TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

<u>HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE</u>

ON FRIDAY, 6TH DECEMBER 2019 - DAY 127

127

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR.

DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC PATRICK MARRINAN SC SINÉAD McGRATH BL JOHN DAVIS, SOLICITOR MR. MS. MR.

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY

& GARDA DAVID TURNER: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY

RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURRAY 10. 11.

13.

SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15.

INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16.

16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE

BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON
INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN

30.

31.

CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN

34.

35.

SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 36. 37.

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S

INSTRUCTED BY:

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL PAUL CONNELLAN

T&N McLYNN BASTION COURT

11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR.

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O'ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

INDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY	
EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCGRATH	54
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	56

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON FRIDAY, 6TH	
2			DECEMBER 2019:	
3				
4			CHAIRMAN: Good morning, everybody.	
5			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Good morning, chief	10:32
6			superintendent.	
7			WITNESS: Good morning, Chairman.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Good morning, Mr. O'Higgins, thank you very	
9			much.	
10				
11			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CONTINUED TO BE	
12			EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS, AS FOLLOWS:	
13				
14	1	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: We were dealing with the issue	
15			of the crime files. I want to just return to the issue	10:32
16			concerning the robbery from the person, which we were	
17			touching on yesterday. Just to start us off there, we	
18			might look at page 229, please, of the materials. This	
19			is Garda Keogh's manuscript report of the 13th	
20			September, I think.	10:32
21		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
22	2	Q.	Regarding the robbery from the person. And do you see	
23			there in the if we scroll down a bit please. So it	
24			is:	
25				10:32
26			"With reference to a robbery from the person"	
27				
28			It gives a reporting time, 4am. Party details blanked	
29			out. Then, towards the end of it, it's quite a short	

1			document:	
2				
3			"This was a serious incident and the IP may have	
4			injuries. Could this be forwarded to D/Branch in	
5			favour of immediate investigation."	10:33
6				
7			And, as we know from either this document or elsewhere,	
8			he was going on rest days I think at this point?	
9		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
10	3	Q.	Now, I think it's the case that on the 14th September,	10:33
11			at the daily PAF meeting, this report or this incident	
12			was raised by the sergeant in charge, Sergeant Baker?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	4	Q.	What did she say and what was the discussion at the PAF	
15			meeting?	10:33
16		Α.	She brought this up, I suppose, and she was, I suppose,	
17			concerned at the fact that it hadn't been dealt with, I	
18			suppose, on the Sunday morning and there seemed to have	
19			been some lag in it coming to attention in terms of	
20			allowing the investigation to move on and be passed	10:34
21			over from one unit to another, so that it could be	
22			dealt with as quickly as possible.	
23	5	Q.	Yes. We have seen previously, I think from	
24			Mr. Marrinan and maybe others, that on foot of	
25			discussions that were had at the PAF meeting, I think	10:34
26			you sent a memo to the sergeant in charge, is that	
27			right?	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	6	Q.	I think we have that at page 2313. We might just look	

Т			at this for a moment. It says:	
2				
3			"In this case the incident on the face of it was	
4			seri ous. "	
5				10:34
6			I think that was the adjective used by Garda Keogh	
7			himself in his initial report?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	7	Q.	"The scant report submitted does not give any	
10			indication of what investigative steps were taken at	10:35
11			the initial reporting stage regarding the scene,	
12			searches of it, CCTV issues, injured parties' account	
13			of events, description of assailants, what was taken,	
14			what violence used, what injuries received, whether	
15			photographs were taken."	10:35
16				
17			Now, there is, in fairness, also a Pulse entry, isn't	
18			that right?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	8	Q.	We will come back to that issue. First of all, did the	10:35
21			questions that you are identifying here, can you assist	
22			the Chairman, did these arise from the discussion of a	
23			matter that was had at the PAF meeting?	
24		Α.	Yes. At the first meeting, the general feeling of the	
25			sergeant and then the rest of us, that the report	10:35
26			perhaps lacked detail to assist the enquiries that	
27			Garda Keogh indicated he was unable to make at the	
28			time. That's understandable, but I suppose detail is	
29			very important and information in terms of allowing a	

- 1 full analysis of the information.
- 2 9 Q. Yes.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

3 Α. I appreciate what was on Pulse, but it was felt that there was additional detail perhaps that could have 4 5 been there that wasn't there.

6 10 well, in relation to the answer or the partial answer Q. of Garda Keogh that, look, didn't I put details on 7 8 Pulse, in terms of the procedures that you had introduced from the spring and summer of 2015, what was 9 the obligation in relation to -- was the Pulse enough 10 10:36 11 or was there an obligation on investigating members to 12 produce a report?

10:36

10:37

10:37

Yes. A report really was required in relation to a Α. case like a robbery, where I suppose the minimum amount of information that one can capture on the narrative on 10:36 Pulse, it doesn't give a full indication of what had occurred maybe over a period of time, which might assist people who are taking over the case and, you know, to allow them the best possible opportunity to prevent them repeating enquiries that perhaps maybe already had been done or maybe there are more issues that they should know prior to making new or further enquiries.

24 Just looking at the document that's on the screen 11 Q. 25 there, the frailties, if frailties they be, the frailties identified appear to relate to the level of 26 27 information in the report as opposed to any commentary 28 on the adequacy or otherwise of investigative steps that were taken? 29

т.	Α.	res, absorbtery. It's about the relaying or	
2		information, I suppose. The correctness and factuality	
3		of information that might be available to people who	
4		were at the scene and who had engaged with the injured	
5		party, that might be essential to those who, I suppose,	10:37
6		were following on then.	
7	12 Q.	Yes. If we could just pull up, please, Garda Keogh's	
8		statement on this issue, page 133. If we go towards	
9		the end of that page I think. So under heading of	
10		number 12 there, it says:	10:38
11			
12		"There was a case of a robbery from a person on 13th	
13		September 2015.	
14			
15		In his opening letter of 23rd September 2015,	10:38
16		Superintendent Pat Murray, in his description of the	
17		matter, said, 'the incident on the face of it was	
18		serious'. In inflating the matter to 'serious' he was	
19		exaggerating it into a stick to beat me with."	
20			10:38
21		What do you say to that?	
22	Α.	I say that Garda Keogh identified the incident as	
23		serious himself and, indeed, it was, you know, serious,	
24		a robbery with violence, as described eventually by the	
25		injured party. It was quite serious. And deserved	10:38
26		needed and immediate Garda response, in line with	
27		systems and processes which I had introduced, which I	
28		had hoped would allow that to happen.	

29 13 Q. Well, what do you say to the more inflammatory

Т			arregation that you infrated the matter to get at him?	
2		Α.	No, absolutely not. You know, the facts in the	
3			situation is, as I have described in my office, it was	
4			something a number of enquiries had been made over	
5			the two-week period from when it was reported to when a	10:39
6			report was sent to the sergeant and chief, I see,	
7			asking for additional information. And, you know, I	
8			suppose quite detailed effort went into keeping this	
9			alive in order that we might be able to bottom it out.	
10	14	Q.	You see the criticism that he makes in the end of the	10:39
11			document, he says, at the end of the page:	
12				
13			"In fact, contrary to what was alleged by Pat Murray,	
14			there was a comprehensive Pulse report on the incident	
15			together with a further report in manuscript submitted	10:40
16			on the 13th September."	
17				
18			You have dealt with that.	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	15	Q.	His response is, look, there's enough on Pulse, what's	10:40
21			your problem?	
22		Α.	Yeah, there wasn't really, there was more information	
23			that could have been captured there. The search.	
24			Maybe scene details. What CCTV was checked or what	
25			direction of travel people had taken, particularly the	10:40
26			injured party, to allow further efforts of CCTV. What	
27			kind of account the had victim given? Had it been	
28			recorded in Garda Keogh's notebook? Were there any	
29			descriptive features? As it turned out, the injured	

1			party seemed to have descriptive features here. The	
2			nature of the injuries, perhaps photographs taken of	
3			them, and those type matters were	
4	16	Q.	Just in fairness to Garda Keogh, you might scroll down	
5			to the next page, please, to see if that is treated of	10:40
6			further. Yeah, that deals with the de classification	
7			issue, which we can come back to.	
8				
9			So, just in terms of the tone of Garda Keogh's	
10			interactions on this issue, we might look at his	10:41
11			initial response to the enquiries being raised. Page	
12			2308, please. This is a manuscript document, it's a	
13			little bit difficult to work out the date but I believe	
14			this to be you might see it from the top of it more	
15			clearly on the computer. The 29th October, I think	10:41
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	17	Q.	If we just scroll down. He gives I don't want to be	
18			unfair to it. He gives details of the investigative	
19			steps that were taken, isn't that so?	
20		Α.	Yes. This is additional and new information that came	10:41
21			after I suppose, five weeks after I initiated the	
22			report on the 23rd September.	
23	18	Q.	Yes. And these were appropriate steps, isn't that so?	
24		Α.	Absolutely, yes.	
25	19	Q.	You're not making criticisms of the steps taken?	10:42
26		Α.	No, no, no. They are ones which would be expected from	
27			trained members of An Garda Síochána, yeah.	
28	20	Q.	From your point of view, presumably it would have been	

useful if some of these or all of these were included

1			in the initial report?	
2		Α.	Yes, it's important. Information is the lifeblood of	
3			crime investigation.	
4	21	Q.	Then if you scroll down to the last paragraph, I want	
5			your view on this. That's fine. So there is a	10:42
6			reference to it being reclassified?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	22	Q.	And then there is, I think, a later response, is there,	
9			on page - also upside down - 2308?	
10		Α.	Yes.	10:43
11	23	Q.	We might just go to the top of this. Yes. And then if	
12			we could go, my apologies, to page 2312, we have a	
13			further response from Garda Keogh?	
14		Α.	No, I think this response that you're looking at now,	
15			came before the last one.	10:43
16	24	Q.	Thank you.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	25	Q.	If we look at the date of this, we're not adding to	
19			putting darkness where there should be light. So this	
20			is earlier?	10:43
21			CHAIRMAN: It looks like the 2nd October, is that	
22			right?	

- 23 A. This is the response to mine of the 23rd September?
- 24 26 Q. MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes, that's fine. If we look
 25 to the last few lines of it, please, I just want to get 10:44
 26 your comment on the tone of this, what I think is the
- initial response. Do you see the last four lines there.
- 29 A. Yes.

1	27	Q.	"The attached report from SuperIntendent Murray IS	
2			nothi ng "	
3 4			The margin is slightly clipped in the photocopying, I	
5			think it should read:	
6			tillik it slibulu leau.	10:44
7			"nothing short of a form of harassment towards	
8			myself."	
9		۸	Yes.	
10		Α.		
11	28	0	CHAIRMAN: "Forwarded for your information."	10:44
12	20	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: It's a matter for the Chairman,	
			but do you regard that as a reasonable response to the	
13			enquiries raised?	
14		Α.	It was a very personalised response. At that stage	
15			Garda Keogh had, you know, been dealing with me, I	10:44
16			suppose, in a very personalised way and conflating	
17			issues that were work obligations with some personal	
18			bias that he seemed to have of me for merely performing	
19			my role in trying to manage the myriad of crime	
20			investigations that were passing through my desk.	10:45
21	29	Q.	Yes. And then just if we can go back then to 2308,	
22			which, as you have identified, is the later response?	
23		Α.	At page 2309 is my response, I suppose, to Garda	
24			Keogh's of the 2nd October, which came before 2308.	
25	30	Q.	Yes. Just for flow, we might look at 2309, just first,	10:45
26			and then we look at 2308. And you had said:	
27				
28			"I note Garda Keogh's response, which is far from	
29			satisfactory, in order that I can be assured the	

1			organisation's objectives regarding the investigation	
2			of crime are met in this case. Garda Keogh would be	
3			well advised to take careful note of his statutory	
4			obligation to account as set out in section 39 of the	
5			Garda Síochána Act, which applies to every member of An	10:46
6			Garda Síochána equally and its inexplicable link to the	
7			Garda Síochána discipline regulations 2007."	
8				
9			Then you make reference to the bullying policy and you	
10			say:	10:46
11				
12			"I await a proper response as to the actions taken on	
13			the night this matter was reported."	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	31	Q.	"I also expect to see some written record as to what	10:46
16			the injured party alleged, to include a description	
17			etcetera of the assailants and an answer as to why my	
18			instructions of the 18th August were not complied	
19			with."	
20				10:46
21			So, would it be fair to say there's a degree of rigour,	
22			seriousness and authority to this note?	
23		Α.	Yes. I suppose I didn't want Garda Keogh to confuse	
24			whatever complaint he wished to make about me with my	
25			obligations to continue with the enquiry, which I saw	10:46
26			as a prudent and proper enquiry, commensurate with the	
27			role I held and the responsibilities I had in that	
28			role. And I didn't want him to confuse, you know, what	
29			he had said about making a complaint with my	

1 obligation. Nor did I want him to feel that that would 2 in some way, I suppose, make me move away from what I 3 felt was a legitimate enquiry. So I persisted with the enguiry while making it clear to him that he had an 4 5 obligation to account to deal with that enquiry, and I 10:47 also made him aware of a mechanism which would allow 6 7 him to make some type of formal complaint if he wished 8 to do so. You made reference to Section 39 of the 2005 Act, Garda 9 32 Q. Síochána Act? 10 10.47 11 Yes. Α. 12 I think that says basically, without going legalistic 33 0. 13 on it, it says: 14 15 "A member of An Garda Síochána shall, when directed to 10:47 16 do so by a member of a higher rank, account for any act 17 done or omission made by the member whilst on duty." 18 Yes. Α. 19 34 And you were bringing that to his attention? Q. Every member of An Garda Síochána has an 20 Α. 10:48 21 obligation under that section to account when asked. 22 35 All right. And then the response to that is 2308, the Q. next page? 23 24 Yes. Α. 25 Unfortunately, for Mr. Kavanagh's point of view, it's 36 Q. 10 · 48 upside down? 26 27 And at that stage new information came in. Α. 28 37 I just want to ask you to deal with new Q. 29 information but also with the first paragraph, which is

Τ			important for the Chairman. And the date of this, can	
2			you assist us, chief superintendent?	
3		Α.	The 29th October.	
4	38	Q.	Yes. "With reference to overleaf, I have complied in	
5			full with Section 39 of the Garda Síochána Act 2005."	10:48
6				
7			And he says:	
8				
9			"I note with the exception of how it was reported "	
10				10:48
11			I think it is	
12				
13			" and injuries."	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	39	Q.	Wasn't that the point you were making?	10:49
16		Α.	Yes. I felt there was more information there. I felt	
17			there had been some entries in notebooks or a notebook	
18			or some entries from the night that wasn't being I	
19			suppose, wasn't being forwarded in an open and	
20			transparent way. I wondered about that and I wanted to	10:49
21			know what that was about and I wanted to make sure that	
22			any information that was available was put into the	
23			main of the PAF meetings.	
24	40	Q.	In these few lines here, it's a matter for the Chairman	
25			to construe the document, but Garda Keogh, in fairness	10:49
26			to him, if I am reading it correctly, appears to be	
27			acknowledging there perhaps were frailties in how it	
28			was reported and in the description of the injuries?	
29		Δ	Ves he was diving more information yeah	

1	41	Q.	And then I think in the body of the document then he	
2			gives further information as to the investigative,	
3			appropriate investigate steps that were taken?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	42	Q.	As to assisting the injured party?	10:50
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	43	Q.	From your point of view, did that justify the exercise	
8			in terms of getting further information out of him?	
9		Α.	It did, but I was a little bit exasperated that perhaps	
10			that hadn't been available earlier on, particularly the	10:50
11			bit about the taxi. As I suppose a witness of that	
12			calibre may have added something to allow the analysis	
13			of the situation to take place in a more fuller	
14			fashion.	
15	44	Q.	Yes, all right. I am going to move now to a new	10:50
16			matter, if I may, and it concerns the Ó Cualáin	
17			investigation. I think it's the case that in September	
18			2015 you, at the beginning sorry, excuse me, at the	
19			beginning of October 2015 you received certain	
20			information from Garda John Ryan at Athlone Garda	10:51
21			Station?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23			MR. KELLY: Chairman, I wasn't aware that this was	
24			included in this particular section, it had hadn't come	
25			up in the items as I had understood it.	10:51
26			CHAIRMAN: Yes. Yes.	
27			MR. KELLY: This is the Ó Cualáin investigation	
28			apparently.	

CHAIRMAN: Could you in general terms, Mr. O'Higgins,

1	let us know where you're going.	
2	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Certainly.	
3	CHAIRMAN: In general terms.	
4	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
5	CHAIRMAN: I am certainly anyway, I won't say	10:51
6	anything for the moment. Yes, in general terms.	
7	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: In general terms, what follows	
8	is I have a few points, but one point being the	
9	suggestion by Garda Keogh that there was some class of	
10	bias or preference towards Garda A in matters.	10:52
11	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
12	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: That's one matter. And also,	
13	there's been clearly the Ó Cualáin investigation	
14	is	
15	CHAIRMAN: In other words, the suggestion that Garda A	10:52
16	was kept informed, whereas he wasn't?	
17	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
18	CHAIRMAN: As to the progress of the investigation?	
19	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
20	CHAIRMAN: Is that essentially	10:52
21	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: And also generally a preference	
22	towards him in terms of steps taken and criticism of	
23	the suggestion of being slow in suspended Garda A and	
24	so forth.	
25	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	10:52
26	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I am going to ask this witness	
27	to deal with that.	
28	CHAIRMAN: Is that to do with the chief superintendent,	
29	Mr. O'Higgins?	

1	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Oh it is. With respect, to
2	discrete issues, it is.
3	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Marrinan, what's your view.
4	MR. MARRINAN: I am a bit concerned, because I don't
5	have a recollection of Garda Keogh making a case that 10:52
6	in some way Garda A got preferential treatment, other
7	than what you have identified as being that he was kept
8	informed.
9	CHAIRMAN: I don't understand, I have to say,
10	Mr. Marrinan and Mr. O'Higgins, what I don't understand $_{ m 10:53}$
11	is that I didn't understand sorry, I don't think
12	Garda Keogh made allegations against the chief
13	superintendent in respect of preferential treatment for
14	Garda A. I don't recall him doing that.
15	MR. MARRINAN: No, I don't recall that either. 10:53
16	CHAIRMAN: Now, maybe I am wrong about that. And I can
17	see that if he had made that, it would be legitimate to
18	question him on it. But, I have to say, I am somewhat
19	sympathetic to Mr. Kelly's point, because it does come
20	as a bit of a surprise to me to be heading into the 10:53
21	Ó Cualáin report, I have to say, Mr. O'Higgins.
22	MR. MARRINAN: Yes.
23	CHAIRMAN: The last thing I want to do is to curtail
24	anybody's entitlement.
25	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.
26	CHAIRMAN: But I think I am right in saying
27	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, just looking at
28	matters from the context of the over all investigation
29	you're inquiring into, the allegation that on foot of

1	making his disclosures Garda Keogh was subjected to	
2	discrediting and targeting.	
3	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
4	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: On foot of making his	
5	disclosures.	10:54
6	CHAIRMAN: Right.	
7	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: As part of that over all	
8	allegation, it is my respectful submission, he appears	
9	to have made a submission that insofar, for instance,	
10	that Assistant Commissioner Finn made certain findings	10:54
11	not in accordance with his wishes, that was targeting.	
12	In relation to how matters were dealt with in relation	
13	to the Ó Cualáin investigation, the outcome reached by	
14	Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin, that was targeting.	
15	CHAIRMAN: And he says the methodology employed by	10:54
16	assistant commissioner with regard to Assistant	
17	Commissioner Finn, Garda Keogh is very clear. There is	
18	a blanket condemnation; he says everything to do with	
19	it was wrong. With regard to Assistant Commissioner Ó	
20	Cualáin, it's more specific and he has listed, I think,	10:55
21	ten points or at least something like ten, which he	
22	says, here is how I was targeted and how they went	
23	wrong.	
24	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
25	CHAIRMAN: But how is that got to do with	10:55
26	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: He goes further, he says that	
27	Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin deliberately sabotaged	
28	his own investigation.	
29	CHAIRMAN: well endeavoured to sabotage. There's a	

1		little confusion there. Don't ask me to summarise it,	
2		but I think in fairness, he says he has respect for	
3		Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and Detective	
4		Inspector Coppinger and their work, despite what he	
5		says was the endeavour or motivation of their superior.	10:55
6		But wait now, Mr. O'Higgins, I want to be fair as	
7		possible, what I want to know is this: Tell me what	
8		you are going to ask Chief Superintendent Murray and if	
9		it's something that he has direct knowledge of or was	
10		involved in, I have no problem with it.	10:56
11		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: It is.	
12		CHAIRMAN: If it's something that he wasn't directly	
13		involved in, I do have a problem with it, because there	
14		I'm with Mr. Kelly.	
15		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: No, Chairman, my questions will	10:56
16		be directed at matters in which the witness had direct	
17		involvement.	
18		CHAIRMAN: Well, what I propose to is, we will hear a	
19		question first of all and then we will proceed. All	
20		right. You can renew your application, Mr. Kelly, but	10:56
21		at least we'll get to the nub of the matter by hearing	
22		what Mr. O'Higgins' question is.	
23		MR. KELLY: That's fine, Chairman. It's issue 17 and	
24		it's not on the menu today.	
25		CHAIRMAN: Well, issue 17 is the Ó Cualáin inquiry.	10:57
26		MR. KELLY: Yes.	
27		CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Anyway, tell us what the	
28		question is and then we will decide, Mr. O'Higgins.	
29	45 Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: On the 2nd October, chief	

- superintendent, Garda John Ryan called to your office
- and made a report to you that had relevance to the
- 3 Ó Cualáin investigation, isn't that so?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 46 Q. What did he say to you and what steps did you take?
- 6 A. He informed me that he had been speaking to a lady who

10:57

10:58

- 7 had confidential information concerning a liaison
- 8 between Ms. B and Garda A. And he indicated this lady
- 9 was in a position to describe Ms. B in detail and
- perhaps sufficient detail of her liaisons with Garda A, 10:57
- to be of interest to the Ó Cualáin investigation. And
- Garda Ryan seemed to know about that, that it was
- 13 relevant to that.
- 14 47 Q. Yes. So you sent -- I think it has been established in
- evidence possibly already, you sent Garda Ryan's report 10:58
- to Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, is that right?
- 17 A. I think that was on a Friday evening, if I my memory is
- 18 correct.
- 19 48 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. I asked Garda Ryan for a report and it didn't come then 10:58
- 21 until the Monday, the 5th October. And in the
- intervening period I phoned Detective Superintendent
- 23 Mulcahy. I outlined to him what Garda Ryan had told me
- 24 and I asked him if it was of interest to his
- investigation and he said it was. I then sent him the
- 26 report when I got it from Garda Ryan.
- 27 49 Q. We might just very briefly look at page 2325, which is
- largely redacted, but it gives the essential gist of
- 29 what put you on your enquiry. In fact, we might just

Τ			go to page 2326, which is the portion that's not	
2			redacted. And this is Garda John Ryan's report to you.	
3			Then, after all the deleted text, it says:	
4				
5			"Ms. B would have communicated with Garda A as recent	10:59
6			as two months ago using this phone."	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	50	Q.	And in addition, there was a verbal report was well?	
9		Α.	Yes. The verbal report, her first and the written	
10			report followed.	10:59
11	51	Q.	Right. And I think you sent the report to Detective	
12			Superintendent Mulcahy, that's at 2324?	
13		Α.	I did.	
14	52	Q.	And then I think at page 2328 we have some notes you	
15			made as to certain steps you took?	10:59
16		Α.	Yes. Detective Superintendent Mulcahy then phoned me	
17			and he indicated to me that this was something that was	
18			of interest to him again but that he wanted to meet the	
19			informant with Garda Ryan. I put Garda Ryan and	
20			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy in contact with each	11:00
21			other, they made private arrangements with the	
22			informant to meet with that person. And I think that	
23			meeting took place sometime between the 5th and the	
24			8th. But I had no direct knowledge of it, I wasn't	
25			involved in it. I only used that information	11:00
26			afterwards.	
27	53	Q.	Yes. You sent a report to Chief Superintendent	
28			Wheatley on the 5th October?	
29		Δ	T did	

1 2	54	Q.	I think that's at 2329. We might just look at that briefly?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	55	Q.	That indicates:	
5	55	ψ.	mac marcaces.	11:00
6			"At a recent meeting I had with Garda A, he informed me	11:00
7			that he been served with discipline form IA32, which	
8			·	
			outlined seven allegations of serious breaches of	
9			di sci pl i ne. "	
10				11:00
11			Then the relevant portion is the last three lines:	
12				
13			"In light of this development, I would be obliged if	
14			enquiries could be made to ascertain if Garda A	
15			represents a risk by being left in his present work	11:01
16			area on drug/crime investigation within the detective	
17			uni t."	
18				
19			I think you sent a further update on the 9th October to	
20			the chief superintendent, is that right?	11:01
21		Α.	I did.	
22	56	Q.	That's on 2330. And you, in this document, set out the	
23			recent history of the meeting with Garda Ryan on the	
24			Friday afternoon, the 2nd October, and you say in the	
25			last paragraph:	11:01
26				
27			"The information is very relevant to the enquiries he	
28			is carrying out."	
-			5	

1			That's Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	
2				
3			"I am aware of the interaction between [blank] and	
4			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy is expected to lead to	
5			very early operational initiatives being carried out by	11:01
6			the D/Superintendent and his team. I will assist those	
7			operational objectives in whatever way I can. Any	
8			developments coming to my attention will be immediately	
9			communicated to you."	
LO				11:02
L1			So you immediately updated your chief on that?	
L2		Α.	Yes.	
L3	57	Q.	I think the next you step is that you requested Garda A	
L4			to come to your office to have dealings with him, and	
L5			that is page 2333?	11:02
L6		Α.	For completeness, I had further interaction with	
L7			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy on that Friday	
L8			afternoon. I assisted him in relation to queries he	
L9			had regarding jurisdictional issues for search	
20			warrants. I also linked in with a surveillance team	11:02
21			that he had working for him regarding the movements of	
22			Garda A on that afternoon.	
23	58	Q.	Yes. Now, we see on pain 2334, this is your note;	
24			isn't that right?	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:02
26	59	Q.	Of a meeting you had with Garda A on the 10th October?	
27		Α.	That's correct.	
28	60	Q.	A reasonably early meeting, 7am. And you say in this,	
29			this is the third paragraph down:	

1				
2			"Explained I was of the view that both in the	
3			organisation's interest and his interest for now, it's	
4			best for him to return to uniform duties and perform	
5			duty full-time for the moment indoors as SO."	11:03
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	61	Q.	"A member in charge on unite E, the unit he is	
8			attached."	
9				
10			Then the last three lines of the same statement:	11:03
11				
12			"I informed him he was not allowed drive any patrol	
13			cars for the time being. I said I would meet him again	
14			on Monday, the 12th October, to discuss the situation	
15			further."	11:03
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	62	Q.	Those were management decisions you took in relation to	
18			Garda A arising from the developing information?	
19		Α.	Yes. I was made aware late on Friday evening that	
20			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy had carried out	11:03
21			searches of properties belonging to Garda A and Ms. B	
22			and I felt that that was a significant development in	
23			terms of, I suppose, the risk associated with the role	
24			and the area Garda A was working in, in a crime drugs	
25			unit in plain clothes. And I came in at 7am to meet	11:04
26			him the following morning when he was rostered for	
27			duty, but I had taken that decision to, I suppose, take	
28			him out of plain clothes duty and put him full-time	
29			indoors.	

Τ	63	Q.	Now, based on the emerging developments, you took a	
2			decision, did you not, to seek Garda A's suspension?	
3		Α.	I did, I recommended that course of action to Chief	
4			Superintendent Wheatley.	
5	64	Q.	I think your recommendation to Chief Superintendent	11:04
6			Wheatley is at page 2336. And in the first couple of	
7			paragraphs it narrates the correspondence that he	
8			previously provided to your chief superintendent?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	65	Q.	It relays certain matters:	11:04
11				
12			"carried out by Detective Superintendent Mulcahy in	
13			relation to obtaining search warrants."	
14				
15			Isn't that so?	11:05
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	66	Q.	Had you received any information as to what information	
18			was elicited on foot of the search warrant process?	
19		Α.	Detective Superintendent Mulcahy had informed me that	
20			he had seized telephonic equipment and I think a	11:05
21			computer and that he was going to have those analysed	
22			and he felt that there was a significant chance that	
23			there would be some evidential value in that evidence.	
24	67	Q.	Yes. Then if we go over to the next page, 2337 we have	
25			your recommendation. Seven or eight lines from the	11:05
26			bottom, you say:	
27				
28			"However, I am aware that since Garda A's homes were	
29			searched and since Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	

1 informed him that new information had come to light 2 which gave rise to the searches, he has been actively 3 trying to ascertain the source of that new information. That in itself causes grave concerns and will 4 5 undoubtedly lead to difficulties for and possible 11:05 6 danger to the informant and difficulties in the 7 workplace, where tensions are already high in relation 8 to the entire affair. Therefore, at this time I 9 respectfully recommend, taking account of all the information to hand, that serious consideration be 10 11:06 11 given to suspending Garda A from duty in light of 12 recent developments of mitigating risks he poses to the 13 public and to the organisation."

- 14 A. That's correct, Chairman.
- 15 68 Q. And that is your recommendation at that time. And I 11:06 think that was acted upon, was it?
- 17 It was. The system in place and the policy requires Α. 18 the chief superintendent to forward that. And it's 19 anticipated that a suspension may last for more than 20 ten days, the chief superintendent again doesn't have a 11:06 delegated function to discipline or to suspend anyone 21 22 for longer than ten days and it was clear that this one 23 was going to need to be for longer than ten days. 24 the file had to be forwarded from Chief Superintendent 25 wheatlev with her recommendations to the assistant 11:06 26 commissioner governance and accountability, under whose 27 remit Internal Affairs falls, for his decision on the suspension. 28
- 29 69 Q. Now, I think it's the case that in the in around this

- time you had occasion to call Garda A into your office and you had a certain intention regarding a particular
- 3 mobile phone, is that right?
- 4 A. Yes. Information had been supplied to me by a member
- of An Garda Síochána in Athlone, that since the search
- 6 of Garda A's home he had been given -- I think an
- 7 official telephone was seized during the course of that

11:07

11:08

- 8 search, but he had been given another one by a member
- 9 of An Garda Síochána in Athlone.
- 10 70 Q. Yes. I think you met him on the 14th October?
- 11 A. I did, to serve a suspension order which had just
- 12 arrived from Garda Headquarters for him.
- 13 71 Q. Can you tell us what transpired at that meeting?
- A. So, I had been aware of the information and in my
- dealings with Garda A in relation to the suspension, I
- seized any official equipment he had, as I felt his
- suspension was going to last for a number of months and
- 18 be reviewed in three months time. So during the course
- of that, he gave me what information he had and I asked
- 20 him if he had any telephone and he said he hadn't. And
- being aware of the information I had, I had my own
- telephone on my knee with the number of the official
- telephone I knew he had received on the Saturday
- 24 morning, the 10th October, so I rang that, I hit the
- 25 ring button on my knee and it rang in Garda A's pocket. 11:08
- 26 72 Q. CHAIRMAN: So it rang in his pocket anyway?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 73 Q. CHAIRMAN: And the jig was up.
- 29 A. Yes, and I seized it at that stage.

2		Α.	I subsequently handed it to Detective Superintendent	
3			Mulcahy on the 27th October, as evidence.	
4	75	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Right. Now, I think in January	
5			2016, to move the timeline on, you sought, am I	11:09
6			correct, to have disciplinary charges preferred against	
7			Garda A?	
8		Α.	Yes. As a result of that incident, I sought to, or I	
9			recommended that discipline proceedings under	
10			regulation 14 be commenced against both Garda A and the	11:09
11			Garda member who had supplied Garda A with that	
12			official telephone.	
13	76	Q.	I think we have that at page 2339 and 2340, a letter	
14			you sent to again Chief Superintendent Wheatley on 21st	
15			January 2016. And if we move to the bottom of the	11:09
16			second page of that letter, the last two lines, we see	
17			your recommendation:	
18				
19			"In the circumstances that exist in this case, I	
20			respectfully recommended that both Garda [blank] and	11:10
21			Garda A be dealt with under regulation 14 of the Garda	
22			Síochána (Discipline) Regulations 2007."	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	77	Q.	That was your recommendation?	
25		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	11:10
26	78	Q.	Now, can I ask you to move to a different area	
27			canvassed with you by Mr. Marrinan, and that is the	
28			report from Garda Keogh relating to what he believed	
29			was a sighting of Ms R in Tullamore?	

1 74 Q. CHAIRMAN: All right.

		Α.	res, charrillan.	
2	79	Q.	I will just deal with this relatively briefly, I think.	
3			The position is that I think in November 2015 you	
4			received correspondence from a superintendent in	
5			Tullamore regarding a Pulse incident entry that had	11:1
6			been created by Garda Keogh?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	80	Q.	Now, as it has been dealt with quite extensively by	
9			Mr. Marrinan, I propose to deal with this with some	
10			dispatch. Can I just ask you first of all, would you	11:1
11			mind looking at the incident summary report, which is	
12			at 2367. There is obviously a Pulse entry as well.	
13			Just for the record, I think it's 2366, we needn't look	
14			at it now for the moment. But this one here, the	
15			incident summary report. The detail at the bottom	11:1
16			is sorry, at top left:	
17				
18			"Occurred date: 28th October 2015.	
19				
20			Reported date: 28th October."	11:1
21				
22			Down towards the bottom left:	
23				
24			"Reporting Garda: Nicholas P Keogh, Garda, Athlone."	
25				11:1
26			Then the narrative is set out:	
27				
28			"While off duty, driving out of house, observed a white	
29			Volvo speed towards the canal. At the shop this car	

1			had to stop. [Registration]. There appeared to be a	
2			female driving with a male in the passenger seat. Car	
3			then sped off towards town centre. No offences	
4			di scl osed. "	
5				11:12
6			That was the narrative that was provided in is that,	
7			isn't that so?	
8		Α.	Yes. The superintendent in Tullamore had sent that	
9			across on an incident summary sheet, as set out here.	
10	81	Q.	I think we might just look at I think you directed	11:12
11			certain enquiries and steps be taken, at page 2357?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	82	Q.	You requested:	
14				
15			"Garda Keogh should now attach a statement of evidence	11:13
16			in respect of this incident. The registered owner of	
17			the vehicle should be interviewed by a different member	
18			and asked to outline who was driving at the time, as	
19			requested."	
20				11:13
21			And you sought a reply by the 7th December?	
22		Α.	Just for clarity, initially when the file came up from	
23			Tullamore, Garda Keogh provided a brief report.	
24	83	Q.	Yes.	
25		Α.	And as a result of that, the superintendent Tullamore	11:13
26			sent the file back again, asking for a statement from	
27			Garda Keogh. And this was my minute on top of his	
28			minute.	
29	84	Q.	I see.	

1	Α.	Yes.
	~.	103.

2 85 Q. So we might look at the printed version of the 3 statement, I think that's to be found at 2352. It's 4 the statement of evidence of Garda Nick Keogh, made in 5 Athlone on the 21st December?

11:13

11:14

11:14

11:14

- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 86 Q. He says in it:

8

9 "On 28/10/15 I was off duty about 17:53. I drove out 10 of [blank] Tullamore. I turned right onto the [blank] 11 towards town centre, when I noticed what appeared to be 12 a white Volvo in front of me at the junction of [blank] 13 and [blank]. I would have an interest in a particular 14 white Volvo S40 for other reasons. Therefore, I 15 accelerated my own car in an attempt to get the 16 registration number of the white Volvo. At [blank] 17 location another car pulled out from a shop, causing 18 the white Volvo to stop. I then stopped right behind 19 the white Volvo and noticed the registration to be 20 I could see the driver had long hair and there 21 was a front seat passenger, who appeared to have short 22 hai r. "

23 A. Yes.

24 87 Q. "... the car moved along the canal towards the Kilbeggan bridge. I did not see what direction it turned, as I drove towards Bowen's lock house, where I rang GISC at 17:55 and carried out a registration on the vehicle to ascertain if this was the same area which I had an interest in, which it was."

1				
2			Nothing really turns on this, but it appears to be the	
3			case that the description of the occupants is somewhat	
4			different to the description provided in the Pulse	
5			summary sheet?	11:15
6		Α.	Yes. And I think the times are slightly out as well.	
7	88	Q.	Yes. You mentioned Sergeant Monaghan seeking a report,	
8			I think that's at page 2368. 2368. This may be out of	
9			sequence.	
10		Α.	Yes. I suppose this is the first time the report came	11:15
11			from Tullamore. Yes, and occurred before the statement	
12			was made.	
13	89	Q.	Sergeant Monaghan had obviously sought that?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	90	Q.	If we go to 2369?	11:15
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	91	Q.	We have I am just looking for Garda Keogh's yes,	
18			sorry, it's handwritten on this document. He says:	
19				
20			"I did not report the incident to Tullamore Garda	11:16
21			station. I did report it to Detective Superintendent	
22			Mulcahy. I do not know if this was a coincidence or	
23			other."	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	92	Q.	And that was that. Mr. Marrinan also brought you over	11:16
26			your report. Would it be fair to say there was a	
27			degree of skepticism arising from matters?	
28		Α.	I suppose I was concerned that you know, if it had	
29			happened, it was sinister. But I was also concerned	

- that there may have been some unconscious bias on Garda

 Keogh's part.
- 3 93 Q. Yes.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- A. You know, and as I went through the CCTV and that, it caused some doubt in my mind about if it actually -- if 11:16 he got the right registration number or...
- 7 94 Q. Garda Keogh himself had referred to the possibility in 8 the report I am looking at, that, I do not know if this 9 was coincidence?
- 10 A. Yes. He was, I suppose not making a big issue out of 11:17
 11 it, that's what I felt in that report.
- 12 95 Q. I see. Well, can I leave this issue with this
 13 question: In raising the enquiries you raised and in
 14 making a report in which you -- I think it's fair to
 15 say, you're acknowledging you expressed scepticism
 16 about the details, were you targeting or seeking to
 17 discredit Garda Keogh?
 - A. No, absolutely not. I wanted to bring this to a very firm conclusion, because if there was any element of truth in it, you know, certain steps may have been to taken in relation to Garda Keogh and advising him about safety measures. And while that would be an issue for the superintendent in Tullamore, you know, I have no doubt -- undoubtedly, you know, I was concerned about that insofar as I could help out in any way I could. And I knew that Garda Keogh would have no faith in my impartiality to make a decision on it, so I sent it to the chief superintendent to have someone else do that and I recommended that it be done by an inspector.

11:17

11:18

1	96	Q.	I think arising from that, we see at page 6180	
2			sorry, I beg your pardon, 6181, that Inspector Drey did	
3			carry out further enquiries and investigations?	
4		Α.	That's my understanding, yes.	
5	97	Q.	We see there under the heading:	11:18
6				
7			"Attention and complaints incident regarding this	
8			matter."	
9				
10			A list of the various steps that were taken?	11:18
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	98	Q.	It records that:	
13				
14			"Superintendent Tullamore, following a review of	
15			incidents at a daily PAF meeting, sent correspondence	11:18
16			to Athlone seeking information from Garda Keogh	
17			regarding the creation of the incident.	
18				
19			Garda Keogh's response in a brief report indicated the	
20			car and its driver were connected to a complaint he had	11:19
21			made which is being dealt with under the Prevention of	
22			Corruption and Malpractice Act 1997. He raised	
23			concerns regarding the presence of the car and its	
24			driver, Ms. B, in an area close to his home, leading to	
25			a direct inference that he was somehow under	11:19
26			survei I I ance.	
27				
28			Superintendent Tullamore, it appears, had enquiries	
29			carried out at his end to establish if CCTV existed in	

1	the area where Garda Keogh indicated the suspicious	
2	activity took place. It appears no CCTV footage	
3	exi sts.	
4		
5	Statement was subsequently obtained from Garda Keogh	11:19
6	and Ms. B was interviewed.	
7		
8	Despite a number of enquiries being made to establish	
9	if Ms. B's car was in Tullamore at the time of the	
10	alleged incident, no definitive information is	11:19
11	available to indicate the presence of her vehicle at	
12	the time reported. The only information which could be	
13	established was that Ms. B's vehicle was in Athlone a	
14	short time later.	
15		11:19
16	Inspector Dermot Drea was directed to speak with Garda	
17	Keogh and outlined to him the proper reporting	
18	structures for incidents occurring outside his own	
19	district when he was off duty. Garda Keogh was	
20	informed that the proper reporting structures would	11:20
21	allow for the appropriate immediate investigation of	
22	such matters and may result in definitive evidence	
23	being obtained at the earliest opportunity."	
24		
25	We might just scroll down there a small bit on that	11:20
26	document. The file was returned. I think it is the	
27	case that - if we look at page 6176 - this report was	
28	sent up to the Commissioner on 24th May 2016 by Chief	
29	Superintendent Wheatley?	

1		Α.	Yes. It's an appendix attached to a report that she	
2			was asked to send to the private secretary to the	
3			Commissioner.	
4	99	Q.	We might just scroll down in that document to the	
5			conclusion paragraph. It deals with support matters	11:21
6			and welfare. Then it refers to the intelligence report	
7			and the attention and complaints incident. She says at	
8			the conclusion:	
9				
10			"The welfare of Garda Keogh is being attended to within	11:21
11			the division at every level. He has been referred"	
12				
13			I suppose this is a more general update.	
14				
15			"He has been referred to the CMO for review."	11:21
16				
17			And it deals with matters relating to his absence	
18			through illness and so on.	
19		Α.	Yes, that was around May or June 2016, I think.	
20	100	Q.	Yes. Thank you. We might then move that concludes	11:21
21			my questions in relation to that area. Chairman, can I	
22			just give you a roadmap of where I am going, I don't	
23			have an awful lot more for the witness. In relation to	
24			the issue of commendations.	
25			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	11:21
26			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I am content that that issue	
27			has been sufficiently explored.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Yes. The fact that you don't cover	
29			something I will not draw an inference of any	

1			concession if you don't do it.	
2			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Simply that there are no relevant questions	
4			you propose to ask. I think that's the sensible way to	
5			approach it. And similarly in regard to questions that	11:22
6			Garda Keogh's team may have left unasked, I make no	
7			assumption as to any concession unless it's expressly	
8			declared.	
9	101	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I am going to do all of that,	
10			time being saved, by asking one question on	11:22
11			commendations that's just a wrap up, if I may. In	
12			respect of commendations, you have been accused of	
13			targeting, you're aware of the allegation I think.	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	102	Q.	You're not in agreement with it, I understand?	11:22
16		Α.	No, absolutely, I utterly reject that. I never	
17			targeted or discredited Garda Keogh in any shape or	
18			form. That was never my intention. I acted in public	
19			interest and what I felt was within my role and	
20			responsibilities in dealing with the issues in the	11:23
21			workplace that I had to deal with.	
22	103	Q.	Chief superintendent, may I ask you to deal with a few	
23			miscellaneous matters which may be of importance to the	
24			Chairman and to the inquiry being carried out. That	
25			is, I want to ask you about dealings with Garda Fergal	11:23
26			Greene in relation to one or two matters?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	104	Q.	I think it's the case that, moving forward to January	
29			'16, January 2016	

Τ			MR. KELLY: Judge, I don't want to be but yet again,	
2			I wonder if this is straying into an area that is	
3			scheduled for examination later.	
4			CHAIRMAN: I thought so too, Mr. Kelly. Are we heading	
5			into the issue of promotion?	11:23
6			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: No. I propose not to deal with	
7			that. I appreciate that has been parked.	
8			CHAIRMAN: That's all right. Well then proceed to ask	
9			your questions.	
10			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	11:24
11			CHAIRMAN: But bear in mind. I think Mr. Kelly,	
12			obviously they have left all questions about the chief	
13			superintendent's promotion question, another issue to	
14			be debated, to be discussed in due course.	
15			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	11:24
16			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Sure. So what is your question,	
17			Mr. O'Higgins?	
18	105	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: In relation to this then, chief	
19			superintendent, Garda Greene called to your office I	
20			think on 19th January 2016.	11:24
21		Α.	He did, Chairman.	
22	106	Q.	You say he relayed information to you concerning an	
23			effort that was being made to discredit you, is that	
24			right?	
25		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	11:24
26	107	Q.	What did he say to you?	
27		Α.	He said that he had been talking to Garda Keogh, who	
28			told him that he was trying to dig up dirt on me with a	
29			view to having Mr Wallace and Ms Dalv mention it in	

Т			Dail Eireann, to damage me. He indicated to me that	
2			Garda Keogh had told him that he hadn't found anything	
3			yet but he would keep trying. I asked Garda Greene to	
4			tell him that I wasn't his enemy but that I was	
5			concerned for his welfare.	11:25
6	108	Q.	Yes.	
7			CHAIRMAN: This is in January 2016, did you say?	
8		Α.	'16 Chairman.	
9	109	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Do you have a date in	
10			January?	11:25
11		Α.	The 19th January. Tuesday, 19th January 2016.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
13	110	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: And you say you asked Garda	
14			Greene to inform Garda Keogh that you were not his	
15			enemy?	11:25
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	111	Q.	Moving matters forward, I think you had perhaps a	
18			number of conversations, but I am going to ask you	
19			about a conversation you had with Garda Greene in	
20			September of 2017, in the presence of Inspector Minnock	11:25
21			on 4th September 2017?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	112	Q.	What information were you relayed concerning Assistant	
24			Commissioner Ó Cualáin?	
25		Α.	Garda Greene indicated at that stage that Garda Keogh	11:26
26			had informed him that he was now going after acting	
27			Commissioner Ó Cualáin.	
28	113	Q.	Yes. If it is of assistance, you might look at page	
29			2647 in the materials, please, which is a note of 4th	

2			note?	
3		٨	Yes.	
3 4	114	Α.	It records that Garda Greene came to you in the front	
4 5	114	Q.	hallway of the station and had a conversation with you	
6			and decided to tell you that Garda Keogh was no longer	11:26
7			going after you, as he was of the view that he could	
8			not damage your promotion.	
9			not damage your promotion.	
10			Sorry, that relates to the promotion. We can leave	11:26
11			that over. But for the purpose of this aspect, the	
12			note relays that he said:	
13				
14			"Garda Keogh now going after Deputy Commissioner	
15			Ó Cualáin and the Commissioner because the	11:27
16			investigation of his complaints were not brought to a	
17			conclusion re Garda A and another Garda member."	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	115	Q.	Are you clear that that is what was said to you by	
20			Garda Greene?	11:27
21		Α.	Yes. Superintendent Minnock and I were leaving the	
22			building to go for a coffee and we met him just in the	
23			hallway on the way out the door.	
24	116	Q.	Yes.	
25		Α.	It's not something that I would readily forget.	11:27
26	117	Q.	Moving the timeline on, I think it's the case that in	
27			November of 2017 you received e-mail correspondence	
28			from Assistant Commissioner Fintan Fanning?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

1	118	Q.	Informing you that he was appointing Assistant	
2			Commissioner Michael Finn to carry out a formal	
3			investigation into Garda Keogh's allegations against	
4			you?	
5		Α.	Yes.	11:28
6	119	Q.	Of bullying and harassment?	
7		Α.	Yes, on 15th November 2017.	
8	120	Q.	Sorry, just before we deal with that, I omitted to deal	
9			with a note you had made concerning a similar issue to	
10			the matter discussed with Garda Greene. So excuse me	11:28
11			for bringing this out of turn, but would you mind	
12			turning to page 2537, please. This is a note again I	
13			think made by you, is that right?	
14		Α.	It is.	
15	121	Q.	Related to a meeting of 24th May 2016, that you had	11:28
16			with Inspector Minnock.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	122	Q.	He reported, Inspector Minnock reported to you of his	
19			call to Garda Keogh, in the second paragraph this note?	
20		Α.	Yes. I think that was one of the Inspector Minnock's	11:29
21			first visits to Garda Keogh in a welfare capacity.	
22	123	Q.	And the note records that:	
23				
24			"Inspector Minnock called to Garda Keogh. Found him	
25			very drunk and drinking from a can of cider. His	11:29
26			mother and another man were there."	
27				
28			This is the portion I am interested in:	

Т			"Said he was going to bring down D/Commissioner	
2			Ó Cualáin and me."	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	124	Q.	Well, when that was relayed to you, what was your	
5			reaction?	11:29
6		Α.	That was in May 2016. I didn't pass much remarks on	
7			it. Garda Keogh was drunk at the time, as reported by	
8			Inspector Minnock, and I didn't pass any remarks on it.	
9			I didn't see how he could do that and I didn't really	
10			have much concern at that stage, on the 24th May. I	11:30
11			could never have anticipated the approach taken towards	
12			me from that point on.	
13	125	Q.	At this point in time you were how long in the station?	
14		Α.	I was just over one year.	
15	126	Q.	If we could move matters on then to page 2531, please.	11:30
16			I think this is a note you made concerning information	
17			you received from Inspector Minnock, in the second	
18			paragraph, do you see that?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	127	Q.	This is a note of a meeting on 20th May 2016?	11:3
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	128	Q.	It relates to:	
23				
24			"Inspector Minnock got information from Garda Greene re	
25			Garda Keogh, telling him that M Clifford, O'Toole,	11:3
26			M McCabe, [another garda] are on to him. Said he has	
27			something big to bring out over the weekend to bring	
28			Commissioner down. Garda Greene rang Garda Keogh	
29			afternoon of 19/5. Jockey Wilson answered the phone."	

Т		Α.	Yes, inspector minnock reported that to me, and he said	
2			on that occasion that Garda Greene actually called to	
3			his home to give him the information, he felt he should	
4			give it urgently.	
5	129	Q.	If we could have on screen then, please, page 15823.	11:31
6			And what we are looking at there is then Inspector	
7			Aidan Minnock's note of a conversation he had, he	
8			indicates he has with Garda Greene. If you move	
9			towards the bottom of the document, we have, in the	
10			last paragraph:	11:32
11				
12			"Nick said he wasn't happy with Lyons and Curley and	
13			what they'd said after he got disclosure. He seems to	
14			suggest he was going after them now."	
15		Α.	Yes.	11:33
16	130	Q.	Do you recall that conversation?	
17		Α.	No, I don't know anything about that conversation.	
18	131	Q.	Sorry, do you recall seeing this note in the materials?	
19		Α.	In the materials, absolutely, yes.	
20	132	Q.	And then if we could then please move then, please, to	11:33
21			a new matter concerning a development in November 2017,	
22			concerning the Finn investigation. I started to ask	
23			you about that?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	133	Q.	In November '17 you got word from Assistant	11:33
26			Commissioner Fanning by letter that he was going to	
27			appoint AC Finn to carry out the bullying and	
28			harassment investigation?	
20		۸	Vac Chairman on 15th November 2017	

134 Just moving matters on. I think on Sunday, the 19th 1 Q. 2 November, you heard, did you, an RTÉ News At One radio 3 programme regarding a feature that was going to be played on that programme regarding Assistant 4 5 Commissioner Finn's appointment to investigate you? 11:34 6 Yes, I did. And I unfortunately had listened to that Α. 7 programme each Sunday during the autumn of 2017, I 8 heard this feature myself. Yes. And that was four days after you had received 9 135 Q. word from Assistant Commissioner Fintan Fanning? 10 11:34 11 That's right. Α. 12 I think it's the case then in July of 2018 --136 0. 13 CHAIRMAN: Do we know what the programme said. 14 MR. MÍ CHEÁL O' HI GGINS: Excuse me. I am going too 15 quickly. That programme related to --11:34 16 The appointment of Assistant Commissioner Finn to carry Α. 17 out the bullying and harassment investigation. 18 CHAI RMAN: Okay. 137 Q. 19 And made references to me. Α. 20 CHAI RMAN: Okay. 138 Q. 11:35 21 Directly. Α. 22 Chairman, I am sorry to interject. MR. McGARRY: 23 Yes, I'm sorry, Mr. McGarry, yes. CHAI RMAN: 24 MR. McGARRY: Chairman, I am struggling to see how this 25 has any relevance to the specific issues that this 11:35 witness has been asked to identify and deal with. 26 27 anything, it is potentially relevant to matters which are to be looked into I think later on by the Tribunal. 28 29 CHAI RMAN: I think that would accord, Mr. Kelly's Yes.

1	point, and Mr. McGarry I think are indicating. That	
2	does seem right, Mr. O'Higgins. I mean, I know it's	
3	difficult to separate but it does seem more relevant to	
4	the question. I mean, we know what Garda Keogh's	
5	position is on the superintendent's, as he then was,	11:35
6	promotion to chief superintendent, and we know what	
7	Chief Superintendent Murray's position is in relation	
8	to that and there is a major clash there. But this	
9	would certainly seem to reflect that.	
10	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, could I just say	11:36
11	this, I am largely finished with that issue, but in my	
12	submission it's directly relevant to a very important	
13	issue have you to decide, that is to say the contest.	
14	But Garda Keogh says he was harassed and targeted by	
15	Chief Superintendent Murray, Chief Superintendent	11:36
16	Murray says in response	
17	CHAIRMAN: I am the one who was targeted.	
18	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I am the one who was	
19	targeted.	
20	CHAIRMAN: Absolutely.	11:36
21	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: It is directed to that issue	
22	and the invoking and calling in	
23	CHAIRMAN: well, let's leave it at this. What are you	
24	saying is, look, I mean, we don't want to make too much	
25	of it at this stage, and we can return to it later.	11:36
26	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
27	CHAIRMAN: You're saying that the notification came on	
28	the 15th November and somebody alerted RTÉ to it and	
29	query did that come from Chief Superintendent Murray,	

1 unlikely, so it must have come from somebody else. 2 That's where we stand at the moment. Somebody else. And if we want to pursue that further, we will pursue 3 it at the time, I think, when the promotion question is 4 5 coming up. Because I think that's more relevant. 11:37 WI TNESS: 6 Yes. 7 It seems to me that that falls more CHAI RMAN: naturally into that category, into that box rather than 8 the matters that were canvassed by Mr. Marrinan. 9 10 MR. MÍ CHEÁL O' HI GGINS: May it please you, Chairman. 11 will leave that. 12 CHAI RMAN: Okav. 13 MR. MÍ CHEÁL O' HI GGINS: Moving matters on then, I think 139 Q. 14 it's the case that in July of 2018 you had a 15 conversation with Superintendent Minnock, again dealing 11:37 16 with matters which he said was told to him by Garda 17 Fergal Greene. 18 Yes. Α. 19 140 And what was said to you in relation to that? Q. On 19th July 2018, Superintendent Minnock informed me 20 Α. 11:38 21 that he was contacted by Garda Greene, who informed him 22 that Garda Keogh had telephoned Garda Greene while 23 drunk and told him he was being assisted by Assistant 24 Commissioner Fanning, who, Garda Keogh informed Garda 25 Greene, had made a protected disclosure in relation to 11:38 26 failures of Garda management in Athlone. 27 Mr. O'Higgins, maybe I should have said this 28 a little earlier, but we're going to have the evidence of Garda Greene, isn't that right?

29

1	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I think so.
2	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Marrinan, we're having Garda Greene to
3	give evidence.
4	MR. MARRINAN: Yes, later on.
5	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Here we have Inspector Minnock 11:38
6	reporting to Superintendent Murray what Garda Greene
7	told Inspector Minnock as to what Garda Keogh told
8	Garda Greene. I shudder to think what Phipson on
9	Evidence would say about the levels of hearsay that
10	we're engaged in really. I mean, we're going to have 11:39
11	Garda Greene and then we're going to have Chief
12	Superintendent Murray on the promotion question.
13	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.
14	CHAIRMAN: Are we not safer to leave it at that,
15	Mr. O'Higgins? I mean, we all have this material and 11:39
16	we know that people said what other people said to them
17	about what Nick Keogh said and whether he was sober or
18	not sober at the time. So the reliability, without
19	castings aspersions on anybody, but it's a difficult
20	one to I mean, the chief superintendent is receiving $_{11:40}$
21	this information. Naturally, he is not pleased about
22	it. But we may have to work out who actually said what
23	to whom and where it went. Do you understand me? I
24	mean, is that a reasonable point?
25	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, what I propose to 11:40
26	do
27	CHAIRMAN: I know it's a reasonable point because I
28	just made it. But I am hoping you will see the force
29	of the logic behind it.

1			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, I won't demure I	
2			don't demure. I am going to ask the witness a	
3			different question.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. I think we are better off	
5			to try to have some regard to the Rules of Evidence.	11:40
6			And I appreciate the point, it's not the importance of	
7			the value of the thing, it's what was said and done.	
8			So anyway, thanks very much.	
9	141	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: In December of 2018, and this	
10			is now relevant to the Michael Finn investigation, in	11:41
11			December 2018, you received communication from	
12			Assistant Commissioner Fanning.	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	142	Q.	I think indicating that he received the completed	
15			investigation file from Assistant Commissioner Finn, is	11:41
16			that so?	
17		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
18	143	Q.	Presumably you were anxious to obtain this was a	
19			matter of stress for you and you were anxious to know	
20			the outcome?	11:41
21		Α.	Yes, it had gone on for some time in my life, yes.	
22	144	Q.	Did you seek to have the result disclosed to you?	
23		Α.	Yes. Assistant Commissioner Fanning indicated in the	
24			e-mail that he would not be releasing the results to me	
25			at that time. On 3rd January 2019, I sought the	11:41
26			representations of the chief superintendents	
27			associations to have the results released to me.	
28	145	Q.	Yes. We might just very briefly look at that, page	
29			2968, please.	

1			MR. McGARRY: Sorry, Chairman, I am again struggling to	
2			comprehend how this is relevant to the issues that the	
3			witness is being asked to deal with at this stage. It	
4			doesn't seem to feature anywhere in relation to Garda	
5			Keogh's issues that have been identified.	11:42
6			MR. KELLY: Chairman, I have also got to say, I am in	
7			total agreement on that.	
8			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: This actually is my last	
9			question. But it is directly relevant to how the Fin	
10			investigation impacted this witness.	11:42
11			MR. KELLY: But that is another issue.	
12			CHAIRMAN: He wasn't told the result and maybe he has a	
13			good complaint that he wasn't told the result and maybe	
14			he doesn't have a good complaint. So what difference	
15			does it make, Mr. O'Higgins? By which I do not mean	11:42
16			any disrespect to anybody. Assume everything is	
17			correct, so then Assistant Commissioner Fanning was (a)	
18			correct or (b) incorrect or maybe inconsiderate in not	
19			letting him no. So what? To be blunt about it.	
20			Anyway, I think we will close that off. I think	11:43
21			Mr. McGarry and Mr. Kelly are right.	
22			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: May it please you, Chairman.	
23			CHAIRMAN: And I don't think it's doing anybody any	
24			injustice.	
25	146	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Could I conclude by asking you,	11:43
26			chief superintendent, in terms of all of the decisions	
27			you have taken that you have described in your evidence	
28			regarding Garda Keogh and regarding the developments	
29			that were on your desk, the files that were on your	

Т		desk during this period, were any of those decisions	
2		directed towards targeting or discrediting Garda	
3		Nicholas Keogh?	
4	Α.	Absolutely not, Chairman. My motives were honourable	
5		in line with the values of the organisation in relation	11:43
6		to service, honesty, accountability, respect,	
7		professionalism and empathy. I live and abide by those	
8		values and I use them in my decision-making and my	
9		judgment. And any issue I dealt with, with Garda Keogh	
10		came across my desk and there was an issue that was in	11:44
11		the workplace that I had to deal with, commensurate	
12		with the role and responsibilities I had as the	
13		district officer and superintendent in Athlone at the	
14		time.	
15		CHAIRMAN: Okay.	11:44
16		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you.	
17			
18		END OF EXAMINATION	
19			
20		CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Now, does anybody else	11:44
21		want to ask any questions? Very good. Yes,	
22		Mr. McGrath.	
23		MR. McGRATH: I think it was indicated that we may	
24		wish	
25		CHAIRMAN: Just remind me who you are for?	11:44
26		MR. McGRATH: I am for Garda Greene, Judge.	
27		MR. McGUINNESS: Your microphone wasn't on.	
28		MR. McGRATH: I'm very sorry. I only have two very	
29		brief questions.	

Т			CHAIRMAN: Very good, thanks very much.	
2			MR. McGRATH: And I am conscious of what you said.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Okay, Mr. McGrath, very good.	
4				
5			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY WAS CROSS-EXAMINED	11:45
6			BY MR. McGRATH, AS FOLLOWS:	
7				
8	147	Q.	MR. McGRATH: Just two questions, chief superintendent.	
9			The first question is: Did you at any time after the	
10			date of Garda Keogh's first complaint, which is I think	11:45
11			8th May 2014, did you inform or did you ask Garda	
12			Greene not to pull away from Garda Keogh or words to	
13			that effect?	
14		Α.	I had no conversation, I wasn't even in Athlone in May	
15			'14. I didn't arrive there until March '15.	11:45
16	148	Q.	Well, at any time after you arrived did you ask him not	
17			to pull away?	
18		Α.	Absolutely not. I never tasked Garda Greene with	
19			anything in relation to Garda Keogh, other than to pass	
20			by my views on to him once or twice.	11:45
21			CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGrath, maybe I am just being dumb.	
22			Did you mean did you ask him to pull away?	
23			MR. McGRATH: Not to pull away.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
25			MR. McGRATH: Not to pull away.	11:45
26			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. That's the question	
27			you asked and that is the question the chief	
28			superintendent answered. Thank you very much.	
29	149	Q.	MR. McGRATH: At any stage after you arrived, did you	

Т			become aware that Garda Keogh had said that he wished	
2			for management interventions or your communications to	
3			him to stop? Did you become aware of that at any	
4			stage.	
5		Α.	That Garda Keogh asked for management interventions to	11:46
6			stop?	
7	150	Q.	Yes.	
8		Α.	To the best of my recollection that occurred when Chief	
9			Superintendent Duff arrived in the autumn of 2018.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	11:46
11	151	Q.	MR. McGRATH: And did you pass that information on to	
12			Garda Greene?	
13		Α.	I have no recollection of doing that.	
14	152	Q.	I see. Inspector Minnock, I think, from recollection	
15			again, may have informed me before he left that Garda	11:46
16			Keogh wasn't anxious for any local management	
17			intervention any more.	
18	153	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But it wasn't something that you dealt with?	
19		Α.	No.	
20	154	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Or that came across your desk?	11:47
21		Α.	No.	
22	155	Q.	MR. McGRATH: Can I just ask for page 438, please.	
23			Sorry, it's 2498, page 2498. Could I just ask you to	
24			look at this, please? And could I ask you about this?	
25			Is that a memorandum prepared by you?	11:47
26				
27			"Garda Greene called, told me Garda Keogh told him he	
28			was going public again. Asked him"	
29				

1			I presume that's is you.	
2				
3			"asked him to tell Garda Keogh my views about	
4			treatment and transfer to get him better."	
5				11:47
6			Do you recall that?	
7		Α.	I do. That's my note. I disclosed it, yeah.	
8	156	Q.	That's something that you asked Garda Greene to do, is	
9			that correct?	
10		Α.	Absolutely, and I repeated another message in January	11:48
11			'16, as we mentioned earlier, to tell him I wasn't his	
12			entry.	
13	157	Q.	That's right. I think that's on page 2529, you may	
14			have been referred to that?	
15		Α.	Yes.	11:48
16	158	Q.	You told Garda Greene to tell Garda Keogh he was not	
17			his enemy but was concerned for his welfare; is that	
18			correct?	
19		Α.	I did.	
20			MR. McGRATH: Thank you very much.	11:48
21				
22			END OF EXAMINATION	
23				
24			CHAIRMAN: So, nobody else? Very good. Now,	
25			Mr. Marrinan.	11:48
26				
27			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY WAS RE-EXAMINED BY	
28			MR. MARRINAN, AS FOLLOWS:	
29				

159 There are just a number of matters that 1 Q. MR. MARRINAN: 2 arose out of cross-examination of you and examination 3 by Mr. O'Higgins. 4 5 The fist matter is in answer to a question that you 11:48 6 were asked by Mr. O'Higgins in relation to your contacts with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy? 7 8 Yes, Chairman. Α. You under indicated that you commenced with contact on 9 160 Q. the 1st April and then a general statement that the 10 11 · 48 contacts continued thereafter? 11 12 Yes. Α. 13 We have a whole series of notes in your diary, notes of 161 Q. 14 phone calls, and they appear at different parts of the 15 material, in Volume 8, Volume 9, Volume 13 and Volume 11:49 16 43, I don't want to go through them one-by-one, and you 17 seem to be on top of your papers, as it were. 18 I hope. Α. But it appears that you were in contact on the 1st 19 162 Q. April, arising out of the utterances in Dáil Éireann, 20 11:49 and you were also in contact with Assistant 21 22 Commissioner Ó Cualáin. And then there are a number of 23 calls that are made from Detective Superintendent 24 Mulcahy to you. One on the 13th April concerning the 25 investigation. And then the 20th April, where he told 26 you that Nicholas Keogh had phoned the night before

Commissioner. You recall we opened that?

27

28

29

Yes.

Α.

while drunk and talked about bringing down the

- We went through that. And then, the 21st April, you 1 163 Q. 2 had a conversation, which we have again referred to, 3 you spoke to Detective Superintendent Mulcahy regarding the welfare services that had been put in place for 4 5 Nicky Keogh? 11:50 6 Yes. Α. 7 164 That concerned Garda Quinn? Q. 8 Yes. Α. Then we have the call that was again made from 9 165 Q. 10 Superintendent Mulcahy to you on the 27th April, that 11:50 11 was the one where we referred to, where he said that 12 Garda Keogh had asked him to say to you that he was not 13 a bad person? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Do you recall that? 166 Q. 11:50 16 I do. Α. 17 There's a note of a call then a month later, which is 167 0. 18 an entry that says "calls from Detective Superintendent 19 Mul cahy relating to the plane", some plane in Shannon 20 "and whistleblower investigation"? 11:51 21 Yes. Α. 22 Do you recall what that was about? Not the plane, 168 0.
- A. The primary purpose of the call was him seeking some
 advice from me in relation to an issue he was dealing
 with in Shannon. And then the conversation reverted to
 Garda Keogh and how he was doing. So, while I wrote
 down whistleblower investigation, it wasn't -- you
 know, Detective Superintendent Mulcahy has always been

we're not interested in that.

23

Τ			clear about this, he would never would discuss the	
2			investigation with me. I was happy enough with that.	
3			He made that clear to me on the 1st April, that he	
4			couldn't.	
5	169	Q.	Then there's a call, again I think it's from Chief	11:52
6			Superintendent Mulcahy, on the 26th May. You have a	
7			note:	
8				
9			"Calls later from and to the chief superintendent and	
10			Superintendent Mulcahy re whistleblower investigations	11:52
11			and Athlone."	
12				
13			Do you recall what that was about?	
14		Α.	I don't. But it was concerning Garda Keogh or some	
15			involvement he had. But I don't	11:52
16	170	Q.	There don't appear to be any calls in the month of June	
17			between the two of you?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	171	Q.	And there don't appear to be any calls in the month of	
20			July between the two of you?	11:52
21		Α.	Yeah, I have none recorded there.	
22	172	Q.	In August, the only contact seems to be in relation to	
23			what we were discussing earlier on, namely the planting	
24			of drugs, but it didn't concern Garda Keogh?	
25		Α.	Planting of drugs?	11:52
26	173	Q.	You have a diary entry:	
27				
28			"Sent statements re planting of drugs to Detective	
29			Superintendent Mulicaby "	

- 1 A. I don't just recall that.
- 2 174 Q. Right, okay.
- 3 A. Yeah.
- 4 175 Q. But then there is no contact in relation to Garda Keogh
- for the month of August. And then there's no contact

11:53

11:53

11 · 54

- 6 for the month of September, is that right?
- 7 A. Yes, if I haven't it recorded in my diary, it's not
- 8 there.
- 9 176 Q. The calls in October appear to be in relation to what
- 10 we were discussing about Garda John Ryan?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 177 Q. Isn't that right?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 178 Q. So the next call we have where there's a reference to
- Garda Keogh is 11th November 2015, where you inform the 11:53
- 16 welfare service with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy
- 17 that Nicky Keogh were was drinking heavily, is that
- 18 right?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 179 Q. So it would appear from May until 11th November 2015
- there was no contact between you and Detective
- 22 Superintendent Mulcahy concerning the welfare of Garda
- 23 Keogh?
- A. Well, I'd say none that I have recorded, but my
- recollection is that we had frequent interaction but I
- recorded what I recorded and there may be other calls
- but I can't be certain, yeah.
- 28 180 Q. Will you tell us about them, because we will have
- 29 Detective Superintendent Mulcahy in due course?

1		Α.	Absolutely, yeah. My recollection of that time is that	
2			whenever he had an issue in relation to Garda Keogh he	
3			would phone me to let me, as local management, know.	
4			And if it involved a welfare situation, well, we would	
5			discuss that and if there was anything that could be	11:54
6			done to help him outside of the structures that we had	
7			in place with the employee assistance service, that was	
8			it. I was making efforts from July to have a case	
9			conference on Garda Keogh.	
10	181	Q.	We will just come to that in a minute. But all I am	11:54
11			pointing out to you is that you said as a result of	
12			what you believed to have been said in the Dáil on the	
13			1st April, that you decided that you were going to take	
14			a note in relation to your interactions	
15		Α.	Yes.	11:55
16	182	Q.	with Garda Keogh?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	183	Q.	And you appear to have kept a note in relation to your	
19			interactions with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and	
20			Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin?	11:55
21		Α.	On that date, yes.	
22	184	Q.	You have made them all available to us?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
	405	Q.	I am just pointing out, that on the basis of the notes	
24	185	Q.	Tam just pointing out, that on the subject of the notes	
24 25	185	ų.	that you have made available to us of your contacts	11:55
	185	Ψ.		11:55
25	185	Q.	that you have made available to us of your contacts	11:55

29

relation to Garda Keogh between May and the 11th

1 November? 2 That may be the case. The majority of the phone calls Α. 3 that I received were from him to me, because he was liaising very regularly with Garda Keogh at that time. 4 5 186 If we could just then deal with another issue that Q. 11:55 6 again arose out of questions that were asked of you in 7 relation to the referral to the CMO. We know that 8 Garda Keogh saw the CMO on the 19th May? 9 Yes. Α. of 2015. 10 187 Q. 11:56 11 Yes. Α. 12 Did you not get a report back in some form, either from 188 Ο. the CMO or from human resource section? 13 14 Α. And I never got any, I suppose, report back in 15 response to my referral, let's say, as to what had 11:56 16 happened at that meeting or what the views of the CMO 17 were. 18 You had referred --189 Q. 19 Yes. Α. -- in relation to a particular issue? 20 190 0. 11:57 21 Α. 22 And the particular issue you had referred to referred 191 0. 23 on the form to mental health. Which, because of the 24 regulations and the way these things are framed, would 25 have encompassed the work related stress, isn't that 11 · 57 26 right? 27 Yes. Α.

concern in relation to that?

28

29

192

Q.

So that was a referral that you made, because you had a

- 1 A. Yes, I wanted to give support.
- 2 193 Q. It's not a phrase I particularly like but everybody
- 3 seems to be using it, you were using, but you were
- 4 bottoming out a lot of issues. Why didn't you bottom
- 5 that issue out?
- 6 A. Well, I wasn't sure, I suppose, what way the CMO was
- 7 going to deal with that. When I sent the report up on

11:58

11:58

- 8 the 2nd April, it set out the context of Garda Keogh's
- 9 involvement with the confidential -- as a confidential
- 10 reporter. And once that was highlighted, things seemed 11:57
- 11 to get very secretive and I assumed that this may be
- something that had occurred along those lines and
- perhaps that the CMO was dealing with Garda Keogh and I
- 14 didn't make any further enquiries.
- 15 194 Q. What's the normal procedure if you refer somebody to
- the CMO in these circumstances?
- 17 A. The normal procedure --
- 18 195 Q. Have you got an expectation that you are going to
- 19 receive a report back?
- 20 A. The normal procedure is that you would receive a report 11:58
- 21 back. And after the visit of Garda Keogh to the CMO in
- December '15, a report arrived in January of '16.
- 23 196 Q. Just stay with the 19th May for the moment?
- A. No, I am just trying to make a connection, that
- 25 normally that's what happens, yeah.
- 26 197 Q. Well, for instance, you didn't go to Garda Keogh and
- say, how did you get on with the CMO?
- 28 A. I don't recall that, but I do recall him in evidence
- saying that I did ask him when I met him in the

1 corridor one day.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

199

Q.

2 198 Q. Did you make enquiries in relation to the chief 3 superintendent? Did you write any correspondence 4 asking what's emerged?

5 I suppose events moved on, in that in the middle Α. 11:59 6 of April then the employee assistance service came on board. They're directly aligned with the human 7 8 resource section and the occupational health section. And I know that the CMO interacts personally with that 9 10 group of people in relation to issues. And once they 11:59 11 were involved again then, well, you know, he was, I 12 suppose I felt, coming under the care of that 13 specialist section, which involved the occupational 14 health department and the human resource section, which 15 is directly under it's chain of command, the employee 11:59 16 assistance service.

You went through this, and I'm not going to go over it again, but your note of the 26th March indicates that you were somewhat sceptical of the work related stress issue. You note at the end of it, you note that Garda A was in the Garda station, and you had a certain viewpoint in your own mind. You continue to deal with Garda Keogh. Having referred him on this very issue no the CMO, can you explain why it was that you didn't make an enquiry to find out whether or not you were wrong in your view, that there was work related stress, that it wasn't always alcohol related, that there were issues here that had to be addressed, or that there were stress factors at work that had been identified?

11:59

12:00

- 1 Did you not make any enquiries at all?
- 2 A. I have never said there weren't stress factors. And I
- 3 have been very clear, the skepticism that I had was
- 4 about the excuse he was using for the stress, in
- 5 relation to the presence of Garda A in the workplace.

12:01

12:01

12:01

12.02

- 6 And the enquiries or the information, I didn't make
- 7 direct enquiries with the occupational health
- 8 department or the CMO. But again, on 20th May 2015 I
- 9 answered correspondence that came to the chief
- superintendent from Mr. Mulligan, from the HR
- department. And again, in that I sent up certificates
- 12 at this time. So like, more information had now gone
- back up to the occupational health department.
- 14 200 Q. But that related to what you perceived to be your duty
- to investigate thoroughly the issue of work related
- stress. That wasn't concerning the CMO and the CMO's
- 17 observations and recommendations?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 201 Q. But is there any correspondence anywhere from you to
- 20 your authorities asking the question, what is the
- official position coming out of the CMO in relation to
- the condition of Garda Keogh?
- 23 A. There isn't, no.
- 24 202 Q. So we know then that you formed a view in July that
- 25 there should on a case conference, isn't that right?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 203 Q. Yes. You wrote off in relation to that. One wasn't
- 28 held until the 9th December?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 204 Q. Do you know why that was?
- 2 A. I don't.
- 3 205 Q. We have your notes in relation to that, your
- 4 preparatory notes and then subsequently a brief note in
- 5 relation to that. It's at page 2500. I don't need it

12:03

12:03

12:03

- 6 up on the screen. But you were asked questions in
- 7 relation to the notes from the CMO, which are at page
- 8 3646 of the material. Just to identify the issues that
- 9 you are disputing in relation to this, so that we can
- deal with it with future witnesses, as it were. On the 12:03
- right-hand side there's comments that are attributed to
- 12 you, because you were there from local management,
- isn't that right?
- 14 A. This is the -- which meeting is this?
- 15 206 Q. This is the meeting of 9th December 2015?
- 16 A. Okay. Yes, I was indeed.
- 17 207 Q. "Local management observations and actions"?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 208 Q. This is what's noted.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 209 Q. "Management are relaying that there are serious
- concerns over the member's obvious misuse of alcohol,
- which is adversely affecting his ability to do his job
- 24 and his physical presentation."
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 210 Q. "High Level of short-term sickness absences on record."
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 211 Q. "EAS officer observation is that the member needs to
- decide for himself that he needs help and make a

Т			concerted effort to access services to address the	
2			i ssue. "	
3				
4			And then it says:	
5				12:04
6			"Management suggesting medium to long-term support	
7			would be given for a transfer out of Athlone in view of	
8			events that had transpired there, if it is considered	
9			to be beneficial for the member's sustained wellbeing	
10			and effectiveness after he would have come through an	12:04
11			appropriate treatment programme."	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	212	Q.	Do you accept that as being the view that was expressed	
14			by you at the time?	
15		Α.	It was a view expressed by quite a few people,	12:04
16			including the CMO and the HR department, that this was	
17			one of the options.	
18	213	Q.	No, I am just asking you about that. Do you accept	
19			those notes, do you, in relation to that?	
20		Α.	Oh, yeah, absolutely. We all discussed it at that	12:04
21			time.	
22	214	Q.	I thought an issue had arisen	
23		Α.	No, absolutely not.	
24	215	Q.	that you might have been disputing what was recorded	
25			there and I just wanted to give you the opportunity to	12:04
26			deal with it. A matter arose this morning, and if we	
27			could have page 8663 up on the screen. This is going	
28			back to the Tullamore incident. You said yesterday in	
29			evidence and you have said it again in an answer to	

1			Mr. O'Higgins, that you had referred this on for an	
2			independent review, is that right?	
3		Α.	Whatever yeah, like I wanted someone impartial to	
4			have a look at it.	
5	216	Q.	From what perspective did you want them to have a look	12:06
6			at it?	
7		Α.	Because I didn't feel that if there was an issue, that	
8			Garda Keogh would have any faith in my impartiality to	
9			make any decision with regard to any assessment.	
10	217	Q.	With regard to what?	12:06
11		Α.	Whether or not Ms. B was driving around his house or	
12			close to his house on that particular day.	
13	218	Q.	You see, I had asked you questions in relation to this	
14			the day before yesterday?	
15		Α.	Yes.	12:06
16	219	Q.	And I thought that we had agreed on this. First of,	
17			all I thought that we had agreed that your statement in	
18			relation to Garda Keogh's account may lack credibility,	
19			we had agreed that that was based on the fact of the	
20			timeline?	12:07
21		Α.	The timeline, yes.	
22	220	Q.	Yes. But it didn't exclude the possibility and that	
23			was the only reason	
24		Α.	Absolutely, no, I agree that, yeah.	
25	221	Q.	And that was the only basis that you had referred to	12:07

26

27

28

29

this?

Yes.

Α.

222 Q.

Today you have said that he may not have been correct

or he may have made a mistake. But that's not the

Τ			terminology that you have used here. It you look at	
2			the first line:	
3				
4			"It appeared that Garda Keogh's alleged observation	
5			regarding the presence of Ms. B around his home may	12:07
6			lack credibility."	
7				
8			You don't say he might have been mistaken. You don't	
9			say that	
10		Α.	well, that's what I mean by the credibility, you know,	12:07
11			I mean, I may have used the wrong word, but that's what	
12			I mean. The whole thing was you know, the	
13			credibility around the whole thing and	
14	223	Q.	Then we move onto the next line, because you have now	
15			moved away from the actual incident and you're talking	12:07
16			about the creation of the incident?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	224	Q.	"The manner and circumstances under which the incident	
19			was created by Garda Keogh via GISC requires	
20			explanation in that Garda Keogh was off duty and did	12:08
21			not contact Tullamore Garda station at the time of his	
22			alleged observation."	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	225	Q.	"Neither did he report the matter to anyone other than	
25			GI SC. "	12:08
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	226	Q.	"The creation of the incident by Garda Keogh, which he	
28			has intertwined with a whistleblower investigation,	
29			merits further explanation by the member in light of	

1			the clear assertion by Ms. B that her car was at a	
2			garage that afternoon and that neither she nor her car	
3			were in Tullamore."	
4		Α.	Yes. That's my understanding of what her position was.	
5	227	Q.	So what we have now moved on to here is the creation of	12:08
6			the incident by Garda Keogh, isn't that right?	
7		Α.	That's one issue in the incident. That's one issue.	
8			You know, the whole thing has to be taken in context.	
9			That's one issue. That's one part of it, the creation	
10			of it. And then it moves on to the CCTV and there's a	12:09
11			garage man involved.	
12	228	Q.	If we look at the last three lines:	
13				
14			"Therefore, I respectfully suggest that a member of	
15			inspector rank be tasked with carrying out a	12:09
16			fact-finding exercise in relation to the creation of	
17			the incident by Garda Keogh."	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	229	Q.	Now, am I understanding from your evidence	
20			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, could I just make one	12:09
21			observation.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
23			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I appreciate this has been gone	
24			over and Mr. Marrinan has chosen to focus in his	
25			re-direct again on this Tullamore matter. I had	12:09
26			understood that it wasn't intended to accord this to	
27			the status of item number 23 in the list of matters.	
28			It appears to be given focus and emphasis suggestive	
29			that it has been put on the list as a discreet matter	

1 to be inquired into, and I'm not sure that's in 2 accordance with the indication that was given. I just make that observation, Chairman. 3 Well, what do you want me to do about that, 4 5 Mr. O'Higgins? 12:10 MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: well, insofar as Mr. Marrinan 6 7 appears to be intent on dwelling on issue and devoting the balance of the morning to it, I wonder is 8 that appropriate? 9 I think you think Mr. Marrinan is being a 10 230 CHAI RMAN: Q. 12:10 11 bit hard. Maybe he is, but that's his decision. Can I 12 just clarify one thing: I thought the creation of the 13 incident was the creation of the incident on Pulse. 14 Α. Yes. 15 MR. MARRINAN: Yes. 12:10 16 So it's not the creation of the incident in 231 CHAI RMAN: Ο. 17 the sense that -- nobody is suggesting that Garda Keogh 18 made it up? 19 Absolutely not. Oh no. Α. 232 CHAIRMAN: Created the incident. It's the creation of 20 Q. it on Pulse, is that correct? 21 22 Yes. Α. 23 That is the point? 233 MR. MARRINAN: Q. 24 Oh, I didn't get that. No, absolutely not. Α. 25 Mr. O'Higgins is not making an objection, he 12:10 26 is making an observation. There it is, Mr. Marrinan,

let's proceed.

MR. MARRINAN:

27

28

29

simple reason that I dealt with this yesterday --

which I actually utterly reject, for the

- 1 I don't think there's anything that you need CHAI RMAN: 2 to reject, Mr. Marrinan. 3 MR. MARRINAN: Well, I do, and I would like to state my position in relation to it. Because I introduced the 4 5 matter yesterday, I gave what I thought was a very fair 12:11 6 summary of the background and the circumstances without going into the details of the actual report. The chief 7 8 superintendent agreed with that summary that I gave. Mr. O'Higgins revisited the matter today and went 9 10 through all aspects of the report, the report and what 12 · 11 11 was requested. 12 Mr. Marrinan, what can do I to reassure you? CHAI RMAN: 13 MR. MARRINAN: Yes. 14 CHAI RMAN: That your standing is undiminished and that 15 your propriety and expertise are in no way challenged. 12:11 16 There is no criticism of you. I have just rejected it and observed that Mr. O'Higgins' intervention was 17 18 merely an observation. Please proceed, Mr. Marrinan, 19 undimmed and undiminished, undeterred by any 20 interventions. 12:12 What's being investigated here, guite 21 234 MR. MARRINAN: Q. 22 clearly, was Garda Keogh creating this incident on 23 Pulse? 24 Yes. Α. 25 By using the Pulse system? 235 Ο. 12:12 26 Yes. Α.
- 29 237 Q. Instead of reporting the matter to An Garda Síochána?

Himself directly?

27

28

236

Q.

Α.

Yes.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 238 Q. In Tullamore through the normal reporting procedures?
- 3 A. Absolutely.
- 4 239 Q. Isn't that right? That is what was going to be
- 5 investigated --
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 240 Q. -- by the inspector. The actual incident had already

12 · 12

12:13

12:13

- 8 been investigated by you?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 241 Q. And you had determined that it lacked credibility, is
- 11 that right?
- 12 A. Well, I had hoped that the inspector would look at the
- 13 -- take the whole thing in its entirety. The word
- 14 creation there is not me insinuating that the incident
- was created in someone's mind. It was the creation on
- Pulse. But I mean, the job went to a detective
- inspector, a very experienced detective inspector and,
- 18 you know, it'd be normal to look at the whole thing in
- the round, rather than fragmenting it or taking just
- one aspect of it and dealing with that. I mean, these
- are experienced police people and if there is an issue
- like that, the issue has to be looked at in the round.
- 23 242 Q. Now, just one final matter, chief superintendent, and
- it refers the decision to deal with Garda Keogh by way
- of regulation 14 in relation to the absence without
- leave.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 243 Q. I am not entirely sure, I may have misheard you in
- relation to some questions that were asked in relation

Т			to Mr. Kelly, but what's clear from the documentation	
2			is that you had decided to deal by way of regulation 14	
3			before you got the response from Garda Keogh, isn't	
4			that right?	
5		Α.	No. I suppose and I appreciate there's a document	12:14
6			there which says I was going to deal with this under	
7			separate cover. But I was I wanted to see a	
8			response from Garda Keogh. And in my mind, if he had,	
9			I suppose, acknowledged that he needed help, I would	
10			have supplied him with that help and perhaps a	12:14
11			different course would have been taken in consultation	
12			with the chief superintendent. But I had given him an	
13			opportunity to explain, I told him I would. And the	
14			first letter I sent was primarily for the CMO for a	
15			case conference. So I wanted to emphasise that, you	12:14
16			know, this was a serious issue and perhaps to have that	
17			case conference held as quickly as possible.	
18	244	Q.	Okay, it would appear that I was correct, that is your	
19			position. I think if you could just explore that a	
20			little bit more. Page 2227. This is Garda Keogh's	12:15
21			response, 21st July 2015?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	245	Q.	"Sergeant Monaghan, with reference to overleaf, I made	
24			a mistake regarding the reporting unfit for duty, I	
25			thought I was still on sick those days. I apologise	12:15
26			for same. Sick certificate attached. Forwarded for	
27			your information, please."	
28				

29

And that's sent on by Sergeant Monaghan to you, isn't

1			that right?	
2		Α.	That's correct, yeah.	
3	246	Q.	But you had already written a letter to Chief	
4			Superintendent Wheatley. If we could have page 800 up	
5			on the screen, please. Sorry, it's 8800. We have	12:16
6			already opened this. But if we turn over to page 8801,	
7			we note:	
8				
9			"Under separate cover I intend recommending	
10			disciplinary proceedings under regulation 14 commence	12:16
11			against the member for being absent without leave."	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	247	Q.	Then you go on and ask for a case conference. That	
14			seems very clear, that had you already determined that	
15			you were going to deal with him by way of regulation	12:17
16			10?	
17		Α.	I just want to make my position very clear on this.	
18	248	Q.	Regular 14.	
19		Α.	I phoned Garda Keogh on the 15th July, we had a	
20			meaningful conversation around this. He asked me to	12:17
21			ignore it and I said I couldn't and I would ask for an	
22			for an explanation. And I talked to him about having a	
23			case conference. I wanted him to understand that	
24			something needed to be done about this, it had to be	
25			marked. And if it wasn't, I felt it would re-occur	12:17
26			again. I had hoped that Garda Keogh would take	
27			responsibility and perhaps give me some indication or	
28			succour that he was going to deal with his issues. So	
29			when I saw his response I had no hesitation in	

Т			recommending discipline at that stage. The first	
2			report is merely a report to go up to the CMO. It's in	
3			relation to a case conference. I wanted to have that,	
4			the discipline aspect of it, emphasised, when that was	
5			going up there, in order that, I suppose, some account	12:18
6			would be taken of the situation to have a case	
7			conference.	
8	249	Q.	What is the Chairman to make of the statement there	
9			"under separate cover I intend recommending	
10			di sci pl i nary proceedi ng"?	12:18
11		Α.	Just as I have explained it now.	
12	250	Q.	Just finally then, in relation to one matter that	
13			unfortunately I have to return to, just to bring	
14			absolute clarity, that's in relation to the filing	
15			process, all right, and the obligations in relation to	12:18
16			Pulse. Before the introduction by you on 18th August	
17			2015, of your direction in relation to the reporting of	
18			incidents other than creating Pulse entries, what was	
19			in force was your direction of 19th June 2015, in	
20			relation to the investigation and volume of crime and	12:19
21			the accountability process, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	That should be the investigation of volume crime.	
23	251	Q.	Sorry?	
24		Α.	Of volume crime, yes.	
25	252	Q.	So the heading is wrong there, right. A garda	12:19
26			investigates a matter, a matter is reported to a garda.	
27			What's envisaged is that that appears on Pulse, because	
28			that's the primary obligation of the member, is to put	
29			the incident on Pulse, isn't that right?	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 253 Q. He would also have an obligation, if he is an ordinary
- 3 serving member of garda rank, to report the matter to
- 4 his supervising sergeant, isn't that right?
- 5 A. Yes. I suppose that would be something -- depending on 12:20
- 6 how serious the incident was, it depends on the
- 7 incident.
- 8 254 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. Whether something needed to be brought to attention out

12:20

- of the Pulse realm, let's say.
- 11 255 Q. So that was the only obligation at that time, other
- than obviously to investigate the matter.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 256 Q. But that came before the daily PAF meeting?
- 15 A. The Pulse incident would arrive at the daily PAF 12:20
- 16 meeting in the incident summary report.
- 17 257 Q. And then at the PAF meeting a crime file would be sent
- back attached to an e-mail, through the sergeant to the
- 19 member?
- 20 A. Okay. No. What would go back, if there were no leads
- indicated on the incident, if it wasn't going in any
- direction, a request would go by e-mail and be placed
- on an Excel sheet for the member to generate a crime
- 24 file.
- 25 258 Q. Right, okay.
- 26 A. And return that maybe in a six-week period or at the
- end of six weeks.
- 28 259 Q. So that crime file would then be returned to come
- 29 before a future PAF meeting; is that right?

- 1 A. No.
- 2 260 Q. Right.
- 3 A. At that stage, when the crime file would come back in
- 4 then, it would come to either myself or the two
- 5 inspectors to have a look at it, to review and to
- 6 audit, before we would indicate that we would mark it

12.21

12:22

- 7 inactive.
- 8 261 Q. That's what I was going to ask you, does it come back
- 9 in two circumstances; does it come back in the first
- instance where the original PAF meeting have set --
- 11 A. No.
- 12 262 Q. -- a timeline in which it is to come back, or does it
- merely come back with a view to closing the file?
- 14 A. It comes with a view to closing the file, if it's
- 15 submitted in that fashion.
- 16 263 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. And every Monday then, those outstanding files for each
- unit would be reviewed with the sergeant in charge of
- 19 that unit. So whatever ones were outstanding or had
- 20 gone outside of time, would be reviewed from the Excel
- sheet, to ensure things were kept moving. But it would
- 22 be returned back to me to close off.
- 23 264 Q. That was the issue that I had, when you say it had gone
- 24 outside the timeline?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 265 Q. What do you mean by that?
- 27 A. So, at the initial request to submit a crime file, a
- time would be given to allow the member do that and to
- allow him make a few enquiries or whatever enquiries

- were necessary to allow him make a decision on which
 way this was going, whether it was going to be marked
 inactive or whether there were leads to follow and it
 would end in a prosecution.
- 5 266 Q. Is the crime file sent back to you when the deadline is 12:22 passed?
- 7 Again, it's a bit complicated. The Monday reviews Α. 8 would, I suppose, at times interfere with that Excel sheet again outside of the PAF. The PAF meeting only 9 calls maybe for the initial request and then it would 10 12 · 23 11 come into the realm of the two inspectors and I and the 12 mechanism around a weekly Monday meeting with whatever 13 sergeants were working in relation to their issues.
- 14 267 Q. So then you introduce a different procedure in relation
 15 to reporting, with the direction which we see at page 12:23
 16 2121. This concerned the reporting of incidents other
 17 than creating Pulse entries?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 268 Q. In relation to this, again the matter comes before the daily PAF meetings, is that right?

- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 269 Q. Who is it in the first instance who reports the incident to the PAF meeting?
- A. In relation to ones other than Pulse entries or critical or serious incidents.
- 26 270 O. Yes.
- 27 A. That would be generated, I suppose, as a result of
 28 whatever group of people on the team that were at that
 29 incident and primarily it should be the sergeant.

- 1 271 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. But in his absence --
- 3 272 Q. You see, this is what I am not clear about. In the
- 4 actual document itself, it refers twice to two short

12.24

12:25

12:25

12:25

- 5 concise reports?
- 6 A. Mm-hmm.
- 7 273 Q. And we see there, the first line there:

8

- 9 "All incidents of a critical or serious nature must be
- the subject of a short, concise report in addition to
- an entry made on Pulse."
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 274 Q. And then the second paragraph appears to suggest that
- that obligation referred to in paragraph one is placed
- on the sergeant on duty at the time of the incident?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 275 Q. Am I correct in that?
- 18 A. That would primarily be the number one person I would
- 19 expect to provide as much information as possible to
- 20 allow that critical or serious incident get immediate
- attention by an oncoming unit.
- 22 276 Q. So the onus there appears to be put on the sergeant on
- 23 duty?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 277 Q. And in the absence of the sergeant on duty --
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 278 Q. -- the station orderly.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 279 Q. To ascertain from the investigating member --

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 280 Q. -- the details that would go into his or her concise
- 3 report?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 281 Q. Is that right?
- 6 A. Yes, and they're all on the one team, they're all on

12:26

12:26

12:26

- 7 the same team. This is a group of people working
- 8 between two times, who all work together on the same
- 9 team.
- 10 282 Q. So when Sergeant Baker raised the issue in relation to
- 11 the robbery from the person.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 283 Q. And that there was no report, the primary obligation
- 14 would have been on the sergeant in charge?
- 15 A. Yes, of the unit.
- 16 284 Q. Of the unit?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 285 Q. Or alternatively, the station orderly?
- 19 A. Or member in charge of the investigation.
- 20 286 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 287 Q. But is it because Garda Keogh had done a report that it
- was perceived that this had been the report that was
- being sent to the PAF meeting in lieu of a report from
- 25 the sergeant or from the station orderly?
- 26 A. Yes. The main concern was the report lacked
- 27 information and the second concern at that PAF meeting
- was that it hadn't, I suppose, gone in the way it
- should in terms of there had been a gap and this

- incident wasn't picked up on, and our investigative process didn't kick into place immediately.
- 3 288 Q. That is not really what I am asking you.
- 4 A. Okay.
- I am asking you, was it perceived that in some way that 12:27
 Garda Keogh's report had, as it were, bypassed the
 sergeant in charge, bypassed the station orderly and
 come in the guise of a report that was anticipated in
 this?
- I mean, the information is what's important, 10 Α. No. 12.27 11 not who generates the report really. And so, if the 12 sergeant had delegated this function to someone on his 13 unit, will you draw up a report for me there and just, 14 you know, send it in, or e-mail it or whatever was 15 required, there would be no problem with that. 12:27 16 about getting the information and I suppose as much information as possible. 17
- 18 290 Q. But were there any queries raised at the time in 19 relation to why the sergeant in charge or the station 20 orderly hadn't sent in a report?
- A. I presume there was no sergeant on that night and there
 were no enquiries generated in that way. This is
 something that's not new, this is in chapter 33 of the
 Garda Code, this type of reporting for critical or
 serious incidents. And I am merely, I suppose, trying
 to make that fit, to highlight good work and to try and
 fit it into the mechanism we were creating.

28 291 Q. You understand, why was Garda Keogh in the circumstance 29 where the obligation is placed on the sergeant in

1		charge or the station orderly, why was Garda Keogh the	
2		subject-matter of criticism in relation to his report,	
3		when it should have come from one of those two others	
4		gardaí?	
5	Α.	It lacked detail, number one. And secondly, I suppose,	12:29
6		I believe there was no sergeant on duty that night.	
7		That was my understanding I think at the time.	
8		MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much.	
9			
10		END OF EXAMINATION	12:29
11			
12		CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thank you very much chief	
13		superintendent.	
14		WITNESS: Thank you Chairman.	
15		CHAIRMAN: We will in due course return to the	12:29
16		outstanding question but that deals with all of those	
17		issues, whatever they are, from number 5 to, I forget	
18		what the number is. So thank you very much, indeed.	
19		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, excuse me, could I	
20		interrupt you. Could I just bring one matter to your	12:29
21		attention, which is not of any importance.	
22		CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
23		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: It's a matter, it's proper that	
24		I correct, an error was made by me yesterday.	
25		CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	12:29
26		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: In case it leads to inadvertent	
27		follow on effects, it's proper I correct it. I wonder,	
28		Chairman, could I call up page 14895 of the system for	
29		a moment, to correct this.	

1	CHAIRMAN: Document 14 shall we leave the chief	
2	superintendent where he is?	
3	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: No, it's not related to the	
4	chief superintendent.	
5	CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. I am sure you will be	12:30
6	relieved to be finished.	
7		
8	THE WITNESS STOOD DOWN	
9		
10	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So you have the number, 14895.	12:30
11	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: 14895. I will just explain why	
12	I need to correct this. In the course of my asking	
13	questions of Chief Superintendent Murray, this document	
14	came up on the screen, I asked for it to be put up on	
15	the screen.	12:30
16	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
17	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: You see the second paragraph	
18	down, there is a reference to Garda X and Garda Y.	
19	CHAIRMAN: You said Garda X was Garda Keogh.	
20	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: That's exactly right. I was	12:30
21	wrong in that.	
22	CHAIRMAN: It's Garda Y is Garda Keogh.	
23	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: It's Garda Y. Nothing really	
24	turns on that, save that as there are other references	
25	to Garda X elsewhere in the materials	12:31
26	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much point for pointing that	
27	out. Thank you very much. I had noted that you had	
28	identified or mentioned that that was the situation.	
29	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: So apologies for that, it was	

T	inadvertent.	
2	CHAIRMAN: No, no problem. Consider it corrected then,	
3	we all know where we are. Okay. So thank you very	
4	much. Right. That's the end of that phase of the	
5	Tribunal. We will resume our hearings on the 20th	2:31
6	January 2020, at 10:30.	
7		
8	Now, because of the efficiency of our officer manager,	
9	Mr. Barnes, the parties can leave their papers here and	
10	they will be secure. So you don't have to take them	2:31
11	away with you, obviously you are free to take them away	
12	with you, but they will be secure here over the holiday	
13	period. Mr. Barnes can be contacted over the period in	
14	case parties wish to have access to the room. But	
15	otherwise it will be locked and secure and so on. So	2:32
16	that I think is the facility. And thank you very much	
17	indeed, Mr. Barnes, take a bow for that facility. I am	
18	sure the parties will be relieved and pleased to have	
19	that.	
20	12	2:32
21	So, nothing more then than to adjourn and wish	
22	everybody a happy Christmas and New Year and we look	
23	forward to seeing you back here on the 20th. Thank you	
24	very much.	
25	12	2:32
26	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL MONDAY, 20TH JANUARY	
27	2020 AT 10: 30AM	
28		

		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	2	2352 [1] - 34:3	5	36:18, 40:16, 46:19,
		2357 [1] - 33:11		48:20, 53:4, 54:18,
		2366 [1] - 32:13		56:10, 61:1, 67:20,
'14 [1] - 54:15	2 [3] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:6	2367 [1] - 32:12	5 [2] - 3:4, 83:17	67:23, 68:24, 71:19,
'15 [2] - 54:15, 63:22	20 [1] - 3:12	2368 [2] - 35:8	51 [1] - 2:18	71:24, 73:3
'16 [4] - 40:29, 42:8,	2005 [2] - 16:9, 17:5	2369 [1] - 35:15	54 [1] - 5:6	AC [1] - 46:27
56:11, 63:22	2007 [2] - 15:7, 31:22	23rd [3] - 10:15,	56 [1] - 5:7	accelerated [1] -
'17 [1] - 46:25	2014 [2] - 1:3, 54:11	12:22, 13:23	5th [3] - 23:21,	34:15
'serious' [1] - 10:18	2015 [15] - 9:9,	24 [1] - 3:14	24:23, 24:28	accept [2] - 67:13,
'the [1] - 10:17	10:13, 10:15, 18:18,	2498 [2] - 55:23		67:18
	18:19, 32:3, 32:18,	24th [3] - 38:28,	6	access [2] - 67:1,
1	60:15, 60:20, 62:10,	44:15, 45:10		85:14
	65:8, 66:15, 74:21,	25 [1] - 3:14	6 rol 2.5 5.5	accord [2] - 47:29,
4 2.2	76:17, 76:19	2500 [1] - 66:5	6 [2] - 3:5, 5:5	70:26
1 [1] - 3:2	2016 [11] - 31:5,	2529 [1] - 56:13	6176 [1] - 38:27	accordance [2] -
10 [2] - 3:7, 75:16	31:15, 38:28, 39:19,	2531 [1] - 45:15	6180 [1] - 37:1	21:11, 71:2
10:30 [1] - 85:6	40:29, 41:20, 42:7,	2537 [1] - 44:12	6181 [1] - 37:2	account [9] - 8:12,
10:30AM [1] - 85:27	42:11, 44:15, 45:6,	26 [1] - 3:15	6TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1	11:27, 15:4, 16:5,
10th [2] - 26:26,	45:20	2647 [1] - 42:29		16:16, 16:21, 29:9,
30:24	2017 [10] - 1:5, 1:9,	26th [2] - 59:6, 64:18	7	68:18, 76:5
11 [1] - 3:7	42:20, 42:21, 43:1,	27 [1] - 3:15		accountability [3] -
11-13 [1] - 3:32	43:27, 44:7, 46:21,	27th [2] - 31:3, 58:10	7 [3] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5	29:26, 53:6, 76:21
11th [3] - 60:15,	46:29, 47:7	28 [1] - 3:16	7am [2] - 26:28,	accused [1] - 40:12
60:20, 61:29	2018 [7] - 1:9, 47:12,	28/10/15 [1] - 34:9	27:25	acknowledged [1] -
12 [3] - 3:8, 4:5,	49:14, 49:20, 51:9,	28th [2] - 32:18,	7th [1] - 33:21	74:9
10:10	51:11, 55:9	32:20		acknowledging [2] -
127 [1] - 1:18	2019 [3] - 1:18, 6:2,	29 [1] - 3:17	8	17:27, 36:15
12th [1] - 27:14	51:25	2968 [1] - 51:29		ACT [2] - 1:3, 1:8
13 [3] - 2:31, 3:8,	2020 [2] - 85:6, 85:27	29th [2] - 12:15, 17:3		Act [5] - 15:5, 16:9,
57:15	20th [5] - 45:20,	2nd [5] - 13:21,	8 [3] - 3:6, 3:28,	16:10, 17:5, 37:22
133 [1] - 10:8	57:25, 65:8, 85:5,	14:24, 22:29, 25:24,	57:15	act [1] - 16:16
13th [4] - 6:19,	85:23	63:8	800 [1] - 75:4	acted [2] - 29:16,
10:12, 11:16, 57:24	20TH [1] - 85:26	00.0	8663 [1] - 67:27	40:18
14 [8] - 3:9, 31:10,	21 [1] - 3:12	3	8800 [1] - 75:5	acting [1] - 42:26
31:21, 73:25, 74:2,	2121 [1] - 79:16	3	8801 [1] - 75:6	ACTING [2] - 3:7,
75:10, 75:18, 84:1	21st [4] - 31:14, 34:5,		8th [2] - 24:24, 54:11	3:13
14895 [3] - 83:28,	58:1, 74:21	3 [1] - 3:3		action [2] - 1:27,
84:10, 84:11	22 [1] - 3:13	30 [1] - 3:17	9	28:3
14th [2] - 7:10, 30:10	2227 [1] - 74:20	31 [1] - 3:18		actions [2] - 15:12,
15 [1] - 3:9	229 [1] - 6:18	32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18	0 ros 2.6 E7.1E	66:17
15823 [1] - 46:5	23 [2] - 3:13, 70:27	33 [2] - 3:19, 82:23	9 [2] - 3:6, 57:15	actively [1] - 29:2
15th [4] - 44:7,	2308 [6] - 12:12,	34 [1] - 3:19	9th [3] - 25:19,	activity [1] - 38:2
46:29, 48:28, 75:19	13:9, 14:21, 14:24,	35 [1] - 3:20	65:28, 66:15	actual [4] - 69:15,
16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10	14:26, 16:22	36 [1] - 3:20	Λ	72:7, 73:7, 80:4
17 [4] - 1:9, 3:10,	2309 [2] - 14:23,	3646 [1] - 66:8	Α	added [1] - 18:12
22:23, 22:25	14:25	37 [1] - 3:21		adding [1] - 13:18
17:53 [1] - 34:9	2312 [1] - 13:12	38 [1] - 3:21	A's [4] - 28:2, 28:28,	addition [2] - 24:8,
17:55 [1] - 34:27	2313 [1] - 7:29	39 [4] - 3:22, 15:4,	30:6, 30:25	80:10
18 [1] - 3:11	2324 [1] - 24:12	16:9, 17:5	abide [1] - 53:7	additional [3] - 9:4,
18th [2] - 15:18,	2325 [1] - 23:27	3rd [1] - 51:25	ability [1] - 66:23	11:7, 12:20
76:16	2326 [1] - 24:1		able [1] - 11:9	address [1] - 67:1
19 [1] - 3:11	2328 [1] - 24:14	4	above-named [1] -	addressed [1] -
19/5 [1] - 45:29	2329 [1] - 25:1	-	1:26	64:28
1921 [1] - 1:9	2330 [1] - 25:22	4 0.40 0.4	absence [4] - 39:17,	adequacy [1] - 9:28
1997 [1] - 37:22	2333 [1] - 26:15	4 [2] - 2:19, 3:4	73:25, 80:2, 80:25	adjective[1] - 8:6
19th [8] - 41:20,	2334 [1] - 26:23	43 [1] - 57:16	absences [1] - 66:26	adjourn [1] - 85:21
42:11, 47:1, 49:20,	2336 [1] - 28:6	438 [1] - 55:22	absent [1] - 75:11	ADJOURNED [1] -
62:8, 63:23, 76:19	2337 [1] - 28:24	4am [1] - 6:28	absolute [1] - 76:14	85:26
1st [4] - 57:10, 57:19,	2339 [1] - 31:13	4th [2] - 42:21, 42:29	absolutely [17] -	ADMINISTRATIVE
59:3, 61:13	2340 [1] - 31:13		10:1, 11:2, 12:24,	[1] - 3:14

adversely [1] - 66:23 advice [1] - 58:25 advised [1] - 15:3 advising [1] - 36:21 **affair** [1] - 29:8 Affairs [1] - 29:27 affecting [1] - 66:23 afternoon [5] -25:24, 26:18, 26:22, 45:29, 70:2 afterwards [1] -24:26 ago [1] - 24:6 agree [1] - 68:24 agreed [4] - 68:16, 68:17, 68:19, 72:8 agreement [2] -40:15, 52:7 **AGSI**[1] - 4:1 AIDAN [2] - 3:9, 4:3 Aidan [1] - 46:7 **AISLING** [2] - 2:11, **ALAN**[2] - 3:9, 3:13 alcohol [2] - 64:27, 66:22 alerted [1] - 48:28 aligned [1] - 64:7 **ALISON** [1] - 3:26 alive [1] - 11:9 allegation [4] - 11:1, 20:29, 21:8, 40:13 allegations [3] -20:12, 25:8, 44:3 alleged [5] - 11:13, 15:16, 38:10, 69:4, 69.22 allow [10] - 9:19, 10:28, 11:26, 16:6, 18:12, 38:21, 78:28, 78:29, 79:1, 80:20 allowed [1] - 27:12 allowing [2] - 7:20, 8.29 alternatively [1] -81:18 **AMENDED**[1] - 1:9 amount [1] - 9:14 AN [1] - 3:2 analysed [1] - 28:21 **analysis** [2] - 9:1, 18:12 **AND** [4] - 1:3, 1:4, 1:8, 3:15 and.. [1] - 69:13 **ANDREW** [2] - 2:22, **ANNE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 answer [5] - 9:6, 15:17, 57:5, 67:29

answered [3] -45:29, 54:28, 65:9 **ANTHONY** [1] - 3:6 anticipated [3] -29:19, 45:11, 82:8 anxious [3] - 51:18, 51:19, 55:16 anyway [5] - 19:5, 22:27, 30:26, 51:8, 52:20 apologies [2] -13:12, 84:29 apologise [1] - 74:25 APPEAL [2] - 1:13, 2:3 appear [8] - 9:26, 57:14, 59:16, 59:19, 60:9, 60:20, 61:18, 74:18 APPEARANCES[1] appeared [4] - 33:1, 34:11, 34:21, 69:4 appendix [1] - 39:1 application [1] -22.20 applies [1] - 15:5 appoint [1] - 46:27 appointing [1] - 44:1 appointment [2] -47:5, 47:16 appreciate [5] - 9:3, 41:7, 51:6, 70:23, 74:5 approach [2] - 40:5, 45.11 appropriate [5] -

12:23, 18:3, 38:21,

April [10] - 57:10,

57:20, 57:24, 57:25,

58:1, 58:10, 59:3,

61:13, 63:8, 64:6

area [8] - 25:16,

27:24, 31:26, 34:28,

37:24, 38:1, 39:21,

arise [1] - 8:22

arisen [1] - 67:22

35:27, 37:1, 57:20

arose [3] - 57:2,

ARRAN[1] - 2:24

arrive [2] - 54:15,

arrived [5] - 30:12,

54:16, 54:29, 55:9,

arrangements [1] -

62:6, 67:26

24:21

77:15

arising [4] - 27:18,

41:2

67:11, 71:9

63:22

AS [5] - 1:9, 6:1,

29:3, 34:28, 80:29

73:20, 76:4

50.19

68:9

aspect [3] - 43:11,

aspects [1] - 72:10

assailants [2] - 8:13,

assertion [1] - 70:1

assessment [1] -

assist [5] - 8:21,

assistance [4] -

42:28, 61:7, 64:6,

8:26, 9:18, 17:2, 26:6

aspersions [1] -

ascertain [4] - 25:14,

6:12, 54:6, 56:28

64:16 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Assistant [20] -21:10, 21:14, 21:16, 21:19, 21:27, 42:23, 43:28, 44:1, 46:25, 47:4, 47:10, 47:16, 49:23, 51:12, 51:15, 51:23, 52:17, 57:21, 61:20, 61:26 assistant [2] - 21:16, 29:25 assisted [2] - 26:18, 49.23 assisting [1] - 18:5 associated [1] -27:23 associations [1] -51:27 assume [1] - 52:16 assumed [1] - 63:11 assumption [1] -40:7 assured [1] - 14:29 **AT**[1] - 85:27 **ATHLONE** [1] - 3:32 Athlone [12] - 18:20, 30:5, 30:9, 32:24, 34:5, 37:16, 38:13, 49:26, 53:13, 54:14, 59:11, 67:7 attach [1] - 33:15 attached [5] - 14:1, 27:8, 39:1, 74:26, 77:18 attempt [1] - 34:15 attended [1] - 39:10 attention [8] - 7:19,

39:7, 77:9, 80:21, 83:21 attributed [1] - 66:11 audit [1] - 78:6 August [4] - 15:18, 59:22, 60:5, 76:16 authorities [1] -65:20 authority [1] - 15:22 autumn [2] - 47:7, 55:9 available [6] - 10:3, 17:22, 18:10, 38:11, 61:22, 61:25 await [1] - 15:12 aware [10] - 16:6, 18:23, 26:3, 27:19, 28:28, 30:14, 30:21, 40:13, 55:1, 55:3 awful [1] - 39:23

В

bad [1] - 58:13

BAR [1] - 2:31

85:13 85:17

BE [1] - 6:11

bear [1] - 41:11

beat [1] - 10:19

beg [1] - 37:2

18:18, 18:19

50:29

55.8

81:8

beginning [2] -

best [3] - 9:19, 27:4,

better [2] - 51:4, 56:4

between [8] - 23:8,

24:23, 26:3, 59:17,

bias [3] - 14:18,

19:10, 36:1

59:20, 60:21, 61:29,

Baker [2] - 7:12,

72:6

81:10

68:19

68:25

blank [6] - 26:3, 31:20, 34:10, 34:12, 34:16 **blank]** [1] - 34:13 blanked [1] - 6:28 blanket [1] - 21:18 blunt [1] - 52:19 board [1] - 64:7 **body** [1] - 18:1 bottom [7] - 11:9, 28:26, 31:15, 32:15, 32:22, 46:9, 63:4 **bottoming** [1] - 63:4 bow [1] - 85:17 Bowen's [1] - 34:26 B's [2] - 38:9, 38:13 **box** [1] - 49:8 background [1] breaches [1] - 25:8 **BRIAN** [2] - 3:15, 3.16 **bridge** [1] - 34:25 brief [4] - 33:23, **balance** [1] - 71:8 37:19, 53:29, 66:4 briefly [4] - 23:27, Barnes [3] - 85:9, 25:2, 32:2, 51:28 bring [6] - 36:18, based [2] - 28:1, 45:1, 45:27, 76:13, 83:20 basis [2] - 61:24, **bringing** [3] - 16:19, 44:11. 57:27 **BASTION**[1] - 3:31 brought [4] - 7:16, 35:25, 43:16, 77:9 building [1] - 43:22 bullying [4] - 15:9, become [2] - 55:1, 44:6, 46:27, 47:17 button [1] - 30:25 **BY** [16] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 3:30, 4:5, 5:5, behind [2] - 34:18, 5:6, 5:7, 6:12, 54:6, 56:27 belonging [1] - 27:21 bypassed [2] - 82:6, **beneficial** [1] - 67:9

big [2] - 36:10, 45:27

bit [10] - 6:23, 12:13,

18:9, 18:11, 20:4,

74:20, 79:7

3:30. 4:4

20:20, 38:25, 71:11,

BL [12] - 2:7, 2:10,

2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28,

2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25,

C

CAGNEY [1] - 3:17 calibre [1] - 18:12 canal [2] - 32:29, 34:24 canvassed [2] -

16:19, 26:8, 37:7,

31:27, 49:9 17:1, 17:24, 18:23, capacity [1] - 44:21 20:27, 22:15, 22:23, capture [1] - 9:15 29:14, 31:25, 32:1, 39:21, 40:24, 41:21, captured [1] - 11:23 car [10] - 32:29, 33:2, 42:8, 46:29, 47:22, 49:10, 50:25, 51:1, 34:15, 34:17, 34:24, 51:17, 52:1, 52:6, 37:20, 37:23, 38:9, 52:22, 53:4, 57:8, 70:1, 70:2 70:20, 71:3, 76:8, care [1] - 64:12 83:14, 83:19, 83:28 careful [1] - 15:3 CARR [1] - 3:15 chairman [2] - 47:24, **CARRICK**[1] - 2:13 48:10 CHAIRMAN [94] -CARRICK-ON-1:12, 6:4, 6:8, 13:21, **SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 14:10, 18:26, 18:29, carried [6] - 26:5, 19:3, 19:5, 19:11, 27:20, 28:12, 34:27, 19:15, 19:18, 19:20, 37:29, 40:24 19:25, 19:28, 20:3, **CARROLL** [1] - 2:16 20:9, 20:16, 20:23, carry [4] - 37:3, 44:2, 20:26, 21:3, 21:6, 46:27, 47:16 21:15, 21:25, 21:29, carrying [2] - 25:28, 22:12, 22:18, 22:25, 70:15 22:27, 30:26, 30:28, cars [1] - 27:13 31:1, 39:25, 39:28, CARTHAGE[1] -40:3, 41:4, 41:8, 2:17 41:11, 41:16, 42:7, case [27] - 7:10, 8:3, 42:9, 42:12, 47:13, 9:14. 9:18. 10:12. 47:18, 47:20, 47:23, 15:2, 18:17, 20:5, 47:29, 48:17, 48:20, 29:29, 31:19, 35:3, 48:23, 48:27, 49:7, 38:27, 40:28, 43:26, 49:12, 49:27, 50:2, 47:12, 49:14, 61:8, 50:5, 50:14, 50:27, 62:2, 65:25, 74:15, 51:4, 52:12, 52:23, 74:17, 75:13, 75:23, 53:15, 53:20, 53:25, 76:3, 76:6, 83:26, 54:1, 54:3, 54:21, 85:14 54:24, 54:26, 55:10, castings [1] - 50:19 55:18, 55:20, 56:24,**CASTLE** [1] - 1:17 70:22, 71:4, 71:10, category [1] - 49:8 71:16, 71:20, 71:25, 80:3 caused [1] - 36:5 72:1, 72:12, 72:14, causes [1] - 29:4 83:12. 83:15. 83:22. causing [1] - 34:17 83:25 84:1 84:5 **CCTV** [7] - 8:12, 84:10, 84:16, 84:19, 11:24, 11:26, 36:4, 84:22, 84:26, 85:2 37:29, 38:2, 70:10 challenged [1] centre [2] - 33:3, 72.15 34:11 **chance** [1] - 28:22 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 chapter [1] - 82:23 certain [9] - 18:19, charge [9] - 7:12, 21:10, 24:15, 28:10, 7:26, 27:7, 78:18, 30:2, 33:11, 36:20, 81:14, 81:19, 82:7, 60:27, 64:21 82:19 83:1 certainly [3] - 19:2, charges [1] - 31:6 19:5. 48:9 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:5 certificate [1] - 74:26 CHEALLACHÁIN[1] certificates [1] --2:3065:11 checked [1] - 11:24 certify [1] - 1:24 Chief [9] - 24:27, **chain** [1] - 64:15 28:3, 28:5, 29:24, Code [1] - 82:24 Chairman [35] - 6:7, 31:14, 38:28, 55:8, coffee [1] - 43:22 6:21, 7:9, 8:22, 14:11,

59:5, 75:3 chief [37] - 6:5, 11:6, 17:2, 19:28, 20:12, 22:8, 22:29, 25:20, 26:11, 28:8, 29:18, 29:20, 36:28, 40:22, 41:12, 41:18, 48:6, 48:7, 48:15, 48:29, 50:11, 50:20, 51:26, 52:26, 54:8, 54:27, 59:9, 64:2, 65:9, 72:7, 73:23, 74:12, 83:12, 84:1, 84:4, 84:13 CHIEF [18] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27, 5:3, 6:11, 54:5, 56:27 chosen [1] - 70:24 Christmas [1] -85:22 **cider** [1] - 44:25 circumstance [1] -82.28 circumstances [5] -31:19, 63:16, 69:18, 72:6, 78:9 **clarify** [1] - 71:12 clarity [2] - 33:22, 76:14 **clash** [1] - 48:8 class [1] - 19:9 classification [1] -12.6 clear [12] - 16:4, 21:17, 29:22, 43:19, 59:1, 59:3, 65:3, 70:1, 74:1, 75:14, 75:17, clearly [3] - 12:15, 19:13, 72:22 **Clifford** [1] - 45:25 clipped [1] - 14:4 **close** [4] - 37:24, 52:20, 68:12, 78:22 closing [2] - 78:13, 78:14 clothes [2] - 27:25, 27:28 CMO [19] - 39:15, 62:7, 62:8, 62:13, 62:16, 63:6, 63:13, 63:16, 63:21, 63:27, 64:9, 64:24, 65:8, 65:16, 65:21, 66:7, 67:16, 74:14, 76:2 CMO's [1] - 65:16 CO [2] - 2:13, 4:1

coincidence [2] -35:22, 36:9 coming [5] - 7:19, 26:8, 49:5, 64:12, 65:21 command [1] - 64:15 commence [1] -75:10 commenced [2] -31:10. 57:9 commendations [3] - 39:24, 40:11, 40:12 commensurate [2] -15:26, 53:11 **comment** [1] - 13:26 commentary [1] comments [1] -**COMMISSIONER** [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Commissioner [27] -21:10, 21:14, 21:17, 21:19, 21:27, 38:28, 39:3, 42:24, 42:27, 43:14, 43:15, 43:28, 44:2, 45:28, 46:26, 47:5, 47:10, 47:16, 49:24, 51:12, 51:15, 51:23, 52:17, 57:22, 57:28, 61:20, 61:27 commissioner [2] -21:16, 29:26 communicated [2] -24:5, 26:9 communication [1] -51:11 communications [1] - 55:2 **COMPANY**[1] - 2:22 complaint [7] -15:24, 15:29, 16:7, 37:20, 52:13, 52:14, 54.10 complaints [3] -37:7, 39:7, 43:16 completed [1] -51:14 completeness [1] -26:16 complicated [1] -79:7

complied [2] - 15:18,

comprehensive [1] -

comprehend [1] -

52:2

11:14

computer [2] -12:15, 28:21 concern [5] - 45:10, 59:24, 62:29, 81:26, 81.27 concerned [9] - 7:17, 20:4, 35:28, 35:29, 36:24, 42:5, 56:17, 58:7, 79:16 concerning [12] -6:16, 23:7, 41:22, 42:23, 44:9, 45:16, 46:21, 46:22, 57:24, 59:14, 60:22, 65:16 concerns [4] - 18:16, 29:4, 37:23, 66:22 concerted [1] - 67:1 concession [2] -40:1. 40:7 concise [3] - 80:5, 80:10, 81:2 conclude [1] - 52:25 concludes [1] -39:20 conclusion [4] -36:19, 39:5, 39:8, 43:17 condemnation [1] -21:18 condition [1] - 65:22 conference 181 -61:9, 65:25, 74:15, 74:17, 75:13, 75:23, 76:3, 76:7 confidential [3] -23:7, 63:9 conflating [1] - 14:16 confuse [2] - 15:23, confusion [1] - 22:1 **CONLON** [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT [1] -3:32 connected [1] -37:20 connection [1] -63:24 CONNELLAN[2] -3:30, 3:30 **CONOR** [1] - 3:24 conscious [1] - 54:2 consider [1] - 85:2 consideration [1] **considered** [1] - 67:8 construe [1] - 17:25 consultation [1] -74.11

contact [10] - 24:20,

57:9, 57:19, 57:21,

59:22, 60:4, 60:5, 76:18, 79:17, 82:27 51:2 61:21 57:14, 74:11, 79:14 60:21, 61:28, 69:21 creation [12] - 37:17, **DAVID** [2] - 2:28, department [5] difficult [3] - 12:13, contacted [2] -69:16, 69:27, 70:5, 3:18 64:14, 65:8, 65:11, 48:3, 50:19 70:9, 70:16, 71:12, **DAVIS** [1] - 2:8 49:21, 85:13 65:13, 67:16 difficulties [2] - 29:5, contacts [3] - 57:7, 71:13, 71:16, 71:20, **Deputy** [1] - 43:14 29.6 **DAY** [1] - 1:18 73:14, 73:15 57:11, 61:25 days [6] - 7:8, 29:20, Dermot [1] - 38:16 dig [1] - 41:28 credibility [5] -29:22, 29:23, 47:9, content [1] - 39:26 describe [1] - 23:9 **DIGNAM**[1] - 3:24 68:18, 69:6, 69:10, contest [1] - 48:13 74:25 described [3] direct [6] - 22:9, 69:13, 73:10 context [3] - 20:28, de [1] - 12:6 10:24, 11:3, 52:27 22:16, 24:24, 37:25, crime [14] - 6:15, 65:7, 70:25 63:8. 70:8 deadline [1] - 79:5 description [6] continue [2] - 15:25, 13:3, 14:19, 15:2, directed [6] - 16:15, deal [23] - 16:5, 8:13, 10:16, 15:16, 64:22 27:24, 76:20, 76:22, 16:28, 19:27, 32:2, 17:28, 35:3, 35:4 22:16, 33:10, 38:16, CONTINUED [1] -76:24, 77:17, 77:23, 32:9, 40:21, 40:22, descriptive [2] -48:21, 53:2 77:28, 78:3, 78:27, 6:11 41:6, 44:8, 47:26, 11:29, 12:1 direction [6] - 11:25, continued [1] - 57:11 52:3, 53:11, 62:5, deserved [1] - 10:25 34:25, 76:17, 76:19, critical [4] - 79:25, 63:7, 64:22, 66:10, 77:22, 79:15 contrary [1] - 11:13 desk [5] - 14:20, 80:9, 80:20, 82:24 67:26, 73:24, 74:2, conversation [10] -52:29, 53:1, 53:10, directly [7] - 22:12, criticism [4] - 11:10, 74:6, 75:15, 75:28 55:20 47:21, 48:12, 52:9, 42:19, 43:5, 46:7, 19:22, 72:16, 83:2 dealing [7] - 6:14, 64:7, 64:15, 72:27 46:16, 46:17, 49:15, **DESMOND**[1] - 4:3 **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 criticisms [1] - 12:25 14:15, 40:20, 49:15, 54:14, 58:2, 58:26, despite [2] - 22:4, cross [1] - 57:2 58:25, 63:13, 73:20 DIRECTORATE[1] -75:20 38:8 conversations [1] -CROSS [2] - 5:6, dealings [3] - 26:14, detail [7] - 8:26, 3:15 42:18 54:5 30:15, 40:25 8:28, 9:4, 23:9, 23:10, dirt [1] - 41:28 cross-examination deals [4] - 12:6, 39:5, Coppinger [1] - 22:4 32:15, 83:5 disciplinary [3] -[1] - 57:2 39:17. 83:16 31:6, 75:10, 76:10 COPPINGER [1] detailed [1] - 11:8 **CROSS-EXAMINED** dealt [10] - 7:17, details [7] - 6:28, 3.4 discipline [7] - 15:7, correct [24] - 7:13, [2] - 5:6, 54:5 7:22, 11:18, 21:12, 9:7, 11:24, 12:18, 25:7, 25:9, 29:21, **CUALÁIN** [1] - 3:7 23:4, 23:18, 26:27, 31:21, 32:8, 37:21, 36:16, 72:7, 81:2 31:9, 76:1, 76:4 Cualáin [18] - 18:16, 53:9, 55:18, 71:29 29:14, 31:6, 31:23, detective [3] - 25:16, **Discipline** [1] - 31:22 18:27, 19:13, 20:21, debated [1] - 41:14 31:25, 41:25, 45:21, 73:16, 73:17 disclosed [3] - 33:4, 51:17, 52:17, 52:18, 21:13, 21:14, 21:20, DECEMBER [3] -**Detective** [28] - 22:3, 51:22, 56:7 56:9, 56:18, 68:28, 21:27, 22:25, 23:3, 1:9, 1:18, 6:2 23:16, 23:22, 24:11, disclosure [2] -23:11, 42:24, 42:27, 71:21, 74:18, 75:2, December [7] -24:16, 24:20, 26:1, 46:13, 49:25 43:15, 45:2, 57:22, 80:17, 83:24, 83:27, 33:21, 34:5, 51:9, 26:4, 26:17, 27:20, DISCLOSURES [2] -61:20, 61:27 51:11, 63:22, 65:28, 83:29 84:12 28:12, 28:19, 28:29, 1:2. 1:3 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 corrected [1] - 85:2 66:15 31:2, 35:21, 57:7, disclosures [2] -Curley [1] - 46:12 decide [3] - 22:28, correctly [1] - 17:26 57:23, 58:3, 58:18, 21:1, 21:5 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 correctness [1] -48:13, 66:29 58:29, 59:28, 60:16, discredit [2] - 36:17, **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 decided [3] - 43:6, 60:21, 60:29, 61:19, curtail [1] - 20:23 61:13, 74:2 61:26, 61:28 correspondence [7] discredited [1] -- 28:7, 32:4, 37:15, decision [9] - 27:27, **DETECTIVE** [5] - 3:4, 40.17 43:27, 64:3, 65:9, D 28:2, 29:27, 36:27, 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17 discrediting [2] -65:19 53:8, 68:9, 71:11, determined [2] -21:2, 53:2 73:24 79:1 73:10, 75:14 **corridor** [1] - 64:1 discreet [1] - 70:29 D/Branch [1] - 7:4 developing [1] decision-making [1] Corruption [1] discrete [1] - 20:2 D/Commissioner [1] - 53.8 27:18 37:22 discuss [3] - 27:14, 45:1 COSTELLO [1] decisions [3] -**DEVELOPMENT**[1] 59:1, 61:5 D/Superintendent 27:17, 52:26, 53:1 - 3:16 discussed 131 -[1] - 26:6 couple [1] - 28:6 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:5 development [3] -41:14, 44:10, 67:20 daily [5] - 7:11, declared [1] - 40:8 25:13, 27:22, 46:21 course [8] - 28:3, discussing [2] -37:15, 77:14, 77:15, 30:7, 30:18, 41:14, definitive [2] - 38:10, developments [4] -59:23, 60:10 79:20 60:29, 74:11, 83:15, 38:22 26:8, 28:1, 29:12, discussion [2] -Daly [1] - 41:29 degree [2] - 15:21, 52:28 84:12 7:14, 8:22 damage [2] - 42:1, **COURT** [3] - 1:13, 35:27 devoting [1] - 71:7 discussions [1] -43:8 delegated [2] -**DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 2:3, 3:31 danger [1] - 29:6 cover [4] - 39:28, 29:21, 82:12 diary [3] - 57:13, dispatch [1] - 32:10 darkness [1] - 13:19 deleted [1] - 24:3 59:26, 60:7 74:7, 75:9, 76:9 **disputing** [2] - 66:9, date [8] - 12:13, created [4] - 32:6, deliberately [1] difference [1] - 52:14 67:24 13:18, 17:1, 32:18, 69:19, 71:20, 73:15 21:27 different [7] - 31:26, disrespect [1] -32:20, 42:9, 54:10, creating [4] - 72:22, demure [2] - 51:1, 33:17, 35:4, 51:3, 52:16

33:15, 34:4, 38:22, 70:16 district [2] - 38:19, duty [15] - 16:17, endeavour [1] - 22:5 53:13 27:5, 27:27, 27:28, endeavoured [1] -49:28, 50:3, 52:27, fact-finding [1] -**DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 29:11, 32:28, 34:9, 21:29 63:28, 67:29, 70:19 70:16 38:19, 65:14, 69:20, evidential [1] - 28:23 factors [2] - 64:29, division [1] - 39:11 enemy [3] - 42:4, 74:24, 80:15, 80:23, exactly [1] - 84:20 65.2 **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:3 42:15, 56:17 engaged [2] - 10:4, 80:25, 83:6 document [16] - 7:1, exaggerating [1] facts [1] - 11:2 dwelling [1] - 71:7 7:7, 9:24, 11:11, 50.10 10:19 factuality [1] - 10:2 12:12, 17:25, 18:1, **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 examination [3] failures [1] - 49:26 enquiries [21] - 8:26, Dáil [3] - 42:1, 57:20, 25:22, 35:18, 38:26, 9:20, 9:23, 11:4, 41:3, 57:2 fair [5] - 15:21, 22:6, 12:11, 14:13, 25:14. **EXAMINATION**[3] -61:12 39:4, 46:9, 74:5, 80:4, 35:26, 36:14, 72:5 84:1, 84:13 25:27, 33:11, 36:13, 53:18, 56:22, 83:10 fairness [4] - 8:17, documentation [1] -Ε 37:3, 37:28, 38:8, **EXAMINED** [6] - 5:5, 12:4, 17:25, 22:2 74:1 63:14, 64:2, 65:1, 5:6, 5:7, 6:12, 54:5, faith [2] - 36:26, 68:8 **DONAL** [2] - 3:7, 65:6, 65:7, 78:29, 56:27 falls [2] - 29:27, 49:7 e-mail [5] - 43:27, 82:22 3:24 exasperated [1] -**FANNING** [1] - 2:21 51:24, 77:18, 77:22, done [7] - 9:21, enquiry [7] - 15:25, 18:9 **Fanning** [7] - 43:28, 82:14 16:17, 36:29, 51:7, 15:26, 16:3, 16:4, excel [3] - 77:23, 46:26, 47:10, 49:24, **EAMON**[1] - 3:10 16:5, 23:29, 64:25 61:6, 75:24, 81:22 78:20, 79:8 51:12, 51:23, 52:17 earliest [1] - 38:23 ensure [1] - 78:21 door [1] - 43:23 **exception** [1] - 17:9 far [1] - 14:28 early [2] - 26:5, 26:28 doubt [2] - 36:5, entire [1] - 29:8 exclude [1] - 68:22 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:2 EAS[1] - 66:28 entirely [1] - 73:28 excuse [5] - 18:18, 36:24 fashion [2] - 18:14, effect [1] - 54:13 **DOWN** [1] - 84:8 entirety [1] - 73:13 44:10, 47:14, 65:4, 78:15 effectiveness[1] down [15] - 6:23, entitlement [1] -83:19 **favour** [1] - 7:5 67:10 12:4, 12:17, 13:4, 20:24 EXECUTIVE [1] feature [3] - 47:3, effects [1] - 83:27 entries [5] - 17:17, 13:9, 16:26, 26:29, 3:13 47:8, 52:4 efficiency [1] - 85:8 17:18, 76:18, 79:17, 32:22, 38:25, 39:4, exercise [2] - 18:7, features [2] - 11:29, effort [3] - 11:8, 45:1, 45:28, 57:27, 79.24 70:16 12.1 41:23, 67:1 58:28, 84:18 entry [7] - 8:17, 32:5, exist [1] - 31:19 **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:5, efforts [2] - 11:26, **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, 32:12, 56:12, 58:18, existed [1] - 37:29 61.8 59:26. 80:11 3:20 exists [1] - 38:3 felt [12] - 9:3, 16:3, EGAN [1] - 3:25 DR [1] - 3:11 envisaged [1] expect [2] - 15:15, 17:16, 27:22, 28:22, eight [1] - 28:25 draw [2] - 39:29, 76:27 80:19 30:16, 36:11, 40:19, either [4] - 7:7, 82:13 **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 expectation [1] -46:3, 64:12, 75:25 20:15, 62:12, 78:4 Drea[1] - 38:16 **EQUALITY** [1] - 1:8 63:18 female [1] - 33:2 element [1] - 36:19 **Drey** [1] - 37:2 equally [1] - 15:6 expected [2] - 12:26, Fergal [2] - 40:25, elicited [1] - 28:18 drinking [2] - 44:25, equipment [2] -26.4 49:17 ELIZABETH [1] -28:20, 30:16 60:17 experienced [2] -FERGAL [1] - 2:27 2:29 drive [1] - 27:12 error[1] - 83:24 73:17, 73:21 **FERRY** [1] - 2:16 elsewhere [2] - 7:7, driver [3] - 34:20, essential [2] - 10:5, expertise [1] - 72:15 few [6] - 13:25, 84:25 37:20, 37:24 23:28 explain [3] - 64:24, 17:24, 19:8, 40:22, **emerged** [1] - 64:4 driving [4] - 32:28, essentially.. [1] -74:13, 84:11 67:15, 78:29 emerging [1] - 28:1 33:2, 33:18, 68:11 19:20 **explained** [2] - 27:2, file [13] - 29:24, **EMMA**[1] - 3:26 drove [2] - 34:9, establish [2] - 37:29, 76:11 33:22, 33:26, 38:26, empathy [1] - 53:7 34:26 38:8 explanation [3] -51:15, 77:17, 77:24, emphasis [1] - 70:28 drug/crime [1] established [2] -69:20, 69:29, 75:22 77:28, 78:3, 78:13, emphasise [1] -23:14, 38:13 25:16 **explore** [1] - 74:19 78:14, 78:27, 79:5 74:15 ESTABLISHED[1] drugs [4] - 27:24, files [3] - 6:15, 52:29, explored [1] - 39:27 emphasised [1] -59:24, 59:25, 59:28 78:17 expressed [3] drunk [4] - 44:25, etcetera [1] - 15:17 36:15. 67:13. 67:15 filing [1] - 76:14 employed [1] - 21:15 45:7, 49:23, 57:27 expressly [1] - 40:7 Fin [1] - 52:9 evening [2] - 23:17, employee [3] - 61:7, **DUBLIN** [6] - 1:17, 27:19 extensively[1] - 32:8 final [1] - 73:23 64:6, 64:15 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, events [3] - 8:13, finally [1] - 76:12 encompassed [1] -4:6 64:5. 67:8 **findings** [1] - 21:10 62:25 due [3] - 41:14, eventually [1] fine [3] - 13:5, 13:24, **END** [3] - 53:18, 60:29, 83:15 10:24 22:23 face [2] - 8:3, 10:17 56:22, 83:10 **Duff** [1] - 55:9 Evidence [2] - 50:9, finished [2] - 48:11, facility [2] - 85:16, end [9] - 6:29, 10:9, dumb [1] - 54:21 84:6 85:17 11:10, 11:11, 37:29, during [4] - 30:7, **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 **FINN** [1] - 3:5 fact [6] - 7:17, 11:13, 64:20, 77:27, 79:4, 30:18, 47:7, 53:1 evidence [12] -Finn [8] - 21:10, 85:4 23:29, 39:28, 68:19, duties [1] - 27:4 23:15, 28:23, 31:3, 21:17, 44:2, 46:22,

46:27, 47:16, 51:10, 51:15 **Finn's** [1] - 47:5 $\pmb{\text{Fintan}}\ {\tiny [2]} \textbf{-43:} 28,$ 47.10 **FINTAN**[1] - 2:21 firm [1] - 36:19 first [19] - 8:20, 8:24, 14:25, 16:29, 22:19, 24:9, 28:6, 32:10, 35:10, 44:21, 54:9, 54:10, 68:16, 69:2, 74:14, 76:1, 78:9, 79:22, 80:7 fist [1] - 57:5 fit [2] - 82:26, 82:27 FITZWILLIAM [1] five [1] - 12:21 flow [1] - 14:25 FLYNN [1] - 3:19 focus [2] - 70:24, 70:28 follow [2] - 79:3, 83:27 **followed** [1] - 24:10 following [4] - 1:25, 10:6, 27:26, 37:14 FOLLOWING [1] -1:4 follows [1] - 19:7 FOLLOWS [4] - 6:1, 6:12, 54:6, 56:28 foot [4] - 7:24, 20:29, 21:4, 28:18 **footage** [1] - 38:2 **FOR** [9] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 3:30, 4:1 force [2] - 50:28, 76:19 forget [2] - 43:25, 83:17 form [5] - 14:7, 25:7, 40:18, 62:12, 62:23 formal [2] - 16:7, 44.2 formed [1] - 65:24 **FORMER** [2] - 1:13, forth [1] - 19:24 forward [4] - 29:18, 40:28, 42:17, 85:23 forwarded [5] - 7:4, 14:10, 17:19, 29:24, 74:26 four [2] - 13:27, 47:9 fragmenting [1] -73:19

frailties [4] - 9:25,

9:26, 17:27 framed [1] - 62:24 free [1] - 85:11 FREEMAN [1] - 2:22 frequent [1] - 60:25 Friday [4] - 23:17, 25:24, 26:17, 27:19 FRIDAY [2] - 1:18, front [3] - 34:12, 34:21, 43:4 full [5] - 9:1, 9:16, 17:5, 27:5, 27:28 full-time [2] - 27:5, 27:28 fuller [1] - 18:13 function [2] - 29:21, 82:12 future [2] - 66:10, 77:29

G

gap [1] - 81:29 garage [2] - 70:2, 70:11 garda [4] - 45:26, 76:25, 76:26, 77:3 Garda [217] - 6:19, 8:6, 8:27, 9:7, 10:7, 10:22, 10:26, 11:28, 12:4, 12:9, 12:27, 13:13, 14:15, 14:23, 14:28. 15:2. 15:5. 15:6, 15:7, 15:23, 16:9, 16:15, 16:20, 17:5, 17:25, 18:20, 19:9, 19:10, 19:15, 19:23, 20:5, 20:6, 20:12, 20:14, 21:1, 21:17, 23:1, 23:8, 23:10. 23:12. 23:15. 23:20, 23:23, 23:26, 24:2, 24:5, 24:19, 25:6, 25:14, 25:23, 26:13, 26:22, 26:26, 27:18, 27:21, 27:24, 28:2, 28:28, 29:11, 30:1. 30:5. 30:6. 30:9. 30:12, 30:15, 30:25, 31:7, 31:10, 31:11, 31:20, 31:21, 31:28, 32:6, 32:24, 33:15, 33:23, 33:27, 34:4, 35:17, 35:20, 36:1, 36:7, 36:17, 36:21, 36:26, 37:16, 37:19, 38:1, 38:5, 38:16, 38:19, 39:10, 40:6, 40:17, 40:25, 41:19,

41:27, 42:2, 42:3, 42:13, 42:14, 42:19, 42:25, 43:4, 43:6, 43:14, 43:17, 43:20, 44:3, 44:10, 44:19, 44:21, 44:24, 45:7, 45:24, 45:25, 45:28, 46:2, 46:8, 48:4, 48:14, 49:16, 49:21, 49:22, 49:24, 49:26, 49:29, 50:2, 50:6, 50:7, 50:8, 50:11, 52:4, 52:28, 53:2, 53:9, 53:26, 54:10, 54:11, 54:12, 54:18, 54:19, 55:1, 55:5, 55:12, 55:15, 55:27, 56:3, 56:8, 56:16, 58:7, 58:12, 58:27, 59:14, 59:24, 60:4, 60:10, 60:15, 60:22, 61:2, 61:9, 61:16, 61:29, 62:4, 62:8, 63:8, 63:13, 63:21, 63:26. 64:20. 64:21. 64:23, 65:5, 65:22, 68:8, 68:18, 69:4, 69:19, 69:20, 69:21, 69:27, 70:6, 70:17, 71:17, 72:22, 72:29, 73:24, 74:3, 74:8, 74:20, 75:19, 75:26, 81:22, 82:6, 82:24, 82:28, 83:1, 84:18, 84:19, 84:22, 84:23, 84:25 **GARDA** [9] - 2:10,

2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2, 3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21 gardaí [1] - 83:4 general [7] - 8:24, 18:29, 19:3, 19:6, 19:7, 39:13, 57:10 generally [1] - 19:21 generate [1] - 77:23 generated [2] - 79:27, 82:22 generates [1] - 82:11 GERAGHTY [1] - 2:17

GERARD [1] - 2:11 GERRY [1] - 3:11 GISC [3] - 34:26, 69:19, 69:25 gist [1] - 23:28 given [9] - 11:27, 29:11, 30:6, 30:8, 67:7, 70:28, 71:2, 74:12, 78:28 GOODE [1] - 3:22 governance [1] -29:26

GRALTON [1] - 3:14 grave [1] - 29:4 Greene [29] - 40:26, 41:19, 42:3, 42:14, 42:19, 42:25, 43:4, 43:20, 44:10, 45:24, 45:28, 46:2, 46:8, 49:17, 49:21, 49:22, 49:25, 49:29, 50:2, 50:6, 50:8, 50:11, 53:26, 54:12, 54:18, 55:12, 55:27, 56:8, 56:16

GREENE [1] - 2:27 GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26 group [3] - 64:10, 79:28, 81:7 guise [1] - 82:8

GWEN [1] - 1:29 **Gwen** [1] - 1:24

Н

hair [2] **-** 34:20, 34:22

HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 **hallway** [2] - 43:5, 43:23

hand [2] - 29:10, 66:11

handed [1] - 31:2 handwritten [1] -35:18

happy [3] - 46:12, 59:2, 85:22

HARAN[1] - 4:2 harassed [1] - 48:14 harassment [4] -14:7, 44:6, 46:28, 47:17

hard [1] - 71:11 HEAD [1] - 3:15 heading [5] - 10:9, 20:20, 37:5, 41:4, 76:25

Headquarters [1] - 30:12

health [5] **-** 62:23, 64:8, 64:14, 65:7, 65:13

hear [1] - 22:18 heard [2] - 47:2, 47:8 HEARING [2] - 6:1, 85:26

hearing [1] - 22:21 hearings [1] - 85:5

hearsay [1] - 50:9 heavily [1] - 60:17 HELD [1] - 1:17 held [3] - 15:27, 65:28, 74:17 help [5] - 36:25, 61:6, 66:29, 74:9, 74:10

hesitation [1] - 75:29 high [2] - 29:7, 66:26 higher [1] - 16:16 highlight [1] - 82:26 highlighted [1] -

63:10 **him..** [1] **-** 55:28

himself [5] - 8:7, 10:23, 36:7, 66:29, 72:27

 $\begin{array}{l} \textbf{history} \ [1] \ - \ 25:23 \\ \textbf{hit} \ [1] \ - \ 30:24 \\ \textbf{hmm} \ [1] \ - \ 80:6 \\ \textbf{holiday} \ [1] \ - \ 85:12 \\ \textbf{home} \ [4] \ - \ 30:6, \end{array}$

37:24, 46:3, 69:5 homes [1] - 28:28 honesty [1] - 53:6

honourable [1] - 53: 53:4

hope [1] - 57:18 hoped [3] - 10:28, 73:12, 75:26

hoping [1] - 50:28 HORAN [1] - 3:25 house [4] - 32:28, 34:26, 68:11, 68:12

HOUSE [2] - 2:23, 3:27

HR [2] - 65:10, 67:16 **HUGHES** [2] - 2:29, 2:30

human [3] - 62:13, 64:7, 64:14 **HUMAN** [1] - 3:15

IA32 [1] - 25:7
identified [7] - 9:26,
10:22, 14:22, 20:7,
52:5, 64:29, 84:28
identify [2] - 47:26,
66:8
identifying [1] - 8:21
ignore [1] - 75:21
illness [1] - 39:18
immediate [4] - 7:5,
10:26, 38:21, 80:20
immediately [3] 26:8, 26:11, 82:2

GLEESON [1] - 4:4

impacted [1] - 52:10 impartial [1] - 68:3 impartiality [2] -36:27, 68:8 importance [3] -40:23, 51:6, 83:21 important [5] - 8:29, 13:2, 17:1, 48:12, 82:10 **IN** [1] - 1:17 inactive [2] - 78:7, inadvertent [2] -83:26, 85:1 incident [43] - 7:3, 7:11, 8:3, 10:17, 10:22, 11:14, 31:8, 32:5, 32:11, 32:15, 33:9, 33:16, 35:20, 37:7, 37:17, 38:10, 39:7, 67:28, 69:15, 69:16, 69:18, 69:27, 70:6, 70:7, 70:17, 71:13, 71:16, 71:20, 72:22, 73:7, 73:14, 76:29, 77:6, 77:7, 77:15, 77:16, 77:21, 79:23, 79:29, 80:15, 80:20, 82:1 incidents [7] - 37:15, 38:18, 76:18, 79:16, 79:25, 80:9, 82:25 include [1] - 15:16 included [2] - 12:29, including [1] - 67:16 inconsiderate [1] -52:18 incorrect [1] - 52:18 indeed [4] - 10:23, 66:16, 83:18, 85:17 independent [1] -68:2 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 indicate [2] - 38:11, indicated [11] - 8:27, 23:8, 24:17, 37:19, 38:1, 42:1, 42:25, 51:23, 53:23, 57:9, 77:21 indicates [3] - 25:4, 46:8, 64:18 indicating [2] - 48:1, 51:14 indication [4] - 8:10, 9:16, 71:2, 75:27 indoors [2] - 27:5, 27:29 inexplicable [1] -

15:6 inference [2] - 37:25, 39:29 inflammatory [1] -10:29 inflated [1] - 11:1 inflating [1] - 10:18 inform [3] - 42:14, 54:11, 60:15 informant [3] -24:19, 24:22, 29:6 information [50] -8:29, 9:1, 9:15, 9:27, 10:2, 10:3, 11:7, 11:22, 12:20, 13:2, 14:10, 16:27, 16:29, 17:16, 17:22, 17:29, 18:2, 18:8, 18:20, 23:7, 24:25, 25:27, 27:18, 28:17, 29:1, 29:3, 29:10, 30:4, 30:14, 30:19, 30:21, 37:16, 38:10, 38:12, 41:22, 42:23, 45:16, 45:24, 46:3, 50:21, 55:11, 65:6, 65:12, 74:27, 80:19, 81:27, 82:10, 82:16, 82:17 informed [13] -19:16, 20:8, 23:6, 25:6, 27:12, 28:19, 29:1, 38:20, 42:26, 49:20, 49:21, 49:24, 55:15 informing [1] - 44:1 initial [7] - 8:7, 8:11, 12:11, 13:1, 13:27, 78:27, 79:10 initiated [1] - 12:21 initiatives [1] - 26:5 injured [7] - 8:12, 10:4, 10:25, 11:26, 11:29, 15:16, 18:5 injuries [5] - 7:4, 8:14, 12:2, 17:13, 17:28 injustice [1] - 52:24 inquired [1] - 71:1 inquiring [1] - 20:29 inquiry [2] - 22:25, 40:24 **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:2, insinuating [1] -

73.14

36:25, 71:6

3:18, 3:22, 4:2

insofar [3] - 21:9,

INSPECTOR [7] -

3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17,

inspector [7] - 36:29, 38:16, 70:15, 73:7, 73:12, 73:17 Inspector [15] - 22:4, 37:2, 42:20, 44:16, 44:18, 44:20, 44:24, 45:8, 45:17, 45:24, 46:1, 46:6, 50:5, 50:7, 55:14 inspectors [2] - 78:5, 79:11 instance [4] - 21:9, 63:26, 78:10, 79:22 instead [1] - 72:29 INSTRUCTED [7] -2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 3:30, 4:5 instructions [1] -15.18 INSTRUMENT[1] -1:7 intelligence [1] -39:6 intend [2] - 75:9, 76.9 intended [1] - 70:26 intent [1] - 71:7 intention [2] - 30:2, 40:18 interaction [3] -26:3, 26:16, 60:25 interactions [3] -12:10, 61:14, 61:19 interacts [1] - 64:9 interest [8] - 23:11, 23:24, 24:18, 27:3, 34:13, 34:29, 40:19 interested [2] -44:28, 58:23 **interfere** [1] - 79:8 interject [1] - 47:22 Internal [1] - 29:27 interrupt [1] - 83:20 intertwined [1] -69:28 intervening [1] -23:22 intervention [2] -55:17, 72:17 interventions [3] -55:2, 55:5, 72:20 interviewed [2] -33:17. 38:6 **INTO** [1] - 1:2 introduce [1] - 79:14 introduced [3] - 9:9, 10:27, 72:4 introduction [1] -

18:3, 47:5, 65:15, 77:12 investigated [3] -72:21, 73:5, 73:8 investigates [1] investigating [2] -9:11, 80:29 investigation [32] -7:5, 7:20, 13:3, 15:1, 18:17, 18:27, 19:13, 19:18, 20:28, 21:13, 21:28, 23:3, 23:11, 23:25, 25:16, 38:21, 43:16, 44:3, 46:22, 46:28, 47:17, 51:10, 51:15, 52:10, 57:25, 58:20, 58:28, 59:2, 69:28, 76:20, 76:22, 81:19 investigations [3] -14:20, 37:3, 59:10 investigative [5] -8:10, 9:28, 12:18, 18:2, 82:1 invoking [1] - 48:22 involved [7] - 22:10, 22:13, 24:25, 61:4, 64:11, 64:13, 70:11 involvement [3] -22:17, 59:15, 63:9 **IP** [1] - 7:3 **issue** [43] - 6:14, 6:15, 8:20, 10:8, 12:7, 12:10, 22:23, 22:25, 36:10, 36:12, 36:22, 39:24, 39:26, 41:5, 41:13, 44:9, 48:11, 48:13, 48:21, 52:11, 53:9, 53:10, 58:25, 61:2, 62:5, 62:20, 62:22, 63:5, 64:20, 64:23, 65:15, 67:2, 67:22, 68:7, 70:7, 70:9, 71:7, 73:21, 73:22, 74:16, 78:23, 81:10 issues [16] - 8:12, 9:21, 14:17, 20:2, 26:19, 40:20, 47:25, 52:2, 52:5, 63:4, 64:10, 64:28, 66:8, 75:28, 79:13, 83:17 it'd [1] - 73:18

item [1] - 70:27

items [1] - 18:25

itself [2] - 29:4, 80:4

J **JACK**[1] - 3:6 **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 **JANUARY**[1] - 85:26 January [13] - 31:4, 31:15, 40:28, 40:29, 41:20, 42:7, 42:10, 42:11, 51:25, 56:10, 63:22, 85:6 jig [1] - 30:28 **job** [2] - 66:23, 73:16 Jockey [1] - 45:29 **JOE** [1] - 3:14 John [4] - 18:20, 23:1, 24:2, 60:10 **JOHN** [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 3:30 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 Judge [2] - 41:1, 53:26 **judgment** [1] - 53:9 July [8] - 47:12, 49:14, 49:20, 59:20, 61:8, 65:24, 74:21, 75:19 junction [1] - 34:12 June [3] - 39:19, 59:16, 76:19 jurisdictional [1] -26:19 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1.12 2.2 justify [1] - 18:7 K KANE [1] - 2:28 **KATE**[1] - 3:25

KAVANAGH[1] - 2:5 Kavanagh's [1] -16:25 **KEANE**[1] - 4:3 keep[1] - 42:3 keeping [1] - 11:8 **KELLY** [9] - 2:10, 3:12, 18:23, 18:27, 22:23, 22:26, 41:1, 52:6, 52:11 Kelly [6] - 22:14, 22:20, 41:4, 41:11, 52:21. 74:1 Kelly's [2] - 20:19, 47:29 Keogh [100] - 8:6, 8:27, 9:7, 10:22, 12:4, 13:13, 14:15, 15:2, 15:23, 17:25, 19:9,

investigate [4] -

20:5, 20:12, 21:1, 21:17, 31:28, 32:6, 32:24, 33:15, 33:23, 33:27, 34:4, 36:7, 36:17, 36:21, 36:26, 37:16, 38:1, 38:5, 38:17, 38:19, 39:10, 40:17, 41:27, 42:2, 42:14, 42:25, 43:6, 43:14, 44:19, 44:21, 44:24, 45:7, 45:25, 45:28, 48:14, 49:22. 49:24, 50:7, 50:17, 52:28, 53:3, 53:9, 54:12, 54:19, 55:1, 55:5, 55:16, 55:27, 56:3, 56:16, 57:26, 58:5, 58:12, 58:27, 59:14, 59:24, 60:4, 60:15, 60:17, 60:23, 61:2, 61:9, 61:16, 61:29, 62:4, 62:8, 63:13, 63:21, 63:26, 64:23, 65:22, 68:8, 69:19. 69:20. 69:27. 70:6, 70:17, 71:17, 72:22, 73:24, 74:3, 74:8, 75:19, 75:26, 81:22, 82:28, 83:1, 84:19, 84:22 **KEOGH**[1] - 2:10 Keogh's [19] - 6:19, 10:7, 11:28, 12:9, 14:24, 14:28, 35:17, 36:2, 37:19, 40:6, 44:3, 48:4, 52:5, 54:10, 63:8, 68:18, 69:4, 74:20, 82:6 kept [4] - 19:16, 20:7, 61:18, 78:21 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 kick [1] - 82:2 KIERAN [1] - 3:20 Kilbeggan [1] -34:24 kind [1] - 11:27 **KIRWAN** [1] - 3:13 knee [2] - 30:22, 30.25 knowledge [2] -22:9, 24:24

L

lack [2] - 68:18, 69:6 lacked [4] - 8:26, 73:10, 81:26, 83:5 lady [2] - 23:6, 23:8 lag [1] - 7:19 largely [2] - 23:28,

48:11 last [14] - 13:4, 13:15, 13:25, 13:27, 20:23, 25:11, 25:25, 27:10, 29:19, 30:17, 31:16, 46:10, 52:8, 70:12 late [1] - 27:19 **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29

lead [2] - 26:4, 29:5 leading [1] - 37:24 leads [3] - 77:20, 79:3, 83:26 least [2] - 21:21,

22:21 leave [9] - 36:12, 43:10, 48:23, 49:11, 50:14, 73:26, 75:11, 84:1, 85:9

leaving [1] - 43:21 left [6] - 25:15, 32:16, 32:22, 40:6, 41:12, 55:15

legalistic [1] - 16:12 legitimate [2] - 16:3, 20:17

LEITRIM [1] - 2:13 letter [6] - 10:15, 31:13, 31:16, 46:26, 74:14, 75:3 letting [1] - 52:19

level [3] - 9:26, 39:11, 66:26 levels [1] - 50:9 liaising [1] - 62:4 liaison [1] - 23:7 liaisons [1] - 23:10

LIAM [1] - 3:18 lieu [1] - 81:24 life [1] - 51:21 lifeblood [1] - 13:2

light [5] - 13:19, 25:13, 29:1, 29:11, 69:29

line [5] - 10:26, 53:5, 69:2, 69:14, 80:7 lines [9] - 13:25, 13:27, 17:24, 25:11, 27:10, 28:25, 31:16, 63:12, 70:12

link [1] - 15:6 linked [1] - 26:20 list [3] - 37:10, 70:27, 70:29

listed [1] - 21:20 listened [1] - 47:6 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:28 live [1] - 53:7

local [4] - 55:16, 61:3, 66:12, 66:17

location [1] - 34:17 lock [1] - 34:26 locked [1] - 85:15 logic [1] - 50:29 long-term [1] - 67:6 look [27] - 6:18, 7:29, 9:7. 11:20. 12:10. 13:18, 13:24, 14:25, 14:26, 23:27, 25:1, 32:13, 33:10, 34:2, 38:27, 42:28, 48:24, 51:28, 55:24, 68:4, 68:5, 69:1, 70:12, 73:12, 73:18, 78:5, 85:22

looked [2] - 47:28, looking [7] - 9:24,

13:14, 20:27, 32:11, 35:17, 36:8, 46:6 looks [1] - 13:21 **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 **Lyons** [1] - 46:12

LYONS [1] - 4:3

M

MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7 mail [5] - 43:27, 51:24, 77:18, 77:22, 82:14 **MAIN**[1] - 2:12 main [2] - 17:23, 81:26 major [1] - 48:8 majority [1] - 62:2

male [1] - 33:2 MALONE [1] - 1:29

Malone [1] - 1:24 Malpractice [1] -37:22

man [2] - 44:26, 70:11

manage [1] - 14:19 management [10] -27:17, 49:26, 55:2, 55:5, 55:16, 61:3, 66:12, 66:17, 66:21, 67:6

manager [1] - 85:8 manner [1] - 69:18 manuscript [3] -6:19, 11:15, 12:12 March [2] - 54:15,

64.18 MARGARET[1] -3:21

margin [1] - 14:4 MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17

MARK[1] - 3:3 mark [1] - 78:6 marked [2] - 75:25, 79:2

MARRINAN [15] -2:7, 5:7, 20:4, 20:15, 20:22, 50:4, 56:28, 57:1, 71:15, 71:23, 71:28, 72:3, 72:13, 72:21, 83:8

marrinan [1] - 72:2 Marrinan [15] - 7:24, 20:3, 20:10, 31:27, 32:9, 35:25, 49:9, 50:2, 56:25, 70:24, 71:6, 71:10, 71:26, 72:12, 72:18

material [3] - 50:15, 57:15. 66:8 materials [5] - 6:18, 42:29, 46:18, 46:19,

84:25 **MATT**[1] - 3:19

matter [32] - 8:23, 10:17, 10:18, 11:1, 14:11, 15:13, 17:24, 18:16, 19:12, 22:21, 37:8, 44:10, 46:21, 51:19, 57:5, 67:26, 69:24, 70:25, 70:29, 72:5, 72:9, 72:29, 73:23, 76:12, 76:26, 77:3, 77:12, 79:19, 83:2, 83:20, 83:23 matters [21] - 12:3, 19:10, 20:28, 21:12, 22:16, 28:10, 35:27, 38:22, 39:5, 39:17, 40:23, 40:26, 42:17, 45:15, 47:1, 47:27, 49:9, 49:13, 49:16,

57:1, 70:27 MATTERS[1] - 1:4 MATTHIAS[1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:16 McCabe [1] - 45:26 McCOURT[1] - 2:17 McGarry [7] - 2:21, 47:22, 47:23, 47:24, 48:1, 52:1, 52:21 MCGRATH[1] - 5:6 mcGrath [1] - 54:3

McGrath [16] - 2:7, 2:28, 53:22, 53:23, 53:26, 53:28, 54:2, 54:6, 54:8, 54:21, 54:23, 54:25, 54:29,

55:11, 55:22, 56:20 McGUINNESS [3] -2:6, 3:24, 53:27

MCLOUGHLIN [1] -

McLYNN [1] - 3:31 **MCMAHON**[1] - 3:8 MCPARTLIN[1] -3.20

mean [16] - 48:2, 48:4, 48:24, 50:10, 50:15, 50:20, 50:24, 52:15, 54:22, 69:10, 69:11, 69:12, 73:16, 73:20, 78:26, 82:10 meaningful[1]-

75:20

mechanism [3] -16:6, 79:12, 82:27 MEDICAL[1] - 3:11 medium [1] - 67:6 meet [4] - 24:18, 24:22, 27:13, 27:25

measures [1] - 36:22

meeting [27] - 7:11, 7:15, 7:25, 8:23, 8:24, 24:23, 25:6, 25:23, 26:26, 26:28, 30:13, 37:15, 44:15, 45:20, 62:16, 66:14, 66:15, 77:14, 77:16, 77:17, 77:29, 78:10, 79:9, 79:12, 79:23, 81:24, 81:27

meetings [2] - 17:23, 79:20

member [22] - 15:5, 16:15, 16:16, 16:17, 16:20, 27:7, 30:4, 30:8, 31:11, 33:17, 43:17, 66:28, 69:29, 70:14, 75:11, 76:28, 77:3, 77:19, 77:23, 78:28, 80:29, 81:19

MEMBER [1] - 2:2 member's [2] -66:22 67:9

members [2] - 9:11,

memo [1] - 7:26 memorandum [1] -55:25

memory [1] - 23:17 mental [1] - 62:23 mention [1] - 41:29 mentioned [3] - 35:7, 56:11, 84:28

menu [1] - 22:24 merely [5] - 14:18, 72:18, 76:2, 78:13, 82:25

merits [1] - 69:29 message [1] - 56:10

met [4] - 15:2, 30:10, 43:22, 63:29 methodology [1] -21:15 MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 Michael [2] - 44:2, 51:10 microphone [1] -53:27 middle [1] - 64:5 might [23] - 6:18, 7:29, 9:17, 10:3, 10:5, 11:9, 12:4, 12:10, 12:14, 13:11, 14:25, 23:27, 23:29, 25:1, 33:10, 34:2, 38:25, 39:4, 39:20, 42:28, 51:28, 67:24, 69:8 mind [7] - 32:11, 36:5, 41:11, 44:11, 64:22, 73:15, 74:8 **mine** [1] - 13:23 minimum [1] - 9:14 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 Minnock [14] - 42:20, 43:21, 44:16, 44:18, 44:24, 45:8, 45:17, 45:24, 46:1, 49:15, 49:20, 50:5, 50:7, 55:14 Minnock's [2] -44:20, 46:7 minute [3] - 33:27, 33:28, 61:10 miscellaneous [1] -40:23 misheard [1] - 73:28 mistake [2] - 68:29, 74:24 mistaken [1] - 69:8 misuse [1] - 66:22 mitigating [1] - 29:12 **mobile** [1] - 30:3 moment [7] - 8:1, 19:6. 27:5. 32:14. 49:2, 63:23, 83:29 Monaghan [4] - 35:7, 35:13, 74:23, 74:29 MONDAY [1] - 85:26 Monday [5] - 23:21, 27:14, 78:17, 79:7, 79:12 MONICA [1] - 3:15 month [5] - 58:17, 59:16, 59:19, 60:5, months [3] - 24:6,

30:17, 30:18

morning [9] - 6:4, 6:5, 6:7, 6:8, 7:18, 27:26, 30:24, 67:26, 71:8 MORONEY [1] - 3:18 MORRISSEY [1] -3:26 mother [1] - 44:26 motivation [1] - 22:5 motives [1] - 53:4 move [11] - 7:20, 16:2, 18:15, 31:5, 31:15, 31:26, 39:20, 45:15, 46:8, 46:20, 69:14 moved [4] - 34:24, 64:5, 69:15, 70:5 movements [1] -26:21 moves [1] - 70:10 moving [6] - 40:28, 42:17, 43:26, 47:1, 49:13, 78:21 MR [125] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:8, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 3:30, 3:30, 4:3, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 6:5, 6:12, 6:14, 13:24, 14:11, 18:23, 18:27, 19:2, 19:4, 19:7, 19:12, 19:17, 19:19, 19:21, 19:26, 20:1, 20:4, 20:15, 20:22, 20:25, 20:27, 21:4, 21:7, 21:24, 21:26, 22:11, 22:15, 22:23, 22:26, 22:29, 31:4, 39:26, 40:2, 40:9, 41:1, 41:6, 41:10, 41:15, 41:18, 42:13, 47:14, 47:22, 47:24, 48:10, 48:18, 48:21, 48:26, 49:10, 49:13, 50:1, 50:4, 50:13, 50:25, 51:1, 51:9, 52:1. 52:6. 52:8. 52:11, 52:22, 52:25, 53:16, 53:23, 53:26, 53:27, 53:28, 54:2, 54:6, 54:8, 54:23, 54:25, 54:29, 55:11, 55:22, 56:20, 56:28, 57:1, 70:20, 70:23, 71:6, 71:15, 71:23, 71:28, 72:3, 72:13, 72:21, 83:8, 83:19,

83:23, 83:26, 84:3, 84:11, 84:17, 84:20, 84:23, 84:29 **MS** [11] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 3:30, 4:4, **MULCAHY**[1] - 3:5 Mulcahy [30] - 22:3, 23:16, 23:23, 24:12, 24:16, 24:20, 26:1, 26:4, 26:17, 27:20, 28:12, 28:19, 28:29, 31:3, 35:22, 57:7, 57:24, 58:3, 58:10, 58:19, 58:29, 59:6, 59:10, 59:29, 60:16, 60:22, 60:29, 61:19, 61:26, 61:28 MULLIGAN [2] -2:11, 3:13 Mulligan [1] - 65:10 MURPHY [2] - 2:30, Murray [10] - 10:16, 11:13, 14:1, 22:8, 48:15, 48:16, 48:29, 50:6. 50:12. 84:13 MURRAY [6] - 3:3, 3:9, 5:3, 6:11, 54:5, 56:27 **Murray's** [1] - 48:7 must [2] - 49:1, 80:9 myriad [1] - 14:19 MÍCHEÁL [62] - 3:23, 5:5, 6:5, 6:12, 6:14, 13:24, 14:11, 19:2, 19:4, 19:7, 19:12, 19:17, 19:19, 19:21, 19:26, 20:1, 20:25, 20:27, 21:4, 21:7, 21:24, 21:26, 22:11, 22:15, 22:29, 31:4, 39:26, 40:2, 40:9, 41:6, 41:10, 41:15, 41:18, 42:13, 47:14, 48:10, 48:18, 48:21, 48:26, 49:10, 49:13, 50:1, 50:13, 50:25, 51:1. 51:9. 52:8. 52:22, 52:25, 53:16, 70:20, 70:23, 71:6, 83:19, 83:23, 83:26,

Ν

84:3. 84:11. 84:17.

84:20, 84:23, 84:29

named [1] - 1:26 namely [1] - 59:23

narrates [1] - 28:7 narrative [3] - 9:15, 32:26, 33:6 naturally [2] - 49:8, 50:21 nature [2] - 12:2, necessary [1] - 79:1 need [4] - 29:23, 66:5, 72:1, 84:12 needed [4] - 10:26, 74:9, 75:24, 77:9 needn't [1] - 32:13 needs [2] - 66:28, 66:29 never [7] - 40:16, 40:18. 45:11. 54:18. 59:1, 62:14, 65:2 New [1] - 85:22 new [9] - 9:22, 12:20, 16:27, 16:28, 18:15, 29:1, 29:3, 46:21, 82:23 News [1] - 47:2 next [6] - 12:5, 16:23, 26:13, 28:24, 60:14, 69:14 nicholas [1] - 32:24 Nicholas [2] - 53:3, 57:26 NICHOLAS [2] -2:10. 4:2 nick [1] - 46:12 Nick [2] - 34:4, 50:17 Nicky [2] - 58:5, 60:17 **night** [5] - 15:13, 17:18. 57:26. 82:21. nobody [2] - 56:24, 71:17 **NOLAN** [1] - 3:6 none [2] - 59:21, 60.24 **NOREEN** [1] - 2:16 normal [5] - 63:15, 63:17, 63:20, 73:2, 73:18

normally [1] - 63:25 NORTHUMBERLAN D [1] - 2:18 note [26] - 14:28, 15:3, 15:22, 17:9, 26:23, 42:29, 43:2, 43:12, 44:9, 44:12, 44:19, 44:22, 45:16, 45:20, 46:7, 46:18, 56:7, 58:17, 59:7, 61:14, 61:18, 64:18, 64:20, 66:4, 75:7

notebook [2] - 11:28, 17:17 notebooks [1] -17:17 noted [2] - 66:19, 84:27 notes [9] - 1:26, 24:14, 57:13, 61:24, 66:3, 66:4, 66:7, 67:19 nothing [4] - 14:7, 35:2, 84:23, 85:21 **nothing..** [1] - 14:2 noticed [2] - 34:11, 34 19 notification [1] -November [11] -32:3, 43:27, 44:7, 46:21, 46:25, 46:29, 47:2, 48:28, 60:15, 60:20, 62:1 **nub** [1] - 22:21 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:14, 3.21 number [16] - 10:10. 11:4, 30:17, 30:22, 34:16, 36:6, 38:8, 42:18, 57:1, 57:22, 70:27, 80:18, 83:5, 83:17, 83:18, 84:10 NYLAND[1] - 3:19 **NÍ** [1] - 2:30 **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7

0

O'BRIEN [1] - 2:10 O'CONNOR [1] -O'Higgins [18] - 6:8, 18:29, 19:29, 20:10, 20:21, 22:6, 22:28, 41:17, 48:2, 49:27, 50:15, 52:15, 57:3, 57:6, 68:1, 71:5, 71:25, 72:9 O'HIGGINS [62] -3:23, 5:5, 6:5, 6:12, 6:14, 13:24, 14:11, 19:2, 19:4, 19:7, 19:12, 19:17, 19:19, 19:21, 19:26, 20:1, 20:25, 20:27, 21:4, 21:7, 21:24, 21:26, 22:11, 22:15, 22:29, 31:4, 39:26, 40:2, 40:9, 41:6, 41:10, 41:15, 41:18, 42:13,

47:14, 48:10, 48:18, 48:21, 48:26, 49:10, 49:13, 50:1, 50:13, 50:25, 51:1, 51:9, 52:8, 52:22, 52:25, 53:16, 70:20, 70:23, 71:6, 83:19, 83:23, 83:26, 84:3, 84:11, 84:17, 84:20, 84:23, 84:29 O'Higgins' [2] -22:22, 72:17 O'MARA[1] - 2:17 O'NEILL [1] - 3:30 O'REARDON [1] -3:17 O'ROURKE [1] - 4:4 O'SULLIVAN [1] -3:7 **O'Toole** [1] - 45:25 objection [1] - 71:25 objectives [2] - 15:1, 26:7 obligation [12] -9:10, 9:11, 15:4, 16:1, 16:5, 16:21, 76:28, 77:2, 77:11, 80:14, 81:13, 82:29 obligations [3] -14:17, 15:25, 76:15 obliged [1] - 25:13 observation [7] -66:28, 69:4, 69:22, 70:21, 71:3, 71:26, 72:18 observations [2] -65:17, 66:17 observed [2] - 32:28, 72:17 **obtain** [1] - 51:18 obtained [2] - 38:5, 38:23 obtaining [1] - 28:13 **obvious** [1] **-** 66:22 obviously [5] -32:12, 35:13, 41:12, 77:12, 85:11 occasion [2] - 30:1, 46:2 occupants [1] - 35:3 occupational [4] -64:8, 64:13, 65:7, 65:13 occur [1] - 75:25 occurred [5] - 9:17, 32:18, 35:11, 55:8, 63:12 occurring [1] - 38:18 October [18] - 12:15, 13:21, 14:24, 17:3,

18:19, 22:29, 23:21, 24:28, 25:19, 25:24, 26:26, 27:14, 30:10, 30:24, 31:3, 32:18, 32:20, 60:9 **OF** [12] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, 3:15, 53:18, 56:22, 83:10 offences [1] - 33:3 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 office [5] - 11:3, 23:1, 26:14, 30:1, 41.19 officer [3] - 53:13, 66:28, 85:8 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, official [5] - 30:7, 30:16, 30:22, 31:12, 65:21 OGHUVBU [1] - 3:11 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12, 3:30 omission [1] - 16:17 omitted [1] - 44:8 ON [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [3] - 54:20, 63:10, 64:10 oncoming [1] - 80:21

One [1] - 47:2

one [37] - 7:21, 9:15,

13:15, 19:8, 19:12,

29:22, 30:8, 32:14,

40:10, 40:26, 44:20,

45:14, 48:17, 48:18,

50:20, 57:16, 57:24,

58:11, 64:1, 65:27,

70:20, 71:12, 73:20,

73:23, 76:12, 80:14,

80:18, 81:6, 83:3,

one-by-one [1] -

ones [3] - 12:26,

onus [1] - 80:22

open [1] - 17:19

opened [2] - 57:28,

opening [1] - 10:15

operational [2] -

opportunity [4] -

9:19, 38:23, 67:25,

opposed [1] - 9:27

options [1] - 67:17

26:5. 26:7

74:13

83:5, 83:20

78:19, 79:24

57:16

67:17, 70:7, 70:9,

Ρ

or.. [1] - 36:6

order [4] - 11:9,

14:29, 30:11, 76:5

81:18, 81:25, 82:7,

82:20, 83:1

29:13, 53:5

15:1. 27:3

85:15

25:8. 38:17

79:9

74:23

64.22

orderly [6] - 80:27,

ordinary [1] - 77:2

organisation [2] -

organisation's [2] -

original [1] - 78:10

OSMOND [1] - 3:27

otherwise [2] - 9:28,

outcome [2] - 21:13.

outline [1] - 33:18

outlined [3] - 23:23,

outside [5] - 38:18,

61:6, 78:20, 78:24,

outstanding [3] -

78:17, 78:19, 83:16

own [5] - 21:28,

30:21, 34:15, 38:18,

owner [1] - 33:16

overleaf [2] - 17:4,

ORLA [1] - 3:20

OTHER [1] - 1:3

PAF [17] - 7:11, 7:14, 7:25, 8:23, 17:23, 37:15, 77:14, 77:15, 77:17, 77:29, 78:10, 79:9, 79:20, 79:23, 81:24, 81:27 **PAGE**[1] - 5:2 page [39] - 6:18, 7:29, 10:8, 10:9, 11:11, 12:5, 12:11, 13:9, 13:12, 14:23, 16:23, 23:27, 24:1, 24:14, 26:15, 28:6, 28:24, 31:13, 31:16, 33:11, 35:8, 37:1, 38:27, 42:28, 44:12, 45:15. 46:5. 51:28. 55:22, 55:23, 56:13, 66:5, 66:7, 67:27, 74:20, 75:4, 75:6, 79:15, 83:28 pain [1] - 26:23 papers [2] - 57:17,

85:9 paragraph [11] -13:4, 16:29, 25:25, 26:29, 39:5, 44:19, 45:18, 46:10, 80:13, 80:14, 84:17 paragraphs [1] -28:7 pardon [1] - 37:2 parked [1] - 41:7 part [3] - 21:7, 36:2, partial [1] - 9:6 particular [6] -18:24, 30:2, 34:13, 62:20, 62:22, 68:12 particularly [3] -11:25, 18:10, 63:2 parties [3] - 85:9, 85:14. 85:18 parties' [1] - 8:12 parts [1] - 57:14 party [7] - 6:28, 10:5, 10:25, 11:26, 12:1, 15:16, 18:5 pass [4] - 45:6, 45:8. 54:19, 55:11 PASSED[1] - 1:4 passed [2] - 7:20, 79.6 passenger [2] - 33:2, 34:21 passing [1] - 14:20 Pat [2] - 10:16, 11:13 **PATRICK** [8] - 2:7,

2:10. 2:28. 3:3. 5:3. 6:11, 54:5, 56:27 patrol [1] - 27:12 **PAUL** [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 3:30 **PEGGY** [1] - 4:4 people [10] - 9:18, 10:3, 11:25, 50:16, 64:10, 67:15, 73:21, 79:28, 81:7 **PEOPLE** [1] - 3:16 perceived [3] -65:14 81:23 82:5 perform [1] - 27:4 performing [1] -14:18 perhaps [12] - 8:26, 9:4, 9:20, 12:2, 17:27, 18:9, 23:10, 42:17, 63:13, 74:10, 74:16, 75:27 **period** [7] - 9:17, 11:5. 23:22. 53:1. 77:26, 85:13 persisted [1] - 16:3

person [7] - 6:16, 6:22, 10:12, 24:22, 58:13, 80:18, 81:11 **person..** [1] - 6:26 personal [1] - 14:17 personalised [2] -14:14, 14:16 personally [1] - 64:9 perspective [1] -68:5 **PETER** [2] - 2:5, 3:13 phase [1] - 85:4 **Phipson** [1] - 50:8 phone [6] - 24:6, 30:3, 45:29, 57:14, 61:3, 62:2 phoned [4] - 23:22, 24:16, 57:26, 75:19 photocopying [1] photographs [2] -8:15, 12:2 phrase [1] - 63:2 physical [1] - 66:24 picked [1] - 82:1 **PLACE** [1] - 4:5 place [7] - 18:13, 24:23, 29:17, 38:2, 58:4, 61:7, 82:2 placed [3] - 77:22, 80:14, 82:29 **plain** [2] - 27:25, 27.28 plane [3] - 58:19, 58:22 planting [3] - 59:23, 59:25, 59:28 played [1] - 47:4 pleased [2] - 50:21, pocket [2] - 30:25, 30:26 point [15] - 7:8, 12:28, 16:25, 17:15, 18:7, 19:8, 20:19, 45:12, 45:13, 48:1, 50:24, 50:27, 51:6, 71:23. 84:26 pointing [3] - 61:11, 61:24, 84:26 points [2] - 19:8, 21:21 police [1] - 73:21 policy [2] - 15:9, 29.17 portion [3] - 24:1, 25:11, 44:28 **poses** [1] - 29:12 position [9] - 23:9,

32:3, 48:5, 48:7,

47:9, 51:11, 51:14, 65:21, 70:4, 72:4, produce [1] - 9:12 8:21, 22:15, 39:21, registration [4] -74:19, 75:17 professionalism [1] 40:3, 40:5, 41:9, 62:3 34:16, 34:19, 34:27, possibility [2] - 36:7, - 53:7 41:12, 53:21, 53:29, receiving [1] - 50:20 36:6 54:8, 62:6, 66:6, recent [4] - 24:5, registration] [1] -68:22 programme [6] possible [7] - 7:22, 68:13, 73:29, 84:13 25:6. 25:23. 29:12 33.1 47:3, 47:4, 47:7, quickly [3] - 7:22, 9:19, 22:7, 29:5, 47:13, 47:15, 67:11 reclassified [1] regular [1] - 75:18 74:17, 80:19, 82:17 47:15, 74:17 13:6 progress [1] - 19:18 regularly [1] - 62:4 **QUINN** [1] - 3:10 possibly [1] - 23:15 promotion [7] - 41:5, recollection [6] regulation [6] potentially [1] -Quinn [1] - 58:7 31:10, 31:21, 73:25, 41:13, 43:8, 43:10, 20:5, 55:8, 55:13, 47:27 48:6, 49:4, 50:12 quite [6] - 6:29, 55:14, 60:25, 61:1 74:2, 75:10, 75:15 preference [2] proper [6] - 15:12, 10:25, 11:8, 32:8, recommend [1] regulations [2] -19:10, 19:21 15:26, 38:17, 38:20, 67:15, 72:21 29:9 15:7, 62:24 preferential [2] -83:23, 83:27 recommendation [5] Regulations [1] -20:6. 20:13 properties [1] -R - 28:5, 28:25, 29:15, 31.22 preferred [1] - 31:6 31:17 31:24 reject [3] - 40:16, 27:21 propose [5] - 22:18, preparatory [1] recommendations 71:28. 72:2 radio [1] - 47:2 [2] - 29:25, 65:17 32:9, 40:4, 41:6, rejected [1] - 72:16 raised [7] - 7:12, prepared [1] - 55:25 50:25 recommended [4] relate [1] - 9:26 12:11, 14:13, 36:13, propriety [1] - 72:15 28:3, 31:9, 31:20, presence [5] - 37:23, related [9] - 44:15, 37:22, 81:10, 82:18 36:29 38:11, 42:20, 65:5, prosecution [1] -47:15, 62:25, 64:19, raising [1] - 36:13 recommending [3] -64:26, 64:27, 65:14, 69:5 79:4 rang [5] - 30:24, present [1] - 25:15 PROTECTED[2] -75:9, 76:1, 76:9 65:15, 84:3 30:25, 30:26, 34:26, record [3] - 15:15, relates [2] - 43:10, presentation [1] -1:2. 1:3 45:28 32:13, 66:26 66:24 protected [1] - 49:25 45:22 rank [3] - 16:16, recorded [7] - 11:28, PRESIDENT [2] **provide** [1] - 80:19 relating [3] - 31:28, 70:15, 77:3 59:21, 60:7, 60:24, 39:17. 58:19 1:13, 2:3 provided [4] - 28:8, rather [2] - 49:8, presumably [2] -33:6, 33:23, 35:4 60:26, 67:24 relation [63] - 9:6, 73:19 12:28, 51:18 prudent [1] - 15:26 records [3] - 37:12, 9:10, 9:13, 21:12, re [6] - 43:17, 45:24, 43:4. 44:22 presume [2] - 56:1, public [3] - 29:13, 26:18, 27:17, 28:13, 59:10, 59:28, 70:25, redacted [2] - 23:28, 29:7, 30:15, 36:21, 82:21 40:18, 55:28 75:25 24.2 39:21, 39:23, 40:26, prevent [1] - 9:20 pull [6] - 10:7, 54:12, **RE** [2] - 5:7, 56:27 54:17, 54:22, 54:23, **REDDY** [1] - 4:5 41:18, 48:7, 49:19, Prevention [1] re-direct [1] - 70:25 49:25, 52:4, 53:5, 54:25 refer [1] - 63:15 RE-EXAMINED [2] -54:19, 57:6, 58:25, previously [2] - 7:23, pulled [1] - 34:17 reference [8] - 6:26, 5:7. 56:27 59:22. 60:4. 60:9. 13:6, 15:9, 16:9, 17:4, 28:8 Pulse [24] - 8:17, 9:3, re-occur [1] - 75:25 60:14, 74:23, 84:18 61:2, 61:14, 61:18, 9:8, 9:10, 9:16, 11:14, primarily [3] - 74:14, reached [1] - 21:13 61:29, 62:7, 62:20, 11:20, 32:5, 32:12, references [2] -79:29 80:18 reaction [1] - 45:5 62:29, 64:2, 64:10, 47:19, 84:24 primary [3] - 58:24, 35:4, 71:13, 71:21, read [1] - 14:5 65:5, 65:21, 65:27, 76:28, 81:13 72:23, 72:25, 73:16, referral [3] - 62:7, readily [1] - 43:25 66:3, 66:5, 66:7, 66:9, 62:15. 62:28 printed [1] - 34:2 76:16, 76:18, 76:27, reading [1] - 17:26 67:19, 68:13, 68:18, 76:29, 77:10, 77:15, referred [13] - 36:7, private [2] - 24:21, really [8] - 9:13, 79:17, 79:24, 80:11 39:11, 39:15, 56:14, 70:16, 72:4, 73:25, 39.2 11:22, 35:2, 45:9, 73:29, 76:3, 76:12, problem [5] - 11:21, purpose [2] - 43:11, 58:2, 58:11, 62:18, 50:10, 82:3, 82:11, 76:14, 76:15, 76:17, 22:10, 22:13, 82:15, 58:24 62:22, 64:23, 68:1, 84:23 76:20, 79:13, 79:14, 68:25 80:14 85:2 **pursue** [2] - 49:3 realm [2] - 77:10, 79:19, 79:24, 81:10, refers [3] - 39:6, put [10] - 9:7, 17:22, procedure [4] -82:19. 83:2 73:24, 80:4 63:15, 63:17, 63:20, 23:29, 24:19, 27:28, reason [2] - 68:23, relatively [1] - 32:2 58:4, 70:29, 76:28, reflect [1] - 48:9 79:14 71:29 relayed [3] - 41:22, 80:22, 84:14 regard [7] - 14:12, procedures [2] - 9:8, reasonable 131 -42:23, 45:4 putting [1] - 13:19 21:16, 21:19, 40:5, 73:2 14:12, 50:24, 50:27 relaying [2] - 10:1, 51:5, 68:9, 68:10 proceed [4] - 22:19, reasonably [1] -66:21 Q regarding [17] - 6:22, 41:8, 71:27, 72:18 26.28 relays [2] - 28:10, 8:11, 15:1, 26:19, proceeding [1] reasons [1] - 34:14 26:21, 30:2, 32:5, QUAY [2] - 2:24, reassure [1] - 72:12 37:7, 37:17, 37:23, released [1] - 51:27 proceedings [2] -2:31 receive [2] - 63:19, releasing [1] - 51:24 47:3, 47:4, 52:28, 31:9, 75:10 queries [2] - 26:18, 63:20 58:3, 69:5, 74:24 relevance [2] - 23:2, process [4] - 28:18, 82:18 received [11] - 8:14, 47:25 registered [1] -76:15. 76:21. 82:2 **query** [1] - 48:29 18:19, 28:17, 30:23, relevant [11] - 23:13, 33:16 processes [1] questions [15] -32:4, 43:27, 45:17, 25:11, 25:27, 40:3, **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:5 10:27

47:27, 48:3, 48:12, 26:19, 28:13, 28:18, 3:12, 3:20, 4:2, 4:3, 69:19 robbery [7] - 6:16, 49:5, 51:10, 52:2, RESOLUTIONS [1] -6:22, 6:26, 9:14, 30:5, 30:8 4:3 52:9 10:12, 10:24, 81:11 searched [1] - 28:29 sergeant [19] - 7:12, 1:4 reliability [1] - 50:18 searches [3] - 8:12, 7:26, 8:25, 11:6, 77:4, resource [3] - 62:13, **role** [6] - 14:19, relieved [2] - 84:6, 64.8 64.14 15:27, 15:28, 27:23, 27.21 29.2 77:18, 78:18, 79:29, 80:15, 80:22, 80:25, RESOURCES [1] -40:19, 53:12 seat [2] - 33:2, 34:21 room [1] - 85:14 81:14, 81:25, 82:7, remarks [2] - 45:6, second [6] - 31:16, 82:12, 82:19, 82:21, 45:8 respect [6] - 20:1, rostered [1] - 27:26 44:19, 45:17, 80:13, 82:29, 83:6 remind [1] - 53:25 20:13, 22:2, 33:16, round [2] - 73:19, 81:27, 84:17 Sergeant [6] - 7:12, remit [1] - 29:27 40:12, 53:6 73.22 secondly [1] - 83:5 renew [1] - 22:20 respectful [1] - 21:8 RTÉ [2] - 47:2, 48:28 secretary [1] - 39:2 35:7, 35:13, 74:23, repeated [1] - 56:10 respectfully [3] -Rules [1] - 51:5 secretive [1] - 63:11 74:29. 81:10 29:9, 31:20, 70:14 RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 **sergeants** [1] - 79:13 repeating [1] - 9:20 section [8] - 15:4, series [1] - 57:13 reply [1] - 33:21 response [22] -Ryan [10] - 18:20, 16:21, 18:24, 62:13, serious [14] - 7:3, report [68] - 6:19, 10:26, 11:20, 12:11, 23:1, 23:12, 23:20, 64:8, 64:13, 64:14 **Section** [2] - 16:9, 8:4, 10:23, 10:25, 13:8, 13:13, 13:14, 23:23, 23:26, 24:19, 7:11, 8:7, 8:9, 8:25, 9:12, 9:13, 9:27, 11:6, 13:23, 13:27, 14:12, 25:8, 29:10, 66:21, 25:23, 60:10 74:16, 77:6, 79:25, 14:14, 14:22, 14:23, Ryan's [2] - 23:15, 11:14, 11:15, 12:22, secure [3] - 85:10, 80:9, 80:20, 82:25 14:28, 15:12, 16:22, 13:1, 14:1, 20:21, 24:2 85:12, 85:15 37:19, 48:16, 62:15, serious' [1] - 10:18 23:2, 23:15, 23:20, see [27] - 6:22, 11:6, 74:3, 74:8, 74:21, seriousness [1] -11:10, 12:5, 12:14, 23:26, 24:2, 24:8, S 24:9, 24:10, 24:11, 75:29 13:27, 15:15, 20:17, 15:22 responsibilities [3] -24:27, 31:28, 32:11, 26:23, 31:16, 33:29, **serve** [1] - 30:11 **S40** [1] - 34:14 15:27. 40:20. 53:12 32:15, 33:23, 35:7, served [1] - 25:7 34:20, 34:25, 36:12, sabotage [1] - 21:29 responsibility [1] service [5] - 53:6, 35:10, 35:20, 35:21, 37:1, 37:5, 45:9, sabotaged [1] -35:26, 36:8, 36:11, 75:27 45:18, 47:24, 50:28, 60:16, 61:7, 64:6, 21:27 36:14, 37:19, 38:27, rest [2] - 7:8, 8:25 55:14, 68:13, 74:7, 64:16 safer [1] - 50:14 39:1, 39:6, 62:12, result [8] - 31:8, 79:15, 80:3, 80:7, Services [1] - 1:24 safety [1] - 36:22 62:14, 63:7, 63:19, 33:25, 38:22, 51:22, 84.17 **services** [2] - 58:4, SANDRA [1] - 4:3 63:20, 63:22, 69:24, 52:12, 52:13, 61:11, seeing [2] - 46:18, 67:1 satisfactory [1] -72:7, 72:10, 76:2, **SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 79:27 85:23 14.29 77:3, 77:16, 80:10, results [2] - 51:24, seek [2] - 28:2, 51:22 serving [1] - 77:3 Saturday [1] - 30:23 81:3, 81:13, 81:22, 51:27 seeking [4] - 35:7, set [6] - 15:4, 25:22, **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 81:23, 81:24, 81:26, resume [1] - 85:5 36:16, 37:16, 58:24 32:26, 33:9, 63:8, 82:6, 82:8, 82:11, save [1] - 84:24 **RESUMED** [1] - 6:1 seem [6] - 48:2, 48:3, 78:10 saved [1] - 40:10 82:13, 82:20, 83:2 **RETIRED** [7] - 3:5, 48:9, 52:4, 57:17, seven [2] - 25:8, reported [11] - 11:5, saw [3] - 15:25, 62:8, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, 61:27 15:13, 17:9, 17:28, 75:29 3:12, 3:13 seized [4] - 28:20, **shall** [2] - 16:15, 84:1 32:20, 38:12, 44:18, **SC** [11] - 2:6, 2:7, return [6] - 6:15, 30:7, 30:16, 30:29 **SHANE** [1] - 3:23 45:7, 46:1, 76:26 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 27:4, 48:25, 76:13, send [2] - 39:2, **SHANKEY**[1] - 3:21 reporter [1] - 63:10 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:3, 77:26, 83:15 82.14 SHANKEY-SMITH reporting [13] - 6:28, sense [1] - 71:17 returned [3] - 38:26, [1] - 3:21 8:11, 32:24, 38:17, SCANLAN [1] - 3:8 77:28, 78:22 sensible [1] - 40:4 **SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 38:20, 50:6, 72:29, scant [1] - 8:9 $\textbf{reverted}\, [\textbf{1}]\textbf{ - }58\text{:}26$ **sent** [23] - 7:26, 11:6, Shannon [2] - 58:19, 73:2, 74:24, 76:17, scene [3] - 8:11, 23:14, 23:15, 23:25, review [4] - 37:14, 58:26 79:15, 79:16, 82:24 10:4, 11:24 24:11, 24:27, 25:19, 39:15, 68:2, 78:5 shape [1] - 40:17 reports [2] - 79:22, reviewed [3] - 30:18, sceptical [1] - 64:19 31:14, 33:8, 33:26, **SHEAHAN**[1] - 3:18 scepticism [1] -78:18, 78:20 36:27, 37:15, 38:28, sheet [5] - 33:9. representations[1] -36:15 reviews [1] - 79:7 59:28, 63:7, 65:11, 35:5, 77:23, 78:21, 51:26 scheduled [1] - 41:3 74:14, 74:29, 77:17, revisited [1] - 72:9 79:9 represents [1] screen [7] - 9:24, 79:5, 81:24, 82:20 right-hand [1] -**SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 25.15 46:5, 66:6, 67:27, separate [4] - 48:3, **SHIP** [1] - 3:28 request [3] - 77:22, 75:5, 84:14, 84:15 74:7, 75:9, 76:9 rigour [1] - 15:21 **shop** [2] - 32:29, 78:27, 79:10 scroll [6] - 6:23, September [12] ring [1] - 30:25 34.17 requested [4] -12:4, 12:17, 13:4, 6:20, 7:10, 10:13, rise [1] - 29:2 short [7] - 6:29, 14:7, 26:13, 33:13, 33:19, 38:25, 39:4 10:15, 11:16, 12:22, risk [2] - 25:15, 34:21, 38:14, 66:26, 72:11 **SEAN**[4] - 1:12, 2:2, 13:23, 18:17, 42:20, 27:23 80:4, 80:10 required [2] - 9:13, 2:22. 3:17 42:21, 43:1, 60:6 risks [1] - 29:12 short-term [1] -82:15 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 sequence [1] - 35:9 **ROAD** [1] - 2:18 requires [2] - 29:17, search [6] - 11:23, SERGEANT [5] roadmap [1] - 39:22 shudder [1] - 50:8

84:13 sick [2] - 74:25, stage [12] - 8:11, 83:2 targeted [5] - 21:22, 74:26 14:14, 16:27, 30:29, subject-matter [1] -**SUPERINTENDENT** 40:17, 48:14, 48:17, sickness [1] - 66:26 42:25, 45:10, 48:25, 83:2 [19] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, 48:19 52:3, 54:29, 55:4, targeting [6] - 21:2, side [1] - 66:11 **subjected** [1] - 21:1 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, 76:1, 78:3 submission [3] -3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, 21:11, 21:14, 36:16, sighting [1] - 31:29 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 5:3, significant [2] stand [1] - 49:2 21:8, 21:9, 48:12 40:13, 53:2 standing [1] - 72:14 6:11, 54:5, 56:27 tasked [2] - 54:18, 27:22, 28:22 submit [1] - 78:27 similar [1] - 44:9 start [1] - 6:17 submitted [3] - 8:9, superintendent's [2] 70:15 - 41:13, 48:5 taxi [1] - 18:11 similarly [1] - 40:5 started [1] - 46:22 11:15, 78:15 superintendents [1] team [7] - 26:6, state [1] - 72:3 subsequently [3] simple [1] - 71:29 - 51:26 26:20, 40:6, 79:28, STATE[1] - 3:27 31:2, 38:5, 66:4 **simply** [1] - 40:3 sinister [1] - 35:29 statement [11] succour [1] - 75:28 **superior** [1] - 22:5 81:6, 81:7, 81:9 supervising [1] telephone [5] - 30:7, SINÉAD [1] - 4:4 10:8, 27:10, 33:15, sufficient [1] - 23:10 33:26, 34:3, 34:4, sufficiently [1] -77:4 30:20, 30:22, 30:23, SINéAD [1] - 2:7 35:11, 38:5, 57:10, supplied [3] - 30:4, 31.12 39:27 situation [6] - 11:3, 68:17, 76:8 31:11, 74:10 telephoned [1] suggest [3] - 46:14, 18:13, 27:14, 61:4, support [3] - 39:5, statements [1] -49:22 70:14 80:13 76:6. 84:28 63:1, 67:6 telephonic [1] suggesting [2] six [2] - 77:26, 77:27 suppose [35] - 7:16, 28:20 six-week [1] - 77:26 Station [1] - 18:21 67:6, 71:17 7:18, 8:28, 9:14, 10:2, **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 **station** [11] - 35:21, suggestion [3] skepticism [2] -10:5, 11:8, 12:21, ten [5] - 21:21, 43:5, 45:13, 64:21, 19:9, 19:15, 19:23 35:27, 65:3 69:21, 80:27, 81:18, 14:16, 14:23, 15:23, 29:20, 29:22, 29:23 suggestive [1] slightly [2] - 14:4, 81:25, 82:7, 82:19, 16:2, 17:19, 18:11, tensions [1] - 29:7 70:28 35.6 27:23, 27:27, 35:10, 83:1 summarise [1] - 22:1 term [2] - 66:26, 67:6 **slow** [1] - 19:23 35:28, 36:10, 39:13, status [1] - 70:27 **summary** [7] - 32:11, terminology [1] small [1] - 38:25 62:14, 63:6, 64:5, 69:1 statutory [1] - 15:3 32:15. 33:9. 35:5. **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 stay [1] - 63:23 72:6, 72:8, 77:16 64:12, 74:5, 74:9, terms [13] - 7:19. SMITHFIELD [1] -76:5, 77:5, 79:8, stenographic [1] summer [1] - 9:9 8:29, 9:8, 12:9, 18:8, 2:24 79:27, 81:28, 82:16, 1:26 Sunday [3] - 7:18, 18:29, 19:3, 19:6, **SO** [1] - 27:5 82:25, 83:5 19:7, 19:22, 27:23, stenography [1] -47:1, 47:7 sober [2] - 50:17, **surprise**[1] - 20:20 52:26, 81:29 superintendent [34] 50:18 1.24 surveillance [2] -STENOGRAPHY[1] text [1] - 24:3 - 6:6, 17:2, 19:28, **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 26:20 37:26 **THE** [9] - 1:3, 1:7, - 1:29 20:13, 23:1, 25:20, **SOLICITOR** [1] - 2:8 suspend [1] - 29:21 step [1] - 26:13 28:8, 29:18, 29:20, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, SOLICITOR'S [1] suspended [1] -6:1, 84:8, 85:26 STEPHANIE [1] -32:4, 33:8, 33:25, 19.23 THEN [1] - 85:26 36:23, 36:28, 37:14, 2:27 SOLICITORS [5] suspending [1] -37:28, 40:22, 41:19, thereafter [1] - 57:11 **STEPHEN** [1] - 2:21 2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, 29:11 43:21, 48:6, 50:20, therefore [3] - 29:8, steps [12] - 8:10, 4:5 suspension [6] -9:28, 12:19, 12:23, 52:26, 53:13, 54:8, 34:14, 70:14 someone [3] - 36:28, 28:2, 29:19, 29:28, 54:28. 59:9. 64:3. third [1] - 26:29 12:25, 18:3, 19:22, 68:3 82:12 30:11, 30:15, 30:17 65:10, 72:8, 73:23, 23:5, 24:15, 33:11, thoroughly [1] sometime [1] - 24:23 36:20. 37:10 74:12, 83:13, 84:2, **suspicious** [1] - 38:1 65:15 somewhat [3] **sustained** [1] - 67:9 stick [1] - 10:19 84:4 three [4] - 25:11, 20:18, 35:3, 64:19 sympathetic [1] still [1] - 74:25 Superintendent [50] 27:10, 30:18, 70:12 sorry [15] - 18:18, 20:19 - 10:16, 14:1, 22:3, STOOD [1] - 84:8 timeline [6] - 31:5, 20:11, 32:16, 35:18, system [3] - 29:17, 22:8, 23:16, 23:22, 43:26, 68:20, 68:21, stop [4] - 33:1, 37:2, 43:10, 44:8, 24:12, 24:16, 24:20, 72:25, 83:28 78:12, 78:24 34:18, 55:3, 55:6 46:18, 47:22, 47:23, 24:27, 26:1, 26:4, systems [1] - 10:27 stopped [1] - 34:18 **TO**[1] - 6:11 52:1, 53:28, 55:23, 26:17, 27:20, 28:4, **SÍOCHÁNA** [1] - 3:2 today [3] - 22:24, straying [1] - 41:2 75:5, 76:23 28:5, 28:12, 28:19, Síochána [12] -STREET [3] - 2:12, 68:28, 72:9 sought [5] - 31:5, 28:29, 29:24, 31:2, 12:27, 15:5, 15:6, 3:28, 3:32 together [2] - 11:15, 31:8, 33:21, 35:13, 31:14, 35:21, 38:29, 15:7, 16:10, 16:15, 81.8 stress [8] - 51:19, 51:25 48:7, 48:15, 48:29, 16:20, 17:5, 30:5, 62:25, 64:19, 64:26, TOM [1] - 3:12 **source** [1] - 29:3 49:15, 49:20, 50:6, 30:9, 31:22, 72:29 64:29, 65:2, 65:4, tone [2] - 12:9, 13:26 speaking [1] - 23:6 50:12, 55:9, 57:7, took [5] - 24:15, 65:16 **specialist** [1] - 64:13 57:23, 58:3, 58:10, Т structures [3] -24:23, 27:17, 28:1, **specific** [2] - 21:20, 58:18, 58:29, 59:6, 38:18, 38:20, 61:6 38:2 47:25 59:10, 59:29, 60:16, top [5] - 12:14, struggling [2] sped [1] - 33:3 T&N [1] - 3:31 60:22, 60:29, 61:19, 47:24. 52:1 13:11, 32:16, 33:27, speed [1] - 32:29 TARA[1] - 3:22 61:26, 61:28, 75:4, subject [2] - 80:10, 57:17 spring [1] - 9:9

Section Conting Cont	total [1] - 52:7	U	V	4:1	57:20
Unable (i) - 8.27 value(a) - 8.27 value(a) - 8.23, and a second (i) - 4.06 value(a) - 8.27 value(a) - 8.23, and a second (i) - 4.06 value(a) - 8.27 value(a) - 8.28, and a second (i) - 4.27 value(a) - 8.28, and a second (i) - 4.28 value(a) - 8.28 value(a) - 8.29	_				
		unable (4) 9:27	volue rei 20:22		1:5
					<u> </u>
36.1					O
S32 S33 S34:11 S32:12 S35:13 S33:13 S32:12 S35:13 S33:13 S32:13 S33:13				whereas [1] - 19:16	
18.27, 29.28, 31.9, 34.11 37.5, 37.21, 34.27, 38.11, 38.13 34.27, 20.21, 21.13, 36.27 27.20, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 37.5, 37.21, 34.27, 38.11, 38.13 34.19 white s. 32.8, 34.19 whole s. 32.8, 34.10, 34.18, 34.18 whole s. 32.8, 34.10, 34.18, 34.18 whol				whilst [1] - 16:17	Ó [40] - 3:7 18:16
34:11 TOWPARKS [n] - 12:27 trained [n] - 12:27 transpired [n] - 12:28 transfer [n] - 12:5 transpired [n] - 12:	53:2		· ·	whistleblower [4] -	
TOWNPARKS [1] - 2.12 trained [1] - 12.27 transcript [1] - 1.25 transpired [2] - 30.13, 67.8 7.72 transpired [2] - 30.13, 67.8 7.72 transpired [2] - 30.13, 67.8 7.72 trated [1] - 1.25 trated [1] - 1.25 trated [1] - 1.25 trated [1] - 1.26 trated [1] - 1.26 trated [1] - 1.27 transpired [2] - 30.13, 67.8 7.72 trated [1] - 1.25 trated [1] - 1.25 trated [1] - 1.26 trated [1] - 1.26 trated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.26 trated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.28 trated [1] - 1.29 undiminished [2] - 7.21 strated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.28 trated [1] - 1.29 undiminished [2] - 7.21 trated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.27 trated [1] - 1.28 trated [1] - 1.29 undiminished [2] - 7.21 trated [1] - 1.29 undoubted[1] 2.26 try [2] - 51:5, 8.2.26 try [2] - 51:5, 8.2.	town [2] - 33:3,		• •	58:20, 58:28, 59:10,	
1.0 1.2	34:11			69:28	
rained [1] - 1227 transcript [1] - 1228 transfer [2] - 56.9, 75:10, 76:9. Verbattim [1] - 1:25 transpired [2] - 12.1 is understandable [1] is 25, 70:26, 61:20, 18:25 in a contest and able [1] is 25, 70:26, 61:20, 18:26 transpired [2] - 18:25, 70:26 transpired [2] - 18:25, 70	TOWNPARKS[1] -		I	WHITE [1] - 3:11	
ONDER 2 - 1:2, 1:8 understandable 1:3 vicini 1:12:5	2:12		24:9	white [6] - 32:28,	
Version 19-12 19-13 19-15 19	trained [1] - 12:27	75:9, 75:10, 76:9	verbatim [1] - 1:25	34:12, 34:14, 34:16,	
8.28	transcript [1] - 1:25	UNDER [2] - 1:2, 1:8	version [1] - 34:2	34:18, 34:19	
	transfer [2] - 56:4,	understandable [1] -	via [1] - 69:19	whole [6] - 57:13,	o [1] - 19:13
understood	· · ·	8:28	victim [1] - 11:27		
17:20 transpired [2] modeterred [1] 20:3, 70:26 unditinished [2] 72:19 undiminished [2] 72:19 visit [2] 72:20 visit [2] 72:24 visit [2] 72:24 visit [2] 72:24 visit [2] 72:25 72:24 visit [2] 72:25 72:24 visit [2] 72:25 72:24 visit [2] 72:25 72:24 visit [2] 72:26 72:24 visit		understood [2] -	view [15] - 12:28,		
Undeterred	•	18:25, 70:26		•	
3013, 67.8 Travel(n) - 11:25 TREACY(n) - 2:27 treated(n) - 12:5 treatment(a) - 20:6, 2013, 563.4, 67:11 Tribunal(n) - 47:28, 26:5 TRIBUNAL(n) - 36:20 try(n) - 51:5, 82:26 try(n) - 14:19, 29:3, 41:28, 42:3, 83:24, 82:25 Tursday(n) - 42:11 Tullamore(n) - 27:7 unlikely(n) - 83:20 try(n) - 36:23, 33:25, 33:10, 33:25, 33:8, 33:25, 33:10, 33:25, 33:10, 33:25 Tursday(n) - 44:11 tursday(n) - 44:12 turne(n) - 14:29 turne(n) - 14:19, 29:3, 41:12, 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 70:3, 76:29, 34:10, 34:25 Turne(n) - 44:11, 75:6, 69:21, 82:13, 83:28, 40:11, 41:28, 40:11, 41:28, 40:16, 76:29, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:29, 40:14, 41:28, 40:14, 41:28, 40:16, 76:29, 76:22, 76:24 visit(n) - 43:2		undeterred [1] -			
Undiminished 2 - TREACY 1 - 2:27 treated 1- 12:5 treatment 1- 2:06 20:13, 56:4, 67:11 72:19 undoubted 2 - 25:5, 36:24 unfair 1- 12:14 2:24 unfair 1- 12:14 2:25 53:6:24 unfair 1- 12:14 2:25 53:6:24 unfair 1- 12:14 2:25 2:6 Unfortunately 16:25, 47:6, 76:13 67:15, 62:26 try	•		, , ,		
TREACY - -	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			•	
rreated [n] - 12.5 treatment [a] - 20.6 20:13, 56:4, 67:11 Tribunal [z] - 47:28, 85:5 TRIBUNAL [z] - 1:2, 2:6 TRIBUNAL [z] - 1:2, 2:6 TRIBUNALS [n] - 1:8 truth [n] - 36:20 trying [s] - 14:19, 29:3, 41:28, 42:3, 43:29; 3, 43:29, 34:10, 34:25 TUSSday [n] - 42:11 Tullamore [n] - 12:18 tunless [n] - 40:7 unlikely [n] - 49:1 UNTIL [n] - 58:26 turn [z] - 48:11, 75:6 turn [z] - 48:11, 75:6 turn [z] - 48:12, 32:5 TURNER [n] - 2:28 turn [z] - 48:12, 32:5 TURNER [n] - 2:28 turn [z] - 48:12, 32:13 turn [z] - 48:12, 32:14 undoubtedly [z] - 12:18 unfair [n] - 12:18 unit [n] - 12:18 unit [n] - 12:18				1	
rreatment (4] - 20:6, 20:13, 56:4, 67:11		·		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
Undoubtedly	1				
Tribunal [2] - 47.28, 85.5 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, 2.6 TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8 truth [1] - 36.20 try [2] - 51.5, 82.26 try [2] - 51.5, 82.26 try [3] - 51.6, 82.26 try [3] - 51.6, 82.26 try [3] - 51.6, 82.26 truble [1] - 33.2, 82.25 Tuesday [1] - 42.11 Tullamore [17] - 33.2, 33.25, 33.4; 33.2, 33.2, 33.2, 33.2, 33.2, 34.10, 35.21, 35.23, 33.25, 34.10, 35.21, 35.23, 35.25, 36.24 UNTIL [1] - 85.26 up [2] - 71.6, 10.7, 36.6, 6.7.27, turned [3] - 11.2, 35.2, 36.23, 35.2, 34.10, 34.25 Turned [3] - 11.29, 35.2, 84.24 turning [1] - 44.12 turning [1]				1	
## 10:24 ## 10:25 ## 10:25 ## 10:25 ## 10:25 ## 10:26 ## 10:25 ## 10:26 ## 10:25 ## 10:26 ##		-	•		
TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, 2:6 TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8 truth [1] - 36:20 trying [6] - 14:19, 25:17, 277, 27:25, 73:2 trying [6] - 14:19, 25:5, 33:8, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 truned [9] - 11:5, 24:6, 34:18, 34:19 truing [1] - 44:12 truned [9] - 11:5, 24:6, 34:18, 34:18, 34:19 truned [9] - 44:12 truned [9] - 11:5, 24:6, 34:18, 34:18, 34:19 truned [9] - 44:12 truned [9] - 11:5, 24:6, 34:18, 34:18, 34:19 truned [9] - 44:12 truned [9] - 11:5, 24:6, 34:18, 34:18, 34:19 truned [9] - 44:12 truned [9] - 54:20, 80:4 two [9] - 11:5, 24:6, 34:18, 34:18, 34:19 truned [9] - 44:12 truned [9] - 54:20, 80:4 two [9] - 11:5, 24:6, 34:18, 34:19 truned [9] - 46:4 truned [9] - 44:12 truned [9] - 44:12 truned [9] - 46:25 truned [9] - 44:12 truned [9] -	· · ·				
Unfortunately 3					
TRIBUNALS [I] - 1:8 truth [I] - 36:20 try [2] - 51:5, 82:26 try [2] - 51:5, 82:26 try [3] - 14:19, 29:3, 41:28, 42:3, 63:24, 82:25					
truth [1] - 36:20 try [2] - 51:5, 82:26 trying [9] - 14:19, 29:3, 41:28, 42:3, 63:24, 82:25 Tuesday [1] - 42:11 Tullamore [17] - 31:29, 32:5, 33:8, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 22:8 turning [1] - 44:12 turning [1] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 36:24, 81:8, 38:3 TURNER [1] - 22:8 turning [1] - 44:12 turned [3] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:11, 64:62 32:19 TURNER [1] - 22:8 turning [1] - 44:12 turned [2] - 15:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:18, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5, 24:6, 71:28 Tive [1] - 12:30 turne [2] - 12:3, 16:7, Tive [2] - 40:16, 71:28 Tive [3] - 12:3, 16:7, Tive [4] - 12:9 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, Tive [4] - 40:26, 53:28, 40:11, 41:28, 40:10, 77:21, 20:11, 23:14, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Tive [3] - 41:2, 71:8, 83:27 wonder [3] - 41:2, 71:8, 83:29 word [4] - 46:25, 47:10, 69:11, 73:13 words [2] - 19:15, 54:12 Wilace [1] - 22:6 Wallace [1] - 41:29 warrant [1] - 28:18 Warrant [1] - 28:6 Wallace [1] - 41:2, 71:8, 83:27 Work [4] - 46:25, 47:10, 69:11, 73:13 words [2] - 19:15, 54:12 work [2] - 19:15, 54:12 Wilace [1] - 41:29 warrant [1] - 28:18 Warrant [1] - 48:29 warrant [1] - 28:18 Warrant [1] - 28:26 Wallace [1] - 41:29 Warrant [1] - 28:18 Warrant [1] - 28:26 Warrant [1] - 28:26 Warrant [1] - 48:12 Vear [1] - 45:14 Ve	2:6		· ·		
try 2 - 51:5, 82:26 trying 6 - 14:19, 29:3, 41:28, 42:3, 63:24, 82:25 Tuesday 1 - 42:11 Tullamore [17 - 31:29, 32:5, 33:8, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:11, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turn 2 - 44:11, 75:6 turned 3 - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER 1 - 2:28 turning 1 - 44:12 turn 2 - 35:2, 41:20, 34:25 Tuned 1 - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:36, 59:17, 59:20, 78:18, 78:29, 80:21, 78:18, 78:27, 77:25, 78:18, 78:29, 80:21, 78:18, 78:29, 80:21, 78:18, 78:29, 80:21, 78:18, 78:29, 80:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume 4 - 57:15 Volvo 6 - 32:29, 34:12, 34:14, 34:16, 34:18, 34:19 Volume	TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8				
trying [6] - 14:19, 29:3, 41:28, 42:3, 63:24, 82:25 Tuesday [1] - 42:11 Tullamore [17] - 31:29, 32:5, 33:8, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:11, 35:20, 36:23, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turne [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 44:12 turning [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:18, 63:3 two-week [1] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:18, 33:3 two-week [1] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:18, 33:3 two-week [1] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:18, 33:3 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, 71:28	truth [1] - 36:20		l ·	wonder [3] - 41:2,	
29:3, 41:28, 42:3, 63:24, 82:25 Tuesday[i] - 42:11 Tullamore[i7] - 31:29, 32:5, 33:8, 33:25, 34:10, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turned[i3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER[i] - 2:28 turning[i] - 44:12 turn[i2] - 35:2, 83:24 two[i4] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week[i] - 11:5 type[i3] - 12:3, 16:7, 78:18, 78:19, 80:21, 81:18, 80:213 Tuesday[i] - 42:11 unite [i] - 27:7 unless [i] - 40:7 unless [i] - 40:7 unlikely [i] - 49:1 UNTIL [i] - 85:26 up [i] - 49:1 UNTIL [i] - 85:26 up [i] - 7:16, 10:7, 82:18 up [i] - 39:26 up [i] - 7:16, 10:7, 92:16 UNTIL [i] - 85:26 up [i] - 7:16, 10:7, 92:16 UNTIL [i] - 85:26 up [i] - 7:16, 10:7, 92:16 UNTIL [i] - 85:26 up [i] - 7:16, 10:7, 92:16 UNTIL [i] - 85:26 up [i] - 7:16, 10:7, 92:16 UNTIL [i] - 85:26 up [i] - 7:16, 10:7, 92:16 Wait [i] - 22:6 Wallace [i] - 41:29 warrant [i] - 26:20, 28:13 WAS [i] - 54:5, 55:27 week[i] - 11:5, 77:26 weekend [i] - 45:27 week[i] - 11:5, 77:26 weekend [i] - 45:27 week[i] - 11:5, 77:27 weeki [i] - 79:12 weeks [i] - 12:21, 77:27 weeki [i] - 45:14 veeks [i] - 79:12 weeks [i] - 79:12 weeks [i] - 13:24, 40:16, 77:27 sulterances [i] - 57:20 utterances [i] - 57:20 utterances [i] - 57:20 utterances [i] - 57:20 itterances [i] - 57:20 i	try [2] - 51:5, 82:26			71:8, 83:27	
63:24, 82:25 Tuesday[i] - 42:11 Tullamore [i7] - 31:29, 32:5, 33:8, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:11, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [i] - 22:8 turning [i] - 44:12 turn [2] - 35:2, 83:28, 40:14 turn [2] - 35:2, 84:24 two [i4] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [i] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7,	trying [6] - 14:19,			wondered [1] - 17:20	
Tuesday [1] - 42:11 Tullamore [17] - 31:29, 32:5, 33:8, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:21, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 22:8 turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80, 48:18, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, unitike [1] - 27:7 unless [1] - 40:7 unlikely [1] - 40:10 wait [1] - 22:6 Wallace [1] - 41:29 warrants [2] - 26:20, 28:13 WAS [2] - 54:5, 56:27 week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 weekend [1] - 45:27 week[2] - 11:5, 77:27 week[2] - 11:5, 77:27 week[2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 EABHALL [1] - 2:30 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30	29:3, 41:28, 42:3,			word [4] - 46:25,	
Tullamore [17] - 31:29, 32:5, 33:8, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:11, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 44:12 turning [1] - 44:12 turning [1] - 44:12 turb (2] - 55:20, 80:4 turb (2] - 54:20, 80:4 turb (2] - 57:20 turb (3] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, unless [1] - 40:7 turb (41:2) turb (2] - 54:20, 80:1 turb (2] - 54:20, 80:4 turb (2] - 54:20, 80:4 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, unless [1] - 40:7 turb (2] - 44:12, 49:5, 63:7, 65:11, 65:13, 66:6, 67:27, 71:18, 75:4, 76:2, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 40:11, 41:28, 49:5, 63:7, 65:11, 65:13, 66:6, 67:27, 71:18, 75:4, 76:2, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 42:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 46:4 useful [1] - 12:29 utterances [1] - 57:20 utterly [2] - 40:16, 71:28 Wait [1] - 22:6 Wallace [1] - 41:29 warrant [1] - 22:6 Wallace [1] - 41:29 warrant [2] - 26:20, 28:13 WAS [2] - 54:5, 56:27 week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 weekend [1] - 45:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 year [1] - 45:14 Year [1] - 85:22 yesterday [6] - 6:17, 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24 E E E E E E E E E E E E E	63:24, 82:25		34:18, 34:19	47:10, 69:11, 73:13	
Tullamore [17] - 31:29, 32:5, 33:8, 33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:21, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 22:8 turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, Tunek [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, JUNTIL [1] - 85:26 UNITL [1] - 85:26 Wait [1] - 22:6 Warant [1] - 40:21 witt [1] - 28:18 warants [2] - 26:20, 28:13 WAS [2] - 54:5, 56:27 Week [2] - 11:5, 7:26 Week [2] - 11:5, 7:27 week [2] - 11:5, 7:27 week [2] - 11:5, 7:27 week [2] - 12:21, 7:28 Y year [1] - 45:14 Year [1] - 85:22 yesterday[6] - 6:17, 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,	Tuesday [1] - 42:11	unite [1] - 27:7		words [2] - 19:15,	
33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 44:12 turning [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, UNTIL [1] - 85:26 up [23] - 7:16, 10:7, 18:25, 30:28, 33:22, 33:22, 33:22, 38:28, 40:11, 41:28, 4p:54, 50:27, 65:17, 58:21, 82:13, 82:8, 40:11, 41:28, 4p:54, 56:27, 71:18, 75:4, 76:2, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 84:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 46:4 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 12:29 utterances [1] - 57:20 utterly [2] - 40:16, 71:28 Wait [1] - 22:6 Wallace [1] - 22:6 Warrants [2] - 26:20, 28:13 Warrants [2] - 26:20, 28:13 Warrants [2] - 26:20, 28:13 Was [2] - 54:5, 56:27 WAS [2] - 54:5, 56:27 Week [2] - 54:5, 56:27 Week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 week [1] - 45:27 week [1] - 45:14 Year [1] - 85:22 yesterday [6] - 6:17, 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24 EABHALL [1] - 2:30 Eigently [1] - 42:1, Wait [1] - 22:6 warrant [2] - 26:20, 28:13 writen [3] - 15:15, 24:9, 75:3 wrote [2] - 58:27, 65:27 WAS [2] - 54:5, 56:27 Week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 week [2] - 12:21, 77:27 Week [2] - 11:5, 77:27 Week [2] - 12:21, 77:27 Week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 Week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 Week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 Week [2] - 12:21, 77:27 Week [2] - 12:21, 77:2	Tullamore [17] -	unless [1] - 40:7	W	54:12	
33:23, 33:25, 34:10, 35:11, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2 turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 22:8 turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, UNTIL [1] - 85:26 up [2] - 75:26 up [23] - 71:6, 10:7, 18:25, 30:28, 33:22, 33:23, 33:22, 33:22, 33:22, 33:22, 33:23, 33:22, 33:22, 33:22, 33:23, 33:22, 33:22, 33:22, 33:23, 33:22, 33:22, 33:23, 33:22, 33:22, 33:24,	31:29, 32:5, 33:8,	unlikely [1] - 49:1		workplace [4] - 29:7,	
35:11, 35:20, 36:23, 37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2		UNTIL [1] - 85:26		40:21, 53:11, 65:5	
37:14, 37:28, 38:9, 67:28, 69:21, 70:3, 70:25, 73:2		up [23] - 7:16, 10:7,		wrap [1] - 40:11	
38:28, 40:11, 41:28, 49:5, 63:7, 65:11, 65:13, 66:6, 67:27, 71:18, 75:4, 76:2, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 84:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 12:29 utterances [1] - 57:20 utterly [2] - 40:16, 71:28 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, 18:28 type [3] - 12:3, 18:3 type [3] - 12:3, 18:28, 40:11, 41:28, 49:5, 63:7, 65:17, 56:15, 56:27 type [3] - 12:3, 18:3 type [3] - 12:3, 18:21, 18:3, 18:3, 18:21, 18:3, 18:3, 18:21, 18:3, 18:3, 18:3, 18:21, 18:3, 18:3, 18:21, 18:21, 18:3, 18:3, 18:21, 18:21, 18:3, 18:21, 18:3, 18:3, 18:21, 18:3, 18:15, 18:3, 18:15, 18:15, 15:15, 18:15, 18:13, 18:15, 18:13, 18:15, 18:13, 18:15, 18:13, 18:15, 18:13, 18:15, 18:13, 18:15, 18:13, 18:13, 18:13, 18:21, 18:13, 18:21, 18:13, 18:13, 18:21, 18:13, 18:13, 18:13, 18:21, 18:13, 18:13, 18:13, 18:21, 18:13, 18:13, 18:21, 18:13, 18:13, 18:13		18:25, 30:28, 33:22,		• • • •	
70:25, 73:2 turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, 49:5, 63:7, 65:11, 65:13, 66:6, 67:27, 71:18, 75:4, 76:2, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 84:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 46:4 useful [1] - 12:29 utterances [1] - 57:20 utterly [2] - 40:16, 71:28 warrants [2] - 26:20, 28:13 WAS [2] - 54:5, 56:27 week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekly [1] - 79:12 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,		38:28, 40:11, 41:28,			
turn [2] - 44:11, 75:6 turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, 65:13, 66:6, 67:27, 71:18, 75:4, 76:2, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 84:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 46:4 useful [1] - 12:29 utterances [1] - 57:20 utterly [2] - 40:16, 71:28 WAS [2] - 54:5, 56:27 weeke [2] - 11:5, 77:26 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekey [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weekey [2] - 58:27 **Was [2] - 54:5, 56:27 **weekend [1] - 45:27 weekey [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weekey [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weekey [2] - 12:21, 77:27 year [1] - 45:14 Year [1]					
turned [3] - 11:29, 34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, 71:18, 75:4, 76:2, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 84:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 weekend [1] - 45:27 week[2] - 11:5, 77:26 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekend [1] - 45:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 west [2] - 54:5, 65:27 final in the state of t		65:13, 66:6, 67:27,		·	
34:10, 34:25 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 84:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 46:4 useful [1] - 12:29 utterances [1] - 57:20 utterly [2] - 40:16, 71:28 76:5, 82:1, 82:13, 83:28, 84:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 45:27 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekend [1] - 79:12 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 WESTMEATH [1] - ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,					
TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, 83:28, 84:14 update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 46:4 useful [1] - 12:29 utterances [1] - 57:20 utterly [2] - 40:16, 71:28 Week [2] - 11:5, 77:26 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekly [1] - 79:12 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 WESTMEATH [1] - ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •			J	
turning [1] - 44:12 turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, update [2] - 25:19, 39:13 updated [1] - 26:11 upside [2] - 13:9, 16:26 urgently [1] - 46:4 useful [1] - 12:29 utterances [1] - 57:20 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekly [1] - 79:12 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 WESTMEATH [1] - in Title in Title in Title weekend [1] - 45:27 weekly [1] - 45:14 Year [1] - 45:14 Year [1] - 45:14 Year [1] - 45:14 Year [1] - 85:22 yesterday [6] - 6:17, 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,			week [2] - 11:5,	v	
turns [2] - 35:2, 84:24 twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, 39:13 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekly [1] - 79:12 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 weekend [1] - 45:27 weekly [1] - 79:12 year [1] - 45:14 Year [1] - 85:22 yesterday [6] - 6:17, 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,				Ī	
## Weekly [1] - 79:12 weekly [1] - 79:12 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 weellbeing [1] - 67:9 weeks [2] - 12:31 weeks [2] - 40:16, 71:28 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:28 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 weellbeing [1] - 67:9 weeks [2] - 12:31 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:28 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 weeks [2] - 12:1, 77:28 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:28 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:28 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 weeks [2] - 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24	_		weekend [1] - 45:27		
twice [2] - 54:20, 80:4 two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 WESTMEATH [1] - Weeks [2] - 12:21, 77:27 welfare [9] - 39:6, 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24 Year [1] - 85:22 yesterday [6] - 6:17, 67:28, 68:14, 71:29, 72:5, 83:24 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,			weekly [1] - 79:12	year [1] - 45:14	
## 16:26 ##		-	weeks [2] - 12:21,	1 -	
two [14] - 11:5, 24:6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, welfare [9] - 39:6, 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 WESTMEATH [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,	,	-	77:27		
two [14] - 17.5, 24.6, 31:16, 40:26, 53:28, useful [1] - 12:29 39:10, 42:5, 44:21, 72:5, 83:24 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, twerances [1] - 57:20 60:22, 61:4 E wellbeing [1] - 67:9 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, WESTMEATH [1] - Éireann [2] - 42:1,			welfare [9] - 39:6,		
31:16, 40:26, 53:28, 54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, two-week [1] - 12:25 utterances [1] - 57:20 utterly [2] - 40:16, 71:28 56:17, 58:4, 60:16, 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 WESTMEATH [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,					
54:8, 59:17, 59:20, 78:4, 78:9, 79:11, 80:4, 81:8, 83:3 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, titlerances [1] - 60:22, 61:4 wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 WESTMEATH [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,				,	
wellbeing [1] - 67:9 two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, wellbeing [1] - 67:9 WELLINGTON [1] - 2:31 westmeath [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,				É	
two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, week [1] - 2:30 westmeath [1] - 2:30 Éireann [2] - 42:1,				-	
two-week [1] - 11:5 type [3] - 12:3, 16:7,		• • • •	=		
type [3] - 12:3, 16:7, WESTMEATH[1] - Éireann [2] - 42:1,		/ 1.20		ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30	
	type [3] - 12:3, 16:7,			Éireann [2] - 42:1,	
	82:24				