TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON TUESDAY, 3RD DECEMBER 2019 - DAY 124

124

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR.

DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC PATRICK MARRINAN SC SINÉAD McGRATH BL JOHN DAVIS, SOLICITOR MR. MS. MR.

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY

& GARDA DAVID TURNER: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY

RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURRAY 10. 11.

13.

SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15.

INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16.

16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE

BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON
INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN

30.

31.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN

34.

35.

SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 36. 37.

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL PAUL CONNELLAN

T&N McLYNN BASTION COURT

11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR.

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O'ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

INDEX

WI TNESS	PAGE
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY	
DTRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	6

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON TUESDAY, 3RD	
2			DECEMBER 2019:	
3				
4			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CONTINUED TO BE	
5			DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN, AS FOLLOWS:	10:18
6				
7	1	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Good morning, chief superintendent.	
8		Α.	Good morning, Chairman.	
9	2	Q.	If we could have page 184 up on the screen. What were	
10			the circumstances giving rise to this direction that	10:30
11			you sent to the sergeant in charge and for the	
12			attention of all members? What was the background to	
13			you	
14		Α.	Chairman, as I said yesterday, I met Garda Keogh on the	
15			26th March for the first time, and during the course of	10:30
16			dealing with his tax with him, he got annoyed, as I	
17			said, and in what I felt might be a reactionary way, he	
18			made a general allegation that are other people who may	
19			have issues with their cars. And when I heard that, I	
20			tried to explore it with him, but he wasn't anxious to	10:31
21			give me any information that might help any further	
22			with it. The allegation was just left there in that	
23			fashion.	
24	3	Q.	Did you make any other enquiries, perhaps of the	
25			inspectors or the sergeants, whether or not this was an	10:31
26			issue?	
27		Α.	well, I asked Garda Keogh first.	
28	4	Q.	Yes.	
29		Α.	And then he wouldn't go further. And I told him I	

1	couldn't	unhoar	i +	and T	h Luow	havo	+^	doal	with	i +
1	Coului L	unnear	ΙL	anu 1	would	nave	LU	ueai	WILII	ıı.

2 But he was anxious then that perhaps I not deal with

- 3 it.
- 4 5 Q. Yes.
- 5 A. Then I told him I would take his views on board, but I

10:31

10:31

10:32

10:32

10:32

- 6 couldn't unhear it and I would have to think about it.
- 7 So I did discuss it with both inspectors, to see how
- 8 would I handle this.
- 9 6 Q. Well first of all, when you spoke to them, did you ask
- them was this an issue? Were there members who were
- 11 not complying with the law in relation to their
- 12 vehicles?
- 13 A. I told them what had happened and neither of them
- 14 expressed any concern in that regard to me. We
- discussed it and how we might deal with it or what we
- might do about it. I felt that I suppose, every member
- 17 -- the allegation was, you know, toward every member in
- the absence of any information directly alleging any
- pain against anyone, and I felt, I suppose, that
- 20 everyone is entitled to the presumption of innocence
- and I couldn't go about, in the absence of specific
- information, accusing anybody of anything.
- 23 7 Q. So this direction was solely based on what had been
- said to you by Garda Keogh?
- 25 A. Absolutely, yeah.
- 26 8 Q. And you had no other anecdotal evidence to suggest that
- there were guards who weren't complying --
- 28 A. No.
- 29 9 Q. -- with their obligations under the Road Traffic Act.

Τ			In any event, it's dated 22nd th April 2015. It is:	
2				
3			"Members private vehicles.	
4				
5			I refer to the above and wish to inform each member	10:33
6			that I have been made aware in a general way that the	
7			private vehicles of some members are not in order in	
8			relation to"	
9				
10			And then you list:	10:33
11				
12			"no valid tax, no valid insurance, no valid NCT	
13			certs and no valid Driving Licences."	
14				
15			I don't think Garda Keogh had actually itemised the	10:33
16			offences which he believed had been committed by other	
17			members?	
18		Α.	No, he left it in a general way. He said that members	
19			had issues with their cars. I didn't know how to take	
20			that.	10:33
21	10	Q.	"In order to allay any fears that exist, I wish to	
22			advise all members that commencing on 1st June 2015 I	
23			will have the necessary checks carried out as	
24			follows"	
25				10:33
26			So you are giving a period in which members are to	
27			if they aren't complying with the requirements under	
28			the Road Traffic Act, this period is a period of grace,	
29			as it were, for them to put their act and get their act	

1			in order.	
2		Α.	Yeah, I don't see it like that, because I had no	
3			information that anyone wasn't complying with the Road	
4			Traffic Act. It's not normal for members of An Garda	
5			Síochána not to comply with the Road Traffic Act, in my	10:34
6			experience. You know, I haven't come across it too	
7			many times in my career.	
8	11	Q.	"All members will be asked to voluntarily present their	
9			vehicles and Driving Licences for inspection to their	
10			immediate supervisors, who will certify all is correct.	10:34
11				
12			The supervisors will in the same manner be asked to	
13			present their Driving Licences and vehicles for	
14			inspection to their immediate inspectors, who will	
15			certify all is correct.	10:34
16				
17			I will ask both inspectors to present to me.	
18				
19			In turn will present to the divisional officer.	
20				10:35
21			In that way I will be in a position to confirm members'	
22			private vehicles are in order in the district.	
23				
24			All members are reminded that any claims involving the	
25			use of a member's private vehicle will only be approved	10:35
26			if the vehicle being used complies with all road	
27			traffic legislation in force."	
28				
29			Had you previously, before you arrived in Athlone,	

Т			issued a similar direction in relation to any other	
2			station?	
3		Α.	Not that can recall.	
4	12	Q.	Pardon?	
5		Α.	No, not that I can recall.	10:35
6	13	Q.	Well, it would be something that you would recall,	
7			surely?	
8		Α.	well, I have been in 14 stations in my service	
9			altogether I think and I became an inspector in 2006,	
10			so I can't recall ever doing it in that period of time.	10:35
11	14	Q.	Well, I thought you were indicating that this was quite	
12			exceptional, that as far as you were concerned most	
13			members of An Garda Síochána complied with the	
14			requirements under the Road Traffic Act?	
15		Α.	That's my experience, yes.	10:36
16	15	Q.	That you didn't regard this as being an issue and that	
17			the only reason it was an issue was because Garda Keogh	
18			had raised it as an issue. Surely you would remember	
19			and recall if on a previous occasion that you had	
20			issued a similar direction?	10:36
21		Α.	I don't recall issuing one. I can't recall if I issued	
22			a similar direction in the past. That's all I can tell	
23			you about that.	
24	16	Q.	You're not in a position to say definitively that you	
25			didn't?	10:36
26		Α.	I can't tell you one way or the other, because I can't	
27			recall at the moment whether I did or not. But I mean,	
28			any person that uses their car on duty, that's allowed	
29			to, makes an application where they certify that	

- everything is correct with their car, on the form that
 they're applying. So, that's the normal circumstances
 in which I would deal with them, issue of members using
 their vehicles on duty.
- 5 17 You know what Garda Keogh's complaint is in relation to 10:37 Q. this; that he sees it as being victimisation of him 6 7 insofar as he was disciplined for a revenue offence in 8 relation the taxation of his vehicle. And what he says in relation to this is that people who perhaps were 9 quilty of more serious offences, such as no insurance, 10 10:37 11 no Driving Licences, were given a period of grace to 12 get their act together, as it were. What do you say in 13 relation to that?
- 14 Α. well, I think the complaint has, I suppose, conflated or twisted my action into a negative against Garda 15 16 Keogh in an unfair way. Garda Keogh, I suppose, made 17 the allegation in a general way, he wouldn't back it up 18 in any way when I asked him. I felt that I was in a position where to do nothing wasn't an option for me, 19 20 having heard what he had to say. Having discussed it with my inspectors and decided on this course of 21 22 action, to be fair to the hundred or so other employees 23 against whom the general allegation was made in that 24 way.

10:37

10:38

25 18 Q. You were interviewed by our investigators in relation 10:38
26 to this issue. If we could have page 3077 up on the
27 screen, please. And if we can scroll down to line
28 1051. You say:

29

1	"I decided to have everyone's vehicle checked. I	
2	understand one other member was in a similar position	
3	to Garda Keogh and was dealt with in the same fashion,	
4	i.e. by way of regulation 10."	
5		10:39
6	Further on, at 3079, please, at 1080, the question is:	
7		
8	"I have been asked, given that I issued a regulation 10	
9	notice to Garda Nicholas Keogh after he had remedied	
10	the situation regarding his car tax, and then gave	10:39
11	other Garda members a grace period of approximately	
12	five weeks to remedy any defects relating to tax,	
13	insurance, NCT, Driving Licences, whether this amounted	
14	to me targeting or discrediting Garda Nicholas Keogh as	
15	per term of reference (p)."	10:40
16		
17	Your answer is:	
18		
19	"No, absolutely not. I have explained how that came	
20	about. As noted above, there was one person who had to	10:40
21	back tax and that was dealt with in the same way."	
22		
23	Now, this was dealt with by the Tribunal in a series of	
24	letters, which I don't intend to open, but they're in	
25	Volume 54 and they're from page 15229 to 15236, for the	10:40
26	benefit of the parties. But the initial letter is	
27	written by the Tribunal's solicitor Mr. Davis to Alison	
28	Morrissay in the Chief State Solicitor's Office	

"We refer to previous correspondence in relation to the above and would be obliged for confirmation as to whether Garda Brendan Madden --"

This is the garda who was eventually nominated as the guard who received a regulation 10.

" -- was disciplined by way of regulation 10 or in any other way arising out of the resolution of his car tax issue in 2015/2016. If he was disciplined by way of regulation 10, please let us have a copy of the document. We look forward to hearing from you as soon as possible."

Now, it appears that Garda Madden wasn't disciplined by 10:41 way of regulation 10, you would accept that to be the position?

Α.

I wouldn't accept it to be the position. He was approached by a sergeant, I understand, who was I suppose to deal with this issue. To explain my involvement in it, because the certification of this was a live reminder in my office being dealt with by a clerk there to ensure it was being brought to a conclusion in a swift way. The initial report about the guard in question was made to me by his then sergeant, who had checked the other members and indicated that Garda Madden had a tax disk goods on his vehicle, but that all his other documents were in order. She indicated that she highlighted the matter

1			to him and asked him to rectify it. He then	
2			unfortunately was injured on duty and went sick for a	
3			period and the sergeants in that station changed. And	
4			Sergeant Moylan was transferred there. And in a	
5			reminder that went to him, I asked him to deal with the	10:42
6			matter immediately, as it was running since May '15 and	
7			Garda Madden was the last person to have certified.	
8			Sergeant Moylan indicated to me that Garda Madden was	
9			on sick leave. I said despite the fact he is on sick	
10			leave, it needed to be certified that his vehicle was	10:43
11			taxed and therefore you should visit him to deal with	
12			the issue. I asked him to report back to me on that.	
13			And he did report back to me to indicate that Garda	
14			Madden had corrected his tax and he had spoken to him	
15			about it and gave him advice.	10:43
16				
17			I think I explained yesterday, the discipline	
18			regulations and part 1 in regulation 10 allows	
19			unfettered, I suppose, discretion to the person dealing	
20			with the issue to deal with it under regulation 10.	10:43
21			It's a matter for Sergeant Moylan to indicate what way	
22			he felt the advice he gave to Garda Madden was dealt	
23			with or treated.	
24	19	Q.	If we could have Volume 31, page 87	
25			MR. KELLY: Judge, just before my learned Friend goes	10:44
26			on to that, could I ask what it was that the chief	
27			superintendent has been reading from, documents	
28			relating to this.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	

1	WITNESS: They're documents that were supplied to the	
2	Tribunal, I understand, it's in relation to the tax.	
3	Documents written by me.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Chief superintendent, just what is it, so	
5	that Mr. Kelly and everybody else knows exactly where	10:44
6	we	
7	WITNESS: It's the file in relation to Garda Madden's	
8	tax, car tax.	
9	CHAIRMAN: You have the materials relating to	
10	WITNESS: Yes.	10:44
11	CHAIRMAN: I suppose in fairness to Garda Madden, who	
12	isn't accused of anything and isn't here, we should	
13	I suppose there it is, he has been mentioned.	
14	MR. MARRINAN: He has been mentioned.	
15	CHAIRMAN: It's is not exactly the most heinous matter,	10:44
16	I think everybody would agree. So there it is. But	
17	what you are actually referring to are the notes which	
18	have been supplied to the Tribunal. Do we have those?	
19	MR. MARRINAN: I was just about to open the report from	
20	Sergeant Moylan in relation to the matter.	10:45
21	CHAIRMAN: Okay. But just before we go anywhere, so	
22	that we all know exactly where we are, chief	
23	superintendent, can you identify, is it a bundle of	
24	documents you have in front of you? There's no	
25	suggestion of any impropriety or anything, we just want	10:45
26	to clarify where we are at the moment. So the	
27	documents that you are referring to are documents in	
28	the Tribunal's voluminous disclosure?	
29	WITNESS. Ves I understand that	

1	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Can you identify them a bit more	
2	precisely so that we all know what documents you're	
3	actually referring to?	
4	WITNESS: They start off with a document from Sergeant	
5	McDonnell in Kilbeggan.	10:45
6	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Can I ask you this, is there a	
7	Tribunal number on them?	
8	WITNESS: Not on the one I have.	
9	CHAIRMAN: Not on the one have you. Thanks very much,	
10	okay. At least identify the document. So they are	10:46
11	Sergeant McDonnell, is that right?	
12	WITNESS: Sergeant McDonnell.	
13	CHAIRMAN: In Kilbeggan?	
14	WITNESS: And then a trail of correspondence after	
15	that.	10:46
16	CHAIRMAN: And a subsequent trail of correspondence	
17	from there. Now, Mr. Marrinan, can you help us with	
18	the trail that begins with sergeant McDonnell in	
19	Kilbeggan.	
20	MR. MARRINAN: Page 8785 of the materials, Volume 31.	10:46
21	CHAIRMAN: 8785.	
22	MR. MARRINAN: Yes.	
23	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Let's just do that for the moment.	
24	MR. MARRINAN: It's is a letter to Superintendent	
25	Murray dated 15th June 2015.	10:46
26	CHAIRMAN: And may I take it then that the next	
27	chief superintendent, when you're referring to a	
28	document, would you be good enough to let us know what	
29	it is what date it is so that we can identify the	

Т			specific number it is so we all know where we are	
2			going, do you understand?	
3			WITNESS: I do.	
4			CHAIRMAN: That it will certainly help me in looking at	
5			it afterwards. Anyway, so we have the account. If I	10:47
6			understand it, where we stand at the moment, the	
7			sergeant identified this as an issue, a similar issue,	
8			it would seem, taxed as a goods, whereas in fact should	
9			be taxed as private. That's the understanding of where	
10			we are. The garda in question, before the thing came	10:47
11			to a head or could be processed further, got injured on	
12			duty and was now on sick leave. Okay. The sergeant	
13			changed. So a new sergeant, that was Sergeant Moylan,	
14			came into the picture instead of Sergeant McDonnell.	
15		Α.	Yes.	10:47
16	20	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Who had been previously dealing with it?	
17		Α.	Correct, Chairman.	
18	21	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. You directed, suggested that Sergeant	
19			Moylan, notwithstanding the fact that the garda was on	
20			sick leave, that he should go out and speak to him and	10:48
21			get this sorted out?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	22	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It was sorted out, if I understand, in the	
24			sense that the garda corrected the tax on his car?	
25		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	10:48
26	23	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And if I understand where the evidence is at	
27			the moment, it is that, was it a matter then for the	
28			sergeant to deal with it under your general authority	
29			or what was the situation?	

1		Α.	That was the nature and tone of the way the whole idea	
2			of the check was drafted, that the sergeant would deal	
3			with any issue and if they weren't in a position to	
4			deal with it, to bring it to my attention.	
5	24	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So was it a matter for him to say,	10:4
6			make sure you don't do this again or to issue a notice	
7			or to proceed under regulation 10? Was that within the	
8			sergeant's authority?	
9		Α.	Yes, I was leaving that to the sergeant.	
10	25	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. And was that something that could be	10:4
11			left to a sergeant's authority?	
12		Α.	Well, yes, Chairman. I am satisfied that that is	
13			something that was within the sergeant's remit.	
14	26	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
15		Α.	And that the discipline regulations allow for that.	10:4
16			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, I'm sorry for interrupting and	
17			just summarising, but that's my understanding of where	
18			we stand at the moment. And we have the document 8785,	
19			Mr. Marrinan, and we are going to proceed from there,	
20			is that right?	10:4
21			MR. MARRINAN: well, I'm not going to go back that far.	

25 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

WI TNESS:

question.

22

23

24

26

27

28

29

WITNESS: I think he offered some excuse, in that he was a farmer and he a herd number and this was a second vehicle he had. You know, he felt that because of the occupation or part-time occupation he was involved in

Just before Mr. Marrinan goes on, just to

10:49

make it very clear in relation to the member in

1	with the farming, that it entitled him to have the
2	vehicle taxed in a goods class, which slightly differed
3	from Garda Keogh's situation. And I am sure the
4	sergeant took that into account.

- MR. MARRINAN: But, chief superintendent, I think there 10:50
 was also a substantial difference between he and Garda
 Keogh, because he was in breach after the 1st June,
 after the period of grace, he continued to tax his
 vehicle as a goods vehicle, isn't that right?
- 10 A. I don't know that. He back taxed it, corrected it. I 10:50
 11 don't know to what date. I don't have that in front of
 12 me. He that too.

10:50

10:51

10:51

13 Perhaps if we have page 8792 up on the screen please 28 Q. 14 because this is the report from Sergeant Moylan in 15 relation to the matter. He sets out the background 16 there, that he took over responsibility for Kilbeggan Garda station on the 20th July. This is clearly after 17 18 the 1st June, and the period of grace, if you can call 19 it that, has expired. Then in November 2015 he received correspondence in relation to a query of a 20 privately owned vehicle. Then he refers to 21 22 correspondence, in the second paragraph, that he 23 received from you, his district officer, in January 24 2016 to visit the guard, to certify that his vehicle 25 was taxed correctly. He arranged to meet him. informed him that he was involved in farming. 26

27

28

29

"He told me that he would tax it privately and call into the station to show me his tax disk when he had it

1			done. "	
2				
3			So, therefore, the offences continued on into January	
4			2016, some six months after the direction that you had	
5			issued. He then goes on to say:	10:52
6				
7			"I informed him that it was my belief that he had an	
8			obligation to tax his vehicle privately if it was being	
9			used other than in the course of his business. He	
10			accepted my explanation and told me he would tax it	10:52
11			privately and call in to the station to show me his tax	
12			disk when he had it done.	
13				
14			I understood this advice which I gave to the guard as	
15			negating the need for any further disciplinary action,	10:52
16			as I subsequently inspected the disk at Kilbeggan Garda	
17			station in February 2016, took a copy of it and	
18			reported the fact to the district officer that was all	
19			now in order."	
20				10:53
21			So, I think the point here is, chief superintendent,	
22			that when you were questioned about this by the	
23			Tribunal investigators you held this case up as a case	
24			that was dealt with in a similar fashion by way of	
25			regulation 10, as that of Garda Keogh's?	10:53
26		Α.	That was my understanding.	
27	29	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	That the sergeant dealing with it had given advice.	
29	30	0	But do you accept that it wasn't dealt with in a	

1			similar fashion?	
2		Α.	In that there was no notice given?	
3	31	Q.	Yes.	
4		Α.	The actual notice?	
5	32	Q.	Yes.	10:53
6		Α.	But that was a matter for the sergeant to make that	
7			decision. He the same unfettered	
8	33	Q.	But do you accept that it wasn't dealt with in the same	
9			way and in the same manner in which you dealt with it?	
10		Α.	Well, I mean, I accept there was no notice given to the	10:53
11			particular guard in question.	
12	34	Q.	Do you accept you didn't deal with it in the same	
13			manner?	
14		Α.	Well I wasn't dealing with it.	
15	35	Q.	Or wasn't dealt with in the same manner?	10:53
16		Α.	I accept it was dealt with you know, there was no	
17			notice given, that's what I accept. I accept that the	
18			difference is that there was no notice given, that the	
19			actual regulation 10 notice wasn't given to this guard.	
20	36	Q.	Well, we will move on from that then in relation to	10:54
21			that. We have a statement from Garda Madden, it's at	
22			page 15236. He says:	
23				
24			"In November 2015, I was contacted by Sergeant Cormac	
25			Moylan of Kilbeggan Garda station regarding the taxing	10:54
26			of my privately owned jeep. I informed Sergeant Moylan	
27			that I was recovering from a serious operation, having	
28			been injured on duty and that I would contact him in	
29			early January 2016, where it was anticipated that I	

1			would be returning on duty. I was again contacted by	
2			Sergeant Moylan in January 2016 and I took his informed	
3			advice and changed my tax on my jeep to private."	
4				
5			It doesn't say anything there about being disciplined.	10:55
6				
7			"I got a new tax disk for my jeep and produced it to	
8			Sergeant Moylan in Kilbeggan in February 2016."	
9				
10			Then he goes on to say that he taxed it commercially	10:55
11			because he was an owner of a farm and had a herd number	
12			and that his jeep was used primarily for farming. Is	
13			there anything else you want to say in relation to	
14			that?	
15		Α.	No. No two cases are the same. The standard is what's	10:55
16			important and I left it to the sergeant to deal with	
17			any issues that arose on their unit in relation to any	
18			issue that they might find and this was the only one	
19			brought that came to my attention. I think Garda	
20			Keogh's may have been certified again to have been all	10:56
21			correct in this process, the same as everyone else.	
22	37	Q.	Just before we move on to issue 7, if I just refer you	
23			to contact that you had with Detective Superintendent	
24			Mulcahy. If we could have Volume 13, 3910 up on the	
25			screen, please. This is a statement from Detective	10:57
26			Superintendent Mulcahy. If we can just scroll down.	
27			Sorry, if we stop there.	
28				
29			"On 27th April 2015, I rang the reporter to update him	

_				
2			welfare. He confirmed to me that he a planned meeting	
3			with Mick Quinn, the welfare officer, on the 1st May.	
4			I also rang Superintendent Pat Murray and advised him	
5			regarding the action taken and the reporter had asked	10:58
6			me to ring him and explain to him that he was not bad."	
7				
8			Do you recall that, that telephone conversation?	
9		Α.	I do. That telephone conversation came about as a	
10			result of Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and I	10:58
11			interacting around Garda Keogh's welfare and to have a,	
12			I suppose, a welfare officer assigned to him.	
13	38	Q.	At that stage you had two meetings with Garda Keogh, is	
14			that right?	
15		Α.	Yes.	10:58
16	39	Q.	I understood you to say that in relation to the first	
17			meeting that the two of you shook hands and that the	
18			second meeting ended amicably	
19		Α.	Both meetings ended amicably, yes.	
20	40	Q.	Did this surprise you, that Detective Superintendent	10:59
21			Mulcahy was conveying a message to you from Garda Keogh	
22			that he wasn't a bad person?	
23		Α.	Yeah, well I didn't know what was meant by it and	
24			neither did Detective Superintendent Mulcahy.	
25	41	Q.	It may suggest that relations weren't particularly good	10:59
26			at that stage and that Garda Keogh was being somewhat	
27			defensive in relation to what he might have been	
28			perceived to have been a close examination of him by	
29			you?	

on the investigation and enquiring regarding his

1

Т		Α.	I don t know what his perception was. He has told us	
2			here that he had some preconceived idea, that I was	
3			sent to Athlone on day one to get him. I'm afraid I	
4			knew nothing about that until very late, when all these	
5			things started to manifest against me.	11:00
6	42	Q.	Okay, if we can move on then to issue 7, and it	
7			concerns events between the 11th July and the 14th	
8			July. I think that you were contacted by Sergeant	
9			Cormac Moylan on the 14th July at 9:05am. If we could	
10			have page 2218 up on the screen, please. This is an	11:00
11			e-mail that was sent to you from Sergeant Moylan and it	
12			reads:	
13				
14			"I am not sure if you are aware that Nick Keogh has not	
15			been in work all weekend. He went sick last Thursday	11:0
16			and Friday and reported fit for duty on Friday night	
17			but has not attended yet. I was on leave on Saturday	
18			and it appears he did not appear into work on that	
19			night. He was not on leave on Sunday or Monday night	
20			either and did not turn up for work. I have tried	11:01
21			calling him but he has not or returned my calls.	
22				
23			Just said I'd let you know, meant to say it to you	
24			earlier as wasn't sure if you knew. It appears from	
25			others that he has 'broken out' and is drinking in	11:01
26			Tul I amore. "	
27				
28			If we just go to the statement of Sergeant Moylan in	
29			that regard, it's at page 607, paragraph 4.2, if we	

1			scroll down.	
2				
3			"I was Garda Keogh's unit sergeant at the time of his	
4			sick report on 9th July 2015 and subsequent call to	
5			report off sick on 10th July 2015. However, I was on	11:02
6			annual leave on the 10th and 11th July 2015 and resting	
7			on the 12th July. I returned to work on Monday, the	
8			13th July, when I became aware that Garda Keogh had not	
9			shown up for duty on the previous two days. I tried to	
10			call him, to no avail. I subsequently reported his	11:02
11			absence to the district officer, Athlone,	
12			Superintendent Murray by e-mail.	
13				
14			The e-mail was sent to the district inbox at 3:15am on	
15			the 14th July."	11:02
16				
17			And then he details the e-mail that I have just opened.	
18			At 4.4 on the following page, 608, he says:	
19				
20			"At 00:29 I received the following Facebook message	11:03
21			from Garda Keogh: 'Sorry about this week, Cormac. I	
22			missed your call and haven't credit to call you back.'"	
23				
24			Then he said he didn't acknowledge that message. As a	
25			result of receiving the e-mail, did you then make	11:03
26			contact with Garda Keogh?	
27		Α.	I did, on the 15th of July.	
28	43	Q.	Will you just tell us the conversation that you had in	
29			that regard?	

1		Α.	I phoned Garda Keogh at about twelve midday to find out	
2			what had happened, that he hadn't turned up to work.	
3	44	Q.	Your note in relation to this, and it might help you,	
4			the first note to be found is at page 2219 and it's	
5			dated, it says:	11:0
6				
7			"Wednesday, 15th July 2015. Phoned Garda Nick Keogh re	
8			absent without leave. See notes."	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	45	Q.	If we go over the notes to page 2220, Wednesday, 15th	11:0
11			July is now Tuesday, the 14th July?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	46	Q.	Can you say how that happened?	
14		Α.	It's a mistake on my part. I conflated the date on the	
15			e-mail when I was writing the note.	11:0
16	47	Q.	And also the day of the week?	
17		Α.	Yes, which was the same day, the 14th.	
18	48	Q.	But I think your position now is that you accept that	
19			in fact it was Wednesday, the 15th July, is that right?	
20		Α.	That's always been my position.	11:0
21	49	Q.	Well, I wonder whether that is correct, but we will	
22			come to that now in a minute. But anyway, the note	
23			reads:	
24				
25			"Tuesday, 14th July 2015.	11:0
26				
27			Report to me by Sergeant Moylan that Garda Keogh was	
28			AWOL for four days, Saturday the 11th July to Tuesday	
29			the 14th July. Phoned member at twelve noon. Spoke to	

1 him for 15 minutes."

2 A. Yes.

- 3 50 Q. Will you just tell us now, with the aid of your note 4 there, what you recall being said?
- 5 It was a very open and frank conversation that Garda Α. 11:05 6 Keogh was very open with me in dealing with it. 7 admitted that he was absent without leave and he went 8 on to explain that, that he had signed off sick on the 10th July, after drinking for a few days, and he had 9 forgotten that he had reported off sick and then didn't 11:06 10 11 go to work and he continued drinking. And he admitted 12 that he had a drink problem and that he had stopped 13 going to AA. He went on to describe to me then his 14 drinking habit and how he would drink.
- 15 51 Q. Yes. Is there anything else there that you think might 11:06 be important?
- 17 Yes. Well, he brought up the whistleblower case and he Α. 18 explained that he was worried about Garda A and another 19 member and that they might get him. And then I put the 20 alternative to him and I explained or challenged him that they had done nothing since it came to light and 21 22 nothing had happened since Garda A was informed or questioned about the allegation. So I was trying to 23 24 allay his fears in that regard. I challenged him about 25 not answering the sergeant's call during the weekend and he said he no credit. I put the point that credit 26 27 wasn't required to answer a call. And he indicated at that stage that he had to continue going sick as well. 28 I said to him then that I had to request a case 29

11:06

11 · 07

1			conference and I would have to consider discipline and	
2			I would seek an explanation from him in writing.	
3	52	Q.	Do you recall whether or not he mentioned the fact that	
4			he had phoned Sergeant Moylan or had contacted him via	
5			his Facebook?	11:07
6		Α.	He did mention Facebook to me, yes. Yeah.	
7	53	Q.	In what context did he mention it?	
8		Α.	That he had used Facebook to contact the sergeant. And	
9			I said that wasn't I didn't feel that was an	
10			acceptable way to make contact about a matter as	11:08
11			important as being absent from work for four days.	
12	54	Q.	So how did you leave him on that phone call?	
13		Α.	He wanted me to ignore it, if I could. And I said to	
14			him that I felt it was poor behaviour, he had let his	
15			colleagues down and there were resource issues	11:08
16			obviously over the weekend in relation to what had	
17			happened. And there was a concern for him as well, no	
18			one knew where he was for four days. And I felt, you	
19			know, drinking, while it might be an explanation, that	
20			it wasn't or couldn't be an excuse in my view.	11:08
21	55	Q.	Then if we could have Volume 11, page 225. 2225, I beg	
22			your pardon. This is a letter you sent to the sergeant	
23			in charge on the 16th July. It's headed:	
24				
25			"Absent without Leave - Garda Keogh.	11:09
26				
27			Garda Nick Keogh, unit C, reported fit for duty on	
28			Friday, 10th July 2015. However, he failed to	
29			report"	

1				
2			Then you set out the days.	
3				
4			"An explanation by return is now required from the	
5			member."	11:09
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	56	Q.	well, he had given you an explanation on the phone,	
8			isn't that right?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	57	Q.	Why were you writing then looking for an explanation?	11:09
11		Α.	I explained to him that I was considering discipline	
12			and that I would seek an explanation from him. I was	
13			open and upfront with him about that, and this was the	
14			follow up for what I said I would do.	
15	58	Q.	And then his response is at page 2227 of the material,	11:10
16			dated 21st July 2015?	
17				
18			"Sergeant Monaghan, with reference overleaf, I made a	
19			mistake regarding the reporting unfit for duty. I	
20			thought I was still on sick those days. I apologise	11:10
21			for same. Sick cert is attached. Forwarded for your	
22			information."	
23				
24			And then at page 2228 of the material, we have the sick	
25			cert dated 16th July 2015.	11:10
26				
27			"This is to certify that the above patient was	
28			medically unfit for work from 9th July to 15th July due	
29			to work related stress. He was certified medically fit	

1			to work on the 16th July onwards."	
2				
3			Were you happy with the medical certificate that had	
4			been sent in?	
5		Α.	well, it appeared clear to me from the certificate that	11:11
6			perhaps Garda Keogh may not have been to the doctor	
7			until the 16th July.	
8	59	Q.	was that the only issue that you had with it?	
9		Α.	It appeared to be a retrospective medical cert to cover	
10			the period that he was absent without leave.	11:11
11	60	Q.	And did you see something wrong with that?	
12		Α.	No, but I thought it was unusual, you know. I felt	
13			that he tried to report off sick again as if he hadn't	
14			reported off sick on the 10th as well, on that same	
15			day, the 15th. I thought both those things were	11:11
16			unusual, in that he was trying to explain this in some	
17			way without dealing with the underlying issue that had	
18			caused the problem, when he felt it was going to recur.	
19	61	Q.	Did you think the contents of the medical certificate	
20			were false?	11:12
21		Α.	I couldn't question the contents of a medical	
22			certificate from a doctor. I have no business doing	
23			that.	
24	62	Q.	Did you confront Garda Keogh in relation to your	
25			concerns about the medical certificate?	11:12
26		Α.	No. I had asked him for an explanation. He had sent	
27			in an explanation, and I had, what I had.	
28	63	Q.	But you had a problem in relation to the medical	
29			certificate, is that right?	

	Α.	I had a problem, two things: The retrospective aspect	
		of it and the fact that he had tried that day or did	
		that day try and report off sick again, as if he had	
		never reported off sick on the 10th. Those two things	
		together.	11:1
64	Q.	So anyway, you report to the chief superintendent in	
		relation to the matter. If we could have page 8800 on	
		the screen, please. This is a letter dated the 19th	
		July from you to Chief Superintendent Lorraine	
		Wheatley.	11:1
		"Sick report Garda Keogh.	
		I refer to the above named member, who, following my	
		request, was reviewed by the Occupational Health	11:1
		Service on the 19th May. Unfortunately Garda Keogh's	
		absences from work continue on a very frequent basis.	
		At present, a pattern has developed where he reports	
		unfit for duty on early and late tours, works on night	
		tours and reports fit for duty to avail of rest days."	11:1
		Was that your belief in relation to the matter?	
	Α.	That is what was happening, yes.	
65	Q.	"On Friday, 10th July 2015, the member reported off	
		sick leave and fit for duty but was then absent without	11:1
		leave for four days between Saturday, 11th July 2015	
		and Tuesday, 14th July inclusive. After availing of	
		64 Q.	of it and the fact that he had tried that day or did that day try and report off sick again, as if he had never reported off sick on the 10th. Those two things together. 64 Q. So anyway, you report to the chief superintendent in relation to the matter. If we could have page 8800 on the screen, please. This is a letter dated the 19th July from you to Chief Superintendent Lorraine Wheatley. "Sick report Garda Keogh. I refer to the above named member, who, following my request, was reviewed by the Occupational Health Service on the 19th May. Unfortunately Garda Keogh's absences from work continue on a very frequent basis. At present, a pattern has developed where he reports unfit for duty on early and late tours, works on night tours and reports fit for duty to avail of rest days." Was that your belief in relation to the matter? A. That is what was happening, yes. 65 Q. "On Friday, 10th July 2015, the member reported off sick leave and fit for duty but was then absent without leave for four days between Saturday, 11th July 2015

28

29

four rest days, the member has appeared to work today,

Sunday the 19th July. As I am sure you will agree,

1			this type of attitude towards work commitments is	
2			unacceptable and must be addressed immediately so that	
3			the district force can have confidence in that the work	
4			demands placed on them apply fairly and objectively to	
5			every member."	11:14
6				
7			Was that a view that you shared?	
8		Α.	That's my view.	
9	66	Q.	That you shared with the chief superintendent at that	
10			time?	11:14
11		Α.	That's my view.	
12	67	Q.	How strongly did you hold that view?	
13		Α.	I hold that view in relation to behaviours of this	
14			nature, where alcohol is involved, where it impacts on	
15			the workplace.	11:15
16	68	Q.	"As a result of the member's absence without leave, I	
17			phoned him on Tuesday, the 14th July."	
18				
19			So your position hasn't always been that it was	
20			Wednesday, the 15th July?	11:15
21		Α.	Well, it's a mistake by me, you know. I conflated, as	
22			I said, the e-mail Sergeant Moylan sent on Tuesday the	
23			14th with the date I made the phone call.	
24	69	Q.	"As a reason for being absent without leave, he	
25			indicated that when he reported off sick on Friday, the	11:15
26			10th July, he was very drunk, had been drinking for a	
27			few days and had forgotten he had reported off sick.	
28			The member admitted having an alcohol problem. The	
29			member's unit sergeant had tried to contact the member	

1			while he was absent without leave. The member	
2			acknowledged he had not returned calls to his sergeant,	
3			indicating he no phone credit. Credit is not required	
4			to answer an incoming call."	
5				11:16
6			You don't indicate there to the chief superintendent	
7			that Garda Keogh had contacted Sergeant Moylan on	
8			Facebook?	
9		Α.	I indicated that I didn't feel that was an acceptable	
10			form of communication for Garda Keogh, you know. When	11:16
11			he realised that people had been wondering where he	
12			was, I felt he should have contacted the sergeant or	
13			the station to explain where he was and how he was.	
14	70	Q.	"The member indicated that he intended continuing with	
15			the present pattern of reporting sick and unfit for	11:16
16			duty at will.	
17				
18			Under separate cover, I intend recommending	
19			disciplinary proceedings under regulation 14 commence	
20			against the member for being absent without leave. In	11:16
21			addition, I wish to request that a case conference be	
22			held as soon as possible with Garda Occupational Health	
23			Service and Human Resource Management to discuss the	
24			member with a view to deciding on a course of action to	
25			assist a full return to work or a sanction based	11:17
26			alternative should the member continue to ignore his	
27			responsibilities and work commitments."	
28				
29			What did you mean by that; "a sanction based	

-1				
1			al ternati ve"?	
2		Α.	That that was going to be for the occupational health	
3			department to decide on what was the best way to go	
4			forward with this. It was clear that Garda Keogh	
5			needed treatment, in my view, of some kind or another.	11:17
6			I'm not a medical expert. And I wanted to ensure that	
7			this behaviour wouldn't re-occur. I felt that the	
8			explanation given by Garda Keogh later on to me you	
9			know, I wasn't happy that it wouldn't recur.	
10	71	Q.	What was in your mind in relation to what would	11:17
11			constitute a sanctioned based alternative?	
12		Α.	That would be for the organisation and the occupational	
13			health section to decide then, I had dealt with	
14	72	Q.	What does that mean, what does a sanctioned based	
15			alternative mean?	11:18
16		Α.	A sanctioned based alternative would depend on how the	
17			occupational health and the CMO would view the member's	
18			ability to return to work and if he were, I suppose,	
19			certified as fit to work and then wasn't returning or	
20			continuing to behave in a fashion that wouldn't allow	11:18
21			him attend work, well then there would have to be a	
22			sanction.	
23	73	Q.	What sort of sanction?	
24		Α.	Well, the only sanction available in the Garda	
25			organisation is disciplinary regulations.	11:18

74 Q. You thought it had come to a head at that stage, did

in that fashion for four days, it's just not

26

27

28

29

you?

Α.

Well, I mean, for anybody in any workplace to stay out

1	acceptable.	No organis	sation o	could g	overnance	its
2	functions if	employees	are to	behave	in that	fashion.

- 3 75 Q. So as far as you were concerned it had come to a head at that stage?
- A. I felt that Garda Keogh needed treatment at that stage. 11:19
 And the purpose of that report to the chief was to have
 a case conference as soon as possible to try and, I
 suppose, see what could be done from an organisational
- 10 76 Q. What you're clearly indicating there is that there
 11:19
 11 should be a course of action which would assist Garda
 12 Keogh's full return to work.

perspective. I couldn't do any more, I felt.

13 A. Yes.

9

14 77 Q. Or, in the alternative, some form of disciplinary
15 sanction?

11:19

- 16 A. If Garda Keogh wasn't facing up to his responsibilities 17 in that regard, yeah.
- 18 78 Q. So in your mind this is how it should be dealt with?
- A. Yes. I suppose the onus to manage his health is
 primarily Garda Keogh's. The organisation has
 fantastic supports available to allow that to happen.
- 22 But it's his responsibility to manage his health.
- 23 79 Q. In the meantime you were going to recommend
 24 disciplinary proceedings against Garda Keogh for
 25 reporting in fit for duty when he was clearly drunk, is 11:20
 26 that right?
- 27 A. Yes. I was going to report under separate cover on that.
- 29 80 Q. The letter that you write is on page 2221 of the

1			material. It's dated 4th August 2015. It says:	
2				
3			"I refer to the above and wish to report the fact that	
4			Garda Nicholas Keogh was absent without leave for four	
5			days between the 11th July and the 14th July	11:21
6			i ncl usi ve. "	
7				
8			Then you summarise the sequence of events. At 3 there	
9			you say:	
10				11:21
11			"Garda Keogh was absent without leave. Sergeant	
12			Moylan, his unit sergeant, tried personally and through	
13			other members of the unit to contact the member over	
14			the period of absence by phone. The calls went	
15			unanswered and the member did not call back."	11:21
16				
17			Once again you hadn't referred to his attempt to	
18			contact Sergeant Moylan on Facebook.	
19		Α.	That's not an acceptable form of communication in my	
20			view.	11:21
21	81	Q.	In your view?	
22		Α.	In my view.	
23	82	Q.	I mean, it does indicate that he wasn't simply ignoring	
24			Sergeant Moylan?	
25		Α.	No, I accept fully, and he explained that to me, that	11:21
26			he contacted with the sergeant by Facebook.	
27	83	Q.	Yes. But you haven't alerted the chief superintendent	
28			to that?	
29		Α.	Well, I mean, that's not the issue here. The issue is	

1			the absence without leave. That's the issue that I am	
2			reporting.	
3	84	Q.	And then:	
4				
5			"On Tuesday, the 14th July I contacted the member by	11:22
6			phone. "	
7				
8			But that is in fact incorrect?	
9		Α.	Yes, and I have explained that.	
10	85	Q.	"He agreed he was absent without leave and indicated he	11:22
11			had reported off sick while he was drunk but had	
12			forgotten he done so. He had no excuse for not	
13			returning Sergeant Moylan's calls."	
14				
15			Well, he did offer an excuse, but it was an excuse that	11:22
16			you didn't accept.	
17		Α.	I didn't find it acceptable, yes.	
18	86	Q.	But he had offered you an excuse, isn't that right?	
19		Α.	Yes, he had.	
20	87	Q.	And he said that he had no credit?	11:22
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	88	Q.	"On the 16th July I sought a formal explanation from	
23			the member and he replied in a vague and unacceptable	
24			expl anati on. "	
25				11:22
26			Was that the view that you had of	
27		Α.	That's my view; that he didn't seem to understand the	
28			import of what had happened, to miss work in that	
29			fashion.	

1	89	Q.	And then at 6:	
2				
3			"In order to create a defence to any possible breach of	
4			discipline, the member submitted a retrospective	
5			medical certificate dated the 16th July. The	11:23
6			certificate indicates that he was most likely not	
7			examined by a doctor until the 16th July. In addition,	
8			he attempted to report off sick on leave 15th July for	
9			a second time."	
10				11:23
11			Why were you expressing the view that the medical	
12			certificates indicated that he most likely had not been	
13			examined by a doctor until the 16th July?	
14		Α.	Because it was dated the 16th July.	
15	90	Q.	But you don't know whether he was examined by the	11:23
16			doctor on the 11th July, the 12th July, the 13th July,	
17			the 14th July, the 15th July and merely got a	
18			certificate that was dated the 16th July, covering the	
19			period of time; you didn't know that, did you?	
20		Α.	It appeared to me from the date on the cert and his	11:23
21			attempt to report off duty or off sick leave for a	
22			second time, that he hadn't visited a doctor until the	
23			16th. That's a view I took from what was in front of	
24			me.	
25	91	Q.	If you turn over to page 2222, please:	11:24
26				
27			"Having considered the member's history of absence and	
28			his blatant disregard"	
29				

1			I think that is:	
2				
3			" for his responsibilities to the organisation,	
4			which appears to stem from over indulgence in alcohol,	
5			I respectfully recommend that the member be dealt with	11:24
6			under regulation 14 of the discipline regulations for	
7			his absence without leave amounting to four days."	
8				
9			There is no mention there of the certificate and work	
10			related stress. This is being put down purely to the	11:24
11			abuse of alcohol, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	That's what Garda Keogh said to me, that he had been	
13			drunk	
14	92	Q.	But you're putting Garda Keogh's absence from work down	
15			to purely an issue of alcohol dependency, isn't that	11:25
16			right?	
17		Α.	That's what he tole me, that's the excuse that he gave	
18			me; that he was drunk and he couldn't come to work.	
19	93	Q.	Insofar as he has a certificate saying that he is	
20			suffering and had, you knew, certificates over a long	11:25
21			period of time, that he was suffering work related	
22			stress, nevertheless you don't make any reference to	
23			that in your report to the chief superintendent?	
24		Α.	Garda Keogh explained to me that alcohol was an issue.	
25			He never mentioned work related stress as an excuse to	11:25
26			me when I spoke with him.	
27	94	Q.	Well, I wonder whether that'`s right. I mean, you had	
28			your initial discussion with him on the 26th March?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

1	95	Q.	Work related	stress,	you	accepted,	was	an	issue	for
2			Garda Keogh?							

- 3 A. Absolutely, and I put that on a file going to the CMO.
- 96 Q. You know, I asked you yesterday as to whether or not your notes perhaps showed and displayed that you were sceptical that he was suffering from work related stress and that perhaps you were putting everything

- down to alcohol dependency. Was that your mindset throughout this?
- No, alcohol is a major factor in Garda Keogh's life for 11:26 10 Α. 11 quite some time. You know, it caused his absence from 12 work on this occasion. I felt that the, I suppose, 13 behaviour should be marked, that it was important that 14 it be marked and that someone independent would look at 15 it under the discipline regulations and make whatever 11:26 16 decision they chose.
- 17 97 Q. Were you of the view at that stage that Garda Keogh was a malingerer?
- A. Had alcohol problem was, I suppose, a major basis of him not coming to work on a frequent basis, I felt.
- 21 98 Q. Were you of the view that he was malingering?
- A. No. I felt he had issues, he had a sickness, an illness, an addiction that he needed to deal with, but he wasn't prepared to deal with it.
- 25 99 Q. What sickness do you say he had?
- 26 A. Well, I said, you know, his alcohol addiction problem.
- 27 100 Q. What about stress?
- 28 A. I'm not a medical expert. He said he had stress. His doctor certified he had stress. He obviously had

1	stress.	And	one	fed	into	the	other.	And	the	other	fec
2	into the	othe	er.								

- 3 101 Q. But that's not really reflected in any of the reports 4 that you sent to the chief superintendent?
- 5 A. Well, the medical certificate is there from the doctor. 11:27
- 6 102 Q. But you make no reference to the contents of the medical certificate?
- 8 A. But it's there, it's plain, in plain view to see, it's attached as an attachment.
- I wonder, chief superintendent, I mean, if it is the 10 103 Q. 11:27 11 situation that you believe perhaps Garda Keogh was 12 hiding behind medical certificates indicating that he 13 was suffering from work related stress, when in fact 14 the real problem was that he was an alcoholic. If that 15 is so and that was your view, just say it was your 11:28 16 view?
- 17 I didn't have any view in that regard. It's quite Α. 18 clear that Garda Keogh had stress because of the 19 situation he was in, in relation to the whistleblower 20 allegations and obviously that would cause stress anybody. What part alcohol had in that and how they 21 22 mixed together and what the combination was, I simply don't know. On this occasion, I dealt with what I saw 23 24 in front of me.

- 25 104 Q. Did you make any enquiries from the inspectors or the sergeants in relation to what might be causing Garda

 Keogh's stress at work?
- 28 A. He explained to me himself what was causing it.
- 29 105 Q. Did you make any enquiries of anybody else?

2 Q. Did you go at that time back to Sergeant Yvonne Martin 106 3 and ask her for a report in relation to any interactions that she may have had with Garda Keogh? 4 5 No. At this point in time Garda Keogh, in an Α. 6 arrangement with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and I, had a full-time welfare officer assigned to him. 7 8 107 Did you go back to Sergeant Martin? 0. 9 No. Α. 10 108 Did you ask her for a report? Q. 11 Α. No. 12 Did you go to Sergeant Moylan, who was his supervising 109 Ο. sergeant at the time? 13 No. Sergeant Moylan had reported the issue to me, 14 Α.

11:29

11:29

11:29

11:29

- 16 Did you ask him did he observe any issues at work that 110 Q. 17 might be the stress factors for Garda Keogh?
- 18 No. Α.

Α.

1

15

20

28

Α.

No.

19 111 Did you go to Sergeant Haran --Q.

escalated it to me.

- -- and ask him how Garda Keogh was and had he confided 21 112 Q.
- 22 in him any issues that were causing him stress at work?
- 23 No, I did not, Chairman. Α.
- 24 Why didn't you do that? 113 Q.
- 25 I didn't -- I put Garda Keogh on to the occupational Α. 11 · 29 26 health department and the CMO. He was seen there on
- 27 the 19th May. As far as I was concerned, he was under their care in addition to the care of the welfare
- 29 service, who directly report to human resource section,

Т			under whose re commit occupational health sits. And I	
2			had left the care of the Garda Keogh in their capable	
3			hands.	
4	114	Q.	If we just move on. I think at page 2232, this is a	
5			letter from the chief superintendent to you dated 10th	11:30
6			August 2015. It's dealing with the alleged breach of	
7			discipline, internal discipline of Garda Keogh. She	
8			says:	
9				
10			"In accordance with regulation 14 of the Garda Síochána	11:30
11			(Discipline) Regulations, I have appointed	
12			Superintendent Alan Murray to investigate the breaches	
13			of discipline alleged against Garda Keogh."	
14				
15			If we could have page 2233 up on the screen. This is a	11:31
16			letter from you to the overpayment department HRM.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	115	Q.	In Navan. And this is before any disciplinary	
19			proceedings have taken place. Then you point out:	
20				11:31
21			"The above named Garda Keogh was absent without leave	
22			from the 11th to the 14th July 2015 inclusive (SAMS	
23			updated)."	
24				
25			Had you caused SAMS to be updated at that time?	11:31
26		Α.	The district clerk would update SAMS automatically for	
27			me. I had no involvement with SAMS.	
28	116	Q.	"Please recoup any overpayment of wages from this	
29			employee for the relevant dates."	

Τ				
2			These were medically certified as dates he was out	
3			sick, isn't that right?	
4		Α.	Well, as far as I was concerned he was absent without	
5			leave	11:32
6	117	Q.	That was going to be the subject-matter of disciplinary	
7			proceedings and Superintendent Alan Murray was going to	
8			examine the circumstances in which that occurred?	
9		Α.	Absolutely, from a disciplinary perspective.	
10	118	Q.	Yes.	11:32
11		Α.	But like that letter to the overpayments section was me	
12			complying with a policy on overpayments that doesn't	
13			allow me any discretion where public money is	
14			concerned. It's a matter for the overpayment section	
15			how they deal with that. You know, I mean I am just	11:32
16			bringing it to their attention.	
17	119	Q.	You dealt with this in subsequent letters, that I am	
18			not going to open and go into?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	120	Q.	They're there in the papers.	11:32
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	121	Q.	You're familiar with them?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	122	Q.	And the response from the overpayment section.	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:32
26	123	Q.	They seemed a little bit surprised that the issue was	
27			arising.	
28		Α.	I don't know how they are surprised when the HQ	
29			circular is there, 68/15.	

- 1 124 Q. Was this not a matter that maybe your clerk, your
 2 district clerk could have dealt with? You seemed to be
 3 dealing with all this issue personally?
- A. Well, the first letter, I'd imagine by looking at it,
 was written by the district clerk and the subsequent
 correspondence that came back then was directed towards
 me.
- 8 125 In any event, I think that the disciplinary proceedings Q. were in respect of two issues; neglect of duty, which 9 related to -- and we will see this at 8836 of the 10 11:34 11 material, breaches of discipline alleged. Neglect of 12 duty. That deals with the reporting fit for duty. And then discreditable conduct. That concerns the sick 13 certificate, isn't that right? 14
- 15 A. I don't know. I had no involvement in the matter after 11:34 16 that.
- 17 126 You had no involvement. What was supplied to Q. 18 Superintendent Pat Murray -- or to Superintendent Alan 19 Murray, was your report of the 4th August, two SR1 20 forms that were completed by Garda Buckley and Sergeant 11:34 Cormack, again a minute from you seeking the 21 22 explanation from Garda Keogh, and a report from Garda Keogh dated the 21st July, medical certificate of Garda 23 24 Keogh and then an SR1 form. I suppose the point about 25 this is, I understand Garda Keogh's case to be that the 11:35 26 date, whether it was Tuesday, they 14th July or 27 wednesday, the 15th July, was important and 28 significant. Do you understand why he is saying that?

Α.

I don't really. But no one ever asked me about the

1 date until these things began to manifest and I never 2 had a problem, I made a mistake on the date and that's 3 mv mistake. 4 I think that Garda Keogh's position in relation to this 127 0. 5 is that the impression given by saying that it was the 6 14th July, indicates that that was a day on which 7 Sergeant Moylan was saying he was trying to contact 8 Garda Keogh and that his calls went unanswered. stating that you phoned him on the 14th July and that 9 he answered your call, would indicate that he was 10 11:36 11 deliberately ignoring Sergeant Moylan's calls. understand? 12 13 Yes, I never saw that, I never took that into account Α. 14 at all. You didn't intend --15 128 Q. 11:36 16 No, absolutely. Α. 17 -- through your error --129 Q. 18 No. Α. 19 130 -- to create that impression? Q. Absolutely not. And I accepted the fact that he did 20 Α. 11:36 try and make contact through Facebook. 21 But I did not 22 intend to create that impression in any way at all. 23 Now, I think on 8th October 2015, if we could have page 131 Q. 24 8822 up on the screen, please. That sets out the 25 findings and you were notified of that, breach number 11:37 26 1, a fine of €300, and breach number 2, not in breach. 27 I think you had met with Garda Keogh on 30th August 2015? 28

29

Yes.

Α.

_	132	Ų.	At John. Court we just have this up on the screen,	
2			please, it's page 2246 of the materials.	
3				
4			"Met the member to serve an IA12 for superintendent	
5			Mullingar re discipline AWOL."	11:38
6				
7			You say:	
8				
9			"It was clear that the member was annoyed at events."	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:38
11	133	Q.	How did he express that annoyance?	
12		Α.	He protested, I suppose, that this shouldn't be	
13			happening and it was only happening to him because of,	
14			you know, what he was involved in.	
15	134	Q.	"It was clear the member I explained to him I had	11:38
16			indicated this might happen because of his cavalier	
17			attitude towards his work obligations."	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	135	Q.	That's how you regarded it at the time, is that right?	
20		Α.	Well, yes, as I explained, you know, that's how I saw	11:39
21			the absence and the nature of it.	
22	136	Q.	I think he asked you to explain regulation 14?	
23		Α.	He did. He was annoyed and then he calmed down a bit	
24			and I went through regulation 14 with him in full,	
25			explaining it fully to him, that this was deemed	11:39
26			being investigated by Superintendent Alan Murray and	
27			that he would look at it independently and Garda Keogh	
28			would have an opportunity to meet with him. I went	
29			through the entire gambit of regulation 14 with him to	

2 "I also enquired as to his welfare and alcohol 137 Q. 3 addiction problem." Yes. 4 Α. 5 138 You indicate he was reticent to discuss the same? Q. 11:39 6 Α. 7 You were aware of at that time from Detective 139 Q. 8 Superintendent Mulcahy that he was engaging with Garda Quinn? 9 10 Yes. Α. 11:40 11 140 Q. Did you discuss that engagement with Garda Quinn with 12 Garda Keogh? 13 I never contacted Garda Quinn. Detective Α. 14 Superintendent Mulcahy was the point of contact and I 15 understand Chief Superintendent Wheatley also contacted 11:40 16 Garda Quinn. 141 17 Yes. What I am asking, it's in your notes here, you Q. 18 say: 19 20 "I am aware he engaged with welfare service, Garda 11:40 21 Qui nn. " 22 Oh no, that's a note to --Α. 23 To yourself? 142 Q. 24 I'm aware of that myself, yeah. Α. So that wasn't --25 143 Ο. 11:40 26 No, no. Α. 27 144 Then you say you asked him about his work and you say Q.

1

28

29

allay his fears.

you noticed poor work standards?

Yes.

Α.

What was that a reference to? 1 145 Q. 2 It was a reference to two recent crime files that had Α. 3 come to my attention, where the statements were written by the injured parties themselves and a letter from a 4 5 solicitor regarding a local family, a criminal family. You refer to a matter that we will come to now, the 6 146 Q. 7 Custume Place crime. You refer to the fact there that 8 the injured parties had written their statements. And 9 you asked him if events were impacting on his work? 10 Yes. Α. 11:41 11 147 Q. And then you go on to say: 12 13 "I said if he continued as at present I would have to 14 consider reducing the risk he posed by taking him off 15 outdoor duty." 11:42 16 Yes. Α. 17 148 "He asked me to continue to send him my issues in Q. 18 writing and he said he would do what he liked." 19 Yes. Α. 20 You assured him that he could not and that the meeting 149 Q. ended on that. That exchange at the end, is that 21 22 something that you are sure about? 23 Yes. Α. 24 150 If we just look at Garda Keogh's note in relation to Q. 25 this, it's at page 13326. Down at the end we see: 11:42 26 27 "9pm, superintendent arrives to the station." 28 29 Did you go in specifically to serve the papers on him?

1		Α.	I had the papers Superintendent Murray in Mullingar	
2			sent to me and I wanted to ensure confidentiality	
3			around them. I went to the station to do some work and	
4			Garda Keogh was there, so I served them at the same	
5			time.	11:4
6	151	Q.	He doesn't make any recount of what actually transpired	
7			at that meeting in his note. But in terms of his	
8			comments in the latter portion of your notes there, did	
9			you not feel that you were entitled to actually	
10			discipline him there and then?	11:4
11		Α.	No, I wouldn't see that. This was the reaction of	
12			someone who was very annoyed at me for having, I	
13			suppose, reported the matter of his absence without	
14			leave to the chief superintendent. It was a reaction	
15			in that way.	11:4
16	152	Q.	I mean, it certainly would on the face of it amount to	
17			insubordination?	
18		Α.	I can understand him being annoyed, he a view that this	
19			was all being done to target him in some way. I	
20			couldn't satisfy him that it wasn't, that it was just a	11:4
21			normal part of business, that the organisation has	
22			rules and regulations that have to be abided by. And	

regulations.

he had an obligation to comply with those rules and

11:44

23

24

2			"The actual date of the phone call by Superintendent	
3			Pat Murray was material, in that it was clear that	
4			Superintendent Pat Murray that telephoned me on the	
5			15th July at 12:08pm only and then said, how could you	11:45
6			ring in off sick when you were not on sick. By	
7			changing the date of his telephone call from the 15th	
8			July to the 14th July, Superintendent Pat Murray was	
9			able to imply that I was deliberately not contacting	
10			Sergeant Moylan on the 14th July, when Superintendent	11:46
11			Pat Murray said he was able to contact me on that same	
12			date. I had in fact contacted Sergeant Moylan on	
13			Facebook (when my phone went dead) 12 hours before Pat	
14			Murray's call on the 15th July."	
15				11:46
16			Now factually what he sets out there is correct, isn't	
17			that right?	
18		Α.	In relation to Facebook?	
19	154	Q.	The phone call.	
20		Α.	The phone call?	11:46
21	155	Q.	Yes.	
22		Α.	Was on the 15th?	
23	156	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	Absolutely.	
25	157	Q.	But he is attributing a motive to you and you have	11:46
26			already dealt with it?	
27		Α.	Yes. No, I genuinely had no motive in that regard, it	
28			was a simple, genuine error on my part.	

29 158 Q. Now, he then goes on to say, which is a matter that has

Т			been withdrawn and I think that he has acknowledged his	
2			letter. But nevertheless it's there and he said it at	
3			one stage. In the last paragraph there before 15, and	
4			then he says:	
5				11:47
6			"Pat Murray then vindictively requested an	
7			acknowledgment of his findings to him in circumstances	
8			where it was a contest between my version and that of	
9			Pat Murray."	
10				11:47
11			And then:	
12				
13			"He acted as formulator of the charge, judge, witness	
14			giving untrue testimony and now enforcer of a cap in	
15			hand acknowl edgment."	11:47
16				
17			Now, I think the position is that he has withdrawn that	
18			in relation to the fact that he acknowledges that you	
19			had nothing to do in relation to the deciding of the	
20			issue, which was a matter for Superintendent Alan	11:47
21			Murray.	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	159	Q.	Now, I think having served the notice on him, I think	
24			that subsequently he was advised of the result also of	
25			the outcome of the disciplinary proceedings and then he	11:48
26			lodged an appeal in relation to that. It can be found	
27			at page 8854 of the material. Again there, we see, and	
28			I'm not going to open all this to you, it is dated 2nd	
29			December. Again he is focusing on:	

1				
2			"Superintendent Murray's report states that this phone	
3			call was made on 14th July 2015. The phone call is	
4			relevant, in that I outlined to Superintendent Murray	
5			as honestly as I could as to the mistake I had made and	11:49
6			how it came about. In the said report it implies that	
7			I deliberately did not answer a phone call from	
8			Sergeant Cormac Moylan when I had explained this to	
9			Superintendent Murray, that I contacted Sergeant Moylan	
10			on Facebook, explaining same to him prior to the phone	11:49
11			call from Superintendent Pat Murray."	
12				
13			You had cause to serve papers on him in relation to	
14			these matters. Did you know at that stage that that	
15			was an issue for Garda Keogh?	11:49
16		Α.	I didn't look at the papers. It was as I say, I met	
17			him on the 22nd October in the same fashion I had on	
18			the 30th August, to serve the documents, this time from	
19			the chief superintendent. I merely handed him the	
20			documents and got him to acknowledge it.	11:50
21	160	Q.	Were you not curious to read it, to see what his case	
22			was?	
23		Α.	No.	
24	161	Q.	No?	
25		Α.	No.	11:50
26	162	Q.	So your evidence is that you were totally unaware that	
27			this was an issue that concerned Garda Keogh?	

29

Α.

Yes. No one brought that to my attention for quite

sometime. And I would have readily corrected my

- 1 mistake then had someone done so.
- 2 163 Q. Is there anything else that you wish to say in relation

11:51

11:51

11:51

11:52

- 3 to that?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 164 Q. That issue generally?
- 6 A. No. No. The date situation is a mistake on my part.
- 7 Garda Keogh made a mistake for a while, albeit
- 8 influenced by my mistake. So I don't have a monopoly
- on wisdom, I made a genuine error. I am willing to
- 10 correct that at any time.

him.

- 11 165 Q. Okay. If we could then go on to deal with issue number
- 12 9, the alleged criticisms of the criminal
- investigations of Garda Keogh. We'll deal with the
- first one, which you refer to in your meeting with
- 15 Garda Keogh that we just dealt with, and that's the
- theft at Custume Place on the 4th July. Garda Keogh's
- case in relation to this is that he believes that you
- were hypercritical of him in relation to this and other
- matters and in consequence you were seeking to target

20

21

- The relevant crime files are at page 190. If I could
- first of all have that up on screen. This relates to
- one of the injured parties. Effectively it's the same
- 25 incident?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 166 Q. But there are two injured parties.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 167 Q. This crime file came to you on the 30th July, when you

1 were reviewing crime files, is that right? 2 Yes. Α. The nominated supervisor was Sergeant Moylan and the 3 168 Q. remarks of the supervisor: 4 5 11:52 6 "The CCTV was viewed but of no evidential value as 7 camera panning quickly past premises." 8 9 Are you familiar with Sergeant Moylan's handwriting? Can you read the next line there? Is that collated? 10 11:53 11 Or collected, is it? 12 Collated. Α. 13 Collated? 169 Q. That is: 14 Α. 15 11:53 16 "Suspect collated at Custume Place." 17 170 At the time of the offence, is that right? Q. 18 Yes. Α. 19 171 "Possible suspect". Q. 20 Α. Yes. 11:53 And then "statement of injured party enclosed." Thank 21 172 Ο. 22 you, that's of assistance. Then there's additional 23 comments on the next page, page 191, at number 12, if 24 you scroll down, Mr. Kavanagh, please. 25 Yes. Α. 11:53 26 173 "CCTV viewed with injured parties and information Q. 27 passed to members on patrol." 28 Yes. Α. 29 174 And then: "Investigating members comments", and then Q.

1			it's the name of the suspect:	
2				
3			"in area around time of the crime."	
4				
5			Then he says:	11:54
6				
7			"No other evidence."	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	175	Q.	Then page 192 you have the statement of the injured	
10			party, who doesn't nominate any suspect, isn't that	11:54
11			right?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	176	Q.	Page 193. Then, if we go to 194, which is really	
14			almost a duplication of what we saw on 190; isn't that	
15			right?	11:54
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	177	Q.	At 195:	
18				
19			"Additional enquiries conducted: Info passed to patrol	
20			cars and members on duty in area.	11:54
21				
22			Investigating member comments: Suspect in area around	
23			the time of crime during the triathlon."	
24				
25			Then at page 196 we have a statement of the injured	11:5
26			party, isn't that right?	
27		Α.	The second injured party, yes.	
28	178	Q.	Again, I don't think any suspect is nominated there, is	
29			that right?	

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	179	Q.	Then if we could just have a brief look at the Pulse	
3			entry. If we could have that up on the screen, page	
4			8891 to 8892. It has that it's a theft on the Pulse	
5			incident summary?	11:56
6			CHAIRMAN: Just give us a moment while we go around the	
7			houses. Thanks very much.	
8			MR. MARRINAN: I beg your pardon.	
9			CHAIRMAN: That's all right.	
10			MR. MARRINAN: You see Pulse incident.	11:56
11			CHAIRMAN: Now we have it, now we can read it.	
12			MR. MARRINAN: Yes. Pulse incident category, it says	
13			theft. Then the report of the time, nine o'clock in	
14			the evening. The scene type, it was a house. Then it	
15			has the address. Then it's the review status. It says	11:56
16			that it was reviewed, on the right-hand side of the	
17			page there, on the far right column. And then there is	
18			the narrative. Then I think when we are reading a	
19			narrative on Pulse. The first entry appears as the	
20			last entry, is that right? But in any event:	11:56
21				
22			"Injured party's purse left in upstairs room.	
23			Triathlon public demo house. Purse was stolen. CCTV	
24			moving camera viewed but to no avail."	
25				11:57
26			And then:	
27				
28			"Updated. CVSO Letter. Contacted injured party.	

Updated crime file submitted on the 28th August, plus

1			report from Garda Keogh."	
2				
3			Then further down it has, in the last box under:	
4				
5			"Review records of incident Pulse."	11:57
6				
7			I think that would be the two names of the two injured	
8			parties who would potentially be witnesses. Maybe	
9			that's not right. It refers to:	
10				11:57
11			"Public had access to the room."	
12				
13			Would that be further inquiries that were carried out?	
14		Α.	No, that's reviews carried out by civilian inputers at	
15			the call centre in Castlebar.	11:58
16	180	Q.	Yes, all right, thank you.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I am not seeing that.	
18	181	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: "Review records for incident Pulse ID."	
19			CHAIRMAN: Oh yes.	
20			MR. MARRINAN: At the end of the page. There's two	11:58
21			entries there. And these were done by	
22			CHAIRMAN: This is the Pulse management.	
23		Α.	Data management review.	
24	182	Q.	CHAIRMAN: This is the Pulse central management.	
25		Α.	Known as GISE, yes.	11:58
26	183	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Exactly. I couldn't remember it. So the	
27			GISE officials look at that?	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Okay, thanks.	

1	184	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: One of them has noted on the 4th July:	
2				
3			"Public had access to the room."	
4				
5			And then over the page, we see:	11:58
6				
7			"Catalogue detail overview for incident Pulse."	
8				
9			And then we have just what was stolen, the items:	
10			Handbag, cash, cheque, cards, etcetera.	11:58
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	185	Q.	That's in relation to one of the incidents. And we	
13			have a similar one, which I don't believe there's any	
14			need to open, it's at page 8893 and 8894, but it	
15			recites the same details?	11:59
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	186	Q.	There is no point in going through it. And that	
18			relates to the second victim, as I say. Presumably	
19			this matter was dealt with initially at a PAF meeting,	
20			is that right?	11:59
21		Α.	The incident would have been reviewed at the morning	
22			PAF meeting, yes, and a request for a crime file.	
23	187	Q.	And no issues in relation to the investigation were	
24			identified, is that right?	
25		Α.	We didn't know anything about the investigation at the	11:59
26			PAF meeting.	
27	188	Q.	Well, nothing arose in relation to the incident at the	
28			PAF meeting?	
29		Α.	Nothing other than the request for progress on the	

- 1 investigation.
- 2 189 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. In order that we could monitor.
- 4 190 Q. Which is the creation of the crime file?
- 5 A. The crime file.
- 6 191 Q. Yes.
- 7 A. And an investigation process that would have taken

12:00

12:00

12:00

- 8 place, yes.
- 9 192 Q. The crime file, in the normal course of events went
- from, at that time, because it subsequently changed,
- but at that time in the normal course of events it
- would have gone through the supervising sergeant?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 193 Q. Isn't that right? He doesn't appear to have picked up
- on any issues?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 194 Q. Had he picked up on an issue that was of concern to
- him, he would have referred it back to the member
- investigating it, is that right?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 195 Q. In the ideal world, that is?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 196 Q. But in any event, this had been signed off by Sergeant
- 24 Moylan?
- 25 A. It had been sent to me, yes, to my office.
- 26 197 Q. And sent on to you?
- 27 A. In the normal course of correspondence that occurred,
- 28 yes.
- 29 198 Q. Your response, having read the crime file, is at page

Т			197 of the material. It refers to the two crime files.	
2			It says:	
3				
4			"The attached two crime files are returned for further	
5			attention as follows:	12:01
6				
7			A suspect has been identified in both cases. What	
8			efforts have been made to deal with them?	
9				
10			Why is it that both injured parties who are witnesses	12:01
11			appear to have written out their own statements on form	
12			C8 rather than the investigating member taking down the	
13			statement?	
14				
15			Each and every reported crime must be brought to an	12:02
16			investigative conclusion, so the injured parties and	
17			public in general can have confidence in the police	
18			servi ce we provi de. "	
19				
20			What was your concern in relation to the statements	12:02
21			that had been taken?	
22		Α.	They weren't taken by the investigating member. They	
23			were written out. On reading them, it was clear that	
24			those witnesses had further information that they could	
25			give in relation to what had occurred. And it didn't	12:02
26			seem to, I suppose, have been elicited from them in an	
27			investigative way. One of the objective of statements	
28			is to gather evidence.	
29	199	0	There is no direction to re-interview the witnesses?	

- 1 A. I mean, I suppose that would be kind of painting by
- 2 numbers for someone who would be investigating crime.
- This is a basic, the first, I suppose, you know, action
- 4 in relation to someone who is reporting crime, who is a
- witness; is that a statement would be taken from them

12:03

12:03

12:03

- 6 in a proper fashion.
- 7 200 Q. Yes, but was it the fact they had written out their own
- 8 statements that was the problem rather than the
- 9 contents of their statements?
- 10 A. No. It was the facts, the information that they
- appeared to have or evidence that they appeared to have
- wasn't being elicited from them in a proper way.
- 13 201 Q. What are you referring to?
- A. I'm referring to the content of the statement,
- particularly the second page, with the crossed out
- 16 writing. It appears they had more information, when I
- 17 read the statements.
- 18 202 Q. If we just go back to that?
- 19 A. That's page 193.
- 20 203 Q. 193?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 204 Q. How do you say that that --
- A. Well, they appear to have had some interaction with a
- 24 suspect.
- 25 205 Q. Where is there --
- 26 A. "Person who was suspected of stealing these has
- confessed to entering the building and eating food on
- the stairs."
- 29 206 Q. Right. So, you thought that that was an issue?

- A. I felt that the witnesses had more information and I felt that, you know, just merely to, I suppose, allow
- them write their own statements was contrary to the
- 4 ethos and training of members of An Garda Síochána.
- 5 207 Q. Okay. But there's no direction to re-interview and to 12:04 elicit this information from the witnesses?
- 7 A. The whole purpose of carrying out an investigation is 8 to gather evidence. They are the primary source of
- 9 evidence. That would be, you know, a basic step. I 10 didn't feel the need to, I suppose, be prescriptive in
- that nature and to that extent. If I had to do that in
- every case, it would be absolutely mind boggling to
- consider that an organisation could run without people
- 14 understanding their basic roles, having been trained in

- a very thorough fashion and having a number of years
- service and having done investigations previously.
- 17 208 Q. In terms of a witness writing out their own statement,
- is there an absolute prohibition on that?
- 19 A. Well, a witness who has information, that might be
- evidence, and if's is allowed to go unchallenged and if 12:05
- 21 An Garda Síochána are using it as a foundation or a
- basis on which to take action in an investigation, it
- would be wholly inappropriate and I shutter to think
- 24 how I would prosecute such case in the District Court.
- 25 209 Q. Well, are you saying there is an absolute prohibition,
- or is it a matter of best practice?
- 27 A. It's absolutely best practice.
- 28 210 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. And I have never, I suppose, seen -- I have seen, I

1 suppose, suspects present statements in answer to 2 allegations in their own hand. But I have never seen anyone just allow a witness who had evidence to just 3 write it out and leave it at that and, I suppose, allow 4 5 that to conclude matters. I couldn't -- that wasn't a 12:06 6 stand that was acceptable to me. I had come to an 7 Athlone and I had initiated new systems and processes, 8 I had an obligations under the Garda Code to monitor the thoroughness, accuracy of investigations and the 9 direction of them. And I had obligations, you know, to 12:07 10 11 make sure that each and every incident was brought to 12 an investigative conclusion in as far as possible. 13 14 I suppose my obligation was carried out by the members 15 of An Garda Síochána who were attached to Athlone 12:07 16 district and I had to ensure that they did their job in 17 a correct manner, so as that the organisation could 18 allow, trust, the trust of the public in carrying out 19 its investigative function in dealing with issues that they had complained about in a proper fashion. 20 12:07 Garda Keogh gave evidence in relation to this and he 21 211 Q. 22 takes issue and says that this is something that he had done on other occasions. He was cross-examined by your 23

64

24

25

26

27

28

29

counsel and it wasn't suggested to him that there was

an absolute prohibition on doing this but that it was

demonstrate in a clear, unambiguous way that there is

best practice that a Garda should take a statement.

I am wondering whether you can point to any of the

rules or regulations covering this, that would

12:08

So

1			an absolute prohibition on a garda inviting a person	
2			merely to write out their own statement?	
3		Α.	I would say that the whole training and ethos of An	
4			Garda Síochána revolves around best practice, best	
5			international practice and best practice benchmarked	12:08
6			against international practice. All of the research	
7			included in the Garda Síochána investigating interview	
8			model indicates that it's best practice to take a	
9			statement from a witness to elicit information in order	
10			that evidence can be gathered to bring a case to	12:09
11			conclusion.	
12	212	Q.	That's not really the answer to my question. My	
13			question is: Can you point to any regulation anywhere	
14			in the manual or otherwise	
15		Α.	Well, I think	12:09
16	213	Q.	Just let me finish. Can you point to any regulation	
17			anywhere that demonstrates an absolute prohibition on a	
18			member inviting a person to write out their own	
19			statement?	
20		Α.	No, I can't, but I think a reading of chapter 3 of the	12:09
21			crime CIT manual, Crime Investigation Techniques	
22			Manual, will give an understanding of that. I think a	
23			reading of the HQ 29/14, the Garda Síochána	
24			Investigative Interviewing Model, will give an	
25			indication of what's required.	12:10
26	214	Q.	We will look at Garda Keogh's response then, if we	
27			might. It's at page 201. He says:	
28				
29			"Sergeant Monaghan, this was the day of the triathlon.	

1			The suspect, along with hundreds of other people, were	
2			in the area. There is no evidence to link that suspect	
3			to this crime."	
4				
5			That's very clear, isn't it?	12:11
6		Α.	Well, the triathlon occurred early in the afternoon,	
7			this crime was reported at 9pm.	
8	215	Q.	No, what he is saying there is that there is no	
9			evidence linking the suspect to the crime?	
10		Α.	well, I don't know how he could say that, because he	12:11
11			hasn't gathered the evidence from the witnesses in a	
12			proper fashion.	
13	216	Q.	"In relation to why both statements were taken the way	
14			they were, on C8s, is because I was on my own in the	
15			public office during the triathlon. It was very busy	12:11
16			when the two injured parties arrived in, so I did the	
17			best I could under the circumstances."	
18				
19			So that's the reason he is giving for departing from	
20			what would have been the best practice. He says in	12:12
21			evidence that he read the statements over to the	
22			injured parties, he invited them if they wished to add	
23			anything to their statements and they signed off on	
24			them. In what he is putting forward as being very	
25			exceptional circumstances - being alone in the public	12:12
26			office, dealing with two members of the public - you	
27			didn't think that the matter should rest there, is that	
28			right?	
29		Α.	No. And that wouldn't be an acceptable standard at	

- all. The triathlon, as I said, occurred much earlier in the day, and this was 9pm at night.
- 3 217 Q. The town would be busy, presumably people stayed on, drinking and eating?
- 5 A. It may or may not, yeah, there's normally plenty of
 6 help around on those days and as per Garda Keogh did in
 7 other issues in relation to Olivia O'Neill that are
 8 here, someone could have been, you know, procured to I
 9 suppose deal with this proper if he was busy and didn't
 10 feel he could deal with it himself.
- 11 218 Q. Did you make enquiries as to whether or not he was the only person on the desk?
- 13 No, it wouldn't be, I suppose, a way of doing things. Α. 14 And when I sent back the file, I would have expected that it would have been corrected and perhaps the case 15 12:13 16 would have been followed up and that information that 17 the witnesses appeared to have would be elicited from 18 them, which might give an indication as to the 19 culpability of the suspect. I have, I suppose, in my experience, been an operational policeman for all my 20 12:13 service really, with quite an amount of experience in 21 22 crime investigation.
- 23 219 Q. Did you write under separate cover to the sergeant, 24 indicating that you were unhappy that he had supervised 25 it in the way that he had?

- 26 A. No.
- 27 220 Q. Why not?
- A. Because the process at that time, the sergeant missed it, he didn't comment on it. I don't know what his

1			issue was. I wrote back to him asking those questions	
2			and the reply came up again, through the sergeant from	
3			Garda Keogh.	
4	221	Q.	We will just look at this, it's page 202. It's dated	
5			the 3rd September.	12:14
6				
7			"The explanation given in this case for what I see is a	
8			laissez faire attitude towards the investigation of two	
9			crimes is far from satisfactory. Garda Keogh appears	
10			to need advice in relation to the purpose and scope of	12:14
11			interviewing witnesses and in that regard should be	
12			advised in relation to the existing instructions at	
13			chapter 3 of the Crime Investigations Manual. The	
14			manner in which these statements form part of an	
15			investigation is contrary to the training and ethos of	12:15
16			members of An Garda Síochána and does not allow for	
17			this organisation to assure the victims in this case	
18			the best possible effort has been put into	
19			investigating the crimes reported."	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:15
21	222	Q.	That's your opening paragraph?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	223	Q.	That's quite forceful?	
24		Α.	As I said to you, when I came to Athlone I wanted to, I	
25			suppose, set a standard, create efficiencies, have	12:15
26			performance as a paramount and this was, I suppose	
27			in my view I am setting out my position very clearly	
28			here, in a direct way.	
29	224	Q.	You then go on to say:	

Τ				
2			"The basis of any investigation is the injured party's	
3			statements and in these cases the injured parties	
4			nomi nate a suspect."	
5		Α.	Yes.	12:16
6	225	Q.	That's actually not right. One of them did, but the	
7			other didn't?	
8		Α.	Well, both of them were together when this happened.	
9			So I am sure if information was elicited from them,	
10			that would have been the case.	12:16
11	226	Q.	But sure, apparently Garda Keogh sat down and went	
12			through the CCTV with them and it was viewed?	
13		Α.	Again, that wouldn't be best practice. Because again,	
14			if I were trying to prosecute that in the District	
15			Court and an identification had been made in that	12:16
16			matter, I would have a problem bringing my case over	
17			the line.	
18	227	Q.	Well, is it the case that Garda Keogh was damned if he	
19			did and damned if he didn't?	
20		Α.	I suppose I wanted the investigation to be carried out	12:16
21			in a proper fashion. I felt there was information	
22			there from those witnesses that would lead to evidence	
23			against the nominated suspect, who was a well known	
24			criminal in the area.	
25	228	Q.	You then continue on:	12:16
26				
27			"The issue must be explored in a proper fashion with	
28			them. Indeed, Garda Keogh has also nominated the same	
29			suspect on the crime tracking file."	

Т				
2			That seems to be an error.	
3		Α.	In what regard?	
4	229	Q.	Is that the same suspect has been nominated by the	
5			injured party?	12:1
6		Α.	Yes. In what I saw and the information they obviously	
7			had and the suspect Garda Keogh nominated, I concluded	
8			that that was the same person.	
9	230	Q.	Where did you get that from?	
10		Α.	From what they were saying here.	12:1
11	231	Q.	where?	
12		Α.	In their statements, that they had spoken to a suspect.	
13	232	Q.	Where is that?	
14		Α.	Who confessed to entering the building.	
15	233	Q.	Where is there a suspect nominated by name?	12:1
16		Α.	Not by name, no, but they had a person who they spoke	
17			to.	
18	234	Q.	But where is the evidence to suggest that they both	
19			nominated the same suspect?	
20		Α.	What I mean by that is that they had spoken or dealt or	12:1
21			had information in relation to a suspect which Garda	
22			Keogh had nominated.	
23	235	Q.	You're discerning from a portion that had been crossed	
24			out in a statement; in other words, had been excised	
25			from the statement, after it had been read over, as	12:1
26			being presumably inappropriate to put in. And Garda	
27			Keogh has separately nominated a suspect himself.	
28			Where are you drawing the conclusion that both suspects	

had been nominated -- the same suspect is being

			nominated by both injured parties and by darda keogn:	
2		Α.	Well, knowing the gentleman in question who was	
3			suspect, this is the type of crime that he would be	
4			involved in. I felt that if information was elicited	
5			from the witnesses, you know, it would be very apparent	12:1
6			that he was likely involved.	
7	236	Q.	"That issue must be explored in a proper fashion with	
8			them. Indeed, Garda Keogh has also nominated the named	
9			suspect. It is incumbent on us to ensure we explore	
10			the various available options to assist in gathering	12:1
11			evidence. The case of DPP v. Reddy indicates the low	
12			threshold in relation to reasonable suspicion that	
13			exists in order to assist investigations. The tools	
14			available to Garda Keogh to assist him with his work	
15			are not used in this case."	12:1
16				
17			What did you mean by that?	
18		Α.	There are powers available to Garda Keogh.	
19	237	Q.	Specifically?	
20		Α.	That he had powers of arrest and search and other	12:1
21			powers that would be available to him, to allow him to	
22			further this investigation.	
23	238	Q.	So are you suggesting that he ought to have arrested	
24		Α.	I am suggesting that they are options. I consider that	
25			guidance, advice and direction. And it also, I	12:1
26			suppose, allowed the sergeant and, indeed, Garda Keogh	
27			to understand where I was coming from. I felt I was	
28			very open and honest in expressing my feelings there in	
29			the standard T wanted annlied in relation to this and	

1			all other investigations of volume crime, to, I	
2			suppose, go hand in hand with the new procedures that I	
3			had introduced.	
4	239	Q.	You go on to say "In order to bring these matters"	
5			it should be " to an acceptable conclusion for the	12:20
6			victims, please address the following: Garda Keogh	
7			should be given formal advice regarding the	
8			investigation of crime and the importance of	
9			interviewing witnesses. Chapter 3 of the crime	
10			investigation manual is a source of reference; what	12:20
11			efforts have been made to include/exclude the suspect	
12			identified, as two months have passed. This matter	
13			needs urgent attention; Sergeant Monaghan should ensure	
14			that Garda Keogh is supervised in bringing this matter	
15			to the conclusion so that the victims office can advise	12:21
16			the injured parties of the efforts An Garda Síochána	
17			put into solving their crimes."	
18				
19			"Sergeant Monaghan should ensure that Garda Keogh is	
20			supervised in bringing this matter to a conclusion so	12:21
21			that the victims office can advised injured parties of	
22			the efforts An Garda Síochána put into solving their	
23			cri mes.	
24				
25			Report without fail by the 20th September."	12:21
26				
27			Garda Keogh has made the case that this was a long	
28			letter, you've set out your concerns and they are	
29			extensive. And he feels that it would have taken you a	

- considerable period of time to sit down and write that
 letter, expressing your concerns in relation to this
 investigation. Did it take you a considerable period
 of time?
- A. No. Writing letters is something I would do every day
 of the week when I was a superintendent. It was second
 nature to me.
- 8 240 Q. Now, in relation to how you were dealing with other
 9 members of An Garda Síochána at the time, and the
 10 number of files and crime files that were passing 12:22
 11 through your desk, can you just give us an indication in relation to how many and how many you might have 13 sent back?

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α. The process began in or around the 1st July. was on annual leave until the 13th and when I came back 12:22 both inspectors went on leave and I was dealing with most of the correspondence at that stage. But in 2015, after the process came in, I returned 44, I suppose, crime files to different members. These ones to Garda Keogh and the rest to other members, out of 184 that 12:23 were submitted that year. And in '16 again that continued, 68 returned out of 536 that came in. In '17 53 returned out 502 that came in. That's a monitoring and control and an audit process that we were going I would give the benefit of my experience, as 12:23 would the inspectors, in pointing out other avenues of inquiry, to allow fruition to develop an investigation, with the primary objective of providing as good a service as possible to the public and ensuring that

Т			criminals are prought to justice and the people would	
2			be kept safe.	
3	241	Q.	What you described as laissez faire attitude, did you	
4			see evidence of that in other members in Athlone at the	
5			time?	12:24
6		Α.	If I saw evidence, I would be quick it point it out. I	
7			am quite candid like that. I did call people to	
8			account on various occasions.	
9	242	Q.	In a similar passion, using that expression?	
10		Α.	I could have used I'm not sure if I used that	12:24
11			express before, I could have. If I saw something that	
12			needed attention, I would call it out.	
13	243	Q.	If we could have page 208 up on the screen, please,	
14			Mr. Kavanagh. This is Garda Keogh's response. He	
15			says:	12:24
16				
17			"With reference to the above, I have already written on	
18			this and explained verbally to Superintendent Pat	
19			Murray regarding the statements, which are legally	
20			binding and valid, made by the injured parties on C8	12:24
21			forms."	
22				
23			I think that is a reference to his meeting with you,	
24			that we have already gone through, on the 30th August,	
25			is that right?	12:25
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	244	Q.	"Which were read over to both witnesses, who signed	
28			same. When I got a chance, I brought"	

1		And then "one of the witnesses" or "the witnesses"	
2		" into the CCTV room to view the footage with her	
3		but it did not show the suspect enter or leave the	
4		building. I also wish to point out that neither of the	
5		witnesses named a person in their statements. I	12:25
6		nominated a suspect who was in the area at the time,	
7		along with hundreds of other people for the triathlon	
8		event. There is no evidence to link him with this	
9		cri me. "	
LO			12:25
L1		If we just	
L2		CHAIRMAN: Just give me the date of that again,	
L3		Mr. Marrinan.	
L4		MR. MARRINAN: It hasn't a date on it.	
L5		CHAIRMAN: But the 22nd September, it's stamped.	12:26
L6		MR. MARRINAN: It is stamped the 22nd September.	
L7		CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Sorry.	
L8	245 Q.	MR. MARRINAN: It's attached to a letter sent by	
L9		Sergeant Monaghan to you on 5th October 2015. And he	
20		says:	12:26
21			
22		"With reference to the above, please find attached	
23		report from Garda Keogh. Chapter 3 of the Crime	
24		Investigation Manual has been brought to the attention	
25		of Garda Keogh. Garda Keogh nominated the suspect for	12:26
26		these thefts but since then he has been unable to link	
27		him with the crimes. All CCTV was viewed and this gave	
28		no leads in the investigation. This case cannot be	
29		progressed at this time and any developments will be	

1			reported to your office as they arise."	
2				
3			And then you note, and it's stamped 6th October, and if	
4			you just read your own handwriting there, please?	
5		Α.	Yes "I note your views. The crime files have been sent	12:27
6			to the victims office, who will inform the injured	
7			parties of the efforts made and the result. I do not	
8			expect to see a repeat of this situation by the member	
9			i nvol ved. "	
10				12:27
11	246	Q.	It's something I will come to later on, but did you	
12			form a suspicion in your mind in relation to why the	
13			injured parties had written out their statements?	
14		Α.	No. I didn't know, but like, in what I had sent down,	
15			I had hoped that Garda Keogh would correct that and	12:27
16			would go out and, I suppose, put an effort into	
17			investigating this crime and bring it to as good a	
18			conclusion as possible. As time passed by, that became	
19			irrelevant, because of the chances of success lessened	
20			considerably.	12:28
21	247	Q.	CHAIRMAN: were you satisfied that it was concluded	
22			when he viewed the CCTV with the suspect?	
23		Α.	No.	
24	248	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Tell me why, chief superintendent, why that	
25			wasn't satisfactory?	12:28
26		Α.	I don't know what occurred, you know, in viewing the	
27			CCTV. That wasn't apparent, it's just something that's	
28			written down. So to allow someone come in and view	
29			CCTV in that fashion, wouldn't be evidentially correct	

- in my view and would cause serious problems.
- 2 249 Q. CHAIRMAN: You're looking at downstream problems that
- 3 might arise?
- 4 A. I am, yeah.
- 5 250 Q. CHAIRMAN: But from the point of view, if you like -
- 6 sorry to interrupt, Mr. Marrinan, but from the point of

12.29

12:29

12:29

12.29

- 7 view there is a suspect. Now, let's look at the thing
- 8 to see, well we see him but we can't see him going into
- 9 the building.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 251 Q. CHAIRMAN: And we can't see him coming out. That in
- itself would seem to be a reasonable investigative
- process, would it? I mean, I am not saying it is or it
- isn't, but on the face of it. Should he have done that
- on his own or not with the --
- 16 A. Yeah.
- 17 252 Q. CHAIRMAN: Involving the injured party in it might
- 18 compromise something?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 253 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is that what you were worried about?
- 21 A. That's where I saw a problem. I suppose the injured
- 22 party seemed to have conversed with the person who
- committed this crime.
- 24 254 Q. CHAIRMAN: If the crossed out bit --
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 255 Q. CHAIRMAN: If we ignore the crossing out bit, somebody
- 20 233 Q. CHARNIAN. IT WE IGNOTE THE CLOSSING OUT DIE, SomeDody
- confessed to something?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 256 Q. CHAIRMAN: But apparently it didn't show up on the

1 CCTV. That's what ultimately appears to be the 2 situation? 3 Α. Yeah. Okay. But you're unhappy. You say, okay, 4 257 0. CHAI RMAN: 5 that may seem like a practical way of doing it, to an 12:29 6 outsider, but because of possible downstream 7 consequences, if there were to be a trial, you wouldn't 8 think that was an appropriate way of doing it? No, I wouldn't say for a trained member of An Garda 9 Α. Síochána it would be something... 10 12:30 11 CHAI RMAN: Thanks very much. 12 was this the first crime file that had MR. MARRINAN: 258 Q. 13 passed your desk from Garda Keogh? 14 Α. In the new process, yes. 15 259 was that something you were looking for? Q. 12:30 No. As I said to you, I came back from holidays and 16 Α. 17 the inspectors I think went on holidays and I was 18 dealing with everything. 19 260 So you don't recall having observed another crime file Q. having crossed your desk by Garda Keogh? 20 12:31 Before this? 21 Α. 22 261 Q. Yes. 23 Α. No. 24 You're very certain of that? 262 Q. Well, a new process had begun, I don't recall having 25 Α. 12:31 dealt with a crime file before this one. 26 27 263 Bearing in mind your interactions with Garda Keogh and Q. what you had been advised of his difficulties, your 28

29

conversations with Sergeant Haran, to a lesser extent

Т			Superintendent McBrien, but also your conversations	
2			with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, and the attempts	
3			to put in place welfare and personnel to deal with him?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	264	Q.	Did you think that the tone of the letter that you	12:3
6			sent, talking about the ethos in An Garda Síochána,	
7			mightn't just be appropriate to somebody in his	
8			position and that maybe it could have been dealt with	
9			by a more gentle reprimand?	
10		Α.	No, I was setting out my position very clearly.	12:3
11	265	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	The standard I wanted applied and how it was to be	
13			applied and I would hope that the effort would be put	
14			in to achieve that standard.	
15	266	Q.	You didn't think of dealing with it perhaps by calling	12:3
16			Sergeant Moylan in and saying, look, this isn't really	
17			satisfactory, it's not how I want things done, will you	
18			have a word with Garda Keogh and make sure that he is	
19			applying himself to his work? You didn't think of	
20			dealing with it in that rather informal way?	12:3
21		Α.	No, I dealt with it in a formal way. Yeah, that's the	
22			way I normally like to work.	
23	267	Q.	Pardon?	
24		Α.	I normally like to work in a formal fashion.	
25	268	Q.	Yes.	12:3
26		Α.	This was formally part of a crime file, which was going	

to be there for everyone to see.

27

28

29

269 Q.

Now, we know later, and we will come to this in due

course, but later on, one of the reasons that Garda

1			Keogh is placed on indoor duty is that you had formed a	
2			suspicion in relation to why these two witnesses had	
3			written out their own statements?	
4		Α.	I don't follow.	
5	270	Q.	You don't recall that; that you were concerned that	12:33
6			perhaps Garda Keogh mightn't have been himself in a	
7			position to write out the statements? We will come to	
8			it in due course, if it's not a matter that springs to	
9			your mind. You weren't suspicious that maybe he was	
10			drunk on duty?	12:33
11		Α.	No, I didn't suspect that but I didn't know why he had	
12			chosen to do it that way. He didn't tell me.	
13	271	Q.	Was that a suspicion that you had?	
14		Α.	No, I wouldn't have had that suspicion, because I	
15			wouldn't think that any sergeant would allow that to	12:33
16			occur.	
17	272	Q.	All right.	
18		Α.	It just didn't make sense to me, that he would do it in	
19			that fashion, when there was obviously information to	
20			be elicited.	12:34
21	273	Q.	Was that an explanation that you considered?	
22		Α.	I didn't I simply didn't know, I asked the question,	
23			why, and I didn't get a sufficient answer.	
24	274	Q.	Well, you got the answer, he said he was too busy	
25			because he was busy at the desk.	12:34
26		Α.	Yes, but I mean, that doesn't hold then, you know.	
27	275	Q.	Okay. We will move on then to that was the end of	
28			the matter and it didn't go any further. And then if	
29			we can just go forward then to the theft of a trailer	

1			at Dublin Road, the 17th August. Again, if we could	
2			just perhaps in the first instance look at the Pulse	
3			entry in relation to this. I will just get the	
4			reference number now, I'm sorry. Yes, it's at 8921 of	
5			the materials. Again, we see there the occurrence	12:35
6			date, the time it was reported, the time it occurred,	
7			4:30am. Where? In a driveway. The scene. And then	
8			there's a narrative. If we go down to the bottom	
9			there:	
10				12:36
11			"Injured party reports trailer stolen from driveway of	
12			house. "	
13				
14			And then it's updated on 11th August 2015, when the	
15			crime file was submitted, it says:	12:36
16				
17			"No suspects."	
18				
19			And then it's updated on the 28th August, a vehicle is	
20			added, isn't that right? And then it's updated on the	12:36
21			11th September, the time of occurrence is updated. And	
22			then eventually it's updated by reference to CCTV	
23			footage of two possible suspects forwarded and uploaded	
24			to GTube, isn't that right?	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:36
26	276	Q.	If we then can look at the crime file in relation to	
27			it, which came to be reviewed by you. If we go to page	
28			2300, please. This is the file that was reviewed by	
29			VOU:	

Т				
2			"Crime category: Theft."	
3				
4			It has the injured party, the date. And then the	
5			remarks of the supervisor:	12:37
6				
7			"CCTV viewed to no avail as it is of poor quality. No	
8			ID for suspects."	
9				
10			And then it has the signature of the supervisor. That	12:37
11			is Sergeant Monaghan I think, is that his signature?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	277	Q.	Then on the next page, at 2301, this was filled out by	
14			Garda Keogh:	
15				12:38
16			"Garda CCTV viewed. Crime occurred 4:31-4:34am."	
17				
18			Then there is a date. I can't see what is written in	
19			the corner.	
20				12:38
21			"8th August 2015. Poor quality footage of car moving	
22			with stolen trailer hitched."	
23				
24			And then:	
25				12:38
26			"Investigating member's comments: Unable to make out	
27			registration number, colour or type of car."	
28				
29			So those were the matters that were contained in the	

1			report. You then raise a query in relation to this	
2			based on what's contained in the crime file, is that	
3			right?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	278	Q.	This is at page 2299. This is on the 14th August. It	12:39
6			refers to the theft at Dublin Road and then also to	
7			criminal damage, which I will come to in due course?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	279	Q.	At Mulligan's filling station?	
10		Α.	Two crime files came to me together.	12:40
11	280	Q.	"Who wrote the statements of attached C8s?"	
12				
13			Now, I think there's been assumption made, I think it	
14			might be incorrect, that this refers to what we have	
15			just been discussing in relation to	12:40
16		Α.	No.	
17	281	Q.	<pre>It doesn't?</pre>	
18		Α.	It refers to the statements that were attached to both	
19			these files that came to me together.	
20	282	Q.	Yes. Why did you ask that question?	12:40
21		Α.	I thought I noted that the writing was different to	
22			Garda Keogh's and I just wanted to be sure the same	
23			thing hadn't happened again.	
24	283	Q.	All right. You say:	
25				12:40
26			"In relation to the stolen trailer, who supplied the	
27			CCTV?"	
28				
29			It's apparent from the report that you received that it	

2 I didn't note that at the time. Garda is written in Α. 3 there now, but at the time I didn't note that. It said 4 CCTV. 5 284 All right. If we can have it back up on the screen, Q. 12:41 6 2301, please. 7 Yes. Α. 8 285 "Garda CCTV viewed, crime occurred..." 0. 9 10 Are you suggesting that the word "Garda" was written in 12:41 11 afterwards? 12 I'm not suggesting anything, but it wasn't apparent to Α. 13 me that it was Garda CCTV at the time. 14 286 Q. But it would appear that it was your error in relation 15 to it? 12:41 16 It may well have been, it may well have been. Α. 17 Well, are you accepting the document on its face as 287 Q. 18 being a genuine document? 19 I have no choice but to accept that the document is a Α. 20 genuine document. 12:42 So it would appear that it was your error in relation 21 288 Q. 22 to --23 It may well be my error, yes. Α. "Who supplied the CCTV?" 24 289 Q. 25 12:42 "There is no statement from that person on the file." 26 27 There wouldn't be if there was Garda CCTV? 28

was Garda CCTV, isn't that right?

1

29

Α.

well, if someone downloaded it, there still

proof. 2 proof. 3 290 Q. "Has any effort been made to enhance the CCTV?" 4 5 A. Yes. 6 291 Q. "Should it be circulated in any way?" 7 8 A. Yes.	12:42
4 5 A. Yes. 6 291 Q. "Shouldit be circulated in any way?" 7 8 A. Yes.	12:42
5 A. Yes. 6 291 Q. "Shouldit be circulated in any way?" 7 A. Yes.	12:42
6 291 Q. "Shouldit be circulated in any way?" 7 8 A. Yes.	12:42
7 8 A. Yes.	
8 A. Yes.	
• • • • · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
9 292 Q. "Where is the CCTV now?"	
10	12:42
11 A. Yes.	
12 293 Q. Which again, if it was Garda CCTV, that wouldn't arise?	
13 A. It would be very relevant, because at that point in	
time when I got the file, the CCTV is the only thing I	
15 had.	12:42
16 294 Q. Well, those questions would appear to be inappropriate	
if you had realised that it was Garda CCTV; isn't that	
18 right?	
19 A. No. I suppose I didn't realise it was Garda CCTV at	
the time and those questions are there, you know, with	12:43
me not realising it was Garda CCTV.	
22 295 Q. But the questions wouldn't be appropriate if it had	
23 been Garda CCTV?	
A. I wouldn't say it would be totally inappropriate.	
Because the CCTV, irrespective of whether it was Garda	12:43
or not, was there, it would have to be downloaded by	
somebody and it would have to be held as evidence in	
that regard. Because at that stage that was the only,	
I suppose, tangible explanation that we may be on to	

1			some lead that needed to be followed.	
2	296	Q.	Your letter is addressed to Sergeant Monaghan and he	
3			sent it on to Garda Keogh on the 18th August. That is	
4			at page 2297. Nothing arises in relation to that. And	
5			then at 2298, Garda Keogh responds.	12:44
6				
7 8			"1. Garda Ni chol as Keogh wrote both statements."	
9			All right?	
10		Α.	Yes.	12:44
11	297	Q.	Did that put your mind at rest?	
12		Α.	Yes, absolutely.	
13	298	Q.	And then:	
14				
15			"3. It is Garda CCTV, which is stored on computer."	12:44
16		Α.	Okay.	
17	299	Q.	"The incident happened at night and the quality is	
18			poor. "	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	300	Q.	If we look at page 2296, this is the letter that was	12:44
21			sent by Sergeant Monaghan and it's dated the 28th	
22			August.	
23				
24			"With reference to the above, please find attached	
25			report from Garda Keogh. He states that he wrote out	12:45
26			the statement from the injured party on the form C8."	
27				
28			It appears that there was just simply one statement	
29			that had been taken?	

2 301 Q. He then goes on to say: 3 4 "The only CCTV footage available to cover the location 5 of the theft is Garda CCTV and on viewing it, the 12:45 6 quality is poor and it was nighttime and this CCTV is 7 stored on the hard drive in the station." 8 Yes. Α. That's right, isn't it? 9 302 Q. 10 So it seems apparent that I hadn't understood Α. 12 · 45 11 that it was Garda CCTV. 12 Now this relates to entirely different CCTV footage 303 0. 13 that had been obtained from Kilmartin's. 14 15 "Garda Keogh has since obtained CCTV footage from 12:46 16 Kilmartin's N6 centre and this shows two possible 17 suspect vehicles, which he has updated the incident 18 Enquiries are ongoing in this case and progress will be reported." 19 20 12:46 21 So did that allay your fears in relation to the issues 22 that you raised? 23 I was glad to see that additional CCTV, which gave a Α. 24 definite lead to follow, had now been identified. 25 well, it had already been identified by Garda Keogh? 304 0. 12:46 But I didn't know that. 26 Α. 27 305 You didn't know that. Then you raise a further query, 0. this is page 2295, it's dated 3rd September 2015. 28

There was statements from both the crimes.

1

29

Α.

Yes.

Α.

- 1 306 Q.
- The incident regarding the theft of the trailer
- 3 requires further explanation in relation to the CCTV.
- 4 It appears the crime file was submitted prematurely,
- indicating no evidence was available, and now evidence

12 · 47

12:47

- 6 has come to light following a request for further
- 7 information."
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 307 Q. That seems to be a misunderstanding on your part?
- 10 A. That was my understanding at the time.
- 11 308 Q. Yes. But it seems to be wrong, isn't that right?
- 12 A. Well, after hearing the evidence here, it appears that
- Garda Keogh had gone to Kilmartin's and I wasn't aware
- of that.
- 15 309 Q. "The following issues have not been dealt with: My
- question in relation to the CCTV in correspondence
- dated 14th August has not been answered."
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 310 Q. Well, I suppose it was answered, because Sergeant
- 20 Monaghan had answered it and advised you that it was
- 21 Garda CCTV and was stored in the station?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 311 Q. All right. Isn't that right?
- 24 A. Well, I was looking for, I suppose, the evidential
- proofs that may be necessary to be included in the file 12:48
- in relation to it, because it was something that may
- become apparent at prosecution stage if that were to
- happen, and I was thinking a couple of steps ahead.
- 29 312 Q. Well, the questions were: Who has it? Where is it?

Τ		Α.	Yes.	
2	313	Q.	Sergeant Monaghan tells you it is Garda CCTV?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	314	Q.	Garda Keogh told you it was Garda CCTV?	
5		Α.	Yes. And I also asked	12:48
6	315	Q.	The crime report form has that it is Garda CCTV. And	
7			here you are still pursuing it?	
8		Α.	I also asked: Was there a statement from a person who	
9			downloaded it? Did it need to be enhanced? And should	
10			it be circulated in any way?	12:49
11	316	Q.	And then:	
12				
13			"2. The car identify identified was involved in a	
14			burglary in Ballinasloe on 9th August 2015. What	
15			liaison has occurred with the investigating member of	12:49
16			that incident?	
17				
18			How is it proposed to allow the CCTV harvested to	
19			assist the investigation?	
20				12:49
21			Where is the CCTV now from an evidential exhibit point	
22			of view?"	
23				
24			That's relating to a different CCTV	
25		Α.	This is the new CCTV.	12:49
26	317	Q.	That's the CCTV that has come to light, isn't that	
27			right?	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	318	0	"Sergeant Monaghan should supervise the proper	

1			investigation of this crime so that we can show to the	
2			victim that we were thorough and professional in our	
3			approach to solving the crime."	
4				
5			And then, if we go on, Sergeant Monaghan receives that	12:49
6			from Sergeant Baker. That's at page 2294. If we could	
7			go forward then to 2293 of the material. There we have	
8			the handwritten response. If we can scroll down,	
9			Mr. Kavanagh, the handwritten response from Garda	
10			Keogh. Again he says:	12:50
11				
12			"Garda CCTV is of poor quality."	
13				
14			Then he says separately:	
15				12:50
16			"Saved Kilmartin's CCTV, downloaded. Statement	
17			regarding same is attached to the file."	
18				
19			That statement was attached to the file, isn't that	
20			right?	12:51
21		Α.	Yes, yeah.	
22	319	Q.	"Garda Keogh has spoken with Garda Eoin Fox and	
23			supplied Garda Fox with a copy of Kilmartin's CCTV of	
24			car and suspects. Both incidents connected on Pulse	
25			and warning attached to"	12:51
26				
27			There is a name there.	
28				
29			" which is registered to a false address."	

Τ				
2			That's a motor car.	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	320	Q.	"CCTV forwarded with request to be put on GTube on the	
5			10th September."	12:51
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	321	Q.	"Garda Keogh has original CCTV. Copy of same forwarded	
8			to Garda Eoin Fox."	
9				
10			He sets out the date there. That is sent on, again on	12:52
11			the 19th September, if we can go to page 2292 of the	
12			material. This is from Sergeant Monaghan to you:	
13				
14			"With reference to the above, please find attached	
15			report from Garda Keogh in relation to this case.	12:52
16			Garda Keogh has addressed points 1-4 raised in your	
17			report.	
18				
19			All the CCTV is saved and the originals are in	
20			possession of Garda Keogh. A copy of this CCTV has	12:52
21			been forwarded to Garda Eoin Fox in Ballinasloe and	
22			Garda Keogh has been in contact with this member in	
23			relation to possible suspects for both cases and	
24			another copy has been forwarded to collator in	
25			Mullingar to be uploaded to GTube. Garda Keogh has put	12:52
26			a warning on Pulse in relation to the suspected	
27			offending vehicle and has made contact with gardaí in	
28			Kildare, where the car is registered to. This is a	
29			false address	

1				
2			This crime is still under investigation and any further	
3			progress will be reported as it arises."	
4				
5			Then you noted there:	12:53
6				
7			"Noted: I appreciate the additional enquiries carried	
8			out, which ensure the organisation is achieving its	
9			goal in relation to the investigation"	
10				12:53
11			CHAIRMAN: "Of crime".	
12		Α.	"Of crime".	
13	322	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Yes "of crime". Then what does it say	
14			that?	
15		Α.	"Report on the efforts of identification by 1/11/15."	12:53
16				
17			That's the identification of the suspects.	
18	323	Q.	We know that Sergeant Minnock sent an e-mail on the	
19			31st August to Garda Keogh, praising him for the work	
20			that he had done in relation to this. It's at page	12:54
21			218.	
22				
23			"Garda Keogh, good work in advancing this	
24			i nvesti gati on. "	
25				12:54
26			There does seem to be some confusion that arose during	
27			the course of this. If I can summarise it in this way,	
28			and correct me if I am wrong in relation to this, if I	
29			can short-circuit matters it would be helpful: It	

- would appear that Garda Keogh investigated the original complaint and that he did so properly, isn't that
- 3 right?
- 4 A. Yes, Garda Keogh used his initiative and he went to
- 5 Kilmartin's and found -- 12:54

12:55

12:55

- 6 324 Q. No, I haven't come to that.
- 7 A. Sorry.
- 8 325 Q. He investigated the original complaint in the first
- 9 instance properly, isn't that right?
- 10 A. I don't understand what you mean.
- 11 326 Q. He took a statement from the injured party?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 327 Q. He viewed CCTV footage?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 328 Q. Which was Garda CCTV footage?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 329 Q. It was in the safe custody of the Gardaí in Athlone,
- isn't that right?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 330 Q. You then raised queries in relation to it because you
- were acting under the misapprehension that the CCTV
- footage related to non-Garda CCTV footage?
- 23 A. That's what I thought.
- 24 331 Q. It was an innocent mistake that you made in the
- 25 circumstances. You raised those queries with Garda
- 26 Keogh.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 332 Q. Unbeknown to you, Garda Keogh in actual fact had gone
- further in relation to the investigation and acting on

- 1 perhaps a hunch or just good police work.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 333 Q. He went to Kilmartin's.
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 334 Q. To see if they had CCTV footage. On the off chance -- 12:55
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 335 Q. -- that people who had taken the trailer may have been
- 8 foolish enough to call in and get petrol in a garage
- 9 nearby?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 336 Q. Then a series of questions go back and forth in
- relation to the original CCTV footage. And you're not

12:56

12:56

- aware still that it's Garda CCTV footage but Sergeant
- 14 Monaghan eventually informs you of that?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 337 Q. Isn't that right? And arising out of those enquiries,
- it appears that in the meantime the CCTV footage that
- 18 Garda Keogh had asked for in Kilmartin's had become
- 19 available?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 338 Q. And in around the same time Garda Keogh had viewed that
- and had identified a suspect vehicle?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 339 Q. Then the matter had been progressed from there?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 340 Q. Your subsequent enquiries then in relation to the CCTV
- footage related to the Garda CCTV footage in the first
- instance?
- 29 A. Yes.

1	341	Q.	And then secondly in relation to the second CCTV
2			footage from Kilmartin's?

- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 342 Q. And Garda Keogh in actual fact had got a statement and
 the CCTV footage had been supplied to him?
 12:57
- 6 A. Yes. Well, he got a statement on the 9th September.
- 7 343 Q. Yes.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 344 Q. And the CCTV footage had been supplied to him?
- 10 A. Yes. Sometime in late August, I understand. And I had 12:57
 11 been keeping in touch with Sergeant Monaghan in
 12 relation to the progress and I knew he was assisting
 13 Garda Keogh.
- 14 345 Q. In your statement, and I will summarise this as broadly
 15 as I can, but in your statement to the Tribunal 12:57
 16 investigators and to the Tribunal, you seem to think it
 17 was as a result of your intervention and the queries
 18 that you raised in the first instance that led to a
 19 successful prosecution?
- A. Yes. I suppose, in the first instance and continuing to follow the investigation, both myself, Sergeant Monaghan and Inspector Curley, you know, ensured that this wasn't going to go being detected and we supported Garda Keogh in doing that, you know, even though he was in a difficult place at the time.
- 26 346 Q. Yes, but it would appear that Garda Keogh had investigated the matter thoroughly?
- A. Yes, indeed, with the assistance of Sergeant Monaghan and his unit colleagues.

1	347	Q.	It would appear that Garda Keogh had investigated the	
2			matter thoroughly?	
3		Α.	Absolutely.	
4	348	Q.	And as a result of good police work, it led to the	
5			solving of this crime, isn't that right?	12:58
6		Α.	Absolutely, and I acknowledged that in the	
7			correspondence, when I said I appreciated the	
8			additional enquiries made and the efforts that were	
9			made to deal with this.	
10	349	Q.	Did you think that that was adequate in the	12:58
11			circumstance, in the light of all the queries that you	
12			had initially raised mistakenly in relation to the	
13			Garda CCTV footage?	
14		Α.	Well, I was mistaken in relation to the Garda CCTV	
15			footage, but I would say the other queries I generated	12:59
16			were legitimate queries, in me doing my performing	
17			my role as a superintendent, monitoring and being	
18			responsible for the thoroughness and accuracy of all	
19			investigations in the district.	
20			MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much chief	12:59
21			superintendent. We are now going to move on briefly in	
22			relation to the criminal damage of Mulligan's and	
23			perhaps we will leave is there.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Perhaps we will leave it until after lunch,	
25			Mr. Marrinan, before we move on to that the matter.	12:59
26			Thank you very much.	
27				
28				

1			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED AND RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS,	
2			AFTER LUNCH:	
3				
4	350	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: was there anything else that occurred to	
5			you over lunch that you might wish to expand on in	14:00
6			relation to what we dealt with before lunch?	
7		Α.	Just in relation to the last crime file we discussed, I	
8			did put supports in place to lead Garda Keogh through	
9			the arrest phase and involved in every stage of that,	
10			right up until the 18th November, when the arrests were	14:01
11			made.	
12	351	Q.	Yes, yes. I think we see that in the papers.	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	352	Q.	It's good that you highlight that.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, say that again, Mr. Marrinan?	14:01
16			MR. McGUINNESS: He put supports in place for Garda	
17			Keogh.	
18			CHAIRMAN: No, it was just your last comment. I heard	
19			what the chief said. You said, we see that	
20			MR. McGUINNESS: we have that in the papers.	14:01
21			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, thank you. No, no, I just didn't	
22			quite hear, thanks very much.	
23	353	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: If we could then go on and deal with the	
24			criminal damage at Mulligan's Petrol Station on the 3rd	
25			August. Perhaps we can just look at the Pulse entry in	14:01
26			the first instance in relation to this. It's at page	
27			8940, Mr. Kavanagh. This is the Pulse entry. It says	
28			the incident category. Up at the top there we see it's	
29			criminal damage?	

		Α.	163.	
2	354	Q.	3rd August 2015. It's a petrol service station and	
3			then there's the narrative.	
4				
5			"Two males wearing track suits and hoodies threw rocks	14:02
6			at a petrol station, cracking a pane of glass. CCTV to	
7			be viewed, to be downloaded. No suspects. Faces not	
8			vi si bl e. "	
9				
10			Then we see it's updated subsequently, but that's the	14:03
11			initial entry. Then we see that Garda Keogh, assisted	
12			by Garda Glennon, is investigating and Sergeant	
13			Monaghan is the supervising garda in relation to it.	
14			Over the next page, we can see the damage that was	
15			caused. I think it doesn't assist us any further in	14:03
16			relation to that. Then if we look at the crime form,	
17			which is page 8942 of the materials. We see there,	
18			it's a very poor photocopy, unfortunately, but we can	
19			just about make it out. Again:	
20				14:04
21			"Crime category: Criminal damage.	
22				
23			Mulligan's filling station, Roscommon road."	
24				
25			Then the date and then investigating member. And then	14:04
26			the remarks of the supervisor. Again, this was	
27			supervised.	
28				
29			"No suspects to date."	

1		
2	And that's signed by Sergeant Monaghan. And then if we	
3	turn over the page to page 3943, we will see at 7, if	
4	we scroll down there I beg your pardon, it's 8943,	
5	Mr. Barnes. Yes. If we scroll down there we will see	14:05
6	on under 7, CCTV, it's ticked. Then:	
7		
8	"8. House to house enquiries."	
9		
10	Were apparently carried out. Then number 9:	14:05
11		
12	"Crime prevention advices."	
13		
14	Apparently they were also handed out. Then under	
15	suspects, under 10 there, there is nobody indicated.	14:05
16	And then under 12:	
17		
18	"Additional enquiries: Area was searched for	
19	cul pri ts. "	
20		14:05
21	So then if we just look at the statement that was	
22	attached to the crime file, I think at 8945, is the	
23	statement of, I think it's the owner of a premises at	
24	Mulligan's filling station. And at the second part of	
25	the statement, he said:	14:06
26		
27	"I viewed the CCTV with the Gardaí, which showed at	
28	3:37am, on the 3rd August, two males track suits and	
29	hoodies covering their faces, also wearing gloves, ran	

Τ			up to the shop door and each threw an object at the	
2			window, causing it to smash. I did not give anybody	
3			permission"	
4				
5			And if we go over the page, Mr. Barnes, to 8946:	14:06
6				
7			" to damage or interfere with my property. The CCTV	
8			will be downloaded in due course."	
9				
10			That statement had been read over and I think that was	14:07
11			taken by Garda Keogh, as we can see from the	
12			introduction on the previous page. So that's where	
13			matters stood. Then we go back to a document that we	
14			opened earlier on, I just didn't open this paragraph,	
15			at page 215, please. You raise an issue in relation to	14:07
16			this.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	355	Q.	And you say:	
19				
20			"In relation to Mulligan's, it appears"	14:07
21				
22			And then you have a named person or a family, is it?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	356	Q.	" may be suspect."	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:07
26	357	Q.	"Was this put to them in any way?"	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	358	Q.	Where did that come from?	
29		Α.	So, the particular family in question were very active	

_			at that time. I note from my drary at that time that I	
2			have entries in about them on the 2nd, 3rd, 4th and	
3			14th August. At the morning meeting, at the PAF	
4			meeting all, I suppose, activities or criminal activity	
5			would be discussed. I think it's quite likely that	14:08
6			their nomination arose as a result of something that	
7			occurred at one of those meetings.	
8	359	Q.	Are there any notes of those PAF meetings that would	
9			support that?	
10		Α.	No, I don't, other than I have notes about the	14:08
11			particular family in my diary on the 2nd, 3rd 4th and	
12			14th August.	
13	360	Q.	So this was you nominating?	
14		Α.	This was me, yes. I suppose to guide them, guide Garda	
15			Keogh towards possible suspects and, you know,	14:08
16			considering that CCTV was available, perhaps their	
17			stature, their build or some element of them would be,	
18			I suppose, identified by somebody perhaps in the Garda	
19			station or even the	
20	361	Q.	You might appreciate, I don't know, but in your letter	14:09
21			it doesn't come across that way. It says:	
22				
23			"In relation to Mulligan's, it appears that [certain	
24			family] may be suspect."	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:09
26	362	Q.	And then:	
27				
28			"Was it put to them in way?"	

4			• .	•			• • •
1	So it's	takına	auite	a lumr) there.	ısn't	1t?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

24

25

26

27

28

29

- Yeah, well I suppose just the level of activity I think Α. that were involved with the family at that time. also had access to a house that was close by to that filling station as well I think, and it may possibly 14:09 have been them. I just wanted that avenue explored. If there was nothing in it, there was nothing in it. But I was, I suppose, guiding the direction of the investigation, to ensure there was no stone was left unturned and I felt always that the public would demand 14:10 that kind of a service from us.
- 12 Yes, chief superintendent, but this comes in the 363 Q. context of a letter which has raised three gueries. 13 14 One in relation to who wrote statements in relation to the Dublin Road incident. And it appears there was one 14:10 15 16 statement. But then second of all, a query in relation 17 to Mulligan's, saying that people were a suspect who 18 hadn't been nominated as a suspect. And then querying 19 whether or not this was put to them. And then in relation to the CCTV, which we discussed earlier on, 20 and I am not going to go back onto that. But these 21 22 were all directed at Garda Keogh, isn't that right? 23
 - They were directed to the sergeant in charge of Athlone Α. as far as I was concerned. They were cases Garda Keogh was involved in but I do indicate that they may be I was giving some guidance as I saw it and I saw that as a my role in not merely rubber stamping a crime file that came up, but I felt my role was to add value in the service to the public in terms of how

14:10

1			volume crime was investigated, so as that the victim	
2			would be at the centre of what we did in a holistic	
3			type way. And I think the structures I set up, you	
4			know, ensured that that was the case and it was a	
5			matter for me then to ensure that everyone understood	14:11
6			the standard that I had set and that that would be	
7			applied then fairly across the board, with a view to	
8			improving the service, creating efficiency and	
9			effectiveness in the service we're delivering.	
10	364	Q.	Perhaps a line along this line would be: Has the	14:11
11			investigating member considered that a member of such	
12			and such a family might have been involved? If so,	
13			then in those circumstances investigate further. But	
14			this is a statement that these people are suspect?	
15		Α.	I said they may be suspect.	14:12
16	365	Q.	All right.	
17		Α.	You know, my use of language is open to interpretation	
18			but my intentions were honourable. I have no doubt	
19			about that. And, indeed, that's the way I approach	
20			things with all of the other crime files I sent to	14:12
21			every other member as well.	
22	366	Q.	Then if we go over to page 21	
23	367	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Just before we leave that, chief	
24			superintendent, can I ask you: What did you envisage	
25			when you say "may be suspect, was this put to them in	14:12
26			amy way", what did you have in mind?	
27		Α.	Could we establish	
28	368	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That somebody would go and say, where were	
29			you on the blank day or blank? It was the suspect	

1			people?	
2		Α.	Yeah, could we establish where they might be or	
3			yeah.	
4	369	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The suspects were the people whom had you in	
5			mind, that somebody would go and say?	14:13
6		Α.	Yeah.	
7	370	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
8		Α.	Additionally then, you know, if their stature or some	
9			element of clothing might become apparent in the CCTV.	
10			CHAIRMAN: I understand that point about the CCTV.	14:13
11			Okay, thanks very much.	
12	371	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: If we go on then to page 217. This is	
13			again a response from Sergeant Monaghan, we have opened	
14			it in relation to the other issues. He says:	
15				14:13
16			"In relation to PID"	
17				
18			And that's the number that we are concerned with here.	
19				
20			" Garda Keogh indicates that there is no evidence to	14:13
21			suspect the persons nominated of this damage and on	
22			speaking to the owner, he is happy that it was no that	
23			particular family as they do not frequent this area.	
24			Any developments will be reported."	
25				14:13
26			Attached to that was 216, which we have already opened	
27			but we didn't open this paragraph. It's from Garda	
28			Keogh and it's dated, is that the 23rd August, I think.	
29			No. I think it's the 28th August.	

Τ				
2			"In relation to"	
3				
4			And he refers to the family	
5				14:14
6			" being suspects, there is no evidence to suggest	
7			this. When I spoke to the owner, he did not feel it	
8			could be them as they do not frequent the area."	
9				
10			So there you have it, I mean Garda Keogh is	14:14
11			responding and saying these people weren't nominated as	
12			suspects.	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	372	Q.	They're not considered as suspects, he has spoken to	
15			the owner of the petrol station.	14:14
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	373	Q.	And he is not nominating as suspects or perhaps people	
18			who had a grievance or otherwise against the petrol	
19			station. So, this family are off the pitch, as it	
20			were, all right, as far as Garda Keogh is concerned?	14:15
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	374	Q.	Then if we go to 219, which we have opened earlier on	
23			today, and your response in relation to it is, you say:	
24				
25			"The crime file in relation to Mulligan's	14:15
26				
27			This is the last paragraph.	
28				
29			" has been sent to the victims office so they can	

1			inform the injured party of our lack of progress due to	
2			the unavailability of avenues of enquiry to progress	
3			the case."	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	375	Q.	If we just deal with what Garda Keogh has to say in	14:1
6			relation to this. If we could have page 62 of his	
7			interview with the Tribunal investigators, and if we	
8			look at line 887 there. This is a quote but it covers	
9			in general what he is alleging in relation to these	
10			matters that I am questioning you on now.	14:1
11				
12			"My police work was again irrationally scrutinised and	
13			minutely criticised by Pat Murray."	
14				
15			Then if we go down to 892:	14:1
16				
17			"It was very simple, Superintendent Murray has set out	
18			in a report dated 14th August 2015 the following: 'In	
19			relation to Mulligan's, it appears [family] may be	
20			suspect. Was this put to them in any way?' In my view	14:1
21			this was irrational because the families live on the	
22			other side of Athlone, the Westmeath side of Athlone,	
23			and have no transport. Mulligan's garage is on the	
24			Roscommon side of Athlone, well away from where they	
25			live. I am still baffled as to how he suggested them	14:1
26			as being suspects in the crime and there is absolutely	
27			no evidence to suggest it was that family. Separately,	
28			in my view it is oppressive in the manner that	

Superintendent Murray is pie out of the sky nominating

1			these suspects and criticising me for not nominating	
2			the family that live two miles away and have no	
3			transport."	
4				
5			So, what do you say in relation to that?	14:17
6		Α.	I didn't criticise Garda Keogh in any way for not	
7			nominating suspects. I merely included them so as that	
8			avenue of enquiry might be conducted in order to, I	
9			suppose, ensure that there was no stone left unturned.	
10			Like, Garda Keogh would well know that the absence of	14:17
11			transport wouldn't prevent a family who were as active	
12			as the [blank]	
13			CHAIRMAN: I think you better try to avoid referring to	
14			anybody's name, for fear	
15		Α.	That family, from moving around in order to commit	14:18
16			crime. That was the type of people they were, and they	
17			were very active at that time.	
18	376	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: This was the third crime file that you	
19			had raised issues in relation to, to Garda Keogh. Were	
20			there any crime files at that time that you didn't	14:18
21			raise an issue in relation to?	
22		Α.	I think there was one in the 44 in that year that I	
23			didn't raise an issue in.	
24	377	Q.	In relation to Garda Keogh?	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:18
26	378	Q.	One in 44 that you didn't?	
27		Α.	Well, I mean, I returned 44 to various members, there	
28			were four that I dealt with that Garda Keogh submitted.	
29	379	Q.	Yes.	

- 1 A. But there was another one, a fifth one, that I didn't
- 2 return to him.
- 3 380 Q. In relation to Garda Keogh?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 381 Q. Have you got the date for that?
- 6 A. I think it was in November of '15.
- 7 382 Q. November of '15?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 383 Q. At a time when he was on indoor duties, is that right?

14 · 19

14:19

14:19

14 . 20

- 10 A. It was a file that was, I suppose, one of the issues
- that he had dealt with before he went on indoor duties.
- 12 384 Q. This is the third file and they have all been returned
- to him, comments have made in relation to them. The
- first of those comments primarily relates to the fact
- that the injured parties made their own statements.
- 16 You're also now unhappy with the fact that he asked
- 17 them to view CCTV footage, even though you didn't raise
- that issue at the time, isn't that right?
- 19 A. Sorry, I didn't get that question fully.
- 20 385 Q. You're unhappy now, you expressed in evidence this
- 21 morning, that Garda Keogh arranged with the injured
- 22 parties to view CCTV with him?
- 23 A. Well, it wouldn't be something that would be
- 24 evidentially best practice.
- 25 386 Q. Yes, but you didn't raise that concern at the time?
- 26 A. No.
- 27 387 Q. Yes. And then we have a situation where the second
- incident, being the theft of a trailer, and there were
- a series of misunderstandings there in relation to

Т			Garda CCIV, but I think that you acknowledge that Garda	
2			Keogh did in fact do good work in relation to that	
3			which led to the solving of the crime?	
4		Α.	Yes, and we tried to support him being involved in it	
5			right to the very end.	14:20
6	388	Q.	Then we have this incident in relation to Mulligan's,	
7			where you have nominated suspects and both he and his	
8			sergeants have returned to say that these suspects	
9			weren't nominated by anybody at the time, that it has	
10			been put to the injured party and they're not	14:20
11			considered suspects and you seem to have accepted that.	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	389	Q.	So then we move on to robbery from the person on the	
14			13th September?	
15		Α.	I would just like to say, you know, I suppose my	14:21
16			dealing with the crime files was the same for Garda	
17			Keogh as every other member in the station. If I felt	
18			a query needed to be generated, if I felt guidance or a	
19			direction needed to be given, I did that irrespective	
20			of who the member was.	14:21
21	390	Q.	Now, we come to deal with the robbery from the person.	
22			In the first instance, if we could look at the report	
23			that had been sent in by Garda Keogh, it's at page 229	
24			of the material. It's a handwritten report, robbery	
25			from the person. He gives the Pulse ID number at the	14:22
26			top. Have you got that?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	391	Q.	Is that right?	

1			"With reference to above, a robbery from the person who	
2			reported at 4am on the 13th September, [the injured	
3			party at a certain location, date of birth and	
4			telephone number], was intoxicated and after pointing	
5			out the scene was brought home by Gardaí. Garda Keogh	14:22
6			is going on rest days and has two days annual leave	
7			booked and is not due to work until 19th September	
8			2015. This was a serious incident and the injured	
9			party may have injuries. Could this be forwarded to	
10			D/Branch for favour of immediate investigation."	14:23
11				
12			Is there anything wrong with a member referring a	
13			matter to the detective branch for investigation?	
14		Α.	Well, the system that was in place at the time meant	
15			that would come to our morning meeting, so we could	14:23
16			decide on the best course of action. Ideally in a	
17			situation like a robbery, things would need to happen	
18			very quickly. You know, robbery is quite a serious	
19			offence and things need to happen very quickly. We had	
20			a system in place that would allow, I suppose,	14:23
21			immediate action by the next available group of people	
22			coming on to, I suppose, immediately commence the	
23			investigation, and that was important in a situation	
24			like this.	
25	392	Q.	Do you believe that this comes under your direction	14:23
26			that you issued on 18th August 2015, in relation to	
27			reporting of critical or serious incidents?	
28		Α.	I'd say there isn't enough information in it, there	

isn't enough information in it to allow, I suppose,

1			people who might be dealing with it in the absence of	
2			Garda Keogh to have a full and comprehensive knowledge	
3			of what might be happening.	
4	393	Q.	Do you believe on the basis of the material that was	
5			available that this would be regarded as a critical or	14:24
6			of a serious nature?	
7		Α.	The incident is serious?	
8	394	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	Yes, absolutely.	
10	395	Q.	You did?	14:24
11		Α.	Yes, the incident.	
12	396	Q.	We discussed this yesterday and your direction, which	
13			is at page 2121. In the first instance, the obligation	
14			was on the sergeant on duty to report this matter, is	
15			that right?	14:24
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	397	Q.	In the absence of the sergeant on duty, then the	
18			station orderly?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	398	Q.	So when this came before your daily PAF meeting, what	14:25
21			you had then available to you was the short report from	
22			Garda Keogh and no report from the sergeant or from the	
23			station orderly, is that right?	
24		Α.	It wasn't envisaged ever that there would be three	
25			reports, just one, and whichever one of those people	14:25
26			who were there to do it, that would be the person that	
27			should, I suppose, provide the details, so as that we	
28			would have as much information as possible.	
29	399	Q.	If we look at the Pulse entry would you viewed the	

1			following day at the PAF meeting, it's page 225 of the	
2			materials, please. It's reclassified there and we will	
3			come to that in a due course, insofar as the category.	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	400	Q.	But it has the date on which it occurred, at 2:30am to	14:26
6			3:30am. The date on which it was reported, which we	
7			see at 4am, I think it is, I can just about make it	
8			out. We have where it occurred on the far right there,	
9			under latitude and longitude?	
10		Α.	Yes.	14:26
11	401	Q.	It gives the precise location. And then the narrative	
12			can be seen further down there in the box on the	
13			left-hand side.	
14				
15			"Injured party walking home through St. Mell's to	14:26
16			Sarsfield Square and under the train bridge, was mugged	
17			by two males. Had €20 stolen. Patrol of the area with	
18			injured party, who pointed out the scene, with negative	
19			results. Suspects were Irish, in their 20s wearing,	
20			white Air Max top and black tracksuit"	14:27
21				
22			Then if we go over to the next page, because we see a	
23			continuation of it at page 226	
24				
25			"black tracksuit bottoms. Number two wearing a blue	14:27
26			McKenzie windsheet or top. Both fled towards waste	
27			ground behind Sarsfield Square."	
28				
29			There is a note there saying that there is no CCTV	

1			footage. So that sets out the details in relation to	
2			it, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	It's a very brief outline, yes.	
4	402	Q.	There is a further incident summary report, which	
5			duplicates what we just read there from the Pulse?	14:28
6		Α.	Yes, and it's the incident summary report that we will	
7			be working from at the PAF meeting.	
8	403	Q.	You would be working from that?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	404	Q.	Then we just better have a quick look at it. 496.	14:28
11			This is printed off instead of the Pulse entry itself;	
12			is that right?	
13		Α.	Yeah. This is the way it comes off with the 003	
14			report, that the sergeant in charge would bring to the	
15			meeting.	14:28
16	405	Q.	But it has all the details?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	406	Q.	We have it there. Under the narrative?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	407	Q.	That is the same as set out	14:29
21		Α.	Absolutely.	
22	408	Q.	in the Pulse report. Now, I think at the PAF	
23			meeting, I think that Sergeant Baker, Inspector Minnock	
24			and Sergeant Curley were there, is that right?	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:29
26	409	Q.	Who was it that raised an issue in relation to this	
27			Pulse entry?	
28		Α.	Inspector Baker, who was then the sergeant in charge,	
29			brought the matter to attention. It had happened in	

Τ			the early hours of Sunday morning and it seemed to be	
2			coming to attention for the first time. So we had	
3			missed an opportunity, I suppose, all throughout Sunday	
4			to make some effort to deal with it.	
5	410	Q.	So what was the concern at that stage?	14:30
6		Α.	The concern was that we had missed an opportunity on	
7			Sunday to deal with it and the passing on the	
8			information, I suppose, hadn't occurred in the fashion	
9			that we would have liked.	
10	411	Q.	Well, in the first instance Garda Keogh had given a	14:30
11			short report in relation to the matter to the sergeant	
12			in charge of Athlone Garda Station, isn't that right?	
13		Α.	I'm not sure how the transfer of the report took place.	
14	412	Q.	If we look at 229?	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:30
16	413	Q.	It's addressed to the sergeant in charge?	
17		Α.	It is, yeah.	
18	414	Q.	And it's indicating that he is going on leave and that	
19			it would be better if a member of the detective branch	
20			dealt with it?	14:30
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	415	Q.	So that was then a matter for the sergeant in charge to	
23			deal with?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	416	Q.	As he or she saw fit?	14:30
26		Α.	I suppose Inspector Baker is best placed to explain the	
27			workings of her office there, but for whatever reason	
28			it didn't appear to get the attention it deserved	
29			immediately when it happened by way of passing on to	

1	someone who would immediately roll into place and begin
2	the enquiries on Sunday morning.

- Quite clearly this report doesn't comply with the direction that you issued on the 18th August?
- 5 A. Well, I would have liked to have seen more information. 14:31
- 6 418 Q. Well it doesn't even purport to be a report as such. I
 7 am just wondering whether or not this was a matter for
 8 the sergeant in charge, once they received this, as to
 9 what they did with it?
- 10 A. Well, under normal circumstances, like as I said, you 14:31
 11 know, some investigative process would immediately
 12 begin to roll out.
- 13 419 Q. That would be the obligation of the sergeant in charge, 14 having received this from Garda Keogh?
- 15 Yes. And I suppose the e-mail that we had envisaged in 14:31 Α. 16 the document you mentioned there, allows that early 17 alert process, so as that none of this happens and 18 things don't get lost. Detective Sergeant Curley and 19 Sergeant Baker have access to emails on their phone and 20 would be able to -- as do I, and would be able to sort 14:32 of ensure that some element of investigative process 21 22 would begin immediately. Robbery wasn't a hugely 23 common offence in Athlone and I think for 2015 there 24 were six robberies. Two of them we will probably be 25 speaking about later. 14:32
- 26 420 Q. Now, you write a letter arising out of this, it's at
 27 page 505. This letter is written to the sergeant in
 28 charge but it's not written to Garda Keogh's
 29 supervising sergeant. Is there some reason why it was

- 1 written to the sergeant in charge?
- 2 A. That letter comes sometime after a whole series of things happened looking into that robbery.
- 4 421 Q. Yes
- 5 A. It's not immediately after. There's a series of events 14:33

14:33

14:34

- 6 between the report arriving and that letter that took
- 7 place.
- 8 CHAIRMAN: what is the date of that letter,
- 9 Mr. Marrinan?
- MR. MARRINAN: This letter is 23rd September 2015.
- 11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.
- 12 422 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Have you a preference that we would deal
- with it in the chronological order, in terms of you're
- referring to the reclassification of the crime?
- 15 A. No, I am referring to the enquiries that were carried
- out on the 14th of September and later on into that
- 17 week by two different members and I suppose
- conversations I would have had with Inspector Curley
- before it arrived to the PAF meeting on the 23/9, so as
- 20 we could make a decision.
- 21 423 Q. CHAIRMAN: But at this point, if I am understanding, at
- this point you're referring back to the original report
- and you're saying that's not satisfactory?
- 24 A. Yes, Chairman.
- 25 424 Q. CHAIRMAN: I know things happen in the middle.
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 425 Q. CHAIRMAN: But that is essentially what the -- is that
- 28 right?
- 29 A. Yes. And I suppose, the things in the middle, and I

- 1 can explain them briefly.
- 2 426 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 3 A. Garda A was detailed to take a statement by Inspector
- 4 Curley from the injured party. He did that. Inspector

14:34

14:35

14:35

- 5 Curley approached me again that evening. We decided
- 6 we'd have another member go back to the injured party
- 7 again.
- 8 427 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 9 A. We were anxious to bottom this out. We were anxious to
- find out what was going on and why a change of heart
- 11 had occurred. I suppose in doing that, different
- 12 pieces of information came in that in some degree it
- was new information and the injuries didn't seem to
- 14 tally with --
- 15 428 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, let me interrupt you for a second,
- 16 chief superintendent. I understand because it's
- 17 another area that is to be looked at.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 429 Q. CHAIRMAN: Which is the circumstances in which it came
- to be reclassified.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 430 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand all that.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 431 Q. CHAIRMAN: But specifically at this point, we have a
- report. Mr. Marrinan has been asking you about the
- 26 function of the sergeant in charge.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 432 Q. CHAIRMAN: But whoever had the obligation of recording
- it, you say in your letter, separate from anything

Τ			else.	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	433	Q.	CHAIRMAN: This report isn't satisfactory.	
4		Α.	Yes. Yes, that's what I say, yeah.	
5	434	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now my question is: Would you have	14:36
6			considered the information on Pulse to be reasonably	
7			satisfactory as a description of what happened and who	
8			did what and what efforts were made?	
9		Α.	I suppose in the circumstances, the way it turned out,	
10			it's scant what's on Pulse, it's a very brief	14:36
11			description.	
12	435	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
13		Α.	I suppose it was kind of the new information that	
14			came to light, a different version sort of, interfered	
15			with what was on Pulse in a way. At that meeting on	14:36
16			the 23rd September we decided to deal with it in three	
17			different or three actions.	
18	436	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So if I am understanding, and I'm	
19			sorry, Mr. Marrinan, for interrupting. If I am	
20			understanding, you say we have to look at what happened	14:36
21			in the meantime in order to understand the nature of	
22			the complaints	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	437	Q.	CHAIRMAN: about the deficiency	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:37
26	438	Q.	CHAIRMAN: or alleged deficiency, suggested	
27			deficiency of the report, is that right?	

Yes. I think the middle --

CHAI RMAN:

28

29

Α.

Then maybe that's the best way to proceed,

Т			Mr. Marrinan. I understand exactly, that would have	
2			been my question, but maybe just to proceed	
3	439	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: We will proceed on that basis. But I	
4			think that the first thing that happened was that, in	
5			actual fact, it was Garda A who went out and took a	14:37
6			statement from the injured party?	
7		Α.	Inspector Curley asked Garda A to take a statement from	
8			the injured party.	
9	440	Q.	But nothing else had occurred other than that?	
10		Α.	I don't know. Inspector Curley asked Garda A to carry	14:37
11			out enquiries and he came out with a statement. I	
12			don't know	
13	441	Q.	Can we look at the statement, it's at page 504 of the	
14			materials. It's a brief statement, so I will go	
15			through it quickly.	14:37
16				
17			"I remember last Saturday night I was walking home at	
18			2am or 3pm. I was walking near the bridge at [a	
19			certain location]. I saw two lads approach me and	
20			asked me for a cigarette. I said I had none and one of	14:38
21			them shouted at me and hit me across the forehead with	
22			a copper bar and fell to the ground and one held me	
23			down and searched my pockets, and the other fella was	
24			kicking me in the chest. I started to fight back and	
25			he then hit me with a bar again a few times. They took	14:38
26			a €20 note and about"	
27				
28			Something.	
29			CHAIRMAN: "Three or four euro in change out of my	

1			pockets".	
2	442	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Thank you, Chairman.	
3				
4			in my pockets. They ran off along the side of the	
5			football pitch towards the railway line. I reported	14:38
6			that to the Guards that night but I don't want any more	
7			done about it. I am not really pushed about it now, I	
8			just want to forget it ever happened."	
9				
10			So that's the statement that was taken.	14:39
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	443	Q.	Which is in fact bereft of any detail in it?	
13		Α.	Well, it describes a very serious beating.	
14	444	Q.	But it doesn't describe the assailants, for example?	
15		Α.	No, no.	14:39
16	445	Q.	It doesn't describe quite a number of details?	
17		Α.	Absolutely.	
18	446	Q.	Did anybody raise this issue with Garda A?	
19		Α.	I suppose Inspector Curley is best placed to deal with	
20			that, but he approached me on that evening and we	14:39
21			discussed this and he decided to send a second member	
22			back to the injured party.	
23	447	Q.	Why was that?	
24		Α.	He wanted more detail from the injured party	
25	448	Q.	All right.	14:39
26		Α.	in relation to what happened. Because, as it's	
27			described here, it's quite serious, he got a very	
28			savage beating, that should be very apparent on him,	
29			and he sent another member back to make more enquiries.	

Т	449	Q.	was a letter sent out to Garda A in relation to the	
2			quality of the statement he had taking?	
3		Α.	Not by me.	
4	450	Q.	No. So then if we move on then, I think that the next	
5			we have is a letter of 14th September 2015, from	14:4
6			Inspector Curley to you and it's at page 500 of the	
7			materials.	
8				
9			"Please find attached statement from the injured party	
10			in this case. On the 14th September, I tasked Garda A	14:4
11			to interview the victim and he recorded the attached	
12			statement. Garda A reported that the victim was	
13			reluctant to meet with him, stating he didn't wish to	
14			pursue the matter. I encouraged Garda A to record a	
15			statement from him, which is attached.	14:4
16				
17			In summary, the victim states that he was robbed by two	
18			males who initially asked him for a cigarette. He	
19			stated that they had hit and kicked him and stole €20	
20			and some change from his pocket. The victim states he	14:4
21			does not wish to pursue the complaint.	
22				
23			The witness statement as recorded is lacking in detail	
24			regarding description of offenders. However, as the	
25			victim is reluctant to cooperate it is difficult to	14:4
26			envisage how a prosecution could be successful, even if	
27			a suspect could be identified.	
28				
29			I recommend consideration be given to recategorise the	

1			incident due to the attitude of the victim."	
2				
3			Of course, that isn't a basis to recategorise, sure	
4			it's not?	
5		Α.	No.	14:42
6	451	Q.	No. So, you say then that you had a discussion with	
7			that evening with Sergeant Curley; is that right?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	452	Q.	what was discussed?	
10		Α.	Broadly the outline of his report there and the	14:42
11			statement Garda A had. He decided that he would detail	
12			another member to go back then to the injured party.	
13	453	Q.	I think that that was done and we have a report that	
14			was sent in, it's at page 498, from Garda John Divilly?	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:42
16	454	Q.	"With reference to the above, I was requested to speak	
17			to the injured party to answer four questions namely:	
18				
19			1. The reason why he does not wish for this incident	
20			to be investigated.	14:42
21			2. A better description of the offenders.	
22			3. What injuries he received.	
23			4. Had he any alcohol consumed."	
24				
25			Now, of course, those were all dealt with by Garda	14:43
26			Keogh, who has a description of the assailants and he	
27			refers to the fact that the injured party was	
28			intoxicated. Then replies to the questions:	
29				

Τ			"Has informed Garda Divilly that he just wants to	
2			forget about this incident. He was not seriously	
3			injured and does not want the matter investigated. He	
4			says he has not been intimidated and is not pursuing	
5			this matter."	14:43
6				
7			Then there is a description of the two assailants.	
8			Then he describes having received a bruise to his head	
9			and cuts to his knuckles, which was caused when he	
10			attempted to fight off his assailants. His mother is a	14:43
11			nurse and treated his injuries at home. He didn't	
12			attend a doctor or hospital. He said he was drunk at	
13			the time of the incident.	
14				
15			"Garda Divilly informed the injured party that it was	14:44
16			his choice if he did not want the matter to be	
17			investigated but if he changed his mind, to contact	
18			Gardaí. Garda Divilly informed him that it would be	
19			better for the investigation to start sooner. However,	
20			he is adamant that he does not wish for the matter to	14:44
21			be investigated."	
22				
23			But it was still open to him if he wished to come	
24			forward	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:44
26	455	Q.	to make a statement, that the matter would be	
27			investigated?	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	456	0	Rut it annears that the matter was in fact	

1			reclassified, isn't that right?	
2		Α.	Well, the report from Garda Divilly adds further new	
3			information in relation to the description and it also,	
4			I suppose, gives a different view of a bruise to his	
5			head and cuts to his knuckles. There's no mention of	14:44
6			an injury to his leg in any shape or form. It just	
7			brings new information into the situation again. We	
8			met then on the 23rd September in relation to the	
9			incident and discussed it, as to what we would do with	
10			it, and we decided on three actions.	14:45
11	457	Q.	Which were?	
12		Α.	Which were to reclassify it to attention and	
13			complaints; to write and ask why, I suppose, or how,	
14			I'd try and find out how the incident hadn't been	
15			passed on in the way that might allow it to be dealt	14:45
16			with. In addition to that, then see what other	
17			information Garda Keogh might that might help us in our	
18			final decisions on it. And the third one was to leave	
19			it on the PAF review system, and that's what happened,	
20			so that it could be reviewed again.	14:45
21	458	Q.	If we just have page 7982. This is chapter 33 of the	
22			Garda Code, in relation to crimes and offences	
23			reporting and recording. If we look at paragraph 3	
24			there, it states:	
25				14:46
26			"If the criteria to record are satisfied"	
27				
28			That's record on Pulse.	
29				

1 "... reasonable probability and no credible evidence to 2 the contrary and the victim does not want the matter 3 taken any further, a criminal offence should nonetheless be recorded." 4 5 Yes. Α. 14:46 6 459 That's very clear, isn't it? Q. 7 Well, HQ circular 139/03 is the crime counting rules. Α. 8 It's much the same as that really, but number 1 on that gives me, I suppose, the delegated authority to make 9 decisions around reclassification of crimes, taking 10 14 · 46 11 into account that quality and the other regulations 12 that are there about that. There are in the pages in 13 the disclosures as well. That creates a situation 14 where I and my team are allowed to make that decision 15 in the best interests --14:47 16 So you determined this wasn't a credible complaint; is 460 Q. 17 that right? 18 well, on the balance of probability, I found the new Α. 19 information, as explained to me, and that was the view 20 of the people in the room around me as well, and I made 14:47 the decision as I am the one that has the delegated 21 22 authority to do that. 23 was this regarded as a significant and important 461 Q. 24 decision and if so, why? 25 We had spent some time that week trying to make sure Α. 14 · 47 26 that, you know, we could take it as far as we could, if 27 it had occurred, that it was serious. We wanted to 28 know who was doing it, you know, who might do it. Who

29

could it possibly be and could we, I suppose, even have

1			an idea who they were in order that we would prevent	
2			anything further happening.	
3	462	Q.	If the injured party arrived in the following week and	
4			said, I've just been walking down the road and saw my	
5			attacker in the chip chop?	14:48
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	463	Q.	What would happen then?	
8		Α.	That would be new information that came in and we would	
9			take that at face value and review the station again.	
10			That's why it was left on the PAF system.	14:48
11	464	Q.	How would you feel prosecuting that in the District	
12			Court, if you had already determined that it wasn't	
13			credibility, the allegation?	
14		Α.	What happens on Pulse is a data quality issue. That	
15			has no relevance to the crime. Pulse won't investigate	14:48
16			a crime. That requires human endeavour. Pulse is just	
17			a means of storing information in relation to crime.	
18	465	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I can understand, chief superintendent, I	
19			can understand that the local superintendent would be a	
20			fit frustrated, when it looks like an outstanding	14:48
21			crime, an unsolved crime, and there's no way he can	
22			solve it. I can understand that that that would be a	
23			frustrating experience. But the rule seems very clear.	
24			Even if I say, look, I want to do nothing about it, if	
25			it's a crime then it has to be recorded, even if, as I	14:49
26			say, rather frustratingly, it comes up as a number	
27			that do you understand me? As I say, I can	
28			understand a degree of frustration, but it does seem	
29			pretty clear.	

A. Chairman, the fact that it's on Pulse as a robbery
wouldn't have any bearing in terms of my frustration,
because if the injured party didn't want to do anything
about it, that would be captured on the narrative and

14:49

- 5 that would explain its lack of detection or efforts.
- 6 466 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 7 But with the crime counting rules, if there's, I Α. 8 suppose, an issue as to whether it happened or not and on the balance of probabilities that's a decision I and 9 my team made, we made it in the best interests of 10 14 · 49 11 capturing what we thought was data quality, there were some issues and new information that was coming each 12 13 teach the injured party had spoken to, I suppose added 14 to that, and we made that in the best -- with the best 15 intentions possible. And not to, I suppose, frustrate 14:50 16 or hide anything. I was in the business of looking for 17 resources, so I wasn't in the business of hiding 18 anything.
- 19 467 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 20 A. All of my interactions had been opened, transparent and 14:50 honest in --
- 22 468 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, don't think I am suggesting
 23 propriety or impropriety, I am trying to be as neutral
 24 as I can. As I say, I can somewhat understand somebody
 25 saying, here's a case, I can't investigate it as
 26 matters stand?
- 20 matters stair

Α.

Yes.

27

28 469 Q. CHAIRMAN: Which I could understand as being a -- I
29 mean have you explained your answer to that?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 470 Q. CHAIRMAN: And when I said frustrated, I didn't imply
- 3 any criticism or anything like that?
- 4 A. No. I am just trying to give the best answer I can for
- 5 myself, Chairman.

14 · 51

14:51

14:51

- 6 CHAIRMAN: I understand. Okay.
- 7 471 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Before the decision was made, did
- 8 anybody go back to Garda Keogh, who perhaps was best
- 9 placed to give a description of the demeanour of the
- injured party?
- 11 A. No. No, to the best of my knowledge no one went back
- 12 to Garda Keogh.
- 13 472 Q. Why not?
- 14 A. I don't know.
- 15 473 Q. Do you think it is something that should have been
- 16 done?
- 17 A. Well, I wrote to him then on the 23rd September in
- 18 relation to it.
- 19 474 Q. I know, but this is after reclassification. Prior to
- 20 reclassification, do you think it's something that
- 21 should have been done?
- 22 A. No, because Garda Keogh had no real involvement in the
- investigation outside of meeting the man on the first
- 24 night. He was in possession of information from that.
- 25 475 Q. But he took him on a tour of the area?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 476 Q. He looked for CCTV, if there was any, that could help?
- 28 A. Yes. But he didn't outline where he had looked or, you
- know, matters to that effect that might help.

1 477 Q. He interacted with the injured party	1	477	Q.	не	interacted	with	the	injured	party
---	---	-----	----	----	------------	------	-----	---------	-------

- 2 A. He interacted and brought him home, yes.
- 4 He told us in evidence that he had additional evidence to give insofar as meeting the injured party who was coming in a taxi to the Garda station?

14:53

- 6 A. Well, that information didn't come until much later.
- 7 479 Q. But that's because nobody made any enquiry of him?
- 8 But, I mean, he furnished a report on the first night Α. which didn't contain that information. There was a 9 potential witness perhaps lost. And that was the type 10 14:52 11 of situation I was trying to indicate that had occurred 12 here, that I suppose wouldn't meet the standard that I 13 wished to apply and in turn wouldn't demonstrate that 14 we were providing the best possible service. 15 accountable to the chief superintendent and I had to, I 14:52

suppose, account for myself every fortnight to her.

17 480 Q. You see, chief superintendent, the letter that was
18 written by Garda Keogh on the morning of the offence
19 was addressed to the sergeant in charge?

16

- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 481 Q. It's not entirely clear that that was intended to be 22 the report that was envisaged by you in your direction 23 of the 18th August. But the sergeant in charge had 24 that obligation, to prepare an adequate report for your 25 purposes. Do you understand?
- A. I understand what you are saying. That didn't happen, yeah.
- 28 482 Q. So therefore, if the sergeant in charge on receiving 29 that report considered it didn't measure up to what you

1 were requesting, the obligation was on him or her to 2 compile the report and they then should have compiled a 3 report and sent it to the PAF meeting, is that not correct? 4 5 The sergeant in charge brought that information, but Α. 14:53 6 the person with the information was off duty. 7 The sergeant in charge had the obligation to prepare an 483 Q. 8 adequate report under your direction of the 18th August, is that right? 9 10 The sergeant on duty on the night, if there was one. Α. 14:53 11 484 The sergeant on duty. Q. 12 On the night --Α. 13 485 Yes. Q. 14 Α. -- that the incident occurred, should be full owe au fait with what the information would be. 15 14:54 16 He or she had the obligation --486 Q. 17 Α. Yes. 18 487 -- to bring a report to the PAF meeting that was Q. 19 adequate? 20 Well, it wouldn't be to the PAF meeting because they Α. 14:54 too could be off duty, but to leave a report with 21 22 adequate information there. 23 For the PAF meeting? 488 Q. 24 Yes. Well even before the PAF meeting, because this Α. 25 happened over a weekend, the PAF meeting happened on 14.54 26 Monday morning, so there was time lost on Sunday there 27 where enquiries could have commenced. 28 I am not entirely sure that I understand, chief 489 Q. 29 superintendent, how you can say time was lost. Garda

1			Keogh presumably was going off duty that very morning?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	490	Q.	He has indicated to the sergeant in charge the Pulse	
4			entry, there's a brief report there indicating that he	
5			is going off duty and he is not going to be on duty and	14:54
6			somebody in the detective branch should take over the	
7			investigation?	
8		Α.	Yes. That doesn't appear to have been passed on to me.	
9	491	Q.	But that's not Garda Keogh's fault?	
10		Α.	Oh I never blamed Garda Keogh for that.	14:55
11	492	Q.	We come to your report at page 505, the queries that	
12			you raised in relation to this investigation. It's	
13			addressed to the sergeant in charge, as I say.	
14				
15			"I refer to the above matter and my correspondence	14:55
16			attached regarding reporting incidents."	
17				
18			Okay, this is your report, it's set out on page 2121,	
19			on the 18th August, is that right?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:55
21	493	Q.	"In this case the incident on the face of it was	
22			seri ous. "	
23				
24			This is the first correspondence that you have written	
25			in relation to this case, is that right?	14:55
26		Α.	Yes, I was sending it to the sergeant in charge of	
27			Athlone.	
28	494	Q.	It's after it's been reclassified, is that right?	
29		Δ	Yes	

1	495	Q.	And it's headed "robbery from the person"?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	496	Q.	Why is that?	
4		Α.	I suppose there's no real reason for that. There's	
5			no there's nothing intended by that. It merely was,	14:56
6			I suppose, what I felt I was dealing with that morning	
7			at the PAF, even though the decision to reclassify it	
8			was made at that morning meeting and probably	
9			reclassified at some point later on in that day.	
10	497	Q.	"The scant report submitted does not give any	14:56
11			indication of what investigative steps were taken at	
12			the initial reporting stage regarding the scene"	
13				
14			Now, the Pulse entry does give these details, isn't	
15			that right?	14:56
16		Α.	Well, it doesn't, I suppose, outline it outlines in	
17			the GPS coordinates where the scene is but it doesn't	
18			outline exactly what was searched.	
19	498	Q.	It says that he took the injured party on a search of	
20			the area?	14:57
21		Α.	Drove him around to see could he identify them, yeah.	
22	499	Q.	He tells with the next line in your letter, CCTV	
23			issues, he says there's none?	
24		Α.	Again, it doesn't say where was checked for that, how	
25			far was the check carried out?	14:57
26	500	Q.	I understood what was envisaged in the report was a	
27			short, concise report?	
28		Α.	Yes. I suppose I hoped that vital information would be	

included and I didn't expect to have to be exactly

- 1 prescriptive to every experienced member of the Garda
- 2 in the district.
- 3 501 Q. You see, if we go back to your direction of the 18th
- 4 August, it's a short, concise report in addition to any

- 5 entry made on Pulse?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 502 Q. But in any event, injured parties, I think that's
- 8 identify in the Pulse?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 503 Q. And, indeed, in his report. An account of events, this 14:57
- is dealt with in Pulse in a brief form?
- 12 A. In brief form, yeah.
- 13 504 Q. Descriptions of assailants, that's dealt with?
- 14 A. Description of clothing is dealt with, yeah. Like, I
- suppose new information came from Garda Divilly's visit 14:58
- then which describes something.
- 17 505 Q. There is a description of the assailants in the Pulse
- 18 entry, isn't that right?
- 19 A. Males in their 20s and their clothing is described.
- 20 506 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. But Garda Divilly intervention added another dimension.
- there's some features described.
- 23 507 Q. What was taken? We know from the Pulse entry how much
- 24 was taken?
- A. Well, yes, €20, then the coins or the additional money. 14:58
- 26 508 O. What violence was used?
- 27 A. That was, I suppose -- there was new information coming
- all the time about that. It was initially a leg
- injury, then it was bad beating with an iron bar or a

- copper bar and when Garda Divilly it was just a bruise
- to the forehead and cuts to the knuckles.
- 3 509 Q. What injuries were received? Whether photographs were
- 4 taken, etcetera?
- 5 A. Yes.

14:59

14:59

14:59

- 6 510 Q. "These issues are the basic steps required at the
- 7 commencement of any investigation."
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 511 Q. But in actual fact almost all those matters are dealt
- with by Garda Keogh on Pulse, is that not right?
- 11 A. Yeah, and they're all matter that you would record in
- 12 your notebook and the duty of the first member at the
- scene are set out in the CIT manual.
- 14 512 Q. Did he have all those details in his notebook?
- 15 A. I don't know. I don't know.
- 16 513 Q. "The duties of the first member at the scene are also
- set out clearly in the CIT manual but are not recorded
- in this report."
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 514 Q. "I require an explanation, please, as to why this
- 21 matter was dealt with in the fashion chosen."
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 515 Q. So it's is addressed to the sergeant in charge?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 516 Q. It's his or her obligation to provide that report?
- A. Absolutely. And I expected him to do that, yeah.
- 27 517 Q. Yes. And did you get a reply from the sergeant in
- charge?
- 29 A. I got a reply Garda Keogh through his unit sergeant.

Т	518	Q.	But it's the sergeant's obligation to deal with the	
2			report and why these matters weren't contained in the	
3			report?	
4		Α.	The sergeant, yes.	
5	519	Q.	Yes.	15:00
6		Α.	Yeah. I would have liked the sergeant to have taken a	
7			more comprehensive approach.	
8	520	Q.	This is then forwarded on to Garda Keogh. If we look	
9			at page 235 of the materials, this is his response. It	
10			seems to be dated the 29th September.	15:00
11		Α.	There may be one before that, page 232.	
12	521	Q.	I beg your pardon, yes, this one, it's upside down, but	
13			it's dated the 20th September. He says:	
14				
15			"With reference to the attached report, this incident	15:01
16			was reported to Gardaí at 4am on 13th September 2015.	
17			The injured party was brought to the scene, where it	
18			was searched. The injured party was driven around the	
19			area in an effort to identify the suspects."	
20				15:01
21			All of this, of course, is in the Pulse entry.	
22				
23			"There is no CCTV in the area the incident occurred.	
24			The injured party was then brought home and placed in	
25			the care of his mother. When I returned to work on the	15:01
26			19th September, having already written a report on the	
27			incident and put it on Pulse, I rang the injured party,	
28			who informed me that he had made a statement to a	
29			detective to the effect that he did not want the matter	

1		pursued by Gardaí. The attached report from	
2		Superintendent Murray is nothing short of a form of	
3		harassment towards myself."	
4			
5		That was sent with an accompanying letter from Sergeant	15:0
6		Monaghan and it's at 233 of the material. And he says:	
7			
8		"With reference to the above, please find attached	
9		report from Garda Keogh in relation to your report of	
10		the 23rd September. He reports that the injured party	15:0
11		was brought to the scene and that the area was	
12		searched. The injured party was driven in the patrol	
13		car around the town in an attempt to identify any	
14		suspects. There is no CCTV in the area where the	
15		incident took place. He was then brought home and	15:0
16		placed in the custody of his mother. On returning to	
17		work on the 19th September, he made contact with the	
18		injured party to obtain a statement and the injured	
19		party informed him that he had already made statement	
20		to a detective garda in Athlone, withdrawing his	15:0
21		compl ai nt."	
22			
23		That's signed by Garda Monaghan. Should that not	
24		really have been the end of the matter?	
25	Α.	Well, the tone of the report indicated that Garda Keogh	15:0
26		wasn't happy with me or didn't feel that I could make	
27		enquiries of him. My intentions were honourable. I	
28		was trying to bring some conclusion to this if	

possible. I kept it on the review system. And I was

1			hoping that we could, I suppose, get more information	
2			as to what happened on the night, so as we could, I	
3			suppose, analyse that with what we had already. I	
4			didn't want to merely close the matter out and leave it	
5			like that, if I could possibly come to some conclusion	15:04
6			on it.	
7	522	Q.	Then you respond at page 234 of the material?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	523	Q.	"I note Garda Keogh's response to date."	
10				15:04
11			Sorry, Chairman, it's the 13th October.	
12				
13			"I note Garda Keogh's response to date, which is far	
14			from satisfactory. In order that I can be assured the	
15			organisation's objectives regarding the investigation	15:04
16			of crime are met in this case, Garda Keogh would be	
17			well advised to take careful note of his statutory	
18			obligation to account as set out at section 39 of the	
19			Garda Síochána Act 2005, which applies to every member	
20			of An Garda Síochána equally, and its inextricable link	15:05
21			to the Garda Síochána discipline regulations 2007. If	
22			the member feels he is someway removed from his	
23			statutory obligations, then there may be a remedy open	
24			to him under the policy document Working Together to	
25			Create a Positive Working Environment."	15:05
26				
27			We discussed earlier on the meeting on the 30th, that	
28			things may have come to a head at that stage, it seems	
29			that they have gone a little bit further here.	

1	Α.	Yeah. Like, I suppose, Garda Keogh may have or had a	
2		view of me, I don't know when he formed that view or	
3		why, but I had only the objectives of ensuring the	
4		organisation's investigative service was met in	
5		relation to the case. I only wanted to get the	15:06
6		information that he possibly had. I made it clear to	
7		him that, despite the fact that he was making a	
8		complaint that I was harassing him, that didn't remove	
9		him from the obligation to account. He had a remedy	
10		open to him, if he felt that I was harassing him or if	15:06
11		he felt I was being unfair to him. And I invited him	
12		to take that remedy and I feel that, you know, if my	
13		intentions weren't honourable, I wouldn't have sent	
14		that letter or adopted that approach.	

- 15 524 Q. Again, I mentioned insubordination in relation to your 15:06

 16 meeting on the 30th August and why you could have dealt

 17 with it --
- 18 A. I shudder to think if I had gone down that road, what position I'd be in now.
- 20 525 Q. But I suppose you had tolerated what was clearly insubordination at that time?
- 22 I knew the position Garda Keogh was in, I knew it was Α. 23 difficult for him. But he continued to come to work 24 and his doctor was certifying him fit for work on a certain day and he was going to incidents and calls and 15:07 25 meeting the public. My system insisted on follow up. 26 27 I was very anxious that that follow up would happen. And I understood, you know, Garda Keogh wasn't able at 28 29 times, I suppose, to follow up because of the issues he

1			had with alcohol and the impact that was having on his	
2			absences. And then he seemed detached from his roles	
3			and responsibilities in the Garda station and to the	
4			public as a member of An Garda Síochána, in relation to	
5			the every day duties that had to be carried out when he	15:07
6			presented for work. And that was where I found myself.	
7	526	Q.	You conclude:	
8				
9			"In the meantime, I await a proper response as to the	
10			actions taken on the night that this matter was	15:08
11			reported. "	
12				
13			Are you questioning there his investigation of it?	
14		Α.	No, I amn't, I'm looking for information.	
15	527	Q.	But it's all on Pulse, you have it.	15:08
16		Α.	No, but like I suppose we'll come to it in a minute,	
17			the answer introduced new information again.	
18	528	Q.	"I also expect to see some written record as to what	
19			the injured party alleged, to include a description of	
20			his assailants and an answer as to why my instructions	15:08
21			of the 18th August were not complied with."	
22				
23			This matter had been reclassified.	
24		Α.	I explained how that came about and how I felt I made	
25			that with honourable intention was my team, in a	15:09
26			measured way, assessing all the information that we had	
27			at the time, lending the combined experience, the	
28			policing experience that the four of us had to that	
29			decision.	

There was nothing further to be gained in terms of any 1 529 Q. 2 investigation, because the matter had effectively been 3 closed as far as the investigation was concerned, isn't that right? 4 5 I didn't see it like that. I left it open on the PAF Α. 15:09 6 incident review list until December, in the hope that 7 new information would come to light that might allow 8 some --What new information did you anticipate? 9 530 Q. I didn't know what Garda Keogh had. 10 I didn't know. Α. Ι 15:09 11 simply would liked to have had the full set of 12 circumstances and information that he may have had. 13 CHAI RMAN: The victim would have to change his mind for 531 Q. 14 a start? 15 Absolutely. Α. 15:09 16 532 CHAI RMAN: Or the injured party. Something else might 0. 17 come up? 18 Yes. Something, some other witness might emerge that Α. 19 might add something to it or take something from it. Chief superintendent, from Garda Keogh's 20 CHAI RMAN: 533 Q. 15:10 point of view, I am just recalling his position on 21 22 this. 23 Yes. Α. 24 He says, look, I investigate it, the next 534 CHAI RMAN: Q. 25 thing I come back to work and I find the victim, the 15:10 26 injured party has suddenly mysteriously dropped his

27

28

29

one.

complaint, despite the fact that he looked serious to

me and I said it and I wanted it there. That's number

And he comes back and then he gets queries about

1			it. And it transpires that at the time he gets the	
2			queries the matter has actually been reclassified as,	
3			so to speak, a non-crime. So, it looks a bit	
4			frustrating from his point of view?	
5		Α.	I see that. I see that, Chairman.	15:10
6	535	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean that he's getting it in the neck, so	
7			to speak, for something that is a non-crime. Can you	
8			understand?	
9		Α.	I see his position exactly. In fairness to him, when	
10			he came back he contacted the injured party, who told	15:11
11			him that somebody had visited. I see how he might form	
12			a view in his mind that I was in some way against him,	
13			you know, but that wasn't the case. Maybe I added to	
14			that, Chairman, in the way I handled it but	
15	536	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But your evidence, if I am understanding,	15:11
16			your evidence is that although it had in fact been	
17			reclassified as a non-crime, your mind was still open	
18			to some extent?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	537	Q.	CHAIRMAN: In the event that something else happened,	15:11
21			one of which we agree has to be that the injured party	
22			changed his mind and said after all, I am going to	
23			pursue it. Is that right?	
24		Α.	Yeah, or indeed, you know, some new witness will come	
25			forward that might have an idea of who we might be	15:11
26			dealing with, if it happened, if this crime happened.	
27	538	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So that stayed the situation until December.	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	539	Q.	CHAIRMAN: When nothing further having happened	

1		relevant	to this,	you said,	we'll	close off?
2	_					. C'

- 2 A. Inspector Farrell actually made the final decision on it at one of the meetings.
- 4 CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thank you.
- 5 540 MR. MARRI NAN: If I could just deal with one issue Q. 15:12 6 concerning your interview with the Tribunal 7 investigators, it's at page 3048. We obviously have 8 all this material and it's all available to the Tribunal and we can't go over every word of it when 9 you're in the witness box, but there is a comment that 10 15:13 11 you made here in relation to incident, and I just ask 12 you to explain what you meant in relation to it. If we 13 can scroll down, Mr. Barnes, to line 593. This is in 14 relation to Detective Sergeant Curley.

15:13

15:13

"On Monday 14th September 2015, a detective sergeant allocated one of his team to bottom this out and as it turned out, the member did not I believe see fit to contact Garda Keogh at all, which I believe would be unusual and speaks for itself."

21 A. Yes.

22 541 Q. What did you mean by that?

- A. I meant that Garda Keogh's drinking at that stage was
 having a big impact on him. He was going off for a
 number of days and he used to go drinking while he was
 off duty, and that was commonly known. So the person
 at the source of the information may not have been
 available to help, nothing more than that.
- 29 542 Q. Then if we can go to 235 of the material, this is Garda

Τ			Reogn's response. It's dated the 29th September. No,	
2			sorry, it's the 29th October.	
3				
4			"Sergeant Monaghan, with reference to the overleaf, I	
5			have complied in full with section 39 of the Garda	15:15
6			Síochána Act I note with the exception of how it was	
7			reported and injuries."	
8				
9			So there he is setting out his stall, he says that	
10			everything is there on Pulse effectively. Then he goes	15:15
11			on to deal with:	
12				
13			"Garda McMeeting and I were in a patrol car at Church	
14			Street at 4am when a taxi parked beside us, which had	
15			come from the direction of St. Mell's. The injured got	15:15
16			out of this taxi and reported the incident to me. The	
17			injured party did not want medical treatment and stated	
18			that he would go to the doctor in the morning. Injured	
19			party"	
20			CHAIRMAN: "If his leg was still at him."	15:16
21	543	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Yes. "was still at him. Pointed out	
22			the scene, requested to be brought home, which we duly	
23			obliged. I also wish to point out that this incident	
24			was recategorised by Superintendent Murray from robbery	
25			from the person to attention and complaints on the 23rd	15:16
26			September."	
27				
28			That's where matters rested, is that right?	
29		Α.	Well, that's the new information, yeah, the taxi person	

1			was new to the whole thing at this stage and an	
2			opportunity was perhaps lost to try and find that	
3			person.	
4	544	Q.	Presumably it was still available?	
5		Α.	Well	15:16
6	545	Q.	Were any enquiries made in relation to taxi companies	
7			in Athlone?	
8		Α.	Like this was in October. This was, I suppose, nearly	
9			two months later, definitely six or seven weeks later.	
10			It was a fruitless exercise at that point in time, I	15:17
11			felt. I needed to get more information from Garda	
12			Keogh. He wasn't willing to give it. I didn't see any	
13			point in pressing the issue. I knew how he felt about	
14			me and I felt I was on a hiding to nothing in trying	
15			to, I suppose, elicit any more information.	15:17
16	546	Q.	Just before we move on, in relation to this, ultimately	
17			what's your criticism of Garda Keogh in relation to the	
18			investigation of this robbery that he conducted in the	
19			early hours of the morning, before he went off duty?	
20		Α.	I haven't criticised him hugely in any way up to now.	15:17
21			I'm trying to get information from him. I felt there	
22			may be more information. I felt, I suppose, more	
23			information could have been provided on the night.	
24			There's no issue, we had a system in place for	
25			incidents like that to be handled over immediately, so	15:18
26			as the machine, as it were, the investigative machine	
27			would crank up and things would happen and to give	
28			ourselves the best opportunity.	
29	547	Q.	At the time when the matter was being reviewed, when	

- could you have sought additional information from him, nobody went to him, isn't that right?
- A. Well, he had indicated to me in August that he wanted everything in writing and it was just very difficult.

 Though it work challenging dealing with Carda Koogh

I found it very challenging, dealing with Garda Keogh,

6 in terms of him being available for work, going to

incidents, my responsibility to, I suppose, ensure that

they are closed out and his view of me, I suppose, you

9 know, the view that he had adopted of me being in some

way against him, when I wasn't and I only tried to help $_{15:19}$

him in any way I could in relation to his welfare. But

15:18

15:19

15:19

I had to bottom out the stuff. I had to have a

standard and it had to apply equally to everybody.

14 548 Q. Okay.

7

8

10

11

12

- 15 A. It may not be against -- it may be against my
 16 interests. In trying to press Garda Keogh, I felt I
 17 had to do the right thing for the right reason. I knew
 18 that might be against my interests, and so that's the
 19 way it turned out.
- 20 549 Q. We know at this time, and we will come to it in a minute, that he was, in late September, involved in an incident at the River Shannon, where he pulled a
- 23 drowning lady from it?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 550 Q. Did you ever go to him directly and commend him for
- 26 what he had done at that time?
- 27 A. No. But I did ensure that he was commended, yeah.
- 28 551 Q. We will come to that in due course?
- 29 A. Yes.

- But did you ever think of maybe writing to him even and saying, I understand that you performed this and I compliment you in relation to it and, you know, that's good police work?
- A. Not directly, but my system was that at the PAF meeting 15:20 when an incident summary report of that nature would come up, I would write down to the sergeant, good work, consider PW1 or consider commendation.
- 9 553 Q. But it was good work?
- 10 A. Yeah, absolutely. All of the team performed very well 15:20 that night.
- 12 554 Q. We have a description from him and he seems to have
 13 been in the front line, and I don't think he was
 14 actually looking for any great credit for it. But he
 15 seemed to be in the front line and he was the person
 16 who pulled the lady from the river.
- 17 A. Yes, absolutely. Sergeant Monaghan was there and I am 18 sure he will be giving evidence on that.
- 19 555 Q. He described his colleague behind him holding onto him and he was therefore also in danger?

- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 You know, all this is unfolding, you're being critical 556 0. of his work. We have those incidents, there's four of 23 24 them, where you have sent back the files, guite clearly 25 he is responding in a very negative way and believes 26 that in some way he is being harassed. I am just 27 asking you, when this arose at a PAF meeting, you saw 28 that he was involved in saving a drowning lady, did you 29 think that this might, as it were, break the ice

2			go to him and congratulate him on the work that he had	
3			undertaken?	
4		Α.	I would have no difficulty doing that. I had no	
5			animosity towards Garda Keogh in any way. I am	15:2
6			professional and, you know, I am officer now for a	
7			number of years and I adopt a professional approach in	
8			all my dealings with staff. I have always done that.	
9			Garda Keogh wasn't around during the daytime when I'd	
10			be there. He worked mostly at nighttime. It was	15:2
11			difficult to meet him. I didn't see him around the	
12			station. If I had have, I would certainly have said	
13			hello to him at any time that I could. But I don't	
14			recall meeting him very much during the day.	
15	557	Q.	Okay. We will move on swiftly to issue number 10 then.	15:2
16			This is denial, cancellation of annual leave. If we	

between the two of you and it might be a good idea to

15:22

"I applied to cancel an annual leave day, namely 31st August 2014, for the purpose of attend ago GSOC appointment on that date under the Protected Disclosure Act. My line manager, Sergeant Monaghan, approved my request. Superintendent Pat Murray, who was aware of the confidentiality of GSOC communications with members, countermanded this approval, citing 'absence or proper explanation' (my emphasis) in circumstances where I could not provide any more specific explanation

could have 131 up on the screen, please. This is Garda

Keogh's position in relation to this. If we scroll

down to paragraph 10. He says:

given the confidential nature of the GSOC disclosures."

2

3

4

5

1

Then at page 58 of the material, at line 835, if we can scroll down to that. This is what he said to the Tribunal investigators:

15:23

15:23

15:24

15:24

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

"They knew I was going to meet GSOC. But Superintendent Murray was Looking for a comprehensive report of what I was going to meet GSOC about. protected disclosures process is supposed to be protected and confidential. The Garda Commissioner O'Sullivan was saying publicly she supported whistleblowers but I feel Superintendent Murray was looking to ascertain confidential information about my meeting with GSOC. I felt that I had given an explanation and I did not feel I needed to give further explanation than I had already set out, namely that I The superintendent would have been had to meet GSOC. aware that there were no papers served on me GSOC in relation to any other work related investigation and that I was not a witness to any investigation being conducted by GSOC, as this paperwork always is dealt with through the ranks. As I have said, I believe Superintendent Murray was aware that this meeting with GSOC related to my protected disclosure and given the

protections in that legislation, I felt that I outlined

15.24

2829

writing."

as much as I could in my initial explanation in

1			If we just briefly look at that before we look at the	
2			allegations contained in that. This is a letter	
3			written by Sergeant Keogh dated the 1st September.	
4			Garda Keogh, sorry, dated 1st September, at 9209 of the	
5			material. It's addressed to Sergeant Monaghan re	15:25
6			annual leave 31st August 2015. Garda Keogh Nick Keogh:	
7				
8			"With reference to above, I took annual leave on the	
9			31st August, however I was required to meet GSOC on	
10			that day in Portlaoise and I requested to have the	15:25
11			annual leave cancelled for that day, Monday 31st August	
12			2015. Forwarded for your consideration, please."	
13				
14			You will note there that there's a note at the bottom,	
15			under Garda Keogh's signature:	15:26
16				
17			"Application approved."	
18				
19			On the 2nd September by Detective Sergeant Monaghan,	
20			isn't that right?	15:26
21		Α.	Sergeant Monaghan, yes.	
22	558	Q.	Yes. Or Sergeant Monaghan, I beg your pardon. If we	
23			look at chapter 11 of the Garda Code. If we turn to	
24			page 7943, please. If we scroll down to 11.3, at the	
25			bottom of the page. This is:	15:26
26				
27			"Granting of annual leave."	
28				
29			Then if we scroll over to 7944, at the top of the page:	

Τ				
2			"2. Applications for annual Leave submitted by members	
3			of garda rank may be granted by the sergeant in charge	
4			of the stations, units and sections."	
5		Α.	Yes.	15:27
6	559	Q.	Now, I think it's silent in relation to the withdrawal	
7			of annual leave or the an cancellation of annual leave.	
8			Presumably it covers that situation, is that right?	
9		Α.	That instruction was superseded by the Westmanstown	
10			Agreement, it's in Volume 48, at page 13488.	15:27
11	560	Q.	Can we have that up on the screen?	
12		Α.	13488. I think it's at 4.3 and 4.5. Basically it	
13			changed to that. It said all annual leave and anything	
14			to do with annual leave became the obligation of the	
15			superintendent.	15:28
16	561	Q.	So that's been amended then?	
17		Α.	I think since the roster has changed in 2012, all	
18			applications for annual leave or anything to do with	
19			annual leave came to me when I was the superintendent	
20			in every station I was in, including Athlone.	15:28
21	562	Q.	Which section do you say it is?	
22		Α.	I have it recorded here as 4.3 and 4.4.	
23	563	Q.	4".3, the Westmanstown rosters will endeavour to best	
24			manage	
25			CHAIRMAN: That's not the one. Scroll down the other	15:29
26			way, please, sorry, I think we will have a better	
27			chance. Keep going. We can have a look at that.	
28		Α.	Yes, I'm sorry now.	
29	564	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, no, no. As far as you're concerned, you	

- say you believe that this scheme superseded the
- 2 existing one.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 565 Q. CHAIRMAN: So that all decisions concerning leave were

15 : 29

15:29

- 5 a matter for the superintendent?
- 6 A. Yes, and that's how it ended up with me.
- 7 566 Q. CHAIRMAN: I follow.
- 8 A. Okay.
- 9 CHAIRMAN: So you think it was a matter for the
- 10 superintendent. Okay.
- MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sorry, Chairperson, if I may be
- 12 of assistance.
- 13 CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much, Mr. O'Higgins, yes.
- MR. MÍ CHEÁL O' HI GGINS: It may be of assistance,
- paragraph 8.3.
- 16 CHAIRMAN: 8.3. Thank you very much. 8.3. That's
- very good. We will try not get dizzy when we go there.
- 18 Very good.
- 19 A. There is a mention at 8.5 as well.
- 20 CHAIRMAN: 8.3 and 8.5. All right, thank you very
- 21 much. Okay, Mr. Marrinan, off we go.
- 22 567 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Yes. Sergeant Monaghan mustn't have
- been aware of that in approving it, had no power to
- 24 approve it?
- A. All annual leave applications came to me on forms and I 15:30
- had to countersign them. The sergeant would make a
- 27 recommendation rather than approve it. I'd say he
- simply made a mistake.
- 29 568 Q. CHAIRMAN: So Garda Keogh had annual leave for this

particular day? 1 Yeah, he been granted annual leave. 2 Α. 3 569 Q. CHAI RMAN: Now it turns out that he has an appointment with GSOC? 4 5 Yes. Α. 15:30 6 570 CHAI RMAN: So he wants to undo the leave? 0. 7 Α. Yes. 8 571 CHAI RMAN: So as to be still on duty and going to GSOC? Q. 9 Yes. Α. 10 CHAI RMAN: That's essentially what was involved here, 572 Q. 15:30 11 okay. 12 Yes. Α. 13 CHAI RMAN: So he wants to undo the annual leave? 573 Q. 14 Α. Yes. 15 574 CHAI RMAN: Okay. Q. 15:31 16 And take it again, as it were, and allow the day to be Α. 17 duty. 18 Save it up for another occasion, exactly, 575 CHAI RMAN: Q. 19 yes. 20 Α. Yes. 15:31 21 576 MR. MARRINAN: So we note from that same, 9209, you Q. 22 have written at the top of it "application refused in 23 the absence" can you read that? 24 "In the absence of any proper explanation". Α. 25 So just tell us, why did you refuse it? 577 Q. 15:31 26 I met Garda Keogh on the 30th August, the night before Α.

27

28

29

he wanted to cancel annual leave. We had a discussion

and I was serving documents on him for Superintendent

Alan Murray in Mullingar. He made no mention of that,

Τ			to have the leave cancelled the next day. When I got	
2			the application, it came to me retrospectively, I just	
3			couldn't marry that up, that, you know, why he didn't	
4			mention it to me. And I felt that the couple of lines	
5			wrote were vague in nature anyway. And all I wanted	15:32
6			was to have some sort of process where I could stand	
7			over to cancel his annual leave. I suppose go a little	
8			bit further than what he has there.	
9	578	Q.	Were you looking for some evidence that he had that	
10			particular appointment?	15:32
11		Α.	No, absolutely not. I had no interest in what his	
12			appointment was about.	
13	579	Q.	No, I am not asking you were you interested in what the	
14			appointment was about?	
15		Α.	Sorry.	15:32
16	580	Q.	Were you doubting that he did have the appointment at	
17			all?	
18		Α.	I didn't I simply didn't know. Like, this is just a	
19			retrospective application. It hadn't been mentioned to	
20			me the night before, so I simply was looking for a	15:32
21			little bit more information. He needn't have mentioned	
22			GSOC at all. He could have put some other excuse on it	
23			and it still wouldn't matter, I'd still have looked for	
24			more information, you know.	
25	581	Q.	What sort of information were you looking for?	15:33
26		Α.	well, all I wanted was to say what times he was at the	
27			meeting at, to allow me to grant him the full day or a	
28			half day or how many hours would it be. So I could	
29			have a proper account and governance measure auditable	

Т			in relation to annual leave, the Westmanstown roster at	
2			8.5 indicating that I had to record annual leave and	
3			account for it.	
4	582	Q.	I understood you to say that part of this was because	
5			you had met him on the 30th August?	15:33
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	583	Q.	And he hadn't	
8		Α.	He didn't mention anything to me.	
9	584	Q.	He didn't mention anything about a meeting?	
10		Α.	No.	15:33
11	585	Q.	That to my mind calls into question, was there a	
12			meeting at all?	
13		Α.	Well	
14	586	Q.	Because he didn't mention it to me. Do you understand?	
15		Α.	No, I've never taken Garda Keogh at anything other than	15:33
16			his word. But I found it strange that he didn't	
17			mention it the night before.	
18	587	Q.	What was strange about that?	
19		Α.	Because he was looking to make a retrospective	
20			application then a number of days later to cancel	15:34
21			leave, when he had an opportunity to mention it to me	
22			the night before.	
23	588	Q.	So you weren't questioning that he had the appointment	
24			and you weren't looking for proof that he was going to	
25			meet with GSOC?	15:34
26		Α.	No. Like I would take him at his word if he said he	
27			was going to meet GSOC, or he said he was going to a	
28			doctor's appointment.	
29	589	Q.	All right. So what were you looking for then?	

2			is 10 hours.	
3	590	Q.	Yes.	
4		Α.	So how much of that did it take, the meeting. Like,	
5			would it be a halfway that he would be cancelling or a	15:34
6			full day.	
7	591	Q.	That would be a simple question for Sergeant Monaghan	
8			to go back and say: Is this cancellation in relation	
9			to a half day or a full day or what time is the	
10			appointment at?	15:35
11		Α.	Yes. But I felt that Garda Keogh, who was making the	
12			application, should put forward his case and I'd have	
13			no difficulty granting it. And I left the door open to	
14			him to do that.	
15	592	Q.	His reaction is fairly negative towards this. If we	15:35
16			look at page 9208, this is his sergeant writing to him,	
17			this appears to be the 19th September, I think it is?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	593	Q.	Is the date on the left, it's stamped. It's headed:	
20				15:35
21			"Application for cancellation of days leave.	
22				
23			With reference to the above, Superintendent Murray has	
24			refused the cancellation of this days leave in the	
25			absence of proper explanation. If you still wish to	15:36
26			have this day considered for cancellation, can you	
27			forward a comprehensive report as to the reasons and	
28			attach same to your D9 and resubmit."	
29				

A. Like I was anxious to know -- a full day's annual leave

Garda Keogh believes that that was an intrusion into 1 2 the confidentiality as between him and GSOC. If it was really just a matter of finding out whether or not he 3 would be absent for a half day or a full day, looking 4 5 back on it, you weren't really looking for an 15:36 explanation, you were looking for details of the visit, 6 7 namely what time is it occurring? 8 So as I could account for the decision I would Α. make in cancelling his annual leave. I felt it was up 9 to Garda Keogh to provide me with the information to 10 15:37 11 allow me to make a decision in a more meaningful I had no interest in his meeting with GSOC. 12 fashion. 13 I didn't know what it was about. It didn't worry me. That's a matter for himself. 14 15 594 You made a note in your diary in relation to this, it's 15:37 Q. 16 at page 2263 of the material. Why did you note this in 17 your diary? 18 As I said to you, I noted all my interactions with Α. 19 Garda Keogh, because things were very difficult, it was 20 very challenging dealing with him and trying to, I 15:37 suppose, marry my obligations, my work obligations in 21 22 terms of delivering the policing service and my obligations to him as a whistleblower. 23 24 Did you consider that this might make it worse? 595 Q. 25 Everything I did made it worse. Other than ignore Α. 15:38 everything, you know, I couldn't see any -- I didn't 26

27

28

29

feel that was an option for me, ignoring things.

felt I couldn't do nothing. I felt I had to try and

treat Garda Keogh as normally as I could in terms of

1			work.	
2	596	Q.	"Application to cancel leave for Garda Keogh, who	
3			explained he was meeting with GSOC in Portlaoise.	
4			Returned, refused in absence of proper explanation."	
5				15:38
6			In any event, he didn't pursue the matter then, isn't	
7			that right?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	597	Q.	And the matter died a death at that stage. We now move	
10			on from that, is there anything else you wish to say in	15:38
11			relation to that? Were you in any way attempting, as	
12			Garda Keogh suggests, to pry into his dealings with	
13			GSOC?	
14		Α.	No. I had no information or knowledge about its	
15			investigation. It wasn't of concern to me. That was	15:39
16			being dealt with somewhere else for him. I had to try	
17			and dealt with him in the workplace in terms of him	
18			presenting for work fit, as a resource to me, and to be	
19			on the team during periods he was fit and then he had	
20			intermittent absences then with work related stress.	15:39
21			But certificates were indicating that he was fit for	
22			work on particular days. And that's the situation,	
23			that I had.	
24	598	Q.	And can we sign off on this on the basis that your only	
25			concern at the time was whether it was a half day or a	15:39
26			full day?	
27		Α.	Yeah, I just wanted to account for it in a proper	
28			fashion, in keeping what I felt were my	

29

responsibilities. I was subject to audit myself, you

1			know, annually by the assistant commissioner, and	
2			biannually by the chief superintendent. I had an audit	
3			during my tenure in Athlone. These things are looked	
4			at and I needed to keep proper governance in the	
5			monitoring and control of annual leave, because again	15:40
6			it's about resourcing issues and it's about public	
7			money, it's about providing a service.	
8	599	Q.	Okay, we will move on then to issue 11, which concerns	
9			Garda Keogh's confinement to indoor duties. If we can	
10			look at page 153 of the materials, please, Mr. Barnes,	15:40
11			top of the page there, paragraph 13. He says:	
12				
13			"I was reduced to indoor duty and was confined to desk	
14			bound duties in the public office, carrying out	
15			therefore the most stressful job in the station, in	15:41
16			circumstances where it was known to management that I	
17			was suffering from work related stress. Thus, on 22nd	
18			October 2015, Superintendent Pat Murray simply 'with	
19			immediate effect' reduced me to indoor duties. There	
20			was no analysis or right of representation. He said	15:41
21			that he will review the matter again on 1st November	
22			2015. "	
23				
24			He made an entry in his diary, which is at page 1334,	
25			CHAIRMAN: Are you sure that is the right number,	15:42
26			Mr. Marrinan? I thought Garda Keogh's diaries were	
27			five digits, no?	
28			MR. MARRINAN: 13334.	
29			CHAIRMAN: 13334. Okay, here we are. Thank you very	

1			much. Sorry, my mistake.	
2	600	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: we see here an entry that he has:	
3				
4			"Sergeant Monaghan said Superintendent Murray Looking	
5			to speak with me. Gave me appeals sheet re €300	15:42
6			discipline. Said he was having a case conference re	
7			sick and putting me permanent in the public office."	
8				
9			Then in brackets he has:	
10				15:42
11			"I never looked at him."	
12				
13			Then he refers to another member, further down:	
14				
15			" has moved back into uniform re his investigation	15:43
16			he is to work off unit C."	
17				
18			Which is the same unit as Garda Keogh. Could you just	
19			deal with this aspect of it. At this time Garda A had	
20			been suspended, isn't that right?	15:43
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	601	Q.	Garda Keogh refers to the fact that the other member	
23			that he has mentioned there was somebody who he was	
24			concerned about, and you were aware of that?	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:43
26	602	Q.	Do you know who he is talking to in that regard?	
27		Α.	I do.	
28	603	Q.	Yes.	
29		Δ	He mentioned the name to me on the 15th July	

- 1 604 Q. It's the same person that he mentioned to you on the 2 15th July?
- 3 A. Yes, I think so, yeah.
- 4 605 Q. Was there any intention at that time by moving that
 5 guard back into uniform and putting him on unit C, to 15:43
 6 some way target Garda Keogh?
- 7 That guard, it came up yesterday, he was one of Α. 8 the people that I gave a regulation 10 to as a result of an audit I had carried out by the National 9 Immigration Bureau. My responsibility as district 10 15 · 44 11 officer meant that I was also immigration officer. outcome of that audit wasn't favourable. 12 13 restructured the entire workings of the immigration 14 section. I suppose it's at page 2123. I think it 15 would be important to have a look at that. That gives 15:44 16 an indication of -- that that member had always worked 17 on unit C and it gives an indication of the extent I 18 went to restructure the immigration services, to take 19 account of the failings in the audit and to have more governance and accountability in that area. 20 That meant 15:45 that this particular member was working more with unit 21 22 There was no intention in any way to get at Garda 23 Keogh by doing that. It was a simple measure that I 24 felt I had to introduce.
- 25 606 Q. Is there any more you would like to say about that?

 26 A. No. I just think it's important that the document -- I

 27 think speaks for itself and it goes into detail as to
 28 how the system would work. It's not directed at Garda
 29 Keogh in any way. It's simply a response to failings

15 · 45

Т			that I had uncovered.	
2	607	Q.	Now, if we could just deal with two diary entries that	
3			you have. Obviously there's the one for the 22nd	
4			October but I think we should just briefly refer back	
5			to the one of the 30th August, which is at page 2246 of	15:45
6			the material. This is your meeting on the evening at	
7			nine o'clock, that we have already opened, but simply	
8			to highlight a matter there. On the fifth line from	
9			the end, you say:	
10				15:46
11			"I asked him if events were impacting on his work and	
12			said if he continued as at present I would have to	
13			consider reducing the risk he posed by taking him off	
14			outdoor duty."	
15				15:46
16			Isn't that right?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	608	Q.	So you were of the view when you put him in indoor	
19			duties on 22nd October 2015 that you had already	
20			advised him that this might happen?	15:46
21		Α.	I had spoken to him, yes, and I made him aware of, I	
22			suppose, the issues as I saw them from where I was	
23			sitting. I understand he had a completely different	
24			perspective.	
25	609	Q.	You have a note here:	15:47
26				
27			"Met Garda Keogh in my office."	
28				
29			At your request, you were serving the 1A14 papers from	

- the chief, which we opened earlier on in relation to the result of the disciplinary inquiry.
- A. Yes.
- 4 610 Q. He acknowledged that. You have a note saying that you noticed his hands shaking a lot, to say that he couldn't properly write his signature. Would you just describe that to us.

15 · 47

15:48

- 8 So, I suppose, I met Garda Keogh for no other purpose Α. other than to serve the documents on him in a 9 confidential way from the chief superintendent. 10 11 think while engaging with him in that process, I noticed that he didn't seem well to me. I felt on 12 13 having to sign an acknowledgment further, I remember 14 having to hold the page so as he could sign and his 15 hands were, to me, visibly shaking doing that. And he 16 just didn't seem as if he could focus on what I was 17 saying. And he didn't seem to be able to do that and 18 he just seemed a bit disorientated to me and I just felt that he wasn't well. And I asked him about that. 19
- 20 611 Q. Did you think that he was drunk?
- A. No, no. No, absolutely not. No. No, there was no suggestion there was alcohol involved.
- 23 612 Q. You suggest that his signature at the end there, and we
 24 can see it at 2259, that his signature in some way
 25 would reflect that he had difficulty writing his name? 15:48
- 26 A. Yeah.
- 27 613 Q. If we look just at random and other signatures of Garda 28 Keogh. Perhaps we will look at 216. Just scroll down. 29 There's his signature there. And maybe at 8830.

- Again, his signature is there. There doesn't seem to
- 2 be any great variation, if we go back to 2259?
- 3 A. Yes. I am just telling it as I saw it. I had to hold
- 4 the page and I remember asking him to take your time,
- 5 you know. I didn't intend dealing with the member in

15:50

15:50

15:50

- 6 that way. That wasn't the purpose of the meeting.
- Just, when I saw what I saw, I felt concern for him. I
- 8 asked him was he well enough to be in work and he said
- 9 he was.
- 10 614 Q. You then explained to him that you felt there was a
- risk of having him to go to incidents as he was having
- around to follow them up; is that right?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 615 Q. Were there any incidents that arose that that became an
- issue?
- 16 A. Like, I can't recall, but there were some incidents on
- 17 the PAF lists with Sergeant Monaghan that we had spoken
- about a couple of days earlier, where there had been an
- inability to move some of them on, relating to Garda
- 21 616 Q. There are no notes of that PAF meeting?
- 22 A. No, absolutely not, no.

Keogh.

- 23 617 Q. I think the Tribunal wrote asking for them.
- 24 A. Yes.

- 25 618 Q. Do you recall what was discussed when this issue arose? 15:50
- A. I can't now. I made that note at the time on the 22nd,
- it was fresh in my mind, having only met Sergeant
- Monaghan for a Monday PAF review on the 19th.
- 29 619 Q. Then you say:

1				
2			"I pointed out the incidents were not dealt with	
3			properly, which I had written on."	
4				
5			Those are the four incidents that we have gone through	15:51
6			today?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	620	Q.	Then you say other items, which we are not able to	
9			identity, on Sergeant Monaghan's PAF list, which	
10			weren't progressed. You say he has no reason or excuse	15:51
11			for that?	
12		Α.	No, he didn't seem to be able to engage with me.	
13	621	Q.	Then you explained to him as per your earlier	
14			conversation, you reminded him of that conversation,	
15			did you?	15:51
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	622	Q.	And that he was to be put on indoor duty, is that	
18			right?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	623	Q.	That was because you stated "I felt there was a risk	15:52
21			involved to the public and/or our organisation"?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	624	Q.	What risk was posed?	
24		Α.	I suppose, if I was meeting members of the public in	
25			the condition I found him in, I didn't feel it to be	15:52
26			good. He seemed completely detached from being able to	
27			engage with me. That's what I found.	
28	625	Q.	Would he not be exposed to the public in the public	
29			office?	

- 1 Absolutely. But I suppose I was hoping that that would Α. encourage him to come to work, I suppose, in a proper 2 3 way and fit for work. You know, the supports he'd have there would ensure that the risk would be minimised. 4 5 The options I had to putting him indoors were quite 15:52 I didn't have a suite of jobs that I could 6 7 That option wasn't available to assign to him indoors.
- assign to him indoors. That option wasn't available to
 me. So I was limited. I tried to do the best I could
 in the circumstances that I found.
- 10 626 Q. You see, he alleges this is a form of targeting. But I 15:52

 11 mean, the four incidents that we have looked at and we have gone over them and I don't intend to rehash them,

 13 but one concerned the manner in which statements were taken. Then the other incidents, Garda Keogh seems to have been involved in reasonable police work?

 15:53
- A. Yes, but I knew that his colleagues were supporting him on the unit and talking -- Sergeant Monaghan was giving him great support at that time, as were his fellow colleagues, in trying to ensure that he wasn't getting into difficulty with things.

- 21 627 Q. We will come to it, not today, but tomorrow, when we 22 are dealing with the issue of commendations, it should 23 be a relatively brief matter but just to deal with it 24 now, I mean, we have a transcript of a call to the 25 Pulse centre --
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 628 Q. -- in relation to the robbery of the taxi driver?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 629 Q. Where Garda Keogh is interacting and giving all the

1			details in relation to the offence and sets out he	
2			seemed to be on top of the case at that stage, at a	
3			very early stage. There doesn't appear to be any	
4			evidence forthcoming that he wasn't performing his	
5			duties on the ground appropriately. Where would you	15:54
6			identify that you thought that other than the	
7			incident in relation to the taking of the statements	
8			and whether or not that was best practice, what other	
9			issue have you identified that would suggest that Garda	
10			Keogh was unable to perform his tasks?	15:54
11		Α.	The haphazard nature which he was in and out of work	
12			had to have an effect on him.	
13	630	Q.	Yes.	
14		Α.	And it did have an effect on his ability to carry out	
15			his work properly. And I can understand that	15:54
16			completely.	
17	631	Q.	How did that manifest itself, do you believe?	
18		Α.	In, I suppose, the way incidents were being dealt with	
19			in a less timely fashion and that was, I suppose,	
20			coming across to me from Sergeant Monaghan as I	15:55
21			monitored the PAF list. I suppose I felt that alcohol	
22			was an issue. While I didn't notice any alcohol on	
23			this day in question, he just didn't seem with it to	
24			me. He didn't seem to be able to engage with me.	
25	632	Q.	Did you notice alcohol being present on any day in	15:55
26			question?	
27		Α.	No, I never did, no. But I only met him four times.	
28	633	Q.	Did anybody report to you, did Sergeant Baker express	
29			any concerns	

		Α.	NO.	
2	634	Q.	as the sergeant in charge?	
3		Α.	No. No, there was never any indication that alcohol	
4			was an issue.	
5	635	Q.	Did Detective Sergeant Curley or any of the other	15:55
6			guards express any concern to you that Garda Keogh	
7			might be misbehaving on duty or be drunk on duty?	
8		Α.	No.	
9	636	Q.	Just something I asked you about earlier on, and this	
10			is at page 691 of material, which is a statement from	15:55
11			Inspector Minnock. If we scroll down to the bottom	
12			line there of that statement:	
13				
14			"Superintendent Murray consulted with me regarding his	
15			decision to detail Garda Keogh to indoor duties."	15:56
16				
17			When did that consultation take place?	
18		Α.	After I made the decision. So after I did this, I	
19			consulted with him. This was something that occurred,	
20			it was unexpected to me, I hadn't expected to find	15:56
21			Garda Keogh in the condition I did, and I felt I had to	
22			take action.	
23	637	Q.	"The decision was reached following recent interactions	
24			between Chief Superintendent Murray and Garda Keogh."	
25				15:56
26			What's that a reference to?	
27		Α.	I don't know.	
28	638	Q.	"And also a recent dealing that Garda Keogh had with a	
29			member of the nublic "	

1		Α.	I don't know what that's about.	
2	639	Q.	"In this instance, Garda Keogh asked the person,	
3			injured party or witness to write their own statement."	
4		Α.	Okay.	
5	640	Q.	"This would not be normal practice and in my view not	15:57
6			best practice."	
7				
8			Of course this goes back to July.	
9				
10			"Chief Superintendent Murray outlined to me that he had	15:57
11			noticed a significant shake in Garda Keogh's hand and	
12			this was possibly related to his recent absenteeism and	
13			could also have been why Garda Keogh had asked the	
14			person to write their own statement."	
15				15:57
16			Okay? So remember I was asking about that.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	641	Q.	Whether that was something that was in your mind?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	642	Q.	That Garda Keogh may not have written out the	15:57
21			statements at the time because he was intoxicated?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	643	Q.	And unable to do so.	
24		Α.	I don't recall having that conversation with	
25			Superintendent Minnock, you know, about that. I know I	15:58
26			did go to him, I haven't a note myself of what we	
27			discussed but I went to him immediately after Garda	
28			Keogh left, to explain to him what had happened. And I	
29			wanted to ensure that Garda Keogh wouldn't be on	

- 1 outdoor duty after that.
- 2 644 Q. Would you agree with Garda Keogh's contention that 3 indoor duties and working in the public office in 4 particular can be very stressful?
- 5 There are many stresses with being a member of An Garda 15:58 Α. 6 Síochána, but I suppose in the hierarchy, being outside 7 on duty and the uncertainty of what one is going to 8 come across, is normally more stressful for most people than being indoors and having the support of someone 9 available to you and dealing with, I suppose, what 10 15:59 11 might be telephone calls and callers to the counter and 12 referring them on to someone else or perhaps sending a 13 car to the issue they had phoned in about or called 14 about. And as I said, I didn't have a huge amount of 15 options open to me and I felt that that option would be 15:59 16 good for Garda Keogh, he would be in a secure 17 environment, he'd have support there. It would give 18 him time to, I suppose, deal with whatever paperwork 19 had manifested itself in our meeting on 19/10. And, 20 you know, I phoned the sick absence section, the Human 15:59 Resources section that day to see if I could expedite 21 22 the CMO conference in some shape or form. I think they 23 have a record of that in their papers here, page 11722.
- 24 645 Q. Do you want that brought up?
- A. No, I am just making just a reference. So like, I took 16:00
 action after noticing what I noticed. I made a phone
 call to say, look it, you know, I need this conference
 to take place. Garda Keogh needs some help and he
 needs to deal with the problems he's having.

1	646	Q.	You then wrote to the chief superintendent advising	
2			her. This is at page 2260. In the second paragraph:	
3				
4			"The member's hands were shaking quite a lot while I	
5			spoke to him, to an extent that he could hardly write.	16:00
6			As a result of that and other issues regarding work	
7			performance, I informed Garda Keogh he would be	
8			employed on indoor duties at present with a review date	
9			of 1st November 2015. The member acknowledged	
10			acceptance of my decision. I have recently been in	16:01
11			contact with the sickness section regarding a case	
12			conference in relation to Garda Keogh."	
13				
14			That's on the 22nd October, isn't that right?	
15		Α.	Yes.	16:01
16	647	Q.	Your direction in relation to this is at page 2261.	
17			It's addressed to the sergeant in charge, Athlone, and	
18			also the unit sergeant of unit C. That was Sergeant	
19			Haran, is that right, at that time?	
20		Α.	Unit C, I would imagine Monaghan.	16:01
21	648	Q.	Monaghan?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	649	Q.	But I think that Sergeant Haran may have been standing	
24			in, I am not sure. But you didn't consult Sergeant	
25			Haran in relation to	16:01
26		Α.	I didn't consult anybody, because I was presented with	
27			a situation and I made a decision on the spot, as it	
28			were.	
29	650	Q.	Again, that's up on the screen, it's dated the 22nd	

1			October.	
2				
3			"With immediate effect, Garda Keogh should be detailed	
4			for indoor duties with unit C.	
5				16:02
6			I have spoken with the member on this issue. I will	
7			review the matter again on the 1st November.	
8				
9			Please inform all concerned and arrange accordingly."	
10				16:02
11			And Garda Keogh's position in relation to that is that	
12			this was another incident he alleges of targeting and	
13			it was effectively broadcasting to all the members by	
14			placing him in the public office, that people who were	
15			in his position of whistleblowers wouldn't be	16:02
16			tolerated, that's effectively	
17	Д	١.	I deny that utterly. That absolutely was not my	
18			intention. I have nothing but support for anyone who	
19			reports wrongdoing, and my history will show that.	
20			Indeed, I've had to arrest a sergeant and two members	16:02
21			at garda rank, one twice, in addition to directing the	
22			arrest of two other Garda members for wrongdoing. I	
23			have a history of supporting the outing of wrongdoing	
24			and dealing with it in an effective manner.	
25			CHAIRMAN: Are you nearly finished on this issue,	16:03
26			Mr. Marrinan.	
27			MR. MARRINAN: Yes, I have just two more questions.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
29	651 Q).	MR. MARRINAN: I think just for completeness sake,	

1			there is another reference to this in your notes, it's	
2			at page 2500. I think these were notes before you went	
3			to see the chief medical officer on 9th December 2015.	
4			And we see there:	
5				16:03
6			"Sickness and TRR, car tax."	
7				
8			That was one of the issues in relation to Garda Keogh.	
9			The regulation 10 that arose in relation to that, that	
10			he was absent without leave between 11th to 14th. Then	16:04
11			there is a reference to intel and Pulse created, that's	
12			before your time, isn't that right?	
13		Α.	Before my time, yeah.	
14	652	Q.	Then there is a reference to the incident that we	
15			talked about today, the theft of the trailer?	16:04
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	653	Q.	And then the crime files 14/07?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	654	Q.	Injured party wrote their own statement. Then you deal	
20			with a robbery on the 21/9, which we've discussed. And	16:04
21			then, on the 22nd October, shaking hands and indoor	
22			duty. Then we will come to deal briefly with an	
23			incident on the 28th October, Tullamore, and you have	
24			written "paranoia" there?	
25		Α.	Yes.	16:04
26			CHAIRMAN: "Re other members".	
27		Α.	"Re other members" yes.	
28	655	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: And then "alcohol sickness, shaking,	
29			etcetera". And we will come to deal with that meeting	

_	iii dde course.	
2	CHAIRMAN: That's unrelated to this issue.	
3	MR. MARRINAN: Yes.	
4	WITNESS: One final thing, Chairman, if I could. You	
5	know, in trying to support Garda Keogh, even though he	16:05
6	was indoors, I tried to accommodate him in taking part	
7	of the arrest phase of the trailer case and made	
8	arrangements that he would be accompanied by another	
9	member to take part in the arrest and unfortunately he,	
10	I suppose, didn't attend to that because of a drinking	16:0
11	issue that he had on that particular day. That was on	
12	the 18th November.	
13	CHAIRMAN: In the trailer case, yes.	
14	WITNESS: Just for completeness.	
15	CHAIRMAN: I understand. Thanks very much, chief	16:06
16	superintendent. We will call a halt there. I should	
17	have mentioned to you that these are long and detailed	
18	sessions, so if you find that you need a break at some	
19	point or you just want to clear your head or you want	
20	to refresh your memory, just mention it to me. I	16:06
21	should have mentioned that earlier.	
22	WITNESS: Thank you, Chairman.	
23	CHAIRMAN: I am just conscious that I think that for	
24	all of us it's quite a heavy session to proceed from	
25	10:30 to 4 o'clock. So, please bear that in mind.	16:06
26	WITNESS: Chairman, I appreciate that.	
27		
28		

1	CHAIRMAN: If you need it, okay. All right. Thank you	
2	very much.	
3		
4	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURN UNTIL WEDNESDAY, 4TH DECEMBER	
5	2019, AT 10: 30AM	6:0
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

•	158:29	62:19, 62:20	21 [2] - 3:12, 103:22	124:8, 128:17,
	1334 [1] - 158:24	194 [1] - 56:13	21/9 [1] - 172:20	136:10, 143:25
	13488 [2] - 150:10,	195 [1] - 56:17	2121 [2] - 111:13,	24 [1] - 3:14
'15 [3] - 14:6, 108:6,	150:12	196 [1] - 56:25	131:18	25 [1] - 3:14
108:7		I		
'16 [1] - 73:21	136 [1] - 50:26	197 [1] - 61:1	2123 [1] - 160:14	2500 [1] - 172:2
'17 [1] - 73:22	139/03 [1] - 125:7	19th [10] - 31:8,	215 [1] - 100:15	26 [1] - 3:15
	13th [7] - 25:8,	31:16, 31:29, 42:27,	216 [2] - 104:26,	26th [2] - 6:15, 39:28
'absence [1] - 147:27	38:16, 73:15, 109:14,	91:11, 110:7, 135:26,	162:28	27 [1] - 3:15
'broken [1] - 24:25	110:2, 135:16, 137:11	136:17, 155:17,	217 [1] - 104:12	27th [1] - 22:29
'in [1] - 106:18	14 [8] - 3:9, 10:8,	163:28	218 [1] - 92:21	28 [1] - 3:16
'sorry [1] - 25:21	33:19, 39:6, 43:10,	1A14 [1] - 161:29	219 [1] - 105:22	28th [5] - 57:29,
'with [1] - 158:18	47:22, 47:24, 47:29	1st [10] - 8:22, 19:7,	21st [2] - 29:16,	81:19, 86:21, 104:29,
	14/07 [1] - 172:17	19:18, 23:3, 73:14,	45:23	172:23
0	14th [30] - 24:7, 24:9,	149:3, 149:4, 158:21,	22 [1] - 3:13	29 [1] - 3:17
	25:15, 26:11, 26:17,	170:9, 171:7	2218 [1] - 24:10	29/14 [1] - 65:23
	26:25, 26:29, 31:27,		2219 [1] - 26:4	29th [3] - 135:10,
003 [1] - 113:13	32:17, 32:23, 36:5,	2	2220 [1] - 26:10	143:1, 143:2
00:29 [1] - 25:20	37:5, 38:17, 43:22,			
	45:26, 46:6, 46:9,		2221 [1] - 35:29	2:30am [1] - 112:5
1	51:8, 51:10, 53:3,	2 [7] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:6,	2222 [1] - 38:25	2am [1] - 119:18
		46:26, 89:13, 122:21,	2225 [1] - 28:21	2nd [4] - 52:28,
	83:5, 88:17, 101:3,	150:2	2227 [1] - 29:15	101:2, 101:11, 149:19
1 [6] - 3:2, 14:18,	101:12, 106:18,	20 [1] - 3:12	2228 [1] - 29:24	
46:26, 86:7, 122:19,	116:16, 121:5,	2005 [1] - 137:19	2232 [1] - 43:4	3
125:8	121:10, 142:16,		2233 [1] - 43:15	
1-4 [1] - 91:16	172:10	2006 [1] - 10:9	2246 [2] - 47:2, 161:5	
1/11/15 [1] - 92:15	15 [3] - 3:9, 27:1,	2007 [1] - 137:21	225 [2] - 28:21, 112:1	3 [9] - 3:3, 36:8,
10 [18] - 3:7, 12:4,	52:3	201 [1] - 65:27	2259 [2] - 162:24,	65:20, 68:13, 72:9,
12:8, 13:6, 13:8,	15229 [1] - 12:25	2012 [1] - 150:17	163:2	75:23, 86:15, 122:22,
13:11, 13:16, 14:18,	15236 [2] - 12:25,	2014 [2] - 1:3, 147:22	226 [1] - 112:23	124:23
14:20, 18:7, 20:25,	21:22	2015 [44] - 8:1, 8:22,		30 [1] - 3:17
21:19, 99:15, 147:15,	153 [1] - 158:10	16:25, 19:19, 21:24,	2260 [1] - 170:2	3048 [1] - 142:7
	15th [17] - 16:25,	22:29, 25:4, 25:5,	2261 [1] - 170:16	3077 [1] - 11:26
147:19, 155:2, 160:8, 172:9	25:27, 26:7, 26:10,	25:6, 26:7, 26:25,	2263 [1] - 156:16	3079 [1] - 12:6
	26:19, 29:28, 30:15,	28:28, 29:16, 29:25,	229 [2] - 109:23,	30th [9] - 46:27,
1051 [1] - 11:28	32:20, 38:8, 38:17,	31:24, 31:26, 36:1,	114:14	53:18, 54:29, 74:24,
1080 [1] - 12:6	45:27, 51:5, 51:7,	43:6, 43:22, 46:23,	2292 [1] - 91:11	137:27, 138:16,
10:30 [1] - 173:25		46:28, 53:3, 73:17,	2293 [1] - 90:7	
	1 61 1/1 61 77 160 70			1 15/70 1545 INTS
10:30AM [1] - 174:5	51:14, 51:22, 159:29,		2294 [1] - 90:6	152:26, 154:5, 161:5
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6,	160:2	75:19, 81:14, 82:21,	2294 [1] - 90:6 2295 [1] - 87:28	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24,
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2,	2295 [1] - 87:28	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23,	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19,
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7,	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9,
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7,	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18,	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1,	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16,	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3,	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016[1] - 13:10	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26,	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [i] - 13:10 2016 [i] - 19:24,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29,	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3,	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [n] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8,	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2018 [1] - 1:9	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3,	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [n] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28 2301 [2] - 82:13, 84:6	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 3:32 11.3 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16 124 [1] - 1:18	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3, 139:21, 173:12	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2018 [1] - 1:9	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24 3943 [1] - 99:3
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16 124 [1] - 1:18 12:08pm [1] - 51:5	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3, 139:21, 173:12 19 [1] - 3:11	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [n] - 13:10 2016 [n] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2018 [n] - 1:18, 6:2,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28 2301 [2] - 82:13, 84:6	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24 3943 [1] - 99:3 3:15am [1] - 25:14
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16 124 [1] - 1:18 12:08pm [1] - 51:5 12th [2] - 25:7, 38:16	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3, 139:21, 173:12 19 [1] - 3:11 19/10 [1] - 169:19	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2018 [1] - 1:18, 6:2, 174:5	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28 2301 [2] - 82:13, 84:6 232 [1] - 135:11	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24 3943 [1] - 99:3 3:15am [1] - 25:14 3:30am [1] - 112:6
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16 124 [1] - 1:18 12:08pm [1] - 51:5 12th [2] - 25:7, 38:16 13 [4] - 2:31, 3:8,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3, 139:21, 173:12 19 [1] - 3:11 19/10 [1] - 169:19 190 [2] - 54:22, 56:14	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2018 [1] - 1:8, 6:2, 174:5 202 [1] - 68:4	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28 2301 [2] - 82:13, 84:6 232 [1] - 135:11 233 [1] - 136:6	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24 3943 [1] - 99:3 3:15am [1] - 25:14 3:30am [1] - 112:6 3:37am [1] - 99:28
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16 124 [1] - 1:18 12:08pm [1] - 51:5 12th [2] - 25:7, 38:16	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3, 139:21, 173:12 19 [1] - 3:11 19/10 [1] - 169:19 190 [2] - 54:22, 56:14 191 [1] - 55:23	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2018 [1] - 1:8, 6:2, 174:5 202 [1] - 68:4 208 [1] - 74:13 20s [2] - 112:19,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28 2301 [2] - 82:13, 84:6 232 [1] - 135:11 233 [1] - 136:6 234 [1] - 137:7	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24 3943 [1] - 99:3 3:15am [1] - 25:14 3:30am [1] - 112:6 3:37am [1] - 99:28 3pm [1] - 119:18
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16 124 [1] - 1:18 12:08pm [1] - 51:5 12th [2] - 25:7, 38:16 13 [4] - 2:31, 3:8,	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3, 139:21, 173:12 19 [1] - 3:11 19/10 [1] - 169:19 190 [2] - 54:22, 56:14 191 [1] - 55:23 192 [1] - 56:9	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2018 [1] - 1:8, 6:2, 174:5 202 [1] - 68:4 208 [1] - 74:13 205 [2] - 112:19, 133:19	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28 2301 [2] - 82:13, 84:6 232 [1] - 135:11 233 [1] - 136:6 234 [1] - 137:7 235 [2] - 135:9, 142:29	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24 3943 [1] - 99:3 3:15am [1] - 25:14 3:30am [1] - 112:6 3:37am [1] - 99:28 3pm [1] - 119:18 3RD [2] - 1:18, 6:1
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16 124 [1] - 1:18 12:08pm [1] - 51:5 12th [2] - 25:7, 38:16 13 [4] - 2:31, 3:8, 22:24, 158:11	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3, 139:21, 173:12 19 [1] - 3:11 19/10 [1] - 169:19 190 [2] - 54:22, 56:14 191 [1] - 55:23 192 [1] - 56:9 1921 [1] - 1:9	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2019 [3] - 1:18, 6:2, 174:5 202 [1] - 68:4 208 [1] - 74:13 205 [2] - 112:19, 133:19 20th [3] - 19:17,	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28 2301 [2] - 82:13, 84:6 232 [1] - 135:11 233 [1] - 136:6 234 [1] - 137:7 235 [2] - 135:9, 142:29 23rd [7] - 104:28,	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24 3943 [1] - 99:3 3:15am [1] - 25:14 3:30am [1] - 112:6 3:37am [1] - 99:28 3pm [1] - 119:18 3RD [2] - 1:18, 6:1 3rd [7] - 68:5, 87:28,
10th [10] - 25:5, 25:6, 27:9, 28:28, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:26, 43:5, 91:5 11 [4] - 3:7, 28:21, 149:23, 158:8 11-13 [1] - 149:24 11722 [1] - 169:23 11th [10] - 24:7, 25:6, 26:28, 31:26, 36:5, 38:16, 43:22, 81:14, 81:21, 172:10 12 [5] - 3:8, 4:5, 51:13, 55:23, 99:16 124 [1] - 1:18 12:08pm [1] - 51:5 12th [2] - 25:7, 38:16 13 [4] - 2:31, 3:8, 22:24, 158:11 131 [1] - 147:17	160:2 16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10 16th [11] - 28:23, 29:25, 30:1, 30:7, 37:22, 38:5, 38:7, 38:13, 38:14, 38:18, 38:23 17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10 17th [1] - 81:1 18 [1] - 3:11 184 [2] - 6:9, 73:20 18th [10] - 86:3, 97:10, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:8, 131:19, 133:3, 139:21, 173:12 19 [1] - 3:11 19/10 [1] - 169:19 190 [2] - 54:22, 56:14 191 [1] - 55:23 192 [1] - 56:9	75:19, 81:14, 82:21, 87:28, 89:14, 98:2, 106:18, 110:8, 110:26, 115:23, 116:10, 121:5, 135:16, 142:16, 149:6, 149:12, 158:18, 158:22, 161:19, 170:9, 172:3 2015/2016 [1] - 13:10 2016 [6] - 19:24, 20:4, 20:17, 21:29, 22:2, 22:8 2017 [2] - 1:5, 1:9 2018 [1] - 1:8, 6:2, 174:5 202 [1] - 68:4 208 [1] - 74:13 205 [2] - 112:19, 133:19	2295 [1] - 87:28 2296 [1] - 86:20 2297 [1] - 86:4 2298 [1] - 86:5 2299 [1] - 83:5 22nd [11] - 8:1, 53:17, 75:15, 75:16, 158:17, 161:3, 161:19, 163:26, 170:14, 170:29, 172:21 23 [1] - 3:13 23/9 [1] - 116:19 2300 [1] - 81:28 2301 [2] - 82:13, 84:6 232 [1] - 135:11 233 [1] - 136:6 234 [1] - 137:7 235 [2] - 135:9, 142:29	31 [3] - 3:18, 14:24, 16:20 31st [5] - 92:19, 147:21, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11 32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18 33 [2] - 3:19, 124:21 34 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [3] - 3:22, 137:18, 143:5 3910 [1] - 22:24 3943 [1] - 99:3 3:15am [1] - 25:14 3:30am [1] - 112:6 3:37am [1] - 99:28 3pm [1] - 119:18 3RD [2] - 1:18, 6:1

101:2, 101:11	7	ability [2] - 34:18,	173:6	adamant [1] - 123:20
4		166:14	accompanied [1] -	add [3] - 66:22, 102:28, 140:19
4	7 [7] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5,	able [10] - 51:9, 51:11, 115:20,	accompanying [1] -	added [4] - 81:20,
	22:22, 24:6, 99:3,	138:28, 162:17,	136:5	127:13, 133:21,
4 [4] - 2:19, 3:4,	99:6	164:8, 164:12,	accordance [1] -	141:13
122:23, 173:25	7943 [1] - 149:24	164:26, 166:24	43:10	addiction [3] - 40:23,
4".3 [1] - 150:23	7944 [1] - 149:29	about [1] - 119:26	accordingly [1] -	40:26, 48:3
4.2 [1] - 24:29	7982 [1] - 124:21	above-named [1] -	171:9	addition [6] - 33:21,
4.3 [2] - 150:12,		1:26	account [14] - 17:5,	38:7, 42:28, 124:16,
150:22	8	absence [20] - 7:18,	19:4, 46:13, 74:8,	133:4, 171:21
4.4 [2] - 25:18,		7:21, 25:11, 32:16,	125:11, 129:16,	additional [9] -
150:22		36:14, 37:1, 38:27,	133:10, 137:18,	55:22, 56:19, 87:23,
4.5 [1] - 150:12	8 [3] - 3:6, 3:28, 99:8	39:7, 39:14, 40:11,	138:9, 153:29, 154:3,	92:7, 96:8, 99:18,
44 [4] - 73:18,	8.3 [4] - 151:15,	47:21, 50:13, 107:10,	156:8, 157:27, 160:19	129:3, 133:25, 145:1
107:22, 107:26,	151:16, 151:20	111:1, 111:17,	accountability [1] -	additionally [1] -
107:27	8.5 [3] - 151:19,	152:23, 152:24,	160:20	104:8
48 [1] - 150:10	151:20, 154:2	155:25, 157:4, 169:20	accountable [1] -	address [4] - 57:15,
496 [1] - 113:10	835 [1] - 148:3	absences [3] -	129:15	72:6, 90:29, 91:29
498 [1] - 122:14	87 [1] - 14:24	31:17, 139:2, 157:20	accuracy [2] - 64:9,	addressed [9] - 32:2,
4:30am [1] - 81:7	8785 [3] - 16:20, 16:21, 18:18	absent [16] - 26:8,	96:18	86:2, 91:16, 114:16,
4:31-4:34am [1] -	,	27:7, 28:11, 28:25,	accused [1] - 15:12	129:19, 131:13,
82:16	8792 [1] - 19:13	30:10, 31:25, 32:24,	accusing [1] - 7:22	134:23, 149:5, 170:17
4am [4] - 110:2,	8800 [1] - 31:7 8822 [1] - 46:24	33:1, 33:20, 36:4,	achieve [1] - 79:14	adds [1] - 124:2
112:7, 135:16, 143:14	8830 [1] - 162:29	36:11, 37:10, 43:21,	achieving [1] - 92:8	adequate [5] - 96:10,
4th [6] - 36:1, 45:19,	8836 [1] - 45:10	44:4, 156:4, 172:10	acknowledge [3] -	129:24, 130:8,
54:16, 59:1, 101:2, 101:11	8854 [1] - 52:27	absenteeism [1] -	25:24, 53:20, 109:1	130:19, 130:22
	887 [1] - 106:8	168:12	acknowledged [5] -	ADJOURN[1] -
4TH [1] - 174:4	8891 [1] - 57:4	absolute [5] - 63:18,	33:2, 52:1, 96:6,	174:4
5	8892 [1] - 57:4	63:25, 64:25, 65:1,	162:4, 170:9	ADJOURNED [1] -
<u> </u>	8893 [1] - 59:14	65:17	acknowledges [1] -	97:1
	8894 [1] - 59:14	absolutely [25] - 7:25, 12:19, 40:3,	52:18	ADMINISTRATIVE
5 [1] - 3:4	892 [1] - 106:15	44:9, 46:16, 46:20,	acknowledgment [3]	[1] - 3:14
500 [1] - 121:6	8921 [1] - 81:4	51:24, 63:12, 63:27,	- 52:7, 52:15, 162:13	admitted [3] - 27:7,
502 [1] - 73:23	8940 [1] - 97:27	86:12, 96:3, 96:6,	ACT [2] - 1:3, 1:8	27:11, 32:28 adopt [1] - 147:7
504 [1] - 119:13	8942 [1] - 98:17	106:26, 111:9,	act [3] - 8:29, 11:12	adopted [2] - 138:14,
505 [2] - 115:27,	8943 [1] - 99:4	113:21, 120:17,	Act [8] - 7:29, 8:28, 9:4, 9:5, 10:14,	145:9
131:11	8945 [1] - 99:22	134:26, 140:15,	137:19, 143:6, 147:24	advancing [1] -
51 [1] - 2:18	8946 [1] - 100:5	146:10, 146:17,	acted [1] - 52:13	92:23
53 [1] - 73:23	8th [2] - 46:23, 82:21	153:11, 162:21,	acting [2] - 93:21,	advice [8] - 14:15,
536 [1] - 73:22		163:22, 165:1, 171:17	93:29	14:22, 20:14, 20:28,
54 [1] - 12:25	9	abuse [1] - 39:11	ACTING [2] - 3:7,	22:3, 68:10, 71:25,
58 [1] - 148:3		accept [13] - 13:16,	3:13	72:7
593 [1] - 142:13	0 to 2:0 54:40	13:18, 20:29, 21:8,	action [13] - 1:27,	advices [1] - 99:12
5th [1] - 75:19	9 [3] - 3:6, 54:12,	21:10, 21:12, 21:16,	11:15, 11:22, 20:15,	advise [2] - 8:22,
	99:10 9208 [1] - 155:16	21:17, 26:18, 36:25,	23:5, 33:24, 35:11,	72:15
6	9208 [1] - 155:16 9209 [2] - 149:4,	37:16, 84:19	62:3, 63:22, 110:16,	advised [8] - 23:4,
	152:21	acceptable [8] -	110:21, 167:22,	52:24, 68:12, 72:21,
6 [3] - 3:5, 5:5, 38:1	9:05am [1] - 24:9	28:10, 33:9, 35:1,	169:26	78:28, 88:20, 137:17,
607 [1] - 24:29	9.03am [1] - 24.9 9pm [4] - 47:1,	36:19, 37:17, 64:6,	actions [3] - 118:17,	161:20
608 [1] - 25:18	49:27, 66:7, 67:2	66:29, 72:5	124:10, 139:10	advising [1] - 170:1
62 [1] - 106:6	9th [5] - 25:4, 29:28,	acceptance [1] - 170:10	active [3] - 100:29,	afraid [1] - 24:3
68 [1] - 73:22	89:14, 95:6, 172:3	accepted [4] - 20:10,	107:11, 107:17	AFTER [1] - 97:2
68/15 [1] - 44:29	, ,	40:1, 46:20, 109:11	activities [1] - 101:4	afternoon [1] - 66:6
691 [1] - 167:10	Α	accepting [1] - 84:17	activity [2] - 101:4,	afterwards [2] - 17:5,
6th [1] - 76:3		access [4] - 58:11,	102:2	84:11
		59:3, 102:4, 115:19	actual [7] - 21:4,	ago [1] - 147:22
	AA [1] - 27:13	accommodate [1] -	21:19, 51:2, 93:28,	agree [4] - 15:16,
	abided [1] - 50:22	3000mmoduto [1]	95:4, 119:5, 134:9	31:29, 141:21, 169:2
	I		1	1

agreed [1] - 37:10 Agreement [1] -150:10 **AGSI**[1] - 4:1 ahead [1] - 88:28 aid [1] - 27:3 AIDAN [2] - 3:9, 4:3 Air [1] - 112:20 **AISLING** [2] - 2:11, Alan [6] - 43:12, 44:7, 45:18, 47:26, 52:20, 152:29 **ALAN**[2] - 3:9, 3:13 albeit [1] - 54:7 alcohol [20] - 32:14, 32:28, 39:4, 39:11, 39:15, 39:24, 40:8, 40:10, 40:19, 40:26, 41:21, 48:2, 122:23, 139:1, 162:22, 166:21, 166:22, 166:25, 167:3, 172:28 alcoholic [1] - 41:14 alert [1] - 115:17 alerted [1] - 36:27 Alison [1] - 12:27 ALISON [1] - 3:26 allay [4] - 8:21, 27:24, 48:1, 87:21 allegation [7] - 6:18, 6:22, 7:17, 11:17, 11:23, 27:23, 126:13 allegations [3] -41:20, 64:2, 149:2 alleged [6] - 43:6, 43:13, 45:11, 54:12, 118:26. 139:19 alleges [2] - 165:10, 171:12 alleging [2] - 7:18, 106:9 allocated [1] -142:17 allow [21] - 18:15, 34:20, 35:21, 44:13, 63:2. 64:3. 64:4. 64:18, 68:16, 71:21, 73:27, 76:28, 80:15, 89:18, 110:20, 110:29, 124:15, 140:7, 152:16, 153:27, 156:11 allowed [4] - 10:28, 63:20, 71:26, 125:14 **allows** [2] - 14:18, 115:16 almost [2] - 56:14, 134:9 alone [1] - 66:25

alternative [7] -27:20, 33:26, 34:1, 34:11, 34:15, 34:16, 35:14 altogether [1] - 10:9 **AMENDED**[1] - 1:9 amended [1] -150:16 amicably [2] - 23:18, 23:19 amn't [1] - 139:14 amount [3] - 50:16, 67:21, 169:14 amounted [1] - 12:13 amounting [1] - 39:7 amy [1] - 103:26 AN [1] - 3:2 analyse [1] - 137:3 analysis [1] - 158:20 AND [5] - 1:3, 1:4, 1:8, 3:15, 97:1 ANDREW [2] - 2:22, anecdotal [1] - 7:26 animosity [1] - 147:5 **ANNE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 annoyance [1] -47.11 annoyed [5] - 6:16, 47:9, 47:23, 50:12, 50:18 annual [27] - 25:6, 73:15, 110:6, 147:16, 147:21, 149:6, 149:8, 149:11, 149:27, 150:2, 150:7, 150:13, 150:14, 150:18, 150:19. 151:25. 151:29, 152:2, 152:13, 152:27, 153:7, 154:1, 154:2, 155:1, 156:9, 158:5 annually [1] - 158:1 answer [13] - 12:17, 27:27, 33:4, 53:7, 64:1, 65:12, 80:23, 80:24. 122:17. 127:29, 128:4, 139:17, 139:20 answered [4] -46:10, 88:17, 88:19, 88:20

answering [1] -

ANTHONY [1] - 3:6

anticipated [1] -

anxious [6] - 6:20,

7:2, 117:9, 138:27,

anticipate [1] - 140:9

27:25

21:29

155:1 anyway [4] - 17:5, 26:22, 31:6, 153:5 **apologise** [1] - 29:20 apparent [8] - 71:5, 76:27, 83:29, 84:12, 87:10, 88:27, 104:9, 120:28 APPEAL[2] - 1:13, appeal [1] - 52:26 appeals [1] - 159:5 appear [13] - 24:18, 60:14, 61:11, 62:23, 84:14, 84:21, 85:16, 93:1, 95:26, 96:1, 114:28, 131:8, 166:3 APPEARANCES[1] appeared [7] - 30:5, 30:9, 31:28, 38:20, 62:11, 67:17 application [9] -10:29, 149:17, 152:22, 153:2, 153:19, 154:20, 155:12, 155:21, 157:2 applications [3] -150:2, 150:18, 151:25 applied [5] - 71:29, 79:12, 79:13, 103:7, 147:21 **applies** [1] - 137:19 **apply** [3] - 32:4, 129:13, 145:13 applying [2] - 11:2, appointed [1] - 43:11 appointment [9] -147:23, 152:3, 153:10, 153:12, 153:14, 153:16, 154:23, 154:28, 155:10 appreciate [3] - 92:7, 101:20, 173:26 appreciated [1] -96:7 approach [6] - 90:3, 103:19, 119:19, 135:7, 138:14, 147:7 approached [3] -13:19, 117:5, 120:20 appropriate [3] -78:8, 79:7, 85:22 appropriately [1] approval [1] - 147:27 approve [2] - 151:24, 151:27

approved [3] - 9:25, 147:24, 149:17 approving[1]-151:23 April [2] - 8:1, 22:29 area [18] - 56:3, 56:20, 56:22, 66:2, 69:24, 75:6, 99:18, 104:23, 105:8, 112:17, 117:17, 128:25, 132:20, 135:19, 135:23, 136:11, 136:14, 160:20 arise [3] - 76:1, 77:3, arises [2] - 86:4, 92:3 arising [4] - 13:9, 44:27, 94:16, 115:26 arose [8] - 22:17, 59:27, 92:26, 101:6, 146:27, 163:14, 163:25, 172:9 **ARRAN**[1] - 2:24 arrange [1] - 171:9 arranged [2] - 19:25, 108:21 arrangement[1] arrangements [1] -173:8 arrest [6] - 71:20, 97:9, 171:20, 171:22, 173.7 173.9 arrested [1] - 71:23 arrests [1] - 97:10 arrived [4] - 9:29, 66:16, 116:19, 126:3 arrives [1] - 49:27 **arriving** [1] - 116:6 **AS**[4] - 1:9, 6:1, 6:5, 97:1 ascertain [1] -148:14 aspect [2] - 31:1, 159:19 assailants [7] -120:14, 122:26, 123:7, 123:10, 133:13, 133:17, 139:20 assessing[1] -139:26 assign [1] - 165:7 assigned [2] - 23:12,

assistance [4] -55:22, 95:28, 151:12, 151:14 assistant [1] - 158:1 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 assisted [1] - 98:11 **assisting** [1] - 95:12 assumption [1] -83:13 assure [1] - 68:17 assured [2] - 49:20, 137:14 **AT** [1] - 174:5 **ATHLONE** [1] - 3:32 Athlone [20] - 9:29, 24:3, 25:11, 64:7, 64:15, 68:24, 74:4, 93:17, 102:23, 106:22, 106:24, 114:12, 115:23, 131:27, 136:20, 144:7, 150:20, 158:3, 170.17 attach [1] - 155:28 attached [22] - 29:21, 41:9, 61:4, 64:15, 75:18, 75:22, 83:11, 83:18, 86:24, 90:17, 90:19, 90:25, 91:14, 99:22, 104:26, 121:9, 121:11, 121:15, 131:16, 135:15, 136:1, 136:8 attachment [1] - 41:9 attacker [1] - 126:5 attempt [3] - 36:17, 38:21, 136:13 attempted [2] - 38:8, 123:10 attempting [1] -157:11 attempts [1] - 79:2 attend [4] - 34:21, 123:12, 147:22, 173:10 attended [1] - 24:17 attention [15] - 6:12, 18:4, 22:19, 44:16, 49:3, 53:28, 61:5, 72:13, 74:12, 75:24, 113:29, 114:2, 114:28, 124:12, 143:25 attitude [5] - 32:1, 47:17, 68:8, 74:3, 122:1 attributing [1] -

42:7

assist [7] - 33:25,

35:11, 71:10, 71:13,

71:14, 89:19, 98:15

au [1] - 130:14 audit [6] - 73:24, 157:29, 158:2, 160:9, 160:12, 160:19 auditable [1] -153:29 August [42] - 36:1, 43:6, 45:19, 46:27, 53:18, 57:29, 74:24, 81:1, 81:14, 81:19, 82:21, 83:5, 86:3, 86:22, 88:17, 89:14, 92:19, 95:10, 97:25, 98:2, 99:28, 101:3, 101:12, 104:28, 104:29, 106:18, 110:26, 115:4, 129:23, 130:9, 131:19, 133:4, 138:16, 139:21, 145:3, 147:22, 149:6, 149:9, 149:11, 152:26, 154:5, 161:5 authority [5] - 17:28, 18:8, 18:11, 125:9, 125.22 automatically [1] -43:26 avail [4] - 25:10, 31:20, 57:24, 82:7 available [19] -34:24, 35:21, 71:10, 71:14, 71:18, 71:21, 87:4, 88:5, 94:19, 101:16, 110:21, 111:5, 111:21, 142:8, 142:28, 144:4, 145:6, 165:7, 169:10 availing [1] - 31:27 avenue [2] - 102:6, 107.8 avenues [2] - 73:26, 106:2 avoid [1] - 107:13 await [1] - 139:9 **aware** [14] - 8:6, 24:14, 25:8, 48:7, 48:20, 48:24, 88:13, 94:13, 147:25, 148:19, 148:24, 151:23, 159:24, 161:21 AWOL [2] - 26:28, 47:5

В

background [2] **-** 6:12, 19:15

bad [3] - 23:6, 23:22, 133:29 **baffled** [1] - 106:25 Baker [6] - 90:6, 113:23, 113:28, 114:26, 115:19, 166:28 balance [2] - 125:18, 127:9 Ballinasloe [2] -89:14, 91:21 bar [4] - 119:22, 119:25, 133:29, 134:1 **BAR** [1] - 2:31 Barnes [4] - 99:5, 100:5, 142:13, 158:10 based [7] - 7:23, 33:25, 33:29, 34:11, 34:14, 34:16, 83:2 basic [4] - 62:3, 63:9, 63:14, 134:6 basis [9] - 31:17, 40:19, 40:20, 63:22, 69:2, 111:4, 119:3, 122:3, 157:24 **BASTION**[1] - 3:31 **BE** [1] - 6:4 bear [1] - 173:25 bearing [2] - 78:27, 127:2 beating [3] - 120:13, 120:28, 133:29 became [5] - 10:9, 25:8, 76:18, 150:14, 163:14 become [3] - 88:27, 94:18, 104:9 beg [5] - 28:21, 57:8, 99:4, 135:12, 149:22 began [2] - 46:1, 73.14 begin [3] - 115:1, 115:12, 115:22 begins [1] - 16:18 begun [1] - 78:25 behave [2] - 34:20, 35.2

begun [1] - 78:25 behave [2] - 34:20, 35:2 behaviour [3] -28:14, 34:7, 40:13 behaviours [1] -32:13 behind [3] - 41:12, 112:27, 146:19 belief [2] - 20:7,

31:22 believes [3] - 54:17, 146:25, 156:1 benchmarked [1] -

benefit [2] - 12:26,

22,

73:25

bereft [1] - 120:12

beside [1] - 143:14

best [30] - 34:3,
63:26, 63:27, 64:26,
65:4, 65:5, 65:8,
66:17, 66:20, 68:18,

69:13, 108:24, 110:16, 114:26, 118:29, 120:19, 125:15, 127:10, 127:14, 128:4, 128:8,

128:11, 129:14, 144:28, 150:23, 165:8, 166:8, 168:6

better [6] - 107:13, 113:10, 114:19, 122:21, 123:19, 150:26

between [10] - 19:6, 24:7, 31:26, 36:5, 52:8, 116:6, 147:1, 156:2, 167:24, 172:10

biannually [1] -158:2 big [1] - 142:24 binding [1] - 74:20

birth [1] - 110:3 **bit** [10] - 16:1, 44:26, 47:23, 77:24, 77:26, 137:29, 141:3, 153:8, 153:21, 162:18

BL [12] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 3:30, 4:4

black [2] - 112:20, 112:25

blamed [1] - 131:10 **blank** [3] - 103:29, 107:12

blatant [1] - 38:28

blue [1] - 112:25 **board** [2] - 7:5, 103:7 **boggling** [1] - 63:12

booked [1] - 110:7 **bottom** [7] - 81:8, 117:9, 142:17,

145:12, 149:14, 149:25, 167:11 **bottoms** [1] - 112:25 **bound** [1] - 158:14

bound [1] - 138.14 **box** [3] - 58:3, 112:12, 142:10

brackets [1] - 159:9 branch [3] - 110:13, 114:19, 131:6 breach [6] - 19:7,

38:3, 43:6, 46:25, 46:26 breaches [2] - 43:12,

45:11

break [2] - 146:29, 173:18

Brendan [1] - 13:3 **BRIAN** [2] - 3:15,

bridge [2] - 112:16, 119:18

brief [8] - 57:2, 113:3, 118:10, 119:14, 131:4, 133:11, 133:12, 165:23

briefly [5] - 96:21, 117:1, 149:1, 161:4, 172:22

bring [7] - 18:4, 65:10, 72:4, 76:17, 113:14, 130:18, 136:28

bringing [4] - 44:16, 69:16, 72:14, 72:20 brings [1] - 124:7 broadcasting [1] -

171:13 **broadly** [2] - 95:14, 122:10

brought [19] - 13:23, 22:19, 27:17, 53:28, 61:15, 64:11, 74:1, 74:28, 75:24, 110:5, 113:29, 129:2, 130:5, 135:17, 135:24, 136:11, 136:15, 143:22, 169:24

bruise [3] - 123:8, 124:4, 134:1 **Buckley** [1] - 45:20

build [1] - 101:17 building [4] - 62:27, 70:14, 75:4, 77:9 bundle [1] - 15:23 Bureau [1] - 160:10 burglary [1] - 89:14 business [5] - 20:9, 30:22, 50:21, 127:16,

busy [5] - 66:15, 67:3, 67:9, 80:24, 80:25

127:17

but.. [1] - 141:14 **BY** [12] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 3:30, 4:5, 5:5, C

C8 [3] - 61:12, 74:20, 86:26 **C8s** [2] - 66:14,

CAGNEY [1] - 3:17 callers [1] - 169:11 calmed [1] - 47:23 camera [2] - 55:7,

83:11

cancel [5] - 147:21, 152:27, 153:7, 154:20, 157:2

cancellation [6] - 147:16, 150:7, 155:8, 155:21, 155:24, 155:26

cancelled [2] -149:11, 153:1 cancelling [2] -155:5, 156:9

candid [1] - 74:7 cannot [1] - 75:28 cap [1] - 52:14 capable [1] - 43:2

captured [1] - 127:4 capturing [1] -127:11

car [16] - 10:28, 11:1, 12:10, 13:9, 15:8, 17:24, 82:21, 82:27, 89:13, 90:24, 91:2, 91:28, 136:13, 143:13, 169:13, 172:6

cards [1] - 59:10 care [4] - 42:28, 43:2, 135:25 career [1] - 9:7

careful [1] - 137:17 CARR [1] - 3:15 CARRICK [1] - 2:13 CARRICK-ON-SHANNON [1] - 2:13

carried [11] - 8:23, 58:13, 58:14, 64:14, 69:20, 92:7, 99:10, 116:15, 132:25, 139:5, 160:9 **CARROLL** [1] - 2:16

carry [2] - 119:10, 166:14 **carrying** [3] - 63:7,

64:18, 158:14 cars [3] - 6:19, 8:19,

CARTHAGE[1] - 2:17

case [40] - 20:23,

07.47.07.00.00.04
27:17, 27:29, 33:21,
35:7, 45:25, 50:25,
53:21, 54:17, 63:12,
63:24, 65:10, 67:15,
68:7, 68:17, 69:10,
69:16, 69:18, 71:11,
69:16, 69:18, 71:11, 71:15, 72:27, 75:28, 87:18, 91:15, 103:4,
87:18. 91:15. 103:4.
106:3, 121:10,
127:25, 131:21,
131:25, 137:16,
138:5, 141:13,
155:12, 159:6, 166:2,
170:11, 173:7, 173:13
cases [5] - 22:15,
61:7, 69:3, 91:23,
102:24
cash [1] - 59:10
CASTLE[1] - 1:17
Castlebar [1] - 58:15
catalogue [1] - 59:7
category [5] - 57:12,
82:2, 97:28, 98:21,
112:3
caused [5] - 30:18,
40:11, 43:25, 98:15,
123:9
causing [4] - 41:26,
41:28, 42:22, 100:2
cavalier [1] - 47:16
CCTV [86] - 55:6,
55:26, 57:23, 69:12,
75:2, 75:27, 76:22,
76:27, 76:29, 78:1,
81:22, 82:7, 82:16,
83:27, 84:1, 84:4,
84:8, 84:13, 84:24,
84:28, 85:3, 85:9,
85:12, 85:14, 85:17,
85:19, 85:21, 85:23,
85:25, 86:15, 87:4,
87:5, 87:6, 87:11,
87:12, 87:15, 87:23,
88:3, 88:16, 88:21,
89:2, 89:4, 89:6,
89:18, 89:21, 89:24,
89:25, 89:26, 90:12,
90:16, 90:23, 91:4,
91:7, 91:19, 91:20,
93:13, 93:15, 93:21,
93:22, 94:5, 94:12,
94:13, 94:17, 94:26,
94:27, 95:1, 95:5,
95:9, 96:13, 96:14,
98:6, 99:6, 99:27,
100:7, 101:16,
102:20, 104:9,
104:10, 108:17,
108:22, 109:1,
112:29, 128:27,
, ,

132:22, 135:23, 136:14 central [1] - 58:24 centre [4] - 58:15, 87:16, 103:2, 165:25 cert [4] - 29:21, 29:25, 30:9, 38:20 certain [5] - 78:24, 101:23, 110:3, 119:19, 138:25 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 certainly [3] - 17:4, 50:16, 147:12 certificate [15] -30:3, 30:5, 30:19, 30:22, 30:25, 30:29, 38:5, 38:6, 38:18, 39:9, 39:19, 41:5, 41:7, 45:14, 45:23 certificates [4] -38:12, 39:20, 41:12, 157:21 certification [1] -13:21 certified [7] - 14:7. 14:10, 22:20, 29:29, 34:19, 40:29, 44:2 certify [6] - 1:24, 9:10, 9:15, 10:29, 19:24, 29:27 certifying [1] -138:24 **certs** [1] - 8:13 CHAIRMAN[124] -1:12, 14:29, 15:4, 15:9, 15:11, 15:15, 15:21, 16:1, 16:6, 16:9, 16:13, 16:16, 16:21, 16:23, 16:26, 17:4, 17:16, 17:18, 17:23, 17:26, 18:5, 18:10, 18:14, 18:16, 18:25, 57:6, 57:9, 57:11, 58:17, 58:19, 58:22, 58:24, 58:26, 58:29, 75:12, 75:15, 75:17, 76:21, 76:24, 77:2, 77:5, 77:11, 77:17, 77:20, 77:24, 77:26, 77:29, 78:4, 78:11, 92:11, 96:24, 97:15, 97:18, 97:21, 103:23, 103:28, 104:4, 104:7, 104:10, 107:13, 116:8, 116:11, 116:21, 116:25, 116:27, 117:2, 117:8, 117:15, 117:19. 117:22.

117:24, 117:28,

118:3, 118:5, 118:12, 118:18, 118:24, 118:26, 118:29, 119:29, 126:18, 127:6, 127:19, 127:22, 127:28, 128:2, 128:6, 140:13, 140:16, 140:20, 140:24, 141:6, 141:15, 141:20, 141:27, 141:29, 142:4, 143:20, 150:25, 150:29, 151:4, 151:7, 151:9, 151:13, 151:16, 151:20, 151:29, 152:3, 152:6, 152:8, 152:10, 152:13, 152:15, 152:18, 158:25, 158:29, 171:25, 171:28, 172:26, 173:2, 173:13, 173:15, 173:23, 174:1 Chairman [16] - 6:8. 6:14, 17:17, 17:25, 18:12, 42:23, 116:24, 120:2, 127:1, 128:5, 137:11. 141:5. 141:14, 173:4, 173:22, 173:26 Chairperson [1] -151:11 challenged [2] -27:20, 27:24 challenging [2] -145:5, 156:20 chance [3] - 74:28, 94:5, 150:27 chances [1] - 76:19 change [4] - 117:10, 119:29, 121:20, 140.13 changed [8] - 14:3, 17:13, 22:3, 60:10, 123:17, 141:22, 150:13, 150:17 changing [1] - 51:7 **chapter** [6] - 65:20, 68:13, 72:9, 75:23, 124:21, 149:23 charge [27] - 6:11, 28:23, 52:13, 102:23, 113:14. 113:28. 114:12, 114:16, 114:22, 115:8, 115:13, 115:28, 116:1, 117:26, 129:19, 129:23,

131:3, 131:13, 131:26, 134:23, 134:28, 150:3, 167:2, 170.17 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:5 CHEALLACHÁIN [1] - 2:30 check [2] - 18:2, 132.25 checked [3] - 12:1, 13:26, 132:24 checks [1] - 8:23 cheque [1] - 59:10 **chest** [1] - 119:24 Chief [3] - 12:28, 31:9. 48:15 chief [37] - 6:7, 14:26, 15:4, 15:22, 16:27, 19:5, 20:21, 31:6, 32:9, 33:6, 35:6. 36:27, 39:23, 41:4, 41:10, 43:5, 50:14, 53:19, 76:24, 96:20, 97:19, 102:12, 103:23, 117:16, 126:18, 129:15, 129:17, 130:28, 140:20, 158:2, 162:1, 162:10, 167:24, 168:10, 170:1, 172:3, 173:15 **CHIEF** [16] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27, 5:3, 6:4 **chip** [1] - 126:5 **choice** [2] - 84:19, 123:16 **chop** [1] - 126:5 chose [1] - 40:16 **chosen** [2] - 80:12, 134.21 chronological [1] -116:13 Church [1] - 143:13 cigarette [2] -119:20, 121:18 circuit [1] - 92:29 circular [2] - 44:29,

circulated [2] - 85:6,

circumstance [1] -

circumstances [15] -

6:10, 11:2, 44:8, 52:7,

66:17, 66:25, 93:25,

103:13. 115:10.

117:19, 118:9,

89.10

96:11

140:12, 147:28, 158:16, 165:9 **CIT** [3] - 65:21, 134:13, 134:17 citing [1] - 147:27 civilian [1] - 58:14 claims [1] - 9:24 clarify [1] - 15:26 class [1] - 19:2 clear [16] - 18:23, 30:5, 34:4, 41:18, 47:9, 47:15, 51:3, 61:23, 64:29, 66:5, 125:6, 126:23, 126:29, 129:21, 138:6, 173:19 clearly [9] - 19:17, 35:10, 35:25, 68:27, 79:10, 115:3, 134:17, 138:20, 146:24 clerk [5] - 13:23, 43:26, 45:1, 45:2, 45.5 close [4] - 23:28, 102:4. 137:4. 142:1 closed [2] - 140:3, 145:8 clothing [3] - 104:9, 133:14, 133:19 CMO [4] - 34:17, 40:3, 42:26, 169:22 **CO** [2] - 2:13, 4:1 Code [3] - 64:8, 124:22, 149:23 coins [1] - 133:25 collated [4] - 55:10, 55:12, 55:13, 55:16 collator [1] - 91:24 colleague [1] -146:19 colleagues [4] -28:15, 95:29, 165:16, 165:19 collected [1] - 55:11 colour [1] - 82:27 column [1] - 57:17 combination [1] -41:22 combined [1] -139:27 coming [9] - 40:20, 71:27, 77:11, 110:22, 114:2, 127:12, 129:5, 133:27, 166:20 commence [2] -33:19, 110:22 commenced [1] -130:27 commencement [1] - 134:7

129:28, 130:5, 130:7,

commencing [1] -8:22 commend [1] -145:25 commendation [1] -146:8 commendations [1] - 165:22 commended [1] -145:27 comment [3] - 67:29, 97:18, 142:10 comments [7] - 50:8, 55:23, 55:29, 56:22, 82:26, 108:13, 108:14 commercially [1] -22:10 Commissioner [1] -148:11 **COMMISSIONER** [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 commissioner [1] -158.1 commit [2] - 43:1, 107:15 commitments [2] -32:1, 33:27 committed [2] - 8:16, 77:23 common [1] - 115:23 commonly [1] -142:26 communication [2] -33:10, 36:19 communications [1] 147:26 companies [1] -144:6 **COMPANY**[1] - 2:22 compile [1] - 130:2 compiled [1] - 130:2 complained [1] -64:20 complaint [9] - 11:5, 11:14, 93:2, 93:8, 121:21, 125:16, 136:21, 138:8, 140:27 complaints [3] -118:22, 124:13, 143:25 completed [1] -45:20 completely [3] -161:23, 164:26, 166.16 completeness [2] -171:29, 173:14 complied [3] - 10:13,

139:21, 143:5 complies [1] - 9:26 compliment [1] -146:3 **comply** [3] - 9:5, 50:23, 115:3 complying [5] - 7:11, 7:27, 8:27, 9:3, 44:12 comprehensive [4] -111:2, 135:7, 148:8, 155:27 compromise [1] -77:18 computer [1] - 86:15 concern [11] - 7:14, 28:17, 60:17, 61:20, 108:25, 114:5, 114:6, 157:15, 157:25, 163:7, 167:6 concerned [15] -10:12, 35:3, 42:27, 44:4, 44:14, 53:27, 80:5, 102:24, 104:18, 105:20, 140:3, 150:29, 159:24, 165:13, 171:9 concerning [2] -142:6, 151:4 concerns [7] - 24:7, 30:25, 45:13, 72:28, 73:2, 158:8, 166:29 concise [2] - 132:27, 133:4 conclude [2] - 64:5, 139:7 concluded [2] - 70:7, 76:21 conclusion [11] -13:24, 61:16, 64:12, 65:11, 70:28, 72:5, 72:15, 72:20, 76:18, 136:28, 137:5 condition [2] -164:25. 167:21 conduct [1] - 45:13 conducted [4] -56:19, 107:8, 144:18, 148.22

conference [7] -

28:1, 33:21, 35:7,

159:6, 169:22,

169:27, 170:12

confessed [3] -

62:27, 70:14, 77:27

confidence [2] -

confidential [4] -

32:3, 61:17

148:1, 148:11,

148:14, 162:10

confided [1] - 42:21

confront [1] - 30:24 confusion [1] - 92:26 congratulate [1] -147:2 **CONLON** [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT[1] connected [1] -CONNELLAN[2] -3:30, 3:30 **CONOR** [1] - 3:24 conscious [1] -173:23 consequence [1] -54:19 consequences [1] -78:7 consider [8] - 28:1, 49:14, 63:13, 71:24, 146:8, 156:24, 161:13 considerable [2] -73:1, 73:3 considerably [1] -76:20 consideration [2] -121:29. 149:12 considered [8] -38:27, 80:21, 103:11, 105:14, 109:11, 118:6, 129:29, 155:26 considering [2] -29:11, 101:16 constitute [1] - 34:11 consult [2] - 170:24, 170:26 consultation [1] -167:17 consulted [2] -167:14, 167:19 consumed [1] -122:23 contact [18] - 21:28, 22:23, 25:26, 28:8, 28:10, 32:29, 36:13, 36:18, 46:7, 46:21, 48:14, 51:11, 91:22, 91:27, 123:17, 136:17, 142:19,

confidentiality [3] -

confined [1] - 158:13

50:2, 147:26, 156:2

confinement [1] -

confirm [1] - 9:21

confirmation [1] -

confirmed [1] - 23:2

conflated [3] - 11:14,

26:14. 32:21

158:9

170:11 contacted [14] -21:24, 22:1, 24:8, 28:4, 33:7, 33:12, 36:26, 37:5, 48:13, 48:15, 51:12, 53:9, 57:28, 141:10 contacting [1] - 51:9 contain [1] - 129:9 contained [4] -82:29, 83:2, 135:2, 149:2 content [1] - 62:14 contention [1] -169.2 contents [4] - 30:19, 30:21, 41:6, 62:9 contest [1] - 52:8 context [2] - 28:7, 102.13 continuation [1] -112:23 continue [5] - 27:28, 31:17, 33:26, 49:17, 69:25 CONTINUED [1] continued [7] - 19:8, 20:3, 27:11, 49:13, 73:22, 138:23, 161:12 continuing [3] -33:14, 34:20, 95:20 contrary [3] - 63:3, 68:15, 125:2 control [2] - 73:24, 158:5 conversation [7] -23:8, 23:9, 25:28, 27:5, 164:14, 168:24 conversations [3] -78:29, 79:1, 116:18 conversed [1] -77:22 conveying [1] -23:21 cooperate [1] -121:25 coordinates [1] -132:17 copper [2] - 119:22, 134:1 COPPINGER [1] **copy** [6] - 13:11, 20:17, 90:23, 91:7, 91:20. 91:24 Cormac [4] - 21:24, 24:9, 25:21, 53:8

Cormack [1] - 45:21

corner [1] - 82:19

correct [15] - 9:10, 9:15, 11:1, 17:17, 17:25, 22:21, 26:21, 51:16, 54:10, 64:17, 76:15, 76:29, 92:28, 94:4, 130:4 corrected [5] -14:14, 17:24, 19:10, 53:29, 67:15 correctly [1] - 19:25 correspondence [12] - 13:1, 16:14, 16:16, 19:20, 19:22, 45:6, 60:27, 73:17, 88:16, 96:7, 131:15, 131:24 COSTELLO [1] -2.22 counsel [1] - 64:24 counter [1] - 169:11 countermanded [1] -147:27 countersign [1] -151:26 counting [2] - 125:7, 127.7 couple [3] - 88:28, 153:4, 163:18 course [21] - 6:15, 11:21, 20:9, 33:24, 35:11, 60:9, 60:11, 60:27, 79:29, 80:8, 83:7, 92:27, 100:8, 110:16, 112:3, 122:3, 122:25, 135:21, 145:28, 168:8, 173:1 Court [3] - 63:24, 69:15, 126:12 COURT [3] - 1:13, 2:3. 3:31 cover [5] - 30:9, 33:18, 35:27, 67:23, 87:4 **covering** [3] - 38:18, 64:28, 99:29 covers [2] - 106:8, cracking [1] - 98:6 crank [1] - 144:27 create [4] - 38:3, 46:19, 46:22, 68:25 Create [1] - 137:25 created [1] - 172:11 creates [1] - 125:13 creating [1] - 103:8 creation [1] - 60:4 credibility [1] -126:13 credible [2] - 125:1, 125:16 credit [7] - 25:22,

27:26, 33:3, 37:20, 146:14 crime [81] - 49:2, 49:7, 54:22, 54:29, 55:1, 56:3, 56:23, 57:29, 59:22, 60:4, 60:5, 60:9, 60:29, 61:1, 61:4, 61:15, 62:2, 62:4, 65:21, 66:3, 66:7, 66:9, 67:22, 69:29, 71:3, 72:1, 72:8, 72:9, 73:10, 73:19, 75:9, 76:5, 76:17, 77:23, 78:12, 78:19, 78:26, 79:26, 81:15, 81:26, 82:2, 82:16, 83:2, 83:10, 84:8, 88:4, 89:6, 90:1, 90:3, 92:2, 96:5, 97:7, 98:16, 98:21, 99:12, 99:22, 102:28, 103:1, 103:20, 105:25, 106:26, 107:16, 107:18. 107:20. 109:3, 109:16, 116:14, 125:7, 126:15, 126:16, 126:17, 126:21, 126:25, 127:7, 137:16, 141:3, 141:7, 141:17, 141:26, 172:17 Crime [3] - 65:21, 68:13, 75:23 crime" [3] - 92:11, 92:12, 92:13 crimes [8] - 68:9, 68:19, 72:17, 72:23, 75:27, 87:1, 124:22, 125:10 criminal [10] - 49:5, 54:12. 69:24. 83:7. 96:22, 97:24, 97:29, 98:21, 101:4, 125:3 criminals [1] - 74:1 criteria [1] - 124:26 critical [3] - 110:27, 111:5, 146:22 criticise [1] - 107:6 criticised [2] -106:13, 144:20 criticising [1] - 107:1 criticism [2] - 128:3, 144:17 criticisms [1] - 54:12 cross [1] - 64:23 cross-examined [1] - 64:23 crossed [4] - 62:15,

70:23, 77:24, 78:20 crossing [1] - 77:26 **CUALÁIN** [1] - 3:7 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 culpability [1] -67:19 culprits [1] - 99:19 curious [1] - 53:21 Curley [13] - 95:22, 113:24, 115:18, 116:18, 117:4, 117:5, 119:7, 119:10, 120:19, 121:6, 122:7, 142:14, 167:5 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 custody [2] - 93:17, 136.16 Custume [3] - 49:7, 54:16, 55:16 cuts [3] - 123:9, 124:5, 134:2 CVSO [1] - 57:28

D

D/Branch [1] -110:10 D9 [1] - 155:28 daily [1] - 111:20 damage [8] - 83:7, 96:22, 97:24, 97:29, 98:14, 98:21, 100:7, 104:21 damned [2] - 69:18, 69:19 danger [1] - 146:20 data [3] - 58:23, 126:14, 127:11 date [31] - 16:29, 19:11, 26:14, 32:23, 38:20, 45:26, 46:1, 46:2, 50:28, 51:2, 51:7, 51:12, 54:6, 75:12, 75:14, 81:6, 82:4, 82:18, 91:10, 98:25, 98:29, 108:5, 110:3, 112:5, 112:6, 116:8, 137:9, 137:13, 147:23, 155:19, 170:8 dated [25] - 8:1, 16:25, 26:5, 29:16, 29:25. 31:8. 36:1. 38:5, 38:14, 38:18, 43:5, 45:23, 52:28, 68:4, 86:21, 87:28, 88:17, 104:28, 106:18, 135:10, 135:13, 143:1, 149:3,

149:4, 170:29 dates [2] - 43:29, 44:2 **DAVID**[2] - 2:28, 3.18 Davis [1] - 12:27 **DAVIS**[1] - 2:8 **DAY** [1] - 1:18 day's [1] - 155:1 days [23] - 25:9, 26:28, 27:9, 28:11, 28:18, 29:2, 29:20, 31:20, 31:26, 31:28, 32:27, 34:29, 36:5, 39:7, 67:6, 110:6, 142:25, 154:20, 155:21, 155:24, 157:22, 163:18 daytime [1] - 147:9 dead [1] - 51:13 deal [43] - 7:1, 7:2, 7:15, 11:3, 13:20, 14:5, 14:11, 14:20, 17:28, 18:2, 18:4, 21:12, 22:16, 40:23, 40:24, 44:15, 54:11, 54:13, 61:8, 67:9, 67:10, 79:3, 96:9, 97:23, 106:5, 109:21, 114:4, 114:7, 114:23, 116:12, 118:16, 120:19, 135:1, 142:5, 143:11, 159:19, 161:2, 165:23, 169:18, 169:29, 172:19, 172:22, 172:29 dealing [27] - 6:16, 14:19, 17:16, 20:28, 21:14, 27:6, 30:17, 43:6, 45:3, 64:19, 66:26, 73:8, 73:16, 78:18, 79:15, 79:20, 109:16, 111:1, 132:6, 141:26, 145:5. 156:20, 163:5, 165:22, 167:28, 169:10, 171:24 dealings [2] - 147:8, 157:12 **deals** [1] - 45:12 dealt [42] - 12:3, 12:21, 12:23, 13:22, 14:22, 20:24, 20:29,

97:6, 107:28, 108:11, 114:20, 122:25, 124:15, 133:11, 133:13, 133:14, 134:9, 134:21, 138:16, 148:22, 157:16, 157:17, 164:2, 166:18 death [1] - 157:9 December [4] -52:29, 140:6, 141:27, 172:3 DECEMBER [4] -1:9, 1:18, 6:2, 174:4 decide [3] - 34:3, 34:13, 110:16 decided [7] - 11:21, 12:1, 117:5, 118:16, 120:21, 122:11, 124:10 deciding [2] - 33:24, 52:19 decision [18] - 21:7, 40:16, 116:20, 125:14, 125:21, 125:24, 127:9, 128:7, 132:7, 139:29, 142:2, 156:8, 156:11, 167:15, 167:18, 167:23, 170:10, 170:27 decisions 131 -124:18, 125:10, 151:4 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:5 deemed [1] - 47:25 defects [1] - 12:12 defence [1] - 38:3 defensive[1] - 23:27 deficiency [3] -118:24, 118:26, 118:27 **definite** [1] - 87:24 definitely [1] - 144:9 definitively [1] -10:24 degree [2] - 117:12, 126:28 delegated [2] -

125:9, 125:21 deliberately [3] -46:11, 51:9, 53:7 delivering [2] -103:9, 156:22 demand [1] - 102:10 demands [1] - 32:4 demeanour [1] -128:9 demo [1] - 57:23 demonstrate [2] -

64:29, 129:13

demonstrates [1] -65:17 denial [1] - 147:16 deny [1] - 171:17 departing [1] - 66:19 department [3] -34:3, 42:26, 43:16 dependency [2] -39:15, 40:8 describe [4] - 27:13, 120:14, 120:16, 162:7 described [5] - 74:3, 120:27, 133:19, 133:22, 146:19 describes [3] -120:13, 123:8, 133:16 description [12] -118:7, 118:11, 121:24, 122:21, 122:26, 123:7, 124:3, 128:9. 133:14. 133:17, 139:19, 146:12 descriptions [1] -133.13 deserved [1] -114:28 desk [6] - 67:12, 73:11, 78:13, 78:20, 80:25, 158:13 **DESMOND** [1] - 4:3 despite [3] - 14:9, 138:7, 140:27 detached [2] - 139:2, 164:26 detail [7] - 59:7, 120:12, 120:24, 121:23, 122:11, 160:27, 167:15 detailed [3] - 117:3, 171:3, 173:17 details [10] - 25:17, 59:15, 111:27, 113:1, 113:16, 120:16, 132:14, 134:14, 156:6, 166:1 detected [1] - 95:23 detection [1] - 127:5 **DETECTIVE** [5] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17 Detective [13] -22:23, 22:25, 23:10, 23:20, 23:24, 42:6, 48:7, 48:13, 79:2, 115:18, 142:14, 149:19, 167:5 detective [6] -110:13, 114:19,

131:6. 135:29.

136:20, 142:16

21:8. 21:9. 21:15.

21:16, 34:13, 35:18,

39:5, 41:23, 44:17,

45:2, 51:26, 54:15,

79:8, 79:21, 88:15,

59:19. 70:20. 78:26.

determined [2] -125:16, 126:12 develop[1] - 73:27 developed [1] -31:18 **DEVELOPMENT**[1] developments [2] -75:29, 104:24 diaries [1] - 158:26 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diary [6] - 101:1, 101:11, 156:15, 156:17, 158:24, 161:2 **died** [1] - 157:9 differed [1] - 19:2 difference [2] - 19:6, 21.18 different [10] - 73:19, 83:21, 87:12, 89:24, 116:17, 117:11, 118:14, 118:17, 124:4, 161:23 difficult [6] - 95:25, 121:25, 138:23, 145:4, 147:11, 156:19 difficulties [1] -78:28 difficulty [4] - 147:4, 155:13, 162:25, 165:20 digits [1] - 158:27 **DIGNAM**[1] - 3:24 dimension [1] -133:21 direct [1] - 68:28 directed [5] - 17:18, 45:6, 102:22, 102:23, 160:28 directing [1] - 171:21 direction [20] - 6:10, 7:23, 10:1, 10:20, 10:22, 20:4, 61:29, 63:5, 64:10, 71:25, 102:8, 109:19, 110:25, 111:12, 115:4, 129:22, 130:8, 133:3, 143:15, 170:16 directly [4] - 7:18, 42:29, 145:25, 146:5 **DIRECTLY** [2] - 5:5, 6.5 **DIRECTLY-EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 DIRECTORATE[1] discerning [1] -70:23

disciplinary [11] -20:15, 33:19, 34:25, 35:14, 35:24, 43:18, 44:6. 44:9. 45:8. 52:25, 162:2 discipline [15] -14:17, 18:15, 28:1, 29:11, 38:4, 39:6, 40:15, 43:7, 43:13, 45:11, 47:5, 50:10, 137:21, 159:6 **Discipline** [1] - 43:11 disciplined [5] -11:7, 13:8, 13:10, 13:15, 22:5 disclosure [2] -15:28, 148:25 Disclosure [1] -147:23 disclosures [3] -125:13, 148:1, 148:10 DISCLOSURES [2] -1:2. 1:3 discreditable [1] -45:13 discrediting [1] -12:14 discretion [2] -14:19, 44:13 discuss [4] - 7:7, 33:23, 48:5, 48:11 discussed [13] -7:15, 11:20, 97:7, 101:5, 102:20, 111:12, 120:21, 122:9, 124:9, 137:27, 163:25, 168:27, 172:20 discussing [1] -83:15 discussion [3] -39:28, 122:6, 152:27 disk [5] - 13:27, 19:29, 20:12, 20:16, 22.7 disorientated [1] -162:18 displayed [1] - 40:5 disregard [1] - 38:28 district [13] - 9:22, 19:23, 20:18, 25:11, 25:14, 32:3, 43:26, 45:2, 45:5, 64:16, 96:19, 133:2, 160:10 District [3] - 63:24, 69:14, 126:11

Divilly [7] - 122:14,

123:1. 123:15.

123:18, 124:2,

133:21, 134:1

Divilly's [1] - 133:15 **DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 divisional [1] - 9:19 dizzy [1] - 151:17 **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:3 doctor [11] - 30:6, 30:22. 38:7. 38:13. 38:16, 38:22, 40:29, 41:5, 123:12, 138:24, 143:18 doctor's [1] - 154:28 document [13] -13:12, 16:4, 16:10, 16:28, 18:18, 84:17, 84:18, 84:19, 84:20, 100:13, 115:16, 137:24, 160:26 documents [12] -13:28, 14:27, 15:1, 15:3, 15:24, 15:27. 16:2, 53:18, 53:20, 152:28, 162:9 **DONAL** [2] - 3:7, 3:24 **done** [19] - 20:1, 20:12, 27:21, 35:8, 37:12, 50:19, 54:1, 58:21, 63:16, 64:23, 77:14, 79:17, 92:20, 120:7, 122:13, 128:16, 128:21, 145:26, 147:8 door [2] - 100:1, 155.13 doubt [1] - 103:18 doubting [1] -153:16 down [36] - 11:27, 22:26, 25:1, 28:15, 39:10, 39:14, 40:8, 47:23, 49:25, 50:29, 55:24, 58:3, 61:12, 69:11, 73:1, 76:14, 76:28, 81:8, 90:8, 99:4, 99:5, 106:15, 112:12, 119:23, 126:4, 135:12, 138:18, 142:13, 146:7, 147:19, 148:4, 149:24, 150:25, 159:13, 162:28, 167:11 **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, downloaded [6] -84:29, 85:26, 89:9, 90:16, 98:7, 100:8 downstream [2] -77:2, 78:6

drafted [1] - 18:2 drawing [1] - 70:28 drink [2] - 27:12, 27:14 drinking [10] - 24:25, 27:9, 27:11, 27:14, 28:19, 32:26, 67:4, 142:23, 142:25, 173:10 drive [1] - 87:7 driven [2] - 135:18, 136:12 driver [1] - 165:27 driveway [2] - 81:7, 81.11 **Driving** [5] - 8:13, 9:9, 9:13, 11:11, 12:13 dropped [1] - 140:26 drove [1] - 132:21 drowning [2] -145:23, 146:28 drunk [9] - 32:26, 35:25, 37:11, 39:13, 39:18, 80:10, 123:12, 162:20, 167:7 **DUBLIN** [6] - 1:17, 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, 4:6 **Dublin** [3] - 81:1, 83:6, 102:15 due [11] - 29:28, 79:28, 80:8, 83:7, 100:8, 106:1, 110:7, 112:3, 122:1, 145:28, 173.1 duly [1] - 143:22 duplicates [1] -113:5 duplication [1] -56:14 during [9] - 6:15, 27:25, 56:23, 66:15, 92:26, 147:9, 147:14, 157:19. 158:3 duties [13] - 108:9, 108:11, 134:16, 139:5, 158:9, 158:14, 158:19, 161:19, 166:5, 167:15, 169:3, 170:8, 171:4 duty [45] - 10:28, 11:4, 14:2, 17:12, 21:28, 22:1, 24:16, 25:9, 28:27, 29:19, 31:19, 31:20, 31:25, 33:16, 35:25, 38:21, 45:9. 45:12. 49:15.

56:20, 80:1, 80:10,

DR [1] - 3:11

130:11, 130:21, 131:1, 131:5, 134:12, 142:26, 144:19, 152:8, 152:17, 158:13, 161:14, 164:17, 167:7, 169:1, 169:7, 172:22 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 Ε e-mail [9] - 24:11, 25:12, 25:14, 25:17, 25:25, 26:15, 32:22, 92:18, 115:15 **EAMON** [1] - 3:10 early [7] - 21:29, 31:19, 66:6, 114:1, 115:16, 144:19, 166:3 eating [2] - 62:27, 67:4 effect [5] - 128:29, 135:29, 166:12, 166:14, 171:3 effect' [1] - 158:19 effective [1] - 171:24 effectively [5] -54:24, 140:2, 143:10, 171:13, 171:16 effectiveness[1] -103:9 efficiencies [1] -68:25 efficiency [1] - 103:8 effort [6] - 68:18, 76:16, 79:13, 85:3, 114:4, 135:19 efforts [9] - 61:8, 72:11. 72:16. 72:22. 76:7, 92:15, 96:8, 118:8, 127:5 **EGAN**[1] - 3:25 either [1] - 24:20 element [3] - 101:17, 104:9, 115:21 elicit [3] - 63:6, 65:9, 144:15 elicited [6] - 61:26, 62:12, 67:17, 69:9, 71:4, 80:20 ELIZABETH [1] -2:29 emails [1] - 115:19 emerge [1] - 140:18 **EMMA**[1] - 3:26

emphasis [1] -

147:28

111:14, 111:17,

130:6, 130:10,

DPP[1] - 71:11

employed [1] - 170:8 employee [1] - 43:29 employees [2] -11:22, 35:2 enclosed [1] - 55:21 encourage [1] -165:2 encouraged [1] -121:14 end [8] - 49:21, 49:25, 58:20, 80:27, 109:5, 136:24, 161:9, 162:23 endeavour [2] -126:16, 150:23 ended [4] - 23:18, 23:19, 49:21, 151:6 enforcer [1] - 52:14 engage [3] - 164:12, 164:27, 166:24 engaged [1] - 48:20 engagement [1] -48:11 engaging [2] - 48:8, 162:11 **enhance** [1] - 85:3 enhanced [1] - 89:9 enquired [1] - 48:2 enquiries [19] - 6:24, 41:25, 41:29, 56:19, 67:11, 87:18, 92:7, 94:16, 94:26, 96:8, 99:8, 99:18, 115:2, 116:15, 119:11, 120:29, 130:27, 136:27, 144:6 enquiring [1] - 23:1 enquiry [3] - 106:2, 107:8, 129:7 ensure [17] - 13:23, 34:6, 50:2, 64:16, 71:9, 72:13, 72:19, 92:8, 102:9, 103:5, 107:9, 115:21, 145:7, 145:27, 165:4, 165:19, 168:29 ensured [2] - 95:22, 103:4 ensuring [2] - 73:29, 138:3 enter [1] - 75:3 entering [2] - 62:27, 70:14 entire [2] - 47:29, 160:13 entirely [3] - 87:12, 129:21, 130:28 entitled [3] - 7:20, 19:1, 50:9 entries [3] - 58:21,

101:2, 161:2 entry [18] - 57:3, 57:19, 57:20, 81:3, 97:25, 97:27, 98:11, 111:29, 113:11, 113:27, 131:4, 132:14, 133:5, 133:18, 133:23. 135:21, 158:24, 159:2 environment [1] -169:17 Environment [1] -137:25 envisage [2] -103:24, 121:26 envisaged [4] -111:24, 115:15, 129:22, 132:26 **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 Eoin [3] - 90:22, 91:8. 91:21 **EQUALITY** [1] - 1:8 equally [2] - 137:20, 145:13 error [7] - 46:17, 51:28, 54:9, 70:2, 84:14, 84:21, 84:23 escalated [1] - 42:15 essential [1] - 85:1 essentially [2] -116:27, 152:10 establish [2] -103:27, 104:2 ESTABLISHED[1] etcetera [2] - 59:10, 134.4 etcetera" [1] -172:29 ethos [4] - 63:4, 65:3, 68:15, 79:6 euro [1] - 119:29 evening [5] - 57:14, 117:5, 120:20, 122:7, 161:6 event [8] - 8:1, 45:8, 57:20, 60:23, 75:8, 133:7, 141:20, 157:6 events [9] - 24:7, 36:8, 47:9, 49:9, 60:9, 60:11, 116:5, 133:10, 161:11

eventually [3] - 13:5,

evidence [38] - 7:26,

17:26, 53:26, 56:7,

61:28, 62:11, 63:8,

63:9, 63:20, 64:3,

64:21, 65:10, 66:2,

66:9, 66:11, 66:21,

81:22, 94:14

69:22, 70:18, 71:11, 74:4, 74:6, 75:8, 85:27, 88:5, 88:12, 104:20, 105:6, 106:27, 108:20, 125:1, 129:3, 141:15, 141:16, 146:18, 153:9, 166:4 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 evidential [3] - 55:6, 88:24, 89:21 evidentially [2] -76:29, 108:24 exactly [9] - 15:5, 15:15, 15:22, 58:26, 119:1, 132:18, 132:29, 141:9, 152:18 examination [1] -23:28 examine [1] - 44:8 examined [4] - 38:7, 38:13, 38:15, 64:23 **EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, example [1] - 120:14 **exception** [1] - 143:6 exceptional [2] -10:12, 66:25 exchange [1] - 49:21 excised [1] - 70:24 excuse [10] - 18:26, 28:20, 37:12, 37:15, 37:18, 39:17, 39:25, 153:22, 164:10 EXECUTIVE [1] exercise [1] - 144:10 exhibit [1] - 89:21 exist [1] - 8:21 existing [2] - 68:12, 151:2 exists [1] - 71:13 **expand** [1] - 97:5 expect [3] - 76:8, 132:29, 139:18 expected [3] - 67:14, 134:26, 167:20 expedite [1] - 169:21 experience [8] - 9:6, 10:15, 67:20, 67:21, 73:25, 126:23, 139:27, 139:28 experienced [1] -133:1 expert [2] - 34:6, 40.28 expired [1] - 19:19

117:1, 127:5, 142:12, 168:28 explained [19] -12:19, 14:17, 27:18, 27:20, 29:11, 36:25, 37:9, 39:24, 41:28, 47:15, 47:20, 53:8, 74:18. 125:19. 127:29, 139:24, 157:3, 163:10, 164:13 explaining [2] -47:25. 53:10 explanation [25] -20:10, 28:2, 28:19, 29:4, 29:7, 29:10, 29:12, 30:26, 30:27, 34:8, 37:22, 37:24, 45:22, 68:7, 80:21, 85:29, 88:3, 134:20, 147:29, 148:16, 148:17, 148:27, 155:25, 156:6, 157:4 explanation" [1] -152:24 explanation' [1] -147:28 explore [2] - 6:20, explored [3] - 69:27, 71:7, 102:6 exposed [1] - 164:28 express [4] - 47:11, 74:11, 166:28, 167:6 expressed [2] - 7:14, 108:20 expressing [3] -38:11, 71:28, 73:2 **expression** [1] - 74:9 extensive [1] - 72:29 extent [5] - 63:11, 78:29, 141:18, 160:17, 170:5

F

face [5] - 50:16,

Facebook [11] -

25:20, 28:5, 28:6,

131:21

77:14, 84:17, 126:9,

28:8, 33:8, 36:18, 36:26, 46:21, 51:13, 51:18, 53:10 faces [2] - 98:7, 99:29 facing [1] - 35:16 fact [30] - 14:9, 17:8, 17:19, 20:18, 26:19, 28:3, 31:2, 36:3, 37:8,

41:13, 46:20, 49:7, 51:12, 52:18, 62:7, 93:28, 95:4, 108:14, 108:16, 109:2, 119:5, 120:12, 122:27, 123:29, 127:1, 134:9, 138:7, 140:27, 141:16, 159:22 factor [1] - 40:10 factors [1] - 42:17 facts [1] - 62:10 factually [1] - 51:16 fail [1] - 72:25 $\textbf{failed} \ [\textbf{1}] \textbf{ - } 28 \vdots 28$ failings [2] - 160:19, 160:29 fair [1] - 11:22 faire [2] - 68:8, 74:3 fairly [3] - 32:4, 103:7, 155:15 fairness [2] - 15:11, 141:9 fait [1] - 130:15 false [3] - 30:20, 90:29. 91:29 familiar [2] - 44:22, families [1] - 106:21 family [16] - 49:5, 100:22, 100:29, 101:11, 101:24, 102:3, 103:12, 104:23, 105:4, 105:19, 106:19, 106:27, 107:2, 107:11, 107:15 **FANNING** [1] - 2:21 fantastic [1] - 35:21 far [16] - 10:12, 18:21, 35:3, 42:27, 44:4, 57:17, 64:12, 68:9, 102:24, 105:20, 112:8, 125:26, 132:25, 137:13, 140:3, 150:29 farm [1] - 22:11 farmer [1] - 18:27 farming [3] - 19:1, 19:26, 22:12 **FARRELL**[1] - 4:2 Farrell [1] - 142:2 fashion [24] - 6:23. 12:3, 20:24, 21:1, 34:20, 34:29, 35:2, 37:29, 53:17, 62:6, 63:15, 64:20, 66:12, 69:21, 69:27, 71:7, 76:29, 79:24, 80:19, 114:8, 134:21, 156:12, 157:28,

explain [11] - 13:20,

33:13, 47:22, 114:26,

23:6, 27:8, 30:16.

166:19 fault [1] - 131:9 favour [1] - 110:10 favourable [1] -160:12 fear [1] - 107:14 fears [4] - 8:21, 27:24, 48:1, 87:21 features [1] - 133:22 **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:5, February [2] - 20:17, fed [2] - 41:1 feelings [1] - 71:28 **fell** [1] - 119:22 fella [1] - 119:23 fellow [1] - 165:18 felt [53] - 6:17, 7:16, 7:19, 11:18, 14:22, 18:28, 28:14, 28:18, 30:12, 30:18, 33:12, 34:7, 35:5, 35:9, 40:12, 40:20, 40:22, 63:1, 63:2, 69:21, 71:4, 71:27, 102:10, 102:28, 109:17, 109:18, 132:6, 138:10, 138:11, 139:24, 144:11, 144:13, 144:14, 144:21, 144:22, 145:16, 148:15, 148:26, 153:4, 155:11, 156:9, 156:28, 157:28, 160:24, 162:12, 162:19, 163:7, 163:10, 164:20, 166:21, 167:21, 169:15 **FERGAL** [1] - 2:27 **FERRY** [1] - 2:16 few [3] - 27:9, 32:27, 119:25 fifth [2] - 108:1, 161:8 fight [2] - 119:24, 123:10 file [32] - 15:7, 40:3, 54:29, 57:29, 59:22, 60:4, 60:5, 60:9, 60:29, 67:14, 69:29, 78:12, 78:19, 78:26, 79:26, 81:15, 81:26, 81:28, 83:2, 84:26, 85:14, 88:4, 88:25, 90:17, 90:19, 97:7, 99:22, 102:28,

105:25, 107:18,

files [16] - 49:2, 54:22, 55:1, 61:1, 61:4, 73:10, 73:19, 76:5, 83:10, 83:19, 103:20, 107:20, 109:16, 146:24, 172:17 filled [1] - 82:13 filling [4] - 83:9, 98:23, 99:24, 102:5 final [3] - 124:18, 142:2. 173:4 findings [2] - 46:25, 52:7 fine [1] - 46:26 finish [1] - 65:16 finished [1] - 171:25 **FINN** [1] - 3:5 FINTAN [1] - 2:21 first [28] - 6:15, 6:27, 7:9, 23:16, 26:4, 45:4, 54:14, 54:23, 57:19, 62:3, 78:12, 81:2, 93:8, 94:27, 95:18, 95:20, 97:26, 108:14, 109:22, 111:13, 114:2, 114:10, 119:4, 128:23, 129:8, 131:24, 134:12, 134:16 fit [16] - 24:16, 28:27, 29:29, 31:20, 31:25, 34:19, 35:25, 45:12, 114:25, 126:20, 138:24, 142:18, 157:18, 157:19, 157:21, 165:3 FITZWILLIAM [1] five [2] - 12:12, 158:27 **fled** [1] - 112:26 **FLYNN** [1] - 3:19 focus [1] - 162:16 focusing [1] - 52:29 follow [9] - 29:14, 80:4, 87:24, 95:21, 138:26, 138:27, 138:29, 151:7, 163:12 followed [2] - 67:16, FOLLOWING [1] **following** [11] - 1:25, 25:18, 25:20, 31:14, 72:6, 88:6, 88:15, 106:18, 112:1, 126:3,

167:23

follows [1] - 61:5

108:10, 108:12

FOLLOWS [3] - 6:1, 6:5. 97:1 follows.. [1] - 8:24 **food** [1] - 62:27 foolish [1] - 94:8 footage [23] - 75:2, 81:23, 82:21, 87:4, 87:12, 87:15, 93:13, 93:15, 93:22, 94:5, 94:12, 94:13, 94:17, 94:27, 95:2, 95:5, 95:9, 96:13, 96:15, 108:17, 113:1 football [1] - 120:5 **FOR** [9] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 3:30, 4:1 force [2] - 9:27, 32:3 forceful [1] - 68:23 forehead [2] -119:21. 134:2 forget [2] - 120:8, 123:2 forgotten [3] - 27:10, 32:27, 37:12 form [18] - 11:1, 33:10, 35:14, 36:19, 45:24, 61:11, 68:14, 76:12, 86:26, 89:6, 98:16, 124:6, 133:11, 133:12, 136:2, 141:11, 165:10, 169:22 **formal** [4] - 37:22, 72:7, 79:21, 79:24 formally [1] - 79:26 formed [2] - 80:1, 138:2 **FORMER** [2] - 1:13, forms [3] - 45:20. 74:21, 151:25 formulator [1] -52:13 **forth** [1] - 94:11 forthcoming [1] -166.4 fortnight [1] - 129:16 forward [9] - 13:12, 34:4, 66:24, 80:29, 90:7, 123:24, 141:25, 155:12, 155:27 forwarded [9] -29:21, 81:23, 91:4, 91:7, 91:21, 91:24, 110:9, 135:8, 149:12

31:28, 34:29, 36:4, 39:7, 50:28, 107:28, 119:29, 122:17, 139:28, 146:23, 164:5, 165:11, 166:27 Fox [4] - 90:22, 90:23, 91:8, 91:21 frank [1] - 27:5 FREEMAN [1] - 2:22 frequent [4] - 31:17, 40:20, 104:23, 105:8 fresh [1] - 163:27 Friday [5] - 24:16, 28:28, 31:24, 32:25 Friend [1] - 14:25 front [6] - 15:24, 19:11, 38:23, 41:24, 146:13, 146:15 fruition [1] - 73:27 fruitless [1] - 144:10 frustrate [1] - 127:15 frustrated [2] -126:20, 128:2 frustrating [2] -126:23, 141:4 frustratingly [1] -126:26 frustration [2] -126:28, 127:2 full [14] - 33:25, 35:12, 42:7, 47:24, 111:2, 130:14, 140:11, 143:5, 153:27, 155:1, 155:6, 155:9, 156:4, 157:26 full-time [1] - 42:7 fully [3] - 36:25, 47:25, 108:19 function [2] - 64:19, 117:26 **functions** [1] - 35:2 furnished [1] - 129:8

G

gained [1] - 140:1

gambit [1] - 47:29 garage [2] - 94:8, 106:23 Garda [361] - 6:14, 6:27, 7:24, 8:15, 9:4, 10:13, 10:17, 11:5, 11:15, 11:16, 12:3, 12:9, 12:11, 12:14, 13:3, 13:15, 13:27, 14:7, 14:8, 14:13, 14:22, 15:7, 15:11, 19:3, 19:6, 19:17, 20:16, 20:25, 21:21,

21:25, 22:19, 23:11, 23:13, 23:21, 23:26, 25:3, 25:8, 25:21, 25:26, 26:1, 26:7, 26:27, 27:5, 27:18, 27:22, 28:25, 28:27, 30:6, 30:24, 31:12, 31:16, 33:7, 33:10, 33:22, 34:4, 34:8, 34:24, 35:5, 35:11, 35:16, 35:20, 35:24, 36:4, 36:11, 39:12, 39:14, 39:24, 40:2, 40:10, 40:17, 41:11, 41:18, 41:26, 42:4, 42:5, 42:17, 42:21, 42:25, 43:2, 43:7, 43:10, 43:13, 43:21, 45:20, 45:22, 45:23, 45:25, 46:4, 46:8, 46:27, 47:27, 48:8, 48:11, 48:12, 48:13, 48:16, 48:20, 49:24, 50:4, 50:25, 53:15, 53:27. 54:7. 54:13. 54:15, 54:16, 58:1, 63:4, 63:21, 64:8, 64:15, 64:21, 64:26, 65:4, 65:7, 65:23, 65:26, 67:6, 68:3, 68:9, 68:16, 69:11, 69:18, 69:28, 70:7, 70:21, 70:26, 71:1. 71:8, 71:14, 71:18, 71:26, 72:6, 72:14, 72:16, 72:19, 72:22, 72:27, 73:9, 73:19, 74:14, 75:23, 75:25, 76:15, 78:9, 78:13, 78:20, 78:27, 79:6, 79:18, 79:29, 80:6, 82:14, 82:16, 83:22, 84:1, 84:2, 84:8, 84:10, 84:13, 84:28, 85:12, 85:17, 85:19, 85:21, 85:23, 85:25, 86:3, 86:5, 86:7, 86:15, 86:25, 87:5, 87:11, 87:15, 87:25, 88:13, 88:21, 89:2, 89:4, 89:6, 90:9, 90:12, 90:22, 90:23, 91:7, 91:8, 91:15, 91:16, 91:20, 91:21, 91:22, 91:25, 92:19, 92:23, 93:1, 93:4, 93:15, 93:22, 93:25, 93:28. 94:13. 94:18. 94:21, 94:27, 95:4, 95:13, 95:24, 95:26, 96:1, 96:13, 96:14,

foundation [1] -

four [17] - 26:28,

28:11, 28:18, 31:26,

	I			I
97:8, 97:16, 98:11,	168:27, 168:29,	GPS [1] - 132:17	handle [1] - 7:8	hide [1] - 127:16
98:12, 100:11,	169:2, 169:5, 169:16,	grace [5] - 8:28,	handled [2] - 141:14,	hiding [3] - 41:12,
101:14, 101:18,	169:28, 170:7,	11:11, 12:11, 19:8,	144:25	127:17, 144:14
102:22, 102:24,	170:12, 171:3,	19:18	hands [6] - 23:17,	hierarchy [1] - 169:6
104:20, 104:27,	171:11, 171:22,	GRALTON [1] - 3:14	43:3, 162:5, 162:15,	highlight [2] - 97:14,
105:10, 105:20,	172:8, 173:5	grant [1] - 153:27	170:4, 172:21	161:8
106:5, 107:6, 107:10,	GARDA [9] - 2:10,	granted [2] - 150:3,	handwriting [2] -	highlighted [1] -
107:19, 107:24,	2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2,	152:2	55:9, 76:4	13:29
107:28, 108:3,	3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21	granting [2] -	handwritten [3] -	himself [6] - 41:28,
108:21, 109:1,	garda [9] - 13:5,	149:27, 155:13	90:8, 90:9, 109:24	67:10, 70:27, 79:19,
109:16, 109:23,	17:10, 17:19, 17:24,	great [3] - 146:14,	haphazard [1] -	80:6, 156:14
110:5, 111:2, 111:22,	65:1, 98:13, 136:20,	163:2, 165:18	166:11	history [3] - 38:27,
114:10, 114:12,	150:3, 171:21	GREENE [1] - 2:27	happy [4] - 30:3,	171:19, 171:23
115:14, 115:28,	gardaí [1] - 91:27	grievance [1] -	34:9, 104:22, 136:26	hit [3] - 119:21,
117:3, 119:5, 119:7,	Gardaí [6] - 93:17,	105:18	HARAN[1] - 4:2	119:25, 121:19
119:10, 120:18, 121:1, 121:10,	99:27, 110:5, 123:18,	GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26	Haran [5] - 42:19,	hitched [1] - 82:22
121:12, 121:10,	135:16, 136:1	ground [3] - 112:27,	78:29, 170:19,	hold [5] - 32:12,
122:11, 122:14,	gather [2] - 61:28,	119:22, 166:5	170:23, 170:25	32:13, 80:26, 162:14,
122:25, 123:1,	63:8	group [1] - 110:21	harassed [1] -	163:3
123:15, 123:18,	gathered [2] - 65:10, 66:11	GSOC [20] - 147:22,	146:26	holding [1] - 146:19
124:2, 124:17,	gathering [1] - 71:10	147:26, 148:1, 148:7,	harassing [2] -	holidays [2] - 78:16,
124:22, 128:8,	general [8] - 6:18,	148:9, 148:15,	138:8, 138:10	78:17
128:12, 128:22,	8:6, 8:18, 11:17,	148:18, 148:19, 148:22, 148:25,	harassment [1] - 136:3	holistic [1] - 103:2 home [8] - 110:5,
129:5, 129:18,	11:23, 17:28, 61:17,	149:9, 152:4, 152:8,	hard [1] - 87:7	112:15, 119:17,
130:29, 131:9,	106:9	153:22, 154:25,	hardly [1] - 170:5	123:11, 129:2,
131:10, 133:1,	generally [1] - 54:5	154:27, 156:2,	harvested [1] - 89:18	135:24, 136:15,
133:15, 133:21,	generated [2] -	156:12, 157:3, 157:13	HEAD [1] - 3:15	143:22
134:1, 134:10,	96:15, 109:18	Gtube [3] - 81:24,	head [7] - 17:11,	honest [2] - 71:28,
134:29, 135:8, 136:9,	gentle [1] - 79:9	91:4, 91:25	34:26, 35:3, 123:8,	127:21
136:23, 136:25,	gentleman [1] - 71:2	guard [8] - 13:6,	124:5, 137:28, 173:19	honestly [1] - 53:5
137:9, 137:13,	genuine [4] - 51:28,	13:25, 19:24, 20:14,	headed [3] - 28:23,	honourable [4] -
137:16, 137:19,	54:9, 84:18, 84:20	21:11, 21:19, 160:5,	132:1, 155:19	103:18, 136:27,
137:20, 137:21,	genuinely [1] - 51:27	160:7	health [7] - 34:2,	138:13, 139:25
138:1, 138:22,	GERAGHTY[1] -	guards [2] - 7:27,	34:13, 34:17, 35:19,	hoodies [2] - 98:5,
138:28, 139:3, 139:4, 140:10, 140:20,	2:17	167:6	35:22, 42:26, 43:1	99:29
142:19, 142:23,	GERARD [1] - 2:11	Guards [1] - 120:6	Health [2] - 31:15,	hope [2] - 79:13,
142:29, 143:5,	GERRY [1] - 3:11	guidance [3] - 71:25,	33:22	140:6
143:13, 144:11,	GISE [2] - 58:25,	102:26, 109:18	hear [1] - 97:22	hoped [2] - 76:15,
144:17, 145:5,	58:27	guide [2] - 101:14	heard [3] - 6:19,	132:28
145:16, 147:5, 147:9,	given [19] - 11:11,	guiding [1] - 102:8	11:20, 97:18	hoping [2] - 137:1,
147:17, 148:11,	12:8, 20:28, 21:2,	guilty [1] - 11:10	hearing [2] - 13:12,	165:1
149:4, 149:6, 149:15,	21:10, 21:17, 21:18,	Gwen [1] - 1:24	88:12	HORAN [1] - 3:25
149:23, 151:29,	21:19, 29:7, 34:8,	GWEN [1] - 1:29	HEARING [3] - 6:1,	hospital [1] - 123:12
152:26, 154:15,	46:5, 68:7, 72:7, 109:19, 114:10,	- 11	97:1, 174:4	hours [5] - 51:13,
155:11, 156:1,	121:29, 148:1,	Н	heart [1] - 117:10	114:1, 144:19,
156:10, 156:19,	148:15, 148:25		heavy [1] - 173:24	153:28, 155:2
156:29, 157:2,	glad [1] - 87:23	habit [1] - 27:14	heinous [1] - 15:15	HOUSE [2] - 2:23, 3:27
157:12, 158:9,	glass [1] - 98:6	half [4] - 153:28,	held [4] - 20:23,	house [6] - 57:14,
158:26, 159:18,	GLEESON [1] - 4:4	155:9, 156:4, 157:25	33:22, 85:27, 119:22	57:23, 81:12, 99:8,
159:19, 159:22,	Glennon [1] - 98:12	halfway [1] - 155:5	HELD [1] - 1:17 hello [1] - 147:13	102:4
160:6, 160:22,	gloves [1] - 99:29	HALIDAY [1] - 2:23	help [11] - 6:21,	houses [1] - 57:7
160:28, 161:27, 162:8, 162:27,	goal [1] - 92:9	halt [1] - 173:16	16:17, 17:4, 26:3,	HQ [3] - 44:28,
163:19, 165:14,	GOODE [1] - 3:22	hand [7] - 52:15,	67:6, 124:17, 128:27,	65:23, 125:7
165:29, 166:9, 167:6,	goods [4] - 13:27,	57:16, 64:2, 72:2,	128:29, 142:28,	HRM [1] - 43:16
167:15, 167:21,	17:8, 19:2, 19:9	112:13, 168:11	145:10, 169:28	huge [1] - 169:14
167:24, 167:28,	governance [4] -	handbag [1] - 59:10	helpful [1] - 92:29	hugely [2] - 115:22,
168:2, 168:11,	35:1, 153:29, 158:4,	handed [2] - 53:19,	herd [2] - 18:27,	144:20
168:13, 168:20,	160:20	99:14	22:11	HUGHES [2] - 2:29,

2:30 140:26, 141:10, impacting [2] - 49:9, 36:6, 43:22 110:29, 111:28, human [2] - 42:29, 161:11 incoming [1] - 33:4 114:8, 115:5, 117:12, 141:21, 143:15, 126:16 impacts [1] - 32:14 incorrect [2] - 37:8, 117:13, 118:6, 143:17, 143:18, 118:13, 124:3, 124:7, 168:3, 172:19 **Human** [2] - 33:23, **implies** [1] - 53:6 83:14 169:20 incumbent [1] - 71:9 124:17, 125:19, injuries [6] - 110:9, **imply** [2] - 51:9, 117:13, 122:22, **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15 128.2 indeed [8] - 69:28, 126:8, 126:17, 127:12, 128:24, 123:11, 134:3, 143:7 hunch [1] - 94:1 import [1] - 37:28 71:8, 71:26, 95:28, 129:6, 129:9, 130:5, injury [2] - 124:6, hundred [1] - 11:22 103:19, 133:10, importance [1] -130:6, 130:15, 133:29 hundreds [2] - 66:1, 72:8 141:24, 171:20 130:22, 132:28, innocence [1] - 7:20 75.7 independent [1] important [9] -40:14 133:15, 133:27, innocent [1] - 93:24 hypercritical [1] -22:16, 27:16, 28:11, 137:1, 138:6, 139:14. 54:18 40:13, 45:27, 110:23, independently [1] inputers [1] - 58:14 139:17, 139:26, 125:23, 160:15, 47:27 inquiries [1] - 58:13 140:7, 140:9, 140:12, 160:26 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 INQUIRY [2] - 1:2, 142:27, 143:29, impression [3] indicate [8] - 14:13, 144:11, 144:15, 46:5, 46:19, 46:22 14:21. 33:6. 36:23. inquiry [2] - 73:27, i.e [1] - 12:4 144:21, 144:22, impropriety [2] -46:10, 48:5, 102:25, 162.2 IA12 [1] - 47:4 144:23, 145:1, 15:25, 127:23 129:11 insisted [1] - 138:26 ice [1] - 146:29 148:14, 153:21, improving [1] indicated [14] insofar [4] - 11:7, **ID** [3] - 58:18, 82:8, 153:24, 153:25, 103:8 13:27, 13:29, 14:8, 39:19, 112:3, 129:4 109:25 156:10, 157:14 IN [1] - 1:17 27:27, 32:25, 33:9, inspected [1] - 20:16 idea [5] - 18:1, 24:2, informed [11] inability [1] - 163:19 33:14, 37:10, 38:12, inspection [2] - 9:9, 126:1, 141:25, 147:1 19:26, 20:7, 21:26, 47:16, 99:15, 131:3, inappropriate [4] -9:14 ideal [1] - 60:21 22:2, 27:22, 123:1, 136:25, 145:3 63:23, 70:26, 85:16, INSPECTOR [7] -123:15, 123:18. ideally [1] - 110:16 indicates [5] - 38:6, 85:24 3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, identification [3] -135:28, 136:19, 170:7 46:6, 65:8, 71:11, inbox [1] - 25:14 3:18, 3:22, 4:2 69:15, 92:15, 92:17 informs [1] - 94:14 incident [45] - 54:25, 104:20 inspector [1] - 10:9 identified [11] - 17:7, initial [6] - 12:26, 57:5, 57:10, 57:12, indicating [10] -Inspector [13] -59:24, 61:7, 72:12, 13:24, 39:28, 98:11, 10:11. 33:3. 35:10. 58:5, 58:18, 59:7, 95:22, 113:23, 132:12, 148:27 87:24, 87:25, 89:13, 41:12, 67:24, 88:5, 59:21, 59:27, 64:11, 113:28, 114:26, 94:22, 101:18, initiated [1] - 64:7 114:18, 131:4, 154:2, 86:17, 87:17, 88:2, 116:18, 117:3, 117:4, 121:27, 166:9 initiative [1] - 93:4 89:16, 97:28, 102:15, 157:21 119:7, 119:10, identify [10] - 15:23, injured [80] - 14:2, indication [7] -108:28, 109:6, 110:8, 120:19, 121:6, 142:2, 16:1, 16:10, 16:29, 17:11, 21:28, 49:4, 65:25, 67:18, 73:11, 111:7, 111:11, 113:4, 167:11 89:13, 132:21, 133:8, 49:8, 54:24, 54:27, 132:11, 160:16, 113:6, 122:1, 122:19, inspectors [9] - 6:25, 135:19, 136:13, 166:6 55:21, 55:26, 56:9, 160:17, 167:3 123:2, 123:13, 124:9, 7:7, 9:14, 9:17, 11:21, 56:25, 56:27, 57:22, identity [1] - 164:9 124:14, 130:14, indoor [13] - 80:1, 41:25, 73:16, 73:26, if's [1] - 63:20 57:28, 58:7, 61:10, 108:9, 108:11, 158:9, 131:21, 135:15, 78:17 61:16, 66:16, 66:22, ignore [4] - 28:13, 135:23, 135:27, 158:13, 158:19, instance [10] - 81:2, 69:2, 69:3, 70:5, 71:1, 33:26, 77:26, 156:25 161:18, 164:17, 136:15, 140:6, 93:9, 94:28, 95:18, 72:16, 72:21, 74:20, ignoring [3] - 36:23, 167:15, 169:3, 170:8, 142:11, 143:16, 95:20, 97:26, 109:22, 76:6, 76:13, 77:17, 46:11, 156:27 143:23, 145:22, 171:4, 172:21 111:13, 114:10, 168:2 illness [1] - 40:23 146:6, 166:7, 171:12, 77:21, 81:11, 82:4, indoors [4] - 165:5, instead [2] - 17:14, 86:26. 93:11. 106:1. imagine [2] - 45:4, 172:14, 172:23 165:7, 169:9, 173:6 113:11 108:15, 108:21, 170:20 indulgence [1] - 39:4 incidents [16] -INSTRUCTED [7] -109:10, 110:2, 110:8, immediate [6] - 9:10, 59:12, 90:24, 110:27, inextricable [1] -2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 112:15, 112:18, 9:14, 110:10, 110:21, 131:16, 138:25, 137:20 3:26, 3:30, 4:5 117:4, 117:6, 119:6, 158:19, 171:3 144:25, 145:7, influenced [1] - 54:8 instruction [1] -119:8, 120:22, immediately [10] -146:23, 163:11, info [1] - 56:19 150.9 120:24, 121:9, 14:6, 32:2, 110:22, 163:14, 163:16, inform [4] - 8:5, 76:6, instructions [2] -122:12, 122:17, 114:29, 115:1, 164:2, 164:5, 165:11, 106:1, 171:9 68:12, 139:20 122:27. 123:3. 115:11, 115:22, 165:14, 166:18 informal [1] - 79:20 INSTRUMENT[1] -123:15, 126:3, 127:3, 116:5, 144:25, 168:27 include [1] - 139:19 information [69] -127:13, 128:10, Immigration [1] include/exclude [1] -6:21, 7:18, 7:22, 9:3, insubordination [3] 129:1, 129:4, 132:19, 160:10 72:11 29:22, 55:26, 61:24, - 50:17, 138:15, 133:7, 135:17, immigration [3] included [4] - 65:7, 62:10, 62:16, 63:1, 138:21 135:18, 135:24, 160:11, 160:13, 88:25, 107:7, 132:29 63:6, 63:19, 65:9, insurance [3] - 8:12, 135:27, 136:10, 160:18 including [1] -67:16, 69:9, 69:21, 11:10, 12:13 136:12, 136:18, impact [2] - 139:1, 150:20 70:6, 70:21, 71:4, intel [1] - 172:11 139:19, 140:16, 142:24 inclusive [3] - 31:27, 80:19, 88:7, 110:28, intend [6] - 12:24,

33:18, 46:15, 46:22, 19:26, 32:14, 47:14, introduction [1] itemised [1] - 8:15 55:24, 74:14, 90:9, 163:5, 165:12 100:12 71:4, 71:6, 76:9, items [2] - 59:9, 97:27 intended [3] - 33:14, 89:13, 97:9, 102:3, **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:5 intrusion [1] - 156:1 164:8 102:25, 103:12, 129:21, 132:5 **KEANE** [1] - 4:3 investigate [5] itself [6] - 77:12, intention [4] -43:12, 103:13, 109:4, 145:21, keep [2] - 150:27, 113:11, 142:20, 139:25, 160:4, 146:28, 152:10, 126:15, 127:25, 160:27, 166:17, 158:4 162:22, 164:21, 160:22, 171:18 140:24 169:19 keeping [2] - 95:11, 165:15 intentions [4] investigated [11] -157:28 involvement [5] -103:18, 127:15, J **KELLY** [3] - 2:10, 47:26, 93:1, 93:8, 136:27, 138:13 95:27, 96:1, 103:1, 13:21, 43:27, 45:15, 3:12, 14:25 interacted [2] -122:20, 123:3, 45:17, 128:22 **Kelly** [1] - 15:5 **JACK**[1] - 3:6 involving [2] - 9:24, 129:1, 129:2 123:17, 123:21, Keogh [221] - 6:14, **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 77:17 interacting [2] -123:27 6:27, 7:24, 8:15, January [4] - 19:23, Irish [1] - 112:19 investigating [14] -23:11, 165:29 10:17, 11:16, 12:3, 20:3, 21:29, 22:2 55:29, 56:22, 60:19, iron [1] - 133:29 interaction [1] -12:9, 12:14, 19:7, jeep [4] - 21:26, 22:3, 61:12, 61:22, 62:2, irrational [1] -23:13, 23:21, 23:26, 22:7, 22:12 interactions [5] -65:7, 68:19, 76:17, 106:21 24:14, 25:8, 25:21, job [2] - 64:16, 82:26, 89:15, 98:12, irrationally [1] -25:26, 26:1, 26:7, 42:4, 78:27, 127:20, 158:15 98:25, 103:11 156:18, 167:23 106:12 26:27, 27:6, 28:25, jobs [1] - 165:6 interest [2] - 153:11, investigation [42] irrelevant [1] - 76:19 28:27, 30:6, 30:24, **JOE** [1] - 3:14 23:1, 59:23, 59:25, 31:12, 33:7, 33:10, 156:12 irrespective [2] -John [1] - 122:14 interested [1] -60:1, 60:7, 63:7, 85:25, 109:19 34:4, 34:8, 35:5, **JOHN** [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 63:22, 67:22, 68:8, 35:16, 35:24, 36:4, 153:13 issue [65] - 6:26, 2:16, 3:8, 3:30 68:15, 69:2, 69:20, 36:11, 39:12, 39:24, 7:10, 10:16, 10:17, interests [4] -JUDGE [1] - 3:12 125:15, 127:10, 71:22, 72:8, 72:10, 10:18, 11:3, 11:26, 40:2, 40:17, 41:11, Judge [1] - 14:25 145:16, 145:18 73:3, 73:27, 75:28, 13:10, 13:20, 14:12, 41:18, 42:4, 42:5, judge [1] - 52:13 89:19, 90:1, 92:2, 42:17, 42:21, 42:25, interfere [1] - 100:7 14:20, 17:7, 18:3, July [69] - 19:17, 92:24, 93:29, 95:21, 43:2, 43:7, 43:13, 18:6, 22:18, 22:22, interfered [1] -102:9, 110:10, 24:7, 24:8, 24:9, 25:4, 43:21, 45:22, 45:23, 24:6, 30:8, 30:17, 118:14 110:13, 110:23, 36:29, 37:1, 39:15, 25:5, 25:6, 25:7, 25:8, 45:24, 46:8, 46:27, intermittent [1] -25:15, 25:27, 26:7, 123:19, 128:23, 39:24, 40:1, 42:14, 47:27, 48:12, 50:4, 157:20 26:11, 26:19, 26:25, 131:7, 131:12, 134:7, 50:25, 53:15, 53:27, 44:26, 45:3, 50:27, internal [1] - 43:7 26:28, 26:29, 27:9, 54:7, 54:13, 54:15, 137:15, 139:13, 52:20, 53:15, 53:27, international [2] -28:23, 28:28, 29:16, 140:2, 140:3, 144:18, 54:5, 54:11, 60:17, 58:1, 64:21, 67:6, 65:5. 65:6 148:20, 148:21, 29:25. 29:28. 30:1. 68:3 68:9 69:11 62:29, 64:22, 68:1, interpretation [1] -30:7, 31:9, 31:24, 157:15, 159:15 69:27, 71:7, 100:15, 69:18, 69:28, 70:7, 103:17 31:26, 31:27, 31:29, Investigation [2] -107:21, 107:23, 70:22, 70:27, 71:1, interrupt [2] - 77:6, 32:17, 32:20, 32:26, 65:21, 75:24 108:18, 113:26, 71:8, 71:14, 71:18, 117:15 36:5, 37:5, 37:22, investigation.. [1] -120:18, 126:14, 71:26, 72:6, 72:14, interrupting [2] -127:8, 142:5, 144:13, 38:5, 38:7, 38:8, 92.9 72:19, 72:27, 73:20, 18:16, 118:19 38:13, 38:14, 38:16, investigations [6] -144:24, 147:15, 75:23, 75:25, 76:15, intervention [2] -38:17, 38:18, 43:22, 54:13, 63:16, 64:9, 78:13, 78:20, 78:27, 158:8, 163:15, 95:17, 133:21 45:23, 45:26, 45:27, 71:13, 72:1, 96:19 163:25, 165:22, 79:18, 80:1, 80:6, interview [6] - 61:29, 46:6, 46:9, 51:5, 51:8, 82:14, 86:3, 86:5, 166:9, 166:22, 167:4, Investigations [1] -63:5, 65:7, 106:7, 51:10, 51:14, 53:3, 169:13. 171:6. 86:7, 86:25, 87:15, 68:13 121:11, 142:6 investigative [10] -171:25, 173:2, 173:11 54:16, 54:29, 59:1, 87:25, 88:13, 89:4, interviewed [1] -73:14, 159:29, 160:2, 90:10, 90:22, 91:7, 61:16, 61:27, 64:12, issued [7] - 10:1, 11.25 168:8 91:15, 91:16, 91:20, 64:19, 77:12, 115:11, 10:20, 10:21, 12:8, interviewing [2] -20:5, 110:26, 115:4 **jump** [1] - 102:1 91:22, 91:25, 92:19, 115:21, 132:11, 68:11, 72:9 issues [26] - 6:19, June [4] - 8:22, 92:23, 93:1, 93:4, 138:4, 144:26 Interviewing [1] -16:25, 19:7, 19:18 8:19, 22:17, 28:15, 93:26, 93:28, 94:18, Investigative [1] -65:24 justice [1] - 74:1 94:21, 95:4, 95:13, 40:22, 42:16, 42:22, intimidated [1] -JUSTICE [3] - 1:7. 95:24, 95:26, 96:1, 45:9, 49:17, 59:23, investigators [6] -123:4 60:15. 64:19. 67:7. 1:12, 2:2 97:8, 97:17, 98:11, 11:25, 20:23, 95:16, **INTO** [1] - 1:2 106:7. 142:7. 148:5 87:21, 88:15, 104:14, 100:11, 101:15, intoxicated [3] -102:22, 102:24, K invited [2] - 66:22, 107:19, 108:10, 110:4, 122:28, 168:21 104:20, 104:28, 138:11 127:12, 132:23, introduce [1] -105:10, 105:20, 134:6, 138:29, 158:6, inviting [2] - 65:1, 160:24 KANE [1] - 2:28 106:5, 107:6, 107:10, 161:22, 170:6, 172:8 65:18 introduced [2] -**KATE**[1] - 3:25 107:19, 107:24, issuing [1] - 10:21 involved [19] - 18:29, 72:3, 139:17 Kavanagh [4] -

107:28, 108:3, 108:21, 109:2, 109:17, 109:23, 110:5, 111:2, 111:22, 114:10, 115:14, 122:26, 124:17, 128:8, 128:12, 128:22, 129:18, 131:1, 131:10, 134:10, 134:29, 135:8, 136:9, 136:25, 137:16. 138:1. 138:22, 138:28, 140:10, 142:19, 144:12, 144:17, 145:5, 145:16, 147:5, 147:9, 149:3, 149:4, 149:6, 151:29, 152:26, 154:15, 155:11, 156:1, 156:10, 156:19, 156:29, 157:2, 127:5 157:12, 159:18, 159:22, 160:6, 160:23, 160:29, 161:27, 162:8, 162:28, 163:20, 165:14, 165:29, 74:3 166:10, 167:6, 167:15, 167:21, 103:17 167:24, 167:28, 168:2, 168:13, 168:20, 168:28, 168:29, 169:16, 119:17 169:28, 170:7, 170:12, 171:3, 172:8, 173:5 **KEOGH**[1] - 2:10 Keogh's [33] - 11:5, 19:3, 20:25, 22:20, 23:11, 25:3, 31:16, 35:12, 35:20, 39:14, 40:10, 41:27, 45:25, 46:4, 49:24, 54:16, 65:26, 74:14, 83:22, 115:28, 131:9, 137:9, 137:13, 140:20, 142:23, 143:1, 147:18, 149:15, 158.9 158.26 168:11, 169:2, 171:11 kept [2] - 74:2, 136:29 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 kicked [1] - 121:19 kicking [1] - 119:24 **KIERAN**[1] - 3:20 Kilbeggan [7] - 16:5, 16:13, 16:19, 19:16, 20:16, 21:25, 22:8

Kildare [1] - 91:28 Kilmartin's [9] -87:13, 87:16, 88:13, 90:16, 90:23, 93:5, 94:3, 94:18, 95:2 kind [4] - 34:5, 62:1, 102:11, 118:13 KIRWAN [1] - 3:13 knowing [1] - 71:2 knowledge [3] -111:2, 128:11, 157:14 known [4] - 58:25, 69:23, 142:26, 158:16 knows [1] - 15:5 knuckles [3] - 123:9, 124:5, 134:2

L

lack [2] - 106:1, lacking [1] - 121:23 lads [1] - 119:19 lady [3] - 145:23, 146:16, 146:28 laissez [2] - 68:8, language [1] last [9] - 14:7, 24:15, 52:3, 57:20, 58:3, 97:7, 97:18, 105:27, late [4] - 24:4, 31:19, 95:10, 145:21 latitude [1] - 112:9 latter [1] - 50:8 law [1] - 7:11 **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29 lead [4] - 69:22, 86:1, 87:24, 97:8 leads [1] - 75:28 learned [1] - 14:25 least [1] - 16:10 leave [72] - 14:9, 14:10, 17:12, 17:20, 24:17, 24:19, 25:6, 26:8, 27:7, 28:12, 28:25, 30:10, 31:25, 31:26, 32:16, 32:24, 33:1, 33:20, 36:4, 36:11, 37:1, 37:10, 38:8, 38:21, 39:7, 43:21, 44:5, 50:14, 64:4, 73:15, 73:16, 75:3, 96:23, 96:24, 103:23, 110:6, 114:18. 124:18. 130:21, 137:4,

147:16, 147:21, 149:6, 149:8, 149:11, 149:27, 150:2, 150:7, 150:13, 150:14, 150:18, 150:19, 151:4, 151:25, 151:29, 152:2, 152:6, 152:13, 152:27, 153:1, 153:7, 154:1, 154:2, 154:21, 155:1, 155:21, 155:24, 156:9, 157:2, 158:5, 172:10 leaving [1] - 18:9 led [3] - 95:18, 96:4, 109:3 left [14] - 6:22, 8:18, 18:11, 22:16, 43:2, 57:22, 102:9, 107:9, 112:13, 126:10, 140:5, 155:13, 155:19, 168:28 left-hand [1] - 112:13 leg [3] - 124:6, 133:28, 143:20 legally [1] - 74:19 legislation [2] - 9:27, 148:26 legitimate [1] - 96:16 **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13 lending [1] - 139:27 less [1] - 166:19 lessened [1] - 76:19 lesser [1] - 78:29 letter [34] - 12:26, 16:24, 28:22, 31:8, 35:29, 43:5, 43:16, 44:11, 45:4, 49:4, 52:2, 57:28, 72:28, 73:2, 75:18, 79:5, 86:2, 86:20, 101:20, 102:13, 115:26, 115:27, 116:2, 116:6, 116:8, 116:10, 117:29, 121:1, 121:5, 129:17, 132:22, 136:5, 138:14, 149:2 letters [3] - 12:24, 44:17, 73:5 level [1] - 102:2 liaison [1] - 89:15 **LIAM** [1] - 3:18 Licences [5] - 8:13, 9:9, 9:13, 11:11, 12:13 life [1] - 40:10 light [6] - 27:21, 88:6, 89:26, 96:11,

limited [2] - 165:6, 165:8 line [15] - 11:27, 55:10, 69:17, 103:10, 106:8, 120:5, 132:22, 142:13, 146:13, 146:15, 147:24, 148:3, 161:8, 167:12 lines [2] - 50:28, 153:4 link [4] - 66:2, 75:8, 75:26, 137:20 linking [1] - 66:9 list [4] - 8:10, 140:6, 164:9, 166:21 lists [1] - 163:17 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:28 live [4] - 13:22, 106:21, 106:25, 107:2 local [2] - 49:5, 126:19 location [3] - 87:4, 110:3, 112:11 location] [1] - 119:19 lodged [1] - 52:26 longitude [1] - 112:9 look [40] - 13:12, 40:14, 47:27, 49:24, 50:25, 50:28, 53:16, 57:2, 58:27, 65:26, 68:4, 77:7, 79:16, 81:2, 81:26, 86:20, 97:25, 98:16, 99:21, 106:8, 109:22, 111:29, 113:10, 114:14, 118:20, 119:13, 124:23, 126:24, 135:8, 140:24, 149:1, 149:23, 150:27, 155:16, 158:10, 160:15, 162:27, 162:28, 169:27 looked [8] - 117:17, 128:27, 128:28, 140:27, 153:23, 158:3, 159:11, 165:11 looking [22] - 17:4, 29:10, 45:4, 77:2, 78:15, 88:24, 116:3, 127:16, 139:14, 146:14, 148:8, 148:14, 153:9, 153:20, 153:25, 154:19, 154:24, 154:29, 156:4, 156:5, 156:6, 159:4

looks [2] - 126:20,

141:3

38:12, 71:6, 101:5

Lorraine [1] - 31:9 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 lost [5] - 115:18, 129:10, 130:26, 130:29, 144:2 low [1] - 71:11 lunch [3] - 96:24, 97:5, 97:6 LUNCH [1] - 97:2 LYONS [1] - 4:3

M

machine [2] - 144:26 Madden [9] - 13:3, 13:15, 13:27, 14:7, 14:8, 14:14, 14:22, 15:11, 21:21 Madden's [1] - 15:7 MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7 mail [9] - 24:11, 25:12, 25:14, 25:17, 25:25, 26:15, 32:22, 92:18. 115:15 MAIN [1] - 2:12 major [2] - 40:10, 40:19 males [5] - 98:5, 99:28, 112:17, 121:18, 133:19 malingerer [1] -40:18 malingering [1] -40:21 MALONE [1] - 1:29 Malone [1] - 1:24 man [1] - 128:23 manage [3] - 35:19, 35:22, 150:24 management [4] -58:22, 58:23, 58:24, 158:16 Management [1] -33.23 manager [1] - 147:24 manifest [3] - 24:5, 46:1, 166:17 manifested [1] -169:19 manner [9] - 9:12, 21:9, 21:13, 21:15, 64:17, 68:14, 106:28, 165:13, 171:24 manual [5] - 65:14, 65:21, 72:10, 134:13, 134:17 Manual [3] - 65:22, 68:13, 75:24 March[2] - 6:15,

118:14, 140:7

likely [4] - 38:6,

39:28 80:8, 80:28, 94:24, 156:11 32:5, 32:28, 32:29, met [13] - 6:14, MARGARET[1] -95:27, 96:2, 96:25, means [1] - 126:17 33:1, 33:14, 33:20, 46:27, 47:4, 53:16, 3:21 103:5, 110:13, meant [7] - 23:23, 33:24, 33:26, 36:13, 124:8, 137:16, 138:4, 36:15, 37:5, 37:23, MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17 111:14, 113:29, 24:23, 110:14, 152:26, 154:5, 161:27, 162:8, 114:11, 114:22, 142:12, 142:23, 38:4, 39:5, 47:4, 47:9, **MARK**[1] - 3:3 115:7, 121:14, 123:3, 47:15, 56:22, 60:18, 163:27, 166:27 marked [2] - 40:13, 160:11, 160:20 123:5, 123:16, meantime [4] -61:12, 61:22, 65:18, MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 40.14 123:20, 123:26, 76:8, 78:9, 89:15, MARRINAN [42] -35:23, 94:17, 118:21, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 123:29, 125:2, 91:22, 98:25, 103:11, Mick[1] - 23:3 139.9 2:7, 5:5, 6:5, 6:7, 131:15, 134:11, 103:21, 109:17, midday [1] - 26:1 15:14, 15:19, 16:20, measure [3] -16:22, 16:24, 18:21, 134:21, 135:29, 129:29, 153:29, 109:20, 110:12, middle [3] - 116:25, 114:19, 117:6, 136:24, 137:4, 19:5, 57:8, 57:10, 160:23 116:29, 118:28 139:10, 139:23, 120:21, 120:29, 57:12, 58:18, 58:20, measured [1] might [47] - 6:17, 140:2, 141:2, 144:29, 122:12, 133:1, 59:1, 75:14, 75:16, 139:26 6:21, 7:15, 7:16, 134:12, 134:16, 151:5, 151:9, 153:23, 75:18, 78:12, 92:13, medical [16] - 30:3, 22:18, 23:27, 26:3, 156:3, 156:14, 157:6, 137:19, 137:22, 96:20, 97:4, 97:23, 30:9, 30:19, 30:21, 27:15, 27:19, 28:19, 157:9, 158:21, 161:8, 139:4, 142:18, 104:12, 107:18, 30:25, 30:28, 34:6, 41:26, 42:17, 47:16, 159:13, 159:22, 116:10, 116:12, 165:23, 171:7 38:5, 38:11, 40:28, 63:19, 65:27, 67:18, matters [13] - 53:14, 160:16, 160:21, 119:3, 120:2, 128:7, 41:5, 41:7, 41:12, 73:12, 77:3, 77:17, 163:5, 167:29, 169:5, 54:19, 64:5, 72:4, 142:5, 143:21, 45:23, 143:17, 172:3 83:14, 97:5, 101:20, 82:29, 92:29, 100:13, 170:9. 171:6. 173:9 151:22, 152:21, MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 103:12, 104:2, 104:9, 106:10, 127:26, member's [7] - 9:25, 158:28, 159:2, medically [3] -107:8, 111:1, 111:3, 171:27, 171:29, 128:29, 134:9, 135:2, 32:16, 32:29, 34:17, 29:28, 29:29, 44:2 124:15. 124:17. 38:27, 82:26, 170:4 172:28, 173:3 143.28 125:28, 128:29, meet [11] - 19:25, MATTERS[1] - 1:4 members [36] - 6:12, Marrinan [13] -47:28, 121:13, 140:7, 140:16, MATTHIAS[1] - 2:10 7:10, 8:3, 8:7, 8:17, 16:17, 18:22, 75:13, 129:12, 147:11, 140:18, 140:19, Max [1] - 112:20 8:18, 8:22, 8:26, 9:4, 77:6, 96:25, 97:15, 141:11, 141:25, 148:7, 148:9, 148:18, 9:8, 9:24, 10:13, 11:3, 116:9, 117:25, McBrien [2] - 2:16, 145:18, 146:29, 149:9, 154:25, 154:27 12:11, 13:26, 36:13, 118:19, 119:1, meeting [50] - 23:2, 147:1, 156:24, 151:21, 158:26, McCOURT [1] - 2:17 55:27, 55:29, 56:20, 161:20, 167:7, 169:11 23:17, 23:18, 49:20, 63:4, 64:14, 66:26, 171:26 McDonnell [5] - 16:5, 50:7, 54:14, 59:19, mightn't [2] - 79:7, 68:16, 73:9, 73:19, 16:11, 16:12, 16:18, marrinan [1] - 18:19 80:6 59:22, 59:26, 59:28, 73:20, 74:4, 107:27, marry [2] - 153:3, 17:14 miles [1] - 107:2 74:23, 101:3, 101:4, 116:17. 147:27. 156:21 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 mind [18] - 34:10, 110:15, 111:20, 150:2, 164:24, Martin [2] - 42:2, McGRATH[2] - 2:7, 112:1, 113:7, 113:15, 35:18, 63:12, 76:12, 171:13, 171:20, 42:8 2.28 78:27, 80:9, 86:11, 113:23, 116:19, 171:22, 172:27 McGUINNESS [4] -118:15, 128:23, 103:26, 104:5, material [20] - 29:15, members" [1] -123:17, 140:13, 29:24, 36:1, 45:11, 2:6, 3:24, 97:16, 129:4, 130:3, 130:18, 172:26 51:3, 52:27, 61:1, 97:20 130:20, 130:23, 141:12, 141:17, members' [1] - 9:21 90:7, 91:12, 109:24, McKenzie [1] -130:24, 130:25, 141:22, 154:11, memory [1] - 173:20 163:27, 168:18, 132:8, 137:27, 111:4, 136:6, 137:7, 112:26 mention [13] - 28:6, 142:8, 142:29, 148:3, 138:16, 138:26, 173:25 MCLOUGHLIN [1] -149:5, 156:16, 161:6, 146:5, 146:27, 28:7, 39:9, 124:5, mindset [1] - 40:8 151:19. 152:29. 167:10 147:14, 148:15, minimised [1] -McLYNN [1] - 3:31 153:4, 154:8, 154:9, 148:24, 153:27, materials [11] - 15:9, MCMAHON[1] - 3:8 165.4 154:14, 154:17, 16:20, 47:2, 50:27, 154:9, 154:12, 155:4, MINISTER [1] - 1:7 Mcmeeting [1] -154:21, 173:20 156:12, 157:3, 161:6, 81:5, 98:17, 112:2, Minnock [4] - 92:18, 143.13 mentioned [13] -119:14, 121:7, 135:9, 163:6, 163:21, MCPARTLIN[1] -113:23, 167:11, 164:24, 169:19, 15:13, 15:14, 28:3, 158:10 168:25 39:25, 115:16, 172:29 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 **MATT**[1] - 3:19 mean [26] - 10:27, 138:15, 153:19, matter [71] - 13:29, meetings [5] - 23:13, minute [4] - 26:22, 21:10, 33:29, 34:14, 153:21, 159:23, 14:6, 14:21, 15:15, 23:19, 101:7, 101:8, 34:15, 34:28, 36:23, 45:21, 139:16, 145:21 159:29, 160:1, 15:20, 17:27, 18:5, 142.3 36:29, 39:27, 41:10, minutely [1] - 106:13 173:17, 173:21 Mell's [2] - 112:15, 19:15, 21:6, 28:10, 44:15, 50:16, 62:1, minutes [1] - 27:1 31:7, 31:22, 44:6. 143:15 merely [8] - 38:17, 70:20, 71:17, 77:13, misapprehension 53:19, 63:2, 65:2, 44:14, 45:1, 45:15, 80:26, 93:10, 105:10. **MEMBER** [1] - 2:2 [1] - 93:21 102:27, 107:7, 132:5, 49:6, 50:13, 50:26, 107:27, 127:29, member [66] - 7:16, misbehaving [1] -137:4 51:29, 52:20, 59:19, 129:8, 141:6, 142:22, 7:17, 8:5, 12:2, 18:23, 167.7 message [3] - 23:21, 63:26, 66:27, 69:16, 26:29, 27:19, 29:5, 165:11, 165:24 miss [1] - 37:28 25:20, 25:24 72:12, 72:14, 72:20, meaningful [1] -31:14, 31:24, 31:28, missed [4] - 25:22,

67:28, 114:3, 114:6 mistake [13] - 26:14, 29:19, 32:21, 46:2, 46:3, 53:5, 54:1, 54:6, 54:7, 54:8, 93:24, 151:28, 159:1 mistaken [1] - 96:14 mistakenly [1] -96.12 misunderstanding [1] - 88:9 misunderstandings [1] - 108:29 mixed [1] - 41:22 model [1] - 65:8 Model [1] - 65:24 moment [7] - 10:27, 15:26, 16:23, 17:6, 17:27, 18:18, 57:6 Monaghan [38] -29:18, 65:29, 72:13, 72:19, 75:19, 82:11, 86:2, 86:21, 88:20, 89:2, 89:29, 90:5, 91:12, 94:14, 95:11, 95:22, 95:28, 98:13, 99:2, 104:13, 136:6, 136:23, 143:4, 146:17, 147:24, 149:5, 149:19, 149:21, 149:22, 151:22, 155:7, 159:4, 163:17, 163:28, 165:17, 166:20, 170:20, 170:21 Monaghan's [1] -164:9 Monday [6] - 24:19, 25:7, 130:26, 142:16, 149:11, 163:28 money [3] - 44:13, 133:25, 158:7 MONICA [1] - 3:15 monitor [2] - 60:3, 64:8 monitored [1] -166:21 monitoring [3] -73:23, 96:17, 158:5 monopoly [1] - 54:8 months [3] - 20:4, 72:12, 144:9 morning [15] - 6:7, 6:8, 59:21, 101:3, 108:21, 110:15, 114:1, 115:2, 129:18, 130:26, 131:1, 132:6, 132:8, 143:18, 144:19 MORONEY [1] - 3:18 Morrissey[1] - 12:28

MORRISSEY [1] -3:26 most [7] - 10:12, 15:15, 38:6, 38:12, 73:17, 158:15, 169:8 mostly [1] - 147:10 mother [3] - 123:10, 135:25, 136:16 motive [2] - 51:25, 51:27 motor [1] - 91:2 move [14] - 21:20, 22:22, 24:6, 43:4, 80:27, 96:21, 96:25, 109:13. 121:4. 144:16, 147:15, 157:9, 158:8, 163:19 moved [1] - 159:15 moving [4] - 57:24, 82:21, 107:15, 160:4 Moylan [31] - 14:4, 14:8, 14:21, 15:20, 17:13, 17:19, 19:14, 21:25, 21:26, 22:2, 22:8, 24:9, 24:11, 24:28, 26:27, 28:4, 32:22, 33:7, 36:12, 36:18, 36:24, 42:12, 42:14, 46:7, 51:10, 51:12, 53:8, 53:9, 55:3, 60:24, 79:16 Moylan's [3] - 37:13, 46:11, 55:9 **MR** [72] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:8, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 3:30, 3:30, 4:3, 5:5, 6:5, 6:7, 14:25, 15:14, 15:19, 16:20, 16:22, 16:24, 18:21, 19:5, 57:8, 57:10, 57:12, 58:18, 58:20, 59:1, 75:14, 75:16, 75:18, 78:12, 92:13, 96:20, 97:4, 97:16, 97:20, 97:23, 104:12, 107:18. 116:10. 116:12, 119:3, 120:2, 128:7, 142:5, 143:21, 151:11, 151:14, 151:22, 152:21, 158:28, 159:2, 171:27, 171:29, 172:28, 173:3

MS[11] - 2:7, 2:11,

2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25,

3:26, 3:26, 3:30, 4:4,

4:4 mugged [1] - 112:16 Mulcahy [9] - 22:24, 22:26, 23:10, 23:21, 23:24, 42:6, 48:8, 48:14, 79:2 MULCAHY [1] - 3:5 MULLIGAN [2] -2:11, 3:13 Mulligan's [12] -83:9, 96:22, 97:24, 98:23, 99:24, 100:20, 101:23, 102:17, 105:25, 106:19, 106:23, 109:6 Mullingar [4] - 47:5, 50:1, 91:25, 152:29 MURPHY [2] - 2:30, Murray [36] - 16:25, 23:4, 25:12, 43:12, 44:7, 45:18, 45:19, 47:26, 50:1, 51:3, 51:4, 51:8, 51:11, 52:6, 52:9, 52:21, 53:4, 53:9, 53:11, 74:19, 106:13, 106:17, 106:29, 136:2, 143:24, 147:25, 148:8, 148:13, 148:24, 152:29, 155:23, 158:18, 159:4, 167:14, 167:24, 168:10 **MURRAY**[4] - 3:3, 3:9, 5:3, 6:4 Murray's [2] - 51:14, 53:2 must [4] - 32:2, 61:15, 69:27, 71:7 mustn't [1] - 151:22 mysteriously [1] -140:26 MÍCHEÁL [3] - 3:23, 151:11, 151:14

N

N6 [1] - 87:16 name [7] - 56:1, 70:15, 70:16, 90:27, 107:14, 159:29, 162:25 named [6] - 1:26, 31:14, 43:21, 71:8, 75:5, 100:22 namely [4] - 122:17, 147:21, 148:17, 156:7

names [1] - 58:7 narrative [7] - 57:18, 57:19, 81:8, 98:3, 112:11, 113:18, 127:4 National [1] - 160:9 nature [11] - 18:1, 32:14, 47:21, 63:11, 73:7, 111:6, 118:21, 146:6, 148:1, 153:5, 166:11 Navan [1] - 43:18 **NCT**[2] - 8:12, 12:13 near [1] - 119:18 nearby [1] - 94:9 nearly [2] - 144:8, 171.25 necessary [2] - 8:23, neck [1] - 141:6 need [10] - 20:15, 59:14. 63:10. 68:10. 89:9, 110:17, 110:19, 169:27, 173:18, 174:1 needed [11] - 14:10, 34:5, 35:5, 40:23, 74:12, 86:1, 109:18, 109:19, 144:11, 148:16, 158:4 needn't [1] - 153:21 needs [3] - 72:13, 169:28, 169:29 negating [1] - 20:15 negative [4] - 11:15, 112:18, 146:25, 155:15 neglect [2] - 45:9, 45:11 neutral [1] - 127:23 never [13] - 31:4, 39:25, 46:1, 46:13, 48:13, 63:29, 64:2, 131:10, 154:15, 159:11, 166:27, 167:3 nevertheless [2] -39:22. 52:2 **new** [22] - 17:13, 22:7, 64:7, 72:2, 78:14, 78:25, 89:25, 117:13, 118:13, 124:2, 124:7, 125:18, 126:8, 127:12, 133:15, 133:27, 139:17, 140:7, 140:9, 141:24, 143:29, 144:1 next [11] - 16:26, 55:10, 55:23, 82:13,

98:14, 110:21,

112:22, 121:4,

132:22, 140:24, 153:1

Nicholas [4] - 12:9,

12:14, 36:4, 86:7 NICHOLAS [2] -2:10, 4:2 Nick [4] - 24:14, 26:7, 28:27, 149:6 night [20] - 24:16, 24:19, 31:19, 67:2, 86:17, 119:17, 120:6, 128:24, 129:8, 130:10, 130:12, 137:2, 139:10, 144:23, 146:11, 152:26, 153:20, 154:17, 154:22 nighttime [2] - 87:6, 147:10 nine [2] - 57:13, 161:7 nobody [3] - 99:15, 129:7, 145:2 **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 nominate [2] - 56:10, 69:4 nominated [21] -13:5, 55:3, 56:28, 69:23, 69:28, 70:4, 70:7, 70:15, 70:19, 70:22. 70:27. 70:29. 71:1, 71:8, 75:6, 75:25, 102:18, 104:21, 105:11, 109:7, 109:9 nominating [5] -101:13, 105:17, 106:29, 107:1, 107:7 nomination [1] -101.6 non [4] - 93:22, 141:3, 141:7, 141:17 non-crime [3] -141:3, 141:7, 141:17 non-Garda [1] -93.22 none [3] - 115:17, 119:20, 132:23 nonetheless [1] -125.4 noon [1] - 26:29 **NOREEN** [1] - 2:16 normal [8] - 9:4, 11:2, 50:21, 60:9, 60:11, 60:27, 115:10, 168.5 normally [5] - 67:5, 79:22, 79:24, 156:29, 169.8 **NORTHUMBERLAN D**[1] - 2:18 note [28] - 26:3, 26:4, 26:15, 26:22, 27:3,

48:22, 49:24, 50:7, **NÍ**[1] - 2:30 76:3, 76:5, 84:2, 84:3, **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7 101:1, 112:29, 119:26, 137:9, 0 137:13, 137:17, 143:6, 149:14, 80.16 **O'BRIEN** [1] - 2:10 152:21, 156:15, o'clock [3] - 57:13, 156:16, 161:25, 161:7. 173:25 162:4, 163:26, 168:26 O'CONNOR [1] notebook [2] -134:12, 134:14 O'Higgins [1] **noted** [6] - 12:20, 151:13 59:1, 83:21, 92:5, O'HIGGINS [3] -92:7, 156:18 3:23, 151:11, 151:14 notes [12] - 1:26, 167:19 O'MARA[1] - 2:17 15:17, 26:8, 26:10, O'NEILL [1] - 3:30 40:5, 48:17, 50:8, **O'Neill** [1] - 67:7 101:8, 101:10, O'REARDON[1] -163:21, 172:1, 172:2 3:17 nothing [20] - 11:19, O'ROURKE [1] - 4:4 24:4, 27:21, 27:22, O'SULLIVAN [1] -52:19, 59:27, 59:29, 86:4, 102:7, 119:9, 126:24, 132:5, 136:2, O'Sullivan [1] -148.12 140:1, 141:29, object [1] - 100:1 142:28, 144:14, 156:28, 171:18 objective [2] - 61:27, notice [11] - 12:9, 3:15 18:6, 21:2, 21:4, objectively [1] - 32:4 21:10, 21:17, 21:18, objectives [2] -21:19, 52:23, 166:22, 137:15, 138:3 166:25 obligation [15] noticed [5] - 48:28, 20:8, 50:23, 64:14, 162:5, 162:12, 111:13, 115:13, 168:11, 169:26 117:28, 129:24, noticing [1] - 169:26 130:1, 130:7, 130:16, notified [1] - 46:25 134:25, 135:1, notwithstanding [1] 137:18, 138:9, 150:14 - 17:19 obligations [8] -7:29, 47:17, 64:8, November [9] -37:18 19:19, 21:24, 97:10, 64:10, 137:23, 108:6, 108:7, 158:21, 156:21, 156:23 170:9, 171:7, 173:12 obliged [2] - 13:2, **NUGENT**[2] - 3:14, 143.23 3.21 observe [1] - 42:16 observed [1] - 78:19 number [26] - 16:7, 17:1, 18:27, 22:11, obtain [1] - 136:18 46:25, 46:26, 54:11, obtained [2] - 87:13, 55:23, 63:15, 73:10, 87:15 81:4, 82:27, 99:10, obviously [7] -104:18, 109:25, 28:16, 40:29, 41:20, 3:14 110:4, 112:25, 70:6, 80:19, 142:7, 120:16, 125:8, 126:26, 140:28, occasion [4] - 10:19, 142:25, 147:7, 40:12, 41:23, 152:18 147:15, 154:20, occasions [2] -158:25 64:23, 74:8 numbers [1] - 62:2 occupation [2] nurse [1] - 123:11 18:29 **NYLAND**[1] - 3:19 occupational [5] -3:30

34:2, 34:12, 34:17, 42:25, 43:1 Occupational [2] -31:15, 33:22 occur [2] - 34:7, occurred [21] - 44:8, 60:27, 61:25, 66:6, 67:1. 76:26. 81:6. 82:16, 89:15, 97:4, 101:7, 112:5, 112:8, 114:8, 117:11, 119:9, 125:27, 129:11, 130:14, 135:23, occurred.. [1] - 84:8 occurrence [2] -81:5, 81:21 occurring [1] - 156:7 October [14] - 46:23, 53:17, 75:19, 76:3, 137:11, 143:2, 144:8, 158:18, 161:4, 161:19, 170:14, 171:1, 172:21, 172:23 **OF** [9] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, offence [7] - 11:7, 55:17, 110:19, 115:23, 125:3, 129:18, 166:1 offences [4] - 8:16, 11:10, 20:3, 124:22 offenders [2] -121:24, 122:21 offending [1] - 91:27 offer [1] - 37:15 offered [2] - 18:26, **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 office [16] - 13:22, 60:25, 66:15, 66:26, 72:15, 72:21, 76:1, 76:6, 105:29, 114:27, 158:14, 159:7, 161:27, 164:29, 169:3. 171:14 Office [1] - 12:28 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, officer [11] - 9:19, 19:23, 20:18, 23:3, 23:12, 25:11, 42:7, 147:6, 160:11, 172:3 officials [1] - 58:27 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 Olivia [1] - 67:7 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12,

ON [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [2] - 36:17, 115.8 one [57] - 10:21. 10:26, 12:2, 12:20, 16:8, 16:9, 22:18, 24:3, 28:18, 41:1, 45:29, 52:3, 53:28, 54:14, 54:24, 59:1, 59:12, 59:13, 61:27, 69:6, 75:1, 78:26, 79:29, 86:28, 101:7, 102:14, 102:15, 107:22, 107:26, 108:1, 108:10, 111:25, 119:20. 119:22, 124:18, 125:21, 128:11, 130:10, 135:11, 135:12, 140:29, 141:21, 142:3, 142:5, 142:17, 150:25, 151:2, 160:7, 161:3, 161:5, 165:13, 169:7, 171:21, 172:8, 173:4 ones [1] - 73:19 ongoing [1] - 87:18 onus [1] - 35:19 onwards [1] - 30:1 open [19] - 12:24, 15:19, 27:5, 27:6, 29:13, 44:18, 52:28, 59:14, 71:28, 100:14, 103:17, 104:27, 123:23, 137:23, 138:10, 140:5, 141:17, 155:13, 169:15 opened [8] - 25:17, 100:14, 104:13, 104:26, 105:22, 127:20, 161:7, 162:1 opening [1] - 68:21 operation [1] - 21:27 operational [1] -67:20 opportunity [6] -47:28, 114:3, 114:6, 144:2, 144:28, 154:21 oppressive [1] -106:28 option [4] - 11:19, 156:27, 165:7, 169:15 **options** [4] - 71:10, 71:24, 165:5, 169:15 order [17] - 8:7, 8:21, 9:1, 9:22, 13:29,

20:19, 38:3, 60:3,

65:9, 71:13, 72:4,

107:8, 107:15, 116:13, 118:21, 126:1, 137:14 orderly [2] - 111:18, 111:23 organisation [11] -34:12, 34:25, 35:1, 35:20, 39:3, 50:21, 63:13, 64:17, 68:17, 92:8, 164:21 organisation's [2] -137:15, 138:4 organisational [1] -35.8 original [5] - 91:7, 93:1, 93:8, 94:12, 116:22 originals [1] - 91:19 **ORLA** [1] - 3:20 **OSMOND** [1] - 3:27 OTHER [1] - 1:3 otherwise [2] -65:14, 105:18 ought [1] - 71:23 ourselves [1] -144.28 out' [1] - 24:25 outcome [2] - 52:25, 160:12 outdoor [3] - 49:15, 161:14, 169:1 outing [1] - 171:23 outline [5] - 113:3, 122:10, 128:28, 132:16, 132:18 outlined [3] - 53:4, 148:26, 168:10 outlines [1] - 132:16 outside [2] - 128:23, outsider [1] - 78:6 outstanding [1] -126:20 overleaf [2] - 29:18, 143:4 overpayment [4] -43:16, 43:28, 44:14, 44:24 overpayments [2] -44:11, 44:12 overview [1] - 59:7 **owe** [1] - 130:14 own [15] - 61:11, 62:7, 63:3, 63:17, 64:2, 65:2, 65:18, 66:14, 76:4, 77:15, 80:3, 108:15, 168:3, 168:14, 172:19 owned [2] - 19:21, 21:26

132:19, 135:17, owner [5] - 22:11, painting [1] - 62:1 7:2, 11:9, 19:13, 30:6, picked [2] - 60:14, 99:23, 104:22, 105:7, pane [1] - 98:6 135:18, 135:24, 40:5, 40:7, 41:11, 60:17 105:15 panning [1] - 55:7 135:27, 136:10, 67:15, 79:15, 80:6, picture [1] - 17:14 136:12, 136:18, 81:2, 94:1, 96:23, papers [10] - 44:20, **PID...** [1] - 104:16 Р 136:19, 139:19, 96:24, 97:25, 101:16, 49:29, 50:1, 53:13, **pie** [1] - 106:29 140:16, 140:26, 101:18, 103:10, 53:16. 97:12. 97:20. pieces [1] - 117:12 141:10, 141:21, 105:17, 128:8, 148:19, 161:29, pitch [2] - 105:19, **p)** [1] - 12:15 143:17, 143:19, 129:10, 144:2, 169:23 **PAF** [28] - 59:19, 168:3, 172:19 162:28, 169:12 paperwork [2] -Place [2] - 49:7, 59:22, 59:26, 59:28, party's [2] - 57:22, period [15] - 8:26, 148:22, 169:18 54:16 101:3, 101:8, 111:20, paragraph [12] -69:2 8:28, 10:10, 11:11, **PLACE** [1] - 4:5 112:1, 113:7, 113:22, 19:22, 24:29, 52:3, **PASSED**[1] - 1:4 12:11, 14:3, 19:8, place [16] - 43:19, 116:19, 124:19, 19:18, 30:10, 36:14, 68:21, 100:14, passed [7] - 55:27, 55:16, 60:8, 79:3, 126:10, 130:3, 56:19, 72:12, 76:18, 38:19, 39:21, 73:1, 104:27, 105:27, 95:25, 97:8, 97:16, 130:18, 130:20, 78:13, 124:15, 131:8 73:3 124:23, 147:19, 110:14, 110:20, 130:23, 130:24, passing [3] - 73:10, periods [1] - 157:19 151:15, 158:11, 170:2 114:13, 115:1, 116:7, 130:25, 132:7, 140:5, paramount [1] -114:7, 114:29 permanent [1] -136:15, 144:24, 146:5, 146:27, 159:7 passion [1] - 74:9 68:26 167:17, 169:28 163:17, 163:21, past [2] - 10:22, 55:7 permission[1] paranoia [1] - 172:24 placed [7] - 32:4, 163:28, 164:9, 166:21 Pat [14] - 23:4, 45:18, 100:3 pardon [7] - 10:4, 80:1, 114:26, 120:19, PAGE [1] - 5:2 51:3, 51:4, 51:8, person [31] - 10:28, 28:22, 57:8, 79:23, 128:9, 135:24, 136:16 page [97] - 6:9, 99:4, 135:12, 149:22 51:11, 51:13, 52:6, 12:20, 14:7, 14:19, placing [1] - 171:14 11:26, 12:25, 14:24, 23:22, 62:26, 65:1, parked [1] - 143:14 52:9, 53:11, 74:18, **plain** [2] - 41:8 16:20, 19:13, 21:22, 106:13, 147:25, 65:18, 67:12, 70:8, part [14] - 14:18, planned [1] - 23:2 24:10, 24:29, 25:18, 158:18 70:16, 75:5, 77:22, 18:29, 26:14, 41:21, **plenty** [1] - 67:5 26:4, 26:10, 28:21, 84:26, 89:8, 100:22, 50:21, 51:28, 54:6, patient [1] - 29:27 **plus** [1] - 57:29 29:15, 29:24, 31:7, 109:13, 109:21, 68:14, 79:26, 88:9, **PATRICK** [6] - 2:7, pocket [1] - 121:20 35:29, 38:25, 43:4, 109:25, 110:1, 2:10, 2:28, 3:3, 5:3, 99:24, 154:4, 173:6, pockets [2] - 119:23, 43:15, 46:23, 47:2, 111:26, 130:6, 132:1, 173.9 49:25. 50:26. 52:27. 142:26, 143:25, part-time [1] - 18:29 patrol [5] - 55:27, pockets" [1] - 120:1 54:22, 55:23, 56:9, 56:19, 112:17, 143:29, 144:3, particular [10] point [27] - 20:21, 56:13, 56:25, 57:3, 146:15, 160:1, 168:2, 21:11, 100:29, 136:12, 143:13 27:26, 42:5, 43:19, 57:17, 58:20, 59:5, 168:14 pattern [2] - 31:18, 101:11, 104:23, 45:24, 48:14, 59:17, 59:14, 60:29, 62:15, personally [2] -152:1, 153:10, 33:15 64:27, 65:13, 65:16, 62:19, 65:27, 68:4, 36:12, 45:3 157:22, 160:21, **PAUL** [3] - 2:16, 74:6, 75:4, 77:5, 77:6, 74:13, 81:27, 82:13, personnel [1] - 79:3 169:4, 173:11 2:21, 3:30 85:13, 89:21, 104:10, 83:5, 86:4, 86:20, persons [1] - 104:21 particularly [2] -**PEGGY** [1] - 4:4 116:21, 116:22, 87:28, 90:6, 91:11, **PEOPLE** [1] - 3:16 perspective [3] -23:25, 62:15 117:24, 132:9, 92:20, 97:26, 98:14, 35:9, 44:9, 161:24 parties [21] - 12:26, people [24] - 6:18, 140:21, 141:4, 98:17, 99:3, 100:5, **PETER** [2] - 2:5, 3:13 49:4, 49:8, 54:24, 11:9, 33:11, 63:13, 143:23, 144:10, 100:12, 100:15, 54:27, 55:26, 58:8, 66:1, 67:3, 74:1, 74:7, petrol [5] - 94:8, 144:13, 173:19 103:22, 104:12, 98:2, 98:6, 105:15, 61:10, 61:16, 66:16, 75:7, 94:7, 102:17, pointed [3] - 112:18, 106:6, 109:23, 66:22, 69:3, 71:1, 105:18 103:14, 104:1, 104:4, 143:21, 164:2 111:13, 112:1, Petrol [1] - 97:24 72:16, 72:21, 74:20, 105:11, 105:17, pointing [2] - 73:26, 112:22, 112:23, 76:7, 76:13, 108:15, 107:16, 110:21, phase [2] - 97:9, 110:4 115:27, 119:13, 108:22, 133:7 111:1, 111:25, 173.7 121:6, 122:14, points [1] - 91:16 125:20, 160:8, 169:8, phone [16] - 28:12, party [53] - 55:21, police [6] - 61:17, 124:21, 131:11, 29:7, 32:23, 33:3, 56:10, 56:26, 56:27, 171:14 94:1, 96:4, 106:12, 131:18, 135:9, 36:14, 37:6, 51:2, 57:28, 70:5, 77:17, per [3] - 12:15, 67:6, 146:4, 165:15 135:11, 137:7, 142:7, 77:22, 81:11, 82:4, 164:13 51:13, 51:19, 51:20, policeman [1] -148:3, 149:24, 86:26, 93:11, 106:1, perceived [1] - 23:28 53:2. 53:3. 53:7. 149:25, 149:29, 67:20 109:10, 110:3, 110:9, perception [1] - 24:1 53:10, 115:19, 169:26 policing [2] - 139:28, 150:10, 155:16, 112:15, 112:18, perform [1] - 166:10 phoned [8] - 26:1, 156:16, 158:10, 156:22 117:4, 117:6, 119:6, 26:7, 26:29, 28:4, performance [2] -158:11, 158:24, policy [2] - 44:12, 32:17, 46:9, 169:13, 119:8, 120:22, 68:26, 170:7 137:24 160:14, 161:5, 169:20 120:24, 121:9, performed [2] -162:14, 163:4, **poor** [8] - 28:14, 122:12, 122:17, photocopy [1] -146:2, 146:10 48:28. 82:7. 82:21. 167:10, 169:23, 122:27, 123:15, 98:18 performing [2] -86:18, 87:6, 90:12, 170:2, 170:16, 172:2 126:3, 127:3, 127:13, 96:16, 166:4 photographs [1] -98:18 pages [1] - 125:12

perhaps [25] - 6:24,

134:3

portion [2] - 50:8,

128:10, 129:1, 129:4,

pain [1] - 7:19

70:23 Portlaoise [2] -149:10, 157:3 posed [3] - 49:14, 161:13, 164:23 position [23] - 9:21, 10:24, 11:19, 12:2, 13:17, 13:18, 18:3, 26:18, 26:20, 32:19, 46:4, 52:17, 68:27, 79:8, 79:10, 80:7, 138:19, 138:22, 140:21, 141:9, 147:18, 171:11, 171:15 Positive [1] - 137:25 possession [2] -91:20, 128:24 possible [18] - 13:13, 33:22, 35:7, 38:3, 55:19, 64:12, 68:18, 73:29, 76:18, 78:6, 81:23, 87:16, 91:23, 101:15, 111:28, 127:15, 129:14, 136:29 possibly [5] - 102:5, 125:29, 137:5, 138:6, 168:12 potential [1] - 129:10 potentially [1] - 58:8 **power** [1] - 151:23 powers [3] - 71:18, 71:20, 71:21 practical [1] - 78:5 practice [14] - 63:26, 63:27, 64:26, 65:4, 65:5, 65:6, 65:8, 66:20, 69:13, 108:24, 166:8, 168:5, 168:6 praising [1] - 92:19 precise [1] - 112:11 **precisely** [1] - 16:2 preconceived [1] -24:2 preference[1] -116:12 prematurely [1] -88:4 premises [2] - 55:7, 99:23 prepare [2] - 129:24, 130:7 prepared [1] - 40:24 prescriptive [2] -63:10, 133:1 present [11] - 9:8, 9:13, 9:17, 9:19, 31:18, 33:15, 49:13, 64:1, 161:12, 166:25,

170:8 presented [2] -139:6, 170:26 presenting [1] -157.18 PRESIDENT [2] -1:13, 2:3 press [1] - 145:16 pressing [1] - 144:13 presumably [6] -59:18, 67:3, 70:26, 131:1, 144:4, 150:8 presumption [1] -7:20 pretty [1] - 126:29 prevent [2] - 107:11, 126:1 prevention [1] -99:12 previous [4] - 10:19, 13:1, 25:9, 100:12 previously [3] - 9:29, 17:16, 63:16 primarily [3] - 22:12, 35:20, 108:14 primary [2] - 63:8, 73:28 printed [1] - 113:11 private [6] - 8:3, 8:7, 9:22, 9:25, 17:9, 22:3 privately [5] - 19:21, 19:28, 20:8, 20:11, 21:26 probabilities [1] -127:9 probability [2] -125:1, 125:18 problem [13] - 27:12, 30:18, 30:28, 31:1, 32:28, 40:19, 40:26, 41:14, 46:2, 48:3, 62:8, 69:16, 77:21 problems [3] - 77:1, 77:2, 169:29 procedures [1] -72:2 proceed [6] - 18:7, 18:19, 118:29, 119:2, 119:3, 173:24 proceedings [6] -33:19, 35:24, 43:19, 44:7, 45:8, 52:25 process [15] - 22:21, 60:7, 67:28, 73:14,

73:18, 73:24, 77:13,

115:17, 115:21,

processed [1] -

17.11

78:14, 78:25, 115:11,

148:10, 153:6, 162:11

processes [1] - 64:7 procured [1] - 67:8 produced [1] - 22:7 professional [3] -90:2, 147:6, 147:7 progress [6] - 59:29, 87:18, 92:3, 95:12, 106:1, 106:2 progressed [3] -75:29, 94:24, 164:10 prohibition [5] -63:18, 63:25, 64:25, 65:1, 65:17 proof [2] - 85:2, 154:24 proofs [1] - 88:25 proper [18] - 62:6, 62:12, 64:20, 66:12, 67:9, 69:21, 69:27, 71:7, 89:29, 139:9, 147:28, 152:24, 153:29, 155:25, 157:4, 157:27, 158:4, 165:2 **properly** [5] - 93:2, 93:9, 162:6, 164:3, property [1] - 100:7 proposed [1] - 89:18 propriety [1] -127:23 prosecute [2] -63:24, 69:14 prosecuting [1] -126:11 prosecution [3] -88:27, 95:19, 121:26 PROTECTED [2] -1:2, 1:3 Protected [1] -147:23 protected [3] -148:10, 148:11, 148:25 protections [1] -148:26 protested [1] - 47:12 provide [5] - 61:18, 111:27, 134:25, 147:29, 156:10 provided [1] - 144:23 providina (3) -73:28, 129:14, 158:7 pry [1] - 157:12 public [24] - 44:13, 57:23, 58:11, 59:3, 61:17, 64:18, 66:15, 66:25, 66:26, 73:29, 102:10, 102:29,

164:21, 164:24, 164:28, 167:29, 169:3, 171:14 publicly [1] - 148:12 pulled [2] - 145:22, 146:16 Pulse [43] - 57:2, 57:4, 57:10, 57:12, 57:19, 58:5, 58:18, 58:22, 58:24, 59:7, 81:2, 90:24, 91:26, 97:25, 97:27, 109:25, 111:29, 113:5, 113:11, 113:22, 113:27, 118:6, 118:10. 118:15. 124:28, 126:14, 126:15, 126:16, 127:1, 131:3, 132:14, 133:5, 133:8, 133:11, 133:17, 133:23, 134:10, 135:21, 135:27, 139:15, 143:10, 165:25, 172:11 purely [2] - 39:10, 39:15 purport [1] - 115:6 purpose [6] - 35:6, 63:7, 68:10, 147:22, 162:8, 163:6 purposes [1] -129:25 purse [2] - 57:22, 57:23 pursue [4] - 121:14, 121:21, 141:23, 157:6 pursued [1] - 136:1 pursuing [2] - 89:7, 123:4 pushed [1] - 120:7 put [29] - 8:29, 27:19, 27:26, 39:10, 40:3, 42:25, 68:18, 70:26, 72:17, 72:22, 76:16, 79:3, 79:13, 86:11, 91:4, 91:25, 97:8, 97:16, 100:26, 101:28, 102:19, 103:25, 106:20, 109:10, 135:27, 153:22, 155:12, 161:18, 164:17 putting [6] - 39:14, 40:7, 66:24, 159:7, 160:5, 165:5 **PW1** [1] - 146:8

158:14, 159:7,

Q

quality [9] - 82:7, 82:21, 86:17, 87:6, 90:12, 121:2, 125:11, 126:14, 127:11 QUAY [2] - 2:24, 2:31 queries [10] - 93:20, 93:25, 95:17, 96:11, 96:15, 96:16, 102:13, 131:11, 140:29, 141:2 query [5] - 19:20, 83:1, 87:27, 102:16, 109:18 querying [1] - 102:18 questioned [2] -20:22, 27:23 questioning [3] -106:10, 139:13, 154:23 questions [9] - 68:1, 85:16, 85:20, 85:22, 88:29, 94:11, 122:17. 122:28, 171:27 quick [2] - 74:6, 113:10 quickly [4] - 55:7, 110:18, 110:19, 119:15 Quinn [6] - 23:3, 48:9, 48:11, 48:13, 48:16, 48:21 **QUINN** [1] - 3:10 quite [18] - 10:11, 40:11, 41:17, 53:28, 67:21, 68:23, 74:7, 97:22, 101:5, 102:1, 110:18. 115:3. 120:16, 120:27, 146:24, 165:5, 170:4, 173.24 quote [1] - 106:8

R

railway [1] - 120:5
raise [8] - 83:1,
87:27, 100:15,
107:21, 107:23,
108:17, 108:25,
120:18
raised [11] - 10:18,
87:22, 91:16, 93:20,
93:25, 95:18, 96:12,
102:13, 107:19,
113:26, 131:12
ran [2] - 99:29, 120:4
random [1] - 162:27

138:26, 139:4, 158:6,

rang [3] - 22:29, 23:4, 135:27 rank [2] - 150:3, 171:21 ranks [1] - 148:23 rather [5] - 61:12, 62:8, 79:20, 126:26, 151:27 re [12] - 26:7, 34:7, 43:1, 47:5, 61:29, 63:5, 149:5, 159:5, 159:6, 159:15, 172:26, 172:27 re-interview [2] -61:29 63:5 re-occur [1] - 34:7 reached [1] - 167:23 reaction [3] - 50:11, 50:14, 155:15 reactionary [1] - 6:17 read [12] - 53:21, 55:10, 57:11, 60:29, 62:17, 66:21, 70:25, 74:27, 76:4, 100:10, 113:5, 152:23 readily [1] - 53:29 reading [5] - 14:27, 57:18, 61:23, 65:20, 65:23 reads [2] - 24:12, 26:23 real [3] - 41:14, 128:22, 132:4 realise [1] - 85:19 realised [2] - 33:11, 85.17 realising [1] - 85:21 really [11] - 41:3, 45:29, 56:13, 65:12, 67:21, 79:16, 120:7, 125:8, 136:24, 156:3, 156:5 reason [9] - 10:17, 32:24, 66:19, 114:27, 115:29, 122:19, 132:4, 145:17, 164:10 reasonable [4] -71:12, 77:12, 125:1, 165:15 reasonably [1] -118:6 reasons [2] - 79:29, 155:27 recalling [1] - 140:21 recategorise [2] -121:29, 122:3 recategorised [1] received [10] - 13:6, 19:20, 19:23, 25:20,

83:29, 115:8, 115:14, 122:22, 123:8, 134:3 receives [1] - 90:5 receiving [2] - 25:25, 129.28 recent [4] - 49:2, 167:23, 167:28, 168:12 recently [1] - 170:10 recites [1] - 59:15 reclassification [4] -116:14, 125:10, 128:19, 128:20 reclassified [8] -112:2, 117:20, 124:1, 131:28, 132:9, 139:23, 141:2, 141:17 reclassify [2] -124:12, 132:7 recommend [3] -35:23, 39:5, 121:29 recommendation [1] - 151:27 recommending [1] -33.18 record [7] - 121:14, 124:26, 124:28, 134:11, 139:18, 154:2, 169:23 recorded [6] -121:11, 121:23, 125:4, 126:25, 134:17, 150:22 recording [2] -117:28 124:23 records [2] - 58:5, recount [1] - 50:6 recoup [1] - 43:28 recovering [1] -21:27 rectify [1] - 14:1 recur [2] - 30:18, 34:9 Reddy [1] - 71:11 **REDDY** [1] - 4:5 reduced [2] - 158:13, 158:19 reducing [2] - 49:14, 161:13 refer [10] - 8:5, 13:1, 22:22, 31:14, 36:3, 49:6, 49:7, 54:14,

131:15, 161:4

reference [26] -

41:6, 49:1, 49:2,

12:15, 29:18, 39:22,

72:10, 74:17, 74:23,

86:24, 91:14, 110:1,

75:22, 81:4, 81:22,

122:16, 135:15, 136:8, 143:4, 149:8, 155:23, 167:26, 169:25, 172:1, 172:11, 172:14 referred [3] - 36:17, 50:28, 60:18 referring [12] - 15:17, 15:27, 16:3, 16:27, 62:13, 62:14, 107:13, 110:12, 116:14, 116:15, 116:22, 169.12 refers [10] - 19:21, 58:9, 61:1, 83:6, 83:14, 83:18, 105:4, 122:27. 159:13. 159:22 reflect [1] - 162:25 reflected [1] - 41:3 refresh [1] - 173:20 **refuse** [1] - 152:25 refused [3] - 152:22, 155:24 157:4 regard [12] - 7:14, 10:16, 24:29, 25:29, 27:24, 35:17, 41:17, 51:27, 68:11, 70:3, 85:28, 159:26 regarded [3] - 47:19, 111:5, 125:23 regarding [17] -12:10, 21:25, 23:1, 23:5, 29:19, 49:5, 72:7, 74:19, 88:2, 90:17, 121:24, 131:16, 132:12, 137:15, 167:14, 170:6, 170:11 registered [2] -90:29, 91:28 **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:5 registration [1] -82.27 regulation [21] -12:4, 12:8, 13:6, 13:8, 13:11, 13:16, 14:18, 14:20, 18:7, 20:25, 21:19, 33:19, 39:6, 43:10, 47:22, 47:24, 47:29, 65:13, 65:16, 160:8. 172:9 Regulations [1] -43:11 regulations [10] -14:18, 18:15, 34:25, 39:6, 40:15, 50:22, 50:24, 64:28, 125:11, 137:21

related [15] - 29:29, 39:10, 39:21, 39:25, 40:1, 40:6, 41:13, 45:10, 93:22, 94:27, 148:20, 148:25, 157:20, 158:17, 168:12 relates [4] - 54:23, 59:18, 87:12, 108:14 relating [5] - 12:12, 14:28, 15:9, 89:24, 163:19 relation [160] - 7:11, 8:8, 10:1, 11:5, 11:8, 11:9, 11:13, 11:25, 13:1, 15:2, 15:7, 15:20, 18:23, 19:15, 19:20, 21:20, 22:13, 22:17, 23:16, 23:27, 26:3, 28:16, 30:24, 30:28, 31:7, 31:22, 32:13, 34:10, 41:19, 41:26, 42:3, 46:4, 49:24, 50:26, 50:27, 51:18, 52:18, 52:19, 52:26, 53:13, 54:2, 54:17, 54:18, 59:12, 59:23, 59:27, 61:20, 61:25, 62:4, 64:21, 66:13, 67:7, 68:10, 68:12, 70:21, 71:12, 71:29, 73:2, 73:8, 73:12, 76:12, 80:2, 81:3. 81:26. 83:1. 83:15, 83:26, 84:14, 84:21, 86:4, 87:21, 88:3, 88:16, 88:26, 91:15, 91:23, 91:26, 92:9, 92:20, 92:28, 93:20, 93:29, 94:12, 94:26, 95:1, 95:12, 96:12, 96:14, 96:22, 97:6. 97:7. 97:26. 98:13, 98:16, 100:15, 100:20, 101:23, 102:14, 102:16, 102:20, 104:14, 104:16, 105:2, 105:23, 105:25, 106:6, 106:9, 106:19, 107:5 107:19 107:21, 107:24, 108:3, 108:13, 108:29, 109:2, 109:6, 110:26, 113:1, 113:26, 114:11, 120:26, 121:1, 124:3, 124:8, 124:22, 126:17, 128:18, 131:12, 131:25, 136:9, 138:5, 138:15, 139:4, 142:11, 142:12, 142:14, 144:6, 144:16, 144:17, 145:11, 146:3, 147:18, 148:20, 150:6, 154:1, 155:8, 156:15, 157:11, 162:1, 165:27, 166:1, 166:7, 170:12, 170:16, 170:25, 171:11, 172:8. 172:9 relations [1] - 23:25 relatively [1] -165:23 relevance [1] -126:15 relevant [5] - 43:29, 53:4, 54:22, 85:13, 142:1 reluctant [2] -121:13, 121:25 remarks [3] - 55:4, 82:5, 98:26 remedied [1] - 12:9 remedy [4] - 12:12, 137:23, 138:9, 138:12 remember [6] -10:18, 58:26, 119:17, 162:13, 163:4, 168:16 reminded [2] - 9:24, 164.14 reminder [2] - 13:22, 14:5 remit [1] - 18:13 remove [1] - 138:8 removed [1] - 137:22 repeat [1] - 76:8 replied [1] - 37:23 replies [1] - 122:28 reply [3] - 68:2, 134:27, 134:29 report [89] - 13:24, 14:12, 14:13, 15:19, 19:14, 25:4, 25:5, 26:27, 30:13, 31:3, 31:6, 31:12, 35:6, 35:27, 36:3, 38:8, 38:21, 39:23, 42:3, 42:10, 42:29, 45:19, 45:22, 53:2, 53:6, 57:13, 58:1, 72:25, 75:23, 83:1, 83:29, 86:25, 89:6, 91:15, 91:17, 92:15, 106:18, 109:22, 109:24, 111:14, 111:21, 111:22, 113:4, 113:6, 113:14, 113:22, 114:11, 114:13,

rehash [1] - 165:12

115:3, 115:6, 116:6, 116:22, 117:25, 118:3, 118:27, 122:10, 122:13, 124:2, 129:8, 129:22, 129:24, 129:29, 130:2, 130:3, 130:8, 130:18, 130:21, 131:4, 131:11, 131:18, 132:10, 132:26, 132:27, 133:4, 133:10, 134:18, 134:25, 135:2, 135:3, 135:15, 135:26, 136:1, 136:9, 136:25, 146:6, 148:9, 155:27, 166:28 report.. [1] - 28:29 reported [29] - 20:18, 24:16, 25:10, 27:10, 28:27, 30:14, 31:4, 31:24, 32:25, 32:27, 37:11, 42:14, 50:13, 61:15, 66:7, 68:19, 76:1, 81:6, 87:19, 92:3, 104:24, 110:2, 112:6, 120:5, 121:12, 135:16, 139:11, 143:7, 143:16 reporter [2] - 22:29, reporting [10] -29:19, 33:15, 35:25, 37:2, 45:12, 62:4, 110:27, 124:23, 131:16, 132:12 reports [7] - 31:18, 31:20, 41:3, 81:11, 111:25, 136:10, 171:19 representation [1] -158:20 reprimand [1] - 79:9 request [9] - 27:29, 31:15, 33:21, 59:22, 59:29, 88:6, 91:4, 147:25, 161:29 requested [4] - 52:6, 122:16, 143:22, 149:10 requesting [1] -130:1 require [1] - 134:20 required [6] - 27:27, 29:4, 33:3, 65:25, 134:6, 149:9 requirements [2] -8:27, 10:14 requires [2] - 88:3, 126:16

research [1] - 65:6 resolution [1] - 13:9 RESOLUTIONS [1] -1:4 Resource [1] - 33:23 resource [3] - 28:15, 42:29, 157:18 Resources [1] -169:21 RESOURCES [1] -3:15 resources [1] -127:17 resourcing [1] -158:6 respect [1] - 45:9 respectfully [1] -39.5 respond [1] - 137:7 responding [2] -105:11, 146:25 responds [1] - 86:5 response [15] -29:15, 44:24, 60:29, 65:26, 74:14, 90:8, 90:9, 104:13, 105:23, 135:9, 137:9, 137:13, 139:9, 143:1, 160:29 responsibilities [5] -33:27, 35:16, 39:3, 139:3, 157:29 responsibility [4] -19:16, 35:22, 145:7, 160:10 responsible [1] -96:18 rest [6] - 31:20, 31:28, 66:27, 73:20, 86:11, 110:6 rested [1] - 143:28 resting [1] - 25:6 restructure [1] -160:18 restructured [1] -160:13 resubmit [1] - 155:28 result [11] - 23:10, 25:25. 32:16. 52:24. 76:7, 95:17, 96:4,

101:6, 160:8, 162:2,

results [1] - 112:19

RESUMED [2] - 6:1,

reticent [1] - 48:5

RETIRED [7] - 3:5,

retrospective [5] -

30:9, 31:1, 38:4,

3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11,

3:12. 3:13

170:6

153:2 return [5] - 29:4, 33:25. 34:18. 35:12. returned [12] - 24:21, 25:7, 33:2, 61:4, 73:18, 73:22, 73:23, 107:27, 108:12, 109:8, 135:25, 157:4 returning [4] - 22:1, 34:19, 37:13, 136:16 revenue [1] - 11:7 review [12] - 57:15, 58:5, 58:18, 58:23, 124:19, 126:9, 136:29, 140:6, 158:21, 163:28, 170:8, 171:7 reviewed [7] - 31:15, 57:16, 59:21, 81:27, 81:28, 124:20, 144:29 reviewing [1] - 55:1 reviews [1] - 58:14 revolves [1] - 65:4 right-hand [1] -57:16 ring [2] - 23:6, 51:6 rise [1] - 6:10 risk [6] - 49:14, 161:13, 163:11, 164:20, 164:23, 165:4 River [1] - 145:22 river [1] - 146:16 road [4] - 9:26, 98:23, 126:4, 138:18 Road [8] - 7:29, 8:28, 9:3, 9:5, 10:14, 81:1, 83:6, 102:15 **ROAD**[1] - 2:18 robbed [1] - 121:17 robberies [1] -115:24 robbery [14] -109:13, 109:21, 109:24, 110:1, 110:17, 110:18, 115:22, 116:3, 127:1, 132:1, 143:24, 144:18, 165:27, 172:20 rocks [1] - 98:5 **role** [3] - 96:17, 102:27, 102:28 roles [2] - 63:14, 139.2

153:19, 154:19

retrospectively[1] -

58:11, 59:3, 75:2, 125:20 Roscommon [2] -98:23, 106:24 roster [2] - 150:17, 154:1 rosters [1] - 150:23 rubber [1] - 102:27 rule [1] - 126:23 rules [5] - 50:22, 50:23, 64:28, 125:7, 127:7 run [1] - 63:13 running [1] - 14:6 RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2

S

safe [2] - 74:2, 93:17 sake [1] - 171:29 SAMS[4] - 43:22, 43:25, 43:26, 43:27 sanction [6] - 33:25, 33:29, 34:22, 34:23, 34:24, 35:15 sanctioned [3] -34:11, 34:14, 34:16 **SANDRA**[1] - 4:3 Sarsfield [2] -112:16, 112:27 sat [1] - 69:11 satisfactory [7] -68:9, 76:25, 79:17, 116:23, 118:3, 118:7, 137:14 satisfied [2] - 18:12, 76:21 satisfied.. [1] -124:26 satisfy [1] - 50:20 Saturday [4] - 24:17, 26:28, 31:26, 119:17 **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 savage [1] - 120:28 **save** [1] - 152:18 saved [2] - 90:16, 91:19 saving [1] - 146:28 saw [18] - 41:23, 46:13, 47:20, 56:14, 70:6, 74:6, 74:11, 77:21, 102:26, 102:27, 114:25, 119:19, 126:4, 146:27, 161:22, 163:3, 163:7 **SC** [11] - 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28,

3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:3,

scant [2] - 118:10, 132:10 scene [11] - 57:14. 81:7, 110:5, 112:18, 132:12, 132:17, 134:13, 134:16, 135:17, 136:11, 143:22 sceptical [1] - 40:6 scheme [1] - 151:1 scope [1] - 68:10 screen [16] - 6:9, 11:27, 19:13, 22:25, 24:10, 31:8, 43:15, 46:24, 47:1, 54:23, 57:3, 74:13, 84:5, 147:17, 150:11, 170:29 scroll [15] - 11:27, 22:26, 25:1, 55:24, 90:8, 99:4, 99:5, 142:13, 147:18, 148:4, 149:24, 149:29, 150:25, 162:28, 167:11 scrutinised [1] -106:12 **SEAN**[4] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:22, 3:17 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 **search** [2] - 71:20, 132.19 searched [5] - 99:18, 119:23, 132:18, 135:18, 136:12 second [16] - 18:27, 19:22, 23:18, 38:9, 38:22, 56:27, 59:18, 62:15, 73:6, 95:1, 99:24, 102:16, 108:27, 117:15, 120:21, 170:2 secondly [1] - 95:1 section [12] - 34:13, 42:29, 44:11, 44:14, 44:24, 137:18, 143:5, 150:21, 160:14, 169:20, 169:21, 170:11 sections [1] - 150:4 **secure** [1] - 169:16 see [57] - 7:7, 9:2, 26:8, 30:11, 35:8, 41:8, 45:10, 49:25, 50:11, 52:27, 53:21, 57:10, 59:5, 68:7, 74:4, 76:8, 77:8,

77:11, 79:27, 81:5,

SCANLAN[1] - 3:8

room [5] - 57:22,

roll [2] - 115:1,

115:12

82:18, 87:23, 94:5, 136:17, 142:16, 131:3, 131:13, shaking [5] - 162:5, signed [6] - 27:8, 97:12, 97:19, 97:28, 143:1, 143:26, 131:26, 134:23, 162:15, 170:4, 60:23, 66:23, 74:27, 145:21, 149:3, 149:4, 98:10, 98:11, 98:14, 134:27, 134:29, 172:21, 172:28 99:2, 136:23 135:4, 135:6, 142:16, 98:17, 99:3, 99:5, **SHANE** [1] - 3:23 149:19, 155:17 significant [3] -100:11, 112:7, sequence [1] - 36:8 146:7, 150:3, 151:26, **SHANKEY** [1] - 3:21 45:28, 125:23, 168:11 112:22, 124:16, 155:16, 167:2, Sergeant [92] - 14:4, SHANKEY-SMITH silent [1] - 150:6 129:17, 132:21, 14:8, 14:21, 15:20, 170:17, 170:18, similar [9] - 10:1, [1] - 3:21 133:3, 139:18, 140:5, 16:4, 16:11, 17:13, 171:20 Shannon [1] -10:20, 10:22, 12:2, 141:5, 141:9, 141:11, SERGEANT [5] -17:14, 17:18, 19:14, 145:22 17:7, 20:24, 21:1, 142:18, 144:12, 21:24, 21:26, 22:2, 3:12, 3:20, 4:2, 4:3, **SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 59:13. 74:9 147:11, 156:26, 22:8, 24:8, 24:11, simple [4] - 51:28, shape [2] - 124:6, 159:2, 162:24, 24:28, 26:27, 28:4, sergeant's [5] - 18:8, 169:22 106:17, 155:7, 160:23 165:10, 169:21, 29:18, 32:22, 33:7, 18:11, 18:13, 27:25, **simply** [11] - 36:23, shared [2] - 32:7, 172:3, 172:4 36:11, 36:18, 36:24, 135.1 32:9 41:22, 80:22, 86:28, seeing [1] - 58:17 37:13, 42:2, 42:8, sergeants [4] - 6:25, 140:11. 151:28. **SHEAHAN**[1] - 3:18 seek [2] - 28:2, 29:12 42:12, 42:14, 42:19, 14:3, 41:26, 109:8 153:18, 153:20, sheet [1] - 159:5 seeking [2] - 45:21, 45:20, 46:7, 46:11, series [5] - 12:23, 158:18, 160:29, 161:7 **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 54:19 51:10, 51:12, 53:8, 94:11, 108:29, 116:2, **SINÉAD**[1] - 4:4 **SHIP** [1] - 3:28 53:9, 55:3, 55:9, seem [17] - 17:8, 116:5 SINéAD [1] - 2:7 shook [1] - 23:17 37:27, 61:26, 77:12, 60:23, 65:29, 72:13, serious [13] - 11:10, sit [1] - 73:1 shop [1] - 100:1 72:19, 75:19, 78:29, 78:5, 92:26, 95:16, 21:27, 77:1, 110:8, sits [1] - 43:1 short [6] - 92:29, 79:16, 82:11, 86:2, 109:11, 117:13, 110:18, 110:27, sitting [1] - 161:23 111:21, 114:11, 126:28, 162:12, 86:21, 88:19, 89:2, 111:6, 111:7, 120:13, situation [18] -132:27, 133:4, 136:2 162:16, 162:17, 89:29, 90:5, 90:6, 120:27, 125:27, 12:10, 17:29, 19:3, short-circuit [1] -91:12, 92:18, 94:13, 163:1, 164:12, 131:22, 140:27 41:11, 41:19, 54:6, 92:29 95:11, 95:21, 95:28, 166:23, 166:24 seriously [1] - 123:2 76:8. 78:2. 108:27. **shouted** [1] - 119:21 98:12, 99:2, 104:13, sees [1] - 11:6 serve [5] - 47:4, 110:17, 110:23, **show** [6] - 19:29, 113:23, 113:24, send [2] - 49:17, 49:29, 53:13, 53:18, 124:7, 125:13, 20:11, 75:3, 77:29, 115:18, 115:19, 120:21 162:9 129:11, 141:27, 90:1, 171:19 122:7, 136:5, 142:14, sending [2] - 131:26, served [3] - 50:4, 150:8, 157:22, 170:27 showed [2] - 40:5, 143:4, 146:17, 169:12 52:23, 148:19 six [3] - 20:4, 115:24, 99:27 147:24, 149:3, 149:5, **Service** [2] - 31:16, sense [2] - 17:24, 144:9 **shown** [1] - 25:9 149:19, 149:21, 33:23 **sky** [1] - 106:29 **shows** [1] - 87:16 149:22. 151:22. sent [32] - 6:11, 24:3, service [16] - 10:8, **slightly** [1] - 19:2 **shudder** [1] - 138:18 155:7, 159:4, 163:17, 24:11, 25:14, 28:22, 42:29, 48:20, 61:18, smash [1] - 100:2 shutter [1] - 63:23 163:27, 164:9, 30:4, 30:26, 32:22, 63:16, 67:21, 73:29, **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 sick [32] - 14:2, 14:9, 165:17, 166:20, 41:4, 50:2, 60:25, 98:2, 102:11, 102:29, SMITHFIELD [1] -17:12, 17:20, 24:15, 166:28, 167:5, 60:26, 67:14, 73:13, 103:8, 103:9, 129:14, 25:4, 25:5, 27:8, 170:18, 170:23, 75:18, 76:5, 76:14, 138:4, 156:22, 158:7 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 27:10, 27:28, 29:20, 170:24 79:6, 86:3, 86:21, services [1] - 160:18 solely [1] - 7:23 29:21, 29:24, 30:13, sergeant [69] - 6:11, 91:10, 92:18, 103:20, **Services** [1] - 1:24 **solicitor** [2] - 12:27, 30:14, 31:3, 31:4, 13:19. 13:26. 16:12. 105:29, 109:23, **SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 31:12, 31:25, 32:25, 16:18, 17:7, 17:12, 120:29, 121:1, serving [2] - 152:28, 32:27, 33:15, 37:11, **SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:8 17:13, 17:28, 18:2, 122:14, 130:3, 136:5, 161.29 38:8, 38:21, 44:3, SOLICITOR'S [1] -18:9, 19:4, 20:28, 138:13. 146:24 session [1] - 173:24 45:13, 51:6, 159:7, 3:27 21:6. 22:16. 25:3. separate [4] - 33:18, sessions [1] -169:20 **Solicitor's** [1] - 12:28 28:8, 28:22, 32:29, 35:27, 67:23, 117:29 173:18 SOLICITORS [5] sickness [5] - 40:22, 33:2, 33:12, 36:12, separately [3] set [13] - 29:2, 68:25, 40:25. 170:11. 172:6. 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, 36:26, 42:13, 60:12, 70:27, 90:14, 106:27 72:28, 103:3, 103:6, 172:28 67:23, 67:28, 68:2, September 1331 -106:17, 113:20, side [6] - 57:16, solve [1] - 126:22 71:26, 80:15, 102:23, 68:5, 72:25, 75:15, 131:18, 134:13, 106:22, 106:24, solving [5] - 72:17, 111:14, 111:17, 75:16, 81:21, 87:28, 134:17, 137:18, 112:13, 120:4 72:22, 90:3, 96:5, 111:22, 113:14, 91:5, 91:11, 95:6, 140:11, 148:17 sign [3] - 157:24, 109:3 113:28, 114:11, 109:14, 110:2, 110:7, sets [6] - 19:15, 162:13, 162:14 someone [11] -114:16, 114:22, 116:10, 116:16, 46:24, 51:16, 91:10, signature [8] - 82:10, 40:14, 50:12, 54:1, 115:8, 115:13, 118:16, 121:5, 113:1, 166:1 82:11, 149:15, 162:6, 62:2, 62:4, 67:8, 115:27, 115:29, 121:10, 124:8, setting [3] - 68:27, 162:23, 162:24, 76:28, 84:29, 115:1, 116:1, 117:26, 128:17, 135:10, 79:10, 143:9 162:29, 163:1 169:9, 169:12 129:19, 129:23, 135:13, 135:16, seven [1] - 144:9 something.. [1] signatures [1] -129:28, 130:5, 130:7, 135:26, 136:10, shake [1] - 168:11 162:27 78:10 130:10, 130:11,

sometime [3] -53:29, 95:10, 116:2 someway [1] -137:22 somewhat [2] -23:26, 127:24 somewhere [1] -157:16 soon [3] - 13:12, 33:22, 35:7 sooner [1] - 123:19 sorry [20] - 18:16, 22:27, 58:17, 75:17, 77:6, 81:4, 93:7, 97:15, 97:21, 108:19, 118:19, 127:22, 137:11, 143:2, 149:4, 150:26, 150:28, 151:11, 153:15, 159:1 sort [5] - 34:23, 115:20, 118:14, 153:6, 153:25 sorted [2] - 17:21, 17:23 sought [2] - 37:22, 145.1 source [3] - 63:8, 72:10, 142:27 speaking [2] -104:22, 115:25 speaks [2] - 142:20, 160:27 **specific** [3] - 7:21, 17:1, 147:29 specifically [3] -49:29, 71:19, 117:24 spent [1] - 125:25 spoken [9] - 14:14, 70:12, 70:20, 90:22, 105:14, 127:13, 161:21, 163:17, 171:6 **spot** [1] - 170:27 **springs** [1] - 80:8 **Square** [2] - 112:16, 112:27 SR1 [2] - 45:19, 45.24 St [2] - 112:15, 143:15 staff [1] - 147:8 stage [21] - 23:13, 23:26, 27:28, 34:26, 35:4, 35:5, 40:17, 52:3, 53:14, 73:17, 85:28, 88:27, 97:9, 114:5, 132:12, 137:28, 142:23, 144:1, 157:9, 166:2, 166:3 stairs [1] - 62:28

stall [1] - 143:9 stamped [4] - 75:15, 75:16, 76:3, 155:19 stamping [1] -102:27 stand [5] - 17:6, 18:18, 64:6, 127:26, 153:6 standard [9] - 22:15, 66:29, 68:25, 71:29, 79:12, 79:14, 103:6, 129:12, 145:13 standards [1] - 48:28 standing [1] - 170:23 start [3] - 16:4, 123:19. 140:14 started [2] - 24:5, 119:24 State [1] - 12:28 **STATE**[1] - 3:27 statement [56] -21:21, 22:25, 24:28, 55:21, 56:9, 56:25, 61:13, 62:5, 62:14, 63:17, 64:26, 65:2, 65:9, 65:19, 70:24, 70:25, 84:26, 85:1, 86:26, 86:28, 89:8, 90:16, 90:19, 93:11, 95:4, 95:6, 95:14, 95:15, 99:21, 99:23, 99:25, 100:10, 102:16, 103:14, 117:3, 119:6, 119:7, 119:11, 119:13, 119:14, 120:10, 121:2, 121:9, 121:12, 121:15, 121:23, 122:11, 123:26, 135:28, 136:18, 136:19, 167:10, 167:12, 168:3, 168:14, 172:19 statements [30] -49:3, 49:8, 61:11, 61:20, 61:27, 62:8, 62:9, 62:17, 63:3, 64:1, 66:13, 66:21, 66:23, 68:14, 69:3, 70:12, 74:19, 75:5, 76:13, 80:3, 80:7, 83:11, 83:18, 86:7, 87:1, 102:14, 108:15, 165:13, 166:7, 168:21 states [5] - 53:2, 86:25, 121:17, 121:20, 124:24 stating [2] - 46:9, 121:13

Station [2] - 97:24,

114:12 station [30] - 10:2, 14:3, 19:17, 19:29, 20:11, 20:17, 21:25, 33:13, 49:27, 50:3, 83:9, 87:7, 88:21, 98:2, 98:6, 98:23, 99:24, 101:19, 102:5, 105:15, 105:19, 109:17, 111:18, 111:23, 126:9, 129:5, 139:3, 147:12, 150:20, 158:15 stations [2] - 10:8, stature [2] - 101:17, 104:8 **status** [1] - 57:15 statutory [2] -137:17, 137:23 stay [1] - 34:28 stayed [2] - 67:3, 141:27 stealing [1] - 62:26 stem [1] - 39:4 stenographic [1] stenography [1] -1.24 STENOGRAPHY[1] - 1:29 step [1] - 63:9 STEPHANIE [1] -2:27 STEPHEN [1] - 2:21 steps [3] - 88:28, 132:11, 134:6 still [15] - 29:20, 84:29, 89:7, 92:2, 94:13, 106:25, 123:23, 141:17, 143:20, 143:21, 144:4, 152:8, 153:23, 155:25 stole [1] - 121:19 stolen [6] - 57:23, 59:9, 81:11, 82:22, 83:26, 112:17 stone [2] - 102:9, 107:9 stood [1] - 100:13 stop [1] - 22:27 stopped [1] - 27:12 stored [3] - 86:15, 87:7. 88:21 storing [1] - 126:17 strange [2] - 154:16, 154:18 **STREET** [3] - 2:12, 3:28, 3:32

Street [1] - 143:14 stress [18] - 29:29, 39:10, 39:22, 39:25, 40:1, 40:7, 40:27, 40:28, 40:29, 41:1, 41:13, 41:18, 41:20, 41:27, 42:17, 42:22, 157:20, 158:17 stresses [1] - 169:5 stressful (3) -158:15, 169:4, 169:8 strongly [1] - 32:12 structures [1] -103:3 stuff [1] - 145:12 subject [2] - 44:6, subject-matter [1] submitted [8] - 38:4, 57:29. 73:21. 81:15. 88:4, 107:28, 132:10, 150:2 subsequent [5] -16:16, 25:4, 44:17, 45:5, 94:26 subsequently [5] -20:16, 25:10, 52:24, 60:10, 98:10 substantial [1] - 19:6 success [1] - 76:19 successful [2] -95:19, 121:26 suddenly [1] -140:26 suffering [5] - 39:20, 39:21, 40:6, 41:13, 158:17 sufficient [1] - 80:23 suggest [7] - 7:26, 23:25, 70:18, 105:6, 106:27, 162:23, 166:9 suggested [4] -17:18, 64:24, 106:25, 118:26 suagesting [5] -71:23, 71:24, 84:10, 84:12, 127:22 suggestion [2] -15:25, 162:22 suggests [1] -157:12 suite [1] - 165:6 suits [2] - 98:5, 99.28 summarise 131 -36:8, 92:27, 95:14 summarising [1] -18:17

summary [5] - 57:5,

113:4, 113:6, 121:17, 146:6 **Sunday** [7] - 24:19, 31:29, 114:1, 114:3, 114:7, 115:2, 130:26 superintendent [41] - 6:7, 14:27, 15:4, 15:23, 16:27, 19:5, 20:21, 31:6, 32:9, 33:6, 36:27, 39:23, 41:4, 41:10, 43:5, 47:4, 49:27, 50:14, 53:19, 73:6, 76:24, 96:17, 96:21, 102:12, 103:24, 117:16, 126:18, 126:19, 129:15, 129:17, 130:29, 140:20, 148:18, 150:15, 150:19, 151:5, 151:10, 158:2, 162:10, 170:1, 173:16 SUPERINTENDENT [17] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, 3:9. 3:13. 3:14. 3:17. 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 5:3, Superintendent [47] - 16:24, 22:23, 22:26, 23:4, 23:10, 23:20, 23:24, 25:12, 31:9, 42:6, 43:12, 44:7, 45:18, 47:26, 48:8, 48:14. 48:15. 50:1. 51:2, 51:4, 51:8, 51:10, 52:20, 53:2, 53:4, 53:9, 53:11, 74:18, 79:1, 79:2, 106:17, 106:29, 136:2, 143:24, 147:25, 148:8, 148:13. 148:24. 152:28, 155:23, 158:18, 159:4, 167:14, 167:24, 168:10, 168:25 superseded [2] -150:9, 151:1 **supervise** [1] - 89:29 supervised [4] -67:24, 72:14, 72:20, 98:27 supervising [4] -42:12, 60:12, 98:13, 115:29 supervisor [5] -55:3, 55:4, 82:5, 82:10, 98:26

supervisors [2] -

9:10, 9:12 10:18 **THEN** [2] - 97:1, tours [2] - 31:19, Т supplied [8] - 15:1, surprise [1] - 23:20 174:4 31:20 15:18, 45:17, 83:26, surprised [2] therefore [5] - 14:11, toward [1] - 7:17 T&N [1] - 3:31 84:24, 90:23, 95:5, 44:26, 44:28 20:3, 129:28, 146:20, towards [10] - 32:1, tally [1] - 117:14 95.9 suspect [45] - 55:16, 158:15 45:6, 47:17, 68:8, tangible [1] - 85:29 support [7] - 101:9, 56:1, 56:10, 56:22, thinking [1] - 88:28 101:15, 112:26, **TARA**[1] - 3:22 109:4, 165:18, 169:9, 56:28, 61:7, 62:24, 120:5, 136:3, 147:5, third [3] - 107:18, target [3] - 50:19, 169:17, 171:18, 173:5 66:1, 66:2, 66:9, 108:12, 124:18 155:15 54:19, 160:6 supported [2] -67:19, 69:4, 69:23, thorough [2] - 63:15, town [2] - 67:3, 95:23, 148:12 69:29, 70:4, 70:7, targeting [3] - 12:14, 90.2 136:13 supporting [2] -70:12, 70:15, 70:19, 165:10, 171:12 thoroughly [2] -TOWNPARKS[1] tasked[1] - 121:10165:16, 171:23 70:21, 70:27, 70:29, 95:27, 96:2 2:12 71:3, 71:9, 72:11, tasks [1] - 166:10 **supports** [4] - 35:21, thoroughness [2] track [2] - 98:5, 75:3, 75:6, 75:25, tax [21] - 6:16, 8:12, 97:8, 97:16, 165:3 64:9, 96:18 99.28 76:22, 77:7, 80:11, 12:10, 12:12, 12:21, **suppose** [105] - 7:16, tracking [1] - 69:29 three [6] - 102:13, 7:19, 11:14, 11:16, 87:17, 94:22, 100:24, 13:9, 13:27, 14:14, 111:24, 118:16. tracksuit [1] - 112:25 101:24, 102:17. 15:2, 15:8, 17:24, 13:20, 14:19, 15:11, 118:17, 119:29, tracksuit.. [1] -102:18, 102:26, 19:8, 19:28, 19:29, 15:13, 23:12, 34:18, 124:10 112:20 103:14, 103:15, 20:8, 20:10, 20:11, 35:8, 35:19, 40:12, threshold [1] - 71:12 Traffic [5] - 7:29, 103:25, 103:29, 22:3, 22:7, 172:6 40:19, 45:24, 47:12, threw [2] - 98:5, 8:28, 9:4, 9:5, 10:14 104:21, 106:20, 50:13, 61:26, 62:1, taxation [1] - 11:8 traffic [1] - 9:27 100:1 121:27 taxed [7] - 14:11, 62:3, 63:2, 63:10, throughout [2] trail [3] - 16:14, suspect" [1] - 55:19 17:8, 17:9, 19:2, 63:29, 64:1, 64:4, 40:9, 114:3 16:16, 16:18 64:14, 67:9, 67:13, suspected [2] -19:10, 19:25, 22:10 **Thursday** [1] - 24:15 trailer [10] - 80:29, 67:19, 68:25, 68:26, 62:26, 91:26 taxi [6] - 129:5, 81:11, 82:22, 83:26, ticked [1] - 99:6 suspects [26] - 64:1, 69:20, 71:26, 72:2, 143:14, 143:16, timely [1] - 166:19 88:2, 94:7, 108:28, 70:28, 81:17, 81:23, 143:29, 144:6, 165:27 73:18, 76:16, 77:21, TO [1] - 6:4 172:15, 173:7, 173:13 85:19, 85:29, 88:19, 82:8, 90:24, 91:23, taxing [1] - 21:25 to.. [1] - 8:8 train [1] - 112:16 88:24, 95:20, 101:4, 92:17, 98:7, 98:29, teach [1] - 127:13 today [5] - 31:28, trained [2] - 63:14, 101:14, 101:18, 99:15, 101:15, 104:4, team [6] - 125:14, 105:23, 164:6, 78.9 105:6, 105:12, 102:2, 102:8, 107:9, 127:10, 139:25, 165:21, 172:15 training [3] - 63:4, 108:10, 109:15, 105:14, 105:17, 142:17, 146:10, 65:3, 68:15 together [6] - 11:12, 110:20, 110:22, 106:26, 107:1, 107:7, 157:19 31:5, 41:22, 69:8, transcript [2] - 1:25, 110:29, 111:27, 109:7, 109:8, 109:11, Techniques [1] -83:10, 83:19 165:24 112:19, 135:19, 114:3, 114:8, 114:26, Together [1] transfer [1] - 114:13 115:15, 116:17, 136:14 telephone [5] - 23:8, 137:24 transferred [1] - 14:4 116:29, 117:11, suspended [1] -23:9, 51:7, 110:4, tole [1] - 39:17 transparent[1] -118:9, 118:13, 159:20 169:11 tolerated [2] -127:20 120:19, 124:4, suspicion [5] telephoned [1] - 51:4 138:20, 171:16 transpired [1] - 50:6 124:13, 125:9, 71:12, 76:12, 80:2, **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 **TOM**[1] - 3:12 transpires [1] -125:29, 127:8, 80:13, 80:14 tenure [1] - 158:3 tomorrow [1] -141:1 127:13, 127:15, suspicious [1] - 80:9 term [1] - 12:15 transport [3] -165:21 129:12, 129:16, swift [1] - 13:24 terms [10] - 50:7, tone [3] - 18:1, 79:5, 106:23, 107:3, 107:11 132:4, 132:6, 132:16, swiftly [1] - 147:15 63:17, 102:29, 136:25 TREACY[1] - 2:27 132:28, 133:15, **system** [9] - 110:14, 116:13, 127:2, 140:1, took [16] - 19:4, treat [1] - 156:29 133:27, 137:1, 137:3, 110:20, 124:19, 145:6, 156:22, 19:16, 20:17, 22:2, treated [2] - 14:23, 138:1, 138:20, 126:10, 136:29, 156:29, 157:17 38:23, 46:13, 93:11, 123:11 138:29, 139:16, 138:26, 144:24, testimony [1] - 52:14 114:13, 116:6, 119:5, treatment [3] - 34:5, 144:8, 144:15, 146:5, 160:28 th [1] - 8:1 119:25, 128:25, 35:5. 143:17 144:22, 145:7, 145:8, systems [1] - 64:7 that's [1] - 39:27 132:19, 136:15, trial [1] - 78:7 153:7, 156:21, SÍOCHÁNA [1] - 3:2 **THE** [9] - 1:3, 1:7, 149:8, 169:25 triathlon [7] - 56:23, 160:14. 161:22. Síochána [21] - 9:5, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, tools [1] - 71:13 57:23, 65:29, 66:6, 162:8, 164:24, 165:1, 10:13, 43:10, 63:4, 6:1, 97:1, 174:4 top [8] - 97:28, 66:15, 67:1, 75:7 165:2, 166:18, 63:21, 64:15, 65:4, theft [10] - 54:16, 109:26, 112:20, TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, 166:19, 166:21, 65:7, 65:23, 68:16, 57:4, 57:13, 80:29, 112:26, 149:29, 169:6, 169:10, 72:16, 72:22, 73:9, 82:2, 83:6, 87:5, 88:2, 152:22, 158:11, 166:2 Tribunal [12] - 12:23, 169:18, 173:10 78:10, 79:6, 137:19, 108:28, 172:15 totally [2] - 53:26, 15:2, 15:18, 16:7, supposed [1] -137:20, 137:21, thefts [1] - 75:26 20:23, 95:15, 95:16, 148:10 139:4, 143:6, 169:6 themselves [1] touch [1] - 95:11 106:7. 142:6. 142:9. **surely** [2] - 10:7, 49.4 tour [1] - 128:25 148:5, 163:23

Tribunal's [2] -12:27, 15:28 **TRIBUNALS**[1] - 1:8 tried [11] - 6:20, 24:20, 25:9, 30:13, 31:2, 32:29, 36:12, 109:4, 145:10, 165:8, 173:6 TRR [1] - 172:6 trust [2] - 64:18 try [9] - 31:3, 35:7, 46:21, 107:13, 124:14, 144:2, 151:17, 156:28, 157:16 trying [15] - 27:23, 30:16, 46:7, 69:14, 125:25, 127:23, 128:4, 129:11, 136:28, 144:14, 144:21, 145:16, 156:20, 165:19, 173:5 **TUESDAY**[2] - 1:18, 6.1 Tuesday [8] - 26:11, 26:25, 26:28, 31:27, 32:17, 32:22, 37:5, 45:26 Tullamore [2] -24:26, 172:23 turn [6] - 9:19, 24:20, 38:25, 99:3, 129:13, 149:23 turned [4] - 26:2, 118:9, 142:18, 145:19 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turns [1] - 152:3 twelve [2] - 26:1, 26:29 twice [1] - 171:21 twisted [1] - 11:15 two [40] - 22:15, 23:13, 23:17, 25:9, 31:1, 31:4, 45:9, 45:19, 49:2, 54:27, 58:7, 58:20, 61:1, 61:4, 66:16, 66:26, 68:8, 72:12, 80:2, 81:23, 83:10, 87:16, 98:5, 99:28, 107:2, 110:6, 112:17, 112:25, 115:24, 116:17, 119:19, 121:17, 123:7, 144:9, 147:1, 161:2, 171:20, 171:22, 171:27 type [7] - 32:1, 57:14, 71:3, 82:27,

103:3, 107:16, 129:10

U

ultimately [2] - 78:1,

unable [4] - 75:26,

144.16

173:9

160:5

unhappy [4] - 67:24,

78:4, 108:16, 108:20

unhear [2] - 7:1, 7:6

uniform [2] - 159:15,

82:26, 166:10, 168:23 unit [18] - 22:17, unacceptable [2] -25:3, 28:27, 32:29, 32:2, 37:23 36:12, 36:13, 95:29, unambiguous [1] -134:29, 159:16, 64:29 159:18, 160:5, unanswered [2] -160:17, 160:21, 36:15, 46:8 165:17, 170:18, unavailability [1] -170:20, 171:4 106:2 units [1] - 150:4 unaware [1] - 53:26 unrelated [1] - 173:2 unbeknown [1] unsolved [1] -93:28 126:21 uncertainty [1] -**UNTIL** [1] - 174:4 169:7 untrue [1] - 52:14 unchallenged [1] unturned [2] -63:20 102:10, 107:9 uncovered[1] unusual [3] - 30:12, 161:1 30:16, 142:20 under [32] - 7:29, **up** [49] - 6:9, 11:17, 8:27, 10:14, 14:20, 11:26, 19:13, 20:23, 17:28, 18:7, 33:18, 22:24, 24:10, 24:20, 33:19, 35:27, 39:6, 25:9, 26:2, 27:17, 40:15, 42:27, 43:1, 29:14, 35:16, 43:15, 58:3, 64:8, 66:17, 46:24, 47:1, 54:23, 67:23, 92:2, 93:21, 57:3, 60:14, 60:17, 99:6, 99:14, 99:15, 67:16, 68:2, 74:13, 99:16, 110:25, 112:9, 77:29, 84:5, 97:10, 112:16, 113:18, 97:28, 100:1, 102:28, 115:10, 130:8. 103:3, 126:26, 137:24, 147:23, 129:29, 138:26, 149:15 138:27, 138:29, UNDER [2] - 1:2, 1:8 140:17, 144:20, underlying [1] -144:27, 146:7, 30.17 147:17, 150:11, understood [7] -151:6, 152:18, 153:3, 156:9, 160:7, 163:12, 20:14, 23:16, 87:10, 103:5, 132:26, 169:24, 170:29 138:28, 154:4 update [2] - 22:29, undertaken [1] -43:26 147:3 updated [10] - 43:25, undo [2] - 152:6, 57:28, 57:29, 81:14, 152:13 81:19, 81:20, 81:21, unexpected [1] -81:22, 87:17, 98:10 167:20 updated) [1] - 43:23 unfair [2] - 11:16, upfront [1] - 29:13 138:11 uploaded [2] - 81:23, unfettered [2] -91:25 14:19, 21:7 upside [1] - 135:12 unfit [4] - 29:19, upstairs [1] - 57:22 29:28, 31:19, 33:15 urgent [1] - 72:13 unfolding [1] uses [1] - 10:28

146:22

unfortunately [4] -

14:2, 31:16, 98:18,

V

vague [2] - 37:23,

value [3] - 55:6,

valid [5] - 8:12, 8:13,

153:5

74:20

102:29, 126:9 **variation** [1] - 163:2 various [3] - 71:10, 74.8 107.27 vehicle [16] - 9:25, 9:26, 11:8, 12:1, 13:28, 14:10, 18:28, 19:2. 19:9. 19:21. 19:24, 20:8, 81:19, 91:27, 94:22 vehicles [8] - 7:12, 8:3, 8:7, 9:9, 9:13, 9:22, 11:4, 87:17 verbally [1] - 74:18 verbatim [1] - 1:25 version [2] - 52:8, 118:14 via [1] - 28:4 victim [12] - 59:18, 90:2, 103:1, 121:11, 121:12, 121:17, 121:20, 121:25, 122:1, 125:2, 140:13, 140:25 victimisation [1] victims [6] - 68:17, 72:6, 72:15, 72:21, 76:6, 105:29 view [46] - 28:20, 32:7, 32:8, 32:11, 32:12, 32:13, 33:24, 34:5, 34:17, 36:20, 36:21, 36:22, 37:26, 37:27, 38:11, 38:23, 40:17, 40:21, 41:8, 41:15. 41:16. 41:17. 50:18, 68:27, 75:2, 76:28, 77:1, 77:5, 77:7, 89:22, 103:7, 106:20, 106:28, 108:17, 108:22, 124:4, 125:19, 138:2, 140:21, 141:4, 141:12, 145:8, 145:9, 161:18, 168:5 viewed [14] - 55:6, 55:26, 57:24, 69:12, 75:27, 76:22, 82:7, 82:16, 84:8, 93:13, 94:21, 98:7, 99:27,

87:5 views [2] - 7:5, 76:5 vindictively [1] -52:6 violence [1] - 133:26 visible [1] - 98:8 visibly [1] - 162:15 visit [4] - 14:11, 19:24, 133:15, 156:6 visited [2] - 38:22, 141:11 vital [1] - 132:28 Volume [6] - 12:25, 14:24, 16:20, 22:24, 28:21, 150:10 volume [2] - 72:1, 103:1 voluminous [1] -15:28 voluntarily [1] - 9:8

viewing [2] - 76:26,

W

wages [1] - 43:28 walking [4] - 112:15, 119:17, 119:18, 126:4 wants [3] - 123:1, 152:6, 152:13 warning [2] - 90:25, waste [1] - 112:26 wearing [4] - 98:5, 99:29, 112:19, 112:25 Wednesday [5] -26:7, 26:10, 26:19, 32:20, 45:27 WEDNESDAY [1] -174:4 week [6] - 25:21, 26:16, 73:6, 116:17, 125:25, 126:3 weekend [4] - 24:15, 27:25, 28:16, 130:25 weeks [2] - 12:12, 144:9 welfare [10] - 23:2, 23:3, 23:11, 23:12, 42:7, 42:28, 48:2, 48:20, 79:3, 145:11 well.. [1] - 144:5 WELLINGTON [1] -Westmanstown [1] westmanstown [2] -150:23, 154:1 WESTMEATH[1] -

utterly [1] - 171:17

111:29

Westmeath [1] wondering [3] yourself [1] - 48:23 106:22 33:11, 64:27, 115:7 Yvonne [1] - 42:2 Wheatley [2] - 31:10, word [5] - 79:18, 84:10, 142:9, 154:16, 48:15 € **WHEATLEY** [1] - 3:4 154:26 whereas [1] - 17:8 words [1] - 70:24 **€20** [4] - 112:17, workings [2] whichever [1] -119:26, 121:19, 114:27, 160:13 111:25 133:25 workplace [3] whistleblower [3] -**€300** [2] - 46:26, 32:15, 34:28, 157:17 27:17, 41:19, 156:23 159:5 whistleblowers [2] works [1] - 31:19 148:13, 171:15 world [1] - 60:21 É WHITE [1] - 3:11 worried [2] - 27:18, white [1] - 112:20 77:20 whole [5] - 18:1, worry [1] - 156:13 **ÉABHALL**[1] - 2:30 63:7, 65:3, 116:2, worse [2] - 156:24, **ÉIREANN** [2] - 1:4, 156:25 144.1 1:5 wholly [1] - 63:23 write [15] - 35:29, willing [2] - 54:9, 63:3, 64:4, 65:2, Ó 65:18, 67:23, 73:1, 144:12 80:7, 115:26, 124:13, window [1] - 100:2 **Ó** [1] - 3:7 146:7, 162:6, 168:3, windsheet [1] -168:14, 170:5 112:26 wisdom [1] - 54:9 writing [13] - 26:15, 28:2, 29:10, 49:18, wish [14] - 8:5, 8:21, 62:16, 63:17, 73:5, 33:21, 36:3, 54:2, 83:21, 145:4, 146:1, 75:4, 97:5, 121:13, 121:21, 122:19, 148:28, 155:16, 162:25 123:20, 143:23, written [27] - 12:27, 155:25, 157:10 15:3, 45:5, 49:3, 49:8, wished [3] - 66:22, 123:23, 129:13 61:11, 61:23, 62:7, 74:17, 76:13, 76:28, withdrawal [1] -80:3, 82:18, 84:2, 150:6 84:10, 115:27, withdrawing [1] -115:28, 116:1, 136:20 129:18, 131:24, withdrawn [2] - 52:1, 135:26, 139:18, 52:17 149:3, 152:22, 164:3, witness [13] - 52:13, 168:20, 172:24 62:5, 63:17, 63:19, wrongdoing [3] -64:3, 65:9, 121:23, 171:19, 171:22, 129:10, 140:18, 171:23 141:24, 142:10, wrote [10] - 68:1, 148:21, 168:3 83:11, 86:7, 86:25, **WITNESS** [16] - 5:2, 102:14, 128:17, 15:1, 15:7, 15:10, 153:5, 163:23, 170:1, 15:29, 16:4, 16:8, 172:19 16:12, 16:14, 17:3, 18:22, 18:26, 173:4, Y 173:14, 173:22, 173:26 witnesses [17] year [2] - 73:21, 58:8, 61:10, 61:24, 107:22 61:29, 63:1, 63:6, years [2] - 63:15, 66:11, 67:17, 68:11, 147:7 69:22, 71:5, 72:9, yesterday [5] - 6:14, 74:27, 75:1, 75:5, 14:17, 40:4, 111:12, 80:2 160:7 wonder [3] - 26:21, **you..** [1] - 6:13 39:27, 41:10