TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON TUESDAY, 5TH NOVEMBER 2019 - DAY 110

110

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR.

DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC PATRICK MARRINAN SC SINÉAD McGRATH BL JOHN DAVIS, SOLICITOR MR. MS. MR.

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY

& GARDA DAVID TURNER: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY

RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURRAY 10. 11.

13.

SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15.

INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16.

16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE

BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON
INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN

30.

31.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN

34.

35.

SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 36. 37.

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL PAUL CONNELLAN

T&N McLYNN BASTION COURT

11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR.

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O'ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

I NDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH	
CDOSS_EVANTNED BY MD MIDDLY	6

Т		THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FULLOWS, UN TUESDAY, STH	
2		NOVEMBER 2019:	
3			
4			
5		GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH CONTINUED TO BE CROSS-EXAMINED BY	10:11
6		MR. MURPHY, AS FOLLOWS:	
7			
8		CHAIRMAN: Good morning, Chairman. I propose to	
9		continue asking questions, with your permission, in	
10		relation to issue 18, that relates to the complaint by	10:30
11		Garda Keogh in relation to the bullying and harassment	
12		investigation carried out by Assistant Commissioner	
13		Michael Finn.	
14	1 Q.	Garda Keogh, I think yesterday you made reference to	
15		your complaints in relation to how Assistant	10:30
16		Commissioner Finn had dealt with the McHugh allegation.	
17		This is one that you focused in on in response to the	
18		Chairman's questions. First of all, can I ask you, can	
19		you be shown Volume 6, page 1477, please. This is a	
20		letter dated 5th August 2014, and it's signed by	10:31
21		Superintendent Noreen Mcbrien, a person against whom	
22		you have no complaints in this process. It refers to a	
23		conversation and it says "intelligence created". So,	
24		do you see at the beginning, page 1477, she refers to a	
25		question concerning correspondence received from you	10:31
26		dated 27th July 2014, and in response to her query as	
27		to whether the informant had been registered with CHIS.	
28		Your response, which I think we dealt with earlier, was	
29		that this was not a CHIS matter and the information was	

Т			in the care of Assistant Commissioner Donal o Cualain.	
2			Do you see that?	
3		Α.	Yes. That doesn't have anything to do with the Liam	
4			McHugh matter.	
5	2	Q.	Just looking at the letter for a moment, please. I	10:32
6			think then she refers to issues concerning intelligence	
7			entries in the second paragraph. And then in the third	
8			paragraph:	
9				
10			"Conversation: I attach for your information	10:32
11			correspondence received from Garda Nicholas Keogh dated	
12			27th July 2014 regarding Liam McHugh. He states that	
13			apart from meeting Liam McHugh on the 19th July while	
14			on the beat, he had not met him in the past three	
15			months. On the 19th July Garda Keogh sent me a text	10:32
16			message saying, "was on the beat and McHugh came over	
17			to me". In addition I met Garda Keogh by arrangement	
18			on this date. This was the earliest opportunity we	
19			could meet."	
20				10:32
21			Just over the page, which is page 1478, she refers to	
22			the conversation that she has with you, isn't that	
23			right?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	3	Q.	Do you remember that conversation?	10:32
26		Α.	Yeah.	
27	4	Q.	She records that she read out the allegation as	
28			outlined in the report of Garda Aidan Lyons dated 7th	
29			June 2014, and you requested to see the allegation.	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 5 Q. She says that she allowed you to do so without
- disclosing the identity of the member making the
- 4 complaint. But you were informed that it was a member

10:33

10:33

10:33

10:33

10:33

- 5 at Athlone Garda Station.
- 6 A. I don't know if I was informed it was a member in the
- 7 Athlone Garda Station, but I don't think I would have
- 8 needed -- I think that would have been fairly obvious.
- 9 6 Q. Well, I understand that will be Chief Superintendent
- McBrien's evidence. So, insofar as your reply is
- 11 concerned, your recorded by her as having replied that
- 12 you knew nothing about this or any part of it, even the
- content of the story.
- 14 A. Right.
- 15 7 Q. And that you said that if you had the information
- alleged you would have put it with him, with your
- 17 complaint rather, to the confidential recipient?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 8 Q. You also said that Liam McHugh's name is not on the
- complaint that you made to the confidential recipient?
- 21 A. That's correct.
- 9 Q. I think you also said you didn't know anything about
- this alleged meeting with Liam McHugh?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 10 Q. You also said that if you had such information, you
- 26 would have used it when making your complaint?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 11 Q. Then I think you reiterated what you said earlier, that
- you hadn't seen Liam McHugh for a long time?

1	Α.	Yes.
_		

28

29

2	12	Q.	So, I think the position is that this is information	
3			that you're aware of in the sense of the document that	
4			has being outlined to you, the report of 2nd June 2014.	
5			Moving forward then to the Finn investigation, in the	10:34
6			course of that investigation I think there was	
7			considerable interaction between Assistant Commissioner	
8			Finn and your solicitor, Mr. Cullen, acting on your	
9			behalf?	
10		Α.	By way of correspondence.	10:34
11	13	Q.	Correspondence communication?	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	14	Q.	And there were also meetings, some of which you	
14			referred to yesterday?	
15		Α.	One meeting.	10:34
16	15	Q.	One meeting. In terms of this particular process, on	
17			my instructions Assistant Commissioner Finn's evidence	
18			will be that he furnished the documentation, including	
19			the report of Garda Lyons, dated 2nd June 2014 to	
20			Mr. Cullen as part of the process of the inquiry. What	10:34
21			was furnished to you, he will say, was the unredacted	
22			version containing Garda Lyons's name?	
23		Α.	That's correct, yeah.	
24	16	Q.	He will also say that in the course of his interaction	
25			with you he invited you to make comments and to revert	10:35
26			to him on a number of occasions, and I will come back	

question of Garda Lyons?

to those in due course, but that ultimately he will say

that you never made any issue to him in relation to the

1	Α.	I didn't, because that's the first time I found out
2		about Garda Lyons in relation to this. But I had
3		already made the issue of the whole thing, so for me no
4		matter who wrote that report, it was irrelevant. I had
5		contested the whole report. It didn't matter who wrote 10:35

7 17 Q. You see, Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to you that
8 Assistant Commissioner Finn's position will be that as
9 part of this process he gave you this information and
10 that you made no submissions to him in the course of
11 his inquiry?

the report, I contested it.

- 12 A. That's not the case, because from day one I've always
 13 contested this whole allegation. As I have said, it
 14 didn't matter who wrote the report at that point, I had
 15 already contested everything to do with what was in
 16 there.
- 17 18 Q. Is that why you didn't make a submission to him about this?
- A. Well, it's already there. I deal with everything in relation to it.

10:36

10:36

- 21 19 Q. You see, Garda Keogh, we know in 2014 Superintendent
 22 McBrien didn't give your name to Garda Lyons; is that
 23 right?
- 24 A. That's correct.

6

25 20 Q. So here we have a situation where you are being given
26 the name of Garda Lyons, again an inquiry that lasts
27 for nearly a year, and you don't make any submissions
28 to the person carrying out the inquiry, Assistant
29 Commissioner Finn?

- The submissions are already in writing, they're already 1 Α. 2 made. As I said, whoever the author of the report was, 3 I'd already said to the effect that everything that was contained in that report was false, so it didn't -- I 4 5 mean, it didn't really matter at that point which guard 10:36 6 wrote that report. I had already disputed everything 7 to do with that report.
- 8 21 Garda Keogh, I understood yesterday you were Q. criticising Assistant Commissioner Finn for the way in 9 which he dealt with this, suggesting that somehow you 10 10:37 had been unable to interact with him about this in 11 12 relation to Garda Lyons. Whereas, in fact, I think you 13 now are admitting that you had the information but you 14 chose not to make any submission to him, is that the 15 position? 10:37

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

There was no -- I've already just answered the same Α. question, Judge, twice, in relation to this. relation to the other thing, I said yesterday that this -- where no new evidence came in relation to this, the Liam McHugh complaint, as a result of the Finn 10:37 investigation it still seemed to grow arms and legs and a tail even, because by the time it got to the de Bruir thing, in the light of no new information, it appeared then that I was a perpetrator in this alleged crime, which I dispute even ever happened.

10:38

26 22 Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to you that Assistant Q. 27 Commissioner Finn's approach towards this evidence was 28 scrupulous and can I ask you for you to be shown 29 page 7480, please.

- 1 CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, hold on, you suggested that 2 his approach was scrupulous and Garda Keogh wanted to 3 respond to that.
- A. Judge, if it was scrupulous he, might have found out
 the names of the other two guards in this, in this
 whole allegation. I mean, that would be -- that would
 be common sense.
- 8 23 Garda Keogh, this is yet another new Q. MR. MURPHY: point, yesterday, at great length, an attempt was made 9 to identity what was your complaint in relation to the 10 10:38 11 McHugh incident. And now today you seem to be saying, really it didn't matter what Assistant Commissioner 12 13 Finn because this had all been done in the past.
- 14 A. No, I didn't say -- I think you're twisting words.
- 15 24 Q. Garda Keogh, could you be shown please page 7480, which 10:38
 16 is in Volume 25. Do you see paragraph 4, under the
 17 heading "Liam McHugh alleged complaint"?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 25 Q. This is Assistant Commissioner Finn's report on the
 20 issue. Can I just ask you to take a moment, just to save time, to read the heading under section 4, down to the word "findings"?
- 23 A. I see it, yeah.
- 24 26 Q. So ultimately, I think you'll agree with me, that that
 25 represents a précis of the information that had been
 26 available and was made available to Assistant
 27 Commissioner Finn. The first paragraph deals with
 28 Superintendent McBrien. The second paragraph deals
 29 with Superintendent McBrien. The documents that are

10 · 40

Т			refevant are appendicised, do you see that?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	27	Q.	With reference to an investigation initiated locally.	
4			The fact that Mr. McHugh was requested by Detective	
5			Sergeant Curley to make a witness statement. That the	10:40
6			view was taken that the allegations of Mr. McHugh were	
7			not supported by the evidence from the parties	
8			involved. You knew all of this prior to Assistant	
9			Commissioner Finn carrying out his investigation, is	
10			that right?	10:41
11		Α.	Judge, sorry, I'm just reading the next part here, I	
12			mean, on the first line of the next page or the	
13			findings, Judge, it has	
14	28	Q.	Before we get to that, Garda Keogh, just take a	
15			moment	10:41
16			CHAIRMAN: Hold on, no, let him finish, Mr. Murphy. We	
17			will decide the relevance or whether he's, what they	
18			call it in America, non-responsive, we will worry about	
19			that in a moment. What do you want to say about that?	
20		Α.	Judge, the first line in "Findings" is:	10:41
21				
22			"Garda Lyons received the intelligence in good faith."	
23				
24			CHAIRMAN: Can I just ask you, Mr. Murphy is focusing	
25			at the moment on the statement of facts?	10:41
26	29	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I'm just asking Garda Keogh to confirm,	
27			there's nothing wrong in that statement of fact, is	
28			there?	
29		Α.	No, not in that, no.	

CHAIRMAN: I am a little puzzled about the statement of facts, Mr. Murphy. I may as well tell you so you know. I thought that the essence of the complaint was the allegation that Garda Keogh was drumming up complaints. I thought that was the essence. Garda Lyons reported that Liam McHugh had imputed to the bald guard that he reminded him of an incident and said, I will support you if you make a complaint. Now, I am speaking from complete memory. But the essence of the matter that came was that it was an allegation that Garda Keogh was drumming up or potentially drumming up, if this wasn't true, he was encouraging McHugh, Liam McHugh to make a complaint, number one.

10:42

10:43

10 · 43

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

Number two, I didn't understand Garda Lyons' report to include the allegation that Garda Keogh was one of the I agree that's a possible interpretation, but only a 50/50, and that's my understanding. Now, maybe I am eccentric and I'm the only one in the room who thinks this, but I thought that that was the essence and that the incident came to light. That's what I I thought that the report was a report as to whether he had - now, maybe I am wrong about this, and please correct me - a report as to whether Garda Keogh had had this conversation as reported by Garda Lyons. In other words, did he have the conversation, did he say the things that were attributed to him in the report? That's what I thought was the issue. I'm alone in misunderstanding that.

1	MR. MURPHY: I think it's clear from the report I have	
2	just shown at page 1477, I think, Chairman, that the	
3	way it was approached by Superintendent McBrien was to	
4	clarify had Mr. McHugh made a complaint or not to Garda	
5	Keogh. Garda Keogh made his response and the matter	10:44
6	ended.	
7	CHAIRMAN: Does what I am saying make any sense?	
8	MR. MURPHY: I think, Chairman, again subject to	
9	CHAIRMAN: If I am totally	
10	MR. MURPHY: I think there are other points, Chairman.	10:44
11	CHAIRMAN: okay, sorry.	
12	MR. MURPHY: I think this one related to whether or not	
13	Liam McHugh made a complaint.	
14	CHAIRMAN: Maybe counsel might come back to that.	
15	MR. MURPHY: Yes.	10:44
16	CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness, maybe you will come back to	
17	that and demonstrate that I am totally in the wrong in	
18	due course when you come round to it. I just may as	
19	well tell you, I am reading that with a question mark,	
20	I am not entirely sure as to the statement of facts.	10:44
21	MR. KELLY: Judge, to try and assist, my understanding	
22	has always been that what Garda Keogh was saying is	
23	that this complaint came from Mr. McHugh, that it was,	
24	as you put it rightly, the substance, he understood	
25	was, well, he is supposed to be drumming up a	10:44
26	complaint.	
27	CHAIRMAN: Yes. His case, it's a trumped up	
28	allegation.	
29	MR. KELLY: Yes. And what he is saying is that as it	

1	has gone on it appears to have grown legs.	
2	CHAIRMAN: That's what he said, and arms and a tail in	
3	fact.	
4	MR. KELLY: So we reach the point here where he said	
5	before:	10:45
6		
7	"Superintendent McBrien became aware of an	
8	allegationcertify a number of gardaí, including	
9	Garda Keogh, who seized money from McHugh."	
10		10:45
11	That gives it a wholly different flavour. I think	
12	that's what Garda Keogh is saying.	
13	CHAIRMAN: Well that's what I am saying. Because I am	
14	saying that I am not understanding the complaint and	
15	the event involving the report by Garda Lyons. I am	10:45
16	not understanding it to be accurately summarised. But	
17	I am ready to be shown to be wrong. Anyway,	
18	Mr. Murphy, I think I may as well tell you, that's my	
19	state of mind on the matter.	
20	MR. MURPHY: Yes.	10:45
21	CHAIRMAN: But that doesn't mean it's right.	
22	MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
23	CHAIRMAN: As I know from experience.	
24	MR. MURPHY: I think the position is in terms of the	
25	Garda Lyons complaint, I will get the reference in a	10:46
26	moment, which I think is at page 1161, just to assist	
27	at this stage	
28	CHAIRMAN: Yes, thank you very much. You see, one of	
29	his complaints, one of Garda Keogh's complaints and one	

1	of the reasons that he says supports his contention	
2	about the illusory nature of the McHugh complaint, one	
3	of the reasons is that he says there was actually no	
4	investigation of the gardaí who might have been	
5	possibly involved in the incident. That's what he	: 46
6	says.	
7	MR. MURPHY: well, I think the answer to that is	
8	indicative of the response of Mr. McHugh, which he	
9	didn't wish to make a statement	
10	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Anyway, there we are. 10	: 46
11	You want to ask questions. I just thought, look, so	
12	everybody knows, that's my, what shall I say,	
13	provisional understanding of the situation. Please	
14	feel free to correct.	
15	MR. MURPHY: Chairman, just again to answer your	: 47
16	question, can I ask you to have a look at the document,	
17	please, which is on the screen.	
18	CHAIRMAN: 1161.	
19	MR. MURPHY: Please. There, you will see that there is	
20	a reference to the report. It says that he wished to $_{10}$: 47
21	report:	
22		
23	"On 31/5/2014 I was approached by Liam McHugh at	
24	Bastion Street."	
25	10	: 47
26	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
27	MR. MURPHY: They had a general conversation. Then he	
28	says:	

1	"The bald guard came to me the other day and asked if I	
2	could remember the time I was searched by three guards	
3	and €800 was stolen from me and spent drinking in the	
4	castle, the bookies and casino.	
5		10:4
6	He said if I wanted to make a complaint about it he	
7	would back me up. Then I asked Liam McHugh if he was	
8	alleging this had actually happened and his answer was	
9	no, not at all, I'm not going to bring trouble on	
10	mysel f.	10:4
11		
12	I asked him if he was referring to Garda Nick Keogh and	
13	he confirmed he was. He went on to say he told me he	
14	was there himself when it happened and he would back me	
15	up if I wanted to make a complaint."	10:4
16		
17	So ultimately this is a statement that, if Mr. McHugh,	
18	which is accepted and ultimately he did not make a	
19	statement, suggested that he was going to say at that	
20	stage that Garda Keogh had witnessed something, not	10:4
21	that he had taken part but that he had witnessed it,	
22	and that in those circumstances the request of	
23	Superintendent McBrien was to clarify had Mr. McHugh	
24	made that complaint and Mr. McHugh declined to make a	
25	statement	10:4
26	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you very much.	
27	MR. MURPHY: Subject to any submissions that may be	
28	made, that's a suggestion that Garda Keogh suggested,	

according to Mr. McHugh, that if he, Mr. McHugh, was to

1	come, Garda Keogh could perhaps be of assistance to	
2	him.	
3	CHAIRMAN: He would back him up, yes.	
4	MR. MURPHY: Yes. Now ultimately what happens is that	
5	Superintendent McBrien, who is a person against whom no 1	0:48
6	complaint is made by Garda Keogh, speaks to him,	
7	clarifies the situation and it goes no further.	
8	CHAIRMAN: Mr. McHugh gives a somewhat, as reported,	
9	gives a somewhat equivocal answer. I am not going to	
10	bring trouble on myself.	10:48
11	MR. MURPHY: Again this goes back I think to the	
12	perspective reality issue. In fact the way it's looked	
13	at in our submission and it's also contained in the	
14	assistant commissioner's report, page 7480, that the	
15	response is that the allegations of Mr. McHugh that he $^{-1}$	10:49
16	was assaulted or robbed wasn't supported by any	
17	evidence or statement from any of the parties involved.	
18	CHAIRMAN: Okay. I just wanted to tell you.	
19	MR. MURPHY: Sure.	
20	CHAIRMAN: As to the first paragraph, the relevant	10:49
21	paragraph, section 4 in Assistant Commissioner Finn's	
22	report at 7480, that my understanding of it is, I am	
23	MR. MURPHY: I don't believe even on Mr. McHugh's	
24	reported events in Garda Lyons' statement, I don't	
25	understand Garda Keogh to be saying that he, Garda	10:49
26	Keogh, was guilty of complicity in any offence. On the	
27	contrary, the suggestion seems to be that he's in a	
28	position to witness something or to give assistance to	
29	Mr. McHugh.	

Т		WITNESS: Judge	
2		CHAIRMAN: Wait now. The understanding and	
3		interpretation of the Lyons report is one thing. I	
4		intervened merely to indicate that I wasn't sure at	
5		this point that I agreed with the summary facts as	10:50
6		stated in paragraph 4 of the facts of Assistant	
7		Commissioner Finn's report. I may turn out to be	
8		entirely wrong, in which case I am perfectly happy.	
9		But I wanted to alert Mr. Murphy to that and you.	
10		Okay.	10:50
11		WITNESS: Judge, just in relation to that last part,	
12		and I may have read things wrong in relation to the	
13		de Bruir report, but I think it goes further into the	
14		findings in the de Bruir report.	
15		CHAIRMAN: Now, hold on, sorry.	10:50
16		WITNESS: Okay.	
17		CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kelly may ask you about the de Bruir	
18		report. Mr. Murphy is not asking you about the de	
19		Bruir report. So we will keep things on track.	
20		MR. MURPHY: Yes.	10:50
21		CHAIRMAN: We will focus on Mr. Murphy. Now,	
22		Mr. Murphy, I am sorry for that lengthy interruption.	
23		MR. MURPHY: Not at all, Chairman.	
24		CHAIRMAN: Please proceed.	
25	30 Q.	MR. MURPHY: So we know, I think, just to bring you	10:50
26		back please to page 1478 in Volume 6. I beg your	
27		pardon, at 1478 please. So here we have Superintendent	
28		McBrien, against whom you have no complaint, saying at	
29		the end of her report, that your assertion that you had	

Т			not been in contact with Liam McHugh was consistent	
2			with your conversation with her on 9th June 2014, which	
3			is covered in correspondence to you of the same date.	
4				
5			So she is there effectively reporting up the line that	10:5
6			she accepts what you have said and is consistent with	
7			the conversation you had with her, do you understand?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	31	Q.	So as at that date the position is that no one is	
10			accusing you of any wrongdoing at all, there is an	10:5
11			acceptance that Mr. McHugh is somebody who is not	
12			willing to make a statement and the matter is at an	
13			end?	
14		Α.	Yes. Judge, I know I pointed out, I think last week,	
15			that there's nothing to preclude Garda management from	10:5
16			asking Garda Lyons for a statement and Garda Lyons	
17			would have been obliged to give them a statement. They	
18			didn't do that, they didn't go down that road. There	
19			is an alleged theft by three members of An Garda	
20			Síochána in this. They didn't pursue it.	10:5
21	32	Q.	Garda Keogh, we know that Superintendent McBrien didn't	
22			pursue an inquiry and she wasn't targeting you but not	
23			doing that?	
24		Α.	I know.	
25	33	Q.	I have to say, the same way that Assistant Commissioner	10:5
26			Finn's approach towards this was not targeting you	
27			either. Let's just look at the findings and see how he	
28			approached it very briefly. At page 7480 please, the	
29			page we just opened, book 25. Do you see that, please?	

1		If I take you to the heading "Findings", which we have	
2		just been discussing before you dealt with the other	
3		matter. The first point is, Assistant Commissioner	
4		Finn says his finding is:	
5			10:53
6		"Garda Lyons received the intelligence in good faith.	
7		The district officer, Superintendent McBrien, sought to	
8		have the matter investigated because it contained	
9		allegations of inappropriate/criminal behaviour by	
10		members of An Garda Síochána."	10:53
11			
12		She reported the matter to divisional officer, Chief	
13		Superintendent Curran, who directed the matter be	
14		followed to establish if the gardaí had been given the	
15		opportunity to comment on the veracity of the	10:53
16		information contained in the report."	
17			
18		Then over the page:	
19			
20		"Liam McHugh declined to make a statement when	10:53
21		interviewed by gardaí."	
22			
23		So, all of that is factually correct, isn't it?	
24	Α.	Yes. Liam McHugh obviously is entitled not to make	
25		to make a statement or not to make a statement. A	10:53
26		member of An Garda Síochána doesn't have that same	
27		doesn't have those same rights. If they are requested	
28		to make a statement, they are obliged to make a	
29		statement Garda management it's something Garda	

Т			management courd have done, to request the statement.	
2	34	Q.	Garda Keogh, you see in the next paragraph the way	
3			Assistant Commissioner Finn approaches it, he says:	
4				
5			"The allegation reported by Garda Lyons"	10:54
6				
7			That's supposedly what Mr. McHugh said to him:	
8				
9			" were very serious matters. The senior management	
10			would have been in dereliction of their duty had they	10:54
11			not initiated the respective enquiries they made into	
12			the matter."	
13				
14			So he's saying effectively they had a duty to enquire	
15			and the enquiry resulted in nothing from the point of	10:54
16			view of any further evidence, but at least they had to	
17			check it out.	
18		Α.	I understand that part. There is no issue, Judge, that	
19			when Garda management receive a report like that, that	
20			they have to check it out. I don't have an issue on	10:54
21			that part.	
22	35	Q.	The next paragraph, he says that:	
23				
24			"The actions taken by Chief Superintendent Curran and	
25			Superintendent McBrien are in keeping with their roles	10:54
26			and responsibilities as divisional and district	
27			officers. There is no indication that the behaviour of	
28			either officer was inappropriate or reasonably capable	
29			of undermining the dignity at work of Garda Keogh."	

1				
2			So, again he's applying the same logic, he is saying,	
3			look, they had a duty to investigate and that's all	
4			they did.	
5		Α.	You see, where they have one version which is against	10:5
6			me, they can't get it off the ground. But equally,	
7			Judge, I am saying from the very start that there's	
8			nothing to do this, which is also then, I mean, a	
9			serious thing, because I am then saying this is false,	
10			this is false. And they don't pursue that. They don't	10:5
11			seem to look at whether it's false. It's just, it's no	
12			use to them because	
13	36	Q.	Garda Keogh, you see the next sentence they say:	
14				
15			"In the context of complaint made by Garda Keogh, there	10:5
16			is no evidence to suggest that the behaviour of Chief	
17			Superintendent Curran or any of the other officers	
18			involved amounted to bullying or harassment of Garda	
19			Keogh. "	
20				10:5
21			So that would include Superintendent McBrien, isn't	
22			that right?	
23		Α.	Well, when I had said this never occurred, there's an	
24			issue there that perhaps they ought to have looked for	
25			statements from Garda Lyons, a statement from Garda	10:5
26			Lyons in relation to this matter. Because this is	

28

29

Garda Síochána -- basically someone is lying in

relation to this. They should have followed this

serious, and somebody is -- there's two members of An

1			through.	
2	37	Q.	Garda Keogh, again just to come back to the second last	
3			paragraph, Assistant Commissioner Finn says:	
4				
5			"In the context of the complaint made by Garda Keogh,	10:56
6			there is no evidence that the individual behaviour of	
7			Chief Superintendent Curran, Superintendent McBrien or	
8			any of the officers amounts to bullying or harassment	
9			of Garda Keogh."	
10				10:56
11			I have to suggest to you, that's a reasonable	
12			conclusion based on the assessment of the evidence	
13		Α.	That's	
14	38	Q.	Put it this way: Here is a situation where all of the	
15			people make an enquiry and are satisfied that	10:56
16			Mr. McHugh is not willing to make a statement and the	
17			matter ends.	
18		Α.	It's not as simple as that, Judge. Just from	
19			recollection, we have dealt with this over the last few	
20			weeks, that they sent people out to try and take	10:57
21			statements, not just once but twice from Mr. McHugh in	
22			relation to this. In the meantime, I'm saying this	
23			whole thing well, whenever the allegation is put to	
24			me, from that point on, I know what the allegation is,	
25			I say this is completely false, there's no	10:57
26	39	Q.	Again I have to suggest to you that Assistant	
27			Commissioner Finn, looking at all these facts, looking	
28			at the way in which Superintendent McBrien acted,	
29			looking at the way in which Chief Superintendent Curran	

- acted, is effectively saying there is no evidence of 1 2 any corporate bullying of you. In other words, the 3 organisation isn't seeking to bully or harass you, it is checking out something, which I think you very 4 5 fairly accepted a few moments ago they had to check 10:57 out, and ultimately Superintendent McBrien accepts what 6 7 you say and Mr. McHugh won't make a statement and 8 that's the end of the matter.
- Well, you see, Judge, I just touched on this a moment 9 Α. ago. Checked it out and when it didn't suit their 10 10:58 11 narrative to be able to go after me, they couldn't bring it any further. But I had already said this is 12 13 false. There's obviously -- if I am then saying this 14 is false and this whole thing is not true, perhaps they 15 should have then looked at that and said, well maybe 10:58 16 this isn't -- this never happened, maybe we should 17 investigate to see whether this report is accurate.
- 18 40 Q. Garda Keogh, the end result of all of this, at local
 19 level, in Athlone with Superintendent McBrien, with
 20 Chief Superintendent Curran, is that your version of
 21 events is acceptable. How could that be targeting or
 22 bullying of you?

10:58

10:59

- A. Judge, I referred to something a moment ago and it's
 the thing that I was to perhaps under re-examination
 come back to, but there is something for me to come
 back on that.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: If there is a response to Mr. Murphy, give it.
- 29 A. Yes. In the de Bruir report, Judge, it doesn't appear

Т			that way. And again, the documents, whatever documents	
2			go, I don't know what happens behind the scenes,	
3			contacts and meetings between different people.	
4			Documents are fine, we can read what happened but we	
5			don't know how things can get twisted with arms and	10:59
6			legs to such a level that	
7	41	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that this is a little	
8			complicated, because you first of all have the role of	
9			the officers on the spot, Superintendent McBrien and	
10			Chief Superintendent I understand that. You're	10:59
11			endeavouring, you are trying to then look at that	
12			situation and your comments on that. But specifically,	
13			where we are at this moment, Mr. Murphy is exploring	
14			your complaint that Assistant Commissioner Finn got it	
15			wrong and it represented targeting and discrediting.	11:00
16			Let's not worry about definitions and so on. Am I	
17			understanding that your complaint is that Assistant	
18			Commissioner Finn didn't investigate the possible	
19			falsity of the Lyons report?	
20		Α.	Yes, Judge.	11:00
21	42	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Now, as I say, don't just agree with it	
22			because that's my but that's the sense I'm getting.	
23			That's what I'm writing down as what I am	
24			understanding.	
25		Α.	Yeah.	11:00
26	43	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Hold on. Now hold on.	
27		Α.	Sure.	
28	44	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But I'm not sure that that was his job. He	
29			was looking at bullying and harassment in respect of	

1			the treatment up the line, if you know what I mean, by	
2			a superintendent and a chief superintendent. What	
3			would you say to that?	
4		Α.	Well, Judge, there they are inextricably linked. The	
5			whole thing is linked.	11:01
6	45	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So you say, however it comes about,	
7			that's the complaint you make under the McHugh heading,	
8			Assistant Commissioner Finn should have investigated	
9			the possible falsity of the complaint.	
10		Α.	Yes. And, Judge, on that	11:01
11	46	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, of the report?	
12		Α.	The one line again, is:	
13				
14			"Findings: Garda Lyons received the intelligence in	
15			good faith."	11:01
16				
17	47	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18		Α.	And I have a huge issue with that particular line,	
19			Judge.	
20	48	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Did you complain to him? I thought	11:01
21			Mr. Murphy asked you as to whether you said to	
22			Assistant Commissioner Finn that that report was	
23			untrue, was false?	
24		Α.	You see, I didn't know Garda Lyons when I met	
25			Assistant Commissioner Finn, I didn't know Garda Lyons	11:01
26			was the author of that report. It was as a result of	
27			his investigation, where he did send out	
28	49	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I thought Mr. Murphy said he gave you this	
29			material?	

_		Α.	res, that's what I am getting on. He then sent out the	
2			material.	
3	50	Q.	CHAIRMAN: okay.	
4		Α.	And from that material is how	
5			CHAIRMAN: All right.	11:02
6	51	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I'm wondering, Garda Keogh, he sent it out	
7			to you before he wrote this report. But I think you	
8			will agree with me, you didn't make a submission to him	
9			to say, you should investigate whether Garda Lyons was	
10			telling the truth or not?	11:02
11		Α.	Judge, I've said that from the very start. I mean,	
12			Garda Lyons is not the issue because I don't know it's	
13			Garda Lyons is basically saying this report is look,	
14			I mean, I've	
15	52	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. You found out that it was Garda	11:02
16			Lyons	
17		Α.	Nothing changes for me, Judge, because I already said	
18			the report, the whole thing is	
19			CHAIRMAN: All right. There it is.	
20	53	Q.	MR. MURPHY: But I think you do agree that you never	11:02
21			contacted Assistant Commissioner Finn and said, ah,	
22			this is new information, I think you should investigate	
23			Garda Lyons because I think he's making it up, or	
24			anything else. Yesterday you seemed to suggest, at	
25			page 75 of yesterday's transcript, sorry, Day 100, that	11:03
26			you had	
27				

29

"Aidan Lyons is a guard that would have been a clean

pair of hands. They got him to write this nonsense."

Again an allegation that isn't supported by any
evidence. But I don't see anything in the papers, I
think you will agree with me, you never put that to
Assistant Commissioner Finn and said, this needs to be investigated.

7 A. Judge, as
8 wrote the
9 still be s
10 whole thir

Judge, as I have already said, it didn't matter who wrote the thing. If the Pope wrote the thing, I would still be standing by what I said. I said that this whole thing is false. It happened to be Aidan Lyons that was the author of the report. But I have already prior to that, all along maintained this whole thing is false, it's not done properly. Here you have two -- a guard now that is saying this is false and there's no follow up from my point of view as to, you know, to see if my side of this was in any way accurate, did this did this conversation ever happen? Or, you know, was it made up? All these questions. They were never looked at.

You, see Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to you that what the assistant commissioner was doing, deciding the issue in relation to whether there was any bullying or harassment under the policy, he was looking at how the officers such as Chief Superintendent Curran and Superintendent McBrien had acted. You have no complaint against Superintendent McBrien. In effect, she did the same as Chief Superintendent Curran; she investigated, she came to the conclusion there was nothing to find and that was the end of it. And what

11:04

11 · 04

- Assistant Commissioner Finn is saying, looking down at this, as far as they are concerned, he is looking at whether they bullied you, he is saying he is satisfied that they didn't?
- 5 A. Look, I dispute that part. I'm in your hands on this, 11:04
 6 Judge, because my answers are going to be pretty much
 7 the same as the last ones.

11:05

- 8 55 Again just finally on that point, I just want to Q. suggest to you that although you may disagree with the 9 methodology or the approach, there is nothing in 10 11 Assistant Commissioner Finn's report to demonstrate 12 that he was irrational or unreasonable in saying here 13 were two senior officers carrying our their duty, and 14 there was no adverse result for you; isn't that right?
- 15 A. On the face of it, in writing, that's what appears.

 16 But as I said, this leads on to another report.
- 17 56 Q. I just want to deal with the Finn report just for a moment.
- 19 A. Yeah, sorry.
- 20 57 Thank you. Can I just deal with a number of other Q. 11:05 points on the Finn report? First of all, can I ask if 21 22 you can to be shown Volume 14. Chairman, just for 23 signposting in this regard, to assist the witness and 24 you, Chairman, I am proposing to deal as briefly as I 25 can, just with a number of aspects of the sequencing of 11:05 the investigation? 26
- 27 CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.
- MR. MURPHY: I will try to keep this as tight as I can.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: Absolutely. Yes, thank you.

Τ	58	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Just again to assist you and the Tribunal	
2			for the record, the timeline here. This is a document	
3			which is 15th November 2017. You will see on page 4128	
4			it's signed by Fintan Fanning, Assistant Commissioner.	
5			This is the formal appointment of Assistant	11:06
6			Commissioner Finn, do you see that?	
7		Α.	Just 4128?	
8	59	Q.	4128, please, yes.	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	60	Q.	On the first page he deals with the policy and all	11:07
11			sorts of information that doesn't concern us. But on	
12			the second page he says:	
13				
14			"On 15th November 2017, I met Mr. John Barrett,	
15			executive director HRPD. He nominated you, Assistant	11:07
16			Commissioner Finn, in order for me to make the	
17			necessary appointment as per the policy. I am	
18			appointing you as investigator in this matter."	
19				
20			And then he gave contact details for you. Again, there	11:07
21			is no controversy about that.	
22		Α.	No.	
23	61	Q.	That's the letter of appointment and you have said what	
24			you said about this before. Then can you please turn	
25			forward to 4219. This is a document, I won't go	11:07
26			through this now, this is a document we dealt with	
27			yesterday, which is the meeting on 1st December 2017.	
28			I think you dealt with that issue. But that shows the	
29			meeting in the Mullingar Park Hotel with Assistant	

Т			Commissioner Finn, Chief Superintendent fom Myers,	
2			Inspector Ned Brown, yourself and Mr. Cullen.	
3				
4			Then moving, please, to page 4233. Sorry 4233. This	
5			is a document of 3/12/2017 and it's a worksheet.	11:08
6			Again, just for the assistance of the Tribunal, if you	
7			flick through the next few pages, you see on the	
8			left-hand column there is a listed names. There are	
9			statements identified, there's reference to a	
10			narrative. In the right-hand column there are tasks	11:08
11			allocated. It's a bit like a jobs like I think, isn't	
12			it, in terms of Garda investigation. Would you agree?	
13		Α.	Yeah.	
14	62	Q.	So again in terms of the structure, left-hand column,	
15			you have names of people and then you will see on the	11:08
16			left-hand column, the division of functions or	
17			responsibilities between Assistant Commissioner Finn	
18			and Chief Superintendent Myers and that proceeds then	
19			through all of the names, which are familiar to the	
20			Tribunal, moving down through the different ranks and	11:09
21			down as far as page 4241. So ultimately that indicates	
22			the sort of disposition of work to be done and tasks to	
23			be achieved.	
24				
25			Could I ask you then please to turn to page 4227?	11:09
26		Α.	Going backwards, 4227?	
27	63	Q.	Sorry, that is the wrong page, excuse me. If I can	
28			pass from that, please. If I can go to 4282 please.	
29			Again. I think we needn't dwell on the detail of the	

Т			letter but here I think your solicitor is writing to	
2			Assistant Commissioner Finn and he is making	
3			suggestions. He is making some complaints, I think, at	
4			that stage, about the level of early response. But you	
5			also indicate that if you turn over to page 4283,	11:10
6			the last paragraph Mr. Cullen asks on your behalf that:	
7				
8			"You say that you indicated to my client that you will	
9			be fair to all parties, that you will adhere to the	
10			principles of natural justice and fair procedures. In	11:10
11			that regard we respectfully submit you might now engage	
12			in the detail and text of the complaint and kindly	
13			confirm the nature of any response from Superintendent	
14			Murray and the others to seek avoidance through	
15			di versi on. "	11:11
16				
17			Ultimately I think in summary, the position is that	
18			there is a request for communication and fair	
19			procedures by your solicitor to Assistant Commissioner	
20			Finn, is that right?	11:11
21		Α.	Yes. Sorry, which paragraph? I am not disputing that	
22			or anything I am just trying to find it myself.	
23	64	Q.	The very last paragraph of 4283, please. If I can just	
24			paraphrase that, it's a request. 4283, do you see	
25			that?	11:11
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	65	Q.	There is a request for communication and fair	
28			procedures, there. Then if I can ask you to move,	
29			nlease to 4292. This is one example of a number of	

1	letters which the Tribunal has in its archives at this	
2	stage. This is a letter addressed to Chief	
3	Superintendent Curran on 15th December 2017 by	
4	Assistant Commissioner Finn. Basically he is saying	
5	first of all that he met with you. Then he says:	11:12
6		
7	"On 1st December 2017 I met with Garda Keogh. I	
8	received a comprehensive document outlining an	
9	extensive array of issues.	
10		11:12
11	On 7th December I sought additional information by way	
12	of clarification. Garda Keogh has confirmed he knew	
13	all of the people that he is alleging was involved in	
14	this complaint. I wish to meet with you and put to you	
15	the complaint made by Garda Keogh."	11:12
16		
17	Then he goes on to say:	
18		
19	"Please note, I have advised Assistant Commissioner	
20	Fanning that I have not been in a position to complete	11:12
21	this investigation with the timeframe set out in the	
22	guidelines for working together to create a positive	
23	working environment, but I will make every effort to	
24	complete my investigation as expeditiously as	
25	possi bl e. "	11:12
26		
27	And then asks the officer to contact him.	
28		
29	Again, this is an example I think of him taking your	

1			information, seeking to digest it, communicating out to	
2			the people who are under investigation and seeking to	
3			get them to engage.	
4				
5			If you could turn forward, please, just momentarily as	11:12
6			well to 4300. There we have a similar letter, I think,	
7			addressed to Chief Superintendent Wheatley. So again	
8			that indicates that by that stage the communications	
9			were advancing rapidly.	
10				11:13
11			Could I ask you to be shown Volume 15, please, at 4324,	
12			please.	
13		Α.	Sorry, the page, please?	
14	66	Q.	4324, please. So this is a further example of	
15			engaging, Mr. Cullen is writing to Assistant	11:14
16			Commissioner Finn on 21st December 2017. Do you see	
17			that?	
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	67	Q.	Again he raises queries about how much more detail is	
20			being required. He also indicates that he says:	11:14
21				
22			"You say you're not in possession of the appendices	
23			which would appear to be incorrect, some of the	
24			appendices were on your desk."	
25				11:14
26			Then turning over the page to 4325, he raises issues	
27			about matters which may appear to be outside the scope	
28			of the investigation. He says:	
29				

1 "We would be grateful if you now confirm...electronic 2 further meetings in order."

3

4

5

6

7

15

And then indicates that there are days thereafter, further meetings to be nominated. Again, he's seeking to engage on your behalf with the assistant I think you would agree? commissioner.

11 · 15

11:15

11:15

- 8 Yes, Judge. And just on that, actually, I forgot that Α. yesterday, in relation to the notes of the meeting. 9 That word "scoping" is another thing that cropped up 10 11 that doesn't appear to be in those notes. Just to be 12 I had forgotten about it. And that's why we clear.
- 13 were looking for a subsequent meeting to be recorded, 14 Judge, so that there would -- because there was --
- there is a dispute over what was said at that meeting 16 and to avoid that for any further thing down the road,

17 we were looking to have it recorded, so that there 18 would be no dispute and that it was the Guards that

declined to have the meeting, the second meeting 19

20 recorded.

- Just very briefly again, Garda Keogh, could you move 21 68 Ο. 22 forward to page 4467, please? This is example again of 23 the assistant commissioner to writing out to affected 24 He is writing to Mr. Hegarty of Ready parties. Charleton Solicitors in relation to his client Nicholas 11:16 25 Farrell. And again, the same type of detail that we 26 27 have seen in the earlier letters and seeking engagement 28 with those people with his inquiry. Do you see that?
- 29 4467, yeah. Α.

1	69	Q.	Yes, please. Then could I ask you to move forward in	
2			the same volume to page 4650, please? This is in	
3			January of 2019. 4650, Volume 15, the last two pages	
4			of that volume. In this case, the assistant	
5			commissioner is writing to Chief Superintendent Mark	11:17
6			Curran?	
7		Α.	Sorry, I have 4650.	
8	70	Q.	Yes, 4650, in Volume 15?	
9		Α.	Yeah, Volume 15. I have a chief superintendent letter	
10			to the superintendent of Athlone.	11:17
11	71	Q.	Sorry. What I have at the page if you just look at	
12			the letters at the bottom, 4650 at the bottom. If you	
13			just please look, Garda Keogh?	
14			MR. KELLY: That's not what we have.	
15			CHAIRMAN: It's a 2014 letter.	11:17
16			MR. MURPHY: Sorry, I have to pass from that. In the	
17			version I have, it has that number at the bottom.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Give us the dates, Mr. Murphy.	
19			MR. MURPHY: I can pass from that, Chairman, and come	
20			back to it.	11:18
21			CHAIRMAN: Well, why don't you just ask the question.	
22			If it's not an important one, I mean if it's showing,	
23			as I am understanding you're doing, if you are showing	
24			the efforts that Assistant Commissioner Finn made with	
25			a view to supporting the proposition that he set about	11:18
26			his work efficiently, then if you just tell us what the	
27			letter was and that he wrote to somebody.	

MR. MURPHY: Yes.

28

29

CHAIRMAN: I think we can return, revisit it if

Τ	necessary at a time when its materiality can be	
2	explored.	
3	MR. MURPHY: If I can hand this to the witness.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Certainly. Just tell him what it is so we	
5	all know what it is.	11:18
6	MR. MURPHY: The position is, the point is made, he	
7	notifies Chief Superintendent Curran notifies	
8	everybody else.	
9	CHAIRMAN: The date of the letter, Mr. Murphy?	
10	MR. MURPHY: The date of the letter is 17th January	11:18
11	2018.	
12	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
13	MR. MURPHY: And he says:	
14		
15	"I have notified the appointing officer"	11:18
16		
17	That's Assistant Commissioner Fanning.	
18		
19	"l am not in a position to complete the	
20	investigation within the timeframe set out by the	11:19
21	guidelines. I am seeking your consent to continue to	
22	conclude the matter as soon as possible given the	
23	volume of material involved."	
24		
25	So I think he's acknowledging you have given a large	11:19
26	volume of material.	
27	CHAIRMAN: And it's is going to take as long as it's	
28	going to take.	
29	MR. MURPHY: Yes.	

1		Α.	I accept that.	
2	72	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You're happy with that?	
3		Α.	It couldn't have been done within the normal time	
4			period, I accept that.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Garda Keogh says that's fair enough.	11:19
6	73	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Then can I ask you, please, to move	
7			forward to 4672, and that should be in Volume 16.	
8			These are all just by way of examples as to the	
9			progress of the investigation. So, this is a letter	
10			from Chief Superintendent Pat Murray, it's dated 29th	11:20
11			May 2018. It's in response to the points which are	
12			made, do you see that?	
13		Α.	4672.	
14	74	Q.	Yes, please.	
15		Α.	Yeah.	11:20
16	75	Q.	Various different points are dealt with. Could you	
17			please turn forward to page 4675. There you will see	
18			that Chief Superintendent Pat Murray says:	
19				
20			"I strongly refute all the allegations made by Garda	11:20
21			Keogh against me. I believe I have always behaved in a	
22			professional, supportive and caring manner towards	
23			him."	
24				
25			He gives effectively a defence of his position at that	11:20
26			stage. Again, you will be aware of that?	
27		Α.	That's what he says.	
28	76	Q.	Yes. Could you then turn forward, please, to page	
29			4903. This is a letter of 13th June 2018, this is	

1			where Assistant Commissioner Finn writes to Mr. Cullen,	
2			referring to earlier correspondence. He says:	
3				
4			"Please find attached a copy of all witness statements	
5			and reports I have procured during the course of my	11:21
6			investigation. I wish to afford your client an	
7			opportunity to review the material and make any comment	
8			or observation before I conclude my investigation. As	
9			alluded to previously, I am available and prepared to	
10			meet your client to clarify any issues he may wish to	11:21
11			rai se. "	
12				
13			I think there's no dispute between us, that letter was	
14			sent and that was part of the communications with your	
15			solicitor. Is that right?	11:21
16		Α.	That's correct, Judge.	
17	77	Q.	Then could I ask you, please, to move forward in the	
18			same volume, to page 4997? Sorry, for ease of	
19			reference, I beg your pardon, Registrar, could I ask	
20			you just to start the sequence on 4996. This is an	11:21
21			e-mail from your solicitor dated 6th September 2018.	
22			It's addressed to commissioner	
23			CHAIRMAN: This is from Assistant Commissioner Finn, is	
24			that right?	
25			MR. MURPHY: No, this is from Mr. Cullen to	11:22
26			CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, I have been asking Mr. Kavanagh	
27			to go the wrong way, sorry. Do you see what we are	
28			looking at here?	
29			MR. MURPHY: This appears to be a reply to issues that	

Т			were raised in the statements that had come back from	
2			Superintendent Murray, Chief Superintendent Wheatley,	
3			Chief Superintendent Curran. So this is your solicitor	
4			I think responding to the documents that he has been	
5			shown by Assistant Commissioner Finn.	11:23
6			CHAIRMAN: That's not what I am seeing, Mr. Murphy. I	
7			think Mr. Kelly isn't seeing the same thing.	
8			MR. MURPHY: At page 4998, Chairman.	
9			CHAIRMAN: 4998, okay, thank you.	
10			MR. KELLY: All I'm seeing is the heading of an e-mail.	11:23
11			MR. MURPHY: It's the beginning of the sequence, if I	
12			just ask you to move forward two pages, please, to	
13			4998. You will see there's an address at the top. It	
14			says:	
15				11:23
16			"Dear Assistant Commissioner Finn,	
17			We refer to the letter from Assistant Commissioner Finn	
18			dated 13th June 2018, together with enclosures and the	
19			letter of the 10th August requesting clarification and	
20			comment on such."	11:23
21				
22			So this is a response, a measured response to documents	
23			that are served in June, reminders that are sent in	
24			August. Then a series of questions are set out by your	
25			solicitor over the next two pages, do you see that?	11:23
26		Α.	I am just looking at them here.	
27	78	Q.	Yes. Perhaps I will just pick one or two out. For	
28			example:	

1			"Have you advised the penalties imposed on Garda Keogh	
2			and meetings in respect of both breaches."	
3				
4			Then questions in relation to Superintendent Murray's	
5			statement, asking what does he mean by this. But in	11:24
6			effect these are questions raised by your solicitor in	
7			response to the material that has been sent to him on	
8			your behalf.	
9			CHAIRMAN: And the date of that, Mr. Murphy?	
10			MR. MURPHY: That date, Judge, is September 2018. I	11:24
11			appreciate	
12			CHAIRMAN: 6th September.	
13			MR. MURPHY: Sorry, 6th September.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
15	79	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I appreciate there is a large volume of	11:24
16			material and Assistant Commissioner Finn will say that	
17			he had to take time to explore this. He highlighted at	
18			an earlier stage that it wouldn't fit into the normal	
19			timeframe. But here he is outlining the responses	
20			which are present.	11:24
21				
22			Can I ask you then, please, to go to Volume 17, at page	
23			5033? If you just ignore the date at the top, that has	
24			been reproduced I think. If you turn back, please, to	
25			page 5032?	11:25
26		Α.	Sorry, just the page?	
27	80	Q.	5032?	
28		Α.	55.	
29	81	Q.	5032, please.	

1 A. Sorry.

Q.

82

2

16

17

3 Murray wrote back to Assistant Commissioner Finn. the pages that follow there are a series of additional 4 5 responses to queries that were raised, I think some of 11:26 6 which come from Mr. Cullen. So again that's evidence 7 on that date, 9th October 2018, Superintendent Murray 8 is communicating back to Assistant Commissioner Finn. Do you see this? 9 10 Yes, yeah. Just --Α. 11:26 11 83 Q. CHAI RMAN: Yes. 12 Judge, is it October 2018 that Assistant Commissioner Α. 13 Finn signs off on the clearance forms to the Policing 14 Authority? 15 84 MR. MURPHY: I think there's a finalisation process Q. 11:27

This indicates on 9th October 2017, Superintendent

18 A. Right.

at that time.

19 85 Q. Yes. Then internal assessment, could you turn forward to 5521 please, at Volume 18.

taking place, there's communication between the parties

11:27

- 21 A. 5521?
- 22 86 Q. Yes, please. This is the final version of the report
 23 which is issued by Assistant Commissioner Finn and it's
 24 dated 20th December 2018, as can be seen on 5560. If
 25 you turn forward, please, to 5560.
- A. Sorry?
- 27 87 Q. 5560. Again, this is a document we have seen before, 28 but this is the conclusion, the conclusion of Assistant 29 Commissioner Finn, where he concluded that

Superintendent Murray and Chief Superintendent Curran and Chief Superintendent Wheatley acted legitimately within their respective roles and responsibilities to manage the issues and policing demands of their areas of responsibility and in particular their interaction with you. So that's the final version of the report.

11:29

11:29

11:29

11:29

11 · 29

Just very briefly, can I just put it to you that all those documents, and there are many, many more, that they are just a sample of them, demonstrate that Assistant Commissioner Finn took his task very seriously, communicated with your solicitor, he communicated with all the relevant parties, collated statements with his team, reviewed the evidence and came to his final conclusion, which he expressed in detail in this report.

I have to suggest to you that all of that was consistent with good practice and did not represent targeting or bullying or any form of hostility towards you.

A. On the face of it, Judge, that's the way it appears in the written record. But, Judge, my dates may not be correct, so I won't go into the dates, but I think there is an issue here, Judge, where Commissioner Finn is signing off on the clearance forms in relation to the Policing Authority while this is under investigation. I think that would lead to a huge issue there, where he is not -- basically has the finding --

1			if I am correct, now I mightn't be correct on this,	
2			that's why I don't want to but if it's a case that	
3			he has cleared off on them while he is conducting the	
4			investigation, it would appear that he already has the	
5			findings made prior to the investigation being	11:30
6			concluded.	
7	88	Q.	I think, Garda Keogh, you're aware that the point you	
8			just made relates to the next issue?	
9		Α.	Right.	
10	89	Q.	Not this issue?	11:30
11		Α.	Right.	
12	90	Q.	But secondly, on behalf of Assistant Commissioner Finn	
13			I have to suggest to you that in fact what you suggest	
14			there is incorrect, that at every stage he approached	
15			the task seriously, fairly and partially. You accepted	11:30
16			yesterday, you never sought to challenge his	
17			appointment or you never sought to challenge him to	
18			stand down in the course of that 12-month inquiry and	
19			you accepted that, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	I accept that. As I stated Judge, at that stage I had	11:30
21			to go through the motions with the Guards, that I had	
22			been in touch with GSOC. At that point in didn't	
23			matter who was doing the bullying and harassment	
24			investigation.	
25	91	Q.	But you see, at that time you also knew that	11:31
26			Superintendent Murray had been promoted and was then	
27			Chief Superintendent Murray, is that right?	
28		Α.	He was promoted in January 2018.	
29	92	Q.	Yes. The focus of the investigation proceeds all the	

1 way through that year without objection from you?

2 A. I think it starts prior.

3 93 Q. Yes.

4 A. Yes.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

5 94 CHAI RMAN: Just to be fair to yourself and so I Q. 11:31 understand exactly, just tell me the last bit again. 6 You referred to GSOC. I don't want to tell you what I 7 8 think you said because I don't want to influence you in any way. Tell me about the relevance of the GSOC --9 you see, Mr. Murphy says, look, all these steps show -- 11:31 10 11 now leave aside the promotion question, because we'll 12 coming to that, I understand your point about that, 13 your query about that. So, let's just park that just 14 for the moment. But tell me about the GSOC thing, what's the relevance of that? 15 11:32

> Prior, back, I think as far as back as 2016, when I'm Α. trying to invoke the bullying -- make a complaint to do with bullying and harassment, because the law has changed in 2014 and a guard can now go to GSOC, I was in consultation with GSOC about bullying and 11:32 harassment. The advice that I got there was that I had to invoke the Garda procedures first. So I had to go through Garda procedures first. So that's what I did, I invoked the Garda policy. So there's obviously the Finn investigation. Then later I appeal it. 11:32 that would have been finalised, I had already, let's say, spoken to GSOC in 2016, to say, listen, I might need to come back to you in relation to this. had to go through the internal Garda policy.

1	95	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I have to ask you, you said, I had to go
2			through the motions?
3		Δ	Ves Judge

- 4 96 Which has a certain implication; that it 0. CHAI RMAN: 5 didn't matter, I am just going through the motions 11:33 6 because I want to get this over in order to head off to
- Is that what you meant? 7 GSOC.
- 8 Unfortunately, unfortunately --Α.
- I don't want to suggest something, do you 9 97 Q. CHAI RMAN: 10 understand? 11:33
- 11 Α. Unfortunately, judge, that would be the case. At this 12 period I am in a fair bit of conflict with Garda 13 management in general.
- 14 98 Q. CHAI RMAN: Yes.
- 15 So I'm not expecting a whole lot. That's why I had Α. 11:33 16 originally gone to GSOC.
- 17 CHAI RMAN: I am torn between asking you anything 18 further, so I think I won't. okay.
- 19 99 MR. MURPHY: Chairman, just by way of conclusion, can I Q. 20 just it to you Garda Keogh on behalf of Assistant 11:34 Commissioner Finn, that he will say that he did his 21
- 22 duty as best he could, that he never intended to either 23 target, discredit or damage your interest in any way.
- 24 That will be his evidence.
- I can't comment on his evidence. 25 Α.

- 26 MR. MURPHY: Chairman, those are my questions in 27 relation to that.
- 28 Thanks very much. CHAI RMAN:
- 29 MR. MURPHY: Chairman, I propose to move to the next

1			issue, which is number	
2			CHAIRMAN: Just give me a moment. Now, sorry, yes,	
3			Mr. Murphy.	
4			MR. MURPHY: Chairman, the next issue to address is	
5			number 19; whether the disciplinary investigation	11:35
6			carried out by Assistant Commissioner Anne Marie	
7			McMahon constituted discrediting or targeting of Garda	
8			Nicholas Keogh.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Right. Am I right in thinking that this is	
10			a relatively brief area.	11:35
11			MR. MURPHY: It is. It's not a ten minute issue but it	
12			is a brief issue.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
14			MR. MURPHY: If it was suitable for you to rise at this	
15			point.	11:35
16			CHAIRMAN: If we are moving to a new point.	
17			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
18			CHAIRMAN: We will give Garda Keogh a break and,	
19			indeed, everybody else a break and we will come back	
20			at, say, 11:45. All right. Okay.	11:35
21			MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.	
22				
23			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS	
24			FOLLOWS:	
25				11:49
26	100	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Chairman, the next issue to be addressed	
27			is issue number 19, whether the disciplinary	
28			investigation carried out by Assistant Commissioner	
29			Anne Marie McMahon constituted discrediting or	

1			targeting of Garda Nicholas Keogh.	
2				
3			Garda Keogh, I think you have given evidence in your	
4			examination-in-chief in response to Mr. Mr. McGuinness,	
5			you gave that evidence on Day 104. I wonder if that	11:50
6			transcript could be brought up, please, on the screen,	
7			with particular reference to page 96.	
8				
9			Just at the outset, Garda Keogh, I am going to go	
10			through the points which I understand you are making	11:50
11			here, just so we are very clear about them. Then I	
12			will come back and ask questions, if that is convenient	
13			to you and the Chairman.	
14				
15			So I think the first point at paragraph 96, is you say	11:50
16			in line 23:	
17				
18			"I would argue she was obliged to make an arrest at	
19			that point."	
20				11:51
21			Are we agreed, that's is the first issue?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	101	Q.	Then the issue at page 98, at lines 7 and 8, you	
24			suggest that because Assistant Commissioner McMahon did	
25			not carry out the arrests that that was discrediting	11:51
26			you. Do you see this at line 9? You see in response	
27			to a question from the Chairman at line 6, the Chairman	
28			asked you:	
29				

Τ			"CHAIRMAN: Sorry, hold on. Let's get to the bottom of	
2			this in the end. You say that's is targeting you,	
3			because she didn't arrest?	
4			A. No, but it's is discrediting, I would say	
5			di scredi ti ng. "	
6				
7			So, I understood you to say it's not targeting but	
8			discrediting, is that fair?	
9		Α.	Yeah. Judge, there's more to play in this, in relation	
10			to in relation to there's a particular statement	11:52
11			that is taken and they seemed to sit on it I think for	
12			five to six months.	
13	102	Q.	There is a he third point at page 107, I think you are	
14			saying at line 28, when you are asked:	
15				11:52
16			"What's the major points in relation to this issue?"	
17				
18			And you say at line 28:	
19				
20			"Chairman, two things: Dragging it out and failing to	11:52
21			make arrests."	
22				
23			Just over the top of the next page, page 108, we have a	
24			third one, the second line:	
25				11:52
26			"Failure to keep you informed."	
27				
28			Can we take it that those are the points that you raise	
29			on this issue?	

Т		Α.	res.	
2	103	Q.	Just to assist the Chairman to focus on those points	
3			and those points only. Very good. Can I ask you,	
4			please, then to be shown Volume 20. Could you please	
5			turn to page 6005? You see here a letter from Deputy	11:53
6			Commissioner John Twomey dated 12th May 2017. It's	
7			addressed to Assistant Commissioner Anne Marie McMahon,	
8			and it says:	
9				
10			"You are hereby appointed to pursuant to section 23 of	11:54
11			the Garda Síochána (Discipline) Regulations 2007 to	
12			investigate the allegations as per attached form IA31S	
13			in respect of two gardaí, Garda A and superintendent."	
14				
15			Then you say:	11:54
16				
17			"Attached report on behalf of Assistant Commissioner	
18			Nolan, recently retired, is also attached for your	
19			information."	
20				11:54
21			Just turning over to the bottom of the page, you will	
22			see the form, IA31, and it's entitled "Appointment of	
23			investigating officer under regulation 23."	
24				
25			I think you are familiar with this type of form?	11:54
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	104	Q.	It is a standard form into which details are placed?	
28		Α.	I understand. I just want to bring one point to your	
29			attention, Judge. It's probably not it's just prior	

			to this part. It's just that Assistant commissioner	
2			Nolan was originally appointed to do this	
3			investigation. Judge, they knew Assistant Commissioner	
4			Nolan was due to retire. I just wanted to bring that	
5			point to your and then it goes to Assistant	11:55
6			Commissioner Anne Marie McMahon. I just	
7	105	Q.	Well, I think as a matter of fact he did retire?	
8		Α.	He did retire.	
9	106	Q.	Yes.	
10		Α.	They knew this wasn't a simple investigation, like the	11:55
11			guard stole a Mars bar from a stop, a disciplinary	
12			thing. As we touched on in the last thing with the	
13			Finn thing, that this was going to be a lengthy,	
14			another lengthy, long and complicated thing. They	
15			appointed a person they knew was going to retire. I	11:55
16			wanted to bring that to your attention.	
17	107	Q.	That is your perception of events but I want point to	
18			you that the fact is that Assistant	
19		Α.	Sorry, my perception, just on perception.	
20	108	Q.	Yes.	11:55
21		Α.	Like that is a fact, that they did appoint, because	
22			we're only after looking at this, it's here in the	
23			previous document that we referred to. It's at page	
24			6005. It has on behalf of Assistant Commissioner	
25			Nolan, recently retired. I was just making the point	11:56
26			that they originally appointed him when they knew he	
27			was due to retire. That's all on that matter.	
28	109	Q.	Well again, just for the record, can I say, there is	
29			nothing wrong with them having done that	

Т		Α.	No, you are say that that was my perception.	
2	110	Q.	Yes.	
3		Α.	And I was just making the point that that it's there.	
4	111	Q.	No, two things. The fact is he was appointed before	
5			you, that's a fact.	11:56
6		Α.	Right.	
7	112	Q.	The fact that they knew that he was going to retire is	
8			your perception of events. But it's not relevant to	
9			what we're dealing with here?	
10		Α.	Okay.	11:56
11	113	Q.	So, if we can just move on please, thank you. In terms	
12			of the focus, I just want to look at this form for a	
13			moment. Would you agree with me that if you look at	
14			the middle of the document, the focus of this	
15			appointment is:	11:56
16				
17			"It appears that Garda A"	
18				
19			And then it details:	
20				11:56
21			"may have been in breach of discipline as set out at	
22			A and may be subject to the following disciplinary	
23			sancti on:	
24				
25			1. Di smi ssal;	11:56
26			2. Requirement to retire or resign as an alternative	
27			to dismissal.	
28			3. Reduction of rank.	
29			4. Reduction in pay not exceeding 4 weeks pay."	

Т				
2			So, just in terms of that approach, would you agree	
3			with me that the entire focus of the investigation is	
4			on the two guards who are named in that particular box,	
5			that's what it's about.	11:57
6		Α.	No, no, no. I don't think so, Judge. There's two	
7	114	Q.	Would you agree with me that it is a disciplinary	
8			regulation?	
9		Α.	Yes. But you said two guards. Judge, we've touched on	
10			this, there's four. There's one a chief	11:57
11			superintendent, one is Garda A. Then there's two	
12			guards from the National Drugs Unit, which I have	
13			always stated, I don't know why they were ever they	
14			should never have been thrown into the mix.	
15	115	Q.	The position, you're aware of this, none of these	11:57
16			parties are to be named and I'm not naming them for	
17			that purpose.	
18			CHAIRMAN: No, in fairness, Garda Keogh has been very	
19			careful, I have to say, he has been very careful in his	
20			evidence not to name people. But he does say that	11:57
21			there are two other gardaí.	
22			MR. MURPHY: I don't see how this is relevant to this	
23			issue, Chairman.	
24		Α.	They're blanked out, Judge, the names are blanked out	
25			on the page, I think, presuming it's them, on page	11:58
26			6005, which I have been referred to.	
27	116	Q.	Can I perhaps come back to that point later on. Can I	
28			just ask you confirm the focus of the investigation is	
29			discipline?	

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	117	Q.	Do you agree with that?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	118	Q.	Yes. So this is not a criminal investigation, would	
5			you agree with that?	11:58
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	119	Q.	In fact, the consequences or the outcome of an adverse	
8			finding can be seen in that block in the centre:	
9			Dismissal; requirement to retire; reduction in rank; or	
10			reduction in pay. Do you see that?	11:58
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	120	Q.	In terms of the matters to be enquired into, that's	
13			contained in the box under the heading "(a)" at the	
14			bottom of page 6006. Do you see that?	
15		Α.	Yeah.	11:58
16	121	Q.	Insofar as that's concerned, Assistant Commissioner	
17			McMahon will say that her focus therefore was on that	
18			particular approach; namely, the question of	
19			discipline, and nothing else. So, just to take your	
20			first complaint against her, your complaint that you	11:59
21			made on the last occasion was that she was obliged to	
22			arrest people. She will say that that wasn't her focus	
23			at that time because she was dealing with a	
24			disciplinary investigation, not a criminal	
25			investigation. I think you do appreciate the	11:59
26			difference between the two?	
27		Α.	There is, but it's not again as simple as that. I	
28			mean, the argument, what we are dealing with here is,	
29			it's a conspiracy to supply heroin. John Gilligan is	

1			the only person that I know of that was actually	
2			convicted, I could be totally wrong, that was convicted	
3			of something like this. The point I'm trying to make	
4			is: Let's say, because this did cropped up last week,	
5			that a murder or something happened during the and	11:59
6			it cropped up during a disciplinary investigation,	
7			like, it's not as simple, they can't turn around and	
8			say, oh, well we're just doing a disciplinary	
9			investigation, we're not going to look at this more	
10			serious event, you know, it's nothing to do with us.	12:00
11	122	Q.	In terms of the approach towards the investigation, she	
12			will say in her evidence that she effectively carried	
13			out that investigation under those regulations and not	
14			under any other focus.	
15		Α.	Yeah.	12:00
16	123	Q.	Would you agree with that?	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	124	Q.	Yes. So, insofar as that investigation concerned you,	
19			the position is that the members that were identified	
20			in the form that I have mentioned for her	12:00
21			investigations were Garda A and the names are blanked	
22			out on the page 5994. Can I ask you to be shown,	
23			please, 5994 at Volume 20? Ultimately she will say in	
24			her evidence, as you will see in 5994, that on 2nd	
25			February 2017 she is aware that Superintendent Michael	12:01
26			Lacey and Detective Inspector Seamus Maher, met by	
27			appoint with you, to seek consent from you to use	
28			statements previously made by you to Detective	
29			Superintendent Declan Mulcahy. Do you remember that?	

Т		Α.	res.	
2	125	Q.	She will also say that on 6th March 2018 that Detective	
3			Inspector Seamus Maher spoke with you by way of	
4			telephone call?	
5		Α.	Judge. I am not I'm not sure about that. I have	12:02
6			seen that document, it's an incredible document and	
7			I've never seen anything like it in	
8	126	Q.	Did he contact you by telephone?	
9		Α.	I have no note of it in my diary. I have a note	
10			Judge, if I can refer to my diary note.	12:02
11			CHAIRMAN: Yes, of course.	
12		Α.	What date, please?	
13	127	Q.	MR. MURPHY: This date is 6th March 2018.	
14			CHAIRMAN: 6th March '18.	
15		Α.	Judge, on my diary note, what I have here is, on 6th	12:02
16			March 2018:	
17				
18			"I received a text message from Superintendent Minnock	
19			texted me to say Inspector Seamus Maher Looking for my	
20			number. Part of AC McMahon's investigation team."	12:03
21				
22			Then, on the 7th, the next morning, at 7 that was at	
23			13:08. So at 7:43am I got a text back saying:	
24				
25			"Superintendent Minnock text me. Inspector Maher tells	12:03
26			me he okay now."	
27				
28			I don't have a record for that conversation. I am not	
29			I am not sure, I have myself mulled over all the	

1 possibilities, Judge, and I do see I relapse into my 2 weakness a few days after. I don't know. recollection of that conversation. 3 I have no note of I have a note from the 6th in relation to this 4 5 contact and on the 7th. But either way, this document 12:03 6 that you're referring to is an incredibly unusual 7 document, which I have never seen before in any --8 128 CHAI RMAN: What document? Q. 9 It appears to be notes of a phone call between myself Α. 10 and Inspector Maher. 12:04 11 129 CHAI RMAN: Okay. Q. 12 As a guard I have never seen them in the last 20 years. Α. 13 I doubt any solicitor or barrister has ever seen such a 14 document, where there appears to be a phone call. It's 15 as if there was a phone call and it was recorded and 12:04 16 everything is written down and it seems to be presented in -- given in as some form of evidence. It's never 17 18 put to me after to sign, you know, sign it, have it read out to me or to sign it. 19 20 130 CHAI RMAN: I am sure Mr. Murphy is probably going to Q. 12:04 21 ask you about it? 22 Yes, sorry. Α. 23 well actually I'm not. I'm just curious MR. MURPHY: 24 to which document the witness is referring. 25 He is referring to a note that you have seen 12:04 of the conversation. 26

27

28

29

131

Yes.

CHAI RMAN:

disputing?

Α.

Ο.

Which you're not sure of our you're

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	132	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Or you're denying, of 6th March 2018,	
3			Between Detective Inspector Seamus Maher and Garda	
4			Keogh. He says there's a note of that. Mr. Murphy is	
5			not asking you apparently about the note of that?	:05
6		Α.	Right.	
7	133	Q.	MR. MURPHY: We will attempt to identify that note and	
8			will return to the witness with it?	
9			CHAIRMAN: If it's is important, no doubt Mr. Kelly	
10			will take us back to it and you can reveal your	:05
11			reservations or comments about it in due course. But	
12			unless Mr. Murphy asks you something about it, I am not	
13			inclined to take it into account. Okay. But that	
14			doesn't stop you.	
15			WITNESS: I'm sorry, I thought is was that that he	:05
16			was referring to.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Don't apologise in the slightest, there's no	
18			need to apologise whatsoever. I can understand your	
19			thinking, oh, I know where we're going now. So that's	
20			okay, that's no problem. So, you say there was a call $_{12}$:05
21			and it would appear at least, if I am understanding the	
22			exchanges, that Inspector Minnock was alerting you to	

25 A. Yes.

23

24

- 26 134 Q. CHAIRMAN: So, he may well have phoned you, but we 27 don't know what happened after that, unless somebody 28 says it's relevant. Okay.
- 29 A. Yes, Judge.

number.

the fact that Inspector Maher was looking for your

1			MR. KELLY: Judge, what he is also saying is that his	
2			diary entry for the following day indicates that	
3			Minnock contacted him to say that it was all okay with	
4			Maher, thereby implying he never made contact.	
5			MR. MURPHY: Sorry, Chairman, that's consistent with	12:06
6			having made contact with him.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Hold on, wait now. The implications, the	
8			inferences, we will worry about in due course. At the	
9			moment we have the evidence.	
10			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	12:06
11			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thanks very much.	
12	135	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, Assistant Commissioner	
13			McMahon will say that she did not interact with you. I	
14			think that's something you agree with?	
15		Α.	Yes.	12:06
16	136	Q.	She will say she carried out her investigation, she	
17			made her reports but nothing that she did in relation	
18			to that report required her to arrest anybody?	
19		Α.	Just, there's two, two points to that question, Judge.	
20			The first one is: When Assistant Commissioner Nolan	12:07
21			was appointed to do the investigation, he sent me out a	
22			letter to say I am appointed to the investigation,	
23			that's fine. I never got any notification from	
24			Assistant Commissioner McMahon. I didn't know for a	
25			long period of time that it was Assistant Commissioner	12:07
26			McMahon. I knew Assistant Commissioner Nolan had	
27			retired, I didn't know then what was no one had	
28			informed me.	
29	137	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	

2			things, that you're supposed to be kept up-to-date.	
3			And I didn't even know who was conducting the	
4			investigation. But back to the second	
5	138	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Can I take that point for a moment?	12:07
6		Α.	Yeah.	
7	139	Q.	That seems highly unlikely because, as you accept, you	
8			met with Detective Superintendent Lacey and Detective	
9			Inspector Maher on 2nd February 2017?	
10		Α.	Yeah, but were they not for Jack Nolan's investigation?	12:08
11	140	Q.	Yes, but insofar as their standing is concerned, you	
12			were aware that the investigation was taking place,	
13			were you not?	
14			CHAIRMAN: No, he agrees that he knew that the Nolan	
15			investigation was taking place.	12:08
16			MR. MURPHY: I see.	
17			CHAIRMAN: He says he didn't about the McMahon	
18			investigation and he says he wasn't told of it.	
19			MR. MURPHY: Very good.	
20	141	Q.	Insofar as the position is concerned, I say that there	12:08
21			is nothing in the evidence to indicate that Assistant	
22			Commissioner McMahon was required to arrest anybody as	
23			part of her investigative duties in this disciplinary	
24			inquiry, would you agree with that?	
25		Α.	I'm not so sure on that, Judge. That will be you	12:08
26			may have to make a decision on that, Judge. My	
27			argument, Judge, would be that in the course of that	
28			investigation, there appears I think in April 2018	
29			Ms. B makes an admission, which is incredible thing, in	

A. Under the protected disclosures, that's one of the

the whole -- if you go back through the whole series of investigation and events of the last few years, it is a game changer here. A statement from a person that was actively involved in the supply of heroin has made a statement of admission, it's an incredible thing,

12:09

12:09

12:09

12:10

12:10

6 Judge.

- 7 142 Q. Garda Keogh, my question was: There's nothing in the investigation that required Assistant Commissioner
 9 McMahon to arrest anybody because she was conducting, as you have accepted, a disciplinary investigation.
 11 You are aware of the distinction, are you not, between that and a criminal investigation?
- 13 A. I am aware of the distinction.
- 14 143 Q. Yes.
- 15 But this is a game changer, this is a different Α. 16 scenario here now, where you have something, it relates to the -- the disciplinary investigation crops out of a 17 18 criminal investigation where theirs is something very 19 This information was not available to the 20 criminal investigation team. So this is a -- it's -we're into -- I don't know if we in untested waters or 21 22 whatever here, but if this, as I said, was something 23 even more serious, like a murder or that, you couldn't 24 -- one could not just say, oh, well, I am only doing a disciplinary investigation, I'm not looking at that. 25
- 26 144 Q. I have to suggest to you that it was entirely
 27 appropriate and correct for her to do so. Would you
 28 agree that this investigation wasn't about you, it was
 29 about people who were under investigation?

- 1 A. I understand that.
- 2 145 Q. Yes. She will say in her evidence that she carried out
- 3 the task as diligently as she could and that she also
- 4 made recommendations in relation to disciplinary
- 5 matters, which were effectively passed further up the

12 · 11

12:11

12:11

- 6 chain of command. I think you agree with me, there's
- 7 nothing in her report that expressly discredits you or
- 8 attacks you, harasses you, targets you in any shape or
- 9 form?
- 10 A. I think we've clearly outlined from the outset the
- 11 three matters that are to be contested.
- 12 146 Q. Again, I think you have no evidence from your own
- personal knowledge to indicate that this investigation
- 14 was dragged out, as you suggest at page 107 of your
- 15 testimony on Day 104.
- 16 A. Judge, I can't agree with that. I simply can't. I
- 17 mean --
- 18 147 Q. Just again from your own personal knowledge, can I ask
- 19 you, would you agree with me, you have no knowledge of
- 20 what actually took place in the investigation itself?
- 21 A. From my point -- I can only give from my point of view.
- 22 148 Q. No, not from your point of view, from your knowledge,
- 23 what you know?
- 24 A. From my knowledge, Judge, I am informed there is a
- discipline investigation, I think Detective Mulcahy
- informs me there is going to be a disciplinary
- investigation in 2015, I think at the end of 2015, if
- I'm correct, and here we are in, what are we, 2018, is
- it now, are we, for this document we're referring to?

- I mean, that's three years later.
- 2 149 Q. Again, you have absolutely no idea what is taking place internally within the investigation, is that right?
- A. Well, this even goes on into this year. I think it's only quite recently --

12:12

12:13

12:13

But then I wrote to the new

- 6 150 No, just focus on Assistant Commissioner Anne Marie Q. McMahon for the moment. She is appointed on 12th May 7 8 2017, what information do you have from your personal knowledge that says that she dragged out this 9 investigation in an effort to discredit you? I have to 12:12 10 11 suggest to you that the answer is none? 12 No, give him a chance to answer that. CHAI RMAN:
- Judge, I wasn't even informed that she -- she never 13 Α. 14 informed me that she -- she was obliged to inform 15 me that she was conducting this, as Jack Nolan did. 16 She was also obliged to at least let me know, by the 17 way, I'm appointed now to do this investigation. 18 was none of that. I was writing to Donal Ó Cualáin to 19 try and find out. He wouldn't tell me. He wrote back 20 to say the CEO Joe Nugent will be in touch with you. I'm aware Clare Daly wrote a letter to I think the 21 22 Taoiseach and the Minister for Justice in relation to it, but fair enough, they couldn't get involved, I 23
- commissioner, Drew Harris. There was no letter ever came back to say Assistant Commissioner McMahon is investigating this.

understand, I accept that.

24

28 151 Q. MR. MURPHY: So the answer to the question is you have no evidence to demonstrate Assistant Commissioner

1			McMahon deliberately dragged out this investigation to	
2			discredit you, isn't that correct?	
3		Α.	Equally, I could argue there was no evidence, I would	
4			have had no evidence she was even conducting the	
5			investigation.	12:13
6	152	Q.	Well, that hasn't stopped you from making a complaint	
7			against her, with no evidence?	
8		Α.	Because I am aware obviously that she was conducting an	
9			investigation.	
10	153	Q.	Yes. And I have to suggest to you on her behalf that	12:13
11			in fact the allegations that you are making in this	
12			case of dragging things out, failing to make arrests,	
13			have no foundation whatsoever?	
14		Α.	There's a serious foundation in relation to that Ms. B	
15			statement. That Ms. B statement is an incredible	12:14
16			document and you're saying there's no evidence?	
17	154	Q.	Garda Keogh, in terms of the points I put to you in	
18			relation to dragging things out and failing to make	
19			arrests, I am suggesting to you, you have no evidence	
20			to support those allegations at all?	12:14
21		Α.	I dispute that. Because Ms. B's statement was made in	
22			it was made in, was it April 2018, roughly, I	
23			mightn't have the dates right, Judge. But that	
24			statement then appears to have been just sat on for	
25			five months and then it is passed over to Detective	12:14
26			Inspector Coppinger from the original investigation	
27			team. That in itself, that whole episode there, that	
28			six-month period has massive question marks all over	
29			it. And there is evidence.	

- 1 155 Q. There's no evidence.
- 2 A. There is.
- 3 156 Q. There is no evidence that Assistant Commissioner
- 4 McMahon deliberately dragged out the investigation in
- 5 the way that you suggest in your answer to the Chairman 12:15
- 6 on the last occasion?
- 7 A. Well look, we're disputed on that.
- 8 157 Q. Well, no, what's happening, can I suggest to you, what
- 9 you are doing here is, you are effectively analysing
- things from your own perspective, but you know nothing

12:15

- about the conduct of the investigation, you haven't
- spoken on your version to anybody involved in the
- investigation, that's your version, apart from two
- 14 members you mentioned at the outset, you don't know
- 15 what course the investigation took, but still you are
- making an allegation that Assistant Commissioner
- 17 McMahon dragged out the investigation?
- 18 A. Judge, Mr. Murphy is doing the very same thing on the
- other side of the coin; he is following the
- instructions given to him. Judge, there is evidence in 12:15
- relation to the Ms. B statement. There is evidence in
- those documents that it wasn't acted on immediately.
- 23 It appears to have been sat on for about five months.
- 24 It's an incredible statement in the whole sequence of
- events that went on and then appears to be just passed
- over then to Detective Inspector Coppinger. So, I
- think we're talking about six months of a period here
- where they have this hot coal and they seem to be
- 29 juggling it around.

1	158	Q.	But, Garda Keogh, you have no idea what they were	
2			doing, isn't that the case?	
3		Α.	Well, I have read it in the documents.	
4	159	Q.	But you have no idea what was taking place at the time,	
5			do you?	12:16
6		Α.	At the time, I wasn't even informed it was	
7			investigated.	
8	160	Q.	I am suggesting to you that there is simply no evidence	
9			to support the accusation that you made against	
10			Assistant Commissioner McMahon in relation to her	12:16
11			investigation?	
12		Α.	I dispute that.	
13	161	Q.	Assistant Commissioner McMahon will say in her	
14			evidence, if I can refer you to, please, to page 5999	
15			of the volume, that's to say volume, 20. She will say	12:17
16			in her evidence, if I draw your attention to the middle	
17			of page 5559, she will say in her evidence that she can	
18			say that her investigation was progressed as	
19			expeditiously as possible and that she rejects any	
20			assertion, implied or otherwise, that her investigation	12:17
21			was substandard or delayed or negatively impacted in	
22			any manner whatsoever. That will be her evidence.	
23		Α.	Judge, at the very top paragraph on page 5999, treble	
24			9, Judge, there's a thing here:	
25				12:18
26			"Within the body of the letter of Nicholas Keogh, I	
27			note there his reference to Olivia O'Neill and alleged	
28			i nteracti on "	

_	102	Q.	CHAIRMAN. I am not with you, sorry. I am not with	
2			you. Tell me where we are.	
3		Α.	It's at the top paragraph of page 5999.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Yes, "I know there is a reference", yes,	
5			yes, yes. Thank you.	12:18
6		Α.		
7			"and alleged interactions between Garda A and Ms. B.	
8			I can state that this information was not previously	
9			known to me and my discipline investigation team and	
10			has only come to my attention as part of the	12:18
11			documentation received from the Chief State Solicitors	
12			on 8th March 2019."	
13				
14	163	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
15		Α.	Judge, that'S a massive thing. That'S a massive thing.	12:18
16			So like, essentially	
17	164	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, all she is doing there is	
18			indicating when information was brought to her	
19			attention. How on earth can you ascribe something	
20			negatively to her in that regard?	12:19
21		Α.	What discipline investigation was she conducting if she	
22			didn't know about Garda A and Ms. B? I mean and the	
23			first like she's appointed in what, is it April or	
24			May 2017, and the first that she becomes aware of	
25			Assistant Commissioner McMahon becomes aware of this is	12:19
26			8th March 2019. Judge, bear in mind at that point they	
27			know this Tribunal is coming up.	
28	165	Q.	Her position is she will indicate in her evidence that	
29			the substantive investigation file concerning Garda A	

1 was submitted for the attention of the deciding officer 2 on 27th February of 2019. Isn't it the case that you understand full well that in this situation -- sorry, 3 isn't it the case that you understand full well that a 4 5 person in Assistant Commissioner Anne Marie McMahon's 12:20 position has the capacity to make recommendations at 6 7 the end of the process of investigation? 8 That's fair enough. Α. what recommendation do you understand she made? 9 166 Q. Judge, can I get that, the date you called out first. 10 Α. 12:20 You called a date out there. 11 12 27th February 2019? 167 Ο. 13 27th? Α. 14 168 Q. Of February 2019. 15 Judge, can I just write that date on this? Α. 12:20 16 169 CHAI RMAN: Absolutely, Yes. Ο. 17 So, Judge, now it appears that Assistant Commissioner Α. 18 McMahon has made a recommendation on 27/2/2019. 19 170 CHAI RMAN: Yes. Q. And she's not aware of interactions between Garda A and 12:20 20 Α. Ms. B until 8th March 2019. 21 22 CHAI RMAN: You're suggesting that as a reading of a 23 I am not accepting it, agreeing it or not 24 agreeing it. I am simply receiving that that's your interpretation of that statement. 25 12.21 Yes. Well, I think the position is 26 MR. MURPHY: 27 that --28 CHAI RMAN: Do you understand me? 171 Q. 29 Sorry? Α.

1	172	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Let me be absolutely clear. I don't know
2			whether that means the information in relation to
3			Olivia O'Neill and alleged interactions wasn't known to
4			Assistant Commissioner McMahon. That's one
5			possibility. The second possibility is the inference 12
6			or implication that you're putting on it, which is to
7			say that she wasn't aware of the relationship or the
8			alleged relationship between Garda A and Ms. B. So, as
9			I am seeing it, rightly or wrongly, I am reading it,
10			and you take one meaning from it, which may be correct, $_{12}$
11			I do not know, we will have to hear the evidence. But
12			as a piece of an analysis of the statement, that's the
13			way it appears to me, there are two possible meanings.
14		Α.	Judge, I understand and I agree.
15	173	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, I don't expect you to agree with me now 12
16			but I am saying, you are taking, it seems to me, a
17			meaning from it. I have to say, I have to reserve
18			judgment as to the correctness of that meaning. It

21 A. Judge, if you were to take either of those scenarios, 22 Judge, I would still argue that it is incredible that -

doesn't seem irresistible to me, it seems another

12:22

23 174 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay, I have the point, yes.

possibility.

19

- A. the recommendations are made on the 27/2/19 and that
 this new information comes on 8th March 2019. As I
 said, Judge, at this point An Garda Síochána are aware
 that this Tribunal is approaching.
- 28 175 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, again that's entirely
 29 supposition on your part. What I am suggesting to you

1			is that Assistant Commissioner McMahon will say,	
2			considering the complex nature of the investigations	
3			conducted, that the timeframe in which she operated was	
4			not inordinate or excessive.	
5	176	Q.	CHAIRMAN: well, you don't agree with that.	12:23
6		Α.	No.	
7	177	Q.	MR. MURPHY: And that will be her evidence. So	
8			finally, I just have to suggest to you that nothing in	
9			the criticisms you have made of her are supported by	
10			any material evidence. That ultimately she will say	12:23
11			she carried out her investigation in good faith, that	
12			she never sought to target you. What was the outcome	
13			of her investigation?	
14		Α.	I don't think there was I think she recommended	
15			from recollection.	12:23
16	178	Q.	Yes.	
17		Α.	She may have recommended a board of inquiry	
18	179	Q.	Exactly. So you do know that?	
19		Α.	Yeah.	
20	180	Q.	I think you will agree with me that that recommendation	12:23
21			wasn't something that was hostile to you or	
22			discrediting you. On the contrary, I presume that's a	
23			conclusion you would have welcomed?	
24		Α.	It's not that I would have welcomed. There's no	
25			welcoming. Judge, there's no welcoming, it's not that	12:24
26			I'm delighted or anything, because this thing has	
27			dragged on now years and years. I mean, from going	
28			back this starts for me on even prior to the	
29			2014 hut officially on 8th May 2014	

1	181	Q.	Garda Keogh, a very simple point I am going to put to	
2			you, I have to suggest to you that Assistant	
3			Commissioner McMahon's recommendation could in a way be	
4			regarded as an attempt to discredit you?	
5		Α.	On the recommendation, I am not in dispute with you on	12:24
6			that.	
7			MR. MURPHY: Thank you. Chairman, those are the	
8			questions I propose to ask on this issue.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
10			MR. MURPHY: There may be one issue I may seek to raise	12:24
11			later on, just based on instructions, but that's the	
12			last question I am going to ask at this stage.	
13			Chairman, in terms of the next phase, we're moving to a	
14			much longer piece and this might be an appropriate time	
15			to break. The issue I'm coming to here is number 20,	12:25
16			it's complaints by Garda Nicholas Keogh in relation to	
17			the promotion of Superintendent Pat Murray.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Is this the last item that you will be	
19			wait now, we have what's the position? Just remind	
20			me of the position, Mr. McGuinness, remind me of the	12:25
21			position about 21 and 22. Well, we can worry about	
22			those. I suppose you might have a word with your	
23			colleagues about particularly 22. Have we covered that	
24			before? It looks like that's a matter for the	
25			department, doesn't it?	12:25
26			MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chairman.	
27			CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kelly, would you have a look at item 22.	
28			Possibly we have mentioned it. Have we mentioned it	
29			already?	

1 I may be of assistance, Judge, there. If WI TNESS: 2 that's the section 41 matter. 3 CHAI RMAN: Yes. WI TNFSS: I think that's gone. 4 5 CHAIRMAN: I think so too. I was going to give 12:26 6 Mr. Kelly a chance to get in there. WI TNESS: 7 Sorry. 8 MR. KELLY: I think that went. I have a memory of you at one point saying that it was a matter, since it was 9 a section 41 report, for the Minister as to whether it 10 12:26 should or shouldn't --11 12 CHAI RMAN: Yes. And even if the Minister was wrong in 13 holding it, it couldn't be targeting by senior Gardaí. 14 well, at the time it was then -- there was 15 no point in it being advanced further with you. 12:26 16 CHAI RMAN: Very good. 17 MR. KELLY: We accept that it is purely for the 18 Minister. 19 CHAI RMAN: Very good. MR. KELLY: Where it's a Tribunal of Inquiry. But 20 12:26 there's no point in going there. 21 22 CHAI RMAN: Thank you. 23 Chairman, I understood that in fact what MR. MURPHY: 24 was left was 20 and 21. So I agree with Mr. Kelly. 25 CHAI RMAN: Very good. So the remaining ones are 20 and 12:27 26 21. 27 MR. MURPHY: Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Very good.

WI TNESS:

28

29

Judge, can I just ask, I know what 20 is,

1	what's 21?	
2	CHAIRMAN: 21 is, was the disclosures order	
3	deliberately withheld from you? Sorry:	
4		
5	"Complaints by Garda Nicholas Keogh that the disclosure 12:27	7
6	Tribunal order was deliberately withheld from him."	
7		
8	WITNESS: I thought we dealt with that.	
9	MR. McGUINNESS: we did.	
10	CHAIRMAN: Did Mr. Murphy deal with that? 12:27	7
11	MR. McGUINNESS: No, Mr. Murphy hasn't dealt with that.	
12	The Tribunal did deal with that and we took some short	
13	evidence on it.	
14	CHAIRMAN: Absolutely, you dealt with that.	
15	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	7
16	CHAIRMAN: 21 is still there. Are we clear? So,	
17	Mr. Murphy, you think it would be a good idea to take a	
18	break at this point and come back at two o'clock.	
19	MR. MURPHY: It will be lengthy, Chairman, so I do	
20	think that it would be one which will go for a number 12:28	3
21	of years.	
22	CHAIRMAN: In fairness, I should say, my attitude is to	
23	be a bit conscious that Garda Keogh has been sitting	
24	here now, this is his third week, so I am quite	
25	conscious as well. He has a lot of material to deal 12:28	3
26	with. So I am quite happy to deal with that.	
27	MR. MURPHY: Chairman, can I raise one matter, I	
28	probably should put a document to the witness, it's	
29	just in relation to the recommendation that I	

Т			mentioned.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Yes. So we are going back for a moment	
3			before we break to Assistant Commissioner McMahon.	
4			MR. MURPHY: Yes. Volume 42, please, at page 11894.	
5			CHAIRMAN: 11894.	12:28
6			MR. MURPHY: please.	
7	182	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. It's just in relation to the issue	
8			that we just dealt with a few moments ago. Can I just	
9			point you to paragraph 5.47 please? 5.47 relates to,	
10			as we've seen, Chairman, at 11879, an allegation that	12:29
11			Garda A frustrated the investigation of a public order	
12				
13			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
14			MR. MURPHY: In terms of paragraph 5.7:	
15				12:29
16			"Even in the absence of a witness statement of Ms. B,	
17			on the balance of the probabilities based on the	
18			evidence gleaned from this investigation, I am of the	
19			opinion that there is substance to this allegation	
20			resulting in a potential serious breach of the Garda	12:30
21			Síochána (Discipline) Regulations and that a board of	
22			inquiry is established under section 25 to further	
23			examine the matter."	
24				
25			Sp, there is nothing in that recommendation that	12:30
26			targets you and I understand, in fact, it's something	
27			that you don't disagree with?	
28		Α.	I can't disagree with that. I mean, what else could be	
29			said?	

Т	183 Q.	inal s precisely my point; that there is nothing in the	
2		allegation made against Assistant Commissioner McMahon	
3		at all. Thank you.	
4	Α.	I think we disputed some of the other stuff.	
5		CHAIRMAN: Don't worry. Don't worry. I do understand.	12:30
6		All right. So, two o'clock?	
7		MR. MURPHY: Or 1:30, Chairman, if that suits you.	
8		CHAIRMAN: Oh! Certainly, if you like. Well,	
9		Mr. McGuinness, what do you suggest? We will	
10		compromise, 1:45. We will leave our existing	12:30
11		arrangements, 1:45. That will allow us to give a break	
12		in the middle of the afternoon.	
13		MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.	
14		CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
15			12:31
16		THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED, AS	
17		FOLLOWS:	
18			
19		CHAIRMAN: Now. Thanks very much. Just sit down there	
20		for a moment. Just before we begin this afternoon, I	13:49
21		want to say something but I want to be as careful as I	
22		can in what I say. I don't want to give the impression	
23		of being over critical. But, I am uneasy about	
24		correspondence that we are receiving in the Tribunal	
25		from Mr. Cullen. I am uneasy about it and I simply	13:49
26		want to express unease. I don't want to be critical,	
27		but let me just say from the outset, my understanding	
28		is that I am entrusted to carry out an inquiry. Who is	
29		carrying out the inquiry? I am. Assisted by a very	

able team, to whom I am very grateful. It is not an action inter partes. There is nothing to stop, and I think this was made clear in the procedures document and at an our preliminary hearing, there is nothing to stop any party from writing to us to suggest an appropriate witness, be it expert or otherwise. It is arguably, arguably — it is certainly inappropriate, it seems to me, that the Tribunal should be sent documents without any covering letter, not even the courtesy of a covering letter, simply, not even a "herewith copies of data and it in."

Number two, it seems to me to be inappropriate, certainly without any notice, for one party to engage a person as an expert without any reference to the Tribunal. It is inappropriate and arguably, it seems to me, improper, arguably, for a party to take a large bundle of materials, including witness statements, and send them to a person outside the jurisdiction, for that person to peruse and comment on.

13:51

13:51

So, I say these things are arguably, because I don't want to be in a situation that would be -- I am very reluctant to say this, especially when Garda Keogh is being cross-examined at this moment. But I have to put 13:52 a stop to this volume of material with which the Tribunal is being, in my view, inundated, and without any permission being sought.

T	now, I am not one for getting over fussy, but a fine	
2	has to be drawn and I am now drawing a line. As I say,	
3	there is nothing to stop anybody from applying for any	
4	particular facility or for any particular person or	
5	thing. I think that was made clear at the procedures	13:52
6	hearing that we had on the 11th April. Certainly this	
7	mode of proceeding is, in my view, not acceptable,	
8	certainly it's not acceptable in this fashion. And so,	
9	I am saying no more.	
10		13:53
11	Applications in writing, please, mentioning to counsel,	
12	if necessary, the matters can be circulated to other	
13	counsel and parties can have a comment on it, insofar	
14	as that may be relevant. All present, please note,	
15	particularly Mr. Cullen	13:53
16	MR. KELLY: Chairman, thank you very much for that.	
17	Would you mind rising? Might I see the correspondence	
18	in order that I can familiarise I am in the dark at	
19	the moment.	
20	CHAIRMAN: Certainly.	13:53
21	MR. KELLY: If you would be kind enough to rise and let	
22	me see it.	
23	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kelly, I will tell you what I think I	
24	will do, I will give you the material and at four	
25	o'clock, if you like, if you choose to mention it,	13:54
26	having had a little break in the middle, well and good.	
27	But you will understand, I don't want to be over	
28	critical. I don't want to get myself into a situation,	
29	and particularly I am conscious that Garda Keogh is	

here being cross-examined, but at the same time, it's bad enough to get stuff on the 1st, but there was nothing to reply to in that, we didn't even have the courtesy of a covering note, then to get the material on the 5th, today, and then to discover, I think it's 64 pages of material that went out.

So, if you want an opportunity to have a look at it, Mr. Kelly, be my guest. I will rise. I will rise, and I'll tell you, I will give you 15 minutes, but please bear in mind, the last thing I want to do is to be getting into a big battle over something, do you understand. My whole instinct is to avoid controversy, believe it, even sometimes where I shouldn't be avoiding controversy. Anyway, thank you very much.

THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS:

MR. KELLY: Chairman, thank you very much for the opportunity to look at that material and for sight of it. Unfortunately, I find myself not in a position to proceed further today, this matter having arisen. We need the opportunity to consider the position generally and our own position as counsel. With reluctance, for that reason I ask you not to sit for the rest of the day.

CHAIRMAN: Well, the best thing I can do is to say nothing at all. So, I will accede to that request.

T	Counsel will no doubt communicate with each other, I	
2	understand. So we will adjourn until tomorrow in those	
3	circumstances. Very good.	
4		
5	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL WEDNESDAY, 6TH	14:4
6	NOVEMBER 2019 AT 10: 30AM	
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

		T		
•	2	3	43:27, 43:29	44:7
			5033 [1] - 43:23	
'18 [1] - 58:14	2 [4] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:6,	3 [2] - 3:3, 54:28	51 [1] - 2:18	A
16 [1] - 30.14	2 [4] - 2.32, 3.3, 4.0, 54:26	3/12/2017 [1] - 33:5	55 [1] - 43:28	
1	20 [9] - 3:12, 52:4,	30 [1] - 3:17	5521 [2] - 44:20,	A [1] - 54:17
	57:23, 59:12, 68:15,	31 [1] - 3:18	44:21	able [2] - 26:11, 78:1
	73:15, 74:24, 74:25,	31/5/2014 [1] - 17:23	5559 [1] - 68:17	above-named [1] -
1 [2] - 3:2, 54:25	74:29	32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18	5560 [3] - 44:24, 44:25, 44:27	1:26
10 [1] - 3:7	2007 [1] - 52:11	33 [1] - 3:19		absence [1] - 76:16
100 [1] - 29:25	2014 [13] - 1:3, 6:20,	34 [1] - 3:19	5994 [3] - 57:22, 57:23, 57:24	absolutely [5] -
104 [2] - 50:5, 64:15	6:26, 7:12, 7:29, 9:4,	35 [1] - 3:20	5999 [3] - 68:14,	31:29, 65:2, 70:16,
107 [2] - 51:13, 64:14	9:19, 10:21, 21:2,	36 [1] - 3:20	68:23, 69:3	71:1, 75:14
108 [1] - 51:23	38:15, 47:19, 72:29	37 [1] - 3:21	5TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1	AC [1] - 58:20
10:30AM [1] - 81:6	2015 [2] - 64:27	38 [1] - 3:21	5th [2] - 6:20, 80:5	accede [1] - 80:29
10th [1] - 42:19	2016 [2] - 47:16,	39 [1] - 3:22	0.20, 00.0	accept [6] - 40:1,
11 [1] - 3:7	47:27		6	40:4, 46:20, 62:7,
11-13 [1] - 3:32	2017 [14] - 1:5, 1:9,	4	•	65:24, 74:17
110 [1] - 1:18	32:3, 32:14, 32:27,	•	-	acceptable [3] -
1161 [2] - 16:26,	35:3, 35:7, 36:16,		6 [5] - 3:5, 5:5, 6:19,	26:21, 79:7, 79:8
17:18	44:2, 52:6, 57:25,	4 [8] - 2:19, 3:4,	20:26, 50:27	acceptance [1] -
11879 [1] - 76:10	62:9, 65:8, 69:24	12:16, 12:21, 19:21,	6005 [3] - 52:5,	21:11
11894 [2] - 76:4, 76:5	2018 [18] - 1:9,	20:6, 54:29	53:24, 55:26	accepted [5] - 18:18,
11:45 [1] - 49:20	39:11, 40:11, 40:29,	41 [2] - 74:2, 74:10	6006 [1] - 56:14	26:5, 46:15, 46:19,
11th [1] - 79:6	41:21, 42:18, 43:10,	4128 [3] - 32:3, 32:7,	64 [1] - 80:6	63:10
12 [2] - 3:8, 4:5	44:7, 44:12, 44:24,	32:8	6th [9] - 41:21,	accepting [1] - 70:23
12-month [1] - 46:18	46:28, 58:2, 58:13,	42 [1] - 76:4 4219 [1] - 32:25	43:12, 43:13, 58:2,	accepts [2] - 21:6, 26:6
12th [2] - 52:6, 65:7	58:16, 60:2, 62:28, 64:28, 66:22	4217 [1] - 32.25 4227 [2] - 33:25,	58:13, 58:14, 58:15, 59:4, 60:2	according [1] - 18:29
13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 13:08 [1] - 58:23	2019 [11] - 1:18, 6:2,	33:26	6TH [1] - 81:5	account [1] - 60:13
13:06 [1] - 38:23 13th [2] - 40:29,	38:3, 69:12, 69:26,	4233 [2] - 33:4	01H[i] - 01.3	accurate [2] - 26:17,
42:18	70:2, 70:12, 70:14,	4241 [1] - 33:21	7	30:16
14 [2] - 3:9, 31:22	70:21, 71:25, 81:6	4282 [1] - 33:28	′	accurately [1] -
1477 [3] - 6:19, 6:24,	20th [1] - 44:24	4283 [3] - 34:5,		16:16
15:2	21 [7] - 3:12, 73:21,	34:23, 34:24	7 [5] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5,	accusation [1] - 68:9
1478 [3] - 7:21,	74:24, 74:26, 75:1,	4292 [1] - 34:29	50:23, 58:22	accusing [1] - 21:10
20:26, 20:27	75:2, 75:16	4300 [1] - 36:6	7480 [5] - 11:29,	achieved [1] - 33:23
15 [6] - 3:9, 36:11,	21st [1] - 36:16	4324 [2] - 36:11,	12:15, 19:14, 19:22,	acknowledging [1] -
38:3, 38:8, 38:9,	22 [4] - 3:13, 73:21,	36:14	21:28	39:25
80:10	73:23, 73:27	4325 [1] - 36:26	75 [1] - 29:25	ACT[2] - 1:3, 1:8
15th [3] - 32:3,	23 [4] - 3:13, 50:16,	4467 [2] - 37:22,	7:43am [1] - 58:23	acted [5] - 25:28,
32:14, 35:3	52:10, 52:23	37:29	7th [4] - 7:28, 35:11,	26:1, 30:25, 45:2,
16 [3] - 1:5, 3:10,	24 [1] - 3:14	4650 [5] - 38:2, 38:3,	58:22, 59:5	67:22
40:7	25 [4] - 3:14, 12:16,	38:7, 38:8, 38:12	0	ACTING [2] - 3:7,
17 [3] - 1:9, 3:10,	21:29, 76:22	4672 [2] - 40:7, 40:13	8	3:13
43:22	26 [1] - 3:15	4675 [1] - 40:17		acting [1] - 9:8
17th [1] - 39:10	27 [1] - 3:15	4903 [1] - 40:29	8 [3] - 3:6, 3:28,	action [2] - 1:27,
18 [3] - 3:11, 6:10,	27/2/19 [1] - 71:24	4996 [1] - 41:20	50:23	78:2
44:20	27/2/2019 [1] - 70:18	4997 [1] - 41:18	8th [5] - 69:12,	actions [1] - 23:24
19 [3] - 3:11, 49:5,	27th [5] - 6:26, 7:12,	4998 [3] - 42:8, 42:9,	69:26, 70:21, 71:25,	actively [1] - 63:4
49:27	70:2, 70:12, 70:13	42:13	72:29	addition [1] - 7:17
1921 [1] - 1:9	28 [3] - 3:16, 51:14,	-		additional [2] -
19th [2] - 7:13, 7:15	51:18 20 (4) - 3:17	5	9	35:11, 44:4
1:30 [1] - 77:7	29 [1] - 3:17			address [2] - 42:13,
1:45 [2] - 77:10, 77:11	29th [1] - 40:10 2nd [4] - 9:4, 9:19,	5 [1] - 3:4	9 [3] - 3:6, 50:26,	49:4
1st [3] - 32:27, 35:7,	57:24, 62:9	5.47 [2] - 76:9	68:24	addressed [5] - 35:2, 36:7, 41:22, 49:26,
80:2	01.24, 02.3	5.7 [1] - 76:14	96 [2] - 50:7, 50:15	52:7
00.2		50/50 [1] - 14:18	98 [1] - 50:23	adhere [1] - 34:9
		5032 [3] - 43:25,	9th [3] - 21:2, 44:2,	adjourn [1] - 81:2
		1		

ADJOURNED [4] -49:23, 77:16, 80:17, 81:5 **ADMINISTRATIVE** [1] - 3:14 admission [2] -62:29, 63:5 admitting [1] - 11:13 advanced [1] - 74:15 advancing [1] - 36:9 adverse [2] - 31:14, advice [1] - 47:21 advised [2] - 35:19, 43:1 affected [1] - 37:23 afford [1] - 41:6 afternoon [2] -77:12, 77:20 **ago** [4] - 26:5, 26:10, 26:23, 76:8 agree [25] - 12:24, 14:17, 27:21, 29:8, 29:20, 30:4, 33:12, 37:7, 54:13, 55:2, 55:7, 56:2, 56:5, 57:16, 61:14, 62:24, 63:28, 64:6, 64:16, 64:19, 71:14, 71:15, 72:5, 72:20, 74:24 agreed [2] - 20:5, 50:21 agreeing [2] - 70:23, 70:24 agrees [1] - 62:14 AGSI [1] - 4:1 Aidan [3] - 7:28, 29:28, 30:10 AIDAN [2] - 3:9, 4:3 **AISLING** [2] - 2:11, **ALAN**[2] - 3:9, 3:13 alert [1] - 20:9 alerting [1] - 60:22 **ALISON** [1] - 3:26 allegation [17] -6:16, 7:27, 7:29, 10:13, 12:6, 14:4, 14:10, 14:16, 15:28, 23:5, 25:23, 25:24, 30:2, 67:16, 76:10, 76:19, 77:2 allegation...certify [1] - 16:8 allegations [7] -13:6, 19:15, 22:9, 40:20, 52:12, 66:11, alleged [9] - 8:16, 8:23, 11:24, 12:17,

21:19, 68:27, 69:7, 71:3, 71:8 alleging [2] - 18:8, 35:13 allocated [1] - 33:11 allow [1] - 77:11 allowed [1] - 8:2 alluded [1] - 41:9 alone [1] - 14:29 alternative [1] -54:26 **AMENDED**[1] - 1:9 America [1] - 13:18 amounted [1] - 24:18 amounts [1] - 25:8 AN [1] - 3:2 analysing [1] - 67:9 analysis [1] - 71:12 AND [7] - 1:3, 1:4, 1:8, 3:15, 49:23, 77:16, 80:17 ANDREW [2] - 2:22, Anne [6] - 49:6, 49:29, 52:7, 53:6, 65:6, 70:5 **ANNE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 answer [8] - 17:7, 17:15. 18:8. 19:9. 65:11, 65:12, 65:28, 67:5 answered [1] - 11:16 answers [1] - 31:6 **ANTHONY** [1] - 3:6 anyway [3] - 16:17, 17:10, 80:15 apart [2] - 7:13, 67:13 apologise [2] -60:17. 60:18 **APPEAL**[2] - 1:13, appeal [1] - 47:25 appear [6] - 26:29, 36:23, 36:27, 37:11, 46:4, 60:21

APPEARANCES[1] -

appeared [1] - 11:23

appendices [2] -

appendicised [1] -

applications [1] -

applying [2] - 24:2,

appoint [2] - 53:21,

appointed [10] -

36:22, 36:24

2:1

79.11

57:27

52:10, 53:2, 53:15, 53:26, 54:4, 61:21, 61:22, 65:7, 65:17, 69.23 appointing [2] -32:18, 39:15 Appointment [1] -52:22 appointment [5] -32:5, 32:17, 32:23, 46:17, 54:15 appreciate [4] - 27:7, 43:11, 43:15, 56:25 approach [7] - 11:27, 12:2, 21:26, 31:10, 55:2, 56:18, 57:11 approached [4] -15:3, 17:23, 21:28, 46:14 approaches [1] -23:3 approaching [1] -71:27 appropriate [3] -63:27, 73:14, 78:6 April [4] - 62:28, 66:22, 69:23, 79:6 archives [1] - 35:1 area [1] - 49:10 areas [1] - 45:4 arguably [5] - 78:7, 78:16, 78:17, 78:22 argue [3] - 50:18, 66:3, 71:22 argument [2] -56:28, 62:27 arisen [1] - 80:23 arms [3] - 11:21, 16:2, 27:5 ARRAN[1] - 2:24 arrangement [1] arrangements [1] -77:11 **array** [1] - 35:9 arrest [6] - 50:18, 51:3, 56:22, 61:18, 62:22. 63:9 arrests [4] - 50:25, 51:21, 66:12, 66:19 **AS** [6] - 1:9, 6:1, 6:6, 49:23, 77:16, 80:17 ascribe [1] - 69:19 aside [1] - 47:11 aspects [1] - 31:25 assaulted [1] - 19:16 assertion [2] - 20:29, 68:20 assessment [2] -

52:2 74.1 38:4 28:22, 28:25, 29:21, 30:5, 31:1, 31:11, 32:4, 32:5, 32:15, 32:29, 33:17, 34:2, 34:19, 35:4, 35:19, 36:15, 38:24, 39:17, 41:1, 41:23, 42:5, 42:16, 42:17, 43:16, 44:3, 44:8, 44:12, 44:23, 44:28, 45:11, 46:12, 48:20, 49:6, 49:28, 50:24, 52:7, 52:17, 53:1, 53:3, 53:5, 53:18, 53:24, 56:16, 61:12, 61:20, 61:24, 61:25, 61:26, 62:21, 63:8, 65:6, 65:26, 65:29, 67:3, 67:16, 68:10, 68:13, 69:25, 70:5, 70:17, 71:4, 72:1, 73:2, 76:3, 77:2 assisted [1] - 77:29 AT [1] - 81:6 **ATHLONE** [1] - 3:32 Athlone [4] - 8:5, 8:7, 26:19, 38:10 attach [1] - 7:10 attached [4] - 41:4, 52:12, 52:17, 52:18 attacks [1] - 64:8 attempt [3] - 12:9, 60:7, 73:4 attention [6] - 52:29, 53:16, 68:16, 69:10, 69:19, 70:1 attitude [1] - 75:22 attributed [1] - 14:27 August [3] - 6:20, 42:19, 42:24

assist [5] - 15:21, author [3] - 11:2, 16:26, 31:23, 32:1, 28:26, 30:11 Authority [2] - 44:14, assistance [4] -45:27 19:1, 19:28, 33:6. available [4] - 12:26, 41:9, 63:19 ASSISTANT[6] avoid [2] - 37:16, 2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 80:13 3.18 3.20 avoidance [1] assistant [5] - 19:14, 34.14 30:21, 37:6, 37:23, avoiding [1] - 80:15 aware [16] - 9:3, **Assistant** [88] - 6:12, 16:7, 40:26, 46:7, 6:15, 7:1, 9:7, 9:17, 55:15, 57:25, 62:12, 10:8, 10:28, 11:9, 63:11, 63:13, 65:21, 11:26, 12:12, 12:19, 66:8, 69:24, 69:25, 12:26, 13:8, 19:21, 70:20, 71:7, 71:26 20:6, 21:25, 22:3, 23:3, 25:3, 25:26, В 27:14, 27:17, 28:8,

B's [1] - 66:21 backwards [1] -33:26 **bad** [1] - 80:2 balance [1] - 76:17 bald [2] - 14:6, 18:1 **BAR** [1] - 2:31 bar [1] - 53:11 Barrett [1] - 32:14 barrister [1] - 59:13 based [3] - 25:12, 73:11, 76:17 **BASTION**[1] - 3:31 Bastion [1] - 17:24 **battle** [1] - 80:12 **BE** [1] - 6:5 bear [2] - 69:26, 80:11 beat [2] - 7:14, 7:16 became [1] - 16:7 becomes [2] - 69:24, 69:25 beg [2] - 20:26, 41:19 begin [1] - 77:20 beginning [2] - 6:24, 42:11 behalf [9] - 9:9, 34:6, 37:6, 43:8, 46:12, 48:20, 52:17, 53:24, 66:10 behaved [1] - 40:21 behaviour [4] - 22:9, 23:27, 24:16, 25:6 behind [1] - 27:2 best [2] - 48:22, 80.28 Between [1] - 60:3

between [12] - 9:7,

25:12, 44:19

27:3, 33:17, 41:13, 44:16, 48:17, 56:26, 59:9, 63:11, 69:7, 70:20, 71:8 big [1] - 80:12 bit [4] - 33:11, 47:6, 48:12, 75:23 **BL** [12] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 3:30. 4:4 blanked [3] - 55:24, 57:21 **block** [1] - 56:8 board [2] - 72:17, body [1] - 68:26 book [1] - 21:29 bookies [1] - 18:4 bottom [6] - 38:12, 38:17, 51:1, 52:21, 56:14 **box** [2] - 55:4, 56:13 breach [2] - 54:21, 76:20 **breaches** [1] - 43:2 break [7] - 49:18, 49:19, 73:15, 75:18, 76:3, 77:11, 79:26 **BRIAN** [2] - 3:15, 3:16 brief [2] - 49:10, 49:12 BRIEFLY [2] - 49:23, 80:17 **briefly** [4] - 21:28, 31:24, 37:21, 45:8 bring [7] - 18:9, 19:10, 20:25, 26:12, 52:28, 53:4, 53:16 brought [2] - 50:6, 69:18 Brown [1] - 33:2 **Bruir** [6] - 11:22, 20:13, 20:14, 20:17, 20:19, 26:29 **bullied** [1] - 31:3 **bully** [1] - 26:3 bullying [12] - 6:11, 24:18, 25:8, 26:2, 26:22, 27:29, 30:22, 45:20, 46:23, 47:17, 47:18, 47:20 bundle [1] - 78:18 **BY** [12] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 3:30, 4:5, 5:5,

C

CAGNEY [1] - 3:17

capable [1] - 23:28

capacity [1] - 70:6

careful [3] - 55:19,

care [1] - 7:1

77:21

caring [1] - 40:22 **CARR** [1] - 3:15 **CARRICK** [1] - 2:13 CARRICK-ON-**SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 carried [7] - 6:12, 49:6, 49:28, 57:12, 61:16, 64:2, 72:11 **CARROLL** [1] - 2:16 carry [2] - 50:25, 77:28 carrying [4] - 10:28, 13:9, 31:13, 77:29 CARTHAGE[1] -2:17 case [10] - 10:12, 15:27, 20:8, 38:4, 46:2, 48:11, 66:12, 68:2, 70:2, 70:4 casino [1] - 18:4 CASTLE [1] - 1:17 castle [1] - 18:4 centre [1] - 56:8 CEO [1] - 65:20 certain [1] - 48:4 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 certainly [7] - 39:4, 77:8, 78:7, 78:14, 79:6, 79:8, 79:20 certify [1] - 1:24 chain [1] - 64:6 Chairman [33] - 6:8, 15:2, 15:8, 15:10, 20:23, 31:22, 31:24, 38:19, 42:8, 48:26, 48:29, 49:4, 49:21, 49:26, 50:13, 50:27, 51:20, 52:2, 55:23, 61:5, 67:5, 73:7, 73:13, 73:26, 74:23, 75:19, 75:27, 76:10, 77:7, 77:13, 79:16, 80:20 chairman [2] - 17:15, 48:19 CHAIRMAN[133] -1:12, 6:8, 12:1, 13:16, 13:24, 14:1, 15:7, 15:9, 15:11, 15:14, 15:16, 15:27, 16:2, 16:13, 16:21, 16:23,

16:28, 17:10, 17:18, 17:26, 18:26, 19:3, 19:8, 19:18, 19:20, 20:2, 20:15, 20:17, 20:21, 20:24, 26:27, 27:7, 27:21, 27:26, 27:28, 28:6, 28:11, 28:17, 28:20, 28:28, 29:3, 29:5, 29:15, 29:19, 31:27, 31:29, 38:15, 38:18, 38:21, 38:29, 39:4, 39:9, 39:12, 39:27, 40:2, 40:5, 41:23, 41:26, 42:6, 42:9, 43:9, 43:12, 43:14, 44:11, 47:5, 48:1, 48:4, 48:9, 48:14, 48:17, 48:28, 49:2, 49:9, 49:13, 49:16, 49:18, 51:1, 55:18, 58:11, 58:14, 59:8, 59:11, 59:20, 59:25, 59:28, 60:2, 60:9, 60:17, 60:26, 61:7. 61:11. 61:29. 62:14, 62:17, 65:12, 69:1, 69:4, 69:14, 70:16, 70:19, 70:22, 70:28, 71:1, 71:15, 71:23, 72:5, 73:9, 73:18, 73:27, 74:3, 74:5, 74:12, 74:16, 74:19, 74:22, 74:25, 74:28, 75:2, 75:10, 75:14, 75:16, 75:22, 76:2, 76:5, 76:7, 76:13, 77:5, 77:8, 77:14, 77:19, 79:20, 79:23, 80:28 Chairman's [1] -6:18 challenge [2] -46.16 46.17 chance [2] - 65:12, changed [1] - 47:19 **changer** [2] - 63:3, 63:15 changes [1] - 29:17 Charleton [1] - 37:25 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:5 CHEALLACHÁIN[1] - 2:30 check [3] - 23:17, 23:20, 26:5 checked [1] - 26:10 **checking** [1] - 26:4 Chief [24] - 8:9, 22:12, 23:24, 24:16, 25:7, 25:29, 26:20,

27:10, 30:24, 30:27, 33:1, 33:18, 35:2, 36:7, 38:5, 39:7, 40:10, 40:18, 42:2, 42:3, 45:1, 45:2, 46:27, 69:11 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11. 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [4] - 28:2, 38:9, 50:4, 55:10 CHIS [2] - 6:27, 6:29 **choose** [1] - 79:25 chose [1] - 11:14 circulated [1] - 79:12 circumstances [2] -18:22, 81:3 Clare [1] - 65:21 clarification [2] -35:12, 42:19 clarifies [1] - 19:7 clarify [3] - 15:4, 18:23, 41:10 **clean** [1] - 29:28 clear [7] - 15:1, 37:12, 50:11, 71:1, 75:16, 78:3, 79:5 clearance [2] -44:13, 45:26 cleared [1] - 46:3 clearly [1] - 64:10 client [4] - 34:8, 37:25, 41:6, 41:10 **CO** [2] - 2:13, 4:1 coal [1] - 67:28 coin [1] - 67:19 collated [1] - 45:13 colleagues [1] -73:23 column [4] - 33:8, 33:10, 33:14, 33:16 coming [3] - 47:12, 69:27, 73:15 command [1] - 64:6 comment [6] - 22:15,

comments [3] - 9:25, 27:12, 60:11

Commissioner [89] - 6:12, 6:16, 7:1, 9:7, 9:17, 10:8, 10:29, 11:9, 11:27, 12:12, 12:19, 12:27, 13:9, 19:21, 20:7, 21:25, 22:3, 23:3, 25:3, 25:27, 27:14, 27:18, 28:8, 28:22, 28:25, 29:21, 30:5, 31:1,

41:7, 42:20, 48:25,

78:20, 79:13

31:11, 32:4, 32:6, 32:16, 33:1, 33:17, 34:2, 34:19, 35:4, 35:19, 36:16, 38:24, 39:17, 41:1, 41:23, 42:5, 42:16, 42:17, 43:16, 44:3, 44:8, 44:12, 44:23, 44:29, 45:11, 45:25, 46:12, 48:21, 49:6, 49:28, 50:24, 52:6, 52:7, 52:17, 53:1, 53:3, 53:6, 53:24, 56:16, 61:12, 61:20, 61:24, 61:25, 61:26, 62:22, 63:8, 65:6, 65:26, 65:29, 67:3, 67:16, 68:10, 68:13, 69:25, 70:5, 70:17, 71:4, 72:1, 73:3, 76:3, 77:2 commissioner [6] -30:21, 37:7, 37:23, 38:5, 41:22, 65:25 **COMMISSIONER** [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 commissioner's [1] -19:14 common [1] - 12:7 communicate [1] communicated [2] -45:12, 45:13 communicating [2] -36:1, 44:8 communication [4] -9:11, 34:18, 34:27, 44:16 communications [2] - 36:8, 41:14 **COMPANY**[1] - 2:22 complain [1] - 28:20

complaint [37] -

6:10, 8:4, 8:17, 8:20,

8:26, 11:20, 12:10,

14:13, 15:4, 15:13,

15:23, 15:26, 16:14,

12:17, 14:3, 14:8,

16:25, 17:2, 18:6,

18:15, 18:24, 19:6,

20:28, 24:15, 25:5,

27:14, 27:17, 28:7,

28:9, 30:26, 34:12,

Complaints [1] -

complaints [7] -

6:15, 6:22, 14:4,

56:20, 66:6

75:5

35:14, 35:15, 47:17,

16:29, 34:3, 73:16 21:6, 45:19, 61:5 counsel [5] - 15:14, date [15] - 7:18, 21:3, **Deputy** [1] - 52:5 complete [4] - 14:9, conspiracy [1] -79:11, 79:13, 80:25, 21:9, 39:9, 39:10, dereliction [1] -35:20, 35:24, 39:19 56:29 81:1 43:9, 43:10, 43:23, 23:10 constituted [2] -44:7, 58:12, 58:13, completely [1] **course** [12] - 9:6, **desk** [1] - 36:24 25:25 49.7 49.29 9:24, 9:27, 10:10, 62:2, 70:10, 70:11, **DESMOND** [1] - 4:3 complex [1] - 72:2 consultation [1] -15:18, 41:5, 46:18, 70:15 detail [5] - 33:29, 58:11, 60:11, 61:8, dated [10] - 6:20, complicated [2] -47:20 34:12, 36:19, 37:26, 27:8, 53:14 contact [7] - 21:1, 62:27, 67:15 6:26, 7:11, 7:28, 9:19, 45:16 **COURT** [3] - 1:13, 40:10, 41:21, 42:18, complicity [1] -32:20, 35:27, 58:8, details [3] - 32:20, 2:3, 3:31 44:24, 52:6 19:26 59:5, 61:4, 61:6 52:27. 54:19 contacted [2] courtesy [2] - 78:9, dates [4] - 38:18, **DETECTIVE** [5] - 3:4, comprehensive [1] -29:21. 61:3 80:4 45:23, 45:24, 66:23 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17 $\textbf{DAVID}\, {\tiny [2]} \textbf{-} 2{:}28,$ contacts [1] - 27:3 covered [2] - 21:3, compromise [1] -**Detective** [10] - 13:4, 77:10 contained [5] - 11:4, 73:23 3.18 57:26, 57:28, 58:2, **DAVIS**[1] - 2:8 concern [1] - 32:11 19:13, 22:8, 22:16, **covering** [3] - 78:9, 60:3, 62:8, 64:25, 56:13 78:10, 80:4 **DAY**[1] - 1:18 concerned [6] - 8:11, 66:25 67:26 create [1] - 35:22 days [2] - 37:4, 59:2 DEVELOPMENT [1] 31:2, 56:16, 57:18, **containing** [1] - 9:22 62:11, 62:20 created" [1] - 6:23 de [6] - 11:22, 20:13, content [1] - 8:13 20:14, 20:17, 20:18, concerning [3] contention [1] - 17:1 crime [1] - 11:24 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 26:29 6:25, 7:6, 69:29 contested [5] - 10:5, criminal [5] - 56:4, diary [4] - 58:9, 56:24, 63:12, 63:18, deal [8] - 10:19, conclude [2] - 39:22, 10:6, 10:13, 10:15, 58:10, 58:15, 61:2 41.8 64:11 63:20 31:17, 31:20, 31:24, difference [1] - 56:26 concluded [2] critical [3] - 77:23, 75:10, 75:12, 75:25, context [2] - 24:15, different [5] - 16:11, 75:26 44:29, 46:6 25:5 77:26, 79:28 27:3, 33:20, 40:16, dealing [3] - 54:9, criticising [1] - 11:9 conclusion [7] **continue** [2] - 6:9, 63:15 56:23, 56:28 25:12, 30:28, 44:28, 39.21 criticisms [1] - 72:9 digest [1] - 36:1 45:15, 48:19, 72:23 CONTINUED [1] cropped [3] - 37:10, deals [3] - 12:27, **DIGNAM**[1] - 3:24 conduct [1] - 67:11 57:4, 57:6 12:28, 32:10 dignity [1] - 23:29 dealt [12] - 6:16, conducted [1] - 72:3 contrary [2] - 19:27, crops [1] - 63:17 diligently [1] - 64:3 6:28, 11:10, 22:2, conducting [7] -72:22 **CROSS** [2] - 5:5, 6:5 directed [1] - 22:13 25:19, 32:26, 32:28, 46:3, 62:3, 63:9, controversy [3] cross [2] - 78:25, director [1] - 32:15 65:15, 66:4, 66:8, 32:21, 80:13, 80:15 40:16, 75:8, 75:11, 80:1 **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 75:14, 76:8 69:21 convenient [1] -**CROSS-EXAMINED** DIRECTORATE[1] -**Dear** [1] - 42:16 confidential [2] -50:12 121 - 5:5. 6:5 3:15 December [6] -8:17. 8:20 conversation [13] cross-examined [2] disagree [3] - 31:9, 32:27, 35:3, 35:7, confirm [3] - 13:26, 6:23, 7:10, 7:22, 7:25, - 78:25, 80:1 76:27, 76:28 35:11, 36:16, 44:24 34:13, 55:28 14:25, 14:26, 17:27, **CUALÁIN** [1] - 3:7 disciplinary [14] -21:2, 21:7, 30:17, **DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 confirm...electronic Cualáin [2] - 7:1, 49:5, 49:27, 53:11, decide [1] - 13:17 58:28, 59:3, 59:26 [1] - 37:1 54:22, 55:7, 56:24. deciding [2] - 30:21, confirmed [2] convicted [2] - 57:2 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 57:6, 57:8, 62:23, copies [1] - 78:10 18:13, 35:12 Cullen [10] - 9:8, 63:10, 63:17, 63:25, conflict [1] - 48:12 Coppinger [2] decision [1] - 62:26 9:20, 33:2, 34:6, 64:4, 64:26 CONLON [1] - 2:17 66:26, 67:26 36:15, 41:1, 41:25, Declan [1] - 57:29 Discipline [2] -CONNAUGHT[1] -COPPINGER [1] -44:6, 77:25, 79:15 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:5 52:11, 76:21 declined [3] - 18:24, 3:32 3:4 curious [1] - 59:23 discipline [6] -22:20. 37:19 CONNELLAN[2] copy [1] - 41:4 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 54:21, 55:29, 56:19, defence [1] - 40:25 3:30, 3:30 corporate [1] - 26:2 **Curley** [1] - 13:5 64:25, 69:9, 69:21 **CURRAN** [1] - 3:3 **CONOR** [1] - 3:24 definitions [1] correct [14] - 8:21, **disclosing** [1] - 8:3 27:16 conscious [3] -9:23, 10:24, 14:24, **disclosure** [1] - 75:5 Curran [13] - 22:13, 75:23, 75:25, 79:29 17:14, 22:23, 41:16, delayed [1] - 68:21 DISCLOSURES [2] -23:24, 24:17, 25:7, consent [2] - 39:21, 45:24, 46:1, 63:27, 25:29, 26:20, 30:24, deliberately [4] -1:2, 1:3 64:28, 66:2, 71:10 66:1, 67:4, 75:3, 75:6 57:27 30:27, 35:3, 38:6, disclosures [2] correctness [1] -39:7, 42:3, 45:1 delighted [1] - 72:26 62:1, 75:2 consequences [1] discover[1] - 80:5 71:18 demands [1] - 45:4 correspondence [8] demonstrate [4] consider [1] - 80:24 D discredit [4] - 48:23, 15:17, 31:11, 45:10, **-** 6:25, 7:11, 9:10, considerable [1] -65:10, 66:2, 73:4 9:11, 21:3, 41:2. 65:29 9.7 discrediting [8] -**Daly** [1] - 65:21 77:24, 79:17 denying [1] - 60:2 27:15, 49:7, 49:29, considering [1] damage [1] - 48:23 COSTELLO[1] -72.2 department [1] -50:25, 51:4, 51:5, dark [1] - 79:18 2:22 consistent [4] - 21:1, 73:25 51:8, 72:22

discredits [1] - 64:7 Drew [1] - 65:25 36:3, 37:6, 78:14 examination [2] fair [10] - 34:9, 34:10, discussing [1] - 22:2 drinking [1] - 18:3 engagement [1] -26:24, 50:4 34:18, 34:27, 40:5, **Drugs** [1] - 55:12 37:27 examination-in-47:5, 48:12, 51:8, dismissal [3] -54:25, 54:27, 56:9 drumming [4] - 14:4, **engaging** [1] - 36:15 **chief** [1] - 50:4 65:23, 70:8 fairly [3] - 8:8, 26:5, disposition [1] -14:11, 15:25 enquire [1] - 23:14 examine [1] - 76:23 **DUBLIN** [6] - 1:17, enquired [1] - 56:12 33.22 **EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, 46.15 fairness [2] - 55:18, dispute [8] - 11:25, 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, enquiries [1] - 23:11 31:5, 37:15, 37:18, 75:22 enquiry [2] - 23:15, examined [2] faith [4] - 13:22, 41:13, 66:21, 68:12, due [6] - 9:27, 15:18, 25:15 78:25, 80:1 22:6, 28:15, 72:11 53:4, 53:27, 60:11, 73:5 example [5] - 34:29, entire [1] - 55:3 disputed [3] - 11:6, 61:8 35:29, 36:14, 37:22, false [11] - 11:4, entirely [4] - 15:20, 67:7, 77:4 during [3] - 41:5, 20:8, 63:26, 71:28 42.28 24:9, 24:10, 24:11, disputing [2] - 34:21, 57:5, 57:6 25:25, 26:13, 26:14, entitled [2] - 22:24, examples [1] - 40:8 28:23, 30:10, 30:13, 59:29 duties [1] - 62:23 52:22 exceeding [1] -30:14 distinction [2] duty [5] - 23:10, entries [1] - 7:7 54:29 23:14, 24:3, 31:13, falsity [2] - 27:19, 63:11 63:13 **excessive** [1] - 72:4 entrusted [1] - 77:28 28.9 district [2] - 22:7, 48:22 entry [1] - 61:2 exchanges [1] familiar [2] - 33:19, dwell [1] - 33:29 environment [1] -23:26 52.25 diversion [1] - 34:15 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 excuse [1] - 33:27 35:23 familiarise [1] -**DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 EXECUTIVE [1] -79:18 division [1] - 33:16 E episode [1] - 66:27 Fanning [3] - 32:4, divisional [2] -**EQUALITY** [1] - 1:8 executive [1] - 32:15 35:20, 39:17 22:12, 23:26 equally [2] - 24:6, existing [1] - 77:10 e-mail [2] - 41:21, **FANNING** [1] - 2:21 **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:3 66:3 expect [1] - 71:15 42:10 far [3] - 31:2, 33:21, document [21] - 9:3, equivocal [1] - 19:9 **expecting** [1] - 48:15 **EAMON**[1] - 3:10 47:16 17:16, 32:2, 32:25, expeditiously [2] especially [1] - 78:24 earliest [1] - 7:18 32:26, 33:5, 35:8, Farrell [1] - 37:26 essence [4] - 14:3, 35:24, 68:19 early [1] - 34:4 44:27, 53:23, 54:14, **FARRELL** [1] - 4:2 experience [1] -14:5, 14:9, 14:20 earth [1] - 69:19 58:6, 59:5, 59:7, 59:8, fashion [1] - 79:8 16:23 essentially [1] ease [1] - 41:18 59:14, 59:24, 64:29, 69:16 expert [2] - 78:6, **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:5, eccentric [1] - 14:19 66:16, 75:28, 78:3 establish [1] - 22:14 78:15 effect [3] - 11:3, documentation [2] -February [5] - 57:25, established [1] explore [1] - 43:17 30:26, 43:6 9:18, 69:11 62:9, 70:2, 70:12, 76:22 explored [1] - 39:2 effectively [7] - 21:5, documents [10] -70:14 exploring [1] - 27:13 ESTABLISHED[1] -23:14, 26:1, 40:25, 12:29, 27:1, 27:4, **FERGAL** [1] - 2:27 express [1] - 77:26 1.7 57:12, 64:5, 67:9 42:4, 42:22, 45:9, **FERRY** [1] - 2:16 event [2] - 16:15, expressed[1] efficiently [1] - 38:26 67:22, 68:3, 78:8 few [6] - 25:19, 26:5, 45:15 effort [2] - 35:23, **DONAL** [2] - 3:7, 33:7, 59:2, 63:2, 76:8 events [6] - 19:24, expressly [1] - 64:7 65:10 3:24 file [1] - 69:29 26:21, 53:17, 54:8, extensive [1] - 35:9 efforts [1] - 38:24 **Donal** [2] - 7:1, 65:18 final [3] - 44:22, 63:2. 67:25 **EGAN**[1] - 3:25 done [6] - 12:13, 45:6, 45:15 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 F either [5] - 21:27, 23:1, 30:13, 33:22, finalisation [1] evidence [48] - 8:10, 23:28, 48:22, 59:5, 40:3, 53:29 44:15 9:17, 11:19, 11:27, 71:21 face [2] - 31:15, doubt [3] - 59:13, finalised [1] - 47:26 13:7, 19:17, 23:16, ELIZABETH[1] -45.22 60:9.81:1 finally [2] - 31:8, 24:16, 25:6, 25:12, 2:29 facility [1] - 79:4 down [10] - 12:21, 72.8 26:1, 30:3, 44:6, **EMMA**[1] - 3:26 fact [17] - 11:12, 21:18, 27:23, 31:1, findings [6] - 12:22, 45:14, 48:24, 48:25, enclosures [1] -13:4, 13:27, 16:3, 33:20, 33:21, 37:16, 13:13, 20:14, 21:27, 50:3. 50:5. 55:20. 42:18 19:12, 46:13, 53:7, 46:18, 59:16, 77:19 28:14. 46:5 57:12, 57:24, 59:17, encouraging [1] -53:18, 53:21, 54:4, **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, Findings [2] - 13:20, 61:9, 62:21, 64:2, 14:12 54:5, 54:7, 56:7, 3:20 64:12, 65:29, 66:3, end [8] - 20:29, DR [1] - 3:11 60:23, 66:11, 74:23, 66:4, 66:7, 66:16, fine [2] - 27:4, 61:23 21:13, 26:8, 26:18, 76:26 dragged [6] - 64:14, 66:19, 66:29, 67:1, finish [1] - 13:16 facts [6] - 13:25, 30:29, 51:2, 64:27, 65:9, 66:1, 67:4, 67:3, 67:20, 67:21, **FINN** [1] - 3:5 70:7 14:2, 15:20, 20:5, 67:17, 72:27 68:8, 68:14, 68:16, **Finn** [50] - 6:13, 6:16, endeavouring[1] -20:6, 25:27 dragging [3] - 51:20, 68:17, 68:22, 69:28, 9:5, 9:8, 10:29, 11:9, 27:11 factually [1] - 22:23 66:12, 66:18 71:11, 72:7, 72:10, 11:20, 12:13, 12:27, ended [1] - 15:6 failing [3] - 51:20, draw [1] - 68:16 75:13, 76:18 13:9, 22:4, 23:3, 25:3, ends [1] - 25:17 66:12, 66:18 drawing [1] - 79:2 exactly [2] - 47:6, 25:27, 27:14, 27:18, engage [4] - 34:11, failure [1] - 51:26 drawn [1] - 79:2 72:18 28:8, 28:22, 28:25,

	1			
29:21, 30:5, 31:1,	FORMER [2] - 1:13,	55:18, 57:21, 60:3,	н	1
31:17, 31:21, 32:6,	2:3	61:12, 63:7, 66:17,		-
32:16, 33:1, 33:17,	forms [2] - 44:13,	68:1, 69:7, 69:17,		
34:2, 34:20, 35:4,	45:26	69:22, 69:29, 70:20,	HALIDAY [1] - 2:23	IA31 [1] - 52:22
36:16, 38:24, 41:1,	forward [12] - 9:5,	71:8, 71:26, 71:28,	hand [5] - 33:8,	IA31S [1] - 52:12
41:23, 42:5, 42:16,	32:25, 36:5, 37:22,	73:1, 73:16, 75:5,	33:10, 33:14, 33:16,	idea [4] - 65:2, 68:1,
42:17, 43:16, 44:3,	38:1, 40:7, 40:17,	75:23, 76:11, 76:20,	39:3	68:4, 75:17
44:8, 44:13, 44:23,	40:28, 41:17, 42:12,	78:24, 79:29	hands [2] - 29:29,	identified [2] - 33:9,
44:29, 45:11, 45:25,	44:19, 44:25	GARDA [11] - 2:10,	31:5	57:19
46:12, 47:25, 48:21,	foundation [2] -	2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2,	happy [3] - 20:8,	identify [1] - 60:7
53:13	66:13, 66:14	3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21,	40:2, 75:26	identity [2] - 8:3,
Finn's [8] - 9:17,	four [2] - 55:10,	5:3, 6:5	HARAN[1] - 4:2	12:10
10:8, 11:27, 12:19,	79:24	gardaí [6] - 16:8,	harass [1] - 26:3	ignore [1] - 43:23
19:21, 20:7, 21:26,		17:4, 22:14, 22:21,	harasses [1] - 64:8	illusory [1] - 17:2
31:11	free [1] - 17:14	52:13, 55:21		immediately[1] -
	FREEMAN [1] - 2:22		harassment [8] -	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
Fintan [1] - 32:4	frustrated [1] - 76:11	Gardaí [1] - 74:13	6:11, 24:18, 25:8,	67:22
FINTAN [1] - 2:21	full [2] - 70:3, 70:4	general [2] - 17:27,	27:29, 30:23, 46:23,	impacted [1] - 68:21
first [20] - 6:18, 10:1,	functions [1] - 33:16	48:13	47:18, 47:21	implication [2] -
12:27, 13:12, 13:20,	furnished [2] - 9:18,	generally [1] - 80:24	Harris [1] - 65:25	48:4, 71:6
19:20, 22:3, 27:8,	9:21	GERAGHTY[1] -	HEAD [1] - 3:15	implications [1] -
31:21, 32:10, 35:5,	fussy [1] - 79:1	2:17	head [1] - 48:6	61:7
47:22, 47:23, 50:15,		GERARD [1] - 2:11	heading [6] - 12:17,	implied [1] - 68:20
50:21, 56:20, 61:20,	G	GERRY [1] - 3:11	12:21, 22:1, 28:7,	implying [1] - 61:4
69:23, 69:24, 70:10		Gilligan [1] - 56:29	42:10, 56:13	important [2] -
fit [1] - 43:18	00.0	given [7] - 10:25,	hear [1] - 71:11	38:22, 60:9
FITZWILLIAM [1] -	game [2] - 63:3,	22:14, 39:22, 39:25,	hearing [2] - 78:4,	imposed [1] - 43:1
4:5	63:15	50:3, 59:17, 67:20	79:6	impression [1] -
five [3] - 51:12,	Garda [130] - 6:11,	gleaned [1] - 76:18	HEARING [5] - 6:1,	77:22
66:25, 67:23	6:14, 7:11, 7:15, 7:17,	GLEESON [1] - 4:4	49:23, 77:16, 80:17,	improper [1] - 78:17
flavour [1] - 16:11	7:28, 8:5, 8:7, 9:19,	GOODE [1] - 3:22	81:5	imputed [1] - 14:6
flick [1] - 33:7	9:22, 9:29, 10:2, 10:7,	GRALTON [1] - 3:14	Hegarty [1] - 37:24	IN [1] - 1:17
FLYNN [1] - 3:19	10:21, 10:22, 10:26,	grateful [2] - 37:1,	HELD [1] - 1:17	inappropriate [4] -
focus [11] - 20:21,	11:8, 11:12, 11:26,	78:1	hereby [1] - 52:10	23:28, 78:7, 78:13,
46:29, 52:2, 54:12,	12:2, 12:8, 12:15,	great [1] - 12:9	herewith [1] - 78:10	78:16
54:14, 55:3, 55:28,	13:14, 13:22, 13:26,	GREENE [1] - 2:27	heroin [2] - 56:29,	inappropriate/
56:17, 56:22, 57:14,	14:4, 14:5, 14:10,	GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26	63:4	criminal [1] - 22:9
65:6	14:15, 14:16, 14:24,	ground [1] - 24:6	highlighted [1] -	incident [4] - 12:11,
focused [1] - 6:17	14:25, 15:4, 15:5,	grow [1] - 11:21	43:17	14:7, 14:21, 17:5
focusing [1] - 13:24	15:22, 16:9, 16:12,	grown [1] - 16:1	highly [1] - 62:7	inclined [1] - 60:13
follow [2] - 30:15,	16:15, 16:25, 16:29,	GSOC [9] - 46:22,	himself [1] - 18:14	include [2] - 14:16,
44:4	18:12, 18:20, 18:28,	47:7, 47:9, 47:14,	hold [7] - 12:1,	24:21
followed [2] - 22:14,	19:1, 19:6, 19:24,	47:19, 47:20, 47:27,	13:16, 20:15, 27:26,	including [3] - 9:18,
24:29	19:25, 21:15, 21:16,	48:7, 48:16	51:1, 61:7	16:8, 78:18
following [4] - 1:25,	21:19, 21:21, 22:6,	guard [8] - 11:5,	holding [1] - 74:13	incorrect [2] - 36:23,
54:22, 61:2, 67:19	22:10, 22:26, 22:29,	14:6, 18:1, 29:28,	HORAN [1] - 3:25	46:14
FOLLOWING [1] -	23:2, 23:5, 23:19,	30:14, 47:19, 53:11,	hostile [1] - 72:21	incredible [6] - 58:6,
1:4	23:29, 24:13, 24:15,	59:12	hostility [1] - 45:20	62:29, 63:5, 66:15,
FOLLOWS [5] - 6:1,	24:18, 24:25, 24:28,	Guards [2] - 37:18,	hot [1] - 67:28	67:24, 71:22
6:6, 49:24, 77:17,	25:2, 25:5, 25:9,	46:21	Hotel [1] - 32:29	incredibly [1] - 59:6
80:18	26:18, 28:14, 28:24,	guards [5] - 12:5,	HOUSE [2] - 2:23,	indeed [1] - 49:19
FOR [10] - 1:7, 2:6,	28:25, 29:6, 29:9,	18:2, 55:4, 55:9,	3:27	INDEX [1] - 5:1
2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27,	29:12, 29:13, 29:15,	55:12	HRPD [1] - 32:15	indicate [5] - 20:4,
3:2, 3:30, 4:1, 77:16	29:23, 30:20, 33:12,	guest [1] - 80:9	huge [2] - 28:18,	34:5, 62:21, 64:13,
forgot [1] - 37:8	35:7, 35:12, 35:15,	guidelines [2] -	45:28	69:28
forgotten [1] - 37:12	37:21, 38:13, 40:5,	35:22, 39:21	HUGHES [2] - 2:29,	indicated [1] - 34:8
form [9] - 45:20,	40:20, 43:1, 46:7,	guilty [1] - 19:26	2:30	indicates [6] - 33:21,
52:12, 52:22, 52:25,	47:22, 47:23, 47:24,	Gwen [1] - 1:24	HUMAN [1] - 3:15	36:8, 36:20, 37:4,
52:27, 54:12, 57:20,	47:29, 48:12, 48:20,	GWEN [1] - 1:29	1.0mA(t[i] = 0.10	44:2, 61:2
59:17, 64:9	49:7, 49:18, 50:1,	3WEN[I] - 1.29		*
formal [1] - 32:5	50:3, 50:9, 52:11,			indicating [1] - 69:18
	52:13, 54:17, 55:11,			indication [1] - 23:27

61:13 28:19, 29:11, 29:17, indicative [1] - 17:8 62:23 12:15, 13:14, 13:26, individual [1] - 25:6 interaction [3] - 9:7, investigator [1] -30:7, 31:6, 37:8, 14:4, 14:10, 14:16, inextricably [1] -9:24, 45:5 32:18 37:14, 41:16, 43:10, 14:24, 15:5, 15:22, interaction.. [1] -44:12, 45:22, 45:23, 16:9, 16:12, 18:12, 28:4 invited [1] - 9:25 68:28 invoke [2] - 47:17, 45:25, 46:20, 48:3, 18:20, 18:28, 19:1, **inference** [1] - 71:5 51:9, 52:29, 53:3, 19:6, 19:25, 19:26, inferences [1] - 61:8 interactions [3] -47:22 69:7, 70:20, 71:3 55:6, 55:24, 58:5, 21:21, 23:2, 23:29, influence [1] - 47:8 invoked [1] - 47:24 58:10, 58:15, 59:1, 24:13, 24:15, 24:19, interest [1] - 48:23 involved [9] - 13:8, inform [1] - 65:14 60:29, 61:1, 61:19, 25:2, 25:5, 25:9, informant [1] - 6:27 internal [2] - 44:19, 17:5, 19:17, 24:18, 62:25, 62:26, 62:27, 26:18, 29:6, 30:20, 47.29 35:13. 39:23. 63:4. information [21] internally [1] - 65:3 65:23, 67:12 63:6, 64:16, 64:24, 35:7, 35:12, 35:15, 6:29, 7:10, 8:15, 8:25, 66:23, 67:18, 67:20, 37:21, 38:13, 40:5, interpretation [3] involving [1] - 16:15 9:2, 10:9, 11:13, 68:23, 68:24, 69:15, 40:21, 43:1, 46:7, 14:17, 20:3, 70:25 irrational [1] - 31:12 11:23, 12:25, 22:16, 69:26, 70:10, 70:15, 48:20, 49:8, 49:18, 29:22, 32:11, 35:11, interruption [1] irrelevant [1] - 10:4 70:17, 71:14, 71:21, 50:1, 50:3, 50:9, 36:1, 52:19, 63:19, 20:22 irresistible [1] -71:22, 71:26, 74:1, 55:18, 60:4, 61:12, 65:8, 69:8, 69:18, intervened [1] - 20:4 71.19 74:29 63:7, 66:17, 68:1, 71:2, 71:25 interviewed [1] issue [32] - 6:10, **JUDGE** [1] - 3:12 68:26, 69:17, 71:28, informed [8] - 8:4, 22.21 9:28, 10:3, 12:20, judge [6] - 13:20, 73:1, 73:16, 75:5, 8:6, 51:26, 61:28, INTO [1] - 1:2 14:28, 19:12, 23:18, 75:23, 78:24, 79:29 20:11, 48:11, 55:9, 64:24, 65:13, 65:14, 23:20, 24:24, 28:18, inundated [1] - 78:27 **KEOGH**[3] - 2:10, 65:13, 72:25 29:12, 30:22, 32:28, 68:6 investigate [6] -5:3, 6:5 judgment [1] - 71:18 informs [1] - 64:26 45:25, 45:28, 46:8, 24:3, 26:17, 27:18, juggling [1] - 67:29 Keogh's [1] - 16:29 initiated [2] - 13:3, 46:10, 49:1, 49:4, 29:9, 29:22, 52:12 July [4] - 6:26, 7:12, kept [1] - 62:2 49:11, 49:12, 49:26, 23:11 investigated [5] -7:13, 7:15 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 49:27, 50:21, 50:23, inordinate [1] - 72:4 22:8, 28:8, 30:6, **KIERAN** [1] - 3:20 June [7] - 7:29, 9:4, 51:16, 51:29, 55:23, 30:28, 68:7 **inquiry** [11] - 9:20, 9:19, 21:2, 40:29, kind [1] - 79:21 10:11, 10:26, 10:28, investigating [2] -73:8, 73:10, 73:15, 42:18, 42:23 kindly [1] - 34:12 76.7 21:22, 37:28, 46:18, 52:23, 65:27 jurisdiction [1] -KIRWAN [1] - 3:13 issued [1] - 44:2362:24, 76:22, 77:28, investigation [85] -78:19 knowledge [6] issues [6] - 7:6, 35:9, 77:29 6:12, 9:5, 9:6, 11:21, **JUSTICE** [3] - 1:7, 64:13, 64:18, 64:19, 36:26, 41:10, 41:29, **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:2, 13:3, 13:9, 17:4, 1.12 2.2 64:22, 64:24, 65:9 28:27, 31:26, 33:12, 45:4 1:8 justice [1] - 34:10 known [2] - 69:9. Inquiry [1] - 74:20 item [2] - 73:18, 35:21, 35:24, 36:2, Justice [1] - 65:22 73:27 inquiry. [1] - 72:17 36:28, 39:20, 40:9, itself [2] - 64:20, knows [1] - 17:12 41:6, 41:8, 45:28, insofar [6] - 8:10, K 46:4, 46:5, 46:24, 66:27 56:16, 57:18, 62:11, L 46:29, 47:25, 49:5, 62:20, 79:13 49:28, 53:3, 53:10, Inspector [11] - 33:2, **KANE** [1] - 2:28 55:3, 55:28, 56:4, 57:26, 58:3, 58:19, **KATE** [1] - 3:25 Lacey [2] - 57:26, 56:24, 56:25, 57:6, 59:10, 60:3, 60:22, **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:5 62.8 Jack [2] - 62:10, 60:23, 62:9, 66:26, 57:9, 57:11, 57:13, Kavanagh [1] - 41:26 large [3] - 39:25, 65:15 67:26 57:18, 58:20, 61:16, 43:15, 78:17 JACK [1] - 3:6 **KEANE** [1] - 4:3 $61{:}21,\,61{:}22,\,62{:}4,$ inspector [1] - 58:25 last [18] - 20:11, **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 keep [3] - 20:19, 62:10, 62:12, 62:15, INSPECTOR [7] -31:28, 51:26 21:14, 25:2, 25:19, January [3] - 38:3, 62:18, 62:28, 63:2, 3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 31:7, 34:6, 34:23, 39:10, 46:28 keeping [1] - 23:25 63:8, 63:10, 63:12, 3:18, 3:22, 4:2 38:3, 47:6, 53:12, **kelly** [1] - 80:9 job [1] - 27:28 63:17, 63:18, 63:20, instinct [1] - 80:13 56:21, 57:4, 59:12, jobs [1] - 33:11 Kelly [7] - 20:17, 63:25, 63:28, 63:29, INSTRUCTED [7] -63:2. 67:6. 73:12. **JOE** [1] - 3:14 42:7, 60:9, 73:27, 64:13, 64:20, 64:25, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 73:18 80:11 74:6, 74:24, 79:23 Joe [1] - 65:20 64:27, 65:3, 65:10, 3:26, 3:30, 4:5 lasts [1] - 10:26 **KELLY** [15] - 2:10, **JOHN** [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 65:17, 66:1, 66:5, instructions [3] law [1] - 47:18 3:12, 15:21, 15:29, 2:16, 3:8, 3:30 66:9, 66:26, 67:4, 9:17, 67:20, 73:11 16:4, 38:14, 42:10. **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29 John [3] - 32:14, 67:11, 67:13, 67:15, INSTRUMENT[1] -61:1, 74:8, 74:14, lead [1] - 45:28 52:6. 56:29 67:17, 68:11, 68:18, Judge [65] - 11:17, 74:17, 74:20, 79:16, leads [1] - 31:16 68:20, 69:9, 69:21, intelligence [5] least [3] - 23:16, 12:4, 13:11, 13:13, 79:21, 80:20 69:29, 70:7, 72:11, 6:23, 7:6, 13:22, 22:6, Keogh [72] - 6:11, 60:21, 65:16 72:13, 76:11, 76:18 15:21, 20:1, 21:14, 28:14 6:14, 7:11, 7:15, 7:17, leave [2] - 47:11, investigations [2] -23:18, 24:7, 25:18, intended [1] - 48:22 10:7, 10:21, 11:8, 26:9, 26:23, 26:29, 77:10 57:21, 72:2 inter [1] - 78:2 11:26, 12:2, 12:8, left [4] - 33:8, 33:14, 27:20, 28:4, 28:10, investigative [1] interact [2] - 11:11,

33:16, 74:24 42:26, 53:22, 58:19, massive [3] - 66:28, MCLOUGHLIN [1] methodology [1] left-hand [3] - 33:8, 60:23, 63:25 69:15 31:10 33:14, 33:16 looks [1] - 73:24 material [16] - 28:29, McLYNN [1] - 3:31 Michael [2] - 6:13, **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 29:2, 29:4, 39:23, legitimately [1] -McMahon [25] - 49:7, 57:25 39:26, 41:7, 43:7. 45.2 **LUNCH** [1] - 77:16 MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 49:29, 50:24, 52:7, legs [3] - 11:21, 16:1, 43:16, 72:10, 75:25, lying [1] - 24:28 53:6, 56:17, 61:13, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 78:11, 78:26, 79:24, 61:24, 61:26, 62:17, middle [4] - 54:14, Lyons [29] - 7:28, **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13 9:19, 9:29, 10:2, 80:4, 80:6, 80:21 62:22, 63:9, 65:7, 68:16, 77:12, 79:26 65:26, 66:1, 67:4, materiality [1] - 39:1 length [1] - 12:9 10:22, 10:26, 11:12, might [8] - 12:4, materials [1] - 78:18 67:17, 68:10, 68:13, lengthy [4] - 20:22, 13:22, 14:5, 14:25, 15:14, 17:4, 34:11, 53:13, 53:14, 75:19 16:15, 16:25, 20:3, MATT[1] - 3:19 69:25, 70:18, 71:4, 47:27, 73:14, 73:22, letter [23] - 6:20, 7:5, 21:16, 22:6, 24:25, matter [32] - 6:29, 72:1, 76:3, 77:2 79:17 32:23, 34:1, 35:2, 24:26, 27:19, 28:14, 7:4, 10:4, 10:5, 10:14, MCMAHON [1] - 3:8 mightn't [2] - 46:1, 36:6, 38:9, 38:15, 28:24, 28:25, 29:9, 11:5, 12:12, 14:9, McMahon's 131 -66:23 29:12, 29:13, 29:16, 58:20, 70:5, 73:3 15:5, 16:19, 21:12, 38:27, 39:9, 39:10, **mind** [4] - 16:19, 29:23, 29:28, 30:10 40:9, 40:29, 41:13, 22:3, 22:8, 22:12, MCPARTLIN[1] -69:26, 79:17, 80:11 **LYONS** [1] - 4:3 22:13, 23:12, 24:26, 3.20 42:17, 42:19, 52:5, Minister [4] - 65:22, Lyons' [2] - 14:15, 61:22, 65:21, 65:25, 25:17, 26:8, 30:7, me" [1] - 7:17 74:10, 74:12, 74:18 68:26, 78:9, 78:10 19:24 32:18, 39:22, 46:23, mean [16] - 11:5, MINISTER [1] - 1:7 letters [3] - 35:1, 48:5, 53:7, 53:27, 12:6, 13:12, 16:21, Lyons's [1] - 9:22 Minnock [4] - 58:18, 73:24, 74:2, 74:9, 37:27, 38:12 Lyons.. [1] - 23:5 24:8, 28:1, 29:11, 58:25, 60:22, 61:3 level [3] - 26:19, 75:27, 76:23, 80:23 29:14, 38:22, 43:5, MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 matters [6] - 23:9, 27:6, 34:4 M 56:28, 64:17, 65:1, minute [2] - 12:1, 36:27, 56:12, 64:5, 69:22, 72:27, 76:28 **Liam** [16] - 7:3, 7:12, 49:11 64:11, 79:12 meaning [3] - 71:10, 7:13, 8:19, 8:23, 8:29, minutes [1] - 80:10 MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7 11:20, 12:17, 14:6, MATTERS[1] - 1:4 71:17, 71:18 misunderstanding Maher [9] - 57:26, 14:12, 15:13, 17:23, **MATTHIAS**[1] - 2:10 meanings [1] - 71:13 111 - 14:29 58:3, 58:19, 58:25, 18:7, 21:1, 22:20, Mcbrien [21] - 2:16, means [1] - 71:2 mix [1] - 55:14 59:10, 60:3, 60:23, 22:24 6:21, 10:22, 12:28, meant [1] - 48:7 mode [1] - 79:7 61:4, 62:9 **LIAM**[1] - 3:18 12:29, 15:3, 16:7, meantime [1] - 25:22 moment [20] - 7:5, mail [2] - 41:21, 18:23, 19:5, 20:28, light [2] - 11:23, measured [1] - 42:22 12:20, 13:15, 13:19, 42.10 14:21 21:21, 22:7, 23:25, MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 13:25, 16:26, 26:9, MAIN [1] - 2:12 24:21, 25:7, 25:28, line [15] - 13:12, meet [3] - 7:19, 26:23, 27:13, 31:18, maintained [1] -26:6, 26:19, 27:9, 13:20, 21:5, 28:1, 35:14, 41:10 47:14, 49:2, 54:13, 30:12 30:25, 30:26 28:12, 28:18, 50:16, meeting [11] - 7:13, 61:9, 62:5, 65:7, 76:2, major [1] - 51:16 50:26, 50:27, 51:14, McBrien's [1] - 8:10 8:23, 9:15, 9:16, 77:20, 78:25, 79:19 Malone [1] - 1:24 McCOURT [1] - 2:17 51:18, 51:24, 70:23, 32:27, 32:29, 37:9, momentarily [1] -MALONE [1] - 1:29 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 79:1, 79:2 37:13, 37:15, 37:19 manage [1] - 45:4 lines [1] - 50:23 McGRATH[2] - 2:7, meetings [5] - 9:13, moments [2] - 26:5, management [6] linked [2] - 28:4, 27:3, 37:2, 37:5, 43:2 21:15, 22:29, 23:1, 28:5 McGuinness [9] -MEMBER [1] - 2:2 money [1] - 16:9 23:9, 23:19, 48:13 listed [1] - 33:8 2:6, 3:24, 15:16, 50:4, member [4] - 8:3, MONICA [1] - 3:15 manner [2] - 40:22, 73:20, 75:9, 75:11, listen [1] - 47:27 8:4, 8:6, 22:26 month [1] - 66:28 68:22 75:15, 77:9 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:28 members [5] - 21:19, months [5] - 7:15, March [9] - 58:2, mcHugh [1] - 19:29 local [1] - 26:18 22:10, 24:27, 57:19, 51:12, 66:25, 67:23, 58:13, 58:14, 58:16, McHugh [39] - 6:16, locally [1] - 13:3 67.14 67:27 60:2, 69:12, 69:26, 7:4, 7:12, 7:13, 7:16, memory [2] - 14:9, logic [1] - 24:2 morning [2] - 6:8, 70:21, 71:25 8:23, 8:29, 11:20, look [18] - 17:11, 74:8 58:22 MARGARET[1] -12:11, 12:17, 13:4, 17:16, 21:27, 24:3, mention [1] - 79:25 MORONEY [1] - 3:18 13:6, 14:6, 14:12, 24:11, 27:11, 29:13, mentioned [5] -MORRISSEY [1] -**MARIE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 15:4, 15:13, 15:23, 31:5, 38:11, 38:13, 57:20, 67:14, 73:28, 3:26 Marie [6] - 49:6, 16:9, 17:2, 17:8, 47:10, 54:12, 54:13, 76:1 motions [3] - 46:21, 49:29, 52:7, 53:6, 17:23, 18:7, 18:17, 57:9, 67:7, 73:27, mentioning [1] -48:2, 48:5 65:6, 70:5 18:23, 18:24, 18:29, 80:8, 80:21 79:11 move [8] - 34:28, mark [1] - 15:19 19:8, 19:15, 21:1, looked [4] - 19:12, merely [1] - 20:4 37:21, 38:1, 40:6, MARK[1] - 3:3 21:11, 22:20, 22:24, 24:24, 26:15, 30:19 41:17, 42:12, 48:29, message [2] - 7:16, Mark[1] - 38:5 23:7, 25:16, 25:21, looking [16] - 7:5, 58.18 54.11 marks [1] - 66:28 26:7, 28:7 25:27, 25:29, 27:29, met [8] - 7:14, 7:17, moving [5] - 9:5, MARRINAN[1] - 2:7 McHugh's [2] - 8:19, 30:23. 31:1. 31:2. 28:24, 32:14, 35:5, 33:4, 33:20, 49:16, 37:13, 37:17, 41:28, Mars [1] - 53:11 19:23 35:7, 57:26, 62:8 73:13

MR [123] - 1:12, 2:2, 19:11, 19:19, 19:23, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:8, 20:20, 20:23, 20:25, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 29:6, 29:20, 31:28, 32:1, 38:16, 38:19, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 38:28, 39:3, 39:6, 39:10, 39:13, 39:29, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 3:30, 3:30, 4:3, 40:6, 41:25, 41:29, 42:8, 42:11, 43:10, 5:5, 6:6, 12:8, 13:26, 15:1, 15:8, 15:10, 43:13, 43:15, 44:15, 15:12, 15:15, 15:21, 48:19, 48:26, 48:29, 15:29, 16:4, 16:20, 49:4, 49:11, 49:14, 49:17, 49:21, 49:26, 16:22, 16:24, 17:7, 17:15, 17:19, 17:27, 55:22, 58:13, 59:23, 60:7, 61:5, 61:10, 18:27, 19:4, 19:11, 19:19, 19:23, 20:20, 61:12, 62:5, 62:16, 20:23, 20:25, 29:6, 62:19, 65:28, 69:17, 29:20, 31:28, 32:1, 70:26, 71:28, 72:7, 73:7, 73:10, 73:26, 38:14, 38:16, 38:19, 38:28, 39:3, 39:6, 74:23, 74:27, 75:19, 75:27, 76:4, 76:6, 39:10, 39:13, 39:29, 76:14, 77:7, 77:13 40:6, 41:25, 41:29, 42:8, 42:10, 42:11, Murphy [24] - 13:16, 43:10, 43:13, 43:15, 13:24, 14:2, 16:18, 20:9, 20:18, 20:21, 44:15, 48:19, 48:26, 48:29, 49:4, 49:11, 20:22, 26:27, 27:13, 49:14, 49:17, 49:21, 28:21, 28:28, 38:18, 49:26, 55:22, 58:13, 42:6, 43:9, 47:10, 59:23, 60:7, 61:1, 49:3, 59:20, 60:4, 60:12, 67:18, 75:10, 61:5, 61:10, 61:12, 62:5, 62:16, 62:19, 75:11, 75:17 65:28, 69:17, 70:26, Murray [10] - 34:14, 71:28, 72:7, 73:7, 40:10, 40:18, 42:2, 44:3, 44:7, 45:1, 73:10, 73:26, 74:8, 74:14, 74:17, 74:20, 46:26. 46:27. 73:17 74:23, 74:27, 75:9, MURRAY [2] - 3:3, 75:11, 75:15, 75:19, 75:27, 76:4, 76:6, Murray's [1] - 43:4 76:14, 77:7, 77:13, Myers [2] - 33:1, 79:16, 79:21, 80:20 33:18 **MS**[11] - 2:7, 2:11, MÍCHEÁL [1] - 3:23 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 3:30, 4:4, Ν Mulcahy [2] - 57:29, name [5] - 8:19, 64:25 9:22, 10:22, 10:26, **MULCAHY** [1] - 3:5 55:20 mulled [1] - 58:29 named [3] - 1:26, MULLIGAN [2] -55:4, 55:16 2:11, 3:13 namely [1] - 56:18 Mullingar [1] - 32:29 names [6] - 12:5, murder [2] - 57:5, 33:8, 33:15, 33:19, 63.23 55:24, 57:21 murphy [1] - 39:9 naming [1] - 55:16 MURPHY [83] - 2:30, narrative [2] - 26:11, 3:23, 5:5, 6:6, 12:8, 33:10 13:26, 15:1, 15:8, **National** [1] - 55:12 15:10, 15:12, 15:15, natural [1] - 34:10 16:20, 16:22, 16:24, nature [3] - 17:2, 17:7, 17:15, 17:19, 34:13, 72:2 17:27, 18:27, 19:4,

necessary [3] -32:17, 39:1, 79:12 Ned [1] - 33:2 need [3] - 47:28, 60:18, 80:24 needed [1] - 8:8 needn't [1] - 33:29 needs [1] - 30:5 negatively [2] -68:21, 69:20 never [18] - 9:28, 24:23, 26:16, 29:20, 30:4, 30:18, 46:16, 46:17, 48:22, 55:14, 58:7, 59:7, 59:12, 59:17, 61:4, 61:23, 65:13, 72:12 new [7] - 11:19, 11:23, 12:8, 29:22, 49:16, 65:24, 71:25 next [14] - 13:11, 13:12, 23:2, 23:22, 24:13, 33:7, 42:25, 46:8, 48:29, 49:4, 49:26, 51:23, 58:22, 73.13 NICHOLAS [4] -2:10, 4:2, 5:3, 6:5 Nicholas [7] - 7:11, 37:25, 49:8, 50:1, 68:26, 73:16, 75:5 Nick [1] - 18:12 Nolan [8] - 52:18, 53:2, 53:4, 53:25, 61:20, 61:26, 62:14, 65:15 **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 Nolan's [1] - 62:10 nominated [2] -32:15, 37:5 non [1] - 13:18 non-responsive [1] -13:18 **none** [3] - 55:15, 65:11, 65:18 nonsense [1] - 29:29 Noreen [1] - 6:21 NOREEN [1] - 2:16 normal [2] - 40:3, 43:18 **NORTHUMBERLAN D**[1] - 2:18

13:27, 21:15, 23:15, 24:8, 29:17, 30:29, 31:10, 53:29, 56:19, 57:10, 61:17, 62:21, 63:7, 64:7, 67:10, 72:8, 76:25, 77:1, 78:2, 78:4, 79:3, 80:3, 80:29 notice [1] - 78:14 notification [1] -61:23 notified [1] - 39:15 notifies [2] - 39:7 November [2] - 32:3, 32:14 NOVEMBER [3] -1:18, 6:2, 81:6 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:14, 3.21 Nugent [1] - 65:20 number [14] - 9:26, 14:13, 16:8, 31:20, 31:25, 34:29, 38:17, 49:1, 49:5, 49:27, 58:20, 60:24, 73:15, 75:20 Number [2] - 14:15, 78:13 **NYLAND**[1] - 3:19 NÍ [1] - 2:30 **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7

0

O'BRIEN [1] - 2:10

o'clock [3] - 75:18,

O'CONNOR [1] -

O'HIGGINS [1] - 3:23

O'MARA [1] - 2:17

O'Neill [2] - 68:27,

O'NEILL [1] - 3:30

O'REARDON[1] -

77:6. 79:25

O'ROURKE [1] - 4:4 O'SULLIVAN [1] -3:7 objection [1] - 47:1 obliged [6] - 21:17, 22:28, 50:18, 56:21, 65:14, 65:16 observation [1] -41:8 obvious [1] - 8:8 obviously [4] -22:24, 26:13, 47:24, 66:8

occasion [2] - 56:21, occasions [1] - 9:26 occurred [1] - 24:23 October [3] - 44:2, 44:7. 44:12 **OF** [9] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, 3:15 offence [1] - 19:26 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, officer [6] - 22:7, 22:12, 23:28, 35:27, 52:23, 70:1 officer.. [1] - 39:15 officers [6] - 23:27, 24:17, 25:8, 27:9, 30:24, 31:13 officially [1] - 72:29 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 Olivia [2] - 68:27, 71:3 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12, 3:30 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [1] - 25:21 one [35] - 6:17, 9:15, 9:16, 10:12, 14:13, 14:16, 14:19, 15:12, 16:28, 16:29, 17:2, 20:3, 21:9, 24:5, 28:12, 34:29, 38:22, 42:27, 51:24, 52:28, 55:10, 55:11, 61:20, 61:27, 62:1, 63:24, 71:4, 71:10, 73:10, 74:9, 75:20, 75:27, 78:14, 79:1 ones [2] - 31:7, 74:25 opened [1] - 21:29 operated [1] - 72:3 opinion [1] - 76:19 opportunity [6] -7:18, 22:15, 41:7, 80:8, 80:21, 80:24 order [7] - 32:16, 37:2, 48:6, 75:2, 75:6, 76:11, 79:18 organisation [1] -26:3 original [1] - 66:26 originally [3] - 48:16, 53:2, 53:26 ORLA [1] - 3:20

OSMOND [1] - 3:27

OTHER [1] - 1:3

nothing [24] - 8:12,

note [14] - 35:19,

58:9, 58:10, 58:15,

59:3, 59:4, 59:25,

68:27, 79:14, 80:4

notes [4] - 1:26,

37:9, 37:11, 59:9

nearly [1] - 10:27

60:4, 60:5, 60:7,

otherwise [2] -68:20, 78:6 ought [1] - 24:24 outcome [2] - 56:7, 72:12 outlined [3] - 7:28, 9:4, 64:10 outlining [2] - 35:8, 43:19 outset [4] - 50:9, 64:10, 67:14, 77:27 outside [2] - 36:27, 78:19 own [4] - 64:12, 64:18, 67:10, 80:25

PAGE[1] - 5:2 page [53] - 6:19, 6:24, 7:21, 11:29, 12:15, 13:12, 15:2, 16:26. 19:14. 20:26. 21:28, 21:29, 22:18, 29:25, 32:3, 32:10, 32:12, 33:4, 33:21, 33:25, 33:27, 34:5, 36:13, 36:26, 37:22, 38:2, 38:11, 40:17, 40:28, 41:18, 42:8, 43:22, 43:25, 43:26, 50:7, 50:23, 51:13, 51:23, 52:5, 52:21, 53:23, 55:25, 56:14, 57:22, 64:14, 68:14, 68:17, 68:23, 69:3, 76:4 pages [6] - 33:7, 38:3, 42:12, 42:25, 44:4, 80:6 pair [1] - 29:29 papers [1] - 30:3 paragraph [19] - 7:7, 7:8, 12:16, 12:27, 12:28, 19:20, 19:21, 20:6, 23:2, 23:22, 25:3, 34:6, 34:21, 34:23. 50:15. 68:23. 69:3, 76:9, 76:14 paraphrase [1] -34.24 pardon [2] - 20:27, 41:19 Park [1] - 32:29 park [1] - 47:13 part [15] - 8:12, 9:20, 10:9, 13:11, 18:21, 20:11, 23:18, 23:21, 31:5, 41:14, 53:1,

58:20, 62:23, 69:10, 71:29 partes [1] - 78:2 partially [1] - 46:15 particular [9] - 9:16, 28:18, 45:5, 50:7, 51:10, 55:4, 56:18, 79:4 particularly [3] -73:23, 79:15, 79:29 parties [8] - 13:7, 19:17, 34:9, 37:24, 44:16, 45:13, 55:16, 79.13 party [3] - 78:5, 78:14, 78:17 pass [3] - 33:28, 38:16, 38:19 passed [3] - 64:5, 66:25. 67:25

40:18, 73:17 **PATRICK** [4] - 2:7, 2:10. 2:28. 3:3 PAUL [3] - 2:16, 2:21. 3:30 pay [3] - 54:29, 56:10 PEGGY [1] - 4:4 penalties [1] - 43:1 people [10] - 25:15, 25:20, 27:3, 33:15, 35:13, 36:2, 37:28,

PASSED[1] - 1:4

Pat [3] - 40:10,

past [2] - 7:14, 12:13

55:20, 56:22, 63:29 PEOPLE [1] - 3:16 per [2] - 32:17, 52:12 perception [5] -53:17, 53:19, 54:1, 54:8

perfectly [1] - 20:8 perhaps [6] - 19:1, 24:24, 26:14, 26:24, 42:27, 55:27 period [5] - 40:4, 48:12, 61:25, 66:28, 67:27

permission [2] - 6:9, 78:28

11:24 person [11] - 6:21, 10:28, 19:5, 53:15, 57:1, 63:3, 70:5, 78:15, 78:19, 78:20,

perpetrator[1] -

79.4 personal [3] - 64:13, 64:18, 65:8

perspective [2] -19:12, 67:10

peruse [1] - 78:20 PETER [2] - 2:5, 3:13 phase [1] - 73:13 phone [3] - 59:9, 59:14, 59:15 phoned [1] - 60:26 pick [1] - 42:27 piece [2] - 71:12, 73:14 **PLACE** [1] - 4:5 place [6] - 44:16, 62:12, 62:15, 64:20, 65:2, 68:4 placed [1] - 52:27 play [1] - 51:9 point [40] - 10:14, 11:5, 12:9, 16:4, 20:5, 22:3, 23:15, 25:24, 30:15, 31:8, 39:6, 46:7, 46:22, 47:12,

49:15, 49:16, 50:15, 50:19, 51:13, 52:28, 53:5, 53:17, 53:25, 54:3, 55:27, 57:3, 62:5, 64:21, 64:22, 69:26. 71:23. 71:26. 73:1, 74:9, 74:15, 74:21, 75:18, 76:9, 77.1 pointed [1] - 21:14

points [11] - 15:10, 31:21, 40:11, 40:16, 50:10, 51:16, 51:28, 52:2, 52:3, 61:19,66.17

policing [1] - 45:4 **policy** [5] - 30:23, 32:10, 32:17, 47:24,

Policing [2] - 44:13,

47.29 Pope [1] - 30:8 position [23] - 9:2, 10:8, 11:15, 16:24, 19:28, 21:9, 34:17, 35:20, 39:6, 39:19, 40:25, 55:15, 57:19, 62:20, 69:28, 70:6, 70:26, 73:19, 73:20, 73:21, 80:22, 80:24, 80:25

positive [1] - 35:22 possession[1] -36.22

possibilities [1] -

possibility [3] - 71:5, 71:20

possible [7] - 14:17, 27:18, 28:9, 35:25,

39:22, 68:19, 71:13 possibly [2] - 17:5, 73:28

potential [1] - 76:20 potentially [1] -14:11

practice [1] - 45:19 precisely [1] - 77:1 preclude [1] - 21:15 preliminary [1] -78:4

prepared [1] - 41:9 present [2] - 43:20, 79:14

presented [1] - 59:16 PRESIDENT [2] -1.13 2.3

presume [1] - 72:22 presuming [1] -55:25

pretty [1] - 31:6 previous [1] - 53:23 previously [3] - 41:9, 57:28, 69:8 principles [1] - 34:10

probabilities [1] -76:17 problem [1] - 60:20

procedures [7] -34:10, 34:19, 34:28, 47:22, 47:23, 78:3, 79.5 proceed [2] - 20:24,

80:23 proceeding [1] -79.7 proceeds [2] - 33:18,

46.29 process [6] - 6:22,

9:16, 9:20, 10:9, 44:15, 70:7 procured [1] - 41:5

professional [1] -40.22 progress [1] - 40:9 progressed [1] -

68:18 promoted [2] -46:26, 46:28 promotion [2] -47:11, 73:17 properly [1] - 30:13 propose [3] - 6:8,

48:29, 73:8 proposing [1] -31:24 proposition [1] -

38:25 PROTECTED[2] -1:2, 1:3

protected [1] - 62:1 provisional [1] -17:13 **précis** [1] - 12:25 **public** [1] - 76:11 purely [1] - 74:17 purpose [1] - 55:17 pursuant [1] - 52:10 pursue [3] - 21:20, 21:22, 24:10 **put** [12] - 8:16, 15:24, 25:14, 25:23, 30:4, 35:14, 45:8, 59:18, 66:17, 73:1, 75:28, 78:25

O

putting [1] - 71:6

puzzled [1] - 14:1

QUAY [2] - 2:24, queries [2] - 36:19, 44:5 query [2] - 6:26, 47:13 questions [10] - 6:9, 6:18, 17:11, 30:18, 42:24, 43:4, 43:6, 48:26, 50:12, 73:8 **QUINN** [1] - 3:10 quite [3] - 65:5, 75:24, 75:26

R

raise [4] - 41:11, 51:28, 73:10, 75:27 raised [3] - 42:1, 43:6. 44:5 raises [2] - 36:19, 36:26 rank [2] - 54:28, 56:9 ranks [1] - 33:20 rapidly [1] - 36:9 rather [1] - 8:17 re [1] - 26:24 re-examination [1] -26:24 reach [1] - 16:4 read [6] - 7:27, 12:21, 20:12, 27:4, 59:19, 68:3 reading [4] - 13:11, 15:19, 70:22, 71:9 ready [1] - 16:17 Ready [1] - 37:24 reality [1] - 19:12

really [2] - 11:5, 12:12 reason [1] - 80:26 regulation [2] reasonable [1] -52:23, 55:8 25:11 regulations [1] reasonably [1] -57.13 23.28 Regulations [2] -52:11, 76:21 reasons [2] - 17:1, 17:3 receive [1] - 23:19 rejects [1] - 68:19 received [8] - 6:25, relapse [1] - 59:1 7:11, 13:22, 22:6, 28:14, 35:8, 58:18, relates [4] - 6:10, 69:11 46:8, 63:16, 76:9 receiving [2] - 70:24, 77:24 recently [3] - 52:18, 10:20, 11:12, 11:17, 53:25, 65:5 11:18, 11:19, 12:10, recipient [2] - 8:17, 20:11, 20:12, 24:26, 8.20 24:29, 25:22, 30:22, 37:9, 37:25, 43:4, recollection [3] -25:19, 59:3, 72:15 45:26, 47:28, 48:27, 51:9, 51:10, 51:16, recommendation [7] - 70:9, 70:18, 72:20, 59:4, 61:17, 64:4, 65:22, 66:14, 66:18, 73:3, 73:5, 75:29, 76:25 67:21, 68:10, 71:2, recommendations 73:16, 75:29, 76:7 [3] - 64:4, 70:6, 71:24 relationship [2] -71:7. 71:8 recommended [2] -72:14, 72:17 relevance [3] record [4] - 32:2, 45:23, 53:28, 58:28 13:17, 47:9, 47:15 recorded [5] - 8:11, 37:13, 37:17, 37:20, 19:20, 45:13, 54:8, 55:22, 60:28, 79:14 59:15 reluctance [1] records [1] - 7:27 **REDDY** [1] - 4:5 reduction [4] -54:28, 54:29, 56:9, 56:10 18:2. 57:29 refer [3] - 42:17, 58:10, 68:14 reference [10] - 6:14, 73:20 13:3, 16:25, 17:20, 33:9, 41:19, 50:7, reminders [1] -68:27, 69:4, 78:15 42:23 referred [5] - 9:14, replied [1] - 8:11 26:23, 47:7, 53:23, reply [3] - 8:10, 55:26 41:29, 80:3 referring [7] - 18:12, report [53] - 7:28, 41:2, 59:6, 59:24, 59:25, 60:16, 64:29 10:6, 10:14, 11:2, refers [4] - 6:22, 11:4, 11:6, 11:7, 6:24, 7:6, 7:21 12:19, 14:15, 14:22, **refute** [1] - 40:20 14:24, 14:28, 15:1, 16:15, 17:20, 17:21, regard [3] - 31:23, 34:11, 69:20 19:14, 19:22, 20:3, 20:7, 20:13, 20:14, regarded [1] - 73:4 regarding [1] - 7:12 20:18, 20:19, 20:29, 22:16, 23:19, 26:17, registered [1] - 6:27

26:29, 27:19, 28:11, **REGISTRAR**[1] - 2:5 Registrar [1] - 41:19 28:22, 28:26, 29:7, 29:13, 29:18, 30:11, 31:11, 31:16, 31:17, 31:21, 44:22, 45:6, 45:16, 52:17, 61:18, 64:7, 74:10 reported [6] - 14:5, 14:25, 19:8, 19:24, reiterated [1] - 8:28 22:12. 23:5 reporting [1] - 21:5 related [1] - 15:12 reports [2] - 41:5, 61:17 represent [1] - 45:19 represented [1] relation [38] - 6:10, 6:11, 6:15, 9:28, 10:2, represents [1] -12:25 reproduced [1] -43:24 request [6] - 18:22, 23:1, 34:18, 34:24, 34:27, 80:29 requested [3] - 7:29, 13:4, 22:27 requesting [1] -42:19 required [4] - 36:20, 61:18, 62:22, 63:8 requirement [2] relatively [1] - 49:10 54:26, 56:9 reservations [1] relevant [7] - 13:1, 60:11 reserve [1] - 71:17 resign [1] - 54:26 RESOLUTIONS [1] reluctant [1] - 78:24 RESOURCES [1] remaining [1] - 74:25 3:15 respect [3] - 27:29, remember [3] - 7:25, 43:2, 52:13 remind [2] - 73:19, respectfully [1] -34:11 reminded [1] - 14:7 respective [2] -23:11, 45:3 respond [1] - 12:3 responding [1] response [15] - 6:17, 6:26, 6:28, 15:5, 17:8, 19:15, 26:27, 34:4, 9:4, 9:19, 10:4, 10:5, 34:13, 40:11, 42:22, 43:7, 50:4, 50:26 responses [2] -43:19, 44:5 responsibilities [3] -

13:18 rest [1] - 80:26 result [4] - 11:20, 26:18, 28:26, 31:14 resulted [1] - 23:15 resulting [1] - 76:20 **RESUMED** [4] - 6:1, 49:23, 77:16, 80:17 retire [8] - 53:4, 53:7, 53:8, 53:15, 53:27, 54:7, 54:26, 56:9 **RETIRED** [7] - 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, 3:12, 3:13 retired [3] - 52:18, 53:25. 61:27 return [2] - 38:29, reveal [1] - 60:10 revert [1] - 9:25 review [1] - 41:7 reviewed [1] - 45:14 revisit [1] - 38:29 right-hand [1] -33:10 rightly [2] - 15:24, 71:9 rights [1] - 22:27 rise [4] - 49:14, 79:21, 80:9 rising [1] - 79:17 **ROAD** [1] - 2:18 road [2] - 21:18, 37:16 robbed [1] - 19:16 role [1] - 27:8 roles [2] - 23:25, 45:3 room [1] - 14:19 roughly [1] - 66:22 round [1] - 15:18 RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2

S

sample [1] - 45:10

SANDRA[1] - 4:3

sanction [1] - 54:23

sat [2] - 66:24, 67:23 satisfied [2] - 25:15, 31:3 SAVAGE [1] - 3:16 save [1] - 12:21 SC [11] - 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:3, 4:4 SCANLAN [1] - 3:8 scenario [1] - 63:16

scenarios [1] - 71:21 scenes [1] - 27:2 scope [1] - 36:27 **scoping** [1] - 37:10 screen [2] - 17:17, 50:6 scrupulous [3] -11:28, 12:2, 12:4 Seamus [4] - 57:26, 58:3, 58:19, 60:3 **SEAN**[4] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:22. 3:17 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 searched [1] - 18:2 second [8] - 7:7, 12:28, 25:2, 32:12, 37:19, 51:24, 62:4, 71:5 secondly [1] - 46:12 section [6] - 12:21, 19:21, 52:10, 74:2, 74:10, 76:22 see [48] - 6:24, 7:2, 7:29, 10:7, 10:21, 12:16, 12:23, 13:1, 16:28, 17:19, 21:27, 21:29, 23:2, 24:5, 24:13, 26:9, 26:17, 28:24, 30:3, 30:15, 30:20, 32:3, 32:6, 33:7, 33:15, 34:24, 36:16, 37:28, 40:12, 40:17, 41:27, 42:13, 42:25, 44:9, 46:25, 47:10. 50:26. 52:5. 52:22, 55:22, 56:10, 56:14, 57:24, 59:1, 62:16, 79:17, 79:22 seeing [4] - 42:6, 42:7, 42:10, 71:9 seek [3] - 34:14, 57:27, 73:10 **seeking** [6] - 26:3, 36:1, 36:2, 37:5, 37:27, 39:21 seem [4] - 12:11, 24:11, 67:28, 71:19 seized [1] - 16:9 send [3] - 28:27, 78:11, 78:19 senior [3] - 23:9, 31:13, 74:13 sense [4] - 9:3, 12:7, 15:7, 27:22 sent [10] - 7:15, 25:20, 29:1, 29:6, 41:14, 42:23, 43:7, 61:21, 78:8, 78:11 sentence [1] - 24:13

September [4] -

23:26, 33:17, 45:3

responsive [1] -

responsibility [1] -

41:21, 43:10, 43:12, SINÉAD[1] - 4:4 spot [1] - 27:9 structure [1] - 33:14 46:27, 57:25, 57:29, 43:13 SINéAD [1] - 2:7 stage [9] - 18:20, stuff [2] - 77:4, 80:2 58:18, 62:8, 73:17 SUPERINTENDENT sequence [3] sit [3] - 51:11, 77:19, 34:4, 35:2, 36:8, subject [3] - 15:8, 41:20, 42:11, 67:24 40:26, 43:18, 46:14, 80.26 18:27, 54:22 [15] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, sequencing [1] -46:20, 73:12 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, sitting [1] - 75:23 submission [4] -31.25 situation [8] - 10:25, stage. [1] - 16:27 10:17, 11:14, 19:13, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, Sergeant [1] - 13:5 3:19, 3:19, 3:21 17:13, 19:7, 25:14, stand [1] - 46:18 29.8 SERGEANT [5] -27:12, 70:3, 78:23, standard [1] - 52:27 submissions [4] superintendent [7] -28:2, 38:9, 38:10, 3:12, 3:20, 4:2, 4:3, 79:28 standing [2] - 30:9, 10:10, 10:27, 11:1, 52:13, 55:11, 58:25 4:3 18:27 six [3] - 51:12, 66:28, series [3] - 42:24, submit [1] - 34:11 **supply** [2] - 56:29, 67:27 start [3] - 24:7, 44:4. 63:1 six-month [1] - 66:28 29:11, 41:20 **submitted** [1] - 70:1 63:4 serious [8] - 23:9, **support** [3] - 14:7, slightest [1] - 60:17 starts [2] - 47:2, subsequent [1] -66:20 68:9 24:9, 24:27, 57:10, **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 72:28 37:13 **supported** [4] - 13:7, 63:19, 63:23, 66:14, SMITHFIELD [1] -**State** [1] - 69:11 substance [2] -19:16, 30:2, 72:9 76:20 15:24 76:19 2:24 STATE[1] - 3:27 supporting [1] seriously [2] - 45:12, substandard [1] -**SOLE** [1] - 2:2 state [2] - 16:19, 46:15 38:25 solicitor [10] - 9:8, served [1] - 42:23 supportive [1] -34:1, 34:19, 41:15, statement [36] substantive [1] -40:22 **SERVICES**[1] - 1:29 41:21, 42:3, 42:25, 13:5, 13:25, 13:27, 69:29 Services [1] - 1:24 supports [1] - 17:1 43:6, 45:12, 59:13 14:1, 15:20, 17:9, suggest [23] - 10:7, set [5] - 35:21, 38:25, **SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:8 18:17, 18:19, 18:25, 11:26, 24:16, 25:11, suppose [1] - 73:22 39:20, 42:24, 54:21 supposed [2] -SOLICITOR'S [1] -19:17, 19:24, 21:12, 25:26, 29:24, 30:20, **shall** [1] - 17:12 21:16, 21:17, 22:20, 31:9, 45:18, 46:13, 15:25, 62:2 3:27 48:9, 50:24, 63:26, supposedly [1] -**SHANE** [1] - 3:23 Solicitors [2] -22:25, 22:28, 22:29, 23:1, 24:25, 25:16, 64:14, 65:11, 66:10, 23:7 **SHANKEY** [1] - 3:21 37:25, 69:11 SHANKEY-SMITH 26:7, 43:5, 51:10, 67:5, 67:8, 72:8, 73:2, supposition [1] -SOLICITORS [5] -[1] - 3:21 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, 63:3, 63:5, 66:15, 77:9, 78:5 71:29 66:21, 66:24, 67:21, **SÍOCHÁNA** [1] - 3:2 **SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 suggested [3] - 12:1, 18:19, 18:28 67:24, 70:25, 71:12, Síochána [7] - 21:20, shape [1] - 64:8 someone [1] - 24:28 76:16 22:10, 22:26, 24:28, suggesting [5] -SHEAHAN[1] - 3:18 sometimes [1] -**SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 statements [8] -11:10, 66:19, 68:8, 52:11, 71:26, 76:21 80.14 24:25, 25:21, 33:9, 70:22, 71:29 somewhat [2] - 19:8, **SHIP** [1] - 3:28 41:4, 42:1, 45:14, suggestion [2] -Т short [1] - 75:12 57:28, 78:18 18:28, 19:27 soon [1] - 39:22 **show** [1] - 47:10 suggestions [1] states [1] - 7:12 sorry [32] - 13:11, **showing** [2] - 38:22, **T&N** [1] - 3:31 Station [2] - 8:5, 8:7 15:11, 20:15, 20:22, 38:23 tail [2] - 11:22, 16:2 stenographic [1] suit [1] - 26:10 28:11, 29:25, 31:19, **shown** [10] **-** 6:19, Taoiseach [1] suitable [1] - 49:14 33:4, 33:27, 34:21, 11:28, 12:15, 15:2, 65:22 stenography [1] -16:17, 31:22, 36:11, 36:13, 38:7, 38:11, suits [1] - 77:7 **TARA**[1] - 3:22 1:24 summarised [1] -42:5, 52:4, 57:22 38:16, 41:18, 41:26, target [2] - 48:23, 41:27, 43:13, 43:26, STENOGRAPHY[1] 16:16 shows [1] - 32:28 72.12 44:1, 44:26, 49:2, 1:29 summary [2] - 20:5, side [2] - 30:16, targeting [10] -51:1, 53:19, 59:22, STEPHANIE[1] -34:17 67.19 21:22, 21:26, 26:21, sight [1] - 80:21 60:15, 61:5, 69:1, 2.27 Superintendent [55] 27:15, 45:20, 49:7, 70:3, 70:29, 74:7, **STEPHEN** [1] - 2:21 - 6:21, 8:9, 10:21, sign [3] - 59:18, 50:1, 51:2, 51:7, 75:3 steps [1] - 47:10 12:28, 12:29, 15:3, 59:19 74:13 still [5] - 11:21, 30:9, 16:7, 18:23, 19:5, sort [1] - 33:22 signed [2] - 6:20, targets [2] - 64:8, sorts [1] - 32:11 67:15, 71:22, 75:16 20:27, 21:21, 22:7, 32:4 76:26 22:13, 23:24, 23:25, sought [6] - 22:7, stole [1] - 53:11 signing [1] - 45:26 task [3] - 45:11, 24:17, 24:21, 25:7, 35:11, 46:16, 46:17, stolen [1] - 18:3 signposting [1] -46:15, 64:3 72:12, 78:28 stop [6] - 53:11, 25:28, 25:29, 26:6, tasks [2] - 33:10, 26:19, 26:20, 27:9, **sp** [1] - 76:25 60:14, 78:2, 78:5, **signs** [1] - 44:13 33.22 27:10, 30:24, 30:25, speaking [1] - 14:8 78:26, 79:3 similar [1] - 36:6 team [6] - 45:14, 30:26, 30:27, 33:1, **stopped** [1] - 66:6 speaks [1] - 19:6 **simple** [5] - 25:18, 58:20, 63:20, 66:27, story [1] - 8:13 33:18, 34:13, 35:3, specifically [1] -53:10, 56:27, 57:7, 69:9, 78:1 36:7, 38:5, 39:7, STREET [3] - 2:12, 27.12 telephone [2] - 58:4, 40:10, 40:18, 42:2. spent [1] - 18:3 3:28, 3:32 **simply** [5] - 64:16, 58:8 42:3, 43:4, 44:2, 44:7, spoken [2] - 47:27, Street [1] - 17:24 68:8, 70:24, 77:25, **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 45:1, 45:2, 46:26, strongly [1] - 40:20 78:10

21:26, 40:22, 45:20, 57:11	34:17, 57:23, 72:10 unable [1] - 11:11	36:11, 38:3, 38:8,	word [3] - 12:22,	
towards [5] - 11:27,	12:24, 18:17, 18:18, 19:4, 26:6, 33:21,	Volume [14] - 6:19, 12:16, 20:26, 31:22,	wonder [1] - 50:5 wondering [1] - 29:6	O [0] - 0.1, 1.1, 00.10
53:12, 55:9	ultimately [10] - 9:27,	78:26	18:20, 18:21	Ó [3] - 3:7, 7:1, 65:18
touched [3] - 26:9,		41:18, 43:15, 68:15,	witnessed [2] -	
touch [2] - 46:22, 65:20		38:4, 39:23, 39:26,	74:7, 74:29, 75:8	Ó
15:17, 57:2	U	volume [9] - 38:2,	60:15, 74:1, 74:4,	
totally [3] - 15:9,	52:25	79:7	20:1, 20:11, 20:16,	1:5
torn [1] - 48:17	type [2] - 37:26,	64:21, 64:22, 78:27,	WITNESS [10] - 5:2,	ÉIREANN [2] - 1:4,
69:3	Twomey [1] - 52:6	23:16, 30:15, 38:25,	78:18	ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30
43:23, 51:23, 68:23,	77:6, 78:13	view [8] - 13:6,	75:28, 76:16, 78:6,	
top [5] - 42:13,	67:13, 71:13, 75:18,	67:13	41:4, 59:24, 60:8,	É
64:20, 67:15, 75:12	55:21, 56:26, 61:19,	44:22, 45:6, 67:12,	19:28, 31:23, 39:3,	
took [4] - 45:11,	55:6, 55:9, 55:11,	24:5, 26:20, 38:17,	witness [11] - 13:5,	€800 [1] - 18:3
tomorrow [1] - 81:2	52:13, 54:4, 55:4,	version [8] - 9:22,	75:6	
Tom [1] - 33:1	42:25, 42:27, 51:20,	verbatim [1] - 1:25	withheld [2] - 75:3,	
TOM [1] - 3:12	31:13, 38:3, 42:12,	veracity [1] - 22:15	wished [1] - 17:20	€
42:18	14:15, 24:27, 30:13,	various [1] - 40:16	35:14, 41:6, 41:10	
together [2] - 35:22,	two [25] - 12:5,		wish [4] - 17:9,	47:5
80:5, 80:23	twisting [1] - 12:14	V	25:16	yourself [2] - 33:2,
today [3] - 12:11,	twisted [1] - 27:5		willing [2] - 21:12,	29:25
TO [1] - 6:5	25:21	up-to-date [1] - 62:2	wholly [1] - 16:11	yesterday's [1] -
timeline [1] - 32:2	twice [2] - 11:17,	69:27	48:15, 63:1, 66:27, 67:24, 80:13	37:9, 46:16
72:3	52:21	57:4, 57:6, 62:2, 64:5,	29:18, 30:10, 30:12,	12:9, 29:24, 32:27,
35:21, 39:20, 43:19,	turning [2] - 36:26,	30:18, 37:10, 50:6,	25:23, 26:14, 28:5,	yesterday [9] - 6:14, 9:14, 11:8, 11:18,
timeframe [4] -	TURNER [1] - 2:28	28:1, 29:23, 30:15,	10:5, 10:13, 12:6,	
tight [1] - 31:28	52:5, 57:7	18:15, 19:3, 21:5,	whole [16] - 10:3,	75:21
thrown [1] - 55:14	43:24, 44:19, 44:25,	15:25, 15:27, 18:7,	WHITE [1] - 3:11	years [6] - 59:12, 63:2, 65:1, 72:27,
64:11, 65:1	36:5, 40:17, 40:28,	up [20] - 14:4, 14:11,	whereas [1] - 11:12	years [6] - 59:12,
14:17, 18:2, 21:19,	32:24, 33:25, 34:5,	unusual [1] - 59:6	42:2, 45:2	year [3] - 10:27, 47:1, 65:4
three [6] - 7:14,	turn [12] - 20:7,	untrue [1] - 28:23	Wheatley [3] - 36:7,	Vear (a) 10:27 47:4
51:24, 75:24	6:1	UNTIL [1] - 81:5	WHEATLEY [1] - 3:4	
third [4] - 7:7, 51:13,	TUESDAY[2] - 1:18,	untested [1] - 63:21	60:18, 66:13, 68:22	Υ
thinks [1] - 14:20	34:22, 47:17, 57:3	9:21	whatsoever [3] -	
60:19	trying [4] - 27:11,	unredacted [1] -	4:1	65:24
thinking [2] - 49:9,	31:28, 65:19	31:12	WESTMEATH[1] -	44:3, 65:19, 65:21,
therefore [1] - 56:17	try [4] - 15:21, 25:20,	unreasonable [1] -	2:31	29:7, 30:8, 38:27,
thereby [1] - 61:4	truth [1] - 29:10	unlikely [1] - 62:7	WELLINGTON [1] -	10:5, 10:14, 11:6,
thereafter [1] - 37:4	trumped [1] - 15:27	60:27	72:25	wrote [12] - 10:4,
77:16, 80:17, 81:5	26:14	unless [2] - 60:12,	welcoming [2] -	wrongly [1] - 71:9
THEN [4] - 49:23,	true [2] - 14:12,	Unit [1] - 55:12	72:23, 72:24	21:10
theirs [1] - 63:18	19:10	48:8, 48:11, 80:22	welcomed [2] -	wrongdoing [1] -
80:17, 81:5 theft [1] - 21:19	TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8 trouble [2] - 18:9,	unfortunately [4] -	54:29	59:16
6:1, 49:23, 77:16,	2:6	77:25	weeks [2] - 25:20,	written [2] - 45:23,
1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6,	TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2,	unease [1] - 77:26 uneasy [2] - 77:23,	57:4, 75:24	38:5, 65:18, 78:5, 79:11
THE [11] - 1:3, 1:7,	78:8, 78:16, 78:27	74:23	week [3] - 21:14,	36:15, 37:23, 37:24,
texted [1] - 58:19	75:6, 75:12, 77:24,	11:8, 15:24, 51:7,	81:5	27:23, 31:15, 34:1,
58:18, 58:23, 58:25	69:27, 71:27, 74:20,	understood [4] -	WEDNESDAY[1] -	writing [11] - 11:1,
text [5] - 7:15, 34:12,	33:6, 33:20, 35:1,	23:29	weakness [1] - 59:2	writes [1] - 41:1
testimony [1] - 64:15	Tribunal [13] - 32:1,	undermining [1] -	waters [1] - 63:21	70:15
76:14	treble [1] - 68:23	UNDER [2] - 1:2, 1:8	73:19	write [2] - 29:29,
57:11, 66:17, 73:13,	treatment [1] - 28:1	76:22	wait [3] - 20:2, 61:7,	77:5
54:11, 55:2, 56:12,	TREACY[1] - 2:27	57:14, 62:1, 63:29,		27:16, 61:8, 73:21,
16:24, 33:12, 33:14,	29:25, 50:6	52:23, 56:13, 57:13,	W	worry [6] - 13:18,
		00.20, 00.2, 10.21,		- WOLKOLOGE [1] 00.0
terms [11] - 9:16,	transcript [3] - 1:25,	30:23, 36:2, 45:27,		worksheet [1] - 33:5