TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

<u>HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE</u>

<u>ON WEDNESDAY, 6TH NOVEMBER 2019 - DAY 111</u>

111

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

## **APPEARANCES**

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

**REGI STRAR:** MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR.

DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC PATRICK MARRINAN SC SINÉAD McGRATH BL JOHN DAVIS, SOLICITOR MR. MS. MR.

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY

& GARDA DAVID TURNER: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

**FOR** COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY

RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURRAY 10. 11.

13.

SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15.

INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16.

16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE

BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON
INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN

30.

31.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN

34.

35.

SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 36. 37.

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL PAUL CONNELLAN

T&N McLYNN BASTION COURT

11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

**ATHLONE** 

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR.

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O'ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

## I NDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH	
CDOSS_EVANTNED BY MD MIDDLY	6

1		THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON WEDNESDAY, 6TH	
2		NOVEMBER 2019:	
3			
4		CHAIRMAN: Now, where is Garda Keogh?	
5		WITNESS: Good morning.	10:29
6		CHAIRMAN: Good morning.	
7		MR. MURPHY: Good morning, Chairman. Good morning,	
8		Garda Keogh.	
9			
10		GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH CONTINUED TO BE CROSS-EXAMINED BY	10:29
11		MR. MURPHY, AS FOLLOWS:	
12			
13		CHAIRMAN: Now, you were going on to?	
14		MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chairman, but before we do, I wonder	
15		could I ask a number of very short questions in	10:29
16		relation to the last section?	
17		CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18		MR. MURPHY: There was one area I wanted to take	
19		instructions on.	
20		CHAIRMAN: I think you mentioned that. Yes.	10:29
21		MR. MURPHY: It won't take long, Judge.	
22		CHAIRMAN: It's all right.	
23	1 Q.	MR. MURPHY: I wonder if you could be shown, please,	
24		book 20 and page 5995. Yesterday, Garda Keogh, I think	
25		in the course of the transcript at page 61, you said	10:30
26		the following words, you said:	
27			
28		"I didn't know for a long period of time that it was	
29		Assistant Commissioner McMahon."	

Τ				
2			Who who was carrying out the investigation.	
3				
4			Could you help the Chairman to understand when you	
5			became aware that it was Assistant Commissioner	10:30
6			McMahon?	
7		Α.	The first I think that I became aware was when I	
8			received a text message from Aidan Minnock. But I had	
9			nothing officially, all I was aware was Jack Nolan was	
10			doing the investigation, he retired. I had nothing	10:30
11			formally in writing from anywhere to say who was doing	
12			the investigation. And that's what I was looking for;	
13			something formally in writing to say this person is	
14			doing the investigation. I got nothing. There's	
15			nothing in those documents to say where I was informed.	10:31
16	2	Q.	Apart from formal notification, would you agree with me	
17			that on 6th March 2018, when Detective Inspector Seamus	
18			Maher spoke to you, that he told you that Anne Marie	
19			McMahon was involved in this investigation?	
20		Α.	Can we see the that's what I explained yesterday. I	10:31
21			have an issue with this, this thing. I have no note of	
22			this conversation.	
23	3	Q.	But you're aware, I think you indicated yesterday, that	
24			the detective inspector took?	
25		Α.	Sorry?	10:31
26	4	Q.	You are aware of a note that the detective inspector	
27			took? This is the one you referred to?	
28		Α.	I said it's an incredible document, never seen before.	
29			In that it appears Judge, if it could be brought up	

Т			on the screen, it would simplify.	
2	5	Q.	Let's take it in stages, Garda Keogh. First of all,	
3			will you agree with me that you met with him?	
4		Α.	I met with	
5	6	Q.	On 6th March 2018.	10:32
6			CHAIRMAN: Hold on one second. Sorry, start again.	
7			Say that again. I just want everybody to know exactly	
8			what they are saying.	
9	7	Q.	MR. MURPHY: would you agree with me that he telephoned	
10			you on 6th March 2018?	10:32
11		Α.	I have no note of it. I have no note of it.	
12	8	Q.	Can I put it to you that he will say that he did. So	
13			in those circumstances, he spoke with you by way of a	
14			telephone call and he took a note, the note that you	
15			know he took, this is the one you referred to	10:32
16			yesterday; isn't that right?	
17		Α.	If we can bring the note up, Judge.	
18	9	Q.	I will. But before we go to the note, just dealing	
19			with reality. Would you accept there was a phone call	
20			from detective Inspector Seamus Maher to you on that	10:32
21			date?	
22		Α.	Judge, my diary notes have on the 6th March, at 13:08:	
23				
24			"Superintendent text me to say inspector Seamus Maher	
25			looking for my number as part of AC McMahon's	10:32
26			investigation team."	
27				
28			The next morning at 7:43am:	
29				

1			"Superintendent Minnock text me. Inspector Maher tells	
2			me he okay now."	
3				
4			That is all I have.	
5	10	Q.	Again, you told the Chairman many times that you tend	10:3
6			to forget things. I have to suggest to you that	
7			Detective Inspector Maher took a note of this telephone	
8			conversation with you. Do you deny that that	
9			conversation happened at all or is it that you don't	
10			remember it?	10:3
11		Α.	Judge, as I explained, I can't confirm or deny the	
12			conversation. I don't remember it. I have no note of	
13			it. The document, it's not even a note, it seems to be	
14			a transcript of it appears to be it's a recording	
15			of a phone call which had been transcribed down. The	10:3
16			document, as I said, I have never seen anything like it	
17			before and I don't know if any solicitor or barrister	
18			ever dealing with Garda stuff or criminal cases has	
19			seen a document like this.	
20	11	Q.	You see, Garda Keogh, again that's another exaggeration	10:3
21			on your part. You told the Chairman on a number of	
22			occasions that you weren't very good with paperwork.	
23			Can I suggest to you that the alternative explanation	
24			for this is that the detective inspector was good with	
25			paperwork and he took a note of the phone call with	10:3
26			you. Could we please show you the document?	

- 27 A. Please.
- 28 12 Q. Which is 11286, Volume 40.
- 29 A. Judge, there's a typed version somewhere in the files.

1	CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Will we get the typed	
2	version? We're going to be here a while, Mr. Murphy.	
3	MR. MURPHY: No, Chairman, I think the version that's	
4	in the Tribunal book is the one I'm operating from, and	
5	that's in the volume that was served on us.	10:34
6	CHAIRMAN: Very good. All right. Can you read that?	
7	WITNESS: No.	
8	CHAIRMAN: I can't. I mean, sorry, if we sat down, I	
9	can decipher it. But anyway, are you referring to much	
10	of it, Mr. Murphy?	10:35
11	MR. MURPHY: No, Chairman, I'm not.	
12	CHAIRMAN: Is there an easy bit.	
13	MR. MURPHY: Yes, there is.	
14	CHAIRMAN: which bit are you referring to?	
15	MR. MURPHY: The first bit, Chairman, the bottom of	10:35
16	11285, left-hand side, 6/3/18. Can you see that, Garda	
17	Keogh.	
18	CHAIRMAN: we haven't got 11285 yet.	
19	MR. KELLY: Chairman, the witness says that he has come	
20	across a typed version. I was looking at this this	10:35
21	morning, I can't make head nor tail of it. If there is	
22	a typed version.	
23	CHAIRMAN: That would be helpful.	
24	MR. KELLY: It would be extremely helpful.	
25	CHAIRMAN: Detective Inspector Maher, in due course,	10:35
26	can confirm or correct any problems, any errors, any	
27	transcription errors or something like that.	
28	MR. KELLY: I am just a little concerned that the	
29	witness is being cross-examined on a document that	

certainly, for my part, I am having difficulty reading. Mr. Kelly, where I am going with this, I completely -- my understanding, first of all, just where we stand, before we get to the note, where we stand, and correct me if I am wrong about this: Garda 10:36 Keogh says, I don't remember a phone call on 6th March 2018 from Detective Inspector Seamus Maher. implication from what he says, as I take it, is, that he says, if I had got a phone call, I think I would have made a note of it. That's is the implication of 10:36 what he is saying. I did get a phone call from the station about my phone number and, so, that would seem to suggest, that would have seemed to be the precursor to a phone call. And then he got another phone call -he got a text message the next day. Whatever the 10:36 meaning of, I don't know the meaning of it or what we are to take from it. Then he says, okay, and what's more, when I see the note that Detective Inspector Maher made, I think it is in an unusual form, he said. That's his point. Now, you're going to refer him to 10:37 some particular part of it. MR. MURPHY: I am. Just to reassure everybody where my view CHAI RMAN: was, if the parts that Mr. Murphy is going to rely on are very clear, I don't see a particular problem at 10:37 this moment. If they are not very clear, we will have to postpone that to see what we can do to decipher this and, if necessary, identify it, or maybe make our own typed transcript in circumstances of tranquility, where

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1			we can actually concentrate on it.	
2			MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.	
3			CHAIRMAN: For the moment, and if you want to come back	
4			to it, that is all right, but for the moment, if	
5			Mr. Murphy is referring you to bits that are clear that	10:3
6			we can all read, well and good. Are you happy with	
7			that?	
8			WITNESS: well, Judge, I think there is a typed	
9			transcript in these documents, of this.	
10			CHAIRMAN: I understand that. But hold on, we don't	10:3
11			have it to hand at the moment, and in the 50 whatever	
12			it is volumes, we can't if Mr. McGuinness can't	
13			remember it, then nobody can remember where it is. So	
14			I am relying that we will find it sooner or later and	
15			if we do, well and good. Okay. But we will muddle	10:3
16			along for the moment. Okay.	
17	13	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman. On the left-hand	
18			corner at 11285, would you agree with me that the	
19			letters "6318" appear?	
20		Α.	It looks like 6218 on this.	10:3
21	14	Q.	Very good. Well again, if you turn over the page	
22			please, to 11286, and this is a note which you say you	
23			read, Garda Keogh?	
24		Α.	Sorry, no, no, I have read the typed I have not	
25			read I couldn't read.	10:3
26	15	Q.	You note there is a note?	
27		Α.	Yes.	

28

29

CHAIRMAN: Which bits are you referring, to Mr. Murphy?

Given that we have a question is it 63 or 62, we can

1 have our views on that, but that's is not important. 2 11286, Chairman, please. MR. MURPHY: 3 CHAI RMAN: 11286, very good. You will see on the left-hand side: 4 16 MR. MURPHY: Ο. 5 10:39 6 "SM I explained I am ringing on behalf of AC Anne Marie 7 McMahon. " 8 9 CHAI RMAN: Yes. That's what it says. Then it says: 10 17 MR. MURPHY: Q. 10:39 11 12 "NK - not a good fit". 13 Do you see that? 14 I can't read it. 15 Α. 10:39 16 "Not a good fit"? 18 Q. 17 Not a good fit? Α. 18 19 Did you say that? Q. 19 Chairman, as I've stated, I don't even remember this Α. 20 phone call. 10:39 21 So I have to suggest to you that the phone call did 20 Q. 22 take place. If you can't remember it, Detective 23 Inspector Maher can. He will say, as the note 24 suggests, that he explained to you that he was ringing 25 on behalf of Assistant Commissioner Anne Marie McMahon, 10:39 isn't that clear from the note? 26 27 Α. Judge, as I said yesterday in relation to this as well, I've explored every possibility myself as to why I 28 29 can't remember it. I see, I note the time, it's 10:15

1	on that.	
2	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Garda Keogh, can you stop for a	
3	second.	
4	WI TNESS: Sorry.	
5	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Murphy, we are engaged in a fairly 10:	40
6	hopeless endeavour, looking at a scanned copy of a	
7	handwritten note and it's not sufficiently clear. Can	
8	you postpone your cross-examination on this issue.	
9	MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
10	CHAIRMAN: We will return to it in due course, either 10:	40
11	with an enhanced investing of the handwritten note or	
12	an enhanced version plus a typed copy, is that all	
13	right?	
14	MR. MURPHY: Certainly, I have no difficulty.	
15	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kelly, that seems to be the way to deal 10:	40
16	with it.	
17	MR. KELLY: I agree, Judge, it is the way to deal with	
18	it when it's unclear.	
19	CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Do you understand?	
20	WI TNESS: Yes.	40
21	CHAIRMAN: It is much simpler.	
22	WI TNESS: Yes.	
23	CHAIRMAN: We all know where we are then.	
24	WITNESS: Even the date, it looks like 6218.	
25	CHAIRMAN: I got that, don't worry. I am not agreeing 10:	41
26	that it says 62, but I heard what you said about it.	
27	Okay.	
28	MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, might I just draw to your	
29	attention that we have not received a statement from	

1	inspector Maher. Mr. Murphy has confirmed that to me.	
2	So I would be very anxious that we would receive a	
3	statement obviously before long.	
4	CHAIRMAN: That be would helpful. Mr. Murphy, can you	
5	take responsibility for that?	10:41
6	MR. MURPHY: Certainly, Chairman.	
7	CHAIRMAN: Are you the person I address in relation to	
8	that issue?	
9	MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chairman. That will be done. This	
10	is an issue raised by the witness yesterday, when he	10:41
11	raised the reference to the note, which is not a note	
12	either Mr. McGuinness or myself had identified as	
13	relevant to the issue. As the witness has done so,	
14	this	
15	CHAIRMAN: Certainly. Well, if we can get a statement.	10:41
16	If the detective inspector or whatever his rank is now,	
17	if he would be good enough, if it hasn't happened	
18	already, to give us as good a copy as he can of the	
19	original.	
20	MR. MURPHY: Yes.	10:42
21	CHAIRMAN: And to give us a, what do you call it, a	
22	typed copy. That would be great.	
23	MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chairman. What I will do, I have	
24	three other questions but I will defer those questions	
25	until we deal with that matter.	10:42
26	CHAIRMAN: I think that seems the sensible thing to do	
27	all round. Okay. We're talking about a few minutes,	
28	Mr. Murphy.	
29	MR. MURPHY: That's all.	

1 If it has to be interposed at some point, CHAI RMAN: 2 that wouldn't be a disaster. 3 MR. MURPHY: I can see it taking no longer than five to ten minutes. 4 5 CHAI RMAN: Thank you very much. Okay, very good. 10:42 6 Chairman, with your permission, may I 7 proceed to deal with issue number 20, which is complaints by Garda Nicholas Keogh in relation to the 8 promotion of Superintendent Patrick Murray to chief 9 superintendent in 2017. 10 10.42 11 CHAI RMAN: Yes. Thank you. 12 MR. MURPHY: 21 I wonder first of all if you could please Q. 13 take out your diary for 2014. That, Chairman, is page 14 13267 at book 47. 15 Just the date, please? Α. 10:43 16 13267, and the date is 30th July 2014. 22 Q. 17 Α. Yes. 18 23 Do you see on the 30th, it says: Q. 19 20 "3pm Doyle J Wilson met with Clare Daly TD section 62 10:43 21 Garda Act." 22 23 Yes. Α. 24 Can I ask you, is that the first time you met with 24 Q. 25 Deputy Daly? 10 · 43 I wouldn't... 26 Α. 27 25 Q. Could it be one of the first times that you met with Deputy Daly? 28 I would have had a note previous if I met her. I know 29

Α.

1			I definitely met with her when I was at some point,	
2			it was only an introduction when I was with Luke Ming	
3			Flanagan earlier in 2014. So that could have been one	
4			of the first times, when he became an MEP, I then went	
5			was in liaison with deputies Daly and Wallace.	10:44
6	26	Q.	Then could I ask you, please, to turn forward in your	
7			diary to January 2015, page 13293, please.	
8		Α.	Just the date please?	
9	27	Q.	Yes, the date, the 7th January. Do you have that?	
10		Α.	Yes.	10:45
11	28	Q.	Do you see where it says "FG under pressure" is that	
12			Fergal Greene?	
13		Α.	Yes, Judge.	
14	29	Q.	Then the next phrase, you say:	
15				10:45
16			"My reply Shakespeare not Hercules himself. Do what	
17			may be done. Each dog will have its day."	
18				
19			Then it says:	
20				10:45
21			"Stalingrad this will turn."	
22				
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	30	Q.	Just in next entry at the top of the page, there is a	
25			reference to:	10:45
26				
27			"Talking to Mick Wallace."	
28				
29			Is that right?	

1 That's the next day. Α. 2 31 Q. The next day, I see. So at that stage, can we take it 3 that --Sorry, just one second, the next day, it's not "talking 4 Α. 5 to Mick Wallace" it's a text I sent Mick Wallace to say 10:45 "nine months today". In other words, back then I am 6 concerned this has gone on nine months at that stage. 7 8 I know it's a number of years ago now, but. So, can we take then that you had been speaking to 9 32 Q. 10 deputy Wallace before that date? 10 · 45 11 I would imagine so. Α. 12 You have spoken to Deputy Flanagan, as we know, before? 33 Q. I would have been talking to Mick Wallace, if I 13 Α. 14 able to text him "nine months today", I would have 15 certainly been talking to Mick Wallace and Deputy Daly 10:46 16 at that point in time, 2015. 17 Could you just then turn forward, please, to page 34 Q. 18 13296, which I think is 28th January 2015. 19 Yes, Judge. Α. Again, you might just help the Chairman and myself to 20 35 Q. 10:46 understand your handwriting here, but does it say: 21 22

"Mick Wallace asks Enda Kenny."

Yeah, that's correct.

25 Is that correct?

24

26

27 36 Q. Could you just read the balance, please, just so I

28 understand it.

Α.

29 A. I will read it?

2		Α.		
3			"Mick Wallace asks Enda Kenny when he was first aware	
4			of Garda malpractice in Athlone. Enda Kenny avoided	
5			answering. Mick Wallace asked him again. Enda Kenny	10:47
6			said, I'm not sure exactly what you're referring to."	
7				
8	38	Q.	So, is there some materials that you provided to Deputy	
9			Wallace, information?	
10		Α.	There was information that I had become aware of that I	10:47
11			provided, it was information and I provided it to	
12			Deputy Wallace.	
13	39	Q.	Could I ask you then, please, to turn on to 5th	
14			February 2015, at page 13297, please?	
15		Α.	Judge, that could have been the day Enda Kenny gave the	10:47
16			handwritten note to Deputy Wallace, to ask him to meet	
17			afterwards. I'm not sure if it's that date. But there	
18			was a handwritten note passed from the Taoiseach at the	
19			time to Mick Wallace to meet after the Dáil sitting in	
20			relation to it.	10:48
21	40	Q.	Can I just ask you then to turn over, please, to page	
22			13297, which is 5th February 2015?	
23		Α.	Going back to the 5th, is it?	
24	41	Q.	Please. Well, the 4th.	
25		Α.	Sorry. Yes.	10:48
26	42	Q.	I think there you have a reference to:	
27				
28			"Deputy Clare Daly alleges Ó Cualáin covered a whole	

37 Q. Please, if you will.

1

2

29

complaint against Garda".

Т				
2			Is that information you provided to Deputy Daly?	
3		Α.	No, it's not information I provided. I'm now aware of	
4			what it was, Judge. At the time it was	
5	43	Q.	No, no.	10:49
6		Α.	Well, if I can explain?	
7	44	Q.	No, you have already said you weren't involved in	
8			passing that information, that was my question?	
9		Α.	I wasn't involved, but I am aware of it, if you wish	
10	45	Q.	It's not relevant to this term of reference. What I	10:49
11			was asking you was, did you pass on the information to	
12			Deputy Daly and you said no?	
13		Α.	No.	
14	46	Q.	So, can we move on then, please, to the 25th March,	
15			which I think is a Wednesday, that is page 13304.	10:49
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	47	Q.	Can I ask you just to help us understand the writing	
18			there. Are there names of senior officers?	
19		Α.	Yes. On the 25th, Wednesday, March, Judge, I have a	
20			note of:	10:50
21				
22			"Assistant Commissioner Kieran Kenny, Assistant	
23			Commissioner John Twomey"	
24				
25			Now deputy commissioner.	10:50
26				
27			"Assistant Commissioner Donal Ó Cualáin, Chief	
28			Superintendent Aidan Glacken at Leinster House."	
29				

- 1 48 Q. You're off sick that day, is that something you're monitoring from your home?
- A. Judge, I was looking at the journal and the top cover image for that date on the journal had a photograph,

5 ironically, of those four individuals walking into

6 Leinster House. It caught my eye, because this is

incredible, because AC Ó Cualáin is investigating one

of the other persons in the photo and the two of them

10:50

10:50

10:51

10:51

10:51

were walking in side by side. And that's why I made

the note of that. And it's there on the journal, I

would imagine, if anyone wishes to go back and few the

photograph, that was the cover photograph. I don't

think they even had an article in relation to it, it

just happened to be a photograph they took as their

main cover photograph that day.

- 16 49 Q. I think you refer to that at the top of the next page, 17 the 26th, is that right?
- 18 A. Yes.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

- 19 50 Q. Even though that in fact relates to the 25th?
- 20 A. Yeah.

21 51 Q. So, is this an example of you writing things after the

22 event?

- A. But sure, after the event, we're talking about, what,
- this is within a 24-hour period.
- 25 52 Q. Yes, but it's not on the same day, that's fine.
- A. Sorry?
- 27 53 Q. It's not on the same day, I think you will agree?
- 28 A. Well, I mean, look, if I had written in that at 11:55pm
- or I wrote it in at, let's say, 12:05am, we're in two

- different days. It was within a 24-hour period.
- 2 54 Q. I wonder if I could ask you to be shown on the booklet,
- please, Volume 8, at page 2062. Garda Keogh, this is
- 4 the statement of Superintendent Patrick Murray. He
- will say in his evidence that his first meeting with

10:52

10:53

- 6 you is on 26th March 2015; isn't that right?
- 7 A. That's the first official meeting in Athlone, yeah.
- 8 55 Q. Yes. In terms of the next sequence, he will say, that
- on 1st April 2015, Deputy Wallace raised the
- interaction between Superintendent Murray and you in
- 11 Dáil Éireann in relation to the question of your car
- tax, do you remember that?
- 13 A. I would have made an issue over the car tax with Deputy
- 14 Wallace.
- 15 56 Q. Would you agree that you supplied that information to
- 16 Deputy Wallace to deploy in the Dáil?
- 17 A. I gave that information to Deputy Wallace and, Judge,
- just for clarification, deputies Wallace and Daly don't
- go shouting about everything just because someone like
- 20 me says it. So there's plenty of stuff I had told them 10:53
- 21 that never cropped up in the Dáil. And, indeed, as
- 22 we --
- 23 57 Q. Garda Keogh --
- A. No, I have to back this up. In relation to even Luke
- 25 Ming Flanagan, he didn't mention anything in the Dáil
- 26 until he got an affidavit. So it's not that these are
- 27 unscrupulous and they are jumping up and down just
- because the first guard comes to tell them a story.
- MR. McGUINNESS: I am sorry to interrupt Mr. Murphy,

Т			but there has been a reference made there to ball on	
2			the 1st April, and we have circulated the debate for	
3			the entirety of that day, which is now in Volume 55, it	
4			doesn't appear to record any such mention of the car	
5			tax issue or any similar item.	10:5
6			MR. MURPHY: well, I will pass on from that and return	
7			to it. There is a document that I will discuss with	
8			Mr. McGuinness.	
9	58	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Did you think that Deputy Wallace raised the	
10			car tax issue?	10:5
11		Α.	I can't remember exactly. I'll just check my diary	
12			for	
13			MR. MURPHY: But I think you did tell us, Garda Keogh,	
14			that had you told him about the tax issue.	
15	59	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You told him about the tax?	10:5
16		Α.	Yeah, I would have told him. I can't remember if he	
17			raised it. I don't know if he would have raised it. I	
18			don't know is the answer, Judge. Anything that was	
19			raised in the Dáil will be on Dáil records.	
20	60	Q.	MR. MURPHY: was it your intention when telling him	10:5
21			about the car tax that he would then publish that	
22			information in the Dáil?	
23		Α.	No, Deputy Wallace doesn't publish anything in the	
24			Dáil. Obviously it would go onto the Dáil record.	
25			But, no, I told Deputy Wallace lots of other things	10:5
26			that certainly never went any further.	
27	61	Q.	Is it the case though	
28		Α.	And just for clarification. Judge, because the way this	

29

is going, it's as if I am the only member of An Garda

- 1 Síochána that speaks to Deputy Wallace and Daly.
- 2 Judge, there's an awful lot of other guards, members of
- 3 the force and retired members that are in touch with
- 4 them. Because anybody that would find themselves in
- any sort of a similar situation, they're the tried and

10:55

10:55

10:56

- 6 tested and proven people to go to, and anyone with
- 7 common sense would go to them. So they are hearing
- 8 various things from members of An Garda Síochána from
- 9 across the country of different ranks and the way this
- appears to be spun is that everything, like that
- western region incident, came from me. I knew nothing
- 12 about that.
- 13 62 Q. You see, Garda Keogh, we're not talking about other
- guards in this issue, we're talking about you. So I
- think you've agreed that you told Deputy Wallace about this information. Can I take it from that, that it was
- 17 your intention that he would publish this and speak
- 18 about this in the Dáil?
- 19 A. No, Judge. As I've said, I have told Deputies Wallace
- and Daly numerous other things in relation to -- that
- 21 never cropped their heads up. You know, they evaluate
- themselves. It's not as a case that I'd say to them, I
- want you to say this in the Dáil. That is not the way
- they work. I tell them the story, they will listen,
- they will ask me certain questions, that's it. What
- they use -- there's certain times that never -- where I
- 27 would be expecting them to bring up matters on policing
- and they would move, for example, it could be something
- to do with Wexford or Dublin north central, to do with

- their constituencies, and it's not used at all. It
- depends. They have the information, they use that
- 3 whatever way -- it's not -- I have no further part in
- 4 it, other than I inform them of any wrongdoing that I'm

10:57

10:57

10:57

- 5 aware of.
- 6 63 Q. And can we take it that you were hopeful that they
- 7 would speak about it in the Dáil?
- 8 A. I mean, I can't, I can't answer that, because there's a
- 9 whole sequence of events. And at that point in time,
- it may not have been relevant to bring it up in the
- 11 Dáil, you know.
- 12 64 Q. CHAIRMAN: Can I ask you a question?
- 13 A. Yes, Judge.
- 14 65 Q. CHAIRMAN: Why did you tell them about the car tax?
- 15 A. Judge, the whole thing with the car tax was --
- 16 66 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, no, just --
- 17 A. Oh, yeah.
- 18 67 Q. CHAIRMAN: It is a simple question: Why did you tell
- 19 them about the car tax?
- 20 A. Because I believed --
- 21 68 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am trying to ask as neutral a question as
- 22 I possibly can.
- 23 A. Yes. I believe I was being targeted in relation to the
- car tax. I mean, we have already --
- 25 69 Q. CHAIRMAN: As early as the 1st April, is that right?
- 26 A. The 1st --
- 27 70 Q. CHAIRMAN: So the meeting was on the 26th March.
- 28 A. Yeah, then I got disciplined for the car tax. So I had
- been disciplined -- or -- look it, I can't remember.

- But it's in that time period I did they will them about
- 2 the car tax.
- 3 71 Q. MR. MURPHY: I wonder if you could be, please, shown
- 4 Volume 22, page 6467, please?
- 5 A. Just for clarification, Judge, like this car and the
- 6 previous car I had was exactly the same, with only two

10:58

10:58

10:58

- 7 seats in it. So I'm driving the same vehicle for
- 8 years.
- 9 72 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 10 A. And there's no issue at all. And actually, those
- sub-claims, I meant to say, Judge, they were for
- periods on duty, I wasn't using the car privately.
- 13 That's irrelevant, but then, when I become a
- 14 whistleblower there's a huge issue with my car tax.
- 15 73 Q. CHAIRMAN: I think we have been over the car tax.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 74 Q. CHAIRMAN: If there is something extra, well and good.
- 18 A. No, no.
- 19 75 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am sort of reluctant to explore it. I
- just wanted to ask you what you thought. The reason
- 21 you said you raised it with Deputy Wallace was that you
- felt -- sorry, do we have a date for that meeting with
- Deputy Wallace, when you told him about the car tax?
- 24 A. Judge...
- 25 76 Q. CHAIRMAN: It's not important if you don't.
- 26 A. I have it -- I wouldn't have --
- 27 77 Q. CHAIRMAN: Superintendent Murray thinks that --
- MR. McGUINNESS: I can help you on that, Chairman.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: Yes, thanks.

Τ			MR. MCGUINNESS: Garda Keogh's diary appears to record	
2			that on the 30th March -	
3			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
4			MR. McGUINNESS: - he met Deputy Wallace and Daly.	
5	78	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Are you happy with that, 30th March?	10:59
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	79	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And you told them about the car tax?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9			MR. MURPHY: In fact, that's a meeting which we	
10			discussed a few days ago, it says in the entry on the	10:59
11			30th March, which is page 13305:	
12				
13			"Met Mick and Clare and Sergeant McCabe. My first time	
14			to meet Sergeant McCabe."	
15				10:59
16			It's a reference we dealt with several days ago. You	
17			accept that?	
18		Α.	Yeah, yeah.	
19			CHAIRMAN: So the 30th March, okay.	
20	80	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Within that very short time, Garda Keogh,	10:59
21			the position is that you were making complaints to TDs	
22			and you go one step further on Volume 22, page 6467,	
23			please. I think this is the letter which you wrote,	
24			it's your handwriting, to Assistant Commissioner Fintan	
25			Fanning, is that correct?	11:00
26		Α.	Yes. Can I just read it first?	
27	81	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes, take your time. Familiarise yourself	
28			with it.	
29		Α.	Yes.	

Т	82	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I think the position is that in this	
2			letter addressed to Assistant Commissioner Fintan	
3			Fanning, you say that:	
4				
5			"On 8th May 2014 I made a formal complaint of Garda	11:00
6			malpractice in the Athlone division. The said matter	
7			is under investigation."	
8				
9			And then:	
10				11:00
11			"Over the last year I have been advised by members of	
12			An Garda Síochána, both my current Westmeath division	
13			and my previous Wicklow division to speak to yourself."	
14				
15			Could I ask you to read out the next few words, please?	11:00
16		Α.		
17			"I am now being advised by both independent TDs Clare	
18			Daly and Mick Wallace to speak to you. I am aware that	
19			you are the assistant commissioner for the region and I	
20			would be obliged if you would consider meeting with	11:01
21			me. "	
22				
23	83	Q.	So, I think that request is one that you made at the	
24			suggestion of Deputies Wallace and Daly?	
25		Α.	Not as simple as that, Judge. There's the first part	11:01
26			where I wasn't asked to read out, and that is:	
27				
28			"I have been advised by members of An Garda Síochána in	
29			both my current Westmeath division and my previous	

1			Wicklow division to speak to yourself."	
2				
3			The reason that is, Judge, is, I would have maintained	
4			a lot of contact with a lot of members of An Garda	
5			Síochána throughout the country, because some	11:01
6			transferred, so I'd a lot of contacts. All the gardaí,	
7			from when I was telling them there's serious problems	
8			with what's going on here, there's serious problems	
9			with this investigation, virtually every one of them	
10			said, go to Fanning. I didn't know anything about	11:01
11			Assistant Commissioner Fanning, but these were people	
12			that I trusted, members of the force that I was	
13			confiding in, and they all happened to say the same	
14			thing, go to Fanning. Now there was another assistant	
15			commissioner that I was advised to speak to as well,	11:02
16			retired now, Assistant Commissioner Byrne, but the bulk	
17			of these then to Fanning.	
18	84	Q.	You are also clearly saying:	
19				
20			"I have now been advised by Independent TDs Clare Daly	11:02
21			and Mick Wallace to speak to you."	
22				
23			So, they told you to speak to Assistant Commissioner	
24			Fanning as well?	
25		Α.	On top of members of all the other members of An Garda	11:02
26			Síochána on the ground.	
27	85	Q.	CHAIRMAN: All roads led to Assistant Commissioner	
28			Fanning?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 86 Q. CHAIRMAN: Wicklow, Westmeath and Dáil Éireann.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 4 87 Q. MR. MURPHY: Can I ask you then to go back, please, to 5 page 2062? I am moving to the end of mid December

6 2015. I think the position is that both Mr. Wallace

7 and Ms. Daly accused Superintendent Murray in public,

in Dáil Éireann, of harassing and bullying you, and

11:02

11:03

11:03

11:04

11:04

wrongly classifying crimes in the district in a

deliberate fashion; isn't that right?

11 A. Yes.

8

9

10

- 12 88 Q. Did you tell that information to them with the hope and expectation that they would say it in the Dáil?
- A. I passed on that information to them because at the time there was a whole issue to do with fiddling of figures. It was not just in the Dáil, Deputy Wallace and Daly were members of the justice committee also, Judge. So they had a, what's the word, a more prevalent role in matters than just asking questions in the Dáil.
- 21 89 Q. But in this case, I have to suggest to you, Garda 22 Keogh, that what you are doing is you are targeting 23 Superintendent Murray by name, isn't that right?
- A. That's an interesting way of putting it, I'm exposing corruption.
- 26 90 Q. And again I have to suggest to you what you are doing 27 is you are targeting him because you are doing it in a 28 forum where you know he can't reply, where he can't 29 speak back and which is covered by Dáil privilege,

1			isn't that right?	
2		Α.	Superintendent Murray has the whole of Garda management	
3			behind him here. I have nobody. I am the one that has	
4			to go to Deputies Wallace and Daly.	
5	91	Q.	Garda Keogh, did you hold a press conference outside	11:04
6			Dáil Éireann, away from parliamentary buildings to say	
7			these things?	
8		Α.	Did I?	
9	92	Q.	Yes, with Deputy Wallace and Deputy Daly?	
10		Α.	No, I didn't.	11:04
11	93	Q.	So you knew they were availing of Dáil privilege as the	
12			place in which they were saying these things. You knew	
13			that they were protected in saying these things?	
14		Α.	No, as I said, I provided with all the relevant	
15			information, after that it was up to them what	11:04
16			they did. There's many, many things they did not use	
17			in the Dáil.	
18	94	Q.	Are you suggesting to the Chairman seriously that it	
19			was an accident that you gave this information about	
20			Superintendent Murray and it just happened to be	11:05
21		Α.	There was no accident, there was a lot of other things	
22			that I would have told them that were never used.	
23	95	Q.	Was it clearly the case that this was a deliberate ploy	
24			on your part to ensure that Superintendent Murray would	
25			be vilified in public?	11:05
26		Α.	No. This is what you call exposing corruption.	
27			There's corruption here. And, Judge, just to go back	
28			to how this happened and where this emanated from.	
29			This emanated from the robbery from the person	

1			incident, which was declassified, and where I had to,	
2			in the chain of correspondence, to go back, writing in	
3			relation to the robbery from the person, where I	
4			discovered then that he had declassified that incident.	
5			That's where then I looked at other incidents, and I	11:05
6			saw a lot of other incidents that he had declassified.	
7			I then printed those off and I brought them to the	
8			attention of Deputy Wallace and Daly.	
9	96	Q.	Again I have to suggest to you that there's no	
10			foundation for the allegation that this is corruption.	11:06
11			But this is you putting a spin on these matters. If I	
12			can ask you, please, to see page 2523, please, which is	
13			the following?	
14		Α.	Judge, I would argue it is Mr. Murphy's spin on	
15			matters.	11:06
16	97	Q.	2523, please. Can I draw your attention to the second	
17			last paragraph on the page? There is a reference there	
18			to:	
19				
20			"We know for a fact"	11:06
21				
22			Third line:	
23				
24			"that the massaging of figures is still continuing.	
25			In recent weeks Superintendent Pat Murray station in	11:06
26			the midlands and Athlone, we have seen direct evidence	
27			of at least eight cases where crimes were written down	
28			so the original crime was reclassified as a more minor	
29			matter. It is clear evidence of massaging the figures.	

Τ		for example changing burglaries to criminal damage,	
2		which is reclassification. This is a very serious	
3		situation. The Garda inspector was clear this is	
4		lawlessness out there which has not been addressed. We	
5		need a strong code of ethics with strong human rights	11:07
6		at n the centre."	
7			
8		And goes on to talk about the Bill.	
9		CHAIRMAN: Just identify that, Mr. Murphy.	
10		MR. MURPHY: It's Deputy Daly's speech in the Dáil on	11:07
11		that date.	
12		CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
13		MR. MURPHY: 15/12/2015.	
14		CHAIRMAN: 15/12?	
15		MR. MURPHY: 2015.	11:07
16		CHAIRMAN: Thank you. You have a question about that?	
17	98 Q.	MR. MURPHY: Yes. I have to suggest to you that that	
18		is a specific that is an information that you	
19		provided Deputy Daly in the hope and expectation that	
20		Superintendent Murray would be accused of criminal	11:07
21		conduct with the protection of Dáil privilege, isn't	
22		that correct?	
23	Α.	Judge, just on reading this first line here, sorry, the	
24		first line in the last paragraph:	
25			11:07
26		"It is a very serious situation and the Garda	
27		inspectorate was clear that there is lawlessness out	
28		there that is not being addressed."	
29			

- 1 99 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. So, I have never disputed I have gave this information,

11:08

11:08

11:09

- I've gone into how it came to be. It was actually
- 4 Superintendent Murray that set this into train. I
- 5 printed off those examples, I gave them to Deputy
- 6 Wallace and Daly, and that's it.
- 7 100 Q. You see --
- 8 A. They then had evidence to back up whatever they wanted
- 9 to say. After that, I mean, it's not like I'm pulling
- strings, using them as puppets. They are very much
- their own independently minded people.
- 12 101 Q. Garda Keogh, they're in your circle of trust, as you
- called it earlier on in your evidence. I have to
- suggest to you, what are you doing here is deliberately
- targeting your superior by accusing him criminal
- offences falsely, by passing on this information to
- 17 Deputy Wallace Deputy Daly in the hope and expectation
- that they will use Dáil privilege to attack
- 19 Superintendent Murray, isn't that what's going on here?
- 20 A. You used that word falsely.
- 21 102 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. Can you clarify that in your question there, please?
- 23 103 Q. Here's the question, has Superintendent Murray been
- convicted of any offences of corruption? Yes or no.
- 25 A. No.
- 26 104 Q. Has Superintendent Murray been prosecuted for any
- offence involving corruption? Yes or no.
- 28 A. No.
- 29 105 Q. Therefore, there is absolutely no basis to suggest

- corruption against Superintendent Murray and you know that.
- A. That's false though. That last part is false, because that's not the case.
- 5 106 Q. You see --

A. In fact, actually, when you go into this, in relation
to that whole thing with declassifying and all that
messing, I don't think anyone -- with all that went on,

11:09

11 . 09

11:09

9 I don't think any member of Garda management was ever

10 prosecuted or dealt with in any way in relation to

11 that.

- 12 107 Q. Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to you that you know 13 full well that there is no evidence of corruption.
- What you are doing here is circumventing the system by putting information to the deputies in the hope that

they will effectively attack Superintendent Murray.

17 Publicly you can stand back and say, nothing to do with

18 me?

19 A. Judge, that's false. That's not true. Because there
20 is evidence of corruption and I gave it to them. I
21 said, yes, I printed them off -- printed it off and I

gave it to them. I gave them the evidence.

- 23 108 Q. Would you agree with me that you wanted them to say this in the Dáil?
- A. Mr. Murphy is saying there was no evidence. I'm saying 11:10
  yes, there was evidence, it was me that printed it off
  and gave it to them.
- 28 109 Q. You see, what's involved here, Garda Keogh, is you putting your speculation and conjecture and then giving

- 1 it to the TDs in the hope that they will go and mention
- it in the Dáil; isn't that what's happening here?
- 3 A. Judge, no.
- 4 110 Q. CHAIRMAN: Did you think he was guilty of corruption?
- 5 A. Sorry?

11:10

11:11

- 6 111 Q. CHAIRMAN: Did you think he was guilty of corruption?
- 7 A. Judge, yes. But it's a lower level of -- like in the
- 8 scheme of things it's very low level stuff, Judge. But
- 9 it is, Judge.
- 10 112 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. What did you think was the proper way 11:10
- of dealing with an allegation of corruption?
- 12 A. Well, I wouldn't go through -- I couldn't go through
- the Guards.
- 14 113 Q. CHAIRMAN: Should it be investigated?
- 15 A. The investigation could happen via Deputy Wallace.
- 16 114 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, Mr. Murphy is suggesting to you that
- 17 giving it to the deputies for use in the Dáil was
- unfair, because it presumed he was guilty. What about
- the presumption of innocence?
- 20 A. I understand.
- 21 115 Q. CHAIRMAN: Was he entitled to defend himself?
- 22 A. He would be entitled.
- 23 116 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is everybody not entitled to defend
- 24 themselves?
- 25 A. Sorry.
- 26 117 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is everybody not entitled to defend
- 27 themselves?
- 28 A. Oh absolutely, absolutely.
- 29 118 Q. CHAIRMAN: And to the presumption of innocence?

- 1 A. Yes, I understand that, yes.
- 2 119 Q. CHAIRMAN: where does that happen in relation to the
- 3 allegations of corruption?
- 4 A. Judge, all I did was print off the information. I gave

11:11

11:12

11 · 12

- 5 it to deputies Wallace and Daly, after that --
- 6 120 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do you see what I am getting at?
- 7 A. I totally understand.
- 8 121 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am not trying to get up on your back, but
- 9 I mean, this was mentioned in the Morris report, we
- 10 know?
- 11 A. Yeah.
- 12 122 Q. CHAIRMAN: For circumstances where the deputies
- actually sent the information to the Minister and Judge
- 14 Morris was critical of them for not checking it out.
- 15 A. But, Judge, that wasn't Wallace -- I don't think that
- was Wallace and Daly.
- 17 123 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, no, no, absolutely. No, totally
- different, absolutely. Anyway, what do you say to the
- 19 charge that that was convicting him without giving him
- 20 a chance to defend himself?
- 21 A. Well, Judge, the way the system works is, whether it's
- right or wrong, I was entitled to do what I did. And I
- was entitled under section 2 of the An Garda Síochána
- Act to bring that to a TD. I brought that lawfully and
- legally to a TD. After that, it's up to them whether
- they want to use it. And I understand at the time
- there were topical issues where the guards I think were
- 28 turning around -
- 29 124 Q. CHAIRMAN: clearly.

1		Α.	- saying everything was wonderful and there is no	
2			problem, this is all sorted. And I was saying, no,	
3			look, this is still going on here.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
5	125	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, would you agree with me that	11:12
6			the way in which these words were uttered suggested	
7			that there was no doubt about it but that	
8			Superintendent Murray was guilty?	
9		Α.	Judge, as I said, I noted the words, I provided the	
10			evidence.	11:13
11	126	Q.	But you did cause it to be, Garda Keogh, didn't you?	
12		Α.	I provided the evidence. After that, whatever wording,	
13			the way things were worded or whatever was said, it was	
14			brought up, as I said there was plenty of things	
15			weren't brought up.	11:13
16	127	Q.	Did you go back, Garda Keogh, to Deputy Wallace and to	
17			Deputy Daly and say to them, you shouldn't have said	
18			that, please don't say that again?	
19		Α.	No, I did not, Judge.	
20	128	Q.	I think we can infer from that, I would like the	11:13
21			Chairman to infer from that that you were quite happy	
22			to allow this allegation sit out there without any	

25 A. I dispute that, because once again you said without any 11:13 26 proof, there was proof, and I have given it to Deputy 27 Wallace and Deputy Daly.

proof because you were trying to target Superintendent

28 129 Q. You know as a serving officer that if you have proof of criminality, you submit that through a criminal

Murray; isn't that right?

23

24

1 process? 2 Judge, I only after saying a second ago I wouldn't even Α. 3 call it criminality, I'd call it corruption, probably at a lower level, but it is corruption. 4 5 130 Again I have to suggest to you that that's completely Q. 11:13 6 incorrect. If we move forward to January 2016. 7 ask you, please, to provide 2528 in Volume 9. 8 2528. Α. Yes, please. 9 131 Q. 10 Α. Yes. 11:14 11 132 Do you have that? Q. 12 Yes. Α. 13 This is effectively a note taken by Superintendent 133 Q. 14 Murray in relation to a discussion with Garda Greene? 15 Yeah. Α. 11:14 16 He will say that Garda Greene called to his office on 134 0. 17 that day about summonses, but also he told 18 Superintendent Murray that he was aware that you were 19 about to have Deputies Daly and Wallace run a story. Well, that's what's written here. 20 Α. 11:15 21 135 Sorry, Chairman, can I show something to Q. 22 Mr. McGuinness? 23 Certainly. CHAI RMAN: 24 Judge, can I ask someone for a lend of a pen? Α. CHAI RMAN: 25 Certainly. 11:15 Perhaps in ease of reference, I might show 26 MR. MURPHY:

a second document about the same issue.

Yes.

CHAI RMAN:

MR. MURPHY:

27

28

29

That is to say 2529. 2529, please.

1			CHAIRMAN: 2529. It's the same thing but redacted, is	
2			that right?	
3			MR. MURPHY: It's a slightly larger version of the same	
4			thing.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	11:16
6			MR. MURPHY: I think that Mr. McGuinness was concerned	
7			to do with names that were irrelevant?	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
9			MR. MURPHY: Mr. McGuinness is happy I should use this	
10			document?	11:16
11			CHAIRMAN: Take a moment to read that one. What is	
12			your question about it? Have you read that, Garda	
13			Keogh?	
14			WITNESS: Yes, Judge.	
15	136	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Superintendent Murray will say that Garda	11:17
16			Greene told him that you had said to Garda Greene that	
17			you were trying to get something on Superintendent	
18			Murray and you thought you had something, and claimed	
19			that you were going to get on to deputies Daly and	
20			Wallace to mention it in the Dáil in an effort to	11:17
21			damage Superintendent Murray and his reputation?	
22		Α.	Judge, that is to do with a conversation between Garda	
23			Greene and Superintendent Murray. However, there is a	
24			part of it, there is a little bit of truth in this,	
25			Judge. A rumour went around the station when the	11:17
26			superintendent first arrived, to do with I won't go	
27			into it, it was a false rumour basically.	
28	137	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean, if fairness to you, whatever about	
29			the point about your disposition, if you like, towards	

1 Superintendent Murray, the point here is, whether you 2 were disappointed or not, the fact is you discovered it wasn't true and then didn't proceed with it? 3 Judae --4 Α. 5 CHAI RMAN: I mean, I can well imagine that you would 11:18 6 say, well look, that actually shows that I was trying 7 to be as careful as possible to make sure it was true. 8 There I go, when I shouldn't be intervening but I imagine that that --9 I will perhaps answer the Chair's 10 138 MR. MURPHY: Q. 11 · 18 11 question. The next sentence indicates that you were 12 very disappointed and would keep trying. 13 Judge, no, no, no. Α. 14 139 Q. Is that what you told him, Garda Keogh? 15 Α. No. 11:18 16 Is that what you told Garda Greene? 140 Q. 17 I can't remember what I told him. If I can explain. Α. 18 141 CHAI RMAN: Yes, hold on. Wait now. We're getting a Q. 19 little confused. Mr. Murphy is saying to you, look, 20 accepting that you discovered that this adverse 11:18 material about Superintendent Murray was not true. 21 22 Can I clarify just this? Α. 23 I don't want to know what the material was 142 CHAI RMAN: Q. 24 or anything else. 25 No, I won't go into that. Α. 11:19 26 143 CHAIRMAN: Okay. You understand where we are going. 0.

Yes, go on.

Murray.

27

28

29

Α.

A rumour went around the station about Superintendent

- 1 144 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 2 A. It was rampant around the station. Everyone was
- yapping about it. Obviously I heard it. So I went
- further and I went to -- I was able to establish the
- source of the rumour, which emanated from a different

11:19

11:19

11:19

11 · 19

- 6 Garda station in a different division.
- 7 145 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes?
- 8 A. I was able to basically find out that that rumour was
- 9 not true.
- 10 146 Q. CHAIRMAN: Was not true?
- 11 A. Was not true.
- 12 147 Q. CHAIRMAN: If you had found it was true, would you have
- gone to Deputies Daly and Wallace with it?
- 14 A. Oh, probably, yes, Judge.
- 15 148 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. So is it right to say that you might
- have been a little disappointed at discovering that
- 17 your enemy was actually in the clear, so to speak?
- 18 A. That's fair enough but, Judge, it was me that
- 19 established the rumour was false. And I then went back
- 20 to others in Athlone Garda Station and --
- 21 149 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am with you, I am understanding your
- 22 point?
- 23 A. And said that rumour is not true.
- 24 CHAIRMAN: I follow.
- 25 150 Q. MR. MURPHY: But you keep trying looking for another
- one, is that right?
- 27 A. I don't --
- 28 151 Q. Is that what you said to Garda Greene; very
- 29 disappointed but will keep trying?

- 1 A. These are Superintendent Murray's notes so --
- 2 152 Q. That's what he was told by Garda Greene?
- 3 A. I have already said from the first week, the problem
- 4 with Superintendent Murray's notes is, there's some
- 5 truth, there's some stuff that's false and then there's 11:20
- 6 some stuff where there's half truths and twisted stuff.
- 7 They were a nightmare to go through when I was reading
- 8 them, Judge.
- 9 153 Q. Superintendent Murray will say that he told Garda
- 10 Greene that he was concerned for your welfare and he

11 · 20

11:20

11 · 21

- felt that you should take the CMO's advice and you
- should go for treatment for alcohol?
- 13 A. These are Superintendent Murray's notes, Judge.
- 14 154 Q. CHAIRMAN: Of a conversation with Garda Greene.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 155 Q. CHAIRMAN: And their only real relevance is in the
- implication that you said this to Garda Greene or that
- 18 Garda Greene transmitted this ultimately to you?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 156 Q. CHAIRMAN: Came back to you and said listen, you better 11:20
- 21 get treatment for --
- 22 A. Judge, there is another issue to touch on.
- 23 157 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- A. I don't know when exactly, it will be in my diaries,
- but I had become aware that Garda Greene was going up
- 26 to -- spending a lot of time in Superintendent Murray's
- office. Judge, based on that, without going into it, I
- gave Garda Greene a little bit of misinformation and,
- 29 Judge, Superintendent Minnock, within about a week,

		came back to me with this piece of misinformation. So	
		I knew Garda Greene was telling stories or talking,	
		talking shop with Superintendent Murray. Judge, after	
		that	
158	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yourself and Colleen Rooney would be in this	11:2
		division, isn't that right!	
	Α.	Judge, after that	
159	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Isn't that right?	
	Α.	Yes, Judge. After that, a lot of the stuff that I told	
		to Garda Greene, Judge, was not a lot of the stuff,	11:2
		there was a lot of porkies thrown in there,	
		misinformation is the word there, and he was running	
		back with this to Superintendent Murray, just for	
		clarification.	
		CHAIRMAN: Okay.	11:2
160	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Superintendent Murray will say that he	
		asked Garda Greene to tell you that he was not your	
		enemy but he was concerned for your welfare. Did Garda	
		Greene pass that message on to you?	
	Α.	I don't, I mean I can't	11:2
161	Q.	Is it possible that he did?	
	Α.	I know Garda Greene would have spoken highly of	
		Superintendent Murray. I knew that.	
162	Q.	At that stage did Garda Greene speak to you and suggest	
		to you that maybe you should go for counselling?	11:2
	Α.	I don't recall that. At the time Garda Greene himself	
		had been through his own stresses with various stuff	
		that went on in Athlone also.	
	159 160 161	A. 159 Q. A. 160 Q.  A. 161 Q. A.	I knew Garda Greene was telling stories or talking, talking shop with Superintendent Murray. Judge, after that  158 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yourself and Colleen Rooney would be in this division, isn't that right!  A. Judge, after that  159 Q. CHAIRMAN: Isn't that right?  A. Yes, Judge. After that, a lot of the stuff that I told to Garda Greene, Judge, was not a lot of the stuff, there was a lot of porkies thrown in there, misinformation is the word there, and he was running back with this to Superintendent Murray, just for clarification.  CHAIRMAN: okay.  160 Q. MR. MURPHY: Superintendent Murray will say that he asked Garda Greene to tell you that he was not your enemy but he was concerned for your welfare. Did Garda Greene pass that message on to you?  A. I don't, I mean I can't  161 Q. Is it possible that he did?  A. I know Garda Greene would have spoken highly of Superintendent Murray. I knew that.  162 Q. At that stage did Garda Greene speak to you and suggest to you that maybe you should go for counselling?  A. I don't recall that. At the time Garda Greene himself had been through his own stresses with various stuff

29 163 Q. Is it the case that at this stage you knew that the CMO

1			thought that you needed to go for treatment in relation	
2			to your	
3		Α.	Sorry?	
4	164	Q.	Didn't you know at this stage, in January 2016, that	
5			the CMO was recommending that you would go for	11:23
6			treatment for your alcohol problem?	
7		Α.	I wouldn't dispute that.	
8	165	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	But bear in mind, there was also a serious amount of	
10			stress here. We're forgetting that part of it.	11:23
11	166	Q.	If we move on then, please, back to the statement,	
12			Volume 8, at page 2062. Now, on 18th January 2016, we	
13			know that Superintendent Murray applied for promotion	
14			to the rank of chief superintendent and that there had	
15			been a competition advertised on 23rd December 2015, do	11:23
16			you see that?	
17		Α.	Which paragraph?	
18	167	Q.	2062, last paragraph, please?	
19		Α.	Okay.	
20	168	Q.	You're aware at this stage, are you not, that on the	11:23
21			18th January 2016 that Superintendent Murray applied	
22			for promotion to the rank of chief superintendent and	
23			there had been a competition advertised on 23rd	
24			December 2015?	
25		Α.	Okay.	11:24
26	169	Q.	You were aware of that at the time, were you not?	
27		Α.	I wasn't aware of when he applied for promotion.	
28	170	Q.	Were you aware that there were promotions effectively	
29			being reviewed at the time?	

- 1 A. I became aware at some stage in 2016 that there were --
- 2 that he would have got -- had -- that he was on
- 3 promotion lists or something. But obviously I would
- 4 never have known when he applied for promotion or
- 5 anything like that. The first I would have heard was

- 6 when he would have appeared on a promotion list.
- 7 171 Q. He will say that he was called for interview on 4th May
- 8 2016?
- 9 A. Okay.
- 10 172 Q. He says that he now realises that on 16th May 2016, you 11:24
- 11 wrote to the Minister for Justice and Equality and
- 12 complained about him?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 173 Q. Can I ask you to be shown the following document. In
- 15 view of that, you wrote first of all on that date and I 11:25
- think you also wrote at a later stage, on 14/5, is that
- 17 right?
- 18 A. I can't remember off hand. But, Judge, I wrote a
- 19 number of letters to Ms. Fitzgerald, the Minister for
- 20 Justice, and later Tánaiste. I had trust in
- 21 Ms. Fitzgerald and that's why I wrote the letters to
- 22 her.
- 23 174 Q. Let's just take one example. Can I ask you to turn to
- 24 Volume 24, 7128, please.
- A. When I say had, had and have, she has not done anything 11:25
- 26 wrong to diminish -- just for clarification, Judge.
- 27 175 Q. Just before we come to that, can I ask you to go back,
- please, first of all, to page 2063, Volume 9? Have
- those two volumes side by side, please.

- 1 A. Okay.
- 2 176 Q. So Volume 9, please.
- 3 A. 2063?
- 4 177 Q. Volume 8, I beg your pardon. Volume 8, at page 2063,
- yes, please. Do you see that on 20th May 2016, Garda

11 · 26

11:26

11:27

11 . 27

- 6 Greene called to Superintendent Murray's office and he
- will say that he was informed by Garda Greene that he,
- 8 Garda Greene, had spoken with you the night before and
- 9 you had expressed dissatisfaction with the fact that
- 10 Chief Superintendent Wheatley and Sergeant Guinan
- called to your house on 17th May 2016, do you remember
- 12 that?
- 13 A. I remember them calling, I just don't remember this
- part but I'm not disputing it.
- 15 178 Q. Do you see the next bit: Garda Greene informed
- 16 Superintendent Murray that Garda Keogh had told you --
- sorry, that you had told him, rather, that you were at
- a high level that Chief Superintendent Glacken was to
- be promoted to assistant commissioner and that this was
- something that you found very annoying?
- 21 A. Judge, I see in this here now -- can I just read it
- 22 again? Yeah, Judge, I don't know did that even happen.
- 23 179 Q. Okay.
- 24 A. I don't know if he went -- I don't know, I can't
- comment on it.
- 26 180 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, hold on. The suggestion is that you
- 27 said this to Garda Greene.
- 28 A. Garda Greene. I may have, I don't know. I can't
- remember, Judge.

1			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
2	181	Q.	MR. MURPHY: But in the next sentence, Garda Keogh, I	
3			think the position is Garda Greene said that you	
4			expressed a view that the CMO was going to send you	
5			back to work, that you didn't want that, because you	11:28
6			thought people were conspiring against you. Do you	
7			remember telling him that?	
8		Α.	Well, I would have I mean, I would have informed	
9			Garda Greene would have I would have spoken to Garda	
10			Greene just in relation to a lot of the stuff that was	11:28
11			going on. So I don't dispute that. And I mean, what's	
12			interesting there is, that ties in with something else,	
13			where:	
14				
15			"Expressed the view that the CMO was going to send me	11:28
16			back to work and I didn't want that."	
17				
18			If you recall even back to last week, where they were	
19			trying to say the opposite, that the CMO marked me out	
20			on such a date in December as opposed to me and I	11:28
21			made the point, like, I didn't want to go back into	
22			work on 21st December, I had enough. I only lasted a	
23			few days after and went sick on the 26th January.	
24			Either way, this particular part, just back, reinforces	
25			I suppose last week's stuff	11:29
26	182	Q.	Garda Keogh, here we are in the middle of 2016 and	
27			Garda Greene also told Superintendent Murray that you	
28			had said you wanted to bring down the commissioner and	
29			Deputy Commissioner Ó Cualáin. Is that what you said	

1			to Garda Greene at that stage?	
2		Α.	I can't deny I would have said I can't remember	
3			saying it, but I certainly can't deny that that would	
4			have been something I would have said, Judge.	
5	183	Q.	Did you also indicate to Garda Greene that you will	11:29
6			engage with transparency Ireland through retired Garda	
7			John Wilson?	
8		Α.	Yes. Well, I mean that's accurate. Look, it appears	
9			accurate.	
10	184	Q.	Did you tell Garda Greene that you had engaged with the	11:29
11			media in relation to the way whistleblowers were	
12			treated and that you were aware allegations were going	
13			to be made against Sergeant Yvonne Martin?	
14		Α.	Judge, anything to do with those allegations against	
15			Sergeant Martin had nothing to do with me. That was a	11:29
16			separate matter. I've had the opportunity to apologise	
17			to Sergeant Martin, Judge, actually I know I'm not	
18			allowed talk to witnesses but just at the door, I did	
19			make an apology. But this part has nothing to do with	
20			me. And Sergeant Martin was vindicated in the last	11:30
21			part of the Tribunal. But that part, at the time I,	
22			along with most	
23	185	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But Mr. Murphy's question, sorry, Garda	
24			Keogh, Mr. Murphy's question is: Did you say this?	
25		Α.	I could have.	11:30
26			CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you very much.	
27	186	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I'm not saying you were making the	
28			allegation against Sergeant Martin?	
29			CHAIRMAN: No, absolutely.	

- 1 187 Q. MR. MURPHY: I'm simply saying you were aware that an
- 2 allegation was going to be made -
- 3 CHAIRMAN: You were referring to.
- 4 188 Q. MR. MURPHY: by somebody, isn't that right?
- 5 A. That's the way it appears.
- 6 189 Q. Would you agree with me that what you were aware of at

11:30

11:31

- 7 the time was that allegation was going to be made
- 8 against her in the Dáil?
- 9 A. Again, I don't -- I presume but I don't know. This was
- 10 nothing to do with me.
- 11 190 Q. CHAIRMAN: Somebody else was going to provide the
- information to name her in the Dáil, is that right?
- 13 A. Well, it wasn't -- the other person, Judge, I know --
- because the other member of An Garda Síochána, Judge,
- 15 who's not here, Judge, he would have had at the time a
- belief, like the rest of the country at the time I'm
- 17 sure, but that was all dealt with and both sergeants
- 18 were vindicated in the end as a result of that. It had
- 19 nothing do with me.
- 20 CHAIRMAN: I follow.
- 21 191 Q. MR. MURPHY: The superintendent took a note of that
- conversation, which he marked "PM 78". Can I ask you
- please to be shown Volume 9, at page 2530.
- A. Sorry, just the page?
- 25 192 Q. I will pass from that document, it's not the right one 11:32
- I want. I might come back. Perhaps I can pass on from
- that, please.
- 28 CHAIRMAN: So we can forget 2530 for the moment at
- 29 least.

Т			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
3	193	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Thank you. Just to come back to the	
4			position, engaged in that conversation, I think that in	
5			terms of the next development, Superintendent Murray	11:32
6			will say that he was telephoned on 21st May 2016 by	
7			Sergeant Martin, indicating that she received a call	
8			from the commissioner's office telling her she was to	
9			be named in the Dáil and in the media and that she was	
10			very upset about that?	11:32
11		Α.	That part has absolutely nothing to do with me.	
12			Absolutely zero to do with me.	
13			CHAIRMAN: That does appear to be the case, Mr. Murphy,	
14			doesn't it? I mean, he said that he was aware of	
15			allegations. He wasn't the source of them or anything	11:33
16			else but he was aware of them.	
17	194	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I am just putting to him that he was	
18			aware, no more than that, Chairman, yes.	
19		Α.	I had the same awareness as a lot of people.	
20			CHAIRMAN: I understand that. I am understanding you	11:33
21			simply said, look, I knew about them but they didn't	
22			emanate from me, I wasn't backing them up or anything	
23			of that kind but I had heard of them, as other people	
24			had. Okay.	
25	195	Q.	MR. MURPHY: By that date I think you had written, I	11:33
26			think it was your first letter to the Minister.	
27			Perhaps you could, please, be shown 3292 at Volume 11.	
28			If I can ask you to turn to page 3293?	

A. 3293, yes.

29

1	196	Q.	I want to focus on the Superintendent Murray references	
2			only, please, for this purpose. In the second	
3			paragraph I think you complain about Superintendent	
4			Murray and the fact that you were confined to desk	
5			duties in the public office due to going intermittently	11:34
6			sick with work related stress?	
7		Α.	Okay.	
8	197	Q.	You also say:	
9				
10			"Superintendent Murray had me recorded as sick with the	11:34
11			flu."	
12				
13			Do you see that? The second paragraph, last line?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	198	Q.	In terms of the issues, if you turn down two	11:34
16			paragraphs, you will see:	
17				
18			"On 9/12/2015, Superintendent Pat Murray held a case	
19			conference in Garda headquarters in relation me to	
20			going sick with flu, this was attended by three members	11:35
21			of An Garda Síochána, three civilians and a Garda	
22			doctor."	
23				
24		Α.	That's what I wrote.	
25	199	Q.	If you turn forward, please, to page 3296, which is the	11:35
26			last letter. There you raise three points: You ask	
27			that your Garda file be given to GSOC, number one; you	
28			request a copy of the Ó Cualáin report containing his	
29			findings of your allegations should be given to you;	

1			and third, you ask the Minister to give some	
2			consideration to ensuring that a person in your	
3			position, a whistleblower, who is on sick leave on work	
4			related stress should not be penalised financially.	
5			You make reference to pay which you identified as	11:35
6			penalisation?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	200	Q.	That's the letter that you sent to the Minister. That	
9			occurred I think four days between the conversation	
10			between Garda Greene and the superintendent on the 20th	11:35
11			May, that we just discussed?	
12		Α.	Okay. Actually, I forgot to say, Judge, in relation to	
13			point one there, to have an a Garda file handed over to	
14			GSOC without delay, Judge, when GSOC requested the	
15			Garda file, the Guards didn't give it to them	11:36
16			straightaway. It took five months and political	
17			pressure. It was actually Wallace, he did that much	
18			shouting about it in the Dáil, that was the only reason	
19			that the guards actually gave, five months later from	
20			the GSOC request, they handed over that file to GSOC.	11:36
21			This is the file in relation to the conspiracy to	
22			supply heroin.	
23	201	Q.	Just one more point before we come to the next phase of	
24			this progression, Garda Keogh. On 24th May 2016,	
25			Superintendent Murray will say that Inspector Minnock	11:36
26			reported that he called to you at your home on a	
27			welfare visit and that he found you drunk and drinking	
28			from a can of cider, do you remember that visit?	
29		Α.	I don't remember it. But just what page are we on	

1			here?	
2	202	Q.	That's at page 2063, this is statement of	
3			Superintendent Murray, Volume 8.	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5	203	Q.	So that in that situation Inspector Minnock reported	11:37
6			back that you had spoken to him, to Inspector Minnock,	
7			about bringing down the commissioner, then Deputy	
8			Commissioner Ó Cualáin and Superintendent Murray. Do	
9			you recall saying that to him?	
10		Α.	I don't recall it but I see that's said there. It	11:37
11			would be the kind of stuff I probably would have said,	
12			Judge.	
13	204	Q.	So I think it's fair to say that from that answer, that	
14			the Chairman can take it that certainly as of that date	
15			it was your intention to target Superintendent Murray	11:38
16			and to bring him down?	
17		Α.	Judge, the second line there, I mean, I have no problem	
18			in reading this out again, like Inspector Minnock	
19			reported he called to my house:	
20				11:38
21			"on a welfare visit and found him drunk and drinking	
22			from a can of cider."	
23				
24			Drunk and I'm on about this stuff. I mean Like, you	
25			know, do I need to even go I mean, I'm not disputing	11:38
26			it, it is certainly the kind of thing I would have	
27			said, Judge. I don't remember saying it but it would	
28			be definitely the kind of thing I would have said,	
29			Judge	

- 1 205 Q. Yes. And that's because that's what you thought at the time, isn't it, Garda Keogh?
- A. Well, you see, where are we here? We're in 2016?
- 4 206 Q. Yes.
- 5 A. My awareness to what's going on internally in the

11:39

11:39

11:39

11 - 40

- 6 Guards is growing and what I thought was mild
- 7 corruption was an understatement.
- 8 207 Q. Garda Keogh, can we just focus on the words you use
- 9 here "bringing down", can I put it to you that that
- suggests that you wanted to end the careers of the
- 11 commissioner, Deputy Commissioner Ó Cualáin and
- 12 Superintendent Murray? Isn't that what "bringing down"
- means?
- 14 A. That's what "bringing down" I suppose would mean but, I
  15 mean...
- 16 208 Q. So it wasn't a warning shot or a general warning to
- 17 behave better in the future, it was to bring their
- 18 careers to an end?
- 19 A. Judge, at that point in time, under commissioner Nóirín
- 20 O'Sullivan's watch, where she publicly, from 9th May
- 21 2014, said whistleblowers will be supported. Judge, I
- was being butchered, okay. Donal Ó Cualáin, I have
- 23 always said, was trying to do a cover up investigation
- in relation to the heroin thing. Superintendent
- 25 Murray, I've always maintained was a mere -- I haven't
- used the word before, but just a lackey for Assistant
- Commissioner Ó Cualáin to get me out of Athlone so he
- would have freer rein to do a cover up.
- 29 209 Q. Garda Keogh, obviously I disagree with you in those

1			opinions that you have expressed, but I think you	
2			accept, do you not, for the Chairman, that as of this	
3			date, May of 2016, your mind was made up, your mission	
4			was to bring down Superintendent Murray, bring an end	
5			to his career?	11:40
6		Α.	Judge	
7	210	Q.	If you could, isn't that right?	
8		Α.	Well, I mean, look, I am in serious conflict with all	
9			these people at this period in time, Judge.	
10	211	Q.	But you're also a person, Garda Keogh, who has	11:40
11			repeatedly over the last few days stressed your	
12			entitlement to fair procedures and to be given notice	
13			and to be treated fairly. I have to suggest to you	
14			what's is going on here is quite different. What you	
15			are doing here is indicating an intention to get these	11:40
16			people?	
17		Α.	Judge	
18	212	Q.	By whatever means?	
19		Α.	Judge, that would be the natural instinct for any	
20			person in my there's two natural instincts in a	11:41
21			human being and it's fight or flight. One is pack up,	
22			run, leave the country. Two, is stand my ground and	
23			fight. And, Judge, that's why I am here today in	
24			relation to this. I mean, I have plenty of evidence to	
25			reinforce my beliefs and pretty much put down in	11:41
26			general all these allegations about these three	
27			characters, I	
28	213	Q.	You see, Garda Keogh, the position is that at this	
29			stage you weren't defending yourself, you were on sick	

- leave. The real position here, I have to suggest to
  you, is that you were now forming an intention to
  attack people, to bring them down and to destroy them.
- 4 A. I am on sick leave.
- 5 214 Q. That's not a defence.
- 6 A. Judge, I was effectively driven out of work in the end.

11:42

11 · 42

- That's the way I perceive it. I may be wrong in that,
- but that's the way I perceived it.
- 9 215 Q. You see, I have to disagree with you because you do 10 accept that the objective evidence is that the CMO took 11:42
- a view about you in relation to your alcohol problems
- and recommended you attend for alcohol treatment?
- 13 A. He took --
- 14 216 Q. That was the position six months before this, isn't that right?
- A. Judge, he took that view because he wasn't even aware
  of work related stress until I -- the last date that I
  met him, was it 19th December 2012, I brought a file up
  with me, Judge, it was that thick, with all the
- documents and we had the discussion about stress and he 11:42
  said, why aren't you out with work related stress and I
- said I am. He said, is that on your certs? He didn't
- 22
- know. I said, it is. He showed me the document then,
- which is in the files, which had viral flu written the whole way about it, so he didn't know anything about
- 26 work related stress.
- 27 217 Q. Garda Keogh, it's very clear that whatever you said
- about stress, you accepted this earlier, that the
- 29 treatment you were recommended to undergo was addiction

- treatment in relation to alcohol?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 218 Q. And that the reason you were out of work in May 2016 is
- 4 because of that particular medical diagnosis, isn't
- 5 that right?
- 6 A. Yes. But again, why the drink? And even the patterns

11 · 43

11:43

- of when I was drinking, Judge, which I noted in my
- 8 diary, it always appeared to be the day before I was
- 9 due to go back on work period, was when I would start
- drinking. Because I was just under that much pressure
- and the thoughts of having to go back into work on
- 12 those days were unbearable. Unfortunately I did --
- look, I'm not the first Irish man to have this problem
- 14 and I won't be the last.
- 15 219 Q. Could I ask you see to Volume 9, please, page 2537?
- This is a note of 24/5/2016 which Superintendent Murray
- 17 prepared. There are two sections. First, can I ask
- you to just look at the upper section, where you
- 19 recorded that he, Superintendent Murray asked Inspector
- 20 Minnock to call to you in relation to your welfare. Do
- you see that. I think you accept that Inspector
- 22 Minnock did call to you about your welfare?
- 23 A. Judge, I --
- 24 220 Q. Did he call to you about welfare?
- 25 A. Judge, it's on paper about welfare, I said this
- 26 already --
- 27 221 Q. Garda Keogh --
- 28 A. No, I have to answer this, please, if I may.
- 29 222 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

1		Α.	In relation to Superintendent Minnock, when he was	
2			Inspector Minnock under Noreen McBrien, he was somebody	
3			I trusted. When Superintendent Murray arrived, Judge,	
4			I became aware I could not trust Inspector Minnock.	
5			There was a change there, Judge. So what is written	11:4
6			down as calling out for welfare, transpires to be more	
7			spying issues, because everything is documented and	
8			everything is noted. Whatever I say is written down	
9			and all the rest. So, this thing about welfare,	
10			welfare is just a bail for a spy mission on this part.	11:4
11	223	Q.	Again I have to suggest to you that's another paranoid	
12			response because Inspector Minnock will say that he	
13			called to you on his way home from work, I think he	
14			lived in your general area, is that right?	
15		Α.	Yes, as I said, Judge, Inspector Minnock, in Noreen	11:4
16			McBrien's time, there was no problem with him calling	
17			up. Towards the end under Superintendent Murray's	
18			tenor, I actually told Inspector Minnock, I don't want	
19			you calling up here anymore and I tried to tell him,	
20			stay out of this. Not try, I used to refer to him as	11:4
21			cig, which is still a word that's used in An Garda	
22			Síochána, I said cig, can you please stay out of this,	
23			this is going to get messy.	

- 24 224 Q. CHAIRMAN: What did you mean by this?
- 25 A. This whole episode, this whole thing.
- 26 225 Q. CHAIRMAN: What was the whole thing?
- 27 A. Everything we are dealing with here to do with all of this.
- 29 226 Q. CHAIRMAN: What was he to stay out of?

- A. Stay out of, not to be calling, not to be getting involved, stay out of all the rest. I was trying to keep him out of it, Judge.
- 4 227 Q. MR. MURPHY: When you say it, Garda Keogh, were you
  trying to keep him out of the escalating plan on your
  part to try and destroy and take out people?
- 7 Not at all. Because, Judge, at this point in time, Α. 8 we're in 2016, there's the -- I'm just trying to think, okay, there is the GSOC investigation is in train, 9 there's the Garda disciplinary investigation, and then 10 11 · 46 11 there's the bullying and harassment investigation. 12 there's the three of those things are in play at this 13 period of time.
- 14 228 Q. Effectively at this time you're at home and you're drinking?

- 16 Yeah. Well, three of these large investigations going Α. 17 on, I mean, and there is all this, this is all going 18 Unfortunately, where Mr. Murphy is on about 19 reality and my perception of reality, my reality is there is these three massive investigations, I mean, 20 11:47 that are -- and none of them are simple, none of those 21 22 investigations, not one of them are simple, they're 23 very complicated. All three of them are extremely 24 complicated investigations.
- 25 229 Q. Garda Keogh, could be shown Volume 4, please, at page 11:47
  26 702. Chairman, this is the statement of Inspector
  27 Minnock?
- 28 CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 29 230 Q. MR. MURPHY: Do you see this refers to the visit on the

- 1 24th May 2016, do you see that? Page 702?
- 2 Up the top, yeah. Α.
- 3 231 Just before we go there, can I ask you to turn Q.
- back to the previous page, please, that's page 701? 4
- 5 Okay. Paragraph? Α.

- 6 232 The last paragraph, please. 0.
- 7 CHAI RMAN: "At some point", is that the one.
- 8 233 MR. MURPHY: Yes, "At some point", this is on May 20th. 0.
- 9 He will say that at some point he was asked to liaise
- 10 with you and to ensure that you had appropriate welfare 11:48
- 11 supports.
- 12 Yeah, I don't dispute that. Α.
- 13 I think he said that Superintendent McBrien had 234 Q.
- been linking in with you. 14
- 15 Yes. Α. 11:48

11:49

11:49

- 16 He will say that he had a conversation with 235 Q.
- 17 Superintendent Murray?

Okay.

18 Yes. Α.

Α.

20

- 19 236 In relation to your welfare supports? Q.
- In fact, he said that you lived outside Tullamore, 21 237 Q.
- 22 making it more convenient for house calls and he also
- 23 felt at that time that he had a good rapport with you?
- 24 That was very correct, at that time we did have a good Α.
- 25 rapport and there's absolutely no issue there.

He thinks that his first visit to you in that capacity 26 238 Q.

- 27 was on 24th May 2016, is that possible?
- That's is possible. 28 Α.
- 29 Just turning over the page, please. He will say that 239 Q.

Т			ne carred to you on the way nome from work at 5:45pm	
2			and that on arrival you were on the phone and you were	
3			talking to Mick Quinn, your welfare officer?	
4		Α.	Okay.	
5	240	Q.	He will say that you handed him the phone and that he	11:49
6			had a brief word with Mick Quinn, your welfare officer?	
7		Α.	Right.	
8	241	Q.	So I think you agree that the discussion was likely to	
9			be about your welfare?	
10		Α.	Yeah, at this period I have no issue, yeah.	11:49
11	242	Q.	I think you invited him into the house?	
12		Α.	That would that would have as I said, at that	
13			point in time I had good time for Superintendent	
14			Minnock.	
15	243	Q.	Inspector Minnock will say that although you were	11:50
16			drinking, he was glad to see that you were linking in	
17			with Mick Quinn?	
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	244	Q.	And that he was glad to see that you were in company?	
20		Α.	Yeah.	11:50
21	245	Q.	I think he also notes that your mother was in the	
22			kitchen and he was introduced to her?	
23		Α.	Okay.	
24	246	Q.	And there was some general chat about her?	
25		Α.	Right.	11:50
26	247	Q.	I think he will say that you were keen to show him a	
27			letter from the Minister's office which referred to	
28			some issue being examined by GSOC?	
20		۸	T soo that	

- 1 248 Q. And he passed that off quickly.
- 2 A. Okay.
- 3 249 Q. Then he also spoke about Inspector Farrell and
- 4 Superintendent Murray?
- 5 A. Right.
- 6 250 Q. As management in Athlone. Then he also moved on to
- 7 talk about the commissioner and Commissioner Ó Cualáin

11:50

11:51

- and contacts that you were having with some TDs?
- 9 A. Right.
- 10 251 Q. He asked you for your mobile number, which you weren't
- sure of your number?
- 12 A. That would be -- that would be quite possible, Judge.
- I wouldn't even know my number now, because I was
- changing phone numbers that often that I actually
- 15 wouldn't know any of the phone numbers.
- 16 252 Q. I think you spoke about management to him as well. So,
- if we just look at the end, he will say in the course
- of his evidence that you were in good spirits although
- 19 you did appear to be under the influence of alcohol. I
- think you would accept that?
- 21 A. I have no issue with that.
- 22 253 Q. So if we can just move on then to 25th May 2016. If I
- could ask you, please, to go back to Volume 8, page
- 24 2063.
- 25 CHAIRMAN: I am looking for a convenient time to take a 11:51
- break, Mr. Murphy.
- 27 MR. MURPHY: This might be the time, Judge.
- 28 CHAIRMAN: If this is it. I don't want to impede your
- 29 flow.

1			MR. MURPHY: This would be a natural time, Chairman.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. That seems sensible.	
3			You will be happy to have a little break at this point.	
4			In the meantime, if you want we have already	
5			referred to 2063, isn't that right?	11:52
6			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
7			CHAIRMAN: And you're going to come back to it now.	
8			Okay. All right. So we will say 12:05. Thank you.	
9				
10			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS	12:05
11			FOLLOWS:	
12				
13			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
14			MR. MURPHY: Chairman. Garda Keogh, I think if we can	
15			go to page 2063, please. I think on the Wednesday,	12:06
16			25th May 2016, Superintendent Murray received	
17			notification that he was successful in the promotion	
18			competition for chief superintendent and he was placed	
19			at number 14 on a list of 18 people selected for	
20			promotion in that rank.	12:06
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	254	Q.	When did you become aware of that development?	
23		Α.	Whenever the list came out, I would have been contacted	
24			by somebody who would have informed me, I presume.	
25	255	Q.	I think during that period, if I can ask you to turn	12:06
26			over to 2064, did you give any interview to the Sunday	
27			Business Post during that time?	
28		Α.	Yes. The only time I ever went on record was that	
29			interview with the media, it was with journalist	

1			Francesca Comyn. Judge, to go back, under the	
2			Protected Disclosures Act, Judge, normally a guard is	
3			not allowed speak to the media. But, under the	
4			Protected Disclosures Act there is a provision whereby,	
5			if you have exhausted all avenues and there's nothing	12:07
6			happening, you can go to the media. Judge, I think,	
7			from recollection, this is in a period of time where	
8			the Guards where I have reported the matter to GSOC	
9			and the Guards are not sending the file to GSOC. There	
10			was five months of a delay, as I previously said.	12:07
11	256	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Can I stop you one second?	
12		Α.	Yes, Judge.	
13	257	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Up to now Mr. Murphy has not made a	
14			complaint, has not suggested it was unlawful, has not	
15			suggested it was wrong or anything else. Maybe he will	12:08
16			come to that and maybe will you have to make that	
17			defence. If you need to, come back and we will discuss	
18			it or you can okay, don't worry about what's coming.	
19			You gave an interview to Francesca Comyn of the Sunday	
20			Business Post?	12:08
21		Α.	Yes, Judge.	
22	258	Q.	MR. MURPHY: This is at a period after you become aware	
23			that Superintendent Murray is on a promotions list?	
24		Α.	I can't remember, Judge.	
25	259	Q.	Could I ask you please to turn forward, please, to page	12:08
26			2546, please? That's contained in Volume 9. You will	
27			see the headline is:	
28				

29

"Internal probe into Garda whistleblower claims

1			I aunched. "	
2				
3		Α.	Yeah.	
4	260	Q.	Can I ask you to turn to the next page, 2547, please.	
5			In the middle of the page you will see the continuation	12:09
6			of that article. Can I just draw your attention to the	
7			second paragraph, sorry the third paragraph under that	
8			column, last section, where you're recorded as saying	
9			that senior officers have subjected your:	
10				12:09
11			"work to an unreasonable degree of scrutiny and	
12			criticism and even touted members of the community to	
13			make complaints against him, one of the senior officers	
14			was listed for promotion and Keogh is currently out on	
15			si ck l eave. "	12:09
16				
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	261	Q.	So, will you agree me that it appears that you made	
19			reference, although not by name, to Superintendent	
20			Murray in the course of that interview?	12:09
21		Α.	That appears to be the case, Judge.	
22	262	Q.	So we can take it then that as of that date, 12th June	
23			2016, you were aware of the existence of the promotion	
24			and you were publicising your dissatisfaction with	
25			Superintendent Murray in that regard?	12:10
26		Α.	Yes. Now, just for clarification, as I said	
27			CHAIRMAN: Do you mind going back for two seconds?	
28			Where is that, Mr. Murphy? I am missing that.	
29			MR. MURPHY: Chairman if you look in the fourth column	

1			on page	
2			CHAIRMAN: The last column, yes. That's is all right.	
3			Mr. Kavanagh is trying to help me.	
4			MR. MURPHY: If you look please, Chairman, in the third	
5			column, the last three lines.	12:10
6			CHAIRMAN: "It is understood".	
7			MR. MURPHY: No, the paragraphs begins "having had".	
8			CHAIRMAN: Oh, sorry, yes.	
9				
10			"Having had an exemplary record as a young guard"	12:10
11				
12			MR. MURPHY: If you read down, Judge, through there,	
13			you will see the end of the paragraph, where I started:	
14				
15			"He also alleges that senior officers subjected his	12:10
16			work to an unreasonable degree of scrutiny and	
17			criticism and even touted members of the community to	
18			make complaints against him. One of the senior	
19			officers in question is listed for promotion. Keogh is	
20			currently out on sick leave."	12:11
21				
22			CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Very good. Thank you very much.	
23			Okay.	
24	263	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I think on the 14th June you wrote to the	
25			Minister for Justice. That is a letter which you have	12:11
26			seen briefly before?	
27		Α.	Can I close this?	
28	264	Q.	Can I ask you, please, to be shown Volume 24.	
29			CHAIRMAN: I think we are finished with that one now.	

1			Yes, the next one, Mr. Murphy, is?	
2			MR. MURPHY: I will come back to this point. I just	
3			really making the point that the promotions issue was	
4			being publicised in the newspapers.	
5		Α.	Can I just get the page?	12:11
6	265	Q.	Please, if I could have page 7128 on the screen,	
7			please. Garda Keogh, in the course of this letter you	
8			wrote to the Minister, and I think in the first page	
9			you made your complaints against Superintendent Pat	
10			Murray by name. Do you see in the second paragraph,	12:12
11			you say:	
12				
13			"I was recorded as being out sick with flu by	
14			Superintendent Pat Murray, despite my doctor's	
15			certification of my condition as work related stress."	12:12
16				
17			Do you see that?	
18		Α.	I see that. And Judge, I understand it should have	
19			been under his watch, as opposed to	
20	266	Q.	I think you accept that he wasn't responsible for	12:12
21			recording matters, as we discussed on previous days?	
22		Α.	Yes, but under his watch, is what I should have written	
23			there.	
24	267	Q.	In terms of the next page, 7129, at the very last line	
25			you make reference to:	12:13
26				
27			"Disciplinary breaches Garda management got me on were	
28			questi onabl e;	
29			1. The tax bracket category of my private car was	

Т			nothing short of vindictive.	
2			2. For ringing in sick where I made a statement	
3			accepting that I had erred."	
4				
5			Do you see that?	12:13
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	268	Q.	You say:	
8				
9			"When I was given the opportunity to appeal this, Garda	
10			management wouldn't give me a copy of my statement	12:13
11			which I had requested, due to the fact that I said the	
12			amount of stress I was under, while they were	
13			deliberately recording me as sick with the flu."	
14				
15			So again there is that reference to "deliberately	12:13
16			recording", I think you accept now that there wasn't	
17			deliberate recording?	
18		Α.	Oh no, I don't accept that at all. I have accepted to	
19			a certain point, Judge, we have gone through all this,	
20			I've said up to a certain point, fair enough, there may	12:13
21			have been a mistake, but after a certain period	
22			CHAIRMAN: If you are satisfied to let the debate on	
23			the sick leave issue rest as it stood, I think we will	
24			leave it as a stood, Mr. Murphy. I think that's the	
25			sensible thing, Mr. Kelly, rather than have a go at it	12:13
26			every so often.	
27			MR. KELLY: I am very much in favour of that. It	
28			doesn't actually gain by being beaten around all the	
29			time.	

1 Mr. Kelly, obviously if there is any issue CHAI RMAN: 2 you want to revisit, clearly that's a matter entirely 3 for you. Anyway, we will ignore previous debates, Mr. Murphy, except where they're strictly relevant to 4 5 the present. 12:14 6 MR. MURPHY: Certainly, Judge. 7 269 Could I ask you then to turn forward to page 7130? 0. 8 Α. 37? 7130, in same volume, 24. 9 270 Q. No, forget the 3, it's 7130, the next page. 10 12 · 14 11 Yes. Α. 12 271 Do you see towards the end of the letter 0. MR. MURPHY: 13 there is a sentence beginning: 14 15 "Of course it will come as no surprise that Garda 12:14 16 commissioners were warning Superintendent Murray by way 17 of promotion from superintendent to chief 18 superintendent whilst the harassment allegations are 19 being investigated prior to the policing authority 20 taking over the promotions procedure in relation to An 12:14 Garda Sí ochána. " 21 22 23 Do you see that? 24 Yes. Α. 25 That's the accusation you made to the Minister for 272 Q. 12:15 26 Justice at that stage? 27 Yes. Α. 28 273 I have to suggest to you again that you are effectively Q.

29

seeking to communicate to the Minister in an effort to

- 1 stop the promotion, isn't that right?
- 2 A. Em, I am pointing out -- there's an issue here and I am
- 3 pointing it out to the Minister. I am entitled to do
- 4 that. That's -- I mean, that's -- I am entitled to do
- 5 that. I wrote a letter to the Minister, everything is

12:15

12:16

12:16

- 6 there in writing. I still stand by that.
- 7 274 Q. Insofar as you are saying that harassment allegations
- 8 are been investigated, which harassment allegations are
- 9 they? Superintendent Murray has been promoted whilst
- the harassment allegations have been investigated?
- 11 A. I presume this is after I reported the -- initially
- report the harassment to Chief Superintendent Tony
- McLoughlin, which I don't have the date off hand. It
- 14 was the first time I met Chief Superintendent
- 15 McLoughlin. But I would accept I don't get to make a
- statement until, is it, March '17. But that wasn't
- 17 my -- that was out of my control, when I got to make a
- 18 statement. I was pushing for a long time to -- in
- relation to the bullying and harassment.
- 20 275 Q. Would you agree with me that that phrase gives the
- impression to whoever read it at the time that
- 22 harassment allegations were being investigated?
- 23 A. Well, they should have been investigated then.
- 24 276 Q. That's a different thing from saying they are being
- 25 investigated. You said they are being investigated,
- that was incorrect, wasn't it?
- 27 A. May have -- I may have not worded it correct but the
- 28 gist of it is correct, Judge.
- 29 277 Q. Well, there was no gist of it being correct at that

1			time. On that date in 2016, is it not the case that	
2			the harassment allegations were not being investigated?	
3		Α.	No, no, Judge, I had reported bullying and harassment,	
4			I had reported it. I accept that the actual	
5			investigation hadn't taken place, but I had reported	12:16
6			it.	
7	278	Q.	Weren't you at the same time complaining that there	
8			wasn't an investigation taking place. Later on,	
9			haven't we have seen in earlier issues that you were	
10			complaining about a delay in the investigation in 2017?	12:17
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	279	Q.	So here we are in the middle of 2016. I just have to	
13			suggest to you that that's a very misleading statement	
14			that you incorporated in your letter?	
15		Α.	No, it's not.	12:17
16	280	Q.	And do you see at the bottom on the left-hand side	
17		Α.	No, it's not.	
18	281	Q.	You cc'd the letter to GSOC, the Policing Authority and	
19			to Clare Daly TD, do you see that?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:17
21	282	Q.	Did Deputy Daly suggest to you that you should write	
22			this letter to the Minister?	
23		Α.	No, I don't think so. I don't think so, no, this is a	
24			letter I would have done I'd say completely myself,	
25			from recollection.	12:17
26	283	Q.	I see. But do you see here, I have to suggest to you	
27			that this begins to appear like a pincer movement by	
28			you, where you are effectively triggering Deputy Daly	
29			and Deputy Wallace to make speeches in the Dáil and now	

Т			you re copyring them in in correspondence to the	
2			Minister, where you are seeking on the other wing, the	
3			other pincer, to start saying to the Policing	
4			Authority, GSOC and the Minister for Justice that	
5			there's something wrong with Superintendent Murray's	12:18
6			promotion?	
7		Α.	This is incredible. Is this my perception of reality?	
8			Because last week, Judge, Mr. Murphy was saying I	
9			couldn't hold a pen and write me own name and now I'm	
10			in pincer movements.	12:18
11	284	Q.	Garda Keogh	
12		Α.	In elaborate	
13	285	Q.	Garda Keogh, on your own admission before the break,	
14			you indicated that you had intended to try and bring	
15			down Superintendent Murray. I'm suggesting to you that	12:18
16			you now you are putting this plan into effect. You're	
17			writing to the Minister, you're writing to GSOC, you're	
18			writing to the Policing Authority, you're writing to	
19			Deputy Daly, although she knows all about your views.	
20			I am suggesting to you this is all part of your plan to	12:18
21			bring down Superintendent Murray?	
22		Α.	It's not as simple no, no, no that's not fair,	
23			Judge. Judge, I am trying to invoke a bullying and	
24			harassment policy. It ends up how I get to actually	
25			invoke the policy, I have to get my solicitor to write	12:18
26			in a number of letters to An Garda Síochána to say	
27			here, listen, this is reported, can we get this moving.	
28			There was a reluctance there to touch this. That was	
20			out of my control So T am already trying to implement	

1			this bullying and harassment policy. Sorry, you	
2			touched the second part of the question?	
3	286	Q.	Yes, I was suggesting to you that you are enlisting,	
4			effectively writing to all of these people complaining	
5			about Superintendent Murray, because you are intending	12:19
6			to bring his career to an end?	
7		Α.	No, no, no. Judge, what that is, even under the old	
8			the Garda Síochána Act and I didn't know this at the	
9			time, I know it now, one wouldn't get promoted if there	
10			was an active complaint against them. But equally,	12:19
11			under this new the new promotion thing or	
12			whatever Judge, Superintendent Murray, there's no	
13			issue with him being promoted, but after it's	
14			investigated. That's my point. He should have been	
15			investigated and then promoted. No issue. This craic	12:20
16			where they know there's an allegation of bullying and	
17			harassment, they know I'm trying to invoke the bullying	
18			and harassment policy and then afterwards it takes, I	
19			think, about a year before I get to actually make the	
20			statement. But that's out of my hands, that was out of	12:20
21			my control. That's why I was writing to Minister	
22			Fitzgerald in relation to this, because if I wasn't	
23			informing Minister Fitzgerald what was going on, I	
24			doubt Garda management were informing her what was	
25			going on.	12:20
26	287	Q.	You see, Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to you that	
27			it's a bit more than that, because by this time you	
28			have given information which has resulted in	
29			Superintendent Murray being named in the Dáil, being	

1			accused of corruption, of massaging the crime figures,	
2			and now you're writing to the Minister, who we know has	
3			responsibility for An Garda Síochána, and to the other	
4			authorities and you're adding cumulatively to this	
5			complaint in relation to his promotion. I have to	12:20
6			suggest to you that all of this was calculated to try	
7			and stop Superintendent Murray from being promoted?	
8		Α.	Judge, again, it's not as simple as that. My point is:	
9			Promote him but promote him after you do the	
10			investigation. If you are going to promote him, do it	12:21
11			right, promote him after. Not what happened. And what	
12			has subsequently happened was all done wrong, in my	
13			view, Judge.	
14	288	Q.	So is it your evidence to the Chairman here today that	
15			you weren't trying to interfere with Superintendent	12:21
16			Murray's promotion?	
17		Α.	Judge, I didn't want him to be promoted while there was	
18			an active investigation, or there should have been	
19			investigation, a matter which I had already reported.	
20			I believe that was wrong. It was wrong the way the	12:21
21			Garda management were dealing with this.	
22	289	Q.	Garda Keogh, earlier this morning did you not agree	
23			with me that bringing down was what you were trying to	
24			do and that you accepted that bringing down was	
25			bringing the person's career to an end, do you remember	12:21
26			that?	

27

28

29

Α.

Bringing down -- no, but bringing down and preventing

from promotion are two very different things. Bringing

down -- Judge, bringing someone down, I mean, here I am

- trying to prevent -- I'm saying -- well, I don't know how -- I haven't it worded here.
- 3 290 Q. CHAIRMAN: Take your time.
- 4 My point is, I've reported this matter to An Α. 5 Garda Síochána. No one has come near me for this 12:22 6 I end up having to get my solicitor to 7 write letters in, solicitors letters in to say, can 8 someone invoke this policy within An Garda Síochána. Ι don't get to make to statement until I think March 9 10 2017. So that's formally when the statement -- but 12.22 11 that was out of my -- I had no control over when I made 12 that statement. As in, you know, I had reported it 13 approximately a year prior to that, and the point is, 14 nobody, Superintendent Murray or anybody else, if there
- was a complaint or an investigation or anything, they
  shouldn't be promoted until at least it has been
  investigated. That's fair procedures.

  MR. MURPHY: Again, I have to suggest to you that what

- you are doing here is that you are effectively not
  engaging in fair procedures. Did you CC Superintendent
  Murray in that correspondence? Did you tell him at the
  time that you were writing to the Minister?
- 23 A. No, I didn't.
- 24 292 Q. You didn't?
- 25 A. No.
- 26 293 Q. Again, at that time he was unaware this is what you
  27 were doing. I have to suggest to you, that's clearly
  28 unfair.
- 29 A. Well, there's a lot of things, Judge, in these

Т			documents, in retters in relation to superintendent	
2			Murray and other parties which he wasn't CCing to me.	
3	294	Q.	Garda Keogh, in relation to this correspondence, was	
4			Transparency Ireland involved in assisting you in	
5			relation to this letter?	12:2
6		Α.	No, definitely not. No, I met Transparency, Judge,	
7			International Ireland, just in relation to that was	
8			I think was it around 2016 or something like that.	
9			But it was more just I gave them my view of whatever	
10			was going on. That was really it.	12:2
11	295	Q.	Did Deputies Daly or Wallace help you to, for example,	
12			type this letter?	
13		Α.	Absolutely not. And, Judge, in relation to this	
14			letter, Judge, I see, I just notice the way this is	
15			printed, there's a line down on this printer, on the	12:2
16			right-hand side of this printer, so that's a domestic	
17			printer. I know where that printer is. That printer	
18			is somewhere in Tullamore and it seems to always leave	
19			that line. This was printed this was done by me,	
20			Judge, and nobody else, this letter.	12:2
21	296	Q.	Can we move forward then, please, to Volume 1, at page	
22			345? This is a letter that you wrote to the Minister	
23			on 2/9/2016, in handwriting.	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	297	Q.	Had you no typewriter or computer at that stage?	12:2
26		Α.	No, this is the only letter I sent Ms. Fitzgerald in	
27			longhand, Judge, because it was an urgent letter and I	
28			don't think I had even time to type this letter.	

29

298 Q. In terms of this letter, was this letter a letter that

- 1 you received any help with from any person, like 2 Transparency Ireland? 3 Oh, no, no. This was -- as I said, whatever I had Α. heard -- can I read the contents of the letter first, 4 5 Judge? 12:25 6 299 This is your letter, Garda Keogh? Q. 7 It is. Α. 8 300 You are familiar with it? Q. 9 There's no question, I just want to read what's in it. Α. 10 CHAI RMAN: Familiarise yourself with it. Take a 12:25 moment. If that's what you want to do, yes, take a 11 12 moment, of course. 13 Judge, can I read this letter into -- can I read this Α. 14 letter? 15 CHAI RMAN: Only if Mr. Murphy asks you to read it. He 12:26 16 is cross-examining, so it's a matter for him. 17 MR. MURPHY: I'm going to ask you questions about the 301 Q. 18 letter, Garda Keogh. 19 Okay. Α. 20 302 First of all, you agree that the letter was written by Q. 12:26 21 you in relation to the promotion of Superintendent Pat 22 Murray? 23 Yes. Α.
- 27 A. That's correct. And that's -- from recollection,

signed off by the cabinet?

24

25

26

303

Q.

- 28 before I even had read the letter, I said this was an
- urgent letter, that I didn't even have time to type.

Second, do you agree with me that it's clear as of that

12:26

date you knew that the promotion was waiting to be

- 304 How did you know it was about to be signed off by the 1 Q. 2 cabinet? I can't remember how I knew that. But I found -- I 3 Α. obviously found that out, possibly that day. 4 5 305 Yes. Q. 12:27 6 I don't know, I presume that. Α. 7 who could have told you about that kind of information 306 0. 8 before it went to the cabinet? I don't know. I don't know. 9 Α. I mean, you agree with me it wasn't on the radio? 10 307 Q. 12.27 11 Oh! Α. 12 So it had to be somebody who was very close 308 It wasn't. Ο. to the organisation at a very high level in An Garda 13 14 Síochána or else to the Cabinet. Where did you find the information? 15 12:27 16 It was someone in a Government department. Α. 17 many other aspects that --18 309 Who was it then? Q. 19 I don't know, I actually do not know. All I know is, I Α.
- got this information and I wrote -- this is back in
  21 2016. I recall -- actually, I recall writing the
  22 letter just on the kitchen table, I scribbled it down.
  23 It is a letter to the Minister, where I didn't even go
  24 to type it or anything like that, it was just urgent,
  25 wrote it down and posted it immediately. And that was

12.27

27 310 Q. So did someone tell you, somebody with inside 28 information tell you that the matter was now about to 29 be signed off by the Cabinet and that was why you are

26

it.

Τ			writing so urgently?	
2		Α.	That would be correct.	
3	311	Q.	So who was the person who told you?	
4		Α.	Well, can I check my diary, Judge.	
5	312	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Please do.	12:28
6		Α.	And see if I can be of assistance.	
7	313	Q.	CHAIRMAN: what does your diary say?	
8		Α.	On the 1st I have:	
9				
10			"Post letter to Chief Superintendent McLoughlin	12:28
11			re harassment."	
12				
13			And on the 2nd I have:	
14				
15			"Post letter to Tánaiste re Pat Murray harassment."	12:29
16				
17	314	Q.	MR. MURPHY: So, I think you will agree with me, this	
18			is a big deal, Garda Keogh, this was a letter that you	
19			were writing to the Minister, a very important in your	
20			life as Garda and a very important person in the	12:29
21			community, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	A very important person in the State because she's also	
23			had the Tánaiste.	
24	315	Q.	You're also writing it in great haste because you	
25			considered it to be urgent that you bring this matter	12:29
26			to the attention of the Minister?	
27		Α.	That's correct.	
28	316	Q.	You had also received information of a very delicate	
29			kind to indicate that this was just about to be	

- 1 assessed by the cabinet. Now, who told you? 2 Judge, I go back to -- can I go back the month before, Α. 3 if I can even find out if I noted who... Judge, I don't know, all I know is that I became aware of it, I don't 4 5 have it recorded how I became aware of it but I became 12:30 aware of it. 6 7 Garda Keogh, you've given us evidence you have problems 317 Q. 8 with memory, but I have to suggest to you, it's incredible that you don't remember who told you this 9 information? 10 12:30 There's an awful lot of information that I've have 11 Α. 12 heard and stuff that I can't remember. 13 Why don't you think about it for a moment. You 318 Q. 14 mentioned your circle of trust a few days ago, was it 15 somebody in your circle of trust that told you about 12:30 16 this information? I mean it could have been. 17 Α. 18 319 Could have been? Q. 19 Could have been. Α. So who was in circle of trust at that stage? 320 20 Q. 12:30
- 23 321 Q. Deputy Wallace isn't in the cabinet, is he?

not in the documents in my circle.

24 A. Sorry?

Α.

- 25 322 Q. Deputy Wallace is not in the cabinet?
- 26 A. No.

21

22

- 27 323 Q. On in higher management of An Garda Síochána?
- 28 A. No.
- 29 324 Q. Deputy Daly isn't either?

Just people you wouldn't even know about and that are

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 325 Q. Deputy Wallace isn't either -- Deputy Flanagan, rather?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 326 Q. So, who else was in the circle of trust at that time,
- for example, was in Garda management?
- 6 MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, I wonder is it relevant to

12:31

12:31

- 7 keep persisting in this enquiry? The letter is
- 8 written, he said he became aware of the information.
- 9 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Murphy is suggesting that he does know
- 10 but he won't say.
- MR. MURPHY: I am.
- 12 CHAIRMAN: That's, rather, what Mr. Murphy is implying,
- 13 where we are.
- MR. MURPHY: Yes.
- 15 WITNESS: I dispute that.
- 16 CHAIRMAN: Let's get it out in the open. Hold on, one
- second. Let's get it out in the open. Mr. Murphy says
- this is either an unusual or possibly the only letter
- that you penned in longhand to the Minister.
- 20 WITNESS: I have given that evidence.
- 21 CHAIRMAN: Absolutely. Number two, it was an extremely
- 22 important letter.
- WITNESS: Yes.
- 24 CHAIRMAN: He says it was an extremely urgent letter.
- 25 So, the information that you got must have come as very 12:31
- important information. In those circumstances,
- 27 Mr. Murphy is suggesting -
- 28 WITNESS: Oh, I have heard --
- 29 CHAIRMAN: that it is very hard to understand. Hold

1			on.	
2			WI TNESS: Yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: He's suggesting, implying that it's very	
4			hard to understand how you wouldn't be able to remember	
5			who gave you this highly important and urgent	12:32
6			information. That's what he's suggesting.	
7			WITNESS: I understand.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Maybe it's unimportant, maybe it's	
9			important. That's not where we are at this moment. I	
10			don't want to be suggesting to you that it's important	12:32
11			or not important. But that's what he is exploring and	
12			I think that is the essence of where we are. He says,	
13			look, it's too much to think that you couldn't remember	
14			that or put it in your diary or whatever it is. That's	
15			what he is saying. What do you say that?	12:32
16		Α.	I cannot remember. I definitely got the information	
17			from what would have been a good source. His last	
18			question was, he was implying Garda management	
19	327	Q.	CHAIRMAN: what he's really saying is: why can't you	
20			remember? That's really where we are going. What	12:32
21			reason is there for you not to be able to	
22		Α.	I have no note, I have no note, if I had even a note	
23	328	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I have done enough now.	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	329	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I am trying as neutrally as I can to layout	12:33
26			where Mr. Murphy is going.	
27		Α.	Judge, I have gone back here into August as well to see	
28			who I was talking to in relation I don't have a note	

29

of anything. I obviously got that information on

- the -- I'd say that day, on 2/9, I presume.
- 2 330 Q. CHAIRMAN: Somebody had to tell you.
- 3 A. Of course.
- 4 331 Q. CHAIRMAN: Somebody had to tell you, this is going to

12:33

12:34

12:34

- 5 the cabinet?
- 6 A. Yes, yes.
- 7 332 Q. CHAIRMAN: Superintendent Murray, his promotion is
- 8 going to the cabinet.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 333 Q. CHAIRMAN: Whenever it is, at their next meeting.
- 11 A. Look, if I knew who it was, if I had it in my diary, I
- just can't --
- 13 334 Q. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Murphy is suggesting that you do know
- 14 who it was.
- 15 A. I reject that.
- 16 335 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's the writing on the wall?
- 17 A. I would tell you if I knew who it was.
- 18 336 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand.
- 19 A. I can't turn around and say it might have been Clare
- Daly, and it wasn't Clare Daly. And, it might have
- been Mick Wallace, and it wasn't. It was obviously
- somebody in my circle.
- 23 CHAIRMAN: Anything else on that, Mr. Murphy? Whether
- it is important or not important or what inferences are
- another day's work. Okay.
- 26 337 Q. MR. MURPHY: Do you think it's likely, therefore, just
- taking your answer, that it was somebody in your circle
- 28 who really wanted you to write a letter to the Minister
- 29 urgently?

1		Α.	No. No, I wouldn't this would have been this	
2			would have been the letter is my doing.	
3	338	Q.	Then turning down to the letter, please, could I ask	
4			you to look in the middle of the letter, where you say:	
5				12:34
6			"The fact that An Garda Síochána is recommending this	
7			man for promotion is incredible in itself."	
8				
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	339	Q.	Okay. So there's no doubt about that, Garda Keogh, at	12:34
11			that stage you're targeting Superintendent Murray and	
12			saying he's not a person who is fit it to be promoted.	
13			It's incredible at least, your words?	
14		Α.	Judge, I already touched on this. This where I am	
15			trying to invoke my complaint against him. And	12:35
16			actually, I think, is it in this one, where I actually	
17			at some stage I think attach a lot of documents as	
18			well, some of the documents that we have touched on in	
19			previous matters, where I attach them and I am sending	
20			these letters	12:35
21	340	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But not to this one, not to this letter?	
22		Α.	I can't remember which letter it was. I do know I sent	
23			documents to Ms. Fitzgerald, because I am obviously	
24			aware of what happened to Minister Shatter when he was	
25			being lied to by Garda management and I would have very	12:35
26			serious suspicions that Ms. Fitzgerald was being	
27			misled. And actually, in that last paragraph here:	
28				
29			"I feel obliged to inform you that you may have been	

1			misled by the Garda commissioner in relation to	
2			misconduct in Athlone."	
3				
4			And I have that in my own handwriting and I sign it. I	
5			can't be any more transparent than that, Judge	12:35
6	341	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Perhaps you could be. Who gave you the	
7			information that led you to say that the commissioner	
8			may have misled the Minister?	
9		Α.	That would be my view.	
10	342	Q.	Or was that possibly somebody in your circle of trust,	12:36
11			the same person who gave you the information about the	
12			cabinet?	
13		Α.	Sorry, when it comes to circle of trust and the	
14			commissioner at the time, Nóirín O'Sullivan, I think	
15			everyone, along with most of the country, would have	12:36
16			had a firm view there, Judge.	
17	343	Q.	I disagree with you, Garda Keogh. Can you just answer	
18			the question if you can. On what basis were you saying	
19			that the commissioner misled the Minister, in	
20			circumstances where, I think you will agree with me,	12:36
21			you had nothing in your possession at that time such	
22			as	
23		Α.	The question is misleading there. Judge, what I have,	
24			"to inform you that you may have been misled."	
25				12:36
26			CHAIRMAN: I agree.	
27	344	Q.	MR. MURPHY: would you agree with me, though, this	
28			letter is clearly an attempt to target Superintendent	
29			Murray, to stop him from being promoted?	

1		Α.	It's not targeting. This is where there's an issue	
2			here. There's someone going for promotion who I	
3			believe has a I believe I have a case and	
4			Superintendent Murray has questions to answer, that it	
5			has to be investigated, and then go on and do	12:37
6			promotions.	
7	345	Q.	Moving on to the 10th October, Garda Keogh, can I ask	
8			you to go back, please, to page 2066, Volume 8.	
9			Superintendent Murray will say that on the 10th October	
10			2016, that Garda Greene called to his office and	12:37
11			informed him that he had been approached by you and by	
12			other whistleblowers to go with him and that he had	
13			been asked would he go with them and you to speak to	
14			John McGuinness TD but he had declined. Do you recall	
15			that?	12:38
16		Α.	I am just trying to find where	
17	346	Q.	2066, at the top of the page, the third line.	
18			CHAIRMAN: The paragraph "on the 10th October".	
19		Α.	Yes, okay.	
20	347	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Do you recall approaching Garda Greene and	12:38
21			suggesting that he might go with you to speak to John	
22			McGuinness TD, with other whistleblowers?	
23		Α.	I just want to read this for a moment, please. Judge,	
24			I don't think this is accurate. This note can't be	
25			accurate, because I didn't at any stage have any	12:38
26			dealings with John McGuinness, Judge. So any dealings,	
27			as in, over the phone or arranging meetings, anything	
28			at all. So I don't think this is accurate, this part	
29			is accurate at all.	

Did you suggest to Garda Greene that he might join 1 348 Q. 2 forces with you and other whistleblowers? 3 well, Judge, at this period of time --Α. 349 10th October 2016? 4 0. 5 Garda Greene and I, Judge there's issues there, and we Α. 12:39 6 have different views in relation to Superintendent 7 Murray. So I question this whole paragraph. 8 CHAI RMAN: Okay. So you don't remember this. No, I don't agree with it, Judge. 9 Α. 10 CHAI RMAN: Okay. 12:39 11 350 MR. MURPHY: Sorry, just be clear, is it you don't Q. 12 remember it or it didn't happen? 13 He doesn't agree with it; isn't that right? 351 CHAI RMAN: Q. 14 The question is this: Garda Greene said that you had 15 asked him to join you and other whistleblowers in 12:39 16 approaching Deputy McGuinness. You say, no, that 17 didn't happen? 18 Judge, firstly, firstly for clarification, just, are Α. 19 these Superintendent Murray's notes? MR. MURPHY: 20 352 Q. Yes. 12:39 21 Right. Α. 22 Sorry, this is his statement? 353 Q. 23 Okay. Well, but they're based on his notes, Α. 24 Superintendent Murray's notes? He's recording what Garda Greene said to him. 25 354 Q. 12:40 That's fine, okay. I see what's written here. 26 Α.

27

28

29

have mentioned, I'm only surmising here, that perhaps

there was an offer from John McGuinness or someone who

was talking to John McGuinness may have said, listen --

- I mean, I am only trying to put this together. And I
- 2 may have mentioned something like that to Garda Greene.
- But other than that, that's... I can't go any further
- 4 with this.
- 5 355 Q. Moving on then, please, to 25th October 2016. Can I

12:41

12:41

12:41

- 6 ask you to be shown Volume 4, please, at page 703?
- 7 This is Inspector Minnock's statement. Inspector
- 8 Minnock will say on 25th October 2016 he called to see
- 9 you. Do you remember that meeting?
- 10 A. Where in this?
- 11 356 Q. Top of page 703, first sentence, first line.
- 12 A. Okay.
- 13 357 Q. Do you recall on the 25th October that he called to
- 14 visit you?
- 15 A. I accept. Like, I don't recall just off the top of my
- 16 head. I am accepting it.
- 17 358 Q. To help you, he will say that he wanted to notify you
- 18 that he received notification about you going on half
- 19 pay?
- 20 A. Right.
- 21 359 Q. You also had a certificate award from the Irish Water
- 22 Safety group?
- 23 A. Right.
- 24 360 Q. I think he explained to you about the invitation to
- attend the presentation at Dublin Castle?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 361 Q. We heard about it in one of the earlier issues?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 362 Q. He asked you if you would attend the ceremony?

- 1 So far everything, I am in agreement. Α.
- 2 363 I think you said you weren't sure if you would attend Q.
- 3 and he asked you how you were doing. You said that you
- were doing well, that you were still not drinking? 4
- 5 I was still? Α.

364 0. CHAI RMAN: You were still off the drink or whatever it

12:42

12.42

12:42

12:42

12:42

- 6 7 is. You were still not drinking.
- 8 Right. Α.
- 9 365 MR. MURPHY: was that correct at that time? Q.
- Just what period is this? 10 Α.
- 11 366 The 25th October? Q.
- 12 Yes, this is correct. Yes, yeah, yeah. Α.
- 13 absolutely correct, yes.
- 14 367 Q. I mean, by this stage, just to assist, had you done the
- course in relation to --15
- 16 Yes. Α.
- 17 That would have helped you. So I think that he will 368 Q.
- 18 say that he asked you if you were still engaging with
- 19 welfare officers and you said you were, and that you
- 20 were just off the phone to Mick Quinn, do you remember
- that right? 21
- 22 Right. Α.
- 23 Then he will say that you referred to the Garda 369 Q.
- 24 Commissioner and you said:
- 26 "She will be gone by Christmas".
- 27

25

- 28 Okay. Α.
- 29 Can I ask you in that regard, had somebody told you in 370 Q.

Т			your circle of trust that the Commissioner would be	
2			gone by Christmas?	
3		Α.	Oh I don't know. Was she gone by Christmas? I don't	
4			know if that was even accurate, I don't know.	
5	371	Q.	If we can move then back, please, to the statement of	12:43
6			Superintendent Murray, page 2066, Volume 8. Again,	
7			Superintendent Murray will say that on 2nd November	
8			2016, he received a registered letter from PIAB,	
9			indicating that you had been authorised to bring civil	
10			proceedings by the board. That's a document which has	12:43
11			been exhibited. He refers to it as PM92. I think it's	
12			not an issue that I think ultimately by that stage	
13			you had issued personal injuries proceedings, isn't	
14			that right?	
15		Α.	Yes, Judge. Just, I am after noticing something here,	12:44
16			Judge.	
17	372	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18		Α.	In relation to 25th October 2016, in Inspector	
19			Minnock's statement he says, as we just touched on	
20			there:	12:44
21				
22			"Referred to the Garda Commissioner and that she'd be	
23			gone by Christmas."	
24				
25			Okay? Full stop. Then Superintendent Murray has in	12:44
26			his statement, on a note:	
27				
28			"On 25th October 2016, Inspector Minnock reported to me	
29			that he found Garda Keogh in poor living conditions	

1			while carrying out a welfare visit and that Garda Keogh	
2			informed him that he was going to bring down the	
3			Commissioner by December/January '16."	
4				
5			CHAIRMAN: Or January, yes.	12:44
6		Α.	Yeah, but there's a big difference between she'll be	
7			gone by and he's going to bring down.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes, I am aware of that.	
9	373	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Let's take the best evidence then, we'll	
10			take Superintendent's inspector Minnock's evidence	12:45
11			because he was talking to you. He will say that what	
12			you said was that the Garda Commissioner will be gone	
13			by Christmas?	
14		Α.	Are you implying that Superintendent Murray's evidence	
15			is not	12:45
16	374	Q.	No, I'm saying it's secondhand, he is recording what	
17			was said to him. I am saying to you that the best	
18			evidence	
19			CHAIRMAN: But you were drawing a difference, a	
20			distinction between the two and it's clear there is a	12:45
21			difference between the two.	
22		Α.	Judge, as I have said in relation it, a lot of	
23			Superintendent Murray's notes, they're twisted and	
24			there's things that aren't true and there's falsehoods.	
25			Some parts are true. That just was the issue there.	12:45
26	375	Q.	MR. MURPHY: To assist on this issue, very briefly	
27			could I ask you to be shown page 2562, please, Volume	
28			9. Here is a note that was taken by Superintendent	
29			Murray will say that in his record what he was told by	

1			Inspector Minnock was that on his visit to your home,	
2			he said that you were sober, the house was very dirty	
3			and that you had said you were going to bring down the	
4			Commissioner and he records:	
5				12:46
6			"She will be gone by December or January '17 latest.	
7			Said they had more stuff. And he was restored to full	
8			pay. "	
9				
10		Α.	Are you trying to back up my case? Because I am only	12:46
11			after saying a minute ago I'm only after saying what	
12			he said a minute ago. Whose note this? This is	
13			Superintendent Murray's note. We've just referred to	
14			Inspector Minnock's statement and this stuff is not in	
15			Inspector Minnock's statement.	12:46
16	376	Q.	Garda Keogh, you know Christmas falls every year in	
17			December. There isn't any material difference between	
18			them?	
19		Α.	There is. Because it has "she'll be gone by" to "he	
20			said he was going to bring down", there's a big	12:47
21			difference.	
22	377	Q.	You've already told us that you were going to try and	
23			bring her down, that was your objective months ago.	
24		Α.	It's you that brought up and using these examples.	
25	378	Q.	Why are you objecting to the fact that that was your	12:47
26			objective, you said it was your objective?	
27		Α.	You're questioning me on documents and when I am	
28			pointing out that there is discrepancies in those	
29			documents	

Т	3/9	Q.	I'm suggesting to you they are in the material	
2			discrepancies at all. That's a matter for the Chair.	
3			What I am saying to you is, Inspector Minnock will say	
4			that you referred to the Garda Commissioner and said	
5			she'd be gone by Christmas. Do you accept that that's	12:47
6			what you said?	
7		Α.	I have no doubt I said that.	
8	380	Q.	Moving on please. Can I ask you to go back to	
9			Superintendent Murray's statement at page 2066?	
10		Α.	Sorry, volume?	12:48
11	381	Q.	That's at Volume 8. Superintendent Murray will say	
12			that on 8th November 2016, he received a call from	
13			chief Superintendent Matt Nyland, indicating that you	
14			had been phoning Mr. Croke of GSOC while drunk at	
15			nighttime and making allegations against Garda A. Is	12:48
16			that true?	
17		Α.	No, that's	
18			MR. KELLY: Sorry, that's actually not what is written	
19			there.	
20			CHAIRMAN: No.	12:48
21			MR. KELLY: If Mr. Murphy would care to read what is	
22			actually written there.	
23			MR. MURPHY: what is contained there is a record that	
24			he received a call from Chief Superintendent Matt	
25			Nyland indicating that you were phoning Mr. Croke of	12:48
26			GSOC while drunk at nighttime, making an allegation	
27			against Garda A.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Alleging that Garda A was going to kill you.	
29			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	

1			CHAIRMAN: That's specifically what you had written	
2			down.	
3			WITNESS: I don't think that was the first question	
4			though.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Don't mind was that the first question.	12:49
6	382	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Were you making an allegation against	
7			Garda A? Yes or no?	
8		Α.	Judge, yes. Hang on, I will try to think. At that	
9			period of time, Judge, I had Ms. B, who had what	
10			appeared to be a male person in the car drive by my	12:49
11			house in October 2015, Judge. I had my own security	
12			issues there, which I can tell you, I got not a lot of	
13			help from Garda management in relation to that.	
14	383	Q.	Sorry, could I just ask you for one simple fact, did	
15			you phone Mr. Croke of GSOC while you were drunk?	12:49
16		Α.	I can't remember that, but I accept I would accept I	
17			more than likely did. That would be, unfortunately,	
18			the kind of	
19	384	Q.	Can I move on, please, to page 2067. On 20th December	
20			2016, Superintendent Murray will say that he was	12:50
21			informed that neither nor numbers 15 through 18 on the	
22			promotion list would be promoted to chief	
23			superintendent on the present panel, the panel was	
24			being extinguished by the Government and he received	
25			notice of that at that time. So, I think you're aware	12:50
26			of the fact that the system changed?	
27		Α.	Correct, yeah.	
28	385	Q.	So, moving to 2017, on 24th January 2017, I think	
29			Denuty Wallace referred to Superintendent Murray in	

2 Yeah. I see that. Α. I think you accept that Mr. Wallace referred in Dáil 3 386 0. 4 Éireann to Superintendent Murray as being a person on 5 the promotion list who had harassed you? 12:51 6 I would accept that. Α. 7 387 Can I ask you just to move down again, to page 2067? Q. 8 On 13th February 2017, Sergeant Haran reported to Superintendent Murray, in the presence of Inspector 9 10 Farrell, that you had phoned him on 12th February 2017, 12:51 11 do you remember that phone conversation? I don't. 12 Α. 13 He will say that in the course of that conversation 388 Q. 14 that you said that you were bringing down Commissioner 15 O'Sullivan and she will be gone by the end of the week 12:51 16 and that her computer would let her down? 17 Right. Α. 18 Do you recall saying that? 389 Q. 19 With all my attempts to bring down the former Α. 20 Commissioner, I appear to have failed miserably, Judge. 12:51 I'd accept -- like if Sergeant Haran said that, I mean, 21 22 I would accept it. But I don't -- I just don't 23 remember that. 24 Again, Chairman, just for ease of reference, could I 390 Q. 25 ask the Tribunal to note that the reference to Deputy 12:52

1

26

27

28

29

Dáil Éireann.

Wallace is at page 2596.

it.

to have it on the screen unless the Chairman requires

But that indicates the details, where in effect:

I don't think it's necessary

Т			Mr. wallace said that the commissioner was protecting	
2			the chief superintendent, who has been involved in a	
3			heroin case in Athlone. Last year she place the	
4			superintendent on a promotion list. He has been	
5			accused on number occasions of harassing a	12:52
6			whi stl ebl ower. "	
7				
8			So, in terms of progression, on the 14th February	
9			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, do you want to say something?	
10		Α.	Oh, I was just going to say I'd agree that that	12:52
11			statement was accurate.	
12	391	Q.	MR. MURPHY: So, you're aware of the fact that Deputy	
13			Wallace has begun again to make reference to	
14			Superintendent Murray in the Dáil. Could I move	
15			forward to 14th February of 2017. Superintendent	12:53
16			Murray will say that at 5:40 in the afternoon, while	
17			listening to the Life Five programme on RTÉ, he heard	
18			Deputy Wallace ask the question in Dáil Éireann as to	
19			why the superintendent who bullied you was on placed on	
20			a promotion list to chief superintendent. He will say	12:53
21			that there was further media coverage of Mr. Wallace's	
22			Dáil utterances in the Irish mail on the 15th February.	
23		Α.	I see that.	
24	392	Q.	Can I ask you to be shown we will move forward then,	
25			please, to 30th March 2017. He will say that Deputy	12:53
26			Wallace questioned the Garda Commissioner during a	
27			meeting of the Dáil Justice Committee about	
28			Superintendent Murrays's appointment, to enquire into	
29			aspects of the controversy relating to penalty points.	

1 Do you recall that? 2 I don't recall it, but I would accept that, I don't see Α. 3 an issue there. Could I ask you, please, to be shown Volume 9, at page 4 393 0. 5 2612? Do you see this is an extract from the 12:54 journal.ie. There is a headline which says: 6 7 "The appointment of Superintendent Pat Murray." 8 9 10 Do you see that? 12:55 11 Α. It doesn't appear to be the -- is this the 12 same --13 394 Q. Yes. The headline is: 14 Α. 15 12:55 16 "Confusion over last minute change." 17 18 And then the subheading appears to be the appointment of --19 20 I'm talking about page 2612, the heading on that page 395 Q. 12:55 21 is: 22 23 "The appointment of Superintendent Pat Murray." 24 25 Do you agree? 12:55 26 It's not a heading, it's a subheading. Α. 27 396 It's a heading on that page? Q. 28 On that page. Α. 29 397 Yes, thank you? Ο.

1		Α.	The heading would be the previous page, for	
2			clarification.	
3	398	Q.	In terms of the report, can I ask you to turn over to	
4			the following page, I think you will agree with me that	
5			Superintendent Murray is named?	12:55
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	399	Q.	If you turn over to the following page, he is also	
8			named again, do you see that?	
9		Α.	Yeah.	
10	400	Q.	In the middle of the page.	12:56
11				
12			"Deputy Wallace rephrased the query. I just read the	
13			press report that Superintendent Pat Murray was	
14			actually involved in it but I don't know whether it is	
15			true or not."	12:56
16				
17			Were you aware that these questions were going to be	
18			asked about Superintendent Murray on that date?	
19		Α.	I don't know if I would've been aware. As I said, any	
20			dealings I had with Deputies Wallace and Daly is, I sit	12:56
21			down, I do the talking, they would listen and at	
22			different times they would ask me questions about	
23			whatever and that's it. After that, they deal with	
24			whatever they don't they're the type of people to	
25			say, if you said, I want you to bring that up or	12:56
26			something, you can forget it, because they're going to	
27			do their own thing anyway. They are very much their	
28			own individuals.	
29	401	Q.	Did you brief them in advance of that meeting, saying	

1			things against Superintendent Murray?	
2		Α.	Sorry?	
3	402	Q.	Did you brief them in advance of that meeting to say	
4			things against Superintendent Murray?	
5		Α.	I am sure I would have briefed it wouldn't have been	12:57
6			that I would have looked the way it probably would	
7			have worked is, I would have received a call and it	
8			would have been, come up to Dublin. I would have then	
9			had a meeting with them. I've described the way all	
10			the meetings were with them. That's it.	12:57
11	403	Q.	So is it fair to say at this time that you met with the	
12			deputies regularly to discuss Superintendent Murray?	
13		Α.	Superintendent Murray and other there's all the	
14			other stuff that's going on in the background.	
15	404	Q.	Let's just focus on Superintendent Murray?	12:57
16		Α.	But it's not just	
17	405	Q.	Let's just focus on this issue, please. This is issue	
18			we're are dealing with, Superintendent Murray. All I'm	
19			asking you is: Did you meet with them regularly to	
20			discuss Superintendent Murray?	12:57
21		Α.	Among other issues, which were all interrelated and	
22			emanate from criminality and corruption in Athlone.	
23	406	Q.	If I can ask you to go back, please, to Volume 8, page	
24			2068. This is March of 2017. I think you're aware	
25			this perhaps can be dealt with relatively briefly. I	12:58
26			think you're aware of the fact now that in March 2017	
27			Superintendent Murray submitted an application for	
28			promotion to the rank of chief superintendent to the	
29			Policing Authority?	

1		Α.	I'm aware now, yeah.	
2	407	Q.	Yes. And you're aware that the Policing Authority	
3			effectively step into this new role at that time?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	408	Q.	In terms of the first round, he will say that he was	12:58
6			interviewed for the first time on 5th May 2017. He was	
7			then informed on 19th May 2017 that he was selected to	
8			progress to the final interview stage of the promotion	
9			competition?	
10		Α.	Yes.	12:58
11	409	Q.	Then again on 13th June 2017, he will say that he was	
12			informed by the Policing Authority, and this is page	
13			2069, the last paragraph, that he was successful in the	
14			competition for promotion to the rank of chief	
15			superintendent and was placed at number 7, in the order	12:59
16			of merit for list of candidates deemed suitable for	
17			promotion?	
12		٨	Okav	

- You also say that named list of candidates appeared in 19 410 Q. the media on 7th July 2017. Did you become aware of 20 12:59 21 that fact at that date?
- 22 I don't know when I became aware of it. Α.
- 23 411 Was it shortly thereafter? Q.
- More than likely, more than likely I would have become 24 25 aware at some stage.

- 26 Now, in terms of the position as the summer of 2017 412 Q.
- 27 progressed, I think in September of 2017,
- 28 Superintendent Murray will say, this is at page 2070,
- 29 that Garda Greene spoke to him in the presence of then

1			Inspector Minnock and that he said that you, Garda	
2			Keogh, were no longer going after Superintendent Murray	
3			because your searches for information to unearth	
4			scandal about Superintendent Murray had proved	
5			fruitless. Is that something you said to Garda Greene	13:00
6			in that time?	
7		Α.	I doubt I would have said that because I fairly I	
8			submitted a lot of evidence before this Tribunal,	
9			Judge. So I doubt, I doubt that's accurate.	
10	413	Q.	He will say that Garda Green indicated that you were	13:00
11			now going after former Commissioner Ó Cualáin. Is that	
12			what you would have told Garda Greene?	
13		Α.	I can't recollect.	
14	414	Q.	Is that possible?	
15		Α.	I can't recollect what way I would have worded things	13:00
16			to Garda Greene and what way Garda Greene then would	
17			have worded them to Superintendent Murray. Then the	
18			issue of what Superintendent Murray himself wrote down.	
19			So, on this, the wording in any of this thing, Judge,	
20			there is a question mark over it.	13:00
21	415	Q.	would that have reflected your state of mind in	
22			September of 2017?	
23		Α.	It may have, I would say, Judge, because I would have	
24			always believed that it was Ó Cualáin, Deputy	
25			Commissioner Ó Cualáin that put Superintendent Murray	13:01
26			into the role to get me out. That's always been my	
27			case. I have always maintained that.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
29	416	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Except, as I put to you before, that's a	

1 case with no evidence. 2 But that's what he says, I have always 3 believed that. All right. Judge, just to address the last page, Judge. WI TNFSS: 4 5 CHAI RMAN: Yes. 13:01 6 WI TNESS: Can we bring document 11345, Judge. 7 CHAI RMAN: Certainly. Yes. 11345. Okay. Now, what's this? 8 WI TNESS: Judge, this is on Thursday, 14th September 9 It's a note from Donal Ó Cualáin. 10 2017. 13:01 11 417 CHAI RMAN: Thursday, the 14th September? Q. 12 Yes. Α. 13 14 "Rang P Murray. Discussed college option with him. 15 Was happy to take it on promotion." 13:02 16 17 418 CHAI RMAN: Yes. Q. 18 They're already lining Superintendent Murray and Deputy Α. 19 Commissioner Ó Cualáin, they're all ready, and this is 20 prior to the promotion in the Policing Authority. 13:02 21 Judge, if we go to the next page, there is a further 22 part. 23 419 CHAI RMAN: Yes. Q. 24 It's on Thursday, 19th October 2017. Α. 25 Hold on a second until we get there. 420 Ο. CHAI RMAN: Just 13:02 26 give us a chance to get there. Yes. 27 Α. Yes. This is Donal Ó Cualáin: 28 29 "Rang Eugene Corcoran."

2			He's another assistant commissioner, I think he's now	
3			maybe retired.	
4	421	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
5		Α.		13:02
6			" to call to office. Also discussed NK file.	
7			Clearance for P Murray."	
8				
9			Judge, this is prior, this is all going on prior to the	
10			Policing Authority promotion.	13:02
11	422	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Did you know that in September 2017?	
12		Α.	No, I am only	
13	423	Q.	Or October 2017?	
14		Α.	I am only after finding out sure all this from reading	
15			the documents.	13:03
16	424	Q.	We will come back to this later on. We are talking	
17			about your state of mind in September 2017, where it's	
18			recorded that you were saying that you were now going	
19			after former Commissioner Ó Cualáin. At that stage you	
20			know nothing about the internal disposition of forward	13:03
21			planning, or did you?	
22		Α.	No, I didn't know anything about it.	
23	425	Q.	No.	
24		Α.	I didn't know internally what was going on. But the	
25			point is, they're already, they're already lining up	13:03
26			the promotion. My point was originally I know I	
27			have said it again.	
28	426	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
29		Α.	But just to reinforce it, that Ó Cualáin put Murray	

Т			Deputy Commissioner O Cualain put Superintendent Murray	
2			in Athlone to get me out so he could conduct the	
3			investigation or whatever he was doing. And after that	
4			then they organised the promotion, which is clearly	
5			there on 11345, where ó Cualáin is discussing with	13:03
6			this. And I mean	
7	427	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Tell me more. What conclusion are you	
8			drawing from the materials that we're looking at?	
9		Α.	My conclusion is, what I had stated all along, my	
10			suspicion.	13:04
11	428	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Turns out to be right.	
12		Α.	Correct.	
13	429	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Explain how it turned out to be right.	
14		Α.	Well, it's in these documents here and then there is	
15			more	13:04
16	430	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, these documents here, what do you read	
17			these documents as saying that confirms your	
18			suspicions, that is what I want to know?	
19		Α.	Yes. In relation to 345, Judge, there, Deputy	
20			Commissioner Ó Cualáin is in contact, direct contact	13:04
21			with Superintendent Pat Murray, discussing where he is	
22			going to be stationed after he is promoted.	
23	431	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes? And?	
24		Α.	Well, he hasn't even been promoted yet and they're	
25			discussing where he is going to be put after the	13:04
26			promotion. Because there's an issue with filling out	
27			the clearance forms.	
28	432	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
29		Α.	Which involved Deputy Commissioner Ó Cualáin and	

- 1 Assistant Commissioner Finn, Judge.
- 2 433 Q. CHAIRMAN: Whether it's right or it's not right or it's important or it's not important, you are citing these
- 4 documents as evidence to support your contention of
- 5 irregular conduct on the part of Assistant Commissioner 13:05
- 6 Ó Cualáin?
- 7 A. Yes, Judge.
- 8 434 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is that right?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 435 Q. MR. MURPHY: Sorry, Garda Keogh, there is just one
- 11 problem about that, which you dealt with, which you
- have ignored, that's at page 2069. That's on 30th June

13:05

13:06

- 13 2017, the Policing Authority, an independent body, had
- told Superintendent Murray he was successful in the
- 15 competition for promotion to chief superintendent and
- was placed in an order of rank. In other words, his
- 17 promotion in that situation will occur in the course of
- 18 time?
- 19 CHAIRMAN: On the 30th June.
- MR. MURPHY: on the 30th.
- 21 CHAIRMAN: No, no, I had it as the 13th, I had
- 22 miswritten it.
- 23 436 Q. MR. MURPHY: I have to suggest to you there's nothing
- 24 weird or wonderful about that discussion at all.
- 25 WITNESS: Judge, can I address that, and I know we're
- 26 due to break. Page 4023, please.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Can we get 4023? What about this?
- 28 WI TNESS: This is, Judge, September 2017, these are the
- 29 clearance forms in relation to Superintendent Murray's

Т			promotion. Judge, Assistant Commissioner Finn, 1 think	
2			now just on this, is investigating the bullying and	
3			harassment thing, Judge. At the bottom of page 4023,	
4			this is Assistant Commissioner Finn's clearance form	
5			for Superintendent Murray.	13:07
6				
7			"Records at this office indicate there are presently no	
8			outstanding discipline or complaint investigation in	
9			respect of this candidate."	
10				13:07
11	437	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. And the date of that is?	
12		Α.	It looks like 16/9/17, it looks like.	
13	438	Q.	CHAIRMAN: We will get the date of that. Hold on, we	
14			will get the date of that document.	
15		Α.	Judge, just on the next document, at 4024, Judge,	13:07
16			section 5:	
17				
18			"I confirm that the information provided in section 1	
19			to 4 is complete and I will notify the Policing	
20			Authority without delay of any change or update of that	13:08
21			information until the panel candidates arising from	
22			this section competition expires and if requested"	
23				
24			Judge, they lied to the Policing Authority in relation	
25			to this matter, between Assistant Commissioner Finn and	13:08
26			Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin and they're already	
27			Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin is previously speaking	
28			to Murray in relation to where he wants to go when he's	
29			promoted.	

Т	439	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Again, Garda Keogn, I suggest that's	
2			entirely false. What agreement and what investigation	
3			was in place at that date?	
4		Α.	There's a bullying and harassment investigation.	
5	440	Q.	On which date?	13:08
6		Α.	These documents are written in, when, September '17.	
7	441	Q.	Had anybody been appointed to investigate at that	
8			stage?	
9		Α.	Judge, the thing with I'm not sure on the	
10			appointment. But what it has here:	13:09
11				
12			"I will notify the Policing Authority without delay of	
13			any change or update."	
14				
15			They never told or updated the Policing Authority with	13:09
16			anything. That's as good as a lie. They kept them in	
17			the dark	
18	442	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. That's on page 40?	
19		Α.	24.	
20	443	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Notwithstanding the fact, Garda Keogh, as	13:09
21			we dealt with in recent days, you know full well that	
22			the appointment in relation to bullying and harassment	
23			was November 2017, is that right?	
24		Α.	Sorry?	
25	444	Q.	The appointment in relation to the bullying and	13:09
26			harassment case, inquiry, was 2017, November, isn't	
27			that right?	
28		Α.	And was Assistant Commissioner Finn appointed to do it.	
29			MR. KELLY: Judge, in fairness, I should point out that	

1			this witness has said that the complaint was actually	
2			made in March.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
4			MR. KELLY: It may well be that there was a delay in	
5			the process, that's part of our case, that there was a	13:09
6			delay in appointment.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
8			MR. MURPHY: And there was also an acceptance by this	
9			witness in relation to the Finn inquiry, that he	
10			accepted the explanation given by Assistant	13:10
11			Commissioner Fanning.	
12			CHAIRMAN: well, there we will leave it. Thank you	
13			very much. We will come back a little after, whatever	
14			time is it now, we will come back at 2:15. Okay.	
15			Thank you very much.	13:10
16				
17			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED, AS	
18			FOLLOWS:	
19				
20	445	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman. Garda Keogh, I think	14:13
21			just before lunch you made reference to some	
22			documentation in relation to the Policing Authority. I	
23			wonder if you could be shown Volume 14, page 4021,	
24			please. I think this is the document entitled:	
25				14:14
26			"Policing Authority clearance form - to be completed by	
27			the Garda Síochána".	
28				
29			Do you see this?	

Т		Α.	res.	
2	446	Q.	Can I just ask you to turn to the second sorry, the	
3			middle of the page, it says:	
4				
5			"Clearance process required of the authority."	14:14
6				
7			And it says:	
8				
9			"The authority's clearance process is based on this	
10			form, a form completed by the candidate and a form	14:15
11			completed by the GSOC Commission. The clearance	
12			process will be activated in the event that candidate	
13			is placed on the panel of candidates and has been	
14			considered for appointment to a position and the	
15			selection Board will decide on any clearance process	14:15
16			forms."	
17				
18			Just turning over to the next page, please?	
19		Α.	Sorry, just what page are we on now?	
20	447	Q.	That's page 4022.	14:15
21		Α.	Okay.	
22	448	Q.	Which is the next page. Can I just draw your attention	
23			to the middle of the page, under the heading	
24			"Section 2". This is the format that applied at that	
25			time, it has been I think subsequently amended. I	14:15
26			think you are familiar with this. Under section 2, it	
27			says:	
28				
29			"Previous disciplinary actions: Please provide details	

Τ			of any disciplinary actions under the Garda Siochana	
2			(Discipline) Regulations that the candidate was the	
3			subject of."	
4				
5			Do you see that?	14:15
6		Α.	That's what it says.	
7	449	Q.	And what it says and what it says at the time was, this	
8			should include:	
9				
10			"1. The nature of the breach of discipline in respect	14:16
11			of which the candidate was sanctioned.	
12				
13			2. The nature of the sanction.	
14				
15			3. The date of the sanction.	14:16
16				
17			4. Any other relevant matters you may wish to bring to	
18			the authority's attention."	
19				
20		Α.	Sorry, what was the last one there?	14:16
21	450	Q.	Garda Keogh, can you see the page?	
22		Α.	Any other	
23	451	Q.	Yes. Can you just look at the paragraph I am looking	
24			at, which I am reading out to you and just focus on the	
25			page, if you will, please. So, this indicates what's	14:16
26			required to be included. Do you see all those details?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	452	Q.	Now, the first point, would you agree with me that the	
29			heading there is "previous disciplinary actions"?	

1		Α.	Yes. But obviously the last part jumped out:	
2				
3			"Any other relevant matters you wish to bring to the	
4			authority's attention."	
5				14:16
6	453	Q.	Yes, and that is under the heading of "disciplinary	
7			action", isn't that right?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	454	Q.	You agree with me that that does not refer to bullying	
10			or harassment, it refers to disciplinary issues, isn't	14:16
11			that correct. That's the word at the top of the form?	
12		Α.	Well, you see, it's a possibility that there could very	
13			well be disciplinary matters out of a bullying and	
14			harassment investigation.	
15	455	Q.	Garda Keogh, don't you know full well there's a	14:17
16			difference between disciplinary investigations and	
17			bullying and harassment investigations. The point I'm	
18			putting to you, which you understand fully I suggest,	
19			is that at that time what was required to be inserted	
20			was matters relating to disciplinary actions, full	14:17
21			stop?	
22		Α.	It has here, in this is:	
23				
24			"Any other relevant matters that you wish to bring to	
25			the authority's attention".	14:17
26				
27	456	Q.	Again, that's all relating, as it suggests there, to	
28		•	disciplinary issues. I will put it to you again, just	
29			to assist you in that regard, this has been changed, on	

Т			my instructions, since that time and now does	
2			incorporate a separate reference to bullying and	
3			harassment. So, at the time that we are talking about	
4			relevant to this case, that the only material that was	
5			to be put in was disciplinary. Would you agree with	14:17
6			that?	
7		Α.	Well, Judge, on section 4 here, on the next page, it	
8			has	
9			CHAIRMAN: He is asking about paragraph 2.	
10			WI TNESS: Yes.	14:18
11			CHAIRMAN: He's not asking you to argue or jump ahead	
12			or anything else. Let's just focus on the questions.	
13	457	Q.	MR. MURPHY: So, looking at section 2, I have asked you	
14			to agree with me that that's disciplinary, and I think	
15			you accept that?	14:18
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	458	Q.	I've asked you to agree that that doesn't represent	
18			bullying and harassment, which as you know under the	
19			Garda Code at that time was a separate process?	
20		Α.	But again, my answer is, it's possible there could be	14:18
21			disciplinary matters out of a bullying and harassment	
22			investigation.	
23	459	Q.	The point I'm making to you, Garda Keogh, which I think	
24			you understood, is that at the time the forms were	
25			filled in that's relevant to this issue, what was	14:18
26			required to be inserted was disciplinary actions, isn't	
27			that right?	
28		Α.	That's the heading it's under.	
29	460	Q.	If we just turn over the page, please, to the page you	

1			were going to move to, page 4023, section 3 deals with	
2			previous convictions. I think you will agree with me,	
3			that relates to criminal items, including road traffic	
4			items?	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:18
6	461	Q.	That's very specific. Then section 4, that's headed	
7				
8			"Outstanding criminal or disciplinary investigations."	
9				
10			Do you see that?	14:19
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	462	Q.	Do you see also the bullet-points, it says:	
13				
14			"This should include the nature of the alleged	
15			wrongdoing; the nature of the investigative process;	14:19
16			criminal or discipline; less serious discipline or	
17			serious discipline; and details of the stage of the	
18			investigation or process."	
19				
20		Α.	Yes, Judge.	14:19
21	463	Q.	So, I have to suggest to you that at that time the	
22			documentation required information in those categories	
23			and those categories only to be referred to in the	
24			form?	
25		Α.	Oh, I don't Judge, I can't this Judge, they	14:19
26			were obliged to inform the Policing Authority that	
27			there was a bullying and harassment investigation.	
28	464	Q.	I have to suggest to you that the Policing Authority's	
29			own rules did not require that at the time. And that's	

Т			the point about the form, isn't it? The form doesn't	
2			mention bullying and harassment at all, isn't that	
3			correct?	
4		Α.	I'd have to read the full form, but Mr. Murphy may be	
5			correct on that, Judge.	14:20
6	465	Q.	Garda Keogh, there are two things here, you may	
7			disagree with the this form, you may disagree with the	
8			completeness of what was required by the authority, but	
9			I am just asking you to accept as a matter of fact, at	
10			that time this was the form the Policing Authority	14:20
11			required to be filled in?	
12		Α.	Judge, I have to accept that, but in accepting it, I	
13			have to point out the thing on page 4022, which does	
14			say:	
15				14:20
16			"Any other relevant matters you wish to bring to the	
17			authority's attention."	
18				
19			I think that sentence, Judge, covers my argument.	
20	466	Q.	You see, I have to suggest to you that that covers	14:20
21			issues in relation to disciplinary action?	
22			CHAIRMAN: Mr. Murphy, are we slightly at Garda	
23			Keogh says, look, I wrote to the various people,	
24			including the Policing Authority, and I said, here's	
25			serious complaints against Superintendent Murray and	14:21
26			you shouldn't promote him until they have been disposed	
27			of.	
28			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
29			CHAIRMAN: In a nutshell, not exactly that, but in a	

1			nutshell that was what he was saying. The meaning, the	
2			interpretation of the Policing Authority rules, may I	
3			respectfully suggest, is not to be determined by, with	
4			all respect, Garda Keogh's opinion about it.	
5			MR. MURPHY: Yes, Chairman, I accept that.	14:21
6			CHAIRMAN: He points out the inclusion of any other	
7			relevant matters. I will in due course be hoping for	
8			submissions from you and from Mr. Kelly and from our	
9			own counsel as to the proper interpretation to be put	
10			on that. But I think it's a matter of interpretation	14:22
11			of law. In other words, I don't think that Garda	
12			Keogh, you didn't have this at the time	
13		Α.	No.	
14	467	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You didn't have this form at the time?	
15		Α.	No.	14:22
16	468	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You're just looking at this after. I mean	
17			no disrespect when I say that let me put it this	
18			way: Just for the sake of argument, suppose you were	
19			to agree with Mr. Murphy that this had nothing to do	
20			whatsoever with bullying and harassment, and suppose it	14:22
21			did have a section saying it and you mistakenly agreed,	
22			it's still a matter that for interpretation that has to	
23			be looked at. Do you follow me?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	469	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Really in the end it's a lawyers' debate	14:22
26			arising out of the facts. I take it would you agree	
27			with that, Mr. Kelly?	
28			MR. KELLY: Yes.	
29			CHAIRMAN: The interpretation of the form is a	

1			matter I would be welcoming submissions on that	
2			particular point. Mr. Murphy says, look, we did	
3			absolutely nothing wrong, the Gardaí did nothing wrong,	
4			they sent it forward in accordance with the form at the	
5			time. That's a matter for discussion, it seems to me,	14:23
6			as to the meaning of the thing.	
7			MR. KELLY: It's a matter for you in the end, Judge, to	
8			decide.	
9			CHAIRMAN: with counsel's assistance.	
10			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	14:23
11			CHAIRMAN: It's not a rebuke, Mr. Murphy. I am just	
12			thinking, I am just reflecting on the discussion. I	
13			have no criticism for you putting it to Garda Keogh but	
14			I am just thinking through that, no, we will get to	
15			that.	14:23
16			MR. MURPHY: Chairman, I fully accept your indication	
17			and direction. Merely I felt the need to put it to a	
18			witness because it was so	
19			CHAIRMAN: No, no, I appreciate that. We have been	
20			dealing very much a question as to what was necessary	14:23
21			to put. Garda Keogh has said, look, my position is, I	
22			notified them and I believe they shouldn't have moved	
23			without satisfying themselves that this matter was	
24			determined. I think that's essentially your point.	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:24
26			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
27	470	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman. Could I move on then	
28			please, to Volume 8, at page 2070. Superintendent	
29			Murray will say that on 27th Sentember 2017 that RTÉ	

1			News at one radio programme made reference to him by	
2			name as a senior officer waiting to be promoted and	
3			against whom you had made allegations. The programme	
4			also queried if the Policing Authority were aware of	
5			that. Can I ask you, did you speak to RTÉ in an effort	14:24
6			to ensure that that information was made available to	
7			them?	
8		Α.	Em, Judge, can I just read this is bottom paragraph	
9			on page	
10			CHAIRMAN: On the 27th September, yes.	14:25
11		Α.	Judge, this is Clare Daly I think that's speaking to	
12			RTÉ.	
13	471	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Just to be clear, Garda Keogh, are you	
14			saying to the Chairman that had you nothing to do with	
15			this at all?	14:25
16		Α.	No, I would agree anything that Clare Daly had said	
17			in relation to Athlone or anything to do with me has	
18			come from me.	
19	472	Q.	Does it come a bit closer than that? Did you instruct	
20			your solicitor to speak to RTÉ about this matter?	14:25
21		Α.	Judge, I'm aware that my solicitor did speak to, oh, I	
22			think it was the This Week programme on RTÉ.	
23	473	Q.	Again just to help you, Garda Keogh, and to be fair to	
24			you, could I ask that you be shown	
25		Α.	Sorry, no, I think. I know, Judge, that.	14:26
26	474	Q.	Could you please be shown Volume 9, at page 2648?	
27	475	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Around this time, in other words?	
28		Α.	Yes, Judge.	

29 476 Q. MR. MURPHY: First of all, Garda Keogh, you see the

1			headline says:	
2				
3			"Letter claims Garda whistleblower kept in dark over	
4			allegations probe."	
5				14:26
6			Do you see that?	
7		Α.	Yes, Judge	
8	477	Q.	Can I ask you to look at the second paragraph, it says:	
9				
10			"According to correspondence seen by RTÉ's This Week	14:26
11			radio programme, Garda Nick Keogh has written to Garda	
12			headquarters saying he is totally in the dark over how	
13			several related programmes into his allegations are now	
14			bei ng handl ed. "	
15				14:27
16			Do you see that?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	478	Q.	I think you will agree with me, that must have been	
19			because you or Mr. Cullen supplied that information to	
20			RTÉ?	14:27
21		Α.	Yes, Judge.	
22	479	Q.	Thank you. Then over the next page	
23		Α.	Just for clarification as well, it's not just one	
24			probe, it's not just the bullying and harassment thing,	
25			there's the disciplinary investigation, of course, as	14:27
26			well.	
27			CHAIRMAN: Several related probes it says.	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	480	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Please could you just turn over to the	

Τ			tollowing page, page 2649. Do you see the middle of	
2			the page, please, the sentence beginning:	
3				
4			"Speaking to RTÉ This Week, Carrick-on-Shannon based	
5			solicitor John Gerard Cullen, who represents Garda	14:27
6			Keogh, said his client had no idea what was the current	
7			status of the complaint."	
8				
9		Α.	Yes, Judge.	
10	481	Q.	You can see there is a quotation, I don't propose to	14:28
11			read that into the record, but I think effectively	
12			Mr. Cullen protests about delay and says that you have	
13			no reason as to understand why there had been a delay.	
14			Is that correct?	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:28
16	482	Q.	Then it says, at the following page, at page 2650, and	
17			it made reference to your complaints, it says:	
18				
19			"He says in the letter"	
20				14:28
21			That's you say in the letter.	
22				
23			"that the bullying complaint relates in part to a	
24			senior officer in the force who has sought promotion	
25			and he has questioned whether the Policing Authority	14:28
26			would be have been made aware of this complaint."	
27				
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	483	Q.	Then Mr. Cullen is quoted as saying:	

Т				
2			"Garda Keogh invoked a formal procedure about six	
3			months ago and we don't have any idea what has happened	
4			si nce. "	
5				14:29
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	484	Q.	Again, the balance of the article refers protests by	
8			Mr. Cullen on your behalf about delay. So I think	
9			there is no doubt about it but that this broadcast was	
10			directly, fundamentally and completely informed by what	14:29
11			you instructed Mr. Cullen to say towards you?	
12		Α.	Judge, I wouldn't have instructed word-for-word what	
13			Mr. Cullen is going to say.	
14	485	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, in a general way, Mr. Cullen acting on	
15			your behalf is making these observations?	14:29
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	486	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Could I ask you please to move back then	
18			to Volume 8, at page 2070. This is in September of	
19			2017. Superintendent Murray will say that on 27th	
20			September 2017, Deputy Daly made reference at a Dáil	14:30
21			Justice Committee to Superintendent Murray in asking	
22			the authority chairman, Ms. Josephine Feehily of the	
23			Policing Authority, if she received correspondence from	
24			a solicitor about you, and if Garda management were	
25			pulling the wool over the authority's eyes in relation	14:30
26			to the promotion of Superintendent Murray. Can we take	
27			it insofar as there is reference to correspondence from	
28			a solicitor, you had furnished that correspondence to	
29			Deputy Daly?	

- 1 A. I would presume so.
- 2 487 Q. Yes. In terms of Superintendent Murray's position, at
- this stage there has been multiple broadcasts, now an
- 4 interview by your solicitor, speeches in the Dáil and
- all of this, I have to suggest to you, was a pattern of 14:30

14:31

- 6 conduct which amounted to targeting Superintendent
- 7 Murray to try and block his promotion?
- 8 A. No, no, no, no. No, Judge. Because there's other
- 9 matters. There's the main thing -- there's the
- promotion is one issue, fine. But there's also the
- other, the big -- the elephant in the room, the
- 12 disciplinary investigation into the heroin and that
- side of the thing is also there.
- 14 488 Q. To put it a different way, I think you agreed earlier
- on what you were doing here was seeking to bring
- 16 Superintendent Murray down?
- 17 A. No, no.
- 18 489 Q. Well you weren't trying to help him, were you?
- 19 A. No, no. I have said all along, if they were going to
- do the promotion, do it properly. Have the
- investigation and do it properly. That's all.
- 22 490 Q. Garda Keogh, separately did you not accept this morning
- 23 that you had an intention to do what you could to bring
- down a number of people, including Superintendent
- Murray and you accepted this morning that bringing down 14:31
- 26 meant ending their career?
- 27 A. No, Judge.
- 28 491 Q. That's what you said this morning?
- 29 A. Judge, I don't think it's entirely accurate.

- 1 492 Q. I have to suggest to you it was.
- 2 CHAIRMAN: You have raised the question, Mr. Murphy.
- If he said it this morning, then he said it this
- 4 morning, and if he didn't say it this morning... Now
- what do you say? How do you want to respond to that?

14:32

14:32

14:33

- 6 A. I accept there's an awful lot of references to me
- 7 saying bring down Nóirín O'Sullivan. But in relation
- 8 to Superintendent Murray, it's to do with -- what my
- 9 argument all along is, if he was to be promoted it
- should have been after the investigation and not
- 11 during.
- 12 493 Q. CHAIRMAN: I have that point.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 494 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Murphy says, well, look here,
- wasn't this part of a plan? I'm not saying I agree
- with it, I'm just saying what he is saying. Wasn't
- this part of your plan, your intention, your scheme,
- 18 reflected in your attitude, that you wanted eh wanted
- to bring him down? Do you understand?
- 20 A. Oh yeah, I understand.
- 21 495 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do you understand what I am saying? I'm not
- 22 saying that's your attitude. I am asking you to
- comment on the suggestion that that was your attitude?
- 24 A. I think bringing down is the wrong phrase. To prevent
- 25 him being promoted while the investigation is ongoing.
- 26 496 O. CHAIRMAN: Let me come back for a second. If it was
- 27 your intention, before any question of promotion came
- up, if it was your intention to bring him down, if it
- was your intention to bring him down, and then this

promotion question comes in, okay, that might be an opportunity for at least damaging him, if not bringing him down, I'll try to frustrate the promotion, you know.

5 A. Yeah.

Α.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

6 497 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Maybe it's not nice, but maybe that 7 was your attitude. Is that what we are talking about? 14:33

14:33

A. Yeah, I think that's more accurate than bringing him down, Judge. I think that's more accurate.

10 498 Q. CHAIRMAN: I really don't want to be -- I'm slightly
11 reluctant to put any words on this for fear of getting
12 it wrong or suggesting something wrong. Do you follow
13 me?

Judge, I was highlighting -- trying to get Deputy Daly and Deputy Wallace to highlight the fact 14:34 that they're aware from the very start in relation to bullying, the whole chain of events of bullying and harassment that I -- prior even to Superintendent Murray. But in relation to Superintendent Murray, that becomes an issue when he then is going for promotion. 14:34 It's parallel at the same time, roughly, I am trying to invoke the bullying and harassment policy. where we are at here. Both of these things are in -what's the word? They're both parallel, going forward. An Garda Síochána is trying to promote, appears to be 14:35 trying to promote Superintendent Murray, based on what it showed earlier. And I'm speaking to Deputies Wallace and Daly and I'm pointing out to them he shouldn't be promoted, at least until this dealt with.

1			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
2	499	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I wonder just in the light of that answer,	
3			can I ask you to be shown Volume 9, please, page 2647.	
4			This is a note prepared by Superintendent Murray based	
5			on the conversation you referred to before lunch, on	14:35
6			4/9/2017, with Garda Greene. You recall that before	
7			lunch we raised this issue with you, that	
8			Superintendent Murray will say that Garda Greene spoke	
9			to him in Athlone Garda Station, then had a	
10			conversation with him outside, in which he told	14:36
11			Superintendent Murray that you were no longer going	
12			after him because you were of the view that you could	
13			no longer damage Superintendent Murray's promotions any	
14			more because he had been selected for promotion by the	
15			Policing Authority and your searches hadn't unearthed	14:36
16			anything with which to damage the character of	
17			Superintendent Murray any further?	
18		Α.	Judge, this is Superintendent Murray's version in	
19			writing.	
20	500	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Of a conversation he had with Garda Greene?	14:36
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	501	Q.	CHAIRMAN: In relation to a conversation that Garda	
23			Greene had with you?	
24		Α.	Correct.	
25	502	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. All I want to know is, take what	14:36
26			Garda Greene is reported as saying about you and tell	
27			me what you think: Did you say it? Did you mean it?	
28			Or did you say something different? Can you remember?	
29			Or what is the position?	

1		Α.	Judge, can I just read the paragraph?	
2			CHAIRMAN: Read it, yes.	
3	503	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, can I you ask you just to	
4			forget for a moment about Superintendent Murray and	
5			just think about Garda Greene. Did you tell Garda	14:3
6			Greene in early September 2017 that you were no longer	
7			going after Superintendent Murray because you were of	
8			the view that you couldn't damage Superintendent	
9			Murray's promotion prospects any more?	
10		Α.	Judge, I can't recollect what I would have said to	14:3
11			Garda Greene. Certainly the wording in this definitely	
12			wouldn't have been if there was a conversation along	
13			those lines, definitely I wouldn't worded it as they're	
14			recorded here.	
15	504	Q.	Leave the words to one side, how about the message,	14:3
16			would the essential message have been correct; that you	
17			weren't going after Superintendent Murray any more,	
18			that your searches hadn't unearthed anything with which	
19			to damage Superintendent Murray's character any	
20			further, something along those lines?	14:3
		_		

- 21 A. Judge, I don't think that would be accurate, that part.
- 22 505 Q. Do you see the next bit where --
- 23 CHAIRMAN: Just stop there for a minute. You say there was a conversation along those lines.

- 25 A. There may have been.
- 26 506 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is that right?
- 27 A. There may have been.
- 28 507 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, there may have been?
- 29 A. I just can't remember.

- No, no, that is okay. You're not agreeing 1 CHAI RMAN: 2 that there was, you're saying it's possible that there 3 You're not denying the possibility. I'm not, no, I'm not denying the possibility. 4 Α. 5 508 CHAI RMAN: Okay. Q. 14:39 6 But the wording on this, the way it's worded --Α. 7 509 MR. MURPHY: Let's leave the wording, Garda, to one Q. 8 side. Just the second message, is it the case that you gave a message to Garda Greene in early September 2017 9 10 that you were now going after Deputy Commissioner 14:39 11 O Cualáin and the Commissioner instead? 12 Judge, the words here "going after" and all this sort Α. 13 of stuff, that's not something that I -- I mean... 14 don't know what to say in relation to that. 15 CHAI RMAN: Just say what you want to say? 510 Q. 14:39 16 Yeah. Α. 17 511 CHAI RMAN: If you don't think you said it. You had 0. 18 some such conversation? 19 Yeah, I'm sure I would have had a --Α. But you don't recall saying the things that 20 512 Q. 14:39 you're reported as saying, but there was some such 21 22 conversation? 23 There would have been a certain conversation, Judge. Α. 24 But again, whatever I would have said to Garda Greene
- 28 513 Q. CHAIRMAN: Don't you worry, I am fully alive.
- 29 A. Yeah.

25

26

27

Murray, who then interprets what he said.

is one matter, and then Garda Greene, whatever way he

interpreted what I said, goes back to Superintendent

14 · 40

- 1 514 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am fully alive to the possibilities of
- 2 misunderstanding. I am fully alive to that. But where

14 · 40

14:41

- we are so far is, yes, there was a conversation
- 4 referring to these matters, is that right?
- 5 A. I presume.
- 6 515 Q. CHAIRMAN: You think.
- 7 A. Can I check my diary, just in case I have --
- 8 516 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes, that would be helpful.
- 9 A. Yeah, I have nothing in my diary.
- 10 517 Q. CHAIRMAN: Nothing there?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 CHAIRMAN: Very good. All right, Mr. Murphy.
- 13 518 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, would you agree with me that
- 14 recording of that conversation is completely different
- to what occurs on 24th September 2017, when your
- 16 solicitor is on national radio or TV effectively again
- 17 repeating your complaints against Superintendent
- 18 Murray?
- 19 A. Judge, I'm confused. Like, a huge part of the evidence
- 20 I've given to this Tribunal is in relation to
- 21 Superintendent Murray. I don't fully follow where the
- 22 question is going.
- 23 519 Q. Can I suggest to you that certainly by the end of
- September 2017, your campaign to damage Superintendent
- Murray, to prevent his promotion, to bring him down was 14:41
- 26 fully underway?
- 27 A. Judge --
- 28 520 Q. CHAIRMAN: If you said that to Garda Greene and he got
- it right, and if the record made by the superintendent

1			a correct reflection, Mr. Murphy says that position as	
2			imputed to you is very different to from the position	
3			by Mr. Cullen on the 24th September. Which is correct,	
4			it is very different. Because you're saying in this	
5			one, as reported, I'm not going after him any more,	14:42
6			because he's already got promoted. Whereas on the 24th	
7			you definitely appeared to be going after him.	
8		Α.	Judge, yeah, if that was the case, wouldn't I have	
9			dropped my bullying and harassment thing.	
10	521	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I don't know whether you would or wouldn't.	14:42
11			But there is a big difference between -	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	522	Q.	CHAIRMAN: - what is imputed to you there and what	
14			happened. That is what Mr. Murphy is pointing out?	
15		Α.	Judge, I never dropped any of these allegations or	14:42
16			anything. All along I have stood by them and here to	
17			this Tribunal and that. So I am just confused by the	
18			way this is worded as well.	
19	523	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand.	
20		Α.	All I can accept, Judge, is there would have been a	14:43
21			conversation, I'm sure there is a conversation between	
22			myself and Garda Greene. The way it's worded thirdhand	
23			down the line, Judge, I can't	
24	524	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You cannot remember a version of the	
25			statement you might have made? I don't want you to	14:43
26			guess or speculate, you either remember it or you	
27			don't.	
28		Α.	Judge, I would have had numerous conversations with	
29			Garda Greene.	

- 1 525 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 2 A. On various matters. So there wouldn't be one that
- 3 stands out.
- 4 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 5 526 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, just for a few moments if you 14:43
- 6 would just help us in relation to your diary for that
- year, the diary for 2017. This is at Volume 47. If I
- 8 can begin at page 13369.
- 9 A. Just the date, please?
- 10 527 Q. Sorry, September. Just again to assist, there are two
- 11 calendars, I think, Garda Keogh, aren't there, 2016 and
- 12 2017 they become much larger, they are the one with the
- 13 Intergalactic Star Wars covers on the front of them.
- but the actual boxes are smaller, aren't they?
- 15 A. Yeah, that's correct. Judge, just for clarification, I 14:44
- had the diaries but I actually thought this would all
- be over by 2017 and '18 and that's why I switched onto
- calendars, because I thought this whole episode would

14 · 44

- be over. Obviously it wasn't and by 2018 I reverted
- 20 back to a diary.
- 21 528 Q. I see. I think this is a diary that has got Rebel
- 22 Forces on the top, is it, as opposed to the Star Wars
- for the early one, for 2016?
- A. They're both Star Wars calendars, Judge.
- 25 529 Q. Just if you wouldn't mind looking, please, at
- September, at page 13369, what event have you recorded
- for 10th September?
- 28 A. "Nóirín retires".
- 29 530 Q. I think that refers to Commissioner O'Sullivan?

1 Α. Yes. 2 Could I ask you just, if you wouldn't mind, please 531 Q. going back to a number of references. 3 In July of 2017, can I ask you to look at the 5th July? Again, the 4 5 handwriting is very small, I would just appreciate your 14:45 6 help in confirming what it says. 7 Yeah: Α. 8 "Under pressure trying to stop promotions". 9 10 14 · 45 11 532 Q. Sorry, could you explain the next sentence, if that is 12 relevant, I am not sure what it is. Does it relate to 13 this at all? It's not related to this. 14 Α. 15 533 Okay. I won't ask you it then. Just the first part Q. 14:45 16 then: 17 18 "Under pressure trying to stop promotions." 19 20 Is it fair to say that that reflected your mindset on 21 5th July 2017? That related to Superintendent Murray's 22 promotion? 23 Yeah, well I mean -- yes. Α. 24 Thank you. Do you see on the 9th July. 534 Q. 25 Just in the context, stop the promotion, the way they Α. 14 · 46 26 were trying to do it, to take it into context. 27 535 Q. I think the way you record it is simply to "stop the

promoti on"?

28

29

Α.

Yes, obviously that's what I have written here. But in

Т			the context, I mean, I haven't an essay written, it's a	
2			two-line note is all I have.	
3	536	Q.	I think that will be a matter for the Chairman to	
4			decide. But just in terms of number 9, the 9th July,	
5			does that relate to this issue at all? Can I ask you	14:46
6			to explain what that says?	
7		Α.	I can't remember exactly which letters they are. But I	
8			have a note, I am sure they're in the documents here.	
9			"Letters to GSOC".	
10	537	Q.	That's the second point:	14:46
11				
12			"John Barrett mental health Leo Varadkar"?	
13				
14		Α.	Promotions, yeah.	
15	538	Q.	Promotions, so that means you were writing to Leo	14:46
16			Varadkar in relation to the promotions as well?	
17		Α.	I presume so, Judge.	
18	539	Q.	Were you writing to Mr. Varadkar to ask him to use his	
19			influence to stop Superintendent Murray from being	
20			promoted?	14:47
21		Α.	Judge, if I could get a copy of the letter I'd have a	
22			better idea of what's in it, because I just can't	
23			remember.	
24	540	Q.	I don't appear to have that letter myself. Can I just	
25			ask you to confirm that you did write a letter to Leo	14:47
26			Varadkar in relation to Superintendent Murray's	
27			promotion, seeking for it to be stopped?	
28		Α.	If I can get the letter, I don't I can't I don't	
29			know what's in the letter, Judge. I can't actually	

- 1 recall.
- 2 541 Q. You weren't asking Mr. Varadkar to assist
- 3 Superintendent Murray's promotion to proceed, were you?
- 4 A. No, but it would have been -- on the lines I'm sure --

14 · 47

14:48

11.18

- 5 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, it says "and Leo Varadkar
- 6 (promotions)"
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 542 Q. CHAIRMAN: I think the cat in the corner of the room
- 9 would kind of guess what that meant?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 CHAIRMAN: I think. Until further suggestions?
- 12 543 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, could I ask you to go back to
- June, please?
- 14 A. Sorry?
- 15 544 Q. Could you go back to the month of June, please, in your 14:47
- 16 diary. In particular could you please look at the 29th
- 17 June. I am going to ask you to read that out to assist
- the Tribunal understand what this says.
- 19 A. 29th "Donal Ó Cualáin" and, Judge, I have written -- do
- you want me to read the whole wording of it?
- 21 545 Q. Please. I'm just not sure what it says, the print is
- so small.
- 23 A. Okay. Judge, just for clarification, this is going to
- refer to a senior officer, Judge.
- 25 546 Q. Well, if it's not relevant to the issue, then we will
- leave it out. But does it refer to promotions as well?
- 27 CHAIRMAN: Donal Ó Cualáin and another officer, another
- senior officer, meet police authority.
- 29 A. Yes.

1	547	Q.	CHAIRMAN: what is the next bit?	
2		Α.	The next bit is a separate thing.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Okay. We're not concerned with the bit	
4			under the line?	
5		Α.	No.	14:49
6	548	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Can I ask you: Was that entry to do with	
7			promotions or was it something completely different?	
8		Α.	No, this is I presume I don't know, this is, I	
9			presume what I here is that Donal Ó Cualáin and	
10	549	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Another officer?	14:49
11		Α.	a chief superintendent meet at the Policing	
12			Authority.	
13	550	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Very well. Perhaps we will move on from	
14			that, please could I ask you to look back at May. In	
15			particular on the 15th May, there's a reference to	14:49
16			Clare, is that Clare Daly TD, Monday?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	551	Q.	Yes. So is that Clare Daly speaking about your	
19			complaints and about Superintendent Murray?	
20		Α.	I can't remember off hand what she was talking about	14:49
21			but it was more than likely everything in general, I	
22			presume. The only note I have is:	
23				
24			"Clare on Vincent Browne".	
25				14:50
26	552	Q.	Just to help you in that regard, would you turn to the	
27			4th, Thursday 4th May, could you help us to understand	
28			what's in that box, please?	

29 A.

1				
2			"Nóirín PAC Barrett clash. I heard P Murray on second	
3			round promotion list."	
4				
5	553	Q.	Okay. So you were made aware of the fact that	14:50
6			Superintendent Murray was on the second round of the	
7			promotions list. Can I ask you to tell the Chairman	
8			who told you that?	
9		Α.	I don't know was it a list that's circulated. That	
10			could have been anybody within the Guards or anything.	14:50
11			I have no idea.	
12	554	Q.	Well, can we just see who it wouldn't have been. It	
13			wouldn't have been somebody in the Policing Authority,	
14			would it?	
15		Α.	Oh, no.	14:50
16	555	Q.	So, it is much more likely to be somebody in the	
17			Guards?	
18		Α.	More than likely. But in the Guards, guards with	
19			rumours and things like that is like wildfire. So I	
20			would have if that I would have heard that fairly	14:51
21			lively, Judge.	
22	556	Q.	This is fairly specific intelligence, it's that he's on	
23			the second round of appointments?	
24		Α.	Yeah.	
25	557	Q.	Would that type of information really at that stage be	14:51
26			only known to very high ranking officers?	
27		Α.	I don't know.	
28	558	Q.	Do you remember who it was who gave you that	
29			information?	

2 No, but it didn't come out of the sky, it had to come 559 Q. 3 from somebody who was in the know? Absolutely, yeah. 4 Α. 5 560 And the number of people in the know at that time --Q. 14:51 6 It may not have come from somebody -- it may have come Α. 7 from somebody in the know to somebody else and then to 8 me. Can I just ask you to look down at the 25th 9 561 I see. Q. 10 May, is that an entry about Deputy Wallace? 14:51 11 Yes. Α. 12 562 Again, could you just help me to read what that says, 0. if it's relevant to this issue? 13 14 Α. Yeah. 15 14:52 16 "Mick Wallace brings up (it's to do with broadsheet article). 17 The plot thickens. Broadsheet. Case about..." 18 19 20 The bottom part is nothing to do with this, anything to 14:52 do with this 21 22 Could I ask you to turn back, please, to April. 563 I see. Q. 23 In particular, could you please look at the 26th April. 24 Again, the writing is very small, but could you just 25 help me identify, is that relevant to this issue? Is 14 · 52 26 that relevant to Superintendent Murray? It starts 27 "Mick Ouinn"? 28 Α. Yes.

I don't have it, I don't have it written down.

1

29

Α.

1 "Just rang on behalf of Chief Superintendent 2 McLoughlin, do I want to go back to work in Athlone". 3 4 564 I think there aren't any other references on Ο. 5 that page to do with what we are dealing with today, is 14:53 6 that right, on that page? I would have to look at the whole page. 7 Α. Take a moment. 8 565 Q. 9 Yeah, I don't think there is anything. Α. Finally on this part, could I ask you, please, to go 10 566 Q. 14:53 11 back to March. Can I ask you to look at the 26th 12 March. 13 Yes. Α. 14 567 Q. There's a reference there to "Nóirín" is that Nóirín O'Sullivan, the Commissioner? 15 14:54 16 Yes. Α. 17 568 Could you just identify what else is said there? Q. 18 Α. 19 "FF pulls support on Nóirín". 20 14:54 To what does that refer? 21 569 Q. 22 Fianna Fáil. Α. 23 570 In terms of the 7th of that month, of March, there's a Q. 24 reference to Carrick-on-Shannon? 25 Yeah. Α. 14:54 26 571 It refers to somebody under pressure. Who is that? 0. 27 Does that relate to Murray?

No. Can you just give a moment?

28

29

572

Α.

Q.

Please.

1			CHAIRMAN: what date are we looking at?	
2			MR. MURPHY: we are looking at the 7th March.	
3			CHAIRMAN: The 7th, thank you.	
4		Α.	Yeah, no, that's to do with my statement to do with the	
5			Tribunal, Judge.	14:54
6	573	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I see.	
7		Α.	That's where I thought there was a deadline for the	
8			13th and just down below it I have "statement for".	
9	574	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Cullen's office is in	
10			Carrick-on-Shannon?	14:55
11		Α.	Yes. I went up there, you see, trying to get that	
12			statement.	
13	575	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's just noting that you went up there?	
14		Α.	For the 13th.	
15			CHAIRMAN: All right.	14:55
16	576	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Yes, very good. Just finally on the	
17			diaries, could I ask you to turn to October, please,	
18			page 13370, in particular 1st October.	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	577	Q.	Could I ask you just to clarify for the Chairman what	14:55
21			is in that entry, again the writing is quite small.	
22		Α.		
23			"Phone call from Dave Taylor, Barrett didn't receive	
24			registered post."	
25				14:55
26	578	Q.	So I think that's David Taylor, who was the then Press	
27			Officer?	
28		Α.	Superintendent.	

29 579 Q. Superintendent, yes. What registered post is he

Τ			referring to there?	
2		Α.	I think it was to do with the bullying and harassment	
3			complaint, the bullying and harassment, the statement	
4			that I made on the 13th March, Judge, where it went	
5			missing for six months.	14:55
6	580	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
7		Α.	And we now established that it actually wasn't missing,	
8			but at the time I had thought we thought it was	
9			missing.	
10	581	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	14:56
11		Α.	So that's what it was to do with. I was trying to get	
12			that in John Barrett's hands, he was the head of HR at	
13			the time.	
14	582	Q.	MR. MURPHY: So had you asked for his help to try and	
15			clarify that issue?	14:56
16		Α.	Sorry?	
17	583	Q.	Had you asked for his help to try and clarify the	
18			issue?	
19		Α.	I am sure I would have. I am sure I would have,	
20			because it came up just in a previous meeting, we	14:56
21			touched on on a previous date there, on the diary	
22			entry, it is noted that I have	
23				
24			"Clash between Nóirín O'Sullivan and John Barrett",	
25				14:56
26			That's initially to do with the fraud embezzlement in	
27			Templemore.	
28	584	Q.	Here we are in October 2017 and you referred earlier to	
29			your circle of trust - T nut it to you on the first day	

1			of your cross-examination that you considered	
2			Mr. Taylor to be an ally. For how long had you been	
3			speaking to him in that capacity?	
4		Α.	I would never have heard of Superintendent Taylor until	
5			he made his disclosure, Judge. When he made his	14:57
6			disclosure, I have already said, I would have made	
7			contact with him just to say because I know what	
8			it's like and he wasn't going to get a whole lot of	
9			phone calls from chiefs or superintendents to say well	
10			done or I'm behind you or anything. And I rang and I	14:57
11			just said, listen, just offered support, that was it.	
12	585	Q.	Did he support you thereafter?	
13		Α.	It wasn't	
14	586	Q.	Just take that example, he's providing you with	
15			information from Garda Headquarters?	14:57
16		Α.	No, that's not, that's not	
17	587	Q.	Where else would he get the information?	
18		Α.	That may not have what you referred to earlier may	
19			not have come from him. Just because I there's	
20			other there's lot an other people that I am talking	14:57
21			to. It doesn't necessarily mean that it was him.	
22	588	Q.	No, but this is a phone call?	
23		Α.	Sorry?	
24	589	Q.	This is a phone call from him to you?	
25		Α.	Yeah.	14:57
26	590	Q.	Yes. So, if we just pause for a moment and go back to	
27			Volume 8. Can I take you, please, to 27th September	
28			2017. We know that on that day the Justice Committee	
29			met.	

- 1 A. Sorry, just what page is that?
- 2 591 Q. Yes, that's 2070, the page we've looked at before. You
- will recall a few minutes ago, before we looked at the

14:59

14:59

- diaries, I asked you I think about this Justice Dáil
- 5 Committee and its meeting with Ms. Feehily of the
- 6 Policing Authority. Do you have that?
- 7 A. Just one moment. 2070?
- 8 592 Q. Yes. 2070.
- 9 A. 17.
- 10 593 Q. No, 2070, please.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 594 Q. Thank you. Just before you go to that, I wonder if I
- can give you, side by side with that, Volume 9, at page
- 14 2655, please. Just hold them together, please, if you
- 15 would.
- 16 A. Page 26?
- 17 595 Q. 55, please.
- 18 A. Just for clarification, just whose notes --
- 19 596 Q. This is a note I think prepared by Superintendent
- 20 Murray based on his observation of the Dáil
- 21 proceedings?
- 22 A. This is on 2655?
- 23 597 Q. Please.
- 24 A. Judge, just the other one is on 27 --
- 25 598 Q. 2070?
- 26 A. Yes. Whose note is that?
- 27 599 Q. I am going to ask you first about 2655, please?
- 28 A. Okay.
- 29 600 Q. If you just please look at that. You will see that at

Т			9:50pm he recorded that Deputy Daly brought up the	
2			question to Ms. Feehily:	
3				
4			"Some people on the promotion lists are under	
5			i nvesti gati on. "	15:00
6				
7			She send correspondence to the Policing Authority about	
8			it. Were you aware that Deputy Daly had sent	
9			correspondence to the Policing Authority about	
10			Superintendent Murray's promotion?	15:00
11		Α.	I don't know. Em, I'm not sure.	
12	601	Q.	I see. Very good.	
13		Α.	She may have told me. I don't know.	
14	602	Q.	Do you see also on the next note, it was noted that	
15			Deputy Daly said a solicitor had sent correspondence to	15:00
16			the policing authority about one person on the	
17			promotion list. Was that your solicitor?	
18		Α.	I presume it was.	
19	603	Q.	So, just to be clear, you instructed your solicitor to	
20			write to the Policing Authority in relation to	15:00
21			Superintendent Murray's promotion?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	604	Q.	Yes. Can we presume that that was a letter urging the	
24			authority not to promote him?	
25		Α.	No, it would have been it would have been a letter	15:0
26			in relation to, listen, there's a complaint here, a	
27			complaint against this man and we want to make you	
28			aware of it, just in case the Guards forget to tell but	
29			it.	

- 1 605 Q. Did it make any complaints about the suitability of the
- promotion?
- 3 A. Sorry?
- 4 606 Q. Did it make any complaints about his suitability to be

15:02

- 5 promoted?
- 6 A. Did who make?
- 7 607 Q. Did the letter from your solicitor make a complaint on
- 8 your behalf about Superintendent Murray's suitability
- 9 to be promoted?
- 10 A. I would have to see the letter. I can't tell off hand. 15:01
- 11 608 Q. Perhaps we might in due course have a look at that. In
- 12 terms of the position, I think that if you turn,
- please, back to the other volume that I have given you,
- that's Volume 8, at page 2071. Superintendent Murray
- will say that by the end of September of 2018, he was
- made aware that a meeting of the Policing Authority
- took place on 28th September 2018, which had Garda
- promotions on the agenda. Did you know about that
- meeting?
- 20 A. I don't think so, but I don't -- can I check my diary,
- just to see if I anything in it?
- 22 609 Q. Sure. This is 2017.
- 23 A. '17?
- 24 610 Q. '17.
- 25 A. This says '18 on the statement.
- 26 611 Q. I beg your pardon. Sorry, I think it's a typographical
- 27 error?
- 28 A. So '17?
- 29 612 Q. '17, please.

- 1 A. I don't have anything for the 28th September.
- 2 613 Q. He will say in evidence, just to put it to you what he
- will say, he will say that he was made aware of the
- fact that a vacancy at chief superintendent level,
- 5 which occurred on 20th September 2018, which applied to 15:03
- 6 his position at number seven in the order of merit on
- 7 the chief superintendent's promotion list was not
- 8 filled even though he had positive clearance in
- 9 relation to his character, which had been supplied to
- 10 the authority on the 14th September. Were you aware of 15:03

15:04

- any of these details at that time?
- 12 A. I don't think so.
- 13 614 Q. Very good.
- 14 A. I don't know about that.
- 15 615 Q. Yes.
- 16 A. Obviously I have read a lot of stuff in the volumes
- here and there's an awful lot of other behind the
- 18 scenes stuff going on, Judge.
- 19 616 Q. Could I ask you then, please, to move forward to -- in
- terms of the position, I think the position is that
- 21 Superintendent Murray will say that he wrote to the
- 22 Authority about his suspicions at this stage that
- efforts were being made by third parties to influence
- the clearance process. He will say at this stage he
- was developing a strong suspicion that the promotion
- for which he had been effectively put forward was being
- 27 stalled because there were efforts being made by third
- parties to influence the clearance process and in an
- 29 effort to assassinate his character for that purpose

1			with the Policing Authority?	
2		Α.	Judge	
3	617	Q.	Would you agree with me that that's what actually was	
4			taking place?	
5		Α.	Judge, I would have had my own suspicion at the time	15:05
6			that there was other skullduggery on the other side	
7			going on, in relation to the Policing Authority not	
8			being informed about the bullying and harassment	
9			complaint.	
10	618	Q.	Garda Keogh, would you agree with me that it was clear	15:05
11			at that stage that you and some people in your circle	
12			of trust were making efforts to influence the clearance	
13			process of promotions by blocking the promotion of	
14			Superintendent Murray?	
15		Α.	No, no. No, no. Judge. The clearance process, Judge,	15:05
16			there's forms there, we have established that. The	
17			only thing I did in relation to the Policing Authority,	
18			the only thing I actually sent to the Policing	
19			Authority was a copy of the complaint to say, here's a	
20			complaint. Now, I understand my solicitor would have	15:06
21			wrote letters and cc'd stuff as well. The only thing I	
22			had sent to them was the actual copy of the complaint	
23			to say, look, here you go, there is a complaint.	
24	619	Q.	Garda Keogh, would you agree with me about the	
25			following points: By this time would you agree that	15:06
26			your solicitor had written letters on your instructions	
27			complaining about the promotion of Superintendent	

Murray?

Α.

28

29

I would have been complaining that the due process was

1	not	being	fol	lowed
1	not	being	fol	lowed

- Were you not complaining about the promotion, proposed 2 620 Q. 3 promotion of Superintendent Murray?
- 4 Judae --Α.
- 5 621 Yes or no? Q.

6 Yes, I would have been complaining in relation to the Α. fact -- in relation to the way it was being done, is 7

15:06

15:07

15:07

8 what I'm trying to say.

- Would you agree that by this time, Garda Keogh, you had 9 622 Q. 10 liaised with Deputies Wallace and Daly and ensured and 15:07 11 assisted them to make repeated attacks on 12 Superintendent Murray through speeches in the Dáil, 13 urging the authorities to consider that he was not a 14 suitable person for promotion?
- 15 Judge, I have already stated that anything I would have 15:07 Α. 16 said to Deputies Wallace and Daly, after that, it was 17 never me to say, I want ye to bring this, I want ye to 18 say that, and I can tell you, if I was to try that road 19 and go down that road, in particular Deputy Daly would 20 cut you in two.
- You see, what I have to suggest to you is that by this 21 623 Q. 22 stage, Garda Keogh, there is clearly an orchestrated 23 plan and you are the man with the baton in your hands. 24 You are effectively feeding people with information, 25 encouraging them to make speeches against Superintendent Murray, sending your solicitor out to 26 27 speak on national media, giving interviews about this 28 thing yourself, all of which are calculated to create a 29 press storm to try and block the promotion of

1			Superintendent Murray, isn't that what has happened?	
2		Α.	Judge, I'm the man with the baton. Last week I	
3			couldn't hold a pen and now I've the baton in the hand.	
4	624	Q.	You see, Garda Keogh, at this time what you are doing	
5			is effectively seeking to achieve vengeance against	15:08
6			Superintendent Murray and you are working in	
7			conjunction with people.	
8		Α.	No, no.	
9	625	Q.	Like Deputy Daly and the others, you're working	
10			together to achieve this result?	15:08
11		Α.	Judge, that's not accurate. I am trying to get fair	
12			procedures for me. I am entitled to fair procedures	
13			too.	
14	626	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And fair procedures as you see it is to have	
15			your complaint dealt with before he's promoted?	15:08
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	627	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's what you mean by fair procedures.	
18			That's okay, I understand.	
19		Α.	Then they can go and promote him.	
20	628	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Garda Keogh, here is what Mr. Murphy I	15:08
21			don't know how far you go in agreeing with this: These	
22			things didn't happen independently or in a vacuum. So,	
23			obviously when Mr. Cullen was writing, he was writing	
24			on your behalf?	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:09
26	629	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That was a venture between the two of you,	
27			very clearly, as would always be the case with	
28			solicitor and client. No problem there. But he says	
29			going briefing the deputies and when they raise the	

1			issue in the Dáil, he says, it looks very like a big	
2			campaign, that everybody knew what was going on. I	
3			mean, they wanted to kill off the promotion, just as	
4			you did.	
5		Α.	They, as in?	15:09
6	630	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Deputies Daly and Wallace?	
7		Α.	I don't, I don't think that's fair to say.	
8	631	Q.	CHAIRMAN: They wanted to prevent the promotion	
9			happening?	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:09
11	632	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You wanted to prevent the promotion	
12			happening. Your solicitor wanted the promotion to	
13			stop?	
14		Α.	Prevent it where it shouldn't where it was wrong to	
15			promote, Judge.	15:09
16	633	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. I understand. I understand that.	
17			But Mr. Murphy saying to you, everybody was acting	
18			together, in concert together.	
19		Α.	Yes. But, Judge, the Guards, what the Guards were at,	
20			the skullduggery	15:10
21	634	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Don't mind about everybody else. I	
22			understand that, I know your point about that, or at	
23			least I think I understand it. They got the	
24			information from you?	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:10
26			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
27	635	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Thank you. Then finally on that point, up	
28			to this date you and they had sought to make the	
29			biggest possible splash in terms of media impact to	

1	disseminate this complaint of yours nationwide through
2	the Dáil, through the media, through the newspapers,
3	not just directly to the decision-makers but to the
4	whole country, isn't that correct?

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

A. Judge, in relation to the media, I can't - I mean, the media pick up what they want, so. Certainly, Deputy Wallace and Daly were addressing it to the Minister for Justice, whatever input they would have had as part of the Justice Committee, and obviously there was the issue of the Policing Authority, but I mean, look, there's no doubt, I'm trying to highlight that the Guards are trying to pull a stunt here and what we're doing is trying to identify that Garda management are trying to pull a stunt here to get this promotion through.

15 · 11

15:11

15:11

15.12

- 16 636 Q. Garda Keogh, again I have to disagree with you on that.

  17 But I do have to put it to you, I think it's

  18 inescapable, I have to suggest, that day after day,

  19 week after week, month after month throughout 2017,

  20 you're pursuing this campaign against Superintendent

  21 Murray in an effort to damage him?
- 22 If that was the case, like -- I mean, if that was the Α. 23 case, if that -- like there is -- I can't deny, Judge, 24 that I didn't want him to be promoted, you know, of 25 course I didn't. The way it was done is what's worse, Judge, it's the way it was done, the way the Garda 26 27 management tried to do it. And obviously I went to deputies Wallace and Daly and I said, this is what 28 29 they're doing, look at what they're doing. That's my

Τ		point on it.	
2		MR. KELLY: Chairman, I wonder whether at this point	
3		the witness could have a break.	
4		CHAIRMAN: Yes, certainly. Are you about to move to	
5		something else, Mr. Murphy?	15:12
6		MR. MURPHY: I am moving to the next phase of this	
7		issue.	
8		CHAIRMAN: The next phase of this matter.	
9		MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
10		CHAIRMAN: That is probably a convenient time. Thanks,	15:12
11		Mr. Kelly, I was forgetting. The matter was moving so	
12		rapidly, I was busy. Thanks very much. Thank you.	
13			
14		THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS	
15		FOLLOWS:	15:12
16			
17		MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.	
18	637 Q.	Garda Keogh, just one point of fact I want to put to	
19		you, which is that Superintendent Murray will say that	
20		on 31st October 2017, he will say in evidence that he	15:24
21		received a call from Mr. Hallinan of the Policing	
22		Authority, which told him that the Policing Authority	
23		were passing him over in the order of merit for	
24		promotion and they were going to promote the person	
25		behind him at number 8 in the order of merit. This,	15:25
26		Chairman, can be seen in book number 8, page 2071. не	
27		will say in evidence that Mr. Hallinan wouldn't tell	
28		him why this was happening.	

			30, I have to suggest to you that at this stage here is	
2			an example of how what you were doing was beginning to	
3			have an effect, and although in the ordinary course	
4			Superintendent Murray was next in line, he was	
5			effectively bypassed at that time and given no	15:25
6			explanation?	
7		Α.	Judge, having an effect, Judge, all I am trying to do	
8			is highlight that I have a complaint that's pending,	
9			making the Policing Authority aware of that. That's	
10			all.	15:26
11	638	Q.	You see, I suggest it's much more than that. Can I ask	
12			you, please, to be shown Volume 9, at page 2672? This	
13			is an e-mail written in response to that telephone call	
14			by Superintendent Murray. He will say that he wrote	
15			basically saying:	15:26
16				
17			"I find it extremely disconcerting, contrary to natural	
18			and constitutional justice, procedurally unfair that	
19			the Policing Authority could make a decision	
20			arbitrarily in my view without foundation to decline to	15:27
21			appoint me to the rank of chief superintendent, while	
22			at the same time bypassing me in a very public fashion	
23			and moving on to the next person in the selected list."	
24				
25			Would you agree with me that the consequence of being	15:27
26			bypassed was something which would have been seen very	
27			swiftly throughout An Garda Síochána and in the public	
28			domain?	
29		Δ	Certainly in An Garda Siochána it would have been seen	

1			yes. Again, if Garda management were upfront with the	
2			Policing Authority, a lot of this would have been	
3			bypassed.	
4	639	Q.	You see, I have to suggest to you that in fact that	
5			this is a classic consequence of what you were setting	15:27
6			out to do. I want to point out to you and suggest to	
7			you that what you were doing was extremely unfair to	
8			Superintendent Murray?	
9		Α.	No, I dispute that.	
10	640	Q.	Do you see in the next paragraph, he says:	15:27
11				
12			"You cannot underestimate the irreparable damage this	
13			public outing of me has caused to me, my family, my	
14			character, my reputation and my career in An Garda	
15			Sí ochána. "	15:27
16				
17			I take it you accept that somebody who had been subject	
18			to vilification in the press, repeated attacks from	
19			members of the Oireachtas and targeted, as you sought	
20			to target him, would be reasonably concerned that their	15:28
21			reputation and their career are being damaged by this?	
22		Α.	Judge, equally, I could have written that about myself	
23			to the Policing Authority in the way Garda management	
24			were trying to proceed with this promotion, you know,	
25			you cannot under estimate the irreparable damage, you	15:28
26			know, that it was doing to me. Because Garda	
27			management were not upfront with the Policing	
28			Authority. The obligation really was on Garda	
29			management to be truthful and honest with the Policing	

- Authority in what was going on and they appear not to have been, Judge.
- Output 1 1 2 3 641 Q. Unfortunately, and we're going to see this in a few moments, I want to suggest to you that that's a completely incorrect statement. In fact, the Policing
- 6 Authority was being given full information in relation

15:29

15:29

15:29

- 7 to Superintendent Murray. But I am suggesting to you
- 8 that what you have done here is to instigate,
- 9 orchestrate and control a pattern of vilification of
- 10 Superintendent Murray and here we have, publicly, a
- 11 consequence flowing from that?
- 12 A. No. No, all I have tried to do, Judge, is inform the
- 13 Policing Authority there is a complaint here, it should
- 14 be dealt with first. It's as simple that. Garda
- management are the ones that have signed off clearance
- forms, they have not informed the Policing Authority
- during the clearance forms or after those clearance
- forms were signed.
- 19 642 Q. Garda, we dealt with this already?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 643 Q. I put it to you the issue in relation to disciplinary
- versus bullying and harassment?
- 23 CHAIRMAN: Yes, we have been over that, Mr. Murphy.
- 24 644 Q. MR. MURPHY: Yes. So, can I put to you that ultimately
- in this situation you have orchestrated this over
- several months and now we have a situation where the
- 27 person who should have been promoted has been blocked.
- 28 A. Judge --
- 29 645 Q. Can I ask you to move forward, please, to 11th November

Т			2017. That's at page 2072. It I can ask you, prease,	
2			to turn to Volume 10.	
3		Α.	Sorry, 2072?	
4	646	Q.	2705, please. Superintendent Murray will say that he	
5			received on Saturday, the 11th November, an e-mail from	15:30
6			Assistant Commissioner Fintan Fanning of the Eastern	
7			Region, referring to correspondence regarding his	
8			interaction with you and he indicated to Superintendent	
9			Murray that he had sent him a letter by post but had	
10			not yesterday been received and the e-mail from	15:31
11			Assistant Commissioner Fanning asked Superintendent	
12			Murray to ignore the correspondence, because you, Garda	
13			Keogh, had decided you wanted a formal investigation of	
14			complaints to be undertaken in line with a policy	
15			document, Working Together to Create a Positive Working	15:31
16			Environment. That correspondence was filled out at a	
17			later stage.	
18				
19			Could I first of all to turn in Volume 10, to page	
20			2706, please? Do you see that?	15:31
21		Α.	I am just looking at it.	
22	647	Q.	Yes.	
23		Α.	Yes, Judge. Judge, just for clarification here, I	
24			see	
25	648	Q.	Perhaps I could just ask you some questions about that,	15:32
26			Garda Keogh. Do you see the first part, it says:	
27				
28			"I wish to inform you a complaint of unacceptable	
29			behaviour has been alleged against you by Garda	

```
1
              Ni chol as Keogh. "
 2
 3
              Do you see that?
 4
         Α.
 5
    649
              Now, can I just ask you, in the time leading up to that 15:32
         Q.
              letter of 9th November 2017, what direct communications
 6
 7
              did you have with Assistant Commissioner Fanning?
 8
              On the 9th of?
         Α.
 9
    650
              At this stage?
         Q.
              I would have had no direct communications was Assistant 15:32
10
         Α.
11
              Commissioner Fanning. But just --
12
              Did you ever meet Assistant Commissioner Fanning?
    651
         Q.
              I only met him twice ever, ever, Judge.
13
         Α.
14
    652
         Q.
              Did you meet him in 2017?
15
              I don't think I met him in 2017, I don't think so.
         Α.
                                                                          15:33
16
              Just on this, where it has -- where the statements,
17
              typed statements, it doesn't have any mention of the
              appendices that backed up with all the -- this cropped
18
              up previously. There's no mention that the appendices
19
20
              were attached to the statement in the bullying and
                                                                          15:33
21
              harassment. They were all the back up documents,
22
              Judge.
23
              Are you criticising Assistant Commissioner Fanning for
    653
         Q.
24
              that?
25
              No, by I am saying --
         Α.
                                                                          15:33
26
    654
              Exactly?
         0.
27
              -- it appears he didn't receive them.
         Α.
              would you look at the next document received? Is that
28
    655
         Q.
29
              a statement from you?
```

1	Α.	Yes.

- 2 656 Q. So, in fact, you have got no complaint to make about 3 this correspondence at all?
- 4 A. Sorry?
- 5 657 Q. You have no valid complaint to make about this to make about this correspondence at all?
- A. Well, what I'm saying now is, it appears that Assistant
  Commissioner Fanning wasn't given the appendices, which
  had --

- 10 658 Q. How do you know that?
- 11 A. This is his statement, let's say, of complaint. The
  12 documents attached were all the back up, to back-up the
  13 substance of what was in the letter.
- 14 659 Q. CHAIRMAN: This letter is not deciding anything. If I

  15 understand, the letter says there's two ways of dealing 15:34

  16 with this. One is through mediation, conciliation,

  17 whatever, if are you interested in it, and the other is

  18 to have a formal investigation?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 660 CHAI RMAN: It both parties agree -- sorry, if all Q. 15:34 In this case it was Superintendent 21 relevant parties. 22 Murray and you, we will go one road, the conciliation 23 It didn't matter whether stuff was there, 24 whether all the stuff was there. The top of your 25 statement actually refers to the appendices. 15:34 26 not so sure, I am not thinking that the appendices make 27 the slightest bit of difference. Because that's not the purpose of his letter. Then he writes off or he 28 29 e-mails or communicates with Superintendent Murray to

- say, don't bother replying to that because Garda Keogh
- 2 wants a full investigation.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 661 Q. CHAIRMAN: Am I understanding that correctly?
- 5 A. That's correct, yes.
- 6 662 Q. MR. MURPHY: So can I ask you --
- 7 CHAIRMAN: Which you were perfectly entitled to do, by

15:35

15:35

15:35

- 8 the way, and so was everybody else.
- 9 663 Q. MR. MURPHY: Can I ask you to indicate to the Chairman
- 10 what communication you had with Assistant Commissioner
- 11 Fanning before that date in 2017?
- 12 A. Judge, I don't think I would have had any.
- 13 664 Q. None at all?
- 14 A. I don't think so.
- 15 665 Q. Did you ever meet with Inspector McCarthy in 2017?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 666 Q. Who is Inspector McCarthy?
- 18 A. Inspector McCarthy, he was an inspector in Assistant
- 19 Commissioner Fanning's office in Mullingar.
- 20 667 O. Did you meet him?
- 21 A. I think that's where he was. Yes.
- 22 668 Q. Did you meet him in 2017?
- 23 A. I am sure I did. I would have, yes.
- 24 669 Q. Would you mind having a look at your diary, for
- example, for June of 2017, say the 19th. The page
- reference is 13366.
- 27 A. Yeah.
- 28 670 Q. Can I ask you just to help us to understand what's that
- 29 entry?

```
1
              I just have:
         Α.
 2
              "Inspector McCarthy called to give letter."
 3
 4
 5
    671
              He called to your house?
         Q.
                                                                          15:36
 6
              Yes.
         Α.
 7
    672
              To give you a letter?
         0.
 8
              Yes.
         Α.
    673
              who was the letter from?
 9
         Q.
              I presume it was from Assistant Commissioner Fanning.
10
         Α.
                                                                         15:36
11
    674
                     Did he call to you another time during 2017?
         Q.
12
              He would have, yes.
         Α.
13
              How often?
    675
         Q.
14
         Α.
              Not often.
                           I mean -- I don't know.
                                                     Whatever -- it
15
              would have been in my diaries whenever he called.
                                                                         15:36
16
              I'm sure, roughly five, five times I'd say.
17
              what was the purpose of these visits?
    676
         Q.
18
              He gave me correspondence in relation to the bullying
         Α.
19
              and harassment thing. Because there was confusion in
20
              relation to it, as I said, two chief superintendents
                                                                         15:37
              were appointed to take the statement and different
21
22
              things like that, there was stuff going on behind the
23
              scenes that I didn't know about, I still don't really
24
              know what was going on. But that was -- that was it.
25
              Any letters he has given me should be in the
                                                                          15:37
              documentation.
26
27
    677
              was he delivering any other messages apart from what
         Q.
              was in the letters?
28
29
                           No, no. Because, Judge, I was trying to
              Oh no, no.
         Α.
```

1			find out from Inspector McCarthy what they knew about	
2			what was going on in Athlone. I was actually trying to	
3			find out and it appeared that both Inspector McCarthy	
4			and Assistant Commissioner Fanning were kept completely	
5			in the dark in relation to everything that went on in	15:37
6			Athlone. Because I was obviously trying to find out	
7			what was going on. I mentioned a report that I may	
8			have been taken up wrong here, if it was given if it	
9			has been given to the Tribunal and it is not relevant	
10			for this module, that's fine. But if it was the Guards	15:38
11			were withholding it, I'd obviously have a problem with	
12			that. But that report as well, I was trying to find	
13			out did they ever see this report and stuff like that.	
14			But they seem to not know a whole lot about what was	
15			going on, which was incredible in that Assistant	15:38
16			Commissioner Fanning is the assistant commissioner of	
17			the Eastern Region, where all these problems were, and	
18			he seemed to be kept in the dark about everything.	
19	678	Q.	Is that what he told you?	
20		Α.	No. I wasn't talking to Assistant Commissioner	15:38
21			Fanning.	
22	679	Q.	How do you know he was kept in the dark?	
23		Α.	It was Inspector McCarthy, I was trying to find out.	
24	680	Q.	Do you see the letter makes reference to:	
25				15:38
26			"a complaint of unacceptable behaviour alleged	
27			against you by Garda Nicholas Keogh on 27th March	
28			2017. "	

1			Do you see the reference, page 2706.	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	681	Q.	I think you will agree with me that your evidence so	
4			far is that you have no criticism of Assistant	
5			Commissioner Fanning's stewardship of managing the file	15:39
6			between that date and November 2017, isn't that right?	
7		Α.	Now, can you just repeat that please?	
8	682	Q.	In your evidence in the earlier issues dealing with the	
9			question of the Finn investigation in particular, I	
10			think you agreed that you weren't criticising Assistant	15:39
11			Commissioner Fanning for his stewardship of this part	
12			of the process, between March of 2017 and November of	
13			2017, is that right?	
14		Α.	Yeah.	
15	683	Q.	Yes. Just moving forward, if I could, to 13th November	15:39
16			2017. I wonder, Chairman, if we could have on the	
17			screen, 2829, please. At the time, can I ask you,	
18			Garda Keogh, did you read this newspaper article? You	
19			followed everything with close attention?	
20		Α.	I did read this article, Judge.	15:41
21	684	Q.	I think that the article indicates that:	
22				
23			"The Irish Independent has learned that bullying	
24			allegations made by Garda Nick Keogh have been the	
25			subject of intense meetings at Garda headquarters in	15:41
26			recent days."	
27				
28			Can I take it you didn't give that information to the	
29			Irish Independent?	

1		Α.	No, I didn't.	
2	685	Q.	It goes on to say:	
3				
4			"With one member of the Garda management strongly	
5			criticising the force's treatment of a decorated	15:41
6			offi cer. "	
7				
8			Now, I presume you didn't say that to the newspaper?	
9		Α.	No, I had nothing to do with this article, but I do	
10			recall reading it because it was an incredible article.	15:41
11			Because for the first time, I'm someone who has made a	
12			protected disclosure, an assistant commissioner stands	
13			up and publicly backs me in relation to the what the	
14			bulk of the complaint, of course, is the supply of	
15			heroin in the midlands. An assistant commissioner had	15:41
16			stood up and has actually that I don't think had	
17			ever happened before in the history of An Garda	
18			Síochána. So, of course I read this article.	
19	686	Q.	Were you surprised to see information about a meeting	
20			in the Garda Headquarters with senior officers in the	15:42
21			Irish Independent in such detail?	
22		Α.	Judge, look, I read the article. I read it like anyone	
23			else that has read it. I can't comment on it any	
24			further.	
25	687	Q.	For example, in the middle column there is a reference	15:42
26			to:	
27				
28			"During intense exchanges in the recent days,	
29			Mr. Fanning pressed strongly for the appointment of an	

1			assistant commissioner."	
2				
3			Were you aware of Assistant Commissioner Fanning's	
4			intention to appoint an assistant commissioner to	
5			investigate your complaints at that date?	15:42
6		Α.	I don't know if I was aware of that. I may have been,	
7			because Inspector McCarthy was updating me with what	
8			was going on. So I may have been but just off hand, I	
9			just can't remember.	
10	688	Q.	You see, in the second last paragraph it says:	15:42
11				
12			"Assistant Commissioner Fanning has held a number of	
13			meetings in recent days about the case with John	
14			Barrett, the force's head of human resources, and Joe	
15			Nugent, the force's chief administrative officer."	15:43
16				
17			Do you see that?	
18		Α.	Which?	
19	689	Q.	Left-hand column.	
20		Α.	I am just trying to find it.	15:43
21			CHAIRMAN: So am I trying to find where that is.	
22			MR. MURPHY: It's on the left-hand column, Chairman.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Oh, the left-hand column, I'm sorry. The	
24			last paragraph of the first column. Thank you. Yes,	
25			sorry, thank you.	15:43
26	690	Q.	MR. MURPHY:	
27				
28			"the force's head of human resources, and Joe	
29			Nugent, the force's chief administrative officer. Mr.	

Т			Nugent proposed numan resources with Joe Nugent the	
2			force chief administrative officer. It is understood	
3			Mr. Nugent proposed Garda Keogh complaints for the	
4			subject of a scoping exercise."	
5				15:43
6			Do you see that?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	691	Q.	Were you aware of that interchange of your own	
9			knowledge at that time?	
10		Α.	I'd say I I think it was just in the article that I	15:43
11			would have read or got a lot of this information from.	
12	692	Q.	Do you see the next phase, it says:	
13				
14			"Garda Keogh is understood to have strongly criticised	
15			the proposal as being completely inadequate in a letter	15:44
16			sent to acting Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin through	
17			his solicitor John Gerard Cullen last week."	
18				
19			Did you give that information to the Irish Independent?	
20		Α.	No, I wouldn't have been aware no, I wouldn't have	15:44
21			been aware of this, what went on at these senior	
22			meetings and clashes or whatever was going on there.	
23	693	Q.	Were you aware of the letter sent by you at that time?	
24		Α.	I would have I'm presuming here, Judge, I'm	
25			presuming that Inspector McCarthy had given me a letter	15:44
26			in relation to what was going on and we would have	
27			wrote a letter back. That's all I can do, is presume.	
28			If the letters were at hand, I might be able to but	
29			other than that	

- 1 694 Q. Do I understand your evidence to be that you were not
- 2 responsible for leaking any of that information to the
- 3 Independent?
- 4 A. I don't think so, no.
- 5 695 Q. If we could move back then, please, to Volume 8. This

15 · 45

15:45

15:46

- is a document you have seen before, 15th November 2017.
- 7 Assistant Commissioner Fanning appointed Assistant
- 8 Commissioner Finn. It's at page 2831, sorry, Chairman.
- 9 2831.
- 10 A. 28 --
- 11 696 Q. -- 31. It's a document you have seen before, it's the
- 12 letter of appointment of Assistant Commissioner Finn.
- 13 A. Just the volume?
- 14 697 O. Book 10. It's also on the screen?
- MR. KELLY: I can't find that myself.
- 16 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, say that again, Mr. Kelly.
- 17 MR. KELLY: I can't find that myself. What is the
- 18 reference again?
- 19 CHAIRMAN: It's 2831.
- 20 MR. MURPHY: 2831.
- 21 CHAIRMAN: This is November, I take it, '17.
- MR. MURPHY: It should be on Mr. Kelly's screen as
- 23 well.
- 24 CHAIRMAN: November '17 --
- MR. KELLY: It's certainly not in Volume 8, which is
- the reference given.
- 27 MR. MURPHY: I beg your pardon, it's Volume 10.
- 28 CHAIRMAN: 15th November 2017, Assistant Commissioner
- 29 Fanning appoints Assistant Commissioner Finn.

1 MR. KELLY: I found it now. It was just the wrong 2 Volume reference. Then moving on, please, if you could be 3 698 Q. MR. MURPHY: shown page 2835, please, in same volume. 4 5 Superintendent Murray will say that on the 16th 15:46 November he received a call from Mr. Nugent, CAO of An 6 7 Garda Síochána, asking if he had any objection to the 8 supply to the Policing Authority of a document prepared in 2017, outlining his interaction with you in relation 9 to the initiation of your civil proceedings. 10 15 · 47 11 confirmed to Mr. Nugent that he, Superintendent Murray, 12 had no problem with that. 13 Oh yeah, I see that. Yeah. Α. 14 699 Q. Then moving on, please, to page 2074, to Sunday, 19th November 2017? 15 15:47 16 2074? Α. 17 700 2074. Volume 8. On that date the RTÉ radio news Q. 18 programme had a feature regarding Assistant Commissioner Finn's appointment to investigate your 19 allegations against Superintendent Murray. Could you 20 15:48 please look at page 2840? 21 22 2840? Α. Yes, please. 23 Do you see that article? 701 Q. 24 Yes. Α. 25 Could I just put it to you that the article in the 702 Ο. 15 · 49 first page makes reference to the initiation of the 26 27 investigation and the appointment of Assistant 28 Commissioner Finn. Do you agree with that? 29 Yeah. Α.

1	703	Q.	I think over the following page, in the middle of the	
2			paragraph there is a reference to:	
3				
4			"The case came to public attention when Garda Keogh's	
5			solicitor gave an interview on This Week last month,	15:49
6			when he revealed his client had no idea what happened	
7			with a bullying complaint he had lodged some six months	
8			earlier."	
9				
10			That was your solicitor?	15:49
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	704	Q.	Then it goes on to make reference to:	
13				
14			"The intervention of the head of Garda human resources,	
15			John Barrett, wrote to Garda Keogh's Legal team Last	15:49
16			month to say he had taken over responsibility of the	
17			case after it came to his attention."	
18				
19			Do you see that?	
20		Α.	Yes.	15:49
21	705	Q.	Then if you turn over, please, to page 2842. In the	
22			middle paragraph it says:	
23				
24			"In his letter of the 13th October, Mr. Barrett asked	
25			the CEO of the Policing Authority if she had any	15:50
26			knowledge about whether a bullying allegation could	
27			have been lost or delayed in order to permit a senior	
28			guard who was accused of bullying from having to answer	
29			questions when going through a promotions process	

1			overseen by the authority."	
2				
3			Do you see that?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	706	Q.	He had you spoken to Mr. Barrett prior to that date?	15:50
6		Α.	Judge, I think I had written a letter I think to	
7			Mr. Barrett with that same question in it. From	
8			recollection, that paragraph is a question I think I	
9			posed to Mr. Barrett, I think. Certainly I think that	
10			part emanates from me, anyway, that paragraph.	15:51
11	707	Q.	So did you share your correspondence with Mr. Barrett	
12			with RTÉ?	
13		Α.	Em	
14	708	Q.	Can I help you, Garda, by turning over the page to page	
15			2843?	15:51
16		Α.	Can I find out who wrote this article and I might be	
17			able to	
18	709	Q.	Turn over, please, to 2843. Do you see the top of the	
19			page:	
20				15:51
21			"Mr. Keogh's solicitor John Gerard Cullen has written	
22			to senior management in the force and the Policing	
23			Authority in recent weeks asking why there has been no	
24			obvious development in the bullying and harassment	
25			case. "	15:51
26				
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	710	Q.	Would you agree that suggests that that information was	
29			given by RTÉ by you?	

Т		Α.	it appears to be, Judge, yes.	
2	711	Q.	Then do you see the next paragraph deals with very	
3			specific details about the correspondence. I think you	
4			can agree that can only have come from you?	
5		Α.	Can I just read which paragraph?	15:51
6	712	Q.	This is the	
7			CHAIRMAN: "It is understood"	
8		Α.	Okay.	
9	713	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Can we just see, the middle of that page,	
10			2843:	15:52
11				
12			"In his letter, Mr. Barrett told the Authority he was	
13			repeating the question which had been addressed to him	
14			by Mr. Keogh."	
15				15:52
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	714	Q.	So the person responsible for making the suggestion	
18			that documents could have been lost, inverted commas.	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	715	Q.	And imputing or implying that there was something	15:52
21			understand taking place, was you?	
22		Α.	Yes. At that time, Judge, at the time that's what I	
23			believed. Obviously having read through the volumes	
24			here, I see there is another side to this. But at that	
25			time I did believe that the bullying and harassment	15:53
26			complaint, that absolutely someone was suppressing it	
27			in management in order to facilitate the promotion.	
28	716	Q.	But, of course, you had no evidence that that was the	
29			case at all. did vou?	

Т		Α.	You see, that was the problem. I had no documents or	
2			anything like that. I just didn't know what was going	
3			on. That's what appeared to be the case.	
4	717	Q.	But that didn't stop you from making the insinuation	
5			that this is what had taken place. Can I ask you,	15:53
6			please, to be shown Volume 44, document 12478. I beg	
7			your pardon 12477. So, the first point I would like to	
8			draw your attention to in the letter is that	
9			Mr. Barrett is writing to Ms. Hall, the heading is	
10			"strictly confidential".	15:54
11		Α.	I see that.	
12	718	Q.	Did you have a copy of that letter at that time to	
13			furnish to RTÉ?	
14		Α.	I don't know. I wouldn't have had a copy myself. I	
15			don't	15:54
16	719	Q.	Would you have given that copy to your solicitor?	
17		Α.	I wouldn't have got a copy of this.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, who is this letter from?	
19			MR. MURPHY: Mr. Barrett, Chairman.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Yes, I am sorry, I didn't see that. Thank	15:55
21			you very much. The 13th October, sorry. Thank you	
22			very much.	
23	720	Q.	MR. MURPHY: So, you remember a few moments ago we	
24			dealt with the fact that Mr. Barrett told the Authority	
25			that he was repeating the question which had been	15:55
26			addressed to him by you?	
27		Α.	Yes, yes.	
28	721	Q.	Do you see here he refers to the letter from your	
29			solicitor raising a series of questions. That letter	

1			was copied to the Minister for Justice and the	
2			Chairperson of the Policing Authority on 21st September	
3			2017?	
4		Α.	That would be the right thing to do, so.	
5	722	Q.	But I think you will agree, that letter wasn't cc'd to	15:55
6			Superintendent Murray, was it, by you?	
7		Α.	No.	
8	723	Q.	No?	
9		Α.	As I said, there's a lot of stuff in relation to	
10			interactions between Superintendent Murray that wasn't	15:55
11			cc'd to me.	
12	724	Q.	Yes, but it's all happening out of sight, isn't that	
13			right? Garda Keogh, your methodology is to deploy	
14			correspondence left, right and centre to Superintendent	
15			Murray's superiors but not to let him know that you are	15:55
16			doing it. And here we have, in the letter:	
17				
18			"In the light of extensive and other issues raised"	
19				
20			MR. KELLY: Judge, is there a question in that?	15:56
21			CHAIRMAN: well, I think there is one coming,	
22			Mr. Kelly.	
23			MR. KELLY: Is there? Right.	
24			CHAIRMAN: I think there is, yes. At least,	
25			Mr. Murphy, I am expecting a question.	15:56
26	725	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Yes. In terms of the letter	
27			CHAIRMAN: I think I could construct the question at	
28			this point, but I would prefer you to put it together.	
29			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	

- 1 726 Q. I think, Garda Keogh, would you agree with me that your solicitor's letter raised a number of questions?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 727 Q. Yes. Would you agree with me that your solicitor's
- 5 letter was addressed to the Minister for Justice and

15:56

15:57

- 6 the Chairperson of the Policing Authority?
- 7 A. You see, I can't remember off hand, but --
- 8 728 Q. Have a look in the middle of this letter, do you see
- 9 the quotation, Mr. Barrett absolutely quotes from the
- 10 letter?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 729 Q. Would you agree with me that`s a quotation from your
- 13 solicitor's letter?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 730 Q. And this says --
- 16 A. The wording, Judge, just for clarification, the wording
- from here, I definitely worded this part. I remember
- 18 wording that part. That originally would have emanated
- from me, that actual wording, Judge.
- 20 731 Q. Garda Keogh, did you authorise this letter to be sent
- on your behalf?
- 22 A. Well, sorry, this letter is from John Barrett to
- Ms. Helen Hall.
- 24 CHAIRMAN: So your question.
- 25 732 Q. MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, the question is raised in
- 26 quotation, the quotations question appears here to be
- the question raised by your solicitor, the words used
- by your solicitor, do you understand me?
- 29 A. Yes.

	133	Q.	now, I have to put it to you, do you agree with me that	
2			this particular letter of Mr. Barrett reflects in	
3			quotation the question which you had raised with your	
4			solicitor?	
5		Α.	Yes.	15:57
6	734	Q.	Now, let's look at the question for a minute. Here it	
7			says:	
8				
9			"Have the Policing Authority considered such a scenario	
10			whereby (I cannot say for sure this has happened) a	15:57
11			complaint is made against a senior officer who is going	
12			for promotion and happens to be favoured by Garda	
13			management? Garda management delay commencing the	
14			investigation, including serving notice disciplinary or	
15			otherwise on the senior officer candidate, whereby	15:58
16			should the Policing Authority ask the candidate to	
17			disclose such disciplinary information he/she could	
18			answer none in good faith. In the meantime the actual	
19			complaint is withheld/lost by Garda management to	
20			facilitate their choice of candidate being promoted.	15:58
21			Is it possible!"	
22				
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	735	Q.	First of all, would you agree with me that that is	
25			putting forward what's referred to as a scenario?	15:58
26		Α.	It is a scenario.	
27	736	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	And actually, Judge, it's not a million miles off what	
29			actually happened.	

_	131	Q.	would you agree with me that it is being put forward	
2			without any basis in evidence referred to in the letter	
3			to support it?	
4		Α.	Judge, there's an awful lot of stuff in the documents	
5			which we touched on earlier.	15:58
6	738	Q.	Garda Keogh	
7		Α.	Which actually, as I have said, touches on this.	
8	739	Q.	Garda Keogh, please answer the question. In this	
9			letter, and this is a letter written to the Policing	
10			Authority, would you agree with me that this involves a	15:59
11			speculation which is being put forward to the Policing	
12			Authority as a scenario but is calculated to try and	
13			block Superintendent Murray's promotion?	
14		Α.	Judge, it's a very relevant scenario which the Policing	
15			Authority should at least they're now aware for	15:59
16			future any future thing, you know.	
17	740	Q.	You see, Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to you that	
18			this kind of correspondence is, with respect to you,	
19			reckless, because you are	
20		Α.	But, Judge	15:59
21	741	Q.	Just listen to me. I have to suggest to you that what	
22			you are doing is writing a letter to the Policing	
23			Authority, putting forward something which is a	
24			complete hypothesis.	
25			MR. KELLY: Judge, with respect, Judge, he is not the	15:59
26			author of the letter. The letter I am looking at is	
27			authored by one John Barrett, which is on An Garda	

Síochána notepaper.

28

29

What's in quotations, as I understand --

1	CHAIRMAN: What Mr. Murphy is exploring, Mr. Kelly, is
2	the quote that not only came from Mr. Cullen, Garda
3	Keogh says he actually wrote it himself, that is the
4	italicised part, and that's the bit. Mr. Barrett is
5	quoting that and Garda Keogh is robustly asserting his 16:00
6	entitlement to do so.
7	MR. KELLY: Yes. What I had also understood was that
8	the question was framed in terms of this letter, namely
9	from Barrett, and it's quoting another letter. All I
10	am merely asking is, would it not be better to actually $_{16:00}$
11	act the other letter as well rather than phrase it and
12	contextualise it within this one document.
13	MR. MURPHY: I can suggest that Mr. Kelly can do that
14	in his re-examination, Chairman.
15	MR. KELLY: It's just I would like fair questions put 16:00
16	to witnesses.
17	CHAIRMAN: I don't think it's a problem. Let me just
18	explain. We know the source of the part in italics,
19	which is the relevant part that Mr. Murphy is
20	examining, exploring. We know that that comes from a 16:01
21	letter written on Garda Keogh's behalf. We know that
22	that actual paragraph was written by Garda Keogh
23	himself. So he's in a perfect position to defend it,
24	it seems to me. That's exactly what he's doing. So I
25	think Mr. Murphy is entitled to explore it. Have you 16:01
26	much more on this topic, Mr. Murphy? If you have a
27	minute or two, well and good, if you have a bit more
28	than a minute or two, I mean two or three minutes, not
29	a problem.

1			MR. MURPHY: Two minutes, Chairman.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Then I think we will proceed.	
3			MR. MURPHY: I will finish it off.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Okay. I mean there's a limited amount	
5			really because I think it largely speaks for itself.	16:01
6			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
7			CHAIRMAN: The inferences we can debate in due course.	
8	742	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Garda Keogh, at this stage would you agree	
9			with me that at this point in time Superintendent	
10			Murray's promotion is imminent? Yes?	16:02
11		Α.	It would appear so.	
12	743	Q.	Would you agree with me that the letter that you wrote	
13			to Mr. Barrett was yet another example of an attempt to	
14			prevent that from happening?	
15		Α.	No. No, Judge, the wording on this, it's not as	16:02
16			simple, because the wording at that time I believed	
17			I know I knew there was skullduggery going on by	
18			Garda management in relation to the Policing Authority.	
19			I didn't know exactly what. So that was as far as I	
20			could go, where I said "in this scenario" and in it I	16:02
21			say:	
22				
23			"I cannot say for sure this has happened."	
24				
25			In brackets. I put this scenario in writing. With	16:02
26			that, I cannot say for sure this has happened. But	
27			that was what I thought at the time was happening.	
28	744	Q.	You see, Garda Keogh, I have to suggest to you that	
29			that's reckless on your part  Tmagine if the roles	

Т			were reversed and a retter was written to the Policing	
2			Authority about your promotion in these terms, would	
3			you consider that a fair exercise and intervention by a	
4			third party who was trying to stop your promotion?	
5		Α.	If Garda management were at skullduggery in trying to	16:0
6			pull me through into the promotion and someone wrote a	
7			letter like that, I mean, I think the Policing	
8			Authority are fully entitled to know what was going on.	
9	745	Q.	Except they wouldn't know it from this quotation, would	
10			they, Garda Keogh, because this quotation tells them	16:0
11			nothing except your supposition and your speculation?	
12		Α.	And it turns out it's not a million miles from what	
13			happened.	
14	746	Q.	On the contrary, I suggest to you that in fact what	
15			this is, is an attempt by any means possible to prevent	16:0
16			a promotion of Superintendent Murray by fair means or	
17			foul in this case, reckless?	
18		Α.	I dispute that. I put the scenario there. The	
19			scenario has been put to the Policing Authority. Bear	
20			in mind, this is the Policing Authority's first time to	16:0
21			deal with promotions. It's their first time to deal	
22			with Garda management as well. And Garda management	
23			don't have a great record when it comes to honesty in	
24			relation to other matters and I	
25	747	Q.	Garda Keogh, this is again another diversion from the	16:0
26			question. Just finally, I put it to you today, that in	
27			this situation this is a question that you raise to the	
28			attention of the Policing Authority but didn't raise it	
29			on the factual basis at all?	

1	CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Okay, until tomorrow.	
2	Very good. Sorry I just want to confirm something.	
3	Just so people know, there's an event happening in the	
4	castle and so we won't be sitting on Monday, the 25th,	
5	because they will have to put the place together again $_{ m 16}$	: 0
6	after the event that happens I think on the day before.	
7	So, Monday, the 25th.	
8	MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.	
9	CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Okay, so 10:30 tomorrow.	
10	Very good. Thank you.	: 0
11		
12	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL THURSDAY, 7TH NOVEMBER	
13	2019 AT 10: 30AM	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

188.8 (381.4, 199.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1662.4, 1601.5, 1602.5, 1		1	T	I	
16(1)   92.3   16(1)   16(2)   16(3)   16(3)   16(4)	'			, ,	
148   - 3.9, 64.19,   148   - 3.9, 64.19,   178   - 771.16, 93.6, 108.6, 143.23,   1445   - 48.16,   148.17,   148.16,   148.23,   148		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,			1
17	<b>'16</b> [1] - 92:3			,	
108.6, 143.23, 144.610, 143.24, 143.26, 144.52, 143.26, 143.28, 144.52, 143.29, 164.24, 103.41, 144.40, 145.29, 130.28, 143.29, 164.24, 103.41, 144.40, 145.29, 130.28, 143.29, 143.25, 143.29, 143.25	<b>'17</b> [9] - 71:16, 93:6,	l			
143.29, 146.21. 15(2) 97.15, 103.9, 103.10, 103.9,	108:6, 143:23,				
143.29, 164.21, 164.24   103.11, 144.10   15/12.91   33.14   15/12.91   33.14   15/12.91   33.14   100.28, 101.16, 101.77, 133.13   101.11, 107.12   13.13, 101.11, 107.12   13.13, 101.12, 101.13, 101.13, 101.14, 101.14, 101.15, 101.16, 101.17, 101.19, 37. 154.2, 101.19, 101.1	143:24, 143:28,				
143.25	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
143/25					
143:25	<b>'18</b> [2] - 130:17,	· ·			
1					
1   33:13   15th       -					,
16  -3:2, 68:29, 77:21, 107:18, 111:10   16  97:71   107:18, 111:10   16  97:71   107:18, 111:10   16  97:71   107:18, 111:10   16  97:71   107:18, 111:10   16  97:71   107:18, 111:10   16  97:71   107:18, 111:10   16  97:71   107:12   106:13, 106:28, 108:26, 108:26, 108:26, 108:20, 108:26, 108:20,	1	• • •			· ·
1	-				
1			· ·		
7.724, 107-18, 1111-10 10[s] -3.7, 154-2, 164:14, 166:5 164:27 10:15   1 - 13:29 10:30   1 - 177:9 10:30 Aligh   - 177:13 10th     - 87.7, 87.9, 108-19 171       - 177:13 10th       - 87.7, 87.9, 108-19 171         - 177:13 10th         - 87.7, 87.9, 108-19 171					
10					
154:19, 164:14, 166:27 10:15 (1) - 13:29 10:30 (1) - 177:13 10:16 (1) - 37.15 11 (1) - 3.20 11 (1) - 3.21 11 (1) - 3.32 11 (1) - 3.32 11 (1) - 3.32 11 (1) - 3.32 11 (1) - 18	<b>10</b> [5] <b>-</b> 3:7, 154:2,	· ·			<b>2nd</b> [2] - 80:13, 91:7
164:27 10:35 (n) - 177:9 10:30AM (n) - 177:9 12:10.30AM (n) - 177:13 10h (n) - 677; 67:9, 87:48, 88.4, 130:27 11 (n) - 37.5, 15:27 11 (n) - 13.8 18 13267 (n) - 18:18 12:18 13267 (n) - 18:18 12:18 12:18 12:18 12:18 12:19 12:18 12:18 12:18 12:19 12:18 12:18 12:18 12			, ,	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	
10:30   177:9   10:30   177:9   10:30   177:9   10:30   177:9   10:30   177:9   10:30   177:9   10:30   177:9   10:30   10:30   177:9   10:30   10:30   177:9   10:30   10:3			· ·		ა
10:30Am   177:9   177th   19-47:11   18   3-3:11, 64:19, 95:21   18th   2-45:12, 45:21   18th   2-45:12, 45:11, 45:26, 45:14, 45:21, 45:21   18th   2-25:32:21, 32:21, 32:12, 32:1					
100.30AM (n) - 177.13   18 [s] - 3.11, 64:19,   19 [s] - 45:12,   18 [s] - 3.11, 64:19,   19 [s] - 57:18,   10 [s] - 10.18, 12:18   11286 [s] - 10.16,   119 [s] - 57:18,   101.7, 103.24,   155:45, 157:11,   155:45, 157:11,   157:25, 158:14,   157:25, 158:11,   157:25, 158:1	<b>10:30</b> [1] - 177:9				<b>3</b> [4] - 3:3, 70:10.
10th     - 877,   - 879,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 887,   - 888,   -	10:30AM [1] - 177:13	· · ·			
87:18, 88:4, 130:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 37, 51:27   11   21 - 32   11   11   - 1:18   11   11   11   11   11   11   11	<b>10th</b> [5] - 87:7, 87:9,				· ·
11-13 (n) - 3.32 111-13 (n) - 3.32 113-13 (n) - 3.32 13-13 (n) - 3.32 13-13 (n) - 3.32 13-13 (n) - 5.32 13-13 (n) - 5	87:18, 88:4, 130:27				
11-1   1-1	<b>11</b> [2] <b>-</b> 3:7, 51:27				
111       -     -					
14286       -	<b>111</b> [1] - 1:18				
101.18, 122.18   11286	<b>11285</b> [3] - 10:16,	1			
11286 (a) - 9:28,   157:25, 166:14   157:25, 166:14   159:28, 160:06,   139:59; - 103:6,   139:59; - 159:28, 160:13,   160:13, 160:16, 164:6,   160:14,	10:18, 12:18				
12:22, 13:2, 13:3	<b>11286</b> [4] - 9:28,				
11345   3   - 103:6,   103:7, 105:5   11:55pm   11 - 21:28   138:18   160:16, 164:6,   166:15, 170:3   162:15, 170:3   170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:15, 170:1		· ·			
103:7, 105:5   11:55pm					
11:55pm [i] - 21:28 11th [i] - 153:29.  2 2 2 2 5th [ii] - 19:27 2 5th [ii] - 19:24 2 (ii) - 10:24 2 (iii) - 10:24 2 (iii) - 77:23 2 (iii) - 77:23 2 (iii) - 16:66 2 (iii) - 18:18 2 (iii) - 17:7 3 (iii) - 18:18 3 3 (iii) - 18:28 3 (iii) - 18:29 3 (iii) - 18:28 3 (iii)					
11th   2] - 153:29,   2		138:18		<b>2562</b> [1] - 92:27	
154:5   2   2018 [9] - 1:9, 7:17,   8:5, 8:10, 11:7,   130:19, 143:15,   1320*   19:22   10:24   16:16   13293* [1] - 17:7   13296* [1] - 18:18   13297* [2] - 19:14,   19:22   13304* [1] - 20:15   13305* [1] - 27:11   130:26   13305* [1] - 27:11   130:26   13370* [1] - 138:18   13:08* [1] - 8:22   13:09* [1] - 13:18   13:08* [1] - 8:22   13:08* [1] - 8:22   13:08* [1] - 13:19   33* [1] - 3:19   33* [1] - 3:19   34* [1] - 3:19	-	_		<b>2596</b> [1] - 96:26	
12 [2] - 3:8, 4:5         12477 [1] - 169:7         2 [9] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:6, 30:19, 143:15, 12478 [1] - 169:6         37:23, 69:2, 110:26, 111:13, 113:9, 113:13         34 [1] - 3:19         345 [2] - 77:22, 105:14         35 [1] - 3:20         35 [1] - 3:20         36 [1] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:15, 141:16         2612 [2] - 98:5, 98:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [1] - 3:21         38 [1] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [1] - 3:21         38 [1] - 3:21         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         39 [1] - 15:3         3		2		• •	
12477 [i] - 169:7         2 [g] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:6, 37:23, 69:2, 110:26, 11:13, 113:9, 113:13         130:19, 143:15, 143:15, 143:17, 144:5         64:16, 89:5, 89:8, 89:13, 90:11, 91:18, 91:29, 115:10:19         345 [2] - 77:22, 105:19           12:05 mm [i] - 21:29         2 [i] - 110:24         2/9 [i] - 84:1         2019 [i] - 1:18, 6:2, 177:13         2062 [i] - 22:3, 30:5, 45:12, 45:18         2013 [i] - 3:20         35 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         37 [2] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [i] - 3:20         39 [i] - 3:22         39 [i] - 3:22         2064 [i] - 64:26         2064 [i] - 64	<b>12</b> [2] - 3:8, 4:5				
12478 [i] - 169:6       37:23, 69:2, 110:26, 111:13, 113:9, 113:13       143:17, 144:5       89:13, 90:11, 91:18, 105:19       105:19       35 [i] - 3:20       36 [i] - 3:20       37 [i] - 3:20       37 [i] - 3:20       36 [i] - 3:20       36 [i] - 3:20       37 [i] - 3:20       36 [i] - 3:20       36 [i] - 3:20       36 [i] - 3:20       36 [i] - 3:20       37 [i] - 3:21       38 [i] - 3:21       38 [i] - 3:21       38 [i] - 3:21       39 [i] - 3:22       38 [i] - 3:21       39 [i] - 3:22       39 [i] - 3:22       39 [i] - 3:22       39 [i] - 10:14       4       4       4 [i] - 64:26       265 [i] - 14:14       4       4 [i] - 64:26       265 [i] - 14:14       4 [i] - 64:26       265 [i] - 14:14       4 [i] - 64:26       265 [i] - 10:14       2		2 rot - 2:32 3:3 1:6		64:16, 89:5, 89:8,	
12:05 [i] - 64:8         111:13, 113:9, 113:13         2019 [i] - 1:18, 6:2, 177:13         177:4, 177:7         35 [i] - 3:20           12:05am [i] - 21:29         2" [i] - 110:24         2062 [i] - 22:3, 30:5, 45:12, 45:18         2062 [i] - 22:3, 30:5, 45:12, 45:18         2612 [i] - 98:5, 98:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         37 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 3:20         36 [i] - 12:3         36 [i] - 13:20					
12:05am [n] - 21:29         2" [n] - 110:24         177:13         2062 [a] - 22:3, 30:5, 45:12, 45:18         36 [n] - 3:20         37 [a] - 3:21, 70:8         36 [n] - 3:20         37 [a] - 3:21, 70:8         36 [n] - 3:20         37 [a] - 3:21, 70:8         36 [n] - 3:20         37 [a] - 3:21, 70:8         36 [n] - 3:20         37 [a] - 3:21, 70:8         37 [a] - 3:21, 70:8         37 [a] - 3:21, 70:8         38 [n] - 3:21         38 [n] - 3:21         38 [n] - 3:21         38 [n] - 3:21         39 [n] - 3:22         30 [n	1	, , ,			
12th   2  - 66:22,         29   1  - 84:1         2062   4  - 22:3, 30:5,         26   2  - 3:15, 141:16         37   2  - 3:21, 70:8           96:10         29/2016   1  - 77:23         45:12, 45:18         2647   1  - 125:3         38   1  - 3:21         37   2  - 3:21, 70:8           13   2  - 2:31, 3:8         20   3  - 3:12, 6:24,         45:12, 45:18         2647   1  - 125:3         2648   1  - 125:3         38   1  - 3:21           13267   2  - 16:14,         16:7         2012   1  - 57:18         2064   1  - 64:26         2649   1  - 120:1         2649   1  - 120:1         39   1  - 3:22         3pm   1  - 16:20           13293   1  - 17:7         2014   6  - 1:3, 16:13,         16:16, 17:3, 28:5,         2066   4  - 87:8,         2655   3  - 141:14,         4           19:22         2015   12  - 17:7,         18:16, 18:18, 19:14,         2068   1  - 100:24         2655   3  - 141:14,         4           13305   1  - 27:11         19:22, 22:6, 22:9,         2068   1  - 100:24         265   1  - 151:12         26th   6  - 21:17,         22:6, 25:27, 48:23,           13369   2  - 130:8,         45:24, 95:11         2070   8  - 101:28,         17:28, 121:18,         27   2  - 3:15, 141:24         40   2  - 9:28, 108:18           13:08   1  - 8:22         46:1, 46:8, 46:10,         44:17.7, 141:8,         2706   2  - 154:20,         402   9:28, 108:18	1			177:7	1
96:10 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 13267 [2] - 16:14, 16:16 13293 [1] - 17:7 13296 [1] - 18:18 13297 [2] - 19:14, 19:22 13304 [1] - 20:15 13305 [1] - 27:11 13306 [1] - 157:26 13369 [2] - 138:18 130:26 13307 [1] - 138:18 130:26 13308 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 1318 [1] - 322 132 [1] - 125:3 2648 [1] - 118:26 2649 [1] - 120:1 2650 [1] - 120:16 2655 [3] - 141:14, 141:22, 141:27 2661 [1] - 151:12 2661 [				<b>26</b> [2] - 3:15, 141:16	
13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8       20 [3] - 3:12, 6:24, 16:7       2063 [7] - 46:28, 47:3, 47:4, 54:2, 63:24, 64:5, 64:15       2648 [1] - 18:26       29 [1] - 3:22       39 [1] - 3:24       4 [8] - 2:19, 3:4       4 [8] - 2:19, 3:4       4 [8] - 2:19, 3:4       4 [8] - 2:19, 3:4       60:25, 89:6, 107:19, 11:17, 22:6, 25:27, 48:23, 136:23, 137:11       20:66 [2] - 10:13, 13:6:12       20:66 [2] - 10:13, 13:6:13       13:6:23, 137:11       27:10 [3] - 15:44       20:10 [3] - 10:26       40 [2] - 9:28, 108:18					
13267			•		
16:16 13293 [1] - 17:7 13296 [1] - 18:18 13297 [2] - 19:14, 19:22 2015 [12] - 17:7, 13304 [1] - 20:15 13366 [1] - 157:26 13369 [2] - 130:8, 130:26 13370 [1] - 138:18 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13th [9] - 96:8, 101:11 106:21  2012 [1] - 57:18 2014 [6] - 1:3, 16:13, 16:13, 16:13, 16:14, 2064 [1] - 64:26 2066 [4] - 87:8, 87:17, 91:6, 94:9 2067 [2] - 95:19, 96:7 2068 [1] - 100:24 2068 [1] - 100:24 2068 [1] - 100:24 2069 [2] - 101:13, 106:12 2070 [8] - 101:28, 117:28, 121:18, 141:2, 141:7, 141:8, 141:10, 141:25 2071 [2] - 143:14, 150:26 118:10, 121:19, 150:11  2649 [1] - 120:1 2655 [3] - 141:14, 141:22, 141:27 2672 [1] - 151:12 26th [6] - 21:17, 22:6, 25:27, 48:23, 136:23, 137:11 27th [5] - 154:4 2706 [2] - 154:4 2706 [2] - 154:20, 160:1 27th [5] - 117:29, 115:13 4023 [4] - 106:26, 106:27, 107:3, 114:1					
13293 [1] - 17:7       2014 [6] - 1:3, 16:13, 16:13, 16:13, 16:16, 17:3, 28:5, 55:21       2066 [4] - 87:8, 87:17, 91:6, 94:9       2655 [3] - 141:14, 141:22, 141:27         19:22       2015 [12] - 17:7, 18:16, 18:18, 19:14, 13:305 [1] - 27:11       2015 [12] - 17:7, 18:16, 18:18, 19:14, 19:22, 22:6, 22:9, 13:366 [1] - 157:26       2068 [1] - 100:24 2069 [2] - 101:13, 13:18 13:026       2069 [2] - 101:13, 106:12       2069 [2] - 101:28, 121:18, 13:026       2070 [8] - 101:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13:08, 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13:08, 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13:08, 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13:08, 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13:08, 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13:08, 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13:08, 13:08 [1] - 8:22 13:08, 100:11 1 106:21       2066 [4] - 87:8, 87:17, 91:6, 94:9 2067 [2] - 95:19, 96:7 2067 [1] - 151:12 2066 [1] - 151:12 2067 [1] - 151:12 2068 [1] - 100:24 2068 [1] - 100:24 2068 [1] - 100:24 2069 [2] - 101:13, 136:23, 137:11 20:6 25, 89:6, 107:19, 111:17, 113:7, 114:6 27 [2] - 3:15, 141:24 207 20:25, 89:6, 107:19, 111:17, 113:7, 114:6 27 [2] - 3:15, 141:24 207 20:25, 89:6, 107:19, 111:17, 113:7, 114:6 27 [2] - 3:15, 141:24 207 20:25, 89:6, 107:19, 110:26 20, 110:28, 12:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:28, 1				<b>2649</b> [1] - 120:1	<b>3pm</b> [1] - 16:20
13296 [1] - 18:18       16:16, 17:3, 28:5, 55:21       2066 [4] - 87:8, 87:17, 91:6, 94:9       2655 [3] - 141:14, 141:22, 141:27         19:22       2015 [12] - 17:7, 18:16, 19:14, 13305 [1] - 27:11       2067 [2] - 95:19, 96:7       2672 [1] - 151:12 26 (1] - 151:12       4 [8] - 2:19, 3:4, 60:25, 89:6, 107:19, 12:17, 22:6, 25:27, 48:23, 136:23, 137:11         13366 [1] - 157:26       30:6, 33:15, 45:15, 45:15, 130:26       2016 [36] - 39:6, 45:4, 45:12, 45:21, 13:08 [1] - 138:18       17:28, 121:18, 117:28, 121:18, 13:08 [1] - 154:4 2706 [2] - 154:20, 160:1       2706 [2] - 154:20, 160:1       4021 [1] - 109:23 4022 [2] - 110:20, 15:13         13th [9] - 96:8, 101:11, 106:21       51:6, 53:24, 55:3.       150:26       2071 [2] - 143:14, 150:26       27th [5] - 117:29, 18:10, 121:19, 106:26, 106:27, 107:3, 114:1				<b>2650</b> [1] - 120:16	4
13297 [2] - 19:14,       55:21       87:17, 91:6, 94:9       141:22, 141:27       2672 [1] - 151:12       4 [8] - 2:19, 3:4,         13304 [1] - 20:15       18:16, 18:18, 19:14,       2068 [1] - 100:24       26th [6] - 21:17,       22:6, 25:27, 48:23,       13:17, 114:6       40:25, 89:6, 107:19,         13366 [1] - 157:26       30:6, 33:15, 45:15,       2069 [2] - 101:13,       106:12       27 [2] - 3:15, 141:24       49/2017 [1] - 125:6         13370 [1] - 138:18       45:4, 45:12, 45:21,       45:4, 45:12, 45:21,       141:2, 141:7, 141:8,       2706 [2] - 154:20,       4021 [1] - 109:23         13:08 [1] - 8:22       46:1, 46:8, 46:10,       47:5, 47:11, 48:26,       2071 [2] - 143:14,       27th [5] - 117:29,       15:13         101:11 106:21       51:6, 53:24, 55:3.       150:26       150:26       150:26       160:27, 107:3, 114:1				<b>2655</b> [3] - 141:14,	4
19:22		, , ,		141:22, 141:27	
13304 [1] - 20:15       18:16, 18:18, 19:14,       2068 [1] - 100:24       26th [6] - 21:17,       60:25, 89:6, 107:19,         13305 [1] - 27:11       19:22, 22:6, 22:9,       30:6, 33:15, 45:15,       106:12       13:60:23, 137:11       49/2017 [1] - 125:6         13370 [1] - 138:18       45:4, 45:12, 45:21,       45:4, 45:12, 45:21,       46:1, 46:8, 46:10,       47:5, 47:11, 48:26,       141:10, 141:25       27th [5] - 117:29,       4023 [4] - 106:26,         101:11 106:21       51:6, 53:24, 55:3.       150:26       150:26       18:10, 12:19,       100:24       26th [6] - 21:17,       22:6, 25:27, 48:23,       111:17, 113:7, 114:6         2069 [2] - 101:13,       106:12       27te [2] - 3:15, 141:24       49/2017 [1] - 125:6       40 [2] - 9:28, 108:18         40 [2] - 9:28, 108:18       4021 [1] - 109:23       4021 [1] - 109:23       4022 [2] - 110:20,         15:13       4023 [4] - 106:26,       115:13       4023 [4] - 106:26,         101:11 106:21       51:6, 53:24, 55:3.       150:26       150:26       18:10, 121:19,       106:27, 107:3, 114:1	,		' '	<b>2672</b> [1] - 151:12	<b>4</b> [8] - 2·19 3·4
13305 [1] - 27:11       19:22, 22:6, 22:9, 30:6, 33:15, 45:15, 45:21, 130:26       2069 [2] - 101:13, 106:12       12:6, 25:27, 48:23, 136:23, 137:11       136:23, 137:11       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6       40 [2] - 9:28, 108:18       40 [2] - 9:28, 108:18       4021 [1] - 109:23       4021 [1] - 109:23       4021 [1] - 109:23       4022 [2] - 110:20, 115:13       4022 [2] - 110:20, 115:13       4023 [4] - 106:26, 116:10       115:13       4023 [4] - 106:26, 116:26, 116:29, 116:19, 117:29, 118:10, 121:19, 116:21       4023 [4] - 106:26, 116:21       4023 [				<b>26th</b> [6] - 21:17,	
13366 [1] - 157:26       30:6, 33:15, 45:15, 45:15, 45:24, 95:11       106:12       136:23, 137:11       4/9/2017 [1] - 125:6         13369 [2] - 130:8, 130:26       2016 [36] - 39:6, 45:4, 45:12, 45:21, 13:08 [1] - 8:22       145:4, 45:12, 45:21, 46:1, 46:8, 46:10, 47:5, 47:11, 48:26, 101:11, 106:21       136:23, 137:11       27 [2] - 3:15, 141:24       40 [2] - 9:28, 108:18         2070 [8] - 101:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:28, 121:18, 17:29, 17:2				22:6, 25:27, 48:23,	
13369 [2] - 130:8,       45:24, 95:11       2070 [8] - 101:28,       275 [1] - 154:4       4021 [1] - 109:23         13370 [1] - 138:18       45:4, 45:12, 45:21,       141:2, 141:7, 141:8,       2706 [2] - 154:20,       4022 [2] - 110:20,         13:08 [1] - 8:22       46:1, 46:8, 46:10,       141:10, 141:25       27th [5] - 117:29,       15:13         101:11 106:21       51:6, 53:24, 55:3.       150:26       150:26       18:10, 121:19,       106:27, 107:3, 114:1				136:23, 137:11	
13369   2  - 130:8,   45:24, 95:11   2016   36  - 39:6,   117:28, 121:18,   2706   2  - 154:20,   4021   1] - 109:23   4022   2] - 110:20,   13108   1] - 8:22   46:1, 46:8, 46:10,   47:5, 47:11, 48:26,   101:11, 106:21   51:6, 53:24, 55:3.   150:26   2076   3  - 101:28,   2705   1] - 154:4   4021   1] - 109:23   4022   2] - 110:20,   15:13   4023   4] - 106:26,   106:27, 107:3, 114:1	1			<b>27</b> [2] - 3:15, 141:24	
13370 [1] - 138:18       45:4, 45:12, 45:21, 46:1, 46:8, 46:10, 47:5, 47:11, 48:26, 101:11, 106:21       141:2, 141:7, 141:8, 141:7, 141:8, 141:10, 141:25       141:2, 141:7, 141:8, 141:10, 141:25       141:10	1				
13370 [1] - 138:18     45:4, 45:12, 45:21, 46:21, 46:3, 46:10, 47:5, 47:11, 48:26, 10:11 106:21     141:2, 141:7, 141:0, 141:25 16:13     160:1     115:13       2071 [2] - 143:14, 150:26     27th [5] - 117:29, 18:10, 121:19, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:10, 18:1					1
<b>13:08</b> [1] - 8:22					
13th [9] - 96:8, 47.51, 47.11, 46.26, 120114, 118:10, 121:19, 14023 [4] - 100:20, 118:10, 121:19, 106:27, 107:3, 114:1					
[ 1()] 1 1()67					
	101:11, 106:21,	51.0, 53.24, 55.3,	130.20		100.21, 101.3, 114.1

		,	I	1
<b>4024</b> [1] - 107:15	54:3, 63:23, 87:8,	117:4	advertised [2] -	32:10, 36:11, 38:22,
<b>44</b> [1] - 169:6	91:6, 94:11, 100:23,	according [1] -	45:15, 45:23	49:28, 50:2, 50:7,
<b>47</b> [2] - 16:14, 130:7	117:28, 121:18,	119:10	advice [1] - 43:11	74:16, 94:26, 95:6,
4th [4] - 19:24, 46:7,	140:27, 143:14,	accurate [14] - 49:8,	advised [5] - 28:11,	166:26
134:27	150:25, 150:26,	49:9, 87:24, 87:25,	28:17, 28:28, 29:15,	allegations [19] -
	164:5, 164:25, 165:17	87:28, 87:29, 91:4,	29:20	37:3, 49:12, 49:14,
5	8th [2] - 28:5, 94:12	97:11, 102:9, 122:29,	affidavit [1] - 22:26	51:15, 52:29, 56:26,
		124:8, 124:9, 126:21,	afternoon [1] - 97:16	70:18, 71:7, 71:8,
	9	147:11	afterwards [2] -	71:10, 71:22, 72:2,
<b>5</b> [2] - 3:4, 107:16		accusation [1] -	19:17, 74:18	94:15, 118:3, 119:4,
<b>50</b> [1] - 12:11		70:25	agenda [1] - 143:18	119:13, 129:15,
<b>51</b> [1] - 2:18	<b>9</b> [14] <b>-</b> 3:6, 39:7,	accused [5] - 30:7,	ago [11] - 18:8,	160:24, 165:20
<b>55</b> [2] - 23:3, 141:17	46:28, 47:2, 50:23,	33:20, 75:1, 97:5,	27:10, 27:16, 39:2,	alleged [3] - 114:14,
<b>5995</b> [1] - 6:24	58:15, 65:26, 92:28,	166:28	81:14, 93:11, 93:12,	154:29, 159:26
<b>5:40</b> [1] - 97:16	98:4, 118:26, 125:3,	accusing [1] - 34:15	93:23, 121:3, 141:3,	alleges [2] - 19:28,
<b>5:45pm</b> [1] - 62:1	132:4, 141:13, 151:12	achieve [2] - 147:5,	169:23	67:15
<b>5th</b> [6] - 19:13,	<b>9/12/2015</b> [1] - 52:18	147:10		alleging [1] - 94:28
19:22, 19:23, 101:6,	9:50pm [1] - 142:1	Act [5] - 16:21,	<b>agree</b> [59] - 7:16, 8:3, 8:9, 12:18, 14:17,	allow [1] - 38:22
131:4, 131:21	9th [5] - 55:20,	37:24, 65:2, 65:4,	21:27, 22:15, 35:23,	allowed [2] - 49:18,
,	131:24, 132:4, 155:6,			65:3
6	155:8	74:8	38:5, 50:6, 62:8,	
<b>U</b>		ACT [2] - 1:3, 1:8	66:18, 71:20, 75:22,	ally [1] - 140:2
	Α	act [1] - 174:11	78:20, 78:24, 79:10,	alternative [1] - 9:23
<b>6</b> [2] <b>-</b> 3:5, 5:5		acting [3] - 121:14,	80:17, 86:20, 86:26,	amended [1] -
<b>6/3/18</b> [1] - 10:16		148:17, 163:16	86:27, 88:9, 88:13,	110:25
<b>61</b> [1] - 6:25	<b>able</b> [7] - 18:14, 42:4,	<b>ACTING</b> [2] - 3:7,	97:10, 98:25, 99:4,	<b>AMENDED</b> [1] - 1:9
<b>62</b> [3] - 12:29, 14:26,	42:8, 83:4, 83:21,	3:13	111:28, 112:9, 113:5,	amount [3] - 45:9,
16:20	163:28, 167:17	action [3] - 1:27,	113:14, 113:17,	69:12, 175:4
<b>6218</b> [2] - 12:20,	<b>about</b> [1] - 136:18	112:7, 115:21	114:2, 116:19,	amounted [1] - 122:6
14:24	above-named [1] -	actions [5] - 110:29,	116:26, 118:16,	<b>AN</b> [1] - 3:2
<b>63</b> [1] - 12:29	1:26	111:1, 111:29,	119:18, 123:15,	<b>AND</b> [7] - 1:3, 1:4,
<b>6318</b> <sub>[1]</sub> - 12:19	absolutely [16] -	112:20, 113:26	128:13, 145:3,	1:8, 3:15, 64:10,
<b>6467</b> [2] - 26:4, 27:22	34:29, 36:28, 37:17,	activated [1] -	145:10, 145:24,	109:17, 150:14
<b>6TH</b> [2] - 1:18, 6:1	37:18, 49:29, 51:11,	110:12	145:25, 146:9,	<b>ANDREW</b> [2] - 2:22,
<b>6th</b> [5] - 7:17, 8:5,	51:12, 61:25, 77:13,	active [2] - 74:10,	151:25, 156:20,	4:2
8:10, 8:22, 11:6	82:21, 90:13, 117:3,	75:18	160:3, 165:28,	<b>ANNE</b> [2] - 3:8, 3:17
0.10, 0.22, 11.0	136:4, 168:26, 171:9	actual [6] - 72:4,	167:28, 168:4, 170:5,	<b>Anne</b> [3] - 7:18, 13:6,
7	<b>AC</b> [3] - 8:25, 13:6,	130:14, 145:22,	171:1, 171:4, 171:12,	13:25
<u>'</u>	21:7	171:19, 172:18,	172:1, 172:24, 173:1,	annoying [1] - 47:20
	accept [29] - 8:19,	174:22	173:10, 175:8, 175:12	answer [13] - 23:18,
<b>7</b> [4] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5,	27:17, 56:2, 57:10,	addiction [1] - 57:29	agreed [4] - 24:15,	25:8, 41:10, 54:13,
101:15	58:21, 63:20, 68:20,	adding [1] - 75:4	116:21, 122:14,	58:28, 84:27, 86:17,
<b>701</b> [1] - 61:4	69:16, 69:18, 71:15,	address [3] - 15:7,	160:10	87:4, 113:20, 125:2,
<b>702</b> [2] - 60:26, 61:1	72:4, 89:15, 94:5,	103:4, 106:25	agreeing [3] - 14:25,	166:28, 172:18, 173:8
<b>703</b> [2] - 89:6, 89:11	95:16, 96:3, 96:6,	addressed [6] - 28:2,	127:1, 147:21	answering [1] - 19:5
<b>7128</b> [2] - 46:24, 68:6	96:21, 96:22, 98:2,	33:4, 33:28, 168:13,	agreement [2] - 90:1,	<b>ANTHONY</b> [1] - 3:6
<b>7129</b> [1] - 68:24	113:15, 115:9,	169:26, 171:5	108:2	anxious [1] - 15:2
<b>7130</b> [3] - 70:7, 70:9,	115:12, 116:5,	addressing [1] -	AGSI [1] - 4:1	anyway [5] - 10:9,
70:10	117:16, 122:22,	149:7	ahead [1] - 113:11	37:18, 70:3, 99:27,
<b>78"</b> [1] - 50:22	123:6, 129:20, 152:17	ADJOURNED [4] -	AIDAN[2] - 3:9, 4:3	167:10
<b>7:43am</b> [1] - 8:28	acceptance [1] -	64:10, 109:17,	<b>Aidan</b> [2] - 7:8, 20:28	apart [2] - 7:16,
7th [5] - 17:9,	109:8	150:14, 177:12	<b>AISLING</b> [2] - 2:11,	158:27
101:20, 137:23,	accepted [5] - 57:28,	ADMINISTRATIVE	3:21	apologise [1] - 49:16
138:2, 138:3	69:18, 75:24, 109:10,	[1] - 3:14	<b>ALAN</b> [2] - 3:9, 3:13	apology [1] - 49:19
<b>7TH</b> <sub>[1]</sub> - 177:12	122:25	administrative [3] -	alcohol [6] - 43:12,	APPEAL[2] - 1:13,
	accepting [4] -	162:15, 162:29, 163:2	45:6, 57:11, 57:12,	2:3
8	41:20, 69:3, 89:16,	admission [1] -	58:1, 63:19	appeal [1] - 69:9
0	115:12	73:13	<b>ALISON</b> [1] - 3:26	appear [10] - 12:19,
	accident [2] - 31:19,	advance [2] - 99:29,	alive [3] - 127:28,	23:4, 51:13, 63:19,
<b>8</b> [21] - 3:6, 3:28,	31:21	100:3	128:1, 128:2	72:27, 96:20, 98:11,
22:3, 45:12, 47:4,	accordance [1] -	adverse [1] - 41:20	allegation [10] -	132:24, 153:1, 175:11
				1

APPEARANCES[1] -2:1 appeared [7] - 46:6, 58:8, 95:10, 101:19, 129:7, 159:3, 169:3 appendices [5] -155:18, 155:19, 156:8, 156:25, 156:26 application [1] -100:27 applied [6] - 45:13, 45:21, 45:27, 46:4, 110:24, 144:5 appoint [2] - 151:21, 162.4 appointed [4] -108:7, 108:28, 158:21, 164:7 appointment [13] -97:28, 98:8, 98:18, 98:23, 108:10, 108:22, 108:25, 109:6, 110:14, 161:29, 164:12, 165:19, 165:27 appointments [1] -135:23 appoints [1] - 164:29 appreciate [2] -117:19, 131:5 approached [1] -87:11 approaching [2] -87:20, 88:16 appropriate [1] -April [5] - 22:9, 23:2, 25:25, 136:22, 136:23 arbitrarily [1] -151:20 area [2] - 6:18, 59:14 argue [2] - 32:14, 113:11 argument [3] -115:19, 116:18, 123:9 arising [2] - 107:21, 116:26 **ARRAN**[1] - 2:24 arranging [1] - 87:27 arrival [1] - 62:2 arrived [2] - 40:26, article [14] - 21:13, 66:6, 121:7, 160:18, 160:20, 160:21, 161:9, 161:10, 161:18, 161:22, 163:10, 165:23, 165:25, 167:16

article) [1] - 136:17

**AS** [6] - 1:9, 6:1, 6:11, 64:10, 109:17, 150:14 aspects [2] - 79:17, 97.29 assassinate [1] -144:29 asserting [1] - 174:5 assessed [1] - 81:1 assist [6] - 90:14, 92:26. 112:29. 130:10, 133:2, 133:17 assistance [2] -80:6, 117:9 assistant [10] -20:22. 28:19. 29:14. 47:19, 104:2, 159:16, 161:12, 161:15, 162:1, 162:4 Assistant [46] - 6:29. 7:5, 13:25, 20:22, 20:27, 27:24, 28:2, 29:11, 29:16, 29:23, 29:27, 55:26, 106:1, 106:5, 107:1, 107:4, 107:25, 107:26, 107:27, 108:28, 109:10, 154:6, 154:11, 155:7, 155:10, 155:12, 155:23, 156:7, 157:10, 157:18, 158:10, 159:4, 159:15, 159:20, 160:4, 160:10, 162:3, 162:12. 163:16. 164:7, 164:12, 164:28, 164:29, 165:18, 165:27 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 assisted [1] - 146:11 assisting [1] - 77:4 **AT**[1] - 177:13 Athlone [16] - 19:4, 22:7, 28:6, 32:26, 42:20, 44:28, 55:27, 63:6, 86:2, 97:3,

100:22, 105:2,

159:6

85.19

118:17, 125:9, 159:2,

ATHLONE [1] - 3:32

Athlone" [1] - 137:2

attach [2] - 85:17,

attack [3] - 34:18,

attached [2] -

155:20, 156:12

35:16, 57:3

attacks [2] - 146:11, 152:18 attempt [3] - 86:28, 175:13, 176:15 attempts [1] - 96:19 attend [4] - 57:12, 89:25, 89:29, 90:2 attended [1] - 52:20 attention [14] -14:29, 32:8, 32:16, 66:6, 80:26, 110:22, 111:18, 112:4, 115:17, 160:19, 166:4, 166:17, 169:8, 176:28 attention" [1] -112:25 attitude [4] - 123:18, 123:22, 123:23, 124:7 August [1] - 83:27 author [1] - 173:26 authored [1] -173:27 authorise [1] -171:20 authorised [1] - 91:9 authorities [2] -75:4, 146:13 authority [12] -70:19, 110:5, 115:8, 121:22, 133:28, 142:16, 142:24, 144:10, 144:22, 167:1, 168:12, 169:24 Authority [62] -72:18, 73:4, 73:18, 100:29, 101:2, 101:12, 103:20, 104:10, 106:13, 107:20, 107:24, 108:12, 108:15, 109:22, 109:26, 114:26, 115:10, 115:24, 116:2, 118:4, 120:25, 121:23, 125:15, 134:12, 135:13, 141:6, 142:7, 142:9, 142:20, 143:16, 145:1, 145:7, 145:17, 145:19, 149:10, 150:22, 151:9, 151:19, 152:2, 152:23, 152:28, 153:1, 153:6, 153:13, 153:16, 165:8, 166:25, 167:23, 170:2, 171:6, 172:9, 172:16, 173:10, 173:12, 173:15, 173:23, 175:18,

176:2, 176:8, 176:19, 176:28 Authority's [2] -114:28, 176:20 authority's [6] -110:9, 111:18, 112:4, 112:25, 115:17, 121:25 available [1] - 118:6 availing [1] - 31:11 avenues [1] - 65:5 avoided [1] - 19:4 award [1] - 89:21 aware [64] - 7:5, 7:7, 7:9, 7:23, 7:26, 19:3, 19:10. 20:3. 20:9. 25:5, 28:18, 39:18, 43:25, 45:20, 45:26, 45:27, 45:28, 46:1, 49:12, 50:1, 50:6, 51:14, 51:16, 51:18, 57:16, 59:4, 64:22, 65:22, 66:23, 81:4. 81.5 81.6 82.8 85:24, 92:8, 95:25, 97:12, 99:17, 99:19, 100:24, 100:26, 101:1, 101:2, 101:20, 101:22, 101:25, 118:4, 118:21, 120:26, 124:16, 135:5, 142:8, 142:28. 143:16, 144:3, 144:10, 151:9, 162:3, 162:6, 163:8, 163:20, 163:21, 163:23, 173:15 awareness [2] -51:19, 55:5 awful [5] - 24:2, 81:11, 123:6, 144:17, 173.4

В

back-up [1] - 156:12

backed [1] - 155:18

background [1] 100:14
backing [1] - 51:22
backs [1] - 161:13
bail [1] - 59:10
balance [2] - 18:27,
121:7
BAR [1] - 2:31
Barrett [21] - 132:12,
135:2, 138:23,
139:24, 162:14,
166:15, 166:24,

167:5, 167:7, 167:9, 167:11, 168:12, 169:9, 169:19, 169:24, 171:9, 171:22, 173:27, 174:4, 174:9, 175:13 barrett [1] - 172:2 Barrett's [1] - 139:12 barrister [1] - 9:17 based [7] - 43:27, 88:23, 110:9, 120:4, 124:26, 125:4, 141:20 **basis** [4] - 34:29, 86:18, 173:2, 176:29 **BASTION**[1] - 3:31 baton [3] - 146:23, 147:2, 147:3 BE [1] - 6:10 bear [2] - 45:9, 176.19 beaten [1] - 69:28 became [10] - 7:5, 7:7, 17:4, 46:1, 59:4, 81:4, 81:5, 82:8, 101.22 become [8] - 19:10, 26:13, 43:25, 64:22, 65:22, 101:20, 101:24, 130:12 becomes [1] -124:20 beg [4] - 47:4, 143:26, 164:27, 169:6 **begin** [1] - 130:8 beginning [3] -70:13, 120:2, 151:2 begins [2] - 67:7, begun [1] - 97:13 behalf [9] - 13:6, 13:25, 121:8, 121:15, 137:1, 143:8, 147:24, 171:21, 174:21 behave [1] - 55:17 behaviour [2] -154:29. 159:26 behind [5] - 31:3, 140:10, 144:17, 150:25, 158:22 belief [1] - 50:16 beliefs [1] - 56:25 below [1] - 138:8 best [2] - 92:9, 92:17 better [4] - 43:20, 55:17, 132:22, 174:10 between [17] - 22:10, 40:22, 53:9, 53:10, 92:6, 92:20, 92:21, 93:17, 107:25,

112:16, 129:11,

129:21, 139:24, 147:26, 160:6, 160:12, 170:10 big [6] - 80:18, 92:6, 93:20, 122:11, 129:11, 148:1 biggest [1] - 148:29 Bill [1] - 33:8 bit [15] - 10:12, 10:14, 10:15, 40:24, 43:28, 47:15, 74:27, 118:19, 126:22, 134:1, 134:2, 134:3, 156:27, 174:4, 174:27 bits [2] - 12:5, 12:28 **BL** [12] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 3:30, 4:4 block [3] - 122:7, 146:29, 173:13 blocked [1] - 153:27 **blocking** [1] - 145:13 **Board** [1] - 110:15 **board** [1] - 91:10 body [1] - 106:13 book [5] - 6:24, 10:4, 16:14, 150:26, 164:14 booklet [1] - 22:2 **bother** [1] - 157:1 bottom [5] - 10:15, 72:16, 107:3, 118:8, 136:20 **box** [1] - 134:28 **boxes** [1] - 130:14 bracket [1] - 68:29 brackets [1] - 175:25 breach [1] - 111:10 breaches [1] - 68:27 break [5] - 63:26, 64:3, 73:13, 106:26, 150:3 BRIAN [2] - 3:15, 3:16 brief [3] - 62:6, 99:29, 100:3 **briefed** [1] - 100:5 briefing [1] - 147:29 BRIEFLY [2] - 64:10, 150:14 briefly [3] - 67:26, 92:26, 100:25 bring [35] - 8:17, 24:27, 25:10, 37:24, 48:28, 54:16, 55:17, 56:4, 57:3, 73:14, 73:21, 74:6, 80:25, 91:9. 92:2. 92:7. 93:3. 93:20, 93:23, 96:19,

99:25, 103:6, 111:17,

112:3, 112:24, 115:16, 122:15, 122:23, 123:7, 123:19, 123:28, 123:29, 128:25, 146:17 bringing [16] - 54:7, 55:9, 55:12, 55:14, 75:23, 75:24, 75:25, 75:27, 75:28, 75:29, 96:14, 122:25, 123:24, 124:2, 124:8 brings [1] - 136:16 broadcast [1] - 121:9 broadcasts [1] -122:3 broadsheet [2] -136:16, 136:17 brought [8] - 7:29, 32:7, 37:24, 38:14, 38:15, 57:18, 93:24, 142:1 Browne" [1] - 134:24 buildings [1] - 31:6 bulk [2] - 29:16, 161:14 bullet [1] - 114:12 bullet-points [1] -114.12 bullied [1] - 97:19 bullying [39] - 30:8, 60:11, 71:19, 72:3, 73:23, 74:1, 74:16, 74:17, 107:2, 108:4, 108:22, 108:25, 112:9, 112:13, 112:17, 113:2, 113:18, 113:21, 114:27, 115:2,

116:20, 119:24,

120:23, 124:17,

155:20, 158:18,

160:23, 166:7,

166:26, 166:28,

167:24, 168:25

65:20

55:22

6:10

124:22, 129:9, 139:2,

139:3. 145:8. 153:22.

burglaries [1] - 33:1

Business [2] - 64:27,

**busy** [1] - 150:12

BY [12] - 1:4, 1:7,

3:26, 3:30, 4:5, 5:5,

bypassed [3] -

bypassing [1] -

151:5, 151:26, 152:3

2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29,

butchered [1] -

cabinet [11] - 78:26, 79:2, 79:8, 79:14, 79:29, 81:1, 81:23, 81:25, 84:5, 84:8, 86:12 **CAGNEY** [1] - 3:17 calculated [3] - 75:6, 146:28, 173:12 calendars [3] -130:11, 130:18, 130:24 campaign [3] -128:24, 148:2, 149:20 candidate [8] -107:9, 110:10, 110:12, 111:2, 111:11, 172:15, 172:16, 172:20 candidates [4] -101:16, 101:19, 107:21, 110:13 cannot [7] - 83:16, 129:24, 152:12, 152:25, 172:10, 175:23, 175:26 **CAO**[1] - 165:6 capacity [2] - 61:26, 140:3 car [20] - 22:11, 22:13, 23:4, 23:10, 23:21, 25:14, 25:15, 25:19, 25:24, 25:28, 26:2, 26:5, 26:6, 26:12, 26:14, 26:15, 26:23, 27:7, 68:29, 95:10 care [1] - 94:21 career [6] - 56:5, 74:6, 75:25, 122:26, 152:14, 152:21 careers [2] - 55:10, careful [1] - 41:7 **CARR** [1] - 3:15 Carrick [3] - 120:4, 137:24 138:10 CARRICK [1] - 2:13 Carrick-on-Shannon [3] - 120:4, 137:24, 138:10 **CARRICK-ON-SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 **CARROLL** [1] - 2:16 carrying [2] - 7:2,

151:22

Byrne [1] - 29:16

C

CARTHAGE[1] -2:17 case [34] - 23:27, 24:22 30:21 31:23 35:4, 44:29, 51:13, 52:18, 66:21, 72:1, 87:3, 93:10, 97:3, 102:27, 103:1, 108:26, 109:5, 113:4, 127:8, 128:7, 129:8, 136:17, 142:28, 147:27, 149:22, 149:23, 156:21, 162:13, 166:4, 166:17, 167:25, 168:29, 169:3, 176:17 cases [2] - 9:18, 32:27 CASTLE[1] - 1:17 Castle [1] - 89:25 castle [1] - 177:4 cat [1] - 133:8 categories [2] -114:22, 114:23 category [1] - 68:29 caught [1] - 21:6 caused [1] - 152:13 **CC** [1] - 76:20 cc'd [4] - 72:18, 145:21, 170:5, 170:11 CCing [1] - 77:2 central [1] - 24:29 centre [2] - 33:6, 170:14 **CEO**[1] - 166:25 ceremony [1] - 89:29 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 certain [6] - 24:25, 24:26, 69:19, 69:20, 69:21, 127:23 certainly [20] - 11:1, 14:14, 15:6, 15:15, 18:15, 23:26, 39:23, 39:25, 49:3, 54:14, 54:26, 70:6, 103:7, 126:11, 128:23, 149:6, 150:4, 151:29, 164:25, 167:9 certificate [1] - 89:21 certification [1] -68:15 certify [1] - 1:24 certs [1] - 57:22 chain [2] - 32:2, 124:17 **Chair** [1] - 94:2 Chair's [1] - 41:10 Chairman [54] - 6:7,

6:14, 7:4, 9:5, 9:21,

10:3, 10:11, 10:15, 10:19, 12:2, 12:17, 13:2, 14:28, 15:6, 15:9, 15:23, 16:6, 16:13, 18:20, 26:28, 31:18, 38:21, 39:21, 51:18, 54:14, 56:2, 60:26, 64:1, 64:14, 66:29, 67:4, 75:14, 82:6, 96:24, 96:27, 109:20, 116:5, 117:16, 117:27, 118:14, 132:3, 135:7, 138:20, 150:2, 150:17, 150:26, 157:9, 160:16, 162:22, 164:8, 169:19, 174:14, 175:1, 177:8 **chairman** [2] - 13:19, 121:22 CHAIRMAN [313] -1:12, 6:4, 6:6, 6:13, 6:17, 6:20, 6:22, 8:6, 10:1, 10:6, 10:8, 10:12, 10:14, 10:18, 10:23, 10:25, 11:2, 11:23, 12:3, 12:10, 12:28, 13:3, 13:9, 14:2, 14:5, 14:10, 14:15, 14:19, 14:21, 14:23, 14:25, 15:4, 15:7, 15:15, 15:21, 15:26 16:1 16:5 16:11, 23:9, 23:15, 25:12, 25:14, 25:16, 25:18, 25:21, 25:25, 25:27, 26:9, 26:15, 26:17, 26:19, 26:25, 26:27, 26:29, 27:3, 27:5. 27:7. 27:19. 27:27 29:27 30:1 30:3, 33:9, 33:12, 33:14, 33:16, 36:4, 36:6, 36:10, 36:14, 36:16, 36:21, 36:23, 36:26, 36:29, 37:2, 37:6, 37:8, 37:12, 37:17, 37:29, 38:4, 39:23, 39:25, 39:28, 40:1, 40:5, 40:8, 40:11, 40:28, 41:5, 41:18, 41:23, 41:26, 42:1, 42:7, 42:10, 42:12, 42:15, 42:21, 42:24, 43:14, 43:16, 43:20, 43:23, 44:5, 44:8. 44:15. 47:26. 48:1, 49:23, 49:26, 49:29, 50:3, 50:11, 50:20, 50:28, 51:2,

51:13, 51:20, 58:29,
59:24, 59:26, 59:29,
60:28, 61:7, 63:25,
63:28, 64:2, 64:7,
64:13, 65:11, 65:13,
66:27, 67:2, 67:6,
67:8, 67:22, 67:29,
69:22, 70:1, 70:10,
76:3, 78:10, 78:15,
80:5, 80:7, 82:9,
82:12, 82:16, 82:21,
82:24, 82:29, 83:3,
83:8, 83:19, 83:23,
83:25, 84:2, 84:4,
84:7, 84:10, 84:13,
84:16, 84:18, 84:23,
85:21, 86:26, 87:18,
88:8, 88:10, 88:13,
90:6, 91:17, 92:5,
92:8, 92:19, 94:20,
94:28, 95:1, 95:5,
97:9, 102:28, 103:2,
103:5, 103:7, 103:11,
103:17, 103:23,
103:25, 104:4,
103.23, 104.4,
104:28, 105:7, 105:11, 105:13,
105:16, 105:23,
105:28, 106:2, 106:8,
105.20, 100.2, 100.0,
106:19, 106:21, 106:27, 107:11,
107:13, 108:18,
109:3, 109:7, 109:12,
113:9, 113:11,
115:22, 115:29,
116:6, 116:14,
116:16, 116:25,
116:29, 117:9, 117:11, 117:19,
117:26, 118:10,
118:27, 119:27,
121:14, 123:2, 123:12, 123:14
123:12, 123:14, 123:21, 123:26,
124:6, 124:10, 125:1,
125:20, 125:22,
125.20, 125.22,
125:25, 126:2, 126:23, 126:26,
126:28, 127:1, 127:5,
127:15, 127:17,
127:20, 127:28,
128:1, 128:6, 128:8,
128:10, 128:12,
128:28, 129:10,
120.20, 129.10,
129:13, 129:19, 129:24, 130:1, 130:4,
133:5, 133:8, 133:11,
133:27, 134:1, 134:3,
134:10, 138:1, 138:3,
138:9, 138:13, 138:15, 139:6,
100.10, 108.0,

```
139:10, 147:14,
147:17, 147:20,
147:26, 148:6, 148:8,
148:11, 148:16,
148:21, 148:26,
150:4, 150:8, 150:10,
153:23, 156:14,
156:20, 157:4, 157:7,
162:21, 162:23,
164:16, 164:19,
164:21, 164:24,
164:28, 168:7,
169:18, 169:20,
170:21, 170:24,
170:27, 171:24,
174:1, 174:17, 175:2,
175:4, 175:7, 177:1,
177:9
 Chairperson [2] -
170:2, 171:6
 chance [2] - 37:20,
103:26
 change [4] - 59:5,
98:16, 107:20, 108:13
 changed [2] - 95:26,
112:29
 changing [2] - 33:1,
63:14
 character [5] -
125:16, 126:19,
144:9, 144:29, 152:14
 characters [1] -
 charge [1] - 37:19
 CHARLTON[1] - 4:5
 chat [1] - 62:24
 CHEALLACHÁIN[1]
- 2:30
 check [4] - 23:11,
80:4, 128:7, 143:20
 checking [1] - 37:14
 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3,
3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11,
3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17,
3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27
 chief [20] - 16:9,
45:14, 45:22, 64:18,
70:17, 94:13, 95:22,
97:2, 97:20, 100:28,
101:14, 106:15,
134:11, 144:4, 144:7,
151:21, 158:20,
162:15, 162:29, 163:2
 Chief [8] - 20:27,
47:10, 47:18, 71:12,
71:14, 80:10, 94:24,
137:1
 chiefs [1] - 140:9
```

choice [1] - 172:20

Christmas [6] - 91:2,

04.0 04.00 00.40
91:3, 91:23, 92:13,
93:16, 94:5
Christmas" [1] -
90:26
cider [2] - 53:28,
54:22
<b>cig</b> [2] - 59:21, 59:22 <b>circle</b> [13] - 34:12,
81:14, 81:15, 81:20,
81:22, 82:4, 84:22,
84:27, 86:10, 86:13,
91:1, 139:29, 145:11
<b>circulated</b> [2] - 23:2,
135:9
circumstances [5] -
8:13, 11:29, 37:12,
82:26, 86:20
circumventing [1] -
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
35:14 citing [1] - 106:3 civil [2] - 91:9,
citing [i] = 100.5
,
165:10
civilians [1] - 52:21
<b>claimed</b> [1] - 40:18
claims [3] - 26:11,
65:29, 119:3
Clare [14] - 16:20,
19:28, 27:13, 28:17,
29:20, 72:19, 84:19,
20.20, 72.10, 04.10,
84:20, 118:11,
118:16, 134:16,
134:18, 134:24
clarification [14] -
22:18, 23:28, 26:5,
44:14, 46:26, 66:26,
88:18, 99:2, 119:23,
130:15, 133:23,
141:18, 154:23,
171:16
<b>clarify</b> [5] - 34:22,
41:22, 138:20,
139:15, 139:17
clash [1] - 135:2
Clash [1] - 139:24
<b>clashes</b> [1] - 163:22
classic [1] - 152:5
classifying [1] - 30:9
clear [16] - 11:25,
11:26. 12:5. 13:26.
14:7, 32:29, 33:3,
33:27, 42:17, 57:27,
78:24, 88:11, 92:20,
118:13, 142:19,
145:10
clearance [17] -
104:7, 105:27,
106:29, 107:4, 109:26, 110:5, 110:9,
109:26, 110:5, 110:9,
110:11, 110:15,
144:8, 144:24,

```
144:28, 145:12,
145:15, 153:15,
153:17
 clearly [9] - 29:18,
31:23, 37:29, 70:2,
76:27, 86:28, 105:4,
146:22, 147:27
 client [3] - 120:6,
147:28, 166:6
 close [3] - 67:27,
79:12, 160:19
 closer [1] - 118:19
 CMO [6] - 44:29,
45:5, 48:4, 48:15,
48:19, 57:10
 CMO's [1] - 43:11
 CO[2] - 2:13, 4:1
 code [1] - 33:5
 Code [1] - 113:19
 Colleen [1] - 44:5
 college [1] - 103:14
 column [9] - 66:8,
66:29, 67:2, 67:5,
161:25, 162:19,
162:22, 162:23,
162:24
 coming [2] - 65:18,
170:21
 commas [1] - 168:18
 commencing [1] -
172:13
 comment [3] - 47:25,
123:23, 161:23
 Commission [1] -
110:11
 Commissioner [73] -
6:29, 7:5, 13:25,
20:22, 20:23, 20:27,
27:24, 28:2, 29:11,
29:16, 29:23, 29:27,
48:29, 54:8, 55:11,
55:27, 63:7, 90:24,
91:1, 91:22, 92:3,
92:12, 93:4, 94:4,
96:14, 96:20, 97:1,
97:26, 102:11,
102:25, 103:19,
104:19, 105:1,
105:20, 105:29,
106:1, 106:5, 107:1,
107:4, 107:25,
107:26, 107:27,
108:28, 109:11,
127:10, 127:11,
130:29, 137:15,
154:6, 154:11, 155:7,
155:11, 155:12,
155:23, 156:8,
157:10, 157:19,
158:10, 159:4,
```

159:16, 159:20, 160:5, 160:11, 162:3, 162:12, 163:16, 164:7, 164:8, 164:12, 164:28, 164:29, 165:19, 165:28 commissioner [19] -20:25, 28:19, 29:15, 47:19, 48:28, 54:7, 55:11, 55:19, 63:7, 86:1, 86:7, 86:14, 86:19, 104:2, 159:16, 161:12, 161:15, 162:1, 162:4 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 commissioner's [1] -51:8 commissioners [1] -70:16 Committee [5] -97:27, 121:21, 140:28, 141:5, 149:9 committee [1] -30:17 common [1] - 24:7 communicate [1] -70:29 communicates [1] -156:29 communication [1] -157:10 communications [2] - 155:6, 155:10 community [3] -66:12, 67:17, 80:21 **COMPANY**[1] - 2:22 company [1] - 62:19 competition [7] -45:15, 45:23, 64:18, 101:9. 101:14. 106:15, 107:22 complain [1] - 52:3 complained [1] -46:12 complaining [7] -72:7, 72:10, 74:4, 145:27, 145:29, 146:2, 146:6 complaint [35] -19:29, 28:5, 65:14, 74:10, 75:5, 76:15, 85:15, 107:8, 109:1, 120:7, 120:23, 120:26, 139:3, 142:26, 142:27, 143:7, 145:9, 145:19, 145:20, 145:22,

145:23, 147:15, 149:1, 151:8, 153:13, 154:28, 156:2, 156:5, 156:11, 159:26, 161:14, 166:7, 168:26, 172:11, 172:19 complaints [14] -16:8, 27:21, 66:13, 67:18, 68:9, 115:25, 120:17, 128:17, 134:19, 143:1, 143:4, 154:14, 162:5, 163:3 complete [2] -107:19, 173:24 completed [3] -109:26, 110:10, 110:11 completely [9] -11:3, 39:5, 72:24, 121:10, 128:14, 134:7, 153:5, 159:4, 163:15 completeness [1] -115:8 complicated [2] -60:23, 60:24 computer [2] -77:25, 96:16 Comyn [2] - 65:1, 65:19 concentrate [1] -12:1 concerned [7] -10:28, 18:7, 40:6, 43:10, 44:18, 134:3, 152:20 concert [1] - 148:18 conciliation [2] -156:16, 156:22 conclusion [2] -105:7, 105:9 condition [1] - 68:15 conditions [1] -91:29 conduct [4] - 33:21, 105:2, 106:5, 122:6 conference [2] -31:5, 52:19 confidential" [1] -169:10 **confiding** [1] - 29:13 confined [1] - 52:4 confirm [5] - 9:11, 10:26, 107:18, 132:25, 177:2 confirmed [2] - 15:1, 165:11 confirming [1] -

131:6

confirms [1] - 105:17 conflict [1] - 56:8 confused [3] - 41:19, 128:19, 129:17 confusion [1] -158:19 Confusion [1] -98:16 conjecture [1] -35:29 conjunction [1] -147:7 CONLON [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT[1] -3:32 CONNELLAN[2] -3:30 3:30 CONOR [1] - 3:24 consequence [3] -151:25, 152:5, 153:11 consider [3] - 28:20, 146:13, 176:3 consideration [1] -53:2 considered [4] -80:25, 110:14, 140:1, 172.9 conspiracy [1] -53:21 conspiring [1] - 48:6 constituencies [1] -25.1 constitutional [1] -151:18 construct [1] -170:27 contact [4] - 29:4, 105:20. 140:7 contacted [1] - 64:23 contacts [2] - 29:6, 63:8 contained [2] -65:26, 94:23 containing [1] -52:28 contention [1] -106:4 contents [1] - 78:4 context [3] - 131:25, 131:26, 132:1 contextualise [1] -

174:12

32.24

176:14

continuation [1] -

CONTINUED [1] -

continuing [1] -

contrary [2] - 151:17,

control [5] - 71:17, 73:29, 74:21, 76:11, 153:9 controversy [1] -97.29 convenient [3] -61:22, 63:25, 150:10 conversation [25] -7:22, 9:8, 9:9, 9:12, 40:22, 43:14, 50:22, 51:4, 53:9, 61:16, 96:11, 96:13, 125:5, 125:10, 125:20, 125:22, 126:12, 126:24, 127:18, 127:22, 127:23, 128:3, 128:14, 129:21 conversations [1] -129:28 convicted [1] - 34:24 convicting [1] -37:19 convictions [1] -114.2 copied [1] - 170:1 COPPINGER [1] copy [13] - 14:6, 14:12. 15:18. 15:22. 52:28, 69:10, 132:21, 145:19, 145:22, 169:12, 169:14, 169:16, 169:17 copying [1] - 73:1 Corcoran [1] corner [2] - 12:18, 133:8 correct [31] - 10:26, 11:5, 18:25, 18:26, 27:25, 33:22, 46:13, 61:24, 71:27, 71:28, 71:29, 78:27, 80:2, 80:27, 82:1, 90:9, 90:12, 90:13, 95:27, 105:12, 112:11, 115:3, 115:5, 120:14. 125:24, 126:16, 129:1, 129:3, 130:15, 149:4, 157:5 correctly [1] - 157:4 correspondence [21] - 32:2, 73:1, 76:21, 77:3, 119:10, 121:23, 121:27, 121:28, 142:7, 142:9, 142:15, 154:7, 154:12, 154:16, 156:3, 156:6,

corruption [18] -30:25, 31:26, 31:27, 32:10, 34:24, 34:27, 35:1, 35:13, 35:20, 36:4, 36:6, 36:11, 37:3, 39:3, 39:4, 55:7, 75:1, 100:22 COSTELLO [1] -2:22 counsel [1] - 116:9 counsel's [1] - 117:9 counselling [1] -44:25 country [6] - 24:9, 29:5. 50:16. 56:22. 86:15, 149:4 course [21] - 6:25, 10:25, 14:10, 63:17, 66:20, 68:7, 70:15, 78:12, 84:3, 90:15, 96:13, 106:17, 116:7, 119:25, 143:11, 149:25, 151:3, 161:14, 161:18, 168:28, 175:7 COURT [3] - 1:13, 2:3, 3:31 cover [5] - 21:3, 21:12, 21:15, 55:23, 55:28 coverage [1] - 97:21 covered [2] - 19:28, 30.29 covers [3] - 115:19, 115:20, 130:13 craic [1] - 74:15 create [1] - 146:28 Create [1] - 154:15 **crime** [2] - 32:28, 75:1 crimes [2] - 30:9, 32:27 criminal [8] - 9:18, 33:1, 33:20, 34:15, 38:29, 114:3, 114:8, 114.16 criminality [3] -38:29, 39:3, 100:22 critical [1] - 37:14 criticised [1] -163:14 criticising [3] -155:23, 160:10, 161:5 criticism [4] - 66:12, 67:17, 117:13, 160:4 Croke [3] - 94:14, 94:25, 95:15 cropped [3] - 22:21,

24:21, 155:18

CROSS [2] - 5:5,

6:10 cross [4] - 10:29, 14:8, 78:16, 140:1 cross-examination [2] - 14:8, 140:1 cross-examined [1] -10:29**CROSS-EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, 6:10 cross-examining [1] - 78:16 **CUALÁIN**[1] - 3:7 Cualáin [30] - 19:28, 20:27, 21:7, 48:29, 52:28, 54:8, 55:11, 55:22, 55:27, 63:7, 102:11, 102:24, 102:25, 103:10, 103:19, 103:27, 104:19, 104:29, 105:1, 105:5, 105:20, 105:29, 106:6, 107:26, 107:27, 127:11, 133:19, 133:27, 134:9, 163:16 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 Cullen [13] - 119:19, 120:5, 120:12, 120:29, 121:8, 121:11, 121:13, 121:14, 129:3, 147:23, 163:17, 167:21, 174:2 Cullen's [1] - 138:9 cumulatively [1] -**CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 **CURRAN** [1] - 3:3 current [3] - 28:12, 28:29, 120:6 cut [1] - 146:20

# D

Daly [57] - 16:20, 16:25, 16:28, 17:5, 18:15, 19:28, 20:2, 20:12, 22:18, 24:1, 24:20, 27:4, 28:18, 28:24, 29:20, 30:7, 30:17, 31:4, 31:9, 32:8, 33:19, 34:6, 34:17, 37:5, 37:16, 38:17, 38:27, 39:19, 40:19, 42:13, 72:19, 72:21, 72:28, 73:19, 77:11, 81:29, 84:20, 99:20, 118:11, 118:16, 121:20, 121:29, 124:15,

168:3, 170:14, 173:18

158:18, 167:11,

124:28, 134:16, dealt [11] - 27:16, 158:27 11:18, 13:22 112:16, 112:20, 134:18, 142:1, 142:8, 35:10, 50:17, 100:25, deny [5] - 9:8, 9:11, detective [5] - 7:24, 112:28, 113:5, 142:15, 146:10, 106:11, 108:21, 49:2, 49:3, 149:23 7:26, 8:20, 9:24, 113:14, 113:21, 146:16, 146:19. 113:26, 114:8, 124:29, 147:15, denying [2] - 127:3, 15:16 147:9, 148:6, 149:7, 153:14, 153:19, 127.4 determined [2] -115:21, 119:25, 169:24 149:28 department [1] -116:3, 117:24 122:12, 153:21, Daly's [1] - 33:10 debate [4] - 23:2, developing [1] -172:14, 172:17 79:16 Disciplinary [1] damage [10] - 33:1, 69:22, 116:25, 175:7 deploy [2] - 22:16, 144:25 68:27 40:21, 125:13, debates [1] - 70:3 **DEVELOPMENT**[1] 170:13 125:16, 126:8, discipline [5] -**DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 deputies [10] - 17:5, - 3:16 126:19, 128:24, **December** [9] - 30:5, 22:18, 35:15, 36:17, development [3] -107:8, 111:10, 149:21, 152:12, 45:15, 45:24, 48:20, 37:5, 37:12, 40:19, 51:5, 64:22, 167:24 114:16, 114:17 152.25 48:22, 57:18, 93:6, 100:12, 147:29, diagnosis [1] - 58:4 **Discipline** [1] - 111:2 damaged [1] disciplined [2] -93:17, 95:19 149:28 diaries [5] - 43:24, 152:21 December/January 25:28, 25:29 Deputies [11] -130:16. 138:17. damaging [1] - 124:2 [1] - 92:3 24:19, 28:24, 31:4, 141:4, 158:15 disclose [1] - 172:17 dark [6] - 108:17, decide [3] - 110:15, 39:19, 42:13, 77:11, disclosure [3] -**DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 119:3, 119:12, 159:5, 117:8, 132:4 99:20, 124:27, diary [20] - 8:22, 140:5, 140:6, 161:12 159:18, 159:22 146:10, 146:16, 148:6 decided [1] - 154:13 Disclosures [2] -16:13, 17:7, 23:11, date [38] - 8:21, deputy [3] - 18:10, deciding [1] - 156:14 27:1. 58:8. 80:4. 80:7. 65:2. 65:4 14:24, 16:15, 16:16, 20:25, 81:25 DISCLOSURES [2] decipher [2] - 10:9, 83:14, 84:11, 128:7, 17:8, 17:9, 18:10, 11:27 **Deputy** [71] - 16:25, 128:9, 130:6, 130:7, 1:2, 1:3 19:17, 21:4, 26:22. decision [2] - 149:3, 16:28, 18:12, 18:15, 130:20, 130:21, disconcerting [1] -33:11, 46:15, 48:20, 19:8, 19:12, 19:16, 133:16, 139:21, 151:19 151:17 51:25, 54:14, 56:3, 19:28, 20:2, 20:12, 143:20, 157:24 discovered [3] decision-makers [1] 57:17, 66:22, 71:13, 22:9, 22:13, 22:16, difference [8] - 92:6, 32:4, 41:2, 41:20 - 149:3 72:1, 78:25, 99:18, **DECLAN**[1] - 3:5 22:17, 23:9, 23:23, 92:19, 92:21, 93:17, discovering [1] -101:21, 107:11, 23:25, 24:1, 24:15, 93:21, 112:16, declassified [3] -42:16 107:13, 107:14, 26:21, 26:23, 27:4, 129:11, 156:27 discrepancies [2] -32:1, 32:4, 32:6 108:3, 108:5, 111:15, 30:16, 31:9, 32:8, different [17] - 22:1, 93:28. 94:2 declassifying [1] -130:9, 138:1, 139:21, 33:10, 33:19, 34:5, 24:9, 37:18, 42:5, discuss [4] - 23:7, 35:7 34:17, 36:15, 38:16, 148:28, 157:11, decline [1] - 151:20 42:6, 56:14, 71:24, 65:17, 100:12, 100:20 160:6, 162:5, 165:17, 38:17, 38:26, 38:27, 75:28, 88:6, 99:22, discussed [5] declined [1] - 87:14 167:5 48:29, 54:7, 55:11, 122:14, 125:28, 27:10, 53:11, 68:21, decorated [1] - 161:5 **Dave** [1] - 138:23 72:21, 72:28, 72:29, 128:14, 129:2, 129:4, 103:14, 104:6 deemed [1] - 101:16 **DAVID** [2] - 2:28, 73:19, 81:23, 81:29, 134:7, 158:21 discussing [3] defence [2] - 57:5, 3:18 82:2, 88:16, 95:29, difficulty [2] - 11:1, 105:5, 105:21, 105:25 65:17 David [1] - 138:26 96:25, 97:12, 97:18, 14:14 discussion [6] defend [5] - 36:21, **DAVIS**[1] - 2:8 97:25, 99:12, 102:24, **DIGNAM**[1] - 3:24 39:14, 57:20, 62:8, 36:23, 36:26, 37:20, 103:18, 105:1, **DAY** [1] - 1:18 diminish [1] - 46:26 106:24, 117:5, 117:12 174:23 105:19, 105:29, day's [1] - 84:25 direct [4] - 32:26, disposed [1] defending [1] - 56:29 121:20, 121:29, days [13] - 22:1, 105:20, 155:6, 155:10 115:26 defer [1] - 15:24 124:15, 127:10, 27:10, 27:16, 48:23, definitely [8] - 17:1, direction [1] - 117:17 disposition [2] -136:10, 142:1, 142:8, 53:9, 56:11, 58:12, directly [2] - 121:10, 40:29, 104:20 54:28, 77:6, 83:16, 142:15, 146:19, 68:21, 81:14, 108:21, 149:3 dispute [7] - 38:25, 126:11, 126:13, 147:9, 149:6 160:26, 161:28, **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 45:7, 48:11, 61:12, 129:7, 171:17 described [1] - 100:9 162:13 DIRECTORATE[1] -82:15, 152:9, 176:18 degree [2] - 66:11, desk [1] - 52:4 deadline [1] - 138:7 3:15 disputed [1] - 34:2 67:16 **DESMOND** [1] - 4:3 deal [8] - 14:15, dirty [1] - 93:2 disputing [2] - 47:14, delay [11] - 53:14, 14:17, 15:25, 16:7, despite [1] - 68:14 disagree [6] - 55:29, 54:25 65:10, 72:10, 107:20, destroy [2] - 57:3, 80:18, 99:23, 176:21 57:9, 86:17, 115:7, disrespect [1] -108:12, 109:4, 109:6, dealing [10] - 8:18, 149:16 116:17 120:12, 120:13, detail [1] - 161:21 9:18, 36:11, 59:27, disappointed [4] dissatisfaction [2] -121:8, 172:13 75:21, 100:18, details [6] - 96:28, 41:2, 41:12, 42:16, 47:9. 66:24 delayed [1] - 166:27 110:29, 111:26, 117:20, 137:5, 42:29 deliberate [3] disseminate [1] -114:17, 144:11, 168:3 156:15, 160:8 30:10, 31:23, 69:17 disaster [1] - 16:2 149:1 dealings [3] - 87:26, **DETECTIVE** [5] - 3:4, disciplinary [21] distinction [1] deliberately [3] -99:20 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17 34:14, 69:13, 69:15 60:10, 110:29, 111:1, deals [2] - 114:1, **Detective** [6] - 7:17, 111:29, 112:6, district [1] - 30:9 delicate [1] - 80:28 168:2 9:7, 10:25, 11:7, 112:10, 112:13, diversion[1] delivering[1] -

176:25 67:12, 73:15, 73:21, 31:6, 31:11, 31:17, EMMA [1] - 3:26 essay [1] - 132:1 **DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 75:23, 75:24, 75:27, 33:10, 33:21, 34:18, encouraging [1] essence [1] - 83:12 division [7] - 28:6, 75:29, 77:15, 79:22, 35:24, 36:2, 36:17, 146:25 essential [1] -79:25, 85:3, 92:2, 40:20, 50:8, 50:12, 28:12, 28:13, 28:29, **end** [18] - 30:5, 126:16 29:1, 42:6, 44:6 92:7, 93:3, 93:20, 51:9, 53:18, 72:29, 50:18, 55:10, 55:18, essentially [1] -93:23, 95:2, 96:7, 74:29, 96:1, 96:3, **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:3 56:4, 57:6, 59:17, 117.24 96:14, 96:16, 96:19, 97:14, 97:18, 97:22, 63:17, 67:13, 70:12, doctor [1] - 52:22 establish [1] - 42:4 99:21, 102:18, 97:27, 121:20, 122:4, doctor's [1] - 68:14 74:6, 75:25, 76:6, ESTABLISHED[1] -122:16, 122:24, 141:4, 141:20, 96:15, 116:25, 117:7, document [24] -122:25, 123:7, 146:12, 148:1, 149:2 128:23, 143:15 7:28, 9:13, 9:16, 9:19, established [3] -123:19, 123:24, Enda [5] - 18:23, 9:26, 10:29, 23:7, 42:19, 139:7, 145:16 123:28, 123:29, 39:27, 40:10, 46:14, Ε 19:3, 19:4, 19:5, estimate [1] - 152:25 124:3, 124:9, 128:25, 50:25, 57:23, 91:10, 19:15 ethics [1] - 33:5 129:23, 136:1, 136:9, 103:6, 107:14, endeavour [1] - 14:6 Eugene [1] - 103:29 e-mail [3] - 151:13, 138:8, 146:19 107:15, 109:24, ending [1] - 122:26 evaluate [1] - 24:21 154:5, 154:10 **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, 154:15, 155:28, ends [1] - 73:24 event [6] - 21:22, e-mails [1] - 156:29 3:20 164:6, 164:11, 165:8, enemy [2] - 42:17, 21:23, 110:12, **EAMON** [1] - 3:10 Doyle [1] - 16:20 169:6, 174:12 44:18 130:26, 177:3, 177:6 early [4] - 25:25, DR [1] - 3:11 documentation [3] engage [1] - 49:6 events [2] - 25:9, 126:6, 127:9, 130:23 draw [5] - 14:28, 109:22, 114:22, **engaged** [3] - 14:5, 124:17 ease [2] - 39:26, 32:16, 66:6, 110:22, 158:26 49:10. 51:4 evidence [34] - 22:5, 96:24 169.8 documented [1] engaging [2] - 76:20, 32:26. 32:29. 34:8. Eastern [2] - 154:6, drawing [2] - 92:19, 59:7 90:18 34:13, 35:13, 35:20, 159:17 105:8 documents [22] enhanced [2] -35:22, 35:25, 35:26, easy [1] - 10:12 7:15, 12:9, 57:20, drink [2] - 58:6, 90:6 14:11, 14:12 38:10, 38:12, 56:24, effect [4] - 73:16, 77:1, 81:22, 85:17, drinking [8] - 53:27, enlisting [1] - 74:3 57:10, 63:18, 75:14, 96:28, 151:3, 151:7 54:21, 58:7, 58:10, 85:18, 85:23, 93:27, enquire [1] - 97:28 81:7, 82:20, 92:9, effectively [16] -60:15, 62:16, 90:4, 93:29. 104:15. enquiry [1] - 82:7 92:10, 92:14, 92:18, 35:16, 39:13, 45:28, 105:14, 105:16, ensure [3] - 31:24, 102:8, 103:1, 106:4, 57:6, 60:14, 70:28, 105:17, 106:4, 108:6, drive [1] - 95:10 128:19, 144:2, 61:10, 118:6 72:28, 74:4, 76:19, 132:8, 155:21, driven [1] - 57:6 150:20, 150:27, **ensured** [1] - 146:10 101:3, 120:11, 156:12, 168:18, driving [1] - 26:7 160:3, 160:8, 164:1, ensuring [1] - 53:2 128:16, 144:26, 169:1, 173:4 dropped [2] - 129:9, entirely [3] - 70:2, 168:28, 173:2 146:24, 147:5, 151:5 dog [1] - 17:17 129:15 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 108:2, 122:29 effort [5] - 40:20, domain [1] - 151:28 drunk [6] - 53:27, exactly [10] - 8:7, entirety [1] - 23:3 70:29, 118:5, 144:29, domestic [1] - 77:16 54:21, 54:24, 94:14, 19:6, 23:11, 26:6, entitled [13] - 36:21, 149:21 94:26, 95:15 don't.. [1] - 169:15 43:24, 115:29, 132:7, 36:22, 36:23, 36:26, efforts [3] - 144:23, **Dublin** [3] - 24:29, **DONAL** [2] - 3:7, 155:26, 174:24, 37:22. 37:23. 71:3. 144:27, 145:12 3:24 89:25, 100:8 175:19 71:4, 109:24, 147:12, **EGAN**[1] - 3:25 Donal [7] - 20:27, **DUBLIN** [6] - 1:17, exaggeration [1] -157:7, 174:25, 176:8 eight [1] - 32:27 55:22, 103:10, 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, 9:20 entitlement [2] either [7] - 14:10. 103:27, 133:19, 4:6 56:12, 174:6 examination [3] -15:12, 48:24, 81:29, 133:27, 134:9 **due** [10] - 10:25, entry [7] - 17:24, 14:8, 140:1, 174:14 82:2, 82:18, 129:26 done [14] - 15:9, 14:10, 52:5, 58:9, 27:10, 134:6, 136:10, examined [2] elaborate [1] - 73:12 69:11, 106:26, 116:7, 15:13, 17:17, 46:25, 10:29. 62:28 138:21, 139:22, elephant [1] - 122:11 72:24, 75:12, 77:19, 143:11, 145:29, 175:7 **EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, 157:29 ELIZABETH [1] -83:23, 90:14, 140:10, During [1] - 161:28 Environment [1] -146:7, 149:25, during [6] - 64:25, examining [2] -154:16 em [3] - 71:2, 118:8, 149:26, 153:8 64:27, 97:26, 123:11, 78:16, 174:20 **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 142:11 153:17, 158:11 door [1] - 49:18 episode [2] - 59:25, example [11] - 21:21, **em..** [1] - 167:13 doubt [9] - 38:7, duties [1] - 52:5 24:28, 33:1, 46:23, 130:18 emanate [2] - 51:22, 74:24, 85:10, 94:7, **duty** [1] - 26:12 77:11, 82:5, 140:14, **EQUALITY** [1] - 1:8 100.22 102:7, 102:9, 121:9, **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 151:2, 157:25, Equality [1] - 46:11 emanated [4] -149.11 Dáil [50] - 19:19, 161:25, 175:13 equally [2] - 74:10, 31:28, 31:29, 42:5, down [57] - 9:15, 22:11, 22:16, 22:21, examples [2] - 34:5, 152:22 171:18 10:8, 22:27, 32:27, 22:25, 23:1, 23:19, erred [1] - 69:3 emanates [1] -48:28, 52:15, 54:7, 23:22, 23:24, 24:18, except [4] - 70:4, error[1] - 143:27 167:10 54:16, 55:9, 55:12, 24:23, 25:7, 25:11, 102:29, 176:9, 176:11 errors [2] - 10:26, embezzlement [1] -55:14, 56:4, 56:25, 30:1, 30:8, 30:13, exchanges [1] -10:27 139:26 57:3, 59:6, 59:8, 30:16, 30:20, 30:29, 161:28 escalating [1] - 60:5

EXECUTIVE [1] -3:13 exemplary [1] -67:10 exercise [2] - 163:4, 176:3 **exhausted** [1] - 65:5 exhibited [1] - 91:11 **existence** [1] - 66:23 expectation [3] -30:13, 33:19, 34:17 expecting [2] -24:27, 170:25 expires [1] - 107:22 explain [6] - 20:6, 41:17, 105:13, 131:11, 132:6, 174:18 explained [5] - 7:20, 9:11, 13:6, 13:24, 89:24 explanation [3] -9:23, 109:10, 151:6 explore [2] - 26:19, 174:25 explored [1] - 13:28 **exploring** [3] - 83:11, 174:1, 174:20 exposing [2] - 30:24, expressed [4] - 47:9, 48:4, 48:15, 56:1 extensive[1] -170:18 extinguished [1] -95:24 extra [1] - 26:17 extract [1] - 98:5 extremely [6] -10:24, 60:23, 82:21, 82:24, 151:17, 152:7 eye [1] - 21:6 eyes [1] - 121:25

#### F

facilitate [2] 168:27, 172:20
fact [27] - 21:19,
27:9, 35:6, 41:2, 47:9,
52:4, 61:21, 69:11,
85:6, 93:25, 95:14,
95:26, 97:12, 100:26,
101:21, 108:20,
115:9, 124:15, 135:5,
144:4, 146:7, 150:18,
152:4, 153:5, 156:2,
169:24, 176:14
fact.. [1] - 32:20

facts [1] - 116:26

factual [1] - 176:29 failed [1] - 96:20 fair [18] - 42:18, 54:13, 56:12, 69:20, 73:22, 76:17, 76:20, 100:11, 118:23, 131:20, 147:11, 147:12, 147:14, 147:17, 148:7, 174:15, 176:3, 176:16 fairly [5] - 14:5, 56:13, 102:7, 135:20, 135:22 fairness [2] - 40:28, 108:29 faith [1] - 172:18

108:29 faith [1] - 172:18 falls [1] - 93:16 false [7] - 35:3, 35:19, 40:27, 42:19, 43:5, 108:2 falsehoods [1] -92:24

**falsely** [2] - 34:16, 34:20 **familiar** [2] - 78:8, 110:26

familiarise [2] -27:27, 78:10 family [1] - 152:13 FANNING [1] - 2:21 Fanning [26] - 27:25,

Fanning [26] - 27:25, 28:3, 29:10, 29:11, 29:14, 29:17, 29:24, 29:28, 109:11, 154:6, 154:11, 155:7, 155:11, 155:12, 155:23, 156:8, 157:11, 158:10, 159:4, 159:16,

159:21, 160:11, 161:29, 162:12, 164:7, 164:29

Fanning's [3] 157:19, 160:5, 162:3
far [5] - 90:1, 128:3,
147:21, 160:4, 175:19
FARRELL [1] - 4:2
Farrell [2] - 63:3,
96:10

96:10 **fashion** [2] - 30:10, 151:22

favour[1] - 69:27 favoured [1] - 172:12 fear [1] - 124:11 feature [1] - 165:18 February [7] - 19:14, 19:22, 96:8, 96:10, 97:8, 97:15, 97:22

**FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:5,

feeding [1] - 146:24
Feehily [3] - 121:22,
141:5, 142:2
felt [4] - 26:22,
43:11, 61:23, 117:17
FERGAL [1] - 2:27
Fergal [1] - 17:12
FERRY [1] - 2:16
few [11] - 15:27,
21:11, 27:10, 28:15,
48:23, 56:11, 81:14,
130:5, 141:3, 153:3,
169:23
FF [1] - 137:19

FG [1] - 17:11 Fianna [1] - 137:22 fiddling [1] - 30:15 fight [2] - 56:21, 56:23 figures [4] - 30:16, 32:24, 32:29, 75:1

**file** [9] - 52:27, 53:13, 53:15, 53:20, 53:21, 57:18, 65:9, 104:6, 160:5

files [2] - 9:29, 57:24 filled [4] - 113:25, 115:11, 144:8, 154:16 filling [1] - 105:26 final [1] - 101:8 finally [4] - 137:10, 138:16, 148:27, 176:26

financially [1] - 53:4 findings [1] - 52:29 fine [5] - 21:25, 61:13, 88:26, 122:10,

159:10 finish [1] - 175:3 finished [1] - 67:29

Finn [10] - 106:1, 107:1, 107:25, 108:28, 109:9, 160:9, 164:8, 164:12, 164:29, 165:28

FINN [1] - 3:5 Finn's [2] - 107:4, 165:19

**Fintan** [3] - 27:24, 28:2, 154:6

FINTAN [1] - 2:21 firm [1] - 86:16 first [51] - 7:7, 8:2, 10:15, 11:3, 16:12, 16:24, 16:27, 17:4, 19:3, 22:5, 22:7, 22:28, 27:13, 27:26, 28:25, 33:23, 33:24, 40:26, 43:3, 46:5.

40:26, 43:3, 46:5, 46:15, 46:28, 51:26,

firstly [2] - 88:18 fit [3] - 13:16, 13:17, 85:12 fit" [1] - 13:12

**Fitzgerald** [7] - 46:19, 46:21, 74:22, 74:23, 77:26, 85:23, 85:26

**FITZWILLIAM** [1] **-** 4:5

Five [1] - 97:17 five [6] - 16:3, 53:16, 53:19, 65:10, 158:16 Flanagan [4] - 17:3, 18:12, 22:25, 82:2 flight [1] - 56:21 flow [1] - 63:29

flowing [1] - 153:11 flu [5] - 52:11, 52:20, 57:24, 68:13, 69:13 FLYNN [1] - 3:19 focus [6] - 52:1, 55:8, 100:15, 100:17,

111:24, 113:12 **follow** [5] - 42:24, 50:20, 116:23, 124:12, 128:21

**followed** [2] - 146:1, 160:19

following [10] - 1:25, 6:26, 32:13, 46:14, 99:4, 99:7, 120:1, 120:16, 145:25, 166:1 FOLLOWING [1] -

1:4 **FOLLOWS** [5] - 6:1, 6:11, 64:11, 109:18, 150:15

FOR [10] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 3:30, 4:1, 109:17 for" [1] - 138:8 for.. [1] - 23:12 force [5] - 24:3, 29:12, 120:24, 163:2,

167:22 **force's** [5] - 161:5, 162:14, 162:15,

162:28, 162:29 forces [1] - 88:2 Forces [1] - 130:22 forget [6] - 9:6, 50:28, 70:10, 99:26, 126:4, 142:28 forgetting [2] -45:10, 150:11 forgot [1] - 53:12 form [16] - 11:19, 107:4, 109:26, 110:10, 112:11, 114:24, 115:1, 115:4, 115:7, 115:10, 116:14, 116:29, 117:4 formal [5] - 7:16, 28:5, 121:2, 154:13, 156:18 formally [3] - 7:11, 7:13, 76:10 format [1] - 110:24 **FORMER** [2] - 1:13, 2:3

former [3] - 96:19, 102:11, 104:19 forming [1] - 57:2 forms [8] - 105:27, 106:29, 110:16,

106:29, 110:16, 113:24, 145:16, 153:16, 153:17, 153:18 forum [1] - 30:28

forward [20] - 17:6, 18:17, 39:6, 52:25, 65:25, 70:7, 77:21, 97:15, 97:24, 104:20, 117:4, 124:24, 144:19, 144:26, 153:29, 160:15, 172:25, 173:1, 173:11, 173:23 foul [1] - 176:17

foundation [2] -32:10, 151:20 four [2] - 21:5, 53:9 fourth [1] - 66:29

framed [1] - 174:8 Francesca [2] - 65:1, 65:19

FREEMAN[1] - 2:22

fraud [1] - 139:26

freer [1] - 55:28 front [1] - 130:13 fruitless [1] - 102:5 frustrate [1] - 124:3 full [9] - 35:13, 91:25, 93:7, 108:21, 112:15, 112:20, 115:4, 153:6, 157:2

fully [8] - 112:18,

117:16, 127:28, 128:1, 128:2, 128:21, 128:26, 176:8 fundamentally [1] -121:10 furnish [1] - 169:13 furnished [1] -121:28 future [3] - 55:17, 173:16 **Fáil** [1] - 137:22

#### G

gain [1] - 69:28 Garda [271] - 6:4, 6:8, 6:24, 8:2, 9:18, 9:20, 10:16, 11:5, 12:23, 14:2, 16:8, 16:21, 19:4, 22:3, 22:23, 23:13, 23:29, 24:8, 24:13, 27:1, 27:20, 28:5, 28:12, 28:28, 29:4, 29:25, 30:21, 31:2, 31:5, 33:3, 33:26, 35:9, 35:12, 35:28, 37:23, 38:5, 38:11, 38:16, 39:14, 39:16, 40:12, 40:15, 40:16, 40:22, 41:14, 41:16, 42:6, 42:20, 42:28, 43:2, 43:9, 43:14, 43:17, 43:18, 43:25, 43:28, 44:2, 44:10, 44:17, 44:18, 44:22, 44:24, 44:26, 47:5, 47:7, 47:8, 47:15, 47:16, 47:27, 47:28, 48:2, 48:3, 48:9, 48:26, 48:27, 49:1, 49:5, 49:6, 49:10, 49:23, 50:14, 52:19, 52:21, 52:27, 53:10, 53:13, 53:15, 53:24, 55:2, 55:8, 56:10, 56:28, 57:27, 58:27, 59:21, 60:4, 60:10, 60:25, 64:14, 65:29, 68:7, 68:27, 69:9, 70:15, 70:21, 73:11, 73:13, 73:26, 74:8, 74:24, 74:26, 75:3, 75:21, 75:22, 76:5, 76:8, 77:3, 78:6, 78:18, 79:13, 80:18, 80:20, 81:7, 81:27, 82:5, 83:18, 85:6, 85:10, 85:25, 86:1, 86:17, 87:7, 87:10, 87:20,

88:25, 89:2, 90:23, 91:22, 91:29, 92:1, 92:12, 93:16, 94:4, 94:15, 94:27, 94:28, 95:7, 95:13, 97:26, 101:29, 102:1, 102:5, 102:10, 102:12, 102:16, 106:10, 108:1, 108:20, 109:20, 109:27, 111:1, 111:21, 112:15, 113:19, 113:23, 115:6, 115:22, 116:4, 116:11, 117:13, 117:21, 118:13, 118:23, 118:29, 119:3, 119:11, 120:5, 121:2, 121:24, 122:22, 124:25, 125:6, 125:8, 125:9, 125:20, 125:22, 125:26, 126:3, 126:5, 126:11. 127:7. 127:9. 127:24, 127:25, 128:13, 128:28, 129:22, 129:29, 130:5, 130:11, 133:12, 140:15, 143:17, 145:10, 145:24, 146:9, 146:22. 147:4. 147:20, 149:13, 149:16, 149:26, 150:18, 151:27, 151:29, 152:1, 152:14, 152:23, 152:26, 152:28, 153:14, 153:19, 154:12, 154:26, 154:29, 157:1, 159:27, 160:18, 160:24, 160:25, 161:4, 161:17, 161:20, 163:3, 163:14, 165:7, 166:4, 166:14, 166:15, 167:14, 170:13, 171:1, 171:20, 171:25, 172:12, 172:13, 172:19, 173:6, 173:8, 173:17, 173:27, 174:2, 174:5, 174:21, 174:22, 175:8, 175:18, 175:28, 176:5, 176:10, 176:22,

176:25

55:29

garda [2] - 34:12,

88:1, 88:5, 88:14, GARDA [11] - 2:10, 2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2, 3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21, 5:3, 6:10 Garda" [1] - 19:29 gardaí [1] - 29:6 Gardaí [1] - 117:3 general [6] - 55:16, 56:26, 59:14, 62:24, 121:14. 134:21 GERAGHTY [1] -Gerard [3] - 120:5, 163:17, 167:21 GERARD [1] - 2:11 **GERRY** [1] - 3:11 gist [2] - 71:28, 71.29 given [22] - 12:29, 38:26, 52:27, 52:29, 56:12, 69:9, 74:28, 81:7, 82:20, 109:10, 128:20, 143:13, 151:5, 153:6, 156:8, 158:25, 159:8, 159:9, 163:25, 164:26, 167:29, 169:16 Glacken [2] - 20:28, 47:18 glad [2] - 62:16,

62:19 **GLEESON** [1] - 4:4 **GOODE** [1] - 3:22 Government [2] -79:16. 95:24 **GRALTON**[1] - 3:14 great [3] - 15:22, 80:24, 176:23 Green [1] - 102:10 Greene [62] - 17:12, 39:14, 39:16, 40:16, 40:23, 41:16, 42:28, 43:2, 43:10, 43:14, 43:17, 43:18, 43:25, 43:28, 44:2, 44:10, 44:17, 44:19, 44:22, 44:24, 44:26, 47:6, 47:7, 47:8, 47:15, 47:27, 47:28, 48:3, 48:9, 48:10, 48:27, 49:1, 49:5, 49:10, 53:10, 87:10, 87:20, 88:1, 88:5, 88:14, 88:25, 89:2, 101:29, 102:5, 102:12, 102:16, 125:6, 125:8, 125:20, 125:23, 125:26, 126:5, 126:6, 126:11, 127:9,

128:28, 129:22, 129:29 **GREENE** [1] - 2:27 **GRIFFIN** [1] - 3:26 ground [2] - 29:26, 56:22 group [1] - 89:22 growing [1] - 55:6 GSOC [16] - 52:27, 53:14, 53:20, 60:9, 62:28, 65:8, 65:9, 72:18, 73:4, 73:17, 94:14, 94:26, 95:15, 110:11 **GSOC"** [1] - 132:9 guard [3] - 22:28, 65:2, 166:28 guard. [1] - 67:10 Guards [12] - 36:13, 53:15, 55:6, 65:9, 135:10, 135:17, 135:18, 142:28, 148:19, 149:12, 159:10 guards [6] - 24:2, 24:14, 37:27, 53:19, 65:8, 135:18 guess [2] - 129:26, 133.9 guilty [4] - 36:4, 36:6, 36:18, 38:8 Guinan [1] - 47:10 **GWEN** [1] - 1:29 Gwen [1] - 1:24 Н

had" [1] - 67:7 half [2] - 43:6, 89:18 HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 hall [1] - 169:9 Hall [1] - 171:23 hallinan [2] - 150:21, 150:27 hand [17] - 10:16, 12:11, 12:17, 13:4, 46:18, 71:13, 72:16, 77:16, 134:20, 143:10, 147:3, 162:8, 162:19, 162:22, 162:23, 163:28, 171:7 handed [3] - 53:13, 53:20. 62:5 handled [1] - 119:14 hands [3] - 74:20, 139:12, 146:23 handwriting [5] -18:21, 27:24, 77:23, 86:4, 131:5

14:7, 14:11, 19:16, 19:18 **hang** [1] **-** 95:8 happy [6] - 12:6, 27:5, 38:21, 40:9, 64:3, 103:15 **HARAN**[1] - 4:2 Haran [2] - 96:8, 96:21 harassed [1] - 96:5 harassing [2] - 30:8, 97:5 harassment [41] -60:11, 70:18, 71:7, 71:8. 71:10. 71:12. 71:19, 71:22, 72:2, 72:3, 73:24, 74:1, 74:17, 74:18, 80:11, 80:15, 107:3, 108:4, 108:22, 108:26, 112:10, 112:14, 112:17, 113:3, 113:18, 113:21, 114:27, 115:2, 116:20, 119:24, 124:18, 124:22, 129:9, 139:2, 139:3, 145:8, 153:22, 155:21, 158:19, 167:24, 168:25 hard [2] - 82:29, 83:4 haste [1] - 80:24 he/she [1] - 172:17 **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 head [6] - 10:21, 89:16, 139:12, 162:14, 162:28, 166:14 headed [1] - 114:6 heading [9] - 98:20, 98:26, 98:27, 99:1, 110:23, 111:29, 112:6, 113:28, 169:9 headline [4] - 65:27, 98:6, 98:14, 119:1 Headquarters [2] -140:15, 161:20 headquarters [3] -52:19, 119:12, 160:25 heads [1] - 24:21 health [1] - 132:12 heard [12] - 14:26, 42:3, 46:5, 51:23, 78:4, 81:12, 82:28, 89:27, 97:17, 135:2, 135:20, 140:4 **HEARING** [5] - 6:1, 64:10, 109:17,

150:14, 177:12

handwritten [4] -

127:24, 127:25,

81:11, 81:16, 82:8, hearing [1] - 24:7 128:19 included [1] - 111:26 instead [1] - 127:11 HELD<sub>[1]</sub> - 1:17 HUGHES [2] - 2:29, including [4] - 114:3, 82:25, 82:26, 83:6, instigate [1] - 153:8 83:16, 83:29, 86:7, held [2] - 52:18, 2:30 115:24, 122:24, instinct [1] - 56:19 86:11, 102:3, 107:18, human [6] - 33:5, 162:12 172:14 instincts [1] - 56:20 inclusion [1] - 116:6 56:21, 162:14, 107:21, 114:22, Helen [1] - 171:23 instruct [1] - 118:19 162:28, 163:1, 166:14 118:6, 119:19, help [21] - 7:4, 18:20, incorporate [1] -INSTRUCTED[7] -HUMAN [1] - 3:15 135:25, 135:29, 20:17, 26:28, 67:3, 113:2 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 140:15, 140:17, 77:11, 78:1, 89:17, hypothesis [1] incorporated [1] -3:26, 3:30, 4:5 146:24, 148:24, 95:13, 118:23, 173:24 72:14 instructed [3] -153:6, 160:28, 122:18, 130:6, 131:6, incorrect [3] - 39:6, 121:11, 121:12, 134:26, 134:27, 161:19, 163:11, 142:19 71:26. 153:5 163:19, 164:2, 136:12, 136:25, incredible [8] - 7:28, instructions [3] -167:28, 172:17 139:14, 139:17, 21:7, 73:7, 81:9, 85:7, 6:19, 113:1, 145:26 idea [5] - 120:6, informed [13] - 7:15, 157:28, 167:14 85:13, 159:15, 161:10 INSTRUMENT[1] -121:3, 132:22, 47:7, 47:15, 48:8, helped [1] - 90:17 indeed [1] - 22:21 135:11, 166:6 64:24, 87:11, 92:2, helpful [4] - 10:23, independent [2] intelligence [1] **identified** [2] - 15:12, 95:21, 101:7, 101:12, 10:24, 15:4, 128:8 28:17, 106:13 135.22 53:5 121:10, 145:8, 153:16 Hercules [1] - 17:16 Independent [6] intended [1] - 73:14 identify [5] - 11:28, informing [2] heroin [5] - 53:22, 29:20, 160:23, intending [1] - 74:5 33:9, 136:25, 137:17, 74:23, 74:24 160:29, 161:21, 55:24, 97:3, 122:12, intense [2] - 160:25, 149:13 initiation [2] -161:15 163:19, 164:3 161:28 ignore [2] - 70:3, 165:10, 165:26 high [3] - 47:18, independently [2] intention [11] -154.12 injuries [1] - 91:13 79:13, 135:26 34:11, 147:22 23:20, 24:17, 54:15, ignored [1] - 106:12 innocence [2] higher [1] - 81:27 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 56:15, 57:2, 122:23, image [1] - 21:4 36:19, 36:29 indicate [4] - 49:5, highlight [3] -123:17, 123:27, imagine [5] - 18:11, input [1] - 149:8 124:15, 149:11, 151:8 80:29, 107:7, 157:9 123:28, 123:29, 162:4 21:11, 41:5, 41:9, **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:2, highlighting [1] indicated [4] - 7:23, interaction [3] -175:29 124:14 73:14, 102:10, 154:8 22:10, 154:8, 165:9 immediately [1] inquiry [2] - 108:26, highly [2] - 44:22, indicates [4] - 41:11, interactions [1] -79:25 109:9 83.5 96:28, 111:25, 160:21 170:10 imminent [1] inserted [2] - 112:19, himself [7] - 17:16, indicating [5] - 51:7, interchange [1] -175:10 36:21, 37:20, 44:26, 56:15, 91:9, 94:13, 113:26 163:8 impact [1] - 148:29 inside [1] - 79:27 102:18, 174:3, 174:23 94:25 interested [1] impede [1] - 63:28 insinuation [1] history [1] - 161:17 indication [1] -156:17 implement [1] -169:4 hold [12] - 8:6, 12:10, 117:16 interesting [2] -73:29 insofar [2] - 71:7, 31:5, 41:18, 47:26, individuals [2] -30:24, 48:12 implication [3] -121:27 73:9, 82:16, 82:29, 21:5, 99:28 interfere [1] - 75:15 11:8, 11:10, 43:17 INSPECTOR [7] -103:25, 107:13, inescapable [1] -Intergalactic [1] **implying** [5] - 82:12, 3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 141:14, 147:3 149:18 130:13 83:3, 83:18, 92:14, 3:18, 3:22, 4:2 home [6] - 21:2, infer [2] - 38:20, intermittently [1] -168:20 Inspector [40] - 7:17, 53:26, 59:13, 60:14, 38:21 important [15] - 13:1, 8:20, 9:7, 10:25, 11:7, 62:1, 93:1 inferences [2] -Internal [1] - 65:29 26:25, 80:19, 80:20, 11:18, 13:23, 53:25, honest [1] - 152:29 84:24, 175:7 internal [1] - 104:20 80:22, 82:22, 82:26, 54:5, 54:6, 54:18, honesty [1] - 176:23 influence [5] - 63:19, internally [2] - 55:5, 83:5, 83:9, 83:10, 58:19, 58:21, 59:2, hope [5] - 30:12, 132:19, 144:23, 104:24 83:11, 84:24, 106:3 59:4, 59:12, 59:15, 33:19, 34:17, 35:15, 144:28, 145:12 International [1] impression[1] -59:18, 60:26, 62:15, inform [6] - 25:4, 77.7 71:21 63:3, 89:7, 91:18, hopeful [1] - 25:6 85:29, 86:24, 114:26, **interposed** [1] - 16:1 imputed [2] - 129:2, 91:28, 93:1, 93:14, hopeless [1] - 14:6 153:12, 154:28 interpretation [5] -129:13 93:15, 94:3, 96:9, hoping [1] - 116:7 information [60] -116:2, 116:9, 116:10, imputing [1] - 168:20 102:1, 157:15, HORAN [1] - 3:25 19:9, 19:10, 19:11, 116:22, 116:29 IN [1] - 1:17 157:17, 157:18, **HOUSE** [2] - 2:23, 20:2, 20:3, 20:8, interpreted [1] inadequate [1] -158:3, 159:1, 159:3, 20:11, 22:15, 22:17, 3:27 127:26 163:15 159:23, 162:7, 163:25 23:22, 24:16, 25:2, house [7] - 47:11, interprets [1] incident [3] - 24:11, inspector [10] - 7:24, 30:12, 30:14, 31:15, 54:19, 61:22, 62:11, 127:27 32:1, 32:4 7:26, 8:24, 9:1, 9:24, 31:19, 33:18, 34:2, 93:2, 95:11, 158:5 interrelated [1] incidents [2] - 32:5, 15:1, 15:16, 33:3, 34:16, 35:15, 37:4, House [2] - 20:28, 100:21 32:6 92:10, 157:18 37:13, 50:12, 74:28, interrupt [1] - 22:29 include [2] - 111:8, inspectorate [1] -79:7, 79:15, 79:20, HR [1] - 139:12 intervening [1] -114:14 33:27 79:28, 80:28, 81:10, huge [2] - 26:14,

intervention [2] -166:14, 176:3 interview [8] - 46:7, 64:26, 64:29, 65:19, 66:20, 101:8, 122:4, interviewed [1] -101:6 interviews [1] -146:27 **INTO**[1] - 1:2 introduced [1] -62:22 introduction [1] -17:2 inverted [1] - 168:18 investigate [3] -108:7, 162:5, 165:19 investigated [13] -36:14, 70:19, 71:8, 71:10, 71:22, 71:23, 71:25, 72:2, 74:14, 74:15, 76:17, 87:5 investigating [2] -21:7, 107:2 investigation [40] -7:2, 7:10, 7:12, 7:14, 7:19, 8:26, 28:7, 29:9, 36:15, 55:23, 60:9, 60:10, 60:11, 72:5, 72:8, 72:10, 75:10, 75:18, 75:19, 76:15, 105:3, 107:8, 108:2, 108:4, 112:14, 113:22, 114:18, 114:27, 119:25, 122:12, 122:21, 123:10, 123:25, 142:5, 154:13, 156:18, 157:2, 160:9, 165:27, 172:14 investigations [7] -60:16, 60:20, 60:22, 60:24, 112:16, 112:17, 114:8 investigative [1] -114:15 investing [1] - 14:11 invitation [1] - 89:24 invited [1] - 62:11 invoke [6] - 73:23, 73:25, 74:17, 76:8, 85:15, 124:22 invoked [1] - 121:2 involved [9] - 7:19, 20:7, 20:9, 35:28, 60:2, 77:4, 97:2, 99:14. 105:29 involves [1] - 173:10 involving [1] - 34:27

Ireland [4] - 49:6, 77:4, 77:7, 78:2 Irish [7] - 58:13, 89:21, 97:22, 160:23, 160:29, 161:21, 163:19 ironically [1] - 21:5 irregular [1] - 106:5 irrelevant [2] - 26:13, irreparable [2] -152:12, 152:25 issue [49] - 7:21, 14:8, 15:8, 15:10, 15:13, 16:7, 22:13, 23:5, 23:10, 23:14, 24:14, 26:10, 26:14, 30:15, 39:27, 43:22, 61:25, 62:10, 62:28, 63:21, 68:3, 69:23, 70:1, 71:2, 74:13, 74:15, 87:1, 91:12, 92:25, 92:26, 98:3, 100:17, 102:18, 105:26, 113:25, 122:10, 124:20, 125:7, 132:5, 133:25, 136:13, 136:25, 139:15, 139:18, 148:1, 149:10, 150:7, 153:21 **issued** [1] - 91:13 issues [13] - 37:27, 52:15, 59:7, 72:9, 88:5, 89:27, 95:12, 100:21, 112:10, 112:28, 115:21, 160:8, 170:18 it`s [1] - 164:11 italicised [1] - 174:4 italics [1] - 174:18 item [1] - 23:5

# J

items [2] - 114:3,

itself [2] - 85:7,

114:4

175:5

JACK [1] - 3:6 Jack [1] - 7:9 JAMES [1] - 2:28 January [11] - 17:7, 17:9, 18:18, 39:6, 45:4, 45:12, 45:21, 48:23, 92:5, 93:6, 95:28 JOE [1] - 3:14 Joe [3] - 162:14,

162:28, 163:1 **JOHN** [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:30 John [17] - 20:23, 49:7, 87:14, 87:21, 87:26, 88:28, 88:29, 120:5, 132:12, 139:12, 139:24, 162:13, 163:17, 166:15, 167:21, 171:22, 173:27 **join** [2] - 88:1, 88:15 Josephine [1] -121.22 journal [3] - 21:3, 21:4, 21:10 journal.ie [1] - 98:6 journalist [1] - 64:29 judge [8] - 32:14, 33:23, 36:7, 39:2, 86:23, 106:25, 147:11, 167:6 Judge [249] - 6:21, 7:29, 8:17, 8:22, 9:11, 9:29, 12:8, 13:27, 14:17, 17:13, 18:19, 19:15, 20:4, 20:19, 21:3, 22:17, 23:18. 23:28, 24:2, 24:19, 25:13, 25:15, 26:5, 26:11, 28:25, 29:3, 30:18, 31:27, 35:19, 36:3, 36:8, 36:9, 37:4, 37:13, 37:15, 37:21, 38:9, 38:19, 39:24, 40:14, 40:22, 40:25, 41:4, 41:13, 42:14, 42:18, 43:8, 43:13, 43:22, 43:27, 43:29, 44:3, 44:7, 44:9, 44:10, 46:18, 46:26, 47:21, 47:22, 47:29, 49:4, 49:14, 49:17, 50:13, 50:14, 50:15, 53:12. 53:14. 54:12. 54:17, 54:27, 54:29, 55:19, 55:21, 56:9, 56:17, 56:19, 56:23, 57:6, 57:16, 57:19, 58:7, 58:23, 58:25, 59:3, 59:5, 59:15, 60:3, 60:7, 63:12, 63:27, 65:1, 65:2, 65:6, 65:12, 65:21, 65:24, 66:21, 67:12, 68:18, 69:19, 70:6, 71:28, 72:3, 73:8, 73:23, 74:7, 74:12, 75:8, 75:13, 75:17,

80:4, 81:2, 81:3, 83:27, 85:14, 86:5, 86:16, 87:23, 87:26, 88:3, 88:5, 88:9, 88:18, 91:15, 91:16, 92:22, 95:8, 95:9, 95:11, 96:20, 102:9, 102:19, 102:23, 103:4, 103:6, 103:9, 103:21, 104:9, 105:19, 106:1, 106:7, 106:28, 107:1, 107:3, 107:15, 107:24, 108:9, 108:29, 113:7, 114:20, 114:25, 115:5, 115:12, 115:19, 117:7, 118:8, 118:11, 118:21, 118:25, 118:28, 119:7, 119:21, 120:9, 121:12, 122:8, 122:27, 122:29, 124:9. 124:14. 125:18, 126:1, 126:10, 126:21, 127:12, 127:23, 128:19, 128:27, 129:8, 129:15, 129:20, 129:23, 129:28, 130:15, 130:24. 132:17. 132:21, 132:29, 133:19, 133:23, 133:24, 135:21, 138:5, 139:4, 140:5, 141:24, 144:18, 145:2, 145:5, 145:15, 146:4. 146:15. 147:2. 148:15, 148:19, 149:5, 149:23, 149:26, 151:7, 152:22, 153:2, 153:12, 153:28, 154:23, 155:13, 155:22, 157:12, 158:29, 160:20, 161:22, 163:24, 168:1, 168:22, 170:20, 171:16, 171:19, 172:28, 173:4, 173:14, 173:20, 173:25, 175:15 **JUDGE** [1] - 3:12 Judge.. [2] - 26:24,

77:13, 77:14, 77:20,

77:27, 78:5, 78:13,

jump [1] - 113:11 jumped [1] - 112:1 jumping [1] - 22:27 June [9] - 66:22, 67:24, 101:11, 106:12, 106:19, 133:13, 133:15, 133:17, 157:25 justice [2] - 30:17, 151.18 Justice [13] - 46:11, 46:20, 67:25, 70:26, 73:4, 97:27, 121:21, 140:28, 141:4, 149:8, 149:9, 170:1, 171:5 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2

### Κ

**KANE**[1] - 2:28 **KATE**[1] - 3:25 Kavanagh [1] - 67:3 **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:5 **KEANE** [1] - 4:3 keen [1] - 62:26 keep [6] - 41:12, 42:25, 42:29, 60:3, 60:5, 82:7 **KELLY** [23] - 2:10, 3:12, 10:19, 10:24, 10:28, 14:17, 69:27, 94:18, 94:21, 108:29, 109:4, 116:28, 117:7, 150:2, 164:15, 164:17, 164:25, 165:1, 170:20, 170:23, 173:25, 174:7, 174:15 kelly [1] - 170:22 Kelly [10] - 11:2, 14:15, 69:25, 70:1, 116:8, 116:27, 150:11, 164:16, 174:1, 174:13 **Kelly's** [1] - 164:22 Kenny [6] - 18:23, 19:3, 19:4, 19:5, 19:15, 20:22 **KEOGH**[3] - 2:10, 5:3 6:10 Keogh [115] - 6:4, 6:8, 6:24, 8:2, 9:20, 10:17, 11:6, 12:23, 14:2, 16:8, 22:3, 22:23, 23:13, 24:13, 27:20, 30:22, 31:5, 34:12, 35:12, 35:28, 38:5, 38:11, 38:16,

75:29, 76:29, 77:6,

56.6

July [7] - 16:16,

101:20, 131:3, 131:4,

131:21, 131:24, 132:4

40:13, 41:14, 47:16, 48:2, 48:26, 49:24, 53:24, 55:2, 55:8, 55:29, 56:10, 56:28, 57:27, 58:27, 60:4, 60:25, 64:14, 66:14, 67:19, 68:7, 73:11, 73:13, 74:26, 75:22, 77:3, 78:6, 78:18, 80:18, 81:7, 85:10, 86:17, 87:7, 91:29, 92:1, 93:16, 102:2, 106:10, 108:1, 108:20, 109:20, 111:21, 112:15, 113:23, 115:6, 115:23, 116:12, 117:13, 117:21, 118:13, 118:23, 118:29, 119:11, 120:6, 121:2, 122:22, 126:3, 128:13, 130:5, 130:11, 133:12, 145:10, 145:24, 146:9. 146:22. 147:4. 147:20, 149:16, 150:18, 154:13, 154:26, 155:1, 157:1, 159:27, 160:18, 160:24, 163:3, 163:14, 168:14, 170:13, 171:1, 171:20, 171:25. 173:6, 173:8, 173:17, 174:3, 174:5, 174:22, 175:8, 175:28, 176:10, 176:25 Keogh's [6] - 27:1, 116:4, 166:4, 166:15, 167:21, 174:21 kept [5] - 108:16, 119:3, 159:4, 159:18, 159.22 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 Kieran [1] - 20:22 **KIERAN** [1] - 3:20 kill [2] - 94:28, 148:3 kind [9] - 51:23, 54:11, 54:26, 54:28, 79:7, 80:29, 95:18, 133:9, 173:18 **KIRWAN** [1] - 3:13 kitchen [2] - 62:22, 79:22 knowledge [2] -163:9, 166:26 known [2] - 46:4, 135:26 knows [1] - 73:19

## L

lackey [1] - 55:26 large [1] - 60:16 largely [1] - 175:5 larger [2] - 40:3, 130:12 last [34] - 6:16, 28:11, 32:17, 33:24, 35:3, 45:18, 48:18, 48:25, 49:20, 52:13, 52:26, 56:11, 57:17, 58:14, 61:6, 66:8, 67:2, 67:5, 68:24, 73:8, 83:17, 85:27, 97:3, 98:16, 101:13, 103:4, 111:20, 112:1, 147:2, 162:10, 162:24, 163:17, 166:5, 166:15 lasted [1] - 48:22 latest [1] - 93:6 launched [1] - 66:1 law [1] - 116:11 lawfully [1] - 37:24 lawlessness [2] -33:4, 33:27 **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29 lawyers' [1] - 116:25 layout [1] - 83:25 leading [1] - 155:5 leaking [1] - 164:2 learned [1] - 160:23 least [9] - 32:27, 50:29, 76:16, 85:13, 124:2, 124:29, 148:23, 170:24, 173:15 leave [13] - 53:3, 56:22, 57:1, 57:4, 66:15, 67:20, 69:23, 69:24, 77:18, 109:12, 126:15, 127:7, 133:26 led [2] - 29:27, 86:7 left [8] - 10:16, 12:17, 13:4, 72:16, 162:19, 162:22, 162:23, 170:14 left-hand [7] - 10:16, 12:17, 13:4, 72:16, 162:19, 162:22, 162.23 legal [1] - 166:15 legally [1] - 37:25

Leinster [2] - 20:28,

**LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13

lend [1] - 39:24

Leo [4] - 132:12,

21.6

132:15, 132:25, 133:5 less [1] - 114:16 letter [108] - 27:23, 28:2, 51:26, 52:26, 53:8, 62:27, 67:25, 68:7, 70:12, 71:5, 72:14, 72:18, 72:22, 72:24, 77:5, 77:12, 77:14, 77:20, 77:22, 77:26, 77:27, 77:28, 77:29, 78:4, 78:6, 78:13, 78:14, 78:18, 78:20, 78:28, 78:29, 79:22, 79:23, 80:10, 80:15, 80:18, 82:7, 82:18, 82:22, 82:24, 84:28, 85:2, 85:3, 85:4, 85:21, 85:22, 86:28, 91:8, 119:3, 120:21, 132:21, 132:24, 132:25, 132:28, 132:29, 142:23, 142:25, 143:7, 143:10, 154:9, 155:6, 156:13, 156:14, 156:15, 156:28, 158:3, 158:7, 158:9, 159:24, 163:15, 163:23, 163:25, 163:27, 164:12, 166:24, 167:6, 168:12, 169:8, 169:12, 169:18, 169:28. 169:29. 170:5, 170:16, 170:26, 171:2, 171:5, 171:8, 171:10, 171:13, 171:20, 171:22, 172:2, 173:2, 173:9, 173:22, 173:26, 174:8, 174:9, 174:11, 174:21, 175:12, 176:1, 176:7 letter.. [1] - 120:19 letters [15] - 12:19, 46:19, 46:21, 73:26, 76:7. 77:1. 85:20. 132:7, 132:9, 145:21, 145:26, 158:25, 158:28, 163:28 level [6] - 36:7, 36:8, 39:4, 47:18, 79:13, 144:4 liaise [1] - 61:9 liaised [1] - 146:10 liaison [1] - 17:5 **LIAM** [1] - 3:18 lie [1] - 108:16 lied [2] - 85:25, 107:24

light [2] - 125:2, 170:18 likely [8] - 62:8, 84:26, 95:17, 101:24, 134:21, 135:16, 135:18 limited [1] - 175:4 line [15] - 32:22, 33:23, 33:24, 52:13, 54:17, 68:24, 77:15, 77:19, 87:17, 89:11, 129:23, 132:2, 134:4, 151:4, 154:14 lines [5] - 67:5, 126:13, 126:20, 126:24, 133:4 lining [2] - 103:18, 104:25 linking [2] - 61:14, 62:16 list [16] - 46:6, 64:19, 64:23, 65:23, 95:22, 96:5. 97:4. 97:20. 101:16, 101:19, 135:3, 135:7, 135:9, 142:17, 144:7, 151:23 listed [2] - 66:14, 67.19 listen [8] - 24:24, 43:20, 73:27, 88:29, 99:21, 140:11, 142:26, 173:21 listening [1] - 97:17 lists [2] - 46:3, 142:4 LITTLE [1] - 3:28 lived [2] - 59:14, 61:21 lively [1] - 135:21 living [1] - 91:29 lodged [1] - 166:7 longhand [2] - 77:27, 82:19 look [40] - 21:28, 25:29. 38:3. 41:6. 41:19, 49:8, 51:21, 56:8, 58:13, 58:18, 63:17, 66:29, 67:4, 83:13, 84:11, 85:4, 111:23, 115:23, 117:2, 117:21, 119:8, 123:14, 131:4, 133:16, 134:14, 136:9, 136:23, 137:7, 137:11, 141:29, 143:11, 145:23, 149:10, 149:29, 155:28, 157:24, 161:22, 165:21,

Life [1] - 97:17

life [1] - 80:20

171:8, 172:6 looked [5] - 32:5, 100:6, 116:23, 141:2, 141:3 looking [16] - 7:12, 8:25, 10:20, 14:6, 21:3, 42:25, 63:25, 105:8, 111:23, 113:13, 116:16, 130:25, 138:1, 138:2, 154:21, 173:26 looks [5] - 12:20, 14:24, 107:12, 148:1 **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 lost [2] - 166:27, 168:18 low [1] - 36:8 lower [2] - 36:7, 39:4 Luke [2] - 17:2, 22:24 **LUNCH** [1] - 109:17 lunch [3] - 109:21, 125:5, 125:7 **LYONS** [1] - 4:3

### M

**MADE** [2] - 1:2, 1:7 Maher [10] - 7:18, 8:20, 8:24, 9:1, 9:7, 10:25, 11:7, 11:19, 13:23, 15:1 mail [4] - 97:22. 151:13, 154:5, 154:10 mails [1] - 156:29 **MAIN**[1] - 2:12 main [2] - 21:15, 122.9 maintained [3] -29:3, 55:25, 102:27 makers [1] - 149:3 male [1] - 95:10 **Malone** [1] - 1:24 **MALONE** [1] - 1:29 malpractice [2] -19:4, 28:6 man [5] - 58:13, 85:7, 142:27, 146:23, 147:2 management [31] -31:2, 35:9, 63:6, 63:16, 68:27, 69:10, 74:24, 75:21, 81:27, 82:5. 83:18. 85:25. 95:13, 121:24, 149:13, 149:27, 152:1, 152:23, 152:27, 152:29, 153:15, 161:4,

167:22, 168:27, 172:13, 172:19, 175:18, 176:5, 176:22 managing [1] - 160:5 March [26] - 7:17, 8:5, 8:10, 8:22, 11:6, 20:14, 20:19, 22:6, 25:27, 27:2, 27:5, 27:11, 27:19, 71:16, 76:9, 97:25, 100:24, 100:26, 109:2, 137:11, 137:12, 137:23, 138:2, 139:4, 159:27, 160:12 MARGARET[1] -3.21 MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17 Marie [3] - 7:18, 13:6, 13:25 mark [1] - 102:20 MARK[1] - 3:3 marked [2] - 48:19, 50:22 MARRINAN[1] - 2:7 Martin [6] - 49:13, 49:15, 49:17, 49:20, 49:28, 51:7 massaging [3] -32:24, 32:29, 75:1 massive [1] - 60:20 material [5] - 41:21, 41:23, 93:17, 94:1, 113:4 materials [2] - 19:8, 105.8 MATT[1] - 3:19 Matt [2] - 94:13, 94:24 matter [26] - 15:25, 28:6, 32:29, 49:16, 65:8, 70:2, 75:19, 76:4, 78:16, 79:28, 80:25, 94:2, 107:25, 115:9, 116:10, 116:22, 117:1, 117:5, 117:7, 117:23, 118:20, 127:25, 132:3, 150:8, 150:11, 156:23 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:4 matters [18] - 24:27, 30:19, 32:11, 32:15, 68:21, 85:19, 111:17, 112:3, 112:13, 112:20, 112:24, 113:21, 115:16, 116:7, 122:9, 128:4, 130:2. 176:24 MATTHIAS[1] - 2:10 McBrien [3] - 2:16,

59:2, 61:13

McCarthy [9] -

157:15, 157:17,

2:6, 3:24, 12:12,

23:8, 26:28, 27:1,

27:4, 39:22, 40:6,

40:9. 82:6. 87:14.

McLoughlin [4] -

McMahon's [1] -

MCPARTLIN[1] -

mean [44] - 10:8,

34:9, 36:16, 37:9,

48:8, 48:11, 49:8,

125:27, 131:23,

132:1. 140:21.

149:10, 149:22,

158:14, 174:28,

175:4, 176:7

55:15, 127:13

116:1, 117:6

56:18, 132:15,

176:15, 176:16

122:26, 133:9

meant [3] - 26:11,

88:28, 88:29

137.2

3:20

27:14

163:25

2:28

meantime [2] - 64:4, McBrien's [1] - 59:16 172:18 McCabe [2] - 27:13, media [12] - 49:11, 51:9, 64:29, 65:3, 65:6, 97:21, 101:20, 146:27, 148:29, 157:18, 158:3, 159:1, 149:2, 149:5, 149:6 159:3, 159:23, 162:7, mediation [1] -156:16 McCOURT [1] - 2:17 MEDICAL[1] - 3:11 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 medical [1] - 58:4 McGRATH[2] - 2:7, meet [11] - 19:16, 19:19, 27:14, 100:19, McGuinness [20] -133:28, 134:11, 155:12, 155:14, 157:15, 157:20, 14:28, 15:12, 22:29, 157:22 meeting [17] - 22:5, 22:7, 25:27, 26:22, 87:22, 87:26, 88:16, 27:9, 28:20, 84:10, 89:9, 97:27, 99:29, 100:3, 100:9, 139:20, 141:5, 143:16, 71:13, 71:15, 80:10, 143:19, 161:19 MCLOUGHLIN [1] meetings [5] - 87:27, 100:10, 160:25, 162:13, 163:22 McLYNN [1] - 3:31 MEMBER [1] - 2:2 MCMAHON[1] - 3:8 member [4] - 23:29, McMahon [5] - 6:29, 7:6, 7:19, 13:7, 13:25 35:9, 50:14, 161:4 members [14] - 24:2, 24:3, 24:8, 28:11, 28:28, 29:4, 29:12, 29:25, 30:17, 52:20, 66:12, 67:17, 152:19 memory [1] - 81:8 21:28, 25:8, 25:24, mental [1] - 132:12 mention [7] - 22:25, 40:28, 41:5, 44:20, 23:4, 36:1, 40:20, 51:14, 54:17, 54:25, 115:2, 155:17, 155:19 55:14, 56:8, 56:24, mentioned [6] - 6:20, 59:24, 60:17, 60:20, 37:9, 81:14, 88:27, 71:4, 75:29, 79:10, 89:2. 159:7 MEP[1] - 17:4 81:17, 89:1, 90:14, 96:21, 105:6, 116:16, mere [1] - 55:25 merely [2] - 117:17, 174:10 147:17, 148:3, 149:5, merit [4] - 101:16, 144:6, 150:23, 150:25 message [7] - 7:8. 11:15, 44:19, 126:15, mean.. [3] - 54:24, 126:16, 127:8, 127:9 messages [1] meaning [4] - 11:16, 158:27 messing [1] - 35:8 means [5] - 55:13, messy [1] - 59:23 met [16] - 8:3, 8:4, 16:20, 16:24, 16:27,

77:6, 100:11, 140:29, 155:13, 155:15 methodology [1] -170:13 MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 Mick [19] - 17:27, 18:5, 18:13, 18:15, 18:23, 19:3, 19:5, 19:19, 27:13, 28:18, 29:21, 62:3, 62:6, 62:17, 84:21, 90:20, 136:16, 136:27 mid [1] - 30:5 middle [13] - 48:26, 66:5, 72:12, 85:4, 99:10, 110:3, 110:23, 120:1, 161:25, 166:1, 166:22, 168:9, 171:8 midlands [2] - 32:26, 161:15 might [15] - 14:28, 18:20, 39:26, 42:15, 50:26, 63:27, 84:19, 84:20, 87:21, 88:1, 124:1, 129:25, 143:11, 163:28, 167:16 mild [1] - 55:6 miles [2] - 172:28, 176:12 million [2] - 172:28, 176:12 mind [11] - 45:9, 56:3, 66:27, 95:5, 102:21, 104:17, 130:25, 131:2, 148:21, 157:24, 176:20 minded [1] - 34:11 mindset [1] - 131:20 Ming [2] - 17:2, 22.25 Minister [32] - 37:13, 46:11, 46:19, 51:26, 53:1, 53:8, 67:25, 68:8, 70:25, 70:29, 71:3, 71:5, 72:22, 73:2, 73:4, 73:17, 74:21, 74:23, 75:2, 76:22, 77:22, 79:23, 80:19, 80:26, 82:19, 84:28, 85:24, 86:8, 86:19, 149:7, 170:1, 171.5 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 Minister's [1] - 62:27 Minnock [23] - 7:8, 9:1, 43:29, 53:25,

54:5, 54:6, 54:18,

58:20, 58:22, 59:1, 59:2, 59:4, 59:12, 59:15, 59:18, 60:27, 62:14, 62:15, 89:8, 91:28, 93:1, 94:3, 102:1 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 Minnock's [5] - 89:7, 91:19, 92:10, 93:14, 93:15 minor [1] - 32:28 minute [7] - 93:11, 93:12, 98:16, 126:23, 172:6, 174:27, 174:28 minutes [5] - 15:27, 16:4, 141:3, 174:28, 175.1 misconduct [1] miserably [1] - 96:20 misinformation [3] -43:28, 44:1, 44:12 misleading [2] -72:13. 86:23 misled [5] - 85:27, 86:1, 86:8, 86:19, 86:24 missing [4] - 66:28, 139:5, 139:7, 139:9 mission [2] - 56:3, mistake [1] - 69:21 mistakenly [1] -116:21 misunderstanding [1] - 128:2 miswritten [1] -106:22 **mobile** [1] - 63:10 module [1] - 159:10 moment [17] - 11:26, 12:3, 12:4, 12:11, 12:16, 40:11, 50:28, 78:11, 78:12, 81:13, 83:9, 87:23, 126:4, 137:8, 137:28, 140:26, 141:7 moments [3] - 130:5, 153:4, 169:23 Monday [3] - 134:16, 177:4, 177:7 MONICA [1] - 3:15 **monitoring** [1] - 21:2 month [7] - 81:2, 133:15, 137:23, 149:19, 166:5, 166:16 months [12] - 18:6, 18:7, 18:14, 53:16, 53:19, 57:14, 65:10, 93:23, 121:3, 139:5,

16:29, 17:1, 27:4,

27:13, 57:18, 71:14,

153:26, 166:7 morning [12] - 6:5, 6:6, 6:7, 8:28, 10:21, 75:22, 122:22, 122:25, 122:28, 123:3, 123:4 morning.. [1] - 123:4 MORONEY [1] - 3:18 Morris [2] - 37:9, 37:14 MORRISSEY [1] most [2] - 49:22, 86:15 mother [1] - 62:21 move [19] - 20:14, 24:28, 39:6, 45:11, 63:22, 77:21, 91:5, 95:19, 96:7, 97:14, 97:24, 114:1, 117:27, 121:17, 134:13, 144:19, 150:4, 153:29, 164:5 moved [2] - 63:6, 117:22 movement [1] -72:27 movements [1] -73:10 moving [12] - 30:5, 73:27, 87:7, 89:5, 94:8, 95:28, 150:6, 150:11, 151:23, 160:15, 165:3, 165:14 MR [203] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:8, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 3:30, 3:30, 4:3, 5:5, 6:7, 6:11, 6:14, 6:18, 6:21, 6:23, 8:9, 10:3, 10:11, 10:13, 10:15, 10:19, 10:24, 10:28, 11:22, 12:2, 12:17, 13:2, 13:4, 13:10, 14:9, 14:14, 14:17, 14:28, 15:6, 15:9, 15:20, 15:23, 15:29, 16:3, 16:6, 16:12, 22:29, 23:6, 23:13, 23:20, 26:3, 26:28, 27:1, 27:4, 27:9. 27:20. 28:1. 30:4, 33:10, 33:13, 33:15, 33:17, 38:5, 39:26, 39:29, 40:3, 40:6, 40:9, 40:15,

41:10, 42:25, 44:16,

48:2, 49:27, 50:1, 50:4, 50:21, 51:1, 51:3, 51:17, 51:25, 60:4, 60:29, 61:8, 63:27, 64:1, 64:6, 64:14, 65:22, 66:29, 67:4, 67:7, 67:12, 67:24, 68:2, 69:27, 70:6, 70:12, 76:18, 78:17, 80:17, 82:6, 82:11, 82:14, 84:26, 86:6, 86:27, 87:20, 88:11, 88:20, 90:9, 92:9, 92:26, 94:18, 94:21, 94:23, 94:29, 95:6, 97:12, 102:29, 104:11, 106:10, 106:20, 106:23, 108:1, 108:20, 108:29, 109:4, 109:8, 109:20, 113:13, 115:28, 116:5, 116:28, 117:7, 117:10, 117:16, 117:27. 118:13. 118:29, 119:29, 121:17, 125:2, 126:3, 127:7, 128:13, 130:5, 133:12, 134:6, 134:13, 138:2, 138:6, 138:16, 139:14, 148:27, 150:2, 150:6, 150.9 150.17 153:24, 157:6, 157:9, 162:22, 162:26, 164:15, 164:17, 164:20, 164:22, 164:25, 164:27, 165:1, 165:3, 168:9, 169:19, 169:23, 170:20, 170:23, 170:26, 170:29, 171:25, 173:25, 173:29, 174:7, 174:13, 174:15, 175:1, 175:3, 175:6, 175:8, 177:8 **MS** [11] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 3:30, 4:4, 4:4 muddle [1] - 12:15 MULCAHY [1] - 3:5 MULLIGAN[2] -2:11. 3:13 Mullingar [1] -157:19

multiple [1] - 122:3

MURPHY [152] -

2:30, 3:23, 5:5, 6:7,

6:11, 6:14, 6:18, 6:21, 6:23, 8:9, 10:3, 10:11, 10:13, 10:15, 11:22, 12:2, 12:17, 13:2, 13:4, 13:10, 14:9, 14:14, 15:6, 15:9, 15:20, 15:23, 15:29, 16:3, 16:6, 16:12, 23:6, 23:13, 23:20, 26:3, 27:9, 27:20, 28:1, 30:4, 33:10, 33:13, 33:15, 33:17, 38:5, 39:26, 39:29, 40:3, 40:6, 40:9, 40:15, 41:10, 42:25, 44:16, 48:2, 49:27, 50:1, 50:4, 50:21, 51:1, 51:3, 51:17, 51:25, 60:4, 60:29, 61:8, 63:27, 64:1, 64:6. 64:14. 65:22. 66:29, 67:4, 67:7, 67:12, 67:24, 68:2, 70:6, 70:12, 76:18, 78:17. 80:17. 82:11. 82:14, 84:26, 86:6, 86:27, 87:20, 88:11, 88:20, 90:9, 92:9, 92:26, 94:23, 94:29, 95:6, 97:12, 102:29, 104:11, 106:10, 106:20, 106:23, 108:1. 108:20. 109:8. 109:20, 113:13, 115:28, 116:5, 117:10, 117:16, 117:27, 118:13, 118:29, 119:29, 121:17, 125:2, 126:3, 127:7, 128:13, 130:5, 133:12 134:6 134:13, 138:2, 138:6, 138:16, 139:14, 148:27, 150:6, 150:9, 150:17, 153:24, 157:6, 157:9, 162:22, 162:26, 164:20, 164:22, 164:27, 165:3, 168:9, 169:19, 169:23, 170:26, 170:29, 171:25, 173:29, 174:13, 175:1, 175:3, 175:6, 175:8, 177:8 Murphy [47] - 10:2, 10:10, 11:24, 12:5, 12:28, 15:1, 15:4, 15:28, 22:29, 33:9, 35:25, 36:16, 41:19, 60:18, 63:26, 65:13, 66:28, 68:1, 69:24,

70:4, 73:8, 78:15, 82:9, 82:12, 82:17, 82:27, 83:26, 84:13, 84:23. 94:21. 115:4. 115:22, 116:19, 117:2, 117:11, 123:2, 123:14, 128:12, 129:1, 129:14, 147:20, 148:17, 170:25, 174:1, 174:19, 174:25, 174.26 murphy [4] - 14:5, 51:13, 150:5, 153:23 Murphy's [3] - 32:14, 49:23. 49:24 Murray [175] - 16:9, 22:4, 22:10, 26:27, 30:7, 30:23, 31:2, 31:20, 31:24, 32:25, 33:20, 34:4, 34:19, 34:23, 34:26, 35:1, 35:16, 38:8, 38:24, 39:14, 39:18, 40:15, 40:18, 40:21, 40:23, 41:1. 41:21. 41:29. 43:9, 44:3, 44:13, 44:16, 44:23, 45:13, 45:21, 47:16, 48:27, 51:5, 52:1, 52:4, 52:10, 52:18, 53:25, 54:3, 54:8, 54:15, 55:12, 55:25, 56:4, 58:16. 58:19. 59:3. 61:17, 63:4, 64:16, 65:23, 66:20, 66:25, 68:10, 68:14, 70:16, 71:9, 73:15, 73:21, 74:5, 74:12, 74:29, 75:7, 76:14, 76:21, 77:2, 78:22, 80:15, 84:7, 85:11, 86:29, 87:4, 87:9, 88:7, 91:6, 91:7, 91:25, 92:29, 94:11, 95:20, 95:29, 96:4, 96:9, 97:14, 97:16, 98:8, 98:23, 99:5, 99:13, 99:18, 100:1, 100:4, 100:12, 100:13, 100:15, 100:18, 100:20, 100:27, 101:28, 102:2, 102:4, 102:17, 102:18, 102:25, 103:14, 103:18, 104:7, 104:29, 105:1, 105:21, 106:14, 107:5, 107:28, 115:25, 117:29, 121:19, 121:21, 121:26, 122:7,

122:16, 122:25, 123:8, 124:19, 124:26, 125:4, 125:8, 125:11, 125:17, 126:4, 126:7, 126:17, 127:27, 128:18, 128:21, 128:25, 132:19, 134:19, 135:2, 135:6, 136:26, 137:27, 141:20, 143:14, 144:21, 145:14, 145:28, 146:3, 146:12, 146:26, 147:1, 147:6, 149:21, 150:19, 151:4, 151:14, 152:8, 153:7, 153:10, 154:4, 154:9, 154:12, 156:22, 156:29, 165:5. 165:11. 165:20, 170:6, 170:10, 176:16 MURRAY [2] - 3:3, Murray's [29] - 43:1, 43:4, 43:13, 43:26, 47:6, 59:17, 73:5, 75:16, 88:19, 88:24, 92:14, 92:23, 93:13, 94:9, 106:29, 122:2, 125:13, 125:18, 126:9, 126:19, 131:21, 132:26, 133:3. 142:10. 142:21, 143:8, 170:15, 173:13, 175:10 Murrays's [1] - 97:28 must [2] - 82:25, **MÍCHEÁL** [1] - 3:23

#### Ν

name [6] - 30:23,
50:12, 66:19, 68:10,
73:9, 118:2
named [6] - 1:26,
51:9, 74:29, 99:5,
99:8, 101:19
namely [1] - 174:8
names [2] - 20:18,
40:7
national [2] - 128:16,
146:27
nationwide [1] 149:1
natural [4] - 56:19,
56:20, 64:1, 151:17
nature [4] - 111:10,

111:13, 114:14, 114:15 **near** [1] - 76:5 necessarily [1] -140.21 necessary [3] -11:28, 96:26, 117:20 need [4] - 33:5, 54:25, 65:17, 117:17 needed [1] - 45:1 neutral [1] - 25:21 neutrally [1] - 83:25 never [13] - 7:28, 9:16, 22:21, 23:26, 24:21, 24:26, 31:22, 34:2. 46:4. 108:15. 129:15, 140:4, 146:17 new [3] - 74:11, 101:3 News [1] - 118:1 news [1] - 165:17 newspaper [2] -160:18, 161:8 newspapers [2] -68:4, 149:2 next [39] - 8:28, 11:15, 17:14, 17:24, 18:1, 18:2, 18:4, 21:16, 22:8, 28:15, 41:11, 47:15, 48:2, 51:5, 53:23, 66:4, 68:1, 68:24, 70:10, 84:10, 103:21, 107:15, 110:18, 110:22, 113:7, 119:22, 126:22, 131:11, 134:1, 134:2, 142:14, 150:6, 150:8, 151:4, 151:23, 152:10, 155:28, 163:12, 168:2 nice [1] - 124:6 NICHOLAS [4] -2:10, 4:2, 5:3, 6:10 Nicholas [3] - 16:8, 155:1, 159:27 Nick [2] - 119:11, 160:24 night [1] - 47:8 nightmare [1] - 43:7 nighttime [2] - 94:15, 94:26 nine [3] - 18:6, 18:7, 18:14 **NK** [2] - 13:12, 104:6 nobody [4] - 12:13, 31:3, 76:14, 77:20 **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 **Nolan** [1] - 7:9 none [4] - 60:21,

157:13, 172:18 **NOREEN** [1] - 2:16 Noreen [2] - 59:2, 59:15 normally [1] - 65:2 north [1] - 24:29 **NORTHUMBERLAN D**[1] - 2:18 note [51] - 7:21, 7:26, 8:11, 8:14, 8:17, 8:18, 9:7, 9:12, 9:13, 9:25, 11:4, 11:10, 11:18, 12:22, 12:26, 13:23, 13:26, 13:29, 14:7, 14:11, 15:11, 16:29, 19:16, 19:18, 20:20, 21:10, 39:13, 50:21, 58:16, 83:22, 83:28, 87:24, 91:26, 92:28, 93:12, 93:13, 96:25, 103:10, 125:4, 132:2, 132:8, 134:22, 141:19, 141:26, 142:14 noted [6] - 38:9, 58:7, 59:8, 81:3, 139:22, 142:14 notepaper [1] -173:28 notes [11] - 1:26, 8:22, 43:1, 43:4, 43:13, 62:21, 88:19, 88:23, 88:24, 92:23, 141:18 nothing [25] - 7:9, 7:10, 7:14, 7:15,

24:11, 35:17, 49:15,

49:19, 50:10, 50:19,

117:3, 118:14, 128:9,

**notice** [4] - 56:12,

77:14, 95:25, 172:14

notification [3] -

7:16, 64:17, 89:18

notify [3] - 89:17,

noting [1] - 138:13

November [16] -

108:26, 153:29,

160:12, 160:15,

91:7, 94:12, 108:23,

154:5, 155:6, 160:6,

notwithstanding [1]

107:19, 108:12

108:20

noticing [1] - 91:15

notified [1] - 117:22

51:11, 65:5, 69:1,

86:21, 104:20,

106:23, 116:19,

128:10, 136:20,

161:9, 176:11

O'BRIEN [1] - 2:10 O'CONNOR [1] -O'HIGGINS [1] - 3:23 O'MARA [1] - 2:17 O'NEILL [1] - 3:30 O'REARDON[1] -3:17 O'ROURKE [1] - 4:4 O'SULLIVAN[1] -

O'Sullivan [6] -86:14, 96:15, 123:7, 130:29, 137:15, 139.24 O'Sullivan's [1] -

55:20 objecting [1] - 93:25

objection [1] - 165:7 objective [4] - 57:10, 93:23, 93:26

141:20 121:15

number [25] - 6:15, 8:25, 9:21, 11:12, 16:7, 18:8, 46:19, 52:27, 63:10, 63:11, 63:13, 64:19, 73:26, 82:21, 97:5, 101:15, 122:24, 131:3, 132:4, 136:5, 144:6, 150:25,

164:6, 164:21,

164:24, 164:28,

NOVEMBER [3] -

Nugent [6] - 162:15,

162:29, 163:1, 163:3,

**NUGENT** [2] - 3:14,

nugent [1] - 163:1

1:18, 6:2, 177:12

165:6, 165:15

165:6, 165:11

150:26, 162:12, 171:2 numbers [3] - 63:14, 63:15, 95:21

24:20, 129:28 nutshell [2] - 115:29, 116:1

numerous [2] -

NYLAND[1] - 3:19 Nyland [2] - 94:13, 94:25

NÍ [1] - 2:30 **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7 **Nóirín** [8] - 55:19,

86:14, 123:7, 130:28, 135:2, 137:14, 139:24 Nóirín" [1] - 137:19

0

34:24

offer [1] - 88:28 offered [1] - 140:11 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 office [11] - 39:16, 43:27, 47:6, 51:8, 52:5, 62:27, 87:10, 104:6, 107:7, 138:9, 157:19

officer [15] - 38:28, 62:3, 62:6, 118:2, 120:24, 133:24, 133:27, 133:28, 134:10, 161:6, 162:15, 162:29, 163:2, 172:11, 172:15 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11,

66:9. 66:13. 67:15. 67:19, 90:19, 135:26,

obligation [1] -152:28 obliged [3] - 28:20, 85:29, 114:26 observation [1] observations [1] obvious [1] - 167:24 obviously [20] - 15:3, 23:24, 42:3, 46:3, 55:29, 70:1, 79:4, 83:29, 84:21, 85:23, 112:1, 130:19, 131:29, 144:16, 147:23, 149:9, 149:27, 159:6, 159:11, 168:23 occasions [2] - 9:22,

97.5 occur [1] - 106:17 occurred [2] - 53:9, 144:5

occurs [1] - 128:15 October [18] - 87:7, 87:9, 88:4, 89:5, 89:8, 89:13, 90:11, 91:18, 91:28, 95:11, 103:24, 104:13, 138:17, 138:18, 139:28, 150:20, 166:24, 169:21

October" [1] - 87:18 **OF** [9] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2,

offence [1] - 34:27 offences [2] - 34:16,

Officer [1] - 138:27

officers [8] - 20:18,

161:20 official [1] - 22:7 officially [1] - 7:9 often [4] - 63:14, 69:26, 158:13, 158:14 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 Oireachtas [1] -152:19 old [1] - 74:7 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12, 3:30 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [1] - 38:25 one [57] - 6:18, 7:27, 8:6, 8:15, 10:4, 16:27, 17:3. 18:4. 21:7. 27:22, 28:23, 29:9, 31:3, 40:11, 42:26, 46:23, 50:25, 52:27, 53:13, 53:23, 56:21, 60:22, 61:7, 65:11, 66:13, 67:18, 67:29, 68:1, 74:9, 76:5, 82:16. 85:16. 85:21. 89:27, 95:14, 106:10, 111:20, 118:1, 119:23, 122:10, 126:15, 127:7, 127:25, 129:5, 130:2, 130:12, 130:23, 141:7, 141:24, 142:16, 150:18, 156:16, 156:22, 161:4, 170:21, 173:27, 174:12 ones [1] - 153:15 ongoing [1] - 123:25 open [2] - 82:16, 82:17 operating [1] - 10:4

orchestrated [2] -146:22, 153:25 order [7] - 101:15, 106:16, 144:6, 150:23, 150:25, 166:27, 168:27 ordinary [1] - 151:3 organisation [1] -

**opinion** [1] - 116:4

opinions [1] - 56:1

opposed [3] - 48:20,

**opposite** [1] - 48:19

option [1] - 103:14

orchestrate[1] -

opportunity [3] -

49:16, 69:9, 124:2

68:19, 130:22

153:9

79:13

organised [1] - 105:4 original [2] - 15:19, 32:28 originally [2] -104:26, 171:18 ORLA [1] - 3:20 OSMOND [1] - 3:27 OTHER [1] - 1:3 otherwise [1] -172:15 outing [1] - 152:13 outlining [1] - 165:9 outside [3] - 31:5, 61:21, 125:10 Outstanding [1] -114:8 outstanding [1] -107:8 overseen [1] - 167:1 own [13] - 11:28, 34:11, 44:27, 73:9, 73:13, 86:4, 95:11, 99:27, 99:28, 114:29, 116:9, 145:5, 163:8

# Ρ

**PAC** [1] - 135:2 pack [1] - 56:21 **PAGE**[1] - 5:2 page [127] - 6:24, 6:25, 12:21, 16:13, 17:7, 17:24, 18:17, 19:14, 19:21, 20:15, 21:16, 22:3, 26:4, 27:11, 27:22, 30:5, 32:12, 32:17, 45:12, 46:28, 47:4, 50:23, 50:24, 51:28, 52:25, 53:29, 54:2, 58:15, 60:25, 61:1, 61:4, 61:29. 63:23. 64:15. 65:25 66:4 66:5 67:1, 68:5, 68:6, 68:8, 68:24, 70:7, 70:10, 77:21, 87:8, 87:17, 89:6, 89:11, 91:6, 92:27, 94:9, 95:19, 96:7, 96:26, 98:4, 98:20, 98:27, 98:28, 99.1 99.4 99.7 99:10, 100:23, 101:12, 101:28, 103:4, 103:21, 106:12, 106:26, 107:3, 108:18, 109:23, 110:3, 110:18, 110:19, 110:20, 110:22,

110:23, 111:21, 111:25, 113:7, 113:29, 114:1, 115:13, 117:28, 118:9, 118:26, 119:22, 120:1, 120:2, 120:16, 121:18, 125:3, 130:8, 130:26, 137:5, 137:6, 137:7, 138:18, 141:1, 141:2, 141:13, 141:16, 143:14, 150:26, 151:12, 154:1, 154:19, 157:25, 160:1, 164:8, 165:4, 165:14, 165:21, 165:26, 166:1, 166:21, 167:14, 167:19, 168:9 panel [4] - 95:23, 107:21, 110:13 paper [1] - 58:25 paperwork [2] - 9:22, 9.25

paragraph [31] 32:17, 33:24, 45:17,
45:18, 52:3, 52:13,
61:5, 61:6, 66:7,
67:13, 68:10, 85:27,
87:18, 88:7, 101:13,
111:23, 113:9, 118:8,
119:8, 126:1, 152:10,
162:10, 162:24,
166:2, 166:2, 167:8,
167:10, 168:2, 168:5,
174:22
paragraphs [2] -

parallel [2] - 124:21, 124:24 paranoid [1] - 59:11 pardon [4] - 47:4, 143:26, 164:27, 169:7 parliamentary [1] -31:6

52:16, 67:7

part [43] - 8:25, 9:21, 11:1, 11:21, 25:3, 28:25, 31:24, 35:3, 40:24, 45:10, 47:14, 48:24, 49:19, 49:21, 51:11, 59:10, 60:6, 73:20, 74:2, 87:28, 103:22, 106:5, 109:5, 112:1, 120:23, 123:15, 123:17, 126:21, 128:19, 131:15, 136:20, 137:10, 149:8,

154:26, 160:11,

167:10, 171:17,

171:18, 174:4, 174:18, 174:19, 175:29 particular [12] -11:21, 11:25, 48:24, 58:4, 117:2, 133:16, 134:15, 136:23, 138:18, 146:19, 160:9, 172:2 parties [5] - 77:2, 144:23, 144:28, 156:20, 156:21 parts [2] - 11:24, 92:25

party [1] - 176:4 pass [5] - 20:11, 23:6, 44:19, 50:25, 50:26 PASSED [1] - 1:4

passed [3] - 19:18, 30:14, 63:1 passing [3] - 20:8, 34:16, 150:23 Pat [10] - 32:25,

Fat [10] - 32:25, 52:18, 68:9, 68:14, 78:21, 80:15, 98:8, 98:23, 99:13, 105:21 Patrick [2] - 16:9,

**PATRICK** [4] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:28, 3:3 **pattern** [2] - 122:5, 153:9

patterns [1] - 58:6 PAUL [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 3:30 pause [1] - 140:26

PEGGY [1] - 4:4 pen [3] - 39:24, 73:9,

pay [3] - 53:5, 89:19,

93.8

147:3 penalisation [1] - 53:6

penalised [1] - 53:4 penalty [1] - 97:29 pending [1] - 151:8 penned [1] - 82:19 PEOPLE [1] - 3:16 people [23] - 24:6,

51:19, 51:23, 56:9, 56:16, 57:3, 60:6, 64:19, 74:4, 81:21, 99:24, 115:23, 122:24, 136:5, 140:20, 142:4, 145:11, 146:24, 147:7, 177:3 perceive [1] - 57:7

29:11, 34:11, 48:6,

perceived [1] - 57:8
perception [2] 60:19, 73:7
perfect [1] - 174:23
perfectly [1] - 157:7
perhaps [10] - 39:26,
41:10, 50:26, 51:27,
86:6, 88:27, 100:25,
134:13, 143:11,
154:25
period [15] - 6:28,

21:24, 22:1, 26:1, 56:9, 58:9, 60:13, 62:10, 64:25, 65:7, 65:22, 69:21, 88:3, 90:10, 95:9

periods [1] - 26:12

periods [1] - 20. 12 permission [1] - 16:6 permit [1] - 166:27 persisting [1] - 82:7 person [22] - 7:13, 15:7, 31:29, 32:3, 50:13, 53:2, 56:10, 56:20, 78:1, 80:3, 80:20, 80:22, 85:12, 86:11, 95:10, 96:4, 142:16, 146:14, 150:24, 151:23, 153:27, 168:17

person's [1] - 75:25 personal [1] - 91:13 persons [1] - 21:8 PETER [2] - 2:5, 3:13 phase [4] - 53:23, 150:6, 150:8, 163:12 Phone [1] - 138:23 phone [22] - 8:19, 9:15, 9:25, 11:6, 11:9, 11:11, 11:12, 11:14, 13:20, 13:21, 62:2, 62:5, 63:14, 63:15, 87:27, 90:20, 95:15,

140:24 **phoned** [1] - 96:10 **phoning** [2] - 94:14, 94:25

96:11, 140:9, 140:22,

photo [1] - 21:8 photograph [5] -21:4, 21:12, 21:14, 21:15 phrase [4] - 17:14, 71:20, 123:24, 174:11 PIAB [1] - 91:8

pick [1] - 149:6 piece [1] - 44:1 pincer [3] - 72:27, 73:3, 73:10 PLACE [1] - 4:5

place [11] - 13:22,

31:12, 72:5, 72:8, 97:3, 108:3, 143:17, 145:4, 168:21, 169:5, 177:5 placed [5] - 64:18, 97:19, 101:15, 106:16, 110:13 plan [6] - 60:5,

73:16, 73:20, 123:15, 123:17, 146:23 planning [1] - 104:21 play [1] - 60:12 plenty [3] - 22:20.

play [1] - 60:12 plenty [3] - 22:20, 38:14, 56:24 plot [1] - 136:17 ploy [1] - 31:23 plus [1] - 14:12

PM [1] - 50:22 PM92 [1] - 91:11 point [47] - 11:20, 16:1, 17:1, 18:16, 25:9, 40:29, 41:1, 42:22, 48:21, 53:13, 53:23, 55:19, 60:7, 61:7, 61:8, 61:9,

62:13, 64:3, 68:2, 68:3, 69:19, 69:20, 74:14, 75:8, 76:4, 76:13, 104:25, 104:26, 108:29, 111:28, 112:17, 113:23, 115:1, 115:13, 117:2, 117:24, 123:12,

132:10, 148:22, 148:27, 150:1, 150:2, 150:18, 152:6, 169:7, 170:28, 175:9

**pointing** [5] - 71:2, 71:3, 93:28, 124:28, 129:14

**points** [5] - 52:26, 97:29, 114:12, 116:6, 145:25 **police** [1] - 133:28

Policing [64] - 72:18, 73:3, 73:18, 100:29, 101:2, 101:12, 103:20, 104:10, 106:13, 107:19, 107:24, 108:12, 108:15, 109:22, 109:26, 114:26, 114:28, 115:10,

115:24, 116:2, 118:4, 120:25, 121:23, 125:15, 134:11, 135:13, 141:6, 142:7, 142:9, 142:20, 143:16, 145:1, 145:7,

66:14, 66:23, 67:19, 145:17, 145:18, 101:29 54:17, 58:13, 59:16, 1:2, 1:3 149:10, 150:21, present [2] - 70:5, 106:11, 147:28, 70:17, 71:1, 73:6, 150:22, 151:9, 95:23 159:11, 165:12, 74:11, 75:5, 75:16, 151:19, 152:2, 169:1, 174:17, 174:29 75:28, 78:21, 78:25, presentation [1] -152:23, 152:27, problems [6] - 10:26, 84:7, 85:7, 87:2, 89:25 95:22, 96:5, 97:4, 152:29, 153:5, 29:7, 29:8, 57:11, presently [1] - 107:7 153:13, 153:16, PRESIDENT [2] -81:7, 159:17 97:20, 100:28, 101:8, 165:8, 166:25, 101:14, 101:17, 1:13, 2:3 procedurally [1] -167:22, 170:2, 171:6, 103:15, 103:20, 151:18 Press [1] - 138:26 172:9, 172:16, 173:9, procedure [2] -104:10, 104:26, press [4] - 31:5, 173:11, 173:14, 70:20, 121:2 105:4, 105:26, 99:13, 146:29, 152:18 173:22, 175:18, 106:15, 106:17, pressed [1] - 161:29 procedures [7] -176:1, 176:7, 176:19, 107:1, 120:24, 56:12, 76:17, 76:20, pressure [6] - 17:11, 176:20, 176:28 147:12, 147:14, 121:26, 122:7, 53:17, 58:10, 131:9, policing [3] - 24:27, 122:10, 122:20, 147:17 131:18, 137:26 123:27, 124:1, 124:3, 70:19, 142:16 proceed [5] - 16:7, presume [16] - 50:9, policy [7] - 73:24, 124:20, 125:14, 41:3, 133:3, 152:24, 64:24, 71:11, 79:6, 126:9, 128:25, 73:25, 74:1, 74:18, 175.2 84:1, 122:1, 128:5, 76:8, 124:22, 154:14 131:22, 131:25, 132:17, 134:8, 134:9, proceedings [4] -131:28, 132:27, political [1] - 53:16 91:10, 91:13, 141:21, 134:22, 142:18, 133:3, 135:3, 142:4, poor [1] - 91:29 165:10 142:23, 158:10, 142:10, 142:17, porkies [1] - 44:11 161:8, 163:27 process [16] - 39:1, 142:21, 143:2, 144:7, posed [1] - 167:9 109:5, 110:5, 110:9, presumed [1] - 36:18 144:25, 145:13, position [21] - 27:21, 110:12, 110:15, presuming [2] -145:27. 146:2. 146:3. 28:1, 30:6, 48:3, 51:4, 113:19, 114:15, 163:24, 163:25 146:14, 146:29, 53:3, 56:28, 57:1, presumption [2] -114:18, 144:24, 148:3, 148:8, 148:11, 57:14, 101:26, 144:28, 145:13, 36:19, 36:29 148:12, 149:14, 110:14, 117:21, 145:15, 145:29, pretty [1] - 56:25 150:24, 152:24, 160:12, 166:29 122:2, 125:29, 129:1, prevalent [1] - 30:19 168:27, 172:12, 129:2, 143:12, 144:6, programme [6] prevent [8] - 76:1, 173:13, 175:10, 144:20, 174:23 97:17, 118:1, 118:3, 123:24, 128:25, 176:2, 176:4, 176:6, positive [1] - 144:8 118:22, 119:11, 148:8, 148:11, 176:16 Positive [1] - 154:15 165:18 148:14, 175:14, promotions [18] possession [1] programmes [1] -176:15 45:28, 65:23, 68:3, 86:21 119:13 preventing [1] -70:20, 87:6, 125:13, possibilities [1] **progress** [1] - 101:8 75:27 131:18, 132:14, progressed [1] -128:1 previous [14] -132:15, 132:16, possibility [4] -101:27 16:29, 26:6, 28:13, 133:6, 133:26, 134:7, 13:28, 112:12, 127:3, progression [2] -28:29, 61:4, 68:21, 135:7, 143:18, 53:24, 97:8 127:4 70:3. 85:19. 99:1. 145:13, 166:29, possible [11] - 41:7, promote [11] - 75:9, 110:29, 111:29, 176:21 44:21, 61:27, 61:28, 75:10, 75:11, 115:26, 114:2, 139:20, 139:21 promotions" [1] -63:12, 102:14, 124:25, 124:26, previously [3] -131:9 113:20, 127:2, 142:24, 147:19, 65:10, 107:27, 155:19 **proof** [4] - 38:23, 148:29, 172:21, 148:15, 150:24 print [2] - 37:4, 38:26. 38:28 176:15 promoted [26] -133:21 proper [2] - 36:10, possibly [4] - 25:22. 47:19, 71:9, 74:9, printed [7] - 32:7, 116:9 79:4, 82:18, 86:10 74:13, 74:15, 75:7, 34:5, 35:21, 35:26, properly [2] -75:17, 76:16, 85:12, Post [4] - 64:27, 77:15, 77:19 122:20, 122:21 65:20, 80:10, 80:15 86:29, 95:22, 105:22, printer [5] - 77:15, proposal [1] - 163:15 105:24, 107:29, post [3] - 138:24, 77:16, 77:17 propose [1] - 120:10 118:2, 123:9, 123:25, 138:29, 154:9 private [1] - 68:29 proposed [3] -124:29, 129:6, posted [1] - 79:25 privately [1] - 26:12 146:2, 163:1, 163:3 132:20, 143:5, 143:9, postpone [2] - 11:27, privilege [4] - 30:29, 147:15, 149:24, prosecuted [2] -31:11, 33:21, 34:18 153:27, 172:20 34:26, 35:10 precursor [1] - 11:13 probe [3] - 65:29, prospects [1] - 126:9 promotion [87] prefer [1] - 170:28 119:4, 119:24 Protected [2] - 65:2, 16:9, 45:13, 45:22, prepared [4] - 58:17, probes [1] - 119:27 125:4, 141:19, 165:8 45:27, 46:3, 46:4, problem [14] - 11:25, PROTECTED[2] -46:6, 64:17, 64:20, presence [2] - 96:9, 51:17, 73:16, 112:18, 38:2, 43:3, 45:6,

32:3, 35:6, 35:10, 117:13, 172:25, rank [8] - 15:16, 95:24, 100:7, 121:23, references [4] - 52:1, 173:23 45:14, 45:22, 64:20, 150:21, 154:5, 123:6, 131:3, 137:4 37:2, 39:14, 45:1, 154:10, 155:28, 165:6 48:10, 49:11, 52:19, 100:28, 101:14, referred [16] - 7:27, Q 53:12, 53:21, 55:24, recent [6] - 32:25, 106:16, 151:21 8:15. 62:27. 64:5. ranking [1] - 135:26 108:21, 160:26, 90:23. 91:22. 93:13. 56:24, 57:11, 58:1, ranks [1] - 24:9 161:28, 162:13, 58:20, 59:1, 61:19, 94:4, 95:29, 96:3, QUAY [2] - 2:24, 167:23 114:23, 125:5, 70:20, 71:19, 74:22, rapidly [1] - 150:12 2:31 75:5, 77:1, 77:3, 77:5, reckless [3] -139:28, 140:18, rapport [2] - 61:23, queried [1] - 118:4 173:19, 175:29, 77:7, 77:13, 78:21, 172:25, 173:2 61:25 query [1] - 99:12 176:17 referring [9] - 10:9, 83:28, 86:1, 88:6, rather [5] - 47:17, questionable [1] reclassification [1] -10:14, 12:5, 12:28, 90:15, 91:18, 92:22, 69:25, 82:2, 82:12, 68:28 95:13, 105:19, 174:11 33:2 19:6, 50:3, 128:4, questioned [2] -106:29, 107:24, re [3] - 80:11, 80:15, reclassified [1] -139:1, 154:7 97:26, 120:25 107:28, 108:22, 32.28 refers [8] - 60:29, 174:14 questioning [1] -108:25, 109:9, 91:11, 112:10, 121:7, recollect [3] re-examination [1] -93:27 109:22, 115:21, 102:13, 102:15, 130:29, 137:26, 174.14 questions [15] -118:17, 121:25, 126:10 156:25, 169:28 read [45] - 10:6, 12:6, 6:15, 15:24, 24:25, 123:7, 124:16, recollection [4] reflected 131 -12:23, 12:24, 12:25, 30:19, 78:17, 87:4, 124:19, 125:22, 102:21, 123:18, 65:7, 72:25, 78:27, 13:15, 18:27, 18:29, 99:17, 99:22, 113:12, 127:14, 128:20, 131:20 167:8 27:26, 28:15, 28:26, 154:25, 166:29, 130:6, 132:16, recommended [2] reflecting [1] -40:11, 40:12, 47:21, 169:29, 171:2, 174:15 132:26, 142:20, 67:12, 71:21, 78:4, 57:12, 57:29 117:12 quickly [1] - 63:1 142:26, 144:9, 145:7, recommending [2] reflection [1] - 129:1 78:9, 78:13, 78:15, QUINN [1] - 3:10 145:17, 146:6, 146:7, 45:5. 85:6 reflects [1] - 172:2 78:28, 87:23, 94:21, Quinn [5] - 62:3, 149:5. 153:6. 153:21. 99:12, 105:16, 115:4, record [11] - 23:4, regard [4] - 66:25, 62:6, 62:17, 90:20, 158:18, 158:20, 118:8, 120:11, 126:1, 23:24, 27:1, 64:28, 90:29, 112:29, 134:26 136:27 159:5, 161:13, 126:2, 133:17, 67:10, 92:29, 94:23, regarding [2] -163:26, 165:9, 170:9, quite [4] - 38:21, 133:20, 136:12, 120:11, 128:29, 154:7, 165:18 56:14, 63:12, 138:21 175:18, 176:24 144:16, 160:18, 131:27, 176:23 region [2] - 24:11, quotation [7] relatively [1] -160:20, 161:18, recorded [9] - 52:10, 28.19 120:10, 171:9, 100:25 161:22, 161:23, 58:19, 66:8, 68:13, Region [2] - 154:7, 171:12, 171:26, relevance [1] - 43:16 163:11, 168:5, 168:23 81:5, 104:18, 126:14, 159:17 172:3, 176:9, 176:10 reading [7] - 11:1, relevant [22] - 15:13, 130:26, 142:1 registered [3] - 91:8, quotations [2] -20:10, 25:10, 31:14, 33:23, 43:7, 54:18, recording [8] - 9:14, 138:24, 138:29 171:26, 173:29 70:4, 82:6, 111:17, 104:14, 111:24, 68:21, 69:13, 69:16, **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:5 quote [1] - 174:2 112:3, 112:24, 113:4, 161:10 69:17, 88:25, 92:16, regularly [2] quoted [1] - 120:29 113:25, 115:16, ready [1] - 103:19 128.14 100:12, 100:19 116:7, 131:12, quotes [1] - 171:9 real [2] - 43:16, 57:1 records [3] - 23:19, Regulations [1] -133:25, 136:13, quoting [2] - 174:5, realises [1] - 46:10 93:4, 107:7 111:2 136:25, 136:26, 174:9 redacted [1] - 40:1 reality [5] - 8:19, rein [1] - 55:28 156:21, 159:9, 60:19, 73:7 **REDDY** [1] - 4:5 reinforce [2] - 56:25, 173:14, 174:19 R really [11] - 68:3, refer [7] - 11:20, 104:29 reluctance [1] -77:10, 83:19, 83:20, 21:16, 59:20, 112:9, reinforces [1] -84:28, 116:25, 133:24, 133:26, 48:24 radio [5] - 79:10, reluctant [2] - 26:19, 124:10, 135:25, 137:21 reject [1] - 84:15 118:1, 119:11, 124:11 152:28, 158:23, 175:5 reference [34] relate [3] - 131:12, 128:16, 165:17 rely [1] - 11:24 reason [6] - 26:20, 15:11, 17:25, 19:26, 132:5, 137:27 raise [4] - 52:26, relying [1] - 12:14 29:3, 53:18, 58:3, 20:10, 23:1, 27:16, related [10] - 52:6, 147:29, 176:27, remember [52] -83:21, 120:13 32:17, 39:26, 53:5, 53:4, 57:17, 57:21, 176:28 9:10, 9:12, 11:6, 66:19, 68:25, 69:15, reasonably [1] -57:26, 68:15, 119:13, raised [14] - 15:10, 12:13, 13:19, 13:22, 152:20 96:24, 96:25, 97:13, 119:27, 131:14, 15:11, 22:9, 23:9, 13:29, 22:12, 23:11, 109:21, 113:2, 118:1, reassure [1] - 11:23 131:21 23:17, 23:19, 26:21, 23:16, 25:29, 41:17, Rebel [1] - 130:21 120:17, 121:20, relates [3] - 21:19, 123:2, 125:7, 171:2, 46:18, 47:11, 47:13, 121:27, 134:15, rebuke [1] - 117:11 114:3, 120:23 171:25, 171:27, 172:3 47:29, 48:7, 49:2, 137:14, 137:24, receive [3] - 15:2, relating [3] - 97:29, raised.. [1] - 170:18 53:28, 53:29, 54:27, 157:26, 159:24, 138:23, 155:27 112:20, 112:27 raising [1] - 169:29 65:24, 75:25, 79:3, 160:1, 161:25, received [18] - 7:8, relation [84] - 6:16, rampant [1] - 42:2 81:9, 81:12, 83:4, 14:29, 51:7, 64:16, 164:18, 164:26, 13:27, 15:7, 16:8, Rang [1] - 103:14 83:13, 83:16, 83:20, 78:1, 80:28, 89:18, 165:2, 165:26, 166:2, 19:20, 21:13, 22:11,

166.12

91:8, 94:12, 94:24,

rang [3] - 103:29,

137:1, 140:10

22:24, 24:20, 25:23,

85:22, 88:8, 88:12,

89:9, 90:20, 95:16, 169:13 116:3 second [25] - 8:6, 160:1, 161:19, 96:11, 96:23, 125:28, respond [1] - 123:5 **RTÉ's** [1] - 119:10 14:3, 18:4, 32:16, 162:10, 162:17, 126:29, 129:24, response [2] - 59:12, rules [2] - 114:29, 39:2, 39:27, 52:2, 163:6, 163:12, 129:26, 132:7, 165:13, 165:23, 52:13, 54:17, 65:11, 151:13 116:2 66:7, 68:10, 74:2, 132:23, 134:20, responsibility [3] rumour [7] - 40:25, 166:19, 167:3, 78:24, 82:17, 103:25, 167:18, 168:2, 168:9, 135:28, 162:9, 15:5, 75:3, 166:16 40:27, 41:28, 42:5, 169:23, 171:7, 171:17 42:8, 42:19, 42:23 110:2, 119:8, 123:26, 168:24, 169:1, responsible [3] repeat [1] - 160:7 169:11, 169:20, 127:8, 132:10, 135:2, 68:20, 164:2, 168:17 rumours [1] - 135:19 repeated [2] -135:6, 135:23, 162:10 169:28, 171:7, 171:8, rest [4] - 50:16, 59:9, run [2] - 39:19, 56:22 146:11, 152:18 secondhand [1] -173:17, 175:28 60:2, 69:23 running [1] - 44:12 repeatedly [1] -RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 92:16 seeking [5] - 70:29, restored [1] - 93:7 result [2] - 50:18, seconds [1] - 66:27 73:2, 122:15, 132:27, 147:5 repeating [3] -147:10 **Section** [1] - 110:24 S seem [2] - 11:12, 128:17, 168:13, section [14] - 6:16, resulted [1] - 74:28 169-25 16:20, 37:23, 58:18, 159:14 **RESUMED** [4] - 6:1, Safety [1] - 89:22 66:8, 107:16, 107:18, selected [4] - 64:19, rephrased [1] -64:10, 109:17, 150:14 **sake** [1] - 116:18 101:7, 125:14, 151:23 99.12 107:22, 110:26, **RETIRED** [7] - 3:5, sanction [2] -113:7, 113:13, 114:1, selection [1] **reply** [2] - 17:16, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, 111:13, 111:15 114:6, 116:21 110:15 30:28 3:12, 3:13 sanctioned [1] send [3] - 48:4, sections [1] - 58:17 replying [1] - 157:1 retired~[5]-7:10,111:11 security [1] - 95:11 48:15, 142:7 report [8] - 37:9, 24:3, 29:16, 49:6, **SANDRA**[1] - 4:3 **sending** [3] - 65:9, 52:28, 71:12, 99:3, 104:3 see [122] - 7:20, 9:20, sat [1] - 10:8 85:19, 146:26 99:13, 159:7, 159:12, retires" [1] - 130:28 10:16, 11:18, 11:25, satisfied [1] - 69:22 senior [15] - 20:18, 159.13 11:27, 13:4, 13:14, return [2] - 14:10, reported [17] - 53:26, satisfying [1] -13:29, 16:3, 16:18, 66:9, 66:13, 67:15, 23:6 117:23 54:5, 54:19, 65:8, 17:11, 18:2, 24:13, 67:18, 118:2, 120:24, revealed [1] - 166:6 Saturday [1] - 154:5 133:24. 133:28. 71:11, 72:3, 72:4, 32:12, 34:7, 35:5, reversed[1] - 176:1 **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 161:20, 163:21, 72:5, 73:27, 75:19, 35:28, 37:6, 45:16, reverted [1] - 130:19 166:27, 167:22, 76:4, 76:12, 91:28, saw [1] - 32:6 47:5, 47:15, 47:21, reviewed [1] - 45:29 96:8, 125:26, 127:21, SC [11] - 2:6, 2:7, 52:13, 52:16, 54:10, 172:11, 172:15 revisit [1] - 70:2 129:5 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 55:3, 56:28, 57:9, sense [1] - 24:7 right-hand [1] -3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:3, 58:15, 58:21, 60:29, sensible [3] - 15:26, represent [1] -77:16 61:1, 62:16, 62:19, 64:2, 69:25 113:17 rights [1] - 33:5 scandal [1] - 102:4 62:29, 65:27, 66:5, represents [1] sent [14] - 18:5, ringing [3] - 13:6, SCANLAN [1] - 3:8 67:13, 68:10, 68:17, 37:13, 53:8, 77:26, 13:24, 69:2 68:18, 69:5, 70:12, reputation [3] scanned [1] - 14:6 85:22, 117:4, 142:8, road [5] - 114:3, scenario [9] - 172:9, 70:23, 72:16, 72:19, 142:15, 145:18, 40:21, 152:14, 152:21 146:18, 146:19, 72:26, 74:26, 77:14, request [3] - 28:23, 172:25, 172:26, 145:22, 154:9, 156:22, 156:23 80:6, 83:27, 88:26, 163:16, 163:23, 52:28, 53:20 173:12, 173:14, **ROAD**[1] - 2:18 89:8, 96:2, 97:23, 175:20, 175:25, 171:20 requested [2] roads [1] - 29:27 98:2, 98:5, 98:10, 53:14, 69:11 176:18, 176:19 sentence [7] - 41:11, robbery [2] - 31:29, 99:8, 109:29, 111:5, scenes [2] - 144:18, 48:2, 70:13, 89:11, requested.. [1] -111:21, 111:26, 158:23 115:19, 120:2, 131:11 107.22 robustly [1] - 174:5 112:12, 114:10, separate [4] - 49:16, scheme [2] - 36:8, require [1] - 114:29 role [3] - 30:19, 114:12, 115:20, 123:17 113:2, 113:19, 134:2 required [7] - 110:5, 101:3, 102:26 118:29, 119:6, 111:26, 112:19, scoping [1] - 163:4 separately [1] roles [1] - 175:29 119:16, 120:1, 122:22 113:26, 114:22, screen [6] - 8:1, room [2] - 122:11, 120:10, 126:22, 68:6, 96:27, 160:17, September [27] -115:8, 115:11 133:8 130:21, 131:24, 101:27, 102:22, requires [1] - 96:27 164:14, 164:22 Rooney [1] - 44:5 135:12, 136:9, scribbled [1] - 79:22 103:9, 103:11, **RESOLUTIONS** [1] roughly [2] - 124:21, 136:22, 138:6, 104:11, 104:17, scrutiny [2] - 66:11, 158:16 138:11, 141:29, 106:28, 108:6, resources [4] -67:16 round [5] - 15:27, 142:12. 142:14. 117:29, 118:10, Seamus [4] - 7:17, 162:14, 162:28, 101:5, 135:3, 135:6, 143:10, 143:21, 121:18, 121:20, 163:1. 166:14 8:20, 8:24, 11:7 135:23 146:21, 147:4, 126:6, 127:9, 128:15, RESOURCES [1] -SEAN[4] - 1:12, 2:2, **RTÉ** [12] - 97:17, 147:14, 151:11, 128:24, 129:3, 2:22, 3:17 117:29, 118:5, 152:4, 152:10, 153:3, 130:10, 130:26, **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 respect [5] - 107:9, 118:12, 118:20, 154:20, 154:24, 130:27, 140:27, searches [3] - 102:3, 111:10. 116:4. 118:22, 119:20, 154:26, 155:3, 143:15, 143:17, 173:18, 173:25 125:15, 126:18 120:4, 165:17, 159:13, 159:24, 144:1, 144:5, 144:10, respectfully [1] seats [1] - 26:7 167:12, 167:29,

107:27, 118:11, 14:29, 15:3, 15:15, 170:2 118:24, 118:26, 118:21, 120:5, sequence [2] - 22:8, 125:3, 151:12, 165:4, 121:24, 121:28, 120:4, 124:27, 22:4, 45:11, 54:2, 60:26, 69:2, 69:10, 25:9 169:6 122:4, 128:16, 134:18, 140:3 142:15, 142:17, 71:16, 71:18, 72:13, SERGEANT [5] **shows** [1] - 41:6 speaks [2] - 24:1, 3:12, 3:20, 4:2, 4:3, sick [14] - 21:1, 142:19, 143:7, 175:5 74:20, 76:6, 76:9, 48:23, 52:6, 52:10, 145:20, 145:26, 76:10, 76:12, 88:22, 4.3 specific [4] - 33:18, 52:20, 53:3, 56:29, 146:26, 147:28, 114:6, 135:22, 168:3 89:7, 91:5, 91:19, Sergeant [11] -148:12, 163:17, 91:26, 93:14, 93:15, 27:13, 27:14, 47:10, 57:4, 66:15, 67:20, specifically [1] -166:5, 166:10, 94:9, 97:11, 129:25, 49:13, 49:15, 49:17, 68:13, 69:2, 69:13, 95.1 49:20, 49:28, 51:7, 69:23 167:21, 169:16, 138:4, 138:8, 138:12, speculate [1] -96:8, 96:21 side [15] - 10:16, 169:29, 171:27, 129:26 139:3, 143:25, 153:5, 171:28, 172:4 155:20, 155:29, sergeants [1] - 50:17 13:4, 21:9, 46:29, speculation [3] -**SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:8 156:11, 156:25, **series** [1] - 169:29 72:16, 77:16, 122:13, 35:29, 173:11, 176:11 158:21 solicitor's [3] -126:15, 127:8, **speech** [1] - 33:10 serious [10] - 29:7, 141:13, 145:6, 168:24 171:2, 171:4, 171:13 statements [2] -29:8. 33:2. 33:26. speeches [4] -155:16, 155:17 sight [1] - 170:12 SOLICITOR'S [1] -45:9, 56:8, 85:26, 72:29, 122:4, 146:12, station [6] - 11:12, 114:16, 114:17, sign [1] - 86:4 146:25 32:25, 40:25, 41:28, signed [5] - 78:26, SOLICITORS [5] -115:25 spending [1] - 43:26 42:2, 42:6 79:1, 79:29, 153:15, 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, seriously [1] - 31:18 **spin** [2] - 32:11, Station [2] - 42:20, served [1] - 10:5 153:18 4:5 32.14 similar [2] - 23:5, **solicitors** [1] - 76:7 125:9 Services [1] - 1:24 **spirits** [1] - 63:18 stationed [1] -**SERVICES**[1] - 1:29 24:5 someone [11] splash [1] - 148:29 105:22 22:19, 39:24, 75:29, **simple** [9] - 25:18, spoken [6] - 18:12, serving [2] - 38:28, 28:25. 60:21. 60:22. 76:8, 79:16, 79:27, status [1] - 120:7 172:14 44:22, 47:8, 48:9, 73:22, 75:8, 95:14, 87:2, 88:28, 161:11, stay [5] - 59:20, 54:6, 167:5 **set** [1] - 34:4 153:14, 175:16 168:26, 176:6 59:22, 59:29, 60:1, setting [1] - 152:5 **spun** [1] - 24:10 somewhere [2] -60:2 seven [1] - 144:6 simpler [1] - 14:21 spy [1] - 59:10 **simplify** [1] - 8:1 9:29, 77:18 stenographic [1] several [4] - 27:16, spying [1] - 59:7 simply [3] - 50:1, sooner [1] - 12:14 119:13, 119:27, stage [33] - 18:2, sorry [59] - 7:25, 8:6, 51:21, 131:27 stenography [1] -153:26 18:7, 44:24, 44:29, 10:8, 12:24, 14:4, SINÉAD [1] - 4:4 45:4, 45:20, 46:1, Shakespeare [1] -18:4, 19:25, 21:26, STENOGRAPHY[1] SINéAD [1] - 2:7 46:16, 49:1, 56:29, 17:16 22:29, 26:22, 33:23, 1:29 sit [2] - 38:22, 99:20 **SHANE** [1] - 3:23 70:26, 77:25, 81:20, 36:5, 36:25, 39:21, **SHANKEY**[1] - 3:21 step [2] - 27:22, **sitting** [2] - 19:19, 85:11, 85:17, 87:25, 45:3, 47:17, 47:26, 101:3 177.4 90:14, 91:12, 101:8, SHANKEY-SMITH 49:23. 50:24. 66:7. STEPHANIE[1] situation [8] - 24:5, 101:25, 104:19, [1] - 3:21 67:8, 74:1, 81:24, 108:8, 114:17, 122:3, 33:3, 33:26, 54:5, **SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 86:13, 88:11, 88:22, **STEPHEN** [1] - 2:21 106:17, 153:25, 135:25, 144:22, Shannon [3] - 120:4 94:10, 94:18, 95:14, 153:26, 176:27 144:24, 145:11, stewardship [2] -137:24, 138:10 97:9, 100:2, 106:10, 160:5, 160:11 six [4] - 57:14, 121:2, 146:22, 151:1, share [1] - 167:11 108:24, 110:2, still [11] - 32:24, 139:5, 166:7 154:17, 155:9, 175:8 Shatter [1] - 85:24 110:19, 111:20, skullduggery [4] stages [1] - 8:2 38:3, 59:21, 71:6, SHEAHAN[1] - 3:18 118:25, 126:28, 90:4, 90:5, 90:6, 90:7, **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 145:6, 148:20, **stalingrad** [1] - 17:21 130:10, 131:11, 90:18, 116:22, 158:23 175:17, 176:5 stalled [1] - 144:27 SHIP [1] - 3:28 133:5. 133:14. **sky** [1] - 136:2 stood [4] - 69:23, stand [5] - 11:4, **shop** [1] - 44:3 139:16, 140:23, 69:24, 129:16, 161:16 slightest [1] - 156:27 11:5, 35:17, 56:22, short [3] - 6:15, 141:1, 143:3, 143:26, stop [16] - 14:2, slightly [3] - 40:3, 71.6 27:20, 69:1 154:3, 156:4, 156:20, 65:11, 71:1, 75:7, 115:22, 124:10 stands [2] - 130:3, **shortly** [1] - 101:23 162:23, 162:25, 86:29, 91:25, 112:21, **SM** [1] - 13:6 161:12 **shot** [1] - 55:16 164:8, 164:16, 126:23, 131:9, Star [3] - 130:13, **small** [4] - 131:5, shouting [2] - 22:19, 169:18, 169:20, 133:22, 136:24, 131:18, 131:25, 130:22, 130:24 53:18 169:21, 171:22, 177:2 131:27, 132:19, 138:21 start [4] - 8:6, 58:9, show [4] - 9:26, sort [3] - 24:5, 26:19, 148:13, 169:4, 176:4 smaller [1] - 130:14 73:3, 124:16 39:21, 39:26, 62:26 127:12 stopped [1] - 132:27 **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 **started** [1] - 67:13 showed [2] - 57:23, sorted [1] - 38:2 stories [1] - 44:2 SMITHFIELD [1] starts [1] - 136:26 124.27 sought [3] - 120:24, storm [1] - 146:29 **STATE**[1] - 3:27 **shown** [19] - 6:23. 148:28, 152:19 story [3] - 22:28, sober [1] - 93:2 State [1] - 80:22 22:2, 26:3, 46:14, source [4] - 42:5, 24:24. 39:19 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 state [2] - 102:21, 50:23, 51:27, 60:25, 51:15, 83:17, 174:18 straightaway [1] solicitor [28] - 9:17, 104:17 67:28, 89:6, 92:27, speaking [7] - 18:9, 53:16 73:25, 76:6, 118:20, statement [38] -97:24, 98:4, 109:23,

STREET [3] - 2:12, 3:28, 3:32 stress [10] - 45:10, 52:6, 53:4, 57:17, 57:20, 57:21, 57:26, 57:28, 68:15, 69:12 stressed [1] - 56:11 stresses [1] - 44:27 strictly [2] - 70:4, 169.10 strings [1] - 34:10 strong [3] - 33:5, 144:25 strongly [3] - 161:4, 161:29, 163:14 stuff [27] - 9:18, 22:20, 36:8, 43:5, 43:6, 44:9, 44:10, 44:27, 48:10, 48:25, 54:11, 54:24, 81:12, 93:7, 93:14, 100:14, 127:13, 144:16, 144:18, 145:21, 156:23, 156:24, 158:22, 159:13, 170:9, 173:4 stunt [2] - 149:12, 149.14 sub [1] - 26:11 sub-claims [1] subheading [2] -98:18, 98:26 subject [4] - 111:3, 152:17. 160:25. 163:4 subjected [2] - 66:9, 67:15 submissions [2] -116:8, 117:1 submit [1] - 38:29 submitted [2] -100:27, 102:8 subsequently [2] -75:12, 110:25 substance [1] -156:13 successful [3] -64:17, 101:13, 106:14 sufficiently [1] - 14:7 **suggest** [48] - 9:6, 9:23, 11:13, 13:21, 30:21, 30:26, 32:9, 33:17, 34:14, 34:29, 35:12, 39:5, 44:24, 56:13, 57:1, 59:11, 70:28, 72:13, 72:21, 72:26, 74:26, 75:6, 76:18, 76:27, 81:8, 88:1, 106:23, 108:1, 112:18, 114:21,

114:28, 115:20, 116:3, 122:5, 123:1, 128:23, 146:21, 149:18, 151:1, 151:11, 152:4, 152:6, 153:4, 173:17, 173:21, 174:13, 175:28, 176:14 suggested [3] - 38:6, 65:14, 65:15 suggesting [15] -31:18, 36:16, 73:15, 73:20, 74:3, 82:9, 82:27, 83:3, 83:6, 83:10, 84:13, 87:21, 94:1, 124:12, 153:7 suggestion [4] -28:24, 47:26, 123:23, 168:17 suggestions [1] -133:11 suggests [4] - 13:24, 55:10, 112:27, 167:28 suitability [3] -143:1, 143:4, 143:8 suitable [2] - 101:16, 146.14 summer [1] - 101:26 summonses [1] -39:17 Sunday [3] - 64:26, 65:19. 165:14 Superintendent [212] - 16:9, 20:28, 22:4, 22:10, 26:27, 30:7, 30:23, 31:2, 31:20, 31:24, 32:25, 33:20, 34:4, 34:19, 34:23, 34:26, 35:1, 35:16, 38:8, 38:23, 39:13, 39:18, 40:15, 40:17, 40:21, 40:23, 41:1, 41:21, 41:28, 43:1, 43:4, 43:9, 43:13, 43:26, 43:29, 44:3, 44:13, 44:16, 44:23, 45:13, 45:21, 47:6, 47:10, 47:16, 47:18, 48:27, 51:5, 52:1, 52:3, 52:10, 52:18, 53:25, 54:3, 54:8, 54:15, 55:12, 55:24, 56:4, 58:16, 58:19, 59.1 59.3 59.17 61:13, 61:17, 62:13, 63:4, 64:16, 65:23, 66:19, 66:25, 68:9, 68:14, 70:16, 71:9,

71:12, 71:14, 73:5,

73:15, 73:21, 74:5,

74:12, 74:29, 75:7, 75:15, 76:14, 76:20, 77:1, 78:21, 80:10, 84:7, 85:11, 86:28, 87:4, 87:9, 88:6, 88:19, 88:24, 91:6, 91:7, 91:25, 92:14, 92:23, 92:28, 93:13, 94:9, 94:11, 94:13, 94:24, 95:20, 95:29, 96:4, 96:9, 97:14, 97:15, 97:28, 98:8, 98:23, 99:5, 99:13, 99:18, 100:1, 100:4, 100:12, 100:13, 100:15, 100:18, 100:20, 100:27, 101:28, 102:2, 102:4, 102:17, 102:18, 102:25, 103:18, 105:1, 105:21, 106:14, 106:29, 107:5, 115:25, 117:28, 121:19, 121:21, 121:26, 122:2, 122:6, 122:16, 122:24, 123:8, 124:18, 124:19, 124:26, 125:4, 125:8, 125:11, 125:13, 125:17, 125:18, 126:4, 126:7, 126:8, 126:17. 126:19. 127:26, 128:17, 128:21, 128:24, 131:21, 132:19, 132:26, 133:3, 134:19, 135:6, 136:26, 137:1, 140:4, 141:19, 142:10, 142:21. 143:8. 143:14, 144:21, 145:14, 145:27, 146:3, 146:12, 146:26, 147:1, 147:6, 149:20, 150:19, 151:4, 151:14, 152:8, 153:7, 153:10, 154:4, 154:8, 154:11, 156:21, 156:29, 165:5, 165:11, 165:20, 170:6, 170:10, 170:14, 173:13, 175:9, 176:16 **SUPERINTENDENT** [15] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21

40:26, 45:14, 45:22, 50:21, 53:10, 64:18, 70:17, 70:18, 95:23, 97:2, 97:4, 97:19, 97:20, 100:28, 101:15, 106:15, 128:29, 134:11, 138:28, 138:29, 144:4, 151:21 superintendent's [1] - 144:7 Superintendent's [1] - 92:10 superintendents [2] 140:9, 158:20 superior [1] - 34:15 superiors [1] -170:15 supplied [3] - 22:15, 119:19, 144:9 **supply** [3] - 53:22, 161:14, 165:8 support [5] - 106:4, 137:19. 140:11. 140:12, 173:3 supported [1] -55:21 supports [2] - 61:11, 61:19 suppose [4] - 48:25, 55:14, 116:18, 116:20 supposition [1] -176:11 suppressing [1] -168:26 surmising [1] - 88:27 surprise [1] - 70:15 surprised [1] -161:19 suspicion [3] -105:10, 144:25, 145:5 suspicions [3] -85:26, 105:18, 144:22 swiftly [1] - 151:27 switched [1] -130:17 system [3] - 35:14, 37:21, 95:26 **SÍOCHÁNA** [1] - 3:2 Síochána [27] - 24:1, 24:8, 28:12, 28:28, 29:5, 29:26, 37:23, 50:14, 52:21, 59:22, 70:21, 73:26, 74:8, 75:3, 76:5, 76:8,

79:14, 81:27, 85:6,

111:1, 124:25,

151:27, 151:29,

152:15, 161:18,

165:7, 173:28

Síochána" [1] -109:27 Т **T&N** [1] - 3:31 table [1] - 79:22 tail [1] - 10:21 Taoiseach [1] -19:18 **TARA**[1] - 3:22 target [4] - 38:23, 54:15, 86:28, 152:20 targeted [2] - 25:23, 152:19 targeting [6] - 30:22, 30:27, 34:15, 85:11, 87:1, 122:6 tax [18] - 22:12, 22:13, 23:5, 23:10, 23:14, 23:15, 23:21, 25:14, 25:15, 25:19, 25:24, 25:28, 26:2, 26:14, 26:15, 26:23, 27:7, 68:29 **Taylor** [4] - 138:23, 138:26, 140:2, 140:4 **TD**[7] - 16:20, 37:24, 37:25, 72:19, 87:14, 87:22, 134:16 **TDs** [5] - 27:21, 28:17, 29:20, 36:1, 63:8 team [2] - 8:26, 166:15 telephone [3] - 8:14, 9:7, 151:13 telephoned [2] - 8:9, **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 Templemore [1] -139-27 ten [1] - 16:4 tend [1] - 9:5 tenor [1] - 59:18 term [1] - 20:10 terms [18] - 22:8, 51:5, 52:15, 68:24, 77:29, 97:8, 99:3, 101:5, 101:26, 122:2, 132:4, 137:23, 143:12, 144:20, 148:29, 170:26,

174:8, 176:2

18:14

tested [1] - 24:6

9:1, 11:15, 18:5,

that's.. [1] - 89:3

text [6] - 7:8, 8:24,

- 8:24, 9:1, 16:10,

superintendent [25]

59:19, 149:27, 153:12 that.. [1] - 163:29 21:14, 50:21, 53:16, turning [5] - 37:28, understatement [1] triggering [1] - 72:28 that`s [1] - 171:12 57:10, 57:13, 57:16, 61:29, 85:3, 110:18, 55:7 THE [11] - 1:3, 1:7, 143:17 true [13] - 35:19, 167:14 understood [4] top [12] - 17:24, 21:3, 41:3, 41:7, 41:21, turns [2] - 105:11, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 113:24, 163:2, 21:16, 29:25, 61:2, 42:9. 42:10. 42:11. 176:12 163:14 174:7 6:1, 64:10, 109:17, 87:17, 89:11, 89:15, 150:14, 177:12 42:12, 42:23, 92:24, **TV** [1] - 128:16 understood" [1] -112:11, 130:22, 92:25, 94:16, 99:15 themselves [5] twice [1] - 155:13 156:24, 167:18 24:4, 24:22, 36:24, trust [12] - 34:12, twisted [2] - 43:6, understood.. [1] topic [1] - 174:26 46:20, 59:4, 81:14, 36:27, 117:23 92:23 168:7 topical [1] - 37:27 81:15, 81:20, 82:4, **THEN** [4] - 64:10, undertaken [1] two [24] - 21:8, 109:17, 150:14, totally [3] - 37:7, 86:10, 86:13, 91:1, 21:29, 26:6, 46:29, 154:14 177:12 37:17, 119:12 139:29, 145:12 52:15, 56:20, 56:22, underway [1] thereafter [2] touch [3] - 24:3, trusted [2] - 29:12, 58:17, 66:27, 75:28, 128:26 43:22, 73:28 101:23, 140:12 82:21, 92:20, 92:21, unearth [1] - 102:3 truth [2] - 40:24, 43:5 115:6, 130:10, 132:2, therefore [2] - 34:29, touched [6] - 74:2, unearthed [2] -84:26 85:14, 85:18, 91:19, truthful [1] - 152:29 146:20, 147:26, 125:15, 126:18 139:21, 173:5 truths [1] - 43:6 156:15, 158:20, thick [1] - 57:19 unfair [4] - 36:18, touches [1] - 173:7 174:27, 174:28, 175:1 thickens [1] - 136:17 try [13] - 59:20, 60:6, 76:28, 151:18, 152:7 touted [2] - 66:12, 73:14, 75:6, 93:22, two-line [1] - 132:2 thinking [3] - 117:12, unfortunately [4] -95:8, 122:7, 124:3, Twomey.. [1] - 20:23 117:14, 156:26 67:17 58:12, 60:18, 95:17, thinks [2] - 26:27, towards [4] - 40:29, 139:14, 139:17, type [6] - 77:12, 153:3 61.26 59:17. 70:12. 121:11 146:18, 146:29, 77:28, 78:29, 79:24, unimportant [1] third [8] - 32:22, TOWNPARKS[1] -173:12 99:24, 135:25 83:8 trying [52] - 25:21, typed [10] - 9:29, 53:1, 66:7, 67:4, 2:12 unlawful [1] - 65:14 37:8, 38:23, 40:17, 10:1, 10:20, 10:22. 87:17, 144:23, traffic [1] - 114:3 unless [1] - 96:27 144:27, 176:4 train [2] - 34:4, 60:9 41:6, 41:12, 42:25, 11:29, 12:8, 12:24, unreasonable [2] thirdhand [1] tranquility [1] -42:29, 48:19, 55:23, 14:12, 15:22, 155:17 66:11, 67:16 60:2, 60:5, 60:8, 67:3, 129:22 11:29 **typewriter** [1] - 77:25 unscrupulous [1] -73:23, 73:29, 74:17, typographical [1] thoughts [1] - 58:11 transcribed [1] -75:15, 75:23, 76:1, 143:26 9.15 three [11] - 15:24, **UNTIL** [1] - 177:12 83:25, 85:15, 87:16, Tánaiste [3] - 46:20, 52:20, 52:21, 52:26, transcript [5] - 1:25, unusual [2] - 11:19, 89:1, 93:10, 122:18, 56:26, 60:12, 60:16, 6:25, 9:14, 11:29, 80:15, 80:23 82:18 124:14, 124:21, 60:20, 60:23, 67:5, 12:9 **up** [50] - 7:29, 8:17, 124:25, 124:26, U 174:28 transcription [1] -22:21, 22:24, 22:27, 131:9, 131:18, throughout [3] -10:27 24:21, 24:27, 25:10, 131:26, 138:11. 29:5, 149:19, 151:27 transferred [1] - 29:6 31:15, 34:8, 37:8, ultimately [3] -139:11, 146:8, thrown [1] - 44:11 transmitted [1] -37:25, 38:14, 38:15, 43:18, 91:12, 153:24 147:11, 149:11, THURSDAY[1] -43:18 43:25, 51:22, 55:23, unacceptable [2] -149:12, 149:13, 177:12 Transparency [3] -55:28, 56:3, 56:21, 154:28, 159:26 149:14, 151:7, 57:18, 59:17, 59:19. Thursday [4] - 103:9, 77:4, 77:6, 78:2 unaware [1] - 76:26 152:24, 158:29, 103:11, 103:24, 61:2, 65:13, 69:20, transparency [1] -159:2, 159:6, 159:12, unbearable [1] -134:27 49:6 73:24, 76:6, 93:10, 58:12 159:23, 162:20, ties [1] - 48:12 transparent [1] -93:24, 99:25, 100:8, unclear [1] - 14:18 162:21, 176:4, 176:5 104:25, 123:28, time. [1] - 116:12 86:5 under [26] - 17:11, Tullamore [2] -136:16, 138:11, **TO** [1] - 6:10 **transpires** [1] - 59:6 28:7, 37:23, 55:19, 61:21, 77:18 138:13, 139:20, TREACY [1] - 2:27 today [5] - 18:14, 58:10, 59:2, 59:17, turn [29] - 12:21, 142:1, 148:27, 149:6, 56:23, 75:14, 137:5, treated [2] - 49:12, 63:19, 65:1, 65:3, 17:6, 17:21, 18:17, 155:5, 155:18, 176:26 56:13 66:7, 68:19, 68:22, 19:13, 19:21, 46:23, 155:19, 155:21, today" [1] - 18:6 treatment [8] -69:12, 74:7, 74:11, 51:28, 52:15, 52:25, 156:12, 159:8, together [7] - 89:1, 43:12, 43:21, 45:1, 110:23, 110:26, 61:3, 64:25, 65:25, 161:13, 161:16 141:14, 147:10, 45:6, 57:12, 57:29, 111:1, 112:6, 113:18, 66:4, 70:7, 84:19, 148:18, 170:28, 177:5 **update** [2] - 107:20, 58:1. 161:5 113:28, 134:4, 99:3, 99:7, 110:2, 108:13 Together [1] -TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, 113:29. 119:29. 137:26, 142:4, 152:25 updated [1] - 108:15 154:15 134:26, 136:22, **UNDER** [2] - 1:2, 1:8 updating [1] - 162:7 **TOM** [1] - 3:12 **Tribunal** [9] - 10:4, 138:17, 143:12, **Under** [2] - 131:9, upfront [2] - 152:1, 49:21, 96:25, 102:8, tomorrow [2] -131.18 154:2, 154:19, 152:27 128:20. 129:17. 177:1, 177:9 166:21, 167:18 underestimate [1] -133:18, 138:5, 159:9 upper [1] - 58:18 **Tony** [1] - 71:12 turned [1] - 105:13 152:12 upset [1] - 51:10 TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8 took [13] - 7:24, 7:27, TURNER [1] - 2:28 undergo [1] - 57:29 urgent [6] - 77:27, 8:14, 8:15, 9:7, 9:25, tried [4] - 24:5,

78:29, 79:24, 80:25, 82:24, 83:5
urgently [2] - 80:1, 84:29
urging [2] - 142:23, 146:13
utterances [1] - 97:22
uttered [1] - 38:6

### ٧

vacancy[1] - 144:4 vacuum [1] - 147:22 valid [1] - 156:5 Varadkar [6] -132:12, 132:16, 132:18, 132:26, 133:2, 133:5 various [4] - 24:8, 44:27, 115:23, 130:2 vehicle [1] - 26:7 vengeance[1] -147:5 venture [1] - 147:26 verbatim [1] - 1:25 version [9] - 9:29, 10:2, 10:3, 10:20, 10:22, 14:12, 40:3, 125:18, 129:24 versus [1] - 153:22 via [1] - 36:15 view [13] - 11:23, 46:15, 48:4, 48:15, 57:11, 57:16, 75:13, 77:9, 86:9, 86:16, 125:12, 126:8, 151:20 **views** [3] - 13:1, 73:19.88:6 vilification [2] -152:18, 153:9 vilified [1] - 31:25 Vincent [1] - 134:24 vindicated [2] -49:20, 50:18 vindictive [1] - 69:1 viral [1] - 57:24 virtually [1] - 29:9 visit [8] - 53:27, 53:28, 54:21, 60:29, 61:26, 89:14, 92:1, visits [1] - 158:17 Volume [46] - 9:28, 22:3, 23:3, 26:4, 27:22, 39:7, 45:12, 46:24, 46:28, 47:2, 47:4, 50:23, 51:27,

54:3, 58:15, 60:25,

63:23, 65:26, 67:28, 77:21, 87:8, 89:6, 91:6, 92:27, 94:11, 98:4, 100:23, 109:23, 117:28, 118:26, 121:18, 125:3, 130:7, 140:27, 141:13, 143:14, 151:12, 154:2, 154:19, 164:5, 164:25, 164:27, 165:2, 165:17, 169:6 volume [6] - 10:5, 70:9, 94:10, 143:13, 164:13, 165:4 volumes [4] - 12:12, 46:29, 144:16, 168:23

#### W

wait [1] - 41:18 waiting [2] - 78:25, 118:2 walking [2] - 21:5, 21:9 **wall** [1] - 84:16 Wallace [71] - 17:5, 17:27, 18:5, 18:10, 18:13, 18:15, 18:23, 19:3, 19:5, 19:9, 19:12. 19:16. 19:19. 22:9, 22:14, 22:16, 22:17, 22:18, 23:9, 23:23, 23:25, 24:1, 24:15, 24:19, 26:21, 26:23, 27:4, 28:18, 28:24, 29:21, 30:6, 30:16, 31:4, 31:9, 32:8. 34:6. 34:17. 36:15, 37:5, 37:15, 37:16, 38:16, 38:27, 39:19, 40:20, 42:13, 53:17, 72:29, 77:11, 81:23, 81:25, 82:2, 84:21, 95:29, 96:26, 97:1, 97:13, 97:18, 97:26, 99:12, 99:20, 124:15, 124:28, 136:10, 136:16, 146:10, 146:16, 148:6, 149:7, 149:28 **wallace** [1] - 96:3 Wallace's [1] - 97:21 wants [2] - 107:28, 157:2 warning [3] - 55:16, 70:16 Wars [3] - 130:13, 130:22, 130:24 watch [3] - 55:20,

68:19, 68:22

Water [1] - 89:21 ways [1] - 156:15 Wednesday [3] -20:15, 20:19, 64:15 WEDNESDAY [2] -1.18 6.1 week [9] - 43:3, 43:29, 48:18, 73:8, 96:15, 147:2, 149:19, 163:17 Week [4] - 118:22, 119:10, 120:4, 166:5 week's [1] - 48:25 weeks [2] - 32:25, 167:23 weird [1] - 106:24 welcoming [1] welfare [18] - 43:10, 44:18, 53:27, 54:21, 58:20, 58:22, 58:24, 58:25, 59:6, 59:9, 59:10, 61:10, 61:19, 62:3, 62:6, 62:9, 90.19 92.1 WELLINGTON [1] western [1] - 24:11 WESTMEATH[1] -Westmeath [3] -

WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31

western [1] - 24:11

WESTMEATH [1] - 4:1

Westmeath [3] - 28:12, 28:29, 30:1

Wexford [1] - 24:29

whatsoever [1] - 116:20

Wheatley [1] - 47:10

WHEATLEY [1] - 3:4

whereas [1] - 129:6

whereby [3] - 65:4, 172:10, 172:15

whilst [2] - 70:18, 71:9

whistleblower [5] - 26:14, 53:3, 65:29, 97:6, 119:3

whistleblowers [6] 49:11, 55:21, 87:12,
87:22, 88:2, 88:15
WHITE [1] - 3:11
who.. [1] - 81:3
whole [18] - 19:28,
25:9, 25:15, 30:15,

31:2, 35:7, 57:25, 59:25, 59:26, 88:7, 124:17, 130:18, 133:20, 137:7, 140:8, 149:4, 159:14

**Wicklow** [3] - 28:13, 29:1, 30:1

wildfire [1] - 135:19

171:27 **works** [1] - 37:21

wish [6] - 20:9, 111:17, 112:3, 112:24, 115:16, 154:28 wishes [1] - 21:11 withheld/lost [1] -172:19

Wilson [2] - 16:20,

wing [1] - 73:2

49:7

159:11 witness [8] - 10:19, 10:29, 15:10, 15:13, 109:1, 109:9, 117:18, 150:3

WITNESS [22] - 5:2, 6:5, 10:7, 12:8, 14:4, 14:20, 14:22, 14:24, 40:14, 82:15, 82:20, 82:23, 82:28, 83:2, 83:7, 95:3, 103:4, 103:6, 103:9, 106:25, 106:28, 113:10 witnesses [2] -

witnesses [2] - 49:18, 174:16 wonder [11] - 6:14, 6:23, 16:12, 22:2, 26:3, 82:6, 109:23, 125:2, 141:12, 150:2, 160:16

wonderful [2] - 38:1, 106:24 wool [1] - 121:25 word [10] - 30:18, 34:20, 44:12, 55:26, 59:21, 62:6, 112:11,

121:12, 124:24 word-for-word [1] -121:12 worded [10] - 38:13,

71:27, 76:2, 102:15, 102:17, 126:13, 127:6, 129:18, 129:22, 171:17 wording [12] - 38:12, 102:19, 126:11, 127:6, 127:7, 133:20, 171:16, 171:18, 171:19, 175:16

words [14] - 6:26, 18:6, 28:15, 38:6, 38:9, 55:8, 85:13, 106:16, 116:11, 118:27, 124:11, 126:15, 127:12,

works [1] - 37:21 worry [3] - 14:25,

worse [1] - 149:25 would've [1] - 99:19 wouldn't.. [1] - 16:26 write [7] - 72:21, 73:9. 73:25. 76:7. 84:28, 132:25, 142:20 writes [1] - 156:28 writing [29] - 7:11, 7:13, 20:17, 21:21, 32:2, 71:6, 73:17, 73:18, 74:4, 74:21, 75:2, 76:22, 79:21, 80:1, 80:19, 80:24, 84:16. 125:19. 132:15, 132:18, 136:24, 138:21, 147:23, 169:9, 173:22, 175:25 written [29] - 21:28, 32:27, 39:20, 51:25, 57:24, 59:5, 59:8, 68:22, 78:20, 82:8, 88:26, 94:18, 94:22, 95:1, 108:6, 119:11, 131:29, 132:1, 133:19, 136:1, 145:26, 151:13, 152:22, 167:6, 167:21, 173:9, 174:21, 174:22, 176:1 wrongdoing [2] -25:4, 114:15 wrongly [1] - 30:9 wrote [25] - 21:29, 27:23, 46:11, 46:15, 46:16, 46:18, 46:21, 52:24, 67:24, 68:8, 71:5, 77:22, 79:20, 79:25, 102:18, 115:23, 144:21,

65:18, 127:28

## Υ

145:21, 151:14,

163:27, 166:15,

167:16, 174:3,

175:12, 176:6

yapping [1] - 42:3 ye [2] - 146:17 year [6] - 28:11, 74:19, 76:13, 93:16, 97:3, 130:7 years [2] - 18:8, 26:8 yesterday [7] - 6:24, 7:20, 7:23, 8:16, 13:27, 15:10, 154:10 young [1] - 67:10 yourself [7] - 27:27, 28:13, 29:1, 44:5, 56:29, 78:10, 146:28 **Yvonne**[1] - 49:13

Ζ

**zero** [1] - 51:12

É

ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 Éireann [7] - 22:11, 30:1, 30:8, 31:6, 96:1, 96:4, 97:18 ÉIREANN [2] - 1:4, 1:5

# Ó

**Ó** [31] - 3:7, 19:28, 20:27, 21:7, 48:29, 52:28, 54:8, 55:11, 55:22, 55:27, 63:7, 102:11, 102:24, 102:25, 103:10, 103:19, 103:27, 104:19, 104:29, 105:1, 105:5, 105:20, 105:29, 106:6, 107:26, 107:27, 127:11, 133:19, 133:27, 134:9, 163:16