TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE

ON TUESDAY, 11TH FEBRUARY 2020 - DAY 136

136

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL:

MR. DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. SINÉAD McGRATH BL

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY & GARDA DAVID TURNER:

MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

FOR COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANIAN 10. 11. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN 13. SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16. 16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR. CHI EF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARI E CAGNEY DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON 30. INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY 31. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN 32. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN 33. 34. SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 35. 36. 37. SHANE MURPHY SC MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC MR. MR. MR.

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE____

INSTRUCTED BY:

LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL MR. PAUL CONNELLAN T&N MCLYNN FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

BASTION COURT 11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

ATHLONE

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O' ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE

INSTRUCTED BY:

DUBLIN 2

FOR GARDA TOM HIGGINS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. TOM POWER BL
MR. NOEL McCARTAN
McCARTAN & BURKE SOLICITORS
ICELAND HOUSE
33-34 ARRAN QUAY
SMITHFIELD

DUBLIN 7

INDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT FRANK WALSH	
DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. KELLY	25
EXAMINED BY MR. DIGNAM	43
RE-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH	54
DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER	
DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	60
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. KELLY	91
EXAMINED BY MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS	104
RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	114
DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY	
DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	119

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON TUESDAY, 11TH	
2			FEBRUARY 2020:	
3				
4			CHAIRMAN: Good morning.	
5			MS. McGRATH: Good morning, Chairman. Detective	10:31
6			Superintendent Walsh, please.	
7				
8			DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT FRANK WALSH, CONTINUED TO BE	
9			DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MS. McGRATH, AS FOLLOWS:	
10				10:31
11			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Good morning,	
12			superintendent.	
13			THE WITNESS: Good morning, Chairman.	
14	1	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Good morning, detective superintendent.	
15			Just to finish up some matters yesterday. I think the	10:31
16			first thing I want to do is just clarify something.	
17			Yesterday, when we were going through the confidential	
18			reporting framework and the documentation, if you	
19			remember we looked at the early regulations and the	
20			charter and then we spoke about the Protected	10:31
21			Disclosures Act.	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	2	Q.	If you remember that. The date of the Act commencing	
24			was 15th July 2014 and I had drawn your attention to	
25			the policy which I had in the brief and I had been	10:32
26			asking you questions about that policy. Now, we sought	
27			to clarify the position on that policy and it would	
28			appear that it didn't come into being until 2017, would	
29			that be your understanding of the situation?	

- A. Yes, Chairman. I was concerned when I was asked the question, I think I was asked the question whether

 Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin would have been aware of the policy and I thought, but wasn't sure, that that charter didn't come into existence at the same time as the Act. That is why I was reluctant to...
- 7 Okay. Thank you for that, detective superintendent. 3 Ι Q. 8 am sorry if I misled you in any way in that regard. But can I ask you this: Given that the Act came into 9 play in July 2014 and the charter, it seems then, did 10 10:32 11 not come into being until at least early 2017, what was the document or the charter that was in operation in 12 13 that intervening period? Was it the old charter, do 14 you still think that everyone was operating under?

10:33

10:33

10:33

- 15 A. It would have been the old Charter but we would have
 16 been cognisant of the new legislation also and the
 17 obligations that were imposed upon us by the
 18 legislation. I would certainly have been guided by
 19 that in any correspondence I was writing.
- 20 4 Q. Okay. Can I just ask you, I just want to finish up
 21 this morning by asking you to deal with two matters,
 22 two or three matters essentially which arose from the
 23 evidence of Chief Superintendent Mark Curran. And as
 24 we mentioned yesterday, he was the divisional officer
 25 in Westmeath at the time of the protected disclosure,
 26 isn't that right?
- 27 A. That's correct, yes.
- 28 5 Q. Now, when the chief superintendent was giving his evidence, one of the matters which arose during his

1			evidence was effectively the knowledge or understanding	
2			of senior management, and particularly the divisional	
3			management, of what was happening on the ground in	
4			Athlone around this time. I think his evidence was to	
5			the effect that they weren't informed of the making of	10:34
6			the protected disclosure and he used the word	
7			officially, is that right? Would that be common?	
8		Α.	Em, yes, that would be common, yes. We would only	
9			notify the assistant commissioner who was appointed to	
10			carry out the investigation.	10:34
11	6	Q.	Okay. During his evidence, he said that he became	
12			aware this is the divisional officer now of where	
13			everything was happening, he said he became aware of	
14			the making of the protected disclosure only through the	
15			broadcast media. Would you accept that that is most	10:34
16			likely the case?	
17		Α.	I would, yes. He certainly wasn't notified from the	
18			Commissioner's office. I certainly didn't do any	
19			correspondence notifying the divisional office, no.	
20	7	Q.	And can I ask you, is the thinking behind that the fact	10:35
21			that the identity of the protected disclosure or the	
22			confidential reporter is to be confidential, is that	
23			the logic behind all that?	
24		Α.	Yes, the whole scheme is a confidential scheme.	
25			Especially the identity of the discloser.	10:35
26	8	Q.	Can I ask you then, just staying on this particular	
27			issue, under the 2007 regulations which were in place	
28			at the time, I think there is provision under section 9	

of the regulations for the reporter's identity to be

1	disclosed. We just might look at that, at page 7862.	
2	You see there in section 9 it talks about the	
3	protection of the confidential reporter's identity. If	
4	you look at perhaps 9(2), it says:	
5		10:36
6	"The identity of a confidential reporter may be	
7	disclosed by the Minister or Commissioner to an officer	
8	of the Minister, a member"	
9		
10	I take that's of AGS	10:36
11		
12	" or a civilian, only where the Minister or	
13	Commissioner believes that disclosure is essential for	
14	the proper examination of the confidential reporter or	
15	investigation of the corruption or malpractice	10:36
16	concerned. "	
17		
18	Subsection (3) then talks about:	
19		
20	"An officer of the Minister or a member or civilian to	10:36
21	whom the identity of the confidential reporter has been	
22	disclose under paragraph (2) may not disclose the	
23	identity of any other person without the written	
24	authorisation of the Minister or Commissioner as the	
25	case may be."	10:36
26		
27	And under subsection (4):	
28		
29	"The Minister or the Commissioner may give such an	

Т			authorisation only where she or he believes that it is	
2			essential for the proper examination of the	
3			confidential reporter or investigation of the alleged	
4			corruption or malpractice."	
5				10:36
6			So I think there It creates a facility where there may	
7			be circumstances where the identity may be disclosed,	
8			is that right?	
9		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
10	9	Q.	Was that considered or taken into account as maybe	10:37
11			something that might be considered by the	
12			Commissioner's office in relation to this protected	
13			disclosure, in the light of the media issues?	
14		Α.	Not in any discussions that I had with the Commissioner	
15			or in any correspondence that I prepared in relation to	10:37
16			this particular report, it wasn't, no.	
17	10	Q.	Okay. Can I ask you this then: In relation to Chief	
18			Superintendent Curran, he expressed some frustration or	
19			some distance from the investigation being carried out	
20			by the Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin in his	10:37
21			evidence, would the Commissioner's office have been	
22			aware of that?	
23		Α.	I can only say I personally wasn't aware. I don't know	
24			whether the Commissioner was aware or not but I	
25			personally was not aware, no.	10:37
26	11	Q.	Can I ask you specifically, we mentioned briefly in	
27			passing yesterday, there was an intelligence entry made	
28			by Garda Keogh and we looked at the Pulse ID for that	
29			yesterday. In particular, I think the chief	

1			superintendent wrote to the assistant commissioner of	
2			the Eastern Region in relation to this issue, which	
3			effectively landed on his desk. I don't know if you	
4			have seen those papers in the brief in relation to	
5			this, the difficulty the chief superintendent said he	10:38
6			had in relation to dealing with this intelligence	
7			entry. Would you be familiar with the papers	
8			surrounding this?	
9		Α.	I'm sure I saw them, I just can't recall them at the	
10			moment.	10:38
11	12	Q.	Well, can I ask you to look in particular, there's a	
12			letter on the papers from the Chief Superintendent	
13			Curran to the assistant commissioner Eastern Region and	
14			it's at page 8276. You see there it's dated 19th May	
15			2014, but in fact the chief superintendent corrected	10:39
16			this as the 20th May, up at the top there,	
17			Mr. Kavanagh. So on the 20th May, which is a number of	
18			days, possibly around two weeks after the protected	
19			disclosure, this intelligence entry was placed on Pulse	
20			by Garda Keogh and here you have the chief	10:39
21			superintendent writing to the assistant commissioner in	
22			relation to the Pulse entry and he identifies it. If	
23			you can just look there at paragraph 2, I think,	
24			because you do have some involvement in a moment in	
25			relation to the movement of this correspondence. He	10:39
26			says:	
27				
28			"Garda Keogh was recently named publicly in the Dáil as	

having reported certain matters to the Garda interim

1	confidential recipient. As is evident from the	
2	attached correspondence of Inspector Farrell dated 20th	
3	May 2014, Garda Keogh has now cited the fact that he is	
4	due to meet with the Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin	
5	in relation to these matters and consequently states 10	: 40
6	that he cannot discuss the entry with Inspector	
7	Farrel I."	
8		
9	Then he says:	
10	10	: 40
11	"I am mindful of the obligations placed on me to ensure	
12	that all acts of criminality disclosed are investigated	
13	thoroughl y. "	
14		
15	He mentions the data protection issues. He then goes $_{10}$: 40
16	on in the next paragraph, he says:	
17		
18	"In view of the foregoing requirements and the	
19	information now entered on the Pulse system alleging	
20	criminality by members of An Garda Síochána, I am now 10	: 40
21	seeking clarification as to how I can progress these	
22	matters with Garda Keogh to obtain additional	
23	information to investigate the allegation. I am also	
24	concludes of Garda Keogh's right to report such matters	
25	to the confidential recipient and have them acted upon $_{ m 10}$: 40
26	through that mechanism.	
27		
28	I must advise that this office is not aware as to	

whether or not the allegation that is now set out on

1 the above created intelligence is the subject of a 2 referral to the confidential recipient." 3 And it goes on to say: 4 5 10:40 6 "However, as the matter has now been disclosed I am 7 duty bound to ensure it is fully investigated." 8 On the next page he says that he seeks the views of the 9 chief superintendent at Internal Affairs and 10 10 · 41 11 Superintendent Nyland at Crime Policy and 12 Administration. 13 14 Now, we know from the papers and in particular that 15 this letter makes its way to you. If Mr. Kavanagh 10:41 16 could open up 8294. So, sorry, 8294, at the bottom 17 there, sorry, Mr. Kavanagh. So from the commissioner 18 of operations, it goes to the Commissioner's office on 19 the 22nd May, which is two days later, attaching this particular report. If Mr. Kavanagh can then just 20 10:41 8293 is the start of that, so keep 21 scroll back up. 22 going, Mr. Kavanagh, please. If you stop there. 23 yourself in the Commissioner's office, you forward this 24 on, you reply to the commissioner of operations on the 25 27th May and you copy the assistant commissioner of the 10:42 26 criminal investigation. If Mr. Kavanagh can now keep 27 scrolling down, please. You say:

"I am directed by the Commissioner..."

28

29

1				
2			So the Commissioner had seen this document, is that	
3			right?	
4		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
5	13	Q.	Okay. And has seen the issue in relation to the	10:42
6			intelligence entry. What the chief superintendent has	
7			outlined there, he is looking for guidance in relation	
8			to how to deal with it. And you say:	
9				
10			"Please report further on requested clarifications	10:42
11			sought from chief superintendent Internal Affairs and,	
12			superintendent crime policy and administrations as to	
13			how the chief superintendent Mullingar can progress	
14			these matters with Garda Keogh to obtain additional	
15			information to investigate the allegation.	10:42
16				
17			This report has been copied to assistant commissioner	
18			Western Region for information."	
19				
20			So you send that on. That is your e-mail, isn't that	10:42
21			right?	
22		Α.	That's correct.	
23	14	Q.	And that's you sending it on. You are directed by the	
24			Commissioner to do this, so was it the case that you	
25			were directed by the Commissioner to bring this pretty	10:43
26			smartly to the attention of the criminal investigation,	
27			that this was an issue that was alive for the chief	
28			superintendent in Mullingar?	
29		Α.	Well. it was a case. it seems, that the deputy	

1 commissioner in charge of operations had sent that 2 particular aspect of the file to the Commissioner for her information. You will note the first line of my 3 response is "the content of which has been noted", so 4 5 there isn't an action per se, the Commissioner is not 10:43 6 directing an action. It would be standard then, the 7 second paragraph, asking them for a further report on 8 the issues that had opinion raised, it would be standard that we would ask that we would be kept 9 informed of any of those issues that might arise. 10 So 10 · 43 11 there's no direction as such in that to do X, Y or Z or to give any guidance as to how it should be done. 12 Ιt 13 is merely saying we are noting what you are saying and please ensure that the office is kept informed. Again, 14 the fact that the Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin 15 10:44 16 would have been investigating the matter, we copied it to him for his information, that he would have a 17 18 complete picture of anything that was touching on the 19 investigation that he was conducting. 20 So would you have been directed to copy the assistant 15 Q. 10:44 commissioner on it? 21 22 I would imagine I was, I can't say, I couldn't say that Α.

a hundred percent, but it would have been the standard procedure that the assistant commissioner had such an integral part in the file at this point in time, that he would be copied for his information.

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

16 Q. Can I ask you, there was a follow up letter by the chief superintendent to the assistant commissioner in the Eastern Region the following day effectively. That

1	is your e-mail of the 27th May. The following day, on	
2	the 28th May, and this letter is at page 8303, and	
3	effectively this is from the chief superintendent to	
4	the assistant commissioner of the Eastern Region and	
5	effectively if we can just have a look at it,	10:45
6	please, detective superintendent, because I want to	
7	clarify whether or not this one ever made its way to	
8	you and whether you remember it or recall it. Now this	
9	is Chief Superintendent Curran, he is saying:	
10		10:45
11	"I refer to previous correspondence from this office	
12	dated 19th May"	
13		
14	Now we know, as I say, that's corrected to the 20th in	
15	his evidence here.	10:45
16		
17	"and yours of the 27th May in reply with attachments	
18	from the office of the Commissioner and deputy	
19	commissioner of operations."	
20		10:45
21	So he is previously outlining the item of intelligence	
22	created in the next paragraph. He outlines the issue	
23	in respect to data protection and that has been	
24	referred. He is repeating the paragraph that Garda	
25	Keogh has been named publicly in the Dáil and is	10:45
26	meeting Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin. Can you just	
27	look at the next paragraph, please, detective	
28	superintendent, because this is an important paragraph	

and I just want to know if this triggers any member of

1		yours or came to your office.	
2			
3		"Owing to the fact that Garda Keogh has now stated that	
4		this current allegation is the subject of a referral to	
5		the Garda confidential recipient, I am not in a	10:46
6		position to determine whether it is appropriate for the	
7		local investigation to proceed."	
8			
9		He said:	
10			10:46
11		"This cross-referencing is an issue that can only be	
12		addressed by the Garda Commissioner and the advices of	
13		superintendent Nyland, Crime Policy and Administration,	
14		is to the effect that the mare should be addressed	
15		solely by the Garda Commissioner to remove any conflict	10:46
16		of interest or intrusion on the investigation reported	
17		through the confidential recipient."	
18			
19		He says in the next page:	
20			10:46
21		"Accordingly, subject to your approval I do not propose	
22		to take any further action unless otherwise directed."	
23			
24		So I think in that previous paragraph it's a very	
25		pointed reference to the Garda Commissioner needing to	10:46
26		get involved in this issue. Do you remember did you	
27		ever see that letter coming through the office?	
28	Α.	The letter is familiar but I am not sure whether it's	
29		from my recent examination of the file or whether I	

Т			remember it from I think it's is most likely that it	
2			is from my recent examination of the file when I was	
3			making my statement. I don't remember but that	
4			particular paragraph, when he talks about "it should be	
5			addressed by the Garda Commissioner", the Garda	10:47
6			Commissioner would address that on receipt of the	
7			advices from the Crime Policy section, which is the	
8			reference to Chief Superintendent Nyland. So that's	
9			where, in the previous minute, when I had written back	
10			to operations I asked for an update on the issues that	10:47
11			had been raised, including Chief Superintendent	
12			Nyland's response to that. I don't know if that was	
13			ever received.	
14	17	Q.	Well it says:	
15				10:47
16			"The advice of Superintendent Nyland in crime	
17			administration is to the effect"	
18				
19			So that suggests that advice was given by	
20			Superintendent Nyland.	10:47
21		Α.	I am not familiar with that, I don't know, I couldn't	
22			answer that, I'm afraid.	
23	18	Q.	I take it then this cross-referencing that he was	
24			looking for from the Garda Commissioner, for the Garda	
25			Commissioner to remove any conflict of interest or	10:48
26			intrusion, did that ever come across your desk, a	
27			request for that, an action for that?	
28		Α.	Not to my recollection.	
29	19	0	Recause what hannens then and this is on the hasis of	

1			the chief superintendent, is that the following day, on	
2			29th May 2014, he gave evidence to this Tribunal both	
3			in his interview with the investigators and his	
4			evidence to the Chairman that there was a phone call	
5			from you to him on the 29th May and it related to this	10:48
6			issue of intelligence. You would be aware of this from	
7			the papers and the transcripts?	
8		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
9	20	Q.	Is that right?	
10		Α.	Mm-hmm.	10:48
11	21	Q.	Now, I think when you gave your second statement to us	
12			in January, you record in your statement, and I will	
13			just get the page for you, at 15882, you record that,	
14			on the 29th May you say:	
15				10:49
16			"No entries regarding telephone	
17			call/conversation/communication with Chief	
18			Superintendent Mark Curran on this date or	
19			subsequently."	
20				10:49
21			Now, that's not the same as saying you have no	
22			recollection or it didn't happen. What is your	
23			evidence to the Chairman in relation to this particular	
24			phone call?	
25		Α.	I was aware this was an issue and that that was	10:49
26			evidence that had been given. I would speak regularly	
27			with Chief Superintendent Mark Curran. I don't recall	
28			making that phone call. It's quite possible that I	
29			did. I think the diary entry for the day, I think I	

1			included the page from the diary, which I think showed	
2			that it was a particularly long day and I was extremely	
3			busy and I didn't have notes of everything that I did	
4			on that particular day. If Chief Superintendent Curran	
5			says that I rang him on that day, I am very happy to	10:49
6			accept that. I wouldn't contradict him in any way.	
7	22	Q.	Can I ask you, if I could ask Mr. Kavanagh to open up	
8			the transcript at Day 117, please. If I can ask	
9			Mr. Kavanagh to go to page 56 please. Now, what is	
10			happening here is Chief Superintendent Curran is giving	10:51
11			his direct-evidence and he is just being asked about	
12			that letter that we opened up there a moment ago of the	
13			28th May, where he says he is not going to take any	
14			further action unless otherwise directed. And then if	
15			you just go to line 19 please. It's there. Are we on	10:51
16			the right page, page 56?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18			CHAIRMAN: No.	
19			THE WITNESS: Sorry, I have a transcript here.	
20	23	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Line 19, please. Now it's put to him	10:51
21			that:	
22				
23			"Now, I think, as you said, that's where it was on the	
24			28th May, and"	
25				10:52
26			We're referring there to that letter you've just looked	
27			at.	
28				
29			"you got a phone call the following day, is that	

1	ri ght?	
2	A. That's correct, Chairman	
3		
4	Q. Okay. Can we just look at that phone call? I	
5	think if you go to you talk about it in your	10:52
6	interview at Volume 7, page 134. I think it might be	
7	at the bottom of the page, line 194, if you see it,	
8	chi ef superi ntendent	
9	A. Yes.	
10		10:52
11	Q. Sorry. If you just stay there, Mr. Kavanagh. If	
12	you go to the next page."	
13		
14	And it's put to him that in his interview or statement	
15	he says:	10:52
16		
17	"I can confirm that on 29th May 2014 Superintendent	
18	Frank Walsh"	
19		
20	And it's identified that you are the private secretary	10:52
21	to the Commissioner. It's there at line 9 onwards,	
22	this is taken from his interview:	
23		
24	"get a call from the Commissioner's office,	
25	contacted me by telephone and made me aware that a	10:52
26	complaint had been made to the confidential recipient,	
27	Judge McMahon."	
28		
29	Now, can you remember this? This is very specific. He	

1			is saying that Judge McMahon has contacted you and made	
2			a complaint to you.	
3		Α.	No, I don't recall it.	
4	24	Q.	Now, as I say, are you sure about that, detective	
5			superintendent? It's a very specific issue. It's a	10:53
6			complaint coming in to you via Judge McMahon and you	
7			are then channelling that on to the chief	
8			superintendent. Is it your evidence you don't remember	
9			the conversation?	
10		Α.	That's my evidence, yeah, and I have no note of it,	10:53
11			unfortunately, so.	
12	25	Q.	Now, if you go on down to line 19, the chief	
13			superintendent says:	
14				
15			"I have gone through that in my head. I didn't take	10:53
16			notes of that call at the time, because the net import	
17			of the call was that I was not to talk to Garda Keogh	
18			about the intelligence itself."	
19				
20			Can you comment on that?	10:53
21		Α.	I can't, no, unfortunately.	
22	26	Q.	Can I just ask you, are you saying the call did or did	
23			not happen or it did happen but you just don't remember	
24			the conversation?	
25		Α.	No, I can't remember whether the call was made or	10:53
26			whether that discussion took place. As I said, I have	
27			no problem accepting that if Chief Superintendent	
28			Curran said I contacted him on that date. I would say	
29			in relation to the content of the call, that it	

1			wouldn't be something that I would decide to do again	
2			off my own bat, it would have been following a	
3			consultation most likely with the Commissioner. But I	
4			don't remember the call and I don't have a note of it.	
5			I was asked specifically, that's why I set it out in my	10:54
6			diary entry, that there was nothing in the diary for	
7			that particular day.	
8	27	Q.	If we just go on to the next page, page 58, at line 12	
9			there. He is asked:	
10				10:54
11			"What exactly were you deciding or told or directed?	
12			Can you just maybe just take us through that. What was	
13			the conversation, and give us as much detail as you can	
14			in relation to the conversation?	
15			A. My understanding was, of that conversation was,	10:54
16			pursuing any questions of Garda Keogh in relation to	
17			the intelligence itself wasn't to happen."	
18				
19			Now, if that call did happen, as you say, this would	
20			not be your direction, you acted pursuant to the	10:55
21			direction of the Commissioner, is that right?	
22		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
23	28	Q.	And here it's saying:	
24				
25			"Pursuing any questions of Garda Keogh in relation to	10:55
26			the intelligence itself wasn't to happen. That to some	
27			extent I suppose it didn't resolve the CHIS issue, but	
28			it meant I couldn't ask him about the intelligence	
29			entry any more."	

1				
2			Now, he goes on then when he is under	
3			cross-examination, I think it was Mr. Kelly was	
4			cross-examining him, and this is at Day 118.	
5			CHAIRMAN: I thought it was Ms. Mulligan who	10:55
6			cross-examined. No. Mr. O'Brien?	
7			MR. KELLY: Mr. O'Brien.	
8			MS. McGRATH: Sorry.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. O'Brien, I picked everybody	
10			except you. Sorry, Mr. O'Brien. Anyway we think it	10:56
11			was Mr. O'Brien on Day 118. 118. It's in the other	
12			direction, Peter.	
13			MS. McGRATH: Up at the top maybe. It's page 2,	
14			Mr. Kavanagh. It should be there. No. So it's Day	
15			118 and it is page 26. If I can ask you to look at	10:57
16			line 6 there, the chief superintendent is asked:	
17				
18			"What did chief superintendent Walsh say to you in	
19			relation to what the concerns of the confidential	
20			recipient were? What was the message that was to be	10:57
21			passed to you?	
22			A. That I wasn't to Garda Keogh about the	
23			i ntel I i gence. "	
24				
25			Now I think it's your evidence you don't remember any	10:58
26			of this, isn't that right, detective superintendent?	
27		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
28	29	Q.	And then the next question is:	

Т			"And the reason for that? Was it that it was within	
2			the remit of the Ó Cualáin investigation?	
3			A. The way that was Superintendent Walsh said he	
4			was just passing on a message."	
5				10:58
6			Again, does that trigger any recollection to you?	
7		Α.	It doesn't ring a bell at all. Again, I would just	
8			like to say that it is possible that I made that call,	
9			I just have no recollection of it whatsoever, and no	
10			note.	10:58
11			MS. McGRATH: Thank you, detective superintendent. If	
12			you could answer any questions please.	
13				
14			END OF EXAMINATION	
15				10:59
16			THE WITNESS: Thank you.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Kelly. Take your time.	
18				
19			DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT FRANK WALSH WAS CROSS-EXAMINED	_
20			BY MR. KELLY, AS FOLLOWS:	10:59
21				
22	30	Q.	MR. KELLY: Superintendent, good morning.	
23		Α.	Good morning.	
24	31	Q.	I want to just ask you a few questions, beginning with	
25			the object of the charter. I think that's the charter	10:59
26			that would have been in place back in May 2014, the	
27			older one?	
28		Α.	The original, yes.	
29	32	0	Ves the original one. Now if T have understood what	

1			you are saying correctly when you were taken through	
2			the object of the charter, that the duties which were	
3			imposed within the charter upon various people were	
4			designed to encourage disclosure, is that right?	
5		Α.	That's correct, yes.	11:00
6	33	Q.	And certainly not to discourage?	
7		Α.	No.	
8	34	Q.	So the object, the culture wasn't to create a culture	
9			where people felt free to make disclosures, is that	
10			right?	11:00
11		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
12	35	Q.	And I think also within that Charter it was envisaged,	
13			again if I have understood you correctly, that one of	
14			the policy objectives was that when someone had made a	
15			disclosure they would then be kept informed or, to use	11:00
16			the phrase, in the frame as to the progress as it went	
17			through, is that right?	
18		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
19	36	Q.	And the chosen channel for that was the confidential	
20			recipient?	11:01
21		Α.	Correct.	
22	37	Q.	So looking at it in the round, a person makes a	
23			disclosure to the confidential recipient, it is dealt	
24			with, the object was to be kept informed via the	
25			confidential recipient?	11:01
26		Α.	That's correct.	
27	38	Q.	That then changed shortly thereafter, didn't it?	
28			Because we know by July the office of the confidential	
29			recipient had gone, that's right, isn't it?	

1	Α.	That's	correct,	ves
-	~.	illat 3	COLLCC.	y CJ.

- 2 39 Q. So I am just wondering, what was the channel then?
- 3 A. The channel then was -- well, there was a new
- 4 confidential recipient came in, Judge McMahon's office
- or his predecessor was then -- under the old system
- there were a number of chief superintendents in various

11:02

11 · 02

11:02

11:03

- 7 regions appointed to receive any confidential reports.
- 8 Subsequent to that, when the new legislation came in,
- 9 the office of the confidential recipient came into
- being and it began I think with Mr. Connolly and
- 11 afterwards Judge McMahon. So they would then have been
- 12 kept informed of the --
- 13 40 Q. I understand that perfectly well, but what I am
- focusing on, perhaps it's my fault, by July the office
- of the confidential recipient had been abolished, there 11:02
- was now a new system, protected disclosure managers, is
- 17 that right?
- 18 A. That's correct, yes.
- 19 41 Q. What I am asking is, so between March -- between May
- and July, the confidential recipient, Judge McMahon,
- was in place, the office is then abolished. Up until
- that point the channel for communication with the
- person who made the protected disclosure was Judge
- 24 McMahon or the occupant of that office?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 42 Q. We know it was Judge McMahon, so we will just use his
- 27 name. The office is then abolished, so what is the
- channel of communication, feedback to the person who
- has made the protected disclosure once that office is

1	gone?

- 2 A. That was, sorry, July in which year?
- 3 43 Q. 2014.
- A. 2014. I am trying to recall. I think it may have been through the HR department, but I am not a hundred percent certain.
- 7 Well, I am suggesting on the basis of -- it may be that 44 Q. 8 I have got the wrong end of the stick, that it may have been an oversight, the confidential recipient is 9 10 abolished, he played a key role in feeding back, 11 · 04 11 keeping the person informed, that office is abolished 12 and there's no real mechanism then put in place to keep 13 the person informed, certainly until much later?
- A. I think there was, but I couldn't -- I can't give you
 the dates for it but I think Chief Superintendent

 McLoughlin at some stage was appointed to have
 oversight of confidential reporting, but that may have
 been at a later point in time. I can't assist you with
 the dates, I'm sorry.
- 20 45 Q. So far as you are concerned, it may well be that after 11:04
 21 July for a period there was in fact no formal channel
 22 for feedback?
- A. But equally, I can't say that there wasn't. I can't
 say that there was but equally I can't say there
 wasn't, because I believe that Chief Superintendent
 McLoughlin had a role in it at that point in time.
- 27 46 Q. Yesterday, when you were being asked questions about it 28 by Ms. McGrath, you went on to speak about -- if we can 29 call up the transcript, it's Day 135, it's yesterday,

Т			page 57, you were asked about risks, the risk	
2			assessment?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	47	Q.	Do you remember that? I think it's page 57, if we can	
5			go to that, please. So line 22:	11:05
6				
7			"That is effectively a similar situation, where the	
8			feedback provisions continued, is that right?	
9			A. Yeah, it seems to be, yes.	
10			Q. Okay. At 7.12: The protected disclosure	11:06
11			disclosures manager shall be aware of any risks	
12			associated with the disclosure and document any risks	
13			identified by the worker maybe making the disclosure."	
14				
15			Is that right? Do you see that?	11:06
16		Α.	Yes, I see that there, yes.	
17	48	Q.	So here, on the basis of that, the intention was that	
18			it would be the protected disclosure manager who would	
19			entertain that role as the channel of feedback, the	
20			link man, with the person who had made the disclosure,	11:06
21			is that right? Well, that's what it seems to be	
22			saying?	
23		Α.	Can I just read that again, if you don't mind?	
24	49	Q.	Yes, of course. If Mr. Kavanagh can move it back up.	
25			CHAIRMAN: What is this document, Mr. Kelly.	11:06
26			MR. KELLY: My understanding is that this is a new	
27			CHAIRMAN: Is this the 2017 document we're talking	
28			about?	
29			MR. KELLY: That is what I am unclear about.	

1			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Is that right, Ms. McGrath? Is this	
2			the 2017 document?	
3			MS. McGRATH: Sorry, we were just looking for something	
4			else there in the papers. What page is Mr. Kelly	
5			talking about?	11:07
6			CHAIRMAN: He is looking at Day 135, page 57 and there	
7			is a 7.12, but I don't have it in front of me and I'm	
8			not sure	
9			MS. McGRATH: Yes, those paragraphs refer to the 2017	
10			document.	11:07
11	50	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The 2017 document. But if I may just	
12			intervene for just one moment. Mr. Kelly is exploring	
13			the feedback situation that existed after the	
14			termination of the confidential recipient office. So	
15			2007 we had Judge McMahon and his little office and the	11:08
16			feedback was supposed to go through him and as far as	
17			we know did go through him, because he went back to the	
18			Commissioner and so on. But when he stopped, and that	
19			was in July 2014, and this is just as far as you are	
20			aware, detective superintendent, as far as you're	11:08
21			aware, was there any a system, a formal system, if you	
22			like, a system in place for feedback?	
23		Α.	Yes, Chairman, I thought Chief Superintendent	
24			McLoughlin may have been appointed at that stage, but	
25			I'm not certain. He was appointed at some stage.	11:08
26	51	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand.	
27		Α.	I don't know whether it was	
28	52	Q.	CHAIRMAN: We know that down the road, because we're	
29			going to hear from Chief Superintendent McLoughlin and	

Τ			we know what he is going to say, but from the point of	
2			view of a formal system in place, am I understanding	
3			that as far as you're aware there wasn't a formal	
4			system in place?	
5		Α.	If Chief Superintendent McLoughlin was appointed at	11:09
6			that point in time, that would have been the formal	
7			system.	
8	53	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So it depends, if Chief	
9			Superintendent McLoughlin as the PD manager was in	
10			place, then your understanding is that he would have	11:09
11			had obligations in regard to feedback?	
12		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
13	54	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So the question then depends on whether he	
14			was appointed or not appointed and when he was	
15			appointed?	11:09
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	55	Q.	CHAIRMAN: If he wasn't appointed for a time, then	
18			Mr. Kelly is correct, there was a gap in which there	
19			was not a formal system in place?	
20		Α.	I accept that.	11:09
21			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Sorry, Mr. Kelly, but I think that	
22			that was implicit in your questions and I am glad you	
23			have clarified that.	
24			MR. KELLY: Yes, thank you, Chairman. I was just	
25			simply exploring it, because as it stands at the moment	11:10
26			there is a gap. I may be wrong about that, I may be	
27			right.	
28			CHAIRMAN: Well, we have now clarified on what it is	
29			appears to depend.	

1			MR. KELLY: That's right.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
3	56	Q.	MR. KELLY: Also, just whilst we have that up there,	
4			looking at the protected disclosure manager, aware of	
5			the risks associated with the disclosure, any risks	11:10
6			identified by the disclosure. So there is a clear	
7			organisational recognition there, isn't there, for the	
8			person making the disclosure, there may well be risks?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	57	Q.	Yes. And the organisation there is saying well, look,	11:10
11			how do we document those and deal with them, is that	
12			right?	
13		Α.	We're talking about line 27?	
14	58	Q.	Well, I am getting at the intention of that, I assume	
15			that that is what it's trying to say.	11:11
16				
17			" shall be aware of the risks associated with the	
18			disclosure and any risks identified by the worker	
19			making the disclosure."	
20				11:11
21			I'm asking you, am I right in thinking that that was	
22			the organisation saying, look, there probably are risks	
23			here, we better document them, identify them, so we can	
24			deal with them.	
25		Α.	That's certainly an interpretation that could be put on	11:11
26			that, yes.	
27	59	Q.	What other interpretation could be put on it?	
28		Α.	<pre>well, it uses the word "shall" so "the protected</pre>	
29			disclosure manager shall be aware of any risks	

1			associated with the disclosure" so that is putting an	
2			onus to my reading, my interpretation of that is,	
3			it's putting an onus on the protected disclosure	
4			manager to be aware of the risks, to be aware of the	
5			risks.	11:11
6	60	Q.	It is saying do a risk assessment?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	61	Q.	Yes. But then it goes on to say?	
9				
10			"the risks identified by the worker."	11:11
11				
12			So is the emphasis upon actually carrying out a risk	
13			assessment upon the person making the disclosure?	
14			CHAIRMAN: Just go down a tiny bit, Peter, so we can	
15			see the next line. Thanks very much.	11:12
16		Α.	Would it be possible to see the full paragraph	
17			together?	
18			CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, yes. There is only one word	
19			missing. I thought there was more. So Peter, just	
20			roll up. Hold on, top there. "Disclosure" is the word	11:12
21			missing.	
22	62	Q.	MR. KELLY: Yeah. "With the disclosure and document	
23			any risks identified by the worker making the	
24			di scl osure. "	
25		Α.	Yes, that is placing the obligation on the protected	11:12
26			disclosures manager to make himself aware of any risks	
27			and any risks that he sees I would read it as any	
28			risks that he sees and any risks as disclosed by the	
29			discloser himself.	

1	63	Q.	Okay. It would be wrong of me then to read that as	
2			meaning it's for the protected disclosure manager to	
3			speak to the person who has made the disclosure, hear	
4			what he has got to say and then he, the protected	
5			disclosure manager, to make a risk assessment. To say	11:13
6			to himself, look, what are the risks here? Is that	
7			really what it's saying?	
8		Α.	Yeah, I don't believe it would be wrong of you to say	
9			that.	
10	64	Q.	Yeah.	11:13
11		Α.	That is an interpretation certainly, yes.	
12	65	Q.	And it's not to be construed as placing the onus upon	
13			the person who is making the disclosure to actually	
14			identify all the risks that there might be in making	
15			that disclosure?	11:13
16		Α.	No. If anything, it's on the protected disclosure	
17			manager, yes.	
18	66	Q.	All right. If I can just turn up, if I can please,	
19			page 1081, which I think is in Volume 38.	
20			CHAIRMAN: 10831, is that what you said, Mr. Kelly.	11:14
21			MR. KELLY: My note says 1081.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I misheard. Thank you.	
23			MR. KELLY: I hope that is the page. This is one where	
24			Chief Superintendent Curran I think this is from	
25			your diary, isn't it? Is this from your diary?	11:14
26		Α.	No, it's not, no.	

67 Q.

27

28

29

Go on down. Sorry, I must have gotten that wrong. The

the formal appointment to be made by the Commissioner's

one I am asking for is where Mr. Ó Cualáin asked for

1	office	in	respect	of	the	criminal	and	disciplinary

- 2 aspects of the investigation?
- 3 Α. Yes.
- 68 You understand what I am asking about? 4 0.
- 5 Yes, I do, yeah. Α.
- 6 69 Now, that was, we dealt with it yesterday, made on 8th Q. 7 May 2015, around about then?

11:15

11:16

- 8 I haven't it in front of me but I accept what you are Α. 9 saying, yes.
- Okay. What I am just curious about is, so Ó Cualáin 10 70 Q. 11 · 15 11 had been conducting an investigation, I think by August '15 that was completed, is that right, that is roughly 12
- 13 about right I think?
- 14 Α. Yes, roughly.
- 15 71 Okay. At the end of it is asking for a formal Q. 11:16 16 appointment to be made in respect of two things; one, 17 the criminal aspects and two, the disciplinary aspects,
- 18 to have an investigation in respect of those, is that 19 right?
- That's correct. 20 Α.

25

- So what had he been doing in the intervening 14, 15, 16 21 72 Q. 22 months, if not investigating those aspects?
- 23 I think my evidence yesterday was that in relation to Α. 24 that, he was talking about a different member of An
- Garda Síochána at this point in time. A garda who had 26 been identified by Garda Keogh in his disclosure.
- 27 got to a stage of the investigation where he felt there
- 28 may be a case against this other garda.
- 29 I understand you now. That is the one we know as Garda 73 Q.

Τ			A?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, say that again, Mr. Kelly.	
4			MR. KELLY: That's the person we know as Garda A.	
5			CHAIRMAN: No.	11:17
6			MR. KELLY: Is it not?	
7			CHAIRMAN: No. It's a new garda who had as I	
8			understand, and I am glad to have this opportunity,	
9			because it will be cleared up. As I understand,	
10			Detective Superintendent Walsh gave evidence yesterday	11:17
11			that Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin requested	
12			criminal and disciplinary authority in respect of a	
13			garda not previously the subject of investigation, who	
14			had not been previously investigated and they were not	
15			investigating in the course of their protected	11:18
16			disclosure investigation. That investigation threw up	
17			a possible case of either criminality or disciplinary	
18			breach by a Garda X, let's say. Am I understanding	
19			that correct?	
20		Α.	Correct.	11:18
21	74	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I will stop using sequential things, but a	
22			Garda X and he said, we better look into this?	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	75	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So that's what he was doing. Now that's my	
25			understanding of it, Mr. Kelly, it doesn't mean it's	11:18
26			right and obviously the assistant commissioner will be	
27			giving evidence. But that's what I thought. Is that	
28			what you meant?	
29		Δ	Ves that is my understanding of what we were being	

1		asked.	
2		CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you.	
3	76 Q.	MR. KELLY: You told us yesterday that the	
4		MR. DIGNAM: Sorry, Chairman, I wonder if I might	
5		intervene.	11:18
6		CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. Dignam.	
7		MR. DIGNAM: Just so that we don't all go off on the	
8		wrong tangent, Judge, I have taken instructions from	
9		former Commissioner Ó Cualáin, and in fact that does	
10		refer to Garda A. That will be his evidence when he	11:19
11		gives evidence.	
12		CHAIRMAN: well, Mr. Kelly was absolutely right and I	
13		was incorrect and it appears that the witness is	
14		incorrect in his recollection because that appears to	
15		be the situation. In defence, I understood correctly	11:19
16		what the witness said, it now appears that Mr. Kelly	
17		was absolutely right and it is Garda A who was	
18		involved. So thank you very much, Mr. Kelly. That's	
19		the advantage of raising these things and discovering	
20		where we stand. Thank you very much.	11:19
21		MS. McGRATH: I wonder if we could put maybe the letter	
22		up just again, so the witness can see it, the 8th May,	
23		if that's the one at issue.	
24		CHAIRMAN: It's 8th May 2015.	
25		MS. McGRATH: It's at 10881, if that just helps	11:19
26		anybody.	
27		CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
28		MS. McGRATH: so 10881.	
29		MR. KELLY: Just scroll down, Mr. Kavanagh, to see the	

1			date on that. Just go down to check the date on the	
2			screen. Right, it's the 8th. Okay. We know that it's	
3			from Mr. Ó Cualáin.	
4				
5			"I refer to the above correspondence."	11:20
6				
7			Yeah, it's perfectly plain there.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
9	77	Q.	MR. KELLY:	
10				11:20
11			"The confidential reporter in this matter has made	
12			serious allegations surrounding Garda activities in the	
13			Athlone district and has named individual gardaí and	
14			management as being complicit in areas of malpractice.	
15			The allegations in the main are made against a serving	11:20
16			member, Garda A, in the drugs unit Athlone."	
17				
18			He then goes on to say	
19			CHAIRMAN: Absolutely right, yes.	
20			MR. KELLY: So that's clear. We are clear on that.	11:21
21		Α.	Sorry, Chairman, if I may.	
22	78	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
23		Α.	And I may be still incorrect.	
24	79	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It's okay, yeah. Your understanding was	
25			different from that.	11:21
26		Α.	But my understanding remains.	
27	80	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
28		Α.	The allegations in the main are made against a serving	
29			member, Garda A, in the drugs unit Athlone station,	

- this is not the member who made the protected
- 2 disclosure.
- 3 CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 4 A. That is my reading of this, and remains my reading of
- 5 this.
- 6 81 Q. MR. KELLY: If it's of any -- I agree with you, I think

11:21

11:21

- 7 that's right, it's not Nick Keogh.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 82 Q. We're agreed on that.
- 10 A. That's the point I am making, that this was another
- 11 guard.
- 12 83 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you also think it wasn't Garda A.
- 13 A. I'm not quite sure who Garda A is.
- 14 84 Q. CHAIRMAN: "The allegations in the main", we will get
- this sorted out ultimately. Mr. Kelly's question
- 16 really should be directed to Assistant Commissioner Ó
- 17 Cualáin. Either this is a request for an investigation
- of Garda A or it's a request for an investigation of
- 19 another garda, we will call Garda X. Your
- 20 understanding was that it was a request for an
- investigation, criminal and disciplinary, in respect of
- another garda, Garda X. That was your understanding,
- is that correct?
- 24 A. Yes, I am just not sure --
- 25 85 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, but what your understanding was and what 11:22
- 26 your evidence was yesterday?
- 27 A. Yes, I believe I knew who Garda A was in this.
- 28 86 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you knew who Garda X was, did you? It
- doesn't matter.

1			MR. KELLY: I have a simple solution. I am going to	
2			pass you a piece of paper.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
4	87	Q.	MR. KELLY: We will pass it over, which just simply has	
5			the name of the person I understand to be Garda A. I	11:22
6			am not going to ask you to read it out, I am going to	
7			ask you to look at it and see if we are talking about	
8			the same person.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
10				11:23
11			PAPER HANDED TO THE WITNESS	
12				
13		Α.	Yes, that's who I believe we're talking about.	
14	88	Q.	MR. KELLY: Right, we are all agreed it's Garda A.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Anyway, carry on, Mr. Kelly, and we will	11:23
16			see, all will become clear in the end.	
17	89	Q.	MR. KELLY: Yeah. So a year later, he has been	
18			investigating, a year later he comes back and says,	
19			look, I think there is something here against Garda A,	
20			and he wants these two aspects done, is that right?	11:23
21		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
22	90	Q.	Initially when this came through the Commissioner's	
23			office, the 9th May, this was pointed at you making	
24			and you made a request for a report, we dealt with that	
25			yesterday, you point at him and say, we want a report	11:23
26			by the 9th June?	
27		Α.	That's correct.	
28	91	Q.	I think what you said yesterday was that it wasn't that	

you were actually expecting it within a month but it

- was just simply so that it would come up on the system?
- 2 A. Yes, it was just a reminder, yes.
- 3 92 Q. How long were you expecting it to take?
- 4 A. It's difficult with an investigation. Any criminal
- 5 investigation is very difficult to put a timeline on

11:24

11:25

- 6 it. They can be quite complex. This one was quite
- 7 complex. It would be unfair of me to put a timeline on
- 8 an investigation. I really couldn't. You would
- 9 certainly hope it would be done within a year. But,
- 10 you know, a smaller investigation could be done within
- a matter of weeks, larger investigations have been
- 12 known to carry on for several years.
- 13 93 Q. How long have you been in the office in total
- 14 performing this role?
- 15 A. I was there since February 2012.
- 16 94 Q. Through to what, '17, was it?
- 17 A. To '16, July '16.
- 18 95 Q. '16. So you would have seen a range of time it took to
- 19 undertake investigations?
- 20 A. Yes. Sorry, I should say I was previously in the
- office in a different rank a number of years previously
- 22 also.
- 23 96 Q. I see. But what we do in fact know is that this
- investigation went on until 11th August '15. That was
- when Mr. Ó Cualáin said, look, I will be sending my
- report to the DPP within a month?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 97 Q. Do you remember that?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 98 1 We know from the papers, it's not necessary to call it Q. 2 up, but I think it is page 10945, that the report from Mr. Mulcahy went to the DPP on 3rd September 2015. 3 That is 16 months later, that's right, isn't it? 4 5 That's correct. Α. 11:25 6 CHAI RMAN: Are those dates correct? I mean, it's not 7 vital. I thought the Ó Cualáin report was completed on 8 24th November 2015. Maybe I am wrong. That's correct, Chairman. 9 MS. McGRATH: The dates are not vital. 10 CHAI RMAN: 11:26 11 MR. KELLY: I hope I am told, Chairman, that are you right. Okav. 12 13 Gratifying. That's gratifying. CHAI RMAN: 14 MR. KELLY: It was November, the report goes off to the DPP. That's what, 17 months or thereabouts later, 17 15 11:26 16 or 18 months later. I will just ask you a direct, 17 blunt question: Why did it take so long? 18 It's a complex investigation. I can't either defend or Α. 19 criticise. 20 99 I know. Q. 11:26 It's not for me. I don't know, but it would have been 21 Α. 22 a very and very complex investigation with a lot of 23 strands to it and I can well understand how -- I think 24 we heard in evidence yesterday of how long it took for 25 the initial statement from Garda Keogh, it took several 11:27 hours. I believe there was a huge number of pages in 26
- 28 100 Q. I accept entirely your position, you weren't the investigating officer?

it. I haven't seen it, so...

27

Т		Α.	res.	
2	101	Q.	I was merely asking whether you have any view on it.	
3			You say it was a complex investigation?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	102	Q.	I can explore that elsewhere, that's fine. You will be	11:27
6			pleased to know that is all the questions I have for	
7			you. Thank you very much.	
8			THE WITNESS: Thank you.	
9				
10			END OF EXAMINATION	11:27
11				
12			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Now, Mr. Dignam, have	
13			you any questions?	
14			MR. DIGNAM: Yes, Chairman, I just have a few brief	
15			areas I want to cover.	11:27
16			CHAIRMAN: That is all right, no problem, I am just	
17			checking.	
18			MR. DIGNAM: Thank you, Chairman.	
19				
20			DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT FRANK WALSH WAS EXAMINED BY	11:27
21			MR. DI GNAM, AS FOLLOWS:	
22				
23	103	Q.	MR. DIGNAM: Detective Superintendent walsh, just in	
24			relation to, you were asked a number of questions about	
25			the interpretation of the policy that was opened up	11:28
26			yesterday. I think Ms. McGrath brought you back to	
27			that this morning, to point out that it appears that	
28			that was a 2017 policy?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 104 Q. You finished, as you just told Mr. Kelly there, you
 2 finished in the Commissioner's office in 2016; is that
 3 right?
- 4 A. That's correct, July '16.
- 5 105 Q. Can I take it that that was the end of your dealings
 6 with the confidential reporting or protected
- 7 disclosures?
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 106 Q. You were asked then in that context about formal
 10 feedback mechanisms and those questions were put to you 11:28
 11 by Mr. Kelly in the context of the framework of that
 12 2017 policy?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 107 Q. But if I can just ask you about your understanding of 15 what feedback was going on with Garda Keogh during the 11:28 16 course of this investigation and when doing that, I 17 also want to ask you about what information you had in 18 relation to Garda Keogh's welfare being looked after 19 and what updates you were getting in relation to the 20 investigation. Now, that's a long way of introducing a 11:29 topic, detective superintendent. But firstly, was it 21 22 your understanding that that the investigation team that had been appointed i.e. headed up by Assistant 23 24 Commissioner Ó Cualáin, were in contact with Garda 25 Keogh during the course of your investigation? 11 . 29
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 108 Q. Was it your understanding that they were attending to 28 his welfare? Is that your understanding?
- 29 A. Yes, it was.

- 1 109 Q. And was it your understanding that they were giving
 2 updates in relation to where the investigation stood at
 3 particular points in time?
- 4 A. Yes, that's correct.
- Now, I don't want to open up the documents to any great 11:29 length, detective superintendent, but if I could just

- 7 ask Mr. Kavanagh to open the document at page 10797.
- This is a letter from Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin to you, dated, I think it's either the 10th or 16th
- June, I think it's probably 16th June 2014. This
- appears to be the first update that the Commissioner's
- office through to you received in relation to the
- investigation; is that right?
- 14 A. Yes.

17

- 15 111 Q. Yes. And at the end of that, at the bottom of the last 11:30 paragraph, there is a sentence:
- "During the course of interview the confidential
 reporter was advised of the services available from the
 employment assistance officer."
- 21 A. That's correct.
- 22 112 Q. You remember seeing that?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 113 Q. Can we take it then that that was your understanding of
 25 the interaction between the investigation team and 11:31
- Garda Keogh in relation to his welfare at that stage?
- 27 A. That's correct, yes.
- 28 114 Q. If I can then ask you to go, Mr. Kavanagh, to open page 29 10827. The Chairman saw all of these yesterday, so I

Т			am not going to go into them in any detail, threi	
2			superintendent. The document at page 10827 is a letter	
3			from you to Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin dated 27th	
4			November 2014. It seems to have followed on from a	
5			newspaper article which appeared in the Daily Mirror in	11:31
6			which Garda Keogh appears to have been recorded as	
7			making some complaints or raising concerns. You, in	
8			the middle paragraph, asked, or stated that:	
9				
10			"The Commissioner directs that immediate contact is	11:32
11			made with Garda Keogh to establish the problems he is	
12			experiencing. He should be reassured that he will not	
13			be subject to any form of harassment and will be	
14			treated with dignity and respect in the workplace.	
15				11:32
16			It is noted from the previous update, supplied 16th	
17			June 2014, that Garda Keogh was advised of the services	
18			of the employment assistance officers."	
19				
20			That last sentence there is a reference back to the	11:32
21			update that you got on the 16th June?	
22		Α.	That's correct.	
23	115	Q.	Can I just ask you about that middle paragraph?	
24			Firstly, can the Chairman take it that obviously An	
25			Garda Síochána is a hierarchical structure, where	11:32
26			directions are issued and the actions that are directed	
27			are performed by people down the line, is that correct?	
28		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
29	116	Q.	Where it's recorded that the Commissioner directs that	

Τ			immediate contact is made with Garda Keogh, can I take	
2			it that's a direction, as it says, of the Commissioner	
3			to the investigation team headed by Assistant	
4			Commissioner Ó Cualáin that contact be made with Garda	
5			Keogh to explore the issues that featured in the	11:33
6			article and to ask in relation to his to reassure	
7			him in relation to his welfare and dignity?	
8		Α.	That's correct.	
9	117	Q.	Can I then ask you to look at page 10836. So your	
10			letter that I just opened is 27th November 2014, the	11:33
11			document at 10836, you wouldn't have been aware, I take	
12			it, at the time, but you have probably seen it in the	
13			Tribunal papers, which is a note from the assistant	
14			commissioner to Detective Superintendent Mulcahy,	
15			bringing your correspondence to Detective	11:34
16			Superintendent Mulcahy's attention and directing that	
17			the actions which were directed by the Commissioner be	
18			carried out by Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. Then,	
19			at page 10832 is a letter or a report of 12th December	
20			2014, again which you probably didn't see at the time,	11:34
21			which is Detective Superintendent Mulcahy's report back	
22			to the assistant commissioner on foot of the direction	
23			which was issued. Then could I bring you up to a	
24			document which you received, which is the document at	
25			10834.	11:34
26				
27			Now, this is a letter from the assistant commissioner	
28			to you and it refers back to your memo or letter of the	

27th November and Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin

Τ	says:	
2		
3	"I wish to confirm that Detective Superintendent	
4	Mulcahy accompanied by detective Inspector Coppinger	
5	met the confidential reporter as directed by the	11:35
6	Commi ssi oner."	
7		
8	The Chairman will hear evidence from both of those	
9	gentlemen later on today or tomorrow and they can deal	
LO	with the actual substance of the conversation. But it	11:35
L1	records:	
L2		
L3	"The confidential reporter stated that he had issues	
L4	with this investigation and was satisfied with	
L5	progress. He further indicated that he felt he was	11:35
L6	harassed by senior management in Mullingar for the	
L7	following reasons."	
L8		
L9	It sets out the three reasons. Then it goes on to say:	
20		11:35
21	"The confidential reporter has stated that he lodged a	
22	complaint with GSOC in respect of that alleged	
23	harassment. He was of the understanding that GSOC will	
24	investigate this aspect of his complaint on the	
25	termination/conclusion of this investigation. He was	11:35
26	assured that the current investigation will proceed to	
27	determine an outcome to his allegations and that he	
28	would be treated with dignity and respect in this	
99	determination. He was also informed that if he felt he	

Т			was being harassed to report the matter immediately."	
2				
3			Now, is that the action, your understanding, is that	
4			the action that was being directed on 27th November	
5			2014?	11:36
6		Α.	Yes, it is.	
7	118	Q.	And when you received that, were you satisfied that the	
8			action which had been directed by the Commissioner	
9			through your report had been implemented or carried	
10			out?	11:36
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	119	Q.	Now, if I could then ask you just to turn briefly to	
13			the document at page 10851. This is a report of the	
14			1st April 2015, so now we have moved on four months,	
15			from Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin to you. It	11:36
16			arrived on the same day. In fact, it's dated the same	
17			day as a report which gave an update of the actual	
18			investigative steps that are taken, but this document	
19			deals with the interactions with the investigation team	
20			and Garda Keogh in relation to welfare. You will see	11:37
21			in the second paragraph first of all, do you	
22			remember receiving this letter?	
23		Α.	I do, yes.	
24	120	Q.	You will see in the second paragraph:	
25				11:37
26			"By way of additional information, I wish to inform you	
27			that Detective Superintendent Mulcahy has been in	
28			regular contact with the confidential reporter both in	
29			person and on the phone. During all of these meetings	

1			and conversations with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	
2			has enquired about the confidential reporter's welfare	
3			and made him aware of all the services available to	
4			him, if required. The confidential reporter has	
5			consistently indicated that he does not want to engage	11:37
6			with any welfare services offered by An Garda	
7			Sí ochána. "	
8				
9			Now, in the final paragraph then Assistant Commissioner	
10			Ó Cualáin states:	11:38
11				
12			"With the investigation ongoing and further	
13			communications expected between Detective	
14			Superintendent Mulcahy and the confidential reporter, I	
15			have instructed Detective Superintendent Mulcahy to	11:38
16			ensure that any welfare issues highlighted will be	
17			communicated to local management for attention, as	
18			appropri ate. "	
19				
20			So you remember receiving that letter. When you	11:38
21			received that, did you consider that the investigation	
22			team were engaged with Garda Keogh in relation to	
23			welfare issues and attending to any welfare concerns	
24			that he might have?	
25		Α.	That would be my reading of that, yes.	11:38
26	121	Q.	Could I then ask you just to turn on a few pages, to	
27			page 10859. This is your letter back to the assistant	
28			commissioner. You seem to be on behalf of the	
29			Commissioner's office, seem to be satisfied that	

1			welfare issues were being attended to as between the	
2			investigation team and Garda Keogh, is that right?	
3		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
4	122	Q.	Yes. And I think that's reflected, we don't need to	
5			open it, but you wrote on the same day I think, at page	11:39
6			10860 and 10883, to GSOC and the Secretary General of	
7			the Department of Justice	
8		Α.	That's correct.	
9	123	Q.	in similar terms in relation to Garda Keogh's	
10			interactions with the investigation team?	11:39
11		Α.	That's correct.	
12	124	Q.	Now, can the Chairman take it, detective	
13			superintendent, that at that stage your understanding	
14			was that the investigation team, through Detective	
15			Superintendent Mulcahy, were in contact with Garda	11:40
16			Keogh and were ensuring and asking him about his	
17			welfare and ensuring that his welfare was being looked	
18			after and that Garda Keogh was declining the services	
19			of the employment assistance?	
20		Α.	That was our understanding at that time, yes.	11:40
21	125	Q.	Yes. I think you didn't know at that stage but you	
22			came to know later that in fact Garda Keogh then had a	
23			change of heart in or around April 2015 and sought the	
24			assistance of the employment assistance scheme, is that	
25			right?	11:40
26		Α.	That's correct.	
27	126	Q.	If I can just then finally ask you to look at page	
28			10945. It's a short covering letter from Assistant	
29			Commissioner Ó Cualáin dated 3rd September 2015, but	

Τ			forwarding to you a detailed report of Detective	
2			Superintendent Mulcahy. This is a two-page report, I	
3			don't propose to open it fully, detective	
4			superintendent. But, do you remember receiving that	
5			report from Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin?	11:41
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	127	Q.	That sets out, isn't it correct to say, that that sets	
8			out the details of the interactions and engagement	
9			between Detective Superintendent Mulcahy on behalf of	
10			the investigation team and Garda Keogh about his	11:41
11			welfare?	
12		Α.	Correct.	
13	128	Q.	Yes. In fact, that brought your information up-to-date	
14			in that over on the second page, on 10947, on the	
15			second paragraph, Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	11:42
16			writes:	
17				
18			"On the morning of 21st April 2015 I received a further	
19			text message from the confidential reporter which read	
20			'superintendent, I will accept welfare if you are still	11:42
21			offering'. I returned a text message to him stating I	
22			would call him later and at 9:42 hours I called him.	
23			In my opinion the reporter was once again under the	
24			influence of an intoxicant. I again discussed this	
25			welfare status with him and conveyed my concerns to	11:42
26			him. He then agreed that I make contact with the	
27			welfare services on his behalf. I subsequently called	
28			Garda Morgan Landy, welfare officer, southern region,	
29			on the confidential reporter's behalf. I outlined the	

			background of my request and darda Landy agreed to make	
2			contact with the confidential reporter."	
3				
4			Then he goes on to say that he informed the	
5			confidential reporter and Garda Keogh of that, that he	11:4:
6			then detective Superintendent Mulcahy called	
7			Sergeant Claire Malone of the Garda welfare service and	
8			made an official referral to her and then he	
9			understands that Garda Michael Quinn, whom the Chairman	
10			has heard from in evidence, was assigned to deal with	11:4
11			the referral, and then Garda Keogh and Garda Quinn had	
12			a close welfare relationship, lasting a considerable	
13			period of time. Is that your understanding?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	129	Q.	Now, taking all of that, Detective Superintendent	11:4
16			Walsh, were you satisfied that the issue of welfare	
17			that had been directed by the Commissioner to be	
18			attended to was being looked after by the investigation	
19			team?	
20		Α.	Yes, yeah. Sorry, I should probably say, it wasn't for	11:4
21			me to be satisfied.	
22	130	Q.	No, I appreciate that?	
23		Α.	I was merely the conduit, informing the Commissioner of	
24			progress updates.	
25	131	Q.	I take that point, but when you were receiving these	11:4
26			reports had you cause to raise any concerns about	
27			whether or not the Commissioner's directions were being	
28			implemented?	
29		Α.	No, I hadn't.	

1	132	Q.	Thank you.
2			
3			END OF EXAMINATION
4			
5			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Anybody else? Now, Ms. McGrath. 11:44
6			MS. McGRATH: I just want to clarify one or two matters
7			with the detective superintendent.
8			CHAIRMAN: Yes.
9			
10			DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT FRANK WALSH WAS RE-EXAMINED BY 11:44
11			MS. McGRATH, AS FOLLOWS:
12			
13	133	Q.	MS. McGRATH: Just in relation to an issue that was
14			raised by Mr. Kelly there in relation to the period of
15			the gap. Can I just ask you to just look I want to 11:44
16			clarify this to assist the Chairman. The regulations
17			there are at 7858, Mr. Kavanagh. This is the 2007
18			regulations. So you see there, it's the confidential
19			reporting of corruption or malpractice in 2007. Now,
20			can I ask then, the next document to go to and we 11:44
21			saw that yesterday, isn't that right?
22		Α.	Yes.
23	134	Q.	The next document, I want to follow a sequence and see
24			if we can clarify this, at 7843 please, Mr. Kavanagh.
25			Now, this is an HQ directive, 105/2008, and it's dated 11:45
26			4th July 2008. If you can just look at the section in
27			bold there:
28			

"Section 124 of An Garda Síochána Act 2005..."

1				
2			Now that's just a general provision which allows the	
3			Minister to make regulations; isn't that right?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	135	Q.	Okay.	11:45
6				
7			"The Garda Síochána confidential reporting of	
8			corruption and malpractice regulations 2007 and the	
9			confidential reporting charter."	
10				11:45
11			And it says:	
12				
13			"With the approval of the Minister for Justice,	
14			Equality and Law Reform, the Commissioner has	
15			established a confidential reporting charter. It is	11:45
16			established in order to provide guidelines and	
17			mechanisms and members of civilian staff of An Garda	
18			Síochána to report in confidence allegations of	
19			corruption or malpractice within An Garda Síochána.	
20				11:45
21			The charter has been developed in line with the Garda	
22			policy of encouraging ethical behaviour within An Garda	
23			Síochána and in compliance with the Garda Síochána	
24			reporting regulations of 2007."	
25				11:45
26			It goes on in the next paragraph, in bold, the second	
27			line there:	
28				
29			"The aim of the charter is to create an environment in	

1			which members and civilian staff members are encouraged	
2			to report incidents of corruption or malpractice."	
3				
4			Okay. So that's the HQ Directive that came down. Then	
5			we saw the charter, it is actually the following page,	11:46
6			Mr. Kavanagh, if you can go on. This is the charter.	
7			It says at the bottom in the box, it says:	
8				
9			"It is established in accordance with section 124 of	
10			the Garda Síochána Acts 2005-2007 and the Garda	11:46
11			Síochána regulations 2007."	
12				
13			That is confirmed on the next page by the then	
14			Commissioner Murphy at 7845. It has been developed in	
15			line with Garda policy. He goes on to say in the	11:46
16			middle of the paragraph:	
17				
18			"And in compliance with the 2007 regulations."	
19				
20			Now, to clarify this then, on 8th May 2007, that was	11:46
21			the structure that was in existence, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	That's correct.	
23	136	Q.	Okay. Now we also know that the Protected Disclosures	
24			Act of 2014 commenced on 15th July 2014?	
25		Α.	Correct.	11:47
26	137	Q.	Okay. Would you be aware, just having looked it up to	
27			confirm this position, under section 19(2) of the Act,	
28			the regulations were revoked, the 2007 regulations were	
29			expressly revoked?	

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 138 Q. Were you aware of that?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 139 Q. Now, in the light of the revocation of the regulations,
- 5 now they can be dealt with in legal submissions, what

11:47

11:47

- 6 impact that has on the charter, did the Commissioner's
- office issue any kind of direction in relation to what
- 8 was now going to be the charter or whether the charter
- 9 was to continue or what framework was continuing in
- 10 this intern period?
- 11 A. No, I don't believe there was any instruction issued.
- 12 There was a group set up to produce a new charter,
- because I was asked for input on that at that
- particular time. I don't know the date, but it was
- around the time that the new legislation came into
- being.
- 17 140 Q. Okay. So to your knowledge did any direction come out
- of the Commissioner's office in respect of the old
- 19 charter or the position of the old charter or what was
- going to be the position in the interim, before there
- 21 was a new policy?
- 22 A. From a policy perspective, I don't believe so. I think
- Judge McMahon mentioned yesterday that he had been in
- contact with the office and he wanted his name to be
- put on any documentation. So something would have gone 11:48
- out in relation to Judge McMahon being the -- possibly
- that's before the dates we're talking about, but that's
- the only thing I can remember that may have gone out
- 29 from the Commissioner's office in relation to the

- confidential reporting.
- 2 141 Q. So do you think Mr. Kelly might have been correct when 3 he put it to you that there was a gap then in the
- 4 process then at this stage, a gap in the framework for
- 5 these mechanisms?
- 6 A. Well, certainly the charter, that was my concern when I

11:49

11:49

11 · 49

- 7 was giving evidence yesterday, to see was there a date
- 8 on the new charter, because I think there certainly was
- 9 a gap as far as the charter was concerned. But we were
- very cognisant of the fact that the new legislation was 11:49
- in being and with the protocols outlined in the old
- 12 charter and taking cognisance of the new legislation,
- that's how we proceeded with any reports that we got in
- 14 the interim.
- 15 142 Q. We just haven't seen it in the disclosure papers, but
- did any direction to this effect go out to Assistant
- 17 Commissioner Ó Cualáin?
- 18 A. I don't believe so.
- 19 143 Q. Just again, I just had a look there, an issue arose as
- to when, first of all, Chief Superintendent McLoughlin
- came on board as the protected disclosures manager. I
- think that there's a statement from Mr. Alan Mulligan
- from HRM at page 3831 of the book and he says that he
- and Tony McLoughlin came on board as protected
- disclosures managers in May 2016. Would you have any
- reason to dispute that? So that is some time later,
- 27 May 2016.
- 28 A. No, I did say I couldn't recall the day. I did think
- there were -- well, I thought Tony McLoughlin was

1			appointed. Now that you mention it, I remember Alan	
2			Mulligan also, yes.	
3	144	Q.	In May 2016?	
4		Α.	Again, I don't remember the date, but I accept that	
5			that's what he says, that's right.	11:50
6	145	Q.	Okay. Then it would appear and also just listening to	
7			my Friend there this morning and our instructions, it	
8			would appear then the policy under the new Act does in	
9			the appear until early 2017, is that right?	
10		Α.	I am only going on the dates that I am told this	11:50
11			morning. I tried to find a date myself this morning	
12			for it but I couldn't. But I accept if it is dated	
13			'17, that is when it came out, yes.	
14	146	Q.	Okay. But you were gone from your position at that	
15			stage, isn't that right?	11:50
16		Α.	I was gone.	
17	147	Q.	Thank you, detective superintendent.	
18				
19			END OF EXAMINATION	
20				11:50
21			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, detective	
22			superintendent. You are free to go. Thank you very	
23			much.	
24				
25			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	11:51
26				
27			MR. McGUINNESS: The next witness, Chairman, is	
28			Detective Inspector Coppinger.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	

1				
2			DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER, HAVING BEEN	
3			SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS, AS	
4			FOLLOWS:	
5				11:51
6	148	Q.	THE WITNESS: Detective Inspector Michael Coppinger,	
7			Galway.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Thanks. Sit down, you're welcome, detective	
9			inspector.	
10	149	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Detective inspector could you just	11:51
11			outline your career to date to the Chairman?	
12		Α.	Chairman, I joined An Garda Síochána in May 1984, and	
13			after my initial period of training I was allocated to	
14			Dun Laoghaire in South County Dublin. While in Dun	
15			Laoghaire, I spent my time there in service in both	11:52
16			uniform, general uniform duties and, indeed, protection	
17			duties. We had a number of High Court Judges sitting	
18			there at the time, including on the Special Criminal	
19			Court and we also did some protection on those static	
20			posts. After about four years there I was seconded to	11:52
21			the detective branch as an aid to the detective branch	
22			and then after a number of years there, seven in total,	
23			I applied for and was successful in getting a posting	
24			to what was then the Central Detective Unit or the	
25			Serious Crime Squad in Harcourt Square. That would	11:52
26			later become the National Bureau of Criminal	
27			Investigation. I spent seven years there investigating	
28			murders and robberies around the city here in Dublin.	
29			I was then promoted back into uniform. I am from	

1 Galway, an opportunity arose and I went back to Galway, 2 initially to Gort and then into the units in Mill 3 Street. After sometime there I applied for a position as detective sergeant and again I was successful and I 4 5 was a detective sergeant in Galway for a number of 11:53 6 years, until I was promoted again to inspector and I 7 went on promotion to Letterkenny in County Donegal. 8 Then returned to Galway and I --9 150 What year was that, that you returned to Galway? Q. 10 CHAI RMAN: Approximate. Don't worry, the dates are 11:53 not --11 12 I'm approximately 13 years promoted inspector. Α. Okay. If you don't remember, the dates --13 151 CHAI RMAN: Q. 14 Α. I don't remember the exact date. 15 CHAI RMAN: We have it written down. So won't worry. 11:53 16 Just give us your own picture, if you like. 17 Yeah. Α. 18 CHAI RMAN: A word picture of your career to date, if 152 Q. 19 you like. Indeed. 20 Α. 11:53 21 153 CHAI RMAN: Just in broad terms. So you were in Donegal Q. 22 as an inspector. 23 A uniform inspector. Α. 24 CHAI RMAN: A uniform inspector. 154 Q. 25 Indeed. I returned after about a year from Donegal, I Α. 26 was then a inform inspector in Galway, presenting in 27 the District Court and supervision of the units. For

have been the detective inspector in Galway.

28

29

the last number of years, approximately six years, I

- 1 155 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you are still serving?
- 2 A. I am still serving.
- 3 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
- 4 156 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: When you moved back to Galway, who was

11:54

11:55

- 5 your divisional or district superintendent there?
- 6 A. The district superintendent when I came back from
- 7 Galway, there was some change, we had Superintendent
- 8 Martin Lee and Donal Ó Cualáin would have been the
- 9 chief superintendent.
- 10 157 Q. Did he become the assistant commissioner for the region 11:54
- then while you were there?
- 12 A. He was later promoted and he was assistant commissioner
- for the region, yes.
- 14 158 Q. And was he based in Galway?
- 15 A. He was based in Galway.
- 16 159 Q. Did you have any dealings with Superintendent Patrick
- 17 Murray?
- 18 A. I would have known Superintendent Murray, in that he
- 19 was the district officer in Gort, but I never was in
- 20 Gort when he was there, other than I knew he was the
- 21 superintendent there.
- 22 160 Q. Did you have any dealings with him?
- 23 A. I was involved in one investigation where I was the
- 24 SIO, an investigation in relation to a person who had
- reported that he had been kidnapped and went missing
- and we investigated that matter and it turned out to be
- 27 a false report.
- 28 161 Q. Yes. Did you know Superintendent McBrien or Chief
- 29 Superintendent Curran? Did you have any dealings with

Т			LNOSE?	
2		Α.	Other than Superintendent McBrien, I met her during the	
3			investigation that is currently the subject of this	
4			Tribunal.	
5	162	Q.	Yes. And any dealings with Chief Superintendent	11:55
6			Curran?	
7		Α.	Chief Superintendent Curran, I would know, he was the	
8			chief superintendent in Ennis, yeah.	
9	163	Q.	You were appointed, in any event, by Assistant	
10			Commissioner Ó Cualáin to assist in conducting an	11:55
11			investigation that he had been appointed to?	
12		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes.	
13	164	Q.	Is that correct? Could you just look at your letter of	
14			appointment at page 3973? That's headed down to you	
15			and Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. It's dated the	11:56
16			15th May. What was the next thing that occurred in the	
17			investigation then?	
18		Α.	well, we approached it like we would approach any	
19			investigation, criminal investigation. In that, we	
20			caused an incident room to be set up and when you set	11:56
21			up an incident room you appoint an IRC and you get an	
22			IRC, an incident room coordinator. We would have	
23			spoken with the assistant commissioner and we sought	
24			further input in relation to that. We would have	
25			looked Henry Burke, Detective Garda Henry Burke was the	11:56
26			incident room coordinator, and other individuals to	
27			carry out inquiries.	
28	165	Q.	Detective Superintendent Mulcahy says in his statement	
29			that the assistant commissioner briefed him and you on	

1			that investigation, do you recall that briefing?	
2		Α.	I recall Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin and Detective	
3			Superintendent Mulcahy relating a meeting they had with	
4			the confidential reporter and the concerns that he had	
5			outlined. I was not present at that meeting, I	11:57
6			understood it took place in Portumna Garda station.	
7	166	Q.	Perhaps I misunderstood the detective superintendent's	
8			statement, but he says in his statement that:	
9				
10			"On 15th May 2014 Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin	11:57
11			briefed both I and Inspector Michael Coppinger on the	
12			facts surrounding this report."	
13				
14			So that would appear, if he is correct, to be on the	
15			day that he made your appointment, that he briefed both	11:58
16			of you on the facts surrounding the report of the	
17			confidential reporter; is that correct?	
18		Α.	I would say it probably is. We would have had many	
19			meetings over the course of the investigation with	
20			Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin in relation to his	11:58
21			guidance and the progression of the investigation.	
22	167	Q.	Well, do you recall such a meeting where you were	
23			briefed?	
24		Α.	I don't recall it in particular but I do recall I do	
25			recall many conferences where the assistant	11:58
26			commissioner would have attended and the team would	
27			have met.	
28	168	Q.	Yes. Superintendent Mulcahy's notes for the 15th May	
29			are to be found at page 11309. It seems to record	

Τ			there at the bottom of the page:	
2				
3			"Met with AC Ó Cualáin and Detective Inspector Mick	
4			Coppinger re whistleblower Nicholas Keogh. Report	
5			required by the 6th June."	11:59
6				
7			So does that help you recall?	
8		Α.	I don't recall where the location was.	
9	169	Q.	It's most likely to have been in Galway?	
10		Α.	Most likely, yes.	11:59
11	170	Q.	But he is obviously cognisant, it would seem, of the	
12			date that the Commissioner had fixed for the receipt of	
13			a report by her, which was the 9th June, he is	
14			requiring you then to report by 6th June to him?	
15		Α.	That would appear from his note, yes.	11:59
16	171	Q.	The next entry in his notes is on the following page,	
17			at 11310, 23/5/14:	
18				
19			"Conference Oranmore re whistleblower Nicholas Keogh."	
20				11:59
21			Presumably that would have been with the team of the	
22			assisting	
23		Α.	Yes. The incident room to coordinate the investigation	
24			was set up in Oranmore Garda station for a number of	
25			reasons. One, there was actual space and it was, I	11:59
26			suppose, confidential in that we would meet there and	
27			nobody needed to know why we were there. It was	
28			convenient for the team, rather than bringing everybody	
29			into the city.	

- 1 172 Q. Okay. You did refer there a few moments ago to a
- 2 meeting that the assistant commissioner had with the
- 3 whistleblower Garda Keogh, isn't that correct?
- 4 A. I have a memory of being briefed in relation to that

12:00

12:00

12:01

- 5 meeting, yeah.
- 6 173 Q. But that's not one that you attended?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 174 Q. Is that the meeting of the 7th June?
- 9 A. That's correct. I was not at that meeting. I met
- 10 Garda Keogh, to the best of my recollection, on four
- occasions and until I met him yesterday morning, I
- 12 haven't met him since.
- 13 175 Q. Had you been kept informed that such a meeting had been
- 14 arranged prior to it taking place?
- 15 A. I'm not sure of the exact sequence, but I knew that
- there was arrangements made to meet him and to enquire
- into exactly what his issues were.
- 18 176 Q. Yes. Is there any reason that you know of why you
- weren't attending at that meeting?
- 20 A. I don't know.
- 21 177 Q. Detective Superintendent Mulcahy notes a conference on
- the 10th June and then a visit to Athlone and speaking
- to Garda Keogh and made arrangements for an
- interview/statement on Wednesday, 11/6/14 in Tullamore.
- You then attended at Garda Keogh's house on the next
- 26 day, isn't that correct?
- 27 A. I did, with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, that's
- correct, at his home in Tullamore, yes.
- 29 178 Q. I think you recorded the statement that he made in

- connection with that, which took place over a number of days, isn't that correct?
- A. That's correct. I took down his statement outlining
 the issues that he wished to have investigated or
 complained of in writing. It took all of three days,
 12:02
- 6 initially at his home in Tullamore and later in
- 7 Oranmore Garda station.
- 8 179 Q. Yes. Now, Detective Superintendent Mulcahy had noted
 9 in his diary for the 10th that he had made a request
 10 for the seizure of the mobile phone allocated to Garda 12:02
- 11 A. Were you aware of that on the 10th June?
- 12 A. I was.

- 13 180 Q. How did you become aware of that?
- A. Obviously following our discussions it was apparent
 that the phone, particularly this phone, was the phone
 being used by Garda A and it was also a phone used by
 the drug unit. It was clearly a priority to get
- 19 181 Q. Yes. It would appear, however, that Detective
 20 Superintendent Mulcahy had to go to Athlone on the 13th 12:03
 21 to seize the phone and the notebook. I think you
 22 accompanied him?

12:03

23 A. I recall the day, yes, I was with him, yeah.

possession of that phone.

24 182 Q. Just going back to the course of the taking of the 25 statement from Garda Keogh. I think he provided you 26 with material, including a warrant and information, 27 notes of interview, a statement of notes that he had 28 made in relation to an account given by another person, 29 isn't that correct?

1		Α.	That's correct. I think you're referring to his	
2			meeting in Galway.	
3	183	Q.	Yes.	
4		Α.	With a particular witness.	
5	184	Q.	We are not naming the person, obviously.	12:03
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	185	Q.	You handed those exhibits to Garda Walsh?	
8		Α.	That's correct, he was another one of the team, which	
9			is essential in any investigation; you appoint an	
10			exhibits officer to maintain continuity of exhibits.	12:03
11	186	Q.	So you resume the taking of the statement on the 13th	
12			and on the 18th and it was concluded on that date?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	187	Q.	Is it correct then that you only met Garda Keogh on one	
15			further occasion?	12:04
16		Α.	I recall myself and Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	
17			met him one evening in the interview room under the	
18			archway in Ballinasloe Garda station.	
19	188	Q.	Was that in December for the purpose of taking further	
20			statement?	12:04
21		Α.	I believe there were a number of reasons that we met	
22			him on that occasion. I think one was in relation to,	
23			he had some notes from John of God's I think that he	
24			was to hand over and also there were a few issues that	
25			required clarification with him.	12:04
26	189	Q.	Garda Keogh has recorded in his diary a number of	
27			concerns that he had during the course of the	
28			investigation that you were involved in. Were you made	

aware of those concerns?

29

1	Α.	During the progress of this investigation, Assistant	
2		Commissioner Ó Cualáin was very, very clear in his	
3		direction to us that Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	
4		would be appointed as a single point of contact and all	
5		contact with Garda Keogh was through the detective	12:0
6		superintendent.	

- 7 So is it the position that at no stage did Garda Keogh 190 Q. 8 write to you or phone you or vice versa, you never wrote to him or phoned him? 9
- Yes, as I already stated in my evidence, I met Garda 10 Α. 12:05 11 Keogh on four occasions; three in relation to taking 12 the statement, the fourth occasion was in Ballinasloe 13 and I met him yesterday morning. Other than that, I 14 have never spoken to Garda Keogh.
- 15 191 Can I just ask you to look at a number of letters that Q. 12:05 16 Garda Keogh wrote to Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, which expressed his concern about a number of different 17 18 matters. The first one is dated the 6th August, it's 19 to be found at page 324 of the Tribunal's papers. 20 Obviously this is addressed to Detective Superintendent 12:06 Do you recall seeing that letter?
- 22 I do recall seeing it and particularly later on when Α. myself and the incident coordinator were putting the 23 24 file together for the director, we would have gone 25 through all the papers.

Mulcahv.

21

But it raised an issue about the reluctance of 26 192 0. 27 witnesses to come forward to make statements, in particular where Garda A was on duty and not suspended. 28 29 was that something that Detective Superintendent

Τ			Mulcany discussed with you?	
2		Α.	I do recall, I do recall that concern being raised and	
3			I remember it being addressed at a conference and the	
4			direction I recall was that where possible, where at	
5			all possible statements would not be taken in a Garda	12:0
6			station. But that was not always possible.	
7	193	Q.	Well, it would appear that that letter gave rise to a	
8			meeting with Garda Keogh. That's not a meeting that	
9			you attended?	
10		Α.	No.	12:0
11	194	Q.	On the 13th August?	
12		Α.	No.	
13	195	Q.	There is a subsequent letter to be found at page 325 of	
14			the papers, dated the 7th September. Again it's	
15			addressed to Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and he	12:0
16			says:	
17				
18			"I have not heard anything from yourself or AC	
19			Ó Cualáin since our last meeting. I am wondering if	
20			there has been any progress with the investigation. I	12:0
21			ask if at all possible that the mobile phone records in	
22			particular from the period 2008-2010 be obtained as	
23			soon as possible as I believe much progress will be	
24			made and valuable information obtained and it should	
25			get together all the circumstantial evidence."	12:0
26				
27			Do you recall saying that?	
28		Α.	As I said earlier, I do recall seeing the letters, they	
29			weren't addressed to me but T do recall seeing them	

Т			rater when we were putting the fire together for the	
2			Director.	
3	196	Q.	You had caused the phone that Garda A had had in his	
4			possession to be seized?	
5		Α.	That's correct.	12:08
6	197	Q.	And you had handed that over?	
7		Α.	That's correct. It was handed over to the exhibits	
8			officer, Garda Barry Walsh. Garda Barry Walsh was also	
9			a telephone liaison officer. In other words, he was	
10			trained in the downloading of data from phones.	12:09
11	198	Q.	Yes. Superintendent Mulcahy in his statement has	
12			confirmed that a contact name, which was a shortened	
13			name for a person who we're referring to as Ms. B, was	
14			not in the contacts list on that phone?	
15		Α.	I am aware who you are referring to.	12:09
16	199	Q.	Yes.	
17		Α.	And that is the position.	
18	200	Q.	Yes. But Garda Keogh in his evidence has stated that	
19			he was told that the phone had been wiped, that there	
20			were no contacts on it; is that correct?	12:09
21		Α.	To my knowledge that's not correct, there was data on	
22			the phone, yes.	
23	201	Q.	Counsel for the Commissioner and Superintendent Mulcahy	
24			put it to him that there were numerous contacts on the	
25			phone and denied that he, Superintendent Mulcahy, had	12:09
26			ever said it had been wiped to Garda Keogh. Did you	
27			ever hear any reference to the phone being wiped?	
28		Α.	I didn't. I didn't hear that kind of language and I	
29			don't think it is possible for the TLO to be able to	

1			say that a phone is actually wiped. He can only say	
2			what's on it or what he downloaded. From my	
3			understanding there was still data on the phone.	
4	202	Q.	I think you took a number of investigative steps that	
5			are recorded in your statements that are appended to	12:1
6			your statement to the Tribunal, isn't that correct?	
7		Α.	That's correct. Those are the statements I would have	
8			made for the purposes of the preparation of the file	
9			for director, which was sent to the director and later	
10			to GSOC.	12:1
11	203	Q.	They're contemporaneous statements during the course of	
12			the investigation, isn't that correct?	
13		Α.	Correct.	
14	204	Q.	Amongst them are a record of your attempts to speak to	
15			Ms. B and obtain a statement from her, isn't that	12:1
16			correct?	
17		Α.	That's absolutely correct, yes.	
18	205	Q.	It would appear, subject to what you may say, that the	
19			first attempt made was in April of 2015?	
20		Α.	Correct, yes.	12:1
21	206	Q.	Is there any reason why that was the first occasion	
22			when a step was taken to obtain a statement from Ms. B?	
23		Α.	Well, clearly we were carrying out our inquiries and	
24			clearly she was identified as a potential witness which	
25			could assist the investigation. So our inquiries led	12:1
26			us to her during the course of investigation and that's	
27			when we deemed it prudent to approach her.	
28	207	Q.	Yes. All of those efforts at that point in time appear	
29			to have been concentrated in the month of April 2015?	

- 1 A. Yes, correct.
- 2 208 Q. I think summarising the outcome, it didn't prove
- possible to meet her and obtain a statement from her;
- 4 isn't that correct?
- 5 A. I would say, to say the least, she was uncooperative.

12.12

12:12

12:13

- 6 209 Q. It would appear at the same time that you were
- 7 intending to take statement from Garda A. Were those
- 8 two actions being coordinated at that point in time?
- 9 A. It was never our intention to, as you say, take a
- statement off Garda A, it was our intention to
- interview him.
- 12 210 Q. Yes.
- 13 A. Which is a very different matter.
- 14 211 Q. Yes. Garda Keogh, I think you will be aware, has been
- 15 critical of the conduct of the investigation in a
- number of respects. Are you familiar with the concerns
- 17 that he has raised?
- 18 A. I have heard that criticism being levelled, yes.
- 19 212 Q. Yes. Could I just ask you to respond to that, if you
- 20 wish to. One of the first concerns, which was raised
- both in correspondence and in a statement and is one of
- the issues that was raised by him, was a delay in
- commencing the investigation during which evidence
- 24 disappeared. Now, in terms of any delays that
- occurred, obviously there's a period from when
- Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin was appointed and the
- 27 first meeting with Garda Keogh on the 7th June. Are
- you aware as to any reason why a meeting or an inquiry
- or a statement from Garda Keogh wasn't taken in a

1			perhaps quicker period?	
2		Α.	I'm not, I'm not but in my own opinion I think that we	
3			moved very quickly to take his statement of complaint.	
4			He had prepared some of the work in his affidavit, so	
5			it was expanding on that affidavit.	12:14
6	213	Q.	Had you been aware prior to commencing the interview	
7			with Garda Keogh that he was attaching importance to	
8			the seizure of a phone?	
9		Α.	Well	
10	214	Q.	Material on a phone?	12:14
11		Α.	all investigators will always attach weight to a	
12			phone and contacts. We are in a time where phones are	
13			becoming more difficult. Certainly it would have been	
14			foremost on our mind and it was. My understanding of	
15			the way it unfolded was that Detective Superintendent	12:14
16			Mulcahy, in contact with the then district officer in	
17			Athlone, in order to have what was then a State phone	
18			taken possession of.	
19	215	Q.	Had you been aware from when you were appointed that	
20			the allegations concerned Garda A and that his use or	12:15
21			possession of the phone might be a significant issue at	
22			that point in time, or did you become aware of that at	
23			a later time?	
24		Α.	Well, for me personally I didn't become aware of a lot	
25			of matters until we sat down with Garda Keogh and	12:15
26			actually took the statement off him. He was clearly	
27			making very serious allegations surrounding the	
28			allegation between Garda A and a named witness.	

29 216 Q. Is that the first time that you became aware of any of

1 the	detail	of those	allegations?
-------	--------	----------	--------------

- A. Well, to that extent. I had a general understanding of what Garda Keogh was alleging was malpractice by a number of gardaí in Athlone.
- The suggestion made by Garda Keogh about there being a delay in seizing evidence during which mobile phone evidence was erased, would you like to say anything in connection with that or in response to that?

12:16

- First of all, I do not know if the phone, as you say, 9 Α. I don't have any evidence to say that it 10 11 was wiped. The critical period surrounding the 12 allegations being made were already downloaded by 13 telecoms in relation to an inquiry that the district officer in Athlone had carried out. And we were 14 15 subsequently able to recover that data, which did, 16 which did support Garda Keogh's suggestion that there 17 was a lot of contact between Garda A and a witness. 18 think some 1,600 contacts over a period.
- 19 218 Q. Are you referring to the billing records that have been 20 obtained?
- 21 A. I am, yes.
- 22 219 Q. Was it your understanding that they had been provided 23 by the telecom company on request at that point in 24 time?
- 25 A. They had been sought previously by the district officer 12:17 26 in Athlone.
- 27 220 Q. But in terms of any records that were sought for any 28 other period, were any other telecom data sought in 29 respect of the phone that was seized from Garda A, that

1			you're aware of?	
2		Α.	From memory, I don't remember, but I imagine we did	
3			apply, yes, I imagine we would have.	
4	221	Q.	The issue of the suspension of Garda A, were you	
5			involved in any way in any discussions considering	12:17
6			whether that was possible or appropriate at any point	
7			in time?	
8		Α.	Clearly that was a matter I suppose of ongoing	
9			attention but it clearly wouldn't have been a matter	
10			for me as I would have no authority to carry out that	12:18
11			function. It would have been a matter for the chief	
12			superintendent in his area in conjunction Garda	
13			headquarters and Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin.	
14	222	Q.	Yes. Garda Keogh wrote another letter to	
15			Superintendent Mulcahy on 17th October of 2014. That's	12:18
16			to be seen at page 326. Can you confirm whether you	
17			saw that at the time?	
18		Α.	Again, I did see all these letters, particularly	
19			surrounding putting the file together, and its content,	
20			yes.	12:19
21	223	Q.	One of the issues there is that the investigation team	
22			would not be permanently or a member wouldn't be	
23			permanently posted so close to Athlone. Did that	
24			reflect his concern about the taking of statements?	
25		Α.	My recollection of that is that he had a concern in	12:19
26			relation to one particular sergeant who was on the	
27			team. Now, that particular sergeant was a detective	
28			sergeant in Loughrea and I think it was his belief that	
29			he was because he had been stationed in Loughrea	

Т			that he was too crose to Athrone. That was my	
2			understanding of it.	
3	224	Q.	All right. In the second paragraph he informs	
4			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy that he had spoken to	
5			GSOC in relation to an attempt to manufacture	12:20
6			complaints against him. He refers later to the fact	
7			that:	
8				
9			"Since I last spoke to both yourself and GSOC the cabal	
10			has come at me from another angle in relation to a	12:20
11			Pulse check I carried out on the 18th May, which I have	
12			enclosed. I am not looking for you to do anything with	
13			that, I just want to make you aware of same."	
14				
15			Do you recall any discussion within the investigation	12:20
16			team about investigating complaints that were	
17			apparently being made against or in relation to Garda	
18			Keogh by his district or divisional officer?	
19		Α.	I don't and certainly our team didn't take any active	
20			part in investigating those complaints, because we had	12:20
21			our Terms of Reference initially, which basically	
22			followed the complaints being made by Garda Keogh in	
23			his statement of complaint. Those I would imagine were	
24			internal issues which he had with the then district	
25			officer.	12:21
26	225	Q.	There are two further letters to Detective	
27			Superintendent Mulcahy in December, at page 327 and	
28			328. We don't need to look at the first one, but if we	
29			go on to 328. The first one related to an apparent	

1			sighting by Garda A near Ms. B's house. It would	
2			appear from Detective Superintendent Mulcahy's	
3			statement that Garda Keogh believed that Garda A had	
4			obtained a copy of his statement at some stage. Can	
5			you just confirm what use was made of Garda Keogh's	12:21
6			statement to the investigation? Was it kept in the	
7			possession of the investigation?	
8		Α.	The original handwritten copy of Garda Keogh's	
9			statement wold have been at all times kept locked in	
10			the incident room in Athlone or sorry, in Oranmore.	12:22
11			It would have been typed for the purpose of the working	
12			file and it was not released to anybody, that I'm aware	
13			of.	
14	226	Q.	In the second letter here he refers to a Pulse	
15			incident. Towards the bottom of the page, in the	12:22
16			middle of the paragraph, he says:	
17				
18			"When I wrote in my last letter that you were	
19			thoroughly investigating this, I didn't realise that	
20			your team hadn't taken statements from"	12:22
21				
22			Two different persons there.	
23				
24			"Who are the most important witnesses. We are 8 months	
25			into this and I haven't seen anything positive yet. In	12:22
26			the event that somebody declines to make a statement, I	
27			ask that yourself and Detective Inspector Coppinger	
28			make statements confirming your conversations with"	
29				

1			A person there. Now, I think one of those persons is	
2			the person that Garda Keogh had met in Galway?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	227	Q.	Is that right?	
5		Α.	Yes.	12:23
6	228	Q.	I think in your statements that you attach to your	
7			statement to the Tribunal you go into all necessary	
8			detail about your attempts to get a statement from that	
9			person?	
10		Α.	That's correct. That particular witness had lived and	12:23
11			resided with a very important witness, referred to by	
12			Garda Keogh, in [address] in Athlone. He had since	
13			that time changed his life and had moved on to Galway	
14			and was working in Galway, and that's where we met him.	
15	229	Q.	I think you document a large number of attempts to meet	12:23
16			him and you eventually did meet him?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	230	Q.	You were not able to obtain a written statement from	
19			him confirming in substance what he had told Garda	
20			Keogh, isn't that correct?	12:24
21		Α.	That's correct. Certainly from our initial meetings	
22			myself and Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, we had	
23			some hope that he would come on board with the	
24			investigation. But having given him some time to	
25			consider the matter and gone back to him and gone back	12:24
26			to him, he declined to come on board with the	
27			investigation.	
28	231	Q.	In the final paragraph of this letter Garda Keogh	
29			states:	

1				
2			"The official State mobile phone involved in the	
3			conspiracy to supply heroin is vital. It is vital	
4			these phone records should be valuable primary	
5			evidence. I am worried that you have doubts as to	12:24
6			Ms. B being a heroin dealer. I wish to state that what	
7			went on was criminal and deceitful and the kind of	
8			stuff that Garda A would not have spoken about to his	
9			many friends in Garda management. State mobile phone	
10			plus [blank] equals case."	12:25
11				
12			He seems to have been re-emphasising the necessity to	
13			get a statement from the witness we have been	
14			previously discussing, isn't that correct?	
15		Α.	That's correct. The witness that we met in Galway	12:25
16			would have previously lived in Athlone with another key	
17			witness and he had been arrested and found in	
18			possession of heroin during operation Loki.	
19	232	Q.	Yes. One of the complaints made by Garda Keogh both in	
20			his correspondence to the DPP and the Minister and in	12:25
21			his statement to the Tribunal was that there was a	
22			failure to revisit a crucial witness who had come	
23			forward with vital information. But is it your	
24			evidence you took all steps possible to obtain a	
25			statement?	12:26
26		Α.	Absolutely.	
27	233	Q.	The interviews with Garda A were arranged in April	
28			2015?	
29		Α.	That's correct.	

- I think you did not provide Garda Keogh's statement but 1 234 Q. 2 a statement of allegations made in connection with
- 3 Garda A which were anonymised, is that correct?

Garda A at this point in time?

- That's correct. 4 Α.
- 5 235 One of Garda Keogh's complaints focuses on what he says 12:26 Q. 6 was a failure to arrest Garda A and question him in 7 custody obviously. Could you just explain the thinking 8 of the investigation team in relation to dealing with
- Yes. Certainly in relation to witness A, we had went 10 Α. 12.27 11 through the statements of complaint and the evidence we had and we set out a number of questions that we wished 12 13 addressed. We had obviously to afford witness A fair 14 procedure and natural justice, in that he would have to 15 be afforded prior to we interviewing him, because we 12:27 16 intended to interview him after caution. So he would 17 have to have been afforded an opportunity to speak with 18 his solicitor and, indeed, in relation to recent 19 judgments would have been allowed to have a solicitor 20 present.

12:27

12 . 28

21 236 Yes. Q.

9

- 22 So that was our thinking. Indeed, from my experience Α. 23 of carrying out criminal investigations, the only real 24 need to arrest anybody for the purpose of interviewing 25 them when they won't comply.
- 237 26 So is it your evidence that that was always an Q. Yes. 27 option if it had proved necessary to --
- Well, we never had to visit that because he was, to say 28 Α. 29 the least, most compliant, as was his solicitor.

- 1 238 Q. Well, could you just outline then how the process of 2 obtaining a statement or an interview with Garda A was 3 achieved?
- A. I think I have set it out there in my statement, in
 that we had a series of questions that we required
 addressing.
- 7 239 Q. Yes.
- A. Which basically set out the allegations being levelled against him. We would have met him with his solicitor in Oranmore Garda station, the date I just can't recall, but it's in my affidavit.
- 12 240 Q. The 24th April?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 241 Q. You met him again then on the 24th June?
- 15 A. Yes. And he had addressed those questions. I would 12:29
 16 have read over them to him and the caution and invited
 17 him to sign them. I would also have invited him to
 18 have conducted his questions and answers on camera.
- But that was declined by his solicitor. We had other issues to address with him and we formally carried out
- an interview with him, myself and Detective
- Superintendent Mulcahy, in the presence of his solicitor.
- 24 242 Q. Yes. I think the notes of that were signed?
- A. They were signed. They were read over to him and they 12:29
 were signed and were witnessed by myself and Detective
 Superintendent Mulcahy.
- 28 243 Q. Garda Keogh, he subsequently wrote again to Detective 29 Superintendent Mulcahy on the 1st July. If we could

Т			Took at that retter, page 333. This is rocusing on the	
2			phone again and it refers some several lines down to	
3			the unauthorised erasing of information from the said	
4			mobile phone SIM card is a form of criminal damage,	
5			theft. He is making the point there, in the second	12:30
6			paragraph, that:	
7				
8			"It can only have been done in an effort to obstruct	
9			gardaí appointed in the course of their duties."	
10				12:30
11			Is that something that you concerned yourself with in	
12			the investigation?	
13		Α.	Well, clearly we had the phone examined and I do not	
14			believe, from my own personal knowledge, that it is	
15			possible to show that data was erased. There was data	12:31
16			on the phone, I am aware there was data on the phone.	
17	244	Q.	He acknowledges, at the bottom there, that you have	
18			worked hard on this investigation and wishes to thank	
19			you for that. Were you ever aware of any accusation	
20			that the investigation was double-crossing him? He has	12:31
21			recorded an entry to that effect in his diary in July	
22			2014.	
23		Α.	Sorry?	
24	245	Q.	The investigation was double-crossing him?	
25		Α.	Double-crossing him?	12:31
26	246	Q.	Yes.	
27		Α.	I was not aware of that, no. And I would like to put	
28			it on the record of this Tribunal that I totally and	
29			utterly refute that allegation. I am actually	

1			surprised by that.	
2	247	Q.	Yes. It's recorded at page 1326, the 22nd July:	
3				
4			"I am fully aware at this stage that the investigation	
5			team is double-crossing me."	12:32
6		Α.	I am disappointed to hear that.	
7	248	Q.	Garda Keogh, in fairness, in evidence he wasn't able to	
8			explain on what basis he had recorded that at that	
9			point in time, but it's not something that was ever	
10			said to you, is that right?	12:32
11		Α.	No. And again, I am disappointed, because we always	
12			set out to do our very best to get to the bottom of the	
13			allegations that were being made by him.	
14	249	Q.	I think you became aware of Detective Superintendent	
15			Mulcahy obtaining confidential information in relation	12:33
16			to Ms. B in and around October 2015, isn't that right?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	250	Q.	I think you swore a warrant to ground an application	
19			you swore an information to ground applications for	
20			warrants?	12:33
21		Α.	Yes, both myself and Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	
22			attended the District Court and we obtained two	
23			warrants to search two specific addresses. One in	
24			[address] and another outside of Athlone.	
25	251	Q.	Yes. I think items were seized and sent for	12:33
26			examination?	
27		Α.	The basis of the confidential information or the kernel	
28			of that information stated that there was some	
29			electronic devices to be found in that property that	

1			could support the allegations being made by Garda	
2			Keogh. A large number of SIM cards, phones, laptops	
3			and electronic devices were seized and examined, but	
4			unfortunately they didn't progress the investigation.	
5	252	Q.	I think that Detective Superintendent Mulcahy retired	12:3
6			at a stage after the investigation had been completed?	
7		Α.	He did, yeah, and I'm sure will he answer this for	
8			himself, but he retired on age grounds. He served	
9			right up to his birthday.	
10	253	Q.	Yes. But I think you became aware of a statement that	12:3
11			had been provided in the context of a disciplinary	
12			inquiry being conducted by Assistant Commissioner	
13			McMahon?	
14		Α.	I did, yeah. I became aware of that through the normal	
15			reporting channels and it was brought to my attention,	12:3
16			yes.	
17	254	Q.	I think on foot of that, I think you acquired a copy of	
18			that statement that Ms. B had made?	
19		Α.	I did, yes.	
20	255	Q.	You outline in your statement, at page 3893, the steps	12:3
21			that you took from that point to try and get	
22			confirmation from Ms. B in the form of a statement in	
23			the course of a criminal inquiry?	
24		Α.	Yes. That's correct, yes. That statement, it was	
25			it set out very, very serious allegations that were the	12:3

26

27

28

29

subject of our investigation and it was confirming some

during the course of what was the disciplinary inquiry.

of those very serious allegations. But it was made

So, from my perspective, it was not a statement that

- 1 would hold any great weight in a criminal prosecution.
- 2 So as a result I set about again approaching that
- 3 witness.
- 4 256 Q. I think you made a number of attempts, which you
- document in that statement, to contact her and make an

12:36

12:37

- 6 appointment for the purpose of taking such a statement
- 7 if possible?
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 257 Q. Ultimately she referred you to her solicitor?
- 10 A. That's not correct, no.
- 11 258 Q. Is that not correct?
- 12 A. No. I called to her on a number of occasions and the
- reception, I didn't get much reception, to say the
- 14 least. The reception was quite hostile. And
- eventually I got contact with her daughter at the house 12:37
- and I asked her to contact me. She didn't make
- 17 contact. I went back on another occasion and again I
- had no luck. But I carried out enquiries following
- speaking with her daughter that she was on a course in
- 20 Athlone and from enquiries I carried out in Athlone
- that day, I established that she was on course. I went
- to that location and I seen her car parked in the car
- park. I was accompanied on that date by Inspector
- 24 Paudie O'Shea. In order to progress the matter, we
- waited for a considerable period, some hours actually,
- 26 until she returned to that car, so that I could make
- contact, because she was frustrating my meetings with
- 28 her.
- 29 259 Q. Yes.

- A. On that occasion she said she would wish to speak with her solicitor.
- 3 260 Q. Yes. I think you spoke with her solicitor, who told 4 you that he had consulted with her and that she would
- be making a statement through his office to the effect

12:38

12:38

12:39

- that his client did not want anything to do with the process, and that Gardaí had called to her house with
- guns and that she felt compelled to make a statement?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 261 Q. He confirmed that position in correspondence to you?
- 11 A. He did.
- 12 262 O. Isn't that correct?
- 13 A. He did. Mr. Gearoid Geraghty & Company, yes.
- 14 263 Q. And then that was followed by a statement to that effect and signed by her, is that correct?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 264 Q. I think you attempted to pursue the taking of a further 18 statement from a witness we've referred to earlier that 19 Garda Keogh had met in Galway on the 9th and 10th May?
- A. Correct. And having examined that statement that was
 made for the purpose of the disciplinary inquiry, again
 because of the content of it, it related to what was
 the destruction or the obstruction of a search and the
 getting rid of evidence and a particular person was key
 to that, that he had spoken with previously. So I
- thought it was only appropriate to afford him a new
- opportunity to come on board, to make a statement and
- to confirm or deny that it happened.
- 29 265 Q. He confirmed in a short written statement that he had

1 nothing to say in relation to those allegations in the 2 past? 3 Α. I think his words were something to the effect, and I did make a note, that that's a long time ago and that 4 5 he had moved on with his life and he wouldn't get 12:39 I did read the statement over to him and ask 6 involved. 7 him to comment. 8 266 Yes. I think you do say that he did sign the notes? Q. He did. 9 Α. 10 They were witnessed by yourself and Detective Sergeant 267 Q. 12:40 11 Burke? 12 Correct. Α. 13 You then I think attempted to progress the matter by 268 Q. 14 reverting back to Garda A's solicitor? 15 Mr. Dan O'Gorman, I think. Α. 12:40 September 2018, isn't that correct? 16 269 Q. 17 That's correct. Α. 18 You arranged through him an opportunity to interview 270 Q. 19 Garda A again under caution? 20 In the office of his solicitor in Limerick. Α. Correct. 12:40 In relation to the statement made by Ms. B in the 21 271 Q. 22 context of the disciplinary inquiry, isn't that 23 correct? 24 Correct. Α. 25 Garda A denied any wrongdoing? 272 Q. 12:40 26 Correct. Α. 27 273 I think arising out of the fact that Detective Q.

28

29

Superintendent Mulcahy had retired, you were, I

suppose, the senior member of the investigating team

Т			that had been appointed, you made a report to the	
2			director?	
3		Α.	I did. I deemed it appropriate, the fact that the	
4			original file which we referred to, Assistant	
5			Commissioner ó Cualáin's file, which had already been	12:41
6			submitted to the director, that there was new evidence	
7			and I wanted to seek the director's view on whether or	
8			not the assistant commissioner who was appointed to	
9			carry out the discipline, that that statement in	
10			itself, could it possibly be used and I re-briefed the	12:41
11			director.	
12	274	Q.	Yes. Did you receive a reply from the director's	
13			office? If we look at page 11307, dated the 1st	
14			November?	
15		Α.	That's correct, yes.	12:42
16	275	Q.	I think you had enclosed the further material referred	
17			to in the last statement that I have been asking but?	
18		Α.	That's correct.	
19	276	Q.	It synopsises what you have described in evidence	
20			there. And it concludes:	12:42
21				
22			"In the light of the above, further investigations have	
23			yielded no new evidence and so the position remains as	
24			set out in my letter of 3rd March 2016."	
25				12:42
26			I think that was the original decision, noting the	
27			position at that stage as a result of which there was	
28			no prosecution for a criminal offence?	
29		Α.	That's correct.	

1	277	Q.	Just revisiting the thrust of Garda Keogh's	
2			allegations, he said there was failure to revisit a	
3			crucial witness, you have taken all of the steps you've	
4			referred to try and get evidence from each of those	
5			three witnesses?	12:4
6		Α.	I believe I took all the steps that I could possibly do	
7			to try and get those witnesses to come on board.	
8	278	Q.	Garda Keogh has suggested that the garda under	
9			investigation was treated unduly favourably in respect	
10			of his interview with the investigation team. Would	12:4
11			you like to respond to that suggestion?	
12		Α.	The witness that is referred to was given fair	
13			procedure and natural justice, as I would give to any	
14			witness.	
15	279	Q.	He points to the fact that the questions were provided	12:4
16			to him in advance through his solicitor and that he had	
17			advance notice of the questions. Is that an unusual	
18			thing to do?	
19		Α.	You must you have to take cognisance of the fact	
20			that the witness these were matters that weren't	12:4
21			recent, they were matters I suppose I'm reluctant to	
22			say historical, but they were of some age and I think	
23			it was only fair to give him a flavour of what was	

- 25 280 Q. Garda Keogh raises a concern that himself and this work 12:44
 26 colleague, the subject of the investigation, were left
 27 in too close proximity in the workplace at times. Did
 28 you have any function in relation to that?
- 29 A. That's not a matter I would have any control over.

being levelled at him.

24

Τ	281	Q.	In relation to a complaint that the investigation team	
2			should have taken on the task of these side	
3			investigations concerning other parties concerned,	
4			Mr. McHugh, Ms. O'Neill, did you see it as the function	
5			of investigating team to take on the investigation of	12:45
6			any other matters?	
7		Α.	No, I didn't, no.	
8	282	Q.	Inspector Coppinger, would you answer any questions	
9			anyone else may have?	
10			THE WITNESS: Thank you.	12:45
11				
12			END OF EXAMINATION	
13				
14			CHAIRMAN: Now, yes, Mr. Kelly. Thank you.	
15				12:45
16			DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER WAS	
17			CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. KELLY AS FOLLOWS:	
18				
19	283	Q.	MR. KELLY: I see from your statement and I hear from	
20			your evidence that you met Garda A and a solicitor at	12:45
21			Oranmore Garda station on 24th April 2015, is that	
22			right?	
23		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
24	284	Q.	And Mr. Mulcahy was there as well?	
25		Α.	Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, yes.	12:46
26	285	Q.	Yes. The upshot of that was that Garda A asked for	
27			time to consider what was being said to him, isn't that	
28			right?	
29		Α.	That's correct, yes.	

- 1 286 Q. And he was given that time?
- 2 A. Correct.
- 3 287 Q. He was given until the 16th June?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 288 Q. Nearly two months, is that right?
- 6 A. I wouldn't have thought -- my recollection was it
- 7 wasn't quite that long but if those are the dates on

12:46

12:47

12 · 47

- 8 it, I can't dispute that, yeah.
- 9 289 Q. Yes. Would you normally give a witness, a suspect,
- five to six weeks to consider their response?
- 11 A. Well, as I said in my direct-evidence, they were
- matters that were complex matters and they were matters
- that were I suppose of some age and I think it was only
- 14 appropriate that he would be given the opportunity to
- respond and to make -- to seek out his own records, if
- he had any.
- 17 290 Q. But what I am asking is, would that be normal in the
- case of any other witness or suspect?
- 19 A. It wouldn't be not normal, particularly in fraud cases
- and cases like that that are complex or particularly
- issues that would require some scrutiny by the witness.
- 22 291 Q. Did he ask for this time?
- 23 A. Not to my recall, no. I think it would probably
- 24 more -- the arrangement for following it was probably
- 25 more to fit in with the work programme of his
- solicitor. That would be my recall of it.
- 27 292 Q. But what I am trying to understand is, you met him and
- 28 his solicitor at the Garda station and you gave him a
- list of what Nick Keogh was alleging. That's on the

- 24th April, yes?

 2 A. Correct, yeah.
- 3 293 Q. Garda A doesn't ask for time to consider it but you 4 give him until the 16th June to consider it. I'm 5 asking, was that not a little unusual?
- A. My only recall for my explanation of that was that it may have been down to the solicitor, who couldn't facilitate a meet again until that time. That's the only explanation I have for that. I'm surprised that it actually was that time between it.

12 · 48

- 11 294 Q. Well can you point me to anything in the evidence, as 12 far as you're concerned, which indicates that the 13 solicitor asked for that length of time?
- A. I don't recall him asking, no, other than that's the
 only explanation I can have for it. He may not have
 been in a position to facilitate a meet again until
 that date. I can't put it any further, I'm sorry.
- 18 295 Q. I don't want to be rude.
- 19 A. I know.
- 20 296 Q. But that's speculation, isn't it?
- 21 A. I know. Well that's --
- 22 297 Q. You're guessing?
- 23 A. I'm not guessing, but I'm -- that's my recall of it. I 24 can't recall it any more than that.
- 25 298 Q. So you specifically recall the solicitor saying but 12:49 we're going to need five to six weeks to answer this?
- 27 A. No, I don't recall him specifically saying that.
- 28 But my -- no, I don't recall him saying that
- 29 specifically, no.

1	299	Q.	And we know that it's on the 16th June that Garda A had	
2			prepared answers?	
3		Α.	Correct, yes.	
4	300	Q.	And the 24th June, days later, you met with Garda A and	
5			the solicitor again at Oranmore station?	12:49
6		Α.	Correct.	
7	301	Q.	And interviewed him then?	
8		Α.	Correct.	
9	302	Q.	That's where we get the 24th June?	
10		Α.	Yes.	12:50
11	303	Q.	I'm looking at your statement, at 3878. If we can go	
12			back up to the top to see what is said in your	
13			statement on the preceding page.	
14				
15			"24th April 2015, together with Detective	12:50
16			Superintendent Mulcahy I met with Garda A and his	
17			solicitor in Oranmore. On this date I served Garda A a	
18			document containing 19 allegations made by the	
19			confidential reporter which alleged malpractice by him.	
20			I invited him to respond to these allegations after	12:51
21			caution. At this meeting he requested time to consider	
22			the allegations and stated that he wished to address	
23			them. I next met with Garda A and his solicitor at	
24			Oranmore on the 16th June."	
25				12:51
26			What I am wondering about that is, you say there "at	
27			this meeting he requested time to consider the	
28			allegations and stated that he wished to address them",	
29			can you recall or assist the Tribunal as to whether he	

Τ			was asking for time, was it the case that could be	
2			anything, it could range from an hour to a day to a	
3			week?	
4		Α.	I cannot I can't help the Tribunal in relation to	
5			how we settled on that particular date, where he was to	12:52
6			come back. But again, all I can I know it's	
7			surmising, but I think it was probably more to	
8			facilitate the solicitor.	
9	304	Q.	So then "Met again in Oranmore on 16th June 2015,	
10			together with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. On	12:52
11			this date [blank] produced to me a document."	
12				
13			I take it that's the solicitor, is it?	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	305	Q.	"Produced to me a document which contained the Legal	12:52
16			caution and it addressed the allegations served on	
17			Garda A on 24th April 2015."	
18				
19			Is that right?	
20		Α.	Correct, yes.	12:52
21	306	Q.	Is it normal that the witness himself would have the	
22			legal caution, as it were, self administered on the	
23			document?	
24		Α.	Well it's not self administered when it's read over. I	
25			mean, I read the document over to him.	12:53
26	307	Q.	I don't dispute that. I'm just asking in your	
27			experience is it normally like that?	
28		Α.	It is actually not uncommon for a solicitor to prepare	
29			a statement for his client and send it to an	

1 investigation team. It's not unusual. 2 308 Oh, I know that. Would they normally put the caution Q. 3 on top of it? Α. Well, we had told him that any interviews with him 4 5 would have been after caution. 12:53 That you administer? 6 309 Q. Of course, yes, and I did. And I did. 7 Α. You then invited him to sign the prepared statement 8 310 Q. 9 memo, he signed it and you and Superintendent Mulcahy witnessed it? 10 12:53 11 Correct. Α. 12 311 You say: 0. 13 14 "Prior to this interview and reading over the 15 allegations, Garda A was invited to have the same 12:53 16 caught on camera but his solicitors declined to take up 17 the option." 18 19 That seems to be the end of that particular meeting. 20 That's correct. Α. 12:54 Then we move on to 24th June 2015, where you again 21 312 Q. 22 connected with the solicitor in Oranmore accompanied by 23 Superintendent Mulcahy? 24 Correct. Α. 25 At that stage, was it not a practice for a witness 313 0. 12:54 being interviewed by An Garda Síochána to be 26 27 accompanied as a matter of routine by their solicitor, we're speaking the period April-June 2015? 28 29 It wouldn't -- again, it would not be terribly unusual Α.

- for a solicitor -- my experience with solicitor firms, 1 some solicitors will come in, they will brief their 2 client, in an arrest situation, prior to a situation 3 where we now know find where solicitors sit in all the 4 5 time on interviews. But it wouldn't be unusual that 12:55 some solicitors would come, brief their client, the 6 7 interview will continue and then they may call back at
- some other stage. But in a voluntary setting generally it is my experience that they would sit in, yes.

 10 314 Q. It is my understanding at that stage that the solicitor 12:55
- of course was afforded an opportunity to advise his
 client prior to an interview but was not allowed to sit
 in on an interview?
- 14 A. I see no reason why he wouldn't sit in.
- 15 315 Q. Neither do I, but I'm asking what the Garda practice 12:55 was at the time?
- A. Well, this was -- this was a witness who was subject to
 very serious allegations presenting for the purpose of
 being interviewed and he brought a solicitor along. I
 don't see anything wrong with that, I think it's only
 fair.
- 22 316 Q. Judge, I am just about to move on to a different section.
- 24 CHAIRMAN: Very good. You will be some time,
- 25 Mr. Kelly?
- MR. KELLY: I may be a little time, yes.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: Very good, okay. Then we will break there,
- if that's convenient. We will say two o'clock. Thanks
- very much.

1			THE HEARING ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED, AS	
2			FOLLOWS:	
3				
4			CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Kelly.	
5	317	Q.	MR. KELLY: Looking at your statement of 26th January	14:05
6			2016, it's not necessary to call it up, you had said	
7			that Superintendent Mulcahy had got information that	
8			told you effectively Mrs. B possessed a large number of	
9			phones etcetera which might be of use, is that correct?	
10		Α.	Correct, yeah, electronic equipment.	14:05
11	318	Q.	And you went off to the District Court and got a	
12			warrant	
13		Α.	Correct.	
14	319	Q.	to search the property.	
15		Α.	Correct.	14:06
16	320	Q.	You say on arrival at the house the occupants became	
17			extremely hostile and had to be restrained, they were	
18			obstructing the search. Were there a large number of	
19			people there or not?	
20		Α.	There was one other individual there who was in a	14:06
21			relationship with the particular person and he would	
22			have been known to us and, indeed, known to the Gardaí	
23			in Athlone. He would have been involved in criminal	
24			activity.	
25	321	Q.	I'm not too interested in that, just the number; was it	14:06
26			two, three, four, five, six?	
27		Α.	There was from my recollection, I think there was	
28			four people, four people there including her daughter.	
29	322	0	T see And how many nolice officers were there?	

- 1 A. There was myself and Inspector O'Shea and we were supported by a unit of the armed support unit.
- 3 323 Q. How many police officers would that be?
- 4 A. About six.
- 5 324 Q. I see, okay. And you say that a large quantity of phones, SIM cards, laptops and computers were seized.
- 7 How many, do you know?
- A. I don't know exactly how many, but they were bagged and tagged on the day and taken possession of by Inspector O'Shea, one of the exhibits officers, Barry Walsh later on. But there was a considerable amount of them, yeah.
- 12 325 Q. Just try and give me a -- I know you don't have the
 13 logbook there, but give me an idea of the approximate
 14 number so I can get a feel for it, as it were? Six,
 15 eight, ten, twelve?
- 16 A. I would say in excess of that. I would say possibly
 17 nearer to 20, between SIM cards -- a lot of the
 18 electronic equipment that was taken was quite old, it
 19 was quite old stuff. Some of the SIM cards were found
 20 out in different places within in a particular -21 within the main bedroom. It was quite a comprehensive

23 326 Q. Yes.

search.

22

- A. We didn't leave any stone unturned in that house.
- 25 327 Q. So you took the old laptops, everything, because they

 might well have useful information on them?
- 27 A. Indeed.
- 28 328 Q. That is why you took them, presumably?
- 29 A. Yeah.

	323	Q.	IT I can then turn to the statement you made writen	
2			follows on, 29th September 2018. If that could be	
3			called up, it begins at 3879. If we go down to the	
4			bottom of that page, I think that is the beginning of	
5			the statement. Yes, that's the date. Now, if we go	14:08
6			over to the next page, which is 388, you say there:	
7				
8			"I wish to say as follows. On a date after 15th	
9			February 2018 I became aware that Ms. B made a	
10			statement to Gardaí from Waterford who were conducting	14:09
11			a disciplinary investigation under the directions of	
12			the Assistant Commissioner Annmarie McMahon."	
13				
14			She forwarded a copy of the statement through official	
15			Garda channels.	14:09
16		Α.	Correct.	
17	330	Q.	Is that right, yeah?	
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	331	Q.	15th April 2018, this investigation had begun, what, in	
20			'14?	14:09
21		Α.	Sorry? Yes, correct, yes.	
22	332	Q.	And this is four years later nearly?	
23		Α.	I'm not sure, I'm sure you have it in your documents	
24			there, the actual statement that was taken as part of	
25			the discipline investigation only, as far as I was	14:10
26			concerned, was generated in the weeks before that.	
27	333	Q.	But by this stage the reports had already all gone in,	
28			hadn't they, to the DPP?	
29		Α.	Oh correct, yes, and a copy of the substantial file,	

- which ran to several volumes, I understand was also
- 2 sent to GSOC.
- 3 334 Q. So this isn't a typo, a misprint or anything else, it
- 4 really was 15th February 2018.
- 5 A. Just -- I'd have to go back to when that statement was

14:11

14 · 11

- 6 generated. It may be a typo.
- 7 335 Q. Well, I think you should, because on the face of it
- 8 there is a four year gap here.
- 9 A. I have a copy actually of the statement from that
- 10 witness and that's dated 15th November 2017.
- 11 CHAIRMAN: 15th November '17?
- 12 A. Yeah, that's the date I have on the top.
- 13 CHAIRMAN: I understand.
- 14 MR. KELLY: That's is fine.
- 15 CHAIRMAN: It's all right.
- 16 336 Q. MR. KELLY: We're just interested in the dates.
- 17 A. Yeah.
- 18 337 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is when that statement was made to
- 19 Commissioner McMahon?
- 20 A. Correct. Well, it was actually made to some of her -- 14:1
- 21 338 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, to her team.
- 22 A. Her team.
- 23 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Commissioner McMahon's team sorry.
- 24 A. Yeah.
- 25 339 Q. MR. KELLY: Give me the date again please, 15th
- 26 November 2017?
- 27 A. Correct. Correct.
- 28 340 Q. That's when Ms. B had made that statement.
- 29 A. Hm-hmm.

- 1 341 Q. So then it comes to you sometime after the 15th
- 2 February?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 342 Q. Why do you use that formulation "on a date after 15th
- February"? Do you have a date for when you got it?

14:12

14:13

14 · 13

- 6 A. Em, I don't know how I come to that conclusion, but I
- 7 know that I acted on it quite quickly after getting it
- 8 so...
- 9 343 Q. So how quickly did you act on it after?
- 10 A. I would say within weeks.
- 11 344 Q. Right.
- 12 A. Once I got sight of it.
- 13 345 Q. So that statement that you have there, which I don't
- actually have, does it say when you actually received
- 15 it?
- 16 A. No, I just have a blank copy.
- 17 346 Q. There's no date stamp or anything?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 347 Q. It was the 26th April when you called at her home?
- 20 A. Correct.
- 21 348 Q. So you get it some time after the 15th February and the
- 22 26th April is when you go to her home?
- 23 A. Correct.
- 24 349 Q. You spoke with her daughter and you there detail the
- various attempts that you made, the 26th April, the
- 30th April, you wrote to her solicitors to arrange a
- 27 meeting, 24th May 2018 you approached her in Athlone?
- 28 A. Correct.
- 29 350 Q. 1st June 2018, that's when her solicitors I think

1			informed you that she was going to make a statement as	
2			soon as possible, to cooperate?	
3		Α.	Correct. And also that she was now withdrawing the	
4			statement that she had made to Commissioner McMahon's	
5			team, on the basis that she that the team had called	14:1
6			to her, that they were armed and that they felt	
7			compelled to make a statement.	
8	351	Q.	Right. But you get notice of that, according to that	
9			statement, on the 1st June, that she's going to do this	
10			and it's the 7th August that her solicitor says that	14:1
11			she's not in fact going to cooperate, nor was she going	
12			to stand over her statement she made to the Waterford	
13			team, is that right?	
14		Α.	Correct.	
15	352	Q.	So this was long after your inquiry had in fact really	14:1
16			concluded? Concluded in the sense of the report sent	
17			to the Commissioner, sent to the DPP, decisions made.	
18			Have I got that right?	
19		Α.	Correct.	
20	353	Q.	Yes.	14:1
21		Α.	My new approach to her was solely based on the basis of	
22			an inquiry to see would she stand over that statement	
23			or indeed make a new statement to myself that could be	
24			submitted for the purpose of re-briefing the director.	
25	354	Q.	Was it Superintendent Mulcahy who was the main author	14:1
26			of the report that ultimately went up?	

27

28

29

Α.

Well, the author of the report, the initial report,

would have been Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin, that

went to the director. I would have sent the follow-up

Т			report in relation to what we will call the new	
2			information.	
3	355	Q.	Well, I will explore it with Superintendent Mulcahy,	
4			but I think it was him that wrote it.	
5		Α.	Yeah.	14:15
6	356	Q.	But if you are not able to comment, that's fine. Thank	
7			you.	
8		Α.	Thank you.	
9				
10			END OF EXAMINATION	14:15
11				
12			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Now, who else?	
13			Mr. O'Higgins.	
14				
15			DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER WAS EXAMINED BY	14:15
16			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS, AS FOLLOWS:	
17				
18	357	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Thank you, Chairman. Detective	
19			inspector, you told the Chairman that you were	
20			appointed I think initially by Inspector Ó Cualáin	14:16
21			by Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin to take part in	
22			this investigation and that was in May, 15th May 2014.	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	358	Q.	I want to ask you about the efforts you made to bring	
25			together the central body of information from the main	14:16
26			protagonists and principally Ms. B and the witness in	
27			Galway?	
28		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
29	359	Q.	You've mentioned already in your evidence that in April	

1 2015 you made efforts to persuade Ms. B to become 2 involved and to proactively take part in the investigation, isn't that so? 3 That's correct. 4 Α. 5 360 We might just have up page 3874, please, just in Q. 14:16 I think this is one of the 6 relation to that. 7 statements you've made to the Tribunal regarding your 8 role in the Galway investigation? That's correct, yeah. 9 Α. Looking at that there, on the 9th April it indicates, 10 361 Q. 14 · 17 11 '15, that you went to speak with, at that point a 12 potential witness, Ms. B, as she had been mentioned by 13 the confidential reporter, isn't that so? 14 Α. That's correct. 15 362 And you narrate there in that statement, communications 14:17 Q. 16 and texts with her over that period and promises to assist and so on? 17 18 Yes. Α. 19 363 would it be fair to say generally speaking it featured Q. promises to help that didn't always materialise into 20 14:17 reality? 21 22 That's correct. Α. 23 I think then moving matters on to the 24th April, over 364 Q. 24 the next page, you have dealt with the text, you also 25 met with Garda A, and you have mentioned this already, 14 · 18 26 and his solicitor at Oranmore Garda station, on the

24th April?

That's correct, yes.

27

28

29

Α.

Q.

365

Again then in June of 2015 as well you met with Garda A

1			and I think also the solicitor?	
2		Α.	That's correct.	
3	366	Q.	And then moving matters on then to October of 2015, I	
4			think it's the case that Detective Superintendent	
5			Mulcahy had received certain confidential information	14:18
6			which tended to indicate that Ms. B was in possession	
7			of certain laptops and phones and so forth, is that so?	
8		Α.	Correct.	
9	367	Q.	On foot of that and I think the gist of it was that	
10			the entail was that they may contain evidence which	14:18
11			might support the allegations that Garda Keogh had been	
12			making that in a particular guard was compromised by	
13			his involvement with Ms. B?	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	368	Q.	I think it's the case on foot of that then, and this is	14:19
16			in your statement, you made application for a search	
17			warrant of Ms. B's home. I think that was 9th October	
18			2015?	
19		Α.	That's correct. Myself and Detective Superintendent	
20			Mulcahy, we obtained two warrants on that date before	14:19
21			the District Court and I executed the one in relation	
22			to the witness that you refer to.	
23	369	Q.	Right. Having applied for a search warrant, you	
24			carried that out. Can I ask you in a general sense,	
25			without getting into criticism of people who aren't	14:19
26			present, but what sort of response did this prompt from	
27			the occupants at the house?	
28		Α.	Well, we didn't get cooperation and, indeed, the	

and I think also the solicitor?

28

29

occupants had to be restrained for the purpose of

			carrying out the search and they were restrained for	
2			the period of the search.	
3	370	Q.	Yes.	
4		Α.	When I say restrained, they were handcuffed.	
5	371	Q.	Yes. And I think you have told the Chairman already	14:20
6			that devices were removed at the time of this search?	
7		Α.	Quite a considerable volume of devices. In particular,	
8			SIM cards. There seemed to be a lot of SIM cards in	
9			various locations throughout the house.	
10	372	Q.	Yes. Just moving the timeline on then, I think the	14:20
11			position is that you became aware, I think was it	
12			February 2018, that Ms. B had made a statement to	
13			Commissioner Annmarie McMahon's investigation regarding	
14			the discipline investigation that she was carrying out?	
15		Α.	That's correct. That's roughly around that time.	14:20
16			After that, I would have got sight of the actual	
17			statement. I was aware it may be in existence but I	
18			didn't actually see it after that.	
19	373	Q.	Yes. What was your hope at this point in terms of	
20			breathing life into the investigation afresh?	14:21
21		Α.	well, clearly on reading the statement, it did show	
22			some promise, in that it was very supportive of the	
23			allegations being made by Garda Keogh and it was my	
24			hope when I approached her that she would stand over	
25			that statement and come on board with the	14:21
26			investigation, so that we could again re-brief the	
27			director.	
28	374	Q.	I think it's the case, and you have set this out in	
29			your statement, on foot of this development you	

Т			attempted to re-interview Ms. B, I think on the 26th	
2			April, is that right?	
3		Α.	That's correct.	
4	375	Q.	Did you call to her home?	
5		Α.	Initially I called to her home, yes.	14:21
6	376	Q.	And did that bring progress?	
7		Α.	No, we didn't get any response there. We eventually	
8			didn't make contact with her daughter on another date	
9			and she told us that she was doing a course in Athlone.	
10	377	Q.	Yes.	14:22
11		Α.	And as a result of those inquiries, I did locate her	
12			and I located the location where she was doing that	
13			course and I recognised her car parked in the car park,	
14			so I took up surveillance on that car.	
15	378	Q.	Yes. Did you manage to establish contact with her?	14:22
16		Α.	Yes. She approached the car, when she did I approached	
17			her and told her my reason for wishing again to speak	
18			to her and again she was evasive and she said she was	
19			going on holidays for ten days and that she would	
20			respond through her solicitor.	14:22
21	379	Q.	I think you subsequently made contact with Gearoid	
22			Geraghty, her solicitor, yourself?	
23		Α.	That's correct. I was aware that Mr. Geraghty had	
24			previously corresponded or, indeed, enquired in	
25			relation to the return of her electronic equipment, so	14:22
26			I knew that he was acting for her.	
27	380	Q.	Yes. You have told the Chairman I think that you	
28			subsequently received correspondence from Mr. Geraghty	
29			setting out Ms R's mosition?	

Τ		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
2	381	Q.	Basically she wasn't	
3			CHAIRMAN: I was forced into the statement and I'm	
4			taking it back.	
5		Α.	That's it, Chairman, yes.	14:23
6	382	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Just in relation to that, what	
7			I am building up to asking you, obviously in order for	
8			an investigation to flower into a prosecution, there	
9			has to be	
10			CHAIRMAN: You needed some evidence.	14:23
11	383	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: One needs some evidence. But	
12			can I ask you firstly, what impact on the viability of	
13			a prosecution/the investigation itself, what impact did	
14			the reluctance of Ms. B and her decision not to	
15			participate ultimately have?	14:23
16		Α.	well, it resulted, basically after my submission, of	
17			what we will call the mini file to the director, they	
18			returned no prosecution.	
19	384	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It didn't make any difference to the	
20			original	14:24
21		Α.	It didn't change the original.	
22	385	Q.	CHAIRMAN: of March 2016.	
23		Α.	Correct.	
24	386	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Detective inspector, I assume you were	
25			saying, look, I know this was made, I know this was	14:24
26			withdrawn, but on the other hand, we have an	
27			incriminating statement, not only of the person who	
28			made it but of another person of interest. We have an	
29			incriminating statement, albeit made in a disciplinary	

Т			and not a criminal thing. How do we stand on this?	
2			Could we proceed on the basis of this statement?	
3			Something of that kind was your query.	
4		Α.	That's correct. And obviously I have a working	
5			knowledge of the law but I needed guidance from the	14:24
6			director's office as to the usefulness of that.	
7	387	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. And the director said, look, it	
8			doesn't make any material our decision stands, is	
9			what they said?	
10		Α.	Correct. Correct, Chairman. Yes.	14:25
11	388	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Just moving matters on then. I	
12			think you didn't rest there, I think you told the	
13			Chairman you also re-established contact with Garda A	
14			with a view to putting this development to him?	
15		Α.	Yes. I thought that that was necessary, because	14:25
16			clearly Garda A was very much the thrust of the	
17			allegation and what this witness was saying, so I	
18			deemed it only appropriate to afford him an opportunity	
19			to respond.	
20	389	Q.	Yes. I think you have outlined that in September of	14:25
21			2018, accompanied by Inspector O'Shea, you travelled to	
22			Limerick to the office of Mr. Daniel Gorman, the	
23			solicitor?	
24		Α.	That's correct.	
25	390	Q.	Where did that process bring you?	14:25
26			CHAIRMAN: I think we have been over that,	
27			Mr. O'Higgins. It didn't lead anywhere.	
28			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: May it please you, Chairman.	
29	391	0	CHAIRMAN: He denied any criminal involvement	

1		Α.	Yes.
2	392	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: You put it to him and he denied
3			it?
4		Α.	Indeed, that's correct.
5	393	Q.	Lastly then can I ask you this, I asked but the impact 14:2
6			of Ms. B's reluctance to engage. The witness from
7			Galway, of whom mention was made earlier, what impact,
8			if any, did that have on the viability of the
9			investigation?
10		Α.	Yes. Again, the witness from Galway, when I sought him 14:2
11			out, he had moved back to Athlone and, indeed, my
12			timing was a little off on the morning. I called to
13			his home house in Athlone and there was actually quite
14			a tragedy in the family. I walked into it. In any
15			case, I made arrangements for him to meet me and we did 14:2
16			meet later and I again put that statement to him.
17	394	Q.	Yes. I mean, presumably that was a significant blow to

20 A. Indeed.

the investigation, that he was not inclined to

21 395 Q. CHAIRMAN: His attitude was he had moved on with his 22 life. The implication is that he had left his past 23 behind him and he didn't want to get back into it in 24 any shape or form, including making statements.

25 A. That's correct, Chairman, yes.

participate?

18

19

26

27

28

29

396 Q. CHAIRMAN: In his case, if I understand it, it wasn't simply a refusal to sign up, if you like, he actually had another string to that bow, he had another reason he didn't want to have anything to do with it, he

Τ			wanted to put it out of his life, so to speak?	
2		Α.	Correct. At the time you was in a new relationship and	
3			himself and his partner were trying to have a family	
4			and he just did not want to reengage.	
5	397	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay, so there is something understandable	14:27
6			in a way about at least part of that. Maybe that's an	
7			unnecessary comment. That's a matter for submission	
8			and somebody might agree with it or not agree with it.	
9			It doesn't matter. Anyway, anything else	
10			Mr. O'Higgins?	14:27
11			MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Just one other matter,	
12			Chairman.	
13			CHAIRMAN: Yes, sure.	
14	398	Q.	MR. MÍCHEÁL O'HIGGINS: Can I ask you about a separate	
15			matter altogether, detective inspector, and it concerns	14:28
16			the question of holding or not holding the base of the	
17			investigation in Athlone. I think it's the case that	
18			you're aware, are you, that D/Superintendent Mulcahy	
19			met with Garda Keogh and I think also Commissioner	
20			Ó Cualáin in August of 2014?	14:28
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	399	Q.	And an indication or an assurance was given that	
23			insofar as possible to interview people away from the	
24			station, Athlone Garda Station?	
25		Α.	Correct.	14:28
26	400	Q.	I think it's the case that in point of fact there did	
27			continue some level, a much lower level, but some level	
28			of interviews did continue from the station, isn't that	
29			sn?	

2	401	Q.	Insofar as you can, can you assist the Chairman as to	
3			why that was, that that continued, albeit the base	
4			moved away?	
5		Α.	There was a number of witnesses who when interviewed	14:29
6			would have to rely on certain documentation which would	
7			be within the confines of the Garda station, to which	
8			they would have a right to refer. And it would in	
9			some cases it would be quite impossible to take their	
10			statements without they having the opportunity to refer	14:29
11			to those records. I myself did attend Athlone station	
12			on a few occasions. On one occasion we had reason to	
13			carry out a search of a particular room or cupboard,	
14			which had been mentioned by the confidential reporter,	
15			that could again render evidence. So for certain	14:29
16			things like that, there was no choice, we had to go and	
17			clear those issues raised.	
18	402	Q.	Would it be correct to say in conclusion then that	
19			while that necessity still remained and led to some	
20			interviews continuing from Athlone, the base of the	14:30
21			investigation did move away?	
22		Α.	Correct.	
23	403	Q.	Thanks very much.	
24				
25			END OF EXAMINATION	
26				
27				
28				
29				

1 A. That's correct.

1			DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER WAS RE-EXAMINED	
2			BY MR. McGUINNESS, AS FOLLOWS:	
3				
4	404	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Detective inspector, where was the base of	
5			the investigation?	14:30
6		Α.	The base of the investigation was Oranmore Garda	
7			station. We had an incident room there and it was set	
8			aside solely for the purpose of this.	
9	405	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So there was a room set aside in Oranmore?	
10		Α.	In Oranmore, yeah.	14:30
11	406	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So when we talk about the base moving away	
12			from Athlone, that's not correct?	
13		Α.	Well, I think what we mean by the base there is the	
14			taking of statements. Statements were taken at a lot	
15			of occasions, I can recall we took a particular	14:30
16			statement, I think a witness may have given evidence	
17			here, and we took it on the forecourt of a petrol	
18			station because that's where he chose to meet us.	
19	407	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand, yes, you take it where	
20		Α.	You take it where you are given it, Chairman.	14:31
21	408	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. But did Oranmore remain from beginning	
22			to end the headquarters, so to speak?	
23		Α.	It remained the collating point, for want of a better	
24			word.	
25	409	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Collating point, yes. Okay. Thank you very	14:31
26			much.	
27		Α.	Thank you, Chairman.	
28	410	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Detective inspector, just a couple of	
29			further questions Perhans on that tonic you have	

1 just looked at Volume 55, it's pages 15524 onwards. 2 This is the letter from the Chief State Solicitors enclosing a table of where the statements were taken, 3 on the following pages. It goes up to 11534. Were you 4 5 involved in the compilation of this to identify what 14:32 6 statements were taken when and, more particularly, 7 where? 8 That's correct, yes. Α. You were involved in this? 9 411 Q. I did see that, yeah, and I would have been involved 10 Α. 14:32 11 with the IRC in compiling it, yes. 12 Is this accurate to the best of your knowledge? 412 Q. I would say so, yeah. 13 Α. 14 413 Q. You have seen it before, obviously? 15 I have, yeah. Α. 14:32 16 It identifies the timeline and place at which 414 Ο. 17 statements were taken in Athlone? 18 Correct. Α. 19 415 Thank you. Could I just ask you to look at another Q. 20 document which has been adverted to, at page 3949. 14:32 21 This is first page of a three-page summary of 22 allegations that were provided to Garda A and his 23 solicitor? 24 Correct. Α. 25 On the 26th April, isn't that correct? 416 Q. 14:33 26 Correct. Α. 27 417 If we just scroll down the page. Q. 28 I recognise that document, yes. Α.

That is signed then by you on page 3951?

29

418

Q.

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 419 Q. You've referred earlier to the telephone billing
- 3 records from the previous period and the number of
- 4 phone calls and contacts apparently had. Is that a
- 5 matter that you put to Garda A when you interviewed

14:33

14:34

14:34

- 6 him?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 420 Q. In relation to the issue of having his solicitor
- 9 present, obviously when people are arrested and
- detained in a Garda station, am I right in suggesting
- that it was not then the practice to allow members of
- the legal profession to sit in on the interviews?
- 13 A. Not then. The decision would have come in after that,
- 14 yes, correct.
- 15 421 Q. Obviously if you're seeking to have someone attend
- voluntarily and they wish their solicitor to attend,
- that's normally permitted and there's nothing unusual
- 18 about that, is there?
- 19 A. Nothing and I don't think you could advance any great
- 20 reason to object.
- 21 422 Q. CHAIRMAN: Well, if you did they would be able to walk
- 22 out.
- 23 A. True, Chairman. Yes.
- 24 423 Q. CHAIRMAN: And then you would have the choice, arrest
- me if you think you enough, if you have a reasonable
- basis and then bring me to the station for charging or
- 27 releasing.
- 28 424 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: Obviously the report of the assistant
- commissioner made reference to the telephone contacts

1			at the time that seemed to have been apparent between	
2			Garda A and Ms. B. But in the absence of the witnesses	
3			themselves confirming the content of any of those, did	
4			it seem that there was not enough evidence to suggest	
5			that anything improper had occurred?	14:35
6		Α.	Well, obviously I don't want to second guess the	
7			director.	
8	425	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	But certainly they did show that there was an	
10			inordinate amount of contact.	14:35
11	426	Q.	Yes. The first mentioned person that you went to see	
12			in Galway, I think that person had never signed a	
13			statement describing what had happened or was alleged	
14			to have happened?	
15		Α.	That's correct.	14:35
16	427	Q.	In any sense, isn't that correct?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	428	Q.	Obviously leaving aside the phone records for the	
19			moment, had you any other evidence of substance to put	
20			to Garda A which would have incriminated him or did	14:36
21			incriminate him, in the interview?	
22		Α.	Well, we would have obviously gone through the whole	
23			operation locally.	
24	429	Q.	Yes.	
25		Α.	How the suspects were identified.	14:36
26	430	Q.	Yes.	
27		Α.	The target lists for operation Loki and all that kind	
28			of thing, because other allegations were made that	
29			somehow or another, in particular, the particular	

1			witness that he referred to was left off that list.	
2			There was certain circumstantial matters we would put	
3			to him.	
4	431	Q.	You had gathered an awful lot of material relating to	
5			that operation?	14:36
6		Α.	Correct.	
7	432	Q.	Which had been a sanctioned operation, isn't that	
8			right?	
9		Α.	Correct. But I would also like to point out that from	
10			our investigation that operation Loki uncovered a	14:36
11			critical witness that we have referred to here and he	
12			was convicted as a result of that. He himself was not	
13			a target.	
14	433	Q.	Yes. Thank you, detective inspector.	
15				14:37
16			END OF EXAMINATION	
17				
18			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you very much, detective	
19			inspector.	
20			THE WITNESS: Thank you, Chairman.	14:37
21			CHAIRMAN: You are free to go. Thank you very much.	
22				
23			THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
24				
25			MR. McGUINNESS: The next witness, Chairman, is retired	14:37
26			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy.	
27			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
28				
29				

1			DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY, HAVING BEEN	
2			SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS, AS	
3			FOLLOWS:	
4				
5			THE WITNESS: Declan Mulcahy.	14:37
6			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much, detective superintendent.	
7			Thank you.	
8	434	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Could I ask you to outline your career	
9			in An Garda Síochána until you retired?	
10		Α.	Very good. I joined An Garda Síochána in April 1982.	14:37
11			On completion of training I was assigned to Harcourt	
12			Terrace in Dublin and later that year, on application,	
13			I moved to Castleconnell in Limerick, where I remained	
14			until 1994. I then went as a community policeman in	
15			the Castletroy area of Limerick, assigned to the	14:38
16			university and the surrounding areas. In early '96 I	
17			was promoted to sergeant and assigned to a unit in	
18			Henry Street. In June of that year I was put on the	
19			team in respect of the Gerry McCabe murder and I worked	
20			with that for some time. In '97, the following year, I	14:38
21			was appointed as a detective sergeant in Henry Street	
22			in Limerick, and remained there until 2003, where I was	
23			promoted to inspector and moved back to Dublin to	
24			Sundrive Road. In 2005, I think, in there or	
25			thereabouts, I went back to Limerick, Roxboro Road, as	14:38
26			an inspector, and the following year or so I was	
27			appointed as detective inspector in Limerick, where I	
28			remained until 2009 and I was promoted to	
29			superintendent and went to Ennistymon in west Clare.	

1 The following year I went to Galway in 2010 and was 2 appointed there as detective inspector and finished, 3 retired there in April of 2018. CHAI RMAN: I think the last one you meant detective 4 5 superintendent. 14:39 6 As detective superintendent. Α. 7 The last one, you were already an inspector 435 CHAI RMAN: Q. and then you became a detective superintendent. 8 9 Yes. Α. You retired at that? 10 436 CHAI RMAN: Q. 14:39 11 Yes. Α. 12 How long are you retired? 437 CHAI RMAN: Ο. I am retired two years in April. 13 Α. 14 CHAI RMAN: Okay. 15 438 MR. McGUI NNESS: So you spent eight years in Galway as Q. 14:39 16 a detective superintendent? 17 Α. Sorry. 18 Eight years in Galway as a detective superintendent? 439 Q. 19 There or thereabouts, yeah. Α. And you had served, had you, under Chief Superintendent 14:39 20 440 0. Ó Cualáin while he been there? 21 22 Chief Superintendent Ó Cualáin was there when I came, Α. 23 yeah. 24 And then he became the regional commissioner? 441 Q. 25 He became commissioner, yes. Α. 14:39 26 442 Just in terms of your knowledge of other personnel 0.

Pat Murray?

27

28

29

Α.

involved in the Tribunal, did you know Superintendent

The first time I ever met Pat Murray was some time in

- 1 2010, we came to Galway in around the same time.
- 2 443 Q. Yes. How long did he serve there?
- 3 A. How long did Pat Murray?
- 4 444 Q. Yes
- 5 A. Pat Murray was in Galway for -- he initially started in 14:40

14 · 40

14:40

14:41

14 · 41

- 6 Gort, he was in Gort Garda station, and he then moved
- 7 to traffic and he then went to Roscommon.
- 8 445 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. Now, I am not sure how long he was in Roscommon.
- 10 446 Q. Yes. Do you know who transferred him to Athlone?
- 11 A. He was subsequently transferred to Athlone, yes.
- 12 447 Q. And do you know who was responsible for that transfer
- or how it came about?
- 14 A. I presume it was HRM. I knew that he had made an
- application to get back towards home. I think he is
- 16 from that particular area.
- 17 448 Q. Yes. Had you any knowledge of Garda Keogh or Garda A,
- as we are calling another guard?
- 19 A. Not prior to the disclosure, no.
- 20 449 Q. In any event, you were appointed by Assistant
- 21 Commissioner Ó Cualáin to assist him in investigating a
- set of allegations made by a confidential reporter at
- 23 that time?
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 450 Q. Garda Keogh. Did you become aware of the Dáil debate
- 26 contribution made by Deputy Flanagan about the matter?
- 27 A. Yeah, I had heard something in the news in passing. I
- hadn't taken a whole pile of notice of it, to tell you
- the honest truth, but I had heard it in the public

1			media.	
2	451	Q.	Yes. Well, did Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin phone	
3			you to say, look, I am going to appoint you to this?	
4		Α.	Commissioner ó Cualáin made contact with me and	
5			suggested that he wanted me both me and Inspector	14:41
6			Coppinger.	
7	452	Q.	Yes. Did he tell you what it was about?	
8		Α.	Initially I don't believe he told us what it was about	
9			until we met him in his office on the morning that he	
10			disclosed what he wanted us for.	14:42
11	453	Q.	Was that down in Galway?	
12		Α.	That was in Galway, yeah.	
13	454	Q.	You say in your statement:	
14				
15			"On 15th May 2014 AC Ó Cualáin briefed both I and	14:42
16			Inspector Michael Coppinger on the facts surrounding	
17			this report."	
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	455	Q.	"He subsequently appointed me to assist with his	
20			i nvesti gati on. "	14:42
21				
22			So, can you recall how he briefed you on the matter	
23		Α.	I think he had a briefing pack, in actual fact, in	
24			relation to which contained the affidavit that Garda	
25			Keogh had submitted to the judge in respect of his	14:42
26			complaint.	
27	456	Q.	Yes. And did it contain anything else?	
28		Α.	I'm not sure, to tell you the honest truth, I just	
29			can't remember but I know it contained the affidavit	

- 1 yeah.
- 2 457 Q. Yes. You appear to have made a note in your diary
- 3 shortly after this that he required you to report by
- 4 the 6th June?
- 5 A. Yeah, that's possible.
- 6 458 Q. Do you recall --
- 7 A. Yeah.
- 8 459 Q. So did you envisage taking steps then that would allow

14 · 43

- 9 you to make some sort of report to the assistant
- 10 commissioner?
- 11 A. Well, we took immediate steps and actually we had a
- conference nearly within a short timeframe of it and
- selected our team that we would require to investigate
- 14 this matter.
- 15 460 Q. Yes. But did you take any steps to find out -- knowing 14:43
- that this was now Garda Keogh, did you take any steps
- 17 to find out anything about Garda Keogh?
- 18 A. No. I was aware that AC Ó Cualáin had or was going to,
- on that date, was going to phone Garda Keogh, and also
- 20 he proposed to write to him on the same day to try make $_{14:43}$
- an appointment to meet him so that we could sit down
- and interview him in relation to his affidavit.
- 23 461 Q. Yes. Did he tell you the outcome of that, whether he
- 24 got through to Garda Keogh?
- A. I know it was some time before he got back to me to say 14:43
- 26 that Garda Keogh had got back to him and a date was
- appointed in relation to meeting him, which I think was
- in around the 7th June, off my head, I'm not sure.
- 29 462 Q. On the face of it that appears some distance in time

1 away from the date of his appointment to investigate 2 the matter. Do you know of any reason why a meeting 3 was arranged for the 7th June? I don't know, only that I was given the date that it 4 Α. 5 was to go ahead on the 7th June. 14:44 6 463 But did you yourself take any step to find out, Q. 7 well what is Garda Keogh on about or what's he like? 8 Did you contact his divisional officer or district officer? 9 I had his affidavit. I read his affidavit. 10 Α. From 14 · 44 11 what came up in that, I made arrangements around 12 obtaining original files in Athlone and tried to take 13 it from there. 14 464 Q. The affidavit doesn't name other members the 15 subject-matter of the allegations. Did you take any 14:45 16 step at that stage to find out who they might be? 17 I must have, because I recall -- well, maybe not at Α. 18 that stage but after the date that we met him, which 19 was the 7th I think, may have been on a Saturday, I think that Monday or Tuesday we went to Athlone 20 14:45 straightaway and I met his superintendent there, Noreen 21 22 We made arrangements there for a liaison 23 person to be appointed so that I would have one point 24 of contact in Athlone, that I wouldn't have to be going 25 all over the place trying to gather information and 14 · 45 26 stuff. I also requested that she make arrangements to

27

28

29

seize the mobile phone from Garda A, who had access to

But he would appear to have access to it maybe more

It was a phone allocated to the drugs unit there.

- often than anyone else.
- 2 465 Q. Just going back to the 7th June, you met with Garda
- 3 Keogh in Portumna?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 466 Q. Just yourself and the assistant commissioner?
- 14:46
- 6 A. Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin and myself, yeah.
- 7 467 Q. And nobody else?
- 8 A. Nobody else.
- 9 468 Q. I think you've provided some notes of that, isn't that
- 10 correct?

14 · 46

- 11 A. Yeah. I took pretty rough notes on the date in
- relation to what he had to say.
- 13 469 Q. Perhaps we will just look at those, at page 3936.
- 14 Detective superintendent, if you would prefer to have
- the paper volume?

14:46

- 16 A. No, I don't mind, I don't have anything in front of me
- 17 here in at the moment.
- 18 470 Q. We should have it on our screens. Document 3936.
- 19 There's mention of a DVD there?
- 20 A. Yes.

14:46

- 21 471 Q. I think he was saying he gave it to the judge, is that
- 22 correct?
- 23 A. That's correct, yes.
- 24 472 Q. There's the first mention of Garda A, is that the first
- 25 time you heard of Garda A?

- 26 A. How do I move this down?
- 27 473 Q. Well, perhaps if we ask Mr. Kavanagh to scroll that
- down. Perhaps you will be given Volume 30.
- 29 474 Q. CHAIRMAN: I think you may find it is more convenient

- 1 to look at it in the paper version.
- 2 A. Yeah, maybe.
- 3 475 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: 3936.
- 4 A. Thank you.
- 5 476 Q. I think it became quite evident at an early stage that
- 6 his allegations that he had made in the affidavit were

14 · 48

14:48

14:48

14 · 48

- 7 being expanded on greatly?
- 8 A. Exactly.

Α.

10

- 9 477 Q. With a great deal of more detail?
- 11 478 Q. And more incidents, isn't that correct?
- 12 A. That's correct.

Yes.

- 13 479 Q. Was there some debate about whether you were just
- investigating the affidavit or all of the matters that
- 15 he was telling you about?
- 16 A. What we were doing was expanding on his affidavit. I
- 17 think he mentioned the words that his affidavit may
- 18 have been a steppingstone.
- 19 480 Q. Yes. In any event, as you say, these are rough notes?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 481 Q. Just turning to page 3942.
- 22 A. Okay.
- 23 482 Q. There's a reference at the bottom of 3942, if you just
- go down. This is still the notes of the meeting in
- 25 Portumna on the 7th June, is that correct?
- 26 A. That's correct, yes.
- 27 483 Q. "Money missing McHugh under pressure. 4,500 missing."
- 28 A. Yeah.
- 29 484 Q. Can you recollect at this point whether he was making

1 any complaints that he was being required to account 2 for his interaction with Mr. McHugh? 3 Α. No, he wasn't making -- as far as I was concerned it was just -- how would I put it, it was just another of 4 5 the stuff that he was offering to us. 14:49 6 485 Okay. Q. 7 Yeah. Α. 8 486 That appears to be the last part of the note on that Q. 9 day? 10 Correct. Α. 14 · 49 11 487 You don't appear to have made an arrangement at that Q. 12 point to take a statement from him, is that right? 13 We must have made an arrangement because we met him on Α. 14 the 10th in Athlone Garda Station. Now, while there 15 mightn't be a note of it there, obviously there was 14:49 16 something exchanged between us, because we met him in 17 Athlone, I think it was on the 10th, which was maybe 18 the Tuesday or that. 19 488 Yes. Just looking at your notes --Q. 20 we did exchange phone numbers that day. Α. 14:50 Is that right? 21 489 Q. 22 Yeah. Α. 23 well, I am just looking at page 11310, which is volume 490 0. 24 40. You may prefer to have your paper copy? 25 I can read that. Α.

met Garda Keogh at that stage?

26

27

28

29

491

492

Ο.

Α.

Q.

Yes.

Yeah.

You had had this conference on the 23rd May?

what had you been conferring about? Because you hadn't

1		Α.	That was a conference basically to set up our team and	
2			to organise in relation to establishing as to the	
3			whereabouts of the original files and taking custody of	
4			them. They were the files that he would have mentioned	
5			in relation to particular incidents i.e. the Loki	14:50
6			investigation and the second investigation, if I can	
7			use the name or not, in relation to where he was	
8			alleging that there was a half kilo of heroin planted	
9			in a car.	
10	493	Q.	But had you been in touch with someone in Athlone to	14:51
11			determine where those files were	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	494	Q.	at that time?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	495	Q.	And who do you think that was?	14:51
16		Α.	Detective Sergeant Eamon Curley.	
17	496	Q.	Sergeant Curley?	
18		Α.	Eamon Curley, yeah.	
19	497	Q.	You referred then to having a single point of contact	
20			in Athlone, was that Sergeant Curley?	14:51
21		Α.	That was Eamon Curley, yes.	
22	498	Q.	Was Sergeant Curley designated by somebody for that	
23			purpose?	
24		Α.	By the superintendent.	
25	499	Q.	By Superintendent McBrien?	14:51
26		Α.	Noreen McBrien, yes.	
27	500	Q.	In any event, if we look at page 11312, there is an	
28			entry there:	
29				

1			"10th June."	
2				
3			We're not quite concerned with the first few lines	
4			there. But on the fifth line:	
5				14:51
6			"Request made for super for seizure of mobile phone."	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	501	Q.	"Presently allocated to Garda A. Spoke to Nicholas	
9			Keogh and made arrangements for interview statements on	
10			Wednesday 11/6/14 in Tullamore."	14:52
11				
12			Were you expecting the phone to be seized on that day?	
13		Α.	The reason why I did was, I didn't want to cause alarm	
14			by us being around the station and stuff like that and	
15			the easiest way to do it would be for maybe her to meet	14:52
16			with him and, without any warning, just to take it.	
17	502	Q.	You seem to have become aware, certainly by the 13th,	
18			that that hadn't happened. Was there some	
19			misunderstanding between yourself and Superintendent	
20			McBrien about that?	14:52
21		Α.	I got an e-mail from Superintendent McBrien on the I	
22			would think on the 12th, asking was it a phone or SIM	
23			card I required.	
24	503	Q.	Okay. And did you reply to that?	
25		Α.	My reply was to go and get it myself.	14:52
26	504	Q.	Yes. In any event, you met Garda Keogh at his home in	
27			Tullamore?	
28		Α.	I did, yes.	
20	ENE	^	And you kent notes of that I don't think we need to so	

1			through them to any great extent. But it continued on	
2			until the 13th. It was suspended for a period	
3			obviously on that day and you got the phone and	
4			notebook of Garda A?	
5		Α.	I did, indeed.	14:53
6	506	Q.	Isn't that correct?	
7		Α.	That's correct.	
8	507	Q.	And eventually the statement was signed by Garda Keogh	
9			on the 18th, the location having moved to Oranmore?	
10		Α.	Well, we went to Oranmore because of the availability	14:53
11			of the video room and we gave him the opportunity, if	
12			he wished, to have it recorded on video, that it was	
13			available. He declined that offer.	
14	508	Q.	Yes. Garda A actually had possession of the phone when	
15			you took it on the 13th June?	14:54
16		Α.	He did.	
17	509	Q.	Is that correct?	
18		Α.	Yeah.	
19	510	Q.	You say in relation to the analysis that you:	
20				14:54
21			"arranged for it to be analysed by Garda Walsh and	
22			having completed same, it was found that it did not	
23			contain any text messages, nor did it contain any	
24			contact details for any person named."	
25				14:54
26			And there is a redaction there.	
27		Α.	Correct.	
28	511	Q.	So, are you intending to confirm there that this	
29			contact and only that named contact was not in the	

1			phone but there were other contacts in the phone?	
2		Α.	There were, indeed, other contacts, yes.	
3	512	Q.	Garda Keogh appears to have formed the belief, which he	
4			referred to later in a letter to you, about the phone	
5			having been wiped. Did you ever use that term in	14:54
6			connection with updating him on the progress of your	
7			investigation?	
8		Α.	No. Maybe it was misunderstood that it was wiped in	
9			respect of the matter that you mentioned there in	
10			relation to the messages and the name mentioned.	14:55
11	513	Q.	Yes. Well, did you determine whether texts had been	
12			deleted and if so at any stage?	
13		Α.	It was impossible to do. And in order to try and	
14			establish did that happen, not alone did I get Garda	
15			Walsh to x-ray it, I also sent it to the	14:55
16			telecommunication section in Dublin, to see if they	
17			could bring up anything and again I was unsuccessful in	
18			that.	
19	514	Q.	Yes. I think you attended Athlone Garda Station with	
20			Inspector Coppinger on a number of different dates to	14:55
21			seize a number of different	
22		Α.	That's correct.	
23	515	Q.	items that you were anxious to obtain. Did it	
24			appear that the items you were interested in had been	
25			in fact securely kept and were in proper custody when	14:56
26			you were taking possession of them?	
27		Α.	Yes. I suppose one particular visit was to the PEMS	
28			store, which is the store that stores everything	
29			under I suppose everything is documented in relation	

1 to the movements of it. There we examined the drugs 2 that were alleged to have been planted in a specific 3 car that we spoke about, which was the subject of one of the allegations. We also examined custody records. 4 5 In relation to -- Garda Keogh had a number of notebooks 14:56 6 in the store and we had sought one from him in respect 7 of any notes that he may have taken in relation to the 8 accusations being made to him about the drugs being However, that wasn't there and he 9 planted. 10 subsequently found it elsewhere and produced it to me. 14:56 11 There was a number of files had to be got from the 12 district office. 13 516 Yes. Q. 14 Α. And they were only got through the services of the staff within that office. 15 14:57 16 517 Yes. Q. 17 And another file in relation to Operation Loki that Α. 18 Garda Keogh had suggested was stolen was obtained from Inspector Farrell in his office. 19 20 518 Yes. 0. 14:57 He had it under lock and key. 21 Α. 22 Yes. And did you in fact discover that Garda A had 519 Q. 23 provided those files to Inspector Farrell for 24 safekeeping? 25 That particular one, I understand that Garda A supplied 14:57 Α.

The 26th June?

26

27

28

29

520

Q.

Α.

the drugs, was that 26th June of 2014?

that to Inspector Farrell, yes.

Now, on the occasion when you were I think looking for

- 1 521 Q. When you searched the store for another purpose?
- 2 A. I was in the station on the 26th June and I am aware
- 3 that the store referred to by the reporter, close to
- 4 the detective office or whatever, that was used to
- 5 house Loki files, we searched that both for Loki files

14:58

14:59

- and for video library, so to speak.
- 7 522 Q. Yes. I think part of Garda Keogh's statement referred
- 8 to the practice of DVDs being stolen on searches by
- 9 members of the Gardaí, in particular I think Garda A,
- and then being kept in this storeroom?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 523 Q. As I understand your search and your statement, you
- found no trace of any such DVDs at all?
- 14 A. We found nothing to support that.
- 15 524 Q. You appear to have picked up on a suggestion that Chief 14:58
- 16 Superintendent Curran had given instructions or even
- 17 attended at Athlone Garda Station on some occasion to
- 18 clear out the store?
- 19 A. Yeah.
- 20 525 Q. Have it cleared out, is that right?
- 21 A. That was what Garda Keogh had said to us; that the
- 22 chief had been down and removed whatever from the
- 23 store.
- 24 526 Q. Yes. It would appear from your statement that you
- contacted him, was that by phone?
- 26 A. It was by phone, yeah.
- 27 527 Q. Did you ever require a statement from him or would that
- 28 be normal course?
- 29 A. No. because we --

- 1 528 Q. To deal with that allegation by way of a written --
- 2 A. We investigated the allegation and the houses that were
- 3 searched and the people that were in the houses in
- 4 relation to specific stuff that was mentioned, there
- 5 was a book mentioned about a hundred and something, I'm 14:59
- 6 not sure what it was.
- 7 529 Q. CHAIRMAN: 1001.
- 8 A. Whatever it was. We interviewed those people and they
- 9 had no recollection of the book ever being in the house
- or anything being taken from the house. We interviewed 14:59
- the guards involved in the searches and they said they
- weren't aware of this kit bag coming back with DVDs and
- stuff like that. There was only three or four of them
- in the drugs office at the particular time. So we had
- no evidence as such to suggest that there was ever
- anything in there other than what Garda Keogh had said

- 17 to us and we tried to bring that to a conclusion by
- 18 those interviews.
- 19 530 Q. Yes. I mean, it might be thought to be a lacuna if had
- you no written documentation relating to the issue from 15:00
- the person he had perhaps suspected of being involved
- 22 in it?
- 23 A. We hadn't anything from them, nor could they recollect
- 24 anything of that nature happening. Now that may appear
- in statements taken from those people, because they
- 26 would have come up in other matters of the
- 27 investigation.
- 28 531 Q. Yes. Now, you kept in touch with Garda Keogh, is that
- correct, and he was seeking the names of the

- 1 investigation team, is that right?
- 2 A. Yes, correct.
- 3 532 Q. Were they provided without any difficulty to him?
- 4 A. Absolutely, yes.
- 5 533 Q. Can you recollect was he complaining at this stage in

15:01

15:01

- 6 June or in early July about any investigations that
- 7 were taking place?
- 8 A. He had made reference to -- which he did on the first
- 9 day that we met him, in relation to both McHugh and an
- O'Neill, matters that he said that were complaints made 15:01
- 11 against him.
- 12 534 Q. Yes.
- 13 A. And had stated to us that he had gone to GSOC about
- those.
- 15 535 Q. Yes, that he had gone to GSOC. But was he anxious for
- those complaints to be included within the scope of
- 17 your investigation and did you receive correspondence,
- indeed, from Superintendent McBrien on that point?
- 19 A. Yeah. I probably agree that maybe he was anxious that
- we do it. But having spoken with the team and spoken
- with the assistant commissioner, we didn't feel that it
- 22 would be correct that we would be investigating him and
- investigating his complaint. So I know correspondence
- 24 -- there was a correspondence exchange in relation to
- it and I think I wrote on it to suggest that any
- 26 matters of that nature should be investigated locally,
- that we were investigating Garda Keogh's complaint.
- 28 536 Q. Yes. At that point in time were you aware of any issue
- that had arisen in relation to the creation of an

1			intelligence entry or an intelligence check on Pulse	
2			that Garda Keogh had been involved in?	
3		Α.	I was. Garda Keogh advised me that his chief had been	
4			on to the or the superintendent had asked him about	
5			it and that the chief was putting pressure on her in	15:02
6			relation to it. So I explained to him that the chief	
7			had an obligation to ensure that anything that was put	
8			on the system was true and racket.	
9	537	Q.	Yes. Well, was that with a view to encouraging him to	
10			comply with the requirements of the chief or the	15:02
11			superintendent?	
12		Α.	But I don't think it was my position to advise him	
13			whether to whether or not I advised him as to what	
14			the chief was asking in relation to it. He then	
15			advised me of where the information had come from.	15:03
16	538	Q.	Yes. He advised you, did he, of his rendezvous with a	
17			person in the Galway area?	
18		Α.	He did, indeed, yes.	
19	539	Q.	Earlier, and his note of same, is that right?	
20		Α.	Yes.	15:03
21	540	Q.	And he provided that in due course, is that correct?	
22		Α.	He did, yeah, and the intelligence that was created had	
23			come from that same person.	
24	541	Q.	Well, had you been in contact with Chief Superintendent	
25			Curran in relation to that matter, because Chief	15:03
26			Superintendent Curran told the Tribunal that he took	
27			some solace in the fact that you had been a CHIS	
28			controller, is that right?	
29		Α.	That's correct, yeah. Yeah.	

- 1 542 Q. Did you have any conversation about that issue?
- 2 A. Chief Superintendent Curran rang me in relation to it,
- 3 I'm not sure of the dates in relation to it but I know
- 4 it wasn't on the same day that I had rang previously,
- 5 in relation to the thing, and in fairness to him, he

15:04

15:04

15:04

- 6 said, I'm not asking you about the investigation, I
- 7 don't want to know anything about the investigation.
- 8 He said, are you aware of the intelligence and are you
- 9 aware where it came from? And I told him that I was
- aware where it came from and he said, okay. And there
- was no further conversation as far as I'm concerned
- 12 after that.
- 13 543 Q. Yes. But was he concerned to know that there was said
- to be an informant for that information, leaving aside
- the issue of the identity?
- 16 A. I think he was relieved to know that I was aware of who
- this person was, who was the person, I won't say the
- author of the thing but who supplied the information to
- 19 Garda Keogh. I think he was relieved when I told him
- that I was aware of that person.
- 21 544 Q. Yes. In any event, I think you received a letter from
- 22 Garda Keogh on the 6th August and you've provided that
- as an annex to your statement, at page 3945.
- 24 A. Yeah.
- 25 545 Q. We saw the handwritten version of it earlier?
- 26 A. Mm-hmm.
- 27 546 Q. But I think the first paragraph relates to the person
- 28 who he had confirmed had provided the information to
- 29 him?

2 547 were you concerned to take steps then to try and Q. 3 reassure the person what would happen? This person? 4 Α. 5 548 Yes. Q. 15:05 6 I tried to reassure him from the very outset, because Α. from the outset it was obvious that he didn't want to 7 8 comply with us, basically, and he didn't want to get involved. I tried to reassure him in relation to he 9 getting involved with us, how we would handle it, how 10 15:06 11 we would manage it, what supports would be in place in 12 relation to him. 13 I suppose you weren't in a position at this point to 549 Ο. 14 reassure Garda Keogh that matters would turn out 15 satisfactorily? 15:06 16 Sorry, I didn't quite get the question. Α. 17 Well, what contact had you had with this person at this 550 Q. 18 point in time? 19 I'm sorry, I'd have to reflect on notes. I just can't Α. 20 remember dates and stuff. 15:06 21 551 Yes. Q. 22 Yeah. Α. 23 552 Well, would you like to look at your notes for this 0. 24 date? The notes have been disclosed. 25 Α. 15:06 26 553 Yes. You've notes for this, 11324. You probably Ο. 27 didn't get the letter on that date. You report

1

28

29

Α.

Correct.

receiving the letter on 11326.

Τ			"Received letters from garda Nick Keogh re call to	
2			and his dissatisfaction with investigation. Met AC	
3			with Ó Cualáin and advised him of same. AC advised we	
4			should take no further action until matter is sorted.	
5			Spoke about"	15:07
6				
7			What is that? After "Nyland" is that relevant? "And	
8			he confirmed that a report had been sent outlining the	
9			position."	
10		Α.	I'm not sure. That might be prior to I think did he	15:08
11			meet him on the 13th August as a result of that letter?	
12	554	Q.	Yes.	
13		Α.	Yeah.	
14	555	Q.	But just going back to the letter for the moment at	
15			3945.	15:08
16		Α.	Okay.	
17	556	Q.	In the third paragraph he raises a different issue	
18			here.	
19				
20			"When I met AC Ó Cualáin and yourself for the first	15:08
21			time in Portumna, I outlined the fact that without a	
22			suspension being issued people would be reluctant to	
23			come forward and that goes for members of the public	
24			such as [blank] and gardaí. I am concerned in	
25			particular that gardaí who tend to volunteer	15:09
26			information have become reluctant to talk to your	
27			investigation team. The manner in which this	
28			investigation is being conducted is actually	
29			obstructing this investigation.	

Τ				
2			I do have faith in An Garda Síochána and hope I did the	
3			right thing in volunteering such confidential	
4			information to yourselves. Unlike many other Garda	
5			regions in the country, Western Region has an excellent	15:09
6			reputation. I feel obliged to again inform you of my	
7			concerns. "	
8		Α.	Yeah.	
9	557	Q.	Now, it may be that when he's referring to the manner	
10			of the investigation there that he's talking about the	15:09
11			fact that statements were being taken	
12		Α.	I think it might be more in relation to the	
13			non-suspension of	
14	558	Q.	Is that the way you interpret that?	
15		Α.	I think so, yeah.	15:09
16	559	Q.	Had you considered that to be an issue or had you	
17			thought about it?	
18		Α.	Well, I know following this letter that we met with	
19			Garda Keogh.	
20	560	Q.	Yes.	15:10
21		Α.	Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin and myself.	
22	561	Q.	Yes.	
23		Α.	That topic came up and the commissioner explained to	
24			him in relation to a high bar that was required.	
25	562	Q.	Yes.	15:10
26		Α.	And that there was certain criteria to be met and had	
27			he anything to add to suggest that the suspension	
28			should be right. As a result of that, the	
29			commissioner I think wrote to HRM in relation to it and	

1			there was a subsequent meeting with Chief	
2			Superintendent Curran and Superintendent McBrien, just	
3			in relation to any issue that had been raised by Garda	
4			Keogh in that regard.	
5	563	Q.	Yes. Well, you did go on to meet him, as you say, on	15:10
6			the 13th August?	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	564	Q.	There's a typed copy of your note at 3946?	
9		Α.	I have it here, yes.	
10	565	Q.	It's a different note from the note in the diary, but	15:11
11			it was kept as a separate note, is that right?	
12		Α.	That was a note that was taken during the course of our	
13			meeting with Garda Keogh.	
14	566	Q.	Yes.	
15				15:11
16			"the assistant commissioner outlined concerned re	
17			report received from Garda Keogh and meeting with."	
18				
19			Such and such.	
20				15:11
21			"Section 5 Disclosures Act 2014 explained and	
22			governance of same - going to GSOC re other	
23			compl ai nts. "	
24				
25			Now, I think you had become aware that the Act had now	15:11
26			come into force, isn't that right?	
27		Α.	Yeah, there was a change in or about that time, yeah.	
28	567	Q.	And the regulations that you were investigating under	
29			had been revoked. did vou know that?	

		Α.	I did, year, but it could continue once a compianit was	
2			made, that we could continue in the manner in which we	
3			were going.	
4	568	Q.	That's what I am just asking you, is that what you	
5			interpret this reference here that you've taken down,	15:12
6			the governance of same?	
7		Α.	That's how the AC explained it to him.	
8	569	Q.	Yes. And "going to GSOC re other complaints"?	
9		Α.	Yeah, he stated there, that was in relation to the	
10			O'Neill and the McHugh matters.	15:12
11	570	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	That he was going to GSOC in relation to those.	
13	571	Q.	Is that what he was telling you that he was going to	
14			do?	
15		Α.	Yes.	15:12
16	572	Q.	And you weren't advising him to do that, is that right?	
17		Α.	No, we told him he's quite entitled to do what he	
18			wished to do.	
19	573	Q.	Yes.	
20		Α.	I think what was emphasised there was that if he was	15:12
21			going to go to GSOC, and I think what the AC was	
22			saying, that is it was important that it was documented	
23			and it was got down in writing, whoever he did it with.	
24	574	Q.	Yes. It goes on to say then:	
25				15:13
26			"AC explains he is investigating original complaint.	
27			Olivia O'Neill is one of the matters he is going to	
28			GSOC about. Nicholas Keogh aware of Act 2014. AC	
29			explains that we will continue. Nicholas Keogh happy	

			and states it is up to [so and so] if he wants to go to	
2			GSOC or not, as long as he gets it down in writing."	
3				
4			So were you trying to reassure Garda Keogh or was the	
5			assistant commissioner trying to reassure Garda Keogh	15:13
6			that the investigation under the regulations was	
7			continuing and that he needed to go to GSOC with that	
8			or that he could bring the other thing to GSOC?	
9		Α.	But it wasn't that he needed to go. I will just read	
10			it here now again.	15:13
11	575	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	That may not be that could be a reference in	
13			relation to the man he had met in Galway.	
14	576	Q.	Yes.	
15		Α.	Because indicated that he told him to go to GSOC.	15:13
16	577	Q.	Yes.	
17		Α.	If he wasn't happy with things.	
18	578	Q.	But he was talking going to GSOC himself, I thought you	
19			told us that a moment ago, in the third line?	
20		Α.	Oh yeah, that was going to GSOC in relation to McHugh	15:14
21			and the O'Neill case.	
22	579	Q.	Yes, okay. The issues raised then.	
23				
24			"1. Nobody will talk unless he is suspended. Garda or	
25			public. Re Garda A hanging around during investigation	15:14
26			concerned about this. AC stated we will try to do our	
27			interviews at another station if we can. Taking focus	
28			of the investigation away from where he works. AC to	
29			write to HRM regarding suspension. High bar. One	

Т			major concern - do our investigation when he is not	
2			around, rest days etcetera. AC explains that he is	
3			entitled to be there, but that we will try to focus of	
4			i nvesti gati on. "	
5				15:14
6			Is the entitlement there, the entitlement of Garda A to	
7			be there, is that it?	
8		Α.	I think that's what the AC was suggesting. What he was	
9			saying was that he was around even though he was on	
10			rest days, etcetera, and the AC explained to him that	15:15
11			he's entitled to be there, you know, that we would try	
12			and move our investigation, the focus of our	
13			investigation away.	
14	580	Q.	Yes. An issue that has arisen is as to whether Garda	
15			Keogh was told or knew from what was said to him that	15:15
16			he would have to consent to provide a statement, to	
17			allow a statement to be provided to HRM in the context	
18			of a suspension being considered. Do you understand	
19			that?	
20		Α.	Yeah. I know and I'm not sure when, that he was	15:15
21			advised that there was a very high bar in relation to	
22			suspension and stuff and that his statement would be	
23			required to help him in the process.	
24	581	Q.	Yes. There is reference to high bar there in the	
25			middle of the page?	15:15
26		Α.	Yeah, I see that, yeah.	
27	582	Q.	So is that the occasion when you think he was informed	
28			that he would need to agree to release a statement to	
29			HRM to enable a suspension to be considered?	

Τ		Α.	I don't know if it was put like that, that he would	
2			need to agree to it. I would be more of the opinion	
3			that it was suggested that, you know, for them to make	
4			a decision it would be helpful for his statement to be	
5			given or allowed to be given to him, you know. And	15:16
6			again, we couldn't give his statement without his	
7			consent. I think that is borne out by a text I	
8			received from him at some stage to say that he wouldn't	
9			provide a statement.	
10	583	Q.	Yes. Perhaps we will just look at that, it's page	15:16
11			13275, Volume 14. It's the entry for the 23rd there.	
12		Α.	The 23rd, yes.	
13	584	Q.	It says:	
14				
15			"12: 00-10: 00pm PO. "	15:16
16				
17			Public office.	
18				
19			"14:44 D/Superintendent rang to say that there was a	
20			meeting today in HQ Phoenix Park, AC Ó Cualáin and	15:17
21			Superintendent McBrien. I wonder was CS Mullingar or	
22			CS Glacken. Wants to give statement to HRM."	
23				
24			So do you recall raising the issue with him on that	
25			occasion?	15:17
26		Α.	In relation to the date, I don't know when the issue	
27			was actually risen with him first. But I do recall	
28			getting a text from him to say that he wouldn't	
29			disclose his statement to HRM - T think he had a	

1			certain fear of HRM, that his statement could be used	
2			for something otherwise.	
3	585	Q.	Yes. We will come back then to the issue of the text.	
4			That's just his diary entry obviously there, at the	
5			moment. Just returning to your note of that meeting.	15:17
6			You have note number 2 there, this is on page 3946,	
7			down the page?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	586	Q.	"2. Suspension. AC invites NK re any other reason -	
10			no just the hanging around. Haven't heard that Garda A	15:18
11			had asked anyone what they did or said.	
12				
13			AC explains that enquiries will be stalled for the time	
14			bei ng. "	
15				15:18
16			First of all, in relation to that, it would seem that	
17			the assistant commissioner was trying to ascertain were	
18			there some other reasons on foot of which he might be	
19			suspended.	
20		Α.	Yeah, that seems to be what's yeah.	15:18
21	587	Q.	Had you discussed the basis of suspension with the	
22			assistant commissioner before the meeting?	
23		Α.	I believe we had discussed it at some stage, yes. It	
24			was raised from an early point like and, yes, we had	
25			discussed it.	15:19
26	588	Q.	What was the position then at that time when you	
27			discussed it?	
28		Α.	I know advice from HRM was sought and I know that the	
29			AC got a letter indicating the requirements for	

1			suspension of anyone.	
2	589	Q.	Yes. Assistant Commissioner Fanning I think, if I am	
3			not mistaken, sent a letter to the assistant	
4			commissioner drawing attention to the policy document,	
5			is that right? Perhaps I have the personnel wrong?	15:19
6		Α.	I vaguely remember something like that, yes.	
7	590	Q.	Did you see the policy document?	
8		Α.	I may have. I may have. I think I may have, yeah.	
9	591	Q.	Okay. The reference to the assistant commissioner	
10			saying the inquiries will be stalled for the time	15:19
11			being, could you help explain that?	
12		Α.	Well, I think where that is coming from is that we	
13			would stall until we got a direction in relation to the	
14			suspension. That's my reading of that.	
15	592	Q.	Until the assistant commissioner got a direction?	15:20
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	593	Q.	It then records:	
18				
19			"Happy with investigation. No leaks, etcetera."	
20				15:20
21			Is that Garda Keogh saying that?	
22		Α.	That's Garda Keogh saying that, yeah.	
23	594	Q.	"Assistant commissioner explains that matter is being	
24			investigated as a confidential reporter and went to the	
25			public forum and know who you are for that reason."	15:20
26				
27			Can you explain the context of that note?	
28		Α.	My understanding of that was that unfortunately Garda	
29			Keogh had gone to a Dáil release in relation to it and	

1			it probably would have put us on the back foot from an	
2			investigative point of view.	
3	595	Q.	Why do you say that or what do you base that on?	
4		Α.	I don't know what context that came up on there. I	
5			honestly don't know. Just as I say, they are rough	15:21
6			notes that I took.	
7	596	Q.	Yes. But you are saying it would have probably put us	
8			on the back foot from an investigative point of view.	
9			Are you saying it hampered or might have hampered the	
10			investigation?	15:21
11		Α.	I don't think it helped the investigation.	
12	597	Q.	Yes. Well, if it didn't help it, did it hinder it?	
13		Α.	It possibly did from the point of view in respect of	
14			the phone and the fact that I outlined that we got	
15			nothing text wise in respect of that person named or	15:21
16			that person's name didn't come up in the contact. Now	
17			I am summarising, I don't know.	
18	598	Q.	You are simply saying you had an absence of evidence on	
19			that point, is that right?	
20		Α.	There seemed to be, yeah.	15:21
21	599	Q.	It concludes on this page:	
22				
23			"Two issues raised in statement explained re disclosure	
24			to DPP. No problem with disclosure of either issues	
25			and statement made and signed giving consent."	15:22
26		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
27	600	Q.	And that was an issue which related to two court cases	
28			that had been in the pipeline, isn't that right?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 601 Q. And prosecuted.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 602 Q. You had to consult with the DPP about --
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 603 Q. -- the matters raised by Garda Keogh insofar as it

15:22

15:22

15:22

- 6 might affect it, isn't that right?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 604 Q. And he was prepared to give his consent for that
- 9 purpose?
- 10 A. He was, that his statement would be allowed to be
- 11 disclosed for that purpose, yeah.
- 12 605 Q. There's some entries then on the next page. He gave
- 13 you another number that he had for Garda A. Were those
- 14 other numbers then by text that he was passing on to
- 15 you, 1 and 2?
- 16 A. No. I think that he had got them by text from that
- 17 same person in Galway.
- 18 606 Q. Yes, he had got them.
- 19 A. Yeah.
- 20 607 Q. But he was passing them on, is that right?
- 21 A. Passing them on, yeah.
- 22 608 Q. Just before I go to September, Superintendent McBrien
- has told us that on an occasion when you were visiting
- 24 Athlone, you were coming back from a coffee perhaps,
- back to the station or maybe to the car park, and you
- 26 made a remark about Garda Keogh's tax on his car?
- 27 A. Okay.
- 28 609 Q. Do you recall doing that?
- 29 A. I do.

- 1 610 Q. Okay. Can you help us fix the date of that? Because
- we know obviously from your statement you were in
- 3 Athlone on the 26th June, 16th July and again on the
- 4 6th August of 2014.
- 5 A. It was in relation to a day that we met Garda Keogh in

15:24

15:24

15.24

- 6 a car park up by B&Q. I think it's B&Q.
- 7 611 Q. This is some other person we're not concerned with.
- 8 You just named somebody there. You met somebody?
- 9 A. Garda Keogh.
- 10 612 Q. Garda Keogh, I'M sorry. I thought it was somebody
- 11 else?
- 12 A. We met Garda Keogh in a car park and he parked near
- where I was.
- 14 613 Q. Yes.
- A. As he was leaving, I noticed that he had a CVR cert on 15:24
- the window, or a cert on the window.
- 17 614 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. Because of that, it struck me that he was driving a
- 19 commercial vehicle. Now, I had concerns from the point
- of view that he was travelling to meet me in a vehicle
- that I didn't know was properly taxed or insured. I
- was aware that he would have to get written consent to
- use his vehicle to attend such meetings and my concern
- 24 was for him. I wasn't aware whether the tax was in,
- out, tax was private or commercial. I did not check
- 26 it.
- 27 615 Q. Yes.
- A. I said it as a passing comment to the superintendent,
- because he told me that he trusted the superintendent

- 1 and he good time for her.
- 2 616 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. It was a remark, I just made it to her because she
- 4 would be the one providing consent for him to use his
- 5 private car on duty to meet me.
- 6 617 Q. Yes. You were obviously familiar with the regulations

15:25

15:25

15:25

- 7 that if he was using a private car the issue might
- 8 arise of an expense claim in relation to it on duty, is
- 9 that it?
- 10 A. No, it was nothing to do with expenses.
- 11 618 Q. Nothing to do with expenses?
- 12 A. Absolutely nothing, didn't even dawn on me.
- 13 619 O. So I just want to be clear then, was this after the
- 14 meeting that you had with Garda Keogh on the 13th that
- 15 we were just looking at there?
- 16 A. No, the 13th was in Oranmore, I understand.
- 17 620 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. It wasn't -- I think -- I'm not sure, he turned up at
- one stage he told me in his mother's car, that his own
- car was -- something was being done with it or
- 21 something like that.
- 22 621 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. This was not on that occasion, nor was it in Oranmore.
- I am happy that it was in the car park in Athlone, in
- 25 Athlone shopping centre.
- 26 622 Q. In Athlone shopping centre?
- 27 A. That's where we would have arranged to meet him.
- 28 623 Q. Okay. What was the purpose of that meeting, just by
- the way?

- 1 A. I can't recall. I can't recall.
- 2 624 Q. Right. In any event, the meeting in Portumna was on
- 3 the 13th and it was before that, is that right?
- 4 A. I have a feeling it may have been before that. I'm not
- one hundred percent sure and I couldn't swear. I
- 6 didn't make any note of it because it was insignificant

15:26

- 7 to me, you know. It was just something I had seen. I
- 8 couldn't unsee it and I felt I was obliged just to do
- 9 something.
- 10 625 Q. Yes. And just to be clear, you're not relating it any
- 11 way to the propriety of claiming expenses --
- 12 A. No.
- 13 626 Q. -- for using the car to come and meet you?
- 14 A. Absolutely not.
- 15 627 Q. Or any other official duty?
- 16 A. Absolutely not.
- 17 628 Q. What was the issue then?
- 18 A. My concern was that he was coming to meet me in a
- vehicle that may not be insured properly. Should
- 20 anything happen him, I wouldn't have it on my conscious 15:26
- and I didn't want to have it on my conscious.
- 22 629 Q. I see. I see. Is there any reason why you perhaps
- 23 wouldn't have mentioned it to him on the occasion of
- 24 meeting him in Portumna on the 13th August?
- A. I wasn't going to get involved in anything personal in
- relation to him. I was investigating his complaint and
- I had formed a trust with him and I wanted to maintain
- that trust.
- 29 630 Q. But then the purposes of mentioning it to

1 Superintendent McBrien, can you recollect how many days after you would have seen the cert that you mentioned 2 3 it to her? It could have been on the same day, I don't know. 4 Α. 5 don't know. 15:27 6 631 okay. Just to go back to the purpose of my question: Q. what was the purpose of mentioning it to her? 7 8 Because I felt that she would -- she would look at it. Α. address it, in whatever way it needed to be addressed. 9 The fact that he told me that he trusted her and that 10 15:27 11 he had good time for her and that he got on well with 12 her, I assumed it would be the best person to deal with 13 it. I didn't discuss it with anybody else. 14 632 0. Yes. 15 That's the only person I said it to. Α. 15:27 16 633 Yes. And did you know or did you enquire whether he Ο. 17 had any outstanding claims in respect of travelling 18 matters? 19 No, no. Α. Or you didn't know whether she had sanctioned any? 20 634 0. 15:28 21 Α. 22 And hadn't received others? 635 0. 23 No. Α. 24 Nothing like that? 636 Q. 25 She didn't mention it to me any more, I didn't Α. 15:28 26 mention it to her any more. I didn't follow it up with 27 paper or I didn't make a note of it. 28 But had it anything to do with his protected 637 Q.

disclosures?

- 1 A. Sorry?
- 2 638 Q. Your observation and reporting of it?
- A. No. No. It was just out of concerned for Garda Keogh himself.
- 5 639 Q. But I mean, was it your concern that he should rectify 15:28 it?
- A. I didn't know. It could well have been taxed as a private vehicle, I didn't know. But when I saw that there wasn't a cert on it, that it was a CVR cert,
- whatever the name is for them is, I then realised that there's a possibility that things mightn't be right.
- 12 CHAIRMAN: The CVR is commercial aspect of it.
- 13 A. The commercial, and that's very noticeable on a 14 windscreen. It was beside me, I saw it.
- 15 640 Q. CHAIRMAN: You noticed that and in your mind, if I am understanding, is not the question of expenses, but the fact that to use the vehicle for official purposes,

- i.e. going to meet you, everything had to be in order, is that right?
- 20 A. Exactly. Exactly.
- 21 641 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 22 A. They're matters I am dealing with people myself every
- 23 day, where I have to get the consent of people, and a
- lot of the time in respect of insurance, and I have given people advice over the years in relation to it,
- for an extra €20 or something the insurance company
- 27 will put down covered to use vehicle while on duty as a
- 28 member of the Garda Síochána.
- 29 642 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.

1		Α.	It gives absolute cover for anybody in your vehicle.	
2	643	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: But was there any part of your concern	
3			that you wanted to have a whistleblower, as it were,	
4			who hadn't got any issues, that you would have a	
5			whistleblower, as it were, with no	15:29
6		Α.	Nothing like that dawned on me. As I say, I saw it, I	
7			couldn't unsee it and I felt I had to do something	
8			about it. I did as little as I possibly could in	
9			relation to it.	
10	644	Q.	Obviously just from the point of view of your contact	15:30
11			with Garda Keogh, you were the single point of contact	
12			on behalf of the assistant commissioner in connection	
13			with the investigation?	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	645	Q.	You've documented and he has documented a very large	15:30
16			number of contacts, one to the other, by phone, text	
17			and letter, etcetera	
18		Α.	Correct.	
19	646	Q.	And I am just wondering, is there any particular reason	
20			why you maybe didn't raise it directly with him and	15:30
21			say, look, just in case anything should happen to you,	
22			you should have a look at this now yourself?	
23		Α.	Sorry, I didn't document the thing with the tax?	
24	647	Q.	That you didn't raise it directly with Garda Keogh on	

any of these occasions?

25

26

27

28

29

Α.

No, I didn't want to get involved with Garda Keogh in

relation to his personal aspects of vehicles and stuff

like that. I tried to establish a trust with Garda

Keogh and to do anything like that, I think I would

1			have shattered it from the outset.	
2	648	Q.	Okay. So you were just focusing on what you were meant	
3			to be doing and nothing else?	
4		Α.	There was no motive behind it or anything like that.	
5			It was something, as I said, I had seen, I couldn't	15:31
6			unsee it and I felt I had to do something and that's	
7			what I did.	
8	649	Q.	In any event, I think you gave him, you gave him an	
9			update on the investigation a few days later, is that	
10			right?	15:31
11		Α.	I would say on every occasion that I spoke with Garda	
12			Keogh that he would have got an update, at least was	
13			brought up-to-date with where we stood on the	
14			investigation.	
15	650	Q.	Yes.	15:31
16		Α.	I tried to keep him as updated as possible as I could.	
17	651	Q.	Yes. Just in terms of the formality of it, did you	
18			understand that you were being required either by the	
19			Commissioner or the assistant commissioner to update	
20			him as confidential reporter under the charter or the	15:32
21			regulation?	
22		Α.	Well, AC Ó Cualáin had suggested to me that I make sure	
23			that he was kept updated on the progress at all times.	
24	652	Q.	Yes. In any event, you had a meeting in headquarters	
25			with AC Ó Cualáin, the Chief Superintendent Curran and	15:32
26			Superintendent McBrien on the 23rd September, isn't	
27			that correct?	
28		Α.	I personally thought it might have been later, but I	
29			will take your word if you say that.	

1	653	Q.	Well that's what you said in your statement?	
2		Α.	Is it? Yeah, I just	
3	654	Q.	Perhaps we will just look at that, at the bottom of	
4			page 3901.	
5		Α.	Yes.	15:33
6	655	Q.	You say, in the second line of the last paragraph:	
7				
8			"A discussion took place around the question of	
9			suspension of Garda A. There was agreement that there	
10			was no local or other issues to justify the suspension	15:33
11			of Garda A at this time. Neither the chief	
12			superintendent nor the superintendent had received any	
13			complaints regarding Garda A following our	
14			investigation or visit to Athlone Garda Station."	
15				15:33
16			I think you made a note of that. If we look at page	
17			11329, your note of this meeting. The first part is	
18			what is contained in your statement. I can't quite	
19			make out the rest of it. You see the line after Garda	
20			A there, could you read that out for us?	15:34
21		Α.	"At this time"?	
22	656	Q.	Yes. "At this time" then continue on. Is that	
23			"neither have received any complaint regarding Garda	
24			A. "	
25		Α.	Yeah, "nei ther have received any complaints regarding	15:34
26			Garda A following our investigation or visits to	
27			Athlone station."	
28	657	Q.	"They were advised that he had"	

1				
2		Α.	" we had moved our investigation from the station	
3			following concerns raised by Nick Keogh."	
4	658	Q.	Yes. "Superintendent McBrien"	
5				15:34
6		Α.	" spoke of an occasion when Nick Keogh had mentioned	
7			to her that Garda A, who carries a firearm, but stated	
8			that he was"	
9			CHAIRMAN: "Was carrying a firearm".	
10		Α.	Sorry, "was carrying a firearm." I can't read my own	15:35
11			writing. "But he"	
12			CHAIRMAN: "But stated that".	
13			MR. McGUINNESS: "That he did not feel under any	
14			threat".	
15			CHAIRMAN: "But stated that he Nick did not feel under	15:35
16			any threat".	
17		Α.	Yeah.	
18	659	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: was that a concern that Garda Keogh	
19			had raised with you at any stage about Garda A and	
20			access to firearms?	15:35
21		Α.	He mentioned firearms on a number of occasions. On one	
22			occasion it was in relation to unnamed persons in a	
23			station putting a gun in a mouth. As a result of that	
24			I immediately contacted his superintendent in relation	
25			to it, out of concern for his welfare and aspects	15:35
26			surrounding that. On another occasion he mentioned,	
27			I'm not sure was it shots being fired or two people	
28			being shot in the Garda station, and again I made	
29			contact with his superintendent in respect of that.	

- 1 660 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. Both of those might have been when he was under the
- 3 influence of drink.
- 4 661 Q. Yes. Later that month, you do appear to have been
- 5 pressing Garda Keogh to disclose his statement to HR,

15:37

15:37

15:37

- 6 because you have a note in your diary at page 11331, if
- 7 we perhaps just look at that. 11331?
- 8 A. Yeah.
- 9 662 Q. It's an entry for the 28th. Maybe it is the -- the
- 10 28th September, if we go up the page, please.
- 11 A. Yeah.
- 12 663 Q. Just in the middle:
- 13
- "Phone call to Nick Keogh re disclosure of his
- 15 statement to HRM. He declined to consent."
- 16 A. Yeah.
- 17 664 Q. So it doesn't appear to be a text as such?
- 18 A. I think there might be a text preceding that and it was
- as a result of the text that I would have made the
- 20 call. I think, from my recollection.
- 21 665 Q. All right.
- 22 A. Yeah.
- 23 666 Q. So you do appear to be have been pressing him on that.
- 24 Have you any doubt that you made him aware it was
- required for the purpose of suspension consideration?
- 26 A. I have no doubt that I said to him that it would help
- 27 them in relation to making a decision. But I cannot
- 28 recall using that phrase -- that terminology.
- 29 667 Q. Yes. Well, can you recall what terminology you did

Т			use?	
2		Α.	It would be asking him if he wished to disclose his	
3			statement and that it would help HRM in making a	
4			decision as to suspension.	
5	668	Q.	All right. It was as clear as that then?	15:37
6		Α.	It would be as clear as that, absolutely, yeah.	
7	669	Q.	Thank you. Just going back then to your efforts to	
8			contact the Galway person, I am going to refer to the	
9			person as the Galway person.	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:38
11	670	Q.	At page 3902 of your statement, you detail attempts	
12			there to contact him and they appear to have been going	
13			on in early July 2014?	
14		Α.	I think even for June sometime, possibly.	
15	671	Q.	Is that right? You think you started in June?	15:38
16		Α.	I think it was sometime in June, yeah.	
17	672	Q.	Okay. You pursued him, if you go down to the bottom of	
18			the page, in August, September, November, and if we go	
19			on to page 3903, I think you succeeded in persuading	
20			him to meet you on 12th December 2014, isn't that	15:39
21			correct?	
22		Α.	Correct, yeah.	
23	673	Q.	You set out what happened there, I think the Tribunal	
24			has heard the results of it?	
25		Α.	Just for the record, in relation to this particular	15:39
26			period, I went to great extremes to try and make	
27			contact with him, having met him first and he	
28			suggesting to us that he didn't want to get involved in	
29			stuff. I was hoping that we could push him that little	

- further. I thought that we might get him.
- 2 Unfortunately at the end it didn't happen. I included
- even going to his workplace, trying to get him to talk
- 4 to us. We visited the house that he had been in with a

15:40

15:40

15 · 41

- 5 partner, but unfortunately he had left that and we
- found a new address for him. So I went to a lot of
- 7 effort to try and establish contact with him and to try
- 8 and get him on board in the investigation.
- 9 674 Q. Garda Keogh had, of course, given you his own original
- 10 notes of the conversation from the night he had first
- met him?
- 12 A. Correct.
- 13 675 Q. Did you bring those to Galway to try and persuade him
- to sign those?
- 15 A. I'm not -- I don't believe we did. What we would have
- done -- in fact, they were original notes.
- 17 676 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. And we wouldn't have interfered with them. What we
- 19 would have done is brought extracts of what he said or
- a copy of what he said and put that to him.
- 21 677 Q. Yes. It's just he does appear to have agreed --
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 678 Q. -- that what he had said to Garda Keogh was a true
- 24 account. So you must have been able to read something
- to him?
- A. Well, as I said, we wouldn't have brought the original
- 27 notes, we brought a copy of them.
- 28 679 Q. Is that right?
- 29 A. Yeah. That would be my recollection.

- 1 680 Q. In any event, he made his position clear in signing a
- 2 statement saying that he didn't want to have anything
- 3 said entered in evidence?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 681 Q. And he never provided a signed account of anything that 15:41
- 6 he had said had happened?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 682 Q. Around this point in time I think you had received a
- 9 request from Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin to
- provide a report in relation to Garda Keogh, isn't that 15:41
- 11 right? Could we look at page 10836?
- 12 A. Sorry, 10 --
- 13 683 Q. 10836. That's in a different volume.
- 14 A. Okay.
- 15 684 Q. We will get that for you, if you wish. This was
- 16 Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin asking you to provide

- a report arising from a copy of a minute from the
- office of the Commissioner and it's asking:
- 19
- "Please confirm contact has been established with Garda 15:42
- 21 Keogh in respect of the Commissioner's direction. I
- 22 understand you are scheduled to meet him on Thursday,
- 11th September 2014 in Ballinasloe."
- 24 A. Okay.
- 25 685 Q. Now, this is dated, if we go down to the bottom of the
- page, December 2014. I think you provided a report in
- 27 relation to that, isn't that right?
- A. I believe so, yes.
- 29 686 Q. Could we look at page 10832. This is actually the date

T	that you met the other person. It says.	
2		
3	"With reference to the above and attached	
4	correspondence dated 27th November 2014, the following	
5	is reported.	15:43
6		
7	On 11th December 2014, confidential reporter was met by	
8	Detective Superintendent Declan Mulcahy and Detective	
9	Inspector Michael Coppinger at Ballinasloe Garda	
10	Station. Confidential reporter stated he had no issues	15:43
11	with this investigation and was content with how it was	
12	being progressed. Investigating Gardaí highlighted and	
13	showed an article to him from the Daily Mirror	
14	newspaper in which the reporter indicated that matters	
15	highlighted concerned separate issues. He further	15:43
16	informed Gardaí that he feels he is being harassed by	
17	senior management at Mullingar due to the following	
18	reasons:	
19	A. A Pulse check he previously done on the Pulse	
20	system.	15:43
21	B. Intelligence he placed on the Pulse system.	
22	C. Two alleged complaints made by Ms. Olivia O'Neill	
23	and Mr. Liam McHugh.	
24		
25	The confidential reporter informed Gardaí he had lodged	15:43
26	a complaint with GSOC concerning alleged harassment and	
27	is of the understanding that the Ombudsman Commission	
28	will investigate same on termination/conclusion of our	
29	i nvesti gati on.	

_				
2			Gardaí also spoke to him with regard to an article that	
3			appeared in an edition of the Irish Times newspaper	
4			dated 11th December 2014. The reporter outlined that	
5			he was surprised by such an article and informed Gardaí	15:44
6			that he had not spoken to Mr. Wallace and supplied such	
7			information. He informed Gardaí that a second	
8			whistleblower may have been responsible for forwarding	
9			such information for this article.	
10				15:44
11			The confidential reporter was reassured by	
12			investigating gardaí as to its determination to	
13			effectively investigate his allegations, that he will	
14			be treated with dignity and respect and informed if he	
15			feels that he is being harassed to report the matter	15:44
16			i mmedi atel y.	
17				
18			He was also once again offered the services of the	
19			empl oyment assistance officers."	
20				15:44
21			Now, that appears to be a confirmation on Garda Keogh's	
22			part that he believed he was being harassed by these	
23			matters?	
24		Α.	Yes, that's what he said, and I have given as it he	
25			said it to us.	15:45
26	687	Q.	I take it at this point in time none of these three	
27			matters, A, B, C there were new to you?	
28		Α.	No.	
29	688	Q.	He had previously given you a copy of a Pulse check, I	

- 1 think?
- 2 A. He had, yeah, or the Pulse intelligence created, yeah.
- 3 689 Q. You knew that he was complaining to GSOC about the
- 4 matters. But did you think that he was requiring you

15 · 46

15:46

15:46

- to do something about his report of harassment?
- 6 A. No. Not from -- I didn't take that from him.
- 7 690 Q. Okay. The second last sentence there, that you have
- 8 included that that you've informed him that if he feels
- 9 he is being harassed to report the matter immediately.
- 10 Would that be to report it to you or to somebody else?
- 11 A. The matter -- I don't believe it was -- we had
- 12 guidelines in relation to our investigation. I suppose
- our points were laid out in relation to it. Anything
- that came, you know, was channelled into that that was
- 15 written by our investigation, we would look at. These
- were matters that he had said he had gone to GSOC in
- 17 respect of and we weren't going to duplicate, I don't
- 18 believe, in relation to it.
- 19 691 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. You know, if the matter was with GSOC.
- 21 692 Q. Yes. But who was he to report the harassment to then?
- 22 Because you're not yourself referring to GSOC in that
- 23 sentence.
- A. I can only presume that it would be local management,
- if he had a problem. That's where any report would
- 26 start.
- 27 693 Q. Yes. Obviously you had your point of contact in
- 28 Athlone with Sergeant Curley?
- 29 A. Mm-hmm.

1	694	Q.	You knew he had been appointed by Superintendent	
2			McBrien. Did you not think it perhaps appropriate that	
3			you should report this to Superintendent McBrien at	
4			that time? Or did you presume she was aware of it all?	
5			Or did you take	15:47
6		Α.	To be honest with you, I can't recall if I spoke to her	
7			in relation to it. But as I say, I have documented it	
8			here.	
9	695	Q.	Yes. Just going on to the next page then. I think you	
10			just sent that up then, indicating you would be	15:47
11			reporting any further developments?	
12		Α.	Yeah. As somebody else gave evidence here yesterday or	
13			today in relation to the hierarchy of An Garda	
14			Síochána, that's how things work.	
15	696	Q.	Yes. Garda Keogh had at this same period made a	15:48
16			statement to you in relation to an alleged visit of	
17			Garda A to Ms. B's house in early December, isn't that	
18			correct, and his belief that Garda A had got a hold of	
19			his statement?	
20		Α.	I'm not sure if it was a statement.	15:48
21	697	Q.	Right.	
22		Α.	I'm open to correction now, I'm not sure it was a	
23			statement.	
24	698	Q.	Well he refers to it as some papers in the statement?	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:48
26	699	Q.	Elsewhere he refers there's a note in the diary	
27		Α.	Yeah, you're correct.	

28 700 Q. -- it's related to a fear that Garda A had been given

his statement?

- 1 A. Yeah.
- 2 701 Q. Did he raise that issue with you?
- 3 A. Did I what.
- 4 702 Q. Did he raise that issue with you?
- 5 A. He did. He said it to me, yes.
- 6 703 Q. And what did you advise him?
- 7 A. I told him it couldn't be possible, because the only

15:49

15:49

15:49

15 · 49

- 8 person that his statement was disclosed to was the
- 9 DPP's office. Now he had a copy of his statement
- 10 himself.
- 11 704 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. And I think he may have disclosed that to GSOC.
- 13 705 Q. Pardon? You think he may have --
- 14 A. Disclosed it to GSOC himself.
- 15 706 Q. To GSOC, Yes.
- 16 A. Yeah.
- 17 707 Q. And was that for the purpose of making a complaint to GSOC or just keeping them informed?
- dsoc or just keeping them informed?
- 19 A. I don't know. But he mentioned at some stage during
- the investigation that he disclosed his statement to
- GSOC.
- 22 708 Q. Yes. In any event, could we look at a document --
- 23 A. Just going back to that.
- 24 709 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. I think he also said in the same time that there had
- been a stabbing or something in the locality and that
- 27 Garda A came from Ms. B's house with paper under his
- arm and he felt that it was his statement. I think I
- asked him, why do you believe that it was your

Т			Statement or now would she have got it, and he	
2			suggested that maybe HRM gave it to her. Now I wasn't	
3			aware that HRM would have had a copy of his statement	
4			at that stage because he hadn't disclosed it himself.	
5	710	Q.	Yes. And you hadn't provided it to them?	15:5
6		Α.	Absolutely not. And if there is any reference to	
7			suggest that it was any of my team, that is absolutely	
8			and total nonsense.	
9	711	Q.	Yes. Could we look at document 8397? This is a report	
10			up to the secretary of the Commissioner. This	15:5
11			incorporates your previous report that we've seen. If	
12			we just continue down the page. There doesn't appear	
13			to be a reference on that page to further reporting any	
14			harassment.	
15		Α.	Okay.	15:5
16	712	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is that the assistant commissioner adopting	
17			your report to send to the Commissioner?	
18		Α.	Correct.	
19	713	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It's essentially the same thing?	
20		Α.	Same thing.	15:5
21	714	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Only it's under his name.	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	715	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It's your draft, so to speak?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	716	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And he is adopting it and saying, here's the	15:5
26			position; is that correct?	
27	717	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: well, there's some detail omitted and	
28			there's some extra material. This second last	
29			paragraph wasn't something that was included in your	

Т			report, for instance, isn't that correct? I am just	
2			wondering, can you enlighten us as to who it was	
3			envisaged would be spoken to there in the near future?	
4		Α.	Em, I presume it was Ms. B. I don't know off hand but	
5			I presume it might have been.	15:52
6	718	Q.	Well is that something that you would have informed the	
7			assistant commissioner of?	
8		Α.	The assistant commissioner was fully aware of the	
9			investigation at all times, where we stood.	
10	719	Q.	Yes.	15:52
11		Α.	Our plan, our strategy in relation to how we deal with	
12			it.	
13	720	Q.	It doesn't appear that Ms. B was approached again until	
14			the very early days of April of 2015?	
15		Α.	Yeah. I suppose the way you look at it, in relation to	15:52
16			the man from Galway, it took from June to December to	
17			try and see could we get him on board and eventually	
18			finish with him. We then there was other matters	
19			around, like all the matters that were investigated are	
20			not here before the Tribunal.	15:52
21	721	Q.	CHAIRMAN: This is not a man from Galway?	
22		Α.	This is not	
23	722	Q.	CHAIRMAN: we have been through that.	
24		Α.	We have been through them and we have just finished	
25			with them.	15:53
26	723	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes, this is another witness?	
27		Α.	Another witness, yeah.	
28	724	Ο.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. And you think it's Ms. B?	

A. I am thinking it is Ms. B from the reading of it.

- 1 725 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: Can we go back up to the previous
- page, Mr. Kavanagh. Thank you. Now, there is the
- 3 reference here to harassment in this paragraph there
- 4 that's visible at the bottom. It's passed up without
- 5 any further comment. Did you discuss the issue of
- 6 harassment with the assistant commissioner prior to him

15:54

15:54

15:54

- 7 sending this letter or on foot of your report that you
- 8 sent to him?
- 9 A. To be honest, I am not sure. I received the
- 10 correspondence, I wrote out what I did on my reply to
- 11 him...
- 12 726 Q. Yes?
- 13 A. And I am not -- I cannot say a hundred percent if I
- 14 did.
- 15 727 Q. Yes, okay. Is it perhaps likely, knowing that it had
- gone to GSOC and knowing that these things had arisen
- 17 locally, that you were satisfied that local management
- 18 knew about these issues?
- 19 A. I suppose you're never satisfied, you know. You try to
- do your best in relation to it and, you know, put it
- into the picture where somebody will deal with it. And
- I think the thing was that it was reported to GSOC,
- 23 GSOC had it on their books and I presume it was fair to
- assume at that stage that it was being investigated by
- 25 them.
- 26 728 Q. Yes. Perhaps we will look at a report slightly later
- in time then, following a conference that you had about
- the case. If we look at document 10839, which is a
- report of the 29th January. Again, this is being sent

1			up to keep the Commissioner informed. It's a follow	
2			on, as it says in the first paragraph. And it says in	
3			the second paragraph:	
4				
5			"I attended the most recent case conference held on	15:55
6			29th January 2015 at Oranmore Garda station, which was	
7			attended by all members of the investigation team."	
8				
9			Can I just stop there? How many case conferences had	
10			there been by this point in time, do you know?	15:55
11		Α.	I don't know.	
12	729	Q.	How many had the commissioner attended? I know he had	
13			been assigned further duties I think which kept him in	
14			Dublin for parts of the working week, isn't that	
15			correct?	15:55
16		Α.	Again, I am aware that he was at some, he wasn't at	
17			them all, I know that.	
18	730	Q.	Yes.	
19		Α.	But he was at a fair share of them, in fairness to him,	
20			yes.	15:56
21	731	Q.	Yes.	
22		Α.	And if not, I would have private meetings with him to	
23			bring him up-to-date.	
24	732	Q.	Yes.	
25		Α.	Because he wouldn't have been in Galway every day, he	15:56
26			might be there maybe on a Monday morning or a Friday	
27			evening or something like that.	
28	733	Q.	Yes.	
29		Α.	I was also tied up with a lot of work around the	

1			country and I mightn't be there. So, you know, when we	
2			did meet, we did discuss.	
3	734	Q.	Obviously the team assembled under you were doing the	
4			actual the work on the street, as it were, if I	
5			could put it that way.	15:56
6		Α.	Correct.	
7	735	Q.	In terms of acquiring things and analysing them and	
8			taking statements. You were doing that too, isn't that	
9			right? The assistant commissioner was supervising it	
10			perhaps more partly from a distance necessarily and	15:56
11			partly through the conferences?	
12		Α.	Well, I presume that would be fair to say, but he did	
13			get involved in relation to Garda Keogh on the two	
14			meetings we had with him.	
15	736	Q.	Yes.	15:56
16		Α.	And I know there was some personal contact as well with	
17			him.	
18	737	Q.	Yes. But in any event, he is reporting here:	
19				
20			"Was updated and fully briefed on progress to date by	15:57
21			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. Investigative	
22			strategies were discussed and outlined with new lines	
23			of inquiry being established that will assist the	
24			investigation progressing to a conclusion."	
25				15:57
26			Can you help us there, what he might be referring to?	
27		Α.	Just maybe if we just go back on it again there a	
28			moment.	
29	738	Q.	Yes. It's the second paragraph, the last two lines of	

1			the second paragraph I was asking you about.	
2		Α.	Okay. That might make reference to when you asked me	
3			about this witness in January and stuff like that,	
4			where I suggested Ms. B. We would have had a strategy	
5			in relation to a timeframe that we would try and	15:5
6			arrange for that, and that would come after	
7			interviewing the man in Galway because who he was and	
8			what he was, hoping he would have given us a lot more	
9			to interview her about.	
10	739	Q.	It goes on to detail of the amount of work that had	15:5
11			been done by that point in time, but at the last	
12			paragraph there that's visible, it says:	
13				
14			"A draft of the final report has commenced and it has	
15			been determined by the investigation team it is not	15:5
16			possible to submit modular files pertaining to each	
17			allegation as previously stated due to the fact that	
18			allegations made are common and interlinked to a number	
19			of persons named by the confidential reporter."	
20				15:5
21			Then if we just go on to the next page.	
22				
23			"The investigation team proposes to have all enquiries	
24			completed with a view to then interviewing the serving	
25			member of An Garda Síochána against whom the majority	15:5
26			of allegations are made. Following the completion of	
27			this interview a final all encompassing file will be	
28			completed as expeditiously as possible. It is expected	
29			that the interviewing of this member and a small number	

1			of outstanding witnesses will be completed before the	
2			end of February.	
3				
4			I appreciate that this investigation is taking a	
5			considerable period of time and is involving	15:59
6			considerable resources. However, the time and	
7			resources are required to definitively complete the	
8			investigation to the highest professional standard and	
9			to ensure all of the allegations are being properly and	
10			thoroughly investigated.	15:59
11				
12			I will keep you apprised."	
13				
14			Now, I just ask you to comment before we go any	
15			further. The investigation had in a sense really	15:59
16			kicked off once you got the statement from Garda Keogh	
17			on the 18th June?	
18		Α.	we would have kicked it off prior to that.	
19	740	Q.	Kicked off, well what had actually in concrete terms	
20			been done prior to that?	15:59
21		Α.	We had set up our incident room.	
22	741	Q.	Yes.	
23		Α.	we had created jobs from the affidavit in relation to	
24			that and we had made contact in relation to the phones	
25			and original files.	15:59
26	742	Q.	Yes.	
27		Α.	And also in relation to I recall now as well, he	
28			hadn't got it on the GNDU in Dublin in respect of the	
29			Loki aspect of it and sought that the original file	

- from their office would be retained.
- 2 743 Q. Yes. Obviously Garda Keogh had expanded on his
- affidavit to a considerable degree, but did you regard
- 4 it at this stage as an investigation which was the
- 5 subject-matter of any delay, let alone deliberate delay 16:00
- 6 or a culpable delay of any sort?
- 7 A. There was absolutely no delay. I suppose all of us
- 8 were doing our day job as well at the same time. Now
- 9 if you look at the man from Galway, it took us nearly
- seven months to get a final answer from him. When we

- look at Ms. B, who is named as another important
- 12 witness, it took considerable time to pin her down and
- try to see where we are going in relation to her. So
- 14 that took up a lot of our time. Our investigation
- sprung from those two potential witnesses, so to speak. 16:00
- 16 744 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. So we couldn't do, we'll say, the tail end of our
- investigation until we had seen what they could offer
- 19 us.
- 20 745 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. Now there was a lot of other investigations in relation
- to other aspects of his complaint going on all through
- that, some of them pretty substantial, which opened up
- into greater channels.
- 25 746 Q. Yes. Just the reference here at the top of the page to 16:01
- having all the enquiries completed with a view to
- interviewing the serving member, you were leaving him
- until last, it would appear. Would that be a normal
- 29 strategy?

- 1 A. You would try to gather your information first.
- 2 747 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. And that you would have your best possible case to put

16:02

16:02

16:02

- 4 to him.
- 5 748 Q. Yes. Obviously the longer it takes and it may take
- 6 however long it does take, but the longer the person
- 7 has to prepare for what may be coming. Was that a
- 8 concern, that Garda A might have an undue amount of
- 9 time to prepare for --
- 10 A. It was a concern that we all would have had.
- 11 749 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. But unfortunately that was the position.
- 13 750 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. Now, if I go back to Garda A, Garda A was a convicted
- criminal, a drug dealer, a heroin addict, a person --
- 16 751 Q. If Garda A, is it?
- 17 A. Sorry?
- 18 752 Q. CHAIRMAN: Assuming the complaints were true, is that
- 19 correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 753 Q. CHAIRMAN: If the allegations made by Garda Keogh were
- true, I think that's the bit you meant to say.
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 754 Q. CHAIRMAN: Then he was guilty of a lot of serious
- 25 things.
- 26 A. I suppose just in relation to the whole aspect of
- 27 trying to create evidence to put to him.
- 28 755 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 29 A. You know. And we had to look at where that was coming

- from.
- 2 756 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- A. And we had to judge that. And also, that person, an
- 4 allegation was made by Garda Keogh to suggest that
- Garda A conspired with Ms. B to have this fella caught

16:03

16:03

16:03

- 6 for heroin dealing.
- 7 757 Q. CHAIRMAN: Indeed.
- 8 A. You know.
- 9 758 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 10 A. So he was the partner of Ms. B.
- 11 759 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 12 A. So there was a lot of things there that we had to try
- and balance and, you know, come to a reasonable
- decision in relation to what we were getting.
- 15 CHAIRMAN: You have some distance to go,
- 16 Mr. McGuinness?
- 17 MR. McGUINNESS: I have, indeed, Chairman.
- 18 760 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's fine. Well, we always knew that you
- were going to be a witness who took a bit of time. So
- we will have to ask you to come back tomorrow.
- 21 A. No problem, Judge.
- 22 761 Q. CHAIRMAN: Can I just ask you before we go, you said
- all of us were doing our day job at the same time.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 762 Q. CHAIRMAN: would you tell me more about that?
- A. Well, I was the detective superintendent for the
- 27 Western Region. My responsibility was in respect of
- 28 Claire, Galway, Mayo, Longford, Roscommon. I was tied
- up in a number of serious investigations, parallel

Т			investigation was dsoc, supervising investigations with	
2			GSOC.	
3	763	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And was the same true of your colleagues who	
4			were on your team?	
5		Α.	well	16:03
6	764	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean not to the same extent but	
7			presumably	
8		Α.	They all had their work. Well, it wasn't a team that	
9			were sitting down all day every day associated with	
10			this.	16:04
11	765	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I was wondering about that.	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	766	Q.	CHAIRMAN: would it have been possible for the	
14			commissioner to say, look, I will appoint Assistant	
15			Commissioner Ó Cualáin, he will pick his team, they	16:04
16			will then devote themselves exclusively to this was	
17			that realistic?	
18		Α.	No, unfortunately.	
19	767	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Could that have happened or would it have	
20			ever happened?	16:04
21		Α.	I don't believe, unless you were a specific group to	
22			deal with such things and then you could concentrate on	
23			it fully. But unfortunately we had to	
24	768	Q.	CHAIRMAN: In other words, if you were the fraud squad	
25			or something like that?	16:04
26		Α.	Exactly, yeah.	
27	769	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is that what you are saying?	
28		Α.	Exactly.	

 $29\ \ 770\ \ Q.$ CHAIRMAN: But if you were assembled as you were, then

Т			you had to do your own work and take on this extra	
2			responsibility?	
3		Α.	That's right.	
4	771	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is that right?	
5		Α.	That is the situation.	16:04
6	772	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you.	
7		Α.	However, Garda Burke, who was our incident room manager	
8			basically, he would have spent a lot of time and was	
9			our conduit for information.	
10	773	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So he was mostly -	16:05
11		Α.	Mostly.	
12	774	Q.	CHAIRMAN: - sort of 90% pretty well on that job?	
13		Α.	A lot of the time, yeah.	
14	775	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay, thanks very much. You	
15			mentioned that and I just wanted to see if I could	16:05
16			clarify that. Thanks very much. So we will start	
17			again tomorrow then, okay. Thank you very much.	
18				
19			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL WEDNESDAY, 12TH	
20			FEBRUARY 2020 AT 10: 30AM	16:05
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
29				

11324 [1] - 138:26 20:20, 22:12, 94:18 6:28, 7:11, 29:27, 325 [1] - 32	76:16
11329 [1] - 157:17	
'14 [1] - 100:20 11331 [2] - 159:6, 194 [1] - 21:7 101:10, 101:26 328 [2] -	77.07
	77:28, 77:29
405:44	
146 m 44.47 44.40	
AAAA	
117 [1] - 20.0 [19th [2] - 11.14, [10th 2.4, 100.0] [34[1] - 3	
104.44	
24. 15 18t [5] - 45. 14, 02.29,	
'96 [1] - 119:16	
36[2] - 3	:21, 34:19
'superintendent [1] -	
102.20, 100.7, 104.4	
12 [3] - 3:8, 4:8, 23:8 12 [2] - 54:29 - 56:9 2 [9] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 21 [1] - 52:18 22 [2] - 3:13, 29:5	- 94:11
124 [2] - 54:29, 50:9	
12:00-10:00pm [1] - 146:6 146:9 149:15 2210 [2] - 10:10, 388 [1] -	100:6
1 [3] - 3:2, 143:24, 145:15 20 [21] - 3:12 90:17 3893 [1]	
149:15 12TH [1] - 179:19 20[3] (1] - 110:22 23[1] - 3:13 39[1] - 3	
1,600 [1] - 75:18	
10 [2] - 3:7, 162:12	- 160:11
1001 [1] - 134:7 13 [3] - 2:31, 3:8, 2005 2507 [1] - 50.20 14 5:11, 145:12, 3903 [1]	- 160:19
104 m - 5:14	- 125:13,
105/2008 [1] - 54:25 1326 [1] - 84:2 30:15 54:17 54:19 24 (1) 31:18 125:18, 1	26:3
10797 [1] - 45:7 13275 [1] - 145:11 55:8 55:24 56:11 2411 [13] - 42:0, 3942 [2]	- 126:21,
1081 [2] - 34:19. 134 [1] - 21:6 138 [2] - 34:19. 134 [1] - 21:6 139 [2] - 34:19. 139	
34:21 135 [2] - 28:29, 30:6 2008 [1] - 54:26 20.445 05:47, 00:24 3945 [2]	- 137:23,
10827 [2] - 45:29, 136 [1] - 1:18 2008-2010 [1] - 70:22 105:23 105:23 139:15	
46:2 13th [12] - 67:20, 2009 [1] - 119:28 105:27,	- 141:8,
10831 [1] - 34:20 68:11, 70:11, 129:17, 2010 [2] - 120:1 25 [2] - 2:14 5:6	
10832 [2] - 47-19 130:2, 130:15, 130:15	- 115:20
162:29 139:11, 141:6, 2012 141:45 25 5 16 25 17 3951 [1]	- 115:29
10834 [1] - 47:25 151.14, 151.16, 2014 [36] - 1:3. 6:24. 102:19, 102:22 3973 [1]	
10836 [4] - 47:9, 102.3, 102.24 7:10 11:15 12:3 102:25 108:1 3rd [3] -	42:3, 51:29,
47:11, 162:11, 162:13 14[3] - 3.9, 35.21, 19:2 21:17 25:26 445:25 422:29 89:24	
10839 (1) - 170:28 145:11	
10851 [1] - 49:13	4
10859 (1) - 50:27 15 [2] - 3:9, 35:21 47:10 47:20 40:5	
10860 [1] - 51:6 15524 [1] - 115:1 56:24 64:10 76:15 16:1 16:1 16:1 16:17 16:2	19, 3:4, 9:27
10881 [2] - 37:25. 13002 [1] = 13:13 83:22 104:22 47:10 47:20 40:4 4.500	- 126:27
1 37:28 1311[10] = 0.24, 112:20 122:15 162:4 162:4	
10883 m - 51:6 30:24, 00:10, 04:10, 132:28 141:21 30:00 2:46	
10945 [2] - 42:2, 04:26, 100:05, 100:15, 142:28, 150:4, 28th [5] - 16:2, 4th [1] -	
51:28 160:13, 160:20, 20:13, 20:24, 159:9,	
10947 [1] - 52:14	5
10:30AM[1] - 179:20 104:22 122:15 103.4, 103.7, 104.4 29[1] - 3:17	
10th [8] - 45:9, 104:22, 122:10 2015 [24] - 35:7, 29th [7] - 19:2, 19:5,	
66:22, 67:9, 67:11, 35:21, 42:4 37:24, 42:3, 42:8, 19:14, 21:17, 100:2, 5[2] - 3:4	4, 141:21
87:19, 127:14, 49:14, 51:23, 51:29, 170:29, 171:6 51 [1] - 2	
127:17, 129:1 52:18, 72:19, 72:29, 54[1] - 5	
92:3 93:4 94:1	
11-13 [1] - 4:3 94:24, 95:9, 150:3 94:15, 95:9, 95:17,	0:9, 20:16
11/6/14 [2] - 66:24, 17 [4] - 1:9. 3:10. 90:21, 90:28, 100:1, 17 [4] - 1:9. 3:10. 17 [4] - 1:9. 3:10.	9:1, 29:4,
129:10 42:15 30:6	
11307 [1] - 89:13 17th [1] - 76:15 100:16, 109:14, 171:0 30 [2] - 3:17, 120:28 58 [1] - 2	3:8
11309 [1] - 64:29	
11310 [2] - 65:17, 18th [4] - 68:12	
77.11 130.9 174.17 32.4, 90.0, 109.22 32[2] - 2.24, 3.10	
11312 [1] - 128:27	

6	1:26	15:5, 15:6, 17:22,	Affairs [2] - 13:10,	107:23, 115:22,
6	absence [2] - 117:2,	18:27, 20:14, 49:3,	14:11	117:28, 121:22,
	148:18	49:4, 49:8, 139:4	affect [1] - 149:6	124:15, 126:6, 132:4,
6 [3] - 3:5, 5:5, 24:16	absolute [1] - 155:1	actions [3] - 46:26,	affidavit [15] - 74:4,	164:13, 173:18,
60 [1] - 5:12	absolutely [13] -	47:17, 73:8	74:5, 82:11, 122:24,	173:26, 174:9, 176:21
6th [6] - 65:5, 65:14,	37:12, 37:17, 38:19,	active [1] - 77:19	122:29, 123:22,	alleged [8] - 10:3,
69:18, 123:4, 137:22,	72:17, 80:26, 135:4,	activities [1] - 38:12	124:10, 124:14,	48:22, 94:19, 117:13,
150:4	151:12, 152:14,	activity [1] - 98:24	126:6, 126:14,	132:2, 163:22,
	152:16, 160:6, 168:6,	acts [1] - 12:12	126:16, 126:17,	163:26, 166:16
7	168:7, 175:7	Acts [1] - 56:10	174:23, 175:3	alleging [4] - 12:19,
-	AC [22] - 65:3, 70:18,	actual [7] - 48:10,	afford [3] - 81:13,	75:3, 92:29, 128:8
	122:15, 123:18,	49:17, 65:25, 100:24,	87:26, 110:18	allocated [4] - 60:13,
7 [5] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5,	139:2, 139:3, 139:20,	107:16, 122:23, 172:4	afforded [3] - 81:15,	67:10, 124:28, 129:8
4:13, 21:6	142:7, 142:21,	add [1] - 140:27	81:17, 97:11	allow [3] - 116:11,
7.12 [2] - 29:10, 30:7	142:26, 142:28,	addict [1] - 176:15	afraid [1] - 18:22	123:8, 144:17
7843 [1] - 54:24	143:26, 143:28,	additional [3] -	afresh [1] - 107:20	allowed [4] - 81:19,
7845 [1] - 56:14	144:2, 144:8, 144:10,	12:22, 14:14, 49:26	afterwards [1] -	97:12, 145:5, 149:10
7858 [1] - 54:17	145:20, 146:9,	address [8] - 18:6,	27:11	allows [1] - 55:2
7862 [1] - 9:1	146:13, 146:29,	79:12, 82:20, 84:24,	age [3] - 85:8, 90:22,	alone [2] - 131:14,
7th [10] - 66:8, 70:14,	156:22, 156:25	94:22, 94:28, 153:9,	92:13	175:5
73:27, 103:10,	accept [8] - 8:15,	161:6	ago [4] - 20:12, 66:1,	altogether [1] -
123:28, 124:3, 124:5,	20:6, 31:20, 35:8,	addressed [11] -	88:4, 143:19	112:15
124:19, 125:2, 126:25	42:28, 52:20, 59:4,	17:12, 17:14, 18:5,	agree [6] - 39:6,	AMENDED [1] - 1:9
	59:12	69:20, 70:3, 70:15,	112:8, 135:19,	amount [4] - 99:11,
8	accepting [1] - 22:27	70:29, 81:13, 82:15,	144:28, 145:2	117:10, 173:10, 176:8
	access [3] - 124:27,	95:16, 153:9	agreed [5] - 39:9,	AN [1] - 3:2
8 [3] - 3:6, 3:28,	124:29, 158:20	addresses [1] -	40:14, 52:26, 53:1,	analysed [1] - 130:21
78:24	accompanied [6] -	84:23	161:21	analysing [1] - 172:7
8276 [1] - 11:14	48:4, 67:22, 86:23,	addressing [1] - 82:6	agreement [1] -	analysis [1] - 130:19
8293 [1] - 13:21	96:22, 96:27, 110:21	ADJOURNED [2] -	157:9	AND [5] - 1:3, 1:4,
8294 [2] - 13:16	accordance [1] -	98:1, 179:19	AGS [1] - 9:10	1:8, 3:15, 98:1
8303 [1] - 16:2	56:9	administer [1] - 96:6	AGSI [1] - 4:4	and [1] - 20:24
8397 [1] - 168:9	according [1] - 103:8	administered [2] -	ahead [1] - 124:5	ANDREW [2] - 2:22,
8th [5] - 35:6, 37:22,	accordingly [1] -	95:22, 95:24	aid [1] - 60:21	4:5
37:24, 38:2, 56:20	17:21	Administration [2] -	AIDAN [2] - 3:9, 4:6	angle [1] - 77:10
37.24, 30.2, 30.20	account [5] - 10:10,	13:12, 17:13	aim [1] - 55:29	ANNE [2] - 3:8, 3:17
0	67:28, 127:1, 161:24,	administration [1] -	AISLING [2] - 2:11,	annex [1] - 137:23
9	162:5	18:17	3:21	Annmarie [2] -
	accurate [1] - 115:12	administrations [1] -	ALAN [2] - 3:9, 3:13	100:12, 107:13
9 [4] - 3:6, 8:28, 9:2,	accusation [1] -	14:12	Alan [2] - 58:22, 59:1	anonymised [1] -
21:21	83:19	ADMINISTRATIVE	alarm [1] - 129:13	81:3
9(2 [1] - 9:4	accusations [1] -	[1] - 3:14	albeit [2] - 109:29,	answer [6] - 18:22,
90% [1] - 179:12	132:8	adopting [2] -	113:3	25:12, 85:7, 91:8,
91 [1] - 5:13	achieved [1] - 82:3	168:16, 168:25	ALISON [1] - 3:26	93:26, 175:10
9:42 [1] - 52:22	acknowledges [1] -	advance [3] - 90:16,	alive [1] - 14:27	answers [2] - 82:18,
9th [6] - 40:23,	83:17	90:17, 116:19	allegation [11] -	94:2
40:26, 65:13, 87:19,	acquired [1] - 85:17	advantage [1] -	12:23, 12:29, 14:15,	ANTHONY [1] - 3:6
105:10, 106:17	acquiring [1] - 172:7	37:19	17:4, 74:28, 83:29,	anxious [3] - 131:23,
	Act [11] - 6:21, 6:23,	adverted [1] - 115:20	110:17, 134:1, 134:2,	135:15, 135:19
Α	7:6, 7:9, 54:29, 56:24,	advice [4] - 18:16,	173:17, 177:4	anyway [3] - 24:10,
	56:27, 59:8, 141:21,	18:19, 146:28, 154:25	allegations [38] -	40:15, 112:9
Ala 00 44	141:25, 142:28	advices [2] - 17:12,	38:12, 38:15, 38:28,	apparent [3] - 67:14,
A's [1] - 88:14	ACT [2] - 1:3, 1:8	18:7	39:14, 48:27, 55:18,	77:29, 117:1
able [7] - 71:29,	act [1] - 102:9	advise [4] - 12:28,	74:20, 74:27, 75:1,	APPEAL[2] - 1:13,
75:15, 79:18, 84:7,	acted [3] - 12:25,	97:11, 136:12, 167:6	75:12, 81:2, 82:8,	2:3
104:6, 116:21, 161:24	23:20, 102:7	advised [10] - 45:19,	84:13, 85:1, 85:25,	appear [27] - 6:28,
abolished [5] -	acting [1] - 108:26	46:17, 136:3, 136:13,	85:27, 88:1, 90:2,	59:6, 59:8, 59:9,
27:15, 27:21, 27:27,	ACTING [2] - 3:7,	136:15, 136:16,	94:18, 94:20, 94:22,	64:14, 65:15, 67:19,
28:10, 28:11	3:13	139:3, 144:21, 157:28	94:28, 95:16, 96:15,	70:7, 72:18, 72:28,
above-named [1] -	action [10] - 1:27,	advising [1] - 142:16	97:18, 106:11,	73:6, 78:2, 123:2,
		1	ĺ	

124:29, 127:11, 131:24, 133:15, 133:24, 134:24, 159:4, 159:17, 159:23, 160:12, 161:21, 168:12, 169:13, 175:28 APPEARANCES[1] -2:1 appeared [2] - 46:5, 164:3 **appended** [1] - 72:5 application [4] -84:18, 106:16, 119:12, 121:15 applications [1] -84.19 applied [3] - 60:23, 61:3, 106:23 **apply** [1] - 76:3 appoint [4] - 63:21, 68:9, 122:3, 178:14 appointed [29] - 8:9, 27:7, 28:16, 30:24, 30:25, 31:5, 31:14, 31:15, 31:17, 44:23, 59:1, 63:9, 63:11, 69:4, 73:26, 74:19, 83:9, 89:1, 89:8, 104:20, 119:21, 119:27, 120:2, 121:20, 122:19, 123:27, 124:23, 166:1 appointment [7] -34:29, 35:16, 63:14, 64:15, 86:6, 123:21, 124:1 appreciate [2] -53:22, 174:4 apprised [1] - 174:12 approach [3] - 63:18, 72:27, 103:21 approached [6] -63:18, 102:27, 107:24, 108:16, 169:13 approaching [1] appropriate [8] -17:6, 50:18, 76:6, 87:26, 89:3, 92:14, 110:18. 166:2 approval [2] - 17:21, approximate [2] -61:10, 99:13 April [27] - 49:14, 51:23, 52:18, 72:19, 72:29, 80:27, 82:12, 91:21, 93:1, 94:15,

95:17, 96:28, 100:19, 102:19, 102:22, 102:25, 102:26, 104:29, 105:10, 105:23, 105:27, 108:2, 115:25, 119:10, 120:3, 120:13, 169:14 April-June [1] archway [1] - 68:18 area [4] - 76:12, 119:15, 121:16, 136:17 areas [3] - 38:14, 43:15, 119:16 arise [2] - 15:10, 151.8 arisen [3] - 135:29, 144:14, 170:16 arising [2] - 88:27, 162:17 arm [1] - 167:28 armed [2] - 99:2, 103:6 arose [4] - 7:22, 7:29, 58:19, 61:1 ARRAN[2] - 2:24, 4.12 arrange [2] - 102:26, arranged [6] - 66:14, 80:27, 88:18, 124:3, 130:21, 151:27 arrangement [3] -92:24, 127:11, 127:13 arrangements [7] -66:16, 66:23, 111:15, 124:11, 124:22, 124:26, 129:9 arrest [4] - 81:6, 81:24, 97:3, 116:24 arrested [2] - 80:17, 116.9 arrival [1] - 98:16 arrived [1] - 49:16 article [6] - 46:5, 47:6, 163:13, 164:2, 164:5. 164:9 **AS** [12] - 1:9, 6:1, 6:9, 25:20, 43:21, 54:11, 60:3, 91:17, 98:1, 104:16, 114:2, 119.2 ascertain [1] aside [4] - 114:8,

114:9, 117:18, 137:14

aspect [5] - 15:2,

48:24, 154:12,

174:29, 176:26 aspects [8] - 35:2, 35:17, 35:22, 40:20, 155:27, 158:25, 175:22 assembled [2] -172:3, 178:29 assessment [4] -29:2, 33:6, 33:13, 34:5 assigned [5] - 53:10, 119:11, 119:15, 119:17, 171:13 assist [10] - 28:18, 54:16, 63:10, 72:25, 94:29, 105:17, 113:2, 121:21, 122:19, 172:23 assistance [6] -45:20, 46:18, 51:19, 51:24, 164:19 **Assistant** [37] - 7:3, 10:20, 12:4, 15:15, 16:26, 36:11, 39:16, 44:23, 45:8, 46:3, 47:3, 47:29, 49:15, 50:9, 51:28, 52:5, 58:16, 63:9, 64:2, 64:10, 64:20, 69:1, 73:26, 76:13, 85:12, 89:4, 100:12, 103:28, 104:21, 121:20, 122:2, 125:6, 140:21, 147:2, 162:9, 162:16, 178.14 assistant [41] - 8:9, 11:1, 11:13, 11:21, 13:25, 14:17, 15:20, 15:24, 15:28, 16:4, 36:26, 47:13, 47:22, 47:27, 50:27, 62:10, 62:12, 63:23, 63:29, 64:25, 66:2, 89:8, 116:28, 123:9, 125:5, 135:21, 141:16, 143:5, 146:17, 146:22, 147:3, 147:9, 147:15, 147:23, 155:12, 156:19, 168:16, 169:7, 169:8, 170:6, 172:9 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8. 3:18, 3:20 assisting.. [1] -65:22 associated [5] -29:12, 32:5, 32:17,

109:24, 170:24 assumed [1] -153:12 assuming [1] -176.18 assurance [1] -112:22 assured [1] - 48:26 AT [1] - 179:20 **ATHLONE**[1] - 4:3 Athlone [48] - 8:4, 38:13, 38:16, 38:29, 66:22, 67:20, 74:17, 75:4, 75:14, 75:26, 76:23, 77:1, 78:10, 79:12, 80:16, 84:24, 86:20, 98:23, 102:27, 108:9, 111:11, 111:13, 112:17, 112:24, 113:11, 113:20, 114:12, 115:17, 121:10, 121:11, 124:12, 124:20, 124:24, 127:14, 127:17, 128:10, 128:20, 131:19, 133:17. 149:24, 150:3, 151:24, 151:25, 151:26, 157:14, 157:27, 165:28 attach [2] - 74:11, attached [2] - 12:2, attaching [2] - 13:19, 74:7 attachments [1] -16:17 attempt [2] - 72:19, 77:5 attempted [3] -87:17, 88:13, 108:1 attempts [6] - 72:14, 79:8, 79:15, 86:4, 102:25, 160:11 attend [4] - 113:11, 116:15, 116:16, 150:23 attended [12] - 51:1, 53:18, 64:26, 66:6, 66:25, 70:9, 84:22, 131:19, 133:17, 171:5, 171:7, 171:12 attending [3] - 44:27, 50:23. 66:19 attention [7] - 6:24, 14:26, 47:16, 50:17, 76:9, 85:15, 147:4

attitude [1] - 111:21

August [12] - 35:11, 41:24, 69:18, 70:11, 103:10, 112:20, 137:22, 139:11, 141:6, 150:4, 152:24, 160:18 author [3] - 103:25, 103:27, 137:18 authorisation [2] -9:24, 10:1 authority [2] - 36:12, 76:10 availability [1] -130:10 available [3] - 45:19, 50:3, 130:13 aware [71] - 7:3, 8:12, 8:13, 10:22, 10:23, 10:24, 10:25, 12:28, 19:6, 19:25, 21:25, 29:11, 30:20, 30:21, 31:3, 32:4, 32:17, 32:29, 33:4, 33:26, 47:11, 50:3, 56:26, 57:2, 67:11, 67:13, 68:29, 71:15, 73:14, 73:28, 74:6, 74:19, 74:22, 74:24, 74:29, 76:1, 77:13, 78:12, 83:16, 83:19, 83:27, 84:4, 84:14, 85:10, 85:14, 100:9, 107:11, 107:17, 108:23, 112:18, 121:25, 123:18. 129:17, 133:2, 134:12, 135:28, 137:8, 137:9, 137:10, 137:16, 137:20, 141:25, 142:28, 150:22, 150:24, 159:24, 166:4, 168:3, 169:8, 171:16 awful [1] - 118:4

В

B&Q [2] - 150:6 B's [6] - 78:1, 106:17, 108:29, 111:6, 166:17, 167:27 background [1] -53:1 bag [1] - 134:12 bagged [1] - 99:8 balance [1] - 177:13 Ballinasloe [4] -68:18, 69:12, 162:23, 163:9 BAR [1] - 2:31

assume [3] - 32:14,

33:1, 178:9

bar [4] - 140:24, 143:29, 144:21, 144:24 **Barry** [3] - 71:8, 99.10 base 181 - 112:16. 113:3, 113:20, 114:4, 114:6, 114:11, 114:13, 148:3 based [3] - 62:14, 62:15, 103:21 basis [10] - 18:29, 28:7, 29:17, 84:8, 84:27, 103:5, 103:21, 110:2, 116:26, 146:21 **BASTION**[1] - 4:2 bat [1] - 23:2 **BE**[1] - 6:8 became [13] - 8:11, 8:13, 74:29, 84:14, 85:10, 85:14, 98:16, 100:9, 107:11, 120:8, 120:24, 120:25, 126:5 become [11] - 40:16, 60:26, 62:10, 67:13. 74:22, 74:24, 105:1, 121:25, 129:17, 139:26, 141:25 becoming [1] - 74:13 bedroom [1] - 99:21 BEEN [2] - 60:2, began [1] - 27:10 beginning [3] -25:24, 100:4, 114:21 begins [1] - 100:3 begun [1] - 100:19 behalf [5] - 50:28, 52:9, 52:27, 52:29, 155:12 behaviour [1] - 55:22 behind [4] - 8:20, 8:23, 111:23, 156:4 belief [3] - 76:28, 131:3, 166:18 believes [2] - 9:13, 10:1 bell [1] - 25:7 beside [1] - 154:14 best [6] - 66:10, 84:12, 115:12, 153:12, 170:20, 176:3 better [3] - 32:23, 36:22, 114:23 between [13] - 27:19, 45:25, 50:13, 51:1, 52:9, 74:28, 75:17, 93:10, 99:17, 117:1, 127:16, 129:19 billing [2] - 75:19,

116:2 birthday [1] - 85:9 bit [3] - 33:14, 176:22, 177:19 **BL** [13] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 4:1, 4:7, 4:10 blank [4] - 80:10, 95:11, 102:16, 139:24 blow [1] - 111:17 blunt [1] - 42:17 board [9] - 58:21, 58:24, 79:23, 79:26, 87:27, 90:7, 107:25, 161:8, 169:17 body [1] - 104:25 **bold** [2] - 54:27, 55:26 book [3] - 58:23,

134:5. 134:9 books [1] - 170:23 borne [1] - 145:7 bottom [14] - 13:16, 21:7, 45:15, 56:7, 65:1, 78:15, 83:17, 84:12, 100:4, 126:23, 157:3, 160:17, 162:25, 170:4 bound [1] - 13:7

bow [1] - 111:28 **box** [1] - 56:7 branch [2] - 60:21 breach [1] - 36:18 break [1] - 97:27 breathing [1] -107:20

BRIAN [2] - 3:15, brief [6] - 6:25, 11:4, 43:14, 97:2, 97:6, 107:26

briefed [9] - 63:29, 64:11, 64:15, 64:23, 66:4, 89:10, 122:15, 122:22, 172:20 **briefing** [3] - 64:1,

103:24, 122:23 briefly [2] - 10:26,

49:12 bring [11] - 14:25, 47:23, 104:24, 108:6, 110:25, 116:26, 131:17, 134:17, 143:8, 161:13, 171:23 **bringing** [2] - 47:15, 65:28

broad [1] - 61:21 broadcast [1] - 8:15 brought [8] - 43:26,

52:13, 85:15, 97:19, 156:13, 161:19, 161:26, 161:27 building [1] - 109:7 Bureau [1] - 60:26 Burke [4] - 63:25, 88:11, 179:7 **BURKE** [1] - 4:11 **busy** [1] - 20:3 **BY** [29] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:15, 5:19, 6:9, 25:20, 43:20, 54:10, 60:3, 91:17, 104:15, 114:2, 119:2

C

cabal [1] - 77:9 **CAGNEY** [1] - 3:17 call/conversation/ communication [1] -19:17 camera [2] - 82:18, 96:16 cannot [4] - 12:6, 95:4, 159:27, 170:13 car [19] - 86:22, 86:26, 108:13, 108:14, 108:16, 128:9, 132:3, 149:25, 149:26, 150:6, 150:12, 151:5, 151:7, 151:19, 151:20, 151:24, 152:13 card [2] - 83:4, 129.23 cards [6] - 85:2, 99:6, 99:17, 99:19, 107:8 career [3] - 60:11, 61:18, 119:8 **CARR** [1] - 3:15 CARRICK [1] - 2:13 **CARRICK-ON-SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 carried [9] - 10:19, 47:18, 49:9, 75:14, 77:11. 82:20. 86:18. 86:20, 106:24 carries [1] - 158:7 CARROLL [1] - 2:16 carry [7] - 8:10, 40:15, 41:12, 63:27, 76:10, 89:9, 113:13

72:23, 81:23, 107:1, 107:14, 158:9, 158:10 CARTHAGE[1] -2:17 case [22] - 8:16. 9:25, 14:24, 14:29, 35:28, 36:17, 80:10, 92:18, 95:1, 106:4, 106:15, 107:28, 111:15, 111:26, 112:17, 112:26, 143:21, 155:21, 170:28, 171:5, 171:9, 176:3 119:13 Castletroy [1] -119:15

71:3 82:16, 88:19, 94:21, 95:16, 95:22, 96:2,

96:5 Central [1] - 60:24

151:26 cert [5] - 150:15, 150:16, 153:2, 154:9 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 28:6, 30:25, 106:5, 8:17, 8:18, 26:6, 28:13, 32:25, 34:11, 41:9, 58:6, 58:8, 74:13, 77:19, 79:21,

19:23, 21:2, 30:23, 31:24, 37:4, 38:21, 42:9, 42:11, 43:14, 43 18 45 29 46 24 48:8, 51:12, 53:9, 54:16, 59:27, 60:11, 60:12, 63:12, 104:18,

104:19, 107:5, 108:27, 109:5, 110:10, 110:13, 110:28, 111:25, 112:12, 113:2, 114:20, 114:27, 116:23, 118:20, 118:25, 177:17 **CHAIRMAN** [148] -

1:12, 6:4, 6:11, 20:18,

24:5, 24:9, 25:17,

29:25, 29:27, 30:1,

30:6, 30:11, 30:26,

30:28, 31:8, 31:13,

31:17, 31:21, 31:28,

32:2, 33:14, 33:18, 34:20, 34:22, 36:3,

36:5, 36:7, 36:21,

36:24, 37:2, 37:6,

37:12, 37:24, 37:27,

38:8, 38:19, 38:22,

38:24, 38:27, 39:3,

39:12, 39:14, 39:25,

39:28, 40:3, 40:9,

40:15, 42:6, 42:10,

54:5, 54:8, 59:21,

59:29. 60:8. 61:10.

61:13, 61:15, 61:18,

61:21, 61:24, 62:1,

62:3, 91:14, 97:24,

101:13, 101:15,

101:18, 101:21,

101:23, 104:12,

109:19, 109:22,

109:24, 110:7,

110:26, 110:29,

111:21, 111:26,

114:9, 114:11,

114:19, 114:21,

114:25, 116:21,

116:24, 118:18,

118:21, 118:27,

120:10, 120:12,

119:6, 120:4, 120:7,

112:5, 112:13, 114:4,

109:3, 109:10,

97:27, 98:4, 101:11,

42:13, 43:12, 43:16,

cases [4] - 92:19, 92:20, 113:9, 148:27 **CASTLE**[1] - 1:17 Castleconnell [1] -

caught [2] - 96:16, 177:5

caused [2] - 63:20,

caution [8] - 81:16,

central [1] - 104:25 centre [2] - 151:25,

certain [10] - 11:29, 106:7, 113:6, 113:15, 118:2, 140:26, 146:1 certainly [16] - 7:18, 81:10, 117:9, 129:17 certify [1] - 1:24 Chairman [42] - 6:5, 6:13, 7:1, 19:4, 19:8,

120:14, 125:29, 134:7, 154:12, 154:15, 154:21, 154:29, 158:9, 158:12, 158:15, 168:16, 168:19, 168:21, 168:23, 168:25, 169:21, 169:23, 169:26, 169:28, 176:18, 176:21, 176:24, 176:28, 177:2, 177:7, 177:9, 177:11, 177:15, 177:18, 177:22, 177:25, 178:3, 178:6, 178:11,

178:13, 178:19,

carrying [7] - 33:12,

178:24, 178:27, 178:29, 179:4, 179:6, 179:10, 179:12, 179.14 change [4] - 51:23. 62:7, 109:21, 141:27 changed [2] - 26:27, 79:13 channel [7] - 26:19, 27:2, 27:3, 27:22, 27:28, 28:21, 29:19 channelled [1] -165:14 channelling [1] channels [3] - 85:15, 100:15, 175:24 charge [1] - 15:1 charging [1] - 116:26 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:8 charter [28] - 6:20, 7:5, 7:10, 7:12, 7:13, 7:15, 25:25, 26:2, 26:3, 26:12, 55:9, 55:15, 55:21, 55:29. 56:5, 56:6, 57:6, 57:8, 57:12, 57:19, 58:6, 58:8, 58:9, 58:12, 156:20 CHEALLACHÁIN [1] - 2:30 check [6] - 38:1, 77:11, 136:1, 150:25, 163:19, 164:29 checking [1] - 43:17 Chief [30] - 7:23, 10:17, 11:12, 16:9, 18:8, 18:11, 19:17, 19:27, 20:4, 20:10, 22:27, 28:15, 28:25, 30:23, 30:29, 31:5, 31:8, 34:24, 58:20, 62:28, 63:5, 63:7, 115:2, 120:20, 133:15, 136:24, 136:25, 137:2, 141:1, 156:25 CHIEF [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [31] - 7:28,

10:29, 11:5, 11:15,

11:20, 13:10, 14:6,

15:28, 16:3, 19:1,

21:8, 22:7, 22:12,

24:16, 24:18, 27:6,

46:1, 62:9, 63:8,

76:11, 120:22,

14:11, 14:13, 14:27,

133:22, 136:3, 136:5, 136:6, 136:10, 136:14, 157:11 **CHIS** [2] - 23:27, 136:27 choice [2] - 113:16, 116:24 chose [1] - 114:18 chosen [1] - 26:19 circumstances [1] circumstantial [2] -70:25, 118:2 cited [1] - 12:3 city [2] - 60:28, 65:29 civilian [4] - 9:12, 9:20, 55:17, 56:1 claim [1] - 151:8 claiming [1] - 152:11 claims [1] - 153:17 Claire [2] - 53:7, 177:28 Clare [1] - 119:29 clarification [2] -12:21, 68:25 clarifications [1] -14:10 clarified [2] - 31:23, 31:28 clarify [8] - 6:16, 6:27, 16:7, 54:6, 54:16, 54:24, 56:20, 179:16 clear [12] - 32:6, 38:20, 40:16, 69:2, 113:17, 133:18, 151.13 152.10 160:5, 160:6, 162:1 cleared [2] - 36:9, 133:20 clearly [9] - 67:17, 72:23, 72:24, 74:26, 76:8, 76:9, 83:13, 107:21, 110:16 **client** [5] - 87:6, 95:29, 97:3, 97:6, 97:12 close [5] - 53:12, 76:23, 77:1, 90:27, 133:3 CO [2] - 2:13, 4:4 coffee [1] - 149:24 cognisance [2] -58:12, 90:19 cognisant [3] - 7:16, 58:10, 65:11

collating [2] -

114:23, 114:25

colleagues [1] -

colleague [1] - 90:26

178:3 coming [8] - 17:27, 22:6, 134:12, 147:12, 149:24, 152:18, 176:7, 176:29 commenced [2] -56:24, 173:14 commencing [3] -6:23, 73:23, 74:6 comment [7] - 22:20, 88:7, 104:6, 112:7, 150:28, 170:5, 174:14 commercial [4] -150:19, 150:25, 154:12, 154:13 Commission [1] -163:27 commissioner [51] -8:9, 11:1, 11:13, 11:21, 13:17, 13:24, 13:25, 14:17, 15:1, 15:21, 15:24, 15:28, 16:4, 16:19, 36:26, 47:14, 47:22, 47:27, 50:28, 62:10, 62:12, 63:23, 63:29, 64:26, 66:2, 89:8, 116:29, 120:24, 120:25, 123:10, 125:5, 135:21, 140:23, 140:29, 141:16, 143:5, 146:17, 146:22, 147:4, 147:9, 147:15, 147:23, 155:12, 156:19, 168:16, 169:7, 169:8, 170:6, 171:12, 172:9, 178:14 Commissioner [85] -7:3, 9:7, 9:13, 9:24, 9:29, 10:14, 10:20, 10:24, 12:4, 14:2, 14:24, 14:25, 15:2, 15:5, 15:15, 16:18, 16:26, 17:12, 17:15, 17:25, 18:5, 18:6, 18:24, 18:25, 21:21, 23:3. 23:21. 30:18. 36:11, 37:9, 39:16, 44:24, 45:8, 46:3, 46:10, 46:29, 47:2, 47:4, 47:17, 47:29, 48:6. 49:8. 49:15. 50:9, 51:29, 52:5, 53:17, 53:23, 55:14, 56:14, 58:17, 63:10, 64:2, 64:10, 64:20, 65:12, 69:2, 71:23, 73:26, 76:13, 85:12, 89:5, 100:12, 101:19,

101:23, 103:4, 103:17, 103:28, 104:21, 107:13, 112:19, 121:21, 122:2, 122:4, 125:6, 140:21, 147:2, 156:19, 162:9, 162:16, 162:18, 168:10, 168:17, 171:1, 178:15 **COMMISSIONER** [9] **-** 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3.20 Commissioner's [16] - 8:18, 10:12, 10:21, 13:18, 13:23, 21:24, 34:29, 40:22, 44:2, 45:11, 50:29, 53:27, 57:6, 57:18, 57:29, 162:21 Commissioner.. [1] -13:29 common [3] - 8:7, 8:8, 173:18 communicated [1] -50:17 communication [2] -27:22, 27:28 communications [2] - 50:13, 105:15 community [1] -119:14 Company [1] - 87:13 company [2] - 75:23, 154:26 **COMPANY** [1] - 2:22 compelled [2] - 87:8, 103:7 compilation [1] -115:5 compiling [1] -115:11 complained [1] complaining [2] -135:5, 165:3 complaint [19] -21:26, 22:2, 22:6, 48:22, 48:24, 74:3, 77:23, 81:11, 91:1, 122:26, 135:23, 135:27, 142:1, 142:26, 152:26, 157:23, 163:26, 167:17, 175:22 complaints [16] -46:7, 77:6, 77:16, 77:20, 77:22, 80:19, 81:5, 127:1, 135:10,

135:16, 141:23, 142:8, 157:13, 157:25, 163:22, 176:18 complete [2] - 15:18, 174:7 completed [8] -35:12, 42:7, 85:6, 130:22, 173:24, 173:28, 174:1, 175:26 completion [2] -119:11, 173:26 complex [7] - 41:6, 41:7, 42:18, 42:22, 43:3, 92:12, 92:20 compliance [2] -55:23, 56:18 compliant [1] - 81:29 complicit [1] - 38:14 comply [3] - 81:25, 136:10, 138:8 comprehensive [1] -99:21 compromised [1] -106:12 **computers** [1] - 99:6 concentrate [1] -178:22 concentrated [1] -72:29 concern [15] - 58:6, 69:17, 70:2, 76:24, 76:25, 90:25, 144:1, 150:23, 152:18, 154:5, 155:2, 158:18, 158:25, 176:8, 176:10 concerned [20] - 7:1, 9:16, 28:20, 58:9, 74:20, 83:11, 91:3, 93:12, 100:26, 127:3, 129:3, 137:11, 137:13, 138:2, 139:24, 141:16, 143:26, 150:7, 154:3, 163:15 concerning [2] -91:3, 163:26 concerns [14] -24:19, 46:7, 50:23, 52:25, 53:26, 64:4, 68:27, 68:29, 73:16, 73:20, 112:15, 140:7, 150:19, 158:3 concluded [3] -68:12, 103:16 concludes [3] -12:24, 89:20, 148:21 conclusion [4] -102:6, 113:18, 134:17, 172:24

concrete [1] - 174:19 conduct [1] - 73:15 conducted [3] -82:18, 85:12, 139:28 conducting [4] -15:19, 35:11, 63:10, 100:10 conduit [2] - 53:23, 179:9 conference [8] -65:19, 66:21, 70:3, 123:12, 127:26, 128:1, 170:27, 171:5 conferences [3] -64:25, 171:9, 172:11 conferring [1] -127.28 confidence [1] -55:18 confidential [65] -6:17, 8:22, 8:24, 9:3, 9:6, 9:14, 9:21, 10:3, 12:1, 12:25, 13:2, 17:5, 17:17, 21:26, 24:19, 26:19, 26:23, 26:25, 26:28, 27:4, 27:7, 27:9, 27:15, 27:20, 28:9, 28:17, 30:14, 38:11, 44:6, 45:18, 48:5, 48:13, 48:21, 49:28, 50:2, 50:4, 50:14, 52:19, 52:29, 53:2, 53:5, 54:18, 55:7, 55:9, 55:15, 58:1, 64:4, 64:17, 65:26, 84:15, 84:27, 94:19, 105:13, 106:5, 113:14, 121:22, 140:3, 147:24, 156:20, 163:7, 163:10, 163:25, 164:11, 173:19 confines [1] - 113:7 **confirm** [8] - 21:17, 48:3, 56:27, 76:16, 78:5, 87:28, 130:28, 162:20 confirmation [2] -85:22, 164:21 confirmed [6] -56:13, 71:12, 87:10, 87:29, 137:28, 139:8 confirming [4] -78:28, 79:19, 85:26, 117:3 conflict [2] - 17:15, 18:25 conjunction [1] -76:12

CONLON [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT[1] -4:3 connected [1] -96:22 connection [5] -67:1, 75:8, 81:2, 131:6, 155:12 CONNELLAN[2] -4:1, 4:1 Connolly [1] - 27:10 **CONOR** [1] - 3:24 conscious [2] -152:20, 152:21 consent [8] - 144:16, 145:7, 148:25, 149:8, 150:22, 151:4, 154:23, 159:15 consequently [1] consider [8] - 50:21, 79:25, 91:27, 92:10, 93:3, 93:4, 94:21, 94:27 considerable [8] -53:12, 86:25, 99:11, 107:7, 174:5, 174:6, 175:3, 175:12 consideration [1] -159:25 considered [5] -10:10, 10:11, 140:16, 144:18, 144:29 considering [1] -76:5 consistently [1] conspiracy [1] - 80:3 conspired [1] - 177:5 construed [1] -34:12 consult [1] - 149:3 consultation [1] -23:3 consulted [1] - 87:4 contact [45] - 44:24, 46:10. 47:1. 47:4. 49:28, 51:15, 52:26, 53:2, 57:24, 69:4, 69:5, 71:12, 74:16, 75:17, 86:5, 86:15, 86:16, 86:17, 86:27, 108:8, 108:15, 108:21, 110:13, 117:10, 122:4, 124:8, 124:24, 128:19,

130:24, 130:29,

136:24, 138:17,

148:16, 155:10,

155:11, 158:29,

160:8, 160:12, 160:27, 161:7, 162:20, 165:27, 172:16, 174:24 contacted [5] -21:25, 22:1, 22:28, 133:25, 158:24 contacts [10] - 71:14, 71:20, 71:24, 74:12, 75:18, 116:4, 116:29, 131:1, 131:2, 155:16 contain [4] - 106:10, 122:27, 130:23 contained [4] -95:15, 122:24, 122:29, 157:18 containing [1] -94.18 contemporaneous [1] - 72:11 content [6] - 15:4, 22:29, 76:19, 87:22, 117:3, 163:11 context [7] - 44:9, 44:11, 85:11, 88:22, 144:17, 147:27, 148:4 continue [9] - 57:9, 97:7, 112:27, 112:28, 142:1, 142:2, 142:29, 157:22, 168:12 continued [3] - 29:8, 113:3. 130:1 CONTINUED [1] continuing [3] -57:9, 113:20, 143:7 continuity [1] - 68:10 contradict [1] - 20:6 contribution [1] -121:26 control [1] - 90:29 controller [1] -136:28 convenient [3] -65:28. 97:28. 125:29 conversation [9] -22:9, 22:24, 23:13, 23:14, 23:15, 48:10, 137:1, 137:11, 161:10 conversations [2] -50:1, 78:28 conveyed [1] - 52:25 convicted [2] -118:12, 176:14 cooperate [2] -103:2, 103:11 cooperation [1] -106:28

coordinated [1] -73:8 coordinator [3] -63:22, 63:26, 69:23 copied [3] - 14:17, 15:16, 15:26 Coppinger [11] -48:4, 59:28, 60:6, 64:11, 65:4, 78:27, 91:8, 122:6, 122:16, 131:20, 163:9 COPPINGER [6] -3:4, 5:10, 60:2, 91:16, 104:15, 114:1 **copy** [17] - 13:25, 15:20, 78:4, 78:8, 85:17, 100:14, 100:29, 101:9, 102:16, 127:24, 141:8, 161:20, 161:27, 162:17, 164:29, 167:9, 168:3 correct [212] - 7:27, 10:9, 14:4, 14:22, 21:2, 23:22, 24:27, 26:5, 26:11, 26:18, 26:21, 26:26, 27:1, 27:18, 31:12, 31:16, 31:18, 35:20, 36:19, 36:20, 36:23, 39:23, 40:21, 40:27, 42:5, 42:6, 42:9, 44:4, 44:8, 44:13, 45:4, 45:21, 45:27, 46:22, 46:27, 46:28, 47:8, 51:3, 51:8, 51:11, 51:26, 52:7, 52:12, 55:4, 56:22, 56:25, 57:1, 58:2, 63:12, 63:13, 64:14, 64:17, 66:3, 66:9, 66:26, 66:28, 67:2, 67:3, 67:29, 68:1. 68:8. 68:13. 68:14, 71:5, 71:7, 71:20, 71:21, 72:6, 72:7, 72:12, 72:13, 72:16, 72:17, 72:20, 73:1, 73:4, 79:10, 79:17, 79:20, 79:21, 80:14, 80:15, 80:29, 81:3, 81:4, 82:13, 84:17, 85:24, 86:8, 86:10, 86:11, 87:9, 87:12, 87:15, 87:16, 87:20, 88:12, 88:16, 88:17. 88:20. 88:23. 88:24, 88:26, 89:15, 89:18, 89:29, 91:23, 91:29, 92:2, 92:4, 93:2, 94:3, 94:6, 94:8,

95:14, 95:20, 96:11, 96:20, 96:24, 98:9, 98:10, 98:13, 98:15, 100:16, 100:21, 100:29, 101:20, 101:27, 102:20, 102:23, 102:28, 103:3, 103:14, 103:19, 104:23, 105:4, 105:9, 105:14, 105:22, 105:28, 106:2, 106:8, 106:14. 106:19, 107:15, 108:3, 108:23, 109:1, 109:23, 110:4, 110:10, 110:24, 111:4, 111:25, 112:2, 112:21, 112:25, 113:1, 113:18, 113:22, 114:12, 115:8. 115:18. 115:24, 115:25, 115:26, 116:1, 116:14, 117:15, 117:16. 117:17. 118:6, 118:9, 121:24, 125:4, 125:10, 125:22, 125:23, 126:11, 126:12, 126:25, 126:26, 127:10, 130:6, 130:7, 130:17, 130:27, 131:22. 134:29. 135:2, 135:22, 136:21, 136:29, 138:1, 149:4, 149:7, 155:14, 155:18, 156:27, 160:21, 160:22, 161:12, 166:18, 166:27, 168:18. 168:26. 169:1, 171:15, 172:6, 176:19 corrected [2] -11:15, 16:14 correction [1] -166:22 **correctly** [3] - 26:1, 26:13, 37:15 corresponded [1] -108:24 correspondence [17] - 7:19, 8:19, 10:15, 11:25, 12:2, 16:11, 38:5, 47:15, 73:21, 80:20, 87:10, 108:28, 135:17, 135:23, 135:24, 163:4, 170:10 **corruption** [6] - 9:15, 10:4, 54:19, 55:8,

coordinate [1] -

55:19, 56:2 COSTELLO [1] -2:22 counsel [1] - 71:23 country [2] - 140:5, 172:1 County [2] - 60:14, 61:7 couple [1] - 114:28 course [23] - 29:24, 36:15, 44:16, 44:25, 45:18, 64:19, 67:24, 68:27, 72:11, 72:26, 83:9, 85:23, 85:28, 86:19, 86:21, 96:7, 97:11, 108:9, 108:13, 133:28, 136:21, 141:12, 161:9 court [1] - 148:27 COURT [3] - 1:13, 2:3, 4:2 Court [6] - 60:17, 60:19, 61:27, 84:22, 98:11, 106:21 cover [2] - 43:15, 155.1 covered [1] - 154:27 covering [1] - 51:28 create [3] - 26:8, 55:29, 176:27 created [5] - 13:1, 16:22, 136:22, 165:2, 174:23 **creates** [1] - 10:6 creation [1] - 135:29 crime [3] - 14:12, 18:7, 18:16 Crime [3] - 13:11, 17:13, 60:25 Criminal [2] - 60:18, 60:26 criminal [18] - 13:26, 14:26, 35:1, 35:17, 36:12, 39:21, 41:4, 63:19, 80:7, 81:23, 83:4, 85:23, 86:1, 89:28, 98:23, 110:1, 110:29, 176:15 criminality [3] -12:12, 12:20, 36:17 criteria [1] - 140:26 critical [3] - 73:15, 75:11, 118:11 **criticise** [1] - 42:19 criticism [2] - 73:18, 106:25 CROSS [4] - 5:6, 5:13, 25:19, 91:17 cross [5] - 17:11, 18:23, 24:3, 24:4,

24:6 cross-examination [1] - 24:3 **CROSS-EXAMINED** [4] - 5:6, 5:13, 25:19, 91.17 cross-examined [1] - 24:6 cross-examining [1] - 24:4 cross-referencing [2] - 17:11, 18:23 crossing [4] - 83:20, 83:24, 83:25, 84:5 crucial [2] - 80:22, 90.3 **CS**[2] - 145:21, 145:22 **CUALÁIN**[1] - 3:7 Cualáin [55] - 7:3, 10:20, 12:4, 15:15, 16:26, 25:2, 34:28, 35:10, 36:11, 37:9, 38:3, 39:17, 41:25, 42:7, 44:24, 45:8, 46:3, 47:4, 47:29, 49:15, 50:10, 51:29, 52:5, 58:17, 62:8, 63:10, 64:2, 64:10, 64:20, 65:3, 69:2, 70:19, 73:26, 76:13, 103:28, 104:20, 104:21, 112:20, 120:21, 120:22, 121:21, 122:2, 122:4, 122:15, 123:18, 125:6, 139:3, 139:20, 140:21, 145:20, 156:22, 156:25, 162:9, 162:16, 178:15 **Cualáin's** [1] - 89:5 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 culpable [1] - 175:6 culture [2] - 26:8 cupboard [1] -113:13 curious [1] - 35:10 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 Curley [7] - 128:16, 128:17, 128:18, 128:20, 128:21, 128:22, 165:28 **Curran** [19] - 7:23, 10:18, 11:13, 16:9, 19:18, 19:27, 20:4, 20:10, 22:28, 34:24, 62:29, 63:6, 63:7, 133:16, 136:25,

136:26, 137:2, 141:2,

156:25

CURRAN [1] - 3:3 current [2] - 17:4, 48:26 custody [4] - 81:7, 128:3, 131:25, 132:4 CVR [3] - 150:15, 154:9, 154:12

D

63:5

D/superintendent [2] - 112:18, 145:19 Daily [2] - 46:5, 163:13 damage [1] - 83:4 Dan [1] - 88:15 Daniel [1] - 110:22 data [10] - 12:15, 16:23, 71:10, 71:21, 72:3, 75:15, 75:28, 83:15, 83:16 date [44] - 6:23, 19:18, 22:28, 38:1, 52:13, 57:14, 58:7, 59:4, 59:11, 60:11, 61:14, 61:18, 65:12, 68:12, 82:10, 86:23, 93:17, 94:17, 95:5, 95:11, 100:5, 100:8, 101:12, 101:25, 102:4, 102:5, 102:17, 106:20, 108:8, 123:19, 123:26, 124:1, 124:4, 124:18, 125:11, 138:24, 138:27, 145:26, 150:1, 156:13, 162:29, 171:23, 172:20 dated [17] - 11:14, 12:2, 16:12, 45:9, 46:3, 49:16, 51:29, 54:25, 59:12, 63:15, 69:18, 70:14, 89:13, 101:10, 162:25, 163:4, 164:4 dates [13] - 28:15, 28:19, 42:6, 42:10, 57:27, 59:10, 61:10, 61:13, 92:7, 101:16, 131:20, 137:3, 138:20 daughter [5] - 86:15, 86:19, 98:28, 102:24, 108:8 **DAVID** [2] - 2:28, 3:18 dawn [1] - 151:12 dawned [1] - 155:6 **DAY** [1] - 1:18

days [11] - 11:18, denied [4] - 71:25, 13:19, 67:2, 67:5, 88:25, 110:29, 111:2 94:4, 108:19, 144:2, deny [1] - 87:28 144:10, 153:1, 156:9, department [1] -169:14 28:5 deal [12] - 7:21, 14:8, Department [1] -32:11, 32:24, 48:9, 51.7 53:10, 126:9, 134:1, **Deputy** [1] - 121:26 153:12, 169:11. deputy [2] - 14:29, 170:21, 178:22 16.18 dealer [2] - 80:6, described [1] - 89:19 176:15 describing [1] **dealing** [4] - 11:6, 117:13 81:8, 154:22, 177:6 designated [1] dealings [5] - 44:5, 128:22 62:16, 62:22, 62:29, designed [1] - 26:4 desk[2] - 11:3, 18:26 deals [1] - 49:19 **DESMOND** [1] - 4:6 dealt [5] - 26:23, destruction [1] -35:6, 40:24, 57:5, 87:23 105:24 detail [9] - 23:13, debate [2] - 121:25, 46:1, 75:1, 79:8, 126:13 102:24, 126:9, deceitful [1] - 80:7 160:11, 168:27, December [9] -173:10 47:19, 68:19, 77:27, detailed [1] - 52:1 160:20, 162:26, details [2] - 52:8, 163:7, 164:4, 166:17, 130:24 169:16 detained [1] - 116:10 **DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 DETECTIVE [15] decide [1] - 23:1 3:4, 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, deciding [1] - 23:11 3:17, 5:3, 6:8, 25:19, decision [8] - 89:26, 43:20, 54:10, 60:2, 109:14, 110:8, 91:16, 104:15, 114:1, 116:13, 145:4, 119:1 159:27, 160:4, 177:14 Detective [57] decisions [1] -36:10, 43:23, 47:14, 103:17 47:15, 47:18, 47:21, **DECLAN**[3] - 3:5, 48:3, 49:27, 50:1, 5:17, 119:1 50:13, 50:15, 51:14, Declan [2] - 119:5, 52:1, 52:9, 52:15, 163:8 53:15, 59:28, 60:24, declined [5] - 79:26, 63:15, 63:25, 63:28, 82:19, 96:16, 130:13, 64:2, 65:3, 66:21, 159:15 66:27, 67:8, 67:19, declines [1] - 78:26 68:16, 69:3, 69:16, declining [1] - 51:18 69:20, 69:29, 70:15, deemed [3] - 72:27, 74:15, 77:4, 77:26, 78:2, 78:27, 79:22, 89:3, 110:18 82:21, 82:26, 82:28, defence [1] - 37:15 84:14, 84:21, 85:5, defend [1] - 42:18 definitively [1] -88:10, 88:27, 91:25, 94:15, 95:10, 106:4, 174:7 106:19, 118:26, degree [1] - 175:3

128:16, 163:8, 172:21

detective [50] - 5:10,

5:17, 6:5, 6:14, 7:7,

24:26, 25:11, 30:20,

16:6, 16:27, 22:4,

44:21, 45:6, 48:4,

delay [6] - 73:22,

75:6, 175:5, 175:6,

delays [1] - 73:24

deleted [1] - 131:12

deliberate [1] - 175:5

51:12, 52:3, 53:6, 54:7, 59:17, 59:21, 60:6, 60:8, 60:10, 60:21, 61:4, 61:5, 61:29, 64:7, 69:5, 76:27, 104:18, 109:24, 112:15, 114:4, 114:28, 118:14, 118:18, 119:6, 119:21, 119:27, 120:2, 120:4, 120:6, 120:8, 120:16, 120:18, 125:14, 133:4, 177:26 determination [2] -48:29. 164:12 determine [4] - 17:6, 48:27, 128:11, 131:11 determined [1] -173:15 developed [2] -55:21, 56:14 development [2] -107:29, 110:14 **DEVELOPMENT**[1] - 3:16 developments [1] -166:11 devices [4] - 84:29, 85:3, 107:6, 107:7 devote [1] - 178:16 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diary [14] - 19:29, 20:1, 23:6, 34:25, 67:9, 68:26, 83:21, 123:2, 141:10, 146:4, 159:6, 166:26 difference [1] -109:19 different [13] - 35:24, 38:25, 41:21, 69:17, 73:13, 78:22, 97:22, 99:20, 131:20, 131:21, 139:17, 141:10, 162:13 difficult [3] - 41:4, 41:5, 74:13 difficulty [2] - 11:5, **DIGNAM**[8] - 3:24, 5:7, 37:4, 37:7, 43:14, 43:18, 43:21, 43:23 Dignam [1] - 43:12 dignam [1] - 37:6 dignity [4] - 46:14, 47:7, 48:28, 164:14 direct [3] - 20:11, 42:16, 92:11 direct-evidence [2] -20:11, 92:11

directed [14] - 13:29, 14:23, 14:25, 15:20, 17:22, 20:14, 23:11, 39:16, 46:26, 47:17, 48:5, 49:4, 49:8, 53:17 directing [2] - 15:6, 47:16 direction [14] -15:11, 23:20, 23:21, 24:12, 47:2, 47:22, 57:7, 57:17, 58:16, 69:3, 70:4, 147:13, 147:15, 162:21 directions [3] -46:26, 53:27, 100:11 **Directive** [1] - 56:4 directive [1] - 54:25 directly [2] - 155:20, 155:24 **DIRECTLY** [6] - 5:5, 5:12, 5:19, 6:9, 60:3, 119:2 DIRECTLY-**EXAMINED** [6] - 5:5, 5:12, 5:19, 6:9, 60:3, 119:2 director [12] - 69:24, 72:9, 89:2, 89:6, 89:11, 103:24, 103:29, 107:27, 109:17, 110:7, 117:7 **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 **Director** [1] - 71:2 director's [3] - 89:7, 89:12, 110:6 DIRECTORATE[1] -3:15 directs [2] - 46:10, 46:29 disappeared [1] -73:24 disappointed [2] -84:6, 84:11 disciplinary [11] -35:1, 35:17, 36:12,

36:17, 39:21, 85:11,

85:28, 87:21, 88:22,

discipline [3] - 89:9,

disclose [5] - 9:22,

145:29, 159:5, 160:2

disclosed [14] - 9:1,

9:7, 10:7, 12:12, 13:6,

167:14, 167:20, 168:4

discloser [2] - 8:25,

100:11, 109:29

100:25, 107:14

33:28, 122:10,

138:25, 149:11,

167:8. 167:12.

33:29 disclosure [45] -7:25, 8:6, 8:14, 8:21, 9:13, 10:13, 11:19, 26:4, 26:15, 26:23, 27:16, 27:23, 27:29, 29:10, 29:12, 29:13, 29:18, 29:20, 32:4, 32:5, 32:6, 32:8, 32:18, 32:19, 32:29, 33:1, 33:3, 33:13, 33:20, 33:22, 33:24, 34:2, 34:3, 34:5, 34:13, 34:15, 34:16, 35:26, 36:16, 39:2, 58:15, 121:19, 148:23, 148:24, 159:14 DISCLOSURES [2] -1:2, 1:3 disclosures [7] -26:9, 29:11, 33:26, 44:7, 58:21, 58:25, 153:29 Disclosures [3] -6:21, 56:23, 141:21 discourage [1] - 26:6 discover [1] - 132:22 discovering [1] -37:19 discuss [4] - 12:6, 153:13, 170:5, 172:2 discussed [7] -52:24, 70:1, 146:21, 146:23, 146:25, 146:27. 172:22 discussing [1] -80:14 discussion [3] -22:26, 77:15, 157:8 discussions [3] -10:14, 67:14, 76:5 dispute [3] - 58:26, 92:8, 95:26 dissatisfaction [1] -139:2 distance [4] - 10:19, 123:29, 172:10, 177:15 District [4] - 61:27, 84:22, 98:11, 106:21 district [11] - 38:13, 62:5, 62:6, 62:19, 74:16, 75:13, 75:25, 77:18, 77:24, 124:8, 132:12 **DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 divisional [7] - 7:24,

7:12, 14:2, 29:12, 29:25, 29:27, 30:2, 30:10, 30:11, 32:11, 32:23, 33:22, 45:7, 46:2, 47:11, 47:24, 49:13, 49:18, 54:20, 54:23, 79:15, 86:5, 94:18, 95:11, 95:15, 95:23, 95:25, 115:20, 115:28, 125:18, 147:4, 147:7, 155:23, 167:22, 168:9, 170:28 documentation [4] -6:18, 57:25, 113:6, 134:20 documented [5] -131:29, 142:22, 155:15, 166:7 documents [2] -45:5, 100:23 **DONAL** [2] - 3:7, 3:24 **Donal** [1] - 62:8 done [11] - 15:12, 40:20, 41:9, 41:10, 83:8, 151:20, 161:16, 161:19, 163:19, 173:11, 174:20 Donegal [3] - 61:7, 61:21, 61:25 double [4] - 83:20, 83:24, 83:25, 84:5 double-crossing [4] - 83:20, 83:24, 83:25, 84:5 doubt [2] - 159:24, 159:26 doubts [1] - 80:5 down [34] - 13:27, 22:12, 30:28, 33:14, 34:27, 37:29, 38:1, 46:27, 56:4, 60:8, 61:15, 63:14, 67:3, 74:25, 83:2, 93:7, 100:3, 115:27, 122:11, 123:21, 125:26, 125:28, 126:24, 133:22, 142:5, 142:23, 143:2, 146:7, 154:27, 160:17, 162:25, 168:12, 175:12, 178:9 **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, 3:20 downloaded [2] -72:2, 75:12 downloading [1] -71:10

DOCKERY [1] - 4:6

document [36] -

DPP [8] - 41:26, 42:3, 42:15, 80:20, 100:28, 103:17, 148:24, 149:3 **DPP's** [1] - 167:9 **DR** [1] - 3:11 draft [2] - 168:23, 173:14 drawing [1] - 147:4 drawn [1] - 6:24 drink [1] - 159:3 driving [1] - 150:18 drug [2] - 67:17, 176:15 drugs [7] - 38:16, 38:29, 124:28, 132:1, 132:8, 132:28, 134:14 **DUBLIN** [7] - 1:17, 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, 4:9, 4:13 **Dublin** [7] - 60:14, 60:28, 119:12, 119:23, 131:16, 171:14, 174:28 **due** [4] - 12:4, 136:21, 163:17, 173:17 Dun [2] - 60:14 duplicate [1] -165:17 during [18] - 7:29, 8:11, 44:15, 44:25, 45:18, 49:29, 63:2, 68:27, 69:1, 72:11, 72:26, 73:23, 75:6, 80:18, 85:28, 141:12, 143:25, 167:19 duties [5] - 26:2, 60:16, 60:17, 83:9, 171:13 duty [6] - 13:7, 69:28, 151:5, 151:8, 152:15, 154:27 **DVD** [1] - 125:19 **DVDs** [3] - 133:8, 133:13, 134:12 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 Dáil [4] - 11:28, 16:25, 121:25, 147:29

Ε

e-mail [3] - 14:20, 16:1, 129:21 EAMON [1] - 3:10 Eamon [3] - 128:16, 128:18, 128:21 early [10] - 6:19, 7:11, 59:9, 119:16,

8:2, 8:12, 8:19, 62:5,

77:18, 124:8

126:5, 135:6, 146:24, 160:13, 166:17, 169:14 easiest [1] - 129:15 Eastern [4] - 11:2, 11:13, 15:29, 16:4 edition [1] - 164:3 effect [7] - 8:5, 17:14, 58:16, 83:21, 87:5, 87:15, 88:3 effect.. [1] - 18:17 effectively [8] - 8:1, 11:3, 15:29, 16:3, 16:5, 29:7, 98:8, 164.13 effort [2] - 83:8, efforts [4] - 72:28, 104:24, 105:1, 160:7 EGAN [1] - 3:25 eight [3] - 99:15, 120:15, 120:18 either [6] - 36:17, 39:17, 42:18, 45:9, 148:24. 156:18 electronic [5] -84:29, 85:3, 98:10, 99:18, 108:25 ELIZABETH[1] -2:29 elsewhere [3] - 43:5, 132:10, 166:26 em [3] - 8:8, 102:6, 169:4 **EMMA**[1] - 3:26 **emphasis** [1] - 33:12 emphasised [1] -142:20 emphasising [1] -80:12 employment [5] -45:20, 46:18, 51:19, 51:24, 164:19 enable [1] - 144:29 enclosed [2] - 77:12, 89:16 **enclosing** [1] - 115:3 encompassing [1] -173:27 encourage [1] - 26:4 encouraged [1] encouraging [2] -55:22, 136:9 end [10] - 28:8, 35:15, 40:16, 44:5, 45:15, 96:19, 114:22, 161:2, 174:2, 175:17 END [8] - 25:14, 43:10, 54:3, 59:19,

91:12, 104:10, 113:25, 118:16 engage [2] - 50:5, 111:6 engaged [1] - 50:22 engagement [1] -52:8 enlighten [1] - 169:2 **Ennis** [1] - 63:8 Ennistymon [1] -119:29 enquire [2] - 66:16, 153:16 enquired [2] - 50:2, 108:24 enquiries [5] - 86:18, 86:20, 146:13, 173:23, 175:26 ensure [6] - 12:11, 13:7, 15:14, 50:16, 136:7, 174:9 ensuring [2] - 51:16, 51:17 entail [1] - 106:10 entered [2] - 12:19, 162:3 entertain [1] - 29:19 entirely [1] - 42:28 entitled [3] - 142:17, 144:3, 144:11 entitlement [2] -144:6 entries [2] - 19:16, 149:12 entry [16] - 10:27, 11:7, 11:19, 11:22, 12:6, 14:6, 19:29, 23:6, 23:29, 65:16, 83:21, 128:28, 136:1, 145:11, 146:4, 159:9 environment [1] -55:29 envisage [1] - 123:8 envisaged [2] -26:12, 169:3 **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:8 Equality [1] - 55:14 equally [2] - 28:23, 28:24 equals [1] - 80:10 equipment [3] -98:10, 99:18, 108:25 erased [2] - 75:7, 83:15 erasing [1] - 83:3

especially [1] - 8:25

essential [3] - 9:13,

essentially [2] -

10:2. 68:9

7:22, 168:19 establish [5] - 46:11, 108:15, 131:14, 155:28, 161:7 ESTABLISHED[1] established [7] -55:15, 55:16, 56:9, 86:21, 110:13, 162:20, 172:23 establishing [1] -128:2 etcetera [5] - 98:9, 144:2, 144:10, 147:19, 155:17 ethical [1] - 55:22 evasive[1] - 108:18 evening [2] - 68:17, 171.27 event [13] - 63:9, 78:26, 121:20, 126:19, 128:27, 129:26, 137:21, 152:2, 156:8, 156:24, 162:1, 167:22, 172:18 eventually [5] -79:16, 86:15, 108:7, 130:8, 169:17 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 evidence [58] - 7:23, 7:29, 8:1, 8:4, 8:11, 10:21, 16:15, 19:2, 19:4, 19:23, 19:26, 20:11, 22:8, 22:10, 24:25, 35:23, 36:10, 36:27, 37:10, 37:11, 39:26, 42:24, 48:8, 53:10, 58:7, 69:10, 70:25, 71:18, 73:23, 75:6, 75:7, 75:10, 80:5, 80:24, 81:11, 81:26, 84:7, 87:24, 89:6, 89:19, 89:23, 90:4, 91:20, 92:11, 93:11, 104:29, 106:10, 109:10, 109:11, 113:15, 114:16, 117:4, 117:19, 134:15, 148:18, 162:3, 166:12, 176:27 evident [2] - 12:1, 126.5 exact [2] - 61:14, 66:15 exactly [8] - 23:11, 66:17, 99:8, 126:8, 154:20, 178:26, 178:28

9:14, 10:2, 17:29, 18:2, 24:3, 84:26 **EXAMINATION**[8] -25:14, 43:10, 54:3, 59:19, 91:12, 104:10, 113:25, 118:16 EXAMINED [18] -5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:15, 5:19, 6:9, 25:19, 43:20, 54:10, 60:3, 91:17, 104:15, 114:1, 119.2 examined [6] - 24:6, 83:13, 85:3, 87:20, 132:1, 132:4 examining [1] - 24:4 excellent [1] - 140:5 except [1] - 24:10 excess [1] - 99:16 exchange [2] -127:20, 135:24 exchanged [1] -127:16 exclusively [1] -178:16 executed [1] -106:21 EXECUTIVE [1] exhibits [5] - 68:7, 68:10, 71:7, 99:10 existed [1] - 30:13 **existence** [3] - 7:5, 56:21. 107:17 expanded [2] -126:7, 175:2 expanding [2] - 74:5, 126:16 expected [2] - 50:13, 173:28 expecting [3] -40:29, 41:3, 129:12 expeditiously [1] -173:28 expense [1] - 151:8 expenses [4] -151:10, 151:11,

expense [1] - 151:8
expenses [4] 151:10, 151:11,
152:11, 154:16
experience [4] 81:22, 95:27, 97:1,
97:9
experiencing [1] 46:12
explain [4] - 81:7,
84:8, 147:11, 147:27
explained [6] 136:6, 140:23,
141:21, 142:7,
144:10, 148:23

explains [5] -142:26, 142:29, 144:2, 146:13, 147:23 explanation [3] -93:6, 93:9, 93:15 **explore** [3] - 43:5, 47:5, 104:3 exploring [2] - 30:12, 31:25 expressed [2] -10:18, 69:17 expressly [1] - 56:29 extent [4] - 23:27, 75:2, 130:1, 178:6 extra [3] - 154:26, 168:28. 179:1 extracts [1] - 161:19 extremely [2] - 20:2, 98:17 extremes [1] -160:26

F

face [2] - 101:7,

123:29 facilitate [3] - 93:8, 93:16, 95:8 facility [1] - 10:6 fact [31] - 8:20, 11:15, 12:3, 15:15, 17:3, 28:21, 37:9, 41:23, 49:16, 51:22, 52:13, 58:10, 77:6, 88:27, 89:3, 90:15, 90:19, 103:11, 103:15, 112:26, 122:23, 131:25, 132:22, 136:27, 139:21, 140:11, 148:14, 153:10, 154:17, 161:16, 173:17 facts [3] - 64:12, 64:16, 122:16 failure [3] - 80:22, 81:6, 90:2 fair [8] - 81:13, 90:12, 90:23, 97:21, 105:19, 170:23, 171:19. 172:12 fairness [3] - 84:7, 137:5, 171:19 faith [1] - 140:2 false [1] - 62:27 familiar [5] - 11:7, 17:28, 18:21, 73:16, family [2] - 111:14,

examination [6] -

112:3 **FANNING** [1] - 2:21 Fanning [1] - 147:2 far [10] - 28:20, 30:16, 30:19, 30:20, 31:3, 58:9, 93:12, 100:25, 127:3, 137:11 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:5 Farrell [5] - 12:2, 12:7, 132:19, 132:23, 132:26 fault [1] - 27:14 **favourably**[1] - 90:9 fear [2] - 146:1, 166:28 featured [2] - 47:5, 105:19 February [8] - 41:15, 100:9, 101:4, 102:2, 102:5, 102:21, 107:12. 174:2 **FEBRUARY** [5] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 6:2, 179:20 feedback [10] -27:28, 28:22, 29:8, 29:19, 30:13, 30:16, 30:22, 31:11, 44:10, 44:15 feeding [1] - 28:10 fella [1] - 177:5 felt [11] - 26:9, 35:27, 48:15, 48:29, 87:8, 103:6, 152:8, 153:8, 155:7, 156:6, 167:28 FERGAL [1] - 2:27 FERRY [1] - 2:16 few [8] - 25:24, 43:14, 50:26, 66:1, 68:24, 113:12, 129:3, 156.9 fifth [1] - 129:4 file [16] - 15:2, 15:25, 17:29, 18:2, 69:24, 71:1, 72:8, 76:19, 78:12, 89:4, 89:5, 100:29, 109:17, 132:17, 173:27, 174:29 files [10] - 124:12, 128:3, 128:4, 128:11, 132:11, 132:23, 133:5, 173:16, 174:25 final [5] - 50:9, 79:28, 173:14, 173:27, 175:10 finally [1] - 51:27 fine [4] - 43:5, 101:14, 104:6, 177:18 finish [3] - 6:15, 7:20, 169:18

finished [4] - 44:1, 44:2, 120:2, 169:24 **FINN** [1] - 3:5 **FINTAN** [1] - 2:21 firearm [2] - 158:7, 158:10 firearm" [1] - 158:9 firearms [2] - 158:20, 158:21 fired [1] - 158:27 firms [1] - 97:1 first [30] - 6:16, 15:3, 45:11, 49:21, 58:20, 69:18, 72:19, 72:21, 73:20, 73:27, 74:29, 75:9, 77:28, 77:29, 115:21, 117:11, 120:29, 125:24, 129:3, 135:8, 137:27, 139:20, 145:27, 146:16, 157:17, 160:27, 161:10, 171:2, 176:1 firstly [3] - 44:21, 46:24, 109:12 fit [1] - 92:25 FITZWILLIAM [1] five [3] - 92:10, 93:26, 98:26 fix [1] - 150:1 fixed [1] - 65:12 Flanagan [1] -121:26 flavour [1] - 90:23 flower [1] - 109:8 **FLYNN** [1] - 3:19 focus [3] - 143:27, 144:3, 144:12 focuses [1] - 81:5 focusing [3] - 27:14, 83:1. 156:2 follow [5] - 15:27, 54:23, 103:29, 153:26, 171:1 follow-up [1] -103:29 followed [3] - 46:4, 77:22, 87:14 following [24] - 1:25, 15:29, 16:1, 19:1, 20:29, 23:2, 48:17, 56:5, 65:16, 67:14, 86:18, 92:24, 115:4, 119:20, 119:26, 120:1, 140:18, 157:13, 157:26,

158:3, 163:4, 163:17,

FOLLOWING [1] -

170:27, 173:26

follows [2] - 100:2, 100:8 **FOLLOWS** [11] - 6:1, 6:9. 25:20. 43:21. 54:11, 60:4, 91:17, 98:2, 104:16, 114:2, 119:3 foot [9] - 47:22, 85:17, 106:9, 106:15, 107:29, 146:18, 148:1, 148:8, 170:7 **FOR** [11] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 4:1, 4:4, 4:10, 98.1 force [1] - 141:26 forced [1] - 109:3 forecourt [1] -114:17 foregoing [1] - 12:18 foremost [1] - 74:14 form [4] - 46:13, 83:4, 85:22, 111:24 formal [9] - 28:21, 30:21, 31:2, 31:3, 31:6, 31:19, 34:29, 35:15, 44:9 formality [1] - 156:17 formally [1] - 82:20 formed [2] - 131:3, 152:27 FORMER [2] - 1:13, **former** [1] - 37:9 formulation [1] forth [1] - 106:7 forum [1] - 147:25 forward [4] - 13:23, 69:27, 80:23, 139:23 forwarded [1] -100:14 forwarding [2] -52:1, 164:8 four [10] - 49:14, 60:20, 66:10, 69:11, 98:26, 98:28, 100:22, 101:8, 134:13 fourth [1] - 69:12 frame [1] - 26:16 framework [4] - 6:18, 44:11, 57:9, 58:4 Frank [1] - 21:18 FRANK [5] - 5:3, 6:8, 25:19, 43:20, 54:10 fraud [2] - 92:19,

Friend [1] - 59:7 friends [1] - 80:9 from.. [1] - 78:20 front [3] - 30:7, 35:8, 125.16 frustrating [1] -86:27 frustration [1] -10.18 full [1] - 33:16 fully [6] - 13:7, 52:3, 84:4, 169:8, 172:20, 178:23 function [3] - 76:11, 90:28. 91:4 future [1] - 169:3 G

FREEMAN [1] - 2:22

Friday [1] - 171:26

Galway [43] - 60:7, 61:1, 61:5, 61:8, 61:9, 61:26, 61:29, 62:4, 62:7, 62:14, 62:15, 65:9, 68:2, 79:2, 79:13, 79:14, 80:15, 87:19, 104:27, 105:8, 111:7, 111:10, 117:12, 120:1, 120:15, 120:18, 121:1, 121:5, 122:11, 122:12, 136:17, 143:13, 149:17, 160:8, 160:9, 161:13, 169:16, 169:21, 171:25, 173:7, 175:9, 177:28 gap [7] - 31:18, 31:26, 54:15, 58:3, 58:4, 58:9, 101:8 garda [10] - 35:25, 35:28, 36:7, 36:13, 39:19, 39:22, 90:8, 139:1, 143:24, 150:10 Garda [300] - 10:28, 11:20, 11:28, 11:29, 12:3, 12:20, 12:22, 12:24, 14:14, 16:24, 17:3, 17:5, 17:12, 17:15, 17:25, 18:5, 18:24, 22:17, 23:16, 23:25, 24:22, 35:25, 35:26, 35:29, 36:4, 36:18, 36:22, 37:10, 37:17, 38:12, 38:16, 38:29, 39:12, 39:13, 39:18, 39:19, 39:22, 39:27, 39:28, 40:5, 40:14, 40:19, 42:25,

44:15, 44:18, 44:24, 45:26, 46:6, 46:11, 46:17, 46:25, 47:1, 47:4, 49:20, 50:6, 50:22, 51:2, 51:9, 51:15, 51:18, 51:22, 52:10, 52:28, 53:1, 53:5, 53:7, 53:9, 53:11, 54:29, 55:7, 55:17, 55:19, 55:21, 55:22, 55:23, 56:10, 56:15, 60:12, 63:25, 64:6, 65:24, 66:3, 66:10, 66:23, 66:25, 67:7, 67:10, 67:16, 67:25, 68:7, 68:14, 68:18, 68:26, 69:5, 69:7, 69:10, 69:14, 69:16, 69:28, 70:5, 70:8, 71:3, 71:8, 71:18, 71:26, 73:7, 73:10, 73:14, 73:27, 73:29, 74:7, 74:20, 74:25, 74:28, 75:3, 75:5. 75:16. 75:17. 75:29, 76:4, 76:12, 76:14, 77:17, 77:22, 78:1, 78:3, 78:5, 78:8, 79:2, 79:12, 79:19, 79:28, 80:8, 80:9, 80:19, 80:27, 81:1, 81:3, 81:5, 81:6, 81:9, 82:2. 82:10. 82:28. 84:7, 85:1, 87:19, 88:14, 88:19, 88:25, 90:1, 90:8, 90:25, 91:20, 91:21, 91:26, 92:28, 93:3, 94:1, 94:4, 94:16, 94:17, 94:23. 95:17. 96:15. 96:26, 97:15, 100:15, 105:25, 105:26, 105:29, 106:11, 107:23, 110:13, 110:16, 112:19, 112:24, 113:7, 114:6, 115:22, 116:5, 116:10, 117:2, 117:20, 119:9, 119:10, 121:6, 121:17, 121:25, 122:24, 123:16, 123:17, 123:19, 123:24, 123:26, 124:7, 124:27, 125:2, 125:24, 125:25, 127:14, 127:29, 129:8, 129:26, 130:4, 130:8, 130:14, 130:21, 131:3,

131:14, 131:19,

free [3] - 26:9, 59:22,

178:24

132:5, 132:18, 132:22, 132:25, 133:7, 133:9, 133:17, 133:21, 134:16, 134:28, 135:27, 136:2, 136:3, 137:19, 137:22, 138:14, 140:2, 140:4, 140:19, 141:3, 141:13, 141:17, 143:4, 143:5, 143:25, 144:6, 144:14, 146:10, 147:21, 147:22, 147:28, 149:5, 149:13, 149:26, 150:5, 150:9, 150:12, 151:14, 154:3, 154:28, 155:11, 155:24, 155:26, 155:28, 156:11, 157:9, 157:11, 157:13, 157:14, 157:19, 157:23, 157:26, 158:7, 158:18, 158:19, 158:28, 159:5, 161:9, 161:23, 162:10, 162:20, 163:9, 164:21, 166:13, 166:15, 166:17, 166:18, 166:28, 167:27, 171:6, 172.13 173.25 174:16, 175:2, 176:8, 176:14, 176:16, 176:21, 177:4, 177:5, 179:7 GARDA [10] - 2:10, 2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2, 3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21, 4.10 Gardaí [10] - 87:7, 98:22, 100:10, 133:9, 163:12, 163:16, 163:25, 164:2, 164:5, 164:7 gardaí [6] - 38:13, 75:4, 83:9, 139:24, 139:25, 164:12 gather [2] - 124:25, 176.1 gathered [1] - 118:4 Gearoid [2] - 87:13, 108:21 general [5] - 51:6, 55:2, 60:16, 75:2, 106:24 generally [2] - 97:8, 105:19 generated [2] -

100:26, 101:6 gentlemen [1] - 48:9 Geraghty [4] - 87:13, 108:22, 108:23, 108:28 GERAGHTY [1] -GERARD [1] - 2:11 Gerry [1] - 119:19 **GERRY** [1] - 3:11 gist [1] - 106:9 given [23] - 7:9, 18:19, 19:26, 67:28, 79:24, 90:12, 92:1, $92{:}3,\,92{:}14,\,112{:}22,$ 114:16, 114:20, 124:4, 125:28, 133:16, 145:5, 154:25, 161:9. 164:24, 164:29, 166:28, 173:8 Glacken [1] - 145:22 glad [2] - 31:22, 36:8 **GLEESON** [1] - 4:7 **GNDU** [1] - 174:28 God's [1] - 68:23 GOODE [1] - 3:22 Gorman [1] - 110:22 Gort [5] - 61:2, 62:19, 62:20, 121:6 governance [2] -141:22, 142:6 **GRALTON** [1] - 3:14 gratifying [2] - 42:13 great [6] - 45:5, 86:1, 116:19, 126:9, 130:1, 160:26 greater [1] - 175:24 greatly [1] - 126:7 GREENE [1] - 2:27 **GRIFFIN** [1] - 3:26 ground [3] - 8:3, 84:18, 84:19 grounds [1] - 85:8 group [2] - 57:12, 178:21 GSOC [35] - 48:22, 48:23, 51:6, 72:10, 77:5, 77:9, 101:2,

135:13, 135:15,

141:22, 142:8,

142:12, 142:21,

143:8, 143:15,

143:18, 143:20,

163:26, 165:3,

165:16, 165:20,

165:22, 167:12,

167:14, 167:15,

167:18, 167:21,

142:28, 143:2, 143:7,

170:16, 170:22, 170:23, 178:1, 178:2 guard [3] - 39:11, 106:12, 121:18 guards [1] - 134:11 guess [1] - 117:6 guessing [2] - 93:22, 93:23 guidance [4] - 14:7, 15:12, 64:21, 110:5 guided [1] - 7:18 guidelines [2] -55:16, 165:12 guilty [1] - 176:24 gun [1] - 158:23 guns [1] - 87:8 GWEN [1] - 1:29 Gwen [1] - 1:24 Н had.. [1] - 157:28 half [1] - 128:8

HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 hampered [2] - 148:9 hand [3] - 68:24, 109:26, 169:4 handcuffed [1] -107:4 **HANDED**[1] - 40:11 handed [3] - 68:7, 71:6, 71:7 handle [1] - 138:10 handwritten [2] -78:8, 137:25 hanging [2] - 143:25, 146:10 happy [5] - 20:5, 142:29, 143:17, 147:19, 151:24 **HARAN**[1] - 4:5 harassed [6] - 48:16, 49:1, 163:16, 164:15, 164:22, 165:9 harassment [8] -46:13, 48:23, 163:26, 165:5, 165:21, 168:14, 170:3, 170:6 Harcourt [2] - 60:25, 119:11 hard [1] - 83:18 **HAVING** [2] - 60:2, 119.1 he.. [1] - 158:11 **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 head [2] - 22:15, 123:28 headed [3] - 44:23, 47:3, 63:14

hear [7] - 30:29, 34:3, 48:8, 71:27, 71:28, 84:6, 91:19 heard [9] - 42:24, 53:10, 70:18, 73:18, 121:27, 121:29, 125:25, 146:10, 160:24 **HEARING** [3] - 6:1, 98:1, 179:19 heart [1] - 51:23 **held** [1] - 171:5 **HELD** [1] - 1:17 help [10] - 65:7, 95:4, 105:20, 144:23, 147:11, 148:12, 150:1, 159:26, 160:3, 172:26 helped [1] - 148:11 helpful [1] - 145:4 helps [1] - 37:25 Henry [4] - 63:25, 119:18, 119:21 heroin [6] - 80:3, 80:6, 80:18, 128:8, 176:15, 177:6 hierarchical [1] -46:25 hierarchy [1] -166:13 **HIGGINS** [1] - 4:10 high [4] - 140:24, 143:29, 144:21, 144:24 High [1] - 60:17 highest [1] - 174:8 highlighted [3] -50:16, 163:12, 163:15 him. [1] - 170:11 himself [13] - 33:26, 33:29, 34:6, 85:8, 90:25, 95:21, 112:3, 118:12, 143:18, 154:4. 167:10. 167:14, 168:4 hinder [1] - 148:12 historical [1] - 90:22 hm [1] - 101:29 hm-hmm [1] - 101:29 **hmm** [6] - 19:10, 101:29, 104:28, 137:26, 148:26, 165:29 hold [3] - 33:20, 86:1, 166:18 holding [2] - 112:16 holidays [1] - 108:19

home [10] - 66:28,

headquarters [3] -

76:13, 114:22, 156:24

67:6, 102:19, 102:22, 106:17, 108:4, 108:5, 111:13, 121:15, 129:26 honest [4] - 121:29, 122:28, 166:6, 170:9 honestly [1] - 148:5 hope [7] - 34:23, 41:9, 42:11, 79:23, 107:19, 107:24, 140:2 hoping [2] - 160:29, 173:8 **HORAN** [1] - 3:25 hostile [2] - 86:14, 98:17 hour [1] - 95:2 hours [3] - 42:26, 52:22, 86:25 **HOUSE** [3] - 2:23, 3:27, 4:11 house [15] - 66:25, 78:1, 86:15, 87:7, 98:16, 99:24, 106:27, 107:9, 111:13, 133:5, 134:9, 134:10, 161:4, 166:17, 167:27 houses [2] - 134:2, 134:3 **HQ** [3] - 54:25, 56:4, 145:20 HR [2] - 28:5, 159:5 HRM [14] - 58:23, 121:14, 140:29, 143:29, 144:17, 144:29, 145:22, 145:29, 146:1, 146:28, 159:15, 160:3, 168:2, 168:3 huge [1] - 42:26 **HUGHES** [2] - 2:29, **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15 hundred [5] - 15:23, 28:5, 134:5, 152:5, 170:13

- 1

I'M [1] - 150:10
i.e [3] - 44:23, 128:5,
154:18
ICELAND [1] - 4:11
ID [1] - 10:28
idea [1] - 99:13
identified [9] - 21:20,
29:13, 32:6, 32:18,
33:10, 33:23, 35:26,
72:24, 117:25
identifies [2] - 11:22,

115:16 identify [3] - 32:23, 34:14, 115:5 **identity** [9] - 8:21, 8:25, 8:29, 9:3, 9:6, 9:21, 9:23, 10:7, 137:15 imagine [4] - 15:22, 76:2, 76:3, 77:23 immediate [3] -46:10, 47:1, 123:11 immediately [4] -49:1, 158:24, 164:16, 165:9 impact [5] - 57:6, 109:12, 109:13, 111:5, 111:7 implemented [2] -49:9, 53:28 implication [1] -111:22 implicit [1] - 31:22 **import** [1] - 22:16 importance [1] -74.7 important [5] -16:28, 78:24, 79:11, 142:22, 175:11 imposed [2] - 7:17, 26:3 impossible [2] -113:9, 131:13 **improper** [1] - 117:5 IN [1] - 1:17 incident [11] - 63:20, 63:21, 63:22, 63:26, 65:23, 69:23, 78:10, 78:15, 114:7, 174:21, 179:7 incidents [3] - 56:2, 126:11, 128:5 inclined [1] - 111:18 included [5] - 20:1, 135:16, 161:2, 165:8, 168:29 including [5] - 18:11, 60:18, 67:26, 98:28, 111:24 incorporates [1] -168:11 incorrect [3] - 37:13, 37:14, 38:23 incriminate [1] -117:21 incriminated [1] -117:20 incriminating [2] -109:27, 109:29 indeed [19] - 60:16, 61:20, 61:25, 81:18,

81:22, 98:22, 99:27, 103:23, 106:28, 108:24, 111:4, 111:11, 111:20, 130:5, 131:2, 135:18, 136:18, 177:7, 177:17 INDEX [1] - 5:1 indicate [1] - 106:6 indicated [4] - 48:15, 50:5, 143:15, 163:14 indicates [2] - 93:12, 105:10 indicating [2] -146:29, 166:10 indication [1] -112.22 individual [2] -38:13, 98:20 individuals [1] -63:26 influence [2] - 52:24, 159:3 inform [3] - 49:26, 61:26, 140:6 informant [1] -137:14 information [34] -12:19, 12:23, 14:15, 14:18, 15:3, 15:17, 15:26, 44:17, 49:26, 52:13, 67:26, 70:24, 80:23, 83:3, 84:15, 84:19, 84:27, 84:28, 98:7, 99:26, 104:2, 104:25, 106:5, 124:25, 136:15, 137:14, 137:18, 137:28, 139:26, 140:4, 164:7, 164:9, 176:1, 179:9 informed [22] - 8:5, 15:10, 15:14, 26:15, 26:24, 27:12, 28:11, 28:13, 48:29, 53:4, 66:13, 103:1, 144:27, 163:16. 163:25. 164:5, 164:7, 164:14, 165:8, 167:18, 169:6, 171:1 informing [1] - 53:23 **informs** [1] - 77:3 initial [4] - 42:25, 60:13, 79:21, 103:27

inordinate [1] -

input [2] - 57:13,

inquiries [5] - 63:27,

72:23, 72:25, 108:11,

117:10

63:24

147:10

INQUIRY [2] - 1:2, inquiry [10] - 73:28, 75:13, 85:12, 85:23, 85:28, 87:21, 88:22, 103:15, 103:22, 172:23 insignificant [1] -152:6 insofar [3] - 112:23, 113:2, 149:5 Inspector [21] - 12:2, 12:6, 48:4, 59:28, 60:6, 64:11, 65:3, 78:27, 86:23, 91:8, 99:1, 99:9, 104:20, 110:21, 122:5, 122:16, 131:20, 132:19, 132:23, 132:26, 163:9 INSPECTOR [12] -3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:18, 3:22, 4:5, 5:10, 60:2, 91:16, 104:15, 114:1 inspector [21] - 60:9, 60:10, 61:6, 61:12, 61:22, 61:23, 61:24, 61:26, 61:29, 104:19, 109:24, 112:15, 114:4, 114:28, 118:14, 118:19, 119:23, 119:26, 119:27, 120:2, 120:7 instance [1] - 169:1 instructed [1] -50:15 INSTRUCTED[8] -2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10 instruction [1] -57:11 instructions [3] -37:8, 59:7, 133:16 INSTRUMENT[1] insurance [2] -154:24, 154:26 insured [2] - 150:21, 152:19 integral [1] - 15:25 intelligence [18] -10:27, 11:6, 11:19, 13:1, 14:6, 16:21, 19:6, 22:18, 23:17, 23:26, 23:28, 24:23, 136:1, 136:22, 137:8, 163:21, 165:2 intended [1] - 81:16 intending [2] - 73:7,

130:28 intention [4] - 29:17, 32:14, 73:9, 73:10 interaction [2] -45:25. 127:2 interactions [3] -49:19, 51:10, 52:8 interest [3] - 17:16, 18:25, 109:28 interested [3] -98:25, 101:16, 131:24 interfered [1] -161:18 interim [3] - 11:29, 57:20. 58:14 interlinked [1] -173:18 intern [1] - 57:10 Internal [2] - 13:10, 14.11 internal [1] - 77:24 interpret [2] -140:14, 142:5 interpretation [5] -32:25, 32:27, 33:2, 34:11, 43:25 intervene [2] - 30:12, intervening [2] -7:13, 35:21 interview [25] - 19:3, 21:6, 21:14, 21:22, 45:18, 67:27, 68:17, 73:11, 74:6, 81:16, 82:2, 82:21, 88:18, 90:10, 96:14, 97:7, 97:12, 97:13, 108:1, 112:23, 117:21, 123:22, 129:9, 173:9, 173:27 interview/ statement [1] - 66:24 interviewed [7] -94:7, 96:26, 97:19, 113:5, 116:5, 134:8,

interview/
statement [1] - 66:24
interviewed [7] 94:7, 96:26, 97:19,
13:5, 116:5, 134:8,
134:10
interviewing [6] 81:15, 81:24, 173:7,
173:24, 173:29,
175:27
interviews [8] 80:27, 96:4, 97:5,
112:28, 113:20,
116:12, 134:18,
143:27
INTO [1] - 1:2
intoxicant [1] - 52:24
introducing [1] 44:20
intrusion [2] - 17:16,

18:26 investigate [7] -12:23, 14:15, 48:24, 123:13, 124:1, 163:28, 164:13 investigated [11] -12:12, 13:7, 36:14, 62:26, 67:4, 134:2, 135:26, 147:24, 169:19, 170:24, 174:10 investigating [21] -15:16, 35:22, 36:15, 40:18, 42:29, 60:27, 77:16, 77:20, 78:19, 88:29, 91:5, 121:21, 126:14, 135:22, 135:23, 135:27, 141:28, 142:26, 152:26, 163:12, 164:12 investigation [155] -8:10, 9:15, 10:3, 10:19, 13:26, 14:26, 15:19, 17:7, 17:16, 25:2, 35:2, 35:11, 35:18, 35:27, 36:13, 36:16, 39:17, 39:18, 39:21, 41:4, 41:5, 41:8, 41:10, 41:24, 42:18, 42:22, 43:3, 44:16, 44:20, 44:22, 44:25, 45:2, 45:13, 45:25, 47:3, 48:14, 48:25, 48:26, 49:19, 50:12, 50:21, 51:2, 51:10, 51:14, 52:10, 53:18, 62:23, 62:24, 63:3, 63:11, 63:17, 63:19, 64:1, 64:19, 64:21, 65:23, 68:9, 68:28, 69:1, 70:20, 72:12. 72:25. 72:26. 73:15, 73:23, 76:21, 77:15, 78:6, 78:7, 79:24, 79:27, 81:8, 83:12, 83:18, 83:20, 83:24, 84:4, 85:4, 85:6, 85:26, 90:9, 90:10, 90:26, 91:1, 91:5, 96:1, 100:11, 100:19, 100:25, 104:22, 105:3, 105:8, 107:13, 107:14, 107:20, 107:26, 109:8, 109:13, 111:9, 111:18, 112:17, 113:21, 114:5, 114:6, 118:10, 122:20,

128:6, 131:7, 134:27,

135:1, 135:17, 137:6,

137:7, 139:2, 139:27, 139:28, 139:29, 140:10, 143:6, 143:25, 143:28, 144:1, 144:4, 144:12, 144:13, 147:19, 148:10, 148:11, 155:13, 156:9, 156:14, 157:14, 157:26, 158:2, 161:8, 163:11, 163:29, 165:12, 165:15, 167:20, 169:9, 171:7, 172:24, 173:15, 173:23, 174:4, 174:8, 174:15, 175:4, 175:14, 175:18, 178:1 Investigation [1] -60:27 investigations [9] -41:11, 41:19, 81:23, 89:22, 91:3, 135:6, 175:21, 177:29, 178:1 investigative [5] -49:18, 72:4, 148:2, 148:8, 172:21 investigators [2] -19:3. 74:11 invited [5] - 82:16, 82:17, 94:20, 96:8, 96:15 invites [1] - 146:9 involved [22] - 17:26, 37:18, 62:23, 68:28, 76:5, 80:2, 88:6, 98:23, 105:2, 115:5, 115:9, 115:10, 120:27, 134:11, $134{:}21,\,136{:}2,\,138{:}9,$ 138:10, 152:25, 155:26, 160:28, 172:13 involvement [3] -11:24, 106:13, 110:29 involving [1] - 174:5 IRC [3] - 63:21, 63:22, 115:11 Irish [1] - 164:3 issue [37] - 8:27, 11:2, 14:5, 14:27, 16:22, 17:11, 17:26, 19:6, 19:25, 22:5, 23:27, 37:23, 53:16, 54:13, 57:7, 58:19, 69:26, 74:21, 76:4, 116:8, 134:20, 135:28, 137:1,

137:15, 139:17.

140:16, 141:3,

144:14, 145:24,

145:26, 146:3, 148:27, 151:7, 152:17, 167:2, 167:4, 170.5 issued [4] - 46:26, 47:23, 57:11, 139:22 issues [27] - 10:13, 12:15, 15:8, 15:10, 18:10, 47:5, 48:13, 50:16, 50:23, 51:1, 66:17, 67:4, 68:24, 73:22, 76:21, 77:24, 82:20, 92:21, 113:17, 143:22, 148:23, 148:24, 155:4, 157:10, 163:10, 163:15, 170:18 item [1] - 16:21 items [3] - 84:25, 131:23, 131:24 itself [5] - 22:18, 23:17, 23:26, 89:10, 109:13

J

JACK[1] - 3:6

job [3] - 175:8,

177:23, 179:12

JOE [1] - 3:14

jobs [1] - 174:23

John [1] - 68:23

JOHN [4] - 2:11,

joined [2] - 60:12,

judge [3] - 122:25, 125:21, 177:3

JUDGE [1] - 3:12

22:1, 22:6, 27:4,

27:26, 30:15, 37:8,

Judges [1] - 60:17

judgments [1] -

28:2, 28:21, 30:19,

41:17, 44:4, 54:26,

84:2, 135:6, 150:3,

2:16, 3:8, 4:1

119.10

177:21

81:19

160.13

173:3

JAMES[1] - 2:28

June [44] - 40:26, 45:10, 46:17, 46:21, 65:5, 65:13, 65:14, 66:8, 66:22, 67:11, 73:27, 82:14, 92:3, 93:4, 94:1, 94:4, 94:9, 94:24, 95:9, 96:21, 96:28, 102:29, 103:9, 105:29, 119:18, 123:4, 123:28, 124:3, 124:5, 125:2, 126:25, 129:1, 130:15, 132:28, 132:29, 133:2, 135:6, 150:3, 160:14, 160:15, 160:16. 169:16. 174:17 just.. [1] - 157:2 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 justice [2] - 81:14, 90.13 Justice [2] - 51:7, 55:13 justify [1] - 157:10

Κ

KANE [1] - 2:28

January [5] - 19:12, **KATE**[1] - 3:25 98:5, 170:29, 171:6, **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:5 kavanagh [1] - 13:22 Kavanagh [18] -11:17, 13:15, 13:17, 13:20, 13:26, 20:7, 20:9, 21:11, 24:14, 29:24, 37:29, 45:7, 45:28, 54:17, 54:24, 56:6, 125:27, 170:2 **KEANE** [1] - 4:6 keep [6] - 13:21, 13:26, 28:12, 156:16, 171:1, 174:12 Judge [14] - 21:27, keeping [2] - 28:11, 167:18 kelly [2] - 40:15, 27:11, 27:20, 27:23, 97:25 57:23, 57:26, 97:22, **KELLY** [35] - 2:10, 3:12. 5:6. 5:13. 24:7. 25:20, 25:22, 29:26, 29:29, 31:24, 32:1, 32:3, 33:22, 34:21, 34:23, 36:4, 36:6, July [18] - 6:24, 7:10, 37:3, 37:29, 38:9, 26:28, 27:14, 27:20, 38:20, 39:6, 40:1, 40:4, 40:14, 40:17, 42:11, 42:14, 91:17, 56:24, 82:29, 83:21, 91:19, 97:26, 98:5, 101:14, 101:16, 101:25

44:1, 44:11, 54:14, 58:2, 91:14, 98:4 **Kelly's** [1] - 39:15 Keogh [139] - 10:28, 11:20, 11:28, 12:3, 12:22, 14:14, 16:25, 17:3, 22:17, 23:16, 23:25, 24:22, 35:26, 39:7, 42:25, 44:15, 44:25, 45:26, 46:6, 46:11, 46:17, 47:1, 47:5. 49:20. 50:22. 51:2, 51:16, 51:18, 51:22, 52:10, 53:5, 53:11, 65:4, 65:19, 66:3, 66:10, 66:23, 67:25, 68:14, 68:26, 69:5, 69:7, 69:11, 69:14, 69:16, 70:8, 71:18, 71:26, 73:14, 73:27, 73:29, 74:7, 74:25, 75:3, 75:5, 76:14, 77:18, 77:22, 78:3, 79:2, 79:12, 79:20, 79:28, 80:19, 82:28, 84:7, 85:2, 87:19, 90:8, 90:25, 92:29, 106:11, 107:23. 112:19. 121:17, 121:25, 122:25, 123:16, 123:17, 123:19, 123:24, 123:26, 124:7, 125:3, 127:29, 129:9, 129:26, 130:8, 131:3, 132:5, 132:18, 133:21, 134:16, 134:28, 136:2, 136:3, 137:19, 137:22, 138:14, 139:1, 140:19, 141:4, 141:13, 141:17, 142:28, 142:29, 143:4, 143:5, 144:15, 147:21, 147:22, 147:29, 149:5, 150:5, 150:9, 150:10, 150:12, 151:14, 154:3. 155:11. 155:24, 155:26, 155:29, 156:12, 158:3, 158:6, 158:18, 159:5, 159:14, 161:9, 161:23, 162:10, 162:21, 166:15,

172:13, 174:16,

Kelly [19] - 24:3,

25:17, 29:25, 30:4,

34:20, 36:3, 36:25,

37:12, 37:16, 37:18,

30:12, 31:18, 31:21,

175:2, 176:21, 177:4 **KEOGH**[1] - 2:10 Keogh's [14] - 12:24, 44:18, 51:9, 66:25, 75:16, 78:5, 78:8, 81:1, 81:5, 90:1, 133:7, 135:27, 149:26, 164:21 kept [15] - 15:9, 15:14, 26:15, 26:24, 27:12, 66:13, 78:6, 78:9, 129:29, 131:25, 133:10, 134:28, 141:11, 156:23, 171:13 kernel [1] - 84:27 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 key [4] - 28:10, 80:16, 87:24, 132:21 kicked [3] - 174:16, 174:18, 174:19 kidnapped [1] -62:25 **KIERAN**[1] - 3:20 kilo [1] - 128:8 kind [5] - 57:7, 71:28, 80:7, 110:3, 117:27 **KIRWAN** [1] - 3:13 **kit** [1] - 134:12 knowing [3] -123:15, 170:15, 170:16 knowledge [8] - 8:1, 57:17, 71:21, 83:14, 110:5, 115:12, 120:26, 121:17 known [4] - 41:12, 62:18, 98:22

L

lacuna [1] - 134:19 laid [1] - 165:13 landed [1] - 11:3 Landy [2] - 52:28, 53.1 language [1] - 71:28 Laoghaire [2] -60:14, 60:15 laptops [4] - 85:2, 99:6, 99:25, 106:7 large [6] - 79:15, 85:2. 98:8. 98:18. 99:5, 155:15 larger [1] - 41:11 last [16] - 45:15, 46:20. 61:28. 70:19. 77:9, 78:18, 89:17,

110:7, 115:19, 122:3, 120:4, 120:7, 127:8, life [5] - 79:13, 88:5, manager [12] -**MATTERS**[1] - 1:4 157:6, 165:7, 168:28, 107:20, 111:22, 112:1 125:13, 126:1, 29:11, 29:18, 31:9, **MATTHIAS**[1] - 2:10 128:27, 138:23, 172:29, 173:11, light [3] - 10:13, 32:4, 32:29, 33:4, May.. [1] - 16:12 175.28 145:10, 153:8, 33:26, 34:2, 34:5, 57:4. 89:22 Mayo [1] - 177:28 likely [6] - 8:16, 18:1. lasting [1] - 53:12 155:21, 155:22, 34:17, 58:21, 179:7 McBrien [16] - 2:16, 157:3, 157:16, 159:7, lastly [1] - 111:5 23:3, 65:9, 65:10, managers [2] -62:28, 63:2, 124:22, Law [1] - 55:14 170:15 162:11, 162:29, 27:16, 58:25 128:25, 128:26, 165:15, 167:22, law [1] - 110:5 Limerick [7] - 88:20, manner [3] - 139:27, 129:20, 129:21, 168:9, 169:15, 140:9, 142:2 **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29 110:22, 119:13, 135:18, 141:2, 170:26, 170:28, 119:15, 119:22, manufacture [1] -145:21, 149:22, lead [1] - 110:27 leaks [1] - 147:19 119:25, 119:27 175:9, 175:11, 153:1, 156:26, 166:2, 176:29, 178:14 least [6] - 7:11, 73:5, line [19] - 15:3, March [3] - 27:19, 166:3 looked [9] - 6:19, 20:15, 20:20, 21:7, 89:24, 109:22 McBrien.. [1] - 158:4 81:29, 86:14, 112:6, 10:28, 20:26, 44:18, mare [1] - 17:14 156:12 21:21, 22:12, 23:8, McCabe [1] - 119:19 51:17, 53:18, 56:26, 24:16, 29:5, 32:13, MARGARET[1] **leave** [1] - 99:24 McCARTAN[2] -63:25, 115:1 33:15, 46:27, 55:21, 4.10 4.11 leaving [4] - 117:18, looking [14] - 14:7, 55:27, 56:15, 129:4, MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17 McCOURT[1] - 2:17 137:14, 150:15, 18:24, 26:22, 30:3, 143:19, 157:6, 157:19 MARK[1] - 3:3 175.27 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 30:6, 32:4, 77:12, lines [4] - 83:2, led [2] - 72:25, Mark [3] - 7:23, McGrath [24] - 2:7, 94:11, 98:5, 105:10, 129:3, 172:22, 172:29 19:18, 19:27 113:19 2:28, 5:5, 5:8, 6:5, 127:19, 127:23, link [1] - 29:20 MARRINAN [1] - 2:7 Lee [1] - 62:8 6:9. 6:14. 20:20. 24:8. 132:27, 151:15 left [4] - 90:26, list [3] - 71:14, 92:29, Martin [1] - 62:8 24:13, 25:11, 28:28, **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 118:1 30:1, 30:3, 30:9, 111:22, 118:1, 161:5 material [6] - 67:26, listening [1] - 59:6 Loughrea [2] -74:10, 89:16, 110:8, 37:21, 37:25, 37:28, legal [4] - 57:5, lists [1] - 117:27 76:28, 76:29 42:9, 43:26, 54:5, 95:15, 95:22, 116:12 118:4, 168:28 lower [1] - 112:27 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:28 54:6, 54:11, 54:13 materialise [1] legislation [6] - 7:16, luck [1] - 86:18 7:18. 27:8. 57:15. lived [2] - 79:10, 105:20 McGuinness [24] -LUNCH [1] - 98:1 58:10, 58:12 80:16 **MATT**[1] - 3:19 2:6, 3:24, 5:12, 5:15, LYONS [1] - 4:6 matter [35] - 13:6, 5:19, 59:27, 60:3, **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13 local [5] - 17:7, 50:17, 157:10, 60:10, 62:4, 114:2, length [2] - 45:6, 15:16, 38:11, 39:29, 165:24, 170:17 M 114:28, 116:28, 41:11, 49:1, 62:26, 93:13 locality [1] - 167:26 73:13, 76:8, 76:9, 118:25, 119:2, 119:8, letter [41] - 11:12, 120:15, 126:3, 155:2, locally [3] - 117:23, 13:15, 15:27, 16:2, 76:11, 79:25, 86:24, **MADE** [2] - 1:2, 1:7 158:13, 158:18, 17:27, 17:28, 20:12, 135:26, 170:17 88:13, 90:29, 96:27, mail [3] - 14:20, 16:1, 168:27, 170:1, locate [1] - 108:11 112:7, 112:9, 112:11, 20:26, 37:21, 45:8, 129:21 177:16, 177:17 located [1] - 108:12 112:15, 116:5, 46:2, 47:10, 47:19, MAIN [1] - 2:12 121:26, 122:22, McHugh [7] - 91:4, 47:27, 47:28, 49:22, location [4] - 65:8, main [6] - 38:15, 126:27, 127:2, 135:9, 123:14, 124:2, 86:22, 108:12, 130:9 50:20, 50:27, 51:28, 38:28, 39:14, 99:21, 124:15, 131:9, 142:10, 143:20, 63:13, 69:21, 70:7, locations [1] - 107:9 103:25, 104:25 163:23 70:13, 76:14, 78:14, 136:25, 139:4, lock [1] - 132:21 maintain [2] - 68:10, McLoughlin [9] -78:18, 79:28, 83:1, 147:23, 164:15, locked [1] - 78:9 152:27 28:16, 28:26, 30:24, 89:24, 115:2, 131:4, lodged [2] - 48:21, 165:9, 165:11, major [1] - 144:1 30:29, 31:5, 31:9, 137:21, 138:27, 163:25 165:20, 175:5 majority [1] - 173:25 58:20, 58:24, 58:29 138:28, 139:11, matters [39] - 6:15, logbook [1] - 99:13 MALONE [1] - 1:29 MCLOUGHLIN [1] -139:14, 140:18, 7:21, 7:22, 7:29, logic [1] - 8:23 Malone [2] - 1:24, 11:29, 12:5, 12:22, 146:29, 147:3, Loki [8] - 80:18, 53.7 McLYNN [1] - 4:2 155:17, 170:7 12:24, 14:14, 54:6, 117:27, 118:10, malpractice [9] -69:18, 74:25, 90:20, MCMAHON [1] - 3:8 Letterkenny [1] -128:5, 132:17, 133:5, 9:15, 10:4, 38:14, 90:21, 91:6, 92:12, McMahon [13] -61:7 174:29 54:19, 55:8, 55:19, 105:23, 106:3, letters [5] - 69:15, 21:27, 22:1, 22:6, Longford [1] -56:2, 75:3, 94:19 110:11, 118:2, 27:11, 27:20, 27:24, 70:28, 76:18, 77:26, 177:28 man [6] - 29:20, 126:14, 134:26, 27:26, 30:15, 57:23, 139:1 look [52] - 9:1, 9:4, 143:13, 169:16, 135:10, 135:26, 57:26, 85:13, 100:12, level [3] - 112:27 11:11, 11:23, 16:5, 169:21, 173:7, 175:9 138:14, 142:10, $\textbf{levelled} \ \tiny{[3]} \textbf{-73:} 18,$ 101:19 16:27, 21:4, 24:15, manage [2] - 108:15, 142:27, 149:5, 82:8, 90:24 McMahon's [4] -32:10, 32:22, 34:6, 138:11 153:18, 154:22. 27:4, 101:23, 103:4, liaison [2] - 71:9, 36:22, 40:7, 40:19, management [9] -163:14, 164:23, 107:13 124:22 41:25, 47:9, 51:27, 8:2, 8:3, 38:14, 48:16, 164:27, 165:4, MCPARTLIN[1] -**LIAM** [1] - 3:18 54:15, 54:26, 58:19, 50:17, 80:9, 163:17, 165:16, 169:18, Liam [1] - 163:23 63:13, 69:15, 77:28, 165:24, 170:17 169:19 mean [8] - 36:25, library [1] - 133:6 83:1, 89:13, 109:25,

42:6, 95:25, 111:17, 114:13, 134:19, 154:5, 178:6 $\boldsymbol{meaning}\, [1] \boldsymbol{-} 34 : 2$ meant [5] - 23:28, 36:28, 120:4, 156:2, 176.22 mechanism [2] -12:26, 28:12 mechanisms [3] -44:10, 55:17, 58:5 media [3] - 8:15, 10:13, 122:1 **MEDICAL**[1] - 3:11 meet [24] - 12:4, 65:26, 66:16, 73:3, 79:15, 79:16, 93:8, 93:16, 111:15, 111:16, 114:18, 123:21, 129:15, 139:11, 141:5, 150:20, 151:5, 151:27, 152:13, 152:18, 154:18, 160:20, 162:22, 172:2 meeting [35] - 16:26, 64:3, 64:5, 64:22, 66:2, 66:5, 66:8, 66:9, 66:13, 66:19, 68:2, 70:8, 70:19, 73:27, 73:28, 94:21, 94:27, 96:19, 102:27, 123:27, 124:2, 126:24, 141:1, 141:13, 141:17, 145:20, 146:5, 146:22, 151:14, 151:28, 152:2, 152:24, 156:24, 157:17 meetings [7] - 49:29, 64:19, 79:21, 86:27, 150:23, 171:22, 172.14 MEMBER [1] - 2:2 member [12] - 9:20, 16:29, 35:24, 38:16, 38:29, 39:1, 76:22, 88:29, 154:28, 173:25, 173:29, 175:27 member.. [1] - 9:8 members [9] - 12:20, 55:17, 56:1, 116:11, 124:14. 133:9. 139:23, 171:7 memo [2] - 47:28, 96:9 memory [2] - 66:4,

76:2

mention [6] - 59:1, 111:7, 125:19, 125:24, 153:25, 153:26 mentioned [21] -7:24, 10:26, 57:23, 104:29, 105:12, 105:25, 113:14, 117:11, 126:17, 128:4, 131:9, 131:10, 134:4, 134:5, 152:23, 153:2, 158:6, 158:21, 158:26, 167:19, 179:15 mentioning [2] -152:29, 153:7 mentions [1] - 12:15 merely [3] - 15:13, 43:2, 53:23 message [4] - 24:20, 25:4, 52:19, 52:21 messages [2] -130:23, 131:10 met [48] - 48:5, 63:2, 64:27, 65:3, 66:9, 66:11, 66:12, 68:14, 68:17, 68:21, 69:10, 69:13, 79:2, 79:14, 80:15, 82:9, 82:14, 87:19, 91:20, 92:27, 94:4, 94:16, 94:23, 105:25, 105:29, 112:19, 120:29, 122:9, 124:18, 124:21, 125:2, 127:13, 127:16, 127:29, 129:26, 135:9, 139:2, 139:20, 140:18, 140:26, 143:13, 150:5, 150:8, 150:12, 160:27, 161:11, 163:1, 163:7 Met [1] - 95:9 MICHAEL [9] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19, 5:10, 60:2, 91:16, 104:15, 114:1 Michael [5] - 53:9, 60:6, 64:11, 122:16, 163:9 Mick [1] - 65:3 middle [6] - 46:8, 46:23, 56:16, 78:16, 144:25, 159:12 might [31] - 9:1, 10:11, 15:10, 21:6, 34:14, 37:4, 50:24,

58:2, 74:21, 98:9,

112:8, 124:16,

99:26, 105:5, 106:11,

134:19, 139:10, 140:12, 146:18, 148:9, 149:6, 151:7, 156:28. 159:2. 159:18, 161:1, 169:5, 171:26, 172:26, 173:2, 176:8 mightn't [3] - 127:15, 154:11, 172:1 Mill [1] - 61:2 mind [4] - 29:23, 74:14, 125:16, 154:15 mindful [1] - 12:11 mini [1] - 109:17 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 Minister [9] - 9:7, 9:8, 9:12, 9:20, 9:24, 9:29, 55:3, 55:13, 80:20 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 minute [2] - 18:9, 162:17 Mirror [2] - 46:5, 163:13 misheard [1] - 34:22 misled [1] - 7:8 misprint [1] - 101:3 missing [5] - 33:19, 33:21, 62:25, 126:27 mistaken [1] - 147:3 misunderstanding [1] - 129:19 misunderstood [2] -64:7, 131:8 **mobile** [8] - 67:10, 70:21, 75:6, 80:2, 80:9, 83:4, 124:27, modular [1] - 173:16 moment [11] - 11:10, 11:24, 20:12, 30:12, 31:25, 117:19, 125:17, 139:14, 143:19, 146:5, 172:28 moments [1] - 66:1 Monday [2] - 124:20, 171:26 money [1] - 126:27 MONICA [1] - 3:15 month [4] - 40:29, 41:26, 72:29, 159:4 months [8] - 35:22, 42:4, 42:15, 42:16, 49:14, 78:24, 92:5, 175:10 Morgan [1] - 52:28 morning [18] - 6:4, 6:5, 6:11, 6:13, 6:14,

59:11, 66:11, 69:13, 111:12, 122:9, 171:26 **MORONEY** [1] - 3:18 MORRISSEY [1] -3.26 most [8] - 8:15, 18:1, 23:3, 65:9, 65:10, 78:24, 81:29, 171:5 mostly [2] - 179:10, 179:11 mother's [1] - 151:19 motive [1] - 156:4 mouth [1] - 158:23 move [6] - 29:24, 96:21, 97:22, 113:21, 125:26 144:12 moved [13] - 49:14, 62:4, 74:3, 79:13, 88:5, 111:11, 111:21, 113:4. 119:13. 119:23, 121:6, 130:9, 158:2 movement [1] -11:25 movements [1] -132:1 moving [5] - 105:23, 106:3, 107:10, 110:11, 114:11 MR [98] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 4:1, 4:1, 4:6, 4:10, 4:10, 5:6, 5:7, 5:12, 5:13, 5:14, 5:15, 5:19, 24:7, 25:20, 25:22, 29:26, 29:29, 31:24, 32:1, 32:3, 33:22, 34:21, 34:23, 36:4, 36:6, 37:3, 37:4, 37:7, 37:29, 38:9, 38:20, 39:6, 40:1, 40:4, 40:14, 40:17, 42:11, 42:14, 43:14, 43:18, 43:21, 43:23, 59:27, 60:3, 60:10, 62:4, 91:17, 91:19, 97:26, 98:5, 101:14, 101:16, 101:25, 104:16, 104:18, 109:6, 109:11, 110:11, 110:28. 111:2. 112:11, 112:14, 114:2, 114:28, 116:28, 118:25, 119:2, 119:8, 120:15, 126:3, 155:2, 158:13,

158:18, 168:27, 170:1, 177:17 **MS** [29] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 4:1, 4:7, 4:7, 5:5, 5:8, 6:5, 6:9, 6:14, 20:20, 24:8, 24:13, 25:11, 30:3, 30:9, 37:21, 37:25, 37:28, 42:9, 54:6, 54:11, 54:13 **Mulcahy** [57] - 42:3, 47:14, 47:18, 48:4, 49:27, 50:1, 50:14, 50:15, 51:15, 52:2, 52:9, 52:15, 53:6, 63:15, 63:28, 64:3, 66:21, 66:27, 67:8, 67:20, 68:16, 69:3, 69:16, 69:21, 70:1, 70:15, 71:11, 71:23, 71:25, 74:16, 76:15, 77:4, 77:27, 79:22, 82:22, 82:27, 82:29, 84:15, 84:21, 85:5, 88:28, 91:24, 91:25, 94:16, 95:10, 96:9, 96:23, 98:7, 103:25, 104:3, 106:5, 106:20, 112:18. 118:26. 119:5, 163:8, 172:21 MULCAHY [3] - 3:5, 5:17, 119:1 Mulcahv's [4] -47:16, 47:21, 64:28, 78:2 Mulligan [3] - 24:5, 58:22, 59:2 MULLIGAN [2] -2:11, 3:13 Mullingar [5] - 14:13, 14:28, 48:16, 145:21, 163:17 murder [1] - 119:19 murders [1] - 60:28 MURPHY [2] - 2:30, Murphy [1] - 56:14 MURRAY [2] - 3:3, Murray [6] - 62:17, 62:18, 120:28, 120:29, 121:3, 121:5 must [6] - 12:28, 34:27, 90:19, 124:17, 127:13, 161:24 MÍCHEÁL [11] - 3:23, 5:14, 104:16, 104:18, 109:6, 109:11, 110:11, 110:28,

7:21, 25:22, 25:23,

43:27, 52:18, 59:7,

111:2, 112:11, 112:14 13:9, 16:22, 16:27, 127:19, 129:29, 84:15, 124:12 0 17:19, 21:12, 23:8, 132:7, 138:19, obvious [1] - 138:7 138:23, 138:25, Ν 24:28, 33:15, 54:20, obviously [28] -O'BRIEN [1] - 2:10 54:23, 55:26, 56:13, 138:26, 148:6, 36:26, 46:24, 65:11, 161:10, 161:16, O'Brien [5] - 24:6, 59:27, 63:16, 65:16, 67:14, 68:5, 69:20, name [11] - 27:27, 24:7, 24:9, 24:10, 66:25, 94:23, 100:6, 161:27 73:25, 81:7, 81:13, 40:5, 57:24, 71:12, 24:11 105:24, 118:25, nothing [12] - 23:6, 109:7, 110:4, 115:14, 71:13, 124:14, 128:7, 88:1, 116:17, 116:19, o'clock [1] - 97:28 149:12, 166:9, 173:21 116:9, 116:15, 131:10, 148:16, Nicholas [5] - 65:4, 133:14, 148:15, O'CONNOR [1] -116:28, 117:6, 154:10, 168:21 65:19, 129:8, 142:28, 151:10, 151:11, 2:21 117:18, 117:22, named [11] - 1:26, 142:29 151:12, 153:24, O'Gorman [1] -127:15, 130:3, 146:4, 11:28, 16:25, 38:13, NICHOLAS [2] -155:6, 156:3 88.15 150:2, 151:6, 155:10, 74:28, 130:24, O'Higgins [3] notice [3] - 90:17, 165:27, 172:3, 175:2, 2.10 4.5 130:29, 148:15, Nick [7] - 39:7, 103:8, 121:28 104:13, 110:27, 176:5 150:8, 173:19, 175:11 92:29, 139:1, 158:3, noticeable [1] -112:10 occasion [18] names [1] - 134:29 O'HIGGINS [11] -158:6, 158:15, 159:14 154:13 68:15, 68:22, 69:12, **naming** [1] - 68:5 night [1] - 161:10 noticed [2] - 150:15, 3:23, 5:14, 104:16, 72:21, 86:17, 87:1, narrate [1] - 105:15 **NK** [1] - 146:9 104:18, 109:6, 113:12, 132:27, 154:15 National [1] - 60:26 109:11, 110:11, 133:17, 144:27, nobody [4] - 65:27, notified [1] - 8:17 natural [2] - 81:14, 110:28, 111:2, 145:25, 149:23, 125:7, 125:8, 143:24 **notify** [1] - 8:9 90:13 112:11, 112:14 **NOEL** [1] - 4:10 notifying [1] - 8:19 151:23, 152:23, nature [2] - 134:24, O'MARA [1] - 2:17 156:11, 158:6, **NOLAN** [1] - 3:6 noting [2] - 15:13, 135:26 O'Neill [6] - 91:4, 158:22, 158:26 **non** [1] - 140:13 89:26 near [3] - 78:1, 135:10, 142:10, occasions [7] -November [12] non-suspension [1] 150:12, 169:3 142:27, 143:21, 42:8, 42:14, 46:4, 66:11, 69:11, 86:12, - 140·13 nearer [1] - 99:17 163:22 113:12, 114:15, none [1] - 164:26 47:10, 47:29, 49:4, nearly [4] - 92:5, O'NEILL [1] - 4:1 155:25, 158:21 nonsense [1] - 168:8 89:14, 101:10, 100:22, 123:12, 175:9 O'REARDON[1] occupant [1] - 27:24 101:11, 101:26, NOREEN [1] - 2:16 necessarily [1] occupants [3] -160:18, 163:4 Noreen [2] - 124:21, 172:10 O'ROURKE [1] - 4:7 98:16, 106:27, 106:29 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:14, 128:26 necessary [5] - 42:1, O'Shea [4] - 86:24, occurred [3] - 63:16, normal [6] - 85:14, 79:7, 81:27, 98:6, 99:1, 99:10, 110:21 73:25. 117:5 92:17, 92:19, 95:21, **number** [40] - 11:17, 110:15 O'SULLIVAN [1] -October [4] - 76:15, 133:28, 175:28 27:6, 41:21, 42:26, necessity [2] - 80:12, 84:16, 106:3, 106:17 43:24, 60:17, 60:22, normally [4] - 92:9, 113:19 61:5, 61:28, 65:24, object [5] - 25:25, **OF** [17] - 1:2, 1:8, 95:27, 96:2, 116:17 need [7] - 51:4, 26:2, 26:8, 26:24, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, 67:1, 68:21, 68:26, **NORTHUMBERLAN** 77:28, 81:24, 93:26, 116:20 3:15, 25:14, 43:10, 69:15, 69:17, 72:4, **D**[1] - 2:18 129:29, 144:28, 145:2 54:3, 59:19, 91:12, 73:16, 75:4, 79:15, objectives [1] note [26] - 15:3, needed [6] - 65:27, 81:12, 85:2, 86:4, 26:14 104:10, 113:25, 22:10, 23:4, 25:10, 109:10, 110:5, 143:7, 86:12, 98:8, 98:18, obligation [2] -118:16 34:21, 47:13, 65:15, 143:9, 153:9 offence [1] - 89:28 98:25, 99:14, 113:5, 33:25, 136:7 88:4, 123:2, 127:8, needing [1] - 17:25 116:3, 131:20, offer [2] - 130:13, obligations [3] -127:15, 136:19, needs [1] - 109:11 131:21, 132:5, 175:18 7:17, 12:11, 31:11 141:8, 141:10, net [1] - 22:16 132:11, 146:6, obliged [2] - 140:6, offered [2] - 50:6, 141:11, 141:12, never [8] - 62:19, 149:13, 155:16, 146:5, 146:6, 147:27. 152.8 164:18 69:8, 69:14, 73:9, 158:21, 173:18, offering [1] - 127:5 observation [1] -152:6, 153:27, 81:28, 117:12, 162:5, 173:29, 177:29 offering' [1] - 52:21 154:2 157:16, 157:17, 170:19 numbers [2] obstruct [1] - 83:8 office [50] - 8:18, 159:6, 166:26 new [23] - 7:16, 27:3, 127:20, 149:14 8:19, 10:12, 10:21, obstructing [2] notebook [2] - 67:21, 27:8, 27:16, 29:26, numerous [1] -98:18, 139:29 12:28, 13:18, 13:23, 130:4 36:7, 57:12, 57:15, 71:24 obstruction [1] -15:14, 16:11, 16:18, notebooks [1] -57:21, 58:8, 58:10, **NYLAND**[1] - 3:19 17:1, 17:27, 21:24, 132:5 87:23 58:12, 59:8, 87:26, 26:28, 27:4, 27:9, Nyland [6] - 13:11, obtain [8] - 12:22, noted [3] - 15:4, 89:6, 89:23, 103:21, 17:13, 18:8, 18:16, 27:14, 27:21, 27:24, 14:14, 72:15, 72:22, 46:16, 67:8 103:23, 104:1, 112:2, 27:27, 27:29, 28:11, 18:20, 139:7 73:3, 79:18, 80:24, notes [26] - 1:26, 161:6, 164:27, 172:22 Nyland's [1] - 18:12 30:14, 30:15, 35:1, 131:23 20:3, 22:16, 64:28, news [1] - 121:27 **NÍ**[1] - 2:30 40:23, 41:13, 41:21, obtained [7] - 70:22, 65:16, 66:21, 67:27, newspaper [3] -**NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7 70:24, 75:20, 78:4, 44:2, 45:12, 50:29, 68:23, 82:24, 88:8, 46:5, 163:14, 164:3 84:22, 106:20, 132:18 57:7, 57:18, 57:24, 125:9. 125:11. next [24] - 12:16, 57:29, 87:5, 88:20, obtaining [3] - 82:2,

126:19, 126:24,

89:13, 110:6, 110:22, 122:9, 132:12, 132:15, 132:19, 133:4, 134:14, 145:17, 162:18, 167:9, 175:1 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 officer [18] - 7:24, 8:12, 9:7, 9:20, 42:29, 45:20, 52:28, 62:19, 68:10, 71:8, 71:9, 74:16, 75:14, 75:25, 77:18, 77:25, 124:8, 124.9 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, 3.14 officers [5] - 46:18, 98:29, 99:3, 99:10, 164:19 official [5] - 53:8, 80:2, 100:14, 152:15, 154:17 officially [1] - 8:7 often [1] - 125:1 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 old [9] - 7:13, 7:15, 27:5, 57:18, 57:19, 58:11, 99:18, 99:19, 99:25 older [1] - 25:27 Olivia [2] - 142:27, 163:22 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12, 4:1 Ombudsman [1] -163:27 omitted [1] - 168:27 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [6] - 27:29, 52:23, 102:12, 142:1, 164:18, 174:16 one [53] - 7:29, 16:7, 25:27, 25:29, 26:13, 30:12, 33:18, 34:23, 34:28, 35:16, 35:29, 37:23, 41:6, 54:6, 62:23, 65:25, 66:6, 68:8, 68:14, 68:17, 68:22, 69:18, 73:20, 73:21, 76:21, 76:26, 77:28, 77:29, 79:1, 80:19, 81:5, 84:23, 98:20, 99:10, 105:6, 106:21, 109:11, 112:11, 113:12, 120:4, 120:7, 124:23, 131:27, 132:3, 132:6, 132:25, 142:27, 143:29, 151:4,

151:19, 152:5,

155:16, 158:21 ongoing [2] - 50:12, 76:8 onus [3] - 33:2, 33:3, 34.12 onwards [2] - 21:21, 115:1 open [8] - 13:16, 20:7, 45:5, 45:7, 45:28, 51:5, 52:3, 166:22 opened [4] - 20:12, 43:25, 47:10, 175:23 operating [1] - 7:14 Operation [1] -132:17 operation [7] - 7:12, 80:18, 117:23, 117:27, 118:5, 118:7, 118:10

118:10
 operations [5] 13:18, 13:24, 15:1,
16:19, 18:10
 opinion [4] - 15:8,
52:23, 74:2, 145:2
 opportunity [10] 36:8, 61:1, 81:17,
87:27, 88:18, 92:14,
97:11, 110:18,
113:10, 130:11
 option [2] - 81:27,
96:17
 Oranmore [21] -

65:19, 65:24, 67:7,

78:10, 82:10, 91:21,

94:5, 94:17, 94:24, 95:9, 96:22, 105:26, 114:6, 114:9, 114:10, 114:21, 130:9, 130:10, 151:16, 151:23, 171:6 order [6] - 55:16, 74:17, 86:24, 109:7, 131:13, 154:18 organisation [2] -32:10, 32:22 organisational [1] organise [1] - 128:2 original [15] - 25:28, 25:29, 78:8, 89:4, 89:26, 109:20, 109:21, 124:12, 128:3, 142:26, 161:9, 161:16, 161:26, 174:25, 174:29 **ORLA** [1] - 3:20 OSMOND [1] - 3:27 OTHER [1] - 1:3

otherwise [3] -

17:22, 20:14, 146:2 outcome [3] - 48:27, 73:2, 123:23 outline [4] - 60:11, 82:1, 85:20, 119:8 outlined [10] - 14:7, 52:29, 58:11, 64:5, 110:20, 139:21, 141:16, 148:14, 164:4, 172:22 outlines [1] - 16:22 outlining [3] - 16:21, 67:3. 139:8 outset [3] - 138:6, 138:7, 156:1 outside [1] - 84:24 outstanding [2] -153:17, 174:1 oversight [2] - 28:9, 28.17 owing [1] - 17:3 own [9] - 23:2, 61:16, 74:2, 83:14, 92:15, 151:19, 158:10, 161:9, 179:1

Ρ

pack [1] - 122:23 page [88] - 9:1, 11:14, 13:9, 16:2, 17:19, 19:13, 20:1, 20:9, 20:16, 21:6, 21:7, 21:12, 23:8, 24:13, 24:15, 29:1, 29:4. 30:4. 30:6. 34:19, 34:23, 42:2, 45:7, 45:28, 46:2, 47:9, 47:19, 49:13, 50:27, 51:5, 51:27, 52:2, 52:14, 56:5, 56:13, 58:23, 63:14, 64:29, 65:1, 65:16, 69:19, 70:13, 76:16, 77:27, 78:15, 83:1, 84:2, 85:20, 89:13, 94:13, 100:4, 100:6, 105:5, 105:24, 115:20, 115:21, 115:27, 115:29, 125:13, 126:21, 127:23, 128:27, 137:23, 144:25, 145:10, 146:6, 146:7, 148:21, 149:12, 157:4, 157:16, 159:6, 159:10. 160:11. 160:18, 160:19, 162:11, 162:26, 162:29, 166:9,

168:12, 168:13, 170:2, 173:21, 175:25 **PAGE** [1] - 5:2 pages [4] - 42:26, 50:26, 115:1, 115:4 paper [6] - 40:2, 125:15, 126:1, 127:24, 153:27, 167:27 PAPER [1] - 40:11 papers [13] - 11:4, 11:7, 11:12, 13:14, 19:7, 30:4, 42:1, 47:13, 58:15, 69:19, 69:25, 70:14, 166:24 paragraph [34] -9:22, 11:23, 12:16, 15:7, 16:22, 16:24, 16:27, 16:28, 17:24, 18:4, 33:16, 45:16, 46:8, 46:23, 49:21, 49:24, 50:9, 52:15, 55:26, 56:16, 77:3, 78:16, 79:28, 83:6, 137:27, 139:17, 157:6, 168:29, 170:3, 171:2, 171:3, 172:29, 173:1, 173:12 paragraphs [1] -

30:9 parallel [1] - 177:29 **pardon** [1] - 167:13 park [6] - 86:23, 108:13, 149:25, 150:6, 150:12, 151:24 Park [1] - 145:20 parked [3] - 86:22, 108:13, 150:12 part [11] - 15:25, 77:20, 100:24, 104:21, 105:2, 112:6, 127:8, 133:7, 155:2, 157:17, 164:22 participate [2] -109:15, 111:19 particular [40] - 8:26, 10:16, 10:29, 11:11, 13:14, 13:20, 15:2, 18:4, 19:23, 20:4, 23:7, 45:3, 57:14, 64:24, 68:4, 69:28, 70:22, 76:26, 76:27, 79:10, 87:24, 95:5, 96:19, 98:21, 99:20, 106:12, 107:7. 113:13, 114:15, 117:29, 121:16, 128:5, 131:27, 132:25, 133:9, 134:14, 139:25,

155:19, 160:25 particularly [8] - 8:2, 20:2, 67:15, 69:22, 76:18, 92:19, 92:20, 115:6 parties [1] - 91:3 partly [2] - 172:10, 172:11 partner [3] - 112:3, 161:5, 177:10 parts [1] - 171:14 pass [2] - 40:2, 40:4 passed [2] - 24:21, 170.4 **PASSED**[1] - 1:4 passing [7] - 10:27, 25:4, 121:27, 149:14, 149:20, 149:21, 150:28 past [2] - 88:2, 111:22 Pat [4] - 120:28, 120:29, 121:3, 121:5 **PATRICK** [4] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:28, 3:3 Patrick [1] - 62:16 Paudie [1] - 86:24 **PAUL** [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 4:1 PD[1] - 31:9 **PEGGY** [1] - 4:7 **PEMS**[1] - 131:27 **PEOPLE** [1] - 3:16 people [17] - 26:3, 26:9, 46:27, 98:19, 98:28, 106:25, 112:23, 116:9, 134:3, 134:8, 134:25, 139:22, 154:22, 154:23, 154:25, 158:27 per [1] - 15:5 percent [4] - 15:23, 28:6, 152:5, 170:13 perfectly [2] - 27:13, 38.7 performed [1] -46:27 performing [1] -41:14 perhaps [19] - 9:4, 27:14, 64:7, 74:1, 114:29, 125:13, 125:27, 125:28, 134:21, 145:10, 147:5, 149:24, 152:22, 157:3, 159:7, 166:2, 170:15, 170:26, 172:10

period [21] - 7:13,

28:21, 53:13, 54:14, 57:10, 60:13, 70:22, 73:25, 74:1, 75:11, 75:18, 75:28, 86:25, 96:28, 105:16, 107:2, 116:3, 130:2, 160:26, 166:15, 174:5 permanently [2] -76:22, 76:23 permitted [1] -116:17 person [53] - 9:23, 26:22, 27:23, 27:28, 28:11, 28:13, 29:20, 32:8, 33:13, 34:3, 34:13, 36:4, 40:5, 40:8, 49:29, 62:24, 67:28, 68:5, 71:13, 79:1, 79:2, 79:9, 87:24, 98:21, 109:27, 109:28, 117:11, 117:12, 124:23, 130:24, 134:21, 136:17, 136:23, 137:17, 137:20, 137:27, 138:3, 138:4, 138:17, 148:15, 149:17, 150:7, 153:12, 153:15, 160:8, 160:9, 163:1, 167:8, 176:6, 176:15, 177:3 person's [1] - 148:16 personal [4] - 83:14, 152:25. 155:27. 172:16 personally [4] -10:23, 10:25, 74:24, 156:28 personnel [2] -120:26, 147:5 persons [4] - 78:22, 79:1, 158:22, 173:19 perspective [2] -57:22. 85:29 persuade [2] - 105:1, 161:13 persuading [1] -160:19 pertaining [1] -173:16 Peter [3] - 24:12, 33:14, 33:19 **PETER** [2] - 2:5, 3:13 petrol [1] - 114:17 Phoenix [1] - 145:20 phone [59] - 19:4, 19:24, 19:28, 20:29, 21:4, 49:29, 67:10, 67:15, 67:16, 67:18,

67:21, 69:8, 70:21, 71:3, 71:14, 71:19, 71:22, 71:25, 71:27, 72:1, 72:3, 74:8, 74:10, 74:12, 74:17, 74:21, 75:6, 75:9, 75:29, 80:2, 80:4, 80:9. 83:2. 83:4. 83:13, 83:16, 116:4, 117:18, 122:2, 123:19, 124:27, 124:28, 127:20, 129:6, 129:12, 129:22, 130:3, 130:14, 131:1, 131:4, 133:25, 133:26. 148:14, 155:16, 159:14 **phoned** [1] - 69:9 phones [7] - 71:10, 74:12, 85:2, 98:9, 99:6, 106:7, 174:24 phrase [2] - 26:16, 159.28 pick [1] - 178:15 picked [2] - 24:9, 133:15 picture [4] - 15:18, 61:16, 61:18, 170:21 piece [1] - 40:2 pile [1] - 121:28 pin [1] - 175:12 pipeline [1] - 148:28 **PLACE** [1] - 4:8 place [18] - 8:27, 22:26, 25:26, 27:21, 28:12, 30:22, 31:2, 31:4, 31:10, 31:19, 64:6, 66:14, 67:1, 115:16, 124:25, 135:7, 138:11, 157:8 **placed** [3] - 11:19, 12:11, 163:21 places [1] - 99:20 placing [2] - 33:25, 34:12 plain [1] - 38:7 plan [1] - 169:11 planted [3] - 128:8, 132:2, 132:9 play [1] - 7:10 played [1] - 28:10 **pleased** [1] - 43:6 plus [1] - 80:10 PO [1] - 145:15 point [49] - 15:25, 27:22, 28:18, 28:26,

31:1, 31:6, 35:25,

39:10, 40:25, 43:27,

53:25, 69:4, 72:28,

73:8, 74:22, 75:23, 76:6, 81:9, 83:5, 84:9, 85:21, 93:11, 105:11, 107:19, 112:26, 114:23, 114:25, 118:9, 124:23, 126:29, 127:12, 128:19, 135:18, 135:28, 138:13, 138:18, 146:24, 148:2, 148:8, 148:13, 148:19, 150:19, 155:10, 155:11, 162:8, 164:26, 165:27, 171:10, 173:11 pointed [2] - 17:25, 40:23 points [3] - 45:3, 90:15, 165:13 **police** [2] - 98:29, 99:3 policeman [1] -119:14 policy [17] - 6:25, 6:26, 6:27, 7:4, 14:12, 18:7, 26:14, 43:25, 43:28, 44:12, 55:22, 56:15, 57:21, 57:22, 59:8, 147:4, 147:7 **Policy** [2] - 13:11, 17:13 Portumna [6] - 64:6, 125:3, 126:25, 139:21, 152:2, 152:24 position [23] - 6:27, 17:6, 42:28, 56:27, 57:19, 57:20, 59:14, 61:3, 69:7, 71:17, 87:10, 89:23, 89:27, 93:16, 107:11, 108:29, 136:12, 138:13, 139:9, 146:26, 162:1, 168:26, 176:12 positive [1] - 78:25 possessed [1] - 98:8 possession [10] -67:18, 71:4, 74:18, 74:21, 78:7, 80:18, 99:9, 106:6, 130:14, 131:26 possibility [1] -154.11 possible [24] - 19:28, 25:8, 33:16, 36:17, 70:4, 70:5, 70:6, 70:21, 70:23, 71:29, 73:3, 76:6, 80:24,

112:23, 123:5, 156:16, 167:7, 173:16, 173:28, 176:3, 178:13 possibly [8] - 11:18, 57:26, 89:10, 90:6, 99:16, 148:13, 155:8, 160.14 posted [1] - 76:23 posting [1] - 60:23 posts [1] - 60:20 potential [3] - 72:24, 105:12, 175:15 **POWER** [1] - 4:10 practice [4] - 96:25, 97:15, 116:11, 133:8 preceding [2] -94:13, 159:18 predecessor[1] -27.5 prefer [2] - 125:14, 127:24 preparation[1] -72:8 prepare [3] - 95:28, 176:7, 176:9 prepared [5] - 10:15, 74:4, 94:2, 96:8, 149:8 presence [1] - 82:22 present [4] - 64:5, 81:20, 106:26, 116:9 presenting [2] -61:26, 97:18 presently [1] - 129:8 PRESIDENT [2] -1:13, 2:3 pressing [2] - 159:5, 159:23 pressure [2] -126:27, 136:5 presumably [4] -65:21, 99:28, 111:17, 178:7 presume [7] -121:14, 165:24, 166:4, 169:4, 169:5, 170:23, 172:12 pretty [4] - 14:25, 125:11, 175:23, 179:12 previous [7] - 16:11, 17:24, 18:9, 46:16, 116:3, 168:11, 170:1 previously [14] -16:21, 36:13, 36:14, 41:20, 41:21, 75:25, 80:14, 80:16, 87:25,

108:24, 137:4,

163:19, 164:29,

173:17 primary [1] - 80:4 principally [1] -104:26 priority [1] - 67:17 private [6] - 21:20, 150:25, 151:5, 151:7, 154:8, 171:22 proactively [1] -105.2 problem [5] - 22:27, 43:16, 148:24, 165:25, 177:21 problems [1] - 46:11 procedure [3] -15:24 81:14 90:13 proceed [3] - 17:7, 48:26, 110:2 proceeded [1] -58:13 process [5] - 58:4, 82:1, 87:7, 110:25, 144:23 produce [1] - 57:12 produced [3] -95:11, 95:15, 132:10 profession [1] -116:12 professional [1] -174:8 programme [1] -92.25 progress [15] -12:21, 14:13, 26:16, 48:15, 53:24, 69:1, 70:20 70:23 85:4 86:24, 88:13, 108:6, 131:6, 156:23, 172:20 progressed [1] -163:12 progressing [1] -172:24 progression[1] -64:21 **promise** [1] - 107:22 promises [2] -105:16, 105:20 promoted [7] -60:29, 61:6, 61:12, 62:12, 119:17, 119:23, 119:28 promotion [1] - 61:7 prompt [1] - 106:26 proper [3] - 9:14, 10:2, 131:25 properly [3] -150:21, 152:19, 174:9 property [2] - 84:29,

propose [2] - 17:21,

83:15, 86:7, 103:2,

52:3 proposed [1] -123:20 proposes [1] -173.23 propriety [1] -152:11 prosecuted [1] -149:1 prosecution [4] -86:1, 89:28, 109:8, 109:18 prosecution/the [1] -109:13 protagonists [1] -104:26 PROTECTED [2] -1:2, 1:3 protected [24] - 7:25, 8:6, 8:14, 8:21, 10:12, 11:18, 27:16, 27:23, 27:29, 29:10, 29:18, 32:4, 32:28, 33:3, 33:25, 34:2, 34:4, 34:16, 36:15, 39:1, 44:6, 58:21, 58:24, 153:28 **Protected** [2] - 6:20, 56:23 protection [5] - 9:3, 12:15, 16:23, 60:16, 60:19 protocols [1] - 58:11 **prove** [1] - 73:2 proved [1] - 81:27 provide [6] - 55:16, 81:1, 144:16, 145:9, 162:10, 162:16 provided [15] -67:25, 75:22, 85:11, 90:15, 115:22, 125:9, 132:23, 135:3, 136:21, 137:22, 137:28, 144:17, 162:5, 162:26, 168:5 providing [1] - 151:4 provision [2] - 8:28, provisions [1] - 29:8 proximity [1] - 90:27 prudent [1] - 72:27 Public [1] - 145:17 public [4] - 121:29, 139:23, 143:25, 147.25 publicly [2] - 11:28, 16:25 Pulse [12] - 10:28, 11:19, 11:22, 12:19, 77:11, 78:14, 136:1,

163:19, 163:21, 164:29, 165:2 purpose [18] - 68:19, 78:11, 81:24, 86:6, 87:21, 97:18, 103:24, 106:29, 114:8, 128:23, 133:1, 149:9, 149:11, 151:28, 153:6, 153:7, 159:25, 167:17 purposes [3] - 72:8, 152:29, 154:17 pursuant [1] - 23:20 pursue [1] - 87:17 pursued [1] - 160:17 pursuing [1] - 23:16 Pursuing [1] - 23:25 push [1] - 160:29 put [33] - 20:20, 21:14, 28:12, 32:25, 32:27, 37:21, 41:5, 41:7, 44:10, 57:25, 58:3, 71:24, 83:27, 93:17, 96:2, 111:2, 111:16, 112:1, 116:5, 117:19, 118:2, 119:18, 127:4, 136:7, 145:1, 148:1, 148:7, 154:27, 161:20, 170:20, 172:5, 176:3, 176:27

Q

quantity [1] - 99:5

QUAY [3] - 2:24,

2:31, 4:12

putting [8] - 33:1,

76:19, 110:14, 136:5,

33:3, 69:23, 71:1,

158:23

query [1] - 110:3 questions [19] -6:26, 23:16, 23:25, 25:12, 25:24, 28:27, 31:22, 43:6, 43:13, 43:24, 44:10, 81:12, 82:5. 82:15. 82:18. 90:15, 90:17, 91:8, 114:29 quicker [1] - 74:1 quickly [3] - 74:3, 102:7, 102:9 Quinn [2] - 53:9, 53:11 **QUINN** [1] - 3:10 quite [18] - 19:28, 39:13, 41:6, 86:14, 92:7, 99:18, 99:19,

99:21, 102:7, 107:7, 111:13, 113:9, 126:5, 129:3, 138:16, 142:17, 157:18

R

racket [1] - 136:8

raise [5] - 53:26,

155:20, 155:24,

167:2, 167:4 raised [16] - 15:8, 18:11, 54:14, 69:26, 70:2, 73:17, 73:20, 73:22, 113:17, 141:3, 143:22, 146:24, 148:23, 149:5, 158:3, 158:19 raises [2] - 90:25, 139:17 raising [3] - 37:19, 46:7, 145:24 ran [1] - 101:1 rang [4] - 20:5, 137:2, 137:4, 145:19 range [2] - 41:18, 95.2 rank [1] - 41:21 rather [1] - 65:28 ray [1] - 131:15 **RE**[4] - 5:8, 5:15, 54:10. 114:1 re [16] - 65:4, 65:19, 80:12, 89:10, 103:24, 107:26, 108:1, 110:13. 139:1. 141:16, 141:22, 142:8, 143:25, 146:9, 148:23, 159:14 re-brief [1] - 107:26 re-briefed [1] - 89:10 re-briefing [1] -103:24 re-emphasising [1] -80:12 re-established [1] -110:13 RE-EXAMINED [4] -5:8, 5:15, 54:10, 114:1 re-interview [1] -108:1 read [16] - 29:23, 33:27, 34:1, 40:6, 52:19, 82:16, 82:25, 88:6. 95:24. 95:25. 124:10, 127:25, 143:9, 157:20,

reading [8] - 33:2, recognise [1] -39:4, 50:25, 96:14, 115:28 107:21, 147:14, recognised [1] -169:29 108:13 real [2] - 28:12, recognition [1] -81.23 32:7 realise [1] - 78:19 recollect [4] realised [1] - 154:10 126:29, 134:23, realistic [1] - 178:17 135:5, 153:1 recollection [12] reality [1] - 105:21 really [6] - 34:7, 18:28, 19:22, 25:6, 39:16, 41:8, 101:4, 25:9, 37:14, 66:10, 103:15, 174:15 76:25, 92:6, 98:27, 134:9, 159:20, 161:29 reason [16] - 25:1, record [6] - 19:12, 58:26, 66:18, 72:21, 73:28, 97:14, 108:17, 19:13, 64:29, 72:14, 111:28, 113:12, 83:28, 160:25 recorded [9] - 46:6, 116:20, 124:2, 129:13, 146:9. 46:29, 66:29, 68:26, 147:25, 152:22, 72:5, 83:21, 84:2, 84:8, 130:12 155:19 reasonable [2] records [11] - 48:11, 70:21, 75:19, 75:27, 116:25, 177:13 80:4, 92:15, 113:11, reasons [6] - 48:17, 48:19. 65:25. 68:21. 116:3, 117:18, 132:4, 146:18, 163:18 147.17 reassure [7] - 47:6, recover [1] - 75:15 rectify [1] - 154:5 138:3, 138:6, 138:9, 138:14, 143:4, 143:5 redaction [1] -130:26 reassured [2] -46:12, 164:11 **REDDY** [1] - 4:8 receipt [2] - 18:6, reengage [1] - 112:4 65:12 refer [9] - 16:11, 30:9, 37:10, 38:5, receive [3] - 27:7, 66:1. 106:22. 113:8. 89:12 135:17 received [19] - 18:13, 113:10, 160:8 45:12, 47:24, 49:7, Reference [1] -50:21, 52:18, 102:14, 77:21 106:5, 108:28, reference [17] -137:21, 139:1, 17:25, 18:8, 46:20, 141:17, 145:8, 71:27, 116:29, 153:22, 157:12, 126:23, 135:8, 142:5, 157:23, 157:25, 143:12, 144:24, 162:8, 170:9 147:9, 163:3, 168:6, receiving [5] - 49:22, 168:13, 170:3, 173:2, 50:20, 52:4, 53:25, 175:25 138:28 referencing [2] recent [5] - 17:29, 17:11, 18:23 18:2, 81:18, 90:21, referral [4] - 13:2, 171:5 17:4, 53:8, 53:11 recently [1] - 11:28 referred [15] - 16:24, reception [3] - 86:13, 79:11, 86:9, 87:18, 86.14 89:4, 89:16, 90:4, recipient [17] - 12:1, 90:12, 116:2, 118:1, 118:11, 128:19, 12:25, 13:2, 17:5, 17:17, 21:26, 24:20, 131:4, 133:3, 133:7 26:20, 26:23, 26:25, referring [8] - 20:26, 26:29, 27:4, 27:9, 68:1, 71:13, 71:15, 27:15, 27:20, 28:9, 75:19, 140:9, 165:22,

172:26

158:10, 161:24

refers [6] - 47:28, 77:6, 78:14, 83:2, 166:24, 166:26 reflect [2] - 76:24, 138:19 reflected [1] - 51:4 Reform [1] - 55:14 refusal [1] - 111:27 refute [1] - 83:29 regard [5] - 7:8, 31:11, 141:4, 164:2, 175:3 regarding [7] -19:16, 105:7, 107:13, 143:29, 157:13, 157:23, 157:25 region [3] - 52:28, 62:10, 62:13 Region [7] - 11:2, 11:13, 14:18, 15:29, 16:4, 140:5, 177:27 regional [1] - 120:24 regions [2] - 27:7, 140:5 **REGISTRAR**[1] - 2:5 regular [1] - 49:28 regularly [1] - 19:26 regulation [1] regulations [16] -6:19, 8:27, 8:29, 54:16, 54:18, 55:3, 55:8, 55:24, 56:11, 56:18, 56:28, 57:4, 141:28, 143:6, 151:6 related [5] - 19:5, 77:29, 87:22, 148:27, 166:28 relates [1] - 137:27 relating [4] - 64:3, 118:4, 134:20, 152:10 relation [129] - 10:12, 10:15, 10:17, 11:2, 11:4, 11:6, 11:22, 11:25, 12:5, 14:5, 14:7, 19:23, 22:29, 23:14, 23:16, 23:25, 24:19, 35:23, 43:24, 44:18, 44:19, 45:2, 45:12, 45:26, 47:6, 47:7, 49:20, 50:22, 51:9, 54:13, 54:14, 57:7, 57:26, 57:29, 62:24, 63:24, 64:20, 66:4, 67:28, 68:22, 69:11, 75:13, 76:26, 77:5, 77:10, 77:17, 81:8, 81:10, 81:18, 84:15, 88:1, 88:21, 90:28, 91:1, 95:4,

104:1, 105:6, 106:21, 108:25, 109:6, 116:8, 122:24, 123:22, 123:27, 125:12, 128:2, 128:5, 128:7, 130:19, 131:10, 131:29, 132:5, 132:7, 132:17, 134:4, 135:9, 135:24, 135:29, 136:6, 136:14, 136:25, 137:2, 137:3, 137:5, 138:9, 138:12, 140:12, 140:24, 140:29, 141:3, 142:9, 142:12, 143:13, 143:20, 144:21, 145:26, 146:16, 147:13, 147:29, 150:5, 151:8, 152:26, 154:25, 155:9, 155:27, 158:22, 158:24, 159:27, 160:25, 162:10, 162:27, 165:12, 165:13. 165:18. 166:7, 166:13, 166:16, 169:11, 169:15, 170:20, 172:13, 173:5, 174:23, 174:24, 174:27, 175:13, 175:21, 176:26, 177.14 relationship [3] -53:12, 98:21, 112:2 release [2] - 144:28, 147.29 released [1] - 78:12 releasing [1] -116:27 relevant [1] - 139:7 relieved [2] - 137:16, 137.19 reluctance [3] -69:26, 109:14, 111:6 reluctant [4] - 7:6, 90:21, 139:22, 139:26 rely [1] - 113:6 remain [1] - 114:21 remained [5] -113:19, 114:23, 119:13, 119:22, 119:28 remains [3] - 38:26, 39:4, 89:23 remark [2] - 149:26, 151:3

remember [28] -

6:19. 6:23. 16:8.

17:26, 18:1, 18:3,

21:29, 22:8, 22:23, 22:25, 23:4, 24:25, 29:4, 41:28, 45:22, 49:22, 50:20, 52:4, 57:28, 59:1, 59:4, 61:13, 61:14, 70:3, 76:2, 122:29, 138:20, 147:6 reminder [1] - 41:2 remit [1] - 25:2 remove [2] - 17:15, 18:25 **removed** [2] - 107:6, 133.22 render [1] - 113:15 rendezvous [1] -136:16 repeating [1] - 16:24 reply [6] - 13:24, 16:17, 89:12, 129:24, 129:25, 170:10 report [60] - 10:16, 12:24, 13:20, 14:10, 14:17, 15:7, 40:24, 40:25, 41:26, 42:2, 42:7, 42:14, 47:19, 47:21, 49:1, 49:9, 49:13, 49:17, 52:1, 52:2, 52:5, 55:18, 56:2, 62:27, 64:12, 64:16, 65:4, 65:13, 65:14, 89:1, 103:16, 103:26, 103:27, 104:1, 116:28, 122:17, 123:3, 123:9, 138:27, 139:8, 141:17, 162:10, 162:17, 162:26, 164:15, 165:5, 165:9, 165:10, 165:21, 165:25, 166:3, 168:9, 168:11, 168:17, 169:1, 170:7, 170:26, 170:29, 173:14 reported [5] - 11:29, 17:16, 62:25, 163:5, 170:22 reporter [33] - 8:22, 9:6, 9:14, 9:21, 10:3, 38:11, 45:19, 48:5, 48:13, 48:21, 49:28, 50:4, 50:14, 52:19, 52:23, 53:2, 53:5, 64:4, 64:17, 94:19, 105:13, 113:14, 121:22, 133:3, 147:24, 156:20, 163:7, 163:10, 163:14, 163:25, 164:4, 164:11, 173:19

reporter's [4] - 8:29, 9:3, 50:2, 52:29 reporting [14] - 6:18, 28:17, 44:6, 54:19, 55:7, 55:9, 55:15, 55:24, 58:1, 85:15, 154:2, 166:11, 168:13, 172:18 reports [4] - 27:7, 53:26, 58:13, 100:27 reputation [1] -140:6 request [10] - 18:27, 39:17, 39:18, 39:20, 40:24, 53:1, 67:9, 75:23, 129:6, 162:9 requested [5] -14:10, 36:11, 94:21, 94:27, 124:26 require [3] - 92:21, 123:13, 133:27 required [12] - 50:4, 65:5, 68:25, 82:5, 123:3, 127:1, 129:23, 140:24, 144:23, 156:18, 159:25, 174:7 requirements [3] -12:18, 136:10, 146:29 requiring [2] - 65:14, resided [1] - 79:11 RESOLUTIONS [1] resolve [1] - 23:27 RESOURCES [1] resources [2] -174:6, 174:7 respect [26] - 16:23, 35:1, 35:16, 35:18, 36:12, 39:21, 46:14, 48:22, 48:28, 57:18, 75:29, 90:9, 119:19, 122:25, 131:9, 132:6, 148:13, 148:15, 153:17, 154:24, 158:29, 162:21, 164:14, 165:17, 174:28, 177:27 respects [1] - 73:16 respond [6] - 73:19, 90:11, 92:15, 94:20, 108:20, 110:19 response [6] - 15:4, 18:12, 75:8, 92:10, 106:26, 108:7 responsibility [2] -177:27, 179:2

responsible [2] -

121:12, 164:8

rest [4] - 110:12, 144:2, 144:10, 157:19 restrained [4] -98:17, 106:29, 107:1, 107.4 result [8] - 86:2, 89:27, 108:11, 118:12, 139:11, 140:28, 158:23, 159:19 resulted [1] - 109:16 results [1] - 160:24 resume [1] - 68:11 **RESUMED** [2] - 6:1, retained [1] - 175:1 **RETIRED** [7] - 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, 3:12, 3:13 retired [9] - 85:5, 85:8, 88:28, 118:25, 119:9, 120:3, 120:10, 120:12, 120:13 return [1] - 108:25 returned [6] - 52:21, 61:8. 61:9. 61:25. 86:26, 109:18 returning [1] - 146:5 reverting [1] - 88:14 revisit [2] - 80:22, revisiting [1] - 90:1 revocation [1] - 57:4 revoked [3] - 56:28, 56:29, 141:29 **rid** [1] - 87:24 ring [1] - 25:7 rise [1] - 70:7 risen [1] - 145:27 risk [4] - 29:1, 33:6, 33:12, 34:5 risks [20] - 29:1, 29:11, 29:12, 32:5, 32:8, 32:17, 32:18, 32:22, 32:29, 33:4, 33:5, 33:10, 33:23, 33:26, 33:27, 33:28, 34:6, 34:14 road [1] - 30:28 Road [2] - 119:24, 119:25 **ROAD**[1] - 2:18 robberies [1] - 60:28 role [5] - 28:10, 28:26, 29:19, 41:14, 105:8 **roll** [1] - 33:20 room [13] - 63:20, 63:21, 63:22, 63:26, 65:23, 68:17, 78:10,

133:5, 134:3 48:16, 88:29, 163:17 113:13, 114:7, 114:9, 130:11, 174:21, 179:7 searches [2] - 133:8, sense [4] - 103:16, Roscommon [3] -134:11 106:24, 117:16, 121:7, 121:9, 177:28 **second** [19] - 15:7, 174:15 rough [3] - 125:11, 19:11. 49:21. 49:24. sent [13] - 15:1, 72:9, 126:19, 148:5 52:14, 52:15, 55:26, 84:25, 101:2, 103:16, roughly [3] - 35:12, 77:3, 78:14, 83:5, 103:17, 103:29, 131:15, 139:8, 147:3, 35:14, 107:15 117:6, 128:6, 157:6, 166:10, 170:8, 170:29 164:7, 165:7, 168:28, round [1] - 26:22 171:3, 172:29, 173:1 sentence [4] - 45:16, routine [1] - 96:27 Roxboro [1] - 119:25 seconded [1] - 60:20 46:20, 165:7, 165:23 rude [1] - 93:18 secretary [3] - 21:20, separate [3] -51:6. 168:10 112:14, 141:11, RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 section [10] - 8:28, 163:15 9:2, 18:7, 54:26, September [11] -S 42:3, 51:29, 70:14, 54:29, 56:9, 56:27, 97:23, 131:16, 141:21 88:16, 100:2, 110:20, safekeeping[1] -149:22, 156:26, securely [1] - 131:25 132:24 see [40] - 9:2, 11:14, 159:10, 160:18, sanctioned [2] -162:23 17:27, 21:7, 29:15, 118:7, 153:20 29:16, 33:15, 33:16, sequence [2] -**SANDRA**[1] - 4:6 37:22, 37:29, 40:7, 54:23, 66:15 sat [1] - 74:25 sequential [1] -40:16, 41:23, 47:20, satisfactorily [1] -49:20, 49:24, 54:18, 36:21 138:15 54:23, 58:7, 76:18, Sergeant [7] - 53:7, satisfied [7] - 48:14, 91:4, 91:19, 94:12, 88:10, 128:16, 49:7, 50:29, 53:16, 97:14, 97:20, 98:29, 128:17, 128:20, 53:21, 170:17, 170:19 99:5, 103:22, 107:18, 128:22, 165:28 Saturday [1] - 124:19 115:10, 117:11, SERGEANT [5] -**SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 131:16, 144:26, 3:12, 3:20, 4:5, 4:6, saw [9] - 11:9, 45:29, 147:7, 152:22, 54:21, 56:5, 76:17, 157:19, 169:17, **sergeant** [7] - 61:4, 137:25, 154:8, 175:13, 179:15 61:5, 76:26, 76:27, 154:14, 155:6 seeing [5] - 45:22, 76:28, 119:17, 119:21 SC [11] - 2:6, 2:7, 69:21, 69:22, 70:28, series [1] - 82:5 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 70:29 serious [7] - 38:12, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:6, seek [2] - 89:7, 92:15 74:27, 85:25, 85:27, 4:7 seeking [3] - 12:21, 97:18, 176:24, 177:29 **SCANLAN**[1] - 3:8 116:15, 134:29 **Serious** [1] - 60:25 scheduled [1] seeks [1] - 13:9 serve [1] - 121:2 162:22 seem [6] - 50:28, served [4] - 85:8, 50:29, 65:11, 117:4, scheme [3] - 8:24,

129:17, 146:16

124:27, 131:21

99:6, 129:12

74:8. 129:6

33:28

sees [2] - 33:27,

seize [3] - 67:21,

seized [6] - 71:4,

75:29, 84:25, 85:3,

seizing [1] - 75:6

seizure [3] - 67:10,

selected [1] - 123:13

self [2] - 95:22, 95:24

sending [3] - 14:23,

send [3] - 14:20,

senior [4] - 8:2,

95:29, 168:17

41:25, 170:7

51:24

scope [1] - 135:16

screens [1] - 125:18

37:29, 115:27, 125:27

scrolling [1] - 13:27

scrutiny [1] - 92:21

SEAN [4] - 1:12, 2:2,

SEANAD[1] - 1:5

search [12] - 84:23,

106:23, 107:1, 107:2,

107:6, 113:13, 133:12

searched [3] - 133:1,

87:23, 98:14, 98:18,

99:22, 106:16,

se [1] - 15:5

2:22, 3:17

screen [1] - 38:2

scroll [4] - 13:21,

sets [3] - 48:19, 52:7 setting [2] - 97:8, 108:29 **settled** [1] - 95:5 seven [3] - 60:22, 60:27, 175:10 several [4] - 41:12, 42:25, 83:2, 101:1 shall [4] - 29:11, 32:17, 32:28, 32:29 **SHANE** [1] - 3:23 **SHANKEY** [1] - 3:21 SHANKEY-SMITH 111 - 3:21 **SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 **shape** [1] - 111:24 **share** [1] - 171:19 shattered [1] - 156:1 SHEAHAN[1] - 3:18 **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 **SHIP** [1] - 3:28 shopping [2] -151:25, 151:26 short [3] - 51:28, 87:29, 123:12 shortened [1] -71:12 shortly [2] - 26:27, 123:3 **shot** [1] - 158:28 shots [1] - 158:27 **show** [3] - 83:15, 107:21, 117:9 showed [2] - 20:1, 163.13 side [1] - 91:2 sight [2] - 102:12, 107:16 sighting [1] - 78:1 **sign** [5] - 82:17, 88:8, 96:8, 111:27, 161:14 signed [10] - 82:24, 82:25, 82:26, 87:15, 96:9, 115:29, 117:12, 130:8, 148:25, 162:5 significant [2] -74:21, 111:17 signing [1] - 162:1 **SIM** [8] - 83:4, 85:2, 99:6, 99:17, 99:19, 107:8, 129:22 similar [2] - 29:7, 51:9 **simple** [1] - 40:1 simply [5] - 31:25, 40:4, 41:1, 111:27, 148:18

single [3] - 69:4,

128:19, 155:11

SINÉAD [1] - 4:7 SINéAD [1] - 2:7 **SIO** [1] - 62:24 sit [7] - 60:8, 97:4, 97:9, 97:12, 97:14, 116:12, 123:21 sitting [2] - 60:17, 178:9 situation [7] - 6:29, 29:7, 30:13, 37:15, 97:3, 179:5 six [6] - 61:28, 92:10, 93:26, 98:26, 99:4, 99:14 **slightly** [1] - 170:26 small [1] - 173:29 smaller [1] - 41:10 smartly [1] - 14:26 **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 SMITHFIELD [2] -2:24, 4:12 **so..** [2] - 42:27, 102:8 solace [1] - 136:27 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 solely [3] - 17:15, 103:21, 114:8 solicitor [39] - 81:18, 81:19, 81:29, 82:9, 82:19, 82:23, 86:9, 87:2, 87:3, 88:14, 88:20, 90:16, 91:20, 92:26, 92:28, 93:7, 93:13, 93:25, 94:5, 94:17, 94:23, 95:8, 95:13, 95:28, 96:22, 96:27, 97:1, 97:10, 97:19, 103:10, 105:26, 106:1, 108:20, 108:22, 110:23, 115:23, 116:8, 116:16 SOLICITOR'S [1] -3:27 **Solicitors** [1] - 115:2 solicitors [6] - 96:16, 97:2. 97:4. 97:6. 102:26, 102:29 SOLICITORS [6] -2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, 4:8. 4:11 solution [1] - 40:1 someone [3] - 26:14, 116:15, 128:10 **sometime** [4] - 61:3, 102:1, 160:14, 160:16 soon [2] - 70:23, 103:2 sorry [37] - 7:8, 13:16, 13:17, 20:19,

21:11, 24:8, 24:9,

94:17, 95:16, 120:20

service [2] - 53:7,

services [8] - 45:19,

51:18, 52:27, 132:14,

SERVICES [1] - 1:29

Services [1] - 1:24

serving [6] - 38:15,

set [20] - 12:29, 23:5,

57:12, 63:20, 65:24,

81:12, 82:4, 82:8,

84:12, 85:25, 86:2,

160:23, 174:21

89:24, 107:28, 114:7,

114:9, 121:22, 128:1,

38:28, 62:1, 62:2,

173:24, 175:27

46:17, 50:3, 50:6,

60.15

24:10, 28:2, 28:19, 30:3, 31:21, 33:18, 34:22, 34:27, 36:3, 37:4, 37:6, 38:21, 41:20, 53:20, 78:10, 83:23, 93:17, 100:21, 101:21, 101:23, 120:17, 138:16, 138:19, 150:10, 154:1, 155:23, 158:10, 162:12, 176:17 sort [4] - 106:26, 123:9, 175:6, 179:12 sorted [2] - 39:15, 139:4 sought [11] - 6:26, 14:11, 51:23, 63:23, 75:25, 75:27, 75:28, 111:10, 132:6, 146:28, 174:29 South [1] - 60:14 southern [1] - 52:28 **space** [1] - 65:25 speaking [4] - 66:22, 86:19, 96:28, 105:19 **Special** [1] - 60:18 specific [6] - 21:29, 22:5, 84:23, 132:2, 134:4, 178:21 specifically [5] -10:26, 23:5, 93:25, 93:27, 93:29 speculation [1] spent [4] - 60:15, 60:27, 120:15, 179:8 **spoken** [9] - 63:23, 69:14, 77:4, 80:8, 87:25, 135:20, 164:6, 169:3 **sprung** [1] - 175:15 **Squad** [1] - 60:25 **squad** [1] - 178:24 **Square** [1] - 60:25 stabbing [1] - 167:26 staff [3] - 55:17, 56:1, 132:15 stage [32] - 28:16, 30:24, 30:25, 35:27, 45:26, 51:13, 51:21, 58:4, 59:15, 69:7, 78:4, 84:4, 85:6, 89:27, 96:25, 97:8, 97:10, 100:27, 124:16, 124:18, 126:5, 127:29, 131:12, 135:5, 145:8, 146:23, 151:19, 158:19, 167:19,

168:4, 170:24, 175:4 stall [1] - 147:13 stalled [2] - 146:13, 147:10 stamp [1] - 102:17 stand [5] - 37:20, 103:12, 103:22, 107:24, 110:1 standard [4] - 15:6, 15:9, 15:23, 174:8 stands [2] - 31:25, start [3] - 13:21, 165:26, 179:16 started [2] - 121:5, 160:15 STATE[1] - 3:27 State [3] - 74:17, 80:2, 115:2 state [2] - 80:6, 80:9 statement [141] -18:3, 19:11, 19:12, 21:14, 42:25, 58:22, 63:28, 64:8, 66:29, 67:3, 67:25, 67:27, 68:11. 68:20. 69:12. 71:11, 72:6, 72:15, 72:22, 73:3, 73:7, 73:10, 73:21, 73:29, 74:3, 74:26, 77:23, 78:3, 78:4, 78:6, 78:9, 78:26, 79:7, 79:8, 79:18, 80:13, 80:21, 80:25, 81:1, 81:2, 82:2, 82:4, 85:10, 85:18, 85:20, 85:22, 85:24, 85:29, 86:5, 86:6, 87:5, 87:8, 87:14, 87:18, 87:20, 87:27, 87:29, 88:6, 88:21, 89:9, 89:17, 91:19, 94:11, 94:13, 95:29, 96:8, 98:5, 100:1, 100:5, 100:10, 100:14, 100:24, 101:5, 101:9, 101:18, 101:28, 102:13, 103:1, 103:4, 103:7, 103:9, 103:12, 103:22, 103:23, 105:15, 106:16, 107:12, 107:17, 107:21, 107:25, 107:29, 109:3, 109:27, 109:29, 110:2, 111:16, 114:16, 117:13, 122:13, 127:12, 130:8, 133:7, 133:12,

133:24, 133:27,

137:23, 144:16, 144:17, 144:22, 144:28, 145:4, 145:6, 145:9, 145:22, 145:29, 146:1, 148:23, 148:25, 149:10, 150:2, 157:1, 157:18, 159:5, 159:15, 160:3, 160:11, 162:2, 166:16, 166:19, 166:20, 166:23, 166:24, 166:29, 167:8, 167:9, 167:20, 167:28, 168:1, 168:3, 174:16 statements [22] -69:27, 70:5, 72:5, 72:7, 72:11, 76:24, 78:20, 78:28, 79:6, 81:11, 105:7, 111:24, 113:10, 114:14, 115:3, 115:6, 115:17, 129:9, 134:25, 140:11. 172:8 states [4] - 12:5, 50:10, 79:29, 143:1 static [1] - 60:19 stating [1] - 52:21 station [29] - 38:29, 64:6, 65:24, 67:7, 68:18, 70:6, 82:10, 91:21, 92:28, 94:5, 105:26, 112:24, 112:28. 113:7. 113:11, 114:7, 114:18, 116:10, 116:26, 121:6, 129:14, 133:2, 143:27, 149:25, 157:27, 158:2, 158:23, 158:28, 171:6 Station [6] - 112:24, 127:14. 131:19. 133:17, 157:14, 163:10 stationed [1] - 76:29 **status** [1] - 52:25 stay [1] - 21:11 staying [1] - 8:26 stenographic [1] stenography [1] -STENOGRAPHY [1] - 1:29 step [3] - 72:22, 124:6, 124:16 STEPHANIE[1] -

STEPHEN [1] - 2:21 steppingstone [1] -126:18 steps [11] - 49:18, 72:4, 80:24, 85:20, 90:3, 90:6, 123:8, 123:11, 123:15, 123:16, 138:2 stick [1] - 28:8 still [8] - 7:14, 38:23, 52:20, 62:1, 62:2, 72:3, 113:19, 126:24 stolen [2] - 132:18, 133.8 stone [1] - 99:24 stood [3] - 45:2, 156:13, 169:9 stop [3] - 13:22, 36:21, 171:9 **stopped** [1] - 30:18 store [7] - 131:28, 132:6, 133:1, 133:3, 133:18, 133:23 storeroom [1] -133:10 stores [1] - 131:28 straightaway [1] -124:21 strands [1] - 42:23 strategies [1] -172.22 strategy [3] - 169:11, 173:4, 175:29 Street [3] - 61:3, 119:18, 119:21 **STREET**[3] - 2:12, 3.28 4.3 street [1] - 172:4 string [1] - 111:28 struck [1] - 150:18 structure [2] - 46:25, 56:21 stuff [12] - 80:8. 99:19, 124:26, 127:5, 129:14, 134:4, 134:13, 138:20, 144:22, 155:27, 160:29, 173:3 subject [13] - 13:1, 17:4, 17:21, 36:13, 46:13, 63:3, 72:18, 85:26, 90:26, 97:17, 124:15, 132:3, 175:5 subject-matter [2] -124:15, 175:5 submission [2] -109:16 112:7 submissions [1] -

submit [1] - 173:16

submitted [3] - 89:6, 103:24, 122:25 subsection [2] -9:18. 9:27 subsequent [3] -27:8, 70:13, 141:1 subsequently [9] -19:19, 52:27, 75:15, 82:28, 108:21, 108:28, 121:11, 122:19, 132:10 substance 131 -48:10, 79:19, 117:19 substantial [2] -100:29. 175:23 succeeded [1] -160:19 successful [2] -60:23. 61:4 suggest [6] - 117:4, 134:15, 135:25, 140:27, 168:7, 177:4 suggested [7] - 90:8, 122:5, 132:18, 145:3, 156:22, 168:2, 173:4 suggesting [4] -28:7, 116:10, 144:8, 160:28 suggestion [4] -75:5, 75:16, 90:11, 133:15 suggests [1] - 18:19 summarising [2] -73:2, 148:17 summarv [1] -115:21 Sundrive [1] -119:24 super [1] - 129:6 Superintendent [114] - 6:6, 7:23, 10:18, 11:12, 13:11, 16:9, 18:8, 18:11, 18:16, 18:20, 19:18, 19:27, 20:4, 20:10, 21:17, 22:27, 25:3, 28:15, 28:25, 30:23, 30:29, 31:5, 31:9, 34:24, 36:10, 43:23, 47:14, 47:16, 47:18, 47:21, 48:3, 49:27, 50:1, 50:14, 50:15, 51:15, 52:2, 52:9, 52:15, 53:6, 53:15, 58:20, 62:7, 62:16, 62:18, 62:28, 62:29, 63:2, 63:5, 63:7, 63:15, 63:28, 64:3, 64:28, 66:21, 66:27, 67:8,

67:20, 68:16, 69:3,

69:16, 69:20, 69:29, 70:15, 71:11, 71:23, 71:25, 74:15, 76:15, 77:4, 77:27, 78:2, 79:22, 82:22, 82:27, 82:29, 84:14, 84:21, 85:5, 88:28, 91:25, 94:16, 95:10, 96:9, 96:23, 98:7, 103:25, 104:3, 106:4, 106:19, 118:26, 120:20, 120:22, 120:27, 128:25, 129:19, 129:21, 133:16, 135:18, 136:24, 136:26, 137:2, 141:2, 145:21, 149:22, 153:1, 156:25, 156:26, 158:4, 163:8, 166:1, 166:3, 172:21 **SUPERINTENDENT** [22] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 5:3, 5:17, 6:8, 25:19, 43:20, 54:10, 119:1 superintendent [64] - 6:12, 6:14, 7:7, 7:28, 11:1, 11:5, 11:15, 11:21, 13:10, 14:6, 14:11, 14:12, 14:13, 14:28, 15:28, 16:3, 16:6. 16:28. 17:13. 19:1, 21:8, 22:5, 22:8, 22:13, 24:16, 24:18, 24:26, 25:11, 25:22, 30:20, 44:21, 45:6, 46:2, 51:13, 52:4, 54:7, 59:17, 59:22, 62:5. 62:6. 62:9. 62:21, 63:8, 69:6, 76:12, 119:6, 119:29, 120:5, 120:6, 120:8, 120:16, 120:18, 124:21, 125:14, 128:24, 136:4, 136:11, 150:28, 150:29, 157:12, 158:24, 158:29, 177:26 superintendent's [1] - 64:7 superintendents [1] - 27:6 supervising [2] -172:9, 178:1 supervision [1] -61:27 supplied [4] - 46:16,

132:25, 137:18, 164:6 **supply** [1] - 80:3 support [5] - 75:16, 85:1, 99:2, 106:11, 133.14 supported [1] - 99:2 supportive [1] -107:22 supports [1] -138.11 suppose [14] -23:27, 65:26, 76:8, 88:29, 90:21, 92:13, 131:27, 131:29, 138:13, 165:12. 169:15, 170:19, 175:7, 176:26 supposed [1] - 30:16 surmising [1] - 95:7 surprised [3] - 84:1, 93:9, 164:5 surrounding [10] -11:8, 38:12, 64:12, 64:16, 74:27, 75:11, 76:19. 119:16. 122:16, 158:26 surveillance [1] -108:14 suspect [2] - 92:9, 92:18 suspected [1] -134:21 suspects [1] -117:25 suspended [4] -69:28, 130:2, 143:24, 146:19 suspension [16] -76:4, 139:22, 140:13, 140:27, 143:29, 144:18, 144:22, 144:29, 146:9, 146:21, 147:1, 147:14, 157:9, 157:10, 159:25, 160:4 swear [1] - 152:5 swore [2] - 84:18, 84.19 **SWORN** [2] - 60:3, 119:2 synopsises [1] -89:19 **system** [14] - 12:19, 27:5, 27:16, 30:21,

30:22, 31:2, 31:4,

31:7, 31:19, 41:1,

Síochána [20] -

12:20, 35:25, 46:25,

136:8, 163:20, 163:21

SÍOCHÁNA [1] - 3:2

50:7, 54:29, 55:7, 55:18, 55:19, 55:23, 56:10, 56:11, 60:12, 96:26, 119:9, 119:10, 140:2, 154:28, 166:14, 173:25 Т **T&N** [1] - 4:2 table [1] - 115:3 tagged [1] - 99:9 tail [1] - 175:17 18:4 **TARA**[1] - 3:22 118:13 task [1] - 91:2 tax [4] - 149:26, 150:24, 150:25, 155:23 154:7 81:8, 84:5, 88:29, 90:10, 91:1, 91:5,

talks [3] - 9:2, 9:18, tangent [1] - 37:8 target [2] - 117:27, taxed [2] - 150:21, team [46] - 44:22, 45:25, 47:3, 49:19, 50:22, 51:2, 51:10, 51:14, 52:10, 53:19, 64:26, 65:21, 65:28, 68:8, 76:21, 76:27, 77:16, 77:19, 78:20, 96:1, 101:21, 101:22, 101:23, 103:5, 103:13, 119:19, 123:13, 128:1, 135:1, 135:20, 139:27, 168:7. 171:7. 172:3. 173:15, 173:23, 178:4, 178:8, 178:15 telecom [2] - 75:23, 75:28 telecommunication [1] - 131:16 telecoms [1] - 75:13 telephone [5] -19:16, 21:25, 71:9, 116.2 116.29 **TEMPLE**[1] - 2:31 ten [2] - 99:15, 108:19 tend [1] - 139:25 tended [1] - 106:6 term [1] - 131:5 termination [1] -

conclusion [2] -48:25, 163:28 terminology [2] -159:28, 159:29 terms [9] - 51:9, 61:21, 73:24, 75:27, 107:19, 120:26, 156:17, 172:7, 174:19 Terms [1] - 77:21 Terrace[1] - 119:12 terribly [1] - 96:29 text [14] - 52:19, 52:21, 105:24, 130:23, 145:7, 145:28, 146:3, 148:15, 149:14, 149:16, 155:16, 159:17, 159:18, 159:19 texts [2] - 105:16, 131:11 that" [1] - 158:12 **THE** [20] - 1:3, 1:7, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 6:1, 6:13, 20:19, 25:16, 40:11, 43:8, 59:25, 60:6, 91:10, 98:1, 118:20, 118:23, 119:5, 179:19 theft [1] - 83:5 themselves [2] -117:3, 178:16 **THEN** [3] - 59:25, 118:23, 179:19 thereabouts [3] -42:15, 119:25, 120:19 thereafter [1] - 26:27 thinking [5] - 8:20, 32:21, 81:7, 81:22, 169:29 third [2] - 139:17, 143:19 thoroughly [3] -12:13, 78:19, 174:10 threat" [2] - 158:14, 158:16 three [9] - 7:22, 48:19, 67:5, 69:11, 90:5, 98:26, 115:21, 134:13, 164:26 three-page [1] -115:21 threw [1] - 36:16 throughout [1] -107.9 thrust [2] - 90:1, 110:16 Thursday [1] -162:22

tied [2] - 171:29,

177:28 timeframe [2] -123:12, 173:5 timeline [4] - 41:5, 41:7, 107:10, 115:16 timing [1] - 111:12 tiny [1] - 33:14 TLO [1] - 71:29 **TO** [2] - 6:8, 40:11 **to..** [1] - 7:6 today [3] - 48:9, 145:20, 166:13 together [8] - 33:17, 69:24, 70:25, 71:1, 76:19, 94:15, 95:10, 104.25 **TOM** [3] - 3:12, 4:10 tomorrow [3] - 48:9, 177:20, 179:17 Tony [2] - 58:24, 58:29 took [29] - 22:26, 41:18, 42:24, 42:25, 64:6, 67:1, 67:3, 67:5, 72:4, 74:26, 80:24, 85:21, 90:6, 99:25, 99:28, 108:14, 114:15, 114:17, 123:11, 125:11, 130:15, 136:26, 148:6, 157:8, 169:16, 175:9, 175:12, 175:14, 177:19 **top** [7] - 11:16, 24:13, 33:20, 94:12, 96:3, 101:12, 175:25 topic [3] - 44:21, 114:29, 140:23 total [3] - 41:13, 60:22, 168:8 totally [1] - 83:28 touch [2] - 128:10, 134:28 touching [1] - 15:18 towards [2] - 78:15, 121:15 TOWNPARKS [1] -2:12 trace [1] - 133:13 traffic [1] - 121:7 tragedy [1] - 111:14 trained [1] - 71:10 training [2] - 60:13, 119:11 transcript [4] - 1:25, 20:8, 20:19, 28:29 transcripts [1] - 19:7 transfer [1] - 121:12 transferred [2] -121:10, 121:11

termination/

travelled [1] - 110:21 travelling [2] -150:20, 153:17 TREACY [1] - 2:27 treated [4] - 46:14, 48:28, 90:9, 164:14 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, Tribunal [14] - 19:2, 47:13, 63:4, 72:6, 79:7, 80:21, 83:28, 94:29, 95:4, 105:7, 120:27, 136:26, 160:23, 169:20 Tribunal's [1] - 69:19 **TRIBUNALS**[1] - 1:8 tried [7] - 59:11, 124:12, 134:17, 138:6, 138:9, 155:28, 156.16 trigger [1] - 25:6 triggers [1] - 16:29 true [6] - 116:23, 136:8, 161:23, 176:18, 176:22, 178:3 trust [3] - 152:27, 152:28, 155:28 trusted [2] - 150:29, 153:10 truth [2] - 121:29, 122:28 try [20] - 85:21, 90:4, 90:7, 99:12, 123:20, 131:13, 138:2, 143:26, 144:3, 144:11, 160:26, 161:7, 161:13, 169:17, 170:19, 173:5, 175:13, 176:1, 177:12 trying [10] - 28:4, 32:15, 92:27, 112:3, 124:25, 143:4, 143:5, 146:17, 161:3, 176:27 Tuesday [2] -124:20, 127:18 TUESDAY [2] - 1:18, Tullamore [5] -66:24, 66:28, 67:6, 129:10, 129:27 turn [5] - 34:18, 49:12, 50:26, 100:1, 138.14 turned [2] - 62:26, 151.18 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turning [1] - 126:21 twelve [1] - 99:15 two [26] - 7:21, 7:22,

11:18, 13:19, 35:16, 35:17, 40:20, 52:2, 54:6, 73:8, 77:26, 78:22, 84:22, 84:23, 92:5, 97:28, 98:26, 106:20, 120:13, 148:23, 148:27, 158:27, 163:22, 172:13, 172:29, 175:15

two-page [1] - 52:2

typed [2] - 78:11, 141:8

typo [2] - 101:3, 101:6

U

ultimately [4] -39:15. 86:9. 103:26. 109.15 unauthorised [1] -83:3 unclear [1] - 29:29 uncommon [1] -95:28 uncooperative [1] uncovered[1] -118:10 UNDER [2] - 1:2, 1:8 under [27] - 7:14, 8:27, 8:28, 9:22, 9:27, 24:2, 27:5, 52:23, 56:27, 59:8, 68:17, 88:19, 90:8, 100:11, 120:20, 126:27, 131:29, 132:21, 141:28, 143:6, 156:20, 158:13, 158:15, 159:2, 167:27, 168:21, 172:3 understandable [1] -112:5 understood [4] -25:29, 26:13, 37:15, 64:6 undertake [1] - 41:19 undue [1] - 176:8 **unduly** [1] - 90:9 unfair [1] - 41:7 unfolded [1] - 74:15 unfortunately [9] -22:11, 22:21, 85:4, 147:28, 161:2, 161:5, 176:12, 178:18, 178:23

uniform [5] - 60:16,

60:29, 61:23, 61:24

unit [7] - 38:16, 38:29, 67:17, 99:2, 119:17, 124:28 Unit [1] - 60:24 units [2] - 61:2, 61:27 university [1] -119:16 unless [4] - 17:22, 20:14, 143:24, 178:21 unlike [1] - 140:4 unnamed [1] -158:22 unnecessary [1] -112:7 unsee [3] - 152:8, 155:7, 156:6 unsuccessful [1] -131:17 **UNTIL** [1] - 179:19 unturned [1] - 99:24 unusual [6] - 90:17, 93:5, 96:1, 96:29, 97:5, 116:17 up [67] - 6:15, 7:20, 11:16, 13:16, 13:21, 15:27, 20:7, 20:12, 24:13, 27:21, 28:29, 29:24, 32:3, 33:20, 34:18, 36:9, 36:16, 37:22, 41:1, 42:2, 43:25, 44:23, 45:5, 47:23, 52:13, 56:26, 57:12, 63:20, 63:21, 65:24. 85:9. 94:12. 96:16, 98:6, 100:3, 103:26, 103:29, 105:5, 108:14, 109:7, 111:27, 115:4, 124:11, 128:1, 131:17, 133:15, 134:26, 140:23, 143:1, 148:4, 148:16, 150:6, 151:18, 153:26, 156:13, 159:10, 166:10, 168:10, 170:1, 170:4, 171:1, 171:23, 171:29, 174:21, 175:14, 175:23, 177.29 up-to-date [3] -52:13, 156:13, 171:23 update [8] - 18:10,

45:2, 53:24

updating [1] - 131:6

upshot [1] - 91:26

useful [1] - 99:26

usefulness [1]
110:6

uses [1] - 32:28

utterly [1] - 83:29

V

vaguely [1] - 147:6

valuable [2] - 70:24,

vaguely [1] - 147:6 valuable [2] - 70:24, various [4] - 26:3, 27:6, 102:25, 107:9 vehicle [8] - 150:19, 150:20, 150:23, 152:19, 154:8, 154:17, 154:27, 155:1 vehicles [1] - 155:27 verbatim [1] - 1:25 versa [1] - 69:8 version [2] - 126:1, 137:25 via [2] - 22:6, 26:24 viability [2] - 109:12, 111:8 vice [1] - 69:8 **video** [3] - 130:11, 130:12, 133:6 view [13] - 12:18, 31:2, 43:2, 89:7, 110:14, 136:9, 148:2, 148:8, 148:13, 150:20, 155:10, 173:24, 175:26 views [1] - 13:9 visible [2] - 170:4, 173:12 visit [5] - 66:22, 81:28, 131:27, 157:14, 166:16 visited [1] - 161:4 visiting [1] - 149:23 visits [1] - 157:26 vital [5] - 42:7, 42:10, 80:3, 80:23 Volume [6] - 21:6, 34:19, 115:1, 125:28, 127:23, 145:11 volume [3] - 107:7, 125:15, 162:13 volumes [1] - 101:1 voluntarily [1] -116:16 **voluntary** [1] - 97:8

volunteer [1] -

139:25

4:4

volunteering [1] - 140:3

W

waited [1] - 86:25 walk [1] - 116:21 walked [1] - 111:14 Wallace [1] - 164:6 **WALSH** [5] - 5:3, 6:8, 25:19, 43:20, 54:10 **Walsh** [12] - 6:6, 24:18, 25:3, 36:10, 43:23, 53:16, 68:7, 71:8, 99:10, 130:21, 131:15 **Walsh...** [1] - 21:18 wants [3] - 40:20, 143:1, 145:22 warning [1] - 129:16 warrant [5] - 67:26, 84:18, 98:12, 106:17, 106:23 warrants [3] - 84:20. 84:23, 106:20 **WAS**[8] - 25:19, 43:20, 54:10, 60:3, 91:16, 104:15, 114:1, 119:2 Waterford [2] -100:10, 103:12 WEDNESDAY [1] -179 19 Wednesday [2] -66:24, 129:10 week [2] - 95:3, 171:14 weeks [6] - 11:18, 41:11, 92:10, 93:26, 100:26, 102:10 weight [2] - 74:11, 86.1 welcome [1] - 60:8 welfare [22] - 44:18, 44:28, 45:26, 47:7, 49:20, 50:2, 50:6, 50:16, 50:23, 51:1, 51:17, 52:11, 52:20, 52:25, 52:27, 52:28, 53:7, 53:12, 53:16, 158:25 WELLINGTON [1] west [1] - 119:29 Western [3] - 14:18, 140:5, 177:27 Westmeath [1] - 7:25 WESTMEATH[1] -

45:11, 46:16, 46:21,

156:19

49:17, 156:9, 156:12,

updated [3] - 156:16,

updates [3] - 44:19,

156:23, 172:20

120:13, 120:15, whatsoever [1] witnessed [3] -25:9 82:26, 88:10, 96:10 120:18, 154:25 WHEATLEY [1] - 3:4 witnesses [8] yesterday [23] - 6:15, 69:27, 78:24, 90:5, 6:17, 7:24, 10:27, whereabouts [1] -128:3 90:7, 113:5, 117:2, 10:29, 28:27, 28:29, 35:6, 35:23, 36:10, whilst [1] - 32:3 174:1, 175:15 wold [1] - 78:9 37:3, 39:26, 40:25, whistleblower [6] -40:28, 42:24, 43:26, 65:4, 65:19, 66:3, wonder [3] - 37:4, 45:29, 54:21, 57:23, 37:21, 145:21 155:3, 155:5, 164:8 **WHITE** [1] - 3:11 58:7, 66:11, 69:13, wondering [6] whole [4] - 8:24, 27:2, 70:19, 94:26, 166:12 117:22, 121:28, 155:19, 169:2, 178:11 yielded [1] - 89:23 176:26 word [7] - 8:6, 32:28, yourself [13] - 13:23, 70:18, 77:9, 78:27, window [2] - 150:16 33:18, 33:20, 61:18, 83:11, 88:10, 108:22, 114:24. 156:29 windscreen [1] -124:6, 125:5, 129:19, words [4] - 71:9, 154.14 139:20. 155:22. 88:3, 126:17, 178:24 wiped [8] - 71:19, 165:22 71:26, 71:27, 72:1, worker [4] - 29:13, yourselves[1] -75:10, 75:11, 131:5, 32:18, 33:10, 33:23 140:4 131:8 workplace [3] wise [1] - 148:15 46:14, 90:27, 161:3 € wish [8] - 48:3, works [1] - 143:28 49:26, 73:20, 80:6, worried [1] - 80:5 87:1, 100:8, 116:16, worry [2] - 61:10, **€20** [1] - 154:26 162:15 61:15 wished [7] - 67:4, write [3] - 69:8, É 81:12, 94:22, 94:28, 123:20, 143:29 130:12, 142:18, 160:2 writes [1] - 52:16 wishes [1] - 83:18 writing [6] - 7:19, **ÉABHALL**[1] - 2:30 11:21, 67:5, 142:23, wishing [1] - 108:17 **ÉIREANN** [2] - 1:4, with.. [1] - 78:28 143:2, 158:11 withdrawing [1] written [9] - 9:23, 18:9, 61:15, 79:18, 103:3 Ó withdrawn [1] -87:29, 134:1, 134:20, 150:22, 165:15 109:26 **Ó** [57] - 3:7, 7:3, WITHDREW [2] wrongdoing [1] -10:20, 12:4, 15:15, 59:25, 118:23 16:26, 25:2, 34:28, wrote [12] - 11:1, WITNESS [12] - 5:2, 35:10, 36:11, 37:9, 6:13, 20:19, 25:16, 51:5, 69:9, 69:16, 38:3, 39:16, 41:25, 76:14, 78:18, 82:28, 40:11, 43:8, 59:25, 42:7, 44:24, 45:8, 60:6, 91:10, 118:20, 102:26, 104:4, 46:3, 47:4, 47:29, 118:23, 119:5 135:25, 140:29, 49:15, 50:10, 51:29, witness [44] - 37:13, 170:10 52:5, 58:17, 62:8, 37:16, 37:22, 59:27, 63:10. 64:2. 64:10. X 68:4, 72:24, 74:28, 64:20, 65:3, 69:2, 75:17, 79:10, 79:11. 70:19, 73:26, 76:13, 80:13, 80:15, 80:17, x-ray [1] - 131:15 89:5, 103:28, 104:20, 80:22, 81:10, 81:13, 104:21, 112:20, 86:3, 87:18, 90:3, 120:21, 120:22, Υ 90:12, 90:14, 90:20, 121:21, 122:2, 122:4, 92:9, 92:18, 92:21, 122:15, 123:18, 95:21, 96:25, 97:17, year [12] - 28:2, 125:6. 139:3. 139:20. 101:10, 104:26, 40:17, 40:18, 41:9, 140:21, 145:20, 105:12, 106:22, 61:9, 61:25, 101:8, 156:22, 156:25, 110:17, 111:6, 119:12, 119:18, 162:9, 162:16, 178:15 111:10, 114:16, 119:20, 119:26, 120:1 118:1, 118:11, years [14] - 41:12, 118:25, 169:26, 41:21, 60:20, 60:22, 169:27, 173:3, 60:27, 61:6, 61:12, 175:12, 177:19 61:28, 100:22,