TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE

ON TUESDAY, 18TH FEBRUARY 2020 - DAY 141

141

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

## **APPEARANCES**

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

**REGI STRAR:** MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL:

MR. DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. SINÉAD McGRATH BL

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY & GARDA DAVID TURNER:

MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

**FOR** COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANIAN 10. 11. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN 13. SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16. 16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR. CHI EF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARI E CAGNEY DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON 30. INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY 31. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN 32. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN 33. 34. SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 35. 36. 37. SHANE MURPHY SC MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC MR. MR. MR.

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. ALISON MORRISSEY
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN

CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE OSMOND HOUSE\_\_\_\_

INSTRUCTED BY:

LITTLE SHIP STREET

DUBLIN 8

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL MR. PAUL CONNELLAN T&N MCLYNN FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

BASTION COURT 11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

**ATHLONE** 

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O' ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITZWILLIAM PLACE

INSTRUCTED BY:

DUBLIN 2

FOR GARDA TOM HIGGINS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. TOM POWER BL
MR. NOEL McCARTAN
McCARTAN & BURKE SOLICITORS
ICELAND HOUSE
33-34 ARRAN QUAY
SMITHFIELD

DUBLIN 7

## INDEX

WI TNESS	PAGE
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY McLOUGHLIN	
DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN	142
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McGARRY	145
EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS	146

1			THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON TUESDAY, 18TH	
2			FEBRUARY 2020:	
3				
4			MR. McGUINNESS: Good morning, Chairman. The witness	
5			today is Chief Superintendent Anthony McLoughlin.	10:30
6			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Good morning, chief	
7			superintendent. Thank you.	
8			THE WITNESS: Good morning, Judge.	
9				
10			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN, HAVING BEEN	10:30
11			SWORN, WAS DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS, AS	
12			FOLLOWS:	
13				
14			THE WITNESS: Chief Superintendent Anthony McLoughlin.	
15			Tony McLoughlin.	10:31
16			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thanks very much.	
17			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, Chief Superintendent	
18			McLoughlin's statement is found in the Tribunal's	
19			papers at Volume 11, page 3228, together with his	
20			associated appendices into Volume 12. There is an	10:31
21			additional statement at Volume 58, at page 16418.	
22	1	Q.	Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, can I first ask you to	
23			give a brief outline of your career to date, please, in	
24			An Garda Síochána?	
25		Α.	I joined An Garda Síochána in 1984 and I was assigned	10:31
26			to Shankill in south Dublin. I was there until my	
27			promotion in approximately 1992, where on promotion to	
28			sergeant I was assigned to Dun Laoghaire. Then, in	
29			around 1996 I was promoted to inspector and I was	

Т			assigned to the change management unit in Garda	
2			Headquarters. I spent 11 or 12 years as an inspector	
3			and then in around 2010, 2009/2010 I was promoted to	
4			superintendent, where I spent time in the HR department	
5			and the chief administrative office before being	10:32
6			promoted in 2013 to chief superintendent. And on	
7			promotion I was allocated initially to Internal Affairs	
8			and then to HR.	
9	2	Q.	Yes. That is obviously Internal Affairs, B branch?	
10		Α.	Yes.	10:32
11	3	Q.	And then HR. You have been a chief superintendent in	
12			HR since then?	
13		Α.	Well, since 2013. I had both portfolios initially, I	
14			had both Internal Affairs and HR and then the Internal	
15			Affairs portfolio was taken away and I was left with	10:32
16			just HR.	
17	4	Q.	Can I just ask you a little bit about the structure, as	
18			it were, since that time. The civilisation, as I call	
19			it, hadn't happened when you went in, in 2013 but there	
20			was a civilian head introduced?	10:33
21		Α.	That's right. I served initially under an assistant	
22			commissioner, and then I served under Mr. John Barrett.	
23	5	Q.	Yes.	
24		Α.	And currently I serve under the exec director Alan	
25			Mulligan.	10:33
26	6	Q.	Is there an assistant commissioner on top of those?	
27		Α.	No.	
28	7	Q.	Or are they at the rank of assistant commissioner?	

29

A. No, the highest Garda ranking Garda officer, if you

- 1 like, in HR at the moment is a chief superintendent.
- 2 8 Q. Yes.
- 3 Α. I report into Mr. Mulligan who reports into the CAO,
- Mr. Joe Nugent. 4
- 5 9 Can I just ask you then about 2013 to 2014. Obviously Q.

10:34

10:34

10:34

- the Protected Disclosures Act came into force in July 6
- 7 2014?
- 8 Yes. Α.
- What function had you got, if any, at that point in 9 10 Q.
- time? 10
- 11 Α. I had no function, other than perhaps if we got a
- 12 referral to us in relation to welfare, because I had
- 13 responsibility for the welfare service.
- 14 11 Q. Yes.
- 15 So other than that we had no function in relation to Α.
- 16 the Protected Disclosures Act.
- 17 Obviously we know that the confidential recipient wrote 12 Q.
- 18 directly to the Commissioner, as was mandated by the
- 19 regulations at the time?
- 20 Yes. Α.
- And the Commissioner made her appointment to appoint 21 13 Ο.
- 22 Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin. But is it the case
- 23 that you wouldn't and weren't in any way directly
- 24 involved in dealing with that protected disclosure?
- 25 No. Α.
- Or in any way connected with the investigation or the 14
- 26 Q.
- 27 reports coming from the investigation?
- No, I had no part whatsoever to play in the 28 Α.
- 29 investigation, in the appointment, in any aspect of it.

- 1 15 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. I only became familiar with it very late on then in maybe 2016.
- 4 16 Q. Yes. Just to clarify then insofar as your role related
  5 to sickness management and pay, where did they slot in 10:35
  6 in terms of issues that did arise and can arise?
- 7 A. I have no direct responsibility for either the 8 sickness, and I still don't, for either sickness or 9 pay. They come under the remit of the director in 10 Athlumney House in Navan.
- 11 17 Q. Yes.
- A. So my only role would be maybe to seek advice or seek a status update in any particular case that we might be dealing with, or if I came across something to maybe make a recommendation to that section, if I thought it was warranted.
- 17 18 Q. Yes. So the pay section is outside HRM?
- 18 A. It comes under the control of HRM but it just so 19 happens, geographically, that it's placed in Navan.
- 20 19 Q. Yes.
- A. And it comes under mostly Garda staff, all of the section is now managed by Garda staff.
- 23 20 Q. Yes. And the sickness management aspect of it, where is that sort of controlled from or responsible to?
- 25 A. It's under the head of the director in Navan and I 10:36
  26 think in this case it was Ms. Monica Carr, and she
  27 reports, like I do, into the exec director of HR.

28 21 Q. Yes. Just coming into, sort of, the period that we're 29 concerned with in question, we've seen that Garda Keogh

1			was previously out ill, receiving treatment back in	
2			2012, he was back on duty then and Assistant	
3			Commissioner Fanning at the time had directed that I	
4			think quarterly reports or regular reports would be	
5			made in relation to it from his unit. We have seen	10:36
6			that I think Mr. Mulligan wrote reminders in relation	
7			to those, which resulted in Sergeant Moylan writing a	
8			unit report up in relation to Garda Keogh. Would that	
9			unit report have come to HRM and to your notice at the	
10			time?	10:37
11		Α.	They wouldn't have come to my notice, no.	
12	22	Q.	We know obviously from the sequence of events that	
13			Garda Keogh had a meeting with Superintendent Murray at	
14			the end of March 2015, as a result of which the work	
15			related stress issue was raised or discussed to a	10:37
16			degree at that meeting. Presumably you had no	
17			knowledge of the basis upon which Garda Keogh was being	
18			recorded on SAMS at that time?	
19		Α.	No. No.	
20	23	Q.	I think you came to learn, obviously, at a stage we	10:38
21			will come to very shortly, that it had been recorded as	
22			flu/viral, although he was being certified by his	
23			doctor as work related stress?	
24		Α.	I became aware of that in early '16, sorry, June 2016,	
25			in around that timeframe.	10:38
26	24	Q.	Yes. Superintendent Murray dealt with the car tax	
27			issue. He seemed to query the stress that Garda Keogh	
28			said he was under, but he referred him up to the CMO in	
29			the light of his absences and his sickness record and	

- so forth. So we know that went up and he was
- 2 ultimately seen by the CMO at a much later stage, but

10:39

10:39

10:39

10 · 40

- 3 that referral would have gone -- would it have gone
- 4 through HRM first, is that correct?
- 5 A. It probably went through the hierarchy within the
- 6 division and then on to HR sickness section.
- 7 25 Q. Yes.
- 8 A. And then on to the CMO's office.
- 9 26 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. It may, on some occasions, I am a complete expert in
- relation to sickness absence, it may go to the CMO on
- occasions directly, but that would be by exception.
- 13 27 Q. Yes. You wouldn't be regularly notified of any such
- 14 matter?
- 15 A. No, no, or I wouldn't expect to be either.
- 16 28 Q. In terms of the protected disclosure that Garda Keogh
- 17 made in May of 2014, what were your responsibilities at
- of that time, May 2014? Had you any in relation to it?
- 19 A. I would have had none.
- 20 29 Q. When did you first acquire responsibility for dealing
- 21 with protected disclosures?
- 22 A. The end of May, early '16, I was appointed as a
- protected disclosures manager for the organisation in
- accordance with or in compliance with the Act of 2014.
- 25 30 Q. Yes. So you had no function, as it were --
- 26 A. No.
- 27 31 Q. -- between the coming into effect of the new Act in
- July '14, until you were assigned to be the protected
- 29 disclosures manager.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 32 Q. In 2016.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 33 Q. Obviously, I take it from that, that you had no
- 5 professional reason to involve yourself in Garda
- 6 Keogh's protected disclosures or what was happening in

- 7 relation to him, concerning his pay or sickness or
- 8 otherwise?
- 9 A. No. And in effect, even from '16, even as a protected
- disclosures manager per se, I wouldn't necessarily have 10:40
- 11 had a role from a protected disclosures management
- 12 perspective and sometimes it's often confused within
- the organisation.
- 14 34 Q. Yes.
- A. Because I was appointed with one other member of staff, 10:40
- Mr. Mulligan, to be a protected disclosures manager,
- but our primary role was a recipient for protected
- disclosures within the organisation for anybody who
- 19 wanted to make it.
- 20 35 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. Then as a result a follow up and support mechanism for
- those people who made a PD to us.
- 23 36 Q. Yes.
- A. But during 2016 and onwards, it kind of got conflated,
- 25 the protected disclosures manager was having to take on 10:41
- 26 maybe people who made protected disclosures otherwise
- than to ourselves.
- 28 37 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. And that's where I suppose I got more involved in this

- particular case than maybe the policy would suggest I should have had.
- 3 38 Q. It may help just as we go through it, but what is your role as a protected disclosures manager? Leaving aside the way you got involved in this particular case.

- Well, my role is first and foremost to act as the 6 Α. recipient for anybody who wants to make a disclosure 7 8 within the organisation. Once somebody has done that in accordance with our policy, my first job then is to 9 assess it and see if it fits within the remit of the 10 10 · 42 Act or comes within all of the terms within the Act 11 12 itself. Having made that assessment, I then have a 13 responsibility to appoint an investigator not below the 14 rank of chief superintendent to investigate that 15 complaint. And I also have responsibility to inform 10:42 16 the Commissioner of a PD having been made but without naming the individual, just indicate to the 17 18 Commissioner that I have a PD, a brief outline of what 19 it is, but do not name the individual concerned.
- 20 39 Q. Yes. And do you then retain oversight of the 10:42 investigation and of welfare issues in connection with that disclosure?
- A. Yes. The other pieces of the responsibility are to
  oversee the investigation without having any input into
  it, but make sure it is happening in a timely manner,
  to then provide regular updates to the person who has
  made the complaint as to how the investigation is
  going.
- 29 40 Q. Yes. Now, obviously in this case you didn't perform

- 1 any of those functions --
- 2 A. No.
- 3 41 Q. -- in relation to Garda Keogh?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 42 Q. So, can you just help the Tribunal understand the basis 10:43
- 6 upon which you then first got involved in connection
- 7 with Garda Keogh and contacting him?
- 8 A. I was asked, well, I would argue I was almost directed

10 · 43

10:44

10.44

- 9 by the head of legal at the time to get involved in
- 10 Garda Keogh's case on behalf of the organisation,
- primarily from a health and welfare perspective, but
- also with a view to maybe pulling all the various
- strands together so that there was one port of call
- that could keep the Commissioner informed of the status
- of all the various elements of the investigations that 10:44
- were ongoing.
- 17 43 Q. So you were effectively going to become and did become,
- 18 did you, the single point of contact?
- 19 A. In terms of coordinating all the activities.
- 20 44 Q. Coordinating, yes. Now obviously we know that Garda
- 21 Keogh had been certified as unfit for work by a report
- made by Dr. Oghuvbu, sent to HRM on I think 8th January
- 23 2016?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 45 Q. And didn't and wasn't regarded as sick for work
- thereafter. He was reviewed by the doctor in 2016.
- 27 But you contacted him on the 20th May, is that correct,
- 28 of 2016?
- 29 A. Sorry, I contacted?

- 1 46 Q. Garda Keogh.
- 2 A. I did. Once I got was given the role of becoming
- involved in Garda Keogh's case, the first thing I did
- 4 was to contact him to let him know who I was, to give
- 5 him my phone number, to ask about his wellbeing and to

10 · 45

10:46

10:46

10.46

- 6 generally see how he was.
- 7 47 Q. Yes. Now he had been referred to and seen the doctor
- 8 the previous day, the 19th May, had you seen any
- 9 documents relating to Garda Keogh at that stage and if
- 10 so --
- 11 A. No, I didn't, no.
- 12 48 Q. Okay. In any event, you made a note of your call. If
- we look at page 3250 of the documents. As we are going
- through your documents, you have helpfully labelled
- them, this TMCL 1?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 49 Q. You initiated that phone call?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 50 Q. As you say, on foot of legal advice, which you were no
- 20 doubt happy to follow?
- 21 A. Absolutely. It wasn't so much legal advice per se, it
- was just a request from the head of legal, where I had
- been involved in other cases and where I think he knelt
- it would be helpful to the organisation if I would
- fulfil a role with Garda Keogh similar to other roles,
- 26 whereby there was an office that was pulling, if you
- like, all of the various elements together.
- 28 51 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. And there was two objectives; one was to be supporting

Т			the people who were in the middle of this; and	
2			secondly, to be able to brief the Commissioner	
3			regularly. Rather than the organisation going all	
4			over, checking and looking for information here, there	
5			and everywhere, that there would be one office with the	10:47
6			responsibility for doing that. So I took that on.	
7	52	Q.	Just on a side issue perhaps, had you spoken to the	
8			Commissioner about Garda Keogh or had she spoken to you	
9			about him?	
10		Α.	Not at that time, no.	10:47
11	53	Q.	But was it your understanding that she would require to	
12			be briefed with up-to-date position regarding Garda	
13			Keogh?	
14		Α.	Yes. I would have done that on request from the	
15			Commissioner's office and on the very odd occasion I	10:47
16			would have made the call, I think it was only once or	
17			twice that I actually rang to give him well, it	
18			wasn't the Commissioner actually, it was the deputy	
19			commissioner, an update.	
20	54	Q.	Okay. Well perhaps maybe if we can look at that note,	10:47
21			page 3250?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	55	Q.	Just to read it there:	
24				
25			"Doctor yesterday."	10:48
26				
27			<pre>Is that "unfit for duty"?</pre>	
28		Α.	I presume it should be "unfit" but that was just	
29			Garda Keogh was reflecting to me that he was unfit for	

- 1 duty, yes.
- 2 56 Q. Yes. And then "flu/work related stress", is that a
- 3 record of -- you're noting the dichotomy there?
- 4 A. Exactly.
- 5 57 Q. Yes. What is the next phrase there?
- 6 A. "As December on file in error."

7

- 8 So what that was basically saying to me, that as far as
- 9 Garda Keogh was concerned that what was reflected on
- file or in the system wasn't exactly what he had wanted 10:48
- it to be, or what it actually was diagnosed as at the
- 12 time
- 13 58 Q. Yes. And then "report from Dr. Oghuvbu"?
- 14 A. Just a reference that there should have been a report
- 15 available from Dr. Oghuvbu in relation to --
- 10:49

10:49

10 · 49

- 16 59 Q. The last two visits?
- 17 A. Yeah.
- 18 60 Q. "His own GP says" something?
- 19 A. It says "no to do". To be honest with you, I don't
- 20 know exactly what that means.

- 21 61 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. I'm assuming it means that as far as his own GP was
- concerned as well he was also out sick with work
- 24 related stress.
- 25 62 Q. There is something then, is that "dispute"?
- A. Well, it's a dispute between -- what was relayed to me
- there, there seemed to be a dispute between what the GP
- 28 may have been saying and what the CMO at that time may
- 29 have suggested or said. I don't know if that's

- 1 accurate or not, I didn't check it out.
- 2 63 Q. Yes. "In contact with Mick Quinn."
- 3 A. That was a really important piece for me at the time,
- because I garnered from that that one of my staff, an
- 5 employee assistance officer, was in constant contact

10:50

10:50

10:50

- 6 with Garda Keogh and it gave me a certain amount of
- 7 confidence in that, that there was, if you like, a
- 8 strong support mechanism in place and a strong
- 9 relationship between Garda Quinn and Garda Keogh.
- 10 64 Q. Yes. And then your note on the last two lines, is it
- "find out"?
- 12 A. That was a note to myself to try and find out what was
- the status and get a copy of the last two Chief Medical
- 14 Officer reports.
- 15 65 Q. Yes. On foot of that then, that was the first time it
- came to your attention that there was this issue of
- 17 recording. There's no mention of pay mentioned there
- in the conversation?
- 19 A. No. It was a very brief conversation that I had.
- 20 66 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. It was just to, if you like, break the ice and make
- 22 contact. I wouldn't have known Nicky Keogh, Garda
- 23 Keogh before that.
- 24 67 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. And I don't think Garda Keogh would have known me. So
- it was just an opportunity to get to know each other
- and to break the ice.
- 28 68 Q. Yes. In terms of getting the CMO's reports, is that
- 29 within your grasp, as it were? Can you, as chief

- superintendent in HR, ask the CMO to give you the last
- two reports? Or, how does that work?
- 3 A. I could do it. I wouldn't necessarily do it on a
- 4 very -- I wouldn't do it very frequently. I would
- 5 probably look for it through our Sick Section in Navan, 10:51
- 6 who would have the file in relation to sickness
- 7 absence. Therefore, I would get what I'd be entitled
- 8 to get. I'd be conscious that there is a
- 9 client-patient confidentiality associated with the
- 10 Chief Medical Officer and I didn't want to cross over

10:52

10:52

- or intervene in that in any way, except with the
- consent of Garda Keogh. So, to answer your questions,
- it would be unusual, if not -- I would never go to the
- 14 CMO directly, I would go through the Sickness Absence
- 15 Section in Navan to get the information.
- 16 69 Q. In Navan?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 70 Q. I think you provided Garda Keogh with an assurance that
- 19 you were always available to help him.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 71 Q. Or, if required, to listen and you gave him your mobile
- 22 number?
- 23 A. I did.
- 24 72 Q. Now, I think he then rang you on the 23rd May, three
- 25 days later?
- 26 A. Yeah.
- 27 73 Q. Had you been able to make any progress in terms of
- finding out more about the issues that he had raised?
- 29 A. No, I don't think I did anything at that time in the

1			intervening days, I think it was only after I met Garda	
2			Keogh that I started to put various things into place,	
3			into action, to try and resolve some of the issues that	
4			he had.	
5	74	Q.	Yes. In any event, you made a note of that call on the	10:52
6			23rd, if we look at page 3251?	
7		Α.	Yeah.	
8	75	Q.	You appear to have noted there at the top "off sick	
9			flu"?	
10		Α.	Yes.	10:53
11	76	Q.	You note the time you received the call. "Admitted to	
12			taking drink last night and was obvious", what?	
13		Α.	Incoherent.	
14	77	Q.	When he was talking to you?	
15		Α.	Yeah. And I don't mean this with any disrespect to	10:53
16			Garda Keogh, he did ring me, he did state to me that he	
17			had some drink taken and that it was his intention	
18			possibly to stay drinking that afternoon.	
19	78	Q.	Okay. "He says he has a problem with Mark Curran."	
20				10:53
21			Did he go into any detail about that?	
22		Α.	No.	
23	79	Q.	"He wanted to get sick sorted out."	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	80	Q.	Is that right?	10:53
26		Α.	Yeah.	
27	81	Q.	"Sick with stress but recorded as the flu."	
28		Α.	Yes. It was one of the things that Garda Keogh	
29			mentioned to me in that conversation, that he was	

1			annoyed that the record showed flu rather than work	
2			related stress.	
3	82	Q.	He wanted you to then go through Mick Quinn, the	
4			welfare officer?	
5		Α.	Yeah. Judge, he kind of said to me that he would	10:54
6			prefer if possible to go through Garda Quinn with any	
7			updates or any information that I might have had for	
8			him. I think the reason for that primarily was that	
9			Garda Quinn would have had a greater level of access to	
10			Garda Keogh than possibly I would have had and he would	10:54
11			be familiar with the phone numbers and things.	
12	83	Q.	Yes.	
13		Α.	So it might have proved to be quicker in the event that	
14			something needed to go to Garda Keogh.	
15	84	Q.	Yes. You have a note then that he wanted you to	10:54
16			contact D/Superintendent Mulcahy?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	85	Q.	Now, this in the period obviously after the Director	
19			has made a decision not to prosecute Garda A and after	
20			Garda Keogh has been informed of that. Can you	10:55
21			recollect, did he give any reason as to why he wanted	
22			to contact D/Super Mulcahy?	
23		Α.	I don't remember it, to be quite honest. I don't	
24			remember the conversation other than what's in my note.	
25			I'm sorry, I'm not able to help.	10:55
26	86	Q.	Not at all. The next note you have then is "going to"	
27			what does that mean?	
28		Α.	What Garda Keogh had stated to me and I took a note of	
29			it:	

_				
2			"He was going to drink more that afternoon."	
3	87	Q.	Okay. Then the last one there?	
4		Α.	"Wanted reports from Dr. Oghuvbu."	
5				10:55
6			So I am suspecting that maybe Garda Keogh himself	
7			wanted to get sight of what Dr. Oghuvbu was actually	
8			saying or stating in his reports.	
9	88	Q.	Yes. I think on foot of that you probably were	
10			concerned for him and you contacted superintendent	10:55
11			Della Murphy to try and get Garda Quinn to call you?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	89	Q.	Isn't that right?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	90	Q.	You also contacted then, on the same day, Claire Egan	10:56
16			in the HR directorate for an update in relation to his	
17			position vis-à-vis SAMS, isn't that correct?	
18		Α.	Yes, I did.	
19	91	Q.	I think you received that, if we look at page 3253?	
20		Α.	Yeah.	10:56
21	92	Q.	If we perhaps just start at the bottom of 3253 and go	
22			onto the next page:	
23				
24			"Garda Ni chol as Keogh has been absent continuously on	
25			sick leave since 26/12/215. The member's GP has	10:56
26			certified the member as being unfit due to work related	
27			stress and the absence is recorded as ordinary illness	
28			on SAMS. The member's local management expressed	
29			concern regarding his attendance patterns prior to the	

commencement of this absence and the member was	
reviewed by the Occupational Health Service in early	
December 2015 and was found to be unfit for duty. The	
OHD is liaising with the member's treating doctor. As	
is the procedure in all cases where stress is cited as	10:57
the nature of the illness, the member's local	
management met with the member to discuss the source of	
his stress. However, the member advised he was	
unwilling to discuss this as he was aware that matters	
raised by him are under the investigation by AC Western	10:57
Region and he is under the protections of the relevant	
legislation in this regard. This branch is not in	
receipt nor aware of any application for this sickness	
absence to be treated as anything other than ordinary	
illness, as recorded. Accordingly, under the	10:57
provisions of the public service management sick leave	
regulations 2014, the member's accumulated sick leave	
in four year period was in excess of 183 days and the	
member was eligible to be paid at the rate of Temporary	
Rehabilitation Remuneration from the commencement date	10:57
of his absence and remains in receipt of TRR pay to	
date. The member continues to submit medical	
certificates in compliance with regulations. The	
member was scheduled to attend a review of the OHD on	
19th May 2016 and a report of the OHD is awaited."	10:58

I see that that is sent on to you by a William J Gardiner and you sent it on to the Commissioner's private secretary.

- 1 A. Mm-hmm.
- 2 93 Q. Was that a process initiated by you to keep the
- 3 Commissioner informed?
- 4 A. It was, but I would suspect in this case I was asked
- for information in relation to it around that time.

10:59

10:59

- 6 94 Q. Yes.
- 7 A. Because it was very infrequent occasions when I would
- 8 have briefed either the Commissioner's office or the
- 9 deputy commissioner's office, I would have awaited on
- the request, and there was a number of reports that I
- 11 compile for the offices and that's how I would have
- 12 basically kept them up-to-date and up to speed on what
- was happening.
- 14 95 Q. Yes. Now, Ms. Egan refers to the procedure there in
- her update, about the local management meeting with the 10:59
- member?
- 17 A. Mm-hmm.
- 18 96 Q. How do you see the investigation of work related stress
- should commence and be completed?
- 20 A. In my previous time in HR as a superintendent I
- 21 happened to be the architect of HQ Directive 139/10, so
- I was very familiar with it.
- 23 97 Q. Yes.
- 24 A. One of the key things in that directive would be that
- if anybody goes sick with injury on duty or work
- related stress, it's meant to precipitate an
- investigation almost immediately, to find out the
- source of the stress or the injury on duty. And the
- idea behind that was to ensure that if at all possible

1 that the organisation could take steps to either 2 alleviate the stress or find out, I mean, the nature of it and what caused it. 3 The evidence relating to Superintendent Murray's 4 98 0. 5 meeting with Garda Keogh on 26th March 2015 suggests 11:00 that Superintendent Murray queried whether Garda Keogh 6 7 was under stress, but he nonetheless, in view of his 8 absences, referred him up to the CMO. Would you regard it as necessary to carry out a further investigation on 9 foot of Garda Keogh being referred to the CMO at that 10 11:00 11 point in time? 12 From HR's perspective --Α. 13 99 Q. Yes. 14 Α. -- and from my perspective, I would have been keen to 15 ensure that if at all possible that an appropriate 11:01 16 investigation was conducted to bottom out the work 17 related stress, as is required under the regulations. 18 100 Q. Yes. 19 And while I understand that, in fairness to Α. 20 Superintendent Murray, he did meet Garda Keogh and he 11:01 did refer him to the Chief Medical Officer. 21 22 the Chief Medical Officer was going to be an important 23 part in the diagnosis of Garda Keogh and may well have 24 become a significant part of the investigation or the 25 report from the investigation into the causes and so on 11:01 and so forth. 26 27 101 Yes. Obviously and in fairness to Superintendent Q. Murray, his report to Chief Superintendent Wheatley 28

29

expressly refers to Garda Keogh reporting to be

1			suffering from work related stress and he fills in the	
2			CMO application form, the referral form.	
3		Α.	Yeah.	
4	102	Q.	On the basis of ticking the mental health box.	
5			Ordinarily would you have expected that to result in	11:02
6			the formal assessment of Garda Keogh's work related	
7			stress, either by HR in some way or by CMO?	
8		Α.	No, the practice at the time in nearly all cases, from	
9			my knowledge, would be that there would have been an	
10			independent well, not so much independent, but there	11:02
11			would have been an report or an investigation outlining	
12			the work related stress issues and detailing them and	
13			offering maybe potential reasons or causes that gave	
14			rise to it. That report would, if you like, satisfy	
15			the regulations but it also would help, I have no	11:02
16			doubt, the Chief Medical Officer in his various	
17			assessments that he was going to conduct as well.	
18	103	Q.	Yes. The issue was further clarified on the 23rd, when	
19			you received an e-mail from Claire Egan later that	
20			afternoon. If we could look at page 3255. She was	11:03
21			only in a position to furnish the CMO advices of the	
22			19th January earlier, but she said in the second	
23			sentence:	
24				
25			"The member's absence records are now being amended	11:03
26			locally by the SAMS user to reflect 'illness type:	
27			Mental health'. This should update overnight on the	
28			feed into GRIPS."	

1			Had you, in your brief conversations, I know they were	
2			with Garda Keogh, discuss how any change might be	
3			recorded or were you aware as to what might be a more	
4			appropriate record of it?	
5		Α.	Well, my understanding from Garda Keogh was very clear:	11:04
6			That Garda Keogh wished the system to reflect what he	
7			believed was his reason for sickness, which was work	
8			related stress. Now I obviously wasn't sure at that	
9			time how that would manifest itself on the system, I	
10			probably in my naivety would have expected that it	11:04
11			would go onto the system and be reflected as work	
12			related stress. But I've subsequently become aware	
13			that SAMS doesn't necessarily keep work related stress	
14			except under the umbrella of mental health as one of	
15			the categories. And that's the way it deals with it.	11:04
16	104	Q.	Yes. The report that you were furnished with, with	
17			that e-mail is on the next page, at page 3256.	
18			Obviously it dates from January, but the last sentence	
19			of it says:	
20				11:05
21			"Please ensure that all sickness absences are recorded	
22			on SAMS."	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	105	Q.	In the context of Dr. Bartlett, Garda Keogh's GP,	
25			sending in certificates of work related stress, it was	11:05
26			your view, was it, that you expected that that would be	

A. Yes. If that's what the GP was saying initially and that was the diagnosis that was available initially,

recorded on SAMS?

27

1 yes. 2 106 Yes. Q. 3 Α. Now, I don't -- I have very limited knowledge of SAMS. I don't think I have ever used it. 4 5 107 Q. Yes. 11:05 6 Yes. Α. 7 In any event, I think within ten minutes of getting 108 Q. 8 Ms. Egan's e-mail you were phoning Garda Quinn on the same afternoon to inform him of this update? 9 10 Yeah. Α. 11:06 11 109 I think you have a note of that. Just to look at that Q. 12 note on 3257: 13 14 "Spoke with M Quinn EAS re Nick Keogh as requested by 15 Nick Keogh. Sick absence, the reason is changed to..." 11:06 16 "Reason is changed to work related stress." 17 Α. 18 19 So the reason for the absence on the system is now, in 20 my view at the time, reflected as work related stress. 11:06 21 110 Yes. 0. 22 As per sick cert. Α. 23 That was your understanding of what it would be? 111 Q. 24 Absolutely, yes. Α. "Repeat" is that "report"? 25 112 Q. 11:06 26 "Report from last CMO meeting not yet available. But Α. 27 previous one is sent to Garda Quinn for his 28 information. Ms. Claire Egan, Navan, contacted to resolve these two issues." 29

- 1 113 Q. Yes. When you say "two issues" there, that's what I
- 2 wanted to ask you about. What did you see as the two
- issues there?
- 4 A. One of them was definitely the entering on SAMS. I can
- only assume that the other one was probably to do with
- 6 pay maybe.
- 7 114 Q. Yes.
- 8 A. But I can't be certain.
- 9 115 Q. Yes. It's possible Garda Quinn raised that with you,
- maybe, is it?
- 11 A. Yes, it may have been, yeah. It's the only two I can

11 · 07

11:07

11:07

11 · 07

- think of, yeah.
- 13 116 Q. Yes. I think you rang Garda Keogh's number later that
- 14 evening to leave a message.
- 15 A. Yeah.
- 16 117 Q. Telling him that you had updated Garda Quinn about the
- 17 matter, is that right?
- 18 A. Yeah. I was anxious -- I felt that Garda Keogh was
- anxious about this and that it was causing him some
- 20 angst. Therefore, once the job had been done and the
- action had been taken, I was keen that he became aware
- of it, because it may help in his own, you know, his
- own recovery, if you like, or his own attitudes towards
- 24 ourselves in trying to help him.
- 25 118 Q. Yes. You kept in touch with Garda Quinn I think, but
- 26 you ended up arranging to meet Garda Keogh with Garda
- 27 Quinn on the 3rd June?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 119 O. In the Tullamore Court Hotel?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 120 Q. What was the purpose of arranging that meeting?
- 3 A. Well I wanted to meet him in person.
- 4 121 Q. In person.
- 5 A. Rather than be conversing over the phone all the time.
- 6 122 Q. Yes
- 7 A. I also wanted to meet him to see how he was in person.
- I wanted him to get a look at what I was about and what
- 9 I was trying to do. So I arranged to have the meeting

11:08

11:09

11:09

- 10 with Garda Keogh and he kindly agreed to meet.
- 11 123 Q. Yes. You took a note of that, perhaps we will look at
- 12 that, at 3259?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 124 Q. If you can just help us?
- 15 A. Sometimes I do find it hard to read my own writing.
- 16 125 Q. It's fine. "Nick had stopped drinking."

17

- 18 That's the first entry.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 126 Q. "He was okay with..."

21

- 22 What is the next word?
- 23 A. "He was okay with discussion."

24

- 25 He was confident to continue with the meeting.
- 26 127 Q. Yes.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 128 Q. "Nick is in hands of Clare Daly and Mick Wallace."
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 129 Q. Had you been aware of that previously?
- 2 A. No, not necessarily, no.
- 3 130 Q. Okay.
- 4 A. It may have been in the media at the time, I can't be
- 5 sure. Garda Keogh gave me that information on the day. 11:09

11 . 09

11:10

11:10

- 6 131 Q. Yes. He was quite open about that obviously.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 132 O. What's next then?
- 9 A. "He did indicate to me that he had become dependent on
- 10 alcohol because of his work related stress."
- 11 133 Q. Did he attribute any reason for the stress or any
- period to it or...
- 13 A. Well, the whole conversation that morning from Garda
- 14 Keogh was about all of the issues that he himself saw
- as, you know, annoying him -- annoying would be the
- wrong word, upsetting him, if you like. So we went
- 17 through a raft of things, including the Athlone issue,
- 18 the investigation into the Athlone issue, his view of
- what management's view was of him, and some of the
- issues that he felt was contributing to his work
- 21 related stress, yes.
- 22 134 Q. Yes. You say there, correct me if I am wrong:
- 23
- "He outlined a list of issues where he has alleged he
- was singled out because of his allegations."
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 135 Q. "He was not going..."
- 28
- 29 Is it?

Т		Α.	He will not be returning to work until these matters	
2			are resolved. He believes that Superintendent Murray	
3			and Chief Curran have targeted him for special	
4			treatment."	
5				11:11
6			That's what he said to me.	
7				
8			"He believes the Commissioner, NOS"	
9				
10			Which I assume is Nóirín O'Sullivan	11:11
11				
12			" had failed to protect him. These matters are now	
13			dealt with in GSOC. He discussed the possibility"	
14				
15			One of the reasons that I had gone to see Garda Keogh	11:11
16			at the time, and this is something I would have done in	
17			the past with other staff, would have been my	
18			primary role as I would have seen at the time was to	
19			see was there any mechanism whereby we could see a	
20			return to work either in the medium or long-term and to	11:11
21			discuss that with Garda Keogh	
22	136	Q.	Yes.	
23		Α.	I suggested to him that, okay, regardless of what I	
24			felt, that at the end of the day, before he could	
25			return to work, he would have to be passed fit to	11:11
26			return by the Chief Medical Officer anyway.	
27	137	Q.	Yes?	
28		Α.	But I was still there explore, in the eventuality of	

29

that happening, how could we orchestrate that? Would

1 it be to his current station, which was Athlone, or as 2 the chief in charge of staff allocations, I could have 3 looked as other possibilities if that would have helped. 4 5 138 So you were in a position of direct control. Q. 11:12 6 Α. 7 139 If that was acceptable? Q. 8 Yes. Α. You say obviously, you record there: 9 140 Q. 10 11:12 11 "But the final say on this matter lay with..." 12 13 The CMO. Α. "... CMO. " 14 141 Q. 15 So in other words, before anything could happen he Α. 11:12 16 would have to be passed fit by the Chief Medical 17 Officer to return to work. 18 Yes. You record it there as saying "pay not an issue 142 Q. 19 for him"? 20 Yes. Α. 11:12 21 143 "But thought there was procedure for work related Q. 22 stress being categorised as injury on duty." 23 Yes. Α. 24 144 Did you, were you aware of that issue? Could that Q. 25 occur; that it could be classified then as --11 · 12 Again, I wouldn't necessarily be the policyholder here, 26 Α. but I would be aware -- and it's always something that 27 is confused within the organisation, that people do 28 29 feel and members do feel that if they do get a

Τ			diagnosis as work related stress that it automatically	
2			means that you then get what we call an award of injury	
3			on duty, and it's not always well, very infrequently	
4			is that the case. Because injury on duty, as a	
5			definition, goes back a long time in the Garda	11:13
6			regulations. An injury on duty usually means or did	
7			mean, in the past in particular, a physical injury	
8			associated with something in the execution of duty or a	
9			mental injury arising from it.	
10	145	Q.	Yes.	11:13
11		Α.	And it's quite clear and that's been the way it has	
12			been for quite sometime.	
13	146	Q.	You have noted there:	
14				
15			"I undertook to look into"	11:13
16				
17			That was that issue?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	147	Q.	And then your note concludes:	
20				11:14
21			"Gave my commitment to him that"	
22				
23			You were there for him to support?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	148	Q.	"There for him."	11:14
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	149	Q.	He also, as you noted, provide you with this harassment	
28			index?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

- 150 Q. We have heard from Dr. Oghuvbu that he, when he saw him 1 2 on the 19th, in fact he recorded in his notes that he 3 gave him a script and he identified a harassment index of two pages, he seems to have given you a similar one? 4 5 Yes.
- Α. 11:14
- 6 151 Had he a copy of that ready for you? Q.
- 7 Yes, I think he had it with him, yeah. Α.
- 8 152 Did you go through the items with him or did he just 0. take it? 9
- It became -- well, the general conversation obviously 10 Α. 11 · 14 11 dealt with those items, so when we finished the 12 conversation Garda Keogh gave me the list.
- 13 Now, had you heard at any time that he had 153 Yes. Q. 14 previously complained of being harassed or bullied?
- 15 No, this would have been the first time, because I Α. 11:15 16 wouldn't have interacted with him up to this point.
- 17 Yes. We know Deputy Wallace, on the 31st March, 154 Q. 18 referred to bullying in Athlone of a whistleblower. 19 know that Garda Keogh himself wrote back to 20 Superintendent Murray that he regarded his directions in relation to certain crime files to be nothing but 21

11 · 16

- 22 harassment. When something like this comes to an 23 officer of your rank, how did you regard this as what 24 ought to be done or what should you do?
- well, if the member is of a view, which Garda 25 Α. Keogh was at the time, and he wanted it to be dealt 26 27 with under the existing policy, the one which is there 28 as bullying and harassment.
- 29 155 0. Yes.

- 1 A. There would have been an onus on me to take that
- 2 complaint from him at that time.
- 3 156 Q. But presumably the policy is on the portal?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 157 Q. And all the guards know of it?
- 6 A. Yeah
- 7 158 Q. We know Superintendent Murray himself, in writing,
- 8 referred Garda Keogh to it --
- 9 A. Yeah.
- 10 159 Q. -- in September of 2015, reminding him of section 39 of  $_{11:16}$

11:16

11:17

11 · 17

- 11 the Garda Síochána Act and of the policy.
- 12 A. Mm-hmm.
- 13 160 Q. Are members often reluctant to invoke the policy or to
- 14 invoke it through their local district or divisional
- 15 officer?
- 16 A. Em, I don't know, is the answer to that. But I do know
- that if they have issues with doing it that way, they
- can go directly into HR with it if they wish.
- 19 161 Q. But is it the position under the policy, it is meant to
- 20 be submitted upwards?
- 21 A. Absolutely.
- 22 162 Q. You know, through the district division.
- 23 A. Absolutely, yes, because the responsibility for
- resolving it and investigating it will be in the
- 25 division unless there is a conflict of interest in
- 26 relation to it.
- 27 163 Q. Yes. But do members in fact directly make complaint to
- 28 headquarters?
- 29 A. Infrequently.

- 1 164 Q. Infrequently. I think you, the next day --
- 2 A. Sorry, if I could, Judge, before I leave that
- 3 particular point.
- 4 165 Q. Yes.
- 5 A. Having been faced with the index and having gone
- 6 through the discussion with Garda Keogh, I was kind of

11:18

11:18

11:18

- put on notice, if you like, at that time that Garda
- 8 Keogh was bringing this to me as a chief superintendent
- 9 and I didn't necessarily want to leave it at that. So
- 10 I did ask Garda Keogh at the time if he did want me to
- do anything with it, which in my view was: Did he want
- me to take a complaint from him? And rightly or
- wrongly, my interpretation was, and Garda Keogh said it
- to me, no, I have already made those complaints to
- another forum and that's where I want them to be
- investigated at that time. So, when I left the meeting
- I left it with a couple of issues to be addressed on
- 18 behalf of Garda Keogh. One was his pay and the second
- one was in relation to following up with the --
- continue following up in relation to his record on
- 21 SAMS.
- 22 166 Q. YES. You do say in your statement obviously that he
- replied that he didn't want to you do anything because
- the matters were with GSOC.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 167 O. You did check with GSOC later.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 168 Q. We will come to that in a due course. But I think the
- 29 next day you sent an e-mail to Chief Wheatley. If we

- 1 look at 3261?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 169 Q. That is a simple enquiry, asking if she can confirm if
- 4 an investigation was carried out in accordance with the
- 5 regulations into work related stress and the outcome of 11:19

11:20

- 6 it?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 170 Q. And the regulations you're referring to presumably are
- 9 one you drafted, 139/10?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 171 Q. You got a reply were Chief Wheatley, which is on the
- 12 next page, 3262.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 172 Q. That sets out the fact that he was deemed unfit for
- duty, reviewed a couple of weeks ago and there's a
- suggestion of a conference being held there.
- 17 A. Yeah.
- 18 173 Q. Presumably you were happy to take on board that
- 19 proposition?
- 20 A. I was, but I still was keen to keep, if you like, I
- 21 won't say forcing but keep following up until such time
- as we got to a point that either the investigation was
- concluded or there was a reasonable reason or rationale
- as to why it mightn't have been conducted.
- 25 174 Q. Yes. You do follow that up with a subsequent e-mail to 11:20
- 26 Chief Wheatley, if we look at 3264?
- 27 A. Yeah.
- 28 175 Q. In the interim, you had earlier that day sent an e-mail
- to Monica Carr. If we look at page 9695, which will

Τ			come up on screen. At the very bottom of that page.	
2			This is being cc'd to the CMO Mr. Barrett, Mr. Downey,	
3			Superintendent Ó Cualáin, Margaret Nugent, about work	
4			related stress. You're raising the issue about the	
5			work on definitions, if you see at the top of the page	11:21
6			there, are near completion.	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	176	Q.	In the third last paragraph you say:	
9				
10			"My own view is that this situation needs to be	11:21
11			reviewed as a matter of urgency. It may well be the	
12			case that pay should not be reduced until these matters	
13			are resolved. The members concerned will argue that it	
14			is not their fault that they are out sick. The	
15			organisation carries a risk also while resolutions are	11:22
16			found.	
17				
18			As a minimum the pay status should not change without	
19			personal contact being made with the members concerned.	
20				11:22
21			This requires urgent attention and my recommendation is	
22			that a mechanism is found for pay not to be reduced	
23			while matters are under consideration."	
24				
25			You received a reply from Mr. Downey the next day.	11:22
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	177	Q.	If we go back to the middle of page 9695. Mr. Downey	
28			is saying essentially that the causality is an issue	
29			and that presents an opportunity to deal with each case	

Τ			on a case-by-case basis, based upon medical assessment.	
2			And he sets out:	
3				
4			"If supported by the CMO, there is no issue."	
5				11:22
6			I think you replied to him later that day, if we look	
7			at the top of the page there.	
8		Α.	Yeah.	
9	178	Q.	You make the key point there in the second last	
10			paragraph:	11:23
11				
12			"The key point here is that they should not be on	
13			reduced pay until it is proven that there wasn't a	
14			causal link between reason for absence and work related	
15			stress. We tend to reduce pay first while we wait on	11:23
16			decisions, thus increasing the stress and exacerbating	
17			the problem.	
18				
19			Change of mindset required here.	
20				11:23
21			This is urgent, Brian. Mark my words, it will be at	
22			some stage appear in the media or the Dáil. It would	
23			be better if we are ahead of the game."	
24				
25			So you are raising the issue there, as it were,	11:23
26			in-house. We have seen the debate in e-mails, some of	
27			which you were copied on.	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	179	Q.	And others that you replied to. But I take it that	

- that represents your view at the time, that you didn't depart from?
- A. Yeah. I had a fairly strong view at the time, rightly or wrongly, and particularly from a protected
- disclosures perspective, which is where I was coming from.

- 7 180 Q. Yes.
- 8 And also from a human perspective, that if people are Α. out sick for quite some time, and I know what the 9 regulations are and I'm not saying for one minute that 10 11 · 24 11 other people didn't act in accordance with the 12 regulations or in accordance with their own authority, 13 but I had a view that perhaps there was another way or 14 a better way of ensuring that people weren't 15 disaffected by a reduction in pay until such time as we 11:24 16 became aware as to the cause of that. Whereas, where 17 the cause was in abeyance, I felt it a little bit 18 unfair that people would be reduced in pay as a result, and particularly conscious of the penalisation that is 19 20 categorised under the Act, and the definition of 11:25 penalisation, which can include a reduction in wage. 21
- 22 181 Q. Yes.
- A. I felt as a PD manager that I needed to bring that to bear on the organisation at the time?
- 25 182 Q. Yes. Your reference to the media and the Dáil, it
  26 would appear you must have been conscious of actual
  27 public utterances in one form or another?
- A. I was. It wasn't that that was the fundamental reason or rationale as to why I would have felt the way I

1			felt, but I was conscious at that time as well, and	
2			from memory, and I can't remember when or the date, I	
3			think there was a reference to Garda Keogh as a	
4			whistleblower on the Houses of the Dáil and it was	
5			referenced that not only is he a whistleblower but the	11:25
6			organisation has cut his pay at the same time. While	
7			the organisation, and rightly so, was publicly saying	
8			that we were supporting people who wanted to come	
9			forward to make a disclosure and we encouraged them to	
10			do so, I felt myself deep down there was a kind of	11:26
11			dichotomy here between what we were saying we could do	
12			or would do and what we actually could do under the	
13			regulations. I felt myself that there was a lacuna in	
14			the regulations in relation to people who came forward	
15			as whistleblowers.	11:26
16	183	Q.	Yes. Your persistence in raising the issue with Chief	
17			Superintendent Wheatley appears to have led to a	
18			further report being sent by her on the 8th June. If	
19			we look at that, on page 3267. That's a comprehensive	
20			document in the sense that it includes all of	11:27
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	184	Q.	Superintendent Murray's previous reports of April	
23			and, indeed, May, the 20th as well, that the Chairman	
24			has already seen. I don't need to open those reports.	
25			But I think the key point that you emphasise in your	11:27
26			statement about this was that efforts had been made	
27			locally to establish it?	
28		Α.	Yeah.	

29 185 Q. But the member was reluctant to discuss it?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 186 Q. And at page 3269, which is the third page of Chief Wheatley's report, in the last paragraph of that, she says:

5

6 "In view of the foregoing, it has not been possible to 7 conduct a full investigation into Garda Keogh's absence 8 through alleged work related stress, nor do I believe 9 that any further or specific information be provided by 10 Garda Keogh which would enable further investigation of 11:28 11 this claim. However, to be clear and to avoid doubt, I 12 am to enquire if there is any requirement to further 13 investigate Garda Keogh's absence through alleged work 14 related stress. In the event that further 15 investigation of this matter is warranted, I would 11:28 16 recommend that permission be granted to appoint an 17 inspector outside the Westmeath division to conduct

19 A. Yes.

same."

18

20 187 Q. Now, I'm sure you considered that report carefully.

21 Did you take it on its face to be a comprehensive

22 answer to the question and did it demonstrate to your

23 mind that as full an investigation as you would have

24 liked had taken place?

- A. I wouldn't -- I did consider it carefully. I wouldn't 11:28 have been happy that a full investigation had taken place.
- 28 188 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. But I would have been satisfied that in fairness to

1			Chief Wheatley, at this point in time she has gone as	
2			far as she could go and that there is no further she	
3			could go in relation to it. So I was satisfied,	
4			therefore, that there was no point in me continuing to	
5			e-mail or prompt Chief Wheatley in relation to the work	11:29
6			related stress investigation and that now it was time	
7			to hand it over to the policy owners for further	
8			investigation, which was the Sickness Absence Section	
9			in Navan.	
10	189	Q.	Yes.	11:29
11		Α.	So I felt that Chief Wheatley had gone as much as she	
12			could go in relation to try and, from her perspective,	
13			investigate the work related stress, because if they	
14			had met with Garda Keogh and they weren't able to	
15			allude or elicit from Garda Keogh the reasons from his	11:30
16			perspective, well then there wasn't much more that she	
17			could do really.	
18	190	Q.	Could I just ask you to consider two things. She was	
19			obviously relying on what Superintendent Murray had	
20			reported back from March 2015, and in the context of	11:30
21			where 139/10 seemed to place the onus on the divisional	
22			officer to do the investigation?	
23		Α.	Yes, it does.	
24	191	Q.	Have you had experience of divisional officers doing it	
25			themselves or trying to elucidate the cause with the	11:30
26			member directly?	
27		Α.	As I say, I don't deal with these on a day-to-day	
28			basis, so I wouldn't have any knowledge in relation to	

29

whether or not it happens or how it happens or how

- 1 frequently it happens.
- 2 192 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. This is the only case really, apart from in my own
- 4 section itself, it would be dealt with.
- 5 193 Q. The option that she, as it were, was suggesting in her
- 6 last paragraph of appointing someone outside the
- 7 division seems a reasonable suggestion?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 194 Q. Was that taken on board or was there any view that it

11:31

11:31

- would be pointless, because he was out sick?
- 11 A. To be honest with you, I don't know.
- 12 195 Q. Yes.
- 13 A. I don't know if it was taken further. I don't know if
- the view would have been it would have been pointless.
- I would have maybe thought that maybe it was worth
- 16 exploring.
- 17 196 Q. Have you seen that done in other cases?
- 18 A. In my own case, yes, staff in my own area, yes, we
- 19 would have appointed somebody from outside to try and
- do an investigation.
- 21 197 Q. Yes. In any event, the case conference that was mooted
- went ahead on the 12th July, isn't that correct?
- 23 A. That's correct, yeah.
- 24 198 Q. I think you have a short note of that at page 3280?
- A. Mm-hmm.
- 26 199 Q. I don't think we need to probably go through it. I
- 27 think everyone was agreeable on the course of action,
- 28 which was, of course, dependent upon Garda Keogh being
- agreeable also, isn't that correct?

- 1 A. Absolutely.
- 2 200 Q. There was support for that, including financial
- 3 support?
- 4 A. Yeah.
- 5 201 Q. I think you spoke with Garda Keogh and Garda Quinn, is
- 6 that right, on the next day?
- 7 A. I just have to refer to my note.
- 8 202 Q. Yes. Page 3282.
- 9 A. Yes. I spoke to both of them. This was actually, and
- 10 I remember this fairly well, this was a day or two
- 11 before Garda Keogh was going in for an assessment to be

11:33

11:33

- 12 accepted into residential treatment.
- 13 203 Q. Yes. And I think he confirmed he had been successful
- in that?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 204 Q. And would enter into the 22-day programme, is that
- 17 right?
- 18 A. Yes, yeah.
- 19 205 Q. On the 14th July.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 206 Q. In the interim, I think the Commissioner or shortly
- 22 afterwards the Commissioner had received a request from
- the Minister for a section 41 report?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 207 Q. And I think that was referred to you by the
- 26 Commissioner's private secretary, Superintendent
- 27 Broderick?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 208 Q. I think on foot of that you -- I suppose just to look

1			at that, that's at page 3283. It enclosed the request	
2			on behalf of the Minister from Mr. Power, who is in the	
3			policing division?	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5	209	Q.	Principal officer there?	11:34
6		Α.	Correct.	
7	210	Q.	If we just have a look at the first page of that. The	
8			letter refers to a number of different letters from	
9			Garda Keogh. Did you receive all of those?	
10		Α.	What I supplied to the Tribunal is what I received.	11:34
11	211	Q.	Yes. So, for example, on the first page there, there's	
12			26th July 2015. That's at page 3288. That's a letter	
13			that had in fact been addressed to the Director of	
14			Public Prosecutions and the Minister?	
15		Α.	Yeah.	11:35
16	212	Q.	Had you seen that before?	
17		Α.	No.	
18	213	Q.	Had you been made aware of its contents by anyone	
19			before?	
20		Α.	No.	11:35
21	214	Q.	The letter of the 14th June to the Minister, page 3302.	
22			That refers directly to you in a number of respects.	
23			In the second paragraph, it says:	
24				
25			"On 3rd June 2016, I met Chief Superintendent	11:36
26			McLoughlin, who was recently appointed by the	
27			Commissioner to oversee protected disclosures very	
28			recently. I understand that he has corrected my sick	
29			Leave record. I was recorded as being out sick with	

Т		flu by Superintendent Pat Murray, despite my doctor's	
2		certification of my condition as work related stress.	
3		I informed Chief Superintendent McLoughlin of the	
4		consistent and relentless harassment I was put through	
5		for 20 months while trying to do my work after I became	11:36
6		a whistleblower. As previously stated, I received no	
7		harassment from my colleagues, including ranks of	
8		Gardaí, sergeants and inspectors. My harassment was	
9		from two senior management closer to the Garda	
10		Commissioner, I named the two individuals, Chief	11:36
11		Superintendent Mark Curran, who was the divisional	
12		officer in Westmeath until March 2015, Superintendent	
13		Pat Murray arrived in Athlone district office in March	
14		2015. "	
15			11:36
16		He then refers to different events there. At the	
17		bottom, he doesn't complain about Chief Wheatley there,	
18		in fact, but at the last paragraph he says:	
19			
20		"Chief Superintendent Tony McLoughlin undertook to	11:37
21		investigate the harassment I received from elements	
22		within Garda management. One example of which"	
23			
24		And he refers to cancelling leave there. You don't	
25		regard that as an accurate statement of your meeting?	11:37
26	Α.	Not the outcome of the meeting, no, because I was	
27		fairly clear in my understanding at the time that I	
28		asked Garda Keogh if he wished me to pursue the matters	
29		that we had discussed and he did say to me that, no,	

1			not at that time, he had made those complaints to	
2			another I think it was to GSOC, and that's where he	
3			wanted them to be pursued.	
4	215	Q.	Yes.	
5		Α.	That is my interpretation. Rightly or wrongly, that is	11:37
6			the interpretation I had when I left the meeting.	
7	216	Q.	Yes. In any event, he refers to these issues and he is	
8			linking it, it would appear, for the first time, on	
9			page 3304, with the promotion issue of Superintendent	
10			Murray. In the second last paragraph there, there is	11:38
11			reference to a quotation from the Garda Commissioner	
12			Nóirín O'Sullivan. Then the last five lines:	
13				
14			"Of course, it will come as no surprise that the Garda	
15			Commissioner is rewarding Superintendent Murray by way	11:38
16			of promotion from superintendent to chief	
17			superintendent whilst the harassment allegations are	
18			being investigated and prior to the Policing Authority	
19			taking over the promotion procedure in relation to An	
20			Garda Sí ochána. "	11:38
21				
22			Then he consents to his identity being disclosed by you	
23			to the Garda Commissioner, also by GSOC. Had you been	
24			aware of any issue surrounding the promotion of	
25			Superintendent Murray's at that time?	11:39
26		Α.	I think maybe Garda Keogh might may have mentioned it	
27			to me in one or two of the conversations, yes, that he	
28			had an issue with it.	
29	217	Q.	Yes. The third letter there, which was provided with	

1			Mr. Power's letter, is the letter of 16th May 2016 to	
2			the Minister, at page 3292.	
3		Α.	3292?	
4	218	Q.	3292.	
5		Α.	Yeah.	11:39
6	219	Q.	It's a five-page letter. It recites many of the	
7			complaints against Superintendent Murray over the first	
8			couple of pages. At the bottom of the second page it	
9			refers to outlining the harassment to Dr. Oghuvbu in	
10			December. It refers to his pay issue at the bottom of	11:40
11			page 3294. It refers to the DPP's decision and GSOC.	
12			At the bottom of the last page, he is asking three	
13			things:	
14				
15			"First of all, that the Garda file into the allegations	11:40
16			handed to GSOC without further delay to enable GSOC	
17			carry out their investigation.	
18				
19			2. My request for a copy of Deputy Commissioner	
20			Ó Cualáin's report containing his findings into my	11:41
21			allegations via the Department of Justice.	
22				
23			3. I would ask you, Minister, to give some	
24			consideration to ensuring that somebody in my position	
25			as a whistleblower, who is forced out on sick leave	11:41
26			with work related stress, should not be penalised	
27			financially as well as professionally and that such	
28			sick leave should warrant full pay and be classified as	
29			injury on duty as it is most certainty 100% duty	

1			related. I am presently facing financial victimisation	
2			on top of everything else, which is also in	
3			contravention of the protections offered under	
4			protected disclosures Act 2014."	
5				11:41
6			So all those things together, you got Mr. Power's	
7			letter, these three letters and you were, I think,	
8			given the responsibility of providing a response to the	
9			request?	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:41
11	220	Q.	Now, that obviously took some time?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	221	Q.	On the first issue you sent a letter to Assistant	
14			Commissioner Ó Cualáin, is that right?	
15		Α.	Yes.	11:42
16	222	Q.	You were looking for an update on his views in relation	
17			to the allegations made by Garda Keogh in respect of	
18			his investigation. If we just look at that, page 3311.	
19			On the same day you wrote to the Commissioner's private	
20			secretary, keeping the Commissioner informed as to what	11:42
21			you were seeking?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	223	Q.	And from whom?	
24		Α.	That was primarily to let them know that I was	
25			progressively actioning the request and to provide a	11:43
26			report, but it was going to take some time to do it.	
27	224	Q.	Yes. You wrote back to Chief Wheatley in relation to	
28			her report of the 25th July, directing her to send her	
29			correspondence in that regard to the executive director	

- for the attention of the Sick Section?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 225 O. Is that correct?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 226 Q. That was a letter which I think was effectively a
- 6 second report that she had -- you saw then a second
- 7 report that she did send in, at page 3314, isn't that

11 · 45

- 8 correct?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 227 Q. It's a very short report but she was again asking about 11:44
- 11 whether she was required to start an investigation
- 12 locally?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 228 Q. I think in the context of your knowledge about the
- complaints of harassment and the allegations that Garda 11:44
- 16 Keogh had made, had you learned for the first time that
- there was all this detail to his complaints and that he
- had previously given the harassment index to
- 19 Dr. Oghuvbu?
- A. I don't think I was aware, from what I can remember, of 11:44
- 21 me being aware that he had giving them to Dr. Oghuvbu.
- Now I could be mistaken, but I don't remember at any
- 23 stage being made aware of that.
- 24 229 Q. Yes. In any event, on the harassment side, I think you
- 25 took the matter up with the chief superintendent for
- Human Resources and People Development about whether
- 27 there had been a record --
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 230 Q. -- of any complaint being made by Garda Keogh under the

1			harassment policy?	
2		Α.	Yeah, when I got the report down, or when I got the	
3			request to do a section 41 and when I looked at	
4			documentations attached to it, and particularly where	
5			it referenced the fact that Garda Keogh was of the view	11:45
6			that he had made the complaint to me on the 3rd June, I	
7			then started to get behind that to try and see well,	
8			okay, if that's what his view was, then I better start	
9			bottoming that out to the point of seeing if I could	
10			get Garda Keogh to confirm that or otherwise. And so,	11:45
11			I started to converse with the exec director, who had	
12			responsibility for bullying and harassment at that	
13			time.	
14	231	Q.	Yes. Who was that?	
15		Α.	Alan Mulligan.	11:46
16	232	Q.	Yes. And I think Kathleen Hassett replied to your	
17			letter of the 9th?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	233	Q.	On the 15th, if we just look at that, page 3315?	
20		Α.	Yeah.	11:46
21	234	Q.	She said:	
22				
23			"There is no record in this section of any complaint	
24			being been made by Garda Keogh."	
25				11:46
26			I think you had written out to Garda Keogh himself on	
27			the 9th?	
28		Α.	Yes.	

29 235 Q. And he wrote back to you on the 16th, in relation to

1			the three issues?	
2		Α.	Yeah.	
3	236	Q.	GSOC, pay and harassment. His letter is at 3316. He	
4			says:	
5				11:47
6			"I am writing in reply to your letter dated 9th August	
7			2016. I am much obliged that you are actively	
8			addressing certain matters raised by me.	
9				
10			In relation to making contact with GSOC, I presume this	11:47
11			relates to the handing over of the Garda investigation	
12			file to GSOC within the specified time as requested. I	
13			consent to this and to the disclosure of my identity	
14			pursuant to the Protected Disclosures Act 2014 for	
15			same."	11:47
16				
17			Just on that point, did you understand that he wanted	
18			GSOC to re investigate his allegations or just that	
19			they be given the file that they can commence their own	
20			assessment of the file, or was it clear on that?	11:47
21		Α.	I wasn't clear on it, to be honest. What I felt was	
22			that Garda Keogh had made a complaint or a disclosure	
23			to GSOC and I understood that it included all and every	
24			aspect of the issues that he was dealing with at that	
25			time. I was then subsequently made aware that there	11:48
26			was an issue from his perspective, as he saw it, that	
27			the GSOC investigation was not proceeding because of a	
28			file not being released to them. Therefore, I started	
29			to take up the baton if you like in relation to that	

1			aspect as well with GSOC.	
2	237	Q.	The second line there, the second paragraph says he	
3			gives his permission for you to liaise with the	
4			civilian head of HR, that's Mr. Barrett or	
5			Mr. Mulligan?	11:48
6		Α.	No, it would be Mr. Mulligan.	
7	238	Q.	Mr. Mulligan?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	239	Q.	In the third paragraph:	
10				11:48
11			"However, the issue of most concern to me at the moment	
12			is that of the harassment I endured from elements	
13			within Garda management. I would be interested to know	
14			if any progress has been made on that front. It is of	
15			particular concern at the moment as I am aware that at	11:48
16			least one of the two persons I named in relation to	
17			this harassment, namely Superintendent Pat Murray, is	
18			number 14 on a promotion list to the rank of chief	
19			superintendent. I presume he has been recommended for	
20			promotion by the Garda Commissioner Nóirín O'Sullivan,	11:49
21			who is aware of these harassment allegations. Has the	
22			Garda Commissioner notified the Minister for Justice	
23			and the Policing Authority of this as it is relevant	
24			information for them to be aware of."	
25				11:49

So that's a very direct question in any event.

27 A. Yeah.

28 240 Q. Which we will come to. In relation to these, I think 29 you wrote to GSOC on the 19th looking for a report in

Т			respect of their investigations into any allegations	
2			made by Garda Keogh. You recite that you were given	
3			permission. You update the Commissioner on what you	
4			are doing on the same date. You also write back to	
5			Garda Keogh on the same date and your letter is at	11:49
6			3319, perhaps we can just look at that. The second	
7			paragraph:	
8				
9			"I wish to advise you that I have pursued the issue of	
10			your pay and have written to the civilian HR in Navan	11:50
11			in order to progress same."	
12				
13			Did that reflect your intention to try and have him put	
14			back on full pay?	
15		Α.	Absolutely.	11:50
16	241	Q.	In the second paragraph you say:	
17				
18			"In the interest of clarity, I wish to ask if a formal	
19			complaint was made by you under the harassment, sexual	
20			harassment and bullying policy in relation to the other	11:50
21			complaints made by you.	
22				
23			With regard to the relevant promotions, I wish to point	
24			out that the promotions process is overseen by an	
25			independent board made up of two civilians from outside	11:50
26			of An Garda Síochána, with one acting as Chair and the	
27			Commissioner mass no role in the selection of same.	
28			They are selected by the Department of Justice and	
29			Equal i ty. "	

Τ				
2			That's is the new Policing Authority?	
3		Α.	No.	
4	242	Q.	No, that was the then existing board?	
5		Α.	Yes.	11:51
6	243	Q.	Yes, that's correct. Garda Keogh wrote back to you on	
7			the 1st September in relation to that. You received	
8			that on the 5th, and that's at page 3321?	
9		Α.	Yeah.	
10	244	Q.	And he says:	11:51
11				
12			"I wish to acknowledge your letter dated 19th August	
13			2016. I have posted documents to you in relation to	
14			the harassment on 29/8/16. I hope you have received	
15			same."	11:51
16				
17			Had you received them by the time you got this letter?	
18		Α.	Sorry, could you repeat that?	
19	245	Q.	Had you received these documents?	
20		Α.	Oh I did, sorry, I did. I beg your pardon, I did,	11:51
21			yeah.	
22	246	Q.	"I am writing in relation to the question of a formal	
23			complaint being made by me regarding the harassment and	
24			the answer is no. I first reported this harassment	
25			when it started to Deputy Commissioner Donal Ó Cualáin	11:51
26			on 7th June 2014. Deputy Commissioner Ó Cualáin	
27			informed me that he was 'only dealing with what was in	
28			my affidavit'.	
29				

1			The issue of harassment has been raised over 20 times	
2			in the Dáil and I have written to the Minister for	
3			Justice Ms. Francis Fitzgerald regarding same on a	
4			number of occasions and she is aware of it.	
5				11:52
6			Forwarded for your information please."	
7				
8			I think the documents that you received are all	
9			documents that the Tribunal has seen in the course of	
10			its investigation of complaints related to the actual	11:52
11			allegations. I don't think we need to go into them.	
12			They are a considerable portion of one of your exhibits	
13			there, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct, yeah.	
15	247	Q.	I think you then, having received this letter, phoned	11:52
16			Garda Keogh, is that right?	
17		Α.	Yeah. If it's in my notes, yeah.	
18	248	Q.	If we look at page 3414. This seems to be in the way	
19			of updating Garda Keogh.	
20		Α.	Yeah.	11:54
21	249	Q.	The reference to GSOC there, "GSOC rang yesterday" is	
22			that right?	
23		Α.	That's correct.	
24	250	Q.	"Act 2005" is that right?	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:54
26	251	Q.	And then a reference to	
27		Α.	"GSOC going to meet Donal Ó Cualáin."	
28				
29			Yes.	

252 That's a meeting scheduled for the 20th 1 Q. Yes. 2 September? 3 Yes. Α. 4 253 There is a reference then "GSOC's protected disclosure. 0. 5 GSOC meeting HR matter." 11:54 6 7 What's the last? 8 "Only and a matter for HR." Α. 9 10 So what that was really saying to me was, that the 11:54 11 complaints of bullying and harassment, GSOC had decided 12 that they are now a matter for An Garda Síochána, not a 13 matter for them 14 254 Q. So the summary at the bottom is the take away 15 point, as it were? 11:54 16 Yes. Α. 17 255 "GSOC phoned yesterday and said bullying and harassment Q. 18 is a matter for An Garda Síochána." 19 Yes. Α. So it wasn't going to be considered by them? 20 256 Q. 11:55 21 Α. 22 So that's further informing him that that's not the 257 Q. 23 avenue? 24 And it brought clarity to me then about where Exactly. Α. 25 this was going or not going, as the case may be, 11:55

26

27

28

29

258

Ο.

Yes.

because I was of the understanding that those elements

of Garda Keogh's complaints were gone to GSOC, from the

You kept the Commissioner informed then through a

conversation I had with Garda Keogh on the 3rd June.

- three-page report of 8th September 2016. It commences
- 2 at page 3415.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 259 Q. I don't think we need to go through it in detail, but
- 5 you reported on the various updates that you had been

11:56

11:56

- 6 seeking, the welfare interventions in relation to pay.
- 7 You obviously reported that he had not made a formal
- 8 complaint, that GSOC took the view it wasn't within
- 9 their remit and that if Garda Keogh wanted to do so, he
- 10 would have to make a formal complaint.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 260 Q. And that the issues be investigated?
- 13 A. What I wasn't saying there necessarily was that Garda
- 14 Keogh hadn't complained of various issues.
- 15 261 Q. Yes.
- 16 A. What I was saying there was that we, in accordance with
- our policy, hadn't received a formal complaint from
- 18 Garda Keogh and my understanding at the time was that
- they were gone to GSOC, rightly or wrongly. Like, I
- 20 wouldn't like to say or suggest that Garda Keogh hadn't 11:56
- 21 mentioned these things in the past.
- 22 262 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. He had.
- 24 263 Q. Yes. You included I think a number of the response
- 25 with that report to the private secretary?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 264 Q. I think that you received a copy of the correspondence
- sent by the commissioner back to the parties.
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 265 Q. That's dated -- that dated, I think, but you received
- 2 it anyway on the 9th September and it includes a lot of
- 3 the information provided by you to the Commissioner?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 266 Q. You received from Assistant Commissioner Ó Cualáin on

11:58

11:58

11:59

- 6 his behalf a report from Detective Superintendent
- 7 Mulcahy which he prepared, giving an overview of the
- 8 investigation which was dated the 21st September. Have
- 9 perhaps I have the date wrong? 2nd September 2016.
- That's to be found at 3432. So you had a overview of
- 11 the investigation?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 267 Q. The outcome of it at that point in time?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 268 Q. Now, you had a meeting in and around that period with
- Mr. Barrett and Mr. Mulligan?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 269 Q. Can you describe to us in evidence the purpose of that
- 19 at that time and the issues discussed?
- 20 A. From memory it was a single item meeting. I am not
- sure how it was called or when it was called, but I do
- recollect the meeting very clearly. It was in John
- 23 Barrett's office. And it was -- I suppose it was a
- follow up to some of the e-mails that I had been making
- in relation to the pay and it was a meeting to decide
- on what we were going to do relative to pay, based on
- 27 my recommendations. So it was a meeting held in the
- office. I made my recommendations. I outlined the
- rationale as to why I was making those recommendations

1 and the exec director at the time agreed with those 2 recommendations and that started in motion then the 3 process whereby Garda Keogh was restored to pay. It would appear to be likely that that discussion took 4 270 0. 5 place sometime before the 26th September, because you 12:00 6 sent an e-mail to Claire Egan? 7 Yes, yes. Α. 8 271 That's at page 3441? Q. 9 That's correct. Α. 10 272 That's stated the 26th September? 0. 12:00 11 Yes. Α. 12 273 This represents then the combined view of the three of 0. 13 you? 14 Α. Yes. 15 274 Is that right? Q. 12:00 16 That's correct. Well, I presented the case to both Α. 17 Mr. Mulligan and to the exec director. I outlined four 18 or five reasons as to why we should restore the member 19 to pay and I think everybody was in agreement that it 20 was the right thing to do at that time. 12:00 21 275 Yes. Q. 22 I was basing it on, well, a human element, more Α. 23 importantly than anything else. I based it on the fact 24 that there was precedent for it in the organisation, I 25 think there was one or if not two people at that time 12:01 had been treated the same. I based it on the fact that 26 27 there were still no conclusions relative to work

28

29

related stress or other elements that Garda Keogh had

complained of. I based it on the fact that the PD

1			legislation at that time in my view was very clear in	
2			terms of what penalisation would look like in terms of	
3			a reduction in wages, despite the fact that the sick	
4			pay regulations would suggest something different, but	
5			we didn't have a lot of opinion at that time. And	12:01
6			finally then, what was important to me was that the	
7			Garda Commissioner at the time and in our own policies	
8			we were suggesting that we would support in every which	
9			way we could anybody who was going to make a complaint	
10			under the Protected Disclosure Acts. And I felt	12:01
11			therefore that the right thing to do and the right	
12			recommendation to make at that time was that Garda	
13			Keogh be restored to pay. I stand over that to this	
14			day, that that was the right decision to make at that	
15			time.	12:02
16	276	Q.	Yes. I think the Tribunal asked a number of direct	
17			questions, which you reported on in the recent past?	
18		Α.	That's correct.	
19	277	Q.	They deal very clearly with that issue and they're in	
20			Volume 58, at page 16418. I don't intend to go through	12:02
21			the questions but you summarised the answers there in	
22			your last piece of evidence to me, isn't that correct?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	278	Q.	Obviously the Tribunal has heard of a different view of	
25			the effect of the 1994 regulations	12:02
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	279	Q.	on the operation of Garda Keogh, in relation to his	

position?

A. Yes.

28

29

2 grounds, is that correct? 3 Well, the category that's provided to Garda Keogh's Α. current absence is mental health, but within that it is 4 5 work related stress. 12:03 6 281 And is it so recorded? Q. 7 My understanding is, yes, that's how it is recorded. Α. 8 282 In any event, I think you got confirmation from the HR Q. 9 directorate in Navan on the 6th October, is that 10 correct? 12:03 11 That's correct. Α. 12 That that recommendation had been accepted. 283 0. 13 Yes. Α. If we look at page 3442. 14 284 Q. That says: 15 12:03 16 "Garda Keogh has been reinstated to full pay status, 17 backdated to the commencement of his absence from 26th 18 December 2015. All arrears owed to him will be paid on 19 Thursday, 13th October, this day week. I have been in 20 contact with Mick Quinn to advise him of same." 12:04 21 22 I think, did you yourself phone Garda Keogh the next 23 day. 24 Yes. Α. To inform him of that? 25 285 0. 12:04 26 Yes. Α. 27 286 I think you have a note to that effect on 3443? Q. 28 Α. Yes.

Currently he stands marked out on mental health

280

Q.

1

29

287

Q.

But I think you have noted there a sort of caveat in

Т			relation to him being unnappy that his complaint of	
2			bullying and harassment was to be investigated	
3			internally?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	288	Q.	He, I think, was concerned that he had complained to	12:05
6			the Minister obviously in relation to the Commissioner	
7			and that his view was that as the Commissioner was a	
8			party to his harassment it ought to be conducted	
9			externally. And he said that he had written to the	
10			Minister about that?	12:05
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	289	Q.	I think you presumably weren't in a position to respond	
13			to that?	
14		Α.	No, to reflect on whether or not it was appropriate or	
15			otherwise. Our policy is very clear.	12:05
16	290	Q.	I think Chief Superintendent Curran, who was working	
17			then in the Commissioner's office, confirmed to you	
18			that a case conference should be called to deal with	
19			the matter, is that right?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:05
21	291	Q.	3444. And he was asking you were there any outstanding	
22			issues with GSOC?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	292	Q.	Were there any insofar as	
25		Α.	As far as I recall, obviously I got a call from GSOC,	12:06
26			so that matter had been dealt with. And in relation to	
27			the file that was holding up that Garda Keogh felt	
28			was holding up the investigation, I think that had been	
29			dealt with as well at that time. I am not a hundred	

Т			percent sure but I think it was. So from that	
2			perspective there was no outstanding matters as far as	
3			we were concerned, as far as I was concerned, with	
4			GSOC.	
5	293	Q.	Yes. I think you wrote to Garda Keogh on the 12th,	12:06
6			just formally to inform him of the payroll situation	
7			and also to refer to that issue of bullying and	
8			harassment again?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	294	Q.	If we look at page 3467.	12:06
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	295	Q.	The second paragraph:	
13				
14			"I wish to advise you that I have pursued the issue of	
15			your pay and have written to civilian HR in Navan in	12:07
16			order to progress same. At this stage you should be	
17			returned to the payroll.	
18				
19			In the interest of clarity and completeness, I wish to	
20			ask if it is your intention to make a formal complaint	12:07
21			under harassment, sexual harassment and bullying and	
22			harassment policy in addition to other complaints made	
23			by you. I appreciate that you indicated to me on the	
24			phone that it is not your intention to do so."	
25				12:07
26			Had he said that on the phone?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	296	Q.	He acknowledged that and wrote back to you the next	
29			day, or sorry, a few days later on the 20th?	

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	297	Q.	And that's at page 3468, it seems to have been received	
3			on the 24th?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	298	Q.	It says:	12:08
6				
7			"I wish to acknowledge receipt of your correspondence.	
8			I also acknowledge that I have been returned to the	
9			payrol I.	
10				12:08
11			I accept I made an indication to you regarding	
12			harassment and bullying. However, the fact that I have	
13			reported this and have supplied relevant documents to	
14			support my allegations, I understand there are	
15			obligations for both myself and An Garda Síochána to	12:08
16			have this investigated under the terms of the	
17			harassment and bullying policy of An Garda Síochána and	
18			I wish to make a formal complaint in relation to same.	
19				
20			Forwarded for your information please."	12:08
21				
22			I think that was the first occasion when there was a	
23			very definitive response given by Garda Keogh to that	
24			issue?	
25		Α.	Yes. From my perspective, yes.	12:08
26	299	Q.	From your perspective.	
27		Α.	Yes, most definitely.	
28	300	Q.	I think you sent that on to the director of civilian	
29			HR	

1	Λ	Yes.
<b>T</b>	Α.	res.

- 2 301 Q. -- on the 26th, at page 3469. You recommend that this formal complaint be investigated fully?
- 4 A. Yes
- 5 302 Now, obviously we know from the sequence of events that 12:09 Q. 6 there was somebody appointed to investigate it in 7 November, November 2017. That seems like a long time 8 between Garda Keogh making his position clear and Assistant Commissioner Finn, as it turned out, being 9 Does that period of time cause you any 10 12:10 11 concern, as to whether it was done quickly enough or 12 dealt with appropriately enough?
- 13 In terms of appropriately enough, I think there was a Α. 14 lot of issues going on, so I would say, I'd have to say 15 that it was appropriate. Obviously in terms of delay, 16 you would like these things to be investigated as quickly as possible and our policy outlines various 17 18 timeframes associated with it. But, like, yes, the 19 answer is, the delay, you'd like to see these things 20 done quicker, yes.

12:10

- 21 303 Q. Now we will see the different interventions from the
  22 different parties involved Garda Keogh, his
  23 solicitors, Superintendent Scanlan etcetera but at
  24 this point in time does it leave your hands in terms of
  25 the responsibility for progressing the investigation?
- A. Yes, it does. I was the conduit for the complaint. I passed that on to the appropriate authority, which was the bullying and harassment section, who then went about appointing the various people to do the

- 1 investigation, yes.
- 2 304 Q. You were kept informed obviously, I think, at a number
- 3 of stages?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 305 Q. And you participated in case conferences that we will

12:12

12:12

12.12

- 6 come to in due course?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 306 Q. But Mr. Mulligan replied to you on the 15th November,
- 9 attaching a response that had issued to Garda Keogh,
- 10 isn't that correct?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 307 Q. That response that issued is set out at page 3472.
- 13 That's under Mr. Barrett's hand?
- 14 A. Yeah.
- 15 308 Q. Mr. Barrett then, he was the appropriate person to be
- the owner of that, as it were?
- 17 A. Ultimately, yes. He's the head of HR and he obviously
- 18 would have had a team of people dealing with -- a small
- team, actually, of dealing with bullying and harassment
- on his behalf.
- 21 309 Q. The letter obviously doesn't go into any of the
- 22 substance of the allegations --
- 23 A. No.
- 24 310 Q. -- that Garda Keogh had raised. But can I ask you
- 25 this: Had you forwarded on to the HR directorate any
- of the documentation that Garda Keogh had given you?
- 27 A. Yeah, because I was in receipt, as mentioned by Garda
- 28 Keogh in one of his letters, an envelope of documents,
- 29 which I think we alluded to earlier in the course of

- 1 this morning. And I had that, I kept that under lock 2 and key. Then, I think it was around the end of 3 October or into November when I passed that list of documentation on to Ms. Kathleen Hassett for the 4 5 purpose of adding it to the file, the bullying and 12:13 harassment file. 6 7 Mr. Barrett is making it clear here, in the third 311 Yes. Q.
- 7 311 Q. Yes. Mr. Barrett is making it clear here, in the third
  8 line obviously, that you do have no role in this and he
  9 sets out then what the policy is and summarises some of
  10 the crucial parts of the policy as far as a complainant 12:13
  11 is concerned, isn't that right?
- 12 A. That's correct.
- 13 312 Q. You phone Garda Keogh some short time after you receive 14 this. You say in your statement you were seeking an 15 update, an update from him really, as to what he was doing, is it?
- 17 A. In relation to?
- 18 313 Q. The bullying complaint.
- 19 Well, I wouldn't be seeking an update from Garda Keogh Α. 20 necessarily; I would have been informing him of the 12:14 various actions that had been taken. The only thing 21 22 would I have been seeking from Garda Keogh necessarily 23 would have been how he was, how he was getting on, how 24 he felt and any further supports that would have been 25 But he did make reference to an issue, as he 12:14 26 saw it, in relation to the bullying and harassment 27 complaint.
- 28 314 Q. Perhaps we will just look at the note then, page 3474?
- 29 A. Yes.

1	315	Q.	"Contact to mobile phone offering support and update on	
2			bullying and harassment complaint. Garda"	
3				
4			Is that acknowledged?	
5		Α.	"Garda confirmed receipt of the minute from	12:15
6			Mr. Mulligan and understood process to be followed but	
7			he was now going to seek legal advice and he had issues	
8			making his complaint to Chief Superintendent Gralton	
9			because of a conflict of interest. He is [something]	
10			of the support."	12:15
11	316	Q.	"Appreciative of the support"?	
12		Α.	Yeah. "Particularly his pay and was in good spirits.	
13			He would reply to Mr. Mulligan in course."	
14	317	Q.	Did you know of any particular issue? He didn't	
15			outline what conflict with chief superintendent	12:15
16			Gralton, who preceded Chief Superintendent Wheatley	
17			there?	
18		Α.	I'm not a hundred percent sure as to whether or not	
19			there was any reference to what the conflict was, to be	
20			honest. If there was, I might have taken a note of it,	12:16
21			but suffice to say he had an issue, a conflictual	
22			issue, as he saw it, with Chief Gralton.	
23	318	Q.	I think you brought this to Mr. Mulligan's attention,	
24			this view of Garda Keogh, isn't that right?	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:16
26	319	Q.	You discussed the possibility of going down to meet	
27			Garda Keogh.	
28		Α.	That's correct.	
29	320	Q.	Perhaps with a solicitor, isn't that right?	

Т		Α.	That's correct, year, I think there was a phone carl or	
2			there was a report in from Garda Keogh's solicitor in	
3			relation to these events and I recall, it could have	
4			been a Friday evening, that Mr. Mulligan rang	
5			Mr. Cullen and we offered to go and meet him that	12:16
6			evening, if needs be.	
7	321	Q.	Yes. I think that offer was declined and then you	
8			considered an alternative of offering the services of	
9			Ms. Hassett to assist in any completion of the form?	
10		Α.	Exactly.	12:17
11	322	Q.	To meet with Garda Keogh if that would help?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	323	Q.	And I don't know, was that offer then actually followed	
14			through? Was Garda Keogh or his solicitors informed of	
15			that proposal, do you recall?	12:17
16		Α.	I think subsequent correspondence would indicate that	
17			Garda Keogh was offered, if he wanted to make the	
18			complaint other than to Chief Gralton, he could do so	
19			directly to Mr. Mulligan or myself, even though	
20	324	Q.	Yes. I think you were copied in the correspondence	12:17
21			that Mr. Cullen sent to Mr. Barrett, which was	
22			correspondence that he, Mr. Cullen, had directed to	
23			Mr. Barrett and also the Minister, the Commissioner,	
24			which was correspondence dated 23rd November 2016, to	
25			be found at 3476.	12:18
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	325	Q.	There's a number of concerns there. Obviously there	
28			was public knowledge of a review being carried out by	
29			Mr. Justice O'Neill and there were a number of issues	

1 raised in that letter on the second page. Raised an 2 issue, on the next page, 3477, of an immediate 3 investigation into, it says Garda Patrick Murray there. It raises the issue of the suspension and is addressing 4 5 in a number of different ways Superintendent Murray's 12:19 6 position vis-à-vis the promotion issue? 7 Yes. Α. 8 326 And Garda Keogh's complaints. Did you discuss that Ο. letter with Mr. Barrett or Mr. Mulligan then? 9 I don't recall that I did in any detail, no, or in 12:19 10 Α. 11 any shape or form. It was sent to me just for my -- it 12 was cc'd to me, I think. 13 I think you became aware that the Commissioner's office 327 Q. 14 requested Mr. Barrett to arrange for the taking of a 15 statement of complaint from Garda Keogh as soon as 12:20 16 possible? 17 Yes. Α. 18 I think that was by letter dated the 16th December, is 328 Q. that correct? 19 20 That's correct. Α. 12:20 21 329 I think you were requested then to provide a response, Q. 22 or to help provide a response for the Commissioner to issues raised in that letter? 23 24 Yes. Α. 25 I think Mr. Barrett made that request of you in 330 Ο. 12:20

73

That's correct.

26

27

28

29

331

Α.

Q.

Perhaps we will just look at that, at page 3492.

December and a report was sent to the Commissioner 's

office by you on the 9th December, isn't that correct?

1		Α.	My office became the conduit for the completion of many	
2			of the reports that the Commissioner requested or	
3			required at that time.	
4	332	Q.	Yes. You say in the second paragraph that you can't	
5			provide assistance regarding the inclusion of the	12:21
6			complaints in Mr. Justice O'Neill's report or the	
7			request for copies of the reports that had been sought	
8			from the Minister by Garda Keogh?	
9		Α.	That's correct.	
10	333	Q.	And in relation to the issue of protected disclosures	12:22
11			and the issue of the Ó Cualáin investigation, you	
12			reported on that at the bottom of that page, 3492, into	
13			3493?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	334	Q.	In relation to the bullying and harassment issue, you	12:22
16			report on the to-ing and fro-ing, if I could put it	
17			that way?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	335	Q.	You do that down to the bottom of page 3493?	
20		Α.	Yes.	12:22
21	336	Q.	In relation to issue of pay, you report on that onto	
22			the top of 3494 and then you report on welfare issues.	
23			But the bottom line, take away points, if I can	
24			describe them as that, 3494, the bottom:	
25				12:23
26			"Bullying and harassment: A formal complaint from	
27			Garda Keogh is awaited.	
28				
29			Discipline: The investigation by Assistant	

1			Commissioner Nolan is ongoing.	
2				
3			GSOC. Correspondence has been sent to GSOC seeking an	
4			update on the matter."	
5		Α.	Yes.	12:23
6	337	Q.	Now, I think you were aware that correspondence had	
7			come in from Mr. Cullen's office on the 15th December.	
8			If we look at page 3505. They are asking very clearly	
9			and briefly there when and where he can make a	
10			statement of complaint?	12:24
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	338	Q.	I think you became aware that Mr. Barrett had nominated	
13			Chief Superintendent Roche, is that correct?	
14		Α.	I'm not if it's in my documentation yes. I'm not	
15			sure whether I specifically became aware it was Chief	12:24
16			Roche or otherwise who had been appointed to do the	
17			investigation. But if it was in correspondence to me,	
18			most definitely, yes.	
19	339	Q.	Yes.	
20			CHAIRMAN: Yes, maybe so.	12:24
21			MR. McGUINNESS: Perhaps we will just look to see did	
22			you get that. If we look at 3506.	
23			CHAIRMAN: 3506.	
24		Α.	Yes. I did receive that.	
25	340	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. Then what is behind that is	12:25
26			Mr. Barrett's letter to the assistant commissioner,	
27			Eastern Region, which would have been Assistant	
28			Commissioner Fanning at the time; is that right?	
29		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	

Т	341	Q.	II WE TOOK at that, at 350%. Was that a decision I	
2			see in the second paragraph Mr. Barrett says in the	
3			last line:	
4				
5			"I would appreciate if you would formalise that	12:25
6			appointment."	
7				
8			Is that the position, that the executive director would	
9			nominate or propose a nomination and the assistant	
10			commissioner would make the appointment?	12:25
11		Α.	I think ordinarily under the policy that's correct.	
12	342	Q.	Assistant Commissioner Fanning copied a letter, which I	
13			think you received, at 3508?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	343	Q.	The 22nd December. And he provided that information	12:26
16			then?	
17		Α.	Yes. And he addressed it to Chief Scanlan.	
18	344	Q.	Yes. Were you involved in any discussion as to who it	
19			should be	
20		Α.	No.	12:26
21	345	Q.	with either of the persons concerned?	
22		Α.	No.	
23	346	Q.	I think there is an issue there which became the	
24			subject of some considerable discussion, about	
25			determining whether the complaint came within the	12:27
26			policy for resolution and the appropriate person to be	
27			appointed as investigator in terms of rank or grade?	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	347	Q.	Had you any view on that at that stage?	

- 1 A. Not at that stage because I was peripheral to what was
- going on, but I think there was a conference later on
- or it came to a head and I did give my view at that
- 4 stage in relation to, I suppose -- I won't say my
- 5 concern, but I was anxious that the bullying and
- 6 harassment would get underway and get concluded as
- quickly as possible. But that's, for me on the outside

12:28

- 8 looking in, without necessarily any authority in
- 9 relation to how it went at that time.
- 10 348 Q. Yes. In any event, you were seeking an update from the 12:27
- chief superintendent in Internal Affairs about the
- 12 discipline inquiries --
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 349 Q. -- in January of 2017?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 350 Q. Why were you doing that at that stage?
- 17 A. I was doing all of that again because my office became
- the conduit for any requests from the Commissioner's
- office in terms of the update on the status of all
- 20 items and ancillary items associated with Garda Keogh's 12:28
- case.
- 22 351 Q. Yes.
- A. So in order for me to get the information I had to go
- to the various sections and units that had the
- information and that were dealing with it.
- 26 352 Q. Yes. You phoned and spoke to Garda Keogh I think on
- the 24th January then?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 353 Q. Had you received any information about his meeting with

1			Chief Scanlan at that stage or was there anything	
2			that	
3		Α.	No, I became aware that they met, okay. And I think,	
4			if memory serves me correctly, there was an issue over	
5			a conflict potentially of Chief Superintendent Scanlan	12:29
6			carrying out the investigation, that they may have	
7			worked together before. I became aware of that, I	
8			don't know how, but I was aware of it, yeah.	
9	354	Q.	You say in your statement that you had spoke with Garda	
10			Quinn on the 24th and he relayed a concern. Is your	12:29
11			note perhaps I misled the Tribunal there, your note	
12			on 3512, is that a note of your conversation with Garda	
13			Quinn rather than with Garda Keogh?	
14		Α.	Yes. So I returned a call to Garda Quinn.	
15	355	Q.	Yes. You do note a call in your statement on the 13th	12:29
16			January and you describe it on page 3241. There	
17			doesn't seem to be any mention of superintendent	
18			Scanlan in that, if we perhaps just confirm that?	
19		Α.	32	
20	356	Q.	At 3241, in the middle of that page.	12:30
21				
22			"Moreover, on the 13th January"	
23				
24		Α.	I don't have that in front of me at the moment.	
25	357	Q.	It should be on the screen there?	12:30
26		Α.	Okay.	
27	358	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Have you got your own statement, chief	
28			superintendent.	
29		Α.	Sorry, Judge?	

333	Q.	CHAIRMAN. Have you got your own statement:	
	Α.	I don't have it in front of me.	
360	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's no problem, we will get it for you.	
		3241 is your statement.	
	Α.	Okay.	12:3
361	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: It doesn't appear that there may have	
		been a mention of Superintendent Scanlan there, is that	
		correct, in that phone call of the 13th?	
	Α.	Yes, and that would be an oversight because it's	
		mentioned here in my notes.	12:3
362	Q.	Well, what you do mention in your notes seems to be the	
		call that you later had with Garda Quinn	
	Α.	Yes.	
363	Q.	on the 24th. If we just go back to page 3512.	
	Α.	Yes. That's a call I had with Garda Quinn and it	12:3
		referenced Chief Scanlan then. And when I spoke	
		with on the 24th January, when I spoke with	
		sorry, when I spoke with Garda Keogh on the 13th	
		January, that's what you are referencing, is it?	
364	Q.	Yes.	12:3
	Α.	"I made a call. No answer. Left a message. Garda	
		Keogh returned my call and spoke about member's health.	
		I provided Garda Keogh with an update, progression in	
		respect of bullying and harassment. I did not take a	
		note of this conversation but I did instruct Sergeant	12:3
		Donlon of its occurrence to put it in the record."	
		So from my recollection and my notes at that time, well	
	361 362 363	A. 360 Q.  A. 361 Q.  362 Q.  A. 363 Q. A. 364 Q.	A. I don't have it in front of me.  360 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's no problem, we will get it for you. 3241 is your statement.  A. Okay.  361 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: It doesn't appear that there may have been a mention of Superintendent Scanlan there, is that correct, in that phone call of the 13th?  A. Yes, and that would be an oversight because it's mentioned here in my notes.  362 Q. Well, what you do mention in your notes seems to be the call that you later had with Garda Quinn  A. Yes.  363 Q on the 24th. If we just go back to page 3512.  A. Yes. That's a call I had with Garda Quinn and it referenced Chief Scanlan then. And when I spoke with on the 24th January, when I spoke with sorry, when I spoke with Garda Keogh on the 13th January, that's what you are referencing, is it?  364 Q. Yes.  A. "I made a call. No answer. Left a message. Garda Keogh returned my call and spoke about member's health. I provided Garda Keogh with an update, progression in respect of bullying and harassment. I did not take a note of this conversation but I did instruct Sergeant Donlon of its occurrence to put it in the record."

I didn't have any notes, I don't remember a

29

- 1 conversation with Garda Keogh eliciting any information
- 2 relative to Chief Scanlan.
- 3 365 Q. Your journal of the 24th --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 366 Q. -- seems to relate to Garda Keogh's concern expressed

12:32

- 6 to Garda Quinn --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 367 Q. -- as to why Chief Roche was gone and Chief Scanlan was
- 9 now doing the investigation?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 368 Q. You said you were awaiting a report from Chief
- 12 Superintendent Scanlan, is that correct?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 369 Q. Would he report to you in the normal --
- 15 A. No. No, he wouldn't. I would follow up with a query
- on behalf of Garda Keogh.
- 17 370 Q. Yes. You would expect that you would be informed of it
- in any event?
- 19 A. Yes. Yeah.
- 20 371 Q. On the 27th January you wrote to Mr. Barrett, at page
- 21 3514, seeking an update.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 372 Q. I think you were copied in on a report from Chief
- Scanlan, at page 3516, which was sent to you on the
- 25 31st January? 12:32
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 373 Q. Is that correct?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 374 Q. This outlined in a little detail an issue about

1			possible conflict?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	375	Q.	It records there that Chief Superintendent Scanlan	
4			spoke with you on the 20th?	
5		Α.	That's correct.	12:33
6	376	Q.	Have you got a recollection of that?	
7		Α.	I do. I do actually.	
8	377	Q.	What was your view of that conflict issue?	
9		Α.	Well, obviously it would be a matter for Chief Scanlan,	
10			his assistant commissioner and the bullying and	12:33
11			harassment section in HQ to deal with that matter, if	
12			there was a conflict. Garda Keogh felt there was. I	
13			am not too sure how Chief Scanlan felt at the time.	
14			But I would have had no input into it whatsoever, other	
15			than to listen to what maybe either party had said in	12:33
16			relation to it.	
17	378	Q.	Were you concerned that he was returning the file in	
18			the light of this assertion and that he was seeking	
19			further directions on the matter?	
20		Α.	Well, I would have had a concern only in the context of	12:34
21			possible delay, but it was the right thing to do and if	
22			the conflict was there, well obviously the best thing	
23			to do would be to remove the conflict, if it was there.	
24	379	Q.	Yes. Obviously Assistant Commissioner Fanning	
25			subsequently raised an issue as to how Garda Keogh had	12:34
26			become aware of the intended appointment of Chief	
27			Superintendent Roche?	

380 Q. Are you in a position to throw any light on that?

28

29

A. Yeah.

- 1 A. No, I have no idea how.
- 2 381 Q. Anyway, Assistant Commissioner Fanning wrote on the
- 3 31st March to Mr. Barrett, which I think you must have

12:35

12:35

12:35

- 4 got a copy of. If we look at page 3517 there.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 382 Q. He expressed a firm view in the last paragraph about
- 7 his belief that Chief Superintendent Scanlan wasn't in
- 8 any way compromised and that it was really up to Garda
- 9 Keogh to advance the matter.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 383 Q. Did you agree with that or was it your position to have
- any view on that?
- 13 A. I wouldn't have had a view on it.
- 14 384 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. My view from previous experience in other cases would
- be, if there's a conflict of interest in any shape or
- form it's safer to remove that conflict in the
- interests of all parties concerned. But I wouldn't
- have had an input into whether or not there was in this
- case or what the correct decision was to be made. I
- 21 left that to the relevant authorities to iron that out.
- 22 385 Q. Yes. The issue of a case conference in relation to the
- 23 matter seems to have raised its head. I don't know
- 24 whether it is instigated by the chief administrative
- officer, Mr. Barrett I think sent you correspondence
- about an intended case conference?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 386 Q. I think that didn't occur?
- 29 A. Not initially anyway.

- Not initially. You say in your statement that it was 1 387 Q. 2 considered imprudent to hold a case conference?
- I think that was the view of the exec director at the 3 Α.
- time. 4

12:37

12:37

- 5 388 Yes. Did you have any view about that or not? Q.
- 6 No. Α.
- 7 Can I ask you, what was actually being done, to your 389 Q.
- 8 knowledge, at that stage to get the complaint taken?
- Well, I think every effort was being made by HR and the 9 Α. exec director and Mr. Mulligan to try and progress the 10
- 11 bullying and harassment as soon as possible.
- 12 obviously you have to deal with issues as they arise.
- 13 And this issue arose and it had to be dealt with before
- 14 it could be progressed further.
- 15 But you seem to have been pursuing it, because 390 Q.
- 16 you were writing for an update --
- 17 Α. Yes.
- 18 391 -- as of the 20th April? Q.
- 19 Yes. Α.
- At page 4524, you're writing to the executive director? 12:37 20 392 Q.
- Yes. And my primary role here was in relation to 21 Α.
- 22 keeping all of the matters moving so that, you know, in
- 23 the interests of everybody concerned, but also in the
- 24 interests of being able to report to the Commissioner
- 25 the progress that was being made on all of the various
- strands of this case. 26
- 27 393 Just in terms of trying to assess how things Q.
- 28 progressed and the space that they progressed at, what
- 29 did you expect would be the normal course to be taken

1			with the complaint when it was received, taken by Chief	
2			Superintendent Scanlan and transmitted?	
3		Α.	In the normal course of events, all things being equal	
4			and if there was no issues associated with Chief	
5			Scanlan, would have met Garda Keogh, would have taken a	12:38
6			detailed complaint from him, would have met and	
7			discussed and investigated and met other parties	
8			involved in it, and then would have compiled a report,	
9			an investigative report and sent it forward to the	
10			appointing officer, who in this case was AC Fanning.	12:38
11			Now that's with a clear wind and with no issues, but we	
12			all know that from time to time there are things that	
13			are encountered and have to be dealt with as you go on	
14			that road.	
15	394	Q.	Well, your letter there of the 20th April, it was	12:38
16			responded to by Mr. Barrett on the 28th, if we look at	
17			page 3525. That says:	
18				
19			"Please be advised that Garda Keogh met with Chief	
20			Superintendent Scanlan on the 2nd and 27th March and	12:39
21			Garda Keogh provided the chief superintendent with a	
22			prepared statement and appendices.	
23				
24			These documents are currently being considered by	
25			assistant commissioner earn region. I will advise you	12:39
26			of developments on receipt of a further report from	
27			that assistant commissioner."	
28				
29			That is Assistant Commissioner Fanning, is it?	

Т		Α.	res.	
2	395	Q.	So it was your understanding that the statements were	
3			with him and being considered by him at that point?	
4		Α.	That's what that is saying, yes.	
5	396	Q.	Yes. Had you received any other update from anyone	12:3
6			else at that point in time as to where the documents	
7			were or what was happening?	
8		Α.	No, other than what's in my statement to the Tribunal.	
9	397	Q.	Yes. You do obviously jump from that period in late	
10			April to the 19th July in your statement. On the 19th	12:4
11			July you received copy correspondence from Mr. Barrett,	
12			which was enclosing correspondence from Mr. Cullen	
13			dated the 12th July. That's at page 3527. This raises	
14			the issue of the classification of Garda Keogh's	
15			absence being recorded as mental health. Is that	12:4
16			something that you are you clear that Garda Keogh	
17			was aware, from your dealings with him in 2016, that it	
18			was recorded as mental health and he was aware of that	
19			at that time?	
20		Α.	Well, I think Garda Keogh would have raised it with me	12:4
21			in terms of his unease with the fact that it was	
22			recorded as mental health. Other than that	
23	398	Q.	It's suggested at the top of the second page of that	
24			letter and the next page that:	
25				12:4
26			"A further consequence of this latest official error is	
27			that there has been a further prolongation of the	
28			failure by An Garda Síochána to initiate an	

29

investigation into the causation of work related stress

Т			together with a denial to Garda Reogn of payment of	
2			wages at the full rate of pay. The latter is	
3			ordinarily payable to gardaí who are absent from work	
4			due to work related stress."	
5				12:41
6			To your knowledge and belief was Garda Keogh still in	
7			receipt of full rate of pay from the period of October	
8			'16 onwards, up to this point in time?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	399	Q.	Have you any reason to doubt that?	12:42
11		Α.	No, I haven't. And it wasn't brought to my attention	
12			that there was anything to the contrary.	
13	400	Q.	On this issue, was his rate of pay that he was actually	
14			being paid related to or dependent upon the	
15			classification of his absences?	12:42
16		Α.	Not at that time.	
17	401	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	Because a decision had been made to put Garda Keogh on	
19			the payroll and I would have expected that that would	
20			continue until such time as something happened to	12:42
21			intervene and change that structure. That while he was	
22			out sick with work related stress associated with the	
23			circumstances that gave rise to putting him on the	
24			payroll in the first instance, that would continue.	
25			And there was no reason and no doubt in my mind that he	12:43
26			was going to change in the short-term.	
27	402	Q.	Yes. The letter from Mr. Cullen enclosed a handwritten	
28			letter from Garda Keogh dated the 9th July. It raises	
29			the interaction with you on the 3rd June. If we look	

Т			at page 3529?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	403	Q.	In the middle of the page it says:	
4				
5			"I met with Chief Superintendent McLoughlin on the	12:43
6			3/6/20, who undertook to address my sick record and did	
7			SO.	
8				
9			However, under the Freedom of Information request I	
10			received my absence report (attached) where I am now	12:43
11			marked out sick with mental health despite my sick	
12			certs stating work related stress.	
13				
14			I now understand that your office may not be aware of	
15			same."	12:44
16				
17			So that has the up-to-date SAMS record with it, which	
18			is actually still the current position as we understand	
19			it then, on page 3530?	
20		Α.	Yes. As I understand it also.	12:44
21	404	Q.	Did you understand or did you have any function in	
22			relation to looking at that issue again at that point	
23			in time?	
24		Α.	No. I was satisfied in my own mind that I did what I	
25			set out to do and that everything that I could do was	12:44
26			done at that time and that the record had been	
27			corrected insofar as it could be, albeit not to the	
28			satisfaction, the full satisfaction of Garda Keogh, but	
29			within the caveat of how the system worked itself	

2			come to the Commissioner's office from the Minister at	
3			that point in time, in August of 2017?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	406	Q.	This was amongst one of the issues raised in the letter	12:45
6			from the Minister to the Commissioner, which was copied	
7			on, isn't that correct?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, I am going onto a slightly	
10			different phase of it now, it might be a convenient	12:45
11			time to break.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Do you think that would be a convenient time	
13			to break?	
14			MR. McGUINNESS: I think so, Chairman.	
15			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thanks very much. How long more	12:45
16			do you anticipate, Mr. McGuinness?	
17			MR. McGUINNESS: I think I will be less than 45	
18			minutes.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much, that's very good. Thanks	
20			very much. Just give me a moment to collect my notes.	12:46
21			Thanks very much.	
22				
23			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED, AS	
24			FOLLOWS.	
25				14:02
26	407	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Chief superintendent, I think on the	
27			18th August 2017 you were copied into correspondence	
28			directed to the chief administrative officer, that	

1 405 Q. I think you were copied into correspondence that had

would be Mr. Nugent?

29

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	408	Q.	Which was coming from the acting commissioner's office.	
3			It was copying you into a letter received from	
4			Mr. Cullen's office on behalf of Garda Keogh, do you	
5			remember getting that?	14:02
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	409	Q.	AND that's three pages that are at 3541 and it's	
8			addressed to Minister Flanagan, the Commissioner,	
9			Ms. Josephine Feehily, the Policing Authority and also	
10			Mr. Caoimhghín Ó Caoláin. It's raising a number of	
11			sort of new issues, if we look at page 3542, the first	
12			of which is in the second paragraph in the following	
13			terms:	
14				
15			"We now understand that Garda Keogh's express	14:03
16			complaints of harassment, bullying, detrimental	
17			treatment and his formal invocation of the Garda	
18			bullying and grievance procedure have been suspended."	
19				
20			Now as far as you are aware, that wasn't correct, is	14:03
21			that right?	
22		Α.	Could you just read that again, please?	
23	410	Q.	It's the second paragraph of that letter on page 3452.	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	411	Q.	"We now understand that Garda Keogh's express	14:03
26			complaints of harassment, bullying, detrimental	
27			treatment and his formal invocation of the Garda	
28			bullying and grievance procedures have been suspended."	
29		Α.	No. from my understanding. I don't think he was ever	

1 suspended, that the process was still in train. 2 412 Yes. Q. 3 Yeah. Α. 4 413 Are you in a position to say where the process was as Ο. 5 of this point in time, mid August? 14:04 6 I'm not unless I refer to my notes, unfortunately. Α. 7 414 Well, we will come on to that. Q. 8 Okay. Α. 9 415 Q. It says: 10 14 · 04 11 "Garda Keogh has been advised in fact that the 12 whereabouts (in An Garda Síochána) of his formal 13 complaints are unknown. His complaints have effectively been clandestinely secreted and covered 14 15 up. " 14:04 16 So this raises the issue as to whether his statement of 17 18 complaint made to Chief Superintendent Scanlan, was 19 that lost or mislaid in the process? 20 well not to my knowledge. Α. 14:04 Did you ever hear Garda Keogh being told by anyone that 21 416 0. 22 his complaint had been lost? 23 No. Α. 24 Did anyone within An Garda Síochána ever tell you that? 417 Q. 25 Α. No. 14:05

That it was lost or mislaid?

26

27

28

29

418

419

Ο.

Α.

Q.

No.

The second paragraph goes on to the misrecording.

third paragraph relates to the failure there:

The

Т				
2			"Persistent failure to trigger in ordinary course any	
3			investigation into the causation of such work related	
4			stress by Superintendent Murray."	
5				14:05
6			It says:	
7				
8			"Another consequence is a failure to pay Garda Keogh at	
9			the appropriate (for police officers absent due to work	
10			related injury)."	14:05
11				
12			The full pay he was getting, that was the amount that	
13			he would have got had he been out certified due to work	
14			related injury?	
15		Α.	No.	14:05
16	420	Q.	Injury on duty?	
17		Α.	No, there would be a difference between the two, from	
18			my understanding. That if you are out from work with,	
19			we'll call it an injury on duty, you would probably	
20			also get compensated for the loss of your allowances	14:05
21			that you would get for working unsocially. So he was	
22			on what we would call a flat rate of pay.	
23	421	Q.	The flat rate.	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	422	Q.	So the reference to FP the previous e-mail from Claire	14:06
26			Egan I think of the HR directorate, reference to FP, is	
27			it full pay?	
28		Α.	It's on your full rate of pay at the time but in order	
29			to do generally speaking, in order to get the	

Т			allowances you have to work them, the exception to that	
2			would be an injury on duty, if it's is awarded, yeah.	
3	423	Q.	So that someone who is classified as injured on duty	
4			gets the allowances they would have got had they still	
5			been able to perform duty?	14:06
6		Α.	Yeah, in some shape or form, yeah.	
7	424	Q.	And therefore entitled to allowances?	
8		Α.	Yeah.	
9	425	Q.	So is that correct then, leaving aside the issue of the	
10			consequence?	14:06
11		Α.	In relation to reference to the appropriate and the	
12			connection between that and an injury on duty, my	
13			understanding would be, yeah, that would be correct.	
14	426	Q.	Yes. He complains further about the misrecording and	
15			reduced pay. Then it says:	14:07
16				
17			"It appears on the one hand that for over 18 months any	
18			investigation into this grave and systematic bullying	
19			has been officially camouflaged, secreted and placed on	
20			hold while on the one hand the promotion of	14:07
21			Superintendent Murray to chief superintendent has been	
22			covertly preferred, protected from the inside and	
23			furtively advanced."	
24				
25			Did you ever hear anyone make any remark to the effect	14:07
26			that something like that was happening?	
27		Α.	No.	
28	427	Q.	Or was intended?	
29		Δ	No and in all honesty T wouldn't agree with that as a	

1 sentiment as to how things were progressing. It wasn't 2 camouflaged or secreted. Every effort was being made, 3 particularly from a HR perspective, to try and advance it as fast as we could. 4 5 428 Yes. Your statement proceeds from the date that this Q. 14:08 6 was copied to you, on into September then. 7 recall discussing any of the issues in that letter 8 after you saw it with anyone in the force? This particular letter? 9 Α. 10 Yes. 429 Q. 14.08 11 No. Α. 12 You did receive direct correspondence from the chief 430 Ο. administrative officer yourself on the 25th September, 13 14 informing you that the Commissioner required an update 15 from you on the present position regarding the bullying 14:08 16 and harassment complaint? 17 Yes. Α. 18 Were you surprised that they would be writing to you 431 Q. 19 for that purpose rather than... 20 Not necessarily, because I think all of the Α. 14:08 21 correspondence seeking a request for an updated report 22 and any item associated with Garda Keogh's case came to 23 me and it was my job then to go and find the 24 information and find out where it was at and reply to 25 the Commissioner. Rightly or wrongly, the office that 14 · 09 26 I held, well from day one started to be the conduit for 27 most of the reports that were going back up again. 28 432 That request is on page 3545. You replied, in a Q. Yes. 29 brief reply on the same day, to Mr. Barrett, at page

1			3546?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3 4	433	Q.	You say:	
5			"Executive director, brief update on above after	14:09
6 7			discussion this morning.	
8			PD was investigated. File went to DPP who advised no	
9			prosecuti on.	
10				14:10
11			I understand that statement, not sure if it was signed,	
12			was made by Garda Keogh in May under the bullying and	
13 14			harassment policy. But I have not seen it.	
1 <del>4</del> 15			I have written on a number of occasions for work	
16			related stress complaint to be investigated. It may	14:10
17			form part of bullying and harassment complaint but I	
18			have no update."	
19			nave no apaate.	
20			First of all, do you recollect who you would have	14:10
21			discussed it with that morning?	
22		Α.	It would have been with John Barrett.	
23	434	Q.	Mr. Barrett.	
24		Α.	Indeed.	
25	435	Q.	Okay. Reference to the statement there, you're saying	14:10
26			you hadn't seen it, can you recollect whether he had	
27			seen it or whether he was familiar with it?	
28		Α.	I don't know.	
29	436	Q.	Okay.	

Т		Α.	I don't know.	
2	437	Q.	All right. In any event, he replied to you by mail or	
3			by letter on the 28th, and that's at page 3547. He	
4			points out in the first paragraph:	
5				14:11
6			"The factual position as of today is to progress a	
7			bullying and harassment investigation, the person	
8			seeking to invoke the policy must nominate the source	
9			of the bullying and harassment complaint. Despite	
10			repeated request to do so, Nicholas Keogh has not done	14:11
11			so as of today's date."	
12				
13			And he says:	
14				
15			"I am unsighted on the progress of investigations being	14:11
16			conducted by Chief Superintendent Scanlan as of today's	
17			date but I understand that some of the papers are on	
18			file with Ms. Kathleen Hassett.	
19				
20			I remain concerned that we need to come prepared to	14:11
21			assess all aspects of this matter at case conference	
22			scheduled for 12:00pm on 3rd October 2017.	
23				
24			I look forward to your full report on that occasion."	
25				14:11
26			He seems to be under the impression in the middle	
27			paragraph there that Chief Superintendent Scanlan is in	
28			some way progressing the investigation. Do you know	
29			the basis for that?	

1		Α.	No, other than maybe information he may have had	
2			himself.	
3	438	Q.	Yes. When he says "I understand some of the papers are	
4			on file with Ms. Kathleen Hassett", what do you	
5			understand that to mean?	14:12
6		Α.	Ms. Hassett at the time was in charge of the bullying	
7			and harassment office.	
8	439	Q.	Yes. Under Mr. Barrett's control?	
9		Α.	Yes. Yes.	
10	440	Q.	In any event, further correspondence had come in from	14:12
11			Mr. Cullen, isn't that correct?	
12		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
13	441	Q.	On the 21st September, at page 3558, just to go back in	
14			sequence. This was a letter I think that was copied to	
15			you, isn't that correct?	14:13
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	442	Q.	It contained the six-page handwritten letter from Garda	
18			Keogh. It's addressed to Minister Flanagan,	
19			Commissioner Ó Cualáin, Josephine Feehily and it	
20			encloses the manuscript letter. Then it sort of breaks	14:13
21			down a series of requests, on page 2 of 3559, the three	
22			categories:	
23				
24			"We should be grateful if the Commissioner might kindly	
25			address the issues raised at paragraphs 1, 2, 3 and 6	14:13
26			of Garda Keogh's letter."	
27				
28			Paragraph 1 related to what stage the discipline	
29			inquiry was at, isn't that correct?	

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	443	Q.	Paragraph 2 related to who was investigating the	
3			bullying and harassment and where that stood?	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	444	Q.	Number 3 related to Superintendent Murray's position on	14:14
6			the promotion list and Commissioner Ó Cualáin's	
7			position in relation to the Policing Authority?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	445	Q.	And what was going to be said to them, isn't that	
10			correct?	14:14
11		Α.	That's correct.	
12	446	Q.	Then the second paragraph there:	
13				
14			"We should be grateful if the Policing Authority might	
15			ask the question raised at paragraph 4 of the letter."	14:14
16				
17			Which was about the Policing Authority's policy and the	
18			issue of delay in finalising the investigation into	
19			bullying and harassment as it related to a candidate,	
20			isn't that correct?	14:14
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	447	Q.	The Minister was asked to answer the question raised at	
23			paragraph 5, 6, 7 and 8. Number 5 was the question of	
24			provision of two reports to Garda Keogh that he had	
25			been seeking. Number 6 related to an assertion that	14:14
26			his pay was to stop in December. That wasn't the case,	
27			isn't that right?	
28		Α.	Yeah. I had no reason at that time to think or even	
29			suggest that his pay was going to be stopped.	

- 1 448 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. If I was aware of it, I probably would have intervened.
- 3 449 Q. Yes. Do you know the basis for that assertion at all?
- 4 A. No, no.
- 5 450 Q. Paragraph 7 related to an assurance by Minister
- 6 Fitzgerald that if the investigations did not progress

14:15

14:16

14:16

14 · 16

- 7 that she would consider another outside forum for
- 8 considering them. And paragraph 8 related to an
- 9 expression of Garda Keogh's frustration at matters not
- 10 having come a conclusion some three and a half years
- after he had raised many of these issues.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 451 Q. The letter itself there is at page 3560 onwards. I
- don't intend to open it verbatim. The parties can
- focus on different portions of it if they wish. But I
- think you were asked subsequent to the conference to
- 17 provide an update in relation to portions of that,
- isn't that correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 452 O. Was that a letter that was considered at the
- 21 conference?
- 22 A. There was a couple, there was two conferences.
- 23 453 Q. Yes.
- 24 A. There was one on the 3rd and there was one later.
- 25 454 Q. Yes.
- 26 A. The one on the 3rd and the one later focused primarily
- on the bullying and harassment investigation and how it
- 28 might be progressed, from memory.
- 29 455 Q. I think prior to the meeting on the 3rd, you had with

1 Mr. Barrett, I think, attended in his office when he 2 phoned Garda Keogh? That's --3 Α. 456 On the 2nd October? 4 0. 5 I think he phoned Mr. Cullen. Α. 14:17 Was it Mr. Cullen? 6 457 Q. 7 I think so. Α. 8 458 I beg your pardon, you say "Mr. Keogh's solicitor". Q. 9 Obviously Mr. Cullen had relayed Garda Keogh's letter, the six-page letter we've referred to. Was there any 10 14 · 17 11 discussion about his complaint being lost? 12 No. Α. 13 Was there any suggestion? 459 Q. 14 Α. I think the focus, from my memory the focus of the discussion with Mr. Cullen at that time with 15 14:17 16 Mr. Barrett, it was quite a short enough conversation 17 over the phone, about maybe meeting to discuss these 18 matters further in person. I think, if memory serves 19 me correctly, I think pay was a substantive part of the 20 discussion and the loss of allowances and the injury on 14:17 duty piece of it. 21 22 Yes. You say in your statement that: 460 Q. 23 24 "The purpose of this call was to inform ourselves of 25 matters pertaining to Garda Nicholas Keogh in advance 14 · 18 of the case conference planned for the next day." 26 27 28 Now, this isn't a criticism, you don't seem to have any

note of that call.

29

- 1 A. No, because I didn't make the call.
- 2 461 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. And I would have relied on -- I did take -- most of the

14 · 18

14:18

14:18

- 4 time I would take notes.
- 5 462 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. But for whatever reason I didn't take notes that day,
- 7 but I would have been relying on Mr. Barrett to take
- 8 his own note at the time.
- 9 463 Q. Yes, and you were probably relying on him to relay to
- 10 you what Mr. Cullen was saying to him?
- 11 A. Exactly, yes.
- 12 464 Q. He was in a position to bring issued raised by
- 13 Mr. Cullen to the conference the following day?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 465 Q. The conference then took place on the 3rd and I think
- Mr. Barrett was at it, Assistant Commissioner Fanning,
- 17 HR director Mr. Mulligan, Sergeant Donlon, Sergeant
- 18 Broderick?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 466 Q. Was she still in the Commissioner's office?
- 21 A. That's is a different Broderick. Fiona Broderick.
- 22 467 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. Who was in John's own office at the time.
- 24 468 Q. Yes. And Inspector McCarthy.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 469 Q. Who worked under Assistant Commissioner Fanning?
- 27 A. That's correct.
- 28 470 Q. And then Mr. Ruane. I think Sergeant Broderick took
- notes at it and you have seen them, they've been

1 referred to as TMcL 76, and they represent an accurate 2 account. Can I ask you to look at that. 3 Α. Yes. 4 471 To try and get a clear sense of what was happening at 0. 5 that meeting. They're at page 3549. You will see that 14:19 6 Mr. Barrett was chairing it? 7 Yes. Α. 8 472 It was opened by him? Q. 9 Yes. Α. 10 473 Then: Ο. 14:19 11 12 "Assistant Commissioner Fanning outlines where he is at 13 in the file with respect to an allegation of bullying 14 and harassment. Garda Keogh has been in contact with his office." 15 14:19 16 17 So did you understand that to mean that he had the file 18 at this point in time? 19 The minutes are not my minutes. Α. I understand that. 20 474 Q. 14:20 So I don't know, is the answer, to be honest. 21 Yes. Α. 22 475 You seem to have endorsed them in your statement Q. 23 as representing a true and accurate account? 24 Yes. Α. 25 was that an issue for you, in terms of the meeting, as 476 0. 14 · 20 to who had the file and what was happening? 26 27 Not necessarily, no. No. Α.

28

29

477

Q.

Α.

Okay.

No, I wouldn't have been focused on that at all at that

Τ			time.	
2	478	Q.	Okay. So have you any reason to think that that's	
3			inaccurate or not?	
4		Α.	I don't have any reason, no.	
5	479	Q.	I don't know whether this represents, the next	14:20
6			paragraph, something that Assistant Commissioner	
7			Fanning said but it's recorded:	
8				
9			"When Assistant Commissioner Fanning received the file	
10			a number of issues arose. He got Chief Superintendent	14:20
11			Scanlan to meet with the member. Assistant	
12			Commissioner Fanning outlines his concern with respect	
13			to issues raised by Garda Keogh and the bullying and	
14			harassment policy does not cover all of the matters	
15			rai sed.	14:21
16				
17			Assistant Commissioner Fanning outlines that there	
18			needs to be a bigger investigation carried out as per	
19			previ ous cases. "	
20				14:21
21			That would seem to imply that he had considered Chief	
22			Scanlan's report, he could see that Garda Keogh had	
23			raised issues which went beyond mere bullying and	
24			embraced other matters?	
25		Α.	Yes, that would suggest that, yes.	14:21
26	480	Q.	And obviously an investigation only into the bullying	
27			wouldn't encompass other matters unless there was	
28			another investigation?	
29		٨	That's true	

Т	481	Q.	He seems to be arguing for a larger investigation,	
2			which would embrace both matters, is that right?	
3		Α.	I think what he was arguing, not arguing	
4	482	Q.	Yes.	
5		Α.	what he was recommending.	14:21
6	483	Q.	Proposing?	
7		Α.	Proposing, was that, yeah, that there'd be a wider,	
8			more encompassing investigation. The bullying and	
9			harassment is quite narrow in its focus under the	
10			policy and the terms of reference that would be given	14:22
11			to an investigative officer would be quite, if you	
12			like, tight in relation to that. So AC Fanning was	
13			suggesting that there were more issues that he saw,	
14			that he felt needed further investigation.	
15	484	Q.	Yes. It goes on to record Mr. Barrett there:	14:22
16				
17			"John outlines that he and Chief Superintendent	
18			McLoughlin spoke to Garda Keogh's solicitors."	
19				
20			That was the previous day obviously.	14:22
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	485	Q.	"John seeks clarification from Assistant Commissioner	
23			Fanning on the criminal aspect."	
24				
25			Can you recollect what his concern was there?	14:22
26		Α.	Mr. Barrett's or Mr. Fanning's?	
27	486	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	I think what John was trying to find out was is okay if	
29			you are proposing an alternative and you have reasons	

Т			for it, what are those reasons and can you allude to	
2			what you're actually talking about.	
3	487	Q.	Yes. "Assistant Commissioner Fanning outlines that	
4			Garda Keogh says he has been victimised by people since	
5			he made protected disclosure.	14:23
6				
7			Assistant Commissioner Fanning is concerned about	
8			making an appointment under the bullying and harassment	
9			policy. He says that the investigation should be made	
10			under the Byrne/McGinn model, where it encompasses a	14:23
11			wider investigation.	
12				
13			It then goes on to say:	
14				
15			"Harassment could be breaches on a number of points.	14:23
16			John outlines that two files have been forwarded to the	
17			department of public prosecution."	
18				
19			You were all familiar, obviously, with the Byrne/McGinn	
20			model?	14:23
21		Α.	Well I wasn't familiar with it, to be honest with you.	
22	488	Q.	All right.	
23		Α.	I have heard obviously of former Assistant Commissioner	
24			Byrne and Chief Superintendent McGinn.	
25	489	Q.	Yes.	14:23
26		Α.	But I was not familiar with the process that they had	
27			adopted and what it actually meant or entailed. I had	
28			no idea of it at all.	
29	490	Q.	Or what necessarily came within it?	

1	Α.	No. No.	
2		CHAIRMAN: Maybe you would just give us a hint of what	
3		the Byrne/McGinn model is.	
4		MR. McGUINNESS: well, Assistant Commissioner Byrne was	
5		appointed to investigate the complaints that	14:24
6		Sergeant McCabe had made in a compendious way, to do a	
7		review of all of them and report upon them and it got	
8		taken over then by Chief Superintendent Terry McGinn	
9		and became the subject of a lengthy report into all of	
10		the investigations that Sergeant McCabe had criticisms	14:24
11		about.	
12		CHAIRMAN: Was that one everybody then was critical of,	
13		internally?	
14		MR. McGUINNESS: well it became effectively the	
15		template for the investigations that were the	14:24
16		subject-matter of the O'Higgins Commission.	
17		CHAIRMAN: I understand, when everyone said that	
18		Byrne/McGinn was all wrong.	
19		MR. McGUINNESS: well, there were a number of different	
20		views obviously.	14:24
21		CHAIRMAN: Anyway. It was a general review. A review	
22		of reviews.	
23		MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
24		CHAIRMAN: Tanks very much and I'm sorry, I know the	
25		name is familiar and I am assuming that everybody in	14:24
26		the room probably knows it, except myself. It wasn't	
27		present in my mind. A general review of everything.	
28		MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
29		CHAIRMAN: A sort of compendium, where we are now and	

1			how we got there.	
2			MR. McGUINNESS: Generally speaking, yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Sorry about that.	
4			THE WITNESS: No problem.	
5	491	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: It then records:	14:25
6				
7			"John spoke to Garda Keogh's solicitors on 2nd October	
8			2017 and he has forwarded a handwritten letter from	
9			Garda Keogh with issues that he believes have not been	
10			resol ved. "	14:25
11				
12			That's obviously a reference to the six-page letter I	
13			think	
14		Α.	I think so, yeah.	
15	492	Q.	It doesn't appear to have been before the meeting then?	14:25
16		Α.	No, it wasn't.	
17	493	Q.	"A general discussion held on the matters.	
18				
19			Assistant Commissioner Fanning outlines that a person	
20			needs to be appointed to look at all matters.	14:25
21				
22			He outlines a statement needs to be taken from Garda	
23			Keogh and a process followed. Someone neutral needs to	
24			carry out an investigation.	
25				14:25
26			Assistant Commissioner Fanning suggests that a full	
27			statement be taken and sent to the Director of Public	
28			Prosecutions and outline what has already been	
29			submitted in the file, then, when Director of Public	

Т			Prosecutions comes back, and other matters should be	
2			looked at under the relevant policies. Mr. Barrett is	
3			in agreement with this."	
4				
5			There doesn't seem to be mention particularly in that	14:26
6			context of the fact that the Ó Cualáin investigation	
7			had been completed and furnished to the director. What	
8			did you understand required or might require to be	
9			criminally investigated under Assistant Commissioner	
10			Fanning's proposal?	14:26
11		Α.	Well, that was my problem at the time and in subsequent	
12			meetings, I didn't know or understand what that might	
13			mean. I don't think it was ever discussed in detail at	
14			that meeting. It was just referred to but never was	
15			the detail associated, what that might look like or	14:26
16			might be, proffered at either meeting.	
17	494	Q.	All right. Well we will just continue on with the note	
18			for the moment. This is on the next page:	
19				
20			"Assistant Commissioner Fanning is concerned that this	14:27
21			has been going on for a long time."	
22				
23			We are actually on the page. He thinks everything has	
24			to be investigated.	
25				14:27
26			"A general conversation held on this matter. There is	
27			a discipline issue on this. Where is this at? Need an	
28			update on same? Mr. Ruane outlines that GSOC and	
29			Assistant Commissioner McMahon needs to provide an	

Т			update. Chrei Superintendent McLoughiin to Seek an	
2			update on both to see where they are at."	
3				
4			So that was something that was tasked to do then?	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:27
6	495	Q.	"Garda A has not been interviewed to see if he has any	
7			complaint to make.	
8				
9			General conversation held on this matter. Mr. Ruane	
10			outlines that he believes what is being proposed is the	14:27
11			best course of action. Discipline needs to be	
12			identified and Garda Keogh be written to telling him	
13			where it is at.	
14				
15			Mr. Mulligan gives his viewpoint and believes that what	14:27
16			is being suggested be carried out. This has been going	
17			on for a long time. It needs clarity and needs to be	
18			moved along."	
19				
20			So there seems to be an acceptance that the pace has to	14:27
21			be upped, as it were, to move things on a bit here?	
22		Α.	Absolutely.	
23	496	Q.	"Chief Superintendent McLoughlin agrees nothing to	
24			preclude this organisation from conducting an	
25			investigation. It is agreed that an assistant	14:28
26			commissioner should be appointed to investigate and get	
27			a full statement from Garda Keogh."	
28				
29			Were you in agreement, therefore, with the sort of	

1			wider investigation model?	
2		Α.	I wasn't.	
3	497	Q.	Pardon?	
4		Α.	I wasn't, no. What I was referring to there was the	
5			bullying and harassment elements of it.	14:28
6	498	Q.	Yes. That's what I was anxious to get your view on.	
7				
8			"Assistant Commissioner Fanning will write to Garda	
9			Keogh, informing him that Human Resources and People	
10			Development will now be his point of contact for any	14:28
11			issues that he has.	
12				
13			Mr. Barrett is in agreement that the route of	
14			investigations will be the best course of action."	
15				14:28
16			Did you understand him to be agreeing with the bullying	
17			and harassment view of it or the wider view?	
18		Α.	I don't know, because it became a point of contention	
19			at the following meeting. So I am not sure what	
20			Mr. Barrett's interpretation was of the course of	14:29
21			action, whether it go under the Byrne/McGinn type model	
22			or some other alternative.	
23	499	Q.	Yes.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Can you help me?	
25		Α.	Yeah.	14:29
26	500	Q.	CHAIRMAN: If it was a bullying and harassment case	
27			simpliciter?	
28		Α.	Yeah.	
29	501	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Presumably somebody would sit down with	

1 Garda Keogh and say, tell me about the bullying and 2 harassment? 3 Α. Yes. 502 And somebody would write it all down? 4 0. CHAI RMAN: 5 Yes. Α. 14:29 6 503 Q. CHAI RMAN: Maybe Garda Keogh would produce a -- but somebody would write it all down? 7 8 Yes. Α. 9 504 CHAI RMAN: And say, now we know what we are doing? Q. 10 Α. Yes. 14 · 29 11 505 CHAI RMAN: As opposed to that, Byrne/McGinn, what would Q. 12 that have involved? 13 Judge, that would have involved everything associated Α. 14 with Garda Keogh's case, it may have gone over old ground maybe that AC Ó Cualáin had gone over in his 15 14:29 16 investigation, it may have looked into that file and other files. So it was likely to take a good bit 17 18 longer. 19 506 CHAI RMAN: It would start off back at the protected Q. disclosure on the 8th May? 20 14:30 21 It could well do. Α. 22 507 And try to do everything and say where we 0. CHAI RMAN: 23 are, where we are now and how we got here? 24 Yes. Α. 25 By reference to everything that happened in 508 0. CHAI RMAN: 14:30 26 the past? 27 Yes. Α. 28 509 CHAI RMAN: That would have been some undertaking, I Ο. 29 rather imagine?

Τ		Α.	And that was my understanding of what was being said,	
2			rightly or wrongly.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Okay, thanks very much. That's what I	
4			wanted to know. I wanted to get a picture of the	
5			difference between the two approaches. Sorry,	14:30
6			Mr. McGuinness?	
7	510	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Not at all. It continues on then:	
8				
9			"Mr. Barrett asks Inspector McCarthy to meet with Garda	
10			Keogh again and to inform him of this meeting."	14:30
11				
12			So, that was agreed, was it?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	511	Q.	"Chief Superintendent McLoughlin to follow up with	
15			Internal Affairs on the discipline investigation.	14:30
16				
17			Sergeant Donlon to look at the file and see what was	
18			provided to the DPP and pull papers together.	
19			Mr. Barrett to send a note to solicitors. Mr. Ruane is	
20			to inform Chief Superintendent Fergus Healy on this	14:30
21			matter."	
22				
23			That is about the litigation issue.	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	512	Q.	"Mr. Mulligan is checking with Ms. Carr with respect to	14:31
26			sick leave and to look manually checking the sick	
27			certificates. Mr. Mulligan will get a list from	
28			Ms. Carr and then this will be then dealt with at local	
29			Level "	

1			Then it's noted:	
2				
3			"The chief superintendent and superintendent in this	
4			division are a problem as they are brothers-in-law.	
5			Corporate risk needs to be moved."	14:31
6				
7			I think that was something that you were tasked with	
8		Α.	Checking into.	
9	513	Q.	checking into. There was then an action sheet	
10			produced on foot of that, is that correct?	14:31
11		Α.	That's correct.	
12	514	Q.	In the days after?	
13		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
14	515	Q.	Was that by Sergeant Broderick?	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:31
16	516	Q.	That's at page 3551. So the first action there, that	
17			was to be taken by Mr. Barrett?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	517	Q.	The scope or type of investigation isn't specified, but	
20			did you understand on getting the minute that this was	14:31
21			to be an investigation into the bullying and	
22			harassment?	
23		Α.	No, I wasn't sure what it was to be.	
24	518	Q.	As a matter of interest, if it was a wider	
25			investigation, suppose it was an investigation into the	14:32
26			allegation of criminal matters and including	
27			victimisation under the 2014 Act and bullying and	
28			harassment and pay issues, is that something that would	
29			have been within Mr. Barrett's jurisdiction, as it	

Т			were, to appoint an assistant commissioner to?	
2		Α.	It would have been up to the point of suggesting there	
3			might have been any criminal or any other matters.	
4			From a HR perspective, most definitely, yes. For	
5			anything outside of HR he may have had to consult with	14:32
6			assistant commissioner Crime and Security, deputy	
7			commissioner Operations and take advice in relation to	
8			it.	
9	519	Q.	Yes.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Anything non-criminal.	14:32
11		Α.	Yes, anything to do with HR.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
13	520	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: The second matter was for Mr. Barrett	
14			then:	
15				14:33
16			"A letter to be drafted to Garda Keogh's solicitors to	
17			address the matter now this proposed AGS will now	
18			proceed. "	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	521	Q.	Third, Mr. Ruane was to deal with the litigation	14:33
21			matter. Fourth, Inspector McCarthy was to visit Garda	
22			Keogh, to verbally inform him of the case conference	
23			held today and what is being proposed. Then you were	
24			to progress the inquiry with Internal Affairs and with	
25			regard to discipline, GSOC?	14:33
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	522	Q.	The other tasks are assigned there as set out.	
28			Sergeant Broderick forwarded that to people on the	
29			afternoon of the 3rd?	

		Α.	ies.	
2	523	Q.	According to an e-mail on page 3554. And then she is	
3			following up with Mr. Barrett, in the middle of that	
4			page. She is asking:	
5				14:33
6			"When will you be doing this?"	
7				
8			Page 3553, she is sort of sending reminders really on	
9			the 10th and the 12th of October. And then,	
10			Mr. Barrett is saying at the top of that page, 3553:	14:34
11				
12			"I want to appoint Barry O'Brien. Could you draw up	
13			the paperwork so that I can walk him through it?"	
14				
15			Was that an issue that was discussed with you?	14:34
16		Α.	No.	
17	524	Q.	You wouldn't normally expect to have a say	
18		Α.	No.	
19	525	Q.	in who was being appointed?	
20		Α.	No.	14:34
21	526	Q.	Is that right?	
22		Α.	Not at that time. I would now, because I now have the	
23			portfolio for bullying and harassment.	
24	527	Q.	Yes. On the other hand, you were requested by the	
25			chief administrative officer on the 10th October to	14:34
26			report on the issues raised by reference to the John	
27			Gerard Cullen letter we looked at earlier, isn't that	
28			correct?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

1	528	Q.	You wrote to Ms. Carr, am I correct about that, to seek	
2			an update?	
3		Α.	If I just could have the reference, please?	
4	529	Q.	Yes. Perhaps it was to Mr. Donlon, was it? It's at	
5			page 3566, on the 12th, to get an update, 3566. Just	14:35
6			slightly down the page, we will see it there. You are	
7			trying to track down what changes were?	
8		Α.	Yeah, and how they happened.	
9	530	Q.	I think you got a you didn't get a reply at that	
10			point in time?	14:36
11		Α.	No, I think I did subsequently.	
12	531	Q.	Yes. I think you were told that a Garda Eileen Cregan	
13			had made the change	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	532	Q.	is that correct, sometime in August 2016?	14:36
16		Α.	I am not sure of the name of the person but that was	
17			the gist of what I was told.	
18	533	Q.	That turned out not to be correct, I believe, is that	
19			right?	
20		Α.	From memory, yes.	14:37
21	534	Q.	You wrote subsequently to the chief superintendent	
22			Internal Affairs on the 19th October, if we look at	
23			page 3587. You're pursuing the issues relating to the	
24			information they may have about GSOC and the discipline	
25			inquiries, isn't that correct?	14:37
26		Α.	That's correct.	
27	535	Q.	You had asked for those matters to be dealt with	
28			urgently and you informed them of the context of the	
29			case conference that had been held?	

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	536	Q.	Isn't that correct? You also wrote sorry, you had	
3			also seen a copy of the letter that Mr. Barrett had	
4			written to Mr. Keogh's solicitors?	
5		Α.	That's correct.	14:38
6	537	Q.	Mr. Cullen, and you forwarded that to the chief	
7			administrative officer yourself?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	538	Q.	That letter is at page 3590?	
10		Α.	Yes.	14:38
11	539	Q.	That letter responds to queries raised both by	
12			Mr. Cullen and Garda Keogh. And at the bottom of 3590	
13			it deals with being taken off the payroll and it's just	
14			stated that it's not correct. The other matters, item	
15			1, which is the investigation into bullying and	14:39
16			harassment, on the next page, says:	
17				
18			"I have undertaken the specific action of assessing how	
19			best to proceed with respect to it. I expect to have	
20			reached a conclusion on this before the end of October	14:39
21			and it will be communicated to you directly. I will	
22			set out the process to be followed and the personnel	
23			assi gned."	
24				
25			Number 2 then says:	14:39
26				
27			"With regard to the bullying and harassment complaint,	
28			I am to advise there has been extensive correspondence	
29			from Garda HRM section seeking clarification from Garda	

		Keogh as to who specifically he was naming as the	
		subject of his complaint. We are now aware from both	
		the correspondence and the telephone conversation who	
		that individual is. We will proceed accordingly."	
			14:39
		Did you understand that to be directed just to	
		Superintendent Murray or in relation to Superintendent	
		Murray?	
	Α.	I didn't know who it was in relation to. As a result	
		of that correspondence I would have had a previous	14:39
		conversation a long time before this with Garda Keogh	
		where he would have mentioned that to me.	
540	Q.	Yes. In any event, number 3 then states:	
		"The matters relating to how the Policing Authority	14:40
		proceed in the circumstances outlined is for them to	
		decide. I have today written to the CEO of the	
		Policing Authority and raised that question with them.	
		My letter is attached.	
			14:40
		4. I have written to the office of the Garda	
		Commissioner and to the office of head of legal	
		services to address the matters set out. This office	
		has had no sight of the correspondence to date but we	
		have now requested it. Our expectation is that it will	14:40
		form part of the comprehensive file which will be made	
		form part of the comprehensive file which will be made available to the individual or team to be appointed	
	540		subject of his complaint. We are now aware from both the correspondence and the telephone conversation who that individual is. We will proceed accordingly."  Did you understand that to be directed just to Superintendent Murray?  A. I didn't know who it was in relation to. As a result of that correspondence I would have had a previous conversation a long time before this with Garda Keogh where he would have mentioned that to me.  540 Q. Yes. In any event, number 3 then states:  "The matters relating to how the Policing Authority proceed in the circumstances outlined is for them to decide. I have today written to the CEO of the Policing Authority and raised that question with them. My letter is attached.  4. I have written to the office of the Garda Commissioner and to the office of head of legal services to address the matters set out. This office has had no sight of the correspondence to date but we

1			5. In the matter of pay, our telephone call and the	
2			primary point at the top of this correspondence refers.	
3				
4			6. Our intention is that the matters to be established	
5			under 1 above will address the issues comprehensively	14:40
6			and the need for intervention of the Tánaiste.	
7				
8			7. I wish to assure you and your client that it is to	
9			this office that those charged with the management of	
10			political dynamites report. I have huge confidence in	14:41
11			the professionalism of the office holder. Chief	
12			Superintendent McLoughlin has met with Garda Keogh in	
13			his capacity as protected disclosure manager and this	
14			relationship continues in effect."	
15				14:41
16			It goes on to say that Inspector McCarthy will visit.	
17			There's nothing unusual in that.	
18		Α.	No.	
19	541	Q.	It doesn't give a commitment to any particular	
20			timeframe, I suppose?	14:41
21		Α.	No, it doesn't. No. I suppose it's a reflection on	
22			the interpretation of where we were at that time by	
23			Mr. Barrett.	
24	542	Q.	Yes.	
25			CHAIRMAN: He was going to progress matters "with all	14:41
26			due Él an".	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28			CHAIRMAN: No less.	
29	543	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: You say in your statement that on the	

1 19th October you were made aware that executive 2 director HRPD had appointed Assistant Commissioner 3 McPartlin to undertake a fact-finding inquiry of the bullying and harassment issues. Is that something that 4 5 was reported to you in writing by Mr. Barrett? 14:42 6 No, that probably came about as a result of a Α. 7 conversation or maybe at our management meeting. 8 544 Yes. Certainly her name appears in the conference 0. notes relating to the 23rd and in a subsequent e-mail? 9 10 Α. Yes. 14 · 42 11 545 So it would appear that there was some conversation or Q. 12 perhaps a tentative proposal that she would be 13 appointed? 14 Α. That would appear to be the case, yes. 15 546 The case conference then on the 23rd, you had notes of Q. 14:42 16 that and there's some other minutes of that. Could I 17 direct you to your notes at page 3593? 18 Yes. Α. 19 547 I am not quite sure what the first name is there on the Q. 20 top? 14:43 Peter Early. 21 Α. 22 Peter Early. Who is Mr. Early? 548 Q. He's a staff -- he was a staff member of the Legal 23 Α. 24 Affairs at that time. He has since resigned. 25 Now there is F Fanning? 549 0. 14:43 26 Yes. Α. 27 550 Jimmy McCarthy? Q. 28 Α. Yes. 29 551 That's yourself then, T McL? Q.

- 1 Α. Yes.
- 2 552 SO? Q.
- Reardon, Séan O'Reardon, the Commissioner's office. 3 Α.
- 553 And Kathleen Hassett. 4 Ο.
- 5 Yes. Α.
  - 14:43

14 · 43

- 6 554 Alan Mulligan. Q.
- 7 Yes. Α.
- 8 555 Q. Joe Nugent.
- 9 Yes. Α.
- 10 556 John Barrett. Ο.
- 11 Yes. Α.
- 12 557 Could you talk us through the notes then, as to how the Ο.
- meeting went? 13
- 14 Α. It was chaired by Mr. Nugent. It was outlined
- 15 obviously that it was a meeting held in confidence and
- 16 that there may be issues discussed that were of a
- 17 confidential nature. The Commissioner had requested
- 18 Mr. Nugent to chair the meeting, to get a holistic view
- 19 of everything that was going on relative to Garda
- 20 Keogh's case. An update of the status in the broadest
- 21 sense was what Joe Nugent was looking for. Not to
- 22 delve into, even if we knew, into the PD space.
- 23 Is that the identity issue? 558 Q.
- 24 Identity or any element or anything of a confidential Α.
- 25 nature that may be associated with the PD, we would not 14:44
- 26 -- or he asked the people there not to go into that.
- 27 559 Yes. Q.
- We had given an overview of where we thought it was at 28 Α.
- 29 the time, that was myself and Sergeant Donlon and we

Т			had given a number of reports up at the time, which are	
2			included previously in this testimony. There was four	
3			strands to the issues as Mr. Nugent saw it. There was	
4			the welfare piece, which I had primary responsibility	
5			for; there was the protected disclosure piece; there	14:45
6			was the criminal and bullying and harassment and then	
7			there was the civil litigation, which was commented on	
8			at the time as well. Then we had reference to GSOC.	
9	560	Q.	Yes.	
LO		Α.	I'm assuming that that was reference to the fact that	14:45
L1			that's where the protected disclosure may have lay. I	
L2			reference the fact that I had sought information from	
L3			GSOC into the nature and to see if it included	
L4			previously any elements of the bullying and harassment	
L5			allegations that Garda Keogh was making. Complaint and	14:45
L6			four-page statement to Chief Scanlan was referenced at	
L7			the meeting. AC Fanning assessed the case as he saw it	
L8			and based on the Byrne/McGinn precedent he felt and	
L9			decided that he could not make an appointment on the	
20			bullying and harassment as a result. Out of case	14:46
21			conference recently agreed to proceed with	
22			fact-finding. That was in reference to the meeting of	
23			the 3rd. FF is Fintan Fanning.	
24				
25			" requires a broad investigation to include all	14:46
26			aspects of the complaint that was made to Chief	
27			Scanl an. "	

A. "Joe Nugent (JN) emphasis too the bullying and

28

29

561 Q. Yes.

1			harassment remains outstanding and that Garda Keogh had	
2			continually made reference to the outstanding bullying	
3			and harassment and to the public."	
4				
5			I don't know what "and to the public" is a reference	14:46
6			to.	
7				
8			"Tony McLoughlin of the view, as John Barrett, that if	
9			at all possible the bullying and harassment	
10			investigation should proceed in isolation of other	14:46
11			matters, if necessary.	
12				
13			Bullying and harassment also referenced in civil	
14			proceedings by Garda Keogh and therefore needs to be	
15			addressed. "	14:47
16				
17			And that was the commentary from Ken Ruane and EC I	
18			think refers to Assistant Commissioner Eugene Corcoran	
19	562	Q.	Assistant commissioner Corcoran?	
20		Α.	That's right, yeah.	14:47
21	563	Q.	So there seems to be a majority there concentrating on	
22			the bullying and harassment at that point, is that	
23			right?	
24		Α.	That's right.	
25	564	Q.	It goes on then?	14:47
26		Α.	Will, I continue?	
27	565	Q.	Pardon?	
28		Α.	Will I continue.	
29	566	Q.	Yes.	

Т		Α.	Yes. FF is Finlan Fanning:	
2				
3			" has a different view of meeting of the 3/10 and	
4			outcome from John Barrett (JB). Letter to Mr. Cullen	
5			solicitor outlines steps forward. "	14:47
6				
7			So that was John's letter to Mr. Cullen and John made	
8			reference to that in the meeting.	
9				
10			"Dealt with multiple issues from AC fanning's report in	14:48
11			parallel to bullying and harassment and no difficulty	
12			with that." So Mr. Ruane was making reference to the	
13			fact that from his perspective he did not believe that	
14			we could not go ahead with two different strands. In	
15			other words, continue with bullying and harassment and	14:48
16			then if there were any other issues to be dealt with,	
17			deal with those separately.	
18	567	Q.	Yes. There were no preclusions from having one to	
19			having a different one?	
20		Α.	Yes. No. Joe Nugent then, JN:	14:48
21				
22			"Two ACs to deal with bullying and harassment and other	
23			matters."	
24				
25			So in other words he was saying, right, appoint	14:48
26			somebody to do the bullying and harassment immediately	
27			and then appoint another AC to continue with the other	
28			elements of it.	
29				

Τ			"We can have as many investigations as we wish	
2			according to AC Eugene Corcoran.	
3				
4			John Barrett to get Mr. Cullen and Keogh to identify	
5			bullying and harassment process that requires	14:49
6			investigation in a meeting.	
7				
8			AC to be appointed to bullying and harassment.	
9				
10			AC appointment fact-finding."	14:49
11				
12			And Orla McPartlin was mentioned there.	
13				
14			"Check 0' Hi ggi ns. "	
15				14:49
16			Now that was an action that I took to myself because I	
17			was unfamiliar with the Byrne McGinn model, that I	
18			would go look at it and see what it entailed.	
19	568	Q.	Yes.	
20		Α.		14:49
21			"Can we defend the non action on bullying and	
22			harassment by virtue of the McGinn"	
23				
24			If we were to adopt the Byrne/McGinn way of doing	
25			things, were we in a position to successfully defend	14:49
26			our position then with not proceeding with the bullying	
27			and harassment. And then I think AC Fanning produced a	
28			chart outlining the welfare interventions that he or	
29			his staff had taken with Garda Keogh within his	

- division at that time.
- 2 569 Q. Yes. There seems to have been sort of slightly more
- 3 official minutes then produced?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 570 Q. Which are at page 3597. It seems to be -- I am not

14:51

14:51

- 6 sure I follow the style of it but could you help us
- 7 just navigate through? It says "decisions" there.
- 8 There's a lot of discussion items obviously --
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 571 Q. -- on the following page. But is 3598 the commencement 14:50
- of the minutes then?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 572 Q. The attendance there is slightly obviously expanded
- from your notation, but there's a large number of
- people at the meeting?
- 16 A. The one person that I had missed in mine is Assistant
- 17 Commissioner Corcoran.
- 18 573 Q. Yes. Were you happy that these minutes were more
- 19 accurate?
- 20 A. I'd be happy with my own minutes.
- 21 574 Q. Yes
- 22 A. In terms of my recollection of the meeting.
- 23 575 Q. Yes.
- A. That's not to say there's anything wrong with those.
- 25 576 Q. Yes. There are comments on 3597 where people want to
- 26 have other bits included. There seemed to be --
- 27 577 Q. CHAIRMAN: Have you seen these before?
- 28 A. I have.
- 29 578 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: There seem to be differing views there

1			as to what ought to have been included in the minutes.	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	579	Q.	But in terms of the outcome, were you in any doubt that	
4			the meeting had decided that an assistant commissioner	
5			would be appointed to investigate the bullying and	14:52
6			harassment?	
7		Α.	That was my understanding of that meeting and the	
8			outcome. There were different views in the meeting	
9			obviously.	
10	580	Q.	Yes.	14:52
11		Α.	But that was the outcome of the meeting.	
12	581	Q.	Yes. In any event, Mr. Barrett would have the	
13			responsibility for appointing or nominating the	
14			assistant commissioner involved, isn't that right?	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:52
16	582	Q.	I think he wrote to others, including you, is that	
17			right, after the meeting?	
18		Α.	Yes, I think he did.	
19	583	Q.	If we look at page 3600?	
20		Α.	Yeah.	14:52
21	584	Q.	Again, this is a document that seems to be arguing the	
22			issues still, in the third last paragraph:	
23				
24			"With respect to the suggestion that the current	
25			panoply of matters is best addressed via Byrne/McGinn	14:53
26			type investigation. I am neutral at best. I do not	
27			agree that the approach being adopted by the CAO is new	
28			or novel. Both Chief Superintendent McLoughlin and I	
29			have resolved a number of multifaceted cases by an	

Т			approach such as this. We are, as an organisation,	
2			greatly disadvantaged by the stove piping which sees so	
3			many of the functions which were previously under the	
4			direction of HR now splintered. This is a recurring	
5			problem giving rise to the general concern voiced by	14:53
6			the AC and others too.	
7				
8			I believe that the best course of action is to ensure	
9			that every assistance is given to AC McPartlin and that	
10			independently and immediately the bullying process is	14:53
11			commenced. I will stay close to this matter and use my	
12			office to do what I can to ensure Garda Keogh is given	
13			every support and comfort about our organisational	
14			intent and approach.	
15				14:53
16			I commend the initiative of the CAO. It is not unique	
17			but with goodwill and coordinated support I believe it	
18			can be effective."	
19				
20			He intends to proceed as above there. That wasn't a	14:54
21			surprise to you, I take it?	
22		Α.	No.	
23	585	Q.	I think you wrote to the executive director in	
24			connection with the previous request to update him in	
25			relation to the matters, isn't that correct?	14:54
26		Α.	That's correct.	
27	586	Q.	You were asked to gather together all materials in	
28			connection with Garda Keogh in the context of the	
29			Freedom of Information Act request as well, isn't that	

1 right? 2 Yes. Α. 3 587 0. we're not concerned with that. I think Ms. Carr 4 updated you on the 24th November with the SAMS change, 5 if you look at page 3620. At the bottom of the page 14:55 6 there, that says that it was a Garda Grehan who did 7 that? That's correct. 8 Α. 9 588 On the 4th August? Q. 10 Α. Yes. 14:55 11 589 But you yourself had received confirmation on the 25th Q. 12 May that it had been changed? 13 Yes. Α. 14 590 Q. Isn't that right? 15 That's correct. Α. 14:55 16 591 Yes. We've received papers recently which confirmed Ο. 17 that Garda Grehan didn't do that on the 4th August, 18 have you seen those, have you? 19 I haven't, no. Α. In any event, that information isn't under your 20 592 0. 14:55 21 control? 22 No. Α. 23 593 And you weren't responsible for generating it? Q. 24 My only purpose and concern was that it was Α. 25 actually done, I didn't particularly mind who did it, 14:56 to be honest. 26 27 594 I think you received information concerning the Q. nomination of Assistant Commissioner Finn from 28 29 Inspector McCarthy on behalf of Assistant Commissioner

- 1 Fanning, is that right?
- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 595 Q. Page 3624. We know that Inspector McCarthy had been
- 4 sent down to hand deliver to Garda Keogh information in
- 5 relation to the complaint and specifically in relation
- 6 to the question of opting to resolve it by way of
- 7 mediation?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 596 Q. Which Garda Keogh refused or declined to do at that
- point in time. That's a normal part of the
- 11 requirement --
- 12 A. It is, yes.
- 13 597 Q. -- under the --
- 14 A. Bullying and harassment.
- 15 598 Q. Yes. And it is therefore quite a usual step to have 14:57

14:57

- 16 taken.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 599 Q. To seek the consent or otherwise of that and then
- 19 progress matters.
- 20 A. Anybody who makes a complaint, that's the first thing
- 21 that would be asked of them, do they want to take an
- informal route or a formal route? Yes.
- 23 600 Q. Yes. Mr. Barrett subsequently I think sent you a copy
- of the letter he had written to the deputy commissioner
- in Governance and Strategy, which chronologically
- sought to update him and you with a synopsis of
- 27 attempts to progress matters?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 601 Q. That's on page 3526 to 3529.

1		Α.	Yeah.	
2	602	Q.	It sets out on the first page of that, at 3626, the	
3			issues in relation to Garda pay. It goes through, on	
4			page 3627, 2016 into 2017. On page 3628, it records in	
5			the middle of page 3628:	14:58
6				
7			"On 5th April 2017 Assistant Commissioner Eastern	
8			Region advised me that he had received one part of a	
9			two-part report from Garda Keogh. On perusal of this	
10			material, Assistant Commissioner Fanning was of the	14:58
11			view that the issues raised by Garda Keogh were much	
12			wider than the bullying and harassment matter. He	
13			further advised that he would revert on receipt of the	
14			next phase of the report.	
15				14:59
16			On 21st April 2017, Assistant Commissioner Eastern	
17			Region advised that further documentation had been	
18			received from Garda Keogh and that this material was	
19			being considered by him."	
20				14:59
21			There's a reference then:	
22				
23			"On 22nd May 2017 I met Assistant Commissioner Eastern	
24			Region, who advised that his report was being	
25			prepared. "	14:59
26				
27			And then there's sort of a big gap of time there	
28			between May and October. Did you see a report from the	
29			assistant commissioner Eastern Region in relation to	

- 1 Garda Keogh's statement.
- 2 A. No.
- 3 603 Q. Did you see the statement itself?
- 4 A. No
- 5 604 Q. Were provided with Assistant Commissioner Fanning with
- 6 a copy of the statement?
- 7 A. No, I don't believe so. I don't believe I received it
- 8 any which way, in any of the documentation surrounding
- 9 this issue from then onwards. No.
- 10 605 Q. Yes. Mr. Cullen wrote to Assistant Commissioner Finn

15:00

15:00

- then, I am not sure did you get that letter at the
- 12 time?
- A. No, but it was part of -- I'm not sure, to be honest,
- but it was part of a list of documentation that we had
- on our files.
- 16 606 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. Yeah.
- 18 607 Q. In any event, you met Garda Keogh subsequent to the
- receipt of that letter, isn't that correct?
- 20 A. Yeah, I think in December of that year.
- 21 608 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 609 Q. Was that on the 15th December at the Killeshen Hotel
- 24 with Mr. Barrett?
- 25 A. That's correct.
- 26 610 Q. And Garda Keogh and Mr. Cullen?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 611 Q. What was the purpose of a meeting at that point in
- 29 time? Mr. Barrett believed he had appointed Assistant

1			Commissioner McPartlin, Assistant Commissioner Fanning	
2			had appointed Assistant Commissioner Finn to	
3			investigate the bullying and harassment. So were they	
4			not were the issues not out of your control at that	
5			stage?	15:01
6		Α.	They were, but again from memory, I think the exec	
7			director, Mr. Barrett, was anxious because Garda Keogh	
8			and Mr. Cullen was writing in continuously in relation	
9			to various matters and he was anxious to meet them, if	
10			we could, to outline to them what had been agreed, what	15:01
11			had been done and what was going to be done. And there	
12			was also the question that was arising at that time and	
13			even previously, was the matter of what we call an	
14			1137.	
15	612	Q.	Yes.	15:01
16		Α.	The payment of allowances associated with being out	
17			sick was an issue as well, that we felt and Mr. Barrett	
18			felt the best way to address that was to meet them in	
19			person.	
20	613	Q.	Yes.	15:02
21		Α.	And to explain it.	
22	614	Q.	Yes. You had in fact discussed previously with	
23			Mr. Barrett keeping in touch with Garda Keogh to	
24			address the possible return to work issues, isn't that	
25			right?	15:02
26		Α.	Yeah. From the time I first met Garda Keogh on 3rd	
27			June '16, I suppose my intention would have been, and	
28			it would have been with other cases in the past, that	
29			the first thing I will try and discuss with the member	

1 is, okay, a return to work and the possibility of a 2 return to work and when that may happen, obviously 3 subject to being certified fit to do so. So, yeah. 4 The notes that you took then on page 3635, you sort of 615 0. 5 highlight a number of bullet points. That's: 15:02 6 7 "Mick Finn, bullying and harassment." 8 Yes. Α. "AC McPartlin, all the elements." 9 616 Q. 10 Α. Yes. 15:03 11 617 Now, I don't know, did you see AC McPartlin's Q. 12 statement, she said she was never written to or 13 appointed by Mr. Barrett as such at that time? 14 Α. Yeah. 15 She clearly had been discussed. You had recorded 618 Q. 15:03 16 reference to her in your notes? 17 Yes. Α. 18 619 At both meetings, isn't that right? Q. 19 That's correct. Α. 20 Was that the intention of Mr. Barrett as far as you 620 Q. 15:03 21 were concerned and did it seem to have been agreed 22 upon? 23 Yes, it was the intention of Mr. Barrett, yes. Α. And then what's the next one "welfare" is it? 24 621 Q. 25 It's just a reference to welfare. Α. 15:03 26 622 "What can we do for you? Back to work. Set up if I go Ο. 27 back and work as before. " 28 29 Is that right?

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	623	Q.	What does that mean?	
3		Α.	So Garda Keogh was making reference to the fact if he	
4			had gone back to work in his view nothing would have	
5			changed in the station or in the circumstances. So I	15:04
6			gathered from that he would have been reluctant to do	
7			so at that time.	
8	624	Q.	Yes. What's is the next entry there?	
9		Α.	"They worked off estimated time."	
10				15:04
11			I'm not sure what that was a reference to.	
12	625	Q.	Was that trying to project how long the investigation	
13			might take?	
14		Α.	Possibly, yes.	
15	626	Q.	Okay.	15:04
16		Α.	"Met with CMO meeting. Minutes of CMO Dr. Oghuvbu.	
17			Correspondence. "	
18				
19	627	Q.	Then there is a reference to "work related stress" and	
20			a arrow to "loss of allowance"	15:04
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	628	Q.	Was that something that he was pursuing or was that	
23			something you confirmed would happen?	
24		Α.	No, it was something that Garda Keogh and Mr. Cullen	
25			had been writing about and were trying to pursue and it	15:04
26			was raised at that meeting again.	
27	629	Q.	Yes. The reference then to "case conference pointed	
28			out flu, not work related stress, December '15.	

Meeting lied to."

29

Τ				
2			Is that right?	
3		Α.	Yes, they obviously came up with commentary during the	
4			meeting.	
5	630	Q.	On the next page there is a reference to	15:05
6		Α.	The Chief's office in Mullingar.	
7	631	Q.	"Superintendent McBrien was good".	
8		Α.	Yes. And I remember Garda Keogh was very complimentary	
9			of Superintendent McBrien interactions with him and	
10			support for him.	15:05
11	632	Q.	Then next, "but Ó Cualáin investigation took its	
12			course".	
13		Α.	Took its course.	
14	633	Q.	"subject to five investigations, same unit of garda	
15			I complained about for one year six months."	15:05
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	634	Q.	"No issue with Minister."	
18		Α.	"No issue with Mark Curran."	
19	635	Q.	"Chi ef's office."	
20		Α.	Offices, yes. "Pat Murray", I took these things as	15:06
21			people were speaking them, so I was writing very	
22			quickly. So "Pat Murray took from Noreen McBrien" is	
23			what that was saying, so in other words	
24			CHAIRMAN: Took over.	
25	636	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: The second entry at the top there, to	15:06
26			go back to that, Superintendent McBrien, was that	
27			"Superintendent McBrien was good, let Ó Cualáin	
28			investigation take its course" is that right?	
29		Α.	It was a combination of two commentaries. One, that	

1 Superintendent McBrien was good and that the Ó Cualáin 2 investigation took its course. 3 637 The Ó Cualáin, yes. Q. 4 Yes. Α. 5 638 Just going back down then, "Pat Murray took over from Q. 15:06 6 Noreen McBrien"? 7 Yeah. Α. 8 639 "Check allowance payments of injury on duty. Q. Are they 9 paid while out sick with injury on duty?" Yeah. 10 Α. 15:07 11 640 You have got an A there? Q. 12 Which is an action to myself. Α. 13 An action to yourself? 641 Q. 14 Α. To confirm and make sure that is the case or was the 15 case. 15:07 16 Then there is a reference to Garda A. 642 Yes. Is that 0. 17 "suspended"? 18 "Suspension by Donal Ó Cualáin". Α. 19 643 A reference then to Ms. B? Q. 20 Yes. Α. 15:07 A reference to a former chief superintendent? 21 644 Q. 22 Α. Yes. There's a lot of references then to Garda A and Ms. B 23 645 0. 24 on the next page, 3637? 25 Α. Yes. 15:07 26 646 But we don't need to go into them. At the top of page 0. 27 3638 it says: 28 29

"All aspects of my complaint are under"

- 1 A. "Some sort".
- 2 647 Q. "Some sort of investigation at present. No loose ends
- at present. But I am the one"?
- 4 A. "The only one pushing it".
- 5 648 Q. "GSOC cannot finish until Garda discipline has
- 6 concluded. "

7

- 8 Something about the other chief superintendent.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 649 Q. And there is Ms. B there, Garda A, we don't need to
- look at that. Going on to the last page, 3639. What
- 12 have you recorded there at the top?
- 13 A. "Cronyism pure and simple."
- 14 650 Q. Cronyism pure and simple. Something about farm trips?
- 15 A. Yeah. "Ryan [bl ank] and Gl acken.

15:08

15:08

15:08

- 16 651 Q. What's next there then?
- 17 A. "Those who told the truth not --" sorry "those who told
- the truth not promoted. Those who lied etcetera got
- 19 promoted."
- 20 652 Q. "Defenders of the house promoted."

15:08

- 21 A. Yeah.
- 22 653 Q. There's reference to the reports of the Commissioner to
- 23 the Minister?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 654 Q. And he was pressing to get those reports?

- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 655 Q. And you would deliver that query?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 656 Q. "Main conclusions" there:

Т				
2			"Possibility of injury"	
3		Α.	"On duty."	
4				
5			Sorry:	15:09
6				
7			"Possibility of inquiry into whole Ó Cualáin	
8			investigation. Discipline bullying and harassment	
9			pursued to end soon."	
10	657	Q.	Did your role cease thereafter in the sense that there	15:09
11			were an awful lot of strands you were dealing with	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	658	Q.	in terms of getting updates for the Commissioner or	
14			others, indeed, the chief administrative officer. Did	
15			you have any further function, not by supervising but	15:09
16			keeping up-to-date with what was happening with the	
17			McMahon inquiry, for instance?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	659	Q.	Or did you have any further contact with the further	
20			report sent in on behalf of the criminal investigation	15:10
21			to the director?	
22		Α.	No.	
23	660	Q.	In terms of the bullying and harassment complaint, were	
24			you consulted at any stage by Assistant Commissioner	
25			Finn in relation to any aspects of that?	15:10
26		Α.	No, not that I can no, not that I recall.	
27	661	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	But I don't believe so.	
29	662	Q.	The reporting of that wasn't back to you?	

- 1 A. No.
- 2 663 Q. It would go back to the same officer?
- 3 A. Absolutely. Mr. Barrett and Mr. Mulligan. Well, it
- 4 would be back to the appointing officer first and
- 5 then -- because once it leaves HR, HR has a management

15:10

15:11

15:11

- 6 role over it, the investigation is carried out outside
- 7 of HR.
- 8 664 Q. Yes. You do say in your statement that after this
- 9 period you did your best or continued in your efforts
- 10 to try and track correspondence, keep abreast of
- matters pertaining to Garda Keogh's health, wellbeing
- 12 and safety?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 665 Q. Did you issue a formal response to him in relation to
- these issues that were raised at the time?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 666 Q. Or that had been previously raised in correspondence?
- 18 A. No. I was satisfied to an extent that all elements of
- 19 Garda Keogh's complaints were now at least under
- investigation and were being pursued in whatever forum
- they were in.
- 22 667 Q. Yes. Garda Keogh, after this period, did he contact
- you in relation to any further action to be taken or in
- relation to a complaint about any other matter?
- A. No. Not that I'm aware of, no.
- 26 668 Q. I think you say in the conclusion of your statement
- that you have no knowledge or belief that Garda Keogh
- 28 was targeted or discredited with the knowledge or
- 29 acquiescence of members of An Garda Síochána. Is that

- your opinion from the papers that you have seen or what do you base that on?
- A. I can only base it on my interactions with the case and all elements of it. I don't believe, my own view is I don't believe people went out to target Garda Keogh. I 15:12 don't believe so. I think -- and Garda Keogh may have a different view obviously.
- 8 669 Q. Yes.
- 9 From a HR perspective and my own perspective, all I can Α. say is we did everything we could to try and support 10 15:12 11 Garda Keogh, we did everything we could to try and move 12 forward any of the aspects of the cases that he was, I 13 suppose, anxious about. And so we did everything we 14 could in our power to try and support him. 15 section representing the Garda organisation, that's 15:12 16 what we tried to do and that's what we did.
- 17 670 Q. Obviously the Chairman, it's his function to report on the matter?
- 19 A. Absolutely.
- 20 671 Q. But looking at the different elements from a HR point
  21 of view, the discipline inquiry commenced by an
  22 appointment in June 2015 and then reported in February
  23 2019, and you have heard the evidence presumably
  24 yesterday of Assistant Commissioner Sheehan with his
  25 view of all the imperfections in that?

- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 672 Q. That's not an area -- that area is Internal Affairs, is it?
- 29 A. It is.

- Exclusively. 1 673 Q.
- 2 Yes. It was one time within HR but it's is not any Α.
- 3 more.
- 4 674 Yes. Q.
- 5 And has been for quite a number of years. Α.
- Is it a HR issue as to whether an appointing 6 675 Q. 7 officer under the regulations, whether that function
- 8 should be conferred on the successor to that office
- or --9

26

It's not a HR matter. It's purely a matter for 10 Α. 15 · 14 11 Internal Affairs and governance.

15:13

15:14

15:14

15.15

- 12 Insofar as the pace of any investigations are 676 Q.
- 13 concerned, either the length, if you look at the
- 14 criminal investigation in its entirety, is it a HR
- 15 matter insofar as members aren't, as it were,
- 16 exclusively dedicated to criminal investigations or
- 17 have to take it on board in conjunction with their
- 18 normal other workloads?
- 19 I would have empathy with any of the people who get Α.
- substantial investigations to do, particularly 20
- superintendent and chief superintendents who have their 21
- 22 own portfolio to deal and manage their districts and
- their divisions and at the same time take on board 23
- 24 significant investigations on top of that. I think
- it's an onerous task, it's is a difficult one and it's 25
- a very difficult one to stay within any timelines, for 27 example, in the bullying and harassment policy, for
- It's a real challenge for our 28 them to maintain.
- organisation and has been for some time. 29

л Т	6//	Q.	i am sure there is debate going on about internal	
2		_	investigation units or Internal Affairs sections?	
3		Α.	Yes, yes.	
4	678	Q.	I don't intrude into any of those discussions. Thank	
5			you, Chief Superintendent McLoughlin.	15:15
6				
7			END OF EXAMINATION	
8				
9			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Now.	
10			MR. KELLY: Ms. Mulligan.	15:15
11			CHAIRMAN: Now, Ms. Mulligan.	
12				
13			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN WAS	
14			CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN, AS FOLLOWS:	
15				15:15
16	679	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Chief superintendent, I have very few	
17			questions for you. I am going to start with saying	
18			that Garda Keogh says that you did nothing but try to	
19			help him at every given moment. So my questions are in	
20			that vein. He is extremely complimentary of the help	15:15
21			that you provided to him in around 2016 in particular.	
22				
23			Can I just ask in relation to this issue about the rate	
24			of pay. So I think you gave evidence to the Chairman	
25			about an hour ago to say that the rate of pay for	15:16
26			injury on duty is the base rate and then an additional	
27			amount, which relates I think to a portion of overtime,	
28			something about a Sunday rate of pay, and other, we'll	
29			say, bits and pieces, is that right?	

- 1 A. Yes. The calculation on the potential loss of earnings
- that you would incur by virtue not being able to work,
- 3 your night duty and working Saturdays and Sundays.
- 4 680 Q. In terms of a rate, would you know approximately what

15:17

15:17

- 5 that rate might be?
- 6 A. I don't, but I think it would come close to what you
- 7 have lost.
- 8 681 Q. Say that to me again?
- 9 A. I think it would come close to the earnings you would
- 10 have lost by virtue of not being able to work them. So 15:16
- it's almost as if you're getting what would you have
- 12 got had you worked it.
- 13 682 Q. And is it a couple hundred euros in the month or is it
- 14 €100 in a week? Is it a very small amount of money or
- is it a large amount of money?
- 16 A. I think -- well I don't know, is the straight answer.
- 17 But working a Sunday carries a premium in terms of
- 18 night duty. So I don't know.
- 19 683 Q. CHAIRMAN: There would be a variety of allowances,
- isn't that right?
- 21 A. Yes, exactly.
- 22 684 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm sure we'll be able to find out the exact
- amount.
- 24 A. I can find out for you.
- MS. MULLIGAN: Yes.
- 26 685 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am sure it would be a significant figure.
- 27 A. It is. It is. Yes.
- 28 686 Q. CHAIRMAN: It's not nothing, because it would be
- various allowances to take account of, maybe unsocial

1 hours or this or that or the other, so it would be a 2 significant sum? 3 On a monthly basis Judge, probably I'd say at least Α. you're talking before tax probably €300 or €400. 4 5 CHAI RMAN: Yes. 15:17 6 687 MS. MULLIGAN: Very good. Thank you, chief Q. 7 superintendent. On that note, you did identify at page 8 3635 that this issue of the restoration of pay was brought up by Garda Keogh. There is a document. it's 9 10 10070, and I presume you haven't had sight of it, I 15:18 11 just want to confirm that that is the case. It's an 12 e-mail from Frank McDermott to the Commissioner that 13 relays Garda Keogh's position to the Commissioner, 14 where it identifies that Garda Keogh and his solicitor have sought the restoration of full pay for Garda 15 15:18 16 I just wanted to clarify, did anyone come to 17 you outside of Garda Keogh asking you to look into this 18 issue for him? 19 Α. No. 20 688 0. No. 15:18 21 Α. No. 22 So Garda Keogh comes to you, I think it's in and around 689 Q. 23 the same time? 24 Yeah. Α. Based on the note on 3635, identifying that he is 25 690 Q. 15:18 raising this issue of, I am in fact still losing a 26 27 relatively substantial sum? 28 Α. Yes. 691 29 And then this issue goes to the Commissioner in and Q.

1			around so again the 20th July. To the best of your	
2			knowledge and belief nobody else came to you to ask you	
3			to look into this issue again, is that right?	
4		Α.	Yes. The source of my information about it being a	
5			problem or an issue for Garda Cullen came from Garda	15:19
6			Cullen's or Garda Cullen's solicitor [sic] particularly	
7			in advance of and at the time of the meeting in	
8			December.	
9			MS. MULLIGAN: No further questions. Thank you very	
10			much, chief superintendent.	15:19
11				
12			END OF EXAMINATION	
13				
14			CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. McGarry, do you want go first	
15			Mr. McGarry and we will finish up with Mr. Murphy, if	15:19
16			you are happy with that.	
17			MR. McGARRY: I only have one very minor matter.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Very good. You appear for Commissioner	
19			Fanning, is that right?	
20			MR. McGARRY: Yes, Chairman.	15:19
21				
22			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY McLOUGHLIN WAS	
23			CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McGARRY, AS FOLLOWS:	
24				
25	692	Q.	MR. McGARRY: Page 3551, I think we had it earlier on.	15:19
26			Do you see there just in relation to the actions	
27			assigned, the very first one says assistant	
28			commissioner assigned Mr. Barrett to appoint an	
29			assistant commissioner, I think I'm correct that is not	

1			technically correct?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	693	Q.	Mr. Barrett nominates, the chain of command requires	
4			that the appointment is made by somebody else, isn't	
5			that right?	15:20
6		Α.	That's correct.	
7	694	Q.	I think that's is what happened, 2831 I think, I don't	
8			need to bring it up. In fact, Assistant Commissioner	
9			Fanning made the appointment although Mr. Barrett may	
10			have had the capacity to nominate a person, is that	15:20
11			right?	
12		Α.	Yeah. Sometimes you would nominate to the appointing	
13			officer.	
14	695	Q.	Yes.	
15		Α.	But the authority to do so rests with the officer	15:20
16			concerned.	
17	696	Q.	Thank you.	
18				
19			END OF EXAMINATION	
20				15:20
21			CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Yes. Mr. McGuinness.	
22				
23			CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN WAS EXAMINED BY	-
24			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS, AS FOLLOWS:	
25				15:20
26	697	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Chief superintendent, can I ask	
27			you just briefly to refer back to document 3259, Volume	
28			11, please. This is your note of your meeting with	
29			Garda Keogh?	

1		Α.	3259?	
2			CHAIRMAN: 3259, is that right, Mr. McGuinness?	
3	698	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: That's correct, in Volume 11.	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	699	Q.	And the fourth sentence down there:	15:21
6				
7			"He has become dependent on alcohol because of his work	
8			related stress."	
9				
10			You mentioned that in evidence already today?	15:21
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	700	Q.	At that meeting did Garda Keogh ever tell you that he	
13			had in the course of the Ó Cualáin investigation in a	
14			statement traced back his addiction downfall, if I can	
15			use that phrase, to 2009, when he started drinking	15:21
16			during the daytime?	
17		Α.	No.	
18	701	Q.	We don't need to refer to this document, but just for	
19			the benefit of the record, the reference in the	
20			Ó Cualáin inquiry to that issue is page 5978. At this	15:21
21			meeting of the 3rd June, did Garda Keogh stipulate why	
22			he wouldn't return to work at this time?	
23		Α.	Well, there was two reasons. One, he was still out of	
24			work, as certified by his GP. And secondly, I think he	
25			was anxious that going back to the same environment was	15:22
26			not going to be conducive to him at the time.	
27	702	Q.	Did he indicate why that was the case?	
28		Α.	Other than that the same structure was still in place,	
29			as he saw it. And I did offer I think then and on	

1			other occasions that if it was amenable to him we could	
2			explore other locations on his return, once he was	
3			certified fit to do so by the Chief Medical Officer.	
4	703	Q.	Then the third issue in relation to this meeting: Was	
5			the issue of injury on duty discussed with him at that	15:2
6			time?	
7		Α.	No. It was just the matter of pay per se, without	
8			exploring what that might be or look like.	
9	704	Q.	Can I just refer down to the second last if	
10			Mr. Kavanagh can scroll down please to the second last	15:2
11			X on that page or asterisk on that page. Can you just	
12			read out that paragraph?	
13		Α.	"I undertook to look into it."	
14	705	Q.	No, pay not an issue?	
15		Α.	"Pay not an issue for him but thought there was	15:2
16			procedure for work related stress being categorised as	
17			an injury on duty."	
18	706	Q.	So was the injury on duty issue not canvassed to some	
19			degree during the course of that meeting?	
20		Α.	Sorry, you're correct. He did. It was a perception	15:2
21			you're right, sorry, I beg your pardon. It was Garda	
22			Keogh's perception that once work related stress was	
23			categorised or diagnosed by medical or other people,	
24			that that automatically equated to an injury on duty.	
25			And it didn't.	15:2
26	707	Q.	I assume you would have discussed that issue with him	
27			and corrected him in that regard?	
28		Α.	Very briefly at that meeting. The concern was to try	
29			and restore him to the payroll and then perhaps look at	

1			other matters afterwards.	
2	708	Q.	Can I ask you to look at document 3302, please? This	
3			is a letter that has been opened to you today already?	
4		Α.	Yeah.	
5	709	Q.	From Garda Keogh to the Tánaiste?	15:24
6		Α.	Yeah.	
7	710	Q.	If you could go to page 3303?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	711	Q.	The last paragraph, the first sentence:	
10				15:24
11			"Chief Superintendent Tony McLoughlin undertook to	
12			investigate the harassment I received from elements	
13			within Garda management."	
14				
15			That is not correct, is it?	15:25
16		Α.	No. My understanding of the meeting that I had with	
17			Garda Keogh was that I took away from that meeting two	
18			things to do, one was pay and the other one was the	
19			categorisation on the system in relation to pay, but	
20			that he clearly discussed with me the fact that all of	15:25
21			those elements, as far as he was concerned, were now	
22			with GSOC and going to be investigated by them.	
23	712	Q.	You, of course, were very au fait with the regulations	
24			concerning bullying and harassment?	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:25
26	713	Q.	It would be very unlikely that would you have misled	
27			him in that regard, even inadvertently?	
28		Α.	If it was, it would be inadvertently, but I wouldn't do	

29

it because I would have been very conscious of it. And

1	I would be conscious also of the protected disclosures
2	legislation, whereby you could argue that GSOC could
3	have had a role to play in investigating items such as
4	those.

- Now, following this meeting -- sorry, following receipt 15:26 of this letter, you double checked then to make sure that there wasn't a complaint of bullying and harassment, isn't that right?
- Yeah, I became concerned when I saw that line that 9 Α. maybe Garda Keogh had a different interpretation than 10 15:26 11 the one I had. And so therefore I started about making 12 sure and trying to find out what was the state of play 13 from Garda Keogh's perspective relative to bullying and 14 harassment and checking to see was there any one made 15 at any stage in relation to it. 15:26
- 16 715 Q. And then if you look at document 3315, that's a letter
  17 from Kathleen Hassett to you in response to that
  18 enquiry?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 716 Q. Confirming that there was no record of a bullying and harassment complaint being lodged. If you could just go now to 3414, please, in Volume 12.
- 23 A. Yeah.
- 24 717 Q. Again, this is a record of a meeting you had with Garda 25 Keogh?

- A. It was a contact, I think, I had made with Garda Keogh, probably by phone.
- 28 718 Q. Sorry, I beg your pardon.
- 29 A. Yeah.

Т	/19	Q.	Phone Contact.	
2		Α.	Yeah.	
3	720	Q.	And at the bottom of that document, under the word	
4			"summary"	
5		Α.	Yes.	15:27
6	721	Q.	If you just read that out, please?	
7		Α.	"GSOC phoned yesterday and said bullying and harassment	
8			is a matter for AGS."	
9				
LO			An Garda Síochána	15:27
L1	722	Q.	So at that stage Garda Keogh is informing you that he	
L2			had been to GSOC and that GSOC weren't going to	
L3			progress a bullying and harassment issue?	
L4		Α.	That's right.	
L5	723	Q.	If we could move on now to the issue of pay. I am	15:27
L6			sorry, no, there's a couple more issues on this. Yes,	
L7			if we could go to 3468, please?	
L8		Α.	Yes.	
L9	724	Q.	This document of 20th October 2016 is a letter to you	
20			from Garda Keogh. It has already been opened today.	15:28
21			But this is the first document this is the first	
22			time Garda Keogh actually indicates that he is happy to	
23			go ahead with the bullying and harassment complaint,	
24			isn't that correct?	
25		Α.	That's correct, yeah.	15:28
26	725	Q.	So in terms of your involvement with Garda Keogh,	
27			you've gone through the months of July, July, August,	
28			September and almost all of October before he decides	
29			to green light the issue of bullying and harassment?	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 726 Q. If during that time he had indicated that he wished to
- 3 go ahead with his complaint in relation to bullying and
- 4 harassment, I assume that would you have taken
- 5 affirmative action at that time?
- 6 A. If I had any indication at all from Garda Keogh I would

15:29

15:29

- 7 have commenced or started to commence the process in
- 8 accordance with the policy, yes.
- 9 727 Q. Moving on now to the issue of pay reinstatement, you
- agree with me that the regulations do not cater for the 15:29
- reinstatement of pay in the circumstances that arose in
- 12 this particular case?
- 13 A. I'm aware of it now, I wouldn't necessarily have been
- aware of it -- oh sorry, I would have been aware of it
- then as well, that the sick pay regulations wouldn't
- have covered it yes, sorry, yes.
- 17 728 Q. And, in fact, the whole issue, as you have already
- 18 covered in evidence, was brought about by your
- intervention specifically?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 729 Q. And that this was a fix that you devised in relation to
- the protected disclosures of Garda Keogh?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 730 Q. And another guard, isn't that correct?
- A. Yes. Well, there's two previous members. I'm not too
- sure -- I don't think I was involved in those ones, but
- I was definitely involved in this one, yes.
- 28 731 Q. And as a result of that his pay was reinstated in
- 29 October 2016?

1		Α.	Yes.					
2	732	Q.	If we could just have a look at document 3541, please?	If we could just have a look at document 3541, please?				
3			CHAIRMAN: And was he paid backpay?					
4		Α.	He was, yes.					
5	733	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But at the level that Ms. Mulligan	15:30				
6			identified, less any allowances that you would get for					
7			actually showing up and standing on the beat or					
8			whatever it was?					
9		Α.	Exactly. Yes, exactly.					
10			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, sorry, Mr. McGuinness. 3541.	15:30				
11	734	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Thank you Chairman. 3541, which					
12			is the letter that Mr. McGuinness has happened already.	is the letter that Mr. McGuinness has happened already.				
13			It's the e-mail from Mr. Cullen's office to the					
14			Minister for Justice, the Commissioner, Josephine					
15			Feehily, and Caoimhghín Ó Caoláin TD.	15:31				
16			CHAIRMAN: Just give me the date of that, I am sure I					
17			have it but					
18			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: It is 17th August 2017.					
19			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.					
20	735	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: If I could just ask you to look	15:31				
21			at the bottom paragraph in that e-mail at page 3542?					
22		Α.	Yes.					
23	736	Q.	3542, Mr. Kavanagh, please. Yes.					
24								
25			"Garda Keogh is consigned to suffering ongoing	15:31				
26			detriment as a consequence of this non-processing of					
27			his formal bullying complaints of the official					
28			misrecording of the medical reasons for his absence					
29			through his reduced pay."					

1				
2			That's incorrect?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	737	Q.	And if we go up another two paragraphs, we see:	
5				15:32
6			"We secondly again advise that An Garda Síochána has	
7			persistently misrecorded on its internal memoranda that	
8			Garda Keogh has been absent from work due to flu and	
9			mental health."	
10				15:32
11			Then he goes on to say:	
12				
13			"It is the case that Garda Keogh has on the contrary	
14			been absent from work since December '15 because of	
15			work related stress caused by harassment and bullying	15:32
16			visited on him by the management of An Garda Síochána	
17			and by Superintendent Murray."	
18				
19			The mental health classification, if you like, was	
20			brought about as a result of your intervention, isn't	15:32
21			that correct?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	738	Q.	And do you agree with me that that in no way impacted	
24			negatively on the pay arrangements of Garda Keogh?	
25		Α.	No, because we already intervened and we already put	15:32
26			him back on the payroll.	
27	739	Q.	Just on this topic, if we could go to page 3563. This	
28			is the letter that Garda Keogh wrote to Mr. Cullen on	
29			17th September 2017, and that Mr. Cullen submitted in	

Τ			turn to the Minister, to the Garda Commissioner and to	
2			Josephine Feehily on 21st September 2017. That was	
3			done at page 3558. But if we can just stay for now at	
4			page 3563, please, and that first paragraph there.	
5				15:34
6			"Sick with the flu for over a year. It was then	
7			changed to sick other and now it's mental health. I	
8			should be marked out in accordance with work related	
9			stress and on a pay rate of injury on duty like every	
10			other garda who hasn't made a protected disclosure.	15:34
11			Can this be sorted out?"	
12				
13			To the best of your knowledge that statement in	
14			relation to every other guard	
15		Α.	Is incorrect.	15:34
16	740	Q.	is incorrect?	
17		Α.	They would have been on the same arrangement as we put	
18			Garda Keogh on.	
19	741	Q.	Thank you. Now, if we could go onto the issue of	
20			delay. We have already heard your evidence about the	15:34
21			initiation of the bullying and harassment in October	
22			2017 and the actual appointment and nomination of	
23			Assistant Commissioner Finn in November 2017. That is	
24			the time period we're talking about here. If I could	
25			ask you briefly to go to document 3476, please.	15:34
26		Α.	Sorry, 34	
27	742	Q.	3476. That is in Volume 12.	
28		Α.	Yeah.	
29	743	0	Again this is a letter from Mr. Cullen to the	

Т			Minister, to the commissioner, to Mr. Barrett. It is	
2			dated 23rd November 2016. Now, bearing in mind the	
3			time that you dealt with Garda Keogh in relation to the	
4			initiation of the bullying and harassment complaint in	
5			the months that we've discussed, June, July, August,	15:35
6			September, October, this letter is fairly hot off the	
7			bat in November 2017, isn't that correct?	
8		Α.	That's correct.	
9	744	Q.	Once he has actually come forward with the And he	
10			complains, at page 3477, "ongoing live health safety	15:36
11			management issues and/or delegate to GSOC". I should	
12			have read the first line of that?	
13				
14			"We again submit that the Minister and the Commissioner	
15			cannot turn a blind eye to ongoing live health and	15:36
16			safety management issues and/or delegate to GSOC. In	
17			this latter regard, we enclose copy letter from John	
18			Barrett dated the 11th October."	
19				
20			Am I correct in saying that the enthusiasm for GSOC's	15:36
21			involvement in this came from Garda Keogh?	
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	745	Q.	Not from	
24		Α.	No.	
25	746	Q.	the Guards?	15:36
26		Α.	No. No.	
27	747	Q.	And at that stage the bullying and harassment complaint	
28			was initiated	
29		Α.	It was.	

- 1 748 Q. -- only in October '16?
- 2 A. Yeah.
- 3 749 Q. A month before the letter was sent?
- 4 A. Yeah.
- 5 750 Q. If I can ask you now to look at document 3474 in the
- 6 same volume. So we're now dealing with the passage of

15:36

15:37

15:37

15:37

- 7 time, if you like, during the course of the initiation
- 8 of the bullying and harassment complaint?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 751 Q. And matters that transpired during the course of that
- period immediately after. November 2016, there is this
- issue about Chief Superintendent Gralton, that's a note
- of your meeting with Garda Keogh or contact with Garda
- 14 Keogh?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 752 Q. And Garda Keogh was suggesting that there is a conflict
- 17 with Chief Superintendent Gralton taking any statement,
- isn't that correct?
- 19 A. That's correct.
- 20 753 Q. And then if we go to 3508?
- 21 A. 350 --
- 22 754 Q. -- 08?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 755 Q. Here we have Assistant Commissioner Fanning writing to
- 25 Chief Superintendent Scanlan and advising Chief
- Superintendent Scanlan that Garda Keogh wishes to make
- a complaint under the bullying and harassment scheme.
- 28 So this essentially the kick off in relation to the
- investigation of that complaint, isn't that correct?

1	Α.	Yes.
	<b>~</b> :	103.

2	756	Q.	But the assistant commissioner asks him to determine if	
3			Garda Keogh's complaint comes within the policy and	
4			that the correct rank and grade be appointed as	
5			investigator. Can you please make the necessary	15:3
6			arrangements to ensure that a copy of the policy is	
7			provided Garda Keogh and he should be advised under the	
8			procedures and processes involved that he may seek the	
9			advice of the equality officer in Garda Headquarters.	

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

15:38

So he is essentially sending Chief Superintendent Scanlan out to see exactly who should be appointed it do the investigation at this point in time. He's not actually having Chief Superintendent Scanlan investigate the bullying?

15:39

A. Yeah, I suspect what the AC is trying to allude here is, okay, before he makes the appointment he needs to know what's the appropriate rank, and that would depend on who the complaint is against. I'm only guessing, that's what he wants to be satisfied himself with.

15:39

21 757 Q. Yes. And that's an appropriate step to take?

22 A. Yes.

Then if we go to -- it's March 2017 by the time that
Garda Keogh had actually engaged fully with Chief
Superintendent Scanlan. And there's a suggestion also
by Garda Keogh that the chief superintendent may be
conflicted --

28 A. Yes.

29 759 Q. -- in his involvement in the investigation at that

Т			stage?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	760	Q.	That obviously involves a certain amount of delay also.	
4		Α.	Yes.	
5	761	Q.	Can I ask you to look at document 10, 10478, please.	15:40
6			That's in Volume 36 or 37. You might have seen this	
7			document before?	
8		Α.	No.	
9	762	Q.	This is a chronology that Inspector McCarthy has	
10			prepared, James McCarthy, for the assistant	15:40
11			commissioner and it's dated 3rd April 2018. It deals	
12			with suggestions that there has been perhaps some delay	
13			in the ongoing bullying and harassment investigation.	
14			This document sets out the steps that were taken along	
15			the way in relation to that process. We have already	15:41
16			gone through some of them in your evidence, in fact	
17			most of them in your evidence already. Were you aware	
18			that Inspector McCarthy had visited Garda Keogh	
19			approximately five times?	
20		Α.	No. I was aware from one of the meetings where he was	15:41
21			tasked with going to meet him as a result of that	
22			meeting, which is either the 3rd or sometime in	
23			October, I have just given evidence in relation to	
24			that.	
25	763	Q.	The October 17th meeting?	15:41
26		Α.	Yeah. I wasn't aware that he had actually met him on	
27			five occasions, no.	
28	764	Q.	So in that case you wouldn't be aware of the fruits of	
29			those discussions or meetings?	

1		Α.	No, no, no.	
2	765	Q.	Just for the record, Garda Keogh's evidence as to	
3			confirmation that there were five such meetings is	
4			contained at Day 111, page 158. Perhaps we might have	
5			a look at page 159 of that transcript, please, Day 111.	15:
6			Actually, Mr. Kavanagh, if you can go to page 158,	
7			please, and if you scroll down to line 16. There's the	
8			piece of evidence in relation to the five times he	
9			visits. Okay. And then he was asked a question at	
10			line 27:	15:
11				
12			"Was he delivering any other messages apart from what	
13			was in the letters?"	
14				
15			And the response was:	15:
16				
17			"Oh no, no. No, no. Because, Judge, I was trying to	
18			find out from Inspector McCarthy what they knew about	
19			what was going on in Athlone. I was actually trying to	
20			find out and it appeared that both Inspector McCarthy	
21			and Assistant Commissioner Fanning were kept completely	
22			in the dark in relation to everything that went on in	
23			Athlone. Because I was obviously trying to find out	
24			what was going on. I mentioned a report that I may	
25			have been taken up wrong here."	
26				
27			If you go on further down.	
28				
29			"But they seem to not know a whole lot about what was	

Т			going on, which was incredible in that Assistant	
2			Commissioner Fanning is the assistant commissioner of	
3			the Eastern Region, where all these problems were, and	
4			he seemed to be kept in the dark about everything."	
5				
6			Were you ever told about that?	
7		Α.	No.	
8	766	Q.	By Garda Keogh?	
9		Α.	No. No, absolutely not.	
10	767	Q.	In any sense was assistant commissioner ever kept in	15:44
11			the dark in relation to anything about Garda Keogh?	
12		Α.	Well, I wouldn't know that.	
13	768	Q.	Insofar as you are aware?	
14		Α.	No. Well, he's the commander in charge of that	
15			particular area, so	15:44
16	769	Q.	Yes. And then further down, at line 22, Garda Keogh	
17			says:	
18				
19			"How do you know he was kept in the dark?	
20			A. It was Inspector McCarthy, I was trying to find	15:44
21			out."	
22				
23			So if we might just go briefly back to that 10478	
24			chronology,	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:44
26	770	Q.	We can see that page 10479 sets out the chronology all	
27			the way through 2017. 10480 goes into some further	
28			detail also. Now, the list contains things that	
29			Inspector McCarthy did, it also contains things that	

1		you did and matters that were going on at the relevant	
2		time. But I just wish to reference that for you.	
3	Α.	Okay.	
4		CHAIRMAN: what's vis the question about this,	
5		Mr. McGuinness, is there a question here?	15:45
6		MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: I suppose I just wanted to put	
7		in front of	
8		CHAIRMAN: A lot of things happened and a lot of things	
9		were	
10		MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Yes. The question in a sense	15:45
11		has already been answered, was this witness aware that	
12		there was a parallel set of conversations and meetings	
13		ongoing between Inspector McCarthy and Garda Keogh.	
14		CHAIRMAN: I mean, I may be wrong but I think this is	
15		the very essence of Garda Keogh's complaint. That	15:46
16		between one thing and the inquiry. He has other	
17		complaints about the Finn investigation but all this	
18		actually happened and it took them all that time.	
19		That's what I understand is his complaint.	
20		MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Yes, Chairman, I accept that	15:46
21		that might be his compliant.	
22		CHAIRMAN: I mean, the fact that there were a lot of	
23		things going on and that A was writing to B and C was	
24		writing to A and they were all wondering about what the	
25		right thing to do was and would it be a Byrne/McGinn or	15:46
26		some other type, whatever, bullying and harassment.	
27		There it is anyway. As you say, it's recorded there,	
28		we can have an argument about it sorry, there can be	
29		an argument about it in due course as to the	

1	significance of that. That's really the case, isn't	
2	it? I mean, Garda Keogh doesn't dispute, as I	
3	understand it, that these things happened.	
4	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Yes. Garda Keogh in his	
5	evidence, on Day 116, accepted that he had no complaint	15:47
6	in relation to all the things that happened with	
7	Inspector McCarthy and Assistant Commissioner Fanning.	
8	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
9	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: In fact, it's contained at page	
10	160.	15:47
11	CHAIRMAN: Of Day 116, is it? Thanks very much.	
12	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Day 116.	
13	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. There you go.	
14	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: At line 3.	
15	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	15:47
16	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS:	
17		
18	"Q. I think you will agree with me that your evidence	
19	so far is that you have no criticism of Assistant	
20	Commissioner Fanning's stewardship of managing the file	15:48
21	between that date and November 2017, isn't that right?	
22	A. Now, can you just repeat that please?	
23	Q. In your evidence in the earlier issues dealing with	
24	the Finn investigation in particular, I think you	
25	agreed that you were weren't criticising Assistant	15:48
26	Commissioner Fanning for his stewardship of his part of	
27	the process between March 2017 and November 2017, is	
28	that right?	
29	A. Yeah."	

2			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
3	771	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: so in relation to I suppose	
4			the next question that is linked to this is, if we go	
5			to document 3541. And we are back to the letter that I	15:48
6			opened previously, the letter from Mr. Cullen on 17th	
7			August 2017. And if we go to page 3543 and the first	
8			paragraph:	
9				
10			"It appears on the one hand that for over 18 months any	15:49
11			investigation into this grave and systematic bullying	
12			has been officially camouflaged, secreted and placed on	
13			hold while on the other hand the promotion of	
14			Superintendent Murray to chief superintendent has been	
15			covertly preferred, protected from the inside and	15:49
16			furti vel y advanced."	
17				
18			Is completely incorrect?	
19		Α.	Most definitely from our perspective, from my	
20			perspective.	15:49
21	772	Q.	Just before we leave that matter, the letter at 3543 is	
22			cc'd to Assistant Commissioner Fintan fanning?	
23		Α.	Yeah.	
24	773	Q.	John Barrett?	
25		Α.	Yes.	15:50
26	774	Q.	Clare Daly TD and Michael Wallace TD. Do any of the	
27			recipients surprise you in relation to the copying of	
28			that letter?	
29		Δ	Other than John Barrett the others would to be	

1			honest, and it would have been the first time that I	
2			would have seen AC Fanning cc'd on documentation coming	
3			through to me from Mr. Cullen or otherwise.	
4	775	Q.	Sorry, Chairman one moment.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Take your time.	15:50
6	776	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: If we can go to 10245, please.	
7			This is quite hard to read. You have already referred	
8			in your evidence to the case conference of the 23rd	
9			October, you've already referred to that.	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:52
11	777	Q.	This is an a newspaper report of 13th November 2017, in	
12			the Irish Independent by Niall O'Connor. And it refers	
13			to, and the heading "row erupts over whistleblower's	
14			bullying claims."	
15				15:52
16			If I could just read out the part that I want to refer	
17			to.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Tell us where it is.	
19			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: It's the first paragraph,	
20			Chairman.	15:52
21			CHAIRMAN: Oh yes.	
22			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: "Seni or Garda bosses have	
23			clashed over the handling of allegations of bullying	
24			and harassment by a Garda whistleblower who took a	
25			leave of absence after presenting claims of major	15:52
26			criminal wrongdoing involving officers in the midlands.	
27				
28			The Irish Independent has Learned the bullying	
29			allegation made by Garda Nick Keogh had been the	

1			subject of a series of tense meetings in Garda	
2			Headquarters in recent days, with one member of Garda	
3			management strongly criticising the force's treatment	
4			of the decorated officer.	
5				15:53
6			Assistant Commissioner Fanning has hit out at the delay	
7			in dealing with the bullying allegations by Garda	
8			Keogh, who claims his life has been destroyed after	
9			coming forward with his claims of criminal wrongdoing."	
10				15:53
11			Now, can I just stop at that, as a matter, was that an	
12			issue that occurred during the course of the meeting on	
13			the 23rd?	
14		Α.	There was obviously healthy discourse and discussion	
15			about what the way forward was. Obviously there was a	15:53
16			difference of opinion between AC Fanning and others at	
17			the meeting of the 23rd.	
18	778	Q.	Yes. And if I recall your evidence correctly, the	
19			issue or one of the major issues was this idea that	
20			there had to be the wider inquiry?	15:53
21		Α.	Yes, most definitely.	
22	779	Q.	Of the type of Byrne/McGinn?	
23		Α.	Most definitely.	
24	780	Q.	Yes. Were you surprised to see the detail of this	
25			appearing in the newspaper at the time?	15:53
26		Α.	I didn't see it, to be honest with you. I am seeing it	
27			now for the first time. And I am surprised that a	
28			meeting what I would see as a confidential meeting	
29			in headquarters about what the best way forward was in	

1			relation to any member of staff would appear in a	
2			newspaper in that vein. I would be I would be very,	
3			very disappointed.	
4	781	Q.	I see. And then it goes on:	
5				15:54
6			"It is understood Mr. Fanning will secure agreement	
7			from Acting Garda Commissioner Donal Ó Cualáin to	
8			appoint an assistant commissioner to investigate how	
9			Garda Keogh was being treated.	
10				15:54
11			Assistant Commissioner Fanning has held a number of	
12			meetings in recent days about the case with John	
13			Barrett, the force's head of Human Resources, and Joe	
14			Nugent, the force's chief administrative officer.	
15				15:54
16			It is understood that Mr. Nugent proposed that Garda	
17			Keogh's complaints be the subject of"	
18				
19			I am just missing a line there	
20				15:54
21			" a scoping exercise.	
22				
23			Garda Keogh is understood to have strongly criticised	
24			this proposal as being completely inadequate in a	
25			letter sent to Commissioner Ó Cualáin through solicitor	15:55
26			John Gerard Cullen this week."	
27				
28			MR. KELLY: Chairman, I was just wondering what the	
29			relevance of all this is an article from the Trish	

2 Well, Mr. McGuinness, what is the relevance CHAI RMAN: 3 of all this? MR. DONAL McGUI NNESS: I suppose this is a document 4 5 that was in the public domain at the relevant time. It 15:55 6 reports what transpired at the meeting. I mean there's a bit of me -- I'm sorry, the 7 CHAI RMAN: 8 devious part of my brain can work out an implication or an inference that I am expected to draw from it but I 9 10 can reassure anybody that I don't propose to draw any 15:55 such inference unless I am satisfied that it's 11 12 relevant. So basically, maybe that's of help. 13 I can see, I can see -- sorry, what am I supposed to do read between -- I don't even have to read between the 14 15 I just have to read the lines to see what I am 16 supposed to infer, deduce. There we are. 17 MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: very good, Chairman. 18 CHAI RMAN: Okay. 19 782 MR. DONAL McGUI NNESS: In relation to the issue that Q. 20 was discussed at the 23rd October meeting --15:56 21 CHAI RMAN: I think we can forget this, can we forget 22 the newspaper report. MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: 23 We can. 24 Thanks very much, that's grand. CHAI RMAN: 25 MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: In relation to the issue that we 15:56 783 Q. discussed or you discussed earlier about the 26 27 appointment of Assistant Commissioner McPartlin to do a 28 scoping exercise?

1

29

Α.

Yes.

Independent.

	704	Q.	That was never actually	
2		Α.	Not to my knowledge, no.	
3	785	Q.	I understand she will say in her statement that she was	
4			never even approached about that matter?	
5		Α.	I think she will.	15:56
6	786	Q.	Now, just one final matter, and that is if we refer	
7			back to document 3635, please?	
8			CHAIRMAN: 3635, is that right?	
9			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: 3635.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Just to get a note of the right	15:57
11			number.	
12	787	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: This is the last meeting that we	
13			referred to with Garda Keogh. At page 3636, the fourth	
14			answer down, you have already referred to this entry	
15			with Mr. McGuinness:	15:57
16				
17			"No issue with Mark Curran. It was chief's offices."	
18				
19			That's Chief Superintendent Curran, he had no issue	
20			with him at that point in time, is that correct?	15:57
21		Α.	That's what that suggests, yeah.	
22	788	Q.	And that was dated 15th December 2017?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	789	Q.	Then if we just scroll over, this is an entry that	
25			wasn't referred to earlier, and again, we're at the	15:57
26			fifth asterisk down. That's the entry, the last entry,	
27			at the bottom of the screen:	
28				
29			"Mul cahy, Coppi nger "	

1				
2		Α.	" Top investigators".	
3	790	Q.	Top investigators. So what was that entry being made	
4			in connection with?	
5		Α.	It was a discussion that was held and Garda Keogh was	15:58
6			alluding to the fact that he felt those two members	
7			were very competent investigators and he seemed to be	
8			happy with what they had done.	
9			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Thank you, assistant	
10			commissioner.	15:58
11			CHAIRMAN: Very good.	
12			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: or chief superintendent, sorry.	
13				
14			END OF EXAMINATION	
15				15:58
16			MS. MULLIGAN: Chairman, my apologies, before	
17			Mr. McGuinness takes up his re-examination.	
18			CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, say that again.	
19			MS. MULLIGAN: Before Mr. McGuinness takes up his	
20			re-examination, there's just one issue that arises, if	15:58
21			I might be in a position to clarify it. It's just at	
22			page 3304.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Yes. Well, raise it anyway and then we will	
24			see. 3304. Yes.	
25			MS. MULLIGAN: My client provides me with an	15:59
26			instruction that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin is	
27			correct in his understanding of the bullying and	
28			harassment, that my client undertook to think about it	
29			and not that the chief superintendent was actually	

1	asked to move on it in the first instance, and that	
2	Mr. McLoughlin's position is correct, not incorrect,	
3	as is later borne out in the correspondence. That's	
4	his position now.	
5	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for clarifying that.	15:59
6	Thank you. Are we all clear on what Ms. Mulligan is	
7	saying there?	
8	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Yes, Chairman.	
9	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.	
10	MS. MULLIGAN: That is the only issue.	15:59
11	CHAIRMAN: Very good, thanks very much. It has been a	
12	long day, chief, superintendent. So you're free to go.	
13	Thanks very much. Will we need Chief Superintendent	
14	McLoughlin on some other occasion.	
15	MR. McGUINNESS: I don't think so, Chairman.	15:59
16	CHAIRMAN: I don't think, no, I think you are in the	
17	clear.	
18		
19	THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
20		16:00
21	CHAIRMAN: Okay, thanks very much.	
22		
23	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL WEDNESDAY, 17TH	
24	FEBRUARY 2020 AT 10: 30AM	
25		
26		
27		
28		
29		

	1	T	1	
•	<b>15</b> [1] - 3:9	23:25, 47:25, 50:1,	3	<b>3443</b> [1] - 64:27
	<b>158</b> [2] - 160:4, 160:6	54:7, 57:13, 60:1,	<u> </u>	<b>3444</b> [1] - 65:21
	<b>159</b> [1] - 160:5	61:9, 72:24, 85:17,		<b>3452</b> [1] - 89:23
<b>'14</b> [1] - 11:28	<b>15th</b> [5] - 53:19,	115:15, 130:4,	<b>3</b> [6] <b>-</b> 3:3, 50:23,	<b>3467</b> [1] - 66:10
<b>'15</b> [2] - 134:28,	69:8, 75:7, 131:23,	142:21, 151:19,	96:25, 97:5, 117:13,	<b>3468</b> [2] - 67:2,
154:14	169:22	152:29, 156:2, 157:11	163:14	151:17
<b>'16</b> [6] - 10:24, 11:22,	<b>16</b> [3] - 1:5, 3:10,	<b>2017</b> [26] - 1:5, 1:9,	<b>3/10</b> [1] - 123:3	<b>3469</b> [1] - 68:2
12:9, 86:8, 132:27,	160:7	68:7, 77:14, 88:3,	<b>3/6/20</b> [1] - 87:6	<b>3472</b> [1] - 69:12
157:1	<b>160</b> [1] - 163:10	88:27, 95:22, 106:8,	<b>30</b> [1] - 3:17	<b>3474</b> [2] - 70:28,
'illness [1] - 26:26	<b>16418</b> [2] - 6:21,	130:4, 130:7, 130:16,	<b>31</b> [1] - 3:18	157:5
'only [1] - 57:27	63:20	130:23, 153:18,	<b>31st</b> [3] - 35:17,	<b>3476</b> [3] - 72:25,
	<b>16th</b> [3] - 50:1,	154:29, 155:2,	80:25, 82:3	155:25, 155:27
0	53:29, 73:18	155:22, 155:23,	<b>32</b> [2] - 2:24, 3:18	<b>3477</b> [2] - 73:2,
	<b>17</b> [2] - 1:9, 3:10	156:7, 158:23,	<b>32</b> [1] - 78:19	156:10
457.00	<b>17TH</b> [1] - 171:23	161:27, 163:21,	<b>3228</b> [1] - 6:19	<b>3492</b> [2] - 73:29,
<b>08</b> [1] - 157:22	<b>17th</b> [4] - 153:18,	163:27, 164:7,	<b>3241</b> [3] - 78:16,	74:12
_	154:29, 159:25, 164:6	165:11, 169:22	78:20, 79:4	<b>3493</b> [2] - 74:13,
1	<b>18</b> [3] - 3:11, 92:17,	<b>2018</b> [2] - 1:9, 159:11	<b>3250</b> [2] - 15:13,	74:19
	164:10	<b>2019</b> [1] - 140:23	16:21	<b>3494</b> [2] - 74:22,
<b>1</b> [7] - 3:2, 15:15,	<b>183</b> [1] - 23:18	<b>2020</b> [3] - 1:18, 6:2,	<b>3251</b> [1] - 20:6	74:24
96:25, 96:28, 116:15,	<b>18TH</b> [2] - 1:18, 6:1	171:24	<b>3253</b> [2] - 22:19,	<b>35</b> [1] - 3:20
117:28, 118:5	<b>18th</b> [1] - 88:27	<b>20th</b> [9] - 14:27,	22:21	<b>350</b> [1] - 157:21
<b>10</b> [2] - 3:7, 159:5	<b>19</b> [1] - 3:11	42:23, 59:1, 66:29,	<b>3255</b> [1] - 26:20	<b>3505</b> [1] - 75:8
<b>100%</b> [1] - 50:29	<b>1921</b> [1] - 1:9	81:4, 83:18, 84:15,	<b>3256</b> [1] - 27:17	<b>3506</b> [2] - 75:22,
<b>10070</b> [1] - 144:10	<b>1984</b> [1] - 6:25	145:1, 151:19	<b>3257</b> [1] - 28:12	75:23
<b>10245</b> [1] - 165:6	<b>1992</b> [1] - 6:27	<b>21</b> [1] - 3:12	<b>3259</b> [4] - 30:12,	<b>3507</b> [1] - 76:1
<b>10478</b> [2] - 159:5,	<b>1994</b> [1] - 63:25	<b>21st</b> [4] - 61:8, 96:13,	146:27, 147:1, 147:2	<b>3508</b> [2] - 76:13,
161:23	<b>1996</b> [1] - 6:29	130:16, 155:2	<b>3261</b> [1] - 38:1	157:20
<b>10479</b> [1] - 161:26	19th [10] - 15:8,	<b>22</b> [2] - 3:13, 161:16	<b>3262</b> [1] - 38:12	<b>3512</b> <sub>[2]</sub> - 78:12,
<b>10480</b> [1] - 161:27	23:25, 26:22, 35:2,	<b>22-day</b> [1] - 46:16	<b>3264</b> [1] - 38:26	79:14
10:30AM [1] - 171:24	55:29, 57:12, 85:10,	<b>22nd</b> [2] - 76:15,	<b>3267</b> [1] - 42:19	<b>3514</b> <sub>[1]</sub> - 80:21
10:50AM[1] = 17 1:24 10th [2] = 114:9,	115:22, 119:1	130:23	<b>3269</b> [1] - 43:2	<b>3516</b> [1] - 80:24
114:25	1st [1] - 57:7	<b>23</b> [1] - 3:13	<b>3280</b> [1] - 45:24	<b>3517</b> [1] - 82:4
<b>11</b> [5] - 3:7, 6:19, 7:2,	151[1] - 57.7	23rd [11] - 19:24,	<b>3282</b> [1] - 46:8	<b>3525</b> [1] - 84:17
146:28, 147:3	2	20:6, 26:18, 72:24,	<b>3283</b> [1] - 47:1	<b>3526</b> [1] - 129:29
<b>11-13</b> [1] - 4:3	2	119:9, 119:15, 156:2,	<b>3288</b> [1] - 47:12	<b>3527</b> [1] - 85:13
<b>111</b> [2] - 160:4, 160:5		165:8, 166:13,	<b>3292</b> [3] - 50:2, 50:3,	<b>3529</b> [2] - 87:1,
<b>1137</b> [1] - 132:14	<b>2</b> [8] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9,	166:17, 168:20	50:4	129:29
1	50:19, 96:21, 96:25,	<b>24</b> [1] - 3:14	<b>3294</b> [1] - 50:11	
<b>116</b> [3] - 163:5, 163:11, 163:12	97:2, 116:25	<b>24th</b> [7] - 67:3,	<b>33</b> [1] - 3:19	<b>3530</b> [1] - 87:19 <b>3541</b> [5] - 89:7,
11th [1] - 156:18	<b>20</b> [3] - 3:12, 48:5,	77:27, 78:10, 79:14,	<b>33-34</b> [1] - 4:12	
	58:1	79:17, 80:3, 128:4	<b>3302</b> [2] - 47:21,	153:2, 153:10,
<b>12</b> [6] - 3:8, 4:8, 6:20, 7:2, 150:22, 155:27	<b>2005</b> [1] - 58:24	<b>25</b> [1] - 3:14	149:2	153:11, 164:5 <b>3542</b> [3] - 89:11,
12:00pm [1] - 95:22	<b>2009</b> [1] - 147:15	<b>25th</b> [3] - 51:28,	<b>3303</b> [1] - 149:7	153:21, 153:23
<b>12.00piii</b> [1] - 95.22 <b>12th</b> [5] - 45:22,	<b>2009/2010</b> [1] - 7:3	93:13, 128:11	<b>3304</b> [3] - 49:9,	<b>3543</b> [2] - 164:7,
66:5, 85:13, 114:9,	<b>2010</b> [1] - 7:3	<b>26</b> [1] - 3:15	170:22, 170:24	
115:5	<b>2012</b> [1] - 10:2	<b>26/12/215</b> [1] - 22:25	<b>3311</b> [1] - 51:18	164:21 <b>3545</b> [1] - 93:28
	<b>2013</b> [4] - 7:6, 7:13,	<b>26th</b> [6] - 25:5,	<b>3314</b> [1] - 51:16	
<b>13</b> [2] - 2:31, 3:8	7:19, 8:5	47:12, 62:5, 62:10,	<b>3315</b> [2] - 53:19,	<b>3546</b> [1] - 94:1
<b>139/10</b> [3] - 24:21,	<b>2014</b> [11] - 1:3, 8:5,	64:17, 68:2	150:16	<b>3547</b> [1] - 95:3
38:9, 44:21	8:7, 11:17, 11:18,	<b>27</b> [2] - 3:15, 160:10	<b>3316</b> [1] - 54:3	<b>3549</b> [1] - 101:5
<b>13th</b> [6] - 64:19,	11:24, 23:17, 51:4,	<b>27th</b> [2] - 80:20,	<b>3319</b> [1] - 56:6	<b>3551</b> [2] - 112:16,
78:15, 78:22, 79:8,	54:14, 57:26, 112:27	84:20		145:25
79:18, 165:11	<b>2015</b> [10] - 10:14,	<b>28</b> [1] - 3:16	<b>3321</b> [1] - 57:8	<b>3553</b> [2] - 114:8,
<b>14</b> [2] - 3:9, 55:18	23:3, 25:5, 36:10,	<b>2831</b> [1] - 146:7	<b>34</b> [2] - 3:19, 155:26	114:10
<b>141</b> [1] - 1:18	44:20, 47:12, 48:12,	<b>28th</b> [2] - 84:16, 95:3	<b>3414</b> [2] - 58:18,	<b>3554</b> [1] - 114:2
<b>142</b> [1] - 5:6	48:14, 64:18, 140:22	<b>29</b> [1] - 3:17	150:22	<b>3558</b> [2] - 96:13,
<b>145</b> [1] - 5:7	<b>2016</b> [23] - 9:3,	<b>29/8/16</b> [1] - 57:14	<b>3415</b> [1] - 60:2	155:3
<b>146</b> [1] - 5:8	10:24, 12:2, 12:24,	<b>2nd</b> [4] - 61:9, 84:20,	<b>3432</b> [1] - 61:10	<b>3559</b> [1] - 96:21
<b>14th</b> [2] - 46:19,	14:23, 14:26, 14:28,	99:4, 106:7	<b>3441</b> [1] - 62:8	<b>3560</b> [1] - 98:13
47:21	, , , , , ,	33.1, 100.7	<b>3442</b> [1] - 64:14	
			1	

<b>3563</b> [2] - 154:27,	97:23, 97:25, 118:4	<b>AC</b> [18] - 23:10,	actions [2] - 70:21,	afterwards [2] -
155:4	<b>6th</b> [1] - 64:9	84:10, 103:12,	145:26	46:22, 149:1
<b>3566</b> [2] <b>-</b> 115:5		110:15, 121:17,	actively [1] - 54:7	<b>ago</b> [2] - 38:15,
<b>3587</b> [1] - 115:23	7	123:10, 123:27,	activities [1] - 14:19	142:25
<b>3590</b> [2] <b>-</b> 116:9,		124:2, 124:8, 124:10,	Acts [1] - 63:10	agree [6] - 82:11,
116:12	7 77 1:0 2:25 2:5	124:27, 127:6, 127:9,	actual [3] - 41:26,	92:29, 126:27,
<b>3593</b> [1] - 119:17	<b>7</b> <sub>[7]</sub> - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5, 4:13, 97:23, 98:5,	133:9, 133:11,	58:10, 155:22	152:10, 154:23,
<b>3597</b> [2] - 125:5,	118:8	158:16, 165:2, 166:16	addiction [1] -	163:18
125:25	<b>76</b> [1] - 101:1	accept [2] - 67:11,	147:14	agreeable [2] -
<b>3598</b> [1] - 125:10	7th [1] - 57:26	162:20	adding [1] - 70:5	45:27, 45:29
<b>36</b> [2] - 3:20, 159:6	7th [1] - 57.20	acceptable [1] - 33:7	addition [1] - 66:22	agreed [8] - 30:10,
<b>3600</b> [1] - 126:19		acceptance [1] -	additional [2] - 6:21,	62:1, 108:25, 111:12,
<b>3620</b> [1] - 128:5	8	108:20	142:26	121:21, 132:10,
<b>3624</b> [1] - 129:3		accepted [3] - 46:12,	address [7] - 87:6,	133:21, 163:25
<b>3626</b> [1] - 130:2	<b>8</b> [4] - 3:6, 3:28,	64:12, 163:5	96:25, 113:17,	agreeing [1] - 109:16
<b>3627</b> [1] - 130:4	97:23, 98:8	access [1] - 21:9	117:23, 118:5,	agreement [5] -
<b>3628</b> [2] - 130:4,	8th [4] - 14:22,	accordance [8] -	132:18, 132:24	62:19, 107:3, 108:29,
130:5	42:18, 60:1, 110:20	11:24, 13:9, 38:4,	addressed [7] -	109:13, 167:6
<b>3635</b> [6] - 133:4,	., ,	41:11, 41:12, 60:16,	37:17, 47:13, 76:17,	agrees [1] - 108:23
144:8, 144:25, 169:7,	9	152:8, 155:8	89:8, 96:18, 122:15,	<b>AGS</b> [2] - 113:17,
169:8, 169:9		according [2] -	126:25	151:8
<b>3636</b> [1] - 169:13		114:2, 124:2	addressing [2] -	<b>AGSI</b> [1] - 4:4
<b>3637</b> [1] - 136:24	<b>9</b> [1] - 3:6	accordingly [2] -	54:8, 73:4	ahead [5] - 40:23,
<b>3638</b> [1] - 136:27	<b>9695</b> [2] - 38:29,	23:15, 117:4	ADJOURNED [2] -	45:22, 123:14,
<b>3639</b> [1] - 137:11	39:27	account [3] - 101:2,	88:23, 171:23	151:23, 152:3
<b>37</b> [2] - 3:21, 159:6	<b>9th</b> [6] - 53:17,	101:23, 143:29	ADMINISTRATIVE	<b>AIDAN</b> [2] - 3:9, 4:6
<b>38</b> [1] - 3:21	53:27, 54:6, 61:2,	accumulated [1] -	[1] - 3:14	<b>AISLING</b> [2] - 2:11,
<b>39</b> [2] <b>-</b> 3:22, 36:10	73:27, 86:28	23:17	administrative [8] -	3:21
3rd [16] - 29:27,		accurate [5] - 18:1,	7:5, 82:24, 88:28,	Alan [3] - 7:24,
47:25, 53:6, 59:28,	A	48:25, 101:1, 101:23,	93:13, 114:25, 116:7,	53:15, 120:6
86:29, 95:22, 98:24,		125:19	138:14, 167:14	<b>ALAN</b> [2] - 3:9, 3:13
98:26, 98:29, 100:15,	ah 44 47	acknowledge [3] -	admitted [1] - 20:11	albeit [1] - 87:27
113:29, 121:23,	abeyance [1] - 41:17	57:12, 67:7, 67:8	adopt [1] - 124:24	alcohol [2] - 31:10,
132:26, 147:21,	<b>able</b> [9] - 16:2, 19:27,	acknowledged [2] -	adopted [2] - 104:27,	147:7
159:11, 159:22	21:25, 44:14, 83:24,	66:28, 71:4	126:27	<b>ALISON</b> [1] - 3:26
	92:5, 143:2, 143:10,	acquiescence [1] -	advance [4] - 82:9,	allegation [3] -
4	143:22	139:29	93:3, 99:25, 145:7	101:13, 112:26,
	above-named [1] -	acquire [1] - 11:20	advanced [2] -	165:29
	1:26	ACs [1] - 123:22	92:23, 164:16	allegations [15] -
<b>4</b> [4] <b>-</b> 2:19, 3:4,	abreast [1] - 139:10	act [2] - 13:6, 41:11	advice [6] - 9:12,	31:25, 49:17, 50:15,
97:15, 117:21	absence [18] - 11:11,	<b>ACT</b> [2] - 1:3, 1:8	15:19, 15:21, 71:7,	50:21, 51:17, 52:15,
<b>41</b> [2] <b>-</b> 46:23, 53:3	19:7, 22:27, 23:1,	Act [13] - 8:6, 8:16,	113:7, 158:9	54:18, 55:21, 56:1,
<b>45</b> [1] - 88:17	23:14, 23:21, 26:25,	11:24, 11:27, 13:11,	advices [1] - 26:21	58:11, 67:14, 69:22,
<b>4524</b> [1] - 83:20	28:15, 28:19, 40:14,	36:11, 41:20, 51:4,	advise [6] - 56:9,	121:15, 165:23, 166:7
4th [2] - 128:9,	43:7, 43:13, 64:4,	54:14, 58:24, 112:27,	64:20, 66:14, 84:25,	alleged [3] - 31:24,
128:17	64:17, 85:15, 87:10,	127:29	116:28, 154:6	43:8, 43:13
	153:28, 165:25	Acting [1] - 167:7	advised [9] - 23:8,	alleviate [1] - 25:2
5	<b>Absence</b> [2] - 19:14,	acting [2] - 56:26,	84:19, 90:11, 94:8,	allocated [1] - 7:7
-	44:8	89:2	130:8, 130:13,	allocations [1] - 33:2
• 040=00	absences [4] -	<b>ACTING</b> [2] - 3:7,	130:17, 130:24, 158:7	allowance [2] -
<b>5</b> [4] <b>-</b> 3:4, 97:23,	10:29, 25:8, 27:21,	3:13	advising [1] - 157:25	134:20, 136:8
118:1	86:15	action [17] - 1:27,	Affairs [12] - 7:7, 7:9,	allowances [9] -
<b>51</b> [1] - 2:18	absent [5] - 22:24,	20:3, 29:21, 45:27,	7:14, 7:15, 77:11,	91:20, 92:1, 92:4,
<b>58</b> [2] <b>-</b> 6:21, 63:20	86:3, 91:9, 154:8,	108:11, 109:14,	111:15, 113:24,	92:7, 99:20, 132:16,
<b>5978</b> [1] - 147:20	154:14	109:21, 112:9,	115:22, 119:24,	143:19, 143:29, 153:6
<b>5th</b> [2] <b>-</b> 57:8, 130:7	absolutely [10] -	112:16, 116:18,	140:27, 141:11, 142:2	<b>allude</b> [3] - 44:15,
	15:21, 28:24, 36:21,	124:16, 124:21,	affidavit' [1] - 57:28	104:1, 158:16
6	36:23, 46:1, 56:15,	127:8, 136:12,	afternoon [5] -	alluded [1] - 69:29
	108:22, 139:3,	136:13, 139:23, 152:5	20:18, 22:2, 26:20,	alluding [1] - 09.29
<b>6</b> to 2.5 E.E 06.05	140:19, 161:9	actioning [1] - 51:25	28:9, 113:29	almost [4] - 14:8,
<b>6</b> [6] <b>-</b> 3:5, 5:5, 96:25,			20.0, 170.20	annost [4] - 14.0,
i	I	I	1	1

24:27, 143:11, 151:28 alternative [3] - 72:8, 103:29, 109:22 amenable [1] - 148:1 amended [1] - 26:25 **AMENDED**[1] - 1:9 amount [7] - 18:6, 91:12, 142:27, 143:14, 143:15, 143:23, 159:3 **AN**[1] - 3:2 ancillary [1] - 77:20 **AND** [6] - 1:3, 1:4, 1:8, 3:15, 88:23, 89:7 **ANDREW** [2] - 2:22, angst [1] - 29:20 **ANNE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 annoyed [1] - 21:1 annoying [2] - 31:15 answer [10] - 19:12, 36:16, 43:22, 57:24, 68:19, 79:21, 97:22, 101:21, 143:16, 169:14 answered [1] -162.11 answers [1] - 63:21 **Anthony** [2] - 6:5, **ANTHONY** [6] - 3:6, 5:3. 6:10. 142:13. 145:22, 146:23 anticipate [1] - 88:16 anxious [8] - 29:18, 29:19, 77:5, 109:6, 132:7, 132:9, 140:13, 147:25 anyway [7] - 32:26, 61:2, 82:2, 82:29, 105:21, 162:27, 170:23 apart [2] - 45:3, 160:12 apologies [1] -170:16 **APPEAL**[2] - 1:13, appear [11] - 20:8, 40:22, 41:26, 49:8, 62:4, 79:6, 106:15, 119:11. 119:14. 145:18, 167:1 APPEARANCES[1] appeared [1] -160.20 appearing [1] -166:25

appendices [2] -

6:20, 84:22 application [2] -23:13, 26:2 appoint [9] - 8:21, 13:13. 43:16. 113:1. 114:12, 123:25, 123:27, 145:28, 167:8 appointed [22] -11:22, 12:15, 45:19, 47:26, 68:6, 68:10, 75:16, 76:27, 105:5, 106:20, 108:26, 114:19, 117:27, 119:2, 119:13, 124:8, 126:5, 131:29, 132:2, 133:13, 158:4, 158:12 appointing [7] -45:6, 68:29, 84:10, 126:13, 139:4, 141:6, 146:12 appointment [14] -8:21, 8:29, 76:6, 76:10, 81:26, 104:8, 121:19, 124:10, 140:22, 146:4, 146:9, 155:22, 158:17, 168:27 appreciate [2] -66:23, 76:5 appreciative [1] -71:11 approach [3] -126:27, 127:1, 127:14 approached [1] -169.4 approaches [1] -111:5 appropriate [11] -25:15, 27:4, 65:14, 68:15, 68:27, 69:15, 76:26, 91:9, 92:11, 158:18, 158:21 appropriately [2] -68:12, 68:13 April [7] - 42:22, 83:18. 84:15. 85:10.

130:7, 130:16, 159:11

architect [1] - 24:21

area [4] - 45:18,

argue [3] - 14:8,

arguing [4] - 103:1,

arise [3] - 9:6, 83:12

arises [1] - 170:20

arising [2] - 34:9,

140:27, 161:15

39:13, 150:2

103:3, 126:21

argument [2] -

162:28, 162:29

132:12

arrange [1] - 73:14 arranged [1] - 30:9 arrangement [1] -155:17 arrangements [2] -154:24, 158:6 arranging [2] -29:26, 30:2 arrears [1] - 64:18 arrived [1] - 48:13 arrow [1] - 134:20 article [1] - 167:29 **AS**[7] - 1:9, 6:1, 6:11, 88:23, 142:14, 145:23, 146:24 aside [2] - 13:4, 92:9 aspect [5] - 8:29, 9:23, 54:24, 55:1, 103:23 aspects [5] - 95:21, 121:26, 136:29, 138:25, 140:12 assertion [3] - 81:18, 97:25, 98:3 assess [3] - 13:10, 83:27, 95:21 assessed [1] -121:17 assessing [1] assessment [5] -13:12, 26:6, 40:1, 46:11, 54:20 assessments [1] assigned [8] - 6:25, 6:28, 7:1, 11:28, 113:27, 116:23, 145:27, 145:28 assist [1] - 72:9 assistance [3] -18:5, 74:5, 127:9 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 Assistant [57] - 8:22, 10:2, 51:13, 61:5, 68:9, 74:29, 75:27, 76:12, 81:24, 82:2, 84:29, 100:16, 100:26, 101:12, 102:6, 102:9, 102:11, 102:17, 103:22, 104:3, 104:7, 104:23, 105:4, 106:19, 106:26, 107:9,

arose [3] - 83:13,

ARRAN[2] - 2:24,

102:10, 152:11

4:12

107:20, 107:29, 109:8, 119:2, 122:18, 125:16, 128:28, 128:29, 130:7, 130:10, 130:16, 130:23, 131:5, 131:10, 131:29, 132:1, 132:2, 138:24, 140:24, 146:8, 155:23, 157:24, 160:21, 161:1, 163:7, 163:19, 163:25, 164:22, 166:6, 167:11, 168:27 assistant [23] - 7:21, 7:26, 7:28, 75:26, 76:9, 81:10, 84:25, 84:27, 108:25, 113:1, 113:6, 122:19, 126:4, 126:14, 130:29, 145:27, 145:29, 158:2, 159:10, 161:2, 161:10, 167:8, 170:9 associated [12] -6:20, 19:9, 34:8, 68:18, 77:20, 84:4, 86:22, 93:22, 107:15, 110:13, 120:25, 132.16 assume [4] - 29:5, 32:10, 148:26, 152:4 assuming [3] -17:22, 105:25, 121:10 assurance [2] -19:18. 98:5 assure [1] - 118:8 asterisk [2] - 148:11, 169:26 **AT**[1] - 171:24 Athlone [7] - 31:17, 31:18, 33:1, 35:18, 48:13, 160:19, 160:23 **ATHLONE** [1] - 4:3 Athlumney [1] - 9:10 attached [3] - 53:4, 87:10, 117:19 attaching [1] - 69:9

Athlumney [1] - 9:10 attached [3] - 53:4, 87:10, 117:19 attaching [1] - 69:9 attempts [1] - 129:27 attend [1] - 23:24 attendance [2] - 22:29, 125:13 attended [1] - 99:1 attention [5] - 18:16, 39:21, 52:1, 71:23, 86:11 attitudes [1] - 29:23 attribute [1] - 31:11 au [1] - 149:23 August [12] - 54:6, 57:12, 88:3, 88:27,

90:5, 115:15, 128:9, 128:17, 151:27, 153:18, 156:5, 164:7 authorities [1] -82:21 Authority [8] - 49:18, 55:23, 57:2, 89:9, 97:7, 97:14, 117:15, 117:18 authority [4] - 41:12, 68:27, 77:8, 146:15 Authority's [1] -97.17 automatically [2] -34:1, 148:24 available [5] - 17:15, 19:19, 27:29, 28:26, 117:27 avenue [1] - 59:23 avoid [1] - 43:11 awaited [3] - 23:25, 24:9, 74:27 awaiting [1] - 80:11 award [1] - 34:2 awarded [1] - 92:2 aware [45] - 10:24, 23:9, 23:13, 27:3, 27:12, 29:21, 31:1, 33:24, 33:27, 41:16, 47:18, 49:24, 52:20, 52:21, 52:23, 54:25, 55:15, 55:21, 55:24, 58:4, 73:13, 75:6, 75:12, 75:15, 78:3, 78:7, 78:8, 81:26, 85:17, 85:18, 87:14, 89:20, 98:2, 117:2, 119:1, 139:25, 152:13, 152:14, 159:17, 159:20, 159:26, 159:28, 161:13, 162:11 awful [1] - 138:11

## В

backdated [1] 64:17
backpay [1] - 153:3
BAR [1] - 2:31
Barrett [61] - 7:22,
39:2, 55:4, 61:16,
69:15, 70:7, 72:21,
72:23, 73:9, 73:14,
73:25, 75:12, 76:2,
80:20, 82:3, 82:25,
84:16, 85:11, 93:29,
94:22, 94:23, 99:1,
99:16, 100:7, 100:16,

101:6, 103:15, 107:2, 86:6, 139:27, 145:2 151:29, 152:3, brief [7] - 6:23, carried [5] - 38:4, 109:13, 111:9, believes [5] - 32:2, 13:18, 16:2, 18:19, 153:27, 154:15, 72:28, 102:18, 111:19, 112:17, 32:8, 106:9, 108:10, 27:1, 93:29, 94:5 155:21, 156:4, 108:16, 139:6 156:27, 157:8, 113:13, 114:3, 108:15 briefed~[2]-16:12,carries [2] - 39:15, 114:10, 116:3, below [1] - 13:13 24.8 157:27, 158:15, 143:17 118:23, 119:5, 159:13, 162:26, benefit [1] - 147:19 briefly [5] - 75:9, **CARROLL** [1] - 2:16 120:10, 122:8, 123:4, best [12] - 81:22, 146:27, 148:28, 164:11, 165:14, carry [3] - 25:9, 124:4, 126:12, 165:23, 165:28, 155:25, 161:23 108:11, 109:14, 50:17, 106:24 129:23, 131:24, 166:7, 170:27 116:19, 126:25, bring [3] - 41:23, **carrying** [1] - 78:6 131:29, 132:7, 126:26, 127:8, 100:12, 146:8 BURKE [1] - 4:11 CARTHAGE [1] -132:17, 132:23, 132:18, 139:9, 145:1, bringing [1] - 37:8 BY [19] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:17 133:13, 133:20, 155:13, 166:29 broad [1] - 121:25 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, case [53] - 8:22, 133:23, 139:3, 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10, better [3] - 40:23, broadest [1] - 120:20 9:13, 9:26, 13:1, 13:5, 145:28, 146:3, 146:9, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 41:14, 53:8 Broderick [7] -13:29, 14:10, 15:3, 156:1, 156:18, 6:11, 142:14, 145:23, between [18] - 11:27, 46:27, 100:18, 24:4, 34:4, 39:12, 164:24, 164:29, 17:26, 17:27, 18:9, 146:23 100:21. 100:28. 39:29, 40:1, 45:3, 167:13 Byrne [3] - 104:24, 40:14, 42:11, 68:8, 112:14, 113:28 45:18, 45:21, 59:25, Barrett's [7] - 61:23, 105:4, 124:17 91:17, 92:12, 111:5, brothers [1] - 112:4 62:16, 65:18, 69:5, 69:13, 75:26, 96:8, Byrne/McGinn [11] -130:28, 162:13, 77:21, 82:20, 82:22, brothers-in-law [1] -103:26, 109:20, 104:10, 104:19, 162:16, 163:21, 82:26, 83:2, 83:26, 112.4 112:29 163:27, 166:16, 105:3, 105:18, 84:10, 93:22, 95:21, brought [6] - 59:24, Barry [1] - 114:12 109:21, 110:11, 168:14 71:23, 86:11, 144:9, 97:26, 99:26, 109:26, Bartlett [1] - 27:24 121:18, 124:24, beyond [1] - 102:23 110:14, 113:22, 152:18, 154:20 base [3] - 140:2, 126:25, 162:25, 115:29, 119:14, big [1] - 130:27 **bullet** [1] - 133:5 140:3, 142:26 bigger [1] - 102:18 166:22 119:15, 120:20, **bullied** [1] - 35:14 based [7] - 40:1, bit [5] - 7:17, 41:17, bullying [103] -121:17, 121:20, 61:26, 62:23, 62:26, 134:27, 136:14, C 108:21, 110:17, 168:7 35:18, 35:28, 53:12, 62:29, 121:18, 144:25 136:15, 140:3, bits [2] - 125:26, 56:20, 59:11, 59:17, basing [1] - 62:22 144:11, 147:27, 142.29 65:2, 66:7, 66:21, **CAGNEY** [1] - 3:17 basis [8] - 10:17, 152:12, 154:13, BL [13] - 2:7, 2:10, 67:12, 67:17, 68:28, calculation [1] -14:5, 26:4, 40:1, 159:28, 163:1, 165:8, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 69:19, 70:5, 70:18, 143:1 44:28, 95:29, 98:3, 167:12 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 70:26, 71:2, 74:15, camouflaged [3] -144:3 case-by-case [1] -4:1, 4:7, 4:10 74:26, 77:5, 79:24, 92:19, 93:2, 164:12 **BASTION**[1] - 4:2 blank [1] - 137:15 81:10, 83:11, 89:16, cancelling [1] bat [1] - 156:7 cases [9] - 15:23, blind [1] - 156:15 89:18, 89:26, 89:28, 48:24 baton [1] - 54:29 23:5, 26:8, 45:17, board [6] - 38:18, 92:18, 93:15, 94:12, candidate [1] - 97:19 bear [1] - 41:24 82:15, 102:19, 45:9, 56:25, 57:4, 94:17, 95:7, 95:9, cannot [2] - 137:5, 126:29, 132:28, bearing [1] - 156:2 96:6, 97:3, 97:19, 141:17, 141:23 156:15 140:12 beat [1] - 153:7 98:27, 101:13, borne [1] - 171:3 canvassed [1] -**CASTLE**[1] - 1:17 became [18] - 9:2, bosses [1] - 165:22 102:13, 102:23, 148:18 10:24, 29:21, 35:10, 102:26, 103:8, 104:8, categories [2] bottom [17] - 22:21, CAO [3] - 8:3, 27:15, 96:22 109:5, 109:16, 41:16, 48:5, 73:13, 25:16, 39:1, 48:17, 126:27, 127:16 109:26, 110:1, categorisation [1] -74:1, 75:12, 75:15, 50:8, 50:10, 50:12, Caoimhghín [2] -112:21, 112:27, 149:19 76:23, 77:17, 78:3, 59:14, 74:12, 74:19, 89:10, 153:15 78:7, 105:9, 105:14, 114:23, 116:15, categorised [4] -74:23, 74:24, 116:12, Caoláin [2] - 89:10, 116:27, 119:4, 121:6, 33:22, 41:20, 148:16, 109:18, 150:9 128:5, 151:3, 153:21, 153:15 121:14, 121:20, 148:23 become [7] - 14:17, 169:27 capacity [2] - 118:13, 25:24, 27:12, 31:9, 121:29, 122:2, 122:9, category [1] - 64:3 **bottoming** [1] - 53:9 146:10 81:26, 147:7 122:13, 122:22, cater [1] - 152:10 **box** [1] - 26:4 car [1] - 10:26 becoming [1] - 15:2 123:11, 123:15, causal [1] - 40:14 brain [1] - 168:8 career [1] - 6:23 123:22, 123:26, **BEEN** [1] - 6:10 branch [2] - 7:9, causality [1] - 39:28 carefully [2] - 43:20, 124:5, 124:8, 124:21, causation [2] **beg** [4] - 57:20, 99:8, 23:12 43.25 124:26, 126:5, 148:21, 150:28 85:29. 91:3 breaches [1] -CARR [1] - 3:15 127:10, 129:14, behalf [9] - 14:10, caused [2] - 25:3, 104:15 130:12, 132:3, 133:7, Carr [6] - 9:26, 37:18, 47:2, 61:6, 154:15 break [4] - 18:21, 138:8, 138:23, 38:29, 111:25, 69:20, 80:16, 89:4, causes [2] - 25:25, 18:27, 88:11, 88:13 111:28, 115:1, 128:3 141:27, 149:24, 128:29, 138:20 breaks [1] - 96:20 26:13 **CARRICK**[1] - 2:13 behind [3] - 24:29, 150:7, 150:13, causing [1] - 29:19 BRIAN [2] - 3:15, **CARRICK-ON-**150:20, 151:7, 53:7, 75:25 caveat [2] - 64:29, 3:16 **SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 151:13, 151:23, belief [4] - 82:7, 87:29 Brian [1] - 40:21

cc'd [4] - 39:2, 73:12, 164:22, 165:2 cease [1] - 138:10 **CEO** [1] - 117:17 cert [1] - 28:22 certain [5] - 18:6, 29:8, 35:21, 54:8, 159:3 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 certainly [1] - 119:8 certainty [1] - 50:29 certificates [3] -23:23, 27:25, 111:27 certification [1] -48:2 certified [7] - 10:22, 14:21, 22:26, 91:13, 133:3, 147:24, 148:3 certify [1] - 1:24 certs [1] - 87:12 chain [1] - 146:3 chair [1] - 120:18 Chair [1] - 56:26 chaired [1] - 120:14 chairing [1] - 101:6 CHAIRMAN [79] -1:12, 6:6, 6:16, 75:20, 75:23, 78:27, 79:1, 79:3, 88:12, 88:15, 88:19, 105:2, 105:12, 105:17, 105:21, 105:24, 105:29, 106:3, 109:24, 109:26, 109:29, 110:4, 110:6, 110:9, 110:11, 110:19, 110:22, 110:25, 110:28, 111:3, 113:10, 113:12, 118:25, 118:28, 125:27, 135:24, 142:9, 142:11, 143:19, 143:22, 143:26, 143:28, 144:5, 145:14, 145:18, 146:21, 147:2, 153:3, 153:5, 153:10, 153:16, 153:19, 162:4, 162:8, 162:14, 162:22, 163:8, 163:11, 163:13, 163:15, 164:2, 165:5, 165:18, 165:21, 168:2, 168:7, 168:18, 168:21, 168:24, 169:8, 169:10, 170:11, 170:18, 170:23, 171:5, 171:9, 171:11, 171:16, 171:21

Chairman [17] - 6:4, 6:17, 42:23, 88:9, 88:14, 140:17, 142:24, 145:20, 153:11, 162:20, 165:4, 165:20, 167:28, 168:17, 170:16, 171:8, 171:15 challenge [1] -141:28 change [8] - 7:1, 27:2, 39:18, 40:19, 86:21, 86:26, 115:13, 128:4 changed [5] - 28:15, 28:17, 128:12, 134:5, 155:7 changes [1] - 115:7 **charge** [3] - 33:2, 96:6, 161:14 charged [1] - 118:9 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:8 **chart** [1] - 124:28 CHEALLACHÁIN[1] - 2:30 check [4] - 18:1, 37:26, 124:14, 136:8 checked [1] - 150:6 checking [6] - 16:4, 111:25, 111:26, 112:8, 112:9, 150:14 Chief [73] - 6:5, 6:14, 6:17, 6:22, 18:13, 19:10, 25:21, 25:22, 25:28, 26:16, 32:3, 32:26, 33:16, 37:29, 42:16, 47:25, 48:3, 48:10, 48:20, 65:16, 71:8, 71:16, 71:22, 72:18, 75:13, 75:15, 76:17, 78:1, 78:5, 79:16, 80:2, 80:8, 80:11, 80:23, 81:3, 81:9, 81:13, 81:26, 82:7, 84:1, 84:4, 84:19, 87:5, 90:18, 95:16, 95:27, 102:10, 102:21, 103:17, 104:24, 105:8, 108:1, 108:23, 111:14, 111:20, 118:11, 121:16, 121:26, 126:28, 142:5, 148:3, 149:11, 157:12,

157:17, 157:25,

158:11, 158:14,

158:24, 169:19,

170:26, 171:13

3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11,

**CHIEF** [19] - 3:3, 3:3,

3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27, 5:3, 6:10, 142:13, 145:22, 146:23 chief [47] - 6:6, 7:5, 7:6, 7:11, 8:1, 13:14, 18:29, 33:2, 37:8, 38:11, 38:26, 43:2, 44:1, 44:5, 44:11, 48:17, 49:16, 51:27, 52:25, 55:18, 71:15, 77:11, 78:27, 82:24, 84:21, 88:26, 88:28, 92:21, 93:12, 112:3, 114:25, 115:21, 116:6, 136:21, 137:8, 138:14, 141:21, 142:16, 144:6, 145:10, 146:26, 158:26, 164:14, 167:14, 170:12, 170:29, 171:12 Chief's [1] - 135:6 chief's [2] - 135:19, 169.17 chronologically [1] -129:25 chronology [3] -159:9, 161:24, 161:26 circumstances [4] -86:23, 117:16, 134:5, 152:11 cited [1] - 23:5 civil [2] - 121:7, 122:13 civilian [5] - 7:20, 55:4, 56:10, 66:15, 67:28 civilians [1] - 56:25 civilisation [1] - 7:18 claim [1] - 43:11 claims [4] - 165:14, 165:25, 166:8, 166:9 Claire [5] - 22:15, 26:19, 28:28, 62:6, 91:25 clandestinely [1] -90:14 Clare [2] - 30:28, 164:26 clarification [2] -103:22, 116:29 clarified [1] - 26:18 clarify [3] - 9:4, 144:16, 170:21 clarifying [1] - 171:5 clarity [4] - 56:18, 59:24, 66:19, 108:17 clashed [1] - 165:23

85:14, 86:15, 154:19 classified [3] -33:25, 50:28, 92:3 **clear** [15] - 27:5, 34:11, 43:11, 48:27, 54:20, 54:21, 63:1, 65:15, 68:8, 70:7, 84:11, 85:16, 101:4, 171:6, 171:17 clearly [5] - 61:22, 63:19, 75:8, 133:15, 149:20 **client** [4] - 19:9, 118:8, 170:25, 170:28 client-patient [1] close [3] - 127:11, 143:6, 143:9 closer [1] - 48:9 CMO [18] - 10:28, 11:2, 11:11, 17:28, 19:1, 19:14, 25:8, 25:10, 26:2, 26:7, 26:21, 28:26, 33:13, 33:14, 39:2, 40:4, 134:16 CMO's [2] - 11:8, 18:28 **CO**[2] - 2:13, 4:4 colleagues [1] - 48:7 collect [1] - 88:20 combination [1] -135:29 combined [1] - 62:12 comfort [1] - 127:13 coming [7] - 8:27, 9:28, 11:27, 41:5, 89:2, 165:2, 166:9 command [1] - 146:3 commander [1] -161:14 commence [3] -24:19, 54:19, 152:7 commenced [3] -127:11, 140:21, 152:7 commencement [4] - 23:1, 23:20, 64:17, 125:10 commences [1] -60.1 commend [1] -127:16 commentaries [1] -135:29 commentary [2] -122:17, 135:3 commented [1] -121:7

Commission [1] -105:16 Commissioner [113] - 8:18, 8:21, 8:22, 10:3, 13:16, 13:18, 14:14, 16:2, 16:8, 16:18, 24:3, 32:8, 46:21, 46:22, 47:27, 48:10, 49:11, 49:15, 49:23, 50:19, 51:14, 51:20, 55:20, 55:22, 56:3, 56:27, 57:25, 57:26, 59:29, 61:3, 61:5, 63:7, 65:6, 65:7, 68:9, 72:23, 73:22, 73:26, 74:2, 75:1, 75:28, 76:12, 81:24, 82:2, 83:24, 84:29, 88:6, 89:8, 93:14, 93:25, 96:19, 96:24, 97:6, 100:16, 100:26, 101:12, 102:6, 102:9, 102:12, 102:17, 103:22, 104:3, 104:7, 104:23, 105:4. 106:19, 106:26, 107:9, 107:20, 107:29, 109:8, 117:22, 119:2, 120:17, 122:18, 125:17, 128:28, 128:29, 130:7, 130:10, 130:16, 130:23. 131:5. 131:10, 132:1, 132:2, 137:22, 138:13, 138:24, 140:24, 144:12, 144:13, 144:29, 145:18, 146:8, 153:14, 155:1, 155:23, 156:1, 156:14, 157:24, 160:21, 161:2, 163:7, 163:20, 163:26, 164:22, 166:6, 167:7, 167:11, 167:25, 168:27 commissioner [27] -7:22, 7:26, 7:28, 16:19, 60:28, 75:26, 76:10, 81:10, 84:25, 84:27, 108:26, 113:1, 113:6, 113:7, 122:19, 126:4, 126:14, 129:24, 130:29, 145:28, 145:29, 158:2, 159:11, 161:2, 161:10, 167:8, 170:10 COMMISSIONER [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18,

classification [3] -

comments [1] -

3:20 Commissioner's [11] - 16:15, 23:28, 24:8, 46:26, 51:19, 65:17, 73:13, 77:18, 88:2, 100:20, 120:3 commissioner's [2] -24:9, 89:2 commitment [2] -34:21, 118:19 communicated [1] -116:21 **COMPANY**[1] - 2:22 compendious [1] -105.6 compendium [1] compensated [1] -91:20 competent [1] -170:7 compile [1] - 24:11 **compiled** [1] - 84:8 complain [1] - 48:17 complainant [1] -70:10 complained [5] -35:14, 60:14, 62:29, 65:5, 135:15 complains [2] -92:14, 156:10 complaint [63] -13:15, 13:27, 36:2, 36:27, 37:12, 52:29, 53:6, 53:23, 54:22, 56:19, 57:23, 60:8, 60:10, 60:17, 63:9, 65:1, 66:20, 67:18, 68:3, 68:26, 70:18, 70:27, 71:2, 71:8, 72:18, 73:15, 74:26, 75:10, 76:25, 83:8, 84:1, 84:6, 90:18, 90:22, 93:16, 94:16, 94:17, 95:9, 99:11, 108:7, 116:27, 117:2, 121:15, 121:26, 129:5, 129:20, 136:29, 138:23, 139:24, 150:7, 150:21, 151:23, 152:3, 156:4, 156:27, 157:8, 157:27, 157:29, 158:3, 158:19, 162:15, 162:19, 163:5 complaints [21] -37:14, 49:1, 50:7, 52:15, 52:17, 56:21, 58:10, 59:11, 59:27,

66:22, 73:8, 74:6, 89:16, 89:26, 90:13, 105:5, 139:19, 153:27, 162:17, 167:17 complete [1] - 11:10 completed [2] -24:19, 107:7 completely [3] -160:21, 164:18, 167:24 completeness [1] -66:19 completion [3] -39:6, 72:9, 74:1 compliance [2] -11:24, 23:23 compliant [1] -162:21 complimentary [2] -135:8, 142:20 comprehensive[3] -42:19, 43:21, 117:26 comprehensively [1] - 118·5 compromised [1] -82:8 concentrating [1] -122:21 concern [13] - 22:29, 55:11, 55:15, 68:11, 77:5, 78:10, 80:5, 81:20, 102:12, 103:25, 127:5, 128:24, 148:28 concerned [24] -9:29, 13:19, 17:9, 17:23, 22:10, 39:13, 39:19, 65:5, 66:3, 70:11, 76:21, 81:17, 82:18, 83:23, 95:20, 104:7, 107:20, 128:3, 133:21. 141:13. 146:16, 149:21, 150:9 concerning[3] -12:7, 128:27, 149:24 concerns [1] - 72:27 concluded [3] -38:23, 77:6, 137:6 concludes [1] -34:19 conclusion [3] -98:10, 116:20, 139:26

conclusions [2] -

condition [1] - 48:2

conduct [3] - 26:17,

conducive [1] -

62:27, 137:29

147:26

43:7, 43:17

conducted [4] -25:16, 38:24, 65:8, 95:16 conducting [1] -108:24 conduit [4] - 68:26, 74:1, 77:18, 93:26 conference [20] -38:16, 45:21, 65:18, 77:2, 82:22, 82:26, 83:2, 95:21, 98:16, 98:21, 99:26, 100:13, 100:15, 113:22, 115:29, 119:8, 119:15, 121:21, 134:27, 165:8 conferences [2] -69:5. 98:22 conferred [1] - 141:8 confidence [3] -18:7, 118:10, 120:15 confident [1] - 30:25 confidential [4] -8:17, 120:17, 120:24, 166:28 confidentiality [1] -19:9 confirm [5] - 38:3, 53:10, 78:18, 136:14, 144:11 confirmation [3] -64:8, 128:11, 160:3 confirmed [5] -46:13, 65:17, 71:5, 128:16, 134:23 confirming [1] -150:20 conflated [1] - 12:24 conflict [13] - 36:25, 71:9, 71:15, 71:19, 78:5, 81:1, 81:8, 81:12, 81:22, 81:23, 82:16, 82:17, 157:16 conflicted [1] -158:27 conflictual [1] -71:21 confused [2] - 12:12, 33:28 conjunction[1] -141:17 **CONLON** [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT[1] connected [1] - 8:26 connection [6] -13:21, 14:6, 92:12, 127:24, 127:28, 170:4

**CONOR** [1] - 3:24 conscious [6] - 19:8, 41:19, 41:26, 42:1, 149:29, 150:1 consent [3] - 19:12, 54:13, 129:18 consents [1] - 49:22 consequence [4] -85:26, 91:8, 92:10, 153:26 consider [3] - 43:25, 44:18, 98:7 considerable [2] -58:12, 76:24 consideration [2] -39:23 50:24 considered [9] -43:20, 59:20, 72:8, 83:2, 84:24, 85:3, 98:20, 102:21, 130:19 considering [1] -98:8 consigned [1] -153:25 consistent [1] - 48:4 constant [1] - 18:5 consult [1] - 113:5 consulted [1] -138:24 contact [18] - 14:18, 15:4. 18:2. 18:5. 18:22, 21:16, 21:22, 39:19, 54:10, 64:20, 71:1, 101:14, 109:10, 138:19, 139:22, 150:26, 151:1, 157:13 contacted [5] -14:27, 14:29, 22:10, 22:15, 28:28 **contacting** [1] - 14:7 contained [3] -96:17, 160:4, 163:9 containing [1] -50:20 contains [2] -161:28, 161:29 contention [1] -109:18 contents [1] - 47:18 context [7] - 27:24, 44:20, 52:14, 81:20. 107:6, 115:28, 127:28 continually [1] -122:2 continue [9] - 30:25, 37:20, 86:20, 86:24, 107:17, 122:26, 122:28, 123:15, 123:27

continued [1] - 139:9

continues [3] -23:22, 111:7, 118:14 continuing [1] - 44:4 continuously [2] -22:24, 132:8 contrary [2] - 86:12, contravention [1] -51:3 contributing [1] -31:20 control [5] - 9:18, 33:5, 96:8, 128:21, 132:4 controlled [1] - 9:24 convenient [2] -88:10, 88:12 conversation [18] -18:18, 18:19, 20:29, 21:24, 31:13, 35:10, 35:12, 59:28, 78:12, 79:25, 80:1, 99:16, 107:26, 108:9, 117:3, 117:11, 119:7, 119:11 conversations [3] -27:1, 49:27, 162:12 converse [1] - 53:11 conversing [1] - 30:5 coordinated [1] -127.17 coordinating [2] -14:19, 14:20 copied [9] - 40:27, 72:20, 76:12, 80:23, 88:1, 88:6, 88:27, 93:6, 96:14 copies [1] - 74:7 COPPINGER [1] -Coppinger.. [1] -169:29 copy [11] - 18:13. 35:6, 50:19, 60:27, 82:4, 85:11, 116:3, 129:23, 131:6, 156:17, 158:6 copying [2] - 89:3, 164:27 Corcoran [4] -122:18, 122:19, 124:2, 125:17 corporate [1] - 112:5 correct [91] - 11:4, 14:27, 22:17, 31:22, 45:22, 45:23, 45:29, 47:6, 52:3, 52:8, 57:6, 58:14, 58:23, 62:9, 62:16, 63:18, 63:22, 64:2. 64:10. 64:11. 69:10, 69:11, 70:12,

CONNELLAN [2] -

4:1, 4:1

71:28, 72:1, 73:19, 73:20, 73:27, 73:28, 74:9, 75:13, 75:29, 76:11, 79:8, 80:12, 80:13, 80:27, 81:5, 82:20, 88:7, 89:20, 92:9, 92:13, 96:11, 96:15, 96:29, 97:10, 97:11, 97:20, 97:21, 98:18, 100:27, 112:10, 112:11, 114:28, 115:1, 115:15, 115:18, 115:25, 115:26, 116:2, 116:5, 116:14, 127:25, 127:26, 128:8, 128:15, 129:2, 131:19, 131:25, 133:19, 145:29, 146:1, 146:6, 147:3, 148:20, 149:15, 151:24, 151:25, 152:24, 154:21, 156:7, 156:8, 156:20, 157:18. 157:19. 157:29, 158:4, 169:20, 170:27, 171:2 corrected [3] -47:28, 87:27, 148:27 correctly [3] - 78:4, 99:19, 166:18 correspondence [27] - 51:29, 60:27, 67:7, 72:16, 72:20, 72:22, 72:24, 75:3, 75:6, 75:17, 82:25, 85:11, 85:12, 88:1, 88:27, 93:12, 93:21, 96:10, 116:28, 117:3, 117:10, 117:24, 118:2, 134:17, 139:10, 139:17, 171:3 COSTELLO [1] couple [6] - 37:17, 38:15, 50:8, 98:22, 143:13, 151:16 course [25] - 37:28, 45:27, 45:28, 49:14, 58:9, 69:6, 69:29, 71:13, 83:29, 84:3, 91:2. 108:11. 109:14. 109:20, 127:8, 135:13, 135:28, 136:2, 147:13, 148:19, 149:23, 157:7, 157:10, 162:29, 166:12 course" [1] - 135:12 COURT [3] - 1:13,

2:3, 4:2

Court [1] - 29:29

cover [1] - 102:14

covered [3] - 90:14,
152:16, 152:18

covertly [2] - 92:22,
164:15

Cregan [1] - 115:12

crime [1] - 35:21

Crime [1] - 113:6

Cregan [1] - 115:12 crime [1] - 35:21 Crime [1] - 113:6 criminal [10] -103:23, 112:26, 113:3, 113:10, 121:6, 138:20, 141:14, 141:16, 165:26, 166:9 criminally [1] - 107:9 critical [1] - 105:12 criticised [1] -

criticising [2] 163:25, 166:3
criticism [2] - 99:28,
163:19
criticisms [1] 105:10

**cronyism** [2] - 137:13, 137:14 **CROSS** [4] - 5:6, 5:7, 142:14, 145:23

cross [1] - 19:10 CROSS-EXAMINED

[4] - 5:6, 5:7, 142:14, 145:23 **crucial** [1] - 70:10 **CUALÁIN** [1] - 3:7 **Cualáin** [20] - 8:22, 39:3, 51:14, 57:25, 57:26, 58:27, 61:5,

57:26, 58:27, 61:5, 74:11, 96:19, 107:6, 110:15, 135:11, 135:27, 136:1, 136:3, 138:7, 147:13, 147:20, 167:7, 167:25

Cualáin" [1] - 136:18 Cualáin's [2] - 50:20,

97:6 **Cullen** [29] - 72:5,
72:21, 72:22, 85:12,
86:27, 96:11, 99:5,
99:6, 99:9, 99:15,
100:10, 100:13,
114:27, 116:6,
116:12, 123:4, 123:7,
124:4, 131:10,
131:26, 132:8,
134:24, 145:5,
154:28, 154:29,

**CULLEN** [1] - 2:11

167:26

155:29, 164:6, 165:3,

Cullen's [5] - 75:7, 89:4, 145:6, 153:13 CURLEY [1] - 3:10 CURRAN [1] - 3:3 Curran [7] - 20:19, 32:3, 48:11, 65:16, 135:18, 169:17, 169:19 current [4] - 33:1, 64:4, 87:18, 126:24 cut [1] - 42:6

D

**D/super** [1] - 21:22 **D/superintendent** [1] - 21:16

**Daly** [2] - 30:28, 164:26

161:4, 161:11, 161:19 **date** [17] - 6:23, 16:12, 23:20, 23:22, 24:12, 42:2, 56:4, 56:5, 61:9, 87:17, 93:5, 95:11, 95:17,

dark [4] - 160:22,

117:24, 138:16, 153:16, 163:21 **dated** [13] - 54:6, 57:12, 61:1, 61:8, 72:24, 73:18, 85:13,

72.24, 73.16, 63.13, 86:28, 156:2, 156:18, 159:11, 169:22 dates [1] - 27:18

**DAVID** [2] - 2:28, 3:18

DAY [1] - 1:18 day-to-day [1] -44:27

days [7] - 19:25, 20:1, 23:18, 66:29, 112:12, 166:2, 167:12 daytime [1] - 147:16 deal [10] - 39:29,

44:27, 63:19, 65:18, 81:11, 83:12, 113:20, 123:17, 123:22, 141:22

**dealing** [12] - 8:24, 9:14, 11:20, 54:24, 57:27, 69:18, 69:19, 77:25, 138:11, 157:6, 163:23, 166:7

dealings [1] - 85:17 deals [3] - 27:15, 116:13, 159:11 dealt [15] - 10:26,

32:13, 35:11, 35:26, 45:4, 65:26, 65:29,

111:28, 115:27, 123:10, 123:16, 156:3 debate [2] - 40:26, 142:1 DECEMBER [1] - 1:9 December [16] -

68:12, 83:13, 84:13,

17:6, 23:3, 50:10, 64:18, 73:18, 73:26, 73:27, 75:7, 76:15, 97:26, 131:20, 131:23, 134:28, 145:8, 154:14, 169:22 decide [2] - 61:25, 117:17

decided [3] - 59:11, 121:19, 126:4 decides [1] - 151:28 decision [6] - 21:19, 50:11, 63:14, 76:1,

82:20, 86:18 **decisions** [2] -40:16, 125:7

**DECLAN** [1] - 3:5 **declined** [2] - 72:7, 129:9

decorated [1] - 166:4 dedicated [1] -141:16

deduce [1] - 168:16 deemed [1] - 38:14 deep [1] - 42:10 defend [2] - 124:21, 124:25

defenders [1] -137:20 definitely [8] - 29:4, 67:27, 75:18, 113:4,

152:27, 164:19, 166:21, 166:23 **definition** [2] - 34:5, 41:20

**definitions** [1] - 39:5 **definitive** [1] - 67:23 **degree** [2] - 10:16,

148:19 **delay** [9] - 50:16,
68:15, 68:19, 81:21,
97:18, 155:20, 159:3,
159:12, 166:6 **delegate** [2] -

156:11, 156:16 **deliver** [2] - 129:4, 137:27

delivering [1] -160:12 Della [1] - 22:11 delve [1] - 120:22 demonstrate [1] -43:22 denial [1] - 86:1 depart [1] - 41:2 Department [2] -50:21, 56:28 department [2] - 7:4,

104.17

dependent [4] - 31:9, 45:28, 86:14, 147:7 deputy [4] - 16:18, 24:9, 113:6, 129:24 Deputy [4] - 35:17,

50:19, 57:25, 57:26 **describe** [3] - 61:18, 74:24, 78:16 **DESMOND** [1] - 4:6

despite [4] - 48:1, 63:3, 87:11, 95:9 destroyed [1] - 166:8 detail [9] - 20:21, 52:17, 60:4, 73:10,

52:17, 60:4, 73:10, 80:29, 107:13, 107:15, 161:28, 166:24

detailed [1] - 84:6 detailing [1] - 26:12 DETECTIVE [5] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17

Detective [1] - 61:6 determine [1] - 158:2 determining [1] -

76:25 **detriment** [1] -153:26

**detrimental** [2] - 89:16, 89:26

**DEVELOPMENT** [1] - 3:16

**Development** [2] - 52:26, 109:10 **developments** [1] - 84:26

devious [1] - 168:8 devised [1] - 152:21 diagnosed [2] -17:11, 148:23

diagnosis [3] -25:23, 27:29, 34:1 DIARMAID [1] - 2:6 dichotomy [2] - 17:3,

42:11

difference [3] 91:17, 111:5, 166:16

different [18] - 47:8,
48:16, 63:4, 63:24,
68:21, 68:22, 73:5,
88:10, 98:15, 100:21

68:21, 68:22, 73:5, 88:10, 98:15, 100:21, 105:19, 123:3, 123:14, 123:19, 126:8, 140:7, 140:20, 150:10

differing [1] - 125:29 121:5, 121:11, 155:10 14:26, 15:7, 16:25, Downey [3] - 39:2, 119:9, 144:12, difficult [2] - 141:25, Disclosure [1] -23:4 39:25, 39:27 153:13, 153:21 141:26 63:10 doctor's [1] - 48:1 **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15, **e-mails** [2] - 40:26, disclosures [17] difficulty [1] - 123:11 document [19] -3:20 61:24 11.21 11.23 11.29 42:20, 126:21, 144:9, downfall [1] - 147:14 **EAMON**[1] - 3:10 **DIGNAM** [1] - 3:24 direct [6] - 9:7, 33:5, 12:6, 12:10, 12:11, 146:27, 147:18, **DPP** [2] - 94:8, Early [2] - 119:21, 12:16, 12:18, 12:25, 149:2, 150:16, 151:3, 119:22 55:26, 63:16, 93:12, 111.18 119:17 12:26, 13:4, 41:5, 151:19, 151:21, **DPP's** [1] - 50:11 early [4] - 10:24, 153:2, 155:25, 157:5, 47:27, 51:4, 74:10, directed [5] - 10:3, DR [1] - 3:11 11:22, 23:2, 119:22 150:1, 152:22 159:5, 159:7, 159:14, earn [1] - 84:25 14:8, 72:22, 88:28, Dr [11] - 14:22, 117:6 DISCLOSURES [2] -164:5, 168:4, 169:7 17:13, 17:15, 22:4, earnings [2] - 143:1, directing [1] - 51:28 1:2, 1:3 documentation [7] -22:7, 27:24, 35:1, Disclosures [3] -69:26, 70:4, 75:14, 50:9, 52:19, 52:21, EAS[1] - 28:14 direction [1] - 127:4 130:17, 131:8, 8:6, 8:16, 54:14 directions [2] -134:16 Eastern [6] - 75:27, 131:14, 165:2 discourse [1] -35:20, 81:19 drafted [2] - 38:9, 130:7, 130:16, documentations [1] 166:14 130:23, 130:29, 161:3 Directive [1] - 24:21 113:16 directive [1] - 24:24 discredited [1] -- 53:4 draw [3] - 114:12, EC [1] - 122:17 documents [11] -139:28 168:9, 168:10 effect [6] - 11:27, directly [10] - 8:18, 15:9, 15:13, 15:14, discuss [8] - 23:7, 8:23, 11:12, 19:14, drink [3] - 20:12, 12:9, 63:25, 64:27, 57:13, 57:19, 58:8, 23:9, 27:2, 32:21, 20:17, 22:2 92:25, 118:14 36:18, 36:27, 44:26, 42:29, 73:8, 99:17, 58:9, 67:13, 69:28, 47:22, 72:19, 116:21 drinking [3] - 20:18, effective [1] - 127:18 **DIRECTLY** [2] - 5:5, 132:29 84:24, 85:6 30:16, 147:15 effectively [4] discussed [19] domain [1] - 168:5 **Dublin** [1] - 6:26 6:11 14:17, 52:5, 90:14, 10:15, 32:13, 48:29, **DONAL** [31] - 3:7, **DIRECTLY-DUBLIN** [7] - 1:17, 105:14 61:19, 71:26, 84:7, 3:24, 5:8, 146:24, effort [2] - 83:9, 93:2 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, **EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, 94:21, 107:13, 146:26, 147:3, 4.9 4.13 efforts [2] - 42:26, 6.11 153:11, 153:18. 114:15, 120:16, due [9] - 22:26, 139:9 director [21] - 7:24, 153:20, 162:6, 132:22. 133:15. 9:9, 9:25, 9:27, 21:18, 37:28, 69:6, 86:4, **EGAN**[1] - 3:25 162:10, 162:20, 148:5, 148:26, 51:29, 53:11, 62:1, 91:9, 91:13, 118:26, Egan [6] - 22:15, 149:20, 156:5, 163:4, 163:9, 163:12, 154:8. 162:29 62:17, 67:28, 76:8, 24:14, 26:19, 28:28, 168:20, 168:26 163:14, 163:16, **Dun** [1] - 6:28 62:6, 91:26 83:3, 83:10, 83:20, discussing [1] - 93:7 164:3, 165:6, 165:19, 94:5, 100:17, 107:7, during [8] - 12:24, Egan's [1] - 28:8 165:22, 168:4, discussion [13] -119:2, 127:23, 132:7, 135:3, 147:16, Eileen [1] - 115:12 168:17, 168:19, 30:23, 37:6, 62:4, 148:19, 152:2, 157:7, 138:21 either [13] - 9:7, 9:8, 168:23, 168:25, 76:18, 76:24, 94:6, 157:10, 166:12 **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 11:15, 24:8, 25:1, 169:9, 169:12, 170:9, 99:11, 99:15, 99:20, duty [32] - 10:2, 26:7, 32:20, 38:22, **Director** [3] - 47:13, 106:17, 125:8, 170:12, 171:8 16:27, 17:1, 23:3, 106:27, 106:29 76:21, 81:15, 107:16, Donal [4] - 57:25, 166:14, 170:5 24:25, 24:28, 33:22, directorate [4] -141:13, 159:22 58:27, 136:18, 167:7 discussions [2] -22:16, 64:9, 69:25, 34:3, 34:4, 34:6, 34:8, element [2] - 62:22, 142:4, 159:29 done [16] - 13:8, 38:15, 50:29, 91:16, 91:26 120:24 16:14, 29:20, 32:16, dispute [4] - 17:25, DIRECTORATE[1] -91:19, 92:2, 92:3, elements [15] -35:24, 45:17, 68:11, 17:26, 17:27, 163:2 3:15 92:5, 92:12, 99:21, 14:15, 15:27, 48:21, 68:20, 83:7, 87:26, disrespect [1] disadvantaged [1] -136:8, 136:9, 138:3, 55:12, 59:26, 62:28, 95:10. 128:25. 20:15 142:26, 143:3, 127:2 109:5, 121:14, 132:11, 155:3, 170:8 district [3] - 36:14, 143:18, 148:5, disaffected [1] -123:28, 133:9, Donlon [5] - 79:26, 36:22. 48:13 148:17, 148:18, 139:18, 140:4, 41:15 100:17, 111:17, districts [1] - 141:22 148:24, 155:9 140:20, 149:12, disappointed [1] -115:4, 120:29 division [8] - 11:6, dynamites [1] -149:21 167:3 **double** [1] - 150:6 36:22, 36:25, 43:17, 118:10 discipline [11] elicit [1] - 44:15 doubt [6] - 15:20, 45:7, 47:3, 112:4, **DÁIL** [1] - 1:4 74:29, 77:12, 96:28, eliciting [1] - 80:1 26:16, 43:11, 86:10, 125:1 Dáil [4] - 40:22, 107:27, 108:11, eligible [1] - 23:19 86:25, 126:3 **DIVISION** [1] - 1:12 111:15, 113:25, 41:25, 42:4, 58:2 ELIZABETH[1] down [20] - 42:10, divisional [4] -115:24, 137:5, 138:8, 2:29 53:2, 71:26, 74:19, 36:14, 44:21, 44:24, Ε 140:21 elucidate [1] - 44:25 96:21. 109:29. 110:4. 48:11 disclosed [1] - 49:22 em [1] - 36:16 110:7, 115:6, 115:7, divisions [1] disclosure [14] embrace [1] - 103:2 e-mail [14] - 26:19, 129:4, 136:5, 147:5, 141:23 8:24, 11:16, 13:7, embraced [1] -27:17, 28:8, 37:29, 148:9, 148:10, 160:7, do" [1] - 17:19 13:22, 42:9, 54:13, 102:24 160:27, 161:16, 38:25, 38:28, 44:5, **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:6 54:22, 59:4, 104:5, **EMMA**[1] - 3:26 62:6, 91:25, 114:2, 169:14, 169:26 doctor [5] - 10:23, 110:20, 118:13, empathy [1] - 141:19

44:2, 65:25, 66:2, emphasis [1] -**EQUALITY**[1] - 1:8 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 6:11, F 121:29 Equality [1] - 56:29 142:14, 145:23, 66:3, 70:10, 89:20, emphasise [1] equality [1] - 158:9 146:23 133:20, 149:21, face [1] - 43:21 example [3] - 47:11, 163:19 42:25 equated [1] - 148:24 **employee** [1] - 18:5 faced [1] - 37:5 48:22, 141:27 farm [1] - 137:14 error [2] - 17:6, facing [1] - 51:1 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:5 enable [2] - 43:10, except [3] - 19:11, 85:26 fact [30] - 35:2, 27:14, 105:26 fast [1] - 93:4 50.16 erupts [1] - 165:13 36:27, 38:14, 47:13, enclose [1] - 156:17 exception [2] fault [1] - 39:14 essence [1] - 162:15 48:18, 53:5, 62:23, 11:12, 92:1 **FEBRUARY** [5] - 1:5, enclosed [2] - 47:1, essentially [3] -62:26, 62:29, 63:3, excess [1] - 23:18 1:9, 1:18, 6:2, 171:24 86.27 39:28, 157:28, 158:11 exclusively [2] -67:12, 85:21, 90:11, February [1] - 140:22 encloses [1] - 96:20 establish [1] - 42:27 107:6, 119:3, 121:10, enclosing [1] - 85:12 141:1, 141:16 feed [1] - 26:28 ESTABLISHED[1] -121:12, 121:22, exec [8] - 7:24, 9:27, encompass [1] -1:7 Feehily [4] - 89:9, 123:13, 124:10, 102:27 53:11. 62:1. 62:17. 96:19, 153:15, 155:2 established [1] -132:22. 134:3. 83:3, 83:10, 132:6 encompasses [1] -118:4 **felt** [21] - 29:18, 144:26, 146:8, **execution** [1] - 34:8 31:20, 32:24, 41:17, 104:10 estimated [1] - 134:9 149:20, 152:17, EXECUTIVE [1] -41:23, 41:29, 42:1, encompassing [1] etcetera [2] - 68:23, 159:16, 162:22, 3:13 42:10, 42:13, 44:11, 137.18 163:9, 170:6 executive [6] -54:21, 63:10, 65:27, encountered [1] -Eugene [2] - 122:18, fact-finding [3] -51:29, 76:8, 83:20, 70:24, 81:12, 81:13, 84:13 119:3, 121:22, 124:10 94:5, 119:1, 127:23 103:14, 121:18, encouraged [1] euros [1] - 143:13 factual [1] - 95:6 exercise [2] -132:17, 132:18, 170:6 42:9 evening [3] - 29:14, failed [1] - 32:12 end [6] - 10:14, 167:21, 168:28 FERGAL [1] - 2:27 72:4. 72:6 failure [4] - 85:28, exhibits [1] - 58:12 Fergus [1] - 111:20 11:22, 32:24, 70:2, event [18] - 15:12, 90:29, 91:2, 91:8 existing [2] - 35:27, **FERRY** [1] - 2:16 116:20, 138:9 20:5, 21:13, 28:7, fairly [4] - 41:3, few [2] - 66:29, 57.4 **END** [4] - 142:7, 43:14, 45:21, 49:7, 46:10, 48:27, 156:6 145:12, 146:19, expanded [1] -142:16 52:24, 55:26, 64:8, fairness [3] - 25:19, 170:14 77:10, 80:18, 95:2, 125:13 FF [2] - 121:23, 25:27, 43:29 ended [1] - 29:26 96:10, 117:13, expect [5] - 11:15, 123:1 fait [1] - 149:23 80:17, 83:29, 114:17, fifth [1] - 169:26 endorsed[1]-126:12, 128:20, familiar [8] - 9:2, 116:19 figure [1] - 143:26 101:22 131:18 21:11, 24:22, 94:27, ends [1] - 137:2 expectation [1] file [24] - 17:6, 17:10, events [5] - 10:12, 104:19, 104:21, 117:25 endured [1] - 55:12 48:16, 68:5, 72:3, 19:6, 50:15, 54:12, 104:26, 105:25 84:3 expected [5] - 26:5, 54:19, 54:20, 54:28, engaged [1] - 158:24 **FANNING** [1] - 2:21 27:10, 27:26, 86:19, 65:27, 70:5, 70:6, enquire [1] - 43:12 eventuality [1] -Fanning [42] - 10:3, 168:9 81:17, 94:8, 95:18, enquiry [2] - 38:3, 32.28 75:28, 76:12, 81:24, 96:4, 101:13, 101:17, experience [2] everywhere[1] -150:18 82:2, 84:10, 84:29, 44:24, 82:15 101:26, 102:9, ensure [6] - 24:29, 100:16, 100:26, expert [1] - 11:10 106:29, 110:16, 25:15. 27:21. 127:8. evidence [18] - 25:4, 101:12, 102:7, 102:9, 111:17, 117:26, explain [1] - 132:21 127:12, 158:6 61:18, 63:22, 140:23, 102:12, 102:17, explore [2] - 32:28, 163:20 142:24, 147:10, ensuring [2] - 41:14, 103:12, 103:23, 152:18, 155:20, 148:2 files [4] - 35:21, 50:24 104:3, 104:7, 106:19, 159:16, 159:17, exploring [2] - 45:16, 104:16, 110:17, entailed [2] - 104:27, 106:26, 107:20, 131:15 159:23, 160:2, 160:8, 148:8 124:18 109:8. 119:25. fills [1] - 26:1 enter [1] - 46:16 163:5, 163:18, express [2] - 89:15, 121:17, 121:23, 163:23, 165:8, 166:18 final [2] - 33:11, 89:25 entering [1] - 29:4 123:1, 124:27, 129:1, **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 169.6 expressed [3] enthusiasm [1] -130:10, 131:5, 132:1, finalising [1] - 97:18 exacerbating [1] -22:28, 80:5, 82:6 156:20 145:19, 146:9, 40:16 expression [1] - 98:9 **finally** [1] - 63:6 entirety [1] - 141:14 157:24, 160:21, financial [2] - 46:2, exact [1] - 143:22 expressly [1] - 25:29 entitled [2] - 19:7, 161:2, 163:7, 163:26, 51:1 exactly [10] - 17:4, extensive [1] -165:2, 166:6, 166:16, 17:10, 17:20, 59:24, financially [1] entry [8] - 30:18, 116:28 167:11 50:27 72:10, 100:11, extent [1] - 139:18 134:8, 135:25, fanning [2] - 164:22, 143:21, 153:9, 158:12 **findings** [1] - 50:20 externally [1] - 65:9 169:14, 169:24, 167:6 examination [2] fine [1] - 30:16 extremely [1] -169:26. 170:3 Fanning's [2] finish [2] - 137:5, **envelope** [1] - 69:28 170:17, 170:20 142:20 107:10, 163:20 EXAMINATION [4] -145:15 environment [1] **eye** [1] - 156:15 fanning's [2] -142:7, 145:12, finished [1] - 35:11 147:25 103:26, 123:10 146:19, 170:14 **FINN** [1] - 3:5 **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 far [11] - 17:8, 17:22,

**EXAMINED** [8] - 5:5,

equal [1] - 84:3

Finn [9] - 68:9,

128:28, 131:10, 132:2, 133:7, 138:25, 155:23, 162:17, 163:24 Fintan [3] - 121:23, 123:1, 164:22 **FINTAN**[1] - 2:21 Fiona [1] - 100:21 firm [1] - 82:6 first [43] - 6:22, 11:4, 11:20, 13:6, 13:9, 14:6, 15:3, 18:15, 30:18, 35:15, 40:15, 47:7, 47:11, 49:8, 50:7, 50:15, 51:13, 52:16, 57:24, 67:22, 86:24, 89:11, 94:20, 95:4, 112:16, 119:19, 129:20, 130:2, 132:26, 132:29, 139:4, 145:14, 145:27, 149:9, 151:21. 155:4. 156:12, 164:7, 165:1, 165:19, 166:27, 171:1 fit [4] - 32:25, 33:16, 133:3, 148:3 fits [1] - 13:10 Fitzgerald [2] - 58:3, FITZWILLIAM [1] five [8] - 49:12, 50:6, 62:18, 135:14, 159:19, 159:27, 160:3, 160:8 five-page [1] - 50:6 fix [1] - 152:21 Flanagan [2] - 89:8, flat [2] - 91:22, 91:23 **flu** [7] - 20:9, 20:27, 21:1, 48:1, 134:28, 154:8, 155:6 flu/viral [1] - 10:22 flu/work [1] - 17:2 **FLYNN** [1] - 3:19 focus [4] - 98:15, 99:14, 103:9 focused [2] - 98:26, 101:29 follow [7] - 12:21, 15:20, 38:25, 61:24, 80:15, 111:14, 125:6 followed [4] - 71:6, 72:13, 106:23, 116:22 following [11] - 1:25, 37:19, 37:20, 38:21, 89:12, 100:13, 109:19, 114:3,

125:10, 150:5 FOLLOWING [1] -1:4 **FOLLOWS** [6] - 6:1, 6:12, 88:24, 142:14, 145:23, 146:24 foot [6] - 15:19, 18:15, 22:9, 25:10, 46:29. 112:10 FOR [11] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 4:1, 4:4, 4:10, 88:23 force [2] - 8:6, 93:8 force's [3] - 166:3, 167:13, 167:14 forced [1] - 50:25 forcing [1] - 38:21 foregoing [1] - 43:6 foremost [1] - 13:6 forget [2] - 168:21 form [9] - 26:2, 41:27, 72:9, 73:11, 82:17, 92:6, 94:17, 117:26 formal [16] - 26:6, 56:18, 57:22, 60:7, 60:10, 60:17, 66:20, 67:18, 68:3, 74:26, 89:17, 89:27, 90:12, 129:22, 139:14, 153:27 **formalise** [1] - 76:5

**formally** [1] **-** 66:6

former [2] - 104:23,

**FORMER** [2] - 1:13,

forth [2] - 11:1, 25:26

forum [3] - 37:15,

forward [10] - 42:9,

123:5, 140:12, 156:9,

166:9, 166:15, 166:29

forwarded [7] - 58:6,

67:20, 69:25, 104:16,

106:8, 113:28, 116:6

62:17, 121:2, 121:16

fourth [3] - 113:21,

**FP** [2] - 91:25, 91:26

Francis [1] - 58:3

Frank [1] - 144:12

Freedom [2] - 87:9,

free [1] - 171:12

four [4] - 23:18,

four-page [1] -

147:5, 169:13

121:16

127:29

42:14, 84:9, 95:24,

98:7, 139:20

136:21

G

furtively [2] - 92:23,

FREEMAN [1] - 2:22

frequently [2] - 19:4,

**Friday** [1] - 72:4

fro-ing [1] - 74:16

front [4] - 55:14,

78:24, 79:2, 162:7

fulfil [1] - 15:25

64:16, 86:2, 86:7,

108:27. 144:15

fully [2] - 68:3,

function [8] - 8:9,

functions [2] - 14:1,

fundamental [1] -

furnish [1] - 26:21

furnished [2] -

27:16, 107:7

8:11, 8:15, 11:25,

87:21, 138:15,

140:17, 141:7

158:24

127:3

41:28

164:16

fruits [1] - 159:28

frustration [1] - 98:9

full [16] - 43:7, 43:23.

43:26, 50:28, 56:14,

87:28, 91:12, 91:27,

91:28, 95:24, 106:26,

**fro** [1] - 74:16

45:1

game [1] - 40:23 gap [1] - 130:27 garda [2] - 135:14, 155:10 Garda [342] - 6:24, 6:25, 7:1, 7:29, 9:21, 9:22, 9:29, 10:8, 10:13, 10:17, 10:27, 11:16, 12:5, 14:3, 14:7, 14:10, 14:20, 15:1, 15:3, 15:9, 15:25, 16:8, 16:12, 16:29, 17:9, 18:6, 18:9, 18:22, 18:25, 19:12, 19:18, 20:1, 20:16, 20:28, 21:6, 21:9, 21:10, 21:14, 21:19, 21:20, 21:28, 22:6, 22:11, 22:24, 25:5, 25:6, 25:10, 25:20, 25:23, 25:29, 26:6, 27:2, 27:5, 27:6, 27:24, 28:8, 28:27, 29:9, 29:13, 29:16,

30:10, 31:5, 31:13, 32:15, 32:21, 34:5, 35:12, 35:19, 35:25, 36:8, 36:11, 37:6, 37:7, 37:10, 37:13, 37:18, 42:3, 43:7, 43:10, 43:13, 44:14, 44:15, 45:28, 46:5, 46:11, 47:9, 48:9, 48:22, 48:28, 49:11, 49:14, 49:20, 49:23, 49:26, 50:15, 51:17, 52:15, 52:29, 53:5, 53:10, 53:24, 53:26, 54:11, 54:22, 55:13, 55:20, 55:22, 56:2, 56:5, 56:26, 57:6, 58:16, 58:19, 59:12, 59:18, 59:27, 59:28, 60:9, 60:13, 60:18, 60:20, 62:3, 62:28, 63:7, 63:12, 63:27, 64:3, 64:16, 64:22, 65:27. 66:5. 67:15. 67:17, 67:23, 68:8, 68:22, 69:9, 69:24, 69:26, 69:27, 70:13, 70:19, 70:22, 71:5, 71:24, 71:27, 72:2, 72:11, 72:14, 72:17, 73:3, 73:8, 73:15, 74:8. 74:27. 77:20. 77:26, 78:9, 78:12, 78:13, 78:14, 79:12, 79:15, 79:18, 79:21, 79:23, 80:1, 80:5, 80:6, 80:16, 81:12, 81:25, 82:8, 84:5, 84:19. 84:21. 85:14. 85:16, 85:20, 85:28, 86:1, 86:6, 86:18, 86:28, 87:28, 89:4, 89:15, 89:17, 89:25, 89:27, 90:11, 90:12, 90:21, 90:24, 91:8, 93:22, 94:12, 96:17, 96:26, 97:24, 98:9, 99.2 99.9 99.25 101:14, 102:13, 102:22, 103:18, 104:4, 106:7, 106:9, 106:22, 108:6, 108:12, 108:27, 109:8, 110:1, 110:6, 110:14, 111:9, 113:16, 113:21, 115:12, 116:12, 116:29, 117:11, 117:21, 118:12, 120:19, 121:15,

29:18, 29:25, 29:26,

122:1, 122:14, 124:29, 127:12, 127:28, 128:6, 128:17, 129:4, 129:9, 130:3, 130:9, 130:11, 130:18, 131:1, 131:18, 131:26, 132:7, 132:23, 132:26, 134:3, 134:24, 135:8, 136:16, 136:23, 137:5, 137:10, 139:11, 139:19, 139:22, 139:27, 139:29, 140:5, 140:6, 140:11, 140:15, 142:18, 144:9, 144:13, 144:14, 144:15, 144:17, 144:22, 145:5, 145:6, 146:29, 147:12, 147:21, 148:21, 149:5, 149:13, 149:17, 150:10, 150:13. 150:24. 150:26, 151:10, 151:11, 151:20, 151:22, 151:26, 152:6, 152:22, 153:25, 154:6, 154:8, 154:13, 154:16, 154:24, 154:28, 155:1. 155:18. 156:3. 156:21, 157:13, 157:16, 157:26, 158:3, 158:7, 158:9, 158:24, 158:26, 159:18, 160:2, 161:8, 161:11, 161:16, 162:13, 162:15, 163:2, 163:4, 165:22, 165:24, 165:29, 166:1, 166:2, 166:7, 167:7, 167:9, 167:16, 167:23, 169:13, 170:5 **GARDA**[10] - 2:10, 2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2, 3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21, 4.10 garda.. [1] - 71:2 gardaí [1] - 86:3 Gardaí [1] - 48:8 Gardiner [1] - 23:28 garnered [1] - 18:4 gather [1] - 127:27 gathered [1] - 134:6 general [7] - 35:10, 105:21, 105:27, 106:17, 107:26, 108:9, 127:5

generally [3] - 15:6, 91:29, 106:2 generating [1] -128:23 geographically [1] -9:19 GERAGHTY [1] -2:17 Gerard [2] - 114:27, 167:26 GERARD[1] - 2:11 **GERRY** [1] - 3:11 gist [1] - 115:17 given [15] - 15:2, 35:4, 51:8, 52:18, 54:19, 56:2, 67:23, 69:26, 103:10, 120:28, 121:1, 127:9, 127:12, 142:19, 159.23 Glacken [1] - 137:15 GLEESON [1] - 4:7 **GWEN** [1] - 1:29 Gwen [1] - 1:24 going.. [1] - 31:27 good" [1] - 135:7 GOODE [1] - 3:22 goodwill [1] - 127:17 governance [1] -141:11 Governance [1] -129:25 **GP**[7] - 17:18, 17:22, 17:27, 22:25, 27:24, 27:28, 147:24 grade [2] - 76:27, **GRALTON**[1] - 3:14 Gralton [6] - 71:8, 71:16, 71:22, 72:18, 157:12, 157:17 grand [1] - 168:24 granted [1] - 43:16 grasp [1] - 18:29 grateful [2] - 96:24, 97:14 grave [2] - 92:18, 164:11 greater [1] - 21:9 greatly [1] - 127:2 green [1] - 151:29 GREENE [1] - 2:27 Grehan [2] - 128:6, 128:17 grievance [2] -89:18, 89:28 GRIFFIN [1] - 3:26 GRIPS [1] - 26:28 ground [1] - 110:15 grounds [1] - 64:2

GSOC [42] - 32:13,

37:24, 37:26, 49:2,

49:23, 50:11, 50:16, 54:3, 54:10, 54:12, 54:18, 54:23, 54:27, 55:1, 55:29, 58:21, 58:27, 59:5, 59:11, 59:17, 59:27, 60:8, 60:19, 65:22, 65:25, 66:4, 75:3, 107:28, 113:25, 115:24, 121:8, 121:13, 137:5, 149:22, 150:2, 151:7, 151:12. 156:16 GSOC" [1] - 156:11 GSOC's [2] - 59:4, 156:20 guard [2] - 152:24, 155:14 guards [1] - 36:5 Guards [1] - 156:25 guessing [1] -158:19

### Н

half [1] - 98:10 HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 hand [8] - 44:7, 69:13, 92:17, 92:20, 114:24, 129:4, 164:10, 164:13 handed [1] - 50:16 handing [1] - 54:11 handling [1] - 165:23 hands [2] - 30:28, 68:24 handwritten [3] -86:27, 96:17, 106:8 happy [8] - 15:20, 38:18, 43:26, 125:18, 125:20, 145:16, 151:22, 170:8 HARAN[1] - 4:5 harassed [1] - 35:14 harassment [116] -34:27, 35:3, 35:22, 35:28, 48:4, 48:7, 48:8, 48:21, 49:17, 50:9, 52:15, 52:18, 52:24, 53:1, 53:12, 54:3. 55:12. 55:17. 55:21, 56:19, 56:20, 57:14, 57:23, 57:24, 58:1, 59:11, 59:17, 65:2, 65:8, 66:8, 66:21, 66:22, 67:12, 67:17, 68:28, 69:19,

70:6, 70:26, 71:2,

89:16, 89:26, 93:16, 94:13, 94:17, 95:7, 95:9, 96:7, 97:3, 97:19, 98:27, 101:14, 102:14, 103:9, 104:8, 104:15, 109:5, 109:17, 109:26, 110:2, 112:22, 112:28, 114:23, 116:16, 116:27, 119:4, 121:6, 121:14, 121:20, 122:1, 122:3, 122:9, 122:13, 122:22, 123:11, 123:15, 123:22, 123:26, 124:5, 124:8, 124:22, 124:27, 126:6, 129:14, 130:12, 132:3, 133:7, 138:8, 138:23, 141:27, 149:12, 149:24, 150:8, 150:14. 150:21. 151:7, 151:13, 151:23, 151:29, 152:4, 154:15, 155:21, 156:4, 156:27, 157:8, 157:27, 159:13, 162:26, 165:24, 170:28 hard [2] - 30:15, 165:7 hassett [1] - 72:9 Hassett [7] - 53:16, 70:4. 95:18. 96:4. 96:6, 120:4, 150:17 **HAVING** [1] - 6:10 **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 head [10] - 7:20, 9:25, 14:9, 15:22, 55:4. 69:17. 77:3. 82:23, 117:22, 167:13 heading [1] - 165:13 Headquarters [3] -7:2, 158:9, 166:2 headquarters [2] -36:28, 166:29 health [16] - 14:11, 26:4, 27:14, 64:1, 64:4, 79:22, 85:15, 85:18, 85:22, 87:11, 139:11, 154:9, 154:19, 155:7, 156:10, 156:15 Health [1] - 23:2

74:15, 74:26, 77:6,

79:24, 81:11, 83:11,

113:23, 115:29, 120:15, 167:11, 170:5 HELD [1] - 1:17 help [15] - 13:3, 14:5, 19:19, 21:25, 26:15, 29:22, 29:24, 30:14, 72:11, 73:22, 109:24, 125:6, 142:19, 142:20, 168:12 helped [1] - 33:4 helpful [1] - 15:24 helpfully [1] - 15:14 hierarchy [1] - 11:5 **HIGGINS** [1] - 4:10 highest [1] - 7:29 highlight [1] - 133:5 himself [7] - 22:6, 31:14, 35:19, 36:7, 53:26, 96:2, 158:20 hint [1] - 105:2 hit [1] - 166:6 hmm [6] - 24:1, 24:17, 36:12, 45:25, 96:12, 112:13 hold [3] - 83:2, 92:20. 164:13 holder [1] - 118:11 holding [2] - 65:27, 65:28 holistic [1] - 120:18 honest [11] - 17:19, 21:23, 45:11, 54:21, 71:20, 101:21, 104:21, 128:26, 131:13, 165:1, 166:26 honesty [1] - 92:29 hope [1] - 57:14 HORAN [1] - 3:25 hot [1] - 156:6 Hotel [2] - 29:29, 131:23 hour [1] - 142:25 hours [1] - 144:1 house [2] - 40:26, 137:20 HOUSE [3] - 2:23, 3:27, 4:11 House [1] - 9:10 Houses [1] - 42:4

Healy [1] - 111:20

hear [2] - 90:21,

heard [6] - 35:1,

140:23, 155:20

88:23, 171:23

107:26, 108:9,

35:13, 63:24, 104:23,

**HEARING** [3] - 6:1,

61:27, 93:26, 106:17,

held [11] - 38:16,

92:25

**HQ** [2] - 24:21, 81:11 HR [40] - 7:4, 7:8, 7:11, 7:12, 7:14, 7:16, 8:1, 9:27, 11:6, 19:1, 22:16, 24:20, 26:7, 36:18, 55:4, 56:10, 59:5, 59:8, 64:8, 66:15, 67:29, 69:17, 69:25, 83:9, 91:26, 93:3, 100:17, 113:4, 113:5, 113:11, 127:4, 139:5, 139:7, 140:9, 140:20, 141:2, 141:6, 141:10, 141:14 HR's [1] - 25:12 **HRM** [6] - 9:17, 9:18, 10:9, 11:4, 14:22, 116:29 HRPD [1] - 119:2 huge [1] - 118:10 HUGHES [2] - 2:29, 2:30 **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15 human [2] - 41:8, 62:22 Human [3] - 52:26, 109:9, 167:13 hundred [3] - 65:29, 71:18, 143:13

### I

ice [2] - 18:21, 18:27 ICELAND[1] - 4:11 idea [4] - 24:29, 82:1, 104:28, 166:19 identified [3] - 35:3, 108:12, 153:6 identifies [1] -144:14 identify [2] - 124:4, 144.7 identifying [1] -144:25 identity [4] - 49:22, 54:13, 120:23, 120:24 **ill** [1] - 10:1 illness [3] - 22:27, 23:6, 23:15 imagine [1] - 110:29 **immediate** [1] - 73:2 immediately [4] -24:27, 123:26, 127:10. 157:11 impacted [1] -154:23 imperfections [1] -140:25 implication [1] -

health' [1] - 26:27

healthy [1] - 166:14

168:8 48:10 166:20 112:19, 112:21, internally [2] - 65:3, imply [1] - 102:21 infer [1] - 168:16 inside [2] - 92:22, 105:13 112:25, 116:15, 121:25, 122:10, important [3] - 18:3, inference [2] - 168:9, 164:15 interpretation [6] insofar [6] - 9:4, 37:13, 49:5, 49:6, 124:6, 126:26, 25:22. 63:6 168:11 importantly [1] inform [8] - 13:15, 65:24, 87:27, 141:12, 109:20, 118:22, 134:12, 135:11, 135:28, 136:2, 137:2, 62:23 28:9, 64:25, 66:6, 141:15, 161:13 150:10 99:24, 111:10, Inspector [14] intervene [2] - 19:11, 138:8, 138:20, 139:6, impression [1] -139:20, 141:14, 95:26 111:20, 113:22 100:24, 111:9, 86:21 113:21, 118:16, 142:2, 147:13, informal [1] - 129:22 intervened [2] - 98:2, imprudent [1] - 83:2 Information [2] -128:29, 129:3, 159:9, 154:25 157:29, 158:13, IN [1] - 1:17 in-house [1] - 40:26 87:9, 127:29 159:18, 160:18, intervening [1] -158:29, 159:13, 162:17, 163:24, inaccurate [1] information [24] -160:20, 161:20, 20:1 161:29, 162:13, 163:7 164:11 16:4, 19:15, 21:7, intervention [3] -102:3 investigations [13] -INSPECTOR [7] -118:6, 152:19, 154:20 inadequate [1] -24:5, 28:28, 31:5, 14:15, 56:1, 95:15, 43:9. 55:24. 58:6. 3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, interventions [3] -167:24 98:6, 105:10, 105:15, 61:3, 67:20, 76:15, 3:18, 3:22, 4:5 60:6, 68:21, 124:28 inadvertently [2] -109:14, 124:1, 77:23, 77:25, 77:29, inspector [3] - 6:29, interviewed [1] -149:27 149:28 135:14, 141:12, 7:2. 43:17 include [2] - 41:21, 80:1, 93:24, 96:1, 108:6 141:16, 141:20, 115:24, 121:12, inspectors [1] - 48:8 **INTO**[1] - 1:2 121:25 141:24 128:20, 128:27, instance [3] - 86:24, into.. [1] - 34:15 included [6] - 54:23, investigative [2] -129:4, 145:4 138:17, 171:1 60:24, 121:2, 121:13, introduced [1] - 7:20 84:9, 103:11 125:26, 126:1 informed [11] instigated [1] - 82:24 intrude [1] - 142:4 investigator [3] -14:14, 21:20, 24:3, includes [2] - 42:20, instruct [1] - 79:25 investigate [13] -48:3, 51:20, 57:27, 13:13, 76:27, 158:5 INSTRUCTED[8] -61:2 13:14, 43:13, 44:13, 59:29, 69:2, 72:14, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, investigators [2] -48:21, 54:18, 68:6, including [5] - 31:17, 170:3. 170:7 80:17, 115:28 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10 105:5, 108:26, 126:5, 46:2, 48:7, 112:26, investigators" [1] instruction [1] -126:16 informing [5] -132:3, 149:12, 170:2 59:22, 70:20, 93:14, inclusion [1] - 74:5 170:26 158:15, 167:8 invocation [2] -109:9, 151:11 INSTRUMENT[1] incoherent [1] investigated [13] -89:17, 89:27 infrequent [1] - 24:7 37:16, 49:18, 60:12, 20:13 infrequently [3] invoke [3] - 36:13, intend [2] - 63:20, 65:2, 67:16, 68:3, incorrect [5] - 154:2, 36:14, 95:8 34:3, 36:29, 37:1 98:14 68:16, 84:7, 94:8, 155:15, 155:16, involve [1] - 12:5 ing [2] - 74:16 intended [3] - 81:26, 94:16, 107:9, 107:24, 164:18, 171:2 involved [16] - 8:24, initiate [1] - 85:28 82:26, 92:28 149:22 increasing [1] intends [1] - 127:20 12:29, 13:5, 14:6, initiated [3] - 15:17, investigating [3] -40:16 14:9, 15:3, 15:23, 24:2, 156:28 intent [1] - 127:14 36:24, 97:2, 150:3 incredible [1] - 161:1 68:22, 76:18, 84:8, initiation [3] intention [8] - 20:17, investigation [92] incur [1] - 143:2 155:21, 156:4, 157:7 110:12, 110:13, 56:13, 66:20, 66:24, 8:26, 8:27, 8:29, indeed [3] - 42:23, 126:14, 152:26, initiative [1] - 127:16 13:21, 13:24, 13:27, 118:4, 132:27, 94:24, 138:14 152:27, 158:8 injured [1] - 92:3 133:20, 133:23 23:10, 24:18, 24:27, Independent [3] involvement [3] injury [24] - 24:25, 25:9, 25:16, 25:24, interacted [1] - 35:16 165:12, 165:28, 168:1 151:26, 156:21, 24:28, 33:22, 34:2, interaction [1] -25:25, 26:11, 31:18, independent [3] -158:29 38:4, 38:22, 43:7, 26:10, 56:25 34:4, 34:6, 34:7, 34:9, 86:29 involves [1] - 159:3 50:29, 91:14, 91:16, 43:10, 43:15, 43:23, independently [1] interactions [2] involving [1] -91:19, 92:2, 92:12, 43:26, 44:6, 44:8, 127:10 135:9, 140:3 165:26 99:20, 136:8, 136:9, 44:22, 45:20, 50:17, interest [6] - 36:25, index [4] - 34:28, Irish [3] - 165:12, 138:2, 142:26, 148:5, 56:18, 66:19, 71:9, 51:18, 52:11, 54:11, 35:3, 37:5, 52:18 165:28, 167:29 148:17, 148:18, 54:27, 58:10, 61:8, 82:16, 112:24 **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 iron [1] - 82:21 148:24, 155:9 61:11, 65:28, 68:25, interested [1] - 55:13 indicate [4] - 13:17, isolation [1] - 122:10 69:1, 73:3, 74:11, injury) [1] - 91:10 interests [3] - 82:18, 31:9, 72:16, 147:27 input [3] - 13:24, 74:29, 75:17, 78:6, issue [92] - 10:15, 83:23. 83:24 indicated [2] - 66:23, 80.9 85.29 91.3 10:27, 16:7, 18:16, 81:14, 82:19 interim [2] - 38:28, 152:2 92:18, 95:7, 95:28, 26:18, 31:17, 31:18, inquiries [2] - 77:12, 46:21 indicates [1] -97:18, 98:27, 102:18, 33:18, 33:24, 34:17, 115:25 Internal [11] - 7:7, 151:22 INQUIRY [2] - 1:2, 102:26, 102:28, 39:4, 39:28, 40:4, 7:9. 7:14. 77:11. indication [2] -103:1, 103:8, 103:14, 40:25, 42:16, 49:9, 111:15, 113:24, 67:11, 152:6 104:9, 104:11, 49:24, 49:28, 50:10, inquiry [9] - 96:29, 115:22, 140:27, individual [4] -113:24, 119:3, 138:7. 106:24, 107:6, 51:13, 54:26, 55:11, 141:11, 142:2 13:17, 13:19, 117:4, 138:17, 140:21, 108:25, 109:1, 56:9, 58:1, 63:19, internal [2] - 142:1, 117:27 110:16, 111:15, 66:7, 66:14, 67:24, 147:20, 162:16, 154:7 individuals [1] -

70:25, 71:14, 71:21, 71:22, 73:2, 73:4, 73:6, 74:10, 74:11, 74:15, 74:21, 76:23, 78:4, 80:29, 81:8, 81:25, 82:22, 83:13, 85:14, 86:13, 87:22, 90:17, 92:9, 97:18, 101:25, 107:27, 111:23, 114:15, 120:23, 131:9, 132:17, 135:17, 135:18, 139:14, 141:6, 142:23, 144:8, 144:18, 144:26, 144:29, 145:3, 145:5, 147:20, 148:4, 148:5, 148:14, 148:15, 148:18, 148:26, 151:13, 151:15, 151:29, 152:9, 152:17, 155:19, 157:12, 166:12, 166:19, 168:19, 168:25, 169:17, 169:19, 170:20, 171:10 issued [3] - 69:9, 69:12. 100:12 issues [59] - 9:6, 13:21, 19:28, 20:3, 26:12, 28:29, 29:1, 29:3, 31:14, 31:20, 31:24. 36:17. 37:17. 49:7, 54:1, 54:24, 60:12, 60:14, 61:19, 65:22, 68:14, 71:7, 72:29, 73:23, 74:22, 83:12, 84:4, 84:11, 88:5, 89:11, 93:7, 96:25, 98:11, 102:10, 102.13 102.23 103:13, 106:9, 109:11, 112:28, 114:26, 115:23, 118:5, 119:4, 120:16, 121:3, 123:10, 123:16, 126:22, 130:3, 130:11, 132:4, 132:24, 139:15, 151:16, 156:11, 156:16, 163:23, 166:19 it" [1] - 137:4 item [3] - 61:20, 93:22, 116:14 items [6] - 35:8, 35:11, 77:20, 125:8, 150:3 itself [6] - 13:12,

27:9, 45:4, 87:29, 98:13, 131:3

#### J

**JACK**[1] - 3:6 James [1] - 159:10 **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 January [10] - 14:22, 26:22, 27:18, 77:14, 77:27, 78:16, 79:17, 79:19, 80:20, 80:25 January.. [1] - 78:22 JB) [1] - 123:4 Jimmy [1] - 119:27 JN [2] - 121:29, 123:20 job [3] - 13:9, 29:20, 93:23 JOE [1] - 3:14 Joe [6] - 8:4, 120:8, 120:21, 121:29, 123:20, 167:13 JOHN [4] - 2:11. 2:16, 3:8, 4:1 John [19] - 7:22, 61:22, 94:22, 103:17, 103:22, 103:28, 104:16, 106:7, 114:26, 120:10, 122:8, 123:4, 123:7, 124:4. 156:17. 164:24, 164:29, 167:12, 167:26 John's [2] - 100:23, 123:7 joined [1] - 6:25 Josephine [4] - 89:9, 96:19, 153:14, 155:2 journal [1] - 80:3 Judge [7] - 6:8, 21:5, 37:2, 78:29, 110:13, 144.3 160.17 JUDGE [1] - 3:12 July [14] - 8:6, 11:28, 45:22, 46:19, 47:12, 51:28, 85:10, 85:11, 85:13, 86:28, 145:1, 151:27, 156:5 jump [1] - 85:9 June [13] - 10:24, 29:27, 42:18, 47:21, 47:25. 53:6. 57:26. 59:28, 86:29, 132:27, 140:22, 147:21, 156:5 jurisdiction [1] -112.29

Justice [5] - 50:21,

55:22, 56:28, 58:3,

153:14 **JUSTICE** [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 **justice** [2] - 72:29, 74:6

## K

**KANE**[1] - 2:28 **KATE**[1] - 3:25 Kathleen [6] - 53:16, 70:4, 95:18, 96:4, 120:4, 150:17 Kavanagh [3] -148:10, 153:23, 160:6 **KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:5 **KEANE** [1] - 4:6 keen [3] - 25:14, 29:21, 38:20 keep [6] - 14:14, 24:2, 27:13, 38:20, 38:21, 139:10 keeping [4] - 51:20, 83:22, 132:23, 138:16 **KELLY** [4] - 2:10, 3:12, 142:10, 167:28 Ken [1] - 122:17 Keogh [233] - 9:29, 10:8, 10:13, 10:17, 10:27, 11:16, 14:3, 14:7, 14:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:25, 16:8, 16:13. 16:29. 17:9. 18:6, 18:9, 18:22, 18:23, 18:25, 19:12, 19:18, 20:2, 20:16, 20:28, 21:10, 21:14, 21:20, 21:28, 22:6, 22:24, 25:5, 25:6, 25:10, 25:20, 25:23, 25:29, 27:2, 27:5, 27:6, 28:14, 28:15, 29:18, 29:26, 30:10, 31:5, 31:14, 32:15, 32:21, 35:12, 35:19, 35:26, 36:8, 37:6, 37:8, 37:10, 37:13, 37:18, 42:3, 43:10, 44:14, 44:15, 45:28, 46:5, 46:11, 47:9, 48:28, 49:26, 51:17, 52:16, 52:29, 53:5, 53:10, 53:24, 53:26, 54:22, 56:2, 56:5, 57:6, 58:16, 58:19, 59:28, 60:9, 60:14, 60:18. 60:20. 62:3. 62:28, 63:13, 63:27, 64:16, 64:22, 65:27,

68:22, 69:9, 69:24, 69:26, 69:28, 70:13, 70:19, 70:22, 71:24, 71:27, 72:11, 72:14, 72:17, 73:15, 74:8, 74:27, 77:26, 78:13, 79:18, 79:22, 79:23, 80:1, 80:16, 81:12, 81:25, 82:9, 84:5, 84:19, 84:21, 85:16, 85:20, 86:1, 86:6, 86:18, 86:28, 87:28, 89:4, 90:11, 90:21, 91:8, 94:12, 95:10, 96:18, 97:24, 99:2, 99:25, 101:14, 102:13, 102:22, 104:4, 106:9, 106:23, 108:12, 108:27, 109:9, 110:1, 110:6, 111:10, 113:22, 116:12, 117:1, 117:11, 118:12, 121:15, 122:1, 122:14. 124:4. 124:29, 127:12, 127:28, 129:4, 129:9, 130:9, 130:11, 130:18, 131:18, 131:26, 132:7, 132:23, 132:26, 134:3, 134:24, 135:8, 139:22. 139:27. 140:5, 140:6, 140:11, 142:18, 144:9, 144:14, 144:16, 144:17, 144:22, 146:29, 147:12, 147:21, 149:5, 149:17, 150:10, 150:25. 150:26. 151:11, 151:20, 151:22, 151:26, 152:6, 152:22, 153:25, 154:8, 154:13, 154:24, 154:28, 155:18, 156:3. 156:21. 157:13, 157:14, 157:16, 157:26, 158:7, 158:24, 158:26, 159:18, 161:8, 161:11, 161:16, 162:13, 163:2, 163:4, 165:29, 166:8, 167:9, 167:23, 169:13. 170:5 **KEOGH** [1] - 2:10 Keogh's [38] - 12:6,

14:10, 15:3, 26:6,

27:24, 29:13, 43:7,

43:13, 59:27, 64:3, 72:2, 73:8, 77:20, 80:5, 85:14, 89:15, 89:25, 93:22, 96:26, 98:9, 99:8, 99:9, 103:18, 106:7, 110:14, 113:16, 116:4, 120:20, 131:1, 139:11, 139:19, 144:13, 148:22, 150:13, 158:3, 160:2, 162:15, 167:17 kept [9] - 24:12, 29:25, 59:29, 69:2, 70:1, 160:21, 161:4, 161:10, 161:19 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 **key** [5] - 24:24, 40:9, 40:12, 42:25, 70:2 kick [1] - 157:28 **KIERAN**[1] - 3:20 Killeshen [1] -131.23 kind [4] - 12:24, 21:5, 37:6, 42:10 kindly [2] - 30:10, 96:24 **KIRWAN** [1] - 3:13 knelt [1] - 15:23 knowledge [14] -10:17, 26:9, 28:3, 44:28, 52:14, 72:28, 83:8, 86:6, 90:20, 139:27, 139:28, 145:2, 155:13, 169:2 known [2] - 18:22, 18:25 knows [1] - 105:26

#### L

labelled [1] - 15:14 lacuna [1] - 42:13 **Laoghaire** [1] - 6:28 large [2] - 125:14, 143.15 larger [1] - 103:1 last [27] - 17:16, 18:10, 18:13, 19:1, 20:12, 22:3, 27:18, 28:26, 39:8, 40:9, 43:3, 45:6, 48:18, 49:10, 49:12, 50:12, 59:7, 63:22, 76:3, 82:6, 126:22, 137:11, 148:9, 148:10, 149:9, 169:12, 169:26 late [2] - 9:2, 85:9 latest [1] - 85:26

66:5, 67:23, 68:8,

latter [2] - 86:2, 156:17 law [1] - 112:4 **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29 lay [2] - 33:11, 121.11 learn [1] - 10:20 learned [2] - 52:16, 165:28 least [3] - 55:16, 139:19, 144:3 leave [14] - 22:25, 23:16, 23:17, 29:14, 37:2, 37:9, 47:29, 48:24, 50:25, 50:28, 68:24 111:26 164:21, 165:25 leaves [1] - 139:5 leaving [2] - 13:4, 92.9 led [1] - 42:17 left [6] - 7:15, 37:16, 37:17, 49:6, 79:21, 82:21 legal [6] - 14:9, 15:19, 15:21, 15:22, 71:7, 117:22 Legal [1] - 119:23 legislation [3] -23:12, 63:1, 150:2 **LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13 length [1] - 141:13 lengthy [1] - 105:9 less [3] - 88:17, 118:28, 153:6 **letter** [71] - 47:8, 47:12, 47:21, 49:29, 50:1, 50:6, 51:7, 51:13, 52:5, 53:17, 54:3, 54:6, 56:5, 57:12, 57:17, 58:15, 69:21, 73:1, 73:9, 73:18, 73:23, 75:26, 76:12, 84:15, 85:24, 86:27, 86:28, 88:5, 89:3, 89:23, 93:7, 93:9, 95:3, 96:14, 96:17, 96:20, 96:26, 97:15, 98:13, 98:20, 99:9, 99:10, 106:8, 106:12, 113:16, 114:27, 116:3, 116:9, 116:11, 117:19, 123:4, 123:7, 129:24, 131:11, 131:19, 149:3, 150:6, 150:16, 151:19, 153:12, 154:28, 155:29, 156:6, 156:17, 157:3, 164:5, 164:6, 164:21,

164:28, 167:25 letters [4] - 47:8, 51:7, 69:28, 160:13 level [3] - 21:9, 111:29 153:5 liaise [1] - 55:3 liaising [1] - 23:4 **LIAM** [1] - 3:18 lied [2] - 134:29, 137:18 life [1] - 166:8 light [4] - 10:29, 81:18, 81:29, 151:29 likely [2] - 62:4, 110:17 limited [1] - 28:3 line [11] - 55:2, 70:8, 74:23, 76:3, 150:9, 156:12, 160:7, 160:10, 161:16, 163:14, 167:19 lines [4] - 18:10, 49:12, 168:15 link [1] - 40:14 linked [1] - 164:4 **linking** [1] - 49:8 list [8] - 31:24, 35:12, 55:18, 70:3, 97:6, 111:27, 131:14, 161:28 listen [2] - 19:21, 81:15 litigation [3] -111:23, 113:20, 121:7 **LITTLE** [1] - 3:28 live [2] - 156:10, 156:15 local [5] - 22:28, 23:6, 24:15, 36:14, 111:28 locally [3] - 26:26, 42:27, 52:12 locations [1] - 148:2 lock [1] - 70:1 lodged [1] - 150:21 long-term [1] - 32:20 look [58] - 15:13, 16:20, 19:5, 20:6, 22:19. 26:20. 28:11. 30:8, 30:11, 34:15, 38:1, 38:26, 38:29, 40:6, 42:19, 46:29,

47:7, 51:18, 53:19,

64:14, 66:10, 70:28,

73:29, 75:8, 75:21,

84:16, 86:29, 89:11,

95:24, 101:2, 106:20,

75:22. 76:1. 82:4.

107:15, 111:17,

56:6, 58:18, 63:2,

111:26, 115:22, 124:18, 126:19, 128:5, 137:11, 141:13, 144:17, 145:3, 148:8, 148:13, 148:29, 149:2, 150:16, 153:2, 153:20, 157:5, 159:5, 160:5 looked [5] - 33:3, 53:3, 107:2, 110:16, 114:27 **looking** [7] - 16:4, 51:16, 55:29, 77:8, 87:22, 120:21, 140:20 loose [1] - 137:2 **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 losing [1] - 144:26 loss [4] - 91:20, 99:20, 134:20, 143:1 lost [6] - 90:19, 90:22, 90:26, 99:11, 143:7, 143:10 **LUNCH** [1] - 88:23 **LYONS** [1] - 4:6

#### M

**MADE** [2] - 1:2, 1:7 mail [15] - 26:19, 27:17, 28:8, 37:29, 38:25, 38:28, 44:5, 62:6, 91:25, 95:2, 114:2, 119:9, 144:12, 153:13, 153:21 mails [2] - 40:26, 61:24 **MAIN** [1] - 2:12 main [1] - 137:29 maintain [1] - 141:28 major [2] - 165:25, 166:19 majority [1] - 122:21 Malone [1] - 1:24 MALONE [1] - 1:29 manage [1] - 141:22 managed [1] - 9:22 management [19] -7:1, 9:5, 9:23, 12:11, 22:28, 23:7, 23:16, 24:15, 48:9, 48:22, 55:13, 118:9, 119:7, 139:5. 149:13. 154:16, 156:11, 156:16, 166:3 management's [1] -31.19 manager [8] - 11:23,

12:25, 13:4, 41:23, 118:13 managing [1] -163:20 mandated [1] - 8:18 manifest [1] - 27:9 manner [1] - 13:25 manually [1] -111:26 manuscript [1] -96:20 March [10] - 10:14, 25:5, 35:17, 44:20, 48:12, 48:13, 82:3, 84:20, 158:23, 163:27 Margaret [1] - 39:3 MARGARET[1] -MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17 **MARK**[1] - 3:3 mark [1] - 40:21 Mark [4] - 20:19, 48:11, 135:18, 169:17 marked [3] - 64:1, 87:11, 155:8 **MARRINAN**[1] - 2:7 mass [1] - 56:27 material [2] - 130:10, 130:18 materials [1] -127:27 MATT[1] - 3:19 matter [44] - 11:14, 29:17, 33:11, 39:11, 43:15, 52:25, 59:5, 59:8, 59:12, 59:13, 59:18. 65:19. 65:26. 75:4, 81:9, 81:11, 81:19, 82:9, 82:23, 95:21, 105:16, 107:26, 108:9, 111:21, 112:24, 113:13, 113:17, 113:21, 118:1, 127:11, 130:12, 132:13, 139:24, 140:18, 141:10, 141:15, 145:17, 148:7, 151:8, 164:21, 166:11, 169:4, 169:6 matters [40] - 23:9, 32:1, 32:12, 37:24, 39:12, 39:23, 48:28, 54:8, 66:2, 83:22, 98:9, 99:18, 99:25, 102:14, 102:24, 102:27, 103:2, 106:17, 106:20, 107:1, 112:26, 113:3,

115:27, 116:14,

117:15, 117:23, 117:28, 118:4, 118:25, 122:11, 123:23, 126:25, 127:25, 129:19, 129:27, 132:9, 139:11, 149:1, 157:10, 162:1 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:4 **MATTHIAS**[1] - 2:10 McBrien [8] - 2:16, 135:7, 135:9, 135:22, 135:26, 135:27, 136:1, 136:6 McCabe [2] - 105:6, 105:10 McCARTAN[2] -4:10, 4:11 McCarthy [16] -100:24, 111:9, 113:21, 118:16, 119:27, 128:29, 129:3, 159:9, 159:10. 159:18, 160:18, 160:20, 161:20, 161:29, 162:13, 163:7 McCOURT[1] - 2:17 McDermott [1] -144:12 McGarry [8] - 2:21, 5:7, 145:14, 145:15, 145:17, 145:20, 145:23, 145:25 McGinn [3] - 104:24, 105:8, 124:17 McGinn.. [1] - 124:22 McGRATH[2] - 2:7, 2:28 McGuinness [66] -2:6, 3:24, 5:5, 5:8, 6:4, 6:11, 6:17, 75:21, 75:25, 79:6, 88:9, 88:14, 88:16, 88:17, 88:26, 105:4, 105:14, 105:19, 105:23, 105:28. 106:2. 106:5. 111:6, 111:7, 113:13, 118:29, 125:29, 135:25, 146:21, 146:24, 146:26, 147:2, 147:3, 153:10, 153:11, 153:12, 153:18, 153:20, 162:5, 162:6, 162:10, 162:20, 163:4, 163:9, 163:12, 163:14, 163:16, 164:3, 165:6, 165:19, 165:22, 168:2, 168:4, 168:17, 168:19, 168:23,

11:29, 12:10, 12:16,

168:25, 169:9, 169:12, 169:15, 170:9, 170:12, 170:17, 170:19, 171:8, 171:15 McL[1] - 119:29 McLoughlin [24] -5:3, 6:5, 6:10, 6:14, 6:15, 6:22, 47:26, 48:3, 48:20, 87:5, 103:18, 108:1, 108:23, 111:14, 118:12, 122:8, 126:28, 142:5, 142:13, 145:22, 146:23, 149:11, 170:26, 171:14 MCLOUGHLIN [1] -McLoughlin's [2] -6:18, 171:2 McLYNN [1] - 4:2 MCMAHON[1] - 3:8 McMahon [2] -107:29, 138:17 McPartlin [6] - 119:3, 124:12, 127:9, 132:1, 133:9, 168:27 MCPARTLIN[1] -McPartlin's [1] -133:11 mean [13] - 20:15, 21:27, 25:2, 34:7, 96:5, 101:17, 107:13, 134:2, 162:14, 162:22, 163:2, 168:7, 168:12 means [4] - 17:20, 17:22, 34:2, 34:6 meant [3] - 24:26, 36:19, 104:27 mechanism [4] -12:21, 18:8, 32:19, 39.22 media [3] - 31:4, 40:22, 41:25 mediation [1] - 129:7 Medical [8] - 18:13, 19:10, 25:21, 25:22, 26:16, 32:26, 33:16, 148:3 medical [4] - 23:22, 40:1, 148:23, 153:28 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medium [1] - 32:20 meet [14] - 25:20, 29:26, 30:3, 30:7, 30:10, 58:27, 71:26, 72:5, 72:11, 102:11,

111:9, 132:9, 132:18, 159:21 meeting [71] - 10:13, 10:16, 24:15, 25:5, 28:26, 30:2, 30:9, 30:25, 37:16, 48:25, 48:26, 49:6, 59:1, 59:5, 61:15, 61:20, 61:22, 61:25, 61:27, 77:29, 98:29, 99:17, 101:5, 101:25, 106:15, 107:14, 107:16, 109:19, 111:10, 119:7, 120:13, 120:15, 120:18, 121:17, 121:22, 123:3, 123:8, 124:6, 125:15, 125:22, 126:4, 126:7, 126:8, 126:11, 126:17, 131:28, 134:16, 134:26, 134:29, 135:4, 145:7, 146:28, 147:12, 147:21. 148:4. 148:19, 148:28, 149:16, 149:17, 150:5, 150:24, 157:13, 159:22, 159:25, 166:12, 166:17, 166:28, 168:6, 168:20, 169:12 meetings [8] -107:12. 133:18. 159:20, 159:29, 160:3, 162:12, 166:1, 167:12 member [18] - 12:15, 22:26, 23:1, 23:7, 23:8, 23:19, 23:22, 23:24, 24:16, 35:25, 42:29. 44:26. 62:18. 102:11, 119:23, 132:29, 166:2, 167:1 MEMBER [1] - 2:2 member's [7] -22:25, 22:28, 23:4, 23:6, 23:17, 26:25, 79:22 members [9] - 33:29, 36:13, 36:27, 39:13, 39:19. 139:29. 141:15, 152:25, 170:6 memoranda [1] -154:7 memory [8] - 42:2, 61:20, 78:4, 98:28,

99:14, 99:18, 115:20,

mental [13] - 26:4,

132:6

26:27, 27:14, 34:9, 64:1, 64:4, 85:15, 85:18, 85:22, 87:11, 154:9. 154:19. 155:7 mention [5] - 18:17, 78:17, 79:7, 79:11, 107:5 mentioned [10] -18:17, 20:29, 49:26, 60:21, 69:27, 79:10, 117:12, 124:12, 147:10, 160:24 mere [1] - 102:23 message [2] - 29:14, 79.21 messages [1] -160:12 met [16] - 20:1, 23:7, 44:14, 47:25, 78:3, 84:5, 84:6, 84:7, 84:19, 87:5, 118:12, 130:23, 131:18, 132:26, 134:16, 159:26 Michael [1] - 164:26 MICHAEL [4] - 3:4, 3:5, 3:10, 3:19 Mick [5] - 18:2, 21:3, 30:28, 64:20, 133:7 mid [1] - 90:5 middle [7] - 16:1, 39:27, 78:20, 87:3, 95:26, 114:3, 130:5 midlands [1] -165:26 might [24] - 9:13, 21:7, 21:13, 27:2, 27:3, 49:26, 71:20, 88:10, 96:24, 97:14, 98:28, 107:8, 107:12, 107:15, 107:16, 113:3, 134:13, 143:5, 148:8, 159:6, 160:4, 161:23, 162:21, 170:21 mightn't [1] - 38:24 mind [6] - 43:23, 86:25, 87:24, 105:27, 128:25, 156:2 mindset [1] - 40:19 mine [1] - 125:16 **minimum** [1] - 39:18 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 Minister [24] - 46:23, 47:2, 47:14, 47:21, 50:2, 50:23, 55:22, 58:2, 65:6, 65:10, 72:23, 74:8, 88:2, 88:6, 89:8, 96:18, 97:22, 98:5, 135:17,

137:23, 153:14, 155:1, 156:1, 156:14 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 minor [1] - 145:17 minute [3] - 41:10, 71:5, 112:20 minutes [11] - 28:7, 88:18, 101:19, 119:16, 125:3, 125:11, 125:18, 125:20, 126:1, 134:16 mislaid [2] - 90:19, 90:26 misled [2] - 78:11, 149:26 misrecorded [1] misrecording [3] -90:28, 92:14, 153:28 missed [1] - 125:16 missing [1] - 167:19 mistaken [1] - 52:22 mobile [2] - 19:21, 71:1 model [6] - 104:10, 104:20, 105:3, 109:1, 109:21, 124:17 moment [8] - 8:1, 55:11, 55:15, 78:24, 88:20. 107:18. 142:19, 165:4 money [2] - 143:14, 143:15 Monica [2] - 9:26, 38 29 MONICA [1] - 3:15 month [2] - 143:13, 157:3 monthly [1] - 144:3 months [6] - 48:5, 92:17, 135:15, 151:27, 156:5, 164:10 mooted [1] - 45:21 moreover [1] - 78:22 morning [7] - 6:4, 6:6. 6:8. 31:13. 70:1. 94:6, 94:21 **MORONEY** [1] - 3:18 MORRISSEY [1] most [11] - 50:29, 55:11, 67:27, 75:18, 93:27, 100:3, 113:4, 159:17, 164:19, 166:21, 166:23 mostly [1] - 9:21 motion [1] - 62:2 move [4] - 108:21, 140:11, 151:15, 171:1

moved [2] - 108:18,

112:5 moving [2] - 83:22, 152:9 **Moylan** [1] - 10:7 MR [87] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 4:1, 4:1, 4:6, 4:10, 4:10, 5:5, 5:7, 5:8, 6:4, 6:11, 6:17, 75:21, 75:25, 79:6, 88:9, 88:14, 88:17, 88:26, 105:4, 105:14, 105:19, 105:23, 105:28, 106:2, 106:5, 111:7, 113:13, 118:29, 125:29, 135:25, 142:10, 145:17, 145:20, 145:23, 145:25, 146:24, 146:26, 147:3, 153:11, 153:18, 153:20, 162:6, 162:10, 162:20, 163:4, 163:9, 163:12, 163:14, 163:16, 164:3, 165:6, 165:19, 165:22, 167:28, 168:4, 168:17, 168:19, 168:23. 168:25. 169:9, 169:12, 170:9, 170:12, 171:8, 171:15 MS [21] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 4:1, 4:7, 4:7, 5:6, 142:14, 142:16, 143:25, 144:6, 145:9, 170:16, 170:19. 170:25. 171:10 MULCAHY [1] - 3:5 Mulcahy [4] - 21:16, 21:22, 61:7, 169:29 Mulligan [27] - 7:25, 8:3, 10:6, 12:16, 53:15, 55:5, 55:6, 55:7, 61:16, 62:17, 69:8, 71:6, 71:13, 72:4, 72:19, 73:9, 83:10, 100:17, 108:15, 111:25, 111:27, 120:6, 139:3, 142:10, 142:11, 153:5, 171:6 MULLIGAN [12] -

2:11, 3:13, 5:6,

142:14, 142:16, 143:25, 144:6, 145:9, 170:16, 170:19, 170:25, 171:10 Mulligan's [1] -71:23 Mullingar [1] - 135:6 multifaceted [1] -126:29 multiple [1] - 123:10 Murphy [2] - 22:11, 145:15 MURPHY [2] - 2:30, 3:23 Murray [25] - 10:13, 10:26, 25:6, 25:20, 25:28, 32:2, 35:20, 36:7, 44:19, 48:1, 48:13, 49:10, 49:15, 50:7, 55:17, 73:3, 91:4, 92:21, 117:7, 117:8, 135:20, 135:22, 136:5, 154:17, 164:14 MURRAY [2] - 3:3, Murray's [5] - 25:4, 42:22, 49:25, 73:5, 97:5 must [3] - 41:26, 82:3, 95:8 MICHEAL [1] - 3:23

#### Ν

naivety [1] - 27:10 name [5] - 13:19, 105:25, 115:16, 119:8, 119:19 named [3] - 1:26, 48:10, 55:16 namely [1] - 55:17 naming [2] - 13:17, 117:1 **narrow** [1] - 103:9 nature [5] - 23:6, 25:2, 120:17, 120:25, 121:13 Navan [11] - 9:10, 9:19, 9:25, 19:5, 19:15, 19:16, 28:28, 44:9, 56:10, 64:9, 66:15 navigate [1] - 125:7 near [1] - 39:6 nearly [1] - 26:8 necessarily [14] -12:10, 19:3, 27:13, 31:2, 33:26, 37:9,

146:8, 147:18, 171:13 needed [3] - 21:14, 41:23, 103:14 needs [13] - 39:10, 72:6, 102:18, 106:20, 106:22, 106:23, 107:29, 108:11, 108:17, 112:5, 122:14, 158:17 negatively [1] -154:24 neutral [2] - 106:23, 126:26 **never** [5] - 19:13, 107:14, 133:12, 169:1, 169:4 new [4] - 11:27, 57:2, 89:11, 126:27 newspaper [4] -165:11, 166:25, 167:2, 168:22 next [27] - 17:5, 21:26, 22:22, 27:17, 30:22, 31:8, 37:1, 37:29, 38:12, 39:25, 46:6, 64:22, 66:28, 73:2, 85:24, 99:26, 102:5, 107:18, 116:16, 130:14, 133:24, 134:8, 135:5, 135:11, 136:24, 137:16. 164:4 Niall [1] - 165:12 Nicholas [3] - 22:24, 95:10, 99:25 NICHOLAS [2] -2:10. 4:5 Nick [4] - 28:14, 28:15, 30:16, 165:29 nick [1] - 30:28 Nicky [1] - 18:22 night [3] - 20:12, 143:3, 143:18 **nobody** [1] - 145:2 **NOEL** [1] - 4:10 **NOLAN**[1] - 3:6 Nolan [1] - 75:1 nominate [4] - 76:9, 95:8, 146:10, 146:12 nominated [1] -75:12

60:13, 70:20, 70:22,

77:8, 93:20, 101:27,

need [12] - 42:24,

45:26, 58:11, 60:4,

136:26, 137:10,

95:20, 107:27, 118:6,

necessary [3] - 25:9,

104:29, 152:13

122:11, 158:5

146:3 nominating [1] -126:13 nomination [3] -76:9, 128:28, 155:22 non [3] - 113:10, 124:21, 153:26 non-criminal [1] -113:10 non-processing [1] -153:26 none [1] - 11:19 nonetheless [1] -25:7 Noreen [2] - 135:22, 136:6 **NOREEN** [1] - 2:16 normal [5] - 80:14, 83:29, 84:3, 129:10, 141:18 normally [1] - 114:17 **NORTHUMBERLAN D**[1] - 2:18 NOS [1] - 32:8 **notation** [1] - 125:14 **note** [33] - 15:12, 16:20, 18:10, 18:12, 20:5, 20:11, 21:15, 21:24, 21:26, 21:28, 28:11, 28:12, 30:11, 34:19, 45:24, 46:7, 64:27, 70:28, 71:20, 78:11, 78:12, 78:15, 79:25, 99:29, 100:8, 107:17, 111:19, 144:7, 144:25, 146:28, 157:12, 169:10 noted [5] - 20:8, 34:13, 34:27, 64:29, 112:1 notes [18] - 1:26, 35:2, 58:17, 79:10, 79:11, 79:28, 79:29, 88:20, 90:6, 100:4, 100:6, 100:29, 119:9, 119:15, 119:17, 120:12, 133:4, 133:16 nothing [6] - 35:21, 108:23, 118:17, 134:4, 142:18, 143:28 **notice** [3] - 10:9, 10.11 37.7 notified [2] - 11:13, noting [1] - 17:3 novel [1] - 126:28 November [13] -68:7, 69:8, 70:3,

nominates [1] -

72:24, 128:4, 155:23, 156:2, 156:7, 157:11, 163:21, 163:27, 165:11 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:14, Nugent [12] - 8:4, 39:3, 88:29, 120:8, 120:14, 120:18, 120:21, 121:3, 121:29, 123:20, 167:14, 167:16 number [31] - 15:5, 19:22, 24:10, 29:13, 47:8, 47:22, 55:18, 58:4, 60:24, 63:16, 69:2. 72:27. 72:29. 73:5, 89:10, 94:15, 97:5, 97:23, 97:25, 102:10, 104:15, 105:19, 116:25, 117:13, 121:1, 125:14, 126:29, 133:5, 141:5, 167:11, 169:11 numbers [1] - 21:11 NYLAND[1] - 3:19 **NÍ**[1] - 2:30 **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7 Nóirín [3] - 32:10, 49:12, 55:20 0 **O'BRIEN** [1] - 2:10 O'Brien [1] - 114:12 O'Connor [1] -165:12 O'CONNOR [1] -2.21 O'Higgins [2] -105:16, 124:14 O'HIGGINS [1] - 3:23 O'MARA [1] - 2:17 **O'NEILL** [1] - 4:1 O'Neill [1] - 72:29 O'Neill's [1] - 74:6 O'REARDON[1] -O'Reardon [1] -

67:15 obliged [1] - 54:7 **obvious** [1] - 20:12 **obviously** [54] **-** 7:9, 8:5, 8:17, 10:12, 10:20, 12:4, 13:29, 14:20, 21:18, 25:21, 25:27, 27:8, 27:18, 31:6. 33:9. 35:10. 37:22, 44:19, 51:11, 60:7, 63:24, 65:6, 65:25, 68:5, 68:15, 69:2, 69:17, 69:21, 70:8, 72:27, 81:9, 81:22, 81:24, 83:12, 85:9, 99:9, 102:26, 103:20. 104:19. 104:23, 105:20, 106:12, 120:15, 125:8, 125:13, 126:9, 133:2, 135:3, 140:7, 140:17, 159:3, 160:23, 166:14, 166:15 occasion [4] - 16:15, 67:22, 95:24, 171:14 occasions [7] -11:10, 11:12, 24:7, 58:4, 94:15, 148:1, 159:27 Occupational [1] occur [2] - 33:25, 82:28 occurred [1] -166:12 occurrence [1] -79:26 October [24] - 64:9, 64:19, 70:3, 86:7, 95:22, 99:4, 106:7, 114:9, 114:25, 115:22, 116:20, 119:1, 130:28, 151:19, 151:28, 152:29, 155:21, 156:6, 156:18, 157:1, 159:23, 159:25, 165:9, 168:20 odd [1] - 16:15 **OF** [13] - 1:2, 1:8,

**O'ROURKE** [1] - 4:7 32:10, 49:12, 55:20 O'SULLIVAN [1] -

1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2,

3:15, 142:7, 145:12,

146:19, 170:14

of.. [1] - 167:17

offer [3] - 72:7,

offered [3] - 51:3,

offering [3] - 26:13,

72:13, 147:29

72:5, 72:17

120:3

3:7

15:29

O'Sullivan [3] -

objectives [1] -

obligations [1] -

71:1, 72:8 office [38] - 7:5, 11:8, 15:26, 16:5, 16:15, 24:8, 24:9, 48:13, 61:23, 61:28, 65:17, 73:13, 73:27, 74:1, 75:7, 77:17, 77:19, 87:14, 88:2, 89:2, 89:4, 93:25, 96:7, 99:1, 100:20, 100:23, 101:15, 117:21, 117:22, 117:23, 118:9, 118:11, 120:3, 127:12, 135:6, 135:19, 141:8, 153:13 **OFFICE** [1] - 3:27 officer [24] - 7:29. 18:5, 21:4, 35:23, 36:15, 44:22, 47:5, 48:12, 82:25, 84:10, 88:28, 93:13, 103:11, 114:25, 116:7, 138:14, 139:2, 139:4, 141:7, 146:13, 146:15, 158:9, 166:4, 167:14 Officer [8] - 18:14, 19:10, 25:21, 25:22, 26:16, 32:26, 33:17, 148:3 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, officers [3] - 44:24, 91:9, 165:26 offices [3] - 24:11, 135:20, 169:17 official [3] - 85:26, 125:3, 153:27 officially [2] - 92:19, 164:12 often [2] - 12:12, 36:13 Oghuvbu [10] -14:22, 17:13, 17:15, 22:4, 22:7, 35:1, 50:9, 52:19, 52:21, 134:16 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 OHD [3] - 23:4, 23:24, 23:25 **old** [1] - 110:14 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12, 4:1 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [8] - 13:8, 15:2, 16:16, 29:20, 139:5, 148:2, 148:22, 156:9 one [64] - 12:15, 14:13, 15:29, 16:5, 18:4, 20:28, 22:3, 24:24, 27:14, 28:27,

29:4, 29:5, 32:15, 35:4, 35:27, 37:18, 37:19, 38:9, 41:10, 41:27, 48:22, 49:27, 55:16, 56:26, 58:12, 62:25, 69:28, 88:5, 92:17, 92:20, 93:26, 98:24, 98:26, 105:12, 123:18, 123:19, 125:16, 130:8, 133:24, 135:15, 135:29, 137:3, 137:4, 141:2, 141:25, 141:26, 145:17, 145:27, 147:23, 149:18, 150:11, 150:14, 152:27, 159:20, 162:16, 164:10, 165:4, 166:2, 166:19, 169:6, 170:20 onerous [1] - 141:25 ones [1] - 152:26 ongoing [7] - 14:16, 75:1, 153:25, 156:10, 156:15, 159:13, 162:13 onus [2] - 36:1, 44:21 onwards [4] - 12:24, 86:8, 98:13, 131:9 **open** [3] - 31:6, 42:24, 98:14 opened [4] - 101:8, 149:3, 151:20, 164:6 operation [1] - 63:27 operations [1] -113:7 opinion [3] - 63:5, 140:1, 166:16 opportunity [2] -18:26, 39:29 opposed [1] - 110:11 opting [1] - 129:6 option [1] - 45:5 or.. [1] - 31:12 orchestrate [1] -32.29 order [5] - 56:11, 66:16, 77:23, 91:28, 91:29 ordinarily [3] - 26:5,

76:11, 86:3

23:14, 91:2

ordinary [3] - 22:27,

organisation [18] -

11:23, 12:13, 12:18,

13:8, 14:10, 15:24,

16:3, 25:1, 33:28,

39:15, 41:24, 42:6,

42:7, 62:24, 108:24,

127:1, 140:15, 141:29 organisational [1] -127:13 ORLA [1] - 3:20 Orla [1] - 124:12 OSMOND [1] - 3:27 OTHER [1] - 1:3 otherwise [7] - 12:8, 12:26, 53:10, 65:15, 75:16, 129:18, 165:3 ought [3] - 35:24, 65:8, 126:1 ourselves [3] -12:27, 29:24, 99:24 outcome [7] - 38:5, 48:26, 61:13, 123:4, 126:3, 126:8, 126:11 outline [5] - 6:23, 13:18, 71:15, 106:28, 132.10 outlined [6] - 31:24, 61:28, 62:17, 80:29, 117:16, 120:14 outlines [12] - 68:17, 101:12, 102:12, 102:17, 103:17, 104:3, 104:16, 106:19, 106:22, 107:28, 108:10, 123:5 outlining [3] - 26:11, 50:9, 124:28 outside [10] - 9:17, 43:17, 45:6, 45:19, 56:25, 77:7, 98:7, 113:5, 139:6, 144:17 outstanding [4] -65:21, 66:2, 122:1, 122:2 overnight [1] - 26:27 oversee [2] - 13:24, 47.27 overseen [1] - 56:24 oversight [2] - 13:20, 79:9 overtime [1] - 142:27 overview [3] - 61:7, 61:10, 120:28 owed [1] - 64:18 own [22] - 17:18, 17:22, 29:22, 29:23, 30:15, 39:10, 41:12, 45:3, 45:18, 54:19, 63:7, 78:27, 79:1, 87:24, 100:8, 100:23, 125:20, 140:4, 140:9, 141.22 owner [1] - 69:16

Ρ pace [2] - 108:20, 141:12 **PAGE** [1] - 5:2 page [128] - 6:19, 6:21, 15:13, 16:21, 20:6, 22:19, 22:22, 26:20, 27:17, 38:12, 38:29, 39:1, 39:5, 39:27, 40:7, 42:19, 43:2, 45:24, 46:8, 47:1, 47:7, 47:11, 47:12, 47:21, 49:9, 50:2, 50:6, 50:8, 50:11, 50:12, 51:18, 52:7, 53:19, 57:8, 58:18, 60:1, 60:2, 62:8, 63:20, 64:14, 66:10, 67:2, 68:2, 69:12, 70:28, 73:1, 73:2. 73:29. 74:12. 74:19, 75:8, 78:16, 78:20, 79:14, 80:20, 80:24, 82:4, 83:20, 84:17, 85:13, 85:23, 85:24, 87:1, 87:3, 87:19, 89:11, 89:23, 93:28, 93:29, 95:3, 96:13, 96:17, 96:21, 98:13, 99:10, 101:5, 106:12, 107:18, 107:23, 112:16, 114:2, 114:4, 114:8, 114:10, 115:5, 115:6, 115:23, 116:9, 116:16, 119:17, 121:16, 125:5, 125:10. 126:19. 128:5, 129:3, 129:29, 130:2, 130:4, 130:5, 133:4, 135:5, 136:24, 136:26, 137:11, 144:7, 145:25, 147:20, 148:11, 149:7, 153:21, 154:27, 155:3, 155:4, 156:10, 160:4, 160:5, 160:6, 161:26, 163:9, 164:7, 169:13, 170:22 pages [3] - 35:4, 50:8, 89:7 paid [5] - 23:19, 64:18, 86:14, 136:9, 153:3 panoply [1] - 126:25 papers [6] - 6:19,

95:17, 96:3, 111:18,

paperwork [1] -

128:16, 140:1

114:13 paragraph [36] -39:8, 40:10, 43:3, 45:6, 47:23, 48:18, 49:10, 55:2, 55:9, 56:7, 56:16, 66:12, 74:4, 76:2, 82:6, 89:12, 89:23, 90:28, 90:29, 95:4, 95:27, 96:28, 97:2, 97:12, 97:15, 97:23, 98:5, 98:8, 102:6, 126:22, 148:12, 149:9, 153:21, 155:4, 164:8, 165:19 paragraphs [2] -96:25, 154:4 parallel [2] - 123:11, 162:12 pardon [6] - 57:20, 99:8, 109:3, 122:27, 148:21, 150:28 part [14] - 8:28, 25:23, 25:24, 94:17, 99:19, 117:26, 129:10, 130:8, 130:9, 131:13, 131:14, 163:26, 165:16, 168:8 participated [1] -69:5 particular [13] - 9:13, 13:1, 13:5, 34:7, 37:3, 55:15, 71:14, 93:9, 118:19, 142:21, 152:12, 161:15, 163:24 particularly [9] -41:4, 41:19, 53:4, 71:12, 93:3, 107:5, 128:25, 141:20, 145:6 parties [5] - 60:28, 68:22, 82:18, 84:7, 98.14 parts [1] - 70:10 party [2] - 65:8, 81:15 passage [1] - 157:6 PASSED[1] - 1:4 passed [4] - 32:25, 33:16, 68:27, 70:3 past [6] - 32:17, 34:7, 60:21, 63:17, 110:26, 132:28 Pat [6] - 48:1, 48:13, 55:17, 135:20, 135:22, 136:5 patient [1] - 19:9 Patrick [1] - 73:3 PATRICK[4] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:28, 3:3

owners [1] - 44:7

patterns [1] - 22:29 PAUL [3] - 2:16, 2:21, 4:1 pay [66] - 9:5, 9:9, 9:17, 12:7, 18:17, 23:21, 29:6, 33:18, 37:18, 39:12, 39:18, 39:22, 40:13, 40:15, 41:15, 41:18, 42:6, 50:10, 50:28, 54:3, 56:10, 56:14, 60:6, 61:25, 61:26, 62:3, 62:19, 63:4, 63:13, 64:16, 66:15, 71:12, 74:21, 86:2, 86:7, 86:13, 91:8, 91:12, 91:22, 91:27, 91:28, 92:15, 97:26, 97:29, 99:19, 112:28, 118:1, 130:3, 142:24, 142:25, 142:28, 144:8, 144:15, 148:7, 148:14, 148:15, 149:18, 149:19, 151:15, 152:9, 152:11, 152:15, 152:28, 153:29, 154:24, 155:9 payable [1] - 86:3 payment [2] - 86:1, 132:16 payments [1] - 136:8 payroll [8] - 66:6, 66:17, 67:9, 86:19, 86:24, 116:13, 148:29, 154:26 PD [8] - 12:22, 13:16, 13:18, 41:23, 62:29, 94:8, 120:22, 120:25 **PEGGY** [1] - 4:7 penalisation [3] -41:19, 41:21, 63:2 penalised [1] - 50:26 People [2] - 52:26, 109:9 **PEOPLE** [1] - 3:16 people [22] - 12:22, 12:26, 16:1, 33:28, 41:8, 41:11, 41:14, 41:18, 42:8, 42:14, 62:25, 68:29, 69:18, 104:4, 113:28, 120:26, 125:15, 125:25, 135:21, 140:5, 141:19, 148:23 per [5] - 12:10, 15:21, 28:22, 102:18, 148:7 percent [2] - 66:1, 71:18

perception [2] -148:20, 148:22 perform [2] - 13:29, 92.5 perhaps [19] - 8:11. 16:7, 16:20, 22:21, 30:11, 41:13, 56:6, 61:9, 70:28, 71:29, 73:29, 75:21, 78:11. 78:18, 115:4, 119:12, 148:29, 159:12, 160:4 period [12] - 9:28, 21:18. 23:18. 31:12. 61:15, 68:10, 85:9. 86:7, 139:9, 139:22, 155:24, 157:11 peripheral [1] - 77:1 permission [3] -43:16, 55:3, 56:3 persistence [1] -42:16 persistent [1] - 91:2 persistently [1] -154:7 person [13] - 13:26. 30:3, 30:4, 30:7, 69:15, 76:26, 95:7, 99:18, 106:19, 115:16, 125:16, 132:19, 146:10 personal [1] - 39:19 personnel [1] -116:22 persons [2] - 55:16, 76:21 perspective [20] -12:12, 14:11, 25:12, 25:14, 41:5, 41:8, 44:12, 44:16, 54:26, 66:2, 67:25, 67:26, 93:3, 113:4, 123:13, 140:9, 150:13, 164:19, 164:20 pertaining [2] -99:25, 139:11 perusal [1] - 130:9 Peter [2] - 119:21, 119:22 **PETER** [2] - 2:5, 3:13 phase [2] - 88:10, 130:14 phone [14] - 15:5, 15:17, 21:11, 30:5,

64:22, 66:24, 66:26,

79:8, 99:17, 150:27,

phoned [6] - 58:15,

59:17, 77:26, 99:2,

99:5, 151:7

70:13, 71:1, 72:1,

151.1

phoning [1] - 28:8 phrase [2] - 17:5, 147:15 **physical** [1] - 34:7 picture [1] - 111:4 **piece** [6] - 18:3, 63:22, 99:21, 121:4, 121:5, 160:8 pieces [2] - 13:23, 142:29 piping [1] - 127:2 place [8] - 18:8, 20:2, 43:24, 43:27, 44:21, 62:5, 100:15, 147:28 **PLACE** [1] - 4:8 placed [3] - 9:19, 92:19. 164:12 planned [1] - 99:26 play [3] - 8:28, 150:3, 150:12 point [35] - 8:9, 14:18, 25:11, 35:16, 37:3, 38:22, 40:9, 40:12, 42:25, 44:1, 44:4, 53:9, 54:17, 56:23, 59:15, 61:13, 68:24, 85:3, 85:6, 86:8, 87:22, 88:3, 90:5, 101:18, 109:10, 109:18, 113:2, 115:10, 118:2, 122:22, 129:10, 131:28, 140:20, 158:13, 169:20 pointed [1] - 134:27 pointless [2] - 45:10, 45:14 points [4] - 74:23, 95:4, 104:15, 133:5 **police** [1] - 91:9 policies [2] - 63:7, 107:2 Policing [9] - 49:18, 55:23, 57:2, 89:9, 97.7 97.14 97.17 117:15, 117:18 policing [1] - 47:3 policy [29] - 13:1, 13:9, 35:27, 36:3, 36:11, 36:13, 36:19, 44:7, 53:1, 56:20, 60:17, 65:15, 66:22, 67:17, 68:17, 70:9, 70:10, 76:11, 76:26, 94:13, 95:8, 97:17, 102:14, 103:10, 104:9, 141:27, 152:8, 158:3, 158:6 policyholder [1] -33:26

political [1] - 118:10 port [1] - 14:13 portal [1] - 36:3 portfolio [3] - 7:15, 114:23, 141:22 portfolios [1] - 7:13 portion [2] - 58:12, 142:27 portions [2] - 98:15, 98:17 position [26] - 16:12, 22:17, 26:21, 33:5, 36:19, 50:24, 63:28, 65:12, 68:8, 73:6, 76:8, 81:29, 82:11, 87:18, 90:4, 93:15, 95:6, 97:5, 97:7, 100:12, 124:25, 124:26, 144:13, 170:21, 171:2, 171:4 possibilities [1] -33:3 possibility [5] -32:13, 71:26, 133:1, 138:2, 138:7 possible [13] - 21:6, 24:29, 25:15, 29:9, 43:6, 68:17, 73:16, 77:7. 81:1. 81:21. 83:11, 122:9, 132:24 possibly [3] - 20:18, 21:10, 134:14 **posted** [1] - 57:13 potential [2] - 26:13, 143.1 potentially [1] - 78:5 POWER [1] - 4:10 power [2] - 47:2, 140:14 power's [2] - 50:1, 51:6 practice [1] - 26:8 preceded [1] - 71:16 precedent [2] -62:24, 121:18 precipitate [1] -24:26 preclude [1] - 108:24 preclusions [1] -123:18 prefer [1] - 21:6 preferred [2] - 92:22, 164:15 premium [1] - 143:17 prepared [5] - 61:7, 84:22, 95:20, 130:25, 159:10

present [4] - 93:15,

105:27, 137:2, 137:3

presented [1] - 62:16

presenting [1] -165:25 presently [1] - 51:1 presents [1] - 39:29 PRESIDENT[2] -1.13 2.3 pressing [1] - 137:25 presumably [7] -10:16, 36:3, 38:8, 38:18, 65:12, 109:29, 140:23 presume [4] - 16:28, 54:10, 55:19, 144:10 previous [11] - 15:8, 24:20, 28:27, 42:22, 82:15, 91:25, 102:19, 103:20, 117:10, 127:24, 152:25 previously [12] -10:1, 31:1, 35:14, 48:6, 52:18, 121:2, 121:14, 127:3, 132:13, 132:22, 139:17, 164:6 primarily [4] - 14:11, 21:8, 51:24, 98:26 primary [5] - 12:17, 32:18, 83:21, 118:2, 121:4 principal [1] - 47:5 private [4] - 23:29, 46:26, 51:19, 60:25 problem [8] - 20:19, 40:17, 79:3, 106:4, 107:11, 112:4, 127:5, problems [1] - 161:3 procedure [6] - 23:5, 24:14, 33:21, 49:19, 89:18, 148:16 procedures [2] -89:28, 158:8 proceed [7] - 113:18, 116:19, 117:4, 117:16, 121:21, 122:10, 127:20 proceeding [2] -54:27, 124:26 proceedings [1] -122:14 proceeds [1] - 93:5 process [15] - 24:2, 56:24, 62:3, 71:6, 90:1, 90:4, 90:19, 104:26, 106:23, 116:22, 124:5, 127:10, 152:7, 159:15, 163:27 processes [1] -158:8

processing [1] -153:26 produce [1] - 110:6 produced [3] -112:10, 124:27, 125:3 professional [1] professionalism [1] - 118:11 professionally [1] -50:27 proffered [1] -107:16 programme [1] -46:16 progress [14] -19:27, 55:14, 56:11, 66:16, 83:10, 83:25, 95:6, 95:15, 98:6, 113:24. 118:25. 129:19, 129:27, 151:13 progressed [4] -83:14, 83:28, 98:28 progressing [3] -68:25, 93:1, 95:28 progression [1] -79:23 progressively [1] -51:25 project [1] - 134:12 prolongation [1] promoted [6] - 6:29, 7:3, 7:6, 137:18, 137:19, 137:20 promotion [13] -6:27, 7:7, 49:9, 49:16, 49:19, 49:24, 55:18, 55:20, 73:6, 92:20, 97:6, 164:13 promotions [2] -56:23, 56:24 **prompt** [1] - 44:5 proposal [4] - 72:15, 107:10, 119:12, 167:24 propose [2] - 76:9, 168:10 proposed [4] -108:10, 113:17, 113:23, 167:16 proposing [3] -103:6, 103:7, 103:29 proposition [1] -38:19 prosecute [1] - 21:19 prosecution [2] -94:9, 104:17

Prosecutions [3] -

47:14, 106:28, 107:1
protect [1] - 32:12
protected [28] - 8:24,
11:16, 11:21, 11:23,
11:28, 12:6, 12:9,
12:11, 12:16, 12:17,
12:25, 12:26, 13:4,
41:4, 47:27, 51:4,
59:4, 74:10, 92:22,
104:5, 110:19,
118:13, 121:5,
121:11, 150:1,
152:22, 155:10,
164:15
Protected [4] - 8:6,

164:15
Protected [4] - 8:6,
8:16, 54:14, 63:10
PROTECTED [2] 1:2, 1:3
protections [2] -

protections [2] -23:11, 51:3 proved [1] - 21:13 proven [1] - 40:13 provide [8] - 13:26, 34:27, 51:25, 73:21, 73:22, 74:5, 98:17, 107:29

provided [12] 19:18, 43:9, 49:29,
61:3, 64:3, 76:15,
79:23, 84:21, 111:18,
131:5, 142:21, 158:7
provides [1] - 170:25
providing [1] - 51:8
provision [1] - 97:24

provisions [1] -23:16 Public [3] - 47:14, 106:27, 106:29 public [7] - 23:16,

public [7] - 23:16, 41:27, 72:28, 104:17, 122:3, 122:5, 168:5 publicly [1] - 42:7 pull [1] - 111:18 pulling [2] - 14:12, 15:26

**pure** [2] - 137:13, 137:14

purely [1] - 141:10 purpose [7] - 30:2, 61:18, 70:5, 93:19, 99:24, 128:24, 131:28 pursuant [1] - 54:14 pursue [2] - 48:28,

134:25 **pursued** [5] - 49:3, 56:9, 66:14, 138:9,

139:20 **pursuing** [3] - 83:15, 115:23, 134:22 **pushing** [1] - 137:4 put [10] - 20:2, 37:7,
48:4, 56:13, 74:16,
79:26, 86:18, 154:25,
155:17, 162:6
putting [1] - 86:23

#### Q

quarterly [1] - 10:4 QUAY [3] - 2:24, 2:31, 4:12 queried [1] - 25:6 queries [1] - 116:11 query [3] - 10:27, 80:15, 137:27 questions [6] -19:12, 63:17, 63:21, 142:17, 142:19, 145:9 quicker [2] - 21:13, 68:20 quickly [4] - 68:11, 68:17, 77:7, 135:22 **QUINN** [1] - 3:10 Quinn [21] - 18:2. 18:9, 21:3, 21:6, 21:9, 22:11, 28:8, 28:14, 28:27, 29:9, 29:16, 29:25, 29:27, 46:5, 64:20, 78:10, 78:13, 78:14, 79:12, 79:15, 80.6 quite [12] - 21:23, 31:6, 34:11, 34:12, 41:9, 99:16, 103:9,

R

quotation [1] - 49:11

129:15, 141:5, 165:7

103:11, 119:19,

raft [1] - 31:17 raise [1] - 170:23 raised [29] - 10:15, 19:28, 23:10, 29:9, 54:8, 58:1, 69:24, 73:1, 73:23, 81:25, 82:23, 85:20, 88:5, 96:25, 97:15, 97:22, 98:11, 100:12, 102:13, 102:15, 102:23, 114:26, 116:11, 117:18, 130:11, 134:26, 139:15, 139:17 raises [4] - 73:4, 85:13, 86:28, 90:17 raising [5] - 39:4, 40:25, 42:16, 89:10, 144:26

rang [5] - 16:17, 19:24, 29:13, 58:21, 72:4 rank [7] - 7:28, 13:14, 35:23, 55:18, 76:27, 158:4, 158:18 ranking [1] - 7:29 ranks [1] - 48:7 rate [14] - 23:19, 86:2, 86:7, 86:13, 91:22, 91:23, 91:28, 142:23, 142:25, 142:26, 142:28, 143:4, 143:5, 155:9 rather [6] - 16:3, 21:1, 30:5, 78:13, 93:19, 110:29 rationale [3] - 38:23, 41:29, 61:29

re [4] - 28:14, 54:18, 170:17, 170:20 re-examination [2] - 170:17, 170:20 reached [1] - 116:20 read [11] - 16:23, 30:15, 89:22, 148:12,

read [11] - 16:23, 30:15, 89:22, 148:12, 151:6, 156:12, 165:7, 165:16, 168:14, 168:15 ready [1] - 35:6 real [1] - 141:28

real [1] - 141:28 really [8] - 18:3, 44:17, 45:3, 59:10, 70:15, 82:8, 114:8, 163:1 Reardon [1] - 120:3

reason [17] - 120:3 reason [17] - 12:5, 21:8, 21:21, 27:7, 28:15, 28:17, 28:19, 31:11, 38:23, 40:14, 41:28, 86:10, 86:25, 97:28, 100:6, 102:2, 102:4

reasonable [2] 38:23, 45:7
reasons [8] - 26:13,
32:15, 44:15, 62:18,
103:29, 104:1,
147:23, 153:28
reassure [1] - 168:10
receipt [10] - 23:13,
23:21, 67:7, 69:27,
71:5, 84:26, 86:7,
130:13, 131:19, 150:5

70:13, 75:24, 93:12 **received** [34] - 20:11, 22:19, 26:19, 39:25, 46:22, 47:10, 48:6,

48:21, 57:7, 57:14,

receive [4] - 47:9,

57:17, 57:19, 58:8, 58:15, 60:17, 60:27, 61:1, 61:5, 67:2, 76:13, 77:29, 84:1, 85:5, 85:11, 87:10, 89:3, 102:9, 128:11, 128:16, 128:27, 130:8, 130:18, 131:7, 149:12

recent[3] - 63:17, 166:2, 167:12

recently [4] - 47:26, 47:28, 121:21, 128:16

47:28, 121:21, 128:16
recipient [3] - 8:17,
12:17, 13:7
recipients [1] 164:27

recite [1] - 56:2 recites [1] - 50:6 recollect [5] - 21:21, 61:22, 94:20, 94:26, 103:25

recollection [3] -79:28, 81:6, 125:22 recommend [2] -43:16, 68:2

recommendation [4] - 9:15, 39:21, 63:12, 64:12

recommendations [4] - 61:27, 61:28, 61:29, 62:2

recommended [1] - 55:19

recommending [1] - 103:5 record [19] - 10:29, 17:3, 21:1, 27:4, 33:9, 23:49, 27:20, 47:20

33:18, 37:20, 47:29, 52:27, 53:23, 79:26, 87:6, 87:17, 87:26, 103:15, 147:19, 150:20, 150:24, 160:2 recorded [19] - 10:18, 10:21, 20:27,

10:18, 10:21, 20:27, 22:27, 23:15, 27:3, 27:21, 27:27, 35:2, 47:29, 64:6, 64:7, 85:15, 85:18, 85:22, 102:7, 133:15, 137:12, 162:27

recording [1] - 18:17 records [4] - 26:25, 81:3, 106:5, 130:4 recovery [1] - 29:23 recurring [1] - 127:4

recurring [1] - 127:4 REDDY [1] - 4:8 reduce [1] - 40:15 reduced [6] - 39:12,

39:22, 40:13, 41:18, 92:15, 153:29 reduction [3] -41:15, 41:21, 63:3 refer [9] - 25:21, 46:7, 66:7, 90:6, 146:27, 147:18, 148:9, 165:16, 169:6 reference [40] -17:14, 41:25, 42:3, 49:11, 58:21, 58:26, 59:4, 70:25, 71:19, 91:25, 91:26, 92:11, 94:25, 103:10, 106:12, 110:25, 114:26, 115:3, 121:8, 121:10, 121:12, 121:22, 122:2, 122:5, 123:8, 123:12, 130:21, 133:16, 133:25, 134:3, 134:11, 134:19, 134:27, 135:5, 136:16, 136:19, 136:21, 137:22, 147:19, 162:2 referenced [5] -42:5, 53:5, 79:16, 121:16, 122:13 references [1] -136:23 referencing [1] referral [3] - 8:12, 11:3. 26:2 referred [15] - 10:28, 15:7, 25:8, 25:10, 35:18, 36:8, 46:25, 99:10, 101:1, 107:14, 165:7, 165:9, 169:13, 169:14, 169:25 referring [2] - 38:8, 109:4 refers [13] - 24:14, 25:29. 47:8. 47:22. 48:16, 48:24, 49:7, 50:9, 50:10, 50:11, 118:2, 122:18, 165:12 reflect [4] - 26:26, 27:6, 56:13, 65:14 reflected [3] - 17:9, 27:11, 28:20 reflecting [1] - 16:29 reflection [1] -118:21 refused [1] - 129:9 regard [11] - 23:12, 25:8, 35:23, 48:25, 51:29, 56:23, 113:25, 116:27, 148:27,

149:27, 156:17 regarded [2] - 14:25, 35:20 regarding [7] -16:12, 22:29, 57:23. 58:3, 67:11, 74:5, 93:15 regardless [1] -32:23 region [1] - 84:25 Region [7] - 23:11, 75:27, 130:8, 130:17, 130:24, 130:29, 161:3 REGISTRAR [1] - 2:5 regular [2] - 10:4, 13:26 regularly [2] - 11:13, 16:3 regulations [18] -8:19. 23:17. 23:23. 25:17, 26:15, 34:6, 38:5, 38:8, 41:10, 41:12, 42:13, 42:14, 63:4, 63:25, 141:7, 149:23, 152:10, 152:15 Rehabilitation [1] -23:20 reinstated [2] -64:16, 152:28 reinstatement [2] -152:9, 152:11 relate [1] - 80:5 related [59] - 9:4, 10:15. 10:23. 17:2. 17:24, 21:2, 22:26, 24:18, 24:26, 25:17, 26:1, 26:6, 26:12, 27:8, 27:12, 27:13, 27:25, 28:17, 28:20, 31:10, 31:21, 33:21, 34:1, 38:5, 39:4, 40:14, 43:8, 43:14, 44:6, 44:13, 48:2, 50:26, 51:1, 58:10, 62:28, 64:5, 85:29, 86:4, 86:14, 86:22, 87:12, 91:3, 91:10, 91:14, 94:16, 96:28, 97:2, 97:5, 97:19, 97:25. 98:5. 98:8. 134:19, 134:28, 147:8, 148:16, 148:22, 154:15, 155:8 relates [3] - 54:11, 90:29, 142:27 relating [5] - 15:9, 25:4, 115:23, 117:15, 119:9 relation [91] - 8:12,

8:15, 10:5, 10:6, 10:8, 11:11, 11:18, 12:7, 14:3, 17:15, 19:6, 22:16, 24:5, 35:21, 36:26, 37:19, 37:20, 42:14, 44:3, 44:5, 44:12, 44:28, 49:19, 51:16, 51:27, 53:29, 54:10, 54:29, 55:16, 55:28, 56:20, 57:7, 57:13, 57:22, 60:6, 61:25, 63:27, 65:1, 65:6, 65:26, 67:18, 70:17, 70:26, 72:3, 74:10, 74:15, 74:21, 77:4, 77:9, 81:16, 82:22, 83:21, 87:22, 92:11, 97:7, 98:17, 103:12, 113:7, 117:7, 117:9, 127:25, 129:5, 130:3, 130:29, 132:8, 138:25, 139:14, 139:23, 139:24, 142:23, 145:26, 148:4. 149:19. 150:15, 152:3, 152:21, 155:14, 156:3, 157:28, 159:15, 159:23, 160:8, 160:22, 161:11, 163:6, 164:3, 164:27, 167:1, 168:19. 168:25 relationship [2] -18:9, 118:14 relative [5] - 61:26, 62:27, 80:2, 120:19, 150:13 relatively [1] -144:27 relay [1] - 100:9 relayed [3] - 17:26, 78:10. 99:9 relays [1] - 144:13 released [1] - 54:28 relentless [1] - 48:4 relevance [2] -167:29, 168:2 relevant [9] - 23:11, 55:23, 56:23, 67:13, 82:21, 107:2, 162:1, 168:5, 168:12 relied [1] - 100:3 reluctant [3] - 36:13, 42:29, 134:6 relying [3] - 44:19, 100:7, 100:9 remain [1] - 95:20 remains [2] - 23:21, 122:1

remark [1] - 92:25 remember [9] -21:23, 21:24, 42:2, 46:10, 52:20, 52:22, 79:29, 89:5, 135:8 reminders [2] - 10:6, 114:8 reminding [1] -36:10 remit [3] - 9:9, 13:10, remove [2] - 81:23, 82:17 Remuneration [1] -23:20 repeat [3] - 28:25. 57:18, 163:22 repeated [1] - 95:10 replied [7] - 37:23, 40:6, 40:29, 53:16, 69:8, 93:28, 95:2 reply [7] - 38:11, 39:25, 54:6, 71:13, 93:24, 93:29, 115:9 report [60] - 8:3, 10:8. 10:9. 14:21. 17:13, 17:14, 23:25, 25:25, 25:28, 26:11, 26:14, 27:16, 28:25, 28:26, 42:18, 43:3, 43:20, 46:23, 50:20, 51:26, 51:28, 52:6, 52:7, 52:10, 53:2, 55:29, 60:1, 60:25, 61:6, 72:2, 73:26, 74:6, 74:16, 74:21, 74:22, 80:11, 80:14, 80:23, 83:24, 84:8, 84:9, 84:26, 87:10, 93:21, 95:24, 102:22, 105:7, 105:9, 114:26, 118:10, 123:10, 130:9, 130:14, 130:24, 130:28, 138:20, 140:17, 160:24, 165:11, 168:22 reported [9] - 44:20, 57:24, 60:5, 60:7, 63:17, 67:13, 74:12, 119:5. 140:22 reporting [2] - 25:29, 138:29 reports [21] - 8:3, 8.27 9.27 10.4 18:14, 18:28, 19:2, 22:4, 22:8, 24:10, 42:22, 42:24, 74:2,

74:7, 93:27, 97:24,

121:1, 137:22,

137:25, 168:6 represent [1] - 101:1 representing [2] -101:23, 140:15 represents [3] -41:1, 62:12, 102:5 request [17] - 15:22, 16:14, 24:10, 46:22, 47:1, 50:19, 51:9, 51:25, 53:3, 73:25, 74:7, 87:9, 93:21, 93:28, 95:10, 127:24, 127:29 requested 181 -28:14, 54:12, 73:14, 73:21, 74:2, 114:24, 117:25, 120:17 requests [2] - 77:18, 96:21 require [2] - 16:11, 107:8 required [8] - 19:21, 25:17, 40:19, 52:11, 70:25, 74:3, 93:14, 107.8 requirement [2] -43:12, 129:11 requires [4] - 39:21, 121:25, 124:5, 146:3 residential [1] -46:12 resigned [1] - 119:24 resolution [1] -76:26 RESOLUTIONS [1] resolutions [1] -39:15 resolve [3] - 20:3, 28:29, 129:6 resolved [4] - 32:2, 39:13, 106:10, 126:29 resolving [1] - 36:24 Resources [3] -52:26, 109:9, 167:13 RESOURCES [1] respect [8] - 51:17, 56:1, 79:24, 101:13, 102:12, 111:25, 116:19, 126:24 respects [1] - 47:22 respond [1] - 65:12 responded [1] -84:16 responds [1] response [10] - 51:8,

60:24, 67:23, 69:9,

69:12, 73:21, 73:22,

102:22 166:26 139:14, 150:17, 12:11, 12:17, 13:4, sergeants [1] - 48:8 160:15 13:6, 15:2, 15:25, scheduled [3] seek [7] - 9:12, 71:7, series [2] - 96:21, responsibilities [1] -32:18, 56:27, 70:8, 23:24, 59:1, 95:22 108:1, 115:1, 129:18, 166:1 83:21, 138:10, 139:6, 158:8 11:17 scheme [1] - 157:27 serve [1] - 7:24 responsibility [13] seeking [13] - 51:21, served [2] - 7:21, **scope** [1] - 112:19 roles [1] - 15:25 60:6, 70:14, 70:19, 8:13, 9:7, 11:20, scoping [2] - 167:21, 7.22 13:13, 13:15, 13:23, room [1] - 105:26 70:22, 75:3, 77:10, 168.28 serves [2] - 78:4, 16:6, 36:23, 51:8, route [3] - 109:13, screen [3] - 39:1, 80:21, 81:18, 93:21, 99:18 53:12, 68:25, 121:4, 95:8, 97:25, 116:29 129.22 78:25, 169:27 **Service** [1] - 23:2 126:13 seeks [1] - 103:22 row [1] - 165:13 script [1] - 35:3 **service** [2] - 8:13, responsible [2] -Ruane [7] - 100:28, scroll [3] - 148:10, seem [9] - 78:17, 23:16 9:24, 128:23 107:28, 108:9, 160:7, 169:24 83:15, 99:28, 101:22, Services [1] - 1:24 restoration [2] -111:19, 113:20, 102:21, 107:5, **SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 se [3] - 12:10, 15:21, 144:8, 144:15 125:29, 133:21, 122:17, 123:12 148:7 **services** [2] - 72:8, restore [2] - 62:18, 160:29 Ryan [1] - 137:15 **SEAN**[4] - 1:12, 2:2, 117:23 148:29 RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2 sees [1] - 127:2 2:22, 3:17 set [7] - 69:12, 87:25, restored [2] - 62:3, selected [1] - 56:28 113:27, 116:22, **SEANAD**[1] - 1:5 63:13 selection [1] - 56:27 second [25] - 26:22, 117:23, 133:26, rests [1] - 146:15 send [3] - 51:28, 37:18, 40:9, 47:23, 162:12 result [10] - 10:14, 52:7, 111:19 49:10, 50:8, 52:6, sets [6] - 38:14, 40:2, safer [1] - 82:17 12:21, 26:5, 41:18, sending [3] - 27:25, 70:9, 130:2, 159:14, 55:2, 56:6, 56:16, **safety** [3] - 139:12, 117:9, 119:6, 121:20, 66:12, 73:1, 74:4, 114:8, 158:11 161:26 156:10, 156:16 152:28, 154:20, 76:2, 85:23, 89:12, senior [2] - 48:9, sexual [2] - 56:19, SAMS [12] - 10:18. 159.21 165:22 89:23, 90:28, 97:12, 66:21 22:17, 22:28, 26:26, resulted [1] - 10:7 113:13, 135:25, sense [6] - 42:20, **SHANE** [1] - 3:23 27:13, 27:22, 27:27, **RESUMED** [2] - 6:1, 148:9, 148:10 101:4, 120:21, **SHANKEY** [1] - 3:21 28:3, 29:4, 37:21, 88:23 secondly [3] - 16:2, 138:10, 161:10, SHANKEY-SMITH 87:17, 128:4 retain [1] - 13:20 147:24, 154:6 162:10 [1] - 3:21 **SANDRA**[1] - 4:6 **RETIRED** [7] - 3:5, sent [24] - 14:22, secretary [4] - 23:29, **Shankill** [1] - 6:26 satisfaction [2] -23:27, 23:28, 28:27, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, 46:26, 51:20, 60:25 **SHANNON**[1] - 2:13 87.28 3:12, 3:13 secreted [4] - 90:14, 37:29, 38:28, 42:18, **shape** [3] - 73:11, satisfied [6] - 43:29, return [9] - 32:20, 92:19, 93:2, 164:12 51:13, 60:28, 62:6, 82:16, 92:6 44:3, 87:24, 139:18, 32:25, 32:26, 33:17, section [13] - 9:15, 67:28, 72:21, 73:11, **SHEAHAN**[1] - 3:18 158:20, 168:11 132:24, 133:1, 133:2, 73:26, 75:3, 80:24, 9:17, 9:22, 11:6, Sheehan [1] - 140:24 satisfy [1] - 26:14 147:22, 148:2 82:25, 84:9, 106:27, 36:10, 45:4, 46:23, sheet [1] - 112:9 Saturdays [1] - 143:3 returned [4] - 66:17, 129:4, 129:23, 53:3, 53:23, 68:28, **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 138:20, 157:3, 167:25 67:8, 78:14, 79:22 81:11, 116:29, 140:15 **SHIP** [1] - 3:28 **saw** [12] - 31:14, sentence [4] - 26:23, returning [2] - 32:1, Section [4] - 19:5, short [5] - 45:24, 35:1, 52:6, 54:26, 81:17 27:18, 147:5, 149:9 19:15, 44:8, 52:1 52:10, 70:13, 86:26, 70:26, 71:22, 93:8, revert [1] - 130:13 sections [2] - 77:24, sentiment [1] - 93:1 99:16 103:13, 121:3, review [7] - 23:24, 142.2 separately[1] short-term [1] -121:17, 147:29, 150:9 72:28, 105:7, 105:21, secure [1] - 167:6 123:17 86:26 **SC** [11] - 2:6, 2:7, September [16] -105:27, 117:28 Security [1] - 113:6 shortly [2] - 10:21, 2:10. 2:16. 2:21. 2:28. 36:10, 57:7, 59:2, reviewed [4] - 14:26, see [39] - 13:10, 46.21 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:6, 23:2, 38:15, 39:11 15:6, 23:27, 24:18, 60:1, 61:2, 61:8, 61:9, **showed** [1] - 21:1 4:7 62:5, 62:10, 93:6, reviews [1] - 105:22 29:2, 30:7, 32:15, showing [1] - 153:7 **SCANLAN**[1] - 3:8 93:13, 96:13, 151:28, rewarding [1] - 49:15 32:19, 39:5, 53:7, sic [1] - 145:6 Scanlan [29] - 68:23, 154:29, 155:2, 156:6 rightly [7] - 37:12, 68:19, 68:21, 75:21, sick [30] - 14:25, 76:17, 78:1, 78:5, sequence [3] -41:3, 42:7, 49:5, 76:2, 101:5, 102:22, 17:23, 20:8, 20:23, 78:18, 79:7, 79:16, 10:12, 68:5, 96:14 108:2, 108:6, 111:17, 60:19, 93:25, 111:2 20:27, 22:25, 23:16, 80:2, 80:8, 80:12, sergeant [2] - 6:28, ring [1] - 20:16 115:6, 121:13, 23:17, 24:25, 28:15, 80:24, 81:3, 81:9, rise [3] - 26:14, 124:18, 130:28, 113:28 28:22, 39:14, 41:9, 81:13. 82:7. 84:2. 131:3, 133:11, SERGEANT [5] -86:23, 127:5 45:10, 47:28, 47:29, 84:5, 84:20, 90:18, 145:26, 150:14, 3:12, 3:20, 4:5, 4:6, risk [2] - 39:15, 50:25, 50:28, 63:3, 95:16, 95:27, 102:11, 154:4, 158:12, 112:5 86:22, 87:6, 87:11, 121:16, 121:27, 161:26, 166:24, Sergeant [10] - 10:7, ROAD [1] - 2:18 111:26, 132:17, 157:25, 157:26, 166:26, 166:28, 79:25, 100:17, road [1] - 84:14 136:9, 152:15, 155:6, 158:12, 158:14, 100:28, 105:6, 167:4, 168:13, Roche [4] - 75:13, 155:7 158:25 168:15, 170:24 105:10, 111:17, 75:16, 80:8, 81:27 Sick [2] - 19:5, 52:1 Scanlan's [1] seeing [2] - 53:9, 112:14, 120:29 role [15] - 9:4, 9:12, sickness [12] - 9:5,

9:8, 9:23, 10:29, 11:6, 11:11, 12:7, 19:6, 23:13, 27:7, 27:21 Sickness [2] - 19:14, 44.8 side [2] - 16:7, 52:24 sight [3] - 22:7, 117:24, 144:10 signed [1] - 94:11 significance [1] -163.1 significant [4] -25:24, 141:24, 143:26, 144:2 similar [2] - 15:25, simple [3] - 38:3, 137:13, 137:14 simpliciter [1] -109:27 single [2] - 14:18, 61:20 singled [1] - 31:25 SINÉAD [1] - 4:7 SINéAD [1] - 2:7 sit [1] - 109:29 situation [2] - 39:10, six [4] - 96:17, 99:10, 106:12, 135:15 **six-page** [3] - 96:17, 99:10, 106:12 slightly [4] - 88:9, 115:6, 125:2, 125:13 slot [1] - 9:5 **small** [2] **-** 69:18, 143:14 **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 SMITHFIELD [2] -2:24, 4:12 **SO**[1] - 120:2 **so..** [1] - 161:15 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 solicitor [6] - 71:29, 72:2, 123:5, 144:14, 145:6, 167:25 **solicitor**" [1] - 99:8 SOLICITOR'S [1] -3:27 SOLICITORS [6] -2:11, 2:18, 2:23, 2:30, 4:8, 4:11 **solicitors** [7] - 68:23, 72:14, 103:18, 106:7, 111:19, 113:16, 116:4 someone [3] - 45:6, 92:3, 106:23 sometime [4] -34:12. 62:5. 115:15. 159:22

sometimes [3] -12:12, 30:15, 146:12 soon [3] - 73:15, 83:11. 138:9 sorry [30] - 10:24, 14:29, 21:25, 37:2, 57:18, 57:20, 66:29, 78:29, 79:18, 105:24, 106:3, 111:5, 116:2, 137:17, 138:5, 148:20, 148:21, 150:5, 150:28, 151:16, 152:14, 152:16, 153:10, 155:26, 162:28, 165:4, 168:7, 168:13, 170:12, 170:18 sort [12] - 9:24, 9:28, 64:29, 89:11, 96:20, 105:29, 108:29, 114:8, 125:2, 130:27, 133:4. 137:2 sort" [1] - 137:1 sorted [2] - 20:23, 155:11 sought [4] - 74:7, 121:12, 129:26, 144:15 source [4] - 23:7, 24:28, 95:8, 145:4 south [1] - 6:26 space [2] - 83:28, 120.22 speaking [3] - 91:29, 106:2, 135:21 special [1] - 32:3 specific [2] - 43:9, 116:18 specifically [4] -75:15, 117:1, 129:5, 152:19 **specified** [2] - 54:12, 112.19 speed [1] - 24:12 spent [2] - 7:2, 7:4 spirits [1] - 71:12 **splintered** [1] - 127:4 spoken [2] - 16:7,

16.8

staff [11] - 9:21, 9:22,

12:15, 18:4, 32:17,

33:2, 45:18, 119:23,

stage [19] - 10:20,

52:23, 66:16, 76:29,

11:2, 15:9, 40:22,

77:1, 77:4, 77:16,

78:1, 83:8, 96:28,

132:5, 138:24,

150:15, 151:11,

124:29, 167:1

156:27, 159:1 stages [1] - 69:3 stand [1] - 63:13 standing [1] - 153:7 stands [1] - 64:1 start [5] - 22:21, 52:11, 53:8, 110:19, 142:17 started [10] - 20:2, 53:7, 53:11, 54:28, 57:25, 62:2, 93:26, 147:15, 150:11, 152:7 **STATE**[1] - 3:27 state [2] - 20:16, 150:12 statement [38] -6:18, 6:21, 37:22, 42:26, 48:25, 70:14, 73:15, 75:10, 78:9, 78:15, 78:27, 79:1, 79:4, 83:1, 84:22, 85:8, 85:10, 90:17, 93:5, 94:11, 94:25, 99:22, 101:22, 106:22, 106:27, 108:27, 118:29, 121:16, 131:1, 131:3, 131:6, 133:12, 139:8. 139:26, 147:14, 155:13, 157:17, 169:3 statements [1] - 85:2 **states** [1] - 117:13 stating [2] - 22:8, 87.12 station [2] - 33:1, 134:5 status [7] - 9:13, 14:14, 18:13, 39:18, 64:16, 77:19, 120:20 stay [4] - 20:18, 127:11, 141:26, 155:3 stenographic [1] -1:26 stenography [1] -1:24 STENOGRAPHY[1] - 1:29 step [2] - 129:15, 158:21 STEPHANIE[1] -**STEPHEN** [1] - 2:21 steps [3] - 25:1, 123:5, 159:14 stewardship [2] -163:20, 163:26 still [13] - 9:8, 32:28, 38:20, 62:27, 86:6,

144:26, 147:23, 147:28 stipulate [1] - 147:21 stood [1] - 97:3 stop [2] - 97:26, 166:11 stopped [2] - 30:16, 97:29 stove [1] - 127:2 straight [1] - 143:16 strands [5] - 14:13, 83:26, 121:3, 123:14, 138:11 Strategy [1] - 129:25 **STREET**[3] - 2:12, 3.28 4.3 stress [55] - 10:15, 10:23, 10:27, 17:2, 17:24, 20:27, 21:2, 22:27, 23:5, 23:8, 24:18, 24:26, 24:28, 25:2, 25:7, 25:17, 26:1, 26:7, 26:12, 27:8, 27:12, 27:13, 27:25, 28:17, 28:20, 31:10, 31:11, 31:21, 33:22, 34:1, 38:5, 39:4, 40:15, 40:16, 43:8, 43:14, 44:6, 44:13, 48:2, 50:26, 62:28, 64:5, 85:29, 86:4, 86:22, 87:12, 91:4, 94:16, 134:19, 134:28, 147:8, 148:16, 148:22, 154:15, 155:9 strong [3] - 18:8, 41:3 strongly [2] - 166:3, 167:23 structure [3] - 7:17, 86:21, 147:28 style [1] - 125:6 subject [8] - 76:24, 105:9, 105:16, 117:2, 133:3, 135:14, 166:1, 167:17 subject-matter [1] -105:16 submit [2] - 23:22, 156:14 submitted [3] -36:20, 106:29, 154:29 subsequent [6] -38:25, 72:16, 98:16, 107:11, 119:9, 131:18 subsequently [6] -27:12, 54:25, 81:25, 115:11, 115:21, 87:18. 90:1. 92:4. 100:20, 126:22, 129:23

substance [1] -69:22 substantial [2] -141:20, 144:27 substantive [1] -99:19 successful [1] -46:13 successfully [1] -124.25 successor [1] -141:8 suffering [2] - 26:1, 153:25 suffice [1] - 71:21 suggest [5] - 13:1, 60:20, 63:4, 97:29, 102:25 suggested [4] -17:29, 32:23, 85:23, 108:16 suggesting [5] -45:5, 63:8, 103:13, 113:2, 157:16 suggestion [5] -38:16, 45:7, 99:13, 126:24, 158:25 suggestions [1] -159:12 suggests [3] - 25:5, 106:26, 169:21 sum [2] - 144:2, 144:27 summarised [1] -63:21 summarises [1] **summary** [2] - 59:14, **Sunday** [2] - 142:28, 143:17 **Sundays** [1] - 143:3 SUPERINTENDENT [20] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 5:3, 6:10, 142:13, 145:22, 146:23 Superintendent [83] - 6:5, 6:14, 6:17, 6:22, 10:13, 10:26, 25:4, 25:6, 25:20, 25:27, 25:28, 32:2, 35:20, 36:7, 39:3, 42:17, 42:22, 44:19, 46:26, 47:25, 48:1, 48:3, 48:11, 48:12, 48:20, 49:9, 49:15, 49:25, 50:7, 55:17, 61:6,

65:16, 68:23, 71:8, 168:13, 168:16 tense [1] - 166:1 to-ing [1] - 74:16 TRIBUNALS [1] - 1:8 71:16, 73:5, 75:13, surprise [3] - 49:14, tentative [1] - 119:12 to.. [1] - 28:15 tried [1] - 140:16 78:5, 79:7, 80:12, 127:21, 164:27 term [2] - 32:20, today [7] - 6:5, 95:6, trigger [1] - 91:2 81:3, 81:27, 82:7, surprised [3] -86:26 113:23, 117:17, **trips** [1] - 137:14 84:2, 84:20, 87:5, 93:18, 166:24, 166:27 terms [26] - 9:6, 147:10, 149:3, 151:20 **TRR** [1] - 23:21 90:18, 91:4, 92:21, surrounding [2] -11:16, 13:11, 14:19, today's [2] - 95:11, true [2] - 101:23, 95:16, 95:27, 97:5, 18:28, 19:27, 63:2, 49:24, 131:8 102:29 102:10, 103:17, suspect [2] - 24:4, 67:16, 68:13, 68:15, together [8] - 6:19, truth [2] - 137:17, 104:24, 105:8, 108:1, 158:16 68:24, 76:27, 77:19, 14:13, 15:27, 51:6, 137:18 108:23, 111:14, 78:7, 86:1, 111:18, suspecting [1] - 22:6 83:27, 85:21, 89:13, try [18] - 18:12, 20:3, 111:20, 117:7, suspended [4] -101:25, 103:10, 127:27 22:11, 44:12, 45:19, 118:12, 126:28, 89:18, 89:28, 90:1, 125:22, 126:3, **TOM** [3] - 3:12, 4:10 53:7, 56:13, 83:10, 135:7, 135:9, 135:26, 136:17 138:13, 138:23, Tony [4] - 6:15, 93:3, 101:4, 110:22, 135:27, 136:1, 142:5, 143:4, 143:17, 151:26 48:20, 122:8, 149:11 suspension [2] -132:29, 139:10, 149:11, 154:17, 73:4, 136:18 Terry[1] - 105:8 took [21] - 16:6, 140:10, 140:11, 157:12, 157:17, SWORN [1] - 6:11 testimony [1] - 121:2 21:28. 30:11. 51:11. 140:14, 142:18, 157:25, 157:26, than.. [1] - 93:19 52:25, 60:8, 62:4, 148:28 synopsis [1] -158:11, 158:14, 129:26 that.. [1] - 34:21 100:15, 100:28, trying [15] - 29:24, 158:25, 164:14, **THE** [13] - 1:3, 1:7, 124:16, 133:4, system [7] - 17:10, 30:9, 44:25, 48:5, 169:19, 170:26, 135:11, 135:13, 27:6, 27:9, 27:11, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 83:27, 103:28, 115:7, 171:13 28:19, 87:29, 149:19 6:1, 6:8, 6:14, 88:23, 135:20, 135:22, 134:12, 134:25, superintendent [36] systematic [2] -106:4, 171:19, 171:23 135:24, 136:2, 136:5, 150:12, 158:16, - 6:7, 7:4, 7:6, 7:11, 92:18, 164:11 the.. [1] - 156:9 149:17, 162:18, 160:17, 160:19, 8:1, 13:14, 19:1, 165:24 160:23, 161:20 **SÍOCHÁNA** [1] - 3:2 themselves [1] -22:10, 24:20, 37:8, top [16] - 7:26, 20:8, TUESDAY [2] - 1:18, 44.25 **Séan** [1] - 120:3 49:16, 49:17, 52:25, Síochána [16] - 6:24, THEN [3] - 88:23, 39:5, 40:7, 51:2, 55:19, 71:15, 77:11, 6:25, 36:11, 49:20, 171:19, 171:23 74:22, 85:23, 114:10, Tullamore [1] - 29:29 78:17, 78:28, 84:21, 118:2, 119:20, 56:26, 59:12, 59:18, there'd [1] - 103:7 turn [2] - 155:1, 88:26, 92:21, 112:3, 135:25, 136:26, 156:15 67:15, 67:17, 85:28, thereafter [2] -115:21, 136:21, 137:12, 141:24, 90:12, 90:24, 139:29, turned [2] - 68:9, 14:26. 138:10 137:8, 141:21, 170:2, 170:3 151:10, 154:6, 154:16 115:18 therefore [10] - 19:7, 142:16, 144:7, 29:20, 44:4, 54:28, topic [1] - 154:27 **TURNER** [1] - 2:28 145:10, 146:26, touch [2] - 29:25, Т 63:11, 92:7, 108:29, twice [1] - 16:17 158:26, 164:14, 132:23 122:14, 129:15, Two [1] - 123:22 170:12, 170:29, towards [1] - 29:23 150.11 two [31] - 15:29, 171:12 T&N [1] - 4:2 TOWNPARKS[1] they've [1] - 100:29 17:16, 18:10, 18:13, superintendents [1] tanks [1] - 105:24 2:12 thinks [1] - 107:23 19:2, 28:29, 29:1, - 141:21 **TARA**[1] - 3:22 traced [1] - 147:14 third [9] - 39:8, 43:2, 29:2, 29:11, 35:4, supervising [1] target [1] - 140:5 track [2] - 115:7, 49:29, 55:9, 70:7, 44:18, 46:10, 48:9, 138:15 targeted [2] - 32:3, 90:29, 113:20, 139:10 48:10, 49:27, 55:16, supplied [2] - 47:10, 139:28 train [1] - 90:1 126:22, 148:4 56:25, 62:25, 91:17, 67:13 task [1] - 141:25 though.. [1] - 72:19 transcript [2] - 1:25, 97:24, 98:22, 104:16, support [15] - 12:21, tasked [3] - 108:4, three [9] - 19:24, 160:5 111:5, 123:14, 130:9, 18:8, 34:23, 46:2, 112:7, 159:21 135:29, 147:23, transmitted [1] -50:12, 51:7, 54:1, 46:3, 63:8, 67:14, tasks [1] - 113:27 149:17, 152:25, 84:2 60:1, 62:12, 89:7, 71:1, 71:10, 71:11, tax [2] - 10:26, 144:4 154:4, 170:6 96:21, 98:10 transpired [2] -127:13, 127:17, **TD**[3] - 153:15, 157:10, 168:6 two-part [1] - 130:9 three-page [1] - 60:1 135:10, 140:10, 164:26 throw [1] - 81:29 TREACY[1] - 2:27 type [6] - 26:26, 140:14 team [3] - 69:18, **Thursday** [1] - 64:19 treated [3] - 23:14, 109:21, 112:19, supported [1] - 40:4 69:19, 117:27 126:26, 162:26, 62:26. 167:9 ticking [1] - 26:4 supporting [2] technically [1] -166:22 treating [1] - 23:4 tight [1] - 103:12 15:29, 42:8 146:1 treatment [6] - 10:1, Tánaiste [2] - 118:6, timeframe [2] supports [1] - 70:24 telephone [2] -149:5 32:4, 46:12, 89:17, 10:25, 118:20 **suppose** [12] -117:3, 118:1 89:27, 166:3 timeframes [1] -12:29, 46:29, 61:23, template [1] - 105:15 U Tribunal [7] - 14:5, 68:18 77:4, 112:25, 118:20, **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 47:10, 58:9, 63:16, timelines [1] -118:21, 132:27, Temporary [1] -63:24, 78:11, 85:8 141.26 140:13, 162:6, 164:3, ultimately [2] - 11:2, 23:19 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, timely [1] - 13:25 168:4 69.17 ten [1] - 28:7 2:6 TMcL [2] - 15:15, supposed [2] umbrella [1] - 27:14 tend [1] - 40:15 Tribunal's [1] - 6:18 101:1

UNDER [2] - 1:2, 1:8 under [51] - 7:21, 7:22, 7:24, 9:9, 9:18, 9:21, 9:25, 10:28, 23:10, 23:11, 23:15, 25:7, 25:17, 27:14, 35:27, 36:19, 39:23, 41:20, 42:12, 51:3, 52:29, 56:19, 63:10, 66:21, 67:16, 69:13, 70:1, 76:11, 87:9, 94:12, 95:26, 96:8, 100:26, 103:9, 104:8, 104:10, 107:2, 107:9, 109:21, 112:27, 117:28, 118:5, 127:3, 128:20, 129:13, 136:29, 139:19, 141:7, 151:3, 157:27, 158:7 understood [5] -54:23, 71:6, 167:6, 167:16, 167:23 undertake [1] - 119:3 undertaken [1] -116:18 undertaking [1] -110:28 undertook [6] -34:15, 48:20, 87:6, 148:13, 149:11, 170:28 underway [1] - 77:6 unease [1] - 85:21 unfair [1] - 41:18 unfamiliar [1] -124:17 unfit [7] - 14:21, 16:27, 16:28, 16:29, 22:26, 23:3, 38:14 unfortunately [1] -90:6 unhappy [1] - 65:1 unique [1] - 127:16 unit [5] - 7:1, 10:5, 10:8, 10:9, 135:14 units [2] - 77:24, 142:2 unknown [1] - 90:13 unless [4] - 36:25, 90:6, 102:27, 168:11 unlikely [1] - 149:26 unsighted [1] - 95:15 unsocial [1] - 143:29 unsocially [1] -91.21 UNTIL [1] - 171:23 unusual [2] - 19:13, 118:17 unwilling [1] - 23:9

up [43] - 10:8, 10:28, 11:1, 12:21, 16:12, 24:12, 25:8, 29:26, 35:16, 37:19, 37:20, 38:21, 38:25, 39:1, 52:25, 54:29, 56:25, 61:24, 65:27, 65:28, 80:15, 82:8, 86:8, 87:17, 90:15, 93:27, 111:14, 113:2, 114:3, 114:12, 121:1, 133:26, 135:3, 138:16, 144:9, 145:15, 146:8, 153:7, 154:4, 160:25, 170:17, 170:19 up-to-date [4] -16:12, 24:12, 87:17, 138:16 update [31] - 9:13, 16:19, 22:16, 24:15, 26:27, 28:9, 51:16, 56:3, 70:15, 70:19, 71:1, 75:4, 77:10, 77:19, 79:23, 80:21, 83:16, 85:5, 93:14, 94:5, 94:18, 98:17, 107:28, 108:1, 108:2, 115:2, 115:5, 120:20, 127:24, 129:26 updated [3] - 29:16, 93:21, 128:4 updates [4] - 13:26, 21:7, 60:5, 138:13 updating [1] - 58:19 upped [1] - 108:21 upsetting [1] - 31:16 **upwards** [1] - 36:20 urgency [1] - 39:11 urgent [2] - 39:21, 40:21 urgently [1] - 115:28 user [1] - 26:26

verbatim [2] - 1:25, 98:14 via [2] - 50:21, 126:25 victimisation [2] -51:1, 112:27 victimised [1] -104:4 view [44] - 14:12, 25:7, 27:26, 28:20, 31:18, 31:19, 35:25, 37:11, 39:10, 41:1, 41:3, 41:13, 43:6, 45:9, 45:14, 53:5, 53:8, 60:8, 62:12, 63:1, 63:24, 65:7, 71:24, 76:29, 77:3, 81:8, 82:6, 82:12, 82:13, 82:15, 83:3, 83:5, 109:6, 109:17, 120:18, 122:8, 123:3, 130:11, 134:4, 140:4, 140:7, 140:21, 140:25 viewpoint [1] -108:15 views [4] - 51:16, 105:20, 125:29, 126:8 virtue [3] - 124:22, 143:2, 143:10 vis [1] - 162:4 vis-à-vis [2] - 22:17, 73.6 **visit** [2] - 113:21, 118:16 visited [2] - 154:16, 159.18 visits [2] - 17:16, 160.9 voiced [1] - 127:5 Volume [9] - 6:19, 6:20, 6:21, 63:20, 146:27, 147:3, 150:22, 155:27, 159:6 volume [1] - 157:6

# W

wage [1] - 41:21

٧

usual [1] - 129:15

utterances [1] -

41:27

variety [1] - 143:19 various [14] - 14:12, 14:15, 15:27, 20:2, 26:16, 60:5, 60:14, 68:17, 68:29, 70:21, 77:24, 83:25, 132:9, 143:29 vein [2] - 142:20, 167.2 verbally [1] - 113:22

wages [2] - 63:3, 86.2 wait [1] - 40:15 walk [1] - 114:13 Wallace [3] - 30:28, 35:17, 164:26 wants [2] - 13:7, 158:20 warrant [1] - 50:28 warranted [2] - 9:16,

wished [3] - 27:6, 48:28, 152:2 WEDNESDAY[1] -33:11 171.19 171.19 162:11 wellbeing [2] - 15:5, WELLINGTON [1] -Western [1] - 23:10 141:18 **WHEATLEY**[1] - 3:4 25:28, 37:29, 38:11, 162:24 Wheatley's [1] - 43:3 whereas [1] - 41:16 whereby [4] - 15:26, 133:12 whistleblower [6] whistleblower's [1] whistleblowers [1] -

**WAS** [4] - 6:11,

**ways** [1] - 73:5

week [3] - 64:19,

weeks [1] - 38:15

welfare [11] - 8:12,

8:13, 13:21, 14:11,

21:4, 60:6, 74:22,

Westmeath [2] -

WESTMEATH[1] -

whatsoever [2] -

Wheatley [11] -

38:26, 42:17, 44:1,

44:5, 44:11, 48:17.

whereabouts [1] -

32:19, 62:3, 150:2

which.. [1] - 48:22

whilst [1] - 49:17

35:18, 42:4, 42:5,

48:6, 50:25, 165:24

**WHITE** [1] - 3:11

whole [4] - 31:13,

wider [7] - 103:7,

William [1] - 23:27

wind [1] - 84:11

wish [13] - 36:18,

56:9, 56:18, 56:23,

67:7, 67:18, 98:15,

118:8, 124:1, 162:2

57:12. 66:14. 66:19.

104:11, 109:1,

109:17, 112:24,

130:12, 166:20

138:7, 152:17, 160:29

51:27, 71:16

90:12

165:13

42.15

43:17, 48:12

8:28. 81:14

121:4, 124:28,

133:24, 133:25

139:11

2:31

4:4

143:14, 167:26

142:13, 145:22,

146:23

171:23

wishes [1] - 157:26 with.. [2] - 30:20, WITHDREW [1] -WITNESS [5] - 5:2, 6:8, 6:14, 106:4, witness [2] - 6:4, wondering [2] -162:24, 167:28 word [3] - 30:22, 31:16. 151:3 words [5] - 33:15, 40:21, 123:15, 123:25, 135:23 workloads [1] worth [1] - 45:15 write [4] - 56:4, 109:8, 110:4, 110:7 writing [15] - 10:7, 30:15, 36:7, 54:6, 57:22, 83:16, 83:20, 93:18, 119:5, 132:8, 134:25, 135:21, 157:24, 162:23, written [12] - 53:26, 56:10, 58:2, 65:9, 66:15, 94:15, 108:12, 116:4. 117:17. 117:21, 129:24, wrongdoing [2] -165:26, 166:9 wrongly [6] - 37:13, 41:4, 49:5, 60:19, 93:25, 111:2 wrote [19] - 8:17, 10:6, 35:19, 51:19, 51:27, 53:29, 55:29, 57:6, 66:5, 66:28, 80:20, 82:2, 115:1,

115:21, 116:2,

126:16, 127:23,

131:10, 154:28

year [4] - 23:18, 131:20, 135:15, 155:6 years [3] - 7:2, 98:10, 141:5 YES [1] - 37:22 yesterday [5] -

16:25, 58:21, 59:17, 140:24, 151:7 yourself [7] - 12:5, 64:22, 93:13, 116:7, 119:29, 128:11, 136:13

### €

**€100** [1] - 143:14 **€300** [1] - 144:4 **€400** [1] - 144:4

# É

**ÉABHALL**[1] - 2:30 **ÉIREANN**[2] - 1:4, **Élan"** [1] - 118:26

# Ó

**Ó** [26] - 3:7, 8:22, 39:3, 50:20, 51:14, 57:25, 57:26, 58:27, 61:5, 74:11, 89:10, 96:19, 97:6, 107:6, 110:15, 135:11, 135:27, 136:1, 136:3, 136:18, 138:7, 147:13, 147:20, 153:15, 167:7, 167:25