed by the divisional	11:26
6			commendation committee?	
7		Α.	Sorry, Judge, I have a different I am on page	
8	104	Q.	13456?	
9		Α.	Oh sorry. 13457.	
10	105	Q.	Yes, on 13457 you will see the box to be completed by	11:26
11			the divisional commendation committee. Do you see	
12			that?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	106	Q.	In terms of that box, it indicates the opinion of that	
15			committee. Then turning back to the previous page,	11:26
16			13456, is the page we read out a few minutes ago, which	
17			you see. Now, I have to suggest to you, that's the	
18			information that was considered by the divisional	
19			committee and upon which it based its opinion. Would	
20			you agree with that?	11:27
21		Α.	I can't disagree well	
22			CHAIRMAN: Go back to the previous one, if you wouldn't	
23			mind, the previous page. Just scroll up to the	
24			previous page.	
25			MR. MURPHY: That's 13457.	11:27
26		Α.	You see, who is the committee? I don't know who the	
27			committee are. And the other thing is, as I stated,	
28			Judge, Superintendent Murray states he took a hands on	
29			approach.	

- 1 107 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, hold on.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 108 Q. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Murphy is asking this question?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 109 Q. CHAIRMAN: This is what the Curley report said.
- 6 Mr. Murphy's question is this: Assuming this was the

11:28

11:28

11:28

- 7 material before the committee, howsoever it was
- 8 composed, it didn't include your name, rightly or
- 9 wrongly. Do you see what I mean?
- 10 A. I do.
- 11 110 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's what he's getting at.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 111 Q. CHAIRMAN: He says, there's the information. Now, I
- don't know whether that's the information or the only
- information that was before the committee or whether
- the members of it knew more or less or should have
- 17 known more or less. I don't know anything about that.
- 18 But he says on the basis of that your name isn't it,
- therefore you wouldn't have got a commendation. That's
- 20 his point. What do you say to that?
- 21 A. Well I, say to that --
- 22 112 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, I understand your case, that I
- 23 understand, but Mr. Murphy is cross-examining you and
- he says, what do you say to that, and I want to know
- what do you say to that?
- 26 A. I just see somewhere here, just there's executive
- search warrant and assist in investigation.
- 28 113 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 29 A. But my argument is that I would have seized the

- 1 evidence at the scene.
- 2 114 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, no, no.
- 3 A. And the whole thing with the taxi driver.
- 4 115 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do you understand the question?
- 5 A. I'm not sure, Judge.
- 6 116 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 7 A. If you can go again, please.
- 8 117 Q. CHAIRMAN: No problem. Take your time. If the
- 9 committee simply had the Curley report in front of it,

11:29

- the only people who might get commendations are the
- people named?
- 12 A. I agree on that.
- 13 118 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you agree?
- 14 A. I agree on that, yes, Judge.
- 15 119 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now whether that should be the situation is 11:29
- another day's work?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 19 120 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, just looking again, please,
- at page 13457. If you look at section 6. The chief
- 21 superintendent is chief superintendent Gralton; is that
- 22 right?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 121 Q. The second superintendent is Alan Murray, and the third
- 25 is?
- 26 A. Thomas Malarkey.
- 27 122 Q. Malarkey. So they are the decision-makers in relation
- to this issue?
- 29 A. Yes.

Τ	123	Q.	And insofar as Superintendent Pat Murray has any role,	
2			if you look at section 5, you will see as report passes	
3			up from Inspector Curley, or Sergeant Curley at that	
4			stage, to the superintendent, he writes in section 5:	
5				11:30
6			""the investigation work carried out on these two cases	
7			was of a very high quality. The suspects were	
8			identified using sound police work and it was a basis	
9			for bringing the case to a conclusion. The culprits	
10			are before the Circuit Court."	11:30
11				
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	124	Q.	So, his only involvement there was to say this was a	
14			very good investigation?	
15		Α.	Yes. Judge, I think you addressed it in the last	11:30
16			question you asked me in relation to the nominations,	
17			let's say, for commendations. Chief Super Gralton,	
18			Super Alan Murray and Super Malarkey, they could only	
19			work on what was in front of them.	
20	125	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That much is clear?	11:30
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	126	Q.	CHAIRMAN: They are in the clear?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	127	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So they had nothing to do, so to speak?	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:3
26			CHAIRMAN: They are the review committee or whatever	
27			you call them, the DCC?	
28	128	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Is it also the case that Inspector Curley	
29			is someone against whom you made no complaint in	

1			relation to these, he is the person who prepared the	
2			report?	
3		Α.	Judge, I understand that. I understand that	
4	129	Q.	Pardon me. Yes.	
5		Α.	Yeah. No, Judge, look, as I said, I have read so much	11:3
6			in documents and that. But I accept that Inspector	
7			Curley	
8	130	Q.	So, what I have to suggest to you, Garda Keogh, is that	
9			the evidence in the case, now not perception but the	
10			evidence, is that Inspector Curley, then a sergeant,	11:3
11			filled out the form, the form reflected an accurate	
12			assessment of the merging of the two investigations and	
13			the detection elements which are identified for	
14			specific praise, that Superintendent Murray didn't get	
15			in the way of that report, on the contrary, he	11:3
16			effectively approbated the applause and commendation	
17			given to these particular members and the committee	
18			which made the decision did so on the basis of the	
19			information available to it, in accordance with	
20			standard practice of chapter 13?	11:3
21		Α.	I don't I can't agree with that because	
22			Superintendent Murray stated he took a hands on	
23			approach -	
24	131	Q.	Yes.	
25		Α.	- in relation to this investigation.	11:3
26	132	Q.	Insofar's as he did so, I say that there is no evidence	
27			to demonstrate that he targeted you, sought to	
28			discredit you, sought to damage you. In fact, all the	
29			evidence is that Inspector Curley was the person	

Τ			involved in the assessment of the investigation, in the	
2			joint investigation, the person who carried out the	
3			report and at least three senior officers are the	
4			people who made the decision?	
5		Α.	Judge	11:32
6	133	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you think Inspector Curley should have	
7			included the first responders? I know that's a general	
8			expression, but the people who were on the scene and	
9			recovered and looked after the taxi driver and so on	
10			and then the people at the shop as well?	11:32
11		Α.	I think he should have, yes. Because, Judge, I have	
12			often been at different incidents like that, where you	
13			would just be even preserving the scene and that.	
14	134	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That would be reported?	
15		Α.	Ah yeah, you would get I mean, in this incident,	11:32
16			Judge, as I said, it's not that I am even down graded	
17			from investigating member to assisting member, which	
18			would be the norm, I am completely removed from the	
19			scene whatsoever according to Pulse.	
20	135	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But do you think that Inspector Curley made	11:33
21			a mistake in what he did?	
22		Α.	I don't know what I can't explain and I can't	
23			explain.	
24	136	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I know you're not making a complaint against	
25			him but I mean we all make mistakes and whatever it is.	11:33
26			Is that what we are talking about here?	
27		Α.	Well, Judge, as I have stated, and I don't want to	
28			repeat myself because I know you could hop off me.	
29	137	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, don't worry, there's no question. This	

- is Friday, it's all right.
- 2 A. Grand.
- 3 138 Q. CHAIRMAN: Go on.
- 4 A. Judge, I suppose from my point of view, I came in to
- work at some stage after I'd come back from the rest

11:33

- 6 days and I clicked onto the incident, and obviously I
- 7 would have become aware there was a second robbery and
- 8 that there was more progress during the week. But when
- 9 I went onto the --
- 10 139 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you discovered you had vanished?
- 11 A. I discovered that I was gone.
- 12 140 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 13 A. I wasn't even down as an assisting member.
- 14 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 15 141 Q. MR. MURPHY: Just on that point, Garda Keogh, I have to 11:34
- suggest to you that there is no evidence that Inspector
- 17 Curley set out to discredit you or target you when he
- 18 went and filled out that form?
- 19 A. I --
- 20 142 Q. CHAIRMAN: He's not suggesting that. In fairness,
- 21 you're not suggesting anything like that?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 CHAIRMAN: No, no.
- 24 143 Q. MR. MURPHY: And I have to suggest there is no evidence
- to suggest that Superintendent Murray was guilty of any 11:34
- targeting or discrediting insofar as he played any role
- in the process of that particular recommendation?
- A. Judge, I suppose that's something, you will have to
- decide on that, I suppose. I can't answer that, Judge.

- 1 CHAI RMAN: Okay. 2 144 MR. MURPHY: Can we move then, please, to the issue on Q. 3 22/9/2015. Can you please be given Volume 1, page 137. I think you have given evidence --4 5 CHAI RMAN: Just in time. 11:35 6 145 MR. MURPHY: Could I ask you please to be shown Volume Q. 7 1 at page 91. This is where you spoke to the Tribunal, 8 effectively complaining that you had not been given a commendation in relation to the rescue from the Shannon 9 10 and that the award that was given under the Irish water 11:36 11 safety was only really some kind of belated 12 afterthought, triggered by the fact that you had issued 13 an application to the Personal Injuries Assessment 14 Board in respect of a civil action against the Gardaí. 15 Now, you remember your evidence last week to 11:36 16 Mr. McGuinness about that? 17 Yes, I do. Α. 18 146 Yes. Q. 19 I think I accepted in relation to the PIAB thing. Α. 20 That's right, yes. 147 Q. 11:37 21 But, Judge, I think it was also established that Irish Α.
- 25 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

incident.

22

23

24

A. Which is very -- two months of a length of time where there's so many other incidents going on. That's very curious.

water safety award, it wasn't even -- the

recommendation didn't come for two months after the

11:37

29 148 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda, is there any time limit that has to

1			be applied for these things? Are you saying there is a	
2			minimum time limit that has to be observed in relation	
3			to awards?	
4		Α.	No. And going off the subject onto this awards thing,	
5			Judge, is a red herring. It's to do with Garda	11:37
6			commendation is the complaint, nothing to do with	
7			awards.	
8	149	Q.	In terms of this situation, the position is that you	
9			are saying this was a guise. Do that in your statement	
10			at line 1321. I have to suggest to you, there is no	11:37
11			evidence to suggest a guise on the part of	
12			Superintendent Murray or anyone else?	
13		Α.	Judge, two months afterwards something I haven't got	
14			to go through this again properly, because it only	
15			cropped up last week in relation to the two months part	11:38
16			so	
17	150	Q.	What was brought up last week was that you were wrong	
18			in the previous sentence, where you said:	
19				
20			"This coincides with the issuance of and the Garda's	11:38
21			receiving my application for the personal injury	
22			assessment board in respect of my civil proceedings	
23			against the Gardaí."	
24				
25			Now, you very fairly said you were wrong in that, wrong	11:38
26			by about a year.	
27		Α.	I stated I was wrong last week. I am only stating a	
28			few minutes, or a few seconds ago even that I was wrong	
29			or incorrect on that.	

- 1 151 Q. And again, just so we understand your mindset when you spoke to the Tribunal investigators in 2018, just a
- year ago, for that reason you said, the reason why you
- 4 were wrong, you were suggesting that there was a guise.
- 5 So I have to suggest to you there is no evidence to
- 6 support your claim in 2018 that this was a guise, would

11:39

11:39

- you agree with that? Because it was based on the false
- 8 premise that PIAB was connected to this process.
- 9 A. Judge, we are going off the subject. The subject is to
- do with Garda commendations not the water safety
- awards.
- 12 152 Q. No, no, Garda Keogh what you are seeking to get away
- from here is that in 2018, to the Tribunal
- investigators, you made a very high case, the case that
- this was deliberate, it was a guise, it was a trick, it 11:39
- was a fraud perpetrated on you because this was all to
- 17 avoid the PIAB application, which you now accept was
- 18 wrong. So I am asking you to accept where you are
- 19 wrong about that, you are also wrong to try to suggest
- there was any guise?
- 21 A. I can't accept that, Judge, because I'm still
- 22 suspicious of why it was two months after. -
- 23 153 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, that's a different question.
- 24 A. Right.
- 25 154 Q. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Murphy is entitled to ask you the
- 26 question. My understanding was that you made the case
- 27 that Superintendent Murray responded to the PIAB
- application by fixing it so that it would appear that
- he was more generous than he was, so that he appeared

1			to be a good person by recommending you for the Seiko	
2			award. That's the case you made. Now, Mr. McGuinness	
3			pointed out to you that that was wrong and you accepted	
4			that in factual terms you cannot make that case because	
5			the time simply does not permit it.	11:40
6		Α.	Okay.	
7	155	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean, that was the date. There's no	
8			point, we don't have to worry about this, it's gone as	
9			an allegation. You have, it seems to me, come back to	
10			the position, oh well, look, it took him two months to	11:40
11			do it. And now you're complaining that it took him two	
12			months to do it. Now, maybe you're right to say it	
13			took him two months to do it, but what's the	
14			significance, what is so sinister about the two months,	
15			it's nothing to do with PIAB, why is two months	11:40
16			sinister? That's the question that we're exploring?	
17		Α.	Judge, my issue on this was nothing really to do with	
18			the water safety awards.	
19	156	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, I know that.	
20		Α.	It's to do with Garda commendations.	11:41
21	157	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Hold on. I know that. But the water	
22			safety, the Seiko Just in Time award is relevant to	
23			this, as you yourself maintained, because you said he	
24			was using it as an excuse over the PIAB. Now, that's	
25			gone. Still on the question of and I am not	11:41
26			forgetting your point that you should have got a	
27			commendation as well as a reference to the water	
28			safety. It seems a very appropriate one for a water	
29			safety in the circumstances. But you say in addition	

- 1 you should have got -- I have that.
- 2 A. And the rest of my unit, Judge.
- 3 158 Q. CHAIRMAN: And the rest of your unit. I have that.
- 4 But here's the question, before we get to that: What

11:42

11:42

11:42

11 · 42

- is the big deal about two months?
- 6 A. I'm not sure. That's why --
- 7 159 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, if he did it in six weeks would it
- 8 be all right? Or if he did it in four weeks would it
- 9 be all right? Or would it be all right if he did it in
- 10 12? Where are we going?
- 11 A. Normally if one is to do that, you do it that week when
- it would be fresh.
- 13 160 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 14 A. Because so many other incidents would happen over the
- week.
- 16 161 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand.
- 17 A. The likes of these robberies and things like that, that
- 18 would take precedence just in the gravity of the
- 19 situation.
- 20 162 Q. CHAIRMAN: He took a while to get around to doing it?
- 21 A. Yeah.
- 22 163 Q. CHAIRMAN: But it's hard to see -- I mean, can I be
- 23 frank with you?
- 24 A. Mm-hmm.
- 25 164 Q. CHAIRMAN: If I am writing a report and I say,
- 26 Superintendent Murray targeted Garda Keogh because he
- 27 delayed two months in writing a recommendation to
- 28 Seiko, that doesn't sound great, does it. That's what
- I am looking at, you know.

1 I understand. Α. 2 165 And maybe you say he could have done it Q. CHAI RMAN: 3 faster and if he was enthusiastic about it and if he liked me or didn't, hadn't got it in for me, he might 4 5 have done it an awful lot faster. That's a general 11:43 6 point I understand, but as a specific allegation of 7 targeting, it seems hard to stand up. 8 A lot can happen in eight weeks of policing. Α. CHAI RMAN: 9 166 Sure. Q. 10 And why --Α. 11:43 11 167 CHAI RMAN: All right, you're sticking with the point Q. 12 about eight weeks? 13 Well, I am just suspicious on that. Α. 14 MR. KELLY: Judge, can I just say on that, just to have 15 the chronological chain. 11:43 16 CHAI RMAN: Yes. MR. KELLY: A letter went to the commissioner of An 17 18 Garda Síochána on the same day as the application went 19 in to PIAB. The letter went in to the commissioner on 20 13th September 2016. 11:43 21 CHAI RMAN: Yes. 22 And to PIAB on the 16th September. MR. KELLY: Thank you. 23 CHAI RMAN: 24 To PIAB on 26th September '16, together MR. KELLY: 25 with the usual supporting documentation. 11 · 44 But this had been done in November 26 CHAI RMAN: Riaht. 27 15.

MR. KELLY: That's right.

CHAI RMAN:

28

29

Sorry.

The application for the Seiko Just in Time

1			went in November '15.	
2			MR. KELLY: Yes, I get the point. I just wanted to get	
3			the chronology.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Mr. Kelly, while we're	
5			at it, while we're at it, for what it's worth, subject	11:44
6			to anything that anybody may say, I find it hard to	
7			condemn as targeting something that was two months when	
8			it should perhaps have been two weeks. But no doubt I	
9			will be put right.	
10			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, I just wanted to remind you	11:44
11			of one piece of evidence that I drew Garda Keogh's	
12			attention to.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
14			MR. McGUINNESS: It was the fact that Superintendent	
15			Murray, in fact, wrote a letter on 22nd September 2015,	11:45
16			on the day of it.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18			MR. McGUINNESS: To the chief superintendent,	
19			indicating that he did intend to recommend the entire	
20			team for a Seiko Just in Time award.	11:45
21			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
22			MR. McGUINNESS: The application was then made two	
23			months later.	
24	168	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand. Do you understand that?	
25		Α.	I do, I heard that.	11:45
26			CHAIRMAN: That appears to have nailed that one down	
27			fairly clearly. Now, you may still say he should have	
28			given you a commendation and Mr. Murphy will now deal	
29			with that one?	

Τ	169 Q.	MR. MURPHY: In terms of the approach towards the	
2		issue, can I ask you to turn to page 2053 in Volume 8,	
3		please? This is an extract from Chief Superintendent	
4		Murray's statement to the Tribunal. Do you see at the	
5		end of page 2053, please, he says:	11:46
6			
7		"On 11th November 2015, I nominated seven members,	
8		including Garda Keogh, for a Seiko Just in Time award	
9		for their part in the rescue of a lady from the river	
10		Shannon on 22nd September 2015."	11:46
11			
12		He attaches the correspondence which Mr. McGuinness	
13		showed you, which I will come back to in a moment.	
14		Just the next bit:	
15			11:46
16		"The awards were presented to the members on 8th	
17		November 2016 at a ceremony in Dublin Castle. This was	
18		the second occasion on which I nominated members from	
19		Athlone for recognition for the Seiko Just in Time	
20		award scheme. The members I nominated on the first	11:46
21		occasi on were also recognised, receiving Seiko watches,	
22		as their rescue efforts put them in great danger.	
23		There was not an ulterior motive for nominating Garda	
24		Keogh for this award."	
25			11:47
26		Could I ask you just to turn to the next page.	
27	Α.	Judge, can I just point out, we got an award from the	
28		water safety, I appreciate that and that, but we didn't	
29		get recognition from An Garda Siochána a commendation	

2			An Garda Síochána. That would normally happen. I gave	
3			the example, Judge, in relation to the badger baiting	
4			incident, Judge, which occurred when I was off duty,	
5			actually in a different division, County Offaly, the	11:47
6			chief in Mullingar, when the National Parks wrote in to	
7			give their commendation, which would be the equivalent	
8			of the Just in Time award, this was in 2013, before I	
9			made a disclosure, when National Parks wrote in a	
10			letter to say this was great work or whatever, a	11:48
11			commendation came down from Mark Curran, the chief in	
12			Mullingar, automatically. That I suppose is my point	
13			on this case.	
14	170	Q.	Garda Keogh, that has absolutely nothing to do with	
15			this, in my submission.	11:48
16		Α.	I'm giving it by way of an example.	
17	171	Q.	It's not an example that is relevant to this case.	
18			CHAIRMAN: It's a contrast.	
19		Α.	Sorry.	
20			CHAIRMAN: No, no, don't apologise. He says, maybe it	11:48
21			has nothing to do with it but look, this happened to me	
22			on another occasion. That's his point Mr. Murphy,	
23			rightly or wrongly. It doesn't seem wildly irrelevant	
24			as a point to make. But we're not investigating the	
25			badger baiting incident in Offaly, mercifully.	11:48
26	172	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, could you ask you, please, to	
27			turn to page 2383. It's a document Mr. McGuinness	
28			showed you last week as well. This is a letter of	
29			commendation from Superintendent Murray, which you have	

all it is, is press the button, good work there, from

1

Т			seen. It names all of your colleagues and it names	
2			you.	
3		Α.	Sorry, Judge, I am just trying to turn to the page.	
4	173	Q.	Garda Keogh, it's 2383, please.	
5		Α.	Thank you.	11:49
6	174	Q.	This is a document you have seen before?	
7			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	175	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Yes. I think you will agree with that	
10			that you are named in this document?	11:49
11		Α.	Oh yeah.	
12	176	Q.	Yes. You will agree with me that Superintendent Murray	
13			is recommending you and your colleagues for	
14			commendation in relation to what had taken place and he	
15			also gives a description of your attempts, successful	11:49
16			attempts to rescue the lady who had fallen into the	
17			river?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	177	Q.	He says:	
20				11:49
21			"The speed in which the members acted, their dedication	
22			and commitment in such inclement weather conditions	
23			ensured a positive outcome to what could possibly have	
24			been a tragic incident."	
25				11:49
26			I have to say to you, on no view of those words or this	
27			letter could this be regarded as targeting of you by	
28			Superintendent Murray.	
29		Α.	Judge	

- 1 178 Q. Isn't that correct?
- 2 A. Judge, I just find it fascinating --
- 3 179 Q. Could you answer the question?
- 4 A. If we were all agreed that it was such good police
- work, why didn't he just press the button and say,
- 6 we're going to give them a commendation from An Garda

11:50

11:50

11:50

- 7 Síochána as well.
- 8 180 Q. CHAIRMAN: what difference would it have made?
- 9 A. It's only a piece of paper.
- 10 181 Q. CHAIRMAN: what difference would it have made to you?
- 11 A. It's a piece of paper.
- 12 182 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, here you're being brought up to
- Dublin, to Dublin Castle, a formal ceremony. That's
- 14 very generous, isn't it?
- A. My point is, what difference is it, it's only a piece
- of paper, press the button, that's the thing.
- 17 183 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand. Hold on a second. Your case
- on this particular issue is, that despite these words,
- 19 which are pretty enthusiastic commendations, despite
- these words, nevertheless he targeted you?
- 21 A. Judge, when you put this with the previous one and the
- 22 next one.
- 23 184 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, on this one alone.
- 24 A. Okay.
- 25 185 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand your point. Look, there is
- another point have you to make, which is to say, any
- one incident might be one way, viewed one way, that I
- understand, but when you look at them in the whole?
- 29 A. Yes.

1	186	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That I understand. But we have to analyse	
2			them one-by-one. As far as it goes on this specific	
3			one, just viewed as a separate one?	
4		Α.	I'm in your hands on this one, Judge.	
5	187	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you know what I mean?	11:51
6		Α.	I understand exactly, Judge.	
7	188	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Do you understand, Garda, that if your	
8			complaint as you made it to the Tribunal in your	
9			statement is upheld, in the light of this evidence, you	
10			would be the first person to be targeted by being	11:51
11			recommended for an award in the presence of the	
12			Minister, in Dublin Castle, with publicity, praise and	
13			commendation. Do you not see even through your	
14			perspective of these events how bizarre such a	
15			complaint is?	11:51
16		Α.	Judge, my argument all along	
17	189	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, hold on a second. There's a statement	
18			and Mr. Murphy says, comment.	
19		Α.	Judge, I am in your hands on this.	
20			CHAIRMAN: All right. That's very fair.	11:51
21	190	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Thank you. Just finally, just as a matter	
22			of fact, can I ask you just to turn, please, to Volume	
23			8, page 2384, please? Just as a matter of fact, I	
24			think to confirm the Tribunal's understanding, this	
25			document indicates that the awards were to be presented	11:52
26			by Minister Simon Coveney on behalf of the award	
27			committee in Dublin Castle. I take it there was a	
28			reception and there was publicity and there were	
29			photographs of that event; isn't that correct?	

- 1 That's correct. We all got to shake hands with Α. 2 Minister Coveney as well.
- 3 CHAI RMAN: Very good.
- I think in fairness, you would also accept MR. MURPHY: 4 191 0. 5 that Superintendent Murray, in his capacity as a member 11:52 6 of An Garda Síochána, recommended you for that award.
- 7 Not in his private capacity, but as your
- 8 superintendent?

18

26

- I accept that, on that part. 9 Α.
- Just finally, I think insofar as the commendation is 10 192 Q. 11:52 11 concerned through An Garda Síochána, I suggest to you that in substance and in fact that's what this was. 12

11:53

11:53

11:53

- But did you say last week to Mr. McGuinness that 13 14 ordinary commendations which you had received in the 15 past were really the kind of thing you put in your 16 locker, do you remember saying that?
- 17 I do, yes. As I just stated a minute ago, like it's Α. only a sheet of paper, it's only to press the button, 19 I would have received many of them over the years for minor, minor things. That is why I just 20 throw them in the locker, because -- now you can get --21 22 I think there's different levels of commendations as well, Judge. But for the ones that would come down, 23 24 let's say, from the chief or that, or if it's just not 25 a major thing, I mean, you just throw them into the
- 27 193 Then finally on this issue, Garda Keogh, I think we can Q. deal with this briefly in the light of Mr. McGuinness 28 29 direction in evidence with you last week, the last

locker and that's it.

1			complaint you made was in relation to failing to get a	
2			commendation in relation to arresting a person for	
3			burglary on 28/10/2014. I think you now accept that	
4			the evidence is that Superintendent Murray wasn't in	
5			your divisional area until March 2015; isn't that	11:54
6			right?	
7		Α.	This is the burglary, the burglary in the bakery.	
8	194	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	Judge, again, it's just I didn't get a commendation.	
10			It's not from the organisation. Me or Garda Dempsey	11:54
11			did not get a commendation that night, Judge, and we	
12			both should have got commendations on that night. It	
13			doesn't matter. Again, this is after I have made my	
14			protected disclosure. We're into 2014. We're getting	
15			commendations up to 2013 for stuff when I'm off duty	11:54
16			and not even in the division and working. But yet,	
17			after I making my protected disclosures, the fact is I	
18			do not get a commendation or anything, and any garda or	
19			sergeants working with me does not get a commendation	
20			either.	11:5
21	195	Q.	I have to suggest to you two things. First of all, you	
22			have no evidence to suggest that this was done	
23			deliberately by anybody to cause you a disadvantage,	
24			isn't that correct?	
25		Α.	Judge, as I said, the commendations are not the biggest	11:55
26			thing in all of this, because they are only a sheet of	
27			paper. It's a small, little thing. It's a small,	
28			little thing. That's all these commendations are;	
29			small things. But my point is, I don't get	

- commendations for -- if I was not a whistleblower --
- 2 196 Q. CHAIRMAN: who should have given you the commendation
- 3 in 2014?
- 4 A. The chief in Mullingar, I would say. Not just -- me
- 5 and Garda Dempsey. We should have got a commendation

11:55

11:55

11:56

- 6 for that.
- 7 197 Q. CHAIRMAN: But wouldn't that have to go to the
- 8 committee, is that right?
- 9 A. I don't know. It would have been --
- 10 198 Q. CHAIRMAN: Who would put you forward for that?
- 11 A. No, it's where --
- 12 199 Q. CHAIRMAN: Who was the divisional officer?
- 13 A. Mark Curran at the time.
- 14 200 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 15 A. At the time would have been the divisional officer
- there. And again, it's just --
- 17 201 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean who was the superintendent in
- 18 Athlone?
- 19 A. In '14, Superintendent McBrien.
- 20 202 Q. MR. MURPHY: A person against whom you make no
- complaint.
- 22 A. It's usually from the chief's office that you would get
- a commendation down.
- 24 203 Q. CHAIRMAN: How does it go? Does it go from the
- 25 superintendent to the chief superintendent?
- A. No, I think it just -- the way I've got them in the
- past, it seems to be just the chief superintendent in
- the office.
- 29 204 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.

1 A. Glances at a file, events that perhaps happened	1	happened
--	---	----------

- 2 205 Q. CHAIRMAN: But somebody has to send it to the chief superintendent?
- A. No, you see they can see everything on Pulse. The chief, when he comes into work, will see everything in

11:56

11:57

11:57

- 6 his division. The chief is in Mullingar, but he can
- 7 still see all the incidents in Athlone or Delvin or
- 8 wherever within, let's say, Westmeath. So he can see
- 9 the different categories of crimes and things like
- 10 that. And where there's a burglary like that one and
- 11 where the burglar is actually caught at the scene. And
- the reason he was caught at the scene is because myself
- and Garda Dempsey were out on patrol, doing our job and
- 14 we were actually -- when we got the call, we just
- happened to be in the right place at the right time.
- 16 CHAIRMAN: I understand.
- 17 206 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, just three points arising
- from that. You have accepted is that Superintendent
- 19 McBrien was the superintendent when this incident
- occurred and you make no complaint against her, isn't
- 21 that correct?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 207 Q. You make no complaint against any member of your own
- 24 station or unit who was on duty with you on that date
- in 2014, is that correct?
- 26 A. How could I make a complaint against any of --
- 27 208 Q. That they didn't recommend you for a commendation?
- 28 A. No. But sure, I wouldn't -- that's not the way, that's
- not the way it works. As I said, I am just after

1 stating, it's the chief in Mullingar that would have 2 spotted good police work there and would have just --3 it's a little sheet of paper. And I presume he would just say to someone in his office, give that fella --4 5 give them lads a commendation. Someone presses a button, it's sent out, we get a piece of paper and it 6 7 just says commendation, good police work. And that's 8 it.

11:57

11:58

11:58

11:58

11:58

9 209 Q. Yes.

26

27

28

29

10 A. It's nota major deal.

11 210 Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to you that you are Q. 12 wrong in that regard, because under the commendation 13 system any member of An Garda Síochána may initiate the 14 commendation system in relation to a colleague. 15 Let's pause for the moment. Take the example we have 16 looked at in relation to the commendation of a detective unit. That started from the sergeant and 17 18 moved its way up the system. It didn't come from the top down. What I have to suggest to you is, there is 19 20 actually no evidence to suggest that the chief superintendent in Mullingar was under a legal duty to 21 22 seek out and find commendations at ground level. 23 the contrary, the preponderance of these, the majority 24 of these come up from the ground up for evaluation? 25

A. Judge, to address the first question in that, if every member of An Garda Síochána -- any member of An Garda Síochána can commend another member. Judge, if that rule was to be applied, every day there would be guards all across the country recommending each other for

2	211	Q.	CHAIRMAN: There might be, yes.	
3		Α.	The whole system would collapse.	
4	212	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay, but your case is simple, you say the	
5			chief superintendent in Mullingar should have seen this	11:59
6			incident on Pulse and, without more, should have issued	
7			a commendation to you and your colleague. That's your	
8			case?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	11:59
11	213	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I have to suggest to you, you have no	
12			legal basis or basis in principle to suggest that	
13			except your own opinion?	
14		Α.	I'm in your hands on this, Judge.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	11:59
16	214	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Chairman those are my questions on that	
17			issue.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Very good. Okay.	
19			MR. MURPHY: With your permission, can I address issue	
20			17, that is to say complaints by Garda Keogh in	12:00
21			relation to the criminal investigation carried out by	
22			Assistant Commissioner Donal Ó Cualáin?	
23			CHAIRMAN: Yes, okay. Thanks very much.	
24	215	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Now, Garda Keogh, you have given evidence	
25			on the first day of your cross-examination in relation	12:00
26			to the approach adopted by Detective Superintendent	
27			Mulcahy. I went through at some length with you the	
28			detail of what Detective Superintendent Mulcahy did in	
29			the investigation when he was under the control of	

commendations.

1

1			Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin. Again, just to	
2			shorten matters, because I don't want to waste the	
3			Tribunal's time on this issue, you very fairly accepted	
4			that Detective Superintendent Mulcahy did a stellar job	
5			as far as you were concerned?	12:01
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	216	Q.	You were unstinting in your praise for Detective Garda	
8			Coppinger as a trained investigator. I think you	
9			accepted readily when I opened to you all of the	
10			detail, the communications, the updates, the following	12:01
11			up of leads, the consultations they had with you	
12			throughout the course of their investigations. I think	
13			you very fairly acknowledged the good forensic work	
14			which they did following the leads which you gave them?	
15		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	12:01
16	217	Q.	So, it seems, does it not, that the case that you're	
17			seeking to make, the residual case that you're seeking	
18			to make in this case, as I understood your evidence	
19			last week when you spoke to Mr. McGuinness, was that	
20			you were suspicious that Assistant Commissioner Ó	12:01
21			Cualáin had somehow sabotaged his own investigation or	
22			attempted to do. Is that the core of your complaint	
23			against Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin?	
24		Α.	Judge, essentially, essentially. I know it's a very	
25			unusual and strange, outrageous allegation. But that's	12:02
26			my position, Judge.	
27	218	Q.	Again, Garda Keogh, you have been very helpful to	
28			indicate to us on a number occasions where you are	
29			coming from but is this your view based on knowledge	

1	or	suspicion?
L	OI	Suspicions

- 2 Judge, I was present, I was present there for parts of Α. 3 the investigation. I have gone into evidence last week 4 in relation to some of the insane things and way that 5 the parts of that investigation -- the way it was 12:02 6 conducted.
- 7 Again, is your criticisms of his delay in certain 219 Q. 8 matters or the time in which it took to do certain things, but have you any evidence that he knowingly set 9 out to sabotage the investigation of which you were so 10 12.02 11 praiseworthy in the course of your testimony?
- 12 Judge, haven't I given evidence last week about -- the Α. 13 investigation team are in Athlone Garda Station, 14 conducting the investigation into Garda A, Garda A is 15 on duty, he's hanging around the station, he doesn't 16 leave the station, and they're then calling other 17 quards in to make statements about Garda A. I at times 18 was able to see, Judge, because I smoke myself, Garda A 19 was smoking in the back area, he was actually walking 20 up and down and around the back part of the station and 12:03 he was actually able to see members, whoever they were 21 22 bringing in and out of the investigation team. 23 example of this is when Garda Lyons was interviewed by 24 the investigation team, he then -- like, he's Garda A's 25 partner there and -- ah look, Judge, that part of the investigation, it was just insane. 26

12.04

27 220 Q. Again, I have to take issue with you on that. all, can I ask you, is it your evidence that Assistant 28 29 Commissioner Ó Cualáin was engaged in those interviews,

Т			the ones that took place in Athlone?	
2		Α.	No.	
3	221	Q.	Right. So I think we will agree that he wasn't present	
4			when you saw those interviews taking place. Two, would	
5			you agree with me that in his statement to the Tribunal	12:04
6			and will be his evidence here, that as soon as you	
7			raised concerns about Garda A being present in Athlone	
8			Garda Station while statements were being taken, that	
9			he directed, he directed, that all future interviews	
10			would be conducted away from the station?	12:04
11		Α.	Now, just for clarification, who is 'he'.	
12	222	Q.	He is Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin?	
13		Α.	I don't know the answer to that, because it was	
14			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy that I had I have	
15			gone into this again. For example, when Detective	12:04
16			Superintendent Mulcahy and Detective Inspector, DI	
17			Coppinger were in the public office in Athlone, there	
18			was four people in the public office at this particular	
19			time. There was me, there was Detective Superintendent	
20			Mulcahy, DI Coppinger, and Garda A was beside us at the	12:05
21			photocopier and he was doing whatever he was doing at	
22			the photocopier. Then myself and the D/Super Mulcahy	
23			went down to a back room in the station and that's	
24			where I had a conversation with Detective	
25			Superintendent Mulcahy and I said, this is just insane,	12:05
26			the way this is going on. Because there was they	
27			had other detectives from the investigation team taking	
28			statements while this incident was going on. And when	
29			I made my expressed my concerns to Detective	

1			Superintendent Mulcahy and I opened the door and Garda	
2			A was out this is the back part of the station,	
3			Garda A was then walking around with, walking by, he	
4			walked by the door, like when I opened the door he was	
5			outside walking. I just looked back at Detective	12:06
6			Superintendent Mulcahy there, because he would have	
7			seen him there as well, and I don't think I said	
8			anything, I don't think I had to say anything. I was	
9			already after pointing out this to him. It was	
10			absolutely insane, Judge.	12:06
11	223	Q.	Garda Keogh, that's your view. The position is that	
12			when you made your views known, it was Assistant	
13			Commissioner Ó Cualáin, when it was reported to him,	
14			directed that the future interviews should be conducted	
15			away from the station. And the people who were	12:06
16			conducting those interviews were in fact people against	
17			whom you are making no complaints, Superintendent	
18			Mulcahy, Inspector Coppinger? Do you see the	
19			illogicality in that?	
20		Α.	I've made no complaint against any member of the	12:06
21			investigation team. But, Judge, to point out, what's	
22			being said to me here is that Ó Cualáin kind of	
23			sorry, Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin just decides	
24			that this shouldn't be done this way. That's not	
25			possible.	12:07
26	224	Q.	Garda Keogh, listen to my question.	
27		Α.	Sorry.	
28	225	Q.	Can I help you in that regard. Could you be shown	
29			Volume 25, page 7339, please? Just to show to you	

1	exactly what the assistant commissioner is saying.	
2	That's Volume 25, 7339, please.	
3	MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, just before Mr. Murphy goes	
4	into that, I wonder, Chairman, could you rise for some	
5	five minutes, I just want to consider an issue that we	12:07
6	may need to discuss.	
7	CHAIRMAN: Certainly, if you say so.	
8	MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you.	
9	CHAIRMAN: I will come back at 12:15.	
10	MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you, Chairman.	12:07
11	CHAIRMAN: Very good.	
12		
13	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED, AS	
14	FOLLOWS:	
15		12:19
16	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
17	MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, thank you for the few	
18	minutes to allow me consult with my team fully. It has	
19	resulted in our giving consideration to an issue which	
20	we brought to your attention.	12:19
21	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
22	MR. McGUINNESS: Relating to an issue of disclosure.	
23	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thanks very much. I think the	
24	situation, if I understand it, correct me if I am wrong	
25	in anything I say, Mr. McGuinness: Obviously the	12:20
26	Tribunal has continued its investigations as time has	
27	gone on. So when queries arise or apparent queries, we	
28	seek to resolve them and to sort out what may possibly	
29	be relevant, and in regard to what is potentially	

relevant, obviously we draw everybody's attention to that. Mr. McGuinness and Mr. Marrinan have drawn my attention to some material that could, I don't say would, is or will be, but could be relevant to the issues that are now being canvassed and being discussed 12:20 in cross-examination. I don't want to say too much about it. I don't want to either hype it up into something hugely significant or treat it as of no importance. I am simply saying that counsel are satisfied, and I agree with them, that this is 12:21 potentially relevant and ought to be brought to the attention of the relevant parties, so as to enable them to know what the situation is.

That seems to me entirely proper and in those circumstances, I think it wouldn't be satisfactory to proceed with this issue, with the cross-examination on this issue in fairness to all concerned. It's also not satisfactory to embark on some further issue when we actually have started on this one.

12:21

12:21

So, what we propose to do, as I say, counsel will explain it and then we will endeavour to make the material available in the most convenient form to the parties. This is a good time to recognise that. So, what I propose to do is to adjourn now and we will resume on Monday week. What date is Monday week?

MR. McGUINNESS: The 4th November, Chairman.

CHAIRMAN: The 4th November at 10:30. So you will have

Т	a break and we will resume, the parties will be able to
2	be appraised of this information in the meantime.
3	Thank you very much. Very good.
4	
5	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL MONDAY, 4TH NOVEMBER 12:2
6	2019 AT 10: 30AM
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

		<u> </u>	T	
'	2	4	1:26	ago [7] - 26:5, 27:21,
-			absence [1] - 6:9	34:1, 34:16, 42:28,
114 td 55:10	2 [4] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:5,	4 [2] - 2:19, 3:4	absolutely [2] -	43:3, 53:17
'14 [1] - 55:19 '15 [4] - 17:26, 18:5,	2 [4] - 2.32, 3.3, 4.5, 13:26	4 [2] - 2.19, 3.4 48 [2] - 13:23, 34:3	49:14, 62:10	agree [20] - 14:4,
46:27, 47:1	20 [1] - 3:12	4:33am [1] - 30:20	accept [14] - 7:8,	16:8, 18:25, 19:18,
'16 [3] - 17:21, 17:24,	2013 [2] - 49:8, 54:15	4TH [1] - 65:5	15:21, 21:17, 24:22,	26:17, 29:5, 29:28,
46:24	2014 [4] - 1:3, 54:14,	4th [7] - 18:18,	26:9, 28:16, 28:29,	31:25, 33:14, 34:20,
40.24	55:3, 56:25	18:19, 18:20, 18:22,	38:6, 43:17, 43:18,	36:12, 36:13, 36:14, 38:21, 43:7, 50:9,
1	2015 [7] - 13:2, 18:4,	30:22, 64:28, 64:29	43:21, 53:4, 53:9, 54:3	50:12, 61:3, 61:5,
	30:22, 47:15, 48:7,	30.22, 04.20, 04.23	accepted [6] - 21:21,	64:10
	48:10, 54:5	5	41:19, 44:3, 56:18,	agreed [1] - 51:4
1 [4] - 3:2, 12:9, 41:3,	2016 [4] - 17:23,		59:3, 59:9	AGSI [1] - 4:1
41:7	17:25, 46:20, 48:17		accesses [1] - 27:28	AIDAN[2] - 3:9, 4:3
10 [1] - 3:7	2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9	5 [3] - 3:4, 37:2, 37:4	accordance [1] -	airbrushed [2] -
108 [1] - 1:18	2018 [4] - 1:9, 43:2,	5/8/2016 [3] - 16:5,	38:19	13:9, 13:16
10:30 [1] - 64:29	43:6, 43:13	16:21, 17:20	according [1] - 39:19	AISLING [2] - 2:11,
10:30AM [1] - 65:6	2019 [3] - 1:18, 6:2,	51 [2] - 2:18, 10:11	account [1] - 10:11	3:21
11 [1] - 3:7	65:6	52 [2] - 10:11, 30:19	accurate [1] - 38:11	Alan [2] - 36:24,
11-13 [1] - 3:32	2053 [2] - 48:2, 48:5	53 [4] - 7:13, 7:15,	accused [2] - 14:11,	37:18
11th [1] - 48:7	21 [1] - 3:12	8:14, 8:22	26:6	ALAN [2] - 3:9, 3:13
12 [9] - 3:8, 4:5, 6:19,	22 [1] - 3:13	54 [2] - 7:13, 8:14	acknowledge [1] -	alia [1] - 13:5
6:21, 7:24, 10:5, 10:9,	22/9/2015 [1] - 41:3	5th [4] - 17:22, 18:5,	6:7	ALISON [1] - 3:26
10:10, 45:10	22nd [2] - 47:15,	18:11, 18:22	acknowledged [1] -	allegation [3] - 44:9,
12:15 [1] - 63:9	48:10		59:13	46:6, 59:25
13 [4] - 2:31, 3:8,	23 [1] - 3:13	6	acknowledging [1] -	allegations [1] -
32:28, 38:20	2383 [2] - 49:27, 50:4		31:12	11:23
13.1 [1] - 33:2	2384 [1] - 52:23	6 [4] - 3:5, 5:5, 34:5,	ACT [2] - 1:3, 1:8	allege [1] - 28:2
1306 [1] - 24:12	24 [1] - 3:14	36:20	acted [1] - 50:21	alleged [2] - 6:23,
1310 [1] - 27:27	25 [3] - 3:14, 62:29,	6/8/2016 [2] - 16:22,	ACTING [2] - 3:7,	11:20
1321 [1] - 42:10	63:2	16:24	3:13	alleges [1] - 10:17
13323 [2] - 18:8, 18:9	25TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1	6th [3] - 17:23,	action [2] - 1:27,	allow [2] - 8:2, 63:18
13455 [1] - 13:24	26 [2] - 3:15, 32:27	18:16, 18:22	41:14	almost [1] - 32:6
13456 [4] - 19:6,	26th [1] - 46:24		actions [1] - 20:24	alone [1] - 51:23
34:3, 34:8, 34:16	27 [2] - 3:15, 32:27	7	active [1] - 15:3	AMENDED [1] - 1:9
13457 [4] - 34:9, 34:10, 34:25, 36:20	28 [1] - 3:16		activities [1] - 13:23	AN [1] - 3:2
137 [3] - 12:10,	28/10/2014 [1] - 54:3	7 4.0 0.05 0.5	activity [1] - 14:23	analyse [1] - 52:1
137 [3] - 12.10,	29 [1] - 3:17	7 [3] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5	actual [1] - 24:25	AND [6] - 1:3, 1:4,
138 [1] - 12:23		7339 [2] - 62:29, 63:2	addition [1] - 44:29	1:8, 3:15, 11:12,
13th [1] - 46:20	3	7973 [1] - 32:28	address [3] - 10:21,	63:13
14 [1] - 40.20		-	57:25, 58:19	ANDREW [2] - 2:22,
14706 [1] - 30:18	3 [2] - 3:3, 15:7	8	addressed [1] -	4:2
15 [5] - 3:9, 11:19,	3/8/2015 [1] - 12:7		37:15	ANNE [2] - 3:8, 3:17
12:1, 12:2, 14:18	30 [1] - 3:17	8 [4] - 3:6, 3:28, 48:2,	adjourn [1] - 64:26	answer [4] - 7:11,
16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10	3093 [2] - 23:11,	52:23	ADJOURNED[3] -	40:29, 51:3, 61:13
16th [1] - 46:22	24:12	8th [1] - 48:16	11:12, 63:13, 65:5	ANTHONY [1] - 3:6
17 [8] - 1:9, 3:10,	3094 [1] - 27:10		ADMINISTRATIVE	antisocial [1] - 14:23
11:23, 11:28, 12:11,	31 [1] - 3:18	9	[1] - 3:14	apart [1] - 14:18
12:18, 12:22, 58:20	31st [1] - 9:17		admission [1] -	apologise [1] - 49:20
17:45 [1] - 15:15	32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18	0 [4] - 3:6	16:27	apparent [1] - 63:27
18 [1] - 3:11	33 [1] - 3:19	9 [1] - 3:6	adopted [1] - 58:26	APPEAL [2] - 1:13,
19 [1] - 3:11	34 [1] - 3:19	91 [1] - 41:7	advancement [1] -	2:3
1921 [1] - 1:9	35 [1] - 3:20	Λ	16:11	appear [1] - 43:28
1:35am [1] - 30:23	36 [1] - 3:20	Α	advice [1] - 26:16	APPEARANCES[1] -
1:40am [1] - 15:14	3640 [1] - 7:25		aftermath [1] - 14:26 afterthought [1] -	2:1
	37 [1] - 3:21	A's [1] - 60:24	41:12	appeared [3] - 13:15,
	38 [1] - 3:21	able [3] - 60:18,	afterwards [1] -	14:11, 43:29
	39 [1] - 3:22	60:21, 65:1	42:13	applause [1] - 38:16 applicable [2] -
	3rd [1] - 13:1	above-named [1] -	age [1] - 14:13	33:11, 33:20
			age [1] - 14.10	00.11, 00.20
	1	1	1	1

application [7] -41:13, 42:21, 43:17, 43:28, 46:18, 46:29, 47:22 applied [2] - 42:1, 57:28 appraised [1] - 65:2 appreciate [2] -26:15, 48:28 apprehended [1] -13:6 apprehension [3] -10:14, 20:27, 22:1 approach [7] - 23:6, 23:7, 30:11, 34:29, 38:23, 48:1, 58:26 approbated [1] -38:16 appropriate [1] -44:28 archives [1] - 10:16 area [4] - 14:24, 31:5, 54:5, 60:19 areas [2] - 33:12, 33:20 argument 131 -21:11, 35:29, 52:16 arise [1] - 63:27 arising [1] - 56:17 **ARRAN**[1] - 2:24 arrest [7] - 16:7, 16:16, 16:22, 17:1, 17:8, 18:28, 20:16 arrested [2] - 19:20, 19:23 arresting [3] - 19:26, 19:29, 54:2 arrival [1] - 19:1 arrive [2] - 8:2, 22:5 arriving [1] - 7:14 **AS** [5] - 1:9, 6:1, 6:16, 11:12, 63:13 assault [1] - 15:13 assaults [1] - 15:12 Assessment [1] -41:13 assessment [3] -38:12, 39:1, 42:22 assist [1] - 35:27 Assistant [8] - 58:22, 59:1, 59:20, 59:23, 60:28, 61:12, 62:12, 62:23 assistant [1] - 63:1 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 assisting [4] - 20:3, 24:4, 39:17, 40:13

assume [1] - 8:10

assuming [2] - 8:5, 35:6 assumption [1] -10.5 **AT** [1] - 65:6 Athlone [11] - 7:6, 13:1, 14:24, 16:15, 48:19, 55:18, 56:7, 60:13, 61:1, 61:7, 61:17 **ATHLONE** [1] - 3:32 attaches [1] - 48:12 attempted [1] - 59:22 attempts [2] - 50:15, 50:16 attend [1] - 31:3 attendance [2] -19:20, 19:24 attended [2] - 20:13, 28:25 attender [1] - 28:19 attention [12] -12:11, 15:6, 15:17, 30:20, 31:22, 33:1, 33:18, 47:12, 63:20, 64:1, 64:3, 64:12 audit [1] - 27:29 August [5] - 13:1, 17:22, 17:23, 18:5, 30:22 automatically [2] -32:19, 49:12 available [4] - 33:24, 33:28, 38:19, 64:24 avoid [1] - 43:17 award [15] - 32:12, 33:15, 41:10, 41:22, 44:2, 44:22, 47:20, 48:8, 48:20, 48:24, 48:27, 49:8, 52:11, 52:26, 53:6 awarded [1] - 33:5 awards [7] - 42:3, 42:4, 42:7, 43:11, 44:18, 48:16, 52:25 aware [5] - 14:29, 22:4, 26:20, 27:27, 40:7

В

awful [1] - 46:5

badger [2] - 49:3, 49:25 baiting [2] - 49:3, 49:25 bakery [1] - 54:7 BAR [1] - 2:31 Barnes [3] - 6:8, 6:9,

based [9] - 27:20, 27:24, 27:26, 29:29, 33:15, 33:23, 34:19, 43:7, 59:29 basis [5] - 35:18, 37:8, 38:18, 58:12 **BASTION**[1] - 3:31 bat [1] - 16:27 **BE** [1] - 6:15 bear [1] - 31:13 became [1] - 31:28 become [1] - 40:7 becomes [1] - 27:26 beg [1] - 18:1 beginning [1] - 21:23 behalf [1] - 52:26 behind [1] - 7:14 belated [1] - 41:11 believes [1] - 27:14 beside [1] - 61:20 better [1] - 19:7 between [1] - 14:7 beyond [1] - 33:8 big [2] - 32:14, 45:5 biggest [1] - 54:25 bit [3] - 8:5, 32:10, 48:14 **bizarre** [1] - 52:14 BL [12] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 3:30, 4:4 blame [1] - 30:17 blank [5] - 16:7, 16:23, 16:29, 31:5 **blind** [1] - 9:25 blood [3] - 21:3, 21:7, 21:8 bloodstained [1] -Board [1] - 41:14 board [1] - 42:22 book [2] - 25:4, 32.27 Book [3] - 26:7, 26:27, 27:6 bottom [1] - 22:20 **bow** [1] - 6:9 **box** [3] - 34:5, 34:10, 34:14 branch [1] - 24:1 break [2] - 11:26, breaking [1] - 33:14 Brian [1] - 19:29

8:3

baseball [1] - 16:27

briefly [1] - 53:28 BRIEFLY [2] - 11:12, 63:13 **bring** [1] - 33:18 **bringing** [2] - 37:9, 60.22 brought [7] - 31:17, 31:22, 31:29, 42:17, 51:12, 63:20, 64:11 burglar [1] - 56:11 burglary [4] - 54:3, 54:7, 56:10 **business** [1] - 14:12 button [5] - 49:1, 51:5, 51:16, 53:18, 57.6 BY [12] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 3:30, 4:4, 5:5, 6.15

C

CAGNEY [1] - 3:17

canvassed [1] - 64:5

cannot [1] - 44:4

capacity [2] - 53:5, 53:7 car [5] - 13:3, 21:4, 21:9, 21:10, 21:11 CARR [1] - 3:15 Carr [1] - 8:22 **CARRICK** [1] - 2:13 CARRICK-ON-**SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 carried [6] - 13:22, 31:1, 31:4, 37:6, 39:2, 58:21 CARROLL [1] - 2:16 CARTHAGE [1] -2:17 case [45] - 13:2, 13:8, 13:14, 14:15, 21:20, 21:25, 22:10, 22:12, 22:18, 22:21, 22:24, 23:6, 24:2, 25:2, 27:13, 27:19, 27:21, 29:5, 29:12, 29:14, 29:15, 29:25, 29:27, 30:3, 31:26, 32:13, 32:14, 32:20, 35:22, 37:9, 37:28, 38:9, 43:14, 43:26, 44:2. 44:4. 49:13. 49:17, 51:17, 58:4, 58:8, 59:16, 59:17, 59:18 cases [4] - 14:16, 29:6, 32:22, 37:6

Castle [4] - 48:17, 51:13, 52:12, 52:27 **CASTLE** [1] - 1:17 categories [1] - 56:9 caught [2] - 56:11, 56.12 CCTV [3] - 15:25, 30:29, 31:1 ceased [1] - 15:3 centre [1] - 25:6 ceremony [2] -48:17. 51:13 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 certain [5] - 11:1, 13:22, 32:24, 60:7, 60:8 certainly [4] - 6:26, 8:14, 11:3, 63:7 certify [1] - 1:24 chain [1] - 46:15 Chair [2] - 6:4, 6:11 CHAIRMAN [157] -1:12, 6:5, 6:12, 6:20, 6:25, 6:29, 7:18, 7:27, 8:3, 8:7, 8:17, 8:25, 9:1, 10:9, 11:3, 11:7, 11:9, 11:15, 11:21, 11:25, 12:2, 17:25, 17:28, 18:3, 18:5, 18:7, 18:10, 18:20, 22:9, 22:12, 22:18, 22:23, 22:29, 23:2, 23:7, 23:15, 23:26, 23:29, 24:27, 25:6, 25:8, 25:11, 25:14, 25:19, 25:21, 26:24, 26:26, 27:2, 27:6, 28:11, 28:21, 28:25, 28:29, 29:5, 29:10, 29:12, 29:15, 29:17, 29:19, 29:25, 29:27, 34:22, 35:1, 35:3, 35:5, 35:11, 35:13, 35:22, 35:28, 36:2, 36:4, 36:6, 36:8, 36:13, 36:15, 36:18, 37:20, 37:22, 37:24, 37:26, 39:6, 39:14, 39:20, 39:24, 39:29, 40:3, 40:10, 40:12, 40:14, 40:20, 40:23, 41:1, 41:5, 41:25, 43:23, 43:25, 44:7, 44:19, 44:21, 45:3, 45:7, 45:13, 45:16, 45:20, 45:22, 45:25, 46:2, 46:9, 46:11, 46:16, 46:21, 46:23, 46:26, 46:29, 47:4,

47:13, 47:17, 47:21,

BRIAN [2] - 3:15,

3.16

47:24, 47:26, 49:18, 49:20, 50:7, 51:8, 51:10, 51:12, 51:17, 51:23, 51:25, 52:1, 52:5, 52:17, 52:20, 53:3, 55:2, 55:7, 55:10, 55:12, 55:14, 55:17, 55:24, 55:29, 56:2, 56:16, 58:2, 58:4, 58:10, 58:15, 58:18, 58:23, 63:7, 63:9, 63:11, 63:16, 63:21, 63:23, 64:29 Chairman [15] - 6:18, 7:26, 10:8, 11:8, 11:16, 18:4, 18:8, 32:5, 47:10, 58:16, 63:3, 63:4, 63:10, 63:17, 64:28 chairman [1] - 10:26 chapter [2] - 32:28, 38:20 charge [2] - 16:29, 28:9 Charge [1] - 32:22 charged [3] - 19:9, 19:20, 19:24 charging [1] - 20:14 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:4 CHEALLACHÁIN[1] - 2:30 **check** [2] - 8:3, 11:3 **chief** [18] - 24:19, 36:20, 36:21, 37:17, 47:18, 48:3, 49:6, 49:11, 53:24, 55:4, 55:25, 55:27, 56:2. 56:5, 56:6, 57:1, 57:20, 58:5 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief's [1] - 55:22 chosen [1] - 23:16 chronological [1] -46.15 chronology [1] -47:3 Circuit [1] - 37:10 circumstances [6] -9:9, 10:26, 22:19, 29:6, 44:29, 64:16 civil [2] - 41:14, 42:22 claim [1] - 43:6 clarification [2] -8:13, 61:11 **clause** [1] - 33:2

clear [5] - 9:2, 18:11,

24:8, 37:20, 37:22 clearly [2] - 28:3, 47:27 clicked [2] - 24:24, 40:6 clothes [1] - 13:3 clothing [6] - 16:6, 21:3, 27:3, 27:15, 27:23, 30:8 cloud [1] - 10:19 CO [2] - 2:13, 4:1 Code [1] - 32:29 coffee [1] - 8:4 Cogavin [3] - 15:26, 19:16, 19:19 coincides [1] - 42:20 collapse [1] - 58:3 colleague [2] -57:14, 58:7 colleagues [9] -15:1, 15:2, 15:26, 16:15, 19:2, 21:13, 28:25, 50:1, 50:13 column [2] - 13:27, 19:18 **coming** [4] - 9:29, 24:2, 27:22, 59:29 commenced [1] commend [1] - 57:27 commendation [48] -22:6, 22:7, 22:9, 29:7,

10:29, 21:23, 21:28, 32:8, 32:20, 32:23, 33:5, 33:7, 33:11, 33:16, 33:20, 33:23, 33:25, 34:6, 34:11, 35:19, 38:16, 41:9, 42:6, 44:27, 47:28, 48:29, 49:7, 49:11, 49:29, 50:14, 51:6, 52:13, 53:10, 54:2, 54:9, 54:11, 54:18, 54:19, 55:2, 55:5, 55:23, 56:27, 57:5, 57:7, 57:12, 57:14, 57:16, 58:7

commendations [26] - 11:20, 11:29, 12:2, 12:12, 12:19, 12:26, 22:19, 29:20, 29:21, 29:23, 30:2, 33:1, 36:10, 37:17, 43:10, 44:20, 51:19, 53:14, 53:22, 54:12, 54:15, 54:25, 54:28, 55:1, 57:22, 58:1

Commendations [1] - 12:22

commendations" [1]

- 12:27 comment [2] - 10:12, 52:18

COMMISSIONER [9] - 2.20 3.2 3.5 3.6 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3.20

Commissioner [8] -58:22, 59:1, 59:20, 59:23, 60:29, 61:12, 62:13, 62:23

commissioner [3] -46:17, 46:19, 63:1 commitment [1] -50:22

committed [1] -14:19

committee [16] -33:7, 33:16, 33:25, 34:6, 34:11, 34:15, 34:19, 34:26, 34:27, 35:7, 35:15, 36:9, 37:26, 38:17, 52:27, 55:8

common [5] - 14:7, 14:10, 14:15, 14:21, 31:26

communications [2] - 18:29, 59:10

COMPANY[1] - 2:22 competently [1] -28:27

complaining [2] -

41.8 44.11 complaint [19] -6:22, 8:20, 9:23, 12:14, 13:11, 27:26, 30:18, 37:29, 39:24.

42:6, 52:8, 52:15, 54:1, 55:21, 56:20, 56:23, 56:26, 59:22, 62:20

complaints [3] -11:19, 58:20, 62:17 completed [6] - 15:8, 24:10, 24:18, 24:28, 34:5. 34:10 completely [4] -13:8, 13:14, 24:5,

39:18 completion [1] -13:25

complicated [1] -31.28

composed [1] - 35:8 concern [1] - 10:19 concerned [4] - 8:19, 53:11, 59:5, 64:18 concerns [2] - 61:7,

61:29

conclusion [1] - 37:9 condemn [1] - 47:7 conditions [1] -50:22

conduct [1] - 13:17 conducted isi -15:25, 16:4, 16:12, 60:6, 61:10, 62:14 conducting [2] -60:14, 62:16 confine [1] - 7:20 confirm [1] - 52:24

24:16 **CONLON** [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT[1] -

confirmed [1] -

connected [2] -

31:29, 43:8 CONNELLAN[2] -3:30, 3:30

Connolly [1] - 20:7 **CONOR** [1] - 3:24 consequently [1] -

consider [2] - 9:24, 63:5 consideration [1] -

63:19 considered [2] -14:22, 34:18 consult [1] - 63:18 consultations [1] -59:11

contacted [1] - 31:2 continued [3] -16:21, 16:25, 63:26 CONTINUED [1] -

6:15

continuity [3] -21:16, 26:2, 26:22 contrary [2] - 38:15, 57:23

contrast [1] - 49:18 contribution [1] control [1] - 58:29

convenient [2] -10:6, 64:24 conversation [1] -61:24

coordinating [2] -20:10, 25:27 COPPINGER [1] -

Coppinger [4] - 59:8, 61:17, 61:20, 62:18 core [1] - 59:22 correct [26] - 14:6, 14:14, 16:3, 16:10,

16:18, 17:6, 17:11, 18:15, 18:24, 19:4, 19:25, 23:23, 25:28, 27:5, 27:8, 27:16, 28:12, 32:3, 51:1, 52:29, 53:1, 54:24, 56:21, 56:25, 59:15, 63:24 correctly [1] - 30:6

correspondence [1] 48:12 COSTELLO [1] -2:22

counsel [2] - 64:9, 64:22

country [1] - 57:29 County [1] - 49:5 course [4] - 9:6, 33:9, 59:12, 60:11 court [4] - 19:1. 19:20, 19:24, 20:14

COURT [3] - 1:13, 2:3, 3:31

Court [1] - 37:10 Coveney [2] - 52:26, 53:2

cover [1] - 11:4 crime [2] - 13:5, 25:9 crimes [3] - 14:21, 15:24. 56:9

criminal~ [2] - 14:23,58:21

critical [1] - 9:7 criticisms [1] - 60:7 cropped [1] - 42:15 CROSS [2] - 5:5,

cross [6] - 6:13, 8:16, 35:23, 58:25, 64:6, 64:17

6.15

cross-examination [3] - 58:25, 64:6, 64:17 cross-examined [1] - 8:16

CROSS-EXAMINED [2] - 5:5, 6:15

cross-examining [2] - 6:13, 35:23 **CUALÁIN**[1] - 3:7

Cualáin [10] - 11:24, 58:22, 59:1, 59:21, 59:23, 60:29, 61:12, 62:13, 62:22, 62:23

CULLEN[1] - 2:11 **culprits** [1] - 37:9 **cup** [1] - 8:4

curious [1] - 41:28 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 Curley [13] - 15:8,

36:9, 37:3, 37:28, demonstrate [1] -8:29, 54:23 **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, 27:14, 30:29, 31:3 38:10, 38:29, 39:6, 38:27 disagree [1] - 34:21 3:20 ensured [1] - 50:23 39:20, 40:17 Dempsey [3] - 54:10, disagreement [1] -**DPP** [2] - 19:1, 23:21 entered [1] - 27:29 Curley.. [1] - 38:7 55:5. 56:13 14:15 **DR** [1] - 3:11 enthusiastic [2] -Curran [2] - 49:11, denial [3] - 11:20, disclosed [2] draw [5] - 12:11, 46:3, 51:19 55:13 12:12, 12:18 10:16, 10:18 15:6, 15:17, 33:1, entire [3] - 32:1, **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 Denial [3] - 12:21, 32:17, 47:19 disclosure [5] -64.1 custody [3] - 16:25, 12:25, 12:27 10:13, 10:19, 49:9, drawn [1] - 64:2 entirely [1] - 64:15 19:10, 26:13 Derek [1] - 31:7 54:14, 63:22 drew [1] - 47:11 entitled [4] - 10:2, DISCLOSURES [2] -32:8, 32:19, 43:25 description [3] driver [6] - 12:7, D 13:29, 30:27, 50:15 entitlement [2] -1:2. 1:3 12:25, 13:1, 15:28, **DESMOND**[1] - 4:3 disclosures [1] -36:3, 39:9 32:7, 32:12 despite [2] - 51:18, 54:17 **DUBLIN** [6] - 1:17, **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 **D/Super** [1] - 61:22 51:19 discovered [3] -2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, **EQUALITY** [1] - 1:8 damage [1] - 38:28 detail [2] - 58:28, 27:15, 40:10, 40:11 4:5 equally [2] - 11:27, Damien [1] - 20:19 discovery [1] - 31:23 **Dublin** [5] - 48:17, 59.10 21:9 danger [1] - 48:22 discredit [2] - 38:28, details [3] - 14:28, 51:13, 52:12, 52:27 equivalent [1] - 49:7 date [4] - 14:19, 15:11, 28:7 due [1] - 8:16 error [1] - 18:2 44:7, 56:24, 64:27 detected [1] - 13:5 discrediting [1] during [3] - 16:13, essentially [2] -**DAVID** [2] - 2:28, 40:26 detection [7] - 16:2, 18:25, 40:8 59:24 3:18 16:11, 17:7, 18:27, discuss [2] - 10:29, duty [9] - 18:23, established [1] -**DAVIS**[1] - 2:8 20:26, 21:29, 38:13 63:6 29:2, 31:27, 33:9, 41.21 **DAY** [1] - 1:18 discussed [1] - 64:5 49:4, 54:15, 56:24, **DETECTIVE** [5] - 3:4, ESTABLISHED[1] day's [2] - 10:20, 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17 dispute [6] - 21:1, 57:21, 60:15 1:7 36:16 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 detective [6] - 15:2, 21:15, 22:3, 26:14, evaluation[1] days [6] - 18:23, 15:9, 19:2, 24:1, 32:1, 31:13. 33:17 57:24 18:25, 31:4, 31:12, 57:17 Divilly [3] - 15:26, Е evening [1] - 24:20 31:26, 40:6 Detective [16] -19:17, 19:23 event [2] - 13:25, **DCC** [1] - 37:27 15:26, 19:16, 19:19, **DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 52:29 deal [7] - 11:18, e-mail [2] - 31:16, 20:10, 30:19, 58:26, division [3] - 49:5, events [2] - 52:14, 11:23, 12:4, 45:5, 31:21 58:28, 59:4, 59:7, 54:16. 56:6 47:28, 53:28, 57:10 e-mails [1] - 8:23 61:14, 61:15, 61:16, divisional [9] - 33:7, everywhere [1] - 9:3 dealing [1] - 9:28 **Eamon** [1] - 15:8 61:19, 61:24, 61:29, 33:16, 33:24, 34:5, evidence [47] - 7:6, **EAMON**[1] - 3:10 deals [1] - 32:29 62:5 34:11, 34:18, 54:5, 12:3, 13:20, 14:27, early [2] - 16:24, dealt [1] - 19:1 **detectives** [2] - 29:3, 55:12, 55:15 15:18, 17:17, 21:5, **DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 31:11 61:27 **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:3 21:11, 21:18, 22:13, effectively [2] decide [1] - 40:29 detention [2] - 16:13, document [5] - 7:23, 24:8, 26:2, 26:28, 38:16, 41:8 decided [2] - 29:19, 49:27, 50:6, 50:10, 28:20, 28:21, 28:22, 29:20 efforts [1] - 48:22 **DEVELOPMENT**[1] 52:25 29:29, 30:3, 30:4, EGAN [1] - 3:25 decides [1] - 62:23 - 3:16 documentation [1] -30:12, 31:15, 32:5, eight [2] - 46:8, decision [8] - 22:14, developments [1] -46:25 36:1, 38:9, 38:10, 46:12 22:26, 22:27, 30:1, 18:27 38:26, 38:29, 40:16, documents [10] -33:15, 36:27, 38:18, either [7] - 16:9, **DI**[2] - 61:16, 61:20 7:3, 7:4, 7:21, 8:27, 40:24, 41:4, 41:15, 39:4 16:17, 17:5, 21:23, **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 22:1, 22:28, 28:3, 42:11, 43:5, 47:11, decision-makers [1] 26:19, 54:20, 64:7 diary [3] - 17:20, 30:5, 38:6 52:9, 53:29, 54:4, - 36:27 elderly [1] - 14:12 54:22, 57:20, 58:24, 17:22, 18:13 **DONAL** [2] - 3:7, element [1] - 32:29 decisions [1] - 18:29 difference [3] - 51:8, 59:18, 60:3, 60:9, 3:24 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:5 elements [2] - 15:23, 60:12, 60:28, 61:6 51:10, 51:15 **Donal** [1] - 58:22 dedication [1] -38:13 different [8] - 9:20, done [13] - 13:13, Evidence [3] - 26:7, 50:21 ELIZABETH[1] -32:25, 34:7, 39:12, 15:1, 21:14, 24:9, 26:27, 27:7 defendants [1] -2:29 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 43:23, 49:5, 53:22, 24:17. 24:27. 25:14. **embark** [1] - 64:19 26:12 28:9, 46:2, 46:5, exactly [2] - 52:6, 56.9 **EMMA**[1] - 3:26 delay [1] - 60:7 46:26, 54:22, 62:24 **DIGNAM** [1] - 3:24 delayed [1] - 45:27 enable [1] - 64:12 directed [3] - 61:9, door [3] - 62:1, 62:4 examination [4] end [3] - 10:21, delays [1] - 9:9 62:14 doubt [1] - 47:8 15:25, 58:25, 64:6, deliberate [1] - 43:15 28:13, 48:5 direction [1] - 53:29 64.17 down [13] - 23:24, deliberately [2] endeavour [1] -**DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 23:27, 24:22, 33:14, **examined** [1] - 8:16 29:20, 54:23 64:23 **EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, DIRECTORATE[1] -39:16, 40:13, 47:26, engaged [1] - 60:29 delivered [1] - 9:25 49:11, 53:23, 55:23, 6:15

57:19, 60:20, 61:23

disadvantage [2] -

Delvin [1] - 56:7

enquiries [4] - 16:12,

examining [2] - 6:13,

35:23 example [10] - 19:19, 25:2, 25:12, 32:22, 49:3, 49:16, 49:17, 57:15, 60:23, 61:15 excellent [3] - 20:26, 26:11, 33:10 except [1] - 58:13 exclude [2] - 30:1, excluded [1] - 29:13 excuse [1] - 44:24 executing [1] - 20:2 **executive** [1] - 35:26 EXECUTIVE [1] exercise [1] - 9:11 exhibits [2] - 27:16, exist [1] - 7:21 expanded [1] - 15:20 **expected** [1] - 33:8 explain [4] - 9:21, 39:22, 39:23, 64:23 exploring [1] - 44:16 expressed[1]-61:29 **expression** [1] - 39:8 extensive [1] - 16:27 extra [1] - 8:26 extract [1] - 48:3 extremely [1] - 8:8

F

faced [1] - 26:12 fact [14] - 9:15, 9:28, 24:22, 27:11, 27:27, 38:28, 41:12, 47:14, 47:15, 52:22, 52:23, 53:12, 54:17, 62:16 facts [1] - 15:12 factual [1] - 44:4 failing [1] - 54:1 fair [5] - 16:1, 17:4, 17:13, 32:23, 52:20 fairly [4] - 42:25, 47:27, 59:3, 59:13 fairness [3] - 40:20, 53:4, 64:18 fallen [1] - 50:16 false [1] - 43:7 family [1] - 31:1 **FANNING** [1] - 2:21 far [5] - 29:24, 32:11, 32:12, 52:2, 59:5 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:2 fascinating [1] - 51:2

faster [2] - 46:3, 46:5

FEBRUARY [2] - 1:5, 1:9 fella [1] - 57:4 felt [1] - 8:29 FERGAL [1] - 2:27 FERRY [1] - 2:16 few [5] - 34:1, 34:16, 42:28, 63:17 file [9] - 20:5, 23:21, 24:9, 24:12, 24:17, 24:27, 26:4, 27:12, 56:1 filled [3] - 33:29,

38:11, 40:18 **final** [1] - 10:12 finally [3] - 52:21, 53:10. 53:27 finger [1] - 9:11 finish [1] - 29:8 FINN [1] - 3:5 FINTAN [1] - 2:21 firearm [2] - 16:26 first [18] - 12:5, 15:6, 15:11, 15:20, 16:13, 21:2, 26:6, 28:17, 28:18, 29:1, 29:12, 39:7, 48:20, 52:10, 54:21, 57:25, 58:25, 60:27

FITZWILLIAM [1] -4:5 five [2] - 10:27, 63:5 fixation [1] - 30:16 fixing [1] - 43:28

FLYNN [1] - 3:19 folder [1] - 7:21 following [7] - 1:25, 12:14, 15:19, 16:11, 23:16, 59:10, 59:14 FOLLOWING [1] -

FOLLOWS [4] - 6:1, 6:16, 11:13, 63:14 footprint [1] - 27:28 FOR [9] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 3:30, 4:1

forensic [1] - 59:13 forgetting [1] - 44:26 form [5] - 33:29, 38:11, 40:18, 64:24 formal [1] - 51:13 FORMER [2] - 1:13,

forward [1] - 55:10 forwarded [1] - 31:6 four [6] - 14:19, 16:27, 19:8, 31:21, 45:8, 61:18 frank [1] - 45:23 fraud [1] - 43:16 FREEMAN [1] - 2:22 fresh [1] - 45:12 Friday [1] - 40:1 FRIDAY [2] - 1:18, 6:1 front [2] - 36:9, 37:19 fully [1] - 63:18

G

Galway [1] - 25:3

furnishing [1] - 9:27

future [3] - 21:4,

61:9, 62:14

gang [1] - 14:22 **Gard** [1] - 19:19 Garda [79] - 6:13, 6:22, 6:27, 7:6, 7:8, 8:8, 9:28, 12:3, 12:24, 15:26, 19:16, 19:23, 19:26, 19:29, 20:5, 20:7, 20:13, 20:16, 20:19. 21:21. 23:13. 23:19, 24:7, 26:4, 26:17, 29:28, 30:29, 31:2, 32:29, 33:5, 36:19, 38:8, 40:15, 41:29, 42:5, 43:10, 43:12, 44:20, 45:26, 46:18, 47:11, 48:8, 48:23, 48:29, 49:2, 49:26, 50:4, 51:6, 52:7, 53:6, 53:11, 53:27, 54:10, 55:5, 56:13, 56:17, 57:13, 57:26, 58:20, 58:24, 59:7, 59:27, 60:13, 60:14, 60:17, 60:18, 60:23, 60:24, 61:7, 61:8, 61:20, 62:1, 62:3, 62:11, 62:26 **GARDA**[11] - 2:10, 2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2, $3:10, \, 3:11, \, 3:12, \, 3:21,$ 5:3, 6:15 garda [4] - 7:1, 49:14, 54:18, 57:11 Garda's [1] - 42:20 Gardaí [2] - 41:14, 42:23 gather [1] - 28:20 gathering [1] - 26:2 general [3] - 31:5, 39:7, 46:5 generous [2] - 43:29, 51:14

GERARD [1] - 2:11 GERRY [1] - 3:11 GISC [1] - 23:25 given [14] - 7:24, 7:25, 14:27, 24:13, 29:7, 38:17, 41:3, 41:4, 41:8, 41:10, 47:28, 55:2, 58:24, 60:12 glances [1] - 56:1 GLEESON [1] - 4:4 GOODE [1] - 3:22 graded [1] - 39:16

GOODE [1] - 3:22 graded [1] - 39:16 GRALTON [1] - 3:14 Gralton [2] - 36:21, 37:17 grand [1] - 40:2 gravity [1] - 45:18

great [5] - 19:4, 28:10, 45:28, 48:22, 49:10 GREENE [1] - 2:27 GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26

GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26 ground [2] - 57:22, 57:24 group [1] - 15:24

guards [3] - 28:8, 57:28, 60:17 guess [1] - 9:13 guilty [4] - 19:9, 26:6, 26:12, 40:25 guise [6] - 42:9, 42:11, 43:4, 43:6,

GWEN [1] - 1:29 **Gwen** [1] - 1:24

half [1] - 19:13

43:15, 43:20

Н

HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 hand [2] - 13:27, 19.18 handed [2] - 27:15, 27.22 hands [9] - 23:6, 23:7, 30:11, 34:28, 38:22, 52:4, 52:19, 53:1, 58:14 hanging [1] - 60:15 happy [1] - 11:7 HARAN[1] - 4:2 hard [3] - 45:22, 46:7, 47:6 hate [1] - 7:26 he' [1] - 61:11 head [1] - 14:17 **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 heading [3] - 12:12, 12:18, 19:14 heard [2] - 30:5, 47:25 **HEARING** [4] - 6:1, 11:12. 63:13. 65:5 **HELD**[1] - 1:17 help[1] - 62:28 helpful [1] - 59:27 heroin [1] - 25:2 herring [1] - 42:5 high [2] - 37:7, 43:14 history [1] - 13:16 hmm [1] - 45:24 hold [4] - 35:1, 44:21, 51:17, 52:17 home [1] - 16:15 **hop** [1] - 39:28 hoped [1] - 9:14 HORAN [1] - 3:25 hours [2] - 14:18, house [1] - 16:5 **HOUSE** [2] - 2:23, howsoever [1] - 35:7 hugely [1] - 64:8 **HUGHES** [2] - 2:29, 2:30 **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15

- 1

hype [1] - 64:7

identification [7] -16:14, 16:22, 17:8, 18:27, 18:28, 19:16, 21:29 identified [5] - 15:27, 19:23, 20:25, 37:8, 38:13 **identifies** [1] - 19:19 ignore [1] - 23:17 illogicality [1] -62:19 imitation [1] - 16:26 impact [1] - 13:13 importance [1] -64.9 important [3] -20:25, 28:13, 28:15 IN [1] - 1:17 **inaudible** [1] - 16:5 incident [36] - 12:6, 14:26, 17:25, 23:25, 24:6, 24:10, 24:18, 24:21, 24:25, 24:28, 25:1, 25:3, 25:11, 25:12, 25:15, 25:22,

25:25, 25:29, 27:29,

GERAGHTY [1] -

28:4, 28:6, 30:9, 30:11, 30:23, 31:5, 39:15, 40:6, 41:24, 49:4, 49:25, 50:24, 51:27, 56:19, 58:6, 61:28 incidents [6] - 14:4, 14:7, 39:12, 41:27, 45:14, 56:7 inclement [1] - 50:22 include [2] - 15:20, included [1] - 39:7 including [2] - 14:17, incorrect [1] - 42:29 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 indicate [4] - 22:2, 31:20, 32:11, 59:28 indicated [2] - 15:23 indicates [6] - 18:26, 21:26, 31:25, 33:15, 34:14, 52:25 indicating [3] -25:25, 27:12, 47:19 indictment [1] -26:15 indulgence [1] -10:27 information [12] -7:12, 9:3, 9:26, 31:7, 33:24, 33:27, 34:18, 35:13, 35:14, 35:15, 38:19, 65:2 initiate [1] - 57:13 injuries [2] - 14:17 Injuries [1] - 41:13 injury [1] - 42:21 inputs [1] - 7:9 inquiry [1] - 9:12 INQUIRY [2] - 1:2, insane [4] - 60:4, 60:26, 61:25, 62:10 insofar [5] - 7:19, 17:7, 37:1, 40:26, 53:10 insofar's [1] - 38:26 INSPECTOR [7] -3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:18, 3:22, 4:2 inspector [1] - 33:6 Inspector [12] - 15:8, 33:29, 37:3, 37:28, 38:6, 38:10, 38:29, 39:6, 39:20, 40:16, 61:16, 62:18 INSTRUCTED [7] -2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 3:30, 4:4

instruction [1] - 9:16 instructions [1] -10:28 INSTRUMENT[1] -1:7 instrumental [1] -17:1 intend [1] - 47:19 intended [1] - 10:28 inter [1] - 13:5 interpret [1] - 27:11 interrogation [1] interrupt [1] - 7:26 interviewed [1] -60.23 interviewer [1] -20:19 interviewing [2] -20:7, 20:13 interviews [6] -16:25, 60:29, 61:4, 61:9, 62:14, 62:16 INTO [1] - 1:2 introduction [1] -9:21 investigating [7] -

49:24 investigation [44] -11:24, 13:4, 13:17, 13:19, 13:26, 15:4, 15:19, 16:12, 17:2, 17:9, 20:3, 20:11, 20:26, 21:29, 23:21, 25:27, 26:11, 28:15, 28:17, 29:1, 31:11, 31:28, 31:29, 32:2, 32:7, 35:27, 37:6, 37:14, 38:25, 39:1, 39:2, 58:21, 58:29, 59:21, 60:3, 60:5, 60:10, 60:13, 60:14, 60:22, 60:24, 60:26, 61:27, 62:21

23:27. 24:3. 24:23.

24:26, 31:2, 39:17,

investigation" [1] - 19:15 investigations [5] - 16:21, 20:28, 38:12,

59:12, 63:26 investigator [1] -59:8

43:2, 43:14 **involved** [26] - 13:2, 13:9, 13:13, 14:23, 16:1, 16:8, 16:17,

investigators [2] -

17:4, 17:9, 17:11, 17:13, 17:14, 19:29,

20:2, 20:5, 20:7, 20:21, 22:20, 22:25, 24:21, 25:22, 25:26, 29:8, 32:18, 32:21, 39:1

involvement [8] -16:28, 19:14, 23:13, 23:19, 27:13, 27:18, 27:21, 37:13 involving [1] - 12:6

Irish [2] - 41:10, 41:21

irrelevant [1] - 49:23

irresistible [1] - 10:1 irrespective [1] -27:2 is's [1] - 12:25

issuance [1] - 42:20 issue [33] - 6:19, 6:21, 7:10, 8:28, 10:5, 10:6, 10:9, 10:29, 11:2, 11:4, 16:2, 19:5, 20:22, 20:24, 24:1, 36:28, 41:2, 44:17, 48:2, 51:18, 53:27, 58:17, 58:19, 59:3, 60:27, 63:5, 63:19, 63:22, 64:17, 64:18, 64:19 issued [2] - 41:12,

58:6 **issues** [5] - 10:12, 11:18, 12:4, 12:5,

itself [1] - 13:19

64:5

J

JACK [1] - 3:6 **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 job [4] - 25:4, 28:10, 56:13, 59:4 **JOE** [1] - 3:14 **JOHN** [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:30 joint [1] - 39:2 Judge [77] - 7:12, 8:12, 14:20, 20:22, 21:1, 21:16, 22:3, 22:11, 22:28, 23:24, 23:27, 24:14, 25:2, 25:7, 25:29, 26:20, 26:22, 27:8, 27:21, 28:3, 28:28, 29:9, 29:11, 29:23, 30:4, 30:11, 31:13, 32:13, 33:17, 34:7, 34:28, 36:5, 36:14, 37:15, 38:3, 38:5, 39:5,

39:11, 39:16, 39:27, 40:4, 40:28, 40:29, 41:21, 42:5, 42:13, 43:9, 43:21, 44:17, 45:2, 46:14, 48:27, 49:3, 49:4, 50:3, 50:29, 51:2, 51:21, 52:4, 52:6, 52:16, 52:19, 53:23, 54:9, 54:11, 54:25, 57:25, 57:27, 58:14, 59:24, 59:26, 60:2, 60:12, 60:18, 60:25, 62:10, 62:21

July [1] - 9:17 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 juveniles [1] - 14:19

K

KANE [1] - 2:28 KATE [1] - 3:25 KAVANAGH [1] - 2:5 Kavanagh [2] - 6:7, 3:10 KEANE [1] - 4:3 Keane [1] - 19:29

Keane [1] - 19:29 **kelly** [1] - 11:1 **Kelly** [5] - 7:6, 7:8, 8:9, 11:17, 47:4 **KELLY** [8] - 2:10, 3:12, 46:14, 46:17, 46:22, 46:24, 46:28, 47:2

Kelly's [1] - 7:23 Keogh [30] - 6:13, 6:22, 6:27, 7:1, 8:8, 9:28, 12:3, 12:24, 21:21, 24:7, 26:4, 29:28, 36:19, 38:8, 40:15, 43:12, 45:26, 48:8, 48:24, 49:14, 49:26, 50:4, 53:27, 56:17, 57:11, 58:20, 58:24, 59:27, 62:11, 62:26

KEOGH [3] - 2:10, 5:3, 6:15 **Keogh's** [4] - 23:13,

23:19, 31:2, 47:11

KEVIN [1] - 3:14

KIERAN [1] - 3:20

kind [3] - 41:11,

53:15, 62:22

KIRWAN [1] - 3:13

knowingly [1] - 60:9 knowledge [4] - 23:13, 23:19, 24:20, 59:29 **known** [2] - 35:17, 62:12

L

lads [1] - 57:5 lady [2] - 48:9, 50:16 larger [2] - 26:16, 32:2 last [20] - 7:3, 12:4,

12:13, 12:16, 12:20, 12:21, 19:13, 33:17, 37:15, 41:15, 42:15, 42:17, 42:27, 49:28, 53:13, 53:29, 59:19, 60:3, 60:12

late [1] - 9:27

LAWLOR [1] - 2:29 leader [1] - 7:28 leads [2] - 59:11, 59:14

learn [1] - 9:17 least [1] - 39:3 leave [4] - 6:23, 6:25, 10:9, 60:16

leaves [1] - 27:28 led [4] - 9:9, 16:13, 16:15, 16:22 legal [4] - 7:16, 8:12,

57:21, 58:12 **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13 **length** [2] - 41:26,

less [3] - 29:24, 35:16, 35:17 letter [6] - 46:17,

58:27

46:19, 47:15, 49:10, 49:28, 50:27 **letters** [1] - 18:13

level [1] - 57:22 levels [1] - 53:22 LIAM [1] - 3:18 light [4] - 21:19,

31:17, 52:9, 53:28
limit [2] - 41:29, 42:2
line [6] - 24:12,
27:10, 27:27, 30:26,
33:17, 42:10

link [3] - 14:7, 14:10, 26:27 listen [1] - 62:26

LITTLE [1] - 3:28 live [2] - 9:17, 10:18 load [1] - 7:13 local [1] - 31:1 locker [3] - 53:16,

53:21, 53:26

look [12] - 9:28, 10:2, 19:13, 19:17, 36:20, 37:2, 38:5, 44:10, 49:21, 51:25, 51:28, 60:25 looked [3] - 39:9, 57:16, 62:5 looking [2] - 36:19, 45.29 **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 lunchtime [1] - 11:26 Lyons [1] - 60:23 LYONS [1] - 4:3 М

MADE[2] - 1:2, 1:7 mail [2] - 31:16, 31:21 mails [1] - 8:23 MAIN [1] - 2:12 maintained [1] -44.23 major [2] - 53:25, 57:10 majority [1] - 57:23 makers [1] - 36:27 Malarkey [2] - 36:26, 37:18 malarkey [1] - 36:27 male [1] - 16:29 Malone [1] - 1:24 MALONE [1] - 1:29 manage [1] - 11:28 management [1] -17:9 March [1] - 54:5 MARGARET[1] -MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17 **MARK**[1] - 3:3 Mark [2] - 49:11, 55:13 mark [1] - 25:4 marked [1] - 12:21 MARRINAN[1] - 2:7 Marrinan [1] - 64:2 Martin [1] - 20:2 material [14] - 8:21, 8:22, 9:4, 9:10, 9:12, 9:14, 9:17, 10:1, 10:18, 14:28, 20:25, 35:7, 64:3, 64:24 materials [4] - 9:8, 9:27, 10:11, 18:9 MATT[1] - 3:19 matter [8] - 7:16, 13:12, 26:24, 29:2, 30:13, 52:21, 52:23,

54:13 matters [4] - 7:2, 19:7, 59:2, 60:8 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:4 **MATTHIAS**[1] - 2:10 McBrien [3] - 2:16, 55:19, 56:19 McCOURT [1] - 2:17 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 McGRATH[2] - 2:7, 2:28 mcGuinness [2] -

8:25, 47:14 McGuinness [26] -2:6, 3:24, 7:2, 8:17, 8:19, 8:26, 11:7, 11:8, 41:16, 44:2, 47:10, 47:18, 47:22, 48:12, 49:27, 53:13, 53:28, 59:19, 63:3, 63:8, 63:10, 63:17, 63:22, 63:25, 64:2, 64:28 MCLOUGHLIN [1] -

3:6 McLYNN [1] - 3:31 MCMAHON[1] - 3:8 McMeeting [1] -19:26

MCPARTLIN[1] -3:20

mean [19] - 21:6, 21:10, 22:16, 22:29, 24:27, 24:29, 25:15, 30:5, 35:9, 35:22, 39:15, 39:25, 44:7, 45:7, 45:22, 51:12, 52:5, 53:25, 55:17 means [1] - 25:16 meantime [1] - 65:2 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 MEMBER [1] - 2:2 member [17] - 23:28, 24:4, 24:23, 24:26,

31:2, 33:10, 39:17, 40:13, 53:5, 56:23, 57:13, 57:26, 57:27, 62:20

Member [1] - 32:22 members [15] -19:15. 21:22. 22:6. 26:18, 31:1, 31:4, 33:5, 35:16, 38:17, 48:7, 48:16, 48:18, 48:20, 50:21, 60:21 mercifully [1] - 49:25 merging [1] - 38:12 MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 middle [1] - 30:26

might [8] - 9:4,

10:14, 10:20, 26:16, 36:10, 46:4, 51:27, 58:2

mind [3] - 12:9, 31:13, 34:23

minimum [1] - 42:2 MINISTER [1] - 1:7

mindset [1] - 43:1

Minister [3] - 52:12, 52:26. 53:2

MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 minor [2] - 53:20 minute [3] - 26:5, 27:21, 53:17

minutes [7] - 8:1, 10:27, 34:1, 34:16, 42:28, 63:5, 63:18 misrecording [2] -

6:23, 6:25 mistake [1] - 39:21

mistakes [1] - 39:25 moment [5] - 7:20, 7:29, 8:17, 48:13, 57:15

Monaghan [4] - 28:9, 30:20, 31:7, 31:10 Monday [2] - 64:27

MONDAY [1] - 65:5 MONICA [1] - 3:15 months [14] - 41:23,

41:26, 42:13, 42:15, 43:22, 44:10, 44:12, 44:13, 44:14, 44:15, 45:5, 45:27, 47:7,

47:23 morning [7] - 6:4, 6:18, 7:20, 16:24, 30:22, 31:22, 32:6

MORONEY [1] - 3:18 morphed [1] - 31:28 MORRISSEY [1] -

3.26 $\boldsymbol{most}\, [2] \boldsymbol{-} 8{:}23,$ 64:24

motive [1] - 48:23 move [4] - 6:19,

10:4, 11:22, 41:2 moved [1] - 57:18 moving [1] - 17:28

MR [97] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:8, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24,

3:24, 3:30, 3:30, 4:3, 5:5, 6:4, 6:11, 6:16, 6:18, 6:21, 7:1, 7:19,

7:26, 7:28, 8:6, 8:19, 8:26, 10:8, 10:26,

11:22, 12:1, 12:3, 17:27, 18:1, 18:4, 18:6, 18:8, 18:11, 18:22, 22:13, 23:9, 23:16, 24:7, 25:22, 27:9, 29:28, 34:25, 36:19, 37:28, 40:15, 40:24, 41:2, 41:6, 41:29, 46:14, 46:17, 46:22, 46:24, 46:28,

11:6, 11:8, 11:16,

47:2, 47:10, 47:14, 47:18, 47:22, 48:1, 49:26, 50:9, 52:7, 52:21, 53:4, 55:20,

56:17, 58:11, 58:16, 58:19, 58:24, 63:3, 63:8, 63:10, 63:17, 63:22, 64:28

MS[10] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 3:30, 4:4

Mulcahy [11] - 58:27, 58:28, 59:4, 61:14, 61:16, 61:20, 61:22,

61:25, 62:1, 62:6,

MULCAHY [1] - 3:5 MULLIGAN [2] -

2:11. 3:13 Mullingar [7] - 49:6, 49:12, 55:4, 56:6, 57:1, 57:21, 58:5

murder [1] - 25:12 Murphy [10] - 7:26, 10:4, 10:7, 35:3,

35:23, 43:25, 47:28, 49:22, 52:18, 63:3 MURPHY [51] - 2:30,

3:23, 5:5, 6:4, 6:11, 6:16, 6:18, 6:21, 7:1, 7:19, 10:8, 10:26, 11:6, 11:16, 11:22,

12:1, 12:3, 17:27, 18:1, 18:4, 18:6, 18:8,

18:11, 18:22, 22:13, 23:9, 23:16, 24:7,

25:22. 27:9. 29:28. 34:25, 36:19, 37:28, 40:15, 40:24, 41:2,

41:6, 41:29, 48:1,

49:26, 50:9, 52:7, 52:21. 53:4. 55:20. 56:17, 58:11, 58:16,

58:19, 58:24 murphy [1] - 23:15

Murphy's [1] - 35:6 MURRAY [2] - 3:3,

Murray [25] - 23:5,

24:9, 24:15, 27:11, 27:17, 30:10, 30:16, 30:21, 31:20, 34:28, 36:24, 37:1, 37:18, 38:14, 38:22, 40:25, 42:12, 43:27, 45:26, 47:15, 49:29, 50:12, 50:28, 53:5, 54:4 Murray's [2] - 31:15, **MÍCHEÁL** [1] - 3:23 Ν

nailed [1] - 47:26 naively [1] - 9:15 name [4] - 24:23, 24:26, 35:8, 35:18 named [3] - 1:26, 36:11, 50:10 namely [2] - 16:23, 16:29 names [2] - 50:1 national [2] - 49:6, 49:9 **nature** [1] - 14:5 necessary [1] -10:24 need [6] - 10:22, 10:29, 13:20, 15:12, 27:6. 63:6 never [2] - 17:16, 24:14 nevertheless [2] -8:9, 51:20 new [1] - 15:19 next [10] - 10:5, 12:23, 12:26, 15:17, 18:16, 23:9, 34:4, 48:14, 48:26, 51:22 NICHOLAS [4] -2:10, 4:2, 5:3, 6:15 night [4] - 13:22 21:13, 54:11, 54:12 **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 nominated [3] - 48:7, 48:18, 48:20 nominating [1] -48:23 nominations [1] -37:16 none [3] - 8:14, 21:21, 26:18 NOREEN [1] - 2:16 norm [2] - 24:2, 39:18 normal [2] - 22:19, 33:9 $\textbf{normally} \ [2] \textbf{ - } 45\text{:}11,$

49:2 **NORTHUMBERLAN D**[1] - 2:18 **nota** [1] - 57:10 **note** [1] - 30:19 notes [1] - 1:26 nothing [11] - 9:16, 21:12, 25:16, 30:6, 31:6, 37:24, 42:6, 44:15, 44:17, 49:14, 49:21 notice [1] - 7:28 **noticed** [1] - 9:5 NOVEMBER [1] -65:5 November [6] -46:26, 47:1, 48:7, 48:17, 64:28, 64:29 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:14, number [6] - 6:19, 6:21, 11:19, 11:23, 11:28, 59:28 numbers [1] - 14:2 32:21, 39:12 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 **NYLAND** [1] - 3:19 **NÍ** [1] - 2:30 **Olivia** [3] - 7:6, 7:8, **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7 0 o'Brien [1] - 7:27 O'Brien [1] - 8:7 **O'BRIEN** [4] - 2:10, 7:26, 7:28, 8:6 o'clock [1] - 31:21 O'Connell [1] - 20:16 O'CONNOR [1] -2:21 O'HIGGINS [1] - 3:23

O'MARA[1] - 2:17 **O'NEILL** [1] - 3:30 O'REARDON [1] -O'Rourke [1] - 20:19 O'SULLIVAN [1] -3:7 **objection** [1] - 11:8 observed [1] - 42:2 obviously [5] - 8:19, 21:7, 40:6, 63:25, 64:1 occasion [4] - 33:10, 48:18, 48:21, 49:22 occasions [1] occurred [5] - 14:18, 16:28, 30:23, 49:4, 56:20 OCTOBER [2] - 1:18,

OF [9] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, 3:15 Offaly [2] - 49:5, 49.25 offence [1] - 30:27 offender [1] - 14:21 offenders [5] -14:22, 15:25, 16:27, 19:8, 20:27 offered [1] - 6:8 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 office [6] - 6:8, 55:22, 55:28, 57:4, 61:17, 61:18 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, officer [7] - 6:8, 27:16, 27:23, 28:17, 28:18, 55:12, 55:15 officers [1] - 39:3 often [3] - 29:23,

7:23 OLIVIA [2] - 3:12, 3:30 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [1] - 6:26 one [34] - 7:24, 8:24, 8:26, 10:12, 14:21, 15:13, 15:24, 16:6, 16:29, 21:8, 23:10, 24:19, 29:22, 32:4, 34:22, 44:28, 45:11, 47:11, 47:26, 47:29, 51:21, 51:22, 51:23, 51:27, 52:2, 52:3, 52:4, 56:10, 64:20 one-by-one [2] -16:6. 52:2 ones [2] - 53:23,

61:1 opened [4] - 8:23, 59:9, 62:1, 62:4 opening [1] - 9:5 operation [4] - 13:8, 13:15, 26:5, 32:18 opinion [5] - 33:7, 33:16, 34:14, 34:19, 58:13 opportunity [5] -

7:17, 10:10, 11:10, 11:17, 26:7 Oranmore [1] - 25:3 ordinary [1] - 53:14 organisation [1] -

54:10 organising [1] -25:27 original [1] - 25:2 originally [2] - 23:24, 23:27 ORLA [1] - 3:20 OSMOND [1] - 3:27 OTHER [1] - 1:3 otherwise [1] - 9:13 ought [2] - 9:24, 64:11 outcome [3] - 32:14, 32:16, 50:23 outrageous [1] -59:25 outset [2] - 7:7, 13:12 outside [1] - 62:5 own [3] - 56:23, 58:13, 59:21

Ρ

PAGE[1] - 5:2

page [33] - 7:25, 12:10, 12:13, 12:16, 12:23, 12:26, 13:24, 13:27, 18:8, 19:6, 19:14, 23:11, 24:12, 27:10, 32:28, 34:3, 34:4. 34:7. 34:15. 34:16, 34:23, 34:24, 36:20, 41:3, 41:7, 48:2, 48:5, 48:26, 49:27, 50:3, 52:23, 62.29 paper [8] - 10:15, 51:9, 51:11, 51:16, 53:18, 54:27, 57:3, 57.6 paragraph [12] -12:11, 12:13, 12:16, 12:18, 12:20, 12:21, 12:25, 12:26, 12:27, 15:18, 19:8, 33:18 paragraphs [1] -15:11 pardon [2] - 18:1, parks [2] - 49:6, 49:9 part [21] - 7:5, 14:22, 20:24, 21:15, 26:5, 26:10, 27:22, 28:10, 28:15, 28:16, 29:1, 30:15, 31:11, 32:7, 42:11, 42:15, 48:9, 53:9, 60:20, 60:25, 62:2

particular [14] - 7:5, 7:15, 8:16, 11:5, 13:21, 15:2, 15:3, 24:6, 30:12, 33:8, 38:17, 40:27, 51:18, 61:18 particularly [1] -8:28 parties [3] - 64:12, 64:25, 65:1 partner [1] - 60:25 parts [2] - 60:2, 60:5 party [2] - 10:17 **PASSED**[1] - 1:4 passes [1] - 37:2 past [3] - 29:23, 53:15, 55:27 Pat [1] - 37:1 **PATRICK** [4] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:28, 3:3 patrol [1] - 56:13 PAUL [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 3:30 pause [1] - 57:15 pay [1] - 7:4 **people** [14] - 9:6, 9:10, 14:12, 22:23, 36:10, 36:11, 39:4, 39:8, 39:10, 61:18, 62:15, 62:16 **PEOPLE** [1] - 3:16 perception [2] -29:29, 38:9 perfectly [1] - 8:9

performed [1] -33:10 perhaps [6] - 8:1, 8:26, 8:27, 33:2, 47:8, permission[1] -

permit [1] - 44:5 permits [1] - 11:22 perpetrated [1] -43:16 perpetrators [1] -21.9 person [9] - 7:8,

58:19

32:18. 38:1. 38:29. 39:2, 44:1, 52:10, 54:2, 55:20 **Personal** [1] - 41:13 personal [1] - 42:21

25:26 perspective[1] -52:14

persons [2] - 22:5,

PETER [2] - 2:5, 3:13 Peter [1] - 6:6 Philip [1] - 6:8

photocopier [2] -61:21, 61:22 photographs [1] -52.29 **PIAB** [9] - 41:19, 43:8, 43:17, 43:27, 44:15, 44:24, 46:19, 46:22, 46:24 piece [9] - 10:15, 27:15, 27:23, 30:8, 47:11, 51:9, 51:11, 51:15, 57:6 place [8] - 15:13, 15:14, 15:15, 20:29, 50:14, 56:15, 61:1, **PLACE**[1] - 4:5 play [1] - 20:24 played [3] - 28:15, 28:16, 40:26 pleaded [3] - 19:9, 26:6, 26:12 point [23] - 8:12, 11:2, 11:5, 13:21, 21:6, 22:6, 35:20, 40:4, 40:15, 44:8, 44:26, 46:6, 46:11, 47:2, 48:27, 49:12, 49:22, 49:24, 51:15, 51:25, 51:26, 54:29, 62:21 **pointed** [1] - 44:3 **pointing** [1] - 62:9 points [2] - 32:4, police [5] - 33:10, 37:8, 51:4, 57:2, 57:7 policing [3] - 33:12, 33:21, 46:8 position [5] - 22:29, 42:8, 44:10, 59:26, 62:11 **positive** [1] - 50:23 possession [1] -

27:3 possible [2] - 11:25, 62:25

possibly [4] - 8:4,

9:4, 50:23, 63:28 potential [1] - 15:27 potentially [4] - 21:8, 21:10, 63:29, 64:11 practical [1] - 13:13 practice [2] - 32:6,

praise [3] - 38:14, 52:12, 59:7 praiseworthy [1] -60:11

38.20

precedence [1] -

45:18 premise [1] - 43:8 preparation [1] -20:5 prepared [3] - 13:24. 26:8. 38:1 preponderance [1] -57:23 presence [1] - 52:11 present [6] - 7:29, 13:21, 60:2, 61:3, presented [2] -48:16, 52:25 preserve [2] - 28:21, 28.22 preserved [1] - 13:6 preserving [3] -21:13, 22:23, 39:13 PRESIDENT [2] -1:13, 2:3 press [4] - 49:1, 51:5, 51:16, 53:18 presses [1] - 57:5 presume [1] - 57:3 **pretty** [1] - 51:19 previous [6] - 34:15, 34:22, 34:23, 34:24, 42:18, 51:21 previously [1] - 22:4 principle [1] - 58:12 prisoner [1] - 20:8 private [1] - 53:7 problem [2] - 8:11, proceed [4] - 8:28, 10:28, 11:26, 64:17 proceedings [1] -42.22 process [6] - 16:12, 31:23, 32:5, 32:19, 40:27, 43:8 progress [4] - 15:13, 19:7, 21:18, 40:8 progresses [1] -9:12 proofs [1] - 26:16 proper [2] - 28:18, 64:15 properly [2] - 28:26, 42:14 propose [3] - 6:18, 64:22, 64:26 proposed [1] - 11:18 prosecute [1] - 18:29 prosecution [2] -17:14, 19:1 PROTECTED[2] -1:2. 1:3

protected [2] -

54:14, 54:17 protest [1] - 8:29 **provide** [1] - 9:6 **provision** [1] - 9:7 **public** [2] - 61:17, 61.18 publicity [2] - 52:12, 52:28 Pulse [19] - 13:7, 14:2, 22:16, 23:25. 24:6, 24:22, 24:24, 26:29, 27:2, 27:28, 28:4, 28:5, 28:7, 30:9, 30:10, 39:19, 56:4, 58.6 purpose [1] - 25:5 purposes [2] - 26:22, 32:24 put [14] - 7:5, 21:12, 23:25, 28:4, 28:6, 28:7, 30:6, 30:8, 47:9,

Q

48:22, 51:21, 53:15,

55:10

quality [2] - 21:28, 37:7 QUAY [2] - 2:24, 2:31 queries [2] - 63:27 questions [2] - 7:20, 58:16 QUINN [1] - 3:10 quoted [1] - 23:10 quoting [1] - 23:4

R

raised [2] - 6:21, 61:7 rang [1] - 23:24 rank [1] - 33:6 rather [1] - 21:28 **RD** [1] - 18:13 read [8] - 7:17, 8:15, 12:28, 26:4, 28:5, 33:2, 34:16, 38:5 readily [1] - 59:9 reading [1] - 22:28 reality [1] - 26:12 really [4] - 11:27, 41:11, 44:17, 53:15 reason [5] - 9:27, 28:1, 43:3, 56:12 rebukes [1] - 9:24 receive [1] - 32:23 received [4] - 14:16,

21:23, 53:14, 53:19 receiving [2] - 42:21, 48:21 recent [2] - 31:18, 31.23 reception [1] - 52:28 recognise [1] - 64:25 recognised [1] -48:21 recognising [1] -31:10 recognition [3] -30:2, 48:19, 48:29 recollect [1] - 30:6 recollection [1] recommend [2] -47:19, 56:27 recommendation [3] 40:27, 41:23, 45:27 recommended [2] -52:11, 53:6 recommending [3] -44:1, 50:13, 57:29 record [1] - 33:3 **recording** [1] - 28:6 recovered [1] - 39:9 recovery [4] - 16:6, 16:26, 17:15, 20:21 red [1] - 42:5 **REDDY** [1] - 4:4 reduction [1] - 6:23 reference [2] - 30:23, 44:27 referred [1] - 18:12 reflected [1] - 38:11 reflects [1] - 15:1 regard [3] - 57:12, 62:28. 63:29 regarded [2] - 13:4, 50:27 **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:5 registrar [1] - 6:6 relate [1] - 8:15 related [2] - 7:4 relates [2] - 11:23,

1:4

3:15

43:27

19:26

65:1

resolve [1] - 63:28

RESOURCES [1] -

respect [3] - 33:9,

respond [1] - 23:15

responded [1] -

responders [2] -

rest [16] - 7:28,

18:14. 18:16. 18:18.

18:20. 18:23. 20:28.

21:18, 24:4, 25:5,

40:5, 45:2, 45:3

11:12. 63:13

3:12, 3:13

31:4, 31:12, 31:26,

resulted [4] - 16:5,

16:16, 16:25, 63:19

resume [2] - 64:27,

RESUMED[3] - 6:1,

RETIRED [7] - 3:5,

3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11,

response [1] - 27:26

responsible [2] - 7:9,

41:14, 42:22

29:12, 39:7

related [2] - 7:4
relates [2] - 11:23,
12:16
relating [2] - 8:22,
63:22
relation [34] - 6:22,
7:3, 7:9, 8:20, 10:28,
11:2, 11:19, 11:24,
12:4, 13:12, 13:16,
17:16, 17:17, 20:26,
30:12, 31:1, 32:13,
36:27, 37:16, 38:1,
38:25, 41:9, 41:19,
42:2, 42:15, 49:3,
50:14, 54:1, 54:2,
57:14, 57:16, 58:21,

58:25, 60:4 returns [1] - 31:3 relative [1] - 7:10 review [2] - 13:21, released [1] - 16:29 37:26 relevance [1] - 9:20 reviewed [1] - 11:17 relevant [13] - 7:9, right-hand [2] -8:27. 9:4. 9:18. 10:1. 13:27 19:18 32:29, 44:22, 49:17, rightly [3] - 10:17, 63:29, 64:1, 64:4, 35:8, 49:23 64:11, 64:12 rise [1] - 63:4 remanded [1] - 19:10 river [2] - 48:9, 50:17 remarks [1] - 10:25 ROAD[1] - 2:18 remember [2] robberies [4] -41:15, 53:16 14:18, 15:12, 16:28, remind [1] - 47:10 45:17 removed [7] - 22:16, robbers [1] - 16:7 24:3, 24:5, 26:29, robbery [12] - 15:14, 28:3, 30:10, 39:18 15:20, 15:21, 15:27, repeat [2] - 31:19, 19:9, 21:2, 21:5, 39:28 21:17, 31:14, 32:15, report [13] - 13:7, 40:7 13:24, 14:28, 16:19, role [5] - 15:3, 31:10, 18:12, 18:26, 35:5, 32:18, 37:1, 40:26 36:9, 37:2, 38:2, roles [1] - 32:24 38:15, 39:3, 45:25 room [14] - 24:10, reported [2] - 39:14, 24:18, 24:28, 25:1, 62.13 25:3. 25:8. 25:11. required [1] - 26:16 25:13, 25:15, 25:23, rescue [4] - 41:9, 25:26, 25:29, 61:23 48:9, 48:22, 50:16 rule [1] - 57:28 residual [1] - 59:17 **RYAN**[2] - 1:12, 2:2 RESOLUTIONS [1] -

S

sabotage [1] - 60:10 sabotaged [1] -59:21 safety [8] - 41:11, 41:22, 43:10, 44:18, 44:22, 44:28, 44:29, salary [1] - 6:24 **SAMS**[1] - 7:10 **SANDRA**[1] - 4:3 satisfactory [2] -64:16, 64:19 satisfied [1] - 64:10 **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 saw [1] - 61:4 SC [10] - 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:3 scale [1] - 28:29 **SCANLAN**[1] - 3:8 scene [22] - 13:5, 17:12, 17:17, 17:18, 21:1, 21:2, 21:14, 22:5, 22:24, 26:1, 28:8, 28:9, 28:17, 28:19, 32:25, 36:1,

39:8, 39:13, 39:19, 31:7, 38:10, 57:17 singled [1] - 21:27 start [7] - 6:5, 17:11, 32:17 Sergeant [6] - 20:2, 56:11, 56:12 sinister [2] - 44:14, 21:16, 24:26, 29:8, successful [6] scheme [1] - 48:20 20:10, 28:8, 30:20, 44:16 32:26, 34:3 13:8, 13:15, 13:25, scroll [1] - 34:23 **SINÉAD**[1] - 4:4 started [2] - 57:17, 32:14, 32:16, 50:15 31:10, 37:3 SEAN [4] - 1:12, 2:2, SERGEANT [5] -SINéAD[1] - 2:7 64:20 **suffered** [1] - 22:25 3:12, 3:20, 4:2, 4:3, 2:22, 3:17 sitting [1] - 10:15 STATE [1] - 3:27 suggest [24] - 14:27, 4.3 15:18, 20:23, 21:26, **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 situation [7] - 9:20, statement [17] - 9:5, search [5] - 16:4, sergeants [1] - 54:19 9:22, 36:15, 42:8, 12:10, 12:19, 17:16, 22:13, 24:7, 30:14, 34:17, 38:8, 40:16, series [1] - 8:22 18:28, 20:3, 31:4, 45:19, 63:24, 64:13 23:5, 23:20, 24:14, 40:24, 40:25, 42:10, 35:27 serious [3] - 14:16, 24:16, 26:1, 26:27, six [1] - 45:7 searches [1] - 17:7 25:1, 25:9 27:4, 27:12, 42:9, 42:11, 43:5, 43:19, **small** [3] - 54:27, second [11] - 15:14, served [3] - 8:8, 48:4, 52:9, 52:17, 53:11, 54:21, 54:22, 54:29 57:11, 57:19, 57:20, 15:20, 21:17, 27:10, 9:14, 9:16 **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 61:5 58:11, 58:12 31:14, 31:29, 36:24, **service** [1] - 6:7 SMITHFIELD [1] statements [6] -25:5, 26:17, 26:18, suggesting [3] -40:7, 48:18, 51:17, Services [1] - 1:24 2:24 60:17, 61:8, 61:28 40:20, 40:21, 43:4 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 52:17 **smoke** [1] - 60:18 states [1] - 34:28 summarised [1] seconds [1] - 42:28 set [2] - 40:17, 60:9 smoking [1] - 60:19 12.14 section [7] - 13:26, stating [2] - 42:27, seven [1] - 48:7 so.. [3] - 27:1, 27:25, 57.1 Summary [1] - 19:14 15:7, 34:5, 36:20, shake [1] - 53:1 42:16 station [8] - 56:24, Super [3] - 37:17, 37:2, 37:4 shall [1] - 33:5 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 see [46] - 7:14, 7:22, 60:15, 60:16, 60:20, 37:18 Shane [1] - 20:16 **SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:8 9:19, 12:22, 12:24, 61:10, 61:23, 62:2, SUPERINTENDENT **SHANE** [1] - 3:23 SOLICITOR'S [1] -13:26, 15:9, 19:11, 62:15 [15] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, **SHANKEY** [1] - 3:21 19:15, 19:21, 19:24, Station [3] - 7:7, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, SHANKEY-SMITH SOLICITORS [5] -60:13, 61:8 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, 21:4, 21:21, 23:9, [1] - 3:21 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, 24:7, 26:22, 26:29, stellar [1] - 59:4 3:19, 3:19, 3:21 **Shankley** [1] - 20:13 4:4 27:10, 28:1, 28:11, stenographic [1] -Superintendent [37] someone [3] - 37:29, SHANNON [1] - 2:13 30:24, 30:25, 30:26, - 23:4. 24:9. 24:15. 57:4, 57:5 **Shannon** [2] - 41:9, 27:10, 27:17, 30:10, 31:9, 31:16, 31:21, somewhere [3] stenography [1] -48:10 30:16, 30:21, 31:15, 34:4, 34:10, 34:11, Sharon [1] - 19:26 10:15, 23:5, 35:26 34:17, 34:26, 35:9, 31:20, 34:28, 37:1, STENOGRAPHY[1] soon [1] - 61:6 SHEAHAN [1] - 3:18 38:14, 38:22, 40:25, 35:26, 37:2, 45:22, - 1:29 sheet [3] - 53:18, sorry [17] - 12:2, 42:12, 43:27, 45:26, 48:4, 52:13, 56:4, STEPHANIE[1] -12:16, 17:27, 24:11, 54:26, 57:3 47:14, 48:3, 49:29, 56:5, 56:7, 56:8, 2:27 27:24, 29:5, 31:19, **sheets** [1] - 25:4 60:18, 60:21, 62:18 50:12, 50:28, 53:5, **STEPHEN**[1] - 2:21 32:10, 34:7, 34:9, **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 54:4, 55:19, 56:18, seek [2] - 57:22, sterling [1] - 6:7 35:1, 46:28, 49:19, SHIP [1] - 3:28 58:26, 58:28, 59:4, 63:28 sticking [1] - 46:11 50:3, 62:23, 62:27 shop [1] - 39:10 seeking [4] - 30:16, 61:14, 61:16, 61:19, still [4] - 43:21, sort [1] - 63:28 **short** [1] - 26:13 61:25, 62:1, 62:6, 43:12, 59:17 44:25, 47:27, 56:7 sought [2] - 38:27, shorten [2] - 7:1, 62:17 seeks [1] - 9:3 stop [1] - 8:17 59:2 seem [1] - 49:23 superintendent [16] straightaway [1] sound [2] - 37:8, **show** [1] - 62:29 - 24:19, 30:21, 36:21, **Seiko** [8] - 44:1, 26:12 45:28 showed [2] - 48:13, 36:24, 37:4, 47:18, 44:22, 45:28, 46:29, strange [1] - 59:25 specific [5] - 21:27, 53:8, 55:17, 55:25, 47:20, 48:8, 48:19, **STREET** [3] - 2:12, 25:8, 38:14, 46:6, shown [6] - 12:9, 55:27, 56:3, 56:19, 48:21 52:2 3:28, 3:32 13:23, 32:9, 32:27, 57:21, 58:5 seized [4] - 13:2, $\textbf{stretch}\, [\textbf{1}]\textbf{ - }32\textbf{:}11$ spectra [1] - 10:13 41:6, 62:28 superiors [1] - 22:14 17:18, 26:23, 35:29 stretching [1] speculate [1] - 23:2 sick [4] - 6:23, 6:25, supplied [2] - 23:20, send [1] - 56:2 32:10 speculation [1] -24:16 senior [2] - 22:23, stuff [3] - 7:15, 9:29, 30:15 side [1] - 26:2 **supplying** [1] - 9:9 54:15 speeches [1] - 11:10 significance [1] **support** [3] - 33:12, sent [3] - 30:19, subject [4] - 42:4, speed [1] - 50:21 44:14 33:21, 43:6 31:21, 57:6 spotted [1] - 57:2 43.9 47.5 significant [2] supporting [1] **sentence** [3] - 19:10, submission [1] stab [1] - 14:17 18:26, 64:8 46:25 23:9. 42:18 49:15 stabbed [1] - 13:1 similar [1] - 14:5 **suppose** [6] - 9:15, separate [2] - 14:4, subsequent [1] -Simon [1] - 52:26 stabbing [1] - 12:6 28:21, 40:4, 40:28, 27:14 stage [2] - 37:4, 40:5 simple [2] - 29:6, 40:29, 49:12 September [5] substance [1] -58.4 stained [1] - 21:3 supposition [1] -46:20, 46:22, 46:24, 53:12 stand [2] - 7:22, 46:7 simply [3] - 36:9, 47:15, 48:10 30:15 success [5] - 13:4, standard [2] - 32:6, 44:5, 64:9 sergeant [4] - 15:9, suspect [5] - 16:7, 17:1, 26:5, 26:10, 38:20

16:13, 19:27, 19:29, 59:29, 62:11 Thomas [1] - 36:26 TURNER [1] - 2:28 WITNESS [3] - 5:2, 20:17 thorough [1] - 26:11 Turner [1] - 20:5 viewed [3] - 30:29, 6:28, 8:12 suspects [14] - 13:6, three [3] - 12:5, 39:3, turning [3] - 19:6, 51:27, 52:3 witness [2] - 8:20, 15:27, 16:14, 16:16, 56:17 27:9, 34:15 views [1] - 62:12 32.9 16:23, 16:24, 18:29, violent [1] - 32:15 wonder [3] - 8:1, throughout [3] twice [1] - 6:26 19:20, 19:23, 20:13, two [29] - 8:1, 8:24, 16:21, 32:5, 59:12 visited [1] - 24:19 17:19, 63:4 22:1, 37:7 words [6] - 23:16, throw [2] - 53:21, 8:26, 14:2, 14:4, Volume [13] - 7:15, **suspicion** [1] - 60:1 53:25 15:11, 15:27, 16:14, 7:24, 8:22, 12:9, 25:6, 26:10, 50:26, suspicious [3] -TO [1] - 6:15 16:16, 16:23, 37:6, 13:23, 30:19, 34:3, 51:18, 51:20 43:22, 46:13, 59:20 38:12, 41:23, 41:26, 41:3, 41:6, 48:2, works [1] - 56:29 toe [1] - 29:10 swift [1] - 26:10 42:13, 42:15, 43:22, 52:22, 62:29, 63:2 worn [1] - 16:6 together [1] - 46:24 system [12] - 7:10, 44:10, 44:11, 44:13, Volumes [3] - 7:13, worry [2] - 39:29, **TOM** [1] - 3:12 22:17, 24:6, 26:29, 44:14, 44:15, 45:5, 8:13, 10:11 took [17] - 7:2, 15:13, 44:8 27:2, 28:4, 33:11, 15:14, 22:26, 23:6, 45:27, 47:7, 47:8, vulnerability [1] worth [1] - 47:5 33:20, 57:13, 57:14, 47:22, 54:21, 61:4 14:13 23:7, 27:3, 30:10, wounds [1] - 14:17 57:18, 58:3 typographical [1] -34:28, 38:22, 44:10, wrestles [1] - 10:13 **SÍOCHÁNA** [1] - 3:2 18.2 W writes [1] - 37:4 44:11, 44:13, 45:20, Síochána [10] - 33:6, 60:8, 61:1 writing [3] - 9:23, 46:18, 48:29, 49:2, U top [5] - 13:27, 45:25, 45:27 wagging [1] - 9:11 51:7, 53:6, 53:11, 22:20, 24:24, 29:10, wrongly [2] - 35:9, walked [1] - 62:4 57:13, 57:26, 57:27 57:19 49:23 ulterior [1] - 48:23 walking [4] - 60:19, topic [1] - 8:16 wrote [3] - 47:15, under [12] - 10:18. 62:3 62:5 Т totally [2] - 21:17, 49:6, 49:9 12:12, 12:20, 12:25, wants [1] - 9:22 22:16 12:27, 16:4, 19:14, warrant [3] - 16:4. Y touching [1] - 6:26 **T&N** [1] - 3:31 31:4, 41:10, 57:12, 20:3, 35:27 towards [1] - 48:1 57:21, 58:29 **TARA**[1] - 3:22 waste [1] - 59:2 TOWNPARKS[1] target [1] - 40:17 **UNDER** [2] - 1:2, 1:8 watches [1] - 48:21 year [2] - 42:26, 43:3 2:12 understandable [1] targeted [5] - 14:12, water [8] - 41:10, years [1] - 53:20 tragic [1] - 50:24 38:27, 45:26, 51:20, 41:22, 43:10, 44:18, yourself [1] - 44:23 trail [1] - 27:29 52:10 understood [1] -44:21, 44:27, 44:28, Yvonne [1] - 20:2 trained [1] - 59:8 targeting [5] - 21:27, 59:18 48.28 transcript [3] - 1:25, 40:26, 46:7, 47:7, unhappy [1] - 8:27 weapons [2] - 17:15, É 28:5 28:6 50:27 unit [12] - 15:2, 19:2, 20.21 transformed [1] taxi [6] - 12:7, 12:25, 21:22, 22:7, 24:5, weather [1] - 50:22 32:1 **ÉABHALL**[1] - 2:30 13:1, 15:28, 36:3, 26:18, 32:1, 45:2, week [17] - 7:3, 12:4, transpires [1] - 30:7 **ÉIREANN** [2] - 1:4, 39.9 45:3, 56:24, 57:17 40:8, 41:15, 42:15, TREACY [1] - 2:27 taximan [1] - 21:7 unnecessary [1] -42:17, 42:27, 45:11, treat [1] - 64:8 team [11] - 7:16, 10:24 45:15, 49:28, 53:13, trial [2] - 26:15, Ó 7:29, 8:12, 32:8, unstinting [1] - 59:7 53:29, 59:19, 60:3, 26:24 47:20, 60:13, 60:22, **UNTIL** [1] - 65:5 60:12, 64:27 Tribunal [12] - 9:3, 60:24, 61:27, 62:21, unusual [1] - 59:25 weeks [5] - 45:7, **Ó** [11] - 3:7, 11:24, 10:12, 10:21, 12:10, 63:18 **up** [15] - 8:3, 26:27, 45:8, 46:8, 46:12, 58:22, 59:1, 59:20, 13:11, 41:7, 43:2, technical [1] - 13:3 34:23, 37:3, 42:15, 47.8 43:13, 48:4, 52:8, 59:23, 60:29, 61:12, **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 42:17, 46:7, 51:12, welcome [2] - 6:6, 62:13, 62:22, 62:23 61:5, 63:26 terms [9] - 7:23, 54:15, 57:18, 57:24, TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, 59:11, 60:20, 64:7 12:15, 13:19, 18:27, WELLINGTON [1] -2:6 33:23, 34:14, 42:8, updates [1] - 59:10 2:31 Tribunal's [2] -44:4, 48:1 upheld [1] - 52:9 Westmeath [1] - 56:8 52:24. 59:3 testimony [1] - 60:11 usual [1] - 46:25 WESTMEATH[1] -TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8 **THE** [10] - 1:3, 1:7, trick [1] - 43:15 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, whatsoever [2] triggered [1] - 41:12 6:1, 11:12, 63:13, 32:19, 39:19 troubled [1] - 11:4 65:5 **WHEATLEY**[1] - 3:4 true [1] - 32:2 vanished [1] - 40:10 **THEN** [3] - 11:12, whistleblower [1] **try** [2] - 7:1, 43:19 verbatim [1] - 1:25 63:13, 65:5 **trying** [1] - 50:3 victim [1] - 28:22 thereafter [1] - 7:22 WHITE [1] - 3:11 turn [7] - 30:18, 34:4, therefore [1] - 35:19 victims [3] - 14:11, whole [4] - 21:16,

view [6] - 24:24,

29:28, 40:4, 50:26,

14:16, 24:19

48:2, 48:26, 49:27,

turned [1] - 19:7

50:3, 52:22

thinks [1] - 9:4

third [2] - 19:8, 36:24

36:3, 51:28, 58:3

wildly [1] - 49:23