

TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE
AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT
1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON WEDNESDAY, 29TH JANUARY 2020 - DAY 134

134

Gwen Malone Stenography
Services certify the
following to be a
verbatim transcript of
their stenographic notes
in the above-named
action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY
SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER: MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF
APPEAL

REGISTRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL: MR. DIARMAID McGUINESS SC
MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC
MS. SINÉAD McGRATH BL

FOR GARDA NICHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC
MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
INSTRUCTED BY: JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET
TOWNPARKS
CARRICK-ON-SHANNON
CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT
NOREEN McBRIEN: MR. PAUL CARROLL SC
MR. JOHN FERRY BL
INSTRUCTED BY: CARTHAGE CONLON
O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT
SOLICITORS
51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD
DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER
FINTAN FANNING: MR. PAUL McGARRY SC
MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL
INSTRUCTED BY: MR. ANDREW FREEMAN
SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY
SOLICITORS
HALIDAY HOUSE
32 ARRAN QUAY
SMITHFIELD
DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE,
GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY
& GARDA DAVID TURNER: MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC
MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
INSTRUCTED BY: MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY
TEMPLE BAR
DUBLIN 2

FOR

1. COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA
2. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY
3. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN
4. DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER
5. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY
6. RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
7. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
8. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
9. RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
10. RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
11. RETIRED COMMISSIONER NOIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
12. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
13. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN
14. SUPERINTENDENT ALAN MURRAY
15. SUPERINTENDENT AIDAN MINNOCK
16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE
29. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARIE CAGNEY
30. DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O'REARDON
31. INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY
32. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN
33. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND
34. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MICHAEL FLYNN
35. SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
36. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
37. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
38. GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
39. INSPECTOR TARA GOODE

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC
MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC
MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL

MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL

INSTRUCTED BY:

MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE
OSMOND HOUSE
LITTLE SHIP STREET
DUBLIN 8

FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL:
INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL
MR. PAUL CONNELLAN
T&N McLYNN
BASTION COURT
11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET
ATHLONE
CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI,
INSPECTOR NICHOLAS FARRELL,
SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN,
SERGEANT AIDAN LYONS,
SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE:

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC
MS. PEGGY O'ROURKE SC
MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL
REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS
12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE
DUBLIN 2

INSTRUCTED BY:

FOR GARDA TOM HIGGINS:
INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. TOM POWER BL
MR. NOEL McCARTAN
McCARTAN & BURKE SOLICITORS
ICELAND HOUSE
33-34 ARRAN QUAY
SMITHFIELD
DUBLIN 7

I N D E X

WITNESS	PAGE
MS. MONICA CARR	
DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN	57
EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS	66
 DR. OGHENOVO (OVO) OGHUVBU	
DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS	82
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. O'BRIEN	150
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS	169

1 THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON WEDNESDAY, 29TH
2 JANUARY 2020:

3
4 MR. MARRINAN: Good morning, Chairman. The first
5 witness today is Monica Carr. 10:32

6 CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Good morning, Ms. Carr,
7 thank you.

8
9 MS. MONICA CARR, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS
10 DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN, AS FOLLOWS: 10:33

11
12 THE WITNESS: Monica Carr.

13 CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.

14 MR. MARRINAN: Ms. Carr's statement is to be found at
15 page 11720 of the materials, Chairman. 10:33

16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

17 MR. MARRINAN: This is her first statement that she
18 provided to the Tribunal.

19 1 Q. I think, Ms. Carr, that you are a civil servant in An
20 Garda Síochána and you hold the rank of principal
21 officer, isn't that right? 10:33

22 A. That's correct, yes.

23 2 Q. I think that you have responsibility for the HR
24 directorate, is that right?

25 A. At the time I did, yes, at the time. I have
26 subsequently been assigned to a different role, but at
27 that time I did. 10:34

28 3 Q. I think that the HR directorate processes all
29 transactions in partnership with local management,

1 including sick leave, is that right?

2 A. That's correct, yes.

3 4 Q. I think the responsibility for sick leave transferred
4 to the HR directorate in May of 2012, and at that time
5 you were assistant principal, is that right? 10:34

6 A. That's correct. We would have had responsibility for
7 the sick leave management for civilian staff at that
8 time, and in May 2012 responsibility for the
9 administration of the Garda sick leave transferred to
10 the directorate. 10:34

11 5 Q. I think in July 2015 you were appointed acting
12 principal officer with responsibility for the whole of
13 the HR directorate, is that right?

14 A. That's correct.

15 6 Q. Then you were appointed a substantive principal officer 10:35
16 in October of 2012. I think at the outset --

17 A. 1990.

18 7 Q. -- if we could just deal with a number of matters.
19 First of all, you had no direct contact with Garda
20 Keogh, is that correct? 10:35

21 A. That's correct.

22 8 Q. Perhaps we can deal with what you hadn't responsibility
23 for in the first instance, before we go on to deal with
24 what you did have responsibility for. Had you any
25 responsibility at all in relation to the recording of 10:35
26 the nature of any illness on the SAMS system?

27 A. No. That would be done locally in the divisional or
28 district office where the member is serving.

29 9 Q. Yes. The second thing is: Have you any responsibility

1 at all for the classification of illness?

2 A. In terms of -- that comes into play when somebody might
3 be pay affected under the sick leave regulations, which
4 is a 2014 public service sick leave document that came
5 into play. So if you're going to be pay affected, 10:36
6 which means that you have availed of, I think it's
7 92/93 days sick leave, within the last four years,
8 subsequent absences would be reduced to half day for a
9 following 91, 92 days -- 91 days. And subsequent to
10 that, if you are still availing of sick leave within a 10:36
11 four year period, you would move on to temporary
12 rehabilitation pay. On notification from the district
13 and divisional offices, that would come up to the
14 centre in Navan into the directorate and that would be
15 managed and the notifications would be sent to Garda 10:36
16 pay section at that time. So that would deal with the
17 amendments to the pay.

18
19 If members are applying for critical illness, they
20 would fill in a particular form. That would be 10:37
21 provided to the occupational health department. The
22 CMO might be in a position to agree that critical
23 illness would apply in that case, or he could send it
24 back to us in Navan, where we would make a management
25 decision in relation to it, between his recommendations 10:37
26 and the information available to us. And the third
27 category --

28 10 Q. Yes.

29 A. -- is the injury on duty category, where the chief

1 superintendent, that's code 11.37 of the Garda code,
2 and where a member might seek to have his absence
3 classified as injury on duty. That would be done in
4 the first instance by the chief superintendent in the
5 particular division based on the information available 10:37
6 to them and reports. There is an option, if the chief
7 superintendent has any doubt, that they would seek
8 advice from us and from the CMO. Also, that would be
9 of particular importance where there may be concerns
10 around a psychological injury or that. 10:38

11 11 Q. We just might briefly just refer to the regulations,
12 since you mentioned them. They're at 8213 of the
13 materials. If they could come up on the screen there.
14 There's no need to go through them because we're
15 familiar now with the content of them. But they're 10:38
16 there, the Public Service Management (Sick Leave)
17 Regulations 2014. There we see the start date for the
18 new Public Service Sick Leave Scheme came into
19 operation on 31st March of 2014, isn't that right?

20 A. That's correct, yes. 10:38

21 12 Q. We can see under 2.1, paid sick leave, you have already
22 referred to it.

23
24 "The new scheme provides for a maximum of 92 days sick
25 leave on full pay in a year, followed by a maximum of 10:39
26 91 days sick leave on half pay, subject to a maximum of
27 183 days paid sick leave in a rolling four year
28 period."
29

1 Is that right?

2 A. That's correct, yes.

3 13 Q. We have heard I think from Inspector Downey yesterday
4 in relation to the application of this to An Garda
5 Síochána. I think it applied retrospectively 10:39
6 effectively, isn't that right?

7 A. Well, this is a public service sick leave regulation,
8 and it applied to the whole of the public service.
9 Heretofore, civil servants would have had a rolling
10 four year, would have been very familiar with the 10:39
11 rolling four year methodology.

12 14 Q. Yes?

13 A. The introduction of the rolling four year for Garda
14 members only came in on 31st March 2014.

15 15 Q. I had understood that he perhaps suggested that the 10:39
16 rolling four years would take into account previous
17 absences?

18 A. That would be correct.

19 16 Q. Yes.

20 A. Yes. 10:40

21 17 Q. Is that correct?

22 A. Yes.

23 18 Q. So in that respect it was retrospective?

24 A. Yes.

25 19 Q. Yes. Then under 2.2 you deal with the temporary 10:40
26 rehabilitation -- well, you don't deal with it, the
27 regulation does, the Temporary Rehabilitation
28 Remuneration, or what is known as TRR, isn't that
29 right?

1 A. That's correct, yes.

2 20 Q. It says:

3

4 "If you have exhausted 183 days paid sick leave in a
5 rolling four year period and continue absent or are on 10:40
6 absent on sick leave again, you may be granted TRR for
7 a further 548 days."

8 A. Yeah.

9 21 Q. And then:

10

10:40

11 "Temporary rehabilitation remuneration used to be
12 called the pension rate of pay and will be calculated
13 in the same way. Temporary Rehabilitation Remuneration
14 will only be available when there is a realistic
15 prospect that you will be able to return to work 10:41
16 following your illness with an ability to provide
17 regular and effective service."

18

19 So those were the regulations that you were applying
20 throughout your period in the directorate. 10:41

21 A. Yes.

22 22 Q. I think, going back to your statement now, if we could
23 have it up again, at page 11720, please. I think you
24 pointed out that you documented all correspondence that
25 issued in relation to Garda Keogh's sick receive from 10:41
26 2012. Initially correspondence issued under cover of
27 the signature of assistant commissioner of HRM, isn't
28 that right?

29 A. That's correct.

1 23 Q. I think that was Assistant Commissioner Fanning at the
2 time, is that right?
3 A. That's correct, yes.

4 24 Q. And that relates to documents 1 to 16 in a schedule
5 that you prepared. And then from July 2012, 10:42
6 correspondence issued under cover of the signature of
7 the director of HR and PD."
8
9 That is Human Resources and People Development. They
10 are documents 17 to 28. 10:42
11 A. Correct.

12 25 Q. Who was the director at that time, is that
13 Mr. Mulligan?
14 A. That would have been Alan Mulligan, yes.

15 26 Q. I think from August 2015 correspondence from the HR 10:42
16 directorate issued under cover of your signature, isn't
17 that right?
18 A. Correct.

19 27 Q. You then prepared a chart of a number of letters and
20 e-mails that have gone back and forth and I don't 10:42
21 intend to open most of these. There are some that are
22 of particular interest but I think we can take these as
23 being read. They're provided in the documentation.
24 The first one there that you recorded is 10th February
25 2012, which is what is known as a 28 day letter: 10:43
26
27 "Garda Keogh was recorded as being absent from 30th
28 December 2011 and the absence exceeded 28 days and a
29 referral to the Chief Medical Officer was now required

1 in accordance with code 139/10."

2

3 Now, we are familiar with that and we have that opened.
4 Is that something that is prompted, as it were, by your
5 department or should it emanate from local management? 10:43

6 A. We would expect local management would notify us of
7 members when they are 28 days absent, with a referral
8 to the Chief Medical Officer to ensure members are
9 fully supported. And when I say members, I mean all
10 the staff of An Garda Síochána. In this instance it 10:44
11 looks like it was one that -- sometimes we would be
12 able to run reports centrally in Navan from the SAMS
13 system, identify people who were absent over 28 days
14 and it's kind of a catchall methodology, to ensure that
15 members were being referred promptly to the Chief 10:44
16 Medical Officer.

17 28 Q. So if somebody exceeded a 28 day period, this is
18 something that would be --

19 A. Standard.

20 29 Q. -- in the first instance would be thrown up or 10:44
21 highlighted by local management to notify you.

22 A. Yes.

23 30 Q. But in any event, the system would pick it up in your
24 department, is that right?

25 A. Well, we would run reports periodically to ensure. So 10:44
26 it wasn't something that was done, we'll say, every 28
27 days or at the end of every month.

28 31 Q. Yes.

29 A. We would do it periodically to try and capture, make

1 sure we have caught everybody and that they are
2 supported.

3 32 Q. Then the next entry is 29/2/2012. This was a report
4 from the chief superintendent in Mullingar to the
5 assistant commissioner in HRM containing a referral 10:45
6 form. That is a referral to the CMO, isn't that right?

7 A. That would be correct, yes.

8 33 Q. "Copies of medical certificates regarding an absence
9 from 30th December 2012, when Garda Keogh reported
10 unfit for duty citing traumatic chest pains." 10:45
11

12 Then there was a cover letter from chief superintendent
13 Conway stating that a certificate in accordance with
14 11.37 was attached. Now, in fact, that wasn't attached
15 but that is not the important thing. What is a 10:45
16 certificate in relation to 11.37?

17 A. A certificate code 11.37 is what is completed by the
18 chief superintendent in the divisional officer where
19 the member serves. So where a member has been injured
20 in the course of executing their duty as a Garda 10:46
21 member, they make an application through the chief
22 superintendent for code 11.37, which means that they
23 are paid when they are absent on sick leave, they
24 wouldn't be pay affected in the same terms as if the
25 ordinary sick leave regulations apply. 10:46

26 34 Q. would their pay be affected at all?

27 A. well, if the absence is longer than -- at that time,
28 that was 2012, so if it was longer than six months it
29 would have been pay affected.

1 35 Q. Right.

2 A. But the other piece with the code 11.37 is that it
3 ring-fences that period of sick leave into the future.
4 So that period of sick leave wouldn't form part of any
5 consideration or calculation of sick absences into the 10:46
6 future.

7 36 Q. Yes. Then if we can move on, there are a number of
8 letters that go back and forth in relation to Garda
9 Keogh's fitness for duty and CMO advices. If we could
10 just scroll down to number 10. Sorry, number 9 there. 10:47
11 This is 19th October of 2012:

12

13 "CMO advices were communicated with the chief
14 superintendent, Mullingar, on the 19th October, which
15 advised that Garda Keogh was fit for work and normal 10:47
16 policing duties and requested a unit report in six
17 weeks time."

18

19 Can you tell us what that is about, the unit report?

20 A. Well, the unit report would be where the CMO has asked 10:47
21 for information in relation to the member when they
22 return to work on a unit and how they are progressing
23 within the unit. I think the CMO might be better able
24 to explain exactly what would be in that report. We
25 would facilitate the notification that the report is 10:48
26 required and to follow up looking for the report to
27 come back in and forward it.

28 37 Q. Does the unit report or the requirement for a unit
29 report kick in only in relation to circumstances where

1 an 11.37 --

2 A. No.

3 38 Q. -- certificate --

4 A. I understand a unit report is a report that the CMO
5 would ask for from local management, as a sort of 10:48
6 follow up as to how a member has re integrated into the
7 workplace following a protracted period of absence or
8 following a period of absence or sick leave.

9 39 Q. We see there that that a unit report was requested to
10 be available in six weeks time. 10:48

11 A. Mm-hmm.

12 40 Q. Then if we scroll down then to item number 15. And if
13 we could perhaps have page 9289 up on the screen. This
14 is a letter dated 14th January 2014, in relation to a
15 sick report. We don't need to go into the actual sick 10:49
16 report or the details in relation to that, the report
17 and correspondence arising from it are set out in your
18 schedule. But if we could just highlight some aspects
19 of this. If we look at the second paragraph, dated the
20 14th January, from Assistant Commissioner Fanning: 10:50

21
22 "In order to assist the Chief Medical Officer in the
23 review of the member, this branch requests an
24 up-to-date report in six to eight weeks time and every
25 three months thereafter for at least 12 months, 10:50
26 prepared in consultation with the member to including
27 the following:

28 1. Work performance, to include what duty the member
29 currently performs;

1 2. History of attendance at work clarifying periods of
2 effective/non-effectiveness;

3 3. Coping skills and efforts which have been made to
4 assist the member to improve coping skills where this
5 has been perceived to be necessary. " 10:51

6
7 That is code 11.32(2) refers.

8
9 "Relationship with pierce and supervisors;

10 5. Any other information deemed relevant in this case 10:51
11 (including any related matters of concern from the
12 member, if any).

13
14 It is essential that this unit report is available to
15 the Chief Medical Officer in six to eight weeks time 10:51
16 and every three months thereafter for at least 12
17 months.

18
19 The Chief Medical Officer advised that no further
20 review is warranted in this case at this time but he 10:51
21 will review the file in three months or earlier if
22 circumstances indicate. "

23
24 Is that a relatively standard form in circumstances
25 where somebody has gone back to work? 10:51

26 A. Yes. The points 1 to 5 would be what the -- that's
27 really what the CMO has asked, that this would be
28 available to him. And we transcribe it into that
29 letter and send it out to the local management.

1 41 Q. You're merely a conduit of the request from the CMO?
2 A. Correct.

3 42 Q. But you will follow it up then if these matters
4 aren't --
5 A. Yes, we would hopefully follow it up, yes. 10:52

6 43 Q. There doesn't appear from the papers to be --
7 A. A follow up.

8 44 Q. -- a follow up that is specific and deals with those
9 requests. Is there any reason why not?
10 A. Other than it would have been an administrative error. 10:52
11 We don't have an actual HR information system, so we're
12 relying on an IT system that wouldn't support, you
13 know, alerts at various times for each individual. So
14 we would be relying on doing individual checks and
15 pulling files out and looking to see if we have had 10:52
16 reports in. So if it hasn't been done and obviously it
17 looks like it hasn't, it would be administrative --

18 45 Q. You see, this request would suggest that there are
19 issues there that need to be monitored and addressed
20 and that the matter needs to be reviewed. It's 10:53
21 anticipated that this will be done quarterly and
22 thereafter at least every 12 months. You don't know
23 why that wasn't followed up in this instance?
24 A. No.

25 46 Q. It's the beginning of 2014. In any event, if we move 10:53
26 on then. If we could have page 9378 up on the screen,
27 please. In terms of Garda Keogh -- yes, we can see
28 here that the next moment in time that this request
29 seems to have been followed up or that there's any

1 movement in relation to it, if we go to page 9382,
2 please. This is a unit report in relation to Garda
3 Nicholas Keogh and it is dated 20th February of 2015.
4 So this is effectively 14 months later.

5
6 "In relation to the above and attached correspondence,
7 I wish to report that I am not in receipt of previous
8 correspondence referred to, as I only gave Garda
9 Keogh's supervisors last December.

10
11 In respect of the points raised, having spoken to Garda
12 Keogh, I am to reply as follows:

- 13 1. Garda Keogh currently performs all duties consume
14 mate with his rank, including beat, station and
15 prisoner management duties;
- 16 2. A history of his effectiveness/non-effectiveness is
17 available in the district office;
- 18 3. There are no coping skills or other measures deemed
19 necessary at this stage;
- 20 4. Garda Keogh states he has a good working
21 relationship with his peers and immediate supervisors
22 alike;
- 23 5. Garda Keogh does not wish to note any other areas
24 of concern."

25
26 And that is signed by his then unit sergeant, Sergeant
27 Cormac Moylan. If we go to page 9378 of the material,
28 we see there in the middle, if we could scroll down, we
29 see an e-mail from Mullingar sent 24th February at 2015

1 at 10:25 to the assistant commissioner, Sick Section:

2
3 "With reference to the above, please see attached
4 report in respect of the member concerned."

5
6 That is sent by local management, isn't that right?

7 A. That's correct.

8 47 Q. Yes. We then move on. There are a number of other
9 documents which I don't need to open, they're self
10 explanatory, but if we move to item number 23 on your
11 list of 11722. This is at page 9407 of the materials
12 please. We see there, it's a letter dated 21st April
13 of 2015, from Superintendent Pat Murray. It concerns
14 the TRR issue. Sorry, I called out the wrong
15 reference. This is 9408 of the material, I beg your
16 pardon. 9408. Thank you, Mr. Kavanagh. This refers
17 to:

18
19 "I refer to the above and your correspondence of the
20 14th April regarding the above member's Temporary
21 Rehabilitation Remuneration. The correspondence
22 arrived here on 16th April 2015. The member reported
23 sick and unfit for duty on 20th April 2015 and remains
24 on sick leave. I have no indication as to when he will
25 return and I have been unable to contact him by phone.
26 I have asked the superintendent in the area where he
27 lives to give him a copy of the correspondence. At
28 this stage I refer to my referral and report of 2nd
29 April 2015 and I can only ask that the member be seen

1 by the Chief Medical Officer as soon as possible."
2
3 Then, if we go to page 9407, we have a letter of the
4 27th April of 2015, from Chief Superintendent Lorraine
5 wheatley, forwarding a report of Superintendent Murray 10:59
6 by way of background information. And there is a
7 request to have the member reviewed by the Chief
8 Medical Officer as soon as possible; isn't that right?
9 A. Yes.
10 48 Q. So again, this request for a review comes through the 10:59
11 directorate, is that right?
12 A. That's correct, yes.
13 49 Q. You are merely a conduit of that request --
14 A. We would forward it.
15 50 Q. -- to the Chief Medical Officer, isn't that right? 10:59
16 A. Correct.
17 51 Q. Now, if we could then move to page 6144 of the
18 material, please. This is correspondence from the
19 directorate to the chief superintendent in Mullingar,
20 stating that as Garda Keogh reported unfit for duty as 11:00
21 a result of work related stress and reported, the chief
22 superintendent communication dated of the 2nd th April,
23 local management should now interview the member to
24 establish the cause of the member's stress?
25 A. Yes. 11:00
26 52 Q. So why is that request made?
27 A. Okay. So that is a standard letter that would issue
28 where medical certificates are received in respect of
29 members or staff stating that they are suffering with

1 stress or work related stress. And we would ask that
2 local management would, I suppose the word investigate,
3 but would establish the cause or the source of that
4 stress. That information would be forwarded then to
5 the Chief Medical Officer, in order that he would have 11:00
6 all the information available to him to assist in his
7 support for the member or the member of staff.

8 53 Q. If we could then volume 20 at 6145 up on the screen,
9 please. Just scroll down. This is a letter of the
10 26th May, from Chief Superintendent Wheatley. It's a 11:01
11 report to the executive director of HRPD, stating:

12
13 "The cause of the member's stress cannot be
14 investigated as the many is not willing to discuss the
15 issue any further." 11:01

16
17 Could you just help us in relation to that? Is that
18 unusual or is that something that you had encountered
19 previously?

20 A. Well, I suppose there's two elements to it. In terms 11:01
21 of protected disclosures, this would be the first time
22 that this -- wouldn't be the first time. This was in
23 the very early days, I suppose, of the new protected
24 disclosures legislation and it wasn't familiar to all
25 of us. Members not being in a position to discuss 11:02
26 causes of stress or issues like that, that would not be
27 unusual, where they might prefer maybe to discuss it
28 directly with the Chief Medical Officer.

29 54 Q. Yes.

1 A. So there's kind of two elements to that, if you like.

2 55 Q. But did you envisage or perceive that the requirement
3 that was imposed on local management in those
4 circumstances was predicated on the member agreeing
5 and -- 11:02

6 A. Yes, I would understand --

7 56 Q. -- being cooperative?

8 A. -- that I suppose we had asked if they would find out,
9 see if they could establish the source of the stress.
10 And in fairness, they came back to say the member had 11:02
11 advised that with the protected disclosure he was
12 invoking, I suppose, what he thought was protections
13 under that and didn't wish to discuss it further.

14 57 Q. Now, I think then on 5th August 2015, if we could have
15 volume 33, it's at 9474, up on the screen, please. 11:03
16 Again, this refers to the -- this stems from a case
17 conference request that had come from the chief
18 superintendent in Mullingar on the 24th July, isn't
19 that right?

20 A. Correct. 11:03

21 58 Q. This is you forwarding that on, isn't that right, to
22 the CMO?

23 A. Yes.

24 59 Q. Now, I think that subsequently there was a case
25 conference that was held, but you weren't in attendance 11:04
26 at any of the case conferences?

27 A. Correct.

28 60 Q. Again, would that be unusual or would you ever
29 attend --

1 A. No.

2 61 Q. -- a case conference?

3 A. At that time the assistant principal generally would
4 have attended the case conferences, but depending on
5 availability of staff, we would also have other members 11:04
6 of staff at HU and DU level attend the case
7 conferences.

8 62 Q. I think on the 19th January then there were the CMO
9 advices, which were dated 8th January 2016, indicating
10 that Garda Keogh was temporarily unfit for work: 11:04
11
12 "...but the member can resume duty on certification of
13 his own GP."
14
15 Those advices were forwarded by you to the chief 11:05
16 superintendent in Mullingar, isn't that right?

17 A. Yes.

18 63 Q. Then if we could just move onto the 12th July, we have
19 case conference notes taken by Claire Egan. Who is
20 Claire Egan? 11:05

21 A. She would have been the assistant principal working
22 with me at the time.

23 64 Q. Yes. She appears to have attended at a conference, is
24 that right?

25 A. Correct. 11:05

26 65 Q. A case conference in relation to Garda Keogh. What
27 would be her role in relation to that, at the
28 conference?

29 A. The idea behind the case conference would be that

1 relevant parties would meet, which would be the Chief
2 Medical Officer, HR and the local management divisional
3 officer and district officer. And the idea behind it
4 would be to ensure that the member is getting all the
5 relevant supports and also to see if there is a way
6 back to facilitate the member returning to work.

11:06

7 66 Q. Now, then if we could have just page 9487 up on the
8 screen, please. This is 31st August 2015, it's dated.
9 It's to the chief superintendent in Westmeath and it
10 relates to Garda Keogh. It says:

11:07

11
12 "On midnight, 9th August of 2015, going into --".

13
14 I don't understand that, but it looks like:

11:07

15
16 "On midnight 9th August 2015 and 20/8/2015, Garda Keogh
17 exceeded 183 days in a four-year period, due to him
18 reporting non-effective for duty on 10th August 2015
19 and 20th August 2015 respectively.

11:07

20
21 As such, Garda Keogh shall receive TRR remuneration for
22 a period of time from 10th August 2015 to 13th August
23 2015, including 20th August 2015 to 23rd August 2015,
24 in accordance with the public service management
25 regulations. Please submit a medical certificate to
26 cover the periods 10th August 2015 and 13th August
27 2015, including 20th August 2015 to 23rd August 2015
28 inclusive, in order that the member's pay may issue."
29

11:08

1 At this stage was Garda Keogh on TRR?
2 A. Yes, it would appear every time that he goes sick at
3 this stage, once he would have reached 183, so
4 automatically his entitlement would revert back to
5 temporary rehabilitation pay. 11:08
6 67 Q. There are a number of other documents then. On 8th
7 September 2016 --
8 68 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, can I ask, Ms. Carr, when did Garda
9 Keogh exceed 183 days in a four year period?
10 A. I honestly couldn't say that just with my records at 11:09
11 the minute. I actually have it probably over in my
12 bag.
13 69 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do you understand from this letter on what
14 date he exceeded 183 days?
15 A. Well, on the date of the 10th, his absence on the 10th 11:09
16 August 2015, he had already had exceeded 183 days sick
17 leave at that stage. So all subsequent absences --
18 70 Q. CHAIRMAN: You see, I am concerned, to what extent the
19 precise date is relevant is another day's work, but I
20 am just trying to understand, it looks like that at 12 11:10
21 midnight on 9th August 2015, if one went back four
22 years, he had 183 days?
23 A. That's correct.
24 71 Q. CHAIRMAN: Or possibly marginally over 183 days?
25 A. It would've been at least 183 days. 11:10
26 72 Q. CHAIRMAN: But I don't understand then why we also have
27 the 20th August?
28 A. Because that's another absence. So the first absence
29 that we are dealing with here is the 10th to 13th

1 August.

2 73 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

3 A. And there is a subsequent absence, the 20th to the 23rd

4 August.

5 74 Q. CHAIRMAN: Ah! 11:10

6 A. So both absences are being dealt with in the one

7 communication.

8 75 Q. CHAIRMAN: So what this really means, if I am

9 understanding then, leave out the 12 midnight for a

10 moment because that seems to me to give a misleading 11:10

11 impression. It should say, in respect of the absences

12 from the 10th August and the 21st August, he is on TRR

13 because he is over 183 days, is that right?

14 A. That's correct.

15 76 Q. CHAIRMAN: Because it gives a different impression, it 11:11

16 gives the impression of precision about when the 183

17 days was exceeded. We're dealing with a situation

18 where he has two absences and he is reduced in pay

19 because at some point he is over 183 in the past four

20 years? 11:11

21 A. But I suppose the 12 midnight refers to, I suppose, the

22 technical piece within our own organisation because

23 members work 24/7.

24 77 Q. CHAIRMAN: Right.

25 A. The issue around the separate instances, at each 11:11

26 instance of sick leave the 183 is retrospectively

27 calculated.

28 78 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand.

29 A. Conceivably on the 20th August he could have been

1 entitled to a different rate of pay if he had reduced
2 down below the 183 days.

3 79 Q. CHAIRMAN: I follow. And the 20th would take into
4 account the absence on the 9th?

5 A. The 10th, yes. 11:12

6 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

7 80 Q. MR. MARRINAN: If we could then move forward, there's a
8 number of correspondences which are set out. If we
9 could just have your statement back up on the screen at
10 11724 please of the material. We see there, there are 11:12
11 a number of documents set out there at number 42 on 8th
12 September 2016, there is a request from the chief
13 superintendent HR as to the status of Garda Keogh's
14 pay. This is at volume 34, 9744. I don't need it up
15 on the screen. And then there is a response, 11:13
16 indicating that Garda Keogh has been in receipt of TRR
17 since he commenced his absence on 26th December 2016.
18 Does that answer the Chairman's question? It's at page
19 9742.

20 A. Well, there was periods in 2015 when the member was 11:13
21 absent on sick leave, earlier in 2015.

22 81 Q. Yes, all right.

23 A. When he had reached 183 days.

24 82 Q. Okay, that might be a little bit misleading then, but
25 inadvertently I am sure. Then there are a number of 11:13
26 documents. At 44 there, 8th September 2016:
27
28 "Response to the chief superintendent stating that the
29 e-mail addresses the query this branch had not had

1 sight of the correspondence. . . "

2
3 Etcetera. We needn't go into that. Then if we could
4 have page 9759 up on the screen, please. Yes. This is
5 an e-mail from chief Superintendent Anthony McLoughlin. 11:14
6 It's addressed to Claire Egan but it's copied to you.
7

8 "You will be aware from previous discussions that Garda
9 Keogh is out of work on sick leave with what I
10 understand to be stress related. I believe he is on 11:14
11 reduced or no pay at this stage. I also understand
12 your department has written to the DPERS for
13 clarification on this situation. In the meantime, I
14 recommend that this member is restored to full pay as
15 soon as possible pending the outcome of your report to 11:14
16 DPERS.
17

18 I would be obliged if I can be informed when this is to
19 happen so that I can contact the member."
20

21 Just tell us about that and how that arose. 11:15

- 22 A. There was a discussion ongoing at the time in relation
23 to whether or not somebody who had made a protected
24 disclosure and subsequently availed of sick leave,
25 whether or not the sick leave regulations applied to 11:15
26 them. I was of the opinion that they did and we sought
27 clarification from DPER at the time in relation to
28 this. Unfortunately the file has been subsequently --
29 I haven't been able to locate the file subsequently.

1 But in that, there is no allowance within, I
2 understand, the protected disclosure legislation to
3 specifically state that a person who has made a
4 protected disclosure subsequently avails of sick leave
5 is entitled --

11:16

6 83 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is in any different position than anybody
7 else?

8 A. Yes.

9 84 Q. MR. MARRINAN: We just might return to that and the
10 discussion that arose in relation to that and we will
11 have a look at that. But at this stage, in any event,
12 it's clear that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, who
13 was then the disclosures manager, was recommending that
14 Garda Keogh be restored to full pay, isn't that right?

11:16

15 A. Yes, correct.

11:16

16 85 Q. That was done, isn't that so?

17 A. That was done following an instruction from the
18 executive director and Chief Superintendent McLoughlin.

19 86 Q. If we could just perhaps return to a timeframe in 2015.
20 If we could have page 8815 up on the screen, please.
21 This is a letter that is addressed to the Overpayment
22 Department HRM. You would have been dealing with this
23 at the time. It's from Superintendent Pat Murray,
24 dated the 28th August.

11:16

25
26 "The above named, Garda Keogh, was absent without leave
27 from the 11th July 2015 to 14th July 2015 inclusive
28 (SAMS updated).
29

11:17

1 Please recoup any overpayment of wages from this
2 employee for the relevant dates."

3
4 Is there anything unusual about receiving a letter from
5 a superintendent in those circumstances? 11:17

6 A. No. There is, I suppose, a difficulty, it's one of the
7 processes that has to be addressed within our own
8 section, in terms of there was an instruction or there
9 was notification received to us into the sick leave
10 section that the member was absent without leave, i.e. 11:18
11 he was neither on annual leave, sick leave or any
12 planned leave. Strictly speaking, the money should
13 have been recouped, but it was not a process that was
14 available to us at the time. So the other side of that
15 coin is that we would always write back and say, has 11:18
16 this matter been addressed under the discipline
17 regulations, just to get a full picture of what has
18 happened.

19 87 Q. If we look at page 8817 of the material, this is your
20 reply, dated 15th September 2015. It sets out the 11:18
21 dates there in the second paragraph.

22
23 "I note the member's explanation for his absence over
24 this period of time and in this regard I am to enquire
25 as to the classification of the entire period of 11:19
26 absence. On receipt of the above clarification, the
27 appropriate instructions, where necessary, may be
28 issued to the Garda pay section, Killarney, and any
29 overpayment incurred will be advised to the HR for the

1 appropriate action."

2

3

Then, at page 8818, there is a response from Superintendent Murray to you, 21st September 2015. And he sets out the period of time where the overpayment arose, isn't that right?

11:19

6

7

A. Correct.

8

88 Q. Then you responded to that on 28th October 2015, at page 8825. The second paragraph, if we scroll down, please:

10

11:20

11

12

"I am to enquire whether you have informed the member:

13

1. That he is deemed by to you be absent without for the period;

14

15

2. That you have requested that the member shall not be paid for the above period of absence;

11:20

16

17

3. That the member's service for the above period will not be reckoned for superannuation purposes and his personnel record will reflect same;

18

19

20

4. Under which Garda Code provisions the above actions are being carried out."

11:20

21

22

23

Then you say:

24

25

"I am to enquire also if consideration has been given to having this matter dealt with under An Garda Síochána discipline regulations."

11:20

26

27

28

29

why do you enquire in relation to that ?

1 A. Just to have the full picture, to be honest. In terms
2 of if the member is being disciplined, that it should
3 be recorded on his record. And at that time, where
4 members were being disciplined and we didn't have the
5 facility of then taking them off pay for the same 11:21
6 period.

7 89 Q. CHAIRMAN: So if he was being disciplined, he wouldn't
8 have his pay recouped?

9 A. Well, we would have to wait, that was the purpose of
10 this letter, to find out, to have the full picture and 11:21
11 to see what actually transpired.

12 90 Q. CHAIRMAN: I thought that's what you just said, I'm
13 obviously mistaken, that if he was being disciplined,
14 then he wouldn't have his pay reduced?

15 A. Well, that's correct, at that time. 11:21

16 91 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. So if he was being disciplined, that
17 was the end of the matter?

18 A. Basically, yes.

19 MR. MARRINAN: So if we could be clear in relation --

20 92 Q. CHAIRMAN: Strictly speaking, if somebody didn't show 11:22
21 up for work for no good reason, strictly speaking he
22 shouldn't get paid.

23 A. Correct.

24 93 Q. CHAIRMAN: It may also be a disciplinary matter?

25 A. Correct. 11:22

26 94 Q. CHAIRMAN: So, strictly speaking, at least in theory,
27 the person could have reduced pay plus a disciplinary
28 process?

29 A. Correct.

1 95 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is that right?
2 A. That is correct.
3 96 Q. CHAIRMAN: But in the circumstances that obtained at
4 the time that would not happen?
5 A. No. 11:22
6 97 Q. CHAIRMAN: If there was discipline, whatever it did, it
7 put an end to the recoupment of the pay?
8 A. Yeah. We had made enquiries at the time and we were
9 told that was --
10 CHAIRMAN: That's okay. I am understanding. 11:22
11 98 Q. MR. MARRINAN: You're highlighting this in your second
12 last sentence of your letter there as perhaps --
13 A. It wouldn't be an unusual process where members were
14 disciplined for noncompliance, well, for non-attendance
15 at work without -- being absent without leave, I think 11:23
16 is the term.
17 99 Q. Yes.
18 A. That would be not unusual. And also where there is
19 noncompliance with the sick leave regulations, so if I
20 am saying that I am out sick but I don't provide the 11:23
21 documentary evidence from the GP, that's another issue
22 that can be dealt with under the discipline
23 regulations, noncompliance.
24 100 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you just inferred in those circumstances
25 that it was dealt with under the discipline 11:23
26 regulations?
27 A. At that time, yes.
28 CHAIRMAN: Yes.
29 101 Q. MR. MARRINAN: How generally known was that? I mean,

1 would Superintendent Murray have known?

2 A. No, I don't expect he would as such, because he would
3 have expected notifying us that we had a procedure and
4 a policy around removing somebody from the payroll for
5 that AWOL experience or AWOL time. 11:23

6 102 Q. Yes.

7 A. But we didn't actually have a process at that time.

8 103 Q. So would Superintendent Murray have known or not that
9 there was this, as it were, lacuna in the system,
10 whereby where somebody was disciplined, that their pay 11:24
11 wouldn't then have been deducted?

12 A. I suppose I can't answer for him but I would expect he
13 didn't realise it, no.

14 104 Q. So it wasn't widely known?

15 A. No. 11:24

16 105 Q. Was it something that you had encountered frequently or
17 infrequently?

18 A. Infrequently, but we had encountered it prior to this.

19 106 Q. Then if we move on to page 8827, please. This is 22nd
20 October 2015 and it's from Superintendent Murray, 11:24
21 referring to your earlier correspondence. He says:

22

23 "I spoke to the member regarding his absence without
24 leave on 14th July 2015. I subsequently sought an
25 explanation from him, which was not satisfactory. I 11:25
26 reported the matter to the chief superintendent
27 Westmeath recommending disciplinary action. A
28 superintendent from outside the district was appointed
29 as deciding officer. That superintendent found Garda

1 Keogh in breach of discipline in relation to his
2 absence without leave between the various dates and the
3 member was fined €300.

4
5 The member is aware that I am of the view that he was 11:25
6 overpaid during the period in question and that any
7 overpayment in that regard is ancillary to the
8 disciplinary fine imposed. The member is also aware
9 that as a natural consequence of being absent without
10 leave, both service and superannuation provisions are 11:25
11 affected. I trust the above explanation satisfies your
12 queries at questions 1 to 3. I am not exactly sure of
13 the point you wish dealt with at question 4."

14
15 Then your reply to that is at page 8828 of the 11:26
16 material. You refer to his correspondence:

17
18 "Please be advised that I will progress this matter
19 with Internal Affairs, Garda Headquarters and will
20 revert to you thereafter." 11:26

21
22 Now, what had Internal Affairs got to do with it?

23 A. Well, Internal Affairs are responsible for all
24 disciplinary matters, so we would have clarified with
25 them whether or not we could recoup the money. 11:26

26 107 Q. Can you assist us as to whether or not Garda Keogh's
27 pay was in fact deducted for that period of time?

28 A. No, it wasn't.

29 CHAIRMAN: No.

1 108 Q. MR. MARRINAN: It wasn't. Now, you then provided a
2 supplemental statement to the Tribunal, which is dated
3 the 17th October of last year and it's at page 14866 of
4 the material, please. This concerns effectively a
5 discussion in relation to what does or does not arise 11:27
6 in work related stress situations and also with people
7 who have made protected disclosures. In some instances
8 it's not case specific to Garda Keogh, isn't that
9 right?

10 A. That's correct. 11:28

11 109 Q. Perhaps if we can just first of all look at a document
12 that is case specific to Garda Keogh. This is at page
13 14870 of the material. If we just scroll down. The
14 initial e-mail is from Chief Superintendent Tony
15 McLoughlin and it's to the chief superintendent. He 11:28
16 says:

17
18 "Garda Keogh reports sick with work related stress.
19 Can you confirm if an investigation was carried out in
20 accordance with the regulations into the work related 11:29
21 stress and the outcome of it."
22

23 Now, I think that this was then highlighted to you,
24 isn't that right, because you were cc'd it?

25 A. Mm-hmm. 11:29

26 110 Q. Then, just scroll up, we can see an e-mail from you to
27 Claire Egan, copying the e-mail from Chief
28 Superintendent McLoughlin to Chief Superintendent
29 wheatley.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

"Can you follow up on this, please?"

So this matter has arisen again, isn't that right?

A. Correct.

11:29

111 Q. If we could then move on to page 14876. This is the body of an e-mail, we will go back to the previous page in a moment, but it is dated the 26th September, at 9:50 in the morning. It's addressed to Claire Egan of your department and it's copied to a number of people, including yourself, isn't that right. The subject-matter is "sick pay". Chief Superintendent McLoughlin says:

11:30

"You will be aware from previous discussions that Garda Nicky Keogh is out of work on sick leave with what I understand to be stress related. I believe he is on reduced or no pay at this stage. I also understand your department has written to DEPERs."

11:30

I have already opened this.

11:30

"In the meantime I recommend that the member be restored to full pay."

11:31

And then if we just go back a page to 1487. This recommendation, was it unusual?

A. Yes.

112 Q. Had you come across it previously?

1 A. We had, yes.

2 113 Q. You had?

3 A. Yes.

4 114 Q. At that time?

5 A. Yeah. 11:31

6 115 Q. We see a --

7 A. This is September 2016, isn't it?

8 116 Q. Yes.

9 A. Yeah.

10 117 Q. And then if we look at the e-mail at page 14878, 11:31

11 please. If we scroll down. There is an e-mail from

12 Claire Egan to you on the 26th September. And then we

13 see:

14

15 "I note Tony is recommending he is restored to full pay 11:32

16 as soon as possible. Not instructing or directing.

17 The member is on a continuous period of sick leave

18 since 26th December 2015 and immediately went on to TRR

19 as his cumulated sick leave was such that he was only

20 eligible to receive TRR. Member currently sanctioned 11:32

21 for TRR up to 28th September 2016."

22

23 Then it says:

24

25 "Shall I revert to Tony enquiring as to the date he 11:32

26 should be restored to full pay from - to go back to

27 start of absence is almost nine months of full pay

28 amendment."

29

1 Then if we just scroll up on the page. This is an
2 e-mail from you on the same day:

3
4 "Claire, it might be worth asking Tony to confirm that
5 he is directing the member to be put on the payroll as 11:33
6 we are currently complying with the sick leave
7 regulations. You need a direction to go outside them."
8

9 And that was the position that you were adopting at
10 that stage, is that right? 11:33

11 A. That's correct, yes.

12 118 Q. If we then move on to page 14880 of the material. This
13 is correspondence, it's on the 6th October, an e-mail
14 on 6th October 2016, from Claire Egan of your
15 department to Chief Superintendent McLoughlin: 11:33

16
17 "With reference to yours below, I am now advised by the
18 Garda pay section of the PSSC that Garda Keogh has been
19 reinstated to full pay status backdated to the
20 commencement of his absence on 26th December 2015 and 11:34
21 that all arrears owing to him will be paid on Thursday,
22 13th October (this day week). I have been in contact
23 with Mick Quinn to advise him of same."
24

25 And I think that that brought that matter to conclusion 11:34
26 and I think Garda Keogh remains on full pay, is that
27 right?

28 A. Correct.

29 119 Q. If we could then move on to page 14884 of the material.

1 Now, I think this is a response by you, it's dated 7th
2 June 2016, to John Barrett, to Inspector Downey, to
3 Brian Broderick, Fiona Collins, and then it's copied to
4 a number of other people, isn't that right?

5 A. Correct.

11:35

6 120 Q. This is, I think, in response from superintendent
7 Margaret Nugent, a request to you that the matter be
8 reviewed and some process should be agreed in the
9 short-term to deal with sensitive cases on a
10 case-by-case basis, isn't that right? If we can just
11 look at your response then, it's to John Barrett, I
12 think, is that right:

11:36

13

14 "Good afternoon John."

15 A. Correct.

11:36

16 121 Q. And then there's a discussion there in the first
17 chapter, I will just read from it and then you can
18 expand on it in relation to your views in relation to
19 it.

20

11:36

21 "Further to Brian's e-mail, absences as a result of
22 work related stress was discussed through the working
23 groups deliberations on amending 11.37."

24

25 We heard about this working group, from Inspector
26 Downey, we heard about it from Inspector Downey
27 yesterday. Can you just tell us more in relation to
28 it?

11:36

29 A. A working group was set up under the chairmanship of

1 the previous Chief Medical Officer, Dr. Donal Collins.
2 On his retirement, it was handed to me. We were going
3 through the whole process of code 11.37, and the idea
4 is that An Garda Síochána has no occupational injury
5 scheme per se for Garda members, so for slips, trips 11:37
6 and falls, there isn't an actual particular scheme that
7 the rest of us within the public service, within the
8 civil service would be familiar with. We have an
9 occupational scheme.

10 122 Q. Yes. 11:37

11 A. With the introduction of the public service sick leave
12 regulations in 2014, it was felt that this is something
13 that needs to be addressed in respect of Garda members.
14 Because not all -- slips, trips and falls shouldn't be
15 properly categorised under code 11.37. 11.37 is where 11:37
16 you are injured in the course of executing your duty as
17 a Garda member. It's very specific and it's very
18 important that it is there available to Garda members
19 who are injured in the course of their duties. So
20 there is a requirement that we would look at our policy 11:37
21 around having an occupational injury scheme. So that
22 was the purpose of that working group. So there was
23 ongoing discussions to try and -- without making it too
24 prescriptive, but to ensure that this encapsulated all
25 the relevant absences that we could. 11:38

26 123 Q. There is a concentration here on work related stress?

27 A. Yes.

28 124 Q. Within is that scheme, is that right?

29 A. No. That is not quite true.

1 125 Q. Yes.

2 A. I suppose the purpose of the discussion around the work
3 related stress, I suppose what we would say is that
4 work related stress of itself is not an injury, it may
5 cause an injury, so therefore that would be part of the 11:38
6 CMO's consideration about whether or not -- if I am
7 reporting with work related stress and I develop an
8 illness or an injury subsequent to that, it will be the
9 Chief Medical Officer who will advise us as to whether
10 or not there is a causality or if there is a 11:38
11 relationship or if the injury or the illness that I
12 suffer is directly related to work related stress.

13 126 Q. We will just look at this paragraph. I will come back
14 to that.

15 A. Yes. 11:39

16 127 Q. You go on to say:
17
18 "I am of the opinion that all sick absences should be
19 categorised as ordinary illness pending completion of
20 whatever investigations are conducted." 11:39
21

22 Was that not the status quo? Was that not the position
23 in relation to the regulations as they then stood?

24 A. Yes. Illnesses are in the first instance recorded as
25 ordinary illness and subsequently, where members seek 11:39
26 to have certificate 11.37 issued, they may get
27 recategorised to injury on duty.

28 128 Q. You say:
29

1 "As I understand it GPs issue medical certs stating
2 that the member suffers from work related stress based
3 on the consultation between the GP and the patient.
4 Similarly, the CMO will only have the member's version
5 of events available to him when meeting the member. He 11:39
6 may also have a report from the member's treating GP
7 and/or specialist, but again these reports will be
8 subjective and give just the member's account or
9 version of events leading to their perception of work
10 related stress." 11:40

11
12 So you're pointing out what you regard as a deficiency
13 in the assessment of what is or is not work related
14 stress, is that right?

15 A. Well, the assessment of the work related stress would 11:40
16 include any investigation and that investigation, I
17 suppose, refers back to where somebody reports that
18 they are suffering with stress or work related stress,
19 that we would ask the line manager to do an
20 investigation into the cause of that stress. 11:40

21 129 Q. Yes. Well, in the first instance there's the issue of
22 whether or not somebody is suffering from stress, in
23 the first instance?

24 A. Yeah.

25 130 Q. Isn't that right? 11:41

26 A. Yes.

27 131 Q. And what you appear to be highlighting in that
28 paragraph is that the CMO is merely relying on a report
29 that he has received from the member's GP or

1 specialist, is that right?

2 A. That's right. I suppose I am stating that it's a
3 one-sided --

4 132 Q. Yes.

5 A. Yes. 11:41

6 133 Q. That is purely subjective, in the sense that it's the
7 complaint that is being made by the person to the GP.
8 But it also involves, I suppose, some sort of
9 professional assessment, whether or not the person is
10 suffering from stress? 11:41

11 A. And that is a medical issue to be determined by the
12 CMO.

13 134 Q. That's a medical issue, yes. Is that a function that
14 the CMO would undertake by reference to the
15 certificates or after consultation with the member's GP 11:41
16 or specialist?

17 A. Well, the CMO would be aware of the reasons for the
18 member's absence and the discussions that occur then,
19 and I suppose you're going to have to talk to the Chief
20 Medical Officer on this piece, discussions between 11:42
21 members and the CMO have the doctor patient
22 confidentiality and we don't have access to that. What
23 the CMO will do is, he will advise us on whether or not
24 the member is fit for duty and he will also, when we
25 ask, advise on whether or not the injury suffered by 11:42
26 the member is causally and directly related to the
27 injury reported.

28 135 Q. Yes. Now, that kicks into whether it is work related
29 stress or not?

1 A. Yes.

2 136 Q. It's just that paragraph is suggesting perhaps in your
3 view that they seemed to be rather one-sided in
4 relation to the assessment by CMO that there was
5 stress? 11:43

6 A. But there is only one side of the -- I suppose perhaps
7 what I was trying to say there, is that there is one
8 side of the story provided at that stage, where the
9 patient consults with their general practitioner and he
10 writes down that it is work related stress. The CMO 11:43
11 will have that report and whatever else the member
12 would be able to tell him. So, there needs for the
13 investigations done locally, if there is further
14 information to augment what is stated by the individual
15 or perhaps be able to challenge what is being said by 11:43
16 the individual.

17 137 Q. And that refers to the requests that we have seen
18 earlier on, for local management as to whether or not
19 they have assessed the --

20 A. Yeah. 11:43

21 138 Q. You then go on:
22
23 "However, not all work related stress absences can be
24 attributed to An Garda Síochána. A lot of the time it
25 is down to the individual's perception of events. 11:43
26 Take, for example, a case being investigated under the
27 bullying and harassment policy. As the person making a
28 complaint may be absent from work as a result of work
29 related stress, however the investigation when

1 completed may under the policy determine that the
2 person complained of has no case to answer. If An
3 Garda Síochána accepted from the outset that my work
4 related stress was an occupational injury, then the
5 organisation is leaving itself open to litigation into 11:44
6 the future for the personal injuries I may have
7 suffered. Following through on this theme, where the
8 person accused of bullying and harassment is absent on
9 work related stress, the issue arises as to how to
10 manage that absence - again if it is recorded as an 11:44
11 occupational injury we may expose An Garda Síochána to
12 personal injury claims from persons found to have
13 breached the bullying and harassment policy."

14
15 That was the view that you were expressing at that 11:45
16 time, is that right?

17 A. That's correct.

18 139 Q. And is it a view that you still hold?

19 A. It is.

20 140 Q. It is, yes. And then you go on to say: 11:45

21
22 "Similarly, from a sick leave perspective, we come
23 across members suffering from work related stress as a
24 result of a disciplinary investigation. Again, I would
25 urge caution accepting this absence as an occupational 11:45
26 injury, as we are exposing An Garda Síochána to
27 possible litigation in circumstances where a member's
28 own actions or indeed inaction has precipitated the
29 instigation of a disciplinary investigation."

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

And that is something that you highlighted at that time, isn't that right?

A. Correct.

141 Q. You then go on to say:

11:45

"It may be that it is necessary to look at absence as a result of work related stress where a member/staff have brought an issue under the protected disclosures legislation. This is more difficult due to the confidential nature of the disclosure. However, this difficulty is applicable across the whole of the public sector."

11:45

Then you ask:

11:46

"Has DEBERS a position on it?"

Then in the concluding paragraph you say:

11:46

"While it is not ideal to reduce a member's salary when they are absent on sick leave, An Garda Síochána should continue to implement the current sick leave regulations. Where sick absences following appropriate investigations are determined to be either an injury on duty or an occupational injury (once the amendment to code 11.37 has been approved) or indeed covered by the critical illness protocol, any monies due to the member will be refunded. This will also benefit An Garda

11:46

1 Síochána in the management of overpayment of salary to
2 members absent sick on leave. "

3

4 That was your stated position in relation to this.

5 A. Correct.

11:47

6 142 Q. would it be fair to say that you think that the system
7 that had you in operation at the time was the
8 appropriate system?

9 A. Yes.

10 143 Q. And the reason for that was the reasons that you have
11 thrown up in your discussion there about it. But in
12 essence you believe that there shouldn't be a
13 recategorisation until there has been an inquiry?

11:47

14 A. Correct. The sick leave regulations apply when you are
15 absent on sick leave and outside of that then, what
16 other policy should apply. So if you are looking for a
17 code 11.37 there has to be the relevant investigations
18 into it.

11:47

19 144 Q. Now, I suppose in some sense, if we can just look at --
20 yes, there were a number of contrary views and I don't
21 see necessarily that you were copied with them all.
22 But in the first instance, if we could look at page
23 14885 of the material. This is one that you were
24 copied. It's from Inspector Downey, it's dated 6th
25 June 2016. It's to you and to John Barrett and
26 Mr. Collins. Who is Mr. Collins?

11:49

27 A. Dr. Donal Collins, was the Chief Medical Officer at the
28 time.

29 145 Q. Sorry, yes. If we just scroll down there, yes. He

1 says:
2
3 "Having discussed this with Chief Superintendent
4 McLoughlin, there is an opportunity to categorise work
5 related stress under the proposed occupational injury 11:49
6 scheme. This will provide the medical staff time to
7 assess the causal nature of the work related stress
8 without the prospect of culling pay after three months
9 in line with the sickness absence regulations. By
10 categorising all work related stress as occupational 11:49
11 injury, the pay remains unaffected for six months
12 followed by half pay for six months and paid pension
13 rate after that. This will give the organisation
14 breathing space to ensure that a full inquiry into the
15 cause of the stress takes place." 11:50
16
17 So that is a contrary view to yours, isn't that right?
18 A. Correct.
19 146 Q. That's leaning in favour of automatically putting work
20 related stress into occupational injury so there is no 11:50
21 deduction in pay and then you have an inquiry, isn't
22 that right?
23 A. That's what is suggested there, yeah.
24 147 Q. What do you see that's wrong with that?
25 A. The public service sick leave regulations are very 11:50
26 clear. We cannot -- I suppose at the end of the day we
27 are dealing with public funds and public monies. We
28 have to be careful on how that is applied. Work
29 related stress in and of itself I understand is not an

1 illness. As I said, it may cause an illness and the
2 Chief Medical Officer will probably advise better than
3 I. But we cannot -- I suppose I felt we were looking
4 at this from the wrong angle. We were looking at this
5 as a means of ensuring someone stays on the payroll, 11:51
6 when in actual fact we have regulations, sick leave
7 regulations that apply and I didn't feel this was in
8 supported of that.

9 148 Q. This debate is ongoing still, is that right?
10 A. Well, not really, I suppose, other than the sick leave 11:51
11 regulations apply. Where somebody is out on sick
12 leave, we have decided where somebody is out on sick
13 leave the sick leave regulations apply.

14 149 Q. CHAIRMAN: The situation remains as stated?
15 A. Yes. 11:52

16 150 Q. CHAIRMAN: Notwithstanding the fact that as a result of
17 Chief Superintendent McLoughlin's intervention, Garda
18 Keogh is on, so to speak, a special regime?
19 A. Yes. And I understand that that was done in
20 conjunction with the executive director. 11:52

21 151 Q. CHAIRMAN: Absolutely.
22 A. Yeah.

23 152 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, no, no, and there is no suggestion there
24 is anything wrong. He is in a particular situation,
25 but the overall regime remains the same? 11:52
26 A. Yeah.

27 153 Q. CHAIRMAN: Although there is some debate about changing
28 it, or there has been some discussion?
29 A. The debate ongoing is in relation to the code 11.37.

1 154 Q. CHAIRMAN: Indeed.

2 A. It's that specific piece that we are still working on
3 it and developing it.

4 155 Q. CHAIRMAN: And we heard from Inspector Downey about it.
5 Okay. 11:53

6 A. Yeah.

7 156 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Then if we could on. Is there anything
8 else that you would like to say in relation to that
9 aspect of it? Your views are expressed, we can see the
10 e-mails back and forth. 11:53

11 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

12 MR. MARRINAN: We can see the contrary view?

13 CHAIRMAN: That sets out the position.

14 157 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Yes, and it sets out your position.
15 Then if we could go on and deal in particular with 11:53
16 absences from work due to having made a protected
17 disclosure. If we could look at page 14889. Again,
18 this is, as it were, a similar debate that arose in
19 relation to protected disclosures and the impact that
20 somebody -- 11:53

21 A. Yeah, this part of the ongoing debate that was ongoing
22 and saying that we really should have something for
23 persons who make protected disclosures. And this was
24 coming, I suppose, from the managers on the protected
25 disclosures side as opposed to those of us on the sick 11:54
26 leave side. So we had drafted that, I suppose,
27 document, but I mean it's very much a draft.

28 158 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

29 A. You know, there's a lot of consideration that needs to

1 be done, there's a lot of legal considerations on it.
2 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

3 159 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Yes. This is the 10th June, it's from
4 Claire Egan. It was sent to you and you had requested
5 her to put this together and that this was to become 11:54
6 part of your submission, as it were, in relation to
7 management of absences from work due to protected
8 disclosures, is that right?

9 A. Well, we had been asked for an opinion on it. I
10 suppose I've clearly voiced my opinion on it, that if 11:54
11 you are out on sick leave -- but if somebody was to be
12 facilitated where they made a protected disclosure,
13 with not returning to work with a form of
14 administrative leave, then we needed to have, I suppose
15 that would be, for want of a better word, a discussion 11:55
16 document around how that might happen.

17 160 Q. CHAIRMAN: There needs to be a regime of regulation
18 about how that's going to work?

19 A. Yeah, if you are bringing it in, we'd need a policy.

20 161 Q. MR. MARRINAN: And we can see there the number of the 11:55
21 bullet points are --

22 CHAIRMAN: Are we concerned with that much,
23 Mr. Marrinan? Does it matter?

24 MR. MARRINAN: No, I am not going to go through it,
25 Chairman. 11:55
26 CHAIRMAN: That's all right.

27 162 Q. MR. MARRINAN: But we can see the bullet points there.
28 I suppose fundamentally the last -- at 14890, one of
29 the considerations that you have there is that:

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

"Not all work related stress absences can be attributed to An Garda Síochána or the actions taken by the organisation in carrying out its functions, and indeed some instances may be attributable to the actions of the employees themselves. The acceptance of responsibility from the outset by granting access to paid administrative leave in the absence of evidence from a concluded investigation may expose the organisation to additional claims, e.g. personal injury, and may also serve to encourage disclosures on a more widespread scale."

So again, this came from a proposal that was being put forward that somebody who had made a protected disclosure would go on administrative leave, effectively, isn't that right?

A. Well --

CHAIRMAN: No, sorry, the person might feel that having made a protected disclosure it was unsuitable for them to continue at work and in those circumstances --

MR. MARRINAN: Yes.

163 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- what should happen. So you're discussing it.

A. It is really -- I suppose the best way to say it, it's a discussion document around a time when there was concern that we didn't have a policy. I suppose there's no policy to permit persons or to support persons who make a protected disclosure and then are

1 availing of sick leave and the sick leave regulation
2 apply to sick leave. So if we wanted to go outside of
3 that, there really should be a policy, a clear and
4 unambiguous policy that sets out --

5 164 Q. CHAIRMAN: For PD people? 11:57

6 A. Yes, what would apply in those circumstances. I
7 suppose the best you could say about this document is
8 it's a discussion document.

9 CHAIRMAN: Yes, I understand.

10 165 Q. MR. MARRINAN: If I can very briefly just complete the 11:57
11 circle in relation to it, just for the sake of
12 completeness?

13 CHAIRMAN: But it doesn't affect Garda Keogh, that's
14 the big point.

15 A. No. 11:57

16 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thanks, Mr. Marrinan.

17 166 Q. MR. MARRINAN: At page 14911, this is from
18 superintendent Nugent, it says:

19
20 "I have read the attached and it is a very good 11:58
21 document, my only concern relates to having to consult
22 with local management regarding the pay."

23
24 14911. scroll down. 14911. Thank you, Mr. Kavanagh.
25 This is an e-mail to you from Superintendent Margaret 11:58
26 Nugent. It says:

27
28 "I have read the attached."

29

1 That is a reference to the document that I just
2 referred to.

3
4 "It is a very good document, my only concern relates to
5 having to consult with local management regarding the 11:59
6 pay, that may pose problems, particularly where
7 legality practices may be the source of the complaint
8 relevant to the disclosure. Furthermore, the
9 disclosure has to be kept confidential. Can an
10 arrangement be made whereby pay issues are sorted out 11:59
11 in Navan, including administrative leave, based on a
12 communication with the protected disclosure manager?"

13
14 Then if we go on to page 15912, she had a further
15 observation. 11:59

16
17 "One query, it takes a very long time to have someone
18 put back on the payroll, as in this case, 24th June
19 2016, which impacts very significantly on people. Can
20 we arrange a human solution in the interim whereby 11:59
21 there is a manual process put in place to ensure there
22 is a work around (e.g. the issuing of a cheque) while
23 waiting for the automated solution to kick in."

24
25 So those were the issues. The debate was there. And 12:00
26 that's where matters stand. would you answer any
27 questions, please.

28 A. Yes.

29

1 END OF EXAMINATION

2
3 MS. MONICA CARR WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN, AS
4 FOLLOWS:

- 5
6 167 Q. MS. MULLIGAN: Good morning, Ms. Carr, I have a very 12:00
7 little for you. Just a couple of practical questions.
8 So in terms of HR, how many staff, I suppose, do you
9 have that are going through your HR --
- 10 A. Well, the HR directorate is what you are talking about 12:00
11 specifically, are you talking about specifically people
12 dealing with pay, there would have been I think four to
13 six people dealing with the pay issue.
- 14 168 Q. No, sorry, my apologies. The opposite question. So 12:00
15 how many people are in An Garda Síochána who are run
16 through your system?
- 17 A. Oh. well --
- 18 169 Q. Is it thousands, is it or more?
- 19 A. So we would have over 13,000 Garda members and we have
20 almost 3,000 Garda staff. That's today's figures. 12:01
- 21 170 Q. Give or take?
- 22 A. About 13,000.
- 23 171 Q. So is it fair to say then you run a systems and
24 procedural process to manage HR?
- 25 A. Yes. It's the transactional element of HR. 12:01
- 26 172 Q. So the individual one-on-one piece is done by local
27 management, is that fair?
- 28 A. Yes, that would be correct.
- 29 173 Q. So you manage this, again the recording, and again

1 making sure the regulation of the processes and the
2 procedures are managed, is that right?

3 A. That would be correct, and we would send out the
4 communications to the local management through the
5 divisional officer, through the chief superintendent's 12:01
6 office for all the members within that division. I
7 suppose we would require that they would deal directly
8 with the individual. From 139/2010 they're obligated,
9 or we're obligated to keep in contact with staff when
10 they are absent on sick leave and we would devolve that 12:02
11 function to the divisional officer or to the
12 superintendent to ensure members are kept -- or there
13 is contact with members at all times. All of that goes
14 down there.

15 174 Q. Just for those of us who wouldn't have the same 12:02
16 expertise as you do, is it fair to say you're
17 governance and they're the people on the first -- local
18 management are the first line of enquiry for the member
19 if they have questions around HR?

20 A. Yes, but we also are available to members to contact us 12:02
21 directly.

22 175 Q. Yes.

23 A. So if they have any queries or questions, we would take
24 them at all times.

25 176 Q. Which would be more common; for someone to go to -- for 12:02
26 a guard to go to their sergeant or for them to go
27 directly to HR?

28 A. They do both.

29 177 Q. They do both, okay.

1 A. It would depend on the individual themselves. We have
2 regular contact with Garda members and Garda staff.

3 178 Q. Okay. And again, you said that you had about six
4 members of staff who deal with that; is that right?

5 A. Well, dealing with that specific piece of Garda sick 12:02
6 leave, Garda pay.

7 179 Q. Okay, perfect. Just in terms of what happened in this
8 case, and just correct me if you can't answer a
9 question, most of the documentation seems to have gone
10 to Mr. Mulligan, is that right, Alan Mulligan? 12:03

11 A. So Alan would have been the director of the HR -- would
12 have been the director over the HR directorate prior to
13 me taking responsibility for it as acting principal and
14 principal officer.

15 180 Q. Okay. 12:03

16 A. From 2015.

17 181 Q. So my questions are quite general in nature, if you
18 can't answer question, that's fine, just let me know.
19 Can I just clarify in terms of I suppose individual
20 profile on an individual guard. I presume there is a 12:03
21 file, is that right, on each individual guard?

22 A. Well, there is actually a number of files. So within
23 the sick leave section there would be his sick leave
24 record.

25 182 Q. Yes. 12:03

26 A. His/hers. There is a file in record section which
27 would be their HR file, I suppose, for want of a better
28 word, from when they attested. It's not a huge file.
29 It is literally maybe where they move from different

1 sections and some information --

2 183 Q. A transfer, for example, that would be on the HR file?

3 A. That would be an entry on it. It would also have

4 commendations and records of personal births of

5 children, marriages and stuff like that. 12:04

6 184 Q. Anything that might relate to pensions and that kind of

7 things that might happen?

8 A. It wouldn't be the pension file per se -- well, I

9 suppose it becomes the pension file at the end but then

10 all files would be collated together. There would 12:04

11 discipline files. There would be various different

12 files in various sections in respect of members.

13 185 Q. So is it fair to say that file doesn't identify that

14 someone is a whistleblower?

15 A. Oh gosh, no. No, no. There would be no record on a 12:04

16 file within the directorate in that regard and the

17 directorate would have responsibility for records, but

18 the protected disclosure piece, there's protected

19 disclosure managers, they're not situated in the

20 directorate, so we wouldn't have any -- 12:05

21 186 Q. When Mr. Mulligan is writing down to the chief

22 superintendent, any chain of processing, if he knows

23 that Garda Keogh is a whistleblower it's not through a

24 systems process, it's not -- there's no way of

25 identifying that individual, is that fair? 12:05

26 A. No.

27 187 Q. No.

28 A. Not from, we'll say, correspondence emanating from the

29 HR directorate. But Mr. Mulligan, Alan was the -- is

1 one of the confidential recipients, so he might have
2 communications under another fora, but not anything to
3 do with the HR directorate. Nothing under cover of his
4 signature from the HR directorate.

5 188 Q. Okay. So, we're not entirely clear if he was aware. 12:05
6 But as a general rule people wouldn't be aware.
7 Mr. Mulligan may have in his own particular
8 circumstances have been aware, would that be fair?

9 A. I will leave that for him to answer, but from the
10 directorate point of view there would be no records 12:05
11 within the directorate.

12 189 Q. Very well, that's fine. So can I just ask you in terms
13 of there is a process for off sick reports that go up
14 through Mr. Mulligan between the 2nd April and the 22nd
15 May. They have been opened extensively to everyone? 12:06

16 A. Yeah.

17 190 Q. So I will try and keep my questions general. If you
18 need to look at a document, that is fine. And what
19 seems to have occurred is an initial report goes up to
20 Mr. Mulligan in around the 7th April and it comes back 12:06
21 identifying, yes, I will now need a full investigation
22 to occur because the member is citing work related
23 stress. Do you recall seeing that document?

24 A. I do.

25 191 Q. Yes. And then a report comes back in or around the 12:06
26 22nd May, essentially identifying that no work related
27 stress investigation is going to occur in this
28 scenario. In those circumstances, I think you gave
29 evidence that generally that wouldn't be an unusual

1 situation. As in, in other scenarios that's something
2 that does occur?

3 A. Yes. I don't want to use the word uncooperate, but we
4 would ask the local manager, and when I say we, having
5 the same position as Alan had at that time. 12:07

6 192 Q. Yes.

7 A. From Navan we would ask the local chief superintendent,
8 the local managers to do that investigation and that
9 investigation is not prescriptive, it doesn't mean that
10 we would interrogate an individual. The idea behind it 12:07
11 is that the local manager would know their staff or
12 know of them or would know their line managers and they
13 would sit with the member and find and establish the
14 source or the cause of that. I suppose in this
15 particular instance that had already been advised to us 12:07
16 in advance. That letter sent out seeking to have an
17 investigated is an standard letter that goes out in all
18 cases. Once we see stress or work related stress, that
19 letter issues.

20 193 Q. So again, just so I am clear, from Mr. Mulligan's point 12:08
21 of view, he wouldn't look beyond the -- once he sends
22 the proforma letter in May, seeking the document and it
23 comes back from the chief superintendent, he doesn't
24 look beyond what is on the page, he accepts the bona
25 fides of it from local management, would that be fair? 12:08

26 A. That would be fair. And I suppose just the other piece
27 on that is, this correspondence goes out under cover,
28 went out under cover of Alan's signature or would go
29 out under cover of my signature, it doesn't actually

1 mean that we have seen the correspondence per se.

2 194 Q. Yes.

3 A. But the process is.

4 195 Q. Exactly. So he is responsible for the process as
5 oppose to necessarily the content, is that fair? 12:08

6 A. Yeah, but we would be aware of it.

7 196 Q. Yes, and obviously there is oversight and that kind of
8 thing?

9 A. Yeah.

10 197 Q. But in terms of the bona fides of any investigation or 12:08
11 anything that it contained, is really a matter for the
12 superintendent and the chief superintendent in local
13 management generally, you don't look beyond it?

14 A. No.

15 198 Q. No. 12:08

16 A. We would provide that information then to the Chief
17 Medical Officer.

18 199 Q. I have just one other question. Just because I
19 don't -- Ms. Egan isn't on the list of witnesses and I
20 anticipate you will be able to answer the question, so 12:09
21 if you bear with me. If we can go to page 3254,
22 Mr. Kavanagh. And it is an e-mail from Claire Egan to
23 HR. I just want to ask at the end, just on the second
24 page.

25 12:09

26 "This branch is not in receipt or aware of any
27 application for this sickness absence to be treated as
28 anything other than ordinary illness as recorded and
29 accordingly under the provisions of the public sick

1 regulations the member accumulated sick leave in the
2 usual way."

3
4 Do you see that, at the end of the page? Just the
5 second half of that page? 12:10

6
7 "This branch is not in receipt of nor aware..."

8

9 A. Sorry.

10 200 Q. Yes, sorry. I will give you a moment to read that? 12:10

11 A. Yeah.

12 201 Q. Can I just ask you very briefly, in terms of this
13 question of an application, is there such an
14 application or is that just a turn of phrase, I just
15 wanted to be clear about that? 12:10

16 A. Under code 11.37 there is no actual -- it's not
17 prescribed as to who should make the application. But
18 I suppose it's my experience that the chief
19 superintendent is required to issue a code and it's my
20 understanding and my experience that the member would 12:10
21 liaise with the chief superintendent in getting that
22 code issued. I suppose in fairness, the local
23 management were writing up to us in relation to this
24 particular case, but as Claire has stated there, there
25 isn't actually -- when you go through everything, there 12:11
26 isn't actually an application for that code 11.37.

27 202 Q. I just wanted to clarify that in terms of how that
28 worked. Thank you very much. I have nothing further.
29 Oh sorry, I do have one further thing, my apologies.

1 Just in relation to the AWOL aspect, so the member
2 having been disciplined, if you had have been aware
3 that a member had been disciplined, am I correct in
4 saying that your understanding is that you wouldn't
5 then at the time have sought to recoup monies, is that 12:11
6 right?

7 A. Well, at the time we made enquiries about recouping
8 monies, because I would see there's two separate issues
9 in relation to that, there's one, the AWOL piece, and
10 there's also the discipline piece, which would be two 12:11
11 separate issues. But from my recollection at the time
12 we were advised against recouping the money for the
13 AWOL piece. There was a fine imposed on the discipline
14 side and that money, as I understand, would have been
15 recouped. 12:12

16 203 Q. Just on the facts of this case, the fine imposed took
17 into account the wages aspect, would that have
18 solidified your position?

19 A. No, that had nothing to do with my position.

20 204 Q. Very good. No further questions. 12:12

21
22 END OF EXAMINATION

23
24 CHAIRMAN: Very good. Anybody else? Yes,
25 Mr. McGuinness. 12:12

26 MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS: Thank you, Chairman.

27 CHAIRMAN: While we're here, I see the Chief Medical
28 Officer here and I know that he has a commitment, isn't
29 that right, Mr. McGuinness. So we won't take you up

1 before 2:30 or as soon as you can get back, we
2 understand. So be at ease, don't be under too much
3 pressure, and we will take your evidence at 2:30 and if
4 possible we will proceed to try to finish you this
5 afternoon. If that is convenient all round.

12:12

6 MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.

7 CHAIRMAN: Is that right.

8 MR. MURPHY: Chairman, just in terms of the timeline, I
9 understand that if you could give us latitude to three
10 o'clock, it may be necessary.

12:13

11 CHAIRMAN: So be it.

12 MR. MURPHY: Thank you.

13 CHAIRMAN: I was assuming that 2:30 might be a little
14 optimistic. We will resume then at three o'clock.
15 Sorry that you are being sort of inconvenienced, having
16 to hang around, I know you have been here on other days
17 as well. Yeah, we will take it up at three o'clock.
18 We will certainly see how far we will get and we will
19 endeavour to finish the evidence this afternoon.

12:13

20 MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.

12:13

21 CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Okay. Yes,
22 Mr. McGuinness.

23
24 MS. MONICA CARR WAS EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS,
25 AS FOLLOWS:

12:13

26
27 205 Q. MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS: Ms. Carr, just briefly your
28 experience in relation to HR in the public service, if
29 you can just tell the Chairman what your experience is

1 in that regard, please?

2 A. Well, I am a career civil servant with 34 years service
3 across a number of departments. I worked in the
4 Department of Defence, Revenue Commissioners,
5 Department of Education, Department of Justice and now 12:14
6 An Garda Síochána. I have been through all the grades
7 from clerical officer through to principal officer. I
8 am currently working in the HR in An Garda Síochána
9 since August 2010.

10 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you very much. 12:14

11 206 Q. MR. DONAL McGUINESS: And that career extends from
12 1986 until now and you are a principal officer at the
13 moment?

14 A. Correct.

15 207 Q. Could I just ask briefly to refer to document 6189? 12:14
16 This is the circular by AC Fanning of the 29th May '14,
17 immediately after the regulations came in to effect,
18 the sick leave regulations came into effect. It
19 refers, paragraph 1 there, that the regulations came
20 into effect on 31st March 2014. Do you agree with 12:14
21 that?

22 A. Correct.

23 208 Q. If I just take up a point that the Chairman mentioned
24 earlier in relation to exactly when Garda Keogh's sick
25 leave exceeded the 183 days, if we could ask for 12:15
26 document 9331, please. This is a fax message to Sick
27 Section, is that to your section?

28 A. Yeah.

29 209 Q. There's a note there of 1st April 2015:

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

"Please see attached SR1 for Garda Nicholas Keogh, who has exceeded his 183 sick days."

Is that the first to your knowledge notification of a rolling period? 12:15

A. I actually can't say. Because it's a rolling four year period, you actually can, you know, today be outside of the sick leave limits and two weeks later be back within the sick leave limits. 12:15

210 Q. I understand.

A. So it is actually calculated on each day of the absence.

211 Q. CHAIRMAN: So any particular day --

A. Yeah. 12:15

212 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- you could be in and it doesn't follow that two weeks later or a month later it would also be in, you could have --

A. You could be out and two or three months later you could be in. 12:16

213 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

A. With the passage of time you come back into it.

CHAIRMAN: Of course. I see the point, yes, thank you.

214 Q. MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS: I understand the sickness regime that came in on 31st March '14 was 92 days sick leave full pay, 91 day sick leave on half pay, isn't that correct? 12:16

A. Correct.

215 Q. And after that, once you reach the 183 days you go onto

1 the temporary rehabilitation remuneration?

2 A. Provided there is a reasonable probability of you
3 returning to work.

4 216 Q. Yes. And I take it that is not a penalisation in any
5 way? 12:16

6 A. No.

7 217 Q. That's an accommodation as such?

8 A. It is an accommodation. I suppose under this
9 regulation there is probably what you could say four
10 years of support under the sick leave regulations, a 12:16
11 maximum of four years.

12 218 Q. Yes. Just in terms of the reduction in pay or an
13 approximation of the pay, is it tied into the pension
14 entitlement if you are pensioned off sick at that time,
15 in terms of the amounts that you receive? 12:17

16 A. Okay. So your full pay, half pay is straightforward.
17 Your Temporary Rehabilitation Remuneration pay and this
18 is probably going to -- as it stands at the moment, is
19 basically what you would receive if you were retired in
20 the morning. 12:17

21 219 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

22 A. There's also the benefit of the -- if you are ill
23 health retired within the public service, you get added
24 years. So if you are on Temporary Rehabilitation
25 Remuneration pay, you also get the benefit of those 12:17
26 added years. So your remuneration takes account of
27 that.

28 220 Q. CHAIRMAN: But that period that you are on TRR doesn't
29 count for your pension?

1 A. Yes.

2 221 Q. CHAIRMAN: Assuming you come back to work.

3 A. Correct.

4 222 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.

5 A. All periods of Temporary Rehabilitation Remuneration 12:17
6 are non-reckonable for pension purposes.

7 223 Q. MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS: And in order to get TRR, I
8 assume you would have to keep submitting sick
9 certificates; isn't that correct?

10 A. You would have to continue submitting your sick 12:17
11 certificates and would you have to engage with the
12 Chief Medical Officer as appropriate.

13 224 Q. And if you didn't produce those certificates and didn't
14 engage with the CMO, what would the consequence be?

15 A. If you do not engage with the process, you would be at 12:18
16 risk of being disciplined for noncompliance with the
17 sick leave regulations.

18 225 Q. Now, just in relation to your chronology, Mr. Marrinan
19 went through quite a few of the documents there and I
20 will try and not trespass on the ground that he went 12:18
21 over, but if I could just ask for page 2191, please,
22 Volume 8. This is from Superintendent Pat Murray, it's
23 dated 2nd April 2015, it's to the chief superintendent
24 Westmeath. Just before we go there, if you go to the
25 second page, please, and it's: 12:19
26
27 "The member has a total of 184 sick days in the past
28 four years."
29

1 If you recall the facts that I just brought up in
2 relation to 183 days, was dated 1st April.

3
4 "48 of those occurred since January 2014, with 52%
5 occurring on early tours. The member has availed of 34 12:19
6 days annual leave from 1st March 2014 to 31st March
7 2015.

8
9 I believe both the member and the organisation would
10 benefit by referring him to the Occupational Health 12:19
11 Service at this time."

12
13 Now, if I could ask Mr. Kavanagh to go back to the
14 first page of that document, please. And the relevance
15 here is, if I can ask you to note the second paragraph: 12:19

16
17 "While Garda Keogh was reticent to discuss any issues
18 he may wish with me, I nonetheless felt it prudent to put an
19 arrangement in place in Athlone to support him in the
20 work environment as he is indicating work related 12:20
21 stress as the source of his absences. With that in
22 mind, I have allocated a female sergeant who is new to
23 the district to act as a district point of contact for
24 the member to discuss."

25
26 Now, the important line there that I want to draw your
27 attention to is:

28
29 "He is indicating work related stress as the source of

1 his absences."

2

3 Do you see that?

4 A. Yeah.

5 226 Q. And although you don't have the complaint from 12:20
6 Mr. Keogh before you, if we could call up page 136.
7 136, sorry, Mr. Kavanagh. And scroll down to number
8 15, and about two-thirds of the way down:

9

10 "At no time did work related stress appear to have been 12:21
11 the subject-matter of this case conference about my
12 sickness records of this case conference should be
13 obtained. The police appear to wish to deny knowledge
14 of my work related stress while on the other hand
15 dealing punitively with my condition in terms of 12:21
16 reduction of pay, monitoring, disciplining etcetera."

17

18 Now, in the context of the allegation, so to speak,
19 Superintendent Murray arrives in Athlone in March 2015
20 and almost one of his very first communications to the 12:21
21 chief superintendent is indicating that Garda Keogh is
22 indicating work related stress as a source of his
23 absence, is that correct?

24 A. Yes.

25 227 Q. The matter progresses then to the document Mr. Marrinan 12:21
26 opened, which is page 9048. Is that 9048? Sorry,
27 9408, please. Here again we have Pat Murray and he is
28 in direct contact with you. He is indicating:

29

1 "The member reported sick and unfit for duty on the
2 12th April and remains on sick. I have no indication
3 as to when he will return and I have been unable to
4 contact him by phone. I have asked the superintendent
5 in the area where he lives to him a copy of the
6 correspondence. I can only ask the member be seen by
7 the Chief Medical Officer as soon as possible."

12:23

8
9 Then Mr. Marrinan has gone through other documents
10 which confirm the chronology after that. The question
11 is: Insofar as the obligations on local management are
12 concerned in relation to the issue of work related
13 stress, have you a view as to the adequacy or otherwise
14 of those initial steps that were taken at that time?

12:23

15 A. Well, clearly Superintendent Murray notified us that
16 the member was suffering with work related stress. I
17 understand the categorisation of an illness is uploaded
18 or is entered locally in the district or the division
19 and the default, I suppose, on the SAMS system, which
20 is a very basic recording system, it's not actually
21 like part of a HRIS, it is an actual recording system
22 for sick absences, and the default on that is that it
23 defaults in "flu/viral", so quite a lot of the time we
24 would find that, you know -- and sometimes it belies
25 the fact that somebody has been quite unwell, it's
26 coming up as "flu/viral". In this instance, in
27 fairness to the superintendent, when he notified us he
28 wanted to support and get help from the CMO for the
29 member, he did indicate in his correspondence that it

12:23

12:24

12:24

1 work related stress and that would have gone over to
2 the Chief Medical Officer, that correspondence.

3 228 Q. I see. Now, just in relation to the membership in
4 relation to occupational injury, or sorry injury on
5 duty, in your experience, to what extent do the members 12:24
6 concerned actively get involved in ensuring that the
7 classification of their injury, we will just leave it
8 at physical injuries for now, is associated with their
9 job?

10 A. In terms of code 11.37s, we would generally receive 12:25
11 them from the divisional office, from the divisional
12 officer, from the chief superintendent and that
13 happens, I suppose you could say, seamlessly in a lot
14 of the cases. But there is -- where the chief
15 superintendent might ask for advices from HRM or 12:25
16 advices from the Chief Medical Officer, we would get
17 correspondence on that and we would work around that.
18 Then there are cases where a chief may decide that
19 they're not in a position to issue a code 11.37 and
20 there can be discussions ongoing between the member and 12:25
21 the superintendent and the chief and stuff like that
22 and then they make enquiries with our office and they
23 can be kind of protracted, ongoing.

24
25 It isn't actually provided within code 11.37, but 12:26
26 should a member wish to appeal the non-issue of a code
27 11.37, we will accept the appeal into the directorate
28 and it will be considered and all circumstances will be
29 considered in that and a recommendation made. So we

1 would have -- in general, you would say that they would
2 go ahead without too much interference, but, as I say,
3 the chief might look for information and advice from
4 the CMO about causality, about whether or not the
5 injury arises can be directly related to the incident 12:26
6 as reported, and we would facilitate that and those
7 discussions. And then there are times when the member
8 themselves would be in contact with our office trying
9 to progress their position.

10 229 Q. I would imagine because the matter relates to pay, the 12:26
11 members would be quite enthusiastic about ensuring that
12 the issue is dealt with as expeditiously as possible,
13 ordinarily.

14 A. I suppose in fairness to them, yes, and we would try to
15 assist where we can. 12:27

16 230 Q. But when there is a dispute in relation to the issue of
17 the 11.37 between the management and the member,
18 presumably the CMO's position is going to be very
19 critical in resolution of that issue?

20 A. Well, yes. It depends on what the dispute centres 12:27
21 around, because there is an element under code 11.37
22 where the chief superintendent has to certify that
23 there is no willful default or negligence on behalf of
24 the member, so there is that element to it. And then
25 when it comes to causality and whether or not the 12:27
26 injury arising can be associated with the incidents,
27 then that's where the advices of the CMO and he may
28 seek independent medical specialists as well to assist
29 in that determination.

1 231 Q. Yes. In relation to causality, work related stress is
2 something probably a lot of people suffer from. For
3 example, today you're working, you might be under some
4 stress, would you agree with that?
5 A. I would. 12:28
6 232 Q. But whether you actually suffer an injury or not as a
7 result of that stress is really the crux?
8 A. And as I say, the CMO would be able to explain that
9 better, but that would be my understanding of the it,
10 that work related stress is not in itself an injury. 12:28
11 233 Q. CHAIRMAN: I think you set it out in your memo. You
12 set it out in your e-mail, I thought, very extensively,
13 your views on it.
14 MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS: Very good. Thank you, Chairman.
15 234 Q. In relation to the recommendation to restore full pay, 12:28
16 you mention in your evidence that you had come across
17 that issue previously?
18 A. Yes.
19 235 Q. Was it very proximate to the resolution of the issue
20 with Garda Keogh? 12:28
21 A. In this particular case, yes.
22 236 Q. Within a matter of months?
23 A. Yes.
24 237 Q. And before that, had you come across the issue
25 previously? 12:28
26 A. No.
27 238 Q. In some of the e-mails that have been referred to,
28 there's a reference to Garda X and Garda Y, is Garda X
29 the other person that you mentioned?

1 A. Yes.

2 239 Q. And Garda Y we now know is Garda Keogh?

3 A. I understand, yes.

4 240 Q. But that wouldn't necessarily have been known to you at
5 the time the discussions took place? 12:29

6 A. I can't say for definite no, if that makes sense.

7 241 Q. And then finally, just in relation to all of your
8 dealings with Garda Keogh, did you ever perceive any
9 actions taken by anybody that you would have considered
10 to be a form of targeting or a form of victimisation or 12:29
11 a form of bullying?

12 A. No. Certainly from the correspondence that we would
13 have received, it would be what I would have expected.
14 I reviewed the file and it would be what I would
15 expect, that the superintendent and the chief 12:29
16 superintendent would be sending up correspondence,
17 looking to get the support of the Chief Medical Officer
18 for the individual. I didn't see anything different in
19 this than on numerous other files that I would review.

20 242 Q. You would agree with me that the only thing different 12:30
21 was that Garda Keogh was eventually treated as an
22 exceptional case, along with the other case that you
23 mentioned, Garda X?

24 A. Yes.

25 243 Q. Thank you. 12:30

26

27 END OF EXAMINATION

28

29 CHAIRMAN: All right. Very good. No questions,

1 Mr. Murrinan.
2 MR. MARRINAN: No further questions.
3 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, Ms. Carr, you are free
4 to go.
5 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 12:30
6 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for your assistance.
7 Very good.
8
9 THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW
10 12:30
11 CHAIRMAN: So now, Mr. McGuinness, the CMO --
12 MR. MCGUINNESS: Yes.
13 CHAIRMAN: -- is going to be back at three.
14 MR. MCGUINNESS: Hopefully in time for a three o'clock
15 start. If people perhaps came at 2:45, just in case. 12:30
16 CHAIRMAN: Let's say we will try to be ready at 2:30
17 but we're not expecting him back -- how long is he
18 going to take? Is it sensible to leave him over until
19 tomorrow?
20 MR. MCGUINNESS: No, no, he is not available tomorrow, 12:31
21 Chairman, unfortunately.
22 CHAIRMAN: Very good.
23 MR. MCGUINNESS: So we are hoping to finish him.
24 CHAIRMAN: That's very good reason. So then we will
25 propose to sit on. We hope he comes back as soon as he 12:31
26 can, but we will have to live with his availability.
27 The CMO is not available tomorrow, Mr. Kelly, therefore
28 that option doesn't arise.
29 MR. KELLY: Yes, I am quite happy to sit on to deal

1 with him.

2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. It is obviously more
3 convenient. That will be the end of our witnesses. We
4 would have had further sessions but circumstances
5 beyond our control concerning a particular witness have 12:31
6 prevented us. He's indisposed and therefore we are not
7 in a position to do that. Just while I have the
8 opportunity let me say that we will resume on, what is
9 the date.

10 MS. McGRATH: The 10th February. 12:31

11 CHAIRMAN: We will resume on the 10th February. The
12 schedule of witnesses will be available certainly by
13 Friday and will be on the website. It just needs to be
14 finalised before we can say that. Okay. So we will
15 resume, if I can get this closed, we will resume at 12:32
16 three o'clock or as soon before that as we can. Okay,
17 thank you very much.

18

19 THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED AS
20 FOLLOWS: 12:32

21

22 MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, we're ready for the next
23 witness, Dr. Oghuvbu.

24 CHAIRMAN: Just two seconds, doctor. Just for a
25 moment. The order, 23rd January. Okay. Just before 14:59
26 the Chief Medical Officer gives evidence, I want to
27 mention a request that we have received from Garda
28 Keogh's team, who refer to another case that has
29 potential relevance. We have gathered the materials in

1 that case from the relevant authorities. The position
2 is as follows: First of all, the person whose case
3 that is has an opportunity to respond to the order that
4 we have made, I have made, to object to it, and that
5 will be I think at the end of this week. So the first 15:00
6 thing that could happen is that the person involved
7 might object and in due course I may have to have
8 submissions or argument, which I would anticipate would
9 have to be in private and I would then rule on that.
10 Assuming that I upheld the objection, end of story in 15:01
11 regard to that. Assuming I didn't uphold it, the
12 question of relevance or materiality would remain, in
13 my view would remain to be established. In that
14 circumstance, as soon as the period has elapsed or the
15 objection is overruled, we will confidentially, highly 15:01
16 confidentially make the material available in redacted
17 form to Mr. Kelly's team, with a view to them making a
18 submission within seven days as so why the material is
19 relevant. The Garda authorities would have to have an
20 opportunity of responding to that and I would propose 15:02
21 three or four days thereafter. All this will have to
22 follow, everything will depend really on whether there
23 is any objection in the first place.

24
25 So I am not saying it is relevant or it is irrelevant, 15:02
26 it seems to me that that matter is a matter where I
27 ought to allow debate, I won't give any preliminary
28 view, where debate ought to be permitted. So that is
29 the way we will proceed, Mr. Kelly, in due course. So

1 I am just alerting you, that's the way it is going to
2 be. Because there will be time constraints, I'm
3 assuming that a week will be sufficient to do that. If
4 it's disastrously insufficient, let us know. We will
5 do our best to facilitate that. But obviously there's 15:02
6 a limit. If in the end of all that it turns out that
7 the matter is relevant, then it would be necessary to
8 ask the Chief Medical Officer to return to deal with
9 that aspect. But as of today, we're dealing with Garda
10 Kelly's case and only Garda Kelly's case. 15:03

11
12 Now, that doesn't stop anybody asking in general terms
13 but not with any reference to the particular case that
14 we all know about. Are you happy with that,
15 Mr. McGuinness? 15:03

16 MR. McGUI NNESS: Yes.

17 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Mr. Kelly?

18 MR. KELLY: Yes, Chairman. That seems sensible to me.
19 Just one thing I may have missed --

20 CHAIRMAN: It doesn't stop you asking questions or your 15:03
21 side, it doesn't stop you asking questions that might
22 be asked in any case that are general, if you know what
23 I mean, but it's just that any comparison with this
24 particular case obviously won't arise until a much
25 later stage. 15:03

26 MR. KELLY: I understand that entirely, Chairman. I am
27 in agreement with what you are saying. There's just
28 one thing for clarity, you probably dealt with it and I
29 have missed it. But, assuming all these hurdles arise

1 and the objection, then we move on to decide it and so
2 on, presumably before we would be invited to make
3 submissions on such material that was given to us, we
4 would actually see the material.

5 CHAIRMAN: Oh of course, absolutely. 15:04

6 MR. KELLY: I thought that.

7 CHAIRMAN: If I didn't say it, I should have said it.
8 Of course.

9 MR. KELLY: That is absolutely --

10 CHAIRMAN: Yes. You have to see, as I said, in 15:04
11 redacted form and on a confidential, a highly
12 confidential basis. I don't emphasise that for any
13 ironic purpose or any ulterior purpose, just to be safe
14 that I have mentioned it sufficiently often. All
15 right, thank you very much. So we will proceed then 15:04
16 with the Chief Medical Officer. Thanks very much.

17 MR. McGUI NNESS: Dr. Oghuvbu, thank you.

18

19 DR. OGHENOVO (OVO) OGHUVBU, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS
20 DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUI NNESS, AS FOLLOWS: 15:05

21

22 THE WITNESS: Dr. Oghuvbu.

23 CHAIRMAN: Doctor, sit down, please. May I ask you to
24 do me a favour? Could you tell me how to pronounce
25 your name. 15:05

26 THE WITNESS: which one?

27 CHAIRMAN: I presume you have a first name and a second
28 name and I would like to call you doctor by your second
29 name.

1 A. Dr. Oghuvbu, the V is silent.

2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Dr. Oghuvbu, forgive

3 me for being -- well, it'S actually more polite. So,

4 thanks Dr. Oghuvbu. Yes.

5 244 Q. MR. MCGUINNESS: Doctor, I think qualified with a 15:05

6 bachelor of medicine, bachelor of surgery from the

7 College of Medicine, University of Lagos, Nigeria in

8 1991?

9 A. Yes, I did.

10 245 Q. Thereafter, I think you did a number of pre-specialist 15:06

11 medical training in Ireland as senior house officer in

12 medical registrar posts, isn't that correct?

13 A. Yes.

14 246 Q. You then went on to do an advanced diploma in 15:06

15 occupational medicine in the University of Manchester

16 in 2001, isn't that correct?

17 A. Yes.

18 247 Q. And then you were back in Ireland, where you qualified

19 as a member of the Royal College of Physicians of

20 Ireland? 15:06

21 A. Yes.

22 248 Q. I think that probably entitled to become a specialist

23 registrar in occupational medicine in Ireland, is that

24 correct?

25 A. No, I entered into a training programme as a result of 15:06

26 that.

27 249 Q. Okay. All right. I think you took a diploma in

28 tropical medicine in the Royal College of Surgeons in

29 Ireland in 2004. You became a member of the faculty of

1 occupational medicine in the Royal College of
2 Physicians in Ireland in 2005. Then you I think
3 practiced as a specialist occupational physician at
4 that point in time?

5 A. That was in 2006. 15:07

6 250 Q. In 2006, yes. I think you've done specialist training
7 in occupational medicine in the Royal College of
8 Physicians in Ireland and the Irish Committee of Higher
9 Medical Training. You have been since I think 2010, or
10 before that you were a specialist occupational 15:07
11 physician in HSE west in Ireland in 2009?

12 A. Yes, I was.

13 251 Q. And then in 2010 you became a specialist occupational
14 physician in An Garda Síochána?

15 A. Yes. 15:07

16 252 Q. You have remained working with An Garda Síochána since
17 that date?

18 A. Yes, I have.

19 253 Q. Also, I think you're member of the faculty board, the
20 board faculty of occupational medicine, you're a member 15:08
21 of the emergency management of injuries and post
22 exposure prophylaxis, the subcommittee of Scientific
23 Advisory Committee, the health protection surveillance
24 centre, is that correct?

25 A. Yes, I am. 15:08

26 254 Q. You're a fellow of the faculty of occupational medicine
27 of the Royal College of Physicians and in 2015 you were
28 a member of the Scientific Steering Committee for
29 National Post-Exposure Prophylaxis Conference?

1 A. Yes.

2 255 Q. Have I left anything out of relevance there?

3 A. No.

4 256 Q. I think in your capacity as an occupational physician,
5 you had occasion to review Garda Keogh in this case? 15:08

6 A. Yes, I had.

7 257 Q. I should have said, Chairman, for the benefit of my
8 colleagues, that Dr. Oghuvbu's statement of evidence is
9 in volume 13, at page 3643 and associated papers. And
10 doctor, I will be referring you to a number of 15:09
11 different documents throughout the course of your
12 evidence?

13 A. Okay.

14 258 Q. You will have the opportunity to see them on screen or
15 paper, a hard copy version, whichever is convenient to 15:09
16 you?

17 A. Okay.

18 259 Q. I think in the second paragraph of your statement at
19 3643, you say:

20 15:09

21 "I first encountered Garda Keogh as one of the
22 specialist occupational physicians employed in GOHS on
23 the 18th April following absence related referral to
24 GOHS from Garda Human Resources."

25 15:09

26 I think there's a record of that. If we look at page
27 3680 of the papers. That's your reporting back upon
28 your review of Garda Keogh on the 18th April 2012?

29 A. Yes, that is right.

1 260 Q. And I think he had suffered a physical injury. He had
2 some traumatic chest pains. He had been absent on
3 medical grounds for approximately seven weeks?
4 A. Yes.
5 261 Q. You reviewed him and found him fit to resume duties? 15:10
6 A. Yes, I did.
7 262 Q. I think you next reviewed him slightly later in the
8 same year on foot of an Occupational Health Service
9 referral form. Perhaps we will just look at front page
10 of that, at 3674. That was a referral form completed 15:10
11 by Inspector Minnock at that stage. It was dated 27th
12 July 2012. It was based upon an absence that had
13 occurred when Garda Keogh was not fit for duty from
14 25th May 2012 to 8th July 2012?
15 A. That's correct. 15:11
16 263 Q. And he had had some inpatient treatment at that stage?
17 A. Yes.
18 264 Q. We see at the bottom of that page, just to note, it's
19 written down there that he had 107 days of absence
20 inclusive of this period above. In any event, you 15:11
21 reviewed him, we don't need to look at the rest of
22 those referral papers but you reviewed him on the 9th
23 October?
24 A. Yes.
25 265 Q. If we look at page 3661, I think that is your report, 15:11
26 written again to the Eastern Region Commissioner -- or
27 sorry, the Human Resource Management Commissioner,
28 Super Fanning at that time. At paragraph 2 you note:
29

1 "The member's absence is attributed to a new clinical
2 condition for which he received appropriate clinical
3 management."

4
5 I think you recommend that he is medically fit to 15:12
6 attend and resume normal duty, policing duties at that
7 point in time?

8 A. Yes. Yes, I did.

9 266 Q. There was a further referral as a result of a report 15:12
10 from Inspector Farrell, at page 3701 of the papers.
11 That's a referral of 22nd October 2013. In the second
12 paragraph, it refers to the previous issue where he had
13 been receiving treatment.

14
15 "May/June 2012 Garda Keogh attended a residential 15:13
16 treatment course in Dublin for alcohol addiction."

17
18 And he returned to full duty then. Then there is a
19 report:

20 15:13
21 "In the recent past he has commenced drinking again,
22 despite continuing to work full-time. Concerns have
23 been raised as regards his welfare management and
24 colleagues close to Garda Keogh have tried to assist
25 him in seeking treatment, however he remains reluctant 15:13
26 to avail of same."

27
28 And it refers to one particular incident there. I
29 think an early referral date was provided to him and I

1 think Superintendent McBrien completed the formal
2 referral form, which is at page 3702 and 3. She gives
3 details of the reason there at the top of 3703. If we
4 look at the next page. That's signed by her then on
5 the bottom, dated the 21st October. You were in a 15:14
6 position to review Garda Keogh on 7th November 2013, if
7 we look at page 3705.

8 A. Yes, that's correct.

9 267 Q. Is that correct?

10 A. Yes. 15:14

11 268 Q. In the second paragraph there, you say:

12

13 "Based on the information available to me, the member
14 is recommended medically fit for normal policing duties
15 with standard safeguards in place. I have reiterated 15:14
16 the necessity for the member to comply with the
17 relevant clinical interventions and follow up
18 arrangements."

19

20 You make reference to: 15:14

21

22 "The member should avail of confidential organisational
23 sports."

24

25 Etcetera. You recommended that unit report should be 15:14
26 provided in six to eight weeks time and every three
27 months thereafter for a period of at least 12 months.

28 A. That's correct.

29 269 Q. You state that no further review was warranted. Why

1 did you consider a unit report would be of help there
2 at that point in time?

3 A. When a member presents with a condition that we find
4 them -- we find it satisfactory that he can return to
5 work but we want to just have an idea of how they are 15:15
6 settling back at work, if there are any problems
7 arising.

8 270 Q. Yes.

9 A. We would write to their management and say we want a
10 unit report and they would come back to us. If there 15:15
11 is no issues raised in the unit report, we just allow
12 them to continue to work as they would have been before
13 this occurs.

14 271 Q. Yes. You may not have known it, but Assistant
15 Commissioner Fanning and his office at that stage had 15:15
16 to write a number of reminders looking for a unit
17 report, until one was ultimately provided by Sergeant
18 Moylan. I think you received that report?

19 A. Yes.

20 272 Q. Which was dated the 20th February. That's at page 15:15
21 3729. You obviously gave consideration to that on
22 receipt, isn't that correct?

23 A. Yes, I did.

24 273 Q. If we look at page 3788 of the papers, you have a note
25 in your file relating to Garda Keogh, as it were, dated 15:16
26 5th March 2005 [sic]. That is:
27
28 "HRPD Absence Section e-mail of 24/2/2015. Noted
29 with..."

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

Is that "noted with unit report of 20th"?

A. That's correct, yes.

274 Q. "20/2/2015. Member reported as performing..."

A. Performing all duties required.

15:16

275 Q. All duties required of him.

A. Yeah.

276 Q. And not requiring any extra supports?

A. Yes.

277 Q. "Member reported as not indicating any areas of concern."

15:16

A. In the course of his duties.

278 Q. "In the course of his duties. Nil further warranted. Maintain previous OHS monitoring arrangements."

15:17

Is that right?

A. Yes.

279 Q. That's signed by you?

A. Yes.

280 Q. Now, your note goes on then to 17th April 2015?

15:17

A. Yes.

281 Q. But in the interim you have received the report which is referred to there, which is dated 2nd April 2015, isn't that correct?

A. Yes, correct.

15:17

282 Q. Perhaps we will just look at that first, because that obviously came in before you made your notes. But that's at page 3721. This is a report which went from Superintendent Murray to the chief superintendent, it

1 is dated the 2nd April. In the first paragraph he
2 refers to the revelation in the Dáil by Deputy
3 Flanagan. Then he refers in the second paragraph to
4 the following:

5
6 "I was transferred to Athlone as district officer on
7 9th March 2015. I first met Garda Keogh on Thursday,
8 26th March 2015. One of the issues that arose in my
9 discussion with him was his sick absences, which
10 appeared to be occurring frequently and in a haphazard 15:18
11 fashion. While Garda Keogh was reticent to discuss any
12 issues he may have with me, I nonetheless felt it
13 prudent to put an arrangements: "

14 CHAIRMAN: I think that means -- I'm sorry.

15
16 "He was reluctant to discuss any issues he may have
17 with me."

18
19 MR. MCGUINNESS: Yes.

20 CHAIRMAN: It wasn't that he had issues with 15:18
21 Superintendent Murray at the time. He was reluctant to
22 discuss any issues with Superintendent Murray.

23 MR. MCGUINNESS: Yes.

24 CHAIRMAN: He might have put the with me at an earlier
25 point. He was reluctant to discuss with me any 15:18
26 issues -- at least that is the way I am reading that.

27 MR. MCGUINNESS: You must be right, Chairman.

28 CHAIRMAN: Because it's only April.

29 MR. MCGUINNESS: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

"I nonetheless felt it prudent to put an arrangement in place in Athlone to support him in the work environment as he is indicating work related stress as a source of his absences. With that in mind, I have allocated a female sergeant who is new to the district to act as a district point of contact for the member to discuss and if possible solve any workplace issues he may have in Athlone in order to allow him attend work more frequently.

15:19

15:19

As an additional measure, I wish to have an appointment with the Chief Medical Officer arranged for Garda Keogh in order that professional medical expertise can advise of other workplace supports which may assist the member. The member indicated he had not attended the CMO previously.

15:19

The member has a total of 184 sick days in the past four years. 48 of those occurred since 2014, with 52% occurring on early tours of duty. The member has availed of 34 days annual leave from 1st March 2014 to 31st March 2015, with 92% of leave taken on early tours alone.

15:19

15:20

I believe both the member and the organisation would benefit by referring him to the Occupational Health Service at this time.

1 Please forward."

2

3

Chairman, that's obviously the document that Superintendent Murray gave evidence about and about which Garda Keogh gave evidence. That was the first period in which he was tipped over into TRR.

15:20

6

7

CHAIRMAN: The 183, yes.

8

MR. MCGUINNESS: Yes.

9 283 Q. You have made notes then on the clinical sheets. If we
10 just go back to page 3788. And it says:

15:20

11

12

"HRPD minute by e-mail of 20/4/2015. Noted with local management document and OHS referral. New district officer concerned about member's high absence levels since January 2014 (48 days) absences falling mostly with early tours and record of 34 days."

15:21

13

14

15

16

17

18

Is that all from --

19

A. Annual leave, sorry.

20

284 Q. "Annual leave March 2014 taken on early tours.

15:21

21

District officer has provided support in the workplace."

22

23

A. workplace.

24

285 Q. "But we are referring to OHS because 'the member indicated that he had not attended the CMO previously' and that the member would benefit from OHS input or additional support if required. In the context of paragraph 1 and paragraph 2..."

15:21

25

26

27

28

29

1 what is the next word there?

2 A. Sentence three.

3 286 Q. "Sentence three of district officer's report of the
4 2/4, a holistic approach involving senior local
5 management." 15:22

6

7 Is that right?

8 A. Yes, local management.

9 287 Q. "Senior HRPD."

10 15:22

11 Is that input?

12 A. Management.

13 288 Q. Management, sorry. And then the next words are?

14 A. "Garda employee assistance management."

15 289 Q. Yes. "Is indicated in this case. Offer appointment 15:22
16 for consultation and OHP."

17

18 Now, Superintendent Murray's report, it refers there to
19 Garda Keogh indicating work related stress as a source
20 of his absences. 15:22

21 A. Yes.

22 290 Q. Had you considered that to be an area that you ought to
23 explore with him at that point?

24 A. It mentioned that, but generally when members say work
25 related stress, what I -- the approach we have, I have, 15:22
26 I tend to have is to kind of meet with them to explore
27 what is it that is generating the stress in the
28 workplace with them and if that stress is actually
29 presenting itself as a medical illness or not, because

1 work related stress itself is not -- or stress itself
2 is not an illness, it is just saying that I am
3 responding abnormally to maybe a situation that I am
4 confronted with outside of work or inside of work. So
5 I would explore that, what it means, and to establish 15:23
6 whether there is actually any illness present or not.

7 291 Q. Yes. In a simplistic way, you wouldn't, or would you
8 ever diagnose somebody as suffering from work related
9 stress in the sense of that being an illness? You're
10 not regarding it as an illness in those terms? 15:23

11 A. No.

12 292 Q. And you're not regarding stress as an illness, simply
13 in those terms either?

14 A. No, I am not regarding it as an illness.

15 293 Q. The referral form is there at page 3723. It's in 15:23
16 contrast perhaps to some of the other ones we have
17 seen. There's a box ticked in there.

18

19 "Management concerned re mental health of employee."

20 A. Yes. 15:24

21 294 Q. would that have caused you any particular concern?

22 A. Yes, it would, because I would explore, I would want to
23 explore what it is that management are concerned about.
24 They may not provide details in the referral but when I
25 see the individual, I would kind of say that management 15:24
26 have expressed a concern in relation to your mental
27 health and I would explore that with them.

28 295 Q. Yes. Now, there don't appear to be any of the member's
29 medical certificates submitted with this at this point

1 in time. would that be a normal procedure? would that
2 be a normal enough referral that would come to you?

3 A. In general we don't -- the Occupational Health Service
4 doesn't process medical certificates and it is not
5 required that they send medical certificates to us, 15:25
6 except that medical certificate has medical details; in
7 other words, that the individual's doctor has written
8 in a report. And normally we would not expect that to
9 come through HR. It should come directly to ourselves.
10 I think it is a provision in the Code for them to send 15:25
11 reports of that fashion to ourselves. I wouldn't
12 really be expecting medical certs to be attached to it.

13 296 Q. Yes. So that didn't raise any red flags or alarms in
14 that sense?

15 A. No, it wouldn't. No. 15:25

16 297 Q. We will come to it in more detail later, but you don't
17 have any responsibility for recording periods of
18 absence on SAMS or the reasons?

19 A. No, I don't.

20 298 Q. But you do and you did consult it I think in relation 15:25
21 to Garda Keogh?

22 A. We would, if there is a -- like in his case, where
23 there was a concern about frequent absences.

24 299 Q. Yes.

25 A. We would request that they provide us with that, so 15:26
26 that we have an idea to see whether there is any type
27 of pattern present in the absences.

28 300 Q. Yes. In any event, you were able to offer an
29 appointment for the 19th May at 1:00pm. If we just

1 look at page 3719, you send that to Mr. Barrett.
2 That's in the normal terms?
3 A. Yes.
4 301 Q. "The local management should explain to the member that
5 the purpose of the review is for assessment and further 15:26
6 advice on medical fitness."
7
8 We have the evidence of Sergeant Moylan that he met
9 with Garda Keogh on the 4th May and he furnished a
10 report in relation to that. I would just like to draw 15:26
11 the form of the report to your attention, from the
12 transcript, it's perhaps easiest. Day 133. You will
13 be handed a copy of the transcript there. At page 97.
14 Sergeant Moylan gave evidence of making this report.
15 It starts at the top there, at line 3: 15:27
16
17 "Garda Keogh was aware that it was referred to the CMO
18 to determine his medical fitness for policing duty.
19 Garda Keogh has been advised to forward all relevant
20 medical reports on or prior to the review date. He 15:27
21 indicates that he may have a report with him on the day
22 as he is due to see his GP this week. He was also made
23 aware of these reports will be treated in the strictest
24 confidence. In relation to other non-medical issues,
25 Garda Keogh states that he may wish to discuss this 15:27
26 with the Chief Medical Officer in person."
27
28 So that would be a standard enough instruction to a
29 member coming to see you, would that be accurate?

1 A. Yes, more or less.

2 302 Q. We know that that's correct, what he was telling
3 Sergeant Moylan, because he did go to Dr. Bartlett and
4 consult with him and mentioned you in that capacity.
5 Could we perhaps just look at Dr. Bartlett's notes, 15:28
6 which will come up on screen, at page 10639. If we
7 just scroll down to this period there, the 31st March,
8 we see that. There's various sick notes referred to
9 for different periods. The first one there is the 2nd
10 April, sick note. That is the one that tipped him over 15:29
11 into TRR for that period. There's one there covering
12 the 31st March to the 3rd April. There's a
13 prescription referred to there, Xanax then. Then 1st
14 May:

15 15:29

16 "Main surgery, met with Nick, further time off work,
17 not coping with investigation at present. Above
18 entered by Dr. David Bartlett. 1st May '15, sick note.
19 Work related stress. Unfit for work. 20-25 April
20 2015. 18th May '15, main surgery, met with Nick. Has 15:29
21 meeting with Garda doctor tomorrow, May 19th, at 1:00pm
22 work cert 12/5 - 16/5 inclusive, work related stress,
23 above entered by Dr. Bartlett. 11th June, main
24 surgery. Met with Nick. Further time off work.
25 Struggling with work related stress and ongoing 15:30
26 investigation. He has met police doctor. Acknowledges
27 he is under duress but can continue to work according
28 to Nick. Discussed? Requesting transfer as he
29 continues to work daily with other staff members under

1 investigation. He is being to feel threatened by these
2 colleagues. I have advised him to liaise with his
3 senior officers/Garda doctor about this."

4
5 So that covers the period immediately before and after, 15:30
6 when you saw him, as you did see him on the 19th May;
7 isn't that correct?

8 A. Yes, that's correct.

9 303 Q. I have noted in the papers that were provided with your
10 statement, at page 3651, that there is a SAMS report 15:30
11 which was issued up to -- it's actually dated the day
12 that you saw him, in the top left-hand corner, if we
13 look at page 3651. If we just go up the page slightly?

14 A. Yes.

15 304 Q. It's on the screen there, you can see. Would that have 15:31
16 been accessed by you on the day of the consultation?

17 A. No, that would have been sent to me.

18 305 Q. That would have been sent to you?

19 A. Because I have no way of pulling this out.

20 306 Q. All right, perhaps I misunderstood you. You are 15:31
21 reliant on it being sent to you?

22 A. Yes.

23 307 Q. But can you confirm that you did in fact have it on the
24 day then?

25 A. I did, because I see I have a little bit of annotations 15:31
26 at the side. I was trying to calculate the period of
27 absence that year.

28 308 Q. You were adding up the days there?

29 A. Yes.

1 309 Q. I think at the bottom of the page, it gives a total of
2 47 in the last 12 months, 196 in the last 48 months.
3 Garda Keogh has given evidence about the different
4 periods. Did you notice that the nature of the illness
5 was being described as "flu/viral" here on SAMS, at the 15:32
6 top?

7 A. Yeah, I would have noticed that, yes.

8 310 Q. Did that cause you any concern because it didn't seem
9 to be consistent with what Superintendent Murray was
10 reporting as stress on Garda Keogh's part? 15:32

11 A. The classification of absence, it's not the
12 responsibility of the Occupational Health Service,
13 that's the first thing.

14 311 Q. Yes.

15 A. And there are processes within HR absence section which 15:32
16 when they receive this they put the classification
17 down. And I understand, I know that where there is a
18 reporting of work related stress, their policy at that
19 time was that they kept it as "ordinary illness" until
20 they were able to prove that there were work related 15:32
21 factors that were the cause of the individual's
22 illness. So that is the procedure that I knew that
23 they adopted. So I never worried myself too much about
24 the classification, because I could still do my
25 consultation without knowing what the classification 15:33
26 was.

27 312 Q. Yes. I mean, that doesn't in any way affect how you're
28 viewing the patient or interacting with the patient on
29 the day; is that right?

1 A. No, it wouldn't.

2 313 Q. Is that right?

3 A. The classification of absence as it is recorded on the
4 SAMS doesn't affect my consultation.

5 314 Q. Okay. Your notes then in relation to the consultation 15:33
6 on the day are at page 3790?

7 A. Yes.

8 315 Q. It commences with a consent statement which is signed
9 by Garda Keogh. He has, I think, filled in the first
10 few lines there relating to his recent absences, is 15:33
11 that right?

12 A. No, I would have written that.

13 316 Q. You would have filled in those?

14 A. Yes.

15 317 Q. Okay. Can you recollect, he was issued by Dr. Bartlett 15:34
16 with a certificate on the 18th relating to work related
17 stress, did he bring that with you, or do you remember
18 seeing that?

19 A. I can't recall.

20 318 Q. You can't recall. Okay. It records then, as I read 15:34
21 it:
22
23 "Was referred originally on account of management
24 concerns about high level of short absences. 48 days
25 in a 12 month period." 15:34
26
27 If we could go to page 3790. It says:
28
29 "If currently absence date absence commenced. Was

1 referred originally on account of management concerns
2 about high level of short absences (48 days in 12
3 months period from January 2014) with more than half
4 concerning early tours. Also high number of annual
5 leave in early tours.

15:35

6
7 Basis for review: As above."

8
9 So, do I understand it that even though Superintendent
10 Murray had referred to the work related stress, you
11 weren't assessing him for that?

15:35

12 A. No, I was assessing him in relation to what was driving
13 the frequent absences, trying to kind of explore if
14 there were any -- all the factors, whether it was work
15 related or not work related, what were the factors that
16 were contributing.

15:35

17 319 Q. Okay. You seem have noted then under a number of star
18 points there.

19
20 "New superintendent since March 2015."

15:35

21
22 I am not sure what the next word is.

23 A. "Affirms meeting with superintendent towards the end of
24 March 2015 and concerns about absences and attendance
25 patterns."

15:35

26 320 Q. "Discussed absences."

27
28 CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry. "New superintendent since March
29 2016", and, doctor, what's the next one?

1 A. Affirms.

2 321 Q. CHAIRMAN: "Affirms meeting with..."

3 A. Yeah. So he said that he confirmed that he met -- -

4 322 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, absolutely, I am understanding, sorry.

5 A. Yes. 15:36

6 323 Q. CHAIRMAN: "With superintendent towards end March?"

7 MR. McGUINESS: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN: So he is confirming that there was a

9 meeting. In other words, the information that you

10 already had from the letter. 15:36

11 A. Yes.

12 324 Q. CHAIRMAN: He is confirming this?

13 A. Is confirming.

14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Sorry, Mr. McGuinness.

15 325 Q. MR. McGUINESS: It then goes on: 15:36

16

17 "Discussed absences in the context of frequent

18 short-term absences between January 2014 and January

19 2015."

20 15:36

21 Do you recollect any more detail about that?

22 A. I can't recall specifically. We would have spoken

23 about different things, as to each of the absences,

24 like why were you absent there? What was the -- you

25 know, what was the thing behind that absence? That is 15:36

26 what I would have been kind of going over.

27 326 Q. Yes. It then goes on:

28

29 "In the context of wellbeing support."

1 A. "Says tries to attend AA regular and is in touch with
2 Garda employee assistance officer."

3 327 Q. Yes. What does it go on to say?

4 A. "Says no alcohol since April, though would have drunk
5 excessively over St. Patrick's holiday and between 15:37
6 January and February, usually about or more than 12
7 pints of alcohol."
8

9 Sorry, units of alcohol

10 CHAIRMAN: 12 pints or more. 15:37

11 A. Or more, yeah, sorry.

12 328 Q. MR. McGUINESS: Is that 12 pints binge or 12 units
13 binge?

14 A. Units.

15 CHAIRMAN: Oh sorry, 12 units. 15:37

16 A. Yeah.

17 329 Q. MR. McGUINESS: "Saw GP in respect of recent absence
18 and prior to return to work. GP has referred for new
19 support interventions and awaits to commence same."

20 A. Yeah. 15:37

21 330 Q. That was something the GP was organising?

22 A. Was organising.

23 331 Q. Yes, okay. "OHP reiterated implication of continued
24 misuse of alcohol on his expected effectiveness and..."

25 A. Importance". 15:38

26 332 Q. "...importance of engaging positively with supports to
27 maintain wellbeing and effectiveness. Engages
28 appropriately."
29

1 Is that right?

2 A. Yeah.

3 333 Q. "Not dysthymic."

4

5 Is that: 15:38

6

7 "Logical content and flow for discussion."

8 A. Yes.

9 CHAIRMAN: what is dysthymic?

10 A. It's a mood, an alteration in the mood or mood 15:38

11 depression, dysthymic.

12 334 Q. MR. MCGUINNESS: He was presenting normally?

13 A. Yes.

14 335 Q. CHAIRMAN: So there wasn't abnormality in the mood.

15 A. There wasn't. 15:38

16 CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you.

17 336 Q. MR. MCGUINNESS: Is that "agree fit to attend at

18 present and fit for duties as assigned."

19 A. Yes.

20 337 Q. "Continued to avail of organisational and GP support." 15:39

21 A. Yes.

22 338 Q. Now, was that something -- you say, you have written it

23 down there "agree", was that agreed between the two of

24 you?

25 A. Yes, that would have. Because I would have said -- 15:39

26 generally, by the time I come to the conclusion and I

27 am saying, okay, this is the plan, I tend to kind of

28 discuss that with the individual, to kind of say, okay,

29 this is what we are going to do, this is what I expect

1 you to do. So there is an understanding that this is
2 what we are going to be doing.

3 339 Q. Yes. Could you give the Chairman a view as accurately
4 as you can do so, what would you say was his condition
5 and what was your diagnosis of his problem at that 15:39
6 point in time that had led to these issues of absence?

7 A. My impression there was that while there were obviously
8 -- I mean I can't recall every specifics, but I felt
9 that there was a mixture of the recurrent drinking,
10 binge drinking, especially when he was on his days off, 15:40
11 there was an impact of that on his attendance, that
12 that was also impacting on the issues that were going
13 on at work. I didn't have any details of any other
14 thing that was going on at work, but it was just that I
15 felt from a medical point of view that it wasn't 15:40
16 helping the situation and that it was reflecting in his
17 attendance and that there was a need for him to engage
18 with his supports that his GP was putting in place.

19 340 Q. Yes. I suppose from your point of view, am I correct
20 in saying, that you could see that he was liaising with 15:40
21 his he GP?

22 A. Yes.

23 341 Q. Taking his advice.

24 A. Yes.

25 342 Q. And trying to follow it, is that right? 15:40
26 A. Yes, yes.

27 343 Q. You concluded that he was fit to resume work?
28 A. He was actually already at work.

29 344 Q. He was already at work, yes.

1 A. Yes.

2 345 Q. I haven't come across a sort of formal report that was
3 sent back, do you recollect whether you sent a report
4 back on foot of that?

5 A. I would have. May 2015. I would have to check the 15:41
6 reports. I'm not sure actually. It is a report that
7 would be dated.

8 346 Q. Yes. It's just in the context of neither
9 Superintendent Murray or Chief Superintendent Wheatley
10 believe that they received any outcome in terms of a 15:41
11 document --

12 A. No, sorry.

13 347 Q. -- relating to that.

14 A. Sorry about this. I just need to see which direction
15 this -- 15:42

16 348 Q. Perhaps we will come back to it.

17 A. Yeah. Go ahead, sorry, I will find it.

18 349 Q. We will move to another issue.

19 350 Q. CHAIRMAN: In the normal way, would you send a report?

20 A. I would have sent a report, yeah. 15:42

21 351 Q. CHAIRMAN: To whom would you send it, doctor?

22 A. It would be addressed to the executive director of HRPD
23 at that point in time.

24 352 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.

25 A. Yes. 15:42

26 353 Q. MR. McGUINNES: I would like you to look at some
27 documents, just to see whether you can help us as to
28 whether you ever received these ones.

29 A. Okay.

1 354 Q. Now, you saw Garda Keogh on the 19th. We know that
2 Superintendent Murray wrote, and the chief
3 superintendent wrote again almost immediately after
4 that period, in a series of documents that were sent up
5 to headquarters. Could I ask you to look at page 6145? 15:43
6 It's in Volume 20. This is a report of the chief
7 superintendent dated the 26th May. It's going up to
8 headquarters in response to correspondence from Human
9 Resources executive director, looking for the required
10 information. It sends on the report, this further 15:43
11 report of Superintendent Murray, which commences on the
12 next page. If you go to 6146, that is Superintendent
13 Murray's report, written on the 20th May. It's giving
14 an answer primarily to the question about whether he
15 can or cannot explore further the claim of the member 15:44
16 that he is suffering from work related stress. He
17 attaches, if we see on that, at page 6147, he attaches
18 the chief's request of the 12th May, the original
19 request from HQ of the 7th May, the report that you saw
20 of the 2nd April, the referral form that you saw and 15:44
21 then the member's medical certificates. These are the
22 member's medical certificates that are referred to in
23 Dr. Bartlett's note that we have seen. I am just
24 wondering, would it be help you in any way to look at
25 those. They are from 6153, 6154, 6155, 6156, 6157, 15:45
26 6158, 6159?

27 A. I wouldn't have seen any of this.

28 355 Q. Pardon?

29 A. I wouldn't have even any of this.

1 356 Q. No. Okay. Obviously these were sent to the chief
2 superintendent and she sent them up after the 20th May,
3 but we have seen from Ms. Carr's evidence this morning
4 that she said all documentation was sent to the CMO,
5 but you don't recall seeing these documents? 15:45

6 A. I don't have -- I didn't see these.

7 357 Q. Okay. In any event, matters arose in July of 2015, as
8 a result of which there was a request for a case
9 conference to be held with the CMO and I think
10 ultimately you attended the case conference on the 9th 15:46
11 December?

12 A. Yes, I did.

13 358 Q. 2015?

14 A. Yes.

15 359 Q. There are minutes of that at 3646. I think you have 15:46
16 seen those minutes, have you?

17 A. Yes.

18 360 Q. Did you yourself take any notes at the meeting?

19 A. No, I don't take notes at meetings.

20 361 Q. Okay. There's a number of observations there, 15:46
21 obviously there is HRPD, which talk about the volume of
22 sickness absence and the consequence. There's
23 Occupational Health observations and actions. Would
24 that represent your contribution, in the middle column
25 there? 15:47

26 A. Yes.

27 362 Q. So it commences:
28
29 "Member's condition appears to have taken a turn for

1 the worst. It was not apparent at the time of CMO's
2 last review of him on 19th May 2015.

3
4 Necessary that the member will engage with the support
5 services offered to him. The member should be booked 15:47
6 into a treatment facility to help him rehabilitate."
7

8 Do you recalling suggesting that?

9 A. I can't recall what I said other than to say if it's
10 recorded that I said that, that was the recommendations 15:47
11 that I made or the advices that I gave at that time,
12 then that's what I recollect, yeah.

13 363 Q. Yes. I suppose my question is: There was nobody else
14 from occupational health there?

15 A. Ms. Fiona O'Brien is a clerical officer. 15:47

16 364 Q. We're told she was to take the notes?

17 A. Yes.

18 365 Q. Would that be accurate?

19 A. Yes.

20 366 Q. Okay. "An early appointment for review at the OHS to 15:47
21 be arranged and communicated."

22
23 You fixed I think the 18th December, isn't that
24 correct?

25 A. That's correct, yes. 15:48

26 367 Q. "Management to inform Garda Keogh of early appointment
27 for review at the OHS. Impress the importance to the
28 member of keeping this review appointment and fully
29 engaging with the necessary processes to prioritise his

1 recovery with the aim of retaining his employment."
2
3 Garda Quinn, who was present there, who was the EAS
4 officer, he said there was some discussion at the
5 meeting as to how the sick absences were recorded and 15:48
6 mentioned the issue of work related stress being
7 discussed. Do you have any recollection of that?
8 A. I wouldn't have.
9 368 Q. Pardon?
10 A. I wouldn't have a recollection. 15:48
11 369 Q. One of the other attendees was Superintendent Declan
12 Mulcahy. I don't know whether you knew this at the
13 time, but he was a detective superintendent
14 investigating allegations that Garda Keogh had made
15 about some aspects of policing in Athlone and he had 15:48
16 been liaising with him regularly about different
17 issues. Did you know that at the time?
18 A. No, I wouldn't know.
19 370 Q. Do you recall whether he made any contribution?
20 A. I wouldn't know what individuals said or didn't say at 15:49
21 the meeting. The meetings generally tend to kind of --
22 the notes that are taken tend to be -- there's no
23 transcript of verbatim recording of the discussion that
24 I'm going on, it's really about what are we coming
25 to -- how are we going to go forward? what are we 15:49
26 going to do to support the member?
27 371 Q. Yes.
28 A. What recommendations or what things that either
29 management need to do or ourselves need to do to help

1 to support the member's wellbeing, recovery and
2 eventual return to work.

3 372 Q. Yes. It may or may not assist your memory, but both
4 Superintendent Mulcahy and Garda Mick Quinn, they had
5 received phone calls at different periods of time from 15:49
6 Garda Keogh, from which it appears that he was
7 apparently drunk on a couple of occasions, would that
8 help your memory as to whether they brought that to
9 your attention?

10 A. It may have been discussed at the meeting, but by this 15:50
11 time we're all pretty clear that alcohol was playing a
12 significant issue, I would say a significant role in
13 what was going on here. The focus would have been on
14 how do we support, you know, support him in order to be
15 able to kind of overcome this particular circumstance. 15:50
16 That would have been the focus at that time.

17 373 Q. Garda Quinn is apparently recorded there in the third
18 column, in the middle there:

19
20 "EAS officer's observation is that the member needs to 15:50
21 decide for himself that he needs help and make a
22 concerted effort to access services to address the
23 issue."

24
25 Then there was some discussion, it would appear, about 15:50
26 the question of a transfer. Do you recall that at all?

27 A. I think there was a discussion about whether continuing
28 in Athlone was actually beneficial in the long-term for
29 him. And I think there had been previously a comment

1 about -- not at the case conference, about the
2 consideration for transfer out of Athlone. But I think
3 this was just management's view that maybe Athlone was
4 not really very conducive for him.

5 374 Q. Yes. In the context of Superintendent Murray's 15:51
6 original report and referral, which had referred to
7 work related stress and the Garda not being open to
8 discussing his concerns, does that ring a bell as to
9 whether there was any discussion of work related stress
10 at this case conference?? 15:51

11 A. No, I wouldn't -- I wouldn't know about that. Because
12 a case conference don't tend to -- I'm just speaking
13 now in general here. The case conferences don't tend
14 to kind of allow for much discussion around the things
15 that the individual might have disclosed confidentially 15:52
16 to ourselves.

17 375 Q. Yes.

18 A. Unless it was something that has been disclosed in
19 general.

20 376 Q. Yes. 15:52

21 A. And there was a view that addressing that particular
22 issue will move things forward. The case conferences
23 didn't tend to kind of go into very personal things.

24 377 Q. Yes. It is correct to point out that Superintendent 15:52
25 Murray and Chief Superintendent Wheatley's memos of
26 July did refer to the drinking rather than work related
27 stress but he was still being certified by his doctor
28 for his absences for work related stress. You wouldn't
29 be aware of that at the time?

1 A. I wouldn't know what was being certified.

2 378 Q. Yes.

3 A. Because I don't deal with certification.

4 379 Q. Yes.

5 A. What was important was, if he was being certified as 15:52
6 unfit for work, it was to explore why he was unfit for
7 work and if there was any illness or, you know,
8 condition that we could address. The factuals in terms
9 of those, it was work related stress, usually it's
10 management's role to kind of explore what the work 15:53
11 related stress concerns were and then to kind of
12 feedback to us. If there things that they could
13 address, we would say they should address then. But
14 they don't -- they wouldn't be -- in terms of what his
15 GP was certifying him for, the GP -- and any doctor is 15:53
16 free to kind of make a decision as to what is
17 certifiable. In terms os when you say it's work
18 related, then generally what is expected is that local
19 management would explore what those issues were in the
20 workplace. 15:53

21 380 Q. Yes.

22 A. The general -- where there is a question that
23 management come to ourselves and say the member is
24 reporting work related stress and, you know, we are
25 referring him on that basis, we would then advise them 15:53
26 to use the HSE work positive stress, guidance on work
27 related factors and stress factors to address the
28 individual. So they would sit down with the individual
29 and talk through what factors at work do you think are

1 causing you stress. But from our own point of view,
2 what we would be looking at is whether there is any
3 illness that is, you know, developing or presenting as
4 a result of the stress that the member is saying the
5 factors, whatever the factors are, and discuss them. 15:54

6 381 Q. We will come to your view obviously after we deal with
7 the consultation. You had the consultation with Garda
8 Keogh on 18th December 2015?

9 A. Yes.

10 382 Q. You have notes there at page 3791 and 2. Just if we go 15:54
11 slightly back up the page, we will see, it says:
12
13 "Level of current duties if at work: N/A but prior to
14 absence normal policing duties as station orderly at
15 station." 15:55
16
17 Is that right?

18 A. Yes.

19 383 Q. And then: 15:55
20
21 "Basis for this review or consultation: New absence
22 concerns and concerns about member's wellbeing
23 following last OHS review and follow on from case
24 conference of the 9/12/2015."
25 A. Yes. 15:55

26 384 Q. Now, again you have a number of starred points, if we
27 could go through them one-by-one. I think the first
28 one is:
29

1 "Since last seen further periods of short-term
2 absences, some of concern highlighted."
3 A. Four days.
4 385 Q. "Four days in July. Had forgotten he was."
5 A. "Rostered". 15:56
6 386 Q. "Rostered after calling in off sick on the 10th July.
7 Attributes this to drinking while off and taking Xanax
8 with alcohol on the 9/7. In November he went off after
9 being directed to do Haddington Road hours, which he
10 says he had done in October (was off 4/7)." 15:56
11 A. Four days as well.
12 387 Q. Four days. Yes. The next starred point is --
13 A. "Says stressed by".
14 388 Q. "Says stressed by difficulties with his senior
15 management. Extra supervision issues with his car tax, 15:56
16 issues surrounding the knowledge that he is a
17 whistleblower, working in the same station with a
18 colleague who is the subject of his complaint, and
19 describes himself as stressed on a daily basis by it
20 all." 15:57
21
22 Now, just in the context of your having dealt with him
23 thus far, both in '12, '13 and early in '15 and your
24 knowledge of his difficulty with his alcohol, were you
25 seeing this as a review of whether he was suffering 15:57
26 from work related stress in any form or fashion or
27 whether he was suffering from an illness related to his
28 alcohol addiction?
29 A. It would have been both of them.

1 389 Q. Both of them.
2 A. Yes.
3 390 Q. The next starred one is:
4
5 "Admits started drinking again in July 2015." 15:57
6 A. And wasn't, particularly after assigned to a station
7 orderly role.
8 391 Q. "After assigned to a station orderly role. Says he
9 took a Xanax previously prescribed by a GP with alcohol
10 which affected him." 15:57
11
12 And then:
13
14 "Says concerned and..."
15 A. Affects him as he has to work with a friend. 15:58
16 392 Q. Yes. "Affects him as he has to work with a friend of
17 the member who was the subject of his complaint. Not
18 happy that local management didn't take or have not
19 taken this into cognisance."
20 A. Yeah, cognisance. 15:58
21 393 Q. "Says situation fraught and they don't speak with each
22 other.
23
24 In respect of drinking and being under the influence,
25 says no driving since July 2015, if he has been 15:58
26 drinking for a day."
27 A. "Says he gets rid of his keys."
28 394 Q. "Says he gets rid of his keys."
29 A. Yeah.

1 395 Q. "Says drinking and binges" is that something heavily?
2 A. "Usually heavily".
3 396 Q. It is continued on next page then.
4
5 "Mixed of beer and/or wine, would be up to 56 cans of 15:59
6 larger or 14 bottles of wine."
7
8 what is that next word, something quite heavily.
9 A. "And usually quite heavily on off days or rest days,
10 which affects his return to work (first day back)." 15:59
11 397 Q. Then something about tobacco?
12 A. Smokes rolls of tobacco,.
13 398 Q. "Smokes rolls of tobacco, about 15 a day. Good support
14 from his mother. Enjoys his pets and going for walk
15 with same." 15:59
16 A. "Tries to eat regular meals."
17 399 Q. "Says he has an appointment with GP on 22/12/2015 and
18 agreed OHP and GP."
19 A. "Communicate in respect of clinical management and
20 supports." 15:59
21 400 Q. Yes. "Discussed how we progress from here and agreed
22 must engage with treatment interventions as referred by
23 GP and linking interactively with GP. Continues to
24 engage with EAS supports. Return to work will be
25 supported depending on GP certification. Importance of 16:00
26 compliance reiterated. Agreed temporarily unfit to
27 attend and work pending re-evaluation with GP."
28
29 And then there is a phrase:

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

"Classification on absence basis. Report to HRPD absence section OHP to highlight. OHP is to communicate with GP in order to progress."

A. "Clinical management issues."

16:00

401 Q. "Clinical management issues. Follow up review with relevant updates."

Now, did you convey to Garda Keogh on this date that he was unfit to work and shouldn't return to duty on this date?

16:00

A. Yes, I did.

402 Q. The reference to "classification on absence basis, report to HRPD", can you help us with what that was?

A. No, because the whole thing -- I think part of the discussion we would have had, wouldn't go into detail, it was about the classification of his absence.

16:01

Because it came up again that his absences were still being classified as ordinary illness and there hadn't been any movement on that. So I said I was going to highlight it in my report or make a reference to it. Just to kind of say that, management had not sought my opinion in relation to whether his absences could be classified or whether it could be classified as work related stress or not.

16:01

16:01

403 Q. Yes.

A. And where management do not request that, we do not as a routine make or provide any specific opinion in relation to that, because the issue of classification

1 of absence does not lie with us.

2 404 Q. Yes.

3 A. But we could flag it to them in a way to make them
4 understand that, you know, this is -- so that we can
5 make -- you know, we can follow that up in terms of 16:02
6 exploring it, both HR and local management.

7 405 Q. Yes.

8 A. But if they ask us specifically about that, we will
9 then trigger our own process, which is about providing
10 us the information about what they had gathered in 16:02
11 relation to work related stress and examining that to
12 see whether there was a clinical possibility that these
13 factors could be generating any illness.

14 406 Q. Yes. So, I suppose putting this way: If the referral
15 form that is sent up to you and you're simply asked to 16:02
16 assess him and see whether he is fit for policing
17 duties.

18 A. Yeah.

19 407 Q. You don't necessarily assess whether he has stress to
20 the extent that it is an illness, unless you are 16:02
21 requested to do so?

22 A. No, we will do an assessment as to whether there is an
23 illness present or not, but in terms of the
24 certification.

25 408 Q. Yes. 16:03

26 A. The classification of the illness, we don't offer any
27 comments because unless there is a specific question to
28 us from management in that regard.

29 409 Q. Okay.

1 A. Yeah.

2 410 Q. Can I just draw your attention to Garda Keogh's account
3 of this meeting at different parts of our papers?

4 A. Okay.

5 411 Q. At page 78 of our papers, this is Garda Keogh's 16:03
6 statement made to our investigators. And he says:
7
8 "I met with the CMO, Dr. Oghuvbu, and through
9 discussions with him we established that I was not
10 being recorded as being out with work related stress 16:03
11 but instead was being recorded as being out with viral
12 flu."
13
14 Do you agree with that?

15 A. It's possible, because that would have been the SAMS 16:03
16 report that I had.

17 412 Q. Yes. He goes on to say:
18
19 "The CMO showed me a sheet of paper with me recorded
20 out of work with viral flu throughout." 16:04
21
22 Is that correct?

23 A. That would be reflective of the SAMS report that I had.

24 413 Q. Yes. "He asked me whether my sick certificates had
25 work related stress on them as the reason I was out 16:04
26 sick. I told him that they did."
27
28 Do you recollect that?

29 A. Probably.

1 414 Q. Pardon.

2 A. I would have asked him the question. If I had the SAMS
3 certificate there and he was saying that and I was
4 showing him that, we would have had a discussion back,
5 you know, about that, but I wouldn't know the details 16:04
6 of the discussion. But he would have asked and I would
7 have said, well, the information I have is this, and he
8 would have been saying that this reflects that. And I
9 would have asked specifically that, because again, I am
10 not involved in certification, I just had the SAMS 16:04
11 sheet with me and all I can do is reference that.

12 415 Q. Yes. Anyway, he says he told you that they did. He
13 then says:
14
15 "The CMO went to look for a folder and took a folder 16:05
16 from a cabinet. He then said he was going to talk to
17 someone high up about this."
18
19 Do you recollect that occurring?

20 A. I wouldn't recollect that. 16:05

21 416 Q. Pardon.

22 A. I can't recall it.

23 417 Q. You don't recollect?

24 A. No.

25 418 Q. Okay. At page 136 of our documents, in an original 16:05
26 earlier statement, at heading 15, seven or eight lines
27 down there he said:
28
29 "This anomaly was advised to me by the Chief Medical

1 Officer on 18th December 2015 and he appeared to be as
2 baffled as I."

3

4 I don't know, does that help you remember? Do you
5 remember being baffled? 16:05

6 A. I wouldn't be baffled about that. I can't recall being
7 baffled. But I wouldn't be baffled because there is a
8 discrepancies between the member's account of the
9 reasons of his absence and what is recorded on the SAMS
10 thing. I wouldn't be, because that does happen and I 16:06
11 wouldn't -- again, like I said, the classification of
12 absence is not my --

13 419 Q. CHAIRMAN: You understood the classification.

14 A. Yeah.

15 420 Q. CHAIRMAN: And that it would be down as flu/viral? 16:06

16 A. Yes.

17 421 Q. CHAIRMAN: Or as ordinary illness?

18 A. Illness, yeah.

19 422 Q. CHAIRMAN: Unless and until it was determined that it
20 was work related stress? 16:06

21 A. Yes.

22 423 Q. CHAIRMAN: So therefore, you wouldn't be surprised or
23 baffled?

24 A. No. That wouldn't be an accurate description of how I
25 would respond to that. 16:06

26 424 Q. CHAIRMAN: But it may well have come as a shock to
27 Garda Keogh because his doctor's certificates were
28 saying work related stress?

29 A. Work related stress, yes.

1 425 Q. CHAIRMAN: And now he is discovering that it is being
2 recorded as flu/viral?
3 A. Yes.

4 426 Q. CHAIRMAN: So it wouldn't make him very happy?
5 A. Yes. 16:07

6 CHAIRMAN: Okay.

7 427 Q. MR. McGUINESS: In a subsequent letter to the Minister
8 for Justice in May of 2016, it's said on behalf of
9 Garda Keogh that:
10 16:07

11 "On 18/12/2015 I was sent to the Chief Medical Officer
12 in Garda HQ, Phoenix Park, where I had a conversation
13 with Dr. Oghuvbu and I outlined 15 types of harassment
14 from being subjected to internal investigations to
15 every aspect of my work being scrutinised." 16:07

16
17 He then specifies them. Now, you obviously have
18 recorded in your notes instances of what he described
19 to you there --

20 A. Yes. 16:07

21 428 Q. -- on the first page of your notes, isn't that correct?
22 A. Yeah, there are two particular highlighted things that
23 came out in the course of that conversation.

24 429 Q. Pardon?
25 A. There were two things that came out, highlight things, 16:07
26 because of our conversation, which I made a note of.

27 430 Q. Yes. He doesn't refer to giving you a document there,
28 nor does he -- he seems to refer to a conversation
29 about them. You don't appear to record receiving a

1 document from him at that point.

2 A. He did present a document, a script where he had
3 written a list of -- as a memoire for himself.

4 431 Q. Yes.

5 A. An aide memoire for himself, I presume, of different 16:08
6 things that he was concerned about.

7 432 Q. Yes.

8 A. He went through them and I took -- I acknowledged them
9 as part of the -- but I didn't record them into my
10 notes. 16:08

11 433 Q. Yes.

12 A. At the end of the consultation he said that he wanted
13 me to have a copy of it. I made a copy of it and I
14 kept it.

15 434 Q. Yes. 16:08

16 A. I think that was all, that was the end of it.

17 435 Q. We will come obviously to the later consultation you
18 had with him.

19 A. Yeah.

20 436 Q. Where your notes do refer to a script as such. I am 16:08
21 wondering, did you get them on the occasion of your
22 second meeting with him?

23 A. I think it was -- I may be mixing up the dates there.
24 But I think the one where I make reference to that
25 script is the one where he gave me the script. 16:09

26 437 Q. Okay. Well, we will come to that in due course. But
27 after this consultation, it appears that you tried to
28 phone his own doctor on the day, on the 18th September.
29 If we look at page 3793. The date at the side, it's

1 7/1/2016, 12:48.

2

3 "Telephone call with GP on foot of unsuccessful attempt
4 on 18/12/2015. Member attended GP on the 22/12/2015.
5 GP agrees or indicates currently not fit to return to 16:09
6 work. Referral to local source outpatient."

7 A. "Local service".

8 438 Q. "Local service outpatient but preference is for
9 inpatient treatment."

10 A. Yes. 16:10

11 439 Q. So that is something that you discussed with
12 Dr. Bartlett; is that right?

13 A. Yes, I did.

14 440 Q. Okay. "To be reviewed in the next fortnight. Further
15 decision to be followed up." 16:10

16

17 Is that right?

18 A. "To be fed back".

19 441 Q. "To be fed back". Okay. "HRPD update report." 16:10

20

21 Then you have signed that. Dr. Bartlett has a note
22 recorded, if we perhaps just look at that, 10643. It's
23 on that date, if we just scroll down.

24

25 "7th January '16, telephone call. Doctor, Phoenix 16:11
26 Park. Discussion re Nicholas. I have advised that
27 local CAD referral has been made."

28 A. Yes.

29 442 Q. "I will review Nicholas prn."

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

That is entered by Dr. Bartlett?

A. Yes.

443 Q. I am just wondering, it was later on that day, in fact, on the 8th when you formally wrote to the executive director?

16:11

A. Yes.

444 Q. Giving your view. Were you holding off on your view as to whether he was unfit for work until you had spoken to his GP?

16:11

A. No, no. I think I had already made that decision, if I am not mistaken. I had already said I agreed temporarily unfit to attend at work pending reevaluation with GP. So I wanted him to be seen by his GP. So I had already made that decision that he was unfit. But the reason why I was contacting his GP was, I was concerned about his clinical management. That I felt that that needed that to be intensified. So I wanted to talk to the GP so that we were on the same page in terms of getting him access to the right clinical management.

16:12

16:12

445 Q. Okay. We heard from Garda Quinn yesterday, who gave evidence and produced his notes. He had a note of a phone conversation with you on the same day as the examination, the 18th?

16:12

A. Yes.

446 Q. Perhaps if we could look at that note. It's on Volume 37, 10619. This would appear perhaps most likely to have been a conversation that took place after your

1 consultation with Garda Keogh but on the same day.

2 A. Yes.

3 447 Q. But you might just read it there.

4

5 "Dr. Oghuvbu rang me to discuss and clarify and get my 16:12
6 opinion about some of the difficulties that the member
7 was encountering with his superintendent."

8 A. Yes.

9 448 Q. "I spoke with the member after his visit to the CMO."

10 A. Yes. 16:13

11 449 Q. That's he, Garda Ryan.

12

13 "I suggested that he document fully any incident where
14 he felt he was being treated unfairly or
15 inappropriately by his superintendent." 16:13

16

17 Do you recollect ringing Garda Quinn?

18 A. I would have spoken with him as an employee assistance
19 officer, supporting him, and said, look, I was
20 concerned about that. It appeared there were issues 16:13
21 between himself and the superintendent, it could have
22 been a misunderstanding between them, I don't know what
23 it was, and I said I want to ask -- because of the role
24 of the employee assistance officer is a welfare support
25 to the individual, so if there is an issue where the 16:13
26 individual was having difficulty with either their
27 supervisor or their management, I would usually bring
28 it to their attention, to say that, look, maybe we need
29 to kind of explore this with the individual and see

1 what can be done in relation to it. But it's not a
2 medical advisory or anything.

3 450 Q. Yes.

4 A. Yes.

5 451 Q. Garda Quinn in evidence yesterday said he gave it as 16:14
6 opinion, that he thought Garda Keogh was being treated
7 perhaps harshly by the superintendent, do you recall
8 any --

9 A. I wouldn't recall it. I think that came out -- sorry,
10 if I go back to my notes, the clinical notes on the 16:14
11 18th December, I said:

12

13 "He felt stressed by difficulties with his senior
14 management in terms of extra supervision."

15 16:14

16 So those would have been the things I would have
17 discussed with him, to say that, look, this is what he
18 is saying. I have no way of validating or anything.

19 452 Q. Yes.

20 A. I am bringing it to your attention as a support. 16:14

21 453 Q. Yes.

22 A. To see whether you can do anything, you know, in terms
23 of supporting him from that perspective.

24 454 Q. Yes. So you were linking in with his support officer
25 and his GP then? 16:14

26 A. Yes.

27 455 Q. You did report then to Mr. Barrett on the 8th January,
28 if we look at page 3750. That's dated the 8th January.
29 In second paragraph he says:

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

"The member has been absent since 8/12/2015, certified on medical grounds for a reactive loss of wellbeing set against a background of reported issues in the workplace or associated with his work, and complicated by inappropriate use of alcohol. A case conference was held on 9/12/2015 and local management are conversing with the issues in this case."

That description in the second line there, was that intended to reflect what Garda Keogh had said to you about the issues?

A. Yes. Without going into details about what was said.

456 Q. Yes.

A. But just to flag that these were his concerns.

457 Q. Then he said:

"Based on the information available to me, my opinion and recommendations in respect of the member are as follows: Medical fitness recommendations:

1. Following consultation on the 18/12 and update now received from the member's doctor, the member is deemed temporarily unfit to attend regularly at work and for policing duties. Relevant treatment interventions have been initiated by his doctor and updates are expected.
2. The member has been advised to avail of the confidential support services afforded members as required.
3. Further review - further advices shall be offered

1 as anticipated updates become available.

2 4. In the event that the member's doctor certifies him

3 fit to return to work prior to further advices from

4 this service, this service should be notified on a

5 priority basis so that the relevant guidance on 16:16

6 workplace accommodations/adjustments can be offered."

7 A. Yes.

8 458 Q. You I think next saw him on the 19th May, is that

9 correct, 2016?

10 A. Yes, 19th May 2016. 16:17

11 459 Q. Yes. Again, you appear to have had access to the SAMS

12 recording there. If we look at page 3692. There is an

13 up-to-date copy of it there. It's dated 19/5?

14 A. 3692?

15 460 Q. 3652. 16:17

16 A. Oh, I'm very sorry.

17 461 Q. I beg your pardon. Your report of the 8th January that

18 we have looked at doesn't seem to raise the issue of

19 classification one way or another for the HR

20 department? 16:17

21 A. I highlighted there were work related concerns being

22 reported by the member, but that was just all I said I

23 was going to do, I was going to highlight it but I

24 wasn't going to dwell on it.

25 462 Q. Okay. In any event, you saw him on the 19th? 16:18

26 A. Yeah, on the 19th of...

27 463 Q. Your notes are on page 3795. The level of current

28 duties not applicable, he's not at work.

29

1 "Basis for this review or consultation: Review of
2 clinical progress and of fitness to return to work and
3 for policing duties."
4
5 Then you have got a starred set of comments or a record 16:18
6 of it.
7
8 "Situation has not improved for him personally and at
9 this time the..."
10 16:19
11 Is that the background circumstances?
12 A. "And at this time the background circumstances and
13 publicity about the whistleblower aspect is weighing
14 very negatively on the member."
15 464 Q. Okay. You then have recorded bringing? 16:19
16 A. No bingeing.
17 465 Q. Sorry:
18
19 "Bingeing on additional alcohol still three to four
20 days episode, anxiety and feeling low have also crept 16:19
21 in."
22 A. Yeah.
23 466 Q. "Sees GP and tries to keep up with CADs follow up but
24 patchy. Open to further intervention but engagement
25 will depend on him." 16:19
26
27 The next one is:
28
29 "Quite situated, the impact of work and how he has been

1 treated as being responsible for everything. Has
2 script detailing events as he sees them since 2014."

3 A. That's his script, sorry.

4 467 Q. Is that when he produced the script; is that correct?

5 A. Yes. 16:20

6 468 Q. You took a copy of that, you said, at the time, is that
7 right?

8 A. Yes.

9 469 Q. "Open to OHP discussing clinical intervention options
10 at this stage and to optimise treatment. Agreed to 16:20
11 continue to avail of organisational supports. Has
12 found EAS officer very supportive in the circumstances.
13 Agree temporarily unfit."

14

15 470 Q. CHAIRMAN: what were the clinical intervention options? 16:20

16 A. In terms of -- because he was attending this service
17 locally, which his GP had arranged, it was a voluntary
18 service. I began to feel that it wasn't intensive
19 enough and would not achieve the goals that we wanted.

20 471 Q. CHAIRMAN: Being? 16:20

21 A. In terms of helping him to get over the difficulties he
22 was experiencing with alcohol. That the service he was
23 attending --

24 472 Q. CHAIRMAN: He had to give up drink?

25 A. Pardon. 16:20

26 473 Q. CHAIRMAN: He had to give up alcohol?

27 A. He had to give up drinking and he needed to be in a
28 service that would facilitate that. So I discussed,
29 you know, in terms of inpatient treatment, which I

1 thought would be the preferable thing. And I mentioned
2 that to his GP before.

3 474 Q. CHAIRMAN: Was there any option to treat stress?

4 A. The thing with -- I would just say this about stress.
5 In terms of stress, the approach to stress is, if you 16:21
6 identify what the stressor is, you remove the stressor.
7 And in his case it was obvious to him -- to me,
8 listening to him then, that his perceptions about the
9 way management had treated him were a big factor, the
10 fact that the whistleblowing thing was there in the 16:21
11 public domain was weighing very heavily on him, because
12 I think he would not be somebody who would like the
13 publicity, who was comfortable with the publicity
14 around it. So, unless you are able to take away those
15 things, that sense of responding to difficulty will 16:21
16 remain there, there isn't very much you can do about
17 it. Whether that was driving the alcohol, the
18 difficulties with alcohol --

19 475 Q. CHAIRMAN: How would that be driving the alcohol? What
20 would be the connection? 16:22

21 A. Well, in terms of how people cope with challenges, some
22 people it would be food, in the presence of stress,
23 with some people it's food, either eating too much or
24 not eating at all. Some people, they might become
25 obsessed with maybe like exercise and they over 16:22
26 exercise as a way of compensating. For some people who
27 smoke, they find themselves smoking more. They just
28 kind of find something to help to kind of diffuse that
29 tension that they feel inside. For some people

1 unfortunately they may recourse to alcohol. We would,
2 from the medical perspective, generally say that
3 alcohol is not a very useful means of dealing with
4 that, because in itself alcohol is a depressant. So it
5 is not going to actually make you feel better in any 16:23
6 shape or form, so we would generally say people
7 shouldn't use alcohol as a coping mechanism when they
8 are faced with stress.

9 476 Q. CHAIRMAN: He has been having this problem since 2012?
10 A. Yes. 16:23

11 477 Q. CHAIRMAN: And he hasn't got over it?
12 A. Well, that does happen because --

13 478 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, no, no, this isn't a moral --
14 A. Yeah.

15 479 Q. CHAIRMAN: This isn't a moral question here? 16:23
16 A. Yeah.

17 480 Q. CHAIRMAN: We're talking practicalities here and
18 treatment options.
19 A. He had been having treatment options. Okay, in --

20 481 Q. CHAIRMAN: Clinical options? 16:23
21 A. Yeah, clinical options.

22 482 Q. CHAIRMAN: This has been going on since long before the
23 publicity?
24 A. Yeah. And I mean like --

25 483 Q. CHAIRMAN: And it's obviously a very intractable, 16:23
26 difficult problem?
27 A. Yes, it is, but it can be addressed. Because between
28 2012, when he was admitted to St. John of God, most of
29 the management he had was really about attending his GP

1 and trying to go to AA and the service, the local
2 service. whether those were sufficient, because they
3 were mainly voluntary, so it all depended on how
4 much he wanted to --

5 484 Q. CHAIRMAN: Does it not have to be voluntary in the end 16:24
6 for it to work?

7 A. At the end of the day it has to be voluntary.

8 485 Q. CHAIRMAN: It's not going to work.

9 A. No.

10 486 Q. CHAIRMAN: There's no point in shoving him in and 16:24
11 locking the door.

12 A. No. And that was where we came to in May 2016, that I
13 felt that he was a little bit more open now about
14 having a more intensive type treatment. And that's
15 what the discussion was about. 16:24

16 487 Q. CHAIRMAN: But from whenever it was, whenever the
17 problem was, and however long it continues?

18 A. Yes.

19 488 Q. CHAIRMAN: He has to decide?

20 A. He has to make the decision that I am going to get the 16:24
21 treatment, yes.

22 489 Q. CHAIRMAN: And keep to it. I mean it's difficult?

23 A. It is difficult.

24 490 Q. CHAIRMAN: Nobody is making a moral judgment or
25 anything else. 16:25

26 A. No, it is difficult.

27 491 Q. CHAIRMAN: Anybody who knows anything about addiction
28 or illness, physical or psychological, knows that these
29 are big questions.

1 A. It is difficult.

2 492 Q. CHAIRMAN: And difficult questions.

3 A. It's difficult and you have to make the choice to

4 engage with the treatment that is being offered. For

5 some people the level of treatment he was given, he was 16:25

6 receiving would have been sufficient, but, you know,

7 for some people and in his case it probably wasn't.

8 But he had to come to the place where he decided that,

9 you know what, I want this. And I think around that

10 time when I saw him in May 2016 we are coming to that. 16:25

11 493 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. And stress features.

12 A. Yes.

13 494 Q. CHAIRMAN: I know what you say about stress and it's

14 not an illness and everybody feels stressed at some

15 time. But stress or severe stress is going to put 16:25

16 extra pressure on somebody who is already vulnerable --

17 A. Yes.

18 495 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- because of alcohol addiction.

19 A. Yes, it will. It will.

20 CHAIRMAN: Okay, thanks. 16:26

21 496 Q. MR. MCGUINNESS: I think, doctor, just to identify the

22 pages that you took a copy of, they're in our papers

23 now at 15956 and 15957. If you start at the top there.

24 I think that's the first page of it.

25 A. Yes, it looks like that is his handwriting. 16:26

26 497 Q. Yes, and there has been a redaction there. And there

27 is a second page then on the next one?

28 A. Yes.

29 498 Q. Garda Keogh kept the original then; is that right?

1 A. Yes, he did.

2 499 Q. All right. You didn't see it obviously as your
3 function to enquire into those matters?

4 A. No.

5 500 Q. I think within a week or two or perhaps a slightly 16:27
6 longer, period, you spoke with his GP on the 7th June;
7 isn't that correct?

8 A. It would be correct I think.

9 501 Q. Could we look at Dr. Bartlett's notes first, at 10644.
10 I'm sorry, I don't see a reference there to a phone 16:28
11 call, but you have in your own notes a reference to a
12 phone call.

13 A. Yes.

14 502 Q. Perhaps we will just leave that page up. Sorry, we
15 will go back to page 3796. You've recorded there: 16:28
16
17 "Telephone call with GP in response to OHP message of
18 20/5/2015. Member attended GP on Friday past. Still
19 binges and reactive loss of well being with..."
20 16:28
21 what is that word

22 A. "Anxiety".

23 503 Q. "Anxiety ++ and stressed out by same. Finding the
24 situation difficult to handle. Open to..."

25 A. "Exploring other treatment options." 16:29

26 504 Q. "...either locally or..."

27 A. "Away".

28 505 Q. "Including"

29 A. "Private psychiatry input".

1 506 Q. "View is currently unfit."

2

3

what is the next phrase there?

4

A. "Pursue new intervention then review progress. Will
5 arrange appointment to follow up with member."

16:29

6

7 507 Q. Okay. I think following that phone call you wrote a
8 report on the 10th June. If we look at page 3741 of
9 the papers. This is a report back to the executive
10 director. The last paragraph is as follows:

16:29

11

12 "In the context of ongoing background issues reportedly
13 associated with the member's work, which appear to be
14 having a significant negative impact on the member's
15 sense of wellbeing and maintenance of same, I recommend
16 a priority case conference involving your office and
17 the member's senior divisional management. This would
18 facilitate elucidation of reasonable and practicable
19 supportive workplace considerations to foster his
20 sustained wellbeing and effectiveness when a return to
21 work becomes feasible."

16:30

16:30

22

23 Was it your intention there to try and build upon his
24 willingness to engage in inpatient treatment
25 particularly?

16:30

26

A. Yes, it was.

27

508 Q. Okay. I think you did have a further telephone contact
28 with the doctor in advance of the conference on the
29 12th June, is that correct?

1 A. I might have, I am not --

2 509 Q. We will go back to your note there, at 3796.

3

4 "12/7/2016. 12:53. Telephone call with GP. Use
5 conference today to see how best AGS can support 16:31
6 member's treatment and recovery of wellbeing. Advised
7 GP that AGS will facilitate."

8 A. "Access to residential care."

9 510 Q. "Access to residential care in the light of member as
10 willingness to access." 16:31

11 A. "Access same now.

12 511 Q. "GP due to meet member today and will."

13

14 Is that discuss?

15 A. "Clarify further". 16:31

16 512 Q. "Clarify further on residential care. Reiterated that
17 AGS will support member's treatment and rehabilitation
18 without prejudice to background circumstances."

19

20 when you are referring to background circumstances, 16:31
21 what do you mean there?

22 A. That, you know, with everything that was going on, that
23 the decision to support his wellbeing and to support
24 his treatment now, was on the basis that he was willing
25 to engage and there were going to be significant 16:32
26 financial costs associated. So without prejudice to
27 any of that, I was pushing that, look, let's do this
28 really. And there was a general consensus that this is
29 probably the right thing to do. So that was what that

1 is about.

2 513 Q. And then:

3

4 "Agree to feedback to OHP if any relevant development."

5 16:32

6 I think there is a note in Dr. Bartlett's note of that

7 phone call, if we go back to 10644. There is a

8 reference to psychiatric issue of assessment there.

9 And then 17th June.

10 A. 17th. 16:32

11 514 Q. If we go down there. Reference to Lexapro. And then

12 there's a phone call there towards the end, if you

13 scroll down a tiny bit?

14 A. Yes.

15 515 Q. "Main surgery, phone call. Has been informed that Nick 16:33

16 is going to admit himself for a residential stay for

17 alcohol. TX. He has explained that following a case

18 conference today he has been advised Garda service to

19 support Nick in all ways possible re financial

20 support." 16:33

21

22 If we go down there.

23

24 "Met with Nick he is self referring to... cancelled.

25 Repeat Lexapro." 16:33

26

27 what is Lexapro?

28 A. It is an antidepressant medication.

29 516 Q. There are notes of the case conference then on the 12th

1 July, at page 3647. Your contribution appears to be
2 recorded there in the middle column, is that correct?

3 A. That's right.

4 517 Q. There appears to have been unanimity in the sense of
5 everyone agreeing that this was the way forward, isn't
6 that right? 16:34

7 A. Yes.

8 518 Q. There was then arrangements made for the funding of it
9 too, isn't that correct?

10 A. Yes. 16:34

11 519 Q. There is no reference to any local management
12 observations there. Do you remember Chief
13 Superintendent Wheatley saying anything? Or do you
14 remember whether Superintendent Murray was there?

15 A. I wouldn't remember who was at the case conference 16:34
16 other than the recording of who the attendees were.
17 And in terms of individual comments, I wouldn't know
18 what anybody said individually.

19 520 Q. Yes. You appear to have phoned Garda Quinn on the 18th
20 July to inform him about the position regarding the 16:35
21 funding for it, do you recall doing that?

22 A. I probably did that, yeah. Because being his support
23 officer, I would have probably linked up with him to
24 say that I had been approved or something.

25 521 Q. Yes. I think you received an update after Garda Keogh 16:35
26 had gone in to treatment and you reported on that, I
27 think, as you said you would, back to OHP. Is that
28 your report of 21st July 2016, at page 3740?

29 A. Yes.

1 522 Q. That sets out the position as it was there. Now, is
2 there anything further you would like to add to that?
3 A. Just one point. You know the report we couldn't find.
4 523 Q. Yes.
5 A. The one from the 19th May. 16:36
6 524 Q. Yes?
7 A. It's at 3741.
8 525 Q. 3741?
9 A. Yes.
10 526 Q. I beg your pardon, thank you for that. Perhaps we will 16:36
11 look at that for completion. That records that you --
12 A. Sorry, no, that is wrong. That is 2016. It is 2015 we
13 were looking for.
14 527 Q. Yes.
15 A. Okay, sorry. Sorry about that. 16:36
16 528 Q. That is okay.
17 A. Just the dates, because it was May, I mixed up the
18 dates.
19 529 Q. We have seen from Ms. Carr's statement that there were
20 a number of subsequent requests to you to schedule an 16:36
21 appointment for Garda Keogh?
22 A. Yes.
23 530 Q. And I think none of those went ahead, isn't that
24 correct?
25 A. They didn't because I think -- I am not sure which of 16:37
26 the correspondence address it, but I think there was
27 correspondence that said he was not willing to return
28 to work until these matters were addressed. And
29 management were aware of that. And where they were

1 asking me to come and assess about his fitness, I
2 didn't think that it was appropriate in the context of
3 what was very much in the public domain at that point
4 in time to do that.

5 531 Q. Yes. 16:37

6 A. So that is the reason why I didn't.

7 532 Q. There is a reference to I think a conversation with you
8 and Garda Quinn on the 10th March, where he I think
9 relayed to you that Garda Keogh wouldn't be coming to
10 you, do you recall that? 16:37

11 A. Yeah, I do.

12 533 Q. So, I mean, it seems to remain the position that you
13 were never formally asked to assess Garda Keogh on the
14 basis of suffering from an injury arising out of work
15 related stress, is that accurate? 16:38

16 A. Yeah. There was no -- well, he was absent, he was
17 being certified by his doctor as absent, he was
18 referred on that basis. But if it's an issue about the
19 classification of his absence, I was never asked for an
20 opinion in relation to the classification of his 16:38
21 absence.

22 534 Q. Yes.

23 A. And I have never been asked about classification of his
24 absence.

25 535 Q. Yes. Okay. 16:38

26 A. To give a view or an opinion on it. And I think on two
27 occasions I flagged that there were work related
28 issues, you know, but I have never been asked to
29 formally give an opinion, which suggests that --

1 536 Q. CHAIRMAN: Nobody has ever said to you --
2 A. Yeah.

3 537 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- is this correct?
4 A. Is this correct.

5 538 Q. CHAIRMAN: Or do you agree that this is -- nobody has 16:38
6 ever asked you that?
7 A. No, they haven't.

8 539 Q. MR. MCGUINNESS: Yes. I think you were here for
9 Ms. Carr's evidence this morning?
10 A. Yes. 16:39

11 540 Q. She seemed to envisage that the CMO would advise them
12 as to whether the absences were causally and directly
13 related to an injury as reported, coming from stress,
14 and that it would be your function to assess whether
15 there was any causation as a result of stress arising 16:39
16 from the workplace?
17 A. Provided there has been a -- there is a query, a
18 question, in the mind of either HR or local management.

19 541 Q. CHAIRMAN: If somebody writes to you.
20 A. Yes. 16:39

21 542 Q. CHAIRMAN: If HR writes to you --
22 A. Yes.

23 543 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- and says, dear CMO, we have a patient, a
24 garda who says or is assessed, please tell us whether
25 in your opinion his condition is arising from work 16:40
26 related stress?
27 A. Yes.

28 544 Q. CHAIRMAN: i.e. is it an injury on duty?
29 A. Yes.

1 545 Q. CHAIRMAN: If you are asked that, you say you'd give an
2 opinion.
3 A. Yes.
4 CHAIRMAN: Okay.

5 546 Q. MR. MCGUINNESS: Perhaps we will just look at the 16:40
6 management of sick absences directive 139/10, at volume
7 28, page 8202. I am bearing in mind obviously that you
8 don't have responsibility for recording the periods of
9 absence?
10 A. No. 16:40

11 547 Q. Or in any way for managing the system under which they
12 are recorded, isn't that correct?
13 A. No, I don't.

14 548 Q. But it says here at the bottom of the page:
15
16 "The Chief Medical Officer (CMO) advising the Garda
17 Commissioner on member's medical fitness for policing
18 duties. In forming a medical opinion, the CMO takes
19 into account all medical information available at the
20 time. Where the CMO advises that a member is fit for 16:41
21 full/slight/restricted police duties, the member will
22 resume duty immediately on being notified of same by
23 the member's district officer/superintendent."
24

25 Is there any comment you would like to make on that? 16:41
26 A. No, that is kind of pretty standard, that we would
27 advise on fitness. So if a member is out and has been
28 referred to ourselves and there is an opinion being --
29 when they are referred to us, they usually would say

1 that, okay, we want medical advice as to whether this
2 person is fit to be at work or not, if they are fit to
3 be at work, what are they fit to do. We would provide
4 that opinion. But that is a very basic part of what we
5 do.

16:41

6 549 Q. If we can go down on to the next page, it goes down to
7 issues of injury on duty then, if we go down to page
8 8204. This is the section relating to injury on duty
9 classification. It says:

10
11 "Where there is any doubt that an injury on duty
12 occurred, a divisional officer should refer the matter
13 to assistant commissioner HRM, who will seek advices of
14 the CMO. The CMO will take into account all relevant
15 information in arriving at his/her advice.

16:42

16:42

16
17 A decision regarding injury on duty will be based on a
18 complete investigation file into the incident.
19 Management views and recommendations, the assessment
20 and opinion of the CMO.

16:42

21
22 Ordinary illness/injury on duty: Where there is a
23 doubt as to whether the member's sick absence is due to
24 ordinary illness or an injury on duty, the member's
25 absence will be treated as ordinary illness pending a
26 decision on the classification of the injury and in
27 particular the CMO's advice."

16:43

28
29 Then it goes on about pay and retrospection. It

1 appears, does it not, that your function is one of
2 offering advice and offering opinion, it's not making
3 decisions then, isn't that right?

4 A. As far as those matters are concerned, in terms of
5 fitness for work, I have to make a decision. 16:43

6 550 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's a decision, fitness or non-fitness,
7 classically your decision and nobody else's?

8 A. Yes. But classifications such as this, and I think it
9 is important to note that it says that "where there is
10 a doubt", so management, local or HR have a doubt and 16:43
11 they feel that they need clarification on it, then they
12 would seek that clarification and that's where I would
13 give advice and then they would have go and make a
14 decision based on the advice that I have given.

15 551 Q. MR. MCGUINNESS: And they would have to make it clear 16:43
16 what matter they were seeking your advice on, isn't
17 that right?

18 A. Yes.

19 552 Q. If we just look at the next paragraph on the top of the
20 next page, it refers expressly to work related stress. 16:44

21
22 "Where members report non-effective for duty as a
23 result of injury on duty or work related stress, a
24 thorough investigation shall be carried out immediately
25 and the outcome reported to the assistant commissioner 16:44
26 HRM for the attention of the CMO."

27
28 So that's not an investigation you carried out?

29 A. No.

1 553 Q. No. And it should be carried out, it would seem, in
2 advance of the matter being referred to you in normal
3 circumstances?
4 A. Yes, it should.
5 554 Q. Thank you, doctor. There may be other counsel who wish 16:44
6 to ask you some questions?
7 A. Okay.

8
9 END OF EXAMINATION

10 16:44

11 CHAIRMAN: Now, yes.

12 MR. KELLY: Chairman, we have no questions of this
13 witness.

14 CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Thanks very much. Well,
15 Mr. Murphy. 16:44

16 MR. MURPHY: Chairman, thank you. Doctor, I wonder if
17 you could be shown please document 3721 please.

18 MR. KELLY: Chairman, in this pause, I was a little --
19 we have four quick questions.

20 CHAIRMAN: No problem. Mr. Murphy, we will forget this 16:45
21 one for the moment. Not a problem. Homer nods
22 Mr. Kelly. Mr. O'Brien, have you got the four
23 questions.

24 MR. O'BRIEN: May it please you, Chairman.

25 CHAIRMAN: Not a problem. 16:45

26
27
28
29

1 DR. OGHENOVO (OVO) OGHUVBU WAS THEN CROSS-EXAMINED BY
2 MR. O'BRIEN, AS FOLLOWS:

3
4 555 Q. MR. O'BRIEN: Just on an issue separate to what you
5 have just discussed with Mr. McGuinness, Dr. Oghuvbu, 16:46
6 can I ask you, were you aware that Garda Keogh had made
7 a bullying and harassment complaint within An Garda
8 Síochána?

9 A. Not until somewhere around 2018, when one of the
10 assistant commissioners who had been assigned to 16:46
11 investigate --

12 556 Q. Were you aware that Assistant Commissioner Finn was
13 appointed to investigate this?

14 A. Not until he contacted me.

15 557 Q. I wonder could we have page 4111 for a moment, please, 16:46
16 Mr. Kavanagh. This is the statement of Assistant
17 Commissioner Finn. You see there, Dr. Oghuvbu, that in
18 the fourth paragraph down?

19 A. Yes.

20 558 Q. Assistant Commissioner Finn identifies you, if you just 16:46
21 scroll back up, Mr. Kavanagh, just a slight bit please.
22 You will see there he identifies you as a person to
23 whom he wrote on 3rd January 2018?

24 A. That would be correct, yes.

25 559 Q. Can I just ask you, just in relation to that, did you 16:47
26 meet subsequently with Assistant Commissioner Finn in
27 relation to Garda Keogh's bullying and harassment
28 complaint?

29 A. I met with him to clarify, because they had written a

1 letter to me to say that you are one of the people that
2 I have to speak with. So I had a meeting with him to
3 kind of find out what --

4 560 Q. Can you recollect where that meeting was? Was it in
5 Garda Headquarters, was it elsewhere? 16:47

6 A. No, it would have been in Garda Headquarters.

7 561 Q. Can you recollect?

8 A. I can't recall specifically but I think it would have
9 been Garda Headquarters. That is the most likely
10 place. 16:47

11 562 Q. Do you recollect what you discussed with him?

12 A. No. Just about the context of why -- my being called
13 in, what my involvement was, what was my -- why I was
14 being -- my role, what was expected of me, because I
15 didn't know anything about him. 16:47

16 563 Q. CHAIRMAN: And what was expected of you.

17 A. What was expected of me.

18 564 Q. CHAIRMAN: Well then you wanted to know.

19 A. Yes.

20 565 Q. CHAIRMAN: Why are you writing to me? 16:47

21 A. Yeah, why are you writing to me.

22 566 Q. CHAIRMAN: And what did he tell you?

23 A. He said that he had been appointed, because I wouldn't
24 know about any of this thing, but he had been appointed
25 - sorry Chairman - he had been appointed to carry out 16:48
26 an investigation and that I was one of a number of
27 people that he was required to.

28 567 Q. CHAIRMAN: Consult?

29 A. Consult. And that was about it.

1 MR. O' BRIEN: Did he ask you any specific question.

2 A. No.

3 MR. O' BRIEN: I have no further questions, Chairman.

4 568 Q. CHAIRMAN: Thanks you very much. Did you give him
5 something? 16:48

6 A. No, because he provided me an excerpt --

7 569 Q. CHAIRMAN: He said I want to consult you?

8 A. Yes.

9 570 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Then he consults you?

10 A. And then he provides an excerpt subsequently, it comes 16:48
11 in a letter, about the statement. I think it's -- I
12 don't know what page this is now.

13 571 Q. CHAIRMAN: Don't worry about what page.

14 A. So they wanted a response from me. So essentially what
15 he explained to me is that -- and I was required to 16:48
16 provide a response to comments where I had been
17 specifically --

18 572 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, which forms?

19 A. Pardon?

20 573 Q. CHAIRMAN: which forms? 16:48

21 A. I was required to provide a response.

22 MR. O' BRIEN: A response.

23 CHAIRMAN: Oh, I'm sorry. Sorry.

24 A. A response.

25 574 Q. CHAIRMAN: It's late in the afternoon, at least it's 16:49
26 late for me. Sorry, I am just being stupid. He wanted
27 a response, yes.

28 A. Yeah, where I had been specifically mentioned as part
29 of what had been provided.

1 575 Q. CHAIRMAN: So if I am understanding, that is all a
2 pretty neutral affair?

3 A. It's a neutral thing, because I didn't even know that
4 there was a bullying and harassment --

5 CHAIRMAN: Are you happy with that, Mr. O'Brien. 16:49

6 MR. O'BRIEN: Yes.

7 CHAIRMAN: Thanks, Mr. O'Brien.

8

9 END OF EXAMINATION

10

11 CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Murphy. 16:49

12 MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chairman.

13

14 DR. OGHENOVO (OVO) OGHUVBU WAS EXAMINED BY MR. MURPHY,

15 AS FOLLOWS: 16:49

16

17 MR. MURPHY: I wonder if Dr. Oghuvbu could be shown
18 page 9722, please.

19 576 Q. CHAIRMAN: You're forgetting 3721 for the moment?

20 MR. MURPHY: I am going to pass. 16:49

21 CHAIRMAN: That's all right. Thank you. Now you want
22 9722.

23 577 Q. MR. MURPHY: Please. 9722. Doctor, I think you have
24 seen this document a few moments ago, can I just draw
25 your attention to paragraph 1. Do you have a hard
26 copy there. Do you see this letter? 16:50

27 A. Yes.

28 578 Q. Can I ask you just to confirm that on the date you
29 wrote that letter, you said:

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

"The member. "

That is Garda Keogh

"Has now accessed and commenced appropriate inpatient care for a long standing and established clinical condition, which has been the clinical basis of his current absence. "

16:50

A. Yes.

16:50

579 Q. Can you just confirm to the Chairman, that was your clinical assessment?

A. That was my clinical assessment.

580 Q. Yes. And that was your clinical assessment in December of 2015?

16:50

A. Yes, it was.

581 Q. And that was your clinical assessment in May of 2015, that there were issues in relation to alcohol?

A. Yes.

582 Q. In terms of your clinical assessment, was that informed by the pre 2015 medical record going back to 2012, where Garda Keogh had difficulties with alcohol?

16:50

A. Yes.

583 Q. I think you were also aware of Garda Keogh's previous residential treatment in 2012?

16:51

A. Yes, I was.

584 Q. So would all of that information contained in the file have formed that clinical assessment that you made and that you recorded here?

1 A. Yes.

2 585 Q. Insofar as the issue of the decisions that you took in
3 December 2015, if I understood your evidence, you said
4 that you had decided in December 2015 that Garda Keogh
5 was unfit to return to work? 16:51

6 A. Yes, I did.

7 586 Q. And that was your decision?

8 A. Yes.

9 587 Q. And insofar as you may have consulted with Dr. Bartlett
10 after, that was purely consultative? 16:51

11 A. It was consultative.

12 588 Q. Insofar as Garda Keogh maintains that he walked away
13 voluntarily from work in 2015, that isn't correct?

14 A. I'm not -- I cannot recall it how he went away from
15 work in 2015, December, but definitely when I saw him, 16:51
16 I made a medical opinion in relation to his fitness or
17 otherwise for being at work.

18 589 Q. I think, as you indicated to the Chairman a few moments
19 saying, when you made that decision, that is a clinical
20 decision that applies to his capacity to return to 16:52
21 work?

22 A. It is my clinical decision, yes.

23 590 Q. I think the entire system which is operated in which
24 you work indicates that that is a decision that is
25 referred to you for your expert assessment? 16:52

26 CHAIRMAN: The decision fit or unfit for work is the
27 doctor's. As I understand it, that's a decision.

28 MR. MURPHY: Yes.

29 CHAIRMAN: Something else is an opinion.

1 MR. MURPHY: Yes.

2 CHAIRMAN: And for another person to decide.

3 MR. MURPHY: Yes.

4 CHAIRMAN: Okay.

5 591 Q. MR. MURPHY: And in this case, as the Chairman has 16:52
6 suggested, doctor, that was a decision you made in
7 December 2015?

8 A. The medical decision about being unfit for work, that
9 was a medical decision, yeah.

10 592 Q. In the course of the documentation that has been shown, 16:52
11 can I ask you to be shown 10639 please? These are
12 Dr. Bartlett's notes.

13 A. Yes.

14 593 Q. I think Mr. McGuinness has taken you through many of
15 these notes, I am not going to dwell on them but can I 16:53
16 ask you two questions in relation to this. The first
17 relates to the drug Xanax --

18 A. Yes.

19 594 Q. -- which features throughout the course of the
20 prescription from Dr. Bartlett. 16:53

21 A. Yes.

22 595 Q. Can I ask you to confirm to the Chairman what does
23 Xanax do?

24 A. It is a member of the -- it is an anxiolytic, if I want
25 to use that word. 16:53

26 596 Q. And again, excuse me, but could you put that in
27 layman's terms please?

28 A. An anxiolytic is a medication that has a calming effect
29 in terms of --

1 CHAIRMAN: An anxiolytic?

2 A. An anxiolytic, yes. It is used in anxiety.

3 CHAIRMAN: Oh yes, I thought so. It's not a

4 benzodiazepine, is it?

5 A. It is in the same family, yes, benzodiazepine. 16:53

6 597 Q. CHAIRMAN: And its effect is to reduce anxiety?

7 A. Anxiety, yes.

8 598 Q. MR. MURPHY: And then, the Lexapro which is referred to

9 throughout the documents, what does that drug do?

10 A. It is an antidepressant. 16:54

11 599 Q. And in relation to the mixing of Xanax and alcohol,

12 would you agree with me --

13 CHAIRMAN: That they are not a good idea.

14 600 Q. MR. MURPHY: -- yes, that it is medically not a

15 recommended thing to do. 16:54

16 A. Not recommended, no.

17 601 Q. And isn't that because it is the case, in medical

18 terms, mixing Xanax with alcohol increases the

19 potential that a person could experience delusions or

20 hallucinations or seizures compared to just using the 16:54

21 drug on its own?

22 A. They act synergistically, in the sense that the

23 cumulative effect of the two of them is worse than the

24 effect of each one of them.

25 602 Q. CHAIRMAN: Does it take you longer then to come down or 16:54

26 come up after you stop taking them?

27 A. Because at the end of the day they would produce a

28 significant depressive effect on you that is multiple

29 of what each one of them is capable of being on their

1 own. So generally, because alcohol will produce a
2 depressive effect at the end of the day, so generally
3 we say if you are taking Xanax don't drink alcohol,
4 would be the advice from the medical practitioner.

5 603 Q. CHAIRMAN: But people do mix them. They shouldn't, but 16:55
6 they do.

7 A. They mix them, sorry, initially it causes a buzz, a
8 feeling of a buzz, that's what it is called. So there
9 is a big problem, for instance, among college students
10 in America where they were mixing that in social, when 16:55
11 they went out for social outings. But the down the
12 road impact of this was this synergistic effect, which
13 was more severe depression and hallucinations and all
14 types of things happening. So generally it is not
15 recommended. You wouldn't recommend it. 16:55

16 604 Q. CHAIRMAN: In fact, it is highly unrecommended?

17 A. Yes. If your doctor knows you are on Xanax, if your
18 doctor knows you have an alcohol problem they will not
19 generally want you to use Xanax. They will tell you to
20 stop drinking alcohol if they are going to prescribe 16:55
21 Xanax to you.

22 605 Q. MR. MURPHY: And is this because of the established
23 medical awareness that this combination gives rise to
24 an increased potential for psychosis or neurological
25 effects?? 16:56

26 A. It does present -- well, it can present with some
27 psychotic features but it is not psychosis per se, but
28 you have hallucination which is a feature of psychosis
29 and then you can have depressive effects, it can affect

1 your speech, just different things, yeah.

2 606 Q. And can it affect the person's perception of things
3 that are happening around them?

4 A. Yes, it would.

5 607 Q. Can it give them an exaggerated perception of events or 16:56
6 an altered perception of events?

7 A. It would give an altered perception of events.

8 608 Q. Thank you. Can I just move forward to your meeting
9 with Garda Keogh in May and I think that should be, and
10 I hope I have the right document here, 3790 please. 16:56

11 A. 3790.

12 609 Q. These are your notes of your meeting in May --

13 A. May 2015.

14 610 Q. -- which have been referred to. First of all, can I
15 ask you to confirm that in these notes, unlike the 16:57
16 notes in December, there's no reference to Garda Keogh
17 telling you that he was suffering from any difficulties
18 with his superiors at work?

19 A. No, I don't recall. If he did, I would have recorded
20 it. And there wasn't anything. I can't recollect him 16:57
21 saying that.

22 611 Q. So, for example, he didn't refer you to any events
23 which may have occurred in 2014 or in the early part of
24 2015 where he mentioned difficulties with his employers
25 in these main notes? 16:57

26 A. No.

27 612 Q. And insofar as there seems to be some indication that
28 Garda Keogh may have indicated later on that he had not
29 met you before, he had in fact met you before, is that

1 right?

2 A. He had.

3 613 Q. Yes.

4 A. Yeah.

5 614 Q. And in terms of that particular meeting I think is it 16:57
6 the case, as a matter of system, that if a guard comes
7 to see you he is free to talk to you in confidence and
8 to tell you anything he wants?

9 A. They are free do, but they don't always do.

10 615 Q. Of course. But it is freedom; there is nobody with 16:58
11 him --

12 A. No.

13 616 Q. -- there is no superior officer present --

14 A. No.

15 617 Q. -- there is no sense of anybody spying in on this 16:58
16 meeting?

17 A. No.

18 618 Q. It is a private meeting between the two of you?

19 A. Yes.

20 619 Q. And therefore can we take it that at that time Garda 16:58
21 Keogh made no complaints to you about any of his
22 superiors?

23 A. I don't think -- I mean, going by my notes, I don't
24 think it featured much in the conversation we had that
25 day because it would have been more -- he was at work, 16:58
26 it was more or less in terms of trying to explore what
27 was going on. And just to kind of point out that if
28 you go to the referral letter by Superintendent Murray
29 on the 2nd April 2015 --

1 620 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes?
2 A. -- he talks about supports they had already, that he
3 said, from his perspective, I have put supports to
4 address the issues that he had raised.
5 621 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes? 16:58
6 A. So from my -- I would have viewed it at that point in
7 time, that's what I would expect management to do.
8 622 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes?
9 A. That if somebody has flagged something to you, put in
10 measures to address that. 16:59
11 MR. MURPHY: Yes.
12 A. So unless those were presenting as a continuing problem
13 it wouldn't really kind of feature big, unless you tell
14 me something that has not been disclosed to me before
15 or you had not disclosed to anybody before. 16:59
16 623 Q. Yes?
17 A. Yes.
18 624 Q. But in contrast, in December we know that he did raise
19 those issues?
20 A. He brought up these things very extensively, so... 16:59
21 625 Q. In terms of the position in May then, were you
22 satisfied that in May what you would have expected to
23 take place had taken place?
24 A. Yes, based on what I had read in the report, yeah.
25 626 Q. And then moving forward to December when you looked 16:59
26 back at what occurred in May, in the December meeting
27 you had a series of concerned people around the table
28 at the conference?
29 A. Yes.

1 627 Q. Can you confirm to the Chairman that the focus of all
2 of those people was on the welfare of Garda Keogh?
3 A. I would say so.

4 628 Q. And insofar as that meeting was concerned, again if we
5 move into 2016, all of the notes that have been put to 16:59
6 you by Mr. McGuinness would you agree with me that they
7 confirm that any discussions in 2016, the focus of An
8 Garda Síochána was to towards Garda Keogh's welfare?
9 A. This is at the case conference in July?

10 629 Q. Yes. 17:00
11 A. Yes, it was.

12 630 Q. I wonder if you can be shown please document 150, in
13 particular page 149. Just to put this in context, this
14 is not a document you will have seen before, this is a
15 documented 14th June 2016 written to the Minister for 17:00
16 Justice and it is written by Garda Keogh. Can I draw
17 your attention please to page 149? Could you move down
18 please about ten lines from the top of the page, and
19 you will see:
20
21 "I was eventually forced out with work related stress
22 certified sick leave since 26th December 2015."
23
24 Do you see that is the complaint that is being made by
25 Garda Keogh to the Minister at that time? would you 17:01
26 agree with me --
27 A. I don't know about forced out --

28 631 Q. Sorry, just the question is this: would you agree with
29 me --

1 A. Yes.

2 632 Q. -- that that is not what you did in December 2015?

3 A. No. In fact, I know I never had it put to me to do

4 this, but when I saw him on the 18th December 2015 I

5 was aware that he had been absent from work for the 8th 17:01

6 December 2015.

7 633 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes?

8 A. So, 8th December 2015.

9 634 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes?

10 A. He had been out of work from then. And I, following my 17:01

11 assessment, felt that he was unfit to go back to work

12 and that was my decision then on the 18th December

13 2015.

14 635 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.

15 A. I wanted to speak with his GP, which is why I didn't 17:02

16 sign the letter off until January 2016. But when I --

17 I'm not sure what the 26th December 2015 is about.

18 Because my recollection was --

19 636 Q. CHAIRMAN: Garda Keogh says that on the 26th that

20 notwithstanding what the record -- if I recall. 17:02

21 A. Yes.

22 637 Q. CHAIRMAN: Notwithstanding what the record says that he

23 decided on the 26th December --

24 A. Yes.

25 638 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- 2015 enough is enough, I can't take any 17:02

26 more of this, I am on long-term sick leave. I think

27 words to that effect. I hope I am not doing anybody an

28 injustice. But it was his decision on the 26th that it

29 had all got too much, that was just it.

1 MR. KELLY: That is absolutely correct, Chairman, from
2 our perspective. And I would point out that at no
3 point has Garda Keogh ever said that this witness
4 forced him out of work.
5 CHAIRMAN: No. 17:03
6 MR. KELLY: Most certainly not. He has never said
7 that.
8 CHAIRMAN: But Mr. Murphy is saying, look, here's what
9 you said on another occasion and he is saying and there
10 it is, and we have some differences as to the 17:03
11 chronology of the thing but the doctor is saying,
12 Dr. Oghuvbu is saying, look, I decided that he wasn't
13 fit for work as a garda and I so decided.
14 A. Yes. Yeah, that's it.
15 CHAIRMAN: So however it worked out, that is what 17:03
16 happened. He says. Okay.
17 639 Q. MR. MURPHY: In terms of your assessment, therefore, I
18 think you have given evidence about that care related
19 approach by An Garda Síochána of which you were a part
20 from 2015 and 2016 and into 2017. And I presume, 17:03
21 doctor, that if at some stage you formed an opinion in
22 any case or in this case that a guard had injured
23 caused by work related stress that presumably that is
24 something that you would be reporting immediately?
25 640 Q. CHAIRMAN: If asked. 17:04
26 A. If asked because I can't --
27 641 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry.
28 A. In terms of injury on duty --
29 642 Q. CHAIRMAN: At least it shows I'm paying attention. I

1 am sorry, doctor, don't just agree with me because I
2 said it.

3 A. No.

4 643 Q. CHAIRMAN: But I know the answer and I'm sorry, I will
5 try not to give the answer in future. 17:04

6 A. In terms of injury on duty, a decision can be made on
7 injury on duty without consulting me.

8 MR. MURPHY: Yes.

9 A. So it is not that every decision on injury on duty the
10 CMO's office has to be consulted. It can be made and 17:04
11 the person who is entitled to make that decision is the
12 chief superintendent.

13 644 Q. Yes?

14 A. Where the chief superintendent has a doubt they will
15 then write to the executive director of HR and say I 17:04
16 need advice or I need assistance in relation to this
17 and then they will be required to present facts. So if
18 the question is a clinical question where I'm not
19 exactly sure whether there is clinical plausibility
20 here, then it is brought to -- then the executive 17:05
21 director of HR will then write to the CMO's office and
22 say can you provide us advice on this. But in terms of
23 injury on duty, I mean I would only, I would -- if
24 there is no doubt about it I would just simply affirm
25 it by saying that this has happened based on this 17:05
26 incident that has been reported by the member. I tend
27 to use the word 'reported', you know. So this is what
28 it is. So I am not involving myself in the decision
29 unless I am asked for an advice to assist the decision

1 that is being made. But I would not ordinarily --

2 645 Q. CHAIRMAN: You don't generally volunteer opinions or
3 decisions?

4 A. In relation to injury on duty, no, unless I am asked.

5 646 Q. CHAIRMAN: You tend to do what you are asked to do? 17:05

6 A. Yes.

7 647 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am understanding that you say I have a
8 careful -- I draw a distinction between decision, fit
9 or not fit?

10 A. Yes. 17:05

11 648 Q. CHAIRMAN: That is my call?

12 A. Yeah. And the supporting arrangements for that.

13 649 Q. CHAIRMAN: Of course.

14 A. Yeah.

15 650 Q. CHAIRMAN: And opinion, that depends on what I am 17:06
16 asked?

17 A. What I am asked, yes.

18 651 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you would, I suppose in extreme cases
19 we'll all do something different, but that is in
20 general what you -- 17:06

21 A. Generally I wouldn't -- I wouldn't do that.

22 CHAIRMAN: Okay.

23 652 Q. MR. MURPHY: You were present I think for Ms. Carr's
24 evidence this morning?

25 A. Yes. 17:06

26 653 Q. I think during the course of her evidence that she
27 indicated that in addition to a request that might come
28 from HRM, the request might come from an individual
29 member to ask that his injury be classified as an

1 injury on duty?

2 A. It would still come through HRM, because they have to
3 apply through HRM because the whole thing about pay and
4 classification lies with HRM so they still have to
5 apply through HRM. 17:06

6 654 Q. But in terms of the initiative to make a complaint,
7 Ms. Carr I think confirmed this morning that can come
8 from the person who wants this to be classified
9 as well?

10 A. Yes, they will have to. 17:06

11 655 Q. So it is not just a question of a top down assessment,
12 it can be activated by the member?

13 A. It could, yes, yes.

14 656 Q. And in the face of local disagreement with a local
15 superior it can still go through the HR? 17:06

16 A. It can still go through HRM, yes.

17 657 Q. Thank you. Just finally in terms of the issues that
18 arose, and you have been asked questions about Garda
19 Keogh's disposition in 2016 and 2017, I mean at this
20 stage I think you're aware that he is not working, is 17:07
21 that correct?

22 A. Yes, I am.

23 658 Q. And in terms of the medical reports that Mr. McGuinness
24 took you through, that indicated there was again
25 periodic intense consumption of alcohol? 17:07

26 A. Yes, that was being reported, yes.

27 659 Q. There was still prescription of depressive drugs,
28 antidepressant drugs?

29 A. Well, medication had been prescribed by his doctor who

1 was responsible for his clinical management and I was
2 satisfied that his doctor would be managing that
3 appropriately. And I was liaising with his doctor
4 because I wanted it to be a collaborative approach in
5 terms of supporting his recovery and eventual return to 17:07
6 work.

7 660 Q. And would you agree with me that at that stage and
8 during those years that if, as Garda Keogh claimed,
9 work was a stressor for him that stressor wasn't
10 existing at that time in 2016 and 2017, he wasn't at 17:07
11 work?

12 A. In 2016 he wasn't at work but --

13 661 Q. And in 2017 also?

14 A. Yeah, but if the -- I'm going to say something here and
15 I hope I don't -- his original premise that the whole 17:08
16 circumstance of the thing was still there, it hadn't
17 gone, even though he was not at work. So there was
18 nothing per se happening in the workplace but this
19 historically hadn't gone away.

20 662 Q. Yes. 17:08

21 A. So that in his own -- it is likely that in his own
22 perception it still existed and I don't think that
23 anybody was kind of --

24 663 Q. Just coming back to this question, in your direct 17:08
25 evidence you did use this word 'perception', in which
26 you said his perception, Garda Keogh's perceptions
27 about management?

28 A. Yeah. That is what would call them, because there has
29 been no investigation to kind of validate anything so

1 they are his perceptions of management.

2 664 Q. Yes.

3 A. There was no investigation.

4 665 Q. And then finally I think would you agree with me that
5 throughout the course of 2012 through to 2017 insofar
6 as there was any clinical assessment and/or treatment
7 made by you or by his doctor that seemed to relate
8 towards how best to solve his alcohol addiction
9 problem?

17:08

10 A. Yes.

17:09

11 MR. MURPHY: Thank you very much.

12

13 DR. OGHUVBU WAS THEN RE-EXAMINED BY MR. MCGUINNESS:

14 666 Q. MR. MCGUINNESS: Just a couple of matters, doctor. We
15 have seen obviously, no doubt because you as CMO and
16 your office you're very busy, you schedule appointments
17 giving members quite a deal of notice, if possible, and
18 shorter notice at times and they're required to confirm
19 their appointment?

17:09

20 A. Yes.

17:09

21 667 Q. And they, as we have seen, have some time to prepare
22 and certainly Garda Keogh attended on the three
23 occasions that you fixed appointments for him?

24 A. Yes.

25 668 Q. And he seems to have consulted with his doctor I think
26 in advance of at least two of those. And he appears to
27 have been intent on sobering up when he was due to come
28 back to work. And from the point of view of your
29 examinations, each of the three examinations that you

17:09

1 carried out, I take it that you found no evidence that
2 on any of those occasions he was either hallucinating
3 or psychotic?

4 A. No.

5 669 Q. Or was he in any way suffering from any altered states 17:10
6 of perception when you examined him?

7 A. He was very articulate, easy to kind of have a
8 discussion with. I never had any difficulty with
9 discussions with him. I think he was always very
10 articulate about what he was, you know what he wanted 17:10
11 to say and had no difficulty in expressing it. I never
12 had any --

13 MR. McGUI NNESS: Okay, thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thank you very much, doctor.
15 And that's very helpful. It's possible that we may ask 17:10
16 you back but that depends on some further processes
17 that we will have to go through. But thank you very
18 much and thank you for being so patient and so
19 accommodating of us. I know you have been here on a
20 number of days and so, thank you very much for that. 17:11
21 Very good.

22

23 THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW

24

25 MR. McGUI NNESS: Chairman, you did announce I think 17:11
26 just at 12:30 or a bit beforehand that our other
27 witness for this week is not available to us for
28 reasons that I don't need to go into, he would have
29 been a substantial witness. So it is intended to

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

comply with our previously published schedule and resume hearings on the 10th February.

CHAIRMAN: So Monday week, 10th February.

MR. MCGUINNESS: And witnesses will published on the website on Friday of this week.

17:11

CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Thanks very much.

THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL MONDAY, 10TH FEBRUARY 2020 AT 10:30AM

	74:27, 75:17, 75:21	162:15	1:00pm [2] - 96:29, 98:21	19:29, 20:13, 20:22, 20:23, 20:29, 21:4, 23:14, 25:8, 25:12, 25:16, 25:18, 25:19, 25:22, 25:23, 25:26, 25:27, 26:16, 26:21, 28:20, 28:21, 30:19, 30:27, 31:20, 32:4, 32:8, 35:20, 35:24, 39:18, 40:20, 59:16, 67:29, 70:23, 71:7, 72:19, 84:27, 90:20, 90:23, 91:7, 91:8, 92:23, 98:20, 102:20, 102:24, 103:19, 107:5, 109:7, 109:13, 110:2, 115:8, 117:5, 117:25, 123:1, 143:12, 154:15, 154:17, 154:21, 155:3, 155:4, 155:13, 155:15, 156:7, 159:13, 159:24, 160:29, 162:22, 163:2, 163:4, 163:6, 163:8, 163:13, 163:17, 163:25, 164:20	25:23, 25:27, 26:27, 27:3, 27:29, 28:3, 89:20, 90:2, 108:13, 109:2
' 12 [1] - 116:23 ' 13 [1] - 116:23 ' 14 [2] - 67:16, 68:25 ' 15 [3] - 98:18, 98:20, 116:23 ' 16 [1] - 126:25 ' perception ' [1] - 168:25 ' reported ' [1] - 165:27 ' the [1] - 93:24	11.37s [1] - 74:10 11720 [2] - 6:15, 11:23 11722 [1] - 20:11 11724 [1] - 28:10 11th [2] - 30:27, 98:23 12 [17] - 3:8, 4:8, 16:25, 17:16, 18:22, 26:20, 27:9, 27:21, 88:27, 100:2, 101:25, 102:2, 104:6, 104:10, 104:12, 104:15 12/5 [1] - 98:22 12/7/2016 [1] - 140:4 12:30 [1] - 170:26 12:48 [1] - 126:1 12:53 [1] - 140:4 12th [5] - 24:18, 73:2, 108:18, 139:29, 141:29 13 [2] - 3:8, 85:9 13,000 [2] - 57:19, 57:22 133 [1] - 97:12 136 [3] - 72:6, 72:7, 122:25 139/10 [2] - 13:1, 146:6 139/2010 [1] - 58:8 13th [4] - 25:22, 25:26, 26:29, 40:22 14 [3] - 3:9, 19:4, 118:6 14866 [1] - 37:3 1487 [1] - 38:26 14870 [1] - 37:13 14876 [1] - 38:6 14878 [1] - 39:10 14880 [1] - 40:12 14884 [1] - 40:29 14885 [1] - 49:23 14889 [1] - 52:17 14890 [1] - 53:28 149 [2] - 162:13, 162:17 14911 [3] - 55:17, 55:24 14th [6] - 16:14, 16:20, 20:20, 30:27, 35:24,	15 [6] - 3:9, 16:12, 72:8, 118:13, 122:26, 124:13 150 [2] - 5:12, 162:12 15912 [1] - 56:14 15956 [1] - 137:23 15957 [1] - 137:23 15th [1] - 31:20 16 [2] - 3:10, 12:4 16/5 [1] - 98:22 169 [1] - 5:13 16th [1] - 20:22 17 [2] - 3:10, 12:10 17th [4] - 37:3, 90:20, 141:9, 141:10 18 [1] - 3:11 18/12 [1] - 130:21 18/12/2015 [2] - 124:11, 126:4 183 [2] - 9:27, 11:4, 25:17, 26:3, 26:9, 26:14, 26:16, 26:22, 26:24, 26:25, 27:13, 27:16, 27:19, 27:26, 28:2, 28:23, 67:25, 68:3, 68:29, 71:2, 93:7 184 [2] - 70:27, 92:19 18th [13] - 85:23, 85:28, 98:20, 101:16, 110:23, 115:8, 123:1, 125:28, 127:25, 129:11, 142:19, 163:4, 163:12 19 [1] - 3:11 19/5 [1] - 131:13 196 [1] - 100:2 1986 [1] - 67:12 1990 [1] - 7:17 1991 [1] - 83:8 19th [13] - 15:11, 15:14, 24:8, 96:29, 98:21, 99:6, 108:1, 110:2, 131:8, 131:10, 131:25, 131:26, 143:5	1st [6] - 67:29, 71:2, 71:6, 92:22, 98:13, 98:18	2	21 [1] - 3:12 2191 [1] - 70:21 21st [5] - 20:12, 27:12, 32:4, 88:5, 142:28 22 [1] - 3:13 22/12/2015 [2] - 118:17, 126:4 22nd [4] - 35:19, 61:14, 61:26, 87:11 23 [2] - 3:13, 20:10 23rd [4] - 25:23, 25:27, 27:3, 79:25 24 [1] - 3:14 24/2/2015 [1] - 89:28 24/7 [1] - 27:23 24th [3] - 19:29, 23:18, 56:18 25 [1] - 3:14 25th [1] - 86:14 26 [1] - 3:15 26th [13] - 22:10, 28:17, 38:8, 39:12, 39:18, 40:20, 91:8, 108:7, 162:22, 163:17, 163:19, 163:23, 163:28 27 [1] - 3:15 27th [2] - 21:4, 86:11 28 [9] - 3:16, 12:10, 12:25, 12:28, 13:7, 13:13, 13:17, 13:26, 146:7 28th [3] - 30:24, 32:8, 39:21 29 [1] - 3:17 29/2/2012 [1] - 14:3 29th [1] - 67:16 29TH [1] - 6:1 2:30 [4] - 66:1, 66:3, 66:13, 78:16 2:45 [1] - 78:15 2nd [9] - 20:28, 21:22, 61:14, 70:23, 90:23, 91:1, 98:9,
1			2 [8] - 3:3, 4:9, 17:1, 19:16, 32:15, 86:28, 115:10, 130:26 2. [1] - 93:28 2.1 [1] - 9:21 2.2 [1] - 10:25 2/4 [1] - 94:4 20 [3] - 3:12, 22:8, 108:6 20-25 [1] - 98:19 20/2/2015 [1] - 90:4 20/4/2015 [1] - 93:12 20/5/2015 [1] - 138:18 20/8/2015 [1] - 25:16 2001 [1] - 83:16 2004 [1] - 83:29 2005 [2] - 84:2, 89:26 2006 [2] - 84:5, 84:6 2009 [1] - 84:11 2010 [3] - 67:9, 84:9, 84:13 2011 [1] - 12:28 2012 [19] - 7:4, 7:8, 7:16, 11:26, 12:5, 12:25, 14:9, 14:28, 15:11, 85:28, 86:12, 86:14, 87:15, 135:9, 135:28, 154:21, 154:25, 169:5 2013 [2] - 87:11, 88:6 2014 [18] - 8:4, 9:17, 9:19, 10:14, 16:14, 18:25, 42:12, 67:20, 71:4, 71:6, 92:20, 92:22, 93:15, 93:20, 102:3, 103:18, 133:2, 159:23 2015 [81] - 7:11, 12:15, 19:3,	19:29, 20:13, 20:22, 20:23, 20:29, 21:4, 23:14, 25:8, 25:12, 25:16, 25:18, 25:19, 25:22, 25:23, 25:26, 25:27, 26:16, 26:21, 28:20, 28:21, 30:19, 30:27, 31:20, 32:4, 32:8, 35:20, 35:24, 39:18, 40:20, 59:16, 67:29, 70:23, 71:7, 72:19, 84:27, 90:20, 90:23, 91:7, 91:8, 92:23, 98:20, 102:20, 102:24, 103:19, 107:5, 109:7, 109:13, 110:2, 115:8, 117:5, 117:25, 123:1, 143:12, 154:15, 154:17, 154:21, 155:3, 155:4, 155:13, 155:15, 156:7, 159:13, 159:24, 160:29, 162:22, 163:2, 163:4, 163:6, 163:8, 163:13, 163:17, 163:25, 164:20 2016 [27] - 24:9, 26:7, 28:12, 28:17, 28:26, 39:7, 39:21, 40:14, 41:2, 49:25, 56:19, 102:29, 124:8, 131:9, 131:10, 136:12, 137:10, 142:28, 143:12, 162:5, 162:7, 162:15, 163:16, 164:20, 167:19, 168:10, 168:12 2017 [5] - 164:20, 167:19, 168:10, 168:13, 169:5 2018 [2] - 150:9, 150:23 2020 [2] - 6:2, 171:9 20th [13] - 19:3, 20:23, 25:19,	21 [1] - 3:12 2191 [1] - 70:21 21st [5] - 20:12, 27:12, 32:4, 88:5, 142:28 22 [1] - 3:13 22/12/2015 [2] - 118:17, 126:4 22nd [4] - 35:19, 61:14, 61:26, 87:11 23 [2] - 3:13, 20:10 23rd [4] - 25:23, 25:27, 27:3, 79:25 24 [1] - 3:14 24/2/2015 [1] - 89:28 24/7 [1] - 27:23 24th [3] - 19:29, 23:18, 56:18 25 [1] - 3:14 25th [1] - 86:14 26 [1] - 3:15 26th [13] - 22:10, 28:17, 38:8, 39:12, 39:18, 40:20, 91:8, 108:7, 162:22, 163:17, 163:19, 163:23, 163:28 27 [1] - 3:15 27th [2] - 21:4, 86:11 28 [9] - 3:16, 12:10, 12:25, 12:28, 13:7, 13:13, 13:17, 13:26, 146:7 28th [3] - 30:24, 32:8, 39:21 29 [1] - 3:17 29/2/2012 [1] - 14:3 29th [1] - 67:16 29TH [1] - 6:1 2:30 [4] - 66:1, 66:3, 66:13, 78:16 2:45 [1] - 78:15 2nd [9] - 20:28, 21:22, 61:14, 70:23, 90:23, 91:1, 98:9,

108:20, 160:29	159:11	7	97 [1] - 97:13 9722 [3] - 153:18, 153:22, 153:23 9742 [1] - 28:19 9744 [1] - 28:14 9759 [1] - 29:4 9:50 [1] - 38:9 9th [7] - 25:12, 25:16, 26:21, 28:4, 86:22, 91:7, 109:10	absences [40] - 8:8, 10:17, 15:5, 26:17, 27:6, 27:11, 27:18, 41:21, 42:25, 43:18, 46:23, 48:24, 52:16, 53:7, 54:2, 71:21, 72:1, 73:22, 91:9, 92:5, 93:15, 94:20, 96:23, 96:27, 101:10, 101:24, 102:2, 102:13, 102:24, 102:26, 103:17, 103:18, 103:23, 111:5, 113:28, 116:2, 119:18, 119:23, 145:12, 146:6 absent [24] - 11:5, 11:6, 12:27, 13:7, 13:13, 14:23, 28:21, 30:26, 31:10, 32:13, 34:15, 36:9, 46:28, 47:8, 48:22, 49:2, 49:15, 58:10, 86:2, 103:24, 130:2, 144:16, 144:17, 163:5 absolutely [5] - 51:21, 82:5, 82:9, 103:4, 164:1 AC [1] - 67:16 accept [1] - 74:27 acceptance [1] - 54:6 accepted [1] - 47:3 accepting [1] - 47:25 accepts [1] - 62:24 access [9] - 45:22, 54:7, 112:22, 127:20, 131:11, 140:8, 140:9, 140:10, 140:11 accessed [2] - 99:16, 154:6 accommodatin g [1] - 170:19 accommodatio n [2] - 69:7, 69:8 accommodatio ns/adjustments	[1] - 131:6 accordance [4] - 13:1, 14:13, 25:24, 37:20 according [1] - 98:27 accordingly [1] - 63:29 account [11] - 10:16, 28:4, 44:8, 65:17, 69:26, 101:23, 102:1, 121:2, 123:8, 146:19, 147:14 accumulated [1] - 64:1 accurate [4] - 97:29, 110:18, 123:24, 144:15 accurately [1] - 106:3 accused [1] - 47:8 achieve [1] - 133:19 acknowledged [1] - 125:8 acknowledges [1] - 98:26 act [3] - 71:23, 92:6, 157:22 acting [2] - 7:11, 59:13 ACTING [2] - 3:7, 3:13 action [2] - 32:1, 35:27 actions [6] - 32:20, 47:28, 54:3, 54:5, 77:9, 109:23 activated [1] - 167:12 actively [1] - 74:6 actual [6] - 16:15, 18:11, 42:6, 51:6, 64:16, 73:21 add [1] - 143:2 added [2] - 69:23, 69:26 addiction [5] - 87:16, 116:28, 136:27, 137:18, 169:8 adding [1] - 99:28 addition [1] - 166:27
3	3791 [1] - 115:10 3793 [1] - 125:29 3795 [1] - 131:27 3796 [2] - 138:15, 140:2 38 [1] - 3:21 39 [1] - 3:22 3rd [2] - 98:12, 150:23	7 [2] - 3:5, 4:13 7/1/2016 [1] - 126:1 78 [1] - 121:5 7th [6] - 41:1, 61:20, 88:6, 108:19, 126:25, 138:6	A		
3 [8] - 3:3, 17:3, 19:18, 32:17, 36:12, 88:2, 97:15, 130:29 3,000 [1] - 57:20 30 [1] - 3:17 30th [2] - 12:27, 14:9 31 [1] - 3:18 31st [9] - 9:19, 10:14, 25:8, 67:20, 68:25, 71:6, 92:23, 98:7, 98:12 32 [1] - 3:18 3254 [1] - 63:21 33 [2] - 3:19, 23:15 33-34 [1] - 4:12 34 [6] - 3:19, 28:14, 67:2, 71:5, 92:22, 93:16 35 [1] - 3:20 36 [1] - 3:20 3643 [2] - 85:9, 85:19 3646 [1] - 109:15 3647 [1] - 142:1 3651 [2] - 99:10, 99:13 3652 [1] - 131:15 3661 [1] - 86:25 3674 [1] - 86:10 3680 [1] - 85:27 3692 [2] - 131:12, 131:14 37 [2] - 3:21, 127:28 3701 [1] - 87:10 3702 [1] - 88:2 3703 [1] - 88:3 3705 [1] - 88:7 3719 [1] - 97:1 3721 [3] - 90:28, 149:17, 153:19 3723 [1] - 95:15 3729 [1] - 89:21 3740 [1] - 142:28 3741 [3] - 139:8, 143:7, 143:8 3750 [1] - 129:28 3788 [2] - 89:24, 93:10 3790 [4] - 101:6, 101:27, 159:10,	4 4 [5] - 3:4, 19:20, 32:20, 36:13, 131:2 4/7 [1] - 116:10 4111 [1] - 150:15 42 [1] - 28:11 44 [1] - 28:26 47 [1] - 100:2 48 [6] - 71:4, 92:20, 93:15, 100:2, 101:24, 102:2 4th [1] - 97:9	8 8 [3] - 3:6, 3:28, 70:22 8/12/2015 [1] - 130:2 82 [1] - 5:11 8202 [1] - 146:7 8204 [1] - 147:8 8213 [1] - 9:12 8815 [1] - 30:20 8817 [1] - 31:19 8818 [1] - 32:3 8825 [1] - 32:9 8827 [1] - 35:19 8828 [1] - 36:15 8th [11] - 24:9, 26:6, 28:11, 28:26, 86:14, 127:5, 129:27, 129:28, 131:17, 163:5, 163:8			
	4	8			
	5 5 [4] - 3:4, 17:10, 17:26, 19:23 52% [2] - 71:4, 92:20 548 [1] - 11:7 56 [1] - 118:5 57 [1] - 5:6 5th [2] - 23:14, 89:26	9 9 [2] - 3:6, 15:10 9/12/2015 [2] - 115:24, 130:7 9/7 [1] - 116:8 9048 [2] - 72:26 91 [4] - 8:9, 9:26, 68:26 92 [3] - 8:9, 9:24, 68:25 92% [1] - 92:23 92/93 [1] - 8:7 9289 [1] - 16:13 9331 [1] - 67:26 9378 [2] - 18:26, 19:27 9382 [1] - 19:1 9407 [2] - 20:11, 21:3 9408 [3] - 20:15, 20:16, 72:27 9474 [1] - 23:15 9487 [1] - 25:7			
	6 6 [2] - 3:5, 5:5 6144 [1] - 21:17 6145 [2] - 22:8, 108:5 6146 [1] - 108:12 6147 [1] - 108:17 6153 [1] - 108:25 6154 [1] - 108:25 6155 [1] - 108:25 6156 [1] - 108:25 6157 [1] - 108:25 6158 [1] - 108:26 6159 [1] - 108:26 6189 [1] - 67:15 66 [1] - 5:7 6th [3] - 40:13, 40:14, 49:24				

<p>additional [4] - 54:10, 92:12, 93:27, 132:19</p> <p>address [8] - 112:22, 114:8, 114:13, 114:27, 143:26, 161:4, 161:10</p> <p>addressed [10] - 18:19, 29:6, 30:21, 31:7, 31:16, 38:9, 42:13, 107:22, 135:27, 143:28</p> <p>addresses [1] - 28:29</p> <p>addressing [1] - 113:21</p> <p>adequacy [1] - 73:13</p> <p>ADJOURNED [2] - 79:19, 171:8</p> <p>administration [1] - 7:9</p> <p>ADMINISTRATIVE [1] - 3:14</p> <p>administrative [6] - 18:10, 18:17, 53:14, 54:8, 54:16, 56:11</p> <p>admit [1] - 141:16</p> <p>admits [1] - 117:5</p> <p>admitted [1] - 135:28</p> <p>adopted [1] - 100:23</p> <p>adopting [1] - 40:9</p> <p>advance [4] - 62:16, 139:28, 149:2, 169:26</p> <p>advanced [1] - 83:14</p> <p>advice [15] - 9:8, 75:3, 97:6, 106:23, 147:1, 147:15, 147:27, 148:2, 148:13, 148:14, 148:16, 158:4, 165:16, 165:22, 165:29</p> <p>advices [11] - 15:9, 15:13, 24:9, 24:15, 74:15, 74:16, 75:27, 110:11, 130:29, 131:3, 147:13</p> <p>advise [9] -</p>	<p>40:23, 43:9, 45:23, 45:25, 51:2, 92:14, 114:25, 145:11, 146:27</p> <p>advised [15] - 15:15, 17:19, 23:11, 31:29, 36:18, 40:17, 62:15, 65:12, 97:19, 99:2, 122:29, 126:26, 130:26, 140:6, 141:18</p> <p>advises [1] - 146:20</p> <p>advising [1] - 146:16</p> <p>Advisory [1] - 84:23</p> <p>advisory [1] - 129:2</p> <p>affair [1] - 153:2</p> <p>Affairs [3] - 36:19, 36:22, 36:23</p> <p>affect [5] - 55:13, 100:27, 101:4, 158:29, 159:2</p> <p>affected [7] - 8:3, 8:5, 14:24, 14:26, 14:29, 36:11, 117:10</p> <p>affects [3] - 117:15, 117:16, 118:10</p> <p>affirm [1] - 165:24</p> <p>affirms [3] - 102:23, 103:1, 103:2</p> <p>afforded [1] - 130:27</p> <p>afternoon [4] - 41:14, 66:5, 66:19, 152:25</p> <p>ago [1] - 153:24</p> <p>agree [17] - 8:22, 67:20, 76:4, 77:20, 105:17, 105:23, 121:14, 133:13, 141:4, 145:5, 157:12, 162:6, 162:26, 162:28, 165:1, 168:7, 169:4</p> <p>agreed [7] - 41:8, 105:23, 118:18, 118:21,</p>	<p>118:26, 127:12, 133:10</p> <p>agreeing [2] - 23:4, 142:5</p> <p>agreement [1] - 81:27</p> <p>agrees [1] - 126:5</p> <p>AGS [3] - 140:5, 140:7, 140:17</p> <p>AGSI [1] - 4:4</p> <p>ahead [3] - 75:2, 107:17, 143:23</p> <p>AIDAN [2] - 3:9, 4:6</p> <p>aide [1] - 125:5</p> <p>aim [1] - 111:1</p> <p>AISLING [1] - 3:21</p> <p>Alan [5] - 12:14, 59:10, 59:11, 60:29, 62:5</p> <p>ALAN [2] - 3:9, 3:13</p> <p>Alan's [1] - 62:28</p> <p>alarms [1] - 96:13</p> <p>alcohol [33] - 87:16, 104:4, 104:7, 104:9, 104:24, 112:11, 116:8, 116:24, 116:28, 117:9, 130:6, 132:19, 133:22, 133:26, 134:17, 134:18, 134:19, 135:1, 135:3, 135:4, 135:7, 137:18, 141:17, 154:18, 154:22, 157:11, 157:18, 158:1, 158:3, 158:18, 158:20, 167:25, 169:8</p> <p>alerting [1] - 81:1</p> <p>alerts [1] - 18:13</p> <p>alike [1] - 19:22</p> <p>ALISON [1] - 3:26</p> <p>allegation [1] - 72:18</p> <p>allegations [1] - 111:14</p> <p>allocated [2] - 71:22, 92:5</p> <p>allow [4] - 80:27, 89:11, 92:9,</p>	<p>113:14</p> <p>allowance [1] - 30:1</p> <p>almost [4] - 39:27, 57:20, 72:20, 108:3</p> <p>alone [1] - 92:24</p> <p>alteration [1] - 105:10</p> <p>altered [3] - 159:6, 159:7, 170:5</p> <p>amending [1] - 41:23</p> <p>amendment [2] - 39:28, 48:26</p> <p>amendments [1] - 8:17</p> <p>America [1] - 158:10</p> <p>amounts [1] - 69:15</p> <p>AN [1] - 3:2</p> <p>ancillary [1] - 36:7</p> <p>AND [2] - 3:15, 79:19</p> <p>and.. [2] - 104:24, 117:14</p> <p>ANDREW [1] - 4:5</p> <p>angle [1] - 51:4</p> <p>ANNE [2] - 3:8, 3:17</p> <p>annotations [1] - 99:25</p> <p>announce [1] - 170:25</p> <p>annual [6] - 31:11, 71:6, 92:22, 93:19, 93:20, 102:4</p> <p>anomaly [1] - 122:29</p> <p>answer [11] - 28:18, 35:12, 47:2, 56:26, 59:8, 59:18, 61:9, 63:20, 108:14, 165:4, 165:5</p> <p>ANTHONY [1] - 3:6</p> <p>Anthony [1] - 29:5</p> <p>anticipate [2] - 63:20, 80:8</p> <p>anticipated [2] - 18:21, 131:1</p> <p>antidepressant [3] - 141:28,</p>	<p>157:10, 167:28</p> <p>anxiety [5] - 132:20, 138:23, 157:2, 157:6, 157:7</p> <p>"anxiety" [1] - 138:22</p> <p>anxiolytic [4] - 156:24, 156:28, 157:1, 157:2</p> <p>any [1] - 17:12</p> <p>anyway [1] - 122:12</p> <p>apologies [2] - 57:14, 64:29</p> <p>apparent [1] - 110:1</p> <p>appeal [2] - 74:26, 74:27</p> <p>appear [12] - 18:6, 26:2, 44:27, 72:10, 72:13, 95:28, 112:25, 124:29, 127:28, 131:11, 139:13, 142:19</p> <p>appeared [3] - 91:10, 123:1, 128:20</p> <p>applicable [2] - 48:12, 131:28</p> <p>application [7] - 10:4, 14:21, 63:27, 64:13, 64:14, 64:17, 64:26</p> <p>applied [4] - 10:5, 10:8, 29:25, 50:28</p> <p>applies [1] - 155:20</p> <p>apply [11] - 8:23, 14:25, 49:14, 49:16, 51:7, 51:11, 51:13, 55:2, 55:6, 167:3, 167:5</p> <p>applying [2] - 8:19, 11:19</p> <p>appointed [7] - 7:11, 7:15, 35:28, 150:13, 151:23, 151:24, 151:25</p> <p>appointment [10] - 92:12, 94:15, 96:29, 110:20, 110:26, 110:28, 118:17, 139:5, 143:21, 169:19</p>	<p>appointments [2] - 169:16, 169:23</p> <p>approach [5] - 94:4, 94:25, 134:5, 164:19, 168:4</p> <p>appropriate [8] - 31:27, 32:1, 48:24, 49:8, 70:12, 87:2, 144:2, 154:6</p> <p>appropriately [2] - 104:28, 168:3</p> <p>approved [2] - 48:27, 142:24</p> <p>approximation [1] - 69:13</p> <p>April [25] - 20:12, 20:20, 20:22, 20:23, 20:29, 21:4, 21:22, 61:14, 61:20, 67:29, 70:23, 71:2, 73:2, 85:23, 85:28, 90:20, 90:23, 91:1, 91:28, 98:10, 98:12, 98:19, 104:4, 108:20, 160:29</p> <p>area [3] - 20:26, 73:5, 94:22</p> <p>areas [2] - 19:23, 90:10</p> <p>argument [1] - 80:8</p> <p>arise [4] - 37:5, 78:28, 81:24, 81:29</p> <p>arisen [1] - 38:4</p> <p>arises [2] - 47:9, 75:5</p> <p>arising [6] - 16:17, 75:26, 89:7, 144:14, 145:15, 145:25</p> <p>arose [7] - 29:21, 30:10, 32:6, 52:18, 91:8, 109:7, 167:18</p> <p>ARRAN [1] - 4:12</p> <p>arrange [2] - 56:20, 139:5</p> <p>arranged [3] - 92:13, 110:21, 133:17</p> <p>arrangement [3] - 56:10, 71:19,</p>
--	---	---	---	---	--

<p>92:2</p> <p>arrangements [5] - 88:18, 90:14, 91:13, 142:8, 166:12</p> <p>arrears [1] - 40:21</p> <p>arrived [1] - 20:22</p> <p>arrives [1] - 72:19</p> <p>arriving [1] - 147:15</p> <p>articulate [2] - 170:7, 170:10</p> <p>AS [8] - 6:1, 6:10, 57:3, 66:25, 79:19, 82:20, 150:2, 153:15</p> <p>aspect [6] - 52:9, 65:1, 65:17, 81:9, 124:15, 132:13</p> <p>aspects [2] - 16:18, 111:15</p> <p>assess [6] - 50:7, 120:16, 120:19, 144:1, 144:13, 145:14</p> <p>assessed [2] - 46:19, 145:24</p> <p>assessing [2] - 102:11, 102:12</p> <p>assessment [19] - 44:13, 44:15, 45:9, 46:4, 97:5, 120:22, 141:8, 147:19, 154:12, 154:13, 154:14, 154:17, 154:20, 154:28, 155:25, 163:11, 164:17, 167:11, 169:6</p> <p>assigned [5] - 6:26, 105:18, 117:6, 117:8, 150:10</p> <p>assist [10] - 16:22, 17:4, 22:6, 36:26, 75:15, 75:28, 87:24, 92:15, 112:3, 165:29</p> <p>assistance [6] - 78:6, 94:14, 104:2, 128:18, 128:24, 165:16</p> <p>assistant [9] - 7:5, 11:27, 14:5, 20:1, 24:3, 24:21,</p>	<p>147:13, 148:25, 150:10</p> <p>Assistant [7] - 12:1, 16:20, 89:14, 150:12, 150:16, 150:20, 150:26</p> <p>ASSISTANT [5] - 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20</p> <p>associated [6] - 74:8, 75:26, 85:9, 130:5, 139:13, 140:26</p> <p>assume [1] - 70:8</p> <p>assuming [6] - 66:13, 70:2, 80:10, 80:11, 81:3, 81:29</p> <p>AT [1] - 171:9</p> <p>Athlone [9] - 71:19, 72:19, 91:6, 92:3, 92:9, 111:15, 112:28, 113:2, 113:3</p> <p>ATHLONE [1] - 4:3</p> <p>attached [8] - 14:14, 19:6, 20:3, 55:20, 55:28, 68:2, 96:12</p> <p>attaches [2] - 108:17</p> <p>attempt [1] - 126:3</p> <p>attend [9] - 23:29, 24:6, 87:6, 92:9, 104:1, 105:17, 118:27, 127:13, 130:23</p> <p>attendance [6] - 17:1, 23:25, 34:14, 102:24, 106:11, 106:17</p> <p>attended [9] - 24:4, 24:23, 87:15, 92:16, 93:25, 109:10, 126:4, 138:18, 169:22</p> <p>attendees [2] - 111:11, 142:16</p> <p>attending [3] - 133:16, 133:23, 135:29</p> <p>attention [10] - 71:27, 97:11, 112:9, 121:2, 128:28, 129:20,</p>	<p>148:26, 153:25, 162:17, 164:29</p> <p>attested [1] - 59:28</p> <p>attributable [1] - 54:5</p> <p>attributed [3] - 46:24, 54:2, 87:1</p> <p>attributes [1] - 116:7</p> <p>augment [1] - 46:14</p> <p>August [25] - 12:15, 23:14, 25:8, 25:12, 25:16, 25:18, 25:19, 25:22, 25:23, 25:26, 25:27, 26:16, 26:21, 26:27, 27:1, 27:4, 27:12, 27:29, 30:24, 67:9</p> <p>authorities [2] - 80:1, 80:19</p> <p>automated [1] - 56:23</p> <p>automatically [2] - 26:4, 50:19</p> <p>avail [5] - 87:26, 88:22, 105:20, 130:26, 133:11</p> <p>availability [2] - 24:5, 78:26</p> <p>available [21] - 8:26, 9:5, 11:14, 16:10, 17:14, 17:28, 19:17, 22:6, 31:14, 42:18, 44:5, 58:20, 78:20, 78:27, 79:12, 80:16, 88:13, 130:18, 131:1, 146:19, 170:27</p> <p>availed [4] - 8:6, 29:24, 71:5, 92:22</p> <p>availing [2] - 8:10, 55:1</p> <p>avails [1] - 30:4</p> <p>awaits [1] - 104:19</p> <p>aware [20] - 29:8, 36:5, 36:8, 38:15, 45:17, 61:5, 61:6, 61:8, 63:6, 63:26, 65:2, 97:17, 97:23, 113:29, 143:29,</p>	<p>150:6, 150:12, 154:24, 163:5, 167:20</p> <p>aware.. [1] - 64:7</p> <p>awareness [1] - 158:23</p> <p>away [1] - 138:27</p> <p>AWOL [5] - 35:5, 65:1, 65:9, 65:13</p>	<p>B</p> <p>bachelor [2] - 83:6</p> <p>back [2] - 126:18, 126:19</p> <p>back [1] - 118:10</p> <p>backdated [1] - 40:19</p> <p>background [7] - 21:6, 130:4, 132:11, 132:12, 139:12, 140:18, 140:20</p> <p>baffled [6] - 123:2, 123:5, 123:6, 123:7, 123:23</p> <p>bag [1] - 26:12</p> <p>Barrett [5] - 41:2, 41:11, 49:25, 97:1, 129:27</p> <p>Bartlett [9] - 98:3, 98:18, 98:23, 101:15, 126:12, 126:21, 127:2, 155:9, 156:20</p> <p>Bartlett's [5] - 98:5, 108:23, 138:9, 141:6, 156:12</p> <p>based [10] - 9:5, 44:2, 56:11, 86:12, 88:13, 130:18, 147:17, 148:14, 161:24, 165:25</p> <p>basic [2] - 73:20, 147:4</p> <p>basis [14] - 41:10, 82:12, 102:7, 114:25, 115:21, 116:19, 119:2, 119:13, 131:5, 132:1,</p>	<p>140:24, 144:14, 144:18, 154:8</p> <p>BASTION [1] - 4:2</p> <p>bear [1] - 63:21</p> <p>bearing [1] - 146:7</p> <p>beat [1] - 19:14</p> <p>became [2] - 83:29, 84:13</p> <p>become [4] - 53:5, 83:22, 131:1, 134:24</p> <p>becomes [2] - 60:9, 139:21</p> <p>BEEN [2] - 6:9, 82:19</p> <p>beer [1] - 118:5</p> <p>beforehand [1] - 170:26</p> <p>beg [3] - 20:15, 131:17, 143:10</p> <p>began [1] - 133:18</p> <p>beginning [1] - 18:25</p> <p>behalf [2] - 75:23, 124:8</p> <p>behind [4] - 24:29, 25:3, 62:10, 103:25</p> <p>belies [1] - 73:24</p> <p>bell [1] - 113:8</p> <p>below [2] - 28:2, 40:17</p> <p>beneficial [1] - 112:28</p> <p>benefit [7] - 48:29, 69:22, 69:25, 71:10, 85:7, 92:27, 93:26</p> <p>benzodiazepin e [2] - 157:4, 157:5</p> <p>best [5] - 54:25, 55:7, 81:5, 140:5, 169:8</p> <p>better [6] - 15:23, 51:2, 53:15, 59:27, 76:9, 135:5</p> <p>between [16] - 8:25, 36:2, 44:3, 45:20, 61:14, 74:20, 75:17, 103:18, 104:5, 105:23, 123:8, 128:21, 128:22, 135:27, 160:18,</p>	<p>166:8</p> <p>beyond [4] - 62:21, 62:24, 63:13, 79:5</p> <p>big [5] - 55:14, 134:9, 136:29, 158:9, 161:13</p> <p>binge [3] - 104:12, 104:13, 106:10</p> <p>bingeing [2] - 132:16, 132:19</p> <p>binges [2] - 118:1, 138:19</p> <p>births [1] - 60:4</p> <p>bit [6] - 28:24, 99:25, 136:13, 141:13, 150:21, 170:26</p> <p>BL [6] - 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 4:1, 4:7, 4:10</p> <p>board [2] - 84:19, 84:20</p> <p>body [1] - 38:7</p> <p>bona [2] - 62:24, 63:10</p> <p>booked [1] - 110:5</p> <p>bottles [1] - 118:6</p> <p>bottom [4] - 86:18, 88:5, 100:1, 146:14</p> <p>box [1] - 95:17</p> <p>branch [4] - 16:23, 28:29, 63:26, 64:7</p> <p>breach [1] - 36:1</p> <p>breached [1] - 47:13</p> <p>breathing [1] - 50:14</p> <p>Brian [1] - 41:3</p> <p>BRIAN [2] - 3:15, 3:16</p> <p>Brian's [1] - 41:21</p> <p>briefly [5] - 9:11, 55:10, 64:12, 66:27, 67:15</p> <p>bring [2] - 101:17, 128:27</p> <p>bringing [3] - 53:19, 129:20, 132:15</p> <p>Broderick [1] - 41:3</p> <p>brought [6] - 40:25, 48:9, 71:1,</p>
---	--	--	--	--	--	---

112:8, 161:20, 165:20 build [1] - 139:23 bullet [2] - 53:21, 53:27 bullying [7] - 46:27, 47:8, 47:13, 77:11, 150:7, 150:27, 153:4 BURKE [1] - 4:11 busy [1] - 169:16 buzz [2] - 158:7, 158:8 BY [17] - 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:11, 5:12, 5:13, 6:10, 57:3, 66:24, 82:20, 150:1, 153:14, 169:13 by [1] - 116:13	care [5] - 140:8, 140:9, 140:16, 154:7, 164:18 career [2] - 67:2, 67:11 careful [2] - 50:28, 166:8 carr [1] - 66:27 Carr [8] - 6:5, 6:6, 6:12, 6:19, 26:8, 57:6, 78:3, 167:7 CARR [5] - 3:15, 5:3, 6:9, 57:3, 66:24 Carr's [5] - 6:14, 109:3, 143:19, 145:9, 166:23 carried [6] - 32:21, 37:19, 148:24, 148:28, 149:1, 170:1 carry [1] - 151:25 carrying [1] - 54:4 case [61] - 8:23, 17:10, 17:20, 23:16, 23:24, 23:26, 24:2, 24:4, 24:6, 24:19, 24:26, 24:29, 37:8, 37:12, 41:10, 46:26, 47:2, 56:18, 59:8, 64:24, 65:16, 72:11, 72:12, 76:21, 77:22, 78:15, 79:28, 80:1, 80:2, 81:10, 81:13, 81:22, 81:24, 85:5, 94:15, 96:22, 109:8, 109:10, 113:1, 113:10, 113:12, 113:13, 113:22, 115:23, 130:6, 130:8, 134:7, 137:7, 139:16, 141:17, 141:29, 142:15, 156:5, 157:17, 160:6, 162:9, 164:22 case-by-case [1] - 41:10 cases [5] - 41:9, 62:18, 74:14, 74:18, 166:18 catchall [1] -	13:14 categorisation [1] - 73:17 categorise [1] - 50:4 categorised [2] - 42:15, 43:19 categorising [1] - 50:10 category [2] - 8:27, 8:29 caught [1] - 14:1 causal [1] - 50:7 causality [4] - 43:10, 75:4, 75:25, 76:1 causally [2] - 45:26, 145:12 causation [1] - 145:15 caused [2] - 95:21, 164:23 causes [2] - 22:26, 158:7 causing [1] - 115:1 caution [1] - 47:25 cc'd [1] - 37:24 centrally [1] - 13:12 centre [2] - 8:14, 84:24 centres [1] - 75:20 cert [1] - 98:22 certainly [5] - 66:18, 77:12, 79:12, 164:6, 169:22 certifiable [1] - 114:17 certificate [9] - 14:13, 14:16, 14:17, 16:3, 25:25, 43:26, 96:6, 101:16, 122:3 certificates [13] - 14:8, 21:28, 45:15, 70:9, 70:11, 70:13, 95:29, 96:4, 96:5, 108:21, 108:22, 121:24, 123:27 certification [5] - 24:12, 114:3, 118:25, 120:24, 122:10 certified [6] -	113:27, 114:1, 114:5, 130:2, 144:17, 162:22 certifies [1] - 131:2 certify [1] - 75:22 certifying [1] - 114:15 certs [2] - 44:1, 96:12 chain [1] - 60:22 Chairman [32] - 6:4, 6:15, 53:25, 65:26, 66:6, 66:8, 66:20, 66:29, 67:23, 76:14, 78:21, 79:22, 81:18, 81:26, 85:7, 91:27, 93:3, 106:3, 149:12, 149:16, 149:18, 149:24, 151:25, 152:3, 153:12, 154:11, 155:18, 156:5, 156:22, 162:1, 164:1, 170:25 CHAIRMAN [212] - 6:6, 6:13, 6:16, 26:8, 26:13, 26:18, 26:24, 26:26, 27:2, 27:5, 27:8, 27:15, 27:24, 27:28, 28:3, 28:6, 30:6, 33:7, 33:12, 33:16, 33:20, 33:24, 33:26, 34:1, 34:3, 34:6, 34:10, 34:24, 34:28, 36:29, 51:14, 51:16, 51:21, 51:23, 51:27, 52:1, 52:4, 52:11, 52:13, 52:28, 53:2, 53:17, 53:22, 53:26, 54:19, 54:23, 55:5, 55:9, 55:13, 55:16, 65:24, 65:27, 66:7, 66:11, 66:13, 66:21, 67:10, 68:14, 68:16, 68:21, 68:23, 69:21, 69:28, 70:2, 70:4, 76:11, 77:29, 78:3, 78:6, 78:11,	78:13, 78:16, 78:22, 78:24, 79:2, 79:11, 79:24, 81:17, 81:20, 82:5, 82:7, 82:10, 82:23, 82:27, 83:2, 91:14, 91:20, 91:24, 91:28, 93:7, 102:28, 103:2, 103:4, 103:6, 103:8, 103:12, 103:14, 104:10, 104:15, 105:9, 105:14, 105:16, 107:19, 107:21, 107:24, 123:13, 123:15, 123:17, 123:19, 123:22, 123:26, 124:1, 124:4, 124:6, 133:15, 133:20, 133:24, 133:26, 134:3, 134:19, 135:9, 135:11, 135:13, 135:15, 135:17, 135:20, 135:22, 135:25, 136:5, 136:8, 136:10, 136:16, 136:19, 136:22, 136:24, 136:27, 137:2, 137:11, 137:13, 137:18, 137:20, 145:1, 145:3, 145:5, 145:19, 145:21, 145:23, 145:28, 146:1, 146:4, 148:6, 149:11, 149:14, 149:20, 149:25, 151:16, 151:18, 151:20, 151:22, 151:28, 152:4, 152:7, 152:9, 152:13, 152:18, 152:20, 152:23, 152:25, 153:1, 153:5, 153:7, 153:11, 153:19, 153:21, 155:26, 155:29, 156:2, 156:4, 157:1, 157:3, 157:6, 157:13, 157:25, 158:5, 158:16, 161:1, 161:5, 161:8, 163:7, 163:9, 163:14, 163:19, 163:22,	163:25, 164:5, 164:8, 164:15, 164:25, 164:27, 164:29, 165:4, 166:2, 166:5, 166:7, 166:11, 166:13, 166:15, 166:18, 166:22, 170:14, 171:3, 171:6 Chairman's [1] - 28:18 chairmanship [1] - 41:29 challenge [1] - 46:15 challenges [1] - 134:21 changing [1] - 51:27 chapter [1] - 41:17 CHARLTON [1] - 4:8 chart [1] - 12:19 check [1] - 107:5 checks [1] - 18:14 cheque [1] - 56:22 chest [2] - 14:10, 86:2 chief [40] - 8:29, 9:4, 9:6, 14:4, 14:12, 14:18, 14:21, 15:13, 21:19, 21:21, 23:17, 24:15, 25:9, 28:12, 28:28, 29:5, 35:26, 37:15, 58:5, 60:21, 62:7, 62:23, 63:12, 64:18, 64:21, 70:23, 72:21, 74:12, 74:14, 74:18, 74:21, 75:3, 75:22, 77:15, 90:29, 108:2, 108:6, 109:1, 165:12, 165:14 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 Chief [46] - 12:29, 13:8, 13:15, 16:22,
C					
cabinet [1] - 122:16 CAD [1] - 126:27 CADs [1] - 132:23 CAGNEY [1] - 3:17 calculate [1] - 99:26 calculated [3] - 11:12, 27:27, 68:12 calculation [1] - 15:5 calming [1] - 156:28 cancelled [1] - 141:24 cannot [5] - 22:13, 50:26, 51:3, 108:15, 155:14 cans [1] - 118:5 capable [1] - 157:29 capacity [3] - 85:4, 98:4, 155:20 capture [1] - 13:29 car [1] - 116:15					

<p>17:15, 17:19, 21:1, 21:4, 21:7, 21:15, 22:5, 22:10, 22:28, 25:1, 30:12, 30:18, 37:14, 37:27, 37:28, 38:12, 40:15, 42:1, 43:9, 45:19, 49:27, 50:3, 51:2, 51:17, 63:16, 65:27, 70:12, 73:7, 74:2, 74:16, 77:17, 79:26, 81:8, 82:16, 92:13, 97:26, 107:9, 113:25, 122:29, 124:11, 142:12, 146:16</p> <p>chief's [1] - 108:18</p> <p>children [1] - 60:5</p> <p>choice [1] - 137:3</p> <p>chronology [3] - 70:18, 73:10, 164:11</p> <p>circle [1] - 55:11</p> <p>circular [1] - 67:16</p> <p>circumstance [3] - 80:14, 112:15, 168:16</p> <p>circumstances [20] - 15:29, 17:22, 17:24, 23:4, 31:5, 34:3, 34:24, 47:27, 54:21, 55:6, 61:8, 61:28, 74:28, 79:4, 132:11, 132:12, 133:12, 140:18, 140:20, 149:3</p> <p>citing [2] - 14:10, 61:22</p> <p>civil [4] - 6:19, 10:9, 42:8, 67:2</p> <p>civilian [1] - 7:7</p> <p>claim [1] - 108:15</p> <p>claimed [1] - 168:8</p> <p>claims [2] - 47:12, 54:10</p> <p>Claire [11] - 24:19, 24:20, 29:6, 37:27, 38:9, 39:12, 40:4,</p>	<p>40:14, 53:4, 63:22, 64:24</p> <p>clarification [5] - 29:13, 29:27, 31:26, 148:11, 148:12</p> <p>clarified [1] - 36:24</p> <p>clarify [6] - 59:19, 64:27, 128:5, 140:15, 140:16, 150:29</p> <p>clarifying [1] - 17:1</p> <p>clarity [1] - 81:28</p> <p>classically [1] - 148:7</p> <p>classification [22] - 8:1, 31:25, 74:7, 100:11, 100:16, 100:24, 100:25, 101:3, 119:2, 119:13, 119:17, 119:29, 120:26, 123:11, 123:13, 131:19, 144:19, 144:20, 144:23, 147:9, 147:26, 167:4</p> <p>classifications [1] - 148:8</p> <p>classified [6] - 9:3, 119:19, 119:24, 166:29, 167:8</p> <p>clear [9] - 30:12, 33:19, 50:26, 55:3, 61:5, 62:20, 64:15, 112:11, 148:15</p> <p>clearly [2] - 53:10, 73:15</p> <p>clerk [2] - 67:7, 110:15</p> <p>clinical [29] - 87:1, 87:2, 88:17, 93:9, 118:19, 119:5, 120:12, 127:17, 127:21, 129:10, 132:2, 133:9, 133:15, 135:20, 135:21, 154:7, 154:8, 154:12, 154:13, 154:14, 154:17, 154:20, 154:28, 155:19, 155:22, 165:18, 165:19, 168:1, 169:6</p>	<p>Clinical [1] - 119:6</p> <p>close [1] - 87:24</p> <p>closed [1] - 79:15</p> <p>CMO [47] - 8:22, 9:8, 14:6, 15:9, 15:13, 15:20, 15:23, 16:4, 17:27, 18:1, 23:22, 24:8, 44:4, 44:28, 45:12, 45:14, 45:17, 45:21, 45:23, 46:4, 46:10, 70:14, 73:28, 75:4, 75:27, 76:8, 78:11, 78:27, 92:17, 93:25, 97:17, 109:4, 109:9, 121:8, 121:19, 122:15, 128:9, 145:11, 145:23, 146:16, 146:18, 146:20, 147:14, 147:20, 148:26, 169:15</p> <p>CMO's [6] - 43:6, 75:18, 110:1, 147:27, 165:10, 165:21</p> <p>CO [1] - 4:4</p> <p>code [21] - 9:1, 13:1, 14:17, 14:22, 15:2, 17:7, 42:3, 42:15, 48:27, 49:17, 51:29, 64:16, 64:19, 64:22, 64:26, 74:10, 74:19, 74:25, 74:26, 75:21</p> <p>Code [2] - 32:20, 96:10</p> <p>cognisance [2] - 117:19, 117:20</p> <p>coin [1] - 31:15</p> <p>collaborative [1] - 168:4</p> <p>collated [1] - 60:10</p> <p>colleague [1] - 116:18</p> <p>colleagues [3] - 85:8, 87:24, 99:2</p> <p>college [1] - 158:9</p> <p>College [6] - 83:7, 83:19, 83:28, 84:1, 84:7,</p>	<p>84:27</p> <p>Collins [5] - 41:3, 42:1, 49:26, 49:27</p> <p>column [3] - 109:24, 112:18, 142:2</p> <p>combination [1] - 158:23</p> <p>comfortable [1] - 134:13</p> <p>coming [8] - 52:24, 73:26, 97:29, 111:24, 137:10, 144:9, 145:13, 168:24</p> <p>commence [1] - 104:19</p> <p>commenced [4] - 28:17, 87:21, 101:29, 154:6</p> <p>commencemen [1] - 40:20</p> <p>commences [3] - 101:8, 108:11, 109:27</p> <p>commendation [1] - 60:4</p> <p>comment [2] - 112:29, 146:25</p> <p>comments [4] - 120:27, 132:5, 142:17, 152:16</p> <p>commissioner [5] - 11:27, 14:5, 20:1, 147:13, 148:25</p> <p>COMMISSIONER [8] - 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20</p> <p>Commissioner [10] - 12:1, 16:20, 86:26, 86:27, 89:15, 146:17, 150:12, 150:17, 150:20, 150:26</p> <p>Commissioner [1] - 67:4</p> <p>commissioner [1] - 150:10</p> <p>commitment [1] - 65:28</p> <p>Committee [3] - 84:8, 84:23, 84:28</p> <p>common [1] - 58:25</p> <p>communicate [2] - 118:19, 119:4</p>	<p>communicated [2] - 15:13, 110:21</p> <p>communicatio [3] - 21:22, 27:7, 56:12</p> <p>communicatio [3] - 58:4, 61:2, 72:20</p> <p>compared [1] - 157:20</p> <p>comparison [1] - 81:23</p> <p>compensating [1] - 134:26</p> <p>complained [1] - 47:2</p> <p>complaint [10] - 45:7, 46:28, 56:7, 72:5, 116:18, 117:17, 150:7, 150:28, 162:24, 167:6</p> <p>complaints [1] - 160:21</p> <p>complete [2] - 55:10, 147:18</p> <p>completed [4] - 14:17, 47:1, 86:10, 88:1</p> <p>completeness [1] - 55:12</p> <p>completion [2] - 43:19, 143:11</p> <p>compliance [1] - 118:26</p> <p>complicated [1] - 130:5</p> <p>comply [2] - 88:16, 171:1</p> <p>complying [1] - 40:6</p> <p>conceivably [1] - 27:29</p> <p>concentration [1] - 42:26</p> <p>concern [11] - 17:11, 19:24, 54:27, 55:21, 56:4, 90:11, 95:21, 95:26, 96:23, 100:8, 116:2</p> <p>concerned [15] - 20:4, 26:18, 53:22, 73:12, 74:6, 93:14, 95:19, 95:23, 117:14, 125:6, 127:17, 128:20, 148:4, 161:27,</p>	<p>162:4</p> <p>concerning [2] - 79:5, 102:4</p> <p>concerns [13] - 9:9, 20:13, 37:4, 87:22, 101:24, 102:1, 102:24, 113:8, 114:11, 115:22, 130:15, 131:21</p> <p>concerted [1] - 112:22</p> <p>concluded [2] - 54:9, 106:27</p> <p>concluding [1] - 48:19</p> <p>conclusion [2] - 40:25, 105:26</p> <p>condition [8] - 72:15, 87:2, 89:3, 106:4, 109:29, 114:8, 145:25, 154:8</p> <p>conducive [1] - 113:4</p> <p>conducted [1] - 43:20</p> <p>conduit [2] - 18:1, 21:13</p> <p>conference [25] - 23:17, 23:25, 24:2, 24:19, 24:23, 24:26, 24:28, 24:29, 72:11, 72:12, 109:9, 109:10, 113:1, 113:10, 113:12, 115:24, 130:6, 139:16, 139:28, 140:5, 141:18, 141:29, 142:15, 161:28, 162:9</p> <p>Conference [1] - 84:29</p> <p>conferences [5] - 23:26, 24:4, 24:7, 113:13, 113:22</p> <p>confidence [2] - 97:24, 160:7</p> <p>confidential [7] - 48:11, 56:9, 61:1, 82:11, 82:12, 88:22, 130:27</p> <p>confidentiality [1] - 45:22</p> <p>confidentially [3] - 80:15, 80:16,</p>
---	--	---	---	---	---

<p>113:15 confirm ^[11] - 37:19, 40:4, 73:10, 99:23, 153:28, 154:11, 156:22, 159:15, 162:1, 162:7, 169:18 confirmed ^[2] - 103:3, 167:7 confirming ^[3] - 103:8, 103:12, 103:13 confronted ^[1] - 95:4 conjunction ^[1] - 51:20 CONNAUGHT ^[1] - 4:3 connection ^[1] - 134:20 CONNELLAN ^[2] - 4:1, 4:1 CONOR ^[1] - 3:24 consensus ^[1] - 140:28 consent ^[1] - 101:8 consequence ^[3] - 36:9, 70:14, 109:22 consider ^[1] - 89:1 consideration ^[6] - 15:5, 32:25, 43:6, 52:29, 89:21, 113:2 considerations ^[3] - 53:1, 53:29, 139:19 considered ^[4] - 74:28, 74:29, 77:9, 94:22 consistent ^[1] - 100:9 constraints ^[1] - 81:2 consult ^[7] - 55:21, 56:5, 96:20, 98:4, 151:28, 151:29, 152:7 consultation ^[17] - 16:26, 44:3, 45:15, 94:16, 99:16, 100:25, 101:4, 101:5, 115:7, 115:21, 125:12, 125:17,</p>	<p>125:27, 128:1, 130:21, 132:1 consultative ^[2] - 155:10, 155:11 consulted ^[3] - 155:9, 165:10, 169:25 consulting ^[1] - 165:7 consults ^[2] - 46:9, 152:9 consume ^[1] - 19:13 consumption ^[1] - 167:25 contact ^[14] - 7:19, 20:25, 29:19, 40:22, 58:9, 58:13, 58:20, 59:2, 71:23, 72:28, 73:4, 75:8, 92:7, 139:27 contacted ^[1] - 150:14 contacting ^[1] - 127:16 contained ^[2] - 63:11, 154:27 containing ^[1] - 14:5 content ^[3] - 9:15, 63:5, 105:7 context ^[11] - 72:18, 93:27, 103:17, 103:29, 107:8, 113:5, 116:22, 139:12, 144:2, 151:12, 162:13 continue ^[7] - 11:5, 48:23, 54:21, 70:10, 89:12, 98:27, 133:11 continued ^[3] - 104:23, 105:20, 118:3 continues ^[3] - 98:29, 118:23, 136:17 continuing ^[3] - 87:22, 112:27, 161:12 continuous ^[1] - 39:17 contrary ^[3] - 49:20, 50:17, 52:12 contrast ^[2] -</p>	<p>95:16, 161:18 contributing ^[1] - 102:16 contribution ^[3] - 109:24, 111:19, 142:1 control ^[1] - 79:5 convenient ^[3] - 66:5, 79:3, 85:15 conversation ^[8] - 124:12, 124:23, 124:26, 124:28, 127:24, 127:29, 144:7, 160:24 conversing ^[1] - 130:7 convey ^[1] - 119:9 Conway ^[1] - 14:13 cooperative ^[1] - 23:7 cope ^[1] - 134:21 copied ^[5] - 29:6, 38:10, 41:3, 49:21, 49:24 copies ^[1] - 14:8 coping ^[5] - 17:3, 17:4, 19:18, 98:17, 135:7 COPPINGER ^[1] - 3:4 copy ^[10] - 20:27, 73:5, 85:15, 97:13, 125:13, 131:13, 133:6, 137:22, 153:26 copying ^[1] - 37:27 Cormac ^[1] - 19:27 corner ^[1] - 99:12 correct ^[90] - 6:22, 7:2, 7:6, 7:14, 7:20, 7:21, 9:20, 10:2, 10:18, 10:21, 11:1, 11:29, 12:3, 12:11, 12:18, 14:7, 18:2, 20:7, 21:12, 21:16, 23:20, 23:27, 24:25, 26:23, 27:14, 30:15, 32:7, 33:15, 33:23, 33:25, 33:29, 34:2,</p>	<p>37:10, 38:5, 40:11, 40:28, 41:5, 41:15, 47:17, 48:4, 49:5, 49:14, 50:18, 57:28, 58:3, 59:8, 65:3, 67:14, 67:22, 68:27, 68:28, 70:3, 70:9, 72:23, 83:12, 83:16, 83:24, 84:24, 86:15, 88:8, 88:9, 88:28, 89:22, 90:3, 90:24, 90:25, 98:2, 99:7, 99:8, 106:19, 110:24, 110:25, 113:24, 121:22, 124:21, 131:9, 133:4, 138:7, 138:8, 139:29, 142:2, 142:9, 143:24, 145:3, 145:4, 146:12, 150:24, 155:13, 164:1, 167:21 correspondenc e ^[26] - 11:24, 11:26, 12:6, 12:15, 16:17, 19:6, 19:8, 20:19, 20:21, 20:27, 21:18, 35:21, 36:16, 40:13, 60:28, 62:27, 63:1, 73:6, 73:29, 74:2, 74:17, 77:12, 77:16, 108:8, 143:26, 143:27 correspondenc e. ^[1] - 29:1 correspondenc es ^[1] - 28:8 costs ^[1] - 140:26 counsel ^[1] - 149:5 count ^[1] - 69:29 couple ^[3] - 57:7, 112:7, 169:14 course ^[20] - 14:20, 42:16, 42:19, 68:23, 80:7, 80:29, 82:5, 82:8, 85:11, 87:16, 90:12, 90:13, 124:23,</p>	<p>125:26, 156:10, 156:19, 160:10, 166:13, 166:26, 169:5 COURT ^[1] - 4:2 cover ^[9] - 11:26, 12:6, 12:16, 14:12, 25:26, 61:3, 62:27, 62:28, 62:29 covered ^[1] - 48:27 covering ^[1] - 98:11 covers ^[1] - 99:5 crept ^[1] - 132:20 critical ^[4] - 8:19, 8:22, 48:28, 75:19 CROSS ^[4] - 5:6, 5:12, 57:3, 150:1 CROSS-EXAMINED ^[4] - 5:6, 5:12, 57:3, 150:1 crux ^[1] - 76:7 CUALÁIN ^[1] - 3:7 culling ^[1] - 50:8 cumulated ^[1] - 39:19 cumulative ^[1] - 157:23 CURLEY ^[1] - 3:10 CURRAN ^[1] - 3:3 current ^[4] - 48:23, 115:13, 131:27, 154:9</p>	<p>21:22, 24:9, 25:8, 30:24, 31:20, 37:2, 38:8, 41:1, 49:24, 70:23, 71:2, 86:11, 88:5, 89:20, 89:25, 90:23, 91:1, 99:11, 107:7, 108:7, 129:28, 131:13 dates ^[6] - 31:2, 31:21, 36:2, 125:23, 143:17, 143:18 DAVID ^[1] - 3:18 David ^[1] - 98:18 day's ^[1] - 26:19 days ^[51] - 8:7, 8:9, 9:24, 9:26, 9:27, 11:4, 11:7, 12:28, 13:7, 13:13, 13:27, 22:23, 25:17, 26:9, 26:14, 26:16, 26:22, 26:24, 26:25, 27:13, 27:17, 28:2, 28:23, 66:16, 67:25, 68:3, 68:25, 68:29, 70:27, 71:2, 71:6, 80:18, 80:21, 86:19, 92:19, 92:22, 93:15, 93:16, 99:28, 101:24, 102:2, 106:10, 116:3, 116:4, 116:11, 116:12, 118:9, 132:20, 170:20 deal ^[15] - 7:18, 7:22, 7:23, 8:16, 10:25, 10:26, 41:9, 52:15, 58:7, 59:4, 78:29, 81:8, 114:3, 115:6, 169:17 dealing ^[10] - 26:29, 27:17, 30:22, 50:27, 57:12, 57:13, 59:5, 72:15, 81:9, 135:3 dealings ^[1] - 77:8 deals ^[1] - 18:8 dealt ^[8] - 27:6, 32:26, 34:22, 34:25, 36:13,</p>
D					
<p>daily ^[2] - 98:29, 116:19 date ^[17] - 9:17, 16:24, 26:14, 26:15, 26:19, 39:25, 79:9, 84:17, 87:29, 97:20, 101:29, 119:9, 119:11, 125:29, 126:23, 131:13, 153:28 dated ^[26] - 16:14, 16:19, 19:3, 20:12,</p>					

<p>75:12, 81:28, 116:22</p> <p>dear [1] - 145:23</p> <p>debate [8] - 51:9, 51:27, 51:29, 52:18, 52:21, 56:25, 80:27, 80:28</p> <p>December [28] - 12:28, 14:9, 19:9, 28:17, 39:18, 40:20, 109:11, 110:23, 115:8, 123:1, 129:11, 154:14, 155:3, 155:4, 155:15, 156:7, 159:16, 161:18, 161:25, 161:26, 162:22, 163:2, 163:4, 163:6, 163:8, 163:12, 163:17, 163:23</p> <p>decide [5] - 74:18, 82:1, 112:21, 136:19, 156:2</p> <p>decided [6] - 51:12, 137:8, 155:4, 163:23, 164:12, 164:13</p> <p>deciding [1] - 35:29</p> <p>decision [31] - 8:25, 114:16, 126:15, 127:11, 127:15, 136:20, 140:23, 147:17, 147:26, 148:5, 148:6, 148:7, 148:14, 155:7, 155:19, 155:20, 155:22, 155:24, 155:26, 155:27, 156:6, 156:8, 156:9, 163:12, 163:28, 165:6, 165:9, 165:11, 165:28, 165:29, 166:8</p> <p>decisions [3] - 148:3, 155:2, 166:3</p> <p>DECLAN [1] - 3:5</p> <p>Declan [1] - 111:11</p> <p>deducted [2] - 35:11, 36:27</p> <p>deduction [1] -</p>	<p>50:21</p> <p>deemed [4] - 17:10, 19:18, 32:13, 130:22</p> <p>default [3] - 73:19, 73:22, 75:23</p> <p>defaults [1] - 73:23</p> <p>Defence [1] - 67:4</p> <p>deficiency [1] - 44:12</p> <p>definite [1] - 77:6</p> <p>definitely [1] - 155:15</p> <p>deliberations [1] - 41:23</p> <p>delusions [1] - 157:19</p> <p>deny [1] - 72:13</p> <p>Department [4] - 30:22, 67:4, 67:5</p> <p>department [8] - 8:21, 13:5, 13:24, 29:12, 38:10, 38:19, 40:15, 131:20</p> <p>departments [1] - 67:3</p> <p>depended [1] - 136:3</p> <p>DEPERS [2] - 38:19, 48:17</p> <p>depressant [1] - 135:4</p> <p>depression [2] - 105:11, 158:13</p> <p>depressive [4] - 157:28, 158:2, 158:29, 167:27</p> <p>Deputy [1] - 91:2</p> <p>described [2] - 100:5, 124:18</p> <p>describes [1] - 116:19</p> <p>description [2] - 123:24, 130:10</p> <p>DESMOND [1] - 4:6</p> <p>despite [1] - 87:22</p> <p>detail [3] - 96:16, 103:21, 119:16</p> <p>detailing [1] - 133:2</p> <p>details [7] - 16:16, 88:3,</p>	<p>95:24, 96:6, 106:13, 122:5, 130:13</p> <p>detective [1] - 111:13</p> <p>DETECTIVE [5] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17</p> <p>determination [1] - 75:29</p> <p>determine [2] - 47:1, 97:18</p> <p>determined [3] - 45:11, 48:25, 123:19</p> <p>develop [1] - 43:7</p> <p>developing [2] - 52:3, 115:3</p> <p>Development [1] - 12:9</p> <p>development [1] - 141:4</p> <p>DEVELOPMEN T [1] - 3:16</p> <p>devolve [1] - 58:10</p> <p>diagnose [1] - 95:8</p> <p>diagnosis [1] - 106:5</p> <p>differences [1] - 164:10</p> <p>different [18] - 6:26, 27:15, 28:1, 30:6, 59:29, 60:11, 77:18, 77:20, 85:11, 98:9, 100:3, 103:23, 111:16, 112:5, 121:3, 125:5, 159:1, 166:19</p> <p>difficult [9] - 48:10, 135:26, 136:22, 136:23, 136:26, 137:1, 137:2, 137:3, 138:24</p> <p>difficulties [8] - 116:14, 128:6, 129:13, 133:21, 134:18, 154:22, 159:17, 159:24</p> <p>difficulty [7] - 31:6, 48:12, 116:24, 128:26, 134:15, 170:8, 170:11</p> <p>diffuse [1] -</p>	<p>134:28</p> <p>DIGNAM [1] - 3:24</p> <p>diploma [2] - 83:14, 83:27</p> <p>direct [3] - 7:19, 72:28, 168:24</p> <p>directed [1] - 116:9</p> <p>directing [2] - 39:16, 40:5</p> <p>direction [2] - 40:7, 107:14</p> <p>directive [1] - 146:6</p> <p>directly [9] - 22:28, 43:12, 45:26, 58:7, 58:21, 58:27, 75:5, 96:9, 145:12</p> <p>DIRECTLY [4] - 5:5, 5:11, 6:10, 82:20</p> <p>DIRECTLY- EXAMINED [4] - 5:5, 5:11, 6:10, 82:20</p> <p>DIRECTOR [1] - 3:13</p> <p>director [13] - 12:7, 12:12, 22:11, 30:18, 51:20, 59:11, 59:12, 107:22, 108:9, 127:6, 139:10, 165:15, 165:21</p> <p>DIRECTORATE [1] - 3:15</p> <p>directorate [21] - 6:24, 6:28, 7:4, 7:10, 7:13, 8:14, 11:20, 12:16, 21:11, 21:19, 57:10, 59:12, 60:16, 60:17, 60:20, 60:29, 61:3, 61:4, 61:10, 61:11, 74:27</p> <p>disagreement [1] - 167:14</p> <p>disastrously [1] - 81:4</p> <p>disciplinary [7] - 33:24, 33:27, 35:27, 36:8, 36:24, 47:24, 47:29</p> <p>discipline [9] -</p>	<p>31:16, 32:27, 34:6, 34:22, 34:25, 36:1, 60:11, 65:10, 65:13</p> <p>disciplined [10] - 33:2, 33:4, 33:7, 33:13, 33:16, 34:14, 35:10, 65:2, 65:3, 70:16</p> <p>disciplining [1] - 72:16</p> <p>disclosed [4] - 113:15, 113:18, 161:14, 161:15</p> <p>disclosure [15] - 23:11, 29:24, 30:2, 30:4, 48:11, 52:17, 53:12, 54:16, 54:20, 54:29, 56:8, 56:9, 56:12, 60:18, 60:19</p> <p>disclosures [10] - 22:21, 22:24, 30:13, 37:7, 48:9, 52:19, 52:23, 52:25, 53:8, 54:11</p> <p>discovering [1] - 124:1</p> <p>discrepancies [1] - 123:8</p> <p>discuss [16] - 22:14, 22:25, 22:27, 23:13, 71:17, 71:24, 91:11, 91:16, 91:22, 91:25, 92:7, 97:25, 105:28, 115:5, 128:5, 140:14</p> <p>discussed [13] - 41:22, 50:3, 98:28, 102:26, 103:17, 111:7, 112:10, 118:21, 126:11, 129:17, 133:28, 150:5, 151:11</p> <p>discussing [3] - 54:23, 113:8, 133:9</p> <p>discussion [24] - 29:22, 30:10, 37:5, 41:16, 43:2, 49:11, 51:28, 53:15, 54:26, 55:8, 91:9, 105:7, 111:4, 111:23,</p>	<p>112:25, 112:27, 113:9, 113:14, 119:16, 122:4, 122:6, 126:26, 136:15, 170:8</p> <p>discussions [11] - 29:8, 38:15, 42:23, 45:18, 45:20, 74:20, 75:7, 77:5, 121:9, 162:7, 170:9</p> <p>disposition [1] - 167:19</p> <p>dispute [2] - 75:16, 75:20</p> <p>distinction [1] - 166:8</p> <p>district [15] - 7:28, 8:12, 19:17, 25:3, 35:28, 71:23, 73:18, 91:6, 92:6, 92:7, 93:13, 93:21, 94:3, 146:23</p> <p>division [3] - 9:5, 58:6, 73:18</p> <p>divisional [10] - 7:27, 8:13, 14:18, 25:2, 58:5, 58:11, 74:11, 139:17, 147:12</p> <p>DOCKERY [1] - 4:6</p> <p>doctor [38] - 45:21, 79:24, 82:23, 82:28, 83:5, 85:10, 96:7, 98:21, 98:26, 99:3, 102:29, 107:21, 113:27, 114:15, 125:28, 126:25, 130:22, 130:25, 131:2, 137:21, 139:28, 144:17, 149:5, 149:16, 153:23, 156:6, 158:17, 158:18, 164:11, 164:21, 165:1, 167:29, 168:2, 168:3, 169:7, 169:14, 169:25, 170:14</p> <p>doctor's [2] - 123:27, 155:27</p> <p>document [29] - 8:4, 37:11, 52:27, 53:16, 54:26, 55:7, 55:8, 55:21, 56:1, 56:4, 61:18,</p>
---	--	--	---	---	--

<p>61:23, 62:22, 67:15, 67:26, 71:14, 72:25, 93:3, 93:13, 107:11, 124:27, 125:1, 125:2, 128:13, 149:17, 153:24, 159:10, 162:12, 162:14</p> <p>documentary [1] - 34:21</p> <p>documentation [4] - 12:23, 59:9, 109:4, 156:10</p> <p>documented [2] - 11:24, 162:15</p> <p>documents [14] - 12:4, 12:10, 20:9, 26:6, 28:11, 28:26, 70:19, 73:9, 85:11, 107:27, 108:4, 109:5, 122:25, 157:9</p> <p>dol [1] - 153:25</p> <p>domain [2] - 134:11, 144:3</p> <p>Donal [2] - 42:1, 49:27</p> <p>DONAL [10] - 3:7, 3:24, 5:7, 65:26, 66:24, 66:27, 67:11, 68:24, 70:7, 76:14</p> <p>done [14] - 7:27, 9:3, 13:26, 18:16, 18:21, 30:16, 30:17, 46:13, 51:19, 53:1, 57:26, 84:6, 116:10, 129:1</p> <p>door [1] - 136:11</p> <p>doubt [8] - 9:7, 147:11, 147:23, 148:10, 165:14, 165:24, 169:15</p> <p>down [36] - 15:10, 16:12, 19:28, 22:9, 28:2, 32:9, 37:13, 39:11, 46:10, 46:25, 49:29, 55:24, 58:14, 60:21, 72:7, 72:8, 82:23, 86:19, 98:7, 100:17, 105:23, 114:28, 122:27, 123:15, 126:23, 141:11,</p>	<p>141:13, 141:22, 147:6, 147:7, 150:18, 157:25, 158:11, 162:17, 167:11</p> <p>Downey [6] - 10:3, 41:2, 41:26, 49:24, 52:4</p> <p>DOWNEY [2] - 3:15, 3:20</p> <p>DPER [1] - 29:27</p> <p>DPERS [2] - 29:12, 29:16</p> <p>DR [6] - 3:11, 5:9, 82:19, 150:1, 153:14, 169:13</p> <p>Dr [30] - 42:1, 49:27, 79:23, 82:17, 82:22, 83:1, 83:2, 83:4, 85:8, 98:3, 98:5, 98:18, 98:23, 101:15, 108:23, 121:8, 124:13, 126:12, 126:21, 127:2, 128:5, 138:9, 141:6, 150:5, 150:17, 153:17, 155:9, 156:12, 156:20, 164:12</p> <p>draft [1] - 52:27</p> <p>drafted [1] - 52:26</p> <p>drank [1] - 104:4</p> <p>draw [6] - 71:26, 97:10, 121:2, 153:24, 162:16, 166:8</p> <p>drink [2] - 133:24, 158:3</p> <p>drinking [11] - 87:21, 106:9, 106:10, 113:26, 116:7, 117:5, 117:24, 117:26, 118:1, 133:27, 158:20</p> <p>driving [4] - 102:12, 117:25, 134:17, 134:19</p> <p>drug [3] - 156:17, 157:9, 157:21</p> <p>drugs [2] - 167:27, 167:28</p> <p>drunk [1] - 112:7</p> <p>DU [1] - 24:6</p> <p>DUBLIN [3] - 3:28, 4:9, 4:13</p>	<p>Dublin [1] - 87:16</p> <p>due [12] - 25:17, 48:10, 48:28, 52:16, 53:7, 80:7, 80:29, 97:22, 125:26, 140:12, 147:23, 169:27</p> <p>duress [1] - 98:27</p> <p>during [3] - 36:6, 166:26, 168:8</p> <p>duties [20] - 15:16, 19:13, 19:15, 42:19, 86:5, 87:6, 88:14, 90:5, 90:6, 90:12, 90:13, 105:18, 115:13, 115:14, 120:17, 130:24, 131:28, 132:3, 146:18, 146:21</p> <p>duty [39] - 8:29, 9:3, 14:10, 14:20, 15:9, 16:28, 20:23, 21:20, 24:12, 25:18, 42:16, 43:27, 45:24, 48:26, 73:1, 74:5, 86:13, 87:6, 87:18, 92:21, 97:18, 119:10, 145:28, 146:22, 147:7, 147:8, 147:11, 147:17, 147:22, 147:24, 148:22, 148:23, 164:28, 165:6, 165:7, 165:9, 165:23, 166:4, 167:1</p> <p>dwel [2] - 131:24, 156:15</p> <p>dysthymic [3] - 105:3, 105:9, 105:11</p> <p>Dáil [1] - 91:2</p>	<p>93:12</p> <p>e-mails [3] - 12:20, 52:10, 76:27</p> <p>e.g [2] - 54:10, 56:22</p> <p>EAMON [1] - 3:10</p> <p>early [13] - 22:23, 71:5, 87:29, 92:21, 92:23, 93:16, 93:20, 102:4, 102:5, 110:20, 110:26, 116:23, 159:23</p> <p>EAS [4] - 111:3, 112:20, 118:24, 133:12</p> <p>ease [1] - 66:2</p> <p>easiest [1] - 97:12</p> <p>Eastern [1] - 86:26</p> <p>easy [1] - 170:7</p> <p>eat [1] - 118:16</p> <p>eating [2] - 134:23, 134:24</p> <p>Education [1] - 67:5</p> <p>effect [11] - 67:17, 67:18, 67:20, 156:28, 157:6, 157:23, 157:24, 157:28, 158:2, 158:12, 163:27</p> <p>effective [3] - 11:17, 25:18, 148:22</p> <p>effective/non [1] - 17:2</p> <p>effective/non-effectiveness [1] - 17:2</p> <p>effectively [4] - 10:6, 19:4, 37:4, 54:17</p> <p>effectiveness [5] - 17:2, 19:16, 104:24, 104:27, 139:20</p> <p>effectiveness/non [1] - 19:16</p> <p>effectiveness/non-effectiveness [1] - 19:16</p> <p>effects [2] - 158:25, 158:29</p>	<p>effort [1] - 112:22</p> <p>efforts [1] - 17:3</p> <p>EGAN [1] - 3:25</p> <p>Egan [10] - 24:19, 24:20, 29:6, 37:27, 38:9, 39:12, 40:14, 53:4, 63:19, 63:22</p> <p>eight [4] - 16:24, 17:15, 88:26, 122:26</p> <p>either [8] - 48:25, 95:13, 111:28, 128:26, 134:23, 138:26, 145:18, 170:2</p> <p>elapsed [1] - 80:14</p> <p>element [3] - 57:25, 75:21, 75:24</p> <p>elements [2] - 22:20, 23:1</p> <p>eligible [1] - 39:20</p> <p>elsewhere [1] - 151:5</p> <p>elucidation [1] - 139:18</p> <p>emanate [1] - 13:5</p> <p>emanating [1] - 60:28</p> <p>emergency [1] - 84:21</p> <p>EMMA [1] - 3:26</p> <p>emphasise [1] - 82:12</p> <p>employed [1] - 85:22</p> <p>employee [6] - 31:2, 94:14, 95:19, 104:2, 128:18, 128:24</p> <p>employees [1] - 54:6</p> <p>employers [1] - 159:24</p> <p>employment [1] - 111:1</p> <p>encapsulated [1] - 42:24</p> <p>encountered [4] - 22:18, 35:16, 35:18, 85:21</p> <p>encountering [1] - 128:7</p> <p>encourage [1] -</p>	<p>54:11</p> <p>END [5] - 57:1, 65:22, 77:27, 149:9, 153:9</p> <p>end [20] - 13:27, 33:17, 34:7, 50:26, 60:9, 63:23, 64:4, 79:3, 80:5, 80:10, 81:6, 102:23, 103:6, 125:12, 125:16, 136:5, 136:7, 141:12, 157:27, 158:2</p> <p>endeavour [1] - 66:19</p> <p>engage [10] - 70:11, 70:14, 70:15, 106:17, 110:4, 118:22, 118:24, 137:4, 139:24, 140:25</p> <p>engagement [1] - 132:24</p> <p>engages [1] - 104:27</p> <p>engaging [2] - 104:26, 110:29</p> <p>enjoys [1] - 118:14</p> <p>enquire [5] - 31:24, 32:12, 32:25, 32:29, 138:3</p> <p>enquiries [3] - 34:8, 65:7, 74:22</p> <p>enquiring [1] - 39:25</p> <p>enquiry [1] - 58:18</p> <p>ensure [8] - 13:8, 13:14, 13:25, 25:4, 42:24, 50:14, 56:21, 58:12</p> <p>ensuring [3] - 51:5, 74:6, 75:11</p> <p>entered [5] - 73:18, 83:25, 98:18, 98:23, 127:2</p> <p>enthusiastic [1] - 75:11</p> <p>entire [2] - 31:25, 155:23</p> <p>entirely [2] - 61:5, 81:26</p> <p>entitled [4] - 28:1, 30:5, 83:22, 165:11</p>
E					
<p>e-mail [17] - 19:29, 28:29, 29:5, 37:14, 37:26, 37:27, 38:7, 39:10, 39:11, 40:2, 40:13, 41:21, 55:25, 63:22, 76:12, 89:28,</p>					

<p>entitlement [2] - 26:4, 69:14</p> <p>entry [2] - 14:3, 60:3</p> <p>environment [2] - 71:20, 92:3</p> <p>envisage [2] - 23:2, 145:11</p> <p>episode [1] - 132:20</p> <p>error [1] - 18:10</p> <p>especially [1] - 106:10</p> <p>essence [1] - 49:12</p> <p>essential [1] - 17:14</p> <p>essentially [2] - 61:26, 152:14</p> <p>establish [5] - 21:24, 22:3, 23:9, 62:13, 95:5</p> <p>established [4] - 80:13, 121:9, 154:7, 158:22</p> <p>etcetera [3] - 29:3, 72:16, 88:25</p> <p>evaluation [1] - 118:27</p> <p>event [8] - 13:23, 18:25, 30:11, 86:20, 96:28, 109:7, 131:2, 131:25</p> <p>events [8] - 44:5, 44:9, 46:25, 133:2, 159:5, 159:6, 159:7, 159:22</p> <p>eventual [2] - 112:2, 168:5</p> <p>eventually [2] - 77:21, 162:21</p> <p>evidence [24] - 34:21, 54:8, 61:29, 66:3, 66:19, 76:16, 79:26, 85:8, 85:12, 93:4, 93:5, 97:8, 97:14, 100:3, 109:3, 127:23, 129:5, 145:9, 155:3, 164:18, 166:24, 166:26, 168:25, 170:1</p> <p>exactly [5] - 15:24, 36:12, 63:4, 67:24,</p>	<p>165:19</p> <p>exaggerated [1] - 159:5</p> <p>examination [1] - 127:25</p> <p>EXAMINATION [5] - 57:1, 65:22, 77:27, 149:9, 153:9</p> <p>examinations [2] - 169:29</p> <p>EXAMINED [13] - 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:11, 5:12, 5:13, 6:10, 57:3, 66:24, 82:28, 130:1, 153:14, 169:13</p> <p>examined [1] - 170:6</p> <p>examining [1] - 120:11</p> <p>example [4] - 46:26, 60:2, 76:3, 159:22</p> <p>exceed [1] - 26:9</p> <p>exceeded [8] - 12:28, 13:17, 25:17, 26:14, 26:16, 27:17, 67:25, 68:3</p> <p>except [1] - 96:6</p> <p>exceptional [1] - 77:22</p> <p>excerpt [2] - 152:6, 152:10</p> <p>excessively [1] - 104:5</p> <p>excuse [1] - 156:26</p> <p>executing [2] - 14:20, 42:16</p> <p>executive [9] - 22:11, 30:18, 51:20, 107:22, 108:9, 127:5, 139:9, 165:15, 165:20</p> <p>EXECUTIVE [1] - 3:13</p> <p>exercise [2] - 134:25, 134:26</p> <p>exhausted [1] - 11:4</p> <p>existed [1] - 168:22</p> <p>existing [1] - 168:10</p> <p>expand [1] - 41:18</p> <p>expect [7] -</p>	<p>13:6, 35:2, 35:12, 77:15, 96:8, 105:29, 161:7</p> <p>expected [9] - 35:3, 77:13, 104:24, 114:18, 130:25, 151:14, 151:16, 151:17, 161:22</p> <p>expecting [2] - 78:17, 96:12</p> <p>expeditiously [1] - 75:12</p> <p>experience [7] - 35:5, 64:18, 64:20, 66:28, 66:29, 74:5, 157:19</p> <p>experiencing [1] - 133:22</p> <p>expert [1] - 155:25</p> <p>expertise [2] - 58:16, 92:14</p> <p>explain [3] - 15:24, 76:8, 97:4</p> <p>explained [2] - 141:17, 152:15</p> <p>explanation [3] - 31:23, 35:25, 36:11</p> <p>explanatory [1] - 20:10</p> <p>explore [13] - 94:23, 94:26, 95:5, 95:22, 95:23, 95:27, 102:13, 108:15, 114:6, 114:10, 114:19, 128:29, 160:26</p> <p>exploring [2] - 120:6, 138:25</p> <p>expose [2] - 47:11, 54:9</p> <p>exposing [1] - 47:26</p> <p>exposure [1] - 84:22</p> <p>Exposure [1] - 84:29</p> <p>expressed [2] - 52:9, 95:26</p> <p>expressing [2] - 47:15, 170:11</p> <p>expressly [1] - 148:20</p> <p>extends [1] - 67:11</p> <p>extensively [3] -</p>	<p>61:15, 76:12, 161:20</p> <p>extent [3] - 26:18, 74:5, 120:20</p> <p>extra [4] - 90:8, 116:15, 129:14, 137:16</p> <p>extreme [1] - 166:18</p>	<p>157:5</p> <p>Fanning [5] - 12:1, 16:20, 67:16, 86:28, 89:15</p> <p>far [3] - 66:18, 116:23, 148:4</p> <p>FARRELL [1] - 4:5</p> <p>Farrell [1] - 87:10</p> <p>fashion [3] - 91:11, 96:11, 116:26</p> <p>favour [2] - 50:19, 82:24</p> <p>fax [1] - 67:26</p> <p>feasible [1] - 139:21</p> <p>feature [2] - 158:28, 161:13</p> <p>featured [1] - 160:24</p> <p>features [3] - 137:11, 156:19, 158:27</p> <p>FEBRUARY [1] - 171:8</p> <p>February [9] - 12:24, 19:3, 19:29, 79:10, 79:11, 89:20, 104:6, 171:2, 171:3</p> <p>fed [2] - 126:18, 126:19</p> <p>feedback [2] - 114:12, 141:4</p> <p>fellow [1] - 84:26</p> <p>felt [12] - 42:12, 51:3, 71:18, 91:12, 92:2, 106:8, 106:15, 127:18, 128:14, 129:13, 136:13, 163:11</p> <p>female [2] - 71:22, 92:6</p> <p>fences [1] - 15:3</p> <p>few [4] - 70:19, 101:10, 153:24, 155:18</p> <p>fides [2] - 62:25, 63:10</p> <p>figures [1] - 57:20</p> <p>file [16] - 17:21, 29:28, 29:29, 59:21, 59:26,</p>	<p>59:27, 59:28, 60:2, 60:8, 60:9, 60:13, 60:16, 77:14, 89:25, 147:18, 154:27</p> <p>files [6] - 18:15, 59:22, 60:10, 60:11, 60:12, 77:19</p> <p>fill [1] - 8:20</p> <p>filled [2] - 101:9, 101:13</p> <p>finalised [1] - 79:14</p> <p>finally [3] - 77:7, 167:17, 169:4</p> <p>financial [2] - 140:26, 141:19</p> <p>fine [6] - 36:8, 59:18, 61:12, 61:18, 65:13, 65:16</p> <p>fined [1] - 36:3</p> <p>finish [3] - 66:4, 66:19, 78:23</p> <p>Finn [4] - 150:12, 150:17, 150:20, 150:26</p> <p>FINN [1] - 3:5</p> <p>Fiona [2] - 41:3, 110:15</p> <p>first [40] - 6:4, 6:17, 7:19, 7:23, 9:4, 12:24, 13:20, 22:21, 22:22, 26:28, 37:11, 41:16, 43:24, 44:21, 44:23, 49:22, 58:17, 58:18, 68:5, 71:14, 72:20, 80:2, 80:5, 80:23, 82:27, 85:21, 90:26, 91:1, 91:7, 93:5, 98:9, 100:13, 101:9, 115:27, 118:10, 124:21, 137:24, 138:9, 156:16, 159:14</p> <p>fit [20] - 15:15, 45:24, 86:5, 86:13, 87:5, 88:14, 105:17, 105:18, 106:27, 120:16, 126:5, 131:3, 146:20, 147:2, 147:3, 155:26, 164:13, 166:8, 166:9</p>
F					
<p>face [1] - 167:14</p> <p>faced [1] - 135:8</p> <p>facilitate [7] - 15:25, 25:6, 75:6, 81:5, 133:28, 139:18, 140:7</p> <p>facilitated [1] - 53:12</p> <p>facility [2] - 33:5, 110:6</p> <p>fact [11] - 14:14, 36:27, 51:6, 51:16, 73:25, 99:23, 127:4, 134:10, 158:16, 159:29, 163:3</p> <p>factor [1] - 134:9</p> <p>factors [9] - 100:21, 102:14, 102:15, 114:27, 114:29, 115:5, 120:13</p> <p>facts [3] - 65:16, 71:1, 165:17</p> <p>factuals [1] - 114:8</p> <p>faculty [4] - 83:29, 84:19, 84:20, 84:26</p> <p>fair [10] - 49:6, 57:23, 57:27, 58:16, 60:13, 60:25, 61:8, 62:25, 62:26, 63:5</p> <p>fairness [4] - 23:10, 64:22, 73:27, 75:14</p> <p>falling [1] - 93:15</p> <p>falls [2] - 42:6, 42:14</p> <p>familiar [5] - 9:15, 10:10, 13:3, 22:24, 42:8</p> <p>family [1] -</p>					

<p>fitness [12] - 15:9, 97:6, 97:18, 130:20, 132:2, 144:1, 146:17, 146:27, 148:5, 148:6, 155:16</p> <p>FITZWILLIAM [1] - 4:8</p> <p>fixed [2] - 110:23, 169:23</p> <p>flag [2] - 120:3, 130:15</p> <p>flagged [2] - 144:27, 161:9</p> <p>flags [1] - 96:13</p> <p>Flanagan [1] - 91:3</p> <p>flow [1] - 105:7</p> <p>flu [2] - 121:12, 121:20</p> <p>flu/viral [4] - 73:23, 100:5, 123:15, 124:2</p> <p>flu/viral" [1] - 73:26</p> <p>FLYNN [1] - 3:19</p> <p>focus [4] - 112:13, 112:16, 162:1, 162:7</p> <p>folder [2] - 122:15</p> <p>follow [17] - 15:26, 16:6, 18:3, 18:5, 18:7, 18:8, 28:3, 38:2, 68:16, 80:22, 88:17, 106:25, 115:23, 119:6, 120:5, 132:23, 139:5</p> <p>followed [5] - 9:25, 18:23, 18:29, 50:12, 126:15</p> <p>following [15] - 8:9, 11:16, 16:7, 16:8, 16:27, 30:17, 47:7, 48:24, 85:23, 91:4, 115:23, 130:21, 139:7, 141:17, 163:10</p> <p>FOLLOWS [8] - 6:1, 6:10, 57:4, 66:25, 79:20, 82:20, 150:2, 153:15</p> <p>follows [4] - 19:12, 80:2, 130:20, 139:10</p> <p>food [2] -</p>	<p>134:22, 134:23</p> <p>foot [3] - 86:8, 107:4, 126:3</p> <p>FOR [5] - 3:2, 4:1, 4:4, 4:10, 79:19</p> <p>fora [1] - 61:2</p> <p>forced [3] - 162:21, 162:27, 164:4</p> <p>forget [1] - 149:20</p> <p>forgetting [1] - 153:19</p> <p>forgive [1] - 83:2</p> <p>forgotten [1] - 116:4</p> <p>form [19] - 8:20, 14:6, 15:4, 17:24, 53:13, 77:10, 77:11, 80:17, 82:11, 86:9, 86:10, 88:2, 95:15, 97:11, 108:20, 116:26, 120:15, 135:6</p> <p>formal [2] - 88:1, 107:2</p> <p>formally [3] - 127:5, 144:13, 144:29</p> <p>formed [2] - 154:28, 164:21</p> <p>forming [1] - 146:18</p> <p>forms [2] - 152:18, 152:20</p> <p>forth [3] - 12:20, 15:8, 52:10</p> <p>fortnight [1] - 126:14</p> <p>forward [11] - 15:27, 21:14, 28:7, 54:15, 93:1, 97:19, 111:25, 113:22, 142:5, 159:8, 161:25</p> <p>forwarded [2] - 22:4, 24:15</p> <p>forwarding [2] - 21:5, 23:21</p> <p>foster [1] - 139:19</p> <p>four [26] - 8:7, 8:11, 9:27, 10:10, 10:11, 10:13, 10:16, 11:5, 25:17, 26:9, 26:21, 27:19, 57:12, 68:7, 69:9,</p>	<p>69:11, 70:28, 80:21, 92:20, 116:3, 116:4, 116:11, 116:12, 132:19, 149:19, 149:22</p> <p>four-year [1] - 25:17</p> <p>fourth [1] - 150:18</p> <p>fraught [1] - 117:21</p> <p>free [4] - 78:3, 114:16, 160:7, 160:9</p> <p>freedom [1] - 160:10</p> <p>frequent [3] - 96:23, 102:13, 103:17</p> <p>frequently [3] - 35:16, 91:10, 92:10</p> <p>Friday [3] - 79:13, 138:18, 171:5</p> <p>friend [2] - 117:15, 117:16</p> <p>front [1] - 86:9</p> <p>full [19] - 9:25, 29:14, 30:14, 31:17, 33:1, 33:10, 38:24, 39:15, 39:26, 39:27, 40:19, 40:26, 50:14, 61:21, 68:26, 69:16, 76:15, 87:18, 87:22</p> <p>full-time [1] - 87:22</p> <p>full/slight/restricted [1] - 146:21</p> <p>fully [3] - 13:9, 110:28, 128:13</p> <p>function [5] - 45:13, 58:11, 138:3, 145:14, 148:1</p> <p>functions [1] - 54:4</p> <p>fundamentally [1] - 53:28</p> <p>funding [2] - 142:8, 142:21</p> <p>funds [1] - 50:27</p> <p>furnished [1] - 97:9</p> <p>further" [1] -</p>	<p>140:15</p> <p>furthermore [1] - 56:8</p> <p>future [4] - 15:3, 15:6, 47:6, 165:5</p>	<p>G</p> <p>game [1] - 19:8</p> <p>GARDA [6] - 3:2, 3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21, 4:10</p> <p>garda [4] - 111:3, 112:17, 145:24, 164:13</p> <p>Garda [17] - 6:20, 7:9, 7:19, 8:15, 9:1, 10:4, 10:13, 11:25, 12:27, 13:10, 14:9, 14:20, 15:8, 15:15, 18:27, 19:2, 19:8, 19:11, 19:13, 19:20, 19:23, 21:20, 24:10, 24:26, 25:10, 25:16, 25:21, 26:1, 26:8, 28:13, 28:16, 29:8, 30:14, 30:26, 31:28, 32:20, 32:26, 35:29, 36:19, 36:26, 37:8, 37:12, 37:18, 38:15, 40:18, 40:26, 42:4, 42:5, 42:13, 42:17, 42:18, 46:24, 47:3, 47:11, 47:26, 48:22, 48:29, 51:17, 54:3, 55:13, 57:15, 57:19, 57:20, 59:2, 59:5, 59:6, 60:23, 67:6, 67:8, 67:24, 68:2, 71:17, 72:21, 76:20, 76:28, 77:2, 77:8, 77:21, 77:23, 79:27, 80:19, 81:9, 81:10, 84:14, 84:16, 85:5, 85:21, 85:24, 85:28, 86:13, 87:15, 87:24, 88:6, 89:25, 91:7, 91:11, 92:13, 93:5, 94:14,</p>	<p>94:19, 96:21, 97:9, 97:17, 97:19, 97:25, 98:21, 100:3, 100:10, 101:9, 104:2, 108:1, 110:26, 111:14, 112:4, 112:6, 113:7, 115:7, 119:9, 121:2, 121:5, 123:27, 124:9, 124:12, 127:22, 128:1, 128:11, 128:17, 129:5, 129:6, 130:11, 137:29, 141:18, 142:19, 142:25, 143:21, 144:8, 144:9, 144:13, 146:16, 150:6, 150:7, 150:27, 151:5, 151:6, 151:9, 154:4, 154:22, 154:24, 155:4, 155:12, 159:9, 159:16, 159:28, 160:20, 162:2, 162:8, 162:16, 162:25, 163:19, 164:3, 164:19, 167:18, 168:8, 168:26, 169:22</p> <p>gathered [2] - 79:29, 120:10</p> <p>general [13] - 46:9, 59:17, 61:6, 61:17, 75:1, 81:12, 81:22, 96:3, 113:13, 113:19, 114:22, 140:28, 166:20</p> <p>generally [17] - 24:3, 34:29, 61:29, 63:13, 74:10, 94:24, 105:26, 111:21, 114:18, 135:2, 135:6, 158:1, 158:2, 158:14, 158:19, 166:2, 166:21</p> <p>generating [2] - 94:27, 120:13</p> <p>GERRY [1] - 3:11</p> <p>given [6] - 32:25, 82:3, 100:3, 137:5, 148:14, 164:18</p>	<p>GLEESON [1] - 4:7</p> <p>goals [1] - 133:19</p> <p>God [1] - 135:28</p> <p>GOHS [2] - 85:22, 85:24</p> <p>GOODE [1] - 3:22</p> <p>gosh [1] - 60:15</p> <p>governance [1] - 58:17</p> <p>GP [44] - 24:13, 34:21, 44:3, 44:6, 44:29, 45:7, 45:15, 97:22, 104:17, 104:18, 104:21, 105:20, 106:18, 106:21, 114:15, 117:9, 118:17, 118:18, 118:23, 118:25, 118:27, 119:4, 126:3, 126:4, 126:5, 127:10, 127:14, 127:15, 127:16, 127:19, 129:25, 132:23, 133:17, 134:2, 135:29, 138:6, 138:17, 138:18, 140:4, 140:7, 140:12, 163:15</p> <p>GPs [1] - 44:1</p> <p>grades [1] - 67:6</p> <p>GRALTON [1] - 3:14</p> <p>granted [1] - 11:6</p> <p>granting [1] - 54:7</p> <p>GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26</p> <p>ground [1] - 70:20</p> <p>grounds [2] - 86:3, 130:3</p> <p>group [3] - 41:25, 41:29, 42:22</p> <p>groups [1] - 41:23</p> <p>guard [5] - 58:26, 59:20, 59:21, 160:6, 164:22</p> <p>guidance [2] - 114:26, 131:5</p>
--	---	--	---	--	---	---

H							
<p>Haddington [1] - 116:9</p> <p>half [7] - 8:8, 9:26, 50:12, 64:5, 68:26, 69:16, 102:3</p> <p>hallucinating [1] - 170:2</p> <p>hallucination [1] - 158:28</p> <p>hallucinations [2] - 157:20, 158:13</p> <p>hand [2] - 72:14, 99:12</p> <p>handed [2] - 42:2, 97:13</p> <p>handle [1] - 138:24</p> <p>handwriting [1] - 137:25</p> <p>hang [1] - 66:16</p> <p>haphazard [1] - 91:10</p> <p>happy [5] - 78:29, 81:14, 117:18, 124:4, 153:5</p> <p>HARAN [1] - 4:5</p> <p>harassment [7] - 46:27, 47:8, 47:13, 124:13, 150:7, 150:27, 153:4</p> <p>hard [2] - 85:15, 153:25</p> <p>harshly [1] - 129:7</p> <p>HAVING [2] - 6:9, 82:19</p> <p>HEAD [1] - 3:15</p> <p>heading [1] - 122:26</p> <p>Headquarters [4] - 36:19, 151:5, 151:6, 151:9</p> <p>headquarters [2] - 108:5, 108:8</p> <p>health [6] - 8:21, 69:23, 84:23, 95:19, 95:27, 110:14</p> <p>Health [6] - 71:10, 86:8, 92:27, 96:3, 100:12, 109:23</p> <p>heard [5] - 10:3,</p>	<p>41:25, 41:26, 52:4, 127:22</p> <p>HEARING [3] - 6:1, 79:19, 171:8</p> <p>hearings [1] - 171:2</p> <p>heavily [4] - 118:1, 118:8, 118:9, 134:11</p> <p>heavily" [1] - 118:2</p> <p>held [3] - 23:25, 109:9, 130:7</p> <p>help [12] - 22:17, 73:28, 89:1, 107:27, 108:24, 110:6, 111:29, 112:8, 112:21, 119:14, 123:4, 134:28</p> <p>helpful [1] - 170:15</p> <p>helping [2] - 106:16, 133:21</p> <p>heretofore [1] - 10:9</p> <p>HIGGINS [1] - 4:10</p> <p>high [5] - 93:14, 101:24, 102:2, 102:4, 122:17</p> <p>Higher [1] - 84:8</p> <p>highlight [5] - 16:18, 119:3, 119:21, 124:25, 131:23</p> <p>highlighted [6] - 13:21, 37:23, 48:2, 116:2, 124:22, 131:21</p> <p>highlighting [2] - 34:11, 44:27</p> <p>highly [3] - 80:15, 82:11, 158:16</p> <p>himself [6] - 112:21, 116:19, 125:3, 125:5, 128:21, 141:16</p> <p>his/her [1] - 147:15</p> <p>his/hers [1] - 59:26</p> <p>historically [1] - 168:19</p> <p>history [2] - 17:1, 19:16</p> <p>hmm [2] - 16:11, 37:25</p> <p>hold [2] - 6:20,</p>	<p>47:18</p> <p>holding [1] - 127:8</p> <p>holiday [1] - 104:5</p> <p>holistic [1] - 94:4</p> <p>Homer [1] - 149:21</p> <p>honest [1] - 33:1</p> <p>honestly [1] - 26:10</p> <p>hope [4] - 78:25, 159:10, 163:27, 168:15</p> <p>hopefully [2] - 18:5, 78:14</p> <p>hoping [1] - 78:23</p> <p>HORAN [1] - 3:25</p> <p>hours [1] - 116:9</p> <p>HOUSE [2] - 3:27, 4:11</p> <p>house [1] - 83:11</p> <p>HQ [2] - 108:19, 124:12</p> <p>HR [37] - 6:23, 6:28, 7:4, 7:13, 12:7, 12:15, 18:11, 25:2, 28:13, 31:29, 57:8, 57:9, 57:10, 57:24, 57:25, 58:19, 58:27, 59:11, 59:12, 59:27, 60:2, 60:29, 61:3, 61:4, 63:23, 66:28, 67:8, 96:9, 100:15, 120:6, 131:19, 145:18, 145:21, 148:10, 165:15, 165:21, 167:15</p> <p>HRIS [1] - 73:21</p> <p>HRM [12] - 11:27, 14:5, 30:22, 74:15, 147:13, 148:26, 166:28, 167:2, 167:3, 167:4, 167:5, 167:16</p> <p>HRPD [9] - 22:11, 89:28, 93:12, 94:9, 107:22, 109:21, 119:2, 119:14, 126:19</p>	<p>HSE [2] - 84:11, 114:26</p> <p>HU [1] - 24:6</p> <p>huge [1] - 59:28</p> <p>human [1] - 56:20</p> <p>HUMAN [1] - 3:15</p> <p>Human [4] - 12:9, 85:24, 86:27, 108:8</p> <p>hurdles [1] - 81:29</p>	I	<p>i.e [2] - 31:10, 145:28</p> <p>ICELAND [1] - 4:11</p> <p>idea [7] - 24:29, 25:3, 42:3, 62:10, 89:5, 96:26, 157:13</p> <p>ideal [1] - 48:21</p> <p>identifies [2] - 150:20, 150:22</p> <p>identify [4] - 13:13, 60:13, 134:6, 137:21</p> <p>identifying [3] - 60:25, 61:21, 61:26</p> <p>ill [1] - 69:22</p> <p>illness [38] - 7:26, 8:1, 8:19, 8:23, 11:16, 43:8, 43:11, 43:19, 43:25, 48:28, 51:1, 63:28, 73:17, 94:29, 95:2, 95:6, 95:9, 95:10, 95:12, 95:14, 100:4, 100:19, 100:22, 114:7, 115:3, 116:27, 119:19, 120:13, 120:20, 120:23, 120:26, 123:17, 123:18, 136:28, 137:14, 147:24, 147:25</p> <p>illness/injury [1] - 147:22</p> <p>illnesses [1] - 43:24</p> <p>imagine [1] - 75:10</p> <p>immediate [1] -</p>	<p>19:21</p> <p>immediately [7] - 39:18, 67:17, 99:5, 108:3, 146:22, 148:24, 164:24</p> <p>impact [5] - 52:19, 106:11, 132:29, 139:14, 158:12</p> <p>impacting [1] - 106:12</p> <p>impacts [1] - 56:19</p> <p>implement [1] - 48:23</p> <p>implication [1] - 104:23</p> <p>importance [4] - 9:9, 104:26, 110:27, 118:25</p> <p>importance" [1] - 104:25</p> <p>important [5] - 14:15, 42:18, 71:26, 114:5, 148:9</p> <p>imposed [4] - 23:3, 36:8, 65:13, 65:16</p> <p>impress [1] - 110:27</p> <p>impression [4] - 27:11, 27:15, 27:16, 106:7</p> <p>improve [1] - 17:4</p> <p>improved [1] - 132:8</p> <p>inaction [1] - 47:28</p> <p>inadvertently [1] - 28:25</p> <p>inappropriate [1] - 130:6</p> <p>inappropriately [1] - 128:15</p> <p>incident [5] - 75:5, 87:28, 128:13, 147:18, 165:26</p> <p>incidents [1] - 75:26</p> <p>include [2] - 16:28, 44:16</p> <p>including [9] - 7:1, 16:26, 17:11, 19:14, 25:23, 25:27, 38:11, 56:11, 138:28</p>	<p>inclusive [4] - 25:28, 30:27, 86:20, 98:22</p> <p>inconvenience [1] - 66:15</p> <p>increased [1] - 158:24</p> <p>increases [1] - 157:18</p> <p>incurred [1] - 31:29</p> <p>indeed [4] - 47:28, 48:27, 52:1, 54:4</p> <p>independent [1] - 75:28</p> <p>INDEX [1] - 5:1</p> <p>indicate [2] - 17:22, 73:29</p> <p>indicated [7] - 92:16, 93:25, 94:15, 155:18, 159:28, 166:27, 167:24</p> <p>indicates [3] - 97:21, 126:5, 155:24</p> <p>indicating [10] - 24:9, 28:16, 71:20, 71:29, 72:21, 72:22, 72:28, 90:10, 92:4, 94:19</p> <p>indication [3] - 20:24, 73:2, 159:27</p> <p>indisposed [1] - 79:6</p> <p>individual [23] - 18:13, 18:14, 46:14, 46:16, 57:26, 58:8, 59:1, 59:19, 59:20, 59:21, 60:25, 62:10, 77:18, 95:25, 105:28, 113:15, 114:28, 128:25, 128:26, 128:29, 142:17, 166:28</p> <p>individual's [3] - 46:25, 96:7, 100:21</p> <p>individually [1] - 142:18</p> <p>individuals [1] - 111:20</p> <p>inferred [1] - 34:24</p> <p>influence [1] -</p>

<p>117:24 inform [2] - 110:26, 142:20 information [21] - 8:26, 9:5, 15:21, 17:10, 18:11, 21:6, 22:4, 22:6, 46:14, 60:1, 63:16, 75:3, 88:13, 103:9, 108:10, 120:10, 122:7, 130:18, 146:19, 147:15, 154:27 informed [4] - 29:18, 32:12, 141:15, 154:20 infrequently [2] - 35:17, 35:18 initial [3] - 37:14, 61:19, 73:14 initiated [1] - 130:25 initiative [1] - 167:6 injured [4] - 14:19, 42:16, 42:19, 164:22 injuries [3] - 47:6, 74:8, 84:21 injury [48] - 8:29, 9:3, 9:10, 42:4, 42:21, 43:4, 43:5, 43:8, 43:11, 43:27, 45:25, 45:27, 47:4, 47:11, 47:12, 47:26, 48:25, 48:26, 50:5, 50:11, 50:20, 54:11, 74:4, 74:7, 75:5, 75:26, 76:6, 76:10, 86:1, 144:14, 145:13, 145:28, 147:7, 147:8, 147:11, 147:17, 147:24, 147:26, 148:23, 164:28, 165:6, 165:7, 165:9, 165:23, 166:4, 166:29, 167:1 injustice [1] - 163:28 inpatient [5] - 86:16, 126:9, 133:29, 139:24, 154:6 input [2] - 93:26,</p>	<p>94:11 input" [1] - 138:29 inquiry [3] - 49:13, 50:14, 50:21 inside [2] - 95:4, 134:29 insofar [7] - 73:11, 155:2, 155:9, 155:12, 159:27, 162:4, 169:5 Inspector [8] - 10:3, 41:2, 41:25, 41:26, 49:24, 52:4, 86:11, 87:10 INSPECTOR [7] - 3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:18, 3:22, 4:5 instance [13] - 7:23, 9:4, 13:10, 13:20, 18:23, 27:26, 43:24, 44:21, 44:23, 49:22, 62:15, 73:26, 158:9 instances [4] - 27:25, 37:7, 54:5, 124:18 instead [1] - 121:11 instigation [1] - 47:29 INSTRUCTED [4] - 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10 instructing [1] - 39:16 instruction [3] - 30:17, 31:8, 97:28 instructions [1] - 31:27 insufficient [1] - 81:4 integrated [1] - 16:6 intend [1] - 12:21 intended [2] - 130:11, 170:29 intense [1] - 167:25 intensified [1] - 127:18 intensive [2] - 133:18, 136:14</p>	<p>intent [1] - 169:27 intention [1] - 139:23 interacting [1] - 100:28 interactively [1] - 118:23 interest [1] - 12:22 interference [1] - 75:2 interim [2] - 56:20, 90:22 internal [1] - 124:14 Internal [3] - 36:19, 36:22, 36:23 interrogate [1] - 62:10 intervention [5] - 51:17, 132:24, 133:9, 133:15, 139:4 interventions [4] - 88:17, 104:19, 118:22, 130:24 interview [1] - 21:23 intractable [1] - 135:25 introduction [2] - 10:13, 42:11 investigate [3] - 22:2, 150:11, 150:13 investigated [3] - 22:14, 46:26, 62:17 investigating [1] - 111:14 investigation [22] - 37:19, 44:16, 44:20, 46:29, 47:24, 47:29, 54:9, 61:21, 61:27, 62:8, 62:9, 63:10, 98:17, 98:26, 99:1, 147:18, 148:24, 148:28, 151:26, 168:29, 169:3 investigations [5] - 43:20, 46:13, 48:25, 49:17, 124:14 investigators [1]</p>	<p>- 121:6 invited [1] - 82:2 invoking [1] - 23:12 involved [3] - 74:6, 80:6, 122:10 involvement [1] - 151:13 involves [1] - 45:8 involving [3] - 94:4, 139:16, 165:28 Ireland [8] - 83:11, 83:18, 83:20, 83:23, 83:29, 84:2, 84:8, 84:11 Irish [1] - 84:8 ironic [1] - 82:13 irrelevant [1] - 80:25 issue [36] - 20:14, 21:27, 22:15, 25:28, 27:25, 34:21, 44:1, 44:21, 45:11, 45:13, 47:9, 48:9, 57:13, 64:19, 73:12, 74:19, 74:26, 75:12, 75:16, 75:19, 76:17, 76:19, 76:24, 87:12, 107:18, 111:6, 112:12, 112:23, 113:22, 119:29, 128:25, 131:18, 141:8, 144:18, 150:4, 155:2 issued [9] - 11:25, 11:26, 12:6, 12:16, 31:28, 43:26, 64:22, 99:11, 101:15 issues [36] - 18:19, 22:26, 56:10, 56:25, 62:19, 65:8, 65:11, 71:17, 89:11, 91:8, 91:12, 91:16, 91:20, 91:22, 91:26, 92:8, 97:24, 106:6, 106:12, 111:17, 114:19, 116:15,</p>	<p>116:16, 119:5, 119:6, 128:20, 130:4, 130:8, 130:12, 139:12, 144:28, 147:7, 154:18, 161:4, 161:19, 167:17 issuing [1] - 56:22 IT [1] - 18:12 item [2] - 16:12, 20:10 itself [8] - 43:4, 47:5, 50:29, 76:10, 94:29, 95:1, 135:4</p>	<p>162:16</p>
K					
					<p>KATE [1] - 3:25 Kavanagh [7] - 20:16, 55:24, 63:22, 71:13, 72:7, 150:16, 150:21 KEANE [1] - 4:6 keep [5] - 58:9, 61:17, 70:8, 132:23, 136:22 keeping [1] - 110:28 Kelly [4] - 78:27, 80:29, 81:17, 149:22 KELLY [10] - 3:12, 78:29, 81:18, 81:26, 82:6, 82:9, 149:12, 149:18, 164:1, 164:6 Kelly's [3] - 80:17, 81:10 Keogh [92] - 7:20, 12:27, 14:9, 15:15, 18:27, 19:3, 19:12, 19:13, 19:20, 19:23, 21:20, 24:10, 24:26, 25:10, 25:16, 25:21, 26:1, 26:9, 28:16, 29:9, 30:14, 30:26, 36:1, 37:8, 37:12, 37:18, 38:16, 40:18, 40:26, 51:18, 55:13, 60:23, 68:2, 71:17, 72:6, 72:21, 76:20, 77:2, 77:8, 77:21, 85:5, 85:21, 85:28, 86:13, 87:15, 87:24, 88:6, 89:25, 91:7, 91:11, 92:13, 93:5, 94:19, 96:21, 97:9, 97:17, 97:19, 97:25, 100:3, 101:9, 108:1, 110:26, 111:14, 112:6, 115:8, 119:9, 123:27, 124:9, 128:1,</p>
J					
					<p>JACK [1] - 3:6 JANUARY [1] - 6:2 January [17] - 16:14, 16:20, 24:8, 24:9, 71:4, 79:25, 93:15, 102:3, 103:18, 104:6, 126:25, 129:27, 129:28, 131:17, 150:23, 163:16 job [1] - 74:9 JOE [1] - 3:14 JOHN [2] - 3:8, 4:1 John [5] - 41:2, 41:11, 41:14, 49:25, 135:28 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 judgment [1] - 136:24 July [19] - 7:11, 12:5, 23:18, 24:18, 30:27, 35:24, 86:12, 86:14, 109:7, 113:26, 116:4, 116:6, 117:5, 117:25, 142:1, 142:20, 142:28, 162:9 June [10] - 41:2, 49:25, 53:3, 56:18, 98:23, 138:6, 139:8, 139:29, 141:9, 162:15 Justice [3] - 67:5, 124:8,</p>

129:6, 130:11, 137:29, 142:25, 143:21, 144:9, 144:13, 150:6, 154:4, 154:22, 155:4, 155:12, 159:9, 159:16, 159:28, 160:21, 162:2, 162:16, 162:25, 163:19, 164:3, 168:8, 169:22 Keogh's [15] - 11:25, 15:9, 19:9, 28:13, 36:26, 67:24, 79:28, 100:10, 121:2, 121:5, 150:27, 154:24, 162:8, 167:19, 168:26 kept [5] - 56:9, 58:12, 100:19, 125:14, 137:29 KEVIN [1] - 3:14 keys [2] - 117:27, 117:28 kick [2] - 15:29, 56:23 kicks [1] - 45:28 KIERAN [1] - 3:20 Killarney [1] - 31:28 kind [29] - 13:14, 23:1, 60:6, 63:7, 74:23, 94:26, 95:25, 102:13, 103:26, 105:27, 105:28, 111:21, 112:15, 113:14, 113:23, 114:10, 114:11, 114:16, 119:22, 128:29, 134:28, 146:26, 151:3, 160:27, 161:13, 168:23, 168:29, 170:7 KIRWAN [1] - 3:13 knowing [1] - 100:25 knowledge [4] - 68:5, 72:13, 116:16, 116:24 known [8] - 10:28, 12:25, 34:29, 35:1, 35:8, 35:14, 77:4, 89:14 knows [5] -	60:22, 136:27, 136:28, 158:17, 158:18 L lacuna [1] - 35:9 Lagos [1] - 83:7 larger [1] - 118:6 last [11] - 8:7, 19:9, 34:12, 37:3, 53:28, 100:2, 110:2, 115:23, 116:1, 139:10 late [2] - 152:25, 152:26 latitude [1] - 66:9 layman's [1] - 156:27 leading [1] - 44:9 leaning [1] - 50:19 least [10] - 16:25, 17:16, 18:22, 26:25, 33:26, 88:27, 91:26, 152:25, 164:29, 169:26 leave [91] - 7:1, 7:3, 7:7, 7:9, 8:3, 8:4, 8:7, 8:10, 9:21, 9:25, 9:26, 9:27, 10:7, 11:4, 11:6, 14:23, 14:25, 15:3, 15:4, 16:8, 20:24, 26:17, 27:9, 27:26, 28:21, 29:9, 29:24, 29:25, 30:4, 30:26, 31:9, 31:10, 31:11, 31:12, 34:15, 34:19, 35:24, 36:2, 36:10, 38:16, 39:17, 39:19, 40:6, 42:11, 47:22, 48:22, 48:23, 49:2, 49:14, 49:15, 50:25, 51:6, 51:10, 51:12, 51:13, 52:26, 53:11, 53:14, 54:8, 54:16, 55:1, 55:2, 56:11, 58:10, 59:6, 59:23, 61:9,	64:1, 67:18, 67:25, 68:9, 68:10, 68:25, 68:26, 69:10, 70:17, 71:6, 74:7, 78:18, 92:22, 92:23, 93:19, 93:20, 102:5, 138:14, 162:22, 163:26 Leave [2] - 9:16, 9:18 leaving [1] - 47:5 led [1] - 106:6 left [2] - 85:2, 99:12 left-hand [1] - 99:12 legal [1] - 53:1 legality [1] - 56:7 legislation [3] - 22:24, 30:2, 48:10 less [2] - 98:1, 160:26 letter [25] - 12:25, 14:12, 16:14, 17:29, 20:12, 21:3, 21:27, 22:9, 26:13, 30:21, 31:4, 33:10, 34:12, 62:16, 62:17, 62:19, 62:22, 103:10, 124:7, 151:1, 152:11, 153:26, 153:29, 160:28, 163:16 letters [2] - 12:19, 15:8 level [6] - 24:6, 101:24, 102:2, 115:13, 131:27, 137:5 levels [1] - 93:14 Lexapro [4] - 141:11, 141:25, 141:27, 157:8 liaise [2] - 64:21, 99:2 liaising [3] - 106:20, 111:16, 168:3 LIAM [1] - 3:18 lie [1] - 120:1 lies [1] - 167:4 light [1] - 140:9	likely [3] - 127:28, 151:9, 168:21 limit [1] - 81:6 limits [2] - 68:9, 68:10 line [7] - 44:19, 50:9, 58:18, 62:12, 71:26, 97:15, 130:10 lines [3] - 101:10, 122:26, 162:18 linked [1] - 142:23 linking [2] - 118:23, 129:24 list [3] - 20:11, 63:19, 125:3 listening [1] - 134:8 literally [1] - 59:29 litigation [2] - 47:5, 47:27 LITTLE [1] - 3:28 live [1] - 78:26 lives [2] - 20:27, 73:5 Local [1] - 126:7 local [42] - 6:29, 13:5, 13:6, 13:21, 16:5, 17:29, 20:6, 21:23, 22:2, 23:3, 25:2, 46:18, 55:22, 56:5, 57:26, 58:4, 58:17, 62:4, 62:7, 62:8, 62:11, 62:25, 63:12, 64:22, 73:11, 93:12, 94:4, 94:8, 97:4, 114:18, 117:18, 120:6, 126:6, 126:8, 126:27, 130:7, 136:1, 142:11, 145:18, 148:10, 167:14 locally [5] - 7:27, 46:13, 73:18, 133:17, 138:26 locate [1] - 29:29 locking [1] - 136:11 logical [1] - 105:7 long-term [2] - 112:28, 163:26	look [48] - 16:19, 30:11, 31:19, 37:11, 39:10, 41:11, 42:20, 43:13, 48:7, 49:19, 49:22, 52:17, 61:18, 62:21, 62:24, 63:13, 75:3, 85:26, 86:9, 86:21, 86:25, 88:4, 88:7, 89:24, 90:26, 97:1, 98:5, 99:13, 107:26, 108:5, 108:24, 122:15, 125:29, 126:22, 127:27, 128:19, 128:28, 129:17, 129:28, 131:12, 138:9, 139:8, 140:27, 143:11, 146:5, 148:19, 164:8, 164:12 looked [2] - 131:18, 161:25 looking [10] - 15:26, 18:15, 49:16, 51:3, 51:4, 77:17, 89:16, 108:9, 115:2, 143:13 looks [5] - 13:11, 18:17, 25:14, 26:20, 137:25 Lorraine [1] - 21:4 LORRAINE [1] - 3:4 loss [2] - 130:3, 138:19 low [1] - 132:20 LUNCH [1] - 79:19 LYONS [1] - 4:6 M mail [17] - 19:29, 28:29, 29:5, 37:14, 37:26, 37:27, 38:7, 39:10, 39:11, 40:2, 40:13, 41:21, 55:25, 63:22, 76:12, 89:28, 93:12 mails [3] - 12:20, 52:10, 76:27	Main [1] - 98:16 main [4] - 98:20, 98:23, 141:15, 159:25 maintain [2] - 90:14, 104:27 maintains [1] - 155:12 maintenance [1] - 139:15 manage [3] - 47:10, 57:24, 57:29 managed [2] - 8:15, 58:2 management [75] - 6:29, 7:7, 8:24, 13:5, 13:6, 13:21, 16:5, 17:29, 19:15, 20:6, 21:23, 22:2, 23:3, 25:2, 25:24, 46:18, 49:1, 53:7, 55:22, 56:5, 57:27, 58:4, 58:18, 62:25, 63:13, 64:23, 73:11, 75:17, 84:21, 87:3, 87:23, 89:9, 93:13, 94:5, 94:8, 94:12, 94:13, 94:14, 95:19, 95:23, 95:25, 97:4, 101:23, 102:1, 110:26, 111:29, 114:19, 114:23, 116:15, 117:18, 118:19, 119:5, 119:6, 119:22, 119:27, 120:6, 120:28, 127:17, 127:21, 128:27, 129:14, 130:7, 134:9, 135:29, 139:17, 142:11, 143:29, 145:18, 146:6, 147:19, 148:10, 161:7, 168:1, 168:27, 169:1 Management [2] - 9:16, 86:27 management's [2] - 113:3, 114:10 manager [5] - 30:13, 44:19, 56:12, 62:4, 62:11 managers [4] -
--	---	---	--	--	---

<p>52:24, 60:19, 62:8, 62:12</p> <p>managing [2] - 146:11, 168:2</p> <p>Manchester [1] - 83:15</p> <p>manual [1] - 56:21</p> <p>March [20] - 9:19, 10:14, 67:20, 68:25, 71:6, 72:19, 89:26, 91:7, 91:8, 92:22, 92:23, 93:20, 98:7, 98:12, 102:20, 102:24, 102:28, 103:6, 144:8</p> <p>Margaret [2] - 41:7, 55:25</p> <p>MARGARET [1] - 3:21</p> <p>marginally [1] - 26:24</p> <p>MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17</p> <p>MARK [1] - 3:3</p> <p>marriages [1] - 60:5</p> <p>Marrinan [5] - 53:23, 70:18, 72:25, 73:9, 78:1</p> <p>MARRINAN [22] - 5:5, 6:4, 6:10, 6:14, 6:17, 28:7, 30:9, 33:19, 34:11, 34:29, 37:1, 52:7, 52:12, 52:14, 53:3, 53:20, 53:24, 53:27, 54:22, 55:10, 55:17, 78:2</p> <p>marrinan [1] - 55:16</p> <p>mate [1] - 19:14</p> <p>material [15] - 19:27, 20:15, 21:18, 28:10, 31:19, 36:16, 37:4, 37:13, 40:12, 40:29, 49:23, 80:16, 80:18, 82:3, 82:4</p> <p>materiality [1] - 80:12</p> <p>materials [4] - 6:15, 9:13, 20:11, 79:29</p> <p>MATT [1] - 3:19</p>	<p>matter [24] - 18:20, 31:16, 32:26, 33:17, 33:24, 35:26, 36:18, 38:4, 38:12, 40:25, 41:7, 53:23, 63:11, 72:11, 72:25, 75:10, 76:22, 80:26, 81:7, 147:12, 148:16, 149:2, 160:6</p> <p>matters [10] - 7:18, 17:11, 18:3, 36:24, 56:26, 109:7, 138:3, 143:28, 148:4, 169:14</p> <p>maximum [4] - 9:24, 9:25, 9:26, 69:11</p> <p>May/June [1] - 87:15</p> <p>McBrien [1] - 88:1</p> <p>McCARTAN [2] - 4:10, 4:11</p> <p>McGRATH [1] - 79:10</p> <p>McGuinness [51] - 3:24, 5:7, 5:11, 5:13, 65:25, 65:26, 65:29, 66:22, 66:24, 66:27, 67:11, 68:24, 70:7, 76:14, 78:11, 78:12, 78:14, 78:20, 78:23, 79:22, 81:15, 81:16, 82:17, 82:20, 83:5, 91:19, 91:23, 91:27, 91:29, 93:8, 103:7, 103:15, 104:12, 104:17, 105:12, 105:17, 107:26, 124:7, 137:21, 145:8, 146:5, 148:15, 150:5, 156:14, 162:6, 167:23, 169:13, 169:14, 170:13, 170:25, 171:4</p> <p>mcGuinness [1] - 103:14</p> <p>McLOUGHLIN [1] - 3:6</p>	<p>McLoughlin [8] - 29:5, 30:12, 30:18, 37:15, 37:28, 38:13, 40:15, 50:4</p> <p>McLoughlin's [1] - 51:17</p> <p>McLYNN [1] - 4:2</p> <p>MCMAHON [1] - 3:8</p> <p>MCPARTLIN [1] - 3:20</p> <p>meals [1] - 118:16</p> <p>mean [15] - 13:9, 34:29, 52:27, 62:9, 63:1, 81:23, 100:27, 106:8, 135:24, 136:22, 140:21, 144:12, 160:23, 165:23, 167:19</p> <p>means [7] - 8:6, 14:22, 27:8, 51:5, 91:14, 95:5, 135:3</p> <p>meantime [2] - 29:13, 38:23</p> <p>measure [1] - 92:12</p> <p>measures [2] - 19:18, 161:10</p> <p>mechanism [1] - 135:7</p> <p>med [1] - 91:7</p> <p>Medical [33] - 12:29, 13:8, 13:16, 16:22, 17:15, 17:19, 21:1, 21:8, 21:15, 22:5, 22:28, 25:2, 42:1, 43:9, 45:20, 49:27, 51:2, 63:17, 65:27, 70:12, 73:7, 74:2, 74:16, 77:17, 79:26, 81:8, 82:16, 84:9, 92:13, 97:26, 122:29, 124:11, 146:16</p> <p>MEDICAL [1] - 3:11</p> <p>medical [42] - 14:8, 21:28, 25:25, 44:1, 45:11, 45:13, 50:6, 75:28, 83:11, 83:12,</p>	<p>86:3, 92:14, 94:29, 95:29, 96:4, 96:5, 96:6, 96:12, 97:6, 97:18, 97:20, 97:24, 106:15, 108:21, 108:22, 129:2, 130:3, 130:20, 135:2, 146:17, 146:18, 146:19, 147:1, 154:21, 155:16, 156:8, 156:9, 157:17, 158:4, 158:23, 167:23</p> <p>medically [3] - 87:5, 88:14, 157:14</p> <p>medication [3] - 141:28, 156:28, 167:29</p> <p>medicine [8] - 83:6, 83:15, 83:23, 83:28, 84:1, 84:7, 84:20, 84:26</p> <p>Medicine [1] - 83:7</p> <p>meet [4] - 25:1, 94:26, 140:12, 150:26</p> <p>meeting [20] - 44:5, 98:21, 102:23, 103:2, 103:9, 109:18, 111:5, 111:21, 112:10, 121:3, 125:22, 151:2, 151:4, 159:8, 159:12, 160:5, 160:16, 160:18, 161:26, 162:4</p> <p>meetings [2] - 109:19, 111:21</p> <p>member [117] - 7:28, 9:2, 14:19, 14:21, 15:21, 16:6, 16:23, 16:26, 16:28, 17:4, 17:12, 20:4, 20:22, 20:29, 21:7, 21:23, 22:7, 23:4, 23:10, 24:12, 25:4, 25:6, 28:20, 29:14, 29:19, 31:10, 32:12, 32:15, 33:2, 35:23, 36:3, 36:5, 36:8, 38:23, 39:17, 39:20,</p>	<p>40:5, 42:17, 44:2, 44:5, 45:24, 45:26, 46:11, 48:28, 58:18, 61:22, 62:13, 64:1, 64:20, 65:1, 65:3, 70:27, 71:5, 71:9, 71:24, 73:1, 73:6, 73:16, 73:29, 74:20, 74:26, 75:7, 75:17, 75:24, 83:19, 83:29, 84:19, 84:20, 84:28, 88:13, 88:16, 88:22, 89:3, 90:4, 90:10, 92:7, 92:16, 92:19, 92:21, 92:26, 93:24, 93:26, 97:4, 97:29, 108:15, 110:4, 110:5, 110:28, 111:26, 112:20, 114:23, 115:4, 117:17, 126:4, 128:6, 128:9, 130:2, 130:19, 130:22, 130:26, 131:22, 132:14, 138:18, 139:5, 140:9, 140:12, 146:20, 146:21, 146:27, 154:2, 156:24, 165:26, 166:29, 167:12</p> <p>member's [34] - 20:20, 21:24, 22:13, 25:28, 31:23, 32:17, 44:4, 44:6, 44:8, 44:29, 45:15, 45:18, 47:27, 48:21, 87:1, 93:14, 95:28, 108:21, 108:22, 109:29, 112:1, 115:22, 123:8, 130:22, 131:2, 139:13, 139:14, 139:17, 140:6, 140:17, 146:17, 146:23, 147:23, 147:24</p> <p>member/staff [1] - 48:8</p> <p>members [34] - 8:19, 10:14, 13:7, 13:8, 13:9, 13:15, 21:29, 22:25,</p>	<p>24:5, 27:23, 33:4, 34:13, 42:5, 42:13, 42:18, 43:25, 45:21, 47:23, 49:2, 57:19, 58:6, 58:12, 58:13, 58:20, 59:2, 59:4, 60:12, 74:5, 75:11, 94:24, 98:29, 130:27, 148:22, 169:17</p> <p>membership [1] - 74:3</p> <p>memo [1] - 76:11</p> <p>memoire [2] - 125:3, 125:5</p> <p>memory [2] - 112:3, 112:8</p> <p>memos [1] - 113:25</p> <p>mental [2] - 95:19, 95:26</p> <p>mention [2] - 76:16, 79:27</p> <p>mentioned [11] - 9:12, 67:23, 76:29, 77:23, 82:14, 94:24, 98:4, 111:6, 134:1, 152:28, 159:24</p> <p>merely [3] - 18:1, 21:13, 44:28</p> <p>message [2] - 67:26, 138:17</p> <p>met [11] - 97:8, 98:16, 98:20, 98:24, 98:26, 103:3, 121:8, 141:24, 150:29, 159:29</p> <p>methodology [2] - 10:11, 13:14</p> <p>MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19</p> <p>Mick [2] - 40:23, 112:4</p> <p>middle [4] - 19:28, 109:24, 112:18, 142:2</p> <p>midnight [5] - 25:12, 25:16, 26:21, 27:9, 27:21</p> <p>might [27] - 8:2, 8:22, 9:2, 9:11,</p>
---	---	--	---	---	--

15:23, 22:27, 28:24, 30:9, 40:4, 53:16, 54:19, 60:6, 60:7, 61:1, 66:13, 74:15, 75:3, 76:3, 80:7, 81:21, 91:24, 113:15, 128:3, 134:24, 140:1, 166:27, 166:28 mind [4] - 71:22, 92:5, 145:18, 146:7 Minister [3] - 124:7, 162:15, 162:25 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 Minnock [1] - 86:11 minute [2] - 26:11, 93:12 minutes [2] - 109:15, 109:16 misleading [2] - 27:10, 28:24 missed [2] - 81:19, 81:29 mistaken [2] - 33:13, 127:12 misunderstand ing [1] - 128:22 misunderstood [1] - 99:20 misuse [1] - 104:24 mix [2] - 158:5, 158:7 mixed [2] - 118:5, 143:17 mixing [4] - 125:23, 157:11, 157:18, 158:10 mixture [1] - 106:9 moment [10] - 18:28, 27:10, 38:8, 64:10, 67:13, 69:18, 79:25, 149:21, 150:15, 153:19 moments [2] - 153:24, 155:18 Monday [1] - 171:3 MONDAY [1] - 171:8 money [4] - 31:12, 36:25, 65:12, 65:14	MONICA [5] - 3:15, 5:3, 6:9, 57:3, 66:24 Monica [2] - 6:5, 6:12 monies [4] - 48:28, 50:27, 65:5, 65:8 monitored [1] - 18:19 monitoring [2] - 72:16, 90:14 month [3] - 13:27, 68:17, 101:25 months [19] - 14:28, 16:25, 17:16, 17:17, 17:21, 18:22, 19:4, 39:27, 50:8, 50:11, 50:12, 68:19, 76:22, 88:27, 100:2, 102:3 mood [4] - 105:10, 105:14 moral [3] - 135:13, 135:15, 136:24 morning [9] - 6:4, 6:6, 38:9, 57:6, 69:20, 109:3, 145:9, 166:24, 167:7 MORONEY [1] - 3:18 MORRISSEY [1] - 3:26 most [6] - 12:21, 59:9, 127:28, 135:28, 151:9, 164:6 mostly [1] - 93:15 mother [1] - 118:14 move [19] - 8:11, 15:7, 18:25, 20:8, 20:10, 21:17, 24:18, 28:7, 35:19, 38:6, 40:12, 40:29, 59:29, 82:1, 107:18, 113:22, 159:8, 162:5, 162:17 movement [2] - 19:1, 119:20 moving [1] - 161:25	Moylan [5] - 19:27, 89:18, 97:8, 97:14, 98:3 MR [114] - 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 4:1, 4:1, 4:6, 4:10, 4:10, 5:5, 5:7, 5:11, 5:12, 5:13, 6:4, 6:10, 6:14, 6:17, 28:7, 30:9, 33:19, 34:11, 34:29, 37:1, 52:7, 52:12, 52:14, 53:3, 53:20, 53:24, 53:27, 54:22, 55:10, 55:17, 65:26, 66:6, 66:8, 66:12, 66:20, 66:24, 66:27, 67:11, 68:24, 70:7, 76:14, 78:2, 78:12, 78:14, 78:20, 78:23, 78:29, 79:22, 81:16, 81:18, 81:26, 82:6, 82:9, 82:17, 82:20, 83:5, 91:19, 91:23, 91:27, 91:29, 93:8, 103:7, 103:15, 104:12, 104:17, 105:12, 105:17, 107:26, 124:7, 137:21, 145:8, 146:5, 148:15, 149:12, 149:16, 149:18, 149:24, 150:2, 150:4, 152:1, 152:3, 152:22, 153:6, 153:12, 153:14, 153:17, 153:20, 153:23, 155:28, 156:1, 156:3, 156:5, 157:8, 157:14, 158:22, 161:11, 164:1, 164:6, 164:17, 165:8, 166:23, 169:11, 169:13, 169:14, 170:13, 170:25, 171:4 MS [15] - 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 4:1, 4:7, 4:7, 5:3, 5:6, 6:9, 57:3, 57:6, 66:24, 79:10	MULCAHY [1] - 3:5 Mulcahy [2] - 111:12, 112:4 MULLIGAN [4] - 3:13, 5:6, 57:3, 57:6 Mulligan [9] - 12:13, 12:14, 59:10, 60:21, 60:29, 61:7, 61:14, 61:20 Mulligan's [1] - 62:20 Mullingar [6] - 14:4, 15:14, 19:29, 21:19, 23:18, 24:16 multiple [1] - 157:28 MURPHY [23] - 3:23, 66:6, 66:8, 66:12, 66:20, 149:16, 153:12, 153:14, 153:17, 153:20, 153:23, 155:28, 156:1, 156:3, 156:5, 157:8, 157:14, 158:22, 161:11, 164:17, 165:8, 166:23, 169:11 Murphy [4] - 149:15, 149:20, 153:11, 164:8 MURRAY [2] - 3:3, 3:9 Murray [23] - 20:13, 21:5, 30:23, 32:4, 35:1, 35:8, 35:20, 70:22, 72:19, 72:27, 73:15, 90:29, 91:21, 91:22, 93:4, 100:9, 102:10, 107:9, 108:2, 108:11, 113:25, 142:14, 160:28 Murray's [3] - 94:18, 108:13, 113:5 must [2] - 91:27, 118:22 MÍCHEÁL [1] - 3:23	name [4] - 82:25, 82:27, 82:28, 82:29 named [1] - 30:26 National [1] - 84:29 natural [1] - 36:9 nature [5] - 7:26, 48:11, 50:7, 59:17, 100:4 Navan [5] - 8:14, 8:24, 13:12, 56:11, 62:7 necessarily [4] - 49:21, 63:5, 77:4, 120:19 necessary [8] - 17:5, 19:19, 31:27, 48:7, 66:10, 81:7, 110:4, 110:29 necessity [1] - 88:16 need [19] - 9:14, 16:15, 18:19, 20:9, 28:14, 40:7, 53:19, 61:18, 61:21, 86:21, 106:17, 107:14, 111:29, 128:28, 148:11, 165:16, 170:28 needed [3] - 53:14, 127:18, 133:27 needn't [1] - 29:3 needs [8] - 18:20, 42:13, 46:12, 52:29, 53:17, 79:13, 112:20, 112:21 negative [1] - 139:14 negatively [1] - 132:14 negligence [1] - 75:23 neurological [1] - 158:24 neutral [2] - 153:2, 153:3 never [9] - 100:23, 144:13, 144:19, 144:23, 144:28, 163:3, 164:6, 170:8, 170:11 new [12] - 9:18,	9:24, 22:23, 71:22, 87:1, 92:6, 93:13, 102:20, 102:28, 104:18, 115:21, 139:4 next [22] - 14:3, 18:28, 79:22, 86:7, 88:4, 94:1, 94:13, 102:22, 102:29, 108:12, 116:12, 117:3, 118:3, 118:8, 126:14, 131:8, 132:27, 137:27, 139:3, 147:6, 148:19, 148:20 NICHOLAS [1] - 4:5 Nicholas [4] - 19:3, 68:2, 126:26, 126:29 Nick [7] - 98:16, 98:20, 98:24, 98:28, 141:15, 141:19, 141:24 Nicky [1] - 38:16 Nigeria [1] - 83:7 nil [1] - 90:13 nine [1] - 39:27 nobody [6] - 110:13, 136:24, 145:1, 145:5, 148:7, 160:10 NOEL [1] - 4:10 NOLAN [1] - 3:6 non [7] - 25:18, 34:14, 70:6, 74:26, 97:24, 148:6, 148:22 non- attendance [1] - 34:14 non-effective [2] - 25:18, 148:22 non-fitness [1] - 148:6 non-issue [1] - 74:26 non-medical [1] - 97:24 non- reckonable [1] - 70:6 noncompliant e [4] - 34:14, 34:19, 34:23, 70:16 none [1] - 143:23 nonetheless [3]
N					
N/A [1] - 115:13					

<p>- 71:18, 91:12, 92:2</p> <p>normal [9] - 15:15, 87:6, 88:14, 96:1, 96:2, 97:2, 107:19, 115:14, 149:2</p> <p>normally [2] - 96:8, 105:12</p> <p>note [20] - 19:23, 31:23, 39:15, 67:29, 71:15, 86:18, 86:28, 89:24, 90:20, 98:10, 98:18, 108:23, 124:26, 126:21, 127:23, 127:27, 140:2, 141:6, 148:9</p> <p>noted [5] - 89:28, 90:2, 93:12, 99:9, 102:17</p> <p>notes [30] - 24:19, 90:27, 93:9, 98:5, 98:8, 101:5, 109:18, 109:19, 110:16, 111:22, 115:10, 124:18, 124:21, 125:10, 125:20, 127:23, 129:10, 131:27, 138:9, 138:11, 141:29, 156:12, 156:15, 159:12, 159:15, 159:16, 159:25, 160:23, 162:5</p> <p>nothing [4] - 61:3, 64:28, 65:19, 168:18</p> <p>notice [3] - 100:4, 169:17, 169:18</p> <p>noticed [1] - 100:7</p> <p>notification [4] - 8:12, 15:25, 31:9, 68:5</p> <p>notifications [1] - 8:15</p> <p>notified [4] - 73:15, 73:27, 131:4, 146:22</p> <p>notify [2] - 13:6, 13:21</p> <p>notifying [1] - 35:3</p> <p>notwithstanding [3] - 51:16,</p>	<p>163:20, 163:22</p> <p>November [2] - 88:6, 116:8</p> <p>Nugent [3] - 41:7, 55:18, 55:26</p> <p>NUGENT [2] - 3:14, 3:21</p> <p>number [30] - 7:18, 12:19, 15:7, 15:10, 16:12, 20:8, 20:10, 26:6, 28:8, 28:11, 28:25, 38:10, 41:4, 49:20, 53:20, 59:22, 67:3, 72:7, 83:10, 85:10, 89:16, 102:4, 102:17, 109:20, 115:26, 143:20, 151:26, 170:20</p> <p>numerous [1] - 77:19</p> <p>NYLAND [1] - 3:19</p> <p>NÓIRÍN [1] - 3:7</p>	<p>73:11</p> <p>obliged [1] - 29:18</p> <p>observation [2] - 56:15, 112:20</p> <p>observations [3] - 109:20, 109:23, 142:12</p> <p>obsessed [1] - 134:25</p> <p>obtained [2] - 34:3, 72:13</p> <p>obvious [1] - 134:7</p> <p>obviously [19] - 18:16, 33:13, 63:7, 79:2, 81:5, 81:24, 89:21, 90:27, 93:3, 106:7, 109:1, 109:21, 115:6, 124:17, 125:17, 135:25, 138:2, 146:7, 169:15</p> <p>occasion [3] - 85:5, 125:21, 164:9</p> <p>occasions [4] - 112:7, 144:27, 169:23, 170:2</p> <p>Occupational [6] - 71:10, 86:8, 92:27, 96:3, 100:12, 109:23</p> <p>occupational [24] - 8:21, 42:4, 42:9, 42:21, 47:4, 47:11, 47:25, 48:26, 50:5, 50:10, 50:20, 74:4, 83:15, 83:23, 84:1, 84:3, 84:7, 84:10, 84:13, 84:20, 84:26, 85:4, 85:22, 110:14</p> <p>occur [4] - 45:18, 61:22, 61:27, 62:2</p> <p>occurred [7] - 61:19, 71:4, 86:13, 92:20, 147:12, 159:23, 161:26</p> <p>occurring [4] - 71:5, 91:10, 92:21, 122:19</p> <p>occurs [1] - 89:13</p> <p>October [13] -</p>	<p>7:16, 15:11, 15:14, 32:8, 35:20, 37:3, 40:13, 40:14, 40:22, 86:23, 87:11, 88:5, 116:10</p> <p>OF [7] - 3:2, 3:15, 57:1, 65:22, 77:27, 149:9, 153:9</p> <p>of.. [1] - 131:26</p> <p>offer [3] - 94:15, 96:28, 120:26</p> <p>offered [4] - 110:5, 130:29, 131:6, 137:4</p> <p>offering [2] - 148:2</p> <p>office [11] - 7:28, 19:17, 58:6, 74:11, 74:22, 75:8, 89:15, 139:16, 165:10, 165:21, 169:16</p> <p>OFFICE [1] - 3:27</p> <p>Officer [32] - 12:29, 13:8, 13:16, 16:22, 17:15, 17:19, 21:1, 21:8, 21:15, 22:5, 22:28, 25:2, 42:1, 43:9, 45:20, 49:27, 51:2, 63:17, 65:28, 70:12, 73:7, 74:2, 74:16, 77:17, 79:26, 81:8, 82:16, 92:13, 97:26, 123:1, 124:11, 146:16</p> <p>OFFICER [2] - 3:11, 3:14</p> <p>officer [28] - 6:21, 7:12, 7:15, 14:18, 25:3, 35:29, 58:5, 58:11, 59:14, 67:7, 67:12, 74:12, 83:11, 91:6, 93:14, 93:21, 104:2, 110:15, 111:4, 128:19, 128:24, 129:24, 133:12, 142:23, 147:12, 160:13</p> <p>officer's [2] - 94:3, 112:20</p>	<p>officer/ superintendent [1] - 146:23</p> <p>officers/Garda [1] - 99:3</p> <p>offices [1] - 8:13</p> <p>often [1] - 82:14</p> <p>OGHENOVO [4] - 5:9, 82:19, 150:1, 153:14</p> <p>Oghuvbu [13] - 79:23, 82:17, 82:22, 83:1, 83:2, 83:4, 121:8, 124:13, 128:5, 150:5, 150:17, 153:17, 164:12</p> <p>OGHUVBU [6] - 3:11, 5:9, 82:19, 150:1, 153:14, 169:13</p> <p>Oghuvbu's [1] - 85:8</p> <p>OHP [9] - 94:16, 104:23, 118:18, 119:3, 133:9, 138:17, 141:4, 142:27</p> <p>OHS [7] - 90:14, 93:13, 93:24, 93:26, 110:20, 110:27, 115:23</p> <p>OLIVIA [2] - 3:12, 4:1</p> <p>ON [1] - 6:1</p> <p>once [5] - 26:3, 48:26, 62:18, 62:21, 68:29</p> <p>one [49] - 12:24, 13:11, 26:21, 27:6, 31:6, 45:3, 46:3, 46:6, 46:7, 49:23, 53:28, 56:17, 57:26, 61:1, 63:18, 64:29, 65:9, 72:20, 81:19, 81:28, 82:26, 85:21, 87:28, 89:17, 91:8, 98:9, 98:10, 98:11, 102:29, 111:11, 115:27, 115:28, 117:3, 125:24, 125:25, 131:19, 132:27, 137:27, 143:3, 143:5, 148:1, 149:21, 150:9, 151:1, 151:26, 157:24,</p>	<p>157:29</p> <p>one-by-one [1] - 115:27</p> <p>one-on-one [1] - 57:26</p> <p>one-sided [2] - 45:3, 46:3</p> <p>ones [2] - 95:16, 107:28</p> <p>ongoing [10] - 29:22, 42:23, 51:9, 51:29, 52:21, 74:20, 74:23, 98:25, 139:12</p> <p>open [8] - 12:21, 20:9, 47:5, 113:7, 132:24, 133:9, 136:13, 138:24</p> <p>opened [4] - 13:3, 38:21, 61:15, 72:26</p> <p>operated [1] - 155:23</p> <p>operation [2] - 9:19, 49:7</p> <p>opinion [23] - 29:26, 43:18, 53:9, 53:10, 119:23, 119:28, 128:6, 129:6, 130:18, 144:20, 144:26, 144:29, 145:25, 146:2, 146:18, 146:28, 147:4, 147:20, 148:2, 155:16, 155:29, 164:21, 166:15</p> <p>opinions [1] - 166:2</p> <p>opportunity [5] - 50:4, 79:8, 80:3, 80:20, 85:14</p> <p>oppose [1] - 63:5</p> <p>opposed [1] - 52:25</p> <p>opposite [1] - 57:14</p> <p>optimise [1] - 133:10</p> <p>optimistic [1] - 66:14</p> <p>option [3] - 9:6, 78:28, 134:3</p> <p>options [7] - 133:9, 133:15, 135:18, 135:19, 135:20, 135:21,</p>
---	---	---	---	--	--

<p>138:25 or. [1] - 138:26 order [10] - 16:22, 22:5, 25:28, 70:7, 79:25, 80:3, 92:9, 92:14, 112:14, 119:4 orderly [3] - 115:14, 117:7, 117:8 ordinarily [2] - 75:13, 166:1 ordinary [10] - 14:25, 43:19, 43:25, 63:28, 100:19, 119:19, 123:17, 147:22, 147:24, 147:25 organisation [7] - 27:22, 47:5, 50:13, 54:4, 54:10, 71:9, 92:26 organisational [3] - 88:22, 105:20, 133:11 organising [2] - 104:21, 104:22 original [5] - 108:18, 113:6, 122:25, 137:29, 168:15 originally [2] - 101:23, 102:1 ORLA [1] - 3:20 os [1] - 114:17 OSMOND [1] - 3:27 otherwise [2] - 73:13, 155:17 ought [3] - 80:27, 80:28, 94:22 ourselves [6] - 96:9, 96:11, 111:29, 113:16, 114:23, 146:28 outcome [4] - 29:15, 37:21, 107:10, 148:25 outings [1] - 158:11 outlined [1] - 124:13 outpatient [2] - 126:6, 126:8 outset [3] - 7:16, 47:3, 54:7 outside [6] -</p>	<p>35:28, 40:7, 49:15, 55:2, 68:8, 95:4 overall [1] - 51:25 overcome [1] - 112:15 overpaid [1] - 36:6 Overpayment [1] - 30:21 overpayment [5] - 31:1, 31:29, 32:5, 36:7, 49:1 overruled [1] - 80:15 oversight [1] - 63:7 OVO [4] - 5:9, 82:19, 150:1, 153:14 owing [1] - 40:21 own [13] - 24:13, 27:22, 31:7, 47:28, 61:7, 115:1, 120:9, 125:28, 138:11, 157:21, 158:1, 168:21</p>	<p>99:10, 99:13, 100:1, 101:6, 101:27, 108:5, 108:12, 108:17, 115:10, 115:11, 118:3, 121:5, 122:25, 124:21, 125:29, 127:20, 129:28, 131:12, 131:27, 137:24, 137:27, 138:14, 138:15, 139:8, 142:1, 142:28, 146:7, 146:14, 147:6, 147:7, 148:20, 150:15, 152:12, 152:13, 153:18, 162:13, 162:17, 162:18 pages [1] - 137:22 paid [9] - 9:21, 9:27, 11:4, 14:23, 32:16, 33:22, 40:21, 50:12, 54:8 pains [2] - 14:10, 86:2 paper [2] - 85:15, 121:19 papers [11] - 18:6, 85:9, 85:27, 86:22, 87:10, 89:24, 99:9, 121:3, 121:5, 137:22, 139:9 paragraph [22] - 16:19, 31:21, 32:9, 43:13, 44:28, 46:2, 48:19, 67:19, 71:15, 85:18, 86:28, 87:12, 88:11, 91:1, 91:3, 93:28, 129:29, 139:10, 148:19, 150:18, 153:25 pardon [10] - 20:16, 108:28, 111:9, 122:1, 122:21, 124:24, 131:17, 133:25, 143:10, 152:19 Park [2] - 124:12, 126:26 part [12] - 15:4, 43:5, 52:21, 53:6, 73:21, 100:10, 119:15, 125:9, 147:4, 152:28,</p>	<p>159:23, 164:19 particular [23] - 8:20, 9:5, 9:9, 12:22, 42:6, 51:24, 52:15, 61:7, 62:15, 64:24, 68:14, 76:21, 79:5, 81:13, 81:24, 87:28, 95:21, 112:15, 113:21, 124:22, 147:27, 160:5, 162:13 particularly [3] - 56:6, 117:6, 139:25 parties [1] - 25:1 partnership [1] - 6:29 parts [1] - 121:3 pass [1] - 153:20 passage [1] - 68:22 past [5] - 27:19, 70:27, 87:21, 92:19, 138:18 Pat [4] - 20:13, 30:23, 70:22, 72:27 patchy [1] - 132:24 patient [7] - 44:3, 45:21, 46:9, 100:28, 145:23, 170:18 PATRICK [1] - 3:3 Patrick's [1] - 104:5 pattern [1] - 96:27 patterns [1] - 102:25 PAUL [1] - 4:1 pause [1] - 149:18 pay [58] - 8:3, 8:5, 8:12, 8:16, 8:17, 9:25, 9:26, 11:12, 14:24, 14:26, 14:29, 25:28, 26:5, 27:18, 28:1, 28:14, 29:11, 29:14, 30:14, 31:28, 33:5, 33:8, 33:14, 33:27, 34:7, 35:10, 36:27, 38:18, 38:24, 39:15,</p>	<p>39:26, 39:27, 40:18, 40:19, 40:26, 50:8, 50:11, 50:12, 50:21, 55:22, 56:6, 56:10, 57:12, 57:13, 59:6, 68:26, 69:12, 69:13, 69:16, 69:17, 69:25, 72:16, 75:10, 76:15, 147:29, 167:3 pay" [1] - 38:12 paying [1] - 164:29 payroll [4] - 35:4, 40:5, 51:5, 56:18 PD [2] - 12:7, 55:5 peers [1] - 19:21 PEGGY [1] - 4:7 penalisation [1] - 69:4 pending [5] - 29:15, 43:19, 118:27, 127:13, 147:25 pension [7] - 11:12, 50:12, 60:8, 60:9, 69:13, 69:29, 70:6 pensioned [1] - 69:14 pensions [1] - 60:6 people [27] - 13:13, 37:6, 38:10, 41:4, 55:5, 56:19, 57:11, 57:13, 57:15, 58:17, 61:6, 76:2, 78:15, 134:21, 134:22, 134:23, 134:24, 134:26, 134:29, 135:6, 137:5, 137:7, 151:1, 151:27, 158:5, 161:27, 162:2 People [1] - 12:9 PEOPLE [1] - 3:16 per [5] - 42:5, 60:8, 63:1, 158:27, 168:18 perceive [2] - 23:2, 77:8 perceived [1] -</p>	<p>17:5 perception [9] - 44:9, 46:25, 159:2, 159:5, 159:6, 159:7, 168:22, 168:26, 170:6 perceptions [3] - 134:8, 168:26, 169:1 perfect [1] - 59:7 performance [1] - 16:28 performing [1] - 90:5 performing.. [1] - 90:4 performs [2] - 16:29, 19:13 perhaps [25] - 7:22, 10:15, 16:13, 30:19, 34:12, 37:11, 46:2, 46:6, 46:15, 78:15, 86:9, 90:26, 95:16, 97:12, 98:5, 99:20, 107:16, 126:22, 127:27, 127:28, 129:7, 138:5, 138:14, 143:10, 146:5 period [37] - 8:11, 9:28, 11:5, 11:20, 13:17, 15:3, 15:4, 16:7, 16:8, 25:17, 25:22, 26:9, 31:24, 31:25, 32:5, 32:14, 32:16, 32:17, 33:6, 36:6, 36:27, 39:17, 68:6, 68:8, 69:28, 80:14, 86:20, 88:27, 93:6, 98:7, 98:11, 99:5, 99:26, 101:25, 102:3, 108:4, 138:6 periodic [1] - 167:25 periodically [2] - 13:25, 13:29 periods [10] - 17:1, 25:26, 28:20, 70:5, 96:17, 98:9, 100:4, 112:5, 116:1, 146:8 permit [1] -</p>
P					
<p>PAGE [1] - 5:2 page [97] - 6:15, 11:23, 16:13, 18:26, 19:1, 19:27, 20:11, 21:3, 21:17, 25:7, 28:18, 29:4, 30:20, 31:19, 32:3, 32:9, 35:19, 36:15, 37:3, 37:12, 38:6, 38:7, 38:26, 39:10, 40:1, 40:12, 40:29, 49:22, 52:17, 55:17, 56:14, 62:24, 63:21, 63:24, 64:4, 64:5, 70:21, 70:25, 71:14, 72:6, 72:26, 85:9, 85:26, 86:9, 86:18, 86:25, 87:10, 88:2, 88:4, 88:7, 89:20, 89:24, 90:28, 93:10, 95:15, 97:1, 97:13, 98:6,</p>					

<p>54:28 permitted [1] - 80:28 person [18] - 30:3, 33:27, 45:7, 45:9, 46:27, 47:2, 47:8, 54:19, 76:29, 80:2, 80:6, 97:26, 147:2, 150:22, 156:2, 157:19, 165:11, 167:8 person's [1] - 159:2 personal [5] - 47:6, 47:12, 54:10, 60:4, 113:23 personally [1] - 132:8 personnel [1] - 32:19 persons [4] - 47:12, 52:23, 54:28, 54:29 perspective [5] - 47:22, 129:23, 135:2, 161:3, 164:2 PETER [1] - 3:13 pets [1] - 118:14 Phoenix [2] - 124:12, 126:25 phone [11] - 20:25, 73:4, 112:5, 125:28, 127:24, 138:10, 138:12, 139:7, 141:7, 141:12, 141:15 phoned [1] - 142:19 phrase [3] - 64:14, 118:29, 139:3 physical [3] - 74:8, 86:1, 136:28 physician [4] - 84:3, 84:11, 84:14, 85:4 Physicians [4] - 83:19, 84:2, 84:8, 84:27 physicians [1] - 85:22 pick [1] - 13:23 picture [3] - 31:17, 33:1, 33:10</p>	<p>piece [11] - 15:2, 27:22, 45:20, 52:2, 57:26, 59:5, 60:18, 62:26, 65:9, 65:10, 65:13 pierce [1] - 17:9 pints [3] - 104:7, 104:10, 104:12 PLACE [1] - 4:8 place [13] - 50:15, 56:21, 71:19, 77:5, 80:23, 88:15, 92:3, 106:18, 127:29, 137:8, 151:10, 161:23 plan [1] - 105:27 planned [1] - 31:12 plausibility [1] - 165:19 play [2] - 8:2, 8:5 playing [1] - 112:11 plus [1] - 33:27 point [31] - 27:19, 36:13, 55:14, 61:10, 62:20, 67:23, 68:23, 71:23, 84:4, 87:7, 89:2, 91:25, 92:7, 94:23, 95:29, 106:6, 106:15, 106:19, 107:23, 113:24, 115:1, 116:12, 125:1, 136:10, 143:3, 144:3, 160:27, 161:6, 164:2, 164:3, 169:28 pointed [1] - 11:24 pointing [1] - 44:12 points [6] - 17:26, 19:11, 53:21, 53:27, 102:18, 115:26 police [3] - 72:13, 98:26, 146:21 policing [10] - 15:16, 87:6, 88:14, 97:18, 111:15, 115:14, 120:16, 130:24, 132:3, 146:17 policy [12] -</p>	<p>35:4, 42:20, 46:27, 47:1, 47:13, 49:16, 53:19, 54:27, 54:28, 55:3, 55:4, 100:18 polite [1] - 83:3 pose [1] - 56:6 position [22] - 8:22, 22:25, 30:6, 40:9, 43:22, 48:17, 49:4, 52:13, 52:14, 62:5, 65:18, 65:19, 74:19, 75:9, 75:18, 79:7, 80:1, 88:6, 142:20, 143:1, 144:12, 161:21 positive [1] - 114:26 positively [1] - 104:26 possibility [1] - 120:12 possible [13] - 21:1, 21:8, 29:15, 39:16, 47:27, 66:4, 73:7, 75:12, 92:8, 121:15, 141:19, 169:17, 170:15 possibly [1] - 26:24 post [1] - 84:21 Post [1] - 84:29 Post-Exposure [1] - 84:29 posts [1] - 83:12 potential [3] - 79:29, 157:19, 158:24 POWER [1] - 4:10 practicable [1] - 139:18 practical [1] - 57:7 practicalities [1] - 135:17 practiced [1] - 84:3 practices [1] - 56:7 practitioner [2] - 46:9, 158:4 pre [2] - 83:10, 154:21 pre-specialist [1] - 83:10</p>	<p>precipitated [1] - 47:28 precise [1] - 26:19 precision [1] - 27:16 predicated [1] - 23:4 prefer [1] - 22:27 preferable [1] - 134:1 preference [1] - 126:8 prejudice [2] - 140:18, 140:26 preliminary [1] - 80:27 premise [1] - 168:15 prepare [1] - 169:21 prepared [3] - 12:5, 12:19, 16:26 prescribe [1] - 158:20 prescribed [3] - 64:17, 117:9, 167:29 prescription [3] - 98:13, 156:20, 167:27 prescriptive [2] - 42:24, 62:9 presence [1] - 134:22 present [12] - 95:6, 96:27, 98:17, 105:18, 111:3, 120:23, 125:2, 158:26, 160:13, 165:17, 166:23 presenting [4] - 94:29, 105:12, 115:3, 161:12 presents [1] - 89:3 pressure [2] - 66:3, 137:16 presumably [3] - 75:18, 82:2, 164:23 presume [4] - 59:20, 82:27, 125:5, 164:20 pretty [3] - 112:11, 146:26, 153:2 prevented [1] -</p>	<p>79:6 previous [9] - 10:16, 19:7, 29:8, 38:7, 38:15, 42:1, 87:12, 90:14, 154:24 previously [8] - 22:19, 38:29, 76:17, 76:25, 92:17, 112:29, 117:9, 171:1 previously' [1] - 93:25 primarily [1] - 108:14 principal [10] - 6:20, 7:5, 7:12, 7:15, 24:3, 24:21, 59:13, 59:14, 67:7, 67:12 prioritise [1] - 110:29 priority [2] - 131:5, 139:16 prisoner [1] - 19:15 private [3] - 80:9, 138:29, 160:18 prn [1] - 126:29 probability [1] - 69:2 problem [11] - 106:5, 135:9, 135:26, 136:17, 149:20, 149:21, 149:25, 158:9, 158:18, 161:12, 169:9 problems [2] - 56:6, 89:6 procedural [1] - 57:24 procedure [3] - 35:3, 96:1, 100:22 procedures [1] - 58:2 proceed [3] - 66:4, 80:29, 82:15 process [15] - 31:13, 33:28, 34:13, 35:7, 41:8, 42:3, 56:21, 57:24, 60:24, 61:13, 63:3, 63:4, 70:15, 96:4, 120:9 processes [6] -</p>	<p>6:28, 31:7, 58:1, 100:15, 110:29, 170:16 processing [1] - 60:22 produce [3] - 70:13, 157:27, 158:1 produced [2] - 127:23, 133:4 professional [2] - 45:9, 92:14 profile [1] - 59:20 proforma [1] - 62:22 programme [1] - 83:25 progress [6] - 36:18, 75:9, 118:21, 119:4, 132:2, 139:4 progresses [1] - 72:25 progressing [1] - 15:22 prompted [1] - 13:4 promptly [1] - 13:15 pronounce [1] - 82:24 properly [1] - 42:15 prophylaxis [1] - 84:22 Prophylaxis [1] - 84:29 proposal [1] - 54:14 propose [2] - 78:25, 80:20 proposed [1] - 50:5 prospect [2] - 11:15, 50:8 protected [20] - 22:21, 22:23, 23:11, 29:23, 30:2, 30:4, 37:7, 48:9, 52:16, 52:19, 52:23, 52:24, 53:7, 53:12, 54:15, 54:20, 54:29, 56:12, 60:18 protection [1] - 84:23 protections [1] - 23:12</p>
---	---	---	---	---	---

<p>protocol [1] - 48:28</p> <p>protracted [2] - 16:7, 74:23</p> <p>prove [1] - 100:20</p> <p>provide [11] - 11:16, 34:20, 50:6, 63:16, 95:24, 96:25, 119:28, 147:3, 152:16, 152:21, 165:22</p> <p>provided [15] - 6:18, 8:21, 12:23, 37:1, 46:8, 69:2, 74:25, 87:29, 88:26, 89:17, 93:21, 99:9, 145:17, 152:6, 152:29</p> <p>provides [2] - 9:24, 152:10</p> <p>providing [1] - 120:9</p> <p>provision [1] - 96:10</p> <p>provisions [3] - 32:20, 36:10, 63:29</p> <p>proximate [1] - 76:19</p> <p>prudent [3] - 71:18, 91:13, 92:2</p> <p>PSSC [1] - 40:18</p> <p>psychiatric [1] - 141:8</p> <p>psychiatry [1] - 138:29</p> <p>psychological [2] - 9:10, 136:28</p> <p>psychosis [3] - 158:24, 158:27, 158:28</p> <p>psychotic [2] - 158:27, 170:3</p> <p>public [15] - 8:4, 10:7, 10:8, 25:24, 42:7, 42:11, 48:12, 50:25, 50:27, 63:29, 66:28, 69:23, 134:11, 144:3</p> <p>Public [2] - 9:16, 9:18</p> <p>publicity [4] - 132:13, 134:13, 135:23</p> <p>published [2] -</p>	<p>171:1, 171:4</p> <p>pulling [2] - 18:15, 99:19</p> <p>punitively [1] - 72:15</p> <p>purely [2] - 45:6, 155:10</p> <p>purpose [6] - 33:9, 42:22, 43:2, 82:13, 97:5</p> <p>purposes [2] - 32:18, 70:6</p> <p>pursue [1] - 139:4</p> <p>pushing [1] - 140:27</p> <p>put [18] - 34:7, 40:5, 53:5, 54:14, 56:18, 56:21, 71:18, 91:13, 91:24, 92:2, 100:16, 137:15, 156:26, 161:3, 161:9, 162:5, 162:13, 163:3</p> <p>putting [3] - 50:19, 106:18, 120:14</p>	<p>127:22, 128:17, 129:5, 142:19, 144:8</p> <p>Quite [1] - 132:29</p> <p>quite [10] - 42:29, 59:17, 70:19, 73:23, 73:25, 75:11, 78:29, 118:8, 118:9, 169:17</p> <p>quo [1] - 43:22</p>	<p>80:22, 96:12, 111:24, 113:4, 135:29, 140:28, 161:13</p> <p>reason [8] - 18:9, 33:21, 49:10, 78:24, 88:3, 121:25, 127:16, 144:6</p> <p>reasonable [2] - 69:2, 139:18</p> <p>reasons [5] - 45:17, 49:10, 96:18, 123:9, 170:28</p> <p>recalling [1] - 110:8</p> <p>recategorisation [1] - 49:13</p> <p>recategorised [1] - 43:27</p> <p>receipt [6] - 19:7, 28:16, 31:26, 63:26, 64:7, 89:22</p> <p>receive [7] - 11:25, 25:21, 39:20, 69:15, 69:19, 74:10, 100:16</p> <p>received [13] - 21:28, 31:9, 44:29, 77:13, 79:27, 87:2, 89:18, 90:22, 107:10, 107:28, 112:5, 130:22, 142:25</p> <p>receiving [4] - 31:4, 87:13, 124:29, 137:6</p> <p>recent [3] - 87:21, 101:10, 104:17</p> <p>recipients [1] - 61:1</p> <p>reckonable [1] - 70:6</p> <p>reckoned [1] - 32:18</p> <p>recollect [13] - 101:15, 103:21, 107:3, 110:12, 121:28, 122:19, 122:20, 122:23, 128:17, 151:4, 151:7, 151:11, 159:20</p> <p>recollection [4] - 65:11, 111:7,</p>	<p>111:10, 163:18</p> <p>recommend [5] - 29:14, 38:23, 87:5, 139:15, 158:15</p> <p>recommendati on [3] - 38:27, 74:29, 76:15</p> <p>recommendati ons [6] - 8:25, 110:10, 111:28, 130:19, 130:20, 147:19</p> <p>recommended [5] - 88:14, 88:25, 157:15, 157:16, 158:15</p> <p>recommending [3] - 30:13, 35:27, 39:15</p> <p>record [13] - 32:19, 33:3, 59:24, 59:26, 60:15, 85:26, 93:16, 124:29, 125:9, 132:5, 154:21, 163:20, 163:22</p> <p>recorded [23] - 12:24, 12:27, 33:3, 43:24, 47:10, 63:28, 101:3, 110:10, 111:5, 112:17, 121:10, 121:11, 121:19, 123:9, 124:2, 124:18, 126:22, 132:15, 138:15, 142:2, 146:12, 154:29, 159:19</p> <p>recording [9] - 7:25, 57:29, 73:20, 73:21, 96:17, 111:23, 131:12, 142:16, 146:8</p> <p>records [7] - 26:10, 60:4, 60:17, 61:10, 72:12, 101:20, 143:11</p> <p>recoup [3] - 31:1, 36:25, 65:5</p> <p>recouped [3] - 31:13, 33:8, 65:15</p> <p>recouping [2] - 65:7, 65:12</p> <p>recoupment [1]</p>	<p>- 34:7</p> <p>recourse [1] - 135:1</p> <p>recovery [4] - 111:1, 112:1, 140:6, 168:5</p> <p>recurrent [1] - 106:9</p> <p>red [1] - 96:13</p> <p>redacted [2] - 80:16, 82:11</p> <p>redaction [1] - 137:26</p> <p>REDDY [1] - 4:8</p> <p>reduce [2] - 48:21, 157:6</p> <p>reduced [7] - 8:8, 27:18, 28:1, 29:11, 33:14, 33:27, 38:18</p> <p>reduction [2] - 69:12, 72:16</p> <p>reevaluation [1] - 127:14</p> <p>refer [12] - 9:11, 20:19, 20:28, 36:16, 67:15, 79:28, 113:26, 124:27, 124:28, 125:20, 147:12, 159:22</p> <p>reference [19] - 20:3, 20:15, 40:17, 45:14, 56:1, 76:28, 81:13, 88:20, 119:13, 119:21, 122:11, 125:24, 138:10, 138:11, 141:8, 141:11, 142:11, 144:7, 159:16</p> <p>referral [23] - 12:29, 13:7, 14:5, 14:6, 20:28, 85:23, 86:9, 86:10, 86:22, 87:9, 87:11, 87:29, 88:2, 93:13, 95:15, 95:24, 96:2, 108:20, 113:6, 120:14, 126:6, 126:27, 160:28</p> <p>referred [23] - 9:22, 13:15, 19:8, 56:2, 76:27, 90:23, 97:17, 98:8, 98:13, 101:23, 102:1,</p>
	Q				
	<p>qualified [2] - 83:5, 83:18</p> <p>quarterly [1] - 18:21</p> <p>QUAY [1] - 4:12</p> <p>queries [2] - 36:12, 58:23</p> <p>query [3] - 28:29, 56:17, 145:17</p> <p>questions [21] - 36:12, 56:27, 57:7, 58:19, 58:23, 59:17, 61:17, 65:20, 77:29, 78:2, 81:20, 81:21, 136:29, 137:2, 149:6, 149:12, 149:19, 149:23, 152:3, 156:16, 167:18</p> <p>quick [1] - 149:19</p> <p>QUINN [1] - 3:10</p> <p>Quinn [9] - 40:23, 111:3, 112:4, 112:17,</p>	<p>raise [3] - 96:13, 131:18, 161:18</p> <p>raised [4] - 19:11, 87:23, 89:11, 161:4</p> <p>rang [1] - 128:5</p> <p>rank [2] - 6:20, 19:14</p> <p>rate [3] - 11:12, 28:1, 50:13</p> <p>rather [2] - 46:3, 113:26</p> <p>RE [2] - 5:13, 169:13</p> <p>re [5] - 16:6, 95:19, 118:27, 126:26, 141:19</p> <p>re-evaluation [1] - 118:27</p> <p>RE-EXAMINED [2] - 5:13, 169:13</p> <p>reach [1] - 68:29</p> <p>reached [2] - 26:3, 28:23</p> <p>reactive [2] - 130:3, 138:19</p> <p>read [8] - 12:23, 41:17, 55:20, 55:28, 64:10, 101:20, 128:3, 161:24</p> <p>reading [1] - 91:26</p> <p>ready [2] - 78:16, 79:22</p> <p>realise [1] - 35:13</p> <p>realistic [1] - 11:14</p> <p>really [15] - 17:27, 27:8, 51:10, 52:22, 54:25, 55:3, 63:11, 76:7,</p>			

<p>102:10, 104:18, 108:22, 113:6, 118:22, 144:18, 146:28, 146:29, 149:2, 155:25, 157:8, 159:14</p> <p>referring [8] - 35:21, 71:10, 85:10, 92:27, 93:24, 114:25, 140:20, 141:24</p> <p>refers [13] - 17:7, 20:16, 23:16, 27:21, 44:17, 46:17, 67:19, 87:12, 87:28, 91:2, 91:3, 94:18, 148:20</p> <p>reflect [2] - 32:19, 130:11</p> <p>reflecting [1] - 106:16</p> <p>reflective [1] - 121:23</p> <p>reflects [1] - 122:8</p> <p>refunded [1] - 48:29</p> <p>regard [7] - 31:24, 36:7, 44:12, 60:16, 67:1, 80:11, 120:28</p> <p>regarding [10] - 14:8, 20:20, 35:23, 55:22, 56:5, 95:10, 95:12, 95:14, 142:20, 147:17</p> <p>regards [1] - 87:23</p> <p>regime [4] - 51:18, 51:25, 53:17, 68:24</p> <p>Region [1] - 86:26</p> <p>registrar [2] - 83:12, 83:23</p> <p>regular [4] - 11:17, 59:2, 104:1, 118:16</p> <p>regularly [2] - 111:16, 130:23</p> <p>regulation [6] - 10:7, 10:27, 53:17, 55:1, 58:1, 69:9</p> <p>regulations [29] - 8:3, 9:11, 11:19, 14:25, 25:25,</p>	<p>29:25, 31:17, 32:27, 34:19, 34:23, 34:26, 37:20, 40:7, 42:12, 43:23, 48:24, 49:14, 50:9, 50:25, 51:6, 51:7, 51:11, 51:13, 64:1, 67:17, 67:18, 67:19, 69:10, 70:17</p> <p>Regulations [1] - 9:17</p> <p>rehabilitate [1] - 110:6</p> <p>Rehabilitation [6] - 10:27, 11:13, 20:21, 69:17, 69:24, 70:5</p> <p>rehabilitation [6] - 8:12, 10:26, 11:11, 26:5, 69:1, 140:17</p> <p>reinstated [1] - 40:19</p> <p>reiterated [4] - 88:15, 104:23, 118:26, 140:16</p> <p>relate [2] - 60:6, 169:7</p> <p>related [94] - 17:11, 21:21, 22:1, 29:10, 37:6, 37:18, 37:20, 38:17, 41:22, 42:26, 43:3, 43:4, 43:7, 43:12, 44:2, 44:10, 44:13, 44:15, 44:18, 45:26, 45:28, 46:10, 46:23, 46:29, 47:4, 47:9, 47:23, 48:8, 50:5, 50:7, 50:10, 50:20, 50:29, 54:2, 61:22, 61:26, 62:18, 71:20, 71:29, 72:10, 72:14, 72:22, 73:12, 73:16, 74:1, 75:5, 76:1, 76:10, 85:23, 92:4, 94:19, 94:25, 95:1, 95:8, 98:19, 98:22, 98:25, 100:18, 100:20, 101:16, 102:10, 102:15, 108:16,</p>	<p>111:6, 113:7, 113:9, 113:26, 113:28, 114:9, 114:11, 114:18, 114:24, 114:27, 116:26, 116:27, 119:25, 120:11, 121:10, 121:25, 123:20, 123:28, 123:29, 131:21, 144:15, 144:27, 145:13, 145:26, 148:20, 148:23, 162:21, 164:18, 164:23</p> <p>relates [6] - 12:4, 25:10, 55:21, 56:4, 75:10, 156:17</p> <p>relating [5] - 89:25, 101:10, 101:16, 107:13, 147:8</p> <p>relation [67] - 7:25, 8:25, 10:4, 11:25, 14:16, 15:8, 15:21, 15:29, 16:14, 16:16, 19:1, 19:2, 19:6, 22:17, 24:26, 24:27, 29:22, 29:27, 30:10, 32:29, 33:19, 36:1, 37:5, 41:18, 41:27, 43:23, 46:4, 49:4, 51:29, 52:8, 52:19, 53:6, 55:11, 64:23, 65:1, 65:9, 66:28, 67:24, 70:18, 71:2, 73:12, 74:3, 74:4, 75:16, 76:1, 76:15, 77:7, 95:26, 96:20, 97:10, 97:24, 101:5, 102:12, 119:23, 119:29, 120:11, 129:1, 144:20, 150:25, 150:27, 154:18, 155:16, 156:16, 157:11, 165:16, 166:4</p> <p>relationship [3] - 17:9, 19:21, 43:11</p> <p>relatively [1] - 17:24</p> <p>relayed [1] -</p>	<p>144:9</p> <p>relevance [4] - 71:14, 79:29, 80:12, 85:2</p> <p>relevant [19] - 17:10, 25:1, 25:5, 26:19, 31:2, 42:25, 49:17, 56:8, 80:1, 80:19, 80:25, 81:7, 88:17, 97:19, 119:7, 130:24, 131:5, 141:4, 147:14</p> <p>reliant [1] - 99:21</p> <p>reluctant [4] - 87:25, 91:16, 91:21, 91:25</p> <p>relying [3] - 18:12, 18:14, 44:28</p> <p>remain [4] - 80:12, 80:13, 134:16, 144:12</p> <p>remained [1] - 84:16</p> <p>remains [7] - 20:23, 40:26, 50:11, 51:14, 51:25, 73:2, 87:25</p> <p>remember [6] - 101:17, 123:4, 123:5, 142:12, 142:14, 142:15</p> <p>reminders [1] - 89:16</p> <p>remove [1] - 134:6</p> <p>removing [1] - 35:4</p> <p>Remuneration [6] - 10:28, 11:13, 20:21, 69:17, 69:25, 70:5</p> <p>remuneration [4] - 11:11, 25:21, 69:1, 69:26</p> <p>repeat [1] - 141:25</p> <p>reply [3] - 19:12, 31:20, 36:15</p> <p>report [74] - 14:3, 15:16, 15:19, 15:20, 15:24, 15:25, 15:26, 15:28, 15:29, 16:4, 16:9, 16:15, 16:16,</p>	<p>16:24, 17:14, 19:2, 19:7, 20:4, 20:28, 21:5, 22:11, 29:15, 44:6, 44:28, 46:11, 61:19, 61:25, 86:25, 87:9, 87:19, 88:25, 89:1, 89:10, 89:11, 89:17, 89:18, 90:2, 90:22, 90:28, 94:3, 94:18, 96:8, 97:10, 97:11, 97:14, 97:21, 99:10, 107:2, 107:3, 107:6, 107:19, 107:20, 108:6, 108:10, 108:11, 108:13, 108:19, 113:6, 119:2, 119:14, 119:21, 121:16, 121:23, 126:19, 129:27, 131:17, 139:8, 139:9, 142:28, 143:3, 148:22, 161:24</p> <p>reported [17] - 14:9, 20:22, 21:20, 21:21, 35:26, 45:27, 73:1, 75:6, 90:4, 90:10, 130:4, 131:22, 142:26, 145:13, 148:25, 165:26, 167:26</p> <p>reportedly [1] - 139:12</p> <p>reporting [7] - 25:18, 43:7, 85:27, 100:10, 100:18, 114:24, 164:24</p> <p>reports [13] - 9:6, 13:12, 13:25, 18:16, 37:18, 44:7, 44:17, 61:13, 96:11, 97:20, 97:23, 107:6, 167:23</p> <p>represent [1] - 109:24</p> <p>request [18] - 18:1, 18:18, 18:28, 21:7, 21:10, 21:13, 21:26, 23:17, 28:12, 41:7,</p>	<p>79:27, 96:25, 108:18, 108:19, 109:8, 119:27, 166:27, 166:28</p> <p>requested [5] - 15:16, 16:9, 32:15, 53:4, 120:21</p> <p>requesting [1] - 98:28</p> <p>requests [4] - 16:23, 18:9, 46:17, 143:20</p> <p>require [1] - 58:7</p> <p>required [14] - 12:29, 15:26, 64:19, 90:5, 90:6, 93:27, 96:5, 108:9, 130:28, 151:27, 152:15, 152:21, 165:17, 169:18</p> <p>requirement [3] - 15:28, 23:2, 42:20</p> <p>requiring [1] - 90:8</p> <p>residential [6] - 87:15, 140:8, 140:9, 140:16, 141:16, 154:25</p> <p>resolution [2] - 75:19, 76:19</p> <p>Resource [1] - 86:27</p> <p>RESOURCES [1] - 3:15</p> <p>Resources [3] - 12:9, 85:24, 108:9</p> <p>respect [11] - 10:23, 19:11, 20:4, 21:28, 27:11, 42:13, 60:12, 104:17, 117:24, 118:19, 130:19</p> <p>respectively [1] - 25:19</p> <p>respond [2] - 80:3, 123:25</p> <p>responded [1] - 32:8</p> <p>responding [3] - 80:20, 95:3, 134:15</p> <p>response [14] - 28:15, 28:28, 32:3, 41:1, 41:6, 41:11, 108:8,</p>
---	--	---	--	---	--

<p>138:17, 152:14, 152:16, 152:21, 152:22, 152:24, 152:27</p> <p>responsibility [15] - 6:23, 7:3, 7:6, 7:8, 7:12, 7:22, 7:24, 7:25, 7:29, 54:7, 59:13, 60:17, 96:17, 100:12, 146:8</p> <p>responsible [4] - 36:23, 63:4, 133:1, 168:1</p> <p>rest [3] - 42:7, 86:21, 118:9</p> <p>restore [1] - 76:15</p> <p>restored [5] - 29:14, 30:14, 38:24, 39:15, 39:26</p> <p>result [13] - 21:21, 41:21, 46:28, 47:24, 48:8, 51:16, 76:7, 83:25, 87:9, 109:8, 115:4, 145:15, 148:23</p> <p>resume [11] - 24:12, 66:14, 79:8, 79:11, 79:15, 86:5, 87:6, 106:27, 146:22, 171:2</p> <p>RESUMED [2] - 6:1, 79:19</p> <p>retaining [1] - 111:1</p> <p>reticent [2] - 71:17, 91:11</p> <p>RETIRED [7] - 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, 3:12, 3:13</p> <p>retired [2] - 69:19, 69:23</p> <p>retirement [1] - 42:2</p> <p>retrospection [1] - 147:29</p> <p>retrospective [1] - 10:23</p> <p>retrospectively [2] - 10:5, 27:26</p> <p>return [21] - 11:15, 15:22, 20:25, 30:9, 30:19, 73:3, 81:8, 89:4, 104:18, 112:2, 118:10,</p>	<p>118:24, 119:10, 126:5, 131:3, 132:2, 139:20, 143:27, 155:5, 155:20, 168:5</p> <p>returned [1] - 87:18</p> <p>returning [3] - 25:6, 53:13, 69:3</p> <p>revelation [1] - 91:2</p> <p>Revenue [1] - 67:4</p> <p>revert [3] - 26:4, 36:20, 39:25</p> <p>review [25] - 16:23, 17:20, 17:21, 21:10, 77:19, 85:5, 85:28, 88:6, 88:29, 97:5, 97:20, 102:7, 110:2, 110:20, 110:27, 110:28, 115:21, 115:23, 116:25, 119:6, 126:29, 130:29, 132:1, 139:4</p> <p>reviewed [9] - 18:20, 21:7, 41:8, 77:14, 86:5, 86:7, 86:21, 86:22, 126:14</p> <p>rid [2] - 117:27, 117:28</p> <p>ring [2] - 15:3, 113:8</p> <p>ring-fences [1] - 15:3</p> <p>ringing [1] - 128:17</p> <p>rise [1] - 158:23</p> <p>risk [1] - 70:16</p> <p>Road [1] - 116:9</p> <p>road [1] - 158:12</p> <p>role [8] - 6:26, 24:27, 112:12, 114:10, 117:7, 117:8, 128:23, 151:14</p> <p>rolling [8] - 9:27, 10:9, 10:11, 10:13, 10:16, 11:5, 68:6, 68:7</p> <p>rolls [2] - 118:12, 118:13</p> <p>rostered [1] - 116:6</p> <p>rostered" [1] - 116:5</p>	<p>round [1] - 66:5</p> <p>routine [1] - 119:28</p> <p>Royal [5] - 83:19, 83:28, 84:1, 84:7, 84:27</p> <p>rule [2] - 61:6, 80:9</p> <p>run [4] - 13:12, 13:25, 57:15, 57:23</p> <p>Ryan [1] - 128:11</p>	<p>schedule [6] - 12:4, 16:18, 79:12, 143:20, 169:16, 171:1</p> <p>Scheme [1] - 9:18</p> <p>scheme [7] - 9:24, 42:5, 42:6, 42:9, 42:21, 42:28, 50:6</p> <p>Scientific [2] - 84:22, 84:28</p> <p>screen [13] - 9:13, 16:13, 18:26, 22:8, 23:15, 25:8, 28:9, 28:15, 29:4, 30:20, 85:14, 98:6, 99:15</p> <p>script [7] - 125:2, 125:20, 125:25, 133:2, 133:3, 133:4</p> <p>scroll [16] - 15:10, 16:12, 19:28, 22:9, 32:9, 37:13, 37:26, 39:11, 40:1, 49:29, 55:24, 72:7, 98:7, 126:23, 141:13, 150:21</p> <p>scrutinised [1] - 124:15</p> <p>se [5] - 42:5, 60:8, 63:1, 158:27, 168:18</p> <p>seamlessly [1] - 74:13</p> <p>SEAN [1] - 3:17</p> <p>second [19] - 7:29, 16:19, 31:21, 32:9, 34:11, 63:23, 64:5, 70:25, 71:15, 82:27, 82:28, 85:18, 87:11, 88:11, 91:3, 125:22, 129:29, 130:10, 137:27</p> <p>seconds [1] - 79:24</p> <p>Section [3] - 20:1, 67:27, 89:28</p> <p>section [11] - 8:16, 31:8, 31:10, 31:28, 40:18, 59:23, 59:26,</p>	<p>67:27, 100:15, 119:3, 147:8</p> <p>sections [2] - 60:1, 60:12</p> <p>sector [1] - 48:13</p> <p>see [65] - 9:17, 9:21, 16:9, 18:15, 18:18, 18:27, 19:28, 19:29, 20:3, 20:12, 23:9, 25:5, 26:18, 28:10, 33:11, 37:26, 39:6, 39:13, 49:21, 50:24, 52:9, 52:12, 53:20, 53:27, 62:18, 64:4, 65:8, 65:27, 66:18, 68:2, 68:23, 72:3, 74:3, 77:18, 82:4, 82:10, 85:14, 86:18, 95:25, 96:26, 97:22, 97:29, 98:8, 99:6, 99:15, 99:25, 106:20, 107:14, 107:27, 108:17, 109:6, 115:11, 120:12, 120:16, 128:29, 129:22, 138:2, 138:10, 140:5, 150:17, 150:22, 153:26, 160:7, 162:19, 162:24</p> <p>seeing [4] - 61:23, 101:18, 109:5, 116:25</p> <p>seek [6] - 9:2, 9:7, 43:25, 75:28, 147:13, 148:12</p> <p>seeking [4] - 62:16, 62:22, 87:25, 148:16</p> <p>seem [4] - 100:8, 102:17, 131:18, 149:1</p> <p>sees [2] - 132:23, 133:2</p> <p>seizures [1] - 157:20</p> <p>self [2] - 20:9, 141:24</p> <p>send [8] - 8:23, 17:29, 58:3, 96:5, 96:10, 97:1, 107:19, 107:21</p> <p>sending [1] -</p>	<p>77:16</p> <p>sends [2] - 62:21, 108:10</p> <p>senior [7] - 83:11, 94:4, 94:9, 99:3, 116:14, 129:13, 139:17</p> <p>sense [10] - 45:6, 49:19, 77:6, 95:9, 96:14, 134:15, 139:15, 142:4, 157:22, 160:15</p> <p>sensible [2] - 78:18, 81:18</p> <p>sensitive [1] - 41:9</p> <p>sent [17] - 8:15, 19:29, 20:6, 53:4, 62:16, 99:17, 99:18, 99:21, 107:3, 107:20, 108:4, 109:1, 109:2, 109:4, 120:15, 124:11</p> <p>sentence [3] - 34:12, 94:2, 94:3</p> <p>separate [4] - 27:25, 65:8, 65:11, 150:4</p> <p>September [10] - 26:7, 28:12, 28:26, 31:20, 32:4, 38:8, 39:7, 39:12, 39:21, 125:28</p> <p>sergeant [4] - 19:26, 58:26, 71:22, 92:6</p> <p>SERGEANT [5] - 3:12, 3:20, 4:5, 4:6, 4:6</p> <p>Sergeant [5] - 19:26, 89:17, 97:8, 97:14, 98:3</p> <p>series [2] - 108:4, 161:27</p> <p>servant [2] - 6:19, 67:2</p> <p>servants [1] - 10:9</p> <p>serve [1] - 54:11</p> <p>services [1] - 14:19</p> <p>service [24] - 8:4, 10:7, 10:8, 11:17, 25:24, 32:17, 36:10, 42:7, 42:8, 42:11, 50:25, 66:28,</p>
S					
<p>safe [1] - 82:13</p> <p>safeguards [1] - 88:15</p> <p>sake [1] - 55:11</p> <p>salary [2] - 48:21, 49:1</p> <p>SAMS [14] - 7:26, 13:12, 30:28, 73:19, 96:18, 99:10, 100:5, 101:4, 121:15, 121:23, 122:2, 122:10, 123:9, 131:11</p> <p>sanctioned [1] - 39:20</p> <p>SANDRA [1] - 4:6</p> <p>satisfactory [2] - 35:25, 89:4</p> <p>satisfied [2] - 161:22, 168:2</p> <p>satisfies [1] - 36:11</p> <p>SAVAGE [1] - 3:16</p> <p>saw [10] - 99:6, 99:12, 108:1, 108:19, 108:20, 131:8, 131:25, 137:10, 155:15, 163:4</p> <p>Saw [1] - 104:17</p> <p>SC [5] - 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:6, 4:7</p> <p>scale [1] - 54:12</p> <p>SCANLAN [1] - 3:8</p> <p>scenario [1] - 61:28</p> <p>scenarios [1] - 62:1</p>					

<p>67:2, 69:23, 126:8, 131:4, 133:16, 133:18, 133:22, 133:28, 136:1, 136:2, 141:18 Service^[7] - 9:16, 9:18, 71:11, 86:8, 92:28, 96:3, 100:12 service^[1] - 126:7 services^[3] - 110:5, 112:22, 130:27 servng^[1] - 7:28 sessions^[1] - 79:4 set^[8] - 16:17, 28:8, 28:11, 41:29, 76:11, 76:12, 130:3, 132:5 sets^[6] - 31:20, 32:5, 52:13, 52:14, 55:4, 143:1 settling^[1] - 89:6 seven^[3] - 80:18, 86:3, 122:26 severe^[2] - 137:15, 158:13 shall^[5] - 25:21, 32:15, 39:25, 130:29, 148:24 SHANE^[1] - 3:23 SHANKEY^[1] - 3:21 SHANKEY- SMITH^[1] - 3:21 shape^[1] - 135:6 SHEAHAN^[1] - 3:18 sheet^[2] - 121:19, 122:11 sheets^[1] - 93:9 SHELLEY^[1] - 3:25 SHIP^[1] - 3:28 shock^[1] - 123:26 short^[5] - 41:9, 101:24, 102:2, 103:18, 116:1 short-term^[3] -</p>	<p>41:9, 103:18, 116:1 shorter^[1] - 169:18 shoving^[1] - 136:10 show^[1] - 33:20 showed^[1] - 121:19 showing^[1] - 122:4 shown^[5] - 149:17, 153:17, 156:10, 156:11, 162:12 shows^[1] - 164:29 sic^[1] - 89:26 Sick^[4] - 9:16, 9:18, 20:1, 67:26 sick^[100] - 7:1, 7:3, 7:7, 7:9, 8:3, 8:4, 8:7, 8:10, 9:21, 9:24, 9:26, 9:27, 10:7, 11:4, 11:6, 11:25, 14:23, 14:25, 15:3, 15:4, 15:5, 16:8, 16:15, 20:23, 20:24, 26:2, 26:16, 27:26, 28:21, 29:9, 29:24, 29:25, 30:4, 31:9, 31:11, 34:19, 34:20, 37:18, 38:12, 38:16, 39:17, 39:19, 40:6, 42:11, 43:18, 47:22, 48:22, 48:23, 48:24, 49:2, 49:14, 49:15, 50:25, 51:6, 51:10, 51:11, 51:12, 51:13, 52:25, 53:11, 55:1, 55:2, 58:10, 59:5, 59:23, 61:13, 63:29, 64:1, 67:18, 67:24, 68:3, 68:9, 68:10, 68:25, 68:26, 69:10, 69:14, 70:8, 70:10, 70:17, 70:27, 73:1, 73:2, 73:22, 91:9, 92:19, 98:8, 98:10, 98:18,</p>	<p>111:5, 116:6, 121:24, 121:26, 146:6, 147:23, 162:22, 163:26 sickness^[5] - 50:9, 63:27, 68:24, 72:12, 109:22 side^[9] - 31:14, 46:6, 46:8, 52:25, 52:26, 65:14, 81:21, 99:26, 125:29 sided^[2] - 45:3, 46:3 sight^[1] - 29:1 sign^[1] - 163:16 signature^[6] - 11:27, 12:6, 12:16, 61:4, 62:28, 62:29 signed^[5] - 19:26, 88:4, 90:18, 101:8, 126:21 significant^[5] - 112:12, 139:14, 140:25, 157:28 significantly^[1] - 56:19 silent^[1] - 83:1 similar^[1] - 52:18 similarly^[2] - 44:4, 47:22 simplistic^[1] - 95:7 simply^[3] - 95:12, 120:15, 165:24 SINÉAD^[1] - 4:7 sit^[5] - 62:13, 78:25, 78:29, 82:23, 114:28 situated^[2] - 60:19, 132:29 situation^[10] - 27:17, 29:13, 51:14, 51:24, 62:1, 95:3, 106:16, 117:21, 132:8, 138:24 situations^[1] - 37:6 six^[10] - 14:28, 15:16, 16:10, 16:24, 17:15, 50:11, 50:12, 57:13, 59:3, 88:26</p>	<p>skills^[3] - 17:3, 17:4, 19:18 slight^[1] - 150:21 slightly^[4] - 86:7, 99:13, 115:11, 138:5 slips^[2] - 42:5, 42:14 SMITH^[1] - 3:21 SMITHFIELD^[1] - 4:12 smoke^[1] - 134:27 smokes^[1] - 118:12 Smokes^[1] - 118:13 smoking^[1] - 134:27 so..^[1] - 161:20 sobering^[1] - 169:27 social^[2] - 158:10, 158:11 SOLICITOR'S ^[1] - 3:27 SOLICITORS^[2] - 4:8, 4:11 solidified^[1] - 65:18 solution^[2] - 56:20, 56:23 solve^[2] - 92:8, 169:8 someone^[5] - 51:5, 56:17, 58:25, 60:14, 122:17 sometimes^[2] - 13:11, 73:24 somewhere^[1] - 150:9 soon^[9] - 21:1, 21:8, 29:15, 39:16, 66:1, 73:7, 78:25, 79:16, 80:14 sorry^[45] - 15:10, 20:14, 26:8, 49:29, 54:19, 57:14, 64:9, 64:10, 64:29, 66:15, 72:7, 72:26, 74:4, 86:27, 91:14, 93:19, 94:13, 102:28, 103:4, 103:14, 104:9, 104:11, 104:15,</p>	<p>107:12, 107:14, 107:17, 129:9, 131:16, 132:17, 133:3, 138:10, 138:14, 143:12, 143:15, 151:25, 152:18, 152:23, 152:26, 158:7, 162:28, 164:27, 165:1, 165:4 sort^[4] - 16:5, 45:8, 66:15, 107:2 sorted^[1] - 56:10 sought^[4] - 29:26, 35:24, 65:5, 119:22 source^[10] - 22:3, 23:9, 56:7, 62:14, 71:21, 71:29, 72:22, 92:4, 94:19, 126:6 space^[1] - 50:14 speaking^[5] - 31:12, 33:20, 33:21, 33:26, 113:12 special^[1] - 51:18 specialist^[10] - 44:7, 45:1, 45:16, 83:10, 83:22, 84:3, 84:6, 84:10, 84:13, 85:22 specialists^[1] - 75:28 specific^[9] - 18:8, 37:8, 37:12, 42:17, 52:2, 59:5, 119:28, 120:27, 152:1 specifically^[9] - 30:3, 57:11, 103:22, 120:8, 122:9, 151:8, 152:17, 152:28 specifics^[1] - 106:8 specifies^[1] - 124:17 speech^[1] - 159:1 spoken^[4] - 19:11, 103:22, 127:9, 128:18 sports^[1] - 88:23 spying^[1] -</p>	<p>160:15 SR1^[1] - 68:2 St^[2] - 104:5, 135:28 staff^[14] - 7:7, 13:10, 21:29, 22:7, 24:5, 24:6, 50:6, 57:8, 57:20, 58:9, 59:2, 59:4, 62:11, 98:29 stage^[18] - 19:19, 20:28, 26:1, 26:3, 26:17, 29:11, 30:11, 38:18, 40:10, 46:8, 81:25, 86:11, 86:16, 89:15, 133:10, 164:21, 167:20, 168:7 stand^[1] - 56:26 standard^[7] - 13:19, 17:24, 21:27, 62:17, 88:15, 97:28, 146:26 standing^[1] - 154:7 stands^[1] - 69:18 star^[1] - 102:17 starred^[4] - 115:26, 116:12, 117:3, 132:5 start^[4] - 9:17, 39:27, 78:15, 137:23 started^[1] - 117:5 starts^[1] - 97:15 state^[2] - 30:3, 88:29 STATE^[1] - 3:27 statement^[14] - 6:14, 6:17, 11:22, 28:9, 37:2, 85:8, 85:18, 99:10, 101:8, 121:6, 122:26, 143:19, 150:16, 152:11 states^[3] - 19:20, 97:25, 170:5 stating^[7] - 14:13, 21:20, 21:29, 22:11, 28:28, 44:1, 45:2 station^[6] - 19:14, 115:14, 115:15, 116:17,</p>
--	--	--	---	---	---

<p>117:6, 117:8 status [3] - 28:13, 40:19, 43:22 stay [1] - 141:16 stays [1] - 51:5 Steering [1] - 84:28 stems [1] - 23:16 steps [1] - 73:14 still [16] - 8:10, 47:18, 51:9, 52:2, 100:24, 113:27, 119:18, 132:19, 138:18, 167:2, 167:4, 167:15, 167:16, 167:27, 168:16, 168:22 stood [1] - 43:23 stop [5] - 81:12, 81:20, 81:21, 157:26, 158:20 story [2] - 46:8, 80:10 straightforward d [1] - 69:16 STREET [2] - 3:28, 4:3 stress [116] - 21:21, 21:24, 22:1, 22:4, 22:13, 22:26, 23:9, 29:10, 37:6, 37:18, 37:21, 38:17, 41:22, 42:26, 43:3, 43:4, 43:7, 43:12, 44:2, 44:10, 44:14, 44:15, 44:18, 44:20, 44:22, 45:10, 45:29, 46:5, 46:10, 46:23, 46:29, 47:4, 47:9, 47:23, 48:8, 50:5, 50:7, 50:10, 50:15, 50:20, 50:29, 54:2, 61:23, 61:27, 62:18, 71:21, 71:29, 72:10, 72:14, 72:22, 73:13, 73:16, 74:1, 76:1, 76:4, 76:7, 76:10, 92:4, 94:19, 94:25, 94:27, 94:28, 95:1, 95:9, 95:12, 98:19, 98:22, 98:25,</p>	<p>100:10, 100:18, 101:17, 102:10, 108:16, 111:6, 113:7, 113:9, 113:27, 113:28, 114:9, 114:11, 114:24, 114:26, 114:27, 115:1, 115:4, 116:26, 119:25, 120:11, 120:19, 121:10, 121:25, 123:20, 123:28, 123:29, 134:3, 134:4, 134:5, 134:22, 135:8, 137:11, 137:13, 137:15, 144:15, 145:13, 145:15, 145:26, 148:20, 148:23, 162:21, 164:23 stressed [6] - 116:13, 116:14, 116:19, 129:13, 137:14, 138:23 stressor [4] - 134:6, 168:9 strictest [1] - 97:23 strictly [4] - 31:12, 33:20, 33:21, 33:26 struggling [1] - 98:25 students [1] - 158:9 stuff [2] - 60:5, 74:21 stupid [1] - 152:26 subcommittee [1] - 84:22 subject [5] - 9:26, 38:12, 72:11, 116:18, 117:17 subject-matter [2] - 38:12, 72:11 subjected [1] - 124:14 subjective [2] - 44:8, 45:6 submission [2] - 53:6, 80:18 submissions [2] - 80:8, 82:3 submit [1] - 25:25 submitted [1] - 95:29</p>	<p>submitting [2] - 70:8, 70:10 subsequent [7] - 8:8, 8:9, 26:17, 27:3, 43:8, 124:7, 143:20 subsequently [10] - 6:26, 23:24, 29:24, 29:28, 29:29, 30:4, 35:24, 43:25, 150:26, 152:10 substantial [1] - 170:29 substantive [1] - 7:15 suffer [3] - 43:12, 76:2, 76:6 suffered [3] - 45:25, 47:7, 86:1 suffering [13] - 21:29, 44:18, 44:22, 45:10, 47:23, 73:16, 95:8, 108:16, 116:25, 116:27, 144:14, 159:17, 170:5 suffers [1] - 44:2 sufficient [3] - 81:3, 136:2, 137:6 sufficiently [1] - 82:14 suggest [1] - 18:18 suggested [4] - 10:15, 50:23, 128:13, 156:6 suggesting [2] - 46:2, 110:8 suggestion [1] - 51:23 suggests [1] - 144:29 Super [1] - 86:28 superannuation [2] - 32:18, 36:10 Superintenden t [44] - 20:13, 21:4, 21:5, 22:10, 29:5, 30:12, 30:18, 30:23, 32:4, 35:1, 35:8, 35:20, 37:14, 37:28, 38:12, 40:15, 50:3, 51:17, 55:25, 70:22, 72:19,</p>	<p>73:15, 88:1, 90:29, 91:21, 91:22, 93:4, 94:18, 100:9, 102:9, 107:9, 108:2, 108:11, 108:12, 111:11, 112:4, 113:5, 113:24, 113:25, 142:13, 142:14, 160:28 superintendent [56] - 9:1, 9:4, 9:7, 14:4, 14:12, 14:18, 14:22, 15:14, 20:26, 21:19, 21:22, 23:18, 24:16, 25:9, 28:13, 28:28, 31:5, 35:26, 35:28, 35:29, 37:15, 41:6, 55:18, 58:12, 60:22, 62:7, 62:23, 63:12, 64:19, 64:21, 70:23, 72:21, 73:4, 73:27, 74:12, 74:15, 74:21, 75:22, 77:15, 77:16, 90:29, 102:20, 102:23, 102:28, 103:6, 108:3, 108:7, 109:2, 111:13, 128:7, 128:15, 128:21, 129:7, 165:12, 165:14 SUPERINTEND ENT [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21 superintendent 's [1] - 58:5 superior [2] - 160:13, 167:15 superiors [2] - 159:18, 160:22 supervision [2] - 116:15, 129:14 supervisor [1] - 128:27 supervisors [3] - 17:9, 19:9, 19:21 supplemental [1] - 37:2</p>	<p>support [30] - 18:12, 22:7, 54:28, 69:10, 71:19, 73:28, 77:17, 92:3, 93:21, 93:27, 103:29, 104:19, 105:20, 110:4, 111:26, 112:1, 112:14, 118:13, 128:24, 129:20, 129:24, 130:27, 140:5, 140:17, 140:23, 141:19, 141:20, 142:22 supported [4] - 13:9, 14:2, 51:8, 118:25 supporting [4] - 128:19, 129:23, 166:12, 168:5 supportive [2] - 133:12, 139:19 supports [10] - 25:5, 90:8, 92:15, 104:26, 106:18, 118:20, 118:24, 133:11, 161:2, 161:3 suppose [45] - 22:2, 22:20, 22:23, 23:8, 23:12, 27:21, 31:6, 35:12, 43:2, 43:3, 44:17, 45:2, 45:8, 45:19, 46:6, 49:19, 50:26, 51:3, 51:10, 52:24, 52:26, 53:10, 53:14, 53:28, 54:25, 54:27, 55:7, 57:8, 58:7, 59:19, 59:27, 60:9, 62:14, 62:26, 64:18, 64:22, 69:8, 73:19, 74:13, 75:14, 106:19, 110:13, 120:14, 166:18 Surgeons [1] - 83:28 surgery [5] - 83:6, 98:16, 98:20, 98:24, 141:15 surprised [1] - 123:22 surrounding [1] - 116:16</p>	<p>surveillance [1] - 84:23 sustained [1] - 139:20 SWORN [2] - 6:9, 82:19 synergistic [1] - 158:12 synergistically [1] - 157:22 system [15] - 7:26, 13:13, 13:23, 18:11, 18:12, 35:9, 49:6, 49:8, 57:16, 73:19, 73:20, 73:21, 146:11, 155:23, 160:6 systems [2] - 57:23, 60:24 SIÓCHÁNA [1] - 3:2 Sióchána [20] - 6:20, 10:5, 13:10, 32:27, 42:4, 46:24, 47:3, 47:11, 47:26, 48:22, 49:1, 54:3, 57:15, 67:6, 67:8, 84:14, 84:16, 150:8, 162:8, 164:19</p>
T					
<p>T&N [1] - 4:2 table [1] - 161:27 talks [1] - 161:2 TARA [1] - 3:22 targeting [1] - 77:10 tax [1] - 116:15 team [2] - 79:28, 80:17 technical [1] - 27:22 Telephone [1] - 126:3 telephone [4] - 126:25, 138:17, 139:27, 140:4 temporarily [5] - 24:10, 118:26, 127:13, 130:23, 133:13 temporary [5] - 8:11, 10:25, 11:11, 26:5, 69:1</p>					

<p>Temporary [6] - 10:27, 11:13, 20:20, 69:17, 69:24, 70:5</p> <p>ten [1] - 162:18</p> <p>tend [9] - 94:26, 105:27, 111:21, 111:22, 113:12, 113:13, 113:23, 165:26, 166:5</p> <p>tension [1] - 134:29</p> <p>term [6] - 34:16, 41:9, 103:18, 112:28, 116:1, 163:26</p> <p>terms [53] - 8:2, 14:24, 18:27, 22:20, 31:8, 33:1, 57:8, 59:7, 59:19, 61:12, 63:10, 64:12, 64:27, 66:8, 69:12, 69:15, 72:15, 74:10, 81:12, 95:10, 95:13, 97:2, 107:10, 114:8, 114:14, 114:17, 120:5, 120:23, 127:20, 129:14, 129:22, 133:16, 133:21, 133:29, 134:5, 134:21, 142:17, 148:4, 154:20, 156:27, 156:29, 157:18, 160:5, 160:26, 161:21, 164:17, 164:28, 165:6, 165:22, 167:6, 167:17, 167:23, 168:5</p> <p>th [1] - 21:22</p> <p>THE [9] - 6:1, 6:12, 78:5, 78:9, 79:19, 82:22, 82:26, 170:23, 171:8</p> <p>the.. [1] - 132:9</p> <p>theme [1] - 47:7</p> <p>themselves [4] - 54:6, 59:1, 75:8, 134:27</p> <p>THEN [6] - 78:9, 79:19, 150:1, 169:13, 170:23, 171:8</p> <p>theory [1] - 33:26</p> <p>thereafter [7] -</p>	<p>16:25, 17:16, 18:22, 36:20, 80:21, 83:10, 88:27</p> <p>therefore [6] - 43:5, 78:27, 79:6, 123:22, 160:20, 164:17</p> <p>third [2] - 8:26, 112:17</p> <p>thirds [1] - 72:8</p> <p>thorough [1] - 148:24</p> <p>thousands [1] - 57:18</p> <p>threatened [1] - 99:1</p> <p>three [18] - 16:25, 17:16, 17:21, 50:8, 66:9, 66:14, 66:17, 68:19, 78:13, 78:14, 79:16, 80:21, 88:26, 94:2, 94:3, 132:19, 169:22, 169:29</p> <p>throughout [6] - 11:20, 85:11, 121:20, 156:19, 157:9, 169:5</p> <p>thrown [2] - 13:20, 49:11</p> <p>Thursday [2] - 40:21, 91:7</p> <p>ticked [1] - 95:17</p> <p>tied [1] - 69:13</p> <p>timeframe [1] - 30:19</p> <p>timeline [1] - 66:8</p> <p>tiny [1] - 141:13</p> <p>tipped [2] - 93:6, 98:10</p> <p>to.. [2] - 138:24, 141:24</p> <p>tobacco [2] - 118:11, 118:13</p> <p>tobacco, [1] - 118:12</p> <p>today [7] - 6:5, 68:8, 76:3, 81:9, 140:5, 140:12, 141:18</p> <p>today's [1] - 57:20</p> <p>together [2] - 53:5, 60:10</p> <p>TOM [3] - 3:12,</p>	<p>4:10</p> <p>tomorrow [4] - 78:19, 78:20, 78:27, 98:21</p> <p>Tony [4] - 37:14, 39:15, 39:25, 40:4</p> <p>took [11] - 65:16, 77:5, 83:27, 117:9, 122:15, 125:8, 127:29, 133:6, 137:22, 155:2, 167:24</p> <p>top [8] - 88:3, 97:15, 99:12, 100:6, 137:23, 148:19, 162:18, 167:11</p> <p>total [3] - 70:27, 92:19, 100:1</p> <p>touch [1] - 104:1</p> <p>tours [7] - 71:5, 92:21, 92:23, 93:16, 93:20, 102:4, 102:5</p> <p>towards [5] - 102:23, 103:6, 141:12, 162:8, 169:8</p> <p>training [3] - 83:11, 83:25, 84:6</p> <p>Training [1] - 84:9</p> <p>transactional [1] - 57:25</p> <p>transactions [1] - 6:29</p> <p>transcribe [1] - 17:28</p> <p>transcript [3] - 97:12, 97:13, 111:23</p> <p>transfer [4] - 60:2, 98:28, 112:26, 113:2</p> <p>transferred [3] - 7:3, 7:9, 91:6</p> <p>transpired [1] - 33:11</p> <p>traumatic [2] - 14:10, 86:2</p> <p>treat [1] - 134:3</p> <p>treated [8] - 63:27, 77:21, 97:23, 128:14, 129:6, 133:1, 134:9, 147:25</p> <p>treating [1] - 44:6</p>	<p>treatment [24] - 86:16, 87:13, 87:16, 87:25, 110:6, 118:22, 126:9, 130:24, 133:10, 133:29, 135:18, 135:19, 136:14, 136:21, 137:4, 137:5, 138:25, 139:24, 140:6, 140:17, 140:24, 142:26, 154:25, 169:6</p> <p>trespass [1] - 70:20</p> <p>Tribunal [2] - 6:18, 37:2</p> <p>tried [2] - 87:24, 125:27</p> <p>tries [3] - 104:1, 118:16, 132:23</p> <p>trigger [1] - 120:9</p> <p>trips [2] - 42:5, 42:14</p> <p>tropical [1] - 83:28</p> <p>TRR [14] - 10:28, 11:6, 20:14, 25:21, 26:1, 27:12, 28:16, 39:18, 39:20, 39:21, 69:28, 70:7, 93:6, 98:11</p> <p>true [1] - 42:29</p> <p>trust [1] - 36:11</p> <p>try [9] - 13:29, 42:23, 61:17, 66:4, 70:20, 75:14, 78:16, 139:23, 165:5</p> <p>trying [8] - 26:20, 46:7, 75:8, 99:26, 102:13, 106:25, 136:1, 160:26</p> <p>turn [2] - 64:14, 109:29</p> <p>turns [1] - 81:6</p> <p>two [19] - 22:20, 23:1, 27:18, 65:8, 65:10, 68:9, 68:17, 68:19, 72:8, 79:24, 105:23, 124:22, 124:25, 138:5, 144:26, 156:16, 157:23, 160:18, 169:26</p> <p>two-thirds [1] -</p>	<p>72:8</p> <p>tX [1] - 141:17</p> <p>type [2] - 96:26, 136:14</p> <p>types [2] - 124:13, 158:14</p>	<p>135:1</p> <p>unit [18] - 15:16, 15:19, 15:20, 15:22, 15:23, 15:28, 16:4, 16:9, 17:14, 19:2, 19:26, 88:25, 89:1, 89:10, 89:11, 89:16, 90:2</p> <p>units [4] - 104:9, 104:12, 104:14, 104:15</p> <p>University [2] - 83:7, 83:15</p> <p>unless [9] - 113:18, 120:20, 120:27, 123:19, 134:14, 161:12, 161:13, 165:29, 166:4</p> <p>unlike [1] - 159:15</p> <p>unrecommend ed [1] - 158:16</p> <p>unsuccessful [1] - 126:3</p> <p>unsuitable [1] - 54:20</p> <p>UNTIL [1] - 171:8</p> <p>unusual [8] - 22:18, 22:27, 23:28, 31:4, 34:13, 34:18, 38:27, 61:29</p> <p>unwell [1] - 73:25</p> <p>up [71] - 8:13, 9:13, 11:23, 13:20, 13:23, 15:26, 16:6, 16:13, 16:24, 18:3, 18:5, 18:7, 18:8, 18:23, 18:26, 18:29, 22:8, 23:15, 25:7, 28:9, 28:14, 29:4, 30:20, 33:21, 37:26, 38:2, 39:21, 40:1, 41:29, 49:11, 61:13, 61:19, 64:23, 65:29, 66:17, 67:23, 71:1, 72:6, 73:26, 77:16, 88:17, 98:6, 99:11, 99:13, 99:28, 108:4, 108:7,</p>
U					
<p>ulterior [1] - 82:13</p> <p>ultimately [2] - 89:17, 109:10</p> <p>unable [2] - 20:25, 73:3</p> <p>unaffected [1] - 50:11</p> <p>unambiguous [1] - 55:4</p> <p>unanimity [1] - 142:4</p> <p>uncooperate [1] - 62:3</p> <p>under [35] - 8:3, 9:21, 10:25, 11:26, 12:6, 12:16, 23:13, 31:16, 32:20, 32:26, 34:22, 34:25, 41:29, 42:15, 46:26, 47:1, 48:9, 50:5, 61:2, 61:3, 62:27, 62:28, 62:29, 63:29, 64:16, 66:2, 69:8, 69:10, 75:21, 76:3, 98:27, 98:29, 102:17, 117:24, 146:11</p> <p>understood [3] - 10:15, 123:13, 155:3</p> <p>undertake [1] - 45:14</p> <p>unfairly [1] - 128:14</p> <p>unfit [20] - 14:10, 20:23, 21:20, 24:10, 73:1, 98:19, 114:6, 118:26, 119:10, 127:9, 127:13, 127:16, 130:23, 133:13, 139:1, 155:5, 155:26, 156:8, 163:11</p> <p>unfortunately [3] - 29:28, 78:21,</p>					

109:2, 115:11, 118:5, 119:6, 119:18, 120:5, 120:15, 122:17, 125:23, 126:15, 131:13, 132:23, 133:24, 133:26, 133:27, 138:14, 139:5, 142:23, 143:17, 150:21, 157:26, 161:20, 169:27 up-to-date [2] - 16:24, 131:13 update [3] - 126:19, 130:21, 142:25 updated [1] - 30:28 updates [3] - 119:7, 130:25, 131:1 upheld [1] - 80:10 uphold [1] - 80:11 uploaded [1] - 73:17 urge [1] - 47:25 useful [1] - 135:3 usual [1] - 64:2	127:8, 139:1, 144:26, 169:28 viewed [1] - 161:6 viewing [1] - 100:28 views [5] - 41:18, 49:20, 52:9, 76:13, 147:19 viral [2] - 121:11, 121:20 visit [1] - 128:9 voiced [1] - 53:10 volume [1] - 109:21 Volume [8] - 22:8, 23:15, 28:14, 70:22, 85:9, 108:6, 127:27, 146:6 voluntarily [1] - 155:13 voluntary [4] - 133:17, 136:3, 136:5, 136:7 volunteer [1] - 166:2 vulnerable [1] - 137:16	138:5, 170:27, 171:3, 171:5 week [1] - 40:22 weeks [8] - 15:17, 16:10, 16:24, 17:15, 68:9, 68:17, 86:3, 88:26 weighing [2] - 132:13, 134:11 welfare [4] - 87:23, 128:24, 162:2, 162:8 wellbeing [9] - 103:29, 104:27, 112:1, 115:22, 130:3, 138:19, 139:15, 140:6, 140:23 west [1] - 84:11 Westmeath [3] - 25:9, 35:27, 70:24 WESTMEATH [1] - 4:4 Wheatley [5] - 21:5, 22:10, 37:29, 107:9, 142:13 WHEATLEY [1] - 3:4 Wheatley's [1] - 113:25 whereby [3] - 35:10, 56:10, 56:20 whichever [1] - 85:15 whistleblower [4] - 60:14, 60:23, 116:17, 132:13 whistleblowing [1] - 134:10 WHITE [1] - 3:11 whole [7] - 7:12, 10:8, 42:3, 48:12, 119:15, 167:3, 168:15 widely [1] - 35:14 widespread [1] - 54:12 willful [1] - 75:23 willing [3] - 22:14, 140:24, 143:27 willingness [2] - 139:24, 140:10 wine [2] - 118:5,	118:6 wish [9] - 19:7, 19:23, 23:13, 36:13, 72:13, 74:26, 92:12, 97:25, 149:5 with.. [2] - 103:2, 138:19 with... [1] - 89:29 WITHDREW [2] - 78:9, 170:23 WITNESS [7] - 5:2, 6:12, 78:5, 78:9, 82:22, 82:26, 170:23 witness [7] - 6:5, 79:5, 79:23, 149:13, 164:3, 170:27, 170:29 witnesses [4] - 63:19, 79:3, 79:12, 171:4 wold [1] - 110:18 wonder [4] - 149:16, 150:15, 153:17, 162:12 wondering [3] - 108:24, 125:21, 127:4 word [11] - 22:2, 53:15, 59:28, 62:3, 94:1, 102:22, 118:8, 138:21, 156:25, 165:27, 168:25 words [4] - 94:13, 96:7, 103:9, 163:27 workplace [12] - 16:7, 92:8, 92:15, 93:22, 93:23, 94:28, 114:20, 130:5, 131:6, 139:19, 145:16, 168:18 worried [1] - 100:23 worry [1] - 152:13 worse [1] - 157:23 worst [1] - 110:1 worth [1] - 40:4 would've [1] - 26:25 write [5] - 31:15, 89:9, 89:16, 165:15, 165:21	writes [3] - 46:10, 145:19, 145:21 writing [4] - 60:21, 64:23, 151:20, 151:21 written [12] - 29:12, 38:19, 86:19, 86:26, 96:7, 101:12, 105:22, 108:13, 125:3, 150:29, 162:15, 162:16 wrote [6] - 108:2, 108:3, 127:5, 139:7, 150:23, 153:29
V	W	X	Y	
validate [1] - 168:29 validating [1] - 129:18 various [5] - 18:13, 36:2, 60:11, 60:12, 98:8 verbatim [1] - 111:23 version [3] - 44:4, 44:9, 85:15 victimisation [1] - 77:10 view [24] - 36:5, 46:3, 47:15, 47:18, 50:17, 52:12, 61:10, 62:21, 73:13, 80:13, 80:17, 80:28, 106:3, 106:15, 106:19, 113:3, 113:21, 115:1, 115:6,	wages [2] - 31:1, 65:17 wait [1] - 33:9 waiting [1] - 56:23 walk [1] - 118:14 walked [1] - 155:12 wants [2] - 160:8, 167:8 warranted [3] - 17:20, 88:29, 90:13 WAS [7] - 6:9, 57:3, 66:24, 82:19, 150:1, 153:14, 169:13 ways [1] - 141:19 website [2] - 79:13, 171:5 WEDNESDAY [1] - 6:1 week [7] - 80:5, 81:3, 97:22,	Xanax [11] - 98:13, 116:7, 117:9, 156:17, 156:23, 157:11, 157:18, 158:3, 158:17, 158:19, 158:21	year [13] - 8:11, 9:25, 9:27, 10:10, 10:11, 10:13, 11:5, 25:17, 26:9, 37:3, 68:7, 86:8, 99:27 years [12] - 8:7, 10:16, 26:22, 27:20, 67:2, 69:10, 69:11, 69:24, 69:26, 70:28, 92:20, 168:8 yesterday [4] - 10:3, 41:27, 127:22, 129:5 yourself [2] - 38:11, 109:18	
		€	€300 [1] - 36:3	
		Ó	Ó [1] - 3:7	