TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN,
FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE
ON MONDAY, 29TH JUNE 2020 - DAY 150

150

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

## **APPEARANCES**

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

**REGI STRAR:** MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL:

MR. DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. SINÉAD McGRATH BL

FOR GARDA NI CHOLAS KEOGH: MR. MATTHIAS KELLY SC

MR. PATRICK R. O'BRIEN BL
MS. AISLING MULLIGAN BL
JOHN GERARD CULLEN SOLICITORS
MAIN STREET INSTRUCTED BY:

TOWNPARKS

CARRICK-ON-SHANNON CO. LEITRIM

FOR SUPERINTENDENT

MR. PAUL CARROLL SC MR. JOHN FERRY BL CARTHAGE CONLON O'MARA GERAGHTY McCOURT NOREEN McBRIEN:

INSTRUCTED BY:

SOLI CI TORS

51 NORTHUMBERLAND ROAD

DUBLIN 4

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. PAUL McGARRY SC MR. STEPHEN O'CONNOR BL MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

MR.

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMITHFIELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA FERGAL GREENE, GARDA STEPHANIE TREACY & GARDA DAVID TURNER:

MR. PATRICK McGRATH SC

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. JAMES KANE BL
MR. EOIN LAWLOR BL
MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES
MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁIN
HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS
13 WELLINGTON QUAY

TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN 2

**FOR** COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PATRICK MURRAY CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARK CURRAN DETECTIVE INSPECTOR MICHAEL COPPINGER CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT LORRAINE WHEATLEY RETIRED DETECTIVE SUPERINTENDENT DECLAN MULCAHY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MICHAEL FINN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT ANTHONY MCLOUGHLIN
RETIRED ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER JACK NOLAN
RETIRED ACTING COMMISSIONER DONAL Ó CUALÁIN
RETIRED COMMISSIONER NÓIRÍN O'SULLIVAN
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANNE MARIE MCMAHON
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANIAN 10. 11. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT JOHN SCANLAN 13. SUPERI NTENDENT ALAN MURRAY SUPERI NTENDENT ALDAN MI NNOCK 14. 15. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY 16. 16. INSPECTOR EAMON CURLEY
17. GARDA MICHAEL QUINN
18. RETIRED GARDA GERRY WHITE
19. CHIEF MEDICAL OFFICER DR. OGHUVBU
20. GARDA OLIVIA KELLY
21. RETIRED DETECTIVE SERGEANT TOM JUDGE
22. MR. ALAN MULLIGAN, ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
23. RETIRED DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT PETER KIRWAN
24. MR. JOE NUGENT, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
25. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT KEVIN GRALTON
26. INSPECTOR BRIAN DOWNEY
27. MONICA CARR, HEAD OF DIRECTORATE, HUMAN RESOURCES AND PEOPLE DEVELOPMENT
28. MR. BRIAN SAVAGE BRIAN SAVAGE 28. MR. CHI EF SUPERINTENDENT ANNE MARI E CAGNEY DETECTIVE INSPECTOR SEAN O' REARDON 30. INSPECTOR LIAM MORONEY 31. ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DAVID SHEAHAN 32. CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MATT NYLAND CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MI CHAEL FLYNN 33. 34. SERGEANT KIERAN DOWNEY
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ORLA MCPARTLIN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT MARGARET NUGENT
GARDA AISLING SHANKEY-SMITH
INSPECTOR TARA GOODE 35. 36. 37. SHANE MURPHY SC MICHEAL P. O'HIGGINS SC MR. MR. MR. MR.

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. CONOR DIGNAM SC
MR. DONAL McGUINNESS BL
MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL
MS. KATE EGAN BL
MS. EMMA GRIFFIN
MS. CARMEL HOLOHAN
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE
OSMOND HOUSE
LITTLE SHIP STREET
DUBLIN 8

MR. JOHN CONNELLAN BL MR. PAUL CONNELLAN T&N MCLYNN FOR MS. OLIVIA O'NEILL: INSTRUCTED BY:

BASTION COURT 11-13 CONNAUGHT STREET

**ATHLONE** 

CO. WESTMEATH

FOR AGSI, INSPECTOR NI CHOLAS FARRELL, SERGEANT ANDREW HARAN, SERGEANT AI DAN LYONS, SERGEANT SANDRA KEANE: MR

MR. DESMOND DOCKERY SC MS. PEGGY O' ROURKE SC MS. SINEAD GLEESON BL REDDY CHARLTON SOLICITORS 12 FITTURE LLIAM PLACE

INSTRUCTED BY:

DUBLIN 2

FOR GARDA TOM HIGGINS:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. TOM POWER BL
MR. NOEL McCARTAN
McCARTAN & BURKE SOLICITORS
ICELAND HOUSE
33-34 ARRAN QUAY
SMITHFIELD

DUBLIN 7

FOR MR. JOHN BARRETT:

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. TOM CLARKE SC MR. DAVID BYRNES BL MR. FELIX MCTIERNAN NOBEL LAW SOLICITORS FRANKFORT HALL

DUNDRUM ROAD

**DUNDRUM** DUBLIN 14

## INDEX

١	VI TNESS	PAGE
	MR. JOHN BARRETT	
	DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS,	7
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN	122
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL McGUINNESS	149
	CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McGARRY	192
	RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS	194

1	THE HEARING RESUMED, AS FOLLOWS, ON MONDAY, 29TH JUNE	
2	<u>2020</u> :	
3		
4	CHAIRMAN: Good morning. Can you hear me,	
5	Mr. McGuinness?	10:30
6	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, Chairman, thank you.	
7	CHAIRMAN: Very good. I was going to say, I'm not sure	
8	how to say this, but it's nice to see people and it's	
9	nice to be back. But just before we start, I was going	
10	to say that the reason we're able to do this is in	10:31
11	large part due to the efforts of our Office Manager,	
12	Mr. Barnes. So take a bow, Mr. Barnes, for the	
13	arrangements that we have here. Okay. Now, thanks	
14	very much.	
15	MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, the witness today is	10:31
16	Mr. John Barrett.	
17	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
18	MR. McGUINNESS: Just before I ask him to commence his	
19	evidence, I was going to just inform members,	
20	colleagues who are here, for technical reasons, that	10:31
21	the order of cross-examination after I finish, it will	
22	go to Garda Keogh's team then to ask what questions	
23	they may, and I think before they wish to do that, they	
24	wish to consult with Mr. Kelly, who is tuning in and	
25	listening from London, their leader in the matter; it	10:31
26	will then go to the Garda Síochána team behind me,	
27	where Mr. McGuinness will be dealing with the matter;	
28	and then it will go to Assistant Commissioner Fanning's	
29	team, if there is any questions to be asked; and then	

1			go to Mr. Barrett's team, where Mr. Clarke is appearing	
2			for Mr. Barrett, instructed by Mr. McTiernan; and then	
3			back to me for re-examination. I just say that because	
4			it is in ease of the cameraman as well.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Very good.	10:32
6			MR. McGUINNESS: That he will follow that sequence.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Nobody has any objection	
8			to that I'm sure, that seems perfectly reasonable.	
9			MR. McGUINNESS: If I can ask Mr. Barrett to come	
10			forward.	10:32
11			CHAIRMAN: where is Mr. Barrett? Thanks very much	
12			Mr. Barrett. Good morning.	
13				
14			MR. JOHN BARRETT, HAVING BEEN SWORN, WAS	
15			DIRECTLY-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS, AS FOLLOWS:	10:33
16				
17			THE WITNESS: John Barrett.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Sit down, Mr. Barrett.	
19			MR. McGUINNESS: I should also say, Chairman, that	
20			Mr. Barrett's statement is to be found at Volume 56 at	10:33
21			page 15960 of the Tribunal papers. Good morning,	
22			Mr. Barrett.	
23		Α.	Good morning, Mr. McGuinness.	
24	1	Q.	Mr. Barrett, you joined An Garda Síochána as a civilian	
25			at a stage of its development where there was an	10:33
26			increase in civilisation of the force, isn't that	
27			correct?	
28		Α.	That's correct.	
29	2	Q.	I think you became the first civilian executive	

Т			director in An Garda Siochana with responsibility for	
2			Human Resources and development?	
3		Α.	That's correct.	
4	3	Q.	Is that correct? Could I just ask you to briefly	
5			outline your career prior to that to the Chairman?	10:3
6		Α.	Following graduation from UCC, I joined IBEC, the Irish	
7			Business Employers Confederation, as it is now, it was	
8			the FUE back then, as a labour law industrial relations	
9			negotiator and adviser to industry. I spent six years	
10			there. Then I joined in succession two companies that	10:3
11			I had advised who were on my case list; Full Flex	
12			International, a US multinational company, and	
13			thereafter a company called Walsh Western	
14			International. I was the group director of HR at Walsh	
15			Western. I joined one of our customers, Stratus	10:3
16			Computer, a Boston based multinational US organisation.	
17			They in turn were taken over by a company called Send	
18			Communications of California, which in turn was taken	
19			over by Lewison Technologies, and through that I had	
20			increasing ranges of responsibility for Ireland and	10:3
21			Europe.	
22				
23			After that I joined Millipore Corporation in Strasbourg	
24			as European head of HR and deputy general manager for	
25			Europe. Then I became European head of HR for applied	10:3
26			materials based in Grenoble in France. They moved me	

27

28

29

Q.

to Silicone Valley in California, where I headed up

I think after that, you came back to Ireland

mergers and acquisitions for the organisation.

Т			then?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	5	Q.	And applied successfully for the position of executive	
4			director?	
5		Α.	Correct.	10:35
6	6	Q.	I think you took up your position on 3rd October of	
7			2014?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	7	Q.	Obviously a number of events had happened prior to your	
10			arrival, but you must have been familiar with them	10:35
11			obviously, the departure of Commissioner Callinan?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	8	Q.	I think Deputy Commissioner O'Sullivan had been	
14			appointed as acting commissioner after his departure.	
15			She was then appointed formally as Commissioner in her	10:35
16			own right. I think, did that happen before your	
17			arrival?	
18		Α.	She was acting commissioner on my arrival.	
19	9	Q.	On your arrival. But she was appointed shortly	
20			thereafter?	10:36
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	10	Q.	As executive director, could you just give us an	
23			overview of what your responsibilities were at that	
24			point in time and for what?	
25		Α.	The intention at the time in appointing a civilian was	10:36
26			that the organisation would begin a process of renewal	
27			and change, that there would be significant investment	
28			in the functions in my area, which included recruitment	
29			and selection of staff the office of professional	

1			standards, garda Internal Affairs, the office of the	
2			chief medical officers, all matters relating to	
3			internal competitions, industrial relations and the	
4			management of employee relations generally for both	
5			civilians and guards, the Garda College in Templemore	10:37
6			and a range of policy areas under each of those.	
7	11	Q.	Yes. I think the employee relations, that encompassed	
8			bullying and harassment and grievance procedures?	
9		Α.	Yes, it did.	
10	12	Q.	I think your responsibilities also covered, as part of	10:37
11			the employment issues, sick pay and matters related to	
12			that, sickness?	
13		Α.	That's correct. That is for the Garda force and for	
14			civilians.	
15	13	Q.	Did payroll management come under that, under your	10:37
16			watch?	
17		Α.	Tangentially in that it is managed by a central payroll	
18			function for the entire civil service based in	
19			Killarney.	
20	14	Q.	Yes. We will come to aspects of that in due course,	10:37
21			but your arrival then in October 2014, Sergeant McCabe	
22			had been identified as a Garda who made protected	
23			disclosures at that stage, is that correct?	
24		Α.	That's correct.	
25	15	Q.	I think you were appointed by the Commissioner as a	10:38
26			point of contact with Sergeant McCabe, was that from	
27			February 2015 onwards?	
28		Α.	Correct.	

29 16 Q. Had you met him prior to that?

1		Α.	No,	not	prior	to	that.
_	4 -	_	_	_	<b>.</b>		

2 17 Q. In terms of Garda Keogh with whom the Tribunal is 3 dealing now at this point, what was your awareness of 4 Garda Keogh's position, when you joined and then 5 shortly after?

- 6 I had no awareness prior to joining and really no Α. awareness in any material way until about 2016. 7 8 engagement with Sergeant McCabe was a unique appointment by the Commissioner. It essentially made 9 me the protected disclosures managers for dealing with 10 10:39 11 Sergeant McCabe. In the case of the response to the 12 2014 Act, the Commissioner appointed two protected 13 disclosure managers, Alan Mulligan and Chief 14 Superintendent McLoughlin in those particular roles, 15 for civilians and guards respectively. 10:39
- 16 18 Q. Now, Mr. Mulligan and Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, 17 they were effectively working under you, is that right? 18 A. They were.
- 19 Q. But were they reporting to you in relation to their
  20 management of protected disclosures from that period 10:39
  21 on?
- A. No, that's an important distinction, sir. The matters
  of protected disclosures are dealt with, it's quite an
  independent brief within a delegation from the
  Commissioner essentially to act as a PD manager. And
  to do so, the reporting line is directly to the
  Commissioner.
- 28 20 Q. So you have no oversight or, as it were, 29 responsibility, as such, for the management of those?

1		Α.	No.	
2	21	Q.	And were you or would you have been briefed as to the	
3			identity of anyone or any issues?	
4		Α.	Specifically no, and I wouldn't have asked in the	
5			circumstances if it was not in the public domain.	10:40
6			Protected disclosures managers effectively would have	
7			had responsibility to be recipients of protected	
8			disclosures in situations where they had arisen within	
9			the organisation. They would become investigators and	
10			managers of that investigation. They become protectors	10:40
11			under part 3 of the Act and they obviously communicate	
12			with the discloser on an ongoing basis, keeping them	
13			briefed on progress on their disclosure.	
14	22	Q.	Yes. We will see later in 2016 a debate about work	
15			related stress.	10:41
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	23	Q.	Two particular guards who were out on sick pay, Garda	
18			Y, who is not Garda Keogh, but Garda X sorry, I have	
19			it the other way round. Garda Y was another guard and	
20			Garda X was Garda Keogh, is that correct?	10:41
21		Α.	I don't know the designations of the Xs and Ys in this	
22			particular	

23 CHAIRMAN: There were two gardaí -- is it okay, can you hear me?

THE WITNESS: Surely, sir, yeah.

CHAIRMAN: There were two who in respect of whom there

10:41

were issues about work related stress; is that right?

That was my understanding.

MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.

25

26

27

28

- 1 CHAIRMAN: One was Garda Keogh and the other wasn't
- 2 Garda Keogh. It doesn't matter whether he was X or Y
- or z or anything else, all we need to know is that one
- 4 was Garda Keogh and one wasn't Garda Keogh.
- 5 THE WITNESS: Okay.
  - Okay. 10:42

10.42

- 6 CHAIRMAN: Is that right?
- 7 MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, but it is in the context where
- 8 Ms. Nugent met Garda X at a stage in 2016.
- 9 CHAIRMAN: She met the other officer.
- MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.
- 11 CHAIRMAN: The other garda.
- 12 MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.
- 13 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Ms. Nugent met the other idea.
- 14 24 Q. MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. I just want to be clear at the
- beginning, you had met Sergeant McCabe some time in
- 16 February 2015?
- 17 A. For the first time, yes.
- 18 25 Q. Immediately after your appointment, I think?
- 19 A. I was there since October '14.
- 20 26 Q. Yes. When was the first time that you met Garda Keogh? 10:42
- 21 A. I met him only once in my official capacity and that
- was on 15th December 2017.
- 23 27 Q. We will come back to that in due course. But the
- 24 Tribunal has heard that Garda Keogh, as a result of
- sick absences, had gone into a period of what's called
- 26 TRR?
- 27 A. Correct.
- 28 28 Q. I think you understand what that means?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 29 Q. Is that where his absences had exceeded 183 days, it 2 had an effect on his pay?
- 3 A. Yes.
- And in April of 2014, following a meeting with his 4 30 0. 5 superintendent, Superintendent Murray, he was referred 10:43 to the Chief Medical Officer, inter alia. 6 I just want 7 you to help me with your, either, involvement or knowledge at that stage. So could I ask you to turn to 8 page 3272, which is in Volume 11 of our books. 9
- should be there on your left-hand side. You are free to look at them either on the screen or in hard copy

- there. I'm not sure if they are coming up on our screens in front of us.
- 14 CHAIRMAN: Is it on your screen, Mr. Barrett?
- 15 A. I am seeing "Welcome to Dublin Castle".
- MR. McGUINNESS: A picture of Dublin Castle.
- 17 THE WITNESS: I have the letter, Chairman.
- 18 MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.
- 19 CHAIRMAN: Certainly I am seeing "Welcome to Dublin
- Castle". If we can do it reasonably quickly, well and 10:44
- good, if not we will carry on. Carry on,
- Mr. McGuinness. If anybody has a problem, just let us
- know.
- MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. We have seen this document
- before. 10:45
- 26 CHAIRMAN: Of course, yes.
- 27 MR. McGUINNESS: It is a report from Chief
- 28 Superintendent Wheatley dated 7th April 2015.
- 29 CHAIRMAN: Ah yes, I know the one.

1			MR. McGUINNESS: It is directed to executive director	
2			HRPD, sick report Garda Nicholas Keogh, Athlone Garda	
3			Station. It refers to correspondence from	
4			Superintendent Murray, which was his report of the 2nd	
5			April. Just to read the substantive paragraph in the	10:45
6			middle, it says:	
7				
8			"As outlined in the attached correspondence,	
9			Superintendent Murray believes that Garda Keogh would	
10			benefit from this referral to the Chief Medical Officer	10:45
11			as he has frequent sickness absences occurring in	
12			haphazard fashion. The referral to the medical officer	
13			may assist in providing additional workplace supports	
14			for the member who has indicated work related stress as	
15			a source for his absence."	10:45
16				
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	31	Q.	Now, I don't think I need to open Superintendent	
19			Murray's report, but it came following a meeting that	
20			he had with Garda Keogh at the end of March, there was	10:46
21			a referral up with medical certificates and so forth.	
22			But that on its face appears to be directed to your	
23			office, is that right?	
24		Α.	That's right.	
25	32	Q.	would that have come to you?	10:46
26		Α.	Truthfully, I have no recollection of this letter, I	
27			think it was responded to by Alan Mulligan, if I	
28			reading the succession correspondence. I get	
29			correspondence like this all of the time, but I would	

1			put it to the relevant section and that would have gone	
2			down to Alan, and then on to perhaps the folks in	
3			Athlumney House in Navan.	
4	33	Q.	Yes. I mean, if we do look on the next page,	
5			Mr. Mulligan deals with it, he dealt with it in the	10:46
6			interim, but he deals with it slightly later and at	
7			this point, but he is referring then back to the chief	
8			superintendent in the second paragraph, saying:	
9				
10			"You should now interview this member in order to	10:47
11			establish the source of the member's stress and if it	
12			is suggested as being work related stress a full	
13			investigation should be carried out."	
14				
15		Α.	Yes.	10:47
16	34	Q.	It calls for a medical report. But is that something	
17			that would happen normally or is that something that	
18			would be triggered by discussion with you about	
19		Α.	This is a very routine kind of enquiry. When I say	
20			routine, shall we say that in Mr. Mulligan's evidence,	10:47
21			I think he references we have up to 700 people absent	
22			on any given day. So, absences is a normal matter to	
23			deal with, but this obviously was a pattern of	
24			absences.	
25	35	Q.	Yes.	10:47
26		Α.	And so, it was elevated at chief superintendent level	
27			and Alan dealt with it in accordance with the policy,	
28			which is what he states here.	
29	36	Ο	VAS	

- It's for the chief to determine whether or not there is 1 Α. 2 a causal link. Historically, Chairman, and I am saying 3 this only to be helpful to the Tribunal, injury on duty, which is matter in the Garda Code dealt with at 4 11.37, I think you dealt with this in the course of
- 5 10:48 your inquiries. 6
- 7 37 Yes. Q.
- 8 It was always considered very simple blunt force injury Α. on duty kind of concept. With the development of 9 medical science around Post Traumatic Stress Disorder 10 10 · 48 11 and PTSD generally and it being a real issue, work 12 related stress was given some consideration. There was 13 a working group set up to give consideration to how that would be dealt with. 14
- 15 38 Q. Yes. 10:48
- 16 I think Chief Superintendent McLoughlin was originally Α. 17 involved in drafting a HQ Directive, which put the onus 18 on the chief superintendents to ensure that they 19 carried out the enquiries at local level as to whether 20 or not there was a link between an issue of work 10:49 related stress and work. 21
- 22 would you accept on a general level that there 39 Q. would be a duty on your department to, as it were, 23 24 ensure that that would be done?
- 25 Α. Yes. 10 · 49
- And particularly if it had an effect and possibly a 26 40 Ο. 27 detrimental effect on pay as to whether it was carried 28 out or not?
- 29 Yes, I would. I think Mr. Mulligan's efforts here are Α.

1	part	of	that	effort	generally	to	ensure	that	there	is
2	enqui	rie	es mad	de.						

- 3 41 Q. Yes. Could I just ask you then to look at another 4 report from Chief Superintendent Wheatley, dated 27th 5 April 2015. It's at page 3716 in the next volume. 10:49 will have to ask you to switch to Volume 13 there. 6 7 Chief Superintendent Wheatley had been in possession of 8 a report from Superintendent McLoughlin, that we needn't look at, it referred to further absences of 9 Garda Keogh, further medical certificates citing work 10 10:50 11 related stress. Chief Wheatley is writing here again 12 and looking for an expedited review. Again, it's 13 directed to you but does that ring a bell at all or 14 would it have been dealt with by Mr. Mulligan?
- 15 A. It would have been dealt with, there is a process by 10:50 which these matters are routinely dealt with.
- 17 42 Q. Yes, okay. We know in any event that the review was
  18 expedited and a date was fixed for the 19th May. Would
  19 you have been informed of the outcome of that review,
  20 whether the member was being certified as fit or
  21 otherwise?
- 22 A. I have no recollection of being informed that he was 23 fit or otherwise. But in the normal course I would see 24 these things in statistical form.
- 25 43 Q. Yes.
- A. We would track across the organisation data by grade,
  by region, but rather than at name level. So I
  wouldn't have been, you know, aware that this was Garda
  Keogh. I would have been watching the trend across the

- 1 organisation.
- 2 44 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. Single day absence, pattern absence, civilian absence
- 4 versus garda absence, absence by rank, absence by
- 5 region.
- 6 45 Q. Yes. If we turn in the same volume then to page 3719,

10:52

10:52

10:52

- 7 this is written to you explicitly at that time by
- 8 Dr. Oghuvbu?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 46 Q. This is obviously in the context of an intended
- appointment, but he has written back in relation to
- Mr. Mulligan's letter, which is in initial referral,
- which is referred to in the documents. But he is
- 14 writing back to you explicitly there.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 47 Q. Would that be common or would that be a matter of form?
- 17 A. It would be a matter of form. His superior at the time
- was Dr. Donal Collins, who was the Chief Medical
- 19 Officer.
- 20 48 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. Doctor Collins sat on my staff and was particularly
- 22 careful to manage both confidentiality and thorough
- reporting. So I am sure he would have named various
- 24 people at that point in time. I don't recall the
- letter, frankly.
- 26 49 Q. Yes.
- 27 A. But I would place a high degree of confidence that
- Donal Collins would have made some reference to it.
- 29 50 O. Yes. I think that's a fairly standard form as to what

1	is	required	to	be	done?
_	. •				

- 2 A. Yes.
- The appointment date is fixed and then there is an onus on local management to explain the purpose of it?
- 5 In the exception, I attended a number of case Α. 10:53 conferences of a medical nature, but by and large I 6 7 These case conferences would be attended by wouldn't. 8 staff from Athlumney House who administer sick pay and related benefits and generally there are -- there's a 9 decision tree which would go from, if you like, the 10 10:54 11 operational side and it would elevate to me by 12 exception.
- 13 52 Q. Yes.

29

- A. And I think that's ultimately what happened in

  September of '16, when the issue of pay with respect to 10:54

  Garda Keogh was brought to my attention.
- 17 53 But a slightly different question and focus now. Q. 18 Obviously Chief Superintendent Wheatley has written up, 19 drawing attention to the work related stress as a 20 possible source of the absence, the superintendent has 10:54 forwarded the original referral and supporting 21 22 documentation and then there's further documentation coming in, including actual reports from his own doctor 23 24 certifying him out with work related stress. When it 25 is now going to the doctor at this stage, would you 10:54 26 have expected the doctor, without an investigation 27 report locally, to assess a member for work related stress? 28
  - A. Doctors routinely -- we have three doctors, routinely

- 1 assess people for all kinds of reasons.
- 2 54 Q. Yes.
- So that would be, you know, any day you would walk to 3 Α. the surgery there would be a queue of people waiting to 4 5 see one or other of the doctors. That's a routine It happens all the time. 6 As do those case 7 conferences I describe, wherein consideration is given 8 to how pattern absentees, for example, are dealt with, or people with particular conditions arising from 9 accidents or injury on duty. 10

- 11 55 Q. Yes. Obviously Mr. Mulligan, we have seen one of the 12 first letters I asked you to look at, writing back to 13 chief Wheatley looking for an investigation into work 14 related stress. From your point of view, do you regard 15 a report of that investigation as a necessary 10:56 16 prerequisite for the doctor to go about assessing whether there is work related stress? 17
- 18 Not necessarily, No. I mean, the doctors are a Α. 19 tremendous resource, both for advice and for diagnosis. 20 So, there aren't strict preconditions which would guide 10:56 the engagement of a doctor. Donal Collins in 21 22 particular at that time would have been urging chief 23 superintendents throughout the divisions to reach out 24 and be proactive with respect to people who, for 25 example, had addiction problems or who had, you know, 10:56 26 psychological issues. He was hugely proactive in that 27 So there was an effort to be of assistance.
- 28 56 Q. Yes. Mr. Mulligan was met with the reply from chief 29 Wheatley dated 26th May 2015. Again, it's technically

1			addressed to you. It's at page 3276 in Volume 11.	
2			3276. She is reflecting a report from Superintendent	
3			Murray, which we don't need to go into, but she	
4			summarises it there in the second paragraph:	
5				10:57
6			"As outlined in the attached correspondence, the	
7			district officer Athlone advises that he cannot further	
8			explore the reasons for the member's alleged stress as	
9			the member is not willing to further discuss the issue	
10			which he states arising out of his involvement and	10:57
11			protections under the confidential reporting	
12			l egi sl ati on. "	
13				
14			Now, that appears to be the first mention in writing	
15		Α.	Yes.	10:57
16	57	Q.	of the link, as it were, between Garda Keogh, his	
17			absences, possible work related stress issues, medical	
18			certificate and then this impediment, as it were, to	
19			the investigation. First of all, just a question, to	
20			get it out of the way, you presumably didn't get this	10:58
21			or if you did it would have been referred on in the	
22			usual way?	
23		Α.	It was referred on in the usual way. I mean, the	
24			difficulty in the sense, in advance of the Covid break	
25			I read quite an amount of this material.	10:58
26	58	Q.	Yes.	
27		Α.	So I have a perception of it, but at the time I can	
28			certainly say this would not have been something I	
29			would have engagement with.	

- 1 59 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. Conscious also, you know, I have read carefully the
- 3 examination of Chief Superintendent McLoughlin and, you
- 4 know, he was actively engaged with his role as
- 5 protected disclosures manager after this. The original 10:59
- 6 complaint, as I understand it, Chairman, from Garda
- 7 Keogh was made under the old currency of the
- 8 confidential recipient.
- 9 60 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. So I think you're in a nether land time here between

10:59

10:59

- 11 Chief Superintendent McLoughlin's appointment and --
- we're post obviously the Act but we're pre the
- appointment.
- 14 61 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. This is the first time also I would have noted that in
- my reading of this material now, as opposed to then.
- 17 62 Q. Yes. I mean, it is perhaps unfair to look back with
- total 20/20 vision, but this issue here of the linkage,
- it did give rise to the problem that you attempted to
- 20 resolve with Chief Superintendent McLoughlin a year
- later, the inability to actually have an 11.37
- investigation. But I am just wondering, looking back,
- do you accept perhaps that this should have been picked
- up at the time in some way?
- 25 A. Well, it was dealt with, I think, again, and I fully
- accept your 20/20 hindsight issue, because I have been
- trying to identify the same difficulty.
- 28 63 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. Yes, the onus -- let's be clear about this, the onus

1 rests on the chief superintendent to conduct an 2 investigation. That's what the HQ Directive says. I 3 think Chief Wheatley made certain efforts and we can see from the correspondence that those efforts did not 4 5 reach conclusion. 11:00 6 64 Yes. Q. 7 A year on, as you said, I had to make a decision in Α. 8 this matter. 9 65 Yes. Q. 10 And I decided in favour of Garda Keogh, and I think Α. 11:00 11 properly so. 12 66 Well, we will come to that obviously. I think perhaps Q. 13 it may be the case that it certainly didn't become a 14 financial issue, because Garda Keogh at this point was certified fit for work. 15 11:01 16 Correct. Α. 17 67 And went back to work. And he wasn't necessarily then, Q. 18 at that stage, tripping into TRR? 19 Correct. Α. 20 There may not have been, as it were, the financial 68 0. 11:01 hardship arising from this issue as such? 21 22 I think your point that this had potentially a flag Α. 23 element to it is correct. 24 Just going forward to later in the year, there were 69 Q. 25 various absences from work by Garda Keogh throughout 11:01 later 2015. Superintendent Murray was seeking a 26 27 further referral and a case conference. A case 28 conference took place in relation to Garda Keogh and 29 the doctor I think wrote to you again. If we look at

Т			page 3751 in volume 13. Again, is that pretty standard	
2			form there?	
3		Α.	Absolutely, yeah. Yeah. And the response to it looks	
4			very standard also, yes.	
5	70	Q.	Yes. Now, we know from Dr. Oghuvbu, his own evidence,	11:02
6			he saw Garda Keogh and Garda Keogh produced a document	
7			in terms of a list to him and talked him through	
8			different issues that he had at work relating to his	
9			superintendent and his employers. But ultimately he	
10			reported to you on the 8th January. If we look at page	11:03
11			3750 in the same book there. If we look at the top	
12			there. It's addressed to you directly, as it were.	
13			Would that have come past you or would it have been	
14			automatically referred on by your office?	
15		Α.	It would have been automatically referred on.	11:03
16	71	Q.	Pardon?	
17		Α.	It's a report of a consultation, yeah.	
18	72	Q.	Yes. Now, he refers there to issues relating to his	
19			work, workplace accommodations adjustments there in the	
20			last paragraph. In the first page paragraph:	11:04
21				
22			"Against a background of reported issues in the	
23			workpl ace or associated work"	
24				
25			Would you expect although he is respecting his	11:04
26			obligation of medical confidentiality, he is signalling	
27			something there? Would you expect that to have been	
28			picked up upon by someone in your office or by someone	
29			to whom this report was referred on?	

- A. Yeah, I think the -- I am looking at the letter. I haven't studied this correspondence before. The answer
- is yes in general terms, I would have expected that
- 4 people would have responded or picked up on this. You
- 5 know, inappropriate use of alcohol", "workplace or
- associated", yeah, "issues", I would have expected that

11:05

11:05

11:05

- 7 would raised a flag, yes.
- 8 73 Q. Obviously the doctor there isn't engaging in any
- 9 discussion about whether there is work related stress
- or what his own doctor is certifying, but would you
- 11 expect if there is a query raised with the doctor about
- how he was being medically clarified, that perhaps best
- practice might have been important?
- 14 A. Mr. McGuinness, this is new to me in the sense that I
- haven't seen this document before. But I would very
- much expect and I would be surprised if there wasn't a
- follow through from some other part of the organisation
- 18 with respect to this correspondence.
- 19 74 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. I don't know if it's there.
- 21 75 Q. CHAIRMAN: Which section would you be looking for,
- Mr. Barrett.
- 23 A. I would expecting that the sick and absence section,
- sir, would be the appropriate people to deal with it.
- 25 76 Q. CHAIRMAN: who is in charge of that section?
- 26 A. Monica Carr led that section in Athlumney house. It is
- a significant team of people.
- 28 77 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 29 A. All familiar with both the regulations and, you know,

Т			engaging with the office of CMO and Dr. Oghuvbu, who	
2			worked for Donal Collins at the time and was part of	
3			that team.	
4	78	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So the sickness and absence section?	
5		Α.	Yes.	11:06
6	79	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Is that, so to speak, the SAMS section?	
7		Α.	Well SAMS is the system that they use.	
8	80	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. So the sickness and absence section	
9			in Athlumney House in Navan, they should have picked up	
10			on this?	11:06
11		Α.	I think so, yes.	
12	81	Q.	CHAIRMAN: was it said to them?	
13		Α.	I would assume it was.	
14			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
15		Α.	I would assume it was.	11:06
16	82	Q.	CHAIRMAN: How would we know whether it was or not?	
17		Α.	Because my office would generally forward it there,	
18			in they maintain files on it's from them that I	
19			get the statistics with respect to numbers of people	
20			absent by region etcetera.	11:07
21	83	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So this comes to your office?	
22		Α.	It does.	
23	84	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And who deals with it?	
24		Α.	My clerical staff would deal with this in the normal	
25			way. It would normally be then sent for Alan	11:07
26			Mulligan's attention and subsequently to Monica Carr.	
27			In 2015 Alan may have been in fact heading up Athlumney	
28			House at that point.	
29	85	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes. If we look at some further	

Т			correspondence. I mean, at this point in time Garda	
2			Keogh was, I don't say permanently absent, but he was	
3			certified as unfit on the basis of work related stress	
4			from his own doctor from the beginning now of 2016	
5			onwards, just if we are looking forward from that date.	11:07
6			If we look at page 3744, Ms. Carr there.	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	86	Q.	This is again Volume 13. Ms. Carr has scheduled him	
9			for review. So that process has kicked in at that	
10			point in time?	11:08
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	87	Q.	You'd expect that to be normal?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	88	Q.	Normal procedure. If we then look about the	
15			appointment, the chief superintendent is written to, at	11:08
16			3747. That letter, if we go to 3747, issued then to	
17			the chief superintendent. That would appear to have	
18			issued on foot of a letter from the doctor to you, if	
19			we look at 3748?	
20		Α.	Yes.	11:09
21	89	Q.	Again, it's addressed to you directly. He refers back	
22			to his earlier, as it were, formal report after the	
23			would that be standard procedure?	
24		Α.	It would be. This is Monica Carr identifying herself.	
25			Essentially it's under my style and title as executive	11:09
26			director, but to the sickness and absence section. She	
27			was at the time heading up that part of the Athlumney	
28			operation, as well as being the director there at the	
29			time, she was doing two jobs.	

1	90 Q.	Yes. Now, Garda Keogh's evidence is that he raised an	
2		issue of misclassification with the doctor at the	
3		December consultation and then it raised its head again	
4		at the consultation on 19th May 2016, that Garda Keogh	
5		attended. He also gave evidence, the doctor gave	1:10
6		evidence that he actually received and took a copy of a	
7		script which was headed "harassment index" on that	
8		date. But in the interim, Chief Superintendent	
9		Wheatley had written to you again on 18th May 2016,	
10		which as it turned out was the day before the	1:10
11		appointment was fulfilled. But if we look at page 3203	
12		in Volume 11. She is referring to an earlier report	
13		from Superintendent Murray, who is keeping her	
14		up-to-date. She also says:	

15

"I have also on today's date visited the member at his
home to enquire into his welfare and wellbeing. I
enquired as to the probability of him returning to work
in the future and was advised by Garda Keogh that his
current absence is attributable to work related stress

2122

progressed outside the Westmeath division. Garda Keogh

arising from his involvement in investigations being

11:11

11:11

11:11

23

intimated he would not be returning to work until these

matters had been concluded as these matters were

24

exacerbating his conditions.

2627

28

29

Garda Keogh stated that he would be attending the scheduled appointment with the Chief Medical Officer on the 19th May and informed me that he was engaging with

resumption to duty I will ensure that a full 2 3 investigation is conducted to establish the source of the member's alleged work related stress and if same 4 5 can be attributed to his absence." 11:12 6 7 Is that correspondence that would you have seen at that 8 point? I think it's about that point that I became aware that 9 Α. we had a difficult problem to address. 10 11:12 11 91 Q. Yes. 12 I think that is the first occasion I think I list in my Α. 13 own chronology attached to my own statement. 14 92 Q. I mean, it does raise issue and I am wondering whether 15 one could regard it as topsy-turvey in the sense that 11:12 16 the member is out sick --17 Yeah. Α. 18 93 -- allegedly due to work related stress, he is saying Q. 19 there can't be a work related stress investigation, in 20 a sense, and that he wouldn't be returning to work 11:13 until his investigations had taken place. And on the 21 22 other hand, the chief superintendent is saying that she 23 won't be able to or won't be conducting a work related 24 stress until he returns to duty. Did you see that as a Catch 22? 25 11:13 26 Yes. Α. Or is that a fair comment?

the Employee Assistance Service. Upon Garda Keogh's

1

27

28

29

94

95

Q.

Α.

Q.

I think that's a fair comment.

And can I ask you to express a view as to what you

- think the way out at this point perhaps might have
- 2 been?
- 3 A. At this point in time I had a conversation, at least
- 4 one that I can remember with Tony McLoughlin, Chief
- 5 Superintendent McLoughlin, about this. Because having

- 6 been the author of the policy, he was very anxious --
- or the author of the HQ Directive, he was very anxious
- 8 that the division would conduct this particular review
- and he, I think, concludes about this time or shortly
- thereafter that this is, as you describe it, a Catch 22 11:13
- 11 situation.
- 12 96 Q. Yes. Now, I don't think -- subject to what you may
- tell me, Garda Keogh had written to the Minister on the
- 14 16th May. If we look at page 3296.
- 15 A. 3296.
  - 16 97 Q. He is making a final point there. You saw this letter
  - 17 later in the year I think?
  - 18 A. Yes.
  - 19 98 Q. It was referred at a later stage. Garda Keogh is
  - 20 making many points in the letter but this is one to the 11:15
  - 21 Minister about the penalisation issue. I think you
  - became aware that Superintendent McLoughlin spoke to
  - Garda Keogh on the phone on the 20th?
  - 24 A. Yes.
  - 25 99 Q. They had a second conversation then on the 23rd, where
  - 26 Chief Superintendent McLoughlin gave an undertaking to
  - look at the misclassification issue?
  - 28 A. Correct.
  - 29 100 Q. Isn't that correct? Did you become aware yourself that

- 1 Garda Keogh's SAMS record was changed then at that
- point in time from ordinary illness flu/viral to mental
- 3 health?
- 4 A. That's correct, I was informed of that.
- 5 101 Q. Superintendent McLoughlin met Garda Keogh then on the

11 · 16

11:16

- 6 3rd June and he was given a copy of the harassment
- 7 index, did you discuss that with you?
- 8 A. Not until afterwards, he met him, as I understand it
- 9 now, in Tullamore with the employment assistance
- officer who was supporting Garda Keogh in that period.
- 11 102 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. Michael Quinn, Garda Michael Quinn.
- 13 103 Q. He did express the wish at that meeting also that the
- 14 classification would be changed from mental health and
- enquired about whether it should be in fact certified
- as injury on duty?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 104 Q. I think you became aware of that at that point?
- 19 A. So, in ease of the Tribunal's understanding of these
- 20 matters, you may very well have covered this in fine
- detail already, so just to reiterate, injury on duty is
- a designation under the Code where effectively a chief
- 23 superintendent has the Authority to determine that
- somebody's absence through injury has arisen because of
- 25 their duties. And effectively, an 11.37 maintains the
- pay and benefits levels of that member at a full level
- on an ongoing basis for a period of time.
- 28 105 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. Normally it's reviewable, within quarterly or whatever

Τ			time norizons were set, depending on the nature of the	
2			injury. In parallel, at about this time, counsel,	
3			there's a working group looking at the matters I	
4			referred to earlier, as to whether or not an 11.37 is a	
5			suitable way to deal with stress/post traumatic injury.	11:1
6			And that is also seeking to progress some kind of	
7			definitions on this matter. The chief did not seek to	
8			address this by way of 11.37, is my understanding.	
9	106	Q.	Yes. We know that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin went	
10			back to Chief Superintendent Wheatley to say was an	11:1
11			investigation done?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	107	Q.	And she replied, repeating the previous explanation?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	108	Q.	That seems to have been accepted or was there a	11:1
16			discussion between yourself and Chief Superintendent	
17			McLoughlin about that issue?	
18		Α.	Well, Chief Superintendent McLoughlin advised me that	
19			he was very uncomfortable with the fact that we	
20			couldn't ground it upon the kind of investigation that	11:1
21			would normally be the practice in circumstances like	
22			this.	
23	109	Q.	Okay. In any event, he addressed the e-mail to	
24			Ms. Carr and also to you on the 4th June. If we could	
25			look at bottom of page 9695, which is in Volume 34, it	11:1
26			should be there beside you. At the bottom of the page	
27			the e-mail commences, the last few lines, and if we go	
28			on then to page 9696, it refers there to two Gardaí.	
29			Garda Y is Garda Keogh. Garda X is another garda. And	

Τ			it notes the CMO's position then in relation to both of	
2			them, it notes that both of them are on reduced pay.	
3			It says in the fourth line:	
4				
5			"The investigation of work related stress allegations	11:20
6			are ongoing and are likely to be complicated."	
7				
8			Now that's not accurate as far as Garda Keogh is	
9			concerned, isn't that correct?	
10		Α.	Sorry, what page are you on, Mr. McGuinness?	11:20
11	110	Q.	The e-mail starts at the very bottom of 9695 and it	
12			goes on to the next page?	
13		Α.	Okay. And the fourth line?	
14	111	Q.	The fourth sentence, the fourth paragraph, as it were?	
15		Α.	Fourth paragraph. Yeah.	11:20
16	112	Q.	Do you think it is the case that Chief Superintendent	
17			McLoughlin was anticipating that there was going to be	
18			an investigation or that	
19		Α.	I can't say. It's imprecise.	
20	113	Q.	In any event, he expresses a view that it's urgent and	11:20
21			that at a minimum the pay status should not change	
22			without personal contact being made with the members	
23			concerned. And then it concludes by saying:	
24				
25			"This requires urgent attention. My recommendation is	11:21
26			that a mechanism be found for pay not to be reduced	
27			while matters are under consideration."	
28				
29			You got that, I take it?	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 114 Q. Mr. Downey replies, if we go back to 9695, and then
- 3 Chief McLoughlin replies to Mr. Downey and it is copied
- 4 just to you and the chief is saying:

5

6 "A change of mindset required here."

7

- 8 Do you see that?
- 9 A. Yes, I do. And I think the concluding sentences are
- 10 important.

11:22

11:22

- 11 115 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. I would be at one with the chief on that.
- 13 116 Q. Yes. In any event, if we look at 9687 in the same
- volume, you're copied in on all of this these?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 117 Q. I don't think we need to go through them, but I just
- 17 want to confirm that you're aware of them?
- 18 A. I am aware of the deliberations of the committee. I
- sat in on several of its meetings because this was
- 20 regarded as an important matter.
- 21 118 Q. Yes. We saw from Chief McLoughlin's opening one, he
- thought it was a good idea to meet with both?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 119 Q. If we see at 9692, it appears that Ms. Nugent met Garda
- 25 X, who is not Garda Keogh, that afternoon. If we go to 11:23
- 9684, we see that same e-mail, it goes up to Ms. Carr?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 120 Q. And then there is a process proposed by Ms. Egan?
- 29 A. Yes.

which was a general draft proposal, isn't that correct? 1 121 Q. 2 That's correct. Α. 3 122 And then it goes from Ms. Carr back up to Ms. Nugent, Ο. 4 including you. And then, at the top is your e-mail to 5 everyone else, saying: 11:24 6 7 "This is a special case. There needs to be a 8 restoration of full pay for Garda X." 9 I am just wondering where Garda Keogh is Garda Y, was 10 11 · 24 11 there some distinction being made at the time there? 12 These cases were decided contrary to the arrangements Α. 13 for pay generally. 14 123 Q. Yes. 15 And the decision taken was, and I am not altogether Α. 11:24 16 clear who Garda X is, but any changes made at that time 17 with respect to altering TRR or injury on duty 18 arrangements would have to be recommended by me to the 19 Commissioner. By you? 20 124 Q. 11:25 21 Α. Yes. 22 125 That's why I am wondering, you had been briefed by 0. 23 Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, who had met Garda 24 Keogh --25 Yes. Α. 11:25

-- and had a number of phone calls with him.

confirmation that Chief Superintendent Wheatley hadn't

in fact conducted a work related stress investigation?

There was

26

27

28

29

126

0.

Α.

That's correct.

- 1 127 Q. It appears to have been ongoing in relation to the
- other officer. I am just wondering, was there not a
- 3 logic to take the same decision in relation to each of

11 - 25

11:26

11:26

11 · 27

- 4 them at the same time?
- 5 A. We took a decision at a later stage, I think it is
- 6 delayed by two or so months from this date.
- 7 128 Q. Yes.
- 8 A. I think it's September, Mr. McGuinness, that the
- 9 decision was taken with respect to Garda Keogh.
- 10 129 Q. Yes. Now, I mean, in fairness, I do want to note that
- the doctor's report was still awaited. And that was
- sent to you on the 10th June. Was that a factor, do
- you think, involved; that you were waiting for the
- 14 doctor?
- 15 A. I am sure it was a factor. But whether it was a
- determining factor or not, I can't say. Quite frankly,
- I am not familiar with these papers in a way that
- perhaps I should be.
- 19 130 Q. In any event, that is your decision in relation to the
- 20 other quard?
- 21 A. Yes, with the approval obviously of the Commissioner.
- 22 131 Q. Yes. Well, could we see what Chief Superintendent
- 23 Wheatley wrote to you on the 8th June, it's at 3266.
- 24 A. Yeah.
- 25 132 Q. Back in volume 11. She had sent e-mails back in the
- period we have just been looking at, the 4th/5th June.
- 27 But this is a more formal report.
- 28 A. Yes, I think this was requested by Tony, Chief
- 29 Superintendent McLoughlin.

1	133	Q.	So she is setting out if we go on to page 3267, the	
2			report commences there.	
3		Α.	I have it.	
4	134	Q.	In the second paragraph she recites the current	
5			position and in the fourth line she says:	11:28
6				
7			"Efforts are being made locally to establish the source	
8			of the member's alleged work related stress. However	
9			the member is reluctant to discuss the matter as he	
10			indicated that it arises out of matters which he has	11:28
11			reported through the confidential reporting mechanism,	
12			matters which he does not want to discuss with	
13			management within the division."	
14				
15			She then refers to Superintendent Murray's meeting with	11:28
16			him on the 26th March and she tabs a report. On the	
17			next page she tabs further reports. She seems to be	
18			satisfied that Superintendent Murray has made the	
19			necessary enquiries, in the middle of that page, 3268.	
20			At the bottom of page 3268 she says:	11:28
21				
22			"Despite a number of enquiries with Garda Keogh to	
23			establish the source of his alleged work related	
24			stress, the member has continuously correlated his	
25			involvement as confidential reporter to his absence	11:28
26			through alleged work related stress. I am also	
27			conscious that the member's continued absence was the	
28			subject of a case conference in December 2015."	
29				

1 She refers to the different correspondence there. Page 2 3269, in the middle she says: 3 "He hasn't indicated there were incidents." 4 5 11:29 6 Then her conclusion is at the bottom of that page, if 7 we scroll down to the final paragraph. She seems to be 8 saying effectively that it hasn't proved possible to conduct a full investigation and she doesn't believe 9 any further or specific information be provided by 10 11:29 11 Garda Keogh which would enable the further 12 investigation. 13 14 "However, and to be clear and to avoid any doubt, I am 15 to enquire if there is any requirement to further 11:29 16 investigate Garda Keogh's absence through alleged work 17 related stress. In the event that further 18 investigation of this matter is warranted, I would 19 recommend that permission be granted to appoint an 20 inspector outside the Westmeath division to conduct 11:29 same." 21 22 23 So, in a sense she is saying the division now can't do 24 it, and I am telling you they can't do it and are you requiring me to do it, and if you are not going to do 25 11:30 26 that would you get somebody else appointed. 27 recollect was there any discussion between yourself and Chief Superintendent McLoughlin about getting an 28

29

outside officer in to try and break the impasse?

1		Α.	There was. The discussion centred around the meeting	
2			that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin had had five days	
3			earlier with Garda Keogh in person at the Tullamore	
4			Court Hotel. I think there's confirmation of that	
5			meeting, at which Chief McLoughlin described himself	11:30
6			essentially as the single point of contact going	
7			forward. I think also Garda Keogh recorded in a letter	
8			to the Minister on the 14th June, if I am not mistaken,	
9			that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin undertook to	
10			investigate matters.	11:30
11	135	Q.	Yes. If we look at the doctor's report then at 3741.	
12			This is sent to you by name. Do you recall getting	
13			this?	
14		Α.	Mr. McGuinness, can you advise me, 3741? This is	
15			Volume 34?	11:3
16	136	Q.	No, I am sorry, Mr. Barrett, we're back to Volume 13?	
17		Α.	13, my apologies. I have it now.	
18	137	Q.	It's obviously in the context of this point in time.	
19			It's after the decision has been made about the other	
20			guard being restored to full pay. Then the doctor's	11:32
21			report becomes available on the 10th and it's sent to	
22			you, it would appear. Would you recollect getting	
23			that?	
24		Α.	No, I don't.	
25	138	Q.	Okay.	11:32
26		Α.	I would have seen these letters by exception. But I	
27			would have had a discussion with Chief McLoughlin in	

139 Q. Yes. In any event, in the last paragraph he says:

28

29

the case but I don't remember this letter specifically.

2			"In the context of ongoing background issues reportedly	
3			associated with the member's work which appear to be	
4			having a significant negative effect on the member's	
5			sense of wellbeing and maintenance of same recommend a	11:3
6			priority service is involving your office and the	
7			member's senior divisional management. This would	
8			facilitate elucidation of reasonable and practicable	
9			support re workplace considerations to foster his	
10			sustained wellbeing and effectiveness when a return to	11:3
11			work becomes feasible."	
12				
13			In any event, that was arranged and I take it you were	
14			informed of that at that time?	
15		Α.	Yes, in normal course I would be aware that these case	11:3
16			conferences would be happening, the specific details	
17			being brought to my attention.	
18	140	Q.	Yes.	
19		Α.	I understand a case conference did go ahead.	
20	141	Q.	I think the doctor reported the outcome of that to you	11:3
21			at 3740, if we just go back two pages?	
22		Α.	Sure, yeah.	
23	142	Q.	You became aware that there was a programme of	
24			treatment agreed upon?	
25		Α.	Yes.	11:3
26	143	Q.	And to some extent substantially funded as well; isn't	
27			that correct?	

29

Α.

I would have approved that, yes. Chief McLoughlin is

acting at this point, as I understand it, in his role

1			as protected disclosure manager.	
2	144	Q.	Yes.	
3		Α.	So, I can identify between the lines here of what's	
4			actually being said by Dr. Oghuvbu, and I was aware of	
5			the generality that we were going to support a	11:34
6			programme and we had made arrangements for its funding,	
7			as you said.	
8	145	Q.	Yes. Chief Wheatley appeared to have been enquiring	
9			about the issue of an investigation, because she wrote	
10			again on 25th July 2016, if we look at page 3314?	11:35
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	146	Q.	That's addressed to the chief superintendent, which is	
13			Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, isn't that correct?	
14		Α.	Correct.	
15	147	Q.	She is restating the position there, but she is also	11:35
16			saying:	
17				
18			"While these matters have been reported on by this	
19			office in the past, a decision in respect of the	
20			further investigation of this matter has not been	11:35
21			received at this office. Accordingly in the interest	
22			of providing clarity and to avoid any doubt, I am to	
23			enquire if an investigation into the alleged work	
24			related stress Garda Keogh is to be carried out	
25			locally."	11:36
26				
27			Now, Chief McLoughlin wrote back, if we go back to page	
28			3313. This is the response, he says:	

1			"I wish to advise that this correspondence should be	
2			redirected to the executive director, Human Resources	
3			and People Development for the attention of Sick	
4			Section, Navan, who deal with this issues relating to	
5			si ck.	11:36
6				
7			I also wish to draw your attention to the Garda Code	
8			instructions on this matter."	
9		Α.	That last sentence is important I think,	
10			Mr. McGuinness, in light of where the responsibility	11:36
11			lay for conducting that investigation.	
12	148	Q.	Yes. But does 11.37 not require the divisional officer	
13			to do it rather than the Sick Section?	
14		Α.	No, an 11.37 is a decision with respect to an injury on	
15			duty.	11:36
16	149	Q.	Yes.	
17		Α.	The instructions in this matter, the Garda Code	
18			reference there, I think is in relation to the	
19			investigation of the matter.	
20	150	Q.	Yes.	11:37
21		Α.	Which lay with, as far as Chief McLoughlin, as I	
22			understand it, was concerned, that should have been	
23			conducted in the routine way in the first instance by	
24			Chief Wheatley. Chief Wheatley's position on this is	
25			she couldn't do it because Garda Keogh was out and he	11:37
26			wasn't cooperative. I understand on the 3rd June, when	
27			Chief McLoughlin and Garda Quinn met with Garda Keogh	
28			in Tullamore, at that meeting I think there was a	
29			commitment that the chief would actually conduct some	

1			form of investigation. But he is conscious of the	
2			fact, and I think he's correct in this regard, that the	
3			fundamental responsibility for managing the	
4			determination of this lay with Chief Wheatley.	
5	151	Q.	Yes. I don't know whether you can comment on this, but	11:37
6			it doesn't appear that she was ever after this further	
7			request ever actually given an instruction to do it or	
8			told how she should go about it or whether an	
9			independent inspector or superintendent from some other	
10			division should do it?	11:38
11		Α.	I can't comment, I'm not that familiar with the	
12			correspondence trail.	
13	152	Q.	Yes. But can I ask you this question: If it did	
14			remain uninvestigated from that time to this, would you	
15			regard that as a fault in the system or an omission	11:38
16			that ought not to have occurred?	
17		Α.	well, I can say that it was an outstanding matter at	
18			the time I came to consider the issue of pay.	
19	153	Q.	Yes.	
20		Α.	In September.	11:38
21	154	Q.	Yes. I am looking, as it were, beyond your own	
22			responsibility and credit for that obviously, but if it	
23			remained uninvestigated, would you regard that as a	
24			failure of the system?	
25		Α.	well it's certainly contrary to what the system	11:39
26			suggests should have happened.	
27	155	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Barrett, can you say, what was the	
28			question to be investigated?	
29		Α.	I understand the question to be whether or not the	

- absence of Garda Keogh was caused by the stress that he alleged occurred at work.
- 3 156 Q. CHAIRMAN: By?
- 4 A. The work related stress.
- 5 157 Q. CHAIRMAN: What does that actually mean. What was the
- 6 question that somebody was going to say, right, let's
- 7 get to the bottom of this?
- 8 A. Somebody would have had to determine was there a causal
- 9 link between -- was there reason to believe that he was

11:40

- out on foot of the matters that he alleged occurred.
- 11 158 Q. CHAIRMAN: His doctor was certifying that he was
- 12 suffering from work related stress?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 159 Q. CHAIRMAN: And that was the reason why he was absent.
- So, I am trying to understand, what was the nature of
- the investigation?
- 17 A. Well, there wasn't an investigation in any meaningful
- 18 way.
- 19 160 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, but what was the nature of the
- investigation that was intended or supposed to be
- 21 carried out?
- 22 A. Well, in the normal course, if it was --
- 23 161 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do you understand me?
- 24 A. I do, I do.
- 25 162 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, I am wondering, was this something a 11:40
- garda would undertake, something a doctor would
- 27 undertake, something, I don't know, a psychiatrist, a
- 28 psychologist, what was the question they were trying to
- answer?

Т		Α.	Normally in the course of these things it would be	
2			determined with reference to the CMO's office and by	
3			local garda management.	
4	163	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean, it's very simple: If somebody says,	
5			look, Garda Ryan and Garda Barrett were on the beat	11:40
6			when people came up and beat them up, injury on duty,	
7			no problem?	
8		Α.	Correct.	
9	164	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's simple?	
10		Α.	Yes.	11:41
11	165	Q.	CHAIRMAN: As you say, it's more difficult if it's post	
12			traumatic stress or if it is of a psychological nature?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	166	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's not obvious, it's more difficult?	
15		Α.	It is.	11:41
16	167	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But I am just wondering, so suppose Chief	
17			Superintendent Wheatley said, very good, I am going to	
18			either get somebody to do this or I am going to do it	
19			myself?	
20		Α.	Correct.	11:41
21	168	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Very good. One would think that she would	
22			explain to Garda Keogh, look, this is important,	
23			because of whatever other reason, it's important	
24			because your sick pay	
25		Α.	Exactly.	11:41
26	169	Q.	CHAIRMAN: is very much dependent on this, you're on	
27			a pension rate at the moment and your service is, so to	
28			speak, interrupted because you're not qualifying for	
29			pension and so on, all your entitlements. Here is a	

1			big issue for you. So, you know, put him in the	
2			picture?	
3		Α.	Correct.	
4	170	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Nobody seems to have done that?	
5		Α.	Well, you're absolutely right, Chairman. In the normal	11:4
6			course across 41 divisions, there are adult to adult	
7			conversations, difficult things every day. And they	
8			normally work very well. That's what I think Chief	
9			McLoughlin was anticipating should happen in this	
10			particular case and that is what clearly didn't happen	11:4
11			in this particular case.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
13	171	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Obviously without commenting, and this	
14			question isn't commenting on anyone's position, but it	
15			requires cooperation with the process in a sense?	11:4
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	172	Q.	And perhaps an exploration as to why people mightn't be	
18			prepared at any particular time to cooperate with the	
19			process. But ultimately, is it dependent on that, is	
20			it wholly dependent on that in your view?	11:4
21		Α.	Well, I credit Chief McLoughlin for his meeting on the	
22			3rd June, in that he opened a channel of dialogue	
23			directly with Garda Keogh. I understand from papers I	
24			have now read that he undertook to conduct some form of	
25			investigation, into what specifically I'm not sure.	11:4

27

28

29

But at least there was an engaged conversation around

correspondence from Chief Wheatley. She called to his

house, certainly, but she didn't manage to get past his

the issues. I think that's what is missing in the

1			view that I'm not talking to you. I was mindful of	
2			that when it came to making a decision in September.	
3	173	Q.	All right. Perhaps we would look at just a note	
4			relating to the decision, there's a degree of	
5			uncertainty about when you met with Mr. Mulligan and	11:44
6			Chief McLoughlin and made the decision.	
7		Α.	There is.	
8	174	Q.	Can I ask you to look at this note, volume 35, at	
9			10072.	
10		Α.	35, yeah.	11:44
11	175	Q.	This is a standard form, it's form D22B, which is meant	
12			to be filled out on a current basis to continue the	
13			authorisation to grant full pay.	
14		Α.	Correct.	
15	176	Q.	If we just go down the screen there, this is one of	11:44
16			these that records this, it's for a different later	
17			period obviously. But it records:	
18				
19			"I now request permission to authorise to grant the	
20			member full pay for the 4/8/17-31/8/17 as per chief	11:44
21			superintendent HRPD and executive director HRPD on	
22			27/9/16. "	
23				
24			That would appear to suggest, I know it's not your	
25			document, it's from the pay section, that they appear	11:45
26			to have been told this is when the decision was taken.	
27			If we look at the e-mail that Chief McLoughlin has	
28			given evidence about at 3441. You see there that's	
29			from Chief McLoughlin to Clare Egan:	

1				
2			"You will be aware from previous discussions that Garda	
3			Keogh is out of work on sick leave with what I	
4			understand to be stress related. I believe he is on	
5			reduced or no pay at this stage. I also understand	11:45
6			your department has written to DPERS for clarification	
7			on this situation. In the meantime I recommend that	
8			this member is restored to full pay as soon as possible	
9			pending the outcome of your report to DPERS.	
10				11:46
11			I would be obliged if I can be informed when this is to	
12			happen so I can contact the member."	
13				
14			In any event, you met with Chief McLoughlin and	
15			Mr. Mulligan around this time and he was certainly	11:46
16			strongly of the view and recommended it to you and you	
17			agreed with that, as I understand it?	
18		Α.	That's correct.	
19	177	Q.	This was in a formal sense your decision to recommend	
20			this?	11:46
21		Α.	Correct.	
22	178	Q.	We had some discussion with some of the other witnesses	
23			about what full pay meant here?	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	179	Q.	But Mr. Mulligan on Day 144, we needn't look at it, but	11:46
26			he said full pay is basic pay but not the allowances?	
27		Α.	Correct.	
28	180	Q.	You'd agree with that?	
29		Α.	I would. Allowances are paid for such things as	

Т			unsocial nours working, shill work and in circumstances	
2			where those hours aren't required of somebody then the	
3			payment for them doesn't arise. So there is a loss, if	
4			you like, to normal earnings in being restored to full	
5			basic pay, which is what we did here.	11:47
6	181	Q.	Mr. Mulligan said, I mean, that there was a number of	
7			things under consideration at the meeting as per the	
8			e-mails, were we penalising him by applying the sick	
9			regulations strictly and were we on humanitarian	
10			grounds possibly victimising him also?	11:47
11		Α.	We sought direction from the Department of Public	
12			Expenditure and Reform on that matter and Mr. Mulligan	
13			brought that to the table as I recall. This matter	
14			seen through the prism of part 3 of the Protected	
15			Disclosures Act gives rise to real considerations of	11:48
16			whether penalisation arises or not. That's the basis	
17			on which Mr. Mulligan sought the input of DPER.	
18	182	Q.	Yes. Mr. Mulligan also told the Chairman at the time,	
19			we couldn't do the allowances because there was no	
20			11.37, I think you would agree with that?	11:48
21		Α.	well, there was no 11.37, that's correct.	
22	183	Q.	In any event, if we go to 3442, we see Chief McLoughlin	
23			receiving the e-mail from Ms. Egan on the 6th October	
24			from pay section. Did Chief McLoughlin tell you that	
25			he informed Garda Keogh to inform him of this?	11:48
26		Α.	I read that.	
27	184	Q.	And that he then wrote to him also formally to inform	
28			him of that. Perhaps we will look at that, because it	
29			is relevant to your state of knowledge about the	

1			bullying and harassment issue. If we look at page	
2			3467. The second paragraph:	
3				
4			"I wish to advise that I have pursued the issue of your	
5			pay and have written to civilian HR in Navan in order	11:4
6			to progress same. At this stage you should be returned	
7			to the payroll.	
8				
9			In the interest of clarity and completeness I wish to	
10			ask if it is your intention to make a formal complaint	11:4
11			under bullying and harassment policy in addition to any	
12			other complaints made by you. I appreciate that you	
13			indicated to me on the phone that it is not your	
14			intention to do so."	
15				11:4
16			Was that something that the chief had advised you of at	
17			the time?	
18		Α.	Yes. We had had a discussion about this time,	
19			obviously the pay meeting that we held brought it	
20			was a single issue meeting as I recall and it was	11:5
21			purely focused on Garda Keogh.	
22	185	Q.	Yes.	
23		Α.	So, there was clarity required around this. I	
24			understood from Chief McLoughlin that there was some	
25			previous engagement with GSOC and I couldn't understand	11:5
26			how that arose but I thought it was useful to ask that	
27			question.	
28	186	Q.	Yes. Garda Keogh replied, if we look at the next page,	
29			3468, he says:	

"I wish to acknowledge receipt of correspondence.
also acknowledge that I have been returned to the payroll.

11:50

11:51

11:51

11:51

I accept I made an indication to you regarding bullying and harassment. However, the fact that I have reported this and supplied relevant documents to support my allegations. I understand there are obligations for both myself and An Garda Síochána to have this investigated under the terms of bullying and harassment policy of An Garda Síochána and I wish to make a formal complaint in relation to same."

I think you were informed of that, I think Chief McLoughlin recommended to Ms. Hassett that there would be a full investigation into the matter. Mr. Mulligan opened a file in the matter on the 1st November, and I think you then wrote to Garda Keogh on the 15th November. If we look at that letter, page 3472. You are saying there:

"I refer to correspondence dated 20th addressed to Chief Superintendent McLoughlin in which you state that you wish to have the complete dealt with formally. Please be advised that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin has no role in the investigation of complaints made under the harassment policy other than to provide advice and support to members on the policy."

Т				
2			That is because he was the equality officer I think; is	
3			that right?	
4		Α.	That's correct. No, he could it was open to Chief	
5			McLoughlin to actually conduct an investigation in his	11:52
6			autonomous role as the equality officer, that is	
7			clearly stated I think at 7.4 in the policy.	
8	187	Q.	Yes.	
9		Α.	But that wasn't happening here.	
10	188	Q.	Yes. It says:	11:52
11				
12			"I've enclosed a copy of the policy" Sorry, I	
13			should read the previous sentence:	
14				
15			"However, he does not investigate complaints made under	11:52
16			the policy. I have enclosed a copy of the policy for	
17			your information in particular which may be of	
18			assistance to you."	
19				
20			Then you detail various matters. Then you conclude by	11:52
21			saying on the next page:	
22				
23			"The person appointed to investigate a complaint under	
24			the policy must be higher than the complainant and the	
25			person complained of and be not lower than inspector	11:53
26			rank. While you have provided certain documentation to	
27			Chief Superintendent McLoughlin regarding your	
28			complaint it is unclear from same against whom the	
29			allegations are being made, the exact detail/nature of	

Τ			your complaint and the highest rank being complained	
2			of.	
3				
4			To ensure the resolution of your complaint may be	
5			commenced the details referred to above should be	11:53
6			provided by you to your divisional officer at your	
7			earliest convenience."	
8				
9			Can I ask you, had you considered the documentation	
10			that Chief McLoughlin had been sent in the post?	11:53
11		Α.	I hadn't seen it.	
12	189	Q.	You hadn't seen it. Did your office receive that?	
13		Α.	No, I think Chief McLoughlin in his own evidence said	
14			he gave it to Kathleen Hassett and it was kept under	
15			lock and key, I presume that's the same document.	11:53
16	190	Q.	You never saw it as part of your function to	
17		Α.	I'd add no value to that.	
18	191	Q.	Yes. I think Chief McLoughlin informed you of a call	
19			that he had with Garda Keogh on the 25th November,	
20			where he, Garda Keogh, said he understood the process,	11:54
21			that he was seeking legal advice, but also indicating	
22			that making the complaint to his divisional officer,	
23			who was Chief Gralton, at the time, could be an issue?	
24		Α.	I don't recall that, and I know that when the	
25			relationship that I subsequently discovered well after	11:54
26			the fact, the familial relationship between Chief	
27			Gralton and Superintendent Murray, I was not aware of	
28			at the time. So if I was told it, I simply didn't	
29			recall it	

- 1 192 Q. Okay.
- 2 A. The chief did write to me I think or suggest to me that
- because of the nature of this my letter was asking him
- 4 to put the complaint through the people he was
- 5 complaining of. And I think we went and made an

11:55

11:55

11:56

- 6 alternative arrangement.
- 7 193 Q. Yes. I think you were made aware by Mr. Mulligan, who
- 8 phoned Mr. Cullen I think, and there was an offer even
- 9 to go down to meet Garda Keogh and Mr. Cullen to take
- the complaint or discuss the issue with them, is that
- 11 correct?
- 12 A. Yes, I read that.
- 13 194 Q. But also then you received a letter from Mr. Cullen I
- think, if we look at page 3476. This was addressed to
- a number of people, including you, and it sought a
- number of different things. Did you reply to that, do
- 17 you recall?
- 18 A. I think there was action taken on foot of it, I don't
- 19 know if I made a reply. I know that at that point in
- 20 time I received a direction thereafter to make certain
- 21 that there was a statement taken on this matter.
- 22 195 Q. Yes. I think the PIAB authorisation issued in respect
- of Garda Keogh's application to initiate proceedings
- and I think you were made aware of that at one stage?
- 25 A. I have seen the papers.
- 26 196 Q. Yes. But then on the 15th December you were in contact
- 27 with Chief McLoughlin again about the matter, if we
- look at page 3495. That related to gathering up all
- the information for the defence of the bullying and

Т			narassment claim in the proceedings, do you recall	
2			that?	
3		Α.	I know vaguely about this. I would have simply	
4			received a query from legal and I would have passed it	
5			to the two relevant gentleman, Chief McLoughlin and	11:57
6			Alan Mulligan.	
7	197	Q.	Okay. Mr. Cullen wrote to you again on the 15th	
8			December. If we look at page 3504. And it says:	
9				
10			"Dear, Mr. Barrett, Minister and Ms. O'Sullivan.	11:57
11				
12			We refer to the letter of Mr. Barrett dated 11th	
13			November 2016 requesting further information on the	
14			bullying and harassment complaint.	
15				11:57
16			Please note Garda Keogh hereby again invokes his rights	
17			under such bullying and harassment policy. Garda Keogh	
18			advises that he wishes to make a statement of complaint	
19			under said policy as soon as practicable to a	
20			non-conflicted officer."	11:58
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	198	Q.	"Please advise when and where he can make further such	
23			statement of complaint as soon as practicable."	
24				
25			I think the Commissioner made an instruction on the	11:58
26			following day, she obviously having received this, that	
27			a statement should be taken as a matter of priority?	
28		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
29	199	Q.	That was sent to you, that instruction, isn't that	

- 1 correct?
- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 200 Q. That's at 3506, we don't need to look at that. You
- 4 nominated Chief Superintendent Roche on the 20th, is
- 5 that correct?
- 6 A. I did.
- 7 201 Q. If we go to page 3507, the next page that is, and this

11:58

11:59

11:59

- 8 is directed to Assistant Commissioner Fanning?
- 9 A. Yeah.
- 10 202 Q. You're in the middle paragraph nominating him to
- investigate the complaint. But it was his
- responsibility to make the appointment.
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 203 Q. Would you just explain that, because it seemed to
- become an issue in a minor way, perhaps?
- 16 A. Okay. Again, the regulations suggest that those with
- policy responsibilities have the facility to nominate
- somebody, but those with line responsibilities have the
- 19 Authority to make the appointment.
- 20 204 Q. Yes. I think you were copied on an instruction to a
- 21 different chief superintendent, Chief Superintendent
- 22 Scanlan?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 205 Q. On the 23rd December?
- A. Just to clear this up, Mr. McGuinness.
- 26 206 O. Yes.
- 27 A. In very simple terms: There was a period of time when
- 28 chief superintendent John Scanlan and Garda Nicholas
- 29 Keogh was were in the same district together, I think

- 1 at a time when --
- 2 207 Q. He was stationed in Ballynacarrigy?
- 3 A. Correct. I was searching for it, thank you.
- 4 208 Q. Yes.
- 5 A. And the basis for me recommending Gerry Roche was to
- 6 avoid the possibility that this matter would become an

12:00

12:00

12:01

- 7 issue of they having had a prior relationship or
- 8 whatever.
- 9 209 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. Assistant Commissioner Fanning assured me that wasn't
- an issue and to expedite matters and to proceed, I was
- quite pleased with his assurances and I then nominated
- 13 Chief Superintendent John Scanlan.
- 14 210 Q. Yes. So that, as it were, that divisional
- responsibility was respected in that regard?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 211 Q. Okay. In any event, I think Chief Superintendent
- McLoughlin was looking for an update as to what was
- happening in early January and I think you received an
- 20 update from Assistant Commissioner Fanning on the 31st
- 21 January. Perhaps if we look at that, page 3515. If we
- go down the page. Chief Superintendent Scanlan's
- report is attached, which is on the next page, if we
- 24 scroll on further. Then that reports on the actual
- then raising of a potential issue of conflict?
- A. Again, I should just point out, this is precisely the
- 27 kind of thing that I was seeking to avoid by my
- 28 nomination of Roche in the first instance.
- 29 212 Q. Yes. I think Assistant Commissioner Fanning didn't

1			perceive that there was a conflict in the sense that it	
2			wouldn't prevent him taking statement, whatever about	
3			investigating it?	
4		Α.	Correct, and that's ultimately how I think it was	
5			resolved.	12:02
6	213	Q.	Yes. I think you became aware of a request from the	
7			Commissioner's office to hold a case conference in the	
8			matter and that Mr. Mulligan was to be responsible for	
9			that, is that correct?	
10		Α.	Yes.	12:02
11	214	Q.	I think you took the view that a case conference	
12			couldn't be held until you had received the results of	
13			Chief Superintendent Scanlan's efforts to take a	
14			statement of complaint, isn't that correct?	
15		Α.	Well, the conference was to be about the nature of the	12:03
16			complaints.	
17	215	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	And that was the purpose of the statement.	
19	216	Q.	Yes. From the point of view of the Commissioner, the	
20			Commissioner's office through I think Superintendent	12:03
21			walsh was, I won't say keeping the pressure on but	
22			regularly enquiring whether a statement had yet been	
23			taken?	
24		Α.	Correct.	
25	217	Q.	When it was going to happen, that it would be	12:03
26			progressed as soon as possible?	
27		Α.	And somewhere in there I think I wrote to Assistant	
28			Commissioner Fanning circa March and asked about the	
29			progress of	

- 1 218 Q. Yes. 2 A. -- the discussions.
- 3 219 Q. Yes. I think you sought an update in early April and

you had by the 12th April I think received -- you received a report of the 12th April on the 21st April.

6 If we look at page 10021. That is quite clear as to

what is enclosed there, just to note the middle

12:04

12:05

12:06

8 paragraph.

9

7

"This office is now in respect of a further report dated 12th April from chief superintendent Portlaoise enclosed document of Garda Keogh dated 2nd March 2017 relevant appendices please.

14

Assistant commissioner Eastern Region will now give 12:05
this matter further consideration and report more fully
in early course."

18

- 19 Do you recall getting that?
- 20 A. I don't, and I don't recall the enclosures.
- 21 220 Q. Yes. Well, that document referred to, it's a five-page
- 22 typed script, unsigned?
- 23 A. Unsigned.
- 24 221 Q. Yes. Perhaps if we scroll down the page to 10013.
- This is the report of Chief Superintendent Scanlan of
- the 12th April that I referred to, which is his report
- 27 relating to that five-page statement.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 222 Q. And he describes what happens there. Now, I think you

T	received a second report from Assistant Commissioner	
2	Fanning on the 28th April, could we look at that, at	
3	page 3525. I am sorry, that is your report to Chief	
4	Superintendent McLoughlin. You are reporting to him	
5	that Garda Keogh provided the chief superintendent with	12:0
6	a prepared statement, documents are currently being	
7	considered by assistant commissioner Eastern Region and	
8	you will advise him of developments on receipt of a	
9	further report from that assistant commissioner.	
10		12:0
11	The consideration of the documents had been earlier	
12	reported to you by Assistant Commissioner Fanning, if	
13	we just go back a little bit in time to the 5th April,	
14	at page 6823. I think the minute of the 22nd March,	
15	you're referring to there in the first line is a	12:0
16	request for an update. He is reporting to you the	
17	following by way of interim report:	
18		
19	"Chief Superintendent Scanlon Portlaoise has sent me	
20	one part of a two part report from Garda Keogh.	12:0
21		
22	I am examining it and from an early perusal of the file	
23	it appears to be much wider than a bullying and	
24	harassment issue.	
25		12:0
26	I will revert on receipt of the next phase of the	
27	report."	
28		
29	And there doesn't appear to have been anything enclosed	

1			with that.	
2		Α.	There wasn't. Not that I have seen.	
3	223	Q.	In any event, you acknowledged receipt of Assistant	
4			Commissioner Fanning's second report to you, the one we	
5			looked at, of the 12th April, sorry on the 21st April,	12:08
6			if we look at your letter at 6872. That says:	
7				
8			"I am to acknowledge receipt of your correspondence	
9			dated 21st inst. made under the above caption, the	
10			contents of which are noted.	12:09
11				
12			I await your further report in due course."	
13				
14			So that is acknowledging receipt of the report of the	
15			21st with the five-page statement	12:09
16		Α.	Well, I wondered about that, Mr. McGuinness. "The	
17			contents of which are noted", I have sought from both	
18			the Tribunal and from other sources whether or not this	
19			attachment was given to me at that point in time. I	
20			can't determine whether it was.	12:09
21	224	Q.	Yes. Well, we just looked at that report of the 21st,	
22			if we go back to 10021?	
23		Α.	Yes. So let's be clear as to what I was expecting to	
24			receive. The terms of reference that John Scanlan was	
25			pursuing was to determine the to take statement in	12:10
26			full from Garda Keogh of his complaints and to	
27			determine on foot of those complained of the level of	
28			the person to be appointed to conduct the B&H	
29			investigation.	

1	225	Q.	Yes.	
2		Α.	Okay.	
3	226	Q.	So you're raising a query as to whether you got the	
4			five-page unsigned statement with that?	
5		Α.	The five-page unsigned statement effectively enabled	12:10
6			nothing to happen. What we needed was, ultimately what	
7			we got I think much later, the comprehensive document,	
8			I think it runs to 18 different sections, signed and	
9			dated the 27th March. I think that reached my office	
10			on the 4th October.	12:11
11	227	Q.	Yes. Well, perhaps we will look at the letter that	
12			Assistant Commissioner Fanning sent to you on 24th May	
13			2017?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	228	Q.	He had had some and instructed Inspector McCarthy to	12:11
16			have some further dealings and enquiries with Garda	
17			Keogh in the interim about what further matters he	
18			wished to have encompassed in the investigations. But	
19			ultimately he made this report to you on the 24/5. If	
20			we look at page 10049. Now, he refers to your original	12:11
21			correspondence tab A, which we are not concerned with.	
22				
23			"I also refer to correspondence from this office dated	
24			21, tab B."	
25				12:12
26			Which we have just looked at.	
27				
28			"Which refers to the statement of the 2 nd March and	
29			your correspondence dated 20th April at tab C."	

Τ				
2			Which is the acknowledgment of that?	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	229	Q.	He then says:	
5				12:12
6			"On the 16th May 2017 I also corresponded with Garda	
7			Keogh copy attached tab D."	
8				
9			That is neither to you or from you. Then he refers to	
10			a discussion with Mr. Mulligan. Then he refers to a	12:12
11			phone contact with Inspector McCarthy?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	230	Q.	And then he refers to:	
14				
15			"Garda Keogh also stated that he first raised his	12:12
16			issues as outlined in his statement to Chief	
17			Superintendent Scanlan, directly with Chief	
18			Superintendent McLoughlin HRM in June 2016, some 11	
19			months ago."	
20				12:13
21			If we continue down then. There is reference to a	
22			sergeant that we needn't be concerned with. Then he	
23			starts referring to the statement.	
24				
25			"One of the greatest issues of concern to me is the	12:13
26			opening line of Garda Keogh's statement dated 27th	
27			March 2017: Following my making protected disclosures	
28			I encountered harassment, exclusion victimisation	
29			penal i sati on "	

2			Etcetera, etcetera. Then he says:	
3				
4			"I am not aware of the issued raised under the	
5			protected disclosures investigation. However, these	12:13
6			matters are now raised in both statements and in his	
7			account Inspector McCarthy may welcome within protected	
8			disclosures policy. It is clear that his allegations	
9			are grounded in his current status as protected	
10			disclosure discloser. I am of the view that this could	12:13
11			well be treated as effectively being a protected	
12			disclosure and it may well be that those allegations	
13			are included in the earlier disclosure."	
14				
15			Then he refers to an incident about Garda A.	12:13
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	231	Q.	Then the next paragraph, if we scroll down:	
18				
19			"The issues set out in the statement witnessed by Chief	
20			Superintendent Scanlan and the additional list set out	12:14
21			in the unsigned statement also handed to Chief	
22			Superintendent Scanlan by Garda Keogh are most serious.	
23			The allegations could in some circumstances merit a	
24			criminal investigation and the allegations include an	
25			allegation against the Garda Commissioner by a	12:14
26			protected discloser. I am of the firm view that the	
27			bullying policy is not wide enough to include the	
28			comprehensive investigation you decide. The decision	

1		
2	He footnotes that. He says:	
3		
4	"I am reluctant to make any appointments in this matter	
5	as there may well be a conflict of interest in that I	12:14
6	had prior involvement in a previous correspondence with	
7	Garda Keogh and if may well be the perception of the	
8	parties that I would not be impartial. Garda Keogh	
9	corresponded with me on the 15th April 2015 to which I	
10	i ssued a response."	12:14
11		
12	That was the request from Garda Keogh to meet him,	
13	which Assistant Commissioner Fanning didn't in the	
14	instance. He then concludes by saying:	
15		12:15
16	"You will recall in correspondence dated 20th May, tab	
17	E, that Chief Superintendent Roche was nominated to	
18	investigate the complaint under the bullying and	
19	harassment policy and was requested of me to formalise	
20	the appointment. You will also note that Garda Keogh	12:15
21	informed Inspector McCarthy that he had first raised	
22	these issues directly with Chief Superintendent	
23	McLoughlin HR PD in June 2016 and that information then	
24	provided with as not made available to me as part of	
25	the decision-making process.	12:15
26		
27	I recommend a full investigation into these matters."	
28		

Now, there is no tab including Garda Keogh's statement

- of the 27th March there, the signed one, with different
- 2 appendices. He does refer to a very small portion of
- 3 the content. But, was that statement of the 27th
- 4 received by you in the office with this?
- 5 A. No. Shall I say, at that particular date, that letter, 12:16
- 6 I wasn't actually there, but notwithstanding, I didn't
- 7 receive it until the 4th October.
- 8 232 Q. Well, I think you were asked in the course of your
- 9 interview with the investigators about a number of
- reminders that issued from the assistant commissioner's 12:16
- 11 office?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 233 Q. You recall that?
- 14 A. I do, I was very troubled about it.
- 15 234 Q. And there were reminders referred to in the interview

12:17

12.17

- and related to letters of the 16th June, the 17th
- 17 August, the 1st September and the 22nd September, and
- 18 they're at pages 6879, 6882, 6884 and 6889. Do you
- recall getting those reminders?
- 20 A. Well, curiously that summer had two --
- 21 235 Q. Pardon?
- 22 A. That summer had two very significant issues for me that
- were going on and that I think would have been well in
- the public domain. The first half of my year was very
- 25 taken up personally with the financial irregularities
- at the Garda college.
- 27 236 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. This led to a Public Accounts Committee hearing that
- occurred in May. Immediately after that I was away for

- 1 two weeks, during which that time Assistant
- 2 Commissioner Fanning met with Alan Mulligan, who was my
- delegate, in my absence. I was doing some exams at the
- 4 time. I returned in June for a further hearing at the
- 5 Public Accounts Committee and it's in that interregnum

12 · 18

12:19

- 6 that this correspondence that you've just opened
- 7 arrived in my office.
- 8 237 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. The second series of letters that came from Assistant
- 10 Commissioner Fanning, there are two of them in an
- August window, which fall I think between the end of
- 12 July and the 22nd August.
- 13 238 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. In this period of time I was on annual leave and again
- doing exams. I did have no recollection, so when I saw 12:18
- these the dates from the investigators of the Tribunal
- 17 I was troubled, because I had no knowledge of receiving
- this critical report, the statement of Garda Keogh,
- 19 prior to October. And the suggestion was made to me,
- well, you had to have received it. And the short
- answer is, I didn't. Now, I was troubled by it as we
- went through this evidence and I said, I will need to
- see the records.
- 24 239 Q. Yes.
- A. And it's only, Mr. McGuinness, having read the
- transcripts of the Tribunal itself that I come to
- 27 understand actually what had happened.
- 28 240 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. But when I was interviewed I didn't have the benefit of

1			that.	
2	241	Q.	Yes. Well, I mean, in relation to the first reminder	
3			on the 16th June, you appear to have replied on the	
4			17th June?	
5		Α.	Yeah, I would have been there for that.	12:20
6	242	Q.	Pardon?	
7		Α.	I would have been in, at work at that date.	
8	243	Q.	Yes. And you may recall that, your reply referred to	
9			the fact that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin was away	
10			for three weeks?	12:20
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	244	Q.	Isn't that right?	
13		Α.	This was with reference to a case conference that I	
14			understand we were seeking to advance at that time.	
15	245	Q.	Yes. But if we look at the first letter, 6879, this is	12:20
16			from Assistant Commissioner Fanning and that's the 16th	
17			June, it says:	
18				
19			"I refer to my previous correspondence to you dated	
20			24th May 2017.	12:20
21				
22			It is three weeks since my last correspondence for	
23			which I have received no acknowledgment. I believe	
24			that taking all factors into account that any delay	
25			should be kept to a minimum.	12:20
26				
27			I am keen to revert to Garda Keogh with a decision with	
28			I believe to be straightforward.	
29				

Т			i awart your response.	
2				
3			That is dated 16th June. In terms of what was in that,	
4			he was recommending a full investigation, larger than a	
5			bullying and harassment?	12:2
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	246	Q.	Of a sort of Byrne-McGinn model essentially, is that	
8			what you took from that?	
9		Α.	Well, I didn't, because the correspondence that I	
10			understand he had met with Alan Mulligan circa 22 May	12:2
11			in my absence, and that the reference to larger at that	
12			point, he was talking about a Byrne/McGinn model	
13			certainly when we sat down for conversation on the 3rd	
14			October, he was very of the view that a Byrne-McGinn	
15			type model would work. The decision on a bullying and	12:2
16			harassment policy rested with me. I had to make a	
17			determination whether or not the confines of the policy	

would be sufficient or whether there were matters in

the statement, at which time I hadn't actually seen the

12:22

12.22

21 247 Q. Yes.

full statement.

18

19

20

A. Were such that it needed a Byrne-McGinn type model or
whether bullying and harassment could take care of it.

The reality of the request that was made by Garda Keogh
was, he was seeking for action under the policy. And
it was Assistant Commissioner Fanning's respectful
view, and I respect his experience, he sat in my chair
before I did, that it required something larger.

29 248 Q. Yes.

1	Α.	I, in my letter back to Mr. Cullen, I think on or about	
2		the 13th October, made it clear I was going to	
3		deliberate on it and I told I think that I would take a	
4		month or take to the end of the month of October to	
5		determine whether or not it was a Byrne-McGinn or	12:2
6		bullying and harassment type investigation. At the end	
7		of the day I made a determination that it was more	
8		suitable that it be a bullying and harassment type	
9		investigation and I did so because the policy provided	
10		a framework under which if there were, for example,	12:2
11		elements of criminality, they could then be assessed	
12		and independently investigated. One did not preclude	
13		the other.	

- 14 249 Q. Yes. And I mean, it is easy for us to look back and
  15 say but it seems clear that you didn't know what was in 12:23
  16 Garda Keogh's original protected disclosures or what
  17 allegations, criminal or otherwise, were being enquired
  18 into?
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 250 Q. And it would appear that Assistant Commissioner Fanning 12:23
  21 didn't either, because he was not -- I think he didn't
  22 have knowledge of what was in the allegations that were
  23 being investigated?

- A. But, Mr. McGuinness, he had the benefit of the statement of the 27th March, which I didn't.
- 26 251 Q. Just in relation to that, having received his report, 27 as it were, if we could call it that, of the 24th May, 28 I am just wondering why you mightn't have written back 29 to him saying, look, you're referring to the statement

1			of the 27th, please send me a copy of it.	
2		Α.	Well I wasn't there. The 24th March, I went looking at	
3			that point in time to see had we received the documents	
4			and we hadn't. Curiously, I get these follow up	
5			e-mails or letters from Assistant Commissioner Fanning	12:2
6			through the summer and we're still awaiting the Scanlan	
7			report.	
8	252	Q.	Well, perhaps we will just look at them in sequence.	
9			If we go to your reply to the letter of the 16th, which	
10			is on the 17th, 10057. If we scroll down there.	12:2
11				
12			"I act to acknowledge receipt of your correspondence.	
13				
14			Please advise that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin is	
15			on annual leave for three weeks and on his return l	12:2
16			will arrange a meeting to discuss issues arising in	
17			this matter."	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	253	Q.	Obviously a meeting was what was being sought by the	
20			Commissioner at case conference, you had in a sense	12:2
21			postponed it earlier because you hadn't got Scanlan's	
22			statement?	
23		Α.	He had asked Alan Mulligan in my absence to make	
24			arrangements to have a conference.	
25	254	Q.	Could we look at the next letter of the 17th August,	12:2
26			6882?	
27				
28			"I am directed by assistant commissioner Eastern Region	
29			to refer to above and previous correspondence dated	

Т			24th May and 16th June.	
2				
3			Assistant commissioner enquires as to present position	
4			regarding this matter please."	
5				12:26
6			Do you recall	
7		Α.	I wasn't there at the time, I was absent at that time.	
8	255	Q.	Okay. 11th September, 6884?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	256	Q.	He refers to the previous letters, refers to your	12:26
11			previous correspondence, and then he says:	
12				
13			"You will recall my correspondence dated 24th May that	
14			I recommended a full investigation into these matters	
15			and Lordship that any delay should be kept to a	12:26
16			mi ni mum.	
17				
18			I would appreciate your response to these matters,	
19			which are ongoing sometime."	
20		Α.	Yes. I think there is a further letter later in	12:26
21			September that requested either we were going to have	
22			this case conference Alan Mr. Mulligan had sought	
23			to bring the various matters together on a number of	
24			occasions through the summer and I think he references	
25			illness and absence and certainly my absence would have	12:27
26			been part of it, as to why that conference didn't take	
27			place.	
28	257	Q.	Yes.	
29		Α.	So I was reading this correspondence in that context.	

1			There is a letter later in September I understand from	
2			Fintan, from Assistant Commissioner Fanning, which	
3			arrives at about the same time that we had received a	
4			letter from Mr. Cullen. Now, a couple of things that	
5			need to be said about this particular correspondence.	12:27
6			It's very clear at this point in time that Garda Keogh	
7			is to be considered in the prism of protected	
8			disclosure. The reference in the earlier letter to	
9			protected disclosure I think is really important. So	
10			that, matters from the time that Chief Superintendent	12:27
11			McLoughlin identifies himself as the protected	
12			disclosures manager are dealt with in 2016 and the	
13			early part of '17 almost exclusively by him. This	
14			correspondence from Assistant Commissioner Fanning	
15			breaks that loop to some degree in the summer of 2017.	12:28
16	258	Q.	well, I suppose he is reacting to what he has read in	
17			the statement on one view?	
18		Α.	Yes.	
19	259	Q.	That he is concerned that it is quite a different bag	
20			of issues?	12:28
21		Α.	But it would still fit under the umbrella of a	
22			protected disclosure, though he sees it as broader than	
23			a bullying and harassment issue.	
24	260	Q.	Yes. Perhaps we will look at this letter of the 22/9	
25			at 6889?	12:28
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	261	Q.	He refers to the previous correspondence and then he	
28			copies you with a letter from Mr. Cullen's office?	
29		Α.	Yes.	

Т	262	Q.	rogether with a retter from Garda Reogn?	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	263	Q.	And then he says:	
4				
5			"Assistant commissioner has directed me to acknowledge	12:29
6			receipt of letter from John Gerard Cullen. Assistant	
7			commissioner Eastern Region is awaiting confirmation	
8			from your of a meeting to discuss this matter."	
9		Α.	Correct.	
10	264	Q.	You yourself though had received from Garda Keogh in	12:29
11			the summer, earlier, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	I had, in July.	
13	265	Q.	Yes. Could we look at that page?	
14		Α.	Yeah.	
15	266	Q.	Volume 35?	12:29
16		Α.	That's the one, there's no response given to that, I	
17			think.	
18	267	Q.	No response given to this?	
19		Α.	No, to the letter from Keogh in July, from Mr. Cullen	
20			in July.	12:29
21	268	Q.	Right. Well perhaps we'd look at the letter that was	
22			sent to you, 10064. That's dated 12/7. They're	
23			enclosing a letter, a manuscript from Garda Keogh dated	
24			the 9th July.	
25				12:30
26			"This letter (which speaks for itself) contains an	
27			initial garda attachment."	
28				

That is a SAMS record

29

"Which records his current absence from work as being due to mental health issues.

In relation to this latter matter, Garda Keogh was
originally incorrectly recorded by An Garda Síochána as
being somebody sent from work due to flu instead of
work related stress. This flu was clearly contradicted
by his doctor's certificates which restated work
related stress.

An effect of such early misrepresentation of his disability was firstly a failure to initiate any timely investigation into the causation of such work related stress. A second consequence was that he was not, for a substantial period of time, given his basic rate of pay. We understand that both an investigation and the payment of wages are mandatory in accordance with long established custom and practice in respect of work related stress. We enclose here with a letter from the general practitioner dated 31st January 2017 confirming for the voidance of doubt the diagnose of work related stress.

It now appears that instead of rectifying the official record from flu to work related stress in June 2016 there has been a further error in categorisation by An Garda Síochána such that he is now currently being recorded as being absent from work for mental health

1	reasons. A further consequence of this latest official	
2	error is that there has again been a further	
3	prolongation of a failure by An Garda Síochána to	
4	initiate any investigation into the causation of such	
5	work related stress together with a denial to Garda	12:31
6	Keogh of payment of wages at the full rate of pay.	
7	This latter is ordinarily paid to gardaí who are absent	
8	from work due to work related stress.	
9		
10	In all the circumstances we would be grateful if you	12:31
11	might furnish all documentation relating to decisions	
12	taken by An Garda Síochána to incorrectly Garda Keogh	
13	firstly as being absent with the flu (contradicting the	
14	regulation notice from his physicians of work related	
15	stress) and secondly, being absent with mental health	12:32
16	issues thereby further preventing any investigation and	
17	the payment of wages at a full rate. We should also be	
18	grateful if you might kindly furnish us with all	
19	documentation which relates to either the delayed,	
20	partial or full denial of payment of full wages in this	12:32
21	case and to the failure to investigate such serious	
22	matters of harassment for over a year now."	
23		
24	Then it refers to the Data Protection Act etcetera.	
25	But Garda Keogh's letters that came with that is at	12:32
26	10066. And again, that's addressed directly to you.	

27

28

29

"I am writing in relation to my sick record, Garda Nicholas Keogh. I am a garda that had made a protected

1			disclosure. I was forced to go out sick on 26/12/15	
2			can work related stress. I was curiously being	
3			recorded sick with the flu.	
4				
5			I met with Chief Superintendent McLoughlin on the 3rd	12:33
6			June '16 who undertook"	
7				
8			If we scroll down the page Mr. Kavanagh	
9				
10			"to address my sick record and did so.	12:33
11				
12			However, under Freedom of Information request I	
13			received my absence report (attached) where I am now	
14			marked out sick with mental health despite my sick	
15			certs stating work related stress.	12:33
16				
17			I now understand that your office may not be aware of	
18			same.	
19				
20			For your information please and yours sincerely."	12:33
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	269	Q.	Now, I think you received those letters, isn't that	
23			correct?	
24		Α.	I did, after I returned.	
25	270	Q.	Yes. And I think	12:33
26		Α.	Can I just	
27	271	Q.	A draft was prepared for you to send out in reply in	
28			the middle of August, is that correct?	
29		Α.	That's correct. Mr. McGuinness, can I just deal with	

1			this, because I am very conscious of the realities of	
2			this. The Chairman mentioned SAMS earlier. This is a	
3			fairly rigid system in which there are a series of drop	
4			down menus for the categorisation of absence and for	
5			dealing with general causes associated with people	12:34
6			being sick or absent and there isn't, certainly there	
7			wasn't then, any categorisation specifically for work	
8			related stress. The nearest approximation of it, and	
9			you know, I am very sensitive to people's concerned	
10			around labels and being labelled in a mental health	12:34
11			context, and indeed, you know, An Garda Síochána has	
12			tried to deal with building support systems to support	
13			people with mental health. Chief McLoughlin has been	
14			in the vanguard of that. But I could understand the	
15			distress this caused and it is a function of the drop	12:34
16			down menus on the SAMS system and perhaps Chief	
17			McLoughlin should have gone back and explained we don't	
18			have specific label that says work related stress and	
19			clarify the point before it came a clear bugbear to	
20			Garda Keogh and for that I am apologetic, but it is the	12:35
21			reality.	
22	272	Q.	So may we take it from that, that this wasn't sort of	
23			an individual fault or omission directed at Garda Keogh	
24			as such?	
25		Α.	No.	12:35
26	273	Q.	But just simply the way the system was?	
27		Α.	That's an excellent and important observation,	

28 29 Mr. McGuinness. There would have been other various

forms of condition that would have been dealt with

_	 	_
2	what the printout clearly said.	
1	under the general label of mental health.	And that's

In any event, we will see in due course a reply Q. ultimately issues but I think the office and the sick pay section had prepared a draft for you and you probably saw that on your return from holidays but another letter had come in from Mr. Cullen's office on the 17th August directed to a number of people. look at that, 10094. If we just scroll down the page there, the second paragraph there it says:

"We now understand Garda Keogh's express complaints of harassment, bullying, detrimental treatment and his formal invocation of the Garda bullying and grievance procedures have been suspended. Garda Keogh has been advised in fact that the whereabouts (in An Garda Síochána) of his formal complaints are unknown. His complaints have effectively been clandestinely secreted and covered up."

12:36

12:36

12:37

12:37

Could I just ask you to comment on that from your knowledge or perspective?

A. I think I addressed this question, Mr. McGuinness, when the Tribunal investigators asked me was, I think, the complaint lost. And at no point was the complaint lost 12:37 or was there -- I think more particularly of interest, to the Tribunal Chairman, there was no reason for it to be lost. It simply wasn't transmitted to me as I had expected it would be in a timely fashion. But there

1			was no clandestine plan to facilitate the progression	
2			of Pat Murray from superintendent to chief	
3			superintendent that I was aware of. I certainly had no	
4			hand, act or part, as I described it in my statement,	
5			in that.	12:38
6	275	Q.	This letter goes on to repeat many of the complaints	
7			which have been made in the two previous letters that	
8			we have just seen and then at the bottom of the page it	
9			continues on to make that explicit acquisition, as it	
10			were.	12:38
11				
12			"It appears that on the one hand for over 18 months any	
13			investigation into the grave and systematic bullying	
14			has been initially camouflaged, secreted and paced on	
15			hold while on the other hand the promotion of	12:38
16			Superintendent Murray to chief superintendent has been	
17			covertly preferred, protected from the inside and	
18			furtively advanced.	
19				
20			We now call on you again to investigate the failure of	12:38
21			the Commissioner of An Garda Síochána to carry out any	
22			timely investigation into the causation of work related	
23			stress to the prejudice of Garda Keogh and the favour	
24			of Superintendent Murray."	
25				12:39
26			Then it concludes as writ there.	
27				
28			Just in terms of Superintendent Murray, I think you	
29			were asked in interview what your knowledge of	

Τ			Superintendent Murray was?	
2		Α.	Correct. Mr. McGuinness, I had not met Superintendent	
3			Murray, I am sure we were at large meetings together,	
4			where he was in one part of the room and I was in	
5			another. I think the first time I shook hands with	12:39
6			Chief Superintendent Pat Murray was when he joined my	
7			staff as the head of the Garda College, after his	
8			promotion. I wouldn't have been able to recognise him	
9			prior to that.	
10	276	Q.	You had no personal or professional dealings with him	12:39
11			at all?	
12		Α.	No, none.	
13	277	Q.	Prior to or meetings with him prior to him coming on to	
14			the Templemore staff?	
15		Α.	No.	12:39
16	278	Q.	Had you any knowledge as to whether he was seeking	
17			promotion, what steps he was taking in relation to	
18			promotion?	
19		Α.	No, I hadn't, and you know, I need to be very clear	
20			about this, the competitions office sits within Human	12:40
21			Resources, but since the advent of the Policing	
22			Authority, the competitions for superintendent and	
23			chief superintendent, assistant commissioner etcetera,	
24			were managed exclusively and properly by the Policing	
25			Authority. And so, any candidate who wished to apply	12:40
26			for such positions would do so and send their	
27			application forward in the normal way to the Policing	
28			Authority. So I would have no idea who the candidate	
29			slate was, other than you know, water cooler	

- 1 conversation about Diarmuid McGuinness has applied and
- 2 John Barrett has applied, that would have been the
- 3 extent of it, would I have had no idea who were the
- 4 applicants.
- 5 279 Q. Okay. One of the assertions in the letter earlier was

12 · 41

12:41

12 · 42

- 6 that Garda Keogh had been advised that this has
- 7 happened his complaint. Had you any conversation with
- 8 Garda Keogh at that point in time?
- 9 A. No. I met Garda Keogh only once and that was I think
- 10 December 17th, 2017. And we met in Portlaoise.
- 11 280 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. I had no knowledge of Garda Keogh's complaint in the
- round until I got that comprehensive document in
- 14 October.
- 15 281 Q. All right. Well, perhaps we will just scroll up the
- page here, just to see the top of this letter.
- 17 A. Clearly I have --
- 18 282 Q. It was sent to quite a number of people?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 283 Q. If we just go back to 10094, and go back up to 93 then. 12:41
- 21 So it's sent to first of all the Minister, the
- 22 Commissioner, the Policing Authority, and then the
- 23 fourth person is Mr. Ó Cualáin?
- 24 A. I think I am cc'd, Mr. McGuinness, at the end.
- 25 284 Q. That's the point, you're cc'd on it?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 285 Q. It doesn't appear from the documents I have seen that
- 28 you have made any reply to that directly at that
- 29 particular time?

- 1 A. Not at that time, no.
- 2 286 Q. But I think within the month of September, you received
- 3 correspondence from Mr. Cullen's office?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 287 Q. Dated 25th September 2017?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 288 Q. If we look at that, it's Volume 35, 10100. I think in

12:43

12:43

12.44

- 8 fairness to yourself, I think you said in your
- 9 interview that this was the first time when you
- received the statement. So you actually got it towards 12:43
- the last week in September, is that correct?
- 12 A. Yeah. Can I make two points?
- 13 289 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. They are contextual but I think they are relevant. The
- period August/September '17 was a tumultuous time for
- the organisation, and it was clear to me from a number
- of -- I returned from vacation at the back end of
- August and it was clear to me that this matter, which
- was, as far as I was concerned, a protected disclosure
- being dealt with by the protected disclosure manager
- 22 Keogh, this needed assistance from me, the
- correspondence was clearly at a high pitch, there was a

from the time he identified himself as such to Garda

- series of very visible accusations now being addressed
- to me by Garda Keogh and his legal team that needed my
- 26 engagement directly.
- 27 290 Q. Yes.

21

- 28 A. I think there's a preponderance of correspondence right
- 29 across this matter. Somewhere in and around the last

1			week of September, beginning of October, I began to	
2			tell Mr. Mulligan and Mr. McLoughlin that we were going	
3			to deal with this. On the 2nd I asked people to	
4			prepare for a case conference that was called by me on	
5			the 3rd October. And on the 2nd October, in	12:45
6			preparation for that, Chief Superintendent McLoughlin	
7			and I telephoned Mr. Cullen and had a conversation	
8			which was in part to, if you like, put a voice and a	
9			dialogue around these matters, to say we have received	
10			your correspondence and we are going to take some	12:45
11			action on foot of it. And it's, I suppose, an a	
12			consequence of the various elements that had come about	
13			throughout the summer and I think what the media were	
14			making comment on and we had a change of Commissioner's	
15			in the office, I think Ms. O'Sullivan had gone on	12:45
16			extended vacation, and this matter was crying out to be	
17			dealt with. So that conversation on the 2nd October	
18			informed the meeting of the 3rd October and on the 4th	
19			October we take delivery of the statement dated 27th	
20			March.	12:46
21	291	Q.	That is what I am suggesting here, that you actually	
22			got it with this letter?	
23		Α.	Yes, yeah.	
24	292	Q.	You were I think resent it or sent it by Assistant	
25			Commissioner Fanning on the 4th?	12:46
26		Α.	Yes.	
27	293	Q.	Isn't that right?	
28		Α.	Yeah.	

29 294 Q. As well. But on the same date then, I think Chief

1			McLoughlin gave you a brief update on matters that were	
2			perhaps pertinent to your discussion and on the 25th he	
3			sent you an e-mail. If we look at 3549. Perhaps it is	
4			3548. I may have the pagination wrong. Bear with me.	
5			Yes. This seems to reflect a discussion where he was	12:46
6			able to get confirmation that the PD had been	
7			investigated, that the file had gone to the DPP who	
8			advised no prosecution. He says:	
9				
10			"I understand that statement not sure if it was signed	12:47
11			was made by Garda Keogh in May under B&H policy but I	
12			have not seen it.	
13				
14			I have written on a number of occasions for work	
15			related stress complaint to be investigated. It may	12:47
16			form part of a B&H complaint but have I no update."	
17				
18			You received an e-mail then from Assistant Commissioner	
19			Fanning on the 26th, if we look at page 6891. He	
20			refers to the earlier e-mail and he is looking to have	12:47
21			a date confirmed. I think you got back to him that	
22			day, if we look at 6892, and you are proposing in the	
23			heading there, meeting Tuesday, 3rd October 2017 at 12	
24			as a matter of urgency	
25		Α.	Yes.	12:48
26	295	Q.	The phone call that was had with Mr. Cullen, you were	
27			speaking to Mr. Cullen directly?	
28		Α.	That's correct. I had him on a speaker phone in the	
29			conference table with Chief McLoughlin present.	

- 1 296 Q. Yes. And Chief McLoughlin said the purpose of it was
- to enable you to be in a position to bring any issues
- 3 raised by Mr. Cullen to the conference?
- 4 A. Yes and to give Mr. Cullen a certain amount of
- 5 assurance that there was an effort being made. Given

12 · 49

12:49

12:49

- 6 the correspondence of the previous number of summer
- 7 months, I felt we needed to directly engaged.
- 8 297 Q. Yes. The meeting took place on the 3rd and there are
- 9 typed minutes, a record made by I think Chief
- McLoughlin. If we look at Volume 36, 10118. You have
- seen these in the documents, I take it?
- 12 A. I have.
- 13 298 Q. I don't want to go all the way through it, but it
- 14 records the assistant commissioner outlining his
- position there.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 299 Q. About the need for a bigger investigation.
- 18 CHAIRMAN: I think we have been through this
- 19 previously, isn't that right?
- MR. McGUINNESS: This witness hasn't commented on it
- but I don't want to open it in its entirety.
- 22 CHAIRMAN: No. If anybody wants to question about it,
- then they are obviously free to do so.
- MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.
- 25 300 Q. There was a debate about what scope of inquiry might
- 26 be --
- 27 A. Correct.
- 28 301 Q. -- appropriate and perhaps who might do it as well.
- 29 Was there a discussion of Assistant Commissioner

- 1 McPartlin being appointed at that time?
- 2 A. Not at that stage, no.
- 3 302 Q. In any event, an action sheet was agreed or issued on
- 4 foot of the meeting, if which look at page 3551. And
- you were to do the first two actions, isn't that right? 12:50
- 6 A. Mm-hmm. Yes.
- 7 303 Q. I think Assistant Commissioner Fanning, it had been
- 8 agreed that he would liaise with Garda Keogh about what

12:50

12:51

- 9 was going to happen, and what he would be informed of
- 10 as well, isn't that correct?
- 11 A. That's correct. One of the things that I think
- 12 Assistant Commissioner Fanning deserves credit for and
- to some respects it created a problem was, Assistant
- 14 Commissioner Fanning and Inspector McCarthy stayed in
- 15 close touch with Garda Keogh. Now, I think they were
- 16 giving him an understanding that we were in possession
- of a document, which we were not in that period of
- 18 April, May, June etcetera. That may have created the
- 19 commentary that came later in Mr. Cullen's letters.
- 20 But to be fair, there's an obligation on a -- there is
- a right of a protected discloser to be kept informed.
- I think that is something that would normally fall to
- the protected disclosure manager to do.
- 24 304 Q. Yes. You did receive an e-mail on the 4th October, as
- you have referred to, from Assistant Commissioner
- 26 Fanning in relation to the statement. Perhaps we will
- just look at that, page 10104.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 305 Q. It is Inspector McCarthy directed by assistant

			Commit 33 Total Laster if Region to Ferei to a meeting of	
2			yesterday and to forward copies of statements taken by	
3			Garda Nick Keogh on 22nd March and hand-delivered to	
4			HRM on 24th May 2017 per file from Assistant	
5			Commissioner Fanning dated 24th May 2017, please.	12:52
6				
7			So you seem to be certainly getting it there and it	
8			just seems to be	
9		Α.	But the suggestion that it is, you know, per file of	
10			Assistant Commissioner Fanning 24 May, I think	12:52
11			Mr. Mulligan and I are at one, neither of us had seen	
12			it to this date from Assistant Commissioner Fanning.	
13	306	Q.	There is a notation on that, I think that is	
14			Ms. Hassett's reference?	
15		Α.	Yes.	12:52
16	307	Q.	"Case conference Mr. Barrett to appoint investigator	
17			issues raised by Garda Keogh broader than bullying and	
18			harassment."	
19		Α.	Bullying and harassment.	
20	308	Q.	I think Assistant Commissioner Fanning wrote to you	12:52
21			then on the 6th October, if we look at page 10108, four	
22			pages down from that, that it was now going to be your	
23			responsibility to be dealing with Garda Keogh at that	
24			stage, that's the 6th October. He is referring to the	
25			meeting. He is acknowledging the e-mail for actions	12:53
26			arising. In the last line he informs you that:	
27				
28			"Garda Keogh had been informed by Inspector McCarthy	
29			that the actions arising in all future correspondence	

Т			with Garda Reogn will be from executive director Human	
2			Resources and People Development and that an assistant	
3			commissioner would be appointed to investigate these	
4			matters."	
5		Α.	Yeah.	12:53
6	309	Q.	Now, I think you were being prompted by Sergeant	
7			Brodrick, is it, following up on the action sheets to	
8			appoint the assistant commissioner, and I think you	
9			were contemplating Assistant Commissioner Barry O'Brien	
LO			at one stage, is that right?	12:54
L1		Α.	That's right.	
L2	310	Q.	Had you discussed that with him, for instance, or do	
L3			you clear these things in advance?	
L4		Α.	Well, it's an informal engagement because you are	
L5			dealing with people who are extraordinarily busy and	12:54
L6			this arose with Assistant Commissioner McPartlin as	
L7			well. Ultimately, I think probably a month later than	
L8			I had wanted to, I think somewhere around end of	
L9			November, I make a decision that the matter is going to	
20			be dealt with under the bullying and harassment policy	12:54
21			and it's going to be dealt with by Assistant	
22			Commissioner Finn. There was a suggestion, and this	
23			was considered right the way up to a meeting that was	
24			convened by Joe Nugent on the 23rd October, there was	
25			the consideration of whether or not bullying and	12:55
26			harassment should be one part and all other parts	
27			should be hived off into a separate investigation.	
28			Ultimately I determined that there would be an	
29			investigation, as was requested by Garda Keogh, under	

1			the B&H policy and the policy had a framework. I think	
2			my reasons for this decision are important. It had a	
3			framework which was respectful of the person seeking to	
4			invoke the policy and it provided protections for those	
5			who may be impugned by the matters to be investigated.	12:55
6	311	Q.	Yes. Well, you had written directly to Mr. Cullen on	
7			the 13th October, yourself, and perhaps we would look	
8			at the letter at 10121. This is replying to quite a	
9			number of different issues, and in particular it	
10			follows the sequence of an eight point handwritten	12:56
11			letter where Garda Keogh had enumerated concerns?	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	312	Q.	Which were copied by Mr. Cullen to a number of parties?	
14		Α.	Correct.	
15	313	Q.	This came to you then to reply in a compendious way to	12:56
16			each of those eight points.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	314	Q.	The notion seems to have been reached that, as	
19			expressed in two of the letters, that his pay will be	
20			stopping?	12:56
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	315	Q.	And your first paragraph deals with that, that	
23			assurance, that there would be a continuous of his	
24			basic pay beyond that date, no plan to change that at	
25			this time. Had there been some reconsideration of the	12:56
26			pay issue?	
27		Α.	To be honest, I don't know what that reconsideration	
28			was, but it seems to me that in light of the	
29			discussions we had on the 2nd October on the telephone,	

1 2			nothing that should interfere with the continuation of	
3			pay pending the actioning of the items agreed at the	
4			meeting.	
5	316	Q.	Okay. We will just see the next thing that you said to	12:57
6		•	him, the second matter, if we go down the page onto the	
7			next page there.	
8				
9			"Secondly, the matters raised by Garda Keogh under the	
10			terms of the protected disclosure Act continue to be	12:57
11			revi ewed. "	
12				
13			You say:	
14				
15			"Last week at this office a series of decisions were	12:57
16			taken to action key elements of our telephone cushion	
17			with you."	
18				
19			You address then the eight issues as set out in that	
20			letter, as follows:	12:57
21		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
22	317	Q.	You say:	
23				
24			"I have undertaken the specific action of assessing how	
25			best to proceed with respect to item 1. I expect to	12:58
26			have reached a conclusion on this before the end of	
27			October and it will be communicated to you directly. I	
28			will set out the process to be followed and the	
29			personnel assigned."	

1 A. Yes.

2 I mean, there is an issue of delay which Garda Keogh is 318 Q. 3 raising with the Tribunal in the context of the bullying and harassment investigation not having been 4 5 initiated and latterly progressed quickly. At this 6 stage it is almost a year since he has confirmed to Chief Superintendent McLoughlin that he is evoking it. 7 8 Just as a process manager, would you regard it as unsatisfactory to have a delay --9

12:58

12:58

10 A. I would.

Α.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

11 319 Q. -- of that period. It related to status or the number 12 of issues he was raising or where they went, what would 13 you like to say about that?

> I think the delay is unsatisfactory. I think you have the anatomy of the serial events that took place from 12:59 the end of '16 through to this juncture in 2017 well enumerated in your questioning of me. So vou can see what the various segments are. In honesty, the bullying and harassment policy itself gives timelines as to when an entire bullying and harassment 12:59 investigation should be concluded, and they are tight timelines. I think the criminal investigation into the matters raised by Garda Keogh took three and a half I think that the actual investigation conducted by Assistant Commissioner Finn took something over a 12:59 So these are lengthy periods of time. And you know, we appointed John Scanlan and agreed on his position somewhere in January 2017. The statement dated 27th March reached me six months later.

320 I raise the issue because the Chairman is 1 Q. 2 entitled to make such recommendations as he may think 3 fit and I am not in any way suggesting he is going to make any recommendation, that is a matter for the 4 5 future. But it would seem that a part of the process 6 contributing to delay might include issues that various 7 sections at different stages didn't know what had 8 happened with the disclosures and the investigation into disclosures. Is that an inbuilt problem by reason 9 of the issue? 10

13:00

13:00

- 11 Α. I think the actions of and the way the policy on the 12 protected disclosures is set up is designed to have a 13 protected disclosure manager to shepherd these matters 14 that we talked about and to ensure that there is, you 15 know, as I said, a place at which disclosures made 13:01 16 internally can be received, matters can be 17 investigated, communication with the discloser can be 18 managed and managed confidentially and resolved 19 ultimately if that's possible. So the intention and 20 the policy there, it didn't in this case and this is 13:01 under the prism of a protected disclosure, this is 21 22 suddenly in my hands and I'm not the protected disclosure manager, you know, so it didn't work 23 24 particularly well, is the point.
- 25 321 Q. But I suppose I am asking you perhaps more directly
  26 then, are the delays or the lack of knowledge or the
  27 problems that can beset an issue such as this, are they
  28 related to the non-disclosure of the person making the
  29 disclosure, a lack of knowledge of others as to what is

1			being investigated etcetera?	
2		Α.	That can be a part of it, certainly. These are complex	
3			matters, I think Chief McLoughlin has made that point,	
4			and sometimes because of the confidentiality needing to	
5			be maintained it hampers active engagement with other	13:02
6			parties. I think dealing with matters in serial as	
7			opposed to parallel certainly tends to extend time.	
8	322	Q.	You refer to the length of investigations as well,	
9			which is a feature of all of the investigations to some	
10			greater or lesser degree. You may not have any	13:02
11			knowledge of this, but is it perhaps a fault, if it is	
12			a fault, that investigators have other jobs to do, in	
13			the sense that they're not dedicated full-time to the	
14			carrying out of these specific tasks, they have to	
15			carry their additional other daily weekly monthly	13:02
16			burden?	
17		Α.	I can't really make any useful comment other than to	
18			say specialists who have specialisms tend to be able to	
19			focus more so than generalists who have many irons in	
20			the fire. That is a truism not just for the guards but	13:03
21			for any place I have ever worked in this country,	
22			Furone and America it's no different	

23 323 Q. All right. In point 2 there you say:

24

"With respect to the bullying and harassment complaint 13:03

I am advised that there has been extensive correspondence from Garda HRM section seeking clarification from Garda Keogh as to who specifically he was naming as the subject of his complaint. We are

Τ			now aware from both the correspondence and the	
2			telephone conversation who that individual is. We will	
3			proceed accordingly."	
4				
5			Had Garda Keogh or Mr. Cullen named Superintendent	13:03
6			Murray and Superintendent Murray only?	
7		Α.	No.	
8	324	Q.	In the phone call?	
9		Α.	There is an error in that paragraph. That should	
10			really have referred to the materials received but one	13:03
11			of the issues that we had all the while in the absence	
12			of Scanlan's report was specificity of the very two	
13			questions that we were being asked to clarify through	
14			the efforts of Chief Superintendent Scanlan. Who is it	
15			that is being named, and that's a list of names, your	13:04
16			point, and what are their ranks, so that we can make a	
17			determination to the level of the bullying and	
18			harassment investigator.	
19	325	Q.	Yes. But you seem to be suggesting that there is only	
20			one person?	13:04
21		Α.	That's an error on my behalf.	
22	326	Q.	Paragraph 3 then:	
23				
24			"The matters relating to how the Policing Authority	
25			proceed in circumstances outlined. I have today	13:04
26			written to the CEO of the Policing Authority and raised	
27			that question with them. My letter is attached."	
28		Α.	Yes.	
29	327	Q.	That is I think your letter of the 13th	

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 328 Q. -- October, written on the same date?
- 3 A. Yes

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

24

4 329 Q. And obviously written prior to writing this letter on

5 the same date?

A. Yes. I would have been conscious from reading the
correspondence, Mr. McGuinness, that there was a very
clear concern being articulated that there was some
silence or some conspiracy or some actions taken or not
taken which would suggest that Garda Keogh was very

uncomfortable with the process. For transparency and

in the light of the Garda Code of ethics I wanted to

demonstrate that I was alerting, personally alerting

13:05

13:05

13:05

13:06

the Policing Authority, even though I was conscious

that in prior correspondence Mr. Cullen had copied

correspondence to the Chairperson of the Policing

Authority, so I think they were already well on notice

of the concerns of Garda Keogh, but for the purposes of

making it clear that, you know, we have nothing to

hide, there is absolutely no issue with putting them on 13:06

notice formally from my office, I did so and I copied

22 that letter to Mr. Cullen.

23 330 Q. Yes. You were asked in interview by the investigators

whether you had informed the Commissioner's office that

you had written the letter to Ms. Hall of the Policing

26 Authority?

- 27 A. I couldn't recall.
- 28 331 Q. You couldn't recall?
- 29 A. I don't have a copy. I see it in -- I was given some

2 Yes, but you in fact cc'd had letter to Chief 332 Q. 3 Superintendent McLoughlin, isn't that correct? 4 That's correct. Α. 5 333 So it's not as if you have done it in a clandestine Q. 13:06 6 way? 7 No, I am conscious that Chief McLoughlin would a direct Α. reporting line to the Commissioner as protected 8 disclosures manager for Garda Keogh. 9 And certainly your explanation that you gave to the 10 334 Q. 13:06 11 investigators was that you felt you had an obligation 12 to ensure that all relevant information available to 13 you was put before the Policing Authority? 14 Α. Correct. 15 And it wasn't a secret, in fact, it was out in the 335 Q. 13:07 16 public domain? 17 Right. Α. You probably weren't aware the Commissioner's office 18 336 Q. 19 had written the day before? 20 Α. No. 13:07 In relation to -- been written to the day before, on 21 337 Q. 22 the 12th, about matters that were in the public domain? 23 The guiding principle for me was more the code of Α. 24 ethics which demands that, you know, we do what we can 25 to make matters transparent and plain and that was I 13:07 26 think an appropriate response in the context of all the 27 issues that had been put to us. 28 Yes. At paragraph 4 you say: 338 Q.

1

29

materials from --

Т			"I have written to the office of the Garda Keogh and	
2			the to office of head of legal services to address the	
3			errs set out. This office has had no sight of the	
4			correspondence to date and we have now requested. Our	
5			expectation is that it will form part of the	13:07
6			comprehensive file which will be made available to the	
7			individual or team to be appointed under 1 above to	
8			review matters.	
9				
10			5. In the matter.	13:08
11				
12			6. Our intention is that matters to be established	
13			under 1 above will address the issues comprehensively	
14			and diminute the need for intervention of the	
15			Tánai ste. "	13:08
16				
17			There was a request for an outside investigator?	
18		Α.	Correct.	
19	339	Q.	"7. I wish to assure you and your client that this	
20			office that those charged with the management of	13:08
21			protected disclosure report. Huge confidence in the	
22			professionalism of the office holder Chief	
23			Superintendent McLoughlin has met with Garda Keogh in	
24			his capacity as protected disclosure manager and this	
25			relationship continues in effect.	13:08
26				
27			A number of points to conclude and to point a way	
28			forward.	
29				

1	Firstly, we are submitted to addressing the issues put	
2	forth by Garda Keogh, your client. You can be sure	
3	that I will remain available to you and the commitment	
4	to action given will be actioned."	
5	1	3:08
6	If we scroll down the page, Mr. Kavanagh, thank you.	
7		
8	"Secondly, at a meeting at this office last week, it	
9	was agreed that the regular contact from the Employee	
10	Assistance Service would be supplemented by a visit, as 1	3:08
11	has happened in the past, to your client from Inspector	
12	McCarthy. This will take place shortly.	
13		
14	Finally this, office has now assumed coordinative	
15	responsibility for matters at issue and we will seek to $_{ extsf{1}}$	3:09
16	progress the issue transparently and with all due	
17	Él an. "	
18		
19	That is dated 13th October. Chairman, I think the	
20	witness has been in the witness box for over two and a $^{-1}$	3:09
21	half hours, it might be an appropriate time to take a	
22	short break.	
23	CHAIRMAN: Yes. I think Mr. Barnes notified the	
24	parties that we want to avoid a situation where people	
25	have to go through an elaborate checking, so that we	3:09
26	had proposed a shorter lunch break of half an hour	
27	rather than an hour and I hope that that message got	
28	through to everybody so they could bring themselves a	
29	sandwich or whatever it was that they needed, so as to	

1	avoid starvation afterwards. So the plan would be,	
2	what time is it now, we will sit in half an hour's time	
3	and we will proceed to around 3:30, if that is	
4	convenient. I mean in the meantime, if you find the	
5	whole going a bit rough, let us know.	13:10
6	THE WITNESS: No.	
7	CHAIRMAN: Okay. I appreciate that Garda Keogh's team	
8	will need a few minutes for consultation. Perfectly	
9	understood, not a problem. Okay.	
10	MR. McGUINNESS: And if it helps parties assess the	13:10
11	position, Chairman, I estimate I will probably no more	
12	than 30 minutes left.	
13	CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thank you very much. Okay.	
14	Very good.	
15		13:10
16	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED AS	
17	<u>FOLLOWS</u> :	
18		
19	MR. McGUINNESS: Mr. Barrett, just before the break we	
20	had been looking at the first of your long letter of	13:46
21	reply to Garda Keogh on 13th October 2017. I have	
22	referred to your letter to the Policing Authority, and	
23	that's at page 12477. It's addressed to Ms. Hall. And	
24	you say:	
25		13:47
26	"I write in the strictest confidence on foot of a	
27	question raised by a Garda member in correspondence.	
28	The letter from the member's solicitor raised a series	
29	of questions and was conied to amongst others the	

1 Minister for Justice and Equality, the Chairman of the 2 Policing Authority 21st September 2017 from John Gerard 3 Cullen solicitor. 4 5 In the light of extensive and other general issues 13:47 6 raised in the letter from Mr. Cullen which attaches the 7 handwritten letter of Garda Keogh, I thought it best to 8 draw the correspondence to your specific attention and 9 to restate the question raised. It was as follows: 10 Has the Policing Authority considered such a scenario 13 · 47 11 whereby (I cannot say for sure that this has happened) 12 a complaint is made against a senior officer who is 13 going for promotion and happens to be favoured by Garda 14 Garda management delay commencing the 15 investigation, including serving notice disciplinary or 13:47 16 otherwise on the senior officer candidate, whereby 17 should the Policing Authority ask the candidate to 18 disclose such discipline information he/she could 19 answer none in good faith. In the meantime the actual 20 complaint is withheld/lost by Garda management to 13:48 21 facilitate their choice of candidate being promoted. 22 Is this possible? 23 24 This office now seeking to deal with all matters 25 relating to Garda Keogh and I would be most grateful if 13:48 26 you could ensure that I am copied on any reply you 27 might send or have already sent to Mr. Cullen."

2829

So, I think you were explaining that you were aware

			that they had been, as it were, in the roop:	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	340	Q.	And addressed correspondence directly by Mr. Mr. Cullen	
4			and elsewhere. You saw it as part of your function to	
5			refer to this portion of the letter. And, as I say,	13:4
6			you copied that letter to Garda Keogh and to Chief	
7			McLoughlin?	
8		Α.	That's correct.	
9	341	Q.	I think you received a reply from Ms. Hall, just it	
10			complete the record on that, at page 12513. That's a	13:4
11			letter dated the 27th. The essence of the reply is in	
12			the first paragraph:	
13				
14			"I acknowledge receipt of your letter of the 13th	
15			October which refers to a letter from solicitor John	13:4
16			Gerard Cullen, on which you were copied. It would not	
17			be perhaps for us to copy third parties (including An	
18			Garda Síochána) on any response sent to Mr. Cullen.	
19			Mr. Cullen's client is of course free to provide you	
20			with a copy of any such correspondence if he so	13:4
21			wi shes. "	
22				
23			It then sets out the clearance process.	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	342	Q.	Which you understood at the time and were not enquiring	13:4
26			at all obviously. But you probably hadn't been aware	
27			when you wrote your letter that they had originally	
28			earlier written to the acting commissioner,	
29			Mr. Ó Cualáin, on the 12th October. If we look at page	

Т			12471. Writing to the Commissioner there about the	
2			clearance form and the second paragraph says:	
3				
4			"Further to an alleged matter which is in the public	
5			domain I would be grateful to know if any bullying or	13:50
6			harassment complaint has been received or if there is	
7			any investigation relating to the same in train or	
8			being contemplated with regard to this candidate and if	
9			so the stage of those processes."	
10				13:50
11			The Chairman has already heard evidence from An Garda	
12			Síochána, the relevant people at this stage dealing	
13			with that issue.	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	343	Q.	The second case conference then took place on the 23rd	13:5
16			October, isn't that correct?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	344	Q.	There are typed notes of that to be found at page 3598.	
19			You have seen those notes, I take it?	
20		Α.	I have seen a couple of versions of notes.	13:5
21	345	Q.	Yes. There's also I think some maintained by Sergeant	
22			Gallagher?	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	346	Q.	Séan Gallagher, is that right? Perhaps we will just	
25			scroll down here. It was chaired by Mr. Noonan, I	13:5
26			think, the chief administrative office?	
27		Α.	Mr. Nugent, yeah.	
28	347	Q.	Mr. Nugent, I beg your pardon.	
29		Α.	Yeah.	

- 1 348 Q. I beg your pardon. There was a discussion to identify 2 all the particular strands, which are set out there.
- 3 But at the bottom of it, correct me if you don't agree
- 4 with this, there seemed to be a determination that of

13:52

13:52

13:53

- all the things that ought to happen the bullying
- 6 complaint should be bottomed out and that that should
- 7 be progressed, an appointment should be made and an
- 8 investigation should take place?
- 9 A. Yes. I think at that point there were people in the room who knew that I was on the verge of making an
- appointment and that in effect my determination was
- that while I had a certain sympathy for the argument
- made by Assistant Commissioner Fanning, I was neutral
- 14 at best, I think is how I express it in a subsequent
- note, that the thing needed to be expanded beyond B&H.
- 16 349 Q. Yes. There does seem to have been some discussion
- 17 there or thereabouts about the appointment of Assistant
- 18 Commissioner McPartlin?
- 19 A. Yes. And that would have arisen if there was going to
- be a broader discussion. As in, if there was going to
- be that second paralleled investigation. There's some
- confusion about this, which I think I can clear up.
- 23 350 Q. Yes.
- 24 A. In the event of there being can go more than a
- 25 Byrne-McGinn type thing.
- 26 351 O. Yes.
- 27 A. One suggestion I think addressed at that meeting was
- that effectively, I think the term used is, strip out
- the bullying and harassment and all the other issues

- 1 would go into some other investigation, fact-finding or 2 whatever. 3 352 Yes. Q.
- 4 That's if I was to determine that it's a bullying and Α. 5 harassment and it's not sufficient, because it doesn't 13:53 cover all the issues. 6
- 7 It's just, you do seem to have it in your mind 353 0. that it might need a wider one, because we will see in 8 a minute when we come to the 5th November, where you're 9 meeting Garda Keogh --10

13:54

13:54

11 Yeah. Α.

29

- 12 -- isn't that right, you're talking not merely about 354 Q. the Finn appointment but the McPartlin appointment too? 13
- 14 Α. There is a suggestion, you know, that there were other issues that needed to be dealt with. The thing 15 16 that ultimately guided me in going with just a bullying 17 and harassment, under the policy, was that if 18 criminality, as Assistant Commissioner Fanning I think 19 was genuinely concerned about, if there was an issue of 20 criminality arising in that investigation, then at that 13:54 point the criminality could be taken and commenced as a 21 22 separate investigation. I think it's fair to say, Mr. McGuinness, you raised it with me before we broke 23 24 for lunch, there was a real imperative around time at 25 this point. This thing has taken a lengthy period. There was a framework or a scaffolding or a B&H 26 27 investigation and that was more easy expedited than something wherein the parties who were impugned by 28

certain allegations might find fault with a

1 Byrne-McGinn or something that didn't have the same, if 2 you like, policy structure. 3 355 Yes. Q. That was a consideration of mine. 4 Α. 5 356 I mean, what was envisaged as the larger one Q. 13:55 6 would be in a sense non-procedural, non-policy based 7 but simply based on an administrative decision that an 8 investigation shall encompass everything? And I quite frankly didn't know if I had the vires for 9 Α. that. 10 13:55 11 357 Okay. well, in any event, obviously one of the other Q. 12 concerns were the people who were being complained 13 about and I think you received notice from Assistant 14 Commissioner Fanning on the 10th October, following he 15 having sent Inspector McCarthy out to visit Garda 13:55 16 Keogh, that Garda Keogh was not available to mediate on the point? 17 18 Yes. Α. 19 358 Perhaps if we look at page 3619? Q. 20 Α. Yes. 13:56 That is an e-mail to you, just if we go down the page. 21 359 0. 22 He had sent Inspector McCarthy out the previous day, Garda Keogh had signed a sort of objection and he had 23 24 received that back. At the same time I think were you 25 aware that Assistant Commissioner Fanning had written 13:56 26 out to those who were possibly named or implicated in

complaint?

Yes.

Α.

27

28

29

the complaint to inform them of the making of the

_	300	Q.	And seeking a similar solic of response as to whether	
2			they would be objecting?	
3		Α.	I think that is the correct policy that Assistant	
4			Commissioner Fanning was following.	
5	361	Q.	It obviously follows that whoever objected first would	13:57
6			mean or objected at all, if any objected, there	
7			wouldn't be a mediator?	
8		Α.	Correct. Everyone would have to buy in.	
9	362	Q.	Have to, have to go for investigation, isn't that	
10			right?	13:57
11		Α.	Correct, a single objection would have been sufficient.	
12	363	Q.	Then if we look at page 3625, this is you writing to	
13			the Assistant Commissioner Fanning, nominating	
14			Assistant Commissioner Finn and you're asking him to	
15			formalise the appointment under the sexual harassment	13:57
16			and bullying policy?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	364	Q.	"Keep me informed of matters". Am I correct in saying	
19			that nomination took place following a meeting in your	
20			office when he came to see you about a possible	13:57
21			appointment, is that right?	
22		Α.	Yeah, I think so. I think we ironed it out on that	
23			basis, yes.	
24	365	Q.	And then if we look at page 3624, one page up, he is	
25			confirming that Assistant Commissioner Finn was	13:58
26			appointed, isn't that correct?	
27		Α.	Yes, and under the specific policy provisions.	

366 Q. Yes. You had prepared an update for the Deputy

28

29

Commissioner I think on the 5th July covering the whole

- period of effectively a year, from the 1st December '16
- 2 up until the 5th December '17, isn't that right, for
- his information. If we go to page 3626. Was this in
- 4 response to a particular request for an update from the

- 5 Deputy Commissioner?
- 6 A. It may have been. Quite frankly, I don't recall.
- 7 367 Q. Okay.
- 8 A. Can I see the date on this again?
- 9 368 Q. Yes. It should be 5th December, if we scroll up, or
- down. It gives an overview of events?
- 11 A. Yeah, and 5th December, okay. I think there's a
- 12 reference in there that might be incorrect. But
- 13 anyway. Yes.
- 14 369 Q. What do you think that may be?
- 15 A. I think the McPartlin thing may have made its way into
- that.
- 17 370 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. I think it shouldn't have.
- 19 371 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. Because I think by that date two things have happened,
- 21 AC McPartlin had indicated that she was unwilling, and
- I think at that point we had also bottomed out that it
- was just going to be a bullying and harassment matter.
- 24 372 Q. Yes.
- A. So that should have been circa the time we appointed AC 14:00
- 26 Finn.
- 27 373 Q. Yes.
- 28 A. I would imagine that's on foot of a request,
- Mr. McGuinness. I don't have the request in mind, but

- it looks like something that would be done on foot of a request.
- 3 374 Q. Perhaps if we just look at the volume itself, it should 4 be in Volume 12. 3626 and the preceding page.

14:02

14.02

5 A. Got it, yeah.

6 375 Q. It would seem, in any event, that a request came from 7 the Deputy Commissioner's that you were responding to,

8 is that correct?

format.

- 9 A. That looks like it. I don't...
- 10 376 Q. The error that you referred to, if we just look at page 14:01 11 3628, the last paragraph there.
- 12 A. There was some debate, Mr. McGuinness, at the meeting
  13 of the 23rd as to whether or not there was a
  14 requirement for a fact-finding mission. And, you know,
  15 what that was going to accomplish in the circumstances, 14:01
  16 I think I wrote a note after the meeting of the 23rd
  17 which said, and this is from memory now, that I was
  18 somewhat neutral on the idea of the more expanded
- 20 377 Q. Yes.

19

21 A. And I think that began to fall away somewhere in that

- 22 window.
- 23 378 Q. Yes. I mean obviously I think it's clear you didn't
- appoint her on the 19th but her appointment is
- contemplated in a number of different documents and
- 26 e-mails?
- 27 A. It is.
- 28 379 Q. And it may be that you intended to record here that you intended to appoint her?

- 1 A. Yes, I think that's fair comment. There's confusion
- 2 around that, for certain.
- 3 380 Q. Okay. In any event, following Assistant Commissioner
- 4 Finn's first meeting with Garda Keogh and Mr. Cullen,

14 · 03

14:03

14 · 04

- 5 Mr. Cullen wrote on the 5th December a letter
- 6 complaining about conceptual fragmentation and
- 7 procedural fragmentation of the complaint and that it
- 8 was being disarticulated in its parts from a whole.
- 9 A. Okay.
- 10 381 Q. Do you recall seeing that letter?
- 11 A. No, I don't but if you can pull it up, I will have a
- 12 better --
- 13 382 Q. Yes. 3630.
- 14 A. Yeah.
- 15 383 Q. It has gone purple on the screen for some reason. You
- 16 have that in front of you?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 384 Q. A three-page letter?
- 19 A. Yes, have I it. I am cc'd on it.
- 20 385 Q. Yes. It appears to be a complaint which follows upon
- an understanding on his part that it was limited to the
- bullying and harassment claim and wouldn't embrace the
- other matters. And there the memorable phrase about
- the procrustean bed at the top of page 2?
- 25 A. Yeah. It's in the nature of -- and I am not an
- investigator, so let me put that label very clearly out
- there.
- 28 386 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. It's in the nature of these kinds of investigations

1			that there is compartmentalisation for reasons of	
2			getting things clearly defined and stated. So I wasn't	
3			obviously at the meeting that is referred to in the	
4			Mullingar Park Hotel.	
5	387	Q.	Yes.	14:04
6		Α.	I read this letter and in some respects I felt it's	
7			well within Assistant Commissioner Finn's competence to	
8			deal with the matters. He didn't speak to me about it.	
9			I think he proceeded from there. I was aware that he	
10			was planning an early meeting.	14:05
11	388	Q.	Yes. I think you wrote to him about that suggesting	
12			the 15th?	
13		Α.	Yes.	
14	389	Q.	If we look at page 3633, there is an e-mail from you to	
15			him at 12:30 on the 16th, just down there.	14:05
16		Α.	3633.	
17	390	Q.	Yes, it's in the middle of the page, your e-mail to	
18			Chief McLoughlin. It says:	
19				
20			"Hi Tony. Just tried to call you back and I saw you	14:05
21			were at a meeting on this matter. I think we need to	
22			appoint Mick Donlon in the disclosures office to track	
23			and trace. All the various elements of this moving	
24			file make certain that we keep all the elements	
25			together. We need to be cognisant of the appointment	14:05
26			of AC Finn and AC McPartlin to two elements of this	
27			case.	
28				
29			After our discussion this morning we do need to make	

Т			time to speak to Mr. Cullen and his client before	
2			Christmas and see where that leads us from a welfare	
3			and return to work plan."	
4				
5			Then you are suggesting the 15th.	14:06
6		Α.	Mm-hmm.	
7	391	Q.	He agrees with that. You did meet them on the 15th I	
8			any in the Killeshin Hotel?	
9		Α.	That's correct.	
10	392	Q.	I don't know if you kept minutes of that but you have	14:06
11			seen Chief McLoughlin's minutes?	
12		Α.	I have, and I kept a note that I wrote in my own hand	
13			on a letter from Mr. Cullen. It was just a very simple	
14			handwritten scrawl. I think I had typed copies of that	
15			made and given to the investigators, Mr. McGuinness.	14:06
16	393	Q.	Yes.	
17		Α.	I don't know if it's on the file.	
18	394	Q.	In any event, just looking at the chief's note at page	
19			3635, if we go back over the if you turn over the	
20			page yourself?	14:06
21		Α.	Yeah.	
22	395	Q.	It's in Volume 12. It records who is there. Then	
23			there are a number of sort of bullet points.	
24				
25			"Mick Finn B&H.	14:06
26				
27			AC McPartlin all the elements.	
28				
29			Welfare. What can we do for you?	

1				
2			Back to work.	
3				
4			Set up if I go back and"	
5				14:07
6			I am not sure what that says.	
7				
8			"and work."	
9				
10			He refers to the health meeting with the CMO and the	14:07
11			minutes of that and correspondence. The case	
12			conference in December?	
13		Α.	Loss of allowances.	
14	396	Q.	Loss of allowances, yes. Work related stress, loss of	
15			allowances. He complains about Superintendent Murray	14:07
16			on the next page:	
17				
18			"No issue with M Curran. It was chief's office."	
19				
20			It goes about, it goes into different elements	14:08
21			regarding Garda A and Ms. B that we are not concerned	
22			with. On the final page of it, at 3639, towards the	
23			very bottom of the page, raising again obviously the	
24			possibility of injury	
25		Α.	Yeah. IOJ, injury on duty.	14:08
26	397	Q.	Yes. That was something that was still concerning him,	
27			isn't that correct, injury on duty issue?	
28		Α.	Mr. McGuinness, can I just volunteer this in ease of	
29			the Tribunal	

1 398 Q. Yes.

A. I felt going to that meeting that it was an important opportunity to continue the dialogue that we started on the telephone call with Mr. Cullen on the 2nd September.

14:09

6 399 Q. Yes.

A. Many of the issues, and this is from experience in
dealing with Sergeant McCabe, many of the issues that
were difficult, example like trust building, confidence
building, etcetera, were overcome in that case when
Sergeant McCabe returned as the traffic sergeant in
Mullingar.

13 400 Q. Yes.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α. And I was seeking to encourage Garda Keogh to consider a return to work as such a measure. And I felt it was 14:09 important that we do it in person. Garda Keogh was in excellent form, he was looking extremely fit and well. we had a lengthy conversation in the shadow of Christmas on the 15th December. And I felt we were moving in the right direction. AC Finn had begun his 14:09 dialogue, and that my sincere hope was that we would be able to engineer a return to work for Garda Keogh, which would then, you know, vitiate all the issues about full pay and allowances and all that, would naturally restore themselves, and the opportunity to 14 · 10 rebuild what was, you know, a stellar career in the first years of its time in An Garda Síochána. thought it was the right thing to don't and that was the mindset I brought to that meeting.

Т	401	Q.	Yes. I mean the reference to checking the allowance	
2			payment for injury on duty, was that progressed after	
3			the meeting, that is on page 3636?	
4		Α.	I think it was. Again, that is a question I think is	
5			best asked of Chief McLoughlin in his capacity. But to	14:10
6			the best of my knowledge, those items were dealt with.	
7			We I was seeking to allow AC Finn opportunity to	
8			conduct his investigation and hopefully on foot of this	
9			meeting to create a situation where Garda Keogh would	
10			return to work.	14:11
11	402	Q.	Yes. I know you wrote to Assistant Commissioner	
12			McPartlin in late January talking about her	
13			appointment?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	403	Q.	She wrote back saying you haven't spoken to me about	14:11
16			the appointment?	
17		Α.	Yes, that is where the matter was. She came and spoke	
18			to me at that point and said, what appointment. I	
19			think that's when the idea of going beyond the B&H	
20			ended.	14:11
21	404	Q.	I am wondering, did it become abandoned in a more	
22			practical way because of what Garda Keogh and	
23			Mr. Cullen said to you at this meeting. At page 3638,	
24			at the top of it?	
25		Α.	Yeah.	14:11
26	405	Q.	It's in his handwritten obviously, the top of 3628:	
27				
28			"All aspects of my complaints are under some sort of	
29			investigation at present. No loose ends at present.	

1				
2			But I am the one pushing it."	
3		Α.	That is clear. I mean, we had a multiplicity of	
4			investigations ongoing at this point. There had been a	
5			criminal investigation. There was civil litigation.	14:12
6			There was bullying and harassment commenced. The	
7			matter was dealt with under the prism of protected	
8			disclosure. There was a multiplicity of activities or	
9			avenues being pursued. And it had taken it was a	
10			complex matter, I think we have to describe it for what	14:12
11			it was, and it had taken a very long time. That too	
12			had its consequence.	
13	406	Q.	Yes. No other investigation was established	
14			thereafter?	
15		Α.	To the best of my knowledge.	14:12
16	407	Q.	Yes. Insofar as Assistant Commissioner Finn's	
17			investigation occurred then, had you any role in	
18			monitoring it or	
19		Α.	No.	
20	408	Q.	He wasn't required to report to you?	14:12
21		Α.	No, he wasn't required to report to me. His report	
22			would go back to Assistant Commissioner Finn.	
23	409	Q.	You are written to about the issue of stenographers and	
24			recording meetings in February?	

26

27

28

29

410

Α.

Q.

Yes.

And later in the year you're making enquiries, if we

look at a letter, 4711, this is on the 28th September

and you are referring to his previous correspondence.

2018. You're writing to Assistant Commissioner Fanning

1			He was keeping you up-to-date insofar as he was kept	
2			up-to-date, isn't that fair?	
3		Α.	Yes. I think Assistant Commissioner Fanning, to be	
4			fair, was seeking to encourage AC Finn to get this	
5			dealt with as expediently as possible.	14:13
6	411	Q.	Yes. I mean, some of the issues that were raised and	
7			reported upon related to the entitlement and the fact	
8			that parties had sought legal advice at different	
9			stages?	
10		Α.	Yes.	14:14
11	412	Q.	There in the second paragraph, for instance. But you	
12			seem to be pressing here for the investigation to be	
13			finalised and that they be given a two-week deadline to	
14			respond to the allegations?	
15		Α.	Part of the difficulty in the elongation of this whole	14:14
16			thing, is that there were these gaps in the cooperation	
17			or it's not anybody's fault, it just occurred, there	
18			was legal advice sought or whatever. It had the effect	
19			of making the thing elongated.	
20	413	Q.	Now, I'm sure you weren't trying to cut across their	14:14
21			right to legal advice in any way?	
22		Α.	No, no.	
23	414	Q.	But they don't appear at that stage to have responded	
24			to the allegations made and you're suggesting then, if	
25			we go down the page onto the next page, what ought to	14:14
26			happen.	
27				
28			"They should be informed that the assistant	
29			commissioner will finalise his investigation."	

Τ				
2			Then you raise the spectre of non-cooperation.	
3		Α.	Yeah. As the policyholder on this, you know, while	
4			every autonomy must be given to the investigating	
5			officer, I have to be mindful of certain of the issues	14:15
6			arising in the course of investigation if they are put	
7			to me, and they were by AC fanning on I think those two	
8			previous occasions you referred to. So that was my	
9			response.	
10	415	Q.	I mean, you're not in any sense taking side?	14:15
11		Α.	No.	
12	416	Q.	One against the other?	
13		Α.	Not at all.	
14	417	Q.	You're anxious it be concluded?	
15		Α.	Yeah. In fairness, I think that is precisely what	14:15
16			earlier we had been accused of, by, you know, not	
17			expediting matters. I just wanted to make certain that	
18			we weren't letting this thing drift off further.	
19	418	Q.	Yes. I think Assistant Commissioner Fanning further	
20			wrote to you on the 10th October 2018?	14:16
21		Α.	I had been suspended.	
22	419	Q.	On the 10th October?	
23		Α.	No, sorry, I hadn't been suspended by then.	
24	420	Q.	If we look at 4713?	
25		Α.	Okay.	14:16
26	421	Q.	You are being sent the report by Inspector McCarthy	
27			which is the report on the next page, if we scroll	
28			down?	

Yes.

Α.

- 1 422 Q. The reason being explained is that there are further queries raised by Mr. Cullen on Garda Keogh's -3 A. And that's fine, all of that is fine.
- 4 423 Q. And then I think you got a further report on the 18th

  5 October, if we look at 4719 and 4720. Sorry, he is

  14:16
- forwarding a request from you dated the 18th?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 424 Q. If we look on the next page. You're seeking to be updated essentially.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 425 Q. I think you refer to an issue of suspension there,
  12 which isn't relevant. I think you did say in your
  13 statement to our investigators that you met Garda Keogh
  14 once in your official capacity, as it were?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 426 Q. Executive director. And then you met him, I think was 17 it --
- 18 A. The 30th October.
- 19 427 Q. The 30th October, on foot of a request from him I
  20 think?
- 21 A. Correct.
- 22 428 Q. That he had some information, important information to impart?
- A. He left a voicemail on my telephone.
- 25 429 Q. Yes.
- A. I mean, I have to confess, so did probably a hundred others, and I was in my car when I took the message.
- 28 430 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. I was driving to Dublin and he invited me to have a

1			coffee with him.						
2	431	Q.	Was it information in relation to any of the issues						
3			that he is currently examining?						
4		Α.	No.						
5	432	Q.	No?	14:18					
6		Α.	No.						
7	433	Q.	In relation to all of the other issues, I think you						
8			have answered the investigators' questions about your						
9			knowledge or involvement in our list of 22 issues and I						
10			think had you no knowledge or involvement of any of 14:18						
11			them, except the ones that we have discussed in						
12			evidence this morning?						
13		Α.	That's true.						
14	434	Q.	Pay, sick classification and penalisation, bullying and						
15			harassment; isn't that correct?	14:18					
16		Α.	That's correct.						
17	435	Q.	Thank you very much, Mr. Barrett.						
18		Α.	Thank you, Mr. McGuinness.						
19									
20			END OF EXAMINATION	14:19					
21									
22			CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Brien, you would be next, isn't that						
23			right. You probably need a few minutes, yourself and						
24			Ms. Mulligan, you need a few minutes, is that right?						
25			MR. O'BRIEN: Yes, please. I think ten minutes,	14:19					
26			Chairman, would suffice.						
27			CHAIRMAN: Is that enough? Okay. It's nearly twenty						
28			past, if I said 2:30, is that convenient?						
29			MR. O'BRIEN: May it please you, Chairman.						

1			THE WITNESS: That's fine, Chairman.	
2			CHAIRMAN: So be it. We will sit at 2:30 again.	
3			Thanks very much.	
4				
5			THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED BRIEFLY AND RESUMED AS	14:19
6			FOLLOWS:	
7				
8			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Yes, Ms. Mulligan.	
9				
10			MR. JOHN BARRETT WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MS. MULLIGAN, AS	14:35
11			FOLLOWS:	
12				
13	436	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Good afternoon, Mr. Barrett.	
14		Α.	Good afternoon. If you bear with me for a minute.	
15	437	Q.	I wonder can I just go back to the very start, without	14:36
16			hoping the HQ Directive, are you happy to say that you	
17			are familiar with HQ Directive 139/2010?	
18		Α.	No.	
19	438	Q.	Okay.	
20		Α.	If I could have a copy put on the screen, I would be	14:36
21			grateful.	
22	439	Q.	Okay. If we could have open Volume 38, please,	
23			Mr. Kavanagh, it is page 8202. Just in relation to	
24			your role, so I think you have given relatively clear	
25			evidence that, for want of a better word, your role is	14:36
26			the system, so you don't look at individual people per	
27			se, you're looking at the organisation as a whole,	
28			would that be a fair summation as to your role?	
29		۸	VAS	

1	440	Q.	When we look at the role at local management, it's your	
2			role to look at the system and it's the local	
3			management's role to look at the individuals who will	
4			be applying and who will be using these directives on	
5			the ground level, would that be fair?	14:37
6		Α.	Yeah. These directive are to the organisation on how	
7			to conduct various matters of process. I would look at	
8			the score that comes back, how many people we have on	
9			various categories of illness, etcetera.	
10	441	Q.	And I think at the very start of your evidence, for	14:37
11			example, you said there would be hundreds of people off	
12			at any given moment and you would be looking at the	
13			numbers rather than individual cases?	
14		Α.	Yeah, individual cases only by exception.	
15	442	Q.	Yes, by exception?	14:37
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	443	Q.	So, for example, it wouldn't be standard for you for	
18			any and all work related stress investigations to be, I	
19			suppose, managed in any substantial or personal way by	
20			you?	14:37
21		Α.	Correct.	
22	444	Q.	So when you look at the management of the work related	
23			stress/injury on duty categorisation, you're looking at	
24			it from a numbers, how is it being used, how many	
25			people are availing of it, is it effective, how long is	14:38
26			it taking; would that be fair?	
27		Α.	That's correct, and I think there was some reference in	
28			my evidence, but in others, to a review that was	
29			ongoing with respect to injury on duty.	

445 So again, process as opposed to person. And so, 1 Q. Yes. 2 from Garda Keogh's point of view, while his file might 3 go up through, I think there are three essentially tenants is the local management, then you have HR and 4 5 the Sick Section in Navan? 14:38 6 Yes. Α. 7 So there are two, we'll say, HR and administrative 446 Q. 8 processes and then there's the local management role which would be, I suppose, the more direct --9 10 Yes. Α. 14:38 11 447 -- interaction from the individual's point of view? Q. 12 That's correct. Α. 13 So when we look at the 11.37 and it says: 448 Q. 14 "Where there is a doubt about whether or not an injury 15 16 on duty occurred." 17 18 which is just on the second paragraph, on page 8205. 19 8205 yeah. Α. 20 449 You did give clear evidence that that doubt, the Q. 14:39 question is really for the chief superintendent, is 21 22 that right? 23 Yeah, the decision is the chief superintendent. Α. 24 reference to doubt was, when we met in September, there 25 having been no report I think having been requested in 14:39 26 June, I think somebody used the term we gave Garda 27 Keogh the benefit of the doubt. 28 Just so I am very clear in terms of we see in May of 450 Q.

29

2015, the start of the administrative process once the

- 1 six certs are scanned in through Navan, to say you now 2 need to do an investigation?
- 3 Α. Yes.
- 451 And my question to you then is, that letter that's sent 4 0. 5 saying you now need to do an investigation, is that a 6 proforma letter?
- 7 Pretty much. Α.
- 8 452 I asked Mr. Mulligan and he said this is essentially Q. 9 the process to try and catch any gaps?
- 10 Α. Yes. 14 · 40
- 11 453 Therefore, the authorisation or the engagement with an Q. 12 investigation rest, for want of a better word, purely 13 with the management, the local management?
- 14 Α. The local management, that's correct.
- 15 454 In other words, your chief superintendent is the person 14:40 Q. 16 who holds the responsibility?
- 17 Correct. Α.
- 18 455 But she of course may delegate down to investigations? Q.
- 19 Yes. Α.
- So that then leads me on to the issue of that 20 456 Q. 14:40 delegation into an investigation. Would you expect in 21
- 22 ordinary course if someone is going to do the work 23 related stress investigation, that the person who is
- 24 the subject of that investigation would be informed?
- 25 Yes. Α. 14 · 40
- So in other words, Garda Keogh would be written to in 26 457 Q.
- 27 line with presumably the attachment from HR --
- 28 Yes. Α.
- 29 458 -- we have to do a work related stress investigation? Q.

- 1 A. That strikes me as --
- 2 459 Q. Standard?
- 3 A. Yeah, standard.
- 4 460 Q. And would, in your -- and obviously again I accept that
- you are a process, not a person, in engaging as HR, but 14:41

14 · 41

14:41

14 · 41

- from that point of view would you expect to if you open
- 7 the file that you would see that letter, I have been
- 8 asked to do a work related stress investigation, I
- 9 wonder you come in to meet me?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 461 Q. Or would you be available to have a conversation, or
- any of those things?
- 13 A. Yes, I would expect there would have been a number of
- 14 efforts made certainly before.
- 15 462 Q. And so, if I was to tell you that there is no such
- letter on this file, would that surprise you?
- 17 A. I would be surprised.
- 18 463 Q. Okay. Then if I were to look at continuing on I
- 19 suppose the process as opposed to the individual, and
- if there was no such letter and a letter -- we'll say
- 21 that it's the 7th May letter from HR and it says please
- conduct an investigation, would you expect when a reply
- is sent identifying the steps that were taken that
- there was in fact an investigation outlining what steps
- 25 were taken?
- 26 A. I would, and I am obviously a little bit surprised by
- 27 your line of questioning, only because there's a very
- definitive letter from Chief Superintendent Wheatley
- saying that she took the trouble to go and visit Garda

Т			Keogh at his nome address. So I was, up to the point	
2			of your questioning, assuming that which is written is	
3			true.	
4	464	Q.	If we might just open then, because I think it might be	
5			helpful for everyone, if we just look at page 3267.	14:42
6		Α.	3267.	
7	465	Q.	Just to be absolutely clear about everything. I think	
8			to be fair, you will have seen this, it is a series of	
9			correspondence in a report furnished to Chief	
10			Superintendent McLoughlin?	14:43
11		Α.	Okay. And it's written by? Who is the author?	
12	466	Q.	It might be of a benefit to have a hard copy because	
13			there are several sequential pages?	
14		Α.	3267. Yes.	
15	467	Q.	And you will see I will give you a moment?	14:43
16		Α.	This is the lengthy document that Mr. McGuinness	
17			opened, yeah.	
18	468	Q.	Yes, the lengthy document. It identifies the steps	
19			taken by, we'll say, local management to investigate	
20			the source of the work related stress. One of the	14:43
21			issues that arises is that is that efforts were made	
22			locally to establish the source of the member's work	
23			related stress. And it says:	
24				
25			"On the 26th March Superintendent Murray met with Garda	14:43
26			Keogh at Athlone Garda Station to discuss the frequent	
27			absences at work."	
28				
29			Do you see that?	

1	Α.	Ιd	o. pa	ragraph	3.
_			-,		

27

28

29

2 469 Q. Yes. Would it surprise you then to identify that that
3 was actually not a meeting for the purposes of a work
4 related stress investigation, but was the very first
5 time that Superintendent Murray met Garda Keogh?

- A. I would be surprised, yes. Very clearly what it
  doesn't say here is to discuss the member's frequent
  attendance at work.
- In fact Superintendent Murray in his evidence described 9 470 Q. it as a meeting to solve problems. A number of issues 10 14 · 44 11 were raised by Superintendent Murray at this meeting. 12 But just so I am clear about the process, if you are 13 going to conduct a work related stress investigation. 14 you have identified that you would expect the chief 15 superintendent to write to the subject of the 14:44 16 investigation, would you expect the investigator, if we acknowledge that this is what Superintendent Murray's 17 18 role is in this process, as the investigator, who is 19 appointed by Chief Superintendent Wheatley, if that is the case, would you expect then that that, I suppose 20 14:45 that new role, that additional role that Superintendent 21 22 Murray would have would be identified to Garda Keogh? 23 There is to be a work related stress investigation, 24 one, and two, that he would be informed of that? 25
  - A. I really am always surprised that matters are not dealt 14:45 with adult to adult. I think if this was a meeting, as is suggested here, to discuss the member's frequent absence from work, I take it to mean what it says. I wasn't at the meeting, so I can't make any comment. I

1 haven't -- the date didn't jump off the page at me. 2 But in an organisation with 17,000 people, one 3 assumes -- you know. I totally accept again, you're not necessarily 4 471 Q. 5 double-checking everyone's work? 14:46 6 Sure, I'm not. But the business that this letter Α. purports to tell us about is very normal, it happens in 7 every Garda district, in every Garda division in every 8 Garda region every day. 9 You wouldn't be over -- you yourself wouldn't be, I 10 472 Q. 14 · 46 11 suppose, doing it in chronological order? 12 Not at all. Α. 13 You would expect local management to do the job? 473 Q. 14 Α. Precisely, and so it must operate. 15 474 And I appreciate that. So for example, this report Q. 14:46 16 that goes to Chief Superintendent McLoughlin, dated 6th June 2016 --17 18 Yeah. Α. 19 475 -- refers to the efforts that were made to investigate Q. the source of Garda Keogh's work related stress. 20 14:46 can I just for the absolute clarity, there's only one 21 22 direct meeting between Superintendent Murray and my 23 client, Garda Keogh, and that is on the 26th March 24 2015. So that predates the request for the work 25 related stress investigation and there was no further 14 · 47 26 attempts made by anyone to contact Garda Keogh about 27 the source of this stress.

28

29

Α.

I am at a significant disadvantage here in the sense

that I will take your word for it. And I can say that

1			I did rely upon the kinds of reports that are received,	
2			as I did not just from Chief Wheatley but from chiefs	
3			all overt country when matters became contentious. I	
4			would expect and I think anybody in the room would	
5			expect that in circumstances like this there would be	14:47
6			an honest, open and adult to adult conversation as to	
7			why people are absent from work and what is the nature	
8			of the stress and what are the stressors and what are	
9			the symptoms of the stress and how does it manifest	
LO			itself. All the normal, lay person, interested	14:48
L1			enquiries that should be made around topics like that.	
L2			And any organisation, and I say this as somebody who	
L3			has a considerable amount of experience in guiding	
L4			organisations on stuff like this, any organisation	
L5			would be concerned to understand sources of stress and	14:48
L6			destress for its employees. Because they impact proper	
L7			functioning. So when I get a report that tells me	
L8			this, I take it at face value because it should be so.	
L9	476	Q.	So the report in the correspondence is dated the 7th	
20			May is the request, the response is then furnished by	14:48
21			Superintendent Murray on the 20th May. And in that	
22			time no efforts were made to contact Garda Keogh about	
23			the source of his stress, to inform him that there was	
24			an investigation, that there was a request for an	
25			investigation, the consequence of cooperating or	14:48
26			failure to cooperate with that investigation, none of	
27			those things happened?	
28		Α.	I can't make any comment on that. I don't I'm take	
29			your word for it, I don't know.	

- 1 477 Q. I think it's established none of those things happened.
- What they mean is a matter of submission. But that
- 3 seems to have been established on the facts that that
- 4 is what happened. Is that the proper functioning --
- 5 A. No, it's not.
- 6 478 Q. -- of HR directive 139/2010?
- 7 A. I'm not familiar with the directive in all its detail.

- 8 but I can certainly say that that is not the spirit of
- 9 the intent of such an inquiry.
- 10 479 Q. Okay. When we take it into account the fact that Garda 14:49
- 11 Keogh was a whistleblower, would that give you an
- 12 additional cause for concern?
- 13 A. Well, I think the actual issue of stress, you know, it
- 14 doesn't require -- it's not different for
- 15 whistleblowers or non-whistleblowers, it's an issue in
- and of itself and I think the conversation should be,
- 17 you know, a full and frank discussion, whistleblower or
- 18 no.
- 19 480 Q. Absolutely. But we will say, that if the issue, I
- suppose the additional stress of having been subject to 14:50
- 21 protected disclosure, having had --
- 22 A. Yeah, normal human empathy would say, if you were
- dealing with somebody with some kind of --
- 24 481 Q. Might be more difficult, without minimising anyone
- 25 else?
- 26 A. Just as an awareness.
- 27 482 Q. Indeed. So from that point of view, if what I have
- 28 just said is correct, would you say that an
- 29 investigation took place?

- 1 A. I am at a real disadvantage here because you are asking
- 2 me to agree with you, and I will do so in a
- 3 hypothetical sense, if as you described it to be.
- 4 483 Q. Of course?
- 5 A. It would be improper, it would be insufficient in my  $_{14:50}$
- 6 view. In my view.
- 7 484 Q. It would be?
- 8 A. But I think there is a requirement just in all human
- 9 interaction that there is an adult to adult transaction

14:51

- about problem identification, you know, and how it is
- that that problem should then perhaps best be dealt
- 12 with.
- 13 485 Q. Just for the purposes of clarity as well, if we look at
- the report that was furnished to Chief Superintendent
- McLoughlin, and again that's at page 3267, none of that 14:51
- is clearly identified in that correspondence to Chief
- 17 Superintendent McLoughlin either.
- 18 A. None of what?
- 19 486 Q. The fact that there is only one meeting on the 26th
- 20 March 2015?
- 21 A. I'll have to re-read this. It says "efforts have been
- 22 made locally", it sounds as if it's in the plural.
- 23 487 Q. I suppose just for clarity, what I am trying to say is
- 24 that when a request is made from HR on the 7th May to
- do an investigation and a report is furnished on the
- 26 20th May, and doesn't make it clear that the only
- 27 attempt to have a meeting with Garda Keogh was dated
- the 26th March, would you have concern about that and I
- suppose the honesty behind the report in that regard?

1		Α.	I am not prepared to there's a series of things here	
2			that I am not familiar with that I am being asked to	
3			make a judgment on. I think I can make a judgment	
4			about the human interaction, the transaction that	
5			should occur in a generic way between somebody	14:5
6			enquiring about work related stress and somebody	
7			experiencing work related stress. The particular	
8			mechanics of this, I am not sufficiently familiar with	
9			the date sequence or how matters unfolded. But I take	
LO			your point in general, if that's an answer to the	14:5
L1			question.	
L2	488	Q.	Okay. Just so we are I might have to be a little	

- 13 bit more specific when we go through the paperwork as In terms of -- we'll say, we'll 14 is required then. start with Chief Superintendent Wheatley's role. 15 14:53 16 received the request on the 7th May to conduct a work 17 related stress investigation. One might expect if that 18 investigation was to be completed or any undertaking to 19 have the investigation, you would see some attempt of 20 correspondence directly with the subject, in this case 14:53 21 it would be Garda Keogh?
- 22 A. I would imagine it could have been done by 23 correspondence, it could have been done by telephone.
- 24 489 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. Just, I would like to have a discussion with you.
- 26 490 O. Yes.
- A. There's a matter to be raised. It doesn't necessarily have to be in writing, it could have been done, you know, in a face-to-face meeting in a hallway. But

1			there would have to be a contact.	
2	491	Q.	Some direct contact of some kind?	
3		Α.	Correct.	
4	492	Q.	And one of the things that you might then expect to see	
5			on top of that would be, what is the nature of the	14:54
6			complaint and can you talk to me about it?	
7		Α.	I think that's a central core to any problem solving,	
8			identification of what the issue is, yes.	
9	493	Q.	And I can't imagine that in the circumstances I think	
10			you said there was some 17,000 people in the	14:54
11			organisation	
12		Α.	Yes.	
13	494	Q.	that your direct line manager, it wouldn't be that	
14			surprising if the person or the alleged source of	
15			stress was your direct line manager, I presume that is	14:54
16			probably standard enough?	
17		Α.	It does happen.	
18	495	Q.	It does happen?	
19		Α.	You know, there are any number of stressors, but it can	
20			happen, of course.	14:54
21	496	Q.	And so, for example, is it possible if such an issue is	
22			addressed that a third party, someone would come in	
23			from beyond the division to be an independent	
24			investigator, so in other words, a different chief	
25			superintendent?	14:55
26		Α.	Sure. It happens all the time, there's adult to adult	
27			arrangements made around the organisation to circumvent	
28			personal difficulties and to try and resolve things	
29			intelligently.	

- 1 497 Q. So from that point of view, the fact that Garda Keogh 2 had made a protected disclosure, then that wasn't
- 3 necessarily a bar per se to having an investigation,
- 4 would that be fair?
- 5 A. Having an investigation?
- 6 498 Q. Yes, having a work related stress investigation?
- 7 A. Not at all.
- 8 499 Q. Not at all. So one of the issues that was raised by
- 9 Chief Superintendent Wheatley is that she progressed it

14:55

14:56

- as far as she could. That obviously from our point is
- disputed. But from your point of view, if it's the
- case that she progressed it as far as she could
- directly, she could have sought the appointment of an
- investigator from a different division or different
- district. So in other words, if the individual, Garda
- 16 Keogh had a specific grievance with Chief
- 17 Superintendent Wheatley, can a different chief
- superintendent be the person to do the investigation,
- for example?
- 20 A. Sure. I didn't realise that there was an issue between 14:56
- 21 Garda Keogh and Chief Superintendent Wheatley.
- 22 500 Q. No, it was hypothetical, just for clarity?
- 23 A. Right.
- 24 501 Q. That was a purely hypothetical issue?
- 25 A. Okay.
- 26 502 Q. So in other words, if you're the divisional officer?
- 27 A. Sure.
- 28 503 Q. And the complaint is about you?
- 29 A. Yeah.

1	504	Q.	It would make sense that you wouldn't be the person?	
2		Α.	Of course.	
3	505	Q.	If that is the case, can a person from a different	
4			division become the investigating officer?	
5		Α.	Of course.	14:56
6	506	Q.	So that is something that is in place and happens?	
7		Α.	It happens all the time by local arrangement right	
8			throughout the country. I'm sure there is probably	
9			meetings going on now under that particular format.	
10	507	Q.	For example, there's no correspondence from Chief	14:56
11			Superintendent Wheatley or anyone else in that regard	
12			for any such request to be made, that we have. Are you	
13			familiar with there being any such correspondence?	
14		Α.	I am not familiar with this. And truthfully, this is	
15			at a level which I think Chief McLoughlin may have been	14:57
16			a better person to ask these questions of. For two	
17			reasons: He's an actual architect of the HQ and would	
18			be closer to the division in his capacity as the	
19			protected disclosure manager that was engaged with	
20			Garda Keogh. But I can answer you at a level of	14:57
21			principle and I think there's nothing I am saying that	
22			isn't, if you like, just common sense. But you know, I	
23			respect the requirement for the use of common sense in	
24			dealing with matters of sensitivity.	
25	508	Q.	Very good.	14:57
26		Α.	And I can't say about the specific.	

28

29

509 Q.

That's helpful. There is one other issue that has

arisen from Ms. Claire Egan, I will find the relevant

reference now, but Ms. Egan says that she wasn't aware

1 of any application for Garda Keogh's to be considered 2 for an injury on duty. Now, where would that 3 application arise from? Would that come from local management? I presume, as I understand it, Claire Egan 4 5 works again for the Sick Section? 14:58 6 Yes. Α. And correct me if I am wrong, what would you expect is 7 510 Q. 8 a section 11.37 from Chief Superintendent Wheatley? 9 Yes. Α. 10 And then, once that authorisation is provided by her, 511 Q. 14:58 11 then HR? 12 Yes. Α. 13 Or the Sick Section? 512 Q. 14 Α. Yes. 15 513 Do the administrative aspect of that, is that correct? Q. 14:58 16 That is absolutely correct. So chief's prerogative, Α. 17 local decision based on investigation, forward report 18 into Sick Section, matter is resolved and processed. 19 514 In relation to that then, the role of the CMO is Q. obviously to identify if there's any other reason that 20 14:58 might --21 22 Yes. Α. 23 -- have caused the stress. Would it be fair to say 515 Q. 24 that it is the absence of any other reason -- or are 25 you familiar with there being a test? 14:58 No. You know, again, the question is perhaps best 26 Α. directed at Dr. Oghuvbu, but, you know, the CMO is the 27 expert who advises the chief. 28

29

516

Q.

Yes.

- 1 A. Is probably the most simple way I can...
- 2 517 Q. Again for the sake of completeness, that was put to
- 3 Dr. Oghuvbu and what he said was that he would wait for
- 4 an application for a request to be made. In other
- 5 words, he wouldn't diagnose work related stress or
- 6 injury on duty in the absence of being informed that is

14:59

14:59

- 7 what someone was asking him to do. Would you agree
- 8 with that position?
- 9 A. I would have to bow to whatever his process is.
- 10 518 Q. Okay.
- 11 A. But to my knowledge there was a case conference
- 12 attended by Dr. Oghuvbu.
- 13 519 Q. Yes, there was.
- 14 A. At some juncture in this process.
- 15 520 Q. Some 12 months later, yes.
- 16 A. All right. Okay.
- 17 521 Q. Yes, that is the case. The issue is that, yes, while
- the matter was resolved and again by Chief
- 19 Superintendent McLoughlin, there is quite a significant
- timeline between the first request for an investigation 15:00
- by HR and the subsequent resolution of matters?
- 22 A. Yes. I take that point.
- 23 522 Q. It is that issue that we find ourselves discussing
- quite substantively in these proceedings, if that makes
- 25 sense.
- 26 A. I understand. I think Mr. McGuinness asked me some
- 27 questions about that. I think I have answered as
- 28 honestly as I can.
- 29 523 Q. As best you can. Just then in relation to the bullying

1	and harassment piece, again Mr. McGuinness has gone
2	through all the substantive correspondence, so I am
3	going to go through a few of them, if that's okay?

4 A. Sure.

- 5 524 Can I just ask, and I am just going to put the question 15:00 Q. 6 more generally and then I can go more into documents, 7 but in terms of this issue of delay, you have quite 8 reasonably said there was a delay, there were a few moving parts that caused difficulty. It just doesn't 9 appear that you have identified in any of the 10 15:01 11 correspondence when you address the issues that you are 12 acknowledging the delay in a contemporaneous fashion. 13 So, in the flow of correspondence you're not saying 14 there has been a delay here, we need to move this on, 15 or acknowledging that was an issue from that point of 15:01 16 view, at the time. Is that just looking at it with the 17 benefit of hindsight now?
- A. I think it is, truthfully. One of the issues I think
  that I am finding difficult is, I read these papers in
  some detail before Covid in the expectation of coming
  here and having this inquiry, I read some of them in
  the last couple of days, and my perspective I think was
  probably a little different when I was in the middle of
  it, if you know what I mean.

15:01

15:02

25 525 Q. Yes.

29

A. And that's a reality I think for all of us. So I am

finding the question difficult to answer, as to what
lens I should use, was I conscious of the delay because

I have had the benefit of standing back and looking at

Τ			it now, or was I conscious of the delay when I was in	
2			the middle of it. You know, I can acknowledge it now,	
3			but it's probably with the benefit of reading everybody	
4			else's contribution.	
5	526	Q.	Seeing the whole picture?	15:02
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	527	Q.	And I suppose the same question then sort of applies to	
8			the issue of the statement that you say you didn't	
9			receive from Assistant Commissioner Fanning until	
10			October?	15:02
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	528	Q.	That he says was sent to you in March. And there is a	
13			series of correspondence that have been opened	
14			extensively by Mr. McGuinness. But at no point do you	
15			say that I don't have this statement from Chief	15:02
16			Superintendent Scanlan. I suppose just I want you to	
17			clarify why didn't you do that?	
18		Α.	I can address that very clearly and if there is any	
19			doubt I think discussion with the investigators for	
20			this Tribunal. When they put that to me, that there	15:03
21			was this correspondence from AC Fanning, I said I never	
22			saw it. As in, I never saw the attachments or the	
23			appendices that were sent. I was troubled, because my	
24			initial reaction was, have I missed it? I think the	
25			recall evidence of Assistant Commissioner Fanning and	15:03
26			the evidence of Mr. Mulligan corroborates at least what	
27			I said in absolute honesty to the investigators. I	
28			didn't see it because it wasn't sent. It wasn't in the	
29			appendixes that I had received. And I wasn't there,	

- which was the difficulty, I knew, on those dates, Alan was standing in my shoes. So I had that anxiety. But Mr. Fanning himself I think makes the point that it was the 4th October when the matter was resolved.
- 5 529 Q. But my question is: If you didn't receive it, why weren't you looking for it?
- 7 Well, the correspondence that went to me was opened by Α. Alan, I had reports on it. This is where the benefit 8 of hindsight becomes really valuable. Perhaps I should 9 have said, hold a second, let's go through all of this 10 15:04 11 in fine detail. The reality is, I didn't do it until we had the benefit of Mr. Cullen's correspondence in 12 13 September or in whatever that was, September.
- 14 530 Q. And I think just you have already made the point about 15 the difficulty between having I suppose several 16 different players moving at all times, from the Chairman's point of view and I suppose from the ability 17 18 to progress matters into the future, if there was to be 19 an issue that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin's office 20 -- would it be your view that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin's office should deal with all issues in 21

relation to whistleblowers and not --

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

15:04

15:04

15:05

A. Well that's the intent. That's the role of the protected disclosures manager, is to do just that. I had a specific role in that very same vein with Sergeant McCabe. It's an extremely demanding and difficult and unpredictable obligation to have on behalf of an organisation. And I empathise with the chief. I think what is evident is that there was a lot

1			of valiant endeavour and a lot of, what I would	
2			consider to be, outputs in terms of correspondence and	
3			documents flowing. The frustration that I am clearly	
4			seeing from the letters from Mr. Cullen is outputs are	
5			different from outcomes.	15:0
6	531	Q.	So from that point of view, having one person carrying	
7			the whole story is something that is probably necessary	
8			to avoid this kind of system failure?	
9		Α.	I have lived a life in the private sector by and large	
10			and certainly a single point of contact is probably a	15:0
11			whole lot more effective.	
12	532	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You think there was failure?	
13		Α.	I agree that there was certainly elements of confusion,	
14			Chairman.	
15	533	Q.	CHAIRMAN: No, that is not my question?	15:0
16		Α.	The failure	
17	534	Q.	CHAIRMAN: was there a failure? I mean, sorry, here is	
18			the question, if I am understanding Ms. Mulligan's	
19			point, he makes his complaint in March, the 27th March,	
20			Assistant Commissioner Finn is appointed, if I	15:0
21			understand, on the 11th November, those are the	
22			relevant dates?	
23			MS. MULLIGAN: The 15th November.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, the 15th November.	
25			MS. MULLIGAN: Yes.	15:0
26	535	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Are you standing over that?	
27		Α.	I certainly see it as I will answer your question by	
28			putting it in this context.	

29 536 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, are you standing over that as proper

1			behaviour. I mean, you're the man in charge. You	
2			carry the can. Whether it was Alan Mulligan or anybody	
3			else, you're the boss. Do you think that's acceptable?	
4			Because I'll tell you something, I don't	
5		Α.	Chairman, I don't disagree with you.	15:07
6	537	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And I can understand why Garda Keogh is	
7			there saying, what's going on, is there something here,	
8			maybe there is, maybe there isn't, he thinks there was	
9			something very sinister going on?	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:07
11	538	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Doesn't he have every reason to think	
12			there's something sinister going on when everybody is	
13			however it's done, Assistant Commissioner Finn isn't	
14			and I don't sense that you were saying, gosh, we	
15			made an awful mess of this, I'm sorry. I don't have	15:07
16			any sense of that. I think you're explaining things,	
17			that it could be this way or it could be that. I don't	
18			want to be rough, forgive me. Look, maybe it's because	
19			we're just coming back and I am being indiscrete. But	
20			I mean, let's face it, he is sitting there, he has made	15:08
21			his complaint and nothing is happening and he can't	
22			find out what's happening?	
23		Α.	Chairman, I can certainly agree and understand where	
24			are you coming from.	
25	539	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. I am not trying to listen, believe	15:08
26			me, Mr. Barrett I'm not trying to give you a hard time?	
27		Α.	I don't for a moment	
28	540	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Ms. Mulligan has been more polite than I am	
29			hut essentially her noint is really simple?	

A. I am not defending this delay and as you've said, and you're correct, I am seeking to explain it, right. And do I think it's good enough in the circumstances?

Absolutely not good enough.

15:08

15:09

15:09

15:09

15:09

- 5 541 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 6 A. I think if you -- and let's put this in --
- 7 542 Q. CHAIRMAN: What do you think went wrong?
- 8 A. Well, I think that there is a series of communications
  9 which are incomplete, in that they did not contain the
  10 required information. And let's be clear. All that
- 11 Chief Superintendent Scanlan was tasked to do was take 12 a statement.
- 13 543 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 14 A. And determine what it is that was the most senior officer complained of.
- 16 544 Q. CHAIRMAN: So as to tell us the level of which --
- 17 A. Precisely.

Α.

26

- 18 545 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 19 A. In the context of the bullying and harassment itself,
- it sets out some timelines, albeit they aspirational,
- which are substantially shorter than the timeline that
- it took to actually take the statement. So I can't
- disagree with you, Chairman. I am not seeking to --
- 24 546 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, no, I understand. Please understand, I
- am not here to give you a hard time?

I understand that.

- 27 547 Q. CHAIRMAN: I am looking more at systems and issues and
- so on. I think that was the thrust of his Mulligan's
- 29 exploration of the matter. So the first thing you

- think was communication that went wrong. I am looking at the thing then and I think, there are two views about the nature of the investigation to be carried
- out, isn't that right? Assistant Commissioner Fanning
- says it should be this way and the other, the majority

15:10

15:10

15:10

- 6 view says well, no, we have a bullying and harassment?
- 7 A. Yes. Which is what was sought, let's be clear.
- 8 CHAIRMAN: I understand. That is what Mr. Cullen had 9 sought on behalf of -- but that doesn't take a long
- 10 time to decide. I mean, you have to talk about it and
- 11 then you decide.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 548 Q. CHAIRMAN: You don't sit down, wringing your hands and
- scratching your head. You know, you do it. You of all
- people with your extensive experience in industry and
- 16 everything else would know that. You make a decision
- 17 and there it is, right or wrong. Surely.
- 18 A. I would agree with you entirely and can I say further,
- that in the circumstances of this commencing in May
- 20 2014, wherein there are elements that, you know, took
- their own course, all elongated courses.
- 22 549 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sure, yes. But everything here seems to
- have conspired to lengthen the time, people not talking
- to other people, people taking different views and then
- not able to make up their minds about what to do?
- A. Well, I am satisfied, Chairman, with respect to the
- 27 decisions that I took and the part that I played in
- this.
- 29 550 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay.

1		Α.	Which moved from the tail end of September to the point	
2			at which Mr. Nugent took the coordination role on the	
3			23rd October.	
4	551	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
5		Α.	I am satisfied that I sought to move this Élan and in	15:11
6			good faith.	
7	552	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand. So basically sorry to	
8			interrupt?	
9		Α.	Sure.	
10	553	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But if I understand your position is, look,	15:11
11			you say, I accept there was a delay, and the delay that	
12			you say was there and the delay that you accept must be	
13			criticised is it arises because of the communications,	
14			is that essentially the point?	
15		Α.	In a lifetime of working in this space and doing all	15:12
16			sorts of things, I have never seen so much committed to	
17			paper when a phone call, a conversation or a meeting	
18			would drive the thing further and faster.	
19			Ms. Mulligan's enquiries regarding the report, that it	
20			was given, a written report has to be taken into the	15:12
21			literal sense. And you know, what was put to me	
22			suggested that something is different behind the words	
23			"Garda Keogh at Athlone Garda Station to discuss the	
24			member's frequent absence from work", that tells me	
25			what this letter says was discussed.	15:12

26

27

28

29

554 Q.

CHAI RMAN:

point that we are looking at, the delay in assigning

the assistant commissioner to carry out the bullying

and harassment investigation, that, you say, and I

Not but in this case, just to focus on the

Т			introduced some other elements about decisiveness and	
2			you said no, if I am understanding, it is a lack of	
3			communications, that is the report?	
4		Α.	The nature of the communications elongated the process.	
5			I think we could have foreshorten that.	15:13
6	555	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
7		Α.	That is a reality in the volumes of correspondence that	
8			we have here, I think, you know, things can be done	
9			more effectively, much like you and I are having,	
10			Chairman, a conversation right now to clarify what it	15:13
11			is that needs clarification. If we were doing this in	
12			correspondence we would probably have half a dozen	
13			letters written at this stage.	
14			CHAIRMAN: I understand. Okay. Thanks very much.	
15			That's all I wanted to ask. Do you want to ask	15:13
16			anything arising out of that, Ms. Mulligan?	
17			MS. MULLIGAN: Just one or two things very briefly.	
18			CHAIRMAN: And then I will move on to everybody else.	
19	556	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Just in relation to page 2549, this is	
20			just the meeting calling for a case conference, where	15:13
21			you did try to take actions and move things forward.	
22		Α.	Yeah.	
23	557	Q.	It just doesn't say there in the minutes of that	
24			meeting that you still don't have Chief Superintendent	
25			Scanlan's report?	15:14
26		Α.	No.	
27	558	Q.	I just wanted to give you an opportunity to address	
28			that?	
29		Α.	Sure. Fintan Fanning advised us that he had a copy	

Т			with him and that we were going to be given the	
2			benefit, if you like, of what it said. The essence of	
3			the reason this meeting took place was really the	
4			letter from Mr. Cullen at the end of September, which	
5			came to me and suggested that our protected disclosure	15:14
6			arrangements perhaps weren't working as they should.	
7	559	Q.	Just so I am clear, Mr. Cullen's letter I suppose	
8		Α.	Triggered.	
9	560	Q.	Lit the fire to move, progress things forward?	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:14
11	561	Q.	In the absence of that letter, do you think that this	
12			matter wouldn't have moved forward then?	
13		Α.	No, I think it would. I tried to give context in	
14			answering Mr. McGuinness. Of all of the other things	
15			that were going on in the August, September, October,	15:15
16			timeframe, we were having a tumultuous time in An Garda	
17			Síochána at that time, and there was a tremendous	
18			amount of interest, external and internal, in this	
19			matter and I decided that it needed to be pushed along,	
20			if that's a fair statement of my action.	15:15
21			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
22	562	Q.	MS. MULLIGAN: Just so that I have put it to you, I am	
23			going to say that this delay just had the effect of	
24			both targeting and discrediting Garda Keogh because it	
25			left him in a situation where he was left in limbo,	15:15
26			ultimately 18 months for something that is supposed to	
27			take a number of weeks.	
28		Α.	Yeah, I don't think the number of weeks would ever	
29			apply to a case of this complexity.	

2	503	Q.	effect of damaging Garda Keogh and certainly his	
3			relationship with his employer?	
4		Α.	I think that, you know, and taking the Chairman's	
5		۸.	point, I can explain the various segments of this, I am	15.10
6			not seeking to approve or justify it.	15:16
7	564	0	Very good. Nothing further.	
8	J 0 <del>1</del>	φ.	very good. Nothing further.	
9			END OF EXAMINATION	
10			LIND OF EXAMINATION	15:16
11			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Now, who is next? Yes	15:16
12			Mr. McGuinness. The other Mr. McGuinness, Mr. Donal	
13			McGuinness, yes.	
14			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Thank you, Chairman.	
15			CHAIRMAN: You're for An Garda Síochána.	15:16
16			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Yes.	13.10
17			CHAIRMAN: Are you okay, Mr. Barrett?	
18			THE WITNESS: Yes, I am very anxious to be of	
 19			assistance.	
20			CHAIRMAN: It's a long day. Thanks very much.	15:16
21				
22			MR. JOHN BARRETT WAS THEN CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. DONAL	
23			McGUI NNESS, AS FOLLOWS:	
24			<u> </u>	
25	565	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Mr. Barrett, can I deal with the	15:16
26		•	work related stress issue in brief to start with. The	
27			11.37 process, that has to be engaged in and we have	
28			talked about it at great length, that is a process that	
29			anticipates a certain amount of participation on the	

2			duty, isn't that correct?	
3		Α.	It does.	
4	566	Q.	Garda Keogh was at all times represented by a solicitor	
5			during this time. Garda Keogh as a guard would be	15:17
6			aware that in order to get the 11.37 processed he has	
7			to engage in a process to get certification; isn't that	
8			right?	
9		Α.	I think that is widely understood, yes.	
10	567	Q.	Now, the correspondence that you have gone into in	15:17
11			relation to Chief Superintendent Wheatley, she makes it	
12			very clear that from her perspective Garda Keogh has,	
13			for the want of a better word, put the hand up to any	
14			enquiries being asked of him that address the issue as	
15			to yes is claiming he is out of work on work related	15:17
16			stress. Do you accept that that is her view?	
17		Α.	I do. Again, in response to the correspondence that	
18			was opened by Ms. Mulligan, that's the suggestion	
19			clearly, yes, that there was a less than forthcoming,	
20			is the best way I could put it.	15:18
21	568	Q.	Yes. Ms. Mulligan has referenced the letter of the 8th	
22			June 2016, if we might just call that letter up, and	
23			she sets out, Chief Superintendent Wheatley clearly	
24			sets out the chronology of events that has led her to	
25			the view that she is not able to progress this issue of	15:18
26			finding out exactly what is the cause of the work	
27			related stress. Sorry, the page number is 3267. This	
28			is the letter that Ms. Mulligan referred to:	
29				

part of the guard who claims he has been injured on

1

Τ			"On 26th March 2015 Superintendent Murray met with	
2			Garda Keogh at Athlone Garda Station to discuss the	
3			member's frequent absences from work. Superintendent	
4			Murray outlined in his report dated 2nd April that	
5			Garda Keogh was reticent to discuss any issues	15:19
6			regarding his absence through work related stress."	
7				
8			Then she goes on to provide some more detail in	
9			relation to that.	
10		Α.	Yeah, I have that letter.	15:19
11	569	Q.	Ms. Mulligan has suggested that the reason why Garda	
12			Keogh failed to engage with Superintendent Murray on	
13			that occasion was because he was in some way concerned	
14			with that work related stress, that's my understanding	
15			of her question?	15:19
16		Α.	That's what I understood from it also.	
17	570	Q.	But are you aware that Superintendent Murray was barely	
18			two weeks	
19		Α.	I am.	
20	571	Q.	in Athlone at that time?	15:19
21		Α.	He was newly appointed in Athlone, yeah.	
22	572	Q.	Yes. So would you accept that it's very unlikely that	
23			within such a relatively short period of time there	
24			would on such animosity between them, that that is	
25			actually the reason why?	15:19
26		Α.	Well I was conscious of his date of appointment and I	
27			know he was preceded in the role.	
28	573	Q.	Yes. We might just look in a little more detail at	
29			some of the correspondence. There was a letter of the	

1			17th May 2016 from Chief Superintendent Wheatley, that	
2			is at 3203?	
3			MR. McGUINNESS: Chairman, might I just intervene on	
4			that point, because I did open that letter, but that	
5			isn't the letter that Chief Superintendent Wheatley	15:20
6			sent to the executive director's office in her report	
7			of the 8th June. There's a slightly revised version of	
8			it, which is actually dated the 18th May. That's to be	
9			found at 3277. There's some more factual information	
10			in it in relation to her visit. I should have opened	15:20
11			that.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Are you happy to deal with it on that basis,	
13			Mr. McGuinness. I am sure what Mr. McGuinness is	
14			saying is correct. Are you happy to accept that?	
15			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: I am, Chairman.	15:20
16			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Then 3277 is the one,	
17			is that right?	
18			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes.	
19	574	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: If we look at that letter, Chief	
20			Superintendent Wheatley addresses the issue again,	15:21
21			isn't that correct, or for the first time.	
22				
23			"I enquired if Garda Keogh was anxious to return to	
24			work and was advised by Garda Keogh he attributes his	
25			current absence to work related stress deriving from	15:21
26			his involvement in investigations being progressed	
27			outside the Westmeath division. Garda Keogh intimated	
28			that he would not be returning to work until these	
29			matters had been concluded as these matters were	

1			exacerbating his condition.	
2				
3			While this was noted the referral of the member to the	
4			CMO by his local district officer was made following a	
5			significant number of absences and the member's own	15:21
6			acknowledgment of a dependence on alcohol. During my	
7			meeting with him he outlined that he was not drinking	
8			heavi I y "	
9				
10			I will go on.	15:21
11				
12			"Garda Keogh stated that he would be attending the	
13			scheduled appointment with CMO."	
14				
15			She references the medical certificates forwarded by	15:22
16			the member set out the reasons for his continued	
17			absences from work. If we then just go on to the 26th	
18			May, which is 3276, the second paragraph there, Chief	
19			Superintendent Wheatley advises your office sorry	
20			that is	15:22
21			MR. McGUINNESS: That is a year earlier.	
22	575	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Actually, if we could look at	
23			that year. It's 2015, a year earlier, the alleged	
24			stress:	
25				15:22
26			"As the member is not willing to further discuss the	
27			issue which he states arises out of his involvement and	
28			protections under the confidentially reporting	
29			l egi sl ati on. "	

Τ				
2			And then if we go to the 3267, which is back to this	
3			letter, this long letter, and this letter is the 8th	
4			June 2016.	
5		Α.	Yeah.	15:22
6	576	Q.	And once more this is in response to this issue as to	
7			whether or not an investigation has been carried out,	
8			do you understand?	
9		Α.	I do.	
10	577	Q.	And it's to your office. The letter sets out the	15:23
11			progress of this issue, the difficulties with this	
12			issue and then if we just go to the very last	
13			paragraph, at page 3269:	
14				
15			"In view of the foregoing, it has not been possible to	15:23
16			conduct a full investigation into Garda Keogh's absence	
17			through alleged work related stress, nor do I believe	
18			will any further or specific information be provided by	
19			Garda Keogh which would enable the further	
20			investigation of this claim."	15:23
21				
22			She is making it very clear that she is unable to	
23			progress matters. She goes on:	
24				
25			"However, to be clear and to avoid any doubt, I am to	15:23
26			enquire if there is any requirement to further	
27			investigate Garda Keogh's absence through alleged work	
28			related stress. In the event that the further	
29			investigation of this matter is warranted, I would	

recommend	that permission be granted to appoint an
i nspector	outside the Westmeath division to conduct
same."	

Now, if you recall my answer to Mr. Diarmuid Α. Yeah. McGuinness earlier, Chief Superintendent McLoughlin had 15:24 met with Garda Keogh on the 3rd June, that's about a week, five days earlier than this letter, and he had committed per a letter from Garda Keogh of the 14th June that he would conduct the investigation. effectively what I understand the chief to have done is 15:24 to circumvent the dilemma that was pointed up here in this letter, some days earlier he anticipated it, because this had been raised. Chief McLoughlin, to his credit, has been very careful to ensure that in situations where work related stress arises that the obligation to investigate it was very much put in the hands of the divisional office. It's not just in the westmeath meet division, it's in all of the divisions, he has been a leading light in that respect and a leading campaigner for supports for mental health within An Garda Síochána. So I think this letter in many respects was almost moot by the fact that that meeting took place on the 3rd June in Tullamore and that the chief himself was going to take this in hand. And I think that's confirmed.

15:24

15:25

15:25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Subsequently the actions clearly were in September, which I appreciate again to the Chairman's point there was some delay, but there was a decision taken at that

- point, on the recommendation of the chief, that pay,
- full basic pay would be restored to Garda Keogh.
- 3 578 Q. Yes. That's essentially where I get to.
- 4 A. Sorry, I didn't mean to preempt.
- 5 579 Q. Garda Keogh, who was independently legally advised, as

15:26

15:26

15:26

- any guard would be, would be aware of the 11.37
- 7 procedure?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 580 Q. Chief Superintendent Wheatley shows her good faith by
- 10 explaining to your office exactly the difficulty that
- she has in completing an investigation into the cause
- of the work related stress. And that is associated
- with the very single fact that Garda Keogh has invoked
- his status as a protected discloser not to engage with
- 15 Superintendent Murray on this issue?
- 16 A. I'm not impugning Chief Wheatley at all. What she
- 17 wrote I read to be the position.
- 18 581 Q. I'm not suggesting you are impugning the Chief but what
- I want to make clear, her motives have very clear here.
- 20 Her motives are, she is telling head office is this is
- 21 the problem, this is the reason why we haven't got an
- investigation and if you still think an investigation
- is needed --
- A. Get somebody else, yeah.
- 25 582 Q. -- then there is the opportunity to appoint another to
- 26 investigate it?
- 27 A. Understood.
- 28 583 Q. That plays into --
- 29 A. It does.

- 1 584 Q. -- cross-examination by Ms. Mulligan, who raised the 2 issue with you as to whether or not engaging with 3 outside investigators was something that is done from 4 time to time?
- 5 A. It is, and I think we are clear on that.
- 6 585 Q. So Chief Superintendent Wheatley actually engaged even with that issue as well?

15:27

- 8 A. She did.
- 9 586 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. I think Chief McLoughlin, to his credit, had already 15:27
  11 found a different bridge to try and address the matter.
- 12 587 Q. And that's the point I am making, is that the problem
  13 was created as a result of Garda Keogh forming a view
  14 that as a protected discloser he didn't have to engage
  15 with local management on the issues that he says now
  16 were causally related to the work related stress
- because he is a protected discloser. And the work around it was fine, the local division went as far as
- they could, and the local management went as far as they could and told your office they went as far as
- they could, and then your office and Tony McLoughlin
- found a work around to that; isn't that really the
- 23 case?
- 24 A. That is the case.
- 25 588 Q. He was put on full pay from October 2016 and it was backdated to December 2015?
- 27 A. That's correct, when the absence began.
- 28 589 Q. Thank you. Now, if we move onto the next issue. This is the issue of delay, this is the issue you have

1			engaged in with the Chairman in relation to the delay	
2			that you believe occurred in relation to the bullying	
3			and harassment and the progressing of that complaint.	
4			As I understand it, you referenced that there was a	
5			delay in actually taking the complaint in the first	15:28
6			instance. Did I understand you correctly in saying	
7			that?	
8		Α.	I think that's documented, Mr. McGuinness. I think	
9			there were meetings to happen that didn't happen.	
10			There was legal advice sought. There was a variety of	15:28
11			different things that are in the various papers that I	
12			have read. Now don't ask me what papers because	
13			there's a forest of paper here.	
14	590	Q.	Well, let's break it down. There is the initial period	
15			when Garda Keogh eventually decides that he wishes to	15:29
16			engage with the bullying and harassment policy. We	
17			will call that period number one. He eventually	
18			decides in November 2016 to engage in the policy, isn't	
19			that correct?	
20		Α.	That is correct.	15:29
21	591	Q.	So there is that period between November 2016 and the	
22			end of March 2017, when he delivers his signed	
23			statement to Chief Superintendent Scanlan. That is	
24			period number one.	
25		Α.	That's your numbering, I accept the point.	15:29
26	592	Q.	I just want to clarify, do you believe that there has	
27			been a delay in relation to that period?	
28			CHAIRMAN: Between the time he decided to engage with	
29			the I'm sorry Mr. McGuinness, just so we know where	

1			we are going. The time he discovers he says he wants	
2			to engage with the bullying and harassment policy.	
3		Α.	Yes.	
4	593	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And that appears to be November 2016?	
5		Α.	'16, correct.	15:30
6	594	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Take that for the moment?	
7		Α.	Yeah.	
8	595	Q.	CHAIRMAN: We know that he meets Chief Superintendent	
9			Scanlan in March 2017 and gives him a statement on the	
LO			27th March 2017. And Mr. McGuinness says, let's take	15:30
L1			that as period number one. We were discussing period	
L2			number two. The period between the Scanlan exchanges,	
L3			the Scanlan encounter when the statement was made and	
L4			possibly November, when Assistant Commissioner Finn,	
L5			but that is another matter, but the first one	15:30
L6			Mr. McGuinness wants to say, let's take the first of	
L7			those, November 2016 to the Chief Superintendent	
L8			Scanlan statement, which is the end of March.	
L9		Α.	That's period number one.	
20	596	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Correct.	15:31
21		Α.	All right. In that, there are various back and forths,	
22			I have a letter in there saying can I be updated on the	
23			progress of this statement and I think there are	
24			responses telling me that meetings were scheduled and	
25			had to be cancelled and that there was legal advice	15:31
26			sought and there was a statement that wasn't signed,	
27			there's a lot of activity which then, to the chair's	
28			point, ultimately results in a signed statement dated	
29			27th March.	

- 1 597 Q. MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: well, I represent quite a few 2 clients in An Garda Síochána and one of them is Chief 3 Superintendent Scanlan.
- 4 A. Sure.
- 5 598 Q. I had perhaps understood that you were suggesting that 15:31 there had been a delay under his watch?

15:32

15:32

- 7 A. No, no, I'm not attributing it to anybody.
- 8 599 Q. In taking a statement?
- 9 Let's be clear, there is correspondence, again please Α. I'm not that familiar with all the paperwork and this 10 11 is something I didn't micromanage in any way, but there 12 are correspondences in there to suggest that meetings 13 were to be set up with Garda Keogh, and one party or 14 the other, and I'm attributing no blame, right, were 15 unavailable, or that Garda Keogh engaged legal advice. 16 Now, there are people in the room who are far more 17 familiar with the correspondence than I am, but that 18 was my reading, that there was a series of valiant 19 efforts made and for one reasonable reason or another it took the length of time that it did. 20
- 21 600 Q. If I may add some clarity to that period of time?
- 22 A. Sure.
- 23 If we could have a look at page 9866, please. 601 Q. 24 the second page of a letter from HR director Alan 25 Mulligan to the superintendent in the Commissioner's If we could go 9866, it's 25th November 2016 26 office. 27 it is dated. You might scroll down, Mr. Kavanagh, 28 There is a typed there of July 16th but please. November is inserted because that was the date it was 29

Т			sent.	
2				
3			If you just scroll up a little bit please to the main	
4			paragraph there. Yes. Stop there, please. In the	
5			middle of that paragraph Mr. Mulligan says:	15:33
6				
7			"Mr. Cullen said that he has no problem with this	
8			letter, that he understands that Garda Keogh must	
9			formally submit him a complaint in a clear and	
10			unambiguous manner and that he has advised Garda Keogh	15:33
11			to fully comply with the Garda policy in relation to	
12			bullying and harassment. He advised me that Garda	
13			Keogh was working on his complaint and will send it as	
14			soon as possible. I offered my assistance and/or	
15			Ms. Hassett's assistance to Mr. Cullen and Garda Keogh	15:33
16			in relation to the matter. Mr. Cullen took my contact	
17			details and said he will ring me if he needs	
18			assistance. We agreed that Garda Keogh's complaint	
19			would be sent directly to me or Chief Superintendent	
20			McLoughlin. I promised that we will arrange for	15:33
21			investigating officer to be appointed as soon as the	
22			complaint is received."	
23				
24			So An Garda Síochána has very clearly engaged with	
25			Garda Keogh and his solicitor at this time, telling him	15:34
26			what is required in order to progress his bullying and	
27			harassment complaint, do you agree with me?	
28		Α.	I do, yes.	
20	602	^	Voc. And then if I could just give you a comics of	

1			dates and you can disagree with these if you wish, but	
2			I think they are correct, on the 23rd December 2016	
3			Assistant Commissioner Fanning instructed Chief	
4			Superintendent Scanlan to take the statement under the	
5			bullying and harassment complaint, you don't dispute	15:34
6			that?	
7		Α.	I think he did something different, I think he asked	
8			the statement be taken and that he would therefore be	
9			able to determine the rank of there were two	
10			elements of it, the second element being, being in a	15:34
11			position to determine the rank of the investigator.	
12	603	Q.	That's correct. And that was after you had attempted	
13			to appoint Chief Superintendent Roche and he thought	
14			that that was premature?	
15		Α.	Which was because I wanted to ensure that there was no	15:34
16			issue or conflict which may give rise to a delay, as it	
17			did.	
18	604	Q.	Indeed. So Chief Superintendent Scanlan was instructed	
19			two days before Christmas. He then engaged with Garda	
20			Keogh and Garda Keogh told him that he thought Chief	15:35
21			Superintendent Roche had been engaged and he was	
22			surprised by Chief Superintendent Scanlan, that was in	
23			January 2017, you don't dispute that?	
24		Α.	I don't.	
25	605	Q.	He on that occasion raised the possibility that Chief	15:35
26			Superintendent Scanlan was conflicted, you're familiar	
27			with that query. As a result of that conversation	
28			Chief Superintendent Scanlan spoke to Tony McLoughlin	
29			on 20th January 2017 and passed on the concerns and	

- eventually he was directed to proceed by AC Fanning on 13th February 2017, you don't dispute any of these dates?
- 4 A. No, they're all the explanations I guess.
- 5 606 Exactly. Then on the first occasion Garda Keogh met Q. 15:35 for the first time with Chief Superintendent Scanlan on 6 7 the 2nd March 2017, when we have the short unsigned 8 statement prepared. And then there were a series of dates that Garda Keogh was unavailable. 7th March '17, 9 when Chief Superintendent Scanlan sought to engage with 15:36 10 11 him; 13th March '17, Garda Keogh was contacted and 12 requested for a time; 15th March 2017 Garda Keogh was 13 unavailable for the week; on the 20th March '17 Garda 14 Keogh looked for further time; and eventually there was 15 a meeting set for the 21st March '17 and Garda Keogh 15:36 16 cancelled that meeting. Eventually he did meet on the 27th March 2017 and a statement was finalised and 17 Do you accept all of those dates? 18
- A. I mean if you tell me so. I didn't micromanage this,
  but I read it and as I said to Ms. Mulligan, you know,
  I don't know what I knew at the time relevant to what I
  know now, Mr. McGuinness. I am not trying to be
  difficult about this.
- 24 607 Q. Yes.
- A. But I do accept that there were several valiant efforts 15:37
  made, and I am not attributing any became to either
  side, but this did take a period of time.
- 28 608 Q. Yes. And if I might just ask you to have a look at document 10031, please.

Τ			CHAIRMAN: Are you sure that is the right number?	
2			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Yes.	
3			CHAIRMAN: would you give it to me again?	
4			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: 10031.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	15:37
6	609	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: This is the personal injury	
7			summons that was issued by Garda Keogh and his	
8			solicitor on 13th April 2017. If I might just refer	
9			you to page 10035, I don't want you to spend any time	
10			reading it but have you seen this document before.	15:37
11		Α.	No.	
12	610	Q.	Well, I hope I'm not being unfair here, the endorsement	
13			of claim that appears on page 10035, if we just scroll	
14			down please, Mr. Kavanagh:	
15				15:38
16			"Particulars of bullying, harassment, intimidation,	
17			demeaning behaviour and the like."	
18				
19			Then if you just scroll onto the next page please,	
20			Mr. Kavanagh, there is a series of particulars.	15:38
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	611	Q.	Of the alleged bullying and harassment. I am going to	
23			suggest to you that these particulars very much mirror	
24			the content of the statement that was prepared by Chief	
25			Superintendent Scanlan, with Chief Superintendent	15:38
26			Scanlan. So the issues being addressed in the personal	
27			injuries summons are the same as the issues that are	
28			addressed in the bullying and harassment statement. Do	
29			you understand?	

1		Α.	I do.	
2	612	Q.	The point I am making is that Garda Keogh may have had	
3			his own reasons for delaying the contact with Chief	
4			Superintendent Scanlan because he was engaged in	
5			another process, which he is perfectly entitled to	15:39
6			engage in, namely further and solve his personal	
7			injury claim against An Garda Síochána for the very	
8			same things that	
9			MS. MULLIGAN: Chairman, I am very reluctant to	
10			interrupt my friend, but that seems extremely	15:39
11			speculative and not something that this witness can	
12			even speak to. So in those circumstances I am going to	
13			object to that being put to the witness.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Yes, that seems like a good objection. It's	
15			not that there's anything particular improper about the	15:39
16			question, Mr. McGuinness, but how on earth could	
17			Mr. Barrett, with all his talents and experience, how	
18			on earth could he be expected to I mean, that is a	
19			point that you might make in a submission or an	
20			argument. One of the ways I look at this is, if	15:39
21			Mr. Barrett said, oh absolutely, does it make any	
22			difference? Or if he said, oh absolutely not, does it	
23			matter in the slightest what answer he gives to that	
24			question?	
25			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Very good, Chairman, I was just	15:40
26			giving the witness an opportunity to	
27			CHAIRMAN: I think the essence is, Mr. McGuinness, if I	
28			may, we have identified period number one, and I	
29			understood, Mr. Barrett, that you said, look, in the	

1			nature of things everybody was trying to do their best	
2			but there were delays. Mr. McGuinness is seeking to	
3			establish that whatever about that, the delays were not	
4			to be laid at the door of Chief Superintendent Scanlan.	
5			There's not much moral blame in it, he's not	15:40
6			suggesting, but he is saying that Chief Superintendent	
7			Scanlan was not to blame for any of the delay between	
8			November and March.	
9		Α.	Chairman, I am at a very substantial disadvantage. I	
10			have never seen these pleadings, whether they mirror	15:41
11			the	
12	613	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Don't mind the pleadings, don't mind that,	
13			we're past that. I'm just saying over all, what he is	
14			saying is, Chief Superintendent Scanlan I'm not sure	
15			that Ms. Mulligan is making any claim, but just in case	15:41
16			somebody is making a claim, Mr. McGuinness wishes to	
17			say these dates establish that that it is not Chief	
18			Superintendent Scanlan's responsibility, he wasn't	
19			responsible for any of the delays in phase number one.	
20			That is all he is saying. If you don't want to comment	15:41
21			on that, say I don't want to comment on that. If you	
22			want to say you comment on that, comment on it. And	
23			you don't have to say anything on it?	
24		Α.	I don't want to comment.	
25			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Thank you very much.	15:41
26			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Thank you.	
27			CHAIRMAN: I mean the dates that Mr. McGuinness has	
28			presented, and if I may say so very, very clearly	
29			presented, he says that's evidence, if you like, he is	

1			referring to evidence that we already have and to tell	
2			the honest truth, Mr. Barrett, it doesn't matter	
3			whether you agree with it or not, do you know what I	
4			mean.	
5		Α.	I do.	15:42
6	614	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Now it may be disagreed with, isn't that	
7			right, Ms. Mulligan?	
8			MS. MULLIGAN: It's a matter for submission.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Okay, Mr. McGuinness.	
10	615	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Thank you, Chairman. But it	15:42
11			might be of some interest to you, Mr. Barrett, that in	
12			a document that you prepared and sent to the deputy	
13			commissioner, Governance and Strategy, which was dated	
14			5th December 2017, you indeed set out a very detailed	
15			chronology of the events that had transpired, including	15:42
16			a lot of the dates that I have just mentioned.	
17		Α.	I don't doubt it. It's just that I'm not attributing	
18			any	
19			CHAIRMAN: No, no, I understand.	
20	616	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: So I'm going to move on to	15:42
21			period number two now if that is in order, Chairman?	
22			CHAIRMAN: Yes, absolutely.	
23	617	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: And if we could have a look at	
24			document number 10049, please. This is a letter which	
25			shows that it's from AC Fanning, can you scroll down	15:43
26			to the bottom of that document, please. It's from AC	
27			Fanning of the 24th May 2017, scroll up to the top	
28			please, to your office. I am right in that, yes?	
29		Α.	That's correct.	

- Essentially, this document suggests, if you want 1 618 Q. 2 to take time to read it or perhaps you are familiar 3 with it having prepared for today, it establishes two things, I suggest to you. One is that Garda Keogh was 4 5 in the loop with what is proposed. But the critical 15:44 thing here is that AC Fanning is proposing that the 6 7 bullying and harassment policy is not wide enough and 8 he is making it very clear to your office at this time, hang on a second with the bullying and harassment, I 9 have got the statement, I have read it, it's not big 10 15 · 44 11 enough to deal with this issue and Garda Keogh is aware 12 that that is my view? 13 Correct. Α. 14 619 Q. You're also aware that Garda Keogh doesn't in any way 15 criticise AC Fanning's management and governance of 15:44 16 In fact, I think he has apprised him of this issue. 17 this? 18 I will take your word for it. Α. 19 620 I call this period number two? Q. This is the period two the 24th May? 20 Α. 15:44
- 21 621 Q. This is the period, if you like, after the statement is
- received at the end of March?
- 23 A. 27th March to 24 May.
- 24 622 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. Okay.
- 26 623 Q. But it goes on. I just want to you accept two things
  27 out of this letter. One is that AC Fanning is of the
  28 firm view that the policy is not adequate to deal with
  29 the issues that arise in the statement. That is the

15 · 45

Т			first thing.	
2		Α.	Right.	
3	624	Q.	Do you accept that?	
4		Α.	I'm not accepting that.	
5	625	Q.	No but do you accept that that's his view?	15:45
6		Α.	Oh that's his.	
7	626	Q.	And he expressed that to you?	
8		Α.	And he held that view all the way to the 23rd November.	
9	627	Q.	Indeed. But importantly, within that letter is a	
10			reference that Garda Keogh has been kept informed of	15:45
11			this issue. If you go on to document 10051, and this	
12			is a letter from AC Fanning. My understanding is it's	
13			dated the 30th May to Garda Keogh. And he tells him:	
14				
15			"I am of the view that these matters merit	15:46
16			consideration outside the bullying and harassment	
17			policy before proceeding to next steps I am awaiting	
18			his decision and once I have his decision I will	
19			communicate with you further.	
20				15:46
21			I do hope that you are keeping well and I do look	
22			forward to you returning to the workplace, where I	
23			believe you can make a very valuable contribution."	
24				
25			He refers to Inspector McCarthy visiting him on the	15:46
26			22nd May, where he raised a number of other issues?	
27		Α.	Sure.	
28	628	Q.	So he is essentially keeping Garda Keogh in the loop as	
29			to this is his view hullving and harassment shouldn't	

1			be progressed, if I could nuance it that way, because	
2			there is a bigger enquiry to be made?	
3		Α.	So let me just go to the second paragraph:	
4				
5			"I have included those issues along with your statement	15:46
6			and forwarded them to (me) on the 24th May."	
7	629	Q.	Yes?	
8		Α.	"The purpose is that I am of the view that these	
9			matters merit consideration."	
10				15:47
11			So he is essentially saying that he is expressing	
12			what he expressed to you on the 24th May, I believe	
13			that there is a greater issue at stake here, beyond the	
14			bullying and harassment policy. The matter needs a	
15			larger investigation. Garda Keogh is being made aware	15:47
16			of it?	
17		Α.	He was consistent on that all the way through.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Yes. But you don't agree.	
19		Α.	No, ultimately I don't agree.	
20	630	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I know you don't agree with that, but you	15:47
21			don't agree that he forwarded the material?	
22		Α.	Oh I don't agree that he forwarded the materials,	
23			absolutely no.	
24	631	Q.	CHAIRMAN: There is a factual statement where there is	
25			a difference?	15:47
26		Α.	Okay.	
27	632	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You say, no, he didn't do that. You agree	
28			that he formed the view with which you do not agree	
29			about the policy and the approach to the matter, you	

Τ			agree?	
2		Α.	There are two facts that I am absolutely clear about.	
3			One is at this point in time Fintan Fanning is very	
4			clear that the matters as set out in the statement of	
5			the 27th March extend beyond the bounds of	15:48
6	633	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's his view?	
7		Α.	That's his view. The second thing I am clear about is,	
8			I did not receive the documents that he talked about	
9			until the 4th October.	
10			CHAIRMAN: So there we are.	15:48
11			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: If we just go back to page	
12			number 10050 please, the second last paragraph, this is	
13			the letter to you. He says:	
14				
15			"I am reluctant to make any appointments in this matter	15:48
16			as there may well be a conflict of interest, in that I	
17			had prior involvement in a previous correspondence	
18			regarding Garda Keogh and it may well be the perception	
19			of the parties that I would not be impartial. Garda	
20			Keogh corresponded with me on the 15th April to which I	15:48
21			issued a response on the 24th April."	
22				
23			So he is raising another issue as well in addition to	
24			the issue about the bullying policy not being	
25			comprehensive enough to cover this matter. Do you	15:49
26			accept that?	
27		Α.	I understand that clearly, I think. But what was the	
28			question about, Mr. McGuinness, I didn't	
29	634	0	No. I am just pointing it out?	

1		Α.	Okay.	
2	635	Q.	This is his view at that time. This is the view of AC	
3			Fanning, whom Garda Keogh finds no fault with, so it is	
4			relevant that his view is expressed in evidence and you	
5			are given an opportunity to comment on it if you feel	15:49
6			the need to.	
7				
8			If we go on then to page 10052, and this is an e-mail,	
9			now it's very difficult to read but I will read it out	
10			to you, it's an e-mail from AC Fanning, as commissioner	15:49
11			east, to you, or to HRPD.executivedirector.	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	636	Q.	That's you. And it's dated 5th June 2017. I might	
14			just read it out.	
15				15:50
16			"Executi ve di rector.	
17				
18			I am directed by the assistant commissioner Eastern	
19			Region to refer to previous correspondence from this	
20			office on 24th May 2017.	15:50
21				
22			I also refer to the attached correspondence dated 31st	
23			May 2017.	
24				
25			On 1st June 2017 Garda Keogh contacted me by phone to	15:50
26			confirm that he had received this correspondence dated	
27			(something) May 2017 and that he was satisfied that	
28			with how this matter was progressing and was thankful	
29			for the progress report."	

1				
2			So very clearly Garda Keogh was in the loop here about	
3			AC Fanning's firm views as to how to progress matters?	
4		Α.	And also firm in his view that these materials had been	
5			transmitted to my office.	15:5
6	637	Q.	Yes.	
7		Α.	So if you recall my earlier evidence, Mr. McGuinness, I	
8			was clear that Mr. Fanning or Assistant Commissioner	
9			Fanning did in effect some of the work of the protected	
10			disclosure manager because communication is a key part	15:5
11			of that.	
12	638	Q.	Yes.	
13		Α.	By keeping the protected discloser, Garda Keogh,	
14			appropriately in the loop, save that he is giving	
15			assurances to Garda Keogh that materials which were not	15:5
16			transmitted had been.	
17	639	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	That's my earlier evidence.	
19	640	Q.	But I suppose if you were to take the key message that	
20			AC is communicating to you, is that he doesn't want the	15:5
21			bullying and harassment policy to kick off, because he	
22			believes that there is a bigger issue, a bigger	
23			investigation required?	
24		Α.	If you go through the transcript of Assistant	
25			Commissioner Fanning's evidence, I think he is very	15:5
26			correct and very respectful as to who is the	
27			policyholder, as to who is the personal ultimately	

28

29

going to have to make that decision. And I think the

trail of correspondence, including some from me, makes

the point that I am neutral at best on the idea of extending it. I was mindful of the fact that time that had elapsed, to the Chairman's point, we would be setting potentially the clock at zero, and I think that might be an expression you yourself used.

15:52

15:52

15:52

15:53

CHAI RMAN: Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

And I was mindful of the fact that in the context of Α. something that assistant commissioner Eugene Corcoran said at the meeting of the 23rd November, we needed to have regard to the consideration of those who were impugned by Garda Keogh in his allegations, and there were a number of those people. By going with what Assistant Commissioner Fanning argued as Byrne-McGinn model, we were going into a situation where there weren't tram rails and handrails and parameters in a way that such exists in a bullying and harassment policy. And so, due process, fair procedure, timelines, resources and there being precedent that we could rely upon was all part of my consideration as to why B&H trumped any novel extended beyond. Plus, after 15:53 the 4th October when I had an opportunity to read at length and read several times the statement taken by -please let me finish, this is important -- the statement taken by Chief Superintendent Scanlan, I was satisfied that in the main the matters raised fell within the terms of bullying and harassment, which was my jurisdiction, and that if there were criminal matters there was a facility for the criminal matters

to be explored in parallel, as a part of a criminal

1			investigation if AC Finn so decided.	
2			CHAIRMAN: Mr. McGuinness's point however is, for what	
3			it's worth and as far as it goes, this e-mail shows	
4			that Assistant Commissioner Fanning was keeping Garda	
5			Keogh in the loop, we all agree with that.	15:53
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	641	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You're agreeing with that. And number two,	
8			that Garda Keogh appeared to be satisfied with it.	
9			That's what Mr. McGuinness is suggesting?	
10		Α.	I understand that.	15:54
11	642	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. I am right about that,	
12			Mr. McGuinness?	
13			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: You are indeed, Chairman.	
14			CHAIRMAN: That's essentially the point. Okay. It	
15			doesn't mean it's right but that is what Mr. McGuinness	15:54
16			is suggesting this e-mail indicates, evidences or	
17			implies.	
18	643	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Yes. And if we could just move	
19			to document 13367, this is Garda Keogh's diaries, and	
20			there's an entry there of the 5th July, you probably	15:54
21			can't read it, I will do that for you.	
22		Α.	I can't.	
23			CHAIRMAN: Why don't you read it, Mr. McGuinness.	
24	644	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS:	
25				15:54
26			"Under pressure, trying to stop promotions, didn't need	
27			(two initials) witness crap."	
28				
29			So I'm suggesting to you that Garda Keogh had other	

1			things on his mind in July of 2017, he was trying to	
2			stop promotions.	
3		Α.	I haven't seen this before, by the way, so it's news to	
4			me.	
5			CHAIRMAN: Well, Mr. McGuinness, there is some limit to	15:55
6			what Mr. Barrett as the executive director can say	
7			about a diary entry. There's a limit to	
8			cross-examination.	
9			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: I do accept that, Chairman, but	
10			in circumstances where this witness has been asked	15:55
11			directly about the period of delay and he has	
12			deprecated the period of delay, I believe there is a	
13			CHAIRMAN: I understand that, but explicating the	
14			meaning of his diary, Mr. McGuinness, you and I know we	
15			will not fall out over this one, Mr. McGuinness,	15:55
16			because we both know the rules.	
17	645	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: May it please you, Chairman. If	
18			I could ask you then to look at document 5897, please.	
19			This is a letter from Inspector McCarthy to Garda	
20			Keogh. Again, I only reference it to illustrate that	15:56
21			Inspector McCarthy on behalf of Assistant Commissioner	
22			Fanning is keeping him in the loop at all times.	
23				
24			"I wish to acknowledge our meeting yesterday afternoon	
25			at your home, wherein you spoke about matters regarding	15:56
26			members of An Garda Síochána. I also prefer to	
27			previous correspondence from this office to you dated	
28			16th June 2017 and to inform you that AC Eastern Region	
29			has written to executive director HRPD on the 17th	

August seeking an updated report regarding this matter."

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

Α.

1

2

So AC Fanning is writing to Garda Keogh and he is saying, listen, I am keeping in touch with your office about this matter, but the matter that essentially is still a live one is, AC Fanning's view, that the investigation that needs to be carried out is not the bullying and harassment complaint but a larger type investigation. Do you agree with me that that is the live issue on the 17th August 2017?

15:56

15:57

15:57

15:57

15:58

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

No, I don't, and here's why: The outstanding matter upon which the decision is going to be made is the assignment given to Chief Superintendent Scanlan in January or December of 2016, a copy of which we still do not have. And I would contend that this letter from James McCarthy tends to suggest that HR and PD are equipped with all the necessary inputs upon which to make the decision and the delay is attending therefore Now, let's be clear about this, I commend the regional office for keeping the protected discloser updated on progress. Essentially that is the action that would normally fall to the PD manager. And in my evidence earlier before you began this cross-examination I think I called that out. At the meeting on the 3rd October in my office I explicitly instructed that the contact established by the said James McCarthy inspector should continue. I saw it to be positive and of assistance to anybody who felt they

1			were being obscured by or cut out from or deprived of	
2			information. So, insofar as the communication exists,	
3			goodness.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Communication is good but it is based on a	
5			mistake?	15:58
6		Α.	Correct.	
7	646	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And you say the mistake is there's an	
8			implication, which there apparently is, I'm going to	
9			look for an updated report, meaning I haven't got one?	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:58
11	647	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And you say you couldn't have got one	
12			because we didn't have the right material?	
13		Α.	And that fundamentally is, I think	
14	648	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean we're not going to resolve that one,	
15			if you know what I mean. But Mr. McGuinness's point	15:59
16			is, here they're keeping in touch with Garda Keogh?	
17		Α.	Goodness.	
18	649	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And you say you're entirely in favour of	
19			that?	
20		Α.	Yes.	15:59
21	650	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But you say there's a real problem insofar	
22			as your office is concerned?	
23		Α.	Absolutely.	
24	651	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Because your office does not have the	
25			that is your case, your office does not have the	15:59
26			documentation and clearly Inspector McCarthy and	
27			Assistant Commissioner Fanning think you do, or	
28			apparently think you do?	
29		Α.	At that point in time they may very well have been	

1			labouring under the misapprehension, but to go through	
2			the transcript	
3	652	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand that.	
4		Α.	The transcript of Assistant Commissioner Fanning's own	
5			evidence makes clear that it was October 4 when that	15:59
6			material became available to me, from him.	
7	653	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I am with you. To the extent that it's an	
8			issue of fact, we will have to worry about that and	
9			look at the various things. But that's what you say	
10			about this e-mail, this letter?	16:00
11		Α.	Communication in general good, Chairman.	
12	654	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay, I think we have that.	
13		Α.	Material communicated not correct.	
14	655	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: If we could have a look at 5896	
15			please. This is another letter from AC Fanning to your	16:00
16			office of 1st September 2017.	
17				
18			"I refer to previous correspondence from June."	
19				
20			He goes on to say:	16:00
21				
22			"You will recall in my correspondence dated 24th May	
23			that I recommended a full investigation into these	
24			matters and also that any delay should be kept to a	
25			mi ni mum.	16:00
26				
27			I would appreciate your response to these matters which	
28			are ongoing for some time."	
29				

- 1 So it's clear to me, from reading that letter, that he 2 is referencing back the letter of the 24th May, he's 3 not referencing the statement of Garda Keogh in the bullying and harassment complaint, he's referencing the 4 5 larger investigation --16:00 But Mr. McGuinness --6 Α. -- "I recommend a full investigation into these 7 656 Q. 8 matters." Isn't it only fair to say that he is making the 9 Α. assessment that this is a matter larger than bullying 10 16:01 11 and harassment, based upon a statement taken with Chief Superintendent Scanlan? That is the basis of his 12 13 assessment that this is larger than B&H, right. 14 657 Q. Don't get me wrong, I am not saying that he is right or 15 wrong, I just want to explain that this is in his mind? 16:01 16 I am accepting that it is in his mind and I said to the Α. Chairman that it continued to be in his mind. 17 18 Carry on, Mr. Barrett, you said that he is 658 CHAI RMAN: Q. 19 basing his view as to the nature of the inquiry on the 20 statement given to Chief Superintendent Scanlan. 16:01 That is my belief. 21 Α. 22 CHAI RMAN: Yes. Well, that appears to be so. 659 Q. 23 let's assume that that is the case, I don't think 24 anybody is going to dispute that. So what is the next 25 thing you are going to say about that? 16:02 26 So he has the facility to have a fully formed opinion. Α.
- 27 660 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 28 A. Based upon this document.
- 29 661 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

1		Α.	Which at that point, right, there is no way I can	
2			counter it, because nobody has had sight of it, right.	
3	662	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You haven't seen it. That's your evidence?	
4		Α.	So the reality becomes that when we gain sight of this	
5			document, and he continues to canvass this view and I	16:02
6			am accepting Mr. McGuinness's point, at the meeting we	
7			had in my office on the 3rd October, he said, oh, this	
8			is larger than B&H, and he says, I think there could be	
9			criminality in it.	
10	663	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	16:02
11		Α.	And we spend a little bit of time discussing, well, if	
12			there was to be criminality in it, what would that give	
13			rise to, it would give rise to a criminal investigation	
14			independent and separate from.	
15	664	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Indeed?	16:02
16		Α.	So B&H does not obviate or prevent	
17	665	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I heard that, I understand that to be your	
18			situation and to be also your situation as a matter of	
19			logic. So you really challenge the logic behind	
20			Assistant Commissioner Fanning's position?	16:03
21		Α.	It's, I'm sure, a very sincerely held view.	
22	666	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand that. People have	
23			disagreements. But I'm understanding that you don't	
24			agree, first of all you say about the statement, I have	
25			that, then you say the logic is, you could still have	16:03
26			the B&H investigation and if criminality is revealed	
27			you can slough that off, you can send that off to a	
28			criminal investigation, there's nothing to stop you	
29			doing that. That's what you are saying. Okay.	

Т	667	Q.	MR. DUNAL MCGUINNESS: II WE Can look at 3349. Please,	
2			if we look towards the yes. The last complete	
3			paragraph on that current screen grab.	
4				
5			"Assistant Commissioner Fanning is concerned about	16:04
6			making an appointment under the bullying and harassment	
7			policy. He says that the investigation should be made	
8			under the Byrne/McGinn model where it encompasses a	
9			wider investigation."	
10				16:04
11			So he persists in his view at the meeting of the 3rd	
12			October 2017?	
13		Α.	I said that earlier.	
14	668	Q.	I know you did. We are talking about periods of delay,	
15			so I am just chronicling the reason why there was a	16:04
16			delay, is that AC Fanning, who is in touch with Garda	
17			Keogh, and is apparently in agreement with this	
18			approach is saying, hang on a second here, let's not	
19			engage the bullying and harassment policy, let's get a	
20			wider investigation. And he is persisting in that	16:04
21			approach, correctly or incorrectly, I am not passing	
22			any judgment on it, he is persisting in that approach	
23			as of 3rd October 2017?	
24		Α.	We are in violent agreement.	
25	669	Q.	Sorry, I beg your pardon?	16:05
26		Α.	You and I are in violent agreement.	
27	670	Q.	Yes.	
28		Α.	He is consistent right the way through to the 23rd	
29			November, to the best of my knowledge.	

1	671	Q.	Indeed. Exactly. That's essentially where we will end	
2			this discussion, that right up to the very end AC	
3			Fanning essentially tries to divert matters to move	
4			away from bullying and harassment because he is	
5			obviously concerned that you start the bullying and	16:05
6			harassment that the larger investigation will never be	
7			engaged. So eventually, after the second meeting of	
8			the 23rd October, he finally agrees that he will	
9			nominate, or that he will appoint someone to conduct	
10			the bullying and harassment policy?	16:05
11		Α.	Mr. McGuinness, I know that this is, you know, a matter	
12			related in some way to delay, AC Fanning is entitled to	
13			his sincerely held views and I am certain that they	
14			were sincerely held.	
15	672	Q.	Indeed, I am not suggesting otherwise?	16:06
16		Α.	He attended that meeting, I understand, on the 23rd and	
17			this is based on my reading in a subsequent	
18			conversation with him, where he made submissions at the	
19			meeting and after the meeting with respect to pie	
20			charts and various other things that he had prepared	16:06
21			for Joe Nugent to consider. I think there is a	
22			correspondence between himself and Joe after that	
23			meeting. So I want to make it plain, I get the point	
24			that he was advocating something different. I am the	
25			policyholder, I have to make a decision as to what is	16:06
26			the appropriate way to proceed here.	
27	673	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Ultimately it was for you to decide?	

28

29

Α.

It was for me to decide. But I explained, you know, as

transparently as I could, having read the Scanlan

1			statement, that I was satisfied that in the main,	
2			right, it related to matters that I would consider to	
3			be bullying and harassment. And as I said to the	
4			Chairman, if it emerged in the course of that	
5			investigation that, for example, and it's only an	16:06
6			example, if criminality, which was one of the things	
7			that AC Fanning	
8	674	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That could be accommodated?	
9		Α.	Precisely.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Okay, all right. Anything else,	16:07
11			Mr. McGuinness?	
12	675	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: You are in agreement with me	
13			that as of the 23rd October there is essentially a	
14			decision taken. You were at that meeting, Joe Nugent	
15			was at that meeting, AC Fanning was at that meeting,	16:07
16			there was a decision taken as of the 23rd October to	
17			move forward with the bullying and harassment.	
18		Α.	I can't say there was a decision taken at the meeting.	
19			The meeting was chaotic in some respects, in the sense	
20			that I think we have a couple of different minutes of	16:07
21			it. I made a note myself of the meeting and I don't	
22			have it to hand. I left the meeting hearing clearly	
23			that Fintan was of the view that it was a broader issue	
24			and that there were views around the table that we	
25			should keep it as a bullying and harassment issue and	16:07
26			that I should go away and reflect on that.	
27	676	Q.	CHAIRMAN: There can't have been many people in the	
28			Garda Síochána who weren't aware at this stage of	
29			Assistant Commissioner Fanning's view that it should be	

Т			product, because everybody was aware of it at this	
2			stage. All right.	
3			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Including Garda Keogh.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Eventually a decision was made, let's have a	
5			bullying and harassment decision. You had to make that	16:0
6			decision, you made that call and that was your call to	
7			make.	
8		Α.	That's correct.	
9	677	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: And a nomination was eventually	
10			made on 15th November '17.	16:0
11		Α.	Somewhere around then, yeah.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
13	678	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: You would agree with me that	
14			there was never an attempt to clandestinely, secrete,	
15			camouflage Garda Keogh's bullying and harassment	16:0
16			statement at any stage within An Garda Síochána?	
17		Α.	I would like to be clear about that: No, I would	
18			certainly agree that there was no clandestine effort	
19			that I was aware of at all, and I would have been	
20			central to an awful lot of the movements of that	16:0
21			statement.	
22	679	Q.	And the period of delay that I call period of delay	
23			two, that we just discussed	
24		Α.	No, I thought you were characterising that to 24 May,	
25			from 27 March.	16:0
26			CHAIRMAN: No. Wait now. Don't worry, I mean I have	
27			the point, Mr. McGuinness.	
28	680	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Thank you, Chairman. There's	
29			one other issue, Mr. Barrett, that I would like to just	

Т			raise with you, because AC McPartlin is also a client	
2			that this legal team represents and there is some	
3			documentation on file that suggests that on the 19th	
4			October that you appointed her to carry out a fact find	
5			into issues concerning Garda Keogh.	16:09
6		Α.	There was confusion around this on the basis that at	
7			that point we were looking at the two possible options	
8			and the suggestion was made and it wasn't me in the	
9			first instance that came up with it, I don't know where	
10			the name Orla McPartlin came from but	16:09
11	681	Q.	Can I interrupt you, Mr. Barrett, I don't want to delay	
12			the Tribunal unnecessarily, it's the only the fact?	
13		Α.	Sure.	
14	682	Q.	the fact that there was a letter, there is a letter,	
15			it's document 10416?	16:10
16		Α.	Can I see it?	
17	683	Q.	It's signed by you, it dated 19th October 2017, it	
18			says:	
19				
20			"I am hereby appointing you to conduct a fact-finding	16:10
21			investigation on matters raised with respect to the	
22			above member."	
23				
24		Α.	And do you have her reply?	
25	684	Q.	No, but if we just look at this letter first. It is	16:10
26			cc'd to Acting Commissioner Donal Ó Cualáin, Deputy	
27			Commissioner John Twomey, Mr. Joe Nugent Chief	
28			Administrative Officer?	
29		Δ	John Twomey I think was the source of the suggestion	

1			that we approach Orla, and Orla wrote back, so you have	
2			a reply?	
3	685	Q.	Yeah, just we'll come to the reply in a second,.	
4			Mr. Barrett. Do you accept this letter never reached	
5			AC McPartlin?	16:1
6		Α.	well she wrote me a reply declining, so she must have	
7			had knowledge of this.	
8	686	Q.	well let's have a look at her reply then, 10424. She	
9			references your correspondence of the 29th January	
10			2018, if we just go back to your letter of the 29th	16:1
11			January 2018, it's 10425, if we call that up first,	
12			Mr. Kavanagh. I will just read this.	
13				
14			"Prior to Christmas we spoke with respect to the review	
15			of all matters pertaining to the file of complaint	16:1
16			sense to An Garda Síochána by a solicitor acting for	
17			Garda Keogh. That long list of issues required two	
18			appointments and with assent I appointed AC Michael	
19			Finn to examine the bullying and harassment issues	
20			arising and I appointed you to survey all other	16:1
21			matters.	
22				
23			It seems that the communication to your office was not	
24			properly forwarded and so as to ensure that the	
25			original intent is appropriately set out I am writing	16:1
26			to you again to confirm.	
27				
28			Very helpfully, AC Fanning segmented the issues set out	
29			to Mr. John Gerard Cullen acting for Garda Keogh and I	

1			attach a copy of Mr. Cullen's letter.	
2				
3			Any and all files and materials held by HRPD will be	
4			made available."	
5				16:12
6			Then if I can just go to 10424, this is AC McPartlin	
7			writing to you on the 31st January	
8		Α.	No, this is a letter from Joe Nugent.	
9			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
10			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: sorry, 10424, please.	16:12
11			CHAIRMAN: Now, there we are.	
12	687	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: "With reference to your	
13			correspondence of the 29th January in above matter, I	
14			wish to state that at no stage prior to or since	
15			Christmas 2017 did you and I have a conversation about	16:12
16			a review of matters pertaining to a file of complaint	
17			sent to An Garda Síochána by the solicitor acting for	
18			Garda Ni chol as Keogh.	
19				
20			In addition, I have not at any more time received	16:12
21			correspondence from you in that regard either in my	
22			role as AC Western Region or AC executive support and	
23			corporate services.	
24				
25			There has been no previous communication either written	16:13
26			or oral between your office and mine in relation to the	
27			aforementioned matter. I note also that there is no	
28			copy of correspondence attached to your letter of 29th	
29			January 2018 as indicated in same.	

1				
2			I am at a loss as to the purpose of your correspondence	
3			of 29th January 2018."	
4		Α.	I have never seen that letter as it's presented there.	
5			I had a conversation with Orla, she declined the	16:13
6			appointment and that is news to me.	
7	688	Q.	Well, perhaps we will finish this by looking at 10426,	
8			please. This is a letter from Joseph Nugent CAO of the	
9			31st January 2018, who, as you will recall, was one of	
10			the parties indicated as a cc corresponded on your	16:13
11			initial appointment?	
12		Α.	Yeah.	
13	689	Q.	It says:	
14				
15			"I refer to the above ours of the 25th January 2018 and	16:14
16			yours of the 29th January 2018, the contents of which	
17			are noted.	
18				
19			In our ours of 25th January 2018 it was confirmed that	
20			none of the addressees were in receipt of yours of 19th	16:14
21			October 2017. There was no instruction to correct this	
22			anomaly as you were separately informed that the	
23			executive director, legal and compliance, is looking at	
24			the broader question and will develop a strategy on how	
25			best to proceed in this issue.	16:14
26				
27			Forwarded for your information and necessary	
28			attenti on. "	
29		Α.	He never saw that correspondence either.	

1			CHAIRMAN: So you never saw this?	
2		Α.	No. I saw Joe Nugent's response in his	
3			cross-examination and it referred to writing a letter	
4			to the Department of Justice. This correspondence is	
5			news to me.	16:14
6	690	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. But the net result is that there was	
7			never an assignment of Assistant Commissioner McPartlin	
8			to do anything?	
9		Α.	There was originally a suggestion that she should be	
10			assigned if there was to be	16:14
11	691	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand that.	
12		Α.	Sure.	
13	692	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But it never actually happened?	
14		Α.	No, it didn't.	
15	693	Q.	CHAIRMAN: However it happened and whether the letters	16:15
16			got crossed or lost or did or didn't, it didn't happen?	
17		Α.	It fell away.	
18	694	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	
19	695	Q.	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: And the reason I mention it and	
20			the reason I bring it up is not to cause any	16:15
21			embarrassment, Mr. Barrett, it's that AC McPartlin	
22			subsequently did a peer review at the instruction of AC	
23			Sheahan in relation to the McMahon investigation.	
24		Α.	That was a separate matter entirely.	
25	696	Q.	That was a separate matter entirely?	16:15
26			CHAIRMAN: So are we clear that Mr. Barrett confirms	
27			she had nothing to do with anything.	
28			MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Indeed.	
29			CHAIRMAN: Either on his recollection she turned it	

1	down flat at the verbal suggestion, or there's a	
2	mystery was to how it happened but she never had	
3	anything to do with it. She wrote a stiff letter of	
4	protest but it comes to nothing in the end.	
5	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Indeed. But I can confirm my	:15
6	firm instructions.	
7	CHAIRMAN: I understand.	
8	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: That she never received any such	
9	instructions in the first instance.	
10	CHAIRMAN: Okay.	:16
11	MR. DONAL McGUINNESS: Thank you. Mr. Barrett.	
12		
13	END OF EXAMINATION.	
14		
15	CHAIRMAN: Now, how are you doing, Mr. Barrett?	:16
16	THE WITNESS: I am fine.	
17	CHAIRMAN: Are you fine? Has anybody else many	
18	questions of Mr. Barrett? I wouldn't have thought so.	
19	Mr. McGarry, why don't I start with you, you're for	
20	Assistant Commissioner Fanning.	:16
21	MR. McGARRY: Yes.	
22	CHAIRMAN: I am going to end up with Mr. Clarke, who is	
23	for Mr. Barrett. So I am going to end up there but I	
24	wouldn't have thought that anybody else had a great	
25	deal of questions. Now, Mr. McGarry.	:16
26	MR. McGARRY: Just a couple of matters, Chairman, if I	
27	may.	
28	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	

Т				
2				
3				
4			MR. JOHN BARRETT WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. McGARRY, AS	
5			FOLLOWS:	
6				
7	697	Q.	MR. McGARRY: Mr. Barrett, you said in your evidence	
8			that Assistant Commissioner Fanning's evidence supports	
9			you to the extent that you didn't get any of the	
10			material relating to Garda Keogh, that's the statement	16:1
11			and the Scanlan report?	
12		Α.	No, I got it on the 4th October.	
13	698	Q.	Yes, but prior to the 4th October?	
14		Α.	No, I didn't. I got an unsigned statement, the Scanlan	
15			report comes to us, I think it's October 4th, the day	16:1
16			after the meeting we had in my office.	
17	699	Q.	You said earlier in your evidence that the evidence of	
18			Assistant Commissioner Fanning corroborates what you've	
19			said in relation to it, I didn't see it because it	
20			wasn't sent. That's what you said earlier on in your	16:1
21			evidence.	
22		Α.	Correct, and I would have to get you the page number of	
23			the details, I can send it to the Chairman or send it	
24			to the Tribunal.	
25	700	Q.	Assistant Commissioner Fanning's evidence, that was not	16:1
26			his evidence. His evidence specifically was, because	
27			he was asked about this in some detail on Day 148,	
28			after page 200, when he was asked about the position,	
29			he didn't accept that that material had not been sent.	

1			In fact, the correspondence that was opened was the	
2			correspondence that we've looked at, which referred	
3			back to the letter of the 24th May and, indeed, the	
4			letter that was sent by Inspector McCarthy following	
5			the meeting in October, I think it was on the 4th	16:17
6			October, where he refers to the fact that the material	
7			was hand-delivered, that included the statement	
8			witnessed by Garda Keogh hand-delivered to HRM on the	
9			24th May?	
10		Α.	I have seen that piece in the first statements made by	16:18
11			Fintan Fanning and I would refer you also to the	
12			evidence given by Alan Mulligan on the same matter. He	
13			was standing in my shoes on that particular day in May.	
14	701	Q.	Yes, but your evidence when you said that Assistant	
15			Commissioner Fanning agreed with you to the effect that	16:18
16			I didn't see it because it wasn't sent, that wasn't his	
17			evidence?	
18		Α.	All right. Let me get the reference, apologies. My	
19			evidence can be confined to this then. I did not	
20			receive a copy of the Scanlan statement made by Garda	16:18
21			Keogh until 4th October 2017.	
22	702	Q.	You seem very adamant about that, Mr. Barrett, but	
23			you've also told us that you didn't see the letter of	
24			the 24th May, the 16th June, the 30th June, the 17th	
25			August, even the two letters in September because you	16:19

were occupied with other things at the time?

That's true of much of that correspondence.

you are giving me a list. But certainly, given that I

wasn't in the office for a period of time in May, I was

I mean,

26

27

28

29

Α.

1			dealing with matters pertaining to the Garda College	
2			and PAC and I was out for 28 odd days of August, there	
3			is a substantial amount of that time. But the office	
4			receives material and so, in my stead would have been	
5			Alan Mulligan and I think his testimony referred.	16:19
6	703	Q.	Thank you.	
7				
8			END OF EXAMINATION.	
9				
10			CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you very much. Now, anybody	16:19
11			else before I come to Mr. Clarke? Very good. Okay,	
12			Mr. Clarke, thank you.	
13			MR. CLARKE: Chairman, I don't have any questions.	
14			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Well it has been very	
15			well ventilated. Mr. McGuinness, have you any	16:20
16			questions.	
17			MR. McGUINNESS: Yes just a few, Chairman.	
18			CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
19				
20			MR. JOHN BARRETT WAS RE-EXAMINED BY MR. McGUINNESS, AS	16:20
21			FOLLOWS:	
22				
23	704	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Mr. Barrett, when Ms. Mulligan was	
24			asking you about Chief Wheatley's responses to the	
25			issue as to whether she had carried out one and whether	16:20
26			she could carry out one etcetera, you seemed to be	
27			implying that Chief Superintendent McLoughlin had given	
28			Garda Keogh an undertaking that he, the chief, would	
29			carry it out.	

- 1 A. Well, I wonder --
- 2 705 Q. He undertook, as I understood it, to look into his pay
- issue, but not to investigate the cause of his stress?
- 4 A. I think I am referring, Mr. McGuinness, to a letter
- 5 that is sent from Garda Keogh or Mr. Cullen on his
- 6 behalf dated the 14th June. And I assumed the matters

16:20

16:21

16:21

16:21

16:21

- 7 to be investigated essentially were the matters that
- 8 they discussed on that day.
- 9 706 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. On the 3rd in Tullamore.
- 11 707 Q. Yes. I just am going to suggest to you that that may
- be a misinterpretation of matters in the sense that
- 13 Garda Keogh subsequently in that letter considered that
- 14 Chief Superintendent McLoughlin had undertaken to
- investigate the bullying and harassment, whereas Chief
- 16 Superintendent McLoughlin's evidence was that that
- 17 wasn't so, because Garda Keogh made it expressly clear
- that he had made a complaint to GSOC about it at that
- 19 point in time?
- 20 A. Okay, I will be guided by you, sir.
- 21 708 Q. You made reference there, which just caused me a little
- 22 bit of concern. You said you had never seen the
- 23 assignment of Chief Superintendent Scanlan in the
- papers.
- A. No, no, my apologies, the output.
- 26 709 Q. The output?
- 27 A. The output of the chief superintendent's work.
- Obviously I was involved in the appointment and the
- 29 assignment of Chief Superintendent Scanlan.

1	710	Q.	Yes.	
2		Α.	And as I was saying to Mr. McGuinness, it was a twofold	
3			assignment that he had; take the statement and	
4			determine on foot of it what was the level of the	
5			person to be appointed to conduct the investigation.	16:22
6	711	Q.	Yes. Just to be clear that we are talking about the	
7			same letter, page 3508, just to confirm that.	
8		Α.	Yes, that's it.	
9	712	Q.	This is Assistant Commissioner Fanning's instruction to	
10			Chief Superintendent Scanlan as to what to do?	16:22
11		Α.	Yeah.	
12	713	Q.	Okay. Now, if we go back to 3507, you had recommended	
13			something entirely different, which was the appointment	
14			of Chief Superintendent Roche to investigate the	
15			complaint?	16:22
16		Α.	Because, and this is one of the things when we're	
17			talking about delay, my original thought in	
18			recommending that Chief Superintendent Roche would	
19			effectively roll what the Chairman is calling delay A	
20			and the work that was subsequently done by AC Finn,	16:23
21			that he would effectively try and roll with that as a	
22			way of expediting matters, but that didn't prove	
23			workable for a couple of reasons, the assistant	
24			commissioner rightly pointed out that we needed first	
25			as a preliminary statement get a statement and	16:23
26			determine the rank of the person that should conduct	

the investigation.

27

28

29

714 Q.

I am not saying there is anything improper about that

view because it does determine who you should appoint

1			as such?	
2		Α.	The level, yes.	
3	715	Q.	But if an appointment had actually been made it might	
4			have avoided the year's passage of time?	
5		Α.	It would have proved problematic, because as it turned	16:24
6			out I think CS Curran was one of those that was	
7			impugned and he too was a chief superintendent. So it	
8			perhaps	
9	716	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So it wouldn't have worked?	
10		Α.	It wouldn't have worked.	16:24
11	717	Q.	CHAIRMAN: There was Chief Superintendent Wheatley and	
12			there was Chief Superintendent Curran.	
13		Α.	Chief Superintendent Wheatley wasn't impugned.	
14	718	Q.	CHAIRMAN: At that point, sorry?	
15		Α.	I think Curran was, I think that's true. So, in some	16:24
16			respects while it was the longest way around, it was	
17			the shortest way home.	
18	719	Q.	CHAIRMAN: On the other hand, by appointing Chief	
19			Superintendent Roche he would have run into this	
20			problem presumably at the very beginning and he would	16:24
21			have reported back and somebody more senior would have	
22			been appointed?	
23		Α.	Well, as I said to Mr. McGuinness, Chair, the initial	
24			thought Gerry Roche was somebody who hadn't served with	
25			<b></b>	16:24
26	720	Q.	CHAIRMAN: He was not likely to be in any way sort of	
27			connected. I see that point, yes. So there would have	
28			been something to be said for having him do it, and if	
29			he ran into an issue he would be reported back and	

2		Α.	There was value in that.	
3	721	Q.	MR. McGUINNESS: Just in terms of the preparation that	
4			you engaged in for the meeting of the 3rd October, we	
5			have seen obviously Mr. Cullen's letter to you of the	16:25
6			23rd September and then an e-mail that Chief	
7			Superintendent McLoughlin sent you?	
8		Α.	Yes.	
9	722	Q.	You actually did reply to that and I perhaps should	
10			have opened that, at page 3547. That's your reply of	16:25
11			the 28th September. You say:	
12				
13			"Thank you for your e-mail of the 25th September, which	
14			addresses the areas which are being considered with	
15			respect to bullying and harassment. The factual	16:25
16			position as of today is that to progress a bullying and	
17			harassment investigation the person seeking to invoke	
18			the policy must nominate the source of the bullying and	
19			harassment complaint. Despite repeated requests to do	
20			so, Ni chol as Keogh has not done so as of today's date."	16:26
21				
22		Α.	Yes.	
23	723	Q.	Now, your state of knowledge in order to make at that	
24			statement?	
25		Α.	Well, I was without the Scanlan report and I suppose	16:26
26			that's a clumsy way of saying it, but the issue that	
27			was arising was, we were without whatever it was that	
28			had been downloaded from Garda Keogh.	
29	724	0 -	You had obviously Mr. Cullen's letter of the 23rd. but	

somebody else would be appointed?

1

1 you hadn't spoken to Garda Keogh yourself until the 2nd 2 October? No, I spoke to Mr. Cullen on the 2nd. 3 Α. 725 On the 2nd? 4 Ο. 5 Yes. Α. 16:26 6 726 But obviously that is subsequent to this letter? Q. 7 Yes. Α. 8 727 So your statement there about Nicholas Keogh not having Q. 9 done so as of the 28th? Was incorrect. 10 Α. 16:26 11 728 How did you know that? Q. That was incorrect. 12 Α. 13 729 I see. The second paragraph then says: Q. 14 15 "I am unsighted on progress of investigations being 16:26 16 conducted by Chief Superintendent Scanlan as of today's date." 17 18 Yes. Α. 19 730 He "but I understand that some of the papers are in Q. 20 file with Ms. Kathleen Hassett." 16:27 21 Per Tony's e-mail, yeah. Α. 22 Pardon? 731 Q. 23 Chief McLoughlin had I think received papers from Garda Α. 24 Keogh and had handed them to Kathleen Hassett, I think 25 there is some reference prior to that. 16:27 Obviously it doesn't appear that Chief Superintendent 26 732 0. 27 Scanlan was conducting any investigations other than the taking of the statement? 28 29 Α. Yes.

1	733	Q.	That you had been informed had been taken?	
2		Α.	Yes. I think there's confusion in that letter.	
3	734	Q.	There is confusion, is there? Okay. And then some of	
4			the papers, I think Chief Superintendent McLoughlin did	
5			provide them to Ms. Hassett, could some of those papers	16:27
6			have included the statement of the 27th?	
7		Α.	No, I don't think so, I think they were papers that	
8			were submitted to Chief Superintendent McLoughlin by	
9			Garda Keogh and he had asked I think for some of them	
10			to be returned for the purpose of making a statement.	16:28
11	735	Q.	Yes. Mr. McGuinness then asked you about Mr. Nugent's	
12			letter concerning Assistant Commissioner McPartlin and	
13			you said you had never seen that letter?	
14		Α.	Yes.	
15	736	Q.	I think that was provided to you in the Tribunal	16:28
16			papers?	
17		Α.	And if it was, sir, I didn't take any heed of it. And	
18			I will go and study those papers on my return to	
19			Limerick.	
20	737	Q.	Don't worry. Just for your own information, they	16:28
21			appear to be in Volume 37?	
22		Α.	Volume?	
23	738	Q.	Volume 37. Thank you, Mr. Barrett?	
24		Α.	Thank you, sir.	
25				16:28
26			END OF EXAMINATION.	
27				
28			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Mr. Barrett, thank you very much for	
29			facilitating us by agreeing to come in today for	

1	good-humouredly and good-naturedly tolerating a very	
2	long day and answering all the questions that you did.	
3	So, we are very grateful to you, thank you very much	
4	for doing that. I thought it was best if possible to	
5	keep ourselves going so that you would be finished.	16:29
6	THE WITNESS: I'm obliged to you.	
7	CHAIRMAN: And get it all over in one day rather than	
8	have you thinking about it and coming back overnight.	
9	So I think that is a more satisfactory way and thank	
10	you very much for your assistance.	16:29
11	THE WITNESS: Chairman if I could say one thing, I	
12	would like to commend your investigators for the	
13	assistance they were for me unsighted of documents and	
14	access to my office.	
15	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, indeed, thank you very	16:29
16	much, yes, and I am sure they will be most grateful to	
17	receive that. Thank you, indeed.	
18		
19	THE WITNESS THEN WITHDREW	
20		16:29
21	CHAIRMAN: So 10:30 tomorrow.	
22	MR. McGUINNESS: Yes, Chairman, thank you.	
23	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
24		
25	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED UNTIL TUESDAY, 30TH JUNE	16:30
26	2020 AT 10: 30AM	
27		
28		
29		

11th [3] - 56:12, **192** [1] - 5:8 189:15, 189:16, 73:8, 142:21 **1921** [1] - 1:9 189:19 **12** [6] - 3:8, 4:8, **194** [1] - 5:9 **2020** [3] - 1:18, 6:2, '14 [1] - 13:19 86:23, 110:4, 113:22, 201:26 19th [7] - 18:18, '16 [5] - 20:15, 78:6, 138:15 **20th** [9] - 31:23, 29:4, 29:29, 110:24, 93:16, 109:1, 159:5 52:23, 57:4, 63:29, **12/7** [1] - 75:22 186:3, 186:17, 189:20 '17 [8] - 74:13, 84:15, 122 [1] - 5:6 66:16, 130:21, 1st [5] - 52:18, 67:17, 109:2, 163:9, 163:11, **12471** [1] - 104:1 109:1, 172:25, 179:16 132:26, 162:29, 163:13, 163:15, 163:13 12477 [1] - 101:23 185:10 21 [2] - 3:12, 63:24 **12513** [1] - 103:10 21st [7] - 60:5, 62:5, **12:30** [1] - 112:15 1 12th [7] - 60:4, 60:5, 62:9, 62:15, 62:21, 2[6] - 2:32, 3:3, 4:9, 102:2, 163:15 60:11, 60:26, 62:5, 63:28. 95:23. 111:24 22 [5] - 3:13, 30:25, 98:22, 103:29 **1** [4] **-** 3:2, 92:25, 20 [1] - 3:12 31:10, 70:10, 121:9 **13** [7] - 2:31, 3:8, 99:7, 99:13 20/20 [2] - 23:18, 22/9 [1] - 74:24 18:6, 25:1, 28:8, 10[1] - 3:7 23:26 22nd [5] - 61:14, 40:16. 40:17 **10013** [1] - 60:24 **200** [1] - 192:28 13367 [1] - 175:19 67:17, 68:12, 89:3, **10021** [2] - 60:6, 2014 [6] - 1:3, 9:7, 169:26 139/2010 [2] -62.22 10:21, 11:12, 14:4, 23 [1] - 3:13 122:17, 131:6 **10031** [2] - 163:29, 145:20 23rd [17] - 31:25, **13th** [9] - 71:2, 91:7, 2015 [15] - 10:27, 57:24, 90:24, 104:15, 96:29. 100:19. **10035** [2] - 164:9, 13:16, 14:28, 18:5, 110:13, 110:16, 101:21, 103:14, 164:13 21:29, 24:26, 27:27, 146:3, 162:2, 169:8, 163:2, 163:11, 164:8 **10049** [2] - 63:20, 38:28, 66:9, 124:29, 174:9, 182:28, 183:8, 14 [2] - 3:9, 4:17 167:24 129:24, 132:20, 183:16, 184:13, **144** [1] - 49:25 10050 [1] - 171:12 151:1, 153:23, 157:26 184:16, 198:6, 198:29 **148** [1] - 192:27 **10051** [1] - 169:11 **2016** [24] - 11:7, 24 [4] - 3:14, 89:10, 149 [1] - 5:7 10052 [1] - 172:8 12:14, 13:8, 28:4, 168:23, 185:24 14th [3] - 40:8, 10057 [1] - 72:10 29:4, 29:9, 42:10, 24/5 [1] - 63:19 155:8, 195:6 10064 [1] - 75:22 56:13, 64:18, 66:23, 24th [19] - 63:12, **15** [1] - 3:9 10066 [1] - 77:26 74:12, 76:26, 129:17, 69:20, 71:27, 72:2, **150** [1] - 1:18 **10072** [1] - 48:9 150:22, 152:1, 154:4, 73:1, 73:13, 89:4, 15960 [1] - 7:21 10094 [2] - 80:9, 157:25, 158:18, 89:5, 167:27, 168:20, 15th [14] - 13:22, 83:20 158:21, 159:4, 170:6, 170:12, 52:19, 55:26, 56:7, 159:17, 160:26, **10100** [1] - 84:7 171:21, 172:20, 66:9, 112:12, 113:5, 162:2, 177:15 **10104** [1] - 88:27 179:22, 180:2, 193:3, 113:7, 115:19, **10108** [1] - 89:21 2017 [46] - 1:5, 1:9, 193:9, 193:24 142:23, 142:24, 13:22, 60:12, 63:13, **10118**[1] - 87:10 **25** [1] - 3:14 163:12, 171:20, 64:6, 64:27, 69:20, **10121** [1] - 91:8 2549 [1] - 147:19 185:10 **10416**[1] - 186:15 74:15. 76:21. 83:10. 25th [8] - 42:10, **16** [2] - 1:5, 3:10 84:5, 86:23, 89:4, **10424** [3] - 187:8, 54:19, 84:5, 86:2, 16th [12] - 31:14, 89:5, 93:16, 93:28, 188:6, 188:10 160:26, 189:15, 64:6, 67:16, 69:3, 101:21, 102:2, **10425** [1] - 187:11 189:19, 198:13 69:16, 70:3, 72:9, 158:22, 159:9, **10426** [1] - 189:7 **26** [1] - 3:15 73:1, 112:15, 160:28, 159:10, 162:23, **10:30** [1] - 201:21 26/12/15 [1] - 78:1 176:28, 193:24 162:29, 163:2, 163:7, 10:30AM [1] - 201:26 26th [9] - 21:29, **17** [2] - 1:9, 3:10 163:12, 163:17, 10th [5] - 37:12, 38:16, 86:19, 127:25, **17,000** [2] - 129:2, 164:8, 167:14, 40:21, 107:14, 129:23, 132:19, 134:10 167:27, 172:13, 119:20, 119:22 132:28, 151:1, 153:17 17th [10] - 67:16, 172:20, 172:23, **11** [6] **-** 3:7, 14:9, **27** [2] - 3:15, 185:25 69:4, 72:10, 72:25, 172:25, 172:27, 22:1, 29:12, 37:25, 27/9/16 [1] - 48:22 80:8, 83:10, 152:1, 176:1, 176:28, 64:18 **27th** [17] - 18:4, 63:9, 176:29, 177:11, 177:11, 179:16, **11-13** [1] - 4:3 64:26, 67:1, 67:3, 193:24 182:12, 182:23, **11.37** [14] - 17:5, 71:25, 72:1, 85:19, **18** [4] - 3:11, 63:8, 186:17, 188:15, 23:21, 32:25, 33:4. 93:29, 103:11, 81:12, 148:26 189:21, 193:21 33:8, 43:12, 43:14, 142:19, 159:10, 183 [1] - 14:1 2018 [11] - 1:9, 50:20, 50:21, 124:13, 159:29, 163:17, 18th [4] - 29:9,

117:28, 119:20,

187:10, 187:11,

188:29, 189:3, 189:9,

120:4, 120:6, 152:8

**19** [1] - 3:11

168:23, 171:5, 200:6

28 [2] - 3:16, 194:2

137:8, 149:27, 150:6,

156:6

28th [4] - 61:2, 117:27, 198:11, 199:9 29 [1] - 3:17 29TH [2] - 1:18, 6:1 29th [6] - 187:9, 187:10. 188:13. 188:28, 189:3, 189:16 2:30 [2] - 121:28, 122:2 2nd [12] - 15:4, 60:12, 85:3, 85:5, 85:17, 91:29, 115:4, 151:4, 163:7, 199:1, 199:3, 199:4

### 3

**3** [5] - 3:3, 12:11, 50:14, 96:22, 128:1 **30** [2] - 3:17, 101:12 **30TH** [1] - 201:25 30th [4] - 120:18, 120:19, 169:13, 193:24 **31** [1] - 3:18 31st [5] - 58:20, 76:21, 172:22, 188:7, 189:9 **32** [2] - 2:24, 3:18 **3203** [2] - 29:11, 152:2 **3266** [1] - 37:23 **3267** [7] - 38:1, 127:5. 127:6. 127:14. 132:15, 150:27, 154:2 **3268** [2] - 38:19, 38:20 **3269** [2] - 39:2, 154:13 **3272** [1] - 14:9 **3276** [3] - 22:1, 22:2, 153:18 **3277** [2] - 152:9, 152:16 **3296** [2] - 31:14, 31:15 **33** [1] - 3:19 **33-34** [1] - 4:12 **3313** [1] - 42:28 3314[1] - 42:10 **34** [3] - 3:19, 33:25, 40:15 **3441** [1] - 48:28 3442 [1] - 50:22 **3467** [1] - 51:2 **3468** [1] - 51:29 **3472** [1] - 52:20 3476 [1] - 55:14 3495<sub>[1]</sub> - 55:28

	1	I		
<b>35</b> [5] - 3:20, 48:8,	<b>4711</b> [1] - 117:27	124:19	127:7, 131:19,	128:17, 140:2, 176:24
48:10, 75:15, 84:7	<b>4713</b> [1] - 119:24	8th [5] - 25:10,	137:16, 144:4,	acknowledged [1] -
<b>3504</b> [1] - 56:8	<b>4719</b> [1] - 120:5	37:23, 150:21, 152:7,	165:21, 165:22,	62:3
<b>3506</b> [1] - 57:3	<b>4720</b> [1] - 120:5	154:3	167:22, 170:23,	acknowledging [4] -
<b>3507</b> [2] - 57:7,	4th [14] - 33:24,	104.0	171:2, 178:23	62:14, 89:25, 139:12,
196:12	63:10, 67:7, 85:18,	9	<b>AC</b> [41] - 109:21,	139:15
	, , ,	9	109:25, 112:26,	
<b>3508</b> [1] - 196:7	85:25, 88:24, 141:4,		113:27, 115:20,	acknowledgment [3]
<b>3515</b> [1] - 58:21	171:9, 174:21,	<b>9</b> [1] - 3:6		- 64:2, 69:23, 153:6
<b>3525</b> [1] - 61:3	192:12, 192:13,	<b>93</b> [1] - 83:20	116:7, 118:4, 119:7,	acquisition [1] - 81:9
<b>3547</b> [1] - 198:10	192:15, 193:5, 193:21	<b>9684</b> [1] - 35:26	140:21, 163:1,	acquisitions [1] -
<b>3548</b> [1] - 86:4	4th/5th [1] - 37:26	<b>9687</b> [1] - 35:13	167:25, 167:26,	8:28
<b>3549</b> [2] - 86:3, 182:1		<b>9692</b> [1] - 35:24	168:6, 168:15,	act [3] - 11:25, 72:12,
<b>3551</b> [1] - 88:4	5	I	168:27, 169:12,	81:4
<b>3598</b> [1] - 104:18		<b>9695</b> [3] - 33:25,	172:2, 172:10, 173:3,	<b>ACT</b> [2] - 1:3, 1:8
<b>36</b> [2] - 3:20, 87:10	- 04.0040	34:11, 35:2	173:20, 175:1,	Act [6] - 11:12,
<b>3619</b> [1] - 107:19	<b>5</b> [2] - 3:4, 99:10	<b>9696</b> [1] - 33:28	176:28, 177:4, 177:7,	12:11, 23:12, 50:15,
<b>3624</b> [1] - 108:24	<b>51</b> [1] - 2:18	<b>9866</b> [2] - 160:23,	179:15, 182:16,	77:24, 92:10
<b>3625</b> [1] - 108:12	<b>56</b> [1] - 7:20	160:26	183:2, 183:12, 184:7,	<b>ACTING</b> [2] - 3:7,
<b>3626</b> [2] - 109:3,	<b>5896</b> [1] - 179:14	<b>9th</b> [1] - 75:24	184:15, 186:1, 187:5,	3:13
110:4	<b>5897</b> [1] - 176:18		187:18, 187:28,	Acting [1] - 186:26
	<b>5th</b> [10] <b>-</b> 61:13,	Α	188:6, 188:22,	acting [7] - 9:14,
<b>3628</b> [2] - 110:11,	106:9, 108:29, 109:2,		190:21, 190:22,	9:18, 41:29, 103:28,
116:26	109:9, 109:11, 111:5,	1	196:20	187:16, 187:29,
<b>3630</b> [1] - 111:13	167:14, 172:13,	abandoned [1] -	accept [21] - 17:22,	188:17
<b>3633</b> [2] - 112:14,	175:20	116:21	23:23, 23:26, 52:6,	
112:16		ability [1] - 141:17	126:4, 129:4, 146:11,	action [11] - 1:27,
<b>3635</b> [1] - 113:19	6	<b>able</b> [9] - 6:10, 30:23,	146:12, 150:16,	55:18, 70:25, 85:11,
<b>3636</b> [1] - 116:3		82:8, 86:6, 95:18,	151:22, 152:14,	88:3, 90:7, 92:16,
<b>3638</b> [1] - 116:23		115:22, 145:25,	158:25, 163:18,	92:24, 100:4, 148:20,
<b>3639</b> [1] - 114:22	<b>6</b> [2] <b>-</b> 3:5, 99:12	150:25, 162:9	163:25, 168:26,	177:22
<b>37</b> [3] - 3:21, 200:21,	<b>6823</b> [1] - 61:14	above-named [1] -	i i	actioned [1] - 100:4
200:23	<b>6872</b> [1] - 62:6	1:26	169:3, 169:5, 171:26,	actioning [1] - 92:3
<b>3716</b> [1] - 18:5	<b>6879</b> [2] <b>-</b> 67:18,	absence [38] - 15:15,	176:9, 187:4, 192:29	actions [7] - 88:5,
<b>3719</b> [1] - 19:6	69:15	19:3, 19:4, 20:20,	acceptable [1] -	89:25, 89:29, 94:11,
<b>3740</b> [1] - 41:21	<b>6882</b> [2] - 67:18,	26:23, 27:4, 27:8,	143:3	97:9, 147:21, 155:27
<b>3741</b> [2] - 40:11,	72:26	28:26, 29:20, 30:5,	accepted [1] - 33:15	active [1] - 95:5
40:14	<b>6884</b> [2] - 67:18, 73:8	32:24, 38:25, 38:27,	accepting [3] -	actively [1] - 23:4
		39:16, 45:1, 68:3,	169:4, 180:16, 181:6	activities [1] - 117:8
<b>3744</b> [1] - 28:6	<b>6889</b> [2] - 67:18,		access [1] - 201:14	activity [1] - 159:27
<b>3747</b> [2] - 28:16	74:25	70:11, 72:23, 73:25,	accidents [1] - 21:10	actual [6] - 20:23,
<b>3748</b> [1] - 28:19	<b>6891</b> [1] - 86:19	76:2, 78:13, 79:4,	accommodated [1] -	58:24, 93:24, 102:19,
<b>3750</b> [1] - 25:11	<b>6892</b> [1] <b>-</b> 86:22	96:11, 128:28,	184:8	131:13, 136:17
<b>3751</b> [1] - 25:1	<b>6th</b> [4] <b>-</b> 50:23,	137:24, 138:6,	accommodations	
<b>38</b> [2] - 3:21, 122:22	89:21, 89:24, 129:16	146:24, 148:11,	[1] - 25:19	adamant [1] - 193:22
<b>39</b> [1] - 3:22		151:6, 152:25,	accomplish [1] -	add [2] - 54:17,
<b>3:30</b> [1] - 101:3	7	154:16, 154:27,	110:15	160:21
<b>3rd</b> [18] - 9:6, 32:6,		157:27	accordance [2] -	addiction [1] - 21:25
43:26, 47:22, 70:13,	7 40.005.05	absences [12] -	16:27, 76:18	addition [3] - 51:11,
78:5, 85:5, 85:18,	<b>7</b> <sub>[6]</sub> - 1:9, 2:25, 3:5,	13:25, 14:1, 15:11,	accordingly [2] -	171:23, 188:20
86:23, 87:8, 155:6,	4:13, 5:5, 99:19	16:22, 16:24, 18:9,	42:21, 96:3	additional [6] -
155:23, 177:26,	<b>7.4</b> [1] - 53:7	22:17, 24:25, 127:27,	account [3] - 65:7,	15:13, 65:20, 95:15,
181:7, 182:11,	<b>700</b> [1] - 16:21	151:3, 153:5, 153:17		128:21, 131:12,
182:23, 195:10, 198:4	7th [6] - 14:28,	absent [11] - 16:21,	69:24, 131:10	131:20
	126:21, 130:19,	27:20, 28:2, 45:14,	Accounts [2] -	address [12] - 30:10,
4	132:24, 133:16, 163:9	73:7, 76:29, 77:7,	67:28, 68:5	33:8, 78:10, 92:19,
-		77:13, 77:15, 79:6,	accurate [1] - 34:8	99:2, 99:13, 127:1,
	8	130:7	accusations [1] -	139:11, 140:18,
<b>4</b> [4] - 2:19, 3:4,		<b>absentees</b> [1] - 21:8	84:24	147:27, 150:14,
98:28, 179:5		absolute [2] -	accused [1] - 119:16	157:11
4/8/17-31/8/17 [1] -	<b>8</b> [2] <b>-</b> 3:6, 3:28	129:21, 140:27	acknowledge [9] -	addressed [16] -
48:20	<b>8202</b> [1] - 122:23	absolutely [13] -	52:2, 52:3, 62:8,	22:1, 25:12, 28:21,
<b>41</b> [1] - 47:6	<b>8205</b> [2] - 124:18,	25:3, 47:5, 97:20,	72:12, 75:5, 103:14,	33:23, 42:12, 52:23,
		20.0, 47.0, 57.20,		

55:14, 77:26, 80:23, 84:24, 101:23, 103:3, 105:27, 134:22, 164:26, 164:28 addressees [1] -189:20 addresses [2] -152:20, 198:14 addressing [1] -100:1 adequate [1] -168:28 ADJOURNED[3] -101:16, 122:5, 201:25 adjustments [1] -25.19 administer [1] - 20:8 Administrative [1] -186.28 administrative [5] -104:26, 107:7, 124:7, 124:29, 137:15 **ADMINISTRATIVE** [1] - 3:14 adult [10] - 47:6, 128:26, 130:6, 132:9, 134:26 advance [3] - 22:24, 69:14, 90:13 advanced [1] - 81:18 advent [1] - 82:21 advice [9] - 21:19, 52:29, 54:21, 118:8, 118:18, 118:21, 158:10, 159:25, 160:15 advise [6] - 40:14, 43:1, 51:4, 56:22, 61:8, 72:14 advised [14] - 8:11, 29:19, 33:18, 51:16, 52:26, 80:16, 83:6, 86:8, 95:26, 147:29, 152:24, 156:5, 161:10, 161:12 adviser [1] - 8:9 advises [4] - 22:7, 56:18, 137:28, 153:19 advocating[1] -183:24 Affairs [1] - 10:1 aforementioned [1] -188:27 afternoon [4] -35:25, 122:13, 122:14, 176:24 afterwards [2] - 32:8, 101:1 ago [1] - 64:19 agree [23] - 49:28,

50:20, 105:3, 132:2, 138:7, 142:13, 143:23, 145:18, 161:27, 167:3, 170:18, 170:19, 170:20, 170:21, 170:22, 170:27, 170:28, 171:1, 175:5, 177:10, 181:24, 185:13, 185:18 agreed [9] - 41:24, 49:17, 88:3, 88:8, 92:3, 93:27, 100:9, 161:18, 193:15 agreeing [2] - 175:7, 200:29 agreement [4] -182:17, 182:24, 182:26, 184:12 agrees [2] - 113:7, 183:8 **AGSI** [1] - 4:4 ahead [1] - 41:19 AIDAN [2] - 3:9, 4:6 AISLING [2] - 2:11, 3.21 Alan [17] - 11:13, 15:27, 16:2, 16:27, 27:25, 27:27, 56:6, 68:2, 70:10, 72:23, 73:22, 141:1, 141:8, 143:2, 160:24, 193:12, 194:5 **ALAN**[2] - 3:9, 3:13 albeit [1] - 144:20 alcohol [2] - 26:5, 153:6 alerting [2] - 97:13 alia [1] - 14:6 allegation [1] - 65:25 allegations [13] -34:5, 52:9, 53:29, 65:8, 65:12, 65:23, 65:24, 71:17, 71:22, 106:29, 118:14, 118:24, 174:11 alleged [15] - 22:8, 30:4, 38:8, 38:23, 38:26, 39:16, 42:23, 45:2, 45:10, 104:4, 134:14, 153:23, 154:17, 154:27, 164:22 allegedly [1] - 30:18

allow [1] - 116:7

allowances [7] -

114:13, 114:14,

114:15, 115:24

49:26, 49:29, 50:19,

allowance [1] - 116:1

almost [3] - 74:13, 93:6, 155:22 altering [1] - 36:17 alternative [1] - 55:6 altogether [1] -36.15 **AMENDED**[1] - 1:9 America [1] - 95:22 amount [6] - 22:25, 87:4, 130:13, 148:18, 149:29, 194:3 **AN**[1] - 3:2 anatomy [1] - 93:15 AND [6] - 1:3, 1:4, 1:8, 3:15, 101:16, 122:5 and.. [1] - 114:4 **ANDREW** [2] - 2:22, animosity [1] -151:24 **ANNE** [2] - 3:8, 3:17 annual [2] - 68:14, 72:15 anomaly [1] - 189:22 answer [10] - 26:2, 45:29, 68:21, 102:19, 133:10. 136:20. 139:27, 142:27, 155:4, 165:23 answered [2] -121:8, 138:27 answering [2] -148:14, 201:2 **ANTHONY** [1] - 3:6 anticipated [1] -155.12 anticipates [1] -149:29 anticipating [2] -34:17, 47:9 anxiety [1] - 141:2 anxious [5] - 31:6, 31:7, 119:14, 149:18, 152:23 anyway [1] - 109:13 apologetic [1] -79:20 apologies [3] -40:17, 193:18, 195:25 **APPEAL**[2] - 1:13, appear [14] - 28:17, 40:22, 41:3, 44:6, 48:24, 48:25, 61:29, 69:3, 71:20, 83:27, 118:23, 139:10, 199:26, 200:21 APPEARANCES[1] -

appeared [2] - 42:8, 175:8 appearing [1] - 7:1 appendices [3] -60:13, 67:2, 140:23 appendixes [1] -140.29 applicants [1] - 83:4 application [5] -55:23, 82:27, 137:1, 137:3, 138:4 applied [4] - 8:25, 9:3, 83:1, 83:2 applies [1] - 140:7 **apply** [2] - 82:25, 148:29 applying [2] - 50:8, appoint [11] - 39:19, 89:16, 90:8, 110:24, 110:29, 112:22, 155:1, 156:25, 162:13, 183:9, 196:29 appointed [24] -9:14, 9:15, 9:19, 10:25. 11:12. 39:26. 53:23, 62:28, 88:1, 90:3, 93:27, 99:7, 108:26, 109:25, 128:19, 142:20, 151:21, 161:21, 186:4, 187:18, 187:20, 196:5, 197:22, 198:1 appointing [3] -9:25, 186:20, 197:18 appointment [33] -11:9, 13:18, 19:11, 20:3, 23:11, 23:13, 28:15, 29:11, 29:28, 57:12, 57:19, 66:20, 105:7, 105:11, 105:17, 106:13, 108:15, 108:21, 110:24, 112:25, 116:13, 116:16, 116:18, 135:13, 151:26, 153:13, 182:6, 189:6, 189:11, 195:28, 196:13, 197:3 appointments [3] -66:4, 171:15, 187:18 appreciate [7] -51:12, 73:18, 101:7, 129:15, 149:1, 155:28, 179:27 apprised [1] - 168:16 approach [5] -170:29, 182:18, 182:21, 182:22, 187:1

appropriate [5] -26:24, 87:28, 98:26, 100:21, 183:26 appropriately [2] -173:14, 187:25 approval [1] - 37:21 approve [1] - 149:6 approved [1] - 41:28 approximation [1] -79.8 April [21] - 14:4, 14:28, 15:5, 18:5, 60:3, 60:4, 60:5, 60:11, 60:26, 61:2, 61:13, 62:5, 63:29, 66:9, 88:18, 151:4, 164:8, 171:20, 171:21 architect [1] - 136:17 area [1] - 9:28 areas [2] - 10:6, 198:14 argued [1] - 174:13 argument [2] -105:12, 165:20 arise [3] - 50:3, 137:3. 168:29 arisen [4] - 12:8, 32:24, 105:19, 136:28 arises [6] - 38:10, 50:16, 127:21, 146:13, 153:27, 155:15 arising [12] - 21:9, 22:10, 24:21, 29:21, 72:16, 89:26, 89:29, 106:20, 119:6, 147:16, 187:20, 198:27 arose [2] - 51:26, 90:16 ARRAN[2] - 2:24, 4:12 arrange [2] - 72:16, 161:20 arranged [1] - 41:13 arrangement [2] -55:6, 136:7 arrangements [7] -6:13, 36:12, 36:18, 42:6, 72:24, 134:27, 148:6 arrival [5] - 9:10, 9:17, 9:18, 9:19, 10:21  $\boldsymbol{arrived}\, [1] \boldsymbol{-} 68:7$ arrives [1] - 74:3 articulated [1] - 97:8 **AS** [9] - 1:9, 6:1, 7:15, 101:16, 122:5, 122:10, 149:23,

192:4, 194:20 aspect [1] - 137:15 aspects [2] - 10:20, 116:28 aspirational [1] -144:20 assent [1] - 187:18 assertions [1] - 83:5 assess [3] - 20:27, 21:1, 101:10 assessed [1] - 71:11 assessing [2] -21:16, 92:24 assessment [2] -180:10, 180:13 assigned [2] - 92:29, 190.10 assigning [1] -146:27 assignment [5] -177:14, 190:7, 195:23, 195:29, 196:3 assist [1] - 15:13 Assistance [2] -30:1, 100:10 assistance [11] -21:27, 32:9, 53:18. 84:22, 149:19, 161:14, 161:15, 161:18, 177:29, 201:10, 201:13 ASSISTANT[6] -2:20, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 assistant [18] -60:15, 61:7, 61:9, 67:10, 72:28, 73:3, 75:5, 75:6, 82:23, 87:14, 88:29, 90:2, 90:8, 118:28, 146:28, 172:18, 174:8, 196:23 Assistant [76] - 6:28, 57:8, 58:10, 58:20, 58:29, 59:27, 61:1, 61:12, 62:3, 63:12, 66:13, 68:1, 68:9, 69:16, 70:26, 71:20, 72:5, 74:2, 74:14, 85:24, 86:18, 87:29, 88:7, 88:12, 88:13, 88:25, 89:4, 89:10, 89:12, 89:20, 90:9, 90:16, 90:21, 93:25, 105:13, 105:17, 106:18, 107:13, 107:25, 108:3, 108:13, 108:14, 108:25, 111:3, 112:7, 116:11, 117:16, 117:22, 117:28,

118:3, 119:19, 140:9, 140:25, 142:20, 143:13, 145:4, 159:14, 162:3, 173:8, 173:24, 174:13, 175:4, 176:21, 178:27, 179:4, 181:20, 182:5, 184:29, 190:7, 191:20, 192:8, 192:18, 192:25, 193:14, 196:9, 200:12 associated [5] -25:23, 26:6, 41:3, 79:5, 156:12 assume [3] - 27:13, 27:15, 180:23 assumed [2] -100:14, 195:6 assumes [1] - 129:3 assuming [1] - 127:2 assurance [2] - 87:5, 91.23 assurances [2] -58:12, 173:15 assure [1] - 99:19 assured [1] - 58:10 AT [1] - 201:26 Athlone [7] - 15:2, 22:7, 127:26, 146:23, 151:2, 151:20, 151:21 **ATHLONE** [1] - 4:3 Athlumney [6] -16:3, 20:8, 26:26, 27:9, 27:27, 28:27 attach [1] - 188:1 attached [9] - 15:8, 22:6, 30:13, 58:23, 64:7, 78:13, 96:27, 172:22, 188:28 attaches [1] - 102:6 attachment [3] -62:19, 75:27, 125:27 attachments [1] -140:22 attempt [3] - 132:27, 133:19, 185:14 attempted [2] -23:19, 162:12 attempts [1] - 129:26 attendance [1] -128:8 attended [5] - 20:5, 20:7, 29:5, 138:12, 183:16 attending [3] - 29:27,

153:12, 177:19

attention [9] - 20:16,

20:19, 27:26, 34:25,

41:17, 43:3, 43:7,

102:8, 189:28 attributable [1] -29:20 attributed [1] - 30:5 attributes [1] -152:24 attributing [4] -160:7, 160:14, 163:26, 167:17 August [12] - 67:17, 68:11, 68:12, 72:25, 78:28, 80:8, 84:18, 148:15, 177:1, 177:11, 193:25, 194:2 August/September [1] - 84:15 author [3] - 31:6, 31:7, 127:11 authorisation [4] -48:13, 55:22, 125:11, 137:10 authorise [1] - 48:19 Authority [14] -82:22, 82:25, 82:28, 83:22, 96:24, 96:26, 97:14, 97:17, 97:26, 98:13, 101:22, 102:2, 102:10, 102:17  $\boldsymbol{authority}\, [2] \boldsymbol{-} 32{:}23,$ automatically [2] -25:14, 25:15 autonomous [1] -53.6 autonomy [1] - 119:4 available [9] - 40:21, 66:24, 98:12, 99:6, 100:3, 107:16, 126:11, 179:6, 188:4 availing [1] - 123:25 avenues [1] - 117:9 avoid [8] - 39:14, 42:22, 58:6, 58:27, 100:24, 101:1, 142:8, 154:25 avoided [1] - 197:4 await [2] - 62:12, awaited [1] - 37:11 awaiting [3] - 72:6, 75:7, 169:17 aware [34] - 18:28, 30:9, 31:22, 31:29, 32:18, 35:17, 35:18, 41:15, 41:23, 42:4, 49:2, 54:27, 55:7, 55:24, 59:6, 65:4, 78:17, 81:3, 96:1, 98:18, 102:29,

103:26, 107:25,

### В

**B&H** [13] - 62:28, 86:11, 86:16, 91:1, 105:15, 106:26, 113:25, 116:19, 174:20, 180:13, 181:8, 181:16, 181:26 backdated [1] -157:26 background [2] -25:22, 41:2 **bag** [1] - 74:19  $\textbf{Ballynacarrigy} \ [1] \ \textbf{-}$ bar [1] - 135:3 BAR [1] - 2:31 barely [1] - 151:17 Barnes [3] - 6:12, 100:23 barrett [1] - 187:4 **BARRETT**[7] - 4:14, 5:3, 7:14, 122:10, 149:22, 192:4, 194:20 Barrett [44] - 6:16, 7:2, 7:9, 7:11, 7:12, 7:17, 7:18, 7:22, 7:24, 14:14, 26:22, 40:16, 44:27, 46:5, 56:10, 56:12. 83:2. 89:16. 101:19, 121:17, 122:13, 143:26, 149:17, 149:25, 165:17, 165:21, 165:29, 167:2, 167:11, 176:6, 180:18, 185:29, 186:11. 190:21. 190:26, 191:11, 191:15, 191:18, 191:23, 192:7, 193:22, 194:23, 200:23, 200:28 Barrett's [2] - 7:1,

7:20

**Barry** [1] - 90:9

based [10] - 8:16,

8:26, 10:18, 107:6,

183:17 basic [5] - 49:26, 50:5, 76:16, 91:24, 156:2 basing [1] - 180:19 basis [10] - 12:12, 28:3, 32:27, 48:12, 50:16, 58:5, 108:23, 152:12, 180:12, 186:6 **BASTION**[1] - 4:2 **bear** [2] - 86:4, 122:14 beat [2] - 46:5, 46:6 became [10] - 7:29, 8:25, 30:9, 31:22, 32:18, 41:23, 59:6, 130:3, 163:26, 179:6 become [8] - 12:9, 12:10, 24:13, 31:29, 57:15, 58:6, 116:21, 136:4 becomes [4] - 40:21, 41:11, 141:9, 181:4 bed [1] - 111:24 BEEN [1] - 7:14 beg [3] - 104:28, 105:1, 182:25 began [4] - 85:1, 110:21, 157:27, 177:24 **begin** [1] - 9:26 beginning [4] -13:15, 28:4, 85:1, 197:20 begun [1] - 115:20 behalf [5] - 96:21, 141:28, 145:9, 176:21, 195:6 behaviour [2] -143:1, 164:17 behind [4] - 6:26, 132:29. 146:22. 181.19 belief [1] - 180:21 believes [2] - 15:9, 173:22 bell [1] - 18:13 benefit [11] - 15:10, 68:29, 71:24, 124:27, 127:12, 139:17, 139:29, 140:3, 141:8, 141:12, 148:2 benefits [2] - 20:9, 32:26 beset [1] - 94:27 beside [1] - 33:26 best [16] - 26:12,

92:25, 102:7, 105:14,

107:7, 137:17, 178:4,

180:11, 180:28,

116:5, 116:6, 117:15, 132:11, 137:26, 138:29, 150:20, 166:1, 174:1, 182:29, 189:25, 201:4 better [5] - 111:12, 122:25, 125:12, 136:16, 150:13 between [21] - 17:20, 22:16, 23:10, 33:16, 39:27, 42:3, 45:9, 54:26, 68:11, 129:22, 133:5, 135:20, 138:20, 141:15, 151:24, 158:21, 158:28, 159:12, 166:7, 183:22, 188:26 beyond [8] - 44:21, 91:24, 105:15, 116:19, 134:23, 170:13, 171:5, 174:20  $\pmb{\text{big}}\, {\tiny [2]} \textbf{-47:} 1,\, 168:} 10$ bigger [4] - 87:17, 170:2, 173:22 bit [7] - 61:13, 101:5, 126:26, 133:13, 161:3, 181:11, 195:22 **BL** [14] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:11, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 2:29, 3:24, 3:25, 3:25, 4:1, 4:7, 4:10, 4:14 blame [3] - 160:14, 166:5, 166:7 blunt [1] - 17:8 book [1] - 25:11 books [1] - 14:9 **boss** [1] - 143:3 Boston [1] - 8:16 bottom [10] - 33:25, 33:26, 34:11, 38:20, 39:6, 45:7, 81:8, 105:3, 114:23, 167:26 bottomed [2] -105:6, 109:22 **bounds** [1] - 171:5 bow [2] - 6:12, 138:9 **box** [1] - 100:20 break [6] - 22:24, 39:29, 100:22, 100:26, 101:19, 158:14 breaks [1] - 74:15 **BRIAN** [2] - 3:15, bridge [1] - 157:11 brief [3] - 11:24, 86:1, 149:26 briefed [3] - 12:2, 12:13, 36:22 briefly [2] - 8:4,

147:17 BRIEFLY [1] - 122:5 bring [4] - 73:23, 87:2, 100:28, 190:20 broader [6] - 74:22, 89:17, 105:20, 184:23, 185:1, 189:24 Brodrick [1] - 90:7 broke [1] - 106:23 brought [5] - 20:16, 41:17, 50:13, 51:19, 115:29 bugbear [1] - 79:19 building [3] - 79:12, 115:9, 115:10 bullet [1] - 113:23 bullying [79] - 10:8, 51:1, 51:11, 52:6, 52:11, 55:29, 56:14, 56:17, 61:23, 65:27, 66:18, 70:5, 70:15, 70:23, 71:6, 71:8, 74:23, 80:13, 80:14, 81:13, 89:17, 89:19, 90:20, 90:25, 93:4, 93:19, 93:20, 95:25, 96:17, 104:5, 105:5, 105:29, 106:4, 106:16, 108:16, 109:23, 111:22, 117:6, 121:14, 138:29, 144:19, 145:6, 146:28, 158:2. 158:16, 159:2, 161:12, 161:26, 162:5, 164:16, 164:22, 164:28, 168:7, 168:9, 169:16, 169:29, 170:14, 171:24, 173:21, 174:16, 174:26, 177:9, 180:4, 180:10, 182:6, 182:19, 183:4, 183:5, 183:10, 184:3, 184:17, 184:25, 185:5, 185:15, 187:19, 195:15, 198:15, 198:16, 198.18 burden [1] - 95:16 BURKE [1] - 4:11 Business [1] - 8:7 business [1] - 129:6 **busy** [1] - 90:15 **buy** [1] - 108:8 **BY** [22] - 1:4, 1:7, 2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29,

3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10,

4:15, 5:5, 5:6, 5:7,

5:8, 5:9, 7:15, 122:10,

149:22, 192:4, 194:20 **Byrne** [7] - 70:7,
70:14, 70:22, 71:5,
105:25, 107:1, 174:13 **Byrne-McGinn** [7] 70:7, 70:14, 70:22,
71:5, 105:25, 107:1,
174:13 **Byrne/McGinn** [2] 70:12, 182:8 **BYRNES** [1] - 4:14

# С

**CAGNEY** [1] - 3:17 California [2] - 8:18, 8:27 Callinan [1] - 9:11 cameraman [1] - 7:4 camouflage [1] -185:15 camouflaged [1] -81:14 campaigner [1] -155:20 can.. [1] - 138:1 cancelled [2] -159:25, 163:16 candidate [6] -82:25, 82:28, 102:16, 102:17, 102:21, 104:8 cannot [2] - 22:7, 102:11 canvass [1] - 181:5 CAO [1] - 189:8 capacity [5] - 13:21, 99:24, 116:5, 120:14, 136:18 caption [1] - 62:9 car [1] - 120:27 care [1] - 70:23 career [2] - 8:5, 115:26 careful [2] - 19:22, 155:14 carefully [1] - 23:2 **CARMEL**[1] - 3:26 Carr [8] - 26:26, 27:26, 28:6, 28:8, 28:24, 33:24, 35:26, CARR [1] - 3:15 **CARRICK** [1] - 2:13 **CARRICK-ON-SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 carried [9] - 16:13, 17:19, 17:27, 42:24, 45:21, 145:3, 154:7,

177:8, 194:25

CARROLL [1] - 2:16 carry [10] - 14:21, 81:21, 95:15, 143:2, 146:28, 180:18, 186:4, 194:26, 194:29 carrying [2] - 95:14, 142:6 CARTHAGE [1] -2:17 case [44] - 8:11, 11:11, 20:5, 20:7, 21:6, 24:13, 24:27, 34:16, 36:7, 38:28, 40:28, 41:15, 41:19, 47:10, 47:11, 59:7, 59:11, 65:29, 69:13, 72:20, 73:22, 77:21, 85:4, 89:16, 94:20, 104:15, 112:27, 114:11, 115:10, 128:20, 133:20, 135:12, 136:3, 138:11, 138:17, 146:26, 147:20, 148:29, 157:23, 157:24, 166:15, 178:25, 180:23 cases [3] - 36:12, 123:13, 123:14 **CASTLE**[1] - 1:17 Castle [1] - 14:16 Castle" [2] - 14:15, 14:20 Catch [2] - 30:25, 31:10 catch [1] - 125:9 categories [1] -123:9 categorisation [4] -76:27, 79:4, 79:7, 123:23 causal [2] - 17:2, 45.8 causally [1] - 157:16 causation [3] -76:14, 77:4, 81:22 caused [5] - 45:1, 79:15, 137:23, 139:9, 195:21 causes [1] - 79:5 **cc** [1] - 189:10 cc'd [5] - 83:24, 83:25, 98:2, 111:19, 186:26 central [3] - 10:17, 134:7, 185:20 centred [1] - 40:1 **CEO** [1] - 96:26 certain [12] - 24:3,

53:26, 55:20, 87:4,

105:12, 106:29, 111:2, 112:24, 119:5, 119:17, 149:29, 183.13 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:3 certainly [23] - 14:19, 22:28, 24:13, 44:25, 47:29, 49:15, 70:13, 73:25, 79:6, 81:3, 89:7, 95:2, 95:7, 98:10, 126:14, 131:8, 142:10, 142:13, 142:27, 143:23, 149:2, 185:18, 193:28 certificate [1] - 22:18 certificates [4] -15:21, 18:10, 76:9, 153:15 certification [1] -150:7 certified [4] - 18:20, 24:15, 28:3, 32:15 **certify** [1] - 1:24 certifying [3] - 20:24, 26:10, 45:11 certs [2] - 78:15, 125:1 chair [1] - 70:27 Chair [1] - 197:23 chair's [1] - 159:27 chaired [1] - 104:25 Chairman [48] - 6:6, 6:15, 7:19, 8:5, 14:17, 17:2, 23:6, 47:5, 50:18. 79:2. 80:27. 94:1, 100:19, 101:11, 102:1, 104:11, 121:26, 121:29, 122:1, 142:14, 143:5, 143:23, 144:23, 145:26, 147:10, 149:14, 152:3, 152:15, 158:1, 165:9, 165:25, 166:9, 167:10, 167:21, 175:13, 176:9, 176:17, 179:11, 180:17, 184:4, 185:28, 191:26, 192:23, 194:13, 194:17, 196:19, 201:11, 201:22 CHAIRMAN [176] -1:12, 6:4, 6:7, 6:17, 7:5, 7:7, 7:11, 7:18, 12:23. 12:26. 13:1. 13:6, 13:9, 13:11, 13:13, 14:14, 14:19, 14:26, 14:29, 26:21, 26:25, 26:28, 27:4,

07.0.07.0.07.40
27:6, 27:8, 27:12,
27:16, 27:21, 27:23,
44:27, 45:3, 45:5,
45:11, 45:14, 45:19,
45:23, 45:25, 46:4,
46:9, 46:11, 46:14,
46:16, 46:21, 46:26,
47:4, 47:12, 87:18,
87:22, 100:23, 101:7,
101:13, 121:22,
121:27, 122:2, 122:8,
121.27, 122.2, 122.0,
142:12, 142:15,
142:17, 142:24,
142:26, 142:29,
143:6, 143:11,
143:25, 143:28,
144:5, 144:7, 144:13,
144:16, 144:18,
144:24, 144:27,
145:8, 145:13,
145:22, 145:29,
146:4, 146:7, 146:10,
146:26, 147:6,
147:14, 147:18,
148:21, 149:11,
140-15 140-17
149:15, 149:17, 149:20, 152:12,
149:20, 152:12,
152:16, 158:28,
159:4, 159:6, 159:8,
159:20, 164:1, 164:3,
164:5, 165:14,
165:27, 166:12,
166:25, 166:27,
167:6, 167:9, 167:19,
167:22, 170:18,
170:20, 170:24,
170.20, 170.24,
170:27, 171:6,
171:10, 174:6, 175:2,
175:7, 175:11,
175:14, 175:23,
176:5, 176:13, 178:4,
178:7, 178:11,
178:14, 178:18,
178:21, 178:24,
179:3, 179:7, 179:12,
180:18, 180:22,
180:27, 180:29,
181:3, 181:10,
181:15, 181:17,
181:22, 183:27,
184:8, 184:10,
184:27, 185:4,
185:12, 185:26,
188:9, 188:11, 190:1,
190:6, 190:11,
190:13, 190:15,
190:18, 190:26,
100.20, 100.20,
190:29, 191:7,
191:10, 191:15,
191:17, 191:22, 191:28, 194:10,
101:28 104:10
131.20, 134.10.

194:14, 194:18, 197:9, 197:11, 197:14, 197:18, 197:26, 200:28, 201:7, 201:15, 201:21, 201:23 Chairman's [4] -141:17, 149:4, 155:28, 174:3 Chairperson [1] -97:16 challenge [1] -181:19 **change** [5] - 9:27, 34:21, 35:6, 85:14, 91:24 changed [2] - 32:1, 32:14 changes [1] - 36:16 channel [1] - 47:22 chaotic [1] - 184:19 characterising [1] -185:24 **charge** [2] - 26:25, 143.1 charged [1] - 99:20 **CHARLTON**[1] - 4:8 charts [1] - 183:20 CHEALLACHÁIN [1] - 2:30 checking [3] -100:25, 116:1, 129:5 Chief [178] - 11:13, 11:16, 14:6, 14:27, 15:10, 17:16, 18:4, 18:7, 19:18, 20:18, 23:3, 23:11, 23:20, 24:3, 29:8, 29:28, 31:4, 31:26, 33:9, 33:10, 33:16, 33:18, 34:16, 35:3, 35:21, 36:23, 36:27, 37:22, 37:28, 39:28, 40:2, 40:5, 40:9, 40:27. 42:13, 42:27, 43:21, 43:24, 43:27, 44:4, 46:16, 47:8, 47:21, 47:28, 48:6, 48:27, 48:29, 49:14, 50:22, 50:24, 51:24, 52:15, 52:24, 52:26, 53:4, 53:27, 54:10, 54:13, 54:18, 54:23, 54:26, 55:27, 56:5, 57:4, 57:21, 58:13, 58:17, 58:22, 59:13, 60:25, 61:3, 61:19, 64:16, 64:17, 65:19, 65:21, 66:17, 66:22, 69:9, 72:14, 74:10, 78:5,

79:13, 79:16, 82:6, 85:6, 85:29, 86:29, 87:1, 87:9, 93:7, 95:3, 96:14, 98:2, 98:7, 99:22, 103:6, 112:18, 113:11, 116:5, 126:28, 127:9, 128:19, 129:16, 130:2, 132:14, 132:16, 133:15, 135:9, 135:16, 135:21, 136:10, 136:15, 137:8, 138:18, 140:15, 141:19, 141:20, 144:11, 147:24, 150:11, 150:23, 152:1, 152:5, 152:19, 153:18, 155:5, 155:13, 156:9, 156:16, 156:18, 157:6, 157:10, 158:23, 159:8, 159:17, 160:2, 161:19. 162:3. 162:13, 162:18, 162:20, 162:22, 162:25, 162:28, 163:6, 163:10, 164:24, 164:25, 165:3, 166:4, 166:6, 166:14, 166:17, 174:24, 177:14. 180:11, 180:20, 186:27, 194:24, 194:27, 195:14, 195:15, 195:23, 195:29, 196:10, 196:14, 196:18, 197:11, 197:12, 197:13. 197:18. 198:6, 199:16, 199:23, 199:26, 200:4, 200:8 **CHIEF** [14] - 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:6, 3:8, 3:11, 3:13, 3:14, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21, 3:27 chief [47] - 10:2, 16:7, 16:26, 17:1, 17:18, 18:11, 21:13, 21:22, 21:28, 24:1, 28:15, 28:17, 30:22, 32:22, 33:7, 35:4, 35:12, 41:28, 42:8, 42:12, 43:24, 43:29, 48:20, 51:16, 55:2, 57:21, 57:28, 60:11, 61:5, 81:2, 81:16, 82:23, 104:26, 124:21, 124:23,

125:15, 128:14, 134:24, 135:17, 137:28, 141:29, 155:10, 155:24, 156:1, 194:28, 195:27, 197:7 chief's [3] - 113:18, 114:18, 137:16 chiefs [1] - 130:2 choice [1] - 102:21 Christmas [5] -113:2, 115:19, 162:19, 187:14, 188:15 chronicling [1] -182:15 chronological [1] -129:11 chronology [3] -30:13, 150:24, 167:15 circa [3] - 59:28, 70:10, 109:25 circumstances [13] -12:5, 33:21, 50:1, 65:23, 77:10, 96:25, 110:15, 130:5, 134:9, 144:3, 145:19, 165:12, 176:10 circumvent [2] -134:27, 155:11 citing [1] - 18:10 **civil** [2] - 10:18, 117:5 civilian [5] - 7:24, 7:29, 9:25, 19:3, 51:5 civilians [3] - 10:5, 10:14, 11:15 civilisation [1] - 7:26 claim [7] - 56:1, 111:22, 154:20, 164:13, 165:7, 166:15, 166:16 **claiming** [1] - 150:15 **claims** [1] - 150:1 Claire [2] - 136:28, 137.4 clandestine [3] -81:1, 98:5, 185:18 clandestinely [2] -80:18. 185:14 Clare [1] - 48:29 clarification [3] -49:6, 95:28, 147:11 clarified [1] - 26:12 clarify [5] - 79:19, 96:13. 140:17. 147:10, 158:26 clarity [8] - 42:22, 51:9, 51:23, 129:21, 132:13, 132:23,

135:22, 160:21 Clarke [4] - 7:1, 191:22, 194:11, 194:12 **CLARKE** [2] - 4:14, 194:13 classification [2] -32:14, 121:14 clear [50] - 13:14, 23:29, 36:16, 39:14, 57:25, 60:6, 62:23, 65:8, 71:2, 71:15, 74:6, 79:19, 82:19, 84 16 84 18 90 13 97:8, 97:19, 105:22, 110:23, 117:3, 122:24, 124:20, 124:28, 127:7, 128:12, 132:26, 144:10, 145:7, 148:7, 150:12, 154:22, 154:25, 156:19, 157:5, 160:9, 161:9, 168:8, 171:2, 171:4, 171:7, 173:8, 177:20, 179:5, 180:1, 185:17, 190:26, 195:17, 196:6 clearance [2] -103:23, 104:2 clearly [21] - 47:10, 53:7, 76:8, 80:2, 83:17, 84:23, 111:26, 112:2, 128:6, 132:16, 140:18, 142:3, 150:19, 150:23, 155:27, 161:24, 166:28, 171:27, 173:2, 178:26, 184:22 clerical [1] - 27:24 client [7] - 99:19, 100:2, 100:11, 103:19, 113:1, 129:23, 186:1 **clients** [1] - 160:2 clock [1] - 174:4 close [1] - 88:15 closer [1] - 136:18 **clumsy** [1] - 198:26 CMO [6] - 27:1, 114:10, 137:19, 137:27, 153:4, 153:13 CMO's [2] - 34:1, CO [2] - 2:13, 4:4 **code** [1] - 98:23 Code [5] - 17:4, 32:22, 43:7, 43:17, 97:12 coffee [1] - 121:1 cognisant [1] -

112:25 colleagues [1] - 6:20 college [1] - 67:26 College [3] - 10:5, 82:7, 194:1 Collins [5] - 19:18, 19:21, 19:28, 21:21, 27:2 coming [7] - 14:12, 20:23, 82:13, 139:20, 143:19, 143:24, 201:8 commence [1] - 6:18 commenced [3] -54:5, 106:21, 117:6 commences [2] -33:27 38:2 commencing [2] -102:14, 145:19 commend [2] -177:20, 201:12 comment [16] -30:27, 30:28, 44:5, 44:11, 80:21, 85:14, 95:17, 111:1, 128:29, 130:28, 166:20, 166:21, 166:22, 166:24, 172:5 commentary [1] -88.19 commented [1] -87:20 commenting [2] -47:13, 47:14 commissioner [22] -9:14, 9:18, 60:15, 61:7, 61:9, 72:28, 73:3, 75:5, 75:7, 82:23, 87:14, 89:1, 90:3, 90:8, 103:28, 118:29, 146:28, 167:13, 172:10, 172:18, 174:8, 196:24 Commissioner [98] -6:28. 9:11. 9:13. 9:15. 10:25, 11:9, 11:12, 11:25, 11:27, 36:19, 37:21, 56:25, 57:8, 58:10, 58:20, 58:29, 59:19, 59:28, 61:1, 61:12, 62:4, 63:12, 65:25, 66:13, 68:2, 68:10, 69:16, 70:26, 71:20, 72:5, 72:20, 74:2, 74:14, 81:21, 83:22, 85:25, 86:18, 87:29, 88:7, 88:12, 88:14, 88:25, 89:5, 89:10, 89:12, 89:20, 90:9, 90:16, 90:22, 93:25, 98:8, 104:1,

105:13, 105:18, 106:18, 107:14, 107:25, 108:4, 108:13, 108:14, 108:25, 108:29, 109:5, 111:3, 112:7, 116:11, 117:16, 117:22, 117:28, 118:3, 119:19, 140:9, 140:25, 142:20, 143:13, 145:4, 159:14, 162:3, 173:8, 173:25, 174:13, 175:4, 176:21, 178:27, 179:4, 181:20, 182:5, 184:29, 186:26, 186:27, 190:7, 191:20, 192:8, 192:18, 192:25, 193:15, 196:9, 200:12 **COMMISSIONER** [9] - 2:20, 3:2, 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:8, 3:18, 3:20 commissioner's [1] -67:10 Commissioner's [7] - 59:7, 59:20, 85:14, 97:24, 98:18, 110:7, 160:25 commitment [2] -43:29, 100:3 committed [2] -146:16. 155:8 committee [1] -35:18 Committee [2] -67:28, 68:5 common [3] - 19:16, 136:22, 136:23 communicate [2] -12:11, 169:19 communicated [2] -92:27, 179:13 communicating [1] -173:20 communication [8] -

94:17, 145:1, 173:10,

178:2, 178:4, 179:11,

Communications [1]

communications [4]

companies [1] - 8:10

COMPANY [1] - 2:22

company [3] - 8:12,

187:23, 188:25

- 144:8, 146:13,

147:3, 147:4

8:13, 8:17

compartmentalisati on [1] - 112:1 compendious [1] -91:15 competence [1] -112.7 competitions [3] -10:3, 82:20, 82:22 complainant [1] -53:24 complained [5] -53:25, 54:1, 62:27, 107:12, 144:15 complaining [2] -55:5, 111:6 complains [1] -114:15 complaint [51] -23:6, 51:10, 52:13, 53:23, 53:28, 54:1, 54:4, 54:22, 55:4, 55:10, 56:14, 56:18, 56:23, 57:11, 59:14, 66:18, 80:25, 83:7, 83:12, 86:15, 86:16, 95:25, 95:29, 102:12, 102:20, 104:6, 105:6, 107:27, 107:28, 111:7, 111:20, 134:6, 135:28, 142:19, 143:21, 158:3, 158:5, 161:9, 161:13, 161:18, 161:22, 161:27, 162:5, 177:9, 180:4, 187:15, 188:16, 195:18, 196:15, 198:19 complaints [10] -51:12, 52:27, 53:15, 59:16, 62:26, 80:12, 80:17, 80:18, 81:6, 116:28 complete [3] - 52:25, 103:10, 182:2 completed [1] -133:18 completeness [2] -51:9, 138:2 completing [1] -156:11 complex [2] - 95:2, 117:10 complexity [1] -148:29 compliance [1] -189:23 complicated [1] -34:6 comply [1] - 161:11 comprehensive [5] -

63:7, 65:28, 83:13, 99:6, 171:25 comprehensively [1] - 99:13 Computer [1] - 8:16 concept [1] - 17:9 conceptual [1] -111:6 concern [5] - 64:25, 97:8, 131:12, 132:28, 195:22 concerned [15] -34:9, 34:23, 43:22, 63:21, 64:22, 74:19, 79:9, 84:19, 106:19, 114:21, 130:15, 151:13, 178:22, 182:5, 183:5 concerning [3] -114:26, 186:5, 200:12 concerns [4] - 91:11, 97:18, 107:12, 162:29 conclude [2] - 53:20, 99:27 concluded [4] -29:24, 93:21, 119:14, 152:29 concludes [4] - 31:9, 34:23, 66:14, 81:26 concluding [1] - 35:9 conclusion [3] -24:5, 39:6, 92:26 condition [2] - 79:29, 153:1 conditions [2] - 21:9, 29:25 conduct [20] - 24:1, 31:8, 39:9, 39:20, 43:29, 47:24, 53:5, 62:28, 116:8, 123:7, 126:22, 128:13, 133:16, 154:16, 155:2, 155:9, 183:9, 186:20, 196:5, 196:26 conducted [5] - 30:3, 36:28, 43:23, 93:24, 199:16 conducting [3] -30:23, 43:11, 199:27 Confederation [1] conference [20] -24:27, 24:28, 38:28, 41:19, 59:7, 59:11, 59:15, 69:13, 72:20, 72:24, 73:22, 73:26, 85:4, 86:29, 87:3, 89:16, 104:15, 114:12, 138:11, 147:20

conferences [4] -20:6, 20:7, 21:7, 41:16 confess [1] - 120:26 confidence [4] -19:27, 99:21, 101:26, 115:9 confidential [4] -22:11, 23:8, 38:11, 38:25 confidentiality [3] -19:22, 25:26, 95:4 confidentially [2] -94:18, 153:28 confined [1] - 193:19 confines [1] - 70:17 confirm [5] - 35:17, 172:26, 187:26, 191:5, 196:7 confirmation [4] -36:27, 40:4, 75:7, 86:6 confirmed [4] -86:21, 93:6, 155:25, 189.19 confirming [2] -76:21, 108:25 confirms [1] - 190:26 conflict [5] - 58:25, 59:1, 66:5, 162:16, 171:16 conflicted [2] -56:20, 162:26 confusion [6] -105:22, 111:1, 142:13, 186:6, 200:2, **CONLON** [1] - 2:17 CONNAUGHT [1] connected [1] -197:27 CONNELLAN[2] -4:1, 4:1 **CONOR** [1] - 3:24 conscious [10] -23:2, 38:27, 44:1, 79:1, 97:6, 97:14, 98:7, 139:28, 140:1, 151:26 consequence [5] -76:15, 77:1, 85:12, 117:12, 130:25 consider [5] - 44:18, 115:14, 142:2, 183:21, 184:2 considerable [1] -130:13 consideration [13] -17:12, 17:13, 21:7,

34:27, 50:7, 60:16, 61:11, 90:25, 107:4, 169:16, 170:9, 174:10, 174:19 considerations [2] -41:9, 50:15 considered [9] -17:8, 54:9, 61:7, 74:7, 90:23, 102:10, 137:1, 195:13, 198:14 consistent [2] -170:17, 182:28 **conspiracy** [1] - 97:9 conspired [1] -145:23 consult [1] - 6:24 consultation [4] -25:17, 29:3, 29:4, 101:8 contact [15] - 10:26. 34:22, 40:6, 49:12, 55:26, 64:11, 100:9, 129:26, 130:22, 134:1, 134:2, 142:10, 161:16, 165:3, 177:27 contacted [2] -163:11, 172:25 contain [1] - 144:9 contains [1] - 75:26 contemplated [2] -104:8, 110:25 contemplating [1] -90:9 contemporaneous 111 - 139:12 contend [1] - 177:16 content [2] - 67:3, 164:24 contentious [1] -130:3 contents [3] - 62:10, 62:17, 189:16 context [12] - 13:7, 19:10, 40:18, 41:2, 73:29, 79:11, 93:3, 98:26, 142:28, 144:19, 148:13, 174:7 contextual [1] -84.14 continuation [1] continue [5] - 48:12, 64:21, 92:10, 115:3, 177:28 continued [3] -38:27, 153:16, 180:17 continues [3] - 81:9, 99:25, 181:5 continuing [1] -126:18

continuous [1] continuously [1] contradicted [1] contradicting [1] contrary [2] - 36:12, contributing [1] contribution [2] convened [1] - 90:24 convenience [1] conversation [19] -31:3, 31:25, 47:26, 70:13, 83:1, 83:7, 85:7, 85:17, 96:2, conversations [1] cooler [1] - 82:29 cooperating [1] cooperation [3] -47:15, 118:16, 119:2 cooperative [1] coordination [1] coordinative [1] **copied** [10] - 35:3, 35:14, 57:20, 91:13, 97:15, 97:21, 101:29, 102:26, 103:6, 103:16 copies [3] - 74:28, COPPINGER [1] copy [17] - 14:11, 29:6, 32:6, 53:12, 53:16, 64:7, 72:1,

91:23

38:24

76:8

77:13

44.25

54:7

140:4, 169:23

convenient [2] -

101:4, 121:28

115:18, 126:11,

130:6, 131:16,

146:17, 147:10,

162:27, 183:18,

cooperate [2] -

47:18, 130:26

130.25

43:26

146:2

100:14

89:2, 113:14

97:29, 103:17,

103:20, 122:20,

127:12, 147:29,

177:15, 188:1,

188:28. 193:20

Corcoran [1] - 174:8

188:15, 189:5

47:7

core [1] - 134:7 corporate [1] -188:23 Corporation [1] -8:23 correct [106] - 7:27. 7:28, 8:3, 8:4, 9:5, 10:13, 10:23, 10:24, 10:28, 12:20, 13:27, 24:16, 24:19, 24:23, 31:28, 31:29, 32:4, 34:9, 36:1, 36:2, 36:29, 41:27, 42:13, 42:14, 44:2, 46:8, 46:20, 47:3, 48:14, 49:18, 49:21, 49:27, 50:21, 53:4, 55:11, 56:28, 57:1, 57:2, 57:5, 57:13, 58:3, 59:4, 59:9, 59:14, 59:24, 71:19, 75:9, 78:23, 78:28, 78:29, 82:2, 84:6, 84:11, 86:28, 87:27, 88:10, 88:11, 91:14, 98:3, 98:4, 98:14, 99:18, 103:8, 104:16, 104:17, 105:3, 108:3, 108:8, 108:11, 108:18, 108:26, 110:8, 113:9, 114:27, 120:21, 121:15, 121:16, 123:21, 123:27, 124:12, 125:14. 125:17. 131:28, 134:3, 137:7, 137:15, 137:16, 144:2, 150:2, 152:14, 152:21, 157:27, 158:19, 158:20, 159:5, 159:20, 162:2, 162:12, 167:29, 168:13. 173:26. 178:6, 179:13, 185:8, 189:21, 192:22 correctly [2] - 158:6, 182.21 correlated [1] -38:24 corresponded [4] -64:6, 66:9, 171:20, 189.10 correspondence [94] - 15:3, 15:8, 15:28, 15:29, 22:6, 24:4, 26:2, 26:18, 28:1, 30:7, 39:1, 43:1, 44:12, 47:28, 52:2, 52:23, 62:8, 63:21, 63:23, 63:29, 66:6,

66:16, 68:6, 69:19, 69:22, 70:9, 72:12, 72:29, 73:11, 73:13, 73:29, 74:5, 74:14, 74:27, 84:3, 84:23, 84:28, 85:10, 87:6, 89:29, 92:1, 95:27, 96:1, 97:7, 97:15, 97:16, 99:4, 101:27, 102:8, 103:3, 103:20, 114:11, 117:29, 127:9, 130:19, 132:16, 133:20, 133:23, 136:10, 136:13, 139:2, 139:11, 139:13, 140:13, 140:21, 141:7, 141:12, 142:2, 147:7, 147:12, 150:10, 150:17, 151:29, 160:9, 160:17, 171:17, 172:19, 172:22, 172:26, 173:29, 176:27. 179:18. 179:22, 183:22, 187:9, 188:13, 188:21, 188:28, 189:2, 189:29, 190:4, 193:1, 193:2, 193:27 correspondences [1] - 160:12 corroborates [2] -140:26. 192:18 COSTELLO [1] -2:22 counsel [1] - 33:2 counter [1] - 181:2 **country** [3] - 95:21, 130:3, 136:8 couple [6] - 74:4, 104:20, 139:22, 184:20, 191:26, 196:23 course [23] - 10:20, 13:23, 14:26, 17:5, 18:23, 41:15, 45:22, 46:1, 47:6, 60:17, 62:12, 67:8, 80:3, 103:19, 119:6, 125:18, 125:22, 132:4, 134:20, 136:2, 136:5, 145:21, 184:4

courses [1] - 145:21

Court [1] - 40:4

2:3, 4:2

171:25

COURT [3] - 1:13,

cover [2] - 106:6,

covered [3] - 10:10,

32:20, 80:19 covering [1] - 108:29 covertly [1] - 81:17 Covid [2] - 22:24, 139:20 crap [1] - 175:27 create [1] - 116:9 created [3] - 88:13, 88:18, 157:13 credit [5] - 44:22, 47:21, 88:12, 155:14, 157:10 criminal [9] - 65:24, 71:17, 93:22, 117:5, 174:27, 174:28, 174:29, 181:13, 181:28 criminality [8] -71:11, 106:18, 106:20, 106:21, 181:9, 181:12, 181:26, 184:6 critical [2] - 68:18, 168:5 criticise [1] - 168:15 criticised [1] -146.13 CROSS [6] - 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 122:10, 149:22, 192:4 cross [5] - 6:21, 157:1, 176:8, 177:25, 190:3 cross-examination rsi - 6:21, 157:1. 176:8, 177:25, 190:3 **CROSS-EXAMINED** [6] - 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 122:10, 149:22, 192:4 crossed [1] - 190:16 crying [1] - 85:16 CS [1] - 197:6 **CUALÁIN** [1] - 3:7 Cualáin [3] - 83:23, 103:29, 186:26 **CULLEN** [1] - 2:11 Cullen [40] - 55:8, 55:9, 55:13, 56:7, 71:1, 74:4, 75:6, 75:19, 85:7, 86:26, 86:27, 87:3, 87:4, 91:6, 91:13, 96:5, 97:15, 97:22, 102:3, 102:6, 102:27, 103:3, 103:16, 103:18, 111:4, 111:5, 113:1, 113:13, 115:4, 116:23, 120:2, 142:4, 145:8, 148:4, 161:7, 161:15, 161:16,

187:29, 195:5, 199:3 Cullen's [10] - 74:28, 80:7, 84:3, 88:19, 103:19, 141:12, 148:7, 188:1, 198:5, 198:29 curiously [3] - 67:20, 72:4, 78:2 **CURLEY** [1] - 3:10 Curran [4] - 114:18, 197:6, 197:12, 197:15 **CURRAN**[1] - 3:3 currency [1] - 23:7 current [7] - 29:20, 38:4, 48:12, 65:9, 76:2, 152:25, 182:3 cushion [1] - 92:16 custom [1] - 76:19 customers [1] - 8:15 cut [2] - 118:20, 178:1

### D

D22B [1] - 48:11 daily [1] - 95:15 damaging [1] - 149:2 data [1] - 18:26 Data [1] - 77:24 date [26] - 18:18, 20:3, 28:5, 29:8, 29:14, 29:16, 37:6, 67:5, 69:7, 85:29, 86:21. 89:12. 91:24. 97:2, 97:5, 99:4, 109:8, 109:20, 118:1, 118:2, 129:1, 133:9, 151:26, 160:29, 198:20, 199:17 dated [43] - 14:28, 18:4, 21:29, 52:23, 56:12. 60:11. 60:12. 62:9. 63:9. 63:23. 63:29, 64:26, 66:16, 69:19, 70:3, 72:29, 73:13, 75:22, 75:23, 76:21, 84:5, 85:19, 89:5, 93:29, 100:19, 103:11, 120:6, 129:16, 130:19, 132:27, 151:4, 152:8, 159:28, 160:27, 167:13, 169:13, 172:13, 172:22, 172:26, 176:27, 179:22, 186:17, 195:6 dates [10] - 68:16, 141:1, 142:22, 162:1,

163:3, 163:9, 163:18,

166:17, 166:27, 167:16 DAVID [3] - 2:28, 3:18, 4:14 **DAY** [1] - 1:18 days [7] - 14:1, 40:2, 139:22, 155:7, 155:12, 162:19, 194:2 deadline [1] - 118:13 deal [16] - 16:23, 26:24, 27:24, 33:5, 43:4, 78:29, 79:12, 85:3, 102:24, 112:8, 141:21, 149:25, 152:12, 168:11, 168:28, 191:25 dealing [12] - 6:27, 11:3, 11:10, 79:5, 89:23, 90:15, 95:6, 104:12, 115:8, 131:23, 136:24, 194:1 dealings [2] - 63:16, 82:10

deals [4] - 16:5, 16:6, 27:23, 91:22 dealt [24] - 11:23, 16:5, 16:27, 17:4, 17:5, 17:14, 18:14, 18:15, 18:16, 21:8, 23:25, 52:25, 74:12, 79:29, 84:20, 85:17, 90:20, 90:21, 106:15, 116:6, 117:7, 118:5, 128:25, 132:11 Dear [1] - 56:10 debate [3] - 12:14,

**DECEMBER** [1] - 1:9 **December** [18] -13:22, 29:3, 38:28, 55:26, 56:8, 57:24, 83:10, 109:1, 109:2, 109:9, 109:11, 111:5, 114:12, 115:19, 157:26, 162:2,

87:25. 110:12

167:14, 177:15 **decide** [5] - 65:28, 145:10, 145:11, 183:27, 183:28 **decided** [5] - 24:10,

36:12, 148:19, 158:28, 175:1

**decides** [2] - 158:15, 158:18

decision [38] - 20:10, 24:7, 36:15, 37:3, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 40:19, 42:19, 43:14, 48:2, 48:4, 48:6, 48:26, 49:19, 65:28, 66:25, 69:27, 70:15, 90:19, 91:2, 107:7, 124:23, 137:17, 145:16, 155:29, 169:18, 173:28, 177:13, 177:19, 183:25, 184:14, 184:16, 184:18, 185:4, 185:5, 185:6 decision-making [1] - 66:25 decisions [3] - 77:11, 92:15, 145:27 decisiveness [1] - 147:1

decisiveness [1] 147:1

DECLAN [1] - 3:5
declined [1] - 189:5
declining [1] - 187:6
dedicated [1] - 95:13
defence [1] - 55:29
defending [1] - 144:1
defined [1] - 112:2
definitions [1] - 33:7
definitive [1] 126:28
degree [4] - 19:27,

delay [39] - 69:24, 73:15, 93:2, 93:9, 93:14, 94:6, 102:14, 139:7, 139:8, 139:12, 139:14, 144:1, 146:11, 146:12, 146:27, 148:23, 155:29, 157:29, 158:27, 160:6, 162:16, 166:7, 176:11, 176:12, 177:19, 179:24,

48:4, 74:15, 95:10

182:14, 182:16, 183:12, 185:22, 186:11, 196:17, 196:19

**delayed** [2] - 37:6, 77:19

**delaying** [1] - 165:3 **delays** [4] - 94:26, 166:2, 166:3, 166:19

delegate [2] - 68:3, 125:18 delegation [2] -

11:24, 125:21 deliberate [1] - 71:3 deliberations [1] -

**delivered** [3] - 89:3, 193:7, 193:8

**delivers** [1] - 158:22 **delivery** [1] - 85:19

demanding [1] -141:26 demands [1] - 98:24

demeaning [1] - 164:17

demonstrate [1] - 97:13 denial [2] - 77:5,

77:20 department [2] -17:23, 49:6 Department [2] -

50:11, 190:4 **departure** [2] - 9:11, 9:14

dependence [1] -153:6 dependent [3] -46:26, 47:19, 47:20 deprecated [1] -176:12

deprived [1] - 178:1 deputy [2] - 8:24, 167:12

**Deputy** [5] - 9:13, 108:28, 109:5, 110:7, 186:26

deriving [1] - 152:25 describe [3] - 21:7, 31:10, 117:10 described [4] - 40:5, 81:4, 128:9, 132:3 describes [1] - 60:29 deserves [1] - 88:12

designation [1] - 32:22 designations [1] -

designed [1] - 94:12 DESMOND [1] - 4:6 despite [3] - 38:22, 78:14, 198:19 destress [1] - 130:16

detail [8] - 32:21, 53:20, 131:7, 139:20, 141:11, 151:8, 151:28, 192:27 detail/nature [1] -

53:29
detailed [1] - 167:14
details [4] - 41:16,
54:5, 161:17, 192:23
DETECTIVE [5] - 3:4,
3:5, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17
determination [6] -

44:4, 70:17, 71:7, 96:17, 105:4, 105:11 **determine** [14] -17:1, 32:23, 45:8.

17:1, 32:23, 45:8, 62:20, 62:25, 62:27,

71:5, 106:4, 144:14, 162:9, 162:11, 196:4, 196:26, 196:29

determined [2] - 46:2, 90:28

determining [1] - 37:16

detrimental [2] - 17:27, 80:13

**develop** [1] - 189:24 **DEVELOPMENT** [1] - 3:16

development [3] - 7:25, 8:2, 17:9

Development [2] - 43:3, 90:2

developments [1] -

61:8 diagnose [2] - 76:22,

138:5 diagnosis [1] - 21:19

dialogue [4] - 47:22, 85:9, 115:3, 115:21 diaries [1] - 175:19 DIARMAID [1] - 2:6

**DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 **Diarmuid** [2] - 83:1, 155:4

diary [2] - 176:7, 176:14 difference [2] -165:22, 170:25 different [32] - 20:17,

25:8, 39:1, 48:16, 55:16, 57:21, 63:8, 67:1, 74:19, 91:9, 94:7, 95:22, 110:25, 114:20, 118:8, 131:14, 134:24, 135:14, 135:17,

136:3, 139:23, 141:16, 142:5, 145:24, 146:22, 157:11, 158:11, 162:7, 183:24,

184:20, 196:13 **difficult** [11] - 30:10, 46:11, 46:14, 47:7, 115:9, 131:24,

139:19, 139:27, 141:27, 163:23, 172:9 **difficulties** [2] -134:28, 154:11

**difficulty** [7] - 22:24, 23:27, 118:15, 139:9, 141:1, 141:15, 156:10 **DIGNAM** [1] - 3:24

dilemma [1] - 155:11 diminute [1] - 99:14 direct [6] - 98:7, 124:9, 129:22, 134:2,

134:13, 134:15 directed [12] - 15:1, 15:22, 18:13, 57:8, 72:28, 75:5, 79:23, 80:8, 88:29, 137:27, 163:1, 172:18 direction [3] - 50:11, 55:20, 115:20 directive [3] - 123:6, 131:6, 131:7 Directive [5] - 17:17, 24:2, 31:7, 122:16, 122:17 directives [1] - 123:4 **DIRECTLY** [2] - 5:5, directly [19] - 11:26, 25:12, 28:21, 47:23, 64:17, 66:22, 77:26, 83:28, 84:26, 86:27, 87:7, 91:6, 92:27, 94:25, 103:3, 133:20, 135:13, 161:19, 176:11 **DIRECTLY-EXAMINED** [2] - 5:5, 7:15 director [16] - 8:1, 8:14, 9:4, 9:22, 15:1, 28:26, 28:28, 43:2, 48:21, 90:1, 120:16, 160:24, 172:16, 176:6, 176:29, 189:23 **DIRECTOR** [1] - 3:13 director's [1] - 152:6 DIRECTORATE[1] disability [1] - 76:13 disadvantage [3] -129:28, 132:1, 166:9 disagree [3] - 143:5, 144:23, 162:1 **disagreed** [1] - 167:6 disagreements [1] -181:23 disarticulated [1] -111:8 disciplinary [1] -102:15 discipline [1] -102:18 disclose [1] - 102:18 discloser [10] -12:12, 65:10, 65:26, 88:21, 94:17, 156:14, 157:14, 157:17, 173:13, 177:21 disclosure [27] -11:13. 12:13. 42:1. 65:10, 65:12, 65:13,

74:8, 74:9, 74:22, 39:23, 44:10, 129:8, 78:1, 84:19, 84:20, 134:23, 135:14, 88:23, 92:10, 94:13, 136:4, 136:18, 94:21, 94:23, 94:28, 152:27, 155:2, 94:29, 99:21, 99:24, 155:18, 157:18 117:8, 131:21, 135:2, **DIVISION**[1] - 1:12 136:19, 148:5, 173:10 divisional [7] - 41:7, Disclosures [1] -43:12, 54:6, 54:22, 50:15 58:14, 135:26, 155:17 disclosures [19] divisions [3] - 21:23, 10:23, 11:10, 11:20, 47:6. 155:18 11:23, 12:6, 12:8, **DOCKERY** [1] - 4:6 23:5, 64:27, 65:5, doctor [18] - 19:21, 20:23, 20:25, 20:26, 65:8, 71:16, 74:12, 94:8, 94:9, 94:12, 21:16, 21:21, 24:29, 94:15, 98:9, 112:22, 26:8, 26:10, 26:11, 141:24 28:4, 28:18, 29:2, DISCLOSURES [2] -29:5, 37:14, 41:20, 1:2, 1:3 45:11, 45:26 discovered[1] doctor's [4] - 37:11, 54:25 40:11, 40:20, 76:9 discovers [1] - 159:1 doctors [4] - 20:29, discrediting [1] -21:5, 21:18 148:24 document [24] discuss [14] - 22:9, 14:24, 25:6, 26:15, 32:7, 38:9, 38:12, 48:25, 54:15, 60:12, 55:10, 72:16, 75:8, 60:21, 63:7, 83:13, 127:26, 128:7, 88:17, 127:16, 128:27, 146:23, 127:18, 163:29, 151:2, 151:5, 153:26 164:10, 167:12, discussed [5] -167:24, 167:26, 90:12, 121:11, 168:1, 169:11, 146:25, 185:23, 195:8 175:19, 176:18, 180:28, 181:5, 186:15 discussing [3] -138:23, 159:11, documentation [8] -20:22. 53:26. 54:9. 181:11 discussion [20] -77:11, 77:19, 178:26, 16:18, 26:9, 33:16, 186:3 39:27, 40:1, 40:27, documented [1] -49:22, 51:18, 64:10, 158:8 documents [12] -86:2, 86:5, 87:29, 105:1, 105:16, 19:13, 52:8, 61:6, 105:20, 112:29, 61:11, 72:3, 83:27, 131:17, 133:25, 87:11, 110:25, 139:6, 140:19, 183:2 142:3, 171:8, 201:13 discussions 131 domain [5] - 12:5, 49:2, 60:2, 91:29 67:24, 98:16, 98:22, Disorder [1] - 17:10 104:5 dispute [4] - 162:5, don't.. [1] - 110:9 162:23, 163:2, 180:24 **DONAL** [39] - 3:7, disputed [1] - 135:11 3:24, 5:7, 149:14, distinction [2] -149:16, 149:22, 149:25, 152:15, 11:22, 36:11 152:19, 153:22, distress [1] - 79:15 160:1, 164:2, 164:4, district [5] - 22:7, 164:6, 165:25, 57:29, 129:8, 135:15, 153:4 166:26, 167:10, divert [1] - 183:3 167:20, 167:23,

176:9, 176:17, 179:14, 182:1, 184:12, 185:3, 185:9, 185:13, 185:28, 188:10, 188:12, 190:19, 190:28, 191:5, 191:8, 191:11 **Donal** [6] - 19:18, 19:28, 21:21, 27:2, 149:12, 186:26 done [16] - 17:24, 20:1, 33:11, 47:4, 98:5, 110:1, 133:22, 133:23, 133:28, 143:13, 147:8, 155:10, 157:3, 196:20, 198:20, 199:9 **Donlon** [1] - 112:22 door [1] - 166:4 double [1] - 129:5 double-checking [1] - 129.5 doubt [10] - 39:14, 42:22, 76:22, 124:15, 124:20, 124:24, 124:27, 140:19, 154:25, 167:17 down [31] - 7:18, 16:2, 39:7, 48:15, 55:9, 58:22, 60:24, 64:21, 65:17, 70:13, 72:10, 78:8, 79:4, 79:16, 80:9, 89:22, 92:6, 100:6, 104:25, 107:21, 109:10, 112:15, 118:25, 119:28, 125:18, 145:13, 158:14, 160:27, 164:14, 167:25, 191:1 Downey [2] - 35:2, **DOWNEY** [2] - 3:15,

downloaded [1] -

198:28 dozen [1] - 147:12 **DPER** [1] - 50:17 **DPERS** [2] - 49:6,

**DPP** [1] - 86:7 **Dr** [8] - 19:8, 19:18, 25:5, 27:1, 42:4, 137:27, 138:3, 138:12 **DR** [1] - 3:11 draft [3] - 36:1, 78:27, 80:5

drafting [1] - 17:17 draw [2] - 43:7, 102:8

171:11. 175:13.

175:18, 175:24,

division [15] - 29:22,

31:8, 38:13, 39:20,

drawing [1] - 20:19 drift [1] - 119:18 drinking [1] - 153:7 drive [1] - 146:18 driving [1] - 120:29 **drop** [2] - 79:3, 79:15 **Dublin** [4] - 14:15, 14:16, 14:19, 120:29 **DUBLIN** [8] - 1:17, 2:19, 2:25, 2:32, 3:28, 4:9, 4:13, 4:17 due [11] - 6:11, 10:20, 13:23, 30:18, 62:12, 76:3, 76:7, 77:8, 80:3, 100:16, 174.17 DUNDRUM [2] -4:16, 4:17 during [3] - 68:1, 150:5, 153:6 **duties** [1] - 32:25 duty [20] - 17:4, 17:9, 17:23, 21:10, 30:2, 30:24, 32:16, 32:21, 36:17, 43:15, 46:6, 114:25, 114:27, 116:2, 123:23, 123:29, 124:16, 137:2, 138:6, 150:2

### Ε

**DÁIL** [1] - 1:4

e-mail [23] - 33:23, 33:27, 34:11, 35:26, 36:4, 48:27, 50:23, 86:3, 86:18, 86:20, 88:24, 89:25, 107:21, 112:14, 112:17, 172:8, 172:10, 175:3, 175:16. 179:10. 198:6, 198:13, 199:21 e-mails [4] - 37:25, 50:8, 72:5, 110:26 **EAMON**[1] - 3:10 earliest [1] - 54:7 early [7] - 58:19, 60:3, 60:17, 61:22, 74:13, 76:12, 112:10 earnings [1] - 50:4 earth [2] - 165:16, 165:18 ease [3] - 7:4, 32:19, 114:28 east [1] - 172:11 Eastern [7] - 60:15, 61:7, 72:28, 75:7, 89:1, 172:18, 176:28 easy [2] - 71:14,

106:27 190:21 177:18 123:10, 123:28, 158:18, 158:28, effect [12] - 14:2, embrace [1] - 111:22 159:2, 163:10, 165:6, error [5] - 76:27, 17:26, 17:27, 41:4, emerged [1] - 184:4 182:19 77:2, 96:9, 96:21, 76:12, 99:25, 105:11, engaged [14] - 23:4, **EMMA**[1] - 3:26 110:10 118:18, 148:23, 47:26, 87:7, 136:19, empathise [1] errs [1] - 99:3 149:2, 173:9, 193:15 149:27, 157:6, 158:1, 141.28 essence [3] - 103:11, effective [2] -160:15, 161:24, 148:2, 165:27 empathy [1] - 131:22 162:19, 162:21, 123:25, 142:11 essentially [21] -Employee [2] - 30:1, 165:4, 183:7, 198:4 effectively [14] -100:9 11:9, 11:25, 28:25, 11:17, 12:6, 32:22, engagement [8] -40:6, 70:7, 120:9, employee [2] - 10:4, 32:25, 39:8, 63:5, 11:8, 21:21, 22:29, 124:3, 125:8, 143:29, 10:7 65:11, 80:18, 105:28, employees [1] -51:25, 84:26, 90:14, 146:14, 156:3, 168:1, 95:5, 125:11 109:1, 147:9, 155:10, 169:28, 170:11, 130:16 196:19, 196:21 engaging [5] - 26:8, 175:14, 177:6, employer [1] - 149:3 27:1, 29:29, 126:5, effectiveness [1] -177:22, 183:1, 183:3, **Employers** [1] - 8:7 41:10 157.2 184:13, 195:7 employers [1] - 25:9 engineer [1] - 115:22 establish [7] - 16:11, effort [4] - 18:1, employment [2] -21:27, 87:5, 185:18 enquire [4] - 29:17, 30:3, 38:7, 38:23, 10:11, 32:9 39:15, 42:23, 154:26 127:22, 166:3, 166:17 efforts [14] - 6:11, enable [3] - 39:11, 17:29, 24:3, 24:4, enquired [4] - 29:18, established [6] -87:2, 154:19 38:7, 59:13, 96:14, 32:15, 71:17, 152:23 76:19, 99:12, 117:13, enabled [1] - 63:5 126:14, 127:21, **enquires** [1] - 73:3 131:1, 131:3, 177:27 enclose [1] - 76:20 129:19, 130:22, ESTABLISHED[1] enquiries [9] - 17:19, enclosed [5] - 53:12, 132:21, 160:19, 18:2. 38:19. 38:22. 1:7 53:16, 60:7, 60:12, 163:25 63:16, 117:26, establishes [1] -61:29 EGAN [1] - 3:25 130:11, 146:19, 168:3 enclosing [1] - 75:23 Egan [6] - 35:28, 150:14 estimate [1] - 101:11 enclosures [1] -48:29, 50:23, 136:28, enquiring [4] - 42:8, etcetera [10] - 27:20, 60.20 136:29, 137:4 59:22, 103:25, 133:6 65:2, 77:24, 82:23, encompass [1] eight [3] - 91:10, enquiry [2] - 16:19, 88:18, 95:1, 115:10, 91:16, 92:19 123:9, 194:26 170:2 encompassed [2] either [12] - 14:7, **ensure** [11] - 17:18, ethics [2] - 97:12, 10:7, 63:18 14:11, 46:18, 71:21, 98:24 17:24, 18:1, 30:2, encompasses [1] -73:21, 77:19, 132:17, 54:4, 94:14, 98:12, Eugene [1] - 174:8 182:8 163:26, 188:21, 102:26, 155:14, Europe [3] - 8:21, encounter [1] -188:25, 189:29, 162:15, 187:24 8:25, 95:22 159:13 190:29 entire [2] - 10:18, European [2] - 8:24, encountered [1] elaborate [1] -93:20 8.25 64.28 100:25 entirely [5] - 145:18, event [20] - 18:17, encourage [2] elapsed [1] - 174:3 178:18, 190:24, 33:23, 34:20, 35:13, 115:14, 118:4 element [2] - 24:23, 190:25, 196:13 37:19, 39:17, 40:29, end [19] - 15:20, entirety [1] - 87:21 162:10 41:13, 49:14, 50:22, 68:11, 71:4, 71:6, **elements** [12] -58:17, 62:3, 80:3, entitled [3] - 94:2, 83:24, 84:17, 90:18, 71:11, 85:12, 92:16, 165:5, 183:12 88:3, 105:24, 107:11, 92:26, 93:16, 146:1, 112:23, 112:24, 110:6, 111:3, 113:18, entitlement [1] -148:4, 158:22, 112:26, 113:27, 118.7 154:28 159:18, 168:22, 114:20, 142:13, entitlements [1] events [5] - 9:9, 183:1, 183:2, 191:4, 145:20, 147:1, 162:10 46:29 93:15, 109:10, 191:22, 191:23 elevate [1] - 20:11 entry [2] - 175:20, 150:24, 167:15 END [5] - 121:20, elevated [1] - 16:26 eventually [8] -149:9, 191:13, 194:8, ELIZABETH[1] enumerated [2] -158:15, 158:17, 200:26 163:1, 163:14, 91:11, 93:17 endeavour[1] elongated [3] -163:16, 183:7, 185:4, envisaged [1] -142:1 118:19, 145:21, 147:4 107:5 185:9 ended [1] - 116:20 elongation [1] -**EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:8 **EOIN** [1] - 2:29 endorsement [1] -118:15 **EQUALITY** [1] - 1:8 evidence [40] - 6:19, 164:12 16:20, 25:5, 29:1, elsewhere [1] -Equality [1] - 102:1 ends [1] - 116:29 29:5, 29:6, 48:28, 103:4 equality [2] - 53:2, engage [11] - 150:7, elucidation [1] - 41:8 54:13, 68:22, 104:11, 53.6 151:12. 156:14. embarrassment[1] -121:12, 122:25, equipped [1] -157:14, 158:16,

124:20, 128:9, 140:25, 140:26, 166:29, 167:1, 172:4, 173:7, 173:18, 173:25, 177:24, 179:5, 181:3, 192:7, 192:8, 192:17, 192:21, 192:25, 192:26, 193:12, 193:14, 193:17, 193:19, 195:16 evidences [1] -175:16 evident [1] - 141:29 evoking [1] - 93:7 exacerbating [2] -29:25, 153:1 exact [1] - 53:29 exactly [5] - 46:25, 150:26, 156:10, 163:5, 183:1 EXAMINATION [5] -121:20, 149:9, 191:13, 194:8, 200:26 examination [7] -6:21, 7:3, 23:3, 157:1, 176:8, 177:25, 190:3 **examine** [1] - 187:19 EXAMINED [10] -5:5, 5:6, 5:7, 5:8, 5:9, 7:15, 122:10, 149:22, 192:4, 194:20 examining [2] -61:22, 121:3 example [12] - 21:8, 21:25, 71:10, 115:9, 123:11, 123:17, 129:15, 134:21, 135:19, 136:10, 184:5, 184:6 exams [2] - 68:3, 68:15 exceeded [1] - 14:1 excellent [2] - 79:27, 115:17 except [1] - 121:11 exception [5] - 20:5, 20:12, 40:26, 123:14, 123:15 exchanges [1] -159:12 **exclusion** [1] - 64:28 exclusively [2] -74:13, 82:24 EXECUTIVE [1] executive [15] - 7:29, 9:3, 9:22, 15:1, 28:25, 43:2, 48:21, 90:1,

120:16, 152:6, 172:16, 176:6, 176:29, 188:22, 189.23 exists [2] - 174:16, expanded [2] -105:15, 110:18 expect [19] - 25:25, 25:27, 26:11, 26:16, 28:12, 92:25, 125:21, 126:6, 126:13, 126:22, 128:14, 128:16, 128:20, 129:13, 130:4, 130:5, 133:17, 134:4, 137:7 expectation [2] -99:5, 139:20 expected [5] - 20:26, 26:3, 26:6, 80:29, 165:18 expecting [2] -26:23, 62:23 expediently [1] -118:5 expedite [1] - 58:11 expedited [3] -18:12, 18:18, 106:27 expediting [2] -119:17, 196:22 Expenditure [1] -50:12 experience [5] -70:27, 115:7, 130:13, 145:15, 165:17 experiencing [1] -133:7 expert [1] - 137:28 explain [6] - 20:4, 46:22, 57:14, 144:2, 149:5, 180:15 explained [3] -79:17, 120:1, 183:28 explaining [3] -102:29, 143:16, 156:10 explanation [2] -33:13. 98:10 explanations [1] -163:4 explicating [1] -176:13 explicit [1] - 81:9 **explicitly** [3] - 19:7, 19:14, 177:26 exploration [2] -47:17, 144:29 **explore** [1] - 22:8 explored [1] - 174:29 express [4] - 30:29,

32:13, 80:12, 105:14 expressed[4] -91:19, 169:7, 170:12, 172:4 expresses [1] -34:20 expressing [1] -170:11 expression[1] -174:5 expressly [1] -195:17 extend [2] - 95:7, 171:5 extended [2] - 85:16, 174:20 extending [1] - 174:2 extensive [3] -95:26, 102:5, 145:15 extensively [1] -140:14 extent [5] - 41:26, 83:3, 149:1, 179:7, 192:9 external [1] - 148:18 extraordinarily [1] -90:15 extremely [3] -115:17, 141:26, 165:10

## F

face [5] - 15:22, 130:18, 133:29, 143:20 face-to-face [1] -133:29 facilitate [3] - 41:8, 81:1, 102:21 facilitating [1] -200.29 facility [3] - 57:17, 174:28, 180:26 fact [31] - 27:27, 32:15, 33:19, 36:28, 44:2, 52:7, 54:26, 69:9, 80:16, 98:2, 98:15, 106:1, 110:14, 118:7, 126:24, 128:9, 131:10, 132:19, 135:1. 155:22. 156:13, 168:16, 174:2, 174:7, 179:8, 186:4, 186:12, 186:14, 186:20, 193:1, 193:6 fact-finding [3] -106:1, 110:14, 186:20

factor [3] - 37:12, 37:15, 37:16 factors [1] - 69:24 facts [2] - 131:3, 171:2 factual [3] - 152:9, 170:24, 198:15 failed [1] - 151:12 failure [10] - 44:24, 76:13, 77:3, 77:21, 81:20, 130:26, 142:8, 142:12, 142:16, 142:17 **fair** [16] - 30:27, 30:28, 88:20, 106:22, 111:1, 118:2, 118:4, 122:28, 123:5, 123:26, 127:8, 135:4, 137:23, 148:20, 174:17, 180:9 fairly [2] - 19:29, 79:3 fairness [3] - 37:10, 84:8, 119:15 faith [3] - 102:19, 146:6, 156:9 fall [5] - 68:11, 88:22, 110:21, 176:15, 177:23 familial [1] - 54:26 familiar [15] - 9:10, 26:29, 37:17, 44:11, 122:17, 131:7, 133:2, 133:8, 136:13, 136:14, 137:25, 160:10, 160:17, 162:26, 168:2 fanning [2] - 119:7, 173:8 Fanning [69] - 57:8, 58:10, 58:20, 58:29, 59:28, 61:2, 61:12, 63:12, 66:13, 68:2, 68:10, 69:16, 71:20, 72:5, 74:2, 74:14, 85:25, 86:19, 88:7, 88:12, 88:14, 88:26, 89:5, 89:10, 89:12, 89:20, 105:13, 106:18, 107:14, 107:25, 108:4, 108:13, 117:28, 118:3, 119:19, 140:9, 140:21, 140:25, 141:3, 145:4, 147:29, 162:3, 163:1, 167:25, 167:27, 168:6,

168:27, 169:12,

171:3, 172:3, 172:10,

173:9, 174:13, 175:4,

178:27, 179:15, 182:5, 182:16, 183:3, 183:12, 184:7, 184:15, 187:28, 191:20, 192:18, 193:11, 193:15 **FANNING** [1] - 2:21 Fanning's [13] -6:28, 62:4, 70:26, 168:15, 173:3, 173:25, 177:7, 179:4, 181:20, 184:29, 192:8, 192:25, 196:9 far [10] - 34:8, 43:21, 84:19, 135:10, 135:12. 157:18. 157:19, 157:20, 160:16, 175:3 **FARRELL** [1] - 4:5 fashion [3] - 15:12, 80:29, 139:12 faster [1] - 146:18 fault [7] - 44:15, 79:23, 95:11, 95:12, 106:29, 118:17, 172:3 favour [3] - 24:10, 81:23, 178:18 favoured [1] - 102:13 feasible [1] - 41:11 feature [1] - 95:9 February [4] - 10:27, 13:16, 117:24, 163:2 **FEBRUARY** [2] - 1:5, **FELIX** [1] - 4:15 fell [2] - 174:25, 190:17 felt [7] - 87:7, 98:11, 112:6, 115:2, 115:15, 115:19, 177:29 FERGAL [1] - 2:27 FERRY [1] - 2:16 few [8] - 33:27, 101:8, 121:23, 121:24, 139:3, 139:8, 160:1, 194:17 file [15] - 52:18, 61:22, 86:7, 89:4, 89:9, 99:6, 112:24, 113:17, 124:2, 126:7, 126:16, 186:3, 187:15, 188:16, 199:20 files [2] - 27:18, 188:3 filled [1] - 48:12

final [3] - 31:16,

finalise [1] - 118:29

39:7, 114:22

176:22, 177:4,

finalised [2] -118:13, 163:17 finally [2] - 100:14, 183.8 financial [3] - 24:14, 24:20, 67:25 fine [8] - 32:20, 120:3, 122:1, 141:11, 157:18, 191:16, 191:17 finish [3] - 6:21, 174:23, 189:7 finished [1] - 201:5 **FINN** [1] - 3:5 Finn [18] - 90:22, 93:25. 106:13. 108:14, 108:25, 109:26, 112:26, 113:25, 115:20, 116:7, 117:22, 118:4, 142:20, 143:13, 159:14, 175:1, 187:19, 196:20 Finn's [3] - 111:4, 112:7, 117:16 Fintan [5] - 74:2, 147:29, 171:3, 184:23, 193:11 **FINTAN**[1] - 2:21 fire [2] - 95:20, 148:9 firm [5] - 65:26, 168:28, 173:3, 173:4, 191:6 first [44] - 7:29, 13:17, 13:20, 21:12, 22:14, 22:19, 23:15, 25:20, 30:12, 43:23, 58:28, 61:15, 64:15, 66:21, 67:24, 69:2, 69:15, 82:5, 83:21, 84:9, 88:5, 91:22, 101:20, 103:12, 108:5, 111:4, 115:27, 128:4, 138:20, 144:29, 152:21, 158:5, 159:15, 159:16, 163:5, 163:6, 169:1, 181:24, 186:9, 186:25, 187:11, 191:9, 193:10, 196:24 firstly [3] - 76:13, 77:13, 100:1 fit [6] - 18:20, 18:23, 24:15, 74:21, 94:3, 115:17 FITZWILLIAM [1] five [7] - 40:2, 60:21, 60:27, 62:15, 63:4, 63:5, 155:7

five-page [5] - 60:21, 60:27, 62:15, 63:4, 63:5 fixed [2] - 18:18, 20.3 flag [2] - 24:22, 26:7 flat [1] - 191:1 Flex [1] - 8:11 flow [1] - 139:13 flowing [1] - 142:3 flu [5] - 76:7, 76:8, 76:26, 77:13, 78:3 flu/viral [1] - 32:2 **FLYNN** [1] - 3:19 focus [3] - 20:17, 95:19, 146:26 focused [1] - 51:21 folks [1] - 16:2 follow [3] - 7:6, 26:17, 72:4 followed [1] - 92:28 FOLLOWING [1] following [14] - 1:25, 8:6, 14:4, 15:19, 56:26, 61:17, 64:27, 90:7, 107:14, 108:4, 108:19, 111:3, 153:4, follows [5] - 91:10, 92:20, 102:9, 108:5, 111:20 FOLLOWS [8] - 6:1, 7:15, 101:17, 122:6, 122:11, 149:23, 192:5, 194:21 foot [12] - 28:18, 45:10, 55:18, 62:27, 85:11, 88:4, 101:26, 109:28, 110:1, 116:8, 120:19, 196:4 footnotes [1] - 66:2 **FOR** [12] - 1:7, 2:6, 2:10, 2:15, 2:20, 2:27, 3:2, 4:1, 4:4, 4:10, 4:14, 101:16 force [3] - 7:26, 10:13, 17:8 forced [1] - 78:1 foregoing [1] -154:15 foreshorten [1] -147:5 forest [1] - 158:13 **forgive** [1] - 143:18 form [13] - 18:24, 19:16, 19:17, 19:29, 25:2. 44:1. 47:24. 48:11, 86:16, 99:5, 104:2, 115:17

formal [7] - 28:22, frustration [1] -37:27, 49:19, 51:10, 142:3 52:12, 80:14, 80:17 **FUE** [1] - 8:8 formalise [2] - 66:19, fulfilled [1] - 29:11 108:15 full [30] - 16:12, 30:2, 32:26, 36:8, 39:9, formally [5] - 9:15, 50:27, 52:25, 97:21, 40:20, 48:13, 48:20, 49:8, 49:23, 49:26, format [2] - 110:19, 50:4, 52:17, 62:26, 66:27, 70:4, 70:20, formed [2] - 170:28, 73:14, 77:6, 77:17, 180:26 77:20, 95:13, 115:24, FORMER [2] - 1:13, 131:17, 154:16, 156:2, 157:25, 179:23, 180:7 forming [1] - 157:13 Full [1] - 8:11 forms [1] - 79:29 full-time [1] - 95:13 forth [2] - 15:21, fully [4] - 23:25, 60:16, 161:11, 180:26 forthcoming [1] function [4] - 10:18, 150:19 54:16, 79:15, 103:4 forths [1] - 159:21 forward [14] - 7:10, functioning [2] -130:17, 131:4 24:24, 27:17, 28:5, **functions** [1] - 9:28 40:7, 82:27, 89:2, fundamental [1] -99:28, 137:17, 44:3 147.21 148.9 148:12, 169:22, fundamentally [1] -184:17 178:13 forwarded [7] funded [1] - 41:26 20:21, 153:15, 170:6, funding [1] - 42:6 170:21, 170:22, furnish [2] - 77:11, 187:24, 189:27 77:18 forwarding [1] furnished [4] -127:9, 130:20, foster [1] - 41:9 132:14, 132:25 furtively [1] - 81:18 four [1] - 89:21 fourth [7] - 34:3, future [4] - 29:19, 34:13, 34:14, 34:15, 89:29, 94:5, 141:18 38:5, 83:23 fragmentation [2] -G 111:6, 111:7 framework [4] -

gain [1] - 181:4

Gallagher [2] -

gaps [2] - 118:16,

GARDA [10] - 2:10,

2:27, 2:27, 2:28, 3:2,

garda [8] - 10:1,

13:11, 19:4, 33:29,

45:26, 46:3, 75:27,

Garda [313] - 6:22,

6:26, 7:24, 8:1, 10:5,

10:13, 10:22, 11:2,

11:4, 12:17, 12:18,

12:19, 12:20, 13:1,

3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 3:21,

104:22. 104:24

125:9

77:29

161:9

136:9

2:3

100:2

120:6

71:10, 91:1, 91:3,

France [1] - 8:26

frank [1] - 131:17

FRANKFORT [1] -

frankly [4] - 19:25,

Freedom [1] - 78:12

FREEMAN [1] - 2:22

frequent [6] - 15:11,

128:27, 146:24, 151:3

friend [1] - 165:10

front [2] - 14:13,

111:16

37:16, 107:9, 109:6

free [3] - 14:10,

87:23, 103:19

127:26, 128:7,

106:26

13:2, 13:4, 13:8, 13:20, 13:24, 15:2, 15:9, 15:20, 17:4, 18:10, 18:28, 20:16, 22:16, 23:6, 24:10, 24:14, 24:25, 24:28, 25:6, 28:1, 29:1, 29:4, 29:19, 29:22, 29:27, 30:1, 31:13, 31:19, 31:23, 32:1, 32:5, 32:10, 32:12, 33:29, 34:8, 35:24, 35:25, 36:8, 36:10, 36:16, 36:23, 37:9, 38:22, 39:11, 39:16, 40:3, 40:7, 42:24, 43:7, 43:17, 43:25, 43:27, 45:1, 46:5, 46:22, 47:23, 49:2, 50:25, 51:21, 51:28, 52:10, 52:12, 52:19, 54:19, 54:20, 55:9, 55:23, 56:16, 56:17, 57:28, 60:12, 61:5, 61:20, 62:26. 63:16. 64:6. 64:15, 64:26, 65:15, 65:22, 65:25, 66:7, 66:8, 66:12, 66:20, 66:29, 67:26, 68:18, 69:27, 70:24, 71:16, 74:6, 75:1, 75:10, 75:23, 76:5, 76:6, 76:28. 77:3. 77:5. 77:12, 77:25, 77:28, 79:11, 79:20, 79:23, 80:12, 80:14, 80:15, 80:16, 81:21, 81:23, 82:7, 83:6, 83:8, 83:9, 83:12, 84:21, 84:25, 86:11, 88:8, 88:15, 89.3 89.17 89.23 89:28, 90:1, 90:29, 91:11, 92:9, 93:2, 93:23, 95:27, 95:28, 96:5, 97:10, 97:12, 97:18, 98:9, 99:1, 99:23, 100:2, 101:7, 101:21, 101:27, 102.7 102.13 102:14, 102:20, 102:25, 103:6, 103:18, 104:11, 106:10, 107:15, 107:16, 107:23, 111:4, 114:21, 115:14, 115:16, 115:22, 115:27, 116:9, 116:22, 120:2, 120:13, 124:2, 124:26, 125:26, 126:29, 127:25,

127:26, 128:5, 128:22, 129:8, 129:9, 129:20, 129:23, 129:26, 130:22, 131:10, 132:27, 133:21, 135:1, 135:15, 135:21, 136:20, 137:1, 143:6, 146:23, 148:16, 148:24, 149:2, 149:15, 150:4, 150:5, 150:12, 151:2, 151:5, 151:11, 152:23, 152:24, 152:27, 153:12, 154:16, 154:19, 154:27, 155:6, 155:8, 155:21, 156:2, 156:5, 156:13, 157:13, 158:15, 160:2, 160:13, 160:15, 161:8, 161:10, 161:11, 161:12, 161:15, 161:18, 161:24, 161:25. 162:19. 162:20, 163:5, 163:9, 163:11, 163:12, 163:13, 163:15, 164:7, 165:2, 165:7, 168:4, 168:11, 168:14, 169:10, 169:13, 169:28, 170:15, 171:18, 171:19, 172:3, 172:25, 173:2, 173:13, 173:15, 174:11, 175:4, 175:8, 175:19, 175:29, 176:19, 176:26, 177:4, 178:16, 180:3, 182.16 184.28 185:3, 185:15, 185:16, 186:5, 187:16, 187:17, 187:29, 188:17, 188:18, 192:10, 193:8, 193:20, 194:1, 194:28, 195:5, 195:13, 195:17, 198:28, 199:1, 199:23, 200:9 Gardaí [1] - 33:28 gardaí [2] - 12:23, 77:7 gathering [1] - 55:28 general [10] - 8:24, 17:22, 26:3, 36:1, 76:21, 79:5, 80:1, 102:5, 133:10, 179:11 generalists [1] -

95:19 generality [1] - 42:5 generally [7] - 10:4, 17:11, 18:1, 20:9, 27:17, 36:13, 139:6 generic [1] - 133:5 gentleman [1] - 56:5 genuinely [1] -106:19 GERAGHTY[1] -2:17 Gerard [4] - 75:6, 102:2, 103:16, 187:29 **GERARD**[1] - 2:11 **GERRY** [1] - 3:11 Gerry [2] - 58:5, 197.24 given [26] - 16:22, 17:12, 21:7, 32:6, 44:7, 48:28, 62:19, 75:16, 75:18, 76:16, 87:5, 97:29, 100:4, 113:15, 118:13, 119:4, 122:24, 123:12, 146:20, 148:1, 172:5, 177:14, 180:20, 193:12, 193:28, 194:27 **GLEESON** [1] - 4:7 good-humouredly 111 - 201:1 good-naturedly [1] -201:1 **GOODE** [1] - 3:22 goodness [2] -178:3, 178:17 gosh [1] - 143:14 Governance [1] -167:13 governance [1] -168:15 grab [1] - 182:3 grade [1] - 18:26 graduation [1] - 8:6 Gralton [2] - 54:23, 54:27 **GRALTON**[1] - 3:14 grant [2] - 48:13, 48:19 granted [2] - 39:19, 155:1 grateful [7] - 77:10, 77:18, 102:25, 104:5, 122:21, 201:3, 201:16 grave [1] - 81:13 great [2] - 149:28, 191:24 greater [2] - 95:10, 170:13 greatest [1] - 64:25

GREENE [1] - 2:27 Grenoble [1] - 8:26 grievance [3] - 10:8, 80:14, 135:16 **GRIFFIN** [1] - 3:26 ground [2] - 33:20, 123:5 grounded [1] - 65:9 grounds [1] - 50:10 group [3] - 8:14, 17:13, 33:3 **GSOC** [2] - 51:25, 195:18 guard [6] - 12:19, 37:20, 40:20, 150:1, 150:5, 156:6 **guards** [4] - 10:5, 11:15, 12:17, 95:20 guess [1] - 163:4 guide [1] - 21:20 guided [2] - 106:16, 195:20 guiding [2] - 98:23, 130:13 GWEN [1] - 1:29 Gwen [1] - 1:24

happy [3] - 122:16,

152:12, 152:14

**HARAN**[1] - 4:5

harassment [79] -

51:11, 52:7, 52:11,

52:28, 56:1, 56:14,

56:17, 61:24, 64:28,

74:23, 77:22, 80:13,

89:18, 89:19, 90:20,

93:20, 95:25, 96:18,

104:6, 105:29, 106:5,

117:6, 121:15, 139:1,

90:26, 93:4, 93:19,

106:17, 108:15,

109:23. 111:22.

144:19, 145:6,

146:29, 158:3,

158:16, 159:2,

161:12, 161:27,

162:5, 164:16,

164:22, 164:28,

169:29, 170:14,

173:21, 174:16,

180:11, 182:6,

168:7, 168:9, 169:16,

174:26, 177:9, 180:4,

182:19, 183:4, 183:6,

66:19, 70:5, 70:16,

70:23, 71:6, 71:8,

10:8, 29:7, 32:6, 51:1,

### Н

183:10, 184:3, half [6] - 67:24, 184:17, 184:25, 93:23, 100:21, 100:26, 101:2, 147:12 185:5, 185:15, 187:19. 195:15. HALIDAY [1] - 2:23 198:15, 198:17, hall [3] - 97:25, 198:19 101:23. 103:9 hard [4] - 14:11, HALL [1] - 4:16 127:12. 143:26. hallway [1] - 133:29 144:25 hampers [1] - 95:5 hardship [1] - 24:21 hand [13] - 14:10, Hassett [5] - 52:16, 30:22, 81:4, 81:12, 54:14, 199:20, 81:15, 89:3, 113:12, 199:24, 200:5 150:13, 155:24, hassett's [2] - 89:14, 184:22, 193:7, 193:8, 161:15 197:18 **HAVING** [1] - 7:14 hand-delivered [3] he/she [1] - 102:18 89:3, 193:7, 193:8 **HEAD**[1] - 3:15 handed [2] - 65:21, 199:24 head [7] - 8:24, 8:25, 29:3, 82:7, 99:2, handrails [1] -145:14, 156:20 174:15 headed [2] - 8:27, **hands** [4] - 82:5, 94:22, 145:13, 155:17 heading [3] - 27:27, handwritten [4] -28:27. 86:23 91:10, 102:7, 113:14, health [11] - 32:3, 116:26 32:14, 76:3, 76:29, hang [2] - 168:9, 182:18 77:15, 78:14, 79:10, 79:13, 80:1, 114:10, haphazard [1] -

155:20

15:12

hear [2] - 6:4, 12:24 heard [3] - 13:24, 104:11, 181:17 hearing [3] - 67:28, 68:4, 184:22 **HEARING** [4] - 6:1, 101:16, 122:5, 201:25 heavily.. [1] - 153:8 heed [1] - 200:17 **HELD** [1] - 1:17 held [7] - 51:19, 59:12, 169:8, 181:21, 183:13, 183:14, 188:3 **help** [1] - 14:7 helpful [3] - 17:3, 127:5, 136:27 helpfully [1] - 187:28 helps [1] - 101:10 hereby [2] - 56:16, 186:20 herself [1] - 28:24 **hi** [1] - 112:20 hide [1] - 97:20 HIGGINS [1] - 4:10 high [2] - 19:27, 84:23 higher [1] - 53:24 highest [1] - 54:1 himself [6] - 40:5, 74:11. 84:21. 141:3. 155:24, 183:22 hindsight [3] - 23:26, 139:17, 141:9 historically [1] - 17:2 hived [1] - 90:27 hmm [3] - 88:6, 92:21, 113:6 hold [3] - 59:7, 81:15, 141:10 holder [1] - 99:22 holds [1] - 125:16 holidays [1] - 80:6 HOLOHAN [1] - 3:26 home [4] - 29:17, 127:1, 176:25, 197:17 honest [3] - 91:27, 130:6. 167:2 honestly [1] - 138:28 honesty [3] - 93:18, 132:29, 140:27 hope [4] - 100:27, 115:21, 164:12,

169:21

hopefully [1] - 116:8

hoping [1] - 122:16

HORAN [1] - 3:25

Hotel [3] - 40:4,

112:4, 113:8

horizons [1] - 33:1

hour [2] - 100:26, 100:27 hour's [1] - 101:2 **hours** [3] **-** 50:1, 50:2. 100:21 **HOUSE** [3] - 2:23, 3:27, 4:11 House [4] - 16:3, 20:8, 27:9, 27:28 house [2] - 26:26, 47:29 **HQ** [6] - 17:17, 24:2, 31:7, 122:16, 122:17, 136:17 HR [16] - 8:14, 8:24, 8:25. 51:5. 66:23. 124:4, 124:7, 125:27, 126:5, 126:21, 131:6, 132:24, 137:11, 138:21, 160:24, 177:17 **HRM** [5] - 64:18, 65:29, 89:4, 95:27, 193:8 HRPD [5] - 15:2, 48:21, 176:29, 188:3 HRPD. executivedirector[1] - 172:11 huge [1] - 99:21 hugely [1] - 21:26 **HUGHES** [2] - 2:29, **HUMAN**[1] - 3:15 **human** [3] - 131:22, 132:8. 133:4 Human [4] - 8:2, 43:2, 82:20, 90:1 humanitarian [1] -50:9 humouredly [1] -201:1 hundred [1] - 120:26 hundreds [1] -123:11 hypothetical [3] -132:3. 135:22. 135:24

## Ī

IBEC [1] - 8:6 ICELAND [1] - 4:11 idea [7] - 13:13, 35:22, 82:28, 83:3, 110:18, 116:19, 174:1 identification [2] -132:10, 134:8 identified [7] - 10:22, 84:21, 128:14,

128:22, 132:16, 139:10, 165:28 identifies [2] - 74:11, 127:18 identify [5] - 23:27, 42:3, 105:1, 128:2, 137:20 identifying [2] -28:24, 126:23 identity [1] - 12:3 illness [3] - 32:2, 73:25, 123:9 illustrate [1] - 176:20 imagine [3] - 109:28, 133:22, 134:9 immediately [2] -13:18, 67:29 impact [1] - 130:16 impart [1] - 120:23 impartial [2] - 66:8, 171:19 impasse [1] - 39:29 impediment [1] -22:18 imperative [1] -106:24 implicated [1] -107:26 implication [1] -178:8 implies [1] - 175:17 implying [1] - 194:27 important [14] -11:22, 26:13, 35:10, 35:20, 43:9, 46:22, 46:23, 74:9, 79:27, 91:2, 115:2, 115:16, 120:22, 174:23 importantly [1] -169:9 imprecise [1] - 34:19 improper [3] - 132:5, 165:15, 196:28 impugned [5] - 91:5, 106:28, 174:11, 197:7, 197:13 impugning [2] -156:16, 156:18 IN [1] - 1:17 inability [1] - 23:21 inappropriate [1] -26:5 inbuilt [1] - 94:9 incident [1] - 65:15 incidents [1] - 39:4 include [3] - 65:24, 65:27, 94:6 included [5] - 9:28, 65:13, 170:5, 193:7, 200:6

including [9] - 20:23, 36:4, 55:15, 66:29, 102:15, 103:17, 167:15, 173:29, 185:3 incomplete [1] -144.9 incorrect [3] -109:12, 199:10, 199.12 incorrectly [3] -76:6, 77:12, 182:21 increase [1] - 7:26 increasing [1] - 8:20 indeed [14] - 79:11, 131:27, 162:18, 167:14, 169:9, 175:13, 181:15, 183:1, 183:15, 190:28, 191:5, 193:3, 201:15, 201:17 independent [4] -11:24, 44:9, 134:23, 181:14 independently [2] -71:12, 156:5 index [2] - 29:7, 32:7 INDEX [1] - 5:1 indicated [7] - 15:14, 38:10, 39:4, 51:13, 109:21, 188:29, 189:10 indicates [1] -175:16 indicating [1] - 54:21 indication [1] - 52:6 indiscrete [1] -143.19 individual [8] -79:23, 96:2, 99:7, 122:26, 123:13, 123:14, 126:19, 135:15 individual's [1] -124:11 individuals [1] -123:3 industrial [2] - 8:8, 10:3 industry [2] - 8:9, 145:15 inform [6] - 6:19, 50:25, 50:27, 107:27, 130:23, 176:28 informal [1] - 90:14

information [18] -

39:10, 53:17, 55:29,

56:13, 66:23, 78:20,

98:12, 102:18, 109:3,

120:22, 121:2,

144:10, 152:9,

154:18, 178:2, 189:27, 200:20 Information [1] -78:12 informed [23] -18:19, 18:22, 29:29, 32:4, 41:14, 49:11, 50:25, 52:15, 54:18, 66:21, 85:18, 88:9, 88:21, 89:28, 97:24, 108:18, 118:28, 125:24, 128:24, 138:6, 169:10, 189:22, 200:1 informs [1] - 89:26 initial [6] - 19:12, 75:27, 140:24, 158:14, 189:11, 197:23 initials [1] - 175:27 initiate [3] - 55:23, 76:13, 77:4 initiated [1] - 93:5 injured [1] - 150:1 injuries [1] - 164:27 injury [21] - 17:3, 17:8, 21:10, 32:16, 32:21, 32:24, 33:2, 33:5, 36:17, 43:14, 46:6, 114:24, 114:25, 114:27, 116:2, 123:29, 124:15, 137:2, 138:6, 164:6, 165.7 input [1] - 50:17 inputs [1] - 177:18 inquiries [1] - 17:6 inquiry [4] - 87:25, 131:9, 139:21, 180:19 **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:2, 1:8 inserted [1] - 160:29 inside [1] - 81:17 insofar [4] - 117:16, 118:1, 178:2, 178:21 Inspector [16] -63:15, 64:11, 65:7, 66:21, 88:14, 88:29, 89:28, 100:11, 107:15, 107:22, 119:26, 169:25, 176:19, 176:21, 178:26, 193:4 INSPECTOR [7] -3:4, 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:18, 3:22, 4:5 inspector [5] - 39:20, 44:9, 53:25, 155:2, 177:28

instance [8] - 43:23, 58:28, 66:14, 90:12, 118:11, 158:6, 186:9, 191:9 instead [2] - 76:7, 76:25 instructed [5] - 7:2, 63:15, 162:3, 162:18, 177:27 INSTRUCTED [9] -2:11, 2:17, 2:22, 2:29, 3:26, 4:1, 4:8, 4:10, 4:15 instruction [7] -44:7, 56:25, 56:29, 57:20, 189:21, 190:22, 196:9 instructions [4] -43:8, 43:17, 191:6, 191:9 INSTRUMENT[1] -1:7 insufficient [1] -132.5 intelligently [1] -134:29 intended [4] - 19:10, 45:20, 110:28, 110:29 intent [3] - 131:9, 141:23, 187:25 intention [5] - 9:25, 51:10, 51:14, 94:19, 99:12 inter [1] - 14:6 interaction [3] -124:11, 132:9, 133:4 interest [7] - 42:21, 51:9, 66:5, 80:26, 148:18, 167:11, 171:16 interested [1] -130:10 **interfere** [1] - 92:2 interim [4] - 16:6, 29:8, 61:17, 63:17 internal [2] - 10:3, 148:18 Internal [1] - 10:1 internally [1] - 94:16 International [2] -8:12, 8:14 interregnum [1] -68:5 interrupt [3] - 146:8, 165:10, 186:11 interrupted [1] intervene [1] - 152:3 intervention [1] inst [1] - 62:9 99:14

interview [6] - 16:10, 67:9, 67:15, 81:29, 84:9, 97:23 interviewed [1] -68:29 intimated [2] - 29:23, 152:27 intimidation [1] -164:16 **INTO** [1] - 1:2 introduced [1] investigate [17] -39:16, 40:10, 53:15, 53:23, 57:11, 66:18, 77:21, 81:20, 90:3, 127:19, 129:19, 154:27, 155:16, 156:26, 195:3, 195:15, 196:14 investigated [10] -44:28, 52:11, 71:12, 71:23, 86:7, 86:15, 91:5, 94:17, 95:1, 195.7 investigating [4] -59:3, 119:4, 136:4, 161.21 investigation [132] -12:10, 16:13, 20:26, 21:13, 21:15, 22:19, 23:22, 24:2, 30:3, 30:19, 33:11, 33:20, 34:5, 34:18, 36:28, 39:9, 39:12, 39:18, 42:9, 42:20, 42:23, 43:11, 43:19, 44:1, 45:16, 45:17, 45:20, 47:25, 52:17, 52:27, 53:5, 62:29, 65:5, 65:24, 65:28, 66:27, 70:4, 71:6, 71:9, 73:14, 76:14, 76:17, 77:4, 77:16, 81:13, 81:22, 87:17, 90:27, 90:29, 93:4, 93:21, 93:22, 93:24, 94:8, 102:15, 104:7, 105:8, 105:21, 106:1, 106:20, 106:22, 106:27, 107:8, 108:9, 116:8, 116:29, 117:5, 117:13, 117:17, 118:12, 118:29, 119:6, 125:2, 125:5, 125:12, 125:21, 125:23, 125:24, 125:29, 126:8,

126:22, 126:24,

128:4, 128:13,

128:16, 128:23, 129:25, 130:24, 130:25, 130:26, 131:29, 132:25, 133:17, 133:18, 133:19, 135:3, 135:5, 135:6, 135:18, 137:17, 138:20, 145:3, 146:29, 154:7, 154:16, 154:20, 154:29, 155:9, 156:11, 156:22, 170:15, 173:23, 175:1, 177:8, 177:10, 179:23, 180:5, 180:7, 181:13, 181:26, 181:28, 182:7, 182:9, 182:20, 183:6, 184:5, 186:21, 190:23, 196:5, 196:27, 198:17 investigations [12] -29:21, 30:21, 63:18, 95:8, 95:9, 111:29, 117:4, 123:18, 125:18. 152:26. 199:15, 199:27 investigator [9] -89:16, 96:18, 99:17, 111:26, 128:16, 128:18, 134:24, 135:14, 162:11 investigators [13] -12:9, 67:9, 68:16, 80:24, 95:12, 97:23, 98:11, 113:15, 120:13, 140:19, 140:27, 157:3, 201:12 investigators' [1] -121:8 investment [1] - 9:27 invited [1] - 120:29 invocation [1] -80:14 invoke [2] - 91:4, 198:17 invoked [1] - 156:13 invokes [1] - 56:16 involved [3] - 17:17, 37:13, 195:28 involvement [10] -14:7, 22:10, 29:21, 38:25, 66:6, 121:9, 121:10, 152:26, 153:27, 171:17 involving [1] - 41:6 IOJ [1] - 114:25 Ireland [2] - 8:20, 8:29 Irish [1] - 8:6 ironed [1] - 108:22

irons [1] - 95:19 irregularities [1] -67:25 issue [88] - 17:11, 17:20, 20:15, 22:9, 23:18, 23:26, 24:14, 24:21, 29:2, 30:14, 31:21, 31:27, 33:17, 42:9, 44:18, 47:1, 51:1, 51:4, 51:20, 54:23, 55:10, 57:15, 58:7, 58:11, 58:25,  $61{:}24,\, 74{:}23,\, 91{:}26,\,$ 93:2, 94:1, 94:10, 94:27, 97:20, 100:15, 100:16, 104:13, 106:19. 114:18. 114:27, 117:23, 120:11, 125:20, 131:13, 131:15, 131:19, 134:8, 134:21, 135:20, 135:24, 136:27, 138:17, 138:23, 139:7, 139:15, 140:8, 141:19, 149:26, 150:14, 150:25, 152:20, 153:27, 154:6, 154:11, 154:12, 156:15, 157:2, 157:7, 157:28, 157:29, 162:16, 168:11, 168:16, 169:11. 170:13. 171:23, 171:24, 173:22, 177:11, 179:8, 184:23, 184:25, 185:29, 189:25, 194:25, 195:3, 197:29, 198:26 issued [9] - 28:16, 28:18, 55:22, 65:4, 66:10. 67:10. 88:3. 164:7, 171:21 issues [62] - 10:11, 12:3, 12:27, 21:26, 22:17, 25:8, 25:18, 25:22, 26:6, 41:2, 43:4, 47:27, 64:16, 64:25, 65:19, 66:22, 67:22, 72:16, 74:20, 76:3, 77:16, 80:4, 87:2, 89:17, 91:9, 92:19, 93:12, 94:6, 96:11, 98:27, 99:13, 100:1, 102:5, 105:29, 106:6, 106:15, 115:7, 115:8, 115:23, 118:6,

119:5, 121:2, 121:7,

121:9, 127:21,

128:10, 135:8, 139:11, 139:18, 141:21, 144:27, 151:5, 157:15, 164:26, 164:27, 168:29, 169:26, 170:5, 186:5, 187:17, 187:19, 187:28 item [1] - 92:25 items [2] - 92:3, 116:6 itself [7] - 68:26, 75:26, 93:19, 110:3, 130:10, 131:16,

#### J

**JACK** [1] - 3:6 James [2] - 177:17, 177:28 **JAMES**[1] - 2:28 January [19] - 25:10, 58:19, 58:21, 76:21, 93:28. 116:12. 162:23, 162:29, 177:15, 187:9, 187:11, 188:7, 188:13, 188:29, 189:3, 189:9, 189:15. 189:16, 189:19 job [1] - 129:13 jobs [2] - 28:29, 95:12 **JOE** [1] - 3:14 Joe [7] - 90:24, 183:21, 183:22, 184:14, 186:27, 188:8, 190:2 John [12] - 6:16, 7:17, 57:28, 58:13, 62:24, 75:6, 83:2, 93:27, 102:2, 103:15, 186:27, 186:29 john [1] - 187:29 **JOHN** [11] - 2:11, 2:16, 3:8, 4:1, 4:14, 5:3, 7:14, 122:10, 149:22, 192:4, 194:20 joined [7] - 7:24, 8:6, 8:10, 8:15, 8:23, 11:4, 82:6 **joining** [1] - 11:6 Joseph [1] - 189:8 **JUDGE** [1] - 3:12 judgment [3] - 133:3, 182:22 July [10] - 42:10,

68:12, 75:12, 75:19,

160:28, 175:20, 176:1 **jump** [1] - 129:1 juncture [2] - 93:16, 138.14 JUNE [3] - 1:18, 6:1, 201:25 June [35] - 32:6, 33:24, 37:12, 37:23, 37:26, 40:8, 43:26, 47:22, 64:18, 66:23, 67:16, 68:4, 69:3, 69:4, 69:17, 70:3, 73:1, 76:26, 78:6, 88:18, 124:26, 129:17, 150:22, 152:7, 154:4, 155:6, 155:9, 155:23, 172:13, 172:25, 176:28, 179:18, 193:24, 195:6 jurisdiction [1] -174:27 JUSTICE [3] - 1:7, 1:12, 2:2 Justice [2] - 102:1, 190.4 justify [1] - 149:6

75:20, 75:24, 108:29,

# K

Kathleen [3] - 54:14,

**KAVANAGH**[1] - 2:5

Kavanagh [7] - 78:8,

KANE [1] - 2:28

**KATE**[1] - 3:25

199:20, 199:24

100:6, 122:23,

160:27, 164:14, 164:20, 187:12 **KEANE** [1] - 4:6 keen [1] - 69:27 keep [4] - 108:18, 112:24, 184:25, 201:5 keeping [12] - 12:12, 29:13, 59:21, 118:1, 169:21, 169:28, 173:13, 175:4, 176:22, 177:5, 177:21, 178:16 Kelly [1] - 6:24 **KELLY** [2] - 2:10, 3:12 Keogh [225] - 11:2, 12:18, 12:20, 13:1, 13:2, 13:4, 13:20, 13:24, 15:2, 15:9, 15:20, 18:10, 18:29, 20:16, 22:16, 23:7,

24:10, 24:14, 24:25, 24:28, 25:6, 28:2, 29:4, 29:19, 29:22, 29:27, 31:13, 31:19, 31:23, 32:5, 32:10, 33:29, 34:8, 35:25, 36:10, 36:24, 37:9, 38:22, 39:11, 40:3, 40:7, 42:24, 43:25, 43:27, 45:1, 46:22, 47:23, 49:3, 50:25, 51:21, 51:28, 52:19, 54:19, 54:20, 55:9, 56:16, 56:17, 57:29, 60:12, 61:5, 61:20, 62:26, 63:17, 64:7, 64:15, 65:22, 66:7, 66:8, 66:12, 66:20, 68:18, 69:27, 70:24, 74:6, 75:1, 75:10, 75:19, 75:23, 76:5, 77:6, 77:12, 77:29, 79:20, 79:23, 80:15, 81:23, 83:6, 83:8, 83:9. 84:22. 84:25. 86:11, 88:8, 88:15, 89:3, 89:17, 89:23, 89:28, 90:1, 90:29, 91:11, 92:9, 93:2, 93:23, 95:28, 96:5, 97:10, 97:18, 98:9, 99:1, 99:23, 100:2, 101:21. 102:7. 102:25, 103:6, 106:10, 107:16, 107:23, 111:4, 115:14, 115:16, 115:22, 116:9, 116:22, 120:13, 124:27, 125:26, 127:1, 127:26, 128:5, 128:22, 129:23, 129:26, 130:22, 131:11, 132:27, 133:21, 135:1, 135:16, 135:21, 136:20, 143:6, 146:23, 148:24, 149:2, 150:4, 150:5, 150:12, 151:2, 151:5, 151:12, 152:23, 152:24, 152:27, 153:12, 154:19, 155:6, 155:8, 156:2, 156:5, 156:13, 157:13, 158:15, 160:13, 160:15, 161:8, 161:10,

161:13, 161:15,

161:25, 162:20,

163:5, 163:9, 163:11,

168:4, 168:11, 168:14, 169:10, 169:13, 169:28, 170:15, 171:18, 171:20, 172:3, 172:25, 173:2, 173:13, 173:15, 174:11, 175:5, 175:8, 175:29, 176:20, 177:4, 178:16, 180:3, 182:17, 185:3, 186:5, 187:17, 187:29, 188:18, 192:10, 193:8, 193:21, 194:28, 195:5, 195:13, 195:17, 198:20, 198:28, 199:1, 199:8, 199:24, 200:9 **KEOGH**[1] - 2:10 Keogh's [23] - 6:22, 11:4, 29:1, 30:1, 32:1, 39:16, 55:23, 64:26, 66:29, 71:16, 77:25, 80:12, 83:12, 101:7, 120:2, 124:2, 129:20, 137:1, 154:16, 154:27, 161:18, 175:19, 185:15 kept [9] - 54:14, 69:25, 73:15, 88:21, 113.10 113.12 118:1, 169:10, 179:24 **KEVIN** [1] - 3:14 key [4] - 54:15, 92:16, 173:10, 173:19 kick [1] - 173:21 kicked [1] - 28:9 KIERAN [1] - 3:20 Killarney [1] - 10:19 Killeshin [1] - 113:8 kind [8] - 16:19, 17:9. 33:6. 33:20. 58:27, 131:23, 134:2, 142:8 kindly [1] - 77:18 kinds [3] - 21:1, 111:29, 130:1 KIRWAN [1] - 3:13 knowledge [19] -14:8, 50:29, 68:17,

71:22, 80:22, 81:29,

82:16, 83:12, 94:26,

94:29, 95:11, 116:6,

182:29, 187:7, 198:23

117:15, 121:9,

121:10, 138:11,

163:12, 163:14,

163:15, 164:7, 165:2,

#### L

label [3] - 79:18, 80:1, 111:26 labelled [1] - 79:10 labels [1] - 79:10 labour [1] - 8:8 labouring [1] - 179:1 lack [3] - 94:26, 94:29, 147:2 laid [1] - 166:4 land [1] - 23:10 large [4] - 6:11, 20:6, 82:3, 142:9 larger [11] - 70:4, 70:11, 70:28, 107:5, 170:15, 177:9, 180:5, 180:10, 180:13, 181:8, 183:6 last [15] - 25:20, 33:27, 40:29, 43:9, 69:22, 84:11, 84:29, 89:26, 92:15, 100:8, 110:11, 139:22, 154:12, 171:12, 182:2 late [1] - 116:12 latest [1] - 77:1 latter [2] - 76:5, 77:7 latterly [1] - 93:5 law [1] - 8:8 **LAW** [1] - 4:15 **LAWLOR** [1] - 2:29 lay [4] - 43:11, 43:21, 44:4, 130:10 leader [1] - 6:25 leading [2] - 155:19, 155:20 leads [2] - 113:2, 125:20 least [3] - 31:3, 47:26, 140:26 leave [3] - 49:3, 68:14, 72:15 led [3] - 26:26, 67:28, 150:24 left [6] - 14:10, 101:12, 120:24, 148:25, 184:22 left-hand [1] - 14:10 legal [12] - 54:21, 56:4, 84:25, 99:2, 118:8, 118:18, 118:21, 158:10, 159:25. 160:15. 186:2, 189:23

legally [1] - 156:5

**LEITRIM** [1] - 2:13

legislation [2] -

22:12, 153:29

length [4] - 95:8, 149:28, 160:20, 174:22 lengthen [1] - 145:23 lengthy [5] - 93:26, 106:25, 115:18, 127:16, 127:18 lens [1] - 139:28 less [1] - 150:19 lesser [1] - 95:10 letter [133] - 14:17, 15:26, 19:12, 19:25, 26:1, 28:16, 28:18, 31:16, 31:20, 40:7, 40:28, 52:20, 55:3, 55:13, 56:12, 62:6, 63:11, 67:5, 69:15, 71:1, 72:9, 72:25, 73:20, 74:1, 74:4, 74:8, 74:24, 74:28, 75:1, 75:6, 75:19, 75:21, 75:23, 75:26, 76:20, 80:7, 81:6, 83:5, 83:16, 85:22, 91:8, 91:11, 92:20, 96:27, 96:29, 97:4, 97:22, 97:25, 98:2, 101:20, 101:22, 101:28, 102:6, 102:7, 103:5, 103:6, 103:11, 103:14, 103:15, 103:27, 111:5, 111:10, 111:18, 112:6, 113:13, 117:27, 125:4, 125:6, 126:7, 126:16, 126:20, 126:21, 126:28, 129:6, 146:25, 148:4, 148:7, 148:11. 150:21. 150:22, 150:28, 151:10, 151:29, 152:4, 152:5, 152:19, 154:3, 154:10, 155:7, 155:8, 155:12, 155:21, 159:22, 160:24, 161:8, 167:24, 168:27, 169:9, 169:12, 171:13, 176:19, 177:16, 179:10, 179:15, 180:1, 180:2, 186:14, 186:25, 187:4, 187:10, 188:1, 188:8, 188:28, 189:4, 189:8, 190:3, 191:3, 193:3, 193:4, 193:23, 195:4, 195:13, 196:7, 198:5, 198:29, 199:6, 200:2, 200:12, 200:13

40:26, 67:16, 68:9, 72:5, 73:10, 77:25, 78:22, 81:7, 88:19, 91:19, 142:4, 147:13, 190:15, 193:25 letting [1] - 119:18 level [13] - 16:26, 17:19, 17:22, 18:27, 32:26, 62:27, 96:17, 123:5, 136:15, 136:20, 144:16, 196:4, 197:2 levels [1] - 32:26 Lewison [1] - 8:19 liaise [1] - 88:8 **LIAM** [1] - 3:18 life [1] - 142:9 lifetime [1] - 146:15 light [5] - 43:10, 91:28, 97:12, 102:5, 155:19 likely [2] - 34:6, 197:26 limbo [1] - 148:25 Limerick [1] - 200:19 limit [2] - 176:5, 176:7 limited [1] - 111:21 line [13] - 11:26, 34:3, 34:13, 38:5, 57:18, 61:15, 64:26, 89:26, 98:8, 125:27, 126:27, 134:13, 134:15 lines [2] - 33:27, 42:3 link [4] - 17:2, 17:20, 22:16. 45:9 linkage [1] - 23:18 list [8] - 8:11, 25:7, 30:12, 65:20, 96:15, 121:9, 187:17, 193:28 listen [2] - 143:25, 177:5 listening [1] - 6:25 lit [1] - 148:9 literal [1] - 146:21 litigation [1] - 117:5 LITTLE [1] - 3:28 live [2] - 177:7, 177:11 lived [1] - 142:9 local [18] - 17:19, 20:4, 46:3, 123:1, 123:2, 124:4, 124:8, 125:13, 125:14, 127:19, 129:13, 136:7, 137:3, 137:17, 153:4, 157:15, 157:18, 157:19

letters [15] - 21:12,

locally [5] - 20:27, 38:7, 42:25, 127:22, 132:22 lock [1] - 54:15 logic [4] - 37:3, 181:19, 181:25 London [1] - 6:25 longest [1] - 197:16 look [99] - 14:11, 16:4, 18:3, 18:9, 21:12, 23:17, 24:29, 25:10, 25:11, 27:29, 28:6, 28:14, 28:19, 29:11, 31:14, 31:27, 33:25, 35:13, 40:11, 42:10, 46:5, 46:22, 48:3, 48:8, 48:27, 49:25, 50:28, 51:1, 51:28, 52:20, 55:14, 55:28, 56:8, 57:3, 58:21, 60:6, 61:2, 62:6, 63:11, 63:20, 69:15, 71:14, 71:29, 72:8, 72:25, 74:24, 75:13, 75:21, 80:9, 84:7, 86:3, 86:19, 86:22, 87:10, 88:4, 88:27, 89:21, 91:7, 103:29, 107:19, 108:12, 108:24, 110:3, 110:10, 112:14, 117:27, 119:24, 120:5, 120:8, 122:26, 123:1, 123:2, 123:3, 123:7, 123:22, 124:13, 126:18, 127:5, 132:13, 143:18, 146:10, 151:28, 152:19, 153:22, 160:23, 163:28, 165:20, 165:29, 167:23, 169:21, 176:18, 178:9. 179:9. 179:14. 182:1, 182:2, 186:25, 187:8, 195:2 looked [5] - 62:5, 62:21, 63:26, 163:14, 193:2 looking [27] - 18:12, 21:13, 23:22, 26:1, 26:21, 28:5, 33:3, 37:26. 44:21. 58:18. 72:2, 86:20, 101:20, 113:18, 115:17, 122:27, 123:12, 123:23, 139:16, 139:29, 141:6, 144:27, 145:1, 146:27, 186:7, 189:7,

189:23 looks [3] - 25:3, 110:1, 110:9 **loop** [8] - 74:15, 103:1, 168:5, 169:28, 173:2, 173:14, 175:5, 176:22 loose [1] - 116:29 Lordship [1] - 73:15 **LORRAINE** [1] - 3:4 loss 151 - 50:3. 114:13, 114:14, 189:2 lost [4] - 80:25, 80:28, 190:16 **lower** [1] - 53:25 lunch [2] - 100:26, 106:24 LUNCH [1] - 101:16 LYONS [1] - 4:6

## М

MADE [2] - 1:2, 1:7 mail [23] - 33:23. 33:27, 34:11, 35:26, 36:4, 48:27, 50:23, 86:3, 86:18, 86:20, 88:24, 89:25, 107:21, 112:14, 112:17, 172:8, 172:10, 175:3, 175:16, 179:10, 198:6, 198:13, 199:21 mails [4] - 37:25, 50:8, 72:5, 110:26 MAIN [1] - 2:12 main [3] - 161:3, 174:25, 184:1 maintain [1] - 27:18 maintained [2] -95:5, 104:21 maintains [1] - 32:25 maintenance [1] majority [1] - 145:5 Malone [1] - 1:24 MALONE [1] - 1:29 man [1] - 143:1 manage [2] - 19:22, 47:29 managed [5] - 10:17, 82:24, 94:18, 123:19 management [25] -10:4, 10:15, 11:20, 11:29, 20:4, 38:13, 41:7, 46:3, 99:20, 102:14, 102:20, 123:1, 123:22, 124:4, 124:8, 125:13, 125:14, 127:19,

129:13, 137:4, 157:15, 157:19, 168:15 management's [1] -123:3 manager [18] - 8:24, 11:25, 23:5, 42:1, 74:12, 84:20, 88:23, 93:8, 94:13, 94:23, 98:9, 99:24, 134:13, 134:15, 136:19, 141:24, 173:10, 177.23 Manager [1] - 6:11 managers [4] -11:10, 11:13, 12:6, 12:10 managing [1] - 44:3 mandatory [1] -76:18 manifest [1] - 130:9 manner [1] - 161:10

manuscript [1] -75:23 March [39] - 15:20. 38:16, 59:28, 60:12, 61:14, 63:9, 63:28, 64:27, 67:1, 71:25, 72:2, 85:20, 89:3, 93:29, 127:25, 129:23, 132:20, 132:28, 140:12, 142:19, 151:1, 158:22, 159:9, 159:10, 159:18, 159:29, 163:7, 163:9, 163:11, 163:12, 163:13, 163:15, 163:17, 166:8, 168:22, 168:23, 171:5, 185:25 MARGARET[1] -

MARIE [2] - 3:8, 3:17 MARK[1] - 3:3 marked [1] - 78:14 MARRINAN[1] - 2:7 material [11] - 11:7, 22:25, 23:16, 170:21, 178:12, 179:6, 179:13, 192:10, 192:29, 193:6, 194:4 materials [7] - 8:26, 96:10, 98:1, 170:22, 173:4, 173:15, 188:3 **MATT**[1] - 3:19 matter [79] - 6:25, 6:27, 13:2, 16:22, 17:4, 19:16, 19:17, 21:6, 24:8, 33:7,

35:20, 38:9, 39:18, 42:20, 43:8, 43:17, 43:19, 44:17, 50:12, 50:13, 52:17, 52:18, 55:21, 55:27, 56:27, 58:6, 59:8, 60:16, 66:4, 72:17, 73:4, 75:8, 76:5, 84:18, 84:29, 85:16, 86:24, 90:19, 92:6, 94:4, 99:10, 104:4, 109:23, 112:21, 116:17, 117:7, 117:10, 131:2, 133:27, 137:18, 138:18, 141:4, 144:29, 148:12, 148:19, 154:29, 157:11, 159:15, 161:16, 165:23, 167:2, 167:8, 170:14, 170:29, 171:15, 171:25, 172:28, 177:2, 177:6, 177:12, 180:10, 181:18, 183:11. 188:13. 188:27, 190:24, 190:25, 193:12 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:4 matters [78] - 10:2, 10:11, 11:22, 18:16, 29:24, 32:20, 33:3, 34:27, 38:10, 38:12, 40:10, 42:18, 45:10, 53:20. 58:11. 63:17. 65:6, 66:27, 70:18, 73:14, 73:18, 73:23, 74:10, 77:22, 85:9, 86:1, 90:4, 91:5, 92:9, 93:23, 94:13, 94:16, 95:3, 95:6, 96:24, 98:22. 98:25. 99:8. 99:12. 100:15. 102:24, 111:23, 112:8, 119:17, 123:7, 128:25, 130:3, 133:9, 136:24, 138:21, 141:18, 152:29, 154:23, 169:15, 170:9, 171:4, 173:3, 174.25 174.28 176:25, 179:24, 179:27, 180:8, 183:3, 184:2, 186:21, 187:15, 187:21, 188:16, 191:26, 194:1, 195:6, 195:7, 195:12, 196:22 matters" [1] - 108:18 **MATTHIAS**[1] - 2:10 McBRIEN [1] - 2:16

10:26, 11:8, 11:11, 13:15, 65:29, 115:8, 115:11, 141:26 McCARTAN[2] -4:10, 4:11 McCarthy [18] -63:15, 64:11, 65:7, 66:21, 88:14, 88:29, 89:28, 100:12, 107:15, 107:22, 119:26, 169:25, 176:19, 176:21, 177:17, 177:28, 178:26, 193:4 McCOURT[1] - 2:17 McGarry [8] - 2:21, 5:8, 191:19, 191:21, 191:25, 191:26, 192:4, 192:7 McGinn [7] - 70:7, 70:14, 70:22, 71:5, 105:25, 107:1, 174:13 McGRATH[2] - 2:7, mcGuinness [3] -5:9, 167:9, 194:20 McGuinness [136] -2:6, 3:24, 5:5, 5:7, 6:5, 6:6, 6:15, 6:18, 6:27, 7:6, 7:9, 7:15, 7:19, 7:23, 12:29, 13:7, 13:10, 13:12, 13:14, 14:16, 14:18, 14:22, 14:24, 14:27, 15:1, 26:14, 27:14, 27:29, 34:10, 37:8, 40:14, 43:10, 47:13, 57:25, 62:16, 68:25, 71:24, 78:29, 79:28, 80:23, 82:2, 83:1, 83:24, 87:20, 87:24, 97:7, 101:10, 101:19, 106:23, 109:29, 110:12. 113:15. 114:28, 121:18, 127:16, 138:26, 139:1, 140:14, 148:14, 149:12, 149:13, 149:14, 149:16, 149:23, 149:25, 152:3, 152:13, 152:15, 152:18, 152:19, 153:21, 153:22, 155:5, 158:8, 158:29, 159:10, 159:16, 160:1, 163:22, 164:2, 164:4, 164:6, 165:16, 165:25, 165:27,

McCabe [9] - 10:21,

166:2, 166:16, 166:26, 166:27, 167:10, 167:20, 167:23, 171:11, 171:28, 173:7, 175:9, 175:12, 175:13, 175:15, 175:18, 175:23, 175:24, 176:5, 176:9, 176:14, 176:15, 176:17, 179:14, 180:6, 182:1, 183:11, 184:11, 184:12, 185:3, 185:9, 185:13, 185:27, 185:28, 188:10, 188:12, 190:19, 190:28, 191:5, 191:8, 191:11, 194:15, 194:17, 194:23, 195:4, 196:2, 197:23, 198:3. 200:11. 201:22 McGuinness's [3] -175:2, 178:15, 181:6 McLoughlin [89] -11:14, 11:16, 17:16, 18:8, 23:3, 23:20, 31:4, 31:5, 31:22, 31:26, 32:5, 33:9, 33:17, 33:18, 34:17, 35:3, 36:23, 37:29, 39:28, 40:2, 40:5, 40:9, 40:27, 41:28, 42:13, 42:27, 43:21, 43:27, 47:9, 47:21, 48:6, 48:27, 48:29, 49:14, 50:22, 50:24, 51:24, 52:16, 52:24, 52:26, 53:5, 53:27, 54:10, 54:13, 54:18, 55:27, 56:5, 58:18, 61:4, 64:18, 66:23, 69:9, 72:14, 74:11, 78:5, 79:13, 79:17, 85:2, 85:6, 86:1, 86:29, 87:1, 87:10, 93:7, 95:3, 98:3, 98:7, 99:23, 103:7, 112:18, 116:5, 127:10, 129:16, 132:15, 132:17, 136:15, 138:19, 155:5, 155:13, 157:10, 157:21, 161:20, 162:28, 194:27, 195:14, 198:7, 199:23, 200:4, 200:8 MCLOUGHLIN [1] -McLoughlin's [6] -23:11, 35:21, 113:11, 141:19, 141:21,

195:16 McLYNN [1] - 4:2 MCMAHON[1] - 3:8 McMahon [1] -190:23 MCPARTLIN[1] -McPartlin [16] - 88:1, 90:16, 105:18, 106:13, 109:15, 109:21, 112:26, 113:27, 116:12, 186:1, 186:10, 187:5, 188:6, 190:7, 190:21, 200:12 mcTiernan [1] - 7:2 McTIERNAN[1] -4:15 mean [40] - 16:4, 21:18, 22:23, 23:17, 28:1, 30:14, 37:10, 45:5, 45:25, 46:4, 50:6, 69:2, 71:14, 93:2, 101:4, 107:5, 108:6, 110:23, 116:1, 117:3, 118:6, 119:10, 120:26, 128:28, 131:2, 139:24, 142:17, 143:1, 143:20, 145:10, 156:4, 163:19, 165:18, 166:27, 167:4, 175:15, 178:14, 178:15, 185:26, 193:27 meaning [2] -176:14, 178:9 meaningful [1] -45:17 means [1] - 13:28 meant [2] - 48:11, 49.23 meantime [3] - 49:7. 101:4, 102:19 measure [1] - 115:15 mechanics [1] -133.8 mechanism [2] -34:26, 38:11 media [1] - 85:13 mediate [1] - 107:16 mediator [1] - 108:7 Medical [4] - 14:6, 15:10, 19:18, 29:28 MEDICAL [1] - 3:11 medical [10] - 10:2, 15:12, 15:21, 16:16, 17:10, 18:10, 20:6, 22:17, 25:26, 153:15 medically [1] - 26:12

meet [7] - 35:22, 55:9, 66:12, 113:7, 126:9, 155:18, 163:16 meeting [75] - 14:4, 15:19, 32:13, 38:15, 40:1, 40:5, 43:28, 47:21, 50:7, 51:19, 51:20, 72:16, 72:19, 75:8, 85:18, 86:23, 87:8, 88:4, 89:1, 89:25, 90:23, 92:4, 100:8, 105:27, 106:10, 108:19, 110:12, 110:16, 111:4, 112:3, 112:10, 112:21, 114:10, 115:2, 115:29, 116:3, 116:9, 116:23, 128:3, 128:10, 128:11, 128:26, 128:29, 129:22, 132:19, 132:27, 133:29, 146:17, 147:20, 147:24, 148:3, 153:7, 155:23, 163:15, 163:16, 174:9, 176:24, 177:26, 181:6, 182:11, 183:7, 183:16, 183:19, 183:23, 184:14, 184:15, 184:18, 184:19, 184:21, 184:22, 192:16, 193:5. 198:4 meetings [8] - 35:19, 82:3, 82:13, 117:24, 136:9, 158:9, 159:24, 160:12 meets [1] - 159:8 MEMBER [1] - 2:2 member [18] - 15:14, 16:10, 18:20, 20:27, 22:9, 29:16, 30:16, 32:26. 38:9. 38:24. 48:20, 49:8, 49:12, 101:27, 153:3, 153:16, 153:26, 186:22 member's [15] -16:11, 22:8, 30:4, 38:8, 38:27, 41:3, 41:4, 41:7, 101:28, 127:22, 128:7, 128:27, 146:24, 151:3, 153:5

members [4] - 6:19,

34:22, 52:29, 176:26

memory [1] - 110:17

memorable[1] -

111:23

mental [10] - 32:2, 32:14, 76:3, 76:29, 77:15, 78:14, 79:10, 79:13, 80:1, 155:20 mention [2] - 22:14, mentioned [2] - 79:2, 167:16 menus [2] - 79:4, 79:16 merely [1] - 106:12 mergers [1] - 8:28 merit [3] - 65:23, 169:15, 170:9 mess [1] - 143:15 message [3] -100:27, 120:27, 173:19 met [30] - 10:29, 13:8, 13:9, 13:13, 13:15, 13:20, 13:21, 21:28, 32:5, 32:8, 35:24, 36:23, 43:27, 48:5, 49:14, 68:2, 70:10, 78:5, 82:2, 83:9, 83:10, 99:23, 120:13, 120:16, 124:24, 127:25, 128:5, 151:1, 155:6, 163:5 Michael [3] - 32:12, 187:18  $\textbf{MICHAEL}\, [4] - 3{:}4,$ 3:5. 3:10. 3:19 Mick [2] - 112:22, 113:25 micromanage [2] -160:11, 163:19 middle [10] - 15:6, 38:19, 39:2, 57:10, 60:7, 78:28, 112:17, 139:23, 140:2, 161:5 might [32] - 26:13, 31:1, 77:11, 77:18, 87:25, 87:28, 94:6, 100:21, 102:27, 106:8, 106:29, 109:12, 124:2, 127:4, 127:12, 131:24, 133:12, 133:17, 134:4, 137:21, 150:22, 151:28, 152:3, 160:27, 163:28, 164:8, 165:19, 167:11, 172:13, 174:5, 197:3 mightn't [2] - 47:17, 71:28 Millipore [1] - 8:23 mind [8] - 106:7,

109:29, 166:12, 176:1, 180:15, 180:16, 180:17 mindful [4] - 48:1, 119:5, 174:2, 174:7 minds [1] - 145:25 mindset [2] - 35:6, 115:29 mine [2] - 107:4, 188:26 minimising [1] -131:24 minimum [4] - 34:21, 69:25, 73:16, 179:25 Minister [6] - 31:13, 31:21, 40:8, 56:10, 83:21, 102:1 MINISTER [1] - 1:7 MINNOCK [1] - 3:9 minor [1] - 57:15 minute [3] - 61:14, 106:9, 122:14 minutes [11] - 87:9, 101:8, 101:12, 113:10, 113:11, 114:11, 121:23. 121:24, 121:25, 147:23, 184:20 mirror [2] - 164:23, 166:10 misapprehension [1] - 179:1 misclassification [2] - 29:2. 31:27 misinterpretation [1] - 195:12 misrepresentation [1] - 76:12 missed [1] - 140:24 missing [1] - 47:27 mission [1] - 110:14 mistake [2] - 178:5, 178:7 mistaken [1] - 40:8 model [6] - 70:7, 70:12, 70:15, 70:22, 174.14 182.8 moment [5] - 46:27, 123:12, 127:15, 143:27, 159:6 MONDAY [2] - 1:18, MONICA [1] - 3:15 Monica [3] - 26:26, 27:26, 28:24 monitoring [1] -117:18 month [4] - 71:4, 84:2, 90:17

monthly [1] - 95:15

months [7] - 37:6, 64:19, 81:12, 87:7, 93:29, 138:15, 148:26 **moot** [1] - 155:22 moral [1] - 166:5 morning [6] - 6:4, 7:12, 7:21, 7:23, 112:29, 121:12 MORONEY [1] - 3:18 most [5] - 65:22, 102:25, 138:1, 144:14, 201:16 motives [2] - 156:19, 156:20 move [10] - 139:14, 146:5, 147:18, 147:21, 148:9, 157:28, 167:20, 175:18, 183:3, 184:17 moved [3] - 8:26, 146:1, 148:12 movements [1] -185:20 moving [4] - 112:23, 115:20, 139:9, 141:16 MR [116] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:10, 2:16, 2:16, 2:21, 2:21, 2:22, 2:28, 2:28, 2:29, 3:13, 3:14, 3:16, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 3:24, 4:1, 4:1, 4:6, 4:10, 4:10, 4:14, 4:14, 4:15, 5:3, 5:5, 5:7, 5:8, 5:9, 6:6, 6:15, 6:18, 7:6, 7:9, 7:14, 7:15, 7:19, 12:29, 13:7, 13:10, 13:12, 13:14, 14:16, 14:18, 14:24, 14:27, 15:1, 27:14, 27:29, 47:13, 87:20, 87:24, 101:10, 101:19, 121:25, 121:29, 122:10, 149:14, 149:16, 149:22, 149:25, 152:3, 152:15, 152:18, 152:19, 153:21, 153:22, 160:1, 164:2, 164:4, 164:6, 165:25, 166:26, 167:10, 167:20, 167:23, 171:11, 175:13, 175:18, 175:24, 176:9, 176:17, 179:14, 182:1, 184:12, 185:3, 185:9, 185:13, 185:28, 188:10, 188:12, 190:19, 190:28,

191:5, 191:8, 191:11, 191:21, 191:26, 192:4, 192:7, 194:13, 194:17, 194:20, 194:23, 198:3, 201:22 **MS** [21] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:29, 2:30, 3:25, 3:25, 3:26, 3:26, 4:1, 4:7, 4:7, 5:6, 122:10, 122:13, 142:23, 142:25, 147:17, 147:19, 148:22, 165:9, 167:8 MULCAHY [1] - 3:5 mulligan [1] - 49:15 MULLIGAN [12] -2:11, 3:13, 5:6, 122:10, 122:13, 142:23, 142:25, 147:17, 147:19, 148:22, 165:9, 167:8 Mulligan [44] - 11:13, 11:16, 15:27, 16:5, 18:14, 21:11, 21:28, 48:5, 49:25, 50:6, 50:12, 50:17, 50:18, 52:17, 55:7, 56:6, 59:8, 64:10, 68:2, 70:10, 72:23, 73:22, 85:2, 89:11, 121:24, 122:8, 125:8, 140:26, 143:2, 143:28, 147:16, 150:18, 150:21, 150:28, 151:11, 157:1, 160:25, 161:5, 163:20, 166:15, 167:7, 193:12, 194:5, 194:23 Mulligan's [7] -16:20, 17:29, 19:12, 27:26, 142:18, 144:28, 146:19 Mullingar [2] - 112:4, 115:12 multinational [2] -8:12, 8:16 multiplicity [2] -117:3, 117:8 MURPHY [2] - 2:30, Murray [30] - 14:5, 15:4. 15:9. 22:3. 24:26. 29:13. 38:18. 54:27, 81:2, 81:16, 81:24, 81:28, 82:1, 82:3, 82:6, 96:6, 114:15, 127:25, 128:5, 128:9, 128:11, 128:22, 129:22,

130:21, 151:1, 151:4, 151:12, 151:17, 156:15

MURRAY[2] - 3:3, 3:9

Murray's [3] - 15:19, 38:15, 128:17

must [8] - 9:10, 53:24, 119:4, 129:14, 146:12, 161:8, 187:6, 198:18

mystery [1] - 191:2

MÍCHEÁL [1] - 3:23

#### Ν

name [3] - 18:27, 40:12, 186:10 named [5] - 1:26, 19:23, 96:5, 96:15, 107:26 namely [1] - 165:6 names [1] - 96:15 naming [1] - 95:29 naturally [1] - 115:25 nature [15] - 20:6, 33:1, 45:15, 45:19, 46:12, 55:3, 59:15, 111:25, 111:29, 130:7, 134:5, 145:3, 147:4, 166:1, 180:19 naturedly [1] - 201:1 Navan [6] - 16:3. 27:9, 43:4, 51:5, 124:5, 125:1 **nd** [1] - 63:28 nearest [1] - 79:8 nearly [1] - 121:27 necessarily [5] -21:18, 24:17, 129:4, 133:27, 135:3 necessary [5] -21:15, 38:19, 142:7, 177:18, 189:27 need [22] - 13:3, 15:18, 22:3, 35:16, 57:3, 68:22, 74:5, 82:19, 87:17, 99:14, 101:8, 106:8, 112:21, 112:25, 112:29, 121:23, 121:24, 125:2. 125:5. 139:14. 172:6, 175:26 needed [12] - 63:6, 70:22, 84:22, 84:25, 87:7, 100:29, 105:15, 106:15, 148:19,

156:23, 174:9, 196:24

needing [1] - 95:4

needn't [3] - 18:9, 49:25, 64:22 needs [5] - 36:7, 147:11, 161:17, 170:14, 177:8 negative [1] - 41:4 negotiator [1] - 8:9 net [1] - 190:6 nether [1] - 23:10 neutral [3] - 105:13, 110:18, 174:1 never [17] - 54:16, 140:21, 140:22, 146:16, 166:10, 183:6, 185:14, 187:4, 189:4, 189:29, 190:1. 190:7, 190:13, 191:2, 191:8, 195:22, 200:13 new [2] - 26:14, 128:21 newly [1] - 151:21 news [3] - 176:3, 189:6, 190:5 next [23] - 16:4, 18:5, 34:12, 38:17, 51:28, 53:21, 57:7, 58:23, 61:26, 65:17, 72:25, 92:5, 92:7, 114:16, 118:25, 119:27, 120:8, 121:22, 149:11, 157:28, 164:19, 169:17, 180:24 nice [2] - 6:8, 6:9 Nicholas [6] - 15:2, 57:28, 77:29, 188:18, 198:20, 199:8 NICHOLAS [2] -2:10, 4:5 Nick [1] - 89:3 **NOBEL** [1] - 4:15 nobody [3] - 7:7, 47:4, 181:2 **NOEL** [1] - 4:10 **NOLAN** [1] - 3:6 nominate [3] - 57:17, 183:9, 198:18 nominated [3] - 57:4, 58:12, 66:17 nominating [2] -57:10. 108:13 nomination [3] -58:28, 108:19, 185:9 non [6] - 56:20,

94:28, 107:6, 119:2,

non-conflicted [1] -

non-cooperation [1]

131.15

- 119:2

non-disclosure [1] -94:28 non-policy [1] -107:6 non-procedural [1] -107:6 nonwhistleblowers [1] -131:15 none [7] - 82:12, 102:19, 130:26, 131:1, 132:15, 132:18, 189:20 Noonan [1] - 104:25 NOREEN [1] - 2:16 normal [13] - 16:22, 18:23, 27:24, 28:12, 28:14, 41:15, 45:22, 47:5, 50:4, 82:27, 129:7, 130:10, 131:22 normally [8] - 16:17, 27:25, 32:29, 33:21, 46:1, 47:8, 88:22, 177:23 **NORTHUMBERLAN D**[1] - 2:18 notation [1] - 89:13 note [12] - 37:10, 48:3, 48:8, 56:16,

**noted** [5] - 23:15, 62:10, 62:17, 153:3, 189:17 notes [6] - 1:26, 34:1, 34:2, 104:18, 104:19, 104:20 nothing [9] - 63:6, 92:2, 97:19, 136:21, 143:21, 149:7, 181:28, 190:27, 191:4 notice [5] - 77:14, 97:17, 97:21, 102:15, 107:13 notified [1] - 100:23 **notion** [1] - 91:18 notwithstanding [1] - 67:6 novel [1] - 174:20 November [21] -52:18, 52:20, 54:19, 56:13, 90:19, 106:9, 142:21, 142:23, 142:24, 158:18, 158:21, 159:4, 159:14, 159:17, 160:26. 160:29. 166:8, 169:8, 174:9,

60:7, 66:20, 105:15,

110:16, 113:12,

113:18, 184:21,

188:27

182:29, 185:10 nuance [1] - 170:1 Nugent [13] - 13:8, 13:13, 35:24, 36:3, 90:24, 104:27, 104:28, 146:2, 183:21, 184:14, 186:27, 188:8, 189:8 **NUGENT** [2] - 3:14, Nugent's [2] - 190:2, 200:11 **number** [43] - 9:9, 20:5, 36:26, 38:22, 50:6, 55:15, 55:16, 67:9, 73:23, 80:8, 83:18, 84:16, 86:14, 87:6, 91:9, 91:13, 93:11, 99:27, 110:25, 113:23, 126:13, 128:10, 134:19, 148:27, 148:28, 150:27, 153:5, 158:17, 158:24, 159:11, 159:12, 159:19, 164:1, 165:28, 166:19, 167:21, 167:24, 168:19, 169:26, 171:12, 174:12, 175:7, 192:22 numbering [1] -158:25 numbers [3] - 27:19, 123:13, 123:24 NYLAND[1] - 3:19 **NÍ**[1] - 2:30 **NÓIRÍN** [1] - 3:7

# 0

O'BRIEN [3] - 2:10,
121:25, 121:29
O'Brien [2] - 90:9,
121:22
O'CONNOR [1] 2:21
O'HIGGINS [1] - 3:23
O'MARA [1] - 2:17
O'NEILL [1] - 4:1
O'REARDON [1] 3:17
O'ROURKE [1] - 4:7
O'Sullivan [3] - 9:13,
56:10, 85:15
O'SULLIVAN [1] 3:7
object [1] - 165:13
objected [3] - 108:5,

108:6 objecting [1] - 108:2 objection [4] - 7:7, 107:23, 108:11, 165.14 obligation [5] -25:26, 88:20, 98:11, 141:27, 155:16 obligations [1] - 52:9 obliged [2] - 49:11, 201:6 obscured [1] - 178:1 observation [1] -79:27 obviate [1] - 181:16 obvious [1] - 46:14 obviously [37] - 9:9, 9:11, 12:11, 16:23, 19:10, 20:18, 21:11, 23:12, 24:12, 26:8, 37:21, 40:18, 44:22, 47:13, 48:17, 51:19, 56:26, 72:19, 87:23, 97:4, 103:26, 107:11, 108:5, 110:23, 112:3, 114:23, 116:26, 126:4, 126:26, 135:10, 137:20, 183:5, 195:28, 198:5, 198:29, 199:6, 199:26 occasion [4] - 30:12, 151:13, 162:25, 163:5 occasions [3] -73:24, 86:14, 119:8 occupied [1] occur [1] - 133:5 occurred [8] - 44:16, 45:2, 45:10, 67:29, 117:17, 118:17, 124:16, 158:2 occurring [1] - 15:11 October [63] - 9:6, 10:21, 13:19, 50:23, 63:10, 67:7, 68:19, 70:14, 71:2, 71:4, 83:14, 85:1, 85:5, 85:17, 85:18, 85:19, 86:23, 88:24, 89:21, 89:24, 90:24, 91:7, 91:29, 92:27, 97:2, 100:19, 101:21, 103:15, 103:29, 104:16, 107:14, 119:20, 119:22, 120:5, 120:18, 120:19, 140:10, 141:4, 146:3, 148:15, 157:25, 171:9, 174:21, 177:26,

179:5, 181:7, 182:12, 182:23, 183:8, 184:13, 184:16, 186:4, 186:17, 189:21, 192:12, 192:13, 192:15, 193:5, 193:6, 193:21, 198:4, 199:2 odd [1] - 194:2 **OF** [14] - 1:2, 1:8, 1:12, 1:13, 2:3, 3:2, 3:15, 121:20, 149:9, 191:13, 194:8, 200:26 offer [1] - 55:8 offered [1] - 161:14 Office [1] - 6:11 OFFICE [1] - 3:27 office [74] - 9:29, 10:1, 15:23, 25:14, 25:28, 27:1, 27:17, 27:21, 41:6, 42:19, 42:21, 46:2, 54:12, 59:7, 59:20, 60:10, 63:9, 63:23, 67:4, 67:11, 68:7, 74:28, 78:17, 80:4, 80:7, 82:20, 84:3, 85:15, 92:15, 97:21, 97:24, 98:18, 99:1, 99:2, 99:3, 99:20, 99:22, 100:8, 100:14, 102:24, 104:26, 108:20, 112:22, 114:18, 141:19, 141:21, 152:6, 153:19, 154:10, 155:17, 156:10, 156:20, 157:20, 157:21, 160:26, 167:28, 168:8, 172:20, 173:5, 176:27, 177:5, 177:21, 177:26, 178:22, 178:24, 178:25, 179:16, 181:7, 187:23, 188:26, 192:16, 193:29, 194:3, 201:14 Officer [5] - 14:6, 15:10, 19:19, 29:28, 186:28 **OFFICER** [2] - 3:11, 3:14 officer [20] - 13:9, 15:12, 22:7, 32:10, 37:2, 39:29, 43:12,

53:2, 53:6, 54:6,

102:16, 119:5,

135:26, 136:4,

54:22, 56:20, 102:12,

144:15, 153:4, 161:21 officers [1] - 10:2 official [4] - 13:21, 76:25, 77:1, 120:14 **Oghuvbu** [7] - 19:8, 25:5, 27:1, 42:4, 137:27, 138:3, 138:12 **OGHUVBU** [1] - 3:11 old [1] - 23:7 **OLIVIA** [2] - 3:12, 4:1 omission [2] - 44:15, 79.23 **ON** [6] - 1:5, 1:9, 1:18, 2:13, 6:1 once [7] - 13:21, 83:9, 120:14, 124:29, 137:10, 154:6, 169:18 one [79] - 8:15, 13:1, 13:3, 13:4, 14:29, 21:5, 21:11, 30:15, 31:4, 31:20, 35:12, 35:21, 46:21, 48:15, 55:24, 61:20, 62:4, 64:25, 67:1, 71:12, 74:17, 75:16, 81:12, 82:4, 83:5, 88:11, 89:11, 90:10, 90:26, 96:10, 96:20, 105:27, 106:8, 107:5, 107:11, 108:24, 117:2, 119:12, 127:20, 128:24, 129:2, 129:21, 132:19, 133:17, 134:4, 135:8, 136:27, 139:18, 142:6, 147:17, 152:16, 158:17, 158:24, 159:11, 159:15, 159:19, 160:2, 160:13, 160:19, 165:20, 165:28, 166:19, 168:4, 168:27, 171:3, 176:15, 177:7, 178:9, 178:11, 178:14, 184:6, 185:29, 189:9, 194:25, 194:26, 196:16, 197:6, 201:7, 201.11 ones [1] - 121:11 ongoing [9] - 12:12, 32:27, 34:6, 37:1, 41:2, 73:19, 117:4, 123:29, 179:28 onus [4] - 17:17. 20:3, 23:29 onwards [2] - 10:27, 28:5 open [8] - 15:18,

53:4, 87:21, 122:22,

126:6, 127:4, 130:6, 152:4 opened [10] - 47:22, 52:18, 68:6, 127:17, 140:13, 141:7, 150:18, 152:10, 193:1, 198:10 opening [2] - 35:21, 64:26 operate [1] - 129:14 operation [1] - 28:28 operational [1] -20:11 opinion [1] - 180:26 opportunity [8] -115:3, 115:25, 116:7, 147:27, 156:25, 165:26, 172:5, 174:21 opposed [4] - 23:16, 95:7, 124:1, 126:19 options [1] - 186:7 oral [1] - 188:26 order [8] - 6:21, 16:10, 51:5, 129:11, 150:6, 161:26, 167:21, 198:23 ordinarily [1] - 77:7 ordinary [2] - 32:2, 125:22 organisation [16] -8:16, 8:28, 9:26, 12:9,

84:16, 122:27, 123:6, 129:2, 130:12, 130:14, 134:11, 134:27, 141:28 organisations [1] -130:14 original [6] - 20:21, 23:5, 63:20, 71:16, 187:25, 196:17 originally [4] - 17:16, 76:6, 103:27, 190:9 **ORLA** [1] - 3:20 Orla [4] - 186:10, 187:1, 189:5 **OSMOND** [1] - 3:27 OTHER [1] - 1:3 otherwise [5] -18:21, 18:23, 71:17, 102:16, 183:15 ought [3] - 44:16, 105:5, 118:25 ourselves [2] -138:23, 201:5 outcome [3] - 18:19,

41:20, 49:9

outcomes [1] - 142:5

outline [1] - 8:5

outlined [6] - 15:8,

18:26, 19:1, 26:17,

22:6, 64:16, 96:25, 151:4, 153:7 outlining [2] - 87:14, 126:24 output [3] - 195:25, 195:26, 195:27 outputs [2] - 142:2, 142:4 outside [8] - 29:22, 39:20, 39:29, 99:17, 152:27, 155:2, 157:3, 169:16 outstanding [2] -44:17, 177:12 overcome [1] -115:10 overnight [1] - 201:8 oversight [1] - 11:28 overt [1] - 130:3 overview [2] - 9:23, 109:10 own [15] - 9:16, 20:23, 25:5, 26:10, 28:4, 30:13, 44:21, 54:13. 113:12. 145:21, 153:5, 165:3, 179:4, 200:20

## Р

**PAC** [1] - 194:2 paced [1] - 81:14 **PAGE** [1] - 5:2 page [105] - 7:21, 14:9, 16:4, 18:5, 19:6, 22:1, 25:1, 25:10, 25:20, 28:6, 29:11, 31:14, 33:25, 33:26, 33:28, 34:10, 34:12, 38:1, 38:17, 38:19, 38:20, 39:1, 39:6, 42:10, 42:27, 51:1, 51:28, 52:20, 53:21, 55:14, 55:28, 56:8, 57:7, 58:21, 58:22, 58:23, 60:6, 60:21, 60:24, 60:27, 61:3, 61:14, 62:15, 63:4, 63:5, 63:20, 75:13, 78:8, 80:9, 81:8, 83:16, 86:19, 88:4, 88:27, 89:21, 92:6, 92:7, 100:6, 101:23, 103:10, 103:29, 104:18, 107:19, 107:21, 108:12, 108:24, 109:3, 110:4, 110:10, 111:18, 111:24, 112:14, 112:17, 113:18,

113:20, 114:16, 114:22, 114:23, 116:3, 116:23, 118:25, 119:27, 120:8, 122:23, 124:18, 127:5, 129:1, 132:15, 147:19, 150:27, 154:13, 160:23, 160:24, 164:9, 164:13, 164:19, 171:11, 172:8, 192:22, 192:28, 196:7, 198:10 pages [4] - 41:21, 67:18, 89:22, 127:13 pagination [1] - 86:4 paid [2] - 49:29, 77:7 paper [2] - 146:17, 158:13 papers [15] - 7:21, 37:17, 47:23, 55:25, 139:19, 158:11, 158:12. 195:24. 199:19, 199:23, 200:4, 200:5, 200:7, 200:16. 200:18 paperwork [2] -133:13, 160:10 paragraph [33] -15:5, 16:8, 22:4, 25:20, 34:14, 34:15, 38:4, 39:7, 40:29, 51:2, 57:10, 60:8, 65:17, 80:10, 91:22, 96:9, 96:22, 98:28, 103:12, 104:2, 110:11, 118:11, 124:18, 128:1, 153:18, 154:13, 161:4, 161:5, 170:3, 171:12, 182:3, 199:13 parallel [3] - 33:2, 95:7, 174:29 paralleled [1] -105:21 parameters [1] -174:15 pardon [7] - 25:16, 67:21, 69:6, 104:28, 105:1, 182:25, 199:22 Park [1] - 112:4 part [30] - 6:11, 10:10, 12:11, 18:1, 26:17, 27:2, 28:27, 50:14. 54:16. 61:20. 66:24, 73:26, 74:13, 81:4, 82:4, 85:8, 86:16, 90:26, 94:5, 95:2. 99:5. 103:4. 111:21, 118:15,

145:27, 150:1, 173:10, 174:19, 174:29 partial [1] - 77:20 participation [1] -149.29 particular [20] -11:14, 12:17, 12:22, 21:9, 21:22, 31:8, 47:10, 47:11, 47:18, 53:17, 67:5, 74:5, 83:29, 91:9, 105:2, 109:4, 133:7, 136:9, 165:15, 193:13 particularly [4] -17:26, 19:21, 80:26, 94:24 particulars [3] -164:16, 164:20, 164:23 parties [10] - 66:8, 91:13, 95:6, 100:24, 101:10, 103:17, 106:28, 118:8, 171:19, 189:10 parts [3] - 90:26, 111:8. 139:9 party [2] - 134:22, 160:13 passage [1] - 197:4 PASSED[1] - 1:4 passed [2] - 56:4, 162:29 passing [1] - 182:21 past [6] - 25:13, 42:19, 47:29, 100:11, 121:28, 166:13 Pat [2] - 81:2, 82:6 PATRICK [4] - 2:7, 2:10, 2:28, 3:3 pattern [3] - 16:23, 19:3, 21:8 **PAUL** [3] - 2:16, 2.21 4.1 pay [40] - 10:11, 12:17, 14:2, 17:27, 20:8, 20:15, 32:26, 34:2. 34:21. 34:26. 36:8, 36:13, 40:20, 44:18, 46:24, 48:13, 48:20, 48:25, 49:5, 49:8, 49:23, 49:26, 50.5 50.24 51.5 51:19, 76:17, 77:6, 80:5, 91:19, 91:24, 91:26, 92:3, 115:24, 121:14, 156:1, 156:2, 157:25, 195:2

payment [6] - 50:3,

76:18, 77:6, 77:17,

77:20, 116:2 payroll [4] - 10:15, 10:17, 51:7, 52:4 **PD** [5] - 11:25, 66:23, 86:6, 177:17, 177:23 peer [1] - 190:22 PEGGY [1] - 4:7 penalisation [3] -31:21, 50:16, 121:14 penalisation.. [1] -64:29 penalising [1] - 50:8 pending [2] - 49:9, 92:3 pension [2] - 46:27, 46.29 **PEOPLE** [1] - 3:16 people [40] - 6:8, 16:21, 19:24, 21:1, 21:4, 21:9, 21:24, 26:4, 26:24, 26:27, 27:19, 46:6, 47:17, 55:4, 55:15, 79:5, 79:13, 80:8, 83:18, 85:3, 90:15, 100:24, 104:12, 105:9, 107:12, 122:26, 123:8, 123:11, 123:25, 129:2, 130:7. 134:10, 145:15, 145:23, 145:24, 160:16, 174:12, 181:22, 184:27 People [2] - 43:3, people's [1] - 79:9 per [8] - 48:20, 50:7, 89:4, 89:9, 122:26, 135:3, 155:8, 199:21 perceive [1] - 59:1 perception [3] -22:27, 66:7, 171:18 **perfectly** [3] - 7:8, 101:8, 165:5 perhaps [39] - 16:2, 23:17, 23:23, 24:12, 26:12, 31:1, 37:18, 47:17, 48:3, 50:28, 57:15, 58:21, 60:24, 63:11, 72:8, 74:24, 75:21, 79:16, 83:15, 86:2, 86:3, 87:28, 88:26, 91:7, 94:25, 95:11, 103:17, 104:24, 107:19, 110:3, 132:11, 137:26, 141:9, 148:6, 160:5, 168:2, 189:7, 197:8, 198:9 period [36] - 11:20,

13:25, 32:10, 32:27, 37:26, 48:17, 57:27, 68:14, 76:16, 84:15, 88:17, 93:11, 106:25, 109:1, 151:23, 158:14, 158:17, 158:21, 158:24, 158:27, 159:11, 159:12, 159:19, 160:21, 163:27, 165:28, 167:21, 168:19, 168:20, 168:21, 176:11, 176:12, 185:22, 193:29 periods [2] - 93:26, 182:14 permanently [1] -28:2 permission[3] -39:19, 48:19, 155:1 persisting [2] -182:20, 182:22 persists [1] - 182:11 person [23] - 40:3, 53:23, 53:25, 62:28, 83:23, 91:3, 94:28, 96:20, 115:16, 124:1, 125:15, 125:23, 126:5, 130:10, 134:14, 135:18, 136:1, 136:3, 136:16, 142:6, 196:5, 196:26, 198:17 personal [8] - 34:22, 82:10, 123:19, 134:28, 164:6, 164:26, 165:6, 173:27 personally [2] -67:25. 97:13 personnel [1] - 92:29 perspective [3] -80:22, 139:22, 150:12 pertaining [3] -187:15, 188:16, 194:1 pertinent [1] - 86:2 perusal [1] - 61:22 **PETER** [2] - 2:5, 3:13 phase [2] - 61:26, 166:19 phone [9] - 31:23, 36:26, 51:13, 64:11, 86:26, 86:28, 96:8, 146:17, 172:25 phoned [1] - 55:8 **phrase** [1] - 111:23 physicians [1] -77:14 PIAB [1] - 55:22

picked [4] - 23:23,

25:28, 26:4, 27:9 picture [3] - 14:16, 47:2, 140:5 **pie** [1] - 183:19 piece [2] - 139:1, 193:10 pitch [1] - 84:23 place [16] - 19:27, 24:28, 30:21, 73:27, 87:8, 93:15, 94:15, 95:21, 100:12, 104:15, 105:8, 108:19, 131:29, 136:6, 148:3, 155:23 PLACE [1] - 4:8 plain [2] - 98:25, 183:23 plan [4] - 81:1, 91:24, 101:1, 113:3 planning [1] - 112:10 played [1] - 145:27 players [1] - 141:16 plays [1] - 156:28 pleadings [2] -166:10, 166:12 pleased [1] - 58:12 plural [1] - 132:22 plus [1] - 174:20 point [91] - 9:24, 10:26, 11:3, 16:7, 19:24, 21:14, 24:14, 24:22, 27:28, 28:1, 28:10, 30:8, 30:9, 31:1, 31:3, 31:16, 32:2, 32:18, 40:6, 40:18, 41:29, 55:19, 58:26, 59:19, 62:19, 70:12, 72:3, 74:6, 79:19, 80:25, 83:8, 83:25, 91:10, 94:24, 95:3, 95:23, 96:16, 99:27, 105:9, 106:21, 106:25, 107:17, 109:22, 116:18, 117:4, 124:2, 124:11, 126:6, 127:1, 131:27, 133:10, 135:1, 135:10, 135:11, 138:22, 139:15, 140:14, 141:3, 141:14, 141:17, 142:6, 142:10, 142:19, 143:29, 146:1, 146:14, 146:27, 149:5, 152:4, 155:28, 156:1, 157:12, 158:25, 159:28, 165:2, 165:19, 171:3, 174:1, 174:3, 175:2, 175:14,

178:15, 178:29, 181:1, 181:6, 183:23, 185:27, 186:7, 195:19, 197:14, 197-27 pointed [2] - 155:11, 196:24 pointing [1] - 171:29 points [5] - 31:20, 84:12, 91:16, 99:27, 113:23 Policing [14] - 82:21, 82:24, 82:27, 83:22, 96:24, 96:26, 97:14, 97:16, 97:25, 98:13, 101:22, 102:2, 102:10, 102:17 **policy** [51] - 10:6, 16:27, 31:6, 51:11, 52:12, 52:28, 52:29, 53:7, 53:16, 53:24, 56:17, 56:19, 57:17, 65:8, 65:27, 66:19, 70:16, 70:17, 70:25, 71:9, 86:11, 90:20, 91:1. 91:4. 93:19. 94:11, 94:20, 106:17, 107:2, 107:6, 108:3, 108:16, 108:27, 158:16, 158:18, 159:2, 161:11, 168:7, 168:28, 169:17, 170:14, 170:29, 171:24, 173:21, 174:17, 182:7. 182:19, 183:10, 198:18 policy.. [1] - 53:12 policyholder [3] -119:3, 173:27, 183:25 polite [1] - 143:28 portion [2] - 67:2, 103:5 Portlaoise [3] -60:11, 61:19, 83:10 position [20] - 9:3, 9:6, 11:4, 34:1, 38:5, 42:15, 43:24, 47:14, 73:3, 87:2, 87:15, 93:28, 101:11, 138:8, 146:10, 156:17, 162:11, 181:20, 192:28, 198:16 positions [1] - 82:26 positive [1] - 177:29 possession [2] -18:7, 88:16 possibility [3] - 58:6, 114:24, 162:25 **possible** [14] - 20:20,

22:17, 39:8, 49:8, 59:26, 94:19, 102:22, 108:20, 118:5, 134:21, 154:15, 161:14, 186:7, 201:4 possibly [4] - 17:26, 50:10, 107:26, 159:14 post [3] - 23:12, 46:11, 54:10 Post [1] - 17:10 postponed [1] -72:21 potential [1] - 58:25 potentially [2] -24:22, 174:4 **POWER** [1] - 4:10 practicable [3] -41:8, 56:19, 56:23 practical [1] - 116:22 practice [3] - 26:13, 33:21. 76:19 practitioner [1] -76:21 pre [1] - 23:12 preceded [1] -151:27 precedent [1] -174:18 preceding [1] - 110:4 precisely [5] - 58:26, 119:15. 129:14. 144:17, 184:9 preclude [1] - 71:12 preconditions [1] -21:20 predates [1] - 129:24 preempt [1] - 156:4 prefer [1] - 176:26 preferred [1] - 81:17 prejudice [1] - 81:23 preliminary [1] -196:25

premature [1] -

prepared [12] -

163:8, 163:18,

168:3. 183:20

84:28

21.16

137:16

164:24, 167:12,

47:18, 61:6, 78:27,

80:5, 108:28, 133:1,

preponderance [1] -

prerequisite [1] -

prerogative [1] -

present [4] - 73:3,

162:14

85:6, 198:3

preparation [2] prepare [1] - 85:4

86:29, 116:29 presented [3] -166:28, 166:29, 189:4 PRESIDENT [2] -1.13 2.3 pressing [1] - 118:12 pressure [2] - 59:21, 175:26 presumably [3] -22:20, 125:27, 197:20 presume [3] - 54:15, 134:15, 137:4 pretty [2] - 25:1, 125:7 prevent [2] - 59:2, 181.16 preventing [1] -77:16 previous [20] -33:13, 49:2, 51:25, 53:13, 66:6, 69:19, 72:29, 73:10, 73:11, 74:27, 81:7, 87:6, 107:22, 117:29, 119:8, 171:17, 172:19, 176:27, 179:18, 188:25 previously [1] -87:19 principle [2] - 98:23, 136:21 printout [1] - 80:2 priority [2] - 41:6, 56:27 prism [4] - 50:14, 74:7, 94:21, 117:7 private [1] - 142:9 proactive [2] - 21:24, 21:26 probability [1] -29:18 problem [15] - 14:22, 23:19, 30:10, 46:7, 88:13, 94:9, 101:9, 132:10, 132:11, 134:7, 156:21, 157:12, 161:7, 178:21, 197:20 problematic [1] -197:5 problems [3] - 21:25, 94:27, 128:10 procedural [2] -107:6, 111:7 procedure [4] -28:14, 28:23, 156:7, 174:17

procedures [2] -

proceed [8] - 58:11,

10:8, 80:15

92:25, 96:3, 96:25, 101:3, 163:1, 183:26, 189:25 proceeded [1] -112:9 proceeding [1] -169:17 proceedings [3] -55:23, 56:1, 138:24 process [29] - 9:26, 18:15, 28:9, 35:28, 47:15, 47:19, 54:20, 66:25, 92:28, 93:8, 94:5, 97:11, 103:23, 123:7, 124:1, 124:29, 125:9, 126:5, 126:19, 128:12, 128:18, 138:9, 138:14, 147:4, 149:27, 149:28, 150:7, 165:5, 174:17 processed [2] -137:18, 150:6 processes [2] -104:9, 124:8 procrustean [1] -111:24 produced [1] - 25:6 professional [2] -9:29, 82:10 professionalism [1] - 99:22 **proforma** [1] - 125:6 programme [2] -41:23, 42:6 progress [17] -12:13, 33:6, 51:6, 59:29, 100:16, 141:18, 148:9, 150:25, 154:11, 154:23, 159:23, 161:26, 172:29, 173:3, 177:22, 198:16, 199:15 progressed [9] -29:22, 59:26, 93:5, 105:7, 116:2, 135:9, 135:12, 152:26, 170:1 progressing [2] -158:3, 172:28 progression [1] -81:1 prolongation [1] -77:3 promised [1] -161:20 promoted [1] -102:21 promotion [5] -81:15, 82:8, 82:17, 82:18, 102:13

promotions [2] -175:26, 176:2 **prompted** [1] - 90:6 **proper** [3] - 130:16, 131:4, 142:29 properly [3] - 24:11, 82:24, 187:24 proposal [1] - 36:1 proposed [3] -35:28, 100:26, 168:5 proposing [2] -86:22, 168:6 prosecution [1] -86:8 PROTECTED[2] -1.2 1.3 Protected [1] - 50:14 protected [46] -10:22, 11:10, 11:12, 11:20, 11:23, 12:6, 12:7, 23:5, 42:1, 64:27, 65:5, 65:7, 65:9, 65:11, 65:26, 71:16, 74:7, 74:9, 74:11, 74:22, 77:29, 81:17, 84:19, 84:20, 88:21, 88:23, 92:10, 94:12, 94:13, 94:21, 94:22, 98:8, 99:21, 99:24, 117:7, 131:21, 135:2, 136:19, 141:24, 148:5, 156:14, 157:14, 157:17, 173:9, 173:13, 177:21 Protection [1] -77.24 protections [3] -22:11, 91:4, 153:28 protectors [1] -12:10 protest [1] - 191:4 **prove** [1] - 196:22 proved [2] - 39:8, 197:5 provide [4] - 52:28, 103:19, 151:8, 200:5 provided [10] -39:10, 53:26, 54:6, 61:5, 66:24, 71:9, 91:4, 137:10, 154:18, 200:15 providing [2] -15:13, 42:22 provisions [1] -108:27 psychiatrist [1] -45:27 psychological [2] -21:26, 46:12

psychologist [1] -45:28 **PTSD** [1] - 17:11 **Public** [3] - 50:11, 67:28, 68:5 **public** [5] - 12:5, 67:24, 98:16, 98:22, 104:4 pull [1] - 111:11 **purely** [3] - 51:21, 125:12, 135:24 purple [1] - 111:15 purports [1] - 129:7 purpose [6] - 20:4, 59:18, 87:1, 170:8, 189:2, 200:10 purposes [3] - 97:18, 128:3, 132:13 pursued [2] - 51:4, 117:9 pursuing [1] - 62:25 pushed [1] - 148:19 pushing [1] - 117:2 put [22] - 16:1, 17:17, 47:1, 55:4, 85:8, 98:13, 98:27, 100:1, 111:26, 119:6, 122:20, 138:2, 139:5, 140:20, 144:6, 146:21, 148:22, 150:13, 150:20, 155:16, 157:25, 165:13 putting [2] - 97:20, 142:28

# Q

qualifying [1] - 46:28 quarterly [1] - 32:29 QUAY [3] - 2:24, 2:31, 4:12 queries [1] - 120:2 query [4] - 26:11, 56:4, 63:3, 162:27 questioning [3] -93:17, 126:27, 127:2 questions [12] -6:22, 6:29, 96:13, 101:29, 121:8, 136:16, 138:27, 191:18, 191:25, 194:13, 194:16, 201:2 queue [1] - 21:4 quickly [2] - 14:20, 93:5 Quinn [3] - 32:12, 43.27 **QUINN** [1] - 3:10

**quite** [14] - 11:23, 22:25, 37:16, 58:12, 60:6, 74:19, 83:18, 91:8, 107:9, 109:6, 138:19, 138:24, 139:7, 160:1

#### R

rails [1] - 174:15

raise [4] - 30:14,

94:1, 119:2, 186:1

26:11, 29:1, 29:3,

64:15, 65:4, 65:6,

66:21, 87:3, 89:17,

92:9, 93:23, 96:26,

102:6, 102:9, 106:23,

118:6, 120:2, 128:11,

101:27, 101:28,

raised [29] - 26:7,

133:27, 135:8, 155:13, 157:1, 162:25, 169:26, 174:25, 186:21 raising [6] - 58:25, 63:3, 93:3, 93:12, 114:23, 171:23 ran [1] - 197:29 range [1] - 10:6 ranges [1] - 8:20 rank [6] - 19:4, 53:26, 54:1, 162:9, 162:11, 196:26 ranks [1] - 96:16 rate [4] - 46:27, 76:16, 77:6, 77:17 rather [5] - 18:27, 43:13, 100:27, 123:13, 201:7 re [3] - 7:3, 41:9, 132:21 **RE** [2] - 5:9, 194:20 re-examination [1] -7:3 RE-EXAMINED [2] -5:9. 194:20 re-read [1] - 132:21 reach [2] - 21:23, 24:5 reached [5] - 63:9, 91:18, 92:26, 93:29, 187:4 reacting [1] - 74:16 reaction [1] - 140:24 read [27] - 15:5, 22:25, 23:2, 47:24, 50:26, 53:13, 55:12, 68:25, 74:16, 112:6,

132:21, 139:19,

168:2, 168:10, 172:9, 172:14, 174:21, 174:22, 175:21, 175:23, 183:29, 187:12 reading [9] - 15:28, 23:16, 73:29, 97:6, 140:3, 160:18, 164:10, 180:1, 183:17 real [5] - 17:11, 50:15, 106:24, 132:1, 178:21 realise [1] - 135:20 realities [1] - 79:1 reality [6] - 70:24, 79:21. 139:26. 141:11, 147:7, 181:4 really [11] - 11:6, 74:9, 95:17, 96:10, 124:21, 128:25, 141:9, 143:29, 148:3, 157:22, 181:19 reason [19] - 6:10, 45:9, 45:14, 46:23, 80:27, 94:9, 111:15, 120:1, 137:20, 137:24, 143:11, 148:3, 151:11, 151:25, 156:21, 160:19, 182:15, 190:19, 190:20 reasonable [3] - 7:8, 41:8, 160:19 reasonably [2] -14:20, 139:8 reasons [10] - 6:20, 21:1, 22:8, 77:1, 91:2, 112:1, 136:17, 153:16, 165:3, 196:23 rebuild [1] - 115:26 receipt [10] - 52:2, 61:8, 61:26, 62:3, 62:8, 62:14, 72:12, 75:6, 103:14, 189:20 receive [9] - 54:12, 62:24, 67:7, 88:24, 140:9, 141:5, 171:8, 193:20, 201:17 received [40] - 29:6, 42:21, 55:13, 55:20, 56:4, 56:26, 58:19, 59:12, 60:4, 60:5, 61:1, 67:4, 68:20, 69:23, 71:26, 72:3, 74:3, 75:10, 78:13, 78:22, 84:2, 84:10, 85:9. 86:18. 92:1. 94:16, 96:10, 103:9,

139:21, 156:17,

158:12, 163:20,

104:6, 107:13, 107:24, 130:1, 133:16, 140:29, 161:22, 168:22, 172:26, 188:20, 191:8, 199:23 receives [1] - 194:4 receiving [2] - 50:23, 68:17 recipient [1] - 23:8 recipients [1] - 12:7 recites [1] - 38:4 recognise [1] - 82:8 recollect [2] - 39:27, 40.22 recollection [4] -15:26, 18:22, 68:15, 190:29 recommend [7] -39:19 41:5 49:7 49:19, 66:27, 155:1, 180:7 recommendation [3] - 34:25, 94:4, 156:1 recommendations [1] - 94:2 recommended [6] -36:18, 49:16, 52:16, 73:14, 179:23, 196:12 recommending [3] -58:5, 70:4, 196:18 reconsideration [2] -91:25, 91:27 record [8] - 32:1, 75:29, 76:26, 77:28, 78:10, 87:9, 103:10, 110:28 recorded [4] - 40:7, 76:6, 76:29, 78:3 recording [1] -117:24 records [6] - 48:16, 48:17, 68:23, 76:2, 87:14, 113:22 recruitment [1] rectifying [1] - 76:25 **REDDY** [1] - 4:8 redirected [1] - 43:2 reduced [3] - 34:2, 34:26, 49:5 refer [16] - 52:23, 56:12, 63:23, 67:2, 69:19, 72:29, 89:1, 95:8, 103:5, 120:11, 164:8, 172:19, 172:22, 179:18, 189:15, 193:11 reference [20] -19:28, 43:18, 46:2,

62:24, 64:21, 69:13, 70:11, 74:8, 89:14, 109:12, 116:1, 123:27, 124:24, 136:29, 169:10, 176:20, 188:12, 193:18, 195:21, 199:25 referenced [2] -150:21, 158:4 references [4] -16:21, 73:24, 153:15, 187.9 referencina [3] -180:2, 180:3, 180:4 referral [7] - 15:10, 15:12, 15:21, 19:12, 20:21, 24:27, 153:3 referred [25] - 14:5, 18:9, 19:13, 22:21, 22:23, 25:14, 25:15, 25:29, 31:19, 33:4, 54:5, 60:21, 60:26, 67:15, 69:8, 88:25, 96:10, 101:22, 110:10, 112:3, 119:8, 150:28, 190:3, 193:2, 194:5 referring [9] - 16:7, 29:12, 61:15, 64:23, 71:29, 89:24, 117:29, 167:1, 195:4 refers [22] - 15:3, 25:18, 28:21, 33:28, 38:15, 39:1, 63:20, 63:28, 64:9, 64:10, 64:13, 65:15, 73:10, 74:27, 77:24, 86:20, 103:15, 114:10, 129:19, 169:25, 193:6 reflect [2] - 86:5, reflecting [1] - 22:2 **Reform** [1] - 50:12 regard [12] - 21:14, 30:15, 44:2, 44:15, 44:23, 58:15, 93:8, 104:8, 132:29, 136:11, 174:10, 188:21 regarded [1] - 35:20 regarding [9] - 52:6, 53:27, 73:4, 114:21, 146:19, 151:6, 171:18, 176:25, 177:1 Region [8] - 60:15, 61:7, 72:28, 75:7, 89:1, 172:19, 176:28, 188:22 region [4] - 18:27,

19:5, 27:20, 129:9 regional [1] - 177:21 **REGISTRAR** [1] - 2:5 regular [1] - 100:9 regularly [1] - 59:22 regulation [1] -77:14 regulations [3] -26:29, 50:9, 57:16 reiterate [1] - 32:21 related [84] - 10:11, 12:15, 12:27, 15:14, 16:12, 17:12, 17:21, 18:11, 20:9, 20:19, 20:24, 20:27, 21:14, 21:17, 22:17, 26:9, 28:3, 29:20, 30:4, 30:18, 30:19, 30:23, 34:5, 36:28, 38:8, 38:23, 38:26, 39:17, 42:24, 45:4, 45:12, 49:4, 55:28, 67:16, 76:8, 76:10, 76:14, 76:20, 76:22, 76:26, 77:5, 77:8, 77:14, 78:2, 78:15, 79:8, 79:18, 81:22, 86:15, 93:11, 94:28, 114:14, 118:7, 123:18, 123:22, 125:23, 125:29, 126:8, 127:20, 127:23, 128:4, 128:13, 128:23, 129:20, 129:25, 133:6, 133:7, 133:17, 135:6, 138:5, 149:26, 150:15, 150:27, 151:6, 151:14, 152:25, 154:17, 154:28, 155:15, 156:12, 157:16, 183:12, 184:2 relates [1] - 77:19 relating [11] - 10:2, 25:8, 25:18, 43:4, 48:4, 60:27, 77:11, 96:24, 102:25, 104:7, 192:10 relation [34] - 11:19, 19:11, 24:28, 34:1, 37:1, 37:3, 37:19, 43:18, 52:13, 69:2, 71:26, 76:5, 77:28, 82:17, 88:26, 98:21, 121:2, 121:7, 122:23, 137:19, 138:29, 141:22, 147:19, 150:11, 151:9, 152:10, 158:1, 158:2, 158:27, 161:11,

161:16, 188:26, 190:23, 192:19 **relations** [4] - 8:8, 10:3, 10:4, 10:7 relationship [5] -54:25, 54:26, 58:7, 99:25, 149:3 relatively [2] -122:24, 151:23 relevant [13] - 16:1, 50:29, 52:8, 56:5, 60:13, 84:14, 98:12, 104:12, 120:12, 136:28, 142:22, 163:21, 172:4 reluctant [4] - 38:9, 66:4, 165:9, 171:15 rely [2] - 130:1, 174:19 remain [2] - 44:14, 100:3 remained [1] - 44:23 remember [2] - 31:4, 40:28 reminder [1] - 69:2 reminders [3] -67:10, 67:15, 67:19 renewal [1] - 9:26 repeat [1] - 81:6 repeated [1] - 198:19 repeating [1] - 33:13 replied [3] - 33:13, 51:28, 69:3 replies [2] - 35:2, 35:3 reply [21] - 21:28, 55:16, 55:19, 69:8, 72:9, 78:27, 80:3, 83:28, 91:15, 101:21, 102:26, 103:9, 103:11, 126:22, 186:24, 187:2, 187:3, 187:6, 187:8, 198:9, 198:10 replying [1] - 91:8 report [71] - 14:27, 15:2, 15:4, 15:19, 16:16, 18:4, 18:8, 20:27, 21:15, 22:2, 25:17, 25:29, 28:22, 29:12, 37:11, 37:27, 38:2, 38:16, 40:11, 40:21, 49:9, 58:23, 60:5, 60:10, 60:16, 60:25, 60:26, 61:1, 61:3, 61:9, 61:17, 61:20, 61:27, 62:4, 62:12, 62:14, 62:21,

63:19, 68:18, 71:26,

72:7, 78:13, 96:12,

99:21, 117:20, 117:21, 119:26, 119:27, 120:4, 124:25, 127:9, 129:15, 130:17, 130:19, 132:14, 132:25, 132:29, 137:17, 146:19, 146:20, 147:3, 147:25, 151:4, 152:6, 172:29, 177:1, 178:9, 192:11, 192:15, 198:25 reported [10] - 25:10, 25:22, 38:11, 41:20, 42:18, 52:7, 61:12, 118:7, 197:21, 197:29 reportedly [1] - 41:2 reporter [1] - 38:25 reporting [9] - 11:19, 11:26, 19:23, 22:11, 38:11, 61:4, 61:16, 98:8, 153:28 reports [5] - 20:23, 38:17, 58:24, 130:1, 141:8 represent [1] - 160:1 represented [1] -150:4 represents [1] -186:2 request [23] - 44:7, 48:19, 59:6, 61:16, 66:12, 70:24, 78:12, 99:17, 109:4, 109:28, 109:29. 110:2. 110:6. 120:6, 120:19, 129:24, 130:20, 130:24, 132:24, 133:16, 136:12, 138:4, 138:20 requested [7] -37:28, 66:19, 73:21, 90:29, 99:4, 124:25, 163:12 requesting [1] requests [1] - 198:19 require [2] - 43:12, 131:14 required [12] - 20:1, 35:6, 50:2, 51:23, 70:28, 117:20, 117:21, 133:14, 144:10, 161:26, 173:23, 187:17 requirement [5] -39:15, 110:14, 132:8, 136:23, 154:26

requires [2] - 34:25,

47:15 requiring [1] - 39:25 resent [1] - 85:24 resolution [2] - 54:4, 138:21 RESOLUTIONS [1] resolve [3] - 23:20, 134:28, 178:14 resolved [5] - 59:5, 94:18. 137:18. 138:18, 141:4 resource [1] - 21:19 Resources [4] - 8:2, 43:2, 82:21, 90:2 RESOURCES [1] -3:15 resources [1] -174:18 respect [23] - 12:26, 20:15, 21:24, 26:18, 27:19, 36:17, 37:9, 42:19, 43:14, 55:22, 60:10, 70:27, 76:19, 92:25, 95:25, 123:29, 136:23, 145:26, 155:19, 183:19, 186:21, 187:14, 198:15 respected [1] - 58:15 respectful [3] -70:26, 91:3, 173:26 respecting[1] -25:25 respectively [1] -11:15 respects [5] - 88:13, 112:6, 155:22, 184:19, 197:16 respond [1] - 118:14 responded [3] -15:27, 26:4, 118:23 responding [1] -110:7 response [19] -11:11, 25:3, 42:28, 66:10, 70:1, 73:18, 75:16, 75:18, 98:26, 103:18, 108:1, 109:4, 119:9, 130:20, 150:17, 154:6, 171:21, 179:27, 190:2 responses [2] -159:24, 194:24 responsibilities [4] -9:23, 10:10, 57:17, 57:18 responsibility [13] -

8:1, 8:20, 11:29, 12:7,

43:10, 44:3, 44:22,

57:12, 58:15, 89:23, 100:15, 125:16, 166:18 responsible [2] -59:8, 166:19 rest [1] - 125:12 restate [1] - 102:9 restated [1] - 76:9 restating [1] - 42:15 rested [1] - 70:16 restoration [1] - 36:8 restore [1] - 115:25 restored [4] - 40:20, 49:8, 50:4, 156:2 rests [1] - 24:1 result [4] - 13:24, 157:13, 162:27, 190:6 results [2] - 59:12, **RESUMED** [3] - 6:1, 101:16, 122:5 resumption [1] reticent [1] - 151:5 **RETIRED** [7] - 3:5, 3:6, 3:7, 3:7, 3:11, 3:12, 3:13 return [9] - 41:10, 72:15, 80:6, 113:3, 115:15, 115:22, 116:10, 152:23, 200:18 returned [7] - 51:6, 52:3, 68:4, 78:24, 84:17, 115:11, 200:10 returning [5] - 29:18, 29:23, 30:20, 152:28, 169:22 returns [1] - 30:24 revealed [1] - 181:26 revert [2] - 61:26, 69.27 review [10] - 18:12, 18:17, 18:19, 28:9, 31:8, 99:8, 123:28, 187:14, 188:16, 190:22 reviewable [1] reviewed [1] - 92:11 revised [1] - 152:7 rightly [1] - 196:24 rights [1] - 56:16 rigid [1] - 79:3 ring [2] - 18:13, 161:17 rise [5] - 23:19, 50:15, 162:16, 181:13 **ROAD** [2] - 2:18,

Roche [10] - 57:4, 58:5, 58:28, 66:17, 162:13, 162:21, 196:14, 196:18, 197:19, 197:24 role [22] - 23:4, 41:29, 52:27, 53:6, 117:17, 122:24, 122:25, 122:28, 123:1, 123:2, 123:3, 124:8, 128:18, 128:21, 133:15, 137:19, 141:23, 141:25, 146:2, 151:27, 188:22 roles [1] - 11:14 roll [2] - 196:19, 196:21 room [4] - 82:4, 105:10, 130:4, 160:16 rough [2] - 101:5, 143:18 round [2] - 12:19, 83:13 routine [4] - 16:19, 16:20, 21:5, 43:23 routinely [3] - 18:16, 20:29 rules [1] - 176:16 run [1] - 197:19 runs [1] - 63:8 Ryan [1] - 46:5 RYAN [2] - 1:12, 2:2

#### S

**sake** [1] - 138:2 **SAMS**[6] - 27:6, 27:7, 32:1, 75:29, 79:2, 79:16 **SANDRA**[1] - 4:6 sandwich [1] -100:29 sat [4] - 19:21, 35:19, 70:13, 70:27 satisfactory[1] -201:9 satisfied [7] - 38:18, 145:26, 146:5, 172:27, 174:25, 175:8, 184:1 **SAVAGE**[1] - 3:16 save[1] - 173:14 saw [14] - 25:6, 31:16, 35:21, 54:16, 68:15, 80:6, 103:4, 112:20, 140:22, 177:28, 189:29, 190:1, 190:2

SC [12] - 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:16, 2:21, 2:28, 3:23, 3:23, 3:24, 4:6, 4:7, 4:14 scaffolding [1] -106:26 Scanlan [46] - 57:22, 57:28, 58:13, 60:25, 62:24, 64:17, 65:20. 65:22, 72:6, 93:27, 96:14, 140:16, 144:11, 158:23, 159:9, 159:12, 159:13, 159:18, 160:3, 162:4, 162:18, 162:22, 162:26, 162:28. 163:6. 163:10, 164:25, 164:26, 165:4, 166:4, 166:7, 166:14, 174:24, 177:14, 180:12, 180:20, 183:29, 192:11, 192:14, 193:20, 195:23, 195:29, 196:10, 198:25, 199:16, 199:27 **SCANLAN**[1] - 3:8 Scanlan's [6] -58:22, 59:13, 72:21, Scanlon [1] - 61:19

96:12, 147:25, 166:18 scanned [1] - 125:1 scenario [1] - 102:10 scheduled [4] - 28:8, 29:28, 153:13, 159:24 science [1] - 17:10 scope [1] - 87:25

scratching [1] -145:14 scrawl [1] - 113:14 screen [6] - 14:11, 14:14, 48:15, 111:15, 122:20, 182:3

score [1] - 123:8

screens [1] - 14:13 script [2] - 29:7, 60:22

scroll [18] - 39:7, 58:24, 60:24, 65:17, 72:10, 78:8, 80:9, 83:15, 100:6, 104:25, 109:9, 119:27, 160:27, 161:3, 164:13, 164:19, 167:25, 167:27

se [2] - 122:27, 135:3 **SEAN**[4] - 1:12, 2:2, 2:22, 3:17

**SEANAD**[1] - 1:5

searching [1] - 58:3 second [27] - 16:8, 22:4, 31:25, 38:4, 51:2, 61:1, 62:4, 68:9, 76:15, 80:10, 92:6, 104:2, 104:15, 105:21, 118:11, 124:18, 141:10, 153:18, 160:24, 162:10, 168:9, 170:3, 171:7, 171:12, 182:18, 183:7, 199:13 second, [1] - 187:3 secondly [3] - 77:15, 92:9, 100:8

secret [1] - 98:15 secrete [1] - 185:14 secreted [2] - 80:18, 81:14 **Section** [6] - 43:4,

43:13, 124:5, 137:5, 137:13, 137:18 section [14] - 16:1, 26:21, 26:23, 26:25, 26:26, 27:4, 27:6, 27:8, 28:26, 48:25, 50:24, 80:5, 95:27, 137.8

sections [2] - 63:8,

sector [1] - 142:9 see [37] - 6:8, 12:14, 18:23, 21:5, 24:4, 30:24, 35:8, 35:24, 35:26, 37:22, 48:28, 50:22, 68:23, 72:3, 80:3, 83:16, 92:5, 93:17, 97:29, 106:8, 108:20, 109:8, 113:2,

124:28, 126:7, 140:12, 140:23, 127:15, 127:29, 161:19, 167:12, 133:19, 134:4, 140:28, 142:27, 188:17, 192:20, 186:16, 192:19, 192:29, 193:4,

193:16, 193:23, 197:27, 199:13 sentence [3] - 34:14, seeing [5] - 14:15, 43:9, 53:13

14:19, 111:10, 140:5, 142:4 seek [2] - 33:7,

100.15 seeking [21] - 24:26,

33:6, 54:21, 58:27, 69:14, 70:25, 82:16, 91:3, 95:27, 102:24, 108:1, 115:14, 116:7, 118:4, 120:8, 144:2, 144:23, 149:6, 166:2, 177:1, 198:17 seem [8] - 89:7, 94:5, 96:19, 105:16, 106:7, 110:6, 118:12, 193:22 **sees** [1] - 74:22 segmented [1] -187.28

segments [2] -93:18, 149:5 selection [1] - 9:29

Send [1] - 8:17 send [8] - 72:1, 78:27, 82:26, 102:27, 161:13, 181:27, 192:23

**senior** [5] - 41:7, 102:12, 102:16, 144:14, 197:21

sense [25] - 22:24, 26:14, 30:15, 30:20, 39:23, 41:5, 47:15, 49:19, 59:1, 72:20,

95:13, 107:6, 119:10, 129:28, 132:3, 136:1, 136:22, 136:23,

138:25, 143:14, 143:16, 146:21, 184:19, 187:16,

195:12 sensitive [1] - 79:9

sensitivity [1] -136:24

sent [36] - 27:25, 37:12, 37:25, 40:12, 40:21, 54:10, 56:29, 61:19, 63:12, 75:22, 76:7, 83:18, 83:21, 85:24, 86:3, 102:27, 103:18, 107:15, 107:22, 119:26, 125:4, 126:23,

140:28, 152:6, 161:1,

193:16, 195:5, 198:7

sentences [1] - 35:9 separate [5] - 90:27, 106:22, 181:14,

190:24, 190:25 separately [1] -189:22

September [28] -20:15, 37:8, 44:20, 48:2, 67:17, 73:8, 73:21, 74:1, 84:2, 84:5, 84:11, 85:1, 102:2, 115:5, 117:27,

124:24, 141:13,

146:1, 148:4, 148:15, 155:27, 179:16, 193:25, 198:6, 198:11, 198:13 sequence [4] - 7:6, 72:8, 91:10, 133:9

127:13 Sergeant [10] -10:21, 10:26, 11:8, 11:11, 13:15, 90:6, 104:21, 115:8,

sequential [1] -

115:11, 141:26 sergeant [2] - 64:22, 115:11

SERGEANT[5] -3:12, 3:20, 4:5, 4:6, 4:6

serial [2] - 93:15, 95:6

series [13] - 68:9, 79:3, 84:24, 92:15, 101:28, 127:8, 133:1, 140:13, 144:8, 160:18, 161:29, 163:8, 164:20

serious [2] - 65:22, 77:21

served [1] - 197:24 Service [2] - 30:1, 100:10

**service** [3] - 10:18, 41:6. 46:27

**SERVICES** [1] - 1:29 services [2] - 99:2, 188:23 Services [1] - 1:24

**serving** [1] - 102:15 set [17] - 17:13, 33:1, 65:19, 65:20, 92:19, 92:28, 94:12, 99:3, 105:2, 114:4, 153:16, 160:13, 163:15, 167:14, 171:4,

187:25, 187:28 sets [5] - 103:23, 144:20, 150:23, 150:24, 154:10

setting [2] - 38:1,

several [5] - 35:19, 127:13, 141:15, 163:25, 174:22 sexual [1] - 108:15 shadow [1] - 115:18 shall [3] - 16:20,

67:5, 107:8 **SHANE** [1] - 3:23 **SHANKEY**[1] - 3:21 SHANKEY-SMITH

183:14 150:27, 153:19, [1] - 3:21 stage [23] - 7:25, **SHANNON** [1] - 2:13 single [6] - 19:3, 156:4, 158:29, 10:23, 13:8, 14:8, 180:22, 182:25, Sheahan [1] - 190:23 40:6, 51:20, 108:11, 20:25, 24:18, 31:19, 188:10, 197:14 **SHEAHAN**[1] - 3:18 142:10, 156:13 37:5, 49:5, 51:6, sheer [1] - 149:1 sinister [2] - 143:9, Sorry [1] - 53:12 55:24, 88:2, 89:24, 90:10, 93:6, 104:9, sheet [1] - 88:3 143:12 sort [8] - 70:7, 79:22, SINÉAD [1] - 4:7 107:23, 108:1, 104:12, 118:23, sheets [1] - 90:7 147:13, 184:28, **SHELLEY** [1] - 3:25 SINéAD [1] - 2:7 113:23, 116:28, 185:2, 185:16, 188:14 140:7, 197:26 shepherd [1] - 94:13 sit [4] - 7:18, 101:2, sorts [1] - 146:16 stages [2] - 94:7, 122:2, 145:13 shift [1] - 50:1 sits [1] - 82:20 sought [16] - 50:11, 118:9 SHIP [1] - 3:28 sitting [1] - 143:20 50:17, 55:15, 60:3, **stake** [1] - 170:13 **shoes** [2] - 141:2, standard [9] - 19:29, 62:17, 72:19, 73:22, 193:13 situation [8] - 31:11, 118:8, 118:18, 25:1, 25:4, 28:23, 49:7, 100:24, 116:9, **shook** [1] - 82:5 135:13, 145:7, 145:9, 48:11, 123:17, 126:2, 148:25, 174:14, short [4] - 68:20, 146:5, 158:10, 126:3, 134:16 181.18 100:22, 151:23, 163:7 159:26, 163:10 standards [1] - 10:1 situations [2] - 12:8, **shorter** [2] - 100:26, sounds [1] - 132:22 standing [5] -155:15 144:21 source [14] - 15:15, 139:29. 141:2. six [3] - 8:9, 93:29, **shortest** [1] - 197:17 142:26, 142:29, 16:11, 20:20, 30:3, 125.1 shortly [4] - 9:19, 38:7, 38:23, 127:20, 193:13 slate [1] - 82:29 11:5, 31:9, 100:12 slightest [1] - 165:23 127:22, 129:20, **start** [8] - 6:9, shows [3] - 156:9, 129:27, 130:23, 122:15, 123:10, slightly [3] - 16:6, 167:25, 175:3 134:14, 186:29, 124:29, 133:15, 20:17, 152:7 Sick [6] - 43:3. 198:18 149:26, 183:5, 191:19 slough [1] - 181:27 43:13, 124:5, 137:5, sources [2] - 62:18, started [1] - 115:3 137:13, 137:18 **small** [1] - 67:2 130:15 starts [2] - 34:11, **SMITH** [1] - 3:21 sick [20] - 10:11, **space** [2] - 21:27, 64.23 SMITHFIELD [2] -12:17, 13:25, 15:2, 146:15 starvation [1] - 101:1 20:8, 26:23, 30:16, 2:24, 4:12 speaker [1] - 86:28 state [4] - 50:29, 43:5, 46:24, 49:3, **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 speaking [1] - 86:27 52:24, 188:14, 198:23 50:8, 77:28, 78:1, solicitor [8] - 101:28, **speaks** [1] - 75:26 **STATE**[1] - 3:27 102:3, 103:15, 150:4, 78:3, 78:10, 78:14, special [1] - 36:7 statement [84] -79:6, 80:4, 121:14 161:25, 164:8, 7:20, 30:13, 55:21, specialisms [1] sickness [5] - 10:12, 187:16, 188:17 95:18 56:18, 56:23, 56:27, SOLICITOR'S [1] -15:11, 27:4, 27:8, 59:2, 59:14, 59:18, specialists [1] -28:26 95:18 59:22, 60:27, 61:6, SOLICITORS [7] **side** [4] - 14:10, 62:15, 62:25, 63:4, specific [12] - 39:10, 20:11, 119:10, 163:27 2.11 2.18 2.23 2.30 41:16, 79:18, 92:24, 63:5, 63:28, 64:16, sight [3] - 99:3, 4:8, 4:11, 4:15 64:23, 64:26, 65:19, 95:14, 102:8, 108:27, solve [2] - 128:10, 181:2, 181:4 133:13, 135:16, 65:21, 66:29, 67:3, signalling [1] - 25:26 165:6 68:18, 70:19, 70:20, 136:26, 141:25, **solving** [1] - 134:7 signed [8] - 63:8, 154.18 71:25, 71:29, 72:22, 67:1, 86:10, 107:23, someone [6] - 25:28, specifically [6] -74:17, 81:4, 84:10, 158:22, 159:26, 125:22, 134:22, 85:19, 86:10, 88:26, 12:4, 40:28, 47:25, 159:28, 186:17 138:7, 183:9 79:7, 95:28, 192:26 93:28, 120:13, 140:8, significant [7] - 9:27, sometime [1] - 73:19 140:15, 144:12, specificity [1] -26:27, 41:4, 67:22, **sometimes** [1] - 95:4 144:22, 148:20, 96:12 129:28, 138:19, 153:5 somewhat [1] -158:23, 159:9, spectre [1] - 119:2 silence [1] - 97:9 110:18 159:13, 159:18, speculative[1] -Silicone [1] - 8:27 somewhere [6] -159:23, 159:26, 165:11 similar [1] - 108:1 59:27, 84:29, 90:18, 159:28, 160:8, 162:4, spend [2] - 164:9, simple [7] - 17:8, 93:28, 110:21, 185:11 162:8, 163:8, 163:17, 181:11 46:4, 46:9, 57:27, soon [6] - 49:8, 164:24, 164:28, **spent** [1] - 8:9 56:19, 56:23, 59:26, 113:13, 138:1, 143:29 168:10. 168:21. **spirit** [1] - 131:8 **simply** [5] - 54:28, 161:14, 161:21 168:29, 170:5, spoken [2] - 116:15, 56:3, 79:26, 80:28, sorry [19] - 12:18, 170:24, 171:4, 199:1 107:7 34:10, 40:16, 61:3, 174:22, 174:24, staff [6] - 9:29, sincere [1] - 115:21 62:5, 119:23, 120:5, 180:3, 180:11, 19:21, 20:8, 27:24, sincerely [4] - 78:20, 142:17, 142:24, 180:20, 181:24, 82:7, 82:14 143:15, 146:7, 181:21, 183:13,

184:1, 185:16, 185:21, 192:10, 192:14, 193:7, 193:20, 196:3, 196:25, 198:24, 199:8, 199:28, 200:6, 200:10 statements [3] -65:6, 89:2, 193:10 states [3] - 16:28, 22:10, 153:27 **stating** [1] - 78:15 Station [4] - 15:3, 127:26, 146:23, 151:2 **stationed** [1] - 58:2 statistical [1] - 18:24 statistics [1] - 27:19 status [4] - 34:21, 65:9, 93:11, 156:14 stayed [1] - 88:14 stead [1] - 194:4 stellar [1] - 115:26 stenographers [1] -117:23 stenographic [1] -1.26 stenography [1] -STENOGRAPHY [1] - 1:29 STEPHANIE [1] -**STEPHEN**[1] - 2:21 **steps** [5] - 82:17, 126:23, 126:24, 127:18, 169:17 **stiff** [1] - 191:3 still [9] - 37:11, 72:6, 74:21, 114:26, 147:24, 156:22, 177:7, 177:15, 181:25 stop [4] - 161:4, 175:26, 176:2, 181:28 **stopping** [1] - 91:20 story [1] - 142:7 straightforward [1] -69:28 **strands** [1] - 105:2 **Strasbourg** [1] - 8:23 strategy [1] - 189:24 Strategy [1] - 167:13 Stratus [1] - 8:15 **STREET** [3] - 2:12, 3:28. 4:3 stress [88] - 12:15, 12:27, 15:14, 16:11, 16:12, 17:12, 17:21, 18:11, 20:19, 20:24, 20:28. 21:14. 21:17.

22:8, 22:17, 26:9,

28:3, 29:20, 30:4, 30:18, 30:19, 30:24, 34:5, 36:28, 38:8, 38:24, 38:26, 39:17, 42:24, 45:1, 45:4, 45:12, 46:12, 49:4, 76:8, 76:10, 76:15, 76:20, 76:23, 76:26, 77:5, 77:8, 77:15, 78:2, 78:15, 79:8, 79:18, 81:23, 86:15, 114:14, 123:18, 125:23, 125:29, 126:8, 127:20, 127:23, 128:4, 128:13, 128:23, 129:20, 129:25, 129:27, 130:8, 130:9, 130:15, 130:23, 131:13, 131:20, 133:6, 133:7, 133:17, 134:15, 135:6, 137:23, 138:5, 149:26, 150:16, 150:27. 151:6. 151:14, 152:25, 153:24, 154:17, 154:28, 155:15, 156:12, 157:16, 195:3 Stress [1] - 17:10 stress/injury [1] -123:23 **stress/post** [1] - 33:5 stressors [2] - 130:8, 134:19 strict [1] - 21:20 strictest [1] - 101:26 strictly [1] - 50:9 strikes [1] - 126:1 strip [1] - 105:28 strongly [1] - 49:16 structure [1] - 107:2 studied [1] - 26:2 study [1] - 200:18 stuff [1] - 130:14 **style** [1] - 28:25 subject [7] - 31:12, 38:28, 95:29, 125:24, 128:15, 131:20, 133:20 submission [3] -131:2, 165:19, 167:8 submissions [1] -183:18 submit [1] - 161:9 submitted [2] -100:1, 200:8 subsequent [4] -105:14, 138:21,

183:17, 199:6

subsequently [6] -27:26, 54:25, 155:27, 190:22, 195:13, 196:20 substantial [4] -76:16, 123:19, 166:9, 194:3 substantially [2] -41:26, 144:21 substantive [2] -15:5, 139:2 substantively [1] -138:24 successfully [1] -9:3 succession [2] -8:10. 15:28 suddenly [1] - 94:22 suffering [1] - 45:12 suffice [1] - 121:26 sufficient [3] - 70:18, 106:5, 108:11 sufficiently [1] -133:8 suggest [9] - 48:24, 55:2, 57:16, 97:10, 160:12, 164:23, 168:4, 177:17, 195:11 suggested [5] -16:12. 128:27. 146:22, 148:5, 151:11 suggesting [13] -85:21, 94:3, 96:19, 112:11, 113:5, 118:24, 156:18, 160:5, 166:6, 175:9, 175:16, 175:29, 183:15 suggestion [10] -68:19, 89:9, 90:22, 105:27, 106:14, 150:18, 186:8, 186:29, 190:9, 191:1 suggests [3] - 44:26, 168:1, 186:3 suitable [2] - 33:5, 71:8 summarises [1] -22:4 summation [1] -122:28 summer [8] - 67:20, 67:22, 72:6, 73:24, 74:15, 75:11, 85:13, 87:6 summons [2] -164:7, 164:27

superintendent [30]

- 14:5, 16:8, 16:26,

20:20, 24:1, 25:9,

28:15, 28:17, 30:22, 32:23, 42:12, 44:9, 48:21, 57:21, 57:28, 60:11, 61:5, 81:2, 81:3, 81:16, 82:22, 82:23, 124:21, 124:23, 125:15, 128:15, 134:25, 135:18, 160:25, 197:7 **SUPERINTENDENT** [15] - 2:15, 3:3, 3:3, 3:4, 3:5, 3:6, 3:8, 3:9, 3:9, 3:13, 3:14, 3:17, 3:19, 3:19, 3:21 Superintendent [159] - 11:14, 11:16, 14:5, 14:28, 15:4, 15:9, 15:18, 17:16, 18:4, 18:7, 18:8, 20:18, 22:2, 23:3, 23:11, 23:20, 24:26, 29:8, 29:13, 31:5, 31:22, 31:26, 32:5, 33:9, 33:10, 33:16, 33:18, 34:16, 36:23, 36:27, 37:22, 37:29, 38:15, 38:18, 39:28, 40:2, 40:9, 42:13, 46:17, 52:24, 52:26, 53:27, 54:27, 57:4, 57:21, 58:13, 58:17, 58:22, 59:13, 59:20, 60:25, 61:4. 61:19. 64:17. 64:18, 65:20, 65:22, 66:17, 66:22, 69:9, 72:14, 74:10, 78:5, 81:16, 81:24, 81:28, 82:1, 82:2, 82:6, 85:6, 93:7, 96:5, 96:6, 96:14, 98:3, 99:23, 114:15, 126:28, 127:10. 127:25. 128:5, 128:9, 128:11, 128:17, 128:19, 128:21, 129:16, 129:22, 130:21, 132:14, 132:17, 133:15, 135:9, 135:17, 135:21, 136:11. 137:8. 138:19, 140:16, 141:19, 141:20, 144:11, 147:24, 150:11, 150:23, 151:1, 151:3, 151:12, 151:17, 152:1, 152:5, 152:20, 153:19, 155:5, 156:9, 156:15, 157:6, 158:23, 159:8, 159:17, 160:3, 161:19, 162:4,

162:13, 162:18, 162:21, 162:22, 162:26, 162:28, 163:6, 163:10, 164:25, 165:4, 166:4, 166:6, 166:14, 166:18, 174:24, 177:14, 180:12, 180:20, 194:27, 195:14, 195:16, 195:23, 195:29, 196:10, 196:14, 196:18, 197:11, 197:12, 197:13, 197:19, 198:7, 199:16, 199:26, 200:4, 200:8 superintendent's [1] - 195:27 superintendents [2] - 17:18, 21:23 superior [1] - 19:17 supplemented [1] -100:10 supplied [1] - 52:8 **support** [7] - 41:9,

42:5, 52:8, 52:29, 79:12, 188:22 supporting [2] -20:21, 32:10 **supports** [3] - 15:13, 155:20, 192:8 **suppose** [19] -46:16, 74:16, 85:11, 94:25, 123:19, 124:9, 126:19. 128:20. 129:11, 131:20, 132:23, 132:29, 140:7, 140:16, 141:15, 141:17, 148:7, 173:19, 198:25 supposed [2] -45:20, 148:26 surely [2] - 12:25, 145:17 surgery [1] - 21:4 surprise [2] - 126:16, 128:2

128:2 surprised [6] - 26:16, 126:17, 126:26, 128:6, 128:25, 162:22 surprising [1] - 134:14 survey [1] - 187:20 suspended [3] -

suspended [3] -80:15, 119:21, 119:23 suspension [1] -120:11

sustained [1] - 41:10

switch [1] - 18:6 **SWORN** [1] - 7:14 sympathy [1] -105:12 symptoms [1] -130.9 system [10] - 27:7, 44:15, 44:24, 44:25, 79:3, 79:16, 79:26, 122:26, 123:2, 142:8 systematic [1] systems [2] - 79:12, 144:27 **SÍOCHÁNA** [1] - 3:2 Séan [1] - 104:24 Síochána [26] - 6:26, 7:24, 8:1, 52:10, 52:12, 76:6, 76:28,

# T

77:3, 77:12, 79:11,

104:12, 115:27,

148:17, 149:15,

155:21, 160:2,

161:24, 165:7,

176:26, 184:28,

185:16, 187:16,

188:17

80:17, 81:21, 103:18,

**T&N** [1] - 4:2 tab [6] - 63:21, 63:24, 63:29, 64:7, 66:16, 66:29 table [3] - 50:13, 86:29, 184:24 tabs [2] - 38:16, 38:17 tail [1] - 146:1 talents [1] - 165:17 tangentially [1] -10:17 TARA[1] - 3:22 targeting [1] -148:24 tasked [1] - 144:11 tasks [1] - 95:14 team [10] - 6:22, 6:26, 6:29, 7:1, 26:27, 27:3, 84:25, 99:7, 101:7, 186:2 technical [1] - 6:20 technically [1] -21:29 Technologies [1] -8:19 telephone [6] -91:29, 92:16, 96:2,

115:4, 120:24, 133:23 telephoned [1] - 85:7 **TEMPLE** [1] - 2:31 Templemore [2] -10:5, 82:14 ten [1] - 121:25 tenants [1] - 124:4 tend [1] - 95:18 tends [2] - 95:7, 177:17 term [2] - 105:28, 124:26 terms [15] - 11:2, 25:7, 26:3, 52:11, 57:27, 62:24, 70:3, 81:28, 92:10, 124:28, 133:14, 139:7, 142:2, 174:26, 198:3 test [1] - 137:25 testimony [1] - 194:5 thankful [1] - 172:28 **THE** [21] - 1:3, 1:7, 1:8, 1:13, 2:3, 2:6, 6:1, 7:17, 12:25, 13:5, 14:17, 101:6, 101:16, 122:1, 122:5, 149:18, 191:16, 201:6, 201:11, 201:19, 201:25 themselves [2] -100:28, 115:25 **THEN** [5] - 101:16, 122:5, 149:22, 201:19, 201:25 thereabouts [1] -105:17 thereafter [5] - 8:13, 9:20, 31:10, 55:20, 117:14 thereby [1] - 77:16 therefore [3] -125:11, 162:8, 177:19 thinking [1] - 201:8 thinks [1] - 143:8 third [2] - 103:17, 134:22 thorough [1] - 19:22 three [7] - 20:29, 69:10, 69:22, 72:15, 93:23, 111:18, 124:3 three-page [1] -111:18 throughout [4] -21:23, 24:25, 85:13, 136:8 thrust [1] - 144:28 tight [1] - 93:21 timeframe [1] -148:16

timeline [2] - 138:20,

144:21 timelines [4] - 93:19, 93:22, 144:20, 174:18 timely [3] - 76:13, 80:29. 81:22 title [1] - 28:25 today [5] - 6:15, 96:25, 168:3, 198:16, 200:29 today's [3] - 29:16, 198:20, 199:16 together [6] - 57:29, 73:23, 75:1, 77:5, 82:3, 112:25 tolerating [1] - 201:1 **TOM** [4] - 3:12, 4:10, tomorrow [1] -201:21 **Tony** [5] - 31:4, 37:28. 112:20. 157:21, 162:28 Tony's [1] - 199:21 took [23] - 9:6, 24:28, 29:6, 37:5, 59:11, 70:8. 87:8. 93:15. 93:23, 93:25, 104:15, 108:19, 120:27, 126:29, 131:29, 144:22, 145:20, 145:27, 146:2, 148:3, 155:23, 160:20, 161:16 top [8] - 25:11, 36:4, 83:16, 111:24, 116:24, 116:26, 134:5, 167:27 topics [1] - 130:11 topsy [1] - 30:15 topsy-turvey[1] -30:15 total [1] - 23:18 totally [1] - 129:4 touch [4] - 88:15, 177:5, 178:16, 182:16 towards [3] - 84:10, 114:22. 182:2 TOWNPARKS [1] -2:12 trace [1] - 112:23 track [2] - 18:26, 112:22 traffic [1] - 115:11

trail [2] - 44:12,

train [1] - 104:7

tram [1] - 174:15

transaction [2] -

transcript [4] - 1:25,

132:9, 133:4

173:29

173:24, 179:2, 179:4 transcripts [1] -68:26 transmitted [3] -80:28, 173:5, 173:16 transparency [1] -97:11 transparent [1] -98:25 transparently [2] -100:16, 183:29 transpired [1] -167:15 Traumatic [1] - 17:10 traumatic [2] - 33:5, 46.12 TREACY[1] - 2:27 treated [1] - 65:11 treatment [2] -41:24, 80:13 tree [1] - 20:10 tremendous [2] -21:19, 148:17 trend [1] - 18:29 Tribunal [15] - 7:21, 11:2, 13:24, 17:3, 62:18, 68:16, 68:26, 80:24, 80:27, 93:3, 114:29, 140:20, 186:12, 192:24, 200:15 TRIBUNAL [2] - 1:2, Tribunal's [1] - 32:19 **TRIBUNALS**[1] - 1:8 tried [3] - 79:12, 112:20, 148:13 tries [1] - 183:3 triggered [2] - 16:18, 148:8 tripping [1] - 24:18 trouble [1] - 126:29 troubled [4] - 67:14, 68:17, 68:21, 140:23 TRR [3] - 13:26, 24:18, 36:17 true [4] - 121:13, 127:3, 193:27, 197:15 truism [1] - 95:20 trumped [1] - 174:20 trust [1] - 115:9 truth [1] - 167:2 truthfully [3] - 15:26, 136:14, 139:18 try [6] - 39:29, 125:9, 134:28, 147:21, 157:11, 196:21

trying [11] - 23:27,

45:15, 45:28, 118:20,

132:23, 143:25,

143:26, 163:22, 166:1, 175:26, 176:1 TUESDAY [1] -201:25 Tuesday [1] - 86:23 Tullamore [5] - 32:9, 40:3, 43:28, 155:23, 195:10 tumultuous [2] -84:15, 148:16 tuning [1] - 6:24 turn [5] - 8:17, 8:18, 14:8, 19:6, 113:19 turned [3] - 29:10, 190:29, 197:5 TURNER [1] - 2:28 turvey [1] - 30:15 twenty [1] - 121:27 two [46] - 8:10, 11:12, 12:17, 12:23, 12:26, 28:29, 33:28, 37:6, 41:21, 56:5, 61:20, 67:20, 67:22, 68:1, 68:10, 81:7, 84:12, 88:5, 91:19, 96:12, 100:20, 109:20, 112:26, 118:13, 119:7, 124:7, 128:24, 136:16, 145:2, 147:17, 151:18, 159:12, 162:9, 162:19, 167:21, 168:3, 168:19, 168:20, 168:26, 171:2, 175:7, 175:27, 185:23, 186:7, 187:17, 193:25 two-week [1] -118:13 twofold [1] - 196:2 Twomey [2] - 186:27, 186:29 **type** [6] - 70:15, 70:22, 71:6, 71:8, 105:25, 177:9 typed [5] - 60:22, 87:9, 104:18, 113:14, 160:28 Tánaiste [1] - 99:15 U

UCC [1] - 8:6 ultimately [16] -20:14, 25:9, 47:19, 59:4, 63:6, 63:19, 80:4, 90:17, 90:28, 94:19, 106:16, 148:26, 159:28,

141:27

unsatisfactory [2] -

170:19, 173:27, 183:27 umbrella [1] - 74:21 **unable** [1] - 154:22 unambiguous [1] -161:10 unavailable [3] -160:15, 163:9, 163:13 uncertainty [1] -48.5 unclear [1] - 53:28 uncomfortable [2] -33:19, 97:11 under [47] - 10:6, 10:15, 11:17, 12:11, 22:11, 23:7, 28:25, 32:22, 34:27, 50:7, 51:11, 52:11, 52:28, 53:15, 53:23, 54:14, 56:17, 56:19, 62:9, 65:4, 66:18, 70:25, 71:10, 74:21, 78:12, 80:1, 86:11, 90:20, 90:29, 92:9, 94:21, 99:7, 99:13, 106:17, 108:15, 108:27, 116:28, 117:7, 136:9, 153:28, 160:6, 162:4, 175:26, 179:1, 182:6, 182:8 **UNDER** [2] - 1:2, 1:8 understood [10] -51:24, 54:20, 101:9, 103:25, 150:9, 151:16, 156:27, 160:5, 165:29, 195:2 undertake [2] -45:26, 45:27 undertaken [2] -92:24, 195:14 undertaking [3] -31:26, 133:18, 194:28 undertook [3] - 40:9, 47:24, 195:2 undertook.. [1] -78:6 unfair [2] - 23:17, 164:12 unfit [1] - 28:3 unfolded [1] - 133:9 uninvestigated [2] -44:14, 44:23 unique [1] - 11:8 unknown [1] - 80:17 unlikely [1] - 151:22 unnecessarily [1] -186:12 unpredictable [1] -

93:9, 93:14 unsighted [2] -199:15, 201:13  $\boldsymbol{unsigned}~[7] \boldsymbol{-} 60:22,$ 60:23. 63:4. 63:5. 65:21, 163:7, 192:14 unsocial [1] - 50:1 UNTIL [1] - 201:25 unwilling [1] -109.21 **up** [51] - 8:27, 9:6, 14:12, 15:21, 16:21, 17:13, 20:18, 23:24, 25:28, 26:4, 27:9, 27:27, 28:27, 29:14, 35:26, 36:3, 46:6, 55:28, 57:25, 67:25, 72:4, 80:19, 83:15, 83:20, 90:7, 90:23, 94:12, 105:22, 108:24, 109:2, 109:9, 111:11, 114:4, 118:1, 118:2. 124:3. 127:1. 145:25, 150:13, 150:22, 155:11, 160:13, 161:3, 167:27, 183:2, 186:9, 187:11, 190:20, 191:22, 191:23 up-to-date [3] -29:14, 118:1, 118:2 update [8] - 58:18, 58:20, 60:3, 61:16, 86:1, 86:16, 108:28, 109.4 updated [5] - 120:9, 159:22. 177:1. 177:22, 178:9 urgency [1] - 86:24 urgent [2] - 34:20, 34:25 **urging** [1] - 21:22 US 121 - 8:12, 8:16 useful [2] - 51:26, 95.17 usual [2] - 22:22, 22.23 ٧

vacation [2] - 84:17, 85:16 vaguely [1] - 56:3 valiant [3] - 142:1, 160:18, 163:25 Valley [1] - 8:27 valuable [2] - 141:9, 169:23 value [3] - 54:17,

130:18, 198:2 vanguard [1] - 79:14 variety [1] - 158:10 various [16] - 19:23, 24:25, 53:20, 73:23, 79:28, 85:12, 93:18, 94:6, 112:23, 123:7, 123:9, 149:5, 158:11, 159:21, 179:9, 183:20 vein [1] - 141:25 ventilated [1] -194:15 verbal [1] - 191:1 verbatim [1] - 1:25 verge [1] - 105:10 version [1] - 152:7 versions [1] - 104:20 versus [1] - 19:4 victimisation [1] -64:28 victimising [1] -50:10 view [52] - 21:14, 30:29, 34:20, 47:20, 48:1, 49:16, 59:11, 59:19, 65:10, 65:26, 70:14, 70:27, 74:17, 124:2, 124:11, 126:6, 131:27, 132:6, 135:1, 135:11, 139:16, 141:17, 141:20, 142:6, 145:6, 150:16, 150:25, 154:15, 157:13, 168:12, 168:28, 169:5, 169:8, 169:15, 169:29, 170:8, 170:28, 171:6, 171:7, 172:2, 172:4, 173:4, 177:7, 180:19, 181:5, 181:21, 182:11, 184:23, 184:29, 196:29 views [5] - 145:2, 145:24, 173:3, 183:13, 184:24 violent [2] - 182:24, 182.26 vires [1] - 107:9 visible [1] - 84:24 vision [1] - 23:18 visit [4] - 100:10, 107:15, 126:29, 152:10 visited [1] - 29:16 visiting [1] - 169:25

vitiate [1] - 115:23

voidance [1] - 76:22

voice [1] - 85:8

voicemail [1] -

120:24

Volume [18] - 7:20, 14:9, 18:6, 22:1, 25:1, 28:8, 29:12, 33:25, 40:15, 40:16, 75:15, 84:7, 87:10, 110:4, 113:22, 122:22, 200:21, 200:23 volume [7] - 18:5, 19:6, 35:14, 37:25, 48:8, 110:3, 200:22 volumes [1] - 147:7 volunteer [1] -

#### W

wages [4] - 76:18, 77:6, 77:17, 77:20 wait [2] - 138:3, 185:26  $\pmb{\text{waiting } [2] \text{ - } 21\text{:}4,}\\$ 37:13 walk [1] - 21:3 Walsh [3] - 8:13, 8:14, 59:21 wants [3] - 87:22, 159:1, 159:16 warranted [2] -39:18, 154:29 WAS [5] - 7:14, 122:10, 149:22, 192:4. 194:20 watch [2] - 10:16, 160:6 watching [1] - 18:29 water [1] - 82:29 ways [1] - 165:20 week [7] - 84:11, 85:1, 92:15, 100:8, 118:13, 155:7, 163:13 weekly [1] - 95:15 weeks [7] - 68:1, 69:10, 69:22, 72:15, 148:27, 148:28, 151:18 Welcome [2] - 14:15, 14.19 welcome [1] - 65:7 welfare [3] - 29:17, 113:2, 113:29 wellbeing [3] -29:17, 41:5, 41:10 WELLINGTON [1] -2:31 Western [3] - 8:13, 8:15, 188:22 WESTMEATH[1] -

Westmeath [5] -

29:22, 39:20, 152:27, 102:20 155:2, 155:18 WITNESS [12] - 5:2, Wheatley [36] -7:17, 12:25, 13:5, 14:28, 18:4, 18:7, 14:17, 101:6, 122:1, 18:11, 20:18, 21:13, 149:18, 191:16, 201:6, 201:11, 201:19 21:29, 24:3, 29:9, 33:10, 36:27, 37:23, witness [9] - 6:15, 42:8, 43:24, 44:4, 87:20, 100:20, 46:17, 47:28, 126:28, 165:11, 165:13, 128:19, 130:2, 135:9, 165:26, 175:27, 135:17, 135:21, 176:10 136:11, 137:8, witnessed [2] -150:11, 150:23, 65:19, 193:8 152:1, 152:5, 152:20, witnesses [1] - 49:22 153:19, 156:9, wonder [3] - 122:15, 156:16, 157:6. 126:9, 195:1 197:11, 197:13 wondered [1] - 62:16 **WHEATLEY**[1] - 3:4 wondering [9] -Wheatley's [3] -23:22. 30:14. 36:10. 43:24, 133:15, 194:24 36:22, 37:2, 45:25, whereabouts [1] -46:16, 71:28, 116:21 80.16 word [6] - 122:25, whereas [1] - 195:15 125:12, 129:29, whereby [2] -130:29, 150:13, 102:11, 102:16 168.18 wherein [4] - 21:7, words [7] - 125:15, 106:28, 145:20, 125:26, 134:24, 176:25 135:15, 135:26, whistleblower [2] -138:5, 146:22 131:11, 131:17 work.. [1] - 25:23 whistleblowers [3] workable [1] -131:15, 141:22 196:23 WHITE [1] - 3:11 workplace [6] whole [8] - 101:5, 15:13, 25:19, 25:23, 108:29, 111:8, 26:5, 41:9, 169:22 118:15, 122:27, works [1] - 137:5 140:5, 142:7, 142:11 worry [3] - 179:8, wholly [1] - 47:20 185:26, 200:20 wide [2] - 65:27, worth [1] - 175:3 168:7 wringing [1] - 145:13 widely [1] - 150:9 writ [1] - 81:26 wider [4] - 61:23, write [3] - 55:2, 106:8, 182:9, 182:20 101:26, 128:15 willing [2] - 22:9, writing [14] - 18:11, 153:26 19:14, 21:12, 22:14, window [2] - 68:11, 77:28, 97:4, 104:1, 110:22 108:12, 117:28, wish [14] - 6:23, 133:28, 177:4, 6:24, 32:13, 43:1, 187:25, 188:7, 190:3 43:7, 51:4, 51:9, 52:2, written [28] - 19:7, 52:12, 52:25, 99:19, 19:11, 20:18, 28:15, 162:1, 176:24, 188:14 29:9, 31:13, 49:6, wished [2] - 63:18, 51:5, 71:28, 86:14, 82:25 91:6. 96:26. 97:2. wishes [4] - 56:18, 97:4, 97:25, 98:19, 103:21, 158:15, 98:21, 99:1, 103:28,

107:25, 117:23,

127:11, 146:20,

147:13, 176:29,

125:26, 127:2,

166:16

201:19

WITHDREW [1] -

withheld/lost [1] -

188:25 wrote [21] - 24:29, 37:23, 42:9, 42:27, 50:27, 52:19, 56:7, 59:27, 89:20, 103:27, 110:16, 111:5, 112:11, 113:12, 116:11, 116:15, 119:20, 156:17, 187:1, 187:6, 191:3

## X

**Xs** [1] - 12:21

## Υ

**year** [13] - 23:20, 24:7, 24:24, 31:17, 67:24, 77:22, 93:6, 93:26, 109:1, 117:26, 153:21, 153:23 year's [1] - 197:4 years [3] - 8:9, 93:24, 115:27 yesterday [2] - 89:2, 176:24 yourself [11] - 31:29, 33:16, 39:27, 75:10, 84:8, 91:7, 113:20, 121:23, 129:10, 174:5, 199:1 **Ys** [1] - 12:21

#### Ζ

**zero** [1] - 174:4

# É

**ÉABHALL**[1] - 2:30 **ÉIREANN**[2] - 1:4, 1:5 **Élan**[2] - 100:17, 146:5

## Ó

**Ó** [4] - 3:7, 83:23, 103:29, 186:26