TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON TUESDAY, 28TH JANUARY 2020 - DAY 133

133

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL:

MR. DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. SINÉAD McGRATH BL

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH:

MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC
MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET
TOWNPARKS

INSTRUCTED BY:

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O' MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT SOLICITORS NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FINN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY

SOLI CI TORS HALIDAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMI THFI ELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY & GARDA DAVID TURNER:

INSTRUCTED BY:

R: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC MR. JAMES KANE BL MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS 13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURDAY 12. 13. SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT AI DAN MI NNOCK 14. 15. SUPERINIENDENI ALDAN MINNOCK
INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN CRAITON 17. 18. 19. 20. 21. 22. 23. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY 24. 25. 26. 27. MONI CA CARR, H PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT 28. MR. BRI AN SAVA HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND MR. BRIAN SAVAGE
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O'REARDON
INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN 30. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN 33. 34. SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN 35. 36. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH INSPECTOR TARA GOODE SHANE MURPHY SC MÍ CHEÁL P. O' HI GGI NS SC MR. MR. MICHEAL P. O HIGGINS
CONOR DIGNAM SC
DONAL MCGUINNESS BL
SHELLEY HORAN BL
KATE EGAN BL
ALISON MORRISSEY
EMMA GRIFFIN MR. MR. MS. MS. MS. INSTRUCTED BY: MS. CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL MR. PAUL CONNELLAN T&N MCLYNN FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

BASTION COURT 11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AIDAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O'ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

FOR GARDA TOM HIGGINS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. TOM POWER BL
MR. NOEL McCARTAN
McCARTAN & BURKE SOLICITORS
I CELAND HOUSE
33-34 ARRAN QUAY

SMI THFI ELD DUBLIN 7

INDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY	
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN	6
EXAMINED BY MR. MURPHY	77
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	95
FURTHER-EXAMINED BY MR. MURPHY	103
INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY	
DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH	104
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN	140
GARDA MI CHAEL QUI NN	
DIRECTLY EXAMINED BY COUNSEL	142
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. O'BRIEN	194
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	200
RE-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH	211

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON TUESDAY, 28TH	
2			JANUARY 2020:	
3				
4			CHAIRMAN: Now, good morning, chief superintendent.	
5			THE WITNESS: Morning.	10:31
6			CHAIRMAN: So, Mr. Kelly, it's your team's, isn't that	
7			right, turn?	
8			MR. KELLY: That's right. Ms. Mulligan.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Good morning,	
10			Ms. Mulligan.	10:31
11				
12			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY WAS	
13			CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN, AS FOLLOWS:	
14				
15	1	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Good morning chief superintendent, I	10:31
16			just have some questions on behalf of Garda Keogh. Can	
17			I just ask you, I think you gave evidence to the	
18			Chairman yesterday that you have been in the force for	
19			the last 35 years, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	That's correct, yes.	10:31
21	2	Q.	Can you just confirm to me how long you were a	
22			superintendent for?	
23		Α.	Nine and a half years.	
24	3	Q.	When was that?	
25		Α.	I was promoted in 2005, July 2005, yeah.	10:31
26	4	Q.	Was that 2005 to 2013, or have you been a chief	
27			superintendent since 2005?	
28		Α.	No. I have been a superintendent, I have been an	
29			officer, then I have been a superintendent, I was a	

Т			superintendent for nine and a half years, from July	
2			2005 to March 2013. So I have been a chief	
3			superintendent, actually I have five years service next	
4			week, so five years.	
5	5	Q.	Five years?	10:32
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	6	Q.	In terms of then your familiarity in relation to	
8			Superintendent Murray's role, you would be quite	
9			familiar with his obligations in terms of regulations,	
10			because you were in fact a superintendent for an	10:32
11			extended period of time, is that fair?	
12		Α.	That's fair, yeah.	
13	7	Q.	In terms of your own familiarity with the role as a	
14			chief superintendent in a role in relation to sick pay	
15			and your obligations in that regard, would you say to	10:32
16			the Tribunal that you are familiar with your	
17			obligations?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	8	Q.	In terms of work related stress, have you ever had to	
20			do a work related stress assessment prior to this issue	10:32
21			arising in 2014?	
22		Α.	People have reported sick with work related stress.	
23	9	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	And I suppose there's a number of ways this can happen,	
25			and you make a referral to headquarters. It can be	10:32
26			something quite when people are absent with work	
27			related stress you make your referral to the CMO. It	
28			can be just quite minor. You establish the facts. In	
29			most cases, in my experience, and it's evolving, the	

- whole process, because I suppose -- I think you can be stressed but it has to be someone's fault.
- 3 10 Q. Yes.
- A. So while -- let's say, any context, it's a very

 stressful job and you can be stressed over court cases

 or if you are, indeed, being disciplined or whatever,

 but that's not necessarily the job's fault.
- 8 11 Q. Indeed. Can I just go back, and I appreciate that you
 9 have given that evidence to the Chairman, that stress
 10 is not as straightforward as a broken arm, for example. 10:33
- 11 A. Yes.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

12 Q. That is something obviously you can't use -- if you
13 can't drive, you may not be able to do your regular
14 duties. I think it is accepted by everyone in the room
15 that there is no issue from that point of view?

10:33

Sorry, really the point I was trying to make here, in Α. terms of -- clearly I can't assess whether a person is stressed or not, people can be stressed because it is a stressful job that we have. In terms of the organisation making a determination that you -- first 10:34 of all, you actually have to be clinically, I suppose, diagnosed as having stress, is a part of it, but for the organisation to make the decision that, yes, I suppose, that we are responsible, if you like, for this, for this injury that they have clinically, I 10:34 suppose, assessed. It has to be linked back to the So there have been cases where people have made complaints under the bullying and harassment policy, and the outcome is that basically it's established that

1			indeed the behaviours have caused this stress. In	
2			those instances, it's my understanding, after appeal	
3			and the CMO has this can happen to you but you	
4			actually mightn't be clinically stressed, and the CMO	
5			has give answer clinical diagnosis, it is usually done	10:35
6			in conjunction with an external person, that the person	
7			is indeed stressed and it is indeed totally connected,	
8			there is a causal link, is actually the phrase, to the	
9			behaviours in the workplace. And then the final	
10			arbiter in making that decision is executive director	10:35
11			of HRM. And they can also carry out a number of	
12			enquiries.	
13	13	Q.	I just want to go back to the first thing that you	
14			said, you have to establish the facts. In terms of	
15			when you were doing a work related stress investigation	10:35
16			in general, what steps do you take to establish facts?	
17		Α.	Garda Keogh	
18	14	Q.	I am not asking about Garda Keogh.	
19		Α.	I know, just bear with me. To establish the facts in	
20			any investigation, a person has to make a complaint,	10:36
21			they have to identify the nature of the complaint, the	
22			source of the complaint and maybe give you witnesses.	
23	15	Q.	Okay. I just want to deal with that a little bit. So	
24			is there a distinction being made between making a	
25			complaint and identifying that you are under work	10:36
26			related stress?	
27		Α.	Garda Keogh's doctor	
28	16	Q.	No, it's a very specific question, I would like a	

direct answer please?

29

1 A.	Maybe	if	Ι	
------	-------	----	---	--

- 2 17 Q. Is there a distinction to be made between making a
 3 complaint and identifying to your superior officer that
 4 you are under work related stress? Because the
 5 Sickness Absence Management System is not about
 6 complaints, you have a bullying and harassment protocol
 7 for that, is that right?
 - I was just doing that by way of explaining the Α. protocol. When a person is absent due to work related stress, clearly it's related to the work related 10:36 stress, what the policy says is you should identify the cause of that stress. And what you do in any case when anyone makes a complaint, or when anyone makes a complaint, clearly if anyone has an issue, they bring it to your attention and clearly in Garda Keogh's case, 10:37 he had been out periodically, I understand, prior to when Superintendent Murray arrived with work related His doctor had deemed him fit to work on numerous occasions also. When a person is absent with work related stress, we are obliged to find out why the 10:37 person is stressed. And I suppose the rationale behind that is that the CMO, I suppose, needs to understand what this is about.

24

25

26

27

28

29

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

To be honest with you, I reflected on this. In terms of Garda Keogh's case, he was out with work related stress and then he was back and he was fit and notwithstanding that, Superintendent Murray, because that was there, sent it up the line.

- 1 18 Q. Okay. I want to go back to the question that I
- 2 actually asked you.
- 3 A. Okay.
- 4 19 Q. Which is: Is there a distinction to be made about a
- 5 complaint versus a notification of an issue arising? I 10:38

- 6 think you accept that there is a distinction to be
- 7 made?
- 8 A. No, I didn't. I won't accept that.
- 9 20 Q. You don't?
- 10 A. No. It's in order, Chair, that I clarify that.
- 11 21 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. When a person reports sick with work related stress,
- when they are absent with work related stress and they
- 14 report sick, you have to refer that to the CMO. The
- 15 CMO logically needs to understand if this is related to 10:38
- work, what issue in the workplace is causing this
- 17 stress. So you try and establish the source of that
- 18 stress. Garda Keogh did give us the source of his
- 19 stress and we did establish the source of his stress
- and he was very clear that the source of his stress was 10:38
- absolutely connected with the protected disclosure.
- 22 22 Q. We will get back to that.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 23 Q. Again you gave evidence to the Chairman this morning
- 25 that you have to establish the facts. And I am asking
- you in a general case what do you do to establish the
- 27 facts. So, for example, do you expect to have an
- interview with the person who is alleging work related
- 29 stress?

- 1 A. You talk to the person first.
- 2 24 Q. Yes, you talk to them. What would you do then?
- 3 A. You would ask the person to say what's the cause of the

10:39

10:39

- 4 stress. Like normally people will tell you.
- 5 25 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. You know. And in Garda Keogh's case, I think we did
- 7 establish it and he wasn't -- he didn't hide it. He
- 8 was very clear about the source of his stress.
- 9 26 Q. I don't want to talk about Garda Keogh, I don't want to
- 10 cut across you, I don't want to continually cut across
- 11 you, but I wonder would you answer the question I am
- 12 actually asking you. So you talk to the individual who
- has alleging work related stress, yes?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 27 Q. Would you look, for example, any third party
- information, information from sergeants, information
- from any person that is named that might know something
- 18 about whatever the source of that stress is?
- 19 A. I absolutely would not do that in the first instance.
- 20 I'm very clear about is that.
- 21 28 Q. You wouldn't do that?
- 22 A. Absolutely would not do that. It wouldn't be
- appropriate to do it. You know, if a person makes a
- complaint that they're -- you know, they're stressed,
- okay, certainly if they make a complaint, and they give $_{10:40}$
- you the names, they give you the reason. You take that
- 27 information and you move with that. Just in relation
- to Garda Keogh's case, and it's in in order, I just
- really think is important because I have reflected on

1 it at length. Garda Keogh made the position very clear, and that is absolutely understandable, and we 3 sent it up the line. We were anxious that he would be clinically assessed by the CMO. The CMO, even now, you know, that people have reported -- you know, I'm aware of cases where people are sick with work related stress, the investigation can take an awful lot -- can take a long time when the person engages with the process. The CMO can make a clinical determination that the person is actually stressed. The piece about 11 linking it back to the investigation and the piece about the HRM having a view has to take place. relation to Garda Keogh's case, and the medical people 14 can give their own determination, the CMO or no one at 15 this stage, I don't believe, has made that clinical determination, that Garda Keogh was in fact stressed. 17

10 · 41

10:41

29 We will get to that. Q.

> Yes. It's in order and I have reflected on this. Α. weren't putting a roadblock up here to prevent Garda Keogh from progressing to the next sort of, if you 10:41 like, junction in relation to this matter. conscious that we had a fairly good understanding of what the issue was. And that's as far as we could bring it. And I don't believe the CMO had a view that, well, there's really not sufficient here, like we're 10 · 41 not that unkind, to sort of -- he didn't write back and say, no, I'm not doing this determination, I haven't enough here.

29

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

16

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1			So, as I said, when Garda Keogh he was back work,	
2			fit now, you have to remember, when he was referred	
3			back to the CMO, in the first instance the CMO deemed	
4			him fit for duty and then he came back fit, back on our	
5			team. He wasn't absent due to stress. His doctor said	10:42
6			he was fit to work. And then when other patterns	
7			arose, Superintendent Murray said, no, we need to refer	
8			him up the line here again, you know, we need the CMO	
9			to see him. He is reporting sick with work related	
10			stress, this is the reason why he is stressed. And	10:42
11			ultimately a case conference was triggered in respect	
12			of this matter. From reading the material and the	
13			disclosures, it's not my understanding that there was	
14			ever a conversation around that the clinical issue in	
15			respect that Garda Keogh was stress.	10:42
16	30	Q.	Chief superintendent, we will get there.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	31	Q.	My questions are much more basic, which is: What are	
19			the steps that happen generally, and then we will talk	
20			what happened here, and then we will talk about what	10:43
21			happened in the CMO. I need you to answer the question	
22			that I am actually asking you. Because otherwise we	
23			will be here for a very long time?	
24		Α.	Well every case is different.	
25	32	Q.	I haven't asked you a question yes?	10:43
26		Α.	Okay.	
27			MR. MURPHY: Chairman, this question has been asked	

several times and has been answered.

28

29

MS. MULLIGAN: With respect, I didn't ask any question.

1 I was about to ask a question. 2 My friend has put it to the witness that MR. MURPHY: she has asked her the question, she needs to answer it. 3 In my respectful submission, the question has been 4 5 answered and it has been repeated again and again. 10:43 6 MS. MULLIGAN: I will move on. 7 MR. KELLY: Chairman, with respect, Ms. Mulligan is asking this witness a question and this witness is 8 choosing to answer and other questions that she would 9 10 prefer to have been asked. In those circumstances, it 10 · 43 11 seems to me that it is perfectly fair for Ms. Mulligan 12 to ask the question yet again. 13 CHAI RMAN: I don't want to get into a situation where I 14 am interfering unnecessarily with cross-examination. 15 It seems to me that if questions are put that are not 10:44 16 correctly based in evidence or are based on a 17 misunderstanding or are unfair in some shape or form, I 18 have an obligation to intervene, otherwise I don't. 19 this case, the latter is the situation. Ms. Mulligan is asking her questions and we are proceeding. 20 10:44 So you identify that you establish the 21 33 MS. MULLIGAN: Q. 22 facts, you don't go to outside parties, you only try to 23 establish the facts and then the matter goes to the 24 CMO, that's your position, is that right? 25 If it's in order, I would just like to clarify that. Α. 10 · 45 26 34 No, I just want to ask you --0. 27 No, sorry, I need to clarify the question. Α. 28 35 very well. Q.

29

Α.

what they say is, when a member reports with

1			work related stress, I suppose the organisation	
2			recognises that this was something that they needed to	
3			be looking at from, I suppose, a HR perspective, the	
4			member should be referred to the CMO. You know, you	
5			should establish the source of the stress. If a person	10:45
6			is out establish you know, we did establish it.	
7			And Garda Keogh told us his stress was all connected in	
8			relation to his protected disclosure. His position was	
9			quite clear, you know, his position had been quite	
10			clear in relation to other matters, that he was dealing	10:45
11			with people in Galway, he made a protected disclosure.	
12			I made the professional, if you like, judgment when it	
13			was sent to me that we couldn't push this. It wouldn't	
14			be at this stage this was Garda Keogh had made a	
15			protected disclosure	10:46
16	36	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Chief superintendent, can I stop you for a	
17			second.	
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	37	Q.	CHAIRMAN: we may be having a misunderstanding here?	
20		Α.	Yes.	10:46
21	38	Q.	CHAIRMAN: My understanding is that Ms. Mulligan is	
22			saying, I want to ask you questions in general about	
23			the approach in a case, an unspecified case of work	
24			related stress, I am not yet asking you about Garda	
25			Keogh. So an answer to her question should not deal	10:46
26			with Garda Keogh. I think there may be a	
27			misunderstanding here. She is, it seems to me, saying,	
28			what should happen in general, part one, and I expect	
29			that she will then move on to say, let's compare and	

- contrast that with what happened in Nick Keogh's case.
- 2 That's what I expect her to do?
- 3 A. Yeah, I can --
- 4 39 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, no, don't worry for a second. Don't

10 · 47

10:47

10:47

10 · 47

- 5 worry. That's where we are going. It's an
- 6 exploration. So the first thing she is saying is:
- 7 What happens in general?
- 8 A. In general --
- 9 40 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, she is getting a little frustrated, if
- I may say that, because when she asks that you talk
- about Nick Keogh and she hasn't come on to that yet.
- 12 Are we understanding each other at this point?
- 13 A. Yes, I am, Chairman.
- 14 41 Q. CHAIRMAN: Don't think this is a big criticism, there
- just seems to me to be a misunderstanding.
- 16 A. Yeah.
- 17 42 Q. CHAIRMAN: So at this moment Ms. Mulligan is asking
- 18 what happens in general?
- 19 A. What happens in general, if a person --
- 20 43 Q. CHAIRMAN: Well, let's let her ask the question first
- 21 of all.
- 22 A. Okay.
- 23 CHAIRMAN: Don't you worry, we will let her ask the
- question and we will answer it as simply as possible
- and then we will proceed to the next one. Okay. Am I
- right, Ms. Mulligan, am I understanding your position?
- 27 MS. MULLIGAN: Yes, Chairman, I'm obliged.
- 28 CHAIRMAN: Okay. So there we are.
- 29 44 Q. MS. MULLIGAN: Chief superintendent, you identify that

the first thing you do is you establish the facts. The second thing you don't do is you don't go looking for third party information or any corroborating evidence. That's what you said. So let's go back to the first part. You establish the facts and by establishing the facts you accepted that you would interview the member, isn't that right?

10:48

10 · 48

10:48

10:49

10.49

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

I didn't say that. What I am saying is, of course you Α. wouldn't wait to establish the facts, you would send a referral up straightaway to the CMO and say you were exploring the issues. In this case -- in any case a person who reports sick with work related stress, you know, the superintendent would ask the person what was the source of his stress and if they had said, you know, it's to do with this, that and the other, it may not be a case -- sometimes it's a case where a person has made a complaint under the bullying and harassment -- so that kicks off an investigation, you have a complaint. There's times where people don't necessarily have to do that, but they say, you know, this is the source of the stress. We referred this up the line because this is very unusual, I suppose Garda Keogh made a protected disclosure -- in Garda Keogh's case, we just -- I took the position that this was very unusual, Garda Keogh is taking this position, this is the stress he is attributing to the investigation and clearly for us to put another investigation on top of that and to sort of go questioning him about it, could

have been perceived in a negative way. We were saying

Τ			listen, he is saying this, and we didn't disbelieve	
2			him, I understood it, so we were saying, listen, this	
3			is the position, this is how far we will bring it, can	
4			you review this man. And so and he did review him.	
5	45	Q.	Chief superintendent, that wasn't my question. Can I	10:49
6			take you back to my question. You said we're	
7			exploring what do you do to establish the facts and	
8			you said you discuss the source of stress with the	
9			member?	
10		Α.	Yes.	10:50
11	46	Q.	I'm right about that?	
12		Α.	The superintendent discusses the source of the stress.	
13	47	Q.	The superintendent discusses, okay. That's as far as	
14			we have gotten?	
15		Α.	That's as far as we could go as well.	10:50
16	48	Q.	I wonder if could you let me ask the question and then	
17			answer the questions that I am asking?	
18		Α.	Okay.	
19	49	Q.	So you ask the member what is the source of the stress.	
20			Now, when you do that, how long does that take, do you	10:50
21			have a formal meeting about it? In ordinary cases, are	
22			people notified of the meeting ahead of time so they	
23			can prepare themselves. In an ordinary case. I would	
24			accept that Garda Keogh is in a slightly more nuanced	
25			position, so if we leave Garda Keogh here for a little	10:50
26			bit, that would be very helpful. An ordinary work	
27			related stress case, what are the steps that would	
28			happen to identify. Would you in the first instance	
29			I think you confirmed you would have a meeting with the	

- 1 person who is alleging work related stress, is that
- 2 right? That you would talk to them.
- 3 A. The superintendent would.
- 4 50 Q. The superintendent would talk to them?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 51 Q. And when talking to them, would they be given notice of

10:51

10:51

10:51

- 7 the fact that they are having this meeting about work
- 8 related stress?
- 9 A. Garda Keogh --
- 10 52 Q. No.
- 11 A. Okay. Okay, sorry. When it comes to, I suppose, the
- 12 district officer's attention, when the certs comes
- through that a person is suffering with work related
- 14 stress, the policy is that, you know, you have to put
- the CMO on notice. Okay, you have to establish the
- source of this stress as well.
- 17 53 Q. Yes. I want to talk about --
- 18 A. Yeah.
- 19 54 Q. You said that would you meet with the person and I want
- 20 you to answer this question: Would you notify the
- 21 person that you are having this meeting about work
- related stress? Is there a protocol or procedure or
- anything that identifies that the person knows what the
- 24 meeting is about? It's a yes or no answer?
- 25 A. No, it's not actually.
- 26 55 Q. No, it is a yes or no answer?
- 27 A. No, it's not, if you don't mind.
- 28 56 Q. Is there any process or procedure that identifies that
- 29 you notify the person the purpose of the meeting?

1		Α.	I really need to explain this. It's in order,	
2			Chairman.	
3	57	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
4		Α.	I suppose a lot of cases where people I suppose, the	
5			impact of what happens in the workplace makes them	10:52
6			unwell in the sense that they're stressed, they go out	
7			and the doctor says people are out with work related	
8			stress. In many cases it's because maybe they have	
9			made a complaint or something has happened to them in	
10			the workplace and they have complained it, and they	10:52
11			make it under the bullying and harassment you know,	
12			an investigation kicks off and that's happening there,	
13			do you know what I mean. So that's a separate issue.	
14				
15			If a person hasn't made a complaint, which was the	10:52
16			case if a person hasn't made a complaint, you know,	
17			you want to talk to me in general terms, and it comes	
18			to our attention that a person has been absent with	
19			work related stress, we're you know, we have to find	
20			the source of that stress. In Garda Keogh's case	10:53
21	58	Q.	CHAIRMAN: First, you find the source of the stress?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	59	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You see, work related stress is a	
24			conclusion?	

26 60 Q. CHAIRMAN: Not a diagnosis. Stress is the diagnosis.
27 I am stressed. You say the first thing you do is to
28 say what's stressing you. That's the first thing you

25

29

Α.

Yes.

do. And you say you refer the person to the CMO, is

- 1 that --
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 61 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now this is in general terms?
- 4 A. Yes, general.
- 5 62 Q. CHAIRMAN: Not to do particularly -- you do two things. 10:53
- 6 You say, what's causing your stress? If a person comes
- 7 in, is certified as saying work related stress. I am
- 8 understanding you don't give them notice, you don't
- 9 write out and say, I am proposing to have a
- 10 conversation with you about the cause of your work
- related stress, you don't write them out a letter of

10:54

10:54

- 12 that kind?
- 13 A. No. you don't.
- 14 63 Q. CHAIRMAN: There is no provision that says you should
- 15 write a letter of that kind, is that right?
- 16 A. Yeah.
- 17 64 Q. CHAIRMAN: So the answer to Ms. Mulligan's question is
- no, there is no protocol for that. In general, the
- superintendent, the district officer talks to the
- person and says, what's causing your stress?
- 21 A. And I think -- of course we don't wait, stress is very
- serious and unfortunately I understand the impact of
- 23 stress. It is a very serious matter, stress. So you
- 24 don't wait. You refer the person up to the CMO on that
- 25 basis. You are --
- 26 65 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry for interrupting. Are you going to
- 27 refer the person to the CMO anyway, whether or which?
- A. Oh, you'd have to.
- 29 66 Q. CHAIRMAN: Whatever I say about the cause of my stress,

1			am I going to be referred to the CMO?	
2		Α.	Yes, yes. We're not a roadblock. There was never any	
3			roadblocks. We actually opened the road, I would have	
4			thought. So in this situation	
5	67	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So in general terms, two things	10:55
6			happen, there is a conversation, what's causing your	
7			stress? And the answer to that is written down.	
8			Irrespective of the answer to that, I am being	
9			certified with work related stress, you are going to	
10			refer me to the CMO?	10:55
11		Α.	Oh yeah, absolutely.	
12	68	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Because you're going to get the advice of	
13			the CMO, is that right?	
14		Α.	Absolutely.	
15	69	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Very good. So now two things. Now,	10:55
16			Ms. Mulligan, I am sorry for interrupting you?	
17	70	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Not at all, Chairman. So you don't	
18			notify them that they are having a meeting with the	
19			stress, that this is what this meeting is about; is	
20			that right?	10:55
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	71	Q.	In terms of the steps you take then, you notify the	
23			CMO, but you notify the CMO or at least it appears that	
24			you're supposed to notify the CMO once you're past the	
25			28 day absence; is that right?	10:55
26		Α.	They're two separate you've to do it for both. You	
27			could be out with stress for four days and you'd	
28			referring a person, but if you are out ordinarily for	
29			28 days, that's a referral you have to do as well.	

- 1 72 Q. In fairness, there is evidence of that happening over the years of that arising. And in terms of then what is causing you stress, you yourself, if you are doing that meeting, would you ask open-ended questions or would you ask closed questions? Do you challenge the
- 6 individual as to what the nature of the stress is?

10:56

- 7 A. You'd ask the person about the stress.
- 8 73 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. I think you'd be alive to the context, you'd be alive
 10 to, I suppose, the position that a person had taken,
 11 that they weren't in a position to discuss this. And
 12 if a person takes the shutters down and the person is
 13 telling you they are stressed, you're not going to push
 14 it.
- 15 74 Q. So you wouldn't push it?
- 16 And I suppose -- and I will just deal with it in Α. 17 general terms. In the majority of cases, generally, 18 people make a complaint under maybe work, bullying and 19 harassment and that can cause them stress. I have seen cases where people have -- and the CMO is saying stress 10:57 20 is very serious, it's a mental health issue, don't 21 22 leave it, send them up to me straightaway, because if 23 there is an issue in the workplace, I have to look at 24 this and see if they are fit to work or not. So, 25 Superintendent Murray straightaway put this on notice. 10:57 26 And there are cases where people don't take that 27 position and they take the position well, I'll tell you why I'm stressed, I have four witnesses here and this 28 29 is happening. You still send the thing up

1	straightaway, because you want you can't have a	
2	person in the workplace if they are not fit to work	ζ.

- 3 75 Q. Yes, I accept that. So can we just go back to what you 4 just said, again, meeting the superintendent, is not a 5 regular occurrence, that seems to be the evidence from 10:57 6 most of the guards, is that meeting the superintendent wouldn't be a regular occurrence, it happens on a 7 8 weekly basis in a formal sense. So, if he arrives with four witnesses, would you speak to those witnesses? 9 10 CHAI RMAN: Sorry, say that again. If somebody arrives 10:58 11 with four witnesses.
- 12 76 Q. MS. MULLIGAN: Chief Superintendent Wheatley identified
 13 in her own evidence there a moment ago that if there
 14 was someone there with four people and says I have four
 15 witnesses that want to talk about this work related
 16 stress, and my question is, if they did, would you talk
 17 to them?
- 18 A. Can I just, and I think it's in order, Chairman, in 19 this case --
- 20 77 Q. CHAIRMAN: Did you ever come across a case where somebody suffering from stress came along with four witnesses?

- A. No, I didn't. I suppose what I was saying, and maybe you misunderstood --
- 25 78 Q. CHAIRMAN: Could you conceive of a situation where 26 somebody suffering from stress comes along with four 27 witnesses?
- MS. MULLIGAN: It was information given to me by the chief superintendent, I am merely exploring the issue.

1 No, what I am saying here is, refer to the CMO, if the Α. 2 person is suffering with stress, is he fit to be in the 3 workplace or not, that's the priority. In many cases, any work related stress investigation or an 4 5 investigation that is underpinned by the policy under 10:58 bullying and harassment, they're slightly different, 6 7 you can be stressed but you mightn't make a complaint 8 under that policy. It can take a long time, so you don't wait. You send it up. The CMO wants to have --9 10 so the end game here is: Is this person going to get 10:59 11 occupational injury classification? Is he injured? 12 That obviously has to be part of the equation. Did the 13 job cause it? And HRM make a decision. As I said the 14 other day, you don't wait and do your investigation or 15 I don't say to people, if you're not prepared to 10:59 16 discuss this with me I'm not sending you into the CMO, 17 absolutely you don't do that. You send it up the line.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

In the ordinary -- where a person makes a complaint, and I am very clear about this, you don't go on a fishing exercise, because that can embarrass people and cause stress to people. You would say, is there anyone you want me to talk to? Have you any witnesses? You know, who is the cause of this stress? So that's what you do. Then you'd appoint someone to explore it.

10:59

- 26 79 Q. Okay.
- 27 A. Okay.
- 28 80 Q. Your evidence is, is there any witnesses, is that right, and you appoint someone to explore that?

- 1 A. No, what I am saying to you is --
- 2 81 Q. I'm sorry, it's on the transcript that that is what you
- just said to the Chairman. I am just not clear what it

11:00

11:00

11:01

- 4 is that you're trying to tell the Chairman?
- 5 A. What I am trying to tell you is that --
- 6 82 Q. I understand that you are trying to --
- 7 CHAIRMAN: Wait now, you're each interrupting each
- 8 other in a way that makes it impossible to know what is
- 9 happening.
- 10 MS. MULLIGAN: Apologies, Chairman.
- 11 A. What I am saying is --
- 12 83 Q. CHAIRMAN: There is some mitigation for my criticism.
- 13 Chief superintendent, could we try to keep this simple.
- 14 A. Okay.
- 15 84 Q. CHAIRMAN: Look, we're ranging off into bullying and
- harassment, which has nothing to do with this.
- 17 A. Well I --
- 18 85 Q. CHAIRMAN: Hold on. Hold on. It could be that
- somebody comes and says, I'm stressed and it's work
- related stress, and it turns out that it's a bullying
- and harassment case. It could be, or it could be that
- I am just being bullied and harassed, but they're
- separate issues. Somebody coming along and saying I'm
- 24 stressed is something. We're now talking about looking
- for witnesses. That is to do with a claim or a
- complaint or a case that's somebody is making against
- other people. For the present purposes -- there may be
- cases where that is relevant, but for the present
- 29 purposes, Ms. Mulligan is asking in general terms,

1			somebody comes along and says I am suffering from	
2			stress and it's work related stress, and you have said,	
3			I ask the person what's causing the stress. That's the	
4			first thing you do, and the second thing you do, it is	
5			proper and you follow this, you refer the person to the	11:01
6			CMO.	
7		Α.	That's right.	
8	86	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Are we understanding? Please don't think I	
9			am making a big criticism, I am just trying to follow	
10			where we are going.	11:02
11		Α.	Okay.	
12	87	Q.	CHAIRMAN: In this heading I have Ms. Mulligan asking	
13			questions in general. That's where we are at the	
14			moment. I expect, before we are very much older, I	
15			would be turning to say Garda Keogh, do you follow me?	11:02
16			So that's where Ms. Mulligan is going in her	
17			cross-examination, if I am following her. Okay. Now,	
18			Ms. Mulligan, I'm sorry for interrupting?	
19			MS. MULLIGAN: Not at all.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Please.	11:02
21			MS. MULLIGAN: I appreciate, Chairman, and I will	
22			endeavour to be more direct in my questioning.	
23			CHAIRMAN: No, there is no criticism. No, I am not	
24			criticising you at all. I'm trying to explain where	
25			there seems to be a bit of a misunderstanding and maybe	11:02
26			we will proceed.	
27	88	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Chief superintendent, what I am trying	
28			to unpack is, when you say what's the cause of the	
29			stress, what are the questions that would be asked in	

Т			order to ascertain what the cause of the stress is? So	
2			if I can be a little bit more direct in my questioning.	
3			You would start with the open question and in terms of	
4			building, I presume you have to build a rapport for the	
5			purpose of asking these questions. Presumably	11:03
6			superintendents don't often know the individual garda,	
7			is that fair?	
8		Α.	I suppose not necessarily. I suppose if you are only	
9			new to a station you wouldn't know the guard.	
10	89	Q.	Exactly?	11:03
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	90	Q.	Would you expect there to be an element of rapport	
13			building in terms of what might be considered to be	
14			quite a difficult question?	
15			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, it's just an issue with the	11:03
16			audio and the stenography. It is related to where	
17			chief superintendent is sitting vis-à-vis the	
18			microphone. She has to turn, but it would help if she	
19			could turn the microphone	
20			CHAIRMAN: Can you pull the little gadget in front of	11:03
21			you, the base. No, don't fiddle I'm sorry, forgive	
22			my impatience, I am sorry. Just pull the thing towards	
23			you.	
24			THE WITNESS: Okay.	
25			CHAIRMAN: Philip, can it go forward towards the chief	11:04
26			superintendent. No, it's stuck. Sorry. I'm sorry.	
27			Okay. So it's difficult when somebody is asking you	
28			questions from one position and you are tending to face	
29			that's difficult, so don't worry. Now, you were	

- 1 asking about rapport building.
- 2 91 Q. MS. MULLIGAN: Rapport building, would you expect there 3 to be opening rapport because you haven't met this
- 4 person, it's more likely than not, and I suppose it's a

11 · 04

11:05

11:05

- fact in this situation, this was the first meeting
- 6 between Superintendent Murray and Garda Keogh, would
- 7 you expect there to be rapport building?
- 8 A. Yes, I would yeah.
- 9 92 Q. You would. You would say in terms of how would you
- deal with questions, would you dismiss the allegation
- or would you keep everything open, or would you
- challenge the individual about the validity of their
- 13 assertion of work related stress?
- 14 A. A person -- if you become aware, sometimes the person
- might tell you, you might have known before the cert
- comes in, you know, that they were out with work
- 17 related stress. You have a conversation with the
- 18 person to find out the source of the stress. And if
- 19 they're not willing to tell you the source of the
- 20 stress, you sort of -- they might give you a sort --
- they mightn't get into the specifics of it, but they
- 22 might you a context, they might give you some
- 23 understanding of it.
- 24 93 Q. Okay. So my question was: Would you challenge the
- version of events at the first meeting or would you
- 26 mainly use the first meeting to, I suppose, elucidate
- or elicit information so that you could conduct your
- investigation? Which would you do, given that this is
- the first meeting and, as you have said, this isn't an

- 1 investigation, we're not at the investigation point per 2 se?
- 3 Α. I think you have to listen to people and you have to make your -- you know, you have to listen to people. 4 5 If people are saying to you, I'm not discussing this 11:06 6 with you, I can't discuss it with you, but I am working with -- I am suffering from work related stress. 7 8 related maybe to something they were involved in. if that's their position, you know, and if their 9 position that you are quite clear of from other 10 11:06 11 positions they have taken when inquiries have been 12 made, that they don't want to discuss this, this is all 13 connected with another matter, you know, you would say, 14 well listen, I can't bring this any further. 15 wouldn't push a person. You wouldn't put a person 11:06 16 under pressure about it. I think that would be the 17 wrong thing to do.
- 18 94 Okay. You wouldn't put a person under pressure. Q.
- 19 A person is saying to you that they are stressed, Α. what's the nature of your stress? What is it connected 11:06 20 with? Can you go any further? And I think and I know 21 22 I'm staying on point here, Superintendent Murray -- we 23 were very alive to this, the challenging context that 24 Garda Keogh was in and could well understand that he 25 was only going to bring this to a certain point. 26 were saying, yeah, that's understandable. The stress, 27 you know, that mechanism kicked in as well.

11 · 07

29 So, you know, we referred this up to the CMO to say,

28

- this is how far he is willing to go. Sometimes in my experience, some people will have a deeper conversation with the medical officer.
- Okay. If Garda Keogh or any individual member, named 4 95 Ο. 5 superior officers who might have information about 11:07 6 this, I presume you would go and talk to them, not 7 necessarily if -- and I understand what you said 8 earlier about you wouldn't necessarily challenge the individual because that is the purpose of the 9 investigation, but if there were superior officers and 10 11 · 07 11 you were told there were superior officers who had 12 information about what was being complained of, would 13 you contact them, if you asked to by the member?

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α. In this case -- no, okay, where there was a protected disclosures issue, you know, or where there was something very sensitive and where it was very connected, yeah, you probably wouldn't. I suppose this was an unusual case. We were looking to sort of say, listen, we were trying to -- at the first point, we were trying to move it on, trying to -- so it had gone up to the CMO. Garda Keogh made his position crystal clear. We weren't going to push it. And in my actual opinion, I think the context of the whole thing, and that's a matter for himself and maybe a conversation with professional people, it was very clear to me that he was, he was -- this was a cause of stress and it was connected. And you know, when you think about it realistically, even, you know, for me to roll out a

11:08

11:08

11 · 08

team, to say, well, I have to put a team on this, I

Τ			have to put a whole new team and they're ask you	
2			questions in relation to this but we simply have to	
3			have a separate investigation, that wouldn't have been	
4			the right thing to do, I don't believe.	
5	96	Q.	Superintendent, I am really sorry but I didn't ask you	11:09
6			that question?	
7		Α.	Okay.	
8	97	Q.	What I asked you was: If Garda Keogh named their	
9			direct line superior and says this person knows about	
10			where the source of my stress is and asked you to speak	11:09
11			to them, would you do that?	
12		Α.	Sorry, say that again?	
13	98	Q.	If Garda Keogh named his direct supervisor and said,	
14			this person knows about my stress, will you talk to	
15			them, would you do that?	11:09
16		Α.	Yes, you would. Yeah.	
17	99	Q.	Okay. I wonder if we could see page 2187,	
18			Mr. Kavanagh. I am sure, chief superintendent, that	
19			you have seen this document before. It's the note from	
20			Superintendent Murray, his own diary note in written	11:10
21			format of what he understands has occurred on this day.	
22			I appreciate that we don't have any other notes and	
23			this is the best that I have in trying to elucidate	
24			when you say what the cause of this stress is and	
25			trying to elucidate this information. I presume you	11:10
26			didn't see this diary entry at any time prior to the	
27			disclosure of this material being provided to the	
28			Tribunal, would I be right about that?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

2 that you believe that Garda Keogh was crystal clear and is it fair to say that your view is formed by 3 Superintendent Murray's view, isn't that fair? 4 5 Yes. Α. 11:11 6 101 Because you didn't interview at any time Garda Keogh, Q. 7 isn't that right, about the work related stress prior 8 to May 2016? 9 Yes. Α. So the only information that we have about what 10 102 Q. 11:11 11 actually happened is this note, do you accept that? 12 Yes, I do. Α. 13 Okay. So I just wonder if we can have a little look at 103 Q. 14 the entirety of this note. So we know, because this 15 has been opened ad nauseam to the Chairman, that this 11:11

was not a meeting purely about work related stress.

11:11

11:11

So to be fair to you, you have made it very clear

18 A. Yes.

16

17

100 Q.

1

19 104 Q. It also talks about car tax?

you accept that?

- 20 A. Yes, it does.
- 21 105 Q. Is it fair to say that we know this is also, that this
 22 was the first time Garda Keogh met Superintendent
 23 Murray, it's clear on the page that this is the very
 24 first meeting?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 106 Q. There doesn't appear to be any evidence of rapport
 27 building on the part of Pat Murray, is that fair?
 28 There may have been some but we don't have any other
 29 note?

1		Α.	That wouldn't necessarily be captured, yeah.	
2	107	Q.	Okay. And can we just go to the third paragraph, just	
3			further down. He is notified that he'd send it to the	
4			CMO.	
5				11:12
6			"he declined to answering questions re points he was	
7			making, instead asking me to contact Detective	
8			Superintendent Mulcahy and Superintendent McBrien. "	
9				
10			He said he wouldn't do that but would ask him and it	11:12
11			was up to him whether he would answer or not. So,	
12			would you say that Superintendent Pat Murray was	
13			incorrect, given the evidence you've just given to the	
14			Tribunal	
15		Α.	Garda Keogh, I suppose out of this meeting it was	11:12
16			accepted that he would need support and that the	
17			support would come from Galway. Basically the team	
18			were doing it in Galway and then the welfare piece.	
19	108	Q.	Now respectfully, you weren't at this meeting, correct?	
20		Α.	No, I wasn't.	11:13
21	109	Q.	No. And there's no further notes other than the letter	
22			of the 2nd April, isn't that right, and this note here?	
23		Α.	Yeah.	
24	110	Q.	So, just to be clear, working off this note, where does	
25			it say that?	11:13
26		Α.	Well I'm aware of that.	
27	111	Q.	How are you aware of it?	
28		Α.	That the team in Galway were that Garda Keogh was	

29

linking in with the team in Galway from a welfare point

-	_	
	\sim t	$V = \Delta W$
上	Οı	view.

- 2 112 Q. Yes, from a welfare point of view. But from a work related stress point of view?
- 4 A. I don't know what you mean.
- 5 113 Q. Garda Keogh asks Superintendent Murray to make contact
 with Superintendent McBrien and Detective
 Superintendent Mulcahy and he declines to do so. And

11 · 13

11:14

11:14

11 · 14

- what you gave in your evidence to the Tribunal there a
 moment ago was that if the guard citing work related
 stress asked you to speak to their superior officer,
- that you would do that. And I am just asking you to
 comment as to whether or not Superintendent Murray was
 incorrect in those circumstances?
- 14 A. D/Superintendent Mulcahy wouldn't be a superior
- officer.
- 16 114 Q. Very good. In terms of Superintendent McBrien then?
- 17 A. That wouldn't be a superior officer, they're the same grade.
- 19 115 Q. Is Superintendent McBrien not a person who has given
 20 extensive evidence to this Tribunal about all of the
 21 welfare supports she provided to --
- 22 A. I thought you said a superior officer.
- 23 116 Q. My apologies if I am being in some way inarticulate.
- 24 Superintendent McBrien is who Superintendent Murray is
- being asked to make contact with, given her extensive
- 26 knowledge and welfare work that she did with Garda
- 27 Keogh. He is being asked then, Pat Murray is being
- asked to make contact with her, he is declining to do
- so. I ask you again, do you think that Superintendent

L	Murrav w	vas	incorrect	in	that	determination?
-	mainay v	va J	1110011000		criac	accerminacion.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

No, I don't think he was. I mean, I know he had a very Α. good relationship with Superintendent McBrien and she was looking after his welfare and there was no welfare officer even required at that stage. They had a good 11:15 relationship, they knew each other before. understand that Garda Keogh was comfortable there. In terms of -- around that time it was just -- because of, I suppose, Garda Keogh's reluctance to discuss anything, because of the confidential nature of what he 11:15 was involved in, my understanding is that Superintendent Mulcahy, he was liaising with him and ringing him. Superintendent Murray took the decision, and I supported that decision, that because of the sort of, I suppose, unusual nature about this, we didn't 11:15 say, we didn't say he won't tell us, the door is shut, we're not doing any more about it. The position we took is, we said we really need to move this on, we need to explore it, this person is saying they're stressed. We gave, I suppose, as much as we could 11:16 There was an opportunity then -- there was quite an extensive -- I suppose we gave the context, it was all connected with this. Sometimes people have deeper conversations with the CMO. And I am conscious -- and I suppose I know you're talking about in general terms. 11:16 In this case, we -- like we sent him up the line for the medical supports and because it was so unusual, we were -- and he was reticent to discuss it with us and I suppose there was probably a reluctance to get into

1 asking questions that were going to bring it into the 2 nitty gritty of the core investigation in Galway, we 3 were saying -- you know, Pat initiated, listen, we need to send it up the line here, he needs support, that was 4 5 the primary thing. We are giving you -- we're giving 11:17 6 you as much information as we can and please make this 7 assessment. When Garda Keogh -- Garda Keogh was back 8 working then, he was deemed fit. So, you know, he was 9 back working, he was fit. In May he was deemed fit as well. 10 11:17 11 we looked then to have a case conference. We looked at 12 13 case conference with HRM, saying, this member, you 14 know, is reporting sick by work related stress, he has 15 been seen by the CMO, we have a fairly deep 11:17 16 understanding what the issue is but, you know, we just 17 don't think we can bring it any further. This 18 wasn't --19 117 Chief superintendent, I am really reluctant to Q. continually cross over when you're speaking, but my 20 11:17 questions are really quite short? 21 22 Okay. Α. 23 You have given the same evidence nine times now? 118 Q. 24 Okay. Α. 25 And we had a whole day of it yesterday. It's clear 119 Ο. 11 · 18 what your position is. We would all be moving a little 26 27 bit faster if you just answer my questions for a It's a matter for the Chairman to decide what 28 moment. the reality of the facts are. So in terms of what I 29

1			asked you in terms of Superintendent McBrien, and you	
2			say, well, maybe there's a conflict about how that	
3			would happen. I just want to explore this with you:	
4				
5			"I said I wouldn't contact anyone for anecdotal info	11:18
6			but would ask him and it was to him whether he would	
7			answer or not."	
8				
9			That seems to be shutting down seeking to get any	
10			information from any other third party, were you aware	11:18
11			of that? Because if you weren't aware of it, then that	
12			is one thing	
13		Α.	I was aware that he had contacted the superintendent in	
14			Galway.	
15	120	Q.	Were you aware that Superintendent Pat Murray declined	11:18
16			to contact Superintendent McBrien despite the request?	
17		Α.	No.	
18	121	Q.	No. Can I just go back up then to the previous	
19			paragraph, and it is confirmed that he asked he	
20			said:	11:19
21				
22			"No, I would send him to assess the stress because the	
23			in and out appearance do not in my view support what he	
24			is saying."	
25				11:19
26			I am going to put it to you then just for completeness,	
27			that that seems to be challenging on a preliminary	
28			basis, version of events, what Garda Keogh seems to be	
29			saying about work related stress and is quite	

	_			_		
1	_l_	ismissive	- <u>-</u>	منامت منت		
	(1)	AVESSEMSE	OT DIS	WOLK L	'A I A T A N	CTPACC
_	- u	13111133176	01 1113		Clacca	J LI LJJ

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 2 Well, I don't think -- Garda Keogh was intermittently Α. 3 out sick with work related stress. As I said, he was -- he wasn't -- he was intermittently -- so he wasn't 4 5 out for a protracted period of work related stress. 6 we're obliged to report it to the CMO. But just in 7 relation to the other aspect, Superintendent Pat Murray 8 and Superintendent McBrien would have had a hand over meeting and there would have been -- you know, there 9 would have been, I suppose, a conversation. 10 11 · 20
- 11 122 Q. There has been evidence given in relation to that. 12 don't need to ask you about that part. I may need to 13 ask you whether you know about it, and if you do that's 14 fine, and if you don't that's fine. Can you accept 15 that it appears that he seems to be telling Garda Keogh 11:20 16 that he is sceptical about his work related stress? 17 Can you accept that that's a reasonable interpretation 18 of what that says?
 - A. He was sending it to the CMO, as he was supposed to do.

 Garda Keogh went from being fit to being medically

 stressed, you know, in patterns. You know, stress is a

 very serious matter, is a very serious issue. I mean,

 Superintendent Murray didn't say, you know, I don't

 believe you and that's the end of it. He was sending

 him to the CMO to get an assessment done.
- 26 123 Q. That was my question. Can you accept on the -27 CHAIRMAN: The meaning of that, Ms. Mulligan, is really
 28 for me, isn't it? It is pretty clear -29 MS. MULLIGAN: Very well --

Т			CHAIRMAN: Hold on, let me speak, Ms. Mulligan, don't	
2			cut across me when I am speaking.	
3			MS. MULLIGAN: Apologies.	
4			CHAIRMAN: It's pretty clear what the meaning is. I	
5			think you might possibly consider drawing this to a	11:21
6			conclusion by saying that the chief superintendent	
7			agreed, dealing in general terms with the person	
8			complaining of work related stress, dealing in general,	
9			the chief superintendent agreed with two propositions	
10			that you put. One, that the superintendent would not,	11:21
11			perhaps ought not, challenge or disagree with the	
12			situation as described. Number one. That is what the	
13			chief superintendent said. And number two, that if the	
14			person said that there were other people who could	
15			assist with information, that it would be reasonable to	11:22
16			go and ask those people. The chief superintendent, as	
17			I noted, agreed with those two propositions. And your	
18			point is, Superintendent Murray appears to have	
19			disagreed with both of those. He wasn't interested	
20			where he said he had anecdotal evidence from somebody	11:22
21			else about it, I'm not saying he is right or he is	
22			wrong, but this is the situation. There is a	
23			difference there between the what the chief	
24			superintendent said would be general practice and what	
25			Superintendent Murray appears to have adopted. Isn't	11:22
26			that really where we are going.	
27			MS. MULLIGAN: Yes.	
28	124	Q.	CHAIRMAN: what do you say to that, chief	
29			superintendent?	

- 1 A. I think what I am saying is, in this particular case.
- 2 125 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 3 A. It was so, I suppose, sensitive and even the fact that
- 4 I suppose when there was a substantive investigation
- ongoing and people were being investigated in the
- 6 station, that was a cause of concern. In this case --

11:23

11:23

- 7 126 Q. CHAIRMAN: First of all, do you agree, he took a
- 8 different view from the one you have expressed?
- 9 A. No, I don't. Sorry, if it's in order, Chairman.
- 10 127 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 11 A. I mean, I know --
- 12 128 Q. CHAIRMAN: Tell me where I am wrong. I had it down
- that you agreed with Ms. Mulligan that if the person
- told you, you would be sympathetic, it wouldn't be
- challenging, it would be a sympathetic engagement and
- it wouldn't be challenging?
- 17 A. Sorry, yeah.
- 18 129 Q. CHAIRMAN: Number one, that's the first thing I
- 19 thought. The second thing was that if the person told
- you there were senior officers who had information
- about the matters, would you talk to them, and you said
- yes, you would?
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 130 Q. CHAIRMAN: That appears to be different from what
- 25 superintendent -- it doesn't make him wrong, it doesn't 11:24
- 26 make him -- or whatever. I mean, am I missing
- 27 something here? There is a difference between those
- two propositions?
- 29 A. What I am saying, Chairman, if it's in order, sorry.

- 1 131 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yeah, go on.
- 2 A. I suppose the uniqueness of this case.
- 3 132 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, in the circumstances of this case it
- 4 may have been perfectly right. I am not saying that
- 5 you are right or that Superintendent Murray is right,

11 · 24

11:25

11:25

11 · 25

- 6 all I am saying is, there's a difference between the
- 7 two positions. Hold on. There is a different between
- 8 the two positions, chief superintendent?
- 9 A. Okay. Okay.
- 10 133 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, he may be right, he may be perfectly
- right in saying, in this particular case, but we can
- keep it simple, at least in my simplicity, when I wrote
- that down, I thought, well let's see what the situation
- is, and then Ms. Mulligan asked, is that not different
- from here, in two respects I thought?
- 16 A. Well, I think if you look at the next step, Chairman,
- if it's in order --
- 18 134 Q. CHAIRMAN: We may find out something else, chief
- 19 superintendent. I'm sorry, and please don't think -- I
- 20 mean, I am sorry, I am not succeeding in covering my
- impatience, I'm sorry, forgive me. In this case, let's
- 22 keep it very simple?
- 23 A. Okay.
- 24 135 Q. CHAIRMAN: We're not worrying about what happened next
- or what happened before or anything else. We have a
- situation. Now, Ms. Mulligan, as far as I'm concerned,
- 27 may take it that she has established two points of
- difference between your general approach, as you have
- said, that's a general approach, and Superintendent

			Mulitay 5 particular approach. In this case there	
2			appears on the face of it to be two differences, that	
3			is all I am saying?	
4		Α.	If it's in order, so that's the point I make, Chairman.	
5	136	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	11:25
6		Α.	In this context, when you're ten months into, I	
7			suppose, a complicated issue, Garda Keogh had been out	
8			intermittently with work related stress, I don't know	
9			that there had been a referral in that period. When	
10			Superintendent Murray became aware that Garda Keogh had	11:26
11			been out with work related stress and I suppose he	
12			referred him up the line straightaway, for him to be	
13			properly assessed. So this is the key issue here.	
14	137	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You say the key point, whatever about those	
15			differences, the key point is he did the one crucial	11:26
16			thing, which is to refer to the CMO?	
17		Α.	And I think the second point, Chairman.	
18	138	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
19		Α.	As I said, investigations go on all the time and they	
20			go on in stations and most people have no problem with	11:26
21			that, but clearly Garda Keogh had a problem with that.	
22			I think even in my professional opinion, for us to	
23			start an investigation when a person, in that time	
24	139	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I am understanding.	
25		Α.	It was just going to be it just was going to be so	11:26
26			complex and it could even be seen as robust.	
27	140	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Just to reassure you, I am not missing the	
28			point?	

Okay.

Α.

1			CHAIRMAN: Somebody may well submit that Superintendent	
2			Murray was right not to go asking Detective	
3			Superintendent Mulcahy about the state of Garda Keogh's	
4			stress. Somebody may well make that point. I'm not	
5			missing that. But I'm just saying there is a	11:27
6			difference in the two positions. Okay, Ms. Mulligan.	
7			Let's move on. I'm sorry, if you are satisfied that I	
8			have the point at least, well and good.	
9			MS. MULLIGAN: Certainly, Chairman.	
10	141	Q.	In relation to this note, it's fair to say that within	11:27
11			that note there's also no notification in terms of the	
12			consequences being of work related stress being	
13			notified to Garda Keogh, is that fair?	
14		Α.	Sorry.	
15	142	Q.	The consequences of an investigation into work related	11:27
16			stress for Garda Keogh, that hasn't been notified, that	
17			is not on the note, there's no information about that?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	143	Q.	Isn't that the case? In those terms, the issue of pay,	
20			for example, and being notified that if he doesn't	11:28
21			cooperate with the investigation that his pay will	
22			continue will be cut or will continue to be cut?	
23		Α.	That is actually not correct. I know Garda Keogh	
24	144	Q.	Sorry, it's only in relation to what is on this note?	
25		Α.	I know, I just want to explain this. Sorry, Chairman.	11:28
26	145	Q.	I'm very sorry, I am sure the Chairman	
27			CHAIRMAN: There's no reference to that on the note.	
28			There isn't. Don't worry about interpretation of the	
29			note, Ms. Mulligan, I can read it.	

1	146	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN:	I wasn't asking for an	n interpretation.
2			It's the case,	Chief Superintendent,	that there is no

3 information on that note about Garda Keogh being told

4 of the consequences of a work related stress

5 investigation, isn't that fair?

A. That's the point I was answering, I agree with you that there is no note in relation to that. What I am saying to you is, when a member is out sick with work related stress, it's not, even if they fully cooperate with the investigation and I am not saying he didn't you know

investigation and I am not saying he didn't, you know,
I don't even think -- there hasn't even been an

investigation, five years later. If he fully

cooperated with the investigation and he felt he could,

maybe when everything was over, you know, that doesn't

11:28

11 · 29

11:29

11:29

11:29

of itself automatically entitle Garda Keogh to pay.

16 It's quite a complex issue.

- 17 147 Q. I accept that.
- 18 A. Okay.

13

14

15

- 19 148 Q. That is accepted. My question was about that
- 20 information. So your position has been from the

21 extensive evidence that Garda Keogh was explicitly

clear that he wasn't going to engage with anyone. Are

you satisfied that Superintendent Murray was

24 sufficiently clear about the process that he was

embarking on with Garda Keogh?

26 A. Yes, I am. As I said, I mean, that's why we brought it

to the next step, to say, listen, this is as far as we

can go with it here. And I don't even -- I think we

29 went -- in my professional opinion, I think we went far

1			enough in terms of giving the background. Sometimes	
2			when someone is out work related stress, it could be	
3			something very simple and a page will tell you the	
4			story and it's not necessary a major investigation.	
5			And that is sufficient for the CMO to say, yeah, that's	11:30
6			the issue that happened there, there's a causal link	
7			there, happy enough, that's work related stress. And	
8			the person is off.	
9	149	Q.	So you would disagree with Superintendent Murray when	
10			he said that he could have been more clear with Nick	11:30
11			about what was happening?	
12		Α.	In respect of what?	
13	150	Q.	In terms of the investigation. And I think if you go,	
14			it's Day 125, and it's page 54, just for the benefit of	
15			your team, they can consider it, because it's a whole	11:30
16			page, where it was identified by Superintendent Murray	
17			that he could have been a bit clearer about the	
18			position in relation to the work related stress	
19			assessment. So you disagree, you think Superintendent	
20			Murray was sufficiently clear?	11:31
21		Α.	Where are you referring to?	
22	151	Q.	Day 125, page 54, line 14.	
23		Α.	Yeah, I don't disagree with that.	
24	152	Q.	Okay. So you don't disagree with it.	
25		Α.	Yeah.	11:31
26	153	Q.	You gave evidence to the Chairman there that you did	
27			think he was sufficiently clear, you are now changing	
28			that evidence?	
29		Α.	No, I'm not.	

- 1 154 Q. That's a change of position. You said he was
 2 sufficiently clear and now you accept that he wasn't
 3 sufficiently clear?
- A. Sorry, maybe put what you are saying in context, because I've lost you there now.

- 6 155 I will move on. Can I also look then at page 3253. Q. This is just in relation to what you say is the steps. 7 8 You have identified what steps need to be taken as to what the cause of the stress is. Then you go straight 9 Just so I am clear, is there any further to the CMO. 10 11:32 11 investigation process that needs to happen prior to 12 going to the CMO.
- 13 A. If a person -- if a person was willing to engage with you, you could.
- 15 156 Q. You could. Okay. Can you just clarify, so if a person 11:32 is willing to engage, what would you do?
- A. Well, you take a statement of complaint from the person who is making -- who -- you know, you would kick off the investigation from the person.
- Okay. And what's different from that point of view 20 157 Ο. 11:33 than identifying the cause of stress? So what is the 21 22 difference between the two? What additional steps, if someone was willing to engage, you said Garda Keogh 23 24 wasn't, you say you would take a statement. 25 the difference there between what you previously 11:33 identified to the Chairman, identifying what the cause 26 27 of the stress is and taking the statement?
- A. Can I just say, in this case, you know, we were saying, listen -- we were alive to the sensitivities around the

1 whole issue. I don't believe -- and we had given a 2 very good summary of the issue up to the CMO. believe it would have been -- I didn't believe that it 3 was appropriate to start, you know, asking questions 4 5 around the place and doing that. I didn't believe it, 11:34 6 I think it could have been perceived in a negative way, because, you know, the sensitivities around it. And if 7 8 the stress that Garda Keogh was suffering was actually to do with how the investigations were doing, if it was 9 something to do with how people were reacting because 10 11:34 11 how he did it. There were so many nuisances. 12 professional opinion it wasn't going to be appropriate 13 at that stage to sort of start kicking something off on 14 top of him when he was part of this. So I was -- you 15 know, so we were saying, send it up, you know, let's 11:34 16 get an assessment here and that's his position. wasn't the CMO's position, well, I'm not looking at 17 18 this person here because I don't have enough 19 information. we will get to that and perhaps that is a matter for 20 158 0. 11:34 21 the CMO? 22 Yes. Α. 23 But just so I am clear, you would identify the source 159 Q. 24 of the stress, you send Garda Keogh to the CMO. had not been in the specific factual nexus that he 25 11:35 26 found himself in, you would have taken a statement of 27 complaint?

28 A. If he was willing to make one.

29 160 Q. If he was willing to make one, yes?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 161 Q. And is there anything else you would have done?
- 3 A. Well, I suppose Garda Keogh was under the care of the
- 4 welfare person at the time but normally you would
- 5 actually -- if the person wasn't, you would remind them 11:35

11:36

- 6 of the services of the welfare.
- 7 162 Q. So you would remind them of welfare. Anything else?
- 8 A. Not really, no.
- 9 163 Q. Okay. So just for the purposes of this statement of
- 10 complaint, who did the statement of complaint
- ordinarily go to, in other scenarios?
- 12 A. Well you might make an appointment with an inspector to
- go and ask the person for a statement of complaint.
- 14 But in this case, this wasn't something that I was
- 15 going to kick off.
- 16 164 Q. No, sorry, that was a more basic question. If the
- 17 statement of complaint is taken, does it go to the CMO,
- does it go to you? Who actually has charge of that
- document and what is its purpose?
- 20 A. It's like any statement, I suppose it's to establish
- 21 what is the causes of the stress.
- 22 165 Q. And who does that document go to?
- 23 A. Well a person -- it could go to -- it would come
- through to me. I suppose if you had it at the time and
- 25 if Garda Keogh was giving additional information at the 11:36
- time or he had made a statement, that would have gone
- up to the CMO as well.
- 28 166 Q. That would have gone. Just correct me if I am wrong
- and I think it's clear from the papers but no one asked

Τ			Garda Reogn to provide a statement to the CMO	
2			specifically, given just the factual scenario, okay, we	
3			can't look at it, I appreciate that that might be too	
4			difficult, will you write it all down and give it the	
5			CMO. That didn't happen, sure it didn't?	11:36
6		Α.	No, but he had an opportunity to have a conversation	
7			with the CMO.	
8	167	Q.	He did. He did have an opportunity to. We will get to	
9			that. We will talk about the CMO in due course. But	
10			you didn't ask him to make that statement and neither	11:37
11			did Superintendent Murray, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	168	Q.	No. And again, that didn't go to the CMO, isn't that	
14			the case?	
15		Α.	It wasn't made. He didn't make one, yeah.	11:37
16	169	Q.	Okay. So the process then, we're now at the referral	
17			stage, going to the CMO, that's in around the	
18			somewhere between the 19th and the 22nd May. Is there	
19			any other steps that need to be taken in order for	
20			Garda Keogh to be considered for an injury on duty for	11:37
21			work related stress from a HR point of view?	
22		Α.	They have to consult with HRM. They can I know they	
23			can ask for further enquiries to take place in relation	
24			to it. And they can they sometimes send the person	
25			to an external person as well. So ultimately the	11:37
26			executive director of HRM makes the determination	
27			whether the person gets falls into that category.	
28	170	Q.	Okay. In relation to the document at 3253, and then it	
29			just goes on to hage 3254 it's an e-mail from Clare	

Т			Egan and I just want to ask you about it, who I believe	
2			works for HR. The executive director is on it and	
3			member is on sick leave. And I think to be fair, it is	
4			a document that might have been redacted, I am not	
5			entirely sure. I just want to go to, I think it's the	11:38
6			sixth last line. It says:	
7				
8			"This branch is not in receipt of nor aware of any	
9			application for this sickness absence to be treated as	
10			anything other than ordinary illness."	11:38
11				
12			I just wanted to ask, is there an application process	
13			for documents to be considered as something different	
14			from ordinary illness?	
15		Α.	Yeah. When a person is injured on duty, I issue an	11:38
16			11.37. So people can apply for that.	
17	171	Q.	Yes. And that's just what I wanted to clear up. The	
18			application, so my understanding of the 11.37 was that	
19			that is at the end and it's, I suppose, the final cog	
20			in the wheel?	11:39
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	172	Q.	This might be a question for HR, so if you can't answer	
23			it that's fine. But am I reading it right, that the	
24			application has to come from local management?	
25		Α.	well, actually, there's a whole process, right.	11:39
26	173	Q.	But does it have to come from local management, that is	
27			the only question I want to ask?	
28		Α.	No, just in the context of work related stress, it is	
29			actually slightly different. I suppose a person	

1			themselves could apply for this to be considered as	
2			work related stress. And I think there would be a lot	
3			of cases now up in the air, in the ether in the	
4			organisation. I suppose the Code puts the	
5			responsibility back on the chief superintendent to	11:39
6			issue an 11.37, really to say, yes, this is injury on	
7			duty, put him back on the payroll, get the pay	
8			retrospective. In relation to work related stress,	
9			because I suppose of the complexities and that around	
10			it, we're told when the executive director	11:40
11			adjudicates on the matter and I suppose the stress	
12			piece has been established, the causal link has been	
13			established, they can ask other inquiries as well. If	
14			they're satisfied, the CMO, in conjunction with HRM,	
15			they say, yes, this person is injured, the job is	11:40
16			responsible for this injury, then they go back to you	
17			and say, issue an 11.37.	
18	174	Q.	Yes. No, I am very clear on that. Just so I am	
19			absolutely clear, I'm not aware of -:	
20				11:40
21			"This branch is not in receipt of nor aware of any	
22			application for this sickness absence to be treated as	
23			anything other than ordinary illness."	
24				
25			Again, just so that we are clear on the date, that's in	11:41
26			May of 2016.	
27		Α.	Yeah.	
28	175	Q.	So we've already had the letter going up to the CMO, I	
29			think it's the letters in May, seeking for there to be	

Т			a work related stress investigation. So is it possible	
2			that the HR are incorrect that there's been no	
3			application for this to be treated as work related	
4			stress, or is there some other piece that I am just not	
5			following?	11:41
6		Α.	No. Yeah, yeah. HRM ultimately make the	
7			determination, or I suppose the executive director in	
8			consultation with the CMO and local you know, he	
9			ultimately says, yes there has been a few of them,	
10			there hasn't been too many in the job that this	11:41
11			person is medically stressed, it's an injury. We're	
12			happy enough, we have done all this. I think there	
13			might have been a case where a couple of chiefs were	
14			issuing an 11.37s for work related stress and the	
15			organisation said, no, you can't do that, you're not	11:42
16			qualified.	
17			So just in relation to this, this would have come from	
18			HRM, the application to the pay section, to say, look,	
19			we are happy that this is an 11.37, so put him into	
20			that category.	11:42
21	176	Q.	So just I am clear and that's very helpful, I	
22			appreciate that, this is the distinction to be made	
23			between the HR directorate and the Sick Section?	
24		Α.	Yeah.	
25	177	Q.	Okay. So the application can come from you, can come	11:42
26			from Garda Keogh, and then there is a final	
27			recommendation from the HR department, which then is	
28			sent to the Sick Section. Did I get that right?	
29		Δ.	Yeah. broken down it's clearer, you know what I mean.	

- 1 178 Q. I accept that. I just wanted to be clear. Can I then 2 just ask you to go to page 2509, please, Mr. Kavanagh.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 179 Q. Could you just confirm to the Chairman who the private
 5 secretary to the Commissioner is and what the purpose of this report was?
- 7 A. Yeah. He's Superintendent Frank Walsh. This report
 8 was a response to an e-mail that I received from
 9 Superintendent Frank Walsh on the 18th May. It may
 10 have been triggered, I don't know what triggered it but 11:43
 11 the Commissioner wanted a report, an up-to-date report,
 12 I suppose, around all matters in relation to Garda
 13 Keogh. So that's what triggered that.
- 14 180 Q. Okay. So can you just point to me in this document
 15 where you identify the issue of work related stress,
 16 any investigation, the inability to have an
 17 investigation or anything at all just in that general
 18 tenor? Because I just can't see it.
- 19 Well, there wasn't one because we -- there wasn't an Α. investigation, there still hasn't been an investigation 11:44 20 because the member reported sick with work related 21 22 stress and we brought it to a certain point and 23 certainly for the first couple of months the CMO didn't 24 deem him stressed and actually, I don't know, I don't know what the medical determination is for Garda Keogh 25 at the moment. That's matter for someone else. 26 27 really, as I said, we didn't do a work related stress investigation. 28
- 29 181 Q. But I asked you what the purpose of this document was

1			for and it was all information in relation to Garda	
2			Keogh and surely if this was at the forefront of your	
3			mind that this was an issue that you couldn't progress,	
4			surely it would have made its way into this report?	
5		Α.	Well, we stepped out what we did, you know what I mean,	11:44
6			and the lines that we took.	
7	182	Q.	Can I point you to page 2510, into the paragraph of	
8			"welfare". Just to go into the third paragraph.	
9			Because you do identify Yvonne Martin, Sergeant Yvonne	
10			Martin was nominated to make intermittent enquiries	11:45
11			with Garda Keogh with effect from the 2nd April 2005	
12			[sic], isn't that right, that's what that says?	
13		Α.	Yeah.	
14	183	Q.	I think that is relied upon by you in your report to	
15			Chief Superintendent McLoughlin as one of the steps you	11:45
16			took as a support for Garda Keogh	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	184	Q.	to deal with the work related stress. And yet still	
19			the work related stress issue doesn't make its way up	
20			the chain in this document, isn't that right?	11:45
21		Α.	At the risk of repeating myself. Garda Keogh reported	
22			sick with work related stress, he was referred to the	
23			CMO, okay, and he was deemed fit. He came back into	
24			the workplace and then he was out again, periodically,	
25			and we referred him back up again. After that and	11:46
26			there was a conference held. He was out of the	
27			workplace from January he's still out of the	
28			workplace, but from that time, from January to May,	
29			when I saw him. So, you know, he had that was his	

1			view and that was his doctor's view and he brought it	-
2			to our attention. He had made the position clear. W	٧e
3			had sent him to the CMO.	
4	185	Q.	Okay.	

- 5 So really we didn't have any sort of road map after Α. 11:46 6 that to move ahead with this.
- 7 All right. My questions, perhaps I am being unclear. 186 Q. 8 You're asked for a full assessment of all the things that had been done in relation to Garda Keogh and the 9 10 failure or the inability, as you say, to have an 11 · 47 11 investigation, just to be clear, is not mentioned in 12 this report, and then you eye that Yvonne Martin was 13 nominated to make intermittent enquiries. Did you ever 14 follow up with whether or not Yvonne Martin did that?
- No. Α. 16 were you here for her evidence that she said she 187 No. Q. 17 didn't?

11:47

11:47

18 Yes. Α.

15

- 19 188 Okay. So again, that made it into a report, Q. Yes. which I think again is relied --20
- That was a welfare thing, that wasn't necessarily work 21 Α. 22 related stress.
- 23 we will come back to that, as I think there might be 189 Q. 24 another dispute between yourself and Superintendent 25 Murray about what that was for. Return to work interviews were conducted, just two paragraphs down, at 26 27 the very end of that page. Was the work related stress a feature in the return to work interviews? 28
- 29 Sorry, I'm not aware. This report was pulled together Α.

- from all reports, you know, coming from various people.
- 2 190 Q. You signed it, it's your report.
- A. I know it's my report, yeah, I'm just -- where are you referring to?
- 5 191 Q. "Return to work interviews were conducted with Garda 11:48

 Keogh on his return from periods of absence."

So again I just wanted to ask, did work related stress
come up there and if it did, why is there no
notification to the secretary about the issue of work

11 · 48

11:49

11:49

11 · 49

11 related stress

12 Well, we were always clear that Garda Keogh continued Α. 13 to -- when he was absent from duty, that his doctor --14 you know, he was the doctor certified him sick due to 15 work related stress, okay. And that's fine. 16 reference point in terms of -- we referred Garda Keogh 17 to the CMO, and I know I'm repeating myself but I think 18 it's is important, and the CMO deemed him unfit for 19 duty in December. He didn't go into a lot of detail as 20 to what the actual issue was, nor should he, because it's confidential. So that was that position for that 21 22 period. So Garda Keogh continues and does continue to 23 this day I think to get certs from his doctor to say 24 that he is out, that he is suffering from work related 25 stress, he has to get -- so I am sort of not clear as 26 to what the issue is you are raising.

27 192 Q. Okay. Can we just have a look at the document, Volume 28 11, page 3267, please. You will be very familiar with 29 this, it's a report that you completed for Chief

1			Superintendent McLoughlin. You're familiar with this	
2			document, I presume?	
3		Α.	Oh yeah.	
4	193	Q.	It has been opened several times to the Chairman. So I	
5			think from this document that efforts were made locally	11:50
6			to establish the source of the alleged work related	
7			stress, yes?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	194	Q.	It identifies frequent absences from work, it	
10			identifies that the member was reviewed, it establishes	11:50
11			the additional workplace supports, to assist the member	
12			locally. Now, I just want to ask you about this piece	
13			here:	
14				
15			"A request was made and reviewed to establish any	11:50
16			additional work supports."	
17				
18			If we just go to the next paragraph, the next page,	
19			please, Mr. Kavanagh. Yes.	
20				11:51
21			"sergeant rank to a member to discuss and if	
22			possible solve any work related issues he may have in	
23			Athlone in order to allow him to attend work more	
24			frequently."	
25				11:51
26			So in this document that you send, I think, just so I	
27			am clear, two weeks prior.	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	195	Q.	So we have a document on page 2509 which you author on	

- the 24th May 2016, which makes no reference to work related stress, which references Yvonne Martin.
- 3 A. Yes.
- Then a second document at page 3266 and then 3267 references the sergeant who I believe is Yvonne Martin, 11:52
- 6 as being identified as a source of support in
- 7 identifying work issues. I just can't understand how
- 8 work related stress didn't come into this document on
- 9 the 26th May and yet the same person is relied upon in
- page 3267, two weeks later, as a support and work done

11:53

11:53

- in relation to work related stress support?
- 12 A. These were two different reports.
- 13 197 Q. Can you comment on that. Yes, they are two different reports?
- 15 A. Yes. One was going to the Commissioner. This report 11:52

 16 actually on the 8th --
- 17 198 Q. The 6th June?
- 18 A. The 6th June, was in response to Chief Superintendent 19 McLoughlin's request.
- 20 199 Q. Yes.

26

- 21 A. As I said, we had written up twice, we had referred him 22 twice. On the day, on the 20th -- 16th May I had seen
- 23 Garda Keogh and at that he sort of took the decision
- that he was out with stress, that his doctor said he
- was stressed and that, you know, he wasn't going to
- took then was that, yeah, he is saying he is stressed,
- he is saying it is all connected with this matter. So
- I took the decision then and I wrote up to HRM to say

come back until it was all over. So the position I

when he returns, when this is all over and when he is 1 2 in a position to return to work, then I will do the investigation into work related stress. And in 3 response to the two e-mails, I know I have given this 4 5 evidence yesterday, I just said, I will put this whole 11:53 6 report together, just to pull it all together and my 7 professional opinion, you know, at that stage it wasn't 8 going to be realistic to sort of put another investigation on top of this investigation. 9 So then I said, you know, to be clear, do you want us to do an 10 11:54 11 investigation, do you want us to do it, do you think it 12 is appropriate? You are the medical people, you are 13 the HR people, do you think we should go ahead with 14 this now? Do you think it's appropriate? reminder subsequent. My understanding is that an 15 11:54 16 investigation to this date hasn't taken place. 17 I put it to you for the purposes of the transcript that 200 Q. it's clear that there was no legitimate investigation into work related stress and that the report on the

18 19 20 26th May is proof of that. I presume you're not going to accept that, but I am just putting it to you for the 21 22 purposes of --

23 No, maybe you just might repeat what you said. Α.

24 Sorry, my apologies. I am just going to put it to you 201 Q. 25 again that you wrote a document on the 26th May, making 11:55 no reference to any work related stress, despite it 26 27 being in relation to all issues with Garda Keogh, and then two weeks later, using the same information, you 28 29 rely on certain information within it to prove that you

have done a work related stress investigation, and I am putting to you that it undermines the credibility as to

whether or not there was ever any work related stress

4 investigation done in any way, shape or form?

A. No, I didn't say that. Sorry, that not -- I said when
I went to see him, I said I will undertake one when he
comes back, when it's is all over.

8 202 Q. Yes.

3

And then Superintendent McLoughlin may not have had 9 Α. sight of that because it was on the 26th -- I think it 10 11 was the day I visited him, and I said we had told -- we 12 had told people already and we had told the people in 13 HRM, we really don't believe we can advance this. You 14 know, it was always open to people, maybe they could 15 ask the people in Galway to do an investigation because 11:55 16 it was so interlinked. I'm not aware that that was 17 ever suggested. So, you know, so when I went to visit 18 him and he was quite -- he said, I'm out with stress, 19 and that was the whole essence of the issue for him, I wrote up then and said, yes, the member is asserting 20 11:56 his absence is to do with being stressed. 21 22 returns from work, when this is all over, I propose to 23 do a work related stress -- pursue it. Chief 24 Superintendent McLoughlin may not have seen it because 25 of the timeframe and then he asked the question. 11:56 26 was putting this whole thing no context. And I said, 27 okay, if people have a helicopter view, having been 28 alive to the substantive issue, been alive to the 29 medical piece, are you saying, yes, plough ahead.

- 1 203 Q. I appreciate that some of this is out of context, I 2 just don't want to go over material that the Tribunal
- has already opened extensively. But can we just go to
- 4 page 3729 and 3730, on the basis of what you have just
- 5 said. I appreciate, chief superintendent, that this is 11:57
- 6 slightly before your time?
- 7 A. Okay.
- 8 204 Q. It is stamped on the -- my apologies, I think actually
- 9 this is the document that is without a date. If you go

11:58

11:58

- to 3729, it's 20th February 2015, and it is a report
- from Sergeant Cormac Moylan and it appears to me, and I
- am sure someone will correct me if I am incorrect, that
- 13 3730 is a request for a report from Garda Nicholas
- 14 Keogh in relation to his absences, from HR. I presume
- 15 you didn't see this document prior to the disclosures?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 205 Q. No. Okay. Just so I am clear, at 3730, it's a third
- 18 reminder, but it appears to be a proforma request from
- 19 HR, which identifies a need to get some more
- information from Garda Keogh on the basis of his
- absence. Is that a standard enough letter?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 206 Q. Is that something that happens once you go past a
- certain number of days?
- 25 A. Yeah.
- 26 207 Q. Am I right about that?
- 27 A. Yeah.
- 28 208 Q. Then we get to 3729, which I think is the response and
- it certainly does answer the questions that are in that

1			letter, on 20th February 2015. It seems to identify	
2			that Garda Keogh performs all his duties consummate	
3			with his rank, that any history is available in the	
4			district office, there is no coping skills or other	
5			measures deemed necessary at this stage. He has a good	11:59
6			working relationship with his peers, and he does not	
7			wish to note any other reasons or concerns. This was	
8			opened to the Tribunal prior to this, I just want to	
9			know did you see this document when you were doing your	
10			assessment of Garda Keogh?	11:59
11		Α.	No, I don't think so.	
12	209	Q.	No, you didn't see it, that's fine. So we have the	
13			26th March, which is the first meeting with Garda Keogh	
14			and Superintendent Patrick Murray, isn't that right?	
15		Α.	Yes.	11:59
16	210	Q.	Then, on foot of that, a report is sent to you on the	
17			2nd. You send that up, as you're obliged to, to HR,	
18			isn't that right?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	211	Q.	They come back then and I think it's Ann Mulligan comes	12:00
21			back to you, saying you should now seek to interview	
22			the member, isn't that right?	
23		Α.	That's right, yeah.	
24	212	Q.	I think you gave evidence, and I just want to give you	
25			an opportunity to respond to this, you sent a direction	12:00
26			to Patrick Murray to talk to Nick. And I think you	
27			said, in response to questions, you said:	
28				

"There's no point in asking him to send up the note

1 agai n. "

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

I just want to be absolutely clear about this, you were clear that the report of the 22nd May didn't involve any further questions or anything else being put to Nick after it was requested on the 20th May -- or sorry, on the 4th May by Ann Mulligan, for there to be an investigation.

12:00

12:01

- 9 A. I think so, yeah.
- So you're clear that at no point did you feel it 10 213 Q. 12:00 11 necessary for Garda Keogh to be informed or re-informed 12 of the consequences of not engaging in a work related stress investigation or not giving you the information, 13 14 you were satisfied that nothing further needed to be 15 done? 12:01
 - I felt that he made his position clear. I am not sure Α. that there was actually direct consequences for him, In the sense that we had -- we were really trying to explore, this is a complicated issue, you Do you actually need us to do this this way or is there any other way to look at this? I wasn't clear at that stage. I suppose the whole thing was new, the whole protected disclosures piece. And because of that, this is the real, I suppose, piece of the jigsaw here, because of that we were saying, you know, really do we do this the same way as you would ordinarily do it, because of the complexities of it. He is bringing it so far and, you know, really do we start putting another layer on top of this, would that complicate

1			matters? Would it compromise even the integrity of the	
2			substantive issue? So this was my this was our	
3			view, our position; really can we do this or do they	
4			have other mechanisms to deal with it?	
5	214	Q.	And just on that note of other mechanisms, we saw this	12:02
6			when Chief Superintendent Curran gave evidence, where	
7			there was uncertainty there was extensive	
8			correspondence trying to resolve the issue. Could I	
9			just be clear, there is no extensive correspondence	
10			from you trying to resolve the issue of Garda Keogh's	12:02
11			pay, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	215	Q.	Yes. You did give extensive evidence yesterday of your	
14			welfare interest in your members, it's fair to say that	
15			pay is a substantial aspect of the purpose of	12:02
16			employment and yet no steps were taken by you to try	
17			and rectify the issue on pay for Garda Keogh?	
18		Α.	Pay is governed by regulations and, you know, I haven't	
19			been able I have never there's never been a	
20			position other than maybe in a few cases now, in that	12:03
21			people have made protected disclosures, there is no	
22			you know, I work within the processes and procedures in	
23			the organisation and I could write I can't no	
24			matter what I wrote up to HRM, I can't ask them to	
25			operate outside the pay guidelines, or pay regulations.	12:03
26			So, you know, there was never going to be and I	
27			think they still haven't managed to sort of come up	
28			with regulations that would allow people to be paid,	
29			you know, when they're out in certain contexts. So	

1 really, making a submission wouldn't have been any 2 value, because it wasn't going -- and even HRM haven't 3 -- it wasn't within their gift to sort of pay people outside of the regulations. They are guite black and 4 5 white. 12:03 6 216 And no attempts in particular to find a solution to Q. 7 allow an investigation into the work related stress to 8 progress? There's one letter on the 22nd May --9 Yes. Α. 10 -- which you send up from Superintendent Murray and 217 Q. 12:04 11 that's it. The chain stops until May of 2016? 12 Well, like, I suppose --Α. 13 Is that the case? Isn't it the case that the chain 218 Q. 14 stops after that letter until May of 2016? 15 Yes. Α. 12:04 16 219 Yes. Thank you. Q. 17 He was outside the workplace, from December he is Α. 18 outside the workplace. 19 220 Yes. Q. 20 Yeah. Α. 12:04 Just a practical question, in relation to the CMO after 21 221 Q. 22 seeing Garda Keogh on the 22nd May, did you receive a 23 letter from the CMO? 24 No. Α. I don't think you did. I just wanted to be clear? 25 222 Q. 12.04 26 I don't think we did, yeah. Α. 27 223 That's probably a matter for the CMO. But you didn't Q. follow up or look for it. I don't see any evidence of 28 29 that happening either?

1		Α.	No. I mean, we didn't. We looked for it, we are	
2			sending up I mean, I know I am repeating myself	
3			here. Is this person fit to work or not? And I	
4			suppose and he said he was clearly he didn't say	
5			he wasn't, I suppose, taking it the other way. And I	12:0
6			suppose even to follow-through on the issue of, you	
7			know, why we didn't pursue matters, I mean, we were	
8			looking for HRM to give us a bit of guidance here in	
9			relation to this matter, because of the stress piece	
10			and because of the confidential piece and no other	12:0
11			advice advices didn't come back down to say, the	
12			member here is acting stressed, he is saying he has	
13			work related stress. You know, so when we I suppose	
14			if you look later on at the minutes of the December	
15			2015 conference	12:0
16	224	Q.	We will, we will look at those.	
17		Α.	You know, but no advice came back down and we took it	
18			then that the and the member had been back in work	
19			and his doctor had deemed him fit in that period as	

well. So we took it that the member was fit to work.

21 225 Q. All right. Just so that we are clear, the only

material that went to the CMO in April is the report of

12:05

12:06

Superintendent Murray dated 2nd April 2015?

24 A. Yes.

23

25 226 Q. Yes, that's right. And any other questions I have in 26 relation to that I can probably put to the CMO. One 27 other question. I have very little left, you might be 28 glad to know, chief superintendent. If we have a look 29 at page 8874 as well, please. This is a document that

Т			is written to you by superintendent murray to you,	
2			isn't that right, on the 4th November?	
3		Α.	I had transferred from the 8th August.	
4	227	Q.	Very good. No issue arise in that regard. Just to be	
5			clear, you didn't see that document?	12:07
6		Α.	No.	
7	228	Q.	No. Very good. I just want to put it to you so that	
8			it is absolutely clear, it is Garda Keogh's case that	
9			there were no legitimate steps taken to properly	
10			investigate the nature of his work related stress by	12:07
11			you or by Superintendent Pat Murray?	
12		Α.	Garda Keogh made his position quite clear and, as I	
13			said, understandably, it wouldn't have been appropriate	
14			and on reflection, even now it wouldn't have been	
15			appropriate to sort of have an investigation around him	12:08
16			and to be asking questions about people, it would not	
17			have been appropriate. In light of the very sensitive	
18			context I was in at the time, you know, we were looking	
19			for guidance in relation to this.	
20	229	Q.	I put it to you that no steps were taken to limit or	12:08
21			ameliorate that risk that I just identified, of Garda	
22			Keogh being a whistleblower, by you or by	
23			Superintendent Pat Murray?	
24		Α.	Sorry?	
25	230	Q.	No steps were taken by you to limit or ameliorate that	12:08
26			concern, that you couldn't do this because of Garda	
27			Keogh being a whistleblower, no steps were taken	
28			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, that's too complicated, Ms. Mulligan.	
20			Tt is at least three questions and it is too	

1 complicated. Perhaps it is. 2 MS. MULLIGAN: 3 CHAI RMAN: I am not sure how you mitigate concern. Very good, Chairman. MS. MULLI GAN: 4 5 CHAI RMAN: I understand what you are trying to do. 12:09 6 MS. MULLI GAN: Yes. But could you make it simple. 7 CHAI RMAN: 8 MS. MULLI GAN: I will do my best, Chairman. Apologies. That's okay. And possibly in three simple 9 CHAI RMAN: 10 propositions. I have you down as saying that you have 12:09 11 put to the chief superintendent that no steps -- well, 12 let's try to put it in the active voice. She took no 13 steps and neither did Superintendent Murray to 14 investigate Garda Keogh's work related stress, is that 15 a specific point that you have been putting? 12:09 16 MS. MULLIGAN: Yes. 17 CHAI RMAN: Okay, that's the one I have. 18 MS. MULLIGAN: Yes. 19 CHAI RMAN: Now, the next one. MS. MULLIGAN: And in addition to that, the steps that 20 231 Q. you did take were insufficient to protect Garda Keogh 21 22 from losing his pay, which in fact occurred. 23 I reject that entirely. The work related stress Α. 24 investigation, if I have had have ploughed ahead with 25 it, wouldn't of itself given Garda Keogh -- it wouldn't 12:10

26

27

28

29

I took the view that this is unusual, this is

have automatically entitled to Garda Keogh to his pay.

different, you know, he's not in a position really to

sort of go into any great detail. We brought it that

far. I think this is an important point to make here. I don't believe that -- and no one came back to us to say, well actually, do you know what, he is stressed, the doctor has said he is stressed but in order for us to make a decision here, we just need a little bit to more. You know, so we were bringing it up to -- and I really wouldn't -- we were saying because of the complexities of this, you know, are we going to put this person through another investigation just because normal policy tells you if a person -- you know, if that piece wasn't over there and a person is stressed, you go straight down the line and you do it a certain way.

14 232 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.

Α.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

we were saying, this is slightly different and, you know, it was so linked. And I know he wasn't -- he wasn't -- I wouldn't have expected him to go into any more detail. And we brought it that far. I think -so the three pieces of the -- we couldn't do any more here, I believe. And I don't believe the fact we couldn't advance it into any more detail of the nature of the stress, there was another conversation that was going to be had with the CMO that could have teased that out. And then the conversation with HRM. I don't believe -- you know, there was sufficient there, I believe -- in my opinion, there was -- there wasn't a case, well, you have to prove this, you have to prove I think there was sufficient information there that. for all the relevant parties to have. If there was a

12:11

12:11

12.11

Т		conclusion that indeed Garda Keogh was suffering from	
2		stress, you know, I believe that people would have made	
3		a decision that, okay, do you know what, maybe we can	
4		pay him.	
5	233 Q.	I am just going to put it to you that by depriving	12:12
6		Garda Keogh of the opportunity to engage in a work	
7		related stress investigation, he was targeted as a	
8		result of that action?	
9	Α.	I absolutely reject that.	
10		MS. MULLIGAN: You might answer some of the questions	12:12
11		that my Friend has.	
12		CHAIRMAN: Ms. Mulligan, just let me check the second	
13		proposition, it really arises out of the first one, it	
14		seems to me. You say that the chief superintendent and	
15		the superintendent did nothing to investigate his work	12:12
16		related stress.	
17		MS. MULLIGAN: Yes.	
18		CHAIRMAN: That's the first point you are making. And	
19		the second one is, that they failed I am trying to	
20		clarify your point, that they failed to protect his	12:13
21		entitlement to full pay.	
22		MS. MULLIGAN: Yes.	
23		CHAIRMAN: Is that in essence the whole thing?	
24		MS. MULLIGAN: Yes.	
25		CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you very much. You have given	12:13
26		your answers to those questions. I just wanted to make	
27		sure I had it clear as to what Ms. Mulligan was	
28		putting. So thank you very much.	
29		MS MULLIGAN: Chairman just for the benefit T	

1	tried not to referral to material that has already been	
2	opened by the Tribunal and they are a matter for	
3	submissions.	
4	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
5	MS. MULLIGAN: I didn't want to double up.	12:13
6	CHAIRMAN: Those are your calls, Ms. Mulligan, thank	
7	you very much. Now, who is next.	
8	MR. O'BRIEN: In fact, Chairman, I would like to ask	
9	Chief Superintendent Wheatley just some questions.	
10	CHAIRMAN: I don't think that is allowable,	12:13
11	Mr. O'Brien. I think one person cross-examines and you	
12	don't have two goes at the cherry.	
13	MS. MULLIGAN: Very good, Chairman, it is required for	
14	me to continue in those circumstances.	
15	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I thought that was pretty standard.	12:14
16	MS. MULLIGAN: No issue, Chairman. We will deal with	
17	it in the usual way then.	
18	CHAIRMAN: I think it is much more satisfactory.	
19	MS. MULLIGAN: No issue, Chairman.	
20	CHAIRMAN: Is there a principled objection? There	12:14
21	probably is, because it'S one thing for a witness to	
22	face questioning and cross-examination by one person,	
23	but it's a bit unfair for another person then to say,	
24	well I will take up the cudgels now and have a go.	
25	MS. MULLIGAN: Chairman, there is no issue with that.	12:14
26	I wonder would you be in a position to rise for five	
27	minutes, just to organise my papers.	
28	CHAIRMAN: That is perfectly reasonable. Okay, we will	
29	do that. I am hoping that we will finish by lunchtime.	

Τ			MS. MULLIGAN: Yes.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Yes, if you want five minutes,	
3			that's not a problem. Well I will actually say ten	
4			minutes because I am not going to stand outside in the	
5			cold.	12:14
6			MS. MULLIGAN: Thank you, Chairman.	
7				
8			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED, AS	
9			FOLLOWS:	
10				12:27
11			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
12			MS. MULLIGAN: Thank you, Chairman.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Mulligan.	
14	234	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: In relation to the aspect of bullying	
15			and harassment piece, I have very few questions for	12:27
16			you, chief superintendent. Can I just Mr. Kavanagh if	
17			we can have page 4507, please. 4507, my apologies.	
18			This is just a letter that you wrote. I think I am	
19			right in saying that you were concerned in particular	
20			about the delay in relation to	12:28
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	235	Q.	his assessment and that you were really trying to	
23			progress matters with this letter, would I be right	
24			about that?	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:28
26	236	Q.	And just on that, I think you then met for the purposes	
27			of this investigation on 23rd January 2018, does that	
28			sound correct, with Assistant Commissioner Finn? Page	
29			<i>4</i> 113	

- 1 A. Sorry.
- 2 237 Q. It's a note from Assistant Commissioner Finn, which
- seems to refer to -- it's the fourth paragraph. Do you

12:28

12:29

12:29

- 4 see that?
- 5 A. Yeah, I do, yeah.
- 6 238 Q. Do you remember that meeting?
- 7 A. I do, yeah.
- 8 239 Q. Can I just ask, who was at that meeting, can you
- 9 remember?
- 10 A. It was just myself and the assistant commissioner, it
- 11 was in the officers club.
- 12 240 Q. In the office?
- 13 A. Yeah.
- 14 241 Q. Which office?
- 15 A. The Officers Club in Garda Headquarters.
- 16 242 Q. What did you discuss? The meeting was in relation to
- 17 your concerns, I was just wondering if you have any
- 18 specific or additional information that you might be
- able to provide to the Chairman in relation to the
- 20 meeting.
- 21 A. Not really, no.
- 22 243 Q. Sorry, 4113. Just that meeting on the 23rd January:
- The meeting was for the purpose of hearing concerns in
- relation to the investigation. I am just wondering did
- 25 you have any additional or specific memory about that
- 26 meeting?
- 27 A. No, it was a short meeting, it was in the evening time.
- I think I had -- no, I don't, no.
- 29 244 Q. Did you discuss Garda Keogh's complaint?

- 1 It was in that context I met him. I was meeting him in Α. 2 the context of this -- you know, of the bullying and 3 harassment case. So how long do you think that meeting lasted? When you 4 245 Ο. 5 say short, how short? 12:30 6 I remember it was the evening time. I was learning Α. sign language at the time, so I had to run off to the 7 8 class. So I was very annoyed about this, being honest with you, the actual -- the appointment, altogether. 9 10 So I suppose that was my position. 12:31 11 246 When you say you were annoyed, is it because it was Q. 12 just an informal meeting or because it was so late in 13 the day? 14 Α. No, no, I was annoyed by the appointment. You know, I 15 was disappointed that I was being investigated under 12:31 16 this policy. 17 Okay. Did you express that annoyance? 247 Q. 18 I would have, yeah. Α. 19 248 Did you ever meet him again after that date, to Q. the best of your knowledge? 20 12:31
- 21 A. In this context?
- 22 249 Q. In this context?
- A. Yes, of course, yeah. I'm not really sure whether I send him my statement.
- 25 250 Q. You did send him a statement?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 251 Q. The only question is whether or not there was any additional meeting, to the best of your knowledge?
- A. No, there wasn't, no.

1 2	252	Q.	What about Chief Superintendent Myers or Inspector Bryan?	
3		Α.	I never met any of those. I made it quite clear to	
4		Λ.	Assistant Commissioner Finn that I would only deal with	
5			him.	12:32
6	253	Q.	And predominantly then in the form of written	12.32
7	233	ν.	correspondence, is that right?	
8		Α.	Yeah.	
9	254	Q.	No further questions. I am obliged.	
10	234	ν.	No further questions. I am obliged.	12:32
10 11			END OF EXAMINATION.	12:32
12			END OF EXAMINATION.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Very good. Now,	
14			Mr. Murphy.	
15			MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman. If there is any	12:32
16			other party, Chairman, perhaps they would go ahead of	12.32
17			me.	
- <i>.</i> 18			MS. O'ROURKE: No, Chairman.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Nobody else has any questions. Very good.	
20			So it's all yours, Mr. Murphy.	12:32
21			oo re o arr yours, mr marphyr	12.02
22			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY WAS EXAMINED BY	
23			MR. MURPHY, AS FOLLOWS:	
24				
25	255	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Chief superintendent, could I ask you	12:32
26			please to be shown on the screen page 3219 of the	
27			material, please. Chief superintendent, this is a	
28			document you have seen previously, this is a document	
29			HO Directive 139/2010. I think you're familiar with	

- that document?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 256 Q. You are familiar with this document?
- 4 A. Yes, sorry, yes.
- 5 257 Q. And in terms of the document itself, I think it is

12:33

12:33

- 6 management of sickness absence and the Chairman has
- 7 seen this document before?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 258 Q. In terms of the documentation, can I just ask you a
- number of questions on this document. First of all,
- 11 would you agree with me, this is in document which was
- 12 in force in 2015?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 259 Q. And this is the document you sought to apply in terms
- of your capacity as chief superintendent.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 260 Q. In terms of the document, can I ask you please to look
- at the first paragraph, there is a reference to the
- focus of the policy. Were you aware of the fact that
- 20 the focus of the policy was on, as the words say, early 12:33
- 21 intervention and staff welfare?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 261 Q. In terms of the system that's described under the Garda
- Occupational Health Service, you were familiar with all
- 25 this power to outreach to members of the force?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 262 Q. Then going down to the third paragraph, there is a
- 28 reference there to the role of the Chief Medical
- 29 Officer. Is it the case, as it says here, that the

1			Chief Medical Officer, the CMO, advises the Garda	
2			Commissioner of members' fitness for policing duties?	
3		Α.	That's correct.	
4	263	Q.	You emphasised in your evidence, in response to	
5			questions from my friend, that the CMO played an	12:34
6			important role in what you did in this case?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	264	Q.	Can we just tease out why that was so important for you	
9			in this case. In the same paragraph, it says:	
10				12:34
11			"When the CMO advised that the member is fit for duty,	
12			the member will resume duty immediately having been	
13			notified of same."	
14				
15			Now, does this indicate the role the CMO in relation to	12:34
16			medical assessments of the member?	
17		Α.	Yes. I mean, we're asking the CMO to tell us whether a	
18			member is fit or otherwise, sometimes they're fit with	
19			conditions. So if the CMO tells management this member	
20			is fit or he is not fit, he is fit for light duties,	12:34
21			restricted duties, that's our reference point, you	
22			know.	
23	265	Q.	Yes. I think the position is that individual members	
24			can submit medical reports or medical certificates and	
25			the CMO may choose to speak to those treating doctors	12:35
26			before arriving at this conclusion?	
27		Α.	Because of the confidentiality clearly of medical	
28			issues, members are advised when they're going up to	
29			CMO that they bring all their own medical records with	

Т			them. And it is my experience that the CMO or his	
2			team, they will link in with the relevant professionals	
3			and the member's doctors, so that is obviously	
4			something that is not within our sort of sight, rightly	
5			so.	12:35
6	266	Q.	Yes. Just to assist the Tribunal, if I could ask you	
7			to turn to the next page, please, page 3 in fact. In	
8			the third paragraph you will see there is a reference	
9			to members resuming duty after a period of sickness, do	
10			you see that?	12:35
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	267	Q.	If we just pause for a moment on this issue. Is it the	
13			case that when a member is resuming duty after a period	
14			of sickness absence and is certified as fit or	
15			restricted to light duties by his GP, that requires the	12:35
16			further approval of the CMO?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	268	Q.	So again, is it fair to say that the CMO operates a key	
19			position in terms of a clinical medical assessment in	
20			relation to a decision as to whether people are fit or	12:36
21			unfit for duty?	
22		Α.	Yeah, and we do have a situation where we have people	
23			who want to come back to work and their doctor deems	
24			them fit and the CMO will say that they are not fit.	
25			And we have situations where, which is more the case,	12:36
26			that, you know, their doctors will say they are not fit	
27			and the CMO will say they are. So our reference point	
28			is whatever the CMO's determination is.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Mr. Murphy, sorry, the reference that you	

1 just made to the CMO and the GP, where is that? 2 MR. MURPHY: That, Judge, is at page 3221, and it's on 3 the third paragraph down, under the heading: 4 5 "A marginal note should be made to Code 11.34." 12:36 6 7 You will see the next sentence starts: 8 9 "Members resume duty..." 10 11 I see, thank you very much. No, I just 12 didn't see that. 13 269 MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman. Let's keep this Q. 14 general, as my Friend indicated. 15 Yes. Α. 12:37 16 270 This is a rule that applies to everybody in the force? Q. 17 Yes. Α. 18 271 Moving down in the same paragraph, it is indicated that Q. 19 a report be forwarded to assistant commissioner HRM on 20 resumption of duty and the report will contain relevant 12:37 medical certificates and reports? 21 22 Α. Yes. 272 23 Ο. It says: 24 25 "Members will remain on duties until the member's files 12:37 are reviewed by the CMO." 26 27 Α. Yes. 28 273 SO is it the case that once a person enters into the Q.

29

field where the CMO is, that he or she remains in a

Т			sense subject to review as time goes by?	
2		Α.	Yes, until he discharges them, I suppose, effectively.	
3	274	Q.	Then moving forward, in general terms again, to the	
4			question of injury on duty. Can I just ask you to look	
5			please at the next paragraph. You will see there,	12:37
6			there is reference to where there is any doubt that	
7			injury on duty occurred. So in general terms, is it	
8			your understanding as a divisional officer you have to	
9			refer the matter to the assistant commissioner HRM, who	
10			will seek the advice of the CMO?	12:37
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	275	Q.	So in a sense there is a triangle between the	
13			divisional officer, the CMO and the HRM?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	276	Q.	Then in terms of the next sentence, it says:	12:38
16				
17			"The CMO will take into account all relevant	
18			information in arriving at his or her advices."	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	277	Q.	So, taking the general question as put forward by my	12:38
21			Friend, if a member made a statement of complaint, for	
22			example, about work related stress or some other form	
23			of injury in the workplace, would that statement, if it	
24			was made available by the member, go to the CMO?	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:38
26	278	Q.	Would that be part of all relevant information?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	279	Q.	And conversely, if a member refused to make a	
29			statement, that information couldn't travel to a CMO?	

1		Α.	No, but the member would be in a position, I suppose,	
2			to give an account of the CMO himself.	
3	280	Q.	I see. We will come back to that in a moment, but the	
4			CMO is then obliged to look at all the relevant	
5			information. The next paragraph indicates:	12:38
6				
7			"A decision regarding injury on duty will be based on	
8			the complete investigation file into the incident,	
9			management views and recommendations and the assessment	
10			and opinion of the CMO."	12:39
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	281	Q.	But the decision regarding injury on duty is a decision	
13			of the CMO?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	282	Q.	Then turning to the next paragraph	12:39
16			CHAIRMAN: Could you go down a bit, Peter?	
17	283	Q.	MR. MURPHY: Sorry, Chairman. The last paragraph,	
18			please:	
19				
20			"Where there is any doubt as to whether the member's	12:39
21			sickness/absence is due to ordinary illness or an	
22			injury on duty, the member's absence will be treated as	
23			ordinary illness pending a decision on the	
24			classification of the injury and in particular the	
25			CMO's advice."	12:39
26				
27			So is it your understanding that there are two issues.	
28			The first is, is there an injury? And the second is,	
29			what's its classification?	

1 Α. Yes. 2 And who makes that decision? 284 Q. 3 The CMO. Α. Because that's a medical decision? 4 285 Ο. 5 Α. 12:39 6 286 The final paragraph indicates: Q. 7 8 "If it is determined that the absence does relate to an injury on duty, the member's pay will be 9 10 retrospectively adjusted as soon as practicable." 12:40 11 Yes. Α. 12 So is it the case, on your understanding of the 287 0. 13 regulations and the obligations, that the member's pay 14 stays as it is unless and until there is a 15 classification of an injury on duty? 12:40 16 Yes. Α. 17 By the CMO? 288 Q. 18 Yes. Α. 19 289 And that has an impact then on pay. Then finally just Q. 20 on this point, turning over, please, to page 3222, 12:40 21 there's heading on the top "investigations". You have 22 been asked a number of questions about investigations. 23 "Moving from the general to the particular" do you see 24 that paragraph? 25 Α. Yes. 12:40 It says that a thorough investigation should be carried 26 290 Ο. 27 out immediately and the outcome reported to the 28 assistant commissioner. Now, in this case, is it your

29

evidence that Garda Keogh declined to cooperate with an

1 attempt to open up such an investigation? 2 I wouldn't even -- I wouldn't even, I suppose, use that Α. 3 sort of language. His position was that he couldn't really because he was so -- he couldn't, I suppose, 4 5 discuss it outside of the protected disclosures 12:41 6 context, you know, and it was all connected with that. So is it your evidence that in the course of that 7 291 Q. 8 interaction with Garda management, he took the view and never changed his view in 2015, that the protected 9 disclosures mechanism meant that he wasn't going to 10 12 · 41 11 talk to you? 12 Well that's a bit of a jump, isn't it, CHAI RMAN: 13 Mr. Murphy? Surely that's matter for me. Very good, Chairman. 14 MR. MURPHY: 15 CHAI RMAN: I mean, we know what he is recorded as 12:41 16 saying. 17 MR. MURPHY: Yes. 18 CHAI RMAN: We know what he says about it. 19 MR. MURPHY: Yes. 20 The chief superintendent's interpretation of 12:41 CHAI RMAN: the concept, I think is irrelevant. 21 22 MR. MURPHY: Very good. well, just as a matter of fact 292 Q. then as opposed to interpretation, can you confirm as a 23 24 matter of fact that Garda Keogh did not make a 25 statement to you in relation to this matter in 2015? 12 · 41 26 Α. Yes. 27 293 Moving to the particular, you have mentioned earlier Q.

that the --

CHAI RMAN:

28

29

It's not so much that he has to make a

Τ			Statement. We can be a fittle confused about	
2			complaint, because if I go to the doctor I may have a	
3			complaint. But really, if I say I am suffering from	
4			stress, that's really the question, and you say	
5			ultimately that matter is for the CMO. That's	12:42
6			basically what you say.	
7		Α.	Yes, to get a determination.	
8	294	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The CMO. And Mr. Murphy said that there is	
9			a triangle, divisional officer. So superintendent,	
10			HRM, CMO.	12:42
11		Α.	I suppose, just I made this point probably already, in	
12			my experience it can be something very minor but it	
13			does impact on a person and it could be you know,	
14			the CMO, you know, will make his determination when he	
15			sees the person.	12:42
16	295	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand. In a situation, in a stress	
17			case?	
18		Α.	He doesn't wait for the investigation.	
19	296	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The cause might be something relatively	
20			minor, it might be disproportionate in its impact on	12:42
21			me?	
22		Α.	What I am saying is	
23	297	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is that	
24		Α.	Sorry, he will make his determination that a person is	
25			stressed without even having an investigation file. I	12:43
26			mean, you won't get paid until all the things match up	
27			properly.	
28	298	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand.	
29		Α.	Thank you.	

- 1 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. Murphy.
- 2 299 Q. MR. MURPHY: would you agree with me that not all work
- 3 related stress absences can be attributed to An Garda
- 4 Síochána? There can be other multifarious factors
- 5 affecting stress in the workplace?
- 6 A. Yes. The language the CMO uses, you know, is that
- 7 there has to be a causal link between the workplace and

12 · 43

12:43

12:44

12.44

- 8 --
- 9 300 Q. CHAIRMAN: I think he means all stress problems. If it
- is work related stress, it's work related stress. But
- stress problems don't always relate to work.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 301 Q. MR. MURPHY: And you have mentioned the word causation,
- that is an important word from your perspective in
- terms of this type of area, is that right?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 302 Q. Is that because an individual's perception of events
- may be inaccurate and that's why a clinical judgment is
- required by the CMO?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 303 Q. In terms of this case, I think you have given evidence
- about the fact that you were aware that Garda Keogh
- went to the CMO in May of 2015?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 304 Q. I wonder could you be shown document 3790, please?
- This is the CMO's notes from 19th May 2015. I
- appreciate you did not see those notes at the time?
- 28 A. No.
- 29 305 Q. Did you see those notes then when disclosure was

1			provided by this Tribunal?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	306	Q.	We will deal with this in Dr. Oghuvbu's evidence in due	
4			course, but in terms of this document, it reflects the	
5			conversation that he had with Garda Keogh. In terms of	12:45
6			the document itself, would you agree with me, just take	
7			a moment to read it, that the references throughout	
8			that document are to alcohol addiction?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	307	Q.	Yes. So, for example, if one looks at the top of the	12:45
11			page:	
12				
13			"Was referred on account of management's concerns about	
14			high level of short absences (48 days in 12 months	
15			period from January 2014)."	12:45
16				
17			In the middle of the page you will see reference and	
18			the reference then in the middle of the page to:	
19				
20			"In the context of well being supports, says has to	12:45
21			attend AA regularly."	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	308	Q.	And then:	
24				
25			"Says no alcohol since April, though would have drunk	12:45
26			excessively over St. Patrick's weekend and between	
27			January and February unwell, 12 pints binge, saw GP."	
28				
29			Without going through all the details, I think you will	

- agree with me that this document focuses on that
- 2 discussion --
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 309 Q. -- as being focused entirely on alcohol?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 310 Q. From the point of view of your understanding of Garda
- 7 Keogh's position, were you aware in 2014 or '15 and '16
- 8 that Garda Keogh had an alcohol problem?
- 9 A. Yes, I was, yes. I had been linking in with his
- 10 welfare officer from time to time.
- 11 311 Q. Did you have a concern that in fact his alcohol problem

12:46

12 · 47

- 12 was a cause or a foundation cause of the difficulties
- he was experiencing?
- 14 A. It was a significant factor, yeah.
- 15 312 Q. At the end of the process in 2016, what treatment were
- 16 you aware was provided to him in consultation with the
- 17 CMO and An Garda Síochána?
- 18 A. I understand he went into residential treatment to deal
- 19 with his alcohol problem. That's just a fact.
- 20 313 Q. And that was the only treatment that you were aware of
- 21 provided to him in 2016?
- A. Yes, yes.
- 23 314 Q. So you mentioned in an earlier answer that if a person
- has a complaint, he is in a position to freely to talk
- 25 to the CMO and make no foundations of any complaint he
- 26 wishes to make?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 315 Q. Would you agree with me, also in that note there isn't
- any reference to the work related stress, in terms of

- the details of it or the alleged causes of it?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 316 Q. Could I ask you then please to be furnished with one
- 4 further piece of documentation, which is page 9722,
- 5 please?
- 6 A. Yes, I have it open now.
- 7 317 Q. Sorry, Chairman.
- 8 CHAIRMAN: That's all right.
- 9 318 Q. MR. MURPHY: Perhaps I will return to that in a moment.
- 10 Can I ask you instead to be shown 6171, please. I
- 11 wonder if we could scroll up the top of that, please.
- 12 The very top.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 319 Q. This is a document that Mr. McGuinness took you through
- 15 yesterday, you're familiar with this?

12:49

12 · 49

12:47

12 · 48

- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 320 Q. I wonder can you scroll down please, registrar, to the
- second page?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 321 Q. And further down again, please?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 322 Q. Down to the next page?
- 23 CHAIRMAN: what is the paragraph.
- MR. MURPHY: It begins "Garda Keogh has never
- intimated".
- 26 CHAIRMAN: Yes, it's is the second last paragraph.
- 27 323 Q. MR. MURPHY: The second last paragraph, thank you very
- 28 much. I think the position here is that it's intimated
- in the course of the letter:

Т				
2			"Garda Keogh has never intimated that there were any	
3			incidents which occurred in the workplace in Athlone	
4			Garda Station which were causing his alleged work	
5			related stress."	12:49
6				
7			Is that correct?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	324	Q.	It goes on to say:	
10				12:50
11			"Garda Keogh has never made any report which warranted	
12			investigation in accordance with the Garda Síochána	
13			grievance procedures or the Garda policy for dealing	
14			with harassment, sexual harassment and bullying in the	
15			workpl ace. "	12:50
16				
17			Is that correct?	
18		Α.	At that time, yes.	
19	325	Q.	It goes on to say:	
20				12:50
21			"Indeed, all possible supports to facilitate a return	
22			to work by Garda Keogh have been put in place by the	
23			district management team in Athlone and his welfare has	
24			been prioritised through ongoing enquiries to ensure	
25			the member is aware and availing of the employee	12:50
26			assi stance servi ce. "	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	326	Q.	Is that correct also?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

Т	32/	Q.	Just in terms of your approach towards Garda Reogn S	
2			welfare, is it your evidence that you did seek to care	
3			for his welfare and to ensure that he was given all	
4			necessary supports when you became aware of his	
5			difficulties?	12:50
6		Α.	Absolutely, yes.	
7	328	Q.	In terms of the position that the CMO came to	
8			ultimately, is it the case that ultimately the CMO came	
9			to the view that the clinical basis was his concerns in	
10			relation to Garda Keogh and his absences, was his long	12:51
11			standing and established condition, which was alcohol	
12			dependency?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	329	Q.	Was it his recommendation in light of that assessment	
15			that the treatment for that was alcohol addiction	12:51
16			treatment?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18			CHAIRMAN: He can tell us that when he comes.	
19			MR. MURPHY: Yes.	
20	330	Q.	So again, just to assist the Chairman to understand the	12:51
21			position, in this triangular process which you have	
22			described, was it the case that the search by the CMO	
23			and by management was to identify what was the cause of	
24			the difficulty and was it an injury caused in the	
25			workplace?	12:51
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	331	Q.	In terms of your overall stewardship, it has been	
28			suggested that you failed to protect Garda Keogh's	
29			entitlement to full pay. Do you reject that	

1			allegation?	
2		Α.	I reject that completely. I mean, I don't know what	
3			more I could have done in this case.	
4	332	Q.	Just in the same document, if I could ask you to look	
5			down to page 6170. There it is said that:	12:52
6				
7			"Despite a number of enquiries with Garda Keogh to	
8			establish the source of his alleged work related	
9			stress, the member has continually correlated his	
10			involvement as a confidential reporter to his absence	12:52
11			through alleged work related stress."	
12				
13			Does that marry with what you said to us earlier on?	
14		Α.	Yes, yes.	
15	333	Q.	Again, I wonder can you be shown, please, page 3790.	12:52
16			These again are the CMO's notes from May of 2015.	
17			These should be read by the Chairman ultimately in	
18			conjunction with notes from December 2015, is that	
19			correct?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:53
21	334	Q.	I wonder if you can be shown, please, 3791. Again, did	
22			you see those notes in 2015 or did you only see them	
23			more recently?	
24		Α.	No. No, I didn't.	
25	335	Q.	And just very briefly, I think in the course of this	12:53
26			report itself, there's a reference about five lines	
27			down to Xanax and alcohol being taken by Garda Keogh in	
28			July 2015, do you see that?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

1	336	Q.	Can I ask you to go two lines further down.	
2			Dr. Oghuvbu recorded:	
3				
4			"Garda Keogh said he was stressed by difficulties with	
5			his senior manager."	12:53
6				
7			Do you see that?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	337	Q.	Does that confirm your view that the member was free to	
10			speak to the CMO if he wished to?	12:54
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	338	Q.	And this is information which on this occasion was	
13			before him?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	339	Q.	Is that right?	12:54
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	340	Q.	And finally, chief superintendent, can I ask you just	
18			to comment on the suggestion that has been put, that	
19			you somehow failed to carry out your duties in relation	
20			to Garda Keogh. Can I ask you to indicate to the	12:54
21			Chairman, did you by any act or omission on your part	
22			intend to target, harass or discredit Garda Keogh?	
23		Α.	I absolutely did not. I completely reject it. I think	
24			the evidence shows that any at every stage we	
25			signposted him to the supports that he needed. Indeed,	12:55
26			when I went to visit him, you know, I contacted the	
27			doctor because I was so concerned about him. He was	
28			put in the right direction at every stage, he was	
29			nrovided with welfare support along the way. I	

1			absolutely reject it in the strongest terms. I was	
2			concerned about Garda Keogh. We didn't put any	
3			barriers, there was no interference in place there. I	
4			carried out my duty, like I do for all my members. And	
5			I reject absolutely that I targeted and discredited	12:55
6			Garda Keogh. I did not.	
7	341	Q.	In overall terms, having reviewed the file and dealt	
8			with Superintendent Murray, did you find anything in	
9			his actions which in your view amounted to targeting or	
10			harassing of Garda Keogh?	12:55
11		Α.	No, I didn't.	
12			MR. MURPHY: Thank you.	
13				
14			END OF EXAMINATION.	
15				12:55
16			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Now, Mr. McGuinness, have you	
17			anything?	
18			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
19				
20			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY WAS RE-EXAMINED	12:55
21			BY MR. McGUINNESS, AS FOLLOWS:	
22				
23	342	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Chief superintendent, yesterday you	
24			referred to a document which you read. Could I ask you	
25			to look at Volume 41, page 11797? That appears to be	12:56
26			headed at the top an instruction sent out by e-mail on	
27			30th May 2018.	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	343	Q.	It's going to a wide variety of people. If we scroll	

1			down then, it's an instruction to each divisional	
2			officer regarding the issuing of an 11.37 certificate,	
3			isn't that correct?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	344	Q.	Then if we go on to the second next page, 11799, that	12:56
6			is the instruction. The first sentence reflects what	
7			is already in the directive 139/10?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	345	Q.	You are meant to investigate the stress, isn't that	
10			correct?	12:57
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	346	Q.	The second paragraph requires you to report it upwards	
13			in the same manner. Then, the third paragraph provides	
14			that the head of the HR can seek the advices of the	
15			CMO. In this case, just relating it to what occurred,	12:57
16			Superintendent Murray referred it up on the basis of an	
17			instruction given by Mr. Mulligan of HR, which was	
18			conveyed to you to reported it in the way provided by	
19			the Code; isn't that correct?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:58
21	347	Q.	And as part of that, Sergeant Moylan gave evidence on	
22			Friday, at page 60 of Day 131, perhaps we will just	
23			look at that, that he was instructed to bring it to the	
24			attention of Garda Keogh, four different matters as set	
25			out in the instruction. I am not sure whether you were	12:58
26			there for Sergeant Moylan's evidence, but if we go to	
27			page 60, starting at the top, it's Sergeant Moylan's	
28			report upwards as to what he had done on the 4th May in	
29			relation to Garda Keogh. If we see there, if we go	

Т			down the text, four lines down from that, it says:	
2				
3			"Garda Keogh was aware that it was referred to the CMO	
4			to determine his medical fitness for policing duty.	
5			Garda Keogh has been advised to forward all relevant	12:59
6			medical reports on or prior to the review date. He	
7			indicates that he may have a report with him on the day	
8			as he is due to see his GP this week. He was also made	
9			aware that these reports will be treated in the	
10			strictest confidence. In relation to other non-medical	12:59
11			issues, Garda Keogh states that he may wish to discuss	
12			this with the Chief Medical Officer in person."	
13				
14			Now, obviously you were aware from Superintendent	
15			Murray's report to you, which complied with your	12:59
16			instruction to compile all the necessary documentation,	
17			that the referral form was sent to the CMO by	
18			Superintendent Murray, filled out by him on the 2nd	
19			April, isn't that correct?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:59
21	348	Q.	That contained within it a body of documents to be	
22			found at page 6146 to 6160. We don't need to see them	
23			but they included the member's own doctor's	
24			certificates?	
25		Α.	Yes, they would have.	12:59
26	349	Q.	Relating to work related stress, isn't that correct?	
27		Α.	Yes, yes.	
28	350	Q.	You yourself had been aware from Superintendent	
29			Murray's original reports the other report of the 2nd	

- 1 May, of the member's reference to stress?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 351 Q. Isn't that right? So did you believe that you were
- 4 acting in accordance with the provisions of 139/10 in
- 5 referring him and allowing the referral to the CMO?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 352 Q. It would appear that Garda Keogh did raise the issue of

13:00

13:01

13:01

- 8 stress in some way, shape or form with the CMO, isn't
- 9 that correct, from the report that you have seen there?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 353 Q. Would you expect to see a report issued to you if the
- member is deemed fit for duty and comes back on duty,
- from the CMO? Would you expect to see such a report?
- 14 A. Yes, you would, yeah. Yeah.
- 15 354 Q. Now, just in terms of the effect on pay. If Garda
- 16 Keogh is appearing for duty and as such he performs
- 17 duty, he gets paid in the normal away?
- 18 A. That's right, yeah.
- 19 355 Q. If he is absent from duty through ordinary illness in
- accordance with the system, if the illnesses clock up
- to a certain amount, he is then subject to a reduction?
- 22 A. That's right, yeah.
- 23 356 Q. In terms of the effect of any decision that you made as
- regard his pay, that would ultimately depend on whether
- he had been, on the advice of the Chief Medical
- 26 Officer, found to be suffering from work related
- 27 stress?
- 28 A. Well, I wouldn't --
- 29 357 Q. You couldn't certify it either under the old system --

1 Α. No. 2 358 -- or the new system --Q. 3 Α. No. -- unless you had been so advised, is that not correct? 4 359 Ο. 5 Α. 13:02 In terms of decision-making, it is clearly a decision 6 360 Q. assigned to a divisional officer, albeit subject to the 7 8 outcome of investigations and subject to the proffering of advice, isn't that correct? 9 10 Yes. Α. 13:02 11 361 Q. Mr. Murphy referred you to 139/10. If we just go back 12 to page 3221, there's a reference there to that 13 paragraph: 14 15 "A marginal note should be made at Code 11.34(2)." 13:02 16 17 He put that paragraph to you. But that only deals with 18 where a member is resuming duty after a period of 19 sickness absence and his GP certifies him for 20 restricted or light duties; isn't that correct? 13:03 21 Yes. Α. 22 That had no application in this particular case at any 362 0. 23 stage; isn't that correct? 24 Yes. Α. I mean, all of Dr. Bartlett's certificates certified 25 363 Ο. 13:03 absence from work due to work related stress for 26 27 specified periods and was unconditional then, isn't that direct? 28

29

Α.

Yeah, like I suppose even when Garda Keogh was reviewed

1			by the CMO the last time, he qualified that at that	
2			time he was unfit for duty, but, indeed, if his doctor	
3			then deemed him fit for duty, that he wasn't that	
4			really he would have to reference back to the CMO for	
5			his determination.	13:03
6			CHAIRMAN: But this seems to envisage, as	
7			Mr. McGuinness says, a situation where the GP says he	
8			is fit for duty and he returned, it is still subject to	
9			the CMO.	
10		Α.	Yes.	13:03
11			CHAIRMAN: Isn't that the point, Mr. Murphy? I think	
12			Mr. Murphy was just kind of giving a general view of	
13			the regulations as a whole, but this particular one	
14			does not have any relevance here.	
15		Α.	No, sorry, what I am saying here is	13:04
16			CHAIRMAN: And Dr. Bartlett's certificates are indeed	
17			retrospective.	
18			MR. MURPHY: That is agreed, Chairman. As you	
19			correctly identified, I made that point generally.	
20		Α.	Maybe to clarify this, I know what this means because	13:04
21			we have this a lot sometimes. A doctor might certify	
22			that people can't work nights.	
23	364	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sure.	
24		Α.	Or they can only work four hours a day.	
25	365	Q.	CHAIRMAN: of course.	13:04
26		Α.	I would say, well, the CMO has to approve that.	
27	366	Q.	CHAIRMAN: of course.	
28		Α.	You know, if his doctor said he can only do much, the	

CMO may have a different view.

29

- 1 367 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: In any event, Dr. Bartlett never
- 2 imposed sort of conditionality or a restriction on
- 3 duties?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 368 Q. Which is contemplated by this?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 369 Q. This has no application?
- 8 A. No application, yeah.
- 9 370 Q. In terms of the effect of any decision on pay,
- obviously you're not suggesting that the CMO makes a
- decision as to what pay category or classification for

13:05

13:05

- the purpose of pay affects any particular member, isn't
- 13 that correct?
- 14 A. Well, I suppose there's three categories; there's
- ordinary, critical and injury on duty. The CMO does
- make the determination that they are in that category.
- 17 But the HRM are the people who instruct Killarney on
- 18 what rate of pay. So that final piece of jigsaw is
- 19 with HRM. But clearly if the CMO says you're in any of
- those categories, you're paid accordingly.
- 21 371 Q. CHAIRMAN: He doesn't deal with the consequences of his
- 22 diagnosis?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 372 Q. CHAIRMAN: He deals with the diagnosis to the extent of
- 25 cause and causation?
- 26 373 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: And insofar as achieving full pay
- 27 status while suffering from related stress or it being
- regarded as an injury on duty, that is dependent on a
- certification by you at the end of the day for pay

1			purposes?	
2		Α.	I suppose HRM make the decision that you're in this	
3			space, you know what I mean, and	
4	374	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Ultimately it comes down to an 11.34?	
5		Α.	Yeah 11.37.	13:06
6	375	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Absent an 11.34, the pay remains reduced.	
7		Α.	Correct.	
8	376	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But when the process brings it back, it	
9			comes back to the chief superintendent writing an	
10			11.34?	13:06
11		Α.	11.37.	
12	377	Q.	CHAIRMAN: 11.37?	
13		Α.	11.37.	
14			CHAIRMAN: 11.37, I am sorry, there I go, yes, showing	
15			off and I'm wrong.	13:06
16	378	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: That is your function?	
17		Α.	I suppose it is relevant, that is the Code, the chief	
18			issues an 11.37. There can be times in situations	
19			where there is complications with stress and all that,	
20			that there might even be you know, it has to go	13:06
21			through a rigorous process before they finally say,	
22			yeah, we're happy enough up here, you know, we need	
23			this guy on he has been injured on duty, we're	
24			satisfied it's connected, issue the 11.37, it goes into	
25			the system and the pay is, you know, sorted.	13:06
26	379	Q.	Yes, but obviously from the point of view of timing	
27			now, Dr. Bartlett's first certificate relating to work	
28			related stress effectively started from the beginning	
29			of 2015. I am just anxious for your view on this: If	

1			an investigation had in fact been able to take place	
2			either at that period or shortly afterwards and if the	
3			CMO had been asked to report on the basis of whether	
4			there was work related stress being suffered, is it	
5			possible that Garda Keogh's return to full pay might	13:0
6			have been achieved at an earlier point in time?	
7		Α.	I don't think so. The key piece here is the injury,	
8			the clinical diagnosis. So the clinical diagnosis is	
9			the piece that whole thing turns on.	
10			MR. McGUINNESS: Thank you, chief superintendent.	13:0
11				
12			END OF EXAMINATION.	
13				
14			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thanks very much.	
15			MR. MURPHY: Chairman, can I ask one question? There	13:0
16			was a document I mislaid.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Certainly, sure.	
18				
19			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY WAS	
20			FURTHER-EXAMINED BY MR. MURPHY, AS FOLLOWS:	13:0
21				
22	380	Q.	MR. MURPHY: I wonder if you can be shown document	
23			9722, please?	
24			CHAIRMAN: And you did refer to it in fact.	
25			MR. MURPHY: I couldn't identify the reference, I'm	13:0
26			sorry.	
27			CHAIRMAN: Okay, Mr. Murphy, 9722.	
28	381	Q.	MR. MURPHY: This is a document from Dr. Oghuvbu of the	
29			21st July 2016. I just want to ask you, you have given	

1			evidence about 2016 and your ongoing awareness of what	
2			was happening to Garda Keogh. Just looking at	
3			paragraph 1, were you made aware by Dr. Oghuvbu at that	
4			stage that in his words:	
5				13:08
6			"The member has now accessed and commenced appropriate	
7			inpatient care for a long standing and clinical	
8			position which has been the clinical basis of his	
9			current absence."	
10		Α.	Yes.	13:08
11	382	Q.	Thank you.	
12				
13			END OF EXAMINATION.	
14				
15			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thanks very much, chief	13:08
16			superintendent, you're finished now. Thank you. All	
17			right. Very good, 2:10.	
18				
19			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED, AS	
20			FOLLOWS:	13:08
21				
22	383	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Good afternoon Chairman, the next witness	
23			is Inspector Brian Downey, please.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
25				14:11
26			INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	
27			DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH, AS FOLLOWS:	
28				
29			THE WITNESS: Inspector Brian Downey, Balbriggan Garda	

Т			station.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
3	384	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Inspector, as you just said, you're	
4			currently attached to Balbriggan Garda station, is that	
5			right?	14:12
6		Α.	That's correct, yeah.	
7	385	Q.	However, you were previously attached to Garda Human	
8			Resource Management, which we have been calling HRM, is	
9			that right?	
10		Α.	That's correct.	14:12
11	386	Q.	In particular, this is at Garda Headquarters level, you	
12			were attached to HRM from June 2014 until January 2017,	
13			is that right?	
14		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
15	387	Q.	Now, can I just ask you, we have come across the	14:12
16			references to HRM and HRPD, can you tell the Chairman	
17			what the connection is between those two acronyms. Is	
18			it the same unit we're talking about?	
19		Α.	HRPD is the human resource and personal development	
20			umbrella section of HRM. It also encapsulates the HR	14:12
21			directorate, which is in Navan, and half of the HR	
22			functions were transferred over to Navan a couple of	
23			years before me taking up duty there and the remaining	
24			functions are in HRM in Garda Headquarters. I was	
25			attached to HRM in Garda Headquarters.	14:12
26	388	Q.	Just to summarise, under HRM you have HRPD and, for	
27			example, I think you reference as well Garda employee	
28			relations office, is that under HRM as well?	
29		Α.	Yeah, the Garda employee relations office is actually	

1 the office formerly known as C&A, which I was in charge 2 of, which was conciliation and arbitration. Okay. Just one final question, you're really helping 3 389 Q. us in relation to this, the Garda employee assistance 4 5 services? 14:13 6 Yes. Α. They also come under that umbrella, do they? 7 390 Q. 8 Under HRM, yes. Α. When you were at HRM, you say in your statement you 9 391 Q. were responsible for the Garda conciliation and 10 14 · 13 arbitration office? 11 12 Yes. Α. 13 What's that, inspector? 392 Q. 14 Α. It's the section that deals with pay talks and the 15 representative associations, the Garda Representative 14:13 16 Association and the Association of Garda Sergeants and 17 Inspectors, the Garda Superintendents Association and Garda Chief Superintendents Association, and we work 18 19 with the Department of Justice and Department of Public 20 Expenditure and Reform in relation to conciliation 14:14 council and, you know, coming out of that, claims going 21 22 forward and agreed reports, and we manage the agreed 23 reports on behalf of the organisation. 24 would you say you have got very good experience then 393 Q. 25 with employee relations issues or industrial relations 14 · 14 issue really? 26 27 Yes. Α. 28 would that be part of your remit? 394 Q.

29

Α.

Yes.

Т	395	Q.	Okay. Now, I think that you say also in your statement	
2			that while you were attached to C&A, which you have	
3			been calling it, that is the Conciliation and	
4			Arbitration office, you would have attended a number of	
5			case conferences on behalf of the superintendent in	14:14
6			HRM; is that right?	
7		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
8	396	Q.	Okay. In particular, I would like to ask you about one	
9			particular case conference that you attended in respect	
10			of Garda Keogh and the minutes of that conference are	14:14
11			at page 6165. This is a case conference on 9th	
12			December 2015. Do you remember that case conference,	
13			inspector?	
14		Α.	I remember the case conference, yes.	
15	397	Q.	The minutes will come up on the screen there, 6165.	14:15
16			Now, can I ask you there, in relation to these minutes,	
17			looking at them there, do you have any recollection,	
18			inspector, as to who might have drawn up these minutes?	
19		Α.	The sickness absence section were responsible for	
20			running the conference, so it was Sickness Absence	14:15
21			Section and they're based in, as we call it, the Human	
22			Resources directorate section in Navan, under the remit	
23			of Ms. Monica Carr.	
24	398	Q.	So do you know there, look at the attendees?	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:15
26	399	Q.	Could you identify maybe if any of those attendees	
27			might have prepared these minutes? It's just it's not	
28			in our disclosure documents?	

29

Α.

Em, I think it was Fiona O'Brien, who works in the

1			CMO's office, because the conference was run by the CMO	
2			but it's the Sickness Absence Section that would	
3			request a conference.	
4	400	Q.	Okay. Just looking at the attendees, taking that	
5			first, we have the CMO, Dr. Oghuvbu, is that right?	14:16
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	401	Q.	He's attached to Occupational Health, isn't that right?	
8		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
9	402	Q.	And then you have Superintendent Patrick Murray, and he	
10			would come under the local management branch, is that	14:16
11			right?	
12		Α.	Correct.	
13	403	Q.	You have superintendent Declan Mulcahy, and he was	
14			there in his capacity of his involvement in the Galway	
15			investigation, is that right?	14:16
16		Α.	Correct.	
17	404	Q.	Okay. You have HEO Clare Bryan, is it?	
18		Α.	That's correct.	
19	405	Q.	She is HRPD, is that right?	
20		Α.	Yes. She is from the Sickness Absence Section in	14:16
21			Navan.	
22	406	Q.	Okay. Yourself and then you have the employee	
23			assistance officer, Mick Quinn and then as you say, you	
24			have Fiona O'Brien, again, she is occupational health	
25			effectively?	14:17
26		Α.	She is occupational health, so I would imagine she	
27			would have drafted up the minutes	

28 407 Q.

29

I just want to ask you a couple of questions about the

minute. If we look at the first column there, HRPD:

1				
2			"Observations and actions.	
3				
4			With regard to volume of sickness absence, member is	
5			going on to TRR rate of pay in each absence."	14:17
6				
7			Could you tell the Chairman your recollection of the	
8			discussion surrounding that particular issue?	
9		Α.	My understanding is that this conference was called and	
10			the whole thrust of the conference was actually the	14:17
11			welfare of the individual member, Garda Nicholas Keogh,	
12			and the fact that he was now gone on TRR, which is	
13			temporary rehabilitation rate of pay or formerly	
14			pension rate of pay, which kicks in after a person has	
15			exhausted their sickness absence pay, the ordinary	14:17
16			illness sickness absence, which is 92 days, and	
17			followed by further 13 weeks on half pay, and then the	
18			TRR kicks in under the revised sickness regulations	
19			that were introduced by the Department of Public	
20			Expenditure and Reform in 2014. So that's what TRR is.	14:18
21	408	Q.	Okay. Now, it says that the member is going on to TRR	
22			rate of pay in each absence. And I think in your	
23			statement, just to read out what you said in your	
24			statement:	
25				14:18
26			"The issues presented at the case conference related to	
27			the number of sick days taken by Garda Nicholas Keogh	
28			and the fact that he was on temporary rehabilitation	
29			rate (TRR) of pay each time he goes sick."	

1	
ı	

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

Now, there was an issue which arose as to whether therefore the recording of his pay came up as an issue at this case conference or how he was being recorded as being out sick. Is it your recollection that that issue came up there that's recorded in the first column? Are you happy that that was discussed and the issue of ordinary illness --

14:18

14 · 19

14:19

14:19

14:19

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Α.

I actually can't recall it coming up in relation to the discussion, as to how his pay was captured. I do know from the introduction of the Sickness Absence regulations in March 2014, the Garda Síochána were impacted more than most other agencies, in that we didn't have a four year look back when the regulations came in, which meant that anybody who had previous sickness absence could immediately have gone on TRR rate of pay if they had already exhausted the sickness pay at full pay and half pay within the four year look back. Most other departments that were subject to the regulations or agencies subject to the regulations already had a four year look back, so their employees were used to it. It was a whole new venture for An Garda Síochána, we didn't have it before.

23

24

25

409

Q.

But I think just in relation to your statement, you say that:

26

27

28

"It was mentioned the fact that he was on TRR rate of pay every time he goes sick."

29

1 Again just to confirm clearly to the Chairman what was 2 being discussed here, was it being discussed that he 3 was on a reduced rate of pay and was there a reference to ordinary illness in that regard? 4 5 Well, I knew he was on a reduced rate of pay and it was 14:20 Α. discussed that he was on TRR. 6 7 410 Okay. Q. 8 But as to how it was captured locally, I don't know. Α. Or as to what it was called in the SAMS. 9 411 CHAI RMAN: Q. Yeah, it would be just ordinary illness. 10 Α. 14 . 20 11 412 CHAI RMAN: Does that mean it had to be ordinary Q. 12 illness -- sorry, everything was ordinary illness 13 unless it wasn't? 14 Α. Yeah. 15 CHAI RMAN: Isn't that right? 413 Q. 14:20 16 That's right. Α. 17 414 CHAI RMAN: Everything is ordinary? Q. 18 Everything is ordinary illness. Α. Unless it isn't? 19 415 CHAI RMAN: Q. 20 Yes. Α. 14:20 So it would have been assumed that it was 21 416 CHAI RMAN: Q. 22 ordinary illness in SAMS, is that right? 23 Correct, Chairman. Α. 24 CHAI RMAN: Right, okay. Because otherwise TRR doesn't even come 25 417 Q. MS. McGRATH: 14 . 20 26 into the picture if someone is on injury and duty or

occupational injury; is that right?

27

28

29

418

Α.

Q.

Yes.

Okay. Now, can I ask you then in relation to the next

Т			corumn, occupational hearth observations and actions?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	419	Q.	As we said there, occupational health, the members	
4			attending from Occupational Health was the CMO and	
5			Ms. Fiona O'Brien, is that right?	14:21
6		Α.	That's correct.	
7	420	Q.	Can we take it that the observations in this column, if	
8			we can stay on that page, sorry, Mr. Kavanagh, that the	
9			observations in this column come from those	
10			individuals, is that right?	14:21
11		Α.	Correct.	
12	421	Q.	The Chairman has seen this before:	
13				
14			"The member's condition appears to have taken a turn	
15			for the worst, which was not apparent at the time of	14:21
16			the CMO's last review of him on 19th May 2015. It is	
17			necessary that the member engage with support services	
18			offered to him. The member should be booked into a	
19			treatment facility to help him rehabilitate."	
20				14:21
21			Again, only to the best of your recollection, are those	
22			comments coming from Dr. Oghuvbu at that meeting, do	
23			you know?	
24		Α.	As far as I can remember, yes.	
25	422	Q.	Okay. And again:	14:22
26				
27			"An early appointment for review at the OHS to arranged	
28			and communicated to HRPD today."	
29				

1			I think that appointment is at the bottom there, 18th	
2			December 2015. Again, are you happy from your	
3			recollection, did that comment come from the CMO at the	
4			meeting?	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:22
6	423	Q.	Finally, it says:	
7				
8			"Management to inform Garda Keogh of his early	
9			appointment for review at the OHS, impress the	
10			importance to the member of keeping his review	14:22
11			appointment and fully engage with the necessary	
12			processes to prioritise his recovery and the aim of	
13			retaining his employment."	
14				
15			Again, was that Dr. Oghuvbu there, to your	14:22
16			recollection?	
17		Α.	That he was informed by local management?	
18	424	Q.	That management were to inform him.	
19		Α.	I'm not too sure now, I think it might have been	
20			Superintendent Murray who said that we would have	14:22
21			inform the member of his appointment. But he would	
22			have been written directly by the Occupational Health	
23			Service as well. The answer is that I'm not too sure.	
24	425	Q.	Okay. As you say, the theme, you may not have used the	
25			word theme but I am taking it from what you said at the	14:23
26			outset that the theme of this was a support type	
27			meeting?	
28		Α.	Correct.	
29	426	0	This is reflected there in that second column is that	

1			right?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	427	Q.	Now, just in the third column there, just the reference	
4			to local management observations and actions, when we	
5			went through the attendees, the only attendee for local	14:23
6			management was Superintendent Patrick Murray, is that	
7			right?	
8		Α.	That's correct.	
9	428	Q.	If we just look at the first paragraph:	
10				14:23
11			"Management relaying that there are serious concerns	
12			over the member's obvious misuse of alcohol which is	
13			adversely affecting his ability to do his job and his	
14			physical presentation. High level of short term	
15			si ckness/absences on record."	14:23
16				
17			Now, is it your recollection and again to the best of	
18			your recollection, is that something that was said by	
19			Superintendent Murray at the meeting?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:23
21	429	Q.	Okay. Now, we have an EAS officer observation and	
22			again, I would take this is the welfare officer, Garda	
23			Quinn, is that right?	
24		Α.	That's correct.	
25	430	Q.	"The member needs to decide himself that he needs help	14:24
26			and make a concerted effort to access service to	
27			address the issue."	
28				
29			Is that right?	

Т		Α.	mat's correct.	
2	431	Q.	What I want to ask you about is the last paragraph	
3			here. It says:	
4				
5			"Management suggesting in the medium to long-term	14:24
6			support would be given for a transfer out of Athlone in	
7			view of the events that had transpired there."	
8				
9			Now, can I ask you just well, I will continue it	
10			actually and then I will ask you some questions about	14:24
11			the whole paragraph.	
12				
13			"In view of the events that had transpired there, if it	
14			is considered to be beneficial for the member's	
15			sustained wellbeing and effectiveness after he would	14:24
16			have come through an appropriate treatment programme."	
17				
18			Can I ask you about this, it says "management	
19			suggesting" so again, we may take it from the attendees	
20			it appears to be Superintendent Patrick Murray, would	14:24
21			that be in accordance with your recollection	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	432	Q.	Okay.	
24		Α.	My role in that would be one of the sections under HRM	
25			and I was representing the chief superintendent, who	14:24
26			was absent at the time, at this meeting, was we were	
27			responsible for transfer section. So we could	
28			facilitate the transfer subject to management	
29			requesting it, the doctor recommending it and also that	

1			the member himself agreed to it. We would never	
2			transfer somebody without the agreement of the member.	
3			But it was discussed, and I remember distinctly that	
4			Dr. Oghuvbu had said at this particular juncture, at	
5			this particular point in time he wasn't ready to make	14:25
6			that determination, that it was in the best interests	
7			of the member to transfer and he would do so at a later	
8			point because he was going to meet him shortly. And	
9			once that happened, I had no further action with	
10			regards to transferring him or arranging a transfer or	14:25
11			initiating that process.	
12	433	Q.	Well, what I really would like you to clarify,	
13			inspector, is, it's certainly from the note suggests	
14			that it was local management who brought up the issue	
15			of a transfer out of out Athlone, and it's not in any	14:25
16			other column. Can you confirm your recollection,	
17			whether or not the issue of transfer was brought up by	
18			Superintendent Murray at that meeting?	
19		Α.	I can confirm that the issue of transfer was brought	
20			up, but I cannot remember whether Superintendent Murray	14:26
21			brought it up or somebody else.	
22	434	Q.	Okay. In that regard, can I just ask you to look at	
23			3097. Now, I will come back I just want to stay on	
24			this issue and I will come back to your statement, but	
25			if you can just look at page 3097, please. This is the	14:26
26			statement that Superintendent Patrick Murray gave to	
27			the Tribunal investigators. If you just go down,	

28

29

please, Mr. Kavanagh, to line 1366, please. Now this

is a discussion about this conference and if you see

1			there, starting with the word "regarding"?	
2		Α.	Yeah.	
3	435	Q.	"Regarding a transfer out of Athlone at the 9th	
4			December conference, there was a representation from	
5			HRM in attendance and afterwards the inspector of	14:26
6			HRM "	
7				
8			That's yourself?	
9		Α.	Yeah.	
10	436	Q.	"e-mailed me and others with his account of what	14:27
11			happened at the meeting, which referred to a transfer	
12			but have I no influence over transfers in any shape or	
13			form."	
14				
15			Now, that could be in plain English a reference to the	14:27
16			fact that the issue of transfer came up from you at the	
17			meeting. It says:	
18				
19			"There was a representation from HRM in attendance."	
20				14:27
21			Can you just confirm whether or not that's correct?	
22		Α.	Yeah, I was the representative from HRM, but I didn't	
23			bring up the area of transfer. I attended the meeting	
24			to see what could be facilitated and in a general	
25			discussion the issue of transfer came up. I can't	14:27
26			recall exactly who said it. I do know it came up.	
27			But, as I said earlier on, I distinctly remember	
28			Dr. Oghuvbu said I'm not prepared to push that at this	
29			time, I am actually due to see the member shortly.	

	43/	Q.	Now, when chief superintendent Murray was giving his	
2			evidence to the Tribunal on Day 125, at page 94, he was	
3			asked whether the suggestion of a transfer came from	
4			local management and he said no. Do you have any view	
5			on that or can you assist the Chairman whether that is	14:2
6			or is not the case?	
7		Α.	Chair, I can't recall exactly who said it.	
8	438	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Somehow it came up.	
9		Α.	It came up in the discussion. It could have been from	
10			HRPD or the Sickness Absence Section, it could have	14:2
11			been from the medical staff. I can't recall who	
12			brought it up but I do remember it coming up.	
13	439	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Okay. Can I take you back then to page	
14			11746 of the brief, which is the second page of your	
15			statement to the Tribunal. Now, you see there in the	14:2
16			second line:	
17				
18			"The issues presented at the case conference"	
19				
20			I have already opened this one.	14:2
21				
22			"related to the number of sick days taken by Garda	
23			Nicholas Keogh and the fact that he was on temporary	
24			rehabilitation (TRR) of pay each time he goes sick."	
25				14:2
26			You have given your evidence to the Chairman on that?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	440	Q.	"At the meeting a decision was made for Dr. Oghuvbu to	
29			liaise directly with the member's general practitioner	

Т			to work with him to access addiction treatment.	
2		Α.	Correct.	
3	441	Q.	I think you have given your evidence that this was a	
4			support type meeting, you said earlier.	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:29
6	442	Q.	"It was also decided that depending on the engagement	
7			with treatment services, a further case conference	
8			could be arranged in January or February 2016."	
9				
10		Α.	Yes.	14:29
11	443	Q.	"It was also agreed that a transfer to another division	
12			could be of assistance to the member but no decision	
13			was made on a transfer at this case conference."	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	444	Q.	And you go on to say:	14:29
16				
17			"While I attended this case conference, my role was to	
18			represent the superintendent HRM who, would be	
19			responsible for arranging transfers when and where	
20			necessary."	14:29
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	445	Q.	Can I just ask you to stop there. Is that why you were	
23			there effectively, because that sentence would seem to	
24			suggest that the reason you went or were asked to go	
25		Α.	Yeah.	14:29
26	446	Q.	was because transfer was going to come up at this	
27			meeting?	
28		Α.	That's correct.	
29	447	Ο.	How were you aware that transfer was going to be an	

Т			issue at this meeting?	
2		Α.	I was informed, I think I was informed that morning	
3			that, you know, there was going to be an issue in	
4			relation to transfer, there's a case conference on and	
5			can you go to the meeting.	14:30
6	448	Q.	Do you know who?	
7		Α.	Probably from the divisional office, which would be the	
8			chief's office in HRM. But I can't recall who it was.	
9	449	Q.	Okay. So this was flagged as an issue before the	
10			conference?	14:30
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	450	Q.	To you, in any event?	
13		Α.	Yes. That's the reason why I was there.	
14	451	Q.	Okay. But as you say, your recollection is unclear as	
15			to	14:30
16		Α.	Who requested it at the conference, no.	
17	452	Q.	Okay.	
18		Α.	Or who mentioned it. But I do recall that it was	
19			mentioned. There's no other reason for my section to	
20			be there. Sickness Absence Section and occupational	14:30
21			health are the lead sections in relation to sickness	
22			absence. It wouldn't our remit to get involved in	
23			sickness absence per se, unless there is a special	
24			reason or whatever, maybe the GRA making	
25			representations or AGSI or something like that, that's	14:31
26			when we would involved.	
27	453	Q.	Then you record at page 11747, which was an exhibit	
28			attached to your statement, this is the e-mail I think	
29			that you circulated to HRM administration	

		Α.	ies.	
2	454	Q.	on the day at 12:11, and you copied it to Chief	
3			Superintendent Anthony McLoughlin, Superintendent	
4			Murray, you have Clare Bryan, you have Detective	
5			Superintendent Mulcahy and Sinéad power?	14:31
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	455	Q.	Where is Sinéad Power attached to?	
8		Α.	There's only two inspectors at that time in HRM, Sinéad	
9			power and myself. Sinéad power was in charge of solely	
10			on transfers and also competitions, but Sinéad wasn't	14:31
11			available to go and I attended on behalf of	
12			superintendent. We were both controlled by the	
13			superintendent.	
14	456	Q.	Can I just ask there, it very much reflects what you	
15			have in your statement, but can I ask you about the	14:32
16			last sentence there, you say in the e-mail to these	
17			individuals:	
18				
19			"It may be the case that a transfer to another division	
20			or district may be of assistance to the member but this	14:32
21			will be looked at again following the next case	
22			conference. "	
23				
24			Can you tell me who made that decision at the meeting,	
25			do you remember?	14:32
26		Α.	I remember Dr. Oghuvbu, it came up should a transfer be	
27			considered and I remember Dr. Oghuvbu said that he	
28			wasn't prepared to actually put his name to that at	
29			that time. In other words, something similar to that,	

Т			because he was due to meet the member shortly or he	
2			would be liaising with the member's GP and, yes, that	
3			had to be determined. Sp it was going to be put back	
4			for another case conference and I didn't go to the next	
5			case conference.	14:32
6	457	Q.	That's what I was just about to ask you, I think the	
7			next case conference was 12th July 2016 and you're not	
8			recorded as an attendee?	
9		Α.	No.	
10	458	Q.	I think you didn't attend that case conference?	14:32
11		Α.	I didn't attend.	
12	459	Q.	Do you have any idea why, given that it seemed to have	
13			been suggested that the issue was being moved to July,	
14			do you have any idea why it fell away or why there was	
15			no delegate invited from HRM on the issue, on the	14:33
16			application.	
17		Α.	I know why I wasn't invited, I would say it is because	
18			we were involved in the Landsdown Road Agreement talks,	
19			which I was leading out on with the Garda	
20			Representative Association, my primary function, I	14:33
21			certainly wouldn't have been available to go to any	
22			case conference at that time.	
23	460	Q.	Before we leave, on the case conference notes that we	
24			saw there for the 9/12 and, as you note, the CMO was	
25			present. Can I ask you just to confirm to the	14:33
26			Chairman, was there any reference to the word stress or	
27			work related stress or any discussion around that at	
28			the conference to your recollection?	
29		Δ	T can't recall that coming up	

- 1 461 Q. Okay. It's not recorded in your e-mail, isn't that 2 right?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 462 Q. Now can I ask you, just a final issue I would ask you to deal with, Inspector Downey, is that the case

14:34

- 6 conference was in December 2015?
- 7 A. Yeah.
- 8 463 Q. Then the next case conference was in July 2016, but in
 9 the month before that, June 2016, you are involved in a
 10 series of e-mails in relation to this issue with work
 11 related stress and I just want to confirm that you are
- the Brian Downey that's on these e-mails?
- 13 A. That's me, yeah.
- 14 464 Q. Okay. These are been opened to the Chairman before
 15 Christmas certainly, but if I can ask if we can start
 16 at 9695, and we are going to work up the pages, as it
 17 were, just to follow the chronology?
- 18 A. Okay.
- There is an e-mail there 5th June 2016 at -- sorry,
 down at the bottom, it's 10:36. So this is 9695, if we 14:34
 go to the bottom there, 10:36. And this is an e-mail
 from Anthony McLoughlin and it's to Ms. Carr. Sorry,
- Mr. Kavanagh, if you just go back up a little bit,
- you're one of the recipients, isn't that right?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 466 Q. It's on the subject of work related stress. And on the
- 27 next page we see a discussion, and again the Chairman
- has seen that, I don't need to read it out, but it is a
- 29 discussion of the definitions of injury on duty and

T			occupational injury, and the manner in which I suppose	
2			work related stress is categorised and particularly, if	
3			you go down, where he says:	
4				
5			"I posed this question, the issue of reduced pay."	14:35
6				
7			And he says:	
8				
9			"These are sensitive cases."	
10				14:35
11			Etcetera. Okay?	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	467	Q.	So have you seen that e-mail in the documentation?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	468	Q.	As I say, you are one of the recipients of this and you	14:35
16			reply. So again, Mr. Kavanagh, if we can work up	
17			through the pages, back to 9695, you reply the next	
18			day, in the afternoon, do you recall this particular	
19			e-mail?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:36
21	469	Q.	To the chief superintendent. You say:	
22				
23			"The issue of work related stress was discussed as part	
24			of the injury on duty working group but it was decided	
25			not to include it as it was too complicated. That	14:36
26			said, it was recognised that work related stress was an	
27			issue in today's society and that it needed to be dealt	
28			with as a separate matter. From my recollection of the	
29			discussions, the causality of the work related stress	

was the crux of the issue."

2

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Can you tell the Chairman a little bit about this working group, we haven't really gotten to that part of the evidence in the Tribunal yet.

14:36

Okay, there was a working group established under the Α. CMO at the time, Dr. Donal Collins. He was chairing that group. So Dr. Oghuvbu was an occupational health physician in the Occupational Health section at that time, he wasn't the CMO. I was asked to go over to see 14:36 what we could do in terms of progressing this, because it was seeking it amend Code 11.37, to introduce an occupational health injury scheme. The background to that was that An Garda Síochána had ordinary illness and injury on duty, we didn't have an occupational injury scheme. And under the regulations in 2014, the regulations came out and reduced the amount of sick leave from 183 days to 92 for ordinary illness and another six months on half pay and then TRR. And that

14:37

14:37

14:37

was pre the regulations coming out. When the

regulations came out, they actually specified that these regulations do not interfere or prejudice any

previous occupational injury scheme. So we didn't have

one. And the other reason was that the injury on duty

tag had to be protected because when an event happens everybody runs away and policemen and women run towards

So we have to, we put ourselves in harm's way and

that is what the injury on duty scheme is for.

29 470 Okay. Q.

1		Α.	But there are other issues. If you slip or trip or	
2			fall off your chair in your office or go down the	
3			stairs, that's typically occupational injury and it	
4			should be categorised as that. So the group met to	
5			actually put in place and amend Code 11.37. That's	14:38
6			what the group was for. We were there, myself and a	
7			sergeant with me, who was working under my direction,	
8			to try and bring some experience with regards to the	
9			Code, the Garda Code in relation to 11.37, because one	
10			of our remits was to give advice on the Garda Code and	14:38
11			how it should be interpreted and if there was any	
12			conflict in relation to understanding the Code, we	
13			would go back to agreed reports that would have been	
14			the foundation for the Garda Code to be written in the	
15			first place. So that's why we were there.	14:38
16	471	Q.	Okay, so that's why you were there. Just looking at	
17			your e-mail there, you say:	
18				
19			"The issue of work related stress was discussed as part	
20			of the injury on duty working group."	14:38
21				
22			Can you assist the Chairman with the rest of the	
23			sentence:	
24				
25			"But it was decided not to include it as it was too	14:39
26			complicated."	
27		Α.	Yeah, we couldn't get agreement with regards to the	
28			work related stress. It was all linked to causality.	
29			What was the cause of the work related stress? And	

Τ			there was definitely an understanding that pre 2014 we	
2			had 183 days to investigate the causality of work	
3			related stress. This is now reduced to 92 days, which	
4			is only 13 weeks, for the chief to make a	
5			determination, to assign an inspector to investigate	14:39
6			it, to then go to the CMO and to have it all boxed off	
7			in 92 days, was quite a task in itself.	
8				
9			So it was sort of looked at, we're still going to have	
10			the problem of causality, whereas under the old system	14:39
11			we had 183 days to make that assessment. So with our	
12			time reduced, it was just going to be more difficult.	
13			But we still couldn't get over the problem of what was	
14			the cause of the work related stress. And it was	
15			highlighted at that meeting and agreed by everybody	14:39
16			that only the office of the CMO could make that	
17			determination.	
18	472	Q.	You say only the office of the CMO could make that	
19			determination. We have been hearing from Chief	
20			Superintendent Wheatley yesterday and today in relation	14:40
21			to the relationship between a certificate from the	
22			chief superintendent and the role of the CMO in that	
23			regard?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	473	Q.	But was it part of the injury on duty working group,	14:40
26			that you clearly saw it as CMO function?	
27		Α.	No. We're amending the 11.37. At the moment,	
28			currently, because that amendment didn't carry even	
29			though we had agreement with the GRA and AGSI in	

- principle, but I did my part and submitted it up and I 1 2 don't know where it went after that. 3 474 Q. Just to be clear, the Code has not been changed, the code is as we have seen on documents? 4 5 It is as we see it, 11.37 hasn't been changed. This is 14:40 Α. a draft document we're talking about, that is not 6 7 policy, it has never been signed off by executive of 8 the organisation and the working group was to draft the draft and present it up towards executive director 9 10 HRPD, which was John Barrett at the time, and after 14 · 41 11 that, my role was finished, once that was done. 12 CHAI RMAN: 475 Yes. Q. But the idea of introducing the amendment to the Code 13 Α. 14 was introducing an occupational injury scheme and an 15 injury on duty scheme. It was to separate the two. 14:41 16 CHAI RMAN: 476 Two separate schemes? Q. 17 Yes. Α. 18 CHAI RMAN: One for falling off chair if I was at work? 477 Q. 19 Yes. Α. And the other for getting shot if I was on 20 478 Q. CHAI RMAN: 14:41 21 duty? 22 Yes. Α. 23 479 Just back at your e-mail there: Q. MS. McGRATH: 24 25 "This said, it was recognised that work related stress 14 · 41
- 28 A. Yes.

26

27

29 480 Q. What did you mean by that?

be dealt with as a separate matter."

was an issue in today's society and that it needed to

1	Α.	Well, I think there was pulls and there was a	
2		difference of opinion, like any working group, you	
3		know, there was discussions between Sickness Absence	
4		Section, who were raising the issue of, you know,	
5		they're responsible, the HRPD in Navan were responsible	14:41
6		for processing pay as well. So there was an issue of,	
7		how do we actually recoup pay if we put them on halfway	
8		after three months, if we don't do that, what are the	
9		knock on effects for the organisation. So this working	
LO		group wasn't discussing any specific case, it was just	14:42
L1		looking at the policy. But there was still a	
L2		recognition that work related stress is a problem,	
L3		which you probably couldn't find a more stressful	
L4		environment that front line policing at times, you	
L5		know. So there had to be a recognition that we had to	14:42
L6		allow for that. But it was thought that it was best	
L7		looked at as a different measure at that time, because	
L8		it was very complicated, complex. Notwithstanding the	
L9		fact that the 92 days was a problem for us, trying to	
20		assess it in 92 days.	14:42
21	481 Q.	So when you say a separate matter, do you mean outside	

the injury on duty working group process? 22

Well, I did propose a solution, that it could be looked 23 Α. 24 at as occupational injury because it was working 25 But that's my proposal. Other people had 26 different ideas and different challenges that they had to face in their section. I think it's in an e-mail I 27 sent up further in relation to that. 28

14:42

29 482 Okay. We will go through those e-mails in a moment. Q.

1			But when you say that it needed to be dealt with as a	
2			separate matter, as you are saying, in the occupational	
3			injury context, I think that hasn't happened to date,	
4			is that right?	
5		Α.	It hasn't happened, no.	14:43
6	483	Q.	Okay. In your next paragraph you say:	
7				
8			"However, the fact that causality is an issue presents	
9			an opportunity to deal with each case on a case-by-case	
10			basis based on medical assessment."	14:43
11				
12			These are your own views, I think, isn't that right?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	484	Q.	"If a GP's diagnosis of work related stress is	
15			supported by the CMO, then I see no issue with	14:43
16			categorising the illness as occupational injury or	
17			injury illness on duty. This places the matter firmly	
18			in the hands of medical professional and also allows	
19			AGS to categorise work related stress with the	
20			causality medically assessed as work related, as	14:43
21			occupational injury or injury on duty."	
22				
23			So again, you're expressing a very clear position there	
24			that it is a combination of a GP and the CMO who would	
25			categorise an injury as work related stress or	14:43
26			occupational?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	485	Q.	Is that right?	
29		Α.	They the competent authorities to actually make that	

1	determination. Garda management as such, we do not
2	have that medical expertise and we shouldn't be
3	involved in actually saying that somebody is suffering
4	from work related stress because we can't determine the
5	causality or create the link medically.

14:44

14 · 44

14:44

14:45

14 · 45

6 486 Can I just ask you, inspector, and I fully accept that Q. at the case conference in December you say you were 7 8 coming in on a very specific issue, but when you were dealing with this issue in June, did you know or have 9 any recollection of, well, this issue is very similar 10 11 to what is happening in the Garda Keogh scenario, where 12 there are medical certificates from a GP certifying him 13 as out with work related stress? Did you know any of 14 Did that trigger any recollection or bell for 15 you?

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. Well, when I was working in the group that was there, I didn't know, you know -- I can't even recall that -- I remember going to the case conference it was Garda Keogh, but, you know, there were a number of people who had other issues, work related stress and stuff like that. That wasn't the reason I was there. The reason I was there was to actually amend policy and to advise on the Garda Code and what would have to happen to actually amend that Code. It was specific to any specific case.

26 487 Q. Did you know, in the e-mail there that I opened first
27 of all, the one at 10:36 the previous day, Chief
28 Superintendent McLoughlin is referring to Garda X and
29 Garda Y and I think Garda Y is Garda Keogh, did you

1			know that?	
2		Α.	No.	
3	488	Q.	Did you relate this e-mail interaction to any specific	
4			Garda?	
5		Α.	I think that was because at that time, I remember that	14:45
6			protected disclosure legislation was coming on the	
7			track as well, so we had that, and Chief Superintendent	
8			Tony McLoughlin was named as the protected disclosures	
9			manager, but that was complicated, it had to be	
10			confidential. So we would never know who was making a	14:46
11			protected disclosure or whether this case was a	
12			protected disclosure. It's only today that I realise	
13			you can link the two, but that's with hindsight, the	
14			benefit of hindsight. But at that time, no, I didn't	
15			know who they were.	14:46
16	489	Q.	Your e-mail is there is on the 5th June at 14:05. If	
17			we just go back to the previous page there,	
18			Mr. Kavanagh. That's your e-mail at 14:05 to Tony	
19			McLoughlin and then there is the response by the chief	
20			superintendent to you and he copies Mr. Barrett?	14:46
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	490	Q.	Again, it's all work related stress, so everyone is	
23			clear on what they are talking about?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	491	Q.	He says:	14:46
26				
27			"Thanks, Bri an."	
28				
29			And he says:	

Т				
2			"In my absence, could you bring this forward and get it	
3			discussed with JB, Monica, CMO, particularly in	
4			relation to two cases. These cannot wait for my return	
5			for a decision. Sergeant Malone in EAS will provide	14:46
6			the detail required."	
7				
8			So at that stage did you know that this was a Garda	
9			Keogh issue?	
10		Α.	I actually can't recall, you know. For me, I was on	14:46
11			the sickness absence working group to try and address	
12			this policy issue and that was my focus. I wasn't	
13			particularly linking it to any particular individual at	
14			the time.	
15	492	Q.	He goes on to say Kay:	14:47
16				
17			"I don't think there is any dispute over the reasons	
18			for absence from work."	
19				
20			Again, that seems to be case specific that he is	14:47
21			talking about. We will deal with this e-mail with the	
22			chief superintendent, but from yourself, again, it	
23			seems to be case specific in the answer he is giving	
24			down to you.	
25		Α.	I just can't recall it.	14:47
26	493	Q.	Okay. He says:	
27				
28			"But it is a big leap to categorise them as injury on	
29			duty. "	

Τ				
2			I think that's in accordance with your previous e-mail;	
3			is that right?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	494	Q.	And your evidence.	14:47
6				
7			"There should be another category such as occupational	
8			injury, which is in my view safer."	
9				
10			He says:	14:47
11				
12			"The key point here is that they should not be on	
13			reduced pay until it is proven that there wasn't a	
14			causal link between reason for absence and work related	
15			stress."	14:47
16				
17			Now, are you in agreement with that sentiment there	
18			that he has just expressed?	
19		Α.	I think the challenge for our organisation was the	
20			impact that the sickness regulations had on us in	14:48
21			reducing that time to actually make that determination.	
22			This was a government policy. We had to comply. And	
23			it placed an onus, responsibility on us to try and get	
24			this fast tracked and this is where the difficulty	
25			arose for the organisation.	14:48
26			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
27	495	Q.	MS. McGRATH: And he says:	
28				
29			"A change of mindset required here."	

1	

- And he is telling you this. Are you in agreement with that?
- A. I think he was concerned, you know, and in hindsight

 again, he was quite correct, in terms of the challenges 14:48
- 6 that he foresaw coming down the line. At that
- 7 particular time, you know, I certainly brought his
- 8 views back to the group. But, as I said, I wasn't
- 9 chairing that group, the CMO was, and there were other

14 · 49

14:49

14:49

14 · 49

- people around that table that had different views. I
- certainly expressed the views, but I wasn't going to
- win everybody over.
- 13 496 Q. He tells you that it's urgent and he is concerned that
- the issue will appear in the media or the Dáil and it
- would be better if we are ahead of the game. Now, as
- 16 you confirmed to the Chairman, changes were not made
- and have not been made?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 497 Q. Okay. You then reply the following day, well, you
- don't necessarily reply directly to him, but you send
- an e-mail the following day attaching that e-mail?
- 22 A. Okay.
- 23 498 Q. This is the 6th June 2016 at 11:03. This is your
- e-mail to Mr. Barrett, Donal Collins, he is the head of
- 25 the working group there that you mentioned, is that
- 26 right?
- 27 A. That's correct yeah.
- 28 499 Q. And Ms. Carr. And you copy a number of people there.
- 29 At that stage AC Ó Cualáin, Margaret Nugent, Clare

1			Malone, HRPD executive director and Tony McLoughlin?	
2		Α.	Correct.	
3	500	Q.	Again, you're attaching the e-mail from Chief	
4			Superintendent McLoughlin, which we've just looked at,	
5			and you are saying:	14:50
6				
7			"Having discussed this issue with Chief Superintendent	
8			McLoughlin, there is an opportunity to category work	
9			related stress under the proposed occupational injury	
10			scheme."	14:50
11				
12			And again, this is just repeating effectively the	
13			evidence that you have given to the Chairman?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	501	Q.	Isn't that right?	14:50
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	502	Q.	You're expressing the view that if you do that,	
18			effectively it's a breathing space to carry out the	
19			enquiry	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:50
21	503	Q.	as to causality. Okay. You say:	
22				
23			"I am of the view that the definition under the	
24			proposed amendment to the Garda Code 11.37(1) allows	
25			for the categorisation of work related stress as	14:50
26			occupational injury and the proposed definition states	
27			as follows."	
28				
29			You outline it there:	

Т				
2			"Occupational injury illness is an injury illness;	
3			1. That arises from any accident or incident that	
4			occurs in the workplace as a result of which any person	
5			carrying out any work suffers an injury or illness."	14:50
6				
7			So, you were satisfied that work related stress could	
8			come under that scheme?	
9		Α.	That was my opinion.	
10	504	Q.	Okay. Now, can I ask you, it is said there:	14:51
11				
12			"The attached document is the document agreed at the	
13			injury on duty working group on 24th May 2016."	
14				
15			Now, we have a copy of that document, you have kindly	14:51
16			provided it to us, it's at a different place in the	
17			brief, just so that the Chairman can see the document	
18			you are talking about in your evidence, and it's at	
19			15740. As you see there, it is marked draft?	
20		Α.	Yes.	14:51
21	505	Q.	So, as you said, that's the document that had been	
22			circulating?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	506	Q.	Okay. We mentioned there $1(1)$, which is the definition	
25			that you felt could capture work related stress. If	14:51
26			you look at (a) there, it is talking about a full	
27			report of the circumstances by the member. I think	
28			that's a summary of that provision effectively, is that	
29			right?	

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	507	Q.	At (c), if you look at (c):	
3				
4			"When considering the appropriateness or otherwise as	
5			to whether to issue a certificate (appendix A) the	14:52
6			divisional officer shall conduct preliminary enquiries	
7			into the matter and at his her discretion may appoint a	
8			member not below inspector rank to investigate the	
9			matter."	
10				14:52
11			Can we look at the certificate A, I'm not sure if the	
12			Chairman has seen these before, these are the	
13			certificates, it's at 15744 there, it's draft one	
14			you're talking about, 15744.	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:52
16	508	Q.	The first one is the one we're concerned about, if you	
17			just go back there a little bit please, Mr. Kavanagh.	
18			That says:	
19				
20			"Occupational injury/illness."	14:52
21				
22			This is the certificate that it was envisaged would be	
23			filled out by the chief superintendent.	
24		Α.	Chief superintendent, correct.	
25	509	Q.	Okay. So that's what they effectively look like. As	14:52
26			you say, that has remained the position, in the sense	
27			that it remains in draft form. Is it still under	
28			discussion, to your knowledge, or have you moved on?	
29		Α.	I have moved on from that section so	

1	510	Q.	Maybe Ms. Carr may be help us?	
2		Α.	She may be able to clarify.	
3	511	Q.	Going back to that e-mail of 9694, that is the e-mail	
4			of the 6th June, your e-mail there that you sent at	
5			11:03, there were a number of subsequent e-mails after	14:53
6			that to which you were the recipient, but I don't think	
7			you we don't have an e-mail where you were coming	
8			back yourself on the issues. I think you just	
9			effectively were recipient to several e-mails on the	
10			issue subsequently, is that right?	14:53
11		Α.	Some other people came back with different views.	
12	512	Q.	Okay?	
13		Α.	Again, this is still not this is still a draft	
14			policy document we're still talking about.	
15	513	Q.	Okay. And for example, the following day, on the 7th	14:53
16			June at 3:00pm, at 9693, which is just the previous	
17			page, Mr. Kavanagh, you will see, and again Ms. Carr	
18			can deal with this, she is addressing the e-mail to	
19			Mr. Barrett, yourself, Fiona Broderick. Am I right	
20			that Ms. Broderick is in the Commissioner's office?	14:54
21		Α.	Yes, she was the Commissioner's clerk.	
22	514	Q.	Okay. It says:	
23				
24			"Good afternoon, John.	
25				14:54
26			Further to Brian's e-mail"	
27				
28			And there is a discussion there of the issue	
29			effectively of the categorisation issues and the	

1			challenges facing the organisation in that regard, is	
2			that right?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	515	Q.	Again, Ms. Carr is probably the person who should deal	
5			with that and the subsequent e-mails and they can be	14:54
6			opened with her tomorrow, but you were marked as a	
7			recipient but you don't seem to have got back involved	
8			in the fray, as it were. There is no further e-mails	
9			with views from yourself, is that right?	
10		Α.	That's correct.	14:54
11	516	Q.	I think what subsequently happened and was discussed in	
12			those later e-mails was an issue of placing somebody,	
13			particularly in the context of protected disclosures	
14			and work related stress, placing them on administrative	
15			leave. Did you have any knowledge of that?	14:55
16		Α.	No.	
17	517	Q.	Or can you assist in relation to that?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	518	Q.	Okay. Inspector, could you answer any questions	
20			please?	14:55
21		Α.	Okay.	
22				
23			END OF EXAMINATION	
24				
25			INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS.	14:55
26			MULLIGAN, AS FOLLOWS:	
27				
28	519	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Good afternoon, inspector, I have one	
29			very brief question.	

1			CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms. Mulligan.	
2			MS. MULLIGAN: Subject to there being no issue with any	
3			other party that wants to go ahead.	
4			CHAIRMAN: No, I think it is probably better if you go.	
5			You appear for inspector Downey, is that right,	14:55
6			Mr. McGuinness, but if anything arises, then liberty to	
7			apply, Ms. Mulligan. So we will carry on this way.	
8	520	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Thank you, Chairman. Just one question	
9			in relation to page 3254, inspector. It's just in	
10			relation to the question of the application for	14:55
11			sickness. Just because you have obviously done quite a	
12			significant amount of work on this. Can you confirm to	
13			the Chairman who can make an application for work	
14			related stress to be an application for work related	
15			stress? If you don't know the answer that's fine, I	14:56
16			just thought I would ask.	
17		Α.	If a member reports sick with a work related stress	
18			aspect to it, it's my understanding that that's always	
19			reported to the CMO by Garda management.	
20	521	Q.	Thank you very much. No further questions.	14:56
21				
22			END OF EXAMINATION.	
23				
24			CHAIRMAN: Thanks. Hold on, yes, Mr. McGuinness.	
25			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: No questions, Chairman.	14:56
26			CHAIRMAN: No questions. Nobody has any questions.	
27			Thanks very much, inspector. Thank you for your	
28			assistance.	
29			MS. McGRATH: Thank you inspector.	

1				
2			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
3				
4			MS. McGRATH: Chairman, the next witness is Garda	
5			Michael Quinn, please.	14:56
6			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
7				
8			GARDA MICHAEL QUINN, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY	
9			EXAMINED BY COUNSEL, AS FOLLOWS:	
10				14:57
11			THE WITNESS: Garda Michael Quinn.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much, Garda Quinn.	
13	522	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Chairman, the statement of Garda Quinn is	
14			at page 3642 of the brief. Good afternoon, Garda	
15			Quinn.	14:57
16		Α.	Good afternoon.	
17	523	Q.	Now, Garda Quinn, just in relation to the section of	
18			the Gardaí that you're attached to, you say that you	
19			are a Garda employee assistance officer?	
20		Α.	That's right.	14:57
21	524	Q.	Is that effectively placing you under the umbrella	
22			there that we talked about with Inspector Downey,	
23			employee relations section of HRM?	
24		Α.	Yeah, that has changed. The umbrella we have been	
25			under has changed on a number of occasions. Up until	14:57
26			about, I couldn't say exactly, maybe five or six years	
27			ago, believe it or not, we were under Internal Affairs.	
28	525	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
29		Α.	So. I could be going to see somebody who could be	

1 suspended or being disciplined and they'd say, who is 2 your chief and I'd say chief so and so, and he would 3 say, well this is the chief who suspended me. changed it from one side of the house to the other 4 5 side. 14:58 6 526 CHAI RMAN: EAS. Q. 7 Yeah. Α. 8 527 CHAI RMAN: Is that the present one? Q. 9 Well, no, we are the EAS, Employee Assistance Service, Α. 10 but we are under HR, as distinct from IA, which is 14:58 11 Internal Affairs. They changed a number of years ago. 12 It is confusing. 13 To follow my pedantry for the initials, is 528 CHAI RMAN: Q. 14 it HRM or HR? 15 Well, I saw it referred to HRPD one of the days Α. 14:58 16 recently, it used to be HRM, before that it was B 17 branch. When I worked there it was B branch. I think 18 when somebody else changes the name --19 529 CHAI RMAN: So we can just call it HR, if you like, is Q. that right? 20 14:58 21 Yes. Α. 22 That's the safer way, HR, and under HR, one 530 CHAI RMAN: 0. of the division sections is EAS? 23 24 Yes. Α. 25 CHAI RMAN: Okay. 14:59 26 MS. McGRATH: You say there that a number of years ago 531 0. 27 you were initially under Internal Affairs, it is now 28 HR, we will be talking in a moment specifically about

29

when you came on line with Garda Keogh in 2015.

1			2015 do you remember was it under IA?	
2		Α.	No, it's under current side, the non-IA HR.	
3	532	Q.	Now, I think you have been working as a welfare officer	
4			since 8th December 2003 in EAS, is that right?	
5		Α.	Yeah, that's correct.	14:59
6	533	Q.	Okay. Just a little bit about this service. You're	
7			the first witness from EAS and will be the only	
8			witness, I would imagine. I think it's considered to	
9			be a confidential counselling service for members of An	
10			Garda Síochána, is that a correct way of describing it?	14:59
11		Α.	Not exactly. I would have it as confidential, but A,	
12			B, C, anything but counselling, because we're not	
13			counsellors. So encouraging people, suggesting to	
14			people, talking to people, but we're not counsellors.	
15	534	Q.	You say it's a confidential service, is that like a	15:00
16			doctor patient relationship?	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	535	Q.	I want to understand now in a moment what you can talk	
19			about to your superiors, what you can report. Can you	
20			just explain the confidentiality aspect of it to the	15:00
21			Chairman?	
22		Α.	Well, in order for me to build a bond with the person	
23			who may be deciding whether to deal with me or not, it	
24			is confidential. Anything, we'll say a number of	
25			years ago there was a divisional employee welfare	15:00
26			committee meeting and at the meeting a particular chief	
27			asked me was I dealing with a particular guard and I	
28			told him that I couldn't even tell him that, whether he	
29			was or he wasn't. He wasn't happy with my answer, so	

1			he checked with my then supervisor in the middle of the	
2			meeting. So it's that confidential. Now there are	
3			exceptions, you know, if somebody tells me they have	
4			committed a crime, or are about to commit a crime, self	
5			harm	15:01
6	536	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Urgency, self harm?	
7		Α.	Or consent.	
8	537	Q.	CHAIRMAN: A threat to life, something like that?	
9		Α.	Yeah.	
10	538	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The obvious ones?	15:01
11		Α.	Yeah, they're kind of standard, but they apply to us as	
12			well. So if somebody says to me well if a guard	
13			says to me, well, I stabbed somebody or I hit somebody	
14			or whatever, I have to kind of put my Garda hat back on	
15			again.	15:0
16	539	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Okay. we will come to that, we will	
17			drill down a little bit into that in a moment, about	
18			the contact you have with the members and what they	
19			tell you and what you can report. Can I just ask you	
20			first of all, who is effectively your superior officer?	15:0
21			Who do you report to?	
22		Α.	Sergeant Clare Malone and then above that is	
23			superintendent Della Murray.	
24	540	Q.	Della Murray, okay. I think you update your senior	
25			officer, and we are talking generally at the moment,	15:01
26			you update your senior with regard to the progress of a	
27			member or the contacts you have with a member, is that	
28			right?	
29		Α.	Em, normally it's only if there's something different	

Т			than the norm, you know. It the person is bad or	
2			distressed or I can't get them in their normal course	
3			of events, that kind of stuff, I might give a ring and	
4			say we have what we call technically supervision,	
5			where my sergeant would look at my client sheet, we	15:02
6			have a client sheet, I would take a few notes each day	
7			or each time I contact the member, if I get them, and	
8			say I got them or I didn't get them. So it should be	
9			maybe once every six months, my sergeant will look and	
10			have a quick read through it and say, well, you need to	15:02
11			contact him because he hasn't been in contact for six	
12			months, something like that.	
13	541	Q.	Again just generally, we talked about there when would	
14			you ever disclose the nature of a contact or something	
15			a member has said and you said there, for example,	15:03
16			where there was a reference to a crime being committed?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	542	Q.	Right.	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	543	Q.	Would there be again exceptions where somebody	15:03
21			expressed a serious illness or suicidal ideation, can	
22			you then escalate that up or disclose it?	
23		Α.	Well, I would normally discuss it with the sergeant or	
24			the superintendent. Not outside that remit.	
25	544	Q.	Okay. What about work related issues then?	15:03
26		Α.	well, in the course of to the sergeant and	
27			superintendent, I would and could discuss anything	
28			really. Outside that, not really. Maybe the CMO at an	
29			absolute exception. Apart from that, I wouldn't with	

- anybody.
- 2 545 Q. Okay. Now, just then going specifically to dealing
- with Garda Keogh. I think your involvement with him
- 4 commenced on the 21st April 2015, is that right?
- 5 A. As a long-term -- well, we didn't know it was long-term 15:03
- 6 then. I had on occasions spoke with him before. My
- 7 colleague who covered -- I don't cover Athlone, my
- 8 colleague who covered Athlone used to deal with him in
- 9 some capacity, I am not exactly sure. So when she was
- off and Nick had a problem, if you ring her number you

15:04

15.04

- got my number, so I would talk to him then. So there
- had been a low level, a very low level of contact, but
- 13 I had spoken to him before.
- 14 546 Q. So you knew of him?
- 15 A. I knew of him, yeah.
- 16 547 Q. But in the sense of being formally put in as his
- 17 welfare officer?
- 18 A. No, no, not until that, that was the day.
- 19 548 Q. That was the 21st April?
- 20 A. Well, it is actually the 22nd or 23rd, I just clarified 15:04
- with my sergeant because he wasn't technically in my
- 22 area. But yeah, the first contact.
- 23 549 Q. So he wasn't in your area. So was this a little bit
- unusual, that you were asked to deal with Garda Keogh?
- 25 A. Not really, no. Like, people have a choice. If
- somebody had served with me and they didn't like me or
- they didn't think they could get on with me, they could
- ring the sergeant and say, well, I know Mick a long
- time, we didn't get on, or vice versa.

- 1 550 Q. Okay.
- 2 A. There is that. You know, sometimes females might want
- to deal with a female, that's okay too, it's not too
- 4 unusual, not too unusual.
- 5 551 Q. Now, I think you say in your statement that all of this 15:05
- 6 came about because you got a phone call from a
- 7 colleague of yours, Garda Morgan Landy, I think he
- 8 works with you in EAS, is that right?
- 9 A. That's right.
- 10 552 Q. He told you that he had been contacted by Detective

15:05

15:05

15:06

- 11 Superintendent Declan Mulcahy, is that right?
- 12 A. That's right, yeah.
- 13 553 Q. As you say, this was something you had to clear with
- 14 your sergeant because --
- 15 A. Just because it wasn't my area.
- 16 554 Q. Okay. You were asked to contact Garda Keogh from a
- 17 welfare perspective. I think those are the words you
- use in your statement?
- 19 A. Yeah.
- 20 555 Q. Were you told anything about Garda Keogh? Were you
- 21 given any background, any context as to why this was
- 22 happening at that date in time?
- A. No, just to go back just one tiny bit slightly, we were
- known as the Garda welfare service, you know, but that
- changed to employee assistance. Well, I knew of Nick
- 26 from previously, so I would have -- I would have had an
- idea about, you know, his situation generally, at that
- 28 stage.
- 29 556 Q. And would you have known anything to the effect or been

1 told about -- you saw the contact came through 2 Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, who was at that time 3 involved in the protected disclosures investigation. Did you know any of this? 4 5 Α. No. 15:06 6 557 Were you told any context? 0. 7 Α. No. 8 558 Okay. Q. 9 Getting a call from a detective superintendent would be Α. 10 a bit more unusual than a informed inspector. 15:06 11 559 CHAI RMAN: Did you know him? Q. 12 I didn't, no. Α. 13 Did you know Detective Superintendent 560 CHAI RMAN: Q. 14 Mulcahy? 15 No. Α. 15:06 16 561 He presumably must have known you, or he CHAI RMAN: Ο. 17 must have known something about you, because apparently 18 he asked for you, is that right? Maybe not? 19 No, well Morgan was covering Cork and Kerry, so I was Α. 20 closer. 15:07 21 562 CHAI RMAN: Oh, I see what you mean. Q. 22 Something like that maybe. Α. 23 563 would it be the case, and specifically in MS. McGRATH: Q. 24 the case of Garda Keogh, would you have a point of 25 contact with senior management in the sense of 15:07 26 contacting or keeping anybody updated like Detective 27 Superintendent Mulcahy or going back to, for example, Chief Superintendent Wheatley? 28 29 No, our system is kind of unusual, once we get a Α.

1 referral I can get them from medical aid, from a union 2 rep, from a wife or a partner or a sergeant, and once 3 they refer the person to me, that's it. 564 4 Q. Okav. 5 Now, it really becomes confusing, there's a very --Α. 15:07 6 there is a policy called the EAP, which is the Employee 7 Assistance Programme, which is -- and supervisor can refer somebody to me if they're not deemed to be 8 performing. And in that case the superior, only if 9 10 it's under the Employee Assistance Programme, in that 15:08 11 case the sergeant can check and see did whoever contact 12 Otherwise, there's no me going back to them. 13 And to be clear, Garda Keogh did not come to you via 565 Q. the EAP? 14 15 No. Α. 15:08 16 566 All right. Now, I just want to ask you about Ο. 17 two separate areas of your evidence. I suppose you had 18 provided the notes that you kept with Garda Keogh? 19 Yes. Α. Those notes go up until this moment in time, you are 20 567 0. 15:08 still his welfare officer, is that right? 21 22 That's right. I suppose it's kind of unusual that my Α. 23 statement is 24 lines, but in actual fact there's 23 24 pages, so it's kind of... 25 CHAI RMAN: Yes. 15:08 26 568 MS. McGRATH: So you have your notes of those contacts. 0. 27 But what I want to ask you about, because I want to

conferences over your time with Garda Keogh.

28

29

deal with the note separately. You went to two case

Τ			9/12/2015 and one a couple of months later, on 12th	
2			July 2016, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	That's right.	
4	569	Q.	We might talk bout those separately, if you don't mind,	
5			Garda Quinn.	15:09
6		Α.	Okay.	
7	570	Q.	There is just a couple of questions about them. If we	
8			can look at the first one. You will have heard	
9			Inspector Downey looking at these earlier in his	
10			evidence. 9/12/2015, at 6165 of the book. Again, I	15:09
11			want to ask you just similar questions but to get your	
12			evidence on just two questions in particular. We have	
13			gone through first of all, Inspector Downey was of	
14			the belief that it was possibly Fiona O'Brien who	
15			prepared these minutes?	15:10
16		Α.	It was.	
17	571	Q.	It was, okay. Thank you for that. Now, in relation to	
18			the first column there, I was asking earlier about the	
19			content of that column:	
20				15:10
21			"With regard to volume of sickness absence, member is	
22			going on to TRR rate of pay in each absence."	
23				
24			Now, and I'm sorry to do this to Mr. Kavanagh, can I	
25			ask you, Mr. Kavanagh, to open up your statement, Garda	15:10
26			Quinn, at 3642. At 3642, you make reference to this	
27			case conference and about three quarters of the way	
28			down, if you can just flick down please, about six or	
29			seven lines from the end, you record in your statement:	

_
7
_

"There was some discussion as to how the member's sick absence was being recorded."

Can you just tell the Chairman what you meant by that 15:10 in your statement?

15:11

15:11

15:11

15:12

A. Yes. On the day, the reasoning behind the case conference was, you know, some absences and the fact that there would be TRR. But there was -- I can clearly remember that there was a discussion in relation to work related stress. Because the certs were coming in with work related stress on them but the doctor's record didn't state that. So there was some discussion as to -- and I suppose the key factor is, when people go sick with work related stress, the minute, the very day, whatever day, whether that is the

next day or a month later, there is supposed to be an investigation as to -- if somebody puts stress on a cert, the people in Sick Section are supposed to clarify whether it is work related or, we'll call it,

ordinary stress. So that is supposed to happen

immediately the certs are submitted.

Okay. On that day, the 9th December then, the discussion around this, if you can just tell the Chairman about the discussion around this, was there a discussion of work related stress and thereby medical certificates or thereby reduced pay? Can you tell the Chairman what you remember was the discussion

surrounding specifically Garda Keogh?

- I would remember it as a discussion as to how it was 1 Α. 2 recorded rather than discussing what work related stress actually is. From my memory they didn't 3 actually go into that. People know what it is. 4 But. 5 of course, nowadays there's a big problem, the 15:12 6 difference between people with an injury on duty is 7 that they get their full pay and all their allowances. 8 So if a member otherwise -- before the sick regulations changed it wasn't as big an issue, now it's -- if 9 people get an injury on duty it's perceived as very 10 15:13 11 different. The physical work related injuries are much
- 13 573 Q. CHAIRMAN: Obviously?

14 A. Yeah. And there aren't as many -- well, I won't say
15 there aren't as many, well, there probably aren't as many granted.
16 many happen and there probably aren't as many granted.

15:13

17 574 Q. CHAIRMAN: And they don't last as long, the injuries, 18 probably. Well, maybe not.

clearer than psychologically.

- 19 A. Yeah, I don't know, I'm not sure.
- 20 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, it doesn't matter.
- 21 575 Q. MS. McGRATH: Was it clear that day, was there a 22 discussion that Garda Keogh was pay affected?
- 23 A. Well, he would be. He would be, yeah.
- 24 576 Q. Was it discussed at the meeting?
- A. I wouldn't have a whole lot of discussion really. I 15:13 would have thought the main theme of the meeting -- to
- 27 me, the thing I remembered most was how the sick was
- being recorded, to me.
- 29 577 Q. Okay. Now, the theme of the meeting, I understand from

1			the evidence, was with regard to Garda Keogh's	
2			difficulties and the supports necessary for him, is	
3			that right?	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5	578	Q.	Now, you're recorded there under the local management	15:14
6			column, and sorry, we're going back to 6165. Please?	
7		Α.	Oh yeah.	
8	579	Q.	There's a reference to your contribution there. That	
9			is your contribution, is that right?	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:14
11	580	Q.	EAS officer observation?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	581	Q.	"The member needs to decide for himself that he needs	
14			help and make a concerted effort to access services to	
15			address the issue."	15:14
16		Α.	Yeah.	
17	582	Q.	Now, you had been dealing with him since the previous	
18			April, isn't that right?	
19		Α.	I am never of the opinion, ever, ever, ever, in	
20			relation to addiction, that somebody going for	15:14
21			treatment, unless it's their will, is a waste of time.	
22	583	Q.	Was that the view you expressed at that meeting?	
23		Α.	Yeah and it's still my view today, in relation to	
24			anybody. People who are going to you know, one	
25			person I dealt with, who was thankfully 13 years sober	15:15
26			on the 14th January, he said he went in twice, he went	
27			in the first time to save his job, he went in the	
28			second time to stop. So those, his words, resonate	
29			hugely for me. And anybody going in who isn't ready.	

Τ			you know, because there is a discipline inquiry coming	
2			up or because his wife is getting onto him, to me they	
3			are the wrong reasons. He must be ready.	
4	584	Q.	If the previous paragraph, at the top, you have local	
5			management, who we know is Superintendent Murray,	15:15
6			referencing obvious misuse of alcohol, and we will see	
7			from your notes later, you're aware of that?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	585	Q.	And a high level of short-term sickness absences, I	
10			think you were aware of that as well; is that right?	15:15
11		Α.	Yeah. They were probably more historic, you know, than	
12			say the date in April, you know, they are probably	
13			going back a good few years. I was away from the time	
14			I dealt with him, yeah, certainly.	
15	586	Q.	Can I ask you, just at the last paragraph there:	15:16
16				
17			"Management suggesting medium to long-term support be	
18			given for a transfer out of Athlone in view of the	
19			events that had transpired there."	
20				15:16
21			Now again can I ask you, I asked Inspector Downey, to	
22			your recollection who raised the issue of a transfer at	
23			this meeting?	
24		Α.	I wouldn't be as clear on this. I was surprised that	
25			there was somebody there from transfers, it wouldn't be	15:16
26			the norm at case conferences. Sometimes we are there,	
27			sometimes we're not. Sometimes, I haven't been there,	
28			but I have heard my colleagues say there are people	
29			there from discipline section, you know, at a case	

1			conference. So it would be unusual if someone was	
2			there. I am not exactly sure, I couldn't pinpoint who	
3			said it, but it was discussed. I don't know who.	
4	587	Q.	Okay. It says:	
5				15:17
6			"A transfer out of Athlone in view of events that had	
7			transpi red there. "	
8				
9			Do you know what that might mean? What was being	
10			referred to?	15:17
11		Α.	Em, I don't know if Garda Keogh had become a	
12			confidential recipient at that stage. I can't remember	
13			what date he became I don't know if it's that or	
14	588	Q.	And you think that's what that comment refers to, do	
15			you?	15:17
16		Α.	I'd imagine so. I don't know if the I'm not sure if	
17			the date he became a confidential recipient was before	
18			or after that.	
19	589	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That was in May 2014, this is in December of	
20			2015.	15:17
21		Α.	Okay. Well, it's possible.	
22	590	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Just to let you know what the dates are?	
23		Α.	Okay.	
24	591	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The 8th May he became the confidential	
25			recipient?	15:17
26		Α.	I wasn't sure if there was something else in the	
27			yeah, I would imagine it's that.	
28	592	Q.	MS. McGRATH: It's the	
29		Α.	It's the confidential recipient aspect of it.	

Τ	593	Q.	Okay. And it goes on to say:	
2				
3			"If the transfer is considered to be beneficial for the	
4			member's sustained wellbeing and effectiveness after he	
5			would have come through an appropriate treatment	15:18
6			programme. "	
7				
8			Now, did you contribute to this discussion of a	
9			transfer?	
10		Α.	No.	15:18
11	594	Q.	Did you have any view on it?	
12		Α.	No, I wasn't asked to contribute, I didn't contribute.	
13			But I suppose I'm not I wouldn't have thought that a	
14			transfer was a solution to this problem. But I wasn't	
15			asked.	15:18
16	595	Q.	Okay. Can I ask you, it's not recorded on the face of	
17			the minutes, was there a discussion of stress or work	
18			related stress or that issue?	
19		Α.	Not to me the big discussion was on how the sick was	
20			being recorded, not on what constituted work related	15:18
21			stress.	
22	596	Q.	Okay. Now, I think again we will see the before and	
23			after of that conference when we look at your notes,	
24			but you then attended a second conference and that's	
25			12th July 2016, isn't that right, Garda Quinn?	15:19
26		Α.	That's right.	
27	597	Q.	Okay. The minutes for this are at 6167, please.	
28			Again, can you assist, do you think these notes were	
29			nrenared by Fiona O'Brien or do you know?	

1		Α.	Yeah, Fiona O'Brien.	
2	598	Q.	Okay. Now, we see the attendees there. We see the	
3			CMO, we see Chief Superintendent Wheatley, Chief	
4			Superintendent Tony McLoughlin, who at that stage had	
5			come on board as the protected disclosures manager, is	15:19
6			that right?	
7		Α.	Yes. Well, he had that title then, but he was still	
8			there at the previous one but he just didn't have that.	
9			The protected disclosures manager title is just a very	
10			small part of his remit, you know. He has been there	15:20
11			quite a number of years, you know.	
12	599	Q.	Okay. You have Clare Egan from HRPD and yourself and	
13			Fiona O'Brien; isn't that right?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	600	Q.	Now just looking at HRPD observations:	15:20
16				
17			"Chief superintendent HRM and Mick Quinn GS met with	
18			Garda Keogh on 3rd June 2016 to allow the member a	
19			sounding board for his concerns and to outline all	
20			aspects of welfare available to him."	15:20
21				
22			Is that right?	
23		Α.	That's right, yeah.	
24	601	Q.	We see that in your notes as well. Chief	
25			superintendent HRM, would that be Tony McLoughlin?	15:20
26		Α.	That's right.	
27	602	Q.	Says:	
28				
29			"The member is presenting as articulate. List of	

1			issues presented was pay affected."	
2				
3			So that's one of the issues being discussed?	
4		Α.	Yes, that's right.	
5	603	Q.	Is that your recollection?	15:20
6		Α.	Yeah, it is.	
7	604	Q.	"The member did not present as interested in returning	
8			to work in his previous station but would like to	
9			return to work in another location."	
10				15:20
11			So at that stage is the issue of transfer live, as it	
12			were?	
13		Α.	Well, the way I'd interpret that is that he certainty	
14			wasn't I'd be surprised that there was talk of him	
15			going to another station at that stage. I wouldn't	15:21
16			have thought that that was, we'll call it, an inference	
17			from the meeting. He hasn't ever spoken to me about	
18			going somewhere else, so	
19	605	Q.	Okay. It's recorded there as having been raised by	
20			Chief Superintendent Tony McLoughlin, do you agree or	15:21
21			disagree with that? Just your recollection?	
22		Α.	I'd agree with the first bit, but not the second bit.	
23	606	Q.	As in, that you don't recall that being said by Chief	
24			Superintendent McLoughlin?	
25		Α.	No, I would think that he didn't present as being	15:21
26			interested in coming back to work, and he didn't say	
27			that he would like to go to another place.	
28	607	Q.	To you, is that right?	
29		Α.	Well, to what I heard, what I took.	

1	608	Q.	Okay. I think Chief Superintendent McLoughlin can deal	
2			with that?	
3		Α.	Yeah.	
4	609	Q.	Okay. Now GEAS is your contribution?	
5		Α.	That's me.	15:22
6	610	Q.	"Member's difficulties with alcohol are known at this	
7			time and is he receiving relevant supports to help him	
8			overcome same. Member has engaged positively with	
9			GEAS. Concerns about the member being socially quite	
10			isolated. The member's pets are very important to him.	15:22
11			The member himself admits he needs to return to the	
12			j ob. "	
13				
14			Can you tell the Chairman about that?	
15		Α.	Myself and Nick have some things in common and some	15:22
16			things we don't have in common. And our biggest	
17			difference, well, is our pet empathy. So his is 100%,	
18			mine is So his dogs are his life.	
19	611	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You're not a doggy person?	
20		Α.	No, it's not	15:22
21	612	Q.	CHAIRMAN: There's nothing sort of it's not a moral	
22			judgment, but he is and you aren't?	
23		Α.	He is, yeah, he is. I like them but I wouldn't be	
24	613	Q.	CHAIRMAN: In their place, I know what you mean?	
25		Α.	Well, and not alone dogs, but birds, animals, all that	15:22
26			kind of stuff, a huge part of his life.	
27			CHAIRMAN: I understand.	
28	614	Q.	MS. McGRATH: You're recording there that he has	
29			difficulties with alcohol. Again, we will see from the	

Т			notes that this was an ongoing issue over a number of	
2			years, isn't that right?	
3		Α.	Yeah, yeah. When I would have spoken to him pre April	
4			'15, it would have been about alcohol issues as well.	
5			You know, before I got to know him on a long-term, it	15:23
6			was alcohol related, some of it.	
7	615	Q.	Can you just assist the Chairman there, in your	
8			contribution you say:	
9				
10			"The member himself admits he needs to return to the	15:23
11			j ob. "	
12				
13			Is that your understanding, that that's Athlone Garda	
14			Station	
15		Α.	Yeah. But that's I would have that as a long-term,	15:23
16			not as a kind of a short-term or an intermediate. In	
17			time. Nick Keogh never didn't like policing, in my	
18			opinion, like you know.	
19	616	Q.	You say there:	
20				15:23
21			"The member has indicated he would like to enroll in	
22			the rehabilitation programme. It appears the member	
23			has done a lot of research on this subject and has	
24			decided on same."	
25				15:24
26			I think the evidence we have heard so far, we	
27			understand that this was the main raison d'être of this	
28			meeting?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 617 Q. Was the rehabilitation issue?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 618 Q. And cost of same, is that right?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 619 Q. And the willingness to facilitate and assist him in 15:24

15:24

15:25

15:25

- 6 relation to the cost by the organisation?
- 7 A. Yeah. In my time as -- now it may have happened to
- 8 some of my colleagues in the Employee Assistance
- 9 Service, but I haven't -- the way that the treatment
- programme was, I won't say paid for, or organised was
- unusual, very unusual. If members of the guards, we
- run a medical aid system, they pay -- some people think
- private health care is great and this and that and the
- other, but they pay for 28 days addiction treatment
- 15 every five years. Now, Laya and some of the others
- might be paying 42 days every year. But ours mightn't
- 17 be as good. So you have to be clear five years before
- you can get your 28 days. Some of the treatment
- centres they cover, some they don't, some you pay a --
- 20 620 Q. CHAIRMAN: Some are more expensive than others?
- 21 A. Well, some are perceived as being better than others.
- 22 621 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, but some are more expensive?
- 23 A. Sorry, yes.
- 24 622 Q. MS. McGRATH: Can I ask you, it was certainly the
- 25 evidence of Chief Superintendent Murray that this
- 26 meeting was -- that the gist of the meeting, the
- concern of the meeting was putting this residential
- rehabilitation programme in place for him, is that
- 29 right?

1		Α.	Well he wasn't quite up to his five years clear. So he	
2			would either have to pay for him it himself and	
3			somebody somewhere came up with what I would describe	
4			as a very unusual suggestion, that it would be paid	
5			for, most of it be paid for by medical aid and a top-up	15:2
6			from a section that's very unknown in the Guards,	
7			called the Garda Reward Fund.	
8	623	Q.	Something I should have clarified with you at the	
9			outset, I am sorry, Garda Quinn, when we looked at the	
10			number of attendees there, the management attendee, the	15:2
11			local management attendee is Chief Superintendent	
12			Lorraine Wheatley?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	624	Q.	We heard evidence from now Chief Superintendent Patrick	
15			Murray before Christmas, he said he attended this	15:2
16			meeting and that his name was omitted as an attendee,	
17			do you recall that? Can you assist?	
18		Α.	If I was to pick yes or no, I would say no. Just I	
19			just remember meeting	
20	625	Q.	CHAIRMAN: If you don't remember, you don't remember?	15:2
21		Α.	I don't remember. I hadn't noticed actually that he	
22			was missing, you know from, that list there.	
23	626	Q.	MS. McGRATH: I think he has notes in his diary or his	
24			memorandum to the effect that he did attend?	
25		Α.	Okay. Yeah.	15:2

paragraph, it says:

26

27

2829

627 Q.

screen, in the second column, the second last

Okay. Can I ask you to look, just there, it's on the

Τ			management to suggest possible roles and praces to the	
2			member with a view to build back the member's	
3			confi dence. "	
4				
5			Who was suggesting that, do you remember?	15:27
6		Α.	I would imagine it was Dr. Oghuvbu suggesting to Chief	
7			Superintendent Wheatley that they look at trying to	
8			find something that might be suitable.	
9	628	Q.	What did you understand by that?	
10		Α.	Well, that's what I would understand by it. You know,	15:27
11			people who are coming back after long-term absence or	
12			what's known as light duties, where, rather than be out	
13			to the forefront, you could be checking Pulse or	
14			reviewing firearms licences, something like that. So	
15			rather than doing nothing	15:28
16	629	Q.	CHAIRMAN: To get you back sort of gradually?	
17		Α.	Yeah, we call them light duties.	
18	630	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Ease you back into the job?	
19		Α.	Yeah. And, of course, there's then the	
20			non-confrontational light duties, which is people	15:28
21			are still looking for a description.	
22	631	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Was that the nature of the discussion in	
23			respect of Garda Keogh specifically?	
24		Α.	Yes, yeah.	
25	632	Q.	So a discussion regarding change of roles or change of	15:28
26			duties for him to facilitate him coming back, is that	
27			right?	
28		Α.	Yeah.	
29	633	Q.	Do you know if that was ever activated?	

- 1 I wouldn't know. Α.
- 2 You wouldn't know? 634 Q.
- 3 No, I wouldn't know. Sometimes if somebody was trying Α. to do it, the chief or the super or an inspector, they 4
- 5 might ring and say, would Nick be prepared to do this

15:29

15:29

15:29

- 6 or do that, and I might talk to him then.
- 7 if it happened. I am not aware.
- If we go to the next page, it's the end of the 8 635 Q. first column. Sorry, if you go back up there. 9 It's 10 talking about the cost of the programme:

11

12 "GEAS to liaise with the Garda medical aid and chief 13 superintendent HRPD and HRM with regards to the cost."

14

25

15 Were you involved in that?

16 No, actually. I don't know why, but I wasn't. Α. 17 happened was that John Fahy, who was then the general 18 secretary of Garda medical aid, said he would give what 19 it costs for a person to go to Cluain Mhuire, which is

a non-private treatment centre, and that's about 20

€1,400. He said he would give that towards Garda 21

- 22 Then Inspector Della Murray, who is now a Keogh's.
- 23 superintendent, for some reason, even though she never
- 24 had any contact with Garda Keogh, as far as I know, she
- was negotiating with John Fahy, they came up with 4,000 15:30 26 as the agreed figure. The shortfall of, say, 3,400, I
- 27 just mention it briefly.
- 28 CHAI RMAN: 636 Q. Yes.
- 29 It's the Garda reward fund. And what it is, is guards Α.

who have been disciplined, I would say there's 200 1 2 guards in the organisation know about it, it's guards 3 who have been disciplined and fined. CHAI RMAN: In the wrong. 4 637 Sorry, go on? Q. 5 Yeah, and fined monetary values. Α. 15:30 6 638 CHAI RMAN: Yes. Q. 7 They give out the money in this format to people where Α. 8 there's --9 639 CHAI RMAN: Oh, I see what you mean? Q. -- perceived hardship. 10 Α. 15:30 11 640 CHAI RMAN: I follow. There is a fund there? Q. There is a fund. 12 Α. 13 CHAI RMAN: I misunderstood. There is a fund there for 641 Q. 14 people who have been disciplined and fined? 15 Yes. Α. 15:30 16 So my money goes into a thing, it doesn't go 642 CHAI RMAN: Ο. 17 into the general kitty, it goes into a fund and it's 18 available the? 19 It's available, it's available, yeah. Α. 20 643 CHAI RMAN: For a deserving cause? 0. 15:31 21 Yeah. Α. 22 CHAI RMAN: I didn't know that. 644 Okay. Q. Well, there's view few, very few people --23 Α. 24 I would say not many people know that. 645 CHAI RMAN: Q. 25 Α. No. 15:31 26 646 MS. McGRATH: Do you know there under the column, Garda 0. 27 Quinn, local management observations and actions, do

you know why that might be blank?

28

29

No.

Α.

1	647	Q.	Okay. Sorry, I should have finished that, when we were	
2			dealing with the next page, on the next column. After	
3			the discussion of the costs of the programme there is	
4			an entry there, it says:	
5				15:3
6			"The nature of the current illness certification on	
7			record with HRPD is work related stress."	
8				
9			So, can we take it that work related stress was upfront	
10			and central at that particular case conference?	15:3
11		Α.	The only thing is, now it would probably be Chief	
12			McLoughlin, as far as I know Garda Keogh's I don't	
13			know how he's currently recorded. I would doubt it's	
14			work related stress. I would doubt it. I wouldn't	
15			have access to it but I would doubt it. Work related	15:3
16			stress, non-physical, are really contentious.	
17	648	Q.	Okay.	
18		Α.	So I would	
19	649	Q.	I think we have heard evidence to the effect that he is	
20			currently recorded well, the SAMS record marks	15:3
21			ordinary illness, namely mental health. Would you be	
22			aware of that?	
23		Α.	Yeah. Well, SAMS is excellent as a recording device,	
24			but as an accurate way of recording the illness, I	
25			think it's very poor. But it's very good at recording	15:3
26			the fact that people are sick.	
7	650	0	Now what I would like to do Carda Quinn is look at	

your notes. I think when you made your statement first

you provided your notes but they only went up to the

1			end of 2018, isn't that right?	
2		Α.	That's right, yeah.	
3	651	Q.	I think you have kindly provided the notes which bring	
4			us up-to-date and up to quite recently, in fact. Your	
5			last date of entry is 24th January 2020. And just in	15:33
6			ease of the parties, Judge, the notes as initially	
7			provided are at 10616 of the brief and the additional	
8			ten pages, which were circulated this morning, everyone	
9			should have them, are at 15941 of the brief. Now, I	
10			just want to ask you about these notes, Garda Quinn. I	15:33
11			don't want to necessarily delay everybody in going	
12			through them in too much detail but I think there are	
13			some aspects of them, if we could just deal with them.	
14			Do you have them in front of you?	
15		Α.	I do, yeah.	15:33
16	652	Q.	Okay. So, we see you coming on board there, this is	
17			page 10616, if Mr. Kavanagh can bring it up. You come	
18			on board, that's your first note of 21/4/2015 and you	
19			make reference to the fact of you coming on board and	
20			speaking to Garda Morgan Landy and Sergeant Clare	15:34
21			Malone, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	Yeah.	
23	653	Q.	You made Sergeant Malone and D/Superintendent Mulcahy	
24			aware that you had made contact with Garda Keogh and	
25			you describe him as being very drunk, is that right?	15:34

27

28

29

Yeah.

Α.

654 Q.

month by month or blocks like that, there was a

Now, I think in those entries in April, I won't open

every single one of them, but we will try and do it,

1			reference to drinking and then stopping drinking, I	
2			think that would categorise a lot of the entries over	
3			the years, is that right?	
4		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
5	655	Q.	Now, on the 23rd April, just staying on that page,	15:34
6			there are some things I might point out to the Chairman	
7			and feel free to point out anything else yourself that	
8			you would like to do so.	
9		Α.	Okay.	
10	656	Q.	The member rang, you answered.	15:34
11				
12			"He said his pay had been cut and it didn't bother him	
13			parti cul arl y. "	
14				
15			Do you remember that?	15:34
16		Α.	Absolutely.	
17	657	Q.	Is this a reference to the reduced pay on ordinary	
18			illness, was that your understanding?	
19		Α.	Yeah, yeah.	
20	658	Q.	Okay. Then, as we say, during that month	15:35
21		Α.	I suppose, just to clarify, the only reason that I	
22			remember is that I don't think I have ever dealt with	
23			anyone before who wasn't concerned about their pay	
24			being cut, ever.	
25	659	Q.	This is why you noted that?	15:35
26		Α.	Yeah.	
27	660	Q.	Can I ask you, actually, when you're making these	
28			notes, are these a summary of the conversation, would	
29			the conversations be a lot longer? What are you	

Τ			reflecting in the notes? Just a summary?	
2		Α.	It's only a summary, yeah. I suppose trying to capture	
3			what if you asked me how long was the conversation,	
4			I wouldn't have a clue if it was two minutes or two	
5			hours, but I suppose the pertinent point on the day.	15:35
6	661	Q.	Okay. As I say, the initial entries reference him	
7			drinking on the 24th, you say stopped drinking, is that	
8			right?	
9		Α.	Yeah.	
10	662	Q.	You move into May, you met him at his home?	15:35
11				
12			"We discussed all aspects of his case and how he	
13			thought he might deal with the conclusions of the	
14			i nvesti gati on. "	
15				15:35
16			So, the investigation came up very early	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	663	Q.	in your meetings with him, is that right?	
19		Α.	Yeah. Well, the fact that Detective Superintendent	
20			Mulcahy would have contacted me would be, as I say,	15:36
21			very unusual.	
22	664	Q.	Okay. On the 10th May 2015, you are referencing	
23			drinking and the last sentence:	
24				
25			"He went sick and took annual leave due to his	15:36
26			consumption of alcohol."	
27		Α.	That's what he would have told me, you know.	
28	665	Q.	Okay, and that's what you are recording?	
29		Δ	Yeah	

- 1 666 Q. Okay. On the next day, the top, he is after meeting --
- 2 667 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, just a moment. The 10th May, when
- 3 you say rest day, is that your rest day?
- 4 A. Yeah, I'm resting.
- 5 668 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's your day off. Yes, okay.
- 6 A. Yeah. But I discovered very early on that, you know,

15:36

15:36

15:37

15:37

- 7 we have 365-day relationship.
- 8 669 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand. I wasn't certain --
- 9 A. It's mine.
- 10 670 Q. CHAIRMAN: Whether it was Garda Keogh's --
- 11 A. It's mine. Sometimes in work they want us to say,
- 12 well, how many times were you --
- 13 671 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand.
- 14 A. Now, I never explained to Nick in the beginning that we
- work Monday to Friday, nine to five. Look, it doesn't
- make any difference.
- 17 672 Q. CHAIRMAN: As far as you're concerned that wasn't
- 18 vital, if he needed to talk to you?
- 19 A. Yeah, it doesn't matter.
- 20 673 Q. MS. McGRATH: Do you effectively consider yourself on
- call, Garda Quinn, to these members?
- 22 A. Different people, yeah, and to Nick I would.
- 23 674 Q. Okay. At the top of the next page, 10617, just going
- down through them, on the 20th May you contacted him:
- "The member saw Dr. Oghuvbu yesterday and felt that he
- 27 had taken the party line. He is due to meet Detective
- 28 Superintendent Mul cahy next week."

29

25

1			Did you understand what he meant by any of that?	
2		Α.	Yeah. Yeah. Party line, you know, he didn't deviate	
3			too far from I suppose what he expected to hear, you	
4			know.	
5	675	Q.	Moving in June, you rang him.	15:37
6				
7			"The member said he was out sick because the person he	
8			made the allegations against was being interviewed in	
9			the station that they both worked in."	
10		Α.	Yeah, he was very upset or annoyed or disappointed or,	15:37
11			I have another case, even in 2020, in a completely	
12			area, but one of the members there recently saw another	
13			person who was suspended in the station being	
14			interviewed and they were they just happened to	
15			comment. It's really not good practice.	15:38
16	676	Q.	That's the beginning of June. By the end of June	
17			you're contacting him.	
18				
19			"The member is finding it difficult to keep waiting for	
20			the result of his investigation into his allegations.	15:38
21			He mentioned the amnesty other members had got to get	
22			their motor documents rectified."	
23		Α.	Yeah.	
24	677	Q.	Now, if there is further information that you wish to	
25			give to the chair?	15:38
26		Α.	Okay.	
27	678	Q.	Or that you recall, please feel free to do so?	
28	679	Q.	CHAIRMAN: They largely speak for themselves. I'm	
29			assuming that people will assume that the notes speak	

1			for themselves. If there is anything that you want to	
2			add or subtract, well and good. But otherwise, I	
3			think, Ms. McGrath will use her own judgment to give a	
4			flavour of the things. But otherwise, I think we will	
5			just treat them as saying what they say.	15:39
6			MS. McGRATH: Okay.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Which is probably the best way to do it.	
8	680	Q.	MS. McGRATH: That is June, a couple of months into	
9			your appointment with him. In July, we know from our	
10			evidence that there was an issue, an AWOL issue in July	15:39
11			and have you an early entry and then you have a late	
12			entry, where he has admitted to drinking, he said he	
13			sent letters to the DPP and Minister for Justice, he	
14			mentioned that he was due to visit the CMO:	
15				15:39
16			"He spoke of his satisfaction with Detective	
17			Superintendent Mulcahy and admits his frustration with	
18			the inaction against those he has named."	
19				
20			He does mention that satisfaction with Detective	15:39
21			Superintendent Mulcahy a number of times, is that right	
22		Α.	Consistently.	
23	681	Q.	Okay.	
24		Α.	Yeah.	
25	682	Q.	In August, we have again two entries talking about	15:39
26			drinking and by the end of August you say he was sober	
27			and determined in his approach. Again, that reflects	
28			quite a theme in the notes, would that be fair.	
29		Α.	Yeah.	

- 1 683 Q. In July he has been served with discipline papers?
- 2 A. Sorry, I suppose, just a really important point, it's a
- 3 bit like the pay issue, I have never dealt with anybody

15:40

15:40

15:40

15 · 41

- 4 with an addiction who was so honest. You know, most
- 5 people --
- 6 684 Q. CHAIRMAN: There was no concealment?
- 7 A. No concealment. Totally honest. Whether he is
- 8 stopping or starting or continuing.
- 9 685 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 10 A. Very unusual.
- 11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
- 12 686 Q. MS. McGRATH: Garda Quinn, I think in Garda Keogh's
- evidence, when he was giving direct-evidence and under
- 14 cross-examination before Christmas, he talked about the
- very good relationship he had with you in that regard?
- 16 A. Yeah. We get on well.
- 17 687 Q. Now, in September, we have a reference to the
- discipline and I think that was the discipline in
- relation to the AWOL issue in July, is that right?
- 20 A. That's right, yeah.
- 21 688 Q. It is recorded that it was now finished, is that right?
- A. Mm-hmm.
- 23 689 Q. Again, from time to time he is mentioning -- if you
- look into October 2015, he is mentioning media issues
- arising in relation to the protected disclosure from
- time to time, is that right?
- 27 A. Yeah, it was kind of breaking or current for some
- reason at that stage.
- 29 690 Q. Okay. And if you look at the 11th October, he mentions

1			that he spoke of Detective Superintendent Mulcahy's	
2			good work and again there's a reference to a spell of	
3			drinking in the next couple of entries, is that right?	
4		Α.	Yeah. Yeah, he got on very well with Detective	
5			Superintendent Mulcahy.	15:41
6	691	Q.	Okay.	
7		Α.	And Inspector Coppinger.	
8	692	Q.	Very good. On 27/10 you have an entry there of a	
9			discussion with him:	
10				15:41
11			"The member intends dealing with the fact that he has	
12			been assigned to be permanent station orderly (PO) by	
13			his superintendent in a positive way."	
14				
15			Now, that was the allocation to indoor duty at that	15:41
16			time	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	693	Q.	And that's how you have recorded Garda Keogh's	
19			response?	
20		Α.	Yeah. Well, being assigned duty as permanent PO is, I	15:41
21			suppose, the job that everybody doesn't want in the	
22			Guards, in any station really. Some people don't like	
23			being indoors, whatever about doing it in rotation,	
24			doing it consistently is difficult and naturally the	
25			bigger the busier the station, you know. But he did	15:42
26			say that he was going to try and deal with it	
27			positively, yeah.	
28	694	Q.	The next day you contacted or he contacted you,	
29			referencing a white Volvo owned by a local drug dealer	

- 1 near his home, is that right?
- 2 A. Yeah, that's right.
- 3 695 Q. In November, again you have drinking and sobriety
- 4 during the course of the month, is that right?
- 5 A. Yeah, it's consistent. I suppose when I read it
- 6 myself, my notes, even to myself are difficult to read

15 · 43

15:43

15:43

15 · 43

- 7 writing wise, but when I re-read the typed version
- before I sent it in, it did seem unusual, started
- 9 drinking, stopped drinking, trying to stop. That's
- 10 what a lot of it -- but we talk about other things as
- 11 well. But I suppose just as a recording mechanism.
- 12 696 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, you have experience of addiction, I
- take it?
- 14 A. Yeah.
- 15 697 Q. CHAIRMAN: was the pattern unusual?
- 16 A. I wouldn't describe the -- the pattern I would have
- 17 as --
- 18 698 Q. CHAIRMAN: It appeared to be very short-term on, very
- 19 short --
- 20 A. Yeah, on/off. There were only two, I think of all the
- on/offs, on/offs, there were only two I was very
- concerned about, and this would be by telephone, you
- know, he lives in one place, I live in another place.
- There were only two episodes that I felt these are
- really serious, and one of them is in the new notes
- that people got this morning.
- 27 699 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 28 A. I think it was May '19. Apart from that, it's not that
- I wasn't concerned but, you know, normally he'd say

1			today is Tuesday, I hope to be stopped by Thursday.	
2			And I would ring on Thursday and he'd be stopped.	
3	700	Q.	MS. McGRATH: And you can point those out when we come	
4			to them, Garda Keogh. That would be very helpful.	
5			We're in December 2015 and the top of the next page,	15:44
6			ending in 19, on 9/12, and again there is a reference	
7			to you discussing with him stopping drinking or	
8			undergoing addiction programmes?	
9		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
10	701	Q.	There's a reference there I just want to ask you about	15:44
11			on $14/12$, this is in relation to attending the CMO.	
12			Now you have been at the conference at this stage?	
13		Α.	Yeah.	
14	702	Q.	Isn't that right?	
15		Α.	Yeah.	15:44
16	703	Q.	Which we have talked about?	
17		Α.	Sometimes we're invited to them, sometimes we're not.	
18			Sometimes we go, sometimes we don't, depending on	
19			various issues.	
20	704	Q.	Okay. You had spoken to Garda Keogh about being at the	15:44
21			conference and updated him effectively, is that right?	
22		Α.	Yeah.	
23	705	Q.	Now, on 14/12 you say:	
24				
25			"The member confirmed that he would attend the CMO.	15:45
26			The member's superintendent rang me and I confirmed	
27			that he would attend the CMO appointment."	
28				
29			Can you confirm if that's Superintendent Murray? Do	

Т			you remember?	
2		Α.	Yes, I'm sure it is, yeah.	
3	706	Q.	And would you have had much contact	
4		Α.	No. I had nearly forgotten about that, only that I	
5			have written it down. I think apart from there and	15:45
6			meeting him at the case conference, certainly the one,	
7			I can't even remember if he was at the second, I don't	
8			think I have ever had any other contact with him.	
9	707	Q.	Okay.	
10		Α.	But I literally didn't remember that one there until I	15:45
11			was	
12	708	Q.	And do you recall, was the discussion limited to the	
13			CMO?	
14		Α.	Oh, yeah, yeah, definitely.	
15	709	Q.	Okay. Then on 18/12 you say:	15:45
16				
17			"Dr. Oghuvbu rang me to discuss, clarify and get my	
18			opinion about some of the difficulties that the member	
19			was encounter with his superintendent."	
20				15:46
21			Do you remember that?	
22		Α.	Yes, absolutely.	
23	710	Q.	We can ask Dr. Oghuvbu about that himself, but can you	
24			assist the Chairman there, was there any more detail	
25			given or do you have an awareness of the issues?	15:46
26		Α.	I suppose Dr. Oghuvbu in his role was trying to tease	
27			out what was really happening, what could be done, how	
28			he was, could anything be done by management. Kind of	
29			general. There were probably guestions that could have	

1			been or may have been asked at a case conference, but	
2			normally I wouldn't have a very big role in the case	
3			conference. I wouldn't often be asked. If I am asked	
4			I give an opinion. Whereas there were probably some of	
5			those questions like that, I feel, that Dr. Oghuvbu	15:46
6			asked me.	
7	711	Q.	And you said to get your opinion on some of the	
8			difficulties, did you provide an opinion?	
9		Α.	Yeah, yeah.	
10	712	Q.	Can you tell the Chairman what specifically you were	15:47
11			talking about?	
12		Α.	Well, that I always believed that people should be	
13			treated fairly, people should be I suppose two very	
14			important attributes that don't often appear in job	
15			descriptions in the Employee Assistance Service, are	15:47
16			empathy and non-judgmental. So I think everybody	
17			should have them. I think even if you don't know	
18			somebody and you hear that he or she is this or that, I	
19			think you really should everybody in every role	
20			should be forming their own opinion.	15:47
21	713	Q.	Did you give your opinion?	
22		Α.	Yeah.	
23	714	Q.	And what was that?	
24		Α.	That assigning people to permanent PO is not	
25			necessarily the solution to a problem where there's a	15:47
26			difficulty. You know, some stuff like that.	
27	715	Q.	You contacted Garda Keogh, you note there, around that	
28			time, and you suggested that he document fully any	

incident where he felt he was being treated unfairly or

1 inappropriately by his superintendent?	J
--	---

- A. Yeah, well I would to anybody. Anybody, you know. And I did to Garda Keogh on this occasion as well.
- 4 716 Q. Now, from the 18th onwards, we know that that was the day he attended the CMO on the 18th, and after that, we 15:48 also know that he went on long-term sick leave?

15 · 48

15:49

- 7 A. Yeah. There were a lot of calls around the 26th, you know, Christmas. I think I've said nearly every year that Garda Keogh has said that he doesn't like Christmas and he doesn't like what it brings. But I
- suppose I tried hard to encourage him to keep him at
 work. I thought he was doing reasonably well
 considering and I just felt that 26/12/2015, him going
 sick then, I just felt this felt like a different kind
 of sick, as it transpired.
- 16 717 Q. Was it your view as his welfare officer that he was 17 struggling at this period?
- 18 A. Yeah.
- 19 718 Q. Did you understand why or did you know?
- A. Well, I would say frustration at work. I don't know, I 15:49
 wouldn't be one to diagnose the -- you know, I am not
 qualified to diagnose work related stress. But
 frustration with the system and how he perceived he was
 being treated and those elements.
- 25 719 Q. The references there in December are to the superintendent and is that Superintendent Murray?
- 27 A. Yeah. Definitely.
- 28 720 Q. He went there, you record on 27/12 that he rang to say 29 that he had now decided to stay on long-term sick leave

Τ			until he can deal with and rectify his alcohol	
2			addiction. Is that why he told you he was going on	
3			long-term sick?	
4		Α.	Em, I don't think that's why he was going on long-term	
5			sick. I know I have it recorded there, but I would	15:50
6			I think he was going sick because of the frustrations	
7			at work and I would interlink some of his alcohol	
8			problem with his frustrations at work.	
9	721	Q.	We note there that during that period and if you go on	
10			to the next page, of January 2016, the issue of alcohol	15:50
11			continues and his drinking, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	722	Q.	And on the 4/1:	
14				
15			"We spoke for a long time about his drinking. He spoke	15:50
16			about how difficult it was not to have been believed	
17			initially when he made his allegations and how awkward	
18			and difficult and unprofessional it was to be asked to	
19			continue to work alongside the person that he had made	
20			the allegations against."	15:50
21		Α.	Yeah, he talked a lot about that. That, you know, it	
22			was years before the authorities acted on what he had	
23			said and in the intervening time, you know, became	
24			difficult. He was still working.	
25	723	Q.	And we have been referring in evidence to a Garda	15:5
26			called Garda A, and if you can refer to	
27		Α.	Okay.	
28	724	Q.	that Garda by Garda A. Was Garda A mentioned in	
29			this context to you by Garda Keogh?	

Т		Α.	He never talked that much about Garda A. He talked a	
2			lot about management not acting on what he said about	
3			Garda A.	
4	725	Q.	Okay.	
5		Α.	That would be a fairly constant theme.	15:51
6	726	Q.	Okay. And then moving just three days later:	
7				
8			"He says he was pleased that the detective	
9			superintendent had checked on him."	
10				15:51
11			Is that Detective Superintendent Mulcahy?	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	727	Q.	Okay.	
14		Α.	Again, it would be kind of unusual, especially not your	
15			own superintendent. I think again they had a good	15:52
16			rapport, you know.	
17	728	Q.	Okay. And I think then there's again references to	
18			drinking and not drinking. And when we go into	
19			February, you're telling him on the 9th February that	
20			you would contact St. Paul's Garda Medical Aid, is that	15:52
21			right?	
22		Α.	Yeah, that's right.	
23	729	Q.	Moving on to the next page and again if you need to	
24			refer to any particular note just let me know.	
25		Α.	Okay, thank you.	15:52
26	730	Q.	On the next page then we're moving into February and	
27			March and April and again, we have the drinking and	
28			sobriety issue going on, isn't that right	
29		Δ	Veah	

- 1 731 Q. -- during those months?
- 2 A. On the 26th April 2016 we see the notes:

3

"Chief Superintendent Wheatley rang and discussed about
 the possibility of her meeting or visiting the member." 15:52

6

- 7 She rang you, is that right?
- 8 A. Yes, that's right. I remember it very distinctly.
- 9 732 Q. Okay. Can you tell the Chairman about that?
- 10 A. Yeah. I would know Chief Superintendent Wheatley over
- 11 the years, not very well, might meet her at a concert,
- we would have a few words. I remember lots of things,
- but I just remember where I happened to be that day
- 14 when she rang me and we just talked about Garda Keogh
- and addictions and what we knew about it and what could 15:53
- be done to help.
- 17 733 Q. Okay. In that regard, on the 18th May, we see there at
- the bottom of the page, you're talking to the member
- about the visit of Chief Superintendent Wheatley --
- 20 A. Yeah.

15:53

15:53

- 21 734 Q. -- and the divisional clerk to him?
- A. Mm-hmm.
- 23 735 Q. And that she was enquiring about his rate of pay --
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 736 Q. -- and where he was originally from and if he was in
- 26 contact with you, is that right?
- 27 A. Yeah.
- 28 737 Q. Now, in May 2016, this is an issue then again if
- 29 anybody would like -- my colleagues may open up certain

1			entries, but again it is reflecting a pattern of	
2			alcohol. But in the middle of the page there, there is	
3			then this issue arising about the reclassification of	
4			his sick leave to mental health, that's on the 23rd	
5			May, is that right?	15:54
6		Α.	Yeah.	
7	738	Q.	This is a discussion you're having with Chief	
8			Superintendent McLoughlin, is that right?	
9		Α.	Yeah, Chief Superintendent McLoughlin had asked me to	
10			see what he could do.	15:54
11	739	Q.	Okay.	
12		Α.	And he asked me to ask Garda Keogh. I asked him and I	
13			came back with these one, two, three different	
14			suggestions about how these issues could be addressed.	
15	740	Q.	Okay. And then at the bottom of the page, again on	15:54
16			your rest day, the 28th May, Chief Superintendent	
17			Wheatley rang you and asked if there was anything that	
18			could be done to help the member get sober.	
19				
20			"We discussed what this may take in time."	15:54
21				
22			So you would have had a number of contacts with Chief	
23			Superintendent Wheatley, is that right?	
24		Α.	Yes, mm-hmm. Yeah.	
25	741	Q.	I think she is expressing concern for the member	15:54
26			there	
27		Α.	Yeah.	
28	742	Q.	and the issue of sobriety, is that right?	
29		Δ.	That's right, yeah.	

1	743	Q.	Now moving on then throughout 2016, June 2016, this is	
2			before the case conference you attended. You have a	
3			record there of the 3rd June of you meeting the member	
4			with Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, is that right?	
5		Α.	That's right. In Tullamore.	15:55
6	744	Q.	And then moving into July and on to the next page, you	
7			make a reference to the case conference on the 12th	
8			July and the issue of the treatment programme, isn't	
9			that right?	
10		Α.	Yeah. That's right.	15:55
11	745	Q.	And I think we see a pattern developing here of	
12			contact, you were in contact with the CMO from time to	
13			time, you were in contact with Chief Superintendent	
14			McLoughlin and you were in contact with Chief	
15			Superintendent Wheatley from time to time?	15:55
16		Α.	That's right.	
17	746	Q.	would that be fair enough for around this period?	
18		Α.	That's fair enough, yeah, yeah. That Inspector Murray	
19			there, that's my rather than Superintendent Pat	
20			Murray, that's my inspector, Della Murray, who is now a	15:5
21			superintendent. Just in case you're	
22	747	Q.	Okay. So then, I think what we see then at this	
23			particular point in your notes is Garda Keogh is	
24			attending the rehabilitation programme and matters of	
25			his pay are being addressed by management. And that is	15:56
26			reflected in your notes, isn't that right?	
27		Α.	Yeah, that's right.	
28	748	Q.	And at the top of the next page, by August 2016, on the	

29

8th August you met with the member and his counsellor

1 in the treatment centre and both are very happy with 2 how the programme has gone --3 Yes. Α. -- is that right? 4 749 0. 5 Yes. Α. 15:56 6 750 And you're keeping people updated in this respect? Q. 7 Yeah. Α. 8 751 And it's at this point then we see a long period of Ο. 9 sobriety for a number of months, is that right, after the treatment programme, would that be fair to say? 10 15:56 11 Yeah, yeah. Α. And in particular on, if you go through, after that, 12 752 0. 13 August, September, into October, there's a reference in 14 October on the next page, he is talking to you about 15 his back pay. You become aware that he has been put 15:56 16 back on full pay and received back pay, is that right? 17 That's right. Α. 18 And I think that theme continues then throughout 753 Q. 19 October and what is happening then, that November 2016, 20 the issue of this bullying and harassment investigation 15:57 arises and I think you are recording some discussions 21 22 with Garda Keogh in respect of that. That's right. 23 Α. 24 I think that eventually became the Assistant 754 Q. 25 Commissioner Finn investigation, is that right? 15:57 26 Eventually, yeah. Α. 27 755 Okay. And at the top of the page ending 27, on the Q. 15th November 2015 you say: 28

29

1			"The member rang. We discussed the upcoming O'Neill	
2			report. He told me that he, Mr. Barrett, had written	
3			advising him that he needed to make a complaint to the	
4			chief superintendent in Mullingar if he wanted to	
5			pursue his bullying allegations."	15:57
6				
7			And it is around this time that matters commence in	
8			relation to that.	
9		Α.	That's right, yeah.	
10	756	Q.	Okay. So again, during November/December 2016 the	15:57
11			period of sobriety seems to continue into early 2017,	
12			would you agree with that?	
13		Α.	Yeah.	
14	757	Q.	And if I can ask Mr. Kavanagh to move forward and you	
15			can stop me if things are changing, but I think what we	15:58
16			see during 2017 is that period of sobriety and	
17			discussions in respect of the bullying and harassment	
18			investigation?	
19		Α.	That's right.	
20	758	Q.	If you can go to page ending 30, Mr. Kavanagh, and the	15:58
21			entries at the top of the page is the 26th April 2017.	
22			There we go.	
23				
24			"I rang. We discussed the developing situation. Chief	
25			Superintendent McLoughlin rang and asked me to clarify	15:58
26			if the client is interested in returning to work in	
27			Athlone or some other station. The member declined the	
28			offer to return to work."	
29				

Τ			So that was his position as of April 2017, is that	
2			right?	
3		Α.	That kind of came out of nowhere. You know, the chief	
4			rang me, I asked him, he said he wasn't interested.	
5			But I didn't hear any talk, any anything. There was	15:5
6			nothing too much going on at that stage. It's like	
7			somebody said did anybody ask him will he come back,	
8			you know. It didn't link to anything.	
9	759	Q.	And Garda Keogh declined?	
10		Α.	Yeah.	15:5
11	760	Q.	Did you discuss that with Garda Keogh, his reason for	
12			declining it?	
13		Α.	Not really. Well nothing had changed, like, you know,	
14			so You know, in Athlone. I would have perceived.	
15	761	Q.	Can I ask you to go to, move to 2018 now, and the page	15:5
16			ending in 33, and the entry at the top of the page is	
17			15th January 2018. We're not much longer, Garda Quinn.	
18			I am sorry this is taking so long.	
19		Α.	All right. Okay.	
20	762	Q.	Can I just ask you, it says there:	15:5
21				
22			"I spoke with Superintendent Murray re the allegation	
23			of bullying made by the member."	
24		Α.	That is my own superintendent.	
25	763	Q.	Okay. I just wanted to clarify that. Okay. That is	15:5
26			Superintendent Della Murray, is that right?	
27		Α.	Yeah.	
28	764	Q.	And then the period of sobriety appears to have	
29			continued, from the notes in any event, and on the 30th	

Τ			January 2018, you see a reference there:	
2				
3			"I rang. He spoke of Superintendent Pat Murray's	
4			promotion and talked about it being a very surprising	
5			development."	16:00
6				
7			Is that right?	
8		Α.	That's right.	
9	765	Q.	And then we see a period of drinking for January,	
10			February and possibly into March, is that right?	16:00
11		Α.	That's right.	
12	766	Q.	And at the top of page 34, on the March entry at 2018,	
13			was this one of the incidents you were talking about	
14			earlier, the two incidents you say that you were	
15			concerned about in relation to alcohol?	16:00
16		Α.	Yeah. It's unusual for anybody to ring me out of	
17			hours. I mean, we always say if somebody is ringing	
18			you at ten at night or four in the morning there's a	
19			big problem. Okay, there were only three calls within	
20			11 minutes. Just the fact that I couldn't get him back	16:00
21			and whatever he would have said in a voicemail I was	
22			more concerned than normal.	
23	767	Q.	And I think you record there on the 23rd April 2018:	
24				
25			"I rang and spoke of Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	16:01
26			retiring. The member spoke about how fair and	
27			competent he had always found him to be."	
28				
29			I think you noted that a number of times.	

1		Α.	Yeah.	
2	768	Q.	Then he goes on, he is again talking about some media	
3			articles, which I think wouldn't have been unusual. He	
4			would have talked to you about some media articles?	
5		Α.	Yeah. Sometimes he would say there's something coming	16:01
6			up or is not coming up, or he might say I may have been	
7			the feature of the article but I didn't give the	
8			information.	
9	769	Q.	I think throughout 2018 again there were spots of	
10			drinking and spots of sobriety as well during 2018?	16:01
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	770	Q.	Would that be fair to say?	
13		Α.	Yeah.	
14	771	Q.	Now again my colleagues are free to open up any	
15			other I am trying to open up a very balanced view of	16:01
16			the notes Garda Quinn.	
17		Α.	Okay.	
18	772	Q.	So my colleagues may open up some more. If I can ask,	
19			Mr. Kavanagh should have a separate key with the most	
20			recent notes at 15941 there, that have just been	16:01
21			disclosed this morning. These are the notes throughout	
22			2019 and again I think they mark sobriety and	
23			alcoholism in equal measure. But can I ask you about	
24			an entry which is on page 44, ending in 44. 15945. It	
25			is the dated 8th May 2019. It says:	16:02
26				
27			"The member rang. He was keen to talk to a female	
28			member when he rang. He spoke with my sergeant. I	
29			told him that a second member from his intake in	

Templemore had died the same week as his classmate had died. Both members were known to have difficulties with alcohol. I rang Dr. Oghuvbu and told him of my concerns regarding the member's current changed and prolonged drinking pattern. He suggested that the member would engage in a rehabilitation aftercare programme. I discussed this suggestion with Sergeant Malone."

16:03

16:03

16:03

16:03

16:03

The next entry says:

"While speaking with Superintendent Della Murray, I expressed my surprise with Dr. Oghuvbu's reaction when I discussed the member's current drinking pattern. I received numerous calls from the member who continues to drink heavily."

Can you just clarify, when you are talking about there Dr. Oghuvbu's and your surprise, what are you talking about there?

Well I don't bring him too often I don't I would

Α.

Well, I don't bring him too often. I don't. I would ring him from time to time. I just thought that Nick's -- in all my time, that was the time I was most concerned about his drinking pattern. And having spoken to my sergeant and my superintendent it just seemed like he wasn't stopping, it seemed like we couldn't get him to stop. Anybody who was trying. You know, it seemed to be engrained for whatever reason. I just thought as the CMO as --

- 1 773 Q. CHAIRMAN: What was the feature of that one that made 2 you most alarmed, can you recall?
- 3 Α. I think possibly the fact that he wasn't even talking about stopping. Normally when he is drinking he is 4 5 talking about stopping. Myself and John Wilson would 16:04 6 have been talking a bit recently in 2019 about Nick and 7 his drinking and trying to get him to stop. He lives a 8 bit closer than I do. And he was also concerned. I suppose what also concerns me is that there are quite 9 a number of people who like Nick, who work with Nick, 10 16:04 11 who still contact him from around Bray where he worked 12 and some of those were also ringing, saying Nick is

16:05

16:05

14 774 Q. CHAIRMAN: They were ringing you?

very bad at the moment.

15 A. Pardon?

13

26

16 775 Q. CHAIRMAN: They were ringing you?

the...

- 17 Ringing me, yeah. So I think it was the culmination of Α. 18 just -- and this business of ringing Garda stations you 19 know when -- I suppose the only point we differ on is, you know, when, if Nick rings a Garda station, if he 20 happens to be drinking it is just problematic. 21 I don't 22 mind him ringing me, John Wilson doesn't mind me 23 ringing him, but if other guards who don't know him, 24 and there was a bit of that, as you can see, from 10th 25 May, you know he rang Portlaoise. It just complicates
- 27 776 Q. MS. McGRATH: Okay. I think the remainder of your
 28 notes bring us up to, as I said, just recently and I
 29 think that, as you outlined at the start of your

Т			evidence, you you can take that down actually. You	
2			can confirm to the Chairman that the organisation still	
3			has you in place as his welfare officer?	
4		Α.	Yes, that's right.	
5	777	Q.	And I think you are still in regular contact with Garda	16:06
6			Keogh?	
7		Α.	Yeah, very.	
8			MS. McGRATH: I am going to ask you to answer any	
9			questions Garda Quinn, but I just wonder, Chairman, if	
10			you want to get an idea of how long everybody is going	16:06
11			to be?	
12			CHAIRMAN: Is it convenient to proceed so that we can	
13			let Garda Quinn go?	
14			MR. O'BRIEN: I am in a position to proceed. I will be	
15			very short, Chairman.	16:06
16			CHAIRMAN: Is that right? Well, there is no pressure	
17			on you, if you need to be longer	
18			MS. O'BRIEN: No, Chairman.	
19			CHAIRMAN: you can be longer. Same with you,	
20			Mr. Murphy.	16:06
21			MS. McGRATH: I think Mr. O'Higgins	
22			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I will be short, Chairman.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Are you happy with that?	
24			THE WITNESS: Fine.	
25			CHAIRMAN: I think it would be nice to complete your	16:06
26			evidence if we can.	
27			THE WITNESS: Yeah.	
28			CHAIRMAN: You are welcome to back and stay.	
29			THE WITNESS: No, no	

Т			CHAIRMAN: But you don't have to. I am sure you have	
2			other things to do. Now, Mr. O'Brien, yeah.	
3				
4			GARDA QUINN WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. O'BRIEN AS	
5			FOLLOWS:	16:06
6				
7	778	Q.	MR. O'BRIEN: Garda Quinn, thank you. Can I ask you,	
8			please, just to look at your statement again? It's	
9			Volume 12 at page 3642, Mr. Kavanagh. I just want to	
10			go back if I can to revisit that	16:07
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	779	Q.	the meeting of the 9th December 2015 and your	
13			recollection of that meeting and just to clarify with	
14			you something that is recorded in your statement here,	
15			if I can please. Towards the end of the statement,	16:07
16			Garda Quinn, if you can look to the page please?	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	780	Q.	You will see, you say as follows:	
19				
20			"I took the main theme to come from the meeting to be	16:07
21			the possible consequences for Garda Keogh's career if	
22			he didn't stop drinking and address his addiction	
23			issues by undergoing a suitable programme. Later that	
24			day I contacted Garda Keogh and outlined to him the	
25			consensus of the meeting which were the possible	16:07
26			consequences for his career and possibly his physical	
27			health and mental wellbeing if he didn't stop drinking	
28			and undergo and receive the appropriate health."	
29				

			That seems also to be bothe out in your notes which are	
2			at page 37 and it's Volume 37, page 10619. But can I	
3			just ask you, please, Garda Quinn, this issue of	
4			consequences for Garda Keogh, what do you recall about	
5			a discussion of consequences from that meeting?	16:08
6		Α.	Well, people who continually are on long-term sick,	
7			people who have an alcohol problem, you know at some	
8			stage a disciplinary process will kick in.	
9	781	Q.	And was this a feature of the meeting on the 9th	
10			December, do you know?	16:08
11		Α.	Well, yeah, it wouldn't be specific to the 9th. You	
12			know. It did happen on that day very clearly.	
13	782	Q.	And in relation to that, do you recall who specifically	
14			in attendance at the meeting brought up this issue or	
15			raised the issue?	16:08
16		Α.	No. But I suppose everybody there, myself, the	
17			detective superintendent, the superintendent, everybody	
18			there you know, Nick's pattern wasn't good enough to	
19			not be possibly disciplined in time for being missing	
20			and being sick or being medically retired or some kind	16:09
21			of action like that.	
22	783	Q.	I see. But in terms of perhaps the direction of those	
23			in attendance that that issue was coming from, was it	
24			coming from I mean, for example, was it coming from	
25			the superintendent?	16:09
26		Α.	No. I would agree with it myself. I think there may	
27			not have been consensus on how we all found Nick, Garda	
28			Keogh, but there was definitely consensus on what would	
29			happen	

- 1 784 Q. I see.
- 2 A. -- if he didn't, if he wasn't able to change his --
- 3 785 Q. Did I understand you a moment ago to say that that was 4 potential disciplinary --
- 5 A. Possibly. You know, people who go missing -- not go

16:10

- 6 missing, don't attend work. You know, it's not just
- 7 specific to Garda Keogh. You know, if there's a
- 8 pattern like that, people can be medically retired,
- 9 people can be...
- 10 786 Q. I see. Just to move forward then a little bit and in
- 11 relation to the conversation that you had with
- 12 Dr. Oghuvbu on the 18th, we see a note of that again at
- Volume 37, page 10619 and I think Ms. McGrath asked you
- 14 a few moments ago, you see there that Dr. Oghuvbu rang
- you to discuss, clarify and get your opinion about some 16:10
- of the difficulties that the member was encountering
- 17 with his superintendent. I mean, just the use of the
- 18 word "some" there, that suggests that there was more
- than one, would that be a fair reflection of your note?
- 20 A. Okay, if I was to rewrite the notes I would probably
- take out "some", you know.
- 22 787 Q. Okay. But there were difficulties I think?
- 23 A. Ah yeah, there were difficulties.
- 24 788 Q. And I think when you answered Ms. McGrath's question a
- few moments ago I think you said that, for example, the 16:10
- permanent public office is not necessarily a solution,
- 27 that that was your opinion?
- 28 A. Yeah. It still would be.
- 29 789 Q. Was that the extent of your opinion to Dr. Oghuvbu or

- in fact was there more, if you can recollect?
- 2 A. I think there would have been more. You know, whatever
- I felt was relevant at the time, you know.
- 4 790 Q. If I could just ask you to try your best to recollect
- on the date and just to try and recall exactly?
- 6 A. Okay. I would guess that I spoke about the tax issue,

16 · 11

- 7 that Nick was dealt with one way and that others are
- 8 perceived to be dealt with another way. I just like
- 9 when people are treated fairly.
- 10 791 Q. Again that is another issue, so perhaps as you say you
- 11 have the tax issue, you have the permanent public
- office placement. Do you recall was there anything
- 13 further?
- 14 A. I think it's just a bit like when I spoke to the
- 15 Chairman, that he forms his own opinion of Garda Keogh, 16:11
- 16 you know. I don't know I have never --
- 17 792 Q. I certainly accept that, that the Chairman will do that
- in due course,
- 19 A. No, not the Chairman, that Superintendent Murray would
- form his own opinion. No, no, not the Chairman.
- 21 793 Q. I see. But Dr. Oghuvbu in fact was asking you about
- 22 your opinion --
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 794 Q. -- about the difficulties. So what did you -- you have
- given us an example of two, is that the extent of it or 16:12
- 26 would there be more?
- 27 A. You know, that maybe, I don't know if Dr. Oghuvbu was
- going to be talking to Superintendent Murray, I just
- 29 thought that he would factor in that -- you know, to me

1			it just seemed a bit off the way he was being treated.	
2			To me.	
3	795	Q.	Oh, I see. It was off the way Garda Keogh was being	
4			treated by Superintendent Murray?	
5		Α.	Yeah.	16:12
6	796	Q.	Maybe you could help us a little bit more. How was	
7			that in your view?	
8		Α.	You know, I just think	
9			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Chairman, I just wonder, the	
10			witness is being asked to offer an opinion, I am not	16:13
11			sure it is of assistance to you in terms of identifying	
12			the facts as opposed to opinion matter.	
13			CHAIRMAN: well, let's try to see this, Mr. O'Higgins.	
14			The Chief Medical Officer after a conference is ringing	
15			Garda Quinn and they are having a conversation about	16:13
16			Garda Keogh's difficulties. You have to trust that I	
17			know what the issues are from a legal and evidential	
18			point, but where we are going from a welfare point of	
19			view is Dr. Oghuvbu is saying what do you think of	
20			this, what is your view. And obviously as we know from	16:13
21			Garda Quinn he said he met Superintendent Murray very	
22			briefly on only two occasions. He was not offering	
23			is that right.	
24		Α.	Well, one. I can't even remember if there was a	
25			second.	16:14
26	797	Q.	CHAIRMAN: One. Okay. He's not offering a judgment on	
27			the matter. He is giving an impression as to what he	
28			thought. I think a certain looseness I think	
29			Mr. O'Brien's question is legitimate, especially since	

1		Garda Quinn volunteered that he thought Garda Keogh,	
2		the treatment was a bit off. That's what he said.	
3		Mr. O'Brien is entitled to you're entitled to say	
4		perfectly well, Garda Quinn is relating at least	
5		secondhand if not thirdhand, because he's talking about	16:14
6		Dr. Oghuvbu's concerns about Garda Keogh. I mean, it's	
7		an inquiry, Mr. O'Higgins, you will have to trust me to	
8		use my skill and judgment in assessing evidence. But	
9		what he, what the welfare officer actually said was,	
10		look, I have been dealing with this man for a long	16:15
11		time, I made all my notes about him being drunk, and	
12		here's my impression, I thought he was being treated a	
13		bit off and that was his impression, on the basis of	
14		what he understood from (a) Garda Keogh and (b)	
15		Dr. Oghuvbu. And Dr. Oghuvbu was saying, what do you	16:15
16		think? And he said for what it is worth.	
17		MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: May it please you, Chairman.	
18		CHAIRMAN: At this point I take your point. I know	
19		that technically what you are saying is correct, but I	
20		don't think that Mr. O'Brien is asking anything	16:15
21		improper or unreasonable in an inquiry. Mr. O'Brien,	
22		you know the reality and I am sure that Garda Quinn	
23		knows the reality. But he is offering an opinion. He	
24		is offering an opinion. There it is.	
25			16:15
26		So you said it seemed a bit off. You thought he was	
27		getting treated a bit harshly.	
28	Α.	Mm-hmm.	

29 798 Q. CHAIRMAN: That was your impression?

1		Α.	Yeah.	
2	799	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And you weren't making a judgment having	
3			heard and given reasonable notice and following fair	
4			procedures, gone and interviewing Superintendent Murray	
5			and ultimately coming to you were just giving an	16:16
6			impression that you had from talking to Garda Keogh	
7			over the years and talking to Dr. Oghuvbu, is that	
8			about the situation?	
9		Α.	That is exactly it, yes.	
10	800	Q.	MR. O'BRIEN: Just finally, does that remain your view?	16:16
11			CHAIRMAN: Say again.	
12	801	Q.	MR. O'BRIEN: Does that remain your view today, Garda	
13			Quinn?	
14		Α.	It does.	
15			MR. O'BRIEN: Thank you. I have no further questions.	16:16
16			CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Mr. O'Higgins, you can	
17			explore that if you feel like it but I think Garda	
18			Quinn has made it very clear what the basis of his	
19			opinion was or at least between himself and myself I	
20			think we have made it very clear.	16:16
21				
22			GARDA QUI NN WAS CROSS-EXAMI NED BY MR. MÍ CHEÁL O' HI GGI NS	-
23			AS FOLLOWS:	
24				
25	802	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Good afternoon, Garda Quinn.	16:16
26		Α.	Good afternoon.	
27	803	Q.	I can be reasonably brief.	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	804	Q.	Can I bring you first of all towards the end of 2015,	

1			if we can look at the notes which we can deal with very	
2			briefly because they have been gone over in some	
3			detail. On page 10619 the first entry is the 9th	
4			December '15. And if we could go down the page	
5			towards, about two-thirds of the way down there is a	16:17
6			reference to 27/12/15. Do you see that there?	
7		Α.	Yeah.	
8	805	Q.	Thanks, Mr. Kavanagh. So it reads:	
9				
10			"The member rang to say"	16:17
11				
12			This is December '15.	
13				
14			"The member rang to say he had now decided to stay on	
15			long-term sick leave until he can deal with and rectify	16:17
16			his alcohol addiction. We again spoke about work,	
17			money and his life."	
18				
19			The gist of what you were being told at that point,	
20			Garda Quinn, is that Garda Keogh had decided to stay on	16:17
21			long-term sick leave until he can sort out his alcohol	
22			problem.	
23			CHAIRMAN: The 26th was his last day as I recall it.	
24		Α.	Yes. Yeah. But I suppose might stop drinking and I	
25			suppose I could have put in at the time deal with his	16:18
26			work issues.	
27	806	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Get his life together?	
28		Α.	Yeah.	
29	807	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: And then if we look two boxes	

Τ			down for the entry for the 29/12/15 you refer to the	
2			member sending you a text. And then you say:	
3				
4			"He said he wasn't sure if he would return to work as a	
5			garda. He mentioned that his liver felt sore and	16:18
6			admitted to having drunk two bottles of wine since	
7			10: 30. "	
8				
9			So, he was relaying to you there he wasn't sure if he	
10			would return to work and this again was December '15?	16:18
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	808	Q.	Then if we can go over the page then to, I want to ask	
13			you about Chief Superintendent Wheatley, on page 10621,	
14			a few pages on, two-thirds of the way done there's an	
15			entry for the 26th April '16, you see that there. It	16:18
16			says:	
17				
18			"Chief Superintendent Wheatley rang and discussed about	
19			the possibility of her meeting or visiting the member."	
20				16:19
21			That is something you recall, is it?	
22		Α.	Very much. Very clearly.	
23	809	Q.	And then two entries down, there's another reference to	
24			the chief, 18/5/16. You rang different numbers I think	
25			for Garda Keogh and he called you back.	16:19
26				
27			"We spoke of the visit of his chief"	
28				
29			So this was after she had visited the house	

Т				
2			" and the divisional clerk. The chief enquired about	
3			his rate of pay, where he was originally from and if he	
4			was in contact with me. He was given a travel	
5			voucher. "	16:19
6				
7			I think that is a means of getting a member who is	
8			CHAIRMAN: That's right. In case he didn't have the	
9			money.	
10		Α.	Yeah.	16:19
11	810	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Fine. And then if we could	
12			again just go over the page, the last entry, there's	
13			again 28/5/16, there's a reference to:	
14				
15			"Chief Superintendent Wheatley rang and asked if	16:19
16			anything could be done to help the member get sober.	
17			We discussed what this may take in time."	
18				
19			Do you recall that conversation?	
20		Α.	Yes, very much.	16:20
21	811	Q.	All right. And then if we could ask you to go to page	
22			10624, this is a few pages on, there one entry I would	
23			ask you to treat of, it's the second entry down,	
24			12/7/16, you are referring now to the case conference	
25			at headquarters. I simply want to ask you, you have	16:20
26			noted there of this case conference in July 2016:	
27				
28			"All in attendance were pleased to hear the member was	
29			going for treatment."	

- 1 A. Yeah.
- 2 812 Q. That's your own note --
- 3 A. Yeah.
- 4 813 Q. -- of that case conference. All right.
- 5 A. Well it speaks to, you know, for anybody to go.
- 6 814 Q. Yes.
- 7 815 Q. CHAIRMAN: Everybody wanted to see him getting sober?

16:20

16:21

16:21

- 8 A. Yeah.
- 9 816 Q. MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes. And then if you turn over
- to page 10626, three pages on, the top entry, this has
- been mentioned already but I just want to ask you about
- 12 it, 10626, it's the entry for the 29/9/16, top one
- there, and this now is at a point in time I think when
- it has been indicated to Garda Keogh that he is to be
- restored to full pay, isn't that right?
- 16 A. That's right.
- 17 817 Q. And there is an offer to return to work and you relayed
- 18 that to the member, did you?
- 19 A. Not on that day, is it? No?
- 20 818 Q. Just to assist you, page 10630, the top entry for
- 21 24/6/17?
- 22 A. Oh sorry. Okay. Yes, it was on the wrong page.
- 23 819 Q. Do you have it there?
- 24 A. Yes, that's the one where I spoke about --
- 25 820 Q. "Chief Superintendent McLoughlin rang and asked me to
- 26 clarify if the client is interested in returning to
- work in Athlone. The member declined the offer to
- 28 return to work."
- 29 A. It seemed to kind of come out of nowhere. There was no

- talk before or after.
- 2 821 Q. And you are clear in your mind, are you, you relayed
- 3 that to Garda Keogh?
- 4 A. Oh absolutely, yes.
- 5 822 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, it may have occurred to Chief
- 6 Superintendent McLoughlin --
- 7 A. Pardon?
- 8 823 Q. CHAIRMAN: It may have occurred to Chief Superintendent

16:22

16:22

16:22

- 9 McLoughlin, gosh --
- 10 A. Nobody has asked him for a while.
- 11 824 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- maybe nobody has asked him would he like
- to go back?
- 13 A. Yeah, maybe somebody had heard that, you know.
- 14 825 Q. CHAIRMAN: Whether or which --
- 15 A. Yeah.
- 16 826 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- as far as you were concerned it came out
- of the blue?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 827 Q. CHAIRMAN: But you were happy to pass it on --
- 20 A. Yeah.
- 21 828 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- and say what do you think about it?
- 22 A. Yeah.
- 23 829 Q. MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: On page 15941, Garda Quinn, the
- second entry down is the 5/1/19, so 15941. So these
- are the later ones that were distributed this morning.
- 26 A. Yeah.
- 27 830 Q. And the second entry down, you spoke earlier of Garda
- 28 Keogh's honesty that he demonstrated to you in relation
- to his alcohol condition and stuff?

1		Α.	Yeah.	
2	831	Q.	There is a reference here again in his honesty of	
3			describing an unpleasant streak that he notices he has	
4			when he has drink taken?	
5		Α.	Yeah.	16:23
6	832	Q.	What form did that take?	
7		Α.	Well I don't think I noticed it, but he was telling me	
8			that, you know, he would be more likely to be reactive	
9			or touchy or he just didn't like how he well, he	
10			does never like when he is drinking. But he had it	16:23
11			categorised as feeling different about himself, being	
12			agitated or aggravated or that kind of	
13	833	Q.	All right. Just a more general question, you made	
14			reference to your earlier acquaintance with, your	
15			earlier acquaintance with	16:24
16			CHAIRMAN: Take a moment, Mr. O'Higgins, your	
17			colleagues are trying to point out something to you,	
18			take a second if you want to, so you don't miss it.	
19			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Otherwise you will be in trouble with them.	16:24
21	834	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you, Chairman, I will	
22			endeavour to do that. Just while my colleagues are	
23			trying to distract me, if I can finish my question.	
24			Your previous acquaintance with him, that was in the	
25			context of you seeing him again for an earlier, for the	16:24
26			earlier alcohol addiction, is that right?	
27		Α.	Yeah. When my colleague used to deal with him, when	
28			she was off I would, if he had a difficulty he'd ring	
29			me and it was work or alcohol related	

1	835	Q.	Yes.	
2	836	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And alcohol was a problem then.	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	837	Q.	CHAIRMAN: well, we know alcohol was a problem	
5		Α.	Yeah.	16:25
6	838	Q.	CHAIRMAN: for considerable years, we know that	
7			going right back to 2012 we know.	
8		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. O'Higgins, take your moment to	
10			consult.	16:25
11			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Sorry, Chairman, I will just	
12			get the page.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Thanks all right. Mr. O'Higgins, be at	
14			ease.	
15	839	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Yes, there was one question I	16:25
16			want to ask you, page 15946, Garda Quinn.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18	840	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: And about halfway down there is	
19			an entry for the 27th August '19. You rang Garda Keogh	
20			I think:	16:25
21				
22			"The member told me that his disciplinary issues had	
23			been dealt with by AC fanning who had since retired.	
24			He said that he was pleased to have this aspect dealt	
25			with and finalised."	16:26
26				
27			So you have noted that. Is that a recollection you	
28			have, that Garda Keogh said his disciplinary issues had	
29			been dealt with Assistant Commissioner Fanning?	

Τ		Α.	Yean, yean.	
2	841	Q.	And did he elaborate upon that at all?	
3	842	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you know what that was, his disciplinary	
4			issues?	
5		Α.	In relation to the three 9 calls that he made.	16:26
6			CHAIRMAN: Oh right.	
7		Α.	The three 9 calls. The 999 calls that he made.	
8	843	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: 999 calls. I see. And just,	
9			if we go back two pages to 15944, the second entry down	
10			from the bottom, there is an entry for 14th May '19,	16:26
11			which says:	
12				
13			"I spoke with the member at 10:25. He said that an	
14			inspector and a sergeant had called to him to discuss	
15			the report that he had made regarding [blank] and	16:27
16			[bl ank]."	
17				
18			They probably shouldn't be on the screen.	
19				
20			"He hasn't been able to stop drinking to date."	16:27
21				
22			Again you have noted that, was there a particular	
23			importance attaching to that, that you have noted it?	
24		Α.	Well, I suppose I thought considering who he was	
25			talking about it. I hadn't heard it before. I hadn't	16:27
26			ever heard him mention the people that he mentioned	
27			there.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
29		Α.	So I thought normally we just talk about, you know,	

Τ			Garda Stuff.	
2			CHAIRMAN: I understand.	
3	844	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: And without	
4	845	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But this was gardaí telling him about a	
5			report that had been completed.	16:27
6		Α.	Yeah.	
7	846	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Notifying him in other words, is that right?	
8		Α.	Not	
9	847	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I don't want to go into too much detail	
10			obviously.	16:27
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	848	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But somebody was telling him here is the	
13			result.	
14		Α.	Yeah, somebody told him something and he made a report	
15			about it and these two guards came to	16:27
16	849	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Tell him the result of the investigation?	
17		Α.	Or	
18			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Or something.	
19	850	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: And were these gentlemen alive?	
20			CHAIRMAN: were who alive?	16:28
21			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: The gentlemen the subject of	
22			the report. We needn't go back up. It has been	
23			redacted since	
24			MR. KELLY: Chairman, I am far from convinced this is	
25			actually even on the inquiry never mind within the	16:28
26			remit but as it happens, we all know that both those	
27			people at that date were dead and had been dead for	
28			sometime.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	

1			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: What I am getting at	
2			CHAIRMAN: So we're not really concerned	
3			MR. KELLY: It's way off the inquiry.	
4			CHAIRMAN: but whatever they did, somebody came to	
5			him and told him the result of an investigation. Is	16:28
6			that right? As to which, we are not really concerned.	
7			That is my understanding. Now if I am wrong about	
8			that, Mr. O'Higgins, tell me.	
9	851	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Was it your understanding of	
10			matters, Garda Quinn	16:28
11		Α.	I never heard him talk about the statement or the	
12			report or the incident before.	
13	852	Q.	Right. It was a report that he had made, was it?	
14		Α.	He had made or somebody, as far as I know somebody had	
15			told him something about these two people and he had	16:28
16			reported	
17			CHAIRMAN: But is it of any materiality, Mr. O'Higgins?	
18			Mr. Murphy thinks it is of some materiality.	
19			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: I suppose it just goes to the	
20			question of well, in fairness it is 2019 we're	16:29
21			dealing with. But it perhaps goes to issues of	
22			paranoia and so forth, but it is a matter that can be	
23			dealt with in submissions.	
24			CHAIRMAN: If it is there in Garda Quinn's notes then	
25			it seems to me that subject to any objection or any	16:29
26			submission that is made it may be referred to in the	
27			course of a submission or an argument. But I don't	
28			think there's much point in pursuing it in questions,	
29			Mr. O'Higgins.	

1 MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: May it please you, Chairman. 2 That concludes my questions. 3 CHAI RMAN: Thank you very much. MS. O' ROURKE: I don't have any questions. 4 5 CHAI RMAN: Thanks very much. Ms. McGrath, are you 16:29 6 happy? I mean, would you like to ask any more 7 questions, Ms. McGrath? 8 MS. McGRATH: Can I just say one matter arising? 9 CHAI RMAN: Yes. 10 16:30 11 GARDA QUINN WAS THEN RE-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH: 12 MS. McGRATH: I think at the outset, Garda Quinn, I 853 Q. asked you about the confidentiality of your role and 13 14 the level of reporting up of specifics or incidents or 15 detail, and you said it was very unusual, is that 16:30 16 right? 17 Yeah. Α. 18 But there were exceptions? 854 Q. 19 Yeah. Well, we call it within the service, which is my Α. service and superintendent, we don't call that 20 16:30 breaching confidentiality. 21 22 But I think here on your evidence we see you speaking 855 Q. 23 with Chief Superintendent Wheatley --24 No, I answered her, you know. 25 So there was contact made with you effectively --856 Ο. 16:30 26 oh yes. Α. 27 857 -- by senior management? Q. 28 Yeah, but I mean to say, I would --Α. 29 CHAIRMAN: You're not discussing with them.

1		Α.	No.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Your	
3		Α.	Because Chief Superintendent Wheatley didn't have any	
4			contact, she would say I haven't heard from Nick or	
5			about Nick, how is he and I would say he's fine or he's	16:30
6			whatever. I mean to say, I don't have, I don't have	
7			confidentiality and not telling people how somebody is	
8			if they ask me. I wouldn't have that as confidential.	
9	858	Q.	CHAIRMAN: There wouldn't be a bar to somebody, if	
10			somebody, the chief superintendent rang up and said how	16:31
11			is he, it would be okay to say he's fine.	
12		Α.	Like Chief McLoughlin asked me on numerous occasions,	
13			John Barrett met me in the canteen one day and he said	
14			how is my friend or whatever he called him. Most	
15			people just say, how is he? Not too many people have	16:31
16			asked. But I would always tell, kind of a general	
17			thing, okay, or whatever. But I wouldn't be telling	
18			them too much apart from how he is.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
20			MS. McGRATH: Okay. Thank you, Garda Quinn.	16:31
21			THE WITNESS: Okay.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much and you are free to go do	
23			you now. Thank you very much.	
24			THE WITNESS: Thank you, Chairman.	
25				16:31
26			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL WEDNESDAY, 29TH	
27			JANUARY 2020 AT 10: 30AM	
28				
29				

			•	1
1	88:14, 88:27, 194:9	2005 [6] - 6:25, 6:26,	23RD [6] - 74:27,	34 [2] - 3:19, 189:12
	12/7/16 [1] - 203:24	6:27, 7:2, 56:11	75:22, 147:20, 169:5,	35 [2] - 3:19, 6:19
	125 [3] - 47:14,	2012 [1] - 207:7	184:4, 189:23	36 [1] - 3:20
'15 [5] - 89:7, 161:4,	47:22, 118:2	2013 [2] - 6:26, 7:2	24 [2] - 3:13, 150:23	3642 [4] - 142:14,
201:4, 201:12, 202:10	12:11 [1] - 121:2	2014 [9] - 1:3, 7:21,	24/6/17 [1] - 204:21	151:26, 194:9
'16 [2] - 89:7, 202:15	12TH [4] - 122:7,	89:7, 105:12, 109:20,	24TH [4] - 60:1,	365-DAY [1] - 171:7
'19 [3] - 176:28,	151:1, 157:25, 185:7	110:12, 125:16,	137:13, 168:5, 170:7	37 [4] - 3:20, 195:2,
207:19, 208:10	13 [5] - 2:30, 3:8,	127:1, 156:19	25 [1] - 3:14	196:13
	109:17, 127:4, 154:25	2014) [1] - 88:15	2509 [2] - 55:2, 59:29	3729 [3] - 63:4,
1	131 [1] - 96:22	2015 [28] - 63:10,	2510 [1] - 56:7	63:10, 63:28
	133 [1] - 1:18	64:1, 68:15, 68:23,	26 [1] - 3:14	3730 [3] - 63:4,
4 2.2 404.2	1366 [1] - 116:28	78:12, 85:9, 85:25,	26/12/2015 [1] -	63:13, 63:17
1 [3] - 3:2, 104:3,	139/10 [3] - 96:7,	87:23, 87:26, 93:16,	180:13	3790 [2] - 87:25,
137:3	98:4, 99:11	93:18, 93:22, 93:28,	26TH [10] - 60:9,	93:15
1(1 [1] - 137:24	139/2010 [1] - 77:29	102:29, 107:12,	61:20, 61:25, 62:10,	3791 [1] - 93:21
10 [1] - 3:6	14 [2] - 3:8, 47:22	112:16, 113:2, 123:6,	64:13, 180:7, 183:2,	38 [1] - 3:21
100% [1] - 160:17	14/12 [2] - 177:11,	143:29, 144:1, 147:4,	187:21, 201:23,	39 [1] - 3:21
103 [1] - 5:8	177:23	156:20, 170:22,	202:15	3:00PM [1] - 139:16
104 [1] - 5:12	140 [1] - 5:13	174:24, 177:5,	27 [2] - 3:15, 186:27	3RD [2] - 158:18,
10616 [2] - 168:7,	142 [1] - 5:17	186:28, 194:12,	27/10 [1] - 175:8	185:3
168:17	14:05 [2] - 132:16,	200:29	27/12 [1] - 180:28	
10617 [1] - 171:23	132:18	2016 [28] - 34:8,	27/12/15 [1] - 201:6	4
10619 [3] - 195:2,	14TH [2] - 154:26,	53:26, 60:1, 67:11,	27TH [1] - 207:19	7
196:13, 201:3	208:10	67:14, 89:15, 89:21,	28 [5] - 3:16, 23:25,	
10621 [1] - 202:13	15 [1] - 3:9	103:29, 104:1, 119:8,	23:29, 162:14, 162:18	4 [2] - 2:18, 3:3
10624 [1] - 203:22	15740 [1] - 137:19	122:7, 123:8, 123:9,	28/5/16 [1] - 203:13	4,000 [1] - 165:25
10626 [2] - 204:10,	15744 [2] - 138:13,	123:19, 135:23,	28TH [1] - 184:16	4/1 [1] - 181:13
204:12	138:14	137:13, 151:2,	28TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1	41 [1] - 95:25
10630 [1] - 204:20	15941 [4] - 168:9,	157:25, 158:18,	29 [1] - 3:16	4113 [2] - 74:29,
10:25 [1] - 208:13	190:20, 205:23,	181:10, 183:2,	29/12/15 [1] - 202:1	75:22
10:30 [1] - 202:7	205:24	183:28, 185:1,	29/9/16 [1] - 204:12	42 [1] - 162:16
10:30AM [1] - 212:27	15944 [1] - 208:9	185:28, 186:19,	29TH [1] - 212:26	44 [2] - 190:24
10:36 [3] - 123:20,	15945 [1] - 190:24	187:10, 203:26	2:10 [1] - 104:17	4507 [2] - 74:17
123:21, 131:27	15946 [1] - 207:16	2017 [7] - 1:5, 1:9,	2ND [6] - 35:22,	48 [1] - 88:14
10TH [3] - 170:22,	15TH [2] - 186:28,	105:12, 187:11,	56:11, 64:17, 68:23,	4TH [3] - 65:7, 69:2,
171:2, 192:24	188:17	187:16, 187:21, 188:1	97:18, 97:29	96:28
11 [3] - 3:7, 58:28,	16 [2] - 1:5, 3:9	2018 [11] - 1:9,	37.10, 37.23	
189:20	16TH [1] - 60:22	74:27, 95:27, 168:1,	3	5
11-13 [1] - 4:3	17 [2] - 1:9, 3:10	188:15, 188:17,	<u> </u>	
11.34 [4] - 81:5,	18 [1] - 3:10	189:1, 189:12,		.
102:4, 102:6, 102:10	18/12 [1] - 178:15	189:23, 190:9, 190:10	3 [2] - 3:3, 80:7	5 [1] - 3:4
11.34(2) [1] - 99:15	18/5/16 [1] - 202:24	2019 [4] - 190:22,	3,400 [1] - 165:26	5/1/19 [1] - 205:24
11.37 [18] - 52:16,	183 [3] - 125:18,	190:25, 192:6, 210:20	30 [2] - 3:17, 187:20	51 [1] - 2:17
52:18, 53:6, 53:17,	127:2, 127:11	2020 [5] - 1:18, 6:2,	3097 [2] - 116:23,	54 [2] - 47:14, 47:22
54:19, 96:2, 102:5,	18TH [6] - 55:9,	168:5, 172:11, 212:27	116:25	5TH [2] - 123:19,
102:11, 102:12,	113:1, 180:4, 180:5,	20TH [5] - 60:22,	30TH [2] - 95:27,	132:16
102:13, 102:14,	183:17, 196:12	63:10, 64:1, 65:6,	188:29	
102:18, 102:24,	19 [2] - 3:11, 177:6	171:24	31 [1] - 3:17	6
125:12, 126:5, 126:9,	19 [2] - 3.11, 177.0	21 [1] - 3:12	32 [2] - 2:23, 3:18	
127:27, 128:5	192 [1] - 1.9	21/4/2015 [1] -	3219 [1] - 77:26	6 [2] - 3:4, 5:5
11.37(1 [1] - 136:24	19TH [3] - 51:18,	168:18	3221 [2] - 81:2, 99:12	60 [2] - 96:22, 96:27
11.37S [1] - 54:14	87:26, 112:16	211 [1] - 5:20	3222 [1] - 84:20	6146 [1] - 97:22
11746 [1] - 118:14	57.20, 112.10	2187 [1] - 33:17	3253 [2] - 48:6, 51:28	6160 [1] - 97:22
11747 [1] - 120:27	2	21ST [3] - 103:29,	3254 [2] - 51:29,	6165 [4] - 107:11,
11797 [1] - 95:25		147:4, 147:19	141:9	107:15, 151:10, 154:6
11799 [1] - 96:5		22 [1] - 3:12	3266 [1] - 60:4	6167 [1] - 157:27
11:03 [2] - 135:23,	2 [3] - 2:31, 3:2, 4:10	22ND [5] - 51:18,	3267 [3] - 58:28,	6170 [1] - 93:5
139:5	20 [1] - 3:11	65:4, 67:8, 67:22,	60:4, 60:10	6171 [1] - 90:10
11TH [1] - 174:29	200 [2] - 5:19, 166:1	147:20	33 [2] - 3:18, 188:16	6TH [4] - 60:17,
12 [5] - 3:7, 4:9,	1	1 33 m 2.42 4E0.02	1	
	2003 [1] - 144:4	23 [2] - 3:13, 150:23	33-34 [1] - 4:14	60:18, 135:23, 139:4

	04.0.00.40.00.45	000.04		
7	84:8, 93:10, 99:19,	206:24	ADVANCE[2] -	AGS [1] - 130:19
	99:26, 104:9, 107:19,	ACRONYMS[1] -	62:13, 71:21	AGSI [3] - 4:5,
	109:4, 109:5, 109:15,	105:17	ADVERSELY [1] -	120:25, 127:29
7 [4] - 1:9, 2:24, 3:5,	109:16, 109:22,	ACT [1] - 94:21	114:13	AHEAD[8] - 19:22,
4:15	110:16, 120:22,	ACT [2] - 1:3, 1:8	ADVICE [8] - 23:12,	57:6, 61:13, 62:29,
77 [1] - 5:6	120:23, 133:2,	ACTED[1] - 181:22	68:11, 68:17, 82:10,	70:24, 77:16, 135:15,
7TH [1] - 139:15	133:11, 133:18,	ACTING [2] - 3:6,	83:25, 98:25, 99:9,	141:3
	134:14, 151:21,	3:12	126:10	AID [6] - 150:1,
8	151:22, 152:3, 164:11	ACTING [3] - 68:12,	ADVICES [3] - 68:11,	162:12, 163:5,
	ABSENCES [7] -	98:4, 182:2	82:18, 96:14	165:12, 165:18,
8 [2] - 3:5, 3:28	59:9, 63:14, 87:3,	ACTION [4] - 1:27,	ADVISE [1] - 131:22	182:20
	88:14, 92:10, 152:8,	72:8, 116:9, 195:21	ADVISED [4] - 79:11,	AIDAN [2] - 3:9, 4:7
8874 [1] - 68:29	155:9	ACTIONS [5] - 95:9,	79:28, 97:5, 99:4	AIM [1] - 113:12
8TH [6] - 60:16, 69:3,	ABSENT [10] - 7:26,	109:2, 112:1, 114:4,	ADVISES [1] - 79:1	AIR [1] - 53:3
144:4, 156:24,	10:9, 10:19, 11:13,	166:27	ADVISING [1] -	AISLING [2] - 2:10,
185:29, 190:25	14:5, 21:18, 58:13,	ACTIVATED[1] -	187:3	3:21
_	98:19, 102:6, 115:26	164:29	AFFAIRS[3] -	ALAN [2] - 3:8, 3:12
9	ABSOLUTE [1] -	ACTIVE [1] - 70:12	142:27, 143:11,	ALARMED[1] -
	146:29	ACTUAL[4] - 32:22,	143:27	192:2
9 [3] - 3:6, 208:5,	ABSOLUTELY [18] -	58:20, 76:9, 150:23	AFFECTED [2] -	ALBEIT [1] - 99:7
208:7	11:21, 12:19, 12:22,	AD [1] - 34:15	153:22, 159:1	ALCOHOL [30] -
9/12 [2] - 122:24,	13:2, 23:11, 23:14,	ADD [1] - 173:2	AFFECTING [2] -	88:8, 88:25, 89:4,
177:6	26:17, 53:19, 65:3,	ADDICTION [12] -	87:5, 114:13	89:8, 89:11, 89:19,
9/12/2015 [2] - 151:1,	69:8, 72:9, 92:6,	88:8, 92:15, 119:1,	AFFECTS[1] -	92:11, 92:15, 93:27,
151:10	94:23, 95:1, 95:5,	154:20, 162:14,	101:12	114:12, 155:6, 160:6,
92 [6] - 109:16,	169:16, 178:22, 205:4	174:4, 176:12, 177:8,	AFTERCARE[1] -	160:29, 161:4, 161:6,
125:18, 127:3, 127:7,	AC [2] - 135:29,	181:2, 194:22,	191:6	170:26, 181:1, 181:7,
129:19, 129:20	207:23	201:16, 206:26	AFTERNOON [8] -	181:10, 184:2,
94 [1] - 118:2	ACCEPT[15] - 11:6,	ADDICTIONS [1] -	104:22, 124:18,	189:15, 191:3, 195:7,
95 [1] - 5:7	11:8, 19:24, 25:3,	183:15	139:24, 140:28,	201:16, 201:21,
9693 [1] - 139:16	34:11, 34:17, 40:14,	ADDITION [1] - 70:20	142:14, 142:16,	205:29, 206:26,
9694 [1] - 139:3	40:17, 40:26, 46:17,	ADDITIONAL [8] -	200:25, 200:26	206:29, 207:2, 207:4
9695 [3] - 123:16,	48:2, 55:1, 61:21,	48:22, 50:25, 59:11,	AFTERWARDS[2] -	ALCOHOLISM [1] -
123:20, 124:17	131:6, 197:17	59:16, 75:18, 75:25,	103:2, 117:5	190:23
9722 [3] - 90:4,	ACCEPTED[4] -	76:28, 168:7	AGENCIES [2] -	ALISON [1] - 3:25
103:23, 103:27	8:14, 18:6, 35:16,	ADDRESS [4] -	110:13, 110:20	ALIVE [8] - 24:9,
999 [2] - 208:7, 208:8	46:19	114:27, 133:11,	AGGRAVATED[1] -	31:23, 48:29, 62:28,
9TH [8] - 107:11,	ACCESS [4] -	154:15, 194:22	206:12	209:19, 209:20
117:3, 152:23,	114:26, 119:1,	ADDRESSED [2] -	AGITATED[1] -	ALLEGATION [3] -
182:19, 194:12,	154:14, 167:15	184:14, 185:25	206:12	30:10, 93:1, 188:22
195:9, 195:11, 201:3	ACCESSED[1] -	ADDRESSING [1] -	AGO [9] - 25:13,	ALLEGATIONS [5] -
	104:6	139:18	36:9, 142:27, 143:11,	172:8, 172:20,
Α	ACCIDENT[1] -	ADJOURNED [3] -	143:26, 144:25,	181:17, 181:20, 187:5
	137:3	74:8, 104:19, 212:26	196:3, 196:14, 196:25	ALLEGED [5] - 59:6,
A A 00-04	ACCORDANCE[5] -	ADJUDICATES[1] -	AGREE [11] - 42:7,	90:1, 91:4, 93:8,
AA [1] - 88:21	91:12, 98:4, 98:20, 115:21, 134:2	53:11	46:6, 78:11, 87:2,	93:11
ABILITY [1] - 114:13	ACCORDINGLY [1] -	ADJUSTED[1] -	88:6, 89:1, 89:28,	ALLEGING [3] -
ABLE [7] - 8:13,	101:20	84:10	159:20, 159:22,	11:28, 12:13, 20:1
66:19, 75:19, 103:1, 139:2, 196:2, 208:20	ACCOUNT [4] -	ADMINISTRATION	187:12, 195:26	ALLOCATION[1] -
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	82:17, 83:2, 88:13,	[1] - 120:29	AGREED [13] - 41:7,	175:15
ABOVE-NAMED [1] - 1:26	117:10	ADMINISTRATIVE	41:9, 41:17, 42:13,	ALLOW [5] - 59:23,
	ACCURATE[1] -	[1] - 140:14	100:18, 106:22,	66:28, 67:7, 129:16,
ABSENCE [8] - 10:5,	167:24	ADMINISTRATIVE	116:1, 119:11,	158:18
107:20, 108:2, 108:20, 110:11,	ACHIEVED[1] -	[1] - 3:13	126:13, 127:15,	ALLOWABLE[1] -
118:10, 120:20, 129:3	103:6	ADMITS [3] - 160:11,	137:12, 165:26	73:10
	ACHIEVING [1] -	161:10, 173:17	AGREEMENT [5] -	ALLOWANCES[1] -
ABSENCE [31] - 23:25, 52:9, 53:22,	101:26	ADMITTED[2] -	116:2, 126:27,	153:7
58:6, 62:21, 63:21,	ACQUAINTANCE[3]	173:12, 202:6	127:29, 134:17, 135:2	ALLOWING [1] -
78:6, 80:14, 83:22,	- 206:14, 206:15,	ADOPTED [1] -	AGREEMENT[1] -	98:5
7 0.0, 00.17, 00.22,	200.11, 200.10,	41:25	122:18	ALLOWS [2] -
•	-	-	i e	-

130:18, 136:24 **ANXIOUS** [2] - 13:3, **ALONE** [1] - 160:25 102:29 ALONGSIDE [1] -ANYWAY[1] - 22:27 181:19 **APART**[4] - 146:29, ALTOGETHER [1] -176:28, 178:5, 212:18 76:9 APOLOGIES [7] -AMELIORATE [2] -27:10, 36:23, 41:3, 69:21, 69:25 61:24, 63:8, 70:8, AMEND [4] - 125:12, 74:17 126:5, 131:22, 131:24 APPARENT[1] -**AMENDED**[1] - 1:9 112:15 AMENDING[1] -APPEAL[1] - 9:2 127:27 **APPEAL** [2] - 1:13, AMENDMENT[3] -2:3 127:28, 128:13, **APPEAR** [5] - 34:26, 136:24 98:7, 135:14, 141:5, AMNESTY [1] -179.14 APPEARANCE[1] -172:21 **AMOUNT**[3] - 98:21, 39:23 125:17. 141:12 APPEARANCES[1] -AMOUNTED[1] -95.9 APPEARED[1] -**AN**[1] - 3:2 176:18 **AND** [6] - 1:3, 1:4, APPEARING[1] -98:16 1:8, 3:15, 74:8, 104.19 APPENDIX [1] -**ANDREW** [2] - 2:21, 138:5 APPLICATION [15] -ANECDOTAL [2] -52:9, 52:12, 52:18, 52:24. 53:22. 54:3. 39:5, 41:20 54:18, 54:25, 99:22, ANIMALS[1] -160:25 101:7, 101:8, 122:16, ANN [2] - 64:20, 65:7 141:10, 141:13, **ANNE** [2] - 3:7, 3:16 141:14 **APPLIES**[1] - 81:16 ANNOYANCE[1] -**APPLY** [5] - 52:16, 76:17 53:1, 78:14, 141:7, **ANNOYED**[4] - 76:8, 145:11 76:11, 76:14, 172:10 APPOINT[3] - 26:25, **ANNUAL**[1] - 170:25 26:29, 138:7 **ANSWER** [28] - 9:5, APPOINTMENT[10] 9:29, 12:11, 14:21, - 50:12, 76:9, 76:14, 15:3. 15:9. 16:25. 17:24, 19:17, 20:20, 112:27, 113:1, 113:9, 20:24, 20:26, 22:17, 113:11, 113:21, 173:9, 177:27 23:7, 23:8, 35:11, APPRECIATE [8] -38:27, 39:7, 52:22, 8:8, 28:21, 33:22, 63:29, 72:10, 89:23, 51:3, 54:22, 63:1, 113:23, 133:23, 140:19, 141:15, 63:5, 87:27 APPROACH[6] -144:29, 193:8 16:23, 43:28, 43:29, ANSWERED [5] -14:28, 15:5, 169:10, 44:1, 92:1, 173:27 196:24, 211:24 APPROPRIATE[12] -12:23. 49:4. 49:12. ANSWERING [2] -61:12, 61:14, 69:13, 35:6. 46:6 69:15, 69:17, 104:6, ANSWERS [1] -115:16, 157:5, 194:28 **APPROPRIATENES ANTHONY** [1] - 3:5 S[1] - 138:4 ANTHONY [2] -APPROVAL[1] -121:3, 123:22

80:16 APPROVE[1] -100:26 **APRIL** [19] - 35:22, 56:11. 68:22. 68:23. 88:25, 97:19, 147:4, 147:19, 154:18, 155:12, 161:3, 168:27, 169:5, 182:27, 183:2, 187:21, 188:1, 189:23, 202:15 **ARBITER** [1] - 9:10 ARBITRATION[1] -107.4 ARBITRATION[2] -106:2, 106:11 AREA[6] - 87:15, 117:23, 147:22, 147:23, 148:15, 172:12 AREAS[1] - 150:17 ARGUMENT[1] -210.27 **ARISE**[1] - 69:4 ARISES [4] - 72:13, 137:3, 141:6, 186:21 **ARISING** [6] - 7:21, 11:5, 24:2, 174:25, 184:3, 211:8 ARM [1] - 8:10 AROSE [3] - 14:7, 110:2, 134:25 ARRAN[2] - 2:23, ARRANGED[2] -112:27, 119:8 ARRANGING [2] -116:10, 119:19 **ARRIVED**[1] - 10:17 ARRIVES [2] - 25:8, 25:10 ARRIVING [2] -79:26, 82:18 **ARTICLE** [1] - 190:7 ARTICLES [2] -190:3, 190:4 ARTICULATE[1] -158:29 **AS** [13] - 1:9, 6:1, 6:13, 74:8, 77:23, 95:21, 103:20, 104:19, 104:27, 140:26, 142:9, 194:4, 200:23 ASCERTAIN[1] -

207:24 ASPECTS[3] -158:20, 168:13, 170:12 ASSERTING[1] -62:20 ASSERTION[1] -30:13 **ASSESS**[3] - 8:17, 39:22, 129:20 ASSESSED[4] -8:26, 13:4, 44:13, 130:20 ASSESSING [1] -199.8 ASSESSMENT[13] -7:20, 38:7, 40:25, 47:19, 49:16, 57:8, 64:10, 74:22, 80:19, 83:9, 92:14, 127:11, 130:10 ASSESSMENTS[1] -79:16 **ASSIGN** [1] - 127:5 ASSIGNED [3] -99:7, 175:12, 175:20 ASSIGNING [1] -179:24 ASSIST [13] - 41:15, 59:11, 80:6, 92:20, 118:5, 126:22, 140:17, 157:28, 161:7, 162:5, 163:17, 178:24, 204:20 ASSISTANCE [9] -91:26, 106:4, 108:23, 119:12, 121:20, 141:28, 142:19. 148:25, 198:11 ASSISTANCE[5] -143:9, 150:7, 150:10, 162:8, 179:15 ASSISTANT [6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:18, 3:20 ASSISTANT[5] -74:28, 75:2, 77:4, 186:24, 207:29 ASSISTANT[4] -75:10, 81:19, 82:9, 84:28 ASSOCIATION[5] -106:16, 106:17, 106:18, 122:20 ASSOCIATIONS[1] -106:15 **ASSUME**[1] - 172:29

ASSUMED[1] -

ASSUMING [1] -

111:21

172:29 AT [1] - 212:27 ATHLONE [14] -59:23, 91:3, 91:23, 115:6, 116:15, 117:3, 147:7, 147:8, 155:18, 156:6, 161:13, 187:27, 188:14, 204:27 **ATHLONE** [1] - 4:3 ATTACHED[10] -105:4, 105:7, 105:12, 105:25, 107:2, 108:7, 120:28, 121:7, 137:12, 142:18 ATTACHING[3] -135:21, 136:3, 208:23 **ATTEMPT**[1] - 85:1 **ATTEMPTS**[1] - 67:6 ATTEND[8] - 59:23, 88:21, 122:10, 122:11, 163:24, 177:25, 177:27, 196:6 ATTENDANCE[5] -117:5, 117:19, 195:14, 195:23, 203:28 ATTENDED [9] -107:4, 107:9, 117:23, 119:17, 121:11, 157:24, 163:15, 180:5, 185:2 ATTENDEE[5] -114:5, 122:8, 163:10, 163:11, 163:16 ATTENDEES [7] -107:24, 107:26, 108:4, 114:5, 115:19, 158:2, 163:10 ATTENDING [3] -112:4, 177:11, 185:24 ATTENTION [5] -10:15, 20:12, 21:18, 57:2, 96:24 ATTRIBUTED[1] -87:3 ATTRIBUTES[1] -179:14 ATTRIBUTING[1] -**AUDIO**[1] - 29:16 **AUGUST**[7] - 69:3, 173:25, 173:26, 185:28, 185:29, 186:13, 207:19 **AUTHOR** [1] - 59:29 AUTHORITIES [2] -130:29, 181:22 **AUTOMATICALLY** [2] - 46:15, 70:26

ASPECT[7] - 40:7,

66:15, 74:14, 141:18,

144:20, 156:29,

AVAILABLE [8] -64:3, 82:24, 121:11, 122:21, 158:20, 166:18, 166:19 **AVAILING** [1] - 91:25 AWARE [33] - 13:5, 30:14, 35:26, 35:27, 39:10, 39:11, 39:13, 39:15, 44:10, 52:8, 53:19, 53:21, 57:29, 62:16, 78:19, 87:22, 89:7, 89:16, 89:20, 91:25, 92:4, 97:3, 97:9, 97:14, 97:28, 104:3, 119:29, 155:7, 155:10, 165:7, 167:22. 168:24. 186:15 AWARENESS [2] -104:1, 178:25 **AWFUL**[1] - 13:7 AWKWARD[1] -181.17 AWOL [2] - 173:10, 174:19

В

BACKGROUND[3] -47:1, 125:13, 148:21 **BAD**[2] - 146:1, 192.13 BALANCED[1] -190:15 BALBRIGGAN[2] -104:29, 105:4 BAR [1] - 212:9 **BAR** [1] - 2:31 BARRETT[6] -128:10. 132:20. 135:24 139:19 187:2, 212:13 BARRIERS [1] - 95:3 BARTLETT[1] -101:1 BARTLETT'S [3] -99:25, 100:16, 102:27 BASE [1] - 29:21 BASED [5] - 15:16, 83:7, 107:21, 130:10 **BASIC** [2] - 14:18, 50:16 BASIS [12] - 22:25, 25:8, 39:28, 63:4, 63:20, 92:9, 96:16, 103:3, 104:8, 130:10, 199:13, 200:18

BASTION[1] - 4:2

BE.. [1] - 196:9

156:11, 186:15 BECOMES [1] -150:5 BEEN [2] - 104:26, 142:8 BEGINNING [3] -102:28, 171:14, 172:16 **BEGINS** [1] - 90:24 BEHALF [4] - 6:16, 106:23, 107:5, 121:11 BEHAVIOURS [2] -9:1, 9:9 **BEHIND** [2] - 10:21, 152:7 BELIEF [1] - 151:14 BELL [1] - 131:14 **BELOW** [1] - 138:8 BENEFICIAL [2] -115:14, 157:3 BENEFIT [3] - 47:14, 72:29, 132:14 BEST [10] - 33:23, 70:8, 76:20, 76:28, 112:21. 114:17. 116:6, 129:16, 173:7, 197:4 **BETTER** [3] - 135:15, 141:4, 162:21 **BETWEEN** [22] -9:24, 10:2, 30:6, 41:23, 42:27, 43:6, 43:7, 43:28, 48:22, 48:25, 51:18, 54:23, 57:24, 82:12, 87:7, 88:26, 105:17, 127:21, 129:3, 134:14, 153:6, 200:19 BIG [8] - 17:14, 28:9, 133:28, 153:5, 153:9, 157:19, 179:2, 189:19 BIGGER [1] - 175:25 BIGGEST [1] -160:16 BINGE [1] - 88:27 BIRDS [1] - 160:25 BIT [33] - 9:23, 19:26, 28:25, 29:2, 38:27, 47:17, 68:8, 71:5, 73:23, 83:16, 85:12, 123:23, 125:3, 138:17, 144:6, 145:17, 147:23,

148:23, 149:10,

BEAR [1] - 9:19

156:24, 181:23,

186.24

BECAME [7] - 44:10,

BECOME [3] - 30:14,

92:4, 156:13, 156:17,

159:22, 174:3, 192:6, 192:8, 192:24, 196:10, 197:14, 198:1, 198:6, 199:2, 199:13, 199:26, 199:27 BL [13] - 2:7, 2:9, 2:10. 2:15. 2:21. 2:28. 2:28, 3:24, 3:24, 3:25, 4:1, 4:8, 4:12 BLACK [1] - 67:4 **BLANK** [2] - 166:28, 208:15 **BLANK]** [1] - 208:16 BLOCKS [1] - 168:29 BLUE [1] - 205:17 BOARD [5] - 158:5, 158:19, 168:16, 168:18, 168:19 **BODY** [1] - 97:21 **BOND** [1] - 144:22 BOOK [1] - 151:10 BOOKED[1] -112:18 **BORNE** [1] - 195:1 **BOTHER** [1] - 169:12 **BOTTLES**[1] - 202:6 **BOTTOM** [6] - 113:1, 123:20, 123:21, 183:18, 184:15, 208:10 **BOUT** [1] - 151:4 **BOXED** [1] - 127:6 BOXES [1] - 201:29 BRANCH [5] - 52:8, 53:21, 108:10, 143:17 BRAY [1] - 192:11 BREACHING [1] -211:21 BREAKING[1] -174:27 BREATHING[1] -136:18 BRIAN [4] - 104:23, 104:29, 123:12, 132:27 **BRIAN** [5] - 3:14, 3:16. 5:10. 104:26. 140:25 BRIAN'S [1] - 139:26 BRIEF [7] - 118:14, 137:17, 140:29, 142:14, 168:7, 168:9, 200:27 **BRIEFLY** [1] - 74:8 BRIEFLY [4] - 93:25, 165:27, 198:22, 201:2 BRING [17] - 10:14, 13:24, 19:3, 31:14, 31:25, 38:1, 38:17,

79:29, 96:23, 117:23, 126:8, 133:2, 168:3, 168:17, 191:21, 192:28, 200:29 BRINGING [2] -65:27, 71:6 BRINGS [2] - 102:8, 180:10 BRODERICK [2] -139:19, 139:20 BROKEN [2] - 8:10, 54:29 BROUGHT [12] -46:26, 55:22, 57:1, 70:29, 71:18, 116:14, 116:17, 116:19, 116:21, 118:12, 135:7, 195:14 BRYAN [3] - 77:2, 108:17, 121:4 BUILD [3] - 29:4, 144:22, 164:2 **BUILDING** [6] - 29:4, 29:13, 30:1, 30:2, 30:7, 34:27 BULLIED [1] - 27:22 BULLYING [15] -8:28, 10:6, 18:17, 21:11, 24:18, 26:6, 27:15, 27:20, 74:14, 76:2, 91:14, 186:20, 187:5, 187:17, 188:23 **BURKE** [1] - 4:13 BUSIER [1] - 175:25 BUSINESS [1] -192:18 BY [31] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:29, 3:25, 4:1, 4:9, 4:12, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:12, 5:13, 5:17, 5:18, 5:19, 5:20, 6:13, 77:22, 95:21, 103:20, 104:27, 140:25, 142:9, 194:4, 200:22, 211:11

C

C&A [2] - 106:1,

107:2
CAGNEY [1] - 3:16
CANNOT [2] 116:20, 133:4
CANTEEN [1] 212:13
CAPACITY [3] 78:15, 108:14, 147:9
CAPTURE [2] -

137:25, 170:2 CAPTURED[3] -35:1, 110:10, 111:8 **CAR** [1] - 34:19 CARE [4] - 50:3, 92:2, 104:7, 162:13 CAREER [2] -194:21, 194:26 **CARR**[1] - 3:15 CARR [6] - 107:23, 123:22, 135:28, 139:1, 139:17, 140:4 **CARRICK** [1] - 2:12 **CARRICK-ON-SHANNON** [1] - 2:12 CARRIED[2] -84:26 95:4 **CARROLL** [1] - 2:15 **CARRY** [5] - 9:11, 94:19, 127:28, 136:18. 141:7 CARRYING [1] -137:5 CARTHAGE[1] -2:16 **CASE** [119] - 10:12, 10:15. 10:26. 11:26. 12:6, 12:28, 13:13, 14:11, 14:24, 15:19, 16:23, 17:1, 18:11, 18:16, 18:24, 19:23, 19:27, 21:16, 21:20, 25:19, 25:20, 27:21, 27:26, 32:14, 32:18, 37:26, 38:12, 38:13, 42:1, 42:6, 43:2, 43:3, 43:11, 43:21, 44:1, 45:19, 46:2, 48:28, 50:14, 51:14, 54:13, 67:13, 69:8, 71:27, 76:3, 78:29, 79:6, 79:9, 80:13, 80:25, 81:28, 84:12, 84:28, 86:17, 87:21, 92:8, 92:22, 93:3, 96:15, 99:22, 107:5, 107:9, 107:11. 107:12. 107:14, 109:26, 110:4, 118:6, 118:18, 119:7, 119:13, 119:17, 120:4, 121:19, 121:21, 122:4, 122:5, 122:7, 122:10, 122:22, 122:23, 123:5, 123:8, 129:10, 130:9, 131:7, 131:18, 131:25,

132:11, 133:20,

133:23, 149:23,

149:24, 150:9,

150:11, 150:28, 198:28 151:27, 152:7, 155:26, 155:29, 167:10, 170:12, 172:11, 178:6, 179:1, 179:2, 185:2, 185:7, 185:21, 203:8, 203:24, 203:26, 204:4 CASE-BY-CASE [1] -159:13 CASES [16] - 7:29, 8:5, 8:27, 13:6, 19:21, 21:4, 21:8, 24:17, 24:20, 24:26, 26:3, 27:28, 53:3, 66:20, 124:9, 133:4 **CASTLE**[1] - 1:17 CATEGORIES [2] -152:27 101:14, 101:20 **CATEGORISATION** [2] - 136:25, 139:29 CATEGORISE [4] -130:19. 130:25. 133:28, 169:2 CATEGORISED[3] -124:2, 126:4, 206:11 CATEGORISING [1] - 130:16 CATEGORY [6] -131:12 51:27, 54:20, 101:11, 101:16, 134:7, 136:8 **CAUSAL** [5] - 9:8, 47:6, 53:12, 87:7, 134:14 CAUSALITY[8] -124:29, 126:28, 127:2, 127:10, 130:8, 130:20, 131:5, 136:21 CAUSATION[2] -87:13, 101:25 14:27 CAUSED[2] - 9:1, 92:24 **CAUSES** [2] - 50:21, 90.1 CAUSING [7] -11:16, 22:6, 22:20, 23:6, 24:3, 28:3, 91:4 CENTRAL[1] -167:10 CENTRE [2] -165:20, 186:1 CENTRES [1] -162.19 **CERT**[2] - 30:15, 152:19 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 CERTAIN [10] -94:21, 100:18, 31:25, 55:22, 61:29, 63:24, 66:29, 71:12, 103:15, 104:22, 105:16, 109:7, 111:1, 98:21, 171:8, 183:29,

CERTAINLY [14] -12:25, 45:9, 55:23, 63:29, 103:17, 116:13, 122:21, 123:15, 135:7, 135:11, 155:14, 162:24, 178:6, 197:17 CERTAINTY[1] -CERTIFICATE [6] -96:2, 102:27, 127:21, 138:5, 138:11, 138:22 CERTIFICATES [8] -79:24, 81:21, 97:24, 99:25, 100:16, 131:12, 138:13, **CERTIFICATION**[2] - 101:29, 167:6 CERTIFIED [5] -22:7, 23:9, 58:14, 80:14. 99:25 CERTIFIES [1] -**CERTIFY** [3] - 1:24, 98:29, 100:21 CERTIFYING [1] -**CERTS** [4] - 20:12, 58:23, 152:11, 152:22 **CHAIN** [3] - 56:20, 67:11, 67:13 **CHAIR** [1] - 11:10 CHAIR [4] - 118:7, 126:2, 128:18, 172:25 CHAIRING [2] -125:7. 135:9 CHAIRMAN[1] -CHAIRMAN[100] -6:18, 8:9, 11:24, 15:7, 17:13, 17:27, 21:2, 23:17, 25:18, 27:3, 27:4, 27:10, 28:21, 29:15, 34:15, 38:28, 42:9, 42:29, 43:16, 44:4, 44:17, 45:9, 45:25, 45:26, 47:26, 48:26, 55:4, 59:4, 70:4, 70:8, 72:29, 73:8, 73:13, 73:16, 73:19, 73:25, 74:6, 74:12, 75:19, 77:15, 77:16, 77:18, 78:6, 81:13, 83:17, 85:14, 90:7, 92:20, 93:17,

102:4, 102:6, 102:8, 111:23, 112:12, 118:5, 118:26, 102:12, 102:14, 122:26, 123:14, 103:14, 103:17, 123:27, 125:3, 103:24, 103:27, 126:22, 135:16, 104:15, 104:24, 136:13, 137:17, 105:2, 111:9, 111:11, 138:12, 141:8, 111:15, 111:17, 141:13, 141:25, 111:19, 111:21, 142:4, 142:13, 111:24, 118:8, 144:21, 152:5, 128:12, 128:16, 152:25, 152:28, 128:18, 128:20, 160:14, 161:7, 169:6, 134:26, 141:1, 141:4, 178:24, 179:10, 141:24, 141:26, 183:9, 193:2, 193:9, 142:6, 142:12, 193:15, 193:18, 142:28, 143:6, 143:8, 193:22, 197:15, 143:13, 143:19, 197:17, 197:19, 143:22, 143:25, 197:20, 198:9, 145:6, 145:8, 145:10, 199:17, 206:21, 149:11, 149:13, 207:11, 209:24, 149:16, 149:21, 211:1, 212:24 150:25, 153:13, CHAIRMAN [261] -153:17, 153:20, 1:12, 6:4, 6:6, 6:9, 156:19, 156:22, 156:24, 160:19, 15:13. 16:16. 16:19. 160:21. 160:24. 16:21, 17:4, 17:9, 17:14, 17:17, 17:20, 160:27, 162:20, 17:23, 17:28, 21:3, 162:22, 163:20, 21:21, 21:23, 21:26, 164:16, 164:18, 165:28, 166:4, 166:6, 22:3. 22:5. 22:14. 22:17, 22:26, 22:29, 166:9, 166:11, 23:5, 23:12, 23:15, 166:13, 166:16, 166:20, 166:22, 25:10, 25:20, 25:25, 166:24. 171:2. 171:5. 27:7, 27:12, 27:15, 27:18, 28:8, 28:12, 171:8, 171:10, 28:20, 28:23, 29:20, 171:13, 171:17, 172:28, 173:7, 174:6, 29:25, 40:27, 41:1, 41:4. 41:28. 42:2. 174:9, 174:11, 42:7, 42:10, 42:12, 176:12, 176:15, 42:18, 42:24, 43:1, 176:18, 176:27, 43:3, 43:10, 43:18, 192:1, 192:14, 192 16 193 12 43:24, 44:5, 44:14. 44:18, 44:24, 44:27, 193:16, 193:19, 45:1, 45:27, 69:28, 193:23, 193:25, 70:3, 70:5, 70:7, 70:9, 193:28, 194:1, 70:17, 70:19, 71:14, 198:13, 198:26, 72:12, 72:18, 72:23, 199:18, 199:29, 72:25, 73:4, 73:6, 200:2, 200:11, 73:10, 73:15, 73:18, 200:16, 201:23, 201:27, 203:8, 204:7, 73:20, 73:28, 74:2, 74:11, 74:13, 77:13, 205:5, 205:8, 205:11, 77:19, 80:29, 81:11, 205:14, 205:16, 83:16, 85:12, 85:15, 205:19, 205:21, 85:18, 85:20, 85:29, 206:16, 206:20, 207:2, 207:4, 207:6, 86:8. 86:16. 86:19. 86:23, 86:28, 87:1, 207:9. 207:13. 87:9, 90:8, 90:23, 207:17, 208:3, 208:6, 208:28, 209:2, 209:4, 90:26, 92:18, 95:16, 100:6, 100:11, 209:7, 209:9, 209:12, 100:16, 100:23, 209:16, 209:18, 100:25, 100:27, 209:20, 209:29, 101:21, 101:24, 210:2, 210:4, 210:17,

210:24, 211:3, 211:5, 211:9, 211:29, 212:2, 212:9, 212:19, 212:22 CHALLENGE [6] -24:5, 30:12, 30:24, 32:8, 41:11, 134:19 CHALLENGES [3] -129:26, 135:5, 140:1 CHALLENGING [4] -31:23, 39:27, 42:15, **CHANGE** [5] - 48:1, 134:29, 164:25, 196:2 CHANGED[11] -85:9, 128:3, 128:5, 142:24, 142:25, 143:4, 143:11, 148:25, 153:9, 188:13, 191:4 CHANGES [2] -135:16, 143:18 CHANGING [2] -47:27, 187:15 CHARGE [3] - 50:18, 106:1, 121:9 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:9 CHEALLACHÁIN[1] - 2.29 CHECK [2] - 72:12, 150:11 CHECKED[2] -145:1, 182:9 CHECKING [1] -164:13 CHERRY [1] - 73:12 **CHIEF** [19] - 3:2, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:18, 3:19, 3:20, 3:26, 5:3, 6:12, 77:22, 95:20, 103:19 CHIEF [63] - 6:4, 6:15, 6:26, 7:2, 7:14, 14:16, 16:16, 17:29, 19:5, 25:29, 27:13, 28:27, 29:17, 29:25, 33:18, 38:19, 41:6, 41:9, 41:13, 41:16, 41:23, 41:28, 43:8, 43:18, 53:5, 63:5, 68:28, 70:11, 72:14, 74:16, 77:27, 78:15, 85:20, 94:17, 95:23, 102:9, 102:17, 103:10, 104:15, 115:25, 118:1, 124:21, 127:4, 127:22, 132:19, 133:22, 138:23, 138:24, 143:2, 143:3,

144:26, 158:17, 158:24, 162:25, 165:4, 165:12, 187:4, 188:3. 202:24. 202:27, 203:2, 212:10 CHIEF [52] - 25:12, 46:2, 56:15, 58:29, 60:18, 62:23, 66:6, 73:9, 77:1, 77:25, 78:28, 79:1, 97:12, 98:25, 106:18, 121:2, 127:19, 131:27, 132:7, 136:3, 136:7, 149:28, 158:3, 159:20, 159:23, 160:1, 163:11, 163:14, 164:6, 167:11, 183:4, 183:10, 183:19, 184:7, 184:9, 184:16, 184:22, 185:4, 185:13, 185:14, 187:24, 198:14, 202:13. 202:18. 203:15. 204:25. 205:5, 205:8, 211:23, 212:3, 212:12 CHIEF'S [1] - 120:8 **CHIEFS** [1] - 54:13 **CHOICE** [1] - 147:25 CHOOSE [1] - 79:25 CHOOSING [1] -CHRISTMAS[5] -123:15, 163:15, 174:14, 180:8, 180:10 CHRONOLOGY [1] -123:17 CIRCULATED[2] -120:29, 168:8 CIRCULATING [1] -137:22 CIRCUMSTANCES [5] - 15:10, 36:13, 43:3, 73:14, 137:27 **CITING** [1] - 36:9 **CLAIM** [1] - 27:25 CLAIMS [1] - 106:21 CLARE [7] - 51:29, 108:17, 121:4, 135:29, 145:22, 158:12, 168:20 CLARIFIED [2] -147:20, 163:8 CLARIFY [17] -11:10, 15:25, 15:27, 48:15, 72:20, 100:20, 116:12, 139:2, 152:20, 169:21, 178:17, 187:25,

188:25, 191:18, 194:13, 196:15, 204:26 CLASS [1] - 76:8 CLASSIFICATION [5] - 26:11, 83:24, 83:29, 84:15, 101:11 CLASSMATE[1] -191.1 CLEAR [67] - 11:20, 12:8, 12:20, 13:2, 16:9, 16:10, 26:20, 27:3, 31:10, 32:22, 32:25, 34:1, 34:2, 34:23, 35:24, 38:25, 40:28, 41:4, 46:22, 46:24, 47:10, 47:20, 47:27, 48:2, 48:3, 48:10, 49:23, 50:29, 52:17, 53:18, 53:19, 53:25, 54:21, 55:1, 57:2, 57:11, 58:12, 58:25, 59:27, 61:10, 61:18, 63:17, 65:3, 65:4, 65:10, 65:16, 65:21, 66:9, 67:25, 68:21, 69:5, 69:8, 69:12, 72:27, 77:3, 128:3, 130:23, 132:23, 148:13, 150:13, 153:21, 155:24, 162:17, 163:1, 200:18, 200:20, 205:2 CLEARER [3] -47:17, 54:29, 153:12 CLEARLY [15] -8:17, 10:10, 10:14, 10:15, 18:27, 44:21, 68:4, 79:27, 99:6, 101:19, 111:1, 127:26, 152:10, 195:12, 202:22 CLERK [3] - 139:21, 183:21, 203:2 **CLIENT** [4] - 146:5, 146:6, 187:26, 204:26 **CLINICAL** [11] - 9:5, 13:9, 13:15, 14:14, 80:19, 87:18, 92:9, 103:8, 104:7, 104:8 CLINICALLY [4] -8:21, 8:25, 9:4, 13:4 CLOCK [1] - 98:20 CLOSED [1] - 24:5 CLOSER [2] -149:20, 192:8

CLUAIN [1] - 165:19

CLUB [1] - 75:11

CLUB [1] - 75:15

CLUE [1] - 170:4 CMO [152] - 7:27, 9:3, 9:4, 10:22, 11:14, 11:15, 13:4, 13:9, 13:14, 13:24, 14:3. 14:8, 14:21, 15:24, 16:4, 18:10, 20:15, 21:29, 22:24, 22:27, 23:1, 23:10, 23:13, 23:23, 23:24, 24:20, 26:1, 26:9, 26:16, 28:6, 31:29, 32:21, 35:4, 37:24, 38:15, 40:6, 40:19, 40:25, 44:16, 47:5, 48:10, 48:12, 49:2, 49:21, 49:24, 50:17, 50:27, 51:1, 51:5, 51:7, 51:9, 51:13, 51:17, 53:14, 53:28, 54:8, 55:23, 56:23. 57:3. 58:17. 58:18, 67:21, 67:23, 67:27, 68:22, 68:26, 71:23, 79:1, 79:5, 79:11, 79:15, 79:17, 79:19, 79:25, 79:29, 80:1, 80:16, 80:18, 80:24, 80:27, 81:1, 81:26, 81:29, 82:10, 82:13, 82:17, 82:24, 82:29, 83:2, 83:4, 83:10, 83:13, 84:3, 84:17, 86:5, 86:8, 86:10. 86:14. 87:6. 87:19, 87:23, 89:17, 89:25, 92:7, 92:8, 92:22, 94:10, 96:15, 97:3, 97:17, 98:5, 98:8, 98:13, 100:1, 100:4, 100:9, 100:26, 100:29, 101:10, 101:15. 101:19. 103:3, 108:1, 108:5, 112:4, 113:3, 122:24, 125:7, 125:10, 127:6, 127:16, 127:18, 127:22, 127:26, 130:15, 130:24, 133:3, 135:9, 141:19, 146:28. 158:3. 173:14, 177:11, 177:25, 177:27, 178:13, 180:5, 185:12, 191:29 CMO'S [7] - 49:17, 80:28, 83:25, 87:26, 93:16, 108:1, 112:16 **CO** [2] - 2:12, 4:4 **CODE** [17] - 53:4, 81:5, 96:19, 99:15,

- 37:7 187:7 84:28

102:17, 125:12, 3:20 126:5, 126:9, 126:10, **COMMISSIONER'S** 126:12, 126:14, [2] - 139:20, 139:21 128:3, 128:13, **COMMIT**[1] - 145:4 131:23, 131:24, COMMITTED [2] -136:24 145:4, 146:16 **CODE** [1] - 128:4 COMMITTEE [1] -COG [1] - 52:19 144:26 **COLD** [1] - 74:5 COMMON[2] -COLLEAGUE [4] -160:15. 160:16 147:7, 147:8, 148:7, **COMMUNICATED** 206:27 [1] - 112:28 COLLEAGUES [7] -**COMPANY** [1] - 2:22 155:28, 162:8, COMPARE[1] -183:29, 190:14, 16:29 190:18, 206:17, COMPETENT[2] -206:22 130:29, 189:27 **COLLINS** [2] - 125:7, COMPETITIONS [1] 135:24 - 121:10 **COLUMN** [15] -**COMPILE** [1] - 97:16 108:29, 110:7, 112:1, COMPLAINED [2] -112:7, 112:9, 113:29, 21:10, 32:12 114:3, 116:16, COMPLAINING [1] -151:18, 151:19, 41:8 154:6, 163:27, 165:9, COMPLAINT [32] -166:26, 167:2 9:20, 9:21, 9:22, 9:25, COMBINATION[1] -10:3, 10:13, 10:14, 130:24 11:5, 12:24, 12:25, COMFORTABLE [1] 18:17, 18:19, 21:9, 21:15, 21:16, 24:18, **COMING** [25] -26:7, 26:19, 27:26, 27:23, 58:1, 106:21, 48:17, 49:27, 50:10, 110:9, 112:22, 50:13, 50:17, 75:29, 118:12, 122:29, 82:21, 86:2, 86:3, 125:20, 131:8, 132:6, 89:24, 89:25, 187:3 135:6, 139:7, 152:12, COMPLAINTS [2] -155:1, 159:26, 8:28, 10:6 164:11, 164:26, COMPLETE [2] -168:16, 168:19, 83:8, 193:25 190:5, 190:6, 195:23, COMPLETED [2] -195:24, 200:5 58:29, 209:5 COMMENCE[1] -COMPLETELY [3] -93:2, 94:23, 172:11 COMMENCED [2] -COMPLETENESS 104:6, 147:4 [1] - 39:26 COMMENT [6] -COMPLEX [3] -36:12, 60:13, 94:18, 44:26, 46:16, 129:18 113:3, 156:14, 172:15 COMPLEXITIES [3] -COMMENTS [1] -53:9, 65:27, 71:8 112:22 COMPLICATE[1] -**COMMISSIONER** [9] 65:29 - 55:5. 55:11. 60:15. COMPLICATED[8] -74:28, 75:2, 77:4, 44:7, 65:19, 69:28, 79:2, 186:25, 207:29 70:1, 124:25, 126:26, **COMMISSIONER** [4] 129:18, 132:9 - 75:10, 81:19, 82:9, COMPLICATES[1] -

192:25

[1] - 102:19

COMPLICATIONS

COMPLIED [1] -

COMMISSIONER [9]

- 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6,

3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:18,

6

97:15 COMPLY [1] -134:22 COMPROMISE [1] -66.1 CONCEALMENT [2] - 174:6, 174:7 CONCEIVE [1] -25:25 CONCEPT[1] -85:21 CONCERN [6] - 42:6, 69:26, 70:3, 89:11, 162:27, 184:25 CONCERNED [18] -43:26, 74:19, 94:27, 95:2, 135:4, 135:13, 138:16, 169:23, 171:17, 176:22. 176:29, 189:15, 189:22, 191:24, 192:8, 205:16, 210:2, 210:6 CONCERNS [11] -64:7, 75:17, 75:23, 88:13, 92:9, 114:11, 158:19, 160:9, 191:4, 192:9, 199:6 CONCERT [1] -183:11 CONCERTED [2] -114:26, 154:14 CONCILIATION [3] -106:2, 106:10, 106:20 CONCILIATION [1] -107:3 CONCLUDES [1] -211:2 CONCLUSION [4] -21:24, 41:6, 72:1, 79:26 CONCLUSIONS [1] -170:13 CONDITION [3] -92:11, 112:14, 205:29 CONDITIONALITY [1] - 101:2 CONDITIONS [1] -79:19 CONDUCT [2] -30:27, 138:6 CONDUCTED [2] -57:26, 58:5 CONFERENCE [54] -14:11, 38:12, 38:13, 56:26, 68:15, 107:9, 107:10, 107:11, 107:12, 107:14, 107:20, 108:1, 108:3, 109:9, 109:10,

109:26, 110:4, 116:29, 117:4, 119:7, 119:13, 119:17, 120:4, 120:10, 120:16, 121:22, 122:4, 122:5, 122:7, 122:10, 122:22, 122:23, 122:28, 123:6, 123:8, 131:7, 131:18, 151:27, 152:8, 156:1, 157:23, 157:24, 167:10, 177:12, 177:21, 178:6, 179:1, 179:3, 185:2, 185:7, 198:14, 203:24, 203:26, 204:4 CONFERENCE.. [1] -118:18 **CONFERENCES** [3] - 107:5, 150:29, 155:26 CONFIDENCE [2] -97:10, 164:3 **CONFIDENTIAL** [15] - 37:10, 58:21, 68:10, 93:10, 132:10, 144:9, 144:11, 144:15, 144:24, 145:2, 156:12, 156:17, 156:24, 156:29, 212:8 CONFIDENTIALITY [5] - 79:27, 144:20, 211:13, 211:21, 212:7 CONFIRM [13] -6:21, 55:4, 85:23, 94:9, 111:1, 116:16, 116:19, 117:21, 122:25, 123:11, 141:12, 177:29, 193:2 CONFIRMED [5] -

126:12

31:13, 31:20, 32:17,

32:27, 37:23, 60:28,

85:6, 102:24

- 207:6 176:5 182:5 157:20 19:29, 39:19, 135:16, 64.2 177:25, 177:26 **CONFLICT** [2] - 39:2, 170:26 CONFRONTATION AL[1] - 164:20 CONFUSED[1] -CONFUSING [2] -143:12, 150:5 CONJUNCTION [3] -9:6, 53:14, 93:18 CONLON [1] - 2:16 CONNAUGHT[1] -CONNECTED [11] -9:7, 11:21, 16:7,

CONNECTION [1] -175:28, 179:27, 105:17 194:24 CONNELLAN [2] -CONTACTING [2] -149:26, 172:17 4:1. 4:1 **CONOR** [1] - 3:23 CONTACTS [3] -CONSCIOUS [2] -145:27, 150:26, 184.22 13:22, 37:24 **CONTAIN**[1] - 81:20 CONSENSUS [3] -CONTAINED [1] -194:25, 195:27, 97:21 195:28 CONSENT[1] -**CONTEMPLATED** 145:7 111 - 101:5 **CONSEQUENCES** CONTENT[1] -[10] - 45:12, 45:15, 151:19 CONTENTIOUS [1] -46:4, 65:12, 65:17, 101:21, 194:21, 167:16 194:26, 195:4, 195:5 **CONTEXT** [24] - 8:4, CONSIDER [3] -24:9, 30:22, 31:23, 32:23, 37:22, 44:6, 41:5, 47:15, 171:20 CONSIDERABLE [1] 48:4, 52:28, 62:26, 63:1, 69:18, 76:1, CONSIDERED [8] -76:2, 76:21, 76:22, 29:13, 51:20, 52:13, 85:6, 88:20, 130:3, 140:13, 148:21, 53:1, 115:14, 121:27, 149:6, 181:29, 206:25 144.8 157.3 CONSIDERING [3] -CONTEXTS [1] -138:4, 180:13, 208:24 66:29 CONTINUALLY [4] -CONSISTENT[1] -12:10, 38:20, 93:9, CONSISTENTLY [2] 195:6 CONTINUE [7] -- 173:22, 175:24 CONSTANT[1] -45:22, 58:22, 73:14, 115:9, 181:19, 187:11 CONTINUED [2] -CONSTITUTED[1] -58:12, 188:29 CONTINUES [4] -CONSULT [2] -58:22, 181:11, 51:22, 207:10 186:18. 191:15 **CONSULTATION**[2] CONTINUING [1] -- 54:8, 89:16 174:8 CONSUMMATE[1] -CONTRAST[1] -CONSUMPTION [1] -17:1 CONTRIBUTE [3] -157.8 157.12 CONTACT [33] -**CONTRIBUTION** [4] 32:13, 35:7, 36:5, - 154:8, 154:9, 160:4, 36:25, 36:28, 39:5, 161:8 39:16, 145:18, 146:7, CONTROLLED [1] -146:11, 146:14, 147:12, 147:22. 121:12 148:16, 149:1, CONVENIENT [1] -149:25, 150:11, 193:12 165:24, 168:24, CONVERSATION 178:3, 178:8, 182:20, [16] - 14:14, 22:10, 23:6, 30:17, 32:2, 183:26, 185:12, 185:13, 185:14, 32:24, 40:10, 51:6, 192:11, 193:5, 203:4, 71:22, 71:24, 88:5, 169:28, 170:3. 211:25, 212:4 196:11, 198:15, CONTACTED [9] -39:13, 94:26, 148:10, 203:19 170:20, 171:24, **CONVERSATIONS**

[2] - 37:24, 169:29 82:28 96.18 209:24 46:13 137:15 111:23, 112:6, 117:21, 119:2, 135:27, 136:2, 15:16, 100:19 77:7 [1] - 18:3 167:3

CONVERSELY [1] -CONVEYED [1] -CONVINCED [1] -COOPERATE [3] -45:21, 46:9, 84:29 COOPERATED[1] -**COPIED** [1] - 121:2 **COPIES** [1] - 132:20 **COPING** [1] - 64:4 COPPINGER [1] -COPPINGER [1] -**COPY** [2] - 135:28, **CORE** [1] - 38:2 CORK [1] - 149:19 CORMAC [1] - 63:11 CORRECT [50] -6:20, 35:19, 45:23, 50:28, 63:12, 74:28, 79:3, 91:7, 91:17, 91:28, 93:19, 96:3, 96:10, 96:19, 97:19, 97:26, 98:9, 99:4, 99:9, 99:20, 99:23, 101:13, 102:7, 105:6, 105:10, 105:14, 107:7, 108:8, 108:12, 108:16, 108:18, 112:11, 113:28, 114:8, 114:24, 115:1, 119:28, 134:4, 135:5, 138:24, 140:10, 144:5, 144:10, 199:19 CORRECTLY [2] -CORRELATED[1] -CORRESPONDEN CE [3] - 66:8, 66:9, **CORROBORATING COST** [4] - 162:3, 162:6, 165:10, 165:13 COSTELLO [1] -COSTS [2] - 165:19,

COUNCIL [1] -

106:21

COUNSEL [2] - 5:17, 32:21, 34:2 142:9 **CUALÁIN**[1] - 3:6 COUNSELLING [2] -CUALÁIN [1] -144:9. 144:12 135:29 COUNSELLOR [1] -CUDGELS [1] -185:29 73:24 COUNSELLORS [2] **CULLEN** [1] - 2:10 - 144:13, 144:14 CULMINATION[1] -**COUPLE** [8] - 54:13, 192:17 55:23. 105:22. **CURLEY** [1] - 3:9 108:28, 151:1, 151:7, **CURRAN**[1] - 66:6 173:8, 175:3 **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 COURSE [17] - 18:8, CURRENT [6] -22:21, 51:9, 76:23, 104:9, 144:2, 167:6, 85:7, 88:4, 90:29, 174:27, 191:4, 191:14 93:25, 100:25, **CUT** [7] - 12:10, 100:27, 146:2, 41:2. 45:22. 169:12. 146:26, 153:5, 169:24 164:19, 176:4, 197:18, 210:27 D COURT [3] - 1:13, 2:3, 4:2 **D'ÊTRE** [1] - 161:27 **COURT** [1] - 8:5 **COVER** [2] - 147:7, SUPERINTENDENT 162:19 [2] - 36:14, 168:23 COVERED [2] -**DATE** [16] - 53:25, 147:7, 147:8 55:11, 61:16, 63:9, COVERING [2] -76:19, 97:6, 130:3, 43:20, 149:19 148:22, 155:12, CREATE[1] - 131:5 156:13, 156:17, CREDIBILITY [1] -168:4, 168:5, 197:5, 208:20, 209:27 **CRIME** [3] - 145:4, **DATED**[2] - 68:23, 146:16 190:25 CRITICAL [1] -**DATES**[1] - 156:22 101:15 **DAVID** [2] - 2:27, CRITICISING [1] -3:18 28:24 **DAY** [1] - 1:18 CRITICISM [4] -**DAYS** [19] - 23:27, 17:14, 27:12, 28:9, 23:29, 63:24, 88:14, 28:23 109:16, 109:27, CROSS [8] - 5:5, 118:22, 125:18, 5:13, 5:18, 5:19, 6:13, 127:2, 127:3, 127:7, 140:25, 194:4, 200:22 127:11, 129:19, CROSS [6] - 15:14, 129:20, 143:15, 28:17, 38:20, 73:11, 162:14, 162:16, 73:22, 174:14 162:18, 182:6 **CROSS-DEAD** [2] - 209:27 **EXAMINATION**[4] -**DEAL** [30] - 9:23, 15:14, 28:17, 73:22, 16:25, 24:16, 30:10, 174:14 56:18, 66:4, 73:16, **CROSS-EXAMINED** 77:4, 88:3, 89:18, [8] - 5:5, 5:13, 5:18, 101:21, 123:5, 130:9, 5:19, 6:13, 140:25, 133:21, 139:18, 194:4. 200:22 140:4, 144:23, 147:8, **CROSS-EXAMINES** 147:24, 148:3, 111 - 73:11 150:28, 160:1,

CRUCIAL [1] - 44:15

CRUX [1] - 125:1

CRYSTAL[2] -

168:13, 170:13,

175:26, 181:1, 201:1,

201:15, 201:25, 206:27 **DEALER** [1] - 175:29 DEALING [12] -16:10. 41:7. 41:8. 91:13, 131:9, 144:27, 147:2, 154:17, 167:2, 175:11, 199:10, 210:21 **DEALS** [3] - 99:17, 101:24, 106:14 **DEALT** [14] - 95:7, 124:27, 128:27, 130:1, 154:25, 155:14, 169:22, 174:3, 197:7, 197:8, 207:23, 207:24, 207:29. 210:23 DECEMBER [19] -58:19, 67:17, 68:14, 93:18, 107:12, 113:2, 117:4, 123:6, 131:7, 144:4, 152:23, 156:19, 177:5, 180:25, 194:12, 195:10, 201:4, 201:12, 202:10 **DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 **DECIDE** [3] - 38:28, 114:25, 154:13 **DECIDED** [7] - 119:6, 124:24, 126:25, 161:24, 180:29, 201:14, 201:20 DECIDING [1] -144:23 DECISION [26] -8:23, 9:10, 26:13, 37:13, 37:14, 60:23, 60:29, 71:5, 72:3, 80:20, 83:7, 83:12, 83:23, 84:2, 84:4, 98:23, 99:6, 101:9, 101:11, 102:2, 118:28, 119:12, 121:24, 133:5 **DECISION-MAKING** [1] - 99:6 DECLAN[2] -108:13, 148:11 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:4 DECLINED [6] -35:6, 39:15, 84:29, 187:27, 188:9, 204:27 **DECLINES** [1] - 36:7 DECLINING [2] -36:28, 188:12 **DEEM**[1] - 55:24 **DEEMED** [11] -10:18, 14:3, 38:8,

38:9, 56:23, 58:18, 35:7, 36:6, 45:2, 64:5, 68:19, 98:12, 121:4, 148:10, 149:2, 100:3, 150:8 149:13, 149:26, 170:19, 171:27, **DEEMS**[1] - 80:23 **DEEP** [1] - 38:15 **DEEPER** [2] - 32:2, 189:25 37:23 **DEFINITELY** [4] -127:1, 178:14, 180:27, 195:28 **DEFINITION**[3] -136:23, 136:26, 137:24 **DEFINITIONS**[1] -123:29 **DELAY** [2] - 74:20, 168:11 DELEGATE[1] -122:15 **DELLA** [6] - 145:23, 145:24, 165:22, 185:20, 188:26, 191:12 **DEMONSTRATED** [1] - 205:28 DEPARTMENT[1] -- 3:15 DEPARTMENT[3] -106:19, 109:19 **DEPARTMENTS**[1] -110:19 **DEPENDENCY**[1] -92:12 **DEPENDENT**[1] -101:28 8.22 **DEPRIVING** [1] -DESCRIBE [3] -163:3, 168:25, 176:16 DESCRIBED [3] -41:12, 78:23, 92:22 **DESCRIBING** [2] -144:10, 206:3 191.2 DESCRIPTION [1] -164:21 DESCRIPTIONS [1] -179:15 DESERVING [1] -166:20 **DESMOND** [1] - 4:7 **DESPITE** [3] - 39:16, 61:26, 93:7 **DETAIL** [10] - 58:19, 70:29, 71:18, 71:21, 133:6, 168:12, 178:24, 201:3, 209:9, 211:15 **DETAILS**[2] - 88:29,

DETECTIVE [16] -

139:11, 145:29, 153:11, 171:22, 180:14, 184:13, 202:24, 206:11 DIFFICULT [11] -29:14, 29:27, 29:29, 51:4, 127:12, 172:19, 175:24. 176:6. 181:16, 181:18, 181:24 DIFFICULTIES [14] -89:12, 92:5, 94:4, 154:2, 160:6, 160:29, 178:18, 179:8, 191:2, 196:16, 196:22, 196:23, 197:24, 198:16 DIFFICULTY [4] -92:24, 134:24, 179:26, 206:28 **DIGNAM**[1] - 3:23 **DIRECT** [8] - 9:29, 28:22, 29:2, 33:9, 33:13, 65:17, 99:28, 174:13 **DIRECT-EVIDENCE** [1] - 174:13 DIRECTION [4] -64:25, 94:28, 126:7, 195:22 **DIRECTIVE** [1] - 96:7 DIRECTIVE [1] -77:29 **DIRECTLY** [4] - 5:12, 5:17, 104:27, 142:8 DIRECTLY [3] -113:22, 118:29, 135:20 **DIRECTLY-EXAMINED** [2] - 5:12, 104:27 **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:12 DIRECTOR [7] -9:10, 51:26, 52:2, 53:10, 54:7, 128:9, 136:1 DIRECTORATE [3] -54:23. 105:21. 107:22 DIRECTORATE[1] -DISAGREE [6] -41:11, 47:9, 47:19, 47:23, 47:24, 159:21 DISAGREED [1] -DISAPPOINTED [2] -76:15, 172:10 DISBELIEVE [1] -19:1 DISCHARGES [1] -

82:2

DISCIPLINARY [5] -

195:8, 196:4, 207:22,

155:1, 155:29, 174:1,

DISCIPLINED [6] -

166:3, 166:14, 195:19

8:6. 143:1. 166:1.

DISCLOSE [2] -

DISCLOSED [1] -

11:21, 16:8, 16:11,

16:15, 18:23, 33:27,

132:11, 132:12,

87:29, 107:28, 132:6,

DISCLOSURES [12]

- 14:13, 32:15, 63:15,

85:10, 132:8, 140:13,

DISCLOSURES [2] -

DISCOVERED [1] -

DISCREDITED[1] -

DISCRETION [1] -

24:11, 26:16, 31:6,

31:12, 37:9, 37:28,

59:21, 75:16, 75:29,

85:5, 97:11, 146:23,

DISCUSSED [22] -

110:7, 111:2, 111:6,

126:19, 133:3, 136:7,

156:3, 159:3, 170:12,

183:4, 184:20, 187:1,

146:27, 178:17,

188:11, 196:15,

116:3, 124:23,

140:11, 153:24,

187:24, 191:7,

19:12, 19:13

177:7, 211:29

203:17

191:14, 202:18,

DISCUSSES [2] -

DISCUSSING [5] -

31:5, 129:10, 153:2,

DISCUSSION [31] -

89:2, 109:8, 110:10,

208:14

DISCUSS [18] - 19:8,

DISCREDIT[1] -

149:3, 158:5, 158:9

 $65{:}23,\,66{:}21,\,85{:}5,$

DISCLOSURE [12] -

146:14, 146:22

DISCIPLINE [5] -

207:28, 208:3

174:18

190:21

174:25

1:2, 1:3

171:6

94:22

95:5

138.7

116:29, 117:25, 118:9, 122:27, 123:27, 123:29, 138:28, 139:28, 152:2, 152:10, 152:14, 152:24, 152:25, 152:26, 152:28, 153:1, 153:22, 153:25, 157:8, 157:17, 157:19, 164:22, 164:25, 167:3, 175:9, 178:12, 184:7, 195:5 DISCUSSIONS [4] -124:29, 129:3, 186:21, 187:17 **DISMISS**[1] - 30:10 DISMISSIVE [1] -**DISPROPORTIONA TE** [1] - 86:20 **DISPUTE** [2] - 57:24, 133:17 DISTINCT [1] -143:10 **DISTINCTION** [5] -9:24, 10:2, 11:4, 11:6, 54:22 DISTINCTLY [3] -116:3, 117:27, 183:8 DISTRACT[1] -206:23 DISTRESSED[1] -146:2 DISTRIBUTED[1] -205:25 DISTRICT [5] -20:12. 22:19. 64:4. 91:23, 121:20 DIVISION [3] -119:11, 121:19, 143:23 **DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 DIVISIONAL [10] -82:8, 82:13, 86:9, 96:1, 99:7, 120:7, 138:6, 144:25, 183:21. 203:2 **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:7 **DOCTOR** [18] - 9:27, 10:18, 14:5, 21:7, 58:13, 58:14, 58:23, 60:24, 68:19, 71:4, 80:23, 86:2, 94:27, 100:2, 100:21, 100:28, 115:29, 144:16 DOCTOR'S [3] -

79:25, 80:3, 80:26 DOCUMENT [50] -33:19, 50:19, 50:22, 51:28, 52:4, 55:14, 55:29, 56:20, 58:27, 59:2, 59:5, 59:26, 59:29, 60:4, 60:8, 61:25, 63:9, 63:15, 64:9, 68:29, 69:5, 77:28, 78:1, 78:3, 78:5, 78:7, 78:10, 78:11, 78:14, 78:17, 87:25, 88:4, 88:6, 88:8, 89:1, 90:14, 93:4, 95:24, 103:16, 103:22, 103:28, 128:6, 137:12, 137:15, 137:17, 137:21, 139:14, 179:28 **DOCUMENTATION** [4] - 78:9, 90:4, 97:16, 124:13 DOCUMENTS [5] -52:13, 97:21, 107:28, 128:4, 172:22 **DOGGY** [1] - 160:19 DOGS [2] - 160:18, 160:25 **DONAL** [2] - 125:7, 135:24 **DONAL** [3] - 3:6, 3:24, 141:25 **DONE** [20] - 9:5, 40:25, 50:2, 54:12, 57:9, 60:10, 62:1, 62:4, 65:15, 93:3, 96:28, 128:11, 141:11, 161:23, 178:27, 178:28, 183:16, 184:18, 202:14, 203:16 **DOOR** [1] - 37:16 **DOUBLE** [1] - 73:5 DOUBT [6] - 82:6, 83:20, 165:6, 167:13, 167:14, 167:15 **DOWN** [48] - 23:7, 24:12, 35:3, 39:9, 42:12, 43:13, 51:4, 54:29, 57:26, 68:11, 68:17, 70:10, 71:12, 78:27, 81:3, 81:18, 83:16, 90:17, 90:20, 90:22, 93:5, 93:27, 94:1, 96:1, 97:1, 102:4, 116:27, 123:20, 124:3, 126:2, 133:24, 135:6,

145:17, 151:28,

171:24, 178:5, 193:1, 201:4, 201:5, 202:1, 202:23, 203:23, 205:24, 205:27. 207:18, 208:9 **DOWNEY** [5] - 3:14, 3:19, 5:10, 104:26, 140.25 DOWNEY [9] -104:23, 104:29, 123:5, 123:12, 141:5, 142:22, 151:9, 151:13, 155:21 **DPP**[1] - 173:13 **DR** [37] - 88:3, 94:2, 99:25, 100:16, 101:1, 102:27, 103:28, 104:3, 108:5, 112:22, 113:15, 116:4, 117:28, 118:28, 121:26, 121:27, 125:7, 125:8, 164:6, 171:26, 178:17, 178:23, 178:26, 179:5, 191:3, 191:13, 191:19, 196:12, 196:14, 196:29, 197:21, 197:27, 198:19, 199:6, 199:15, 200:7 **DR** [1] - 3:11 DRAFT[7] - 128:6, 128:8, 128:9, 137:19, 138:13, 138:27, 139:13 DRAFTED[1] -108:27 **DRAWING** [1] - 41:5 **DRAWN**[1] - 107:18 **DRILL** [1] - 145:17 **DRINK** [2] - 191:16, 206:4 DRINKING [30] -169:1, 170:7, 170:23, 173:12, 173:26, 175:3, 176:3, 176:9, 177:7, 181:11, 181:15, 182:18, 182:27, 189:9, 190:10, 191:5, 191:14, 191:24, 192:4, 192:7, 192:21, 194:22, 194:27, 201:24, 206:10, 208:20 **DRIVE** [1] - 8:13 DRUG [1] - 175:29 DRUNK [4] - 88:25, 168:25, 199:11, 202:6 **DUBLIN** [7] - 1:17,

57:1, 97:23, 152:13

DOCTORS [3] -

2:18, 2:24, 2:31, 3:28, 4:10, 4:15 **DUE** [14] - 10:9, 14:5, 51:9, 58:14, 83:21, 88:3, 97:8, 99:26, 117:29, 122:1, 170:25, 171:27, 173:14, 197:18 **DURING** [7] - 169:20, 176:4, 181:9, 183:1, 187:10, 187:16, 190:10 **DUTIES** [14] - 8:14, 64:2, 79:2, 79:20, 79:21, 80:15, 81:25, 94:19, 99:20, 101:3, 164:12, 164:17. 164:20, 164:26 **DUTY** [53] - 14:4, 51:20, 52:15, 53:7, 58:13, 58:19, 79:11, 79:12, 80:9, 80:13, 80:21, 81:20, 82:4, 82:7, 83:7, 83:12, 83:22, 84:9, 84:15, 95:4, 97:4, 98:12, 98:16, 98:17, 98:19, 99:18, 100:2, 100:3, 100:8, 101:15, 101:28, 102:23, 105:23, 111:26, 123:29, 124:24, 125:15, 125:24, 125:28, 126:20, 127:25. 128:15. 128:21, 129:22, 130:17, 130:21, 133:29, 137:13, 153:6, 153:10, 175:15, 175:20 **DUTY..** [1] - 81:9 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 **DÁIL** [1] - 135:14

Ε

E-MAIL [28] - 51:29, 55:8, 95:26, 120:28, 121:16, 123:1, 123:21, 124:13, 124:19, 126:17, 128:23, 129:27, 131:26, 132:3, 132:16, 132:18, 133:21, 134:2, 135:24, 136:3, 139:3, 139:4, 139:7, 139:18 E-MAIL.. [1] - 139:26 E-MAILED [1] -

117:10

E-MAILS [9] - 61:4,
123:10, 123:12,
129:29, 139:5, 139:9,
140:5, 140:8, 140:12

EAMON [1] - 3:9

EAP [2] - 150:6,
150:14

EARLY [7] - 78:20,

EARLY [7] - 78:20, 112:27, 113:8, 170:16, 171:6, 173:11, 187:11 EAS [9] - 114:21, 133:5, 143:6, 143:9, 143:23, 144:4, 144:7, 148:8, 154:11 EASE [3] - 164:18,

168:6, 207:14 **EFFECT**_[7] - 56:11, 98:15, 98:23, 101:9, 148:29, 163:24, 167:19

EFFECTIVELY [15] - 82:2, 102:28, 108:25, 119:23, 136:12, 136:18, 137:28, 138:25, 139:9, 139:29, 142:21, 145:20, 171:20, 177:21, 211:25

EFFECTIVENESS [2] - 115:15, 157:4

EFFECTS [1] - 129:9 **EFFORT** [2] -114:26, 154:14 **EFFORTS** [1] - 59:5

EGAN [1] - 3:25 EGAN [2] - 52:1, 158:12

EITHER [4] - 67:29, 98:29, 103:2, 163:2 ELABORATE [1] -208:2

ELEMENT [1] - 29:12 ELEMENTS [1] -180:24

ELICIT [1] - 30:27 ELIZABETH [1] -2:29 ELUCIDATE [3] -

30:26, 33:23, 33:25 **EM** [4] - 107:29, 145:29, 156:11, 181:4 **EMBARKING** [1] -

46:25 **EMBARRASS**[1] -26:21

EMMA[1] - 3:26 **EMPATHY**[2] -160:17, 179:16 **EMPHASISED** [1] - 79:4

EMPLOYEE [5] - 143:9, 150:6, 150:10, 162:8, 179:15 **EMPLOYEE** [10] -

91:25, 105:27, 105:29, 106:4, 106:25, 108:22, 142:19, 142:23,

144:25, 148:25 **EMPLOYEES** [1] -110:21

EMPLOYMENT[2] - 66:16, 113:13

ENCAPSULATES[1] - 105:20 ENCOUNTER[1] -

178:19 ENCOUNTERING [1]

- 196:16 ENCOURAGE [1] -180:11

ENCOURAGING [1] - 144:13 END [6] - 77:11,

95:14, 103:12, 104:13, 140:23, 141:22

END [13] - 26:10, 40:24, 52:19, 57:27, 89:15, 101:29, 151:29, 165:8, 168:1, 172:16, 173:26, 194:15, 200:29

ENDEAVOUR [2] -28:22, 206:22 ENDED [1] - 24:4

ENDING [5] - 177:6, 186:27, 187:20, 188:16, 190:24

ENGAGE [8] - 46:22, 48:13, 48:16, 48:23, 72:6, 112:17, 113:11, 191:6

ENGAGED [1] - 160:8

ENGAGEMENT[2] - 42:15, 119:6

ENGAGES [1] - 13:8 **ENGAGING** [1] -65:12

ENGLISH [1] - 117:15

ENGRAINED [1] - 191:28 **ENQUIRED** [1] -

203:2

ENQUIRIES [7] - 9:12, 51:23, 56:10,

57:13, 91:24, 93:7, 138:6

ENQUIRING [1] - 183:23

ENQUIRY [1] - 136:19

ENROLL [1] - 161:21 ENSURE [2] - 91:24,

ENTERS [1] - 81:28 **ENTIRELY** [3] - 52:5, 70:23, 89:4 **ENTIRETY** [1] -

34:14 **ENTITLE** [1] - 46:15 **ENTITLED** [3] -

70:26, 199:3 ENTITLEMENT_[2] -

72:21, 92:29

ENTRIES [8] - 168:27, 169:2, 170:6, 173:25, 175:3, 184:1,

187:21, 202:23 **ENTRY** [24] - 33:26, 167:4, 168:5, 173:11, 173:12, 175:8,

188:16, 189:12, 190:24, 191:10, 201:3, 202:1, 202:15, 203:12, 203:22, 203:23, 204:10,

204:12, 204:20, 205:24, 205:27, 207:19, 208:9, 208:10

ENVIRONMENT [1] - 129:14

ENVISAGE [1] - 100:6 **ENVISAGED** [1] -

138:22 **EOIN** [1] - 2:28 **EPISODES** [1] -

176:24

26:12

EQUAL[1] - 190:23 **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:8 **EQUATION**[1] -

ESCALATE[1] - 146:22

ESPECIALLY [2] -182:14, 198:29 ESSENCE [2] -

62:19, 72:23 **ESTABLISH** [23] -7:28, 9:14, 9:16, 9:19, 11:17, 11:19, 11:25, 11:26, 12:7, 15:21, 15:23, 16:5, 16:6, 18:1, 18:5, 18:9, 19:7, 20:15, 50:20, 59:6, 59:15, 93:8

ESTABLISHED[1] - 1:7

ESTABLISHED [6] - 8:29, 43:27, 53:12, 53:13, 92:11, 125:6 **ESTABLISHES** [1] -

59:10 ESTABLISHING [1] -

18:5 ETCETERA[1] -

124:11

ETHER [1] - 53:3 **EVENING** [2] - 75:27,

EVENT [4] - 101:1, 120:12, 125:25,

188:29 **EVENTS** [8] - 30:25, 39:28, 87:17, 115:7,

39:28, 87:17, 115:7, 115:13, 146:3, 155:19, 156:6 **EVENTUALLY** [2] -

186:24, 186:26 **EVIDENCE** [58] -6:17, 8:9, 11:24, 15:16, 18:3, 24:1, 25:5, 25:13, 26:28,

34:26, 35:13, 36:8, 36:20, 38:23, 40:11, 41:20, 46:21, 47:26, 47:28, 57:16, 61:5, 64:24, 66:6, 66:13, 67:28, 79:4, 84:29, 85:7, 87:21, 88:3, 92:2, 94:24, 96:21, 96:26, 104:1, 118:2

96:26, 104:1, 118:2, 118:26, 119:3, 125:5, 134:5, 136:13, 137:18, 150:17, 151:10, 151:12, 154:1, 161:26, 162:25, 163:14, 167:19, 173:10, 174:13, 181:25,

211:22 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 **EVIDENTIAL** [1] -

198:17

193:1, 193:26, 199:8,

EXACTLY [9] - 29:10, 117:26, 118:7, 142:26, 144:11, 147:9, 156:2, 197:5, 200:9

EVOLVING [1] - 7:29

EXAMINATION [6] - 77:11, 95:14, 103:12, 104:13, 140:23, 141:22

EXAMINATION[4] -15:14, 28:17, 73:22, 174:14 EXAMINED [20] -5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 46:21 5:12, 5:13, 5:17, 5:18, 5:19, 5:20, 6:13, 77:22, 95:20, 103:20, 104:27, 140:25, 142:9, 194:4, 200:22, 211:11 EXAMINES [1] -73:11 EXAMPLE [13] -8:10, 11:27, 12:15, 45:20, 82:22, 88:10, 105:27, 139:15, 146:15, 149:27, 195:24, 196:25, 197:25 184:25 EXCELLENT[1] -167:23 7:11 EXCEPTION[1] -146:29 EXCEPTIONS [3] -145:3, 146:20, 211:18 66.13 EXCESSIVELY [1] -88:26 EXECUTIVE [8] -9:10, 51:26, 52:2, 53:10, 54:7, 128:7, 128:9, 136:1 51:25 EXECUTIVE [1] -EXERCISE [1] -26:21 EXHAUSTED[2] -109:15, 110:17 44:2, 73:22, 129:27, **EXHIBIT** [1] - 120:27 157:16 **EXPECT** [9] - 11:27, 16:28, 17:2, 28:14, 29:12, 30:2, 30:7, 98:11, 98:13 EXPECTED [2] -71:17, 172:3 **EXPENDITURE** [2] -106:20, 109:20 EXPENSIVE [2] -162:20. 162:22 EXPERIENCE [7] -7:29, 32:2, 80:1, 86:12, 106:24, 126:8, 176:12 **EXPERIENCING** [1] -89:13 EXPERTISE [1] -131:2 **EXPLAIN** [4] - 21:1, 28:24, 45:25, 144:20

EXPLAINED[1] -

EXPLAINING [1] -EXPLICITLY [1] -EXPLORATION[1] -EXPLORE [6] -26:25, 26:29, 37:19, 39:3, 65:19, 200:17 EXPLORING [3] -18:11, 19:7, 25:29 **EXPRESS** [1] - 76:17 EXPRESSED [6] -42:8, 134:18, 135:11, 146:21, 154:22, EXPRESSING [3] -130:23, 136:17, EXTENDED [1] -EXTENSIVE [7] -36:20, 36:25, 37:22, 46:21, 66:7, 66:9, EXTENSIVELY [1] -**EXTENT**[3] - 101:24, 196:29, 197:25 **EXTERNAL**[2] - 9:6, EYE [1] - 57:12

171:14

10:8

17:6

191:13

F

FACE [5] - 29:28,

FACILITATE[4] -91:21, 115:28, 162:5, 164:26 FACILITATED[1] -117:24 FACILITY [1] -112:19 **FACING** [1] - 140:1 FACT [35] - 7:10, 13:16, 20:7, 30:5, 42:3, 70:22, 71:20, 73:8, 78:19, 80:7, 85:22. 85:24. 87:22. 89:11, 89:19, 103:1, 103:24, 109:12, 109:28, 110:27, 117:16, 118:23, 129:19, 130:8, 150:23, 152:8, 167:26, 168:4,

168:19, 170:19, 175:11, 189:20, 192:3, 197:1, 197:21 **FACTOR** [3] - 89:14, 152:14, 197:29 **FACTORS**[1] - 87:4 FACTS[15] - 7:28, 9:14, 9:16, 9:19, 11:25, 11:27, 15:22. 15:23, 18:1, 18:5, 18:6, 18:9, 19:7, 38:29, 198:12 FACTUAL[2] -49:25 51:2 **FAHY** [2] - 165:17, FAILED [4] - 72:19, 72:20, 92:28, 94:19 **FAILURE** [1] - 57:10 FAIR [23] - 7:11, 7:12, 15:11, 29:7, 34:1, 34:3, 34:4, 34:21, 34:27, 45:10, 45:13, 46:5, 52:3, 66:14, 80:18, 173:28, 185:17, 185:18, 186:10, 189:26, 190:12, 196:19, 200:3 **FAIRLY** [5] - 13:22, 38:15, 179:13, 182:5, 197:9 **FAIRNESS** [2] - 24:1, 210.20 **FALL** [1] - 126:2 FALLING [1] -128:18 **FALLS**[1] - 51:27 **FAMILIAR** [8] - 7:9, 7:16, 58:28, 59:1, 77:29, 78:3, 78:24, 90:15 FAMILIARITY [2] -7:7. 7:13 FANNING [1] -207:23 FANNING [1] -207:29 FAR [20] - 13:23, 19:3, 19:13, 19:15,

FEATURE [4] -

195:9

57:28, 190:7, 192:1,

FEBRUARY [8] -

63:10, 64:1, 88:27,

FELL [1] - 122:14

FELT [11] - 46:13,

180:14, 197:3, 202:5

FEMALE[2] - 148:3,

FEMALES[1] - 148:2

FERGAL [1] - 2:26

FERRY [1] - 2:15

FEW [12] - 54:9,

155:13, 166:23,

183:12, 196:14,

196:25, 202:14,

203:22

66:20, 74:15, 146:6,

FIDDLE [1] - 29:21

FIGURE [1] - 165:26

FIELD [1] - 81:29

FILE [3] - 83:8,

FILES [1] - 81:25

FINAL [7] - 9:9,

52:19. 54:26. 84:6.

FINALISED [1] -

101:18, 106:3, 123:4

FINALLY [5] - 84:19,

94:17, 102:21, 113:6,

FINE [10] - 40:14,

FILLED [2] - 97:18,

86:25, 95:7

138:23

207:25

200:10

119:8, 182:19,

182:26, 189:10

65:16, 137:25,

171:26, 176:24,

179:29, 180:13,

190:27

FEBRUARY [2] - 1:5,

52:23, 58:15, 64:12, 141:15, 193:24, 203:11, 212:5, 212:11 FINED [3] - 166:3, 166:5, 166:14 FINISH [2] - 73:29, 32:1, 43:26, 46:27, 206:23 46:29, 65:28, 71:1, FINISHED [4] -71:18, 112:24, 104:16, 128:11, 161:26, 165:24, 167:1, 174:21 167:12, 171:17, FINN [2] - 2:20, 3:5 172:3, 205:16, FINN [4] - 74:28, 209:24, 210:14 75:2. 77:4. 186:25 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:6 FINTAN [1] - 2:20 **FAST**[1] - 134:24 FIONA [8] - 107:29, **FASTER** [1] - 38:27 108:24, 112:5, FAULT[2] - 8:2, 8:7 139:19, 151:14,

157:29, 158:1, 158:13 FIREARMS[1] -164:14 **FIRMLY** [1] - 130:17 FIRST [52] - 8:20, 9:13, 12:1, 12:19, 14:3, 17:6, 17:20, 18:1, 18:4, 19:28, 21:21, 21:27, 21:28, 28:4, 30:5, 30:25, 30:26, 30:29, 32:19, 34:22, 34:24, 42:7, 42:18, 55:23, 64:13, 72:13, 72:18, 78:10, 78:18, 83:28, 96:6, 102:27, 108:5, 108:29, 110:6, 114:9, 126:15, 131:26, 138:16, 144:7, 145:20, 147:22, 151:8, 151:13, 151:18, 154:27, 159:22, 165:9, 167:28, 168:18, 200:29, 201:3 **FISHING** [1] - 26:21 **FIT** [31] - 10:18, 10:27, 14:2, 14:4, 14:6, 24:24, 25:2, 26:2, 38:8, 38:9, 40:20, 56:23, 68:3, 68:19, 68:20, 79:11, 79:18, 79:20, 80:14, 80:20, 80:24, 80:26, 98:12. 100:3. 100:8 **FITNESS** [2] - 79:2, 97:4 FITZWILLIAM [1] -4:9 **FIVE** [12] - 7:3, 7:4, 7:5, 46:12, 73:26, 74:2, 93:26, 142:26, 162:15, 162:17, 163:1. 171:15 FLAGGED [1] -FLAVOUR [1] -173:4 **FLICK** [1] - 151:28 **FLYNN** [1] - 3:19 FOCUS [3] - 78:19, 78:20, 133:12 FOCUSED [1] - 89:4 **FOCUSES** [1] - 89:1

FOLLOW [9] - 28:5,

28:9, 28:15, 57:14,

143:13, 166:11

FOLLOW-

67:28, 68:6, 123:17,

THROUGH [1] - 68:6

200:12, 200:17, FOLLOWED [1] -FOUR [15] - 23:27, 98:15, 99:29, 103:5, G 109:17 24:28, 25:9, 25:11, 104:2, 104:29, 105:4, 200:25, 201:20, FOLLOWING [8] -25:14, 25:21, 25:26, 105:7, 105:11, 202:25, 204:14, GADGET[1] - 29:20 105:24, 105:25, 205:3, 205:23, 96:24, 97:1, 100:24, 1:25, 28:17, 54:5, **GALWAY** [9] - 16:11, 110:14, 110:18, 105:27, 105:29, 205:27, 207:16, 121:21. 135:19. 35:17, 35:18, 35:28, 135:21, 139:15, 200:3 106:4, 106:10, 110:21, 189:18 207:19, 207:28, 35:29, 38:2, 39:14, FOLLOWING [1] -**FOURTH** [1] - 75:3 106:15, 106:16, 209:1, 210:10, 62:15, 108:14 106:17, 106:18, 210:24, 211:12, FRANK [2] - 55:7, **GAME** [2] - 26:10, 107:10, 109:11, 212:20 FOLLOWS [2] -135:15 109:27, 110:12, GARDA[2] - 29:6, FRAY [1] - 140:8 136:27, 194:18 FOLLOWS [12] - 6:1, FREE [5] - 94:9, **GARDA** [15] - 2:9, 110:23, 113:8, 202:5 2:26, 2:27, 2:27, 3:2, 114:22, 118:22, 6:13, 74:9, 77:23, 169:7, 172:27, **GARDAI**[1] - 142:18 3:10, 3:10, 3:11, 3:21, 122:19, 125:14, 95:21, 103:20, 190:14, 212:22 **GARDAÍ**[1] - 209:4 4:12, 5:15, 142:8, 126:9, 126:10, **GEAS**[3] - 160:4, 104:20, 104:27, FREELY [1] - 89:24 194:4, 200:22, 211:11 126:14, 131:1, 140:26, 142:9, 194:5, FREEMAN [1] - 2:21 160:9, 165:12 GARDA [293] - 6:16, 131:11, 131:18, GENERAL [36] -200:23 FREQUENT[1] -9:17, 9:18, 9:27, 131:23, 131:28, **FOOT** [1] - 64:16 9:16, 11:26, 16:22, 10:15, 10:26, 11:18, 131:29, 132:4, 133:8, 16:28, 17:7, 17:8, FOR [11] - 1:7, 2:6, FREQUENTLY [1] -12:6, 12:9, 12:28, 136:24, 141:19, 17:18, 17:19, 21:17, 2:9, 2:14, 2:20, 2:26, 59:24 13:1, 13:13, 13:16, 142:4. 142:11. 3:1, 4:1, 4:5, 4:12, 22:3, 22:4, 22:18, FRIDAY [2] - 96:22, 13:19, 14:1, 14:15, 142:12, 142:13, 23:5, 24:17, 27:29, 104:19 171:15 16:7, 16:14, 16:24, 142:14, 142:17, FORCE [4] - 6:18, FRIEND [3] - 15:2, 28:13, 37:25, 41:7, 16:26, 18:22, 18:23, 142:19, 143:29, 41:8, 41:24, 43:28, 78:12, 78:25, 81:16 79:5. 212:14 144:10, 145:14, 18:25, 19:24, 19:25, 43:29, 55:17, 81:14, FOREFRONT [2] -FRIEND [3] - 72:11, 20:9, 21:20, 28:15, 147:3. 147:24. 148:7. 56:2, 164:13 82:3, 82:7, 82:20, 81:14, 82:21 30:6, 31:24, 32:4, 148:16, 148:20, 84:23, 100:12, FORESAW [1] -FRONT [3] - 29:20, 32:21, 33:8, 33:13, 148:24, 149:24, 117:24, 118:29, 135:6 129:14, 168:14 34:2, 34:6, 34:22, 150:13, 150:18, 165:17, 166:17, **FORGIVE** [2] - 29:21, FRUSTRATED[1] -35:15, 35:28, 36:5, 150:29, 151:5, 178:29, 206:13, 43.21 36:26, 37:7, 37:9, 151:25, 152:29, 212:16 FORGOTTEN[1] -FRUSTRATION[3] -38:7, 39:28, 40:2, 153:22, 154:1, **GENERALLY** [6] -178:4 173:17, 180:20, 156:11, 157:25, 40:15, 40:20, 44:7. 14:19, 24:17, 100:19, **FORM** [10] - 15:17, 180:23 44:10, 44:21, 45:3, 158:18. 161:13. 145:25, 146:13, 62:4, 77:6, 82:22, FRUSTRATIONS [2] 163:7, 163:9, 164:23, 45:13, 45:16, 45:23, 148:27 97:17, 98:8, 117:13, - 181:6, 181:8 46:3, 46:15, 46:21, 165:12, 165:18, GENTLEMEN [2] -138:27, 197:20, 206:6 **FULL** [10] - 57:8, 46:25, 48:23, 49:8, 165:21, 165:24, 209:19, 209:21 **FORMAL** [2] - 19:21, 72:21, 92:29, 101:26, 49:24, 50:3, 50:25, 165:29, 166:26, GERAGHTY[1] -103:5, 110:18, 51:1, 51:20, 54:26, 167:12, 167:27, FORMALLY [1] -137:26, 153:7, 55:12, 55:25, 56:1, 168:10, 168:20, GERARD[1] - 2:10 147:16 186:16, 204:15 56:11, 56:16, 56:21, 168:24, 171:10, **GERRY** [1] - 3:10 **FORMAT**[2] - 33:21, **FULLY** [5] - 46:9, 57:9, 58:5, 58:12, 171:21, 174:12, **GIFT** [1] - 67:3 166:7 46:12, 113:11, 131:6, 58:16, 58:22, 60:23, 175:18, 177:4, GIST [2] - 162:26, FORMED [1] - 34:3 179:28 61:27, 63:13, 63:20, 177:20, 179:27, 201:19 **FORMER** [2] - 1:13, FUNCTION [3] -64:2, 64:10, 64:13, 180:3, 180:9, 181:25, GIVEN [30] - 8:9, 102:16, 122:20, 65:11, 66:10, 66:17, 181:26, 181:28, 20:6, 25:28, 30:28, FORMERLY [2] -127:26 67:22, 69:8, 69:12, 181:29, 182:1, 182:3, 35:13, 36:19, 36:25, 106:1, 109:13 FUNCTIONS [2] -69:21, 69:26, 70:14, 182:20, 183:14, 38:23, 40:11, 49:1, FORMING [1] -105:22, 105:24 184:12, 185:23, 70:21, 70:25, 70:26, 51:2, 61:4, 70:25, 179:20 FUND [5] - 165:29, 72:1, 72:6, 75:15. 186:22. 188:9. 72:25, 87:21, 92:3, **FORMS** [1] - 197:15 166:11, 166:12, 75:29, 78:23, 79:1, 188:11, 188:17, 96:17, 103:29, 115:6, 166:13, 166:17 FORTH [1] - 210:22 84:29, 85:8, 85:24, 190:16, 192:18, 118:26, 119:3, FUND [1] - 163:7 FORWARD[8] -192:20, 193:5, 193:9, 87:3. 87:22. 88:5. 122:12, 136:13, 29:25, 82:3, 82:20, FURNISHED[1] -89:6, 89:8, 89:17, 193:13, 194:7, 148:21, 155:18, 97:5, 106:22, 133:2, 90:24, 91:2, 91:4, 194:16, 194:21, 178:25, 197:25, 187:14, 196:10 **FURTHER** [2] - 5:8, 91:11, 91:12, 91:13, 194:24, 195:3, 195:4, 200:3. 203:4 FORWARDED [1] -103:20 91:22, 92:1, 92:10, 195:27, 196:7, GLAD[1] - 68:28 81:19 **FURTHER-**92:28, 93:7, 93:27. 197:15, 198:3, **GLEESON** [1] - 4:8 FOUNDATION [2] -**EXAMINED** [2] - 5:8, 94:4, 94:20, 94:22, 198:15, 198:16, **GOODE** [1] - 3:21 89:12, 126:14 103:20 95:2, 95:6, 95:10, 198:21, 199:1, 199:4, GOSH [1] - 205:9 FOUNDATIONS[1] -96:24, 96:29, 97:3, 199:6, 199:14, GOVERNED [1] -89:25 97:5, 97:11, 98:7, 199:22, 200:6,

66:18 GOVERNMENT[1] -134:22 **GP** [9] - 80:15, 81:1, 88:27, 97:8, 99:19, 100:7, 122:2, 130:24, 131:12 **GP'S** [1] - 130:14 GRA [2] - 120:24, 127:29 **GRADE** [1] - 36:18 GRADUALLY[1] -164:16 **GRALTON** [1] - 3:14 GRANTED[1] -153:16 GREAT [2] - 70:29, 162:13 **GREENE** [1] - 2:26 GRIEVANCE [1] -91:13 **GRIFFIN** [1] - 3:26 **GRITTY** [1] - 38:2 GROUP [18] -124:24, 125:4, 125:6, 125:8, 126:4, 126:6, 126:20, 127:25. 128:8, 129:2, 129:10, 129:22, 131:16, 133:11, 135:8, 135:9, 135:25, 137:13 GS[1] - 158:17 GUARD [4] - 29:9, 36:9, 144:27, 145:12 **GUARDS** [7] - 25:6, 162:11, 165:29, 166:2, 192:23, 209:15 GUARDS [2] - 163:6, 175:22 **GUESS**[1] - 197:6 GUIDANCE [2] -68:8, 69:19 GUIDELINES [1] -66:25 **GUY** [1] - 102:23 **GWEN** [1] - 1:24 **GWEN** [1] - 1:29 Н

HALF [6] - 6:23, 7:1, 105:21, 109:17, 110:18, 125:19 HALFWAY [2] -129:7, 207:18 HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 **HAND**[1] - 40:8 **HANDS**[1] - 130:18 **HAPPY** [11] - 47:7,

54:12, 54:19, 102:22, 110:7, 113:2, 144:29, 186:1, 193:23, 205:19, 211:6 HARAN[1] - 4:6 HARASS[1] - 94:22 HARASSED[1] -27:22 95:10 187:17 166:10 145:6 199:27 135.24

HARASSING[1] -HARASSMENT[14] -8:28, 10:6, 18:17, 21:11, 24:19, 26:6, 27:16, 27:21, 74:15, 76:3, 91:14, 186:20, HARD[1] - 180:11 HARDSHIP[1] -HARM [2] - 145:5, HARM'S [1] - 125:27 HARSHLY[1] -HAT [1] - 145:14 **HAVING** [2] - 104:26, **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 **HEAD**[2] - 96:14, **HEADED**[1] - 95:26 HEADING [3] -28:12, 81:3, 84:21 **HEADQUARTERS** [4] - 75:15, 105:11, 105:24, 105:25 **HEADQUARTERS** [2] - 7:25, 203:25 HEALTH [5] - 78:24, 108:7, 112:4, 113:22, 125:9

HEALTH [13] - 24:21, 108:24, 108:26, 112:1, 112:3, 120:21, 125:8, 125:13, 162:13, 167:21, 184:4, 194:27, 194:28 **HEAR** [4] - 172:3, 179:18, 188:5, 203:28 **HEARD** [12] - 151:8,

155:28, 159:29, 161:26, 163:14, 167:19, 200:3, 205:13, 208:25, 208:26, 210:11, 212:4 HEARING [2] -

75:23, 127:19 **HEARING** [4] - 6:1, 74:8. 104:19. 212:26 HEAVILY [1] -

191:16 **HELD** [1] - 56:26 **HELD** [1] - 1:17 HELICOPTER [1] -62:27 **HELP** [10] - 29:18, 112:19, 114:25, 139:1, 154:14, 160:7, 183:16, 184:18, 198:6, 203:16 HELPFUL [3] -19:26, 54:21, 177:4 **HELPING** [1] - 106:3 **HEO** [1] - 108:17 HIDE [1] - 12:7 HIGGINS [1] - 4:12 HIGH [3] - 88:14, 114:14, 155:9 HIGHLIGHTED [1] -127:15 HIMSELF [12] -32:24, 49:26, 83:2, 114:25, 116:1, 154:13, 160:11, 161:10, 163:2, 178:23, 200:19. 206:11 HINDSIGHT [3] -132:13, 132:14, 135:4 HISTORIC [1] -155:11

HISTORY [1] - 64:3 HIT [1] - 145:13 **HMM** [7] - 169:4, 174:22, 177:9,

199:28, 207:8 HOLD [5] - 27:18, 41:1, 43:7, 141:24 **HOME** [2] - 170:10, 176:1

183:22, 184:24,

HONEST [4] - 10:25, 76:8, 174:4, 174:7 HONESTY [2] -205:28, 206:2

HOPE [1] - 177:1 HOPING [1] - 73:29 HORAN [1] - 3:24

HOURS [3] - 100:24, 170:5, 189:17 HOUSE [3] - 2:23,

HOUSE [2] - 143:4, 202:29 **HQ**[1] - 77:29

3:27. 4:13

HR [22] - 16:3, 51:21, 52:2, 52:22, 54:2, 54:23, 54:27, 61:13, 63:14, 63:19, 64:17, 96:14, 96:17, 105:20,

105:21, 143:10, 143:14, 143:19, 143:22, 143:28, 144:2 **HRM** [48] - 9:11, 13:12, 26:13, 38:13, 51:22, 51:26, 53:14, 54:6, 54:18, 60:29, 62:13, 66:24, 67:2, 68:8, 71:24, 81:19, 82:9, 82:13, 86:10, 101:17, 101:19, 102:2, 105:8, 105:12, 105:16, 105:20, 105:24, 105:25, 105:26, 105:28, 106:8, 106:9, 107:6, 115:24, 117:5, 117:19, 117:22, 119:18, 120:8, 120:29, 121:8, 122:15, 142:23, 143:14, 143:16, 158:17, 158:25, 165:13

HRPD [15] - 105:16, 105:19, 105:26, 108:19, 108:29, 112:28, 118:10, 128:10, 129:5, 136:1, 143:15, 158:12, 158:15, 165:13, 167:7 HUGE [1] - 160:26 HUGELY [1] - 154:29 **HUGHES** [2] - 2:29,

HRM.. [1] - 117:6

2:30 **HUMAN**[2] - 105:7, 107:21 **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15

HUMAN[1] - 105:19

ı

IA [3] - 143:10,

144:1, 144:2 ICELAND[1] - 4:13 **IDEA** [5] - 122:12, 122:14, 128:13, 148:27, 193:10 IDEAS [1] - 129:26 IDEATION[1] -146:21 IDENTIFIED [7] -25:12, 47:16, 48:8, 48:26, 60:6, 69:21, 100:19 **IDENTIFIES** [5] -20:23, 20:28, 59:9, 59:10, 63:19

IDENTIFY [12] - 9:21, 10:11, 15:21, 17:29, 19:28, 49:23, 55:15, 56:9, 64:1, 92:23, 103:25, 107:26 IDENTIFYING [6] -9:25, 10:3, 48:21, 48:26, 60:7, 198:11 ILLNESS [26] -52:10, 52:14, 53:23, 83:21, 83:23, 98:19, 109:16, 110:8, 111:4, 111:10, 111:12, 111:18, 111:22, 125:14, 125:18, 130:16, 130:17, 137:2, 137:5, 146:21, 167:6, 167:21, 167:24, 169:18 ILLNESSES [1] -98:20 IMAGINE [5] -108:26, 144:8, 156:16, 156:27, 164:6 IMMEDIATELY [4] -79:12, 84:27, 110:16, 152:22 IMPACT [6] - 21:5, 22:22, 84:19, 86:13, 86:20, 134:20 IMPACTED[1] -110.13 IMPATIENCE [2] -29:22, 43:21 IMPORTANCE [2] -113:10, 208:23 IMPORTANT[9] -12:29. 58:18. 71:1. 79:6, 79:8, 87:14, 160:10, 174:2, 179:14 **IMPOSED** [1] - 101:2 IMPOSSIBLE [1] -27:8 **IMPRESS**[1] - 113:9

IMPRESSION [5] -198:27, 199:12, 199:13, 199:29, 200:6 IMPROPER [1] -199:21 IN [1] - 1:17 INABILITY [2] -55:16, 57:10

INACCURATE[1] -87:18 INACTION [1] -173:18

INAPPROPRIATEL Y [1] - 180:1 INARTICULATE[1] -36:23

INCIDENT [4] - 83:8, 137:3, 179:29, 210:12 INCIDENTS [4] -91:3, 189:13, 189:14, 211.14 INCLUDE [2] -124:25, 126:25 INCLUDED [1] -97:23 INCORRECT [5] -35:13, 36:13, 37:1, 54:2. 63:12 INDEED [10] - 8:6, 8:8, 9:1, 9:7, 72:1, 91:21, 94:25, 100:2, 100.16 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 INDICATE [2] -79:15, 94:20 INDICATED [4] -81:14, 81:18, 161:21, 204:14 INDICATES [3] -83:5, 84:6, 97:7 INDIVIDUAL [9] -12:12, 24:6, 29:6, 30:12, 32:4, 32:9, 79:23, 109:11, 133:13 INDIVIDUAL'S [1] -87:17 INDIVIDUALS [2] -112:10, 121:17 **INDOOR** [1] - 175:15 INDOORS [1] -175.23 INDUSTRIAL [1] -106:25 INFERENCE [1] -159:16 INFLUENCE [1] -117:12 **INFO** [1] - 39:5 **INFORM** [3] - 113:8, 113:18, 113:21 INFORMAL[1] -76.12 **INFORMATION** [34] -12:16, 12:27, 18:3, 25:28, 30:27, 32:5, 32:12, 33:25, 34:10, 38:6, 39:10, 41:15, 42:20, 45:17, 46:3, 46:20, 49:19, 50:25, 56:1, 61:28, 61:29, 63:20, 65:13, 71:28, 75:18, 82:18, 82:26, 82:29, 83:5, 94:12, 172:24. 190:8 INFORMED [6] -65:11, 113:17, 120:2,

149:10 **INITIAL** [1] - 170:6 **INITIALS**[1] - 143:13 **INITIATED**[1] - 38:3 INITIATING [1] -116.11 **INJURED** [4] - 26:11, 52:15, 53:15, 102:23 INJURIES [2] -153:11, 153:17 INJURY [54] - 8:25, 26:11, 51:20, 53:6, 53:16, 54:11, 82:4, 82:7, 82:23, 83:7, 83:12, 83:22, 83:24, 83:28, 84:9, 84:15, 92:24, 101:15, 101:28, 103:7, 111:26, 111:27, 123:29, 124:1, 124:24, 125:13, 125:15, 125:16, 125:23, 125:24, 125:28, 126:3, 126:20, 127:25, 128:14, 128:15, 129:22, 129:24, 130:3, 130:16, 130:17, 130:21, 130:25, 133:28, 134:8, 136:9, 136:26, 137:2, 137:5, 137:13, 153:6, 153:10 INJURY/ILLNESS [1] - 138:20 INPATIENT[1] -104:7 INQUIRIES [2] -31:11, 53:13

INQUIRY [5] - 155:1, 199:7, 199:21, 209:25, 210:3 INQUIRY [2] - 1:2, 116:6 INSOFAR [1] -125.22 101:26 INSPECTOR [9] -- 95:3 77:1, 104:23, 123:5, 142:22, 151:9, 15:14 151:13, 155:21, 165:22, 175:7 181.7 INSPECTOR [22] -50:12, 104:29, 105:3, 62:16 106:13, 107:13, INTERMEDIATE[1] -107:18, 116:13, 161:16 117:5, 127:5, 131:6,

138:8, 140:19,

141:27, 141:29,

149:10, 165:4,

140:28, 141:5, 141:9,

185:18, 185:20, 208:14 INSPECTOR [10] -3:3, 3:9, 3:14, 3:17, 3:17, 3:21, 4:6, 5:10, 104:26, 140:25 INSPECTORS [1] -106:17 INSPECTORS [1] -121:8 INSTANCE [3] -12:19, 14:3, 19:28 **INSTANCES** [1] - 9:2 INSTEAD [2] - 35:7, 90.10 INSTRUCT[1] -101:17 INSTRUCTED [8] -2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:29, 3:25. 4:1. 4:9. 4:12 INSTRUCTED[1] -96:23 INSTRUCTION [6] -95:26, 96:1, 96:6, 96:17, 96:25, 97:16 INSTRUMENT[1] -INSUFFICIENT [1] -70.21 INTAKE[1] - 190:29 **INTEGRITY** [1] - 66:1 **INTEND** [1] - 94:22 INTENDS [1] -175:11 INTERACTION [2] -85.8 132.3 INTEREST [1] -66:14 INTERESTED [6] -41:19, 159:7, 159:26, 187:26, 188:4, 204:26 INTERESTS [1] -INTERFERE [1] -INTERFERENCE [1] INTERFERING [1] -INTERLINK [1] -INTERLINKED [1] -

142:27, 143:11, 143:27 INTERPRET [1] -159:13 INTERPRETATION [5] - 40:17, 45:28, 46:1, 85:20, 85:23 INTERPRETED[1] -126.11 INTERRUPTING [4] -22:26, 23:16, 27:7, 28:18 INTERVENE [1] -15:18 INTERVENING [1] -181:23 INTERVENTION[1] -78:21 INTERVIEW [4] -11:28, 18:6, 34:6, 64:21 INTERVIEWED [2] -172:8, 172:14 INTERVIEWING [1] -200.4 INTERVIEWS [3] -57:26, 57:28, 58:5 INTIMATED [2] -90:28. 91:2 INTIMATED" [1] -90:25 **INTO** [1] - 1:2 INTRODUCE [1] -125:12 INTRODUCED[1] -109:19 INTRODUCING [2] -128:13, 128:14 INTRODUCTION [1] - 110·11 INVESTIGATE [7] -69:10, 70:14, 72:15, 96:9, 127:2, 127:5, 138.8 INVESTIGATED [2] -42:5, 76:15 **INVESTIGATION** [72] - 9:15, 9:20, 13:7, 13:11, 18:18, 18:26, 18:27, 21:12, 26:4, 26:5, 26:14, 30:28, 31:1, 32:10, 33:3, 38:2, 42:4, 44:23, 45:15, 45:21, 46:5, 46:10, 46:12, 46:13, 47:4, 47:13, 48:11, 48:19, 54:1, 55:16, 55:17, 55:20, 55:28, 57:11, 61:3, 61:9,

61:11, 61:16, 61:18,

62:1, 62:4, 62:15, 65:8, 65:13, 67:7, 69:15, 70:24, 71:9, 72:7, 74:27, 75:24, 83:8, 84:26, 85:1, 86:18, 86:25, 91:12, 103:1, 108:15, 149:3, 152:18, 170:14, 170:16, 172:20, 186:20, 186:25, 187:18, 209:16, 210:5 **INVESTIGATIONS** [4] - 44:19, 49:9. 84:22, 99:8 **INVESTIGATIONS**" [1] - 84:21 INVESTIGATORS [1]- 116:27 **INVITED** [3] - 122:15, 122:17, 177:17 **INVOLVE** [1] - 65:4 INVOLVED [10] -31:8, 37:11, 120:22, 120:26, 122:18, 123:9, 131:3, 140:7, 149:3, 165:15 **INVOLVEMENT** [3] -93:10, 108:14, 147:3 IRRELEVANT[1] -85:21 IRRESPECTIVE [1] -23:8 **IS..** [1] - 160:18 ISOLATED [1] -160:10 **ISSUE** [113] - 7:20, 8:15, 10:14, 11:5, 11:16, 13:23, 14:14, 21:13, 24:21, 24:23, 25:29, 29:15, 32:15, 38:16, 40:22, 44:7, 44:13, 45:19, 46:16, 47:6, 49:1, 49:2, 52:15, 53:6, 53:17, 55:15, 56:3, 56:19, 58:10, 58:20, 58:26, 62:19, 62:28, 65:19, 66:2, 66:8, 66:10, 66:17, 68:6, 69:4, 73:16, 73:19, 73:25, 80:12, 98:7, 102:24, 106:26, 109:8, 110:2, 110:3, 110:6, 110:8, 114:27, 116:14, 116:17, 116:19, 116:24, 117:16, 117:25, 120:1, 120:3, 120:9. 122:13. 122:15, 123:4, 123:10, 124:5,

INTERMITTENT[2] -

INTERMITTENTLY

[3] - 40:2, 40:4, 44:8

INTERNAL[3] -

56:10 57:13

124:23, 124:27, 125:1, 126:19, 128:26, 129:4, 129:6, 130:8, 130:15, 131:8, 131:9, 131:10, 133:9, 133:12, 135:14, 136:7, 138:5, 139:10, 139:28, 140:12, 141:2, 153:9, 154:15, 155:22, 157:18, 159:11, 161:1, 162:1, 173:10, 174:3, 174:19, 181:10, 182:28, 183:28, 184:3, 184:28, 185:8, 186:20, 195:3, 195:14, 195:15, 195:23, 197:6, 197:10, 197:11 ISSUED [1] - 98:11 **ISSUES** [31] - 18:11, 27:23, 59:22, 60:7, 61:27, 79:28, 83:27, 97:11, 102:18, 106:25, 109:26, 118:18, 126:1, 131:20, 139:8, 139:29, 146:25, 159:1, 159:3, 161:4, 174:24, 177:19, 178:25, 184:14, 194:23, 198:17, 201:26, 207:22, 207:28. 208:4. 210:21 **ISSUING** [2] - 54:14, ITSELF [6] - 46:15, 70:25, 78:5, 88:6, 93:26, 127:7

J

JACK[1] - 3:6 **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 JANUARY [14] -56:27, 56:28, 74:27, 75:22, 88:15, 88:27, 105:12, 119:8, 154:26, 168:5, 181:10, 188:17, 189:1, 189:9 **JANUARY**[3] - 1:18, 6:2, 212:27 **JB** [1] - 133:3 JIGSAW [2] - 65:24, 101:18 **JOB** [13] - 8:5, 8:19, 8:27, 26:13, 53:15, 54:10, 114:13, 154:27, 160:12,

161:11, 164:18, 175:21, 179:14 **JOB'S** [1] - 8:7 **JOE** [1] - 3:13 **JOHN** [7] - 128:10, 139:24, 165:17, 165:25, 192:5, 192:22, 212:13 **JOHN** [4] - 2:10, 2:15, 3:8, 4:1 **JUDGE** [2] - 81:2, JUDGE [1] - 3:12 JUDGMENT [7] -16:12, 87:18, 160:22, 173:3, 198:26, 199:8, 200:2 JUDGMENTAL [1] -179:16 JULY [16] - 6:25, 7:1, 93:28, 103:29, 122:7, 122:13, 123:8, 151:2, 157:25, 173:9, 173:10, 174:1, 174:19, 185:6, 185:8, 203:26 JUMP [1] - 85:12 JUNCTION [1] -13.21 JUNCTURE [1] -116:4 JUNE [17] - 60:17, 60:18, 105:12, 123:9, 123:19, 131:9, 132:16, 135:23, 139:4, 139:16, 158:18, 172:5, 172:16, 173:8, 185:1, 185:3 JUSTICE [2] -106:19, 173:13

K

JUSTICE [3] - 1:7,

1:12, 2:2

KANE [1] - 2:28 **KATE** [1] - 3:25 KAVANAGH[19] -33:18, 55:2, 59:19, 74:16. 112:8. 116:28. 123:23, 124:16, 132:18, 138:17, 139:17, 151:24, 151:25, 168:17, 187:14, 187:20, 190:19, 194:9, 201:8 **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:5 **KAY** [1] - 133:15

KEANE [1] - 4:7 KEEN [1] - 190:27 **KEEP** [7] - 27:13, 30:11, 43:12, 43:22, 81:13, 172:19, 180:11 KEEPING [3] -113:10, 149:26, 186:6 **KELLY** [1] - 6:6 **KELLY** [6] - 2:9, 3:11, 6:8, 15:7, 209:24. 210:3 KEOGH [170] - 6:16, 9:17, 9:18, 11:18, 12:9, 13:1, 13:16, 13:20, 14:1, 14:15, 16:7, 16:14, 16:25, 16:26, 17:11, 18:23, 18:25, 19:24, 19:25, 20:9, 28:15, 30:6, 31:24, 32:4, 32:21, 33:8, 33:13, 34:2, 34:6, 34:22, 35:15, 35:28, 36:5, 36:27, 37:7, 38:7, 39:28, 40:2, 40:15, 40:20, 44:7, 44:10, 44:21, 45:13, 45:16, 45:23, 46:3, 46:15, 46:21, 46:25, 48:23, 49:8, 49:24, 50:3, 50:25, 51:1, 51:20, 54:26, 55:13, 55:25, 56:2, 56:11, 56:16, 56:21, 57:9, 58:6, 58:12, 58:16, 58:22, 60:23, 61:27, 63:14, 63:20, 64:2, 64:10, 64:13, 65:11, 66:17, 67:22, 69:12, 69:22, 69:27, 70:21, 70:25, 70:26, 72:1, 72:6, 84:29, 85:24, 87:22, 88:5, 89:8. 90:24. 91:2. 91:11, 91:22, 92:10, 93:7, 93:27, 94:4, 94:20, 94:22, 95:2, 95:6, 95:10, 96:24, 96:29, 97:3, 97:5, 97:11, 98:7, 98:16, 99:29, 104:2, 107:10, 109:11, 109:27, 113:8, 118:23, 131:11, 131:19, 131:29, 133:9, 143:29, 147:3, 147:24, 148:16, 148:20, 149:24, 150:13, 150:18, 150:29, 152:29,

158:18, 161:17, 164:23, 165:24, 168:24, 177:4, 177:20, 179:27, 180:3, 180:9, 181:29, 183:14, 184:12, 185:23, 186:22, 188:9, 188:11, 193:6, 194:24, 195:4, 195:28, 196:7, 197:15, 198:3, 199:1, 199:6, 199:14, 200:6, 201:20, 202:25, 204:14, 205:3, 207:19, 207:28 **KEOGH** [1] - 2:9 KEOGH'S [28] - 9:27, 10:15, 10:26, 12:6, 12:28, 13:13, 17:1, 18:23, 21:20, 37:9, 45:3, 66:10, 69:8, 70:14, 75:29, 89:7, 92:1, 92:28, 103:5, 154:1, 165:22, 167:12, 171:10, 174:12, 175:18, 194:21, 198:16, 205:28 **KEPT**[1] - 150:18 **KERRY** [1] - 149:19 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 **KEY** [8] - 44:13, 44:14, 44:15, 80:18, 103:7, 134:12, 152:14, 190:19 KICK [3] - 48:18, 50:15, 195:8 KICKED [1] - 31:27 **KICKING** [1] - 49:13 KICKS [4] - 18:18, 21:12, 109:14, 109:18 KIERAN [1] - 3:19 KILLARNEY [1] -101:17 KIND [20] - 22:12, 22:15. 100:12. 145:11, 145:14, 146:3, 149:29, 150:22, 150:24, 160:26, 161:16, 174:27, 178:28, 180:14, 182:14, 188:3, 195:20, 204:29, 206:12, 212:16 KINDLY [2] - 137:15, 168:3 KIRWAN [1] - 3:13

KITTY [1] - 166:17

KNOCK [1] - 129:9

KNOWLEDGE [5] -36:26, 76:20, 76:28, 138:28, 140:15 **KNOWN** [9] - 30:15, 106:1. 148:24. 148:29, 149:16, 149:17, 160:6, 164:12, 191:2 KNOWS [4] - 20:23, 33:9, 33:14, 199:23

L

LANDSDOWN [1] -122:18 **LANDY** [2] - 148:7, 168:20 LANGUAGE[3] -76:7, 85:3, 87:6 LARGELY [1] -172.28 LAST [16] - 6:19. 52:6, 83:17, 90:26, 90:27, 100:1, 112:16, 115:2, 121:16, 153:17, 155:15, 163:27, 168:5, 170:23, 201:23, 203:12 **LASTED**[1] - 76:4 **LATE**[2] - 76:12, 173:11 **LATTER** [1] - 15:19 **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:28 **LAYA**[1] - 162:15 **LAYER** [1] - 65:29 **LEAD** [1] - 120:21 LEADING [1] -122:19 **LEAP**[1] - 133:28 **LEARNING** [1] - 76:6 **LEAST**[6] - 23:23, 43:12, 45:8, 69:29, 199:4, 200:19 **LEAVE** [12] - 19:25, 24:22, 52:3, 122:23, 125:18, 140:15, 170:25, 180:6, 180:29, 184:4, 201:15, 201:21 **LEFT** [1] - 68:27 **LEGAL** [1] - 198:17 LEGISLATION [1] -132:6 LEGITIMATE[3] -61:18, 69:9, 198:29 **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:12 **LENGTH** [1] - 13:1

LETTER [12] - 22:11,

153:22, 156:11,

22:15, 35:21, 53:28, 63:21, 64:1, 67:8, 67:14, 67:23, 74:18, 74:23. 90:29 **LETTERS** [2] - 53:29, 173:13 LEVEL [7] - 88:14, 105:11, 114:14, 147:12, 155:9, 211:14 LIAISE [2] - 118:29, **LIAISING** [2] - 37:12, 122:2 **LIAM** [1] - 3:17 **LIBERTY** [1] - 141:6 LICENCES [1] -164:14 LIFE [5] - 145:8, 160:18, 160:26, 201:17, 201:27 **LIGHT** [8] - 69:17, 79:20, 80:15, 92:14, 99:20, 164:12, 164:17, 164:20 **LIKELY** [2] - 30:4, **LIMIT** [2] - 69:20, 69:25 **LIMITED** [1] - 178:12 LINE [19] - 10:29, 13:3, 14:8, 18:22, 26:17, 33:9, 37:26, 38:4, 44:12, 47:22, 52:6, 71:12, 116:28, 118:16, 129:14, 135:6, 143:29, 171:27, 172:2 **LINES** [6] - 56:6, 93:26, 94:1, 97:1, 150:23, 151:29 LINK [9] - 9:8, 47:6, 53:12, 80:2, 87:7, 131:5, 132:13, 134:14, 188:8 LINKED [3] - 8:26, 71:16, 126:28 **LINKING** [4] - 13:11, 35:29, 89:9, 133:13 **LIST** [2] - 158:29, 163:22 **LISTEN** [9] - 19:1, 19:2, 31:3, 31:4, 31:14, 32:19, 38:3, 46:27, 48:29 LITERALLY [1] -178:10 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:27

LIVE [2] - 159:11,

LIVER [1] - 202:5

176:23

LIVES [2] - 176:23, 192:7 LOCAL [14] - 52:24, 52:26, 54:8, 108:10, 113:17, 114:4, 114:5, 116:14, 118:4, 154:5, 155:4, 163:11, 166:27, 175:29 LOCALLY [3] - 59:5, 59:12, 111:8 LOCATION[1] -159:9 LOGICALLY [1] -11:15 LONG-TERM [14] -115:5, 147:5, 155:17, 161:5, 161:15, 164:11, 180:6, 180:29, 181:3, 181:4, 195:6, 201:15, 201:21 LOOK [47] - 12:15, 24:23, 27:15, 34:13, 43:16, 48:6, 51:3, 54:18, 58:27, 65:21, 67:28, 68:14, 68:16, 96:23, 107:24, 108:29, 110:14, 110:18, 110:21, 114:9, 116:22, 116:25, 137:26, 138:2, 138:11, 151:8, 157:23, 163:26, 164:7, 167:27, 171:15, 174:24, 174:29, 194:8, 194:16,

68:28, 78:17, 82:4, 83:4, 93:4, 95:25, 138:25, 146:5, 146:9, 199:10, 201:1, 201:29 LOOKED [9] - 38:12, 68:1, 121:21, 127:9, 129:17, 129:23, 136:4. 163:9 LOOKING [16] -16:3, 18:2, 27:24, 32:18, 37:4, 49:17, 68:8, 69:18, 104:2, 107:17, 108:4, 126:16, 129:11, 151:9, 158:15, 164:21 LOOKS [1] - 88:10 LOOSENESS [1] -198:28 **LORRAINE** [6] - 3:4,

LORRAINE [1] -

LOSING [1] - 70:22

163:12

5:3, 6:12, 77:22, 95:20, 103:19

LOST [1] - 48:5 **LOW** [2] - 147:12 **LUNCH** [1] - 104:19 LUNCHTIME [1] -73:29 LYONS [1] - 4:7

М

3.20

MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7 MAIL [28] - 51:29, 55:8, 95:26, 120:28, 121:16, 123:1, 123:19, 123:21, 124:13, 124:19, 126:17, 128:23, 129:27, 131:26, 132:3, 132:16, 132:18, 133:21, 134:2, 135:21, 135:24, 136:3, 139:3, 139:4, 139:7, 139:18 MAIL.. [1] - 139:26 MAILED [1] - 117:10 **MAILS** [9] - 61:4, 123:10, 123:12, 129:29, 139:5, 139:9, 140:5, 140:8, 140:12 MAIN [3] - 153:26, 161:27, 194:20 MAIN [1] - 2:11 MAJOR [1] - 47:4 MAJORITY[1] -24:17 **MALONE** [1] - 1:29 MALONE [7] - 1:24, 133:5, 136:1, 145:22, 168:21, 168:23, 191:8 MAN [2] - 19:4, 199:10 MANAGE[1] -106:22 MANAGED[1] -66:27 MANAGEMENT[34] - 52:24, 52:26, 78:6, 79:19, 83:9, 85:8, 91:23, 92:23, 108:10, 113:8, 113:17, 113:18, 114:4, 114:6, 114:11, 115:5, 115:18. 115:28. 116:14, 118:4, 131:1, 141:19, 149:25, 154:5, 155:5, 155:17, 163:10, 163:11, 164:1, 166:27, 178:28, 182:2,

MANAGEMENT[2] -35:8, 36:6, 36:16, 10:5, 105:8 36:19, 36:24, 37:3, MANAGEMENTS [1] 39:1, 39:16, 40:8 MCCARTAN[2] -- 88.13 MANAGER[4] -4:12, 4:13 MCCOURT [1] - 2:16 94:5, 132:9, 158:5, MCGARRY [1] - 2:20 158:9 MANNER [2] - 96:13, MCGRATH[41] - 2:7, 124:1 2:27, 5:12, 5:20, **MAP**[1] - 57:5 104:22, 104:27, MARCH [6] - 7:2, 105:3, 111:25, 64:13, 110:12, 118:13, 128:23, 182:27, 189:10, 134:27, 141:29, 142:4, 142:13, 189.12 143:26, 145:16, MARGARET[1] -149:23, 150:26, 153:21, 156:28, MARGARET[1] -160:28, 162:24, 135:29 163:23, 164:22, MARGINAL [2] -166:26, 171:20, 81:5. 99:15 173:3, 173:6, 173:8, MARIE [2] - 3:7, 3:16 174:12, 177:3, MARK[1] - 190:22 192:27, 193:8, MARK[1] - 3:3 193:21, 196:13, MARKED[2] -211:5, 211:7, 211:8, 137:19, 140:6 211:11, 211:12, MARKS[1] - 167:20 212:20 MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 MCGRATH'S [1] -MARRY [1] - 93:13 196:24 **MARTIN**[6] - 56:9, MCGUINNESS [16] -56:10, 57:12, 57:14, 2:6, 3:24, 5:7, 29:15, 60:2, 60:5 90:14, 95:16, 95:18, **MATCH**[1] - 86:26 95:21, 95:23, 100:7, MATERIAL [6] -101:1, 101:26, 14:12, 33:27, 63:2, 102:16, 103:10, 68:22, 73:1, 77:27 141:24, 141:25 MATERIALITY[2] -MCGUINNESS [1] -210:17, 210:18 141:6 **MATT**[1] - 3:18 MCLOUGHLIN [27] -MATTER [35] - 13:21, 56:15, 59:1, 62:9, 14:12, 15:23, 22:23, 62:24, 121:3, 123:22, 31:13, 32:24, 38:28, 131:28, 132:8, 40:22, 49:20, 53:11, 132:19, 136:1, 136:4, 55:26, 60:28, 66:24, 136:8, 158:4, 158:25, 67:27, 68:9, 73:2,

159:20, 159:24, 160:1, 167:12, 184:8, 184:9, 185:4, 185:14, 187:25. 204:25. 205:6, 205:9, 212:12 MCLOUGHLIN [1] -3.5 MCLOUGHLIN'S [1] 60:19 MCLYNN [1] - 4:2 MCMAHON [1] - 3:7 MCPARTLIN[1] -

82:9, 85:13, 85:22,

85:24, 85:25, 86:5,

130:17, 138:7, 138:9,

124:28, 128:27,

153:20, 171:19,

198:12, 198:27,

MATTERS[10] -

66:1, 68:7, 74:23,

210:10

16:10, 42:21, 55:12,

96:24, 185:24, 187:7,

MATTERS[1] - 1:4

MATTHIAS[1] - 2:9

MCBRIEN [10] - 2:15,

210:22, 211:8

129:21, 130:2,

3:20 **MEAN** [35] - 21:13, 36.4 37.2 40.22 42:11, 42:26, 43:20,

185:25, 211:27

46:26, 54:29, 56:5, 68:1, 68:2, 68:7, 79:17, 85:15, 86:26, 93:2, 99:25, 102:3, 111:11, 128:29, 129:21, 149:21, 156:9, 160:24, 166:9, 176:12, 189:17, 195:24, 196:17, 199:6, 205:5, 211:6, 211:28, 212:6 MEANING [2] -40:27, 41:4 MEANS [3] - 87:9, 100:20, 203:7 **MEANT**[5] - 85:10, 96:9, 110:15, 152:5, 172:1 MEASURE [2] -129:17, 190:23 MEASURES[1] -64:5 MECHANISM [3] -31:27, 85:10, 176:11 MECHANISMS [2] -66:4, 66:5 **MEDIA** [4] - 135:14, 174:24, 190:2, 190:4 MEDICAL [5] - 78:28, 79:1, 97:12, 98:25, 198:14 MEDICAL [29] -13:13, 32:3, 37:27, 55:25, 61:12, 62:29, 79:16, 79:24, 79:27, 79:29, 80:19, 81:21, 84:4, 97:4, 97:6, 97:10, 118:11, 130:10, 130:18, 131:2, 131:12, 150:1, 152:26, 162:12, 163:5, 165:12, 165:18, 182:20 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 MEDICALLY [6] -40:20, 54:11, 130:20, 131:5, 195:20, 196:8 MEDIUM [2] - 115:5, 155:17 **MEET** [6] - 20:19, 76:19, 116:8, 122:1, 171:27, 183:11 **MEETING** [77] -19:21, 19:22, 19:29, 20:7, 20:21, 20:24, 20:29, 23:18, 23:19, 24:4, 25:4, 25:6, 30:5, 30:25, 30:26, 30:29, 34:16, 34:24, 35:15, 35:19, 40:9, 64:13,

75:6, 75:8, 75:16, 75:20, 75:22, 75:23, 75:26, 75:27, 76:1, 76:4, 76:12, 76:28, 112:22, 113:4, 113:27, 114:19, 115:26, 116:18, 117:11, 117:17, 117:23, 118:28, 119:4, 119:27, 120:1, 120:5, 121:24, 127:15, 144:26, 145:2, 153:24, 153:26, 153:29, 154:22, 155:23, 159:17, 161:28, 162:26, 162:27, 163:16, 163:19, 171:1, 178:6, 183:5, 185:3, 194:12, 194:13, 194:20, 194:25, 195:5, 195:9, 195:14, 202:19 MEETINGS [1] -170:18 MEMBER [105] -15:29, 16:4, 18:6, 19:9, 19:19, 32:4, 32:13, 38:13, 46:8, 52:3, 55:21, 59:10, 59:11, 59:21, 62:20, 64:22, 68:12, 68:18, 68:20, 79:11, 79:12, 79:16. 79:18. 79:19. 80:13, 82:21, 82:24, 82:28, 83:1, 91:25, 93:9, 94:9, 98:12, 99:18, 101:12, 104:6, 109:4, 109:11, 109:21, 112:17, 112:18, 113:10, 113:21, 114:25, 116:1, 116:2, 116:7, 117:29, 119:12, 121:20, 122:1, 137:27, 138:8, 141:17, 145:27, 146:7, 146:15,

151:21, 153:8,

154:13, 158:18,

160:9, 160:11,

161:10, 161:21,

161:22, 164:2,

169:10, 171:26,

172:7, 172:19,

175:11, 177:25,

178:18, 183:5,

183:18, 184:18,

184:25, 185:3,

185:29, 187:1,

158:29, 159:7, 160:8,

187:27, 188:23, 189:26, 190:27, 190:28, 190:29, 191:6, 191:15, 196:16, 201:10, 201:14, 202:2, 202:19, 203:7, 203:16, 203:28, 204:18, 204:27, 207:22, 208:13 **MEMBER** [1] - 2:2 MEMBER'S [21] -80:3, 81:25, 83:20, 83:22, 84:9, 84:13, 97:23, 98:1, 112:14, 114:12, 115:14, 118:29, 122:2, 152:2, 157:4, 160:6, 160:10, 164:2, 177:26, 191:4, 191:14 **MEMBERS** [15] -66:14, 78:25, 79:23, 79:28, 80:9, 81:25, 95:4, 112:3, 144:9, 145:18, 162:11, 171:21, 172:12, 172:21, 191:2 MEMBERS[1] - 81:9 MEMBERS' [1] - 79:2 MEMORANDUM[1] -163:24 **MEMORY** [2] - 75:25, MENTAL[4] - 24:21, 167:21, 184:4, 194:27 MENTION [3] -165:27, 173:20, 208:26 MENTIONED [15] -57:11, 85:27, 87:13, 89:23, 110:27, 120:18, 120:19, 135:25, 137:24, 172:21, 173:14, 181:28, 202:5, 204:11, 208:26 **MENTIONING** [2] -174:23, 174:24 MENTIONS [1] -174.29 MERELY [1] - 25:29 **MET**[11] - 30:3, 34:22, 74:26, 76:1, 77:3, 126:4, 158:17, 170:10, 185:29, 198:21, 212:13 MHUIRE [1] - 165:19 MICHAEL [2] - 142:5, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19, 5:15, 142:8 **MICK** [3] - 108:23, 147:28, 158:17 MICROPHONE [2] -29:18, 29:19 MIDDLE [4] - 88:17, 88:18, 145:1, 184:2 MIGHT [41] - 12:17, 29:13, 30:15, 30:20, 30:22, 32:5, 41:5, 50:12, 51:3, 52:4, 52:22, 54:13, 57:23, 61:23, 68:27, 72:10, 75:18, 86:19, 86:20, 100:21, 102:20, 103:5. 107:18. 107:27, 113:19, 146:3, 148:2, 151:4, 156:9, 162:16, 164:8, 165:5, 165:6, 166:28, 169:6, 170:13. 183:11, 190:6, 201:24 MIGHTN'T [4] - 9:4, 26:7, 30:21, 162:16 MIND [7] - 20:27, 56:3, 151:4, 192:22, 205:2, 209:25 MINDSET [1] -134:29 MINE [3] - 160:18, 171:9. 171:11 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 MINISTER [1] -173:13 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 **MINOR** [3] - 7:28, 86:12.86:20 MINUTE [2] - 108:29, 152:16 **MINUTES** [15] -68:14, 73:27, 74:2, 74:4, 107:10, 107:15, 107:16, 107:18, 107:27, 108:27, 151:15, 157:17, 157:27, 170:4, 189:20 MISLAID [1] - 103:16 MISS [1] - 206:18 MISSING [7] - 42:26,

44:27, 45:5, 163:22,

195:19, 196:5, 196:6

NG [5] - 15:17, 16:19,

MISUNDERSTOOD

MISUSE [2] - 114:12,

MITIGATE [1] - 70:3

16:27, 17:15, 28:25

[2] - 25:24, 166:13

155.6

MISUNDERSTANDI

MONETARY[1] -166:5 MONEY [4] - 166:7, 166:16, 201:17, 203:9 MONICA[2] -107:23, 133:3 **MONICA** [1] - 3:15 MONTH [6] - 123:9, 152:17, 168:29, 169:20, 176:4 **MONTHS**[11] - 44:6, 55:23, 88:14, 125:19, 129:8, 146:9, 146:12, 151:1, 173:8, 183:1, 186:9 **MORAL** [1] - 160:21 MORGAN[3] -148:7, 149:19, 168:20 **MORNING** [11] - 6:4, 6:5, 6:9, 6:15, 11:24, 120:2, 168:8, 176:26, 189:18, 190:21, 205:25 MORONEY [1] - 3:17 MORRISSEY [1] -3.25 MOST[12] - 7:29,25:6. 44:20. 110:13. 110:19, 153:27, 163:5, 174:4, 190:19, 191:23, 192:2, 212:14 MOTOR [1] - 172:22 MOVE [12] - 12:27, 15:6, 16:29, 32:20, 37:18, 45:7, 48:6, 57:6, 170:10, 187:14, 188:15, 196:10 **MOVED** [3] - 122:13, 138:28, 138:29 **MOVING** [11] - 38:26, 81:18, 82:3, 84:23, 85:27, 172:5, 182:6, 182:23, 182:26, 185:1, 185:6

MITIGATION [1] -

17:17, 25:13, 28:14,

36:9, 38:28, 55:26,

90:9, 127:27, 129:29,

80:12, 83:3, 88:7,

143:28, 144:18,

145:17, 145:25,

150:20, 171:2,

192:13, 196:3,

206:16, 207:9

196:14. 196:25

MONDAY [1] -

171:15

MOMENTS [2] -

MOMENT [22] -

27:12

MICHAEL [6] - 3:3,

142:11

MOYLAN[2] - 63:11, 140:28, 141:2, 141:8, MURPHY [12] -207:15, 207:18, NEGOTIATING [1] -96:21 141:29, 142:4, 77:14, 77:20, 80:29, 208:8, 209:3, 209:19, 165:25 142:13, 143:26, MOYLAN'S [2] -85:13, 86:8, 87:1, 209:21, 210:1, 210:9, **NEVER** [23] - 23:2, 145:16, 149:23, 210:19 211:1 66:19, 66:26, 77:3, 96:26, 96:27 99:11, 100:11, MR [99] - 1:12, 2:2, 150:26, 153:21, 100:12, 103:27, 85:9. 90:24. 91:2. 156:28, 160:28, 193:20, 210:18 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:9, 2:9, Ν 91:11, 101:1, 116:1, 2:15, 2:15, 2:20, 2:21, 162:24, 163:23, MURPHY [29] - 2:30, 128:7, 132:10, 164:22, 166:26, 2:21, 2:27, 2:28, 2:28, 3:22, 5:6, 5:8, 14:27, 154:19, 161:17, **NAME** [3] - 121:28, 171:20, 173:6, 173:8, 15:2, 77:15, 77:23, 165:23, 171:14, 3:12, 3:13, 3:16, 3:22, 143:18, 163:16 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:1, 174:12, 177:3, 77:25, 81:2, 81:13, 174:3, 182:1, 197:16, **NAMED**[7] - 1:26, 4:1, 4:7, 4:12, 4:12, 192:27, 193:8, 83:17, 85:14, 85:17, 206:10, 209:25, 12:17, 32:4, 33:8, 193:18, 193:21, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:18, 85:19, 85:22, 87:2, 210:11 33:13, 132:8, 173:18 211:4, 211:8, 211:11, 5:19, 6:8, 14:27, 15:2,87:13, 90:9, 90:24, **NEW** [6] - 29:9, 33:1, **NAMELY**[1] - 167:21 15:7, 29:15, 73:8, 211:12, 212:20 90:27, 92:19, 95:12, 65:22, 99:2, 110:22, NAMES[1] - 12:26 77:15, 77:23, 77:25, MULCAHY [1] - 3:4 100:18, 103:15, 176:25 NATURALLY[1] -MULCAHY [19] -103:20, 103:22, 81:2, 81:13, 83:17, **NEXT** [45] - 7:3, 175:24 103:25, 103:28 85:14, 85:17, 85:19, 35:8, 36:7, 36:14, 13:20, 17:25, 43:16, **NATURE**[10] - 9:21, 85:22, 87:2, 87:13, 37:12, 45:3, 108:13, MURRAY [70] -43:24, 46:27, 59:18, 24:6, 31:20, 37:10, 90:9, 90:24, 90:27, 121:5, 148:11, 149:2, 10:17, 10:28, 14:7, 70:19, 73:7, 80:7, 37:15, 69:10, 71:21, 92:19, 95:12, 95:18, 149:14, 149:27, 24:25, 30:6, 31:22, 81:7, 82:5, 82:15, 146:14, 164:22, 167:6 168:23, 170:20, 95:21, 95:23, 100:18, 33:20, 34:23, 34:27, 83:5, 83:15, 90:22, NAUSEAM[1] -101:1, 101:26, 171:28, 173:17, 35:12, 36:5, 36:12, 96:5, 104:22, 111:29, 34:15 102:16, 103:10, 173:21, 175:5, 36:24, 36:27, 37:1, 121:21, 122:4, 122:7, NAVAN [5] - 105:21, 103:15, 103:20, 182:11, 189:25 37:13, 39:15, 40:7, 123:8, 123:27, 105:22, 107:22, 103:22, 103:25, MULCAHY'S [1] -40:23, 41:18, 41:25, 124:17, 130:6, 142:4, 108:21, 129:5 103:28, 141:25, 43:5, 44:10, 45:2, 152:17, 165:8, 167:2, 175:1 **NEAR** [1] - 176:1 193:14, 193:22, MULLIGAN [49] -46:23, 47:9, 47:16, 171:1, 171:23, **NEARLY** [2] - 178:4, 194:4, 194:7, 198:9, 2:10, 3:12, 5:5, 5:13, 47:20, 51:11, 57:25, 171:28, 175:3, 199:17, 200:10, 6:13, 6:15, 14:29, 64:14, 64:26, 67:10, 175:28, 177:5, 200:12, 200:15, 68:23, 69:1, 69:11, NECESSARILY [11] -15:6, 15:21, 17:27, 181:10, 182:23, 8:7, 18:20, 29:8, 32:7, 200:22, 200:25, 17:29, 23:17, 25:12, 69:23, 70:13, 95:8, 182:26, 185:6, 32:8, 35:1, 57:21, 201:29, 203:11, 25:28, 27:10, 28:19, 96:16, 97:18, 108:9, 185:28, 186:14, 135:20, 168:11, 204:9, 205:23, 113:20, 114:6, 28:21, 28:27, 30:2, 191:10 179:25, 196:26 206:19, 206:21, 40:29, 41:3, 41:27, 114:19. 115:20. **NEXUS** [1] - 49:25 NECESSARY [9] -207:11, 207:15, 45:9. 46:1. 70:2. 70:4. 116:18, 116:20, NICE [1] - 193:25 207:18, 208:8, 209:3, 70:6, 70:8, 70:16, 116:26, 118:1, 121:4, 47:4, 64:5, 65:11, NICHOLAS [2] - 2:9, 92:4, 97:16, 112:17, 209:19, 209:21, 70:18, 70:20, 72:10, 145:23, 145:24, 155:5, 162:25, 113:11, 119:20, 154:2 209:24. 210:1. 210:3. 72:17, 72:22, 72:24, NICHOLAS [4] -NEED [22] - 14:7, 210:9, 210:19, 211:1 163:15, 165:22, 72:29, 73:5, 73:13, 63:13, 109:11, 177:29, 180:26, 14:8, 14:21, 15:27, **MS** [96] - 2:7, 2:10, 73:16, 73:19, 73:25, 109:27, 118:23 2:29, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 74:1, 74:6, 74:12, 185:18, 185:20, 21:1, 35:16, 37:18, NICK [21] - 17:1, 188:22, 188:26, 37:19, 38:3, 40:12, 3:25, 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 74:14, 140:26, 17:11, 47:10, 64:26, 4:8. 5:5. 5:12. 5:13. 140:28. 141:2. 141:8 191:12, 197:19, 48:8, 51:19, 63:19, 65:6, 147:10, 148:25, 197:28, 198:4, 65:20, 71:5, 97:22, 5:20, 6:13, 6:15, MULLIGAN [30] -160:15 161:17 102:22, 123:28, 14:29, 15:6, 15:21, 6:8, 6:10, 15:7, 15:11, 198:21, 200:4 165:5. 171:14. 146:10, 182:23, 17:27, 17:29, 23:17, MURRAY [2] - 3:2, 15:19, 16:21, 17:17, 171:22, 192:6, 193:17 25:12, 25:28, 27:10, 17:26, 23:16, 27:29, 192:10, 192:12, **NEEDED** [8] - 16:2, 28:19, 28:21, 28:27, 28:12, 28:16, 28:18, MURRAY'S [6] - 7:8, 192:20, 195:27, 34:4, 44:1, 97:15, 65:14, 94:25, 124:27, 30:2, 40:29, 41:3, 40:27, 41:1, 42:13, 197:7, 212:4, 212:5 128:26. 130:1. 41:27, 45:9, 46:1, 43:14, 43:26, 45:6, 97:29. 189:3 NICK'S [2] - 191:23, 70:2, 70:4, 70:6, 70:8. 171:18, 187:3 45:29, 64:20, 65:7, MUST [3] - 149:16, 195:18 70:16, 70:18, 70:20, 69:28, 72:12, 72:27, 149:17. 155:3 **NEEDN'T** [1] -**NIGHT** [1] - 189:18 72:10, 72:17, 72:22, 73:6, 74:13, 96:17, MYERS[1] - 77:1 209:22 **NIGHTS** [1] - 100:22 72:24, 72:29, 73:5, 141:1, 141:7 MÍCHEÁL [24] - 3:23, NEEDS [11] - 10:22, NINE [4] - 6:23, 7:1, 11:15, 15:3, 38:4, 73:13, 73:16, 73:19, MULLIGAN'S [1] -5:19, 193:22, 198:9, 38:23. 171:15 73:25, 74:1, 74:6, 48:11, 114:25, 22:17 199:17, 200:22, **NITTY** [1] - 38:2 74:12, 74:14, 77:18, MULLINGAR [1] -200:25, 201:29, 154:13, 160:11, **NOBODY** [4] - 77:19, 104:22, 104:27, 161:10 187:4 203:11, 204:9, 141:26, 205:10, 105:3 111:25 NEGATIVE [2] -MULTIFARIOUS[1] -205:23, 206:19, 205:11 118:13, 128:23, 87:4 18:29, 49:6 206:21, 207:11, **NOEL** [1] - 4:12 134:27, 140:25,

NOLAN [1] - 3:6 172:29, 173:28, NUMBERS [1] -OBLIGED [6] -198:22, 198:26, NOMINATED[2] -176:6, 176:25, 183:2, 202:24 10:20, 17:27, 40:6, 199:23, 199:24 56:10, 57:13 185:23, 185:26, NUMEROUS [3] -64:17, 77:9, 83:4 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:26 188:29, 190:16, OBSERVATION[2] -**OFFICE** [17] - 64:4, **NON** [6] - 97:10, 10:19, 191:15, 212:12 190:20, 190:21, NYLAND[1] - 3:18 75:12. 75:14. 105:28. 144:2, 164:20, 114:21. 154:11 192:28, 195:1, 165:20, 167:16, NÍ [1] - 2:29 **OBSERVATIONS** [7] 105:29, 106:1, 179:16 196:20, 199:11, **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7 106:11, 107:4, 108:1, - 109:2, 112:1, 112:7, 201:1, 210:24 NON-112:9, 114:4, 158:15, 120:7, 120:8, 126:2, NOTHING [7] -127:16, 127:18, CONFRONTATIONAL 0 166:27 27:16, 65:14, 72:15, 139:20, 196:26, **OBVIOUS** [3] -111 - 164:20 NON-IA [1] - 144:2 160:21, 164:15, 114:12, 145:10, 155:6 197:12 O'BRIEN [1] - 73:11 188:6, 188:13 NON-OBVIOUSLY [10] -**OFFICER** [29] - 6:29, **O'BRIEN** [10] - 2:9, **NOTICE** [5] - 20:6, 8:12, 26:12, 80:3, 10:3, 22:19, 32:3, JUDGMENTAL[1] -5:18, 73:8, 193:14, 20:15, 22:8, 24:25, 36:10, 36:15, 36:17, 179:16 97:14, 101:10, 193:18, 194:4, 194:7, 36:22, 37:5, 82:8, 200:3 102:26, 141:11, NON-MEDICAL [1] -200:10, 200:12, NOTICED [2] -153:13, 198:20, 82:13, 86:9, 89:10, 97.10 200:15 163:21, 206:7 96:2. 99:7. 108:23. 209:10 NON-PHYSICAL [1] O'BRIEN [11] -NOTICES [1] - 206:3 114:21, 114:22, OCCASION [2] -- 167·16 107:29, 108:24, 138:6, 142:19, 144:3, NOTIFICATION [3] -94:12. 180:3 NON-PRIVATE[1] -112:5, 151:14, 11:5, 45:11, 58:10 145:20, 145:25, OCCASIONS [5] -165:20 157:29, 158:1, NOTIFIED [6] -10:19, 142:25, 147:6, 147:17, 150:21, NOREEN [1] - 2:15 158:13, 194:2, 199:3, 154:11, 180:16, 19:22, 35:3, 45:13, 198:22, 212:12 **NORM** [2] - 146:1, 199:20. 199:21 193:3, 199:9 45:16, 45:20, 79:13 OCCUPATIONAL [5] 155:26 O'BRIEN'S [1] -**NOTIFY** [6] - 20:20, OFFICER [2] - 3:11, - 78:24, 108:7, 112:4, NORMAL[4] - 71:10, 198:29 20:29, 23:18, 23:22, 113:22, 125:9 98:17, 146:2, 189:22 O'CONNOR [1] -OFFICER [5] - 78:29, 23:23, 23:24 **OCCUPATIONAL** NORMALLY [8] -79:1, 97:12, 98:26, NOTIFYING [1] -[24] - 26:11, 108:24, 12.4 50.4 145.29 O'HIGGINS [10] -198:14 209:7 108:26, 111:27, 146:23, 176:29, 193:21, 198:13, OFFICER'S [1] -**NOTWITHSTANDIN** 112:1, 112:3, 120:20, 179:2, 192:4, 208:29 199:7, 200:16, 124:1, 125:8, 125:13, 20:12 G [2] - 10:28, 129:18 NORTHUMBERLAN 206:16, 207:9, NOVEMBER [4] -125:15, 125:23, OFFICERS [1] -**D**[1] - 2:17 207:13, 210:8, 126:3, 128:14, 75:15 69:2, 176:3, 186:19, **NOTE** [32] - 33:19, 210:17, 210:29 129:24, 130:2, **OFFICERS** [5] - 32:5, 186:28 33:20, 34:11, 34:14, O'HIGGINS [24] -130:16, 130:21, 32:10, 32:11, 42:20, **NOVEMBER/** 34:29, 35:22, 35:24, 3:23, 5:19, 193:22, 130:26, 134:7, 136:9, 75:11 DECEMBER [1] -45:10, 45:11, 45:17, 198:9, 199:17, 136:26, 137:2, 138:20 **OFTEN** [4] - 29:6, 187:10 45:24, 45:27, 45:29, 200:22, 200:25, OCCURRED [7] -179:3, 179:14, 191:21 NOWADAYS[1] -46:3, 46:7, 64:7, 201:29, 203:11, **OGHUVBU** [28] -33:21, 70:22, 82:7, 153.5 64:29, 66:5, 75:2, 204:9, 205:23, 91:3, 96:15, 205:5, 94:2, 103:28, 104:3, NOWHERE [2] -81:5, 89:28, 99:15, 206:19. 206:21. 205:8 108:5, 112:22, 188:3, 204:29 116:13, 122:24, 207:11. 207:15. 113:15, 116:4, NUANCED[1] -OCCURRENCE [2] -150:28, 168:18, 207:18, 208:8, 209:3, 117:28, 118:28, 25:5, 25:7 179:27, 181:9, 19:24 209:19, 209:21, 121:26, 121:27, OCCURS [1] - 137:4 NUGENT [1] - 135:29 182:24, 196:12, 210:1, 210:9, 210:19, OCTOBER [5] -125:8, 164:6, 171:26, NUGENT [2] - 3:13, 196:19, 204:2 211:1 178:17, 178:23, **NOTED** [7] - 41:17, 174:24, 174:29, 3:20 **O'MARA**[1] - 2:16 178:26, 179:5, 191:3, 186:13, 186:14, 169:25, 189:29, NUISANCES [1] -**O'NEILL** [1] - 187:1 196:12, 196:14, 186:19 203:26, 207:27, 49:11 **O'NEILL** [1] - 4:1 196:29, 197:21, **OF** [15] - 1:2, 1:8, 208:22, 208:23 NUMBER [29] - 7:24, O'REARDON[1] -197:27, 198:19, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, NOTES [44] - 1:26, 9:11. 41:12. 41:13. 199:15, 200:7 3:15, 77:11, 95:14, 33:22, 35:21, 87:26, 42:18, 63:24, 78:10, **O'ROURKE** [3] - 4:8, 103:12, 104:13, **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 87:27, 87:29, 93:16, 84:22, 93:7, 107:4, 77:18. 211:4 OGHUVBU'S [4] -140:23, 141:22 93:18, 93:22, 122:23, 109:27, 118:22, O'SULLIVAN [1] -88:3, 191:13, 191:19, OF.. [2] - 150:24, 131:19, 135:28, 146:6, 150:18, 3:7 199.6 206:12 150:20, 150:26, 139:5, 142:25, OBJECTION [2] -OHS [2] - 112:27, OFFER [4] - 187:28, 143:11, 143:26, 155:7, 157:23, 73:20. 210:25 198:10, 204:17, 113:9 157:28, 158:24, 144:24, 147:10, OBLIGATION [1] -204:27 OLD [2] - 98:29, 161:1, 163:23, 147:11, 158:11, 15:18 OFFERED[1]-127:10 167:28, 167:29, 161:1, 163:10, **OBLIGATIONS** [4] -168:3, 168:6, 168:10, 173:21, 184:22, 112:18 **OLDER** [1] - 28:14

7:9, 7:15, 7:17, 84:13

186:9, 189:29, 192:10

169:28, 170:1,

OFFERING [4] -

OLIVIA [2] - 3:11, 4:1

OMISSION [1] -**OPENED** [10] - 23:3, 94:21 34:15, 59:4, 63:3, OMITTED[1] -64:8, 73:2, 118:20, 123:14, 131:26, 140:6 163:16 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, **OPENING** [1] - 30:3 1:18, 2:12, 6:1 **OPERATE**[1] - 66:25 **ON/OFF** [1] - 176:20 OPERATES[1] -ON/OFFS [2] -80:18 176:21 **OPINION** [28] -32:23, 44:22, 46:29, ONCE [8] - 23:24, 49:12, 61:7, 71:26, 63:23, 81:28, 116:9, 128:11, 146:9, 83:10, 129:2, 137:9, 149:29, 150:2 154:19, 161:18, **ONE** [78] - 13:14, 178:18, 179:4, 179:7, 179:8, 179:20, 16:28, 17:25, 29:28, 179:21, 196:15, 39:12, 41:10, 41:12, 196:27, 196:29, 42:8, 42:18, 44:15, 197:15, 197:20, 49:28, 49:29, 50:29, 51:15, 55:19, 56:15, 197:22, 198:10, 198:12, 199:23, 60:15, 62:6, 67:8, 68:26, 70:17, 70:19, 199:24, 200:19 OPPORTUNITY [7] -71:2, 72:13, 72:19, 73:11, 73:21, 73:22, 37:21. 51:6. 51:8. 88:10, 90:3, 100:13, 64:25, 72:6, 130:9, 103:15, 106:3, 107:8, 136:8 115:24, 118:20, OPPOSED [2] -123:24, 124:15. 85:23, 198:12 125:24, 126:9, **OR..** [2] - 156:13, 128:18, 131:27, 209:17 138:13, 138:16, ORDER [15] - 11:10, 140:28, 141:8, 143:4, 12:28, 13:18, 15:25, 143:8, 143:15, 21:1, 25:18, 29:1, 143:22, 148:23, 42:9, 42:29, 43:17, 150:29, 151:1, 151:8, 44:4, 51:19, 59:23, 154:24, 158:8, 159:3, 71:4, 144:22 168:28, 172:12, ORDERLY [1] -176:23, 176:25, 175:12 178:6, 178:10, ORDINARILY [3] -180:21, 184:13, 23:28, 50:11, 65:26 189:13, 192:1, ORDINARY [25] -196:19, 197:7, 19:21, 19:23, 19:26, 198:24, 198:26, 26:19, 52:10, 52:14, 203:22, 204:12, 53:23, 83:21, 83:23, 204.24 207.15 98:19, 101:15, 211:8, 212:13 109:15, 110:8, 111:4, **ONES** [2] - 145:10, 111:10, 111:11, 205:25 111:12, 111:17, **ONGOING** [4] - 42:5, 111:18, 111:22, 91:24, 104:1, 161:1 125:14, 125:18, **ONUS**[1] - 134:23 152:21, 167:21, ONWARDS [1] -169:17 ORGANISATION[15] **OPEN** [12] - 24:4, - 8:20, 8:23, 16:1, 29:3, 30:11, 62:14, 53:4, 54:15, 66:23, 85:1, 90:6, 151:25, 106:23. 128:8. 129:9. 168:27, 183:29, 134:19, 134:25, 190:14, 190:15, 140:1, 162:6, 166:2, 190.18 193:2 OPEN-ENDED [1] -ORGANISE[1] -24:4 73:27

ORGANISED [1] -162:10 ORIGINAL [1] -97:29 ORIGINALLY [2] -183:25, 203:3 ORLA [1] - 3:20 **OSMOND** [1] - 3:27 OTHER [1] - 1:3 OTHERWISE [10] -14:22, 15:18, 79:18, 111:25, 138:4, 150:12, 153:8, 173:2, 173:4, 206:20 **OUGHT** [1] - 41:11 OURSELVES [1] -125:27 OUTCOME [3] -8:29, 84:27, 99:8 OUTLINE [2] -136:29. 158:19 OUTLINED [2] -192:29, 194:24 OUTREACH[1] -78:25 OUTSET[3] -113:26, 163:9, 211:12 OUTSIDE [10] -15:22, 66:25, 67:4, 67:17, 67:18, 74:4, 85:5, 129:21, 146:24, 146:28 OVERALL [2] -92:27, 95:7 OVERCOME [1] -160.8 **OWN** [14] - 7:13, 13:14, 25:13, 33:20, 79:29, 97:23, 130:12, 173:3. 179:20. 182:15, 188:24,

Ρ

197:15, 197:20, 204:2

OWNED [1] - 175:29

PAGE [1] - 5:2 PAGE [90] - 33:17, 34:23, 47:3, 47:14, 47:16, 47:22, 48:6, 51:29, 55:2, 56:7, 57:27, 58:28, 59:18, 59:29, 60:4, 60:10, 63:4, 68:29, 74:17, 74:28, 77:26, 80:7, 81:2, 84:20, 88:11, 88:17, 88:18, 90:4, 90:18, 90:22, 93:5, 93:15, 95:25, 96:5, 96:22, 96:27, 97:22, 99:12, 107:11, 112:8, 116:25, 118:2, 118:13, 118:14, 120:27, 123:27, 132:17, 139:17, 141:9, 142:14, 165:8, 167:2, 168:17, 169:5, 171:23, 177:5, 181:10, 182:23, 182:26, 183:18, 184:2, 184:15, 185:6, 185:28, 186:14, 186:27, 187:20, 187:21, 188:15, 188:16, 189:12, 190:24, 194:9, 194:16, 195:2, 196:13, 201:3, 201:4, 202:12, 202:13, 203:12, 203:21, 204:10, 204:20, 204:22, 205:23, 207:12, 207:16 PAGES [8] - 123:16. 124:17, 150:24, 168:8, 202:14, 203:22, 204:10, 208:9 PAID [7] - 66:28, 86:26, 98:17, 101:20, 162:10, 163:4, 163:5

PAPERS [3] - 50:29, 73:27, 174:1 PARAGRAPH [33] -35:2, 39:19, 56:7, 56:8, 59:18, 75:3, 78:18, 78:27, 79:9, 80:8, 81:3, 81:18, 82:5, 83:5, 83:15, 83:17, 84:6, 84:24, 90:23, 90:26, 90:27, 96:12, 96:13, 99:13, 99:17, 104:3, 114:9, 115:2, 115:11, 130:6, 155:4, 155:15, 163:28 PARAGRAPHS [1] -

PARANOIA [1] 210:22
PARDON [2] 192:15, 205:7
PART [18] - 8:22,
16:28, 18:5, 26:12,
34:27, 40:12, 49:14,
82:26, 94:21, 96:21,
106:28, 124:23,
125:4, 126:19,
127:25, 128:1,
158:10, 160:26

PARTICULAR [28] -

57:26

42:1, 43:11, 44:1, 67:6, 74:19, 83:24, 84:23, 85:27, 99:22, 100:13, 101:12, 105:11, 107:8, 107:9, 109:8, 116:4, 116:5, 124:18, 133:13, 135:7, 144:26, 144:27, 151:12, 167:10, 182:24, 185:23, 186:12, 208:22 PARTICULARLY [6] - 22:5, 124:2, 133:3, 133:13, 140:13,

-22.5, 124.2, 133.3, 133:13, 140:13, 169:13 PARTIES [3] - 15:22, 71:29, 168:6 PARTNER [1] - 150:2 PARTY [7] - 12:15, 18:3, 39:10, 77:16, 141:3, 171:27, 172:2 PASS [1] - 205:19 PASSED [1] - 1:4 PAST [2] - 23:24, 63:23 PAT [10] - 34:27, 35:12, 36:27, 38:3,

63:23
PAT_[10] - 34:27,
35:12, 36:27, 38:3,
39:15, 40:7, 69:11,
69:23, 185:19, 189:3
PATIENT_[1] - 144:16
PATRICK_[7] - 64:14,
64:26, 108:9, 114:6,
115:20, 116:26,
163:14
PATRICK_[4] - 2:7,
2:9, 2:27, 3:2

88:26

PATTERN [9] 176:15, 176:16,
184:1, 185:11, 191:5,
191:14, 191:24,
195:18, 196:8

PATTERNS [2] 14:6, 40:21

PATRICK'S [1] -

PAUL [3] - 2:15, 2:20, 4:1 PAUL'S [1] - 182:20 PAUSE [1] - 80:12 PAY [75] - 7:14,

45:19, 45:21, 46:15, 53:7, 54:18, 66:11, 66:15, 66:17, 66:18, 66:25, 67:3, 70:22, 70:26, 72:4, 72:21, 84:9, 84:13, 84:19, 92:29, 98:15, 98:24, 101:9, 101:11, 101:12, 101:18,

101:26, 101:29,	172:29, 174:5,	30:14, 30:18, 31:15,	PLACEMENT[1] -	29:28, 31:9, 31:10,
102:6, 102:25, 103:5,	175:22, 176:26,	31:18, 31:19, 33:9,	197:12	32:21, 37:17, 38:26,
106:14, 109:5,	179:12, 179:13,	33:14, 36:19, 37:19,	PLACES [2] -	46:20, 47:18, 48:1,
109:13, 109:14,	179:24, 186:6,	41:7, 41:14, 42:13,	130:17, 164:1	49:16, 49:17, 57:2,
109:15, 109:17,	192:10, 195:6, 195:7,	42:19, 44:23, 47:8,	PLACING [3] -	58:21, 60:26, 61:2,
109:22, 109:29,	196:5, 196:8, 196:9,	48:13, 48:15, 48:17,	140:12, 140:14,	65:16, 66:3, 66:20,
110:3, 110:10,	197:9, 208:26,	48:19, 49:18, 50:4,	142:21	69:12, 70:28, 73:26,
110:17, 110:18,	209:27, 210:15,	50:5, 50:13, 50:23,	PLAIN [1] - 117:15	76:10, 79:23, 80:19,
110:28, 111:3, 111:5,	212:7, 212:15	51:24, 51:25, 51:27,	PLAYED[1] - 79:5	83:1, 85:3, 89:7,
118:24, 124:5,	PER [2] - 31:1,	52:15, 52:29, 53:15,	PLEASED [3] -	89:24, 90:28, 92:7,
125:19, 129:6, 129:7,	120:23 PERCEIVED [8] -	54:11, 60:9, 68:3, 71:9, 71:10, 71:11,	182:8, 203:28, 207:24	92:21, 104:8, 130:23,
134:13, 151:22, 152:27, 153:7,		73:11, 73:22, 73:23,	PLOUGH [1] - 62:29	138:26, 188:1, 193:14 POSITIONS [4] -
153:22, 159:1,	18:29, 49:6, 153:10, 162:21, 166:10,	81:28, 86:13, 86:15,	PLOUGHED [1] -	31:11, 43:7, 43:8,
162:12, 162:14,	180:23, 188:14, 197:8	86:24, 89:23, 97:12,	70:24	45:6
162:19, 163:2,	PERCEPTION [1] -	109:14, 137:4, 140:4,	PO [3] - 175:12,	POSITIVE [1] -
169:12, 169:17,	87:17	144:22, 146:1, 150:3,	175:20, 179:24	175:13
169:23, 174:3,	PERFECTLY [5] -	154:25, 160:19,	POINT [60] - 8:15,	POSITIVELY [2] -
183:23, 185:25,	15:11, 43:4, 43:10,	165:19, 172:7,	8:16, 17:12, 31:1, 31:22, 31:25, 32:19,	160:8, 175:27
186:15, 186:16,	73:28, 199:4	172:13, 181:19	35:29, 36:2, 36:3,	POSSIBILITY [2] -
203:3, 204:15	PERFORMING [1] -	PERSONAL[1] -	41:18, 44:4, 44:14,	183:5, 202:19
PAYING [1] - 162:16	150:9	105:19	44:15, 44:17, 44:28,	POSSIBLE [9] -
PAYROLL [1] - 53:7	PERFORMS [2] -	PERSPECTIVE [3] -	45:4, 45:8, 46:6,	17:24, 54:1, 59:22,
PEDANTRY [1] -	64:2, 98:16	16:3, 87:14, 148:17	48:20, 51:21, 55:14,	91:21, 103:5, 156:21,
143:13	PERHAPS [10] -	PERTINENT [1] -	55:22, 56:7, 58:16,	164:1, 194:21, 194:25
PEERS [1] - 64:6	41:11, 49:20, 57:7,	170:5	64:29, 65:10, 70:15,	POSSIBLY [8] - 41:5,
PEGGY [1] - 4:8	70:2, 77:16, 90:9,	PET [1] - 160:17	71:1, 72:18, 72:20,	70:9, 151:14, 189:10,
PENDING [1] - 83:23	96:22, 195:22,	PETER [2] - 2:5, 3:13	79:21, 80:27, 84:20,	192:3, 194:26,
PENSION [1] -	197:10, 210:21	PETER [1] - 83:16	86:11, 89:6, 100:11,	195:19, 196:5
109:14	PERIOD [18] - 7:11,	PETS [1] - 160:10	100:19, 102:26,	POTENTIAL [1] -
PEOPLE [1] - 3:15	40:5, 44:9, 58:22,	PHILIP [1] - 29:25	103:6, 116:5, 116:8,	196:4
PEOPLE [97] - 7:22,	68:19, 80:9, 80:13,	PHONE [1] - 148:6	134:12, 149:24,	POWER [4] - 78:25,
7:26, 8:18, 8:27, 12:4,	88:15, 99:18, 103:2,	PHRASE [1] - 9:8	169:6, 169:7, 170:5,	121:5, 121:9
13:5, 13:6, 13:13,	180:17, 181:9,	PHYSICAL [4] -	174:2, 177:3, 185:23,	POWER [1] - 121:7
16:11, 18:19, 19:22,	185:17, 186:8,	114:14, 153:11,	186:8, 192:19,	POWER [1] - 4:12
21:4, 21:7, 24:18,	187:11, 187:16,	167:16, 194:26	198:18, 199:18,	PRACTICABLE[1] -
24:20, 24:26, 25:14,	188:28, 189:9	PHYSICIAN [1] -	201:19, 204:13,	84:10
26:15, 26:21, 26:22,	PERIODICALLY [2] -	125:9	206:17, 210:28	PRACTICAL[1] -
27:27, 31:3, 31:4,	10:16, 56:24	PICK [1] - 163:18	POINTS [2] - 35:6,	67:21
31:5, 32:2, 32:25,	PERIODS [2] - 58:6,	PICTURE [1] -	43:27	PRACTICE [2] -
37:23, 41:14, 41:16,	99:27	111:26	POLICEMEN [1] -	41:24, 172:15
42:5, 44:20, 49:10,	PERMANENT [5] -	PIECE [17] - 13:10,	125:26	PRACTITIONER [1] -
52:16, 58:1, 61:12, 61:13, 62:12, 62:14,	175:12, 175:20,	13:11, 35:18, 53:12,	POLICING [4] - 79:2,	118:29
62:15, 62:27, 66:21,	179:24, 196:26,	54:4, 59:12, 62:29,	97:4, 129:14, 161:17	PRE [3] - 125:20,
66:28, 67:3, 69:16,	197:11 PERSON [106] - 8:17,	65:23, 65:24, 68:9,	POLICY [17] - 8:28, 10:11, 20:14, 26:5,	127:1, 161:3
72:2, 80:20, 80:22,	9:6, 9:20, 10:9, 10:19,	68:10, 71:11, 74:15,	26:8, 71:10, 76:16,	PREDOMINANTLY
95:29, 100:22,	10:21, 11:12, 11:28,	90:4, 101:18, 103:7,	78:19, 78:20, 91:13,	[1] - 77:6
101:17, 129:25,	12:1, 12:3, 12:17,	103:9 PIECES [1] - 71:19	128:7, 129:11,	PREFER [1] - 15:10
131:19, 135:10,	12:23, 13:8, 13:10,		131:22, 133:12,	PREJUDICE [1] -
135:28, 139:11,	16:5, 17:19, 18:12,	PINPOINT [1] - 156:2 PINTS [1] - 88:27	134:22, 139:14, 150:6	125:22 PRELIMINARY [2] -
144:13, 144:14,	18:13, 18:16, 20:1,	PLACE [16] - 13:12,	POOR [1] - 167:25	39:27, 138:6
147:25, 152:15,	20:13, 20:19, 20:21,	49:5, 51:23, 61:16,	PORTLAOISE[1] -	PREPARE [1] - 19:23
152:19, 153:4, 153:6,	20:23, 20:29, 21:15,	91:22, 95:3, 103:1,	192:25	PREPARED[7] -
153:10, 154:24,	21:16, 21:18, 21:29,	126:5, 126:15,	POSED [1] - 124:5	26:15, 107:27,
155:28, 162:12,	22:6, 22:20, 22:24,	137:16, 159:27,	POSITION [49] -	117:28, 121:28,
164:11, 164:20,	22:27, 23:28, 24:7,	160:24, 162:28,	13:1, 15:24, 16:8,	151:15, 157:29, 165:5
166:7, 166:14,	24:10, 24:12, 25:2,	176:23, 193:3	16:9, 17:26, 18:24,	PRESENT [7] -
166:23, 166:24,	26:2, 26:10, 26:19,	PLACE [1] - 4:9	18:25, 19:3, 19:25,	27:27, 27:28, 122:25,
167:26, 171:22,	28:3, 28:5, 30:4,	PLACED[1] - 134:23	24:10, 24:11, 24:27,	128:9, 143:8, 159:7,
				, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,

159:25 PRESENTATION[1] - 114:14 PRESENTED [3] -109:26, 118:18, 159:1 PRESENTING [1] -PRESENTS [1] -130:8 PRESIDENT [2] -1:13. 2:3 PRESSURE [3] -31:16, 31:18, 193:16 PRESUMABLY [2] -29:5, 149:16 PRESUME [6] - 29:4, 32:6, 33:25, 59:2, 61:20, 63:14 PRETTY [3] - 40:28, 41:4, 73:15 PREVENT [1] - 13:19 PREVIOUS [12] -39:18, 110:15, 125:23, 131:27, 132:17, 134:2, 139:16, 154:17, 155:4, 158:8, 159:8, 206:24 PREVIOUSLY [4] -48:25, 77:28, 105:7, 148:26 PRIMARY [2] - 38:5, 122:20 PRINCIPLE [1] -128:1 PRINCIPLED [1] -73:20 PRIORITISE [1] -113:12 PRIORITISED [1] -91:24 **PRIORITY** [1] - 26:3 PRIVATE [3] - 55:4, 162:13, 165:20 PROBLEM [20] -44:20, 44:21, 74:3, 89:8, 89:11, 89:19, 127:10, 127:13, 129:12, 129:19, 147:10, 153:5, 157:14, 179:25, 181:8, 189:19, 195:7, 201:22, 207:2, 207:4 PROBLEMATIC[1] -192:21 PROBLEMS [2] -87:9, 87:11 PROCEDURE [2] -20:22, 20:28 PROCEDURES [3] -

99.8

13:20, 125:11

191:5

6.25

189:4

129:25

22:9

PROLONGED [1] -

PROMOTED[1] -

PROMOTION [1] -

PROOF [1] - 61:20

PROPER [1] - 28:5

PROPERLY [3] -

44:13, 69:9, 86:27

PROPOSAL[1] -

PROPOSE [2] -

PROPOSED [3] -

PROPOSING [1] -

136:9, 136:24, 136:26

62:22, 129:23

66:22, 91:13, 200:4 PROPOSITION [1] -PROCEED [4] -17:25, 28:26, 193:12, PROPOSITIONS [4] 193:14 - 41:9, 41:17, 42:28, PROCEEDING [1] -70.10 15:20 PROTECT [3] -PROCESS [15] - 8:1, 70:21, 72:20, 92:28 13:9, 20:28, 46:24, PROTECTED [2] -48:11. 51:16. 52:12. 1:2, 1:3 52:25, 89:15, 92:21, PROTECTED [20] -102:8, 102:21, 11:21, 16:8, 16:11, 116:11, 129:22, 195:8 16:15, 18:23, 32:14, PROCESSES [2] -65:23, 66:21, 85:5, 66:22 113:12 85:9, 125:25, 132:6, PROCESSING [1] -132:8, 132:11, 132:12, 140:13, PROFESSIONAL [7] 149:3, 158:5, 158:9, 174:25 - 16:12, 32:25, 44:22, PROTOCOL [4] -46:29, 49:12, 61:7, 130:18 10:6, 10:9, 20:22, **PROFESSIONALS** 22:18 [1] - 80:2 PROTRACTED[1] -PROFFERING [1] -40:5 PROVE [3] - 61:29, PROFORMA[1] -71.27 63:18 PROVEN [1] - 134:13 PROGRAMME [2] -**PROVIDE** [4] - 51:1, 150:7, 150:10 75:19, 133:5, 179:8 PROVIDED [12] -PROGRAMME[13] -115:16, 157:6, 33:27, 36:21, 88:1, 161:22, 162:10, 89:16, 89:21, 94:29, 162:28, 165:10, 96:18, 137:16, 167:3, 185:8, 185:24, 150:18, 167:29, 186:2, 186:10, 191:7, 168:3, 168:7 PROVIDES [1] -194:23 PROGRAMMES[1] -PROVISION [2] -177:8 PROGRESS [4] -22:14. 137:28 56:3, 67:8, 74:23, PROVISIONS [1] -145:26 PROGRESSING [2] -**PSYCHOLOGICAL**

PURSUE [3] - 62:23, 68:7, 187:5 PURSUING [1] -210.28 **PUSH** [6] - 16:13, 24:13, 24:15, 31:15, 32:22, 117:28 **PUT** [41] - 15:2, 15:15, 18:27, 20:14, 24:25, 31:15, 31:18, 32:29, 33:1, 39:26, 41:10, 48:4, 53:7, 54:19, 61:5, 61:8, 61:17, 61:24, 65:5, 68:26, 69:7, 69:20, 70:11, 70:12, 71:8, 72:5, 82:20, 91:22, 94:18, 94:28, 95:2, 99:17, 121:28, 122:3, 125:27, 126:5, 129:7, 145:14, 147:16, 186:15, 201:25 **PUTS** [2] - 53:4, 152:18 **PUTTING** [8] - 13:19, 61:21, 62:2, 62:26, 65:28, 70:15, 72:28, 162:27 Q

2:30, 4:14 QUESTIONING [4] -18:28, 28:22, 29:2, 73:22 QUESTIONS [54] -6:16, 14:18, 15:9, 15:15, 15:20, 16:22, 19:17, 24:4, 24:5, 28:13, 28:29, 29:5, 29:28, 30:10, 33:2, 35:6, 38:1, 38:21, 38:27. 49:4. 57:7. 63:29, 64:27, 65:5, 68:25, 69:16, 69:29, 72:10, 72:26, 73:9, 74:15, 77:9, 77:19, 78:10, 79:5, 84:22, 108:28, 115:10, 140:19, 141:20, 141:25, 141:26, 151:7, 151:11, 151:12, 178:29, 179:5, 193:9, 200:15, 210:28, 211:2, 211:4,

QUALIFIED [3] -

QUARTERS[1] -

QUAY [3] - 2:23,

151:27

54:16, 100:1, 180:22

QUICK [1] - 146:10 **QUINN** [6] - 3:10, 5:15, 142:8, 194:4, 200:22. 211:11 QUINN [39] - 108:23, 114:23, 142:5, 142:11, 142:12, 142:13, 142:15, 142:17, 151:5, 151:26, 157:25, 158:17, 163:9, 166:27, 167:27, 168:10, 171:21, 174:12, 188:17, 190:16, 193:9, 193:13. 194:7. 194:16, 195:3, 198:15, 198:21, 199:1, 199:4, 199:22, 200:13, 200:18, 200:25, 201:20, 205:23, 207:16, 210:10, 211:12, 212:20 QUINN'S [1] - 210:24 QUITE [24] - 7:8, 7:26, 7:28, 16:9, 29:14, 31:10, 37:21, 38:21, 39:29, 46:16, 62:18, 67:4, 69:12, 77:3, 127:7, 135:5, 141:11, 158:11, 160:9, 163:1, 168:4, 173:28. 192:9

211:7

R

RAISE [1] - 98:7 RAISED [3] - 155:22, 159:19, 195:15 **RAISING** [2] - 58:26, **RAISON**[1] - 161:27 **RANG** [28] - 169:10, 172:5, 177:26, 178:17, 180:28, 183:4, 183:7, 183:14, 184:17, 187:1, 187:24, 187:25, 188:4, 189:3, 189:25, 190:27, 190:28, 191:3, 192:25, 196:14, 201:10, 201:14, 202:18, 202:24, 203:15, 204:25, 207:19, 212:10 **RANGING** [1] - 27:15 **RANK**[3] - 59:21,

LY[1] - 153:12

109.19

197.11

29:22, 61:6

PUBLIC [2] - 106:19,

PUBLIC [2] - 196:26,

PULL [3] - 29:20,

PULLED [1] - 57:29

PULLS [1] - 129:1

PULSE [1] - 164:13

PURELY [1] - 34:16

PURPOSE [9] -

20:29, 29:5, 32:9,

50:19, 55:5, 55:29,

PURPOSES [7] -

27:27, 27:29, 50:9,

102:1

61:17, 61:22, 74:26,

66:15, 75:23, 101:12

64:3, 138:8 RAPPORT[8] - 29:4, 29:12, 30:1, 30:2, 30:3, 30:7, 34:26, 182:16 **RATE**[13] - 101:18, 109:5, 109:13, 109:14, 109:22, 109:29, 110:17, 110:27, 111:3, 111:5, 151:22, 183:23, 203:3 **RATHER** [4] - 153:2, 164:12, 164:15, 185:19 RATIONALE[1] -10:21 **RE**[4] - 5:7, 5:20, 95:20, 211:11 **RE**[4] - 35:6, 65:11, 176:7, 188:22 RE-EXAMINED [4] -5:7, 5:20, 95:20, 211:11 RE-INFORMED [1] -65:11 RE-READ[1] - 176:7 REACTING [1] -49.10 REACTION[1] -191:13 REACTIVE[1] -206:8 **READ** [10] - 45:29, 88:7, 93:17, 95:24, 109:23, 123:28, 146:10, 176:5, 176:6, 176:7 READING [2] -14:12, 52:23 **READS**[1] - 201:8 **READY** [3] - 116:5, 154:29, 155:3 **REAL** [1] - 65:24 REALISE [1] -132:12 **REALISTIC** [1] - 61:8 REALISTICALLY[1] - 32:28 **REALITY** [3] - 38:29, 199:22, 199:23 **REALLY** [49] - 8:16, 12:29, 13:25, 21:1, 33:5, 37:18, 38:19, 38:21, 40:27, 41:26, 50:8, 53:6, 55:27, 57:5, 62:13, 65:18, 65:25, 65:28, 66:3, 67:1, 70:28, 71:7, 72:13, 74:22, 75:21, 76:23, 85:4, 86:3,

86:4, 100:4, 106:3, 106:26, 116:12, 125:4, 146:28, 147:25, 150:5, 153:25, 167:16, 172:15, 174:2, 175:22, 176:25, 178:27, 179:19, 188:13, 210:2, 210:6 **REASON** [15] -12:26, 14:10, 119:24, 120:13, 120:19, 120:24, 125:24, 131:21, 134:14, 165:23, 169:21, 174:28, 188:11, 191:28 REASONABLE[4] -40:17, 41:15, 73:28, 200:3 REASONABLY [2] -180:12, 200:27 REASONING [1] -152:7 **REASONS**[3] - 64:7, 133:17, 155:3 REASSURE[1] -44:27 **RECEIPT** [2] - 52:8, **RECEIVE** [2] - 67:22, 194.28 RECEIVED [3] -55:8, 186:16, 191:15 RECEIVING [1] -160:7 **RECENT**[1] - 190:20 RECENTLY [6] -93:23, 143:16, 168:4, 172:12, 192:6, 192:28 RECIPIENT [7] -139:6, 139:9, 140:7, 156:12, 156:17, 156:25, 156:29 RECIPIENTS [2] -

N [1] - 184:3 RECOGNISED [2] -124:26, 128:25 RECOGNISES [1] -16:2 RECOGNITION [2] -129:12, 129:15 RECOLLECT [2] -197:1, 197:4 RECOLLECTION [20] - 107:17, 109:7, 110:5, 112:21, 113:3, 113:16, 114:17,

123:24, 124:15

RECLASSIFICATIO

114:18, 115:21, 116:16, 120:14, 122:28, 124:28, 131:10, 131:14, 155:22, 159:5, 159:21, 194:13, 207:27 **RECOMMENDATIO N** [2] - 54:27, 92:14 **RECOMMENDATIO** NS [1] - 83:9 **RECOMMENDING** [1] - 115:29 RECORD [9] -114:15, 120:27, 151:29, 152:13, 167:7, 167:20, 180:28, 185:3, 189:23 RECORDED [19] -85:15, 94:2, 110:4, 110:6, 122:8, 123:1, 152:3, 153:2, 153:28, 154:5, 157:16, 157:20, 159:19, 167:13, 167:20, 174:21, 175:18, 181:5, 194:14 RECORDING [8] -110:3, 160:28, 167:23, 167:24, 167:25, 170:28, 176:11, 186:21 RECORDS [1] -**RECOUP** [1] - 129:7 RECOVERY [1] -113:12 RECTIFIED [1] -172:22 **RECTIFY** [3] - 66:17, 181:1, 201:15 REDACTED [2] -52:4, 209:23 **REDDY** [1] - 4:9 REDUCED [10] -102:6, 111:3, 111:5, 124:5, 125:17, 127:3, 127:12, 134:13, 152:27, 169:17 REDUCING [1] -134:21 REDUCTION [1] -98.21 **REFER** [17] - 11:14, 14:7, 21:29, 22:24, 22:27, 23:10, 26:1, 28:5, 44:16, 75:3, 82:9, 103:24, 150:3, 150:8, 181:26,

REFERENCE [43] -45:27, 58:16, 60:1, 61:26, 78:18, 78:28, 79:21, 80:8, 80:27, 80:29, 82:6, 88:17, 88:18, 89:29, 93:26, 98:1, 99:12, 100:4, 103:25. 105:27. 111:3, 114:3, 117:15, 122:26, 146:16, 151:26, 154:8, 168:19, 169:1, 169:17, 170:6, 174:17, 175:2, 177:6, 177:10, 185:7, 186:13, 189:1, 201:6, 202:23, 203:13, 206:2, 206:14 REFERENCES [6] -60:2, 60:5, 88:7, 105:16, 180:25, 182:17 REFERENCING [3] -155:6, 170:22, 175:29 REFERRAL [10] -7:25, 7:27, 18:10, 23:29, 44:9, 51:16, 73:1, 97:17, 98:5, 150:1 REFERRED [19] -14:2, 16:4, 18:21, 23:1, 31:29, 44:12, 56:22, 56:25, 58:16, 60:21, 88:13, 95:24, 96:16, 97:3, 99:11, 117:11, 143:15, 156:10, 210:26 REFERRING [7] -23:28, 47:21, 58:4, 98:5, 131:28, 181:25, 203:24 REFERS [1] - 156:14 REFLECTED [5] -10:25, 12:29, 13:18, 113:29, 185:26 REFLECTING [2] -170:1, 184:1 REFLECTION [2] -69:14, 196:19 REFLECTS [4] -88:4, 96:6, 121:14, 173:27 REFORM [2] -106:20, 109:20 **REFUSED** [1] - 82:28 **REGARD**[13] - 7:15, 69:4, 98:24, 109:4, 111:4, 116:22,

154:1, 174:15, 183:17 REGARDED[1] -101:28 REGARDING [8] -83:7. 83:12. 96:2. 117:1, 117:3, 164:25, 191:4, 208:15 REGARDS [4] -116:10, 126:8, 126:27, 165:13 REGISTRAR [1] -90:17 **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:5 **REGULAR** [4] - 8:13, 25:5, 25:7, 193:5 REGULARLY [1] -**REGULATIONS** [19] - 7:9, 66:18, 66:25, 66:28, 67:4, 84:13, 100:13, 109:18, 110:12, 110:14, 110:20, 125:16, 125:17, 125:20, 125:21, 125:22, 134:20, 153:8 REHABILITATE[1] -112.19 **REHABILITATION** [8] - 109:13, 109:28, 118:24, 161:22, 162:1, 162:28, 185:24, 191:6 **REJECT** [7] - 70:23, 72:9, 92:29, 93:2, 94:23, 95:1, 95:5 **RELATE** [3] - 84:8, 87:11, 132:3 **RELATED** [165] -7:19, 7:20, 7:22, 7:27, 9:15, 9:26, 10:4, 10:9, 10:10, 10:17, 10:20, 10:26, 11:12, 11:13, 11:15, 11:28, 12:13, 13:6, 14:9, 16:1, 16:24, 18:12, 19:27, 20:1, 20:8, 20:13, 20:22, 21:7, 21:19, 21:23, 22:7, 22:11, 23:9, 25:15, 26:4, 27:20, 28:2, 29:16, 30:13, 30:17, 31:7, 31:8, 34:7, 34:16, 36:3, 36:9, 38:14, 39:29. 40:1. 40:3. 40:5, 40:16, 41:8, 44:8, 44:11, 45:12, 45:15, 46:4, 46:8, 47:2, 47:7, 47:18, 51:21, 52:28, 53:2,

182:24, 202:1

127:23, 140:1,

145:26, 151:21,

53:8, 54:1, 54:3, 123:10, 126:9, 163:21, 164:5, REPRESENT[1] -[2] - 53:5, 134:23 54:14, 55:15, 55:21, 126:12, 127:20, 169:15, 169:22, 119:18 RESPONSIBLE [8] -178:1, 178:7, 178:10, 55:27, 56:18, 56:19, 129:28, 133:4, REPRESENTATION 8:24, 53:16, 106:10, 56:22, 57:22, 57:27, 140:17, 141:9, 178:21, 183:8, [2] - 117:4, 117:19 107:19, 115:27, 58:8, 58:11, 58:15, 141:10, 142:17, 183:12, 183:13, REPRESENTATION 119:19, 129:5 58:24, 59:6, 59:22, 151:17, 152:11, 198:24 **REST**[4] - 126:22, S [1] - 120:25 60:2, 60:8, 60:11, 154:20, 154:23, REMEMBERED[1] -171:3, 184:16 **REPRESENTATIVE** 162:6, 174:19, 61:3, 61:19, 61:26, 153:27 [2] - 106:15, 117:22 **RESTING** [1] - 171:4 62:1, 62:3, 62:23, 174:25, 177:11, **REMIND** [2] - 50:5, RESTORED[1] -**REPRESENTATIVE** 65:12, 67:7, 68:13, 187:8, 189:15, 50:7 [2] - 106:15, 122:20 204:15 69:10, 70:14, 70:23, 195:13, 196:11, REMINDER [2] -REPRESENTING [1] RESTRICTED [3] -72:7, 72:16, 82:22, 205:28, 208:5 61:15, 63:18 79:21, 80:15, 99:20 - 115:25 87:3, 87:10, 89:29, RELATIONS [5] -**REMIT** [6] - 106:28, RESTRICTION[1] -REQUEST [6] -91:5, 93:8, 93:11, 105:28, 105:29, 107:22, 120:22, 39:16, 59:15, 60:19, 101:2 97:26, 98:26, 99:26, 106:25, 142:23 146:24, 158:10, **RESULT** [6] - 72:8, 63:13, 63:18, 108:3 101:27, 102:28, RELATIONSHIP[7] -209:26 137:4, 172:20, REQUESTED [2] -103:4, 109:26, 37:3, 37:6, 64:6, **REMITS**[1] - 126:10 209:13, 209:16, 210:5 65:6, 120:16 118:22, 122:27, 127:21, 144:16, **REP**[1] - 150:2 REQUESTING [1] -**RESUME** [2] - 79:12, 123:11, 123:26, 171:7, 174:15 **REPEAT**[1] - 61:23 115:29 124:2. 124:23. RELATIVELY[1] -REPEATED[1] -REQUIRED [5] -**RESUMED** [3] - 6:1, 124:26, 124:29, 86:19 15:5 74:8, 104:19 37:5, 73:13, 87:19, 126:19, 126:28, RELAYED [2] -REPEATING[4] -133:6, 134:29 RESUMING [3] -126:29, 127:3, 204:17, 205:2 56:21, 58:17, 68:2, REQUIRES [2] -80:9, 80:13, 99:18 127:14, 128:25, RELAYING [2] -136:12 80:15, 96:12 RESUMPTION [1] -129:12. 130:14. 114:11, 202:9 **REPLY** [4] - 124:16, 81.20 RESEARCH[1] -130:19, 130:20, RELEVANCE [1] -124:17, 135:19, RETAINING [1] -161:23 130:25, 131:4, 100:14 135:20 RESIDENTIAL [2] -113.13 131:13, 131:20, RELEVANT[11] -REPORT [46] -89:18, 162:27 RETICENT[1] -132:22, 134:14, 27:28, 71:29, 80:2, 11:14, 40:6, 55:6, RESOLUTIONS [1] -37:28 136:9, 136:25, 137:7, 81:20, 82:17, 82:26, 55:7, 55:11, 56:4, **RETIRED** [7] - 3:4, 137:25, 140:14, 83:4, 97:5, 102:17, 56:14, 57:12, 57:19, 3:6, 3:6, 3:7, 3:10, **RESOLVE** [2] - 66:8, 141:14, 141:17, 160:7, 197:3 57:29, 58:2, 58:3, 3:12, 3:13 66:10 146:25, 152:11, **RELIED** [3] - 56:14, 58:29, 60:15, 61:6, RETIRED [3] -RESONATE [1] -152:12, 152:15, 57:20, 60:9 61:19, 63:10, 63:13, 195:20, 196:8, 207:23 154:28 152:20, 152:26, RELUCTANCE [2] -64:16, 65:4, 68:22, RETIRING [1] -RESOURCE [1] -153:2, 153:11, 37:9. 37:29 81:19, 81:20, 91:11, 189:26 105:8 157:18, 157:20, RELUCTANT[1] -93:26, 96:12, 96:28, RETROSPECTIVE RESOURCE [1] -161:6, 167:7, 167:9, 38:19 97:7, 97:15, 97:29, [2] - 53:8, 100:17 105:19 167:14, 167:15, 98:9, 98:11, 98:13, **RELY** [1] - 61:29 RESOURCES [1] -RETROSPECTIVEL 180:22, 206:29 **REMAIN**[3] - 81:25, 103:3, 137:27, 3:15 **Y** [1] - 84:10 RELATING [4] -200:10. 200:12 144:19, 145:19, RESOURCES [1] -**RETURN** [17] -96:15, 97:26, 102:27, REMAINDER [1] -145:21, 187:2, 107:22 57:25, 57:28, 58:5, 208:15, 209:5, 192:27 RESPECT [10] -58:6, 61:2, 90:9, **RELATION** [73] - 7:7, 209:14, 209:22, REMAINED [1] -14:11, 14:15, 14:29, 91:21, 103:5, 133:4, 7:14, 12:27, 13:13, 138:26 210:12, 210:13 159:9, 160:11, 15:7, 47:12, 107:9, 13:21, 16:8, 16:10, REPORTED [8] -REMAINING [1] -161:10, 187:28, 164:23, 186:6, 33:2, 40:7, 40:11, 7:22, 13:5, 55:21, 105:23 186:22, 187:17 202:4, 202:10, 45:10, 45:24, 46:7, 56:21, 84:27, 96:18, REMAINS [3] -204:17, 204:28 RESPECTFUL[1] -47:18, 48:7, 51:23, 141:19, 210:16 81:29, 102:6, 138:27 RETURNED[1] -51:28, 53:8, 54:17, REPORTER [1] -REMEMBER [36] -RESPECTFULLY [1] 55:12, 56:1, 57:9, 93:10 14:2, 75:6, 75:9, 76:6, RETURNING [3] --35.1960:11, 61:27, 63:14, 107:12, 107:14, REPORTING [3] -159:7, 187:26, 204:26 RESPECTS[1] -67:21, 68:9, 68:26, 14:9, 38:14, 211:14 112:24, 116:3, **RETURNS** [2] - 61:1, 43:15 69:19, 74:14, 74:20, 116:20, 117:27, REPORTS [15] -RESPOND [1] -62.22 75:16, 75:19, 75:24, 11:12, 15:29, 18:12, 118:12, 121:25, **REVIEW** [8] - 19:4, 64:25 79:15, 80:20, 85:25, 121:26, 121:27, 58:1, 60:12, 60:14, 82:1, 97:6, 112:16, RESPONSE [8] -92:10, 94:19, 96:29, 131:18, 132:5, 144:1, 79:24, 81:21, 97:6, 112:27, 113:9, 113:10 55:8. 60:18. 61:4. 97:10, 106:4, 106:20. 152:10, 152:28, 97:9, 97:29, 106:22, 63:28, 64:27, 79:4, REVIEWED [5] -107:16, 110:9, 153:1, 156:12, 106:23, 126:13, 59:10, 59:15, 81:26, 132:19, 175:19 110:24, 111:29, 141:17 163:19, 163:20, 95:7, 99:29 RESPONSIBILITY 120:4, 120:21,

REVIEWING [1] -143:22 199:5 **SELF** [2] - 145:4, 96:26, 96:27, 168:20, 164:14 **SAMS**[4] - 111:9, SECRETARY[3] -145:6 168:23 REVISED[1] -111:22, 167:20, 55:5, 58:10, 165:18 **SEND** [18] - 18:9, SERGEANTS[1] -24:22, 24:29, 26:9, SECTION [14] -109:18 167:23 106:16 **REVISIT**[1] - 194:10 **SANDRA**[1] - 4:7 54:18, 105:20, 26:17, 35:3, 38:4, SERGEANTS[1] -106:14, 107:19, REWARD[1] -SATISFACTION[2] -39:22, 49:15, 49:24, 12:16 173:16, 173:20 107:22, 115:27, 51:24, 59:26, 64:17, **SERIES** [1] - 123:10 165:29 120:19, 125:9, **REWARD**[1] - 163:7 SATISFACTORY[1] 64:29, 67:10, 76:24, **SERIOUS** [8] - 22:22, 129:27, 138:29, 76:25. 135:20 REWRITE [1] -- 73:18 22:23, 24:21, 40:22, 142:17, 142:23, SENDING [5] -SATISFIED [6] -114:11, 146:21, 196:20 **RIGHTLY** [1] - 80:4 45:7, 46:23, 53:14, 155:29, 163:6 26:16, 40:19, 40:24, 176:25 RIGOROUS [1] -65:14, 102:24, 137:7 **SECTION** [9] - 54:23, 68:2, 202:2 SERVED[2] -**SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 54:28, 107:21, 108:2, **SENIOR** [6] - 42:20, 147:26, 174:1 102:21 108:20, 118:10, 94:5, 145:24, 145:26, RING [8] - 146:3, **SAVE** [1] - 154:27 **SERVICE** [5] - 78:24, 120:20, 129:4, 152:19 149:25, 211:27 113:23, 143:9, 162:9, SAW [9] - 56:29, 147:10, 147:28, 165:5, 177:2, 189:16. SECTIONS [3] -**SENSE** [8] - 21:6, 66:5, 88:27, 122:24, 179:15 115:24, 120:21, 25:8, 65:18, 82:1, **SERVICE** [9] - 7:3, 191:22, 206:28 127:26, 143:15, RINGING [10] -143:23 82:12, 138:26, 149:1, 171:26, 172:12 91:26, 114:26, 144:6, **SEE** [81] - 14:9, 147:16, 149:25 144:9, 144:15. 37:13, 189:17, **SC** [11] - 2:6, 2:7, 21:23, 24:24, 33:17, SENSITIVE [4] -148:24, 211:19, 192:12, 192:14, 2:9, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 33:26, 43:13, 55:18, 32:16, 42:3, 69:17, 192:16, 192:17, 3:22, 3:23, 3:23, 4:7, 211:20 192:18, 192:22, 4:8 62:6, 63:15, 64:9, 124:9 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:24 64:12, 67:28, 69:5, SENSITIVITIES [2] -192:23, 198:14 **SCANLAN**[1] - 3:8 **SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 75:4, 80:8, 80:10, 48:29, 49:7 RINGS [1] - 192:20 **SERVICES** [5] - 50:6, SCENARIO [2] -51:2, 131:11 81:7, 81:11, 81:12, **SENT** [15] - 10:29, 106:5, 112:17, 119:7, **RISE** [1] - 73:26 SCENARIOS [1] -82:5. 83:3. 84:23. 13:3, 16:13, 37:26, 154.14 RISK [2] - 56:21, 87:27, 87:29, 88:17, 69:21 50.11 54:28, 57:3, 61:14, **SET**[1] - 96:24 93:22, 93:28, 94:7, 64:16, 64:25, 95:26, ROAD [1] - 2:17 SCEPTICAL[1] -SEVEN [1] - 151:29 96:29, 97:8, 97:22, 97:17, 129:28, 139:4, SEVERAL[3] -ROAD[1] - 122:18 40:16 98:11, 98:13, 116:29, 173:13, 176:8 14:28, 59:4, 139:9 SCHEME [8] -**ROAD**[2] - 23:3, 117:24, 117:29, SENTENCE[7] -125:13, 125:16, **SEXUAL**[1] - 91:14 57.5 118:15, 123:27, 81:7, 82:15, 96:6, 125:23, 125:28, SHALL[1] - 138:6 ROADBLOCK [2] -125:10, 128:5, 119:23, 121:16, 128:14, 128:15, **SHANE** [1] - 3:22 13:19, 23:2 130:15, 137:17, 126:23, 170:23 ROADBLOCKS[1] -136:10, 137:8 **SHANKEY** [1] - 3:21 137:19, 139:17, SENTIMENT[1] -SCHEMES [1] -SHANKEY-SMITH 142:29, 149:21, 134:17 ROBUST [1] - 44:26 128:16 [1] - 3:21 150:11, 155:6, SEPARATE[12] -**SCREEN** [4] - 77:26, **SHANNON**[1] - 2:12 **ROLE** [14] - 7:8, 157:22, 158:2, 158:3, 21:13, 23:26, 27:23, 107:15, 163:27, 7:13, 7:14, 78:28, **SHAPE** [4] - 15:17, 158:24, 160:29, 33:3, 124:28, 128:15, 208:18 79:6, 79:15, 115:24, 62:4, 98:8, 117:12 166:9, 168:16, 183:2, 128:16, 128:27, SCROLL [3] - 90:11, 119:17, 127:22, **SHEAHAN**[1] - 3:18 183:17, 184:10, 129:21, 130:2, 128:11, 178:26, 90:17, 95:29 **SHEET** [2] - 146:5, 185:11, 185:22, 150:17, 190:19 179:2, 179:19, 211:13 **SE** [2] - 31:2, 120:23 146.6 186:8, 187:16, 189:1, SEPARATELY[2] -**ROLES** [2] - 164:1, **SEAN**[4] - 1:12, 2:2, **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:24 189:9, 192:24, 150:28, 151:4 164:25 2:22, 3:17 SHIP [1] - 3:27 194:18, 195:22, SEPTEMBER [2] -**SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 **ROLL** [1] - 32:28 **SHORT** [12] - 38:21, 196:1, 196:10, 174:17, 186:13 SEARCH[1] - 92:22 **ROOM** [1] - 8:14 75:27, 76:5, 88:14, 196:12, 196:14, SERGEANT [5] -ROTATION [1] -**SECOND** [31] -114:14, 155:9. 197:21, 198:3, 3:12, 3:19, 4:6, 4:7, 16:17, 17:4, 18:2, 161:16. 176:18. 175:23 198:13, 201:6, 28:4, 42:19, 44:17, 176:19, 193:15, **RULE** [1] - 81:16 202:15, 204:7, 208:8, SERGEANT[18] -60:4, 72:12, 72:19, **RUN**[4] - 76:7, 193:22 211:22 59:21, 60:5, 126:7, 83:28, 90:18, 90:26, 108:1, 125:26, 162:12 SHORT-TERM [3] -**SEEING** [2] - 67:22, 133:5, 145:22, 146:5, 90:27, 96:5, 96:12, RUNNING [1] -155:9, 161:16, 176:18 206:25 146:9, 146:23, 113:29, 118:14, 107:20 SHORTFALL[1] -**SEEK** [4] - 64:21, 146:26, 147:21, 118:16, 154:28, **RUNS** [1] - 125:26 165:26 82:10, 92:2, 96:14 147:28, 148:14. 157:24, 159:22, SHORTLY [4] -RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 **SEEKING** [3] - 39:9, 150:2, 150:11, 163:27, 178:7, 103:2, 116:8, 117:29, 53:29, 125:12 190:28, 191:7, 190:29, 198:25, S 122:1 **SEEM** [3] - 119:23, 203:23, 205:24, 191:25, 208:14 **SHOT**[1] - 128:20 140:7, 176:8 205:27, 206:18, 208:9 SERGEANT [7] -SHOWING [1] -**SEES** [1] - 86:15 56:9, 63:11, 96:21, **SAFER** [2] - 134:8, SECONDHAND[1] -102:14

11:20, 12:8, 12:18, SHOWN [6] - 77:26, 121:29, 131:10, SOLUTION [5] -START[7] - 29:3, 87:25, 90:10, 93:15, 151:11 67:6, 129:23, 157:14, 16:5, 18:14, 18:21, 44:23, 49:4, 49:13, 93:21, 103:22 **SIMPLE** [6] - 27:13, 179:25, 196:26 19:8, 19:12, 19:19, 65:28, 123:15, 192:29 20:16, 21:20, 21:21, **SHOWS** [1] - 94:24 43:12, 43:22, 47:3, **SOLVE** [1] - 59:22 STARTED[2] -**SHUT** [1] - 37:16 70:7, 70:9 SOMEONE [9] -30:18, 30:19, 33:10, 102:28 176:8 49:23, 59:6, 60:6, SHUTTERS[1] -SIMPLICITY [1] -25:14, 26:25, 26:29, STARTING[3] -93:8 43:12 47:2, 48:23, 55:26, 96:27, 117:1, 174:8 SP [1] - 122:3 **SHUTTING** [1] - 39:9 SIMPLY [3] - 17:24, 63:12, 111:26, 156:1 STARTS[1] - 81:7 **SPACE** [2] - 102:3, 33:2. 203:25 SOMETIME[1] -SIC [1] - 56:12 **STATE** [2] - 45:3, SINGLE [1] - 168:28 136:18 209:28 152:13 SICK [42] - 7:14, SINÉAD [1] - 4:8 SOMETIMES [19] -SPEAKING [5] -**STATE**[1] - 3:26 7:22, 11:12, 11:14, 13:6, 14:9, 18:12, SINÉAD [6] - 2:7, 18:16, 30:14, 32:1, 38:20, 41:2, 168:20, STATEMENT[41] -38:14, 40:3, 46:8, 121:5, 121:7, 121:8, 37:23, 47:1, 51:24, 191:12, 211:22 48:17, 48:24, 48:27, 79:18, 100:21, 148:2, **SPEAKS**[1] - 204:5 52:3, 55:21, 56:22, 121:9, 121:10 49:26, 50:9, 50:10, 155:26, 155:27, SPECIAL[1] -**SITTING** [1] - 29:17 58:14, 109:27, 50:13, 50:17, 50:20, 165:3, 171:11, 109:29, 110:5, SITUATION [15] -120:23 50:26, 51:1, 51:10, 110:28, 118:22, 177:17, 177:18, 190:5 **SPECIFIC** [14] - 9:28, 76:24, 76:25, 82:21, 15:13, 15:19, 23:4, SOMEWHERE [3] -118:24, 125:17, 25:25, 30:5, 41:12, 49:25, 70:15, 75:18, 82:23, 82:29, 85:25, 141:17, 152:2, 41:22, 43:13, 43:26, 51:18, 159:18, 163:3 75:25, 129:10, 131:8, 86:1, 106:9, 107:1, 152:15, 153:8, **SOON** [1] - 84:10 131:24, 131:25, 109:23, 109:24, 80:22, 86:16, 100:7, 153:27, 157:19, 132:3, 133:20, 110:24, 116:24, 148:27, 187:24, 200:8 **SORE** [1] - 202:5 133:23, 195:11, 196:7 167:26, 170:25, SITUATIONS [2] -SORRY [64] - 8:16, 116:26, 118:15, 172:7, 180:6, 180:14, SPECIFICALLY [8] -120:28, 121:15, 80:25, 102:18 15:27, 20:11, 22:26, 180:15, 180:29, 23:16, 25:10, 27:2, 51:2, 143:28, 147:2, 142:13, 148:5, SIX [5] - 125:19, 181:3, 181:5, 181:6, 142:26, 146:9, 28:18, 29:21, 29:22, 149:23, 152:29, 148:18, 150:23, 184:4, 195:6, 195:20, 146:11, 151:28 29:26, 33:5, 33:12, 164:23, 179:10, 151:25, 151:29, 152:6, 167:28, 194:8. 201:15, 201:21 SIXTH [1] - 52:6 42:9, 42:17, 42:29, 195:13 194:14, 194:15, **SICK** [3] - 54:23, SPECIFICS [2] -43:3, 43:19, 43:20, SKILL_[1] - 199:8 54:28, 152:19 43:21, 45:7, 45:14, 30:21, 211:14 210:11 SKILLS [1] - 64:4 SPECIFIED [2] -**STATES**[2] - 97:11, SICKNESS [8] -45:24, 45:25, 45:26, SLIGHTLY [6] -10:5, 107:20, 108:2, 48:4, 50:16, 57:29, 99:27, 125:21 136:26 19:24, 26:6, 52:29, 61:24, 62:5, 65:7, **STATION**[2] - 91:4, 108:20, 110:11, 63:6, 71:15, 148:23 **SPELL** [1] - 175:2 118:10, 120:20, 129:3 69:24, 69:28, 73:15, SPOKEN [5] -161:14 SLIP [1] - 126:1 SICKNESS [20] -75:1, 75:22, 78:4, 147:13, 159:17, **STATION**[13] - 29:9, **SMALL** [1] - 158:10 52:9, 53:22, 78:6, 80:29, 83:17, 86:24, 161:3, 177:20, 191:25 42:6, 105:1, 105:4, **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 87:1, 90:7, 100:15, 80:9, 80:14, 99:19, **SPOTS** [2] - 190:9, 159:8, 159:15, 172:9, SMITHFIELD [2] -107:19, 109:4, 102:14, 103:26, 172:13, 175:12, 190:10 2:24, 4:14 111:12, 112:8, 109:15, 109:16, 175:22, 175:25, **ST**[2] - 88:26, SO [1] - 81:28 109:18, 110:16, 123:19, 123:22, 187:27, 192:20 182:20 SO.. [3] - 138:29, 110:17, 120:21, 151:24, 153:20, STATIONS [2] -STABBED[1] -159:18, 188:14 154:6, 162:23, 163:9, 120:23, 133:11, 44:20, 192:18 **SOBER** [5] - 154:25, 145:13 134:20, 141:11, 165:9, 166:4, 167:1, **STATUS**[1] - 101:27 173:26, 184:18, **STAFF** [2] - 78:21, 151:21, 155:9 171:2, 174:2, 188:18, **STAY** [6] - 112:8, 118:11 203:16, 204:7 SICKNESS/ 204:22, 207:9, 207:11 116:23, 180:29, **STAGE** [23] - 13:15, SOBRIETY [9] -**ABSENCE** [1] - 83:21 **SORT** [23] - 13:20. 193:28, 201:14, 16:14, 37:5, 49:13, 176:3, 182:28, 13:26, 18:28, 30:20, SICKNESS/ 51:17, 61:7, 64:5, 201:20 184:28, 186:9, ABSENCES[1] -32:18, 37:14, 49:13, **STAYING** [2] - 31:22, 65:22, 94:24, 94:28, 187:11, 187:16, 57:5, 58:25, 60:23, 114:15 99:23, 104:4, 133:8, 188:28, 190:10, 61:8, 66:27, 67:3, **SIDE** [3] - 143:4, 135:29, 148:28, STAYS[1] - 84:14 190:22 69:15, 70:29, 80:4, 143:5, 144:2 156:12, 158:4, STENOGRAPHIC [1] SOCIALLY [1] -85:3, 101:2, 127:9, **SIGHT** [2] - 62:10, 159:11, 159:15, - 1:26 160:9 160:21, 164:16, 174:28, 177:12, STENOGRAPHY [2] SOCIETY [2] -201:21 SIGN [1] - 76:7 188:6, 195:8 - 1:24, 29:16 124:27, 128:26 **SORTED**[1] - 102:25 STAIRS[1] - 126:3 **SIGNED** [2] - 58:2, STENOGRAPHY [1] **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 SOUGHT [1] - 78:14 128:7 **STAMPED**[1] - 63:8 **SOLELY** [1] - 121:9 **SOUND** [1] - 74:28 SIGNIFICANT [2] -**STAND**[1] - 74:4 **STEP** [2] - 43:16, SOLICITOR'S [1] -SOUNDING [1] -89:14. 141:12 STANDARD[3] -46:27 3.26 SIGNPOSTED [1] -158:19 63:21, 73:15, 145:11 STEPHANIE[1] -SOLICITORS [6] -**SOURCE** [23] - 9:22, 94:25 STANDING [2] -2:10, 2:17, 2:22, 2:30, 11:17, 11:18, 11:19, SIMILAR [3] -92:11, 104:7 **STEPHEN**[1] - 2:21 4:9, 4:13

CTEDDED FO.F
STEPPED [1] - 56:5
STEPS [17] - 9:16,
14:19, 19:27, 23:22,
48:7, 48:8, 48:22,
51:19, 56:15, 66:16,
69:9, 69:20, 69:25,
69:27, 70:11, 70:13,
70:20
STEWARDSHIP[1] -
92:27
STILL [22] - 24:29,
55:20, 56:18, 56:27,
66:27, 100:8, 127:9,
127:13, 129:11,
138:27, 139:13,
139 14 150 21
139:14, 150:21, 154:23, 158:7,
164:21, 181:24,
104.21, 101.24,
192:11, 193:2, 193:5,
196:28
STOP [11] - 16:16,
119:22, 154:28,
176:9, 187:15,
191:27, 192:7,
194:22, 194:27,
201:24, 208:20
STOPPED [4] -
170:7, 176:9, 177:1,
177:2
STOPPING [6] -
169:1, 174:8, 177:7,
191:26, 192:4, 192:5
STOPS [2] - 67:11,
67:14
STORY [1] - 47:4
STRAIGHT[2] - 48:9,
71:12
STRAIGHTAWAY[5]
- 18:10, 24:22, 24:25,
25:1, 44:12
STRAIGHTFORWA
RD [1] - 8:10
STREAK [1] - 206:3
STREET [3] - 2:11,
3:27, 4:3
STRESS [238] - 7:19,
7:20, 7:22, 7:27, 8:9,
8:22, 9:1, 9:15, 9:26,
10:4, 10:10, 10:11,
10:12, 10:18, 10:20,
10:27, 11:12, 11:13,
11:17, 11:18, 11:19,
11:20, 11:29, 12:4,
12:8, 12:13, 12:18,
13:7, 14:5, 14:10,
14:15, 16:1, 16:5,
16:7, 16:24, 18:12,
18:14, 18:21, 18:26,
19:8, 19:12, 19:19,
19:27, 20:1, 20:8,
, , ,

```
20:14, 20:16, 20:22,
21:8, 21:19, 21:20,
21:21, 21:23, 21:26,
22:6, 22:7, 22:11,
22:20, 22:21, 22:23,
22:29, 23:7, 23:9,
23:19, 23:27, 24:3,
24:6, 24:7, 24:19,
24:20, 25:16, 25:21,
25:26, 26:2, 26:4,
26:22, 26:24, 27:20,
28:2. 28:3. 28:29.
29:1, 30:13, 30:17,
30:18, 30:20, 31:7,
31:20, 31:26, 32:26,
33:10, 33:14, 33:24,
34:7, 34:16, 36:3,
36:10, 38:14, 39:22,
39:29, 40:1, 40:3,
40:5, 40:16, 40:21,
41:8. 44:8. 44:11.
45:4, 45:12, 45:16,
46:4, 46:9, 47:2, 47:7,
47:18, 48:9, 48:21,
48:27, 49:8, 49:24,
50:21, 51:21, 52:28,
53:2, 53:8, 53:11,
54:1, 54:4, 54:14,
55:15, 55:22, 55:27,
56:18, 56:19, 56:22,
57:22, 57:27, 58:8,
58:11, 58:15, 58:25,
59:7. 60:2. 60:8.
60:11, 60:24, 61:3,
61:19, 61:26, 62:1,
62:3, 62:18, 62:23,
65:13, 67:7, 68:9,
68:13, 69:10, 70:14,
70:23, 71:22, 72:2,
72:7, 72:16, 82:22,
86:4, 86:16, 87:3,
87:5, 87:9, 87:10,
87:11, 89:29, 91:5,
93:9, 93:11, 96:9,
97:26, 98:1, 98:8,
98:27, 99:26, 101:27,
102:19, 102:28,
103:4, 122:26,
122:27, 123:11,
123:26, 124:2,
124:23, 124:26,
124:29, 126:19,
126:28, 126:29,
127:3, 127:14,
128:25, 129:12,
129:25, 130:14,
130:19, 130:25,
131:4, 131:13,
131:20, 132:22,
134:15, 136:9,
```

136:25, 137:7,

```
137:25, 140:14,
141:14, 141:15,
141:17, 152:11,
152:12, 152:15,
152:18, 152:21,
152:26, 153:3,
157:17, 157:18,
157:21, 167:7, 167:9,
167:14, 167:16,
180:22
 STRESSED[32] -
8:2, 8:5, 8:18, 9:4,
9:7, 10:21, 12:24,
13:10, 13:16, 14:10,
21:6, 21:27, 24:13,
24:28, 26:7, 27:19,
27:24. 31:19. 37:20.
40:21, 54:11, 55:24,
60:25, 60:27, 62:21,
68:12, 71:3, 71:4,
71:11, 86:25, 94:4
 STRESSFUL[3] -
8:5, 8:19, 129:13
 STRESSING [1] -
21:28
 STRICTEST[1] -
97:10
 STRONGEST[1] -
 STRUGGLING [1] -
180:17
 STUCK [1] - 29:26
 STUFF [6] - 131:20,
146:3, 160:26,
179:26, 205:29, 209:1
 SUBJECT[13] - 82:1,
98:21, 99:7, 99:8,
100:8, 110:19,
110:20, 115:28,
123:26, 141:2,
161:23, 209:21,
210:25
 SUBMISSION [4] -
15:4, 67:1, 210:26,
210:27
 SUBMISSIONS [2] -
73:3. 210:23
 SUBMIT [2] - 45:1,
79:24
 SUBMITTED [2] -
128:1, 152:22
 SUBSEQUENT[3] -
61:15, 139:5, 140:5
 SUBSEQUENTLY
[2] - 139:10, 140:11
 SUBSTANTIAL[1] -
66:15
 SUBSTANTIVE[3] -
42:4, 62:28, 66:2
```

```
43:20
 SUFFERED[1] -
103.4
 SUFFERING [13] -
20:13, 25:21, 25:26,
26:2, 28:1, 31:7, 49:8,
58:24, 72:1, 86:3,
98:26, 101:27, 131:3
 SUFFERS[1] - 137:5
 SUFFICIENT [4] -
13:25, 47:5, 71:25,
71:28
 SUFFICIENTLY [5] -
46:24, 47:20, 47:27,
48:2, 48:3
 SUGGEST [2] -
119:24. 164:1
 SUGGESTED [5] -
62:17, 92:28, 122:13,
179:28, 191:5
 SUGGESTING [7] -
101:10, 115:5,
115:19, 144:13,
155:17, 164:5, 164:6
 SUGGESTION [4] -
94:18, 118:3, 163:4,
191:7
 SUGGESTIONS [1] -
184:14
 SUGGESTS [2] -
116:13, 196:18
 SUICIDAL [1] -
146:21
 SUITABLE [2] -
164:8, 194:23
 SUMMARISE[1] -
105:26
 SUMMARY [5] -
49:2, 137:28, 169:28,
170:1, 170:2
 SUPER [1] - 165:4
 SUPERINTENDENT
[96] - 6:4, 6:15, 6:22,
6:27, 6:28, 6:29, 7:1,
7:3, 7:10, 7:14, 14:16,
16:16, 17:29, 18:13,
19:5. 19:12. 19:13.
20:3, 20:4, 22:19,
25:4, 25:6, 25:29,
27:13, 28:27, 29:17,
29:26, 33:5, 33:18,
38:19, 39:13, 41:6,
41:9, 41:10, 41:13,
41:16, 41:24, 41:29,
42:25, 43:8, 43:19,
53:5, 63:5, 68:28,
70:11, 72:14, 72:15,
74:16, 77:25, 77:27,
```

173:2

SUCCEEDING [1] -

```
78:15, 86:9, 94:17,
95:23, 102:9, 103:10,
104:16, 107:5,
108:13, 115:25,
119:18, 121:12,
121:13, 124:21,
127:22, 132:20,
133:22, 138:23,
138:24, 145:23,
146:24, 146:27,
149:9, 158:17,
158:25, 165:13,
165:23, 175:13,
177:26, 178:19,
180:1, 180:26, 182:9,
182:15, 185:21,
187:4, 188:24,
188:26, 191:12,
191:25, 195:17,
195:25, 196:17,
211:20, 212:10
 SUPERINTENDENT
[20] - 2:14, 3:2, 3:3,
3:4. 3:4. 3:5. 3:8. 3:8.
3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16,
3:18, 3:19, 3:20, 5:3,
6:12, 77:22, 95:20,
103:19
 SUPERINTENDENT
[137] - 7:8, 10:17,
10:28, 14:7, 24:25,
25:12, 30:6, 31:22,
33:20, 34:4, 34:22,
35:8. 35:12. 36:5.
36:6, 36:7, 36:12,
36:16, 36:19, 36:24,
36:29, 37:3, 37:12,
37:13, 39:1, 39:15,
39:16, 40:7, 40:8,
40:23, 41:18, 41:25,
43:5. 43:29. 44:10.
45:1. 45:3. 46:2.
46:23, 47:9, 47:16,
47:19, 51:11, 55:7,
55:9, 56:15, 57:24,
59:1, 60:18, 62:9,
62:24, 64:14, 66:6,
67:10, 68:23, 69:1,
69:11, 69:23, 70:13,
73.9 77.1 95.8
96:16, 97:14, 97:18,
97:28, 108:9, 113:20,
114:6, 114:19,
115:20, 116:18,
116:20, 116:26,
118:1, 121:3, 121:5,
127:20, 131:28,
132:7, 136:4, 136:7,
148:11, 149:2,
149:13, 149:27,
149:28, 155:5, 158:3,
```

SUBTRACT[1] -

158:4, 159:20, 159:24, 160:1, 162:25, 163:11, 163:14, 164:7, 170:19, 171:28, 173:17, 173:21, 175:1, 175:5, 177:29, 180:26, 182:11, 183:4, 183:10, 183:19, 184:8, 184:9, 184:16, 184:23, 185:4, 185:13, 185:15, 185:19, 187:25, 188:22, 189:3, 189:25, 197:19, 197:28, 198:4, 198:21, 200:4, 202:13, 202:18, 203:15, 204:25, 205:6, 205:8, 211:23, 212:3 **SUPERINTENDENT** 'S [1] - 85:20 SUPERINTENDENT **S**[2] - 106:17, 106:18 **SUPERINTENDENT S**[1] - 29:6 SUPERIOR [11] -10:3, 32:5, 32:10, 32:11, 33:9, 36:10, 36:14, 36:17, 36:22, 145:20, 150:9 SUPERIORS [1] -144:19 SUPERVISION [1] -146.4 SUPERVISOR [3] -33:13, 145:1, 150:7 SUPPORT [14] -35:16, 35:17, 38:4, 39:23, 56:16, 60:6, 60:10, 60:11, 94:29, 112:17, 113:26, 115:6, 119:4, 155:17 SUPPORTED [2] -37:14, 130:15 SUPPORTS [10] -36:21, 37:27, 59:11, 59:16, 88:20, 91:21, 92:4, 94:25, 154:2, 160:7 SUPPOSE [84] -7:24, 8:1, 8:21, 8:24, 8:26, 10:21, 10:22, 16:1, 16:3, 18:22, 20:11, 21:4, 24:10, 24:16, 25:23, 29:8, 30:4, 30:26, 32:17,

35:15. 37:9. 37:15.

37:20, 37:22, 37:25,

37:29, 40:10, 42:3, 42:4, 43:2, 44:7, 44:11, 50:3, 50:20, 50:24, 52:19, 52:29, 53:4, 53:9, 53:11, 54:7, 55:12, 65:22, 65:24, 67:12, 68:4, 68:5, 68:6, 68:13, 76:10, 82:2, 83:1, 85:2, 85:4, 86:11, 99:29, 101:14, 102:2, 102:17, 124:1, 150:17, 150:22, 152:14, 157:13, 169:21, 170:2, 170:5, 172:3, 174:2, 175:21, 176:5, 176:11, 178:26, 179:13, 180:11, 192:9, 192:19, 195:16, 201:24, 201:25, 208:24, 210:19 SUPPOSED [5] -23:24, 40:19, 152:17, 152:19, 152:21 **SURELY** [3] - 56:2, 56:4. 85:13 SURPRISE [2] -191:13, 191:19 SURPRISED [2] -155:24, 159:14 SURPRISING [1] -189:4 **SURROUNDING** [2] -109:8. 152:29 SUSPENDED [3] -143:1, 143:3, 172:13 SUSTAINED[2] -115:15, 157:4 SWORN [2] - 104:26, 142:8 SYMPATHETIC[2] -42:14, 42:15 SYSTEM [9] - 78:23, 98:20. 98:29. 99:2.

Т

102:25, 127:10,

149:29, 162:12,

SYSTEM [1] - 10:5

SÍOCHÁNA[7] -

87:4, 89:17, 91:12,

110:12, 110:23,

125:14, 144:10

SÍOCHÁNA [1] - 3:2

180:23

T&N [1] - 4:2 **TABLE** [1] - 135:10

TAG [1] - 125:25 TALKS[4] - 22:19, 34:19, 106:14, 122:18 **TARA**[1] - 3:21 **TARGET**[1] - 94:22 TARGETED[2] -72:7, 95:5 TARGETING[1] -95:9 **TASK**[1] - 127:7 **TAX**[3] - 34:19, 197:6. 197:11 **TEAM**[10] - 14:5, 32:29, 33:1, 35:17, 35:28, 35:29, 47:15, 80:2, 91:23 **TEAM'S** [1] - 6:6 TEASE [2] - 79:8, 178:26 TEASED[1] - 71:23 TECHNICALLY [3] -146:4, 147:21, 199:19 TELEPHONE [1] -176:22 **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 TEMPLEMORE [1] -191:1 TEMPORARY [3] -109:13, 109:28, 118:23 TEN [4] - 44:6, 74:3, 168:8. 189:18 **TENDING** [1] - 29:28 **TENOR** [1] - 55:18 TERM [18] - 114:14, 115:5, 147:5, 155:9, 155:17, 161:5, 161:15, 161:16, 164:11, 176:18, 180:6, 180:29, 181:3, 181:4, 195:6, 201:15, 201:21 **TERMS** [56] - 7:7, 7:9, 7:13, 7:19, 8:17, 8:19, 9:14, 10:25, 21:17, 22:3, 23:5, 23:22, 24:2, 24:17, 27:29, 29:3, 29:13, 30:9, 36:16, 37:8, 37:25, 38:29, 39:1, 41:7, 45:11, 45:19, 47:1, 47:13, 58:16, 78:5, 78:9, 78:14, 78:17, 78:23, 80:19,

135:5, 195:22, 198:11 TODAY [6] - 112:28, **TEXT**[2] - 97:1, 127:20, 132:12, 202:2 154:23, 177:1, 200:12 THANKFULLY[1] -TODAY'S [2] -124:27, 128:26 154:25 **THE** [20] - 1:3, 1:7, TOGETHER [4] -1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 57:29, 61:6, 201:27 6:1, 6:5, 29:24, 74:8, **TOM** [3] - 3:12, 4:12 104:19, 104:29, TOMORROW[1] -142:2, 142:11, 140.6 193:24, 193:27, **TONY** [6] - 132:8, 193:29, 212:21, 132:18, 136:1, 158:4, 212:24, 212:26 158:25, 159:20 THE.. [2] - 156:26, **TOOK** [18] - 18:24, 192:26 37:13, 37:18, 42:7, **THEME** [9] - 113:24, 56:6, 56:16, 60:23, 113:25, 113:26, 60:27, 60:29, 68:17, 153:26, 153:29, 68:20, 70:12, 70:27, 173:28, 182:5, 85:8, 90:14, 159:29, 186:18, 194:20 170:25, 194:20 THEMSELVES [4] -**TOP** [23] - 18:27, 19:23, 53:1, 172:28, 49:14, 61:9, 65:29, 173.1 84:21, 88:10, 90:11, **THEN** [5] - 74:8, 90:12, 95:26, 96:27, 104:19, 142:2, 155:4, 163:5, 171:1, 211:11, 212:26 171:23, 177:5, THEREBY [2] -185:28, 186:27, 187:21, 188:16, 152:26, 152:27 THEREFORE [1] -189:12, 204:10, 204:12, 204:20 **THINKS** [1] - 210:18 **TOP-UP** [1] - 163:5 **THIRD** [11] - 12:15, **TOTALLY** [2] - 9:7, 18:3, 35:2, 39:10, 174.7 56:8, 63:17, 78:27, **TOUCHY** [1] - 206:9 80:8, 81:3, 96:13, TOWARDS [9] -114:3 29:22, 29:25, 92:1, THIRDHAND[1] -125:26, 128:9, 165:21, 194:15, 199:5 THIRDS [2] - 201:5, 200:29, 201:5 TOWNPARKS[1] -202:14 THOROUGH [1] -2:11 84:26 TRACK[1] - 132:7 TRACKED[1] -**THREAT**[1] - 145:8 THREE [12] - 69:29, 134:24 70:9, 71:19, 101:14, TRANSCRIPT[3] -129:8, 151:27, 182:6, 1:25, 27:2, 61:17 184:13, 189:19, TRANSFER [29] -204:10, 208:5, 208:7 115:6, 115:27, THROUGHOUT [5] -115:28, 116:2, 116:7, 116:10, 116:15, 88:7, 185:1, 186:18, 190:9, 190:21 116:17, 116:19, **THRUST** [1] - 109:10 117:3, 117:11, THURSDAY [2] -117:16, 117:23, 117:25, 118:3, 177:1. 177:2 TIMEFRAME[1] -119:11, 119:13, 119:26, 119:29, 62:25 120:4, 121:19, **TIMING** [1] - 102:26 121:26, 155:18, TINY [1] - 148:23

82:3, 82:7, 82:15,

87:15, 87:21, 88:4,

88:5, 89:29, 92:1,

92:7, 92:27, 95:1,

95:7, 98:15, 98:23,

99:6, 101:9, 125:11,

TITLE [2] - 158:7,

158:9

155:22, 156:6, 157:3,

157:9, 157:14, 159:11

TRANSFERRED[2] -69:3, 105:22 TRANSFERRING [1] - 116:10 TRANSFERS [4] -117:12, 119:19, 121:10, 155:25 TRANSPIRED [5] -115:7, 115:13, 155:19, 156:7, 180:15 TRAVEL[2] - 82:29, TREACY [1] - 2:27 **TREAT**[2] - 173:5, 203:23 TREATED[13] - 52:9, 53:22, 54:3, 83:22, 97:9, 179:13, 179:29, 180:24, 197:9, 198:1, 198:4. 199:12. 199:27 TREATING [1] -79:25 TREATMENT[20] -89:15, 89:18, 89:20, 92:15, 92:16, 112:19, 115:16, 119:1, 119:7, 154:21, 157:5, 162:9, 162:14, 162:18, 165:20, 185:8, 186:1, 186:10, 199:2, 203:29 TRIANGLE [2] -82:12, 86:9 TRIANGULAR[1] -92.21 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, TRIBUNAL [14] -7:16, 33:28, 35:14, 36:8, 36:20, 63:2, 64:8, 73:2, 80:6, 88:1, 116:27, 118:2, 118:15, 125:5 **TRIBUNALS**[1] - 1:8 TRIED [2] - 73:1, 180:11 TRIGGER [1] -131:14 TRIGGERED [4] -14:11, 55:10, 55:13 TRIP[1] - 126:1 TROUBLE [1] -206:20 **TRR** [14] - 109:5, 109:12, 109:18, 109:20, 109:21, 109:29, 110:16, 110:27, 111:6, 111:25, 118:24, 125:19, 151:22, 152:9

TRUST[2] - 198:16,

199:7 **TRY** [13] - 11:17, 15:22, 27:13, 66:16, 70:12, 126:8, 133:11, 134:23, 168:28, 175:26, 197:4, 197:5, 198:13 TRYING [29] - 8:16, 27:4, 27:5, 27:6, 28:9, 28:24, 28:27, 32:19, 32:20, 33:23, 33:25, 65:19, 66:8, 66:10, 70:5, 72:19, 74:22, 129:19, 164:7, 165:3, 170:2, 176:9, 178:26, 190:15, 191:27, 192:7, 206:17, 206:23 TUESDAY [2] - 1:18, TUESDAY[1] - 177:1 TULLAMORE[1] -185:5 TURN [6] - 6:7, 29:18, 29:19, 80:7, 112:14, 204:9 TURNER [1] - 2:27 TURNING [3] -60:22, 154:26 **TWO** [53] - 22:5,

28:15, 83:15, 84:20 TURNS [2] - 27:20, TWICE [3] - 60:21, 23:5, 23:15, 23:26, 41:9, 41:13, 41:17, 42:28, 43:7, 43:8, 43:15, 43:27, 44:2, 45:6, 48:22, 57:26, 59:27, 60:10, 60:12, 60:13, 61:4, 61:28, 73:12, 83:27, 94:1, 105:17, 121:8, 128:15, 128:16, 132:13, 133:4, 150:17, 150:28, 151:12, 170:4, 173:25, 176:20, 176:21, 176:24, 179:13, 184:13, 189:14, 197:25, 198:22, 201:5, 201:29, 202:6, 202:14, 202:23, 208:9. 209:15. 210:15 TWO-THIRDS [2] -201:5, 202:14 **TYPE** [3] - 87:15,

113:26, 119:4

TYPED[1] - 176:7

TYPICALLY[1] -

126:3

U

ULTIMATELY[11] -14:11, 51:25, 54:6, 54:9, 86:5, 92:8, 93:17, 98:24, 102:4, 200:5 UMBRELLA[4] -105:20, 106:7, 142:21, 142:24 UNCERTAINTY[1] -66:7 **UNCLEAR** [2] - 57:7, 120:14 **UNCONDITIONAL** [1] - 99:27 UNDER [43] - 8:28, 9:25, 10:4, 18:17, 21:11, 24:18, 26:5. 26:8, 31:16, 31:18, 50:3, 76:15, 78:23, 81:3, 98:29, 105:26, 105:28, 106:7, 106:8, 107:22, 108:10, 109:18, 115:24, 125:6, 125:16, 126:7, 127:10, 136:9, 136:23, 137:8, 138:27, 142:21, 142:25, 142:27, 143:10, 143:22, 143:27, 144:1, 144:2, 150:10, 154:5, 166:26, 174:13 UNDER [2] - 1:2, 1:8 UNDERGO [1] -194:28 UNDERGOING [2] -177:8, 194:23 UNDERMINES [1] -62:2 UNDERPINNED [1] -**UNDERSTANDABL** E[2] - 13:2, 31:26 UNDERSTANDABL Y [1] - 69:13 UNDERSTOOD [2] -19:2, 199:14 UNDERTAKE[1] -

UNIT [1] - 105:18 **UNKIND** [1] - 13:26 UNKNOWN [1] -163:6 **UNLESS** [6] - 84:14, 99:4, 111:13, 111:19, 120:23, 154:21 UNNECESSARILY [1] - 15:14 **UNPACK**[1] - 28:28 UNPLEASANT[1] -206:3 **UNPROFESSIONA** L [1] - 181:18 UNREASONABLE [1] - 199:21 UNSPECIFIED [1] -16:23 UNTIL [1] - 212:26 UNUSUAL [24] -18:22, 18:25, 32:18, 37:15, 37:27, 70:27, 147:24, 148:4, 149:10, 149:29, 150:22, 156:1, 162:11, 163:4, 170:21, 174:10, 176:8, 176:15, 182:14, 189:16, 190:3, 211:15 **UNWELL** [2] - 21:6, 88.27 **UP** [103] - 10:29, 13:3, 13:19, 14:8, 18:10, 18:21, 22:24, 24:22, 24:29, 26:9, 26:17, 31:29, 32:21, 35:11, 37:26, 38:4, 39:18, 44:12, 49:2, 49:15, 50:27, 52:17, 53:3, 53:28, 55:11, 56:19, 56:25, 57:14, 58:9. 60:21. 60:29. 62:20, 64:17, 64:29, 66:24, 66:27, 67:10, 67:28, 68:2, 71:6, 73:5, 73:24, 79:28, 85:1, 86:26, 90:11, 96:16, 98:20, 102:22, 105:23, 107:15, 107:18, 108:27, 110:3, 110:6, 110:9,

116:14, 116:17,

116:20, 116:21,

117:16, 117:23,

UNFORTUNATELY

UNION [1] - 150:1

UNIQUENESS [1] -

[1] - 22:22

43.2

117:25, 117:26, 118:8, 118:9, 118:12, 119:26, 121:26, 122:29, 123:16, 123:23, 124:16, 128:1, 128:9, 129:28, 142:25, 146:22, 150:20, 151:25, 155:2, 163:1, 163:3, 163:5, 165:9, 165:25, 167:29, 168:4, 168:17, 170:16, 183:29, 190:6, 190:14, 190:15, 190:18, 192:28, 195:14, 209:22, 211:14, 212:10 **UP-TO-DATE** [2] -55:11, 168:4 UPCOMING [1] -187:1 UPDATE [2] -145:24, 145:26 UPDATED [3] -149:26, 177:21, 186:6 UPFRONT[1] -167:9 **UPSET** [1] - 172:10 UPWARDS [2] -96:12, 96:28 URGENCY [1] -145.6 **URGENT** [1] - 135:13 **USES** [1] - 87:6 USUAL [1] - 73:17

V

VALIDITY [1] - 30:12 **VALUE** [1] - 67:2 **VALUES** [1] - 166:5 **VARIETY** [1] - 95:29 VARIOUS [2] - 58:1, 177:19 VENTURE [1] -110.22 **VERBATIM**[1] - 1:25 VERSA[1] - 147:29 **VERSION** [3] - 30:25, 39:28, 176:7 **VERSUS**[1] - 11:5 **VIA**[1] - 150:13 VICE [1] - 147:29 **VIEW** [47] - 8:15, 13:12, 13:24, 34:3, 34:4, 36:1, 36:2, 36:3, 39:23, 42:8, 48:20, 51:21, 57:1, 62:27, 66:3, 70:27, 85:8,

UNFAIR [2] - 15:17,

UNFAIRLY [1] -

UNFIT [3] - 58:18,

62:6

73:23

179:29

80:21, 100:2

85:9, 89:6, 92:9, 94:9, 95:9, 100:12, 100:29, 102:26, 102:29, 115:7, 115:13, 118:4, 134:8, 136:17, 136:23, 154:22, 154:23, 155:18, 156:6, 157:11, 164:2, 166:23, 180:16, 190:15, 198:7, 198:19, 198:20, 200:10, 200:12 VIEWS [7] - 83:9, 130:12, 135:8, 135:10, 135:11, 139:11, 140:9 VIS-À-VIS [1] - 29:17 **VISIT** [5] - 62:17, 94:26, 173:14, 183:19, 202:27 **VISITED** [2] - 62:11, 202:29 **VISITING** [2] - 183:5, 202:19 **VITAL**[1] - 171:18 **VOICE** [1] - 70:12 VOICEMAIL [1] -189:21 **VOLUME** [5] - 58:27, 95:25, 194:9, 195:2, 196:13 **VOLUME** [2] - 109:4, 151.21 VOLUNTEERED [1] -VOLVO [1] - 175:29 VOUCHER [1] -203.5 W

22:21, 22:24, 26:9, 26:14, 27:7, 86:18, 133:4 WAITING [1] -172:19 **WALSH** [2] - 55:7, 55.9 **WANTS**[2] - 26:9, 141:3 WARRANTED[1] -91:11 **WAS** [10] - 6:12, 77:22, 95:20, 103:19, 104:26, 140:25, 142:8, 194:4, 200:22, 211:11 **WASTE** [1] - 154:21

WAIT [8] - 18:9,

WAYS [1] - 7:24 WEDNESDAY [1] -212:26 **WEEK** [4] - 7:4, 97:8, 171:28, 191:1 WEEKEND [1] -**WEEKLY** [1] - 25:8 WEEKS [5] - 59:27, 60:10, 61:28, 109:17, 127:4 WELCOME [1] -193:28 WELFARE [31] -

35:18, 35:29, 36:2, 36:21, 36:26, 37:4, 50:4, 50:6, 50:7, 57:21, 66:14, 78:21, 89:10, 91:23, 92:2, 92:3, 94:29, 109:11, 114:22, 144:3, 144:25, 147:17, 148:17, 148:24, 150:21, 158:20. 180:16, 193:3, 198:18, 199:9 WELFARE" [1] -56.8 WELLBEING [3] -

115:15, 157:4, 194:27 WELLINGTON [1] -2:30 WESTMEATH[1] -

WHEATLEY [18] -25:12, 73:9, 127:20, 149:28, 158:3, 163:12, 164:7, 183:4, 183:10, 183:19, 184:17, 184:23,

185:15, 202:13,

202:18, 203:15, 211:23, 212:3 WHEATLEY [6] - 3:4, 5:3, 6:12, 77:22,

95:20. 103:19 WHEEL [1] - 52:20 WHEREAS [2] -127:10, 179:4

WHISTLEBLOWER [2] - 69:22, 69:27

WHITE [1] - 3:10 WHITE [2] - 67:5,

175:29 WHOLE [19] - 8:1, 32:23, 33:1, 38:25, 47:15, 49:1, 52:25, 61:5, 62:19, 62:26, 65:22, 65:23, 72:23, 100:13, 103:9,

109:10, 110:22, 115:11, 153:25 **WIDE** [1] - 95:29 WIFE [2] - 150:2, 155.2

WILLING [7] - 30:19, 32:1, 48:13, 48:16, 48:23, 49:28, 49:29 WILLINGNESS [1] -162:5

WILSON [2] - 192:5, 192:22

WIN [1] - 135:12 WINE [1] - 202:6 WISE [1] - 176:7 WISH [3] - 64:7, 97:11, 172:24 **WISHED** [1] - 94:10 WISHES [1] - 89:26 WITHDREW [1] -142.2

WITNESS [9] - 15:2, 15:8, 73:21, 104:22, 142:4, 144:7, 144:8, 198.10 WITNESS [11] - 5:2,

6:5, 29:24, 104:29, 142:2, 142:11, 193:24, 193:27, 193:29, 212:21, 212:24

WITNESSES [11] -9:22, 24:28, 25:9, 25:11, 25:15, 25:22, 25:27, 26:23, 26:28, 27:25

WOMEN [1] - 125:26 **WONDER** [13] -12:11, 19:16, 33:17, 34:13, 73:26, 87:25, 90:11, 90:17, 93:15, 93:21, 103:22, 193:9, 198:9

WONDERING [2] -75:17, 75:24 WORD [6] - 87:13, 87:14, 113:25, 117:1, 122:26, 196:18 WORDS [7] - 78:20, 104:4, 121:29, 148:17, 154:28, 183:12, 209:7 WORKPLACE [20] -

9:9, 11:16, 21:5, 21:10, 24:23, 25:2, 26:3, 56:24, 56:27, 56:28, 59:11, 67:17, 67:18, 82:23, 87:5, 87:7, 91:3, 91:15, 92:25, 137:4

WORKS [3] - 52:2, 107:29, 148:8 **WORRY** [5] - 17:4, 17:5, 17:23, 29:29, 45.28 WORRYING [1] -43:24

WORST [1] - 112:15 **WORTH** [1] - 199:16 WRITE [6] - 13:26, 22:9, 22:11, 22:15, 51:4, 66:23

WRITING [2] - 102:9, 176.7

WRITTEN [9] - 23:7, 33:20, 60:21, 69:1, 77:6, 113:22, 126:14, 178:5, 187:2 WROTE [6] - 43:12, 60:29, 61:25, 62:20,

X

66:24, 74:18

XANAX[1] - 93:27

YEAR [5] - 110:14, 110:18, 110:21, 162:16, 180:8 YEARS [25] - 6:19, 6:23, 7:1, 7:3, 7:4, 7:5, 24:2, 46:12, 105:23, 142:26, 143:11, 143:26, 144:25, 154:25, 155:13, 158:11, 161:2, 162:15, 162:17, 163:1, 169:3, 181:22, 183:11, 200.7 207.6 YESTERDAY [8] -6:18, 38:25, 61:5,

127:20, 171:26 YOU'RE.. [1] -185:21 YOURSELF [12] -24:3, 57:24, 97:28, 108:22, 117:8, 133:22, 139:8, 139:19, 140:9, 158:12, 169:7, 171:20 **YVONNE** [6] - 56:9, 57:12, 57:14, 60:2, 60:5

66:13, 90:15, 95:23,

€

€1,400 [1] - 165:21

É

ÉABHALL[1] - 2:29 **ÉIREANN** [2] - 1:4,

Ó

Ó[2] - 3:6, 135:29