TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE

ON THURSDAY, 13TH FEBRUARY 2020 - DAY 138

138

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

## **APPEARANCES**

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

**REGI STRAR:** MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL:

MR. DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. SINÉAD McGRATH BL

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY & GARDA DAVID TURNER:

MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

**FOR** COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANIAN 10. 11. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN 13. SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16. 16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR. CHI EF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARI E CAGNEY DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON 30. INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY 31. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN 32. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN 33. 34. SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 35. 36. 37. SHANE MURPHY SC MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC MR. MR. MR.

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE\_\_\_\_

INSTRUCTED BY:

LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL MR. PAUL CONNELLAN T&N MCLYNN FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

BASTION COURT 11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

**ATHLONE** 

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O' ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE

INSTRUCTED BY:

DUBLIN 2

FOR GARDA TOM HIGGINS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. TOM POWER BL
MR. NOEL McCARTAN
McCARTAN & BURKE SOLICITORS
ICELAND HOUSE
33-34 ARRAN QUAY
SMITHFIELD

DUBLIN 7

## INDEX

VI TNESS	PAGE
FORMER ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN	
DTRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN	6

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON THURSDAY, 13TH	
2			FEBRUARY 2020:	
3				
4			CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Marrinan.	
5			MR. MARRINAN: The next witness is former Acting	10:32
6			Commissioner Donal Ó Cualáin.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
8				
9			FORMER ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN, HAVING BEEN	_
10			SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. MARRINAN, AS	10:33
11			FOLLOWS:	
12				
13			THE WITNESS: Donal Ó Cualáin.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Good morning, commissioner. Thank you.	
15	1	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think you have set out your history in	10:33
16			An Garda Síochána at page 7307 of the material. I will	
17			just go through it, because that is how we have dealt	
18			with every other witness up until now.	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	2	Q.	If we scroll down there to line 16. Your first	10:33
21			assignment was to Donnybrook Garda station in 1983,	
22			that was following your attestation, isn't that right?	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	3	Q.	I think you were there until 1987, when you were	
25			transferred to the Garda Headquarters Technical Bureau	10:34
26			and you had an administrative function for	
27			approximately a year and they were advertising for the	
28			Garda college staff under a new training regime	
29			outlined in the Walsh report. I think that you wanted	

_			at that time to broaden your experience and decrued to	
2			go to Templemore and spent four years, from 1988 to	
3			1992, in the Garda college. I think you were promoted	
4			to sergeant rank in the Irish section. Then you	
5			transferred from the college to Galway west division	10:34
6			and then transferred to the Aran islands?	
7		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
8	4	Q.	I think there was a vacancy in the in-service school	
9			and you were successful in your application for that	
10			and you went back to Galway city in that function,	10:35
11			where you spent another year, and in 1994 you were	
12			promoted to the rank of inspector and you were	
13			transferred to Ballyshannon?	
14		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
15	5	Q.	I think then you point out that under a then recently	10:35
16			published Garda Corporate Strategy, an organisation	
17			development unit was proposed and you transferred to	
18			Garda headquarters in late 1994 to assist in the	
19			establishment of that unit. I think in 1996 the	
20			organisation itself was broken into six regions and an	10:35
21			assistant commissioner was put in charge of each region	
22			and you transferred to the western regional office and	
23			you worked there for a number of years, isn't that	
24			right?	
25		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	10:36
26	6	Q.	I think that you were promoted to superintendent and	
27			you spent two and a half years in Donegal at that time,	
28			is that correct?	
29		Α.	That's correct.	

1	7	Q.	In 2002 you went to Ennistimon district in County Clare	
2			and then back to Galway city as superintendent in 2003.	
3			You were promoted to chief superintendent rank in 2006	
4			and you spent a short time in Mayo and then in Sligo,	
5			before returning to the Galway division at the end of	10:30
6			2006. I think you were chief superintendent for a	
7			number of years, until you were promoted again to	
8			assistant commissioner in 2012. And your first	
9			allocation as assistant commissioner was to the	
10			Southern Region, but you transferred back to the	10:3
11			Western Region in late 2011 you have here, but that	
12			must be	
13		Α.	That's 2012.	
14	8	Q.	2012. Yes. I think when former Commissioner Nóirín	

O'Sullivan was assigned at that time as interim

at deputy commissioner level. You say:

18

19

20

21

26

27

15

16

17

"In July 2014, I was directed by the Commissioner to take charge in an administration capacity of the strategy and change management portfolio."

commissioner in March of 2014, there were two vacancies

10:37

10:37

22232425

- A. That's correct, for the lion's share of that portfolio, there was another aspect that was given to another assistant commissioner. And the other vacancy, which was for deputy commissioner operations, that portfolio was filled by a colleague of mine, Assistant Commissioner John Twomey at the time, yes.
- 9 Q. So you took up that responsibility in July 2014, some three months after the protected disclosure of Garda

1	Keogh,	isn't	that	right?

- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 10 Q. How much of an additional responsibility was this for you?
- 5 Well, I was already running a region and that involved, 10:38 Α. 6 I suppose, the implementation of a Commissioner's 7 policing plan for the Western Region and the proper 8 management of both, all criminal investigation and the administration of that region behalf of the 9 So I didn't lose any of that 10 Commissioner. 10:38 11 responsibility but I took on another chunk of work, 12 which was at a more strategic level in An Garda 13 Síochána, at a time of huge change, where there was --14 our Commissioner of the day had embarked on a very 15 ambitious change programme, which most of it would have 10:39 16 fallen to my side of the house in the context of 17 planning for that and getting the financial approval to 18 ensure that we could make the requisite investment in 19 some of the areas that we had become wanting in by some 20 of the problems that had arisen around that time and 10:39 before that time with regard to, say, our computer 21 22 systems, IT, etcetera.
- 23 11 Q. Yes.
- A. So there was lots of work and that was in addition to the normal, I suppose, responsibilities of that time, which was not insignificant in the context of running an organisation of over 16,000 people.
- 28 12 Q. That is a reference to the controversy in relation to the penalty points system?

2 were in around the same time, which in effect, you know, in order to address the issues that caused all of 3 that, we needed to look at root and branch, our 4 5 processes in relation to different matters and ensure 10:40 6 that we got investment in the required areas to, I 7 suppose, future proof those areas. And that took a 8 number of years to, I suppose, plan for, because it was very ambitious. One of the most ambitious change plans 9 ever implemented in An Garda Síochána. 10 That was 10 · 40 11 launched in 2016, but from the time I went to Garda 12 Headquarters in that acting capacity, as it were, a lot 13 of my days were spent -- what I used to do was, maybe I 14 would leave home in Galway on Monday morning, I would 15 go to my Galway office, deal with aspects in relation 10:40 16 to the Western Region on the morning of the first day, travel to Dublin later that day, I would spend Tuesday, 17 18 Wednesday and Thursday in my Dublin office and then 19 return to Galway on Friday morning and spend Friday in Galway. That was generally my pattern of work for the 20 10:41 following year. 21 22 I suppose there were a number of controversies that 13 Q. 23 arose in 2014 concerning An Garda Síochána, not merely 24 the penalty points issue.

The penalty points and breathalyser test, all of that

- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 14 Q. But in January we know that former Commissioner Martin
  27 Callinan had made some comments --
- 28 A. That's correct.

1

Α.

29 15 Q. -- before the Public Accounts Committee that gave rise

1			to disquiet and concern. And another issue arose at	
2			the end of March that caused him to retire, isn't that	
3			right?	
4		Α.	Yes, that's correct. Yes.	
5	16	Q.	What impact did those public controversies have on	10:4
6			members of An Garda Síochána in the higher ranks, as it	
7			were?	
8		Α.	Well, it was a hugely busy time and it was very much in	
9			the public gaze or the public eye.	
10	17	Q.	Yes.	10:4
11		Α.	We had lots of outings to different Dáil committees,	
12			the Justice Committee, the Accounts Committee, at which	
13			were called to account in relation to the different	
14			matters that had become controversial, as well as the	
15			normal day-to-day management of An Garda Síochána and	10:4
16			other issues. So it was a very busy time for everyone	
17			involved. But it didn't remove at the time the	
18			responsibility and the onus to ensure that, you know,	
19			the responsibilities that I had in Galway had to still	
20			be delivered.	10:4
21	18	Q.	Yes.	
22		Α.	In the context of my appointment to do the CR	
23			investigation, that wasn't unusual in the context of	
24			assistant commissioners around the country. There	
25			would always be something on your table in addition to	10:4
26			what your day job was, whether it be some	
27			investigation. And the Commissioner of the day would	

28

29

deal those jobs out on the basis of, you know, making

sure it was fairly distributed as well as, you know,

1	that	nobody	was	getting	an	unfair	slice	of	the	work
2	that	was be	ing 🤉	given out						

- 3 19 Q. I think you continue on and say in early 2015 the 4 deputy commissioner role was advertised and you applied 5 for that and you were successful. You were assigned by 10:43 the Commissioner to the strategy and change management 6 7 I think you were there in that function full-time. 8 position until September 2017. You would have been acting commissioner for Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan, 9 who was on leave during that period of time, and during 10:43 10 11 the summer of 2017 you were also acting commissioner 12 from mid July until the end of August. 13 Commissioner returned in early September and shortly 14 after that she retired. You were then asked by the 15 government to take on the role of acting commissioner 10:44 16 and you agreed. You were then heading up the 17 organisation, isn't that right?
- 18 A. That's correct, Judge.
- 19 20 Q. I think it took a year to fill the role permanently, at
   20 which point you retired?

10.44

- 21 A. That's correct, Chairman.
- 22 21 Q. Obviously one of the matters that became somewhat 23 controversial in 2014 and, indeed, were the 24 subject-matter of remarks by former Commissioner 25 Callinan, was in relation to how An Garda Síochána
- viewed whistleblowers, to use that rather inelegant
  description, but nevertheless, that was the issue that
- 28 arose, isn't that right?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 22 Q. In actual fact, An Garda Síochána had prior to that put 2 in place a charter, isn't that right?
- A. That's correct, Chair. I know that as early as 2008, I think, arising out of that legislation that I was actually nominated as a confidential recipient on behalf of the organisation. There would be one picked in each region I think at the time. I never got any calls in that capacity.
- 9 23 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. But I was appointed by the Commissioner sometime, it 10:45
  11 could have been around 2010 or '11, to investigate a matter that was from a confidential reporter.
- 13 24 Q. Yes. There were a number of appointments to that role
  14 as confidential recipient under the 2007 Act, most of
  15 chief superintendent rank?
- 16 A. They were all of chief superintendent rank, I think
  17 there may have been some civilians as well at that
  18 level appointed. And, of course, there was a the
  19 confidential recipient, the judge at the time, who
  20 would have been our -- you know Judge McMahon was in
  21 that role.
- 22 25 Q. Yes, he took on that role?
- A. Yes. But there was also a confidential recipient in
  each of the regions, so that gave a choice to the
  individual gardaí as to where they wanted to go with
  their complaint.
- 27 26 Q. Perhaps we will just briefly have a look at the charter 28 that was then in place. If we perhaps in the first 29 instance look at page 7843. This is addressed to each

1			member and civilian employee of An Garda Síochána and	
2			is from the Assistant Commissioner Walter Rice. If you	
3			just scroll down to the third paragraph, he says:	
4				
5			"The Charter has been developed in line with the Garda	10:47
6			policy of encouraging ethical behaviour within An Garda	
7			Síochána and in compliance with the Garda (confidential	
8			reporting of corruption or malpractice) regulations	
9			2007.	
10				10:47
11			There already exists an obligation on members of An	
12			Garda Síochána to report criminal or suspect activity	
13			on the part of any person, including a member or	
14			civilian member of An Garda Síochána."	
15				10:48
16			I think that is a matter that may be lost in relation	
17			to some of these matters. There is actually an	
18			obligation on each member and civilian member to report	
19			any wrongdoing, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	Of course, but maybe what didn't exist previously was	10:48
21			this safety net or protection for the individual.	
22	27	Q.	Indeed.	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	28	Q.	Then it says:	
25				10:48
26			"The aim of this Charter is to create an environment in	
27			which members and civilian staff members are encouraged	
28			to report incidents of corruption or malpractice."	
29				

1			Isn't that right?	
2		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
3	29	Q.	Then if we just turn over to the Charter itself, it's	
4			at page the introduction, foreword is at page 7845	
5			of the material. We see there the foreword that is	10:48
6			penned by former Commissioner Fachtna Murphy and if we	
7			scroll down to the last three lines of that, we see:	
8				
9			"The aim of this charter is to create an environment in	
10			which sworn members and civilian employees are	10:49
11			encouraged to report incidents of corruption or	
12			mal practi ce. "	
13				
14			Then if we can perhaps just look at some of the	
15			relevant sections of it and we go to page 7847, under	10:49
16			the introduction there we see, three lines down:	
17				
18			"Its purpose is to provide mechanisms to bring genuine	
19			concerns or allegations of corruption and/or	
20			mal practice within An Garda Síochána to notice at the	10:49
21			earliest possible opportunity without fear of	
22			victimisation or reprisal."	
23				
24			Those two matters, I suppose, would be the principal	
25			barriers to somebody coming forward and disclosing what	10:50
26			they believe is wrongdoing, would that be right?	
27		Α.	Yeah. I'd agree with that, Chairman. It takes a lot	
28			of courage from an individual, you know, to stand up	
29			and shout out something that they see as a wrongdoing	

1			by one of their colleagues and on that basis, yes, I	
2			agree with what you said.	
3	30	Q.	If we go on to page 7849 then of the Charter:	
4				
5			"Duties of commissioner.	10:50
6				
7			The duties of the Garda Commissioner and any persons	
8			acting on his behalf include: Taking all practicable	
9			steps to ensure that the identity of a confidential	
10			reporter is not disclosed other than in strict	10:50
11			accordance with the criteria in regulation 9(2)."	
12				
13			There is an exception in regulation 9(2), but we	
14			needn't go into that, because it doesn't arise in this	
15			particular instance. But that's a matter that we might	10:51
16			return to.	
17				
18			"Examining each report transmitted by a confidential	
19			recipient; investigating or causing to be investigated	
20			all allegations other than those found upon examination	10:51
21			to be false, frivolous or vexatious, or to have been	
22			made in bad faith."	
23				
24			If we then move on to page 7850 of the material, under	
25			"employee safety" at number 6 there:	10:51
26				
27			"The Commissioner is committed to ensure that any	
28			member or civilian employee in An Garda Síochána who	
29			raises genuine concerns or allegations of corruption or	

1			malpractice under the charter will not be at risk of	
2			losing their employment or suffering any form of	
3			retribution as a result.	
4				
5			Harassment or victimisation of confidential reporters	10:52
6			who have raised genuine concerns or allegations of	
7			corruption or malpractice is contrary to the Garda	
8			Síochána (Discipline) Regulations 2007 and the civil	
9			service disciplinary code revised in accordance with	
10			the Civil Service Regulations (Amendment) Act 2006 and	10:52
11			the criminal law."	
12				
13			Isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
15	31	Q.	It then deals with some other matters concerning the	10:52
16			nature and how reporting is done. The general thrust	
17			of this would appear to be two primary objectives;	
18			first of all, to keep the identity of the confidential	
19			reporter confidential, isn't that right?	
20		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	10:53
21	32	Q.	I suppose that's is to prevent any form of retribution	
22			or perhaps targeting of him that may take place?	
23		Α.	Well, it would assist in that regard, of course.	
24	33	Q.	Yes, it would. In this particular instance, and we	
25			will come to deal with the disclosure that was made on	10:53
26			the 8th May, it had become public knowledge as a result	
27			of the confidential reporter giving information to	
28			Deputy Flanagan, isn't that right?	
29		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	

- 1 34 Q. On the 8th May were you aware of the broadcast or were 2 you made aware of the broadcast of the information that 3 was disclosed in Dáil Éireann?
- A. I can't say when exactly I became aware, but having been appointed on the 9th May by the then interim commissioner, I would have got that file the following week. I am sure as I went through it that, you know, what was going on in the media would have resonated at that stage, but I was definitely aware of it early on after my appointment, yes.

10:54

- 11 35 Q. Did you have any view before you embarked on this as to 12 the appropriateness of Garda Keogh going to a member of 13 Dáil Éireann, of the Dáil and disclosing this 14 information?
- 15 A. Well, Chairman, he was quite entitled to do that under 10:5 16 the Act.
- 17 36 Q. Yes.
- 18 I would never second guess anyone's reasons for taking Α. 19 action. As I said earlier, it takes a whole lot of 20 courage for an individual member of any organisation to 10:54 stand up and call out what they see as maybe low 21 22 standards or corruption or malpractice or whatever it 23 might be. On that basis, I would never question any 24 actions that a confidential reporter would take or 25 protected disclosure, a person going a protected 10:55 26 disclosure, in order to highlight the issues that they 27 feel need to be highlighted.
- 28 37 Q. But he was also invoking the protected disclosures 29 procedure and yet his identity was known?

_		Α.	werr, that 3 correct, charrillan. Tou know, that does	
2			cause practical difficulties.	
3	38	Q.	Yes.	
4		Α.	But, I mean, the difficulties were mine. They	
5			shouldn't be visited on the confidential reporter. He	10:55
6			has done his duty by doing what he did. It's up to me	
7			to manage then what I had been told to do within the	
8			confines of the law and ensure that what I had been	
9			asked to do is done to the letter of the law.	
10	39	Q.	If we just then move on to the specifics. On the 9th	10:55
11			May, if we could have page 3969 up on the screen	
12			please. This is the letter of appointment dated 9th	
13			May.	
14				
15			"The attached correspondence from"	10:56
16				
17			Have you got it there? Yes.	
18				
19			"Attached correspondence from Judge Patrick McMahon, An	
20			Garda Síochána confidential recipient, is forwarded for	10:56
21			your information and attention.	
22				
23			Please carry out a thorough investigation into all the	
24			issues raised by the confidential recipient and let me	
25			have a comprehensive report on the matter.	10:56
26				
27			Your report should reach this office no later than the	
28			9th June. Where delays are encountered, an interim	
29			report should be submitted setting out progress to date	

and reasons for delays encountered."

2

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

Α.

I think that deadline that was set in the first instance just simply wasn't achievable. But in terms of the request from the Commissioner there in relation to the investigation, could you just tell us what you envisaged at that time? Because there seems to be -- you certainly draw a distinction in your interview with our investigators in relation to what you describe as a fact-finding investigation, a criminal investigation and then a disciplinary investigation. So could you just assist the Chairman in relation to the difference between those three, please?

10:57

10:57

10:57

10:58

10:58

28

29

Of course, Chairman. First of all, I would say that when I got this correspondence from the Commissioner, it would have been in the week beginning the 12th May, I would have studied it closely. It was not unusual in the event that complaints were made, and that can be without recourse to the PD system at all, but not in the normal course, where wrongdoing is highlighted, that it would be important to establish first what you're dealing with in the context of: Is this criminal? Is it a disciplinary matter? Is it either or is it both? And when the file arrived to me, I can't -- I don't know what the Commissioner's office actually did with it, but I don't think they would have gone into reading the affidavit in any great detail. They would have immediately said, this is something that needs to go and we need to appoint someone to look at this. On that basis, the early date that was given of course was not a realistic date. But I understood that, because I knew that within a month I'd be able to give the Commissioner some indication as to what I was dealing with. At some point further down the line, given how successful our investigation was going, that I could make a call on whether or not it was A, B or A plus B, as I just mentioned in relation to criminal or disciplinary etcetera, or either.

10:58

10:59

10:59

11:00

So I was aware, having read the affidavit, that there were some very serious allegations being made, I knew that I had to immediately set about getting a serious team put together to look at these matters, because they were not insignificant in the level of seriousness that they indicated. And that's what I set about doing immediately.

Having read carefully the affidavit that Garda Keogh had provided, through the judge, then having studied again and refreshed my memory in relation to the regulations and charter and legislation surrounding all of this, and then setting about getting a team together to look into all of these matters. I viewed it so seriously that I called in the most experienced detectives I had available to me in the Western Region in order to initiate those enquiries for me. You have already heard from former detective superintendent Declan Mulcahy, who I appointed as my senior

1 investigating officer. He was at that stage the senior 2 detective in my region, responsible for all investigation of serious crime in the Western Region, 3 not just in Galway but right across the region. 4 5 set about getting assistance for him and I knew that I 11:00 6 had at my disposal in my own, in the -- I suppose in 7 the station in which I resided, Detective Inspector 8 Michael Coppinger, who I had worked with previously at different ranks. I knew that he was someone that would 9 10 be, you know, of the right calibre to put into that 11:00 11 team. I then asked both of them to attend a meeting 12 with me on the following Thursday 13 40 Yes. Q. 14 Α. which was I think the 12th -- or the 15th, was it? 15 Yeah. 11:01 16 I don't want to interrupt you, but if we could just go 41 Q. back and we will come back to that? 17 18 Yeah. Α. 19 42 But we were just dealing with the difference between --Q. 20 Α. Sure. 11:01 21 -- the investigations. A fact-finding investigation, a 43 Q. 22 criminal investigation and a disciplinary 23 investigation. 24 Yes. Α. 25 And just to deal with the disciplinary investigation as 11:01 44 0. compared to the fact-finding and the criminal 26 27 investigation. 28 Okay. Well, the fact-finding is there to establish Α. what you are dealing with. Is it criminal? 29

- 1 have disciplinary aspects to it? If it is a member of 2 An Garda Síochána that allegations of criminality are 3 made against, there is an automatic assumption that you are going to have discipline at some stage in the 4 5 process. Or, it could be just discipline alone? When 11:01 you look at what you're trying to establish, that you 6 7 know, well, there's no criminal aspect here but there 8 is lots of discipline and we need to appoint someone to
- 10 45 Q. That's the important thing. If you conducted a fact-finding or criminal investigation, you then make a recommendation in relation to disciplinary matters that may have arisen from that investigation and that is then handed over to somebody else, is that right?
- 15 A. If I could assist the Tribunal. You know, at the outset you're looking at a bald statement.
- 17 46 Q. CHAIRMAN: What have we got here?

look at the discipline.

- 18 A. Yeah, what have we got? So you have to establish what 19 you're dealing with.
- 20 47 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, that's the fact-finding part, is it?

11:02

- 21 A. It is, but you have to start on the basis that it's a 22 criminal matter.
- 23 48 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes

9

- A. So that all the work you do doesn't come to naught when
  you do establish it's a criminal matter, that all the
  work you've done will stand up to the rigour of that
  particular --
- 28 49 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes. So the default --
- 29 A. The default, yes.

- 1 50 Q. CHAIRMAN: The default position is that it's is a
- 2 criminal matter?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 51 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, Mr. Marrinan. But it may turn
- out to be, I mean just in general terms, it may turn

11:03

11:03

11:03

11.03

- 6 out to be not a criminal matter.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 52 Q. CHAIRMAN: It is really a disciplinary matter.
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 53 Q. CHAIRMAN: In which case you can go down that road?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 13 54 Q. MR. MARRINAN: I don't think the mere fact that it's a
- 14 fact-finding investigation is going to prevent you from
- availing of your legislation in relation to the
- investigation of offences, isn't that right?
- 17 A. Oh absolutely not. As I say, we're dealing with it as
- a criminal investigation until such time that we
- 19 establish that it's not.
- 20 55 Q. CHAIRMAN: That it's is not.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 56 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Absolutely. Well, what I am really
- 23 trying to test, there isn't really a stamp on the
- investigation saying this is only fact-finding. If
- 25 something arose during the course of that, a side
- issue, for example, that may have given rise to some
- 27 form of criminality --
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 57 Q. -- you can then use your powers perhaps of search or

- otherwise in relation to it if you have a reasonable suspicion arising out of your investigation up to there to pursue that matter?
- A. What I would say, Chairman, is: Once you reach a certain threshold in the fact-finding phase, as it were, you would look for formal appointment. And the reason this is important is, the person who does the criminal investigation could never be appointed to do the discipline. And there's case law on that.

11:04

- 10 58 Q. Yes.
  - 11 Like, your prior knowledge of a case and you're doing a Α. 12 criminal investigation and there are disciplinary 13 aspects arising at the end of that criminal 14 investigation, the discipline would have to be given to 15 another person who has nothing to do with the criminal 11:04 16 investigation that just concluded. And that's so that 17 he would remain objective in the context of both 18 investigations. So that's an important point to raise 19 at this juncture. And that's why you would seek to 20 have appointments made at certain junctures so that you 11:04 can continue. I did that at a certain point when I 21 22 felt that that threshold was reached. I did look for 23 formal appointments to be made. But the work that was 24 done up until then wasn't lost in the context of a 25 criminal investigation and even from a disciplinary 11:05 point of view, in that all of the statements that were 26 27 taken during that phase would have been taken on the 28 basis that the witnesses making them would have been 29 told that this particular statement can be used in

- either a criminal or disciplinary.
- 2 59 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. So that that meant when a discipline file began that
- 4 they didn't have to be -- that those witnesses didn't
- 5 have to be re-interviewed for what they had just put in 11:05
- 6 their statements.
- 7 60 Q. As part of your letter of appointment you were provided
- 8 with the affidavit of Garda Keogh.
- 9 61 Q. CHAIRMAN: Could I just ask for a second, Mr. Marrinan,
- would you mind obviously, we start off with the default 11:05
- option, it's a criminal investigation unless it's
- 12 established otherwise.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 62 Q. CHAIRMAN: And you proceed. And I understand that you
- say at a certain point, a threshold of cogency or
- whatever, there's a certain amount of material that may

11:06

11:06

- be evidence or may not be assembled, and you look for a
- formal appointment. Suppose the officer didn't look
- for a formal appointment, would it continue as a
- 20 criminal investigation?
- 21 A. Yes. It wouldn't affect the criminal side as such.
- 22 Just I sought clarity on what the Commissioner's
- view -- what should happen. That was all it was.
- 24 63 Q. CHAIRMAN: I follow. It's sort of seeking clarity.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 64 Q. CHAIRMAN: But it's not a legally decisive point --
- A. No, it's not.
- 28 65 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- that would impact on the nature of the
- investigation. If it's a criminal investigation, it

1			starts and that's the assumption and it continues right	
2			until to the end?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	66	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But you would look for this formal	
5			appointment to keep everything in order; is that right?	11:07
6		Α.	That's correct. And also to ensure that the	
7			distinction between criminal and discipline were	
8			separated at that juncture.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you very much. Sorry	
10			Mr. Marrinan. I am glad to have that clarification.	11:07
11	67	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: I think that the affidavit accompanied	
12			the letter, and that's at page 3971 of the material. I	
13			don't intend to go through this. But you obviously	
14			studied the affidavit quite carefully, isn't that	
15			right?	11:07
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	68	Q.	And there are serious complaints there?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	69	Q.	And substantial complaints in relation to policing in	
20			Athlone?	11:07
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	70	Q.	I suppose one of the things that you would have to	
23			establish fairly early on was, was this a bona fide	
24			disclosure, isn't that right?	
25		Α.	Yes, of course. Now, I think, sorry, Chairman, the	11:08
26			bona fides bit, at that stage we're back to the	
27			Commissioner. I think the charter was clear that, you	
28			know, the Commissioner's functions were to establish	
29			whether this was vexatious I forget the exact	

1 But once I received this, I took it as read 2 that this was a bona fide case that needed 3 investigation. 4 71 Q. CHAI RMAN: And I think the 2014 Act, the Protected 5 Disclosure Act makes that a statutory presumption. 11:08 6 Yes. Α. 7 72 CHAI RMAN: I think. I may be wrong. Q. 8 Yes. Α. No, that's correct. It hadn't come into 9 73 MR. MARRINAN: Q. 10 force at that stage. So the position then, can you 11 · 08 11 just tell us in relation to Garda Keogh, did you cause 12 any background checks to be made in relation to him 13 before you went to see him? 14 Α. No, did I not. As a normal course in major 15 investigations, that would be a job, an early job that 11:08 16 the complainant -- that some background would be done 17 on the complainant. 18 74 Right. Q. 19 However, I felt it would not be prudent to do that in Α. 20 this case because he was a confidential reporter and I 11:08 said to the team that we weren't going to do that. 21 22 75 Now I think that, as you have already indicated, Q. 23 you appointed Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. A 24 letter of appointment dated 15th May is at 3973. 25 That's addressed to both Detective Superintendent 11 . 09 26 Mulcahy and Detective Inspector Michael Coppinger.

27

28

29

you have given the reason for appointing them. Then

there's a further appointment that takes place in

relation to the team on 25th June of 2014. We will

1 look at it, it's 3974. We are jumping a little bit 2 ahead here, but it may well be that in relation to the 3 point that you wish to make in relation to the quality of personnel that you had assigned to this? 4

5 Yes. Α. 11:10

6 76 Q. This is from Detective Superintendent Mulcahy to you 7 and we see there that Detective Sergeant Paudie O'Shea 8 is appointed and Sergeant Gerry Cleary, Detective Sergeant Tom waters and Detective Sergeant Kevin 9 Can you say anything in relation -- first of 10 11:10 11 all, they're all detective branch and they're all 12 sergeants. Can you say anything in relation to the 13 quality of the personnel that were being appointed?

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Α. Of course. I had two challenges here, Chairman, at the outset. All of these were very busy people in relation 11:10 to crime investigation in any case. I wanted to get the best team. I gave that job to the detective superintendent, to pick a team that he would have known of their back records and their experience, but I also asked him to try and spread the load as best he could across the region, rather than just having all of them coming from one division, which would have left them challenged to deal with the day-to-day business of crime investigation. So on that basis, you know, we picked our team and I would have contacted the chief superintendents involved and told them that that was my intention, to bring them into the team.

11:11

11:11

I think that if we could just go back then to the 15th 28 77 Q. 29 May, if we could have page 3975 up on the screen, this

1			is a letter to Garda Keogh that you wrote:	
2				
3			"I wish to inform you that I have been appointed by the	
4			Commissioner to investigate all the issues raised by	
5			you in your sworn affidavit to the confidential	11:11
6			reci pi ent.	
7				
8			With a view to progressing my investigation, I would	
9			appreciate it if you could contact me in early course."	
10				11:12
11			There's a phone call the same day, is that right?	
12		Α.	That's right, yes. I managed to get a phone number for	
13			Garda Keogh, but I still put it in writing, the	
14			request. And the purpose of the call was to introduce	
15			myself to him and to let him know what I was assigned	11:12
16			to do by the Commissioner and to look for an	
17			opportunity to meet with him in early course to get a	
18			statement, a detailed statement from him in relation to	
19			all the issues that he had.	
20	78	Q.	If we could just perhaps look at Garda Keogh's entry in	11:12
21			relation to this first interaction that he had with	
22			you. It's at page 13256, if we put that up on the	
23			screen. It's on the right-hand side. There is an	
24			entry on the left-hand side, I will ask you to deal	
25			with this. Judge McMahon dealt with it.	11:13
26				
27			"Informed judge I'm not happy with AC appointed."	
28				
29			Then there is something about friendship with chief.	

1 CHAI RMAN: Just roll that down. 2 If you just scroll down. MR. MARRINAN: 3 CHAI RMAN: Sorry, that's all right. 4 79 MR. MARRINAN: Do you see there: 0. 5 11:13 6 "Informed judge I'm not happy with AC appointed due to 7 friendship with chief." 8 9 Do you see that? I do. 10 Α. 11:13 11 80 Q. I think Judge McMahon's evidence was and, indeed, Garda 12 Keogh's evidence was in accordance with it, that he 13 said at AC level that you would know most people in the 14 higher ranks in An Garda Síochána. But just to remove 15 any suggestion that there was a particular friendship 11:14 in relation to you and Chief Superintendent Curran? 16 Chief Curran? 17 Α. 18 81 Q. Yes. 19 well, as you laid out my bio earlier in relation to --Α. 20 I served in all four provinces, I served in a lot of 21 different divisions in the districts. I probably would 22 know a lot more people than some of my colleagues here 23 in Dublin, who would have served most of their careers 24 within the pale, as it were. 25 82 Q. Yes. 11:14 So I would have had a working relationship with many 26 Α. 27 officers right throughout the country. 28 83 Yes? Q. I don't think I ever served with Chief Curran. 29 I think Α.

Τ			ne was essentially Dublin based. So I wouldn't have	
2			known chief Curran at all.	
3	84	Q.	Well it's not a matter that is being pursued by Garda	
4			Keogh in any event, but it was a matter that was	
5			apparently in his mind at the time.	11:15
6		Α.	Right.	
7	85	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Were you friendly with him, I mean in the	
8			sense of being friends?	
9		Α.	No.	
10	86	Q.	CHAIRMAN: In other words, above and beyond colleagues?	11:15
11		Α.	No. No. I got to know him later on, in the last	
12			because he works in the Commissioner's office at some	
13			stage.	
14	87	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Yes, that's right.	
15		Α.	That's when I	11:15
16			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
17	88	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: But certainly at that time there was no	
18			friendship there. Then if we look across and scroll up	
19			to the entry on the 15th, you see:	
20				11:15
21			"AC contacts me. He says I understand there is another	
22			matter."	
23				
24			I think that arose out of the letter of Judge McMahon,	
25			isn't that right?	11:15
26				
27			"I say it's far more serious than what's in the	
28			affidavit and we have a job to do."	

- So that is his note. Do you recall him or that issue arising?
- A. Oh yes. There was a few calls I know in the early stages, first of all in order to establish contact and then actually Garda Keogh, when I introduced myself, you know, he was anxious to get across that there was a lot of other issues.
- 8 89 Q. Yeah.
- 9 A. And that's when I would have told him, look it, that's
  10 why we need to sit down with you and get a proper 11:16
  11 statement of all the issues that you have to tell us
  12 about, and tried to make an appointment at which that
  13 could be done.
- 90 Q. Did you discuss with him at that stage or at all the fact that he had gone public in relation to his allegations?
- 17 There was some meeting, it wasn't at that stage, it was Α. 18 much later, where we were dealing with some of the 19 issues that he raised by letter to the detective 20 superintendent and where I would have told him, you know, your name is in the public domain but we're not 21 22 responsible for that. We have maintained your confidentiality within our team, and we hadn't talked 23 24 to anybody in relation to it. But obviously, if his 25 name was in the public domain it had to come through 26 some other avenue and I just explained that to him. 27 And he was very happy to say that he was -- that he didn't have any issue with our team in relation to 28 29 that.

11:17

- 91 Q. We know from the evidence that Garda Keogh appears to have been quite open in relation to the fact that he had made a confidential report. We know from his sergeant, Sergeant Haran, that he suggested that perhaps he speak to his unit.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 92 Q. And he spoke to other members of his unit. He didn't disclose the nature of the allegation or against whom it was made.
- 10 A. Yes.

11:18

11:18

11 · 19

- 11 93 Q. Except for in an intelligence entry that he put on
  12 Pulse. We will come to that in due course. But we
  13 also know from the evidence of other people who have
  14 given evidence to the Tribunal, that it was generally
  15 known that Garda Keogh had made these allegations.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 94 Q. And, indeed, that Garda A was certainly the subject-matter of those allegations as well?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 95 Q. I suppose because of the nature of the investigation, 21 that was bound to come out in any event within Athlone 22 Garda Station. But during this contact that you had 23 with him on the 15th May, did you make enquiries as to 24 whether he was still on duty, that he was still

performing his normal duties in Athlone Garda Station?

- A. No, I didn't go into that at all. The purpose of my
- call was essentially to introduce myself.
- 28 96 Q. Yes.

25

29 A. I felt that any business we had to do had to happen

1			face-to-face.	
2	97	Q.	Yes.	
3		Α.	It was essentially just to introduce myself and make an	
4			appointment at which we could meet. That was the	
5			purpose of the call. Or the calls, as it happened to	11:19
6			be, a few calls had to be made.	
7	98	Q.	Yes. On that day, on the 15th?	
8		Α.	No, between the 15th and the day that we actually	
9			managed to meet, it was June the 7th, I think.	
10	99	Q.	There's another entry on the 19th May, at 13257. This	11:19
11			is the 19th May and this reads:	
12				
13			"Inspector Farrell asks me to change part of an	
14			intelligence entry."	
15				11:20
16			He says no, but he says then:	
17				
18			"I will speak to AC and ask re informant."	
19				
20			Do you recall in around that time having a conversation	11:21
21			with Garda Keogh in relation to this issue of the entry	
22			on Pulse?	
23		Α.	No, Chairman, I don't. But I was aware, I did become	
24			aware of it. Whether it was during a conversation with	
25			Garda Keogh, I'm not sure.	11:21
26	100	Q.	If we could just then look at another entry, at 13258,	
27			this is the 27th May. If we look there:	
28				
29			"Garda A into public office, humming. I walked out."	

1				
2			And then he says:	
3				
4			"I spoke with AC to say I wanted movement on the case."	
5				11:21
6			Do you recall him ringing you on the 27th May?	
7		Α.	I can't dispute that that call happened. There were a	
8			few calls. A lot of them would have been initiated by	
9			myself in an effort to get a date to meet with Garda	
10			Keogh. So I know that calls happened. If Garda Keogh	11:22
11			was endeavouring to go into the meat of his issues over	
12			the phone, I would have encouraged him to wait until we	
13			sat down so we get a full account in a proper	
14			environment.	
15	101	Q.	I think that the reason you emphasise that is in	11:22
16			relation to a question that you were asked by our	
17			investigators dealing with a suggestion at that stage,	
18			which now isn't being pursued by Garda Keogh, that he	
19			may have thought that his phone was being bugged and he	
20			relies on what you said to him in that regard, namely	11:22
21			don't talk over the phone, and I think you dealt with	
22			that, isn't that right?	
23		Α.	That's correct, Chair.	
24	102	Q.	Would you just give us your evidence in relation to	
25			that, to get it out of the way?	11:23
26		Α.	Well, I mean, this allegation was put to me by your	
27			team.	
28	103	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	

29

A. And I would say, you know, I had no evidence to suggest

Τ			that any phone was bugged and if it were, my purpose of	
2			ringing Garda Keogh in those early days was to just	
3			establish contact.	
4	104	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Yes.	
5		Α.	That was the primary purpose. And if I said to him,	11:23
6			look it, we're not going to discuss this, it was for	
7			the purpose that, you know I knew that he was	
8			anxious to get a story out and that he needed to tell	
9			it and that there was a kind of urgency there, but the	
10			phone wasn't the way to do it.	11:23
11	105	Q.	Yes, indeed.	
12		Α.	We needed to sit down and do it in a professional way.	
13	106	Q.	If we then move on to an entry that he has on the 30th	
14			May, on the opposite page there, he says:	
15				11:24
16			"Call from AC."	
17				
18			That's yourself	
19				
20			"I state I am not recording him."	11:24
21				
22			Is that something he volunteered or did you ask him	
23			about that?	
24		Α.	I wouldn't have asked him that, no.	
25	107	Q.	"And there to ask for help re what I've been saying	11:24
26			over last four years. Meeting for 7/6/2014 in	
27			Portumna."	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	108	Q.	So, was it on that date that	

- 1 A. That's the day that the decision was made of the date, 2 yes. Yes.
- 3 109 Q. Was that your suggestion or was it his suggestion or 4 how was it that it was put back for seven days, as it 5 were, the meeting to take place?

11 · 25

11:25

11:25

- 6 Well, I was conscious again of Garda Keogh's situation. Α. He was a confidential reporter. So I would have said 7 8 to him at an early stage, I need to meet with you, I'm happy to meet wherever you nominate, where you feel 9 10 safe, where you can make your statement. Within 11 reason, of course, I knew of the urgency of the matter, 12 that it needed to be attended to, but I wanted to give 13 him the opportunity as well in relation to when it 14 would happen. I have looked at my diary for those,
- Garda Keogh, it was a busy diary, but the only days
  where I wasn't available actually I think were two days
  where I was on annual leave, between my first contact
  with Garda Keogh and the day that I met him. And
  actually, the day I did meet him was on a Saturday, at
  the weekend. I was totally flexible in relation to

from the day I was appointed until the day I met with

- where and when and the when was within reason, I

  couldn't let that go too long because I was anxious to

  get a detailed statement of complaint from him.
- 25 110 Q. I think then you had your first meeting with him on the 11:26 7th June at Portumna Garda station. I think it was at 27 six o'clock in the evening that you met him?
- 28 A. That's correct.

15

29 111 Q. With Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. Would you just

1 tell us what you recall of that meeting?
--

- A. Well again, what I recall is, just, you know, in any of these scenarios it's good to sit down first and just talk, have a good chat before you start making notes or taking anything down formally. So, just to get a view of -- and allow Garda Keogh to relax and just to be able to get into a situation where he could talk freely about the issues that he had to talk about.
- 9 112 Q. What were your first impressions of him?
- That he was -- that he was anxious, yeah. He appeared, 11:27 10 Α. 11 you know, nervous. And I would expect that. 12 you know, aware of the fact that he was making very serious allegations against colleagues and, you know, 13 14 he was fearful of, you know, what might happen him because of that. I was there to reassure him in that 15 11:27 16 I told him, given that it was under the 17 confidential reporting mechanism, you know, that I saw 18 it as my responsibility to ensure that his welfare 19 needs were met. From the earliest stage of this process, that is something that I would have discussed 20 11:27 with Garda Keogh directly or when I didn't attend the 21 22 meetings, that I would have ensured that my single 23 point of contact with Garda Keogh, who was Detective 24 Superintendent Declan Mulcahy, would keep that on the 25 agenda at all times. 11:28

28

29

So the meeting -- it became apparent very quickly to me and to Declan Mulcahy that this particular statement was going to take some time. While we went through the

1			actual affidavit, he then started to talk about other	
2			matters that needed to be recorded. So we needed to	
3			put some shape on that and just get his view as to what	
4			related to what in relation to his statement, get	
5			clarity around, you know, how many different issues	11:28
6			really there were here. That process took well, for	
7			that particular session, which started it and then	
8			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and DI Coppinger	
9			continued with that for I think another three days it	
10			took them before they had a full statement that Garda	11:28
11			Keogh felt he had told us everything he knew at that	
12			particular point in time	
13	113	Q.	Just to come back to the question that I asked you	
14			earlier on, at this meeting did you make any enquiries	
15			in relation to his welfare at that stage?	11:29
16		Α.	Oh, yes. I would have at the very early stage, yes.	
17			Yeah.	
18	114	Q.	Did you ask him whether there had been any	
19			recriminations at work amongst his colleagues?	
20		Α.	No, he had nothing to say on that. But did he have a	11:29
21			certain he was anxious and was he was nervous and	
22			he did feel, and possibly for good reason, he felt	
23			exposed in that his name now had become you know, it	
24			had gone around all of the media in the country. It	
25			was known who he was.	11:29
26	115	Q.	Yes.	
27		Δ	And for that reason he did feel a hit you know	

116 Q. Just to come back to it, you dealt with the Charter

exposed I would say.

28

29

Т			earlier on and one of the thrusts of it was to ensure	
2			that somebody wasn't subjected to inappropriate	
3			response	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5	117	Q.	to having made a protected disclosure. Did you not	11:29
6			think that maybe you would enquire as to how he was	
7			getting on with his colleagues, with management,	
8			whether he had any complaints at that stage to make in	
9			relation to how he had perhaps been treated by them?	
10		Α.	No.	11:30
11	118	Q.	Did you not perhaps think that that might be something	
12			that you might ask?	
13		Α.	I'm sure it formed part of the conversation, Chairman,	
14			because we were there, it was my first meeting with	
15			him. Of course it would be part of the conversation.	11:30
16			However, like, at that stage in particular we would	
17			depend on he had to come to us and if he had any	
18			particular issues that he felt needed to be aired, let	
19			it be in relation to his colleagues or local management	
20			or whatever, because I would have explained to him	11:30
21			where I was coming from in the context of a CR report,	
22			I had to maintain his anonymity at all stages. I	
23			couldn't go to his local management with his name, even	
24			though it was known.	
25	119	Q.	Did you explain that to him?	11:31
26		Α.	I did, I explained the position. In a funny kind of	
27			way, the fact that his name was in the public domain in	
28			some ways and the details of some of his complaints.	
29			Probably affected the early stages of our	

Т			investigation. From a welfare point of view, it did	
2			mean that now local management, through another avenue,	
3			knew that they needed to mind one of their staff who	
4			had made this	
5	120	Q.	Yes. But is this a problem that perhaps arose fairly	11:31
6			early on? I mean, did you regard it as the	
7			responsibility of your investigation under the Charter	
8			to look after the welfare of the reporter?	
9		Α.	I did, Chairman.	
10	121	Q.	So that wasn't a responsibility that was placed on	11:31
11			local management, because obviously it was confidential	
12			and they weren't to know about it?	
13		Α.	Yes. But the fact that his name became public	
14			knowledge, I didn't get rid of my my responsibility	
15			remained. As far as I was concerned, I stayed	11:32
16			interested in Garda Keogh's welfare right throughout	
17			the investigation. But the fact that it was known	
18			locally now that there was a Garda who had made a	
19			confidential report, local management knew through	
20			another avenue, as I say, they then had a	11:32
21			responsibility as well, they couldn't so his welfare	
22			then became an issue for Detective Superintendent	
23			Mulcahy and with local management, they could then talk	
24			about it because it was	
25	122	Q.	Yes. So you were happy in those circumstances that	11:32
26			there should be some sort of information shared between	
27			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and Superintendent	
28			Noreen McBrien, for example, in relation to the welfare	
29			of Garda Keogh?	

- A. Yes. In relation to the welfare of a confidential recipient.
- 3 123 Q. Yes.
- A. And that is how it was done. And Declan Mulcahy, I
  would make it very clear to the people at my
- 6 conferences, this investigation team are still bound by
- 7 the confidential reporting legislation, we cannot
- 8 discuss this individual's name. But like, where it was
- 9 public knowledge, they could mention Garda Keogh to us,

11:34

11:34

- but we'd talk about a confidential reporter back to
- 11 them.
- 12 124 Q. So in a normal case where the confidential reporter
- 13 hadn't disclosed his identity --
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 125 Q. -- the full obligation in relation to welfare would
  16 fall on the investigation team?
- 17 A. Well, that was my interpretation of it, Chairman.
- 18 126 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. You know, it's one thing that does cause -- you know,
- it's a weakness in the system, that I don't think has
- been remedied.
- 22 127 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. In that, you know, the welfare -- the people
- responsible for a garda's welfare are their direct
- supervisors. If they don't know that this individual
- has a problem, they can't deal with it, you know. So
- on that basis I decided early on, I am going to ensure
- that Garda Keogh's welfare is being looked after, in
- the context of whatever services were available within

- An Garda Síochána and on a one-to-one basis through my team members.
- And, indeed, there does seem to be a gap there, because the investigation team won't be familiar with what is going on on the ground in the Garda station, where the

11:34

11:35

11:35

6 local superintendent perhaps would be au fait with

7 matters that were arising, isn't that right?

A. That's correct. And there's another side to this, in that persons complained of would also be in need possibly of some welfare support themselves. I note

11 that the new protocols actually make specific mention

of that in the context of the duty of the person

appointed, which would be me at this stage, to let

local management know about who has been complained of,

so they can be supported from a welfare point of view.

- 16 129 Q. So is there any more you would like to say in relation to that?
- 18 A. No.

13

14

15

19 130 Q. No. The meeting that we are dealing with on the 7th 20 June, I don't intend to open the notes, Detective

21 Superintendent Mulcahy has dealt with the issues that

arose. But in his evidence to the Tribunal, Garda

23 Keogh said that he mentioned the suspension --

- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 131 Q. -- of Garda A at this meeting. Was that a matter that 11:35 was mentioned to you at this meeting?
- 27 A. It was a matter I was already considering myself. Not 28 the actual suspension of any member but the possibility
- that a member may have to be suspended at some future

4	•
1	time.
	1 1 11114
_	L I III L .

2 132 Q. We are going to come back to that in some detail later 3 on, in fact quite shortly, but just in terms of this 4 meeting, do you have a recollection of Garda Keogh 5 mentioning the issue?

11:36

11:36

- 6 A. Oh I do, yes.
- 7 133 Q. You do.
- A. In fact he raised it in a letter to Detective
  Superintendent Mulcahy.
- 10 134 Q. Yes.
- 11 In addition to other issues that he had. And I Α. 12 immediately made arrangements to meet with him, which 13 happened I think two days later, and went through --14 and at that stage I had got some clarity from HRM in 15 relation to other issues that were -- for example, the 11:36 16 continuity from the confidential reporting legislation 17 to the PD legislation and the importance of ensuring 18 that Garda Keogh was aware that my appointment was 19 still, you know, legitimate in the context of the 20 continuance of that and that I was still in place to do 11:37 the investigation. But at that meeting I would have --21 22 he would have raised the issue of the suspension of I would have told him that, you know, this is 23 24 a matter that requires a lot of consideration and the 25 process was there, and it usually happens between local 11:37 26 management and HRM. And here again is another example 27 of the CRPD process, where local management aren't aware of the detail of the complaints being made, they 28 29 may not even be aware at that stage of the garda being

Т			complained of. Therefore, they had no ground on which	
2			to base application for consideration of a suspension.	
3			And I felt, again, that it was incumbent on me to	
4			ensure that that process was considered from the	
5			earliest stages and that is what I did.	11:38
6	135	Q.	Yes. I think that since you have raised the issue, we	
7			can explore it now at this juncture rather than defer	
8			it in the timeframe, because it's a specific allegation	
9			that is made or a complaint that is made by Garda	
10			Keogh. I think that at that time the issue of	11:38
11			suspension of a member was dealt with under the Garda	
12			Síochána Discipline Regulations of 2007, is that right?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	136	Q.	I think that is dealt with under section 7, it's in our	
15			material at page 7795. If we could have that up on the	11:39
16			screen there. We see:	
17				
18			"Where in the opinion of the Commissioner the	
19			circumstances renders such a course desirable in the	
20			interests of Garda Síochána he/she may a from duty. A	11:39
21			member so suspended remains suspended until the	
22			Commissioner decides that the suspension should cease.	
23				
24			The Commissioner shall review the suspension of a	
25			member every three months or at such shorter intervals	11:39
26			as he or she considers necessary, but any noncompliance	
27			with this paragraph does not of itself invalidate a	
28			suspensi on.	
29				

1			A member to whom the function of suspending a member is	
2			delegated by the Commissioner may not suspend a member	
3			for a period exceeding ten days, but the Commissioner	
4			may extend the suspension.	
5				11:39
6			A member who is suspended and is required by the	
7			Commissioner or the Government, as the case may be, to	
8			retire or resign as an alternative to dismissal,	
9			remains suspended during the period of any notice of	
10			retirement or resignation that may be given."	11:40
11				
12			So it appears that under the regulations that the	
13			Commissioner has the role of suspending but that can be	
14			delegated.	
15		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	11:40
16	137	Q.	I think it could be delegated to a chief superintendent	
17			at local level?	
18		Α.	That's correct. All discipline matters are delegated	
19			to chief superintendent level, yes.	
20	138	Q.	But that can only be done for a period of ten days?	11:40
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	139	Q.	But the Commissioner can extend that period?	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	140	Q.	So any long-term suspension would be a matter for the	
25			Commissioner, is that right?	11:40
26		Α.	Yeah. I would say that all suspensions are a matter	
27			for the Commissioner. The Commissioner of the day will	
28			delegate that to chief superintendent level. And any	
29			decision that a Commissioner would be making would be	

Т			informed by a report coming from local management.	
2	141	Q.	I think that that, in fact, has been amended. If we go	
3			to page 7828, which is a policy document on the	
4			suspension from duty of members of An Garda Síochána,	
5			but that is in January 2017. So that wasn't in force	11:41
6			at the time. But if we turn to page 7831 of the	
7			material, paragraph 5:	
8				
9			"Long-term suspensi on."	
10				11:41
11			We see there:	
12				
13			"The Commissioner may suspend a member for a period	
14			exceeding ten days. The Commissioner may also extended	
15			the suspension of a member who has been suspended for a	11:42
16			period not exceeding ten days. These functions may be	
17			delegated by the Commissioner.	
18				
19			The views of the divisional officer will be sought on	
20			the following matters"	11:42
21				
22			Then it sets out the matters and we will come to those	
23			in due course because they actually reflect the view	
24			that was expressed by HR in relation to the	
25			considerations that apply. They are effectively	11:42
26			identical to the matters and we will come to that	
27			shortly.	
28				
29			So if we could just come to deal with this hecause	

1	Garda Keogh, in his statement to the Tribunal	
2	investigators, it's at page 106, I will just quote from	
3	it, where he says:	
4		
5	"I believe that is discrediting to me and targeting me 11:	43
6	as I have made a complaint of a serious nature and of	
7	criminal conduct against a colleague garda, Garda A,	
8	and he was not suspended, not arrested and Garda	
9	colleagues were interviewed about my complaint while	
10	the guard against whom I had made the allegation, Garda 11:	43
11	A, was on duty in the same station at the same time."	
12		
13	Now, we are going to break that down and we will look	
14	at different aspects of it. But that is a complaint	
15	that Garda Keogh has made in relation to it. He has a 11:	43
16	diary entry, which is at page 435 of the material. We	
17	don't need to open it. I am just going to quote from	
18	it:	
19		
20	"I am not happy with the investigation. No 11:	44
21	suspensions. How can they interview his unit?"	
22		
23	And we know that he had raised the issue with you and	
24	that he raised an issue, I think it was in mid July, to	
25	Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, in a letter that he	44
26	sent. You have a diary entry, which is at page 3979,	
27	on 11th August 2014, where you have the entry:	
28		
29	"Spoke with Chief Superintendent Tony McLoughlin and	

got information from him regarding suspension and the new Protected Disclosures Act. He sent me guidelines regarding suspension. To call back regarding the new Act."

5

6

7

8

11:45

11:46

Was that the first time that you sought advice in relation to suspension of Garda A and when did you first consider the issue yourself?

- Chairman, I would like to clarify, I was seeking advice 9 Α. on the suspension of Garda A. I was seeking advice 10 11 · 45 11 generally, because at that juncture the point that 12 needed to be considered, that hadn't been done. 13 doing this on the basis that it may have to happen at 14 some stage and I felt, because of the unique position I 15 was in, in the context of a CR report, that it fell to me because there would not be sufficient knowledge 16 locally if the question of suspension had to arise. 17 18 I would not be in a position at any stage to suspend 19 any garda in Athlone as part of my investigation. All 20 I could do was outline to HR the background that I was 11:46 aware of that may support a suspension by local 21 22 management. That's the position.
- 23 142 Q. CHAIRMAN: So you were looking for what are the rules or guidelines, what's the story about suspension?
- A. Especially in the context of, I suppose, the unique position we were in. I had some experience of suspensions over the years.
- 28 143 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand.
- 29 A. But it's not something you do every day. So,

1			therefore, every time it would be I would advise any	
2			officer to always go back to the experts in this	
3			regard, because it is such a serious move, that you	
4			always consult with the national office in the context	
5			of getting the best possible advice with regard to how	11:46
6			to proceed in the event of a member needing to be	
7			suspended.	
8	144	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So he sent you the guidelines and that would	
9			enable you in an appropriate case to fill in the	
10			information as far as you were able to do so?	11:47
11		Α.	Yes, because that information wasn't available to local	
12			management.	
13			CHAIRMAN: I understand.	
14	145	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: You refer to a letter that had been sent	
15			by Garda Keogh to Detective Superintendent Mulcahy.	11:47
16			This, in fact, is in August, not July, as stated. If	
17			we look at page 3980 of the materials. The first	
18			paragraphs are the matter that I am not going to raise,	
19			there's no need to go into it, Detective Superintendent	
20			Mulcahy has dealt with it. But he says in the third	11:47
21			paragraph:	
22				
23			"When I met AC Ó Cualáin and yourself the first time in	
24			Portumna I outlined the fact that without a suspension	
25			being issued that people would be reluctant to come	11:48
26			forward and that goes for members of the public."	
27				
28			He mentions a particular person	

1			" and gardaí. I am concerned in particular that	
2			gardaí who intended to volunteer information have	
3			become reluctant to talk to your investigation team.	
4			The manner that this investigation is being conducted	
5			is actually obstructing the investigation."	11:48
6				
7			He then goes on to say:	
8				
9			"I do have faith in An Garda Síochána and hope I did	
10			the right thing in volunteering such confidential	11:48
11			information to yourselves. Unlike many other Garda	
12			regions in the country, the Western Region has an	
13			excellent reputation. I feel obliged to again inform	
14			you of my concerns."	
15				11:48
16			Now, I think having received that, that letter, they	
17			seemed to be genuine concerns that he has there, is	
18			that right?	
19		Α.	They were all genuine concerns.	
20	146	Q.	Yes.	11:49
21		Α.	I understand that Garda Keogh had those concerns, of	
22			course, yeah.	
23	147	Q.	I think that you then have a diary entry for the 13th	
24			August, where you note the following, it's page 3982 of	
25			the material:	11:49
26				
27			"Travelled to Portumna with Detective Superintendent	
28			Mulcahy, where I met with the confidential reporter.	
29			Went through the letter with him and the matters that	

1			were of concern to him. He mentioned the suspension of	
2			Garda A and the manner in which the enquiries were	
3			being carried out in Athlone station. I told him that	
4			the suspension of Garda A was a matter for AC HRM and	
5			that an application was being made."	11:50
6				
7			Can you just tell us what that refers to? It envisages	
8			that you were going to make an application	
9		Α.	Yeah. You see at this stage I understood the concerns	
10			being expressed by Garda Keogh. I also knew there was	11:50
11			a process that had to be gone through. I would like to	
12			be in a position to say to Garda Keogh, we have	
13			considered this, this has been considered by the	
14			organisation and it's not considered that or the	
15			suspension of Garda A is not warranted at this	11:50
16			juncture. I needed to have so on the basis of his	
17			concerns and what advice I had received from HR, I did	
18			make a decision to send an application to HR in the	
19			context of having the matter considered, yes.	
20	148	Q.	Garda Keogh has a diary entry for this, it's page 13269	11:51
21			of the material. If we look at the 13th August.	
22			Scroll down please, Mr. Kavanagh. He says:	
23				
24			"4:00pm meet AC and D/Superintendent reletter and I	
25			said it is an absolute disgrace re manner of the	11:51
26			i nvesti gati on. "	
27				
28			Then the assistant commissioner, yourself, says:	
29				

1 2			"High bar for somebody to get suspended."	
3			Did you have that conversation with him?	
4		Α.	I mean, I needed to explain to him that due process	
5			applied to this. It wasn't in my power to just willy	11:5
6			nilly suspend people. The discipline had to be	
7			considered at length. In any event, no matter	
8			information I had in my possession, all I could do was	
9			have it sent to our HR department, where they could	
10			share with local management and then have a decision	11:5
11			made locally, because that is where that decision has	
12			to reside. It wasn't in my power in that particular	
13			circumstance to suspend anybody.	
14	149	Q.	Just in relation to that, I mean it was never going to	
15			be a short-term suspension?	11:5
16		Α.	You see	
17	150	Q.	If suspension was being considered, it would be for the	
18			duration of the investigation or until such time as the	
19			investigation perhaps exonerated Garda A?	
20		Α.	Based on what information was being considered and on	11:5
21			the evidence available to the investigation team, which	
22			was not available to local management	
23	151	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	and which we had to be careful that we didn't give	
25			too much away either in that context.	11:5
26	152	Q.	Yes.	
27		Α.	They had to know the bare facts of what the allegations	
28			were, maybe not the individuals concerned because that	

was something that the confidential reporter had given

- to us, we were duty bound. So this was the challenge..
- from the outset, whether it be long-term, short-term,
- 3 that wasn't something that I was considering. All I
- 4 wanted to do was -- because this was an issue for Garda

11:53

11:54

11:54

11:54

- 5 Keogh and for the investigation team, I wasn't doing
- 6 this because Garda Keogh had an issue with it, I was
- 7 doing it because it was the right thing to do in the
- 8 context of a serious investigation, with serious
- 9 allegations, that this thing would be considered on its
- merits by the people who are charged to do that within
- 11 the organisation.
- 12 153 Q. And it would be something that would be fluent, insofar
- as if the evidence got to a stage where you were then
- 14 moving into a criminal investigation, where the
- 15 evidence was pointing to the guilt of Garda A, then at
- that stage suspension would be considered further?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 154 Q. Is that right?
- 19 A. I know that sometime in August I got a response -- no,
- it was actually in September. I got a detailed
- 21 response from Human Resources in relation to my letter
- to them.
- 23 155 Q. Yes, I will come to that now.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 156 Q. We will come to that shortly.
- 26 A. Sure.
- 27 157 Q. If you just have a look at the notes of Detective
- 28 Superintendent Mulcahy for this meeting. They are at
- page 3946, please, of the material. This is the notes

1	of the meeting on the 13th August. He says:
2	
3	"Issued raised: Nobody will talk unless he is
4	suspended. Garda or public - re Garda A hanging around
5	during an investigation. Concerned about this."
6	
7	You stated:
8	
9	"We will try to do our interviews at another station if
10	we can. Take focus of investigation away from where he 11:55
11	works."
12	
13	You were to write to HRM regarding suspension.
14	
15	"High bar."
16	
17	This is what we just discussed.
18	
19	"One major concern - do our investigation when he is
20	not around. Rest days."
21	
22	You explain that he is entitled to be there.
23	
24	"We will try to move locus of investigation."
25	11:55
26	Suspension, you invite Keogh whether there was any
27	other reason, not just hanging around the Garda
28	station.
29	

"Haven't heard that Garda A has asked anyone what theydid or said."

That brings us in relation to another issue that has arisen, and that was the propriety of conducting this sort of investigation in Athlone Garda Station and interviewing members there. Regardless of the number of people or the extent of the investigation, do you think that it was correct in principle that when you were investigating wrongdoing, alleged wrongdoing in Athlone Garda Station, that if other members had information that they should come forward and give that information to you?

- 14 A. You mean other than nominated by Garda Keogh?
- Or just other members who may have been reluctant to Q. 11:57 come forward previously, but now seeing the confidential process in place, that they may come forward to you as the investigator to either support the allegations that are made or, in fact, to undermine Did you think that that was something that ought 11:57 to be achieved; an openness in Athlone Garda Station, encouraging people if they had information to give information?
  - A. Of course. Like every line of enquiry that we pursued, and this was something that I was again very strict on in relation to the running of the investigation, any line of enquiry that opened up I was insistent that it be followed through. That included -- and that's why the investigation took the time it took, because we had

11 · 57

to go down every single one of those -- and some of them were cul-de-sacs, but we had to go down anyway and explore what the possibilities could be. That included lots of members in Athlone station who might have been mentioned in somebody else's statement and on that basis they would have been approached for a statement on the basis how they would -- this is how the jobs are

All of that, essentially the practical implementation of the overall thrust of the investigation was for the SIO to decide. You had him here yesterday, Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. He would have planned that on the basis of giving out the jobs to the different teams that had been --

11:58

11:58

11:58

11:58

11:59

16 159 Q. That was done from Oranmore Garda Station?

Α.

created.

Oranmore was set up as -- yes, it had a few advantages, in that it was on the periphery of Galway city, it was a new, modern complex, it had some vacant rooms that could be used, it would maintain a certain element of confidentiality for the team. They were travelling from various locations around the region and it meant that they could easily get into that office without having to go through Galway city, etcetera. And that is where the detective superintendent's office was, in Oranmore, as well, at the time. Because we had issues with accommodation in Galway at that juncture. So the detective superintendent's office was there, therefore he was close to the investigation at all times when he

1 wasn't on other duties.

2

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

3 So all of the jobs that were given out, and we had a garda in charge of the incident room, they would have 4 5 been given out at conferences and on a regular basis by 11:59 the team and they would have gone off and done their 6 7 duties and done their jobs based on what they were 8 asked to do, if it was taking statement off Garda X or Y or some witness or some civilian, that would all have 9 been given out and they would told they wanted it back 10 11:59 11 by a certain time. That's is the way in general that 12 our incident room works

13 You changed the location where interviews were going to 160 Ο. 14 place, why did you do that?

12:00

12:00

Once I became aware that there was a concern by Garda Α. Keogh -- this goes back to the welfare. There were some elements I had control of, there were some I didn't have any control of. But where I could, in order to give some element of comfort to Garda Keogh, I said, look it, rather than ringing up a garda who works 12:00 in Athlone and saying we're going to meet you, when are you working again, that was where the people, maybe two guards would go together, they made those arrangements themselves, there was no direction from on high, but there was a direction then from that date. clear to the detective superintendent that in as much as they could that they should interview people away from Athlone, so that this scenario wasn't going to repeat itself or the one described by Garda Keogh.

we have heard different views, the Chairman has heard 161 Q. 1 2 evidence from different members and there's different views in relation to it. You're probably aware of the 3 criticism that Sergeant Haran, who was there locally, 4 5 had in relation to the fact that interviews took place 12:01 in Athlone. And we had contrary evidence from 6 7 Inspector Minnock, who said that there was nothing 8 wrong with it and that it was perfectly all right and he to go and get documents during the course of making 9

12.01

12:01

11 A. Yes.

10

12 162 O. And therefore it was convenient.

a statement.

- 13 A. If I can just say, in relation to any member, including
  14 Sergeant Haran, who did make a statement, as far as I'm
  15 aware, to my investigation team, it was a matter -- at
  16 any stage they could have said, I don't think we should
  17 be doing this in Athlone. They could have raised
  18 concerns, like Garda Keogh rightly did when he felt
  19 there was an issue. And immediate action was taken. -
- 20 163 Q. Well, I suppose, I mean in the first instance we went
  12:02
  through it and you said, you know, that somebody was
  brave to make a protected disclosure?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 164 Q. And that it wasn't particularly easy. I suppose it
  25 wouldn't have been particularly easy for any member to 12:02
  26 start criticising your investigation?
- A. No, I am not saying that they would criticise the investigation, but if a member was approached for a statement, that they would say, could I please be

_			The viewed at some notes on the persphery of Athrone,	
2			I don't want to be in the station making my statement.	
3			That was open to them.	
4	165	Q.	In hindsight, looking back on it, could you understand	
5			how Garda Keogh may have had genuine concerns?	12:02
6		Α.	Obviously I understand, because I took action.	
7	166	Q.	Yes.	
8		Α.	When he gave me when he made his or when his	
9			concerns were aired to me, I immediately took action to	
10			ensure that that wasn't going to be a major concern for	12:02
11			him in the future. However, I understood the	
12			practicalities of taking statements of complaint and	
13			evidence, that sometimes you have to be in the place	
14			that we've just mentioned.	
15	167	Q.	So on a human level you can understand	12:03
16		Α.	I can of course, yes.	
17	168	Q.	his concerns but from an official point of view	
18			there was nothing wrong with conducting enquiries	
19			locally and taking statements in Athlone Garda Station?	
20		Α.	I would say, in fact, that some had to be taken there,	12:03
21			on the basis that, for example, some of the actions	
22			meant that there were searches carried out in the	
23			station of certain PEMS store etcetera that had to	
24			happen there. That if the team were looking for a copy	
25			of an investigation file, it had to be taken from	12:03
26			there. They had no choice in the matter, only visit	
27			Athlone Garda Station. So certain enquiries would have	
28			to happen in that location. However, as I said, once	
29			it became a concern for Garda Keonh T sought out to	

1			ensure that that was minimised.	
2	169	Q.	Is there any more you would like to say in relation to	
3			that issue?	
4		Α.	There isn't, Chairman, no.	
5	170	Q.	Yes. If we could look then, this is a letter from you	12:04
6			to Assistant Commissioner Fanning, it's at page 10815	
7			of the material. Sorry, if we can scroll up there.	
8			Yes. This is actually Assistant Commissioner Fanning's	
9			response to a query that you raised in a letter dated	
10			29th August of 2014?	12:05
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	171	Q.	If we can perhaps go to 3985 of the material to see	
13			that. It's from you to the assistant commissioner,	
14			that's Assistant Commissioner Fanning. If you look at	
15			paragraph 2 and we scroll down towards the end of	12:06
16			paragraph 2, you see:	
17				
18			"The confidential reporter has expressed concern that	
19			Garda A is still at work and has access to and from the	
20			Garda station and may be in a position to interfere	12:06
21			with witnesses and disrupt the investigation. Garda A	
22			is currently attached to the crime unit in Athlone."	
23				
24			Then you go on:	
25				12:06
26			"The allegations being made by the confidential	
27			reporter concern the activities of Garda A while on	
28			duty and his role as a member of An Garda Síochána. A	
29			summary of the allegations (as included in statements	

1	of complaint made by the confidential reporter) as	
2	they refer to Garda A"	
3		
4	Then you set those out over the following page, we	
5	don't need to go into them. And then if we turn over $_{12}$	2:06
6	to the following page, 3986, we see:	
7		
8	"The issue of suspending Garda A is something which now	
9	requires considering. However, while these allegations	
10	are very serious in nature, they remain allegations and $_{12}$	::07
11	the investigation is endeavouring to corroborate or,	
12	indeed, disprove the veracity of these allegations. I	
13	am seeking your views on this matter and the	
14	appropriate course of action to be adopted."	
15	12	2:07
16	Then you say you await their advices.	
17		
18	Then if we turn to page 3987. This is in response to	
19	your letter, your letter was dated the 29th August.	
20	The response is on 16th September 2014.	2:07
21		
22	"It is noted and agreed that the allegations contained	
23	therein concerning Garda A are of a very serious	
24	nature. It would be appreciated if you could forward	
25	the statement containing the allegations and any other $_{12}$	2:07
26	corroborative evidence obtained in relation to this	
27	matter."	
28		
29	How did you view that, that request?	

Τ		Α.	well, I think in the normal course, for example, where	
2			a member of An Garda Síochána has an allegation has	
3			been made against a member of An Garda Síochána and a	
4			suspension is being considered, it would be normal that	
5			a statement made by the complainant would form part of	12:0
6			the document that would be considered by HRM. It	
7			wasn't an unusual request. However, the purpose of my	
8			previous correspondence, which gave some, I suppose, a	
9			précis of the evidence without giving the statement,	
10			was that they would get a flavour of the serious	12:0
11			that was acknowledged, that they were serious.	
12			However, a copy of the statement was sought.	
13	172	Q.	Yes, we will come to that. Then we go on:	
14				
15			"Consideration should be given to an appointment being	12:0
16			made in accordance with the Garda Síochána (Discipline)	
17			Regulations 2007, as amended."	
18				
19			What is that a reference to?	
20		Α.	You see, suspensions, they're all part of the	12:0
21			discipline process.	
22	173	Q.	Yes.	
23		Α.	So once an appointment is made under discipline, while	
24			the discipline itself, the discipline investigation	
25			cannot proceed until the criminal aspects have been	12:0
26			concluded/ it would T assume in the context of a	

28

29

suspension, that they would expect that that matter

that appointment, having someone ready to go into

would be attended to as well, in the context of making

1			looking at the disciplinary matters. But that's for	
2			the HR experts to let you know. This is my	
3			interpretation of it.	
4	174	Q.	We then move on to the fourth paragraph:	
5				12:09
6			"Consideration should also be given to the status of	
7			the member. Accordingly, in order to be exhaustive you	
8			should consider the question of the member's suspension	
9			from duty under the headings below."	
10				12:10
11			Then we see:	
12				
13			"Primary considerations for suspension: Strength of	
14			the evidence; seriousness of allegation; risk to	
15			members of the public; risk to colleagues; potential to	12:10
16			pervert the course of justice/suborn colleagues;	
17			options of alternatives.	
18				
19			Secondary considerations: Likely outcome; estimate	
20			time to conclude investigation; relevant complaint	12:10
21			history; current performance; impact on policy/public	
22			relations; impact on service morale; risk to	
23			offi cer/wel fare consi derati ons."	
24				
25			He goes on:	12:10
26				
27			"You should liaise with the member's divisional officer	
28			and local management to assist you in addressing the	
29			above criteria and aid in your consideration.	

1				
2			Please ensure a prompt reply is forwarded to this	
3			office so that a decision in relation to the member's	
4			continued deployment or otherwise can be examined."	
5				12:11
6			That would appear to be suggesting that perhaps looking	
7			for a recommendation from you in relation to those	
8			matters, is that right?	
9		Α.	Yeah, looking for me to consider those matters. That's	
10			exactly what I did. I did exactly what I was asked to	12:11
11			do. I sought in relation to the full	
12			correspondence, I asked Detective Superintendent	
13			Mulcahy to approach Garda A about his statement and see	
14			whether or not he would give it to HR. And then I	
15			considered those primary and secondary considerations.	12:11
16			I met with the local team. Now, I don't have that in	
17			my statement, Chairman, because when I was preparing my	
18			statement I had the use of my own notes and I didn't	
19			have any reference to it, therefore I couldn't recall	
20			it, but I know that a meeting did take place.	12:12
21	175	Q.	Yes.	
22		Α.	And that was the purpose of it.	
23	176	Q.	And obviously there were matters that you were aware	
24			of	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:12
26	177	Q.	as set out there, as being considerations for	

aware of?

Yes.

Α.

27

28

29

suspension, that local management couldn't have been

1	178	Q.	And likewise, there were matters that local management	
2			were aware of that you couldn't have been aware of?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	179	Q.	Is that right?	
5		Α.	That's correct.	12:12
6	180	Q.	So that brings us to the meeting in Garda Headquarters	
7			on the 23rd September?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	181	Q.	I think that	
10		Α.	You see, while this letter was dated the 16th, these	12:12
11			were matters I was attending to anyway. I knew these	
12			were matters that needed to be done. You know, I may	
13			have been on the phone to somebody in HR and said, you	
14			should meet with the local management. It was	
15			confirmed in this letter of the 16th, but I was already	12:13
16			putting things in place to ensure that I had the	
17			information I required. Sorry.	
18	182	Q.	I think then we have a note of this meeting, or we have	
19			the statement. As you say, you had no recall of this?	
20		Α.	No.	12:13
21	183	Q.	And you didn't include it in the information that you	
22			gave to the Tribunal. That is not a criticism in any	
23			way. But the meeting, I think Detective Superintendent	
24			Mulcahy deals with this, if we look at his statement at	
25			page 3901. If we can scroll down. If you go back up.	12:13
26			Down there. At the bottom. He says:	
27				

"On 23rd September 2014 I met with Assistant

Commissioner Ó Cualáin, Detective Superintendent Mark

28

29

1			Curran and Superintendent McBrien in Dublin. A	
2			discussion took place around the suspension of Garda A.	
3			There was agreement that there was no local or other	
4			issues to justify the suspension of Garda A at the	
5			time. Neither the chief superintendent nor the	12:14
6			superintendent received any complaints regarding Garda	
7			A following our investigation or visit to Athlone Garda	
8			Stati on. "	
9				
10			Is that your recollection?	12:14
11		Α.	It is. It would have informed my decision then at that	
12			stage, that a suspension wasn't warranted at that	
13			juncture.	
14	184	Q.	At that meeting you didn't disclose the contents or the	
15			nature of your investigation or how it had progressed	12:15
16			or the strength of the evidence or any of the	
17			considerations that could have fed into the chief	
18			superintendent making an application to the	
19			Commissioner to suspend Garda Keogh, did you?	
20		Α.	No. I think I retained all of the information from the	12:15
21			point of view of the strength of the evidence and the	
22			seriousness of the allegations, that was something that	
23			I had access to. That was something I could report on.	
24			And once you see, in the normal course if this	
25			weren't a PD, all of the information would be available	12:15
26			to the author writing up to HR.	
27	185	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
28		Α.	So it was a bit disjointed. On the basis of my report	

29

to HR, which happened, HR could then have liaised with

1			the local management and found out about the other bits	
2			here. But this, I'd say, was probably the type of	
3			response that anyone would get in relation to a	
4			suspension application.	
5	186	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. As opposed to a specific PD	12:16
6			circumstance.	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	187	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's what seemed to me to be absent from	
9			the letter from headquarters.	
10		Α.	Yes.	12:16
11	188	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I just wondered about how helpful it was,	
12			because it didn't actually seem to focus or to	
13			acknowledge the protected disclosure confidentiality	
14			end.	
15		Α.	That's correct. That was always paramount in my mind.	12:16
16			I had to keep the two separate. I knew that there were	
17			certain elements that local management couldn't be	
18			aware of. And then I knew there were certain practical	
19			day-to-day local management issues that only they had	
20			knowledge of.	12:16
21	189	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But at least there was no difficulty, as I	
22			understand, about local management saying there's	
23			nothing that we're aware of that impels us towards	
24			suspension. They were able to say that, we're not	
25			aware of anything locally.	12:16
26		Α.	Yeah.	
27	190	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And their local management would have	
28			something to say on the question of suspension.	
29		Α.	Yes.	

Α.

Yes.

1	191	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So seriousness of the allegations,	
2			that was no problem, they were very serious	
3			allegations?	
4		Α.	Yes, they were serious.	
5	192	Q.	CHAIRMAN: The real question was the strength of the	12:17
6			evidence?	
7		Α.	As of that time.	
8	193	Q.	CHAIRMAN: As of that time?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	12:17
11	194	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: If we could just look at Detective	
12			Superintendent Mulcahy's diary entry for that day,	
13			which is at page 11329, Mr. Kavanagh. If we scroll	
14			down, we will see he deals with the meeting, an	
15			introduction to it. He says:	12:17
16				
17			"They were advised that we had moved our investigation	
18			from the station following concerns raised by Nick	
19			Keogh. "	
20				12:17
21			So that was a matter that you dealt with with him and	
22			you advised them on that at that time.	
23				
24			"Superintendent McBrien spoke of an occasion where	
25			Garda Nick Keogh stated to her that Garda A was	12:18
26			carrying a firearm but stated that he, Nick, did not	
27			feel under any threat."	
28				
29			Do you recall that being mentioned?	

Τ		Α.	At that particular meeting, I can t, to be nonest with	
2			you, but I am aware that Garda Keogh had brought this	
3			up, whether in writing or to Detective Superintendent	
4			Mulcahy. But it happened here, I can't disagree with	
5			that.	12:18
6	195	Q.	That is something we might have to return to briefly,	
7			but certainly we have heard Superintendent McBrien that	
8			she caused an enquiry to be made from Detective	
9			Sergeant Curley in relation to Garda A's possession of	
10			a firearm or access to a firearm and he had reported a	12:19
11			few days prior to this meeting on the 23rd September	
12			and assuaged any concerns that she may have had at the	
13			time that there was a problem in that regard.	
14				
15			So, as things stood then at that time in relation to	12:19
16			the suspension of Garda A, did that deal with the issue	
17			in terms of management at divisional level had been	
18			consulted?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	196	Q.	And at district level?	12:19
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	197	Q.	And you, as investigating the matter, you had consulted	
23			and it was a common view that an application to the	
24			Commissioner to suspend Garda A wasn't warranted at	
25			that time?	12:20
26		Α.	At that time, yes.	
27	198	Q.	Just bear with me for one moment. If we just move on	
28			then and if we could have page 3989 up on the screen.	
29			Yes. This is a letter dated 8th May, from you to the	

Т			Commissioner.	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	199	Q.	We will just go through it.	
4				
5			"The confidential reporter in this matter has made	12:21
6			serious allegations surrounding Garda activities in the	
7			Athlone district and has named individual gardaí and	
8			management as being complicit in areas of malpractice.	
9			The allegations in the main are made against a serving	
10			member, Garda A in the drugs unit at Athlone Garda	12:21
11			Stati on.	
12				
13			To date the investigation team has generated 200 lines	
14			of enquiry and interviewed 92 persons who have provided	
15			statements to the investigation."	12:21
16				
17			Now, I haven't opened up as yet your various reports to	
18			the Commissioner as you went along, but we will return	
19			to that at the end in relation to how you had kept the	
20			Commissioner informed, as you were obliged to do, of	12:22
21			your investigation.	
22				
23			You then go on to say:	
24				
25			"On 24th April 2015, Garda A was provided with a	12:22
26			summary of the allegations made against him to afford	
27			him an opportunity to respond. On 5th May 2015 the	
28			investigation team was provided with an analysis of	
29			phone records by a telephone liaison officer. Based on	

1			this analysis and allegations by the confidential	
2			reporter, there now exists a reasonable suspicion that	
3			Garda A may have committed a criminal act."	
4				
5			It would appear that you took the view that when the	12:22
6			billing records became available that these showed a	
7			suspicious, more than suspicious level of communication	
8			between Garda A and a mobile phone which was registered	
9			to Ms. B's daughter, isn't that right?	
10		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	12:23
11	200	Q.	You then say:	
12				
13			"I am now seeking your direction as to whether I	
14			proceed with this investigation to a conclusion and the	
15			necessity for formal appointments for both the criminal	12:23
16			and disciplinary aspects. Advice was previously sought	
17			from assistant commissioner Human Resources Management	
18			regarding the suspension from duty of Garda A and given	
19			the recent developments this matter will now be	
20			revi si ted. "	12:23
21				
22			So it would be fair to say that it would appear that	
23			the investigation team and yourself heading it up	
24			regarded the billing records as a layer of evidence	
25			that was regarded as significant?	12:23
26		Α.	Yeah, we saw it as a significant development in the	
27			context of part of our inquiry, yeah.	
28	201	Q.	Now, you will be aware of the fact that that is one of	
29			the complaints of Garda Keogh: that this wasn't	

Τ			identified at an earlier stage, isn't that right?	
2		Α.	That's correct, yes. Again, it was seen as an absolute	
3			priority at the outset of our investigation that	
4			phones, you know, yield some very useful evidence and	
5			can, so that was seen as a priority. It was dealt with	12:24
6			in that manner. And while the phone that was seized	
7			from Garda A didn't yield anything of an evidential	
8			nature in the context of what we were investigating,	
9			for the same phone and as part of your enquiries into	
10			the broader set of issues that Garda Keogh had made a	12:24
11			statement about, we discovered that these records	
12			existed for the actual period of time, that records for	
13			that same phone had already been sought and on that	
14			basis we had them analysed in the context of what they	
15			contained. And it was clear that there was, as you	12:25
16			said, an inordinate amount of contact between that	
17			official phone and the phone belonging to the daughter	
18			of Ms. B, yes.	
19	202	Q.	Could I just ask you this, because it may be an issue,	
20			how important an issue it is I don't know, but can we	12:25
21			deal with it. Because it would appear that as soon as	
22			Garda Keogh had identified Garda A and his alleged	
23			relationship with Ms. B, that there was an application	
24			or that there was a request made of Superintendent	
25			McBrien to get Garda A or a phone that Garda A had	12:25
26			access to and used 90% of the time apparently. That	
27			phone was retrieved. That was sent off for analysis.	

A. Yes, both locally and at national level, yes.

2829

203 Q.

Yes. But these concerned activities back in 2010?

1	Α.	Yes.

2 204 Q. So that any application that could be made in relation 3 to the service provider providing what limited 4 information they could make available, those 5 applications were made I think?

- 6 A. They were.
- 7 205 Q. They were made in circumstances where you knew that the 8 answer was going to be that we don't have those 9 records, because it's outside the two year period?
- 10 A. Exactly. That application was made and it was a two 12:26

  11 year period that was in it.
- 12 206 Q. Did anybody think that perhaps, look, what we can do 13 though, however, is getting billing records, because 14 they retain those for a six year period?
- 15 I can assure you, whatever evidence the phone could Α. 12:26 16 have produced was sought by the investigation team, in the context of whatever records were available that 17 18 would give us any leads in relation to what we were 19 investigating. The phone itself held nothing of 20 evidential value on the basis that there was --12:27 obviously it could have texts or text messages or the 21 22 text itself, if it was still available, would give 23 us -- may give us some indication as to what was the 24 nature of the contact, if there were contact between 25 certain parties. The fact that we got this dated piece 12:27 of, I suppose, evidence that had been previously 26 27 sought, gave us what -- just the fact that there were these interactions between this phone and this other 28 29 phone. That's all it could give.

- 1 207 Q. I think that line of inquiry ultimately came in early
- 2 2015, when Sergeant Haran made a statement to the
- investigation team and as a result of that a former
- 4 superintendent in the district was requested to make a
- 5 statement and that he was the one who indicated that he 12:28

12:28

- 6 had obtained --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 208 Q. -- Garda A's billing records in 2010?
- 9 A. 2010, yeah.
- 10 209 Q. Is that right?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 210 Q. So that is how that information came to the
- investigation.
- 14 211 Q. CHAIRMAN: was it the same phone?
- 15 A. It was, Judge, yes.
- 16 212 O. MR. MARRINAN: Yes.
- 17 A. Or sorry, Chairman.
- 18 213 Q. So effectively it was the information that was brought
- 19 by Sergeant Haran in the first place?
- 20 A. I am not sure of the history of how -- all I know is
- 21 that based on enquiries carried out by the team, they
- 22 were able to source this piece of --
- 23 214 Q. Yes.
- 24 215 Q. CHAIRMAN: But this information had previously been
- 25 elicited --
- 26 A. It had.
- 27 216 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- in a previous inquiry?
- 28 A. For another purpose.
- 29 217 Q. CHAIRMAN: So in other words, your team, I suggest no

1			criticism or anything like that, maybe somebody might	
2			criticise it, that's is not for me. But this	
3			information had been sought and obtained?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	218	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Back in, whenever it was?	12:29
6		Α.	In 2010.	
7			CHAIRMAN: '10. Sorry, Mr. Marrinan, thank you.	
8	219	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: So in any event, if we just then move	
9			on, in response to your letter of the 8th May that we	
10			just opened, you receive a letter from Superintendent	12:29
11			Frank Walsh, who is the private secretary to the	
12			Commissioner, dated 13th May 2015. It's at 3990, if we	
13			could have that up on the screen. If we scroll down.	
14			He says:	
15				12:29
16			"I am directed by the Commissioner to refer to yours of	
17			8th May 2015.	
18				
19			The Commissioner has directed that you continue with	
20			your investigation into the criminal element of this	12:29
21			matter and that you make the necessary arrangements for	
22			an appointment under the disciplinary regulations	
23			through the member's divisional officer.	
24				
25			Please keep this office advised of developments in	12:30
26			relation to the criminal aspects and any decisions as	
27			regards suspensi on. "	
28				
29			So this is a defining moment in terms of the	

- 1 fact-finding investigation.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 220 Q. Has become a criminal investigation. Then the 4 disciplinary aspect is also to be pursued, is that

5 right?

- 6 That's correct, Chairman, yes. My role in that at this Α. juncture would be to ensure that information available 7 8 to the investigation team that would indicate a breach of discipline, would put into a report and forwarded to 9 the local chief, as is outlined there, is responsible 10 12:30 11 for discipline in their divisions. But where a chief superintendent is involved themselves or an allegation 12 13 against a chief superintendent has been made, it has to raise up one rank. 14 In fact, it was my colleague -- I 15 sent my report back to the Commissioner and then she 12:31 16 appointed Assistant Commissioner Kieran Kenny, who was 17 then based in the Northern Region, and who held that 18 part of the portfolio of the thing, of the section I 19 was then in administrative charge of, but he held the 20 legal and compliance part of that portfolio and that's 12:31 why he was asked by the Commissioner. And again to 21 22 take it out of my office, because I was involved and to 23 ensure that it was -- you know, that there was 24 objectivity involved, he was asked to make the appointment, which he did. 25 12:31
- 26 221 Q. CHAIRMAN: So you handed over the disciplinary --
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 222 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- elements that had been established, so to speak, by the investigation.

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	223	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You handed that back to the Commissioner and	
3			the Commissioner appointed	
4		Α.	And named the people against whom breaches had been	
5			alleged.	12:32
6	224	Q.	CHAIRMAN: of course.	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	225	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Now, if we could just have 3993 up on	
9			the screen, please. After you had received the letter	
10			from the Commissioner, you then write to the executive	12:32
11			director of Human Resource and People Development. I	
12			think that was on John Barrett, is that right?	
13		Α.	That's correct. And just for the information of the	
14			Tribunal again, from the time I had written to the	
15			assistant commissioner HRM until this time, there had	12:32
16			been a change in personnel. This position was now	
17			filled by a civilian. It was a long time arrangement,	
18			the Commissioner had agreed that the HR function would	
19			be headed by an executive director. That appointment	
20			happened between from the time of my last	12:33
21			correspondence, which was to an assistant commissioner,	
22			I was now writing to an executive director.	
23	226	Q.	I think that if we scroll down, this concerns the	
24			operational status of Garda A. You set out the	
25			evidence there and you seek his views in relation to	12:33
26			the appropriate course of action. If you scroll down.	
27			There you say:	
28				

"In light of this evidence, I believe that

29

1	consideration should now be given to the operational	
2	status of Garda A"	
3		
4	That's what you had pointed out.	
5		12:3
6	" to the Commissioner."	
7		
8	And then you go through the strength of the evidence.	
9	We needn't open this. And the seriousness of the	
10	allegations. You deal with the risk to members of the	12:3
11	public. Scroll down. Colleagues. All the issues we	
12	had opened earlier on, you deal with them all. If we	
13	scroll down. You say:	
14		
15	"The issue of suspending Garda A is something which now	12:3
16	requires consideration. At present there are serious	
17	allegations and the investigation team is endeavouring	
18	to corroborate or indeed disprove the veracity of the	
19	allegations. I am seeking your views on the	
20	appropriate course of action to be adopted."	12:3
21		
22	Can I just ask you this, because the previous year an	
23	issue arose in relation to Garda Keogh, in terms of	
24	seeking his consent to have the statement sent to HR	
25	and him refusing to allow you to send the statement to	12:3
26	HR. There's no question here that a statement is being	
27	sent to HR. So can we take it that the request that	
28	was made of Garda Keogh in 2014, in September, for the	

statement to be sent, wasn't fatal, because there was

	1	actually no	application,	is :	that	riaht?
--	---	-------------	--------------	------	------	--------

- 2 Absolutely, Chairman. I am not of the view that was Α. 3 fatal in any regard. I had given précis of the evidence to avail of at that early juncture and it 4 5 wasn't included in this latest application because we 12:35 knew Garda Keogh's view on it. 6 But in any event, all 7 of the issues that were pertinent to the consideration 8 of that application were there for anyone to look at. So I don't consider that that was fatal in any regard, 9 that a statement wasn't made available. Because I was 10 12:36 11 making available the context of again, as I say, the unique circumstances I was in dealing with protected 12 13 disclosure, that as much as I could disclose was being 14 done in the context of ensuring that other processes 15 could be performed in the context of... 12:36
- 16 227 Q. We have had evidence from Garda Keogh in relation to 17 this and, indeed, some cross-examination by Mr. Kelly 18 of Detective Superintendent Mulcahy.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 228 Q. On the fact that Garda Keogh wasn't advised that in some way that his refusal could have consequences and impact on the suspension of Garda A. In other words, that it was a precondition, almost, to suspension occurring. What do you say in relation to that?

- 25 A. I don't believe that the fact that Garda Keogh didn't 12:37 26 give permission had any impact on a decision to suspend 27 or not suspend Garda A.
- 28 229 Q. Okay. If we move on then to 3996, this is 29 Mr. Barrett's response. You see:

1				
2			"Your recommendations on this matter would be	
3			appreci ated. "	
4		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
5	230	Q.	Your response to that is at 3998:	12:37
6				
7			"The Commissioner has directed that an appointment is	
8			made in respect of An Garda Síochána discipline	
9			regulations and has nominated assistant commissioner,	
10			Northern Region, to make the appointment. Local	12:38
11			management, on being updated of this appointment by	
12			HRPD, will be asked to consider the member's deployment	
13			status."	
14				
15			So in the meantime, if we could look at a letter at	12:38
16			sorry we have already had this. You dealt with the	
17			issue of the discipline, which is set out there.	
18			There's no need to open that, Mr. Kavanagh	
19		Α.	I think, Chairman, again just to help the Tribunal, in	
20			the context of those latest pieces of correspondence we	12:39
21			just opened there, in particular the letters from HR	
22			looking for my recommendation.	
23	231	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	I had sent my file up for their consideration. I felt,	
25			and it was possibly because Mr. Barrett was new to this	12:39
26			area and, in fact, the chief superintendent who was now	
27			in the space that looked after that aspect of policy	
28			was brand new as well and hadn't any previous	
29			experience in that area. So I felt this letter	

1			shouldn't I shouldn't be asked for my	
2			recommendations.	
3	232	Q.	CHAIRMAN: It's passing the buck back to you?	
4		Α.	It wasn't for me to make a recommendation. But I had	
5			given as much as I could. It now was between	12:39
6			themselves and local management.	
7	233	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I see the point.	
8		Α.	To go through this matter.	
9	234	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You said, if I understand it, your attitude	
10			was, look, I am in a position to fill in the	12:40
11			information	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	235	Q.	CHAIRMAN: that is set out in the primary and	
14			secondary criteria.	
15		Α.	Yes.	12:40
16	236	Q.	CHAIRMAN: This is what I am doing, I am sending it up.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	237	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Now, please make a decision. Don't come	
19			back and say, what do you think we should do?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:40
21	238	Q.	CHAIRMAN: However, there it is. These big	
22			organisations.	

So I did consult after that, because I didn't -- I knew

it was a very serious matter, I didn't want to leave it

I felt I had to. I did consult with now

12:40

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α.

hanging.

- once that's done, it's a matter for local management.
- 2 So that's what I did.
- 3 239 Q. CHAIRMAN: Am I understanding from your letter,
- 4 commissioner, that the assistant commissioner in the
- 5 northern division wasn't going to do the investigation, 12:41

12 · 41

12:41

12:41

12.41

- 6 he was going to nominate somebody to do the
- 7 investigation?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 240 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is that correct?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 241 Q. CHAIRMAN: In fact, is that how Commissioner Nolan came
- into the picture?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 242 Q. CHAIRMAN: I know he retired at a later stage and no
- doubt we will hear about that, but is that how he came
- into the picture? Because I hadn't heard that
- 17 Commissioner Kenny was involved?
- 18 A. And the reason, Commissioner Kenny held, as I said, a
- 19 portion of that portfolio.
- 20 243 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand,
- 21 A. Which gave him administrative authority.
- 22 244 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm with you.
- 23 A. Which meant that he could in effect appoint someone of
- 24 his own rank.
- 25 245 Q. CHAIRMAN: Indeed?
- A. And that's what happened.
- 27 246 Q. CHAIRMAN: That is what I am understanding from what
- you said.
- 29 A. Yes.

1 CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you.

2 247 But in any event, the next significant MR. MARRINAN: Q. 3 event that takes place I think is on 5th October 2015, which is a report that was sent by Superintendent Pat 4 5 Murray to Chief Superintendent Wheatley, outlining that 12:42 6 Garda A had informed him at a meeting that he had been 7 served with disciplinary forms relating to seven 8 allegations of serious breach of discipline against him. That's at page 4001 of the material. I think 9 arising out of that, we don't need to go through it, we 12:42 10 11 have already had it, Superintendent Murray was asked 12 about it, we have a letter then on 7th October 2015 at 13 page 4000. If we could have that up on the screen.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

This raises the issue of the deployment status there of 12:43
Garda A. It appears that there were a number of correspondence then, which I don't think is necessary to go into, they're there. There's an e-mail from Assistant Commissioner Fanning to Deputy Commissioner John Twomey. But I think for our purposes it's 12:43 sufficient then to go forward to a report on 8th October 2015, which is at page 4005 of the material, which is a report from Superintendent Murray again to his chief superintendent, dealing with additional information received from a Garda John Ryan, which had 12:43 been passed on to your lead investigator?

27 A. Yes.

28 248 Q. Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. Because he considered that it was relevant to the investigation?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 249 Q. Isn't that right?
- 3 A. That's correct.
- 4 250 Q. I think that there was then correspondence with Chief
- 5 Superintendent Wheatley, and she has dealt with this,

12.44

- 6 to Assistant Commissioner Fanning. This all concerned
- 7 the issue of whether or not Garda A ought to be
- 8 suspended in the first instance. But I think initially
- 9 he was put on indoor duties and then he was suspended,
- is that right?
- 11 A. That is what I believe from reading the files,
- 12 Chairman. From the time I sent my response to HR in
- June that year, I felt now the suspension of any
- 14 member, of that member in particular, is a now a matter
- for HR and local management. And it wasn't until this
- 16 correspondence or another piece of correspondence came
- in much later, that I raised a guery again about the
- status, because I felt at that stage it should have
- been dealt with in the context of -- I presume it was
- dealt with in the context of what I had sent was looked 12:45
- at and somebody made a decision, no, we won't be
- 22 suspending.
- 23 251 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- A. But that piece of correspondence you opened there in
- relation to Pat Murray writing in about this additional 12:45
- piece of information.
- 27 252 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Yes.
- 28 A. Obviously we were very interested in the meat of that
- 29 for your investigation.

- 1 253 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 2 A. But here we have another local manager had something --
- 3 254 O. CHAIRMAN: He has information.
- 4 A. He has information that he can consider now in the
- 5 context of suspension of the member being made.
- 6 255 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Your diary entries may help in this
- 7 regard, at 11363. If we look there at the diary entry
- for the 9th October. If you scroll down. There are a
- 9 number of phone calls there --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 256 Q. -- that might illuminate the situation and assist you
- in this regard.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 257 Q. You receive, if we look there, a phone call, 18:57,
- 15 from Detective Superintendent Mulcahy:

12:46

12:46

12:46

12:46

- "Searches of both house have taken place. Phones, sims
- 18 and computers taken."
- 19

16

- That's in relation to a search of Garda A's house;
- isn't that right?
- 22 A. What exactly are you looking at now? What date are you
- talking about.
- 24 258 Q. Sorry, the 9th October there?
- 25 A. Yes, the 9th.
- 26 259 Q. If you look down, 18:57?
- 27 A. I see that, yes.
- 28 260 Q. You see there.
- 29 A. I see that, yes.

- 1 261 Q. Then shortly afterwards there is a phone call with Matt
- 2 Nyland?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 262 Q. Keeping him up-to-date in relation to that development,
- 5 I assume. Then you advised him that suspension was a

12 · 47

12:47

12:47

12 · 48

- 6 matter for local management?
- 7 A. Okay.
- 8 263 Q. But he said his section was available if required. And
- 9 then at 19:21 you got another phone call from Detective
- 10 Superintendent Mulcahy?
- 11 A. Actually I rang him.
- 12 264 Q. Pardon?
- 13 A. I rang him.
- 14 265 Q. You rang him, you updated on "IA advice" what advice?
- 15 A. That's Internal Affairs.
- 16 266 O. Internal Affairs.
- 17 A. So, all of that, I mean I am dealing with two issues
- there, in those notes.
- 19 267 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. So this piece of information came to light.
- 21 268 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. We immediately actioned it. And at the same time the
- 23 whole question of suspension of Garda A also was being
- 24 moved then from the Athlone side. And there was a
- 25 piece of correspondence from Assistant Commissioner
- 26 Fanning, where he asked a question about the
- 27 suspension. I was at that stage, I see the 9th
- October, yeah, I rang my Dublin office and asked my
- 29 superintendent in my office to make contact with Matt

1 Nyland about those, he was already aware of them in the 2 context of the suspension. Like, it really wasn't my 3 business at this stage but I was just anxious to ensure that things weren't going to fall between stools. 4 5 269 Yes. Q. 12:48 I established through that chain of calls, from 6 Α. 7 Internal Affairs, that the suspension should now be 8 considered by local management. And I just asked the detective superintendent to pass that on to local 9 10 management, to the local superintendent, who was Pat 12 · 49 11 Murray at that time. 12 Yes. And you have a diary entry then for the 10th 270 Q. 13 October, which is the same day, you will see a diary 14 entry? 15 Yeah, I see that. Α. 12:49 16 You see at 19:06 you spoke to Detective Superintendent 271 Ο. 17 Mulcahy? 18 Yes. Α. 19 272 And he advised you that he had spoken with Q. 20 Superintendent Pat Murray. 12:49 21 Yes. Α. 22 And that Garda A had been put back in uniform that 273 0. 23 morning. 24 Yes. Α. 25 And that the examinations of the items seized during 274 0. 12:49 26 the course of the search were to be given priority, 27 isn't that right?

28

29

Α.

So a few matters there as well, that are not related

but all form part of the one call. He passed on the

1			message I asked him to pass on and obviously at that	
2			stage action had been taken locally, because in lieu of	
3			suspension at times local management can take someone	
4			from a particular role.	
5	275	Q.	CHAIRMAN: of course.	12:49
6		Α.	And that is what happened there.	
7	276	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
8		Α.	That Garda A was put back into uniform, from plain	
9			clothes. And then I just obviously, part of my view,	
10			that the examination of the items seized should be	12:50
11			given priority, of the most recent searches, yes.	
12	277	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: If we look at page 11033, this is a	
13			letter from Chief Superintendent Séan Ward from	
14			Internal Affairs.	
15		Α.	Yes.	12:50
16	278	Q.	To Chief Superintendent Wheatley. If we look at the	
17			last paragraph, it says:	
18				
19			"With regard to your consideration in respect of the	
20			status of the member concerned, it is requested that	12:50
21			you consider the matter."	
22				
23			Do you see that?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	279	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That is not bringing things very far	12:50
26			forward.	
27	280	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: "matter in line with HQ directive	
28			73/15. In doing so you may wish to consult with	
29			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and Superintendent	

Т			Murray to establish detail required to complete the	
2			review under the standard headings."	
3				
4			So in other words, to support your contention, this is	
5			a matter that was then being dealt with with the	12:51
6			divisional officer?	
7		Α.	Yeah. Now the focus had changed to Athlone as distinct	
8			from my investigation team. But there was an	
9			appreciation that my investigation team may have to	
10			have some input again if they wanted a completely fresh	12:51
11			primary and secondary consideration, suspension file	
12			sent in. Which appears that is what they were looking	
13			for in that regard.	
14	281	Q.	Yes. We have heard evidence from Chief Superintendent	
15			Wheatley and there is no need to open the	12:51
16			correspondence, but she was recommending the suspension	
17			of Garda A?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	282	Q.	And Garda A was in fact suspended.	
20		Α.	Mm-hmm.	12:51
21			CHAIRMAN: On the 14th October, as I understand it.	
22	283	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: On the 14th October, and Garda Keogh has	
23			an entry on that date indicating that he became aware	
24			of it on that date. Just to deal with Garda Keogh's	
25			complaints in relation to some of these matters. In	12:52
26			relation to the suspension, Garda Keogh complains that	
27			the fact that it wasn't explained to him that his	
28			failure to consent to his statement being made	
29			available to HR and he spent some time on this we	

have it on Day 109, I am not going to open the relevant sections because it seems that you have already dealt with this.

4 A. Yes.

Α.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

5 284 Q. But insofar as he makes the complaint that he wasn't 12:52 informed of the consequences, your answer to that is, you say there were no consequences arising from it, is that right?

That's correct. I didn't inform him. I can't say exactly what wording the detective superintendent would 12:53 have used when he went to convey the message that HR had sought this statement. But in any event, I am of the firm belief that it had no impact whatsoever, that there was ample information available through my own team and what we provided. And it was my own view, 12:53 even at that early stage, that there wasn't ample grounds for suspension in August/September of 2014. That changed in May of '15, when I submitted a renewed application, where I could ask them to consider on the basis that now we had considered all the points 12:53 It was a matter then for HR and local relevant. management. And, as we have seen through what you have opened up here on the screen, that by October there was even an additional layer that could be considered by local management, which was shared with us but we were 12:54 just interested in the issue of the investigation of that matter and the suspension was then of no concern to our team on the basis that it was local management that were dealing with it.

- 1 285 Q. And insofar as Garda Keogh's complaints in relation to
  2 -- in some way, in the first instance a suggestion that
  3 the failure to suspend Garda A constituted some form of
  4 targeting of him, we will put it in the first instance
  5 as almost inadvertently or negligently, what do you say 12:55
  6 in relation to that?
- 7 I reject that completely, Chairman. I gave this my Α. 8 utmost attention at a time when the concerns of the confidential reporter came to me in good faith, with 9 10 these concerns. I dealt with them promptly. 12:55 11 dealing with some of them even before they became 12 concerns for Garda Keogh. On that basis, I can't 13 accept that.

Then there is the bigger suggestion, as it were, that

12:55

12:56

12:56

this was done deliberately. What do you say to that?

A. Deliberately? Again, I reject that completely,

Chairman. I am not saying that my investigation was

flawless, of course everything can be improved on, but

I can assure you if there are flaws in my

investigation, they're not deliberate flaws.

14

26

27

28

29

286

Q.

21 287 Q. Have you identified any flaws that you have seen?

22 A. No, I haven't. You know, I think it has been -- my

23 report has been reviewed, I don't know what the outcome

24 of that was, but all I can say is, I suppose the one

25 office that really can be very thorough and searching

in relation to our submissions is the office of the DPP. My file was submitted there and there was no queries arising in relation to the standard of the investigative process that was undertaken.

- 1 288 Q. We will be coming to that in due course, but in terms 2 of Garda Keogh's perspective and perhaps sort of
- 3 empathising with his situation?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 289 Q. Having come forward and made the protected disclosure.

12:57

12:57

- 6 Can you understand how he may have felt in some way at
- 7 the time that the non-suspension of Garda A had made
- 8 life more difficult for him on the ground?
- 9 A. I accept that fully, Chairman. As I said earlier, I
- 10 met with Garda Keogh and all the meetings and
- correspondence, it was clear that he had very well held
- views in relation to some matters, which he was
- entitled to have. However, in managing all of that
- there is due process for everyone involved and that had
- to be applied. Just because one individual felt that a 12:57
- thing should happen, fine, we can consider that, we can
- give it our due attention and work through the process
- so that everyone's rights here are respected. And that
- is what I was trying to ensure across the board in the
- 20 context of my investigation and all the witnesses we
- dealt with, including the confidential reporter
- 22 himself.
- 23 290 Q. It seems that these aren't sort of manufactured
- complaints at this juncture. They seem to have been
- complaints that he raised at the time. He raised the
- issue of the interviewing in the Garda station?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 291 Q. You have dealt with that. And he doesn't have any
- complaints, even though we're aware of the fact that

1			other interviews took place, perhaps out of necessity,	
2			but they weren't certainly impacting on Garda Keogh	
3			during 2015. So you dealt with the issue when he	
4			raised it. He raised the issue of suspension, that it	
5			didn't pan out initially in his favour. But can you	12:58
6			understand why he may have a feeling at the time that	
7			perhaps more could have been done to give some sort of	
8			credibility to the allegations he was making?	
9		Α.	I think I have said it already, Chairman. I fully	
10			understand where Garda Keogh was coming from.	12:59
11	292	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	All I could do was what was then the statutory	
13			framework available to me, and ensure that he was	
14			informed of all the efforts that both myself and the	
15			team were making on his behalf in the context of the	12:59
16			complaints that he had made.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Okay. You're moving on to something else?	
18			MR. MARRINAN: Yes, I am moving on to something else.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thank you very much. We will	
20			take a break there. Thank you very much.	12:59
21				
22			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED AS	
23			FOLLOWS:	
24				
25			CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon.	14:01
26	293	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Now, I think if we move on to another	
27			issue that concerns Garda Keogh. And this is the	
28			involvement or the lack of involvement of your	
29			investigation into the Olivia O'Neill and the Liam	

1	McHugh complaints. In the first instance, if we put	
2	page 123 up on the screen. And scroll down. Sorry,	
3	it's 124, please. If you scroll down further. Scroll	
4	down. Scroll back up. Can we have page 125, please?	
5	If we scroll back up. I'm sorry, it goes over two 14	: 0
6	pages. Yes. Here we have the relevant paragraph.	
7	Garda Keogh says:	
8		
9	"On 16th July 2014, I am asked by Superintendent	
10	McBrien about my meeting with Liam McHugh. She also	: 0
11	looked for information about the informant. At this	
12	stage I had advised Donal Ó Cualáin and Judge McMahon	
13	on 16th July 2014 of what I perceived to be an attempt	
14	to interfere with the internal investigation. On the	
15	16th July Assistant Commissioner Donal Ó Cualáin rings 14	l : 0
16	me at 17:46 to say that he is not dealing with either	
17	the Olivia O'Neill or Liam McHugh matters, even though	
18	it appeared to me that they were conversely serious	
19	matters of interference here by police management in	
20	the investigation and that the Garda management spin of $^{14}$	ŀ:0·
21	coaching would be exposed as a bizarre contrivance if	
22	these matters were independently investigated."	
23		
24	If we could perhaps look at page 100 of the transcript.	
25	Can we go to page 59. If we scroll down to the last	⊦:0·
26	answer on that page, it's line 24. This is the	

"But this does not become rolled into the next thing

27

28

evidence that he gave to the Tribunal:

Т			that we are going to visit and it does become more	
2			sinister then you know, and there's the two of these	
3			then rolled together in the same week. They happened	
4			in the same week. This was the first, it was just an	
5			innocent thing. I hope I clarified that at the start."	14:06
6				
7			Then if we scroll down to line 15. He says:	
8				
9			"My point, my problem there is, I mean, it is really	
10			part of their investigation if the allegations are that	14:06
11			I am rounding up all these people to make complaints	
12			about Garda A, who is the subject of my main complaint,	
13			which Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin is	
14			investigating, like if that is the case my argument is,	
15			they should have looked at that."	14:06
16				
17			So that is the matter. He believes that these matters	
18			ought to have been independently investigated. Were	
19			you aware the matter, of the fact that he had raised	
20			this issue with Judge McMahon?	14:07
21		Α.	I can't be sure that I knew about the contact with	
22			Judge McMahon, but I knew that he had contacted	
23			Superintendent McBrien. And he also had contacted me	
24			in relation to these matters.	
25	294	Q.	If we just look at Garda Keogh's diary entry, at page	14:07
26			13264, please. It says there for the 8th July, the	
27			entry:	
28				
29			"9:00pm met with superintendent, who informed me she is	

1		sending people out again to try get statements from	
2		Olivia O'Neill and Liam McHugh. She is under pressure.	
3		Told her I was meeting judge Monday re this and I know	
4		who was behind it. She didn't reply."	
5			14:0
6		Then if we go to page 13265, there is a note to say:	
7			
8		"7:46 AC rings to say they are not dealing with	
9		complaints. Good progress."	
10			14:0
11		And then shortly afterwards, at 18:56, he received a	
12		call from Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. To what	
13		extent were you aware of the Olivia O'Neill and the	
14		Liam McHugh issue?	
15	Α.	I was aware to the extent that Garda Keogh informed me	14:0
16		about it. Also that Superintendent McBrien	
17		communicated in writing with Detective Superintendent	
18		Mulcahy. And I had a meeting then with the detective	
19		superintendent. We studied what was being asked of us	
20		and even more Detective Superintendent Mulcahy showed	14:0
21		me what he had got from the superintendent in Athlone,	
22		I was firmly of the view that this was nothing to do	
23		with my investigation and, in fact, that I couldn't get	
24		involved in it. That was the independently held view	
25		of Detective Superintendent Mulcahy when he arrived, on	14:1
26		the basis that everything I was dealing with were	
27		complaints that were made by the confidential reporter	
28		and what was being suggested or what was being included	

in the correspondence to me from Superintendent McBrien

1			indicated that these in nature were complaints against	
2			the confidential reporter. And I felt on that basis	
3			that there's no way I could get involved in making	
4			those part of my investigation. And I made sure that	
5			this was communicated back to the local management, so	14:10
6			that if it was felt that these matters needed to be	
7			one thing that the confidential reporter said to me,	
8			when I rang him to tell him that I wasn't taking it on,	
9			he seemed very satisfied with that at the time. That's	
10			a note I made in knew diary. And he also said that he	14:11
11			thought that there was no statement of complaint	
12			actually made yet, in any event. So Detective	
13			Superintendent Mulcahy did communicate with	
14			Superintendent McBrien in Athlone and passed on my	
15			advice in relation to the appointment of some	14:11
16			independent officer to look at these matters.	
17	295	Q.	If we could just look first of all when the matter was	
18			raised formally with you by Superintendent McBrien, her	
19			letter to Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, which is	
20			dated the 9th July, it's at page 3977. Do you see	14:11
21			there:	
22				
23			"On 2nd June 2014, Garda Aidan Lyons, Athlone, made a	
24			report regarding information he received from Mr. Liam	
25			McHugh concerning Garda Keogh. An e-mail outlining	14:12
26			this is attached.	
27				
28			I have requested that a statement regarding this	
29			allegation be taken from Mr. McHugh. Detective	

1	Sergeant Curley, who knows Mr. McHugh personally since	
2	childhood, has stated that he would not be the most	
3	suitable person to take a statement. Garda Tom	
4	Higgins, Athlone, met with Liam McHugh and invited him	
5	to make statement in relation to this incident.	14:12
6	Mr. McHugh refused to make a statement but undertook to	
7	think about it and maybe make himself available to	
8	provide such statement in the future.	
9		
10	I have considered and agree with Inspector Minnock and	14:12
11	Detective Sergeant Curley's view that in light of your	
12	investigation, it might be more appropriate and	
13	impartial if someone from outside this district	
14	approached Mr. McHugh to ascertain if he is willing to	
15	make a statement. In the circumstances, would it be	14:13
16	possible for Detective Inspector Coppinger to arrange	
17	to interview Liam McHugh in this regard? Inspector	
18	Mi nnock "	
19		
20	And he gives the number:	14:13
21		
22	"will assist to arrange the meeting.	
23		
24	Garda Keogh is aware that I know about the allegation.	
25	He informed me last night that he is meeting his	14:13
26	confidential recipient on Monday and he will be making	
27	him aware of it."	
28		
29	So that's how matters stood at that time. Did you look	

1 at the report that came in from Garda Lyons	1	at the	report	that	came	in	from	Garda	Lyons
---	---	--------	--------	------	------	----	------	-------	-------

O'Neill and Liam McHugh.

- 2 A. I looked at the correspondence that came in to
  3 Detective Superintendent Mulcahy from Superintendent
- 4 McBrien, about that.
- 5 296 Q. Yes.

14:13

14:14

14:14

14 · 15

- 6 Before that, I had contacted -- the confidential Α. 7 reporter had contacted the superintendent around the 8 9th July on this matter, and then on the 11th I contacted the confidential reporter by phone and I told 9 him that I had been talking to the detective 10 14 · 14 11 superintendent earlier that day regarding his call of the 9th, in which he raised the issues of Olivia 12
- 14 297 Q. Yes.

13

- 15 And I informed him that I would be discussing it in Α. 16 detail with the detective superintendent at some close 17 date, the 14th, we had arranged a meeting, and that we 18 would have a look at it at that conference. That's the 19 chronology of -- and then at that conference, Detective 20 Superintendent Mulcahy will have brought the correspondence he had received and put it before me. 21 22 But at that juncture, given the knowledge I had of the 23 nature of the complaint or of the two people involved 24 and the nature and type of allegations that were being 25 made, I felt that it wasn't for my team. And both I 26 and Detective Superintendent Mulcahy were in agreement 27 on that matter.
- 28 298 Q. You have a note of that I think at page 3976 of the material, in your diary entries?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 299 Q. The 14th July. It just simply mirrors what you've just
- 3 told us.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 300 Q. Can you explain your reasoning for that and the view
- 6 that you took?
- 7 A. My reasoning is very simple, Chairman. I mean, I think

14:15

14:16

- 8 I would have been very badly exposed if I had started
- 9 to make enquiries about a matter in which a
- 10 confidential reporter had --
- 11 301 Q. CHAIRMAN: It would complicate things. It was going
- 12 two directions.
- 13 A. That was my view.
- 14 302 Q. CHAIRMAN: One was investigating what he complained
- about and another was investigating complaints about
- 16 him?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 303 Q. CHAIRMAN: It didn't make sense. I mean, there was a
- 19 certain advantage from the -- it was understandable
- 20 that the local management might have thought, here is a 14:16
- 21 heaven sent opportunity because these people are
- outside, independent and they're investigating?
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 304 Q. CHAIRMAN: So that might have commended itself to them.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 305 O. CHAIRMAN: But it wouldn't have made sense.
- 27 A. No.
- 28 306 Q. CHAIRMAN: At least that was your thinking.
- 29 A. It made no sense to me.

2	307	Q.	otherwise.	
3		Α.	And while I can fully understand Garda Keogh's thinking	
4		, <b></b>	on it at the time, it still didn't alleviate me of the	
5			issue that I was faced with.	14:16
6	308	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes, I understand.	14.10
7	300	Α.	Yes.	
8	309	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: In any event, Detective Superintendent	
9	303	۷.	Mulcahy writes to Superintendent McBrien on 15th July	
10			2014 and that's at 3978 of the material.	14:17
11		Α.	Yes.	17.17
12	310	Q.	He agrees, after reading the report:	
13	310	Q.	The agrees, arear reading the reports	
14			"I believe that the issues raised by Mr. Liam McHugh	
15			regarding Garda Nicholas Keogh may require further	14:17
16			i nvesti gati on.	
17				
18			As you are aware, the current investigation pertaining	
19			to Garda Keogh is investigating allegations outlined by	
20			the member himself. The report of Garda Lyons concerns	14:17
21			allegations made against Garda Keogh and I feel it may	
22			be prudent for an independent investigation to be	
23			conducted to progress these matters.	
24				
25			Perhaps this file can be forwarded to the chief	14:17
26			superintendent, Westmeath to determine the most	
27			appropriate and effective manner to investigate these	
28			allegations."	

1			You were happy that that dealt with the issue and you	
2			explained it to Garda Keogh, is that right?	
3		Α.	That's correct.	
4	311	Q.	And he at the time appeared happy that that should	
5			remain the situation?	14:18
6		Α.	well, that's reflected in my notes that I took at the	
7			time. I did make the phone call. I promised him I	
8			would, once the meeting had concluded, I did make that	
9			phone call.	
10	312	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean, suppose you had taken it over and	14:18
11			suppose you were satisfied that it was a disciplinary	
12			matter, would that have presented another difficulty,	
13			that you're conducting a criminal investigation on one	
14			side and a disciplinary	
15		Α.	Regardless, Chairman, of what was the outcome it would	14:18
16			have presented problems for my investigation.	
17			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Anyway, that's what you said and	
18			that's what you explained. Okay.	
19	313	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: So that was the end of the matter as far	
20			as you were concerned?	14:19
21		Α.	That's correct, Chairman, yes. We just got on with the	
22			rest of the investigation.	
23	314	Q.	Did it colour your view in any way in relation to Garda	
24			Keogh? I mean, the two allegations, Olivia O'Neill and	
25			Liam McHugh, on one reading, constitute, you know,	14:19
26			Garda Keogh going and coaching witnesses to come	
27			forward and to make false allegations against Garda A,	
28			certainly in relation to Liam McHugh. Did that colour	
29			your view in any sense or did you just decide, this	

1			isn't a matter for us and we're not going to examine	
2			it?	
3		Α.	That's it. Absolutely not, did not colour my view in	
4			any way, shape or form. And I know from my interaction	
5			with Garda Keogh at that time that he seemed perfectly	14:19
6			satisfied with the approach I was taking and I was	
7			happy with that.	
8	315	Q.	Sorry, I just lost the page here. I will return to it.	
9			So if we move on then to the examination of or the	
10			entry of information that was inputted into Pulse.	14:20
11			When did you become aware of the Pulse entry?	
12		Α.	Again, I'm not certain when I became aware of it	
13			exactly, but it was something that was spoken of at my	
14			conferences early on. But I am not sure on what basis	
15			I did become aware of it.	14:21
16	316	Q.	Yes. The first note of it appears to be at page 3911	
17			of the materials. This is on the 16th July. Detective	
18			Superintendent Mulcahy, in his statement to the	
19			Tribunal, says:	
20				14:21
21			"On the 15th July I received a text from the reporter	
22			asking if I could make contact. I rang him at 18:52	
23			and he spoke to me regarding his superintendent asking	
24			him about the intelligence he had put on Pulse and	
25			asking if he had information. I advised him we were	14:21
26			not investigating the Pulse incident. He advised me	
27			where the intelligence had come from. I explained to	
28			him that his supervisor had an obligation to ensure	
29			that any intelligence placed on the system was	

1	correct.	11
	COLLECT.	

3 was that your view also in relation to the matter? Again, it probably was the detective 4 Α. 5 superintendent who brought it to my attention around 14:22 that time, if he had noted it. I suppose the content 6 7 of that Pulse entry was already before -- and was 8 included in Garda Keogh's statement, as far as I'm aware, or some aspects of it. Where the division came 9 here was, the information that was in the Pulse 10 14.22 11 incident and the responsibilities of the local chief 12 superintendent in relation to the management of Covert 13 Human Intelligence Sources. So, while I -- the 14 information was from the point of view of -- our 15 investigation, we would pursue whatever information the 14:23 16 confidential reporter wanted to make available to us in the context of those issues, but if something else 17 18 arose externally, then that was not a matter for me in 19 the context of how that appeared on Pulse, why it 20 appeared on Pulse. That was a matter for local 14:23 21 management.

22 317 Q. I'm not going to open it all because we have already
23 had the correspondence that went back and forth in
24 relation to this to various departments of An Garda
25 Síochána, but this issue, there was a question raised
26 in relation to this from the assistant commissioner in
27 the Eastern Region. If we could just have page 10824

2829

up on the screen, please. This is your letter to him:

14 · 23

1			"Regarding the Pulse intelligence dated 18th May 2014,	
2			this was created approximately three weeks prior to the	
3			garda in question commencing his statement to"	
4				
5			Sorry can you see it there?	14:24
6		Α.	I can see it.	
7	318	Q.	" Detective Superintendent Mulcahy and Detective	
8			Inspector Coppinger.	
9				
10			The matters outlined in his intelligence report are of	14:24
11			a very serious nature. The difficulty that arises for	
12			the investigation team is that the matters are still	
13			under investigation. Furthermore, to discuss with any	
14			third party the contents of that statement would be a	
15			breach of confidentiality, which is the whole basis of	14:25
16			the confidential reporting legislation.	
17				
18			The allegations contained in the intelligence report	
19			have again been alluded to in his statement to the	
20			investigation team, but to date they have been	14:25
21			unsubstantiated. The creation of the intelligence	
22			report is not a matter, I believe, that the	
23			investigation team can directly investigate. I feel	
24			that this is a matter perhaps for both the divisional	
25			officer and district officer to deal with, in whose	14:25
26			division the garda in question is currently serving. I	
27			understand that Detective Superintendent Mulcahy has	
28			spoken to both the divisional and district officers in	
29			respect of this matter."	

Τ				
2			And certainly that was your view at the time, isn't	
3			that right?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	319	Q.	And that remains your view in relation to this, is that	14:25
6			right?	
7		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
8	320	Q.	The matter didn't go away. It did as far as you were	
9			concerned, but again, I think that you have a	
10			communication with Superintendent Walsh, private	14:26
11			secretary to the Commissioner, in 2015, the 18th March.	
12			It's at 10847. If we just scroll down, just the second	
13			paragraph:	
14				
15			"As outlined, it is agreed that the alleged criminal	14:26
16			allegations contained in the intelligence report"	
17				
18			And then you give the Pulse number.	
19				
20			"has certain similarities to a section of a	14:26
21			statement made by the confidential reporter and are	
22			being investigated as part of the overall investigation	
23			under the Garda regulations.	
24				
25			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy also reports that	14:26
26			whilst the investigation is being conducted in respect	
27			of certain matters contained within the	
28			intelligence"	
29				

1			And then you give the number.	
2				
3			"the investigation is not focusing on inputting of	
4			this data on the Pulse system."	
5				14:27
6			Isn't that right?	
7		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
8	321	Q.	We know that subsequently there was, as it were, a	
9			debate in relation to this internally in An Garda	
10			Síochána, but as far as you were concerned that was	14:27
11			your only dealings in relation to it?	
12		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
13	322	Q.	And what do you say to the allegation that is made by	
14			Garda Keogh in this regard, that this was a matter that	
15			you should have been investigating?	14:27
16		Α.	Chairman, this is a matter I was investigating.	
17	323	Q.	I mean the input of the information.	
18		Α.	The inputting of it. Again, if there was an issue with	
19			that, it was an issue that Garda Keogh did something	
20			wrong. I wasn't in any way pursuing any and neither	14:28
21			was it my business to.	
22	324	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes, the essence of the material in the	
23			thing you were investigating?	
24		Α.	Yes, we already had that.	
25	325	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	14:28
26		Α.	As part of a statement. This was, I suppose	
27	326	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But whether it was right or wrong of Garda	
28			Keogh.	
29		Δ	Vac	

- 1 327 Q. CHAIRMAN: To do it or to do it in this manner --
- 2 A. To do it in that manner.

- 3 328 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- or whatever, those were outside, you thought, your remit?
- 5 A. That's right. And within the division, the chief
  6 superintendent of any division had responsibility for
  7 the management or covert human intelligence sources and
  8 it would be his business to ensure that any matters
  9 that are put onto the Pulse system in that manner, that
  10 they can be backed up and that they -- on that basis it 14:28
- 12 329 Q. CHAIRMAN: That was in his bailiwick?
- It was in his bailiwick, indeed. Now, I have to say, I 13 Α. 14 fully again understand the confidential reporter's need to feel that he had to do that. If he felt he needed 15 16 to air this, that was his prerogative. And all I 17 wanted to do was to ensure that whatever the issues 18 were coming out of it in the context of my 19 investigation, that they were fully pursued as part of 20 my investigation.

14:29

14:29

14 . 29

was very much in local Garda management --

- 21 330 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Now, there is an overlap in relation to
  22 some of the complaints that Garda Keogh has made and I
  23 think we have effectively dealt substantially with a
  24 large number of them. In terms of Garda Keogh and
  25 Garda A being left on the same shift, was that
  26 something that you were aware of or concerned about?
- A. Again, it would have come up as part of the discourse at our meetings, etcetera, if Garda Keogh had raised this with the detective superintendent. And again,

1		here were issues	
2	331 Q.	CHAIRMAN: Am I being picky if I say I'm not sure they	
3		were on the same shift, but they were on overlapping	
4		shifts? Am I being wrong or picky or incorrect?	
5		MR. MARRINAN: The complaint is that they	14:30
6		CHAIRMAN: I thought the complaint was that Garda A was	
7		present in the station, not necessarily that it was	
8		so, I am sorry to be picky, but I am not sure it was	
9		the same shift.	
10		MR. MARRINAN: Yes. Initially the complaint was the	14:30
11		same shift but then it became an overlap.	
12		CHAIRMAN: They were overlapping, I thought. And it	
13		was the presence in the station. In comes to the same	
14		thing in the end but it doesn't mean that it's	
15		inevitable that they will be together for all the time.	14:30
16		But the point essentially remains. Sorry.	
17		MR. KELLY: If it helps, Chairman, my understanding of	
18		it was that they were on shifts that very often	
19		overlapped.	
20		CHAIRMAN: Precisely. They weren't on the same shift.	14:31
21		So that they were both together in the I mean, the	
22		same essential point is, they were both in the station	
23		at the same time and Garda Keogh said, look, that's a	
24		difficulty for me.	
25		MR. KELLY: That's the gravamen.	14:31
26		CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you very much. I'm sorry?	
27		MR. CONLON: I'm sorry, Chairman, forgive me. My	
28		client, our understanding was that they were on	
29		different units, which were in different buildings.	

1	They may be on the same they had half an overlap, I	
2	think was her evidence.	
3	CHAIRMAN: I understand. Your client was:	
4	MR. CONLON: I am for Superintendent McBrien.	
5	CHAIRMAN: If I may stop you for a second. Maybe I	14:31
6	shouldn't have started, maybe it's all my mistake.	
7	Mr. Marrinan said they were on the same shifts. A bell	
8	rang in my head, in my tedious, pedantic fashion, that	
9	said I'm not so sure, I know they were there at the	
10	same time, but I thought it was overlapping shifts. So	14:32
11	I am sorry, Mr. Marrinan, I apologise. And the point,	
12	as Mr. Kelly correctly points out, is that the essence	
13	of the matter, the gravamen of it is that they were, so	
14	to speak, in each other's pockets, bumping into each	
15	other or whatever it was.	14:32
16	MR. MARRINAN: I think that we will see, at page 50 of	
17	the material, this is Garda Keogh's statement to our	
18	investigators, that is the state of the evidence at	
19	that stage. He says:	
20		14:32
21	"I raised my concerns re Garda A being on the	
22	same/proximate shifts with the detective superintendent	
23	of the investigation team. Just for clarification, I	
24	was not on the same shift as Garda A all of the time	
25	but most of the time I was on the same shift as him."	14:32
26		
27	The evidence he gave was that there	
28	CHAIRMAN: As we say, as Mr. Kelly comes to,	
29	essentially the point is that they were together in and	

1 about the station.

2 That leads me on to the last sub-issue, 332 MR. MARRINAN: Q. 3 as it were, that's in relation to the incident where Garda Keogh said that Garda A took his firearm from a 4 5 safe near the public office. That has also changed 6 It appears that the safe was out of view, 7 but there was a book that you had to enter in the fact 8 that you had taken the firearm out and that was proximate to the public office. Could you just assist 9 us in relation to that? We know, and you've told us, 10 11 that Superintendent McBrien made reference to this at 12 the meeting on the 23rd September in Garda 13 Headquarters.

14:33

14:33

14 A. Mm-hmm.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

333 Other than that, were you aware of this incident? Q. 14:34 You see, I had appointed Detective Superintendent Α. Mulcahy to liaise both with the confidential reporter and with local management on issues of welfare and that type and any concerns that the confidential reporter was raising with him at his meetings, that that would 14:34 be communicated back. And that any of those issues that could be remedied, would be remedied. There was an issue of -- there was some suggestion that there was Garda A at the time was a detective, he was a firearm. entitled to hold a firearm. He may have had a storage 14:34 facility in the station where he would leave it when off duty. Other members who were allocated firearms from time to time, that wouldn't have a personal issue, as it's called, would have to go to an armoury and sign

1 one out as they required it. I'm not sure of the exact 2 circumstances of it, but I would assume based on the fact that he was a detective, that he would have had a 3 personal issued firearm. That was raised at that 4 5 meeting by Superintendent McBrien, who felt that there 14:35 was no issue in the context of risk, that kind of 6 7 Like, of course these are matters that always thing. 8 have to be kept under review in the context of members, and I am talking generally now, Chairman, in relation 9 to the carrying of firearms. So people would be very 10 14:35 11 aware of that all the time.

- 12 Concerning the failure to arrest Garda A, can you tell 334 Q. us what your view is in relation to the complaint in 13 14 that regard?
- 15 I don't see it as a failure, Chairman. This was -- the 14:35 Α. 16 investigation was carried out by a highly competent and efficient and experienced team of detectives. They did 17 18 their business, they got to a conclusion on the basis 19 of what was uncovered over the investigation. 20 an arrest one needs reasonable suspicion. I can't direct anyone else to arrest another person, that 21 22 person themselves needs to come to that conclusion in their own minds, that they have reasonable suspicion. 23 24 That was a matter for the team I had appointed. And I 25 think I heard Detective Superintendent Mulcahy's testimony yesterday, where he hadn't reached that in 26 27 his own mind. And on that basis, I can't second guess. But it wasn't a failure to arrest. It was the way that 28 29 the investigation was managed.

14:36

1	335	Q.	There's also a complaint that Garda A was given
2			preferential treatment because he was given a summary
3			of the case against him. You heard yesterday the
4			evidence from Detective Superintendent Mulcahy.

5 A. Yes.

6 336 Q. As to how he went about the interviewing of Garda A?

7 A. Yes.

8 337 Q. Would you like to make some observations in relation to that?

Well again, while I was fully conversant with all 10 Α. 14:37 11 aspects of the investigation, these were the hands on 12 people, as it were, the people who were at the pulse of 13 the actual investigation. Whatever decisions they 14 made, I would have respected it, on the basis that I 15 would have been told, this is our planned approach to 14:37 16 this matter. Nothing that I could say would try to 17 convince them otherwise. I wasn't trying to convince 18 them otherwise. This is based on their experience and 19 how they wanted to progress with that aspect of the 20 investigation. 14:38

Now, during this timeframe in 2014, up until March of 21 338 Q. 22 2015, these issues had arisen and were of concern to 23 He seems to have been concerned about the Garda Keogh. 24 Olivia O'Neill incident, he was concerned about the 25 Liam McHugh incident. Because I suppose in some way 26 those reports coming through or what was said either by 27 Olivia O'Neill or what was interpreted as being said by 28 her, and what was said by Liam McHugh or what was 29 interpreted as to what he was actually saying, could

Т			have constituted coaching and therefore he was in some	
2			way encouraging people to come forward and make false	
3			statements. Did you hear any more about that in 2014	
4			from him?	
5		Α.	I can't recall if that was discussed again after that,	14:39
6			Chairman, no.	
7	339	Q.	Did you hear at all about the upshot of the	
8			investigations in relation to those two matters?	
9		Α.	I may have, Chairman, but it would have been a	
10			conversation, I had no note of it or no recollection	14:39
11			really.	
12	340	Q.	But he didn't raise the matter with you?	
13		Α.	I can't recall that he did, Chairman, no.	
14	341	Q.	With you again?	
15		Α.	No.	14:39
16	342	Q.	Were you happy that Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	
17			was in fairly regular contact with Superintendent	
18			McBrien concerning the welfare of Garda Keogh during	
19			that timeframe?	
20		Α.	Yes, I was, indeed, extremely happy. As I said before,	14:39
21			this was always one very item, right at the very top of	
22			our agenda was Garda Keogh's welfare. And at the very	
23			early stages, when obviously his confidentiality had to	
24			be fully respected, I felt that was our responsibility	
25			and ours alone, until such time as then it became	14:40
26			public knowledge. That welfare onus then shifted to	
27			some extent onto the local management, who were best	
28			placed to deal with the day-to-day issues. But it	
29			didn't alleviate my team of what I considered our	

1			responsibility to ensure that he was regularly	
2			contacted and I think there's been a lot of records	
3			produced for the Tribunal that shows lots of contact	
4			between the detective superintendent and Garda Keogh,	
5			in both directions, where welfare issues were	14:40
6			discussed.	
7	343	Q.	So then if we move forward into 1st April 2015. There	
8			was an issue raised in Dáil Éireann, isn't that right,	
9			by Deputy Wallace, concerning Garda Keogh, do you	
10			recall that?	14:41
11		Α.	I recall yes, I have a general recollection of some	
12			statement in the Dáil, yes.	
13	344	Q.	Superintendent Pat Murray had taken up the reins in	
14			Athlone Garda Station at that time, isn't that right?	
15			Just in relation to your personal dealings with	14:41
16			Superintendent Murray, you know the suggestion is and	
17			has been made by Garda Keogh, that you put him into	
18			Athlone Garda Station and arranged for him to take up	
19			the role of superintendent to replace Superintendent	
20			McBrien. Would you like to comment on that?	14:42
21		Α.	I reject that completely, Chairman. Superintendent	
22			Murray I had known, the first I met him was when he	
23			came to, it was probably Gort. Gort and Loughrea	
24			districts from amalgamated at some stage during his	
25			tenure in Galway I would say. That was my first time	14:42
26			meeting Pat Murray. And he was a very efficient and	
27			professional officer in my view, while I had him on my	
28			team. I then moved on and I finished up in Dublin. I	
29			was aware, because of my duties in Dublin in supporting	

the Commissioner, and these were matters for the	
Commissioner to consider, the transfer of officers is	
something the Commissioner does. While at times there	
would be input sought in relation to she may, or he,	
whoever was in the office at the time, I used to	14:43
consult with my senior team and say, here are the	
allocations that we need to make, you know, we were	
looking for horses for courses, as it were, to get the	
best fit for all of our district. In the normal	
course, if you are promoted off a promotion list, you	14:43
are the most junior at that stage in your rank of	
super, therefore you get the last cut of the pie, as it	
were. So people already in office in districts who	
have applied to a transfer to some other district will	
get preference over people on a list. And that is what	14:43
happened Pat Murray when he got promoted; a vacancy	
came up in Gort district because somebody else had	
transferred back, I think it was to Cork at that time.	
I needed to fill that district, and the Commissioner of	
the day allocated Pat Murray to that district. As I	14:44
say, I never knew the man before that. And then in the	
normal course, if people are in a district that doesn't	
suit them, their domestic arrangements, they may and do	
apply for a transfer themselves, to get closer to home	
or to get to a district that is commutable for them.	14:44

So that was what Pat Murray would have done in this instance, I assume. He would have looked for his transfer. A vacancy arose in Athlone because

1			Superintendent McBrien had looked for a transfer back	
2			to the DMR, somewhere in the DMR here in Dublin, which	
3			would have suited her domestic arrangements. I think	
4			Pat lived somewhere in the midlands and he probably	
5			listed Athlone as one of the stations or one of the	14:44
6			districts that would suit him.	
7				
8			So as I say, I was in an administrative capacity at	
9			that stage in my role. I know that Commissioner	
10			O'Sullivan would ask me and John Twomey, who was my	14:45
11			colleague at the same level, about our knowledge of	
12			different people she mightn't have known. But as far	
13			as I know, I think Nóirín O'Sullivan was assistant	
14			commissioner in the Western Region when Pat was in	
15			Galway and I would say there was a common period there.	14:45
16			So she would have known Pat from her own service and	
17			having served in the west. Her decision was made. She	
18			just transferred people based on what the HR department	
19			gave her. Here's a list of people who applied to	
20			transfer, here are a list of people who are going to	14:45
21			retire and where the vacancies will open up, and here	
22			are a list of people who are on the new list and who	
23			can be promoted. And that's the way it worked.	
24	345	Q.	The suggestion is that he was put in there to scupper	
25			the investigation in some way. First of all, to what	14:46
26			extent was the investigation ultimately dependent on	
27			any evidence that Garda Keogh could give himself	
28			personally?	

Α.

He had allegations but he was depending on others to

1 substantiate them. He was pointing us in directions to 2 gather the evidence. 3 346 He had already set out his allegations. Q. 4 Α. 5 347 And they were well defined. Q. 14:46 6 And then when we explored that, those matters Α. 7 with him in his extended statement of complaint, he 8 would have indicated where we may go to find evidence to support that and individuals who would be in a 9 10 position to --14 · 46 11 348 At various stages he perhaps gave you additional Q. information if it became available to him? 12 13 Oh he did, of course. Α. 14 349 0. Yes. And he cooperated fully with the investigation 15 team in that regard? 14:47 16 He did, indeed, yes. Α. 17 350 But I am just wondering, because we know in May, we Q. 18 opened the letter earlier on, that you thought that the 19 issue of the suspension of Garda A should be 20 revisited --14:47 21 Yes. Α. 22 -- in the light of the new evidence of the billing 351 0. 23 records. 24 Yes. Α. That is sort of a month or a month and a half after 25 352 Ο. 14 · 47 26 Superintendent Murray is put in charge. What stage was the investigation at, at that stage? 27

28

29

Α.

well, we would have moved along on many lines.

said, at the start we had to sit down and just break

1			this investigation into nine separate modules, because	
2			there was nine separate elements that needed to be	
3			looked at separately. And at the same time prioritise	
4			which of those we would start first and in some way	
5			make as much inroads as we could. Some jobs, as we	14:4
6			call them, would involve looking for phone records, for	
7			example, or writing off to places, that could be done	
8			early on. Based on what came back from those, then you	
9			would create other jobs in the context of what came out	
10			of those.	14:4
11	353	Q.	CHAIRMAN: A follow up.	
12		Α.	Yes, a follow up. Yeah. So this, it just, it	
13			flowered. There was any number of avenues that open	
14			up.	
15	354	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You throw a stone into a pool.	14:4
16		Α.	That's it.	
17	355	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And it ripples out and you see if something	
18			turns up.	
19		Α.	Yes. I was adamant with my investigation team that we	
20			would follow every single one of those leads to a	14:4
21			conclusion. And that's what we did. So by, is it May	
22			or March, you said, of 2015, we had made some progress	
23			in some and better in others, but we still hadn't	
24			reached that bar, as the detective superintendent	
25			described yesterday in his mind, which would bring it	14:4
26			into the realm of a prima facie criminal case against	
27			any individual. And that's what happened at that	
28			stage, yes.	

356 Q. If we could just have page 2941 up on the screen. This

1			is the diary entry of Superintendent Pat Murray. And	
2			it says there:	
3				
4			"Wednesday, 1st April 2010.	
5				14:49
6			Calls from AC Ó Cualáin 9:58am, 1:45pm and 5:06pm	
7			re outburst in Dáil by Mick Wallace re whistleblower	
8			Athl one. "	
9				
10			And then another member of An Garda Síochána.	14:49
11				
12			"Explained re letter he sent to Clare Daly from	
13			district office and my conversation with Garda Keogh re	
14			his welfare, work supports and his work and car tax and	
15			what I was doing."	14:50
16				
17			The car tax issue, was that a matter you were aware of	
18			at that time?	
19		Α.	No, Chairman, I wasn't. This was something that	
20			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, who had uncovered it,	14:50
21			dealt with it in his own way, in the context of	
22			bringing it to the attention of the local super.	
23	357	Q.	Did he tell but that prior to this?	
24		Α.	He didn't, no. This was why I needed to make these	
25			calls on the day, this was something completely this	14:50
26			was out of the blue. This was a report, I presume, on	
27			radio during the day that we picked up and it was news	
28			to me. That's why I was trying to establish what was	
29			this about.	

1	358	Q.	What was your concern at that time?	
2		Α.	My concern was for Garda Keogh's welfare. Essentially,	
3			I suppose, what the deputies were doing in the Dáil was	
4			outlining the issues in the context of a confidential	
5			reporter and our duty as an organisation to protect	14:51
6			those individuals and ensure that their welfare was	
7			fully supported. So when this came up I needed to know	
8			what was going on locally. So that was the purpose of	
9			the call.	
10	359	Q.	He then goes on:	14:51
11				
12			"AC wanted to know who from Athlone was on to Mick	
13			Wallace. Told him general perception it was Garda	
14			Keogh. AC's last phone call was for me to ask Garda	
15			Keogh re his welfare considering he told Detective	14:51
16			Superintendent Mulcahy he felt people closing in on	
17			him."	
18				
19			And in particular he mentions a chief superintendent,	
20			but it clearly can't be right it has to be Murray	14:51
21			himself.	
22				
23			" when car tax and CMO were mentioned to him.	
24				
25			AC was complimentary of my handling of Garda Keogh and	14:52
26			his welfare to date."	
27				
28			What did Superintendent Murray outline to you?	
29		Δ.	I can't recall. I was aware vou see, as I mentioned	

1			earlier, when his identity became known locally, local	
2			management took a very hands on approach to ensuring	
3			welfare issues were remedied. I just wanted to ensure	
4			that continued. It was more or less saying, keep up	
5			the work, you need to keep on the basis of what's	14:5
6			being reported. And again, you talk about the chief	
7			superintendent, that may be Chief Superintendent	
8			Glacken, he was a former chief in charge	
9	360	Q.	CHAIRMAN: He's wrong about that. It's Chief	
10			Superintendent Curran, I think. It has to be Chief	14:5
11			Superintendent Curran who was there at the time,	
12			doesn't it?	
13		Α.	If he felt things were closing in on him, Chairman, I	
14			would say it could have been Chief Superintendent	
15			Glacken he was referring to, I'm not sure, because he	14:5
16			had made	
17	361	Q.	CHAIRMAN: He had been previously there, yes.	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	362	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: It seems arise in the context when the	
20			car tax and CMO were mentioned to him.	14:5
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	363	Q.	Anyway, regardless, that was the general thrust of your	
23			phone calls?	
24		Α.	It was. I was always motivated in these matters and my	
25			ultimate objective was to ensure that Garda Keogh's	14:5
26			welfare was being protected. And if Garda Keogh felt	
27			that he needed to go to some public representative	
28			because he wasn't getting sufficient support, that was	
29			something that needed to be addressed in the context of	

_			ensuring that the organisation was doing everything	
2			that we could to support him.	
3	364	Q.	If we just scroll down the page there to the following	
4			day, Thursday, 2nd April. Yes. Again:	
5				14:54
6			"Call from AC Ó Cualáin offering advice."	
7				
8			He says:	
9				
10			"As Garda Keogh is protected, no one is supposed to	14:54
11			know his identity and against law to reveal him. He	
12			can't discuss him with anyone. If Garda Keogh refers	
13			me to them, then can only give me info if Keogh gives	
14			written permission, but because he went public I can	
15			only know about that time and two day's ago out burst	14:54
16			he wasn't named, so I don't know who the whistleblower	
17			was then. Explained to AC my support structure for	
18			hi m. "	
19				
20			Is that your recollection? Does that reflect the phone	14:54
21			call that you had?	
22		Α.	Yes. Again, I was anxious to ensure that, you know, in	
23			all of the work that was happening between my team and	
24			the local management team, the risk of Garda Keogh's	
25			identity being exposed by any of our team, that we	14:55
26			wanted to ensure that that didn't happen. Even though	
27			it was common knowledge, I still had the statutory	
28			obligation to protect his identity, and I wanted that	
29			driven home. So I would say while on that phone call,	

- and any call I ever made, I would be referring to the
- 2 confidential reporter, not to a named garda.
- 3 CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 4 365 Q. MR. MARRINAN: He records you as saying "can only give
- info if Keogh gives written permission"?
- 14:55

- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 366 Q. Do you see that?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 367 Q. Did anybody ask Keogh whether he would give written
- 10 permission for you to breach the confidentiality?
- 11 A. Well, the only -- there was a few times it happened.
- 12 We asked for it in relation to the DPP.
- 13 368 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. And we asked for it in relation to, what else? I think
- it was three times. One was HR, which he refused. And 14:55
- there may have been another occasion.
- 17 369 Q. The former chief superintendent that we referred to,
- the chief superintendent we referred to there, who
- 19 wanted a copy of his statement --
- 20 A. Yeah.

14:56

- 21 370 Q. -- before he would be interviewed by the investigation
- team.
- 23 A. Right. Okay.
- 24 371 Q. I think at that point in time Garda Keogh was
- 25 approached and he declined to have his statement --
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 372 Q. And then obviously when the matter was going to HR, he
- 28 was approached as well?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 373 Q. And he declined?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 374 Q. So those were the occasions --
- 4 A. Those were the occasions, yes.
- 5 375 Q. -- on which he declined to have his statement, which

14:57

14:57

- 6 was namely the content of his protected disclosure,
- 7 disclosed to other people. But in terms of his
- 8 actually identity, did you ever --
- 9 A. No, I never looked for his permission because I didn't
- need to, because I didn't feel the need to have to give 14:56
- 11 his identity to anybody. That never arose.
- 12 376 Q. So in terms of the contact that you had with
- 13 Superintendent Murray, was that the extent of your
- 14 contact with him from April?
- 15 A. Again, I had very little contact with Superintendent
- Murray. I have a few references in my own diary notes,
- 17 which again I depended on to write my statement.
- 18 377 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. I accept that there are ones -- I didn't have notes
- that Superintendent Murray noted in his notes and I
- accept that they happened, yes, and I can recall now,
- having my memory refreshed by these notes, that those
- calls did occur.
- 24 378 Q. There doesn't seem to be any contact between May and
- June and July, August or September?
- 26 A. You see most of the communication, Chairman, that
- 27 happened was through the assigned man, who was
- Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. I had asked him to
- be the main focus of liaison with both the confidential

1 reporter and local management. And therefore, the 2 detective superintendent would have had nearly, I'd 3 say, weekly contact with local management in the context of the investigation. 4 5 379 That's actually not recorded as being the case. Q. Ιt 14:58 6 would appear that in June, July and August there was no 7 contact? 8 By whom? Α. 9 380 By Detective Superintendent Mulcahy? Q. With whom? 10 Α. 14:58 11 381 With Superintendent Murray? Q. 12 I don't know. Probably because it wasn't needed. Α. 13 There was nothing to address, maybe. I'm not sure. 14 382 Q. well you know from the issues that have arisen at this 15 Tribunal that there were matters that gave rise to 14:58 16 complaints that Garda Keogh had? 17 Mm-hmm. Α. 18 383 He doesn't appear to have raised them with the Q. 19 investigation team, but you're aware of the fact that 20 he has made complaint about what he says is 14:58 21 micromanagement? 22 I am, yes. Α. 23 Unfair criticism of his investigations? 384 Q. 24 Yes. Α. 25 The failure to get commendations? 385 Q. 14:58 26 Yes. Α. 27 386 There's a variety of issues. Q.

I'm aware of all of those.

28

29

387

Α.

Q.

They don't really concern you, but you weren't aware of

			any or those matters:	
2		Α.	Not at the time. The detail I'm aware of now.	
3	388	Q.	Then if we could move on then to your report to the	
4			Director of Public Prosecutions. First of all, if we	
5			could have your letter to the Commissioner with the	14:59
6			report, it's at page 11159. If we just scroll down	
7			there, please. The next page. Scroll back up. This	
8			is the report to the Commissioner, indicating that you	
9			had sent the report on to the Director of Public	
10			Prosecutions. If we could have then page 1142. Well,	15:00
11			if we look at 11076 first of all, sorry?	
12		Α.	11076?	
13	389	Q.	Yes. That's the cover of the investigation file.	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	390	Q.	We have that and it's is an extensive report. Your	15:00
16			conclusions are at page 11142. If we could just scroll	
17			down to look at them:	
18				
19			"Concl usi ons.	
20				15:01
21			A number of the allegations made by the reporter are	
22			plausible and have substance.	
23				
24			While the investigation uncovered suspicions of	
25			criminal behaviour by Gardaí in Athlone, in particular	15:01
26			the allegation surrounding the destruction of evidence,	
27			which was facilitated by Garda A in the alleged tipping	
28			of Ms. B and [another person], the substantial evidence	
29			may fall short of what is required to bring a criminal	

1			prosecuti on. "	
2				
3			That ultimately was your view in relation to the	
4			matter; is that right?	
5		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	15:01
6	391	Q.	But you didn't make any recommendations for a	
7			prosecution or that there should be no prosecution?	
8		Α.	No.	
9	392	Q.	You seem to have adopted a middle ground on the basis	
10			that the allegations may be plausible and have some	15:01
11			substance but then point to perhaps that they don't	
12			contain the standard of proof required in a criminal	
13			trial. So you have taken a somewhat neutral position	
14			in relation to it and asked the Director of Public	
15			Prosecutions to review the file and give directions, is	15:02
16			that right?	
17		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
18	393	Q.	The DPP directions then came back on the 3rd March,	
19			page 4009. And then in the last paragraph:	
20				15:02
21			"On the basis of the investigation, the Gardaí have not	
22			recommended any criminal charges for consideration. In	
23			the circumstances, the question of a prosecution does	
24			not arise on the evidence."	
25				15:02
26			You're happy that the Director of Public Prosecutions	
27			considered the file and are merely noting there that	
28			there was no recommendation to prosecute?	
29		Α.	I am very satisfied. Of course, a file of this	

1			magnitude and the importance in the context of what we	
2			were investigating would have to go to the DPP,	
3			regardless of what I felt was or was not evidence that	
4			would substantiate a charge. That's a matter for the	
5			law officers to make a determination on. So we were	15:03
6			fully in their hands once the file was submitted.	
7	394	Q.	Then an additional report was sent in on the 16th May,	
8			it's at 4010. This is again to the Director of Public	
9			Prosecutions. It concerns evidence arising out of the	
10			search of the home of Garda A, is that right?	15:03
11		Α.	That's correct.	
12	395	Q.	Then there is additional directions in relation to the	
13			matter, at 4012 of the material. If you scroll down,	
14			please.	
15				15:04
16			"I note the examination of the electronic devices	
17			seized from the homes of Garda A and Ms. B yielded no	
18			evidence and so the position remains as set out in my	
19			letter on 3rd March 2016."	
20				15:04
21			So even after there was no direction to prosecute, you	
22			continued to follow leads and to examine the matter,	
23			isn't that right?	
24		Α.	If evidence showed itself, of course we would have to	
25			consider it and if it was pertinent to this set of	15:04
26			circumstances and the issues raised by Garda Keogh,	
27			then the most appropriate place for that to be done	
28			would be going back to the team that already the file	
29			in their possession, yes.	

Т	396	Q.	I think you were obliged to keep the Garda	
2			Commissioner's office updated in relation to the	
3			progress of your investigation?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	397	Q.	We have heard from Superintendent Walsh. If I can go	15:05
6			through these very briefly. The first update there, it	
7			appears, is on the 16th June, it's at page 10797.	
8			That's just giving a progress report for the	
9			Commissioner. I don't intend to open it, unless	
10			anybody requires me to do so. It's already been opened	15:06
11			in full. That's the first update that you have. The	
12			second correspondence, and it was a matter that I asked	
13			you about earlier on, and we will just deal with it,	
14			it's at page 10802. This is dated the 24th July, it's	
15			from Superintendent Walsh to the deputy commissioner,	15:06
16			strategy and change management. You had taken up that	
17			role, so he has given you that title, is that right?	
18		Α.	What date is this, sorry?	
19	398	Q.	This is on 24th July 2014. 10802?	
20		Α.	Yeah, that's the office I was working in, in an	15:07
21			administrative capacity. I still didn't have the title	
22			of deputy commissioner, but that's the office I was	
23			working out of on that basis, if that's what you're	
24			saying.	
25	399	Q.	I beg your pardon. We just note there:	15:07
26				
27			"On 8th May 2014 the confidential recipient sent a	
28			confidential report to the Commissioner for	
29			investigation under the Garda Síochána regulations	

1			2007. All necessary notifications were addressed and	
2			an assistant commissioner was appointed to carry out an	
3			investigation, which is ongoing.	
4				
5			The confidential recipient has since contacted this	15:07
6			office"	
7				
8			Judge McMahon apparently spoke to the Commissioner.	
9				
10			" and stated that the confidential reporter has	15:07
11			complained that his chief superintendent is continuing	
12			an investigation against him while his own complaint is	
13			being dealt with. The confidential recipient has	
14			enquired as to whether we have any protocols in place	
15			to address such situations. Perhaps assistant	15:08
16			commissioner Human Resource Management should advise."	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	400	Q.	"With the introduction of the Protected Disclosures Act	
19			2014, this particular query may be mood. However, the	
20			issues could well arise again once GSOC become a	15:08
21			prescribed body under section 7 of the Act.	
22				
23			The Commissioner would appreciate your views and	
24			recommendations in early course."	
25				15:08
26			Do you recall dealing with that?	
27		Α.	This came to me in my role as deputy commissioner	
28			administrative functions.	
29	401	Q.	Right?	

- 1 A. Not as the --
- 2 402 Q. CHAIRMAN: Not as the head of the investigation.
- 3 A. Yes. So this would normally -- this is how the
- 4 correspondence would normally be channelled. A request
- of that nature would come through my side of the house, 15:08
- 6 as it was then, because it had to go to HR, and I was
- 7 in charge of that side at that time. So I can recall
- 8 that coming through, yes.
- 9 403 Q. MR. MARRINAN: Did you ever express any views in
- 10 relation to it?
- 11 A. I'm not sure whether that line of correspondence -- I
- 12 assume it went to HR and came back through again and it

15:09

15:09

- was sent back to the Commissioner. That's the
- 14 normal --
- 15 404 Q. All right. So it's a general enquiry?
- 16 A. It was. In relation to -- I suppose it's the last
- 17 paragraph there, you know, the context of the situation
- arising again, having protocols, just wanting to
- 19 confirm that. And it might also inform new protocols
- the that would have to be developed as well, a few
- issues that would have to be addressed in any new set
- of protocols.
- 23 405 Q. CHAIRMAN: It might be difficult one to address in
- general terms. I mean, it would all depend on the
- 25 nature of the investigation.
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 406 Q. CHAIRMAN: And the nature of the other complaint.
- 28 Still, there might be protocols. I suppose there was
- 29 nothing wrong in asking are there protocols.

1		Α.	And I'd say it was just raising the alarm bells in that	
2			section, that this is something you should be looking	
3			at in the context of the new Act, etcetera, you know.	
4	407	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: At 10822 there's again another update.	
5			At that stage 75 statements had been taken?	15:10
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	408	Q.	From 66 interviewees. 47 exhibits seized. You talk	
8			about a case conference held on the 11th November at	
9			Oranmore Garda Station.	
10				15:10
11			"It was attended by all members of the investigation	
12			team.	
13				
14			Further multiple requests have been forwarded to both	
15			Crime and Security concerning telephone data and also	15:10
16			to communications DMR and tetra data concerning dates	
17			of relevance to the investigation."	
18				
19			And then a number of applications concerning CHIS	
20			matters have also been forwarded for assistance in the	15:11
21			investigation. That doesn't concern the entry that	
22			Garda Keogh had made?	
23		Α.	No, it doesn't, Chairman, no.	
24	409	Q.	No. You note:	
25				15:11
26			"As this is a very complex investigation and it appears	
27			that as each potential witness/line of enquiry is	
28			pursued they have the potential to open up further	
29			avenues of investigation which the investigation team	

1			have no choice but to enter and pursue that line of	
2			enqui ry. "	
3				
4			And I think you dealt with that in answer to the	
5			observations of the Chairman and the ripple effect.	15:11
6		Α.	Yes, Chairman.	
7	410	Q.	You then do an analysis of it and that's your update	
8			then. Yes. There's a further update then dated 26th	
9			November 2014, at 10826. It shows the progress of the	
10			investigation. 139 jobs had been created. And that	15:12
11			states that 75 statements have then been taken. You go	
12			through again how the investigation is progressing.	
13			Then if we go to page 10827, this is dated the 27th	
14			November and concerned about the publication in the	
15			Daily Mirror, an article on the 27th November. It	15:13
16			notes:	
17				
18			"I understand that an interim report on the	
19			investigation has been submitted for the Commissioner's	
20			information.	15:13
21				
22			In the light of the contents of this publication, the	
23			Commissioner directs that immediate contact is made	
24			with Garda Keogh to establish the problems he is	
25			experiencing. He should be reassured that he will not	15:13
26			be subject to any form of harassment and will be	
27			treated with dignity and respect in the workplace.	
28				
29			It is noted from previous update, supplied on the 16th	

1			June, that Garda Keogh was advised of the services of	
2			the employment assistance officers.	
3				
4			Please address these issues and report further in early	
5			course to facilitate updates to the Garda Síochána	15:14
6			Ombudsman Commission and the Garda Síochána	
7			Inspectorate. "	
8				
9			Was that matter followed up?	
10		Α.	I'm sure it was. I'm aware that Detective	15:14
11			Superintendent Mulcahy at some juncture submitted a	
12			very detailed report, maybe it could be a bit later	
13			than this, in relation to all of the welfare	
14			interventions that were made. There should be a chain	
15			of correspondence there.	15:14
16	411	Q.	Yes. We will move on to page 10832. It is dated 12th	
17			December 2014, from Detective Superintendent Mulcahy to	
18			you?	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	412	Q.	If we just look at the third paragraph?	15:15
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	413	Q.	"The confidential reporter stated that he had no issues	
23			with this investigation and was content with how it was	
24			being progressed. The investigating gardaí highlighted	
25			and showed an article to him from the Daily Mirror	15:15
26			newspaper, in which the reporter indicated that matters	
27			highlighted concerned separate issues. He further	
28			informed Gardaí that he feels that he is being harassed	
29			by senior management at Mullingar due to the following	

1	reasons. "	
2		
3	Then the Pulse check, we have dealt with that. The	
4	intelligence that he had placed on the Pulse system and	
5	two alleged complaints by Olivia O'Neill and Liam	15:15
6	McHugh.	
7		
8	"The confidential reporter informed Gardaí that he has	
9	lodged a complaint with GSOC concerning alleged	
10	harassment and is of the understanding that the	15:15
11	Ombudsman Commission will investigate same on the	
12	termination/conclusion of our investigation.	
13		
14	Gardaí spoke to him with regard to an article that	
15	appeared in an edition of the Irish Times dated 11th	15:16
16	December 2014. The reporter outlined that he was	
17	surprised by such an article and informed Gardaí that	
18	he had not spoken to Mr. Wallace and supplied such	
19	information. He informed Gardaí that a second	
20	whistleblower may have been responsible for forwarding	15:16
21	such information for this article.	
22		
23	The confidential reporter was reassured by	
24	investigating Gardaí as to his determination to	
25	effectively investigate his allegations, that he will	15:16
26	be treated with dignity and respect and informed if he	
27	feels that he has been harassed to report the matter	
28	i mmedi atel y.	
29		

1 He was also once again offered the services of the 2 employment assistance officer." 3 Were you concerned at any stage that he hadn't taken up 4 5 that offer? 15:17 6 I was, Chairman, because -- and I don't know why he Α. felt he couldn't, but at some stage along the road he 7 8 did voluntarily come back and say, yes, I am now ready for that. Again, it's the only avenue open to the 9 organisation internally. 10 15:17 11 414 Yes. Q. It is a very professional service. It's one that I 12 Α. 13 could recommend to anyone in the service and have done 14 so in the past. On that basis, you know, given, I 15 suppose, the stand he had taken, the context of the 15:17 16 environment at that time, I felt he did need support, 17 not just from my investigation team, who are very good 18 at what they do, but you need experts in that area of 19 welfare to really support people and identify any basis where they might need any assistance in the context of 20 getting through that time. 21 22 415 And then if we turn to page 10834. This is your letter Q. dated 23rd December 2014 --23 24 Yes. Α. 25 -- to Superintendent Walsh. It merely outlines what we 15:18 416 Ο.

27 A. Yes.

26

28 417 Q. -- in relation to the letter that was sent to you by
29 Detective Superintendent Mulcahy.

have just opened --

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 418 Q. There is another update on 30th January 2015, it's at
- page 10804, please Mr. Kavanagh. It deals with an
- 4 update and another conference. I mean, I'm not going
- to go through all the conferences you had, but you had

15:19

15:19

- 6 conferences on a regular basis?
- A. I did.
- 8 419 Q. Is that right?
- 9 A. I did, Chairman.
- 10 420 Q. And at conferences jobs are assigned and they are
- followed up?
- 12 A. Yes, indeed. These are conferences, there were jobs
- given out when I wasn't there, and there would be
- meetings held on a very regular basis by the team
- themselves, but I would on occasion call a conference
- of the full team, where I get a full update across the
- 17 board and talk directly to the investigators in
- relation to lines of enquiries they were pursuing. It
- 19 would have been at those junctures that I would have
- put pen to paper in relation to reporting it further up 15:19
- the line to the Commissioner.
- 22 421 Q. I think you point out in paragraph 3 that the state of
- play at that stage was 154 jobs/lines of enquiry have
- been created, 75 persons have been interviewed and
- 25 there were a further 47 exhibits seized and had to be
- 26 examined, is that right?
- 27 A. That's correct, Chairman.
- 28 422 Q. You point out in the last paragraph of that page:

29

1		"A draft of the final report has been commenced and it	
2		has been determined by the investigation team that it	
3		is not possible to submit modular files pertaining to	
4		each allegation as previously stated due to the fact	
5		that the allegations made are common and interlinked to	15:2
6		a number of persons named by the confidential reporter.	
7			
8		The investigation team proposes to have all enquiries	
9		completed with a view to then interviewing the serving	
10		member of An Garda Síochána against whom the majority	15:2
11		of allegations are made. Following the completion of	
12		this interview, a final all encompassing file will be	
13		completed as expeditiously as possible. It is expected	
14		that the interviewing of this member and a small number	
15		of outstanding witnesses will be completed before the	15:2
16		end of February.	
17			
18		I appreciate that this investigation is taking a	
19		considerable period of time and is involving	
20		considerable resources. However, the time and	15:2
21		resources are required to definitively complete the	
22		investigation to the highest professional standard and	
23		to ensure the allegations are being properly and	
24		thoroughly investigated."	
25			15:2
26		Was it considered at one stage that you would deal with	
27		it on a modular basis?	
28	Α.	That's correct. In effect, Chairman, you could look at	

29

what Garda Keogh gave us as being nine different

1			investigations.	
2	423	Q.	Yes.	
3		Α.	And at the early stages, when not much groundwork had	
4			been done, it was felt prudent that we might just	
5			prioritise some of the modules and get them moving on.	15:2
6	424	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes, well you could have taken Operation	
7			Loki, for example, as a discrete unit?	
8		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
9	425	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And you could have reported on that?	
10		Α.	That's correct.	15:2
11	426	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But the others tended to intermingle.	
12		Α.	There were common lines and that frustrated that	
13			approach. But what did happen is that, you know, the	
14			report started to assemble itself in that the people	
15			working in the incident room had started to perhaps	15:2
16			the report was starting to reach, you know, a maturity	
17			into some form of wording so that it could all come	
18			together.	
19	427	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Then if we just go to page 10851 of the	
20			material. This is a further update, it's primarily	15:2
21			concerning the welfare issues of the confidential	
22			reporter and the comments made in the Dáil by	
23			Mr. Wallace. It's dated the 1st April. You say, the	
24			second paragraph:	
25				15:2
26			"By way of additional information, I wish to inform you	
27			that Detective Superintendent Mulcahy has been in	
28			regular contact with the confidential reporter both in	

person and on the phone. During all of these meetings

1			and conversations Detective Superintendent Mulcahy has	
2			enquired about the confidential reporter's welfare and	
3			made him aware of all services available to him if	
4			required. The confidential reporter has consistently	
5			indicated that he does not want to engage with any of	15:23
6			the welfare services offered by An Garda Síochána.	
7				
8			The most recent communication between Detective	
9			Superintendent Mulcahy and the confidential reporter	
10			was on today's date, 1st April 2015. Following this	15:23
11			communication, Detective Superintendent Mulcahy is of	
12			the belief that the comments made by Michael Wallace TD	
13			in the Dáil on 31st March 2015 regarding the bullying	
14			and harassment of whistleblowers may have emanated from	
15			the above mentioned confidential reporter. In his	15:24
16			conversation with Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, the	
17			confidential reporter intimated that he had no choice	
18			given recent interventions by Superintendent Murray in	
19			raising issues over his car tax and also the question	
20			of having him referred to the CMO for stress related	15:24
21			illness."	
22				
23			That goes back to the note to Superintendent Murray,	
24			where he referred to another	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:24
26	428	Q.	It's quite clear that that's what it actually relates	
27			to?	
28		Α.	Yes.	

29 429 Q. Superintendent Murray.

Τ				
2			"Following this conversation, Detective Superintendent	
3			Mulcahy contacted Superintendent Murray and outlined	
4			the issues as raised by the confidential reporter.	
5				15:24
6			At the end of today's communication the confidential	
7			reporter thanked Detective Superintendent Mulcahy for	
8			contacting him and expressed his satisfaction with the	
9			investigation to date.	
10				15:24
11			With the investigation ongoing and further	
12			communications expected between Detective	
13			Superintendent Mulcahy and the confidential reporter, I	
14			have instructed Detective Superintendent Mulcahy to	
15			ensure that any welfare issues highlighted will be	15:25
16			communicated to local management for attention as	
17			appropri ate. "	
18				
19			There's a further update at 10853, of the same day. It	
20			concerns	15:25
21		Α.	That's actually referred to in the letter you just read	
22			out.	
23	430	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	There were two reports. One an update on the actual	
25			investigation.	15:25
26	431	Q.	Absolutely.	
27		Α.	And the other was dealing with the issue of welfare.	
28	432	Q.	Yes. At that stage we note in the third paragraph that	
29			191 jobs/lines of enquiries have been created, along	

1			with 82 persons having been interviewed. Then you say:	
2				
3			"Members of the investigation team are expected to meet	
4			with two key witnesses central to investigation before	
5			the end of the current week to determine if they will	15:26
6			cooperate with this investigation. Following these	
7			meetings, the investigation team propose to have all	
8			enquiries completed with a view to then interviewing	
9			the member of An Garda Síochána, Garda A, against whom	
10			the majority of the allegations have been made."	15:26
11				
12			We then move forward in time in relation to a letter	
13			that you received from Detective Superintendent Mulcahy	
14			on 5th May of 2015. This is at page 10867. And it's a	
15			preliminary report surrounding an investigation into	15:27
16			the allegations made under the Act. Now,	
17			Mr. McGuinness has already gone through this with	
18			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy. If we could just	
19			move forward to the end, at page 10871. This relates	
20			to the telephone evidence, I think, that had come in.	15:27
21				
22			"On further discussion it was apparent that there now	
23			was a reasonable suspicion based on all information	
24			concerning the tipping off allegation that there	
25			existed a reasonable suspicion that Garda A may have	15:27
26			committed a criminal act."	
27		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
28	433	Q.	Now, attached to that is an appendices, I think it's a	
29			summary of the allegations as made by the confidential	

1			reporter, at 10872.	
2		Α.	Yeah.	
3	434	Q.	And then there's also a report, 10875, which is a	
4			report from Sergeant Andrew Haran to his	
5			superintendent, which is dated 9th September 2012;	15:28
6			isn't that right?	
7		Α.	Yes, I can see that.	
8	435	Q.	Yes. We have already opened this, at page 10881, it's	
9			a report of the 9th May. It says:	
10				15:29
11			"Further to your correspondence on 9th May 2014."	
12				
13			That's the initial correspondence.	
14				
15			"Based on this analysis, the allegations by the	15:29
16			confidential reporter, there now exists a reasonable	
17			suspicion that Garda A has committed a criminal act."	
18				
19			And then the further direction, 10882, we have opened	
20			that, on the 13th May, to continue it as a criminal	15:29
21			investigation. Then further, a report on 21st May	
22			2015, that we have already opened, to Mr. Barrett.	
23				
24			Then if we go forward to 4th June 2015, at 10904, it	
25			says:	15:30
26				
27			"I am directed by the Commissioner to forward the	
28			attached correspondence from the Secretary General for	
29			your information and necessary attention please.	

т		
2	The Commissioner requires an updated report on your	
3	investigation to date, to include an indicative	
4	timeline for completion of the investigation file.	
5		15:30
6	Previous reports submitted on this issue have already	
7	been submitted to the department, including GSOC and	
8	the Inspectorate."	
9		
10	It includes a letter from Noel Waters, at page 10905.	15:31
11	It says:	
12		
13	"I refer to a matter raised by Deputy Mick Wallace	
14	concerning Garda whistleblowers during parliamentary	
15	questions on the 26th May.	15:31
16		
17	The deputy made a number of allegations about how the	
18	Gardaí handled the allegations being made. The matter	
19	was returned to in subsequent Parliamentary Question	
20	about the appointment of a Chairperson to GSOC. I	15:31
21	enclose extracts from the Dáil debates relevant to	
22	these Parliamentary Questions.	
23		
24	The Minister has asked me to seek your observations on	
25	the claims made by Deputy Wallace into how the cases of	15:31
26	the two whistleblowers are being handled."	
27		
28	And that's a sent to the Garda Commissioner.	

Т			on sen June 2015, we see a report that is sent to	
2			you sorry, a report that you sent to the private	
3			secretary, Superintendent Frank Walsh.	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	436	Q.	Then that's a	15:32
6		Α.	This is a response, Chairman, to the direction by the	
7			Commissioner in correspondence, which was in response	
8			to my looking for a direction in relation to the	
9			appointment criminal and discipline.	
10	437	Q.	Yes.	15:32
11		Α.	To which she directed that I would continue with the	
12			criminal investigation and make arrangements for a	
13			discipline someone to be appointed.	
14	438	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That was back over to Assistant Commissioner	
15			Kenny, who in turn yes.	15:32
16		Α.	Assistant Commissioner Kenny and whoever he appointed	
17			would need the basis on which I was seeking a	
18			discipline inquiry to begin and this is what this	
19			report outlines, and the different individuals who we	
20			felt there was a case against in relation to	15:33
21			discipline.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
23	439	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: You outline there the allegations	
24			against Garda A?	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:33
26	440	Q.	There are nine allegations set down. We don't need to	
27			open them. These arose out of your enquiries?	
28		Α.	That's right.	
29	441	Q.	Then you identify three other members of An Garda	

- 1 Síochána.
- 2 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Mr. Marrinan, what number is that
- 3 letter, the 29th May, from Mr. Waters?
- 4 MR. MARRINAN: Sorry, I will just get the page.
- 5 CHAIRMAN: Hold on, we have it here. Thanks very much. 15:33
- 6 10905. Thanks very much. Sorry.
- 7 MR. MARRINAN: Sorry, Chairman.
- 8 442 Q. I haven't opened all your updates to the Commissioner's
- 9 office or all your conference notes. Are there any
- 10 matters that you feel that I may have omitted in that
- chronology of your interactions with the Commissioner's

15:34

15:34

- 12 office?
- 13 A. No, Chairman. Just, I was conscious at all times that
- there was huge interest in the work that we were
- performing, at political level as well as obviously as
- 16 Garda Headquarters, who were dealing with other issues
- in relation to whistleblowers at the time and the
- 18 context of welfare for whistleblowers. And I wanted to
- the Commissioner well informed in relation to what she
- 20 had tasked me to do. Most of those would be coming in
- the normal course after a conference, some were
- 22 prompted by a specific request coming through the
- department or whatever in relation to a specific
- 24 request or Dáil questions etcetera.
- 25 443 Q. CHAIRMAN: And it was being suggested, the Commissioner 15:34
- 26 herself was under pressure.
- 27 A. Absolutely.
- 28 444 Q. CHAIRMAN: And there was a suggestion -- sorry, there
- wasn't a suggestion, there was a statement that she was

1 being hypocritical, that she was making noises about 2 being nice to whistleblowers but the reality on the ground, as exemplified by Garda Keogh's treatment, was 3 that he was being bullied and harassed -- I'm sorry, 4 5 targeted and discredited, you know, generally treated

15:35

15:35

6 badly.

7 Yes. Α.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- 8 445 CHAI RMAN: That was really the context. Q.
- 9 That's it, yes. Α.
- what do you say about the allegation that 10 446 CHAI RMAN: Ο. 11 this was a hypocritical exercise in declaring that she 12 was sympathetic to whistleblowers and actually, so to 13 speak, overlooking the fact that people were being 14 badly treated?
  - Nothing could be further from the truth, Chairman. Α. Ι 15:35 worked very closely with former Commissioner O'Sullivan, from 2014 up until she retired in 2018, and I don't think a day went by when I had interactions with her that whistleblowers wasn't raised in some format, whether it was the updating of policy to 15:36 ensure, you know, that we were learning from mistakes, or the dealing with current cases, as it were, in relation to different members, including my own case and how those members being treated. And our her public pronouncements, and during all our conferences 15:36 to senior management, which were held in the Garda college twice yearly, this was always on the agenda, something that was always raised in the context of raising awareness around the organisation, as to the

1			importance of ensuring that this legislation was	
2			properly	
3	447	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But I mean, that was in the air, that sort	
4			of	
5		Α.	Yes.	15:36
6	448	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I don't think I have actually done it any	
7			injustice, I think I have put it clearly, that was the	
8			essence of the	
9		Α.	It was, and possibly led to some frustration, knowing	
10			the efforts that were being made on one hand and then	15:37
11			the maybe unfound commentary that was coming otherwise,	
12			that was, you know, pretty frustrating for those that	
13			were involved at the front line.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you very much.	
15	449	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: If we could have page 7360 up on the	15:37
16			screen, please. This is a complaint or a list of	
17			complaints that were made by Garda Keogh to the	
18			Director of Public Prosecutions and were copied to the	
19			Minister for Justice. He says:	
20				15:37
21			"A criminal investigation was conducted by Assistant	
22			Commissioner Ó Cualáin. However, I feel obliged to	
23			pint out a number of serious and deliberate flaws with	
24			regard to this investigation."	
25				15:37
26			I will just give you an opportunity to respond to all	
27			these, because they are the basis of subsequent	
28			complaints and his evidence to the Tribunal.	
29				

"The fact that it took assistant commissioner one month to meet with myself, being his informant. There is an unofficial storeroom in Athlone Garda Station which believe contained strong tangible evidence which was deliberately emptied in and around the second week in May 2014 and evidence vital to the case disappeared."

15:38

15:38

15:38

Do you want to -- you have already really dealt with it, but if you want to add anything further.

A. Yeah, just to say I think we have given the chronology of when I was appointed officially, when I got the file, what I did with it. I would say that I treated it with the utmost importance and dealt with it very, very efficiently and ensured that I had a team or the semblance of a team in place by the 15th, which was just after I had a chance to read the affidavit myself and establish the seriousness of what was being said.

In relation to the storeroom, I think Detective
Superintendent Mulcahy dealt with that. The moment we had evidence from Garda Keogh in relation to his statement that this was the case, that place was searched. But as Detective Superintendent Mulcahy stated yesterday, you know, if the confidential reporter's issues had not been highlighted in the national press at around the same time, we may have had a more successful start to our investigation in the context of what we might have been able to find, etcetera in relation to items that he mentioned and

Т			terephones ettetera.	
2	450	Q.	The second complaint is:	
3				
4			"In or around 10th June 2014, the suspect garda had his	
5			state mobile seized. This mobile phone had been wiped	15:40
6			of its information, which could have been potentially	
7			vital and unlike any other criminal investigation where	
8			evidence is seized, the suspect garda was given a	
9			replacement state mobile phone. It is worth noting	
10			that most sergeants in An Garda Síochána do not have	15:40
11			state mobile phones."	
12				
13			I think we have dealt with this issue, but is there	
14			anything else you want to say in relation to it?	
15		Α.	I think the first point, I have dealt with that	15:40
16			already.	
17	451	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	It relates to the the question of the wiping, it	
19			doesn't that's a matter for Declan, and he dealt	
20			with it yesterday, I think, satisfactorily in my view.	15:40
21	452	Q.	Then paragraph 3 relates to the suspension. I think we	
22			have gone through that in great detail. Is there	
23			anything further you want to say about that?	
24		Α.	No, I think I have made it as clear as I can.	
25	453	Q.	And then 4:	15:40
26				
27			"During the investigation statements were taken by	
28			members while they were in Athlone Garda Station."	
29				

_			is there anything more you want to say about that:	
2			think we have dealt with that.	
3		Α.	I think I have, yes, fully ventilated that as well.	
4	454	Q.	It says:	
5				15:41
6			"I am aware that the suspect garda did not leave the	
7			Garda station while the investigation team were	
8			present. He was able to see every person who was	
9			called in to make statements and in a position to	
10			eyeball members of An Garda Síochána. I believe this	15:41
11			was deliberately facilitated in an effort to suppress	
12			honest statements being made by way of informal	
13			intimidation."	
14				
15			Did anybody bring to your attention any issue of people	15:41
16			being eyeballed by Garda A before they made their	
17			statements?	
18		Α.	The person who brought this to my attention was Garda	
19			Commissioner, himself, in relation to his unease at the	
20			statements being take then Athlone. And I have to say	15:41
21			that there was nothing, I heard no reports through the	
22			investigation team or myself that any individual came	
23			forward with that information in the context of being	
24			eyeballed or anything of that nature.	
25	455	Q.	CHAIRMAN: He says it was deliberately facilitated for	15:42
26			the purpose of suppressing honest statements.	
27		Α.	Again, Chair, all I can say is that my team	
28	456	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean, the only reason I'm asking is that	
29			it's actually stated there.	

1		Α.	Yes. What I would say is, Garda A was entitled to be	
2			there, in the context of that was his workplace.	
3			Whether he was on or off duty, gardaí at all times come	
4			and go from Garda stations, even when they're off duty.	
5			What his tensions were, I can't say.	15:42
6	457	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, the suggestion is that you deliberately	
7			facilitated it.	
8		Α.	I completely reject that, Chairman.	
9	458	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That is what is being stated.	
10		Α.	I didn't.	15:42
11			CHAIRMAN: okay.	
12	459	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: Number 5 there:	
13				
14			"A crucial witness had come forward with vital	
15			information. The investigation team met this man."	15:42
16				
17			He was from Galway.	
18				
19			"If around 3rd July 2014 but did not go back to speak	
20			with him for about six months as he did not trust the	15:43
21			investigation team and was in fear of the suspect Garda	
22			who was still armed and on duty."	
23				
24			You were here yesterday.	
25		Α.	I was.	15:43
26	460	Q.	I think Detective Superintendent Mulcahy dealt with	
27			that.	
28		Α.	He did, Chairman.	
29	461	Q.	In considerable detail?	

1		Α.	That was a matter for the investigation team, Chairman.	
2	462	Q.	Yes.	
3		Α.	I think the superintendent dealt with it, yes.	
4	463	Q.	Number 6:	
5				15:43
6			"One of the allegations involves the suspect garda	
7			getting an unregistered informant to plant drugs in a	
8			car. On 7th December 2014 the said unregistered garda	
9			informant was arrested by his handler, the suspect	
10			garda, for possession of approximately €4,000 worth of	15:43
11			heroin. This now put the garda under investigation in	
12			a position of influence over another suspect witness in	
13			the case."	
14				
15			Were you aware of that during the course of	15:43
16		Α.	I wasn't aware of that, Chairman. No, I wasn't. I	
17			have to say, when I saw it written here, it was the	
18			first time I saw any reference to it.	
19	464	Q.	You heard Detective Superintendent Mulcahy, this issue	
20			arose	15:44
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	465	Q.	in a letter that had been sent by Garda Keogh to	
23			Detective Superintendent Mulcahy but Detective	
24			Superintendent Mulcahy had no recollection of receiving	
25			the letter?	15:44
26		Α.	All letters, every correspondence that Detective	
27			Superintendent Mulcahy received from any source in	
28			relation to the investigation was brought to my	
29			attention and any telephone conversations, any text	

1			messaging that happened, was brought to my attention.	
2			This doesn't look familiar to me at all in the context	
3			of what was shown to me at that time.	
4	466	Q.	Number 7 there is:	
5				15:44
6			"Around 24th April 2015, the allegations were put to	
7			the garda under investigation, where he was given over	
8			a month to seek Legal advice. Cautioned statements	
9			were taken from him between 16th June 2015 to 24th June	
10			2015. This is unusual, as in any other criminal	15:45
11			investigation the suspect would be arrested and	
12			interviewed without delay."	
13				
14			Well, you've already given evidence in relation to	
15			that.	15:45
16		Α.	I have, Chairman, yes.	
17	467	Q.	Are you happy to leave it at that?	
18		Α.	I have nothing to add to that, Chairman, no, apart from	
19			what I have said already.	
20	468	Q.		15:45
21			"8. It is my understanding that the investigation team	
22			could not retrieve text messages over two years from	
23			the seized state mobile phone. Text messages for the	
24			period around 2014 are vital and I do not know if every	
25			effort was made to retrieve them."	15:45
26				
27			I think we've dealt with that and we've looked into	
28			that.	
29		Α.	I think Detective Superintendent Mulcahy dealt with	

1			that yesterday.	
2	469	Q.	Yes.	
3		Α.	As well as Detective Inspector Coppinger, if I can	
4			recall, the efforts that were made in relation to all	
5			the enquiries that they carried out.	15:45
6	470	Q.	Then:	
7				
8			"9. In June 2015 the suspect garda stopped a witness	
9			in the case without having committed an offence and	
10			checked her tax and insurance and asked for her drivers	15:46
11			licence. I believe this was an attempt to intimidate	
12			the witness."	
13				
14			There doesn't seem to be any complaint in relation to	
15			that against you. Then he goes on:	15:46
16				
17			"I also wish to point out that while the investigation	
18			was ongoing for over a year, I had to work in the same	
19			station and half the time on the same shift."	
20				15:46
21			CHAIRMAN: You were quite right, Mr. Marrinan. You	
22			were quite right about on the same shift.	
23	471	Q.	MR. MARRINAN: "As the garda under investigation who	
24			was subject to my complaint. Since I joined the force	
25			in 1999 I had"	15:46
26				
27			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, well that doesn't really concern	
28			complaints in respect of the investigation.	
29			MR. MARRINAN: He goes on to sav:	

2 "I have been subject to five internal investigations to date."

I suppose just to wrap things up in relation to this,
can you say how you view Garda Keogh's criticisms of
your investigation in the first instance and secondly,
of you and the suggestion that in some way you tried to
sabotage the investigation?

- A. Well, I have to reject that allegation out of hand. I put every effort and every ounce of energy I had over a very busy period of time into ensuring that everything in relation to Garda Keogh's issues that he reported to us were fully investigated. And during that time to ensure that Garda Keogh's own welfare issues were fully supported. I can identify with some of the frustrations that Garda Keogh would have felt, having been an experienced investigator himself.
- 19 472 Q. Yes.
- And possibly being on the outside of that, and looking Α. over the wall, as it were, and feeling frustrated that things weren't moving at a pace that he would like or maybe in a direction that he would like. But all I can do as an investigator is to follow the evidence that is there. And that is what our team did. 15 - 18 respect to all the rules of law and fair procedure, that is what I was in charge of and that is how I did my business. So, while I can empathise with the confidential reporter and maybe some frustrations that

1			he felt along the way, you know, I have to do my job	
2			within the parameters of the law that is set out. And	
3			that is what I did, and my team.	
4	473	Q.	Does that empathy stretch to perhaps the unfolding of	
5			events? Because it appears whatever happened in	15:48
6			relation to the Olivia O'Neill and her interaction with	
7			Garda Stephanie Treacy, it does appear that that event	
8			and the Liam McHugh incident were effectively	
9			allegations that were being made against Garda Keogh,	
10			isn't that right?	15:49
11		Α.	That's correct, Chairman.	
12	474	Q.	So very shortly after having made a protected	
13			disclosure, he is then the subject-matter of enquiry by	
14			his superiors, isn't that right?	
15		Α.	That's correct, yes.	15:49
16	475	Q.	Assuming for the moment that he is not the author of	
17			his own downfall in that regard and not knowing whether	
18			there was some skullduggery on the ground in relation	
19			to Liam McHugh, but it does appear that he is then the	
20			focus of enquiry locally in Athlone Garda Station?	15:49
21		Α.	I can't say, Chairman, whether or not he ever became	
22			the focus of enquiry in relation to the last two	
23			matters you mentioned or whether statements were ever	
24			made in that regard. I can't say that.	
25	476	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you know anything about those?	15:50
26		Α.	No. Apart from my own involvement with them, which was	
27			to deal with something that was put before me by the CR	
28			and on his behalf.	
29	477	Ο.	CHAIRMAN: I mean obviously if he had other things on	

- his mind, which might have been justified or might not
- 2 have been justified, clearly it's not difficult to
- imagine that it would have been a cause of pressure.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 478 Q. CHAIRMAN: Extra pressure, unnecessary pressure, if

15:50

15:50

15:51

15:51

15:51

- 6 they weren't justified.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 479 Q. CHAIRMAN: So I suppose that's really the essence of
- 9 it.
- 10 480 Q. MR. MARRINAN: what I am really asking you about, you
- 11 know, I mean these weren't just matters that he held
- himself and his concerns, he expressed them to Judge
- McMahon. We know that Judge McMahon contacted the
- 14 Commissioner and was concerned about more than one
- 15 enquiry taking place.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 481 Q. And, you know, you have given very clear evidence in
- relation to your position; namely, that you weren't
- 19 going to investigate complaints Garda Keogh, that you
- were there to investigate complaints that he had made.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 482 Q. But is there a gap there in relation to this that could
- be filled? Have you any constructive --
- A. No, I don't think -- anything Garda Keogh brought to
- our attention, he was coming with a genuine sense of,
- you know that this is something that's out there, that
- was affecting him. And he deserved to be listened to.
- 28 And I think that was -- from where I sat, I listened to
- 29 everything he had to say in relation to the specific

1			item that I was charged with, but outside and above	
2			that, I listened to everything else as well, or my team	
3			did on my behalf. And we did as much as we could in	
4			the context of ensuring that we could reassure him in	
5			some sense that, you know, we were there for his good.	15:52
6			We were there to ensure that we got to a successful	
7			conclusion in relation to our enquiries.	
8	483	Q.	And each decision you made along the way, you explained	
9			it to him and he seemed at the time to understand the	
10			rationale for it?	15:52
11		Α.	That was the consistent message coming back, you know,	
12			that he was happy with the investigation, that he was	
13			happy with the progress, and then all of a sudden he'd	
14			have issues, but once they were addressed or he was	
15			talked to again by, for the most part, Detective	15:52
16			Superintendent Mulcahy, they tended to you know, he	
17			tended to be happy again that things were being done.	
18			So it required that level of interaction and	
19			reassurance.	
20	484	Q.	Yes.	15:52
21		Α.	To ensure that he felt that we weren't just dealing	
22			with this in a flippant manner or that we weren't	
23			taking him seriously.	
24	485	Q.	Yes. Thank you very much.	
25		Α.	Thank you.	15:53
26	486	Q.	Sorry, there was a reference that I made, which was	
27			brought to my attention, an entry that was made by	
28			Garda Keogh in relation to his chief superintendent?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 1 487 Q. I referred to the fact that it was Chief Superintendent 2 Curran who was the person identified? 3 A. Yes.
- 4 488 Q. But in fact that's not correct. It was a former -5 CHAIRMAN: It was the named officer who was the

15:53

15:54

15:54

- 6 previous, is that correct?
- 7 MR. MARRINAN: well, he wasn't named, but it was the 8 previous officer who was a superintendent but had been 9 promoted at that stage to chief superintendent rank.
- 10 CHAIRMAN: Hold on. Is that right, Mr. Kelly.
- MR. KELLY: I am very grateful to Mr. Marrinan for doing that. Just for the purposes of your note,
- 13 Chairman, the diary entry to which Mr. Marrinan was
- referring this witness was Nick Keogh's entry of the
- 15 15th May '14. It's page 13256.
- 16 CHAI RMAN: 13256.
- 17 MR. KELLY: It was suggested --
- 18 CHAIRMAN: Hold on a second. Give me the date again,
- 19 Mr. Kelly.
- MR. KELLY: According to my scribbled handwriting, it's 15:54

  15th May '14.
- 22 CHAIRMAN: I know the reference, I know the one you're
- talking about, 15th May '14, yes.
- MR. KELLY: Yes.
- 25 CHAIRMAN: And what you want to say is that -- 15:54
- MR. KELLY: It's not a big deal.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: No, no, but just for accuracy.
- 28 MR. KELLY: Mr. Marrinan suggested that it was Chief
- 29 Superintendent Curran.

1	CHAIRMAN: Yes.
2	MR. KELLY: In fact it was his predecessor.
3	CHAIRMAN: It wasn't, it was the previous
4	MR. KELLY: I think Glacken was the blank.
5	CHAIRMAN: I don't think there is any big deal about 15:5
6	that because there's no allegation.
7	MR. KELLY: No.
8	CHAIRMAN: It's just a matter of historical accuracy.
9	Thank you very much, Mr. Kelly, for that.
10	15:5:
11	END OF EXAMINATION
12	
13	CHAIRMAN: I assume you don't want to spend six
14	machines cross-examining, Mr. Kelly, and I'm perfectly
15	sure that Commissioner Ó Cualáin is probably quite 15:5
16	happy to leave it until tomorrow.
17	MR. KELLY: That's fine by me.
18	CHAIRMAN: If that's fine by everybody, then that's
19	fine by everybody.
20	MR. MARRINAN: Chairman, it would be helpful perhaps if 15:5
21	we could have a rough indication how long all the
22	parties are going to be.
23	CHAIRMAN: I am sure the commissioner would like to
24	know that. Any idea, Mr. Kelly? Nobody wants to
25	constrain you in any way, but it would be helpful. 15:5
26	MR. KELLY: <b>Yeah.</b>
27	CHAIRMAN: If it's possible to do so.
28	MR. KELLY: What I am going to do is have a think
29	overnight, it has been my general experience if given

1	time overnight, it probably speeds things up.	
2	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
3	MR. KELLY: I can't honestly say, but I don't think I'm	
4	going to be	
5	CHAIRMAN: Let me put it this way, will you more than a $^{\scriptscriptstyle 1}$	15:56
6	day.	
7	MR. KELLY: No.	
8	CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Sorry, I don't mean to be rude	
9	in that or brusk, but I would be hoping, Mr. Kelly,	
10	that we would complete the Commissioner's evidence	15:56
11	tomorrow.	
12	MR. KELLY: well I think that should be possible.	
13	CHAIRMAN: It should be a reasonable expectation, so	
14	that we can finish with him and finish this week's	
15	work.	15:56
16	MR. KELLY: If it's of help to you and the witness, I'm	
17	fought going to traipse over areas that have already	
18	been traipsed over.	
19	CHAIRMAN: Thanks.	
20	MR. KELLY: I may have to touch some clearly because	15:56
21	the examination has been very thorough.	
22	CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that. I don't want to	
23	constrain you in any way. Yes.	
24	MR. MURPHY: Chairman, subject to Mr. Kelly's	
25	cross-examination, I propose to be very brief.	15:56
26	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. I suppose, unless it	
27	was hugely convenient, I propose to sit on a bit if	
28	necessary, and you might want me to do that at	
29	lunchtime, I am quite happy to do either or both. But	

1	I would be kind of keen, if it was possible within
2	reason and if it only took an extra few minutes, then I
3	would prefer to do that. All right. And I am sure the
4	commissioner would prefer to do that as well. Which is
5	more to the point.
6	THE WITNESS: I would, Chairman.
7	CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you very much.
8	
9	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL FRIDAY, 14TH FEBRUARY
10	<u>2020 AT 10: 30AM</u>
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	

		T		
•	22:14, 137:16	1st [4] - 117:7, 122:4,	67:28, 71:11, 113:12,	<b>3993</b> [1] - 79:8
	<b>13</b> [2] <b>-</b> 2:31, 3:8	142:23, 143:10	139:23	<b>3996</b> [1] - 81:28
	<b>13256</b> [3] - 30:22,		<b>24</b> [2] - 3:14, 96:26	<b>3998</b> [1] - 82:5
<b>'10</b> [1] - 77:7	163:15, 163:16	2	24th [5] - 72:25,	3rd [3] - 130:18,
<b>'11</b> [1] - 13:11	<b>13257</b> [1] - 35:10		132:14, 132:19,	131:19, 155:19
<b>'14</b> [3] - 163:15,	<b>13258</b> [1] - 35:26		157:6, 157:9	Í
163:21, 163:23	<b>13264</b> [1] - 97:26	<b>2</b> [5] <b>-</b> 2:32, 3:3, 4:9,	<b>25</b> [1] - 3:14	4
<b>'15</b> [1] - 92:18	<b>13265</b> [1] - 98:6	62:15, 62:16	<b>25th</b> [1] - 28:29	7
	<b>13269</b> [1] - 53:20	<b>20</b> [1] - 3:12	<b>26</b> [1] - 3:15	
1	<b>138</b> [1] - 1:18	<b>200</b> [1] - 72:13	<b>26th</b> [2] - 136:8,	<b>4</b> [3] <b>-</b> 2:19, 3:4,
•	<b>139</b> [1] - 136:10	<b>2002</b> [1] - 8:1	147:15	153:25
		<b>2003</b> [1] - 8:2	<b>27</b> [1] - 3:15	<b>4000</b> [1] - 85:13
<b>1</b> [1] - 3:2	13th [5] - 52:23,	<b>2006</b> [3] - 8:3, 8:6,	<b>27th</b> [4] - 35:27,	<b>4001</b> [1] - 85:9
<b>10</b> [1] - 3:7	53:21, 56:1, 77:12,	17:10		<b>4005</b> [1] - 85:22
<b>100</b> [1] - 96:24	146:20	<b>2007</b> [6] - 13:14,	36:6, 136:13, 136:15	<b>4009</b> [1] - 130:19
<b>106</b> [1] - 49:2	<b>13TH</b> [2] - 1:18, 6:1	14:9, 17:8, 46:12,	<b>28</b> [1] - 3:16	<b>4010</b> [1] - 131:8
<b>10797</b> [1] - 132:7	<b>14</b> [1] - 3:9	64:17, 133:1	<b>29</b> [1] - 3:17	<b>4012</b> [1] - 131:13
<b>10802</b> [2] - 132:14,	<b>14th</b> [4] - 91:21,	<b>2008</b> [1] - 13:3	<b>2941</b> [1] - 121:29	<b>435</b> [1] - 49:16
132:19	91:22, 101:17, 102:2	<b>2010</b> [6] - 13:11,	<b>29th</b> [3] - 62:10,	<b>47</b> [2] - 135:7, 140:25
<b>10804</b> [1] - 140:3	<b>14TH</b> [1] - 166:9	74:29, 76:8, 76:9,	63:19, 149:3	4:00pm [1] - 53:24
<b>10815</b> [1] - 62:6	<b>15</b> [2] - 3:9, 97:7	77:6, 122:4	<b>2nd</b> [2] - 99:23,	' ''
<b>10822</b> [1] - 135:4	<b>154</b> [1] - 140:23	<b>2011</b> [1] - 8:11	125:4	<b>4th</b> [1] - 146:24
<b>10824</b> [1] - 106:27	15th [13] - 22:14,			<del>  _</del>
	28:24, 29:28, 32:19,	<b>2012</b> [4] - 8:8, 8:13,	3	5
<b>10826</b> [1] - 136:9 <b>10827</b> [1] - 136:13	34:23, 35:7, 35:8,	8:14, 146:5		
	103:9, 105:21,	<b>2014</b> [35] - 1:3, 8:16,		<b>5</b> [3] <b>-</b> 3:4, 48:7,
<b>10832</b> [1] - 137:16	152:15, 163:15,	8:19, 8:28, 10:23,	<b>3</b> [3] - 3:3, 140:22,	155:12
<b>10834</b> [1] - 139:22	163:21, 163:23	12:23, 28:4, 28:29,	153:21	<b>50</b> [1] - 112:16
<b>10847</b> [1] - 108:12	<b>16</b> [3] - 1:5, 3:10,	49:27, 62:10, 63:20,	<b>30</b> [1] - 3:17	<b>51</b> [1] - 2:18
<b>10851</b> [1] - 142:19	6:20	67:28, 80:28, 92:17,	<b>30th</b> [2] - 37:13,	<b>59</b> [1] - 96:25
<b>10853</b> [1] - 144:19	<b>16,000</b> [1] - 9:27	96:9, 96:13, 99:23,	140:2	
<b>10867</b> [1] - 145:14	<b>16th</b> [11] - 63:20,	103:10, 107:1,	<b>31</b> [1] - 3:18	5:06pm [1] - 122:6
<b>10871</b> [1] <b>-</b> 145:19	67:10, 67:15, 96:9,	115:21, 116:3,	<b>31st</b> [1] - 143:13	<b>5th</b> [4] - 72:27, 85:3,
<b>10872</b> [1] - 146:1	96:13, 96:15, 105:17,	132:19, 132:27,	<b>32</b> [2] - 2:24, 3:18	145:14, 148:1
<b>10875</b> [1] - 146:3	131:7, 132:7, 136:29,	133:19, 136:9,	<b>33</b> [1] - 3:19	
<b>10881</b> [1] - 146:8	157:9	137:17, 138:16,	<b>33-34</b> [1] - 4:12	6
<b>10882</b> [1] - 146:19	<b>17</b> [2] - 1:9, 3:10	139:23, 146:11,	<b>34</b> [1] - 3:19	
<b>109</b> [1] - 92:1	<b>17:46</b> [1] - 96:16	150:17, 152:6, 153:4,	<b>35</b> [1] - 3:20	<b>6</b> [4] - 3:5, 5:5, 16:25,
<b>10904</b> [1] - 146:24	<b>18</b> [1] - 3:11	155:19, 156:8, 157:24	<b>36</b> [1] - 3:20	156:4
<b>10905</b> [2] - 147:10,	<b>18:52</b> [1] - 105:22	<b>2015</b> [25] - 12:3,	<b>37</b> [1] - 3:21	<b>66</b> [1] - 135:7
149:6	<b>18:56</b> [1] - 98:11	72:25, 72:27, 76:2,	<b>38</b> [1] - 3:21	00[1] - 155.7
10:30AM [1] - 166:10		77:12, 77:17, 85:3,	<b>39</b> [1] - 3:22	7
10th [2] - 89:12,	<b>18:57</b> [2] - 87:14,	85:12, 85:22, 95:3,	<b>3901</b> [1] - 67:25	7
153:4	87:26	108:11, 115:22,	<b>3911</b> [1] - 105:16	
<b>11</b> [1] <b>-</b> 3:7	<b>18th</b> [2] - 107:1,	117:7, 121:22, 140:2,	<b>3946</b> [1] - 55:29	<b>7</b> [7] - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5,
<b>11-13</b> [1] - 4:3	108:11	143:10, 143:13,	<b>3969</b> [1] - 19:11	4:13, 46:14, 133:21,
<b>11033</b> [1] - 90:12	<b>19</b> [1] - 3:11	145:14, 146:22,	<b>3971</b> [1] - 27:12	157:4
<b>11076</b> [2] - 129:11,	<b>191</b> [1] - 144:29	146:24, 148:1, 157:6,	<b>3971</b> [1] - 27:12	<b>7/6/2014</b> [1] - 37:26
129:12	<b>1921</b> [1] - 1:9	157:9, 157:10, 158:8	<b>3974</b> [1] - 29:1	<b>73/15</b> [1] - 90:28
<b>11142</b> [1] - 129:16	<b>1983</b> [1] - 6:21	<b>2016</b> [2] - 10:11,		<b>7307</b> [1] - 6:16
<b>11159</b> [1] - 129:6	<b>1987</b> [1] - 6:24	131:19	<b>3975</b> [1] - 29:29	<b>7360</b> [1] - 151:15
<b>11329</b> [1] - 70:13	<b>1988</b> [1] <b>-</b> 7:2	<b>2017</b> [5] <b>-</b> 1:5, 1:9,	<b>3976</b> [1] - 101:28	<b>75</b> [3] - 135:5,
	<b>1992</b> [1] - 7:3	12:8, 12:11, 48:5	<b>3977</b> [1] - 99:20	136:11, 140:24
<b>11363</b> [1] - 87:7	<b>1994</b> [2] - 7:11, 7:18	<b>2018</b> [2] - 1:9, 150:17	<b>3978</b> [1] - 103:10	<b>7795</b> [1] - 46:15
<b>1142</b> [1] - 129:10	<b>1996</b> [1] - 7:19	<b>2020</b> [3] - 1:18, 6:2,	<b>3979</b> [1] - 49:26	
<b>11th</b> [4] - 49:27,	<b>1999</b> [1] - 158:25	166:10	<b>3980</b> [1] - 51:17	<b>7828</b> [1] - 48:3
101:8, 135:8, 138:15	<b>19:06</b> [1] - 89:16	<b>21</b> [1] - 3:12	<b>3982</b> [1] - 52:24	<b>7831</b> [1] - 48:6
<b>12</b> [2] <b>-</b> 3:8, 4:8	<b>19:21</b> [1] - 88:9	<b>21st</b> [1] - 146:21	<b>3985</b> [1] - 62:12	<b>7843</b> [1] - 13:29
<b>123</b> [1] - 96:2	<b>19th</b> [2] - 35:10,	<b>22</b> [1] - 3:13	<b>3986</b> [1] - 63:6	<b>7845</b> [1] - 15:4
<b>124</b> [1] - 96:3			<b>3987</b> [1] - 63:18	<b>7847</b> [1] - 15:15
	1 35:11	1 23 M - 3·13		
<b>125</b> [1] - 96:4	35:11 <b>1:45pm</b> (1) - 122:6	23 [1] - 3:13	<b>3989</b> [1] - 71:28	<b>7849</b> [1] - 16:3
	1:45pm [1] - 122:6	<b>23</b> [1] - 3:13 <b>23rd</b> [5] - 67:7,	1	<b>7849</b> [1] - 16:3 <b>7850</b> [1] - 16:24

7:46 [1] - 98:8 27:11 13:29, 28:25, 124:29, aim [2] - 14:26, 15:9 alternatives [1] -7th [5] - 35:9, 38:26, accordance[4] -133:1, 134:21, 162:14 air [2] - 110:16, 65:17 44:19, 85:12, 156:8 16:11, 17:9, 31:12, addressing[1] -151:3 amalgamated [1] -64:16 65:28 aired [2] - 41:18, 117:24 according [1] -ADJOURNED [2] ambitious [3] - 9:15, 8 61:9 163:20 95:22, 166:9 **AISLING** [2] - 2:11, 10:9 administration [2] -**AMENDED**[1] - 1:9 accordingly [1] -**8**[3] - 3:6, 3:28, 65:7 8:20, 9:9 **ALAN**[2] - 3:9, 3:13 amended [2] - 48:2, 157:21 **ADMINISTRATIVE** account [2] - 11:13, alarm [1] - 135:1 64:17 **82** [1] - 145:1 36:13 111 - 3:14 **ALISON** [1] - 3:26 Amendment[1] -8th [8] - 17:26, 18:1, Accounts [2] administrative [6] -17:10 allegation [16] -71:29, 77:9, 77:17, 10:29, 11:12 6:26, 78:19, 84:21, 34:8, 36:26, 46:8, amount [2] - 26:16, 85:21, 97:26, 132:27 accuracy [2] -119:8, 132:21, 133:28 49:10, 64:2, 65:14, 74:16 163:27, 164:8 adopted [3] - 63:14, 78:12, 99:29, 100:24, ample [2] - 92:14, 9 80:20. 130:9 achievable [1] - 20:4 109:13, 129:26, 92:16 achieved [1] - 57:21 advantage [1] -141:4, 145:24, **AN**[1] - 3:2 150:10, 159:10, 164:6 acknowledge [1] -102:19 analysed [1] - 74:14 9 [2] - 3:6, 158:8 advantages [1] allegations [60] -69:13 analysis [5] - 72:28, 9(2[1] - 16:13 acknowledged [1] -58.17 15:19, 16:20, 16:29, 73:1, 74:27, 136:7, 9(2)[1] - 16:11 64:11 advertised [1] - 12:4 17:6, 21:12, 23:2, 146:15 90% [1] - 74:26 **ACT** [2] - 1:3, 1:8 advertising [1] - 6:27 33:16, 34:15, 34:18, **AND** [5] - 1:3, 1:4, **92** [1] - 72:14 act [3] - 73:3, 145:26, advice [11] - 50:6, 39:13, 54:27, 55:9, 1:8, 3:15, 95:22 9:00pm [1] - 97:29 50:9, 50:10, 51:5, 57:19, 62:26, 62:29, 146:17 **ANDREW** [2] - 2:22, 9:58am [1] - 122:6 63:9, 63:10, 63:12, Act [11] - 13:14, 53:17, 73:16, 88:14, 4:5 9th [14] - 18:5, 19:10, 63:22, 63:25, 68:22, 99:15, 125:6, 157:8 17:10, 18:16, 28:4, **Andrew** [1] - 146:4 19:12, 19:28, 87:8, advices [1] - 63:16 70:1, 70:3, 72:6, 72:9, 28:5, 50:2, 50:4, **ANNE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 87:24, 87:25, 88:27, 133:18, 133:21, advise [2] - 51:1, 72:26, 73:1, 80:10, annual [1] - 38:18 99:20, 101:8, 101:12, 80:17, 80:19, 85:8, 135:3, 145:16 133:16 anonymity [1] -146:5, 146:9, 146:11 95:8, 97:10, 101:24, **ACTING** [4] - 3:7, advised [10] - 70:17, 41:22 103:19, 103:21, 3:13, 5:3, 6:9 70:22. 77:25. 81:20. answer [4] - 75:8, Α 103:28, 104:24, 88:5, 89:19, 96:12, Acting [1] - 6:5 92:6, 96:26, 136:4 104:27, 107:18, acting [5] - 10:12, 105:25, 105:26, 137:1 **ANTHONY** [1] - 3:6 108:16, 119:29, **A's** [3] - 71:9, 76:8, Affairs [4] - 88:15, 12:9, 12:11, 12:15, anxious [7] - 33:6, 120:3, 129:21, 88:16, 89:7, 90:14 87:20 16:8 37:8, 38:23, 39:10, 130:10, 138:25, **A.**. [1] - 63:2 affect [1] - 26:21action [9] - 1:27, 40:21, 89:3, 125:22 141:5, 141:11, 18:19, 60:19, 61:6, affected [1] - 41:29 able [7] - 21:3, 39:7, anyway [4] - 58:2, 141:23, 145:10, 51:10, 69:24, 76:22, 61:9, 63:14, 79:26, affecting [1] - 161:27 67:11, 104:17, 124:22 145:16, 145:29, 152:28, 154:8 affidavit [10] - 20:27, 80:20, 90:2 apart [2] - 157:18, 146:15, 147:17, above-named [1] actioned [1] - 88:22 21:11, 21:19, 26:8, 160:26 147:18, 148:23, 1.26 actions [2] - 18:24, 27:11, 27:14, 30:5, apologise [1] -148:26, 156:6, 157:6, absent [1] - 69:8 61:21 32:28, 40:1, 152:16 112:11 absolute [2] - 53:25, activities [3] - 62:27, afford [1] - 72:26 apparent [2] - 39:27, alleged [7] - 57:10, 74:2 72:6, 74:29 afternoon [1] - 95:25 145.22 74:22, 79:5, 108:15, absolutely [6] activity [1] - 14:12 afterwards [2] - 88:1, **APPEAL**[2] - 1:13, 129:27, 138:5, 138:9 24:17, 24:22, 81:2, actual [6] - 13:1, 98:11 alleviate [2] - 103:4, 105:3, 144:26, 149:27 40:1, 44:28, 74:12, agenda [3] - 39:25, appear [9] - 17:17, 116:29 AC [16] - 30:27, 31:6, 115:13, 144:24 116:22, 150:27 66:6, 73:5, 73:22, allocated [2] -31:13, 32:21, 35:18, adamant [1] - 121:19 ago [1] - 125:15 74:21, 128:6, 128:18, 113:27, 118:20 36:4, 37:16, 51:23, add [2] - 152:9, agree [3] - 15:27, 160:7, 160:19 allocation [1] - 8:9 53:4, 53:24, 98:8, 157:18 16:2, 100:10 APPEARANCES[1] allocations [1] -122:6, 123:12, addition [3] - 9:24, agreed [4] - 12:16, 118:7 123:25, 125:6, 125:17 11:25. 45:11 63:22, 79:18, 108:15 appeared [6] - 39:10, allow [2] - 39:6, AC's [1] - 123:14 additional [8] - 9:3, agreement [2] - 68:3, 96:18, 104:4, 106:19, 80:25 accept [4] - 93:13, 85:24, 86:25, 92:24, 101:26 106:20, 138:15 alluded [1] - 107:19 94:9, 127:19, 127:21 120:11, 131:7, agrees [1] - 103:12 appendices [1] almost [2] - 81:23, access [4] - 62:19, 131:12, 142:26 AGSI [1] - 4:4 145:28 93.5 68:23, 71:10, 74:26 address [5] - 10:3, ahead [1] - 29:2 application [15] alone [2] - 23:5, accommodation [1] 128:13, 133:15, 7:9, 46:2, 53:5, 53:8, aid [1] - 65:29 116:25 - 58:27 134:23, 137:4 **AIDAN** [2] - 3:9, 4:6 53:18, 68:18, 69:4, alternative [1] - 47:8 accompanied [1] addressed [6] -71:23, 74:23, 75:2, Aidan [1] - 99:23

75:10, 81:1, 81:5, 81:8, 92:19 applications [2] -75:5, 135:19 applied [5] - 12:4, 54:5, 94:15, 118:14, 119.19 apply [2] - 48:25, 118:24 appoint [3] - 20:29, 23:8, 84:23 appointed [21] -13:10, 13:18, 18:5, 21:29, 25:8, 28:23, 29:8, 29:13, 30:3, 30:27, 31:6, 38:15, 44:13, 78:16, 79:3, 113:16, 114:24, 133:2, 148:13, 148:16, 152:11 appointing [1] -28:27 appointment [26] -11:22, 18:10, 19:12, 25:6, 26:7, 26:18, 26:19, 27:5, 28:24, 28:28, 33:12, 35:4, 45:18, 64:15, 64:23, 64:29, 77:22, 78:25, 79:19, 82:7, 82:10, 82:11, 83:29, 99:15, 147:20, 148:9 appointments [4] -13:13, 25:20, 25:23, 73:15 appreciate [4] - 30:9, 133:23, 141:18, 165:22 appreciated [2] -63:24, 82:3 appreciation [1] -91:9 approach [5] - 66:13, 105:6, 115:15, 124:2, 142.13 approached [5] -58:6, 60:28, 100:14, 126:25, 126:28 appropriate [8] -51:9, 63:14, 79:26, 80:20, 100:12, 103:27, 131:27, 144:17 appropriateness [1] - 18·12 approval [1] - 9:17 April [8] - 72:25, 117:7, 122:4, 125:4, 127:14, 142:23, 143:10, 157:6

**Aran** [1] - 7:6 area [3] - 82:26, 82:29, 139:18 areas [5] - 9:19, 10:6, 10:7, 72:8, 165:17 argument [1] - 97:14 arise [5] - 16:14, 50:17, 124:19, 130:24, 133:20 arisen [5] - 9:20, 23:13, 57:5, 115:22, 128:14 arises [1] - 107:11 arising [10] - 13:4, 25:2. 25:13. 33:2. 44:7, 85:10, 92:7, 93:28, 131:9, 134:18 armed [1] - 155:22 armoury [1] - 113:29 arose [13] - 10:23, 11:1, 12:28, 24:25, 32:24, 42:5, 44:22, 80:23, 106:18, 118:29, 127:11, 148:27, 156:20 **ARRAN**[2] - 2:24, 4:12 arrange [2] - 100:16, 100:22 arranged [2] -101:17, 117:18 arrangement [1] -79.17 arrangements [6] -45:12, 59:23, 77:21, 118:23, 119:3, 148:12 arrest [4] - 114:12, 114:20, 114:21, 114:28 arrested [3] - 49:8, 156:9, 157:11 arrived [2] - 20:24, 98:25 article [5] - 136:15, 137:25, 138:14, 138:17, 138:21 AS [4] - 1:9, 6:1,

6:10, 95:22

100:14

115:19

142:14

ascertain [1] -

aspect [5] - 8:23,

aspects [9] - 10:15,

23:1, 25:13, 49:14,

64:25, 73:16, 77:26,

106:9, 115:11

assemble [1] -

23:7, 78:4, 82:27,

assembled [1] -26:17 assigned [6] - 8:15, 12:5, 29:4, 30:15, 127:27, 140:10 assignment [1] -6:21 assist [8] - 7:18, 17:23, 20:12, 23:15, 65:28, 87:11, 100:22, 113:9 assistance [5] -22:5, 135:20, 137:2, 139:2, 139:20 assistant [17] - 7:21. 8:8, 8:9, 8:24, 11:24, 53:28, 62:13, 73:17, 79:15, 79:21, 82:9, 84:4, 106:26, 119:13, 133:2, 133:15, 152:1 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Assistant [15] - 8:26, 14:2, 62:6, 62:8, 62:14, 67:28, 78:16, 85:19, 86:6, 88:25, 96:15, 97:13, 148:14, 148:16, 151:21 assuaged [1] - 71:12 assume [6] - 64:26, 88:5, 114:2, 118:28, 134:12, 164:13 assuming [1] -160:16 assumption [2] -23:3, 27:1 assure [2] - 75:15, 93:19 **AT**[1] - 166:10 Athlone [37] - 27:20, 34:21, 34:25, 50:19, 53:3. 57:6. 57:11. 57:21, 58:4, 59:21, 59:28, 60:6, 60:17, 61:1, 61:19, 61:27, 62:22, 68:7, 72:7, 72:10, 88:24, 91:7, 98:21, 99:14, 99:23, 100:4, 117:14, 117:18, 118:29, 119:5, 122:8, 123:12, 129:25, 152:3, 153:28, 154:20, 160.20 **ATHLONE** [1] - 4:3 attached [6] - 19:15, 19:19, 62:22, 99:26, 145:28, 146:28

attend [2] - 22:11, 39:21 attended [3] - 38:12, 64:28. 135:11 attending [1] - 67:11 attention [13] -19:21, 93:8, 94:17, 106:5, 122:22, 144:16, 146:29, 154:15, 154:18, 156:29, 157:1, 161:25, 162:27 attestation [1] - 6:22 attitude [1] - 83:9 au [1] - 44:6 August [11] - 12:12, 49:27, 51:16, 52:24, 53:21, 55:19, 56:1, 62:10, 63:19, 127:25, 128:6 August/September [1] - 92:17 author [2] - 68:26, 160:16 authority [1] - 84:21 automatic [1] - 23:3 avail [1] - 81:4 available [22] -21:26, 38:17, 43:29, 51:11, 54:21, 54:22, 68:25, 73:6, 75:4, 75:17, 75:22, 78:7, 81:10, 81:11, 88:8, 91 29 92 14 95 13 100:7, 106:16, 120:12, 143:3 availing [1] - 24:15 avenue [4] - 33:26, 42:2, 42:20, 139:9 avenues [2] -121:13, 135:29 await [1] - 63:16 aware [52] - 18:1, 18:2, 18:4, 18:9, 21:11, 35:23, 35:24, 39:12, 45:18, 45:28, 45:29, 50:21, 59:15, 60:3, 60:15, 66:23, 66:28, 67:2, 69:18, 69:23, 69:25, 71:2, 73:28, 89:1, 91:23, 94:29, 97:19, 98:13, 98:15, 100:24, 100:27, 103:18, 105:11, 105:12, 105:15, 106:9, 110:26, 113:15, 114:11, 117:29,

122:17, 123:29,

158:11

128:19, 128:28, 128:29, 129:2, 137:10, 143:3, 154:6, 156:15, 156:16 awareness [1] -150:29

#### В

**B's** [1] - 73:9 backed [1] - 110:10 background [3] -28:12, 28:16, 50:20 bad [1] - 16:22 badly [3] - 102:8, 150:6, 150:14 bailiwick [2] -110:12, 110:13 **bald** [1] - 23:16 Ballyshannon [1] **bar** [3] - 54:1, 56:15, 121:24 BAR [1] - 2:31 bare [1] - 54:27 Barrett [3] - 79:12, 82:25. 146:22 Barrett's [1] - 81:29 barriers [1] - 15:25 base [1] - 46:2 based [12] - 32:1, 54:20, 59:7, 72:29, 76:21, 78:17, 114:2, 115:18, 119:18, 121:8, 145:23, 146:15 basis [41] - 11:28, 16:1, 18:23, 21:1, 23:21, 25:28, 29:24, 43:27, 44:1, 50:13, 53:16, 58:6, 58:7, 58:14, 59:5, 61:21, 68:28, 74:14, 75:20, 92:20. 92:28. 93:12. 98:26, 99:2, 105:14, 107:15, 110:10, 114:18, 114:27, 115:14, 124:5, 130:9, 130:21, 132:23, 139:14, 139:19, 140:6, 140:14, 141:27, 148:17, 151:27 **BASTION**[1] - 4:2 bear [1] - 71:27 became [16] - 12:22, 18:4, 39:27, 42:13, 42:22, 59:15, 61:29, 73:6, 91:23, 93:11,

105:12, 111:11,

attempt [2] - 96:13,

116:25, 120:12, 124:1, 160:21 become [12] - 9:19, 11:14, 17:26, 35:23, 40:23, 52:3, 78:3, 96:29, 97:1, 105:11, 105:15, 133:20 **BEEN** [1] - 6:9 beg [1] - 132:25 began [1] - 26:3 begin [1] - 148:18 beginning [1] - 20:16 behalf [6] - 9:9, 13:6, 16:8, 95:15, 160:28, 162:3 behaviour [2] - 14:6. 129:25 behind [1] - 98:4 belief [2] - 92:13, 143:12 believes [1] - 97:17 bell [1] - 112:7 bells [1] - 135:1 belonging [1] - 74:17 **below** [1] - 65:9 best [5] - 29:17, 29:20, 51:5, 116:27, 118:9 better [1] - 121:23 between [20] - 20:13, 22:19, 27:7, 35:8, 38:18, 42:26, 45:25, 73:8, 74:16, 75:24, 75:28, 79:20, 83:5, 89:4, 117:4, 125:23, 127:24, 143:8, 144:12, 157:9 beyond [1] - 32:10 big [3] - 83:21, 163:26, 164:5 bigger [1] - 93:14 billing [5] - 73:6, 73:24, 75:13, 76:8, 120:22 bio [1] - 31:19 bit [6] - 27:26, 29:1, 40:27, 68:28, 137:12, 165:27 **bits** [1] - 69:1 bizarre [1] - 96:21 **BL** [13] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 4:1, 4:7, 4:10 **blank** [1] - 164:4 **blue** [1] - 122:26 **board** [2] - 94:19, 140.17 **body** [1] - 133:21

bona [3] - 27:23,

27:26, 28:2 book [1] - 113:7 **bottom** [1] - 67:26 **bound** [3] - 34:21, 43:6. 55:1 branch [2] - 10:4,

29.11 brand [1] - 82:28 brave [1] - 60:22 breach [4] - 78:8, 85:8, 107:15, 126:10 breaches [1] - 79:4 break [3] - 49:13, 95:20, 120:29

breathalyser[1] -10:1

**BRIAN** [2] - 3:15, 3:16 brief [1] - 165:25 briefly [3] - 13:27, 71:6, 132:6

bring [5] - 15:18, 29:27, 121:25, 129:29, 154:15 bringing [2] - 90:25,

122.22 brings [2] - 57:4, 67:6

broadcast [2] - 18:1, 18:2

broaden [1] - 7:1 broader [1] - 74:10 broken [1] - 7:20 brought [9] - 71:2, 76:18, 101:20, 106:5, 154:18, 156:28, 157:1, 161:24, 162:27 brusk [1] - 165:9

buck [1] - 83:3 bugged [2] - 36:19,

buildings [1] -111.29

bullied [1] - 150:4 **bullying** [1] - 143:13 bumping [1] - 112:14 Bureau [1] - 6:25 BURKE [1] - 4:11 burst [1] - 125:15

business [7] - 29:23, 34:29, 89:3, 109:21, 110:8, 114:18, 159:28 busy [5] - 11:8, 11:16, 29:15, 38:16, 159.12

BY [13] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10, 5:5, 6:10

C

**CAGNEY** [1] - 3:17 calibre [1] - 22:10 Callinan [2] - 10:27, 12:25 cannot [2] - 43:7, 64:25 capacity [5] - 8:20, 10:12, 13:8, 119:8, 132.21 car [6] - 122:14, 122:17, 123:23, 124:20, 143:19, 156:8 careers [1] - 31:23 careful [1] - 54:24 carefully [2] - 21:19, 27:14 CARR [1] - 3:15 **CARRICK** [1] - 2:13 CARRICK-ON-**SHANNON** [1] - 2:13

**CARROLL** [1] - 2:16 carry [2] - 19:23, 133:2

114:10

2:17

25:9, 25:11, 28:2, 28:20, 29:16, 36:4, 43:12, 47:7, 51:9, 97:14, 115:3, 121:26, 128:5, 135:8, 148:20, 150:23, 152:6, 152:22, 156:13, 158:9

CASTLE[1] - 1:17 caused [3] - 10:3,

central [1] - 145:4

25:20, 25:21, 26:15, 26:16, 40:21, 58:20, 59:11, 61:23, 61:27,

108:20, 108:27 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3

**certainly** [7] - 20:8,

certify [1] - 1:24

chair [2] - 13:3, 36:23

Chair [1] - 154:27 CHAIRMAN [160] -1:12, 6:4, 6:7, 6:14, 23:17, 23:20, 23:23, 23:28, 24:1, 24:4, 24:8, 24:10, 24:12, 24:20, 26:9, 26:14, 26:24, 26:26, 26:28,

32:10, 32:16, 36:28, 50:23, 50:28, 51:8,

69:8, 69:11, 69:21, 69:27, 70:1, 70:5,

77:5, 77:7, 78:26, carried [5] - 53:3, 61:22, 76:21, 114:16,

carrying [2] - 70:26,

CARTHAGE[1] -

case [21] - 24:10,

cases [2] - 147:25, 150:22

11:2, 71:8 causing [1] - 16:19

cautioned [1] - 157:8 cease [1] - 46:22

certain [17] - 25:5,

69:17, 69:18, 75:25, 102:19, 105:12,

32:17, 34:17, 71:7,

95:2, 104:28, 108:2 chain [2] - 89:6, 137:14

27:4, 27:9, 28:4, 28:7, 31:1, 31:3, 32:7,

51:13, 68:27, 69:5,

70:8, 70:10, 76:14, 76:24, 76:27, 76:29,

78:28, 79:2, 79:6, 83:3. 83:7. 83:9.

83:13, 83:16, 83:18, 83:21, 84:3, 84:9, 84:11, 84:14, 84:20,

84:22, 84:25, 84:27, 85:1, 86:23, 87:1,

87:3, 90:5, 90:7, 90:25, 91:21, 95:17,

95:19, 95:25, 102:11, 102:14. 102:18.

102:24, 102:26, 102:28, 103:1, 103:6, 104:10, 104:17,

109:22, 109:25, 109:27, 110:1, 110:3,

110:12, 111:2, 111:6, 111:12, 111:20, 111:26, 112:3, 112:5,

112:28, 121:11, 121:15, 121:17, 124:9, 124:17, 126:3,

134:2, 134:23, 134:27, 142:6, 142:9, 142:11, 148:14,

148:22, 149:2, 149:5, 149:25, 149:28, 150:8, 150:10, 151:3,

151:6, 151:14, 154:25, 154:28,

155:6, 155:9, 155:11, 158:21, 158:27, 160:25, 160:29, 161:5, 161:8, 163:5,

163:10, 163:16, 163:18, 163:22,

164:1, 164:3, 164:5, 164:8, 164:13, 164:18, 164:23, 164:27, 165:2, 165:5, 165:8, 165:13, 165:19, 165:22, 165:26, 166:7 Chairman [78] - 7:7,

163:25, 163:27,

7:14, 7:25, 12:21, 15:2, 15:27, 17:14, 17:20, 17:29, 18:15, 19:1, 20:12, 20:14, 25:4, 27:25, 29:14, 35:23, 41:13, 42:9, 43:17, 47:15, 50:9, 60:1, 62:4, 66:17, 73:10, 76:17, 78:6, 81:2, 82:19, 86:12,

93:7, 93:17, 94:9, 95:9, 102:7, 104:15, 104:21, 108:7, 109:7, 109:12, 109:16, 111:17, 111:27, 114:9, 114:15, 116:6.

116:9, 116:13, 117:21, 122:19, 124:13, 127:26, 130:5, 130:17, 135:23, 136:5, 136:6, 139:6, 140:9, 140:27,

141:28, 148:6, 149:7, 149:13, 150:15, 155:8, 155:28, 156:1, 156:16, 157:16,

157:18, 160:11, 160:21, 163:13,

164:20, 165:24, 166:6 Chairperson [1] -147:20

**challenge.** [1] - 55:1 challenged [1] -29:23

**chance** [1] - 152:16

challenges [1] -

change [8] - 8:21, 9:13, 9:15, 10:9, 12:6, 35:13, 79:16, 132:16 changed [4] - 59:13, 91:7, 92:18, 113:5

channelled [1] -134.4

charge [9] - 7:21, 8:20, 59:4, 78:19, 120:26, 124:8, 131:4, 134:7, 159:27

**charged** [2] - 55:10, 162:1

charges [1] - 130:22

**CHARLTON**[1] - 4:8 charter [12] - 13:2, 13:27, 14:5, 14:26, 15:3, 15:9, 16:3, 17:1, 21:22, 27:27, 40:29, chat [1] - 39:4 CHEALLACHÁIN [1] - 2:30 **check** [1] - 138:3 checked [1] - 158:10 checks [1] - 28:12 chief [30] - 8:3, 8:6, 13:15, 13:16, 29:25, 30:29, 31:7, 31:17, 32:2, 47:16, 47:19, 47:28, 68:5, 68:17, 78:10, 78:11, 78:13, 82:26, 85:24, 103:25, 106:11, 110:5, 123:19, 124:6, 124:8, 126:17, 126:18, 133:11, 162:28, 163:9 **Chief** [15] - 31:16, 31:29, 49:29, 83:26, 85:5, 86:4, 90:13, 90:16, 91:14, 124:7, 124:9, 124:10, 124:14, 163:1, 163:28 **CHIEF** [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 **childhood** [1] - 100:2 CHIS [1] - 135:19 choice [4] - 13:24, 61:26, 136:1, 143:17 chronology [3] -101:19, 149:11, 152:10 chunk [1] - 9:11 circumstance [2] -54:13, 69:6 circumstances [8] -42:25, 46:19, 75:7, 81:12, 100:15, 114:2, 130:23, 131:26 city [4] - 7:10, 8:2, 58:18, 58:24 civil [1] - 17:8 Civil [1] - 17:10 civilian [8] - 14:1, 14:14, 14:18, 14:27, 15:10, 16:28, 59:9, 79:17 civilians [1] - 13:17 claims [1] - 147:25 Clare [2] - 8:1, 122:12

clarification [2] -

27:10, 112:23 **clarified** [1] - 97:5 **clarify** [1] - 50:9 clarity [4] - 26:22, 26:24, 40:5, 45:14 clear [8] - 27:27, 43:5, 59:26, 74:15, 94:11, 143:26, 153:24, 161:17 clearly [4] - 123:20, 151:7, 161:2, 165:20 Cleary [1] - 29:8 client [2] - 111:28, 112:3 **close** [2] - 58:29, 101:16 closely [2] - 20:17, 150:16 closer [1] - 118:24 closing [2] - 123:16, 124:13 clothes [1] - 90:9 CMO [3] - 123:23, 124:20, 143:20 CO [2] - 2:13, 4:4 coaching [3] - 96:21, 104:26, 116:1 code [1] - 17:9 cogency [1] - 26:15 colleague [4] - 8:26, 49:7, 78:14, 119:11 colleagues [11] -16:1, 31:22, 32:10, 39:13, 40:19, 41:7, 41:19, 49:9, 65:15, 65:16, 80:11 college [4] - 6:28, 7:3, 7:5, 150:27 colour [3] - 104:23, 104:28, 105:3 comfort [1] - 59:19 coming [14] - 15:25, 29:22, 41:21, 48:1, 94:1, 95:10, 110:18, 115:26, 134:8, 149:20, 149:22, 151:11, 161:25, 162:11 commenced [1] -141:1 commencing [1] -107:3

commendations [1]

commended [1] -

commentary [1] -

comment [1] -

- 128:25

102.24

117:20

151:11

comments [3] -10:27, 142:22, 143:12 Commission [2] -137:6, 138:11 Commissioner [96] -6:6, 8:14, 8:19, 8:27, 9:10, 9:14, 10:26, 11:27, 12:6, 12:9, 12:13, 12:24, 13:10, 14:2, 15:6, 16:7, 16:27, 20:5, 20:15, 21:4, 27:27, 30:4, 30:16, 46:18, 46:22, 46:24, 47:2, 47:3, 47:7, 47:13, 47:22, 47:25, 47:27, 47:29, 48:13, 48:14, 48:17, 62:6, 62:8, 62:14, 67:29, 68:19, 71:24, 72:1, 72:18, 72:20, 77:12, 77:16, 77:19, 78:15, 78:16, 78:21, 79:2, 79:3, 79:10, 79:18, 80:6, 82:7, 84:11, 84:17, 84:18, 85:19, 86:6, 88:25, 96:15, 97:13, 108:11, 118:1, 118:2, 118:3, 118:19, 119:9, 129:5, 129:8, 132:9, 132:28, 133:8, 133:23, 134:13, 136:23, 140:21, 146:27, 147:2, 147:28, 148:7, 148:14, 148:16, 149:19, 149:25, 150:16, 151:22, 154:19, 161:14, 164:15 **COMMISSIONER** [11] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3.18 3.20 5.3 6.9 commissioner [32] -6:14, 7:21, 8:8, 8:9, 8:16, 8:17, 8:24, 8:25, 12:4, 12:9, 12:11, 12:15, 16:5, 18:6, 53:28, 62:13, 73:17, 79:15, 79:21, 82:9, 84:4, 106:26, 119:14, 132:15, 132:22, 133:2, 133:16, 133:27, 152:1, 164:23, 166:4 Commissioner's [10] - 9:6, 20:25, 26:22, 27:28, 32:12, 132:2, 136:19, 149:8,

11:24 committed [5] -16:27, 73:3, 145:26, 146:17, 158:9 Committee [3] -10:29, 11:12 committees [1] -11:11 **common** [5] - 71:23, 119:15, 125:27, 141:5, 142:12 communicate [1] -99.13 communicated [4] -98:17, 99:5, 113:21, 144:16 communication [6] -73:7, 108:10, 127:26, 143:8, 143:11, 144:6 communications [2] - 135:16, 144:12 commutable [1] -118:25 **COMPANY**[1] - 2:22 compared [1] - 22:26 competent [1] -114:16 complainant [3] -28:16, 28:17, 64:5 complained [5] -44:9, 44:14, 46:1, 102:14, 133:11 complains [1] -91:26 complaint [27] -13:26, 38:24, 46:9, 49:6, 49:9, 49:14, 61:12, 63:1, 65:20, 92:5, 97:12, 99:11, 101:23, 111:5, 111:6, 111:10, 114:13, 115:1, 120:7, 128:20, 133:12, 134:27, 138:9, 151:16, 153:2, 158:14, 158:24 complaints [28] -20:18, 27:17, 27:19, 41:8, 41:28, 45:28, 68:6, 73:29, 91:25, 93:1, 94:24, 94:25, 94:29, 95:16, 96:1, 97:11, 98:9, 98:27, 99:1, 102:15, 110:22, 128:16, 138:5, 151:17, 151:28, 158:28, 161:19, 161:20 complete [3] - 91:1, 141:21, 165:10

commissioners [1] -

completed [4] -141:9, 141:13, 141:15, 145:8 completely [6] -91:10, 93:7, 93:16, 117:21, 122:25, 155:8 completion [2] -141:11, 147:4 complex [2] - 58:19, 135:26 compliance [2] -14:7, 78:20 complicate [1] -102:11 complicit [1] - 72:8 complimentary [1] -123:25 comprehensive [1] -19:25 **computer** [1] - 9:21 computers [1] -87:18 concern [15] - 11:1, 53:1, 56:19, 59:15, 61:10, 61:29, 62:18, 62:27, 92:27, 115:22, 123:1, 123:2, 128:29, 135:21, 158:27 concerned [17] -42:15, 52:1, 54:28, 56:5, 74:29, 86:6, 90:20, 104:20, 108:9, 109:10, 110:26, 115:23, 115:24, 136:14, 137:27, 139:4, 161:14 concerning [14] -10:23, 17:15, 63:23, 99:25, 114:12, 116:18, 117:9, 135:15, 135:16, 135:19, 138:9, 142:21, 145:24, 147:14 concerns [26] -15:19, 16:29, 17:6, 52:14, 52:17, 52:19, 52:21, 53:9, 53:17, 60:18, 61:5, 61:9, 61:17, 70:18, 71:12, 79:23, 93:8, 93:10, 93:12, 95:27, 103:20, 112:21, 113:19, 131:9, 144:20, 161:12 **conclude** [1] - 65:20 concluded [3] -25:16, 64:26, 104:8 conclusion [5] -73:14, 114:18, 114:22, 121:21, 162:7

149:11, 165:10

conclusions [2] -129:16, 129:19 conduct [1] - 49:7 conducted [5] -23:10, 52:4, 103:23, 108:26, 151:21 conducting [3] -57:5, 61:18, 104:13 conference [7] -101:18. 101:19. 135:8, 140:4, 140:15, 149:9, 149:21 conferences [8] -43:6, 59:5, 105:14, 140:5, 140:6, 140:10, 140:12, 150:25 confidential [78] -13:5, 13:12, 13:14, 13:19, 13:23, 14:7, 16:9, 16:18, 17:5, 17:18, 17:19, 17:27, 18:24, 19:5, 19:20, 19:24, 28:20, 30:5, 34:3, 38:7, 39:17, 42:11, 42:19, 43:1, 43:7, 43:10, 43:12, 45:16, 52:10, 52:28, 54:29, 57:17, 62:18, 62:26, 63:1, 72:5, 73:1, 93:9, 94:21, 98:27, 99:2, 99:7, 100:26, 101:6, 101:9, 102:10, 106:16, 107:16, 108:21, 110:14, 113:17, 113:19, 123:4, 126:2, 127:29, 132:27, 132:28, 133:5, 133:10, 133:13, 137:22, 138:8, 138:23, 141:6, 142:21, 142:28, 143:2, 143:4, 143:9, 143.15 143.17 144:4, 144:6, 144:13, 145:29, 146:16, 152:24, 159:29 confidentiality [6] -33:23, 58:21, 69:13, 107:15, 116:23, 126:10 **confines** [1] - 19:8 confirm [1] - 134:19 confirmed [1] -67:15 CONLON [3] - 2:17, 111:27, 112:4 CONNAUGHT[1] -4:3 CONNELLAN[2] -

4:1, 4:1 **CONOR** [1] - 3:24 conscious [2] - 38:6, 149:13 consent [2] - 80:24, 91:28 consequences [3] -81:21, 92:6, 92:7 consider [11] - 50:8, 65:8, 66:9, 81:9, 82:12, 87:4, 90:21, 92:19, 94:16, 118:2, 131:25 considerable [3] -141.19 141.20 155:29 consideration [12] -45:24, 46:2, 64:15, 65:6, 65:29, 80:1, 80:16, 81:7, 82:24, 90:19, 91:11, 130:22 considerations [7] -48:25, 65:13, 65:19, 65:23, 66:15, 66:26, considered [22] -46:4, 50:12, 53:13, 53:14. 53:19. 54:7. 54:17, 54:20, 55:9, 55:16, 64:4, 64:6, 66:15, 85:29, 89:8, 92:20, 92:24, 100:10, 116:29, 130:27, 141:26 considering [4] -44:27, 55:3, 63:9, 123:15 considers [1] - 46:26 consistent [1] -162:11 consistently [1] -143:4 constitute [1] -104:25 constituted [2] -93:3, 116:1 constrain [2] -164:25, 165:23 constructive [1] -161:23 consult [5] - 51:4, 83:23, 83:25, 90:28, 118.6 consulted [2] -71:18, 71:22 contact [22] - 30:9, 33:4, 34:22, 37:3,

38:18, 39:23, 74:16,

75:24, 88:29, 97:21,

105:22, 116:17,

117:3, 127:12, 127:14, 127:15, 127:24, 128:3, 128:7, 136:23, 142:28 contacted [10] -29:25, 97:22, 97:23, 101:6, 101:7, 101:9, 117:2, 133:5, 144:3, 161:13 contacting [1] -144:8 contacts [1] - 32:21 **contain** [1] - 130:12 contained [6] -63:22, 74:15, 107:18, 108:16, 108:27, 152:4 containing [1] -63:25 content [3] - 106:6, 127:6, 137:23 contention [1] - 91:4 contents [3] - 68:14, 107:14, 136:22 context [57] - 9:16, 9:26, 11:22, 11:23, 20:22, 25:17, 25:24, 41:21, 43:29, 44:12, 45:19, 50:15, 50:25, 51:4, 53:19, 54:25, 55:8, 64:26, 64:28, 73:27, 74:8, 74:14, 75:17, 81:11, 81:14, 81:15, 82:20, 86:19, 86:20, 87:5, 89:2, 94:20, 95:15, 106:17, 106:19, 110:18, 114:6, 114:8, 121:9, 122:21, 123:4, 124:19, 124:29, 128:4, 131:1, 134:17, 135:3, 139:15, 139:20, 149:18, 150:8, 150:28, 152:28, 154:23, 155:2, 157:2, 162:4 continuance [1] -45:20 continue [6] - 12:3, 25:21, 26:19, 77:19, 146:20. 148:11 continued [4] - 40:9, 66:4, 124:4, 131:22 continues [1] - 27:1 continuing [1] -133:11 continuity [1] - 45:16 contrary [2] - 17:7, contrivance [1] -96:21

control [2] - 59:17, 59:18 controversial [2] -11:14, 12:23 controversies [2] -10:22, 11:5 controversy [1] -9:28 convenient [2] -60:12, 165:27 conversant [1] -115:10 conversation [9] -35:20, 35:24, 41:13, 41:15, 54:3, 116:10, 122:13, 143:16, 144:2 conversations [2] -143:1, 156:29 conversely[1] -96:18 convey [1] - 92:11 convince [2] -115:17 cooperate [1] - 145:6 cooperated [1] -120.14 copied [1] - 151:18 COPPINGER [1] -Coppinger [6] - 22:8, 28:26, 40:8, 100:16, 107:8, 158:3 copy [3] - 61:24, 64:12, 126:19 Cork [1] - 118:18 **Corporate** [1] - 7:16 correct [62] - 6:23, 7:7, 7:14, 7:25, 7:28, 7:29, 8:22, 9:2, 10:28, 11:4, 12:18, 12:21, 13:3, 15:2, 17:14, 17:20, 17:29, 19:1, 24:9, 24:11, 27:6, 28:9, 36:23, 38:28, 44:8, 46:13, 47:18, 47:23, 55:17, 57:9, 67:5, 69:15, 73:10, 74:2, 76:11, 78:6, 79:13, 84:9, 84:10, 86:3, 92:9, 102:17, 104:3, 104:21, 106:1, 108:4, 108:7, 109:7, 109:12, 130:5, 130:17, 131:11, 132:4, 140:1, 140:27, 141:28, 142:8, 142:10, 160:11, 160:15, 163:4, 163:6 correctly [1] - 112:12 correspondence [28]

- 19:15, 19:19, 20:15, 64:8, 66:12, 79:21, 82:20, 85:17, 86:4, 86:16, 86:24, 88:25, 91:16, 94:11, 98:29, 101:2, 101:21, 106:23, 132:12, 134:4, 134:11, 137:15, 146:11, 146:13, 146:28, 148:7, 156:26 corroborate [2] -63:11, 80:18 corroborative [1] corruption [7] - 14:8, 14:28, 15:11, 15:19, 16:29, 17:7, 18:22 COSTELLO [1] -2:22 country [4] - 11:24, 31:27, 40:24, 52:12 County [1] - 8:1 courage [2] - 15:28, 18:20 course [42] - 13:18, 14:20, 17:23, 20:14, 20:20, 21:2, 24:25, 27:25, 28:14, 29:14, 30:9, 30:17, 34:12, 38:11, 41:15, 46:19, 48:23, 52:22, 57:24, 60:9, 61:16, 63:14, 64:1, 65:16, 68:24, 79:6, 79:26, 80:20, 89:26, 90:5, 93:18, 94:1, 114:7, 118:10, 118:22, 120:13, 130:29, 131:24, 133:24, 137:5, 149:21, 156:15 courses [1] - 118:8 **COURT** [3] - 1:13, 2:3. 4:2 **cover** [1] - 129:13 Covert [1] - 106:12 covert [1] - 110:7 CR [4] - 11:22, 41:21, 50:15, 160:27 create [3] - 14:26, 15:9, 121:9 created [5] - 58:8. 107:2, 136:10, 140:24, 144:29 creation [1] - 107:21 credibility [1] - 95:8 Crime [1] - 135:15 crime [4] - 22:3, 29:16, 29:24, 62:22 criminal [50] - 9:8,

14:12, 17:11, 20:10, 20:23, 21:8, 22:22, 22:26, 22:29, 23:7, 23:11, 23:22, 23:25, 24:2, 24:6, 24:18, 25:8, 25:12, 25:13, 25:15, 25:25, 26:1, 26:11, 26:20, 26:21, 26:29, 27:7, 49:7, 55:14, 64:25, 73:3, 73:15, 77:20, 77:26, 78:3, 104:13, 108:15, 121:26, 129:25, 129:29, 130:12, 130:22, 145:26, 146:17, 146:20, 148:9. 148:12. 151:21, 153:7, 157:10 criminality [2] - 23:2, 24:27 criteria [3] - 16:11, 65:29, 83:14 criticise [2] - 60:27, 77:2 criticising [1] - 60:26 criticism [4] - 60:4. 67:22, 77:1, 128:23 criticisms [1] - 159:6 cross [3] - 81:17, 164:14, 165:25 cross-examination [2] - 81:17, 165:25 cross-examining [1] 164:14 CRPD [1] - 45:27 crucial [1] - 155:14 **CUALÁIN** [3] - 3:7, 5:3. 6:9 Cualáin [11] - 6:6, 6:13, 51:23, 67:29, 96:12, 96:15, 97:13, 122:6, 125:6, 151:22, 164:15 cul [1] - 58:2 cul-de-sacs [1] -58:2 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 **Curley** [2] - 71:9, 100:1 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 Curley's [1] - 100:11 **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 Curran [9] - 31:16, 31:17, 31:29, 32:2, 68:1, 124:10, 124:11, 163:2, 163:29 current [4] - 65:21, 103:18, 145:5, 150:22 cut [1] - 118:12

D D/superintendent [1] - 53:24 Daily [2] - 136:15, 137:25 Daly [1] - 122:12 data [3] - 109:4, 135:15, 135:16 date [21] - 19:29, 21:1, 21:2, 36:9, 37:29, 38:1, 59:25, 72:13, 87:22, 88:4, 91:23, 91:24, 101:17, 107:20, 123:26, 132:18, 143:10, 144:9, 147:3, 159:3, 163:18 dated [18] - 19:12, 28:24, 62:9, 63:19, 67:10, 71:29, 75:25, 77:12, 99:20, 107:1, 132:14, 136:8, 136:13. 137:16. 138:15, 139:23, 142:23, 146:5 dates [1] - 135:16 daughter [2] - 73:9, 74:17 **DAVID** [2] - 2:28, 3:18 **DAY** [1] - 1:18 day's [1] - 125:15 day-to-day [4] -11:15, 29:23, 69:19, 116:28 days [13] - 10:13, 37:2, 38:4, 38:16, 38:17, 40:9, 45:13, 47:3, 47:20, 48:14, 48:16, 56:20, 71:11 de [1] - 58:2 deadline [1] - 20:3 deal [20] - 10:15, 11:28, 17:25, 22:25, 29:23, 30:24, 43:26, 48:29, 71:16, 74:21, 80:10, 80:12, 91:24, 107:25, 116:28, 132:13, 141:26, 160:27, 163:26, 164:5 dealing [22] - 20:22,

21:5, 22:19, 22:29,

23:19, 24:17, 33:18,

36:17, 44:19, 81:12,

85:24, 88:17, 92:29,

93:11, 96:16, 98:8,

98:26, 133:26,

144:27, 149:16,

150:22, 162:21 dealings [2] -109:11, 117:15 deals [4] - 17:15, 67:24, 70:14, 140:3 dealt [37] - 6:17, 30:25, 36:21, 40:29, 44:21, 46:11, 46:14, 51:20, 70:21, 74:5, 82:16, 86:5, 86:19, 86:20, 91:5, 92:2, 93:10, 94:21, 94:28, 95:3, 104:1, 110:23, 122:21, 133:13, 136:4, 138:3, 152:8, 152:13, 152:20, 153:13, 153:15, 153:19, 154:2, 155:26, 156:3, 157:27, 157:29 debate [1] - 109:9 debates [1] - 147:21 December [4] -137:17, 138:16, 139:23, 156:8 **DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 decide [2] - 58:12, 104:29 decided [2] - 7:1, 43:27 decides [1] - 46:22 decision [12] - 38:1, 47:29, 53:18, 54:10, 54:11, 66:3, 68:11, 81:26, 83:18, 86:21, 119:17, 162:8 decisions [2] -77:26, 115:13 decisive [1] - 26:26 **DECLAN**[1] - 3:5 Declan [5] - 21:29, 39:24, 39:28, 43:4, 153:19 declaring [1] -150:11 declined [3] -126:25, 127:1, 127:5 default [4] - 23:28. 23:29, 24:1, 26:10 defer [1] - 46:7 defined [1] - 120:5 defining [1] - 77:29 definitely [1] - 18:9 definitively [1] -141.21 delay [1] - 157:12 delays [2] - 19:28, delegate [1] - 47:28

47:14, 47:16, 47:18, 48:17 deliberate [2] -93:20, 151:23 deliberately [6] -93:15, 93:16, 152:5, 154:11, 154:25, 155:6 delivered [1] - 11:20 department [4] -54:9, 119:18, 147:7, 149:23 departments [1] -106:24 depended [1] -127:17 dependent [1] -119:26 deployment [3] -66:4, 82:12, 85:15 deputies [1] - 123:3 deputy [7] - 8:17, 8:25, 12:4, 132:15, 132:22, 133:27, 147:17 Deputy [5] - 17:28, 85:19, 117:9, 147:13, 147:25 describe [1] - 20:9 described [2] -59:29, 121:25 description [1] -12:27 deserved[1] -161:27 desirable [1] - 46:19 **DESMOND** [1] - 4:6 destruction [1] -129:26 detail [8] - 20:27, 45:2, 45:28, 91:1, 101:16, 129:2, 153:22, 155:29 detailed [4] - 30:18, 38:24, 55:20, 137:12 **details** [1] - 41:28 detective [21] -21:28, 22:2, 29:11, 29:17, 33:19, 58:25, 58:28, 59:26, 89:9, 92:10, 98:18, 101:10, 101:16, 106:4, 110:29, 112:22, 113:24, 114:3, 117:4, 121:24, 128:2 **DETECTIVE** [5] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17 Detective [83] - 22:7, 28:23, 28:25, 28:26, 29:6. 29:7. 29:8. 29:9. 38:29, 39:23, 40:8,

42:22, 42:27, 44:20, 45:8, 49:25, 51:15, 51:19, 52:27, 55:27, 58:12, 66:12, 67:23, 67:29, 70:11, 71:3, 71:8, 81:18, 85:28, 87:15, 88:9, 89:16, 90:29, 98:12, 98:17, 98:20, 98:25, 99:12, 99:19, 99:29, 100:11, 100:16, 101:3, 101:19, 101:26, 103:8, 105:17, 107:7, 107:27, 108:25, 113:16, 114:25, 115:4, 116:16, 122:20, 123:15, 127:28, 128:9, 137:10, 137:17, 139:29, 142:27, 143:1, 143:8, 143:11, 143:16, 144:2, 144:7, 144:12, 144:14, 145:13, 145:18, 152:19. 152:23. 155:26, 156:19, 156:23, 156:26, 157:29, 158:3, 162:15 detectives [2] -21:26, 114:17 determination [2] -131:5, 138:24 determine [2] -103:26. 145:5 determined [1] -141:2 developed [2] - 14:5, 134:20 Development [1] -79:11 **DEVELOPMENT**[1] - 3:16 development [3] -7:17, 73:26, 88:4 developments [2] -73:19, 77:25 devices [1] - 131:16 **DI**[1] - 40:8 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diary [17] - 38:14, 38:16, 49:16, 49:26, 52:23, 53:20, 70:12, 87:6, 87:7, 89:12, 89:13, 97:25, 99:10, 101:29, 122:1. 127:16, 163:13 difference [2] -20:12, 22:19 different [17] - 10:5, 11:11, 11:13, 22:9,

delegated [5] - 47:2,

31:21, 40:5, 49:14, 64:23, 64:24, 78:9, 71:20, 72:7, 76:4, 96:25, 97:7, 108:12, 39:19, 46:5 58:14, 60:1, 60:2, 78:11, 82:8, 82:17, 100:13, 107:25, 120:29, 125:3, 129:6, early [25] - 12:3, 83:29, 85:8, 148:9, 111:29, 119:12, 107:28, 118:9, 129:17, 131:13, 12:13, 13:3, 18:9, 141:29, 148:19, 148:13, 148:18, 118:14, 118:17, 148:26 21:1, 27:23, 28:15, 30:9, 30:17, 33:3, 150.23 148.21 118:19, 118:20, **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, difficult [3] - 94:8, Discipline [3] - 17:8, 118:22, 118:25, 37:2, 38:8, 40:16, 134:23, 161:2 46:12, 64:16 122:13 downfall [1] - 160:17 41:29, 42:6, 43:27, difficulties [2] - 19:2, disclose [3] - 34:8, districts [4] - 31:21, 76:1, 81:4, 92:16, **DPP** [4] - 93:27, 117:24, 118:13, 119:6 105:14, 116:23, 68:14. 81:13 126:12, 130:18, 131:2 difficulty [4] - 69:21, disclosed [4] division [8] - 7:5, 121:8, 133:24, 137:4, **DR** [1] - 3:11 104:12, 107:11, 16:10, 18:3, 43:13, 8:5, 29:22, 84:5, draft [1] - 141:1 142:3 111:24 127:7 106:9, 107:26, 110:5, draw [1] - 20:8 easily [1] - 58:23 **DIGNAM** [1] - 3:24 110.6 disclosing [2] driven [1] - 125:29 Eastern [1] - 106:27 **DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 dignity [2] - 136:27, 15:25, 18:13 easy [2] - 60:24, drivers [1] - 158:10 138:26 **Disclosure** [1] - 28:5 divisional [7] -60.25 drugs [2] - 72:10, 48:19, 65:27, 71:17, edition [1] - 138:15 direct [2] - 43:24, disclosure [12] -156:7 114:21 8:29, 17:25, 18:25, 77:23, 91:6, 107:24, effect [4] - 10:2, **DUBLIN** [7] - 1:17, 107:28 84:23, 136:5, 141:28 directed [6] - 8:19, 18:26, 27:24, 41:5, 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, divisions [2] - 31:21, effective[1] - 103:27 77:16, 77:19, 82:7, 60:22, 69:13, 81:13, 4:9, 4:13 146:27, 148:11 94:5, 127:6, 160:13 78:11 effectively [5] -**Dublin** [9] - 10:17, DMR [3] - 119:2, direction [8] - 59:24, disclosures [1] -48:25, 76:18, 110:23, 10:18, 31:23, 32:1, 59:25, 73:13, 131:21, 18:28 135:16 68:1, 88:28, 117:28, 138:25, 160:8 DISCLOSURES [2] -**DOCKERY** [1] - 4:6 146:19, 148:6, 148:8, 117:29, 119:2 efficient [2] - 114:17, 159.23 1.2 1.3 document [2] - 48:3, due [10] - 31:6, 117:26 directions [6] -Disclosures [2] efficiently [1] -34:12, 48:23, 54:4, 102:12, 117:5, 120:1, 50:2, 133:18 documents [1] - 60:9 94:1. 94:14. 94:17. 152.14 130:15, 130:18, discourse [1] domain [3] - 33:21, 137:29, 141:4, 159:25 effort [4] - 36:9, 33:25, 41:27 131:12 110.27 duration [1] - 54:18 154:11, 157:25, directive [1] - 90:27 discovered [1] domestic [2] -159.11 during [21] - 12:10, directly [3] - 39:21, 74:11 118:23, 119:3 efforts [3] - 95:14, 24:25, 25:27, 34:22, 107:23, 140:17 discredited [1] -Donal [4] - 6:6, 6:13, 35:24, 47:9, 56:5, 151:10, 158:4 **DIRECTLY** [2] - 5:5, 150:5 96:12, 96:15 60:9, 89:25, 95:3, **EGAN**[1] - 3:25 discrediting [1] -**DONAL** [4] - 3:7, 115:21, 116:18, either [8] - 20:23, DIRECTLY-49.5 3:24, 5:3, 6:9 117:24, 122:27, 21:9, 26:1, 54:25, 142:29, 147:14, **EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, discrete [1] - 142:7 57:18, 96:16, 115:26, done [25] - 17:16, 150:25, 153:27, discuss [5] - 33:14, 19:6, 19:9, 23:26, 165:29 Director [6] - 129:4, 37:6, 43:8, 107:13, 25:24, 28:16, 33:13, 156:15, 159:14 electronic [1] -43:4, 47:20, 50:12, 129:9, 130:14, 125:12 duties [7] - 16:5, 131:16 130:26, 131:8, 151:18 58:16, 59:6, 59:7, 16:7, 34:25, 59:1, discussed [4] element [3] - 58:20, **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 39:20, 56:17, 116:5, 67:12, 81:14, 84:1, 59:7, 86:9, 117:29 59:19, 77:20 93:15, 95:7, 118:27, director [3] - 79:11, 117:6 duty [15] - 19:6, elements [4] - 59:17, 79:19, 79:22 discussing [1] -121:7, 131:27, 34:24, 44:12, 46:20, 69:17, 78:28, 121:2 139:13, 142:4, 151:6, 48:4, 49:11, 55:1, DIRECTORATE[1] -101:15 elicited [1] - 76:25 162:17 62:28, 65:9, 73:18, discussion [2] -3:15 ELIZABETH[1] -113:27, 123:5, 155:3, 68:2, 145:22 Donegal [1] - 7:27 directs [1] - 136:23 2.29 Donnybrook [1] -155:4, 155:22 disagree [1] - 71:4 disgrace [1] - 53:25 emanated [1] disjointed [1] - 68:28 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 disappeared [1] -143.14 doubt [2] - 84:15, **Dáil** [12] - 11:11, dismissal [1] - 47:8 embarked [2] - 9:14, 103:1 18:3, 18:13, 117:8, disciplinary [20] disposal [1] - 22:6 18:11 down [40] - 6:20, 117:12, 122:7, 123:3, 17:9. 20:11. 20:23. disprove [2] - 63:12, EMMA[1] - 3:26 14:3, 15:7, 15:16, 142:22, 143:13, 21:9, 22:22, 22:25, empathise [1] -80:18 147:21, 149:24 23:1, 23:12, 24:8, dispute [1] - 36:7 21:5, 24:10, 31:1, 159:28 31:2, 33:10, 36:13, 25:12, 25:25, 26:1, empathising [1] disquiet [1] - 11:1 65:1, 73:16, 77:22, 37:12, 39:3, 39:5, Ε disrupt [1] - 62:21 94:3 49:13, 53:22, 58:1, 78:4, 78:26, 85:7, empathy [1] - 160:4 distinct [1] - 91:7 58:2, 62:15, 67:25, 104:11, 104:14 distinction [2] - 20:8, emphasise [1] e-mail [2] - 85:18, 67:26, 70:14, 77:13, discipline [24] - 23:4, 27:7 36:15 99:25 79:23, 79:26, 80:11, 23:5, 23:8, 23:9, 25:9, distributed [1] employee [3] - 14:1, **EAMON** [1] - 3:10 80:13, 87:8, 87:26, 25:14, 26:3, 27:7, 16:25, 16:28 earliest [3] - 15:21, 47:18, 54:6, 64:21, 96:2, 96:3, 96:4, district [15] - 8:1, employees [1] -

15:10 employment[3] -17:2, 137:2, 139:2 **emptied** [1] - 152:5 **enable** [1] - 51:9 enclose [1] - 147:21 encompassing [1] -141:12 encountered [2] -19:28, 20:1 encouraged [3] -14:27, 15:11, 36:12 encouraging [3] -14:6, 57:22, 116:2 **END**[1] - 164:11 end [14] - 8:5, 11:2, 12:12, 25:13, 27:2, 62:15, 69:14, 72:19, 104:19, 111:14, 141:16, 144:6, 145:5, 145:19 endeavouring [3] -36:11, 63:11, 80:17 energy [1] - 159:11 engage [1] - 143:5 Ennistimon [1] - 8:1 enquire [1] - 41:6 enquired [2] -133:14, 143:2 enquiries [16] -21:27, 34:23, 40:14, 53:2, 61:18, 61:27, 74:9, 76:21, 102:9, 140:18, 141:8, 144:29, 145:8, 148:27, 158:5, 162:7 enquiry [12] - 57:24, 57:27, 71:8, 72:14, 134:15, 135:27, 136:2. 140:23. 160:13, 160:20, 160:22, 161:15 ensure [35] - 9:18, 10:5, 11:18, 16:9, 16:27, 19:8, 27:6, 39:18, 41:1, 43:27, 46:4, 61:10, 62:1, 66:2, 67:16, 78:7, 78:23, 89:3, 94:19, 95:13, 105:28, 110:8, 110:17, 117:1, 123:6, 124:3, 124:25, 125:22, 125:26, 141:23, 144:15, 150:21, 159:15, 162:6, 162:21 ensured [2] - 39:22, 152:14 ensuring [7] - 45:17, 81:14, 124:2, 125:1,

151:1, 159:12, 162:4 enter [2] - 113:7, 136:1 entitled [5] - 18:15, 56:22, 94:13, 113:25. entries [2] - 87:6, 101:29 entry [29] - 30:20, 30:24, 32:19, 34:11, 35:10, 35:14, 35:21, 35:26, 37:13, 49:16, 49:26, 49:27, 52:23, 53:20, 70:12, 87:7, 89:12, 89:14, 91:23, 97:25, 97:27, 105:10, 105:11, 106:7, 122:1, 135:21, 162:27, 163:13, 163:14 environment [4] -14:26, 15:9, 36:14, 139:16 envisaged [1] - 20:7 envisages [1] - 53:7 **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 **EQUALITY**[1] - 1:8 especially [1] - 50:25 essence [4] - 109:22, 112:12, 151:8, 161:8 essential [1] -111:22 essentially [7] -32:1, 34:27, 35:3, 58:10, 111:16, 112:29, 123:2 establish [14] -20:21, 22:28, 23:6, 23:18, 23:25, 24:19, 27:23, 27:28, 33:4, 37:3, 91:1, 122:28, 136:24, 152:17 ESTABLISHED[1] established [3] -26:12, 78:28, 89:6 establishment [1] -7:19 estimate [1] - 65:19 etcetera [9] - 9:22, 21:9, 58:24, 61:23, 110:28, 135:3,

149:24, 152:29, 153:1

evening [1] - 38:27

event [13] - 20:18,

54:7, 77:8, 81:6, 85:2,

32:4, 34:21, 51:6,

85:3, 92:12, 99:12,

events [1] - 160:5

103:8, 160:7

ethical [1] - 14:6

**EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 evidence [57] -26:17, 31:11, 31:12, 34:1, 34:13, 34:14, 36:24, 36:29, 44:22, 54:21, 55:13, 55:15, 60:2, 60:6, 61:13, 63:26, 64:9, 65:14, 68:16, 68:21, 70:6, 73:24, 74:4, 75:15, 75:26, 79:25, 79:29, 80:8, 81:4, 81:16, 91:14, 96:27, 112:2, 112:18, 112:27, 115:4, 119:27, 120:2, 120:8, 120:22, 129:26, 129:28, 130:24, 131:3, 131:9, 131:18, 131:24, 145:20, 151:28, 152:4, 152:6, 152:21. 153:8, 157:14, 159:24, 161:17, 165:10 evidential [2] - 74:7, 75:20 exact [2] - 27:29, exactly [7] - 18:4, 66:10, 75:10, 87:22, 92:10, 105:13 **EXAMINATION**[1] -164:11 examination [7] -16:20. 81:17. 90:10. 105:9, 131:16, 165:21, 165:25 examinations [1] -89:25 examine [2] - 105:1, 131:22 examined [2] - 66:4, 140:26 **EXAMINED**[2] - 5:5, 6.10 examining [2] -16:18, 164:14 example [8] - 24:26, 42:28, 45:15, 45:26, 61:21, 64:1, 121:7, 142:7 **exceeding** [3] - 47:3, 48:14, 48:16 excellent [1] - 52:13 except [1] - 34:11 **exception** [1] - 16:13 executive [3] -

exemplified [1] -150:3 exercise[1] - 150:11 exhaustive [1] - 65:7 exhibits [2] - 135:7, 140:25 exist [1] - 14:20 existed [2] - 74:12, 145:25 exists [3] - 14:11, 73:2, 146:16 exonerated [1] -54:19 expect [2] - 39:11, 64.27expectation [1] -165:13 expected [3] -141:13, 144:12, 145:3 expeditiously [1] -141.13 **experience** [6] - 7:1, 29:19, 50:26, 82:29, 115:18, 164:29 experienced [3] -21:25, 114:17, 159:18 experiencing [1] -136:25 expert [1] - 83:27 experts [3] - 51:2, 65:2, 139:18 explain [4] - 41:25, 54:4, 56:22, 102:5 explained [10] -33:26, 41:20, 41:26, 91:27, 104:2, 104:18, 105:27, 122:12, 125:17, 162:8 explore [2] - 46:7, explored [1] - 120:6 exposed [5] - 40:23. 40:28, 96:21, 102:8, 125:25 express [1] - 134:9 expressed [5] -48:24, 53:10, 62:18, 144:8, 161:12 extend [2] - 47:4, 47:22 extended [2] - 48:14, 120.7 extensive [1] -129:15 extent [6] - 57:8, 98:13, 98:15, 116:27, 119:26, 127:13 79:10, 79:19, 79:22 externally [1] -EXECUTIVE [1] -106:18

extra [2] - 161:5,

extracts [1] - 147:21 extremely [1] -116:20 **eye** [1] - 11:9 eyeball [1] - 154:10 eveballed [2] -154:16, 154:24 F

face [2] - 35:1 face-to-face [1] -35:1 faced [1] - 103:5 Fachtna [1] - 15:6 facie [1] - 121:26 facilitate [1] - 137:5 facilitated [4] -129:27, 154:11, 154:25, 155:7 facility [1] - 113:26 fact [48] - 13:1, 20:10, 22:21, 22:26, 22:28, 23:11, 23:20, 24:13, 24:14, 24:24, 25:5, 33:15, 34:2, 39:12, 41:27, 42:13, 42:17, 45:3, 45:8, 48:2, 51:16, 51:24, 57:19, 60:5, 61:20, 73:28, 75:25, 75:27, 78:1. 78:14. 81:20. 81:25, 82:26, 84:11, 91:19, 91:27, 94:29, 97:19, 98:23, 113:7, 114:3, 128:19, 141:4, 150:13, 152:1, 163:1, 163:4, 164:2 fact-finding [10] -20:10, 22:21, 22:26, 22:28, 23:11, 23:20, 24:14, 24:24, 25:5, 78:1 facts [1] - 54:27 failure [6] - 91:28, 93:3, 114:12, 114:15, 114:28, 128:25 fair [2] - 73:22, 159:26 fairly [4] - 11:29, 27:23, 42:5, 116:17 fait [1] - 44:6 faith [3] - 16:22, 52:9, 93:9 fall [3] - 43:16, 89:4, 129:29 fallen [1] - 9:16 false [3] - 16:21,

3:13

104:27, 116:2 familiar [2] - 44:4, 157:2 **FANNING** [1] - 2:21 Fanning [5] - 62:6, 62:14, 85:19, 86:6, 88:26 Fanning's [1] - 62:8 far [10] - 32:27, 42:15, 51:10, 60:14, 90:25, 104:19, 106:8, 108:8, 109:10, 119:12 Farrell [1] - 35:13 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:5 fashion [1] - 112:8 fatal [3] - 80:29, 81:3, 81:9 favour [1] - 95:5 fear [2] - 15:21, 155:21 fearful [1] - 39:14 February [1] - 141:16 **FEBRUARY** [5] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 6:2, 166:9 fed [1] - 68:17 **fell** [1] - 50:15 felt [33] - 25:22, 28:19. 34:29. 40:11. 40:22, 41:18, 46:3, 50:14, 60:18, 82:24, 82:29, 83:25, 86:13, 86:18, 94:6, 94:15, 99:2, 99:6, 101:25, 110:15, 114:5, 116:24, 123:16, 124:13, 124:26, 131:3, 139:7, 139:16, 142:4, 148:20, 159:17, 160:1, 162:21 FERGAL [1] - 2:27 **FERRY** [1] - 2:16 few [10] - 33:3, 35:6, 36:8, 58:17, 71:11, 89:28, 126:11, 127:16, 134:20, 166:2 fide [2] - 27:23, 28:2 fides [1] - 27:26 file [17] - 18:6, 20:24, 26:3, 61:25, 82:24, 91:11, 93:27, 103:25, 129:13, 130:15, 130:27, 130:29, 131:6, 131:28, 141:12, 147:4, 152:12 files [2] - 86:11, 141:3 fill [4] - 12:19, 51:9, 83:10, 118:19 filled [3] - 8:26, 79:17, 161:23

final [2] - 141:1, 141:12 financial [1] - 9:17 fine [4] - 94:16, 164:17, 164:18, 164:19 finish [2] - 165:14 finished [1] - 117:28 **FINN** [1] - 3:5 FINTAN [1] - 2:21 firearm [8] - 70:26, 71:10, 113:4, 113:8, 113:24, 113:25, 114:4 firearms [2] - 113:27, 114:10 **firm** [1] **-** 92:13 firmly [1] - 98:22 first [40] - 6:20, 8:8, 10:16, 13:28, 17:18, 20:3, 20:14, 20:21, 29:10, 30:21, 33:4, 38:18, 38:25, 39:3, 39:9, 41:14, 50:6, 50:8, 51:17, 51:23, 60:20, 76:19, 86:8, 93:2, 93:4, 96:1, 97:4, 99:17, 105:16, 117:22, 117:25, 119:25, 121:4, 129:4, 129:11, 132:6, 132:11, 153:15, 156:18, 159:7 fit [1] - 118:9 FITZWILLIAM [1] -4.8 five [1] - 159:2 Flanagan [1] - 17:28 flavour [1] - 64:10

Flanagan [1] - 17:28 flavour [1] - 64:10 flawless [1] - 93:18 flaws [4] - 93:19, 93:20, 93:21, 151:23 flexible [1] - 38:21 flippant [1] - 162:22 flowered [1] - 121:13 fluent [1] - 55:12 FLYNN [1] - 3:19 focus [6] - 56:10,

69:12, 91:7, 127:29, 160:20, 160:22 focusing [1] - 109:3 follow [6] - 26:24, 121:11, 121:12, 121:20, 131:22,

159:24 **followed** [3] - 57:28, 137:9, 140:11 **following** [17] - 1:25, 6:22, 10:21, 18:6, 22:12, 48:20, 52:24, 63:4, 63:6, 68:7,

70:18, 125:3, 137:29, 141:11, 143:10, 144:2, 145:6 FOLLOWING [1] -FOLLOWS [3] - 6:1, 6:11, 95:23 FOR [11] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 4:1, 4:4, 4:10, 95:22 force [3] - 28:10, 48:5. 158:24 foreword [2] - 15:4, forget [1] - 27:29 forgive [1] - 111:27 form [9] - 17:2, 17:21, 24:27, 64:5, 89:29, 93:3, 105:4, 136:26, 142:17 formal [6] - 25:6, 25:23, 26:18, 26:19, 27:4, 73:15 formally [2] - 39:5, format [1] - 150:20 formed [1] - 41:13 former [11] - 6:5, 8:14, 10:26, 12:24, 15:6, 21:28, 76:3, 124:8, 126:17, 150:16, 163:4 **FORMER** [4] - 1:13, 2.3 5.3 6.9 forms [1] - 85:7

forward [18] - 15:25, 51:26, 57:12, 57:16, 57:18, 63:24, 85:21, 90:26, 94:5, 104:27, 116:2, 117:7, 145:12, 145:19, 146:24, 146:27, 154:23, 155:14

forth [1] - 106:23

forwarded [6] -19:20, 66:2, 78:9, 103:25, 135:14, 135:20 forwarding [1] -

138:20 **fought** [1] - 165:17 **four** [3] - 7:2, 31:20, 37:26

fourth [1] - 65:4 framework [1] -95:13

**Frank** [2] - 77:11, 148:3

freely [1] - 39:7

FREEMAN [1] - 2:22 fresh [1] - 91:10 Friday [2] - 10:19 FRIDAY [1] - 166:9 friendly [1] - 32:7 friends [1] - 32:8 friendship [4] -30:29, 31:7, 31:15, 32:18 frivolous [1] - 16:21

frivolous [1] - 16:21 front [1] - 151:13 frustrated [2] -142:12, 159:21 frustrating [1] -151:12

frustration [1] -151:9 frustrations [2] -159:17, 159:29

full [8] - 12:7, 36:13, 40:10, 43:15, 66:11, 132:11, 140:16 full-time [1] - 12:7 fully [13] - 94:9, 95:9, 103:3, 110:14, 110:19, 115:10, 116:24, 120:14, 123:7, 131:6, 154:3,

159:14, 159:15 **function** [5] - 6:26, 7:10, 12:7, 47:1, 79:18 **functions** [3] - 27:28,

functions [3] - 27:28 48:16, 133:28 funny [1] - 41:26 furthermore [1] -107:13

**future** [4] - 10:7, 44:29, 61:11, 100:8

G

Galway [16] - 7:5,

7:10. 8:2. 8:5. 10:14.

10:15, 10:19, 10:20, 11:19, 22:4, 58:18, 58:24, 58:27, 117:25, 119:15, 155:17 gap [2] - 44:3, 161:22 Garda [303] - 6:16, 6:21, 6:25, 6:28, 7:3, 7:16, 7:18, 8:29, 9:12, 10:10, 10:11, 10:23, 11:6, 11:15, 12:25, 13:1, 14:1, 14:5, 14:6, 14:7, 14:12, 14:14, 15:20, 16:7, 16:28, 17:7, 18:12, 19:20,

21:19, 23:2, 26:8, 28:11, 30:1, 30:13, 30:20, 31:11, 31:14, 32:3, 33:5, 34:1, 34:15, 34:17, 34:22, 34:25, 35:21, 35:25, 35:29, 36:9, 36:10, 36:18, 37:2, 38:6, 38:16, 38:19, 38:26, 39:6, 39:21, 39:23, 40:10, 42:16, 42:18, 42:29, 43:9, 43:28, 44:1, 44:5, 44:22, 44:25, 45:4, 45:18, 45:23, 46:9, 46:11, 46:20, 48:4, 49:1, 49:7, 49:8, 49:10, 49:15, 50:7, 50:10, 51:15, 52:9, 52:11, 52:21, 53:2, 53:4, 53:10. 53:12. 53:15. 53:20, 54:19, 55:4, 55:6, 55:15, 56:4, 56:27, 57:1, 57:6, 57:11. 57:14. 57:21. 58:16, 59:8, 59:15, 59:19, 59:29, 60:18, 61:5, 61:19, 61:27, 61:29, 62:19, 62:20, 62:21, 62:27, 62:28, 63:2, 63:8, 63:23, 64:2, 64:3, 64:16, 66:13. 67:6. 68:2. 68:4, 68:6, 68:7, 68:19, 70:25, 71:2, 71:9, 71:16, 71:24, 72:6, 72:10, 72:25, 73:3, 73:8, 73:18, 73:29, 74:7, 74:10, 74:22, 74:25, 76:8, 79:24, 80:2, 80:15, 80:23, 80:28, 81:6, 81:16, 81:20, 81:22, 81:25, 81:27, 82:8, 85:6, 85:16, 85:25, 86:7, 87:20, 88:23, 89:22, 90:8, 91:17, 91:19, 91:22, 91:24, 91:26, 93:1, 93:3, 93:12, 94:2, 94:7, 94:10, 94:26, 95:2, 95:10, 95:27, 96:7, 96:20, 97:12, 97:25, 98:15, 99:23, 99:25, 100:3, 100:24, 101:1, 103:3, 103:15, 103:19, 103:20, 103:21, 104:2, 104:23, 104:26,

104:27, 105:5, 106:8,

106:24, 108:23,

109:9, 109:14,
109:19, 109:27,
110:11, 110:22,
110:24, 110:25,
110:24, 110:25,
110:28, 111:6,
111:23, 112:17, 112:21, 112:24,
113:4, 113:12,
113:24, 114:12,
115:1, 115:6, 115:23,
116:18, 116:22, 117:4, 117:9, 117:14,
117:17, 117:18,
119:27, 120:19, 122:10, 122:13,
122.10, 122.13,
123:2, 123:13,
123:14, 123:25,
124:25, 124:26, 125:10, 125:12,
125:10, 125:12,
125:24, 126:24,
128:16, 129:27,
131:10, 131:17,
131:26, 132:1,
132:29, 135:9,
135:22, 136:24,
137:1, 137:5, 137:6,
141:10, 141:29,
143:6, 145:9, 145:25,
146:17, 147:14,
147:28, 148:24,
148:29, 149:16,
150:3, 150:26,
151:17, 152:3,
152:21, 153:10,
153:28, 154:7,
154:10, 154:16,
154:18, 155:1, 155:4,
155:21, 156:22,
159:6, 159:13,
159:15, 159:17,
160:7, 160:9, 160:20,
161:19, 161:24,
162:28
garda [19] - 45:29,
49:7, 50:19, 56:4,
59:4, 59:20, 107:3,
107:26, 126:2, 153:4,
153:8, 154:6, 156:6,
156:8, 156:10,
156:11, 157:7, 158:8,
158:23
<b>GARDA</b> [10] - 2:10,
2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2,
3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21,
4:10
garda's [1] - 43:24
gardaí [7] - 13:25,
52:1, 52:2, 72:7,
137:24, 138:14, 155:3
Gardaí [8] - 129:25,

130:21, 137:28, 138:8, 138:17, 138:19, 138:24, 147.18 gather [1] - 120:2 gaze [1] - 11:9 general [10] - 17:16, 24:5, 59:11, 117:11, 123:13, 124:22, 134:15, 134:24, 146:28, 164:29 generally [5] - 10:20, 34:14, 50:11, 114:9, 150.5 generated [1] - 72:13 genuine [7] - 15:18, 16:29, 17:6, 52:17, 52:19, 61:5, 161:25 GERAGHTY[1] -2:17 GERARD[1] - 2:11 **GERRY** [1] - 3:11 Gerry [1] - 29:8 given [35] - 8:23, 12:2, 21:1, 21:6, 24:26, 25:14, 28:27, 34:14, 39:16, 47:10, 54:29, 59:3, 59:5, 59:10. 64:15. 65:6. 73:18, 80:1, 81:3, 83:5, 89:26, 90:11, 101:22, 115:1, 115:2, 132:17, 139:14, 140:13, 143:18, 152:10, 153:8, 157:7, 157:14, 161:17, 164:29 Glacken [3] - 124:8, 124:15, 164:4 glad [1] - 27:10 **GLEESON** [1] - 4:7 **GOODE** [1] - 3:22 **Gort** [3] - 117:23, 118.17 government [1] -

12:15

47:7

153:22

Government [1] -

**GRALTON** [1] - 3:14

grateful [1] - 163:11

gravamen [2] -

great [2] - 20:27,

**GREENE** [1] - 2:27

**GRIFFIN** [1] - 3:26

ground [6] - 44:5,

grounds [1] - 92:17

46:1, 94:8, 130:9,

150:3, 160:18

111:25, 112:13

groundwork [1] -142:3 **GSOC** [4] - 133:20, 138:9, 147:7, 147:20 guard [1] - 49:10 guards [1] - 59:23 quess [2] - 18:18, 114:27 guidelines [3] - 50:2, 50:24. 51:8 guilt [1] - 55:15 **GWEN** [1] - 1:29 Gwen [1] - 1:24

#### Н

had... [1] - 158:25 half [4] - 7:27, 112:1, 120:25, 158:19 HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 hand [4] - 30:23, 30:24, 151:10, 159:10 handed [3] - 23:14, 78:26 79:2 handled [2] - 147:18, 147:26 handler [1] - 156:9 handling [1] - 123:25 hands [3] - 115:11, 124:2, 131:6 handwriting [1] -163:20 hanging [3] - 56:4, 56:27, 83:25 **happy** [18] - 30:27, 31:6, 33:27, 38:9, 42:25, 49:20, 104:1, 104:4, 105:7, 116:16, 116:20, 130:26, 157:17, 162:12, 162:13, 162:17, 164:16, 165:29 **HARAN**[1] - 4:5 Haran [6] - 34:4, 60:4, 60:14, 76:2, 76:19, 146:4 harassed [3] -137:28, 138:27, 150:4 harassment [4] -17:5, 136:26, 138:10, 143:14 **HAVING** [1] - 6:9 he/she [1] - 46:20 **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 head [2] - 112:8, 134:2 headed [1] - 79:19 heading [2] - 12:16, 73:23

headings [2] - 65:9, 91:2 Headquarters [5] -6:25, 10:12, 67:6, 113:13, 149:16 headquarters [2] -7:18, 69:9 hear [3] - 84:15, 116:3, 116:7 heard [12] - 21:28, 57:1, 60:1, 71:7, 84:16, 91:14, 114:25, 115:3, 132:5, 154:21, 156:19 **HEARING** [3] - 6:1, 95:22, 166:9 heaven [1] - 102:21 held [10] - 75:19, 78:17, 78:19, 84:18,

94:11, 98:24, 135:8, 140:14, 150:26, 161:11 **HELD** [1] - 1:17 help [4] - 37:25, 82:19, 87:6, 165:16 helpful [3] - 69:11, 164:20, 164:25 helps [1] - 111:17 heroin [1] - 156:11 herself [1] - 149:26 HIGGINS [1] - 4:10 Higgins [1] - 100:4 high [3] - 54:1, 56:15, 59:24 higher [2] - 11:6, 31:14

highest [1] - 141:22 highlight [1] - 18:26 highlighted [6] -18:27, 20:20, 137:24, 137:27, 144:15, 152:25 highly [1] - 114:16

himself [8] - 94:22, 100:7, 103:20, 119:27, 123:21, 154:19. 159:18. 161:12

hindsight [1] - 61:4 **historical** [1] - 164:8 history [3] - 6:15, 65:21, 76:20 **hmm** [5] - 82:4, 91:20, 113:14, 128:17, 145:27 **hold** [4] - 113:25, 149:5, 163:10, 163:18 home [4] - 10:14, 118:24, 125:29,

131:10

homes [1] - 131:17 honest [3] - 71:1, 154:12, 154:26 honestly [1] - 165:3 **hope** [2] - 52:9, 97:5 hoping [1] - 165:9 HORAN [1] - 3:25 horses [1] - 118:8 hotel [1] - 61:1 house [4] - 9:16, 87:17, 87:20, 134:5 **HOUSE** [3] - 2:23, 3:27, 4:11 **HQ**[1] - 90:27 HR [26] - 48:24, 50:20, 53:17, 53:18, 54:9, 65:2, 66:14, 67:13, 68:26, 68:29, 79:18, 80:24, 80:26, 80:27, 82:21, 86:12, 86:15, 91:29, 92:11, 92:21, 119:18, 126:15, 126:27, 134:6, 134:12 HRM [6] - 45:14, 45:26, 53:4, 56:13, 64:6, 79:15 HRPD [1] - 82:12 huge [2] - 9:13, 149:14 hugely [2] - 11:8, 165:27 **HUGHES** [2] - 2:29, 2:30 **Human** [5] - 55:21, 73:17, 79:11, 106:13, 133:16 human [2] - 61:15, **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15 humming [1] - 35:29 hypocritical [2] -

#### ı

150:1, 150:11

IA [1] - 88:14 ICELAND[1] - 4:11 idea [1] - 164:24 identical [1] - 48:26 identified [4] - 74:1, 74:22, 93:21, 163:2 identify [3] - 139:19, 148:29, 159:16 identity [10] - 16:9, 17:18, 18:29, 43:13, 124:1, 125:11, 125:25, 125:28, 127:8, 127:11

illness [1] - 143:21 illuminate [1] - 87:11 imagine [1] - 161:3 immediate [2] -60:19, 136:23 immediately [7] -20:28, 21:13, 21:17, 45:12, 61:9, 88:22, 138:28 impact [7] - 11:5, 26:28, 65:21, 65:22, 81:22, 81:26, 92:13 impacting [1] - 95:2 **impartial** [1] - 100:13 **impels** [1] - 69:23 implementation [2] -9:6. 58:10 implemented [1] -10:10 importance [4] -45:17, 131:1, 151:1, 152:13 important [5] -20:21, 23:10, 25:7, 25:18, 74:20 impressions [1] -39:9 improved [1] - 93:18 IN [1] - 1:17 in-service [1] - 7:8 inadvertently [1] -93.5 inappropriate [1] incident [11] - 59:4, 59:12, 100:5, 105:26, 106:11, 113:3, 113:15, 115:24, 115:25, 142:15, 160:8 incidents [2] - 14:28, 15:11 include [3] - 16:8, 67:21, 147:3 included [6] - 57:28, 58:3, 62:29, 81:5, 98:28, 106:8 includes [1] - 147:10 including [5] - 14:13, 60:13, 94:21, 147:7, 150:23 incorrect [1] - 111:4 incumbent [1] - 46:3 indeed [14] - 12:23, 14:22, 31:11, 34:17, 37:11, 44:3, 63:12, 80:18, 81:17, 84:25, 110:13, 116:20, 120:16, 140:12 independent [3] -99:16, 102:22, 103:22

independently [3] -96:22, 97:18, 98:24 INDEX [1] - 5:1 indicate [1] - 78:8 indicated [7] - 21:16, 28:22, 76:5, 99:1, 120:8, 137:26, 143:5 indicating [2] -91:23, 129:8 indication [3] - 21:4, 75:23. 164:21 indicative [1] - 147:3 individual [9] -13:25, 14:21, 15:28, 18:20, 43:25, 72:7, 94:15, 121:27, 154:22 individual's [1] individuals [4] -54:28, 120:9, 123:6, 148:19 indoor [1] - 86:9 inelegant [1] - 12:26 inevitable [1] -111:15 influence [1] -156:12 info [2] - 125:13, 126:5 inform [5] - 30:3, 52:13, 92:9, 134:19, 142:26 informal [1] - 154:12 informant [5] -35:18, 96:11, 152:2, 156:7, 156:9 information [52] -17:27, 18:2, 18:14, 19:21, 42:26, 50:1, 51:10, 51:11, 52:2, 52:11, 54:8, 54:20, 57:12, 57:13, 57:22, 57:23, 67:17, 67:21, 68:20, 68:25, 75:4, 76:12, 76:18, 76:24, 77:3, 78:7, 79:13,

83:11, 85:25, 86:26,

92:14, 96:11, 99:24,

87:3, 87:4, 88:20,

105:10, 105:25,

106:10, 106:14,

106:15, 109:17,

120:12, 136:20,

138:19, 138:21,

142:26, 145:23,

146:29, 153:6,

154:23, 155:15

informed [18] -

30:27, 31:6, 48:1,

68:11, 72:20, 85:6,

92:6, 95:14, 97:29, 98:15, 100:25, 101:15, 137:28, 138:8, 138:17, 138:19, 138:26, 149:19 initial [1] - 146:13 initiate [1] - 21:27 initiated [1] - 36:8 injustice [1] - 151:7 innocent [1] - 97:5 inordinate [1] -74:16 **input** [3] - 91:10, 109:17, 118:4 inputted [1] - 105:10 inputting [2] - 109:3, 109:18 **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:2, 1:8 inquiry [4] - 73:27, 76:1, 76:27, 148:18 inroads [1] - 121:5 insignificant [2] -9:26. 21:15 insistent [1] - 57:27 insofar [3] - 55:12, 92:5, 93:1 Inspector [9] - 22:7, 28:26, 35:13, 60:7, 100:10. 100:16. 100:17, 107:8, 158:3 INSPECTOR [7] -3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:18, 3:22, 4:5 inspector [1] - 7:12Inspectorate [2] -137:7, 147:8 instance [11] - 13:29, 16:15, 17:24, 20:4, 60:20. 86:8. 93:2. 93:4, 96:1, 118:28, 159:7 INSTRUCTED[8] -2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10 instructed [1] -144:14 INSTRUMENT[1] insurance [1] -158:10 intelligence [12] -34:11, 35:14, 105:24, 105:27, 105:29, 107:1, 107:10, 107:18, 107:21,

intelligence.. [1] -108:28 intend [3] - 27:13, 44:20. 132:9 intended [1] - 52:2 intention [1] - 29:27 interaction [4] -30:21, 105:4, 160:6, 162:18 interactions [3] -75:28, 149:11, 150:18 interest [1] - 149:14 interested [3] -42:16, 86:28, 92:26 interests [1] - 46:20 interfere [2] - 62:20, 96:14 interference [1] -96:19 interim [4] - 8:15, 18:5, 19:28, 136:18 interlinked [1] -141:5 intermingle [1] -142:11 Internal [4] - 88:15, 88:16. 89:7. 90:14 internal [2] - 96:14, internally [2] - 109:9, 139:10 interpretation [2] -43:17, 65:3 interpreted [2] -115:27, 115:29 interrupt [1] - 22:16 intervals [1] - 46:25 interventions [2] -137:14, 143:18 interview [5] - 20:8, 49:21, 59:27, 100:17, 141:12 interviewed [8] -26:5, 49:9, 61:1, 72:14, 126:21, 140:24, 145:1, 157:12 interviewees [1] -135.7 interviewing [6] -57:7, 94:26, 115:6, 141:9, 141:14, 145:8 interviews [4] - 56:9, 59:13, 60:5, 95:1 intimated [1] -143:17 intimidate [1] -

introduce [3] -30:14, 34:27, 35:3 **introduced** [1] - 33:5 introduction [4] -15:4, 15:16, 70:15, 133:18 invalidate [1] - 46:27 investigate [8] -13:11, 30:4, 103:27, 107:23, 138:11, 138:25, 161:19, 161:20 investigated [6] -16:19, 96:22, 97:18, 108:22. 141:24. 159.14 investigating [18] -16:19, 22:1, 57:10, 71:22, 74:8, 75:19, 97:14, 102:14, 102:15, 102:22, 103:19, 105:26, 109:15, 109:16, 109:23, 131:2, 137:24, 138:24 investigation [199] -9:8, 11:23, 11:27, 19:23, 20:6, 20:10, 20:11, 21:6, 22:3, 22:21, 22:22, 22:23, 22:25, 22:27, 23:11, 23:13, 24:14, 24:16, 24:18, 24:24, 25:2, 25:8, 25:12, 25:14, 25:16, 25:25, 26:11, 26:20, 26:29, 28:3, 29:16, 29:24, 30:8, 34:20, 42:1, 42:7, 42:17, 43:6, 43:16, 44:4, 45:21, 49:20, 50:19, 52:3, 52:4, 52:5, 53:26, 54:18, 54:19, 54:21, 55:5, 55:8, 55:14, 56:5, 56:10, 56:19, 56:24, 57:6, 57:8, 57:26, 57:29, 58:11, 58:29, 60:15, 60:26, 60:28. 61:25, 62:21, 63:11, 64:24, 65:20, 68:7, 68:15, 70:17, 72:13, 72:15, 72:21, 72:28, 73:14. 73:23. 74:3. 75:16, 76:3, 76:13, 77:20, 78:1, 78:3, 78:8, 78:29, 80:17, 84:5, 84:7, 85:29, 86:29, 91:8, 91:9, 92:26, 93:17, 93:20, 94:20, 95:29, 96:14,

108:16, 110:7, 138:4

Intelligence [1] -

106:13

158:11

154:13

intimidation [1] -

**INTO** [1] - 1:2

96:20, 97:10, 98:23, involve [1] - 121:6 item [2] - 116:21, 28:29, 35:9, 38:26, 45:4, 45:18, 46:10, 99:4, 100:12, 103:16, involved [12] - 9:5, 162:1 44:20, 86:13, 99:23, 49:1, 49:15, 51:15, 103:18, 103:22, 11:17, 29:26, 78:12, items [3] - 89:25, 127:25, 128:6, 132:7, 52:21, 53:10, 53:12, 104:13, 104:16, 137:1, 146:24, 148:1, 53:20, 55:5, 55:6, 78:22, 78:24, 84:17, 90:10, 152:29 104:22, 106:15, 94:14, 98:24, 99:3, itself [10] - 7:20, 153:4, 157:9, 158:8 56:26, 57:14, 59:16, 107:12, 107:13, junior [1] - 118:11 59:19, 59:29, 60:18, 101:23, 151:13 15:3, 46:27, 59:29, 107:20, 107:23, involvement [3] -64:24, 75:19, 75:22, JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 61:5, 61:29, 68:19, 108:22, 108:26, 70:19, 70:25, 71:2, 95:28, 160:26 102:24, 131:24, 1:12, 2:2 109:3, 110:19, involves [1] - 156:6 Justice [2] - 11:12, 73:29, 74:10, 74:22, 142:14 110:20, 112:23, 151:19 80:23, 80:28, 81:16, involving [1] -114:16, 114:19, 141:19 J justice/suborn [1] -81:20, 81:25, 91:22, 114:29, 115:11, 91:26, 93:12, 94:10, Irish [2] - 7:4, 138:15 65:16 115:13, 115:20, 95:2, 95:10, 95:27, islands [1] - 7:6 justified [3] - 161:1, JACK [1] - 3:6 119:25, 119:26, 96:7, 98:15, 99:25, issue [53] - 10:24, 161:2, 161:6 **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 120:14, 120:27, 100:24, 103:15, justify [1] - 68:4 11:1, 12:27, 24:26, January [3] - 10:26, 121:1, 121:19, 103:19, 103:21, 33:1, 33:28, 35:21, 48:5, 140:2 126:21, 128:4, 104:2, 104:24, K 42:22, 45:5, 45:22, job [6] - 11:26, 128:19, 129:13, 104:26, 105:5, 46:6, 46:10, 49:23, 28:15, 29:17, 32:28, 129:24, 130:21, 109:14, 109:19, 49:24, 50:8, 55:4, 132:3, 132:29, 133:3, 160:1 **KANE** [1] - 2:28 109:28, 110:22, 55:6, 57:4, 60:19, jobs [10] - 11:28, **KATE**[1] - 3:25 110:24, 110:28, 133:12, 134:2, 62:3, 63:8, 71:16, 58:7, 58:14, 59:3, 134:25, 135:11, Kavanagh [4] -111:23, 113:4, 74:19, 74:20, 80:15, 59:7. 121:5. 121:9. 53:22, 70:13, 82:18, 135:17, 135:21, 115:23, 116:18, 80:23, 82:17, 85:15, 136:10, 140:10, 140:3 135:26, 135:29, 117:4, 117:9, 117:17, 86:7, 92:26, 94:26, KAVANAGH[1] - 2:5 136:10. 136:12. 140:12 119:27. 122:13. 95:3, 95:4, 95:27, jobs/lines [2] -**KEANE** [1] - 4:6 123:14, 123:15, 136:19, 137:23, 97:20, 98:14, 103:5, 140:23, 144:29 138:12, 139:17, keen [1] - 166:1 123:25, 124:26, 104:1, 106:25, 141:2, 141:8, 141:18, **JOE** [1] - 3:14 keep [8] - 17:18, 125:10, 125:12, 109:18, 109:19, 141:22, 144:9, JOHN [4] - 2:11, 27:5, 39:24, 69:16, 125:13, 126:5, 126:9, 113:2, 113:23, 2:16, 3:8, 4:1 126:24, 128:16, 144:11, 144:25, 77:25, 124:4, 124:5, 113:28, 114:6, 117:8, 145:3, 145:4, 145:6, John [5] - 8:27, 132:1 131:26, 135:22, 120:19, 122:17, 79:12, 85:20, 85:25, 145:7, 145:15, 136:24, 137:1, keeping [1] - 88:4 144:27, 147:6, 146:21. 147:3. 147:4. 119:10 **KELLY** [21] - 2:10, 141:29. 151:17. 153:13, 154:15, 148:12, 151:21, joined [1] - 158:24 3:12, 111:17, 111:25, 152:21, 156:22, 156:19 151:24, 152:27, 159:17, 160:9, **JUDGE** [1] - 3:12 163:11, 163:17, issued [3] - 51:25, 153:7, 153:27, 154:7, Judge [13] - 12:18, 163:20, 163:24, 161:19, 161:24, 56:3, 114:4 162:28 154:22, 155:15, 13:20, 19:19, 30:25, 163:26, 163:28, issues [52] - 10:3, 155:21, 156:1, 164:2, 164:4, 164:7, **KEOGH**[1] - 2:10 31:11, 32:24, 76:15, 11:16, 18:26, 19:24, 156:11, 156:28, 96:12, 97:20, 97:22, 164:17, 164:26, Keogh's [22] - 30:20, 30:4, 30:19, 33:7, 157:7, 157:11, 133:8, 161:12, 161:13 164:28, 165:3, 165:7, 31:12, 38:6, 42:16, 33:11, 33:19, 36:11, 157:21 158:17 judge [5] - 13:19, 165:12, 165:16, 43:28, 81:6, 91:24, 39:8, 40:5, 41:18, 158:23, 158:28, 93:1. 94:2. 97:25. 21:20, 30:27, 31:6, 165:20 44:21, 45:11, 45:15, 159:7, 159:9, 162:12 98:3 Kelly [9] - 81:17, 103:3, 106:8, 112:17, 58:26, 68:4, 69:19, investigations [7] -116:22, 123:2, July [20] - 8:19, 8:28, 112:12, 112:28, 74:10, 80:11, 81:7, 22:21, 25:18, 28:15, 12:12, 49:24, 51:16, 163:10, 163:19, 124:25, 125:24, 88:17, 101:12, 116:8, 128:23, 142:1, 150:3, 159:6, 159:13, 96:9, 96:13, 96:15, 164:9, 164:14, 103:14, 106:17, 159:2 164:24, 165:9 159:15, 163:14 97:26. 99:20. 101:8. 110:17, 111:1, investigative [1] kept [2] - 72:19, 102:2, 103:9, 105:17, Kelly's [1] - 165:24 113:18, 113:21, 93:29 105:21, 127:25, 114:8 115:22, 116:28, Kenny [5] - 78:16, investigator [4] -**Kevin** [1] - 29:9 128:6, 132:14, 84:17, 84:18, 148:15, 117:5, 123:4, 124:3, 57:18, 85:26, 159:18, **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 132:19, 155:19 128:14, 128:27, 148.16 159:24 key [1] - 145:4 jumping [1] - 29:1 Keogh [115] - 9:1, 131:26, 133:20, investigators [5] -134:21, 137:4, juncture [12] - 25:19, 18:12, 21:19, 26:8, **KIERAN** [1] - 3:20 20:9, 36:17, 49:2, 137:22, 137:27, 27:8, 46:7, 50:11, 28:11, 30:1, 30:13, Kieran [1] - 78:16 112:18, 140:17 142:21, 143:19, 53:16, 58:27, 68:13, 32:4, 33:5, 34:1, kind [4] - 37:9, investment [2] -34:15, 35:21, 35:25. 78:7, 81:4, 94:24, 144:4, 144:15, 41:26, 114:6, 166:1 9:18. 10:6 101:22, 137:11 36:10, 36:18, 37:2, 149:16, 152:25, **KIRWAN** [1] - 3:13 invite [1] - 56:26 159:13, 159:15, junctures [2] - 25:20, 38:16, 38:19, 39:6, knowing [2] - 151:9, invited [1] - 100:4 140:19 39:21, 39:23, 40:11, 162:14 160:17 invoking [1] - 18:28 IT [1] - 9:22 June [17] - 19:28, 42:29, 43:9, 44:23, knowledge [10] -

17:26, 25:11, 42:14, 43:9, 50:16, 69:20, 101:22, 116:26, 119:11, 125:27 known [11] - 18:29, 29:18, 32:2, 34:15, 40:25, 41:24, 42:17, 117:22. 119:12. 119:16, 124:1 knows [1] - 100:1 L lack [1] - 95:28 laid [1] - 31:19 large [1] - 110:24 last [14] - 15:7,

32:11, 37:26, 79:20, 90:17, 96:25, 100:25, 113:2, 118:12, 123:14, 130:19, 134:16, 140:28, 160:22 late [2] - 7:18, 8:11 latest [2] - 81:5, 82:20 launched [1] - 10:11 law [8] - 17:11, 19:8, 19:9, 25:9, 125:11, 131:5, 159:26, 160:2 **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29 layer [2] - 73:24, 92:24 lead [1] - 85:26 leads [4] - 75:18, 113:2, 121:20, 131:22 learning [1] - 150:21 least [2] - 69:21, 102:28 leave [8] - 10:14, 12:10, 38:18, 83:24, 113:26, 154:6, 157:17, 164:16 led [1] - 151:9 left [3] - 29:22, 30:24, 110:25 left-hand [1] - 30:24legal [2] - 78:20, 157:8 legally [1] - 26:26 legislation [8] - 13:4, 21:22, 24:15, 43:7, 45:16, 45:17, 107:16, 151:1 legitimate [1] - 45:19 **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13 length [1] - 54:7 less [1] - 124:4 letter [45] - 19:9,

19:12, 26:7, 27:12, 28:24, 30:1, 32:24, 33:19, 45:8, 49:25, 51:14, 52:16, 52:29, 53:24, 55:21, 62:5, 62:9, 63:19, 67:10, 67:15, 69:9, 71:29, 77:9, 77:10, 79:9, 82:15, 82:29, 84:3, 85:12, 90:13, 99:19, 106:28, 120:18, 122:12, 129:5, 131:19, 139:22, 139:28, 144:21, 145:12, 147:10, 149:3, 156:22, 156:25 letters [2] - 82:21, 156:26 level [16] - 8:17, 9:12, 13:18, 21:15, 31:13, 47:17, 47:19, 47:28, 61:15, 71:17, 71:20, 73:7, 74:28, 119:11, 149:15, 162:18 liaise [2] - 65:27, 113:17 liaised [1] - 68:29 liaison [2] - 72:29, 127:29 Liam [17] - 95:29, 96:10, 96:17, 98:2, 98:14, 99:24, 100:4, 100:17, 101:13, 103:14, 104:25, 104:28, 115:25, 115:28, 138:5, 160:8, 160:19 **LIAM** [1] - 3:18 licence [1] - 158:11 lieu [1] - 90:2 life [1] - 94:8 light [5] - 79:29, 88:20, 100:11, 120:22, 136:22 likely [1] - 65:19 likewise [1] - 67:1

limited [1] - 75:3 line [13] - 6:20, 14:5, 21:5, 57:24, 57:27, 76:1, 90:27, 96:26, 97:7, 134:11, 136:1, 140:21, 151:13 lines [6] - 15:7, 15:16, 72:13, 120:28, 140:18, 142:12 lion's [1] - 8:22

list [7] - 118:10,

118:15, 119:19,

119:20, 119:22,

151:16 listed [1] - 119:5 listened [3] - 161:27, 161:28, 162:2 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:28 lived [1] - 119:4 load [1] - 29:20 local [54] - 41:19, 41:23, 42:2, 42:11, 42:19, 42:23, 44:6, 44:14, 45:25, 45:27, 47:17, 48:1, 50:21, 51:11, 54:10, 54:22, 65:28, 66:16, 66:27, 67:1. 67:14. 68:3. 69:1, 69:17, 69:19, 69:22, 69:27, 78:10, 82:10, 83:6, 84:1, 86:15, 87:2, 88:6, 89:8, 89:9, 89:10, 90:3, 92:21, 92:25, 92:28, 99:5, 102:20, 106:11, 106:20, 110:11, 113:18, 116:27, 122:22, 124:1, 125:24, 128:1, 128:3, 144:16 locally [11] - 42:18, 50:17, 54:11, 60:4, 61:19, 69:25, 74:28, 90:2, 123:8, 124:1, 160:20 location [2] - 59:13,

61.28 locations [1] - 58:22 locus [1] - 56:24 lodged [1] - 138:9 Loki [1] - 142:7 long-term [3] -47:24, 48:9, 55:2 look [54] - 10:4, 13:27, 13:29, 15:14, 20:29, 21:14, 21:24, 23:6, 23:9, 25:6, 25:22, 26:17, 26:18, 27:4, 29:1, 30:16, 30:20, 32:18, 33:9, 35:26, 35:27, 37:6, 42:8, 49:13, 51:17, 53:21, 55:27, 59:20, 62:5, 62:14, 67:24, 70:11, 75:12, 81:8, 82:15, 83:10, 83:28, 87:7, 87:14, 87:26, 90:12, 90:16, 96:24, 97:25, 99:16, 99:17, 100:29, 101:18, 111:23, 129:11, 129:17, 137:20, 141:28, 157:2

looked [12] - 38:14, 43:28, 82:27, 86:20, 96:11, 97:15, 101:2, 118:28, 119:1, 121:3, 127:9, 157:27 looking [15] - 23:16, 50:23, 61:4, 61:24, 65:1, 66:6, 66:9, 82:22, 87:22, 91:12, 118:8, 121:6, 135:2, 148:8, 159:20 **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 lose [1] - 9:10 losing [1] - 17:2 lost [3] - 14:16, 25:24, 105:8 Loughrea [1] -117:23 low [1] - 18:21 **LUNCH** [1] - 95:22 lunchtime [1] -165:29 Lyons [3] - 99:23, 101:1, 103:20 **LYONS** [1] - 4:6

M

machines [1] -164:14 MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7 magnitude [1] -131.1 mail [2] - 85:18, 99:25 MAIN [1] - 2:12 main [3] - 72:9, 97:12, 127:29 maintain [2] - 41:22, 58:20 maintained [1] -33:22 major [3] - 28:14, 56:19. 61:10 majority [2] - 141:10, 145:10 Malone [1] - 1:24 MALONE [1] - 1:29 malpractice [8] -14:8, 14:28, 15:12, 15:20, 17:1, 17:7, 18:22, 72:8 man [3] - 118:21, 127:27, 155:15 manage [1] - 19:7 managed [3] - 30:12, 35:9, 114:29 Management [2] -73:17, 133:16

8:21, 9:8, 11:15, 12:6, 41:7, 41:19, 41:23, 42:2, 42:11, 42:19, 42:23, 44:14, 45:26, 45:27, 48:1, 50:22, 51:12, 54:10, 54:22, 65:28, 66:27, 67:1, 67:14, 69:1, 69:17, 69:19, 69:22, 69:27, 71:17, 72:8, 82:11, 83:6, 84:1, 86:15, 88:6, 89:8, 89:10, 90:3, 92:22, 92:25, 92:28, 96:19, 96:20, 99:5, 102:20, 106:12, 106:21, 110:7, 110:11, 113:18, 116:27, 124:2, 125:24, 128:1, 128:3, 132:16, 137:29, 144:16, 150:26 manager [1] - 87:2 managing [1] - 94:13 manner [9] - 52:4, 53:2, 53:25, 74:6, 103:27, 110:1, 110:2, 110:9, 162:22 manufactured [1] -94:23 March [8] - 8:16. 11:2, 108:11, 115:21, 121:22, 130:18, 131:19, 143:13 MARGARET[1] -3:21 MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17 MARK[1] - 3:3 Mark [1] - 67:29 MARRINAN [49] -2:7, 5:5, 6:5, 6:10, 6:15, 24:13, 24:22, 27:11, 28:9, 31:2, 31:4, 32:14, 32:17, 37:4, 51:14, 70:11, 76:16, 77:8, 79:8, 85:2, 86:27, 87:6, 90:12, 90:27, 91:22, 95:18, 95:26, 103:8, 104:19, 110:21, 111:5, 111:10, 112:16, 113:2, 124:19, 126:4, 134:9, 135:4, 142:19, 148:23, 149:4, 149:7, 151:15, 155:12, 158:23, 158:29, 161:10, 163:7, 164:20 marrinan [1] - 24:4

Marrinan [11] - 6:4,

management [59] -

26:9, 27:10, 77:7, 112:7, 112:11, 149:2, 158:21, 163:11, 163:13, 163:28 Martin [1] - 10:26 material [21] - 6:16, 15:5, 16:24, 26:16, 27:12, 46:15, 48:7, 49:16, 52:25, 53:21, 55:29, 62:7, 62:12, 85:9, 85:22, 101:29, 103:10, 109:22, 112:17, 131:13, 142:20 materials [2] - 51:17, 105:17 **MATT**[1] - 3:19 Matt [3] - 83:26, 88:1, 88:29 matter [84] - 12:24, 13:12, 14:16, 16:15, 19:25, 20:23, 23:22, 23:25, 24:2, 24:6, 24:8, 25:3, 32:3, 32:4, 32:22, 34:18, 38:11, 44:25, 44:27, 45:24, 47:24, 47:26, 51:18, 53:4, 53:19, 54:7, 60:15, 61:26, 63:13, 63:27, 64:27, 70:21, 71:22, 72:5, 73:19, 77:21, 82:2, 83:8, 83:24, 84:1, 86:14, 88:6, 90:21, 90:27, 91:5, 92:21, 92:27, 97:17, 97:19, 99:17, 101:8, 101:27, 102:9, 104:12, 104:19, 105:1, 106:3, 106:18, 106:20, 107:22, 107:24, 107:29, 108:8, 109:14, 109:16, 112:13, 114:24, 115:16. 116:12, 122:17, 126:27, 130:4, 131:4, 131:13, 131:22, 132:12, 137:9, 138:27, 147:13, 147:18, 153:19, 156:1, 160:13, 164:8 matters [51] - 10:5, 11:14, 12:22, 14:17, 15:24, 17:15, 21:14, 21:24, 23:12, 40:2, 44:7. 47:18. 48:22. 48:26, 52:29, 65:1, 66:8, 66:9, 66:23, 67:1, 67:11, 67:12, 83:28, 89:28, 91:25,

94:12, 96:17, 96:19, 96:22, 97:17, 97:24, 99:6, 99:16, 100:29, 103:23, 107:10, 107:12, 108:27, 110:8, 114:7, 116:8, 118:1, 120:6, 124:24, 128:15, 129:1, 135:20, 137:26, 149:10, 160:23, 161:11 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:4 matters.. [1] - 48:20 MATTHIAS[1] - 2:10 maturity [1] - 142:16 Mayo [1] - 8:4 McBrien [20] - 2:16, 114:5. 116:18.

42:28, 68:1, 70:24, 71:7, 74:25, 96:10, 97:23, 98:16, 98:29, 99:14, 99:18, 101:4, 103:9, 112:4, 113:11, 117:20, 119:1 McCARTAN[2] -4:10, 4:11

McCOURT [1] - 2:17 McGARRY [1] - 2:21 McGRATH[2] - 2:7,

McGuinness [3] -2:6, 3:24, 145:17 McHugh [21] - 96:1, 96:10, 96:17, 98:2, 98:14, 99:25, 99:29, 100:1, 100:4, 100:6, 100:14, 100:17, 101:13, 103:14, 104:25, 104:28, 115:25, 115:28, 138:6, 160:8, 160:19 McLoughlin [1] -49:29

MCLOUGHLIN [1] -

McLYNN [1] - 4:2 MCMAHON[1] - 3:8 McMahon [10] -13:20, 19:19, 30:25, 32:24, 96:12, 97:20, 97:22, 133:8, 161:13 McMahon's [1] -

31.11

MCPARTLIN[1] mean [26] - 19:4, 24:5, 32:7, 36:26, 42:2, 42:6, 54:4, 54:14, 57:14, 60:20,

88:17, 97:9, 102:7,

102:18, 104:10, 104:24, 109:17, 111:14, 111:21, 134:24, 140:4, 151:3, 154:28, 160:29, 161:11, 165:8 meant [4] - 26:3, 58:22, 61:22, 84:23 meantime [1] - 82:15 meat [2] - 36:11, 86:28 mechanism [1] -

39.17 mechanisms [1] -15:18 media [2] - 18:8, 40:24

**MEDICAL**[1] - 3:11 meet [13] - 30:17, 35:4, 35:9, 36:9, 38:8, 38:9, 38:20, 45:12, 53:24, 59:21, 67:14, 145:3, 152:2 meeting [35] - 22:11,

33:17, 37:26, 38:5, 38:25, 39:1, 39:27, 40:14, 41:14, 44:19, 44:25, 44:26, 45:4, 45:21, 55:28, 56:1, 66:20, 67:6, 67:18,

67:23, 68:14, 70:14, 71:1, 71:11, 85:6, 96:10, 98:3, 98:18, 100:22, 100:25, 101:17, 104:8, 113:12, 114:5, 117:26

meetings [7] - 39:22, 94:10, 110:28, 113:20, 140:14, 142:29, 145:7 **MEMBER** [1] - 2:2

member [38] - 14:1, 14:13, 14:14, 14:18, 16:28, 18:12, 18:20, 23:1, 44:28, 44:29, 46:11, 46:21, 46:25, 47:1, 47:2, 47:6,

48:13, 48:15, 51:6, 60:13, 60:25, 60:28, 62:28, 64:2, 64:3, 65:7, 72:10, 86:14, 87:5, 90:20, 103:20, 122:10, 141:10, 141:14, 145:9

member's 151 - 65:8. 65:27, 66:3, 77:23, 82:12

members [25] - 11:6, 14:11, 14:27, 15:10, 34:7, 44:2, 48:4,

51:26, 57:7, 57:11, 57:15, 58:4, 60:2, 65:15, 80:10, 113:27, 114:8, 135:11, 145:3, 148:29, 150:23, 150:24, 153:28, 154:10 memory [2] - 21:21,

127:22 mention [2] - 43:9, 44:11 mentioned [13] -

21:8, 44:23, 44:26, 53:1, 58:5, 61:14, 70:29, 123:23, 123:29, 124:20, 143:15, 152:29, 160:23

mentioning [1] mentions [2] - 51:28,

123:19 mere [1] - 24:13 merely [3] - 10:23, 130:27, 139:25 merits [1] - 55:10 message [3] - 90:1,

92:11, 162:11 messages [3] -75:21, 157:22, 157:23 messaging [1] -

157:1 **met** [13] - 38:15, 38:19, 38:27, 39:19, 51:23, 52:28, 66:16, 67:28, 94:10, 97:29, 100:4, 117:22, 155:15 Michael [3] - 22:8,

28:26, 143:12 MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 Mick [3] - 122:7,

123:12, 147:13 micromanagement [1] - 128:21

mid [2] - 12:12, 49:24 middle [1] - 130:9 midlands [1] - 119:4 might [21] - 16:15, 18:23, 39:14, 41:11, 41:12, 58:4, 71:6, 77:1, 87:11, 100:12, 102:20, 102:24, 134:19, 134:23,

134:28, 139:20, 142:4, 152:28, 161:1, 165:28

mightn't [1] - 119:12 mind [7] - 26:10,

32:5, 42:3, 69:15, 114:27, 121:25, 161:1 **minds** [1] - 114:23 mine [2] - 8:26, 19:4 minimised [1] - 62:1 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 Minister [2] - 147:24, 151:19 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 Minnock [2] - 60:7, 100:10

Minnock... [1] -100:18 minutes [1] - 166:2

Mirror [2] - 136:15, 137:25 mirrors [1] - 102:2

mistake [1] - 112:6 mistakes [1] -150:21

mobile [6] - 73:8, 153:5, 153:9, 153:11, 157:23

modern [1] - 58:19 modular [2] - 141:3, 141:27

modules [2] - 121:1, 142.5 moment [4] - 71:27.

77:29, 152:20, 160:16 Monday [3] - 10:14, 98:3, 100:26

**MONICA** [1] - 3:15 month [5] - 21:3, 120:25, 152:1, 157:8 months [3] - 8:29, 46:25, 155:20 **mood** [1] - 133:19

morale [1] - 65:22 morning [5] - 6:14, 10:14, 10:16, 10:19, 89:23

**MORONEY** [1] - 3:18 MORRISSEY [1] -

most [17] - 9:15, 10:9, 13:14, 21:25, 31:13, 31:23, 90:11, 100:2, 103:26, 112:25, 118:11, 127:26, 131:27, 143:8, 149:20, 153:10, 162:15 motivated [1] -124:24

move [16] - 16:24, 19:10, 37:13, 51:3, 56:24, 65:4, 71:27, 77:8, 81:28, 95:26, 105:9, 117:7, 129:3,

137:16, 145:12, 98:25, 99:13, 99:19, 26:28, 34:8, 34:20, 96:29, 129:7 115:16, 128:13, 145:19 101:3, 101:20, 49:6, 63:10, 63:24, **nice** [1] - 150:2 134:29, 150:15, moved [4] - 70:17, 101:26, 103:9, 68:15, 74:8, 75:24, NICHOLAS [2] -154:21, 157:18 105:18, 107:7, 99:1, 101:23, 101:24, 88:24, 117:28, 120:28 notice [2] - 15:20, 2:10. 4:5 movement[1] - 36:4 107:27, 108:25, 107:11, 134:5, Nicholas [1] - 103:15 47:9 113:17, 115:4, 134:25, 134:27, moving [5] - 55:14, Nick [4] - 70:18, notifications [1] -95:17, 95:18, 142:5, 116:16, 122:20, 154:24 70:25, 70:26, 163:14 133:1 123:16, 127:28, naught [1] - 23:24 159:22 night [1] - 100:25 noting [2] - 130:27, 128:9, 137:11, MR [97] - 1:12, 2:2, near [1] - 113:5 153.9 nilly [1] - 54:6 137:17, 139:29, **nearly** [1] - 128:2 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, November [4] nine [4] - 121:1, 142:27, 143:1, 143:9, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, necessarily [1] -121:2, 141:29, 148:26 135:8, 136:9, 136:14, 143:11, 143:16, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 111:7 nobody [3] - 12:1, 136:15 144:3, 144:7, 144:13, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, necessary [6] -56:3, 164:24 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:14, 144:14, 145:13, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 46:26, 77:21, 85:17, Noel [1] - 147:10 3:21 145:18, 152:20, 4:1, 4:1, 4:6, 4:10, 133:1, 146:29, 165:28 number [25] - 7:23, **NOEL** [1] - 4:10 152:23, 155:26, 4:10, 5:5, 6:5, 6:10, necessity [2] - 73:15, 8:7, 10:8, 10:22, noises [1] - 150:1 156:19, 156:23, 6:15, 24:13, 24:22, 13:13, 16:25, 30:12, **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 156:24, 156:27, 27:11, 28:9, 31:2, need [22] - 18:27, 57:7, 85:16, 87:9, Nolan [1] - 84:11 157:29, 162:16 31:4, 32:14, 32:17, 20:29, 23:8, 33:10, 100:20, 108:18, nominate [2] - 38:9, 37:4, 51:14, 70:11, Mulcahy's [2] -38:8, 44:9, 49:17, 109:1, 110:24, 70:12, 114:25 76:16, 77:8, 79:8, 51:19, 63:5, 82:18, 121:13, 129:21, nominated [3] - 13:5, 85:2, 86:27, 87:6, MULLIGAN [2] -85:10, 91:15, 110:14, 135:19, 141:6, 57:14, 82:9 90:12, 90:27, 91:22, 2:11, 3:13 141:14, 147:17, 118:7, 124:5, 127:10, non [1] - 94:7 Mullingar [1] -95:18, 95:26, 103:8, 139:16, 139:18, 149:2, 151:23, non-suspension [1] 137.29 104:19, 110:21, 139:20, 148:17, 155:12, 156:4, 157:4 - 94:7 multiple [1] - 135:14 111:5, 111:10, 148:26 **NYLAND**[1] - 3:19 noncompliance [1] -111:17, 111:25, Murphy [1] - 15:6 needed [22] - 10:4, Nyland [3] - 83:26, 46:26 111:27, 112:4, MURPHY [3] - 2:30, 88:2, 89:1 28:2, 37:8, 37:12, **NOREEN** [1] - 2:16 112:16, 113:2, 3:23, 165:24 38:12, 40:2, 41:18, **NÍ**[1] - 2:30 Noreen [1] - 42:28 124:19, 126:4, 134:9, Murray [26] - 85:5, 42:3, 50:12, 53:16, **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7 normal [13] - 9:25, 135:4, 142:19, 85:11, 85:23, 86:25, 54:4, 67:12, 99:6, Nóirín [3] - 8:14, 11:15, 20:20, 28:14, 148:23, 149:4, 149:7, 89:11, 89:20, 91:1, 110:15, 118:19, 12:9, 119:13 34:25, 43:12, 64:1, 151:15, 155:12, 117:13, 117:16, 121:2, 122:24, 123:7, 64:4, 68:24, 118:9, 158:23, 158:29, 117:22, 117:26, 124:27, 124:29, 0 118:22, 134:14, 161:10. 163:7. 118:16, 118:20, 128:12 149:21 163:11, 163:17, 118:27, 120:26, needing [1] - 51:6 normally [2] - 134:3, **O'BRIEN** [1] - 2:10 163:20, 163:24, 122:1, 123:20, needn't [2] - 16:14, 134.4 o'clock [1] - 38:27 163:26, 163:28, 123:28, 127:13, Northern [2] - 78:17, O'CONNOR [1] -164:2, 164:4, 164:7, 127:16, 127:20, needs [4] - 20:29, 164:17, 164:20, 128:11, 143:18, 39:19, 114:20, 114:22 northern [1] - 84:5 164:26, 164:28, **O'Hagan** [1] - 29:10 143:23, 143:29, 144:3 negligently [1] - 93:5 **NORTHUMBERLAN** 165:3, 165:7, 165:12, O'HIGGINS [1] - 3:23 MURRAY [2] - 3:3, nervous [2] - 39:11, **D**[1] - 2:18 165:16, 165:20, O'MARA [1] - 2:17 40:21 note [15] - 33:1, 165:24 O'NEILL [1] - 4:1 must [1] - 8:12 net [1] - 14:21 44:10, 52:24, 67:18, MS [11] - 2:7, 2:11, MÍCHEÁL [1] - 3:23 O'Neill [10] - 95:29, neutral [1] - 130:13 98:6, 99:10, 101:28, 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 96:17, 98:2, 98:13, never [8] - 13:7, 105:16, 116:10, 3:26, 3:26, 4:1, 4:7, 101:13, 104:24, Ν 18:18, 18:23, 25:8, 131:16, 132:25, 115:24. 115:27. 54:14, 118:21, 127:9, 135:24, 143:23, MULCAHY [1] - 3:5 138:5, 160:6 127:11 144:28. 163:12 name [7] - 33:21, Mulcahy [72] - 21:29, O'REARDON[1] nevertheless [1] noted [4] - 63:22, 33:25, 40:23, 41:23, 28:23. 28:26. 29:6. 3:17 12:27 106:6, 127:20, 136:29 41:27, 42:13, 43:8 38:29, 39:24, 39:28, **O'ROURKE** [1] - 4:7 **new** [12] - 6:28, notes [14] - 1:26, named [8] - 1:26, 40:8, 42:23, 42:27, O'Shea [1] - 29:7 44:11, 50:2, 50:3, 39:4, 44:20, 55:27, 72:7, 79:4, 125:16, 43:4, 44:21, 45:9, O'Sullivan [5] - 8:15. 58:19, 82:25, 82:28, 55:29, 66:18, 88:18, 126:2, 141:6, 163:5, 49:25, 51:15, 51:20, 12:9, 119:10, 119:13, 119:22, 120:22, 104:6, 127:16, 163:7 52:28, 55:28, 58:13, 150:17 134:19, 134:21, 135:3 127:19, 127:20, namely [3] - 36:20, 66:13, 67:24, 71:4, O'SULLIVAN[1] news [1] - 122:27 127:22, 136:16, 149:9 127.6 161.18 81:18, 85:28, 87:15, newspaper [1] nothing [13] - 25:15, national [3] - 51:4, 88:10, 89:17, 90:29, objective [2] - 25:17, 137:26 40:20, 60:7, 61:18, 74:28. 152:26 98:12, 98:18, 98:20, 124:25 next [4] - 6:5, 85:2, 69:23, 75:19, 98:22, nature [18] - 17:16,

objectives [1] -17:17 objectivity [1] -78:24 obligation [5] -14:11, 14:18, 43:15, 105:28, 125:28 obliged [4] - 52:13, 72:20, 132:1, 151:22 observations [3] -115:8, 136:5, 147:24 obstructing [1] -52:5 obtained [3] - 63:26, 76:6, 77:3 obviously [15] -12:22, 26:10, 27:13, 33:24, 42:11, 61:6, 66:23, 75:21, 86:28, 90:1, 90:9, 116:23, 126:27, 149:15, 160:29 occasion [3] - 70:24, 126:16, 140:15 occasions [2] -127:3, 127:4 occur [1] - 127:23 occurring [1] - 81:24 October [10] - 85:3, 85:12, 85:22, 87:8, 87:24, 88:28, 89:13, 91:21, 91:22, 92:23 **OF** [10] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, 3:15, 164:11 of.. [1] - 81:15 offence [1] - 158:9 offences [1] - 24:16 offer [1] - 139:5 offered [2] - 139:1, 143:6 offering [1] - 125:6 office [29] - 7:22, 10:15, 10:18, 19:27, 20:25, 32:12, 35:29, 51:4, 58:23, 58:25, 58:28, 66:3, 77:25, 78:22, 88:28, 88:29, 93:25, 93:26, 113:5, 113:9, 118:5, 118:13, 122:13, 132:2, 132:20, 132:22, 133:6, 149:9, 149:12 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 officer [15] - 22:1, 26:18, 48:19, 51:2, 65:27, 72:29, 77:23, 91:6, 99:16, 107:25, 117:27, 139:2, 163:5, 163:8

**OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, 3:14 officer/welfare [1] -65:23 officers [5] - 31:27, 107:28, 118:2, 131:5, 137:2 official [2] - 61:17, 74:17 officially [1] - 152:11 often [1] - 111:18 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 Olivia [10] - 95:29, 96:17, 98:2, 98:13, 101:12, 104:24, 115:24 115:27 138:5, 160:6 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12, 4:1 Ombudsman [2] -137:6, 138:11 omitted [1] - 149:10 ON [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [12] - 25:4, 28:1, 59:15, 61:28, 64:23, 68:24, 84:1, 104:8, 131:6, 133:20, 139:1, 162:14 one [42] - 10:9, 12:22, 13:6, 16:1, 27:22, 29:22, 41:1, 42:3, 43:19, 44:1, 56:19, 58:1, 59:29,  $71{:}27,\,73{:}28,\,76{:}5,$ 78:14, 89:29, 93:24, 94:15, 99:7, 102:14, 104:13, 104:25, 114:1, 114:20, 116:21, 119:5, 121:20, 125:10, 126:15, 134:23, 139:12, 141:26, 144.24 151.10 152:1, 156:6, 161:14, 163:22 one-to-one [1] - 44:1 ones [1] - 127:19 ongoing [3] - 133:3, 144:11, 158:18 onus [2] - 11:18, 116:26 **open** [15] - 34:2, 44:20, 49:17, 61:3, 80:9, 82:18, 91:15, 92:1, 106:22, 119:21, 121:13, 132:9,

135:28, 139:9, 148:27

opened [14] - 57:27,

72:17, 77:10, 80:12,

82:21, 86:24, 92:23,

120:18, 132:10, 139:26, 146:8, 146:19, 146:22, 149:8 openness [1] - 57:21 Operation [1] - 142:6 operational [2] -79:24, 80:1 operations [1] - 8:25 opinion [1] - 46:18 opportunity [6] -15:21, 30:17, 38:13, 72:27, 102:21, 151:26 opposed [1] - 69:5 opposite [1] - 37:14 option [1] - 26:11 options [1] - 65:17 Oranmore [4] -58:16, 58:17, 58:26, 135:9 order [7] - 10:3, 18:26, 21:27, 27:5, 33:4, 59:19, 65:7 organisation [13] -7:16, 7:20, 9:27, 12:17, 13:6, 18:20, 53:14, 55:11, 83:27, 123:5, 125:1, 139:10, 150:29

83:22

151:11

148.19

86:7, 97:18

organisations [1] -ORLA [1] - 3:20 OSMOND [1] - 3:27 OTHER [1] - 1:3 otherwise [7] - 25:1, 26:12, 66:4, 103:2, 115:17, 115:18, ought [3] - 57:20, ounce [1] - 159:11 outburst [1] - 122:7 outcome [3] - 65:19, 93:23, 104:15 outings [1] - 11:11 outline [3] - 50:20, 123:28, 148:23 outlined [8] - 6:29, 51:24. 78:10. 103:19. 107:10, 108:15, 138:16, 144:3 outlines [2] - 139:25, outlining [3] - 85:5, 99:25, 123:4 outset [4] - 23:16, 29:15, 55:2, 74:3 outside [6] - 75:9, 100:13. 102:22. 110:3, 159:20, 162:1 outstanding [1] -

141:15 overall [2] - 58:11, 108:22 overlap [3] - 110:21, 111:11, 112:1 overlapped[1] -111:19 overlapping [3] -111:3, 111:12, 112:10 overlooking [1] -150:13 overnight [2] -164:29, 165:1 own [15] - 22:6, 66:18, 84:24, 92:14, 92:15, 114:23, 114:27, 119:16, 122:21, 127:16, 133:12, 150:23, 159:15, 160:17, 160:26

P

pace [1] - 159:22 **PAGE** [1] - 5:2 page [68] - 6:16, 13:29, 15:4, 15:15, 16:3, 16:24, 19:11, 27:12. 29:29. 30:22. 37:14. 46:15. 48:3. 48:6, 49:2, 49:16, 49:26, 51:17, 52:24, 53:20, 55:29, 62:6, 63:4, 63:6, 63:18, 67:25, 70:13, 71:28, 85:9, 85:13, 85:22, 90:12, 96:2, 96:4, 96:24, 96:25, 96:26, 97:25, 98:6, 99:20, 101:28, 105:8, 105:16, 106:27, 112:16, 121:29, 125:3, 129:6, 129:7, 129:10, 129:16, 130:19, 132:7, 132:14, 136:13, 137:16, 139:22, 140:3, 140:28, 142:19, 145:14, 145:19, 146:8, 147:10, 149:4, 151:15, 163:15 pages [1] - 96:6 pale [1] - 31:24 pan [1] - 95:5 paper [1] - 140:20 paragraph [18] -14:3, 46:27, 48:7, 51:21, 62:15, 62:16, 134:17, 137:20, 140:22, 140:28, 142:24, 144:28, 153:21 paragraphs [1] -51.18 parameters [1] -160:2 paramount [1] -69:15 **pardon** [2] - 88:12, 132.25 parliamentary [1] -147:14 Parliamentary [2] -147:19, 147:22 part [22] - 14:13, 23:20, 26:7, 35:13, 41:13, 41:15, 50:19, 64:5, 64:20, 73:27, 74:9, 78:18, 78:20, 89:29, 90:9, 97:10, 99:4, 108:22, 109:26, 110:19, 110:27, 162:15 particular [20] -16:15, 17:24, 23:27, 25:29, 31:15, 39:28, 40:7, 40:12, 41:16, 41:18, 51:28, 52:1, 54:12, 71:1, 82:21, 86:14, 90:4, 123:19, 129:25, 133:19 particularly [2] -60:24, 60:25 parties [2] - 75:25, 164:22 party [1] - 107:14 pass [2] - 89:9, 90:1 **PASSED**[1] - 1:4 passed [3] - 85:26, 89:29, 99:14 passing [1] - 83:3 past [1] - 139:14 Pat [13] - 85:4, 86:25, 89:10, 89:20, 117:13, 117:26, 118:16, 118:20, 118:27, 119:4, 119:14, 119:16, 122:1 PATRICK[4] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:28, 3:3 Patrick [1] - 19:19 pattern [1] - 10:20 Paudie [1] - 29:7 **PAUL** [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 4:1

**PD**[4] - 20:19, 45:17,

65:4, 90:17, 96:6,

108:13, 130:19,

81:26, 125:14, 126:5, 59:14, 60:5, 61:13, 68:25, 69:5 130:13, 131:18, 122:26 pedantic [1] - 112:8 126:10, 127:9 66:20, 67:16, 68:2, 154:9, 156:12, 161:18 presumption[1] -**PEGGY** [1] - 4:7 person [14] - 14:13, 76:19, 85:3, 87:17, possession [4] -28:5 18:25, 25:7, 25:15, 95:1, 131:27, 133:14, **PEMS** [1] - 61:23 54:8, 71:9, 131:29, **pretty** [1] - 151:12 **pen** [1] - 140:20 44:12, 51:28, 100:3, 152:15, 152:22, 156:10 prevent [2] - 17:21, 161:15 penalty [3] - 9:29, 114:21, 114:22, possibilities [1] -24:14 129:28, 142:29, placed [4] - 42:10, 58:3 10:1, 10:24 previous [9] - 64:8, 105:29, 116:28, 138:4 154:8, 154:18, 163:2 possibility [1] -76:27, 80:22, 82:28, penned [1] - 15:6 personal [3] places [1] - 121:7 44.28 136:29, 147:6, 163:6, People [1] - 79:11 113:28, 114:4, 117:15 **plain** [1] - 90:8 possible [8] - 15:21, 163:8. 164:3 people [37] - 9:27, personally [2] plan [2] - 9:7, 10:8 51:5, 100:16, 141:3, previously [8] -29:15, 31:13, 31:22, 34:13, 43:5, 43:23, 100:1, 119:28 planned [2] - 58:13, 141:13, 164:27, 14:20, 22:8, 57:16, personnel [3] - 29:4, 115:15 165:12, 166:1 73:16, 75:26, 76:24, 51:25, 54:6, 55:10, 29:13, 79:16 possibly [5] - 40:22, 57:8, 57:22, 59:22, **planning** [1] - 9:17 124:17, 141:4 44:10, 82:25, 151:9, persons [6] - 16:7, prima [1] - 121:26 59:27, 79:4, 97:11, **plans** [1] - 10:9 44:9, 72:14, 140:24, 159:20 98:1, 101:23, 102:21, plant [1] - 156:7 primarily [1] - 142:20 141:6, 145:1 potential [3] - 65:15, 114:10, 115:12, plausible [2] primary [6] - 17:17, perspective [1] -116:2, 118:13, 129:22, 130:10 135:27, 135:28 37:5, 65:13, 66:15, 118:15, 118:22, 94:2 potentially [1] -83:13, 91:11 play [1] - 140:23 principal [1] - 15:24 119:12, 119:18, 153:6 pertaining [2] **plus** [1] - 21:8 119:19, 119:20, 103:18, 141:3 POWER [1] - 4:10 principle [1] - 57:9 pockets [1] - 112:14 119:22, 123:16, pertinent [2] - 81:7, point [30] - 7:15, power [2] - 54:5, prioritise [2] - 121:3, 127:7, 139:19, 131.25 54:12 142:5 12:20, 21:5, 25:18, 142:14, 150:13, pervert [1] - 65:16 25:21, 25:26, 26:15, powers [1] - 24:29 priority [4] - 74:3, 154.15 **PETER** [2] - 2:5, 3:13 practicable [1] - 16:8 74:5, 89:26, 90:11 26:26, 29:3, 39:23, **PEOPLE** [1] - 3:16 phase [2] - 25:5, practical [3] - 19:2, 40:12, 42:1, 44:15, private [3] - 77:11, 25:27 perceived [1] - 96:13 50:11, 61:17, 68:21, 58:10, 69:18 108:10, 148:2 perception [1] phone [38] - 30:11, 83:7, 97:9, 106:14, practicalities [1] problem [5] - 42:5, 30:12, 36:12, 36:19, 123:13 111:16, 111:22, 61:12 43:26, 70:2, 71:13, 36:21, 37:1, 37:10, 112:11, 112:29, perfectly [3] - 60:8, 97.9 precisely [1] -105:5, 164:14 67:13, 72:29, 73:8, 126:24, 130:11, 111:20 problems [3] - 9:20, performance [1] -74:6, 74:9, 74:13, 140:22, 140:28, precondition [1] -104:16, 136:24 74:17, 74:25, 74:27, 153:15, 158:17, 166:5 65:21 81:23 procedure [2] -75:15, 75:19, 75:28, pointed [1] - 80:4 performed [1] predecessor[1] -18:29, 159:26 75:29, 76:14, 87:9, 81.15 pointing [2] - 55:15, 164:2 proceed [4] - 26:14, 87:14, 88:1, 88:9, performing [2] -51:6, 64:25, 73:14 120:1 prefer [2] - 166:3, 101:9, 104:7, 104:9. 34:25, 149:15 points [5] - 9:29, 166:4 process [13] - 23:5, 121:6, 123:14, perhaps [27] - 13:27, 10:1, 10:24, 92:20, 39:20, 40:6, 45:25, preference [1] -124:23, 125:20, 13:28, 15:14, 17:22, 112:12 118:15 45:27, 46:4, 53:11, 125:29, 142:29, 24:29, 30:20, 34:5, police [1] - 96:19 54:4, 57:17, 64:21, preferential [1] -153:5, 153:9, 157:23 41:9, 41:11, 42:5, policing [2] - 9:7, 93:29, 94:14, 94:17 115:2 **phones** [3] - 74:4, 44:6, 54:19, 62:12, 27:19 preliminary [1] processes [2] - 10:5, 87:17, 153:11 66:6, 75:12, 94:2, policy [4] - 14:6, 145:15 81:14 pick [1] - 29:18 95:1, 95:7, 96:24, 48:3, 82:27, 150:20 preparing [1] - 66:17 produced [2] picked [3] - 13:6, 103:25, 107:24, policy/public [1] prerogative[1] -75:16, 117:3 120:11, 130:11, 29:25, 122:27 65:21 professional [4] -110:16 133:15, 142:15, picky [3] - 111:2, political [1] - 149:15 37:12, 117:27, prescribed [1] -160:4, 164:20 111:4. 111:8 139:12, 141:22 pool [1] - 121:15 133:21 period [15] - 12:10, picture [2] - 84:12, portfolio [6] - 8:21, programme [1] presence[1] -47:3, 47:9, 47:20, 84:16 8:22, 8:25, 78:18, 111:13 9.15 47:22, 48:13, 48:16, pie [1] - 118:12 progress [9] - 19:29, 78:20, 84:19 present [3] - 80:16, 74:12, 75:9, 75:11, piece [7] - 75:25, portion [1] - 84:19 111:7, 154:8 98:9, 103:23, 115:19, 75:14, 119:15, 76:22, 86:16, 86:24, 121:22, 132:3, 132:8, Portumna [4] presented [2] -141:19, 157:24, 86:26, 88:20, 88:25 37:27, 38:26, 51:24, 104:12, 104:16 136:9, 162:13 159:12 pieces [1] - 82:20 52.27 PRESIDENT [2] progressed [2] periphery [2] pint [1] - 151:23 68:15, 137:24 position [18] - 12:8, 1.13 2.3 58:18, 61:1 PLACE [1] - 4:8 24:1, 28:10, 41:26, press [1] - 152:26 progressing [2] permanently [1] place [22] - 13:2, 50:14, 50:18, 50:22, 30:8, 136:12 pressure [5] - 98:2, 12:19 13:28, 17:22, 28:28, 50:26, 53:12, 62:20, 149:26, 161:3, 161:5 promised [1] - 104:7 permission [5] -38:5, 45:20, 57:17, 79:16, 83:10, 120:10, promoted [9] - 7:3, presume [2] - 86:19,

7:12, 7:26, 8:3, 8:7, 118:10, 118:16, 119:23, 163:9 promotion [1] -118:10 prompt [1] - 66:2 prompted [1] -149:22 promptly [1] - 93:10 pronouncements [1] - 150:25 proof [2] - 10:7, 130:12 **proper** [3] - 9:7, 33:10, 36:13 properly [2] -141:23, 151:2 propose [3] - 145:7, 165:25, 165:27 proposed [1] - 7:17 proposes [1] - 141:8 propriety [1] - 57:5 prosecute [2] -130:28, 131:21 prosecution [4] -130:1, 130:7, 130:23 Prosecutions [6] -129:4, 129:10, 130:15, 130:26, 131:9, 151:18 protect [2] - 123:5, 125:28 PROTECTED[2] -1:2. 1:3 **Protected** [3] - 28:4, 50:2, 133:18 protected [13] - 8:29. 18:25, 18:28, 41:5, 60:22, 69:13, 81:12, 94:5, 124:26, 125:10, 127:6, 160:12 protection [1] -14:21 protocols [7] -44:11, 133:14, 134:18, 134:19, 134:22, 134:28, 134:29 provide [2] - 15:18, 100.8 provided [6] - 21:20, 26:7, 72:14, 72:25, 72:28, 92:15 **provider** [1] - 75:3 providing [1] - 75:3 provinces [1] - 31:20 proximate [1] - 113:9 prudent [3] - 28:19, 103:22, 142:4 précis [2] - 64:9,

81:3 Public [7] - 10:29, 129:4, 129:9, 130:14, 130:26, 131:8, 151:18 public [21] - 11:5, 11:9, 17:26, 33:15, 33:21, 33:25, 35:29, 41:27, 42:13, 43:9, 51:26, 56:4, 65:15, 80:11, 113:5, 113:9, 116:26, 124:27, 125:14, 150:25 publication [2] -136:14, 136:22 published [1] - 7:16 Pulse [16] - 34:12, 35:22, 105:10, 105:11, 105:24. 105:26, 106:7, 106:10, 106:19, 106:20, 107:1, 108:18, 109:4, 110:9, 138:3, 138:4 pulse [1] - 115:12 purpose [12] - 15:18, 30:14, 34:26, 35:5, 37:1, 37:5, 37:7, 64:7, 66:22, 76:28, 123:8, purposes [2] - 85:20, 163:12 pursue [3] - 25:3, 106:15, 136:1 pursued [6] - 32:3, 36:18, 57:24, 78:4, 110:19, 135:28 pursuing [2] -109:20, 140:18 put [30] - 7:21, 13:1, 21:14, 22:10, 26:5, 30:13, 30:22, 34:11, 36:26, 38:4, 40:3, 78:9, 86:9, 89:22, 90:8, 93:4, 96:1, 101:21, 105:24, 110:9, 117:17, 119:24, 120:26, 140:20, 151:7,

### Q

159:11, 160:27, 165:5

putting [1] - 67:16

156:11, 157:6,

quality [2] - 29:3, 29:13 QUAY [3] - 2:24, 2:31, 4:12 queries [1] - 93:28 query [3] - 62:9, 86:17, 133:19 questions [2] -147:15, 149:24 Questions [1] -147:22 quickly [1] - 39:27 QUINN [1] - 3:10 quite [9] - 18:15, 27:14, 34:2, 45:3, 143:26, 158:21, 158:22, 164:15, 165:29 quote [2] - 49:2, 49:17

## R

radio [1] - 122:27 raise [4] - 25:18, 51:18, 78:14, 116:12 raised [33] - 17:6, 19:24. 30:4. 33:19. 45:8, 45:22, 46:6, 49:23, 49:24, 56:3, 60:17, 62:9, 70:18, 86:17, 94:25, 95:4, 97:19, 99:18, 101:12, 103:14, 106:25, 110:28, 112:21, 114:4, 117:8, 128:18, 131:26, 144:4, 147:13, 150:19, 150:28 raises [2] - 16:29, 85:15 raising [4] - 113:20, 135:1, 143:19, 150:29 rang [7] - 88:11, 88:13, 88:14, 88:28, 99:8, 105:22, 112:8 rank [9] - 7:4, 7:12, 8:3, 13:15, 13:16, 78:14, 84:24, 118:11, 163:9 ranks 131 - 11:6. 22:9, 31:14 rather [4] - 12:26, 29:21, 46:7, 59:20 rationale [1] - 162:10 re [13] - 26:5, 35:18. 37:25, 53:24, 53:25, 56:4, 98:3, 112:21, 122:7, 122:12, 122:13, 123:15 re-interviewed [1] -26:5 reach [3] - 19:27, 25:4, 142:16

reached [3] - 25:22, 114:26, 121:24 read [5] - 21:11, 21:19, 28:1, 144:21, 152:16 reading [4] - 20:27, 86:11, 103:12, 104:25 reads [1] - 35:11 ready [2] - 64:29, 139.8 real [1] - 70:5 realistic [1] - 21:2 reality [1] - 150:2 really [16] - 24:8, 24:22, 24:23, 40:6, 83:29, 89:2, 93:25, 97:9, 116:11, 128:29, 139:19, 150:8, 152:8, 158:27, 161:8, 161:10 realm [1] - 121:26 reason [11] - 25:7, 28:27, 36:15, 38:11, 38:22, 40:22, 40:27, 56:27, 84:18, 154:28, 166.2 reasonable [8] -25:1, 73:2, 114:20, 114:23, 145:23, 145:25, 146:16, 165:13 reasoning [2] -102:5, 102:7 reasons [3] - 18:18, 20:1, 138:1 reassurance [1] -162:19 reassure [2] - 39:15, 162:4 reassured [2] -136:25. 138:23 receive [2] - 77:10, 87:14 received [12] - 28:1, 52:16, 53:17, 68:6, 79:9, 85:25, 98:11, 99:24, 101:21, 105:21, 145:13, 156:27 receiving [1] -156:24

recent [4] - 73:19,

90:11, 143:8, 143:18

recently [1] - 7:15

13:14, 13:19, 13:23,

16:19, 19:20, 19:24,

132:27, 133:5, 133:13

30:6, 43:2, 100:26,

recollection [6] -

45:4, 68:10, 116:10,

recipient [13] - 13:5,

117:11, 125:20, 156:24 recommend[1] -139:13 recommendation [5] - 23:12, 66:7, 82:22, 83:4, 130:28 recommendations [4] - 82:2, 83:2, 130:6, 133:24 recommended [1] -130:22 recommending [1] -91:16 recorded [2] - 40:2, recording [1] - 37:20 records [14] - 29:19, 72:29, 73:6, 73:24, 74:11, 74:12, 75:9, 75:13, 75:17, 76:8, 117:2, 120:23, 121:6, 126:4 recourse [1] - 20:19 recriminations [1] -**REDDY** [1] - 4:8 refer [4] - 51:14, 63:2, 77:16, 147:13 reference [7] - 9:28, 64:19, 66:19, 113:11, 156:18, 162:26, 163:22 references [1] -127:16 referred [6] - 126:17, 126:18, 143:20, 143:24, 144:21, 163:1 referring [3] -124:15, 126:1, 163:14 refers [2] - 53:7, 125:12 reflect [2] - 48:23, 125:20 reflected [1] - 104:6 refreshed [2] -21:21, 127:22 refusal [1] - 81:21 refused [2] - 100:6, 126:15 refusing [1] - 80:25 regard [22] - 9:21, 17:23, 36:20, 39:16, 42:6, 51:3, 51:5, 71:13, 81:3, 81:9, 87:7, 87:12, 90:19, 91:13, 100:17, 109:14, 114:14, 120:15, 138:14,

151:24, 160:17,

160:24 regarded [2] - 73:24, 73:25 regarding [13] - 50:1, 50:3, 56:13, 68:6, 73:18, 99:24, 99:28, 101:11, 103:15, 105:23, 107:1, 143:13 regardless [4] - 57:7, 104:15, 124:22, 131:3 regards [1] - 77:27 regime [1] - 6:28 Region [11] - 8:10, 8:11, 9:7, 10:16, 21:26, 22:3, 52:12, 78:17, 82:10, 106:27, 119.14 region [8] - 7:21, 9:5, 9:9, 13:7, 22:2, 22:4, 29:21, 58:22 regional [1] - 7:22 regions [3] - 7:20, 13:24, 52:12  $\textbf{registered} \, [\textbf{1}] \textbf{-} \, 73 \textbf{:} 8$ **REGISTRAR**[1] - 2:5 regular [5] - 59:5, 116:17, 140:6, 140:14, 142:28 regularly [1] - 117:1 regulation [2] -16:11, 16:13 Regulations [4] -17:8, 17:10, 46:12, 64:17 regulations [7] -14:8, 21:22, 47:12, 77:22, 82:9, 108:23, 132:29 reins [1] - 117:13 reject [5] - 93:7, 93:16, 117:21, 155:8, 159:10 related [3] - 40:4, 89:28, 143:20 relates [4] - 143:26, 145:19, 153:18, 153:21 relating [1] - 85:7 relation [140] - 9:28, 10:5, 10:15, 11:13, 12:25, 14:16, 20:5, 20:9, 20:12, 21:8, 21:21, 23:12, 24:15, 25:1, 27:19, 28:11, 28:12, 28:29, 29:2. 29:3, 29:10, 29:12, 29:15, 30:18, 30:21, 31:16, 31:19, 33:15, 33:24, 33:28, 34:2, 35:21, 36:16, 36:24,

38:13, 38:21, 40:4, 40:15, 41:9, 41:19, 42:28, 43:1, 43:15, 44:16, 45:15, 48:24, 49:15, 50:7, 54:14, 55:21, 57:4, 57:26, 60:3, 60:5, 60:13, 62:2, 63:26, 66:3, 66:7, 66:11, 69:3, 71:9, 71:15, 72:19, 75:2, 75:18, 77:26, 79:25, 80:23, 81:16, 81:24, 86:25, 87:20, 88:4, 91:25, 91:26, 93:1, 93:6, 93:26, 93:28, 94:12, 97:24, 99:15, 100:5, 104:23, 104:28, 106:3, 106:12, 106:24, 106:26, 108:5, 109:9, 109:11. 110:21. 113:3, 113:10, 114:9, 114:13, 115:8, 116:8, 117:15, 118:4. 126:12. 126:14. 130:3, 130:14, 131:12, 132:2, 134:10, 134:16, 137:13, 139:28, 140:18, 140:20, 145:12, 148:8, 148:20, 149:17, 149:19. 149:23. 150:23, 152:19, 152:21, 152:29, 153:14, 154:19, 156:28, 157:14, 158:4, 158:14, 159:5, 159:13, 160:6, 160:18, 160:22, 161.18 161.22 161:29, 162:7, 162:28 relations [1] - 65:22 relationship [2] -31:26, 74:23 relax [1] - 39:6 relevance [1] -135:17 relevant [7] - 15:15, 65:20, 85:29, 92:1, 92:21, 96:6, 147:21 relies [1] - 36:20 reluctant [3] - 51:25, 52:3, 57:15 remain [3] - 25:17, 63:10, 104:5 remained [1] - 42:15

remains [5] - 46:21,

47:9, 108:5, 111:16,

131:18

remarks [1] - 12:24 remedied [4] - 43:21, 113:22, 124:3 remit [1] - 110:4 remove [2] - 11:17, 31.14 renders [1] - 46:19 renewed [1] - 92:18 repeat [1] - 59:29 replace [1] - 117:19 replacement [1] -153:9 reply [2] - 66:2, 98:4 report [54] - 6:29, 14:12, 14:18, 14:28, 15:11, 16:18, 19:25, 19:27, 19:29, 34:3, 41:21, 42:19, 48:1, 50:15, 68:23, 68:28, 78:9, 78:15, 85:4, 85:21, 85:23, 93:23, 99:24, 101:1, 103:12, 103:20, 107:10, 107:18, 107:22, 122:26, 129:3, 129:6, 129:8, 129:9, 129:15, 131:7, 132:8, 132:28, 136:18, 137:4, 137:12, 138:27, 141:1, 142:14, 142:16, 145:15, 146:3, 146:4, 146:9, 146:21, 147:2, 148:1, 148:2, 148:19 report.. [1] - 108:16 reported [4] - 71:10, 124:6, 142:9, 159:13 reporter [54] - 13:12, 16:10, 17:19, 17:27, 18:24, 19:5, 28:20, 38:7, 42:8, 43:10, 43:12, 52:28, 54:29, 62:18, 62:27, 63:1, 72:5, 73:2, 93:9, 94:21, 98:27, 99:2, 99:7, 101:7, 101:9, 102:10, 105:21, 106:16, 108:21, 113:17, 113:19, 123:5, 126:2, 128:1, 129:21, 133:10, 137:22, 137:26, 138:8, 138:16, 138:23, 141:6, 142:22, 142:28, 143:4, 143:9, 143:15, 143:17, 144:4, 144:7, 144:13, 146:1, 146:16, 159:29 reporter's [3] -

110:14, 143:2, 152:25 reporters [1] - 17:5 reporting [7] - 14:8, 17:16. 39:17. 43:7. 45:16, 107:16, 140:20 reports [6] - 72:17, 108:25, 115:26, 144:24, 147:6, 154:21 representative[1] -124:27 reprisal [1] - 15:22 reputation [1] -52:13 request [9] - 20:5, 30:14. 63:29. 64:7. 74:24, 80:27, 134:4, 149:22, 149:24 requested [3] - 76:4, 90:20, 99:28 requests [1] - 135:14 require [1] - 103:15 required [11] - 10:6, 47:6, 67:17, 88:8, 91:1, 114:1, 129:29, 130:12, 141:21, 143:4, 162:18 requires [5] - 45:24, 63:9, 80:16, 132:10, 147.2 requisite [1] - 9:18 reside [1] - 54:12 resided [1] - 22:7 resign [1] - 47:8 resignation [1] -47:10 RESOLUTIONS [1] resonated [1] - 18:8 Resource [2] -79:11, 133:16 resources [2] -141:20, 141:21 RESOURCES [1] -3:15 Resources [2] -55:21. 73:17 respect [8] - 82:8, 90:19, 107:29, 108:26, 136:27, 138:26, 158:28, 159:26 respected [3] -94:18, 115:14, 116:24 respond [2] - 72:27, 151:26 response [13] - 41:3, 55:19. 55:21. 62:9.

63:18, 63:20, 69:3,

86:12, 148:6, 148:7

77:9, 81:29, 82:5,

responsibilities [3] -9:25, 11:19, 106:11 responsibility [12] -8:28, 9:3, 9:11, 11:18, 39:18, 42:7, 42:10, 42:14, 42:21, 110:6, 116:24, 117:1 responsible [5] -22:2, 33:22, 43:24, 78:10, 138:20 rest [2] - 56:20, 104:22 result [3] - 17:3, 17:26. 76:3 **RESUMED** [2] - 6:1, 95.22 retain [1] - 75:14 retained [1] - 68:20 retire [3] - 11:2, 47:8, 119.21 retired [4] - 12:14, 12:20, 84:14, 150:17 **RETIRED** [7] - 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, 3:12, 3:13 retirement [1] -47.10 retribution [2] - 17:3, 17:21 retrieve [2] - 157:22, 157:25 retrieved [1] - 74:27 return [5] - 10:19, 16:16, 71:6, 72:18, 105:8 returned [2] - 12:13, 147.19 returning [1] - 8:5 reveal [1] - 125:11 review [4] - 46:24, 91:2, 114:8, 130:15 reviewed [1] - 93:23 revised [1] - 17:9 revisited [2] - 73:20, 120:20 **Rice** [1] - 14:2 **rid** [1] - 42:14 right-hand [1] -30:23 rightly [1] - 60:18 rights [1] - 94:18 rigour [1] - 23:26 ringing [3] - 36:6, 37:2, 59:20 rings [2] - 96:15, ripple [1] - 136:5 ripples [1] - 121:17 rise [3] - 10:29, 24:26, 128:15

risk [7] - 17:1, 65:14, 65:15, 65:22, 80:10, 114:6, 125:24 **ROAD**[1] - 2:18 road [2] - 24:10, 139:7 role [14] - 12:4, 12:15, 12:19, 13:13, 13:21, 13:22, 47:13, 62:28, 78:6, 90:4, 117:19, 119:9, 132:17, 133:27 **roll** [1] - 31:1 rolled [2] - 96:29,97:3 room [3] - 59:4, 59:12, 142:15 rooms [1] - 58:19 root [1] - 10:4 rough [1] - 164:21 rounding [1] - 97:11 rude [1] - 165:8 rules [2] - 50:23, 159:26 running [3] - 9:5, 9:26, 57:26 RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 Ryan [1] - 85:25

## S

sabotage [1] - 159:9 sacs [1] - 58:2 **safe** [3] - 38:10. 113:5, 113:6 safety [2] - 14:21, same/proximate [1] - 112:22 **SANDRA**[1] - 4:6 sat [2] - 36:13, 161:28 satisfaction [1] -144:8 satisfactorily [1] -153:20 satisfied [4] - 99:9, 104:11, 105:6, 130:29 **Saturday** [1] - 38:20 **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 **saw** [4] - 39:17, 73:26, 156:17, 156:18 **SC** [11] - 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:6, 4:7 **SCANLAN**[1] - 3:8 scenario [1] - 59:28 scenarios [1] - 39:3

school [1] - 7:8 screen [13] - 19:11, 29:29, 30:23, 46:16, 71:28, 77:13, 79:9, 85:13, 92:23, 96:2, 106:28, 121:29, 151:16 scribbled [1] -163:20 scroll [29] - 6:20, 14:3, 15:7, 31:2, 32:18, 53:22, 62:7, 62:15, 67:25, 70:13, 77:13, 79:23, 79:26, 80:11, 80:13, 87:8, 96:2, 96:3, 96:4, 96:5, 96:25, 97:7, 108:12,

80:11, 80:13, 87:8, 96:2, 96:3, 96:4, 96:5, 96:25, 97:7, 108:12, 125:3, 129:6, 129:7, 129:16, 131:13 scupper [1] - 119:24 SEAN [4] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:22, 3:17 SEANAD [1] - 1:5 search [4] - 24:29.

SEANAD [1] - 1:5 search [4] - 24:29, 87:20, 89:26, 131:10 searched [1] -152:23 searches [3] - 61:22

**searches** [3] - 61:22, 87:17, 90:11

searching [1] - 93:25 second [11] - 18:18, 26:9, 108:12, 112:5, 114:27, 132:12, 138:19, 142:24, 152:5, 153:2, 163:18 secondary [4] -65:19, 66:15, 83:14, 91:11

secondly [1] - 159:7 secretary [4] - 77:11, 108:11, 146:28, 148:3 section [7] - 7:4, 46:14, 78:18, 88:8, 108:20, 133:21, 135:2 sections [2] - 15:15,

92:2

Security [1] - 135:15

see [46] - 15:5, 15:7,
15:16, 15:29, 18:21,
28:13, 29:7, 31:4,
31:9, 32:19, 46:16,
48:11, 53:9, 54:16,
62:12, 62:16, 63:6,
64:20, 65:11, 66:13,
67:10, 68:24, 70:14,
81:29, 83:7, 87:27,
87:28, 87:29, 88:27,
89:13, 89:15, 89:16,
90:23, 99:20, 107:5,

107:6, 112:16,

113:16, 114:15,
121:17, 123:29,
126:7, 127:26, 146:7,
148:1, 154:8
seeing [1] - 57:16
seek [4] - 25:19,
79:25, 147:24, 157:8
seeking [8] - 26:24,
50:9, 50:10, 63:13,
73:13, 80:19, 80:24,

148:17 **seem** [6] - 44:3, 69:12, 94:24, 127:24, 130:9, 158:14 **seized** [9] - 74:6, 89:25, 90:10, 131:17, 135:7, 140:25, 153:5,

153:8, 157:23 **semblance** [1] -152:15 **send** [2] - 53:18,

80:25

**sending** [2] - 83:16, 98:1

**senior** [5] - 21:29, 22:1, 118:6, 137:29, 150:26 **sense** [7] - 32:8,

102:18, 102:26, 102:29, 104:29, 161:25, 162:5 **sent** [26] - 49:26, 50:2, 51:8, 51:14, 54:9, 74:27, 78:15, 80:24, 80:27, 80:29, 82:24, 85:4, 86:12,

82:24, 85:4, 86:12, 86:20, 91:12, 102:21, 122:12, 129:9, 131:7, 132:27, 134:13, 139:28, 147:28, 148:1, 148:2, 156:22

separate [4] - 69:16, 121:1, 121:2, 137:27 separated [1] - 27:8 separately [1] -

121:3 **September** [11] - 12:8, 12:13, 55:20, 63:20, 67:7, 67:28, 71:11, 80:28, 113:12,

127:25, 146:5

**Sergeant** [13] - 29:7, 29:8, 29:9, 34:4, 60:4, 60:14, 71:9, 76:2, 76:19, 100:1, 100:11, 146:4

**sergeant** [2] - 7:4, 34:4

**SERGEANT** [5] - 3:12, 3:20, 4:5, 4:6,

4:6

sergeants [2] 29:12, 153:10

serious [23] - 21:12,
21:13, 22:3, 27:17,
32:27, 39:13, 49:6,
51:3, 55:8, 63:10,
63:23, 64:10, 64:11,
70:2, 70:4, 72:6,
80:16, 83:24, 85:8,
96:18, 107:11, 151:23

seriously [2] - 21:25,
162:23

seriousness [6] -21:15, 65:14, 68:22, 70:1, 80:9, 152:17 served [6] - 31:20, 31:23, 31:29, 85:7, 119:17

Service [1] - 17:10 service [7] - 7:8, 17:9, 65:22, 75:3, 119:16, 139:12, 139:13 services [5] - 43:29,

**services** [5] - 43:29 137:1, 139:1, 143:3, 143:6 **Services** [1] - 1:24

**SERVICES** [1] - 1:29

serving [3] - 72:9, 107:26, 141:9 session [1] - 40:7 set [18] - 6:15, 20:3, 21:13, 21:16, 22:5, 58:17, 63:4, 66:26, 74:10, 79:24, 82:17, 83:13, 120:3, 131:18, 131:25, 134:21, 148:26, 160:2 sets [1] - 48:22

21:23 seven [2] - 38:4, 85:7 shall [1] - 46:24 SHANE [1] - 3:23 SHANKEY [1] - 3:21 SHANKEY-SMITH

setting [2] - 19:29,

[1] - 3:21 **SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 **shape** [2] - 40:3, 105:4 **share** [2] - 8:22, 54:10

**shared** [2] - 42:26, 92:25 **SHEAHAN** [1] - 3:18 **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25

**shift** [9] - 110:25, 111:3, 111:9, 111:11, 111:20, 112:24,

112:25, 158:19, 158:22 shifted [1] - 116:26 shifts [5] - 111:4, 111:18, 112:7, 112:10, 112:22 SHIP [1] - 3:28 short [4] - 8:4, 54:15, 55:2, 129:29 short-term [2] -54:15, 55:2 shorter [1] - 46:25 shortly [7] - 12:13, 45:3, 48:27, 55:25,

short-term [2] 54:15, 55:2
shorter [1] - 46:25
shortly [7] - 12:13,
45:3, 48:27, 55:25,
88:1, 98:11, 160:12
shout [1] - 15:29
showed [4] - 73:6,
98:20, 131:24, 137:25
shown [1] - 157:3
shows [2] - 117:3,

side [10] - 9:16, 24:25, 26:21, 30:23, 30:24, 44:8, 88:24, 104:14, 134:5, 134:7 sign [1] - 113:29 significant [3] -

136:9

**significant** [3] - 73:25, 73:26, 85:2 **similarities** [1] - 108:20

simple [1] - 102:7 simply [2] - 20:4, 102:2 sims [1] - 87:17

single [3] - 39:22, 58:1, 121:20 sinister [1] - 97:2 SINÉAD [1] - 4:7 SINÉAD [1] - 2:7

SIO [1] - 58:12 sit [5] - 33:10, 37:12, 39:3, 120:29, 165:27 situation [6] - 38:6,

39:7, 87:11, 94:3, 104:5, 134:17 **situations** [1] -133:15

six [5] - 7:20, 38:27, 75:14, 155:20, 164:13 skullduggery [1] -160:18

slice [1] - 12:1 Sligo [1] - 8:4 small [1] - 141:14 SMITH [1] - 3:21

**SMITHFIELD** [2] - 2:24, 4:12 **so-called** [1] - 83:26 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2

SOLICITOR'S [1] -

3:27 SOLICITORS [6] -2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, 4:8, 4:11 someone [8] - 20:29, 22:9, 23:8, 64:29, 84:23, 90:3, 100:13, 148:13 sometime [2] -13:10, 55:19 sometimes [1] -61:13 somewhat [3] -12:22, 113:6, 130:13 somewhere [2] -119:2, 119:4 soon [1] - 74:21 sorry [31] - 24:4, 27:9, 27:25, 31:3, 62:7, 67:17, 76:17, 77:7, 82:16, 87:24, 96:2, 96:5, 105:8, 107:5, 111:8, 111:16, 111:26, 111:27, 112:11, 129:11, 132:18, 148:2, 149:2, 149:4, 149:6, 149:7, 149:28, 150:4, 158:27, 162:26, 165:8 sort [8] - 26:24, 42:26, 57:6, 94:2, 94:23, 95:7, 120:25, 151:3 sought [13] - 26:22, 48:19, 50:6, 61:29, 64:12, 66:11, 73:16, 74:13, 75:16, 75:27, 77:3, 92:12, 118:4 source [2] - 76:22, 156:27 **Sources** [1] - 106:13 sources [1] - 110:7 Southern [1] - 8:10 space [1] - 82:27 specific [6] - 44:11, 46:8, 69:5, 149:22, 149:23. 161:29 specifics [1] - 19:10 speeds [1] - 165:1 spend [3] - 10:17, 10:19, 164:13 **spent** [6] - 7:2, 7:11, 7:27, 8:4, 10:13, 91:29 **spin** [1] - 96:20 spoken [4] - 89:19, 105:13, 107:28, 138.18 spread [1] - 29:20 staff [3] - 6:28,

14:27, 42:3 stage [47] - 18:9, 22:1, 23:4, 27:26, 28:10, 32:13, 33:14, 33:17, 36:17, 38:8, 39:19, 40:15, 40:16, 41:8, 41:16, 44:13, 45:14, 45:29, 50:14, 50:18, 53:9, 55:13, 55:16, 60:16, 68:12, 74:1, 84:14, 86:18, 88:27, 89:3, 90:2, 92:16, 96:12, 112:19, 117:24, 118:11, 119:9, 120:26, 120:27, 121:28, 135:5, 139:4, 139:7, 140:23, 141:26, 144:28, 163:9 stages [7] - 33:4, 41:22, 41:29, 46:5, 116:23, 120:11, 142:3 stamp [1] - 24:23 stand [4] - 15:28, 18:21, 23:26, 139:15 standard [4] - 91:2, 93:28, 130:12, 141:22 standards [1] - 18:22 start [8] - 23:21, 26:10, 39:4, 60:26, 97:5, 120:29, 121:4, 152:27 started [6] - 40:1, 40:7, 102:8, 112:6, 142:14, 142:15 starting [1] - 142:16 starts [1] - 27:1 state [7] - 37:20, 112:18, 140:22, 153:5, 153:9, 153:11, 157:23 STATE[1] - 3:27 statement [60] -23:16, 25:29, 30:18, 33:11, 38:10, 38:24, 39:28. 40:4. 40:10. 49:1, 58:5, 58:6, 59:8, 60:10, 60:14, 60:29, 61:2, 63:25, 64:5, 64:9, 64:12, 66:13, 66:17, 66:18, 67:19, 67:24, 74:11, 76:2, 76:5, 80:24, 80:25, 80:26, 80:29, 81:10, 91:28. 92:12. 99:11. 99:28, 100:3, 100:5,

100:6, 100:8, 100:15,

105:18, 106:8, 107:3,

107:14, 107:19,

108:21, 109:26,

112:17, 117:12, 120:7, 126:19, 126:25, 127:5, 127:17, 149:29, 152.22 statements [18] -25:26, 26:6, 61:12, 61:19. 62:29. 72:15. 98:1, 116:3, 135:5, 136:11, 153:27, 154:9, 154:12, 154:17, 154:20, 154:26, 157:8, 160:23 states [1] - 136:11 station [21] - 6:21, 22:7, 38:26, 44:5, 49:11. 53:3. 56:9. 56:28, 58:4, 61:2, 61:23, 62:20, 70:18, 94:26, 111:7, 111:13, 111:22, 113:1, 113:26, 154:7, 158:19 Station [16] - 34:22, 34:25, 57:6, 57:11, 57:21, 58:16, 61:19, 61:27, 68:8, 72:11, 117:14, 117:18, 135:9, 152:3, 153:28, 160:20 stations [2] - 119:5, 155:4 status [7] - 65:6, 79:24, 80:2, 82:13, 85:15, 86:18, 90:20 **statutory** [3] - 28:5, 95:12, 125:27 stayed [1] - 42:15 stenographic [1] -1:26 stenography [1] -1.24 STENOGRAPHY[1] - 1:29 Stephanie [1] - 160:7 STEPHANIE[1] -STEPHEN [1] - 2:21 steps [1] - 16:9 still [16] - 11:19, 30:13, 34:24, 43:6, 45:19, 45:20, 62:19, 75:22, 103:4, 107:12, 121:23, 125:27, 132:21, 134:28, 155:22 stone [1] - 121:15 stood [2] - 71:15, 100:29 stools [1] - 89:4

stopped [1] - 158:8 storage [1] - 113:25 store [1] - 61:23 storeroom [2] -152:3, 152:19 story [2] - 37:8, 50:24 strategic [1] - 9:12 Strategy [1] - 7:16 strategy [3] - 8:21, 12:6. 132:16 **STREET**[3] - 2:12, 3:28, 4:3 strength [5] - 65:13, 68:16, 68:21, 70:5, 8:08 stress [1] - 143:20 stretch [1] - 160:4 strict [2] - 16:10, 57:25 strong [1] - 152:4 structure [1] -125:17 studied [4] - 20:17, 21:20, 27:14, 98:19 **sub**[1] - 113:2 **sub-issue** [1] - 113:2 subject [8] - 12:24, 34:18. 97:12. 136:26. 158:24, 159:2, 160:13, 165:24 subject-matter [3] -12:24, 34:18, 160:13 subjected [1] - 41:2 submissions [1] -93:26 submit [1] - 141:3 submitted 181 -19:29, 92:18, 93:27, 131:6, 136:19, 137:11, 147:6, 147:7 subsequent [2] -147:19, 151:27 subsequently [1] -109.8 substance [2] -129:22, 130:11 substantial [2] -27:19. 129:28 substantially [1] -110:23 substantiate [2] -120:1, 131:4 successful [5] - 7:9, 12:5, 21:6, 152:27,

sudden [1] - 162:13

**suffering** [1] - 17:2

85:21, 124:28

sufficient [3] - 50:16,

suggest [3] - 36:29, 76:29, 103:1 suggested [5] - 34:4, 98:28, 149:25, 163:17, 163:28 **suggesting** [1] - 66:6 suggestion [13] -31:15, 36:17, 38:3, 93:2, 93:14, 113:23, 117:16, 119:24, 149:28, 149:29, 155:6, 159:8 **suit** [2] - 118:23, 119:6 **suitable** [1] - 100:3 suited [1] - 119:3 summary [4] - 62:29, 72:26, 115:2, 145:29 summer [1] - 12:11 super [2] - 118:12. 122:22 superintendent [53] - 7:26, 8:2, 8:3, 8:6, 13:15, 13:16, 21:28, 29:18, 33:20, 44:6, 47:16, 47:19, 47:28, 59:26, 68:5, 68:6, 68:18, 76:4, 78:12, 78:13, 82:26, 85:24, 88:29, 89:9, 89:10, 92:10, 97:29, 98:19, 98:21, 101:7, 101:11, 101:16, 103:26, 105:23, 106:5, 106:12, 110:6, 110:29, 112:22, 117:4. 117:19. 121:24, 123:19, 124:7, 126:17, 126:18, 128:2, 133:11, 146:5, 156:3, 162:28, 163:8, 163:9 Superintendent [130] - 28:23, 28:25, 29:6, 31:16, 38:29, 39:24, 40:8, 42:22, 42:27, 44:21, 45:9, 49:25, 49:29, 51:15, 51:19, 52:27, 55:28, 58:13, 66:12, 67:23, 67:29, 68:1, 70:12, 70:24, 71:3, 71:7, 74:24, 77:10, 81:18, 83:26, 85:4, 85:5, 85:11, 85:23, 85:28, 86:5, 87:15, 88:10, 89:16, 89:20, 90:13, 90:16, 90:29, 91:14, 96:9, 97:23, 98:12, 98:16,

98:17, 98:20, 98:25,

stop [1] - 112:5

98:29, 99:13, 99:14, 29:25, 29:27, 33:23, 117:29 89:7, 90:3, 91:11, text [6] - 75:21, 99:18, 99:19, 101:3, supports [1] -91:16, 91:26, 92:17, 33:28, 36:27, 43:6, 75:22, 105:21, 101:20, 101:26, 122:14 92:27, 94:7, 95:4, 43:16, 44:2, 44:4, 156:29, 157:22, 103:8, 103:9, 105:18, 120:19, 153:21 52:3, 54:21, 55:5, **suppose** [29] - 9:6, 157:23 107:7, 107:27, 9:25, 10:7, 10:8, suspensions [4] -58:21, 59:6, 60:15, texts [1] - 75:21 108:10, 108:25, 47:26, 49:21, 50:27, 61:24, 66:16, 72:13, 10:22, 15:24, 17:21, thanked [1] - 144:7 112:4, 113:11, 22:6, 26:18, 27:22, 64.20 72:28, 73:23, 75:16, THE [11] - 1:3, 1:7, 113:16, 114:5, 76:3, 76:21, 76:29, suspicion [7] - 25:2, 34:20, 50:25, 60:20, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 114:25, 115:4, 73:2, 114:20, 114:23, 78:8, 80:17, 91:8, 60:24, 64:8, 75:26, 6:1, 6:13, 95:22, 116:16, 116:17, 93:24, 104:10, 145:23, 145:25, 91:9, 92:15, 92:28, 166:6, 166:9 117:13, 117:16, 104:11, 106:6, 146:17 95:15, 101:25, themselves [7] -107:12, 107:20, 117:19, 117:21, 109:26, 115:25, suspicions [1] -44:10, 59:24, 78:12, 119:1, 120:26, 122:1, 107:23, 112:23, 123:3, 134:16, 129:24 83:6, 114:22, 118:24, 122:20, 123:16, 114:17, 114:24, 134:28, 139:15, **suspicious** [2] - 73:7 140:15 123:28, 124:7, 159:5, 161:8, 165:26 116:29, 117:28, sworn [2] - 15:10, THEN [2] - 95:22, 124:10, 124:11, 118:6, 120:15, supposed [1] -166.9 124:14, 127:13, 121:19, 125:23, 125:10 SWORN [1] - 6:10 therefore [8] - 46:1, 127:15, 127:20, 125:24, 125:25, suppress [1] sympathetic [1] -51:1, 58:28, 60:12, 127:28, 128:9, 126:22, 128:19, 154:11 150.12 66:19, 116:1, 118:12, 131:28, 135:12, 128:11, 132:5, suppressing [1] system [7] - 9:29, 128:1 132:15, 137:11, 135:29, 139:17, 154:26 20:19, 43:20, 105:29, therein [1] - 63:23 137:17, 139:25, 140:14, 140:16, surprised [1] -109:4, 110:9, 138:4 thinking [2] - 102:28, 139:29, 142:27, 141:2, 141:8, 145:3, 138:17 systems [1] - 9:22 103:3 145:7, 152:14, 143:1, 143:9, 143:11, surrounding [4] -**SÍOCHÁNA** [1] - 3:2 third [5] - 14:3, 143:16, 143:18, 152:15. 154:7. 21:22, 72:6, 129:26, 51:20, 107:14. Séan [1] - 90:13 154:22, 154:27, 143:23, 143:29, 145.15 Síochána [40] - 6:16, 137:20, 144:28 144:2, 144:3, 144:7, 155:15, 155:21, suspect [10] - 14:12, 9:13, 10:10, 10:23, this.. [1] - 42:4 144:13, 144:14, 156:1, 157:21, 153:4, 153:8, 154:6, 11:6, 11:15, 12:25, thorough [3] - 19:23, 145:13, 145:18, 159:25, 160:3, 162:2 155:21, 156:6, 156:9, 13:1, 14:1, 14:7, 93:25, 165:21 148:3, 152:20, teams [1] - 58:14 156:12, 157:11, 158:8 14:12, 14:14, 15:20, thoroughly [1] -152:23, 155:26, Technical [1] - 6:25 suspend [10] - 47:2, 16:28, 17:8, 19:20, 141:24 156:19, 156:23, tedious [1] - 112:8 48:13, 50:18, 54:6, 23:2, 31:14, 44:1, threat [1] - 70:27 156:24, 156:27, 54:13, 68:19, 71:24, telephone [4] -46:12, 46:20, 48:4, three [9] - 8:29, 15:7, 157:29, 162:16, 72:29, 135:15, 81:26, 81:27, 93:3 52:9, 62:28, 64:2, 15:16, 20:13, 40:9, 163:1, 163:29 145:20. 156:29 suspended [13] -64:3, 64:16, 82:8, 46:25, 107:2, 126:15, SUPERINTENDENT telephones [1] -44:29, 46:21, 47:6, 106:25, 109:10, 148:29 [15] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, 153:1 47:9, 48:15, 49:8, 122:10, 132:29, threshold [3] - 25:5, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, **TEMPLE**[1] - 2:31 51:7, 54:1, 56:4, 86:8, 137:5, 137:6, 141:10, 25:22, 26:15 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, Templemore [1] -86:9, 91:19 143:6, 145:9, 149:1, throughout [2] -3:19. 3:19. 3:21 suspending [5] -153:10, 154:10 31:27, 42:16 superintendent's [2] ten [4] - 47:3, 47:20, 47:1, 47:13, 63:8, throw [1] - 121:15 - 58:25. 58:28 48:14, 48:16 80:15. 86:22 Т thrust [3] - 17:16, superintendents [1] tended [3] - 142:11, suspension [62] -58:11, 124:22 - 29:26 44:23, 44:28, 45:22, 162:16, 162:17 thrusts [1] - 41:1 T&N [1] - 4:2 superiors [1] -46:2, 46:11, 46:22, tensions [1] - 155:5 Thursday [3] - 10:18, table [1] - 11:25 160:14 tenure [1] - 117:25 46:24, 46:28, 47:4, 22:12. 125:4 tangible [1] - 152:4 supervisor [1] -47:24, 48:4, 48:9, term [5] - 47:24, THURSDAY [2] -105:28 **TARA**[1] - 3:22 48:15, 50:1, 50:3, 48:9, 54:15, 55:2 1:18, 6:1 targeted [1] - 150:5 supervisors [1] -50:7, 50:10, 50:17, termination/ timeframe [3] - 46:8, 43:25 targeting [3] - 17:22, 50:21, 50:24, 51:24, conclusion [1] -115:21, 116:19 49:5, 93:4 supplied [2] -53:1, 53:4, 53:15, 138:12 timeline [1] - 147:4 tasked [1] - 149:20 136:29, 138:18 54:15, 54:17, 55:16, terms [11] - 20:4, tipping [2] - 129:27, support [10] - 44:10, tax [6] - 122:14. 56:13, 56:26, 64:4, 24:5, 45:3, 71:17, 145:24 50:21, 57:18, 91:4, 122:17, 123:23, 64:27, 65:8, 65:13, 77:29, 80:23, 94:1, title [2] - 132:17, 120:9, 124:28, 125:2, 66:27, 68:2, 68:4, 124:20, 143:19, 110.24 127.7 132:21 125:17, 139:16, 68:12, 69:4, 69:24, 158:10 127:12, 134:24 today's [2] - 143:10, 139:19 **TD**[1] - 143:12 69:28, 71:16, 73:18, test [2] - 10:1, 24:23 144.6 supported [3] -77:27, 81:22, 81:23, team [77] - 21:14, testimony [1] together [8] - 21:14, 44:15, 123:7, 159:16 86:13, 87:5, 88:5, 21:23, 22:11, 28:21, 114:26 21:23, 59:23, 97:3, supporting [1] -28:29, 29:17, 29:18, 88:23, 88:27, 89:2, tetra [1] - 135:16 111:15, 111:21,

112:29, 142:18 Tom [2] - 29:9, 100:3 **TOM** [3] - 3:12, 4:10 tomorrow [2] -164:16, 165:11 Tony [1] - 49:29 took [22] - 8:28, 9:11, 10:7, 12:19, 13:22, 28:1, 40:6, 40:10, 57:29, 60:5, 61:6, 61:9, 68:2, 73:5, 95:1, 102:6, 104:6, 113:4, 124:2, 152:1, 166:2 **top** [1] - 116:21 totally [1] - 38:21 touch [1] - 165:20 towards [2] - 62:15, TOWNPARKS[1] -2:12 training [1] - 6:28 traipse [1] - 165:17 traipsed [1] - 165:18 transcript [2] - 1:25, 96:24 transfer [6] - 118:2, 118:14 118:24 118:29, 119:1, 119:20 transferred [9] -6:25, 7:5, 7:6, 7:13, 7:17. 7:22. 8:10. 118:18, 119:18 transmitted [1] -16:18 travel [1] - 10:17 travelled [1] - 52:27 travelling [1] - 58:21 TREACY [1] - 2:27 Treacy[1] - 160:7 treated [7] - 41:9, 136:27, 138:26, 150:5, 150:14, 150:24, 152:12 treatment [2] -115:2, 150:3 trial [1] - 130:13 **Tribunal** [12] - 23:15, 34:14, 44:22, 49:1, 67:22, 79:14, 82:19, 96:27, 105:19, 117:3, 128:15, 151:28 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, **TRIBUNALS**[1] - 1:8 tried [2] - 33:12, 159:8 trust [1] - 155:20 truth [1] - 150:15

try [5] - 29:20, 56:9,

56:24, 98:1, 115:16

trying [5] - 23:6, 24:23, 94:19, 115:17, 122:28 Tuesday [1] - 10:17 turn [8] - 15:3, 24:4, 24:5, 48:6, 63:5, 63:18, 139:22, 148:15 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turns [1] - 121:18 twice [1] - 150:27 two [25] - 7:27, 8:16, 15:24, 17:17, 29:14, 38:17, 45:13, 59:22, 69:16, 75:9, 75:10, 88:17, 96:5, 97:2, 101:23, 102:12, 104:24, 116:8, 125:15, 138:5, 144:24, 145:4, 147:26, 157:22, 160:22 Twomey [3] - 8:27, 85:20, 119:10 type [3] - 69:2.

# U

ultimate [1] - 124:25

101:24, 113:19

ultimately [3] - 76:1, 119:26, 130:3 uncovered [3] -114:19, 122:20, 129:24 UNDER [2] - 1:2, 1:8 under [28] - 6:28, 7:15, 13:14, 15:15, 16:24, 17:1, 18:15, 39:16, 42:7, 46:11, 46:14, 47:12, 64:23, 65:9, 70:27, 77:22, 91:2, 98:2, 107:13, 108:23, 114:8, 132:29, 133:21, 145:16, 149:26, 156:11, 157:7, 158:23 undermine [1] understandable [1] -102.19 understood [3] -21:2, 53:9, 61:11 undertaken [1] -93:29 undertook [1] -100:6 unease [1] - 154:19 unfair [2] - 12:1,

128:23

uniform [2] - 89:22, 90:8 unique [3] - 50:14, 50:25. 81:12 unit [8] - 7:17, 7:19, 34:5, 34:7, 49:21, 62:22, 72:10, 142:7 units [1] - 111:29 unless [4] - 26:11, 56:3, 132:9, 165:26 unlike [2] - 52:11, 153:7 unnecessary [1] -161.5 unofficial [1] - 152:3 unregistered [2] -156:7, 156:8 unsubstantiated [1] - 107:21 **UNTIL** [1] - 166:9 unusual [4] - 11:23, 20:17, 64:7, 157:10 up [64] - 6:18, 8:28, 12:16, 15:28, 18:21, 19:6, 19:11, 23:26, 25:2, 25:24, 29:29, 30:22, 32:18, 46:15, 57:27, 58:17, 59:20, 62:7, 67:25, 68:26, 71:3, 71:28, 72:17, 73:23, 77:13, 78:14, 79:8, 82:24, 83:16, 85:13, 88:4, 92:23, 96:2, 96:4, 96:5, 97:11, 106:28, 110:10, 110:27, 115:21, 117:13, 117:18, 117:28, 118:17, 119:21, 121:11, 121:12, 121:14, 121:18, 121:29, 122:27, 123:7, 124:4, 129:7, 132:16, 135:28, 137:9, 139:4, 140:11. 140:20, 150:17, 151:15, 159:5, 165:1 up-to-date [1] - 88:4 update [12] - 132:6, 132:11, 135:4, 136:7, 136:8, 136:29, 140:2, 140:4, 140:16, 142:20, 144:19, 144:24 updated [4] - 82:11,

unfolding [1] - 160:4

unfound [1] - 151:11

updating [1] - 150:20 upshot [1] - 116:7 urgency [2] - 37:9, 38:11 useful [1] - 74:4 utmost [2] - 93:8, 152:13

## V

vacancies [2] - 8:16, 119:21 vacancy [4] - 7:8, 8:24, 118:16, 118:29 vacant [1] - 58:19 value [1] - 75:20 variety [1] - 128:27 various [4] - 58:22, 72:17, 106:24, 120:11 ventilated [1] - 154:3 veracity [2] - 63:12, 80:18 verbatim [1] - 1:25 vexatious [2] -16:21, 27:29 victimisation [2] -15:22, 17:5 view [38] - 18:11, 25:26, 26:23, 30:8, 39:5, 40:3, 42:1, 44:15, 48:23, 61:17, 63:29, 68:21, 71:23, 73:5, 81:2, 81:6, 90:9, 92:15, 98:22, 98:24, 100:11, 102:5, 102:13, 104:23, 104:29, 105:3, 106:3, 106:14, 108:2, 108:5, 113:6, 114:13, 117:27, 130:3, 141:9, 145:8, 153:20, 159:6 viewed [2] - 12:26, 21.24 views [9] - 48:19, 60:1, 60:3, 63:13, 79:25, 80:19, 94:12, 133:23. 134:9 visit [3] - 61:26, 68:7, visited [1] - 19:5 vital [4] - 152:6, 153:7, 155:14, 157:24 voluntarily [1] -139:8 volunteer [1] - 52:2 volunteered [1] -

## W

wait [1] - 36:12 walked [1] - 35:29 wall [1] - 159:21 Wallace [8] - 117:9, 122:7, 123:13, 138:18, 142:23, 143:12, 147:13, 147:25 Walsh [7] - 6:29, 77:11, 108:10, 132:5, 132:15, 139:25, 148:3 Walter [1] - 14:2 wants [1] - 164:24 Ward [1] - 90:13 warranted [3] -53:15, 68:12, 71:24 **WAS**[1] - 6:10 was.. [1] - 42:24 waters [2] - 29:9, 149.3 Waters [1] - 147:10 ways [1] - 41:28 weakness [1] - 43:20 Wednesday [2] -10:18, 122:4 week [6] - 18:7, 20:16, 97:3, 97:4, 145:5, 152:5 week's [1] - 165:14 weekend [1] - 38:21 weekly [1] - 128:3 weeks [1] - 107:2 welfare [36] - 39:18, 40:15, 42:1, 42:8, 42:16, 42:21, 42:28, 43:1, 43:15, 43:23, 43:24, 43:28, 44:10, 44:15, 59:16, 113:18, 116:18, 116:22, 116:26, 117:5, 122:14, 123:2, 123:6, 123:15, 123:26, 124:3, 124:26, 137:13, 139:19, 142:21, 143:2, 143:6, 144:15, 144:27, 149:18, 159:15 WELLINGTON [1] west [2] - 7:5, 119:17 Western [7] - 8:11. 9:7, 10:16, 21:26, 22:3, 52:12, 119:14 western [1] - 7:22 Westmeath [1] -103:26

WESTMEATH[1] -

88:14, 132:2, 147:2

149:8

updates [2] - 137:5,

37:22

52:10

volunteering[1] -

4:4 whatsoever [1] -20:20, 57:10 92:13 **WHEATLEY** [1] - 3:4 Wheatley [4] - 85:5, Υ 86:5, 90:16, 91:15 whilst [1] - 108:26 whistleblower [3] -122:7, 125:16, 138:20 whistleblowers [9] -12:26, 143:14, 147:14, 147:26, 149:17, 149:18, 150:2, 150:12, 150:19 **WHITE** [1] - 3:11 whole [3] - 18:19, 88:23, 107:15 willing [1] - 100:14 **willy** [1] - 54:5 wiped [1] - 153:5 wiping [1] - 153:18 wish [5] - 29:3, 30:3, 90:28, 142:26, 158:17 73:23 WITNESS [3] - 5:2, 6:13, 166:6 52:11 witness [9] - 6:5, 6:18, 59:9, 155:14, € 156:12, 158:8, 158:12, 163:14, 165:16 witness/line [1] -135:27 É witnesses [7] -25:28, 26:4, 62:21, 94:20, 104:26, 141:15, 145:4 18:13, 117:8 wondered [1] - 69:11 wondering [1] -120:17 wording [3] - 28:1, Ó 92:10, 142:17 words [4] - 32:10, 76:29, 81:22, 91:4 workplace [2] -136:27, 155:2 works [4] - 32:12, 56:11, 59:12, 59:20 151:22, 164:15 worth [2] - 153:9, 156:10 wrap [1] - 159:5 write [3] - 56:13, 79:10, 127:17 writes [1] - 103:9 writing [7] - 30:13, 68:26, 71:3, 79:22, 86:25, 98:17, 121:7 written [5] - 79:14, 125:14, 126:5, 126:9, 156:17

wrongdoing [6] -

14:19, 15:26, 15:29, wrote [1] - 30:1

**year** [10] - 6:27, 7:11, 10:21, 12:19, 75:9, 75:11, 75:14, 80:22, 86:13, 158:18 yearly [1] - 150:27 years [8] - 7:2, 7:23, 7:27, 8:7, 10:8, 37:26, 50:27, 157:22 yesterday [8] -58:12, 114:26, 115:3, 121:25, 152:24, 153:20, 155:24, 158:1 yield [2] - 74:4, 74:7 yielded [1] - 131:17 yourself [5] - 37:18, 50:8, 51:23, 53:28, yourselves[1] -

**€4,000** [1] - 156:10

**ÉABHALL**[1] - 2:30 **Éireann** [3] - 18:3, **ÉIREANN**[2] - 1:4,

**Ó** [14] - 3:7, 5:3, 6:6, 6:9, 6:13, 51:23, 67:29, 96:12, 96:15, 97:13, 122:6, 125:6,