TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON WEDNESDAY, 22ND JANUARY 2020 - DAY 129

129

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR.

DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC PATRICK MARRINAN SC SINÉAD McGRATH BL JOHN DAVIS, SOLICITOR MR. MS. MR.

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY

& GARDA DAVID TURNER: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANIAN 10. 11. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN 13. SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16. 16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR. CHI EF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARI E CAGNEY DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON 30. INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY 31. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN 32. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN 33. 34. SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 35. 36. 37. SHANE MURPHY SC MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC MR. MR. MR.

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE____

INSTRUCTED BY:

LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL MR. PAUL CONNELLAN T&N MCLYNN FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

BASTION COURT 11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O' ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE

INSTRUCTED BY:

DUBLIN 2

FOR GARDA TOM HIGGINS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. TOM POWER BL
MR. NOEL McCARTAN
McCARTAN & BURKE SOLICITORS
ICELAND HOUSE
33-34 ARRAN QUAY
SMITHFIELD

DUBLIN 7

INDEX

١	VI TNESS	PAGE
	DETECTIVE SERGEANT YVONNE MARTIN	
	DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH	7
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. O'BRIEN	25
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MURPHY	28
	EXAMINED BY MS. O'ROURKE	35
	SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN	
	DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	42
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. KELLY	67
	EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS,	71
	GARDA GERRY WHITE (RETIRED)	
	DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	85
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. KELLY	88
	EXAMINED BY MR. CARROLL	94
	FURTHER CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. KELLY	98
	INSPECTOR MICHELLE BAKER	
	DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH	102
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. O'BRIEN	135
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS	144
	EXAMINED BY MS. O'ROURKE	152
	QUESTIONED BY THE CHAIRMAN	153
	RE-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH	161

1	NSPECTOR	AI DAN	MII	NNOCK

DIRECTLY-EXAMINED	BY	MR.	McGUINNESS	

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON WEDNESDAY, 22ND	
2			<u>JANUARY 2020</u> :	
3				
4			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
5			MS. McGRATH: Good morning, Chairman.	10:31
6			CHAIRMAN: Good morning, Ms. McGrath.	
7			MS. McGRATH: The next witness is Detective	
8			Sergeant Yvonne Martin, please.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
10				10:31
11			DETECTIVE SERGEANT YVONNE MARTIN, HAVING BEEN SWORN,	
12			WAS DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH, AS FOLLOWS:	
13				
14			THE WITNESS: Detective Sergeant Yvonne Martin.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Good morning.	10:32
16			THE WITNESS: Good morning, Chairman.	
17	1	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Good morning, detective. Detective, I	
18			think you're attached to Athlone Garda Station at the	
19			moment, at the rank of detective sergeant, is that	
20			right?	10:32
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	2	Q.	Okay. I think you were attested back in June 2001,	
23			isn't that right?	
24		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
25	3	Q.	And you became a sergeant in 2007?	10:32
26		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
27	4	Q.	It was in your capacity as sergeant then that you	
28			transferred to Athlone district in December 2014, isn't	
29			that right?	

- A. Yes. I initially went to Castlepollard in Mullingar, in the Westmeath division and then down to Athlone in 2014.
- 5 Q. Okay. Now, I think when you came to Athlone in 2014,
 can you just tell the Chairman what unit you were
 working in, in Athlone?
- 7 I was attached to the regular unit, unit B, in Athlone Α. 8 Garda Station. And I was there just over a year when I was assigned as sergeant in the crime drugs unit. 9 commencing February '16. And I worked there for a 10 10:33 11 number of months alongside Detective Sergeant Eamon 12 Curley before his promotion to inspector and I then 13 worked as acting detective sergeant until I was 14 appointed myself as detective sergeant.
- 15 CHAI RMAN: Sorry, could I ask you to pull the 10:33 16 microphone a tiny bit closer to you. Thanks very much. 17 If you pull that little apparatus. Thanks very much. 18 I don't want to make you uncomfortable or don't get too 19 conscious of it, but I find it a little easier to 20 understand. Thanks very much. 10:33
- 21 6 Q. MS. McGRATH: Now, I think you say there you were on 22 unit B during that period at least between end of 2014 23 into the end of 2015, is that right?
- A. Even up to February 2016.
- 7 Q. Okay. Now, I think Garda Keogh worked on unit C, as we 10:34 have heard here in the Tribunal, is that right?
- 27 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 28 Q. Now, can I just refer to you your statement. Chairman, 29 it's at Volume 3 and it's at page 595. The first

Т			paragraph is the paragraph I want you to look at, the	
2			first paragraph there at page 596. You say there at	
3			paragraph 3.1, there at the very top, you say:	
4				
5			"I would have had no dealings with Garda Keogh as he	10:34
6			was on a different unit to me. Any interaction would	
7			have been limited to change of shifts and other limited	
8			occasions and I do not recall any interactions even at	
9			such times."	
10				10:34
11			Is that right?	
12		Α.	That's correct.	
13	9	Q.	So as you say, you put it down to you were on separate	
14			shifts, separate units?	
15		Α.	Yes, we'd meet at change over of if there was a	10:34
16			crossover of units.	
17	10	Q.	Okay. Now, when you came to Athlone in December 2014,	
18			did you know that Garda Keogh at that point was a	
19			confidential reporter from the previous May, did you	
20			know that?	10:35
21		Α.	I would have known of it. I was on maternity leave for	
22			the six months prior to starting in Athlone, but I	
23			would have known that he had made a protected	
24			disclosure.	
25	11	Q.	Would you have known anything about him either	10:35
26			professionally or personally, that he had been on sick	
27			leave intermittently?	
28		Α.	No, not prior to that, no.	
29	12	Q.	For example, would you have known that from December	

Τ			and at least into mid 2015 his medical certificates	
2			were citing work related stress, would you have known	
3			that at any point?	
4		Α.	I wouldn't have known what his medical certs were	
5			saying.	10:35
6	13	Q.	Can I just ask you, you say there you had effectively	
7			no dealings with him and I think his supervising	
8			sergeant was Sergeant Monaghan, is that right?	
9		Α.	Sergeant Moylan.	
10	14	Q.	Sorry, Sergeant Moylan. Would you ever have come	10:35
11			across or had occasion to come across work performance	
12			issues for Garda Keogh, at least from December to, say,	
13			mid 2015?	
14		Α.	No, I wouldn't, no.	
15	15	Q.	Okay. Can I just ask you, I just want to concentrate	10:36
16			on one particular thing, detective, this morning, and	
17			it's the timeframe and the events in March 2015 and, as	
18			you know, Chief Superintendent Patrick Murray started	
19			in Athlone in early March, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	That's correct.	10:36
21	16	Q.	Now, I want to ask you in particular about 20th March	
22			2015. According to the documentation that the Tribunal	
23			has seen and the chief superintendent's evidence, he	
24			spoke to you on 20th March 2015 about taking on a	
25			support role in respect of Garda Keogh, is that right?	10:36
26		Α.	That is correct, yeah.	
27	17	Q.	Now can you tell the Tribunal a little bit about that	
28			conversation and assist the Chairman as much as you can	
29			about the specifics of it?	

- 1 A. Yes, Chairman. I spoke to Superintendent Murray at
- 2 that time and he informed me that he was putting a
- 3 structure in place to help support Garda Keogh, and he
- 4 asked me I would be a the liaison sergeant for him.
- 5 This was to deal with any welfare issues he may have,

10:37

10:38

- 6 with a view to solving them.
- 7 18 Q. Can you explain the content of the conversation, the
- 8 context of it; why was this necessary? Were you told
- 9 about this was necessary?
- 10 A. Well, it was obvious at that stage that Garda Keogh was 10:37
- going through a stressful time and it was just an extra
- support in place for him. I was somebody new to the
- station too, I was just there a few months and I was
- 14 totally independent from anything that would have went
- on previously. This was separate to his unit sergeant
- and I know Sergeant Haran was the second sergeant
- 17 attached to that unit. So it was just an extra support
- that if he needed any -- he wanted to talk to anybody
- or he had any issues, that he could come to me.
- 20 19 Q. Can I ask you, was the Ó Cualáin investigation
- 21 mentioned to you in the context of all of this?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 20 Q. Can I also ask you, at that point, in December 2014,
- January 2015 and March 2015, Garda Keogh had submitted
- 25 medical certs for his sick leave citing work related
- 26 stress, was this discussed with you?
- 27 A. I know he would have had a number of sick days, but the
- reason for his sick I wasn't aware of.
- 29 21 Q. And also, can I ask you, were alcohol issues or

1			problems mentioned to you in this conversation?	
2		Α.	I don't know if it was mentioned in the conversation,	
3			but I would have been aware that there was alcohol	
4			issues. But I don't recall that it was said in that	
5			conversation.	10:38
6	22	Q.	I think your evidence there just a moment ago to the	
7			Chairman is that you were asked by the chief	
8			superintendent to deal with welfare issues for Garda	
9			Keogh?	
10		Α.	Yes.	10:39
11	23	Q.	Is that right?	
12		Α.	That's correct.	
13	24	Q.	Now, we will come back to that in a moment, because I	
14			think there is some documentation that mention work	
15			related issues, we will come to that in a moment, but I	10:39
16			think is that your evidence; that on the 20th March you	
17			understood it to be a welfare role, is that right?	
18		Α.	Yes, I was very clear from that conversation that it	
19			was a welfare role I had.	
20	25	Q.	Did it concern you or was it an issue that arose that	10:39
21			you didn't know Garda Keogh or had no relationship with	
22			him at that point?	
23		Α.	No, I didn't. I felt that I was probably a suitable	
24			person for the role, in that I had no dealings with	
25			anybody prior to that in Athlone and I was totally	10:39
26			independent and impartial in relation to anything.	
27	26	Q.	Now, I think the chief superintendent made you aware or	
28			at least you may have known that Sergeant Haran was	
29			previously providing the support role, is that right?	

1	Α.	That's	correct.

- 2 27 Q. Did you speak with Sergeant Haran about the change that was to be made?
- A. No. The only time I spoke to Sergeant Haran was a
 number of weeks later when Garda Keogh hadn't
 approached me, that I just wanted to ensure Garda Keogh
 was aware that I was available to him and Sergeant
 Haran informed me that he was, that he was aware. So
 that's the only time I spoke to Sergeant Haran.

10 · 40

10:40

10 · 41

- 10 28 Q. You say this is a couple of weeks later?
- 11 A. Yeah, you know, because Garda Keogh didn't avail of me
 12 as a resource to him, that I just wanted to ensure that
 13 he was -- even though I knew he had received the
 14 correspondence in relation to it, I just wand to ensure
 15 he was to know that he could come to me and Sergeant 10:40
 16 Haran informed me he was aware of that.
- 17 29 Q. Would you have by any chance approached Sergeant Moylan 18 at this stage, to talk to him, get a background or an 19 understanding of what was involved?
- 20 A. No, I didn't speak to Sergeant Moylan.
- Okay. Can I ask you to just move on a couple of days 21 30 Q. 22 then to 26th March 2015. The Chairman has heard that 23 it was on this particular day that the chief 24 superintendent spoke to Garda Keogh and informed him 25 that he was putting new workplace structures in situ 26 for Garda Keogh. In particular, you may be aware from 27 the transcripts that he has given evidence that he 28 informed Garda Keogh that you were going to be put in 29 place to offer support to him?

1	Α.	That's	correct.

- 2 31 Q. Okay. Now, also he has given evidence that Garda Keogh 3 agreed to this and agreed to use you, do you have any 4 issue with that?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 32 Q. Do you disagree with that? Okay. Now, the chief 7 superintendent has recorded that after this meeting he 8 then spoke to you and some of your colleagues and all agreed with the course of action that was going to be 9 So this is the second conversation you 10 10 · 41 11 had with Chief Superintendent Murray. Can you tell the 12 Chairman about that conversation?
- 13 A. I believe it's similar to the first one, my role would
 14 be that I would be dealing with welfare issues.
 15 Sergeant Moylan was his unit sergeant. Like every unit 10:42
 16 in the station, there was two sergeants. Well, there
 17 was one unit sergeant and then there was a second
 18 sergeant that covered in the event that the main unit
 19 sergeant was on leave or away for any reason.

10.42

20 33 Q. If I can ask Mr. Kavanagh just to put up page 2188, I
21 just want to ask you about the note that the chief
22 superintendent took in respect of that meeting with
23 Garda Keogh. Just where it concerns yourself. I just
24 want to ask you about that. So it's 2188. If you see
25 there at the top paragraph, it's recorded:

27 "I said I was asking Sergeant Yvonne Martin to link in with him in relation to all workplace issues."

29

1 Now this is where we see workplace issues. It doesn't 2 say welfare issues, so I wonder can you assist the 3 Chairman in relation to that? Yeah. it doesn't, no. I was very clear that I wasn't 4 Α. 5 dealing with workplace issues. Sergeant Moylan was his 10:43 unit issues. If Superintendent Murray had asked me to 6 7 deal with workplace issues in relation to his files or 8 his work, I would have said, well, he has his own sergeant. I had my own unit. So I was very clear from 9 the conversation with Superintendent Murray that it was 10:43 10 11 welfare issues and not workplace issues. And in the 12 event I didn't then deal with any workplace issues. 13 34 Okay. Q. 14 Α. You know, if I thought it was that role I had and it 15 was in my remit to do it, I would have done it, if he 10:43 16 hadn't got his own sergeant to deal with that matter. 17 35 Just in the next sentence there, detective --Q. 18 MS. O' ROURKE: Chairperson, just an observation. 19 CHAI RMAN: I am sorry, Ms. O'Rourke. MS. O'ROURKE: Chairperson, just an observation, this 20 10:43 is a note prepared by Chief Superintendent Murray. I 21 22 don't know to what extent Sergeant Martin can assist in 23 interpreting that. She is giving her evidence as to 24 what she understood the position to be. There is no issue with that. As I say, I 10:44 25 MS. McGRATH: 26 just want to clarify the reference to workplace issues, 27 But also, there is an issue arising of somewhat of a dispute in relation to the second last 28

29

sentence there, if I could just ask the detective to

1		look at that.	
2		CHAIRMAN: Before you go there, Ms. McGrath, it seems	
3		to me that it is perfectly reasonable and legitimate as	
4		an inquiry to say, look, to the witness, you're saying	
5		that it was exclusively workplace issues, it would	10:44
6		appear from Superintendent Murray I am referring to	
7		people by their title at the relevant time, I know that	
8		Chief Superintendent Murray was promoted, but it's	
9		legitimate for Ms. McGrath to say, look, Superintendent	
10		Murray has recorded here that he was referring to	10:44
11		workplace issues. There's an area to be explored. And	
12		the witness says, no, that wasn't my role, he had	
13		somebody. And the witness might say, well actually,	
14		now that you mention it, yes, there was something of	
15		work. So that's perfectly legitimate, in my view	10:45
16		that's a perfectly legitimate area of inquiry.	
17	36 Q.	MS. McGRATH: Thank you, Chairman. I think in	
18		particular, Chairman, I am looking for clarity in	
19		relation to the second last sentence there, because	
20		Garda Keogh takes issue with this note. In particular,	10:45
21		detective, if you can just have a look at it there,	
22		this is Superintendent Murray saying:	
23			
24		"I advised that he"	
25			10:45
26		Namely Garda Keogh	
27			
28		" discussed the shortfalls in an assault harassment	
29		case with her"	

Т				
2			That's you detective	
3				
4			" and that she would put supports in place to ensure	
5			thoroughness in the investigation and he agreed the	10:45
6			same and to use her."	
7				
8			Now, Garda Keogh disputes this particular note. Can I	
9			ask you, did you have such a discussion with	
10			Superintendent Murray about such a case and Garda	10:46
11			Keogh?	
12		Α.	I can't actually recall that specifically. But I do	
13			know like, even in my time in Monaghan, I worked the	
14			majority of the time in the crime unit. And even now	
15			in my role as a detective sergeant, other members in	10:46
16			the station, not attached to my unit, would come to me	
17			in relation to crime investigations and seek advice.	
18			So he might have went down that line, to get advice	
19			from me from my past experience and my knowledge.	
20	37	Q.	Did Garda Keogh ever come to you in relation to	10:46
21		Α.	No, he didn't, no.	
22	38	Q.	So is it your evidence, detective, that you don't	
23			recall a conversation with the superintendent on that	
24			issue and/or you don't recall a conversation with Garda	
25			Keogh on that issue?	10:46
26		Α.	Well, I know I didn't have a conversation with Garda	
27			Keogh on it. I don't recall being asked to look at	
28			that assault harassment case.	
29	39	Q.	Okay. So if we can just move on, that was the note he	

1			took on the 22nd March. Can I ask Mr. Kavanagh to	
2			bring up page 9332. This is moving forward to the end	
3			of March, 31st March 2015. So this is 9332. Now,	
4			detective, as you know, we have heard evidence from	
5			other witnesses in respect of these SR1 forms, which	10:4
6			are the forms that are filled out when somebody calls	
7			in sick, isn't that right?	
8		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
9	40	Q.	I think this is the 31st March, so you're now in a	
10			welfare liaison officer role in respect of Garda Keogh,	10:4
11			is that right?	
12		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
13	41	Q.	Okay. Now if we just move down there, the ordinary	
14			illness category is ticked, it says "not provided" and	
15			I think it's signed by yourself. Is that your	10:4
16			signature?	
17		Α.	That is, yes.	
18	42	Q.	So would you have taken that call from Garda Keogh then	
19			on that particular day in relation to the sick leave?	
20		Α.	I don't recall. I do know that if you go to the top of	10:4
21			that, if you go to the top of that form his name is	
22			filled out in I don't believe that's my writing	
23			along the time, the date, his name and the reg number	
24			and Athlone. From that the protocol in relation to	
25			reporting sick is that you have to report to a	10:4
26			sergeant. My belief in relation to that, that it was	
27			the member in charge who would are taken the call and	
28			they came down and reported it to me and explained to	
29			me. Because I don't recall speaking to Garda Keogh at	

- 1 any stage reporting sick.
- 2 Would you have been on duty at five past 43 Q. CHAI RMAN:
- 3 midnight?
- Yeah, I would have. 4 Α.
- 5 44 CHAI RMAN: You would have? Q.
- 10:48
- 6 Yeah. Α.
- 7 MS. McGRATH: But in any event, by signing the form you 45 0.
- 8 would have known that he was on sick leave at that
- point? 9
- Yes. And I believe actually that's the time I actually 10:48 10 Α.
- 11 mailed the super in relation to that, that I was
- 12 actually the member in charge who reported sick too.
- 13 And it's actually in the disclosure where I e-mailed
- 14 the superintendent in relation to that matter because
- it wasn't following protocol, where the member was 15
- 16 reporting sick and not asking to speak to the sergeant

- 17 on duty to report sick, he was reporting to the member
- 18 in charge.
- 19 46 Okay. Q.
- And that is included --20 Α.
- I am not following that, sergeant. 21 47 Q.
- 22 you mind just saying that again to me, please?
- 23 In HQ circular in relation to reporting sick, Α.
- 24 when a member is reporting sick, they should actually
- report to the sergeant on duty. So when they ring into 10:49 25
- the station they should look -- they should ask for the 26
- 27 sergeant on duty, but what was happening was, they were
- ringing in and reporting sick to the guard who was the 28
- 29 member in charge and not looking to speak to the

1			sergeant. And I recall that, that night in particular,	
2			because I e-mailed asking could this protocol be	
3	48	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So that was a feature, of people ringing in	
4			who were going sick?	
5		Α.	Yes.	10:49
6	49	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is that right? It wasn't particular or	
7			individual to Garda Keogh?	
8		Α.	No, it was happening across the board.	
9	50	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It was a more general issue?	
10		Α.	Yes.	10:49
11	51	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But it was something that attracted your	
12			attention?	
13		Α.	Yes. And the e-mail related to across the board with	
14			everybody, that if everyone could follow protocol.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	10:50
16	52	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Now, I think we have also heard that what	
17			was a practice or is a process is that medical reports	
18			may come in subsequently to that. I think the medical	
19			report for this date came in on 2nd April 2015. If I	
20			can ask Mr. Kavanagh to open page 422. Now, in	10:50
21			particular, you see this is a summary from his GP of	
22			the sick note. It says:	
23				
24			"2nd April 2015, work related stress, unfit for work,	
25			31st March to 3rd April '15."	10:50
26				
27			Now, in your role then as his liaison officer and	
28			looking after welfare issues, did you seek to follow	
29			this up or look into it or make any contact with Garda	

1	Keogh	in	relation	to	this?

2 I would say I was more a resource for him to come to me Α. 3 if he had any welfare issues. I had to be careful, I was trying to get a balance right of him, knowing he 4 5 was aware that I was available to him and being 6 intrusive. And not long after my becoming the liaison 7 sergeant for him, he was actually appointed a full-time 8 Garda welfare officer and I believe within two months inspector Minnock was assigned as inspector in relation 9 to welfare issues as well. So I didn't follow up on 10 11 this.

10:51

10:51

10:51

- 12 53 Now, on the 2nd April then, you see the letter -- I am Q. 13 just trying to go chronologically, detective, so we're 14 on the 2nd April at this stage. 187 it's a document 15 the Tribunal has already looked at. And again, the 16 first paragraph concerns yourself. I am just opening 17 it to you more formally than anything, because you see 18 there in the first paragraph it's also referring to 19 work related issues he may be having with a view to 20 solving any issues that may arise and both Sergeant Martin and Garda Keogh have been informed of this 21 22 workplace report. So I think it's your evidence that 23 you didn't deal with work related issues for him?
- A. Yes, that's correct. I got that report. But, as I say, it was clear from the conversation I had had with 10:52 Superintendent Murray what my role was.
- 27 54 Q. Okay. Did you seek to correct this with the superintendent?
- 29 A. No.

1	55	Q.	Okay. Now, I think in your statement, if we can just	
2			go back to your statement at page 596, at paragraph 3.3	
3			there, you say, at the end of that paragraph:	
4				
5			"Garda Keogh chose not to avail of this resource and	10:52
6			never spoke to me in my capacity as liaison officer."	
7				
8			Can I just ask you about that? Did you document or	
9			make any attempts yourself to contact the garda or	
10			engage with him?	10:53
11		Α.	I didn't. As I said, I was trying to get the balance	
12			right with him. I knew he knew I was available to him,	
13			that I had been appointed as liaison sergeant and if he	
14			had any issues he could come to me. As I said, I	
15			checked with I confirmed with Sergeant Haran, who I	10:53
16			knew had had a previous close relationship with him in	
17			this regard, and he confirmed with me that Garda Keogh	
18			was aware I was available should he need me.	
19	56	Q.	Were you concerned by the lack of engagement,	
20			detective, by the garda?	10:53
21		Α.	No. I think probably if it went on much longer, but	
22			the fact then that he was appointed a full-time Garda	
23			welfare officer, he had his own unit sergeant, Sergeant	
24			Haran was still available for him and I was just an	
25			extra resource if he wished to speak to somebody	10:53
26			independently really, somebody where he had had no	
27			previous involvement in Athlone station.	
28	57	Q.	Did you ever report back, we just haven't seen in any	
29			of the documentation any official reporting or	

1			documents where you informed the superintendent that	
2			this really was never activated, your role as a liaison	
3			officer?	
4		Α.	No.	
5	58	Q.	Okay. Were you ever asked by Superintendent Murray for	10:54
6			an update or a report?	
7		Α.	No, I don't recall. Again, as the other resources were	
8			put in place for him, I think it	
9	59	Q.	Did the superintendent ever speak to you again about	
10			this issue?	10:54
11		Α.	I can't recall specifically speaking to him again about	
12			it.	
13	60	Q.	I know, from the papers, that Garda Mick Quinn was put	
14			in place as his welfare officer at the end of April	
15			there, 21st April 2005, were you aware of that?	10:54
16		Α.	I was. I don't know when I became aware of it, but I	
17			did come aware of it, yes.	
18	61	Q.	In particular, we see, moving into the middle of 2015,	
19			in particular the Chairman has heard a lot of evidence	
20			around July 2015, were there was an AWOL issue in	10:55
21			respect of Garda Keogh. Did you know anything about	
22			that or have any involvement as a point of contact?	
23		Α.	No, I had no involvement.	
24	62	Q.	Were you ever asked to have any involvement as a point	
25			of contact?	10:55
26		Α.	No.	
27	63	Q.	So is it fair to say, detective, that you were	
28			formally, as it were, put in place, it was never	
29			activated and no questions were ever asked; is that	

1			correct?	
2		Α.	Again, that resource was there for Garda Keogh if he	
3			wished to avail of it and he chose not to.	
4	64	Q.	Now, did you ever query at any stage what was the whole	
5			point of the exercise then effectively?	10:5
6		Α.	To me, and in speaking to Superintendent Murray,	
7			concern for Garda Keogh's welfare was the main	
8			priority. So any steps that we could take to assist	
9			him was the aim of you know, was the reason that I	
10			was put in place. So anything we could do to help.	10:5
11	65	Q.	You see, detective, it appears that whatever concern	
12			might have existed on the 20th and the 26th March,	
13			nobody ever came back to you, nobody ever checked the	
14			position, clarified the position?	
15		Α.	Well, they did, in that they were working, in that they	10:5
16			arranged that there was a full-time Garda welfare	
17			officer put in place. Inspector Minnock then was put	
18			in place from the district management side. So things	
19			kind of moved on from me as such. So it wasn't that it	
20			was just left.	10:5
21	66	Q.	Well, you see, I have to put it to you that Garda Keogh	
22			in his evidence to the Tribunal takes the view that	
23			this was really just an exercise in coming down on him	
24			or microsupervising him or putting sergeants in charge	
25			of him. Now, he concedes fully that that didn't	10:5

I don't agree with that at all. As I said, concern for Α.

happen, but his point still remains, that he says this

is what this was actually all about. What do you have

10:57

to say to that?

26

27

28

1			Garda Keogh was at the forefront.	
2	67	Q.	If you bear with me for one moment, detective. I	
3			wonder if you could answer any questions, please?	
4		Α.	Thank you.	
5				10:57
6			END OF EXAMINATION	
7				
8			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Now, Mr. O'Brien.	
9				
10			DETECTIVE SERGEANT YVONNE MARTIN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY	10:57
11			MR. O'BRIEN, AS FOLLOWS:	
12				
13	68	Q.	MR. O'BRIEN: Good morning, sergeant.	
14		Α.	Good morning,.	
15	69	Q.	Did I understand your evidence to be a moment ago that	10:57
16			when you were asked by Superintendent Murray to become	
17			the liaison officer for Garda Keogh, that you didn't	
18			have a conversation with Garda Keogh in relation to	
19			that?	
20		Α.	I didn't, no.	10:57
21	70	Q.	And why was that?	
22		Α.	Again, I didn't want to be intrusive. I knew he was	
23			aware that I had been appointed as liaison sergeant, I	
24			was available. I was satisfied he knew of my	
25			availability to him if he ever wanted it. And I just	10:58
26			wanted to get the balance right, of him being aware and	
27			not being intrusive with him.	
28	71	Q.	I see. But, for example, to put him in	
29			circumstances where he already had Sergeant Haran and	

1			Sergeant Moylan as his supervising sergeants, to put	
2			him at ease would it not have been better to introduce	
3			yourself and simply say, I am going to make myself	
4			available to you as a liaison officer for welfare	
5			issues only?	10:5
6		Α.	Yes, I understand that, but I was aware and I confirmed	
7			with Sergeant Haran that he knew, he knew me from	
8			around the station and I was satisfied that he knew I	
9			was available.	
10	72	Q.	That being the case then, would you accept that Garda	10:5
11			Keogh's position from his perspective, that along with	
12			Sergeant Haran and Sergeant Moylan you had now been	
13			appointed, I suppose, to supervise him in some	
14			capacity, it's not clear to him what capacity perhaps	
15			that that is, and that therefore it appears to him that	10:5
16			he is being excessively supervised by all three of you,	
17			would you accept that?	
18		Α.	No, because it was always clear that I was dealing with	
19			welfare issues in relation to and you know, it was	
20			explained that I was independent from everyone else in	10:5
21			the station and if he wanted to talk to somebody	

- 22 73 Q. But if you didn't tell him that you were solely dealing 23 with welfare issues, how was it clear to Garda Keogh?
- A. I believe from the correspondence that he was aware
 that I was available to deal with him -- or to address 10:59
 any issues that he may have.
- 27 74 Q. When you say you believe from correspondence, I mean 28 where would that correspondence have emanated from, do 29 you believe?

- A. Well, we all received the same correspondence where I
 was appointed as his liaison sergeant in relation to
 any...
- 4 75 Q. But the letter that Ms. McGrath just referred you to is addressed, as I understand it, to the three sergeants; 11:00 so to yourself, Sergeant Haran, Sergeant Moylan and nobody else?
- A. Well he was made aware of my appointment as well, in correspondence I believe. I believe he received the correspondence and he spoke to Superintendent Murray, who informed him of the structure that was being put in place.
- 13 76 But in circumstances where I suppose there's perhaps an Q. 14 issue regarding the wording that was used in the letter 15 to you, where it says that you were dealing with work 11:00 16 related issues, and you have now told us that you were 17 dealing solely with welfare related issues, can you see 18 how Garda Keogh would be confused about that and --19 Yeah. Α.
- 20 77 Q. -- be under the belief that he was being excessively 11:01 supervised?
- 22 A. I would from that correspondence. But when I spoke to
 23 Sergeant Haran and confirmed that he knew I was
 24 available to talk to if he needed, I believe that he
 25 would have been aware it was welfare issues and not
 26 workplace.

- 27 78 Q. Just for clarification, you didn't do that yourself 28 with Garda Keogh?
- 29 A. No, I didn't do it myself. I didn't speak to him. I

Т			Tert it for film to come to me if he wanted to use me.	
2			MR. O'BRIEN: Thank you, I have no further questions.	
3				
4			END OF EXAMINATION	
5				11:01
6			MS. McGRATH: Chairman, I don't know who wants to go	
7			next.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Murphy.	
9				
10			DETECTIVE SERGEANT YVONNE MARTIN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY	11:01
11			MR. MURPHY, AS FOLLOWS:	
12				
13	79	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I wonder if you could be shown on the	
14			screen page 596, please, which is your statement. And	
15			could I just ask you to confirm paragraph 3.2, that	11:02
16			when you were appointed by Superintendent Murray in	
17			your words it was:	
18				
19			"to allow Garda Keogh to discuss any work related	
20			issues he may have with a view to solving any potential	11:02
21			i ssues. "	
22		Α.	Yes, that's correct, yes.	
23	80	Q.	Can I take it from that that you understood your role	
24			at that stage to be available to talk to him if he	
25			wanted to talk to you?	11:02
26		Α.	That's correct, yeah.	
27	81	Q.	And in terms of the document at page 187, please, if	
28			that can be put on the screen. Thank you. I wonder	
29			please could we scroll down. So this is a document you	

h 1, and id:
id:
11:02
on person
work
to sol vi ng
rtin and
l ace 11:03
dicate that
e 11:03
y that it
ter? 11:03
ph 2 of the
11:03
geant
rı

Т			to continue to supervise the member in a normal way in	
2			relation to any work output required of the member	
3			resulting from incidents he attends or matters he is	
4			investigating. Sergeant Moylan should sit down with	
5			Garda Keogh, go through his notebook, Pulse, the DPP	11:03
6			and crime file lists, ascertain if he requires help	
7			with any ongoing cases as he mentioned a harassment	
8			case he may have difficulty with. Any issues arising	
9			should be immediately reported."	
10				11:04
11			So, would you agree, you weren't asked to do any of	
12			those specific work related supervisory tasks?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	88	Q.	And were you clear, therefore, that those workplace	
15			supervisory tasks were in fact assigned to your	11:04
16			colleagues Sergeant Haran and Sergeant Moylan?	
17		Α.	Yes, I was.	
18	89	Q.	In the ordinary way?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	90	Q.	Can we take it, therefore, that it was your	11:04
21			understanding that your position was, in a sense, an	
22			extra welfare support being put in place should Garda	
23			Keogh seek to avail of it?	
24		Α.	Yes. Exactly, yes.	
25	91	Q.	I think you told the Chairman in your evidence directly	11:04
26			this morning that at the time when you were asked to	
27			carry out this task you understood that Garda Keogh was	
28			going through a stressful time?	
20		٨	Voc	

Т	92	Q.	In terms of the documentation, can I ask you to be	
2			shown document 2188, please. Just on the third line, I	
3			think this document was shown to you earlier on, this	
4			is the document where Superintendent Murray says:	
5				11:05
6			"I said I was asking Sergeant Yvonne Martin to link in	
7			with him in relation to all workplace issues. He asked	
8			why her, didn't know her. I said the very reason she	
9			is new here, like, I knew she would support him to	
10			allow him to attend work regularly."	11:05
11				
12			Just the words "to attend work regularly", did you	
13			understand that the welfare that you were providing was	
14			to assist Garda Keogh if possible to attend work	
15			regularly?	11:05
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	93	Q.	Therefore, were you aware of the fact that he was	
18			having difficulties in attending work regularly?	
19		Α.	Yes, I was, yes.	
20	94	Q.	And were you aware what those difficulties were?	11:05
21		Α.	No. The only issue I knew was that it seemed to be the	
22			early shifts that he seemed to be reporting sick for	
23			and that was really what I knew about it.	
24	95	Q.	So would you agree with me, therefore, it would appear	
25			that the object of involving you in this process at	11:05
26			all, was not to micromanage, but in the words of this	
27			letter "to provide support to him to allow him to	
28			attend work regularly"?	
20		۸	Voc	

- 1 96 Q. Would you consider that in your experience to be a welfare related support?
- 3 A. Definitely, yes.
- 4 97 Q. Now, in terms of your general awareness of the situation, I think you have given evidence that as time 11:06

11:06

11:06

- 6 progressed you became aware of the appointment of Garda
- 7 Mick Quinn?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 98 Q. And you were aware what his role was?
- 10 A. Yeah, he was a Garda welfare officer.
- 11 99 Q. I think you've also told us you then became aware of the role of Inspector Minnock?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 100 Q. Effectively I think, as you have indicated in your 15 evidence, your role in this issue fell away?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 101 Q. Now, you were asked the question a few moments ago by counsel on behalf of Garda Keogh which suggested that
- there was some issue as to how was Garda Keogh to know
- 20 what was your role unless you spoke to him. Were you
- clear at the time when you were asked to carry out this
- task that Garda Keogh had been communicated with?
- 23 A. Yes, I knew Superintendent Murray had spoke to him.
- 24 102 Q. Did Garda Keogh at any stage seek to avail of the welfare support that you represented?
- 26 A. No.
- 27 103 Q. Now, in terms of your statement, I wonder if we can go
- back please to page 596. This is a point that you
- address in your own statement. Can I draw your

Т			attention, please, to paragraph 3.4. This is at page	
2			596, please. Sergeant, do you see that paragraph?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	104	Q.	Just to be clear, the questions put to you today	
5			suggested that perhaps Garda Keogh wasn't contacted by	11:07
6			you, that he wouldn't have understood your role and	
7			that what you were engaged in was supervision which was	
8			excessive. But I think you have identified in your	
9			statement that he went one step further, because in his	
10			statement to this Tribunal he said:	11:07
11				
12			"I was allocated Sergeant Martin as a liaison person to	
13			discuss work related issues. This is the sergeant who	
14			was involved in the McCabe and in the so-called	
15			Mullingar meeting. This response did not amount to a	11:08
16			reasonable accommodation of my medically certified work	
17			related stress."	
18				
19			I think that was a specific allegation he made against	
20			you in the statement. I think you've responded to it	11:08
21			at paragraph 3.4, obviously, is that right?	
22		Α.	I have, yes, yeah.	
23	105	Q.	Can I ask you just to confirm that response?	
24		Α.	Would you like me to read it out.	
25	106	Q.	Yes, please,	11:08
26		Α.	Yes.	
27			CHAIRMAN: well, there is no need. I mean, I can read	
28			it and everybody can read it, Mr. Murphy. But if there	
29			is some specific thing, well and good.	

1			THE WITNESS: Just in relation to this, this was	
2	107	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Nothing was found against you in relation to	
3			any issue or subject of criticism arising out of that.	
4		Α.	That's correct, Chairman. But also in relation to	
5			that, this is April 2015, I was appointed as liaison	11:08
6			sergeant, it was 2016 before there was any issue raised	
7			in relation to the last Tribunal. This is a year	
8			prior.	
9	108	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So this couldn't have been true, according	
10			to you?	11:09
11		Α.	well, him saying that he found that it wasn't a	
12			reasonable accommodation of his medical certified work	
13			related stress, there was no knowledge	
14	109	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It was a matter of time?	
15		Α.	Yeah.	11:09
16	110	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You say that couldn't have been in his mind?	
17		Α.	Yes. When I was appointed liaison sergeant, there was	
18			nothing	
19			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
20	111	Q.	MR. MURPHY: In fact, just to confirm?	11:09
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	112	Q.	At that time there could have been no basis in fact to	
23			hold that view, is that right?	
24		Α.	Exactly.	
25				11:09
26			END OF EXAMINATION	
27				
28			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Anybody else?	
29				

Τ			DETECTIVE SERGEANT YVONNE MARTIN WAS THEN EXAMINED BY	
2			MS. O' ROURKE, AS FOLLOWS:	
3				
4	113	Q.	MS. O'ROURKE: Chairperson, just on that matter. I	
5			think it's is a matter of public record that in fact	11:09
6			you weren't called as a witness.	
7		Α.	That's correct.	
8			CHAIRMAN: That's what she says here.	
9	114	Q.	Yes, thank you. In that regard, I think Garda Keogh in	
10			the course of his evidence has indicated he jumped the	11:09
11			gun insofar as his complaint against you on this issue,	
12			but	
13			CHAIRMAN: Say that again.	
14			MS. O'ROURKE: I think in the course of his evidence	
15			Garda Keogh has indicated he has jumped the gun	11:10
16			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
17			MS. O'ROURKE: in the context of Sergeant Martin.	
18			But there is one document I would ask to be brought up,	
19			I think that's document 151, which is Volume 1.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	11:10
21	115	Q.	MS. O'ROURKE: This is a letter to Minister for Justice	
22			which Garda Keogh sent. The date isn't clear on it.	
23			Reference is made to you in this letter. Can you tell	
24			the Tribunal, when did you become aware of this	
25			correspondence?	11:10
26		Α.	When I received the disclosure for this Tribunal.	
27	116	Q.	And approximately when was that, would you say?	
28		Α.	March last year, March 2019.	
29	117	0	Thank you I have no further questions	

1			CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, just don't leave that hanging in	
2			there, Ms. O'Rourke. I am not understanding. This	
3			letter was written.	
4			MS. O'ROURKE: A letter was written by Garda Keogh to	
5			the Minister for Justice.	11:11
6			CHAIRMAN: Very good.	
7			MS. O'ROURKE: He takes some issue with Sergeant Martin	
8			and it's a matter she only became aware of I think this	
9			year, but it's a matter I think Garda Keogh accepts he	
10			ought not to have that he may have overstepped	11:11
11			matters; is that correct?	
12		Α.	That is correct.	
13	118	Q.	I think you identified in your statement, at paragraph	
14			6.1, the impact that the allegations in the McCabe	
15			issue had on you. And I think you say that Garda	11:11
16			Keogh's betrayal of you has caused further	
17			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, don't go away from that. 151.	
18			MS. O' ROURKE: 151.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Thanks.	
20			MS. O'ROURKE: I think the sixth paragraph down, "It is	11:12
21			interesting that both persons"	
22			CHAIRMAN: The relevant paragraph is "I subsequently	
23			became aware" is that right?	
24			MS. O'ROURKE: I would say that the relevant paragraph	
25			starts with the second last paragraph:	11:12
26				
27			"It is interesting that both persons involved in this	
28			protected disclosure, namely Sergeant Martin and	
29			Superintendent Murray, are themselves subject to	

Τ		separate allegations."	
2			
3		I think it's clear that no allegations that you did	
4		not were not called as a witness before the	
5		Charleton Tribunal, isn't that correct?	11:12
6	Α.	That is correct, yes. And this letter was written to	
7		the Minister for Justice in relation to an assault	
8		investigation in Athlone and it resulted in an	
9		investigation by GSOC on me, which I the first time	
10		I've known about this is in the disclosure to the	11:12
11		Tribunal. I have never been notified that I have been	
12		investigated on another matter until the disclosure in	
13		this Tribunal. I wasn't aware that Garda Keogh had	
14		written to the Minister for Justice in relation to me	
15		or that an investigation took place.	11:13
16		CHAIRMAN: Okay. Mr. Kelly, what am I to make of this?	
17		MR. KELLY: Not a lot. Our view is that it's not	
18		actually relevant to the task that the Tribunal has to	
19		undertake. I can understand the sergeant feeling well,	
20		this is not nice, it has an impact upon me.	11:13
21		CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
22		MR. KELLY: But that's really outside the remit of this	
23		Tribunal. I really don't think it helps you in the	
24		ultimate task that you have to embark upon.	
25		MR. MURPHY: Sorry, Chairman, I wonder if I could	11:13
26		CHAIRMAN: Just hold on a second. Well, sorry	
27		Mr. Murphy.	
28		MR. MURPHY: If I might make a submission, it might	
29		assist the Chair and my Friend.	

1	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
2	MR. MURPHY: In my respectful submission, this is	
3	relevant, as are some of the other questions asked	
4	today because it may be relevant to your assessment,	
5	Chairman, as to the conduct of the complaint in making	14
6	allegations at a alpine level against various	
7	individuals, then effectively abandoning claims after a	
8	four year period and writing correspondence like this,	
9	making allegations	
10	CHAIRMAN: What is the date of this letter to the	14
11	Minister for Justice? Can we just establish that?	
12	MS. O'ROURKE: It's is not clear to us.	
13	CHAIRMAN: No, but somebody must know. Mr. Cullen must	
14	know, Garda Keogh must know. Somebody must know the	
15	date of this letter to the Minister for Justice.	14
16	MR. MURPHY: It appears to be after 2016, because there	
17	is a 2016 incident referred to in it. It's a matter	
18	perhaps I will return to in submission, Chairman.	
19	CHAIRMAN: It is included in, what shall I say, a	
20	dossier that goes, but then there's a lot of materials $_{11}$:	14
21	included in the same dossier that goes to the Policing	
22	Authority. Mr. Caoimhghín Ó Caoláin, the Chairman of	
23	the Oireachtas Justice Committee and various other	
24	people, Ms. Daly TD and so on, but anyway, we will find	
25	out the date of that. Ms. McGrath, what do you say to 11:	15
26	this?	
27	MS. McGRATH: Chairman, as you say, the evidence, the	
28	direct-evidence was quite confined to the issues of the	
29	facts and time and I think there is nothing further	

1	arising for the witness to deal with. We will find the	
2	date of the letter, if we can.	
3	CHAIRMAN: That's all right, yes.	
4	MS. McGRATH: So that we can resolve it.	
5	CHAIRMAN: And what do you say about relevance?	11:15
6	Mr. Murphy says it's relevant, Mr. Kelly it has nothing	
7	to do Mr. Murphy's point is, it's relevant because	
8	he says it shows Garda Keogh getting the boot in left,	
9	right and centre. And here's somebody who had a very	
10	minor role and he is getting digs in that are entirely	11:15
11	inappropriate. That's the essence of the thing, if I	
12	can put it as bluntly as that in an advocate's fashion,	
13	which I fear is a tendency of mine. But that's what he	
14	says. What do you say to that?	
15	MS. McGRATH: Chairman, I think it all post dates the	11:16
16	timeframe that we were interested in.	
17	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18	MS. McGRATH: Which was the March/April 2015.	
19	CHAIRMAN: It's clear we can't get into an	
20	investigation	11:16
21	MS. McGRATH: Absolutely, Chairman.	
22	CHAIRMAN: involving a garda or person named	
23	McMeeking, as to whom there is no suggestion of any	
24	but it is clear we can't get into a substantive	
25	discussion. That is clearly right. That is	11:16
26	irrelevant. I suppose, Mr. Kelly, I will leave this	
27	thought with you, I will leave this question with you,	
28	it doesn't have to be answered this minute:	
29	Mr. Murphy's point is that this, as far as it goes,	

1	demonstrates a capacity for a wild allegation of an
2	unfounded kind. This is his point: Based on a
3	retrospective view that could not have been held at the
4	time. That's his point. So maybe you would consider
5	this at some point to come back to say whether Garda 11:17
6	Keogh is standing over that or whether that was an
7	excess of zeal. I don't expect you to say at this
8	minute, I expect you to be able to reflect on it. But
9	that maybe he went over the top and accepts that he
10	went over the top, or maybe he says, well, I'm sticking 11:17
11	by that. To the extent then that Mr. Murphy says it's
12	relevant as showing an unreasonable desire to lash out
13	left, right and centre. That's really where we are
14	going. Have a think about that, Mr. Kelly. At some
15	point you may wish to include that in a submission,
16	written or oral.
17	MR. KELLY: Yes, Chairman, I will.
18	CHAIRMAN: We will leave it on that basis.
19	MR. KELLY: I will obviously reflect on that.
20	CHAIRMAN: It's limited. You are right, there is no
21	way that the report can deal with that as a substantive
22	question. But clearly that's correct.
23	MR. KELLY: Yeah, I will reflect upon it. I must say
24	that I totally agree with the submissions that
25	Ms. McGrath has made, it was confined and I have been 11:18
26	anxious to confine to what it's about.
27	CHAIRMAN: Indeed.
28	MR. KELLY: For that reason we limited our
29	cross-examination. Now, I will just simply say this:

Ţ	we have heard ad nauseam from Mr. Murphy on a massive	
2	long cross-examination of Garda Keogh about all of	
3	this, whether it gains or not by constantly being	
4	trotted out yet again is of course a matter for	
5	professional judgment for Mr. Murphy. But there it is.	11:18
6	CHAIRMAN: If rebuke is called for in due course,	
7	rebuke will be I think I have enough on my plate at	
8	the moment, Mr. Kelly. Okay, thank you very much, I	
9	appreciate that. Anything else you want to say,	
10	sergeant, about this?	11:19
11	THE WITNESS: No.	
12	MS. O'ROURKE: Chairperson, for the record, I probably	
13	should say that on Day 100, at page 113 of his	
14	evidence, Garda Keogh indicated that he did jump the	
15	gun and shouldn't have made that particular	11:19
16	CHAIRMAN: Very good. That's very helpful. Day 100?	
17	MS. O'ROURKE: At page 113.	
18	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. That's very helpful.	
19	And that may go a long way to deal with the issue.	
20	Thanks very much.	11:19
21		
22	END OF EXAMINATION	
23		
24	MS. McGRATH: Thank you, detective. Chairman, can I	
25	just say, the documentary counsel for the Tribunal have	11:19
26	confirmed that any copies of that letter on page 151	
27	are all undated. So unless the Keogh team can assist	
28	us as to a date, we do not have a date.	
29	CHAIRMAN: Well, the Department of Justice presumably	

1			can say when they received it, they must have put a	
2			stamp on it. Somebody must know the date of the	
3			letter. At least we're advanced because Ms. O'Rourke	
4			has told us that Garda Keogh accepted that he had	
5			jumped the gun in relation to that. If we need to	11:20
6			analyse that, we will do so in due course. Thank you	
7			very much. You have no questions?	
8			MS. McGRATH: No questions, thank you.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
10			THE WITNESS: Thank you.	11:20
11				
12			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
13				
14			MR. MARRINAN: The next witness, Chairman, is Sergeant	
15			Andrew Haran.	11:20
16				
17			SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	
18			DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN, AS FOLLOWS:	
19				
20			THE WITNESS: Andrew Haran.	11:21
21			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
22	119	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Thank you for coming back, Sergeant	
23			Haran, it may well be that you will have to be called	
24			again at a future issue. You have already given	
25			evidence in relation to issues 1 to 4?	11:21
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	120	Q.	Which by and large cover the period of time between	
28			your first dealings with Garda Keogh and the making of	
29			his protected disclosure and your interaction with him	

1			and the advice, etcetera, that you gave to him. Then,	
2			moving right up until March of 2015, when now Chief	
3			Superintendent Murray took over the reins in Athlone	
4			Garda Station?	
5		Α.	Yes.	11:21
6	121	Q.	Since then Superintendent Noreen McBrien has given	
7			evidence and she is going to be recalled to deal with	
8			an issue. We have heard some interactions between you	
9			and she in relation to just simply conversations that	
10			you may have had with her, maybe indicating that Garda	11:22
11			Keogh was drinking again or that he had particular	
12			troubles. Do you take any issue with any of the	
13			evidence that has been given by Superintendent McBrien	
14			in relation to those matters?	
15		Α.	No.	11:22
16	122	Q.	No.	
17		Α.	We largely, as you say, described it accurately and she	
18			had asked me to be available to Garda Keogh as a	
19			liaison. And that was something that I was happy to	
20			take up and was happy to take up.	11:22
21	123	Q.	She has given evidence, I don't want to go through	
22			every conversation you had with everybody?	
23		Α.	No.	
24	124	Q.	And you are aware of the evidence that has been given	
25			at the Tribunal. If we could deal with it on this	11:22
26			basis: You don't take issue with anything that has	
27			been said in relation to any of the conversations that	
28			you had with Superintendent McBrien?	
29		Δ	No	

1	125	Q.	We have heard evidence in relation to how matters	
2			transpired in relation to issues 1, 2, 3 and 4,	
3			culminating I suppose in September 2014 with Garda A	
4			making a complaint in relation to a search on Pulse	
5			that had been conducted by Garda Keogh and another	11:23
6			garda. Between then and March of 2015, were there any	
7			issues arising that you could see in relation to Garda	
8			Keogh?	
9		Α.	Can you narrow down the question? Do you mean in a	
10			negative way, an interactive way?	11:23
11	126	Q.	You had interactions with him	
12		Α.	Oh yeah.	
13	127	Q.	at the time?	
14		Α.	On a regular basis.	
15	128	Q.	I mean, were there any first of all in relation to	11:23
16			his performance, how was he getting on in October,	
17			November, December, January, February?	
18		Α.	Well, he was struggling from the perspective that there	
19			was some alcohol related issues.	
20	129	Q.	Yes.	11:24
21		Α.	He openly admitted he would struggle from the	
22			perspective of file preparation.	
23	130	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	But that wouldn't be unique to Nick Keogh, that would	
25			be, you know, something that as a sergeant you would	11:24
26			look to assist any person who was looking for	
27			assistance. So in relation to Nick, he did struggle in	
28			terms of attendance, because, as I said earlier, he had	
29			difficulties I suppose in working all of the day shifts	

Т			which were, I suppose, could have been seen to be	
2			linked to supervisory issues and could have been seen	
3			to be linked to alcohol issues.	
4	131	Q.	Yes.	
5		Α.	But either way he certainly had a preference for later	11:2
6			shifts than the day and night shifts, for a number of	
7			reasons.	
8	132	Q.	During this period, from September to March, just	
9			trying to get the bigger picture, as it were, in terms	
10			of Garda Keogh, there doesn't appear to be any	11:2
11			significant issues that were arising in Athlone Garda	
12			Station concerning Garda Keogh during this period of	
13			time?	
14		Α.	No. Not that I I mean, had there been anything	
15			significant I would have had a record of it.	11:2
16	133	Q.	Yes.	
17		Α.	Certainly there was nothing significant. Like minor	
18			ones concerning attendance. But certainly nothing of a	
19			nature that required, you know, a record of or a	
20			reporting of.	11:2
21	134	Q.	The Ó Cualáin investigation was ongoing at that time?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	135	Q.	By that time a direction had been given, I think by	
24			Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin, that interviews were	

of that investigation?

Yes.

Α.

25

26

27

28

29

not to take place in Athlone Garda Station and that

they had stopped taking place there. You have already

expressed your view in relation to the earlier stages

11:25

1	136	Q.	We received those from you. In terms of the frequency	
2			of your interactions with Garda Keogh during that	
3			timeframe, I am talking about September to March, can	
4			you say how frequently you would have interacted with	
5			him?	11:26
6		Α.	Well, based on when we would both be working, we would	
7			interact every day. Because, I mean our shifts were	
8			very closely related. I was doing community policing	
9			and the shift would cross the exact shift he would do	
10			by almost two-thirds of each day. By way of	11:26
11			explanation, if I was working at 6:00pm until 2:00am,	
12			Nick would be working from 9:00pm through the night.	
13			So we would cross, every day that the two of us were	
14			working we would cross. And like it's a small station,	
15			you would interact with people most every day. In the	11:26
16			absence of Sergeant Moylan, I would be it would be a	
17			role that I would have to interact with everybody on	
18			the unit, not just him.	
19	137	Q.	I think Inspector Minnock was acting superintendent	
20			during this period of time, because Superintendent	11:26
21			McBrien was on long-term sick leave, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	138	Q.	At various stages you would have been his supervising	
24			garda in the absence of Sergeant Moylan, isn't that	
25			right?	11:27
26		Α.	That's right.	
27	139	Q.	We have heard evidence from you in relation to this, I	

think that Sergeant Moylan had other duties that took

him away from Athlone Garda Station and you would step

1	in then	into	the	role	of	supervising	sergeant,	is	that
2	right?								

- A. Yes, and it would just be standard, very much a standard role that would continue.
- 5 140 Can you just help us in relation to this and the role Q. 11:27 6 of supervising sergeant: When a file is prepared by a 7 garda to be transmitted to the superintendent for directions in relation to how the file would be further 8 disposed, is there actually a function that the 9 10 supervising sergeant performs rather than just being a 11 · 27 11 conduit of the report?
- Yes, there is. If it came to me from any guard, your 12 Α. 13 role is very definitely defined and it's to check the 14 quality of the file and to return the file to the 15 sender if there is something insufficient in it before you send it on. And then, if it was satisfactory, you 16 17 would then send it on with a recommendation one way or 18 the other, to either agree with the proposed course of 19 action. At times you act as a conduit if there is no 20 input required.

11:28

11:28

11:28

- 21 141 Q. Yes. But there is a perusal of the file that is being sent?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 142 Q. To check on the standard of the statements that might
 25 be contained in the file or the extent of the
 26 investigation itself?
- A. Yeah. That would be dependent on each supervisor being different to each other insofar as how far you would check and so on, but certainly is best practice.

- 1 143 Q. As best practice. And from time to time the pressures 2 of work may not allow that best practice to be 3 obtained, is that right?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 144 Q. Did you start to feel uncomfortable in your role, as it 11:29 6 were, as a confidante to Garda Keogh?
- 7 A. No.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- 8 145 we'll come to a meeting that you had with Chief Ο. 9 Superintendent Murray on the 13th March. But as a backdrop to that meeting that you had with him, is 10 11 · 29 11 there an issue there prior to that of a conflict that 12 might have been perceived by other members in the unit 13 or in Athlone Garda Station between your role as being 14 a confidante to Garda Keogh and perhaps your duties to 15 other members? 11:29
 - I think it's fair to say that following the disclosures Α. people, certain people would have had views of both Garda A or Garda Keogh and as such they were held. And it may be that some people would have had a view that I might be -- because I would act as a liaison, some 11:30 people might perceive this as supporting his position. I would have been comfortable in the role, because I felt it was a role -- well number one, I had discussed it with Superintendent McBrien, but I was happy to do it because I saw it as a role to support a person as 11:30 distinct from their stance. It was more, to me, personal. Even though, like, most people had opinions in it, I took it on as a role as a supervisor to support a person in difficulty as distinct from

2	146	Q.	Then Chief Superintendent Murray takes up the role of	
3			superintendent, taking over from Superintendent	
4			McBrien, and you have your first meeting with him on	
5			the 13th March, isn't that right?	11:31
6		Α.	Yeah. I wouldn't have remembered the date.	
7	147	Q.	Yes?	
8		Α.	Like obviously, he references the date.	
9	148	Q.	Yes. Will you just tell us about that. I think in the	
10			first instance he has told us the request for the	11:31
11			meeting had something to do with another investigation	
12			that we're not concerned about, is that right?	
13		Α.	Yeah. Again, I am not a person who kept copious notes	
14			but other people seem to have. So I put a certain	
15			amount of faith in notes that were made. I didn't keep	11:31
16			notes of that date, nor all of its content. The	
17			mention of a Roma tribunal and me looking for a	
18			meeting, I don't remember that event, but I don't have	
19			a reason to dispute that aspect. So if we discussed	
20			that as a prequel to a conversation, I trust and	11:32
21			believe it's true.	
22	149	Q.	Perhaps if we could have page 2184 up on the screen.	
23			This is Superintendent Murray's note of that meeting.	
24			We will come to his evidence in due course. It says:	
25				11:32
26			"Met Sergeant Haran re"	
27				
28			And that's the matter that you just referred to.	

supporting necessarily the role in which he disclosed.

1

29

2			un Carda Nichalas Kaagh and discussed the broad	
			up Garda Ni chol as Keogh and di scussed the broad	
3			outline."	
4				
5			Did you bring up the issue of Garda Keogh?	11:32
6		Α.	I don't remember instigating, but I have no difficulty	
7			remembering the fact that we discussed it. And one	
8			thing I would have been conscious of, with any new	
9			supervisor, in this case Superintendent Murray, I would	
LO			have been very much wanting to assert a position that I	11:32
L1			was neutral in my role, so I would have been wanting to	
L2			make that point to him so that he wouldn't feel I was	
L3			there to say I necessarily support a person who is	
L4			making a protected disclosure. I wanted it to be shown	
L5			that I was supportive of this person through having	11:33
L6			been previously appointed, but also that I was fully	
L7			comfortable because I had a personal relationship with	
L8			Garda Keogh, both working and personal, so I had no	
L9			reason to worry. But what was important to me that day	
20			was to make sure that Superintendent Murray knew that	11:33
21			position.	
22	150	Q.	He goes on to note:	
23				
24			"He indicated he was contact for Garda Keogh and knew	
25			his mind re returning to work etcetera. Said he wasn't	11:33
26			directly involved in any of it. Asked him if there was	
27			a perception he was on one side because of his role."	
28			a per deptron he was on one state because of this forc.	
- 0				

" -- at the request of Inspector Farrell. He brought

1

29

Do you recall that?

1		Α.	I don't, you know, specific words I won't recall. But	
2			we would have discussed how I felt in relation to it	
3			and I said that I had no difficulty in continuing in	
4			that role.	
5	151	Q.	"He said there was and not totally comfortable with	11:3
6			that."	
7				
8			Did you say that you weren't comfortable in your role?	
9		Α.	No, I don't recollect that at all.	
10	152	Q.	"Told him to consider might be better if role passed as	11:3
11			came near end of process."	
12				
13			Do you recall that?	
14		Α.	I do. It's my recollection of it that it was his	
15			suggestion that I might be that the role might be	11:3
16			passed to someone else. Generally speaking, when a	
17			superintendent would take a position, I didn't refute	
18			it. Whilst I was comfortable liaising with Garda	
19			Keogh, if a superintendent was coming in with a plan to	
20			slightly alter the arrangement, I wasn't going to fight	11:3
21			against that decision.	
22	153	Q.	If we just look at Day 123, if we could have that up,	
23			Mr. Kavanagh, at page 44 of the transcript. This may	
24			or may not be important but I think during the course	

26

27

28

29

Yes.

Α.

focused on the statement that this been made by

Superintendent Murray, where he suggests that you had

initiated this change in events, as it were, right?

of your interview with the Tribunal investigators, they 11:35

1	154	Q.	I am just going to give you you took issue with that	
2			because you said that your belief was that it was he	
3			who initiated this. We will go through what he had to	
4			say in relation to this. At page 44, at question 178,	
5			178 is the question:	11:36
6				
7			"A. I had never met Sergeant Haran before."	
8				
9			Is that right?	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:36
11	155	Q.	"And he wanted to discuss this issue that was causing,	
12			I suppose angst to him."	
13				
14			That relates to the other issue.	
15				11:36
16			"I discussed that with him in detail. It was something	
17			that was troubling him. I helped him, assisted as best	
18			I could in our conversation. During the course of it	
19			he brought up Garda Keogh and we had a discussion about	
20			his involvement with Garda Keogh and the support he was	11:36
21			giving him."	
22				
23			Now, I mean he is clearly asserting there that you were	
24			the person who initiated the conversation in relation	
25			to Garda Keogh and the support that you were offering.	11:36
26			Do you take issue with that?	
27		Α.	I do, yeah. Like, I suppose for a start, it would be	
28			more appropriate that the superintendent would call me	
29			to his office than I would toddle in and produce a	

1			conversation to him. So I would have said that as	
2			is mentioned at the start, Inspector Farrell suggests	
3			to Superintendent Murray that he should talk to me, and	
4			I would have thought that we were discussing matters.	
5			I would have been certainly anxious to clarify my role	11:3
6			to him regarding Garda Keogh, but I would have felt he	
7			brought it up.	
8	156	Q.	You say you would have felt that he brought it up. I	
9			mean, if there was a conflict between the two of you	
10			and he seems to have a note that supports his	11:3
11			contention that you were the one who introduced it into	
12			the conversation, I mean are you going to stand firm in	
13			your position that it was he who brought up the	
14			subject?	
15		Α.	well, I'd like to stand firm, in that I didn't initiate	11:3
16			a visit to his office in the first place.	
17	157	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	So therefore, the content of any conversation that I	
19			was going in for would have been known by the person	
20			who planned the meeting, which wasn't me. So I would	11:3
21			have said it's more likely that if I was asked to go to	
22			a meeting to discuss something, that it was the person	
23			who orchestrated the meeting that might have known what	
24			we were discussing.	
25	158	Q.	Well then he goes on to say, in answer to question 179	11:3
26			there on the screen, the question is:	

28

29

"Do you have anything else to say in relation to it?

Well I suppose in dealing with the issue that he

Τ			was facing himself which were causing him worry and in	
2			looking at his position with Garda Keogh and from what	
3			he told me, I suppose he wanted a break, as it were,	
4			and he didn't want any perception to be created because	
5			of his entirely one handed support, one man support for	11:38
6			Garda Keogh."	
7				
8			Do you recall that as being part of your conversation?	
9		Α.	I think my memory of the conversation is that I was	
10			clarifying that I was comfortable in the role and he	11:39
11			was suggesting that perception could exist from other	
12			people. And I understand that, his comment, because he	
13			was coming in from the outside. I grasped it, and that	
14			was the point at which I was saying, I see how that	
15			could be perceived that I amn't impartial.	11:39
16	159	Q.	But he was the one to introduce the perception that	
17			might exist?	
18		Α.	That perceptions could exist, exactly.	
19	160	Q.	If we can then just move down the next page, page 45.	
20			Then we have a quote from your statement, your	11:39
21			interview with the Tribunal investigators, which is at	
22			11756, where an extract of Chief Superintendent	
23			Murray's statement concerning this matter was put to	
24			you. This was the response that you had, it's at line	
25			21 there, and this is a quote from your statement to	11:40
26			the Tribunal investigators:	

29

"My recollection is that this was suggested to me. I was open to it and I had no issue with him saying that.

T	refit he, as my boss, was terring me it would be a	
2	good idea. I think that Superintendent Pat Murray felt	
3	that Sergeant Yvonne Martin would be better placed as	
4	an independent person and that it would be good to have	
5	her in that role. I saw myself as impartial and still	11:40
6	feel the same way. I would like to clarify, I did not	
7	see myself as being the only person supporting Garda	
8	Keogh. "	
9		
10	And then it's put to him that you had been suggesting	11:40
11	that it was he who introduced the issue to the	
12	conversation and the question is:	
13		
14	"Are you sure that it was he introduced it?"	
15		11:41
16	And then he goes on to say:	
17		
18	"Yeah. I had never met Sergeant Haran before."	
19		
20	This is line 8 of that page.	11:41
21		
22	"I had never met Sergeant Haran before, so when he	
23	brought up Garda Keogh and the conversation arose in	
24	terms of what he had been doing, he said he was	
25	concerned that perhaps people didn't think he was	11:41
26	neutral and out of that conversation came, I suppose,	
27	the suggestion, would be relinquish the role or like to	
28	relinquish it, was it too much for him, did he want to	
29	step back. And that was something he considered.	

Т			There was nothing forced or planned or anything about	
2			that, it was something that came up naturally during	
3			the course of the conversation."	
4				
5			Does that reflect your understanding of the	11:42
6			conversation that you had at that time?	
7		Α.	It's certainly broadly in agreement with my memory of	
8			it. It just seems to kind of hinge on whether it was	
9			he or I that brought up the discussion about stepping	
10			back.	11:42
11	161	Q.	Yes?	
12		Α.	And my memory of it is it came up, the conversation	
13			came up and when he discussed it from the perspective	
14			of bringing somebody new into the role, I understood	
15			that logic, because the logic of bringing somebody new	11:42
16			into it could certainly, in my mind, be seen as a	
17			completely impartial person, if I perhaps had been seen	
18			as not. So I did understand that and reflect on it.	
19	162	Q.	Well, when you went to the meeting on the 13th March,	
20			you have already told us that you didn't have any	11:42
21			troubles in relation to your role?	
22		Α.	No, I didn't.	
23	163	Q.	Yes. I think then again on the 20th March that you had	
24			a further discussion with Superintendent Murray?	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:43
26	164	Q.	And you considered the position, is that right?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	165	Q.	Yes. And would you just tell us about that?	
29		Α.	Well again, I think it was, we were asserting a	

1			position then that it would happen that I would step	
2			back and that Sergeant Martin would step into that	
3			role. And, as I said earlier, when the superintendent	
4			had this meeting with me, it was a position that was	
5			held, as distinct from a necessary conversation. So I	11:43
6			was being told that that was it. But I wasn't	
7			uncomfortable with it because of the explanation of the	
8			independence and the perception of the independence of	
9			a new person being given that role. So I understood	
10			that logic.	11:43
11	166	Q.	Having confirmed the position on the 20th March, a	
12			direction issued on the 2nd April. It's at page 2190	
13			of the material. We have already had it open this	
14			morning. If we just focus on paragraph 2:	
15				11:44
16			"Sergeant Moylan and in his absence"	
17				
18			Yourself	
19				
20			"supervise unit C to which Garda Keogh is attached.	11:44
21			Both those sergeants should continue to supervise the	
22			member in the normal way in relation to any work output	
23			required of the member resulting from incidents he	
24			attends or matters he is investigating. Sergeant	
25			Moylan should sit down with Garda Keogh, go through his	11:44
26			notebook, Pulse, the DPP and crime files and ascertain	
27			if he requires help with any ongoing cases as he	
28			mentioned a harassment case he may be in difficulty	
29			with. Any issues arising should be immediately	

1			reported. "	
2				
3			During your conversation on the 13th March with	
4			Superintendent Murray was there any discussion in	
5			relation to the work performance of Garda Keogh?	11:45
6		Α.	No, not to my recollection, it was just the process of	
7			the slight restructuring and because it would have	
8			involved inserting Sergeant Martin in that role, it	
9			would have been more relating to the welfare aspect. I	
10			always was continuing to be on unit C, so my role as	11:45
11			supervisor would continue unchanged for all persons.	
12	167	Q.	Garda Keogh complained that he had been a member of An	
13			Garda Síochána for many years and nobody had questioned	
14			his work prior to this. He says that this amounts to	
15			some form of targeting or certainly it was humiliating	11:45
16			for him to have to sit down and to have his notebook,	
17			his Pulse entries, his DPP and crime files gone over in	
18			detail. It was suggested that in some way this might	
19			be a targeting of him. Is that unusual, for this event	
20			to take place, for somebody to be inspected, as it	11:46
21			were, or audited in this way?	
22		Α.	Well, I don't see it as that. I mean, when that	
23			instruction came out to me, I'll be frank, I read it	
24			and took it with very little need of concern, because	
25			supervising unit C when Sergeant Moylan wasn't there	11:46
26			would have been an absolute role that I would have had.	
27	168	Q.	Yes.	

29

Α.

And relating to Garda Keogh, there is a specific piece

that mentions Sergeant Moylan siting down. But I would

1			have never have taken that kind of instruction that was	
2			specific to Sergeant Moylan onto myself. I would have	
3			assisted Garda Keogh with files but never taken that	
4			piece?	
5	169	Q.	So really in a way this is retaining the status quo	11:47
6			except for the appointment of Sergeant Martin as acting	
7			in some capacity as a welfare support, is that right?	
8		Α.	Yes, because in the main in Athlone at that time there	
9			would have been two sergeants attached. One with a	
10			primary role to supervise a unit and one is a slightly	11:47
11			altered role, like my own, in community policing. And	
12			you would always be, what might be described as a	
13			substitute and your role would be to step in any time.	
14			So that would have been very routine.	
15	170	Q.	Now, as it turned out, I think that Sergeant Moylan did	11:47
16			go through the files, etcetera. You had no role in	
17			relation to that, isn't that right?	
18		Α.	Not the specific files, I might have assisted in some,	
19			what I would call, basic paperwork on occasion.	
20	171	Q.	I think that you were to deputise for Sergeant Moylan	11:48
21			in his absence, but I don't think that you are	
22			concerned with any of the alleged matters that arise in	
23			issue number 9, which are the alleged criticism of	
24			criminal investigations by Garda Keogh during 2015.	
25			You're not concerned in any of those?	11:48
26		Α.	No.	
27	172	Q.	And none of those files went through you or came down	
28			from Chief Superintendent Murray for further queries,	

isn't that right?

29

2 So you're not concerned in relation to any of those 173 Q. 3 I think in relation to issue 15, which concerns the issue of commendations, I don't think you 4 5 had any role in relation to that either? 11:49 6 No. Α. Isn't that right? 7 174 Q. 8 That's right. Α. If we could just have page 2261 up on the screen, 9 175 Q. please. This is a direction dated 22nd October 2015, 10 11 and it concerns the confining to indoor duties of Garda 12 Keogh. 13 14 "With immediate effect, Garda Nick Keogh should be 15 detailed for indoor duties with unit C. 11:49 16 17 I have spoken with the member on this issue. I will 18 review the matter again on 1st November 2015. 19 20 Please inform all concerned and arrange accordingly." 11:49 21 22 That's addressed to the sergeant in charge of Athlone 23 and then the sergeant in charge of unit C, that's 24 yourself, isn't that right? 25 Well, it probably would have been Sergeant Moylan in Α. 11:50 real terms, but I would have been aware. 26 27 176 And then to each sergeant in the Athlone district. Q. 28 Yes. Α.

1

29

177

Q.

Α.

That's right, yes.

And a copy sent to Inspector Farrell and Inspector

Т			Minnock. You had a conversation with Garda Keogh after	
2			this direction, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	I don't remember a specific one, I may have referenced	
4			it in my evidence. I would have had regular	
5			conversations with him through his work.	11:50
6	178	Q.	If we could just have page 591 up on the screen. If we	
7			just scroll down there to 5.2, please. 5.1 deals with:	
8				
9			"A decision was made by Superintendent Murray to	
10			confine Garda Keogh to indoor duty. I was not	11:51
11			consulted in relation to this decision."	
12				
13			Indeed, Superintendent Murray has said that he didn't	
14			consult you in relation to that decision or any other	
15			sergeant because he had formed a view in relation to	11:51
16			the presentation of Garda Keogh when he met him on an	
17			occasion, and also in relation to some crime files that	
18			he was dealing with. First of all in relation to that,	
19			did you notice anything in particular about Garda	
20			Keogh's presentation on duty in the Garda station at	11:51
21			any time?	
22		Α.	Nothing that I took official note of, but I would have	
23			been aware of his general demeanour, health, etcetera.	
24			So I would have been aware that he was struggling at	
25			that point, but nothing that would have caused me to	11:51
26			make a formal report or anything.	
27	179	Q.	Then at 5.2 you say:	
28				
29			"I am aware that Garda Keogh was unhappy with the	

1 decision from informal conversations we had. He would 2 often call me off duty to express his frustrations and 3 his difficulties with drink. I offered support and encouraged him to seek help." 4 5 11:52 6 Then 5.3: 7 8 "Struggled to be on time for early shifts and mentioned 9 that he may have no choice but to commence long-term 10 sick leave. I discouraged him from going on sick 11:52 11 I eave. He felt that his assignment to indoor duties 12 was a ploy on the part of the management to push him 13 out." 14 15 Do you recall that conversation? 11:52 16 They're more an amalgam of conversations as Α. 17 distinct from one particular event now. As I say, we 18

worked daily, so when we spoke daily I would call them 19 informal conversations and as a result there was no 20 doubt he was frustrated at being put into, what we call 11:53 the public office, on a full-time basis. Because 21 22 it's -- well, I previously described it as quite a 23 difficult job, and his frustration was, I suppose, 24 building. You know, he was struggling with the 25 pressures that he was under anyway. So I do remember 11:53 26 regular conversations with him.

27 180 Q. In terms of the role on the public desk, as it were, 28 did you think it was appropriate in the circumstances 29 for Garda Keogh to be put on the public desk?

- 1 A. Well --
- 2 181 Q. Did you have a view?
- 3 A. If you're a sergeant with what you might call a full
- duty team, it's generally a position that rotates.
- 5 There are many people in the Guards who are restricted

11:54

11:54

11:54

- 6 to that role for various reasons, whether it's health
- or other issues. So it's not a role anybody wants to
- be in full-time, but in a place like Athlone we don't
- 9 have a large amount of roles to play with, as such.
- There are functional roles that have to be filled every 11:54
- day, and that was one of them. So once the
- superintendent made the decision that he wouldn't be
- outside, which would generally be involved on patrol
- car duty, this is the next place and the fixed job. We
- don't have a lot of what you might call, you know,
- spare or alternate roles to place anybody in.
- 17 182 Q. Then if we could just move on in relation to another
- 18 matter that you deal with, which is the location of the
- 19 Garda safe in the station?
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 183 Q. Will you just tell us where that is located?
- 22 A. Yeah. There was some mention of -- in relation to the
- firearm and in that context?
- 24 184 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. Yeah. Firearms are located in an office away from the
- 26 public office. It's down a corridor that would be
- 27 maybe 20 metres long. A person who is qualified to
- hold a firearm retrieves the firearm from the safe,
- 29 which is in a different room, but they must bring the

1			firearm to the public office in order to open a small	
2			safe that is located in the public office, and that's	
3			to retrieve a book in which they sign out the firearm	
4			that they are taking. That book is countersigned by	
5			the member in charge, who is effectively the person in	11:55
6			the public office. So that's how it happens.	
7	185	Q.	That seems clear enough in relation to matters. You	
8			had evidence to give in relation to issue number 8, but	
9			that is an issue that is not being pursued but can I	
10			just deal with one aspect of that? This concerns a	11:56
11			suggestion that you were advised by Superintendent	
12			Murray to pull back and alienate Garda Keogh. Do you	
13			understand?	
14		Α.	I certainly understand the comment, yeah.	
15	186	Q.	Yes. What's your response in relation to that	11:57
16			suggested suggestion that is contained in Garda Keogh's	
17			statement to the Tribunal?	
18		Α.	Well, the phrase alienate was never put to me and I	
19			would have rejected it out of hand, even from a	
20			supervisor. And the other phrase used, the phrase pull	11:57
21			back, certainly did come in in a conversation regarding	
22			the impartiality discussion. So it was brought up in	
23			that context and certainly in no respect related to,	
24			you know, the phrase alienate, which is very different.	
25			CHAIRMAN: Isolate, boycott, isolate?	11:57
26		Α.	Yes, and all of those words, had any of them been put	

certainly, absolutely were not.

MR. MARRINAN:

27

28

29

187

Q.

in context to me, I would have rejected them, but they

In terms of as Garda Keogh's supervising

1 sergeant during the relevant period of time in 2014 and 2 then subsequently in 2015, albeit as a stand in for 3 Garda Moylan, did you see any discernible change in 4 management style at that time with the change over from 5 Superintendent McBrien to Superintendent Murray?

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

188

Q.

well, I think it's fair to say that both Α. superintendents are very different in their manner. But changes, like, personnel changes were negligible. Practices regarding some of our meetings, what we call our PAF meetings, our daily meeting, and a thing called 11:58 a crime file which was introduced, some of those things changed, but I would have said that practices changed from supervisor to supervisor. So I didn't see a change that brought -- it wasn't meteoric in any way, it was just discernible insofar as it obvious that a new superintendent was putting his stamp on the way things were done and they were in my memory all in a positive fashion, just improving what I perceived as a

11:58

11:59

there a dramatic change or did it come in gently? Well, I would have to say of Superintendent Murray, Α. that he wasn't -- he was of the type to bring change. So he brought it in promptly. So, insofar as -- it didn't creep, it happened that on a certain day, which I certainly wouldn't remember, a new practice was in, and he did bring that practice in a firm way, insofar as it arrived quickly after his arrival. He obviously brought that manner with him, where he decided, I felt,

good ship and now only just that little bit better.

So it was an evolutionary process, as it were.

2			improvement.	
3	189	Q.	From what you could see, was that done in an evenhanded	
4	203	ζ.	way?	
5		Α.	Absolutely.	12:00
6	190	Q.	If we could just have page 592 up on the screen. This	
7			is paragraph 6.	
8				
9			"Allegations of targeting or discrediting."	
10				12:00
11			You say:	
12				
13			"My understanding is that Garda Keogh is claiming that	
14			as a result of making a protected disclosure he	
15			encountered harassment, exclusion, victimisation and	12:00
16			penalisation. I played no part in any such alleged	
17			treatment."	
18				
19			I don't think there's any suggestion that you did, but	
20			did you observe any of those matters in Athlone Garda	12:00
21			Station?	
22		Α.	Absolutely not.	
23	191	Q.	You then go on to say at paragraph 6.2:	
24				
25			"I did not receive any request or direction from my	12:01
26			other member to treat Garda Keogh any differently from	
27			other members. I have no knowledge of any such alleged	
28			mistreatment. As stated, I am aware that he was	
29			unhappy with the decision to place him on indoor duty."	

1		Α.	That's right.	
2	192	Q.	Yes. Thank you very much. Would you answer any	
3			questions?	
4				
5			END OF EXAMINATION	12:01
6				
7			CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Kelly.	
8				
9			SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. KELLY,	
10			AS FOLLOWS:	12:01
11				
12	193	Q.	MR. KELLY: Good morning, Sergeant Haran?	
13		Α.	Good morning.	
14	194	Q.	You worked for a quite a long time with Nick Keogh, you	
15			were his sergeant?	12:01
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	195	Q.	The both of you got on well, you supported him where	
18			appropriate or needed and as well you're a friend of	
19			his as well?	
20		Α.	Yes, I would like to think we have a good rapport.	12:01
21	196	Q.	There was no tension whatsoever at any point ever	
22			between you and him?	
23		Α.	No, I don't think so.	
24	197	Q.	You had a good, solid working relationship?	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:02
26	198	Q.	One of the things, just before I forget about it, the	
27			changes that were brought in by Superintendent Murray,	
28			I think it was the way he entitled it "The reporting of	
29			incidents other than creating Pulse entries", perhaps	

Т			ii we just puil it up, it's volume 4 and it's page 752.	
2			You see it's there. Just take a moment and look at it	
3			to remind yourself. It is a letter or a memo sent "re	
4			each sergeant in Athlone district" do you see it, 18th	
5			August 2015?	12:02
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	199	Q.	It deals with you see paragraph 2:	
8				
9			"To ensure the reporting system works swiftly, the	
10			sergeant on duty at the time the incident occurs, by	12:03
11			either being reported or discovered, or in the	
12			sergeant's absence the station orderly or member in	
13			charge, will prepare a short, concise report and e-mail	
14			it to the district office e-mail and copy it to myself,	
15			Inspector Farrell, Detective Sergeant Curley and the	12:03
16			sergeant in charge, Sergeant Baker."	
17				
18			Do you remember that?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	200	Q.	That was one of the changes he had introduced. From	12:03
21			your knowledge of Nick Keogh, would you agree that he	
22			was someone who was firstly proud of being a guard?	
23		Α.	Definitely.	
24	201	Q.	Secondly, he was quite proud of his family's connection	
25			with the Gardaí?	12:04
26		Α.	Yeah. To be honest, I hadn't known about the extensive	
27			connections but I know he was proud to be in the	
28			Guards.	
29	202	Q.	Yes. What I want to ask you is, that period around	

1			about May 2014 when he made his protected disclosure,	
2			it couldn't have been that easy for you or any of you	
3			in the station, I imagine?	
4		Α.	No, it was very difficult, absolutely.	
5	203	Q.	But as far as you were concerned, and I put this to	12:0
6			you, what you saw was someone who, right or wrong,	
7			believed that this is what he had to do to expose	
8			wrongdoing?	
9		Α.	Oh absolutely, I have no doubts about his motives	
10			whatsoever.	12:0
11	204	Q.	There was no malice or anything of that sort, making	
12			stuff up?	
13		Α.	No, I believed he was exposing criminality at the time.	
14	205	Q.	That was his firm, honest believe and that was how you	
15			saw it, is that right?	12:0
16		Α.	Absolutely.	
17	206	Q.	Thank you. Then I want to just finally ask you about	
18			the confinement to indoor duty. On the last occasion I	
19			asked you about that, so I will not go over it again in	
20			the same way. But given that by that stage Nick Keogh	12:0
21			was clearly under stress, would you firstly agree that	
22			that?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	207	Q.	And secondly, it was apparent to you, I imagine, that	
25			that was related to what had been going on at work?	12:0
26		Α.	Yes, clearly a factor.	

208 Q.

27

28

29

As he saw it. So you had this guard who then was

appropriate to put Nick Keogh in that situation, on

confined to indoor duty. In your view it wasn't really

- permanent indoor duty, was it?
- 2 A. No, I couldn't say that, because the difficulty we
- have, like if you were in a situation where you have 25
- 4 members on a regular unit, you could try to find a role

12:06

12:06

12:06

12:06

12.07

- for everybody who had different skill levels.
- 6 209 Q. Yes.
- 7 A. But in a situation in Athlone, unfortunately it was a
- 8 numbers game.
- 9 210 Q. Yeah.
- 10 A. If the superintendent perceived that Garda Keogh
- couldn't work outdoors, the reality is, that is the
- next role. Each shift in Athlone, the first three
- places that are filled is the role of public officer
- and patrol car, driver and observer. Then you work off
- any extra personnel you have for various roles, for
- 16 people. So I don't really see the options were --
- 17 211 Q. It was apparent to you that Nick Keogh felt that the
- 18 effect of that was to try and force him out of the
- 19 Guards. That was how he saw it, wasn't it?
- 20 A. Well, I suppose -- well, I see he says that very
- 21 clearly. I don't see it as being -- what the
- 23 212 Q. I'm not asking but that?
- 24 A. Yeah.
- 25 213 Q. But what Nick Keogh seen at the time as?
- 26 A. Oh yeah, Nick Keogh certainly felt the strain and huge
- 27 pressure on that, once that happened.
- 28 214 Q. This was sending him a clear and unmistakable message,
- as he saw it?

Т		Α.	werr, he may have seen it that way, year.	
2	215	Q.	I see. Thank you very much, sergeant.	
3				
4			END OF EXAMINATION	
5				12:07
6			CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Murphy? Mr. O'Higgins?	
7			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you, Chairman.	
8				
9			SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN WAS EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL	
10			O' HI GGI NS, AS FOLLOWS:	12:07
11				
12	216	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Good afternoon?	
13		Α.	Good afternoon.	
14	217	Q.	Sergeant Haran, I just have a few questions for you. I	
15			would ask you to look at your statement and your	12:07
16			interview to the Tribunal investigators. With that in	
17			mind, could we have page 589 please up on the screen.	
18			This is your statement, Sergeant Haran, I just want to	
19			ask you a few general matters. Paragraph 3.6 first of	
20			all. This deals with, just to locate for you, this is	12:07
21			an Olivia O'Neill matter that I am asking you the	
22			question about?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	218	Q.	You say in your statement:	
25				12:08
26			"Garda Keogh refers to an interaction with Olivia	
27			O'Neill sometime in 2014 in his statement. Garda Keogh	
28			was working as public officer on this day. I remember	
29			that he spoke to me during the day in an animated	

Т			manner. He outlined something about office a weith	
2			presenting unannounced at the counter and that she	
3			wanted to make a statement about Garda A and other	
4			i ndi vi dual s. "	
5				12:08
6			Can I just ask you just to elaborate upon that a little	
7			bit. First of all, what do you mean when you say he	
8			spoke you to you in an animated manner?	
9		Α.	Yeah, this I remember because it was significant to	
10			Garda Keogh. Because he was I think I described him	12:08
11			animated, meaning he was positive and he was excited.	
12			It was a good thing for him, he saw her arrival as	
13			apparently unannounced and it was his hope, very	
14			clearly, that she was here, as the phrase was used I	
15			think by somebody else, to name names. So that was my	12:09
16			memory of it, was that he was excited about her	
17			potentially stepping up and making a statement.	
18	219	Q.	Yes.	
19			MR. KELLY: Chairman, I just wonder, probably it's my	
20			fault, isn't this issue 3.	12:09
21			CHAIRMAN: Definitely.	
22			MR. KELLY: Aren't we dealing with	
23			MR. MARRINAN: We actually have dealt with this. He	
24			has already given evidence in relation to this.	
25			MR. KELLY: Yes.	12:09
26			CHAIRMAN: I think that is right. Is that right,	
27			Mr. O'Higgins? If there is a reason for re considering	
28			it, I think everybody should know where they are going,	
29			if you know what I mean.	

1	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
2	CHAIRMAN: Have we covered this before? I mean, have	
3	we covered this particular point?	
4	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: May it please you, Chairman, I	
5	was going to move immediately onto the supervisor role	12:09
6	aspect.	
7	CHAIRMAN: No, no, Mr. O'Higgins, in fairness, I don't	
8	want to shut anybody down in asking a relevant question	
9	and I note there are certain difficulties, but I	
10	thought that Mr. Kelly's point was correct. Now, if	12:10
11	you tell me this issue hasn't arisen before and that	
12	it's proper that it should arise, then I will canvass	
13	views of the various parties and I suppose make a	
14	ruling on it.	
15	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: If I could indicate, Chairman,	12:10
16	I am happy and it's proper that I move to issue number	
17	5, the supervision issue, from that. There had been a	
18	referral back in relation to other matters, for	
19	instance, the	
20	CHAIRMAN: Yes, I understand. There is no criticism.	12:10
21	But I think in fairness, now that we have this	
22	reference to the Olivia O'Neill matter, I think in	
23	fairness if Mr. Kelly wishes to revisit the matter, he	
24	is free to revisit it.	
25	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: May it please you.	12:10
26	CHAIRMAN: So I will come back to you at the end,	
27	Mr. Kelly, if you want to ask anything further about	
28	that.	
29	MR. KELLY: It is very kind of you, but I think it's	

1	probably an invitation I will decline, but you can come	
2	back to me later.	
3	CHAIRMAN: Because I have to say, I have to say, I	
4	wasn't aware of evidence to date, it may be just my	
5	mistake, I wasn't aware of, I can't say, now that	12:11
6	you've just mentioned, animated, I noticed it and wrote	
7	it down, excited, thinking it was a good thing and that	
8	Olivia O'Neill was here to say things that would in	
9	effect support, which is what I am understanding. I	
LO	wasn't aware of that as an issue. Insofar as anybody	12:11
L1	thinks that's of importance, then we might at a later	
L2	stage decide how we are going to revisit it.	
L3	Mr. Kelly, I am sorry, that sounds very obscure, but	
L4	does that make sense?	
L5	MR. KELLY: I think so.	12:12
L6	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, what I mean is, Garda Keogh might	
L7	well sorry, if somebody thinks that is a significant	
L8	piece this is no criticism of anybody, including the	
L9	sergeant. In other words, if it is thought that it's	
20	relevant, that there is evidence which suggests that	12:12
21	Garda Keogh in the Garda station, on the occasion of	
22	the visit of Olivia O'Neill, became excited and	
23	thinking it was a very good thing, in the apparent	
24	belief that she was going to name names and name	
25	people, and i.e. support any case. If that was the	12:12
26	case, if anybody said that's relevant or of any	
27	significance, then I think it would only be fair to	
28	return to it if necessary in a very limited way, but I	
29	am not even certain that anybody is going to say that	

1	is important.	
2	MR. KELLY: I hope not. I will just tell you what is	
3	on my mind. If it is going to be said well, look, here	
4	Garda Keogh was excited and wonderful, because this	
5	alleged coaching that he had had all come to fruition, 12	2:13
6	then of course I'm not having that, we're going to have	
7	to go over an awful lot of stuff. But if that is not	
8	being said, then we will leave it.	
9	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. I think fairness would	
10	dictate if that were being the case. Okay, are we all 12	2:13
11	clear on where we stand on that?	
12	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes, that's fine, Chairman.	
13	CHAIRMAN: Or more particularly where I stand on that.	
14	We're all clear on that.	
15	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Arising from what you said,	2:13
16	Chairman, I know you will be cognisant of what is	
17	stated at paragraph 3.7 there in the next paragraph,	
18	but it's not necessary at this point, having regard to	
19	the fact we're dealing with issues 1 to 4, to dwell on	
20	that at this point.	2:14
21	CHAIRMAN: Paragraph 3.7 will not cause any difficulty,	
22	because we have been over that ground.	
23	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes.	
24	CHAIRMAN: And there had been reference to the fact	
25	that Garda Keogh either declined to take a statement	2:14
26	because he knew something about the matters of Olivia	
27	O'Neill, and then the statement that he took the	
28	following day from the other daughter and so on. We	
29	have been over that ground, so I don't think that	

1			causes any	
2			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sorry, I should be more	
3			specific, I was referring to the final sentence, which	
4			really elaborates upon paragraph 3.6 insofar as it	
5			references manner and enthusiasm that Garda	12:14
6			Keogh showed for	
7			CHAIRMAN: Again, I don't think that anybody is going	
8			to be troubled about that, because as far as I know the	
9			evidence is that Garda Keogh said name names and name	
10			guards. That's what he said himself.	12:14
11			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you, Chair. I might move	
12			then to the supervisory issues.	
13			CHAIRMAN: So I don't think that's any problem, but the	
14			other one would be a somewhat different point I think.	
15			Okay.	12:15
16			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you.	
17			CHAIRMAN: So, thanks very much, sorry about that all.	
18	220	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: So then could I ask you then,	
19			sergeant, if we could move to paragraph 3.15 on page	
20			590 of your statement, I just want to ask you one or	12:15
21			two questions surrounding Garda Keogh's abilities with	
22			paperwork. You say there at 3.15 that in general terms	
23			you were glad to assist Garda Keogh in doing files and	
24			reports, he readily admitted it was a weakness on his	
25			part and on occasion you would sit with him and you	12:15
26			would literally empty out his post locker and between	
27			you would be tidy it and try to shape his	
28			correspondence. Can I just ask you about that: In	
29			your reference to help and your dealings with him in	

- this regard, would he sometimes fall back, fall behind
- in his correspondence in terms of answering it and it
- 3 would build up and cause a stress for him?
- 4 A. Well that's pretty much it. If he had had an absence
- 5 either for a rest days or for sick days and rest days

- 6 combined, that would naturally lengthen time away from
- 7 work, so anybody's correspondence would build up.
- 8 221 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. And Nick's in particular. So I just saw that as being
- a very natural event for me to assist him when he would 12:16
- 11 be back. That particular event refers to one
- particular event that I can remember, when he was on
- 13 night shift.
- 14 222 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. When the phones are quiet and people have time, and was 12:16
- an occasion when we actually manually emptied the
- 17 locker and tried to put matters in order of importance,
- and answering them as systematically as we could.
- 19 223 Q. Yes. In the same vein you mentioned in your interview
- 20 with the investigators to the Tribunal that he was
- 21 struggling to cope with basic paperwork, is how you put
- it, is that something you recall in your various chats
- 23 with him over this period?
- 24 A. It is. That would have been, I suppose, at the latter
- end of Nick's working in the station. That's not meant 12:17
- to suggest an ongoing issue.
- 27 224 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. That's meant to suggest that in what would be described
- as the kind of post disclosures period, he began to

1			struggle more than he would have struggled.	
2	225	Q.	Yes. I think you have indicated in the materials you	
3			have provided that you had a good working relationship	
4			with him and a good friendship relationship with him,	
5			but as things moved up to 2017, he was in frequent	12:1
6			contact with you but thereafter moved a little bit	
7			away?	
8		Α.	They did, and I think it was possibly on both of our	
9			parts. I remember on one occasion Garda Keogh would	
10			have said something to the extent that it's not good to	12:1
11			be talking to me, from his side, he was kind of trying	
12			to, I felt, buffer me from potential, I suppose, you	
13			know, comment of being too close or whatever.	
14	226	Q.	Yes.	
15		Α.	So that was the way he was pulling back, I think you	12:1
16			could call it.	
17	227	Q.	Could I ask you then, looking at paragraph 4.3 of your	
18			statement on page 590, you say that following his	
19			disclosure you continued in your role and on occasions	
20			supervised Garda Keogh:	12:1
21				
22			"He struggled at times to keep things going and would	
23			speak about his drinking being a problem and his	

12:18

- 26 I think you mentioned that already
- 27 A. Yes.

24

28 228 Q. He found the mornings difficult, is that right?

preferences for working nights."

29 A. Yes.

1	229	Q.	In terms of actually turning up on time for work?	
2		Α.	I think it would have been turning up and the scale of	
3			work for the public office changes dramatically,	
4			because obviously the amount of people who come in	
5			during the day to the public counter is huge by day and	12:1
6			a lower volume by night. So one aspect of work is	
7			reduced.	
8	230	Q.	I think you discussed helping him with colleagues and	
9			those colleagues included Inspector Farrell,	
10			Superintendent McBrien and Superintendent Pat Murray?	12:1
11		Α.	Yeah. I just wanted to read that.	
12	231	Q.	And that's mentioned	
13		Α.	Yes, yes. No, I remember, it would have certainly been	
14			brought up by me to supervisors at that time, you know,	
15			just a the supports.	12:1
16	232	Q.	Yes. Now, can I ask you in relation to your interview	
17			with the Tribunal investigators, we might have page	
18			11755 please up, which is your interview, sergeant.	
19			You said there on page 11755, you were being asked by	
20			the interviewers to characterise your working and	12:1
21			personal relationship, about halfway down line 93.	
22			Then you speak towards the bottom of that page, you to	
23			refer to:	
24				
25			"Sadly a lot of calls from him when he was drunk and	12:2
26			rambling. Predominantly those conversations were about	
27			his welfare. I would say my relationship with Garda	
28			Keogh became more distant as he became more unwell."	

Т		Α.	Yean, again, this is the latter times and following his	
2			disclosures when he became, as I say, yeah, unwell.	
3	233	Q.	Yes. In terms then of the matter Mr. Marrinan was	
4			asking you about and others, concerning the passing of	
5			the role of support from yourself to Yvonne Martin, to	12:20
6			come in as a liaison person, I think you mentioned	
7			you were asked about that on page 11756. The position	
8			is, as I understand it, that you were aware of course	
9			from your discussions with Pat Murray that that was	
10			going to be happening, isn't that right?	12:20
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	234	Q.	It had been canvassed with you as to your discussions	
13			with the superintendent, and I think there's a	
14			difference in recollection between the two of you, if I	
15			put it that way, concerning precisely who brought up	12:21
16			the question, isn't that right?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18			CHAIRMAN: That's right, yes.	
19	235	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I am going to ask you about	
20			that?	12:21
21			CHAIRMAN: Does it matter a whole lot?	
22			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I am not sure it does,	
23			Chairman.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Does it matter a whole lot if the	
25			superintendent said, you know, I have a feeling that	12:21
26			this is the case, or, if he says, you know, I am a bit	
27			uncomfortable about this? I mean, I am wondering about	
28			this.	
29			MR MÍCHFÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes Mayhe it's a matter for	

1			submission later on, but in my respectful submission,	
2			it will certainly be our submission	
3	236	Q.	CHAIRMAN: what the sergeant says is, look, I did not	
4			have any discomfort. Yes, I had a conversation with	
5			the superintendent and, yes, this issue came up. It	12:21
6			wasn't that I was uncomfortable and said I was	
7			uncomfortable. But my recollection is that he brought	
8			it up and he felt that I might be uncomfortable in it,	
9			and because he felt it, I went along with it because it	
10			was a reasonable point of view among intelligent people	12:22
11			and sensible people. That's what he wanted. He	
12			apparently wanted Sergeant Martin to take over and you	
13			were comfortable with that. If that's what he wanted,	
14			there was no problem with that.	
15		Α.	Yeah, that's largely how I feel about it, exactly.	12:22
16			CHAIRMAN: That's the situation. And he says, no, he	
17			thought that it was Sergeant Haran who brought it up	
18			because he was feeling discomfort at the role. And I	
19			am not sure it makes any difference.	
20			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: If it's of assistance,	12:22
21			Chairman, if I may say so, I propose to pass from that	
22			very shortly.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Somebody may tell me it	
24			makes had a difference and somebody may make a	
25			suggestion as to how the matter may be resolved. But I	12:22
26			am in doubt at the moment, I cannot see how it makes	
27			any difference.	

then, Chairman.

28

29

MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes. I will shortly conclude

1			CHAIRMAN: It's all right.	
2	237	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Could I ask you lastly, would	
3			you mind taking a look at a document, page 4916,	
4			please, sergeant. This is later in time but perhaps it	
5			is of assistance to the Chairman to give an overview of	12:23
6			your position. It's an e-mail from yourself to Thomas	
7			Myers of 7th March 2018. Just a take a moment there to	
8			familiarise yourself with it, I have jumped ahead in	
9			time, but I think it's a relevant document that you may	
10			be able to assist us with. Who, first of all, is	12:23
11			Thomas Myers?	
12		Α.	He is a chief superintendent that was involved in an	
13			investigation that followed. I don't know at what	
14			point it started.	
15	238	Q.	Yes.	12:23
16		Α.	But he was involved in an investigation into certain	
17			issues.	
18	239	Q.	I think the bullying and harassment complaint by Garda	
19			Keogh, is that right?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:23
21	240	Q.	Just taking up really the last two-thirds of that	
22			document, you say, and forgive me if I am cherry	
23			picking here, others than extract from it what's	
24			relevant. About two-thirds of the way down you say:	
25				12:24
26			"He would often talk to me and I would regularly	
27			advised him on files and paperwork as he freely	
28			admitted he was not good on paper."	
29				

1			That's fine, we dealt with that.	
2				
3			"At this stage when he had admitted to be the person	
4			who made disclosures, he was suffering from alcohol use	
5			and he was clearly struggling even to be in work."	12:24
6 7			And that's your recollection?	
8	244	Α.	It is.	
9	241	Q.	"He appeared to be under enormous strain and I remember	
10			that he loved to work nights but I think he felt more	12:24
11			comfortable when less authority was around. He was	
12			honest to me, stated that he may have to go sick and	
13			this was apparent to me. I offered him guidance and my	
14			advice and engaged with him a number of times on and	
15			off duty for a period of time."	12:24
16				
17			The next portion I wish to ask you about.	
18				
19			"Al cohol and the issues surrounding his protected	
20			disclosures had clearly affected him and his ability to	12:24
21			work at his previous standards was undermined up to the	
22			time he went on long-term sick leave."	
23				
24			Was that your understanding?	
25		Α.	Oh, it was. I mean there was an obvious, you know,	12:25
26			change in Garda Keogh from pre and post disclosure and	
27			alcohol substance abuse.	
28	242	Q.	Can I ask you, when you say in the following few lines:	
29				

1		"I did not see Nick Keogh being bullied by any persons,	
2		his unit colleagues appeared to be supportive. The	
3		supervisors in my station never bullied Nick in my	
4		presence, nor did they ever converse to me on paper,	
5		orally or by any meant in any way that might be	12:25
6		perceived as taking actions directed at Nick in any	
7		way. Indeed, supervisors appeared to make genuine	
8		efforts to support him. I look forward to his recovery	
9		and return to work in due course and would welcome him	
10		back to work."	12:25
11			
12		That is and remains your position?	
13	Α.	Absolutely.	
14		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thanks very much.	
15			12:25
16		END OF EXAMINATION	
17			
18		CHAIRMAN: Anybody else?	
19		MS. O'ROURKE: I don't have any questions, Chairman.	
20		CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Anything,	12:25
21		Mr. Marrinan?	
22		MR. MARRINAN: Nothing arising.	
23		CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry.	
24		MR. MARRINAN: Nothing arising.	
25		CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, sergeant.	12:25
26		MR. MARRINAN: Thank you very much, sergeant.	
27			
28		THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	

1			MR. MARRINAN: Gerry White, please. His statement is	
2			to be found in Volume 3 at page 486.	
3				
4			GARDA GERRY WHITE (RETIRED), HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	
5			DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN, AS FOLLOWS:	12:26
6				
7			THE WITNESS: Gerry white.	
8	243	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Now, I think that you were a member of	
9			An Garda Síochána from 1984 until your retirement on	
10			6th December 2016, is that right?	12:26
11		Α.	That's correct.	
12	244	Q.	I think that you were requested to make a statement	
13			arising from issues raised by Garda Keogh in relation	
14			to searches that were conducted on Pulse in relation to	
15			his motor tax, is that right?	12:26
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	245	Q.	Will you just tell us what you recall in relation to	
18			that?	
19			CHAIRMAN: well tell us what your position was first of	
20			all.	12:27
21			MR. MARRINAN: Yes, sorry.	
22			CHAIRMAN: I mean, I know what your position was, but	
23			let's have it officially.	
24		Α.	Between 2008 and 2014 my position was district clerk,	
25			assistant to the superintendent and the inspectors.	12:27
26	246	Q.	CHAIRMAN: District clerk, based in Athlone?	
27		Α.	Based in Athlone.	
28	247	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Just tell us your recollection of the	
29			events?	

1		Α.	When I was asked about this, first of all I had notes,	
2			it wouldn't be a practice of mine to check cars of	
3			members in the station, bar maybe they parked in the	
4			station in error, blocking entrances or exits or	
5			something like that. But when I was asked about this,	12:27
6			I did recall that I didn't recall the date but I	
7			remember being in the finance officer's in the	
8			finance officer's office when Superintendent McBrien	
9			came in and we had a discussion, informal, unscheduled,	
10			where the finance officer was talking about the number	12:27
11			of claims that she had in front of her for payment.	
12			The superintendent says, well, maybe I should check	
13			that the tax and insurance and that on these vehicles	
14			are all correct before we pay them. So it was agreed	
15			that I would take some of these files and check the car	12:28
16			details of a certain number of these claims. Now, I	
17			don't recall whether I picked up the claims, whether	
18			they were handed to me by the finance officer or handed	
19			to me by the superintendent but I took possibly half a	
20			dozen claims and inputted them into Pulse, checked the	12:28
21			details, printed them off and transmitted to the	
22			superintendent.	
23	248	Q.	I think you said that it was a random check in relation	
24			to Garda members, it was generally a random check but	
25			Superintendent McBrien asked to you include Garda Keogh	12:28

- No, no, it was a random check of the claims that were 27 Α. in front of the finance officer. 28
- Is there no specific request in relation to the 29 249 Q.

as part of that?

25

1			inclusion of Garda Keogh?	
2		Α.	No.	
3	250	Q.	Are you sure about that?	
4		Α.	I'm a hundred percent sure, yes.	
5	251	Q.	Right. If we could just have page 6272 up on the	12:29
6			screen, please. Yes. We see there on 30th September	
7			2014, Thomas white, that was yourself, is that right?	
8		Α.	That is myself, yes.	
9	252	Q.	We see there the search and it refers to "caller to	
10			superintendent's office"?	12:29
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	253	Q.	In the remarks section. Can you recall what that	
13			related to?	
14		Α.	I don't recall that. Pulse at that time, when you put	
15			in a query to Pulse you had to give a reason for your	12:29
16			query. This is only speculation, I don't know this as	
17			a fact, but sometimes what you had put in as a reason	
18			for your previous search came up in the following	
19			search. That may be the reason why that was there.	
20			There was no caller to the superintendent's office in	12:30
21			relation to that search.	
22	254	Q.	We can see from that, just above, on the 1st October,	
23			the following day, Superintendent McBrien conducted her	
24			own check and that relates to an inquiry re Athlone.	
25			But you had no role in relation to that?	12:30
26		Α.	No.	
27	255	Q.	Would you answer any questions, please?	
28				
29			END OF EXAMINATION	

1				
2			CHAIRMAN: Now.	
3				
4			GARDA GERRY WHITE (RETIRED), WAS THEN CROSS-EXAMINED BY	_
5			MR. KELLY, AS FOLLOWS:	12:30
6				
7	256	Q.	MR. KELLY: Do you have any recollection of these	
8			events which is independent of those documents which	
9			have been shown to you?	
10		Α.	When I was first asked about this incident, I had no	12:30
11			recollection whatsoever.	
12	257	Q.	All right.	
13		Α.	But it was just, when it was put into context that I	
14			checked a number of vehicles at the time, that I said	
15			this is maybe why I was being asked this question.	12:31
16	258	Q.	So what you are saying, if I understand it correctly,	
17			is well, look, I was called in to the finance office or	
18			Superintendent McBrien's office?	
19		Α.	I was in the finance officer's office when	
20			Superintendent McBrien came in.	12:31
21	259	Q.	So you were in with the finance office, were you?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	260	Q.	Superintendent McBrien arrives?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	261	Q.	Who has got the handful of vehicles?	12:31
26		Α.	The finance officer had a large number of claims on her	
27			desk.	
28	262	Q.	Right. And a group of those are handed to you, is that	
29			right?	

- A. I may have picked them up, I may have been handed them,
 I just can't recall.
- 3 263 Q. You cannot say whether the finance officer or
 4 Superintendent McBrien picked them up and handed them
 5 to you or whether you reached across and took them?

12:32

12:32

12:32

- 6 A. No, I haven't a clue.
- 7 264 Q. What we can be certain of, as I understand your 8 evidence and on the documents, is that Nick Keogh's 9 vehicle was amongst those?
- 10 A. Yes, that would be the case, yes.
- 11 265 Q. It's right, isn't it, that Superintendent McBrien 12 included that in the bundle that was handed to you?
- 13 A. I cannot say that. As I say, I don't know who handed
 14 me -- whether I picked up the documents, whether it was
 15 the finance officer gave them to me or Superintendent 12:32

McBrien.

- 17 266 Q. So what it comes to is, you can neither say it is
 18 correct or incorrect that Superintendent McBrien
 19 included Nick Keogh's amongst those documents given to
 20 you?
- A. No, I can't say.
- 22 267 Q. You're unable to say that?
- 23 A. I'm unable to say that.
- 24 268 Q. Because you simply don't have a recollection?
- 25 A. I don't have a recollection.
- 26 269 Q. All you can say is, I went into the office, there 's a 27 bundle of these documents, I don't imagine it was that 28 thick, was it?
- 29 A. At that time of the year it would be after a lot of

- summer festivals, so probably -- I don't know.
- 2 270 Q. How big, are we talking, this or this [INDICATING]?
- 3 CHAIRMAN: Are we talking 20 or 40 or something, I mean

12:33

- 4 in a rough --
- 5 A. Yeah, that ballpark.
- 6 271 Q. CHAIRMAN: Something of that kind?
- 7 A. Something of that sort, yeah, nothing major but it was
- 8 enough for the finance officer to make a comment on it.
- 9 272 Q. MR. KELLY: All you can say is, you're called in, the
- object is you're going to check the tax status of these 12:33
- 11 vehicles?
- 12 A. Tax and insurance.
- 13 273 Q. Tax and insurance. And you leave that office with a
- bunch of documents, you cannot say who handed them to
- you or whether they came from Superintendent McBrien or 12:33
- the finance officer, but you took them off, you checked
- 17 it. What you can say for certain is that Nick Keogh's
- 18 was amongst them?
- 19 A. Yeah.
- 20 274 Q. That's right?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 275 Q. And you can also say, as I understood your evidence,
- that this was an unusual exercise from your
- 24 perspective?
- 25 A. I would never have been tasked with doing this before.
- 26 276 Q. Never tasked before with that?
- 27 A. No.
- 28 277 Q. The most you would have been tasked with doing in
- relation to checking members' vehicles on Pulse would

1			be if somebody had taken their car in and was blocking	
2			an exit or a parking space or something, you would be	
3			asked to find out whose that is, so they could get on	
4			to them and say, look, move the thing?	
5		Α.	Yeah, just say if somebody was trying to get out, maybe	12:34
6			station guard, I was at a computer that facilitated the	
7			check.	
8	278	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The name?	
9		Α.	Just the name.	
10	279	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The details would be on the thing?	12:34
11		Α.	Just the member's name, so we could contact that	
12			member.	
13	280	Q.	MR. KELLY: You have got a vehicle in the station yard,	
14			this is how I imagine it, tell me if I have got it	
15			wrong, it's registration whatever, somebody comes in,	12:34
16			it will ultimately end up in front of you, find out	
17			whose that is, do you, they're phoned and presumably	
18			they move their vehicle?	
19		Α.	It wouldn't be in that form, it was a very small yard	
20			with an awful lot of people trying to park in it, so if	12:34
21			there was a change of shift and somebody was trying to	
22			get out and you didn't recognise the name of person, if	
23			I was beside the computer that	
24			CHAIRMAN: It would be a harmless kind of	
25		Α.	Totally harmless.	12:35
26	281	Q.	MR. KELLY: Yeah. So this was totally out of the	

Can I ask you, what you do now?

ordinary from the normal run of the thing?

27

28

29

Yes.

Α.

Q.

- 1 A. I'm retired.
- 2 283 Q. Are you?
- 3 A. Yeah.
- 4 284 Q. Congratulations.
- 5 A. Thank you.
- 6 285 Q. CHAIRMAN: So of the possibilities, the finance officer

12:35

12:35

12:35

- 7 had the documents to begin with?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 286 Q. CHAIRMAN: The superintendent comes in and there's a
- 10 conversation?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 287 Q. CHAIRMAN: As a result of this conversation you leave
- with a bunch of documents?
- 14 A. That's right.
- 15 288 Q. CHAIRMAN: A relatively small bunch of documents?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 289 Q. CHAIRMAN: Compared with the number that are on the
- thing. If it happened that you took them and Nick
- 19 Keogh's car is there, that was random?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 290 Q. CHAIRMAN: If that was the case?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 291 Q. CHAIRMAN: If you are handed the bundle by
- 24 Superintendent McBrien, then she had produced the
- 25 documents, is that right?
- 26 A. That would be the case. But I don't think
- 27 Superintendent McBrien knew I was in the finance
- officer's office when she came in.
- 29 292 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand.

1		Α.	So	
2	293	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But you left with the bundle?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	294	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And that was either handled to you by the	
5			superintendent?	12:36
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	295	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And if the superintendent handed them to	
8			you, you don't know how they came to be selected?	
9		Α.	No.	
10	296	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But the other possibility, that you just	12:36
11			reached for a few of them, then it was random?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Otherwise it remains. Okay, thank	
14			you very much. Anything arising out of that,	
15			Mr. Kelly.	12:36
16			MR. KELLY: No, I think that's it.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
18	297	Q.	MR. KELLY: You haven't come here to assert that there	
19			was a pile of documents and you positively remember	
20			going and you randomly selecting stuff out of it?	12:36
21			CHAIRMAN: No.	
22			MR. KELLY: That is not what you are asserting at all.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Garda White very fairly says, look, I do	
24			remember but I am considering possibilities. Okay,	
25			thank you very much.	12:37
26				
27			END OF EXAMINATION	
28				
29			MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS: No questions, Chairman.	

1			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
2			MS. O'ROURKE: No questions, Chairman.	
3			MR. CARROLL: On behalf of Superintendent McBrien, just	
4			a couple of questions by way of clarification with	
5			Mr. White.	12:37
6			CHAIRMAN: Certainly.	
7				
8			GARDA GERRY WHITE (RETIRED), WAS EXAMINED BY MR.	
9			CARROLL, AS FOLLOWS:	
10				12:37
11	298	Q.	MR. CARROLL: Just to be clear. I think you have said	
12			this wasn't a prearranged meeting in the finance	
13			officer's area or room, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
15	299	Q.	I think the finance officer was Catherine Quirk, I	12:37
16			think she is unfortunately deceased?	
17		Α.	That is correct.	
18	300	Q.	Subsequent to this time. I think the position is that	
19			you went in, and I think you made this clear, that the	
20			context of what you were being asked to do was in the	12:38
21			context of claims for travel and travel subsistence	
22			type claims?	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	301	Q.	It was in that context you were being asked to check a	
25			number of your colleagues' vehicles, isn't that right?	12:38
26		Α.	That is correct, yes.	
27	302	Q.	I think the position is, I don't know if you recollect	
28			if anything was said at that point about audits or	
29			anything of that nature in terms of procedures for	

1			audits or anything like that?	
2		Α.	My recollection is it was just to check that the tax	
3			and insurance was correct for the payment of the	
4			claims. The members, when you make claims, certify	
5			that you are properly taxed and insured.	12:38
6	303	Q.	I think am I right when you say you don't recollect	
7			whether it was the finance officer or Superintendent	
8			McBrien that had indicated or handed you the stuff,	
9			would that be fair?	
10		Α.	It could have been myself, it could have been	12:39
11			Superintendent McBrien or the finance officer.	
12	304	Q.	In the normal run of things the finance officer's role	
13			would involve this type of activity in terms of claims	
14			for payments to be made. That would fall within the	
15		Α.	The payment of claims wouldn't have been exclusively	12:39
16			the finance officer would deal with the administration	
17			of that, yes.	
18	305	Q.	And is it your evidence that you went about that	
19			business in checking the various members' vehicles and	
20			it was at that point you became aware of one of them	12:39
21			was Nicholas Keogh, Garda Keogh?	
22		Α.	Until this query was put to me many years later, I	
23			would are not have known that Nicholas Keogh's car was	
24			one of those that I checked.	
25	306	Q.	In that sense there was nothing outstanding in that	12:40
26			sense. You don't recollect then in terms of matters,	
27			whether it was the finance officer or Superintendent	
28			McBrien talking to you and giving you the instruction,	
29			hut you remember them both being there?	

- A. Superintendent McBrien would have tasked me with checking the vehicles. As I say, I don't know who, whether one or three of us picked up the claims.
- Just bear with me one second. Just bear with me one second, sorry. Subsequently then had you indicated to Superintendent McBrien that the check resulted in Garda Keogh's vehicle being taxed in a commercial way, do you recollect that?
- 9 A. I did the searches on the vehicles that I had been
 10 given. I didn't note any discrepancies or 12:41
 11 irregularities in any of them. It just didn't interest
 12 me, to be honest with you.
- 13 308 Q. Just the final thing then, I know you have dealt with
 14 this, just again to try and clarify it: Superintendent
 15 McBrien, when asked about this by the Tribunal team,
 16 wasn't in a position to clarify the caller to the
 17 superintendent's office. That was an entry you made,
 18 was it, when you were checking the matter?

12 · 43

- 19 A. That turned up in the search box, it wasn't a reason
 20 for this search. I have no explanation as to why it
 21 was there. If I was to speculate, it may have been
 22 related to the previous search I conducted.
- 23 Just one final question -- bear with me one moment, I 309 Q. 24 just want to clarify something, sorry. Just on the 25 point, because Superintendent McBrien hasn't given evidence yet in relation to this matter, but she does 26 27 have a recollection that you had indicated that there was an issue in terms of the tax being commercial, she 28 29 has that recollection, possibly later that day.

- 1 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. Carroll, I am not following.
- 2 MR. CARROLL: Or the following day.
- 3 CHAIRMAN: I am not entirely clear, what question are

12 · 43

12:43

12.44

- 4 you asking?
- MR. CARROLL: That there was some feedback to
- 6 Superintendent McBrien.
- 7 CHAIRMAN: He made the check.
- 8 MR. CARROLL: After the check.
- 9 310 Q. CHAIRMAN: You made the check.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 311 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you got feedback?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 312 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you reported the feedback?
- 14 A. I would have printed off --
- 15 313 Q. CHAIRMAN: Printed off the feedback?
- 16 A. To my recollection, I printed off printouts of the
- 17 registered number. There would be two screens, the
- name and registration, address of the person checked.
- 19 314 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 20 A. The second screen would have been the tax and insurance 12:44
- 21 details of that person.
- 22 315 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 23 A. I don't recall anything --
- 24 316 Q. CHAIRMAN: You don't recollect the details of any of
- 25 the particular enquiries that you made?
- 26 317 Q. MR. CARROLL: Maybe that's is an explanation, it's just
- 27 that she, and I just want to put it so there is no
- issue about it, that she has a recollection that you
- 29 may not have said there was a difficulty with it but

Т			you may have said that it was taxed in a commercial	
2			way, that's the point. But you don't have a	
3			recollection of that following your check?	
4		Α.	I don't, because while it was unusual, it was nothing	
5			of interest to me. It was a mundane task, which I just	12:44
6			completed and moved on.	
7	318	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I follow. What was written was written. It	
8			said what it said.	
9		Α.	Yeah.	
10	319	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And you were passing that on to whoever?	12:44
11		Α.	Yes.	
12			CHAIRMAN: So that seems to deal with that,	
13			Mr. Carroll.	
14			MR. CARROLL: Yes, thank you.	
15				12:44
16			END OF EXAMINATION	
17				
18			CHAIRMAN: Thanks you very much. Anybody else?	
19			MR. KELLY: Chairman, there's one thing.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, yes, Mr. Kelly.	12:44
21			MR. KELLY: It's purely a technical thing. I should	
22			have asked it, I forgot.	
23			CHAIRMAN: There's no problem.	
24				
25			GARDA GERRY WHITE WAS THEN FURTHER CROSS-EXAMINED BY	12:45
26			MR. KELLY, AS FOLLOWS:	
27				
28	320	Q.	MR. KELLY: Looking at that screen in front of you?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 321 Q. I think that's the Pulse record in relation to -- you
- can see at the top, it looks like it's Nick Keogh's
- 3 vehicle at the time, is that right?
- 4 A. Quite possibly, yes.
- 5 322 Q. It seems to run from the bottom up in chronological
- 6 order, is that right?
- 7 A. That's correct, yes.
- 8 323 Q. I see there up at the top, there is third from the top,
- 9 it's, what, 30th September 2014, that's you, Thomas
- 10 White?

12:45

- 11 A. That's correct, yes.
- 12 324 Q. Thomas White, caller to superintendent's office?
- 13 CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 14 325 Q. MR. KELLY: What does that mean?
- 15 A. As I stated, when you carry out a query on Pulse you
- have to put in a reason for your search. But that was
- 17 not the reason for this search. The only explanation I
- can give for that is, that sometimes the reason for
- 19 your previous search carries through to your next
- search. Say, if -- when you put in -- when I put in
- the registration number of, say, Garda Keogh's vehicle,
- it would ask me for the reason, a box would populate,
- if there was something in that screen already and I
- 24 wasn't that interested in the query, I would have just
- said okay, that's the reason for it, the search, and it 12:46
- 26 would have generated a result. If that makes sense.
- 27 326 Q. Then I see above that, the next following in time
- Noreen McBrien, 1st October, seems to have run a check,
- 29 am I reading that correctly?

- 1 A. Yes. That would be correct, yes.
- 2 327 Q. And it says "inquiries re Athlone"?
- A. Yes.
- 4 328 Q. Okay, that is all I wanted to ask.
- 5 329 Q. CHAIRMAN: Can you just help me, I'm not able to read

12 · 47

12:47

12 · 47

- the full form because of the shape it comes up here.
- 7 The column on the left, if I take the very top one,
- 8 Nicholas P Keogh, Garda, what's the one on the right,
- 9 Nicholas P Keogh, Garda? Does that mean that Garda
- 10 Keogh was checking himself.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 330 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is that what was happening?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 331 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry to be stupid about this?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 332 Q. CHAIRMAN: The person being checked on the left and on
- the right is the person who is doing the check or
- 18 requesting the check?
- 19 A. In some cases they might be two different persons. If
- the guery came in to the public office of Athlone Garda 12:47
- 21 Station to check a vehicle, the first -- from my
- recollection, the first name there would be the member
- on the street who was checking it, the second name
- 24 would be the person who checked it on Pulse.
- 25 333 Q. CHAIRMAN: I see.
- A. I'll be honest with you, I don't recall at this stage,
- it may be one or the other. So in some cases them two
- 28 may be different, in some cases they may be the same.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you very much. You want to ask

Τ			something arising out of that, Mr. Kelly.	
2	334	Q.	MR. KELLY: No, I don't want to confuse matters, but	
3			when you're talking about the two, the entry to the	
4			left, take that third one down, "Thomas White, Garda."	
5			Then the next one "Thomas White, Garda". What I read	12:48
6			there, you're not checking yourself, are you?	
7		Α.	No, that would be we're checking the vehicle, the	
8			person requesting the check was Thomas White in this	
9			case.	
10	335	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	12:48
11		Α.	And the person performing the check in this case was	
12			Thomas White.	
13			MR. KELLY: I see.	
14	336	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The person requesting the check and the	
15			person performing the check?	12:48
16		Α.	Yes, in some cases they may vary.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. That's great. Thanks	
18			very much.	
19				
20			END OF EXAMINATION	12:48
21				
22			CHAIRMAN: Nobody wants to ask any more questions?	
23			MR. MARRINAN: No more questions.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much for coming, and you're free	
25			to go now obviously.	12:48
26			THE WITNESS: Thank you.	
27				
28			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
29				

Т			MS. McGRAIH: Chairman, the next witness is Inspector	
2			Michelle Baker and subject to yourself, we can take her	
3			up at two o'clock.	
4			CHAIRMAN: If everybody is happy with that, I think	
5			that makes a lot of sense. Thanks very much.	12:49
6				
7			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED, AS	
8			FOLLOWS:	
9				
10			MS. McGRATH: Good afternoon, Chairman. The next	14:00
11			witness is Inspector Michelle Baker, please.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
13			MS. McGRATH: Chairman, her statement is at page 599 of	
14			the books at Volume 3.	
15				14:00
16			INSPECTOR MICHELLE BAKER, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	
17			DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH, AS FOLLOWS:	
18				
19			THE WITNESS: Michelle Baker.	
20	337	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Good afternoon, inspector. Inspector,	14:01
21			just by way of outline at the beginning, I think you	
22			were attested as a member of An Garda Síochána in 1998,	
23			is that right?	
24		Α.	That's correct.	
25	338	Q.	And you were promoted to the rank of sergeant in	14:01
26			2009 sorry, 2007, and you came to Athlone in that	
27			capacity, is that right?	
28		Α.	No, that'S not right. I transferred to Athlone as a	
29			garda in 2002 and T was promoted in 2007 and T left	

1			Athlone at that point. I was away for a year, returned	
2			in 2008 as sergeant.	
3	339	Q.	So I think June 2008, would that be correct, when you	
4			came back to Athlone?	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:01
6	340	Q.	Okay. You were the sergeant in charge for Athlone for	
7			a significant period, I think the period is August 2013	
8			to September 2016, is that right?	
9		Α.	That's correct.	
10	341	Q.	Okay. Then you were promoted to the rank of inspector	14:01
11			in October 2016, is that right?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	342	Q.	But I think when you were working with Garda Keogh, it	
14			was in your capacity as sergeant in charge in Athlone,	
15			isn't that right?	14:02
16		Α.	Yeah. I didn't work directly with Garda Keogh. When I	
17			was a unit sergeant I was on unit A.	
18	343	Q.	Okay, he was, as we have heard, on unit C?	
19		Α.	Yeah.	
20	344	Q.	You had no unit responsibility for Garda Keogh?	14:02
21		Α.	That's right.	
22	345	Q.	In your statement you say you had limited direct	
23			contact with Garda Keogh and I think you attribute that	
24			to your different units and your different schedules,	
25			is that right?	14:02
26		Α.	Yes. In the initial few years as unit sergeant we were	
27			on a different tour of duty, and then as sergeant in	
28			charge the role is different, it's not directly	
29			supervising individual members.	

Т	346	Q.	I think you say in your statement that he seemed to	
2			favoured nights and weekend duty, while you worked	
3			mostly days, Monday to Friday, is that right?	
4		Α.	Yeah, that's while I was sergeant in charge, yeah.	
5	347	Q.	You also outline in your statement when you talk about	14:03
6			this limited contact, you talk about really being a	
7			conduit for paperwork or signing documentation in	
8			respect of him, but it never went further than that, is	
9			that right?	
10		Α.	That would be correct, yes.	14:03
11	348	Q.	Okay. Now, can I tell you that sorry, can I ask you	
12			then just in relation to the period of 2014, I think	
13			you would have been aware that he had made a protected	
14			disclosure, is that right?	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:03
16	349	Q.	Would you have been aware or have any knowledge of the	
17			impact that was having on him, either personally or	
18			professionally, after that period?	
19		Α.	I wouldn't in the initial stages, no, I wouldn't have	
20			been aware.	14:03
21	350	Q.	Would you have known that he was on sick leave and	
22			attributing it to work related stress, for example?	
23		Α.	I would have been aware of his absence, but maybe not	
24			particularly directed to what the exact nature of it	
25			was.	14:03
26	351	Q.	Can I bring you in to 2015, and if I could ask	
27			Mr. Kavanagh to open up page 2043.	
28		Δ.	Yeah.	

29 352 Q. Now, I think this is the statement of Chief

1			Superintendent Pat Murray?	
2		Α.	Okay.	
3	353	Q.	So it's 2043. Okay. Now, if you just look at the end	
4			of that paragraph there, he is stating in his	
5			statement:	14:04
6				
7			"After meeting Garda Keogh on the 26th March."	
8				
9			Now this is 2015.	
10				14:04
11			" I spoke with Sergeant Martin, Sergeant Moylan and	
12			Sergeant Haran, the sergeant in charge, Sergeant Baker	
13			and Inspector Farrell about the supports I discussed	
14			with Garda Keogh and all agreed with that course of	
15			action."	14:05
16				
17			Can you tell us, you were party to this discussion or	
18			meeting, can you assist the Chairman, were you to have	
19			a role in those supports?	
20		Α.	I would have been advised of that in my capacity as	14:05
21			sergeant in charge. I suppose if I can explain a	
22			little bit in relation to the office and the function.	
23			There is a clerical assistant or a clerical officer	
24			attached to my office, so all the paperwork from the	
25			district offices to and from, all of the uniform	14:05
26			personnel in Athlone, which is unit A, B, C, D, E, in	
27			community policing should be channeled through my	
28			office, where the clerical office would record that.	
29			So as a result of that I would have been included in	

Τ			the briefing because if it had any impact, but as a	
2			rule it didn't have an impact on where the	
3			correspondence was still going to be channelled through	
4			his unit supervisor, which was Sergeant Moylan.	
5	354	Q.	Just so that we all understand it, your function as a	14:05
6			sergeant in charge, just generally, what is that	
7			function in the station?	
8		Α.	I suppose it's sort of like I suppose really the senior	
9			sergeant of the uniform personnel. You have a dual	
10			function, in that you are the conduit, as I have	14:06
11			described, for correspondence between all of the	
12			uniform sergeants and the district officer, the	
13			superintendent and inspectors. You also have sort of a	
14			role in relation to, you know, the building and its	
15			maintenance and security and all those kind of OPW, I	14:06
16			would call it, related matters and issues. And then	
17			another main core function of it is in relation to the	
18			PAF system, which is in relation to the accountability	
19			framework.	
20	355	Q.	Just there with the PAF?	14:06
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	356	Q.	would you have then a sort of general responsibility	
23			for work related issues or performance?	
24		Α.	Do you want me to describe my role in the PAF?	
25	357	Q.	Yes, if you would.	14:06
26		Α.	Yeah, okay. So every morning there is a meeting in the	
27			superintendent's office and the main attendees would be	
28			the superintendent, inspectors, if they're available,	
29			myself as the sergeant in charge, the detective	

1			sergeant, whatever unit sergeants are working or	
2			sergeants from, you know, external sub-district	
3			stations. They would all attend, including the	
4			district clerk and the PAF administrator. There was	
5			also maybe sometimes a person available from the	14:07
6			victims support office sat in. There was also, in	
7			Chief Superintendent Murray's time, an extended	
8			invitation was open to any garda personnel who were	
9			working in the mornings to attend, to understand the	
10			process. Also, if a sergeant was absent or the	14:07
11			detective sergeant was absent, a guard would sit in	
12			instead of those, so a detective might sit in if a	
13			detective sergeant was away. So all members kind of	
14			contributed to the meeting.	
15				14:07
16			So the role of the sergeant in charge in the morning,	
17			certain items I had to gather a lot of items to	
18			bring in to this meeting. The superintendent chaired	
19			the meeting but I was sort of like a presenter. It's	
20			not a formal presentation, it's at a conference table.	14:07
21			So for this I would have to gather numerous items. The	
22			003 report, which is something I printed off Pulse.	
23	358	Q.	Sorry, we wouldn't know what is in that type of report?	
24		Α.	Okay. So a 003 report is the incidents that have	
25			occurred in the previous 24 hours that have been	14:08
26			recorded on Pulse for Athlone district, or on a Monday	
27			morning it's incidents that were recorded for the	
28			previous 72 hours, so from 7:00am on Friday morning	
29			until 7:00am on Monday morning. So I would review all	

1			those incidents and on a Monday, that would be upwards	
2			of 120 incidents. I would have to check each one in	
3			terms of outcome, what position it was at, because when	
4			I present that to the district officer he is going to	
5			have questions as to well, where is that at now, or	14:08
6			what's the latest on that? So my function would be to	
7			gather the most update and relevant information,	
8			anticipating more questions. So that could be that I	
9			might have to talk to people in the station, check for	
10			emails, check for other reports and try and bring it to	14:08
11			the best possible, I suppose, up-to-date information	
12			available.	
13				
14			In addition to that, I would have to check intelligence	
15			record, prisoner details, resources on personnel, who	14:09
16			was available to work in the next 24 hour period. If	
17			it was a Friday morning meeting, I would look at	
18			resources for the next 72 hours to check our cover for	
19			the whole weekend. And then I would also bring matters	
20			to the attention, that go on the agenda for the	14:09
21			meeting, if there were any planned events, if there was	
22			any kind of, you know, races or anything that would	
23			maybe draw on your resources or personnel in the	
24			following 24 hours. So that would be what I would do	
25			for the morning meeting, gather all that stuff.	14:09
26	359	Q.	Can I just bring you back to something, the first	
27			document you talked about, you called it a 003 report,	
28			is that right?	

A. Yes, 003 report, incident --

- 1 360 Q. Is that printed off from the Garda system, would you see that on the heading?
- A. No, you'd have to go into reporting mechanisms within Pulse.
- 5 361 Q. Okay.

6 A. You would request the report, you pick the district you

14:09

14:10

14:10

14:10

7 want it printed for and the time period. It would

8 automatically default to the previously 24 hour or on a

9 Monday you would amend that you want to review the full

10 72 hours, as the case may be. You can check for a week 14:10

- or whatever.
- 12 362 Q. We will come to a specific incident in a moment?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 363 Q. But that 003 report, is it literally just a record of Pulse recordings?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 364 Q. Is there commentary or a narrative on it?
- 18 A. There is narrative. It's basically the date, the time,
- 19 the occurrence, the investigating member, the location
- of the occurrence, and then the narrative, what's in
- 21 the narrative screen on Pulse will --
- 22 365 Q. Is this all pulled automatically from Pulse, there is
- 23 no human interaction?
- 24 A. It interacts it. It prints everything that is recorded
- 25 in that.
- 26 366 Q. Okay. As you may be aware, inspector, we're interested
- in a particular incident, which is issue number 9 that
- the Tribunal is considering?
- 29 A. Yes.

Т	36/	Q.	It is alleged robbery from a person in Athlone in the	
2			early hours of 13th September 2015. Okay?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	368	Q.	Now, do you recall that particular incident that	
5			particular weekend?	14:11
6		Α.	I do, yes.	
7	369	Q.	Can you tell me, were you on duty that weekend or do	
8			you remember your roster around that weekend?	
9		Α.	I was working on Monday morning, I wasn't working on	
10			that weekend.	14:11
11	370	Q.	Do you remember who was on duty over the course of that	
12			weekend?	
13		Α.	From recollection, you know, from obviously being	
14			somewhat influenced by what I saw in the disclosure, I	
15			know that unit C were working on nights at some part of	14:11
16			the weekend.	
17	371	Q.	Do you know who the sergeant on duty was?	
18		Α.	Well, it would have been scheduled to be Sergeant	
19			Monaghan, but I believe he was on leave.	
20	372	Q.	Okay. Do you know if there was a station orderly or	14:11
21			the identity of that person that weekend?	
22		Α.	Do you know, I wouldn't remember that.	
23	373	Q.	Now, can I ask you, you say you weren't on duty until	
24			the Monday, now you were the sergeant in charge?	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:11
26	374	Q.	I think the chief superintendent mentioned in his	
27			evidence that you may have been aware of incidents	
28			occurring, they may have fed into e-mails on your	
29			phone, would you be aware over the weekend of what was	

1	happening?

- 2 Absolutely, yes. I would work occasional Sundays, but Α. 3 primarily I would work Monday to Friday. But with that, I would receive e-mails on my phone, I would be 4 5 cc'd on a lot of correspondence. It would be something 14:12 that -- you know, I would have it, you're obviously 6 7 keeping up-to-date, because while you're off for the 8 weekend, if you are up to speed on what's happening in the station it makes Monday morning easier. Then it 9 wouldn't be unusual that, say, if there was a missing 10 14 · 12 11 person and I received information about that, I would 12 ring in and check. Because I might be aware -- you 13 know, from Friday's meeting I would have known what 14 resources were over the weekend, there may be a lapse in supervision or something, so you might just know 15 14:12 16 that and you'd ring in and say, are you okay, do you need a hand? You might call in. But you would 17 18 definitely be keeping up to speed with your 19 information.
- 20 375 Q. Do you remember if you got an e-mail on the Sunday in relation to the incident of the robbery?
- A. No, I didn't.
- 23 376 Q. Okay.
- 24 A. No.
- 25 377 Q. We have heard evidence from some witnesses who have 26 said that this would have been an unusual incident, 27 that there were not very many robberies like this in 28 that year in Athlone?

14 · 13

29 A. Yes.

- So you just made a reference there that, you know, anything serious or unusual might be brought to your attention, but was this brought to your attention on the Sunday, do you remember?
- 5 No, it definitely wasn't. The first I came across this 14:13 Α. was when I printed out the 003 report. 6 So if you bear 7 in mind, I'm starting, it's chronological order it 8 prints out, so a serious incident, whatever way it I would have looked through Friday's and 9 works out. then Saturday's and then halfway through I would have 10 14 · 13 11 spotted this allegation of the robbery, and at that --12 information was scant enough on Pulse, in my mind. 13 I think, if I recollect, the clerical officer said, 14 here is a report, you might need that. So she would 15 say, oh, this is something that's happening, you might 14:13 16 need that. Because while I would do a 003 report, she 17 is checking the physical trail of paper that has been 18 left in the office over the weekend.
- 19 379 Q. Now, I think one of the physical pieces of paper that
 20 was left for you was the report from Garda Keogh later 14:14
 21 on that morning?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 This is where I was talking about the Sunday. 380 Q. 24 The Chairman has seen this report, it's page 229. 25 marked for the attention of the sergeant in charge, 26 which was yourself. We can see that it is stamped on 27 the 13th in the public office. So he made that --28 would you accept that he made that report that Sunday, before he went off duty? 29

2 381 Q. 229. 3 Yeah. Α. Now, as I say, it has the date stamp there of the 13th, 4 382 0. 5 so it was received by the public office on that Sunday? 14:14 6 Yes. Α. 7 383 Do you accept that? Q. 8 That wouldn't have been received by the public office, Α. that would have been the stamp that Garda Keogh would 9 10 have put on the paper when he wrote that report. 14 · 15 11 That's his date stamp, it's not received by the public 12 office. 13 384 Okay. Q. 14 Α. Just for clarity, all the guards in the station use 15 that as their stamp. 14:15 Okay. Can I also ask you there, it's making reference 16 385 Q. 17 to the robbery from a person and it has the pin, which 18 is the Pulse number, isn't that right? 19 Is the number I believe, yeah. Α. 20 386 Okay. Now, again it's been opened in some detail, I am 14:15 Ο. not going to open it fully, but it makes reference to 21 22 the robbery, the date, the injured party, details of 23 the injured party? 24 Hm-hmm. Α. 25 He notes in the printed first paragraph: 387 0. 14:15 26 "The IP was intoxicated and after pointing out the 27

Just bear with me. 229, yes?

1

28

29

Α.

scene was brought home by the Gardaí."

1				
2			He goes on to say:	
3				
4			"Garda Keogh was going on rest days and has two days	
5			annual leave booked and is not due to work until	14:15
6			19/9/2015. This was a serious incident and the IP may	
7			have injuries. Could this be forwarded to D/Branch for	
8			favour of immediate investigation."	
9				
10			Now, can I ask you, there was a lot of discussion with	14:16
11			the chief superintendent in his evidence about this	
12			particular report and whether it was intended to be a	
13			report in the formal sense. In this regard, Garda	
14			Keogh in his evidence said that he talked about, the	
15			purpose of it was to let you know that he wasn't going	14:16
16			to be there and that it should be escalated for higher	
17			attention. Do you accept his evidence in that regard?	
18		Α.	That is to tell us he wasn't going to be there, yeah,	
19			that's obvious.	
20	388	Q.	He takes issue with the fact that this was intended to	14:16
21			be the report which is outlined in a direction that the	
22			superintendent had put into place on the 18th August	
23			that year. We are going to switch between documents	
24			just for a moment. This direction is at page 2121 and	
25			I am sure you are very familiar with it.	14:16
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	389	Q.	Can I just ask you, just in relation to this direction,	
28			which has come up on the screen.	
29		Α.	Hm-hmm.	

1	390	Q.	If you look at the first paragraph, and, as I say, I'm	
2			sure you're familiar with this, is that the case,	
3			inspector?	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5	391	Q.	It says:	14:17
6				
7			"All incidents of a critical or serious nature must be	
8			the subject of a short, concise report in addition to	
9			any entry made on Pulse."	
10				14:17
11			Now, do you accept that Garda Keogh did make a Pulse	
12			entry and we saw the Pulse number there on his letter?	
13		Α.	He did, yeah.	
14	392	Q.	Okay. Now, just to talk about the actual report that	
15			is envisaged by the directive at page 2121, the second	14:18
16			paragraph, as I say, was the subject of some discussion	
17			with the superintendent. But it says:	
18				
19			"To ensure that the reporting system works swiftly, the	
20			sergeant on duty"	14:18
21				
22			Do you see where I am reading from, inspector?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	393	Q.	"At the time the incident occurs"	
25				14:18
26			So it's at the time the incident occurs, so it's	
27			envisaging an immediate type of report, is that right?	
28		Α.	Yeah. It would hypothetically had a sergeant been	
29			working a Saturday night, the responsibility would have	

т Т			raften on the sergeant on the Saturday Hight, Sunday	
2	204		morning to	
3	394	Q.	So it would have either fall on, as you say, the	
4			sergeant on duty. And it goes on to say:	
5				14:18
6			"In the sergeant's absence, the station orderly or the	
7			member in charge."	
8				
9			Do you accept that?	
10		Α.	It would, it would fall on the sergeant and in practice	14:18
11			what would that would mean is the sergeant would ensure	
12			it was sent. The sergeant themselves mightn't have all	
13			the detail really, I would say the member in charge is	
14			the investigating member, and that member is the person	
15			with the information to complete the report as per the	14:19
16			kind of guidelines that were set out on the remainder	
17			of the document.	
18	395	Q.	I think it goes on to say, and it's quite affirmative,	
19			it says:	
20				14:19
21			"Will prepare a short, concise report and e-mail it to	
22			the district office e-mail, CC it to myself, Inspector	
23			Farrell, D/Sergeant Curley and Sergeant Baker."	
24				
25			Yourself.	14:19
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	396	Q.	So would you have expected to see a report of that	
28			nature about this incident when you came in on the	
29			Monday?	

1		Α.	I would, I would have expected to see it on the Sunday	
2			morning.	
3	397	Q.	On the Sunday morning?	
4		Α.	In my e-mail and which I would have taken action, made	
5			a phone call, checked in with Detective Sergeant	14:19
6			Curley, made sure it was actioned and that the duty	
7			sergeant on Sunday morning was fully aware of it and	
8			had set in plan, you know, a course of action,	
9			interviewing the witness or identifying the scene, all	
10			those sort of preliminary steps.	14:20
11	398	Q.	But that duty sergeant, I think you said earlier in	
12			your evidence, you understood was to be Sergeant	
13			Monaghan?	
14		Α.	Sergeant Monaghan should have been on on the night, but	
15			he was on leave. So he would have finished at 7:00am	14:20
16			if he hadn't been on leave. He wasn't the early	
17			morning sergeant, he wasn't the 7:00am sergeant.	
18	399	Q.	Do you know who was to be the 7:00am sergeant that	
19			morning?	
20		Α.	I couldn't tell you.	14:20
21	400	Q.	Do you know if there was one?	
22		Α.	There may not have been. I don't recall that. There	
23			mightn't have been one. That can happen.	
24	401	Q.	Can I ask you then just generally, move away from the	
25			specific incident, but generally, if you have these	14:20
26			facts colliding, namely there's nobody there and	
27			there's nobody on duty, where does the report come	
28			from, from paragraph 2?	
29		Α.	The report come from? The investigating member.	

_	402	Q.	who produces the short, concrse report:	
2		Α.	In the absence of the sergeant it falls to the	
3			investigating member.	
4	403	Q.	Okay. Do you accept that's not outlined by the	
5			directive?	14:20
6		Α.	No, it would have sorry, where do I see it?	
7				
8			"In the sergeant's absence, the station orderly or	
9			member in charge."	
10				14:21
11			Which is the member in charge of the investigation.	
12			The station orderly member in charge of the	
13			treatment of persons in custody is a different thing.	
14			So in this instance it means the station orderly, which	
15			is the PO, this person doing the desk. And the reason	14:21
16			that would be there is because hypothetically, a	
17			hypothetical incident I should say, the investigating	
18			member could be at the scene, they could be gone to the	
19			hospital with someone, that they would often ring back	
20			and they might say, well, you're there in the station,	14:21
21			will you create this for me and send the e-mail. So I	
22			suppose it boils back on team. It's team work. The	
23			unit would pull together. No individual would	
24			investigate something so seriously, so little tasks	
25			would be delegated amongst the team.	14:21
26	404	Q.	But do you accept it doesn't say the investigating	
27			member, just in black and white, plain English?	
28		Α.	The word investigating member isn't there, but it says	
29			member in charge, which I take to be the same.	

Τ	405	Q.	Okay. Now, you arrived in on the Monday morning and	
2			there was no such report, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	There was no e-mail, no.	
4	406	Q.	There was no e-mail to you, there was no report?	
5		Α.	No, there was a report in the tray.	14:2
6	407	Q.	And are you talking about the report at page 229?	
7		Α.	Well, that's the report from Garda Keogh, the	
8			investigating member, in relation to the alleged	
9			robbery.	
LO	408	Q.	And are you rejecting Garda Keogh's evidence that this	14:2
L1			was a note effectively for you to say that he wouldn't	
L2			be here to deal with it, that's what that was about.	
L3			That's his evidence. Are you accepting or rejecting	
L4			that?	
L5		Α.	I don't know whether what how do you mean	14:2
L6			accepting or rejecting. That is a report. It's a	
L7			Garda report, notifying us (a), that this incident	
L8			occurred and (b), that he wasn't available to	
L9			investigate it.	
20	409	Q.	Now, he does have the pin number or the Pulse number on	14:2
21			that report. As you said to us earlier and it's a	
22			new document we're hearing about, this 003, but you're	
23			saying this 003 form is populated from Pulse and	
24			therefore it was populated in respect of this incident	
25			from that Pulse number 12207121, is that right?	14:2
26		Α.	Sorry, you kind of threw me there. The 003 report is	

here, I would have thought.

27

28

29

410

Q.

the incident summary report, that has been mentioned

Oh, okay. I didn't realise they were one and the same?

- 1 A. 003 is the Pulse code, I suppose, sorry, it's what I
- call it in a day-to-day fashion, but it's the incident
- 3 summary report.
- 4 CHAIRMAN: Sorry.
- 5 A. Summary of all the incidents.
- 6 411 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am lost, and I am lost for two reasons.
- 7 First of all, I can't hear you properly. Could I ask

14 - 23

14:24

14.24

- 8 you to move that a bit closer to you or to move your
- 9 chair a tiny bit closer. I don't want to make anybody
- uncomfortable but I can't hear properly.
- 11 A. Sorry.
- 12 412 Q. CHAIRMAN: The second thing is, I am not understanding,
- there's a Pulse entry, that I understand.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 413 Q. CHAIRMAN: There's a 003 document that you're referring 14:23
- 16 to.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 414 Q. CHAIRMAN: what's that?
- 19 A. That is where -- it's a report that's generated from
- 20 Pulse that shows all of the incidents created in
- respect of a district for a period of time, it can be
- 22 24 hours or 72 hours.
- 23 415 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 24 A. You select.
- 25 416 Q. CHAIRMAN: So that would be something that you would
- either prepare or supervise the preparation of?
- 27 A. No, I would have prepared it. I would extract that
- from Pulse every morning.
- 29 417 Q. CHAIRMAN: And bring it to the PAF on Monday?

1		Α.	Yes. That was one of a number of items I brought to	
2			that meeting every morning.	
3	418	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So for our purposes here, in respect of what	
4			Garda Keogh did or didn't do, he didn't have anything	
5			to do with the 003?	14:24
6		Α.	Oh God, no.	
7	419	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So that's irrelevant for this purpose?	
8		Α.	Well I was explaining, she asked about the	
9			functionality of the sergeant in charge and my role in	
10			the PAF.	14:24
11	420	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Absolutely, and I am understanding. But	
12			from the point of view of Garda Keogh's role and	
13			whether he did right or he didn't do right, he didn't	
14			have anything to do with the 003 report?	
15		Α.	No, it's an incident report.	14:24
16			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. So we have the Pulse	
17			report and now we have a document.	
18	421	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Can I ask you, you say that that 003	
19			report is the incident summary report, is that correct?	
20		Α.	I think it's the summary report. It prints off all the	14:25
21			incidents that occurred in a particular area for a	
22			particular period of time.	
23	422	Q.	Well, can I ask you to look at page 496, which appears	
24			to be the incident summary report for this particular	
25			incident?	14:25
26		Α.	Yes. There's also an incident summary report for an	
27			individual incident.	
28	423	Q.	And that is also printed off by you, is that correct,	
29			on the Monday morning?	

- 1 A. That would be part of it, yes.
- 2 424 Q. That is part of the documentation --
- 3 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, slow down, Ms. McGrath, slow down,
- 4 don't ask the next question before the first one has

14 · 25

14:26

- been answered. I work slowly and I like to take a
- 6 note. Sorry.
- 7 425 Q. MS. McGRATH: 496?
- 8 CHAIRMAN: 496.
- 9 A. As I said, the first thing I will do is print off the
- 10 003 report, which could contain 120 incidents.
- 11 426 Q. CHAIRMAN: It's a summary of a large number of
- 12 incidents?
- 13 A. A period of time.
- 14 427 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- A. From that I would, if you want to call it, drill into a 14:26
- 16 particular incident.
- 17 428 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 18 A. And produce one of those, which is on the screen there
- 19 now.
- 20 429 Q. CHAIRMAN: 496.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 430 Q. CHAIRMAN: We can call that a summary report, it's not
- important what we call it, but that's --
- 24 A. They both kind of have the same name but they're
- 25 different.
- 26 CHAIRMAN: Okay, very good. Now, Ms. McGrath, I am
- 27 sorry for being dim about this.
- 28 431 Q. MS. McGRATH: You understand my confusion?
- 29 A. Yes.

1 432 Q. It was the document at page 496. Okay. So again, just going back to the Monday morning, the preparation of your documentation, as you said yourself earlier, you see the directive, the one you opened as a team, and can I ask you, were any queries raised before the

14:26

14:27

14 - 27

- 6 meeting with anybody else, anyone who was on duty the 7 previous day, as to was there any report, further
- 8 reporting or anything for this incident?
- I don't recollect having conversations but my practice 9 Α. would be I would always go and check with the station 10 14 · 27 11 orderly or the duty sergeant, especially when there's an incident of significance, I would call it, just to 12 13 check, did you hear anything about this, do you know if 14 anyone is doing something on this. I would probably 15 have the same conversation with Detective Sergeant 14:27 16 Curley, just so that I would have an idea of where it's 17 at before I go to the meeting, if some development had 18 occurred.
- 19 433 Q. Did you make those queries that morning in respect of this incident?
- 21 A. Oh I would have, yes, definitely.
- 22 434 Q. Do you remember who you spoke to?
- A. I don't. It could have been just the PO, the guard who
 was at the counter, that would be very normal. As part
 of my preparation I check the cells, I check the
 custody records, I speak to the member in charge, as in
 the PO, and talk to them about if there is somebody in
 custody or whatever. So you do a general sort of a
 walkthrough, I call it, in the mornings, catching up

1			over the weekend to see was there anything of	
2			significance that I need to bring to the meeting.	
3	435	Q.	Can you assist the Chairman as to whether this incident	
4			arose in those conversations?	
5		Α.	I can't specifically remember talking to anybody, but I	14:28
6			imagine I would have. When I had a report like Garda	
7			Keogh's handwritten report, you know, it meant I knew	
8			something so I would have been curious to try and find	
9			more information. Because I would have known going to	
10			the meeting that I hadn't enough information.	14:28
11	436	Q.	Would you have asked, is there a report from the	
12			sergeant in charge, or was there one?	
13		Α.	I am the sergeant in charge.	
14	437	Q.	Sorry, not the sergeant in charge, the sergeant on	
15			duty?	14:28
16		Α.	I was aware that Sergeant Monaghan had been on leave.	
17	438	Q.	Okay. So you went into the meeting. Can I just ask	
18			you, what time was the PAF on Monday mornings?	
19		Α.	It's now at 10:00am but I believe it was 10:30am at the	
20			time.	14:28
21	439	Q.	Okay, and no contact was made with any other team	
22			member or Garda Keogh before the meeting by you?	
23		Α.	No, I wouldn't have he was off on leave and	
24	440	Q.	Okay. So you went to the meeting and I think we have	
25			heard evidence that you raised the issue of this	14:29
26			document, the report at page 229. I think the evidence	
27			we have heard is that you felt it was unsatisfactory?	
28		Α.	Yeah. Well, I would have raised this not as an	
29			individual item, it would have came about in the course	

1			of the list of the hundred and whatever incidents. At	
2			each one we have a brief discussion and I would have	
3			said, I have additional information, a small bit, in	
4			this report that the investigating member isn't	
5			available, he's on leave, and that we need to, you	14:29
6			know, task someone with my view on it is that it was	
7			unsatisfactory and that it wasn't e-mailed and we had	
8			lost crucial time on the Sunday to interview the	
9			injured party, find the scene, look for witnesses, you	
10			know, all that timely investigation.	14:30
11	441	Q.	So your dissatisfaction was that it wasn't e-mailed as	
12			opposed to what it was telling you or content?	
13		Α.	Point one for me was disappointment it wasn't e-mailed	
14			because we lost time and then point two, now that we	
15			are 36 hours later, 24 hours late, we still don't have	14:30
16			enough, we have more questions than answers.	
17	442	Q.	Did you express anything further? Did you express	
18			anything further in relation to Garda Keogh	
19			specifically?	
20		Α.	Oh no. This would have been the way I talk about every	14:30
21			incident if there is something missing. It's about the	
22			data quality, the information to hand, the decisions	
23			that we can make at that time.	
24	443	Q.	Well, can I ask you to look at page 2049 of the papers.	
25			It's Chief Superintendent Murray's statement. 2049,	14:30
26			and it's the third paragraph there?	
27		Α.	Okay.	
28	444	0 -	It's about the fourth line in. It's referring to	

29

yourself as bringing it to the attention of the meeting

1			and I will just quote:	
2				
3			"The report from Garda Keogh, which she felt was far	
4			from satisfactory in that it lacked any detail to	
5			assist inquiries Garda Keogh said he was unable to	14:31
6			make."	
7				
8			Now, that's a little bit different, it doesn't mention	
9			not e-mailing it, it's going to the content or	
10			substance of the report. Is that your recollection of	14:31
11			the objection you raised to the report?	
12		Α.	It's probably accurate, in that I wouldn't have been	
13			satisfied with the information but I know from my own	
14			personal opinion when I saw this handwritten report	
15			that morning and I saw the 003, I was like, why didn't	14:31
16			I get an e-mail on this yesterday morning, to make sure	
17			something was done. I suppose really at the meeting	
18			we're not we can't turn back time, we're dealing	
19			with what we have and what's the best you know, what	
20			is the next best step. So at that meeting I would be	14:32
21			asked questions and if I can ask them, great, we can	
22			advance things, and if I can't, well then we need to	
23			find the extra information, it becomes a task, which	
24			Detective Sergeant Curley took on then.	
25	445	Q.	Would you accept that in relation to details there was	14:32
26			actually a significant amount of detail on the incident	
27			before the meeting, particularly if you look at the	
28			detail of the Pulse entry, would you accept or reject	

that position?

29

- 1 A. There was some details, but there wasn't anything
- 2 extra. If you were to look at, you know the incident
- report, what's required to be sent by e-mail, the
- 4 instruction on the 18/8, you know, certain things like
- 5 exact location, where was the scene, you know, could we 14:32
- 6 organise searches. You know, very fundamental policing
- 7 kind of tasks, where items were missing.
- 8 446 Q. Just in relation to that, seeing as I think you are
- 9 squarely raising an issue there that needs to be
- addressed by looking at the Pulse record at page 225

14:33

14:33

14:34

- 11 and 226.
- 12 A. Okay.
- 13 447 Q. So if we can just open that Pulse record. It's page
- 14 225 and 226.
- 15 A. Okay.
- 16 448 Q. Now, if you look at the Pulse record and again, I don't
- 17 want to delay the Tribunal, the Chairman has seen this
- in some detail while the chief superintendent was
- 19 giving his evidence, but just the last issue you
- 20 mentioned. If you look at the scene and location, it
- could not be more precise, and on the right-hand side
- it has a longitude and latitude location, do you accept
- that, on the Pulse record?
- 24 A. Yeah, the GPS, yeah.
- 25 449 Q. Okay. So it has GPS, it has a scene address, Saint
- Mel's Terrace, do you see that?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 450 Q. It has a time, a date, a date reported, and then it has
- a reference to the sum of money of €20. Then in the

Т			narrative, you will see there's some detail there?	
2		Α.	Yeah.	
3	451	Q.	And again it's location, scene, details of the injured	
4			party, details of the possible suspects and	
5			descriptions. So would you accept that if you want to	14:34
6			tie yourself back to the directive of the 18th August,	
7			the detail is there. Would you accept that or reject	
8			that, inspector?	
9		Α.	To a certain degree, but Saint Mel's Terrace is a long	
10			road, you know, so if you were to say at which end it	14:34
11			happened. That's what I mean, you know, to say that it	
12			wasn't pointed out, it wasn't preserved.	
13	452	Q.	But the GPS there would seem to refer to precise locus?	
14		Α.	Yeah, I suppose it would, yeah.	
15	453	Q.	CHAIRMAN: where did he get the GPS?	14:35
16		Α.	It's on the right of the screen.	
17	454	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I know, where did he get it?	
18		Α.	The guard would collect it on his TETRA radio.	

Okay, very good. Thank you very much.

14:35

14:35

MS. McGRATH: Chairman, if you see just over the word

latitude, you will see DMT TETRA and that box is

- 23 Thank you very much, I am sorry. And if 456 CHAI RMAN: Q.
- 24 somebody put those in, they would give you pretty
- 25 precise --26 More or less, yes.

CHAI RMAN:

ticked?

- CHAIRMAN: If you went the other way round, in other 27 457 Q.
- 28 words?

Α.

455 Q.

19

20

21

22

29 The general area. Α.

Т	458	Q.	MS. MCGRATH: So again, I would put it to you,	
2			inspector, that at the meeting on the Monday, the stark	
3			reality of it was that this is a very detailed Pulse	
4			record and the inquiries could have been commenced on	
5			the basis of the Pulse record that you were referencing	14:3
6			earlier, is that right?	
7		Α.	To a certain they were commenced from it and it	
8			start from that, but in terms of just usually	
9			there's a bit of extra detail required for something so	
10			serious as this.	14:3
11	459	Q.	This is what you say, and we have opened the note there	
12			of the chief superintendent a moment ago, this is why	
13			you said the report was far from satisfactory?	
14		Α.	Yeah. Well, it was not satisfactory from my point of	
15			view, because it wasn't e-mailed on the Sunday.	14:3
16	460	Q.	Can I ask you, inspector, is it the case that when	
17			you're not there as sergeant in charge and matters are	
18			put in your tray, does anybody have responsibility for	
19			notifying you of the matters in your tray on a Sunday,	
20			when you're not there?	14:3
21		Α.	No, the tray post is what I would call generally	
22			it's non-urgent correspondence. Members leave	
23			applications, you know, rudimentary sort of post and	
24			correspondence. That's the sort of channel that's	
25			used, it's something that is going back into the	14:3
26			district office.	

- 27 461 Q. But who is there on your days off to ensure --
- A. Nobody. Nobody. The clerical officer works Monday to Friday, the same as myself. So she is tasked with

1	logging	every	item	in	and	out.

Q. We do know from the evidence that after the meeting
Garda A was tasked with going to meet the injured party
to take a statement from him, isn't that right, were
you aware of that?

14:37

14:37

14:38

- 6 A. Yes. Detective Sergeant Curley took over after the 7 meeting.
- 8 463 Q. Is there any reason why a garda couldn't have been tasked the previous day, given that all the details were there to do that?
- 11 Α. I wasn't there, so I can't say. It wouldn't appear 12 that anybody took it on or wasn't -- I can't speak for 13 what happened, whether Garda Keogh handed the report on 14 to the oncoming unit. There doesn't appear to have 15 been any continuity from when the report was received 14:38 16 until when I picked it up on Monday morning. 17 appears to have laid dormant.
- 18 464 Q. Can I ask you, maybe I'm misinterpreting what you are
 19 saying, but was the problem really a process failure or
 20 that processes or procedures were not in place for
 21 passing on information, as opposed to the content of
 22 Garda Keogh had actually written on the 13th?
- A. Well, primarily the process, it wasn't e-mailed.
 That's the first part, because that would have allowed
 for timely intervention. And then the report wasn't
 exactly detailed. Usually a Garda report about
 something like a serious assault or a robbery, would
 have a lot more detail in relation to efforts made.
- 29 465 Q. Now, can I ask you just to confirm, I think, if I heard

1 you correctly, you said that D/Sergeant Curley took 2 over after the meeting, is that right? 3 Α. Yes. 4 466 Now, we know that there's a letter from 0. Okav. 5 Superintendent Murray to yourself on 23rd September 14:39 6 2015 in relation to this at page 505 of the papers, if 7 you just have a look at that. 8 Okay. Α. At page 505, you see that it's addressed to yourself, 9 467 Q. sergeant in charge, do you see that? 10 14:39 11 Yes. Α. 12 Do you remember getting this particular letter? 468 Q. This would have been sent to me to pass on to 13 Yes. Α. 14 Sergeant Moylan. While it's addressed to me, that's 15 the channels of correspondence, I would have then 14:39 16 forwarded that to Sergeant Moylan. 17 469 Okay. And the content of it, referencing a scant Q. 18 report, do you see that there on the first paragraph? 19 I do, yeah. Α. And the issues highlighted, does that take you somewhat 14:40 20 470 Q. by surprise, given the detail on the Pulse entry? 21 22 No, not really. Α. 23 471 would this be something -- letters of these nature that Q. 24 you might see -- you see a lot of correspondence, you 25 are saying, would you see these types of letters 14 · 40 frequently? 26 27 Yeah, there would be -- any file that is submitted for Α. 28 direction, potentially queries are raised. I suppose 29 the investigating member knows the file very well,

Т			maybe the supervising sergeant knows it well, but	
2			sometimes an inspector or superintendent is reading it	
3			for the first time and they see a loose end that they	
4			want clarification on. So reports coming back with	
5			points for clarity would be quite common.	14:40
6	472	Q.	We see that it's passed on to Garda Keogh and he	
7			replies at page 232. And again he marks it back for	
8			your attention?	
9		Α.	As I said, that's the channel of correspondence,	
10			everything would go through my office, because the	14:41
11			clerical officer, she is based in my office. So she	
12			would record all the post coming to and from the unit.	
13	473	Q.	Have you got 232 in front of why you, inspector?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	474	Q.	This is his response. I just want you to look at the	14:41
16			very end, the last line. He says:	
17				
18			"The attached report from Superintendent Murray is	
19			nothing short of a form of harassment towards myself.	
20			Forwarded for your information, please."	14:41
21				
22			Did you read this document when you got it?	
23		Α.	I'm not	
24	475	Q.	232? Are you on page 232?	
25		Α.	Yeah.	14:41
26	476	Q.	It's there at the very end, the last sentence.	
27		Α.	Just one moment. I am not sure if I did see that. I	
28			don't think I wrote on that, going back in the way.	
29			Like, if I was on a day's absence, then one of the duty	

1			sergeants usually actually at that time Sergeant	
2			Monaghan would have sat in as sergeant in charge if I	
3			was on a course or away. So the 2nd October, I'm not	
4			sure if I was working on that date. And I am looking	
5			at the next page over, Sergeant Monaghan appears to	14:42
6			write direct to the superintendent, which makes me	
7			think he, you know, did, I suppose, a double job, he	
8			was the unit sergeant and the sergeant in charge	
9			passing it on.	
10	477	Q.	Can I ask you then in relation to your as you say,	14:42
11			you attended all the PAF meetings, pretty much?	
12		Α.	When I am working, every day.	
13	478	Q.	When you're working?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	479	Q.	So this incident moved along. We see there that there	14:43
16			was even further exchanges. Can I ask you, there was a	
17			PAF meeting then on the 23rd September in relation to	
18			this. Or this issue came up at a PAF meeting on the	
19			23rd September, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:43
21	480	Q.	We have heard evidence from the superintendent in	
22			respect of the reclassification of this issue at that	
23			meeting. Do you remember that?	
24		Α.	Yeah. I suppose for the PAF process, one of the	
25			changes that Superintendent Murray brought to we	14:43
26			always had a PAF process that was pretty strong in	
27			Athlone. Superintendent Murray brought in an	
28			additional, I suppose, measure. He applied dates on	
29			incidents. So something wouldn't be left open-ended	

1			for a long period of time. The superintendent put	
2			structure on accountability, that, you know, he might	
3			set a target date, to complete it by such a date, so	
4			that things wouldn't be left open-ended. So for	
5			critical and serious incidents like this, he would	14:44
6			often put it on for a short return, I would call it, so	
7			that it could be reviewed again in a short period of	
8			time. Something else that might be a more complex	
9			investigation, might get it over a period of time, if	
10			it was something like a missing period it would be	14:44
11			raised again the next day, you know, sort of depending	
12			on the priority required. So for this to come up again	
13			within a couple of weeks would have been very normal.	
14	481	Q.	Okay. Are you aware then that there was a decision to	
15			reclassify the incident and that's recorded on the	14:44
16			incident summary report we saw?	
17		Α.	Yes, and that would be based on various sort of tasks,	
18			investigation work carried out by the detective branch.	
19	482	Q.	Would you have had any role in relation to that?	
20		Α.	No.	14:44
21	483	Q.	would you have had a view, an opinion or a role?	
22		Α.	Well, I would have sat there collectively and listened	
23			to the new and additional evidence, the position of the	
24			injured party and all of that, and, you know, a general	
25			consensus of the group kind of, a think, a conversation	14:45
26			around like I said, the PAF process, it's very	
27			strong on the control of the data, you know, checking	
28			that incidents are of the correct classification. If	
29			something could be marked, you know, what we call	

Т			attention and complaints but we actually at that	
2			meeting might say there is something more serious to	
3			that and recategorise it up to a crime or laterally,	
4			you know, it can be reviewed. That's what the process	
5			is for.	14:45
6	484	Q.	Just finally, inspector, on that point, we know from	
7			the documentation and the evidence that we have heard	
8			that one of the primary reasons for the	
9			reclassification of the incident was a view taken of	
10			the credibility of the injured party. Did you have	14:45
11			anything to say or contribute or to do with that?	
12		Α.	I didn't meet the injured party or read his statement,	
13			so I didn't have any direct opinion on him.	
14	485	Q.	Okay. Could you answer any questions?	
15				14:45
16			END OF EXAMINATION	
17				
18			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Mr. O'Brien.	
19				
20			INSPECTOR MICHELLE BAKER WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR.	14:46
21			O' BRI EN, AS FOLLOWS:	
22				
23	486	Q.	MR. O'BRIEN: Thank you, Sergeant Baker. If we could	
24			just go back first of all to the document, it's at page	
25			2121, please, it's Superintendent Murray's directive.	14:46
26			That's dated the 18th August.	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	487	Q.	You will see just at the top, it's addressed to each	
29			sergeant	

- 1 A. Sorry.
- 2 488 Q. It's 2121?
- 3 A. Yeah, okay.
- 4 489 Q. It's addressed to each sergeant, each member Athlone
- 5 district. Can you recall, was there ever a meeting in
- 6 relation to this directive between, let's say, the unit
- 7 sergeant and the individual units or any explanatory
- 8 sort of a meeting relating to this?
- 9 A. I wouldn't -- each unit sergeant would have a briefing

14 · 46

14:47

- 10 with their unit at the change of shift and tour. So,
- 11 you know, these type of minutes would be raised. But
- 12 what's in this isn't new, you know, it was always --
- 13 you always had an expectation that anything serious or
- 14 critical should be circulated.
- 15 490 Q. So was it left then, as it were, I suppose for each
- member to interpret the directive as to what it meant?
- 17 A. Well, it would have been left for each sergeant to
- bring it to the attention of members under their
- 19 supervision.
- 20 491 Q. Okay. And when the member received the directive then, 14:47
- just to digest that information themselves and to
- 22 understand it?
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 492 Q. Okay.
- 25 A. It would be standard. There's nothing really unusual
- in it, it's pretty standard.
- 27 493 Q. Yes. So moving forward then. So the directive is in
- place a little over three weeks, nearly four weeks when
- we get to the PAF meeting on 14th September 2015, isn't

- 1 that correct?
- 2 A. Yes. This particular -- I would call Superintendent
- 3 Murray's instruction, it was actually a reminder of
- 4 something that was already in place in the
- organisation, e-mailing critical incidents, you know,

14:48

- 6 serious incidents. It was always in place. This was
- just, I suppose, putting it -- setting it out very
- 8 clearly, the standard, and the information that was
- 9 required.
- 10 494 Q. Well, let's say with the emphasis on the content of the 14:48
- second paragraph, about what the sergeants and so on
- are obliged to do under the directive once an incident
- occurs, that's in place then, as you say?
- 14 A. Yes, it's very clear, yeah.
- 15 495 Q. In advance, you have explained to us the 003 report and 14:48
- 16 vou have advised the Chairman in relation to that. So
- 17 you were in possession of the 003 report in advance of
- the PAF meeting?
- 19 A. Oh I would have, yes, of course.
- 20 496 Q. I see. Had you yourself read the Pulse entry in
- 21 advance of the PAF meeting?
- 22 A. Yes, I would have to read every Pulse entry. I
- wouldn't just read the Pulse entry of every incident, I
- 24 would check the catalogues, check for any update or any
- additional information. It would mean I would check.
- 26 you know, for everything. You'd see was there
- something in my e-mails relating to these. And then
- like that then, we found the paper, I can't say we, in
- that I don't know was it I or was it my clerk

Т			assistant, but between us it was in the office, we had	
2			it. So I would go to a lot of different sources before	
3			I go to the meeting, to try and gather the most	
4			up-to-date information.	
5	497	Q.	In relation to this particular incident, I know it's	14:49
6			some time ago, but do you remember precisely what	
7			information you had, you were armed with going into the	
8			PAF meeting, or in possession of?	
9		Α.	I don't remember it by heart, but I know from the Pulse	
10			screen, the clip that we saw a couple of moments ago,	14:49
11			it was on the narrative.	
12	498	Q.	Okay. Do you see accept what Chief Superintendent	
13			Murray said in his statement at page 2049, that it was	
14			you who brought to his attention the report from Garda	
15			Keogh?	14:50
16		Α.	Yes, because it's me who orally I orally present all	
17			this information.	
18	499	Q.	Yes, I understand, and you would have presented it on	
19			that occasion?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:50
21	500	Q.	I see. My understanding is that you are saying it	
22			lacked detail, the report of Garda Keogh?	
23		Α.	Yes, the handwritten report.	
24	501	Q.	So you had the report, but you had also had the Pulse	
25			entry?	14:50
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	502	Q.	Did you open the Pulse entry or have any discussion	
28			surrounding the Pulse entry at the PAF meeting?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 503 Q. As the presenter?
- 2 A. Both, yes.
- 3 504 Q. Okay. So if we could just -- I know we have been
- 4 through this a couple of times, but if we could just
- 5 have that Pulse entry again, please. I think it's 225

14:51

14:51

14:52

14:52

- 6 and 226. So on Garda Keogh's behalf, what I am
- 7 suggesting to you is that that Pulse entry contains
- 8 most, if not all, of the details that are required for
- 9 you to take further steps in relation to this incident.
- 10 It has the address, it has the GPS coordinates, it has
- a description of the assailants, as it were. Would you
- 12 accept that?
- 13 A. It does. I believe it's missing details about -- in
- 14 his handwritten report he said, may have injuries, he
- didn't expand on that. Then, if he did anything else
- in terms of searching or checked for CCTV or...
- 17 505 Q. Well, if we move down to 226. So again, you will
- 18 accept he visited the scene of the injured party, again
- there is a description of the assailants and that both
- 20 assailants fled towards the waste ground behind that
- address and that there was no CCTV, isn't that right?
- 22 A. Yeah. I suppose he doesn't say what steps he has taken
- to try and source where he looked for the CCTV, if
- there was any premises. Like, it's one thing to say
- there is no CCTV, but you have to say that I checked
- and maybe name the places, so you rule out what has
- been done.
- 28 506 Q. Well, sergeant, you said a minute ago that one of your
- criticisms was, you know, that there was no check for

1			CCTV. I mean it is unequivocal there that there is no	
2			CCTV, I suggest to you?	
3		Α.	It says no CCTV, but he doesn't say, like, where he	
4			looked or if he looked. It just says no CCTV, it's not	
5			exactly expansive enough.	14:52
6	507	Q.	If we move back then, please, to page 2121 again.	
7			We're just moving on then, this again is Superintendent	
8			Murray's directive. Can I just ask you to look at the	
9			second paragraph of that, please. And again,	
10			Ms. McGrath I know has asked you some questions in	14:53
11			relation to this, but just to deal with it on Garda	
12			Keogh's behalf. It says as follows:	
13				
14			"To ensure the reporting system works swiftly, the	
15			sergeant on duty at the time the incident occurs, by	14:53
16			either being reported or discovered, or in the	
17			sergeant's absence the station orderly or the member in	
18			charge will prepare a short, concise report and e-mail	
19			it to the district office."	
20				14:53
21			Do you accept that the member in charge and the	
22			sergeant in charge can be used interchangeably?	
23		Α.	No, member in charge is usually referring to a guard.	
24	508	Q.	Do you accept that it doesn't anywhere say that the	
25			garda investigating the incident would prepare a short,	14:54
26			concise report?	
27			CHAIRMAN: It doesn't, Mr. O'Brien.	
28			MR. O'BRIEN: Very good.	
29			CHAIRMAN: We have been over that a number of times.	

1			It doesn't say it.	
2	509	Q.	MR. O'BRIEN: Very good. Thank you. So I suggest it	
3			put no obligation on Garda Keogh to prepare a report,	
4			isn't that right?	
5		Α.	I would interpret that to say the member in charge of	14:54
6			the investigation, because that is the person with the	
7			information.	
8	510	Q.	Isn't it correct that a Garda Linanne was also involved	
9			in investigating this incident with Garda Keogh?	
10		Α.	I don't actually recall who was with him on the night.	14:54
11			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. O'Brien, I am not trying to cut	
12			you off, but I can tell you this, I can practically	
13			recite that now myself without looking at it but it	
14			does not say that the investigating garda or the first	
15			responder puts in a it does not say that.	14:54
16			MR. O'BRIEN: Yes.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Maybe it should say that, maybe that's the	
18			practice, but that memo does not say it.	
19			MR. O'BRIEN: It's just for completeness sake,	
20			Chairman, that I was putting it on Garda Keogh's	14:55
21			behalf.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Absolutely, that's what I am just trying to	
23			say, Mr. O'Brien, I understand the point you are	
24			making.	
25			MR. O'BRIEN: Yes.	14:55
26			CHAIRMAN: And I agree with it.	
27			MR. O'BRIEN: I will move on so.	
28	511	Q.	Insofar as Garda Keogh is concerned, Sergeant Baker,	
29			the outcome following the PAF meeting is that he then	

1 receives correspondence, I suppose, criticising the 2 manner in which he dealt with the investigation. 3 you accept that, or are you aware of that? That's at 505, is that what you are referring to? 4 Α. 5 512 Yes. Q. 14:55 6 CHAI RMAN: Yes, the 23rd September. 7 MR. O'BRIEN: Apologies, yes, at page 505. 8 Yes, it would appear the superintendent is requesting Α. an explanation. 9 And it puts him back, as it were, on Superintendent 10 513 Q. 14:55 11 Murray's radar, would you accept that? 12 I don't understand what you mean by radar. Α. 13 Well, were you aware that in advance of this PAF 514 Q. 14 meeting that there was any issue between Garda Keogh 15 and Superintendent Murray regarding other investigation 14:56 16 files? 17 No, I wasn't. Α. 18 515 You weren't aware. Q. 19 CHAI RMAN: It puts him back in trouble, in other words. 20 Sorry, it puts him in trouble. 14:56 well, the "back" word, I don't know, because I didn't 21 Α. 22 know he was in trouble. 23 CHAI RMAN: Leave back out of it, I'm sorry, you're 24 completely right, because you're not concerned with the 25 other ones. But it puts him in trouble. 14:56

well, he has to answer questions and explain.

well, he's to answer questions, yes.

MR. O' BRI EN: And you accept that?

26

27

28

29

516

Α.

Q.

Α.

CHAI RMAN:

That's what it really does, it says, look --

1	CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Brien, the letter speaks for itself in
2	a way, do you know what I mean, so I mean, it's a
3	matter of interpretation.

- 4 517 Q. MR. O'BRIEN: Very good. You criticised, I think, in
 your evidence a few moments ago the failure of Garda
 Keogh to provide an e-mail of reporting this issue to
 you.
- 8 A. The e-mail would have kick started everything on Sunday 9 morning.
- 10 518 Q. I see. Did you ever take any step to remind Garda

 11 Keogh, if you say that this is the case, to remind him
 12 of that obligation or to point out his failure in that
 13 regard? Is there any correspondence from you?
- 14 Α. That would have been the responsibility of his duty 15 sergeant, because the instruction in relation to the 14:57 16 e-mail was addressed to each sergeant or each member 17 and they would have been briefed by their unit 18 I personally didn't brief any member. Ι passed it on to ensure it is completed by other 19 20 members. 14:57
- 21 519 Q. Did you say you did pass it on to -- did you pass it on to the duty sergeant?
- A. It would have been passed on to every unit sergeant to bring to the attention of their unit.
- 25 520 Q. But following this particular incident and following
 26 the PAF meeting and the failure to provide this e-mail,
 27 did you report this failure to Garda Keogh's duty
 28 sergeant?
- 29 A. No, I didn't raise it, because the superintendent

1			raised it.	
2	521	Q.	But I think, isn't it fair to say that in fact what	
3			Superintendent Murray was concerned with was more the	
4			lack of information as opposed to the failure to	
5			provide the e-mail?	14:58
6		Α.	Yes. No, I didn't initiate any conversation. I didn't	
7			write to Garda Keogh about that.	
8	522	Q.	I don't have any further questions.	
9				
10			END OF EXAMINATION	14:58
11				
12			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much, Mr. O'Brien. Anybody	
13			else?	
14			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: I just have some questions,	
15			Chairman.	14:58
16			CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. McGuinness.	
17				
18			INSPECTOR MICHELLE BAKER WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR.	
19			DONAL McGUI NNESS, AS FOLLOWS:	
20				14:58
21	523	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: You referred to the incident as	
22			A critical and serious incident in your evidence	
23			earlier?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	524	Q.	And that's because it's a robbery?	14:58
26		Α.	A robbery, yes.	
27	525	Q.	And how often do robberies occur in the likes of	
28			Athlone district?	
29		Α.	I would estimate one every two months and that's very	

Τ			rough. There could be a couple together and none for a	
2			long period of time.	
3	526	Q.	If I might briefly refer you to page 133. This is	
4			Garda Keogh's complaint to the Tribunal, at paragraph	
5			12?	14:59
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	527	Q.	Then briefly, Garda Keogh's allegation is, against	
8			Superintendent Murray:	
9				
10			"Inflating the matter to serious, he was exaggerating	14:59
11			it into a stick to beat me with."	
12				
13			Have you anything to say about that?	
14		Α.	I couldn't really all I can say is it was a serious	
15			incident, it would be one of what we would call a	14:59
16			headline crime, it would be notable. As regards its	
17			you know, it was reviewed in the PAF process, it was	
18			just an incident. It didn't matter who was the member,	
19			if it was presented in that fashion we would still	
20			always ask the same questions.	14:59
21	528	Q.	Was your concern in relation to the absence of the	
22			e-mail the fact that it wasn't circulated quickly among	
23			members so that the matter could be looked at as	
24			promptly as possible?	
25		Α.	Yeah. Time was lost. So the e-mail was of the utmost	15:00
26			importance. That's why the superintendent had	
27			everybody cc'd on it in terms of the key people, myself	
28			and the detective sergeant, that we would be able to	
29			action it and make sure things were done in advance of	

1			the Monday meeting, because time was lost in the	
2			initial stages on this.	
3	529	Q.	If we can just have a look at page 230, please. This	
4			is the we have seen this document a few times. This	
5			is where Superintendent Murray sets out the reason why	15:00
6			he feels that the information that was received was	
7			incomplete.	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	530	Q.	Is there any aspect of that letter that you disagree	
10			with?	15:01
11		Α.	No.	
12	531	Q.	Just in relation to the issue of CCTV, the Pulse entry	
13			that we have looked at refers to no CCTV, but the Pulse	
14			entry also doesn't refer to it refers to the area	
15			where people fled to but it doesn't indicate whether	15:01
16			CCTV footage was sought in that area?	
17		Α.	No. And like, it doesn't say that the injured party	
18			travelled from location X to Y, where the incident	
19			occurred, and that, you know, any corroborative CCTV	
20			along his route and then the alleged offenders' route.	15:01
21			You know, it's not just the immediate area of the	
22			crime, it's what's you know, it's the town, it's the	
23			different routes of where the alleged offenders may	
24			have come from and gone to. So it's not just that	
25			spot, you have to do other areas.	15:01
26	532	Q.	The Pulse entry also doesn't refer to the level of	
27			violence that was used; isn't that correct?	
28		Α.	That's correct, or the injuries, if there was some.	

29 533 Q. Yes.

Т		Α.	It said in the report that they may be injuries, which	
2			would have put it into the serious category.	
3	534	Q.	If I might just briefly refer to page 504, this is the	
4			statement that was taken by Garda A on the 14th	
5			September.	15:02
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	535	Q.	If we would scroll down, please, Mr. Kavanagh. About	
8			six lines down, it references the alleged assault took	
9			place with a copper bar?	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:02
11	536	Q.	How would you describe that, is that in the serious	
12			category, if that was used as a weapon?	
13		Α.	Yes. And like, if that had been indicated in an e-mail	
14			on Sunday morning, it would have definitely push start,	
15			you know, a comprehensive and an immediate response.	15:02
16	537	Q.	Is there any reference in the Pulse to hospital?	
17		Α.	No, nothing in the Pulse incident about medical	
18			treatment or anything, if I recollect.	
19	538	Q.	Is there any reference to the type of injuries that	
20			were incurred?	15:03
21		Α.	Incurred, no, or I don't believe a weapon is mentioned	
22			in Pulse incident.	
23	539	Q.	Is that the type of information that you would expect	
24			to receive in a report furnished in accordance with	
25			your expectations that you mentioned?	15:03
26		Α.	Yeah, they would be key factors in serious or critical	
27			incidents.	
28	540	Q.	Briefly, in relation to this business of member in	
29			charge in common parlance in Garda terms. I know from	

1		a legal perspective lawyers have a particular view what
2		member in charge means?
3	Α.	Yes.

4 But that isn't the context in which you understood in 541 0. 5 this minute?

15:03

15:04

6 No, to me this minute is very clear. As you say, in Α. the legal parlance member in charge is treatment of 7 8 persons in custody, who invariably is a guard but actually also can be a sergeant. That's just one part 9 In the superintendent's minute it addresses 15:04 10 set aside. 11 to me three people, one is the sergeant or supervisor, 12 the next person is the station orderly, also known as 13 the public officer, and then the third person is the 14 member in charge, which is the member in charge of the 15 investigation. Because station orderly, public 15:04 16 officer, you know, you wouldn't say or member in charge 17 because that's the same thing. So his reference to 18 member in charge I would have taken without doubt to be 19 the investigating member in charge of the 20 investigation. 15:04

You mentioned in your evidence that although this memo 21 542 Q. 22 was articulated by Superintendent Murray when he 23 arrived on 18th August 2015, there wasn't anything 24 particularly new in looking for a full report of the incident, of a serious incident? 25

26 No, or e-mail, it was common practice. Α.

27 543 In relation to the response of Superintendent Murray, Q. 28 you have already looked at the response of Garda Keogh, 29 where he indicated it was nothing short of harassment.

Τ.			would you agree that the response from Superintendent	
2			Murray could not be classified as harassment of any	
3			kind?	
4		Α.	No, it was very common for files and correspondence to	
5			have questions and queries and seeking further	15:05
6			information, and also seeking explanations. Sergeants	
7			would do it all the time to guards, and inspectors,	
8			superintendents would also request the same off	
9			sergeants.	
10	544	Q.	In circumstances where a senior officer, such as a	15:05
11			superintendent, would enquire for further information	
12			and the response received that this is nothing short of	
13			a form of harassment toward myself	
14			CHAIRMAN: Just what page is that, Mr. McGuinness, just	
15			remind me.	15:05
16			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: sorry, my apologies, Chairman.	
17			232.	
18			CHAIRMAN: 232, thank you very much.	
19			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: The report from Garda Keogh is:	
20				15:05
21			"I returned to work on 19/9/15 having already written a	
22			report on the incident and put it on Pulse. I rang the	
23			injured party, who informed me that he made a statement	
24			to a detective to the effect that he did not want the	
25			matter pursued by gardaí. The attached report from	15:06
26			Superintendent Murray is nothing short of a form of	
27			harassment towards myself. Forwarded for your	
28			information please."	
29				

1			Is that the type of response that you would expect to	
2			receive from a garda in response to your query from a	
3			superintendent?	
4		Α.	No, I have never seen anything like that before.	
5	545	Q.	Then just looking at Superintendent Murray's response	15:06
6			to that, which is at page 234, it's evident from	
7			would you agree that it is evident from this letter	
8			that Superintendent Murray is unhappy with that	
9			response?	
10		Α.	Yes. And it would appear then he's also seeking an	15:06
11			explanation as to why his instructions of the 18th	
12			August were not complied with, which I would take to	
13			mean why it wasn't e-mailed.	
14	546	Q.	Yes. And just in relation to the last sentence of the	
15			first paragraph there, Superintendent Murray indicates	15:07
16			that if he feels he is some way removed from his	
17			statutory obligations then there may be a remedy to	
18			open to him under the policy document Working Together	
19			to Create a Positive Working Environment. And that's a	
20			reference to the bullying and harassment policy.	15:07
21		Α.	That's right.	
22	547	Q.	Just in relation to the reclassification, had you no	
23			part in the reclassification of this particular crime,	
24			isn't that correct?	
25		Α.	I personally wasn't tasked with it, no.	15:07
26	548	Q.	But the reclassification was to attention and	
27			complaints.	
28		Α.	Yes.	

29 549 Q. It's an odd phrase?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 550 Q. Could you explain that to the Chairman?
- A. Attention and complaints, I suppose it records what we would call a call to service, where somebody reports
- 5 something and, you know, I suppose no crime has been
- 6 established but it's recorded that we were there and we

15:08

15:08

- 7 had an interaction with that person. It would be
- 8 different -- it's not invalidating it, it's not saying
- 9 it didn't happen, it's just that, you know, it records
- the transaction between the Guards and that individual. 15:08
- 11 551 Q. Yes. Would you agree that that classification means
- it's not set in stone that this will not be pursued at
- 13 a later date?
- 14 A. No. Like I said, it's not invalidated, it's still
- there, it's still potentially live and could be, you
- 16 know, reactivated or changed if something new was to
- 17 come about.
- 18 552 Q. And for that reason would you agree that it's important
- 19 that the record is straight in relation to each and
- 20 every fact that can be gleaned is put on the record at
- 21 that stage?
- 22 A. Yes. It is there, it's contained, I suppose it's date
- stamped, for want of a better word, the decisions are
- 24 made, they're there, they're recorded in the narrative.
- The Pulse system has dramatically changed in the last
- couple of years since this time, in that investigation
- 27 actions are recorded. But at that time we just had the
- 28 Pulse narrative. So something being attention and
- complaints means it was still there for consideration.

1 2	553	Q.	Thank you.	
3			END OF EXAMINATION	
4			CHAIDMAN No so had allege ver we old a	
5			CHAIRMAN: Now, anybody else? Yes, Ms. O'Rourke.	15:09
6			MS. O'ROURKE: Chairperson I just have one short	
7			question by way of clarification.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Sure. Absolutely.	
9 10			INSPECTOR MICHELLE BAKER WAS EXAMINED BY MS. O'ROURKE,	15:09
11			AS FOLLOWS:	15.09
12			AS TOLLOWS.	
13	554	Q.	MS. O'ROURKE: I wonder if document 232 could be put on	
14			screen, please. I think that's dated 2nd October 2015?	
15		Α.	Yes.	15:09
16	555	Q.	I know Ms. McGrath asked you some questions as to	
17			whether you had seen that before and I think you	
18			weren't sure that you had?	
19		Α.	No, I don't believe I did.	
20	556	Q.	I just wonder could your witness statement at page 600	15:09
21			be put on the screen. Again, it may be that this might	
22			clarify matters, or it may not. Page 600. If you go	
23			down, sorry, to the top of the next page, you have you	
24			work and your tours of duty. There is an indication	
25			that you were on maternity leave? I think if we go to	15:10
26			the next page, I am sorry.	
27		Α.	I wasn't on maternity at that time, October was an	
28			approximate, but I wasn't at the beginning of the	
29			month. I may have been at this time I believe there	

1			was a transition period between myself and Sergeant	
2			Monaghan. I was going on maternity leave and Sergeant	
3			Monaghan was taken in, so that's probably why he	
4			addressed that matter at that time. I was still	
5			working though.	15:10
6	557	Q.	Thank you.	
7			CHAIRMAN: So sorry.	
8			MS. O'ROURKE: I just didn't know, it may be I just	
9			wanted the dates of whether or not she was on	
10			CHAIRMAN: In relation to this letter of October, you	15:10
11			think you may not have been there at the time.	
12		Α.	Well, I may or may not have been there on that	
13			particular day. I wasn't on leave, but Sergeant	
14			Monaghan, we were having what we call a transition	
15			period.	15:10
16			CHAIRMAN: That's fine.	
17			MS. O'ROURKE: Thank you.	
18				
19			END OF EXAMINATION	
20				15:10
21			CHAIRMAN: Anybody else? Very good. Thanks very much.	
22				
23			INSPECTOR MICHELLE BAKER WAS QUESTIONED BY THE	
24			CHAIRMAN, AS FOLLOWS:	
25				15:10
26	558	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Can I just clarify a couple of points with	
27			you?	
28		Α.	Sure, no problem.	
29	559	Ο.	CHAIRMAN: So a guard is on duty and comes across an	

- incident or it's reported, in this case we have a
- 2 robbery?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 560 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. So the information we have, I am sure

15:11

15:11

- I will be corrected if I get a materially wrong, the
- 6 officers, Garda Keogh and his colleague, attend to the
- 7 injured party who has reported the matter and they do
- 8 certain things, okay.
- 9 A. Mm-hmm.
- 10 561 Q. CHAIRMAN: We know ultimately they see him home?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 562 Q. CHAIRMAN: And give him into the care of his mother?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 563 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's what we know eventually at the very
- 15 end?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 564 Q. CHAIRMAN: Maybe we should have known it earlier but
- that's what we know at the end. Okay. So he puts the
- information on Pulse and as I understand, you are
- somewhat critical of the level of detail of the
- 21 information that's on Pulse?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 565 Q. CHAIRMAN: So that's one point where there's an issue.
- And he maintains that what he put on Pulse was a
- 25 sufficient description. Now, I take it, what he put on 15:12
- 26 Pulse could be added to subsequently if necessary, is
- 27 that correct?
- 28 A. Oh it would be, yes.
- 29 566 Q. So it's not a once for all, I am absolutely stuck, I

Т			know about changing Puise and So on, but to add	
2			information to it is a different story?	
3		Α.	Yes. No, additional information to the Pulse is to	
4			give us a good head start.	
5	567	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I follow.	15:12
6		Α.	Picking up.	
7	568	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The first point is, I should put enough	
8			information to enable the force, i.e. my colleagues, to	
9			be able to get as much information as possible, within	
10			reason?	15:12
11		Α.	And the additional I suppose at the end of the day	
12			the Guards use a lot of files and paper.	
13	569	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sure.	
14		Α.	So the additional report that was to be circulated by	
15			e-mail would be what's in the report.	15:12
16	570	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, we will get to the e-mail in a second?	
17		Α.	Sorry.	
18	571	Q.	CHAIRMAN: we're still on Pulse?	
19		Α.	Pulse is fine.	
20	572	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Put a certain amount on Pulse, and he did	15:13
21			put a certain amount of Pulse and there's a degree of	
22			disagreement, that what you say what he put on Pulse	
23			was less than satisfactory, less than adequate, it left	
24			gaps.	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:13
26	573	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's what you say. So you were critical	
27			of that part of it. The next thing he had to do was he	
28			had to make a report?	

A. Mm-hmm.

- 1 574 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, the memo from Superintendent Murray,
- 2 2121, we don't have to argue that. We can interpret
- 3 that as to what it says or what it requires. But if I
- 4 am understanding, in this case, whether he was obliged
- 5 to do it or wasn't obliged to do it, Garda Keogh put in 15:13
- 6 a report, and that report comes up for consideration at
- 7 the PAF meeting on the Monday?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 575 Q. CHAIRMAN: And that's considered to be unsatisfactory?
- 10 A. Yes. I described it, you still had more questions than 15:14

- answers.
- 12 576 Q. CHAIRMAN: It leaves more questions. Now, this was a
- 13 Sunday morning at 4:00am when this happened?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 577 Q. CHAIRMAN: You say he should have also sent in an
- 16 e-mail?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 578 Q. CHAIRMAN: With the same information as was on the
- 19 Pulse, is that right?
- 20 A. The e-mail should be -- I would say the handwritten
- 21 report should have been e-mailed.
- 22 579 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now there should have been more on
- the handwritten report?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 580 Q. CHAIRMAN: So it should be sufficient to enable him --
- we will just explore that a tiny bit in a moment?
- 27 A. Okay.
- 28 581 Q. CHAIRMAN: He should have put in an e-mail, and the
- 29 purpose of putting in the e-mail was that that would

- come to you even though you were off duty at the time?
- 2 A. Yes, I was one of a number of recipients, yeah.
- 3 582 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Does that mean that the response to
- 4 this would depend on whether you were available to
- 5 receive the e-mail at the time? I mean, you might have 15:15
- 6 been out, you might have been, you know, asleep or
- 7 whatever it is?
- 8 A. Well reasonably, there was five recipients.
- 9 583 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 10 A. So chances are, one, if not all five, would respond or

15:15

- 11 question --
- 12 584 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. And the five recipients would or
- might all be off duty?
- 14 A. Em, I suppose it's the nature of Garda work, you know,
- someone is going --
- 16 585 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm not being critical. I am exploring.
- 17 A. I know, yeah.
- 18 586 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am a little surprised that in the absence
- of the sergeant in charge there isn't a deputy sergeant
- in charge, so that there is somebody on duty available
- 21 to do a specific job. So if you are not there, maybe
- it's my job to be on duty in the station to receive the
- e-mail?
- 24 A. I suppose if there had been a duty sergeant working
- 25 that night, you know, things would have progressed.
- 26 587 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 27 A. So generally there would be a sergeant in the station.
- It's the nature -- like the superintendent could have
- been on call either.

Okay. So it's usual that there would be. 1 588 Q. CHAI RMAN: 2 It would be unusual for all of the recipients, there 3 may be up to five, and so it would be highly likely that one or more of them would respond? 4 5 Absolutely. Α. 15:16 6 589 CHAI RMAN: Possibly to each other and decide and Q. 7 consult. okay. So that's the advantage of an early 8 e-mail? 9 Yeah. Α. 10 590 CHAI RMAN: Okay. And you say that was communicated to Q. 15:16 11 the various sergeants in charge of the squads or divisions, is that right? 12 The e-mail from the incident? 13 Α. 14 591 0. CHAI RMAN: The need for an e-mail, that was well 15 understood? 15:16 16 well understood. Α. 17 592 CHAI RMAN: Okay. All right. Now let's look for a Q. 18 moment at the report that Garda Keogh put in, the 19 actual written report. Whether he had to do it or not 20 we're not concerned. Could we look at 232 for a 15:17 Just stop in the middle there for a second. 21 22 Thanks, Peter. Obviously Garda Keogh resents the 23 criticism, express or implied, in Superintendent 24 Murray's letter. He is very unhappy about it, and he 25 responds here. But as well as complaining that he 15:17 thinks that's harassment, as well as that he actually 26 27 gives a good deal more detail about the incident.

I see that, yeah.

CHAI RMAN:

28

29

593

Α.

Q.

If he had given that detail in the report,

1			would you have been happy with it? In other words,	
2			checking him out, bringing him round, no CCTV, bringing	
3			him round to his mother and so on, blah-blah-blah,	
4			would that have gone some way to	
5		Α.	Yes. And when preparing for this, I was on leave but	15:18
6			there's even more information came in later, you know.	
7			I suppose the quality of the investigating member	
8			writing a detailed report with all the detail that they	
9			have gathered at that time.	
10	594	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I follow. Now can I ask you this: This is	15:18
11			on night duty, four o'clock in the morning?	
12		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
13	595	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Presumably he would be going off duty at	
14			what, six o'clock in the morning?	
15		Α.	Seven.	15:18
16	596	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Seven o'clock in the morning. And maybe	
17			there's other things happening as well?	
18		Α.	Possibly.	
19	597	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean between the incident here. Would you	
20			expect a sort of I understand your point about full	15:18
21			information and I would expect that for somebody	
22			sitting down eventually and writing out a fairly full	
23			report. I am a little concerned that it seems a bit	
24			hard to expect him to put in a full report, do you	
25			understand me, given that he might be busy. I don't	15:19
26			know whether he was very busy or not. If he had	
27			nothing else to do, well and good. But do you	
28			understand my point?	
29		Α.	I understand.	

Т	598	Q.	CHAIRMAN: What would you say to that?	
2		Α.	I understand your point, and if that member was	
3			returning to duty the next evening, I would say, well,	
4			you know, not too much has lapsed and we can get other	
5			information. But he had, to my knowledge, a lot of	15:1
6			information that he took away with him for a period of	
7			days.	
8	599	Q.	CHAIRMAN: He's not back until the 19th?	
9		Α.	He's not back.	
10	600	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I am a bit worried about the numbers, he	15:1
11			thought he was off for two days and he had two days	
12			leave, which only makes four days?	
13		Α.	No, we rest for four.	
14	601	Q.	CHAIRMAN: He was resting for four, okay, that explains	
15			the six days. So you say whether he was off duty or on	15:1
16			duty he should have made the report, even if he was off	
17			duty?	
18		Α.	I suppose the detail, the rule of thumb is, you know,	
19			you put everything in the report to the person who has	
20			never knows nothing about it, should know as much as	15:2
21			possible. So he had some information, whether he	
22			unintentionally left out or forgot to, and it was	
23			important.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thanks very much.	
25				15:2
26			END OF QUESTIONING	
27				
28			CHAIRMAN: Now, I am sorry for asking so many questions	
29			and does anybody want to ask anything arising out of	

1			what I have been exploring.	
2				
3			INSPECTOR MICHELLE BAKER WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MS.	
4			McGRATH, AS FOLLOWS:	
5				15:20
6	602	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Can I just clarify there, inspector, in	
7			relation to the direction and the e-mail issue, I think	
8			the direction says that the e-mail must go to the	
9			district office, is that right?	
10		Α.	The district office, the superintendent where is it	15:20
11			now, sorry?	
12	603	Q.	It's at page 2121. It might come up on the screen	
13			there?	
14		Α.	Sorry.	
15	604	Q.	So it's to go to the district office e-mail.	15:20
16		Α.	Yeah, it goes to the district office and cc'd to	
17			Superintendent Murray's personal e-mail, Inspector	
18			Farrell, I imagine that's meant to say Inspector	
19			Minnock, Detective Sergeant Curley. So five individual	
20			people would have got that personally on their phones	15:20
21			and then it would have been in the district office box,	
22			e-mail box.	
23	605	Q.	Okay. This is the short report, which is timely	
24			report?	
25		Α.	Timely as in immediate. Timely in my mind there means	15:21
26			as soon as possible that they can write this, before	
27			they can finish their tour of duty.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
29	606	Q.	MS. McGRATH: One of the matters, just to finish up	

1			with your statement, I didn't give you an opportunity	
2			earlier to address paragraph 7 of your statement and	
3			you may wish to do so before the Tribunal. It's page	
4			603. So page 603. If you scroll down there,	
5			Mr. Kavanagh. I think you address generally your	15:21
6			position in relation to Garda Keogh and as your	
7			position as sergeant in charge you say you had limited	
8			interaction with him and treated all members under your	
9			supervision equally; is that right?	
10		Α.	That's correct, yes.	15:22
11	607	Q.	You say you did not receive any request or direction	
12			from any other member to treat Garda Keogh in any way	
13			other than the norm, and you say you had no knowledge	
14			of any alleged mistreatment of Garda Keogh; isn't that	
15			right?	15:22
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	608	Q.	And I think you do record that you had gone on	
18			maternity leave shortly after this incident seems to	
19			have occurred, until May 2016 and at that stage I think	
20			Garda Keogh was on long-term sick leave?	15:22
21		Α.	Yes, when I was on maternity leave I think he went on	
22			sick, yeah.	
23				
24			END OF EXAMINATION	
25				15:22
26			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Thank you very much,	
27			inspector.	
28				
29			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	

1				
2			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, the next witness is	
3			Superintendent Minnock, who is being recalled to	
4			continue his evidence.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much, superintendent, you are	15:23
6			already sworn.	
7				
8			INSPECTOR ALDAN MINNOCK, HAVING BEEN PREVIOUSLY SWORN,	
9			WAS DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS, AS FOLLOWS:	
10				15:23
11	609	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Inspector Minnock, you have already	
12			given evidence on Day 122?	
13		Α.	Correct.	
14	610	Q.	Which was the 29th November 2019. Your principal	
15			statement to the Tribunal is to be found in Volume 4,	15:23
16			starting at page 679. You did make an earlier	
17			statement relating to your disclosure of material and	
18			the searches that you had made in relation to such	
19			material.	
20		Α.	That's correct.	15:24
21	611	Q.	On the occasion that you gave evidence on you were	
22			dealing in the first instance with issues 1 to 4.	
23			Could I just ask you one or two more questions in	
24			relation to issue number 4, arising out of some	
25			evidence yesterday. Were you here yesterday for the	15:24
26			evidence of Garda Higgins and Inspector Curley?	
27		Α.	I was here for most of it.	
28	612	Q.	Yes. One fact emerging from Garda Higgins' evidence is	
29			that he said that he did not in fact ask Mr. McHugh to	

1			make a statement, nor did the issue of therefore a	
2			refusal of Mr. McHugh to make a statement arise or the	
3			deferral of it, you understand that?	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5	613	Q.	He, in fact, in evidence to the Chairman, stated that	15:25
6			he obtained a phone number for Mr. McHugh and gave that	
7			phone number to Sergeant Curley, as he then was. You	
8			understand that?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	614	Q.	I just want to ask you briefly about your interaction	15:25
11			with Sergeant Curley in and around that period of the	
12			8th and 9th July 2014. You understand that?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	615	Q.	Now, your account in your statement, if we could look	
15			at page 687, at the bottom half of page 687 in Volume	15:25
16			4.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	616	Q.	In the middle of that paragraph there, where it says:	
19				
20			"Detective Sergeant Curley and I discussed the report	15:26
21			submitted by Garda Aidan Lyons."	
22				
23			Can you recall when that discussion took place?	
24		Α.	It was on the day I submitted a report to	
25			Superintendent McBrien.	15:26
26	617	Q.	Superintendent McBrien?	
27		Α.	Yes, the same day.	
28	618	Q.	We know that's dated the 8th July?	
20		۸	That's connect	

- 1 619 Q. There has been a suggestion in evidence that you may
- 2 have been either on leave or off at a course?
- 3 A. That's correct.
- 4 620 Q. Sometime immediately prior to that?
- 5 A. That's correct, I had been absent for, yeah, the prior
- 6 period.
- 7 621 Q. Was that your first day back then and were you being
- 8 briefed on a number of matters by Detective Sergeant
- 9 Curley?
- 10 A. I had returned, I think, a day or so previous but the

15:27

15:27

- 11 murder investigation was very much underway at the
- 12 time. It was a sickly complex investigation, where the
- culprits had absconded and actually had to be
- 14 extradited from the UK eventually. But it was quite
- 15 complex. So there was daily briefings in respect of
- 16 that ongoing investigation.
- 17 622 Q. Yes.
- 18 CHAIRMAN: Can you just recall the date of the murder,
- by any chance.
- 20 A. Not off the top of my head.
- 21 CHAIRMAN: It's not important, no, that's all right, it
- doesn't matter. We will find it elsewhere.
- 23 A. Yeah. It was in the --
- 24 623 Q. CHAIRMAN: I thought it was June.
- 25 A. It was June.
- 26 624 Q. CHAIRMAN: June of '14?
- 27 A. It was June and it was approximately the second or
- third week.
- 29 625 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you very much.

1		Α.	During when I abroad actually, as it happens, I was in	
2			the States.	
3	626	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: You say there:	
4				
5			"Detective Sergeant Curley outlined that he was asked	15:27
6			to take a statement from Liam McHugh but due to the	
7			fact he knew Liam McHugh, he felt he was not the	
8			appropriate person to take the statement."	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	627	Q.	Is that correct?	15:28
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	628	Q.	Was there any mention by him of having deputed Garda	
13			Higgins to take that statement?	
14		Α.	No.	
15	629	Q.	On that occasion?	15:28
16		Α.	No.	
17	630	Q.	Was there any discussion with you about in lieu of	
18			taking a statement, simply getting Mr. McHugh's phone	
19			number?	
20		Α.	No.	15:28
21	631	Q.	You say you agreed with D/Sergeant Curley.	
22				
23			"I asked that he would return the file to me and I	
24			would write on the file to Superintendent McBrien."	
25				15:28
26			I think you did that on the 8th?	
27		Α.	I did, indeed.	
28	632	Q.	Perhaps we will just look at that very briefly. That's	
29			at page 808 of the papers. That's addressed to the	

Т			superintendent in Athlone:	
2				
3			"Liam McHugh. With reference to the above, I believe	
4			the association of Garda members both with Liam McHugh	
5			and the members involved in the investigation, Garda	15:29
6			Lyons and Garda A and Garda Keogh, make it	
7			inappropriate for Gardaí from Athlone to interview Liam	
8			McHugh when colleagues under investigation.	
9				
10			I understand Detective Inspector Coppinger is the	15:29
11			external appointed officer to investigate this matter	
12			and I feel he or his investigation team are the most	
13			appropriate persons to interview Mr. McHugh.	
14				
15			I will obtain a mobile number from Liam McHugh, which	15:29
16			will assist the investigating team to arrange a meeting	
17			with Mr. McHugh."	
18				
19			Now, and this isn't a criticism, in the first paragraph	
20			you don't refer to your discussion with Detective	15:29
21			Sergeant Curley, in which he expressed his reservations	
22			in a sense about being asked to take a statement, isn't	
23			that right?	
24		Α.	That's right.	
25	633	Q.	You agreed with those reservations?	15:30
26		Α.	I did.	
27	634	Q.	And you're expressing them here also then?	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	635	Ο	It would seem coupled with the absence of any	

1 reference to Garda Higgins, that you didn't depute 2 Garda Higgins to take a statement, did you? I didn't? 3 Α. 636 Depute Garda Higgins to approach Mr. McHugh to take a 4 0. 5 statement? 15:30 I had no interaction with Garda Higgins in 6 Α. 7 relation to the matter. 8 637 The mention of a mobile phone number --0. 9 Yes. Α. -- would appear, therefore, on your understanding of 10 638 Q. 15:30 11 matters, to be perhaps an alternative to the taking of 12 a statement by Sergeant Curley or any other member from 13 Athlone? 14 Α. Well, my position on the matter was that firstly, I 15 didn't feel it appropriate for members from Athlone to 15:31 16 take the statement. 17 639 Yes. Q. 18 And I suppose given that the investigation was underway Α. 19 in relation to certain matters in Galway, of which those matters I was unaware of, this could have been 20 15:31 21 incorporated into that. I was unaware of that. 22 did relate to the same guard and I felt they were the 23 most appropriate persons to take this on. And it could 24 have been actually a matter they were already 25 advancing, but I wasn't aware of that. 15:31 26 640 Yes. Q. 27 And given the difficulties I envisaged, for them to Α.

contact Mr. Liam McHugh.

28

29

641

0.

Yes.

- A. Difficulties that I could easily overcome, I felt it was most appropriate to indicate that if they were going to have difficulty in contacting him, I had the
- 4 solution, in that Detective Sergeant Curley could
- easily obtain a mobile phone number and I knew that

15:32

- because he had an acquaintance or a knowledge ofMr. Liam McHugh.
- 8 642 Q. Yes. You see, I am just looking at the process as it 9 was intended. The superintendent had obviously 10 previously directed that a statement be obtained?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 643 Q. That process was perhaps put on hold in a sense by
 13 Sergeant Curley coming to you with his reservation and
 14 you agreeing with it?
- A. Well, I didn't fully indicate to the detective sergeant 15:32 other than indicating that I agreed with him.
- 17 644 Q. Yes.
- A. But I didn't undermine the superintendent by saying I objected to him taking the statement.
- 20 645 Q. Yes.
- A. I left D/Sergeant Curley under the impression he was to continue his inquiries, because I wasn't going to undermine the superintendent.
- 24 646 Q. Yes.
- A. However, I gave my reservations in respect of the matter to the superintendent immediately and by putting it on paper I was documenting my reservations.
- 28 647 Q. Yes. I mean, I am not suggesting that there is 29 anything improper in what you have done, in this sense,

1 you agreed with Sergeant Curley but it would seem 2 inconsistently if you then, either tacitly or 3 otherwise, allowed him to think he should still seek a statement, would you not agree with that? 4 5 I disagree. Α. 15:33 6 648 You disagree? Q. 7 Because I was an inspector. Α. 8 649 0. Yes. 9 He was a D/Sergeant. Α. 10 650 Q. Yes. 15:33 11 The superintendent had made a direction. Α. 12 651 Yes. 0. 13 Who was my boss. Α. 14 652 0. Yes. 15 I couldn't undermine that decision. Α. 15:33 16 653 Yes. Ο. 17 It was her decision, her direction, and it would be Α. 18 followed. I merely expressed my opinion in relation to 19 her direction for her to consider. 20 654 Yes. 0. 15:33 21 In light of information that I had or knew. Α. 22 655 Yes. Q. 23 And I gave her that to allow her to reconsider her Α. 24 decision on the matter, which in fact I now know she did. 25 15:33 It's just I understood from one of your answers a 26 656 Q. 27 couple of moments ago that you did mention the issue of 28 a telephone number, you were confident that you would 29 be able to get a telephone number for Mr. McHugh?

1	Α.	Yes.
	~ :	103.

- 2 657 Q. Had that been raised by Detective Sergeant Curley with 3 you or did you consider that possibility in 4 conversation with him?
- 5 No, it wasn't a matter that came up in a Α. 15:34 6 conversation with D/Sergeant Curley. But the Galway 7 investigation team wouldn't have been aware of Liam 8 McHugh and basically who he was, where he frequented, whereas I was. I knew the lifestyle he led. I knew he 9 could be somewhat difficult to contact on occasions. 10 15:34 11 but he was still available and amenable. And certainly 12 I knew I could get a phone number from him and would 13 allow Galway to progress the matter. If they were 14 going looking for Liam McHugh at his home address, I 15 believe they were going to have difficulties. 15:34
- 16 658 Q. Okay.
- 17 659 Q. CHAIRMAN: Could I just stop for one second. My
 18 understanding, correct me if I am wrong, was that
 19 Detective Sergeant Curley expressed a personal
 20 difficulty, because he came from the same townland or 15:35
- 21 parish or whatever it was.
- 22 A. That's correct.
- 23 660 Q. CHAIRMAN: He knew him. He a personal difficulty and he mentioned that to you?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 661 Q. CHAIRMAN: You had a bigger issue, you thought
 27 actually, I have a bigger objection, not just the
 28 personal individual one, which you respected, but that
 29 wasn't the case, you said, no, I have a bigger

Т			objection, and you proposed to write to the	
2			superintendent about that. Is that more or less the	
3			situation?	
4		Α.	That's it.	
5	662	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's what I understood. Sorry	15:35
6			Mr. McGuinness. I just thought that's where I stand at	
7			the moment on my understanding of the attitude of	
8			Detective Sergeant Curley, as he was, and of your	
9			position.	
10		Α.	That's exactly it.	15:35
11			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.	
12	663	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: As matters stood then as of the 8th,	
13			you expressly did not countermand the superintendent's	
14			instruction to get a statement?	
15		Α.	Exactly.	15:36
16	664	Q.	And nor did you suggest to Detective Sergeant Curley	
17			that he should deputise it to Garda Higgins?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	665	Q.	Nor did you ask either Garda Higgins or Sergeant Curley	
20			just to get a phone number?	15:36
21		Α.	No.	
22	666	Q.	The issue of the phone number was your own thought	
23			process, not discussed with either of those two; is	
24			that right?	
25		Α.	Exactly, that's correct. And just if I can clarify one	15:36
26			matter on that, that was raised also.	
27	667	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	There was mention in relation to the file in relation	

to that matter.

29

- 1 668 Q. Yes.
 2 A. When the detective sergeant approached me on the
 3 matter, I had no paperwork, no e-mail.
- 4 669 Q. Yes.
- 5 A. No file.
 - 6 670 Q. Yes.
 - 7 A. And I requested a copy of the file.
 - 8 671 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. And what I got, and I think I was clear on two
 10 occasions in my previous evidence, was the report or
 11 e-mail from Sergeant Lyons, and I have expressly said
 12 that in my evidence previously.

15:37

- 13 672 Q. Yes, you did. And in your statement you said you asked 14 for the return of the file?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 673 Q. And then you later said that you were quite happy that 17 the file had been sent to Galway?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 674 Q. Isn't that right? But Detective Sergeant Curley, he 20 also wrote to Superintendent McBrien the following day. 15:37
- 21 A. Yes.

25

- 22 675 Q. On the 9th of July. Perhaps we will look at that, page 23 527. Again, that's addressed to the superintendent.
- In the first paragraph he says:

"I note receipt of attached correspondence. Prior to same being forwarded to me, I requested that I may not be the most suitable person to pursue same as I

29 personally known to Liam McHugh."

2			Now, could I just stop you there. You had known, or	
3			did you, when you came back that the superintendent had	
4			given a direction on the 9th June and a reminder had	
5			issued on the 23rd June?	15:3
6		Α.	Well, I wasn't privy to those at the time. That's the	
7			period I was away.	
8	676	Q.	Okay.	
9		Α.	I returned, I think from abroad, I think on the 4th	
10			July.	15:3
11	677	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	But I was aware of them from conversation with the	
13			D/Sergeant that he had been tasked with it from the	
14			superintendent.	
15	678	Q.	Yes. And if he had been tasked with it, it hadn't, as	15:3
16			of the 9th or the 8th, when you met him, hadn't been	
17			possible to give effect to it or it wasn't given effect	
18			to, for whatever reason?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	679	Q.	Anyway, you agreed with the sentiments in the first	15:3
21			paragraph there?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	680	Q.	The second paragraph then says:	
24				
25			"I have requested personnel within the detective office	15:3
26			to complete this task. I tasked Garda Higgins with	
27			this role."	
28				
29			Now, there had been no discussion with you the previous	

1			day of such task?	
2		Α.	No.	
3	681	Q.	Okay. Would that be, just from your own point of view,	
4			inconsistent with your own judgment as to who should	
5			take the statement?	15:39
6		Α.	Yeah.	
7	682	Q.	It says:	
8				
9			"Garda Tom Higgins met with Liam McHugh and invited him	
10			to make a statement in relation to this incident. Liam	15:39
11			McHugh refused to consent to provide a witness	
12			statement at that time but undertook to think about it	
13			and maybe make himself available to provide such a	
14			statement in the future."	
15				15:39
16			Now, that was information presumably not known to you	
17			as of the time of your either meeting with Detective	
18			Sergeant Curley or at the writing of your memo to the	
19			superintendent?	
20		Α.	That's correct.	15:39
21	683	Q.	So if that had happened, it would appear to have	
22			perhaps happened in the interim, is that your	
23			understanding?	
24		Α.	Yes, certainly.	
25	684	Q.	Had Sergeant Curley reported that to you yourself as of	15:39
26			the 9th?	
27			CHAIRMAN: As of the 9th?	
28			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Or as of the 8th?	

1			MR. McGUINNESS: well, no, this is dated 9th. He is	
2			now writing, Sergeant Curley is writing to the	
3			superintendent.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Correct.	
5			MR. McGUINNESS: If we just look at the top there.	15:40
6			CHAIRMAN: The conversation is in the 8th with	
7			Inspector Minnock. I will call you from your rank at	
8			the time. Okay.	
9	685	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Was this reported to you by Sergeant	
10			Curley on the 9th that this had occurred?	15:40
11		Α.	No.	
12	686	Q.	Or on any subsequent date?	
13		Α.	I have no doubt there was some conversation at some	
14			later date to say that Mr. McHugh was unwilling to make	
15			a statement and that matter had been reported to the	15:40
16			superintendent, but I knew that my report had also gone	
17			in at the same time, but I suppose it was I felt at	
18			that time it was probably a little bit irrelevant, in	
19			that he wasn't or hadn't made a statement to local	
20			Gardaí.	15:40
21	687	Q.	Yes. Obviously from the point of view of the Chairman,	
22			if Garda Higgins' evidence is correct, Mr. McHugh was	
23			never asked to make a statement, isn't that right?	
24		Α.	Yes, that is Garda Higgins' position.	
25	688	Q.	And never contacted by any other member that you know?	15:41
26		Α.	No.	
27	689	Q.	The third paragraph is:	
28				
29			"Garda Higgins reported the situation to me following	

1			his meeting with Liam McHugh."	
2				
3			Then it continues on, if we scroll down the page	
4			slightly:	
5				15:41
6			"Due to the fact that the matter under inquiry relates	
7			to members within Athlone Garda Station, I feel it may	
8			be prudent for a member other than Athlone crime/drug	
9			office staff to pursue Liam McHugh further for a	
10			statement on the matter."	15:41
11				
12			That is then signed at the bottom by D/Sergeant Curley.	
13			Or sorry:	
14				
15			"Consequently, I recommend that some other members of	15:41
16			sergeant or inspector rank be appointed to complete	
17			this task."	
18				
19			Now, there is no mention of obviously the obtaining,	
20			the seeking or obtaining of Mr. McHugh's phone number	15:41
21			there, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	That's correct.	
23	690	Q.	But the phone number was the method by which you had	
24			identified as being the way that Mr. McHugh should be	
25			contacted by outside independent Gardaí, isn't that	15:42
26			right?	
27		Α.	That's correct.	
28	691	Q.	Were you ever provided with or told of the fact that	
29			according to Garda Higgins he had obtained Mr. McHugh's	

1			phone number?	
2		Α.	That was never mentioned to me.	
3	692	Q.	If we go to page 3977. This is the superintendent's	
4			letter. If we go back up to the top, just to look at	
5			the date?	15:42
6			CHAIRMAN: The 9th July.	
7	693	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: It should be the 9th July, yes. This	
8			appears to have been written subsequent to Sergeant	
9			Curley's report getting to the superintendent because	
10			it refers to the events which are described in the	15:43
11			previous report.	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	694	Q.	But in the third paragraph, the superintendent says:	
14				
15			"I have considered and agree with Inspector Minnock and	15:43
16			Detective Sergeant Curley's view that in the light of	
17			your investigation it might be more appropriate and	
18			impartial if someone from outside this district	
19			approached Mr. McHugh to ascertain if he is willing to	
20			make a statement. In the circumstances, would it be	15:43
21			possible for Detective Inspector Coppinger to arrange	
22			to interview Liam McHugh in this regard? Inspector	
23			Minnock, Athlone"	
24				
25			And your phone number is given.	15:43
26				
27			"will assist you in arranging such a meeting."	
28				
29			Scroll down, please.	

2			"Garda Keogh is aware that I know about this	
3			allegation. He informed me last night that he is	
4			meeting his confidential recipient on Monday and he	
5			will be making him aware of it.	15:43
6				
7			I would be grateful for your assistance in this	
8			regard. "	
9				
10			So, it's just from the point of view of the	15:44
11			superintendent's original direction, both you and	
12			Sergeant Curley appear to have come back to her on	
13			successive days to say that this perhaps shouldn't	
14			happen, although Sergeant Curley appears to have	
15			directed that it did happen and to have it reported to	15:44
16			him that Mr. McHugh had been approached by local	
17			Gardaí, is that right?	
18		Α.	Yes. Well, I suppose, when I wrote to the	
19			superintendent, the direction of the superintendent	
20			stood.	15:44
21	695	Q.	Yes.	
22		Α.	So the D/Sergeant was still complying with that and I	
23			didn't indicate any different, and wouldn't, to	
24			undermine that decision.	
25	696	Q.	Yes.	15:44
26		Α.	But provided my report to the superintendent to allow	
27			an opportunity to revisit that.	
28	697	Q.	Yes.	
29		Δ	Giving my views on hoard However things seemed to	

- 1 happen subsequently very quickly after that.
- 2 698 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. With Garda Higgins talking to Mr. McHugh and
- 4 subsequently the report submitted into the
- 5 superintendent and her report to Galway on the 9th, the 15:45

15 · 45

15:45

15:46

- 6 subsequent day.
- 7 699 Q. Yes. Obviously it's a matter for the Chairman to
- 8 decide any findings or any relevant findings, if
- 9 necessary, but on one interpretation, if Garda Higgins
- is correct, nobody approached Mr. McHugh for a
- 11 statement, either locally or from the Galway team. As
- 12 you yourself point out in your statement, you confirm
- that no investigation was ever carried out into the
- 14 allegations concerning the alleged theft of monies
- recounted by Garda Lyons in his report, isn't that
- 16 right?
- 17 A. Yeah. I suppose the decision in relation to the
- matter, Mr. McHugh, when he initially reported the
- matter to Garda Lyons, said that it never happened and
- 20 Garda Keogh also said it never happened.
- 21 700 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. So I suppose Chief Superintendent Curran made a
- 23 decision based on that.
- 24 701 Q. And Superintendent McBrien recommended a course of
- action on foot of that as well, isn't that right?
- 26 A. That's correct.
- 27 702 Q. Were you consulted about that or not?
- 28 A. No.
- 29 703 Q. Okay. Can we just pass on to the next issue.

- A. If I can just say as well in relation to that, I suppose.
- 3 704 Q. Yes.
- A. I know there's been an allegation in relation to, I

 suppose, that we were somehow targeting Garda Keogh in 15:46
- respect of this matter. But I think given the fact that we were sending the matter to Galway and the fact
- 8 that D/Sergeant Curley was anxious to bottom it out, I
- 9 was anxious to bottom it out, as was the
- superintendent, forwarded the matter to Galway, which

15 · 46

- 11 actually gave Garda Keogh protections under the
- 12 protected disclosure legislation. And if we had any
- way intended to target Garda Keogh, that certainly
- 14 wouldn't have been our course of action.
- 15 705 Q. In other words, if you were trying to target him, you 15:47

 16 might have hotfooted it to Mr. McHugh?
- 17 A. Absolutely.
- 18 706 Q. To try and get him to put this allegation in writing and stand over it?
- A. Exactly. We wouldn't have been passing it on to an independent investigation and given him the protections of the protected disclosure legislation.
- 23 707 Q. All right. Can I pass on to the next issue that the
 24 Chairman is concerned with, the issue of
 25 micromanagement and supervision, excessive supervision. 15:47
 26 I think you deal with the issue of Garda Keogh's
- 27 relationship with the three sergeants at page 686 of
- your statement, and also at page 695. You describe
- 29 Garda Keogh's relationship with Sergeant Yvonne Martin,

Τ			but it seems quite clear that he didn't perhaps have	
2			any real relationship with Sergeant Martin as things	
3			turned out?	
4		Α.	That's correct. But he had the availability there of	
5			somebody independent if he wished, I suppose, to	15:48
6			contact them or wish to seek their support or advice at	
7			any stage. I suppose that was the formal structure	
8			that was put in place.	
9	708	Q.	But were you aware of Garda Keogh's view of Sergeant	
10			Martin?	15:48
11		Α.	Certainly not.	
12	709	Q.	From your point of view, was it your responsibility to,	
13			as it were, supervise how Sergeant Martin was	
14			interacting with Garda Keogh?	
15		Α.	Not really, but I suppose if Sergeant Martin maybe had	15:48
16			a particular concern, she may have brought it to me to	
17			consult with me on the matter, if she felt the need to,	
18			or the superintendent, but that didn't arise.	
19	710	Q.	The next paragraph there, if we scroll down, you	
20			describe Garda Keogh's relationship with Sergeant	15:49
21			Haran. Certainly in the second line you seem to be	
22			expressing the view that Sergeant Haran looked out for	
23			Garda Keogh and wouldn't have condoned unfair	
24			targeting, bullying or harassment of any member of	
25			staff; is that correct?	15:49
26		Α.	That's correct.	
27	711	Q.	You also state that you believe that Sergeant Haran had	
28			witnessed or was concerned that he was being unfairly	
29			targeted or subjected to any form of bullying,	

1			harassment or targeting. He would have brought it	
2			either to your attention, Inspector Farrell, the	
3			district officer, directly to the person to whom it	
4			concerned. Does that reflect your view of Sergeant	
5			Haran's character, that he wouldn't put up with that?	15:50
6		Α.	Absolutely, he wouldn't.	
7	712	Q.	You are confirming, are you, that no complaint was ever	
8			made to you by Sergeant Haran about any maltreatment of	
9			Garda Keogh or targeting, is that right?	
10		Α.	That's correct. I suppose I remember an incident	15:50
11			specifically, I suppose, that Sergeant Haran brought to	
12			my attention, I think it was December '15, I'd have to	
13			go back to my diary notes, where Garda Keogh had rang	
14			him on a number of occasions on Christmas day.	
15	713	Q.	Yes.	15:50
16		Α.	And I believe he was intoxicated. But Sergeant Haran,	
17			for the concern of Garda Keogh, answered the phone each	
18			time, because he had concerns and I suppose it really	
19			highlighted to me his approach in relation to	
20			supporting Garda Keogh. But I also felt that the	15:50
21			relationship, myself, had maybe just gone a step too	
22			far, in that getting those phone calls on Christmas day	
23			was probably somewhat inappropriate really. But	
24			subsequently I felt that Sergeant Martin's appointment	
25			as a liaison and a support person was certainly a good	15:51
26			initiative and it kind of made a little bit of distance	
27			between Garda Keogh and Haran, which was a good thing	
28			in my view.	
20	71/	^	Vou!re referring obviously to Christmas 2014 now is	

1		that	correct?	
2	_	34		

- A. Yes, and it was actually January '15 when it was reported to me.
- 4 715 Q. Did you express any concerns to Sergeant Haran about that?

15:51

15:52

- A. I didn't. I just -- I suppose we discussed it and I
 suppose I didn't feel that -- there was very little I
 could advise him to do. You know, not stepping back
 was not a good idea, in that he was a good support for
- 10 Garda Keogh. I suppose I did ask Sergeant Haran if I
- should contact Garda Keogh, but he did consult with

 Garda Keogh in respect of that matter and Garda Keogh
- felt he had enough supports and that I shouldn't make
- 14 further contact.
- 15 716 Q. Did this discussion occur in advance of Superintendent 15:52

 Murray's sort of reassigning?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 717 Q. With Sergeant Haran, is it?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 718 Q. And did Superintendent Murray discuss his proposal with 15:52 you in advance?
- 22 A. I can't recall that he did.
- 23 719 Q. At the bottom of the page we're looking at, you refer 24 to Garda Keogh's relationship with Sergeant Moylan, who
- was his supervisory sergeant on unit C?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 720 Q. You state there that you believe they had a good rapport?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 721 Q. And you express the same view about the issue of bullying and harassment and what Sergeant Moylan would have done, is that correct?
- That's correct. And I suppose, just to be clear, in 4 Α. 5 relation to the units in Athlone, every unit across the 15:53 6 district has two sergeants on the unit. One which is 7 on the regular units attached to Athlone station and 8 one which is across the sub-district. So unit C, Garda Keogh's unit, is no different in any way in respect of 9 10 having two sergeants assigned to them. 15:53
- 11 722 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. But the only distinction that Garda Keogh had was that 13 he was assigned a support person.
- 14 723 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. Which was initially, I suppose, felt to be in an 15:53

 16 informal, it was Sergeant Haran, and then formally

 17 Sergeant Martin was appointed.

15:54

- 18 724 Q. Was it an assignment on the basis that he was a person whose welfare was the subject of concern or because he had made a protected disclosure or both?
- A. Well, I think because he had made a protected disclosure and because of his addiction issues, that his welfare was a -- and that he needed additional supports.
- 25 725 Q. Okay.
- 26 A. They were certainly interlinked.
- 27 726 Q. At page 695 you address directly one of Garda Keogh's
 28 assertions, that there were three sergeants supervising
 29 him. The second last paragraph at page 695.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 727 Q. You say that this was not the position and you explain
- the position there as it was in your view, is that
- 4 right?
- 5 A. Yes. That's the factual position.
- 6 728 Q. Is there anything more you wish to say on that issue of

15:55

15:55

15:56

- 7 microsupervision or excessive supervision that Garda
- 8 Keogh has complained about?
- 9 A. Well he had the same supervision as every other member
- in the district. So, I cannot see where the allegation 15:55
- is in relation to microsupervision.
- 12 729 Q. CHAIRMAN: In fairness, I think that Garda Keogh
- doesn't say that the sergeants actually carried out
- 14 microsupervision, his complaint was with Superintendent
- Murray, who he said put this in place with the
- intention of microsupervision, but it didn't actually
- 17 eventuate. That's what he says. What do you say about
- the intention behind it, superintendent?
- 19 A. The only difference with Garda Keogh's situation was
- 20 that he appointed a support person, who was Sergeant
- 21 Martin, who never actually --
- 22 730 Q. CHAIRMAN: They never actually interacted.
- 23 A. They never interacted. It was really just a support
- resource available to Garda Keogh should he so wish,
- one which he never took up on. So I don't see the
- 26 microsupervision.
- 27 731 Q. CHAIRMAN: So you don't see that arising.
- 28 A. No.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: Okay, very good.

1	732	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Moving on to the issue of the car tax	
2			and the delay in dealing with Garda Keogh's expenses	
3			claims, can I ask you this: We know from	
4			Superintendent McBrien's statement and from Garda	
5			White's evidence that the issue of the taxation of the	15:56
6			car was an issue in August and September of 2014, were	
7			you aware of that?	
8		Α.	No.	
9	733	Q.	So that wasn't discussed with you either via the late	
10			Ms. Quirk or Superintendent McBrien?	15:57
11		Α.	No.	
12	734	Q.	Just before Superintendent Murray was assigned to	
13			Athlone, I think you became aware of a complaint made	
14			by an anonymous member of the public, isn't that	
15			correct?	15:57
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	735	Q.	Just in terms of the relevance of this, it was a	
18			complaint that was sent to Chief Superintendent Curran	
19			and Superintendent McBrien on or about 8th December	
20			2014, isn't that correct?	15:58
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	736	Q.	And it was referred on to you. I don't need to go into	
23			the details of the particular guard concerned?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	737	Q.	But the issue arose from a member of the public who had	15:58
26			been stopped by a member of the Guards in relation to a	
27			check on the normal Driving Licence, tax, insurance	
28			etcetera?	
29		Α.	That's correct.	

1	738	Q.	That person went to a station in the division to	
2			produce the relevant documents, isn't that correct?	
3		Α.	That's correct.	
4	739	Q.	And apparently observed a car belonging to a member of	
5			the Garda Síochána which wasn't taxed?	15:59
6		Α.	That's correct.	
7	740	Q.	That was brought to your attention. You inspected the	
8			guard's car and I think it led to you taking action	
9			against that member when you found them driving the	
10			car?	15:59
11		Α.	Well, the letter came to my attention one afternoon	
12			before I finished work and I did a Pulse check of the	
13			vehicle, and the Pulse check corresponded with what was	
14			in the anonymous letter. In that the tax on Pulse was	
15			not up-to-date. So the following morning, having	15:59
16			checked the duty detail of the member who was the	
17			registered owner of the vehicle, was due to be working,	
18			finishing nights at 7:00am. So I did a checkpoint	
19			outside the Garda station at 6:30 until 7:15 and	
20			stopped the member leaving work, and demand documents,	16:00
21			checked that the insurance was in order, as it had been	
22			alleged that that was also not in date. I did find	
23			that there was no tax on the vehicle and I issued an	
24			FCPS, a fixed charge penalty notice, and recommended a	
25			disciplinary sanction.	16:00
26	741	Q.	Yes. These documents, Chairman, just for the	

transcript, are to be found in Volume 56, the anonymous letter at page 15738 and the associated documentation of relevance at page 15717 to 719.

1			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
2	742	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: But this occurred then between 8th	
3			December and the date in January when you stopped the	
4			member on the public road?	
5		Α.	Yes.	16:01
6	743	Q.	It led to you, I think, disciplining the member	
7			concerned with a regulation 10 notice?	
8		Α.	Yes. I recommended an informal sanction under the	
9			discipline regulations, under regulation 10.	
10	744	Q.	Yes. Now, this is obviously in the period just	16:01
11			immediately while Superintendent McBrien was out,	
12			although she then returned in the new year, and before	
13			Superintendent McBrien was appointed, isn't that	
14			correct?	
15		Α.	That's correct.	16:01
16	745	Q.	Can the Chairman take it you didn't discuss it with	
17			either of those superintendents?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	746	Q.	Did you ever make Superintendent Murray aware that this	
20			is the sort of action that you took in relation to this	16:01
21			guard?	
22		Α.	No, I never told anyone other than my correspondence to	
23			the chief superintendent. I felt it was a sensitive	
24			enough matter. I felt I had dealt with it swiftly, I	
25			had sanctioned the member and I didn't need to	16:02
26			publicise the matter.	
27	747	Q.	In any event, you became aware of Garda Keogh's, a	
28			concern on his part that his payments were being	
29			delayed, is that correct?	

Т		Α.	That's correct.	
2	748	Q.	I think you received a minute from Garda Keogh; is that	
3			correct?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	749	Q.	Perhaps we will just look at that, at page 722 of	6:02
6			Volume 4.	
7			CHAIRMAN: You will probably be a while longer, will	
8			you, Mr. McGuinness?	
9			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, I will be quite a while longer.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Very good, thanks very much, well then we	6:03
11			will break. If it was going to be a few minutes we	
12			would carry on and finish but if you are going to be	
13			looking at a few documents, then we will break there.	
14			MR. McGUINNESS: Very good, Chairman.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Okay, thanks very much. Thanks very much,	6:03
16			superintendent.	
17			THE WITNESS: Thank you.	
18			CHAIRMAN: We will resume in the morning. Thank you.	
19				
20			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL THURSDAY, 23RD JANUARY	
21			2020 AT 10: 30AM	
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
29				

		T		
	15 [2] - 3:9, 60:3	44:6, 59:24, 60:10,	26 [1] - 3:15	123:1
	151 [4] - 35:19,	60:18, 65:2, 68:5,	26th [3] - 13:22,	4:00am [1] - 156:13
	36:17, 36:18, 41:26	104:26, 105:9, 110:2,	24:12, 105:7	4th [1] - 174:9
'14 [1] - 165:26	152 [1] - 5:28	131:6, 136:29,	27 [1] - 3:15	1
'15 [3] - 20:25,	153 [1] - 5:29	148:23, 152:14	28 [2] - 3:16, 5:7	5
183:12, 184:2	15717 [1] - 188:29	2016 [8] - 8:24, 34:6,	29 [1] - 3:17	<u> </u>
'16 [1] - 8:10		38:16, 38:17, 85:10,		
10[1] 0110	15738 [1] - 188:28	103:8, 103:11, 162:19	29th [1] - 163:14	5 [2] - 3:4, 73:17
0	16 [2] - 1:5, 3:10	2017 [3] - 1:5, 1:9,	2:00am [1] - 46:11	5.1 [1] - 61:7
	161 [1] - 5:30	78:5	2nd [7] - 20:19,	5.2 [2] - 61:7, 61:27
	163 [1] - 6:3		20:24, 21:12, 21:14,	5.3 [1] - 62:6
003 [19] - 107:22,	17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10	2018 [2] - 1:9, 82:7	57:12, 133:3, 152:14	504 [1] - 147:3
107:24, 108:27,	178 [2] - 52:4, 52:5	2019 [2] - 35:28,		505 [4] - 131:6,
108:29, 109:14,	179 [1] - 53:25	163:14	3	131:9, 142:4, 142:7
112:6, 112:16,	18 [1] - 3:11	2020 [3] - 1:18, 7:2,		51 [1] - 2:18
119:22, 119:23,	18/8 [1] - 127:4	190:21	3 [6] - 3:3, 8:29, 44:2,	527 [1] - 173:23
119:26, 120:1,	187 [2] - 21:14, 28:27	2043 [2] - 104:27,	72:20, 85:2, 102:14	56 [1] - 188:27
120:15, 121:5,	18th [6] - 68:4,	105:3	3.1 [1] - 9:3	589 [1] - 71:17
121:14, 121:18,	114:22, 128:6,	2049 [3] - 125:24,	3.1 [1] - 9.3 3.15 [2] - 76:19,	
122:10, 126:15,	135:26, 148:23,	125:25, 138:13		590 [2] - 76:20, 78:18
137:15, 137:17	150:11	20th [6] - 10:21,	76:22	591 [1] - 61:6
	19 [1] - 3:11	10:24, 12:16, 24:12,	3.2 [1] - 28:15	592 [1] - 66:6
1	19/9/15 [1] - 149:21	56:23, 57:11	3.3 [1] - 22:2	595 [1] - 8:29
•	19/9/2015 [1] - 114:6	21 [2] - 3:12, 54:25	3.4 [2] - 33:1, 33:21	596 [5] - 9:2, 22:2,
	1921 [1] - 1:9	2121 [7] - 114:24,	3.6 [2] - 71:19, 76:4	28:14, 32:28, 33:2
1 [7] - 3:2, 29:3,	1984 [1] - 85:9	115:15, 135:25,	3.7 [2] - 75:17, 75:21	599 [1] - 102:13
35:19, 42:25, 44:2,	1998 [1] - 102:22	136:2, 140:6, 156:2,	30 [1] - 3:17	
75:19, 163:22	19th [1] - 160:8	161:12	30th [2] - 87:6, 99:9	6
10 [3] - 3:7, 189:7,	1st [3] - 60:18, 87:22,	2184 [1] - 49:22	31 [1] - 3:18	
189:9	99:28	2188 [3] - 14:20,	31st [3] - 18:3, 18:9,	6 [2] - 3:5, 66:7
100 [2] - 41:13, 41:16		14:24, 31:2	20:25	6.1 [1] - 36:14
102 [1] - 5:25	•	2190 [1] - 57:12	32 [2] - 2:24, 3:18	
10=[.] 0.=0				6.2 M = 66.23
10:00am [1] - 124:19	2	21st [1] - 23:15	33 [1] - 3:19	6.2 [1] - 66:23
			33 [1] - 3:19 33-34 [1] - 4:12	600 [2] - 152:20,
10:00am [1] - 124:19	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9,	21st [1] - 23:15		600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21		21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3	2 _[8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22,	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28,
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8,	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2,	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4,	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1,	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] -	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15,	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24,	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3 135 [1] - 5:26	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12, 164:12, 183:29,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20 23rd [5] - 131:5,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17 40 [1] - 90:3	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29 72 [4] - 107:28,
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3 135 [1] - 5:26 13th [8] - 48:9, 49:5,	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12, 164:12, 183:29, 187:6, 187:20	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20 23rd [5] - 131:5, 133:17, 133:19,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17 40 [1] - 90:3 42 [1] - 5:12	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29 72 [4] - 107:28, 108:18, 109:10,
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3 135 [1] - 5:26 13th [8] - 48:9, 49:5, 56:19, 58:3, 110:2,	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12, 164:12, 183:29, 187:6, 187:20 2015 [30] - 8:23,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20 23rd [5] - 131:5, 133:17, 133:19, 142:6, 174:5	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17 40 [1] - 90:3 42 [1] - 5:12 422 [1] - 20:20	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29 72 [4] - 107:28, 108:18, 109:10, 120:22
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3 135 [1] - 5:26 13th [8] - 48:9, 49:5, 56:19, 58:3, 110:2, 112:27, 113:4, 130:22	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12, 164:12, 183:29, 187:6, 187:20 2015 [30] - 8:23, 10:1, 10:13, 10:17,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20 23rd [5] - 131:5, 133:17, 133:19, 142:6, 174:5 24 [7] - 3:14, 107:25,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17 40 [1] - 90:3 42 [1] - 5:12 422 [1] - 20:20 44 [2] - 51:23, 52:4	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29 72 [4] - 107:28, 108:18, 109:10, 120:22 722 [1] - 190:5
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3 135 [1] - 5:26 13th [8] - 48:9, 49:5, 56:19, 58:3, 110:2, 112:27, 113:4, 130:22 14 [1] - 3:9	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12, 164:12, 183:29, 187:6, 187:20 2015 [30] - 8:23, 10:1, 10:13, 10:17, 10:22, 10:24, 11:24,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20 23rd [5] - 131:5, 133:17, 133:19, 142:6, 174:5 24 [7] - 3:14, 107:25, 108:16, 108:24,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17 40 [1] - 90:3 42 [1] - 5:12 422 [1] - 20:20 44 [2] - 51:23, 52:4 45 [1] - 54:19	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29 72 [4] - 107:28, 108:18, 109:10, 120:22 722 [1] - 190:5 752 [1] - 68:1
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3 135 [1] - 5:26 13th [8] - 48:9, 49:5, 56:19, 58:3, 110:2, 112:27, 113:4, 130:22 14 [1] - 3:9 144 [1] - 5:27	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12, 164:12, 183:29, 187:6, 187:20 2015 [30] - 8:23, 10:1, 10:13, 10:17, 10:22, 10:24, 11:24, 13:22, 18:3, 20:19,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20 23rd [5] - 131:5, 133:17, 133:19, 142:6, 174:5 24 [7] - 3:14, 107:25, 108:16, 108:24, 109:8, 120:22, 125:15	33-34 _[1] - 4:12 34 _[1] - 3:19 35 _[2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 _[2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 _[1] - 3:21 38 _[1] - 3:21 39 _[1] - 3:22 3977 _[1] - 178:3 3rd _[1] - 20:25 4 4 _[11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 _[1] - 78:17 40 _[1] - 90:3 42 _[1] - 5:12 42 _[1] - 5:12 42 _[1] - 5:20 44 _[2] - 51:23, 52:4 45 _[1] - 54:19 486 _[1] - 85:2	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29 72 [4] - 107:28, 108:18, 109:10, 120:22 722 [1] - 190:5 752 [1] - 68:1 7:00am [6] - 107:28,
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3 135 [1] - 5:26 13th [8] - 48:9, 49:5, 56:19, 58:3, 110:2, 112:27, 113:4, 130:22 14 [1] - 3:9 144 [1] - 5:27 14th [2] - 136:29,	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12, 164:12, 183:29, 187:6, 187:20 2015 [30] - 8:23, 10:1, 10:13, 10:17, 10:22, 10:24, 11:24, 13:22, 18:3, 20:19, 20:24, 23:18, 23:20,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20 23rd [5] - 131:5, 133:17, 133:19, 142:6, 174:5 24 [7] - 3:14, 107:25, 108:16, 108:24, 109:8, 120:22, 125:15 25 [3] - 3:14, 5:6,	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17 40 [1] - 90:3 42 [1] - 5:12 422 [1] - 20:20 44 [2] - 51:23, 52:4 45 [1] - 54:19 486 [1] - 85:2 4916 [1] - 85:2	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29 72 [4] - 107:28, 108:18, 109:10, 120:22 722 [1] - 190:5 752 [1] - 68:1 7:00am [6] - 107:28, 107:29, 117:15,
10:00am [1] - 124:19 10:30AM [1] - 190:21 10:30am [1] - 124:19 11 [1] - 3:7 11-13 [1] - 4:3 113 [2] - 41:13, 41:17 11755 [2] - 79:18, 79:19 11756 [2] - 54:22, 80:7 12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 145:5 120 [2] - 108:2, 122:10 122 [1] - 163:12 12207121 [1] - 119:25 123 [1] - 51:22 129 [1] - 1:18 13 [2] - 2:31, 3:8 133 [1] - 145:3 135 [1] - 5:26 13th [8] - 48:9, 49:5, 56:19, 58:3, 110:2, 112:27, 113:4, 130:22 14 [1] - 3:9 144 [1] - 5:27	2 [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 29:24, 44:2, 57:14, 68:7, 117:28 20 [3] - 3:12, 63:27, 90:3 2001 [1] - 7:22 2002 [1] - 102:29 2005 [1] - 23:15 2007 [3] - 7:25, 102:26, 102:29 2008 [3] - 85:24, 103:2, 103:3 2009 [1] - 102:26 2013 [1] - 103:7 2014 [19] - 1:3, 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 8:22, 9:17, 11:23, 44:3, 65:1, 69:1, 71:27, 85:24, 87:7, 99:9, 104:12, 164:12, 183:29, 187:6, 187:20 2015 [30] - 8:23, 10:1, 10:13, 10:17, 10:22, 10:24, 11:24, 13:22, 18:3, 20:19,	21st [1] - 23:15 22 [1] - 3:13 225 [3] - 127:10, 127:14, 139:5 226 [4] - 127:11, 127:14, 139:6, 139:17 2261 [1] - 60:9 229 [5] - 112:24, 113:1, 113:2, 119:6, 124:26 22nd [2] - 18:1, 60:10 22ND [2] - 1:18, 7:1 23 [1] - 3:13 230 [1] - 146:3 232 [8] - 132:7, 132:13, 132:24, 149:17, 149:18, 152:13, 158:20 234 [1] - 150:6 23RD [1] - 190:20 23rd [5] - 131:5, 133:17, 133:19, 142:6, 174:5 24 [7] - 3:14, 107:25, 108:16, 108:24, 109:8, 120:22, 125:15	33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [1] - 3:19 35 [2] - 3:20, 5:8 36 [2] - 3:20, 125:15 37 [1] - 3:21 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3977 [1] - 178:3 3rd [1] - 20:25 4 4 [11] - 2:19, 3:4, 42:25, 44:2, 68:1, 75:19, 163:15, 163:22, 163:24, 164:16, 190:6 4.3 [1] - 78:17 40 [1] - 90:3 42 [1] - 5:12 422 [1] - 20:20 44 [2] - 51:23, 52:4 45 [1] - 54:19 486 [1] - 85:2 4916 [1] - 85:3 496 [5] - 121:23,	600 [2] - 152:20, 152:22 603 [2] - 162:4 6272 [1] - 87:5 67 [1] - 5:13 679 [1] - 163:16 686 [1] - 181:27 687 [2] - 164:15 695 [3] - 181:28, 185:27, 185:29 6:00pm [1] - 46:11 6:30 [1] - 188:19 6th [1] - 85:10 7 7 [6] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 5:5, 162:2 71 [1] - 5:14 719 [1] - 188:29 72 [4] - 107:28, 108:18, 109:10, 120:22 722 [1] - 190:5 752 [1] - 68:1 7:00am [6] - 107:28,

188:18 25:15, 29:1, 32:17, absolutely [16] added [1] - 154:26 alternate [1] - 63:16 **7:15** [1] - 188:19 39:21, 64:28, 66:5, addiction [1] -129:12, 138:6, alternative [1] -7th [1] - 82:7 66:22, 69:4, 69:9, 185:22 138:10, 139:28, 168:11 143:5, 170:27 amalgam [1] - 62:16 69:16, 84:13, 111:2, addition [2] - 108:14, 121:11, 141:22, agree [14] - 24:29, 8 115:8 amenable [1] -152:8, 154:29, 158:5, 30:11, 31:24, 40:24, additional [8] -171.11 181:17, 183:6 125:3, 133:28, 47:18, 68:21, 69:21, amend [1] - 109:9 8[4] - 3:6, 3:28, 141:26, 149:1, 150:7, **abuse** [1] - 83:27 134:23, 137:25, **AMENDED**[1] - 1:9 55:20, 64:8 151:11, 151:18, accept [22] - 26:10, 155:3, 155:11, amn't [1] - 54:15 808 [1] - 166:29 26:17, 112:28, 113:7, 170:4, 178:15 155:14, 185:23 amount [7] - 33:15, 85_[1] - 5:18 114:17, 115:11, address [10] - 26:25, agreed [11] - 14:3, 49:15, 63:9, 79:4, 88 [1] - 5:19 14:9, 17:5, 86:14, 116:9, 118:4, 118:26, 32:29, 97:18, 127:25, 126:26, 155:20, 8th [9] - 164:12, 105:14, 166:21. 126:25, 126:28, 139:10, 139:21, 155:21 164:28, 166:26, 127:22, 128:5, 128:7, 167:25, 169:16, 162:2, 162:5, 171:14, amounts [1] - 58:14 172:12, 174:16, 138:12, 139:12, 170:1, 174:20 185:27 **AN**[1] - 3:2 175:29, 176:6, 139:18, 140:21, agreeing [1] - 169:14 addressed [11] **analyse** [1] - 42:6 187:19, 189:2 140:24. 142:3. agreement [1] - 56:7 27:5, 60:22, 127:10, **AND** [5] - 1:3, 1:4, 142:11, 142:28 131:9, 131:14, AGSI [1] - 4:4 1:8, 3:15, 102:7 9 accepted [1] - 42:4 135:28, 136:4, ahead [1] - 82:8 and.. [1] - 124:23 accepting [2] -143:16, 153:4, AIDAN[4] - 3:9, 4:6, Andrew [2] - 42:15, 119:13, 119:16 166:29, 173:23 6:1, 163:8 42:20 9 [3] - 3:6, 59:23, accepts [2] - 36:9, addresses [1] -Aidan [1] - 164:21 ANDREW [6] - 2:22, 109:27 40.9 148:10 **aim** [1] - 24:9 4:5, 5:10, 42:17, 67:9, 93 [1] - 79:21 accommodation [2] **AISLING** [2] - 2:11, adequate [1] -71:9 **9332** [2] - 18:2, 18:3 - 33:16, 34:12 155:23 3.21 angst [1] - 52:12 **94** [1] - 5:20 ADJOURNED [2] accordance [1] -**ALAN**[2] - 3:9, 3:13 animated [4] - 71:29, **98** [1] **-** 5:21 147:24 102:7, 190:20 albeit [1] - 65:2 72:8, 72:11, 74:6 **9:00pm** [1] - 46:12 according [3] administration [1] alcohol [7] - 11:29, **ANNE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 9th [11] - 164:12, 10:22, 34:9, 177:29 95:16 12:3, 44:19, 45:3, annual [1] - 114:5 173:22, 174:4, accordingly [1] -**ADMINISTRATIVE** 83:4, 83:19, 83:27 anonymous [3] -174:16, 175:26, 60:20 111 - 3:14 alienate [3] - 64:12, 187:14, 188:14, 175:27, 176:1, account [1] - 164:14 administrator [1] -64:18, 64:24 176:10, 178:6, 178:7, 188:27 accountability [2] -107:4 **ALISON**[1] - 3:26 answer [7] - 25:3, 180:5 106:18 134:2 admitted [4] - 44:21, allegation [8] -53:25, 67:2, 87:27, accurate [1] - 126:12 76:24, 82:28, 83:3 33:19, 40:1, 112:11, 135:14, 142:26, Α accurately [1] advance [8] -145:7, 179:3, 181:4, 142:29 43:17 126:22, 137:15, 181:18, 186:10 answered 131 -137:17, 137:21, abandoning [1] acquaintance [1] allegations [7] -39:28, 122:5, 183:17 169:6 142:13, 145:29, 36:14, 37:1, 37:3, answering [2] - 77:2, abilities [1] - 76:21 **ACT** [2] - 1:3, 1:8 184:15, 184:21 38:6, 38:9, 66:9, 77:18 advanced [1] - 42:3 ability [1] - 83:20 act [2] - 47:19, 48:20 180:14 answers [3] able [6] - 40:8, 82:10, **ACTING** [2] - 3:7, advancing[1] alleged [13] - 59:22, 125:16, 156:11, 168:25 100:5, 145:28, 155:9, 3:13 59:23, 66:16, 66:27, 170.26 75:5, 110:1, 119:8, advantage [1] -170:29 acting [3] - 8:13, **ANTHONY** [1] - 3:6 158:7 146:20, 146:23, above-named [1] -46:19 59:6 anticipating [1] advice [5] - 17:17, 1:26 action [11] - 1:27, 147:8, 162:14, 108:8 14:9, 47:19, 105:15, 17:18, 43:1, 83:14, 180:14, 188:22 abroad [2] - 166:1, anxious [4] - 40:26, 174:9 117:4, 117:8, 145:29, 182.6 allocated [2] - 29:6, 53:5, 181:8, 181:9 180:25, 181:14, advise [1] - 184:8 33:12 absconded [1] any.. [1] - 27:3 188:8, 189:20 advised [5] - 16:24, allow [8] - 28:19, 165:13 anyway [3] - 38:24, 64:11, 82:27, 105:20, absence [14] - 46:16, actioned [1] - 117:6 29:7, 31:10, 31:27, 62:25, 174:20 actions [2] - 84:6, 46:24, 59:21, 68:12, 137:16 48:2, 170:23, 171:13, apologies [2] -77:4, 104:23, 116:6, 151:27 advocate's [1] -179:26 142:7, 149:16 allowed [2] - 130:24, 118:2, 118:8, 132:29, 39.12 activated [2] - 23:2, apparatus [1] - 8:17 140:17, 145:21, 23.29 affected [1] - 83:20 170:3 apparent [4] - 69:24, almost [1] - 46:10 157:18, 167:29 activity [1] - 95:13 afternoon [5] -70:17, 74:23, 83:13 absence.. [1] - 57:16 71:12, 71:13, 102:10, alongside [1] - 8:11 actual [2] - 115:14, APPEAL[2] - 1:13, 102:20, 188:11 absent [3] - 107:10, 158:19 alpine [1] - 38:6 agenda [1] - 108:20 107:11, 165:5 alter [1] - 51:20 ad [1] - 41:1 appear [10] - 16:6, **ago** [10] - 12:6, altered [1] - 59:11 absolute [1] - 58:26 add [1] - 155:1 31:24, 45:10, 130:11,

130:14, 142:8, 150:10, 168:10, 175:21, 179:12 APPEARANCES[1] appeared [3] - 83:9, 84:2, 84:7 applications [1] -129.23 applied [1] - 133:28 appointed [16] -8:14, 21:7, 22:13, 22:22, 25:23, 26:13, 27:2, 28:16, 34:5, 34:17, 50:16, 167:11, 177:16, 185:17, 186:20, 189:13 appointment [4] -27:8, 32:6, 59:6, 183:24 appreciate [1] - 41:9 approach [2] - 168:4, 183:19 approached [6] -13:6, 13:17, 173:2, 178:19, 179:16, 180:10 appropriate [10] -52:28, 62:28, 67:18, 69:29, 166:8, 167:13, 168:15, 168:23, 169:2, 178:17 approximate [1] -152:28 April [9] - 20:19, 20:24, 20:25, 21:12, 21:14, 23:14, 23:15, 34:5, 57:12 area [8] - 16:11, 16:16, 94:13, 121:21, 128:29, 146:14, 146:16, 146:21 areas [1] - 146:25 argue [1] - 156:2 arise [6] - 21:20, 29:9, 59:22, 73:12, 164:2, 182:18 arisen [1] - 73:11 arising [16] - 15:27, 30:8, 34:3, 39:1, 44:7, 45:11, 57:29, 75:15, 84:22, 84:24, 85:13, 93:14, 101:1, 160:29, 163:24, 186:27 armed [1] - 138:7 arose [4] - 12:20, 55:23, 124:4, 187:25 ARRAN[2] - 2:24, 4:12

arrange [3] - 60:20,

167:16, 178:21 arranged [1] - 24:16 arrangement [1] -51:20 arranging [1] -178:27 arrival [2] - 65:28, 72:12 arrived [3] - 65:28, 119:1, 148:23 arrives [1] - 88:23 articulated [1] -148:22 **AS** [21] - 1:9, 7:1, 7:12, 25:11, 28:11, 35:2. 42:18. 67:10. 71:10, 85:5, 88:5, 94:9, 98:26, 102:7, 102:17, 135:21, 144:19, 152:11, 153:24, 161:4, 163:9 ascertain [3] - 30:6, 57:26, 178:19 **aside** [1] - 148:10 asleep [1] - 157:6 aspect [6] - 49:19, 58:9, 64:10, 73:6, 79:6, 146:9 assailants [3] -139:11, 139:19, 139:20 assault [5] - 16:28, 17:28, 37:7, 130:27, 147:8 assert [2] - 50:10, 93:18 asserting [3] - 52:23, 56:29, 93:22 assertions [1] -185:28 assessment [1] -38:4 assigned [6] - 8:9, 21:9, 30:15, 185:10, 185:13, 187:12 assignment [2] -62:11, 185:18 assist [16] - 10:28, 15:2, 15:22, 24:8, 31:14, 37:29, 41:27, 44:26, 76:23, 77:10, 82:10, 105:18, 124:3, 126:5, 167:16, 178:27

assistance [4] -

44:27, 81:20, 82:5,

ASSISTANT[6] -

2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8,

3:18, 3:20

Assistant [1] - 45:24

assistant [3] - 85:25, 105:23, 138:1 assisted [3] - 52:17, 59:3. 59:18 associated [1] -188:28 association [1] -167:4 AT [1] - 190:21 **ATHLONE** [1] - 4:3 Athlone [53] - 7:18, 7:28, 8:2, 8:4, 8:6, 8:7, 9:17, 9:22, 10:19, 12:25, 18:24, 22:27, 37:8. 43:3. 45:11. 45:25, 46:29, 48:13, 59:8, 60:22, 60:27, 63:8, 66:20, 68:4, 70:7, 70:12, 85:26, 85:27, 87:24, 100:2, 100:20, 102:26, 102:28, 103:1, 103:4, 103:6, 103:14, 105:26, 107:26, 110:1, 111:28, 133:27, 136:4, 144:28, 167:1, 167:7, 168:13, 168:15, 177:7, 177:8, 185:5, 185:7, 187:13 Athlone.. [1] -178.23 attached [11] - 7:18, 8:7, 11:17, 17:16, 57:20, 59:9, 105:24, 132:18. 149:25. 173:26, 185:7 attempts [1] - 22:9 attend [7] - 31:10, 31:12, 31:14, 31:28, 107:3, 107:9, 154:6 attendance [2] -44:28, 45:18 attended [1] - 133:11 attendees [1] -106:27 attending [1] - 31:18 attends [2] - 30:3, 57:24 attention [21] -20:12, 29:3, 33:1, 108:20, 112:3, 112:25, 114:17, 125:29, 132:8, 135:1, 136:18, 138:14, 143:24, 150:26, 151:3, 151:28, 183:2, 183:12, 188:7, 188:11

attracted [1] - 20:11 attribute [1] - 103:23 attributing [1] -104:22 audited [1] - 58:21 audits [2] - 94:28, August [8] - 68:5, 103:7, 114:22, 128:6, 135:26, 148:23, 150:12, 187:6 Authority [1] - 38:22 authority [1] - 83:11 automatically [2] -109:8, 109:22 avail [5] - 13:11, 22:5, 24:3, 30:23, 32:24 availability [2] -25:25, 182:4 available [23] - 13:7, 21:5, 22:12, 22:18, 22:24, 25:24, 26:4, 26:9, 26:25, 27:24, 28:24, 43:18, 106:28, 107:5, 108:12, 108:16, 119:18 125:5, 157:4, 157:20, 171:11, 175:13, 186:24 aware [63] - 11:28, 12:3, 12:27, 13:7, 13:8, 13:16, 13:26, 21:5, 22:18, 23:15. 23:16, 23:17, 25:23, 25:26, 26:6, 26:24, 27:8, 27:25, 31:17, 31:20, 32:6, 32:9, 32:11, 35:24, 36:8, 36:23, 37:13, 43:24, 60:26, 61:23, 61:24, 61:29, 66:28, 74:4, 74:5, 74:10, 80:8, 95:20, 104:13, 104:16, 104:20, 104:23, 109:26, 110:27, 110:29, 111:12, 117:7, 124:16, 130:5, 134:14, 142:3, 142:13, 142:18, 168:25, 171:7, 174:12, 179:2, 179:5, 182:9, 187:7, 187:13, 189:19, 189:27 awareness [1] - 32:4 awful [2] - 75:7, 91:20 AWOL[1] - 23:20

attitude [1] - 172:7

В

backdrop [1] - 48:10 background [1] -13.18 Baker [8] - 68:16, 102:2, 102:11, 102:19, 105:12, 116:23, 135:23, 141:28 **BAKER** [7] - 5:23, 102:16, 135:20, 144:18, 152:10, 153:23, 161:3 balance [3] - 21:4, 22:11, 25:26 **ballpark** [1] - 90:5 BAR [1] - 2:31 bar [2] - 86:3, 147:9 $\pmb{\text{based}}\ [7]\ \textbf{-}\ 40{:}2,$ 46.6 85.26 85.27 132:11, 134:17, 180:23 basic [2] - 59:19, 77:21 basis [7] - 34:22, 40:18, 43:26, 44:14, 62:21, 129:5, 185:18 **BASTION**[1] - 4:2 bear [6] - 25:2, 96:4, 96:23, 112:6, 113:1 beat [1] - 145:11 became [13] - 7:25, 23:16, 32:6, 32:11, 36:8, 36:23, 74:22, 79:28, 80:2, 95:20, 187:13, 189:27 become [2] - 25:16, 35:24 becomes [1] -126:23 becoming [1] - 21:6 **BEEN** [5] - 7:11, 42:17, 85:4, 102:16, 163.8 began [1] - 77:29 begin [1] - 92:7 beginning [2] -102:21, 152:28 behalf [5] - 32:18, 94:3, 139:6, 140:12, 141:21 behind [3] - 77:1, 139:20, 186:18 belief [4] - 18:26, 27:20, 52:2, 74:24

belonging [1] - 188:4

beside [1] - 91:23

best [7] - 47:29,

attested [2] - 7:22,

48:1, 48:2, 52:17, 108:11, 126:19, 126:20 betrayal [1] - 36:16 better [5] - 26:2, 51:10, 55:3, 65:19, 151.23 between [20] - 8:22, 42:27, 43:8, 44:6, 48:13, 53:9, 67:22, 76:26, 80:14, 85:24, 106:11, 114:23, 136:6, 138:1, 142:14, 151:10, 153:1, 159:19, 183:27, 189:2 big [1] - 90:2 bigger [4] - 45:9, 171:26, 171:27, 171:29 bit [17] - 8:16, 10:27, 65:19, 72:7, 78:6, 80:26, 105:22, 120:8, 120:9, 125:3, 126:8, 129:9, 156:26, 159:23, 160:10, 176:18, 183:26 **BL** [13] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 4:1, 4:7, 4:10 black [1] - 118:27 blah [3] - 159:3 blah-blah-blah [1] blocking [2] - 86:4, **bluntly** [1] - 39:12 board [3] - 20:8, 20:13, 179:29 boils [1] - 118:22 book [2] - 64:3, 64:4 **booked** [1] - 114:5 books [1] - 102:14 **boot** [1] - 39:8 boss [2] - 55:1, 170.13 bottom [7] - 79:22, 99:5, 164:15, 177:12, 181:8, 181:9, 184:23 **box** [5] - 96:19, 99:22, 128:21, 161:21, 161:22 boycott [1] - 64:25 branch [1] - 134:18 break [3] - 54:3, 190:11, 190:13 BRIAN [2] - 3:15, brief [2] - 125:2,

143:18

briefed [2] - 143:17, 165:8 briefing [2] - 106:1, 136:9 briefings [1] - 165:15 briefly [6] - 145:3, 145:7, 147:3, 147:28, 164:10, 166:28 bring [14] - 18:2, 50:5, 63:29, 65:23, 65:27, 104:26, 107:18, 108:10, 108:19, 108:26, 120:29, 124:2, 136:18, 143:24 bringing [5] - 56:14, 56:15, 125:29, 159:2 broad [1] - 50:2 broadly [1] - 56:7 brought [28] - 35:18, 50:1, 52:19, 53:7, 53:8, 53:13, 55:23, 56:9, 64:22, 65:14, 65:24, 65:29, 67:27, 79:14, 80:15, 81:7, 81:17, 112:2, 112:3, 113:28, 121:1, 133:25, 133:27, 138:14, 182:16, 183:1, 183:11, 188:7 buffer [1] - 78:12 **build** [2] - 77:3, 77:7 building [2] - 62:24, 106.14 bullied [2] - 84:1, bullying [5] - 82:18, 150:20, 182:24, 182:29, 185:2 bunch [3] - 90:14, 92:13, 92:15 bundle [4] - 89:12, 89:27, 92:23, 93:2 BURKE [1] - 4:11 business [2] - 95:19, 147:28 busy [2] - 159:25, 159:26 BY [47] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:18, 5:19, 5:20, 5:21, 5:25, 5:26, 5:27, 5:28, 5:29, 5:30, 6:3, 7:12, 25:10, 28:10, 35:1, 42:18, 67:9, 71:9, 85:5, 88:4,

94:8, 98:25, 102:17,

135:20, 144:18,

152:10, 153:23, 161:3, 163:9

C

8:1

CAGNEY [1] - 3:17 caller [4] - 87:9, 87:20, 96:16, 99:12 cannot [5] - 81:26, 89:3, 89:13, 90:14, 186:10 canvass [1] - 73:12 canvassed [1] -80:12 Caoimhghín [1] -38:22 Caoláin [1] - 38:22 capacity [9] - 7:27, 22:6, 26:14, 40:1, 59:7, 102:27, 103:14, 105:20 car [11] - 63:14, 70:14, 86:15, 91:1, 92:19, 95:23, 187:1, 187:6, 188:4, 188:8, 188:10 care [1] - 154:12 careful [1] - 21:3 CARR [1] - 3:15 **CARRICK** [1] - 2:13 CARRICK-ON-**SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 carried [3] - 134:18, 180:13. 186:13 carries [1] - 99:19 Carroll [2] - 97:1, 98:13 CARROLL [10] -2:16, 5:20, 94:3, 94:9, 94:11, 97:2, 97:5, 97:8, 97:26, 98:14 carry [4] - 30:27, 32:21, 99:15, 190:12 cars [1] - 86:2 CARTHAGE[1] case [23] - 16:29, 17:10, 17:28, 26:10, 30:8, 50:9, 57:28, 74:25, 74:26, 75:10, 80:26, 89:10, 92:21, 92:26, 101:9, 101:11, 109:10, 115:2, 129:16, 143:11, 154:1, 156:4, 171:29 cases [6] - 30:7, 57:27, 100:19,

28:6, 30:25, 34:4, CASTLE[1] - 1:17 Castlepollard [1] -37:25, 38:5, 38:18, 38:22, 38:27, 39:15, 39:21, 40:17, 41:24, catalogues [1] -42:14, 71:7, 72:19, 137:24 73:4, 73:15, 75:12, catching [1] - 123:29 75:16, 80:23, 81:21, category [3] - 18:14, 81:29, 82:5, 84:19, 147:2, 147:12 93:29, 94:2, 98:19, Catherine [1] - 94:15 102:1, 102:10, caused [2] - 36:16, 102:13, 105:18, 61:25 112:24, 124:3, causes [1] - 76:1 127:17, 137:16, causing [2] - 52:11, 141:20, 144:15, 149:16, 151:2, 163:2, CC [1] - 116:22 164:5, 176:21, 180:7, **cc'd** [3] - 111:5, 181:24, 188:26, 145:27, 161:16 189:16, 190:14 **CCTV** [13] - 139:16, chairman [1] -139:21, 139:23, 128:20 139:25, 140:1, 140:2, CHAIRMAN [262] -140:3, 140:4, 146:12, 1:12, 5:29, 7:4, 7:6, 146:13, 146:16, 7:9, 7:15, 8:15, 15:19, 146:19, 159:2 16:2, 19:2, 19:5, cells [1] - 123:25 19:21, 20:3, 20:6, centre [2] - 39:9, 20:9, 20:11, 20:15, 40:13 25:8, 28:8, 33:27, **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 34:2, 34:9, 34:14, certain [17] - 48:17, 34:16, 34:19, 34:28, 49:14, 65:25, 73:9, 35:8, 35:13, 35:16, 74:29, 82:16, 86:16, 35:20, 36:1, 36:6, 89:7, 90:17, 107:17, 36:17, 36:19, 36:22, 127:4, 128:9, 129:7, 37:16, 37:21, 37:26, 154:8, 155:20, 38:1. 38:10. 38:13. 155:21, 168:19 38:19, 39:3, 39:5, certainly [24] - 45:5, 39:17, 39:19, 39:22, 45:17, 45:18, 47:29, 40:18, 40:20, 40:27, 53:5, 56:7, 56:16, 41:6, 41:16, 41:18, 58:15, 64:14, 64:21, 41:29, 42:9, 42:21, 64:23, 64:28, 65:26, 64:25, 67:7, 71:6, 70:26, 79:13, 81:2, 72:21, 72:26, 73:2, 94:6, 171:11, 175:24, 73:7. 73:20. 73:26. 181:13, 182:11, 74:3, 74:16, 75:9, 182:21, 183:25, 75:13, 75:21, 75:24, 185:26 76:7, 76:13, 76:17, certificates [1] - 10:1 80:18, 80:21, 80:24, certified [2] - 33:16, 81:3, 81:16, 81:23, 34:12 82:1, 84:18, 84:20, certify [2] - 1:24, 84:23, 84:25, 85:19, 85:22 85:26 88:2 certs [2] - 10:4, 90:3, 90:6, 91:8, 11:25 91:10, 91:24, 92:6, Chair [2] - 37:29, 92:9, 92:12, 92:15, 76:11 92:17, 92:21, 92:23, **chair** [1] - 120:9 92:29, 93:2, 93:4, chaired [1] - 107:18 93:7, 93:10, 93:13, Chairman [61] - 7:5, 93:17, 93:21, 93:23, 7:16, 8:5, 8:28, 10:28, 94:1. 94:6. 97:1. 97:3. 11:1, 12:7, 13:22, 97:7, 97:9, 97:11, 14:12, 15:3, 15:27, 97:13, 97:15, 97:19,

100:27, 100:28,

101:16

16:17, 16:18, 23:19,

97:22, 97:24, 98:7,

98:10, 98:12, 98:18,	189:1, 190:7, 190:10,	47:24, 47:29, 86:2,	136:14, 145:22,	14:8, 30:16, 79:8,
98:20, 98:23, 99:13,	190:15, 190:18	86:12, 86:15, 86:23,	155:14	79:9, 84:2, 155:8,
100:5, 100:12,	Chairperson [5] -	86:24, 86:27, 87:24,	circumstances [5] -	167:8
100:14, 100:16,	15:18, 15:20, 35:4,	90:10, 91:7, 94:24,	25:29, 27:13, 62:28,	colleagues' [1] -
100:25, 100:29,	41:12, 152:6	95:2, 96:6, 97:7, 97:8,	149:10, 178:20	94:25
101:10, 101:14,	chance [2] - 13:17,	97:9, 98:3, 99:28,	citing [2] - 10:2,	collect [1] - 128:18
101:17, 101:22,	165:19	100:17, 100:18,	11:25	collectively [1] -
101:24, 102:4,	chances [1] - 157:10	100:21, 101:8,	claiming [1] - 66:13	134:22
102:12, 120:4, 120:6,	change [13] - 9:7,	101:11, 101:14,	claims [15] - 38:7,	colliding [1] - 117:26
120:12, 120:15,	9:15, 13:2, 51:28,	101:15, 108:2, 108:9,	86:11, 86:16, 86:17,	column [1] - 100:7
120:12, 120:13,	65:3, 65:4, 65:14,	108:10, 108:14,	86:20, 86:27, 88:26,	combined [1] - 77:6
120:25, 120:29,	65:21, 65:23, 66:1,	108:18, 109:10,	94:21, 94:22, 95:4,	comfortable [8] -
121:3, 121:7, 121:11,	83:26, 91:21, 136:10	111:12, 123:10,	95:13, 95:15, 96:3,	48:22, 50:17, 51:5,
121:16, 122:3, 122:8,	changed [4] - 65:12,	123:13, 123:25,	187:3	51:8, 51:18, 54:10,
122:11, 122:14,	151:16, 151:25	137:24, 137:25,	clarification [4] -	81:13, 83:11
122:17, 122:20,	changes [6] - 65:8,	139:29, 187:27,	27:27, 94:4, 132:4,	coming [8] - 24:23,
122:22, 122:26,	67:27, 68:20, 79:3,	188:12, 188:13	152:7	42:22, 51:19, 54:13,
128:15, 128:17,	133:25	checked [14] - 22:15,	clarified [1] - 24:14	101:24, 132:4,
128:19, 128:23,	changing [1] - 155:1	24:13, 86:20, 88:14,	clarify [10] - 15:26,	132:12, 169:13
128:27, 135:18,	channel [2] - 129:24,	90:16, 95:24, 97:18,	53:5, 55:6, 96:14,	commence [1] - 62:9
140:27, 140:29,	132:9	100:16, 100:24,	96:16, 96:24, 152:22,	commenced [2] -
141:11, 141:17,	channeled [1] -	117:5, 139:16,	153:26, 161:6, 172:25	129:4, 129:7
141:22, 141:26,	105:27	139:25, 188:16,	clarifying [1] - 54:10	•
142:6, 142:19,	channelled [1] -	188:21	clarity [3] - 16:18,	commencing [1] - 8:10
142:23, 142:27,	106:3	checking [11] -	113:14, 132:5	commendations [1]
143:1, 144:12,	channels [1] -	90:29, 95:19, 96:2,	classification [2] -	- 60:4
144:16, 149:14,	131:15	96:18, 100:10,	134:28, 151:11	comment [4] - 54:12,
149:18, 152:5, 152:8,	character [1] - 183:5	100:23, 101:6, 101:7,	classified [1] - 149:2	64:14, 78:13, 90:8
153:7, 153:10,	characterise [1] -	112:17, 134:27, 159:2	clear [28] - 12:18,	commentary [1] -
153:16, 153:21,	79:20	checkpoint [1] -	15:4, 15:9, 21:25,	109:17
153:24, 153:26,	charge [54] - 18:27,	188:18	26:14, 26:18, 26:23,	commercial [3] -
153:29, 154:4,	19:12, 19:18, 19:29,	cherry [1] - 82:22	29:15, 30:14, 32:21,	96:7, 96:28, 98:1
154:10, 154:12,	24:24, 60:22, 60:23,	Chief [5] - 10:18,	33:4, 35:22, 37:3,	Commissioner [1] -
154:14, 154:17,	Z 1.Z 1, 00.ZZ, 00.Z0,			
154.14, 154.17,	64 5 68 13 68 16	16:8, 104:29, 180:22,		
154:14, 154:17, 154:23, 155:5, 155:7,	64:5, 68:13, 68:16, 103:6, 103:14	16:8, 104:29, 180:22, 187:18	38:12, 39:19, 39:24,	45:24
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16,	103:6, 103:14,		38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9]
154:23, 155:5, 155:7,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4,	187:18	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6,
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18,
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] -
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5,
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:1, 158:6,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] -
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:1, 158:6, 158:10, 158:14,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:1, 158:6, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] -
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:1, 158:6, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:1, 158:6, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:1, 158:6, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:10,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:1, 158:6, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:10, 160:14, 160:24,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] -
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:10, 160:14, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 162:26, 163:5,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] -	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] -
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:26, 156:15, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:10, 160:14, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 165:18, 165:21,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] - 183:14, 183:22,	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13 closely [1] - 46:8	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] - 158:25
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:26, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:48, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 165:21, 165:24, 165:24, 165:26,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16, 148:18, 148:19, 157:19, 157:20, 158:11, 162:7, 188:24	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] - 183:14, 183:22, 183:29	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13 closely [1] - 46:8 closer [3] - 8:16,	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] - 158:25 complaint [9] -
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:26, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:10, 160:14, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 162:26, 165:29, 171:17,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16, 148:18, 148:19, 157:19, 157:20,	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] - 183:14, 183:22, 183:29 chronological [2] -	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13 closely [1] - 46:8 closer [3] - 8:16, 120:8, 120:9	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] - 158:25 complaint [9] - 35:11, 38:5, 44:4,
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:26, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:10, 160:14, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 165:21, 165:24, 165:26, 165:29, 171:17, 171:23, 171:26,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16, 148:18, 148:19, 157:19, 157:20, 158:11, 162:7, 188:24	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] - 183:14, 183:22, 183:29 chronological [2] - 99:5, 112:7	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13 closely [1] - 46:8 closer [3] - 8:16, 120:8, 120:9 clue [1] - 89:6	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] - 158:25 complaint [9] - 35:11, 38:5, 44:4, 82:18, 145:4, 183:7,
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:26, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:10, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 162:26, 163:5, 165:24, 165:29, 171:17, 171:23, 171:26, 172:5, 172:11,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16, 148:18, 148:19, 157:19, 157:20, 158:11, 162:7, 188:24 Charleton [1] - 37:5	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] - 183:14, 183:22, 183:29 chronological [2] - 99:5, 112:7 chronologically [1] -	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13 closely [1] - 46:8 closer [3] - 8:16, 120:8, 120:9 clue [1] - 89:6 CO [2] - 2:13, 4:4	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] - 158:25 complaint [9] - 35:11, 38:5, 44:4,
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:26, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:12, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:10, 160:14, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 162:26, 163:5, 165:18, 165:21, 165:24, 165:26, 165:29, 171:17, 171:23, 171:26, 172:5, 175:29,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16, 148:18, 148:19, 157:19, 157:20, 158:11, 162:7, 188:24 Charleton [1] - 37:5 CHARLTON [1] - 4:8	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] - 183:14, 183:22, 183:29 chronological [2] - 99:5, 112:7 chronologically [1] - 21:13	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13 closely [1] - 46:8 closer [3] - 8:16, 120:8, 120:9 clue [1] - 89:6 CO [2] - 2:13, 4:4 coaching [1] - 75:5	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] - 158:25 complaint [9] - 35:11, 38:5, 44:4, 82:18, 145:4, 183:7, 186:14, 187:13, 187:18
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:12, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:8, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 162:26, 163:5, 165:24, 165:24, 165:26, 172:5, 172:11, 175:27, 175:29, 176:4, 176:6, 178:6, 178:6, 178:6, 179:29, 176:4, 176:6, 178:	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16, 148:18, 148:19, 157:19, 157:20, 158:11, 162:7, 188:24 Charleton [1] - 37:5 CHARLTON [1] - 4:8 chats [1] - 77:22 CHEALLACHÁIN [1] - 2:30	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] - 183:14, 183:22, 183:29 chronological [2] - 99:5, 112:7 chronologically [1] - 21:13 circular [1] - 19:23	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13 closely [1] - 46:8 closer [3] - 8:16, 120:8, 120:9 clue [1] - 89:6 CO [2] - 2:13, 4:4 coaching [1] - 75:5 code [1] - 120:1	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] - 158:25 complaint [9] - 35:11, 38:5, 44:4, 82:18, 145:4, 183:7, 186:14, 187:13,
154:23, 155:5, 155:7, 155:13, 155:16, 155:18, 155:20, 156:26, 156:15, 156:18, 156:22, 156:25, 156:28, 157:3, 157:9, 157:16, 157:18, 157:26, 158:10, 158:14, 158:17, 158:29, 159:10, 159:13, 159:16, 159:19, 160:1, 160:24, 160:28, 161:28, 162:26, 163:5, 165:29, 171:17, 171:23, 171:26, 172:5, 175:29,	103:6, 103:14, 103:28, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:29, 107:16, 110:24, 112:25, 116:7, 116:13, 118:9, 118:11, 118:12, 118:29, 121:9, 123:26, 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 133:2, 133:8, 140:18, 140:21, 140:22, 140:23, 141:5, 147:29, 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16, 148:18, 148:19, 157:19, 157:20, 158:11, 162:7, 188:24 Charleton [1] - 37:5 CHARLTON [1] - 4:8 chats [1] - 77:22 CHEALLACHÁIN [1]	187:18 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [22] - 10:23, 12:7, 12:27, 13:23, 14:6, 14:11, 14:21, 15:21, 43:2, 48:8, 49:2, 54:22, 59:28, 82:12, 107:7, 110:26, 114:11, 125:25, 127:18, 129:12, 138:12, 189:23 choice [1] - 62:9 chose [2] - 22:5, 24:3 Christmas [3] - 183:14, 183:22, 183:29 chronological [2] - 99:5, 112:7 chronologically [1] - 21:13	38:12, 39:19, 39:24, 64:7, 70:28, 75:11, 75:14, 94:11, 94:19, 97:3, 137:14, 148:6, 173:9, 182:1, 185:4 clearly [10] - 39:25, 40:22, 52:23, 69:21, 69:26, 70:21, 72:14, 83:5, 83:20, 137:8 clerical [6] - 105:23, 105:28, 112:13, 129:28, 132:11 clerk [4] - 85:24, 85:26, 107:4, 137:29 clip [1] - 138:10 close [2] - 22:16, 78:13 closely [1] - 46:8 closer [3] - 8:16, 120:8, 120:9 clue [1] - 89:6 CO [2] - 2:13, 4:4 coaching [1] - 75:5 code [1] - 120:1 cognisant [1] - 75:16	45:24 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Committee [1] - 38:23 common [4] - 132:5, 147:29, 148:26, 149:4 communicated [2] - 32:22, 158:10 community [3] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27 COMPANY [1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 92:17 complained [2] - 58:12, 186:8 complaining [1] - 158:25 complaint [9] - 35:11, 38:5, 44:4, 82:18, 145:4, 183:7, 186:14, 187:13, 187:18 complaints [4] -

complete [4] -116:15, 134:3, 174:26, 177:16 completed [2] - 98:6, 143.19 completely [2] -56:17, 142:24 completeness [1] -141:19 **complex** [3] - 134:8, 165:12, 165:15 complied [1] -150:12 complying [1] -179:22 comprehensive[1] -147.15 computer [2] - 91:6, 91:23 concedes [1] - 24:25 concentrate [1] -10:15 concern [10] - 12:20, 24:7, 24:11, 24:29, 58:24, 145:21, 182:16, 183:17, 185:19, 189:28 concerned [18] -22:19, 49:12, 55:25, 59:22, 59:25, 60:2, 60:20, 69:5, 141:28, 142:24, 144:3, 158:20, 159:23, 181:24, 182:28, 183:4, 187:23, 189:7 concerning [6] -45:12, 45:18, 54:23, 80:4, 80:15, 180:14 concerns [7] - 14:23, 21:16, 60:4, 60:11, 64:10, 183:18, 184:4 concise [6] - 68:13, 115:8, 116:21, 118:1, 140:18, 140:26 conclude [1] - 81:28 condoned [1] -182:23 conduct [1] - 38:5 conducted [4] - 44:5, 85:14, 87:23, 96:22 conduit [4] - 47:11, 47:19, 104:7, 106:10 conference[1] -107:20 confidante [2] - 48:6, confident [1] -170:28 confidential [2] -

9:19, 179:4

confine [2] - 40:26, 61:10 confined [3] - 38:28, 40:25, 69:28 confinement [1] -69:18 confining [1] - 60:11 confirm [5] - 28:15, 33:23, 34:20, 130:29, 180.12 confirmed [6] -22:15, 22:17, 26:6, 27:23, 41:26, 57:11 confirming [1] -183:7 conflict [2] - 48:11, confuse [1] - 101:2 confused [1] - 27:18 confusion [1] -122:28 congratulations [1] -92:4 **CONLON** [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT [1] -4:3 connection [1] -68:24 connections [1] -68:27 CONNELLAN[2] -4:1. 4:1 CONOR [1] - 3:24 conscious [2] - 8:19, consensus [1] -134:25 consent [1] - 175:11 consequently [1] consider [5] - 32:1, 40:4, 51:10, 170:19, 171:3 consideration [2] -151:29, 156:6 considered [4] -55:29, 56:26, 156:9, 178:15 considering [3] -72:27, 93:24, 109:28 constantly [1] - 41:3 consult [4] - 61:14,

158:7, 182:17, 184:11

contact [15] - 20:29,

22:9, 23:22, 23:25,

50:24, 78:6, 91:11,

103:23, 104:6,

124:21, 168:28,

consulted [2] -

61:11, 180:27

171:10, 182:6, 184:11, 184:14 contacted [3] - 33:5, 176:25, 177:25 contacting [1] -169.3 contain [1] - 122:10 contained [3] -47:25, 64:16, 151:22 contains [1] - 139:7 content [8] - 11:7, 49:16, 53:18, 125:12, 126:9, 130:21, 131:17, 137:10 contention [1] -53:11 context [11] - 11:8, 11:21, 35:17, 63:23, 64:23, 64:27, 88:13. 94:20, 94:21, 94:24, 148:4 continue [6] - 30:1, 47:4, 57:21, 58:11, 163:4, 169:22 continued [1] - 78:19 continues [1] - 177:3 continuing [2] -51:3, 58:10 continuity [1] -130:15 contribute [1] -135:11 contributed [1] -107:14 control [1] - 134:27 conversation [46] -10:28, 11:7, 12:1, 12:2, 12:5, 12:18, 14:10, 14:12, 15:10, 17:23, 17:24, 17:26, 21:25, 25:18, 29:16, 43:22, 49:20, 52:18, 52:24, 53:1, 53:12, 53:18, 54:8, 54:9, 55:12, 55:23, 55:26, 56:3, 56:6, 56:12, 57:5, 58:3, 61:1, 62:15, 64:21, 81:4, 92:10, 92:12, 123:15, 134:25, 144:6, 171:4, 171:6, 174:12, 176:6, 176.13 conversations [10] -43:9, 43:27, 61:5, 62:1, 62:16, 62:19, 62:26, 79:26, 123:9, 124:4 converse[1] - 84:4 coordinates [1] -

cope [1] - 77:21 copies [1] - 41:26 copious [1] - 49:13 copper [1] - 147:9 Coppinger [2] -167:10, 178:21 COPPINGER [1] copy [3] - 60:29, 68:14, 173:7 core[1] - 106:17 correct [90] - 7:21, 7:24, 7:26, 8:27, 9:12, 10:20, 10:26, 12:12, 13:1, 14:1, 18:8, 18:12, 21:24, 21:27, 24:1, 28:22, 28:26, 30:13, 34:4, 35:7, 36:11, 36:12, 37:5, 37:6, 40:22, 73:10, 85:11, 85:16, 86:14, 89:18, 94:14, 94:17, 94:23, 94:26, 95:3, 99:7, 99:11, 100:1, 102:24, 103:3, 103:9, 104:10, 121:19, 121:28, 134:28, 137:1, 141:8, 146:27, 146:28, 150:24, 154:27, 162:10, 162:16, 163:13, 163:20, 164:29, 165:3, 165:5, 166:10, 169:11, 171:18, 171:22, 172:25, 175:20. 176:4. 176:22, 177:22, 177:27, 180:10, 180:26, 182:4, 182:25, 182:26, 183:10, 184:1, 185:3, 185:4, 187:15, 187:16, 187:20, 187:29, 188:2, 188:3. 188:6. 189:14. 189:15, 189:29, 190:1, 190:3, 190:4 corrected [1] - 154:5 correctly [3] - 88:16, 99:29, 131:1 corresponded [1] -188:13 correspondence [26] - 13:14, 26:24, 26:27, 26:28. 27:1. 27:9. 27:10, 27:22, 35:25,

38:8, 76:28, 77:2,

111:5, 129:22,

129:24, 131:15,

77:7, 106:3, 106:11,

157:16

131:24, 132:9, 142:1, 143:13, 149:4, 173:26, 189:22 **corridor** [1] - 63:26 corroborative [1] -146:19 COSTELLO [1] -2:22 counsel [2] - 32:18, 41:25 counter [3] - 72:2, 79:5, 123:24 countermand [1] -172.13 countersigned [1] couple [10] - 13:10, 13:21, 94:4, 134:13, 138:10, 139:4, 145:1, 151:26, 153:26, 170:27 coupled [1] - 167:29 course [23] - 14:9, 35:10, 35:14, 41:4, 41:6. 42:6. 47:18. 49:24, 51:24, 52:18, 56:3, 75:6, 80:8, 84:9, 105:14, 110:11, 117:8, 124:29, 133:3, 137:19, 165:2, 180:24, 181:14 **COURT** [3] - 1:13, 2:3, 4:2 cover [2] - 42:27, 108:18 covered [3] - 14:18, 73:2, 73:3 Create [1] - 150:19 create [1] - 118:21 created [2] - 54:4, 120:20 creating [1] - 67:29 credibility [1] -135:10 creep [1] - 65:25 crime [13] - 8:9, 17:14, 17:17, 30:6, 57:26, 58:17, 61:17, 65:11, 135:3, 145:16, 146:22, 150:23, 151:5 crime/drug [1] criminal [1] - 59:24 criminality [1] -69.13 critical [9] - 115:7, 134:5, 136:14, 137:5, 144:22, 147:26, 154:20, 155:26,

criticised [1] - 143:4 criticising [1] - 142:1 criticism [6] - 34:3, 59:23, 73:20, 74:18, 158:23, 167:19 criticisms [1] -139-29 CROSS [14] - 5:6, 5:7, 5:13, 5:19, 5:21, 5:26, 5:27, 25:10, 28:10, 67:9, 88:4, 98:25, 135:20, 144:18 cross [5] - 40:29, 41:2, 46:9, 46:13, 46.14 cross-examination [2] - 40:29, 41:2 **CROSS-EXAMINED** [14] - 5:6, 5:7, 5:13, 5:19, 5:21, 5:26, 5:27, 25:10, 28:10, 67:9, 88:4, 98:25, 135:20, 144:18 crossover [1] - 9:16 crucial [1] - 125:8 **CUALÁIN** [1] - 3:7 Cualáin [3] - 11:20, 45:21, 45:24 Cullen [1] - 38:13 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 culminating [1] **culprits** [1] - 165:13 **curious** [1] - 124:8 Curley [37] - 8:12, 68:15, 116:23, 117:6, 123:16, 126:24, 130:6, 131:1, 161:19, 163:26, 164:7, 164:11, 164:20, 165:9, 166:5, 166:21, 167:21, 168:12, 169:4, 169:13, 169:21, 170:1, 171:2, 171:6, 171:19, 172:8, 172:16, 172:19, 173:19, 175:18, 175:25, 176:2, 176:10. 177:12. 179:12, 179:14, 181:8 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 Curley's [2] - 178:9, 178:16 **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 Curran [2] - 180:22, 187.18 custody [4] - 118:13, 123:26, 123:28, 148:8 cut [1] - 141:11

D

D/Branch [1] - 114:7 D/sergeant [10] -116:23. 131:1. 166:21, 169:21, 170:9, 171:6, 174:13, 177:12, 179:22, 181:8 daily [4] - 62:18, 65:10, 165:15 Daly [1] - 38:24 data [2] - 125:22, 134:27 date [36] - 18:23, 20:19, 35:22, 38:10, 38:15, 38:25, 39:2, 41:28, 42:2, 49:6, 49:8, 49:16, 74:4, 86:6, 108:11, 109:18, 111:7, 113:4, 113:11, 113:22, 127:28, 133:4, 134:3, 138:4, 151:13, 151:22, 165:18. 176:12. 176:14, 178:5, 188:15, 188:22, 189:3 dated [5] - 60:10, 135:26, 152:14, 164:28, 176:1 dates [3] - 39:15, 133:28, 153:9 daughter [1] - 75:28 DAVID [2] - 2:28, 3:18 **DAVIS**[1] - 2:8 **DAY** [1] - 1:18 day's [1] - 132:29 day-to-day [1] -120:2 days [15] - 11:27, 13:21, 77:5, 104:3, 114:4, 129:27, 160:7, 160:11, 160:12, 160:15. 179:13 deal [20] - 11:5, 12:8, 15:7, 15:12, 15:16, 21:23, 26:25, 39:1, 40:21, 41:19, 43:7, 43:25, 63:18, 64:10, 95:16, 98:12, 119:12, 140:11, 158:27, 181:26 dealing [13] - 14:14, 15:5, 26:18, 26:22, 27:15, 27:17, 53:29,

61:18, 72:22, 75:19,

dealings [5] - 9:5,

10:7, 12:24, 42:28,

126:18, 163:22, 187:2

76:29 deals [3] - 61:7, 68:7, 71:20 dealt [5] - 72:23, 83:1, 96:13, 142:2, 189.24 deceased [1] - 94:16 December [10] -7:28, 9:17, 9:29, 10:12, 11:23, 44:17, 85:10, 183:12, 187:19, 189:3 **DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 decide [3] - 74:12, 158:6. 180:8 decided [1] - 65:29 decision [14] - 51:21, 61:9, 61:11, 61:14, 62:1, 63:12, 66:29, 134:14, 170:15, 170:17, 170:24, 179:24, 180:17, 180:23 decisions [2] -125:22, 151:23 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:5 decline [1] - 74:1 declined [1] - 75:25 default [1] - 109:8 deferral [1] - 164:3 defined [1] - 47:13 definitely [8] - 32:3, 47:13, 68:23, 72:21, 111:18, 112:5, 123:21, 147:14 degree [2] - 128:9, 155.21 delay [2] - 127:17, 187:2 delayed [1] - 189:29 delegated [1] -118:25 demand [1] - 188:20 demeanour [1] -61:23 demonstrates [1] -40.1 Department [1] -41:29 dependent [1] -47:27 depute [2] - 168:1, 168:4 deputed [1] - 166:12 deputise [2] - 59:20, 172:17 deputy [1] - 157:19 describe [4] -106:24, 147:11,

described [8] -43:17, 59:12, 62:22, 72:10, 77:28, 106:11, 156:10, 178:10 description [3] -139:11, 139:19, 154:25 descriptions [1] -128.5 desire [1] - 40:12 desk [4] - 62:27, 62:29, 88:27, 118:15 **DESMOND** [1] - 4:6 detail [20] - 52:16, 58:18, 113:20, 116:13, 126:4, 126:26, 126:28, 127:18, 128:1, 128:7, 129:9, 130:28, 131:21, 138:22, 154:20, 158:27, 158:29, 159:8, 160:18, 188:16 detailed [4] - 60:15, 129:3, 130:26, 159:8 details [15] - 86:16, 86:21, 91:10, 97:21, 97:24, 108:15. 113:22, 126:25, 127:1, 128:3, 128:4, 130:9, 139:8, 139:13, 187:23 DETECTIVE [10] -3:4, 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17, 5:3, 7:11, 25:10, 28:10, 35:1 **Detective** [22] - 7:7, 8:11, 68:15, 117:5, 123:15, 126:24, 130:6, 161:19, 164:20, 165:8, 166:5, 167:10, 167:20, 169:4, 171:2, 171:19, 172:8, 172:16, 173:19, 175:17, 178:16, 178:21 detective [30] - 7:14, 7:17, 7:19, 8:13, 8:14, 10:16, 15:17, 15:29, 16:21, 17:2, 17:15,

17:22, 18:4, 21:13,

22:20, 23:27, 24:11,

25:2, 41:24, 106:29,

169:15, 173:2, 174:25

DEVELOPMENT [1]

development [1] -

107:11, 107:12,

107:13, 134:18,

145:28, 149:24,

- 3:16

DIARMAID[1] - 2:6 diary [1] - 183:13 dictate [1] - 75:10 difference [5] -80:14. 81:19. 81:24. 81:27, 186:19 different [22] - 9:6, 47:28, 63:29, 64:24, 65:7, 70:5, 76:14, 100:19, 100:28, 103:24, 103:27, 103:28, 118:13, 122:25, 126:8, 138:2, 146:23, 151:8, 155:2, 179:23, 185:9 differently [1] -66:26 difficult [4] - 62:23, 69:4, 78:28, 171:10 difficulties [8] -31:18, 31:20, 44:29, 62:3, 73:9, 168:27, 169:1, 171:15 difficulty [11] - 30:8, 48:29, 50:6, 51:3, 57:28, 70:2, 75:21, 97:29, 169:3, 171:20, 171:23 digest [1] - 136:21 **DIGNAM**[1] - 3:24 digs [1] - 39:10 dim [1] - 122:27 direct [4] - 38:28, 103:22, 133:6, 135:13 direct-evidence [1] directed [4] - 84:6, 104:24, 169:10, 179:15 direction [18] -45:23, 57:12, 60:10, 61:2, 66:25, 114:21, 114:24, 114:27, 131:28, 161:7, 161:8, 162:11, 170:11, 170:17, 170:19, 174:4, 179:11, 179:19 directions [1] - 47:8 directive [11] -115:15, 118:5, 123:4, 128:6, 135:25, 136:6, 136:16, 136:20, 136:27, 137:12, 140:8 directly [6] - 30:25, 50:26, 103:16, 103:28, 183:3, 185:27 **DIRECTLY** [10] - 5:5, 5:12, 5:18, 5:25, 6:3, 7:12, 42:18, 85:5,

123:17

181:28, 182:20

56:9, 56:24, 58:4, 102:17, 163:9 documents [17] -4:9, 4:13 e-mailed [9] - 19:13, **DIRECTLY-**64:22, 86:9, 105:17, 23:1, 88:8, 89:8, due [8] - 41:6, 42:6, 20:2, 125:7, 125:11, **EXAMINED** [10] - 5:5, 114:10, 115:16, 89:14, 89:19, 89:27, 49:24, 84:9, 114:5, 125:13, 129:15, 5:12, 5:18, 5:25, 6:3, 125:2, 138:27, 166:6, 177:6, 188:17 90:14, 92:7, 92:13, 130:23, 150:13, 7:12, 42:18, 85:5, 164:23, 166:17, 92:15, 92:25, 93:19, during [14] - 8:22, 156:21 167:20, 174:29, 114:23, 188:2, 102:17, 163:9 45:8, 45:12, 46:2, e-mailing [2] - 126:9, **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 184:15 188:20, 188:26, 46:20, 51:24, 52:18, 137:5 discussions [2] -DIRECTORATE [1] -190:13 56:2, 58:3, 59:24, e-mails [3] - 110:28, 80:9, 80:12 **DONAL** [9] - 3:7, 65:1, 71:29, 79:5, 111:4. 137:27 3:15 disagree [4] - 14:6, disposed [1] - 47:9 3:24, 5:27, 93:29, 166:1 **EAMON**[1] - 3:10 146:9, 170:5, 170:6 dispute [2] - 15:28, 144:14, 144:19, duties [5] - 46:28, Eamon [1] - 8:11 disagreement [1] -49:19 144:21, 149:16, 48:14, 60:11, 60:15, early [6] - 10:19, 155:22 **disputes** [1] - 17:8 149.19 62:11 31:22, 62:8, 110:2, done [8] - 15:15, dissatisfaction [1] duty [49] - 19:2, disappointment [1] -117:16. 158:7 65:17, 66:3, 126:17, 19:17, 19:25, 19:27, 125:11 ease [1] - 26:2 125:13 139:27, 145:29, 61:10, 61:20, 62:2, discernible [2] distance [1] - 183:26 easier [2] - 8:19, 169:29, 185:3 distant [1] - 79:28 63:4, 63:14, 66:29, 65:3, 65:15 dormant [1] - 130:17 68:10, 69:18, 69:28, disciplinary [1] distinct [4] - 48:26, easily [2] - 169:1, dossier [2] - 38:20, 70:1, 83:15, 103:27, 48:29, 57:5, 62:17 188:25 169:5 104:2, 110:7, 110:11, distinction [1] -38:21 discipline [1] - 189:9 **easy** [1] - 69:2 double [1] - 133:7 110:17, 110:23, 185:12 effect [6] - 60:14, disciplining [1] -112:29, 116:4, 117:6, 189-6 district [30] - 7:28, doubt [4] - 62:20, 70:18, 74:9, 149:24, 117:11, 117:27, 81:26, 148:18, 176:13 disclosed [1] - 49:1 24:18, 60:27, 68:4, 174:17 123:6, 123:11, doubts [1] - 69:9 68:14, 85:24, 85:26, disclosure [19] effectively [6] - 10:6, down [33] - 8:2, 9:13, 124:15, 132:29, 105:25 106:12 24:5, 32:14, 38:7, 9:24, 19:13, 35:26, 140:15, 143:14, 107:2, 107:4, 107:26, 17:18, 18:13, 18:28, 36:28, 37:10, 37:12, 64.5 119.11 143:22, 143:27, 42:29, 50:14, 66:14, 108:4, 109:6, 116:22, 24:23, 28:29, 30:4, efforts [2] - 84:8, 152:24, 153:29, 120:21, 129:26, 36:20. 44:9. 54:19. 69:1, 78:19, 83:26, 130:28 157:1, 157:13, 57:25, 58:16, 58:29, 136:5, 140:19, 104:14, 110:14, **EGAN**[1] - 3:25 157:20, 157:22, 144:28, 161:9, 59:27, 61:7, 63:26, 163:17, 181:12, either [22] - 9:25, 157:24, 159:11, 161:10, 161:15, 73:8, 74:7, 79:21, 181:22, 185:20, 45:5, 47:18, 60:5, 159:13, 160:3, 82:24, 101:4, 122:3, 185:22 161:16, 161:21, 68:11, 75:25, 77:5, 178:18, 183:3, 185:6, 160:15, 160:16, 139:17, 147:7, 147:8, DISCLOSURES [2] -93:4, 104:17, 116:3, 160:17, 161:27, 185:8, 186:10 152:23, 159:22, 1:2, 1:3 120:26, 140:16, 188:16 **DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 162:4, 177:3, 178:29, 157:29, 165:2, 170:2, disclosures [5] duty.. [1] - 115:20 division [2] - 8:2, 182:19 48:16, 77:29, 80:2, 172:19, 172:23, dwell [1] - 75:19 **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, 188.1 175:17, 180:11, 83:4. 83:20 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 divisions [1] -3:20 discomfort [2] -183:2, 187:9, 189:17 dozen [1] - 86:20 158:12 81:4, 81:18 **elaborate** [1] - 72:6 Е **DPP**[3] - 30:5, discouraged [1] -**DMT** [1] - 128:21 elaborates [1] - 76:4 **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:6 57:26, 58:17 62:10 ELIZABETH [1] -DR [1] - 3:11 discovered [2] document [24] -2:29 e-mail [41] - 20:13, dramatic [1] - 65:21 21:14, 22:8, 28:27, 68:11, 140:16 elsewhere [1] -68:13, 68:14, 82:6, dramatically [2] -28:29, 31:2, 31:3, discrediting [1] -165:22 111:20, 116:21, 79:3, 151:25 31:4, 35:18, 35:19, 66.9 **em** [1] - 157:14 116:22, 117:4, 82:3, 82:9, 82:22, draw [2] - 32:29, discrepancies [1] emails [1] - 108:10 118:21, 119:3, 119:4, 108:27, 116:17, 108:23 96:10 emanated [1] - 26:28 126:16, 127:3, 119:22, 120:15, drawn [1] - 29:3 discuss [7] - 28:19, embark [1] - 37:24 140:18, 143:6, 143:8, 121:17, 123:1, drill [1] - 122:15 29:7, 33:13, 52:11, emerging [1] -143:16, 143:26, 124:26, 132:22, drink [1] - 62:3 53:22, 184:20, 189:16 163:28 144:5, 145:22, 135:24, 146:4, drinking [2] - 43:11, discussed [15] -**EMMA**[1] - 3:26 145:25, 147:13, 150:18, 152:13 11:26, 16:28, 48:23, 78:23 emphasis [1] -148:26, 155:15, documentary [1] -49:19, 50:2, 50:7, driver [1] - 70:14 137:10 155:16, 156:16, Driving [1] - 187:27 51:2, 52:16, 56:13, 156:20, 156:28, emptied [1] - 77:16 documentation [9] -79:8, 105:13, 164:20, driving [1] - 188:9 empty [1] - 76:26 156:29, 157:5, 10:22, 12:14, 22:29, 172:23, 184:6, 187:9 drugs [1] - 8:9 enable [2] - 155:8, 157:23, 158:8, 31:1, 104:7, 122:2, discussing [2] drunk [1] - 79:25 156:25 158:13, 158:14, 123:3, 135:7, 188:28 53:4, 53:24 dual [1] - 106:9 encountered [1] -161:7, 161:8, 161:15, documenting [1] discussion [18] -**DUBLIN** [7] - 1:17, 161:17, 161:22, 66:15 17:9, 39:25, 52:19, 169:27 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, 173:3, 173:11 encouraged [1] -

especially [1] -	104:24, 127:5	expectation [1] -	facing [1] - 54:1
123:11	exactly [10] - 30:24,	136:13	fact [23] - 22:22,
essence [1] - 39:11	34:24, 54:18, 81:15,	expectations [1] -	30:15, 31:17, 34:20,
	130:26, 140:5,	147:25	34:22, 35:5, 50:7,
established [1] -	172:10, 172:15,	expected [2] -	75:19, 75:24, 87:17,
	172:25, 181:20		114:20, 144:2,
		•	145:22, 151:20,
1:7	145:10		163:28, 163:29,
estimate [1] - 144:29	examination [2] -		164:5, 166:7, 170:24,
	40:29, 41:2		177:6, 177:28, 181:6,
	EXAMINATION [16] -		181:7
			factor [1] - 69:26
	41:22, 67:5, 71:4,	1	factors [1] - 147:26
	84:16, 87:29, 93:27,		facts [2] - 38:29,
	98:16, 101:20,		117:26
_	135:16, 144:10,	• •	factual [1] - 186:5
	152:3, 153:19, 162:24	-	failure [6] - 130:19,
	EXAMINED [34] -		143:5, 143:12,
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8,		143:26, 143:27, 144:4
, ,	5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:18,		fair [6] - 23:27,
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	5:19, 5:20, 5:21, 5:25,	150:11	48:16, 65:6, 74:27,
	5:26, 5:27, 5:28, 5:30,		95:9, 144:2
•			fairly [2] - 93:23,
,			159:22
, ,			fairness [5] - 73:7,
			73:21, 73:23, 75:9,
	135:20, 144:18,		186:12
	152:10, 161:3, 163:9		faith [1] - 49:15
	example [3] - 9:29,		fall [5] - 77:1, 95:14,
	25:28, 104:22		116:3, 116:10
	except [1] - 59:6		fallen [1] - 116:1
	excess [1] - 40:7		falls [1] - 118:2
	excessive [3] - 33:8,		familiar [2] - 114:25,
	181:25, 186:7		115:2
	excessively [2] -	1	familiarise [1] - 82:8
	26:16, 27:20		family's [1] - 68:24
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	exchanges [1] -		FANNING [1] - 2:21
	133:16	,	far [7] - 39:29, 47:28,
	excited [5] - 72:11,		69:5, 76:8, 126:3,
	72:16, 74:7, 74:22,		129:13, 183:22
	75:4		Farrell [9] - 50:1,
	exclusion [1] - 66:15	-, -	53:2, 60:29, 68:15,
111:25, 114:11,	exclusively [2] -		79:9, 105:13, 116:23,
114:14, 114:17,	16:5, 95:15		161:18, 183:2
117:12, 119:10,	EXECUTIVE [1] -		FARRELL [1] - 4:5
	3:13		fashion [4] - 39:12,
124:26, 127:19,	exercise [3] - 24:5,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	65:18, 120:2, 145:19
130:2, 133:21,			fault [1] - 72:20
			favour [1] - 114:8
144:22, 148:21,	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		favoured [1] - 104:2
163:4, 163:12,	· ·		FCPS [1] - 188:24
163:21, 163:25,			fear [1] - 39:13
163:26, 163:28,	exits [1] - 86:4	82:23, 120:27	feature [1] - 20:3
164:5, 165:1, 173:10,	expand [1] - 139 15	overadited (4)	Echricanica 0.10
164:5, 165:1, 173:10, 173:12, 176:22, 187:5	expand [1] - 139:15 expansive [1] -	extradited [1] -	February [3] - 8:10,
	expansive[1] -	extradited [1] - 165:14	8:24, 44:17
173:12, 176:22, 187:5	expansive [1] - 140:5	165:14	8:24, 44:17 FEBRUARY [2] - 1:5,
173:12, 176:22, 187:5 evident [2] - 150:6,	expansive[1] - 140:5 expect[7] - 40:7,		8:24, 44:17 FEBRUARY [2] - 1:5, 1:9
173:12, 176:22, 187:5 evident [2] - 150:6, 150:7	expansive[1] - 140:5 expect [7] - 40:7, 40:8, 147:23, 150:1,	165:14	8:24, 44:17 FEBRUARY [2] - 1:5, 1:9 fed [1] - 110:28
173:12, 176:22, 187:5 evident [2] - 150:6, 150:7 evolutionary [1] -	expansive[1] - 140:5 expect[7] - 40:7,	165:14	8:24, 44:17 FEBRUARY [2] - 1:5, 1:9
	123:11 essence [1] - 39:11 establish [1] - 38:11 established [1] - 151:6 ESTABLISHED [1] - 1:7 estimate [1] - 144:29 etcetera [5] - 43:1, 50:25, 59:16, 61:23, 187:28 evenhanded [1] - 66:3 evening [1] - 160:3 event [10] - 14:18, 15:12, 19:7, 49:18, 58:19, 62:17, 77:10, 77:11, 77:12, 189:27 events [6] - 10:17, 51:28, 85:29, 88:8, 108:21, 178:10 eventually [3] - 154:14, 159:22, 165:14 eventuate [1] - 186:17 EVIDENCE [1] - 1:8 evidence [68] - 10:23, 12:6, 12:16, 13:27, 14:2, 15:23, 17:22, 18:4, 21:22, 23:19, 24:22, 25:15, 30:25, 32:5, 32:15, 35:10, 35:14, 38:27, 38:28, 41:14, 42:25, 43:7, 43:13, 43:21, 43:24, 44:1, 46:27, 49:24, 61:4, 64:8, 72:24, 74:4, 74:20, 76:9, 89:8, 90:22, 95:18, 96:26, 110:27, 111:25, 114:11, 114:14, 114:17, 117:12, 119:10, 119:13, 124:25, 124:26, 127:19, 130:2, 133:21, 134:23, 135:7, 143:5, 144:22, 148:21, 163:4, 163:12, 163:21, 163:25,	exactly 10 - 30:24, essence 1 - 39:11 establish 1 - 38:11 established 1 - 151:6 ESTABLISHED 1 - 1:7 estimate 1 - 144:29 etcetera 5 - 43:1, 50:25, 59:16, 61:23, 187:28 evenhanded 1 - 66:3 eventig 1 - 160:3 eventig 1 - 160:3 eventig 1 - 160:3 eventig 5 - 10:17, 51:28, 85:29, 88:8, 18:21, 178:10 eventually 3 - 154:14, 159:22, 165:14 eventuate 1 - 18 evidence 68 - 10:23, 12:6, 12:16, 13:27, 14:2, 15:23, 17:22, 18:4, 21:22, 23:19, 24:22, 25:15, 30:25, 32:5, 32:15, 35:10, 35:14, 38:27, 38:28, 41:14, 42:25, 43:24, 44:1, 46:27, 49:24, 61:4, 64:8, 72:24, 74:4, 74:20, 76:9, 89:8, 90:22, 95:18, 96:26, 110:27, 111:25, 114:11, 114:14, 114:17, 117:12, 119:10, 119:13, 124:25, 134:23, 135:7, 143:5, 144:22, 148:21, 163:4, 163:12, 163:4, 163:25, exactly 10 - 30:24, 34:24, 54:18, 81:15, 130:26, 140:5, 172:10, 172:15, 172:10, 172:15, 172:10, 172:15, 172:20, 172:15, 172:10, 172:15, 172:10, 172:15, 172:10, 172:15, 172:20, 172:15, 172:10, 172:15, 145:10 examination 2 40:29, 41:2 EXAMINATION 16 - 25:6, 28:4, 34:26, 41:22, 67:5, 71:4, 84:16, 87:29, 93:27, 98:16, 101:20, 152:13, 15:14, 5:18, 5:19, 5:20, 5:21, 5:25, 5:26, 5:27, 5:28, 5:30, 6:3, 7:12, 25:10, 28:10, 315:1, 42:18, 16:2, 18:10 172:11, 172:1, 13:12, 145:10 145:10 140:29, 41:2 140:29, 41:2 15:10	20:11

fell [1] - 32:15 felt [28] - 12:23, 48:23, 51:2, 53:6, 53:8, 55:1, 55:2, 62:11, 65:29, 70:17, 70:26, 78:12, 81:8, 81:9, 83:10, 124:27, 126:3, 166:7, 168:22, 169:1, 176:17, 182:17, 183:20, 183:24, 184:13, 185:15, 189:23, 189:24 FERGAL [1] - 2:27 **FERRY** [1] - 2:16 festivals [1] - 90:1 few [12] - 11:13, 29:1, 32:17, 71:14, 71:19, 83:28, 93:11, 103:26, 143:5, 146:4, 190:11, 190:13 fight [1] - 51:20 file [18] - 30:6, 44:22, 47:6, 47:8, 47:14, 47:21, 47:25, 65:11, 131:27, 131:29, 166:23, 166:24, $172{:}28,\ 173{:}5,\ 173{:}7,$ 173:14, 173:17 files [14] - 15:7, 57:26, 58:17, 59:3, 59:16, 59:18, 59:27, 61:17, 76:23, 82:27, 86:15, 142:16, 149:4, 155:12 **filled** [4] - 18:6, 18:22, 63:10, 70:13 final [3] - 76:3, 96:13, 96:23 finally [2] - 69:17, 135:6 finance [22] - 86:7, 86:8, 86:10, 86:18, 86:28, 88:17, 88:19, 88:21, 88:26, 89:3, 89:15, 90:8, 90:16, 92:6, 92:27, 94:12, 94:15, 95:7, 95:11, 95:12, 95:16, 95:27 findings [2] - 180:8 fine [4] - 75:12, 83:1, 153:16, 155:19 finish [3] - 161:27, 161:29, 190:12 finished [2] - 117:15, 188:12 finishing [1] - 188:18 FINN [1] - 3:5 FINTAN [1] - 2:21 firearm [5] - 63:23,

firm [4] - 53:12, 53:15, 65:27, 69:14 first [40] - 8:29, 9:2, 14:13, 21:16, 21:18, 37:9, 42:28, 44:15, 49:4, 49:10, 53:16, 61:18, 70:12, 71:19, 72:7, 82:10, 85:19, 86:1, 88:10, 100:21, 100:22, 108:26, 112:5, 113:25, 115:1, 120:7, 122:4, 122:9, 130:24, 131:18, 132:3, 135:24, 141:14, 150:15, 155:7, 163:22, 165:7, 167:19, 173:24, 174:20 firstly [3] - 68:22, 69:21, 168:14 FITZWILLIAM [1] five [6] - 19:2, 157:8, 157:10, 157:12, 158:3, 161:19 fixed [2] - 63:14, 188:24 fled [2] - 139:20, 146:15 **FLYNN** [1] - 3:19 focus [1] - 57:14 focused [1] - 51:26 follow [6] - 20:14, 20:28, 21:10, 98:7, 155:5, 159:10 followed [2] - 82:13, 170:18 FOLLOWING [1] -1:4 following [21] - 1:25, 19:15, 19:21, 48:16, 75:28, 78:18, 80:1, 83:28, 87:18, 87:23, 97:1, 97:2, 98:3, 99:27, 108:24, 141:29, 143:25, 173:20, 176:29, 188:15 follows [1] - 140:12 FOLLOWS [20] - 7:1, 7:12, 25:11, 28:11, 35:2, 42:18, 67:10, 71:10, 85:5, 88:5,

94:9, 98:26, 102:8,

153:24, 161:4, 163:9

foot [1] - 180:25

102:17, 135:21,

144:19, 152:11,

63:28, 64:1, 64:3

firearms [1] - 63:25

footage [1] - 146:16 FOR [11] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 4:1, 4:4, 4:10, 102.7 force [2] - 70:18, 155:8 forced [1] - 56:1 forefront [1] - 25:1 forget [1] - 67:26 forgive [1] - 82:22 forgot [2] - 98:22, 160:22 form [10] - 18:21, 19:7, 58:15, 91:19, 100:6, 119:23, 132:19, 149:13, 149:26, 182:29 formal [4] - 61:26, 107:20, 114:13, 182:7 formally [3] - 21:17, 23:28, 185:16 formed [1] - 61:15 FORMER [2] - 1:13, **forms** [2] - 18:5, 18:6 forward [3] - 18:2, 84:8, 136:27 forwarded [6] -114:7, 131:16, 132:20, 149:27, 173:27, 181:10 four [6] - 38:8, 136:28, 159:11, 160:12, 160:13, 160.14 fourth [1] - 125:28 framework [1] -106:19 frank [1] - 58:23 $\textbf{free}\,{}_{[2]}\textbf{-}73{:}24,$ 101:24 freely [1] - 82:27 FREEMAN [1] - 2:22 frequency [1] - 46:1 frequent [1] - 78:5 frequented [1] -171:8 frequently [2] - 46:4, 131:26 Friday [5] - 104:3, 107:28, 108:17, 111:3. 129:29 Friday's [2] - 111:13,

132:13 **fruition** [1] - 75:5 frustrated [1] - 62:20 frustration [1] -62:23 frustrations [1] full [12] - 21:7, 22:22, 24:16, 62:21, 63:3, 63:8, 100:6, 109:9, 148:24, 159:20, 159:22, 159:24 full-time [5] - 21:7, 22:22, 24:16, 62:21, 63.8 fully [5] - 24:25, 50:16, 113:21, 117:7, 169:15 **function** [7] - 47:9, 105:22, 106:5, 106:7, 106:10, 106:17, 108:6 functional [1] - 63:10 functionality [1] -121:9 fundamental [1] -127:6 furnished [1] -147:24 $\textbf{FURTHER}\,{\tiny [2]}\textbf{-}5\text{:}21,$ 98:25 future [2] - 42:24, 175:14 G

gains [1] - 41:3 **Galway** [8] - 168:19, 171:6, 171:13, 173:17, 180:5, 180:11, 181:7, 181:10 game [1] - 70:8 **gaps** [1] - 155:24 **GARDA**[15] - 2:10, 2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2, 3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21, 4:10, 5:16, 85:4, 88:4, 94:8. 98:25 garda [14] - 22:9, 22:20, 39:22, 44:6, 46:24, 47:7, 100:9, 102:29, 107:8, 130:8, 140:25. 141:14. 150:2, 175:9 Garda [280] - 7:18, 8:8, 8:25, 9:5, 9:18, 10:12, 10:25, 11:3, 11:10, 11:24, 12:8, 12:21, 13:5, 13:6, 13:11, 13:24, 13:26,

13:28, 14:2, 14:23, 16:20, 16:26, 17:8, 17:10, 17:20, 17:24, 17:26, 18:10, 18:18, 18:29, 20:7, 20:29, 21:8, 21:21, 22:5, 22:17, 22:22, 23:13, 23:21, 24:2, 24:7, 24:16, 24:21, 25:1, 25:17, 25:18, 26:10, 26:23, 27:18, 27:28, 28:19, 29:7, 29:10, 30:5, 30:22, 30:27, 31:14, 32:6, 32:10, 32:18, 32:19, 32:22, 32:24, 33:5, 35:9, 35:15, 35:22, 36:4, 36:9, 36:15, 37:13, 38:14, 39:8, 40:5, 41:2, 41:14, 42:4, 42:28, 43:4, 43:10, 43:18, 44:3, 44:5, 44:7, 45:10, 45:11, 45:12, 45:25, 46:2, 46:29, 48:6, 48:13, 48:14, 48:18, 50:2, 50:5, 50:18, 50:24, 51:18, 52:19, 52:20, 52:25, 53:6, 54:2, 54:6, 55:7, 55:23, 57:20, 57:25, 58:5, 58:12, 58:13, 58:28, 59:3. 59:24. 60:11. 60:14, 61:1, 61:10, 61:16, 61:19, 61:20, 61:29, 62:29, 63:19, 64:12, 64:16, 64:29, 65:3, 66:13, 66:20, 66:26, 70:10, 71:26, 71:27, 72:3, 72:10, 74:16, 74:21, 75:4, 75:25, 76:5, 76:9, 76:21, 76:23, 78:9, 78:20, 79:27, 82:18, 83:26, 85:9, 85:13, 86:24, 86:25, 87:1, 93:23, 95:21, 96:6, 99:21, 100:8, 100:9, 100:20, 101:4, 102:22, 103:13, 103:16, 103:20, 103:23, 105:7, 105:14, 109:1, 112:20, 113:9, 114:4, 114:13, 115:11, 119:7, 119:10, 119:17, 121:4, 121:12, 124:6, 124:22, 125:18, 126:3, 126:5, 130:3, 130:13, 130:22,

Friend [1] - 37:29

friend [1] - 67:18

front 151 - 86:11.

86:28, 91:16, 98:28,

friendship [1] - 78:4

130:26, 132:6, 138:14, 138:22, 139:6, 140:11, 141:3, 141:8, 141:9, 141:20, 141:28, 142:14, 143:5, 143:10, 143:27, 144:7, 145:4, 145:7, 147:4, 147:29, 148:28, 149:19, 154:6, 156:5, 157:14, 158:18, 158:22, 162:6, 162:12, 162:14, 162:20, 163:26, 163:28, 164:21, 166:12, 167:4, 167:5, 167:6, 168:1, 168:2, 168:4, 168:6, 172:17, 172:19, 174:26, 176:22, 176:24, 176:29, 177:7, 177:29, 179:2, 180:3, 180:9, 180:15, 180:19, 180:20, 181:5. 181:11. 181:13, 181:26, 181:29, 182:9, 182:14, 182:20, 182:23, 183:9, 183:13, 183:17, 183:20, 183:27, 184:10, 184:11, 184:12. 184:24. 185:8, 185:12, 185:27, 186:7, 186:12, 186:19, 186:24, 187:2, 187:4, 188:5, 188:19, 189:27, 190:2 **Garda**" [1] - 101:5 Gardaí [6] - 68:25, 113:28. 167:7. 176:20, 177:25, 179:17 gardaí [1] - 149:25 gather [5] - 107:17, 107:21, 108:7, 108:25, 138:3 gathered [1] - 159:9 general [9] - 20:9, 32:4, 61:23, 71:19, 76:22. 106:22. 123:28, 128:29, 134:24 generally [10] -155:12, 187:26 51:16, 63:4, 63:13, guidance [1] - 83:13 86:24, 106:6, 117:24, guidelines [1] -117:25, 129:21, 116:16 157:27, 162:5 qun [4] - 35:11, generated [2] -

99:26, 120:19 2:17 98:25 131:21, 158:29, 159:25, 163:12, 168:18, 168:27, 174:4, 174:17, **GP**[1] - 20:21 127:25, 128:13, 128:15, 139:10 126:21 75:29, 139:20 134:25 128:18, 140:23, 148:8, 153:29, 189:21 113:14, 149:7

gently [1] - 65:21 genuine [1] - 84:7 GERAGHTY [1] -GERARD [1] - 2:11 GERRY [6] - 3:11, 5:16, 85:4, 88:4, 94:8, Gerry [2] - 85:1, 85:7 given [27] - 13:27, 14:2, 32:5, 42:24, 43:6, 43:13, 43:21, 43:24, 45:23, 57:9, 69:20, 72:24, 89:19, 96:10, 96:25, 130:9, 178:25, 181:6, 181:21 glad [1] - 76:23 gleaned [1] - 151:20 **GLEESON** [1] - 4:7 God [1] - 121:6 GOODE [1] - 3:22 GPS [5] - 127:24, **GRALTON** [1] - 3:14 grasped [1] - 54:13 grateful [1] - 179:7 great [2] - 101:17, GREENE [1] - 2:27 **GRIFFIN** [1] - 3:26 ground [3] - 75:22, group [2] - 88:28, **GSOC** [1] - 37:9 guard [14] - 19:28, 47:12, 68:22, 69:27, 91:6, 107:11, 123:23, 168:22, 187:23, guard's [1] - 188:8 guards [3] - 76:10, Guards [6] - 63:5, 68:28, 70:19, 151:10,

GWEN [1] - 1:29 Gwen [1] - 1:24

Н

half [2] - 86:19, 164:15 halfway [2] - 79:21, 112:10 HALIDAY[1] - 2:23 hand [4] - 64:19, 111:17, 125:22, 127:21 handed [13] - 54:5, 86:18, 88:28, 89:1, 89:4, 89:12, 89:13, 90:14, 92:23, 93:7, 95:8, 130:13 handful [1] - 88:25 handled [1] - 93:4 handwritten [6] -124:7. 126:14. 138:23. 139:14. 156:20, 156:23 hanging [1] - 36:1 happy [7] - 43:19, 43:20, 48:24, 73:16, 102:4, 159:1, 173:16 HARAN [5] - 4:5, 5:10, 42:17, 67:9, 71:9 Haran [40] - 11:16, 12:28. 13:2. 13:4. 13:8, 13:9, 13:16, 22:15, 22:24, 25:29, 26:7, 26:12, 27:6, 27:23, 29:22, 29:28, 30:16, 42:15, 42:20, 42:23, 49:26, 52:7, 55:18, 55:22, 67:12, 71:14, 71:18, 81:17, 105:12, 182:21, 182:22, 182:27, 183:8, 183:11, 183:16, 183:27, 184:4, 184:10, 184:18, 185:16 **Haran's** [1] - 183:5 harassment [16] -16:28. 17:28. 30:7. 57:28, 66:15, 82:18, 132:19, 148:29, 149:2, 149:13, 149:27, 150:20, 158:26, 182:24, 183:1, 185:2 hard [1] - 159:24

23:19, 41:1, 43:8, 44:1, 46:27, 103:18, 111:25, 124:25, 124:27, 130:29, 133:21, 135:7 hearing [1] - 119:22 **HEARING** [3] - 7:1, 102:7, 190:20 heart [1] - 138:9 **HELD** [1] - 1:17 held [3] - 40:3, 48:18. 57:5 help [8] - 11:3, 24:10, 30:6, 47:5, 57:27, 62:4, 76:29, 100.5 helped [1] - 52:17 helpful [2] - 41:16, 41:18 helping [1] - 79:8 **helps** [1] - 37:23 HIGGINS [1] - 4:10 Higgins [14] -163:26, 166:13, 168:1, 168:2, 168:4, 168:6, 172:17, 172:19, 174:26, 175:9, 176:29, 177:29, 180:3, 180:9 Higgins' [3] - 163:28, 176:22, 176:24 higher [1] - 114:16 highlighted [2] -131:20, 183:19 highly [1] - 158:3 himself [4] - 54:1, 76:10, 100:10, 175:13 hinge [1] - 56:8 hinges [1] - 66:1 **hm** [2] - 113:24, 114:29 hm-hmm [2] -113:24, 114:29 hmm [5] - 113:24, 114:29, 154:9, 155:29, 159:12

HAVING [5] - 7:11,

42:17, 85:4, 102:16,

HEAD[1] - 3:15

head [2] - 155:4,

heading [1] - 109:2

health [2] - 61:23,

hear [3] - 120:7,

heard [16] - 8:26,

13:22, 18:4, 20:16,

120:10, 123:13

headline [1] - 145:16

163:8

165:20

hold [4] - 34:23, 37:26, 63:28, 169:12 home [3] - 113:28, 154:10, 171:14 honest [5] - 68:26, 69:14, 83:12, 96:12, 100:26 hope [2] - 72:13, 75:2 HORAN [1] - 3:25 hospital [2] - 118:19, hotfooted [1] -181:16 hour [2] - 108:16, 109.8 hours [10] - 107:25, 107:28, 108:18, 108:24, 109:10, 110:2, 120:22, 125:15 **HOUSE** [3] - 2:23, 3:27, 4:11 HQ[1] - 19:23 huge [2] - 70:26, 79:5 **HUGHES** [2] - 2:29, human [1] - 109:23 **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15 humiliating [1] -58:15 hundred [2] - 87:4, hypothetical [1] -118:17 hypothetically [2] -115:28. 118:16

ı

i.e [2] - 74:25, 155:8 ICELAND[1] - 4:11 idea [3] - 55:2, 123:16, 184:9 identified [3] - 33:8, 36:13, 177:24 identifying [1] -117:9 identity [1] - 110:21 illness [1] - 18:14 imagine [6] - 69:3, 69:24, 89:27, 91:14, 124:6, 161:18 immediate [6] -60:14, 114:8, 115:27, 146:21, 147:15, 161:25 immediately [6] -

30:9, 57:29, 73:5,

91:25

35:15, 41:15, 42:5

harmless [2] - 91:24,

165:4, 169:26, 189:11 108:1, 108:2, 110:27, indoor [8] - 60:11, insofar [8] - 35:11, intention [2] impact [5] - 36:14, 115:7, 120:5, 120:20, 60:15, 61:10, 62:11, 47:28, 65:15, 65:24, 186:16, 186:18 37:20, 104:17, 106:1, 121:21, 122:10, 66:29, 69:18, 69:28, 65:27, 74:10, 76:4, interact [3] - 46:7, 122:12, 125:1, 106:2 70:1 141:28 46:15, 46:17 impartial [5] - 12:26, 133:29, 134:5, inflating [1] - 145:10 inspected [2] interacted [3] - 46:4, 54:15, 55:5, 56:17, 134:28, 137:5, 137:6, 58:20, 188:7 influenced [1] -186:22, 186:23 178.18 147:27 110:14 INSPECTOR [16] interacting [1] include [2] - 40:15, impartiality [1] inform [1] - 60:20 3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 182:14 86:25 3:18, 3:22, 4:5, 5:23, 64:22 informal [5] - 62:1, interaction [8] - 9:6, included [7] - 19:20, 6:1, 102:16, 135:20, implied [1] - 158:23 62:19, 86:9, 185:16, 42:29, 71:26, 109:23, importance [3] -38:19, 38:21, 79:9, 189.8 144:18, 152:10, 151:7, 162:8, 164:10, 74:11, 77:17, 145:26 89:12, 89:19, 105:29 information [42] -153:23, 161:3, 163:8 168:6 inspector [19] - 8:12, important [7] including [2] - 74:18, 108:7, 108:11, interactions [4] -107:3 21:9, 102:20, 103:10, 50:19, 51:24, 75:1, 111:11, 111:19, 9:8, 43:8, 44:11, 46:2 inclusion [1] - 87:1 112:12, 116:15, 109:26, 115:3, 122:23, 151:18, interactive [1] incomplete [1] -124:9, 124:10, 125:3, 115:22, 128:8, 129:2, 160:23, 165:21 44:10 129:16, 132:2, impression [1] -146.7 125:22, 126:13, interacts [1] - 109:24 132:13, 135:6, 161:6, inconsistent [1] -126:23, 130:21, 169:21 interchangeably [1] 132:20, 136:21, 162:27, 170:7, 177:16 175:4 improper [1] -- 140:22 inconsistently [1] -137:8, 137:25, 138:4, Inspector [23] -169:29 interest [2] - 96:11, 138:7, 138:17, 141:7, 24:17, 32:12, 46:19, 170:2 improvement [1] -98:5 66:2 incorporated [1] -144:4, 146:6, 147:23, 50:1, 53:2, 60:29, interested [3] -68:15, 79:9, 102:1, 149:6, 149:11, improving[1]-168:21 39:16, 99:24, 109:26 149:28, 154:4, 102:11, 105:13, incorrect [1] - 89:18 65:18 interesting [2] incurred [2] -154:19, 154:21, 116:22, 161:17, **IN** [1] - 1:17 36:21, 36:27 161:18, 163:11, inappropriate [3] -147:20, 147:21 155:2, 155:3, 155:8, interim [1] - 175:22 163:26, 167:10, 155:9, 156:18, 159:6, 39:11, 167:7, 183:23 indeed [4] - 40:27, interlinked [1] -176:7, 178:15, 159:21, 160:5, 160:6, 61:13, 84:7, 166:27 incident [63] - 38:17, 185:26 160:21, 170:21, 178:21, 178:22, 183:2 independence [2] -68:10, 88:10, 108:29, intermittently [1] -175:16 inspectors [4] -109:12, 109:27, 57:8 9:27 $\textbf{informed} \ [11] \textbf{-} \ 11:2,$ 85:25, 106:13, 110:4, 111:21, independent [8] interpret 131 -13:8, 13:16, 13:24, 106:28, 149:7 111:26, 112:8, 114:6, 11:14, 12:26, 26:20, 136:16, 141:5, 156:2 instance [4] - 49:10, 13:28, 21:21, 23:1, 115:24, 115:26, 55:4, 88:8, 177:25, interpretation [2] -27:11, 29:10, 149:23, 73:19, 118:14, 163:22 116:28, 117:25, 181:21, 182:5 143:3, 180:9 instead [1] - 107:12 179.3 118:17, 119:17, independently [1] interpreting [1] initial [3] - 103:26, instigating [1] - 50:6 119:24, 119:27, 22.26 15:23 INSTRUCTED[8] -104:19, 146:2 120:2, 121:15, INDEX [1] - 5:1 intervention [1] initiate [2] - 53:15, 121:19, 121:24, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, indicate [6] - 29:13, 130:25 144:6 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10 121:25, 121:26, 73:15, 146:15, 169:2, interview [10] initiated [3] - 51:28, 121:27, 122:16, instruction [7] -169:15, 179:23 51:25, 54:21, 71:16, 52:3 52:24 123:8, 123:12, 58:23, 59:1, 95:28, indicated [11] -77:19, 79:16, 79:18, initiative [1] - 183:26 127:4, 137:3, 143:15, 123:20, 124:3, 32:14, 35:10, 35:15, 125:8, 167:7, 167:13, injured [12] - 113:22, 125:21, 126:26, 172:14 41:14, 50:24, 78:2, 178:22 113:23, 125:9, 128:3, instructions [1] -127:2, 133:15, 95:8, 96:5, 96:27, interviewers [1] -134:15, 134:16, 130:3, 134:24, 150:11 147:13, 148:29 79:20 135:10, 135:12, INSTRUMENT[1] -135:9, 137:12, indicates [2] - 29:4, interviewing [1] -137:23, 138:5, 139:9, 139:18, 146:17, 150:15 117:9 140:15, 140:25, 149:23, 154:7 insufficient [1] indicating [2] interviews [1] -141:9, 143:25, injuries [5] - 114:7, 47:15 43:10. 169:16 45:24 144:21, 144:22, 139:14, 146:28, insurance [7] -INDICATING [1] -**INTO** [1] - 1:2 147:1, 147:19 145:15, 145:18, 86:13, 90:12, 90:13, 90:2 intoxicated [2] -146:18, 147:17, input [1] - 47:20 95:3, 97:20, 187:27, indication [1] -113:27, 183:16 147:22, 148:25, inputted [1] - 86:20 188:21 152:24 introduce [2] - 26:2, 149:22, 154:1, inquiries [4] - 100:2, insured [1] - 95:5individual [9] - 20:7, 54:16 158:13, 158:27, 126:5, 129:4, 169:22 intelligence [1] -103:29, 118:23, introduced [5] -159:19, 162:18, **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:2, 108:14 121:27, 124:29, 53:11, 55:11, 55:14, 175:10, 183:10 1:8 intelligent [1] - 81:10 136:7, 151:10, 65:11, 68:20 incidents [22] - 30:3, inquiry [4] - 16:4, intended [4] -161:19, 171:28 intrusive [3] - 21:6, 57:23, 60:3, 67:29, individuals [2] -16:16, 87:24, 177:6 114:12, 114:20, 25:22, 25:27 107:24, 107:27, 38:7, 72:4 inserting [1] - 58:8 169:9, 181:13 invalidated [1] -

151:14 invalidating [1] -151:8 **invariably** [1] - 148:8 investigate [3] -118:24, 119:19, 167:11 investigated [1] -37:12 investigating [18] -30:4, 57:24, 109:19, 116:14, 117:29, 118:3, 118:17, 118:26, 118:28, 119:8, 125:4, 131:29, 140:25, 141:9, 141:14, 148:19, 159:7, 167:16 investigation [34] -11:20, 17:5, 37:8, 37:9, 37:15, 39:20, 45:21, 45:28, 47:26, 49:11, 82:13, 82:16, 114:8, 118:11, 125:10, 134:9, 134:18, 141:6, 142:2, 142:15, 148:15, 148:20, 151:26, 165:11, 165:12, 165:16, 167:5, 167:8, 167:12, 168:18, 171:7, 178:17, 180:13, 181:21 investigations [2] -17:17. 59:24 investigators [6] -51:25, 54:21, 54:26, 71:16, 77:20, 79:17 invitation [2] - 74:1, 107:8 **invited** [1] - 175:9 involve [1] - 95:13 involved [10] - 13:19, 33:14, 36:27, 50:26, 58:8, 63:13, 82:12, 82:16, 141:8, 167:5 involvement [5] -22:27, 23:22, 23:23, 23:24, 52:20 involving [2] - 31:25, 39.22 **IP** [2] - 113:27, 114:6 irregularities [1] -96:11 irrelevant [3] - 39:26, 121:7, 176:18 isolate [2] - 64:25 issue [75] - 12:20, 14:4, 15:25, 15:27,

16:20, 17:24, 17:25,

20:9, 23:10, 23:20, 27:14, 31:21, 32:15, 32:19, 34:3, 34:6, 35:11, 36:7, 36:15, 41:19, 42:24, 43:8, 43:12, 43:26, 48:11, 50:5, 52:1, 52:11, 52:14, 52:26, 53:29, 54:29, 55:11, 59:23, 60:3, 60:4, 60:17, 64:8, 64:9, 72:20, 73:11, 73:16, 73:17, 74:10, 77:26, 81:5, 96:28, 97:28, 109:27, 114:20, 124:25, 127:9, 127:19, 133:18, 133:22, 142:14, 143:6, 146:12, 154:23, 161:7, 163:24, 164:1, 170:27, 171:26, 172:22, 180:29, 181:23, 181:24, 181:26, 185:1, 186:6, 187:1, 187:5, 187:6, 187:25 issued [3] - 57:12, 174:5, 188:23 issues [61] - 10:12, 11:5, 11:19, 11:29, 12:4, 12:8, 12:15, 14:14, 14:28, 15:1, 15:2, 15:5, 15:6, 15:7, 15:11. 15:12. 15:26. 16:5, 16:11, 20:28, 21:3, 21:10, 21:19, 21:20, 21:23, 22:14, 26:5, 26:19, 26:23, 26:26, 27:16, 27:17, 27:25, 28:20, 28:21, 29:8, 29:9, 30:8, 31:7, 33:13. 38:28. 42:25. 44:2, 44:7, 44:19, 45:2, 45:3, 45:11, 57:29, 63:7, 75:19, 76:12, 82:17, 83:19, 85:13, 106:16, 106:23, 131:20, 163:22, 185:22 item [2] - 124:29, 130:1 items [5] - 107:17, 107:21, 121:1, 127:7 itself [2] - 47:26,

J

143:1

JACK [1] - 3:6 JAMES [1] - 2:28

January [4] - 11:24, 44:17, 184:2, 189:3 JANUARY[3] - 1:18, 7:2. 190:20 job [5] - 62:23, 63:14, 133:7, 157:21, 157:22 **JOE** [1] - 3:14 JOHN [5] - 2:8, 2:11, 2:16. 3:8. 4:1 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 judgment [2] - 41:5, 175:4 July [7] - 23:20, 164:12, 164:28, 173:22, 174:10, 178:6, 178:7 jump [1] - 41:14 jumped [4] - 35:10, 35:15, 42:5, 82:8 June [8] - 7:22, 103:3, 165:24, 165:25, 165:26, 165:27, 174:4, 174:5 **JUSTICE** [3] - 1:7, 1.12 2.2 Justice [8] - 35:21, 36:5, 37:7, 37:14, 38:11, 38:15, 38:23, 41:29

K

KANE [1] - 2:28 **KATE** [1] - 3:25 Kavanagh [7] -14:20, 18:1, 20:20, 51:23, 104:27, 147:7, **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:5 **KEANE** [1] - 4:6 keep [2] - 49:15, 78.22 keeping [2] - 111:7, kelly [2] - 41:8, 98:20 Kelly [10] - 37:16, 39:6, 39:26, 40:14, 67:7, 73:23, 73:27, 74:13, 93:15, 101:1 KELLY [34] - 2:10, 3:12, 5:13, 5:19, 5:21, 37:17, 37:22, 40:17, 40:19, 40:23, 40:28, 67:9, 67:12, 72:19, 72:22, 72:25, 73:29, 74:15. 75:2. 88:5. 88:7, 90:9, 91:13, 91:26, 93:16, 93:18,

101:2, 101:13 **Kelly's** [1] - 73:10 Keogh [202] - 8:25, 9:5, 9:18, 10:12, 10:25, 11:3, 11:10, 11:24, 12:9, 12:21, 13:5, 13:6, 13:11, 13:24, 13:26, 13:28, 14:2, 14:23, 16:20, 16:26, 17:8, 17:11, 17:20, 17:25, 17:27, 18:10, 18:18, 18:29, 20:7, 21:1, 21:21, 22:5, 22:17, 23:21, 24:2, 24:21, 25:1, 25:17, 25:18, 26:23, 27:18, 27:28, 28:19, 29:7, 29:10, 30:5, 30:23, 30:27, 31:14, 32:18, 32:19, 32:22, 32:24, 33:5, 35:9, 35:15, 35:22, 36:4, 36:9, 37:13, 38:14, 39:8, 40:6, 41:2, 41:14, 41:27, 42:4, 42:28, 43:11, 43:18, 44:5, 44:8, 44:24, 45:10, 45:12, 46:2, 48:6, 48:14, 48:18, 50:2, 50:5, 50:18, 50:24, 51:19, 52:19, 52:20. 52:25. 53:6. 54:2, 54:6, 55:8, 55:23, 57:20, 57:25, 58:5, 58:12, 58:28, 59:3, 59:24, 60:12, 60:14, 61:1, 61:10, 61:16, 61:29, 62:29, 64:12, 66:13, 66:26, 67:14. 68:21. 69:20. 69:29, 70:10, 70:17, 70:25, 70:26, 71:26, 71:27, 72:10, 74:16, 74:21, 75:4, 75:25, 76:6, 76:9, 76:23, 78:9, 78:20, 79:28, 82:19, 83:26, 84:1, 85:13, 86:25, 87:1, 95:21, 100:8, 100:9, 100:10, 103:13, 103:16, 103:20, 103:23, 105:7, 105:14, 112:20, 113:9, 114:4, 114:14, 115:11, 119:7, 121:4, 124:22, 125:18, 126:3, 126:5, 130:13, 130:22, 132:6, 138:15, 138:22,

93:22, 98:19, 98:21,

98:26, 98:28, 99:14,

141:3, 141:9, 141:28, 142:14, 143:6, 143:11, 144:7, 148:28, 149:19, 154:6, 156:5, 158:18, 158:22, 162:6, 162:12, 162:14, 162:20, 167:6, 179:2, 180:20, 181:5, 181:11, 181:13, 182:14, 182:23, 183:9, 183:13, 183:17, 183:20, 183:27, 184:10, 184:11, 184:12, 185:12, 186:8, 186:12, 186:24, 190:2 **KEOGH**[1] - 2:10 Keogh's [34] - 24:7, 26:11, 36:16, 61:20, 64:16, 64:29, 76:21, 89:8, 89:19, 90:17, 92:19, 95:23, 96:7, 99:2, 99:21, 119:10, 121:12, 124:7, 139:6, 140:12, 141:20, 143:27, 145:4, 145:7, 181:26, 181:29, 182:9, 182:20, 184:24, 185:9, 185:27, 186:19, 187:2, 189:27 kept [1] - 49:13 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 key [2] - 145:27, 147:26 kick [1] - 143:8 **KIERAN**[1] - 3:20 kind [19] - 24:19, 40:2, 56:8, 59:1, 73:29, 77:29, 78:11, 90:6, 91:24, 106:15, 107:13, 108:22, 116:16, 119:26, 122:24, 127:7, 134:25, 149:3, 183:26 **KIRWAN** [1] - 3:13 knowing [1] - 21:4 knowledge [8] -17:19, 34:13, 66:27, 68:21, 104:16, 160:5, 162:13, 169:6 known [21] - 9:21, 9:23, 9:25, 9:29, 10:2, 10:4, 12:28, 19:8, 37:10, 53:19, 53:23, 68:26, 95:23, 104:21, 111:13, 124:9, 148:12, 154:17, 173:29, 174:2, 175:16

112:20, 133:29, 54:24, 55:20, 79:21, 49:17, 54:2, 78:17, knows [3] - 131:29, majority [1] - 17:14 132:1, 160:20 134:4, 136:15, 125:28, 132:16, 98:28, 127:10, 133:4, malice [1] - 69:11 136:17, 155:23, 182:21 141:13, 148:24, Malone [1] - 1:24 lines [2] - 83:28, 150:5, 169:8, 171:14. 160:22, 169:21 L MALONE [1] - 1:29 legal [2] - 148:1, 147:8 184:23, 190:13 maltreatment [1] looks [1] - 99:2 link [2] - 14:27, 31:6 183.8 lack [2] - 22:19, legislation [2] linked [2] - 45:2, loose [1] - 132:3 man [1] - 54:5 144:4 **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 181:12, 181:22 45:3 management [3] lacked [2] - 126:4, legitimate [4] - 16:3, list [1] - 125:1 lost [6] - 120:6, 24:18, 62:12, 65:4 138:22 16:9, 16:15, 16:16 listened [1] - 134:22 125:8, 125:14, manner [6] - 65:7, laid [1] - 130:17 **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13 lists [1] - 30:6 145:25, 146:1 65:29, 72:1, 72:8, lapse [1] - 111:14 lengthen [1] - 77:6 literally [2] - 76:26, loved [1] - 83:10 76:5, 142:2 lapsed [1] - 160:4 less [5] - 83:11, 109:14 lower [1] - 79:6 **manually** [1] - 77:16 large [4] - 42:27, 128:26, 155:23, 172:2 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:28 **LUNCH** [1] - 102:7 March [27] - 10:17, 63:9, 88:26, 122:11 **Lyons** [5] - 164:21, letter [31] - 21:12, live [1] - 151:15 10:19, 10:21, 10:24, largely [2] - 43:17, 27:4, 27:14, 29:18, 167:6. 173:11. local [2] - 176:19, 11:24, 12:16, 13:22, 81:15 29:20, 29:22, 29:25, 180:15, 180:19 179.16 18:1, 18:3, 18:9, lash [1] - 40:12 31:27, 35:21, 35:23, locally [1] - 180:11 LYONS [1] - 4:6 20:25, 24:12, 35:28, last [14] - 15:28, 36:3, 36:4, 37:6, locate [1] - 71:20 43:2, 44:6, 45:8, 46:3, 16:19, 34:7, 35:28, 38:10, 38:15, 39:2, M 48:9, 49:5, 56:19, located [3] - 63:21, 36:25, 69:18, 82:21, 41:26, 42:3, 68:3, 56:23, 57:11, 58:3, 63:25, 64:2 127:19, 132:16, 115:12, 131:4, location [7] - 63:18, 82:7, 105:7 132:26, 150:14, MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7 131:12, 143:1, 146:9, March/April [1] -109:19, 127:5, 151:25, 179:3, 185:29 mail [41] - 20:13, 150:7, 153:10, 127:20, 127:22, 39:18 lastly [1] - 82:2 68:13, 68:14, 82:6, 158:24, 178:4, MARGARET[1] -128:3, 146:18 late [2] - 125:15, 111:20, 116:21, 188:11, 188:14, 3.21 locker [2] - 76:26, 187:9 116:22, 117:4, 188.28 **MARIE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 77.17 118:21, 119:3, 119:4, laterally [1] - 135:3 letters [2] - 131:23, MARK[1] - 3:3 locus [1] - 128:13 126:16, 127:3, latest [1] - 108:6 131:25 logging [1] - 130:1 marked [2] - 112:25, 140:18, 143:6, 143:8, latitude [2] - 127:22, level [3] - 38:6, 134:29 logic [3] - 56:15, 143:16, 143:26, 128:21 146:26, 154:20 marks [1] - 132:7 57:10 144:5, 145:22, latter [2] - 77:24, levels [1] - 70:5 Marrinan [2] - 80:3, long-term [4] -145:25, 147:13, 80:1 liaising [1] - 51:18 46:21, 62:9, 83:22, 84:21 148:26, 155:15, **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29 liaison [19] - 11:4, MARRINAN [17] -162:20 155:16, 156:16, lawyers [1] - 148:1 18:10, 20:27, 21:6, longitude [1] -2:7, 5:12, 5:18, 42:14, 156:20, 156:28, least [5] - 8:22, 10:1, 22:6, 22:13, 23:2, 42:18, 42:22, 64:29, 127:22 156:29, 157:5, 10:12, 12:28, 42:3 25:17, 25:23, 26:4, 72:23, 84:22, 84:24, look [43] - 9:1, 16:1, 157:23, 158:8, leave [36] - 9:21, 27:2, 29:6, 33:12, 84:26, 85:1, 85:5, 16:4. 16:9. 16:21. 158:13, 158:14, 9:27, 11:25, 14:19, 34:5, 34:17, 43:19, 17:27, 19:26, 20:29, 85:8, 85:21, 85:28, 161:7, 161:8, 161:15, 18:19, 19:8, 36:1, 48:20, 80:6, 183:25 101:23 29:24, 44:26, 51:22, 161:17, 161:22, 39:26, 39:27, 40:18, **LIAM** [1] - 3:18 **MARTIN**[5] - 5:3, 68:2, 71:15, 75:3, 173:3, 173:11 46:21, 62:10, 62:11, Liam [16] - 166:6, 81:3, 82:3, 84:8, 7:11, 25:10, 28:10, mailed [10] - 19:11, 75:8, 83:22, 90:13, 166:7, 167:3, 167:4, 88:17, 91:4, 93:23, 35:1 19:13, 20:2, 125:7, 92:12, 104:21, 167:7, 167:15, 105:3, 108:17, 115:1, **Martin** [26] - 7:8, 125:11, 125:13, 110:19, 114:5. 168:28, 169:7, 171:7, 7:14, 14:27, 15:22, 121:23, 125:9, 129:15, 130:23, 117:15, 117:16, 171:14, 173:29, 125:24, 126:27, 21:21, 29:6, 29:9, 150:13, 156:21 124:16, 124:23, 175:9, 175:10, 177:1, 31:6, 33:12, 35:17, 127:2, 127:16, mailing [2] - 126:9, 125:5, 129:22, 177:9, 178:22 127:20, 131:7, 36:7, 36:28, 55:3, 137.5 142:23, 152:25, Licence [1] - 187:27 132:15, 140:8, 57:2, 58:8, 59:6, 80:5, mails [3] - 110:28, 153:2, 153:13, 159:5, lieu [1] - 166:17 142:27, 146:3, 81:12, 105:11, 111:4, 137:27 160:12, 162:18, lifestyle [1] - 171:9 181:29, 182:2, 158:17, 158:20, 162:20, 162:21, 165:2 MAIN [1] - 2:12 light [2] - 170:21, 164:14, 166:28, 182:10, 182:13, leaves [1] - 156:12 main [5] - 14:18, 178:16 173:22, 176:5, 178:4, 182:15, 185:17, 24:7, 59:8, 106:17, leaving [1] - 188:20 likely [2] - 53:21, 190.5 186:21 106:27 led [3] - 171:9, 188:8, 158:3 looked [9] - 21:15, **Martin's** [1] - 183:24 maintains [1] -189:6 limited [8] - 9:7, 112:9, 139:23, 140:4, massive [1] - 41:1 154:24 left [18] - 24:20, 28:1, 40:20, 40:28, 74:28. 145:23, 146:13, material [3] - 57:13, maintenance [1] -39:8, 40:13, 93:2, 103:22, 104:6, 162:7 148:28, 182:22 163:17, 163:19 106:15 100:7, 100:16, 101:4, Linanne [1] - 141:8 looking [17] - 16:18, materially [1] - 154:5 102:29, 112:18, major [1] - 90:7 line [8] - 17:18, 31:2, 19:29, 20:28, 44:26, materials [2] - 38:20,

78:2 36:14 39:23 meetings [3] - 65:9, 11:21, 12:1, 12:2, maternity [6] - 9:21, McCARTAN[2] -MCPARTLIN[1] -65:10, 133:11 30:7, 53:2, 57:28, 152:25, 152:27, 4:10, 4:11 3:20 Mel's [2] - 127:26, 62:8, 74:6, 77:19, 153:2, 162:18, 162:21 78:26, 79:12, 80:6, McCOURT [1] - 2:17 mean [33] - 26:27, 128.9 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 33:27, 44:9, 44:15, member [74] - 18:27, 110:26, 119:27, **MATT**[1] - 3:19 McGrath [45] - 2:7, 127:20, 147:21, matter [56] - 15:16, 45:14, 46:7, 52:23, 19:12, 19:15, 19:17, 19:14, 34:14, 35:4, 2:28, 5:5, 5:25, 5:30, 53:9, 53:12, 58:22, 19:24, 19:29, 30:1, 147:25, 148:21, 171:24, 178:2 35:5, 36:8, 36:9, 7:5, 7:6, 7:7, 7:12, 72:7, 72:29, 73:2, 30:2, 57:22, 57:23, mentions [1] - 58:29 37:12, 38:17, 41:4, 74:16, 80:27, 83:25, 58:12, 60:17, 64:5, 7:17, 8:21, 15:25, 49:28, 54:23, 60:18, 85:22, 90:3, 99:14, 66:26, 68:12, 85:8, merely [1] - 170:18 16:2, 16:9, 16:17, 63:18, 71:21, 73:22, 19:7, 20:16, 27:4, 100:9, 116:11, 91:12, 100:22, message [1] - 70:28 73:23, 80:3, 80:21, 28:6, 38:25, 38:27, 119:15, 128:11, 102:22, 109:19, met [7] - 49:26, 52:7, 137:25, 140:1, 80:24, 80:29, 81:25, 39:4, 39:15, 39:18, 116:7, 116:13, 55:18, 55:22, 61:16, 96:18, 96:26, 143:3, 142:12, 143:2, 116:14, 117:29, 39:21, 40:25, 41:24, 174:16, 175:9 150:13, 157:3, 157:5, 118:3, 118:9, 118:11, 145:10, 145:18, 42:8, 102:1, 102:10, meteoric [1] - 65:14 145:23, 149:25, 102:13, 102:17, 159:19, 169:28 118:12, 118:18, method [1] - 177:23 153:4, 154:7, 165:22, meaning [1] - 72:11 118:27. 118:28. 102:20, 121:18, metres [1] - 63:27 122:3, 122:7, 122:26, 167:11, 168:7, 118:29, 119:8, means [5] - 118:14, MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 168:14, 168:24, 123:26, 124:22, 122:28, 128:20, 148:2, 151:11, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 169:26, 170:24, 129:1, 140:10, 151:29, 161:25 125:4, 131:29, 136:4, Michelle [3] - 102:2, 152:16, 161:4, 161:6, 171:5, 171:13, meant [6] - 77:25, 136:16, 136:20, 102:11, 102:19 140:17, 140:21, 172:26, 172:29, 161.29 77:28, 84:5, 124:7, MICHELLE [7] -173:3, 176:15, 177:6, mcGuinness [1] -136:16, 161:18 140:23, 141:5, 5:23, 102:16, 135:20, 177:10, 180:7, 190:8 measure [1] - 133:28 143:16, 143:18, 144:18, 152:10, 180:18, 180:19, 145:18, 147:28, McGuinness [26] mechanisms [1] -153:23 161:3 148:2, 148:7, 148:14, 181:6, 181:7, 181:10, 2:6, 3:24, 5:27, 6:3, 109:3 Mick [2] - 23:13, 32:7 182:17, 184:12, 148:16, 148:18, 144:14, 144:16, medical [7] - 10:1, micromanage [1] -189:24, 189:26 148:19, 159:7, 160:2, 144:19, 144:21, 10:4, 11:25, 20:17, 31:26 matters [26] - 30:3, 149:14, 149:16, 162:12, 168:12, 20:18, 34:12, 147:17 micromanagement 36:11, 43:14, 44:1, 149:19, 163:2, 163:9, 176:25, 177:8, MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 [1] - 181:25 53:4, 57:24, 59:22, 182:24, 186:9, 163:11, 166:3, 172:6, medically [1] - 33:16 microphone [1] -64:7, 66:20, 71:19, 187:14, 187:25, 172:12, 175:28, **meet** [3] - 9:15, 187:26, 188:4, 188:9, 73:18, 75:26, 77:17, 176:1, 176:5, 176:9, 130:3, 135:12 microsupervising 95:26, 101:2, 106:16, 188:16. 188:20. 178:7, 187:1, 189:2, meeting [64] - 14:7, [1] - 24:24 108:19. 129:17. 189:4, 189:6, 189:25 190:9. 190:14 14:22, 33:15, 48:8, microsupervision 129:19, 152:22, MCGUINNESS [1] -MEMBER [1] - 2:2 48:10, 49:4, 49:11, [5] - 186:7, 186:11, 161:29, 165:8, member's [1] - 91:11 93:29 49:18, 49:23, 53:20, 186:14, 186:16, 168:11, 168:19, McHugh [32] members [20] -53:22, 53:23, 56:19, 186:26 168:20, 172:12 17:15, 48:12, 48:15, 163:29, 164:2, 164:6, 57:4, 65:10, 94:12, mid [2] - 10:1, 10:13 MATTERS[1] - 1:4 66:27, 70:4, 86:3, 166:6, 166:7, 167:3, 105:7, 105:18, middle [3] - 23:18, MATTHIAS[1] - 2:10 167:4, 167:8, 167:13, 86:24, 95:4, 103:29, 106:26, 107:14, 158:21, 164:18 McBrien [40] - 2:16, 107:13, 129:22, 167:15, 167:17, 107:18, 107:19, midnight [1] - 19:3 43:6, 43:13, 43:28, 168:4, 168:28, 169:7, 136:18, 143:20, 108:17, 108:21, might [50] - 16:13, 46:21, 48:24, 49:4, 145:23. 162:8. 167:4. 170:29, 171:8, 108:25, 111:13, 17:18, 24:12, 37:28, 167:5, 168:15, 177:7, 65:5, 79:10, 86:8, 171:14, 173:29, 121:2, 123:6, 123:17, 47:24, 48:12, 48:20, 86:25, 87:23, 88:20, 175:9, 175:11, 177:15 124:2, 124:10, 48:21, 51:10, 51:15, 88:23, 89:4, 89:11, 176:14, 176:22, members' [2] -124:17, 124:22, 53:23, 54:17, 58:18, 89:16, 89:18, 90:15, 177:1, 177:9, 177:24, 90:29, 95:19 124:24, 125:29, 59:12, 59:18, 63:3, memo [5] - 68:3, 92:24, 92:27, 94:3, 178:19, 178:22, 126:17, 126:20, 63:15, 74:11, 74:16, 95:8, 95:11, 95:28, 141:18, 148:21, 179:16, 180:3, 126:27, 129:2, 130:2, 76:11, 79:17, 81:8, 96:1, 96:6, 96:15, 180:10, 180:18, 156:1, 175:18 130:7, 131:2, 133:17, 84:5, 100:19, 107:12, 96:25, 97:6, 99:28, memory [5] - 54:9, 181:16 133:18, 133:23, 108:9, 111:12, 164:25, 164:26, 56:7, 56:12, 65:17, McHugh's [3] -135:2, 136:5, 136:8, 111:15, 111:17, 166:24, 173:20, 166:18, 177:20, 136:29, 137:18, 72:16 112:2, 112:14, 180:24, 187:10, 177:29 137:21, 138:3, 138:8, mention [10] - 12:14, 112:15, 118:20, 187:19, 189:11, MCLOUGHLIN [1] -138:28, 141:29, 16:14, 49:17, 63:22, 131:24, 134:2, 134:8, 189:13 126:8, 166:12, 168:8, 3:6 142:14, 143:26, 134:9, 135:2, 145:3, McBrien's [2] -McLYNN [1] - 4:2 146:1, 156:7, 167:16, 170:27, 172:28, 147:3, 152:21, 157:5, 88:18, 187:4 MCMAHON[1] - 3:8 175:17, 177:1, 177:19 157:6, 157:13, McCabe [2] - 33:14, mentioned [20] -McMeeking[1] -178:27, 179:4 159:25, 161:12,

178:17, 181:16 mightn't [2] - 116:12, 117:23 **mind** [10] - 19:22, 34:16, 50:25, 56:16, 71:17, 75:3, 82:3, 112:7, 112:12, 161:25 mine [2] - 39:13, 86.2 Minister [6] - 35:21, 36:5, 37:7, 37:14, 38:11, 38:15 **MINISTER** [1] - 1:7 MINNOCK [3] - 3:9, 6:1. 163:8 Minnock [11] - 21:9, 24:17, 32:12, 46:19, 61:1, 161:19, 163:3, 163:11. 176:7. 178:15, 178:23 minor [2] - 39:10, 45:17 minute [7] - 39:28, 40:8, 139:28, 148:5, 148:6, 148:10, 190:2 minutes [2] - 136:11, 190:11 misinterpreting[1] -130.18 missing [5] - 111:10, 125:21, 127:7, 134:10, 139:13 mistake [1] - 74:5 mistreatment [2] -66:28, 162:14 mobile [3] - 167:15, 168:8, 169:5 moment [19] - 7:19, 12:6, 12:13, 12:15, 25:2, 25:15, 41:8, 68:2, 81:26, 82:7, 96:23, 109:12, 114:24, 129:12, 132:27, 156:26, 158:18, 158:21, 172:7 moments [5] - 29:1, 32:17, 138:10, 143:5, 170:27 Monaghan [11] -10:8, 17:13, 110:19, 117:13, 117:14, 124:16, 133:2, 133:5, 153:2, 153:3, 153:14 Monday [21] - 104:3, 107:26, 107:29, 108:1, 109:9, 110:9, 110:24, 111:3, 111:9, 116:29, 119:1,

120:29, 121:29,

123:2, 124:18, 129:2,

129:28, 130:16, 146:1, 156:7, 179:4 money [1] - 127:29 **MONICA** [1] - 3:15 monies [1] - 180:14 month [1] - 152:29 months [5] - 8:11, 9:22, 11:13, 21:8, 144:29 morning [44] - 7:5, 7:6, 7:15, 7:16, 7:17, 10:16, 25:13, 30:26, 57:14, 67:12, 67:13, 106:26, 107:16, 107:27, 107:28, 107:29, 108:17, 108:25, 110:9, 111:9, 112:21, 116:2, 117:2, 117:3, 117:7, 117:17, 117:19, 119:1, 120:28, 121:2, 121:29, 123:2, 123:19, 126:15, 126:16, 130:16, 143:9, 147:14, 156:13, 159:11, 159:14, 159:16, 188:15, 190:18 morning, [1] - 25:14 mornings [4] -78:28, 107:9, 123:29, 124.18 MORONEY [1] - 3:18 MORRISSEY [1] -3:26 most [11] - 46:15, 48:27, 90:28, 108:7, 138:3, 139:8, 163:27, 167:12, 168:23, 169:2, 173:28 mostly [1] - 104:3 mother [2] - 154:12, 159:3 motives [1] - 69:9 motor [1] - 85:15 move [17] - 13:21, 17:29, 18:13, 54:19, 63:17, 73:5, 73:16, 76:11, 76:19, 91:4,

91:18, 117:24, 120:8,

139:17, 140:6, 141:27

moved [5] - 24:19,

moving [6] - 18:2,

23:18, 43:2, 136:27,

Moylan [31] - 10:9,

10:10, 13:17, 13:20,

14:15, 15:5, 26:1,

140:7, 187:1

78:5, 78:6, 98:6,

133:15

26:12, 27:6, 29:20, 29:28, 30:4, 30:16, 46:16, 46:24, 46:28, 57:16, 57:25, 58:25, 58:29, 59:2, 59:15, 59:20, 60:25, 65:3, 105:11, 106:4, 131:14, 131:16, 184:24, 185:2 MR [153] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:8, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 4:1, 4:1, 4:6, 4:10, 4:10, 5:6, 5:7, 5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:18, 5:19, 5:20, 5:21, 5:26, 5:27, 6:3, 25:11, 25:13, 28:2, 28:11, 28:13, 34:20, 37:17, 37:22, 37:25, 37:28, 38:2, 38:16, 40:17, 40:19, 40:23, 40:28, 42:14, 42:18, 42:22, 64:29, 67:9, 67:12, 71:7, 71:9, 71:12, 72:19, 72:22, 72:23, 72:25, 73:1, 73:4, 73:15, 73:25, 73:29, 74:15, 75:2, 75:12, 75:15, 75:23, 76:2, 76:11, 76:16, 76:18, 80:19, 80:22, 80:29, 81:20, 81:28, 82:2, 84:14, 84:22, 84:24, 84:26, 85:1, 85:5, 85:8, 85:21, 85:28, 88:5, 88:7, 90:9, 91:13, 91:26, 93:16, 93:18, 93:22, 93:29, 94:3, 94:8, 94:11, 97:2, 97:5, 97:8, 97:26, 98:14, 98:19, 98:21, 98:26, 98:28, 99:14, 101:2, 101:13, 101:23, 135:20, 135:23, 140:28, 141:2, 141:16, 141:19, 141:25, 141:27, 142:7, 142:28, 143:4, 144:14, 144:18, 144:21, 149:16, 149:19, 163:2, 163:9, 163:11, 166:3, 172:12, 175:28, 176:1, 176:5, 176:9,

MS [68] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 4:1, 4:7, 4:7, 5:5, 5:8, 5:25, 5:28, 5:30, 7:5, 7:7, 7:12, 7:17, 8:21, 15:18, 15:20, 15:25, 16:17, 19:7, 20:16, 28:6, 35:2, 35:4, 35:14, 35:17, 35:21, 36:4, 36:7, 36:18, 36:20, 36:24, 38:12, 38:27, 39:4, 39:15, 39:18, 39:21, 41:12, 41:17, 41:24, 42:8, 84:19, 94:2, 102:1, 102:10, 102:13, 102:17, 102:20, 121:18, 122:7, 122:28, 128:20, 129:1, 152:6, 152:10, 152:13, 153:8, 153:17, 161:3, 161:6, 161:29 MULCAHY [1] - 3:5 MULLIGAN [2] -2:11, 3:13 Mullingar [2] - 8:1, 33:15 **mundane** [1] - 98:5 murder [2] - 165:11, 165:18 Murphy [8] - 28:8, 33:28, 37:27, 39:6, 40:11, 41:1, 41:5, 71:6 MURPHY [10] - 2:30, 3:23, 5:7, 28:11, 28:13, 34:20, 37:25, 37:28. 38:2. 38:16 Murphy's [2] - 39:7, MURRAY [2] - 3:3, 3.9 Murray [62] - 10:18,

11:1, 14:11, 15:6,

15:10, 15:21, 16:6,

16:8, 16:10, 16:22,

17:10, 21:26, 23:5,

24:6, 25:16, 27:10,

28:16, 29:4, 29:16,

31:4, 32:23, 36:29,

50:20, 51:27, 53:3,

59:28, 61:9, 61:13,

64:12, 65:5, 65:22,

67:27, 79:10, 80:9,

133:25, 133:27,

55:2, 56:24, 58:4,

84:14 43:3, 48:9, 49:2, 50:9, 105:1, 131:5, 132:18,

138:13, 142:15, 144:3, 145:8, 146:5, 148:22, 148:27, 149:2, 149:26, 150:8. 150:15, 156:1, 184:20, 186:15, 187:12, 189:19 Murray's [12] - 49:23, 54:23, 107:7, 125:25, 135:25, 137:3, 140:8, 142:11, 150:5, 158:24, 161:17, 184:16 must [10] - 38:13, 38:14, 40:23, 42:1, 42:2, 63:29, 115:7, 161:8 Myers [2] - 82:7, 82:11 MÍCHEÁL [23] - 3:23, 5:14, 71:7, 71:9, 71:12, 73:1, 73:4, 73:15, 73:25, 75:12, 75:15, 75:23, 76:2, 76:11, 76:16, 76:18, 80:19, 80:22, 80:29, 81:20, 81:28, 82:2,

Ν

name [16] - 18:21, 18:23, 72:15, 74:24, 76:9, 91:8, 91:9, 91:11, 91:22, 97:18, 100:22, 100:23, 122:24, 139:26 named [2] - 1:26, 39:22 namely [3] - 16:26, 36:28, 117:26 names [3] - 72:15, 74:24, 76:9 narrative [8] -109:17, 109:18, 109:20, 109:21, 128:1, 138:11, 151:24, 151:28 narrow [1] - 44:9 natural [1] - 77:10 naturally [2] - 56:2, 77:6 nature [8] - 45:19, 94:29, 104:24, 115:7, 116:28, 131:23, 157:14, 157:28 nauseam [1] - 41:1 near [1] - 51:11 nearly [1] - 136:28

178:7, 187:1, 189:2,

190:9, 190:14

necessarily [2] -49:1, 50:13 necessary [7] - 11:8, 11:9, 57:5, 74:28, 75:18, 154:26, 180:9 need [14] - 22:18, 33:27, 42:5, 58:24, 111:17, 112:14, 112:16, 124:2, 125:5, 126:22, 158:14, 182:17, 187:22, 189:25 needed [4] - 11:18, 27:24, 67:18, 185:23 needs [1] - 127:9 negative [1] - 44:10 negligible [1] - 65:8 neutral [2] - 50:11, 55:26 never [26] - 22:6, 23:2, 23:28, 37:11, 52:7, 55:18, 55:22, 59:1, 59:3, 64:18, 84:3, 90:25, 90:26, 104:8, 150:4, 160:20, 176:23, 176:25, 178:2, 180:19, 180:20, 186:21, 186:22, 186:23, 186:25, 189:22 new [15] - 11:12, 13:25, 31:9, 50:8, 56:14, 56:15, 57:9, 65:16, 65:26, 119:22, 134:23, 136:12, 148:24, 151:16, 189:12 next [29] - 7:7, 15:17, 28:7, 42:14, 54:19, 63:14, 70:12, 75:17, 83:17, 99:19, 99:27, 101:5, 102:1, 102:10, 108:16, 108:18, 122:4, 126:20, 133:5, 134:11, 148:12, 152:23, 152:26, 155:27, 160:3, 163:2, 180:29, 181:23, 182:19 **nice** [1] - 37:20 NICHOLAS [2] -2:10, 4:5 Nicholas [5] - 50:2, 95:21, 95:23, 100:8, 100:9 Nick [19] - 44:24, 44:27, 46:12, 60:14, 67:14, 68:21, 69:20, 69:29, 70:17, 70:25, 70:26, 84:1, 84:3,

84:6, 89:8, 89:19, 90:17, 92:18, 99:2 Nick's [2] - 77:9, 77:25 night [12] - 20:1, 45:6, 46:12, 77:13, 79:6, 115:29, 116:1, 117:14, 141:10, 157:25, 159:11, 179:3 nights [5] - 78:24, 83:10, 104:2, 110:15, 188:18 nobody [10] - 24:13, 27:7, 58:13, 101:22, 117:26, 117:27, 129:28, 180:10 **NOEL** [1] - 4:10 **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 non [1] - 129:22 non-urgent [1] -129:22 none [2] - 59:27, 145:1 **NOREEN** [1] - 2:16 Noreen [2] - 43:6, 99:28

norm [1] - 162:13 normal [7] - 30:1, 57:22, 91:27, 95:12, 123:24, 134:13, 187:27

NORTHUMBERLAN

D[1] - 2:18 notable [1] - 145:16 note [16] - 14:21, 15:21, 16:20, 17:8. 17:29, 20:22, 49:23, 50:22, 53:10, 61:22, 73:9, 96:10, 119:11, 122:6, 129:11, 173:26 notebook [3] - 30:5, 57:26, 58:16 notes [7] - 1:26, 49:13, 49:15, 49:16, 86:1, 113:25, 183:13 nothing [22] - 34:2, 34:18, 38:29, 39:6, 45:17, 45:18, 56:1, 61:22, 61:25, 84:22, 84:24, 90:7, 95:25, 98:4, 132:19, 136:25, 147:17, 148:29, 149:12, 149:26, 159:27, 160:20 notice [3] - 61:19, 188:24, 189:7 noticed [1] - 74:6 notified [1] - 37:11 notifying [2] -

119:17, 129:19

November [3] -44:17, 60:18, 163:14 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:14, 3:21 number [47] - 8:11, 11:27, 13:5, 18:23, 45:6, 48:23, 59:23, 64:8, 73:16, 83:14, 86:10, 86:16, 88:14, 88:26, 92:17, 94:25, 97:17, 99:21, 109:27, 113:18, 113:19, 115:12, 119:20, 119:25, 121:1, 122:11, 140:29, 157:2, 163:24, 164:6, 164:7, 165:8, 166:19, 167:15, 168:8, 169:5, 170:28, 170:29, 171:12, 172:20, 172:22, 177:20, 177:23, 178:1, 178:25, 183:14 numbers [2] - 70:8, 160:10 numerous [1] -107:21 NYLAND[1] - 3:19 **NÍ** [1] - 2:30

0

NÓIRÍN [1] - 3:7

O'Brien [7] - 25:8, 135:18, 140:27, 141:11, 141:23, 143:1, 144:12 O'BRIEN [17] - 2:10, 5:6, 5:26, 25:11, 25:13, 28:2, 135:21, 135:23, 140:28, 141:2, 141:16, 141:19, 141:25, 141:27, 142:7, 142:28, 143:4 o'clock [4] - 102:3, 159:11, 159:14, 159:16 O'CONNOR [1] -2:21 O'Higgins [3] - 71:6, 72:27, 73:7 **O'HIGGINS** [23] -3:23, 5:14, 71:7, 71:10, 71:12, 73:1, 73:4, 73:15, 73:25, 75:12, 75:15, 75:23, 76:2, 76:11, 76:16, 76:18, 80:19, 80:22, 80:29, 81:20, 81:28,

82:2, 84:14 O'MARA [1] - 2:17 O'Neill [7] - 71:21, 71:27, 72:1, 73:22, 74:8, 74:22, 75:27 O'NEILL [1] - 4:1 O'REARDON[1] -3:17 O'Rourke [4] - 15:19, 36:2. 42:3. 152:5 O'ROURKE [25] -4:7, 5:8, 5:28, 15:18, 15:20, 35:2, 35:4, 35:14, 35:17, 35:21, 36:4, 36:7, 36:18, 36:20, 36:24, 38:12, 41:12, 41:17, 84:19, 94:2, 152:6, 152:10, 152:13, 153:8, 153:17 O'SULLIVAN [1] -3:7 object [2] - 31:25, 90:10 objected [1] - 169:19 objection [3] -126:11, 171:27, 172:1 obligation [2] -141:3, 143:12 obligations [1] -150:17 obliged [3] - 137:12, 156:4, 156:5 **obscure** [1] - 74:13 observation [2] -15:18. 15:20 observe [1] - 66:20 observed [1] - 188:4

observer [1] - 70:14 obtain [2] - 167:15, 169:5 obtained [4] - 48:3, 164:6, 169:10, 177:29 obtaining [2] -177:19, 177:20 **obvious** [4] - 11:10, 65:15, 83:25, 114:19 obviously [15] -33:21, 40:19, 49:8, 65:28, 79:4, 101:25, 110:13, 111:6, 158:22, 169:9, 176:21, 177:19, 180:7, 183:29, 189:10 occasion [11] -10:11. 59:19. 61:17. 69:18, 74:21, 76:25, 77:16, 78:9, 138:19, 163:21, 166:15 occasional [1] -

111:2

occasions [5] - 9:8, 78:19, 171:10, 173:10, 183:14 occur [2] - 144:27, 184.15 occurred [8] -107:25, 119:18, 121:21, 123:18, 146:19, 162:19, 176:10, 189:2 occurrence [2] -109:19, 109:20 occurring [1] -110:28 occurs [4] - 68:10, 115:26, 137:13, 140:15 occurs.. [1] - 115:24 October [9] - 44:16, 60:10, 87:22, 99:28, 103:11, 133:3, 152:14, 152:27, 153:10 odd [1] - 150:29 **OF** [26] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, 3:15, 25:6, 28:4, 34:26, 41:22, 67:5, 71:4, 84:16, 87:29, 93:27, 98:16, 101:20, 135:16, 144:10, 152:3, 153:19, 160:26, 162:24 offenders [1] -146:23 offenders' [1] -146:20 offer [1] - 13:29 offered [2] - 62:3, 83:13 offering [1] - 52:25 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 office [47] - 52:29, 53:16, 62:21, 63:25, 63:26, 64:1, 64:2, 64:6, 68:14, 79:3, 86:8, 87:10, 87:20, 88:17, 88:18, 88:19, 88:21, 89:26, 90:13, 92:28, 96:17, 99:12, 100:20, 105:22, 105:24, 105:28, 106:27, 107:6, 112:18, 112:27, 113:5, 113:8, 113:12, 116:22, 129:26, 132:10, 132:11, 138:1, 140:19, 161:9, 161:10, 161:15, 161:16, 161:21,

174:25, 177:9 125:13, 132:27, officer [38] - 18:10, 132:29, 133:24, 20:27, 21:8, 22:6, 135:8, 139:24, 139:28, 144:29, 22:23, 23:3, 23:14, 24:17, 25:17, 26:4, 145:15, 148:9, 32:10, 70:13, 71:28, 148:11, 152:6, 86:10, 86:18, 86:28, 154:23, 157:2, 157:10, 158:4, 88:26, 89:3, 89:15, 90:8, 90:16, 92:6, 161:29, 163:23, 94:15, 95:7, 95:11, 163:28, 170:26, 95:16, 95:27, 105:23, 171:17, 171:28, 172:25, 180:9, 185:6, 106:12, 108:4, 185:8, 185:27, 112:13, 129:28, 186:25, 188:11 132:11, 148:13, 148:16, 149:10, ones [2] - 45:18, 167:11, 183:3 142:25 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, ongoing [5] - 30:7, 3:14 45:21, 57:27, 77:26, officer's [6] - 86:7, 165:16 86:8, 88:19, 92:28, open [12] - 20:20, 94:13, 95:12 54:29, 57:13, 64:1, 104:27, 107:8, officers [1] - 154:6 offices [1] - 105:25 113:21, 127:13, official [2] - 22:29, 133:29, 134:4, 138:27, 150:18 61:22 open-ended [2] officially [1] - 85:23 133:29, 134:4 often [5] - 62:2, opened [3] - 113:20, 82:26, 118:19, 134:6, 123:4, 129:11 144:27 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 opening [1] - 21:16 Oireachtas [1] openly [1] - 44:21 opinion [4] - 126:14, 38:23 134:21, 135:13, Olivia [7] - 71:21, 71:26, 72:1, 73:22, 170:18 74:8, 74:22, 75:26 opinions [1] - 48:27 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12, 4:1 opportunity [2] -162:1, 179:27 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, opposed [3] -1:18, 2:13, 7:1 125:12, 130:21, 144:4 once [4] - 63:11, options [1] - 70:16 70:27, 137:12, 154:29 **OPW** [1] - 106:15 oncoming [1] -130:14 **or..** [1] - 139:16 oral [1] - 40:16 **one** [81] - 10:16, orally [3] - 84:5, 14:13, 14:17, 25:2, 29:14, 33:9, 35:18, 138:16 47:17, 48:23, 50:7, orchestrated [1] -50:27, 53:11, 54:5, 53:23 54:16, 59:9, 59:10, order [5] - 64:1, 61:3, 62:17, 63:11, 77:17, 99:6, 112:7, 64:10, 67:26, 68:20, 188:21 76:14, 76:20, 77:11, orderly [10] - 68:12, 78:9, 79:6, 95:20, 110:20, 116:6, 118:8, 95:24, 96:3, 96:4, 118:12, 118:14, 96:23, 98:19, 100:7, 123:11, 140:17, 100:8, 100:27, 101:4, 148:12, 148:15 101:5, 108:2, 112:19, ordinary [3] - 18:13, 117:21, 117:23, 30:18. 91:27 119:29, 121:1, 122:4, organisation [1] -122:18, 123:4, 137:5 124:12, 125:2, organise [1] - 127:6

original [1] - 179:11 ORLA [1] - 3:20 **OSMOND** [1] - 3:27 **OTHER** [1] - 1:3 otherwise [2] -93:13, 170:3 ought [1] - 36:10 outcome [2] - 108:3, 141:29 outdoors [1] - 70:11 outline [3] - 50:3, 102:21, 104:5 outlined [4] - 72:1, 114:21, 118:4, 166:5 output [2] - 30:2, 57:22 outside [6] - 37:22, 54:13, 63:13, 177:25, 178:18, 188:19 outstanding [1] -95:25 overcome [1] - 169:1 overstepped[1] -36:10 overview [1] - 82:5 own [11] - 15:8, 15:9, 15:16, 22:23, 32:29, 59:11, 87:24, 126:13, 172:22, 175:3, 175:4 owner [1] - 188:17

Р

PAF [24] - 65:10, 106:18, 106:20, 106:24, 107:4, 120:29, 121:10, 124:18, 133:11, 133:17, 133:18, 133:24, 133:26, 134:26, 136:29, 137:18, 137:21, 138:8, 138:28, 141:29, 142:13, 143:26, 145:17, 156:7 page [82] - 8:29, 9:2, 14:20, 18:2, 20:20, 185:29 22:2, 28:14, 28:27, 32:28, 33:1, 41:13, 41:17, 41:26, 49:22, 51:23, 52:4, 54:19, 55:20. 57:12. 60:9. 61:6, 66:6, 68:1, 71:17, 76:19, 78:18, 79:17, 79:19, 79:22, 80:7, 82:3, 85:2, 87:5, 62:12, 66:16, 76:25, 102:13, 104:27, 86:26, 110:15, 122:1, 112:24, 114:24, 122:2, 123:24, 115:15, 119:6, 130:24, 148:9,

121:23, 123:1, 150:23, 155:27, 124:26, 125:24, 189:28 127:10, 127:13, particular [39] -131:6, 131:9, 132:7, 10:16, 10:21, 13:23, 132:24, 133:5, 13:26, 16:18, 16:20, 135:24, 138:13 17:8, 18:19, 20:1, 140:6, 142:7, 145:3, 20:6, 20:21, 23:18, 146:3, 147:3, 149:14, 23:19, 41:15, 43:11, 150:6, 152:20, 61:19, 62:17, 73:3, 152:22, 152:23, 77:9, 77:11, 77:12, 152:26, 161:12, 97:25, 109:27, 110:4, 162:3, 162:4, 163:16, 110:5, 114:12, 164:15, 166:29, 121:21, 121:22, 173:22, 177:3, 178:3, 121:24, 122:16, 181:27, 181:28, 131:12, 137:2, 138:5, 184:23, 185:27, 143:25, 148:1, 185:29, 188:28, 150:23, 153:13, 188:29, 190:5 182:16, 187:23 **PAGE**[1] - 5:2 particularly [4] paper [8] - 82:28, 75:13, 104:24, 84:4, 112:17, 112:19, 126:27, 148:24 113:10, 137:28, parties [1] - 73:13 155:12, 169:27 parts [1] - 78:9 papers [4] - 23:13, party [13] - 105:17, 125:24, 131:6, 166:29 113:22, 113:23, 125:9, 128:4, 130:3, paperwork [7] -59:19, 76:22, 77:21, 134:24, 135:10, 82:27, 104:7, 105:24, 135:12, 139:18, 173:3 146:17, 149:23, 154:7 paragraph [52] - 9:1, pass [6] - 81:21, 9:2, 9:3, 14:25, 21:16, 131:13, 143:21, 21:18, 22:2, 22:3, 180:29, 181:23 28:15, 29:3, 29:24, PASSED[1] - 1:4 33:1, 33:2, 33:21, passed [5] - 51:10, 36:13. 36:20. 36:22. 51:16, 132:6, 143:19, 36:24, 36:25, 57:14, 143:23 66:7, 66:23, 68:7, passing [5] - 80:4, 71:19, 75:17, 75:21, 98:10, 130:21, 133:9, 76:4, 76:19, 78:17, 181:20 105:4, 113:25, 115:1, past [2] - 17:19, 19:2 115:16, 117:28, Pat [4] - 55:2, 79:10, 125:26, 131:18, 80:9. 105:1 137:11, 140:9, 145:4, PATRICK [4] - 2:7, 150:15, 162:2, 2:10, 2:28, 3:3 164:18, 167:19, Patrick [1] - 10:18 173:24, 174:21, patrol [2] - 63:13, 174:23, 176:27, 70:14 178:13, 182:19, **PAUL** [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 4:1 parish [1] - 171:21 pay [1] - 86:14 park [1] - 91:20 payment [3] - 86:11, parked [1] - 86:3 95:3, 95:15 parking [1] - 91:2 payments [2] parlance [2] -95:14, 189:28 147:29, 148:7 **PEGGY** [1] - 4:7 part [14] - 54:8, penalisation [1] -

66:16

penalty [1] - 188:24

PEOPLE [1] - 3:16

people [25] - 16:7,

20:3, 38:24, 46:15, 48:17, 48:19, 48:21, 48:27, 49:14, 54:12, 55:25, 63:5, 70:16, 74:25, 77:15, 79:4, 81:10, 81:11, 91:20, 108:9, 145:27, 146:15, 148:11, 161:20 per [1] - 116:15 perceive [1] - 48:21 perceived [6] -48:12, 54:15, 65:18, 66:1, 70:10, 84:6 percent [1] - 87:4 perception [5] -50:27, 54:4, 54:11, 54:16, 57:8 perceptions [1] -54:18 perfectly [3] - 16:3, 16:15, 16:16 performance [4] -10:11, 44:16, 58:5, 106.23 performing [2] -101:11, 101:15 performs [1] - 47:10 perhaps [18] - 26:14, 27:13, 33:5, 38:18, 48:14, 49:22, 55:25, 56:17, 67:29, 82:4, 166:28, 168:11, 169:12, 173:22, 175:22, 179:13, 182:1, 190:5 period [32] - 8:22, 38:8, 42:27, 45:8, 45:12, 46:20, 65:1, 68:29, 77:23, 77:29, 83:15, 103:7, 104:12, 104:18, 108:16, 109:7, 120:21, 121:22, 122:13, 134:1, 134:7, 134:9, 134:10, 145:2, 153:1, 153:15, 160:6, 164:11, 165:6, 174:7, 189:10 permanent [1] - 70:1 person [51] - 12:24, 29:6, 33:12, 39:22, 44:26, 48:25, 48:29, 49:13, 50:13, 50:15, 52:24, 53:19, 53:22, 55:4, 55:7, 56:17, 57:9, 63:27, 64:5, 80:6, 83:3, 91:22, 97:18, 97:21, 100:16, 100:17, 100:24,

101:8, 101:11, 101:14, 101:15, 107:5, 110:1, 110:21, 111:11, 113:17, 116:14, 118:15, 141:6, 148:12, 148:13, 151:7, 160:19, 166:8, 173:28, 183:3, 183:25, 185:13, 185:18, 186:20, 188:1 personal [9] - 48:27, 50:17, 50:18, 79:21, 126:14, 161:17, 171:19, 171:23, 171:28 personally [6] - 9:26, 104:17, 143:18, 150:25, 161:20, 173:29 personnel [8] - 65:8, 70:15, 105:26, 106:9, 107:8, 108:15, 108:23, 174:25 persons [8] - 36:27, 58:11, 84:1, 100:19, 118:13, 148:8, 167:13, 168:23 persons.. [1] - 36:21 perspective [6] -26:11, 44:18, 44:22, 56:13, 90:24, 148:1 perusal [1] - 47:21 Peter [1] - 158:22 **PETER** [2] - 2:5, 3:13 **phone** [17] - 110:29, 111:4, 117:5, 164:6, 164:7, 166:18, 168:8, 169:5, 171:12, 172:20, 172:22, 177:20, 177:23, 178:1, 178:25, 183:17, 183:22 **phoned** [1] - 91:17 phones [2] - 77:15, 161:20 phrase [6] - 64:18, 64:20, 64:24, 72:14, 150:29 physical [2] -112:17, 112:19 pick [1] - 109:6 picked [6] - 86:17, 89:1, 89:4, 89:14, 96:3. 130:16 picking [2] - 82:23, 155:6

picture [1] - 45:9

piece [3] - 58:28,

59:4, 74:18

pieces [1] - 112:19 pile [1] - 93:19 pin [2] - 113:17, 119:20 **PLACE** [1] - 4:8 place [32] - 11:3, 11:12, 13:29, 14:10, 17:4, 23:8, 23:14, 23:28, 24:10, 24:17, 24:18, 27:12, 30:22, 37:15, 45:25, 45:26, 53:16, 58:20, 63:8, 63:14, 63:16, 66:29, 114:22, 130:20, 136:28, 137:4, 137:6, 137:13, 147:9, 164:23, 182:8, 186:15 placed [1] - 55:3 places [2] - 70:13, 139:26 plain [1] - 118:27 plan [2] - 51:19, 117:8 planned [3] - 53:20, 56:1, 108:21 plate [1] - 41:7 play [1] - 63:9 played [1] - 66:16 **ploy** [1] - 62:12 **PO**[3] - 118:15, 123:23, 123:27 point [49] - 9:18, 10:3, 11:23, 12:22, 19:9, 23:22, 23:24, 24:5, 24:26, 32:28, 39:7, 39:29, 40:2, 40:4, 40:5, 40:15, 50:12, 54:14, 61:25, 67:21, 73:3, 73:10, 75:18, 75:20, 76:14, 81:10, 82:14, 94:28, 95:20, 96:25, 98:2, 103:1, 121:12, 125:13, 125:14, 129:14, 135:6, 141:23, 143:12, 154:23, 155:7, 159:20, 159:28, 160:2, 175:3, 176:21, 179:10, 180:12, 182:12 pointed [1] - 128:12 pointing [1] - 113:27 points [2] - 132:5, policing [4] - 46:8, 59:11, 105:27, 127:6 Policing [1] - 38:21 policy [2] - 150:18,

populate [1] - 99:22 populated [2] -119:23, 119:24 portion [1] - 83:17 position [36] - 15:24, 24:14. 26:11. 30:21. 48:21, 50:10, 50:21, 51:17, 53:13, 54:2, 56:26, 57:1, 57:4, 57:11, 63:4, 80:7, 82:6, 84:12, 85:19, 85:22, 85:24, 94:18, 94:27, 96:16, 108:3, 126:29 134:23 162:6, 162:7, 168:14, 172:9, 176:24, 186:2, 186:3, 186:5 positive [2] - 65:18, 72:11 Positive [1] - 150:19 positively [1] - 93:19 possession [2] -137:17, 138:8 possibilities [2] -92:6, 93:24 possibility [2] -93:10, 171:3 possible [9] - 31:14, 108:11, 128:4, 145:24, 155:9, 160:21, 161:26, 174:17, 178:21 possibly [6] - 78:8, 86:19, 96:29, 99:4, 158:6, 159:18 post [7] - 39:15, 76:26, 77:29, 83:26, 129:21, 129:23, 132:12 potential [2] - 28:20, 78:12 potentially [3] -72:17, 131:28, 151:15 **POWER** [1] - 4:10 practically [1] -141:12 practice [11] - 20:17, 47:29, 48:1, 48:2, 65:26, 65:27, 86:2, 116:10, 123:9, 141:18, 148:26 practices [2] - 65:9, 65:12 pre [1] - 83:26 prearranged [1] -94:12 precise [3] - 127:21, 128:13, 128:25 precisely [2] - 80:15,

predominantly [1] -79:26 **preference** [1] - 45:5 preferences[1] -78:24 preliminary [1] -117:10 premises [1] -139:24 preparation [4] -44:22, 120:26, 123:2, 123:25 prepare [6] - 68:13, 116:21, 120:26, 140:18, 140:25, 141:3 prepared [3] - 15:21, 47:6, 120:27 preparing [1] - 159:5 prequel [1] - 49:20 presence [1] - 84:4 present [2] - 108:4, 138:16 presentation [3] -61:16, 61:20, 107:20 presented [2] -138:18, 145:19 presenter [2] -107:19, 139:1 presenting [1] - 72:2 preserved[1] -128:12 PRESIDENT [2] -1:13, 2:3 pressure [1] - 70:27 pressures [2] - 48:1, 62:25 presumably [4] -41:29, 91:17, 159:13, 175:16 pretty [5] - 77:4, 128:24, 133:11, 133:26, 136:26 previous [15] - 9:19, 22:16, 22:27, 83:21, 87:18, 96:22, 99:19, 107:25, 107:28, 123:7. 130:9. 165:10. 173:10, 174:29, 178:11 previously [7] -11:15. 12:29. 50:16. 62:22, 109:8, 169:10, 173:12 PREVIOUSLY [1] -163.8 **primarily** [2] - 111:3, 130:23 primary [2] - 59:10, 135:8 principal [1] - 163:14

154:26, 155:1, 155:3, print [1] - 122:9 PROTECTED[2] -131:28, 149:5 86:24, 86:27, 92:19, printed [10] - 86:21, 1:2. 1:3 155:18, 155:19, query [8] - 24:4, 93:11 97:14, 97:15, 97:16, protections [2] -155:20, 155:21, 87:15, 87:16, 95:22, randomly [1] - 93:20 155:22, 156:19, 99:15, 99:24, 100:20, 107:22, 109:1, 109:7, 181:11, 181:21 rang [2] - 149:22, 112:6, 113:25, 121:28 protocol [4] - 18:24, 188:12, 188:13, 150:2 183.13 printouts [1] - 97:16 19:15, 20:2, 20:14 188:14 questioned [1] rank [5] - 7:19, purely [1] - 98:21 58:13 102:25, 103:10, prints [3] - 109:24, proud [3] - 68:22, QUESTIONED [2] -112:8, 121:20 68:24, 68:27 purpose [3] - 114:15, 176:7, 177:16 121:7, 156:29 rapport [2] - 67:20, 5:29. 153:23 priority [2] - 24:8, provide [6] - 31:27, purposes [1] - 121:3 QUESTIONING [1] -143:6, 143:26, 144:5, 184:28 134.12 prisoner [1] - 108:15 175:11, 175:13 pursue [2] - 173:28, 160:26 rather [1] - 47:10 privy[1] - 174:6 provided [4] - 18:14, 177:9 questions [35] re [6] - 49:26, 50:25, 78:3, 177:28, 179:26 **pursued** [3] - 64:9, 23:29, 25:3, 28:2, 68:3, 72:27, 87:24, problem [6] - 76:13, 78:23, 81:14, 98:23, providing [2] -149:25, 151:12 33:4, 35:29, 38:3, 100:2 push [2] - 62:12, 42:7, 42:8, 67:3, **RE** [2] - 5:30, 161:3 130:19, 153:28 12:29. 31:13 71:14, 76:21, 84:19, prudent [1] - 177:8 147:14 RE-EXAMINED [2] problems [1] - 12:1 put [69] - 9:13, 13:28, 87:27, 93:29, 94:2, procedures [2] public [22] - 35:5, 5:30 161:3 94:4, 101:22, 101:23, 62:21, 62:27, 62:29, 14:10, 14:20, 17:4, reached [2] - 89:5, 94:29, 130:20 108:5, 108:8, 125:16, process [17] - 20:17, 23:8. 23:13. 23:28. 63:26, 64:1, 64:2, 93:11 126:21, 135:14, 24:10, 24:17, 24:21, 64:6, 70:13, 71:28, reactivated [1] -31:25, 51:11, 58:6, 25:28, 26:1, 27:11, 140:10, 142:26, 79:3, 79:5, 100:20, 65:20, 70:22, 107:10, 151:16 142:29, 144:8, 130:19, 130:23, 112:27, 113:5, 113:8, 28:28, 30:22, 33:4, read [12] - 33:24, 144:14, 145:20, 39:12, 42:1, 49:14, 133:24, 133:26, 113:11, 148:13, 33:27, 33:28, 58:23, 54:23, 55:10, 62:20, 149:5, 152:16, 148:15, 187:14, 134:26, 135:4, 79:11, 100:5, 101:5, 187:25, 189:4 62:29, 64:18, 64:26, 156:10, 156:12, 145:17, 169:8, 132:22, 135:12, 160:28, 163:23 169:12, 172:23 publicise [1] -69:5, 69:29, 77:17, 137:20, 137:22, quickly [3] - 65:28, 77:21, 80:15, 87:14, processes [1] -189:26 137:23 87:17, 88:13, 95:22, 145:22, 180:1 130:20 **pull** [6] - 8:15, 8:17, readily [1] - 76:24 97:27, 99:16, 99:20, 64:12, 64:20, 68:1, quiet [1] - 77:15 produce [3] - 52:29, reading [3] - 99:29, 113:10, 114:22, QUINN [1] - 3:10 118:23 115:22, 132:2 122:18, 188:2 128:24, 129:1, Quinn [2] - 23:13, produced [1] - 92:24 pulled [1] - 109:22 real [2] - 60:26, 129:18, 134:1, 134:6, produces [1] - 118:1 pulling [1] - 78:15 32:7 182:2 141:3, 147:2, 149:22, Quirk [1] - 94:15 **Pulse** [73] - 30:5, realise [1] - 119:29 professional [1] -151:20, 152:13, quirk [1] - 187:10 44:4, 57:26, 58:17, 41:5 reality [2] - 70:11, 152:21, 154:24. quite [11] - 38:28, 67:29, 85:14, 86:20, 129.3 professionally [2] -154:25, 155:7, 62:22, 67:14, 68:24, 87:14, 87:15, 90:29, really [25] - 22:26, 9:26. 104:18 155:20, 155:21, 99:4, 116:18, 132:5, 99:1, 99:15, 100:24, progress [1] -23:2, 24:23, 31:23, 155:22, 156:5, 107:22, 107:26, 165:14. 173:16. 37:22, 37:23, 40:13, 171:13 156:28, 158:18, 109:4, 109:15, 182:1, 190:9 progressed [2] -59:5, 69:28, 70:16, 159:24, 160:19, 109:21, 109:22, quo [1] - 59:5 76:4, 82:21, 104:6, 32:6, 157:25 169:12, 181:18, 112:12, 113:18, quote [3] - 54:20, promoted [4] - 16:8, 106:8, 116:13, 182:8, 183:5, 186:15 54:25, 126:1 102:25, 102:29, 115:9, 115:11, 126:17, 130:19, puts [6] - 141:15, 115:12, 119:20, 103:10 131:22, 136:25, 142:10. 142:19. 119:23, 119:25, R 142:27, 145:14, promotion [1] - 8:12 142:20, 142:25, 120:1, 120:13, 182:15, 183:18, promptly [3] - 65:24, 120:20, 120:28, 183:23, 186:23 66:1, 145:24 races [1] - 108:22 putting [8] - 11:2, 121:16, 126:28, reason [23] - 11:28, proper [2] - 73:12, radar [2] - 142:11, 13:25, 24:24, 65:16, 127:10, 127:13, 14:19, 24:9, 31:8, 73:16 137:7, 141:20, 142:12 127:16, 127:23, 40:28, 49:19, 50:19, properly [3] - 95:5, radio [1] - 128:18 129:3, 129:5, 131:21, 156:29, 169:26 72:27, 87:15, 87:17, 120:7, 120:10 raise [1] - 143:29 137:20, 137:22, 87:19, 96:19, 99:16, proposal [1] - 184:20 raised [12] - 34:6, Q 137:23, 138:9, 99:17, 99:18, 99:22, propose [1] - 81:21 85:13, 123:5, 124:25, 138:24, 138:27, 99:25, 118:15, 130:8, proposed [2] -124:28, 126:11, 138:28, 139:5, 139:7, 146:5, 151:18, 47:18, 172:1 qualified [1] - 63:27 131:28, 134:11, 146:12, 146:13, 155:10, 174:18 protected [12] - 9:23, quality [3] - 47:14, 136:11, 144:1, 171:2, 146:26, 147:16, reasonable [4] -36:28, 42:29, 50:14, 125:22, 159:7 172:26 147:17, 147:22, 16:3, 33:16, 34:12, 66:14. 69:1. 83:19. QUAY [3] - 2:24, raising [1] - 127:9 149:22, 151:25, 81:10 104:13, 181:12, 2:31, 4:12 rambling [1] - 79:26 151:28, 154:19, reasonably [1] -181:22, 185:20, queries [5] - 59:28, random [5] - 86:23, 154:21, 154:24, 157:8 185:21 123:5, 123:19,

reasons [4] - 45:7, 63:6, 120:6, 135:8 reassigning [1] -184:16 rebuke [2] - 41:6, 41:7 recalled [2] - 43:7, 163:3 recategorise [1] -135:3 receipt [1] - 173:26 receive [7] - 66:25, 111:4, 147:24, 150:2, 157:5, 157:22, 162:11 received [18] - 13:13, 27:1, 27:9, 29:18, 29:20, 29:22, 35:26, 42:1, 46:1, 111:11, 113:5, 113:8, 113:11, 130:15, 136:20, 146:6, 149:12, 190:2 receives [1] - 142:1 recipient [1] - 179:4 recipients [4] -157:2, 157:8, 157:12, 158:2 recite [1] - 141:13 reclassification [5] -133:22, 135:9, 150:22, 150:23, 150:26 reclassify[1] -134:15 recognise [1] - 91:22 recollect [9] - 51:9, 94:27, 95:6, 95:26, 96:8, 97:24, 112:13, 123:9, 147:18 recollection [20] -51:14, 54:28, 58:6, 80:14, 81:7, 83:7, 85:28, 88:7, 88:11, 89:24, 89:25, 95:2, 96:27, 96:29, 97:16, 97:28, 98:3, 100:22, 110:13, 126:10 recommend [1] -177:15 recommendation [1] - 47:17 recommended [3] -180:24, 188:24, 189:8 reconsider [1] -170.23 record [18] - 35:5. 41:12, 45:15, 45:19, 99:1, 105:28, 108:15, 109:14, 127:10, 127:13, 127:16, 127:23, 129:4, 129:5,

132:12, 151:19, 151:20, 162:17 recorded [10] - 14:7, 14:25, 16:10, 107:26, 107:27, 109:24, 134:15, 151:6, 151:24, 151:27 recordings [1] -109:15 records [3] - 123:26, 151:3, 151:9 recounted [1] -180.15 recovery[1] - 84:8 **REDDY** [1] - 4:8 reduced [1] - 79:7 refer [9] - 8:28, 79:23, 128:13, 145:3, 146:14, 146:26, 147:3, 167:20, 184:23 reference [15] -15:26, 35:23, 73:22, 75:24, 76:29, 112:1, 113:16, 113:21, 127:29, 147:16, 147:19, 148:17, 150:20, 167:3, 168:1 referenced [1] - 61:3 references [3] - 49:8, 76:5, 147:8 referencing [2] -129:5, 131:17 referral [1] - 73:18 referred [5] - 27:4, 38:17, 49:28, 144:21, 187:22 referring [9] - 16:6, 16:10, 21:18, 76:3, 120:15, 125:28, 140:23, 142:4, 183:29 refers [6] - 71:26, 77:11, 87:9, 146:13, 146:14, 178:10 reflect [6] - 40:8, 40:19, 40:23, 56:5, 56:18, 183:4 refusal [1] - 164:2 refused [1] - 175:11 refute [1] - 51:17 reg [1] - 18:23 regard [9] - 22:17,

35:9, 75:18, 77:1,

143:13, 178:22, 179:8

regards [1] - 145:16

114:13, 114:17,

regarding [5] -

65:9, 142:15

97:17, 188:17

27:14, 53:6, 64:21,

registered [2] -

REGISTRAR [1] - 2:5 registration [3] -91:15, 97:18, 99:21 regular [6] - 8:7, 44:14, 61:4, 62:26, 70:4, 185:7 regularly [6] - 31:10, 31:12, 31:15, 31:18, 31:28, 82:26 regulation [2] -189:7, 189:9 regulations [1] -189:9 reins [1] - 43:3 reject [2] - 126:28, 128:7 rejected [2] - 64:19, rejecting [3] -119:10, 119:13, 119:16 relate [1] - 168:22 related [25] - 10:2, 11:25, 12:15, 20:13, 20:24, 21:19, 21:23, 27:16, 27:17, 28:19, 29:8, 30:12, 32:2, 33:13, 33:17, 34:13, 44:19, 46:8, 64:23, 69:25, 87:13, 96:22, 104:22, 106:16, 106:23 relates [3] - 52:14, 87:24, 177:6 relating [5] - 58:9, 58:28, 136:8, 137:27, 163:17 relation [126] - 12:26, 13:14, 14:28, 15:3, 15:7, 15:28, 16:19, 17:17, 17:20, 18:19, 18:24, 18:26, 19:11, 19:14, 19:23, 21:1, 21:9, 25:18, 26:19, 27:2, 29:14, 30:2, 31:7, 34:1, 34:2, 34:4, 34:7, 37:7, 37:14, 42:5, 42:25, 43:9, 43:14, 43:27, 44:1, 44:2, 44:4, 44:7, 44:15, 44:27, 45:27, 46:27, 47:5, 47:8, 51:2, 52:4, 52:24, 53:28, 56:21, 57:22, 58:5, 59:17, 60:2, 60:3, 60:5, 61:11, 61:14, 61:15, 61:17, 61:18, 63:17, 63:22, 64:7, 64:8, 64:15,

85:13, 85:14, 85:17, 86:23, 86:29, 87:21, 87:25, 90:29, 96:26, 99:1, 104:12, 105:22, 106:14, 106:17, 106:18, 111:21, 114:27, 119:8, 125:18, 126:25, 127:8, 130:28, 131:6, 133:10, 133:17, 134:19, 136:6, 137:16, 138:5, 139:9, 140:11, 143:15, 145:21, 146:12, 147:28, 148:27, 150:14, 150:22, 151:19, 153:10, 161:7, 162:6, 163:18, 163:24, 168:7, 168:19, 170:18, 172:28, 175:10, 180:17, 181:1, 181:4, 183:19, 185:5, 186:11, 187:26, 189:20 relationship [14] -12:21, 22:16, 50:17, 67:24, 78:3, 78:4, 79:21, 79:27, 181:27, 181:29, 182:2, 182:20, 183:21, 184.24 relatively [1] - 92:15 relevance [3] - 39:5. 187:17, 188:29 relevant [18] - 16:7, 36:22, 36:24, 37:18, 38:3, 38:4, 39:6, 39:7, 40:12, 65:1, 73:8, 74:20, 74:26, 82:9, 82:24, 108:7, 180:8, 188.2 relinguish [2] -55:27, 55:28 remainder [1] -116:16 remains [3] - 24:26, 84:12, 93:13 remarks [1] - 87:12 remedy [1] - 150:17 remember [28] -49:18, 50:6, 61:3, 62:25, 65:26, 68:18, 71:28, 72:9, 77:12, 78:9, 79:13, 83:9, 86:7, 93:19, 93:24, 95:29, 110:8, 110:11, 110:22, 111:20, 112:4, 123:22, 124:5, 131:12, 133:23,

138:6, 138:9, 183:10 remembered [1] -49:6 remembering [1] -50.7 remind [4] - 68:3, 143:10, 143:11, 149:15 reminder [2] - 137:3, 174:4 remit [2] - 15:15, 37:22 removed [1] - 150:16 replies [1] - 132:7 report [123] - 18:25, 19:17, 19:25, 20:19, 21:22, 21:24, 22:28, 23:6, 40:21, 47:11, 61:26, 68:13, 107:22, 107:23, 107:24, 108:27, 108:29, 109:6, 109:14, 112:6, 112:14, 112:16, 112:20, 112:24, 112:28, 113:10, 114:12, 114:13, 114:21, 115:8, 115:14, 115:27, 116:15, 116:21, 116:27, 117:27, 117:29, 118:1, 119:2, 119:4, 119:5, 119:6, 119:7, 119:16, 119:17, 119:21, 119:26, 119:27, 120:3, 120:19, 121:14, 121:15, 121:17, 121:19, 121:20, 121:24, 121:26, 122:10, 122:22, 123:7, 124:6, 124:7, 124:11, 124:26, 125:4, 126:3, 126:10, 126:11, 126:14, 127:3, 129:13, 130:13, 130:15, 130:25, 130:26, 131:18, 132:18, 134:16, 137:15, 137:17, 138:14, 138:22, 138:23, 138:24, 139:14. 140:18. 140:26, 141:3, 143:27, 147:1, 147:24, 148:24, 149:19, 149:22, 149:25, 155:14, 155:15, 155:28, 156:6, 156:21,

72:24, 73:18, 79:16,

156:23, 158:18, 108:23, 111:14 158:19, 158:29, RESOURCES [1] -159:8, 159:23, 3:15 159:24, 160:16, respect [17] - 10:25, 160:19, 161:23, 14:22, 18:5, 18:10, 161:24, 164:20, 23:21, 64:23, 104:8, 164:24, 173:10, 119:24, 120:21, 176:16, 178:9, 121:3, 123:19, 178:11, 179:26, 133:22, 165:15, 180:4, 180:5, 180:15 169:25, 181:6, reported [17] - 18:28, 184:12, 185:9 19:12, 30:9, 58:1, respected [1] -68:11, 97:13, 127:28, 171:28 140:16, 154:1, 154:7, respectful [2] - 38:2, 175:25, 176:9, 176:15, 176:29, respond [2] - 157:10, 179:15, 180:18, 184:3 158.4 reporter [1] - 9:19 responded [1] reporting [17] -33:20 18:25, 19:1, 19:16, responder [1] -19:17, 19:23, 19:24, 141:15 19:28, 22:29, 31:22, responds [1] -45:20, 67:28, 68:9, 158:25 109:3, 115:19, 123:8, response [15] -140:14, 143:6 33:15, 33:23, 54:24, reports [5] - 20:17, 64:15, 132:15, 76:24, 108:10, 132:4, 147:15, 148:27, 151:4 148:28, 149:1, represented [1] -149:12, 150:1, 150:2, 32:25 150:5, 150:9, 157:3 request [7] - 49:10, responsibility [6] -50:1, 66:25, 86:29, 103:20, 106:22, 109:6, 149:8, 162:11 115:29. 129:18. requested [4] -143:14, 182:12 85:12, 173:7, 173:27, rest [4] - 77:5, 114:4, 174:25 160:13 requesting [4] resting [1] - 160:14 100:18, 101:8, restricted [1] - 63:5 101:14, 142:8 restructuring [1] required [9] - 30:2, 58:7 45:19, 47:20, 57:23, result [5] - 62:19, 127:3, 129:9, 134:12, 66:14, 92:12, 99:26, 137:9, 139:8 105:29 requires [3] - 30:6, resulted [2] - 37:8, 57:27. 156:3 96.6 resents [1] - 158:22 resulting [2] - 30:3, reservation [1] -57:23 169:13 resume [1] - 190:18 reservations [4] -**RESUMED** [2] - 7:1, 167:21, 167:25, 102:7 169:25, 169:27 retaining [1] - 59:5 RESOLUTIONS [1] retired [1] - 92:1 **RETIRED** [11] - 3:5, resolve [1] - 39:4 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, resolved [1] - 81:25 3:12, 3:13, 5:16, 85:4, resource [6] - 13:12, 88:4, 94:8 21:2, 22:5, 22:25, retirement [1] - 85:9 24:2. 186:24 retrieve[1] - 64:3 resources [5] - 23:7, retrieves [1] - 63:28 108:15, 108:18, retrospective[1] -

return [7] - 38:18, 47:14, 74:28, 84:9, 134:6, 166:23, 173:14 returned [5] - 103:1, 149:21, 165:10, 174:9, 189:12 returning [2] - 50:25, 160:3 review [3] - 60:18, 107:29, 109:9 reviewed [3] - 134:7, 135:4, 145:17 revisit [4] - 73:23, 73:24, 74:12, 179:27 right-hand [1] -127:21 ring [4] - 19:25, 111:12, 111:16, 118:19 ringing [2] - 19:28, 20:3 **ROAD**[1] - 2:18 road [2] - 128:10, 189.4 robberies [2] -111:27, 144:27 robbery [10] - 110:1, 111:21, 112:11, 113:17, 113:22, 119:9, 130:27, 144:25, 144:26, 154:2 role [78] - 10:25, 12:17, 12:19, 12:24, 12:29, 14:13, 15:14, 16:12, 17:15, 18:10, 20:27, 21:26, 23:2, 28:23, 29:14, 32:9, 32:12, 32:15, 32:20, 33:6, 39:10, 46:17, 47:1, 47:4, 47:5, 47:13, 48:5, 48:13, 48:22, 48:23, 48:25, 48:28, 49:1, 49:2, 50:11, 50:27, 51:4, 51:8, 51:10, 51:15, 53:5, 54:10, 55:5, 55:27, 56:14, 56:21, 57:3, 57:9, 58:8, 58:10, 58:26, 59:10, 59:11, 59:13, 59:16, 60:5, 62:27, 63:6, 63:7, 70:4, 70:12, 70:13, 73:5, 78:19, 80:5, 81:18, 87:25, 95:12, 103:28, 105:19, 106:14, 106:24, 107:16,

40:3

174:27 roles [4] - 63:9, 63:10, 63:16, 70:15 Roma [1] - 49:17 room [2] - 63:29, 94:13 roster [1] - 110:8 rotates [1] - 63:4 rough [2] - 90:4, 145.1 round [3] - 128:27, 159:2, 159:3 route [2] - 146:20 routes [1] - 146:23 routine [1] - 59:14 rudimentary [1] -129:23 rule [3] - 106:2, 139:26, 160:18 ruling [1] - 73:14 run [4] - 91:27, 95:12, 99:5, 99:28 RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 4:7

scale [1] - 79:2

S

Sadly [1] - 79:25 safe [3] - 63:19, 63:28, 64:2 **Saint** [2] - 127:25, 128:9 sake [1] - 141:19 sanction [2] -188:25, 189:8 sanctioned [1] -189:25 **SANDRA**[1] - 4:6 sat [3] - 107:6, 133:2, 134:22 satisfactory [5] -47:16, 126:4, 129:13, 129:14, 155:23 satisfied [3] - 25:24, 26:8, 126:13 Saturday [2] -115:29, 116:1 Saturday's [1] -112:10 **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 saw [15] - 48:25, 55:5, 69:6, 69:15, 69:27, 70:19, 70:29, 72:12, 77:9, 110:14, 115:12, 126:14, 126:15, 134:16, 138:10 **SC** [11] - 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:6,

SCANLAN[1] - 3:8 scant [2] - 112:12, 131:17 scene [9] - 113:28, 117:9, 118:18, 125:9, 127:5, 127:20, 127:25, 128:3, 139:18 scheduled [1] -110.18 schedules [1] -103:24 screen [20] - 28:14, 28:28, 49:22, 53:26, 60:9, 61:6, 66:6, 71:17, 87:6, 97:20, 98:28, 99:23, 109:21, 114:28, 122:18, 128:16, 138:10, 152:14, 152:21, 161:12 screens [1] - 97:17 scroll [7] - 28:29, 61:7, 147:7, 162:4, 177:3, 178:29, 182:19 **SEAN**[4] - 1:12, 2:2, 2.22 3.17 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 search [13] - 44:4, 87:9, 87:18, 87:19, 87:21, 96:19, 96:20, 96:22, 99:16, 99:17, 99:19, 99:20, 99:25 searches [4] - 85:14, 96:9, 127:6, 163:18 searching [1] -139:16 second [22] - 11:16, 14:10, 14:17, 15:28, 16:19, 36:25, 37:26, 96:4, 96:5, 97:20, 100:23, 115:15, 120:12, 137:11, 140:9, 155:16, 158:21, 165:27, 171:17, 174:23, 182:21, 185:29 secondly [2] - 68:24, 69:24 section [1] - 87:12 **security** [1] - 106:15 **see** [70] - 14:24, 15:1, 20:21, 21:12, 21:17, 23:18, 24:11, 24:21, 25:28, 27:17, 29:27, 33:2, 44:7, 54:14, 55:7, 58:22, 65:3, 65:13, 66:3, 68:2, 68:4, 68:7,

121:9. 121:12.

134:19, 134:21,

70:16, 70:20, 70:21, 71:2, 81:26, 84:1, 87:6, 87:9, 87:22, 99:2, 99:8, 99:27, 100:25, 101:13, 109:2, 112:26, 115:22, 116:27, 117:1, 118:6, 123:4, 124:1, 127:26, 128:1, 128:20, 128:21, 131:9, 131:10, 131:18, 131:24, 131:25, 132:3, 132:6, 132:27, 133:15, 135:28, 137:20, 137:26, 138:12, 138:21, 143:10, 154:10, 158:28, 169:8, 186:10, 186:25, 186:27 seeing [1] - 127:8 seek [8] - 17:17, 20:28, 21:27, 30:23, 32:24, 62:4, 170:3, 182:6 seeking [4] - 149:5, 149:6, 150:10, 177:20 seem [5] - 49:14, 128:13, 167:29, 170:1, 182:21 select [1] - 120:24 selected [1] - 93:8 selecting [1] - 93:20 send [3] - 47:16, 47:17, 118:21 sender [1] - 47:15 sending [2] - 70:28, 181:7 senior [2] - 106:8, 149:10 sense [10] - 30:21, 74:14, 95:25, 95:26, 99:26, 102:5, 114:13, 167:22, 169:12, 169:29 sensible [1] - 81:11 sensitive [1] -189:23 sent [10] - 35:22, 47:22, 60:29, 68:3, 116:12, 127:3, 131:13, 156:15, 173:17, 187:18 sentence [6] - 15:17, 15:29, 16:19, 76:3, 132:26, 150:14 sentiments [1] -174:20 separate [4] - 9:13, 9:14, 11:15, 37:1

September [14] -44:3, 45:8, 46:3, 87:6, 99:9, 103:8, 110:2, 131:5, 133:17, 133:19, 136:29, 142:6, 147:5, 187:6 Sergeant [141] - 7:8, 7:14, 8:11, 10:8, 10:9, 10:10. 11:16. 12:28. 13:2, 13:4, 13:7, 13:9, 13:15, 13:17, 13:20, 14:15, 14:27, 15:5, 15:22, 21:20, 22:15, 22:23, 25:29, 26:1, 26:7, 26:12, 27:6, 27:23, 29:6, 29:9, 29:20, 29:22, 29:27, 29:28, 30:4, 30:16, 31:6, 33:12, 35:17, 36:7, 36:28, 42:14, 42:22, 46:16, 46:24, 46:28, 49:26, 52:7, 55:3, 55:18, 55:22, 57:2, 57:16, 57:24, 58:8, 58:25, 58:29, 59:2, 59:6, 59:15, 59:20, 60:25, 67:12, 68:15, 68:16, 71:18, 81:12, 81:17, 105:11, 105:12, 106:4, 110:18, 116:23, 117:5, 117:12, 117:14, 123:15, 124:16. 126:24. 130:6, 131:14, 131:16, 133:1, 133:5, 135:23, 141:28, 153:1, 153:2, 153:13, 161:19, 164:7, 164:11, 164:20, 165:8, 166:5, 167:21, 168:12. 169:4. 169:13, 170:1, 171:2, 171:19, 172:8, 172:16, 172:19, 173:11, 173:19, 175:18, 175:25, 176:2, 176:9, 178:8, 178:16, 179:12, 179:14. 181:29. 182:2, 182:9, 182:13, 182:15, 182:20, 182:22, 182:27, 183:4, 183:8, 183:11, 183:16, 183:24, 184:4, 184:10, 184:18, 184:24, 185.2 185.16 185:17, 186:20

sergeant [130] - 7:19,

7:25, 7:27, 8:9, 8:13,

8:14, 10:8, 11:4, 11:15, 11:16, 14:15, 14:17, 14:18, 14:19, 15:9, 15:16, 17:15, 18:26, 19:16, 19:21, 19:25, 19:27, 20:1, 21:7, 22:13, 22:23, 25:13, 25:23, 27:2, 33:2, 33:13, 34:6, 34:17, 37:19, 41:10, 44:25, 47:1, 47:6, 47:10, 60:22, 60:23, 60:27, 61:15, 63:3, 65:1, 67:15, 68:4, 68:10, 68:16, 71:2, 71:14, 74:19, 76:19, 79:18, 81:3, 82:4, 84:25, 84:26, 102:25, 103:2, 103:6, 103:14, 103:17, 103:26, 103:27, 104:4, 105:12, 105:21, 106:6, 106:9, 106:29, 107:1, 107:10, 107:11. 107:13. 107:16, 110:17, 110:24, 112:25, 115:20, 115:28, 116:1, 116:4, 116:10, 116:11, 116:12, 117:7, 117:11, 117:17, 117:18, 118:2. 121:9. 123:11. 124:12, 124:13, 124:14, 129:17, 131:10, 132:1, 133:2, 133:8, 135:29, 136:4, 136:7, 136:9, 136:17, 139:28, 140:15, 140:22, 143:15, 143:16, 143:18, 143:22, 143:23, 143:28, 145:28, 148:9, 148:11, 157:19, 157:24, 157:27, 162:7, 169:15, 173:2, 177:16, 184:25 SERGEANT[14] -3:12, 3:20, 4:5, 4:6, 4:6, 5:3, 5:10, 7:11, 25:10, 28:10, 35:1, 42:17, 67:9, 71:9 sergeant's [4] -68:12, 116:6, 118:8, 140:17 sergeants [19] -14:16, 24:24, 26:1, 27:5, 57:21, 59:9, 106:12, 107:1, 107:2, 149:9, 158:11, 181:27, 185:6, 185:10, 185:28, 186:13 serious [17] - 112:2, 112:8, 114:6, 115:7, 129:10, 130:27, 134:5, 135:2, 136:13, 137:6, 144:22, 145:10, 145:14, 147:2, 147:11, 147:26, 148:25 seriously [1] -118:24 service [1] - 151:4 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 Services [1] - 1:24 set [5] - 116:16, 117:8, 134:3, 148:10, 151:12 **sets** [1] - 146:5 setting [1] - 137:7 seven [2] - 159:15, 159:16 shall [1] - 38:19 **SHANE** [1] - 3:23 **SHANKEY** [1] - 3:21 SHANKEY-SMITH [1] - 3:21 **SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 **shape** [2] - 76:27, 100.6 SHEAHAN [1] - 3:18 **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 **shift** [6] - 46:9, 70:12, 77:13, 91:21, 136:10 shifts [8] - 9:7, 9:14, 31:22, 44:29, 45:6, 46:7, 62:8 **SHIP** [1] - 3:28 **ship** [1] - 65:19 short [14] - 68:13, 115:8, 116:21, 118:1, 132:19, 134:6, 134:7, 140:18, 140:25, 148:29, 149:12, 149:26, 152:6, 161:23 **shortfalls** [1] - 16:28 shortly [3] - 81:22, 81:28, 162:18 showed [1] - 76:6 **showing** [1] - 40:12 shown [6] - 28:13, 29:1, 31:2, 31:3, 50:14, 88:9 **shows** [2] - 39:8, 120:20

11:25, 11:27, 11:28, 18:7, 18:19, 18:25, 19:1, 19:8, 19:12, 19:16, 19:17, 19:23, 19:24, 19:28, 20:4, 20:22, 31:22, 46:21, 62:10, 77:5, 83:12, 83:22, 104:21, 162:20, 162:22 sickly [1] - 165:12 side [4] - 24:18, 50:27, 78:11, 127:21 **sign** [1] - 64:3 **signature** [1] - 18:16 signed [2] - 18:15, 177:12 significance [3] -74:27, 123:12, 124:2 significant [7] -45:11, 45:15, 45:17, 72:9, 74:17, 103:7, 126:26 **signing** [2] - 19:7, 104.7 **similar** [1] - 14:13 simply [5] - 26:3, 40:29, 43:9, 89:24, 166.18 **SINÉAD**[1] - 4:7 SINéAD [1] - 2:7 sit [6] - 30:4, 57:25, 58:16, 76:25, 107:11, 107:12 siting [1] - 58:29 sitting [1] - 159:22 situ [1] - 13:25 situation [8] - 32:5, 69:29, 70:3, 70:7, 81:16, 172:3, 176:29, 186:19 six [4] - 9:22, 147:8, 159:14, 160:15 sixth [1] - 36:20 **skill** [1] - 70:5 slight [1] - 58:7 slightly [3] - 51:20, 59:10, 177:4 slow [2] - 122:3 slowly [1] - 122:5 small [5] - 46:14, 64:1, 91:19, 92:15, 125:3 **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 SMITHFIELD [2] -2:24, 4:12 so-called [1] - 33:14 **so..** [1] - 93:1 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 solely [2] - 26:22,

133:1, 137:11, 149:6,

shut [1] - 73:8

sick [27] - 9:26,

SOLICITOR [1] - 2:8 SOLICITOR'S [1] -3:27 SOLICITORS [6] -2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, 4:8. 4:11 solid [1] - 67:24 solution [1] - 169:4 solving [4] - 11:6, 21:20, 28:20, 29:8 somebody.. [1] someone [7] - 51:16, 68:22, 69:6, 118:19, 125:6, 157:15, 178:18 sometime [2] -71:27, 165:4 sometimes [5] -77:1, 87:17, 99:18, 107:5, 132:2 somewhat [7] -15:28, 76:14, 110:14, 131:20, 154:20, 171:10, 183:23 soon [1] - 161:26 **sorry** [46] - 8:15, 10:10, 15:19, 36:1, 36:17, 37:25, 37:26, 74:13, 74:16, 74:17, 76:2, 76:17, 84:23, 85:21, 96:5, 96:24, 97:1, 98:20, 100:14, 102:26, 104:11, 107:23, 118:6, 119:26, 120:1, 120:4, 120:11, 122:3, 122:6, 122:27, 124:14, 128:23, 136:1, 141:11, 142:20, 142:23, 149:16, 152:23, 152:26, 153:7, 155:17, 160:28, 161:11, 161:14, 172:5, 177:13 sort [16] - 69:11, 90:7, 106:8, 106:13, 106:22. 107:19. 117:10, 123:28, 129:23, 129:24, 134:11, 134:17, 136:8, 159:20, 184:16, 189:20 sought [1] - 146:16 sounds [1] - 74:13 source [1] - 139:23 sources [1] - 138:2 **space** [1] - 91:2 **spare** [1] - 63:16 speaking [4] - 18:29, 23:11, 24:6, 51:16

speaks [1] - 143:1 specific [13] - 30:12, 33:19, 33:29, 51:1, 58:28, 59:2, 59:18, 61:3. 76:3. 86:29. 109:12, 117:25, 157:21 specifically [5] -17:12, 23:11, 124:5, 125:19, 183:11 specifics [1] - 10:29 speculate [1] - 96:21 speculation [1] -87:16 **speed** [2] - 111:8, 111:18 spoken [1] - 60:17 spot [1] - 146:25 spotted [1] - 112:11 squads [1] - 158:11 **squarely** [1] - 127:9 SR1 [1] - 18:5 staff [2] - 177:9, 182:25 stage [14] - 11:10, 13:18. 19:1. 21:14. 24:4, 28:24, 32:24, 69:20, 74:12, 83:3, 100:26, 151:21, 162:19, 182:7 stages [4] - 45:27, 46:23, 104:19, 146:2 stamp [6] - 42:2, 65:16, 113:4, 113:9, 113:11, 113:15 stamped [2] -112:26, 151:23 stance [1] - 48:26 stand [7] - 53:12, 53:15, 65:2, 75:11, 75:13, 172:6, 181:19 standard [6] - 47:3, 47:4, 47:24, 136:25, 136:26, 137:8 standards [1] - 83:21 **standing** [1] - 40:6 stark [1] - 129:2 start [6] - 48:5, 52:27, 53:2, 129:8, 147:14, 155:4 started [3] - 10:18, 82:14, 143:8 starting [3] - 9:22, 112:7, 163:16 starts [1] - 36:25 state [2] - 182:27,

184:27

STATE [1] - 3:27

statement [74] -

8:28, 22:1, 22:2,

28:14, 32:27, 32:29, 33:9, 33:10, 33:20, 36:13, 51:26, 54:20, 54:23, 54:25, 64:17, 71:15, 71:18, 71:24, 71:27, 72:3, 72:17, 75:25, 75:27, 76:20, 78:18, 85:1, 85:12, 102:13, 103:22, 104:1, 104:5, 104:29, 105:5, 125:25, 130:4, 135:12, 138:13, 147:4, 149:23, 152:20, 162:1, 162:2, 163:15, 163:17, 164:1, 164:2, 164:14, 166:6, 166:8, 166:13, 166:18, 167:22, 168:2, 168:5, 168:12, 168:16, 169:10, 169:19, 170:4, 172:14, 173:13, 175:5, 175:10, 175:12, 175:14, 176:15, 176:19. 176:23, 177:10, 178:20, 180:11, 180:12, 181:28, 187:4 statements [1] -47:24 States [1] - 166:2 stating [1] - 105:4 station [38] - 11:13, 14:16, 17:16, 19:26, 22:27. 26:8. 26:21. 46:14, 61:20, 63:19, 68:12, 69:3, 74:21, 77:25, 84:3, 86:3, 86:4, 91:6, 91:13, 106:7, 108:9, 110:20, 111:9, 113:14, 116:6, 118:8, 118:12, 118:14. 118:20. 123:10, 140:17, 148:12, 148:15, 157:22, 157:27, 185:7, 188:1, 188:19 **Station** [10] - 7:18, 8:8, 43:4, 45:12, 45:25, 46:29, 48:13, 66:21, 100:21, 177:7 stations [1] - 107:3 status [2] - 59:5, 90:10 statutory [1] - 150:17 stenographic [1] -1:26 stenography [1] -STENOGRAPHY[1]

- 1:29 step [9] - 33:9, 46:29, 55:29, 57:1, 57:2, 59:13, 126:20, 143:10, 183:21 STEPHANIE [1] -2.27 STEPHEN [1] - 2:21 stepping [3] - 56:9, 72:17, 184:8 steps [4] - 24:8, 117:10, 139:9, 139:22 stick [1] - 145:11 sticking [1] - 40:10 **still** [15] - 22:24, 24:26. 55:5. 106:3. 125:15, 145:19, 151:14, 151:15, 151:29, 153:4, 155:18, 156:10, 170:3, 171:11, 179:22 stone [1] - 151:12 stood [2] - 172:12, 179:20 stop [3] - 158:21, 171:17, 174:2 stopped [4] - 45:26, 187:26, 188:20, 189:3 story [1] - 155:2 straight [1] - 151:19 strain [2] - 70:26, street [1] - 100:23 **STREET** [3] - 2:12, 3:28. 4:3 stress [8] - 10:2, 11:26, 20:24, 33:17, 34:13, 69:21, 77:3, 104:22 stressful [2] - 11:11, 30:28 strong [2] - 133:26, 134:27 structure [4] - 11:3, 27:11, 134:2, 182:7 structures [1] -13:25 struggle [3] - 44:21, 44:27, 78:1 struggled [3] - 62:8, 78:1. 78:22 struggling [5] -44:18, 61:24, 62:24, 77:21, 83:5 **stuck** [1] - 154:29 stuff [5] - 69:12, 75:7. 93:20. 95:8. 108:25 stupid [1] - 100:14 style [1] - 65:4

sub [2] - 107:2, 185:8 sub-district [2] -107:2, 185:8 **subject** [7] - 34:3, 36:29, 53:14, 102:2, 115:8, 115:16, 185:19 subjected [1] -182:29 submission [7] -37:28, 38:2, 38:18, 40:15, 81:1, 81:2 submissions [1] -40.24 submitted [5] -11:24, 131:27, 164:21, 164:24, 180:4 subsequent [4] -94:18, 176:12, 178:8, 180:6 subsequently [8] -20:18, 36:22, 65:2, 96:5, 154:26, 180:1, 180:4, 183:24 subsistence [1] -94.21 substance [2] -83:27, 126:10 substantive [2] -39:24. 40:21 **substitute** [1] - 59:13 successive [1] -179:13 **suffering** [1] - 83:4 sufficient [2] -154:25, 156:25 suggest [5] - 77:26, 77:28, 140:2, 141:2, 172:16 suggested [5] -32:18, 33:5, 54:28, 58:18, 64:16 suggesting [4] -54:11, 55:10, 139:7, 169.28 suggestion [8] -39:23, 51:15, 55:27, 64:11, 64:16, 66:19, 81:25. 165:1 suggests [3] - 51:27, 53:2, 74:20 suitable [2] - 12:23, 173:28 **sum** [1] - 127:29 summary [11] -20:21, 119:27, 120:3, 120:5, 121:19, 121:20, 121:24, 121:26, 122:11, 122:22, 134:16

summer [1] - 90:1 Sunday [15] -111:20, 112:4, 112:23, 112:28, 113:5, 116:1, 117:1, 117:3, 117:7, 125:8, 129:15, 129:19, 143:8, 147:14, 156:13 **Sundays** [1] - 111:2 super [1] - 19:11 Superintendent [116] - 10:18, 11:1, 14:11, 15:6, 15:10, 15:21, 16:6, 16:8, 16:9, 16:22, 17:10, 21:26, 23:5, 24:6, 25:16, 27:10, 28:16, 29:4, 29:16, 31:4, 32:23, 36:29, 43:3, 43:6, 43:13, 43:28, 46:20, 48:9, 48:24, 49:2, 49:3, 49:23, 50:9, 50:20, 51:27, 53:3, 54:22, 55:2, 56:24, 58:4, 59:28, 61:9, 61:13. 64:11. 65:5. 65:22, 67:27, 79:10, 86:8, 86:25, 87:23, 88:18, 88:20, 88:23, 89:4, 89:11, 89:15, 89:18, 90:15, 92:24, 92:27, 94:3, 95:7, 95:11, 95:27, 96:1, 96:6, 96:14, 96:25, 97:6, 105:1, 107:7, 125:25, 131:5, 132:18, 133:25, 133:27, 135:25, 137:2, 138:12, 140:7, 142:10, 142:15, 144:3, 145:8, 146:5, 148:22. 148:27. 149:1, 149:26, 150:5, 150:8, 150:15, 156:1, 158:23, 161:17, 163:3, 164:25, 164:26, 166:24, 173:20, 180:22, 180:24, 184:15, 184:20, 186:14, 187:4, 187:10, 187:12, 187:18, 187:19, 189:11, 189:13, 189:19 **SUPERINTENDENT** [15] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21 superintendent [76]

- 12:8, 12:27, 13:24, 14:7, 14:22, 17:23, 19:14, 21:28, 23:1, 23:9, 46:19, 47:7, 49:3, 51:17, 51:19, 52:28, 57:3, 63:12, 65:16, 70:10, 80:13, 80:25, 81:5, 82:12, 85:25, 86:12, 86:19, 86:22, 92:9, 93:5, 93:7, 106:13, 106:28, 107:18, 110:26, 114:11, 114:22, 115:17, 127:18, 129:12, 132:2, 133:6, 133:21, 134:1, 142:8, 143:29, 145:26, 149:11, 150:3, 157:28, 161:10, 163:5, 167:1, 169:9, 169:18. 169:23. 169:26, 170:11, 172:2, 173:23, 174:3, 174:14, 175:19. 176:3. 176:16. 178:9. 178:13, 179:19, 179:26, 180:5, 181:10, 182:18, 186:18, 189:23, 190:16 superintendent's [11] - 10:23, 70:22, 87:10, 87:20, 96:17, 99:12, 106:27, 148:10, 172:13, 178:3, 179:11 superintendents [3] - 65:7, 149:8, 189:17 supervise [7] -26:13, 30:1, 57:20, 57:21, 59:10, 120:26, 182.13 supervised [3] -26:16, 27:21, 78:20 supervising [11] -10:7, 26:1, 46:23, 47:1, 47:6, 47:10, 58:25, 64:29, 103:29, 132:1, 185:28 supervision [9] -33:7, 73:17, 111:15, 136:19, 162:9, 181:25, 186:7, 186:9 supervisor [10] -47:27, 48:28, 50:9, 58:11, 64:20, 65:13, 73:5, 106:4, 148:11

supervisors [3] -

supervisory [5] -

79:14, 84:3, 84:7

76:12, 184:25 support [32] - 10:25, 11:3, 11:12, 11:17, 12:29, 13:29, 29:11, 30:22, 31:9, 31:27, 32:2, 32:25, 48:25, 48:29, 50:13, 52:20, 52:25, 54:5, 59:7, 62:3, 74:9, 74:25, 80:5, 84:8, 107:6, 182:6, 183:25, 184:9, 185:13, 186:20, 186:23 supported [1] -67:17 supporting [4] -48:21, 49:1, 55:7, 183:20 supportive [2] -50:15, 84:2 **supports** [7] - 17:4, 53:10, 79:15, 105:13, 105:19, 184:13, 185:24 suppose [58] -26:13, 27:13, 39:26, 44:3, 44:29, 45:1, 52:12, 52:27, 53:29, 54:3, 55:26, 62:23, 70:20, 73:13, 77:24, 78:12, 105:21, 106:8, 108:11, 118:22, 120:1, 126:17, 128:14, 131:28, 133:7, 133:24, 133:28, 136:15, 137:7, 139:22, 142:1, 151:3, 151:5, 151:22, 155:11, 157:14, 157:24, 159:7, 160:18, 168:18, 176:17, 179:18, 180:17. 180:22. 181:2, 181:5, 182:5, 182:7, 182:15, 183:10, 183:11, 183:18, 184:6, 184:7, 184:10, 185:4, 185:15 surprise [1] - 131:21 surprised [1] -157:18 surrounding [3] -76:21, 83:19, 138:28 suspects [1] - 128:4 swiftly [4] - 68:9, 115:19, 140:14, 189:24 switch [1] - 114:23

30:12, 30:15, 45:2,

SWORN [5] - 7:11,
42:17, 85:4, 102:16,
163:8
 system [6] - 68:9,
106:18, 109:1,
115:19, 140:14,
151:25
 systematically [1] 77:18
 SÍOCHÁNA [1] - 3:2
 Síochána [4] - 58:13,
85:9, 102:22, 188:5

 T

T&N [1] - 4:2
table [1] - 107:20

tacitly [1] - 170:2 **TARA**[1] - 3:22 target [3] - 134:3, 181:13, 181:15 targeted [1] - 182:29 targeting [7] - 58:15, 58:19. 66:9. 181:5. 182:24, 183:1, 183:9 task [10] - 30:27, 32:22, 37:18, 37:24, 98:5, 125:6, 126:23, 174:26, 175:1, 177:17 tasked [11] - 90:25, 90:26, 90:28, 96:1, 129:29, 130:3, 130:9, 150:25. 174:13. 174:15, 174:26 tasks [5] - 30:12, 30:15, 118:24, 127:7, 134:17 tax [12] - 85:15, 86:13, 90:10, 90:12, 90:13, 95:2, 96:28, 97:20, 187:1, 187:27, 188:14. 188:23 taxation [1] - 187:5 taxed [4] - 95:5, 96:7, 98:1, 188:5 **TD**[1] - 38:24 team [12] - 41:27, 63:4, 96:15, 118:22, 118:25, 123:4, 124:21, 167:12, 167:16, 171:7, 180:11 technical [1] - 98:21 telephone [2] -170:28, 170:29 **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 tendency [1] - 39:13 tension [1] - 67:21 term [4] - 46:21, 62:9, 83:22, 162:20

terms [25] - 28:27, 31:1, 32:4, 32:27, 44:28, 45:9, 46:1, 55:24, 60:26, 62:27, 64:29, 76:22, 77:2, 79:1, 80:3, 94:29, 95:13, 95:26, 96:28, 108:3, 129:8, 139:16, 145:27, 147:29, 187:17 Terrace [2] - 127:26, 128.9 **TETRA**[2] - 128:18, 128:21 **THE** [25] - 1:3, 1:7, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 5:29, 7:1, 7:14, 7:16, 34:1, 41:11, 42:10, 42:12, 42:20, 84:28, 85:7, 101:26, 101:28, 102:7, 102:19, 153:23, 162:29, 190:17, 190:20 theft [1] - 180:14 themselves [3] -36:29, 116:12, 136:21 **THEN** [9] - 35:1, 42:12, 84:28, 88:4, 98:25, 101:28, 102:7, 162:29, 190:20 thereafter [1] - 78:6 therefore [9] - 26:15, 30:14, 30:20, 31:17, 31:24, 53:18, 119:24, 164:1, 168:10 thick [1] - 89:28 thinking [2] - 74:7, 74:23 thinks [3] - 74:11, 74:17, 158:26 third [8] - 31:2, 99:8, 101:4, 125:26, 148:13, 165:28, 176:27, 178:13 thirds [3] - 46:10, 82:21, 82:24 Thomas [9] - 82:6, 82:11, 87:7, 99:9, 99:12, 101:4, 101:5, 101:8, 101:12 thoroughness [1] -17.5 three [8] - 26:16, 27:5, 70:12, 96:3, 136:28, 148:11, 181:27, 185:28 threw [1] - 119:26

thumb [1] - 160:18

THURSDAY[1] -

190:20

sworn [1] - 163:6

ticked [2] - 18:14, 128:22 tidy [1] - 76:27 **tie** [1] - 128:6 timeframe [3] -10:17, 39:16, 46:3 timely [5] - 125:10, 130:25, 161:23, 161:25 tiny [3] - 8:16, 120:9, 156:26 title [1] - 16:7 today [2] - 33:4, 38:4 toddle [1] - 52:29 Together [1] -150:18 together [2] -118:23, 145:1 Tom [1] - 175:9 **TOM** [3] - 3:12, 4:10 took [23] - 14:22, 18:1, 37:15, 43:3, 46:28, 48:28, 52:1, 58:24, 61:22, 75:27, 86:19, 89:5, 90:16, 92:18, 126:24, 130:6, 130:12, 131:1, 147:8, 160:6, 164:23, 186:25, 189:20 top [15] - 9:3, 14:25, 18:20, 18:21, 40:9, 40:10, 99:2, 99:8, 100:7, 135:28, 152:23, 165:20, 176:5, 178:4 totally [6] - 11:14, 12:25, 40:24, 51:5, 91:25, 91:26 tour [3] - 103:27, 136:10, 161:27 tours [1] - 152:24 toward [1] - 149:13 towards [4] - 79:22, 132:19, 139:20, 149:27 town [1] - 146:22 townland [1] -171:20 TOWNPARKS[1] -2:12 trail [1] - 112:17 transaction [1] -151:10 transcript [3] - 1:25, 51:23, 188:27 transcripts [1] -13.27 transferred [2] -

153:1, 153:14 transmitted [2] -47:7, 86:21 transpired [1] - 44:2 travel [2] - 94:21 travelled [1] - 146:18 tray [4] - 119:5, 129:18, 129:19, 129:21 TREACY [1] - 2:27 treat [2] - 66:26, 162:12 treated [1] - 162:8 treatment [4] -66:17. 118:13. 147:18, 148:7 tribunal [1] - 49:17 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, Tribunal [29] - 8:26, 10:22, 10:27, 21:15, 24:22, 33:10, 34:7, 35:24, 35:26, 37:5, 37:11, 37:13, 37:18, 37:23, 41:25, 43:25, 51:25, 54:21, 54:26, 64:17, 71:16, 77:20, 79:17, 96:15, 109:28, 127:17, 145:4, 162:3, 163:15 TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8 tried [1] - 77:17 trotted [1] - 41:4 trouble [4] - 142:19, 142:20, 142:22, 142:25 troubled [1] - 76:8 troubles [2] - 43:12, 56:21 troubling [1] - 52:17 true [2] - 34:9, 49:21 trust [1] - 49:20 try [9] - 70:4, 70:18, 76:27, 96:14, 108:10, 124:8, 138:3, 139:23, 181:18 trying [11] - 21:4, 21:13, 22:11, 45:9, 78:11, 91:5, 91:20, 91:21, 141:11, 141:22, 181:15 turn [1] - 126:18 turned [3] - 59:15, 96:19, 182:3

TURNER [1] - 2:28

turning [2] - 79:1,

two [26] - 14:16,

21:8, 46:10, 46:13,

53:9, 59:9, 76:21,

79.2

7:28, 102:28

transition [2] -

80:14, 82:21, 82:24, 97:17, 100:19, 100:27, 101:3, 102:3, 114:4, 120:6, 125:14, 144:29, 160:11, 163:23, 172:23, 173:9, 185:6, 185:10 two-thirds [3] -46:10, 82:21, 82:24 type [9] - 65:23, 94:22, 95:13, 107:23, 115:27, 136:11, 147:19, 147:23, 150:1 types [1] - 131:25 U UK [1] - 165:14 ultimate [1] - 37:24 ultimately [2] -91:16. 154:10 unable [3] - 89:22, 89:23. 126:5 unannounced [2] -72:2, 72:13 unaware [2] -168:20, 168:21 unchanged [1] uncomfortable [8] -8:18. 48:5. 57:7. 80:27, 81:6, 81:7, 81:8, 120:10 undated [1] - 41:27 under [14] - 27:20, 62:25, 69:21, 83:9, 136:18, 137:12, 150:18, 162:8, 167:8, 169:21, 177:6, 181:11, 189:8, 189:9

70:7, 94:16 66:29, 150:8, 158:24

unfair [1] - 182:23

unfortunately [2] -

unfounded [1] - 40:2

unhappy [4] - 61:29,

uniform [3] - 105:25,

unfit [1] - 20:24

unfairly [1] - 182:28

106:9, 106:12 unintentionally [1] -160:22 unique [1] - 44:24 unit [52] - 8:5, 8:7, 8:9, 8:22, 8:25, 9:6, 11:15, 11:17, 14:15, 14:17, 14:18, 15:6. 15:9, 17:14, 17:16, 22:23, 46:18, 48:12, 57:20, 58:10, 58:25, 59:10, 60:15, 60:23, 70:4, 84:2, 103:17, 103:18, 103:20, 103:26, 105:26, 106:4, 107:1, 110:15, 118:23, 130:14, 132:12, 133:8, 136:6, 136:9, 136:10, 143:17, 143:23, 143:24, 184:25, 185:5, 185:6, 185:8, 185:9 units [6] - 9:14, 9:16, 103:24, 136:7, 185:5, unless [2] - 32:20, 41:27 unmistakable [1] -70:28 unreasonable [1] -40:12 unsatisfactory [3] -124:27, 125:7, 156:9 unscheduled [1] -86.9 **UNTIL** [1] - 190:20 unusual [8] - 58:19, 90:23, 98:4, 111:10, 111:26, 112:2, 136:25, 158:2 unwell [2] - 79:28,

80:2

176:14

unwilling [1] -

up [79] - 8:24, 14:20,

18:2, 20:29, 21:10,

35:18, 43:2, 43:20,

49:2, 49:22, 50:2,

50:5, 51:22, 52:19,

53:7, 53:8, 53:13,

55:23, 56:2, 56:9, 56:12, 56:13, 60:9, 61:6, 64:22, 66:6, 68:1, 69:12, 71:17, 72:17, 77:3, 77:7, 78:5, 79:1, 79:2, 79:14, 79:18, 80:15, 81:5, 81:8, 81:17, 82:21, 83:21, 86:17, 87:5, 87:18, 89:1, 89:4, 89:14, 91:16, 96:3, 96:19, 99:5, 99:8, 100:6, 102:3, 104:27, 108:11, 111:7, 111:8, 111:18, 114:28, 123:29, 130:16, 133:18, 134:12, 135:3, 138:4, 155:6, 156:6, 158:3, 161:12, 161:29, 171:5, 178:4, 183:5, 186:25, 188:15 up-to-date [4] -108:11, 111:7, 138:4, 188:15 update [3] - 23:6, 108:7, 137:24 upwards [1] - 108:1 urgent [1] - 129:22 usual [1] - 158:1 utmost [1] - 145:25

various [10] - 38:6, 38:23, 46:23, 63:6, 70:15, 73:13, 77:22, 95:19, 134:17, 158:11 vary[1] - 101:16 vehicle [11] - 89:9, 91:13, 91:18, 96:7, 99:3, 99:21, 100:21, 101:7. 188:13. 188:17, 188:23 vehicles [9] - 86:13, 88:14, 88:25, 90:11, 90:29, 94:25, 95:19, 96:2, 96:9 vein [1] - 77:19 verbatim [1] - 1:25 via [1] - 187:9 victimisation [1] -66:15 victims [1] - 107:6 view [32] - 11:6, 16:15, 21:19, 24:22, 28:20, 29:8, 34:23, 37:17, 40:3, 45:27, 48:19, 61:15, 63:2, 69:28, 81:10, 121:12,

UNDER [2] - 1:2, 1:8

undermine [4] -

undermined [1] -

understood [14] -

12:17, 15:24, 28:23,

30:27, 33:6, 56:14,

148:4, 158:15,

undertook [1] -

underway [2] -

unequivocal [1] -

165:11, 168:18

175:12

140:1

57:9, 90:22, 117:12,

158:16, 170:26, 172:5

undertake [1] - 37:19

169:18, 169:23,

170:15, 179:24

125:6, 129:15, 134:21, 135:9, 148:1, 175:3, 176:21, 178:16, 179:10, 182:9, 182:12, 182:22, 183:4, 183:28, 185:1, 186:3 views [3] - 48:17, 73:13, 179:29 violence [1] - 146:27 visit [2] - 53:16, 74:22 visited [1] - 139:18 **volume** [1] - 79:6 Volume [9] - 8:29, 35:19, 68:1, 85:2, 102:14, 163:15, 164:15, 188:27, 190:6

W

walkthrough [1] -123:29 wand [1] - 13:14 wants [3] - 28:6, 63:7, 101:22 **WAS** [18] - 7:12, 25:10, 28:10, 35:1, 42:17, 67:9, 71:9, 85:4, 88:4, 94:8, 98:25, 102:16, 135:20, 144:18, 152:10, 153:23, 161:3, 163:9 waste [1] - 139:20 weakness [1] - 76:24 weapon [2] - 147:12, 147:21 WEDNESDAY [2] -1:18, 7:1 week [2] - 109:10, 165:28 weekend [14] -104:2, 108:19, 110:5, 110:7, 110:8, 110:10, 110:12, 110:16, 110:21, 110:29, 111:8, 111:14, 112:18, 124:1 weeks [5] - 13:5, 13:10, 134:13, 136:28 welcome [1] - 84:9 welfare [33] - 11:5, 12:8, 12:17, 12:19, 14:14, 15:2, 15:11, 18:10, 20:28, 21:3, 21:8, 21:10, 22:23, 23:14, 24:7, 24:16, 26:4, 26:19, 26:23,

27:17, 27:25, 29:14, 29:17, 30:22, 31:13, 32:2, 32:10, 32:25, 58:9, 59:7, 79:27, 185:19, 185:23

WELLINGTON [1] -

4:4 whatsoever [3] -67:21, 69:10, 88:11 WHEATLEY [1] - 3:4 whereas [1] - 171:9 whilst [1] - 51:18 WHITE [6] - 3:11, 5:16, 85:4, 88:4, 94:8, 98:25

White [8] - 85:1, 93:23, 99:10, 99:12, 101:4, 101:5, 101:8, 101:12

white [4] - 85:7, 87:7, 94:5, 118:27

White's [1] - 187:5 whole [4] - 24:4, 80:21, 80:24, 108:19 wild [1] - 40:1 willing [1] - 178:19 wish [6] - 40:15, 83:17, 162:3, 182:6, 186:6, 186:24 wished [3] - 22:25, 24:3, 182:5

wishes [1] - 73:23 WITHDREW [4] -42:12, 84:28, 101:28, 162:29

WITNESS [15] - 5:2, 7:14, 7:16, 34:1, 41:11, 42:10, 42:12, 42:20, 84:28, 85:7, 101:26, 101:28, 102:19, 162:29, 190:17

witness [14] - 7:7, 16:4, 16:12, 16:13, 35:6, 37:4, 39:1, 42:14, 102:1, 102:11, 117:9, 152:20, 163:2, 175:11

witnessed [1] -182:28

witnesses [3] - 18:5, 111:25, 125:9 wonder [9] - 15:2, 25:3, 28:13, 28:28, 32:27, 37:25, 72:19, 152:13, 152:20

wonderful [1] - 75:4

wondering [1] - 80:27

word [4] - 118:28, 128:20, 142:21, 151:23

151:23
wording [1] - 27:14
words [10] - 28:17,
31:12, 31:26, 51:1,
64:26, 74:19, 128:28,
142:19, 159:1, 181:15
workplace [15] 13:25, 14:28, 15:1,
15:5, 15:7, 15:11,
15:12, 15:26, 16:5,
16:11, 21:22, 27:26,
29:10, 30:14, 31:7
works [5] - 68:9,

129:28, 140:14 **worried** [1] - 160:10 **worry** [2] - 50:19, 54:1

112:9, 115:19,

write [5] - 133:6, 144:7, 161:26, 166:24, 172:1 writing [8] - 18:22, 38:8, 159:8, 159:22, 175:18, 176:2, 181:19 written [11] - 36:3,

36:4, 37:6, 37:14, 40:16, 98:7, 130:22, 149:21, 158:19, 178:8 wrongdoing [1] -

wrote [5] - 74:6, 113:10, 132:28, 173:20, 179:18

69.8

Υ

yard [2] - 91:13, 91:19 year [10] - 8:8, 34:7, 35:28, 36:9, 38:8, 89:29, 103:1, 111:28, 114:23, 189:12 years [4] - 58:13, 95:22, 103:26, 151:26 yesterday [3] -126:16, 163:25 yourself [26] - 14:23, 18:15, 21:16, 22:9, 26:3, 27:6, 27:27, 57:18, 60:24, 68:3, 80:5, 82:6, 82:8, 87:7, 101:6, 102:2, 112:26, 116:25, 123:3, 125:29, 128:6, 131:5, 131:9, 137:20,

175:25, 180:12 **YVONNE** [5] - 5:3, 7:11, 25:10, 28:10, 35:1 **Yvonne** [7] - 7:8, 7:14, 14:27, 31:6,

55:3, 80:5, 181:29

Ζ

zeal [1] - 40:7

€

€20 [1] - 127:29

É

ÉABHALL [1] - 2:30 **ÉIREANN** [2] - 1:4, 1:5

Ó

Ó [5] - 3:7, 11:20, 38:22, 45:21, 45:24