TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY INTO PROTECTED DISCLOSURES MADE UNDER
THE PROTECTED DISCLOSURES ACT 2014 AND CERTAIN OTHER
MATTERS FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS PASSED BY DÁIL ÉIREANN AND
SEANAD ÉIREANN ON 16 FEBRUARY 2017

ESTABLISHED BY INSTRUMENT MADE BY THE MINISTER FOR JUSTICE AND EQUALITY UNDER THE TRIBUNALS OF INQUIRY (EVIDENCE) ACT 1921, ON 17 FEBRUARY 2017, AS AMENDED ON 7 DECEMBER 2018

CHAIRMAN OF DIVISION (P): MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

<u>HEARING HELD IN DUBLIN CASTLE</u>

<u>ON MONDAY, 7TH FEBRUARY 2022 - DAY 162</u>

162

Gwen Malone Stenography Services certify the following to be a verbatim transcript of their stenographic notes in the above-named action.

GWEN MALONE STENOGRAPHY SERVICES

APPEARANCES

SOLE MEMBER:

MR. JUSTICE SEAN RYAN, FORMER PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF

APPFAL

REGI STRAR: MR. PETER KAVANAGH

FOR THE TRIBUNAL:

MR. DIARMAID McGUINNESS SC MR. PATRICK MARRINAN SC MS. SINÉAD McGRATH BL

FOR SERGEANT WILLIAM HUGHES:

MR. MICHAEL LYNN SC MR. COLM O'DWYER SC MS. NÓRA NÍ LOINSIGH BL MR. FINN KEYES BL

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. DARA ROBINSON MS. AOIFE KAVANAGH SHEEHAN & PARTNERS 130 CUNNINGHAM HOUSE FRANCIS STREET THE LIBERTIES DUBLIN 8

FOR THE COMMISSIONER OF AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA:

MR. SHANE MURPHY SC MR. MÍCHEÁL P. O'HIGGINS SC MR. DONAL MCGUINNESS BL MS. SHELLEY HORAN BL MS. KATE EGAN BL

INSTRUCTED BY:

MR. CORMAC FORRISTAL
MS. MAIREAD BURKE
CHIEF STATE SOLICITOR'S OFFICE
OSMOND HOUSE
LITTLE SHIP STREET
DUBLIN 8

FOR ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER FINTAN FANNING: MR. PAUL MCGARRY SC

MR. JOHN FERRY BL

INSTRUCTED BY: MR. ANDREW FREEMAN

SEAN COSTELLO & COMPANY SOLICITORS

HALI DAY HOUSE 32 ARRAN QUAY SMI THFI ELD DUBLIN 7

FOR GARDA NYHAN: MR. JAMES KANE BL

INSTRUCTED BY:

MS. ELIZABETH HUGHES MS. ÉABHALL NÍ CHEALLACHÁI HUGHES MURPHY SOLICITORS 13 WELLINGTON QUAY TEMPLE BAR DUBLIN

TAKE NOTICE - PURSUANT TO ORDER DATED THE 1ST DAY OF FEBRUARY 2022 OF MR. JUSTICE RYAN OF THE DISCLOSURES TRIBUNAL

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the identification by name of Mr. 'A' or of any other suspect whether directly or indirectly in connection with investigations undertaken by An Garda Síochána is hereby prohibited;

AND IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT any interested party in this matter be at liberty to apply on the giving of 2 days notice in writing to the tribunal.

INDEX

WITNESS	PAGE
SERGEANT WILLIAM HUGHES	
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. MCGARRY	6
CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. O'HIGGINS	21

1		THE HEARING RESUMED ON MONDAY, THE 7TH FEBRUARY 2022 AS	_
2		FOLLOWS:	
3			
4		CHAIRMAN: Good morning.	
5		MR. MARRINAN: I'll recall Sergeant Hughes, please.	10:30
6		CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much, yes.	
7		THE WITNESS: Morning.	
8		MR. MARRINAN: Chairman, Mr. McGarry is going to	
9		cross-examine.	
10		CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much. Yes, Mr. McGarry.	10:30
11			
12		SERGEANT WILLIAM HUGHES WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY	
13		MR. McGARRY AS FOLLOWS:	
14		MR. McGARRY: Thank you, Chairman. I am grateful to My	
15		Friends for permitting me to ask questions out of turn.	10:30
16	Q.	Sergeant Hughes, my name is Paul McGarry and I am one	
17		the barristers representing former Assistant	
18		Commissioner Fintan Fanning and I just have a few	
19		questions for you arising from your statement and your	
20		evidence to the Tribunal.	10:31
21	Α.	Thank you.	
22	1 Q.	Can I ask you to look at page 59, this is your omnibus	
23		statement to the Tribunal?	
24		CHAIRMAN: Can everybody hear Mr. McGarry? Good, no	
25		problem. Mr. McGarry, just a tiny bit closer to the	10:31
26		microphone. Maybe I am the only one	
27		MR. McGARRY: Thank you, Chairman.	
28		CHAIRMAN: Page 59 you said?	
29	2 Q.	MR. McGARRY: Yeah, and you'll see there, Sergeant	

1		Hughes, at line 908, there is just a passage I want to	
2		read out, and I just have a few questions for you	
3		arising from that.	
4	Α.	Yes, indeed.	
5	3 Q.	You say: "In addition to the matters I have set out	10:31
6		above in this statement, I believe that I was also	
7		targeted and discredited during the drawing up of my	
8		retirement file. This was undertaken by Assistant	
9		Commissioner HRM (Fintan Fanning). I say this in the	
10		context of all the circumstances leading up to this	10:31
11		point and that there were many unresolved serious	
12		matters which were serious and pertinent issues which	
13		should have been included in the retirement summation	
14		report, however, these were not included.	
15		Nevertheless, the decision to retire me on medical	10:32
16		grounds was actively pursued by Garda management	
17		despite these matters being unresolved at that time.	
18		Completely worn down by the process I accepted this	
19		course, but strongly believe that I had been	
20		constructively dismissed from An Garda Síochána. I	10:32
21		believe this was the ultimate targeting of me BY Garda	
22		management."	
23			
24		Now, I just have a few questions arising from what's	

25

26

27

28

29

Now, I just have a few questions arising from what's said there. In the first instance, you say that you believe you were targeted and discredited during the drawing up of your retirement file and that this was by Assistant Commissioner Fanning. Can you just explain to us what you mean by that?

1	Α.	Well, what I mean is that the retirement was drawn up,
2		the retirement file was drawn up seemingly on medical
3		on the medical evidence alone, and that the matters
4		which we have referred to previously in relation to
5		management not looking after the non-medical issues, I $_{10:3}$
6		don't think they had substantive reports in that
7		regard, and that I felt that the retirement file
8		possibly should have included consideration of the

10 4 Q. So you say that the decision to -- that ultimately the 10:33
11 decision that was taken should have taken into account
12 factors other than the medical issues, is that right?

non-medical issues as well as the medical issues.

13 A. That's correct.

9

- 14 5 Q. Okay. And is that then what you mean when you say
 15 "serious and pertinent issues which should have been 10:33
 16 included in the summation report, however they were not included..."?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 6 Q. And then, you say: "The decision to retire me was
 20 actively pursued by Garda management despite these
 21 matters being unresolved at that time." What do you
 22 mean by unresolved?
- A. Well, again, just referring back to the reports that

 HRM should have received in relation to the non-medical

 issues were not included in the summations behind the

 processes in connection with the retirement process.

10:34

27 Q. But we saw on Friday, when you were giving evidence in 28 response to questions from Mr. Marrinan, there were a 29 number of medical reports submitted, two I think from

1	vour	own	GP.	Dr.	Keenan.	vou	remember	those?

- 2 A. That's correct.
- 8 Q. And in those reports your own GP was recommending that
- 4 you retire on medical grounds?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- 6 9 Q. And I think there was even a report from an independent

10:34

10:35

- 7 psychiatrist at that point, isn't that right?
- 8 A. That's correct I think, yes, yes.
- 9 10 Q. But Dr. Keenan was your doctor and she was the person
- suggesting that you needed to retire because you were
- unfit to continue in position, isn't that right?
- 12 A. That's correct. I went to see Dr. Keenan, to express
- my complete exhaustion at the process that went before.
- 14 11 Q. No, and I appreciate that the CMO and the assistant CMO
- were involved, but at the end of the day your own
- 16 general practitioner was advising you that you needed
- 17 to retire?
- 18 A. Yes. That's after many years of trying to pursue these
- 19 matters with management and with the CMO there in
- relation to the non-medical issues which weren't
- 21 resolved.
- 22 12 Q. And then you say "completely worn down by the process I
- accepted this course but strongly believe that I had
- been constructively dismissed."
- Now, did you ever do anything about the suggestion that 10:35
- 26 you were constructively dismissed?
- A. With the Garda management?
- 28 13 Q. Yes.
- 29 A. I wrote to various commissioners following my

2			retirement and gave sent reports to them in that regard.	
	1.4	•	-	
3	14	Q.	And did you ever bring legal proceedings asserting that	
4		_	you had been constructively dismissed?	
5		Α.	I did not.	10:35
6	15	Q.	I see. And then, can I ask you to move forward just a	
7			few pages, Mr. Kavanagh, to page 62. This is the text	
8			of your letter to Mr. Justice Charlton then setting out	
9			some of the concerns you have. And just at page 62	
10			you'll see there in the second paragraph, you say:	10:36
11				
12			"I haven't received legal assistance in drawing up the	
13			content of this document."	
14				
1 5			That's correct, isn't it?	10:36
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	16	Q.	And then can I ask you to go forward to page 74. And	
18			you'll see in the third paragraph it says:	
19				
20			"In my case a decision was made to cut my pay after six	10:37
21			months absence even though my absence had not been	
22			investigated by local management."	
23				
24			Do you see that?	
25		Α.	I do.	10:37
26	17	Q.	"This action was completely in contravention of the	
27			Code Regulations."	
28				
29			And again I'm going to show you the Code Regulations	

1			just in a moment but I'm suggesting to you that that's	
2			not correct; that the issue with regard to pay was	
3			related to the question as to whether you were unfit	
4			for work because of an injury on duty or otherwise,	
5			isn't that right?	10:37
6		Α.	Yes, the Code Regulations provide for that, yes.	
7	18	Q.	And then you say:	
8				
9			"Management was aware of this factor but to no avail.	
10			I believe that this was yet another tactic condone by	10:37
11			Garda management, a way of starving a whistleblower	
12			back to work."	
13				
14			Again, I am asking you, are you referring to Assistant	
15			Commissioner, or former Assistant Commissioner Fanning	10:37
16			when you say "starving a whistleblower back to work"?	
17		Α.	Well, I would say that the system, the system, that's	
18			the way the system worked, in that I was making very	
19			serious allegations to Garda management, I wasn't being	
20			listened to as far as I could see, and the censure, the	10:38
21			sanction of my pay there was a factor in my stress and	
22			the work related stress. And I wasn't probably	
23			referring specifically to Assistant Commissioner	
24			Fanning, but overall, that this was what the system had	
25			perpetrated.	10:38
26	19	Q.	And then, the next page, at the top of the next page,	
27			page 75, you say:	
28				
29			"I can provide evidence to the Tribunal of senior Garda	

Τ			management's highly irregular dealings and lack of	
2			compliance with the Garda Occupational Health	
3			Department's processes and recommendations that issued	
4			for bringing resolution to the matters affecting me."	
5				10:38
6			Then you say:	
7				
8			"I can prove that reports from Garda management in	
9			relation to my case contained falsehoods and	
10			mi si nformati on. "	10:39
11				
12			Can I just ask you to identify where in the reports you	
13			say there is falsehoods?	
14		Α.	Well, specifically the part of the communications	
15			between management, local management and the HRM was	10:39
16			that I was refusing all offers by management to meet	
17			face-to-face, and that I insisted that communication	
18			with me would be by telephone, that was completely	
19			false.	
20	20	Q.	And is that the extent of the falsehoods that you are	10:39
21			referring to?	
22		Α.	That would be the primary factor, yes.	
23	21	Q.	And again I need to ask you, when you talk about	
24			"senior Garda management" there, are you again, I need	
25			to ask you, referring to former Assistant Commissioner	10:39
26			Fanning?	
27		Α.	The falsehoods, I'd say that were sent up to HRM were	
28			not sent by Assistant Commissioner Fanning.	
29	22	Q.	He is not responsible for the allegation that's	

1			contained here?	
2		Α.	He is not responsible for receiving or for those	
3			messages that were sent to him.	
4	23	Q.	Because, what you have said a moment ago, you say "the	
5			CMO had been falsely informed" You see, you give an	10:40
6			example: "An example of falsehood is contained in the	
7			correspondence", which you have just told us, you had	
8			been "falsely informed by senior ranking management	
9			that I was refusing to meet with local management", but	
10			you say that that wasn't Assistant Commissioner	10:40
11			Fanning, is that right?	
12		Α.	That's correct.	
13	24	Q.	And then if I could ask you to look at page 78, in the	
14			middle of the page, third paragraph, I should say, you	
15			say:	10:40
16				
17			"I believe that I have identified gaping holes in the	
18			administrative procedures leading to my medical	
19			discharge. These matters are currently under review at	
20			\ensuremath{HRM} but I can safely say that the documents that I have	10:40
21			received clearly highlight huge discrepancies in the	
22			administrative processes leading to my retirement."	
23				
24			Is that again a reference to the same thing, the	
25			non-face-to-face meetings or is there something else?	10:41
26		Α.	Well, in the fact that the reports, the investigative	
27			reports concerning my absence on illnesses were not	
28			procured by HRM and not sent to HRM by local	
29			management, despite numerous requests in that regard	

1			from HRM.	
2	25	Q.	Just on the next page, page 79, the second last	
3			paragraph, you'll see:	
4				
5			"In 2012 a new"	10:41
6				
7			Your words.	
8				
9			" Assistant Commissioner HRM seems to have identified	
10			the fact that my protracted absences from the workplace	10:41
11			had not been investigated by local management."	
12				
13			Who are you referring to there?	
14		Α.	Specifically Assistant Commissioner Fanning and, to a	
15			lesser degree, Assistant Commissioner Clancy at an	10:41
16			earlier juncture.	
17	26	Q.	But Assistant Commissioner Clancy moved away from HRM	
18			in 2009 and Assistant Commissioner took over in 2009?	
19		Α.	That's correct.	
20	27	Q.	But it couldn't be a reference to Assistant	10:42
21			Commissioner Clancy if it's in 2012 when you refer to a	
22			new Assistant Commissioner?	
23		Α.	Yes, indeed. In the correspondences are numerous	
24			there from Assistant Commissioner Fanning to local	
25			management, and he made great efforts there to actually	10:42
26			try to secure the investigative reports.	
27	28	Q.	Can I ask you to look at page 6703, please. This is	
28			the injury on duty portion of the Garda Code, do you	
29			see that, 11.37?	

1		Α.	I do.	
2	29	Q.	And I don't want to dwell on that but there is a HQ	
3			directive, which was signed by Assistant Commissioner	
4			Fanning, which is at page 6755 6753 is where it	
5			starts. Are you familiar with that?	10:43
6		Α.	Yes, I have seen that document.	
7	30	Q.	And on page 3, which is at 6755, you'll see the process	
8			in relation to injury on duty classification, do you	
9			see that, bottom of the page, just at the very bottom	
10			of the page you'll see "he notes that a marginal note	10:43
11			should be made at Code 11.37". So that's what this is	
12			referring to, do you see that?	
13		Α.	I just see a marginal note should be made at Code 37,	
14			yes.	
15	31	Q.	Yes. And it's about what's written above and I just	10:43
16			want to look at that for a moment. It says:	
17				
18			"Where there is any doubt"	
19				
20			And that's bold underlined.	10:44
21				
22			" that any injury on duty occurred divisional"	
23			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, where is this?	
24			MR. McGARRY: Sorry, it's page 6755 on page 3,	
25			Chairman.	10:44
26			CHAIRMAN: Page 3, yes. Where are you?	
27			MR. McGARRY: The heading is "Injury on duty	
28			classification".	
29			CHAIRMAN: Yes, I am sorry, thanks very much. I didn't	

1			see that. I hadn't got that in front of me, yeah?	
2	32	Q.	MR. McGARRY: So, it says:	
3				
4			"Where there is any doubt that an injury on duty	
5			occurred, divisional officers should refer the matter	10:44
6			to Assistant Commissioner HRM who will seek the advices	
7			of the CMO. The CMO will take into account all	
8			relevant information in arriving at his/her advices.	
9				
10			The decision regarding injury on duty will be based on	10:44
11			- a complete investigation file into accident;	
12			- management views and recommendation;	
13			- assessment and opinion of the CMO.	
14				
15			Ordinary III ness/Injury on Duty: Where there is a	10:44
16			doubt"	
17				
18			again	
19				
20			" as to whether the member's sickness absence is due	10:44
21			to ordinary illness or an injury on duty, the member's	
22			absence will be treated as ordinary illness pending a	
23			decision on the classification of the injury and in	
24			particular the CMO's advice."	
25				10:45
26			And I am suggesting to you, Sergeant Hughes, that the	
27			CMO's advice in this matter is absolutely crucial.	
28		Α.	In relation yes, in relation to the medical matters,	
29			yes.	

1	33	Q.	Yes. And when you look at the, at all of the documents	
2			that we opened on Thursday and Friday, that Assistant	
3			Commissioner Fanning was involved with, I'm suggesting	
4			to you that at all times, he was making it clear that	
5			he required the input and advice from the CMO in order	10:45
6			to process matters or to take decisions?	
7		Α.	Sorry, I thought there was the CMO was looking to	
8			HRM, Assistant Commissioner HRM for the for his	
9			input.	
10	34	Q.	No, what was happening was and we can go through it	10:45
11			if we need to but what I'm suggesting to you is that	
12			all of the documentation shows that the Assistant	
13			Commissioner HRM was facilitating, on the one hand, the	
14			CMO to get information from local management	
15		Α.	Yes.	10:46
16	35	Q.	to provide information to the CMO?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	36	Q.	And he was acting as a conduit, if you like, for	
19			information to go to the CMO in order to assist the CMO	
20			in providing the advice that he needed to provide?	10:46
21		Α.	That would sound right, yes.	
22	37	Q.	So ultimately, there wasn't, I suggest to you, any	
23			deviation from this HQ directive, which as we know is a	

27 A. Yes. What the first paragraph there says "Where there is any doubt that an injury on duty occurred the divisional officer should refer the matter to the

proved to be crucial, isn't that right?

24

25

26

marginal note on 11.37, there wasn't any deviation from

10:46

that process, because the CMO's advice ultimately

1			Assistant Commissioner HRM." And I think between the	
2			two stools there in relation to injury on duty or	
3			ordinary illness, there has to be reports received by	
4			Commissioner HRM to facilitate a full decision in that	
5			regard.	10:47
6	38	Q.	Yes, but I am suggesting to you that that document	
7			clearly shows that it's the CMO's advice that's crucial	
8			in determining the issue?	
9		Α.	Well, it would be crucial from the medical matters	
10			point of view.	10:47
11	39	Q.	Yes.	
12		Α.	But, overall, any decisions going forward then would	
13			have to include the non-medical reports on the	
14			non-medical matters.	
15	40	Q.	But what this is concerned with is, whether the illness	10:47
16			is an ordinary illness or an injury on duty?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	41	Q.	So I'm suggesting to you that it's entirely proper and	
19			appropriate that that would be done by taking the	
20			advice of the CMO, or relying on the advice of the CMO?	10:47
21		Α.	Yes, on the medical matters, yes.	
22	42	Q.	Yes. But is there any is the question as to whether	
23			the illness is an ordinary illness or an injury on duty	
24			anything other than a medical matter?	
25		Α.	Oh, yes. There would have to be reports submitted by	10:47
26			local management in relation to the non-medical	
27			matters, I think, before full determination can be	

29 43 Q. I see. There was just one other matter and it's not

28

made.

1		particularly important. At page 4262, Mr. Kavanagh, I	
2		think there was a suggestion there is a handwritten	
3		note at the bottom right-hand corner of that document,	
4		and it was suggested I think that that was Assistant	
5		Commissioner Fanning's note, but in fact I'm instructed	10:48
6		that that's superintendent Chief Superintendent	
7		Grogan's note. Again, I don't think anything turns on	
8		that.	
9		Thank you.	
10	Α.	Thank you.	10:49
11		CHAIRMAN: Very good, you are finished now,	
12		Mr. McGarry?	
13		MR. McGARRY: Yes, Chairman.	
14		CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Yes?	
15		MS. McGRATH: Chairman, you'll recall from our	10:49
16		discussion this morning that there is some material	
17		that Mr. O'Higgins wants to have circulated before he	
18		starts his cross-examination.	
19		CHAIRMAN: Certainly.	
20		MS. McGRATH: we are trying to resolve that problem at	10:49
21		the moment, and Ms. Doolan and Ms. Walsh are just gone	
22		upstairs to print hard copies and they should be back	
23		in about five minutes, if I don't know if	
24		Mr. Kavanagh has resolved it electronically?	
25		If you just give me a moment, Chairman, just for one	10:50
26		second.	
27		CHAIRMAN: There should be no problem because I have a	
28		copy here and I am happy for that to be circulated and	
29		I am sure that Tribunal counsel can circulate theirs	

1	and we'll get copies in due course.	
2	MS. McGRATH: I am just going to check something with	
3	with Mr. Kavanagh. Just one moment. No, they haven't	
4	been added electronically, so it might take about five	
5	minutes, if that's okay.	10:50
6	CHAIRMAN: Well, I think we'll proceed. Mr. O'Higgins,	
7	can you leave can you leave this is PULSE	
8	records? Sorry, Mr. O'Higgins, can I address you?	
9	MR. O' HI GGI NS: Sorry, my microphone is misbehaving	
10	slightly.	10:50
11	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, just a moment. We asked that you	
12	asked that certain material, i.e. PULSE records, be	
13	circulated before your cross-examination, isn't that	
14	right?	
15	MR. O'HIGGINS: That's right.	10:51
16	CHAIRMAN: And we assembled the PULSE records and	
17	collected them, but because of glitches in our system	
18	we weren't able to put them electronically so that they	
19	would be immediately available. Can you leave that	
20	matter over until after lunch when we can hand out	10:51
21	when we can hand over copies of the PULSE records to	
22	counsel for Sergeant Hughes so that everybody now	
23	everything is gone off so that everything is that	
24	okay with you?	
25	MR. O'HIGGINS: No difficulty at all, Chairman.	10:51
26	CHAIRMAN: Right. And, Mr. Lynn, you have no problem	
27	with that? You haven't seen the stuff. There is not	
28	that much in it. I don't know how significant it is or	
29	how but it would be useful for you to have an	

1			opportunity of looking at it over lunch, there is not a	
2			lot you can do about it, I dare say, but anyway, we'll	
3			arrange for that. And so, we'll proceed on that basis.	
4			And Ms. McGrath, if copies, if hard copies arrive,	
5			we'll simply distribute them.	10:52
6			MS. McGRATH: They are actually here, Judge, just now.	
7			CHAIRMAN: They have arrived? For goodness sake,	
8			problem solved, Ms. McGrath, it's efficiency more than	
9			anybody could demand. Okay. So, now we're in the	
10			position, Mr. O'Higgins, you can proceed, it seems to	10:52
11			me, in accordance with whatever you you want, including	
12			referring to PULSE records, if and when they are to be	
13			handed to the witness, they will be handed to the	
14			witness.	
15				10:52
16			THE WITNESS WAS CROSS-EXAMINED BY MR. O'HIGGINS AS	
17			FOLLOWS:	
18	44	Q.	MR. O'HIGGINS: Thank you, Chairman. Sergeant Hughes,	
19			Mícheál O'Higgins for An Garda Síochána.	
20		Α.	Hello.	10:53
21	45	Q.	Now, can I just begin, and we needn't spend too long on	
22			this because Mr. Marrinan brought you over much of this	
23			material and it's not directly it's not a matter	
24			that the Tribunal is investigating directly, but just	
25			to set context, can I bring you back to the end of	10:53
26			2004?	
27		Α.	Yes.	
28	46	Q.	I think it's the case that in December of 2004, and	
29			where I'm going with this is just to get a bit of	

- 1 context of when you first met Baiba Saulite, all right?
- 2 A. Yes, indeed.
- 3 47 Q. So in December 2004 Baiba Saulite, I think, obtained a

10:53

10:54

- 4 barring order in the District Court?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- 6 48 Q. And the gist of the basis upon which she obtained it
- 7 was the position that she had been subjected to
- 8 violence by her partner?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 49 Q. And I think on the 10th December, she was accompanied
- 11 by her solicitor, John Hennessy?
- 12 A. That's correct.
- 13 50 Q. And went before, I think, it was district Judge Bryan
- 14 Smyth, is that right?
- 15 A. Yes, indeed.
- 16 51 O. And he directed that an order be made -- that an order
- be served on Mr. A directing him to produce the
- 18 children at Swords District Court on a later date in
- 19 December?
- 20 A. That's correct.
- 21 52 Q. And I think, broadly speaking now, just dealing with
- 22 matters generally, that's appraisal well where you come
- 23 into the picture?
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 53 Q. And you served that order on Mr. A, you have indicated
- in your materials, and he failed to attend at Swords
- 27 District Court, and a warrant had to issue for his
- 28 arrest?
- 29 A. That's correct.

- 1 54 Q. And it's my understanding then that on a later date in
- 2 December, I think it was the 2sst December, he was
- found to be in contempt of court?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 55 Q. Can I just ask you: did you give evidence in relation

10:55

10:55

- 6 to that before the district judge?
- 7 A. I did not, no.
- 8 56 Q. And in one of your reports, it indicates that around
- 9 this time you met I think John Hennessy and you
- 10 certainly met Baiba Saulite?
- 11 A. Yes, I think he was arrested and put in custody and
- taking to Dolphin House Court in Dublin here on the
- 24th December 2004. And I became aware that the garda
- 14 who was in charge of the case had difficulties on that
- particular day, and I was in Swords Garda Station when
- I heard of these difficulties so I decided to proceed
- 17 to Dolphin House Court, as I had some knowledge of the
- 18 case.
- 19 57 Q. Yes. And as we move then into January of 2005, you and
- your superintendent, Noel McLoughlin, obtained an order 10:55
- 21 pursuant to I think it is section 42 of the Criminal
- 22 Justice Act of 1999 for a warrant for the arrest of
- 23 Mr. A?
- A. Yes, from prison, yes.
- 25 58 Q. And I think the purpose of that was to enable his
- 26 questioning in relation to the abduction of the
- 27 children?
- 28 A. Correct.
- 29 59 Q. And I think that thereafter, in January, Mr. A was

- 1 arrested, was it by yourself?
- 2 A. Sorry, he remained in custody. We brought him back to
- 3 Cloverhill Prison and he remained in custody until he
- 4 until he purged his contempt --
- 5 60 Q. Sorry, I said arrested, you are quite right to correct

10:56

- 6 me. He was questioned in relation to the abduction
- 7 investigation?
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 61 Q. And I think you yourself participated in that, I think
- it was in the second interview with Garda McNally, you
- 11 asked him questions pertaining to the abduction
- 12 allegation?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 62 Q. And you were aware, weren't you, that Mr. A continued,
- as his partner complained, you were aware that he
- 16 continued to insert -- to assert considerable influence
- 17 over Ms. Saulite, isn't that right?
- 18 A. Oh yes, he did, yes.
- 19 63 Q. And this brought about a situation where Ms. Saulite
- informed Gardaí that she and Mr. A had arranged to meet 10:57
- 21 to try and bring a conclusion to the ongoing family law
- 22 dispute that they had?
- 23 A. That would be correct, yes.
- 24 64 Q. And I think subsequently then, as January moved, as we
- 25 moved towards the end of January, the 19th January, you 10:57
- became aware that Ms. Saulite was offering to withdraw
- her statements of complaint against Mr. A, isn't that
- 28 right?
- 29 A. That's correct.

т.	0.5	Q.	And am I correct, you met her at swords darda station	
2			over approximately a two-day period, around this time,	
3			where she was effectively seeking to withdraw her	
4			statement?	
5		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	10:57
6	66	Q.	And am I correct that Mr. A was in fact with her on	
7			this occasion, and you took the common sense and	
8			sensible approach of insisting that he remove himself	
9			from the environs of the station?	
10		Α.	That's correct.	10:58
11	67	Q.	And I think through your efforts, you were able to	
12			persuade Ms. Saulite that she should not withdraw her	
13			complaints and that had that bore fruit, those	
14			efforts, and she indicated that she was resolute in her	
15			intent to pursue the complaint?	10:58
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	68	Q.	So as we move the timeline on then to considerably	
18			later that year, I suppose one of the standout events	
19			in 2005 pertaining to the investigation was that	
20			directions were received in August from the Director of	10:58
21			Public Prosecutions, isn't that right?	
22		Α.	I think it might have been May, but I'd it was	
23			mid-2005 anyway.	
24	69	Q.	Well perhaps they were implemented in August. In any	
25			event, was it yourself who charged Mr. A and brought	10:59
26			him before the Bridewell District Court?	
27		Α.	I did indeed, yes.	
28	70	0.	And on that occasion. I think did he threaten you on	

that occasion in the environs of the court?

29

- 1 A. Yes, he made veiled threats towards us but no threat
- 2 that was specific to us.
- 3 71 Q. And he had to be restained by your colleague, Garda
- 4 Nyhan?
- 5 A. Yes, myself and Garda Nyhan.
- 6 72 Q. You both had to restrain him?
- 7 A. Well, we were holding on to him when he was in custody

10:59

11:00

- 8 in the Bridewell prison section.
- 9 73 Q. We needn't look at it now because -- oh, in fact it's
- 10 been circulated. I think there is a -- you took the
- initiative of putting up an entry on PULSE, isn't that
- right, on the 25th August 2005?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 74 Q. Referable to this matter, isn't that so? It's a little
- hard to see the date, but if we -- [document handed to 11:00
- the witness]
- 17 A. Sorry, which page?
- 18 75 Q. CHAIRMAN: Have you got that book of documents? It's
- page 4. And you'll see the date about half-way down
- 20 over towards the right-hand side, which gives date and
- time, do you see that?
- 22 A. 4/1/2005, yes.
- 23 76 Q. CHAIRMAN: No, the next one. The fourth document, at
- least in my book the fourth document in is 25/08/2005.
- Time: 12:06. Is that the one?
- 26 A. Sorry, are we saying --
- MR. O'HIGGINS: There may be a few of them -- this may
- 28 assist sergeant --
- 29 77 Q. CHAIRMAN: Hold on, Mr. O'Higgins, wait until -- wait

- 1 until everybody has the right document, particularly
- 2 Sergeant Hughes. Sergeant Hughes, start from the
- 3 beginning again.
- 4 A. Yes, indeed.
- 5 78 Q. CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, please allow me. Go to the
- 6 fourth page
- 7 A. Fourth page.
- 8 79 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay?
- 9 A. Okay.
- 10 80 Q. CHAIRMAN: Find a date on the right-hand side. You

11:01

11 · 02

- should be familiar with this --
- 12 A. I am.
- 13 81 Q. CHAIRMAN: -- half-way down: 25/08/2005.
- 14 A. Yes, I have it here. Thank you Mr. Chairman.
- 15 82 Q. CHAIRMAN: Very good. Now Mr. O'Higgins.
- MR. O' HI GGI NS: Thank you Chairman.
- 17 83 Q. Do you see there in the narrative box which you would
- have written in, isn't that right?
- 19 A. Yes, indeed.
- 20 84 Q. And what I have here on page 8457, there is a reference 11:02
- 21 to the directions of the DPP, do you see that?
- 22 A. Yes, I do.
- 23 85 Q. "[blank] Mr. A was formally charged before court 46
- 24 with abducting his two children." And the names are
- 25 blanked out appropriately. "See previous intelligence
- reports. " Isn't that right?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 86 Q. "Remanded in custody on the 27th August 2005. He
- 29 made -- "I think you have used this expression already:

1			"He made veiled threats."	
2		Α.	That's correct.	
3	87	Q.	What is a veiled threat?	
4		Α.	Well, it would be mutterings under his breath towards	
5			us in other words that we'd be in trouble or to that	11:02
6			extent, that type of thing. He was sort of aggressive	
7			towards us, you know.	
8	88	Q.	Right. And it was towards yourself. He threatened	
9			you?	
10		Α.	Well, I wouldn't consider it as a threat to me	11:02
11			personally, but he was just aggressive towards us, you	
12			know.	
13	89	Q.	I see. And it says:	
14				
15			"He made veiled threats to Sergeant Hughes at the	11:03
16			Bridewell after his bail application failed. Garda	
17			Declan Nyhan assisted in restraining him."	
18				
19			So he assisted you, is it, in restraining him?	
20		Α.	Well, we had to restrain him to make him comply with	11:03
21			our directions towards the cells, et cetera.	
22	90	Q.	Right. Then it says:	
23				
24			"The mother of the children (Baiba Saulite) is now	
25			anxious that Mr. A may seek to threaten and intimidate	11:03
26			her."	
27				
28			Is that right?	
29		Α.	That is correct.	

1 Did she say that to you? 91 Q. 2 She did, yes. Α. 3 92 Q. It says: 4 5 "Any calls to this address to be treated urgently. Αt 11:03 6 the time of his arrest Mr. A was driving vehicle [7 bl ank]. " 8 And it gives a description. So just that detail there, 9 you put into the PULSE entry that any calls to this 10 11:03 11 address to be treated urgently and that was an 12 appropriate step you took? 13 Yes, it was. Α. 14 93 Q. All right. And am I correct that you also took, if I 15 may say, the appropriate step of sending a memorandum 11:04 16 to your colleagues? Yes, if I can be reminded? 17 Α. 18 94 Yes. So maybe we might have page 1710 on screen, Q. 19 please. And just whilst Mr. Kavanagh is getting it, 20 what you are going to see, sergeant, is a memorandum 11:04 that is signed by yourself, addressed to the 21 superintendent in Coolock, bearing the date stamp the 22 23 25th August of 2005. And you'll see there on the 24 right-hand side, top corner, we have the date stamp, 25 and the heading is: "DPP -v- [blank]". Mr. A. 11:05 "Breaches of section 16, Non-Fatal Offences Against the 26 27 Person Act 1997. " And it indicates in the first 28 paragraph that:

29

Τ			The above person was charged before the Dublin	
2			District Court 46 on that date, the 22nd August '05	
3			with the abduction and was remanded in custody at	
4			Cloverhill on the 26th August."	
5				11:05
6			Then it says:	
7				
8			"His partner, Baiba Saulite, the mother of the	
9			children, now resides at [blank] address in Swords."	
10				11:05
11			Skip over the next bit.	
12				
13			"Ms. Saulite has expressed fear that Mr. A may seek to	
14			intimidate her as a result of her continued cooperation	
15			with the Gardaí in this matter. He has displayed	11:05
16			violent tendencies towards others, including	
17			Ms. Saulite in the past."	
18				
19			Was that your that represented your knowledge at the	
20			time, did it, sergeant?	11:06
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	95	Q.	And you alerted them in the following paragraph, you	
23			said:	
24				
25			"It is requested that all members familiarise	11:06
26			themselves with this matter and be aware that any calls	
27			to the above address should be responded to promptly."	
28				
29			Can you assist the Chairman what was your thinking in	

- 1 putting that alert out to your colleagues?
- 2 A. Well, precisely that; that any calls to the address
- there should be treated as urgent, any patrol cars in
- 4 the vicinity to go immediately to the address, any
- 5 available resources immediately go to the address. And 11:06
- 6 command and control, our control units would be made
- 7 aware of that to be alert, there would be an alert put
- 8 on the system.
- 9 96 Q. CHAIRMAN: May I just ask a question there? Does that

11:06

- really mean any calls from this address should be
- 11 treated urgently?
- 12 A. Eh, any calls from the -- yeah, from the -- from Baiba
- 13 Saulite.
- 14 97 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, it says "to the address", but it
- seems that it means any calls from the address should
- be treated urgently. There is no -- it's just that, to
- 17 be clear about it.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 98 Q. CHAIRMAN: Is that right?
- 20 A. Yes. And if somebody puts in a call from the address,
- they would get there as quickly as possible.
- 22 99 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thanks?
- 23 100 Q. MR. O'HIGGINS: So, as we move the timeline on then
- into September of 2005, we know that Mr. A applied for
- 25 bail in the High Court?
- 26 A. That's correct.
- 27 101 Q. And were you present for that? I think Ms. Saulite
- 28 gave evidence, did she?
- 29 A. Yes, I was there with Baiba.

- 1 102 Q. And did you accompany her to the Court?
- 2 A. I don't recall if I accompanied her to the Court, but
- 3 she was at the court for the bail application.
- 4 103 Q. That's fine. And you also gave evidence?
- 5 A. I did.

6 104 Q. The High Court judge, we have heard already, made the

11:07

11:08

11:08

11:08

- 7 pragmatic decision to admit Mr. A to bail but on the
- 8 condition that the children were to be returned to the
- 9 jurisdiction?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 105 Q. And that practical approach bore fruit, as it were, and
- 12 I think in October of 2005 Mr. A made arrangements for
- the return of the children and it was organised that
- 14 Baiba Saulite would travel to the Middle East to
- 15 collect them, isn't that right?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 106 Q. And I think on the 20th October 2005, the two children
- returned, and in accordance with the bail order of the
- 19 High Court judge, Mr. A was released?
- 20 A. That's correct.
- 21 107 Q. So, as we move the timeline into February of 2006, am I
- correct that Ms. Saulite visited you in the station in
- 23 February of 2006, is that right?
- A. Can I be reminded of the chronology on that, please?
- 25 108 Q. Certainly. This was with a view to obtaining a
- protection order against Mr. A, does that help you? I
- don't mean this to be in any sense a catch you out
- 28 situation.
- A. No, I was aware she was applying for under the family

- 1 law acts there in the courts at the time, okay.
- 2 109 Q. All right. So, in fact I think did you do a PULSE
- entry as well, and again to your credit, did you also
- 4 make a PULSE entry referable to this --
- 5 A. I could have, yes.
- 6 110 Q. -- this incident? I'll just see now if it's in the
- 7 materials that we have there. In any event, it is the

11:10

11:10

- 8 case, isn't it, that Mr. Hennessy was called as a
- 9 witness for the prosecution to contradict the claim
- 10 that is being made by --
- 11 A. Oh, I recall now --
- 12 111 Q. -- Mr. A that he was the legal guardian of the
- children, and that obviously would not have endeared
- Mr. Hennessy to Mr. A, isn't that right?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 112 Q. And that was in the context of Mr. A being anxious to
- 17 get a lighter sentence that he might otherwise get in
- 18 relation to the car operation that he was being
- 19 prosecuted for before the Circuit Court?
- 20 A. I don't recall that, but I do recall that the -- I
- 21 think Mr. Hennessy objected to his status under the
- 22 Guardianship of Infants Act and that I think what was
- the matter that became a bone of contention.
- 24 113 Q. All right. And we know from the timeline that on the
- 25 27th February 2006 Mr. Hennessy's home was the subject
- of an arson attack?
- 27 A. That's correct.
- 28 114 Q. A serious matter. And it's my understanding, as we
- 29 move into March of 2006, that Mr. A was arrested in

- 1 relation to the arson attack and questioned, is that
- 2 right?
- 3 A. That's correct.
- 4 115 Q. And you were made aware, weren't you, you being on good
- 5 terms obviously with Sergeant Ambrose and other people

11:12

- 6 in the station, you were fully aware of this arson
- 7 attack?
- 8 A. Sergeant Ambrose looked after the arson attack on
- 9 Baiba's car.
- 10 116 Q. On her car, excuse me?
- 11 A. Yes, I was aware of that.
- 12 117 Q. And you were also aware of the arson attack on
- Mr. Hennessy's home?
- 14 A. Yes, correct.
- 15 118 Q. And I presume, being an experienced garda officer, and
- availing of your common sense, it did cross your mind
- 17 that there may be a connection --
- 18 A. Oh, yes.
- 19 119 Q. -- a link between these matters, isn't that right?
- 20 A. That's correct.
- 21 120 Q. That is to say, between the abduction of the children,
- and also the attack on Mr. Hennessy's home?
- 23 A. Yes, indeed.
- 24 121 Q. In terms of a common suspect.
- 25 A. Sorry, excuse me?
- 26 122 Q. In terms of a common suspect?
- 27 A. Yes, we knew where the threat was coming from.
- 28 123 Q. And I think the case -- the arson on Mr. Hennessy's
- 29 home, it's fair to note, was investigated by Swords

- 1 detective unit?
- 2 A. Correct.
- 3 124 Q. And you also became aware of Garda intelligence that a

11 · 12

11:13

11:13

11 · 13

- 4 person had been approached and asked to consider
- 5 shooting a solicitor?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 125 Q. And you knew, obviously, that was Mr. Hennessy?
- 8 A. Sorry, I obviously?
- 9 126 Q. You made the connection that that was Mr. Hennessy?
- 10 A. It came down on the bulletin, the bulletin from the
- 11 Commissioner's office that it was Mr. Hennessy, yes.
- 12 127 Q. And you also were aware, when it happened, or shortly
- after it happening, of the attack on Ms. Saulite's car
- 14 in August of 2006?
- 15 A. The arson attack on her car, yes.
- 16 128 Q. And it was outside her home, isn't that right?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 129 Q. And I think on the 11th October 2006, as we move the
- timeline on again, you had visited Ms. Saulite, isn't
- that right, you indicated that in one of your reports?
- 21 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 22 130 Q. And can I just ask you: what was the purpose of that
- 23 visit or what was the context of that visit?
- 24 A. We went over to visit her in relation to the
- forthcoming trial, which was due to start on the 7th
- November.
- 27 131 Q. Yes. And broadly speaking, would it be fair to say you
- 28 wanted to ensure, being the officer centrally involved
- in the abduction investigation, you wanted to ensure

1			that she'd appear in Dublin Circuit Criminal Court for	
2			the trial relating to the abduction?	
3		Α.	Yes, indeed. I think we served a subpoena on her that	
4			day.	
5	132	Q.	I see. And so, this was in, did you say, the 11th	11:14
6			October?	
7		Α.	The 11th October 2006, yes.	
8	133	Q.	The trial was due to happen, due to start on the 7th	
9			November, isn't that right?	
10		Α.	That's correct.	11:14
11	134	Q.	And she relayed to you, did she, that she was	
12			continuing that that he, Mr. A, was continuing to	
13			intimidate her from prison, isn't that right?	
14		Α.	That's correct.	
15	135	Q.	And she told you that he was constantly ringing her and	11:14
16			sending her texts?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	136	Q.	And applying pressure that way?	
19		Α.	That's correct.	
20	137	Q.	Can you just assist us, other than that visit on the	11:14
21			11th October, did you also visit her home on her	
22			occasions in October?	
23		Α.	I'd have to be reminded through the PULSE incidents	
24			there or through any records, but the 11th October is	
25			the one that I remember.	11:15
26	138	Q.	All right. And on the 13th October, you received I	
27			think you have told us this already you received	

regarding a threat on John Hennessy's life?

28

29

what you regarded as more reliable information

Т		Α.	inal's correct, it was an article an instrument down	
2			from the Commissioner's office in that regard.	
3	139	Q.	All right. And you became aware that a specific hitman	
4			had been identified and also I think a weapon; that was	
5			the intel?	11:15
6		Α.	That's correct.	
7	140	Q.	And you made you took proactive steps and you made	
8			contact with an official in the Chief State Solicitor's	
9			Office and told her of these latest developments that	
10			had come to your attention?	11:15
11		Α.	That's correct.	
12	141	Q.	And I think also, you sent in a report via your own	
13			superintendent, on the 20th October, referable to this	
14			information, isn't that correct?	
15		Α.	That's correct.	11:16
16	142	Q.	We might just look at that for a moment, sergeant.	
17			It's at page 1737 of the materials. Maybe I have the	
18			wrong so, I have 1737 in my page. It is a report of	
19			yourself, Sergeant Hughes, to Superintendent Coolock,	
20			of the 20th October 2006. Mr. Kavanagh might just	11:16
21			scroll down, see if we No. We're still on the	
22			PULSE. All right. Well, I'll just, for the moment	
23			then if we scroll down a little bit more, it might be	
24			this next document. That's us there, thanks,	
25			Mr. Kavanagh.	11:17
26				
27			So, do you have it there, sergeant? We have lost it	
28			again there, Mr. Kavanagh. If we scroll down a few	
29			pages.	

Т			CHAIRMAN: Can I have the correct number?	
2			MR. O' HI GGI NS: 1740.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
4			MR. O'HIGGINS: If we just hold it there for a sec.	
5			Thank you.	11:17
6	143	Q.	So just to familiarise yourself, sergeant. This is	
7			your memorandum to the superintendent at Coolock	
8			bearing the date stamp the 20th October '06. And it	
9			records that:	
10				11:17
11			"The above trial it due to proceed at Dublin Circuit	
12			Criminal Court on the 7th November 2006. The accused,	
13			Mr. A, is currently serving a four-year sentence in	
14			Mountjoy Prison on an unrelated matter."	
15				11:17
16			That was the case, wasn't it, sergeant? Mr. A was now	
17			serving a sentence that he had got from the Circuit	
18			Court in relation to the stolen cars operation that	
19		Α.	That's correct.	
20	144	Q.	he had been involved with. If we scroll down a	11:18
21			little bit. The memo continues:	
22				
23			"Two of the witnesses due to give evidence at the trial	
24			on the 7th November are John Hennessy, solicitor, and	
25			Mr. A's partner, Baiba Saulite. Mr. Hennessy has been	11:18
26			the victim of an arson attack on his home on the 27th	
27			February 2006. Bai ba Saulite's private car was the	
28			subject of an arson attack outside her home on the 18th	
29			August 2006."	

1				
2			So it's fair to say you were linking those two serious	
3			criminal matters?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	145	Q.	And then if we read on:	11:18
6				
7			"Mr. A is a suspect for the arson attack on	
8			Mr. Hennessy's home. The attack on Ms. Saulite's	
9			property is still under investigation. Preliminary	
10			findings indicate that Mr. A may be a suspect for	11:18
11			arranging this attack. Mr. Hennessy has recently been	
12			the subject of a further threat on his life. [Blank]	
13			is suspect for organising this threat. It may be	
14			prudent to have details of the above matters furnished	
15			to the office of the DPP for the information of	11:19
16			prosecuting counsel in the above case."	
17				
18			And that's signed by yourself, isn't that right?	
19		Α.	That's correct.	
20	146	Q.	And we have heard already, and you have indicated in	11:19
21			your evidence, sergeant, that the court ordered that a	
22			Victim Impact Report be prepared by Ms. Saulite, and we	
23			know all about?	
24		Α.	we do.	
25	147	Q.	That's at the heart of things. But can you just assist	11:19
26			the Tribunal, how many times, can you recall just to	
27			give us a flavour of it, how many times did you see	
28			Baiba Saulite in between the time when her car was	
29			burnt out in August '06 and 14th November, when she met	

- 1 you in the Garda Station in Swords?
- 2 A. Well, as we discussed, I visited her on the 11th
- October 2006, and there could have been another
- 4 occasion which just doesn't come to mind at the
- present. We would have met her at the court for the

11:20

11:20

11:20

11.21

- 6 trial.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 148 Q. You know. And then following the order that a victim
- 9 impact be composed or prepared we met her then on the
- 10 14th November 2006?
- 11 149 Q. Yes. And what was -- so there were -- were they at the
- 12 station or did you see her at her home?
- 13 A. Sorry, on the 11th October 2006 was at her home.
- 14 150 Q. Were there other visits to her home?
- 15 A. I just can't recall at the moment. I'd have to be
- 16 reminded of the chronology.
- 17 151 Q. All right.
- 18 A. But the 14th November -- or sorry, the 7th November,
- 19 would have been the court hearing obviously.
- 20 152 Q. Right.
- 21 A. And then at the station for the 14th, Swords Station
- for the 14th November of 2006.
- 23 153 Q. Right. And prior to her coming to the station on the
- 24 14th with the draft victim impact, had you given her a
- degree of guidance on what should or shouldn't be in
- 26 it?
- 27 A. I had -- we had arranged for her to call at an earlier
- date and when we contacted her, there was something had
- come up and we couldn't meet her and we put it back to

Т			the 14th. But on the 14th I gave her guidance. I Said	
2			that it should really be matters there that don't refer	
3			to Mr. A in a negative light and she I asked her	
4			from a health point of view, how did she you know,	
5			how did she react to these things and I advised her to	11:21
6			get medical reports in that regard.	
7	154	Q.	All right. We'll come to that because it is quite	
8			important that meeting there, so we'll come to that.	
9			But just to set the context for that, am I correct that	
10			Baiba Saulite, when she came to the Swords Garda	11:21
11			Station on the 14th November, she had made an	
12			appointment to see you?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	155	Q.	And previously, when you had gone to her home, were you	
15			with Garda Nyhan?	11:22
16		Α.	That's correct.	
17	156	Q.	Right. And it's possible, is it, that there were other	
18			visits to her home with Garda Nyhan?	
19		Α.	Between the 11th October and the	
20	157	Q.	No, between August and November?	11:22
21		Α.	Oh yes, there may have been one, at least one visit to	
22			her home.	
23	158	Q.	All right. And obviously, entirely proper, you were	
24			preparing her for her court appearance and ensuring	
25			that she turned up in the first instance?	11:22
26		Α.	Yes, indeed.	
27	159	Q.	And it's my understanding that with Garda Nyhan, when	
28			she arrived at the station on the 14th November, you	
29			took her to an interview room where she provided you	

- with the draft statement that she had written on hotel notepaper?

 A. Yes. Someone else had written the document for her.

 I understand. So. a friend of hers had written the
- document and had given her help in putting it together? 11:22
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 161 Q. Her visit to the station, how long did it last?
- 8 A. I would say approximately 30 minutes, 40 minutes. It wouldn't have been much longer than that.
- 10 162 Q. 30 or 40?
- 11 A. I can't recall specifically exactly how long it was, it
 12 wasn't really -- as I said, it was an informal type of
 13 a meeting so...
- 14 163 Q. Inspector Cryan records you indicating it was 45

 15 minutes, you wouldn't differ with that?

 11:23
- 16 A. I wouldn't have any difficulty with that, no.
- 17 164 Q. All right. The meeting obviously was about this
 18 important document that was to go before the court, and
 19 it was going to be needed by the circuit judge in
 20 dealing with sentence, isn't that right?

- 21 A. Correct.
- 22 165 Q. At this point in time, he had -- Mr. A had pleaded 23 guilty --
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 166 Q. -- to the abduction of the children. And that,
 26 presumably, was obviously good news for the
 27 investigation and good news for you and your
- colleagues?
- 29 A. Yes indeed.

- 1 167 Q. Would it be fair to say there was a degree of stand
 2 down of tension a little bit: what was thought to be a
 3 fully hotly contested trial had now reduced, if that's
 4 the right verb, to a plea?
- A. Yes, we were very relieved that the plea had been taken 11:24
 and that we weren't put through the ordeal of a trial
 in that regard, you know. And my personal belief was
 that he was just accepting full -- accepting fully that
 he was guilty of the crime and he was going to move on
 from that.
- 11 168 Q. Yes. Am I correct that in this visit of Baiba Saulite, 12 that you indicate may have taken place between, was it, 13 between 30 and 45 minutes, whatever it was, you 14 discussed with her Mr. A, and specifically whether --15 how he was after the plea and how his demeanour was?
- A. Yes indeed. We -- having dealt with the aspect of the written document she had, and I photocopied and handed it back to her, I then just engaged in a casual conversation with her as to how he was since the sentencing, and she related some matters to us then.

11:25

- 21 169 O. Casual conversation?
- 22 A. Casual conversation.
- 23 170 Q. She told you, didn't she, that she had stopped bringing the children to see him?
- 25 A. That's correct.
- 26 171 Q. She had told you she had changed the SIM card on her phone?
- 28 A. That would be correct, yes.
- 29 172 Q. Did that cause you any concern, that she had decided to

1			take that step that might annoy him?	
2		Α.	No, not at the time, not really. It was just, I did	
3			express concern to her that 'Is that the right thing to	
4			be doing?' or words to that effect to her, but she	
5			seemed to be determined enough to go that course.	11:26
6	173	Q.	And you detected a greater confidence in her?	
7		Α.	Absolutely. She looked very well and confident within	
8			herself and happy within herself.	
9	174	Q.	You, I think, asked her obviously how she was and she	
10			said Mr. A never stopped talking about John Hennessy	11:26
11			and yourself, Liam Hughes?	
12		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
13	175	Q.	And that you and John Hennessy were responsible for	
14			putting him in prison?	
15		Α.	That's correct, she would have said yes.	11:26
16	176	Q.	It is the case, isn't it, that in the course of this	
17			meeting on the 14th November, sergeant, Baiba Saulite	
18			told you that she feared for her own safety?	
19		Α.	Absolutely not. She did not say that to us.	
20	177	Q.	Absolutely you are clear on that?	11:26
21		Α.	Absolutely clear. If she had said that to he me, I	
22			would have asked her did she want to make a formal	
23			complaint in that regard and we would have investigated	
24			it. She certainly did not say she was in fear of her	
25			own safety to us on that occasion.	11:27
26	178	Q.	Did she not say that she was in fear for her own	
27			safety, Declan's safety, John's safety and your	
28			Liam's safety?	
29		Α.	No. She mentioned myself and John Hennessy and	

1			probably Declan as well. But not she made no	
2			complaint to me whatsoever in relation to her own	
3			safety.	
4	179	Q.	But she was present in the station with a victim impact	
5			draft report, I acknowledge a draft, but she was	11:2
6			present with a draft that indicated in express terms	
7			that she had a concern for her safety?	
8		Α.	Yes indeed. That hadn't been read at the time, and she	
9			didn't make that complaint to us on the 14th November.	
10	180	Q.	So at this meeting of the 14th November, she was	11:2
11			handing you over a draft report in which she expressed	
12			a concern for her own safety, and yet, you're saying	
13			explicitly she expressed no such concern at the	
14			meeting?	
15		Α.	She did not make any allegation to me in relation to	11:2
16			her own safety on that occasion.	
17	181	Q.	You see, I just wonder, are you mistaken about that?	
18			And I'll just offer to you why.	
19		Α.	No. I'm absolutely clear about that.	
20	182	Q.	All right. In your conversation with Inspector Cryan	11:2
21			on the 22nd November, that's the Wednesday after the	
22			murder on the 19th, Inspector Cryan records you as	
23			saying to him that Ms. Saulite had told you at the	
24			meeting on the 14th November that she feared for her	

27 A. No. I did not relate that to Inspector Cryan on that occasion.

safety?

25

26

29 183 Q. Inspector Cryan's note indicates that you told him that

own safety, Declan's safety, John's safety and your

1			she even mentioned a man's name who Mr. A didn't know	
2			was visiting her, and she had told you that this man	
3			was telling Baiba to be careful, do you recall that?	
4		Α.	I think she relayed that to us on the 14th sorry,	
5			for Baiba to be careful?	11:29
6	184	Q.	Yes.	
7		Α.	No, the conversation she had was that this individual	
8			had been in her house on the 11th October when the	
9			detectives visited, the local detectives had visited	
10			her on the 11th October, and that she had conversations	11:29
11			with him in relation to certain matters that were	
12			ongoing at the time.	
13	185	Q.	You had asked her, didn't you, in the discussion you	
14			had on the 14th could she visit this man and she said	
15			no, not under any circumstances?	11:29
16		Α.	Well, she said that the detectives were looking after	
17			the matters there and she was happy to leave it at	
18			that.	
19	186	Q.	You told her that the Victim Impact Statement report	
20			would have to be edited and put in a proper form, isn't	11:29
21			that right?	
22		Α.	That would be correct, yes.	
23	187	Q.	The other person I want to suggest to you, just so that	
24			you are not wrong footed by this, sergeant, as well as	
25			I am suggesting you telling Michael Cryan that she had	11:30

29 A. I don't recall that, no.

that?

26

27

28

reported a fear for her own safety to you, you also

said that to Superintendent Dennedy, do you remember

- 1 188 Q. All right. I'll bring you to that in due course but I
- just want you to be aware of that. That's another
- 3 record which appears to be indicating -- well, I'm
- 4 suggesting to you that you may be mistaken about that
- 5 detail?

11:30

11:30

11:31

- A. No, I certainly did not make a mistake about that detail.
- 8 189 Q. All right. You photocopied the victim impact draft
- 9 that she had produced and gave her the original, and
- 10 you held on to a copy yourself?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 190 Q. Am I correct you asked her did she want to make any
- 13 complaint?
- 14 A. No. She would never -- that was Baiba's form, when
- discussing Mr. A. Apart from the child abduction case
- she never made any formal complaints in relation to
- 17 Mr. A's other activities that she reported to me.
- 18 191 Q. My question was: did you ask her would she make a
- 19 complaint?
- 20 192 Q. CHAIRMAN: It know it may seem a little, it may seem a
- 21 little impractical and possibly even unrealistic, but
- we are referring to Mr. A, and I appreciate, I know it
- slips out occasionally, it's Mr. A?
- 24 A. Sorry. Mr. A.
- 25 193 Q. CHAIRMAN: That's all right. I mean as I say, I am
- aware of the complexities of the situation, but we have
- taken a decision to redact references. And so, it's
- 28 Mr. A.
- 29 A. My apologies, Mr. Chairman.

194 No, no, no, I understand. Consider yourself 1 Q. CHAI RMAN: 2 completely forgiven, it's just a reminder to make sure 3 that we proceed as we have directed, so that's not a big problem. Now, Mr. O'Higgins, yes. 4 5 MR. O' HI GGI NS: Thank you Chairman. 6 195 Sergeant, you have made it clear in your report to Q.

11:32

11:32

11:32

11:33

- Inspector Mangan, and throughout the materials really,
 that you and your colleagues I think had been asking
 her to make a complaint a long time over the period,
 and she hadn't -- it hadn't been her methodology to
 make a complaint?
- 12 A. That's correct.

26

- 13 196 Q. Right. My question to you: on this occasion, on the
 14 14th November, you did ask her, didn't you, do you want
 15 to make a complaint about what you're saying?
- 16 A. Yes, I asked her. I said, when she mentioned this, 17 these matters, I said do you want us to pursue this 18 Baiba? And she said no, she was happy enough that the 19 detective units were looking after it.
- 20 197 Q. Why did you ask her did she want to make a complaint?

 21 A. Well, she was talking -- the matters she was referring

 22 to, we had just finished with the, more or less

 23 finished with the child abduction case and she was

 24 referring to other matters that would require Garda

 25 attention possibly and I just asked her do she want us
- 27 198 Q. You see, I suggest to you the reason you asked her 28 whether she wanted to make a complaint, because you 29 were asking her did she want to make a complaint about

to pursue any of these matters and she said no.

1	threats?
_	tili cats:

- A. No. Not on her. If she wanted to make any formal complaints in relation to any of the matters she was talking to us casually about.
- 5 199 Q. I'm suggesting to you that the reason that you asked
 6 her did she want to make a complaint was because she
 7 had told you something regarding her fears for her own
 8 safety?
- 9 A. No, that's not correct.
- 10 200 Q. Am I correct, you didn't send up any report of this
 11 meeting up to the superintendent or the inspector, as
 12 would have been your normal way?
- 13 A. I didn't send up any report in relation to that 14 interaction with Baiba on that occasion.
- 15 201 Q. And that wouldn't be your norm form, would it? As we have seen, you're assiduous in sending up reports.
- 17 A. The meeting, as I said, we were there to determine
 18 whether or not we would make a Victim Impact Statement,
 19 that didn't occur, and there was nothing arising from
 20 the meeting I felt that should be reported on on that
 21 occasion.
- 22 Just looking at that and viewing matters in context, 202 Q. 23 sergeant: She has visited you on the 14th and said what 24 you've said; she has provided you with a draft impact 25 statement; you retain a copy, don't provide a copy to your superintendent or superior officers; you don't 26 27 send up a report; you then learn the devastating news 28 there's been a murder on the 19th, a short period 29 afterwards?

- 1 A. Yes indeed.
- 2 203 Q. You haven't read the victim impact?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 204 Q. You read it after that?
- 5 A. On the morning after, yes.
- 6 205 Q. You are in serious shock on learning this news.
- 7 A. Serious shock in relation to?
- 8 206 O. When the news breaks that she's been murdered?
- 9 A. Oh, yes indeed, yes.
- 10 207 Q. Amongst your feelings, I take it you'd agree with me,

11:35

11:35

11:35

- 11 you were concerned that you were professionally
- 12 exposed?
- 13 A. I was concerned, when I read the document, that the
- 14 matters within the document there would be of relevance
- to the murder investigation. Obviously, when I read
- the lines in it, I was concerned, yes.
- 17 208 Q. Were you concerned that your own position, that you'd
- 18 be professionally exposed?
- 19 A. Well, I brought it immediately to the attention of
- 20 Detective Inspector Walter O'Sullivan.
- 21 209 Q. I'll come to that because that is an important
- conversation, I'll grant you, and we'll deal with that
- in detail.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 210 Q. But just if I could just bottom out on. Would you
- agree with me, and I am suggesting to you it would be
- 27 perfectly normal and reasonable of you, you had
- concerns that this may give rise to professional
- exposure for you, a problem for you, because you didn't

- send up a report, you didn't tell anybody about the victim impact?
- A. Well, there was no -- there was no how would you say?
- 4 pressing need to send the victim impact on at the
- 5 time, but on the morning that you are referring to, was 11:36
- I professionally exposed? I don't think I thought that
- 7 in that lines. My main objective was to bring it to
- 8 the attention of my authorities as soon as possible and
- 9 the immediate -- the responses I received initially
- were that the matters referred to in the Victim Impact

11:37

- 11 Report were not of significance for me to worry about.
- 12 211 Q. You mentioned Walter O'Sullivan. You met Inspector
- O'Sullivan on the Monday morning, the 20th November?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 212 Q. That's the day after the murder?
- 16 A. The morning after the murder, yes.
- 17 213 Q. The morning after. And you met him in the community
- 18 policing offices, isn't that right?
- 19 A. Yes indeed.
- 20 214 Q. And in your discussion with him, I'm suggesting to you, 11:37
- 21 you expressed concern that the contents of the Victim
- 22 Impact Report would cause you professional problems?
- 23 A. I don't recollect that conversation, that precise,
- those terminology you are referring to there.
- 25 215 Q. Don't worry about the terminology because that's my
- oral language. But just the gist of it, you told him
- that you were concerned that the document left you with
- something to explain, isn't that right?
- A. Well, obviously the content of the document there,

1 having read it on the 20th there, was of concern to me, 2 you can say professionally or personally, and I needed 3 to bring it to the attention of my authorities directly. 4 5 216 And didn't he try to reassure you? Q. 11:37 6 Α. He did. 7 And console you, and didn't he indicate - and again, I 217 Q. 8 am speaking now in the gist rather than the precise words being attributed to either of you - didn't he 9 console you that the Victim Impact Report was not a 10 11:38 11 huge deal, and basically there was no need to worry in relation to it? 12 13 Yes, indeed, I'll accept that. Α. 14 218 Q. All right. Well, I'm suggesting to you that he 15 wouldn't have said that unless you had told him you 11:38 16 were concerned that the document left you with 17 something to explain? 18 Well, the document obviously had the last assertions Α. 19 possibly of a murdered victim, and I just needed to get 20 it to his attention. I needed it to be assessed 11:38 straightaway in relation to the -- you know, her 21 22 assertions, her last assertions to the Garda Síochána 23 more or less prior to her murder needed to be brought 24 to his attention. 25 And I suggest to you that Inspector O'Sullivan made 219 Q. 11:39 efforts to assure you and he indicated and he referred 26

investigation?

27

28

29

Α.

to the professional job you had done on the abduction

That would be the conversation we'd had.

- 1 220 Q. And he indicated that would stand to you?
- 2 A. Excuse me?
- 3 221 Q. He indicated that that would stand to you, the good job

11:39

- 4 you had done?
- 5 A. Eh, I think he may have said that, yes.
- 6 222 Q. And I'm suggesting to you that not only did you say
- 7 that to Inspector O'Sullivan, but the following day,
- 8 the Tuesday, the 21st November, you also had a
- 9 conversation with then Inspector Michael Cryan --
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 223 Q. -- when he rang you, is that right?
- 12 A. Sorry, if you can tell me, he rang me?
- 13 224 Q. Yes. So I'll just put to you what his recollection is:
- 14 You indicated that you were still very shocked and
- couldn't believe it had come to this, with Baiba being 11:39
- 16 murdered, and you said you kept racking your brain to
- see if there was something else you could have done to
- 18 prevent it.
- 19 A. That could be something I may have said to him, that he
- 20 has taken notes of, yes.
- 21 225 Q. And you expressed anger that more had not been done to
- 22 prevent her killing?
- 23 A. I was angry that I felt that more could have been done,
- yes.
- 25 226 Q. And again, he sought to reassure you and expressed the
- belief that from what he knew you had done all you
- could?
- 28 A. That could be correct, yes.
- 29 227 Q. And he indicated he was not aware of any specific

Т			threats Mr. A had made?	
2		Α.	He may have said that, yes.	
3	228	Q.	So, I will, because it's important, I am going to come	
4			back to your conversation in fact conversations,	
5			plural, with Michael Cryan in due course.	11:40
6				
7			Returning to your conversation with Inspector	
8			O'Sullivan. His statement starts at page 657 of the	
9			materials, and we might just have that for a moment.	
10			We might go to page 661, first of all, please,	11:41
11			Mr. Kavanagh. And he says, about four paragraphs down:	
12				
13			"At Swords Garda Station sometime between 10:00 and	
14			11:00am I met with Sergeant William Hughes in the	
15			community policing office."	11:41
16				
17			We're agreed about that, are we, sergeant?	
18		Α.	Yes, indeed.	
19	229	Q.	He continues: "I was interested in meeting him for the	
20			purpose of advancing the murder investigation due to	11:41
21			the fact I was aware he was the senior member in charge	
22			of the investigation into the abduction of the children	
23			of Bai ba Saul i te.	
24				
25			It was my intention to meet with Sergeant Hughes and to	11:42
26			invite him to the investigation conference so that he	
27			could brief the investigators in relation to his	
28			knowledge of the abduction and the characters	
29			associated with it.	

1				
2			Because of his central investigative role in the	
3			abduction case, I believed Sergeant Hughes possessed a	
4			comprehensive knowledge of the character of Mr. A and	
5			other characters of interest to the murder	11:42
6			i nvesti gati on. "	
7				
8			I take it you don't take issue with any of that?	
9		Α.	I am afraid that his recollection is not correct in	
10			relation to that he met me before the first conference	11:42
11			and was with the intention of inviting me to that	
12			conference. I didn't in fact meet Detective Inspector	
13			O'Sullivan until after the first conference had	
14			dispersed.	
15	230	Q.	So, you are making a correction. You are saying that	11:42
16			he didn't invite you to the conference, is that it?	
17		Α.	He didn't invite me to the first conference, no.	
18	231	Q.	All right, we'll come on to that. He continues:	
19				
20			"At Swords Garda Station I enquired as to whether or	11:42
21			not Sergeant Hughes was on duty and I learned that	
22			Sergeant Hughes was "not good" and that he was up	
23			upstairs in the community policing office."	
24				
25			Do you want to comment on that?	11:43
26		Α.	I can't really. That's what he says. I was good. You	
27			know, I wasn't I was sort of being made out to be a	
28			nervous wreck in the office but that's not true. You	
29			know, that wasn't true. I was shocked, I was	

1			concerned, but not in the notes that I have seen in	
2			relation to himself, it wasn't that I was very bad, you	
3			know.	
4	232	Q.	All right. You see, sergeant, there's other indicators	
5			that you were not in a good way. Michael Cryan says	11:4
6			something similar, including conversations the next	
7			day, you were not in a good way?	
8		Α.	That's the Wednesday I think, yes, two days later.	
9	233	Q.	Do you take issue with that general position that you	
10			were really, you were in bits?	11:4
11		Α.	Well, no, not in bits, no. I was able to converse with	
12			them, I was able to express my views, and, you know,	
13			there was as a matter of fact, the issues in	
14			relation to my demeanour on each occasion only came to	
15			my notice, only came to my attention, six years later	11:4
16			at the High Court, at the Declan Nyhan High Court case.	
17	234	Q.	Inspector O'Sullivan says you were visibly upset, you	
18			looked poorly, you were troubled, agitated, and he	
19			refers to you being disturbed?	
20		Α.	Disturbed? Just, I was anxious and I was but not	11:4
21			that I was in bits or anything like that, you know.	
22	235	Q.	You just see there, his statement puts it:	
23				
24			"I cannot recall whether Sergeant Hughes was dressed in	
25			his uniform or civilian attire. He was alone in the	11:4

28 A. No.

26

27

offi ce.

 $29\,$ $236\,$ Q. "He was disturbed by the news of Baiba Saulite's

poorly, troubled and agitated."

He is visibly and emotionally upset, looked

1			death. "	
2		Α.	No. Absolutely not. It was, I that contacted	
3			Detective Inspector O'Sullivan. When the conference	
4			had dispersed he was over in a local cafe having	
5			coffee, and he said he was having coffee and he said	11:45
6			he'd be over to me shortly.	
7	237	Q.	If Mr. Kavanagh might scroll down there we see that his	
8			statement conditions, and Inspector O'Sullivan states	
9			that:	
10				11:45
11			"During the course of the conversation Sergeant William	
12			Hughes reported to me that Baiba Saulite had called to	
13			see him sometime in the days prior to her death and	
14			that he had spoken to her where she complained about	
15			her husband, Mr. A, whom she feared and whom she	11:45
16			believed was planning to do harm to her and do harm to	
17			her solicitor."	
18				
19			Do you see that there?	
20		Α.	That is not correct.	11:45
21	238	Q.	So he is wrong about that, is he?	
22		Α.	She did not make any complaint to me that he was going	
23			to harm her.	
24	239	Q.	"Sergeant William Hughes produced a document from a	
25			drawer underneath his desk and informed me that this	11:45
26			was the Victim Impact Statement that had been prepared	
27			by Ms. Saulite on hotel stationery paper. Sergeant	
28			Hughes went on to say that the Victim Impact Statement	
29			was incomplete and unsigned."	

1				
2			And then he appends a copy of that to his statement.	
3				
4			Then if we scroll down a little bit:	
5				11:46
6			"Sergeant Hughes reported that this was Baiba Saulite's	
7			Victim Impact Statement partially prepared in relation	
8			to the child abduction case. He expressed concern	
9			about the Victim Impact Statement stating that it would	
10			have professional difficulties for him because of what	11:46
11			was contained in it and that "they" would come after	
12			him."	
13		Α.	I don't recall saying that to him.	
14	240	Q.	But you might have?	
15		Α.	No, I don't recall saying that to him.	11:46
16	241	Q.	You are in deep shock, you have learned devastating	
17			news, I think you have acknowledged that there was a	
18			basis for you feeling concerned for your own	
19			professional position, you are telling this to a	
20			colleague and he is saying, in very clear terms, that	11:46
21			you were concerned this would have professional	
22			difficulties for you; I suggest to you that's likely	
23			and very commonsensical?	
24		Α.	Well, as I said, I was concerned in relation to when	
25			I read the contents of the victim impact on the morning	11:47
26			I was concerned that it would be it would be	
27			necessary to bring it to the attention of my	
28			authorities due to what she had included in the	
29			document.	

- 1 242 Q. You told the Tribunal, sergeant, that you didn't attend the conference?
- 3 A. That's correct.
- 4 243 Q. Why not?
- 5 I decided that all the evidence there that was Α. 11:47 available in the child abduction case was already with 6 7 the Garda authorities. My office was next door and I 8 decided to go and go through my files to see was there anything that could assist with the inquiry, and that's 9 the -- while I was always available to the murder 10 11 · 47 11 investigation team.
- 12 244 Q. Inspector O'Sullivan indicates that in the conversation 13 he had with you on the Monday morning, he told you it 14 was important you should attend?
- 15 I don't recollect him saying that because the issue of Α. 11:48 16 me attending the murder conference, as I saw it, would 17 be to actually accept jobs and to go out and actually 18 operate as a murder investigator and doing calls. The 19 distinction I make is that the murder conference or the murder investigation itself. I was always available to 20 the murder investigators in relation to full 21 22 cooperation and full disclosure of any documents or 23 files or any assistance I can give them.
- 24 245 Q. So, sorry, you are drawing a distinction between
 25 whether you did or didn't attend the conference versus
 26 whether you did or didn't participate in the
 27 investigation, is that the distinction you are drawing?

11 · 48

A. Yes. Any reference to me not attending the conference shouldn't be confused with not cooperating with the

Т			murder investigation itself. Any of the people most	
2			of the personnel that were there, and I think one the	
3			witnesses says that the room was packed that morning,	
4			they would have been summoned to be there because they	
5			came from resources from all over the division, you	11:49
6			know, and probably from our divisions. They would have	
7			been contacted by Garda management to attend directly	
8			for the purpose of receiving jobs, and, you know,	
9			duties in relation to the murder investigation itself.	
10			But I was there on that morning, I saw the senior	11:49
11			officers there assembled in the kitchen before the	
12			conference, I was available to the conference if I was	
13			required. If there was any issue in relation to my	
14			non-attendance at the conference, which seems to be	
15			seems to have developed over the passage of time, I	11:49
16			think the correct course would have been to get in	
17			touch with my line manager, Inspector Donal Waters, and	
18			maybe to establish, through him, as to why, if I had	
19			any difficulties in that regard. This wasn't done.	
20	246	Q.	I am just a little bit unclear on this. Is it your	11:50
21			position that you made a conscious decision not to	
22			attend? Is that what you are telling the Chairman?	
23		Α.	It shouldn't be seen that. I went to my office to go	
24			through my files to see if there was anything you	
25			know, to go through the last document there that I	11:50
26			received from Baiba, and also, to go through my files	
27			and see if there was anything that I could bring to the	
28			attention of the murder investigation team that ${\tt I}$ could	
29			be of assistance with. But, as far as going and	

1			actually looking for work in relation to the murder	
2			investigation, going, as I said earlier, boots on	
3			ground and going out and doing house calls, et cetera,	
4			no, that didn't occur to me at all.	
5	247	Q.	Sergeant, nobody needs an invitation to attend a	11:50
6			conference?	
7		Α.	I agree.	
8	248	Q.	Yeah. You were the person centrally involved in the	
9			abduction investigation; you had a reservoir of	
10			information and knowledge pertaining to Baiba Saulite	11:51
11			and her connections?	
12		Α.	Which was with Garda management at the time.	
13	249	Q.	Yeah. You have lots to offer to your colleagues who	
14			were embarking upon a very serious murder	
15			investigation, isn't that right?	11:51
16		Α.	In what respect? Sorry, a lot to offer?	
17	250	Q.	Sorry, I am suggesting to you, you had a reservoir of	
18			information, you had been centrally involved in the	
19			abduction investigation, are we agreed about that?	
20		Α.	Yes. And all my information, apart from the victim	11:51
21			impact, my last meeting with Baiba, was already with	
22			Garda management on that morning.	
23	251	Q.	Sorry, just take it in stages. You knew you could be	
24			of assistance to the conference?	
25		Α.	Yes indeed.	11:51
26	252	Q.	Right. You knew there was a conference going on?	
27		Α.	I did.	
28	253	Q.	There was a lot the people at the conference, the place	

29

was pretty crowded, it must have been quite hard to

- 1 avoid the conference?
- 2 A. I wasn't trying to avoid the conference.
- 3 254 Q. Were you keeping the head down?
- 4 A. I decided to go to my office just to actually look at
- the documents as I have said, and to assist the murder
- 6 investigation.
- 7 255 Q. You see, I am suggesting to you, and I'm asking you, is
- 8 it possible that your concerns for the potential
- 9 professional exposure that you felt you might have,
- that those concerns, and your whole shock in relation

11:52

- to victim impact not being read and so forth, that
- caused you to keep out of the way of questions and
- therefore you made a decision I won't go to that
- 14 conference?
- 15 A. No, that's not true.
- 16 256 Q. I am suggesting to you that you knew, broadly speaking,
- 17 three things?
- 18 A. Sorry, I beg your pardon?
- 19 257 Q. You knew three things --
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 258 Q. -- that caused you professional concern. Firstly, you
- 22 knew that she had come to the station on the 14th
- November and relayed information to you?
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 259 Q. You knew that. Secondly, you knew you hadn't sent up a 11:53
- 26 report, isn't that right?
- 27 A. That's correct.
- 28 260 Q. And thirdly, you knew -- you had read the Victim Impact
- 29 Statement and you knew what it said in the last page,

Т			but you hadn't brought it to anybody's attention?	
2		Α.	That's correct, yes.	
3	261	Q.	And those three things were troubling you deeply, and	
4			you were keeping the head down?	
5		Α.	Oh no, I wasn't keeping the head down, if I met	11:53
6			Detective Inspector Walter O'Sullivan after the first	
7			conference and brought these matters directly to his	
8			attention.	
9	262	Q.	You are aware, aren't you, that there is a dispute	
10			between yourself and Walter O'Sullivan as to this	11:54
11			conversation that you attribute to him, specifically	
12			I'm talking about your claim that he told you, on the	
13			Monday morning, that the Commissioner's office were	
14			aware of threats to John Hennessy and Baiba Saulite,	
15			received a request for protection for her and had	11:54
16			refused that request?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	263	Q.	Isn't that your that is your position, Walter	
19			O'Sullivan told that you?	
20		Α.	That's correct.	11:54
21	264	Q.	And that's an important part of your whole story, I	
22			don't mean that pejoratively, that's an important	
23			element of your position, isn't that right?	
24		Α.	Well it's a matter that I subsequently reported on,	
25			yes.	11:54
26	265	Q.	Yes. So you say that on the very day after the murder	

27

28

29

you were told by a person in management not only that

Baiba Saulite, but that the Commissioner's office had

the Commissioner's office were well aware of threats to

Т			been asked to arrocate protection for her and had	
2			refused?	
3		Α.	That's what he told me, yes.	
4	266	Q.	I presume you were very relieved to hear that when	
5			Walter O'Sullivan, you claim, said that?	11:55
6		Α.	Well he actually said, well, you have nothing to worry	
7			about and he went on to say that in relation to the	
8			protection issue.	
9	267	Q.	My question is: were you very relieved to hear that	
10			information?	11:55
11		Α.	I don't know whether relieved is the word. Possibly,	
12			yes, possibly just	
13	268	Q.	You see, on hearing that, your concerns about not	
14			relaying the Victim Impact Report or not relaying the	
15			details of her visit to the station of the 14th	11:55
16			November would now fall away, wouldn't they?	
17		Α.	But we go back to the 14th November, there was nothing	
18			to really report on in relation to, other than she	
19			visited us to help her prepare a victim impact.	
20	269	Q.	All right. We'll deal with that	11:56
21		Α.	Yes.	
22	270	Q.	but my specific question is: on hearing this	
23			information from Walter O'Sullivan, which you attribute	
24			to him, your concerns about not relaying the victim	
25			impact, and I'm suggesting also the details of the	11:56
26			visit on the 14th, your concerns would now fall away?	
27		Α.	I wouldn't say fall away. I mean, the fact is I still	
28			had the victim impact there with the contents in it, so	
29			it was going to be reviewed fully by management at	

- another juncture, so it was still a meeting I had with
- 2 her, she still had produced this document and in the
- document there was this reference to threats on her, so
- 4 it was something I had to still be concerned about.
- 5 271 Q. But, presumably, you were relieved to hear information
- 6 that was going to take the spotlight off you and switch
- 7 it on to management?
- 8 A. Yes, but --
- 9 272 Q. Isn't that right?
- 10 A. -- inevitably, the reading -- or, sorry, the
- 11 non-reading -- I knew I didn't read the document, so if

11:57

- I didn't read the document I couldn't really be held
- responsible for its contents if she didn't make a
- formal complaint, you know.
- 15 273 Q. Sergeant, the spotlight -- if this information was
- 16 correct, the spotlight would be lifted off you and
- 17 would be placed upon Garda management for refusing her
- 18 protection, isn't that right?
- 19 A. Well, I don't know whether spotlight is the right word,
- but I had my dealings with Baiba, other people had
- 21 their dealings with Baiba, and through probably an
- investigation, we'd find out then if that was the case
- and there was, as Walter O'Sullivan had relayed to me,
- 24 well then we'd have to find out what went wrong in
- relation to the entire episode, our dealings with Baiba 11:57
- 26 Saulite.
- 27 274 Q. Sorry, I didn't mean to cut you off. This was
- 28 startling information. This was, I am suggesting to
- 29 you, information you were going to be pleased to hear,

- for the reason I mentioned the spotlight would lift
- off you on to management you presumably asked Walter
- 3 O'Sullivan some questions around the issue?
- 4 A. Of that -- that issue of protection?
- 5 275 Q. Yeah.
- 6 A. No. I didn't. When he finished he left the office

11 · 58

11:58

11:58

- 7 after saying it.
- 8 276 Q. Well, what did you say to him when he told you?
- 9 A. I can't recall what I said in reply. I think he just
- said it and left, you know. He was on the way out the
- door anyway. He was standing with his back to the
- door, and he just held one hand up and said don't worry
- 13 about this and he moved off.
- 14 277 Q. Did you ask him who had made the request for protection
- on her behalf?
- 16 A. No, I did not.
- 17 278 Q. Did you ask him when this occurred?
- 18 A. Sorry?
- 19 279 Q. Did you ask him when this occurred?
- 20 A. When it occurred?
- 21 280 Q. Yeah.
- 22 A. No.
- 23 281 Q. Did you ask him who made the decision to turn it down?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 282 Q. Did you ask him the reasons it was turned down?
- 26 A. No.
- 27 283 Q. Why not?
- A. He had left the office; he had gone. He left the
- office after saying that, making that statement.

- 1 284 Q. And that's the reason you didn't ask him those questions?
- A. Well, I don't figure that -- that was a matter for Walter and the Commissioner's office. For me to be
- questioning in relation to it, I don't think it's my

11:59

11:59

- 6 place to be questioning him. But I suppose in
- 7 hindsight, I could maybe follow him out and ask him
- 8 more questions and find out exactly what happened.
- 9 285 Q. You see, didn't you have further dealings with Walter 10 O'Sullivan that week?
- 11 A. We did, in the bail application.
- 12 286 Q. Yes. So, your meeting with Walter O'Sullivan occurred on the Monday morning, the 20th November?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 287 Q. And am I correct that you received word that on the following Friday, there was to be a bail application in the High Court where Mr. A was looking for bail?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 288 Q. And Inspector O'Sullivan made contact with you to 20 prepare for the bail hearing?
- 21 A. Yes, we prepared for the bail hearing, yes.
- 22 289 Q. And you worked with him and also I think D/Sergeant
- 23 Finbar Garland who was involved in the stolen car
- racket investigation, and you prepared with Walter
- O'Sullivan on the Thursday and the Friday for the bail
- hearing, isn't that right?
- 27 A. We prepared with them? I don't recall meeting the two
- individuals, Detective Walter O'Sullivan and Sergeant
- 29 Garland, until the actual day of the bail hearing in

- 1 court.
- 2 290 Q. Did you have dealings with Walter O'Sullivan preparing
- for the bail?
- 4 A. I don't recall that.
- 5 291 Q. And I think on the Friday itself, you were in his
- 6 company for a good part of the day, isn't that right;

12:00

12:01

12:01

- 7 the case ran into after lunch?
- 8 A. That's correct, yes.
- 9 292 Q. And you went, you have told us, to a pub near the Four
- 10 Courts, was it, for lunch, on the Friday?
- 11 A. I recall that, yes.
- 12 293 Q. And you had a discussion with him there?
- 13 A. Yes, I did.
- 14 294 Q. Presumably during the course of this discussion, or
- 15 your contact with him right through the week, you
- revisited the conversation you claim you had with him
- on the Monday?
- 18 A. Sorry, can you repeat that? Did I --
- 19 295 Q. Presumably you brought up again with him the startling
- information he had conveyed to you on the Monday?
- 21 A. No. I did not.
- 22 296 Q. Why not?
- A. I just didn't bring it up with him. I thought, like,
- that was between him and the Commissioner's office.
- 25 297 Q. But, look, this was -- this was fairly seismic
- information, you'd agree with me?
- 27 A. Yes. It was information okay, yes, that he had in
- 28 relation to his interactions with the -- or his
- knowledge of interactions with the Commissioner's

- 1 office.
- 2 298 Q. Management were not only aware of a threat on her life
- 3 but they were in receipt of a request for protection
- 4 and they had turned it down?
- 5 A. That's what he said. That's what he said on the 20th

12:02

12:02

- 6 November to me in the office, in the community police
- 7 office in Swords.
- 8 299 Q. Whom did you tell?
- 9 A. Well, that morning, I contacted Garda Nyhan to tell him
- 10 what had --
- 11 300 Q. I beg your pardon, what?
- 12 A. Contacted Garda Nyhan, Declan Nyhan.
- 13 301 Q. And when did you contact him?
- 14 A. I'd say within a few minutes of receiving that
- information.
- 16 302 Q. Because it was important?
- 17 A. Well, I think he'd like to know, yes.
- 18 303 Q. And did you discuss with Garda Nyhan what to do about
- 19 it?
- 20 A. No, I did not, no.
- 21 304 Q. So, you just contacted him but you didn't discuss what
- 22 you were going to do with the information?
- 23 A. I don't understand, what could I do with the
- 24 information?
- 25 305 Q. No, no. You have told us you contacted Garda Nyhan on
- the Monday morning on learning this from Walter
- 27 O'Sullivan?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 306 Q. Was this in a phone call to Garda Nyhan?

- 1 A. A telephone call, yes.
- 2 307 Q. What did you say to him? you won't believe it, Declan,
- 3 I'm after hearing management knew it and they refused
- 4 her protection?
- 5 A. No, I discussed the interaction with Detective
- 6 Inspector Walter O'Sullivan at the office and the
- 7 Victim Impact Statement and I told him then in relation

12:03

12:03

12:04

- 8 to what Walter had said when he was leaving the office.
- 9 308 Q. Right. So, presumably you discussed what you were
- going to do with this important information?
- 11 A. No. We did not.
- 12 309 Q. Why not?
- 13 A. I don't understand what we could do with it. It was a
- 14 matter between Detective Inspector Walter O'Sullivan
- and the Commissioner's office what they were going to
- do with it.
- 17 310 Q. But did it not at the very least concern you that there
- had been a request for protection and somebody had made
- 19 a decision to turn it down?
- 20 A. Yes, it did.
- 21 311 Q. Were you not anxious to know the reasons for that and
- 22 the context in which that request for protection had
- 23 come?
- 24 A. I guess my feeling was that the request for protection
- arose in relation to the meeting on the 11th October
- 26 2006 with Baiba and another person at Baiba's home, and
- as a result of that meeting, the instrument for
- 28 protection -- or sorry, for John Hennessy, the
- instrument that arrived down in relation to the Garda

			response to John Heiliessy 3 Struction was brought to	
2			the attention of all members. And my reasoning back	
3			then was that there was probably protection requested	
4			in relation to the John Hennessy and Baiba Saulite	
5			arising from the 11th October developments.	12:04
6	312	Q.	Are you telling us that was an extrapolation you made	
7			or was that something that Walter O'Sullivan had said?	
8		Α.	No, no. The instrument had arrived down in relation to	
9			the Garda response to the assassination conspiracy on	
10			John Hennessy. My reasoning on the 20th October or	12:05
11			20th November was that protection had been sought for	
12			both John Hennessy and Baiba Saulite, and that was my	
13			reasoning behind what Walter O'Sullivan had told me.	
14	313	Q.	When was the first time you had wrote down your claim	
15			that Inspector O'Sullivan told you this important	12:05
16			information on the 20th November? When was the first	
17			time you wrote that down?	
18		Α.	I wrote it down I included it in my report, the	
19			confidential recipient's office, I included it my	
20			report to the disciplinary inquiry, which was the	12:05
21			disciplinary inquiry was in 2008 and similarly the	
22			confidential recipient process.	
23	314	Q.	Two years later?	
24		Α.	Yes, that's correct.	
25	315	Q.	Does that strike you as odd?	12:06
26		Α.	In hindsight, and looking back from where I am today,	
27			maybe I should have put it in writing straight away,	
28			but back then, I was reticent in relation to reporting	
29			any matter that obviously the tide of feelings in	

1			relation to Baiba Saulite and John Hennessy was that	
2			there was no protection sought and I was reticent at	
3			actually reporting that when the entire management	
4			structure appeared to be saying would be saying the	
5			opposite.	12:06
6	316	Q.	We'll come on to this, but I mean sorry, is that	
7			credible, sergeant? Christy Mangan looked for a report	
8			from you for the fact-finding in December. We all know	
9			it's not in there.	
10		Α.	We all know?	12:06
11	317	Q.	We all know you didn't include that detail in the	
12			report to Inspector Mangan?	
13		Α.	That's correct.	
14	318	Q.	That was a report into Garda knowledge as to whether	
15			there was a threat to Baiba Saulite?	12:07
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	319	Q.	All right? The information you claim Walter O'Sullivan	
18			gave you on the 20th November had a burning relevance	
19			to what Inspector Mangan was investigating. You didn't	
20			put it into Inspector Mangan's report, your report to	12:07
21			him - why?	
22		Α.	I was I gave Inspector Mangan a full chronology of	
23			my dealings with Baiba Saulite. If the same	
24			information had been sought from Inspector Walter	
25			O'Sullivan I would have thought that he would have	12:07
26			included his interactions and his dealings with Baiba	
27			Saulite and John Hennessy in his report to that	
28			fact-finding inquiry.	
29	320	0.	So, is it your evidence that you opted you decided	

1 you wouldn't put it in? 2 Yes. Α. 3 321 0. You withheld it? 4 Well, withheld -- I just didn't include it in that Α. 5 report. 12:08 6 322 In fact, you didn't include it in any report or written Q. document for two years? 7 8 well, as soon as I could avail of the confidential Α. recipient process, I included it in that report. 9 10 323 We might just look at that now. Page 510, please. Q. 12:08 11 And this is your report to Inspector Fergus Dwyer, then 12 Inspector Fergus Dwyer as part of the CRO 13 investigation. And this is dated the 29th October 14 2008, and if we might move to page 525 of the 15 materials, page 16 of this report, we see where you 12:08 16 mention it. And this is October 2008. And if we 17 scroll down towards the bottom of page 16, please, just 18 there, thank you Mr. Kavanagh. 19 20 Do you see here, sergeant, in this report you have 12:09 pasted in large swathes of your report to Inspector 21 22 Mangan for the fact-finding, isn't that right? 23 Yes, it would be from a draft to Inspector Mangan too, Α. 24 ves. But the bit at the bottom that's underlined that we see 12:09 25 324 0. on screen there, that's new, and you have put it in 26 27 there, isn't that right?

28

29

325

Correct.

Α.

Q.

So, you have, as it were, you have woven into your

Т			chronology that you have provided to Inspector Mangan	
2			this extra detail that you didn't provide Inspector	
3			Mangan?	
4		Α.	That's correct.	
5	326	Q.	And the underlined words say:	12:09
6				
7			"He went on to state that I should have no concerns	
8			about the document, that the Commissioner's office were	
9			well aware of the threats to John Hennessy and Baiba	
10			Saulite and refused to allocate protection"	12:10
11				
12			And I am interested in this last clause:	
13				
14			" despite being requested to do so by the	
15			investigating members."	12:10
16				
17			That's what you put in.	
18		Α.	That's correct.	
19	327	Q.	So, leaving aside for a moment that you are doing this	
20			now for the first time two years later, can I ask you	12:10
21			about that last clause there where it says "despite	
22			being requested to do so by the investigating members"?	
23			I want to suggest to you that makes no sense, because	
24			you were one of the investigating members centrally	
25			involved with the abduction, isn't that right?	12:10
26		Α.	The investigating members I am referring to here were	
27			people that were dealing with what I often refer to as	
28			the ancillary crimes that were being committed in	
29			respect of John Hennessy and Baiba Saulite.	

- 1 328 Q. If investigating members had requested protection for
- 2 Baiba Saulite, you would have known all about it?
- 3 A. But I didn't. I didn't know.
- 4 329 Q. You would have. You had constant dealings with her and

12 · 11

12:11

12:12

- 5 you would have had dealings with your colleagues
- 6 telling you about it, nobody would have withheld that
- 7 from that?
- 8 A. But I didn't know in relation to the requests for
- 9 protection on Baiba Saulite or John Hennessy.
- 10 330 Q. I'm suggesting to you, you didn't know because there
- 11 was no request and Walter O'Sullivan never said it to
- 12 you?
- 13 A. No, he definitely said it to me on the 20th November
- 14 2006. He said it to me and he it said in a way that he
- was maybe trying to alleviate my concerns: you needn't
- have anything to worry about. And he went on with
- 17 that, with what he said.
- 18 331 Q. I presume we can eliminate, you are not suggesting he
- said it to you knowing it to be incorrect just to
- 20 alleviate your concerns?
- 21 A. No, no. He said it as though it was factual.
- 22 332 Q. And this really is a central platform of your case,
- isn't it?
- 24 A. Of my case?
- 25 333 Q. Yes. Your whole account?
- A. Sorry, my whole account in relation to?
- 27 334 Q. Your -- the words you attribute to Inspector O'Sullivan
- forms a very important part of your whole account to
- 29 this Tribunal?

- A. It forms a part, the conversation that I had with
 Walter O'Sullivan forms a part of me believing that
 there had been a systems failure in relation to the
 coordination and correlation of crimes before Baiba's
- 5 death. 6 335 Q. As early as the press release, which we know is the

12:13

- 8 are being scapegoated?
- 9 A. I formed a view that there was a systems failure in 10 relation to the correlation and coordination of crimes 12:13 11 before Baiba's murder.

22nd November 2006, you had formed the view that you

- 12 336 Q. No, no. You have told the Tribunal, and I think it's
 13 in your materials as well, that as early as the press
 14 release, which was the 22nd November, a few days after
 15 the murder --
- 16 A. Yes.

7

- 17 337 Q. -- you had formed the view, and you said it to the High
 18 Court during Declan Nyhan's civil proceedings --
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 338 Q. -- you had formed the view that you were being scapegoated by management?
- 22 A. When I saw the press release, yes.
- 23 339 Q. Yes.
- 24 A. Yes
- 25 340 Q. So that's your thinking and that's your perspective as of as early as the 22nd November '06, isn't that right?
- A. Well, it was my feeling that the press release was pointing towards my work.
- 29 341 Q. You knew as well that the purpose of Inspector Mangan's

			race-inding investigation was to ascertain the rever	
2			of knowledge in the possession of An Garda Síochána	
3			concerning any threat to the life of Baiba Saulite; you	
4			knew that was its purpose, didn't you?	
5		Α.	I think it was the level of knowledge was level of	12:14
6			knowledge in relation to Baiba Saulite was the term	
7			they used in the terms of reference for that inquiry.	
8	342	Q.	Yes. So, wouldn't it have been in your interests and	
9			in the interests of the investigation that you would	
10			relay to Inspector Mangan what you claim Walter	12:14
11			O'Sullivan said to you?	
12		Α.	In hindsight, yes, I should have included that in the	
13			Inspector Mangan report, but back then, I was expecting	
14			that Inspector Mangan's investigation would discover	
15			that anyway.	12:14
16	343	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sorry?	
17		Α.	I was expecting that Inspector Mangan's fact-find	
18			investigation would discover that anyhow, without me	
19			having to	
20	344	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Well, why didn't you put it in? I mean,	12:14
21			wasn't it important?	
22		Α.	It was important Mr. Chairman and in hindsight looking	
23			back	
24	345	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I mean, here was a case where there wasn't	
25			just suspicions, there was knowledge.	12:15
26		Α.	It was.	
27	346	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Can you understand why it's puzzling that	
28			you didn't?	
29		Α.	If you recall from my evidence	

1	347	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, question: Can you understand why it's	
2			puzzling that you didn't? I mean it does not look	
3			good	
4		Α.	Yes, Mr. Chairman.	
5	348	Q.	CHAIRMAN: let's in the face it, if you don't	12:15
6			mention it for two years and here is this clearly	
7			bombshell information, I mean that was bombshell	
8			information, the guards knew of the guards looked	
9			for protection and it was rejected by the	
10			Commissioner's office. So senior people were seriously	12:15
11			in default, as you would see it. So why not put that	
12			bombshell information into the report?	
13		Α.	If you recall, Mr. Chairman, I was reticent in relation	
14			to reporting such matters and at the end of the	
15			conversation with Inspector Mangan I did	12:16
16	349	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Why were you reticent?	
17		Α.	I was I was I was concerned in relation to making	
18			such serious matters known, and I expected that	
19			Inspector O'Sullivan would make them known. But if I	
20			can finish?	12:16
21	350	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes.	
22		Α.	In relation to the at the end of my meeting with	
23			Inspector Mangan, I actually said I believe there was a	
24			systems failure in the way that things were managed	
25			and he said that he would report it onto the	12:16
26			Commissioner.	
27	351	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But your meaning of systems failure was	
28			policing failures in the assessment and management of	
29			the series of crimes and the information that was	

- 1 available to the Gardaí, you thought it should have
- been a central command and an overall assessment, isn't
- 3 that right?
- 4 A. Unified assessment, yes.
- 5 352 Q. CHAIRMAN: So you had that -- a unified approach to the 12:16

12:17

12:17

- 6 whole thing. So that they failed to appreciate the
- 7 level of threat to Baiba Saulite, that's essentially
- 8 the point.
- 9 A. That's correct, Mr. Chairman.
- 10 353 Q. CHAIRMAN: But here was evidence that they actually
- 11 knew about the threat.
- 12 A. That's according to the conversation -- yes.
- 13 354 Q. CHAIRMAN: According to you.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 355 Q. CHAIRMAN: So, is that not -- does that not sort of
- outrank the other complaints, your systems failure and
- 17 everything else? Sure, isn't this the biggest systems
- failure you could have conceived of: they actually
- 19 turned down a request?
- 20 A. Well, that would form part of the systems failure,
- Mr. Chairman.
- 22 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Anyway. Thank you.
- 23 356 Q. MR. O'HIGGINS: Inspector Mangan was appointed I think
- on the 6th December '06 to conduct a fact --
- 25 357 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, let me just stop for one moment.
- Sorry. Sergeant, help me on this. The question is:
- 27 why did Sergeant Hughes not put information about the
- request for protection that was made by officers to the
- 29 Commissioner's office and was rejected, why didn't he

- put that into the Mangan report? What do I write down?
 What's the reason you didn't?
- A. The reason was because I was very worried about me
 having to report a third party to an inquiry and I
 expected that Inspector O'Sullivan would actually have covered that in his report to the fact-find investigation.
- 8 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you. Thank you.
- 9 358 Q. MR. O'HIGGINS: Just stemming from the answer you have just given, your position is that you decided not to tell Inspector Mangan, you decided not to tell, am I correct, anybody but your colleague Garda Nyhan, is that right?
- A. I did have conversations with inspectors and with my -in the days after the murder, and I expressed my
 contention that there had been a systems failures --
- 17 359 Q. No, no, just stay with it for a moment.
- 18 A. Yes...
- 19 360 Q. Whom did you tell what I'm suggesting to you if I

 20 could borrow the Chairman's phrase the bombshell
 21 information, whom did you tell that to?
- A. Well, Garda Nyhan. And, I didn't repeat the actual
 terminology that was used to the officers, but I used
 the term "systems failure". And in my mind, if that
 was the case, as outlined by Detective Inspector Walter
 O'Sullivan, well then that would form part of the
 systems failure in relation to the overall events
 connected to Baiba Saulite.
- 29 361 Q. I just don't understand that. Whom did you tell, other

1			than Declan Nyhan, the information that there had been	
2			a request for protection but Garda management had	
3			refused? Who did you tell that to?	
4		Α.	Within the organisation?	
5	362	Q.	Yes.	12:20
6		Α.	Nobody at the time, no.	
7	363	Q.	Nobody?	
8		Α.	Nobody.	
9	364	Q.	But you told Declan Nyhan?	
10		Α.	I told Declan Nyhan, yes.	12:20
11	365	Q.	Right. When you decided not to put not to give the	
12			information to Inspector Mangan, which you'd agree with	
13			me would have been otherwise relevant to his	
14			investigation, so when you decided not to give it to	
15			him, information that would have been relevant, and you	12:20
16			knew would have been relevant, when you decided not to	
17			give it to him, did you discuss that with Declan Nyhan	
18			and did you discuss how you would get it out?	
19		Α.	No, I don't recall discussing that aspect with him at	
20			the time, but he was also invited to make his	12:21
21			contribution to the Mangan investigation, the	
22			fact-finding investigation I should say.	
23	366	Q.	Inspector Mangan was appointed on the 6th December.	
24			Your report is dated the 17th December. Can you tell	
25			the Tribunal when did you first start preparing your	12:21
26			report?	
27		Α.	Em, in the days leading up to the 16th. I decided to	
28			create a chronology of events as I was aware.	
29	367	Q.	Did you put it through a number of drafts?	

- A. I did, yes. Over the years I put it through a number of drafts and copying and pasting from it in relation
- 3 to other reports.
- 4 368 Q. No, but in terms of the actual document that you gave
 5 to -- submitted to Inspector Mangan, did it go through 12:21
- a number of drafts?
- 7 A. I'm not sure, I'm not sure.
- 8 369 Q. Are you maintaining your claim that your report to 9 Inspector Mangan was a protected disclosure?
- 10 A. I was asked by the investigators to describe my
 12:22
 11 revelations to management, my disclosures to management
 12 and I elected to have the Mangan report there as being
 13 a protected disclosure.

- 14 370 Q. I know that, but are you maintaining that claim?
- 15 A. I did say it in my statement, yes.
- 16 371 Q. My question is, and I presume you know why I'm asking
 17 this because it doesn't seem to make sense: Are you
 18 continuing to persist with the contention that it was a
 19 protected disclosure?
- A. Well, there are -- yes, it was a disclosure to
 Inspector Mangan in relation to, as we can see in the
 report there, the non-correlation of and the
 coordination of various crimes, lack of briefings in
 realisation to the various crimes.
- 25 372 Q. The report was a chronology of actions and dealings you 12:22 had with Ms. Saulite, isn't that right?
- 27 A. Sorry, I beg your pardon?
- 28 373 Q. The report was a chronology of dealings you had with 29 Ms. Saulite?

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 374 Q. Indeed, if we look at the report, which is at page 860,
- 3 that is actually spelt out by you in the report?
- 4 A. Sorry. Yes.
- 5 375 Q. You see the second paragraph there, sergeant:

6

- 7 "The following is a chronology of the events from the
- time of the abduction of the [blank] children until the
- 9 death of Ms. Saulite."
- 10 A. That's correct.

- 12:23
- 11 376 Q. That's how you phrased your document?
- 12 A. Yes, indeed.
- 13 377 Q. And this carries the date on the top right-hand corner
- of the 17th December 2006?
- 15 A. That's correct.

12:23

- 16 378 Q. I think this is the report you gave to Inspector Mangan
- for the fact-finding investigation that he was tasked
- 18 with carrying out?
- 19 A. That's correct.
- 20 379 Q. So, it's a timeline of actions and events?

12:24

12.24

- 21 A. The timeline is?
- 22 380 Q. It's a timeline.
- 23 A. Is accurate, yes.
- 24 381 Q. No, what it is is, it's a chronology?
- A. Yes, it's a chronology of all my dealings with Baiba
- 26 Saulite prior to the murder.
- 27 382 Q. You didn't indicate to Inspector Mangan, am I correct,
- that you were making a complaint when you submitted
- 29 your report?

- 1 A. No, no, he -- the request was for me to provide
- 2 information of my dealings with Baiba prior to her
- 3 murder.
- 4 383 Q. Am I correct, you didn't indicate you were making a
- 5 complaint?

- 6 A. Not at that time, no.
- 7 384 Q. When you submitted your report on the 17th December, am
- 8 I correct you handed him a 16-page report, not a
- 9 19-page report?
- 10 A. That's correct.

- 12 · 24
- 11 385 Q. You did not say to him, when you provided him with the
- report, that you were making allegations of system
- 13 failures?
- A. No, I didn't use that term at that time.
- 15 386 Q. Nor did you say you were feeling --

12:25

- 16 A. Sorry, I beg your pardon, if I can recollect. At the
- end, when I submitted the report to him and he slightly
- browsed through it, I said to him that I believe there
- 19 was a systems failure in relation to the Garda handling
- of the Baiba Saulite matters and he said he'd report my 12:25
- 21 concerns to the Commissioner.
- 22 387 Q. I think you are aware that's not Inspector Mangan's
- 23 recollection?
- 24 A. I think I am, yes.
- 25 388 Q. Nor did you say how you were feeling in respect of
- being isolated or being treated by senior management,
- 27 which you have elsewhere claimed you did say?
- 28 A. To Inspector Mangan, no.
- 29 389 Q. Yes.

_				
1	Λ	Λ+	that	time?
	A.	A L	unat	L IIIIC:

2 390 Q. Yes.

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- A. I recollect having a conversation with him in relation to the systems failure, and, you know, my general
- 5 feelings at the time.
- 6 391 Q. Inspector Mangan did not tell you that Garda management 7 would seek further clarification from you.

12:25

- A. He may not have said that but I just passed on my assertion that there had been a systems failure to him.
- 10 In your statement to the Tribunal of Inquiry, you make 392 Q. 12:26 11 an allegation that the commencement of Inspector 12 Mangan's fact-finding was part of a cover-up that was 13 underway in relation to events involving Baiba Saulite 14 prior to her murder, and you allege that the 15 Commissioner and senior Garda management were involved 12:26 16 as they were behind the instigation of the fact-finding 17 process, and you individualise your allegation and you 18 say that the individuals were Noel Conroy, who was the 19 Garda Commissioner, Al McHugh, who is the Assistant 20 Commissioner DMR, and you also say that the cover-up 12:26 involved the chain of command down to Inspector 21 22 Christopher Mangan. Are you persisting with the claim
 - was involved in a cover-up?

 A. The instruction down from -- to Inspector Mangan was to 12:27 carry out a fact-find in relation to all knowledge within An Garda Síochána in relation to Baiba Saulite.

 I was conscious, as the weeks passed, and months passed by that all members of An Garda Síochána who had

that Inspector Mangan, just to take him first of all,

Τ			dealings with Baiba Saulite were not being interviewed,	
2			members that had information in relation to their	
3			dealings with Baiba Saulite, even retired members who	
4			had had dealings with Baiba Saulite were not	
5			interviewed. So, from that perspective, the fact-find	12:27
6			did not extend to actually interview all members and it	
7			appeared to me to be concentrating on the visits by	
8			Baiba to me in the with me on the 14th November	
9			2006.	
10	393	Q.	If that was your position, sergeant, now would have	12:27
11			been the moment, I suggest to you, to play your main	
12			card, your claim that Walter O'Sullivan had told you	
13			about the bombshell information?	
14		Α.	If that was the position then?	
15	394	Q.	If it was your position that you formed a view from the	12:28
16			outset that the lens of the fact-finding was too narrow	
17			and was focussing too much on you and wasn't focussing	
18			sufficiently on others, if that was your position, I	
19			suggest to you that would have prompted you immediately	
20			to bring to the attention of Inspector Mangan and	12:28
21			management what you claim Walter O'Sullivan had said?	
22		Α.	Yes indeed, and taking that in mind, I started to raise	
23			these concerns with Superintendent Curran in April	
24			2007.	
25	395	Q.	No, no, no, you'd immediately make contact with the	12:28
26			inspector: Inspector, I didn't put it into my report	
27			but there is something I need to tell you that's of	
28			startling relevance to your inquiry. Why didn't you do	
29			that?	

2 months following the initiation of the fact-finding inquiry, I started to realise that certain people -- a 3 lot of people were not being interviewed in relation to 4 5 their dealings with Baiba Saulite, and it was following 12:29 that then that I raised it with my own line manager, 6 7 Superintendent Curran, I raised the fact that the 8 systems failure and --We'll come on to that. Superintendent Curran didn't 9 396 Q. come into the picture -- didn't even arrive in the 10 12 - 29 11 station until March of the next year? 12 Correct. Α. 13 He has no baggage in any of this. 397 Q. 14 Α. He has no what? 15 398 He has no baggage --Q. 12:29 16 Yes. Α. 17 399 He arrived in in the spring, all right. Q. **Inspector** 18 Mangan is tasked with doing the report? 19 Correct. Α. You know that because you give him your report? 20 400 Q. 12:29 21 That's correct. Α. 22 You have made a call I'm not going to include my 401 0. 23 startling information Walter O'Sullivan told me? 24 Yes. Α. 25 You now learn, you say, that people who should have 402 0. 12:30 26 been interviewed by Inspector Mangan haven't been 27 interviewed by him. Why didn't you go to Inspector Mangan and alert him to the information? 28

well I didn't do it, and the over the course of the

1

29

Α.

Α.

Yes, I didn't do that.

- 1 403 Q. We know that. Why not?
- A. I felt the proper course was to raise it through my own line management.
- 4 404 Q. But, you see, you didn't raise the bombshell
 5 information with Mark Curran when he entered the picture months later.
- 7 I don't recall, actually, that conversation with Mark Α. 8 Curran but I did raise the concept of a systems failure with him and that would have -- if I had been asked to 9 investigate, or if that was investigated at the time, 10 12:30 11 it's very possible then I would have actually relayed 12 the information in relation to Walter O'Sullivan's 13 conversation with me on the 20th November.
- 14 405 Q. I suggest to you that it's unfair of you to accuse
 15 Inspector Feehan -- Inspector Mangan for being involved 12:31
 16 in a cover-up; that's not fair.
- A. Well, the -- if the investigation was launched and
 certain matters are not uncovered, well then the person
 conducting that investigation then is obviously
 involved in not uncovering that information.

 12:31
- 21 406 Q. Information that you had withheld.
- A. No, the information from other members of the Garda Síochána who had dealings with Baiba Saulite prior to her murder.
- 25 407 Q. So your allegation of impropriety against the inspector 12:31 26 is it that he didn't uncover information that you 27 withheld from him?
- A. No, sorry, that he didn't uncover information that other people had as to their dealings with Baiba

1			Saulite prior to her murder.	
2	408	Q.	No, but included in that is he didn't uncover the	
3			seismic information you had learned?	
4		Α.	Yes, correct.	
5	409	Q.	So you are criticising him for failing to uncover	12:32
6			something that you chose to withhold from him.	
7		Α.	Yes, that's a fair point, but at the time I withheld it	
8			for the reasons, as I stated, I expected other people	
9			to actually contribute that information themselves to	
10			his inquiry.	12:32
11	410	Q.	You see, I wish to suggest to you that Inspector	
12			Mangan, far from limiting his inquiry to you, contacted	
13			a number of people and took a series of steps when he	
14			was tasked with the job of fact-finding. If we might	
15			look at page 856 of the materials.	12:32
16	411	Q.	CHAIRMAN: 856?	
17			MR. O' HI GGI NS: 856.	
18	412	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
19			MR. O'HIGGINS: And this is a report, or a	
20			communication by Detective Superintendent Christopher	12:33
21			Mangan. At that point we see it's signed by him on	
22			page 858, but if we stay on page 856 we see it's dated	
23			11th October 2011. And it's title "Sequence of Events	
24			Relative to Fact-Finding Investigation Report Completed	
25			By Chief Supterintendent Michael Feehan."	12:33
26				
27			"With reference to the above I wish to report the	
28			following is the sequence of events relative to the	
29			fact-finding investigation completed by Chief	

1	Supterintendent Michael Feehan.
2	
3	1. On the 6th December 2006, Chief Superintendent
4	Feehan was requested by Assistant Commissioner McHugh
5	to carry out a fact-finding investigation and report 12:
6	his views and recommendations on the level of knowledge
7	in possession of An Garda Síochána relative to threats
8	to Baiba Saulite prior to her murder.
9	
10	2. Chi ef Superintendent Feehan requested Detective
11	Inspector Christopher Mangan to assist with the
12	i nvesti gati on.
13	
14	3. Detective Inspector Christopher Mangan contacted
15	Detective Superintendent Michael Byrne to establish if 12:
16	he had any information in his possession in relation to
17	the matter and he indicated he was not in possession of
18	any such information.
19	
20	4. Inspector Mangan requested Sergeant Hughes to 12:
21	submit a report Sergeant Hughes submitted a report.
22	
23	5. Detective Inspector Mangan requested Garda Nyhan to
24	submit a report Garda Nyhan submitted a report.
25	12:
26	6. Detective Inspector Mangan requested Detective
27	Sergeant Kieran McEneaney to submit a report for the
28	fact finding. Detective Sergeant Kieran McEneaney
29	submitted a report dated 21st December 2006.

1				
2			7. Inspector Mangan visited the District Office at	
3			Coolock Garda Station where he spoke to Inspector Donal	
4			Waters, Acting District Office. Inspector Donal Waters	
5			was not in possession of any information relative to	12:34
6			the investigation. Detective Inspector Mangan examined	
7			the files held at the District Office, Coolock Garda	
8			Station and two reports relative to Baiba Saulite were	
9			located. The first report was dated 20th January 2005	
10			and had been forwarded to sergeant Liam Hughes by the	12:35
11			District Officer. The second report contained Leader	
12			from John Hennessy solicitor and this had also been	
13			forwarded to Sergeant Liam Hughes on the 1st November	
14			2005. "	
15				12:35
16			Just pause there. Do you recall that, sergeant?	
17		Α.	The second report, is it?	
18	413	Q.	Those two documents referred to at paragraph number 7	
19			there.	
20		Α.	I'd have to be reminded on those.	12:35
21	414	Q.	So, the first is the two reports relative to Baiba	
22			Saulite and also a report of the 1st November '05, does	
23			that ring any bells?	
24		Α.	I'd just have to be reminded on those.	
25	415	Q.	All right. It continues:	12:35
26				

27

28

29

"The former district officer, Superintendent Noel

McLoughlin, was not interviewed as he had retired.

Garda Adrian Walsh, district officer Coolock, was

1	interviewed by Detective Inspector Christopher Mangan	
2	and he was unable to provide any information relative	
3	to the investigation.	
4		
5	8. Inspector Mangan also researched section 5 of the	12:3
6	Criminal Justice Act 1993" and that's the statutory	
7	basis for criminal impact statements.	
8		
9	"9. Detective Inspector Mangan examined and considered	
10	the Victim Impact Report submitted by Baiba Saulite to	12:3
11	Sergeant Hughes.	
12		
13	10. Inspector Mangan researched and considered the	
14	judgement of the Court of Appeal in DPP v Wayne	
15	Donoghue.	12:3
16		
17	11. Inspector Mangan researched and considered the	
18	previous victim impact statements which were submitted	
19	in criminal cases in the C district.	
20		12:3
21	12. Inspector Mangan interrogated the Garda PULSE	
22	information system to establish what information	
23	existed relative to threats to Baiba Saulite.	
24		
25	13. Inspector Mangan examined statements made by Baiba	12:3
26	Saulite to Garda Conor McNally.	
27		
28	14. Inspector Mangan spoke to Garda Alan Campbell who	
29	was involved in the completion of the original file	

Т			Thivorving Sergeant Hughes and Barba Saurite.	
2				
3			Now that you see that there, sergeant, would you agree	
4			with me that it's not fair to suggest that Inspector	
5			Mangan solely focussed on you?	12:36
6		Α.	Em, if you I know it will probably be opened later,	
7			but if you contrast the amount of people interviewed in	
8			that investigation with that that was in the	
9			investigation conducted by Chief Superintendent Feehan	
10			in the confidential recipient process, you'll see that	12:37
11			far more people were interviewed in relation to their	
12			dealings with Baiba Saulite than in this particular	
13			investigation.	
14	416	Q.	So was that latter report an investigation, was that a	
15			very thorough report as far as you were concerned?	12:37
16		Α.	The confidential recipient one?	
17	417	Q.	Yes.	
18		Α.	It seems to be quite extensive, yes.	
19	418	Q.	And very thorough around comprehensive?	
20		Α.	It's thorough and comprehensive in respect of	12:37
21			interviewing far more members of the Garda Síochána	
22			that had dealings with Baiba Saulite prior to her	
23			murder.	
24	419	Q.	And very professionally done and very in-depth in the	
25			approach it took to the whole investigation, you'd	12:37
26			agree with that?	
27		Α.	I don't fully agree with that, no.	
28	420	Q.	I see. We'll come back to that in due course when we	
29			do it in chronology.	

1		Α.	Sure.	
2	421	Q.	Now, if we could if we could look at the conclusions	
3			that Inspector Mangan came to, the conclusion of the	
4			second report is at page 890, and we see from the	
5			bottom of the page that this is then Detective	12:38
6			Inspector Christopher Mangan and it carries the date of	
7			the 2nd February. If we scroll down a bit more, we'll	
8			see the date of it, the 2nd February 2007. So, perhaps	
9			if we could just scroll back up to the top we'll see	
10			the conclusion he reached having spoken to all those	12:38
11			people.	
12				
13			"During the period of time that Baiba Saulite was	
14			involved with Mr. A she suffered emotionally and	
15			physi cal I y "	12:38
16				
17			"Sergeant Liam Hughes had submitted a comprehensive	
18			report outlining his dealings with the deceased."	
19				
20			That word "comprehensive" that's in your ease, isn't	12:39
21			it, that's fair minded of him?	
22		Α.	That's the chronology I gave, yes.	
23	422	Q.	My question is: wasn't it fair minded of him to refer	
24			to it as being a comprehensive report?	
25		Α.	Yes indeed.	12:39
26	423	Q.	"Detective Sergeant Kieran McEneaney has submitted a	
27			report outlining his dealings with the deceased. Both	

sergeants were not in possession of specific threats to

her and she did not make any formal complaint to either

1			member. Garda Nyhan has submitted a brief report	
2			outlining that he was not aware of a threat to her."	
3				
4			I think we can take it from that, sergeant, that Garda	
5			Nyhan also chose not to disclose the startling	12:39
6			information that you had relayed to him?	
7		Α.	Yes indeed.	
8	424	Q.	The report continues:	
9				
10			"The handwritten document submitted by Baiba Saulite to	12:40
11			Sergeant Hughes would not constitute a Victim Impact	
12			Statement and would not have been accepted by the	
13			courts.	
14				
15			The handwritten document purporting to be a Victim	12:40
16			Impact Statement could not be used by the Gardaí to	
17			investigate or instigate a prosecution against Mr. A."	
18				
19			Again, I think that is a reasonable and fair-minded	
20			conclusion to draw that is in ease of your position,	12:40
21			isn't that right	
22		Α.	That would be correct, yes.	
23	425	Q.	"As a result of the investigation of the facts to hand,	
24			I am of the view that Sergeant Hughes and Garda Nyhan	
25			completed a complex investigation in a very	12:40
26			professi onal manner."	
27				
28			You'd agree with me that again is a reasonable and	
29			fair-minded observation for the inspector to make?	

- 1 A. Yes, it is.
- 2 426 Q. He is not targeting you when he makes -- when he puts
- 3 in that reference?
- 4 A. Em, as I stated there, there were far more people
- 5 involved with Baiba Saulite that maybe he could have

12 · 41

12:41

12:41

12.41

- 6 commented on in relation to their investigations.
- 7 427 O. He continues:
- 8 "There certainly was knowledge in existence and
- 9 available to the Gardaí in relation to threats from
- 10 Mr. A to Baiba Saulite."
- 11 That's correct, isn't it?
- 12 A. I have read that. I don't fully understand "there was
- knowledge in existence and available to the Gardaí in
- relation to threats from Mr. A to Baiba Saulite".
- 15 428 Q. Yes. So for instance, what he is referring to there,
- as I understand it, is the fact that you had put up on
- 17 PULSE that he had threatened her, that she had reported
- that he had threatened her, isn't that right?
- 19 A. Yes, yes.
- 20 429 Q. You were also aware that in her statements in January
- of '05, she had also given chapter and verse on
- assaults and, on her case, being threatened and
- intimidated by her partner?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 430 Q. And you were aware of that as well?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 431 Q. So how were you puzzled by that -- there was knowledge
- available to the Gardaí in relation to threats from
- Mr. A to Baiba Saulite? There were.

1	Α.	There were. And there was more information there that
2		could have been discovered in that investigation as
3		well.

- 4 432 Q. Yeah. So, how were you puzzled by that? That's a correct statement.
- A. But he is not including the remaining -- the other members who were involved with Baiba Saulite in their assessments.

12 · 42

12:42

12:43

12 · 43

- 9 433 Q. He does, in his report, indicate the level of knowledge 10 and also looked at the PULSE, isn't that right?
- 11 A. He has looked at PULSE but there was matters that were 12 not put in PULSE pertaining to Baiba.
- 13 434 Q. Yes. And his next statement: "The members of An Garda
 14 Síochána involved with Baiba Saulite readily admit this
 15 in their reports." That's correct as well, isn't it?
- 16 A. I think he is referring just to myself and Kieran 17 McEneaney there.
- 18 435 Q. I think he may be, it's not clear, we can ask him, but
 19 I suggest it's yourself and Declan Nyhan?
- 20 A. Yes, and Declan Nyhan, correct.
- 21 436 Q. So that's also correct?
- 22 Well there was other people that had reports -- sorry, Α. 23 information that could have been -- I'll make it clear 24 to you I am not suggesting that you failed to act on 25 foot of that information, that's not my point. 26 I suggesting to you that you were in any way guilty of 27 the disciplinary charge because you were exonerated of 28 that, I want to make that clear. But in terms of the 29 limited initial conclusions by the inspector in this

1 last page, they are all correct. 2 It is, but he doesn't allude at all to the matters that Α. were not put in PULSE that involved Baiba Saulite and 3 her interactions with Gardaí. 4 5 437 So you are criticising him that he didn't Q. 12:43 6 exhaustively go through in his conclusion paragraph 7 here, he ought to put it in other materials? 8 There is a lot more material that could have been gone Α. into the report, yes, in relation to the assessment of 9 the level of threat known to the Gardaí prior to her 10 12 · 43 11 death. 12 But you see, you are aware, aren't you, sergeant, this 438 Q. 13 was a fact-finding; it is a preliminary report to see 14 if there is something to look into in depth; in modern parlance, a scoping exercise, isn't that right? 15 12:44 16 Yes, to find the level of threat known to members of An Α. 17 Garda Síochána prior to her murder. 18 No, no, no --439 Q. 19 Level of knowledge rather. Α. 20 No, it was to gather facts to see if they warranted an 440 0. inquiry; that's what he was doing, no more than that? 21 22 Yes. Α. 23 441 And you see it in the last sentence: Q. 24 25 "In order to clearly outline the facts in existence, I

That's all he was doing. He wasn't reaching a

investigated."

26

27

28

respectfully suggest that this matter be formally

- conclusion for or against you. He wasn't condemning
- 2 you. He was simply indicating it was appropriate to
- 3 proceed to an investigation.
- 4 A. I accept that.
- 5 442 Q. And yet you say he targeted you?
- 6 A. Well in that report there, the overall -- the overall

12 · 45

- 7 situation with the fact-find investigation leading up
- 8 to the disciplinary investigation, I felt I was
- 9 targeted --
- 10 443 Q. CHAIRMAN: How was this targeting you, sergeant? How
- did Inspector Mangan target you specifically?
- 12 A. Well, I have always believed, Mr. Chairman, that there
- 13 was evidence there available to the Garda Síochána
- following the murder --
- 15 444 Q. CHAIRMAN: Sorry, you are not answering my question. I 12:45
- am trying to be specific because I want to be clear. I
- 17 understand your case and your complaints, I understand
- 18 all that. Here is a report by Inspector Mangan. How
- did he target you in that report?
- 20 A. Well, it appears in that report that he was just -- the 12:46
- focus of attention is back on my dealings with Baiba
- 22 Saulite on the 14th November 2006.
- 23 445 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. The focus is on you?
- 24 A. In that report, yes.
- 25 446 Q. CHAIRMAN: And that's how he targets you?
- A. Well he targeted my, work, yes.
- 27 447 Q. CHAIRMAN: Because the focus is -- the focus of this
- report is on you?
- 29 A. The focus of this report seems to be, to me, to be

Т			actually locussing in on my meeting with Balba Saulite,	
2			and then he is talking about the Victim Impact Report	
3			and the Criminal Justice Act in relation to how the	
4			circumstances by which way the victim impact reports	
5			are formulated.	12:46
6	448	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Does he not tend to exonerate you by saying	
7			it's a complex investigation and so on, and it couldn't	
8			be used to investigate? I mean, are we reading the	
9			same document when he says the victim impact couldn't	
10			be used? How is that targeting you?	12:47
11		Α.	He says the handwritten document purporting to be a	
12			Victim Impact Statement could not be used by the Garda	
13			to instigate a prosecution against Mr. A.	
14	449	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Mmm Nothing wrong with that, I take it?	
15		Α.	It would not have been accepted by the courts,	12:47
16			Mr. Chairman	
17	450	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You are not saying there is anything wrong	
18			with that, are you?	
19		Α.	No, I actually fully agree with that.	
20	451	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yeah.	12:47
21		Α.	But when he was asked to the level of knowledge, the	
22			focus appeared to be on my dealings with Baiba Saulite	
23			prior to her murder.	
24	452	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. When he says "the members of on Garda	
25			Si uochana i nvol ved Bai ba Saulite", do you think that	12:48
26			applies to you and Garda Nyhan exclusively?	
27		Α.	And Detective Sergeant McEneaney I think is mentioned	
28			there as well.	
29	453	0.	CHAIRMAN: Well if Detective Sergeant McEneanev is	

1			included, that's somebody else it's focussed on, isn't	
2			that right?	
3		Α.	That's correct.	
4	454	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. He is deliberately targeting you?	
5		Α.	Well I felt the report	12:48
6	455	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand your complaint. You say this	
7			report could have been better, it could have been more	
8			thorough, it could have been this, that and the other?	
9		Α.	Yes.	
10	456	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay, fair enough, maybe you are right,	12:48
11			maybe you are wrong, maybe the report could have been a	
12			lot better, a lot more thorough. But that's a	
13			different thing saying I have a criticisms of this	
14			report, that's a different thing from saying this man	
15			targeted me, he deliberately set out to damage me. So	12:48
16			I mean, that's what targeting that's my	
17			understanding of targeting is: he set out to get me.	
18		Α.	well, in the overall context of the disciplinary	
19			procedure which came later	
20	457	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I'm not talking about the overall context of	12:49
21			anything. I am talking about I'm sorry, I	
22			interrupt, and I shouldn't interrupt, but just so you	
23			understand what I'm looking for. Here we have	
24			Detective Inspector Mangan. Now, I want to know how	
25			did he set out to target you? Because, presumably, you	12:49
26			can't target somebody accidentally, so he said I'm	
27			going to target Sergeant Hughes, is that what you are	
28			saying?	
29		Α.	What I'm saying, Mr. Chairman, is that the report from	

Т			inspector mangan there formed the basis of his	
2			superiors officers in deciding on a course. Now, if he	
3			had conducted a full fact-finding inquiry, it would	
4			have been revealed that several offences there that	
5			were reported that involved Baiba Saulite were not	12:50
6			properly investigated, and that some of them were not	
7			entered on PULSE and not properly disseminated, and	
8			that was a level of knowledge that was known to members	
9			of the Garda Síochána prior to her murder, and they	
10			were not factored into that report. So, from my	12:50
11			perspective, the fact that the reports were forming the	
12			basis of an assessment to senior officers', therefore,	
13			determination as to whether there was any disciplinary	
14			issues arising, I think that there should have been a	
15			much more widespread collection of information in	12:50
16			relation to Baiba from other members.	
17	458	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. That seems to me please correct me	
18			now if I'm wrong that that seems to to me to be	
19			letting Inspector Mangan off-the-hook. Am I right in	
20			saying that?	12:50
21		Α.	Not off-the-hook, no. His job was to, as we know, to	
22			collect all the information from members of An Garda	
23			Síochána who had knowledge of Baiba's Baiba Saulite	
24			prior to her murder. This wasn't done.	
25	459	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You know what I have to write down. The	12:51
26			question I have to ask is: did senior officers and	
27			we'll include Inspector Mangan for this purpose did	
28			Inspector Mangan target Sergeant Hughes because he had	

made a protected disclosure? That's what I have to

Т			answer. Now what do I say in relation to that?	
2		Α.	Well, I think that if he had concluded or, sorry,	
3			conducted a far more comprehensive investigation, it	
4			would have taken the focus of attention away from my	
5			case.	12:51
6	460	Q.	CHAIRMAN: would he still have had to answer the	
7			question about you?	
8		Α.	Well if he had all the information that I think he	
9			should have had in compiling	
10	461	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But would he still have had to answer the	12:52
11			question about you?	
12		Α.	Yes indeed.	
13	462	Q.	CHAIRMAN: There'd be you, but there'd be a lot of	
14			other people as well	
15		Α.	Yes, the bottom like, the report could have been	12:52
16			concluded that I have noted that there were several	
17			investigations in relation to Baiba Saulite and	
18			information wasn't correlated properly, that they	
19			haven't investigated properly, and that there are far	
20			more issues here arising, rather than the Victim Impact	12:52
21			Report and Sergeant Hughes's dealings with the	
22	463	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you think he was asked to do that?	
23		Α.	He was, he was asked to	
24	464	Q.	CHAIRMAN: was he asked to evaluate the quality of the	
25			policing before the murder?	12:52
26		Α.	Well he was asked to assemble the level of knowledge	
27			or assess the level of knowledge	
28	465	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Are we talking the same language here?	
29		Δ	Vac	

Т	466	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I mean Anyway, there it is. You	
2			say this was targeting you because you had made a	
3			protected disclosure. And which protected disclosure	
4			was that?	
5		Α.	Which protected disclosure?	12:52
6	467	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Did you had you made any protected	
7			disclosure before the Sergeant the Inspector Mangan	
8			report? Actually, do you know, don't worry about that,	
9			we'll have a legal debate in the end over the evidence	
10			and the conclusions and the inferences, and I am sorry	12:53
11			for asking you a question that seems to me is more	
12			properly a matter for argument and inference, so we'll	
13			retreat from that.	
14			Anyway, there it is. I have the picture. You say	
15			Inspector Mangan should have carried out a much more	12:53
16			comprehensive report and he would have found out a lot	
17			of other things, and because he didn't, you say that	
18			represented targeting of me? That's essentially	
19		Α.	That's essentially it, Mr. Chairman. Thanks.	
20	468	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	12:53
21			MR. O'HIGGINS: Sergeant, just before we move off	
22			Inspector Mangan's report, can I ask you to look at	
23			page 882, which is the final page of his earlier report	
24			to Assistant Commissioner to Chief Superintendent	
25			Feehan. So it's his initial report, and this is the	12:54
26			last page of it, and we might scroll down towards the	
27			bottom, please. And this is dated the 22nd December	
28			2006, so it's a little before, and just the last	
29			paragraph there I want to draw to your attention.	

1				
2			He focuses in on the victim impact and he says:	
3				
4			"In the absence of a statement of complaint from Baiba	
5			Saulite, the Gardaí would be unable to interview Mr. A	12:54
6			who was in prison when the intimidation was ongoing.	
7			Without a statement of complaint a prosecution could	
8			not be instigated against Mr. A for the issuing of	
9			threats. As the matter stood, the Gardaí had no	
10			evidence to deal with the situation and impose any form	12:54
11			of sanction on Mr. A."	
12				
13			You'd agree with me that was, again, a fair-minded	
14			reference that actually was in ease of your position?	
15		Α.	That's his assessment of the position, yes.	12:55
16	469	Q.	Yeah, and it was in ease of your position.	
17		Α.	Sorry?	
18	470	Q.	It was in ease of you. It favoured your position. It,	
19			as it were, defended your position.	
20		Α.	If he is referring to the victim impact, it would	12:55
21			appear, yes, that he is speaking in favour of that.	
22	471	Q.	It's not just the victim impact actually, he is saying	
23			that in the absence of a statement of complaint from	
24			Baiba Saulite, you know, at this time, and I suggest to	
25			you this could also incorporate the visit to the	12:55
26			station on the 14th November, in the absence of a	
27			statement of complaint, the Gardaí would be unable to	
28			interview Mr. A, and without a statement of complaint,	
29			a prosecution could not be instigated against Mr. A.	

1			So, I'm suggesting to you these are points,	
2			conclusions, preliminary conclusions he has reached	
3			that are actually in ease of your position?	
4		Α.	Yes, that could be so, yes.	
5	472	Q.	Right. And I am suggesting to you that that doesn't	12:56
6			sit easily with an allegation that this man was	
7			targeting you or being unfair to you.	
8		Α.	The as I said, the when the senior officers	
9			relied on his reports there to proceed with a	
10			disciplinary investigation, I don't think they had	12:56
11			access to all the information that was available in	
12			relation to Baiba Saulite prior to her murder.	
13	473	Q.	Yes. No, it was intended there'd be a more in-depth	
14			investigation then, that's the nature of a scoping	
15			exercise, isn't that right?	12:56
16		Α.	The sorry, could you repeat that?	
17	474	Q.	Yes. The nature of a fact-finding, or what I termed	
18			scoping exercise, is that it's preliminary, it's not	
19			the full investigation?	
20		Α.	Yes, I would say, but it wouldn't necessitate the	12:57
21			conduct of a full investigation.	
22	475	Q.	Yes. And that was his conclusion; from his preliminary	
23			look at things it warranted looking into further, and	
24			that was reasonable, wasn't it?	
25		Α.	A full investigation, ves. I think it warranted a full	12:57

investigation from the outset.

there is --

26

27

28

29

476 Q.

All right. I'm going to move now to your dealings with

Inspector Cryan, which is a new area, and you are aware

1			CHAIRMAN: Do you want to leave it at that before we	
2			will we break is that a convenient time to break for	
3			lunch?	
4			MR. O'HIGGINS: That be would convenient, Chairman.	
5			Thank you.	12:57
6			CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you very much.	
7				
8				
9				
10			THE HEARING ADJOURNED FOR LUNCH AND RESUMED AS FOLLOWS:	12:58
11				
12			CHAIRMAN: Thanks very much.	
13	477	Q.	MR. O'HIGGINS: Sergeant, can I bring you now to Swords	
14			Garda Station on the well, first of all, we know	
15			that the murder was the 19th November and then the	14:01
16			conference was on the 20th, the Monday, isn't that so?	
17		Α.	That's correct.	
18	478	Q.	All right. You had a number of discussions or meetings	
19			with then Inspector Michael Cryan in the days that	
20			followed the murder, isn't that so?	14:02
21		Α.	That's correct.	
22	479	Q.	And on the Tuesday, the 21st November, Inspector Cryan	
23			made contact with you by telephone, isn't that right?	
24		Α.	That's correct.	
25	480	Q.	Around about lunch time, around 1:15?	14:02
26		Α.	I don't recall the time.	
27	481	Q.	Right. And he basically rang you for two reasons I am	
28			suggesting; he had phoned you on the Sunday night, the	
29			night of the murder, while he was en route to the scene	

1 of the murder, and in this phone call now on the 2 Tuesday at lunch hour, his purpose of ringing you was 3 that D/Sergeant McEneaney had asked him to get a copy of the abduction of the children file that you had? 4 5 Yes, I read his notes. Α. 14:03 6 482 0. Pardon? 7 I read his notes on that, yes. Α. 8 483 well, that's correct, isn't it, he asked you --0. Yes, I have a recollection of him ringing me in 9 Α. relation to the child abduction investigation file. 10 14 · 03 11 484 Q. Riaht. He indicates that in this call you were still 12 very shocked, and you said you couldn't believe it had 13 come to this with Baiba being murdered, and you 14 indicated you kept racking your brain to see if there 15 was something else you could have done to prevent it? 14:03 16 Yes, they are his notes on that, yes. Α. 17 I know they are his notes. But is that what you said? 485 Q. 18 I could have said that to him, yes. 19 486 So, I'm suggesting to you that you were -- you Q. were really troubled and you were actually being hard 20 14:04 21 on yourself? 22 Being hard on myself? Α. 23 487 Yes. Q. 24 I was fairly concerned obviously after Baiba's death in 25 relation to how it transpired, yes. 14.04 But more specifically, as well as being obviously 26 488 Yes. Q. 27 deeply upset and troubled by the murder, that she had 28 been killed, you were specifically also concerned, from

29

your own position, in that you were racking your brain:

1			was there more I could have done?	
2		Α.	That's a possibility yes, but I would have if I was	
3			given a chance to qualify it I would say: Was there	
4			more that we all could have done in relation to Baiba	
5			Saulite?	14:04
6	489	Q.	Really? We can all get very philosophical about this.	
7			I am asking you what you said to the man. He says you	
8			indicated to him that you kept racking your brain and	
9			wondered if there was something more you could have	
10			done, did you say that?	14:05
11		Α.	Well, I don't have any recollection of the actual	
12			the words I used with Inspector Cryan on that date.	
13	490	Q.	He indicates that he tried to console you, he doesn't	
14			use that word but he said to you as far as he knew, he	
15			had done all you could?	14:05
16		Α.	Sorry, is this a telephone conversation or is it a	
17			meeting?	
18	491	Q.	A telephone call, lunch hour, 1:15 on the Tuesday?	
19		Α.	No, I don't recollect that format of language being	
20			used.	14:05
21	492	Q.	All right. I wonder is your recollection flawed?	
22			Because you also don't seem to remember that he rang	
23			you on the Sunday night?	
24		Α.	I don't remember that he rang me on the Sunday night.	
25	493	Q.	His note appears to indicate that he did?	14:05
26		Α.	He says that he did, but I have disputed that. I don't	
27			recollect him ringing me on the Sunday night. I	
28			reported on several occasions to the authorities that I	
29			received a telephone call from Sergeant Ambrose and	

- in relation to the murder, twice.
- 2 494 Q. It isn't disputed that you did.
- 3 A. Sorry?
- 4 495 Q. It isn't disputed that you received a call from
- 5 Sergeant Ambrose, certainly it's not my purpose or
- 6 intention to suggest that you didn't get a call from

14 · 06

14:06

14:07

- 7 Sergeant Ambrose. But I'm suggesting you did get a
- 8 call from Michael Cryan on the Sunday.
- 9 A. I don't recollect getting a call from Michael Cryan on
- the night of the murder.
- 11 496 Q. Okay. Do you recall the phone call at lunch hour on
- 12 the Tuesday?
- 13 A. I don't recollect the time, but I accept that I did --
- 14 was contacted by Inspector Cryan over the following
- days.
- 16 497 Q. Right. He says that you said that Mr. A had made
- 17 threats against you, yourself, and Garda Nyhan, and he
- says that you expressed anger that "no one in authority
- had phoned to see how he was".
- A. How I was?
- 21 498 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. Again, I don't recollect the format of the conversation
- that we had on that occasion.
- 24 499 Q. And he says that he responded, that's why I am ringing
- you, and that he said to you that you hadn't told him
- about the specific threats to you and Garda Nyhan when
- 27 he spoke to you on the Sunday night en route to the
- 28 murder scene?
- 29 A. That he said I hadn't told him about the specific

- 1 threats, is it?
- 2 500 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. Again, I don't recollect that format of conversation
- 4 with Inspector Cryan.
- 5 501 Q. He says that you agreed you hadn't told him that, and

14 · 08

14:08

14:08

14 . 08

- 6 you explained that it was only after the murder that
- 7 the significance of the threat became obvious?
- 8 A. Against myself and Garda Nyhan, is it?
- 9 502 Q. Yes.
- 10 A. I don't recollect discussing the level of threat
- 11 against me or Garda Nyhan with Inspector Cryan.
- 12 503 Q. He says that you stated you were very angry and annoyed
- 13 that somebody in DDU that's the detective unit -
- 14 would now try to blame you for not doing your job
- 15 properly.
- 16 A. No, I don't recollect that format of conversation.
- 17 504 Q. And he says that you said you didn't want anybody in
- DDU, especially the D/Sergeant or the D/Superintendent
- 19 ringing you about it or speaking to you?
- 20 A. No, again, I don't recollect that.
- 21 505 Q. You did have some class of longstanding dispute with
- some of your detective colleagues, isn't that right?
- 23 A. I had reported some detective members there, management
- there, for various matters there and that's a matter of
- 25 record.
- 26 506 Q. All right. And believe me, it's not part of my purpose
- to go into that, or I don't think it's really what the
- 28 Tribunal wants to go into it, but you brought it up
- here in this conversation I am suggesting to you, and

			you said to inspector cryan, you asked that someone in	
2			uniform be appointed to deal with you, not one of the	
3			detectives?	
4		Α.	No, I don't recollect that at the time, and I certainly	
5			would not have said to Inspector Cryan, or intimated to	14:09
6			him, that I wouldn't take any approach from a member in	
7			authority such as a detective superintendent.	
8	507	Q.	He says that you also stated that no one in the DDU had	
9			assisted in the investigation of the child abduction?	
10		Α.	He says that? Again, I don't recollect the actual	14:09
11			conversation the words of the conversation I had	
12			with Inspector Cryan on that day, or thereabouts.	
13	508	Q.	And he says that you felt that yourself and Garda Nyhan	
14			were being left out to dry?	
15		Α.	Again, I don't recollect that conversation.	14:09
16	509	Q.	Says that he pointed out Garda Alan Campbell, who was	
17			then in the DDU, had assisted and done the covering	
18			report for the abduction and that the DDU had	
19			investigated the criminal damage to the solicitor's	
20			house which was connected to the case?	14:10
21		Α.	Again, I don't remember the exact train of conversation	
22			that you are referring to there, but Garda Campbell did	
23			actually compile the book, the child investigation	
24			investigation file book.	
25	510	Q.	Of the abduction file that went into the DPP?	14:10
26		Α.	That's grand. In January 2005.	
27	511	Q.	And Inspector Cryan says that you said the criminal	
28			damage to the solicitor's house was not investigated	
29			properly and nor was the criminal damage to Baiba	

1	C7	7
1	Saulite's	car:

- A. Again, I don't remember the conversation in that regard, but that would have been my thoughts at the time.
- 5 512 Q. He says that he pointed out to you that he was well
 aware of what had been done and had only discussed it
 with Sergeant Ambrose the previous Wednesday, the 15th
 November?

- 9 A. Yes. Again I don't recollect the train of conversation.
- 11 513 Q. All right. He says you asked that Inspector Cryan

 12 would ring Garda Nyhan, and he indicated to you that he

 13 would that afternoon?
- A. Yes indeed. Just to qualify that. This -- I think
 most of what you are saying there actually was given in evidence in the High Court six years afterwards in
 2012, and I remember that type of evidence being given.
- 18 514 Q. Yes?
- A. But at the time, if there was any issues in relation to any of the matters, I'm sure it could have been clarified back in 2006, 2007.
- 22 515 Q. My instructions are that he asked you for a copy of the 23 abduction file in this conversation, and you said it 24 was locked in the office, and you'd come in to the 25 station and you'd leave it with the SHO in Swords?
- 26 A. Yes, that could be true. That could be in order, yes.
- 27 516 Q. Right. Later that same day, the Tuesday, he met you in Swords Garda Station, is that right?
- 29 A. Yes, I think that's the chronology all right.

- 1 517 Q. About five o'clock in the evening?
- 2 A. Yes, I am confused as to the actual chronology when I
- 3 met him at the station, and I confused it I think in
- 4 evidence in the High Court in relation to when he
- 5 actually collected the copy of the victim impact off

14 · 13

14:13

14:13

- 6 me, Victim Impact Statement, which was on the
- 7 Wednesday, on the 19th.
- 8 518 Q. All right. Well, that's fair of you to point out and,
- 9 if I may say, that's a reasonable position in
- 10 circumstances of the shock of the whole incident?
- 11 A. Yes. Well, I think I was being asked to recollect it
- in 2012, the sequence of events, which weren't an issue
- at the time in 2006, but they were an issue in the High
- 14 Court, but I couldn't recollect the actual visits that
- he made and the times that he arrived at the station.
- I didn't take any notes of me interacting with
- 17 Inspector Cryan or any of his comments to me or any of
- my comments to him at the time. But in 2012 I found it
- difficult to recollect whether it was five o'clock on
- the Tuesday or twelve o'clock on the Wednesday.
- 21 519 Q. I appreciate that. I appreciate. And doubtless the
- 22 Chairman will as well. At five o'clock then that
- evening you gave him a copy of the abduction file and I
- think also a copy of the disclosure file?
- 25 A. I think that was on the Wednesday the 19th. When you
- say disclosure file, the victim impact, is it?
- 27 520 Q. No, no, no so --
- 28 521 Q. CHAIRMAN: He means the abduction file?
- 29 A. Oh, the abduction file.

1	522	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, Mr. O'Higgins. You mean that	
2			Inspector Cryan's note records that at 5:00pm on the	
3			Tuesday you gave him the abduction file, that's what	
4			his note says?	
5		Α.	Yes.	14:14
6	523	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Okay. And you don't remember the specific	
7			time, but if I understand you don't disagree that	
8			that's probably right?	
9		Α.	That's probably correct, Mr. Chairman.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Okay.	14:14
11	524	Q.	MR. O'HIGGINS: So you handed over the file that went	
12			into the DPP?	
13		Α.	Yes. We had sent five copies of that file to the	
14			district office, one for the district office, one for	
15			the chief's office, one for Crime and Security and one	14:14
16			for the PP's office, I think there's two for the	
17			DPP's office, sorry.	
18	525	Q.	So in this meeting on the evening of the Tuesday, you	
19			didn't mention the victim impact report, you didn't	
20			give it to him?	14:15
21		Α.	I can't recall I know I gave it to him on the	
22			Wednesday, the 19th or sorry, no, the 22nd November.	
23	526	Q.	Why wouldn't you, you are handing him over documents	
24		Α.	Excuse me?	
25	527	Q.	You are handing him over documents for investigative	14:15
26			purposes, why don't you hand him over the victim	
27			impact?	
28		Α.	Well, if you had asked me without referring to notes	
29			did I hand over the victim impact to him, I would have	

- said yes, I handed over all the documents to him at the
- time, but I can't remember the chronology of handing
- 3 them, the file and -- or the victim impact, a copy of

14 · 16

14:16

14:16

- 4 the Victim Impact Statement.
- 5 528 Q. Don't you know well you didn't give him the victim
- 6 impact at this time?
- 7 A. I don't recall. I don't recall.
- 8 529 Q. Not least from the High Court hearing, you know it was
- 9 suggested to you you didn't hand over the victim impact
- when you met him at five o'clock on the Tuesday?
- 11 A. Well, if -- that's his recollection of it. If he says
- I didn't hand it over, it sort of suggests I was
- actually not handing it over deliberately, but if he
- looked for it it was there for him to take at any time.
- 15 530 Q. Would it not have been attached to the same file, or
- 16 with it?
- 17 A. No. The child abduction investigation file was
- actually bound and the victim impact, a copy of the
- 19 victim report was separate.
- 20 531 Q. Did you not have them housed in the same part of your
- 21 locker?
- 22 A. They were in the same locker, but I can't recollect
- 23 why, if he didn't -- if he asked for the victim impact
- 24 at the time, the victim impact document, he would have
- 25 got it and I don't know why -- what the sequence was
- leading, but I do know that he received both documents
- as soon as he -- promptly.
- 28 532 Q. You see, he didn't know about it to ask for it at this
- 29 point.

- 1 A. I thought he did know about it.
- 2 533 Q. No, he did later on, when he was asked to get it from
- 3 you. But in this hand over of documents at five
- 4 o'clock he didn't have it, he didn't know about it at
- 5 least --

14 · 17

14:17

14:17

- 6 A. Okay.
- 7 534 Q. -- and you didn't hand it over. I am not saying you
- 8 were specifically asked to, he doesn't say that. He
- 9 didn't ask you because he didn't know about it.
- 10 A. Yes. Again, I can't remember exact timeframe of
- 11 handing the documents over and, as I said, it only
- became an issue in 2012. And really, if there was an
- issue with regard to any of my transactions with
- 14 Inspector Cryan back in 2006 I am sure if it was
- brought to my attention then it would have been
- remedied immediately.
- 17 535 Q. He says that he later rang you at half past six, an
- hour and a half later, and he asked you, on the request
- of D/Inspector O'Sullivan, for a copy of the -- for the
- victim impact report that you had taken on the 14th?
- 21 A. Yes. Well, again, I don't recall that chronology.
- 22 536 Q. He says you said you'd only a copy as she had the
- original and was in the process of completing it and
- you were keeping a log of all dealings -- sorry --
- sorry, he stated that you only -- he says you said you
- only had a copy as she had the original, do you recall
- 27 that?
- 28 A. No, I don't recall the train of the conversation with
- 29 Inspector Cryan back in 2006.

1	537	Q.	He says that you asked Inspector Cryan asked him to
2			ensure that all in authority were told that what was in
3			the report was not a complaint as such, but rather a
4			part of the victim impact report?

- A. Yes, indeed. I don't recollect the conversation with
 him I had back then, you know, requesting that -making that request of him.
- 8 538 Q. He says you wondered could it be used as evidence? And the inspector told you he doubted that it could?
- 10 A. No, I didn't -- I wouldn't have said that to him. I 14:19
 11 definitely wouldn't have said used in evidence, for what though?

14:19

- 13 539 Q. He instructs me that you undertook to call to Swords on 14 the 22nd November, that's the Wednesday, the next day, 15 and leave a copy of the victim impact?
- 16 Yes, indeed. And any conversations I would have had Α. 17 with Inspector Cryan would be just courteous 18 conversations there. There wouldn't be any demands 19 that he was saying you must get to Swords and then me 20 not turning up to Swords or whatever. So he did make 21 -- we could have made an arrangement for me to turn up in Swords the next day, just an arrangement between 22 23 ourselves, that I would hand over this document then.
- 24 540 Q. He says that you asked him had the original been found in the house?
- 26 A. I don't recollect asking him that.
- 27 541 Q. Well, might you have asked that question?
- A. I could have asked him that question, but I don't have a recollection of it.

- 1 542 Q. And if you did, what was your thinking in asking that?
- 2 A. I don't know what my thinking was back then, but again,
- 3 it's -- we could have had a ten-minute conversation on
- 4 the phone and it could have been taken whatever context
- 5 it was taken in. If I said it -- he says I said it in
- 6 his notes, I don't have a recollection of it.
- 7 543 Q. The next day, the Wednesday the 22nd, he met you in
- 8 Swords at lunch hour again, do you remember this?
- 9 A. Yes, I was at -- I remember this vividly because I was
- 10 at a parent-teacher meeting in Skerries and I think it

14 · 20

14:20

14:21

- 11 was about 15 miles away from Swords station and I was
- 12 called -- I was contacted by Inspector Cryan to get to
- the station as soon as possible.
- 14 544 Q. Yes, and what did he say?
- 15 A. I told him I'd make my way there.
- 16 545 Q. Right. And specifically, what did he say regarding the
- 17 victim impact?
- 18 A. Oh, he said he needed to get a copy of the victim
- impact report that the Commissioner had directed that
- 20 I -- if I wasn't available to produce it that my
- lockers would be forced or burst open.
- 22 546 Q. You you recall him saying that, do you?
- 23 A. Yes, I do. I'll never forget that.
- 24 547 Q. And you are clear on that?
- 25 A. I am absolutely clear on that.
- 26 548 Q. All right. I just wonder is it possible and I am
- 27 putting it no higher is it possible that you may be
- 28 mistaken about that and that you are superimposing on
- 29 your memory something that you happened to learn much

Τ			later?	
2		Α.	No, I am actually very clear on that, in that he said	
3			that the Commissioner said that my locker would be	
4			forced open, or burst open, if I didn't turn up in	
5			Swords Garda Station.	14:21
6	549	Q.	Because, you see, Inspector Cryan's instructions to me	
7			are that he noted what was relayed to him by Chief	
8			Phillips as to what Assistant Commissioner McHugh had	
9			said, indicating he was desirous of the report being	
10			got - I'm going to call that the locker threat, okay -	14:22
11			but he didn't relay it to you?	
12		Α.	Sorry, he relayed to me that the Commissioner, he just	
13			used the word Commissioner, he didn't say Assistant	
14			Commissioner. He said the word Commissioner.	
15	550	Q.	And I am suggesting to you that this graphic picture of	14:22
16			a threat to burst open a locker is something that you	
17			have latched onto because you saw a record to indicate	
18			that much later on, and you have managed to infuse your	
19			memory with it?	
20		Α.	I am absolutely clear I drove all the way in from	14:22
21			Skerries into Swords with that image in my mind, that	
22			the Commissioner was seeking to force open my locker to	
23			obtain a document.	
24	551	Q.	It is agreed from my client's side that you it was	
25			indicated to you that the victim impact was being	14:23
26			sought, and Inspector Cryan says that he had learned	
27			about the victim impact and had asked you for it, but	
28			in fact didn't relay what you say in relation to the	
29			locker threat?	

- 1 A. He is saying that he didn't relay that, is it?
- 2 552 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. No, that's untrue. I'll never forget that statement
- 4 that he made.
- 5 553 Q. All right. My instructions are that you gave him the

14 · 23

14:24

14:24

14.24

- 6 victim impact report and you then told him what
- 7 happened in the visit of Baiba Saulite on the 14th
- 8 November to the station?
- 9 A. Yes, we had a conversation at Swords station.
- 10 554 Q. And he says that he asked you -- this now, this is
- 11 person to person, isn't it?
- 12 A. Person to person.
- 13 555 Q. Yeah.
- 14 A. At the community police office in Swords.
- 15 556 Q. Yes. And I think there is a lot of common ground in
- relation to this. Well, I'll just start, this may not
- 17 be common ground. He says that your hands were
- shaking, you looked very stressed out, you looked tired
- and you were very clearly nervous.
- 20 A. I was very nervous.
- 21 557 Q. Were you shaking?
- 22 A. I was nervous. I was in a state of shock at the
- 23 developments in relation to the apparent focus of
- 24 attention all of a sudden on the victim impact report.
- 25 558 Q. I'm wondering is that a retrospective impression you
- 26 formed?
- 27 A. No, absolutely not.
- 28 559 Q. He advised you to see a doctor, you looked that unwell?
- 29 A. I don't recollect him saying that, but I wouldn't

- dispute it if that's the case.
- 2 560 Q. All right. You gave him -- you asked him to write down
- 3 an account on your behalf, isn't that right?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 561 Q. So this was him taking down what you were saying?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 562 Q. All right. And you recorded -- you asked him to record

14 · 25

14:26

14:26

- 8 what your recollection was of Ms. Saulite's visit to
- 9 the station on the 14th?
- 10 A. In that written report he was taking from me, yes.
- 11 563 Q. Yes. Could I ask you and in fairness to you, you
- should see it would you mind looking at his note at
- 13 page 741.
- 14 A. 741, yes.
- 15 564 Q. Just while we're waiting for that to come up, I think
- it's -- you relayed these portions are not, I think,
- 17 controversial -- you explained to him that she had
- called in by appointment to see yourself and Garda
- 19 Nyhan regarding the victim impact. She produced the
- 20 12-page handwritten document on Great Southern Hotel
- 21 paper, unsigned and undated?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- 23 565 Q. You told him that you had skimmed through it, and you
- could see a lot of it was not admissible as a victim
- 25 impact report?
- A. Yes, that's correct.
- 27 566 Q. You told him that you told her this and that you
- advised her to see a doctor regarding her, what's
- termed, physiological condition, as it's put?

		Α.	res, that's correct.	
2	567	Q.	You said to him that it was agreed to make a second	
3			appointment for the following week starting the 20th	
4			November. There we are, I think we have it up all	
5			right. If we could scroll down please, Mr. Kavanagh,	14:27
6			towards the bottom of the page. Do you see there	
7			14/11/06?	
8		Α.	I do.	
9	568	Q.	So this is the record of what he took down what he	
10			says he took down at your behest. And if we could	14:27
11			could I ask you to look at five lines six lines	
12			down:	
13				
14			"Sergeant Hughes discussed Mr. A with her and how he	
15			was after a plea of guilty and what his demeanour was."	14:27
16				
17			Do you see that?	
18		Α.	Yes, I do.	
19	569	Q.	It continues:	
20				14:27
21			"She told them she had stopped bringing the kids to see	
22			him. Changed SIM card in phone. She was positive and	
23			upbeat, had a great confidence in herself. Asked how	
24			she was and she said he never stopped talking about	
25			John Hennessy and Liam Hughes, that they were	14:28
26			responsible for putting him in prison."	
27				
28			This next bit I just want to ask you about:	
29				

1			"Sergeant Hughes asked what did she mean and she said	
2			she feared for her own safety, Declan's safety, John's	
3			safety and Liam's safety."	
4				
5			Do you see that there?	14:28
6		Α.	I do.	
7	570	Q.	How did it come to pass that the inspector taking down	
8			what you were saying has noted that?	
9		Α.	Well, I don't know how he included that because she	
LO			never said to us in any shape or form that she feared	14:28
L1			for her own safety, and never made any formal complaint	
L2			in that regard or remarks like that. If she had, and I	
L3			understood from what she was saying that she was making	
L4			a formal complaint, I would have investigated it.	
L5	571	Q.	But, sergeant, I mean it's not hugely controversial.	14:28
L6			She had been saying that over over 2005 and a bit of	
L7			2006, hadn't she?	
L8		Α.	Yes, but she didn't say it to I didn't relate that	
L9			to Inspector Cryan that morning. I related to him what	
20			she had said to us on the 14th, was that she that	14:29
21			she feared for John Hennessy and myself and possibly	
22			Declan Nyhan.	
23	572	Q.	How could it possibly be there?	
24		Α.	Well, I mean Declan Nyhan, but not her, not her.	
25	573	Q.	well, you were watching him take it down and he	14:29
26			subsequently read it back to you, so I mean how is it	
27			there if you didn't say it?	
28		Α.	No, this is not the report he took down. I signed a	
29			report that he took from me in relation to the victim	

Т			impact document.	
2	574	Q.	All right. Well, we might just go on. Towards the	
3			bottom of the same page you see he records:	
4				
5			"She was there for about three quarters of an hour."	14:30
6				
7			The very last line on screen, do you see it?	
8		Α.	She was about three quarters of an hour, is it?	
9	575	Q.	Yes.	
10		Α.	Yes.	14:30
11	576	Q.	Then the next sentence, it goes over the page:	
12				
13			"Sergeant Hughes asked her did she want to make any	
14			complaint."	
15				14:30
16			Complaint about what?	
17		Α.	Sorry, "Sergeant Hughes asked her did she want to make	
18			any complaint and she did not".	
19	577	Q.	So did you tell him that you asked her did she want to	
20			make a complaint?	14:30
21		Α.	I can't recall. These are Inspector Cryan's notes, but	
22			I can't recall the I do know that he took down a	
23			written report from me in relation to my full	
24			interaction with Baiba on that date and I signed it.	
25	578	Q.	I'm just focussing on this for a moment. He records	14:30
26			you saying to him that you asked her, on the 14th	
27		Α.	Oh, on the 14th, yes.	
28	579	Q.	did she want to make a complaint, and she had	
29			responded she did not	

1		Α.	Well, that's in line with what I said earlier on about	
2			my interaction with Baiba on the 14th, yes.	
3	580	Q.	Okay. So, the note is correct about that, is it?	
4		Α.	It would be, yes.	
5	581	Q.	Yeah. So what did she want to make a complaint about?	14:31
6		Α.	Well, when we had the casual conversation with her	
7			after discussing the victim impact report, as I said	
8			earlier, we just started speaking about she started	
9			bringing up matters that were already known to the	
10			detective branch, and I asked her did she want to make	14:31
11			any complaint to us about anything and she said no and	
12			she was happy enough for the detectives to deal with	
13			it.	
14	582	Q.	All right. Do you see in the next two lines down,	
15			there is one-liner and it says:	14:31
16				
17			"Sergeant Hughes read the account I had written down	
18			and was happy with it."	
19				
20			Do you see that?	14:31
21		Α.	Sorry, where is that?	
22	583	Q.	Three lines down, it's a line on its own, just where	
23			the cursor is: "Sergeant Hughes read the account I had	
24			written down and was happy with it."	
25		Α.	Is this the account that he wrote down?	14:32
26	584	Q.	Yes. It's the typed version of it.	
27		Α.	I thought I signed it actually, so	

In a separate sheet of paper like a report.

All right.

28

29

585 Q.

Α.

1	586	Q.	All right. Well, we will endeavour to pull that up in	
2			a little while.	
3				
4			In the next paragraph you'll see, if we scroll down,	
5			that he said you looked very stressed out, tired, your	14:32
6			hands were shaking, nervous, up and down out of the	
7			seat.	
8				
9			"He requested I write all this down as he wanted to do	
10			a report but said he couldn't concentrate or write."	14:32
11				
12			Do you accept that?	
13		Α.	Well, the position was, there was a power failure	
14			within Swords Garda Station at the time. I am far	
15			better using a PC than writing, my handwriting wouldn't	14:32
16			be great anyway, so that's why I asked for him to just	
17			write it down himself and I would dictate it for him.	
18	587	Q.	And was part of your purpose to get on record your	
19			defence to any potential criticism that you had failed	
20			to act knowing what you knew?	14:33
21		Α.	Well, the report, I think, that I gave to Inspector	
22			Cryan that I signed, outlines what my intent was at the	
23			time.	
24	588	Q.	Well, was it to get down your position, to defend your	
25			position?	14:33
26		Α.	Well, it was to outline the facts surrounding the my	
27			procurement of the Victim Impact Statement.	
28	589	Q.	This is now your account of what you wanted on the	

record. It's the Wednesday, three days after the

_			murder, and ergite days after barba saurice s visit to	
2			the station. Why is there no mention of what you claim	
3			Walter O'Sullivan told you?	
4		Α.	Again, I feel that I had that information but Walter	
5			O'Sullivan, sorry, primarily had that information, and	14:33
6			he was processing that as far as I was concerned.	
7	590	Q.	I beg your pardon? He was?	
8		Α.	He was processing that information, that was his	
9			information that he had in relation to the Commissioner	
10			and the refusal to or the refusal to provide	14:34
11			protection for John Hennessy and Baiba.	
12	591	Q.	No, but you are committing you are asking the fellow	
13			and he is giving you help and you are in need of help,	
14			if I may suggest. He is recording your position	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:34
16	592	Q.	to defend your position?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	593	Q.	Chief among the points you'd want him to note down is	
19			the startling information from Inspector O'Sullivan.	
20			It's not there. Can you explain that?	14:34
21		Α.	I can't explain why I didn't actually tell him then,	
22			but I didn't tell him a lot more in relation to what I	
23			perceived to be a systems failure in relation to a lot	
24			of matters got to do with the John Hennessy, Baiba	
25			Saulite investigations.	14:34
26	594	Q.	Well, did you tell I should have asked you simply:	
27			Did you tell Michael Cryan, inspector, what Walter	
28			O'Sullivan had said to you on your case?	
29		Δ	T don't recall that T did on that occasion	

- 1 595 Q. Pardon?
- 2 A. I don't recall that I did on that occasion.
- 3 596 Q. Well, did you do it on some other occasion?
- 4 A. Well, I reported to -- when I was reporting the systems

14:35

14:35

14:36

- failure there to -- sorry, in the confidential
- 6 recipient reports and the disciplinary reports, that's
- 7 when I made my first written reports in that regard.
- 8 597 Q. In 2008?
- 9 A. In 2008, yes.
- 10 598 Q. You didn't tell Michael Cryan then?
- 11 A. I don't think I did, no, on that occasion.
- 12 599 Q. Just I want to be fair to you, sergeant. I think in
- the materials you claim that you did tell Michael
- 14 Cryan?
- 15 A. Well, which materials is that, sorry?
- 16 600 Q. In your own statement of interview to the Tribunal.
- 17 A. In the statement to the Tribunal here?
- 18 601 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. Yes, I can't recollect whether I actually discussed it
- 20 with him on that occasion. I am talking about the
- 21 Walter O'Sullivan comments.
- 22 602 Q. Yeah. Did you tell the Tribunal investigators that you
- 23 had told Michael Cryan what you claim Walter O'Sullivan
- 24 had told you?
- 25 A. I can't recollect, no, whether I did.
- 26 603 Q. We might have page 11 on screen, please.
- 27 A. I see here that I said I did relay to Inspector Cryan.
- 28 At the time of making my statement to the Tribunal I
- 29 said that but --

1	604	Q.	Just if we locate it first of all. So about five lines	
2			from the top of page 11, towards the end of the line it	
3			commences:	
4				
5			"He then rang me and said to get there as soon as	14:37
6			possible as the Commissioner had instructed that if I	
7			didn't get there my lockers were to be burst open."	
8				
9			Do you see that there?	
10		Α.	I do.	14:37
11	605	Q.	And your interview continues:	
12				
13			"I made my way to Swords Garda Station and handed over	
14			the 12-page document to Inspector Cryan, who took a	
15			written report from me about how I came into possession	14:37
16			of the 12-page report. I was very anxious hearing	
17			about that instruction and that there were now appeared	
18			to be a huge focus on this 12-page document. I did	
19			relay to Inspector Cryan my conversation I had with	
20			Detective Inspector O'Sullivan in regard to this	14:37
21			matter."	
22		Α.	Yes, I see that.	
23	606	Q.	Now, I asked you before lunch whom had you told, and	
24			you said Declan Nyhan, full stop.	
25		Α.	Yes.	14:37
26	607	Q.	You are saying something else here. Which is correct?	
27		Α.	I am saying something else there. And to the best of	
28			my recollection, when I was making my statement to the	
29			investigators of the Tribunal that's what I said to	

1			them at the time.	
2	608	Q.	So you agree with me that one of your answers is	
3			incorrect?	
4		Α.	Sorry, I beg your pardon?	
5	609	Q.	One of before lunch you told me the only person you	14:38
6			told was Garda Declan Nyhan.	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	610	Q.	You are telling the interviewer here, the Tribunal	
9			interviewer, that actually you also told Inspector	
10			Cryan?	14:38
11		Α.	Yes, that was my recollection at the time of making	
12			this statement.	
13	611	Q.	So, just take your time. Did you tell Inspector Cryan?	
14		Α.	On recollecting it now, I can't be certain that I told	
15			him at that time on the 22nd November 2006.	14:38
16			CHAIRMAN: I am not entirely clear, Mr. O'Higgins, I	
17			have to say. Sorry, wait till I get myself clear. I'm	
18			not entirely clear. Do you say that the statement "I	
19			did relay to Inspector Cryan my conversation I had with	
20			Detective Inspector O'Sullivan in regard to this	14:39
21			matter" necessarily includes the item about	
22		Α.	Oh sorry.	
23			CHAIRMAN: just let me explain my uncertainty,	
24			Sergeant Hughes just, you are reading into that my	
25			conversation in regard to this matter, are you saying	14:39
26			that that necessarily includes the alleged statement	
27			about personal protection? Because I am not reading it	
28			as necessarily including that, if you know what I mean.	

Now maybe I'm just being dumb about it and not seeing

1	the point, but I'm not certain that it's obvious. Are
2	you saying it should be the case?
3	MR. O'HIGGINS: No, I am saying that the witness seems
4	to interpret it that he had, in fact, during this
5	discussion with the interviewer told maintained the 14:
6	position that he had said it to Michael Cryan. He has
7	interpreted it in that way, at my prompting admittedly.
8	CHAIRMAN: Hold on. Let's back up a tiny bit. Is
9	there a conflict, the question that we are addressing
10	and that you are addressing, fairly - I am not
11	suggesting any unfairness - the question you are
12	addressing is this: is there a conflict between what
13	Sergeant Hughes said to the Tribunal investigator and
14	his evidence? That's what you are saying: Is there a
15	conflict? Because his evidence has been the only
16	people he told prior to 2008 for two years, the only
17	people he told the only person he told was Garda
18	Nyhan, isn't that so? That's the evidence we have.
19	And you are saying, did he also but did he make a
20	different tell a different story when he was talking 14:
21	to the investigators?
22	MR. O'HIGGINS: Yes.
23	CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, I'm not certain that when he
24	says I did relay to Inspector Cryan my conversation I
25	had with Detective Inspector O'Sullivan in regard to
26	this matter, it's not obvious to me that that includes
27	the thing, maybe you could explore that I mean, but
28	MR. O'HIGGINS: Fair enough. I will do that, Chairman.
20	CHAIDMAN: No it's just what's not obvious to mo

1			maybe I'm just not seeing it and maybe it's clearly	
2			there, but just to let you know it's not obvious to me.	
3			MR. O'HIGGINS: Thank you Chairman.	
4			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Do you understand that? I am just	
5			explaining	14:41
6		Α.	I do, Mr. Chairman.	
7			CHAIRMAN: So that we are all on the same track. It	
8			may be my mistake, it may be I am just not seeing it.	
9			But Mr. O'Higgins is now going to clarify it with you.	
10	612	Q.	MR. O'HIGGINS: On foot of the Chairman's question	14:42
11			questions, sergeant, did you intend to convey to the	
12			interviewer, the Tribunal, that you had relayed to	
13			Inspector Cryan that Walter O'Sullivan had told you	
14			that there had been a request for protection for Baiba	
15			Saulite and it had been refused by Garda management?	14:42
16			Is that what did you intend to indicate that	
17			position to the Tribunal investigator?	
18		Α.	No. And thanks for clarifying it, because I can see it	
19			here, it's written. My reference to Detective	
20			Inspector O'Sullivan refers to the 12-page document,	14:42
21			not to the conversation I had with him when he was	
22			standing at the door of the office in relation to	
23			protection matters. It's got to do with the 12-page	
24			document. And I said, I did relay to Inspector Cryan	
25			my conversation I had with Detective Inspector	14:42
26			O'Sullivan in that regard to this matter, which is the	
27			12-page document.	
28	613	Q.	Sergeant, would you mind reading the next two sentences	
29			on your interview? It says:	

ı		

"I did relay to Inspector Cryan my conversation I had with Detective Inspector O'Sullivan in regard to this matter."

5 A. Yes.

14:43

14 · 43

14:43

- 6 614 Q. "I wish to add that the particular information
 7 disclosed by Detective Inspector O'Sullivan to me was
 8 worrying as I had not been informed of any of this,
 9 i.e. a request for the protection of Baiba Saulite."
- Yes. "I wished to add that the particular information 10 Α. 11 disclosed by --" That's when I was telling the 12 investigators that at the time I was worried that they 13 were looking for the 12-page document even though Detective Inspector O'Sullivan had commented on the 14 15 12-page document itself, that's what I discussed with 16 Inspector Cryan, where I said "I wish to add that the 17 particular information disclosed by Detective Inspector 18 O'Sullivan to me was worrying as I had not been 19 informed of any of this request for protection of Baiba 20 Saulite. " And that's a fact.
- 21 615 Q. So is it your evidence that what is said there recorded
 22 in your interview with the Tribunal investigator does
 23 not amount to a claim by you that you had told Michael
 24 Cryan about the I'm just going to call it for
 25 shorthand reasons bombshell information from Walter
 26 O'Sullivan?
- 27 A. That would be -- that would appear to be what I was saying to the Tribunal investigators.
- 29 616 Q. So you were saying it now, it's your --

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 617 Q. It's your revelation?
- A. Yes.
- 4 618 Q. It's your disclosure?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 619 Q. It seems to be clear, if I may say, from the next, the

14 · 44

14:44

14:45

- 7 sentence we've just read out, where you say what the
- 8 conversation with Inspector O'Sullivan was, it appears
- 9 to be you telling the interviewer of the disclosure, of
- the bombshell, isn't it plain as a pikestaff?
- 11 A. Sorry? It was? Sorry, could you repeat that?
- 12 620 Q. It is clear that you were claiming to the interviewer
- that Michael Cryan had been told by you of the
- 14 bombshell?
- 15 A. Well, I have no record of actually telling Michael
- 16 Cryan on the morning of the 22nd November that I had
- 17 that conversation with Detective Inspector O'Sullivan.
- 18 So, I could -- I wouldn't back up -- I couldn't
- 19 actually go on and tell the investigators then that I
- 20 had that conversation.
- 21 621 Q. Just so you are clear, for the avoidance of doubt,
- 22 Inspector Cryan says you did not claim to him that you
- had any such conversation with Inspector O'Sullivan?
- A. Well, that's true then. That's true.
- 25 622 Q. And you accept that's the case?
- 26 A. I accept that.
- 27 623 Q. Now, the disciplinary investigation obviously is the
- first question on the Issue Paper that the Tribunal are
- looking into. And the question asks, just to remind

1			ourselves: Did Assistant Commissioner Al McHugh or	
2			Chief Superintendent Michael Feehan target you because	
3			you made a protected disclosure to Superintendent Mark	
4			Curran? And it breaks it down into three:	
5			(a) is by initiating the disciplinary investigation in	14:46
6			June '07; by continuing it from 2008 onwards; and	
7			lastly, by protracting the investigation, as you claim,	
8			unreasonably.	
9				
10			I want to suggest to you that Assistant Commissioner	14:46
11			McHugh needed to establish a level of knowledge or the	
12			level of knowledge regarding the alleged threat posed	
13			to Baiba Saulite's life that was in possession of Garda	
14			prior to her murder.	
15		Α.	Yes.	14:46
16	624	Q.	He needed to do that?	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	625	Q.	And it was legitimate for him to direct the carrying	
19			out of a fact-finding to that end?	
20		Α.	That's accepted. Yeah, that's correct.	14:47
21	626	Q.	So, he asked Chief Superintendent Feehan to carry out	
22			the fact-finding. And I'm suggesting to you	
23			fact-findings are actually quite common in An Garda	
24			Síochána, fact-finding investigations?	
25		Α.	Yes, I'd accept that.	14:47
26	627	Q.	And I'm suggesting to you that for the reasons already	
27			that we have gone over, identified by Inspector Mangan,	
28			there was a legitimate rationale for further inquiry	
29			after the initial fact-finding?	

Т		Α.	ADSOTULETY.	
2	628	Q.	Could I ask you to look at Chief Superintendent	
3			Feehan's statement to the Tribunal, which is at page	
4			821. And if we might go to page 824, Chief	
5			Superintendent Feehan refers to the conclusions reached	14:48
6			by Detective Inspector Mangan. And so half-way down	
7			that page, in the paragraph starting "In his report	
8			dated the 2nd February" if Mr. Kavanagh would scroll	
9			down please. So just there.	
10				14:48
11			"In his report dated 2nd February 2007, Detective	
12			Inspector Mangan states that the handwritten document	
13			provided by Baiba Saulite could not be used by the	
14			Gardaí to investigate or instigate a prosecution	
15			against Mr. A. The Detective Inspector concludes by	14:48
16			stating that: 'There certainly was knowledge in	
17			existence and available to the Gardaí in relation to	
18			threats from Mr. A to Baiba Saulite. The members of An	
19			Garda Síochána involved with Baiba Saulite readily	
20			admit this in their reports. In order to clearly	14:49
21			outline the facts in existence, I respectfully suggest	
22			that the matter be formally investigated.'"	
23				
24			Then he says of his own position:	
25				14:49
26			"I subsequently reported on the fact-finding	
27			investigation to A/c Al McHugh on the 26th March 2007.	
28			I provided background material on Ms. Saulite as	
29			reported to me by Detective Inspector Mangan. I	

T	reported that Garda records held on the PULSE system	
2	were examined which refer to Ms. Saulite. I outlined	
3	the content of those records and appended them to my	
4	report."	
5		14:49
6	And if we scroll on there he says:	
7		
8	"I reported that on a number of occasions when Baiba	
9	Saulite had contact with members of An Garda Síochána	
10	she indicated that she had been the subject of violence	14:49
11	by Mr. A or that Mr. A was threatening her with	
12	violence. My report set out details in relation to	
13	these matters, which had been included in two	
14	statements taken from Ms. Saulite as part of the	
15	investigation into the abduction of her two children by	14:50
16	Mr. A. Both of these statements were included in a	
17	file compiled by Sergeant Hughes and which was	
18	forwarded to the superintendent in Coolock for	
19	transmission to the DPP for directions. In his	
20	covering report on the file Sergeant Hughes recommended	14:50
21	that two charges under section 17 of the Non-Fatal	
22	Offences Against the Person Act should be preferred	
23	against Mr. A.	
24		
25	I reported that on the 14th November 2006"	14:50
26		
27	And there is further, I won't read it all out there,	
28	but that's a fairly faithful reprise of Inspector	
29	Mangan's scoping conclusions isn't that right?	

1		Α.	It's an overview, it's an overview of the scoping	
2			exercise, yes.	
3	629	Q.	Right. If we see down, the paragraph starting "In the	
4			conclusion to my report on the fact-finding	
5			investigation" we now have Chief Superintendent	14:5
6			Feehan, as it were, speaking and it's about half-way	
7			down page 825, if we continue. There we are.	
8				
9			So this is C/S Feehan saying:	
10				14:5
11			"In conclusion to my report" we have there " on	
12			fact-finding I stated that it was apparent that there	
13			was knowledge in existence and available to An Garda	
14			Síochána in relation to threats from Mr. A to Baiba	
15			Saulite and that the members of An Garda Síochána	14:5
16			readily admit this in their reports. In my report I	
17			went on to state that 'In order to fully outline the	
18			facts in existence and the level of actions taken as a	
19			result of this knowledge coming into the possession of	
20			on members of An Garda Síochána I recommended that a	14:5
21			full investigation should be carried out into this	
22			matter.'"	
23				
24			He says:	
25				14:5
26			"My thinking in making this recommendation was informed	
27			by the fact that Sergeant Hughes had acknowledged in	
28			his report that he was in possession of the 12-page	
29			document which Baiba Saulite had provided to him, with	

1	the intention that it be used as a Victim Impact	
2	Statement, and wherein she had stated that: 'At the	
3	moment I am very scared for my life because Mr. A is	
4	blaming me for everything that has gone wrong in his	
5	life.' Ms. Saulite had expressed similar concerns for 1	14:52
6	other own safety in the statement she made on the 4th	
7	January 2005 as part of the investigation into the	
8	abduction of her two children, details of which are set	
9	out above. In the 16-page report which he provided to	
10	Detective Inspector Mangan, Sergeant Hughes stated that 1	14:52
11	in the absence of any Garda intelligence to the	
12	contrary, he had no reason to believe her fears about	
13	Mr. A were of much significance. Sergeant Hughes went	
14	on to state that: 'In fact, the things she referred to	
15	were not untypical of conversations we had had on	14:52
16	numerous occasions in the past.' In that report,	
17	Sergeant Hughes stated that he had read the various	
18	intel reports on file and went on to state that 'apart	
19	from one report from Garda Campbell, I had no reason to	
20	suspect that I was dealing with a dangerous criminal'. 1	14:53
21	Taking all of these matters into consideration, I	
22	believe that my view that there was knowledge of a	
23	possible threat to the safety of Ms. Saulite was	
24	reasonable and that there were compelling grounds for	
25	recommending further investigations into the matter." 1	14:53
26		
27	All right. So that was his thinking. I take it you	

have no difficulty with that reasonable conclusion?

A. The -- yeah, that's Chief Feehan's recollections of

Т			matters there prior to the instigation of the	
2			disciplinary process. I think that I agree that a full	
3			investigation should have been carried out in relation	
4			to the level and knowledge of all members of the Garda	
5			Síochána prior to the murder.	14:53
6	630	Q.	So, the fact that there was to be an investigation that	
7			included you, you have no you have no difficulty	
8			with?	
9		Α.	I have no difficulty at all with any member of the	
10			Garda Síochána, retired or not, being interviewed in	14:54
11			relation to the level of knowledge in their possession	
12			relating to Baiba Saulite before she was murdered.	
13	631	Q.	You are aware, aren't you, that it was necessary for	
14			Chief Superintendent Feehan to report on the	
15			fact-finding to Assistant Commissioner McHugh, and he	14:54
16			did this in March of 2007?	
17		Α.	I was aware of his responsibility, is it?	
18	632	Q.	Yes.	
19		Α.	Yes.	
20	633	Q.	And as part of the fact-finding, Chief Superintendent	14:54
21			Feehan examined relevant case law in relation to the	
22			responsibilities of police to individuals that are	
23			known to be under a specific threat?	
24		Α.	He went into case law, yes, I see that in his	
25			statement, yes.	14:54
26	634	Q.	And he looked also at law from the European Court of	
27			Human Rights?	
28		Α.	I think so, yes.	
29	635	0 -	And the gist of that law indicated that where	

Т			authorities know or ought to know at the time of the	
2			existence of a real and immediate risk to the life of	
3			an individual they had a duty in those circumstances to	
4			take all measures within the scope of their powers that	
5			might be expected to avoid such risk?	14:55
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	636	Q.	You are aware, aren't you, that in the conclusion to	
8			his initial report on the fact-finding, his conclusion	
9			was that it was apparent there was knowledge in	
10			existence and available to Gardaí in relation to	14:55
11			threats from Mr. A to Baiba Saulite?	
12		Α.	There was in the knowledge of the Gardaí?	
13	637	Q.	Yes.	
14		Α.	I don't know how he arrived at that conclusion because	
15			if he is referring to the victim impact report, he	14:55
16			would have known, and I made it very clear in the	
17			report to Inspector Mangan, that I hadn't read the	
18			report. So if I hadn't read it, I wouldn't have	
19			knowledge of the allegations that she made.	
20	638	Q.	We may be at cross purposes.	14:56
21		Α.	Sorry.	
22	639	Q.	It was apparent to him, and I am suggesting to	
23			anybody	
24		Α.	Yes.	
25	640	Q.	looking at it reasonably, that there was knowledge	14:56
26			in existence that was available to An Garda Síochána,	
27			just being neutral about it, regarding threats made by	
28			Mr. A to Ms. Saulite	
29		Α.	Okay.	

- 1 641 Q. -- over the whole period.
- 2 A. Okay. I accept that.
- 3 642 Q. And that this was readily admitted by you and your colleague, Garda Nyhan, to your credit, in your report?
- 5 A. Yes. Okay, yes.
- 6 643 Q. It was to be expected, therefore and this is what I'm

 7 building up to ask you -- therefore, you would have

14:56

14:57

14:57

- 8 expected that there'll be a full investigation needed
- 9 to be carried out?
- 10 A. Yes. And when I say a full investigation I mean that
- 11 all members of An Garda Síochána who had knowledge of
- their dealings with Baiba Saulite prior to her murder
- should have been interviewed before an assessment could
- be made.
- 15 644 Q. We know, sergeant, that on the 2nd May '07 Chief
- Superintendent Feehan is appointed by Commissioner
- 17 McHugh to investigate an alleged breach of discipline
- by you?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 645 Q. And we can see the wording of the disciplinary
- allegation. I wonder might we have page 908 of the
- 22 materials please, which is Chief Superintendent
- 23 Feehan's report on the disciplinary investigation. And
- this document is dated the 3rd June 2009. It starts I
- think at 907. We might scroll up one page, please,
- 26 nine, zero, seven. Just give the date there so it is
- 27 the top right-hand corn 3rd June '09. And just to
- locate it for you, sergeant, this is Michael Feehan's
- report in the disciplinary process.

1		Α.	Yes, indeed.	
2	646	Q.	And if we go to the next page of it, page 908, we have	
3			the wording of the disciplinary investigation that was	
4			being carried out, and it says:	
5				14:59
6			"It appears that"	
7				
8			The bit in italics. Sorry, this is how it's phrased,	
9			taking it in its context.	
10				14:59
11			"On the 2nd May 2007 Assistant Commissioner McHugh,	
12			DMR, appointed Chief Superintendent Michael Feehan in	
13			accordance with regulation 8 of the discipline	
14			regulations of 1989 to investigate the following	
15			alleged breach of discipline.	14:59
16			'It appears that Sergeant William Hughes was in	
17			possession of documentation and information as a result	
18			meetings with Ms. Baiba Saulite, and being in	
19			possession of same knew or ought to have known at the	
20			time of the existence of a real and immediate risk to	14:59
21			the life of Ms. Baiba Saulite, and failed in his duty	
22			to take measures that might have been expected to avoid	
23			that risk.'"	
24				
25			Now, the wording of the disciplinary allegation	14:59
26			indicates that, as it's put there, "it appears" you	
27			were in possession of documentation and information.	
28			And you were in possession of documentation and	
29			information as a result of your meetings with Baiba	

- 1 Saulite.
- A. I was in possession of the victim impact report and also the child abduction investigation file.
- 4 647 Q. Yes. And I don't mean that any way critically, all

 right. Honestly, take it, it's no part of my purpose
 or desire to suggest you were guilty of this because
 you were exonerated one hundred percent of the charge.
- 8 A. Yes, I understand.
- But I am dealing now with what is the correct 9 648 Q. characterisation of what the investigation was, that's 10 15:00 11 where I'm going with this. And, I'm suggesting to you 12 that being in possession of that information, which you 13 accept you were in possession of, what was being 14 investigated was whether you ought to have known at the time of the existence of a real and immediate risk to 15 15:01 16 the life of Baiba Saulite. That's what was being 17 investigated?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 649 Q. And secondly, if you were so aware, they were
 20 investigating whether you had failed to take measures that might have been expected to avoid that risk?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 650 Q. So, it was a two-pronged investigation, all right?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 651 Q. You'd agree with me, that's not the laying of a criminal charge manslaughter?
- A. Well, I disagree. I'd say it's, at least it's recklessness -- alleging recklessness on my behalf that caused or led to her death and it was interpreted by my

			regar people as being carramount to manstaughter, a	
2			manslaughter investigation.	
3	652	Q.	It was interpreted by?	
4		Α.	My legal people.	
5	653	Q.	Was that Mr. Hennessy?	15:02
6		Α.	The first person I showed it to was the first legal	
7			person I showed it to was John Hennessy and he had the	
8			same conclusion immediately, and then also John	
9			Hennessy and counsel.	
10	654	Q.	So you felt the commencement of the investigation that	15:02
11			Chief Superintendent Feehan was tasked to carry out was	
12			tantamount to the laying of the criminal charge of	
13			manslaughter?	
14		Α.	It looked very much like that to me. And on the	
15			occasion of the service of the documents I sought	15:02
16			clarification from Chief Superintendent Feehan at the	
17			time, and asked him what is involved here? And what I	
18			meant by that was: what could happen to me if there's	
19			findings in that regard? And he didn't rule out	
20			dismissal for a start.	15:03
21	655	Q.	Can I suggest to you that in viewing it that way, that	
22			is illustrative of what I'm suggesting is a lack of	
23			perspective and a deterioration in your perspective on	
24			the whole issue?	
25		Α.	No, my perspective was very clear. I could read it	15:03
26			myself. And, you know, having worked in prosecuting	
27			people over the years and laying charges, this here,	
28			obviously the Commissioner or, sorry, the Assistant	
29			Commissioner believed that I had taken some action or	

inaction in relation to Baiba Saulite that presented a
real and immediate risk to her life. It's as clear to
me, and I think anybody reading it there can see that
it's a very serious allegation, when I say -- or matter
that I was being investigated for.

You are aware -- we looked at his rationale; he had

15:04

15:04

- 6 656 Q. You are aware -- we looked at his rationale; he had looked at the ECHR law, the Court of Human Rights

 8 Law --
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 657 Q. -- which asked those questions: Was it real and immediate, the risk to the person? And secondly, was there a breach of a duty to take steps to ameliorate the risk?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 658 Q. That's the approach they took --
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 659 Q. -- when looking at whether there is exposure for a
 18 police organisation, all right? It isn't the laying of
 19 a criminal charge. It's a legitimate inquiry actually
 20 following the template of case law.
- 21 A. Yes. "I knew or ought to have known." Now, they were 22 aware, through my report in the Inspector Mangan 23 investigation, that I hadn't read that particular 24 passage --
- 25 660 Q. CHAIRMAN: That was suggesting you should have read it. 15:04
- 26 A. They are suggesting?
- 27 661 Q. CHAIRMAN: He's suggesting you should have read it.
- 28 A. Yes. I suppose that could be the interpretation.
- 29 662 Q. CHAIRMAN: You knew or ought to have known. It doesn't

- 1 mean it's right.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 663 Q. CHAIRMAN: But it's not enough to say I didn't know
- 4 because I didn't read it, because they are suggesting

15:05

15:05

15:05

- 5 maybe you should have read it.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 664 Q. CHAIRMAN: Now, don't get me wrong, don't think I am
- 8 saying you should have read it.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 665 Q. CHAIRMAN: I'm not saying anything of the kind. But I
- 11 mean, I am reading this, I am understanding this to say
- that the suggestion is maybe you should have read it.
- 13 A. Yes. And I think that clarification in that regard
- could have been obtained through just routine enquiry
- 15 without the imposition of the disciplinary process.
- 16 Just a routine questioning, probably 10, 15 minutes
- 17 questioning of me in relation to what I had read or
- 18 what I hadn't read would have clarified a lot of
- 19 matters there without having to go down the
- 20 disciplinary route.
- 21 666 Q. MR. O'HIGGINS: Let's just take the Chairman's
- intervention there. It covers whether you did or ought
- to have read it, right?
- 24 CHAIRMAN: I didn't think there was anything
- 25 controversial about when I said --
- MR. O' HI GGI NS: Nothing.
- 27 CHAIRMAN: -- I thought that was fairly -- I'm sorry if
- I am interfering with your cross-examination.
- MR. O'HIGGINS: No, well, I didn't mean intervention.

- 1 667 Q. I am suggesting to you that's perfectly legitimate to
- look into that because you yourself felt there were
- problems for you because you hadn't read it.
- 4 A. Yeah.
- 5 668 Q. In other words, that you ought to have read it.
- 6 A. Yes, there was several matters to be looked into in
- 7 relation to Baiba, but in relation to this here, just a

15:06

15:06

15:07

- 8 cursory review of my report to Inspector Mangan, a
- 9 re-interview of me on a cursory level could have
- 10 established for them quite clearly the fact behind it
- 11 that was discovered two years later.
- 12 669 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do you think you should have read it?
- 13 A. In hindsight, I certainly should have.
- 14 670 Q. CHAIRMAN: Okay. In hindsight?
- 15 A. Yes, in hindsight. Obviously the matter -- maybe if I
- had tackled it on the Friday before she died, I
- 17 probably would have recognised this and then kind of
- consulted with her, but that's all conjecture.
- 19 671 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, I appreciate that it's easy for any
- of us to look in hindsight.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 672 Q. CHAIRMAN: But for what it's worth.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 673 Q. MR. O'HIGGINS: The appointment of the chief
- 25 superintendent under the regulations was only to
- investigate whether you and Declan Nyhan may have been
- in breach. There was no predetermined, let's do the
- two lads down. It was, they were looking into the
- 29 possibility that you may have been in breach, no more.

1	Α.	Yes. I see that.	
2		MR. MARRINAN: Sorry, sir, I don't like to interrupt.	
3		In fairness to Sergeant Hughes, Assistant Commissioner	
4		McHugh was written to by Sergeant Hughes's solicitor,	
5		and I opened this during the course of his evidence.	15:08
6		He was asked to outline exactly what the complaint was	
7		being made against his client. And there was a reply	
8		on the 21st August of 2007 and it's at page 216 of the	
9		material.	
10		CHAIRMAN: 216, yeah.	15:08
11		MR. MARRINAN: And at page 2107.	
12		CHAIRMAN: Sorry, 2106?	
13		MR. MARRINAN: Just scroll over there. I just think in	
14		fairness to the witness this should be	
15		CHAIRMAN: What does it say, Mr. Marrinan?	15:08
16		MR. MARRINAN: Just scroll over. At the top of the	
17		page there:	
18			
19		"With regard to the queries raised in your office	
20		correspondence of the 19th June 2007 to Assistant	15:08
21		Commissioner, Human Resource Management I wish to	
22		inform you of the following"	
23			
24		Then if we look at (b) there.	
25			15:08
26		"It is alleged that your client failed in his duty to	
27		take measures that would have been expected of him to	
28		avoid any risk to Ms. Saulite."	
29			

1			So, that has to be read in conjunction with the actual	
2			terms of the order that was made at the time, and I am	
3			just highlighting that because it seems to me that, in	
4			fairness to the witness, that was within his knowledge	
5			also at the time.	15:09
6			CHAIRMAN: I am not understanding that, Mr. Marrinan.	
7			What's the practical application in respect of the	
8			question?	
9			MR. MARRINAN: What I am pointing out is, that that has	
10			to be read in conjunction with the terms of the order	15:09
11			that was made giving rise to the inquiry.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Yes. Okay. Thank you very much.	
13	674	Q.	MR. O'HIGGINS: Sergeant, just to, you may be aware of	
14			this, and I don't have the page reference, but under	
15			regulation 8, I'll just suggest I'll read out to you	15:10
16			what the wording is:	
17				
18			"Subject to representation 7"	
19				
20			which I don't think troubles us.	15:10
21				
22			" where it appears that there may have been a breach	
23			of discipline the matter shall be investigated as soon	
24			as practicable by a member not below the rank of	
25			i nspector. "	15:10
26				
27			So, the regulation 8 investigation is where it appears	
28			there may have been a breach of discipline; it's not	
29			the preferring of a disciplinary finding, or anything	

Т	of that nature. It's couched very tentatively "may	
2	have been a breach of discipline". And I am suggesting	
3	to you that the wording we looked at page 908 of Chief	
4	Superintendent Feehan's report breaks down actually	
5	what the allegation being inquired into was. And we	15:10
6	see on page 908, that it was:	
7		
8	"It appears Sergeant William Hughes was in possession	
9	of documentation and information as a result of	
10	meetings with Ms. Baiba Saulite"	15:11
11		
12	And then it says:	
13		
14	" and being in possession of same, knew or ought to	
15	have known at the time of the existence of a real and	15:11
16	immediate risk to the life of Ms. Baiba Saulite."	
17		
18	So that's how it was framed, and I'm suggesting to	
19	you - well, you have heard me on this already - that	
20	simply wasn't tantamount to a criminal charge. It may	15:11
21	have been an unpleasant thing to have to have looked	
22	into, but it was a reasonable inquiry based upon what	
23	was already found in the preliminary basis in the	
24	scoping exercise.	
25	CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Higgins, I am going to suggest that	15:11
26	the meaning of the inquiry, of the brief for the	
27	inquiry, is really a matter of interpretation and, if	
28	necessary, legal submission. Sergeant Hughes says,	
29	look, I was told this was tantamount to an accusation	

of manslaughter. On the face of it, that seems somewhat extravagant. On the face of it. There may be a logic to it, there may be a reason to it, but his evidence is: listen, I was worried about it and that's what I was told, so my fears were confirmed. Now, if 15:12 I'm understanding, I don't see any point - if I may respectfully suggest it - in debating with Sergeant Hughes the finer points of the law of manslaughter or whatever, or the meaning of the actual interpretation Subject to what anybody else says, of the statement. 15:12 it doesn't seem to me to be terribly profitable because he says, look that's what -- I was worried about it, I thought it was very serious, and that was confirmed by legal advisors.

15:13

15:13

15:13

15

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

26 27 28

29

24

25

There we have it. And it doesn't So, there we stand. mean that they were right. We can debate whether they were right or they were wrong, whether it is extravagant or not extravagant or whatever. And I mean, the lawyers here will know the process under Garda regulations that it comes to, and if there is another step, then they may set up a board of inquiry -- if I'm understanding correctly, they may set up a board of inquiry and that may have an allegation. But we don't need to worry about all that. course, we can all -- the lawyers can make a submission about that and we can sort it out. MR. O' HI GGI NS: Thank you, Chairman. That's helpful. I'll move and and I will--

153

1			CHAIRMAN: Sorry to make a long speech, but that does	
2			strike me as being fair to everybody, all right?	
3			MR. O'HIGGINS: Thank you, Chairman.	
4	675	Q.	Can I ask you to look at page 923, please, sergeant,	
5			which is the penultimate page of Assistant	15:13
6			Commissioner's Feehan's report in the disciplinary	
7			investigation. And he says there:	
8				
9			"On the 20th October 2006 Sergeant Hughes forwarded a	
10			report to superintendent Coolock expressing his	15:14
11			concerns for Ms. Saulite and her solicitor, Mr. John	
12			Hennessy. In the report he outlines how the two	
13			witnesses in the forthcoming trial of Mr. A - namely,	
14			Baiba Saulite and Mr. John Hennessy - had been the	
15			victims of recent arson attacks. The member reported	15:14
16			that Mr. A was suspected of having been concerned in	
17			the attack on Mr. Hennessy's home and that preliminary	
18			findings indicate that he was involved in the attack on	
19			Ms. Saulite."	
20				15:14
21			Then if we just go to the next paragraph, he says:	
22				
23			"With regard to the handwritten report that Ms. Saulite	
24			handed to Sergeant Hughes on the 14th November wherein	
25			she stated, inter alia, 'At the moment I am very scared	15:14
26			for my life because Mr. A is blaming me for everything	
27			that has gone wrong in his life', the following matters	
28			should be borne in mind:	
29			(i) Sergeant Hughes had already apprised his district	

1			officer of his concerns regarding the safety of	
2			Ms. Saulite by way of his report of the 20th October	
3			2006. "	
4				
5			I am going to pause there. It was fair and reasonable,	15:15
6			wasn't it, for Michael Feehan to include that reference	
7			therein (i)?	
8		Α.	Yes, indeed.	
9	676	Q.	Because, in fairness to you, you had sent up the report	
10			of the 20th October '06?	15:15
11		Α.	I had.	
12	677	Q.	We can pass from (ii) because it's not terribly	
13			germane, underneath it, and if we go to the final	
14			paragraph on the next page, we have if we just	
15			scroll down a little bit we have the final paragraph	15:15
16			reads as follows:	
17				
18			"This investigation has not established that the member	
19			concerned was aware 'of the existence of a real and	
20			immediate risk to the life of Ms. Baiba Saulite'. On	15:16
21			the 20th October 2006, Sergeant Hughes advised his	
22			district officer of his concerns for Ms. Saulite,	
23			however, there was nothing to indicate that her was	
24			under threat. Sergeant Hughes denies having read the	
25			victim impact report, wherein she actually states that	15:16
26			she feared for her life, and there is no evidence to	
27			hand that would indicate otherwise. Even if he had	
28			read the report in full it is unlikely that the	
29			contents could be interpreted as a real and immediate	

1			risk to the life of Ms. Baiba Saulite."	
2				
3			So there's a number of important things in there that	
4			are, if I can use this shorthand, exonerating you?	
5		Α.	Yes, indeed.	15:16
6	678	Q.	He points he looks at it from the perspective of the	
7			fact you hadn't read the VIR, you hadn't read the	
8			victim impact. He says there was nothing to indicate	
9			her life was under threat in it, notwithstanding the	
10			express concern she puts into it?	15:17
11		Α.	Yes.	
12	679	Q.	CHAIRMAN: So what do you say to to that?	
13		Α.	This decision, Mr. Chairman, was arrived at nearly two	
14			years after the imposition of the disciplinary process.	
15			And I feel these decisions could have been arrived at	15:17
16			before	
17	680	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes. So, that could have been arrived at	
18			earlier, you say?	
19		Α.	Much earlier. Before the imposition of the	
20			disciplinary process.	15:17
21	681	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes, that's basically it?	
22		Α.	That's it in a nut schedule.	
23	682	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But as far as it goes, that doesn't seem	
24			like an unfair conclusion, does it?	
25		Α.	This is a very good assessment that could have been	15:17
26			arrived at much earlier.	
27	683	Q.	CHAIRMAN: And can I just ask you this: if he was	
28			targeting you, would he have arrived at that	
29			conclusion?	

- 1 A. Eh...
- 2 684 Q. CHAIRMAN: I mean, if he was going to target you,
- 3 surely he would have nailed you a bit better than that?

15:18

15.10

- 4 A. I don't think there was any basis for targeting me in
- 5 the first place.
- 6 685 Q. CHAIRMAN: I understand that. But if -- assuming that
- 7 he was targeting you, that chief superintendent, as he
- 8 was at the time, Chief Superintendent Feehan, assuming
- 9 he was targeting you, surely he'd have done a different
- 10 job than come to that conclusion?
- 11 A. Em, a different job?
- 12 686 Q. CHAIRMAN: What do you say to that?
- 13 A. A different job? Like?
- 14 687 Q. CHAIRMAN: Yeah, he'd have come to a different
- conclusion, he'd have said you were at fault. In fact, 15:18
- 16 he exonerates you.
- 17 A. Yes. And I would say it might have -- with respect to
- 18 Chief Superintendent Feehan at the time, I think he
- 19 would have considerable difficulty in establishing a
- fault because the evidence wasn't there from the first, 15:18
- 21 from the get-go.
- 22 CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 23 688 Q. MR. O'HIGGINS: Is that fair, sergeant? It's not a
- 24 grudging technical clearance of you. It's a ringing
- endorsement of steps you took. It's an exoneration of
- you.
- 27 A. Yes. And the point I'm making is that the exoneration
- could have been arrived at before the disciplinary
- 29 processed started.

- 1 689 Q. It's wholly inconsistent with the suggestion that he was intent on targeting you, isn't it?
- 3 A. But I was targeted in the disciplinary process.
- 4 690 Q. In his questionnaire response to the Tribunal, Chief

 Superintendent Gerry Phillips states that the 15:19
- 6 disciplinary investigation carried out by Michael
- 7 Feehan, then Chief Superintendent Michael Feehan, was a
- 8 balanced and proportionate action to investigate the
- 9 circumstances surrounding the receiving of the Victim
- 10 Impact Statement and to establish if there were other

15:20

15:20

- issues. Would you agree with that?
- 12 A. I don't agree with that.
- 13 691 Q. You don't?
- 14 A. I don't.
- 15 692 Q. You don't think it was balanced?
- 16 A. The disciplinary investigation?
- 17 693 Q. The report that he did.
- 18 A. The report here that we have here that he did at the end of it?
- 20 694 Q. Yes.
- 21 A. Yes. As I said earlier on, the report --
- 22 695 Q. The outcome?
- 23 A. -- the report here, if it had have been, if that
- 24 decision in the last paragraph had been arrived at as a
- result of the fact-finding investigation then there
- 26 wouldn't have been any disciplinary process.
- 27 696 Q. But what I asked to you agree or disagree with, up to
- you, was Chief Superintendent Gerry Phillips saying of
- the disciplinary investigation report, and the

1 investigation, that it was balanced and proportionate,

15:20

15:21

15:21

- 2 do you differ with that?
- 3 A. I do.
- 4 697 Q. All right.
- 5 698 Q. CHAIRMAN: In what way was it not balanced or
- 6 proportionate?
- 7 A. Well --
- 8 699 Q. CHAIRMAN: Do you understand? I accept -- you say,
- 9 look, it wasn't. Now, tell us how it wasn't balanced
- or it wasn't proportionate.
- 11 A. When Chief Superintendent Phillips originally saw the
- victim impact report himself before he reported it,
- when he was reporting it to I think it was Assistant
- 14 Commissioner Al McHugh, on that occasion he intimated
- to Commissioner McHugh that there was no case to answer 15:21
- for either of myself or Garda Nyhan in the document.
- 17 He actually believed that at the time.
- 18 700 Q. MR. O'HIGGINS: And I think, just taking that, it's a
- 19 fair point, Michael -- Inspector Cryan relayed the
- 20 chief's view in that regard to you --
- 21 A. To me.
- 22 701 Q. -- in his conversation with you, I can't remember was
- it the Tuesday or the Wednesday after the murder?
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 702 Q. And that was done intentionally to put you at your
- ease: tell Sergeant Hughes, as far as I am concerned,
- there isn't a problem with the VIR for him?
- 28 A. That's correct.
- 29 703 Q. At this point in time, by the 22nd November certainly,

1	for	better	or	for	worse,	you	have	formed	the	view	that
2	you	are be	ing	scap	pegoate	d?					

- 3 A. Yes, following the release of the press release.
- 4 704 Q. Yes. Even though management up high, down through the chain, are trying to reassure you: listen, stop beating 15:22 yourself up, the victim impact report, it's not a major deal?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 705 Q. I'm suggesting to you that is wholly inconsistent with 10 the desire to target you or oppress you.

15:23

- 11 Α. I disagree. And in the context of what we're talking 12 about, the divisional officer, Gerry Phillips, and his 13 assessment of the disciplinary investigations two years 14 later, he would have known, Chief Superintendent 15 Phillips would have known that the matter of the victim 15:23 16 impact and the controversial statement made in it, 17 could have been investigated without the imposition of 18 a disciplinary process at all.
- 19 706 But you see, it wasn't just -- you focus exclusively on Q. 20 the victim impact. It was also the fact of the conversation and the contents of the conversation you 21 22 had with Baiba Saulite on the 14th. Again, I'm not 23 suggesting to you that it involved any breach, because 24 it didn't, but it was one of the matters in the round 25 that needed to be investigated?
- A. Well, I think in his document there that was just read there, by Mr. Marrinan there, he made it specific that it was the actual document, the line in the document that he was referring to, and not this conversation

1	afterwards.
上	aiteiwaius.

- 2 707 Q. It contains in it and we have been over this already
 an indication from her that she feared for her
 safety, the victim impact that she made.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 708 Q. According to the note of Michael Cryan, which you
 7 differ with, which I suggest to you is supported by the
 8 note we'll look at in a minute from Superintendent
 9 Dennedy, in the conversation you had with Baiba Saulite
 10 on the 14th November she also orally indicated a
 15:24
 11 concern for her own safety. You disagree with that?
- well, I don't think either of those officers appeared 12 Α. 13 as witnesses or there were statements taken from them 14 in relation to the disciplinary investigation. 15 their conversations were not subject -- or the alleged 16 conversations -- sorry, the alleged matters in the 17 conversations were not subject to the disciplinary 18 investigation. They simply focussed in on the couple 19 of lines there in the 12-page victim impact report.

- The disciplinary investigation didn't involve interviewing Inspector Cryan or Inspector Dennedy, as far as I am aware.
- 23 709 Q. All right. In terms of timing, sergeant, would you
 24 agree with me that Assistant Commissioner McHugh had no
 25 knowledge at the time of the disciplinary investigation 15:25
 26 that you had made any whistleblowing complaint, he
 27 didn't know that?
- 28 A. I didn't know that.
- 29 710 Q. Well, he says he wasn't aware. I take it you have no

- 1 reason to doubt that?
- 2 I really can't speak for Assistant Commissioner McHugh, Α. 3 but I wouldn't know what he knew when he was setting up 4 the disciplinary inquiry.
- 5 711 I see. So you the investigation itself, I suggest to Q. 15:25 6 you that when one drills down into the chronology of 7 it, it was in fact not unduly delayed; that is to say there was a lot of time taken up with the fact that you 8 were off sick, and also by the delay occasioned by 9 seeking to ascertain whether you were fit to be 10 15:26 11 interviewed.
- 12 Yes, in relation to the approach made to me in November Α. 13 2007 -- I don't want to be getting mixed up with my 14 years here.

15 CHAI RMAN: All right.

16

17

18

26

27

-- at that point I was very low and not feeling great Α. at all. And I then reported to the Tribunal that my impression of the contacts that were made between Chief 19 Superintendent Feehan and the CMO's office, it must be 20 remembered that I was totally in the dark in relation 15:26 to any communications that were going on between Chief 21 22 Feehan and the CMO's office. I was also extremely wary of the fact that the disciplinary process and the 23 motivations behind it, I was extremely wary of the 24 25 process itself, and I'm sure that if maybe I was told 15:27 that there were difficulties in getting communications and there was feedback in relation to that, I could have assisted further in the speeding up of the --28 29 expediting of the disciplinary process.

1 712 Q. Well, you'd agree with me, I presume, that -- at least you'd accept that the investigation team were anxious to interview you to progress the investigation, and on the 1st November of '07 you were asked to attend Store Street for an interview?

15:27

- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 713 Q. And your solicitor responded, on the 8th November, that you were unfit to attend, do you recall that?
- Yes. And if I can qualify that, please, in relation to 9 Α. the way I'd be feeling probably in the autumn of 2007. 10 15:27 11 Remember, that the disciplinary papers were served on June 15th and the first contact that was made with me 12 13 was in November, or basically around November of the 14 same year, and I was extremely concerned as to why it 15 took so long for the first contact to be made by the 15:28 16 disciplinary team. And eventually, when I did meet 17 with the disciplinary team, and I think there was 18 probably half a dozen questions they needed to ask me, 19 most of which were answered in the fact-finding investigation, and, you know, if I thought that was the 15:28 20 level of the inquiries that were necessary to bring it 21 22 to the end I would have actually made it my business to 23 actually contact the disciplinary team to finish the 24 matter.
- 25 714 Q. Sergeant, I hope we can get through this reasonably
 26 quickly, and it may be common position between us, but
 27 from my look at the timeline, it appears that the
 28 period from November '07 into February '08, when
 29 Inspector Dwyer was tasked with contacting the CMO

1			office to ascertain, to push on the situation as to	
2			whether you were or were not fit for interview, that	
3			issue took up quite a period of months, through	
4			nobody's fault?	
5		Α.	It did.	15:29
6	715	Q.	Through nobody's fault?	
7		Α.	Sorry?	
8	716	Q.	Through nobody's fault?	
9		Α.	Well, I can't understand how much more expeditious	
10			communications couldn't have been conducted in that	15:29
11			regard.	
12	717	Q.	Well to be blunt, I mean it stemmed from the fact that	
13			it was initially indicated you were unfit for	
14			interview. So, the interview that you maintain you	
15			were demanding to have, you were your solicitor was	15:29
16			offering the position you were unfit. So that created	
17			a difficulty for the management, do you see what I	
18			mean?	
19		Α.	Yes, but having said that, should it take three or four	
20			months to receive a response from the CMO? I mean I	15:29
21			don't know.	
22	718	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Did you ever say I am fit to be interviewed?	
23		Α.	Excuse me?	
24	719	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Did you ever get your solicitor to write and	
25			say I'm fit to be interviewed?	15:29
26		Α.	I think we did send correspondence to that effect. In	
27			other words, if they want to even send the questions to	
28			us and	

29 720 Q. CHAIRMAN: But they had to send the questions in

1			advance and you'd give them a written reply.	
2		Α.	Yes.	
3	721	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Do you think that's what they had in mind?	
4		Α.	Do you think that's	
5	722	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That they'd send you a written	15:30
6			questionnaire?	
7		Α.	Well, that would have been very helpful.	
8			CHAIRMAN: Yeah, okay.	
9	723	Q.	MR. O'HIGGINS: And as we moved into April, Chief	
10			Superintendent Feehan was corresponding, and	15:30
11			Mr. Marrinan brought the Tribunal over this in his	
12			examination of the relevant correspondence, but on the	
13			29th April Chief Superintendent Feehan corresponded	
14			with A/C HRM, so Assistant Commissioner's Human	
15			Resources, indicating that he had not received advices	15:30
16			yet from the CMO and highlighting his obligation to	
17			carry out the disciplinary investigation as soon as	
18			possible, and he asked if the CMO didn't revert quickly	
19			should he proceed to interview you anyway? All right?	
20			Do you remember that?	15:30
21		Α.	I recall that correspondence, yes.	
22	724	Q.	And in September, some months later, the human	
23			resources office wrote that the CMO had recommended	

- that the disciplinary investigation be dealt with as 25 soon as possible. And this was interpreted by the human resources side that it should thus be taken that 26 you were fit for interview and to proceed with the 27 interview. 28
- I believe that's the correspondence, yes. 29 Α.

24

- 1 725 Q. And that, as it were, seemed to unblock the logjam and at least allow the interview happen?
- 3 A. Yes.

9

- 4 726 Q. All right. I am suggesting to you that nobody could
 5 say that that period of, you might even regard it as
 6 inefficiency, and ideally oughtn't to have happened,
 7 that period of delay, if delay it be, that isn't
 8 targeting, nor is it harassment? It's just the
- 10 A. Yes, it took almost a year to actually get a response 15:31

 11 from the CMO -- or the HRM in that regard. I think

 12 it's a long time.
- 13 727 Q. I am going to be -- the CMO is going to give his evidence --

processing of a file.

- 15 A. Sorry?
- 16 The CMO is going to give his evidence and doubtless 728 Q. 17 will be pleased that part of your allegations against 18 him appear to have fallen away. But just dealing with 19 the CMO's position and the Garda management position, do you agree with me that though there was a period of 20 interval of time/delay involved, it wasn't targeting of 21 22 you?

15:31

- A. What I say is that the overall disciplinary process and the conduct of the disciplinary process and the delay in the disciplinary process was a targeting of me.
- 26 729 Q. How was the delay targeting of you?
- A. Well, if, as I said, the papers were served in June
 28 2008, there was absolutely no reason why, so far as I
 29 could see, that within six weeks, as was suggested at

Т			the time, of the service of the papers, that he would	
2			actually have the matter wrapped up within six weeks.	
3			That didn't happen. So I can't see why there was a	
4			delay from June 2008 until October/November 2008 when	
5			the information that they sought was pretty concise and	15:33
6			concise answers could have been provided.	
7	730	Q.	Can I draw a distinction? I understand your case that	
8			it was inefficient or undesirable or ought not to have	
9			happened - the delay - I understand that.	
10		Α.	Yes.	15:33
11	731	Q.	I'm not conceding it, but I understand it. I want to	
12			ask you: how could it possibly be said to be targeting	
13			of it? How is it malicious?	
14		Α.	Well, in the first place, I believe - and I still	
15			believe - that the disciplinary process should never	15:33
16			have been undertaken in the form that it was taken, and	
17			that it targeted myself and Garda Nyhan from the	
18			outset, when there were other failures within An Garda	
19			Síochána relating to Baiba Saulite which were not taken	
20			into account.	15:33
21	732	Q.	Moving the timeline on, sergeant, on the 29th October	
22			2008, you were interviewed at the office of your	
23			solicitor by Inspector Dwyer and Inspector Sweeney?	
24		Α.	That's correct.	
25	733	Q.	You provided a pre-prepared 25-page statement?	15:34
26		Α.	Yes, which I'd hoped would help their inquiry.	
27	734	Q.	On the 30th October, the next day, the inspector wrote	
28			to Assistant Commissioner McHugh, and Assistant	
29			Commissioner McHugh asked that the matters in your	

Т			23-page statement which reli outside the disciplinary	
2			investigation regarding bullying and misconduct and so	
3			forth, the issue arose as to whether they should be	
4			dealt with separately, isn't that right?	
5		Α.	We were told that they were not within the ambit of	15:34
6			their disciplinary investigation.	
7	735	Q.	Yeah. And that was a reasonable position, wasn't it?	
8		Α.	I don't think so.	
9	736	Q.	I see. In December, on the 8th December, Inspector	
10			Dwyer phoned you requesting a meeting, and you	15:35
11			responded that the matter should go through your	
12			solicitor?	
13		Α.	A meeting in connection with, sorry, if you can remind	
14			me?	
15	737	Q.	To clarify matters arising from the statement, I	15:35
16			presume.	
17		Α.	I don't recall saying, strictly speaking, it should go	
18			through my solicitor. I could have suggested, could he	
19			correspond with Sean Costello on that matter.	
20	738	Q.	All right. On the 9th December 2008, my understanding	15:35
21			is that Inspector Dwyer wrote to your solicitor seeking	
22			to meet you to clarify matters in the statement, and I	
23			think we have already been over this through	
24			Mr. Marrinan's hands, and there was no response	
25			forthcoming to two pieces of correspondence.	15:35
26		Α.	I can't account for that at the moment, you know.	
27	739	Q.	I just wonder, I mean is there a degree of unfairness	
28			in your thinking there? You can't account for inaction	
20			on your side of the fence but if there was delay on	

- the Garda side, that's targeting?
- 2 A. Well, we're talking about -- sorry, we're talking about
- 3 two meetings which were requested, is it, by Inspector
- 4 Dwyer?
- 5 740 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. I'd really have to check to see what my recollection is

15:36

15:36

15:36

- on that as to why -- there would be a good reason, if
- 8 they weren't answered, there was some reason for it. I
- 9 don't know what it is.
- 10 741 Q. You are aware that in January of 2009, Inspector Dwyer
- 11 wrote to your solicitor and indicated that a number of
- matters in your statement, the pre-prepared statement
- 13 you had provided, did not come within the remit of the
- 14 disciplinary investigation?
- 15 A. Within the ambit, yes.
- 16 742 Q. And that was the position that was communicated clearly
- 17 to your solicitor?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 743 Q. On the 29th January, the inspector wrote again and
- requested a meeting, do you recall that?
- 21 A. Em, I don't recall it at the moment, no.
- 22 744 Q. The meeting, when it eventually happened, happened on
- the 10th February '09?
- 24 A. Okay.
- 25 745 Q. And two days later, the 11th February -- sorry, the
- next day, the 11th February, Inspector Dwyer forwarded
- 27 notes of the meeting to your solicitor and asked for a
- response.
- 29 A. Yes, okay.

1	746	Q.	That was, again, a fair and reasonable, into accordance
2			with fair procedures, process that he operated?
3		Α.	Yeah, I don't disagree with that.
4	747	Q.	I take it you have no complaint about the fairness of
5			the procedures, leaving aside the delay, and you have 15:37
6			made that point in fairness to you, but other than

- that, you have no quibble in relation to the fairness of the procedures that were accorded to you?
- 9 A. The procedures that?
- 10 748 Q. The fair procedures that were accorded to you in the process?

- 12 A. Towards the end, is it, with Fergus Dwyer?
- 13 749 Q. The whole thing.
- 14 A. No, I think the whole thing, initially the imposition 15 of the disciplinary process was --
- 16 750 Q. Sorry, I have that point. No, I mean the actual
 17 interviewing of you, the carrying out of the
 18 investigation, the looking into matters, you have no
 19 complaint about that?
- 20 Well, the the 25-page report I furnished to Inspector Α. 15:38 Dwyer was of some relevance to his inquiry and provided 21 22 a background, it provided evidence that there could be matters elsewhere that could be looked into, as well as 23 24 the allegations of bullying and harassment arising from the different situations I found myself in following 25 15:38 Baiba's murder. And, I wouldn't say it was entirely 26 27 fair for Inspector Dwyer, with the greatest respect to the man, to actually have said that -- or sought 28 29 directions and agree with the fact that most of the

1			matters were not within the ambit of his investigation.	
2			I think if you were to look at the 25-page report you'd	
3			probably see that indeed a lot of the matters in that	
4			report were relevant to the investigation.	
5	751	Q.	Didn't part of the report of your statement, at least	15:39
6			to the investigators, didn't part of it cover	
7			historical bullying and harassment allegations that you	
8			had made?	
9		Α.	It did. I provided that as a backdrop to the child	
10			abduction case that was part of the report.	15:39
11	752	Q.	That had nothing to do with the disciplinary matter	
12			that was being discussed?	
13		Α.	Well it provided a picture of the a backdrop to the	
14			disciplinary process or sorry, the child abduction	
15			case, and the ongoing I think I expressed it in that	15:39
16			report, the fact that I felt I was being bullied as a	
17			result of imposition of the disciplinary matter.	
18	753	Q.	The file indicates that on the 3rd April 2009, that	
19			some months later, your solicitor provided further	
20			communication in relation to the matters raised	15:40
21			regarding the linking of your bullying and harassment	
22			allegations to the disciplinary investigation.	
23		Α.	Yes.	
24	754	Q.	And seven days later, on the 20th April, Inspector	
25			Dwyer wrote back and stated in correspondence there was	15:40
26			no link between the bullying and harassment case and	
27			the disciplinary investigation, and he sought	

disciplinary investigation.

28

29

clarification for your views on the motive for the

1		Α.	Yes.	
2	755	Q.	We might just look at that, please. Page 968. And	
3			this is from the inspector "I have been directed by	
4			Assistant Commissioner Feehan to acknowledge receipt of	
5			your correspondence of the 3rd	15:41
6				
7			Clarification is sought with regard to the following:	
8			From investigation to date there appears to be no link	
9			with the matters referred to in the numerous items to	
10			wit allegations of bullying and the matters that are	15:41
11			the subject of this disciplinary investigation.	
12				
13			As you have previously requested that cognisance be	
14			taken of the matters referred to in the correspondence,	
15			I would be most grateful if you could, for the	15:41
16			avoidance of doubt, detail what your client believes is	
17			a connection between the two matters.	
18				
19			In the correspondence of the 19th June 2007, reference	
20			is made to the regulation 9 notice which was served on	15:41
21			your client shortly after the commencement of this	
22			discipline investigation, wherein you state, inter	
23			alia, 'On our client's instructions the motive behind	
24			the service of such a notice on our client is quite	
25			cl ear' . "	15:41
26				
27			So what I want to canvass with you, sergeant, is: it	
28			would appear that the passage of time that	
29			unfortunately elapsed here, at least some of it is	

1			explained by the hair being raised by you that there	
2			was a link between historical bullying and harassment	
3			allegations and the disciplinary investigation that was	
4			taking place, and that slowed everything down?	
5		Α.	No, I don't agree with that.	15:42
6	756	Q.	All right. Moving the timeline on. On the 16th April	
7			'09, your solicitor wrote back that you had already	
8			elaborated on the matter, and that was it. On the 30th	
9			April, your solicitor wrote amending with his	
10			amendments of the note of the meeting that had been	15:42
11			furnished, isn't that right?	
12		Α.	Sorry, a note of a meeting?	
13	757	Q.	On the 30th April, your solicitor wrote providing his	
14			amendments to the note of the meeting.	
15		Α.	Okay, yes.	15:42
16	758	Q.	And on the 3rd June 2009, the report of the	
17			disciplinary investigation was forwarded by Chief	
18			Superintendent Feehan to Assistant Commissioner McHugh,	
19			and we have seen that already. And then we know that	
20			the following month, in July, the disciplinary	15:43
21			investigation was subsequently discontinued on foot of	
22			Chief Superintendent Feehan's report.	
23		Α.	Yes, indeed.	
24			CHAIRMAN: Say that again. Did you say something	
25			there?	15:43
26		Α.	No, I said "yes indeed".	
27	759	Q.	MR. O'HIGGINS: You'd agree with me that whilst there	
28			was an investigation, ultimately I think this is	
29			probably common case there was no breach of	

- discipline ever preferred against you; you were
- 2 ultimately just exonerated?
- 3 A. I was. After two years, yes.
- 4 760 Q. Thank you. Now, can I bring you now to the CMO
- 5 process, and Mr. Marrinan brought you over some medical 15:43
- 6 reports which are relevant under a number of different
- 7 headings, a number of questions that the Tribunal is
- 8 looking into. The first of these is the statement of
- 9 Dr. Richard Quigley, who has been mentioned in
- despatches, and his statement is at page 1331.
- 11 Now, can I ask you this: Dr. Quigley indicates that in

15 · 44

15:45

15:45

- his meeting with you, in September of 2007 --
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 761 Q. -- 19th September, he took an extensive history from
- 15 you and considered your presentation. So, took a
- history, and it wasn't a quick in-and-out job, it was
- 17 quite extensive?
- 18 A. Em, yes, my recollection is I met with him and
- 19 explained my difficulties to him.
- 20 762 Q. Yes. You told him that you had been referred to a
- 21 psychiatrist, Dr. Joseph Fernandez --
- 22 A. No, sorry, this is prior to seeing Dr. Quigley.
- 23 763 Q. Yes.
- A. Yes, by my own doctor, yes.
- 25 764 Q. By your own GP?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 765 Q. Dr. James Reilly?
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 766 Q. And no medication was prescribed, is that right?

- 1 A. No, I don't think he arrived at a diagnosis either.
- 2 767 Q. Pardon?
- 3 A. I don't think he arrived at a diagnosis in relation to
- 4 just -- in relation that the matters were work related,
- 5 I think.
- 6 768 Q. Well, just we might -- just while we're on it, we might

15:47

15:47

15 · 47

- 7 move to page 6769, which is Dr. Reilly's report. Am
- 8 I correct in my understanding -- just again I don't
- 9 mean this pejoratively in any sense -- but you were
- having difficulties in the spring of -- February period 15:46
- in '07, and you weren't able to cope, and you were, you
- 12 yourself were anxious for a psychiatric opinion?
- A. No. I went to see Dr. Reilly in December 2006, and as
- part of the consultation -- I think I had one or two
- consultations with him -- he decided just to refer me
- 16 to Dr. Fernandez just for assessment.
- 17 769 Q. Is that correct?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 770 Q. You see, he saw you on the 16th February '07, at which
- time you were back at work for a couple of days and
- found you could not cope. You see it says that?
- 22 A. No, there was a prior appointment with Dr. Fernandez.
- 23 771 Q. I beg your pardon?
- A. I had a prior appointment with Dr. Fernandez before
- 25 returning to work.
- 26 772 Q. Well, the GP says: "At that point he was anxious for a
- 27 psychi atri c opi ni on. "
- 28 A. Where is that?
- 29 773 Q. Do you see the paragraph starting "I referred him to a

Τ			counsellor"?	
2				
3			"William was seen again on the 16th December 2006 and	
4			again he was somewhat hypertensive and stressed. He	
5			was given a note for work until 14th February '07."	15:47
6		Α.	Yes.	
7	774	Q.	"He was seen once again on the 16th February 2007 at	
8			which time he was back at work for a couple of days and	
9			found he could not cope."	
10		Α.	That was for a couple of days, yes. I don't I'd	15:48
11			just have to check the dates on that.	
12	775	Q.	My question to you is: at this time, in February '07,	
13			were you unable to cope at work?	
14		Α.	Well, I was under severe stress at work.	
15	776	Q.	Yeah	15:48
16		Α.	Yes.	
17	777	Q.	So you don't take issue with that?	
18		Α.	Well, I was under fierce stress at work and that's why	
19			I went to see the doctor, yes.	
20	778	Q.	Do you take issue with the next sentence: you were	15:48
21			anxious for a psychiatric opinion?	
22		Α.	No, I don't recall being I recall that I was	
23			referred by Dr. Reilly, just on his suggestion, to see	
24			Dr. Fernandez. That's my recollection of that anyway.	
25	779	Q.	You went to see Dr. Fernandez in March, was it?	15:48
26		Α.	In March.	
27	780	Q.	You told him that you felt partly responsible for the	
28			circumstances of Ms. Saulite's death?	
29		Δ	Em	

1			dealing with her before her murder and that there were	
2			circumstances that maybe if I had been made aware of,	
3			leading up to her death, that maybe I would have taken	
4			a different course; that would have been the	
5			conversation I had with Dr. Fernandez at the time.	15:49
6	781	Q.	You were blaming yourself?	
7		Α.	Well, it was I think the Garda Síochána are	
8			ultimately responsible for failures with Baiba Saulite,	
9			and I was dealing with her at the time, so I think the	
10			appropriate thing at the time was to actually carry out	15:49
11			a full debriefing of all members there to find out what	
12			happened, what went wrong, and I just felt that wasn't	
13			happening at the time.	
14	782	Q.	Sergeant, you were blaming yourself in the history you	
15			gave to the psychiatrist, you were blaming yourself,	15:50
16			partly, for her death?	
17		Α.	No, I wasn't blaming myself for her death. I was	
18			blaming myself for probably being involved with Baiba	
19			to the extent of subpoenaing her to the court in	
20			relation to the child abduction case, I was asking	15:50
21			myself questions as to whether, even though it's my	
22			duty, as to whether it was the best course of action to	
23			have taken in such a volatile situation in relation to	
24			the lady.	
25	783	Q.	You see, I wonder is this actually getting to the root	15:50
26			of things? You were blaming yourself and you were	
27			being extremely harsh on yourself, and you reported to	
28			your own doctor, your psychiatrist, that you were	
29			partly responsible?	

_		Α.	No, I didn't I don't remember daring that ranguage to	
2			the psychiatrist that I was partly responsible.	
3			CHAIRMAN: Where is that in the report, in the	
4			psychiatric report? I mean I remember reading it but I	
5			think, to be fair, we should look at it.	15:51
6			MR. O'HIGGINS: Page 1358, Chairman.	
7			CHAIRMAN: Page 1358. Thank you. I think Dr.	
8			Fernandez is deceased, is that correct? Dr. Joseph	
9			Fernandez is no longer with us, is that right? Or is	
10			he?	15:51
11		Α.	I am not sure.	
12	784	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Yes, no? Is there any agreement on this?	
13			Do you not know, Sergeant Hughes? Is the man still	
14			alive or is he not?	
15		Α.	I haven't heard from him in all these years.	15:51
16			CHAIRMAN: You don't know. All right.	
17			MR. MARRINAN: No, he is deceased a considerable period	
18			of time, Chairman.	
19			CHAIRMAN: Very good. Now!	
20			MR. O'HIGGINS: Just it's a reference in Dr. Quigley's	15:52
21			report it's why I have picked up on this.	
22			CHAIRMAN: Let's find the reference, Mr. O'Higgins. I	
23			think it's better that we know exactly where it is.	
24			MR. O'HIGGINS: So, if we have this is a report of	
25			the 4th March 2008, Chairman. If we just scroll up,	15:52
26			we'll see the date of it. Yes, the 4th March	
27			4/3/08 and if we go down towards the bottom of the	
28			page, the paragraph commencing "I feel at that Mr.	
29			Hughes's presentation" about two thirds of the way	

1			down that paragraph towards	
2			CHAIRMAN: So this is Sergeant Hughes talking to	
3			Dr. Quigley?	
4			MR. O'HIGGINS: No, this is yes, this is a report	
5			from Dr. Fernandez to Dr. Quigley.	15:52
6			CHAIRMAN: well let's have a look. Sorry, don't keep	
7			scrolling it. Sorry, go back to where we were. Oh,	
8			Dr. J Fernandez this is Dr. Fernandez, I am sorry.	
9			MR. O'HIGGINS: It's to Dr. Quigley, the Assistant CMO.	
10			CHAIRMAN: Sorry, this is Dr. Fernandez writing?	15:53
11			MR. O' HI GGI NS: Yes.	
12			CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Okay.	
13	785	Q.	CHAIRMAN: Now, do you see that, Sergeant Hughes?	
14		Α.	Yes, I do.	
15			MR. O'HIGGINS: Just to put it in context and not to	15:53
16			take it out of context, the paragraph reads:	
17				
18			"I feel that Mr. Hughes's presentation in February 2007	
19			was precipitated by the assassination of a female	
20			emigrant from eastern Europe which in turn was linked	15:53
21			to the provision of 24-hour Garda protection to her	
22			solicitor because of fear for the latter's safety. Mr.	
23			Hughes was personally involved in bringing in the then	
24			deceased emigrant's children and was resentful of the	
25			fact that he had not been made aware of the	15:53
26			international connections of her male partner who was	
27			believed to be implicated in her murder while	
28			incarcerated in a state prison. Mr. Hughes claimed	
29			that he felt "partly responsible" for the circumstances	

of the above lady's death. Mr. Hughes stated that he
felt "threatened personally" by the aforementioned
events and was resentful of the fact that he had been
"left out in the cold" by his superiors with "no
communication" and with no formal acknowledgment of his 15:54
predicament."

CHAIRMAN: Okay.

7

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

8 786 Q. MR. O'HIGGINS: My question to you, sergeant, is that
9 would appear to indicate that -- to your own
10 psychiatrist -- you were indicating that you felt
11 partly responsible for the events leading to her death?

15:54

15:54

15:55

15:55

Well in the context, and dealing with Dr. Fernandez, we Α. had a discussion there in relation to that obviously. and my feeling back then, in early 2007 and late 2006, was that there had been a systems failure with regard to the investigation, the correlation and the coordination of investigations in respect of Baiba prior to her murder, and particularly from October the 11th 2006, there were serious measures being adopted in relation to Mr. John Hennessy, and I was of the mind that similar measures should have been taken in respect of Baiba Saulite, and maybe I was -- perhaps I was thinking then, like I was thinking now, that if similar measures had have been taken in relation to Baiba Saulite, perhaps her murder could have been prevented, and maybe I should have raised this issue prior to the murder that when I sent a report up to the DPP's office in relation to the forthcoming trial, maybe I should

have highlighted that matter that if John Hennessy is

1			getting this type of protection, crime prevention	
2			advice, visited by senior ranking members of the Garda	
3			Síochána for extended periods of time, I don't know how	
4			the differentiation came to arise between himself and	
5			Baiba's situation.	15:5
6	787	Q.	This report would appear to indicate that you felt	
7			guilt, I am suggesting to you unreasonable guilt,	
8			actually unfair on yourself, but you felt it	
9			nonetheless?	
10		Α.	No, not unreasonable. Just sorry that at the way	15:5
11			things had developed.	
12	788	Q.	That's not what it says. It says "partly responsible"?	
13		Α.	well that's his choice of words. I don't recall saying	
14			that I was partly responsible.	
15	789	Q.	CHAIRMAN: well it's hard to think that you would	15:5
16			actually remember exactly what was said.	
17		Α.	Yes.	
18	790	Q.	CHAIRMAN: But as far as I am concerned, this is a	
19			report by a psychiatrist, and I think I have to take it	
20			as meaning what it says.	15:5
21		Α.	Yes. I can't remember.	
22			CHAIRMAN: I mean I don't think that I am in a position	
23			to say well, you said something different to him and he	
24			has got it wrong. I don't know. Maybe somebody would	
25			suggest to me that there is a basis for saying it's	15:5
26			wrong, but I mean for what it says is, he says you felt	
27			partly responsible. It doesn't mean you were partly	
28			responsible, it doesn't mean he was right that it was	
29			correct, as Mr. O'Higgins is very careful, in fairness,	

to point out, he is making it absolutely clear that he	
actually thinks that that was making it hard on	
yourself. But it's an indication of it's an	
indication of a state of mind that's in need of help.	
It's an indication of a state of mind of a person who	15:57
is out of work because of illness. I mean, you are not	
out of work for nothing. You are out of work because	
you are not well. You are not well because you have a	
problem. I appreciate that you are very uncomfortable	
about saying mental illness, but there is something	15:57
wrong and he is reporting on what's wrong and he says	
you feel partly responsible. That might be an	
indication of the extent of your illness. It's in no	
way a sort of determination that you were to blame, do	
you know what I mean? I mean, in fact many people	15:58
might argue that it goes absolutely the opposite way;	
it shows somebody feeling terrible because, you know,	
looking at a situation, and nobody else has blamed you	
in fact the very things we're talking about, the	
disciplinary investigation you say shouldn't have taken	15:58
place came out and said no, there is no reason for this	
man to be indicted for	
Anyway, I'm sorry for making a speech. All I'm saying	
is, if that's what it says in Dr. Fernandez's report, I	
think I have to take it that that's what he said, and	15:58
if he records you as saying that, then unless there is	
a good reason for thinking you didn't say it, I believe	
I have to take it that you did say it. But, somebody	
may suggest that I have to prefer the evidence of the	

1			witness to the evidence of the document. If so, please	
2			let me have it. But you might as well know that's my	
3			approach at this moment until shown that I'm wrong.	
4			Okay.	
5			But it's in no way I think it's in no way it's	15:59
6			not Dr. Fernandez saying that you are responsible.	
7		Α.	Yes.	
8	791	Q.	CHAIRMAN: If you follow me, after all that long	
9			diatribe from me.	
10		Α.	I think, Mr. Chairman, obviously I don't remember the	15:59
11			conversation I had with the late doctor, but I might	
12			have come from a position if I hadn't managed that	
13			child abduction investigation and it was left without	
14			following up on the recovery of the children from the	
15			Lebanon, would matters have turned out a bit	15:59
16			differently? You know, and that's the context that I	
17			would say, you know	
18	792	Q.	CHAIRMAN: That's part of the background, that might be	
19			part of what fed into the feelings. Who knows? Yeah,	
20			exactly. I mean don't worry, I am	16:00
21		Α.	Yes.	

25 not what he is saying. Α.

Q.

CHAI RMAN:

Sure.

793

22

23

24

26

27

28

29

MR. O' HI GGI NS: A final question for you at this stage, sergeant, is, just while we're on that report, do you see the next paragraph starting "The latter predicament

In fairness, neither is Mr. O'Higgins, in fairness, is

not also saying that; he is making clear that this is

I'm not jumping to conclusions about this.

16:00

			It seems to marcate that you arso reported m	
2			your history to the psychiatrist that your difficulties	
3			had your antecedents, going back over the previous	
4			three and a half years, during which you felt you were	
5			a victim of bullying and harassment at work?	16:00
6		Α.	Yeah that would be my feelings at the time in late 2006	
7			and 2007.	
8	794	Q.	All right. So, a root for your difficulties was also	
9			the the legacy issues, the row with the detective	
10			side in the station?	16:01
11		Α.	Yes, and I believe that they were unresolved at the	
12			time.	
13	795	Q.	All right.	
14	796	Q.	CHAIRMAN: You believe what?	
15		Α.	To my satisfaction anyway. I had recognised on the	16:01
16			that they were unresolved to my satisfaction.	
17	797	Q.	CHAIRMAN: I understand. That seems pretty clear here,	
18			exactly. But they were in the background. Look, we	
19			are not investigating anything of that kind, and we're	
20			not investigating bullying or harassment arising out of	16:01
21			that. But if I understand correctly, you say: Look,	
22			there was a background. Yeah, there were issues there,	
23			they weren't resolved satisfactorily, and obviously	
24			when something else came along that didn't make it any	
25			easier for you.	16:01
26		Α.	Correct.	
27			CHAIRMAN: Okay. Is that a convenient spot to	
28			MR. O'HIGGINS: Yes, Chairman.	
29			CHAIRMAN Okay Thanks very much Thanks neonle	

1	Thank you very much.
2	
3	THE HEARING ADJOURNED UNTIL TUESDAY, 8TH FEBRUARY 2022
4	AS 10: 30 A. M.
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

	13th [1] - 36:26	2005 [13] - 23:19,	216 [2] - 150:8,	5
	14 [1] - 92:28	25:19, 26:12, 27:28,	150:10	
	14/11/06 [1] - 123:7	29:23, 31:24, 32:12,	21st [4] - 53:8, 90:29,	
'05 [3] - 30:2, 91:22,	14th [37] - 39:29,	32:17, 91:9, 91:14,	107:22, 150:8	5 [2] - 90:23, 92:5
96:21	40:10, 40:18, 40:21,	112:26, 124:16, 140:7	22nd [12] - 30:2,	510 [1] - 73:10
'06 [5] - 38:8, 39:29,	40:22, 40:24, 41:1,	2006 [39] - 32:21,	45:21, 76:7, 76:14,	525 [1] - 73:14
76:26, 79:24, 155:10	41:11, 41:28, 44:17,	32:23, 33:25, 33:29,	76:26, 104:27,	59 [2] - 6:22, 6:28
'07 [8] - 136:6,	45:9, 45:10, 45:24,	35:14, 35:18, 36:7,	115:22, 118:14,	5:00pm [1] - 115:2
143:15, 163:4,	46:4, 46:14, 48:14,	37:20, 38:12, 38:27,	119:7, 131:15,	
163:28, 175:11,	49:23, 62:22, 64:15,	38:29, 40:3, 40:10,	135:16, 159:29	6
175:19, 176:5, 176:12 '08 [1] - 163:28	64:17, 64:26, 86:8,	40:13, 40:22, 70:26,	24-hour [1] - 179:21	
'09 [3] - 143:27,	99:22, 105:26,	75:14, 76:7, 83:14,	24th [1] - 23:13	6 [2] - 5:4, 90:26
169:23, 173:7	117:20, 121:7, 122:9,	86:9, 90:3, 90:29,	25-page [4] - 167:25,	62 [2] - 10:7, 10:9
'apart [1] - 140:18	124:20, 125:26,	99:22, 104:28,	168:1, 170:20, 171:2	657 [1] - 54:8
'at [2] - 140:2, 154:25	125:27, 126:2, 138:25, 154:24,	113:21, 114:13, 117:14, 117:29,	25/08/2005 [2] -	661 [1] - 54:10
'in [2] - 139:17,	160:22, 161:10, 176:5	124:17, 131:15,	26:24, 27:13	6703 [1] - 14:27
140:14	15 [2] - 119:11,	138:25, 154:9, 155:3,	25th [2] - 26:12,	6753 [1] - 15:4
'is [1] - 44:3	148:16	155:21, 175:13,	29:23	6755 [3] - 15:4, 15:7,
'it [1] - 144:16	15th [2] - 113:7,	176:3, 180:14,	26th [2] - 30:4, 137:27	15:24
'of [1] - 155:19	163:12	180:19, 184:6	137:27 27th [3] - 27:28,	6769 [1] - 175:7
'on [1] - 172:23	16 [4] - 1:4, 29:26,	2007 [17] - 86:24,	2/tn [3] - 27:28, 33:25, 38:26	6th [3] - 79:24,
'there [1] - 137:16	73:15, 73:17	94:8, 113:21, 137:11,	29th [4] - 73:13,	81:23, 90:3
11010[i] 107.10	16-page [2] - 84:8,	137:27, 141:16,	165:13, 167:21,	
1	140:9	144:11, 150:8,	169:19	7
	162 [1] - 1:17	150:20, 162:13,	2nd [6] - 94:7, 94:8,	
	16th [5] - 81:27,	163:10, 172:19,	137:8, 137:11,	7 (5) 1.0 0.20 01.0
1 [1] - 90:3	173:6, 175:19, 176:3,	174:12, 176:7,	143:15, 144:11	7 [5] - 1:8, 2:30, 91:2, 91:18, 151:18
10 [2] - 92:13, 148:16	176:7	179:18, 180:14, 184:7	2sst [1] - 23:2	74 [1] - 10:17
10:00 [1] - 54:13	17 [2] - 1:8, 138:21	2008 [13] - 71:21,		74 [i] - 10.17 741 [2] - 122:13,
10:30 [1] - 185:4	1710 [1] - 29:18	73:14, 73:16, 129:8,	3	122:14
10th [2] - 22:10,	1737 [2] - 37:17,	129:9, 132:16, 136:6,		75 [1] - 11:27
169:23	37:18	166:28, 167:4,		78 [1] - 13:13
11 [3] - 92:17,	1740 [1] - 38:2	167:22, 168:20,	3 [4] - 15:7, 15:24,	1
129:26, 130:2	1740 [1] - 38:2 17th [3] - 81:24,	178:25	15:26, 90:14	79 [1] - 14:2
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29,		178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8,
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8,
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15,
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25,	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15,	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25,	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20,	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] -	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25,	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15,
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18, 133:20, 133:23,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7 1st [3] - 91:13, 91:22,	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 51:13, 52:1, 67:13,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10 42 [1] - 23:21	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22 860 [1] - 83:2
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18, 133:20, 133:23, 133:27, 134:13,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 51:13, 52:1, 67:13, 69:5, 71:10, 71:11,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10 42 [1] - 23:21 4262 [1] - 19:1	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22 860 [1] - 83:2 882 [1] - 104:23
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18, 133:20, 133:23, 133:27, 134:13, 134:15, 139:28,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7 1st [3] - 91:13, 91:22, 163:4	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 51:13, 52:1, 67:13, 69:5, 71:10, 71:11, 71:16, 72:18, 75:13,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10 42 [1] - 23:21 4262 [1] - 19:1 45 [2] - 42:14, 43:13	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22 860 [1] - 83:2 882 [1] - 104:23 890 [1] - 94:4
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18, 133:20, 133:23, 133:27, 134:13, 134:15, 139:28, 161:19 12:06 [1] - 26:25 13 [2] - 3:7, 92:25	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7 1st [3] - 91:13, 91:22,	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 51:13, 52:1, 67:13, 69:5, 71:10, 71:11, 71:16, 72:18, 75:13, 88:13, 91:9, 107:16,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10 42 [1] - 23:21 4262 [1] - 19:1 45 [2] - 42:14, 43:13 46 [2] - 27:23, 30:2	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22 860 [1] - 83:2 882 [1] - 104:23 890 [1] - 94:4 8th [2] - 163:7, 168:9
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18, 133:20, 133:23, 133:27, 134:13, 134:15, 139:28, 161:19 12:06 [1] - 26:25 13 [2] - 3:7, 92:25 130 [1] - 2:14	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7 1st [3] - 91:13, 91:22, 163:4	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 51:13, 52:1, 67:13, 69:5, 71:10, 71:11, 71:16, 72:18, 75:13, 88:13, 91:9, 107:16, 123:3, 154:9, 155:2,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10 42 [1] - 23:21 4262 [1] - 19:1 45 [2] - 42:14, 43:13 46 [2] - 27:23, 30:2 4th [3] - 140:6,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22 860 [1] - 83:2 882 [1] - 104:23 890 [1] - 94:4
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18, 133:20, 133:23, 133:27, 134:13, 134:15, 139:28, 161:19 12:06 [1] - 26:25 13 [2] - 3:7, 92:25 130 [1] - 2:14 1331 [1] - 174:10	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7 1st [3] - 91:13, 91:22, 163:4	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 51:13, 52:1, 67:13, 69:5, 71:10, 71:11, 71:16, 72:18, 75:13, 88:13, 91:9, 107:16, 123:3, 154:9, 155:2, 155:10, 155:21,	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10 42 [1] - 23:21 4262 [1] - 19:1 45 [2] - 42:14, 43:13 46 [2] - 27:23, 30:2	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22 860 [1] - 83:2 882 [1] - 104:23 890 [1] - 94:4 8th [2] - 163:7, 168:9
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18, 133:20, 133:23, 133:27, 134:13, 134:15, 139:28, 161:19 12:06 [1] - 26:25 13 [2] - 3:7, 92:25 130 [1] - 2:14 1331 [1] - 174:10 1358 [2] - 178:6,	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7 1st [3] - 91:13, 91:22, 163:4	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 51:13, 52:1, 67:13, 69:5, 71:10, 71:11, 71:16, 72:18, 75:13, 88:13, 91:9, 107:16, 123:3, 154:9, 155:2, 155:10, 155:21, 171:24 21 [1] - 5:5 2106 [1] - 150:12	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10 42 [1] - 23:21 4262 [1] - 19:1 45 [2] - 42:14, 43:13 46 [2] - 27:23, 30:2 4th [3] - 140:6,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22 860 [1] - 83:2 882 [1] - 104:23 890 [1] - 94:4 8th [2] - 163:7, 168:9
129:26, 130:2 11.37 [2] - 14:29, 17:24 11.37" [1] - 15:11 11:00am [1] - 54:14 11th [16] - 35:18, 36:5, 36:7, 36:21, 36:24, 40:2, 40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 89:23, 169:25, 169:26, 180:19 12 [1] - 92:21 12-page [11] - 122:20, 130:14, 130:16, 130:18, 133:20, 133:23, 133:27, 134:13, 134:15, 139:28, 161:19 12:06 [1] - 26:25 13 [2] - 3:7, 92:25 130 [1] - 2:14 1331 [1] - 174:10	17th [3] - 81:24, 83:14, 84:7 18th [1] - 38:28 19-page [1] - 84:9 1921 [1] - 1:8 1989 [1] - 144:14 1993 [1] - 92:6 1997 [1] - 29:27 1999 [1] - 23:22 19th [10] - 24:25, 45:22, 49:28, 107:15, 114:7, 114:25, 115:22, 150:20, 172:19, 174:14 1:15 [2] - 107:25, 109:18 1ST [1] - 4:7 1st [3] - 91:13, 91:22, 163:4	178:25 2009 [6] - 14:18, 143:24, 169:10, 171:18, 173:16 2011 [1] - 89:23 2012 [6] - 14:5, 14:21, 113:17, 114:12, 114:18, 117:12 2014 [1] - 1:2 2017 [2] - 1:4, 1:8 2018 [1] - 1:8 2022 [4] - 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, 185:3 20th [22] - 32:17, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 51:13, 52:1, 67:13, 69:5, 71:10, 71:11, 71:16, 72:18, 75:13, 88:13, 91:9, 107:16, 123:3, 154:9, 155:2, 155:10, 155:21, 171:24 21 [1] - 5:5	15:26, 90:14 30 [3] - 42:8, 42:10, 43:13 30th [3] - 167:27, 173:8, 173:13 32 [1] - 2:29 37 [1] - 15:13 3rd [5] - 143:24, 143:27, 171:18, 172:5, 173:16 4 4 [2] - 26:19, 90:20 4/1/2005 [1] - 26:22 4/3/08 [1] - 178:27 40 [2] - 42:8, 42:10 42 [1] - 23:21 4262 [1] - 19:1 45 [2] - 42:14, 43:13 46 [2] - 27:23, 30:2 4th [3] - 140:6,	79 [1] - 14:2 7th [5] - 35:25, 36:8, 38:12, 38:24, 40:18 7TH [2] - 1:17, 6:1 8 8 [6] - 2:15, 2:23, 92:5, 144:13, 151:15, 151:27 821 [1] - 137:4 824 [1] - 137:4 825 [1] - 139:7 8457 [1] - 27:20 856 [4] - 89:15, 89:16, 89:17, 89:22 858 [1] - 89:22 860 [1] - 83:2 882 [1] - 104:23 890 [1] - 94:4 8th [2] - 163:7, 168:9

access [1] - 106:11 31:5, 31:10, 31:14, 178:12 annoy [1] - 44:1 9 accident [1] - 16:11 31:15, 31:20 AI [4] - 85:19, 136:1, annoyed [1] - 111:12 accidentally [1] addressed [1] -137:27, 159:14 answer [5] - 80:9, 9 [2] - 92:9, 172:20 101:26 29:21 **Alan** [2] - 92:28, 103:1, 103:6, 103:10, 907 [1] - 143:25 accompanied [2] addressing [3] -112.16 159:15 908 [5] - 7:1, 143:21, 132:9, 132:10, 132:12 22:10. 32:2 alert [4] - 31:1, 31:7, answered [2] -144:2, 152:3, 152:6 ADJOURNED [2] -163:19, 169:8 accompany [1] -87:28 923 [1] - 154:4 107:10, 185:3 alerted [1] - 30:22 answering [1] -968 [1] - 172:2 administrative [2] accordance [4] alia [2] - 154:25, 99:15 9th [1] - 168:20 13:18. 13:22 172.23 21:11, 32:18, 144:13, answers [2] - 131:2, admissible [1] alive [1] - 178:14 170:1 167:6 Α accorded [2] - 170:8, 122:24 allegation [12] antecedents [1] -170:10 admit [4] - 32:7, 12:29, 24:12, 45:15, 184:3 according [3] -97:14, 137:20, 139:16 85:11, 85:17, 88:25, anxious [9] - 28:25, A's [2] - 38:25, 47:17 79:12, 79:13, 161:6 admitted [1] - 143:3 106:6, 143:21, 33:16, 56:20, 70:21, **A.M** [1] - 185:4 admittedly [1] -144:25, 147:4, 152:5, 130:16. 163:2. account [13] - 8:11, A/c [1] - 137:27 153:24 175:12, 175:26, 16:7, 75:25, 75:26, A/C [1] - 165:14 75:28, 122:3, 126:17, adopted [1] - 180:19 allegations [9] -176:21 abducting [1] - 27:24 11:19, 84:12, 142:19, 126:23, 126:25, Adrian [1] - 91:29 anyhow [1] - 77:18 abduction [38] -166:17, 170:24, 127:28, 167:20, **Anyway** [2] - 104:1, advance [1] - 165:1 23:26, 24:6, 24:11, 168:26, 168:28 171:7, 171:22, advancing[1] -182:23 30:3, 34:21, 35:29, accurate [1] - 83:23 54:20 172:10, 173:3 anyway [10] - 21:2, 36:2, 42:25, 47:15, accusation [1] allege [1] - 85:14 25:23, 66:11, 77:15, advice [9] - 16:24, 48:23, 52:27, 54:22, alleged [7] - 131:26, 152:29 16:27, 17:5, 17:20, 79:22, 104:14, 54:28, 55:3, 58:8, 136:12, 143:17, 127:16, 165:19, accuse [1] - 88:14 17:25, 18:7, 18:20, 59:6. 61:9. 61:19. 144:15, 150:26, 176:24, 184:15 accused [1] - 38:12 181.2 74:25, 83:8, 108:4, acknowledge [2] advices [3] - 16:6, 161:15, 161:16 **AOIFE** [1] - 2:13 108:10, 112:9, 45:5, 172:4 16:8, 165:15 alleging [1] - 145:28 apart [2] - 47:15, 112:18, 112:25, alleviate [2] - 75:15, acknowledged [2] advised [4] - 41:5, 61:20 113:23, 114:23, 75:20 apologies [1] - 47:29 58:17, 139:27 121:28, 122:28, 114:28, 114:29, allocate [2] - 64:1, 155:21 apparent [4] acknowledgment [1] 115:3, 116:17, - 180:5 advising [1] - 9:16 74:10 121:23, 139:12, 138:15, 140:8, 145:3, allow [2] - 27:5, 142:9, 142:22 Act [4] - 23:22, advisors [1] - 153:14 171:10, 171:14, 29:27, 92:6, 100:3 affecting [1] - 12:4 166:2 **APPEAL**[2] - 1:12, 177:20, 183:13 **allude** [1] - 98:2 ACT [2] - 1:2, 1:7 aforementioned [1] able [5] - 20:18, almost [1] - 166:10 act [4] - 33:22, 97:24, 180.2 Appeal [1] - 92:14 25:11, 56:11, 56:12, appear [7] - 36:1, 127:20. 138:22 alone [2] - 8:3, 56:25 afraid [1] - 55:9 175:11 am.. [1] - 183:20 Acting [1] - 91:4 afternoon [1] -105:21, 134:27, above-named [1] ambit [3] - 168:5, 166:18, 172:28, acting [1] - 17:18 113:13 action [5] - 1:26, 180:9, 181:6 169:15, 171:1 afterwards [3] absence [9] - 10:21, **Ambrose** [6] - 34:5, appearance [1] -10:26, 146:29, 158:8, 49:29, 113:16, 161:1 13:27, 16:20, 16:22, 34:8, 109:29, 110:5, 41:24 177.22 aggressive [2] -105:4, 105:23, actions [3] - 82:25, 28:6, 28:11 110:7, 113:7 APPEARANCES[1] -105:26, 140:11 83:20, 139:18 agitated [2] - 56:18, ameliorate [1] -2:1 absences [1] - 14:10 actively [2] - 7:16, 56:27 147.12 appeared [5] - 72:4, absolutely [14] -86:7, 100:22, 130:17, **ago** [1] - 13:4 **AMENDED**[1] - 1:8 8.20 16:27, 44:7, 44:19, 161.12 amending [1] - 173:9 activities [1] - 47:17 agree [23] - 50:10, 44:20, 44:21, 45:19, appended [1] - 138:3 amendments [2] acts [1] - 33:1 50:26, 61:7, 68:26, 57:2, 119:25, 120:20, 173:10, 173:14 appends [1] - 58:2 actual [11] - 67:29, 81:12, 93:3, 93:26, 121:27, 137:1, 80:22, 82:4, 109:11, 93:27, 95:28, 100:19, amount [2] - 93:7, application [5] -166:28, 182:1, 182:16 28:16, 32:3, 67:11, 112:10, 114:2, 105:13, 131:2, 141:2, 134:23 accept [12] - 52:13, 67:16, 151:7 114:14, 151:1, 153:9, 145:25, 158:11, **AN**[1] - 2:18 59:17, 99:4, 110:13, 160:28, 170:16 158:12, 158:27, ancillary [1] - 74:28 applied [1] - 31:24 127:12, 135:25, 161:24, 163:1, applies [1] - 100:26 add [3] - 134:6, **AND** [5] - 1:2, 1:3, 135:26, 136:25, 134:10, 134:16 166:20, 170:29, 1:7, 4:17, 107:10 apply [1] - 4:18 143:2, 145:13, 159:8, 173:5, 173:27 added [1] - 20:4 ANDREW [1] - 2:27 **applying** [2] - 32:29, 163:2

agreement [1] -

agreed [5] - 54:17,

61:19, 111:5, 120:24,

123:2

addition [1] - 7:5

29:5. 29:11. 30:9.

30:27, 31:2, 31:4,

address [12] - 20:8,

accepted [5] - 7:18,

accepting [2] - 43:8

9:23, 95:12, 100:15,

136:20

36:18

appointed [5] -

143:16, 144:12

79:23, 81:23, 112:2,

anger [2] - 53:21,

angry [2] - 53:23,

110:18

111:12

appointment [6] -41:12, 122:18, 123:3, 149:24, 175:22, 175:24 appraisal [1] - 22:22 appreciate [7] - 9:14, 47:22, 79:6, 114:21, 149:19, 182:9 apprised [1] - 154:29 approach [8] - 25:8, 32:11, 79:5, 93:25, 112:6, 147:15, 162:12, 183:3 approached [1] -35.4 appropriate [5] -18:19, 29:12, 29:15, 99:2, 177:10 appropriately [1] -27:25 April [8] - 86:23, 165:9, 165:13, 171:18, 171:24, 173:6, 173:9, 173:13 area [1] - 106:28 argue [1] - 182:16 argument [1] -104:12 arise [1] - 181:4 arising [10] - 6:19, 7:3, 7:24, 49:19, 71:5, 102:14, 103:20, 168:15, 170:24, 184:20 arose [2] - 70:25, 168:3 ARRAN[1] - 2:29 arrange [1] - 21:3 arranged [2] - 24:20, 40:27 arrangement [2] -118:21, 118:22 arrangements [1] -32:12 **arranging** [1] - 39:11 arrest [3] - 22:28, 23:22, 29:6 arrested [4] - 23:11, 24:1, 24:5, 33:29 arrive [2] - 21:4, 87:10 arrived [16] - 21:7, 41:28, 70:29, 71:8, 87:17, 114:15, 142:14, 156:13, 156:15, 156:17, 156:26, 156:28, 157:28, 158:24, 175:1, 175:3

arriving [1] - 16:8

arson [11] - 33:26, 34:1, 34:6, 34:8, 34:12, 34:28, 35:15, 38:26, 38:28, 39:7, 154:15 article [1] - 37:1 AS [6] - 1:8, 6:1, 6:13, 21:16, 107:10, 185.4 ascertain [3] - 77:1, 162:10, 164:1 aside [2] - 74:19, 170:5 aspect [2] - 43:16, 81.19 assassination [2] -71:9. 179:19 assaults [1] - 96:22 assemble [1] -103:26 assembled [2] -20:16, 60:11 assert [1] - 24:16 asserting [1] - 10:3 assertion [1] - 85:9 assertions [3] -52:18, 52:22 assess [1] - 103:27 assessed [1] - 52:20 assessment[11] -16:13, 78:28, 79:2, 79:4, 98:9, 102:12, 105:15, 143:13, 156:25, 160:13, 175:16 assessments [1] -97:8 assiduous [1] assist [8] - 17:19, 26:28, 30:29, 36:20, 39:25, 59:9, 62:5, 90:11 assistance [4] -10:12. 59:23. 60:29. 61:24 Assistant [45] - 6:17, 7:8, 7:28, 11:14, 11:15, 11:23, 12:25, 12:28, 13:10, 14:9, 14:14, 14:15, 14:17,

14:18, 14:20, 14:22,

14:24, 15:3, 16:6,

17:2, 17:12, 18:1,

19:4, 85:19, 90:4,

104:24, 120:8,

120:13, 136:1,

136:10, 141:15,

144:11, 146:28,

150:3, 150:20, 154:5,

167:28, 172:4, 173:18. 179:9 assistant [2] - 9:14, 17:8 ASSISTANT[1] -2:25 assisted [5] - 28:17, 28:19, 112:9, 112:17, 162:28 associated [1] -54:29 assuming [2] -157:6, 157:8 assure [1] - 52:26 attached [1] - 116:15 attack [15] - 33:26, 34:1, 34:7, 34:8, 34:12, 34:22, 35:13, 35:15, 38:26, 38:28, 39:7, 39:8, 39:11, 154:17, 154:18 attacks [1] - 154:15 attend [9] - 22:26, 59:1, 59:14, 59:25, 60:7, 60:22, 61:5, 163:4, 163:8 attendance [1] -60:14 attending [2] - 59:16, 59:28 attention [19] -37:10, 48:25, 50:19, 51:8, 52:3, 52:20, 52:24, 56:15, 58:27, 60:28, 63:1, 63:8, 71:2, 86:20, 99:21, 103:4, 104:29, 117:15, 121:24 attire [1] - 56:25 attribute [3] - 63:11, 64:23, 75:27 attributed [1] - 52:9 August [12] - 25:20, 25:24, 26:12, 27:28, 29:23, 30:2, 30:4, 35:14, 38:29, 39:29, 41:20, 150:8 authorities [6] -51:8, 52:3, 58:28, 59:7, 109:28, 142:1 authority [3] -110:18, 112:7, 118:2 autumn [1] - 163:10 avail [2] - 11:9, 73:8 available [17] -20:19, 31:5, 59:6, 59:10, 59:20, 60:12,

159:13, 161:24,

162:2, 165:14,

96:28, 99:13, 106:11, 119:20, 137:17, 139:13, 142:10, 142:26 availing [1] - 34:16 avoid [6] - 62:1, 62:2, 142:5, 144:22, 145:21, 150:28 avoidance [2] -135:21, 172:16 aware [45] - 11:9, 23:13, 24:14, 24:15, 24:26, 30:26, 31:7, 32:29, 34:4, 34:6, 34:11, 34:12, 35:3, 35:12, 37:3, 47:2, 47:26, 53:29, 54:21, 63:9. 63:14. 63:28. 69:2, 74:9, 81:28, 84:22, 95:2, 96:20, 96:25, 98:12, 106:28, 113:6. 141:13. 141:17, 142:7, 145:19, 147:6, 147:22, 151:13, 155:19, 161:22, 161:29, 169:10, 177:2, 179:25

В

backdrop [2] - 171:9,

171:13 background [5] -137:28, 170:22, 183:18, 184:18, 184:22 bad [1] - 56:2 baggage [2] - 87:13, 87:15 Baiba [129] - 22:1, 22:3, 23:10, 28:24, 30:8, 31:12, 31:29, 32:14, 38:25, 38:27, 39:28, 41:10, 43:11, 44:17, 46:3, 46:5, 48:18, 49:14, 53:15, 54:23, 56:29, 57:12, 58:6, 60:26, 61:10, 61:21. 63:14. 63:29. 65:20, 65:21, 65:25, 70:26, 71:4, 71:12, 72:1, 72:15, 72:23, 72:26, 74:9, 74:29, 75:2, 75:9, 77:3, 77:6, 79:7, 80:28, 83:25, 84:2, 84:20, 85:13, 85:27, 86:1, 86:3, 86:4, 86:8, 87:5, 88:23, 88:29, 90:8,

91:8, 91:21, 92:10, 92:23, 92:25, 93:1, 93:12, 93:22, 94:13, 95:10, 96:5, 96:10, 96:14, 96:29, 97:7, 97:12, 97:14, 98:3, 99:21, 100:1, 100:22, 100:25, 102:5, 102:16, 102:23, 103:17, 105:4, 105:24, 106:12, 108:13, 109:4, 112:29, 121:7, 125:24, 126:2, 128:1, 128:11, 128:24, 133:14, 134:9, 134:19, 136:13, 137:13, 137:18, 137:19, 138:8, 139:14, 139:29, 141:12, 142:11, 143:12, 144:18, 144:21, 144:29, 145:16, 147:1, 149:7, 152:10. 152:16. 154:14, 155:20, 156:1, 160:22, 161:9, 167:19, 177:8, 177:18, 180:17, 180:22, 180:24 Baiba's [9] - 34:9, 47:14, 70:26, 76:4, 76:11, 102:23, 108:24, 170:26, 181:5 bail [13] - 28:16, 31:25, 32:3, 32:7, 32:18, 67:11, 67:16, 67:17, 67:20, 67:21, 67:25, 67:29, 68:3 balanced [5] - 158:8, 158:15, 159:1, 159:5, 159.9 BAR [1] - 3:8 barring [1] - 22:4 **barristers** [1] - 6:17 based [2] - 16:10, 152:22 basis [9] - 21:3, 22:6, 58:18, 92:7, 102:1, 102:12, 152:23, 157:4, 181:25 bearing [2] - 29:22, beating [1] - 160:5 became [7] - 23:13, 24:26, 33:23, 35:3, 37:3, 111:7, 117:12 **beg** [7] - 62:18, 69:11, 82:27, 84:16,

128:7, 131:4, 175:23

79:1, 96:9, 96:13,

begin [1] - 21:21 beginning [1] - 27:3 behalf [3] - 66:15, 122:3, 145:28 behest [1] - 123:10 behind [6] - 8:25, 71:13, 85:16, 149:10, 162:24, 172:23 belief [2] - 43:7, 53:26 believes [1] - 172:16 bells [1] - 91:23 below [1] - 151:24 best [2] - 130:27, 177:22 **better** [6] - 101:7, 101:12, 127:15, 157:3, 160:1, 178:23 between [23] - 12:15, 18:1, 34:19, 34:21, 39:28, 41:19, 41:20, 43:12, 43:13, 54:13, 59:24, 63:10, 68:24, 70:14, 118:22, 132:12, 162:18, 162:21, 163:26, 171:26, 172:17, 173:2, 181:4 big [1] - 48:4 biggest [1] - 79:17 bit [17] - 6:25, 21:29, 30:11, 37:23, 38:21, 43:2, 58:4, 60:20, 73:25, 94:7, 123:28, 124:16, 132:8, 144:8, 155:15, 157:3, 183:15 bits [3] - 56:10, 56:11, 56:21 **BL** [8] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:11, 2:19, 2:19, 2:20, 2:26, 3:5 blame [2] - 111:14, 182:14 **blamed** [1] - 182:18 **blaming** [8] - 140:4, 154:26, 177:6, 177:14, 177:15, 177:17, 177:18, 177:26 blank [4] - 27:23, 30:9, 39:12, 83:8 blank] [1] - 29:7 blank]" [1] - 29:25 blanked [1] - 27:25 **blunt** [1] - 164:12 board [2] - 153:22, 153:24 **bold** [1] - 15:20 bombshell [9] - 78:7, 78:12, 80:20, 86:13,

88:4, 134:25, 135:10, 135:14 **bone** [1] - 33:23 **book** [4] - 26:18, 26:24, 112:23, 112:24 boots [1] - 61:2 bore [2] - 25:13, 32:11 borne [1] - 154:28 **borrow** [1] - 80:20 bottom [12] - 15:9, 19:3, 50:25, 73:17, 73:25, 94:5, 103:15, 104:27, 123:6, 125:3, 178:27 **bound** [1] - 116:18 box [1] - 27:17 brain [4] - 53:16, 108:14, 108:29, 109:8 branch [1] - 126:10 breach [10] - 143:17, 144:15, 147:12, 149:27, 149:29, 151:22, 151:28, 152:2, 160:23, 173:29 breaches [1] - 29:26 break [2] - 107:2 breaks [3] - 50:8, 136:4, 152:4 breath [1] - 28:4 Bridewell [3] - 25:26, 26:8. 28:16 brief [3] - 54:27, 95:1, 152:26 briefings [1] - 82:23 **bring** [13] - 10:3, 21:25, 24:21, 47:1, 51:7, 52:3, 58:27, 60:27, 68:23, 86:20, 107:13, 163:21, 174:4 bringing [5] - 12:4, 43:23, 123:21, 126:9, 179:23 broadly [3] - 22:21, 35:27, 62:16 brought [14] - 21:22, 24:2. 24:19. 25:25. 50:19, 52:23, 63:1, 63:7, 68:19, 71:1, 111:28, 117:15, 165:11, 174:5 browsed [1] - 84:18 Bryan [1] - 22:13 building [1] - 143:7 bulletin [2] - 35:10 bullied [1] - 171:16 bullying [9] - 168:2,

170:24, 171:7.

171:21, 171:26,

172:10, 173:2, 184:5,

184:20
BURKE [1] - 2:21
burning [1] - 72:18
burnt [1] - 39:29
burst [4] - 119:21,
120:4, 120:16, 130:7
business [1] 163:22
BY [12] - 1:3, 1:6,
2:12, 2:21, 2:27, 3:6,
5:4, 5:5, 6:12, 7:21,
21:16
Byrne [1] - 90:15

C

C/S [1] - 139:9 cafe [1] - 57:4 Campbell [4] - 92:28, 112:16, 112:22, 140:19 cannot [1] - 56:24 canvass [1] - 172:27 car [9] - 33:18, 34:9, 34:10, 35:13, 35:15, 38:27, 39:28, 67:23, 113:1 card [3] - 43:26, 86:12, 123:22 careful [3] - 46:3, 46:5, 181:29 carried [6] - 104:15, 139:21, 141:3, 143:9, 144:4. 158:6 carries [2] - 83:13, 94:6 carry [6] - 85:26, 90:5, 136:21, 146:11, 165:17, 177:10 carrying [3] - 83:18, 136:18, 170:17 cars [2] - 31:3, 38:18 case [40] - 10:20, 12:9, 21:28, 23:14, 23:18, 33:8, 34:28, 38:16, 39:16, 44:16, 47:15, 48:23, 55:3, 56:16, 58:8, 59:6, 65:22, 68:7, 75:22, 75:24, 77:24, 80:25, 96:22, 99:17, 103:5, 112:20, 122:1, 128:28, 132:2, 135:25, 141:21, 141:24, 147:20, 159:15, 167:7, 171:10, 171:15, 171:26, 173:29,

casual [4] - 43:18, 43:21, 43:22, 126:6 casually [1] - 49:4 catch [1] - 32:27 caused [3] - 62:12, 62:21, 145:29 cells [1] - 28:21 censure [1] - 11:20 central [3] - 55:2, 75:22, 79:2 centrally [4] - 35:28, 61:8, 61:18, 74:24 **CERTAIN**[1] - 1:2 certain [7] - 20:12, 46:11, 87:3, 88:18, 131:14, 132:1, 132:23 certainly [11] - 19:19, 23:10, 32:25, 44:24, 47:6, 96:8, 110:5, 112:4, 137:16, 149:13, 159:29 certify [1] - 1:23 cetera [2] - 28:21, 61:3 chain [2] - 85:21, 160:5 Chairman [38] - 6:8, 6:14, 6:27, 15:25, 19:13, 19:15, 19:25, 20:25, 21:18, 27:14, 27:16, 30:29, 47:29, 48:5, 60:22, 77:22, 78:4, 78:13, 79:9, 79:21, 99:12, 100:16, 101:29, 104:19, 107:4, 114:22, 115:9, 132:28, 133:3, 133:6, 153:28, 154:3, 156:13, 178:6, 178:18, 178:25, 183:10, 184:28 CHAIRMAN[154] -1:11, 6:4, 6:6, 6:10, 6:24, 6:28, 15:23, 15:26, 15:29, 19:11, 19:14, 19:19, 19:27, 20:6, 20:11, 20:16, 20:26, 21:7, 26:18, 26:23, 26:29, 27:5, 27:8, 27:10, 27:13, 27:15. 31:9. 31:14. 31:19, 31:22, 38:1, 38:3, 47:20, 47:25, 48:1. 77:16. 77:20. 77:24, 77:27, 78:1, 78:5, 78:16, 78:21, 78:27, 79:5, 79:10, 79:13, 79:15, 79:22,

cases [1] - 92:19

CASTLE[1] - 1:16

79:25, 80:8, 89:16, 89:18, 99:10, 99:15, 99:23, 99:25, 99:27, 100:6, 100:14, 100:17, 100:20, 100:24, 100:29, 101:4, 101:6, 101:10, 101:20, 102:17, 102:25, 103:6, 103:10, 103:13, 103:22, 103:24, 103:28, 104:1, 104:6, 104:20, 107:1, 107:6, 107:12, 114:28, 115:1, 115:6, 115:10, 131:16, 131:23, 132:8, 132:23, 132:29, 133:4, 133:7, 147:25, 147:27, 147:29, 148:3, 148:7, 148:10, 148:24, 148:27, 149:12, 149:14, 149:19, 149:22, 150:10, 150:12. 150:15. 151:6, 151:12, 152:25, 154:1, 156:12, 156:17, 156:21, 156:23, 156:27, 157:2, 157:6, 157:12, 157:14, 157:22, 159:5, 159:8, 162:15. 164:22. 164:24, 164:29, 165:3, 165:5, 165:8, 173:24, 178:3, 178:7, 178:12, 178:16, 178:19, 178:22, 179:2, 179:6, 179:10, 179:12, 179:13, 180.7 181.15 181:18, 181:22, 183:8, 183:18, 183:22, 184:14, 184:17, 184:27, 184:29 Chairman's [3] -80:20, 133:10, 148:21 **chance** [1] - 109:3 changed [2] - 43:26, 123:22 chapter [1] - 96:21 **character** [1] - 55:4 characterisation [1] - 145:10 characters [2] -54:28, 55:5 charge [8] - 23:14, 54:21, 97:27, 145:7, 145:26, 146:12,

177:20

147:19, 152:20 circuit [1] - 42:19 150:26, 172:16, 11:23, 12:25, 12:28, 138:17 charged [3] - 25:25, circulate [1] - 19:29 172:21, 172:24 13:10, 14:9, 14:14, compiling [1] - 103:9 27:23, 30:1 circulated [4] client's [2] - 120:24, 14:15, 14:17, 14:18, complained [2] -19:17, 19:28, 20:13, 14:21, 14:22, 14:24, charges [2] - 138:21, 24:15, 57:14 172:23 146.27 closer [1] - 6:25 15:3, 16:6, 17:3, complaint [39] -26:10 17:13, 18:1, 18:4, Charlton [1] - 10:8 circumstances [9] -Cloverhill [2] - 24:3, 24:27, 25:15, 44:23, CHEALLACHÁI[1] -19:5, 78:26, 84:21, 45:2, 45:9, 47:13, 7:10, 46:15, 100:4, 85:15, 85:19, 85:20, 114:10, 142:3, 158:9, CMO [25] - 9:14, 47:19, 48:9, 48:11, 90:4, 104:24, 119:19, 48:15, 48:20, 48:28, check [3] - 20:2, 176:28, 177:2, 179:29 9:19, 13:5, 16:7, 120:3, 120:8, 120:12, 48:29, 49:6, 57:22, civil [1] - 76:18 16:13, 17:5, 17:7, 169:6, 176:11 Chief [35] - 19:6, civilian [1] - 56:25 17:14, 17:16, 17:19, 120:13, 120:14, 65:14, 83:28, 84:5, 120:22, 128:9, 130:6, 37:8, 89:25, 89:29, claim [18] - 33:9, 18:20, 163:29, 94:29, 101:6, 105:4, 136:1, 136:10, 90:3, 90:10, 93:9, 63:12, 64:5, 68:16, 164:20, 165:16, 105:7, 105:23, 141:15, 143:16, 105:27, 105:28, 165:18, 165:23, 104:24, 136:2, 71:14, 72:17, 77:10, 144:11, 146:28, 118:3, 124:11, 166:11, 166:13, 136:21, 137:2, 137:4, 82:8, 82:14, 85:22, 146:29, 150:3, 166:16, 174:4, 179:9 124:14, 125:14, 139:5, 140:29, 86:12, 86:21, 128:2, 150:21, 159:14, 125:16, 125:18, 141:14, 141:20, 129:13, 129:23, CMO's [7] - 16:24, 159:15, 161:24, 125:20, 125:28, 143:15, 143:22, 16:27, 17:25, 18:7, 134:23, 135:22, 136:7 162:2, 167:28, 162:19, 162:22, 126:5, 126:11, 150:6, 144:12, 146:11, claimed [2] - 84:27, 167:29, 172:4, 173:18 166:19 161:26, 170:4, 170:19 146:16, 152:3, 157:8, 179:28 commissioner [1] -157:18, 158:4, 158:7, Code [5] - 10:27, complaints [5] claiming [1] - 135:12 17.8 25:13, 47:16, 49:3, 158:28, 159:11, Clancy [3] - 14:15, 10:29, 11:6, 14:28, **COMMISSIONER** [2] 79:16, 99:17 160:14, 162:18, 15:11 14:17, 14:21 162:21, 165:9, - 2:17, 2:25 complete [2] - 9:13, code [1] - 15:13 clarification [5] -Commissioner's [14] 165:13, 173:17, 85:7, 146:16, 148:13, **coffee** [2] - 57:5 16:11 - 35:11, 37:2, 63:13, Completed [1] -173:22 171:28, 172:7 cognisance [1] -63:28, 63:29, 67:4, 89:24 **CHIEF** [1] - 2:22 clarified [2] - 113:21, 172:13 68:24, 68:29, 70:15, completed [2] chief [4] - 120:7, cold [1] - 180:4 148:18 74:8, 78:10, 79:29, 89:29, 95:25 128:18, 149:24, 157:7 colleague [4] - 26:3, clarify [3] - 133:9, 154:6. 165:14 completely [5] chief's [2] - 115:15, 58:20, 80:12, 143:4 168:15, 168:22 commissioners [1] -159:20 clarifying [1] -7:18, 9:22, 10:26, colleagues [7] -12:18, 48:2 **child** [13] - 47:15, 133:18 29:16, 31:1, 42:28, committed [1] -48:23, 58:8, 59:6, completing [1] class [1] - 111:21 48:8, 61:13, 75:5, 74.28 108:10, 112:9, 117:23 111.22 classification [2] committing [1] -112:23, 116:17, completion [1] collect [2] - 32:15, 15:8. 16:23 128:12 145:3, 171:9, 171:14, 92:29 classification" [1] common [9] - 25:7, 177:20, 183:13 complex [2] - 95:25, collected [2] - 20:17, 15:28 34:16, 34:24, 34:26, children [19] - 22:18, 100:7 clause [2] - 74:12, 114:5 23:27, 27:24, 28:24, 121:15, 121:17, collection [1] complexities [1] -74:21 136:23, 163:26, 30:9, 32:8, 32:13, 47:26 102:15 clear [27] - 17:4, 173:29 32:17, 33:13, 34:21, compliance [1] -31:17, 44:20, 44:21, **COLM** [1] - 2:10 commonsensical [1] 42:25, 43:24, 54:22, 45:19, 48:6, 58:20, coming [3] - 34:27, 12:2 - 58:23 83:8, 108:4, 138:15, comply [1] - 28:20 97:18, 97:23, 97:28, 40:23, 139:19 140:8, 179:24, 183:14 communicated [1] composed [1] - 40:9 command~[3] - 31:6,99:16, 119:24, 169:16 **choice** [1] - 181:13 79:2, 85:21 comprehensive [8] -119:25, 120:2, communication [4] chose [2] - 89:6, 55:4, 93:19, 93:20, 120:20, 131:16, commencement [3] 12:17, 89:20, 171:20, 95:5 131:17, 131:18, - 85:11, 146:10, 94:17, 94:20, 94:24, 180:5 Christopher [6] -103:3. 104:16 135:6, 135:12, 172:21 85:22, 89:20, 90:11, communications [4] conceding [1] -135:21, 142:16, commences [1] -- 12:14, 162:21, 90:14, 92:1, 94:6 167:11 146:25, 147:2, 182:1, 130:3 162:26, 164:10 **Christy** [1] - 72:7 183:24, 184:17 conceived [1] commencing [1] community [5] chronology [17] clear' [1] - 172:25 178:28 79:18 51:17, 54:15, 55:23, 32:24, 40:16, 72:22, concentrate [1] clearance [1] comment [1] - 55:25 69:6, 121:14 74:1, 81:28, 82:25, 127:10 157.24 commented [2] company [1] - 68:6 82:28, 83:7, 83:24, clearly [9] - 13:21, 96:6, 134:14 concentrating [1] -**COMPANY**[1] - 2:28 83:25, 93:29, 94:22, 18:7, 78:6, 98:25, comments [3] -113:29, 114:2, 116:2, compelling [1] -121:19, 133:1, 114:17, 114:18, concept [1] - 88:8 117:21, 162:6 140:24 137:20, 149:10, concern [12] - 43:29, 129:21 Circuit [4] - 33:19, 169:16 compile [1] - 112:23 44:3, 45:7, 45:12, Commissioner [58] -36:1, 38:11, 38:17 client [5] - 150:7, compiled [1] -45:13, 51:21, 52:1, 6:18, 7:9, 7:28, 11:15,

58:8, 62:21, 70:17, 156:10, 161:11 concerned [23] -18:15, 50:11, 50:13, 50:16, 50:17, 51:27, 52:16, 56:1, 58:18, 58:21, 58:24, 58:26, 65:4, 78:17, 93:15, 108:24, 108:28, 128:6, 154:16, 155:19, 159:26, 163:14, 181:18 concerning [2] -13:27, 77:3 concerns [16] - 10:9, 50:28, 62:8, 62:10, 64:13, 64:24, 64:26, 74:7, 75:15, 75:20, 84:21, 86:23, 140:5, 154:11, 155:1, 155:22 concise [2] - 167:5, 167:6 concluded [2] -103:2, 103:16 concludes [1] -137:15 conclusion [18] -24:21. 94:3. 94:10. 95:20, 98:6, 99:1, 106:22, 139:4, 139:11, 140:28, 142:7, 142:8, 142:14, 146:8, 156:24, 156:29, 157:10, 157:15 conclusions [8] -94:2, 97:29, 104:10, 106:2, 137:5, 138:29, 183:22 condemning [1] -99:1 condition [2] - 32:8, 122:29 conditions [1] - 57:8 **condone** [1] - 11:10 conduct [3] - 79:24, 106:21. 166:24 conducted [4] - 93:9, 102:3, 103:3, 164:10 conducting [1] -88:19 conduit [1] - 17:18 conference [24] -54:26, 55:10, 55:12, 55:13, 55:16, 55:17, 57:3, 59:2, 59:16, 59:19, 59:25, 59:28, 60:12, 60:14, 61:6, 61:24, 61:26, 61:28,

62:1, 62:2, 62:14,

63:7, 107:16 confidence [2] -44:6, 123:23 confident [1] - 44:7 confidential [6] -71:19, 71:22, 73:8, 93:10, 93:16, 129:5 confirmed [2] -153:5, 153:13 conflict [3] - 132:9, 132:12, 132:15 confused [3] - 59:29, 114:2, 114:3 conjecture [1] -149:18 conjunction [2] -151:1, 151:10 connected [2] -80:28, 112:20 connection [6] -4:14, 8:26, 34:17, 35:9, 168:13, 172:17 connections [2] -61:11, 179:26 Conor [1] - 92:26 Conroy [1] - 85:18 conscious [2] -60:21, 85:28 consider [3] - 28:10, 35:4, 48:1 considerable 131 -24:16, 157:19, 178:17 considerably [1] -25:17 consideration [2] -8:8. 140:21 considered [4] -92:9, 92:13, 92:17, 174:15 console [3] - 52:7, 52:10, 109:13 conspiracy [1] - 71:9 constant [1] - 75:4 constantly [1] -36:15 constitute [1] - 95:11 constructively [4] -7:20. 9:24. 9:26. 10:4 consultation [1] -175:14 consultations [1] -175:15 consulted [1] -149:18

contact [10] - 37:8,

67:19, 68:15, 69:13,

163:12, 163:15,

contacted [11] -

163:23

86:25, 107:23, 138:9,

40:28, 57:2, 60:7, 69:9, 69:12, 69:21, 69:25, 89:12, 90:14, 110:14, 119:12 contacting [1] -163:29 contacts [1] - 162:18 contained [5] - 12:9, 13:1, 13:6, 58:11, 91:11 contains [1] - 161:2 contempt [2] - 23:3, 24:4 content [3] - 10:13, 51:29, 138:3 contention [3] -33:23, 80:16, 82:18 contents [6] - 51:21, 58:25, 64:28, 65:13, 155:29, 160:21 contested [1] - 43:3 context [17] - 7:10, 21:25, 22:1, 33:16, 35:23, 41:9, 49:22, 70:22, 101:18, 101:20, 119:4, 144:9, 160:11, 179:15, 179:16, 180:12, 183:16 continue [2] - 9:11, continued [3] -24:14, 24:16, 30:14 continues 181 -38:21, 54:19, 55:18, 91:25, 95:8, 96:7, 123:19, 130:11 continuing [4] -36:12, 82:18, 136:6 contradict [1] - 33:9 contrary [1] - 140:12 contrast [1] - 93:7 contravention [1] -10:26 contribute [1] - 89:9 contribution [1] -81:21 control [2] - 31:6 controversial [4] -122:17, 124:15, 148:25, 160:16 convenient [3] -107:2, 107:4, 184:27 conversation [56] -43:19, 43:21, 43:22, 45:20, 46:7, 50:22, 51:23, 52:29, 53:9, 54:4, 54:7, 57:11, 59:12. 63:11. 68:16.

85:3, 88:7, 88:13, 109:16, 110:22, 111:3, 111:16, 111:29, 112:11, 112:15, 112:21, 113:2, 113:10, 113:23, 117:28, 118:5, 119:3, 121:9, 126:6, 130:19, 131:19, 131:25, 132:24, 133:21, 133:25, 134:2, 135:8, 135:17, 135:20, 135:23, 159:22, 160:21, 160:29, 161:9, 177:5, 183:11 conversations [10] -46:10, 54:4, 56:6, 80:14, 118:16, 118:18, 140:15, 161:15, 161:16, 161:17 converse [1] - 56:11 convey [1] - 133:11 conveyed [2] -68:20, 176:29 Coolock [8] - 29:22, 37:19, 38:7, 91:3, 91:7, 91:29, 138:18, 154:10 cooperating [1] -59.29 cooperation [2] -30:14, 59:22 coordination [4] -76:4, 76:10, 82:23, 180:17 cope [4] - 175:11, 175:21, 176:9, 176:13 copies [6] - 19:22, 20:1, 20:21, 21:4, 115:13 copy [17] - 19:28, 47:10, 49:25, 58:2, 108:3, 113:22, 114:5, 114:23, 114:24, 116:3, 116:18, 117:19, 117:22, 117:26, 118:15, 119:18 copying [1] - 82:2 CORMAC [1] - 2:21 corn [1] - 143:27 corner [3] - 19:3, 29:24. 83:13 correct [146] - 8:13, 8:18, 9:2, 9:5, 9:8, 9:12, 10:15, 10:16, 11:2, 13:12, 14:19, 22:5, 22:9, 22:12,

22:20, 22:24, 22:29, 23:4, 23:28, 24:5, 24:8, 24:13, 24:23, 24:29, 25:1, 25:5, 25:6, 25:10, 25:16, 28:2, 28:29, 29:14, 30:21, 31:26, 32:10, 32:16, 32:20, 32:22, 33:15, 33:27, 34:3, 34:14, 34:20, 35:2, 35:6, 35:17, 35:21, 36:10, 36:14, 36:17, 36:19, 37:1, 37:6, 37:11, 37:14, 37:15, 38:1, 38:19, 39:4, 39:19, 41:9, 41:13, 41:16, 42:6, 42:21, 42:24, 43:11, 43:25, 43:28, 44:12, 44:15, 46:22, 47:11, 47:12, 48:12, 49:9, 49:10, 51:14, 53:10, 53:28, 55:9, 57:20, 59:3, 60:16, 62:24, 62:27, 63:2. 63:17. 63:20. 65:16, 67:14, 67:15, 67:18, 68:8, 71:24, 72:13, 73:28, 74:4, 74:18. 79:9. 80:12. 83:1, 83:10, 83:15, 83:19, 83:27, 84:4, 84:8. 84:10. 87:12. 87:19 87:21 89:4 95:22, 96:11, 97:5, 97:15, 97:20, 97:21, 98:1, 101:3, 102:17, 107:17, 107:21, 107:24, 108:8, 115:9, 122:4, 122:22, 122:26, 123:1, 126:3, 130:26. 136:20. 145:9, 159:24, 159:28, 163:6, 167:24, 169:18, 174:13, 175:8, 175:17, 178:8, 181:29, 184:26 correction [1] -55:15 correctly [2] -153:23, 184:21 correlated [1] -103:18 correlation [4] -76:4, 76:10, 82:22, 180:16 correspond[1] -168:19 corresponded [1] -165:13

76:1, 78:15, 79:12,

correspondence [11] - 13:7, 150:20, 164:26, 165:12, 165:21, 165:29, 168:25, 171:25, 172:5, 172:14, 172:19 correspondences [1] - 14:23 corresponding [1] -165:10 Costello [1] - 168:19 COSTELLO[1] -2:28 couched [1] - 152:1 counsel [4] - 19:29, 20:22, 39:16, 146:9 counsellor.. [1] -176:1 couple [4] - 161:18, 175:20, 176:8, 176:10 course [18] - 7:19, 9:23, 20:1, 44:5, 44:16, 47:1, 54:5, 57:11, 60:16, 68:14, 87:1, 88:2, 93:28, 102:2, 150:5, 153:26, 177:4, 177:22 Court [26] - 22:4, 22:18, 22:27, 23:12, 23:17, 25:26, 30:2, 31:25, 32:1, 32:2, 32:6, 32:19, 33:19, 36:1, 38:12, 38:18, 56:16, 67:17, 76:18, 92:14, 113:16, 114:4, 114:14, 116:8, 141:26 COURT [2] - 1:12, 2:3 court [12] - 23:3, 25:29, 27:23, 32:3, 39:21, 40:5, 40:19, 41:24, 42:18, 68:1, 147:7, 177:19 courteous [1] -118:17 Courts [1] - 68:10 courts [3] - 33:1, 95:13, 100:15 cover [5] - 85:12, 85:20, 85:24, 88:16, 171:6 **cover-up** [4] - 85:12, 85:20, 85:24, 88:16 covered [1] - 80:6 covering [2] -112:17, 138:20 covers [1] - 148:22 create [1] - 81:28 created [1] - 164:16 credible [1] - 72:7

credit [2] - 33:3, 143:4 crime [3] - 43:9, 115:15, 181:1 crimes [6] - 74:28, 76:4, 76:10, 78:29, 82:23, 82:24 Criminal [5] - 23:21, 36:1, 38:12, 92:6, 100:3 criminal [10] - 39:3, 92:7, 92:19, 112:19, 112:27, 112:29, 145:26, 146:12, 147:19, 152:20 criminal' [1] - 140:20 critically [1] - 145:4 criticising [2] - 89:5, criticism [1] - 127:19 criticisms [1] -101:13 CRO [1] - 73:12 CROSS [4] - 5:4, 5:5, 6:12, 21:16 cross [6] - 6:9, 19:18, 20:13, 34:16, 142:20, 148:28 cross-examination [3] - 19:18, 20:13, 148:28 cross-examine [1] -**CROSS-EXAMINED** [4] - 5:4, 5:5, 6:12, 21:16 crowded [1] - 61:29 crucial [4] - 16:27, 17:26, 18:7, 18:9 Cryan [54] - 42:14, 45:20, 45:22, 45:27, 46:25, 53:9, 54:5, 56:5, 106:28, 107:19, 107:22, 109:12, 110:8, 110:9, 110:14, 111:4, 111:11, 112:1, 112:5, 112:12, 112:27, 113:11, 114:17, 117:14, 117:29, 118:1, 118:17, 119:12, 120:26, 124:19, 127:22, 128:27, 129:10, 129:14, 129:23, 129:27, 130:14, 130:19, 131:10, 131:13,

131:19, 132:6,

132:24, 133:13,

133:24, 134:2,

134:16, 134:24, 135:13, 135:16, 135:22, 159:19, 161:6, 161:21 Cryan's [4] - 45:29, 115:2, 120:6, 125:21 CUNNINGHAM[1] -Curran [6] - 86:23, 87:7, 87:9, 88:5, 88:8, **cursor** [1] - 126:23 cursory [2] - 149:8, 149:9 **custody** [6] - 23:11, 24:2, 24:3, 26:7, 27:28, 30:3 cut [2] - 10:20, 65:27 D D/Inspector [1] -117:19

D/Sergeant [3] -67:22, 108:3, 111:18 D/superintendent 111 - 111:18 damage [4] - 101:15, 112:19, 112:28, 112:29 dangerous [1] -140.20 **DARA**[1] - 2:12 dare [1] - 21:2 dark [1] - 162:20 date [19] - 22:18, 23:1, 26:15, 26:19, 26:20, 27:10, 29:22, 29:24, 30:2, 38:8, 40:28, 83:13, 94:6, 94:8, 109:12, 125:24, 143:26, 172:8, 178:26 **DATED**[1] - 4:7 dated [9] - 73:13, 81:24, 89:22, 90:29, 91:9, 104:27, 137:8, 137:11, 143:24 dates [1] - 176:11 DAY [2] - 1:17, 4:7 days [15] - 4:18, 56:8, 57:13, 76:14, 80:15, 81:27, 107:19, 110:15, 127:29, 128:1, 169:25, 171:24, 175:20, 176:8, 176:10 **DDU** [5] - 111:13, 111:18, 112:8, 112:17, 112:18

deal [7] - 50:22, 52:11, 64:20, 105:10, 112:2, 126:12, 160:7 dealing [9] - 22:21, 42:20, 74:27, 140:20, 145:9, 166:18, 177:1, 177:9, 180:12 dealings [30] - 12:1, 65:20, 65:21, 65:25, 67:9, 68:2, 72:23, 72:26, 75:4, 75:5, 82:25, 82:28, 83:25, 84:2, 86:1, 86:3, 86:4, 87:5, 88:23, 88:29, 93:12, 93:22, 94:18, 94:27, 99:21, 100:22, 103:21, 106:27, 117:24, 143:12 dealt [3] - 43:16, 165:24, 168:4 death [13] - 57:1, 57:13, 76:5, 83:9, 98:11, 108:24, 145:29, 176:28, 177:3, 177:16, 177:17, 180:1, 180:11 debate [2] - 104:9, 153:17 debating [1] - 153:7 debriefing [1] -177:11 deceased [5] -94:18, 94:27, 178:8, 178:17, 179:24 **DECEMBER** [1] - 1:8 December [21] -21:28. 22:3. 22:10. 22:19, 23:2, 23:13, 72:8, 79:24, 81:23, 81:24, 83:14, 84:7, 90:3, 90:29, 104:27, 168:9, 168:20, 175:13, 176:3 decided [13] - 23:16, 43:29, 59:5, 59:8, 62:4, 72:29, 80:10, 80:11, 81:11, 81:14, 81:16, 81:27, 175:15 deciding [1] - 102:2 decision [16] - 7:15, 8.10 8.11 8.19 10:20, 16:10, 16:23, 18:4, 32:7, 47:27, 60:21, 62:13, 66:23, 70:19, 156:13, 158:24 decisions [3] - 17:6, 18:12, 156:15 Declan [17] - 28:17, 45:1, 56:16, 69:12, 70:2, 76:18, 81:1,

81:9, 81:10, 81:17, 97:19, 97:20, 124:22, 124:24, 130:24, 131:6. 149:26 Declan's [3] - 44:27, 45:25, 124:2 deep [1] - 58:16 deeply [2] - 63:3, 108:27 default [1] - 78:11 defence [1] - 127:19 defend [2] - 127:24, 128:16 defended [1] -105:19 $\textbf{definitely} \ [2] \textbf{ - } 75:13,$ 118:11 degree [4] - 14:15, 40:25, 43:1, 168:27 delay [9] - 162:9, 166:7, 166:24, 166:26, 167:4, 167:9, 168:29, 170:5 delayed [1] - 162:7 deliberately [3] -101:4, 101:15, 116:13 demand [1] - 21:9 demanding [1] -164:15 demands [1] -118:18 demeanour [3] -43:15, 56:14, 123:15 denies [1] - 155:24 **Dennedy** [3] - 46:27, 161:9. 161:21 department's [1] depth [3] - 93:24, 98:14, 106:13 describe [1] - 82:10 description [1] -29.9 desire [2] - 145:6, 160:10 desirous [1] - 120:9 desk [1] - 57:25 despatches [1] -174:10 despite [5] - 7:17, 8:20, 13:29, 74:14, 74.21 detail [7] - 29:9, 47:5, 47:7, 50:23, 72:11, 74:2, 172:16 details [5] - 39:14, 64:15, 64:25, 138:12, 140:8

detected [1] - 44:6

Detective [39] -

50:20, 55:12, 57:3, 63:6, 67:28, 70:5, 70:14, 80:25, 89:20, 90:10, 90:14, 90:15, 90:23, 90:26, 90:28, 91:6, 92:1, 92:9, 94:5, 94:26, 100:27, 100:29, 101:24, 130:20, 131:20, 132:25, 133:19, 133:25, 134:3, 134:7, 134:14, 134:17, 135:17, 137:6, 137:11, 137:15, 137:29, 140:10 detective [8] - 35:1, 48:19. 111:13. 111:22, 111:23, 112:7, 126:10, 184:9 detectives [5] - 46:9, 46:16, 112:3, 126:12 deterioration [1] -146.23 determination [3] -18:27, 102:13, 182:14 **determine** [1] - 49:17 determined [1] -44:5 determining [1] -18:8 devastating [2] -49:27, 58:16 developed [2] -60:15, 181:11 developments [3] -37:9, 71:5, 121:23 deviation [2] - 17:23, 17:24 diagnosis [2] -175:1, 175:3 **DIARMAID**[1] - 2:6 diatribe [1] - 183:9 dictate [1] - 127:17 died [1] - 149:16 differ [3] - 42:15, 159:2, 161:7 different [12] -101:13, 101:14, 132:20, 157:9, 157:11, 157:13, 157:14, 170:25, 174:6, 177:4, 181:23 differentiation [1] -181:4 differently [1] -183:16 difficult [1] - 114:19 difficulties [10] -23:14, 23:16, 58:10, 58:22, 60:19, 162:26,

174:19, 175:10, 184:2, 184:8 difficulty [7] - 20:25, 42:16, 140:28, 141:7, 141:9, 157:19, 164:17 direct [1] - 136:18 directed [4] - 22:16, 48:3, 119:19, 172:3 directing [1] - 22:17 directions 151 -25:20, 27:21, 28:21, 138:19, 170:29 directive [2] - 15:3, 17:23 directly [6] - 4:13, 21:23, 21:24, 52:4, 60:7, 63:7 Director [1] - 25:20 disagree [6] - 115:7, 145:27, 158:27, 160:11, 161:11, 170:3 discharge [1] - 13:19 disciplinary [62] -71:20, 71:21, 97:27, 99:8, 101:18, 102:13, 106:10, 129:6, 135:27, 136:5, 141:2, 143:20, 143:23, 143:29, 144:3, 144:25, 148:15, 148:20, 151:29, 154:6, 156:14, 156:20, 157:28, 158:3, 158:6, 158:16, 158:26, 158:29, 160:13, 160:18, 161:14, 161:17, 161:20, 161:25, 162:4, 162:23, 162:29, 163:11, 163:16, 163:17, 163:23, 165:17, 165:24, 166:23, 166:24, 166:25, 167:15, 168:1, 168:6, 169:14, 170:15, 171:11, 171:14, 171:17, 171:22, 171:27, 171:29, 172:11, 173:3, 173:17, 173:20, 182:20 discipline [7] -143:17, 144:13, 144:15, 151:23,

151:28, 172:22, 174:1

disclose [1] - 95:5

discipline" [1] -

disclosed [3] -

152:2

134:7, 134:11, 134:17 disclosure [15] -59:22, 82:9, 82:13, 82:19, 82:20, 102:29, 104:3, 104:5, 104:7, 114:24, 114:26, 135:4, 135:9, 136:3 DISCLOSURES [3] -1:1. 1:2. 4:8 disclosures [1] discontinued [1] -173:21 discover [2] - 77:14, 77:18 discovered [2] -97:2, 149:11 discredited [2] - 7:7, 7.26 discrepancies [1] -13:21 discuss [4] - 69:18, 69:21, 81:17, 81:18 discussed [9] - 40:2, 43:14. 70:5. 70:9. 113:6, 123:14, 129:19, 134:15, 171:12 discussing [4] -47:15, 81:19, 111:10, discussion [7] -19:16, 46:13, 51:20, 68:12, 68:14, 132:5, 180:13 discussions [1] -107:18 dismissal [1] -146:20 dismissed [4] - 7:20, 9:24, 9:26, 10:4 dispersed [2] -55:14, 57:4 displayed [1] - 30:15 dispute [4] - 24:22, 63:9, 111:21, 122:1 disputed [3] -109:26, 110:2, 110:4 disseminated [1] -102:7 distinction [4] -59:19, 59:24, 59:27, 167:7 **distribute** [1] - 21:5 District [9] - 22:4, 22:18, 22:27, 25:26, 30:2, 91:2, 91:4, 91:7, 91:11 district [9] - 22:13,

92:19, 115:14, 154:29, 155:22 disturbed [3] -56:19, 56:20, 56:29 **DIVISION** [1] - 1:11 division [1] - 60:5 divisional [4] -15:22, 16:5, 17:29, 160:12 divisions [1] - 60:6 DMR [2] - 85:20, 144:12 doctor [7] - 9:9, 121:28, 122:28, 174:24, 176:19, 177:28, 183:11 document [54] -10:13, 15:6, 18:6, 19:3, 26:15, 26:23, 26:24, 27:1, 37:24, 42:3, 42:5, 42:18, 43:17, 50:13, 50:14, 51:27, 51:29, 52:16, 52:18, 57:24, 58:29, 60:25, 65:2, 65:3, 65:11, 65:12, 73:7, 74:8, 82:4, 83:11, 95:10, 95:15, 100:9, 100:11, 116:24, 118:23, 120:23, 122:20, 125:1, 130:14, 130:18, 133:20, 133:24, 133:27, 134:13, 134:15, 137:12, 139:29, 143:24, 159:16, 160:26, 160:28, 183:1 documentation [5] -17:12, 144:17, 144:27, 144:28, 152:9 documents [13] -13:20, 17:1, 26:18, 59:22, 62:5, 91:18, 115:23, 115:25, 116:1, 116:26, 117:3, 117:11, 146:15 **Dolphin** [2] - 23:12, 23:17 **DONAL** [1] - 2:19 **Donal** [3] - 60:17, 91:3, 91:4 done [19] - 18:19, 52:27, 53:4, 53:17, 53:21, 53:23, 53:26, 60:19, 93:24, 102:24, 108:15, 109:1, 109:4, 109:10, 109:15, 112:17, 113:6, 157:9, 159:25

Donoghue [1] -92:15 Doolan [1] - 19:21 **door** [4] - 59:7, 66:11, 66:12, 133:22 doubt [7] - 15:18, 16:4, 16:16, 17:28, 135:21, 162:1, 172:16 doubted [1] - 118:9 doubtless [2] -114:21. 166:16 down [69] - 7:18, 9:22, 26:19, 27:13, 35:10, 37:1, 37:21, 37:23, 37:28, 38:20, 43:2, 54:11, 57:7, 58:4, 62:3, 63:4, 63:5, 66:23, 66:25, 69:4, 70:19, 70:29, 71:8, 71:14, 71:17, 71:18, 73:17, 79:19, 80:1, 85:21, 85:25, 94:7, 102:25, 104:26, 122:2, 122:5, 123:5, 123:9, 123:10, 123:12, 124:7, 124:25, 124:28, 125:22, 126:14, 126:17, 126:22, 126:24, 126:25, 127:4, 127:6, 127:9, 127:17, 127:24, 128:18, 136:4, 137:6, 137:9, 139:3, 139:7, 148:19, 149:28, 152:4, 155:15, 160:4, 162:6, 173:4, 178:27, 179:1 dozen [1] - 163:18 **DPP** [7] - 27:21, 29:25, 39:15, 92:14, 112:25, 115:12, 138:19 **DPP's** [2] - 115:17, 180:27 Dr [30] - 9:1, 9:9, 9:12, 174:9, 174:11, 174:21, 174:22, 174:27, 175:7, 175:13, 175:16, 175:22, 175:24, 176:23, 176:24, 176:25, 177:5, 178:7, 178:8, 178:20, 179:3, 179:5, 179:8, 179:9, 179:10, 180:12, 182:24, 183:6 draft [9] - 40:24, 42:1, 45:5, 45:6, 45:11, 47:8, 49:24,

23:6, 91:27, 91:29,

73:23 drafts [3] - 81:29, 82:2, 82:6 **draw** [3] - 95:20, 104:29, 167:7 drawer [1] - 57:25 drawing [5] - 7:7, 7:27, 10:12, 59:24, 59:27 drawn [2] - 8:1, 8:2 dressed [1] - 56:24 drills [1] - 162:6 driving [1] - 29:6 drove [1] - 120:20 dry [1] - 112:14 **DUBLIN** [5] - 1:16, 2:15, 2:23, 2:30, 3:8 **Dublin** [4] - 23:12, 30:1, 36:1, 38:11 due [13] - 16:20, 20:1, 35:25, 36:8, 38:11, 38:23, 47:1, 54:5, 54:20, 58:28, 93:28, 153:25 dumb [1] - 131:29 during [9] - 7:7, 7:26, 57:11, 68:14, 76:18, 94:13, 132:4, 150:5, 184:4 duties [1] - 60:9 duty [19] - 11:4, 14:28, 15:8, 15:22, 15:27, 16:4, 16:10, 16:15, 16:21, 17:28, 18:2, 18:16, 18:23, 55:21, 142:3, 144:21, 147:12, 150:26, 177:22 dwell [1] - 15:2 Dwyer [13] - 73:11, 73:12, 163:29, 167:23, 168:10, 168:21, 169:4, 169:10, 169:26, 170:12, 170:21, 170:27, 171:25 **DÁIL** [1] - 1:3 Ε

early [4] - 76:6, 76:13, 76:26, 180:14 ease [7] - 94:20, 95:20, 105:14, 105:16, 105:18, 106:3, 159:26 easier [1] - 184:25 easily [1] - 106:6 East [1] - 32:14

eastern [1] - 179:20 easy [1] - 149:19 ECHR [1] - 147:7 edited [1] - 46:20 effect [2] - 44:4, 164:26 effectively [1] - 25:3 efficiency [1] - 21:8 efforts [4] - 14:25, 25:11, 25:14, 52:26 EGAN [1] - 2:20 eh.. [1] - 157:1 eight [1] - 128:1 either [5] - 52:9, 94:29, 159:16, 161:12, 175:1 elaborated [1] -173.8 elapsed [1] - 172:29 elected [1] - 82:12 electronically [3] -19:24, 20:4, 20:18 element [1] - 63:23 eliminate [1] - 75:18 **ELIZABETH** [1] - 3:6 elsewhere [2] -84:27, 170:23 em [6] - 81:27, 93:6, 96:4, 157:11, 169:21, 174:18 em.. [1] - 176:29 embarking[1] -61:14 emigrant [1] - 179:20 emigrant's [1] -179:24 emotionally [2] -56:26, 94:14 en [2] - 107:29, 110:27 enable [1] - 23:25 end [12] - 9:15, 21:25, 24:25, 78:14, 78:22, 84:17, 104:9, 130:2, 136:19. 158:19, 163:22,

170:12 endeared [1] - 33:13 endeavour[1] -127:1 endorsement [1] -157:25 engaged [1] - 43:18 enquired [1] - 55:20 enquiry [1] - 148:14

ensure [3] - 35:28, 35:29. 118:2 ensuring [1] - 41:24 entered [2] - 88:5, 102:7

entire [2] - 65:25, entirely [5] - 18:18, 41:23, 131:16, 131:18, 170:26 entry [4] - 26:11, 29:10, 33:3, 33:4 environs [2] - 25:9, 25:29 episode [1] - 65:25 **EQUALITY** [1] - 1:7 especially [1] -111:18 essentially [3] -79:7, 104:18, 104:19 establish [5] - 60:18, 90:15, 92:22, 136:11, 158:10 established [2] -149:10, 155:18 ESTABLISHED[1] establishing [1] -157:19 et [2] - 28:21, 61:3 **Europe** [1] - 179:20 European [1] -141:26 evaluate [1] - 103:24 evening [3] - 114:1, 114:23, 115:18 event [2] - 25:25, Events [1] - 89:23 events [10] - 25:18, 80:27, 81:28, 83:7, 83:20, 85:13, 89:28, 114:12, 180:3, 180:11 eventually [2] -

163:16, 169:22 evidence [34] - 6:20, 8:3, 8:27, 11:29, 23:5,

31:28, 32:4, 38:23,

39:21, 59:5, 72:29, 77:29, 79:10, 99:13, 104:9, 105:10, 113:16, 113:17, 114:4, 118:8, 118:11, 132:14, 132:15, 132:18, 134:21, 150:5, 153:4, 155:26, 157:20, 166:14,

182:29, 183:1 **EVIDENCE** [1] - 1:7 exact [2] - 112:21, 117:10

166:16, 170:22,

exactly [7] - 42:11, 67:8, 150:6, 178:23, 181:16, 183:20,

examination [4] -19:18, 20:13, 148:28,

examine [1] - 6:9 92:9, 92:25, 138:2, 141:21

5:5, 6:12, 21:16 example [2] - 13:6 exclusively [2] -100:26, 160:19

164:23 106:15, 106:18,

exhaustively [1] -

existed [1] - 92:23

152:15, 155:19 exonerate [1] - 100:6 exonerated [3] -97:27, 145:7, 174:2

157.16

157:25, 157:27 expected [9] - 78:18, 80:5, 89:8, 142:5, 143:6, 143:8, 144:22, 145:21, 150:27 expecting [2] -

expeditious [1] -

experienced [1] -34:15 explain [6] - 7:28,

128:21, 131:23 explained [4] -111:6, 122:17, 173:1, 174:19

133:5

184:18 165:12

examined [5] - 91:6, **EXAMINED** [4] - 5:4,

excuse [5] - 34:10, 34:25, 53:2, 115:24,

exercise [5] - 98:15, 139:2, 152:24 **exhaustion** [1] - 9:13

98:6

existence [14] - 96:8, 96:13, 98:25, 137:17, 137:21. 139:13. 139:18, 142:2, 142:10, 142:26, 144:20, 145:15,

exonerates [1] -

exonerating [1] -

exoneration [2] -

77:13, 77:17 expediting [1] -162:29

164:9

51:28, 52:17, 128:20,

explaining [1] -

explicitly [1] - 45:13

exposed [3] - 50:12, 50:18, 51:6 exposure [3] - 50:29, 62:9, 147:17 express [5] - 9:12, 44:3, 45:6, 56:12, 156:10 expressed [11] -30:13. 45:11. 45:13. 51:21, 53:21, 53:25, 58:8, 80:15, 110:18, 140:5, 171:15 expressing [1] -154:10 expression [1] extend [1] - 86:6 extended [1] - 181:3 extensive [3] -93:18, 174:14, 174:17 extent [4] - 12:20, 28:6, 177:19, 182:13

explore [1] - 132:27

F

extra [1] - 74:2

71.6

extrapolation [1] -

extravagant [3] -

153:2, 153:19

extremely [4] -

162:22, 162:24,

163:14, 177:27

face [7] - 12:17, 13:25, 78:5, 153:1, 153:2 face-to-face [1] -12:17 facilitate [1] - 18:4 facilitating [1] -17:13 Fact [1] - 89:24 fact [71] - 13:26. 14:10, 19:5, 25:6, 26:9, 33:2, 54:4, 54:21, 55:12, 56:13, 64:27, 72:8, 72:28, 73:6, 73:22, 77:1, 77:17, 79:24, 80:6, 81:22, 83:17, 85:12, 85:16, 85:26, 86:5, 86:16, 87:2, 87:7, 89:14, 89:29, 90:5, 90:28, 96:16, 98:13, 99:7, 102:3, 102:11, 106:17, 120:28, 132:4, 134:20, 136:19, 136:22,

95:29, 101:10, 136:23, 136:24, 45:24, 57:15, 124:2, Fernandez's [1] flawed [1] - 109:21 136:29, 137:26, 105:13, 114:8, 124:10, 124:21, 182:24 focus [10] - 99:21, 139:4, 139:12, 129:12, 132:28, 155:26, 161:3 FERRY [1] - 2:26 99:23, 99:27, 99:29, 139:27, 140:14, 154:2, 155:5, 157:23, fears [3] - 49:7, few [8] - 6:18, 7:2, 100:22, 103:4, 141:6, 141:15, 159:19, 170:1, 170:2, 140:12, 153:5 7:24, 10:7, 26:27, 121:23. 130:18. 141:20, 142:8, 170:10, 170:27, 178:5 **FEBRUARY** [6] - 1:4, 37:28, 69:14, 76:14 160.19 149:10, 156:7, fair-minded [3] -1:8, 1:17, 4:8, 6:1, focuses [1] - 105:2 fierce [1] - 176:18 157:15, 158:25, 95:19, 95:29, 105:13 185:3 figure [1] - 67:3 focussed [3] - 93:5, 160:20, 162:7, 162:8, fairly [5] - 68:25, February [18] file [28] - 7:8, 7:27, 101:1, 161:18 162:23, 163:19, 108:24, 132:10, 32:21, 32:23, 33:25, 8:2, 8:7, 16:11, 92:29, focussing [4] -164:12, 170:29, 138:28, 148:27 38:27, 94:7, 94:8, 108:4, 108:10, 86:17, 100:1, 125:25 171:16, 179:25, fairness [11] -137:8, 137:11, 112:24, 112:25, follow [2] - 67:7, 180:3, 182:15, 182:19 122:11, 150:3, 163:28, 169:23, 113:23, 114:23, 183:8 fact-find [5] - 77:17, 150:14, 151:4, 155:9, 169:25, 169:26, followed [1] - 107:20 114:24, 114:26, 80:6, 85:26, 86:5, 170:4, 170:6, 170:7, 114:28, 114:29, 175:10, 175:19, FOLLOWING [1] -99.7 181:29, 183:23 176:5, 176:7, 176:12, 115:3, 115:11, 1.3 Fact-Finding [1] - $\textbf{faithful} \ [\textbf{1}] \textbf{ - } 138:28$ 179:18 115:13, 116:3, following [21] - 1:24, 89:24 fall [3] - 64:16, 64:26, fed [1] - 183:19 116:15, 116:17, 9:29, 30:22, 40:8, fact-finding [28] -64:27 feedback [1] -138:17, 138:20, 53:7, 67:16, 83:7, 72:8, 72:28, 73:22, fallen [1] - 166:18 162:27 140:18, 145:3, 166:9, 87:2, 87:5, 89:28, 77:1, 81:22, 83:17, Feehan [29] - 88:15, 171:18 false [1] - 12:19 99:14, 110:14, 123:3, 85:12, 85:16, 86:16, falsehood [1] - 13:6 89:25, 90:1, 90:4, files [5] - 59:8, 59:23, 144:14, 147:20, 87:2, 89:14, 89:29, 90:10, 93:9, 104:25, 60:24, 60:26, 91:7 falsehoods [4] -154:27, 160:3, 90:5, 98:13, 102:3, 136:2, 136:21, 137:5, final [4] - 104:23, 12:9, 12:13, 12:20, 170:25, 172:7, 106:17, 136:19, 139:6, 139:9, 141:14, 155:13, 155:15, 173:20, 183:14 12:27 136:22, 136:24, falsely [2] - 13:5, 141:21, 143:16, 183:27 following.. [1] -136:29, 137:26, 144:12, 146:11, 13:8 Finbar [1] - 67:23 150:22 139:4, 139:12, 146:16, 155:6, 157:8, findings [4] - 39:10, familiar [2] - 15:5, **FOLLOWS** [4] - 6:2, 141:15, 141:20, 157:18, 158:7, 136:23, 146:19, 27:11 6:13, 21:17, 107:10 142:8, 158:25, 163:19 162:19, 162:22, familiarise [2] -154:18 follows [1] - 155:16 fact-findings [1] -165:10, 165:13, fine [1] - 32:4 30:25, 38:6 foot [3] - 97:25, 136:23 172:4, 173:18 family [2] - 24:21, finer [1] - 153:8 133:10, 173:21 Feehan's [7] - 137:3, factor [3] - 11:9, 32:29 finish [2] - 78:20, footed [1] - 46:24 11:21, 12:22 140:29, 143:23, **FANNING** [1] - 2:26 163:23 **FOR** [7] - 1:6, 2:6, factored [1] - 102:10 143:28, 152:4, 154:6, finished [4] - 19:11, 2:10, 2:17, 2:25, 3:5, Fanning [11] - 6:18, factors [1] - 8:12 173:22 7:28, 11:15, 11:24, 48:22, 48:23, 66:6 107:10 facts [6] - 95:23, feelings [5] - 50:10, 12:26, 12:28, 13:11, FINN [1] - 2:11 force [1] - 120:22 98:20, 98:25, 127:26, 71:29, 85:5, 183:19, 14:14, 14:24, 15:4, FINTAN [1] - 2:26 forced [2] - 119:21, 137:21, 139:18 184:6 17:3 Fintan [2] - 6:18, 7:9 120:4 factual [1] - 75:21 fell [1] - 168:1 Fanning's [1] - 19:5 first [29] - 7:25. forget [2] - 119:23, failed [8] - 22:26, **fellow** [1] - 128:12 Fanning) [1] - 7:9 17:27, 22:1, 29:27, 121:3 28:16, 79:6, 97:24, felt [20] - 8:7, 49:20, far [17] - 11:20, 41:25, 54:10, 55:10, forgiven [1] - 48:2 127:19, 144:21, 53:23, 62:9, 88:2, 60:29, 89:12, 93:11, 55:13, 55:17, 63:6, **form** [8] - 46:20, 145:20, 150:26 99:8, 101:5, 112:13, $71{:}14,\,71{:}16,\,74{:}20,$ 93:15, 93:21, 96:4, 47:14, 49:15, 79:20, 146:10, 149:2. **failing** [1] - 89:5 81:25, 85:23, 91:9, 103:3, 103:19, 80:26, 105:10, 171:16, 176:27, failure [17] - 76:3, 109:14, 127:14, 91:21, 107:14, 129:7, 124:10, 167:16 76:9, 78:24, 78:27, 177:12, 179:29, 128:6, 156:23, 130:1, 135:28, 146:6, formal [8] - 44:22, 79:16, 79:18, 79:20, 180:2, 180:10, 181:6, 159:26, 161:22, 157:5. 157:20. 47:16, 49:2, 65:14, 80:27, 84:19, 85:4, 181:8, 181:26, 184:4 166:28, 181:18 163:12, 163:15, 94:29, 124:11, 85:9, 87:8, 88:8, **female** [1] - 179:19 fatal [1] - 138:21 167:14, 174:8 124:14, 180:5 127:13, 128:23, fence [1] - 168:29 Fatal [1] - 29:26 firstly [1] - 62:21 formally [3] - 27:23, 129:5, 180:15 Fergus [3] - 73:11, fault [5] - 157:15, fit [5] - 162:10, 98:26, 137:22 failure" [1] - 80:24 73:12, 170:12 164:2, 164:22, 157:20, 164:4, 164:6, format [4] - 109:19, failures [5] - 78:28, Fernandez [15] -164:25, 165:27 164.8 110:22, 111:3, 111:16 80:16, 84:13, 167:18, 174:21, 175:16, favour [1] - 105:21 five [10] - 19:23, formed [8] - 76:7, 177:8 175:22, 175:24, 20:4, 114:1, 114:19, favoured [1] - 105:18 76:9, 76:17, 76:20, fair [25] - 34:29, 176:24, 176:25, fear [5] - 30:13, 114:22, 115:13, 86:15, 102:1, 121:26, 35:27, 39:2, 43:1, 177:5, 178:8, 178:9, 116:10. 117:3. 44:24, 44:26, 46:26, 160:1 88:16, 89:7, 93:4, 179:5, 179:8, 179:10, 123:11, 130:1 179:22 **FORMER** [2] - 1:12, 94:21, 94:23, 95:19, 180:12, 183:6 flavour [1] - 39:27 feared [8] - 44:18, 2:3

former [4] - 6:17, 11:15, 12:25, 91:27 forming [1] - 102:11 forms [3] - 75:28, 76:1, 76:2 formulated [1] -FORRISTAL[1] -2:21 forth [2] - 62:11, 168:3 forthcoming [4] -35:25, 154:13, 168:25, 180:28 forward [3] - 10:6, 10:17. 18:12 forwarded [6] -91:10, 91:13, 138:18, 154:9, 169:26, 173:17 four [3] - 38:13, 54:11. 164:19 Four [1] - 68:9 four-year [1] - 38:13 fourth [4] - 26:23, 26:24, 27:6, 27:7 framed [1] - 152:18 FRANCIS [1] - 2:14 FREEMAN [1] - 2:27 Friday [7] - 8:27, 17:2, 67:16, 67:25, 68:5, 68:10, 149:16 friend [1] - 42:4 Friends [1] - 6:15 front [1] - 16:1 fruit [2] - 25:13, 32:11 full [19] - 18:4, 18:27, 43:8, 59:21, 59:22, 72:22, 102:3, 106:19, 106:21, 106:25, 125:23, 130:24, 139:21, 141:2, 143:8, 143:10, 155:28, 177:11 fully [8] - 34:6, 43:3, 43:8, 64:29, 93:27, 96:12. 100:19. 139:17 furnished [3] -39:14, 170:20, 173:11 **FURTHER** [1] - 4:17

G

gaping [1] - 13:17 garda [2] - 23:13, 34:15 Garda [116] - 4:14, 7:16, 7:20, 7:21, 8:20,

9:27, 11:11, 11:19,

11:29, 12:2, 12:8, 12:24, 14:28, 21:19, 23:15, 24:10, 25:1, 26:3, 26:5, 28:16, 35:3, 40:1, 41:10, 41:15, 41:18, 41:27, 48:24, 52:22, 54:13, 55:20, 59:7, 60:7, 61:12, 61:22, 65:17, 69:9, 69:12, 69:18, 69:25, 69:29, 70:29, 71:9, 72:14, 77:2, 80:12, 80:22, 81:2, 84:19, 85:6, 85:15, 85:19, 85:27, 85:29, 88:22, 90:7, 90:23, 90:24, 91:3, 91:7, 91:29, 92:21, 92:26, 92:28, 93:21, 95:1, 95:4, 95:24, 97:13, 98:17, 99:13, 100:12, 100:24, 100:26, 102:9, 102:22, 107:14, 110:17, 110:26. 111:8. 111:11, 112:13, 112:16, 112:22, 113:12, 113:28, 120:5, 122:18, 127:14, 130:13, 131:6, 132:17, 133:15, 136:13, 136:23, 137:19. 138:1, 138:9, 139:13, 139:15, 139:20, 140:11, 140:19, 141:4, 141:10, 142:26, 143:4, 143:11, 153:21, 159:16, 166:19, 167:17. 167:18. 169:1, 177:7, 179:21, 181:2

GARDA [2] - 2:18, 3:5

Gardaí [16] - 24:20, 30:15, 79:1, 95:16, 96:9, 96:13, 96:28, 98:4, 98:10, 105:5, 105:9, 105:27, 137:14, 137:17, 142:10, 142:12 **Garland** [2] - 67:23,

Garland [2] - 67:23, 67:29 qather [1] - 98:20

general [3] - 9:16, 56:9, 85:4 generally [1] - 22:22

generally [1] - 22:22 germane [1] - 155:13 Gerry [3] - 158:5,

158:28, 160:12 get-go [1] - 157:21 gist [4] - 22:6, 51:26, 52:8, 141:29 given [8] - 40:24, 42:5, 80:10, 96:21, 109:3, 113:15, 113:17, 176:5 glitches [1] - 20:17 goodness [1] - 21:7 **GP** [4] - 9:1, 9:3, 174:25, 175:26 grand [1] - 112:26 grant [1] - 50:22 graphic [1] - 120:15 grateful [2] - 6:14, 172.15 great [5] - 14:25, 122:20, 123:23, 127:16, 162:16 greater [1] - 44:6 greatest [1] - 170:27 Grogan's [1] - 19:7 ground [3] - 61:3, 121:15, 121:17 **grounds** [3] - 7:16, 9:4, 140:24 grudging [1] -157:24 guardian [1] - 33:12 guardianship [1] -33:22 guards [2] - 78:8 guess [1] - 70:24 guidance [2] - 40:25, 41:1 guilt [2] - 181:7 guilty [5] - 42:23, 43:9, 97:26, 123:15, 145:6

Н

GWEN [1] - 1:28

Gwen [1] - 1:23

hair [1] - 173:1 half [8] - 26:19, 27:13, 117:17, 117:18, 137:6, 139:6, 163:18, 184:4 half-way [4] - 26:19, 27:13, 137:6, 139:6 HALIDAY [1] - 2:28 hand [19] - 17:13, 19:3, 20:20, 20:21, 26:20, 27:10, 29:24, 66:12, 83:13, 95:23, 115:26, 115:29, 116:9, 116:12, 117:3, 117:7, 118:23, 143:27, 155:27 handed [9] - 21:13, 26:15, 43:17, 84:8, 115:11, 116:1, 130:13, 154:24 handing [6] - 45:11, 115:23, 115:25, 116:2, 116:13, 117:11 handling [1] - 84:19 hands [3] - 121:17, 127:6, 168:24 handwriting [1] -127:15 handwritten [7] -19:2, 95:10, 95:15, 100:11, 122:20, 137:12, 154:23 happy [7] - 19:28, 44:8, 46:17, 48:18, 126:12, 126:18,

harassment [8] 166:8, 170:24, 171:7,
171:21, 171:26,
173:2, 184:5, 184:20
hard [8] - 19:22,
21:4, 26:15, 61:29,
108:20, 108:22,
181:15, 182:2
harm [3] - 57:16,
57:23
harsh [4] - 177:27

126:24

harsh [1] - 177:27 head [3] - 62:3, 63:4, 63:5

heading [2] - 15:27, 29:25 headings [1] - 174:7 health [2] - 12:2,

41:4 hear [5] - 6:24, 64:4, 64:9, 65:5, 65:29 heard [5] - 23:16, 32:6, 39:20, 152:19, 178:15

HEARING [4] - 1:16, 6:1, 107:10, 185:3 hearing [10] - 40:19, 64:13, 64:22, 67:20, 67:21, 67:26, 67:29, 70:3, 116:8, 130:16 heart [1] - 39:25 hed [1] - 92:5 held [5] - 47:10, 65:12, 66:12, 91:7, 138:1 HELD [1] - 1:16 hello [1] - 21:20

help [8] - 32:26,

42:5, 64:19, 79:26,

128:13, 167:26, 182:4 **helpful** [2] - 153:28, 165:7 **Hennessy** [36] -22:11, 23:9, 33:8,

33:14, 33:21, 35:7, 35:9, 35:11, 38:24, 38:25, 39:11, 44:10, 44:13, 44:29, 63:14, 70:28, 71:4, 71:10, 71:12, 72:1, 72:27, 74:9, 74:29, 75:9, 91:12, 123:25, 124:21, 128:11, 128:24, 146:5, 146:7, 146:9, 154:12, 154:14, 180:20,

180:29 Hennessy's [8] -33:25, 34:13, 34:22, 34:28, 36:29, 39:8, 71:1, 154:17 hereby [1] - 4:15 HEREBY [1] - 4:12 herself [3] - 44:8,

123:23

High [11] - 31:25, 32:6, 32:19, 56:16, 67:17, 76:17, 113:16, 114:4, 114:13, 116:8 high [1] - 160:4

higher [1] - 119:27 highlight [1] - 13:21 highlighted [1] -180:29

highlighting [2] -151:3, 165:16 highly [1] - 12:1 himself [5] - 25:8, 56:2, 127:17, 159:12, 181:4

hindsight [8] - 67:7, 71:26, 77:12, 77:22, 149:13, 149:14, 149:15, 149:20 his/her [1] - 16:8 historical [2] - 171:7,

173:2

history [4] - 174:14, 174:16, 177:14, 184:2 hitman [1] - 37:3 hold [3] - 26:29, 38:4, 132:8 holding [1] - 26:7

holes [1] - 13:17 home [17] - 33:25, 34:13, 34:22, 34:29, 35:16, 36:21, 38:26, 38:28, 39:8, 40:12, 40:13, 40:14, 41:14,

105:20, 105:22, 41:18, 41:22, 70:26, 179:23, 179:28, 180:1 includes [3] individual [2] - 46:7, 154:17 Hughes's [4] -114:5, 114:26, 131:21, 131:26, 142:3 honestly [1] - 145:5 103:21, 150:4, 115:19, 115:27, 132:26 individualise [1] -115:29, 116:3, 116:6, including [5] - 21:11, 85:17 **hook** [2] - 102:19, 178:29, 179:18 human [4] - 147:7, 116:9, 116:18, 30:16, 56:6, 97:6, 102.21 individuals 131 -165:14, 165:22, 116:23, 116:24, hope [1] - 163:25 131.28 67:28, 85:18, 141:22 hoped [1] - 167:26 165:26 117:20, 118:4, incomplete [1] inefficiency [1] -118:15, 119:17, 57:29 Human [2] - 141:27, 166:6 HORAN [1] - 2:19 119:19, 120:25, 150.21 inconsistent [2] hotel [3] - 42:1, inefficient [1] - 167:8 120:27, 121:6, 57:27, 122:20 hundred [1] - 145:7 158:1. 160:9 inevitably [1] - 65:10 husband [1] - 57:15 121:24, 122:19, incorporate [1] hotly [1] - 43:3 infants [1] - 33:22 122:25, 125:1, 126:7, hour [7] - 108:2, hypertensive[1] -105:25 inference [1] -142:15, 145:2, 176:4 incorrect [2] - 75:19, 109:18, 110:11, 104:12 155:25, 156:8, 117:18, 119:8, 125:5, 131:3 inferences [1] -159:12, 160:6, 125:8 ı indeed [33] - 7:4, 104:10 160:16, 160:20, House [2] - 23:12, 14:23, 22:2, 22:15, influence [1] - 24:16 161:4, 161:19 25:27, 27:4, 27:19, 23:17 inform [1] - 150:22 i.e [2] - 20:12, 134:9 implemented [1] -34:23, 36:3, 41:26, house [5] - 46:8, informal [1] - 42:12 ideally [1] - 166:6 25:24 42:29, 43:16, 45:8, 61:3, 112:20, 112:28, information [80] identification [1] implicated [1] -50:1, 50:9, 51:19, 118:25 16:8, 17:14, 17:16, 179:27 52:13, 54:18, 61:25, HOUSE [3] - 2:14, 17:19, 36:28, 37:14, identified [4] - 13:17, important [15] - 19:1, 2:22, 2:28 83:2, 83:12, 86:22, 39:15, 61:10, 61:18, 14:9, 37:4, 136:27 41:8, 42:18, 50:21, 94:25, 95:7, 103:12, housed [1] - 116:20 61:20, 62:23, 64:10, identify [1] - 12:12 54:3, 59:14, 63:21, 113:14, 118:5, **HQ** [2] - 15:2, 17:23 64:23, 65:5, 65:15, ii 111 - 155:12 63:22, 69:16, 70:10, 118:16, 144:1, 155:8, HRM [18] - 7:9, 8:24, 65:28, 65:29, 68:20, 71:15, 75:28, 77:21. illness [10] - 16:21, 156:5, 171:3, 173:23 68:26, 68:27, 69:15, 12:15, 12:27, 13:20, 16:22, 18:3, 18:15, 77:22, 156:3 indeed" [1] - 173:26 13:28, 14:1, 14:9, 69:22, 69:24, 70:10, 18:16, 18:23, 182:6, impose [1] - 105:10 independent [1] -14:17, 16:6, 17:8, 71:16, 72:17, 72:24, 182:10, 182:13 imposition [6] -17:13, 18:1, 18:4, 78:7, 78:8, 78:12, Illness/Injury [1] -148:15, 156:14, **INDEX** [1] - 5:1 78:29, 79:27, 80:21, 165:14, 166:11 16:15 156:19, 160:17, indicate [16] - 39:10, 81:1, 81:12, 81:15, huge [3] - 13:21, illnesses [1] - 13:27 170:14, 171:17 52:11, 130:18 43:12, 52:7, 83:27, 84:2, 86:2, 86:13, illustrative [1] impractical [1] -84:4, 97:9, 109:25, hugely [1] - 124:15 87:23, 87:28, 88:5, 146.22 47:21 120:17, 133:16, 88:12, 88:20, 88:21, **HUGHES** [5] - 2:10, image [1] - 120:21 impression [2] -154:18, 155:23, 88:22, 88:26, 88:28, 3:6, 3:7, 5:3, 6:12 immediate [9] - 51:9, 121:25, 162:18 155:27, 156:8, 180:9, 89:3, 89:9, 90:16, Hughes [65] - 6:5, 142:2, 144:20, impropriety [1] -181:6, 184:1 90:18, 91:5, 92:2, 6:16, 7:1, 16:26, 145:15, 147:2, 88:25 indicated [20] -92:22, 95:6, 97:1, 20:22, 21:18, 27:2, 147:11, 152:16, **IN** [1] - 1:16 22:25, 25:14, 35:20, 97:23, 97:25, 102:15, 28:15, 37:19, 44:11, 155:20, 155:29 in-and-out [1] -39:20, 45:6, 52:26, 102:22, 103:8, 54:14, 54:25, 55:3, immediately [8] -174:16 53:1, 53:3, 53:14, 103:18, 106:11, 55:21, 55:22, 56:24, 20:19, 31:4, 31:5, 53:29, 90:17, 108:14. in-depth [2] - 93:24, 128:4, 128:5, 128:8, 57:12, 57:24, 57:28, 50:19, 86:19, 86:25, 106:13 109:8, 113:12, 128:9, 128:19, 134:6, 58:6, 79:27, 90:20, 117:16, 146:8 inaction [2] - 147:1, 120:25, 138:10, 134:10, 134:17, 90:21, 91:10, 91:13, Impact [24] - 39:22, 168:28 141:29, 161:10, 134:25, 144:17, 92:11, 93:1, 94:17, 46:19, 49:18, 51:10, incarcerated [1] -164:13, 169:11 144:27, 144:29, 95:11, 95:24, 101:27, 51:22, 52:10, 57:26, 179:28 indicates [9] - 23:8, 145:12, 152:9, 167:5 102:28, 123:14, 57:28, 58:7, 58:9, 29:27, 45:29, 59:12, incident [2] - 33:6, informed [7] - 13:5, 123:25, 124:1, 62:28, 64:14, 70:7, 108:11, 109:13, 13:8, 24:20, 57:25, 125:13, 125:17, 114:10 92:10, 95:11, 95:16, incidents [1] - 36:23 144:26, 171:18, 134:8, 134:19, 139:26 126:17, 126:23, 100:2, 100:12, 174:11 131:24, 132:13, include [7] - 18:13, **infuse** [1] - 120:18 103:20, 114:6, 116:4, initial [4] - 97:29, 72:11, 73:4, 73:6, indicating [6] -138:17, 138:20, 127:27, 140:1, 158:10 42:14, 47:3, 99:2, 139:27, 140:10, 87:22, 102:27, 155:6 104:25, 136:29, 142:8 impact [55] - 40:9, 120:9, 165:15, 180:10 **initiating** [1] - 136:5 140:13, 140:17, included [17] - 7:13, 40:24, 45:4, 47:8, indication [5] -144:16, 150:3, 152:8, 7:14, 8:8, 8:16, 8:25, **initiation** [1] - 87:2 49:24, 50:2, 51:2, 161:3, 182:3, 182:4, 152:28, 153:8, 154:9, 58:28, 71:18, 71:19, initiative [1] - 26:11 51:4. 58:25. 61:21. 72:26, 73:9, 77:12, 182:5, 182:13 154:24, 154:29, injury [13] - 11:4, 62:11, 64:19, 64:25, 155:21, 155:24, 89:2, 101:1, 124:9, indicators [1] - 56:4 14:28, 15:8, 15:22, 64:28, 92:7, 92:18, 159:26, 178:13, 138:13, 138:16, 141:7 indicted [1] - 182:22 15:27, 16:4, 16:10, 100:4, 100:9, 105:2, 179:2, 179:13, included.. [1] - 8:17 indirectly [1] - 4:13 16:21, 16:23, 17:28,

18:2, 18:16, 18:23 117:14, 117:29, intel [2] - 37:5, 164:25, 167:22 139:21, 140:7, 141:3, input [2] - 17:5, 17:9 118:1, 118:17, 140:18 interviewer [6] -141:6, 143:8, 143:10, inquired [1] - 152:5 119:12, 120:6, intelligence [3] -131:8, 131:9, 132:5, 143:23, 144:3, 145:3, 120:26, 124:19, 145:10, 145:23, inquiries [1] - 163:21 27:25, 35:3, 140:11 133:12, 135:9, 135:12 125:21, 127:21, intend [2] - 133:11, 146:2, 146:10, interviewing [3] -**Inquiry** [1] - 85:10 128:19, 129:27, 147:23, 151:27, inquiry [23] - 59:9, 133:16 93:21, 161:21, 170:17 154:7, 155:18, 158:6, 130:14, 130:19, intimated [2] - 112:5, 71:20, 71:21, 72:28, intended [1] - 106:13 130:20, 131:9, 158:16, 158:25, 77:7, 80:4, 86:28, intent [3] - 25:15, 159:14 131:13, 131:19, 158:29, 159:1, intimidate [3] -87:3, 89:10, 89:12, 127:22, 158:2 131:20, 132:24, 161:14, 161:18, intention [4] - 54:25, 28:25, 30:14, 36:13 98:21, 102:3, 136:28, 147:19, 151:11, 132:25, 133:13, 55:11, 110:6, 140:1 intimidated [1] -161:20, 161:25, 162:5, 163:2, 163:3. 133:20, 133:24, 152:22, 152:26, intentionally [1] -96:23 133:25, 134:2, 134:3, 163:20, 165:17, 152:27, 153:23, 159:25 intimidation [1] -134:7, 134:14, 165:24, 168:2, 168:6, 105:6 153:24, 162:4, inter [2] - 154:25, 134:16, 134:17, 169:14, 170:18, 167:26, 170:21 **INTO** [1] - 1:1 172:22 135:8, 135:17, 171:1, 171:4, 171:22, **INQUIRY** [2] - 1:1, investigate [8] interacting [1] -135:22, 135:23, 171:27, 171:29, 88:10, 95:17, 100:8, 114:16 136:27, 137:6, 172:8, 172:11, insert [1] - 24:16 137:14, 143:17, interaction [4] -137:12, 137:15, 172:22, 173:3, insisted [1] - 12:17 144:14, 149:26, 158:8 49:14, 70:5, 125:24, 137:29, 138:28, 173:17, 173:21, investigated [18] insisting [1] - 25:8 126:2 140:10, 142:17, 173:28, 180:16, 10:22, 14:11, 34:29, Inspector [169] interactions [4] -147:22, 149:8, 182:20, 183:13 42:14, 45:20, 45:22, 68:28, 68:29, 72:26, 44:23, 88:10, 98:27, 159:19, 161:21, Investigation [1] -45:27, 45:29, 48:7, 102:6, 103:19, 98:4 163:29, 167:23, 89:24 50:20, 51:12, 52:25, 112:19, 112:28, interest [1] - 55:5 168:9. 168:21. 169:3. investigation.. [1] -53:7, 53:9, 54:7. 124:14, 137:22, interested [3] - 4:17, 169:10, 169:26, 55:12, 56:17, 57:3, 145:14, 145:17, 54.19 74.12 170:20, 170:27, investigations [8] -57:8, 59:12, 60:17, interests [2] - 77:8, 147:5, 151:23, 171:24 4:14, 96:6, 103:17, 160:17, 160:25 63:6, 67:19, 70:6, 77.9 inspector [15] investigating [10] -128:25, 136:24, 70:14, 71:15, 72:12, interfering [1] -140:25, 160:13, 49:11, 73:11, 86:26, 72:19, 72:20, 72:22, 21:24, 72:19, 74:15, 148:28 88:25, 91:4, 92:5, 180:17 72:24, 73:12, 73:21, 74:22, 74:24, 74:26, international [1] -95:29, 97:29, 118:9, investigative [4] -75:1, 145:20, 184:19, 73:23, 74:1, 74:2, 179:26 124:7, 128:27, 13:26, 14:26, 55:2, 75:27, 76:29, 77:10, 184:20 interpret [1] - 132:4 151:25, 167:27, 115:25 77:13, 77:14, 77:17, investigation [122] interpretation [3] -169:19, 172:3 investigator [4] -78:15, 78:19, 78:23, 16:11, 24:7, 25:19, 147:28, 152:27, 153:9 inspectors [1] -59:18, 132:13, 79:23, 80:5, 80:11, 35:29, 39:9, 42:27, interpreted [5] -80:14 133:17, 134:22 80:25, 81:12, 81:23, 50:15, 52:28, 54:20, 132:7, 145:29, 146:3, instance [3] - 7:25, investigators [10] -82:5, 82:9, 82:21, 54:22, 54:26, 55:6, 155:29, 165:25 41:25, 96:15 54:27, 59:21, 82:10, 83:16, 83:27, 84:22, 59:11, 59:20, 59:27, interrogated [1] instigate [3] - 95:17, 129:22, 130:29, 84:28, 85:6, 85:11, 60:1, 60:9, 60:28, 92:21 100:13, 137:14 132:21, 134:12, 85:21, 85:23, 85:25, 61:2, 61:9, 61:15, interrupt [3] instigated [2] -134:28, 135:19, 171:6 86:20, 86:26, 87:17, 61:19, 62:6, 65:22, 101:22, 150:2 105:8. 105:29 87:26, 87:27, 88:15, **invitation** [1] - 61:5 67:24, 73:13, 77:1, interval [1] - 166:21 instigation [2] invite [3] - 54:26, 89:11, 90:11, 90:14, 77:9, 77:14, 77:18, intervention [2] -85:16, 141:1 55:16, 55:17 90:20, 90:23, 90:26, 80:7, 81:14, 81:21, 148:22, 148:29 instructed [2] - 19:5, 91:2, 91:3, 91:6, 92:1, 81:22, 83:17, 88:17, invited [1] - 81:20 interview [19] -130:6 inviting [1] - 55:11 92:9, 92:13, 92:17, 88:19, 89:29, 90:5, 24:10, 41:29, 86:6, INSTRUCTED [4] -92:21, 92:25, 92:28, 90:12, 91:6, 92:3, involve[1] - 161:20 105:5, 105:28, 93:4. 94:3. 94:6. 2:12, 2:21, 2:27, 3:6 93:8, 93:9, 93:13, involved [28] - 9:15, 129:16, 130:11, 99:11, 99:18, 101:24, instruction [2] -93:14, 93:25, 95:23, 17:3, 35:28, 38:20, 133:29, 134:22, 85:25, 130:17 102:1, 102:19, 95:25, 97:2, 99:3, 61:8, 61:18, 67:23, 149:9, 163:3, 163:5, 102:27, 102:28, instructions [4] -99:7, 99:8, 100:7, 74:25, 85:15, 85:21, 164:2, 164:14, 104:7, 104:15, 113:22, 120:6, 121:5, 103:3, 106:10, 85:24, 88:15, 88:20, 165:19, 165:27, 104:22, 106:28, 172:23 106:14. 106:19. 92:29, 94:14, 96:5, 165:28, 166:2 107:19, 107:22, instructs [1] - 118:13 106:21, 106:25, 97:7, 97:14, 98:3, interviewed [15] -109:12, 110:14, instrument [4] -106:26, 108:10, 100:25, 102:5, 86:1. 86:5. 87:4. 111:4, 111:11, 112:1, 37:1, 70:27, 70:29, 112:9, 112:23, 137:19, 146:17, 87:26, 87:27, 91:28, 154:18, 160:23, 112:5, 112:12, 71:8 112:24, 116:17, 92:1, 93:7, 93:11, 112:27, 113:11, INSTRUMENT[1] -135:27, 136:5, 136:7, 166:21, 177:18, 141:10, 143:13, 114:17, 115:2, 137:27, 138:15, 179:23 162:11, 164:22,

involving [2] - 85:13, 93:1 irregular [1] - 12:1 **IS** [2] - 4:12, 4:17 isolated [1] - 84:26 Issue [1] - 135:28 issue [20] - 11:2, 18:8, 22:27, 55:8, 56:9, 59:15, 60:13, 64:8, 66:3, 66:4, 114:12, 114:13, 117:12, 117:13, 146:24, 164:3, 168:3, 176:17, 176:20, 180.26 issued [1] - 12:3 issues [15] - 7:12, 8:5, 8:9, 8:12, 8:15, 8:25, 9:20, 56:13, 102:14. 103:20. 113:19, 158:11, 184:9, 184:22 **issuing** [1] - 105:8 **IT** [2] - 4:12, 4:17 italics [1] - 144:8 item [1] - 131:21 items [1] - 172:9 itself [7] - 59:20, 60:1, 60:9, 68:5, 134:15, 162:5, 162:25

J

James [1] - 174:27 **JAMES**[1] - 3:5 January [11] - 23:19, 23:29, 24:24, 24:25, 91:9, 96:20, 112:26, 140:7, 169:10, 169:19 job [9] - 52:27, 53:3, 89:14, 102:21, 111:14, 157:10, 157:11. 157:13. 174:16 jobs [2] - 59:17, 60:8 **JOHN** [1] - 2:26 John [29] - 22:11, 23:9, 36:29, 38:24, 44:10, 44:13, 44:29, 63:14, 70:28, 71:1, 71:4, 71:10, 71:12, 72:1, 72:27, 74:9, 74:29, 75:9, 91:12, 123:25, 124:21, 128:11, 128:24, 146:7, 146:8, 154:11, 154:14, 180:20, 180:29 John's [3] - 44:27,

45:25, 124:2 Joseph [2] - 174:21, 178:8 **Judge** [1] - 21:6 judge [5] - 22:13, 23:6, 32:6, 32:19, 42:19 judgement [1] -92:14 July [1] - 173:20 jumping [1] - 183:22 juncture [2] - 14:16, 65:1 June [9] - 136:6, 143:24, 143:27, 150:20. 163:12. 166:27, 167:4, 172:19, 173:16 jurisdiction [1] -32.9 just.. [1] - 64:12 Justice [4] - 10:8, 23:22, 92:6, 100:3 JUSTICE [4] - 1:6,

1:11, 2:2, 4:8

KANE [1] - 3:5

KATE [1] - 2:20

K

55:4, 61:10, 68:29, 72:14, 77:2, 77:5, 77:6, 77:25, 85:26, 90:6, 96:8, 96:13, 96:27, 97:9, 98:19, 100:21, 102:8, 102:23, 103:26, 103:27, 136:11, 136:12, 137:16, 139:13, 139:19, 140:22, 141:4, 141:11, 142:9, 142:12, 142:19, 142:25, 143:11, 151:4, 161:25 known [16] - 75:2, 78:18, 78:19, 98:10, 98:16, 102:8, 126:9, 141:23, 142:16, 144:19, 145:14, 147:21, 147:29, 152:15, 160:14, 160:15 knows [1] - 183:19

L

Kavanagh [13] -10:7, 19:1, 19:24, 20:3, 29:19, 37:20, 37:25, 37:28, 54:11, 57:7, 73:18, 123:5, 137:8 KAVANAGH[2] -2:5, 2:13 Keenan [3] - 9:1, 9:9, keep [2] - 62:12, 179.6 keeping [4] - 62:3, 63:4, 63:5, 117:24 kept [3] - 53:16, 108:14, 109:8 **KEYES** [1] - 2:11 kids [1] - 123:21 Kieran [4] - 90:27, 90:28, 94:26, 97:16 killed [1] - 108:28 killing [1] - 53:22 kind [3] - 148:10, 149:17, 184:19 kitchen [1] - 60:11 knowing [2] - 75:19, 127:20 knowledge [38] -23:17, 30:19, 54:28,

lack [3] - 12:1, 82:23, 146.22 lads [1] - 149:28 lady [1] - 177:24 lady's [1] - 180:1 language [4] - 51:26, 103:28, 109:19, 178:1 large [1] - 73:21 last [15] - 14:2, 42:7, 52:18, 52:22, 60:25, 61:21, 62:29, 74:12, 74:21, 98:1, 98:23, 104:26, 104:28, 125:7, 158:24 lastly [1] - 136:7 latched [1] - 120:17 late [3] - 180:14, 183:11, 184:6 latest [1] - 37:9 latter [2] - 93:14, 183:29 latter's [1] - 179:22 launched [1] - 88:17 law [10] - 24:21, 33:1, 141:21, 141:24, 141:26, 141:29, 147:7, 147:8, 147:20, 153:8 lawyers [2] - 153:20, 153:26 laying [4] - 145:25, 146:12, 146:27,

147:18 leader [1] - 91:11 leading [8] - 7:10, 13:18, 13:22, 81:27, 99:7, 116:26, 177:3, 180.11 learn [3] - 49:27, 87:25, 119:29 learned [4] - 55:21, 58:16, 89:3, 120:26 learning [2] - 50:6, 69:26 least [10] - 26:24, 41:21, 70:17, 116:8, 117:5, 145:27, 163:1, 166:2, 171:5, 172:29 leave [7] - 20:7, 20:19, 46:17, 107:1, 113:25, 118:15 leaving [3] - 70:8, 74:19, 170:5 Lebanon [1] - 183:15 led [1] - 145:29 **left** [9] - 51:27, 52:16, 66:6, 66:10, 66:28, 112:14, 180:4, 183:13 legacy[1] - 184:9 legal [9] - 10:3, 10:12, 33:12, 104:9, 146:1, 146:4, 146:6, 152:28, 153:14 legitimate [4] -136:18, 136:28, 147:19. 149:1 lens [1] - 86:16 less [2] - 48:22, 52:23 lesser [1] - 14:15 letter [1] - 10:8 letting [1] - 102:19 level [21] - 77:1, 77:5, 79:7, 90:6, 97:9, 98:10, 98:16, 98:19, 100:21, 102:8, 103:26, 103:27, 111:10, 136:11, 136:12, 139:18, 141:4, 141:11, 149:9, 163:21 Liam [5] - 44:11,

Liam [5] - 44:11, 91:10, 91:13, 94:17, 123:25 Liam's [2] - 44:28, 124:3 LIBERTIES [1] - 2:15 liberty [1] - 4:18 life [17] - 36:29, 39:12, 69:2, 77:3, 136:13, 140:3, 140:5, 142:2, 144:21, 145:16, 147:2, 152:16, 154:26, 155:20, 155:26, 156:1, 156:9 life' [1] - 154:27 lift [1] - 66:1 **lifted** [1] - 65:16 light [1] - 41:3 lighter [1] - 33:17 likely [1] - 58:22 limited [1] - 97:29 limiting [1] - 89:12 line [9] - 7:1, 60:17, 87:6, 88:3, 125:7, 126:1, 126:22, 130:2, 160:28 liner [1] - 126:15 lines [8] - 50:16, 51:7, 123:11, 126:14, 126:22, 130:1, 161:19 link [4] - 34:19, 171:26, 172:8, 173:2 linked [1] - 179:20 linking [2] - 39:2, 171:21 listen [2] - 153:4, 160.5 listened [1] - 11:20 **LITTLE** [1] - 2:23 local [10] - 10:22, 12:15, 13:9, 13:28, 14:11, 14:24, 17:14, 18:26, 46:9, 57:4 locate [2] - 130:1, 143.28 located [1] - 91:9 locked [1] - 113:24 locker [7] - 116:21, 116:22, 120:3, 120:10, 120:16, 120:22, 120:29 lockers [2] - 119:21, 130:7 log [1] - 117:24 logic [1] - 153:3 logjam [1] - 166:1 **LOINSIGH** [1] - 2:11 longstanding [1] -111:21 look [34] - 6:22, 13:13, 14:27, 15:16, 17:1, 26:9, 37:16, 62:4, 68:25, 73:10, 78:2, 83:2, 89:15, 94:2, 98:14, 104:22, 106:23, 123:11, 137:2. 149:2. 149:20. 150:24, 152:29,

153:12, 154:4, 159:9,

161:8, 163:27, 171:2, 172:2, 178:5, 179:6, 184:18, 184:21 looked [21] - 34:8, 44:7, 56:18, 56:26, 72:7, 78:8, 97:10, 97:11, 116:14, 121:18, 121:28, 127:5. 141:26. 146:14, 147:6, 147:7, 149:6, 152:3, 152:21, 170:23 looking [21] - 8:5, 17:7, 21:1, 46:16, 48:19, 49:22, 61:1, 67:17, 71:26, 77:22, 101:23, 106:23, 122:12, 134:13, 135:29, 142:25, 147:17, 149:28, 170:18, 174:8, 182:18 **looks** [1] - 156:6 lost [1] - 37:27 low [1] - 162:16 **LUNCH** [1] - 107:10 lunch [12] - 20:20, 21:1, 68:7, 68:10, 107:3, 107:25, 108:2, 109:18, 110:11, 119:8, 130:23, 131:5 **LYNN** [1] - 2:10 Lynn [1] - 20:26

M

MADE [2] - 1:1, 1:6 main [2] - 51:7, 86:11 maintain [1] - 164:14 maintained [1] -132:5 maintaining [2] -82:8, 82:14 MAIREAD[1] - 2:21 major [1] - 160:6 male [1] - 179:26 malicious [1] -167:13 MALONE [1] - 1:28 Malone [1] - 1:23 man [8] - 46:2, 46:14, 101:14, 106:6, 109:7, 170:28, 178:13, 182:22 man's [1] - 46:1 managed [3] - 78:24, 120:18, 183:12 management [48] -7:16, 7:22, 8:5, 8:20,

72:3, 76:21, 78:28, 81:2, 82:11, 84:26, 85:6, 85:15, 86:21, 88:3, 111:23, 133:15, 160:4, 164:17, 166:19 Management [2] -69:2. 150:21 management's [1] -12:1 manager [2] - 60:17, 87:6 Mangan [72] - 48:7, 72:7, 72:12, 72:19, 72:22, 73:22, 73:23, 74:1, 74:3, 77:10, 77:13, 78:15, 78:23, 79:23, 80:1, 80:11, 81:12, 81:21, 81:23, 82:5, 82:9, 82:12, 82:21, 83:16, 83:27, 84:28, 85:6, 85:22, 85:23, 85:25, 86:20, 87:18, 87:26, 87:28, 88:15, 89:12, 89:21, 90:11, 90:14, 90:20, 90:23. 90:26. 91:2. 91:6, 92:1, 92:5, 92:9, 92:13, 92:17, 92:21, 92:25, 92:28, 93:5, 94:3, 94:6, 99:11, 99:18, 101:24, 102:1, 102:19, 102:27, 102:28, 104:7, 104:15. 136:27. 137:6, 137:12, 137:29, 140:10, 142:17, 147:22, 149:8 Mangan's [8] -72:20, 76:29, 77:14, 77:17, 84:22, 85:12, 104:22, 138:29 manner [1] - 95:26 manslaughter [6] -145:26, 146:1, 146:2, 146:13, 153:1, 153:8 March [8] - 33:29, 87:11, 137:27, 141:16, 176:25, 176:26, 178:25, 178:26 marginal [3] - 15:10,

9:19, 9:27, 10:22,

11:9, 11:11, 11:19,

12:8, 12:15, 12:16,

13:29, 14:11, 14:25,

16:12, 17:14, 18:26,

60:7, 61:12, 61:22,

63:27, 64:29, 65:7,

65:17, 66:2, 70:3,

12:24, 13:8, 13:9,

15:13, 17:24 Mark [3] - 88:5, 88:7, 136:3 **Marrinan** [7] - 8:28, 21:22, 150:15, 151:6, 160:27, 165:11, 174:5 MARRINAN [9] - 2:7, 6:5, 6:8, 150:2, 150:11, 150:13, 150:16, 151:9, 178:17 Marrinan's [1] -168:24 material [6] - 19:16, 20:12, 21:23, 98:8, 137:28, 150:9 materials [12] -22:26, 33:7, 37:17, 48:7, 54:9, 73:15, 76:13. 89:15. 98:7. 129:13, 129:15, 143:22 matter [46] - 4:18, 16:5, 16:27, 17:29, 18:24, 18:29, 20:20, 21:23, 26:14, 30:15, 30:26, 33:23, 33:28, 38:14, 56:13, 63:24, 67:3, 70:14, 71:29, 90:17, 98:26, 104:12, 105:9, 111:24, 130:21, 131:21, 131:25, 132:26, 133:26, 134:4, 137:22, 139:22, 140:25, 147:4. 149:15, 151:23, 152:27, 160:15, 163:24, 167:2, 168:11, 168:19, 171:11, 171:17, 173:8, 180:29 **MATTERS**[1] - 1:3 matters [65] - 7:5, 7:12, 7:17, 8:3, 8:21, 9:19. 12:4. 13:19. 16:28, 17:6, 18:9, 18:14, 18:21, 18:27, 22:22, 34:19, 39:3, 39:14, 41:2, 43:20, 46:11, 46:17, 48:17, 48:21, 48:24, 48:26, 49:3, 49:22, 50:14, 51:10, 63:7, 78:14, 78:18, 84:20, 88:18, 97:11, 98:2, 111:24, 113:20, 126:9, 128:24, 133:23, 138:13, 140:21, 141:1, 148:19, 149:6, 154:27, 160:24,

161:16, 167:29, 168:15, 168:22, 169:12, 170:18, 170:23, 171:1, 171:3, 171:20, 172:9, 172:10, 172:14, 172:17, 175:4, 183:15 McEneaney [7] -90:27, 90:28, 94:26, 97:17, 100:27, 100:29, 108:3 MCGARRY [2] -2:26. 5:4 McGarry [14] - 6:8, 6:10, 6:13, 6:14, 6:16, 6:24, 6:25, 6:27, 6:29, 15:24, 15:27, 16:2, 19:12, 19:13 McGrath [7] - 2:7, 19:15, 19:20, 20:2, 21:4, 21:6, 21:8 McGUINNESS [2] -2:6. 2:19 McHugh [17] - 85:19, 90:4, 120:8, 136:1, 136:11, 137:27, 141:15, 143:17, 144:11, 150:4, 159:14, 159:15, 161:24, 162:2, 167:28, 167:29, 173:18 McLoughlin [2] -23:20, 91:28 McNally [2] - 24:10, 92:26 mean [50] - 7:29, 8:1, 8:14, 8:22, 31:10, 31:14, 32:27, 47:25, 63:22, 64:27, 65:27, 72:6, 77:20, 77:24, 78:2, 78:7, 100:8, 101:16, 104:1, 115:1, 124:1, 124:15, 124:24, 124:26, 131:28, 132:27, 143:10, 145:4, 148:1, 148:11, 148:29, 149:19, 153:17, 153:20, 157:2, 164:12, 164:18, 164:20, 168:27, 170:16, 175:9, 178:4, 181:22, 181:26, 181:27, 181:28, 182:6, 182:15, 183:20 meaning [4] - 78:27, 152:26, 153:9, 181:20 means [2] - 31:15,

meant [1] - 146:18 measures [7] -142:4, 144:22, 145:20, 150:27, 180:19, 180:21. 180.24 medical [21] - 7:15, 8:2, 8:3, 8:5, 8:9, 8:12, 8:24, 8:29, 9:4, 9:20, 13:18, 16:28, 18:9, 18:13, 18:14, 18:21, 18:24, 18:26, 41:6, 174:5 medication [1] -174:29 meet [8] - 12:16, 13:9, 24:20, 40:29, 54:25, 55:12, 163:16, 168:22 meeting [31] - 41:8, 42:13, 42:17, 44:17, 45:10, 45:14, 45:24, 49:11, 49:17, 49:20, 54:19, 61:21, 65:1, 67:12, 67:27, 70:25, 70:27, 78:22, 100:1, 109:17, 115:18, 119:10, 168:10, 168:13, 169:20, 169:22, 169:27, 173:10, 173:12, 173:14, 174:12 meetings [6] - 13:25, 107:18, 144:18, 144:29, 152:10, 169:3 **MEMBER** [1] - 2:2 member [7] - 54:21, 95:1, 112:6, 141:9, 151:24, 154:15, 155:18 member's [2] -16:20, 16:21 members [29] -30:25, 71:2, 74:15, 74:22, 74:24, 74:26, 75:1, 85:29, 86:2, 86:3, 86:6, 88:22, 93:21, 97:7, 97:13, 98:16, 100:24, 102:8, 102:16, 102:22, 111:23, 137:18, 138:9, 139:15, 139:20. 141:4. 143:11, 177:11, 181:2 memo [1] - 38:21 memorandum [3] -29:15, 29:20, 38:7 memory [2] - 119:29, 120:19 mental [1] - 182:10

114:28

mention [4] - 73:16, 78:6, 115:19, 128:2 mentioned [7] -44:29, 46:1, 48:16, 51:12, 66:1, 100:27, 174.9 messages [1] - 13:3 met [17] - 22:1, 23:9, 23:10, 25:1, 39:29, 40:5, 40:9, 51:12, 51:17, 54:14, 55:10, 63:5, 113:27, 114:3, 116:10, 119:7, 174:18 methodology [1] -48:10 Michael [26] - 46:25, 53:9, 54:5, 56:5, 89:25, 90:1, 90:15, 107:19, 110:8, 110:9, 128:27, 129:10, 129:13, 129:23, 132:6, 134:23, 135:13, 135:15, 136:2, 143:28, 144:12, 155:6, 158:6, 158:7, 159:19, 161:6 MICHAEL [1] - 2:10 microphone [2] -6:26, 20:9 mid-2005 [1] - 25:23 Middle [1] - 32:14 middle [1] - 13:14 might [36] - 20:4, 25:22, 29:18, 33:17, 37:16, 37:20, 37:23, 44:1, 54:9, 54:10, 57:7, 58:14, 62:9, 73:10, 73:14, 89:14, 104:26, 118:27, 125:2, 129:26, 137:4, 142:5, 143:21, 143:25, 144:22, 145:21, 157:17, 166:5, 172:2, 175:6, 182:12, 182:16, 183:2, 183:11, 183:18 miles [1] - 119:11 mind [12] - 34:16, 40:4, 80:24, 86:22, 120:21, 122:12, 133:28. 154:28. 165:3, 180:20, 182:4, 182:5 minded [5] - 94:21, 94:23, 95:19, 95:29, 105:13 MINISTER [1] - 1:6 minute [2] - 119:3, 161:8 minutes [8] - 19:23,

20:5, 42:8, 42:15, 43:13, 69:14, 148:16 misbehaving [1] -20:9 misconduct [1] -168.2 misinformation [1] -12:10 mistake [2] - 47:6, 133:8 mistaken [3] - 45:17, 47:4. 119:28 mixed [1] - 162:13 Mmm.. [1] - 100:14 modern [1] - 98:14 moment [21] - 11:1, 13:4, 15:16, 19:21, 19:25, 20:3, 20:11, 37:16, 37:22, 40:15, 54:9, 74:19, 79:25, 80:17, 86:11, 125:25, 140:3, 154:25, 168:26, 169:21, 183:3 **Monday** [8] - 51:13, 59:13. 63:13. 67:13. 68:17, 68:20, 69:26, 107:16 MONDAY [2] - 1:17, month [1] - 173:20 months [8] - 10:21, 85:28, 87:2, 88:6, 164:3, 164:20, 165:22, 171:19 morning [19] - 6:4, 6:7, 19:16, 50:5, 51:5, 51:13, 51:16, 51:17, 58:25, 59:13, 60:3, 60:10, 61:22, 63:13, 67:13, 69:9, 69:26, 124:19, 135:16 most [5] - 60:1, 113:15, 163:19, 170:29, 172:15 mother [2] - 28:24, 30.8 motivations [1] -162:24 motive [2] - 171:28, 172:23 Mountjoy [1] - 38:14 move [13] - 10:6, 23:19, 25:17, 31:23, 32:21, 33:29, 35:18, 43:9, 73:14, 104:21, 106:27, 153:29, 175:7 moved [5] - 14:17,

24:24, 24:25, 66:13,

moving [2] - 167:21,

165:9

MR [81] - 1:11, 2:2, 2:5, 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:10, 2:11, 2:12, 2:18, 2:18, 2:19, 2:21, 2:26, 2:26, 2:27, 3:5, 4:8, 5:4, 5:5, 6:5, 6:8, 6:13, 6:14, 6:27, 6:29, 15:24, 15:27, 16:2, 19:13, 20:9, 20:15, 20:25, 21:16, 21:18, 26:27, 27:16, 31:23, 38:2, 38:4, 48:5, 79:23, 80:9, 89:17, 89:19, 104:21, 107:4, 107:13, 115:11, 132:3, 132:22, 132:28, 133:3, 133:10, 148:21, 148:26, 148:29, 149:24, 150:2, 150:11, 150:13, 150:16, 151:9, 151:13, 153:28, 154:3, 157:23, 159:18, 165:9, 173:27, 178:6, 178:17, 178:20, 178:24, 179:4, 179:9, 179:11, 179:15, 180:8, 183:27, 184:28 MS [12] - 2:7, 2:11, 2:13, 2:19, 2:20, 2:21, 3:6. 3:6. 19:15. 19:20. 20:2, 21:6 murder [58] - 45:22, 49:28, 50:15, 51:15, 51:16, 52:23, 54:20, 55:5, 59:10, 59:16, 59:18, 59:19, 59:20, 59:21, 60:1, 60:9, 60:28, 61:1, 61:14, 62:5, 63:26, 76:11, 76:15, 80:15, 83:26, 84:3, 85:14, 88:24, 89:1. 90:8. 93:23. 98:17, 99:14, 100:23, 102:9, 102:24, 103:25, 106:12, 107:15, 107:20, 107:29, 108:1, 108:27, 110:1, 110:10, 110:28, 111:6, 128:1, 136:14, 141:5, 143:12, 159:23, 170:26, 177:1, 179:27, 180:18, 180:25, 180:27 murdered [5] - 50:8,

173:6

141:12 MURPHY [2] - 2:18, 3:7 **must** [3] - 61:29, 118:19, 162:19 mutterings [1] - 28:4 MÍCHEÁL [1] - 2:18 Mícheál [1] - 21:19 N nailed [1] - 157:3 name [3] - 4:12, 6:16, 46:1 named [1] - 1:25 namely [1] - 154:13 names [1] - 27:24 narrative [1] - 27:17 **narrow** [1] - 86:16 nature [3] - 106:14, 106:17, 152:1 near [1] - 68:9 nearly [1] - 156:13 necessarily [3] -131:21, 131:26, 131:28 necessary [4] -58:27, 141:13, 152:28, 163:21 necessitate [1] -106:20 need [9] - 12:23, 12:24, 17:11, 51:4, 52:11, 86:27, 128:13, 153:25, 182:4 needed [14] - 9:10, 9:16, 17:20, 42:19, 52:2, 52:19, 52:20, 52:23. 119:18. 136:11, 136:16, 143:8, 160:25, 163:18 needn't [3] - 21:21, 26:9. 75:15 needs [1] - 61:5 negative [1] - 41:3 nervous [5] - 55:28, 121:19, 121:20, 121:22, 127:6 neutral [1] - 142:27 **never** [10] - 44:10, 47:14, 47:16, 75:11, 119:23, 121:3,

123:24, 124:10,

124:11, 167:15

73:26, 106:28

news [7] - 42:26,

7:15

nevertheless [1] -

new [4] - 14:5, 14:22,

138:21 60:14 82.22 - 13:25 65:11 181:9 50:27

42:27, 49:27, 50:6, 50:8, 56:29, 58:17 next [26] - 11:26, 14:2, 26:23, 30:11, 37:24, 56:6, 59:7, 87:11, 97:13, 118:14, 118:22, 119:7, 123:28, 125:11, 126:14, 127:4, 133:28, 135:6, 144:2, 154:21, 155:14, 167:27, 169:26, 176:20, 183:29 night [7] - 107:28, 107:29, 109:23, 109:24, 109:27, 110:10, 110:27 nine [1] - 143:26 nobody [7] - 61:5, 75:6, 81:6, 81:7, 81:8, 166:4, 182:18 nobody's [3] - 164:4, 164:6, 164:8 Noel [3] - 23:20, 85:18, 91:27 non [12] - 8:5, 8:9, 8:24, 9:20, 13:25. 18:13, 18:14, 18:26, 60:14, 65:11, 82:22, Non [1] - 29:26 non-attendance [1] non-correlation [1] non-face-to-face [1] non-fatal [1] - 138:21 Non-Fatal [1] - 29:26 non-medical [7] -8:5, 8:9, 8:24, 9:20, 18:13, 18:14, 18:26 non-reading [1] nonetheless [1] **norm** [1] - 49:15 normal [2] - 49:12, not" [1] - 125:18 note [20] - 15:10, 15:13, 17:24, 19:3, 19:5, 19:7, 34:29, 45:29, 109:25, 115:2, 115:4, 122:12, 126:3, 128:18, 161:6, 161:8, 173:10, 173:12, 173:14, 176:5 noted [3] - 103:16, 120:7, 124:8

52:19, 53:16, 108:13,

notepaper [1] - 42:2 notes [13] - 1:25, 15:10, 53:20, 56:1, 108:5, 108:7, 108:16, 108:17, 114:16, 115:28, 119:6, 125:21, 169:27 nothing [8] - 49:19, 64:6, 64:17, 148:26, 155:23, 156:8, 171:11, 182:7 Nothing [1] - 100:14 **NOTICE** [1] - 4:7 notice [4] - 4:19, 56:15, 172:20, 172:24 notwithstanding [1] November [57] -35:26, 36:9, 38:12, 38:24, 39:29, 40:10, 40:18, 40:22, 41:11, 41:20, 41:28, 44:17, 45:9, 45:10, 45:21, 45:24, 48:14, 51:13, 53:8, 62:23, 64:16, 64:17, 67:13, 69:6, 71:11, 71:16, 72:18, 75:13, 76:7, 76:14, 76:26, 86:8, 88:13, 91:13, 91:22, 99:22, 105:26, 107:15, 107:22, 113:8, 115:22, 118:14, 121:8, 123:4, 131:15, 135:16, 138:25, 154:24, 159:29, 161:10, 162:12, 163:4, 163:7, 163:13, 163:28 number [13] - 8:29, 38:1, 81:29, 82:1, 82:6, 89:13, 91:18, 107:18, 138:8, 156:3, 169:11, 174:6, 174:7 numerous [4] -13:29, 14:23, 140:16, 172:9 nut [1] - 156:22 **NYHAN**[1] - 3:5 **Nyhan** [43] - 26:4, 26:5, 28:17, 41:15, 41:18, 41:27, 56:16, 69:9, 69:12, 69:18, 69:25, 69:29, 80:12, 80:22, 81:1, 81:9, 81:10, 81:17, 90:23, 90:24, 95:1, 95:5, 95:24, 97:19, 97:20, 100:26, 110:17, 110:26, 111:8,

111:11, 112:13, 113:12, 122:19, 124:22, 124:24, 130:24, 131:6, 132:18, 143:4, 149:26, 159:16, 167:17 Nyhan's [1] - 76:18 NÍ [2] - 2:11, 3:6 NÓRA [1] - 2:11

0

o'clock [6] - 114:1, 114:19, 114:20, 114:22, 116:10, 117:4 **O'DWYER** [1] - 2:10 O'Higgins [16] -19:17, 20:6, 20:8, 21:10, 21:19, 26:29, 27:5, 27:15, 48:4, 115:1, 131:16, 133:9, 152:25, 178:22, 181:29, 183:23 O'HIGGINS [47] -2:18, 5:5, 20:9, 20:15, 20:25, 21:16, 21:18, 26:27, 27:16, 31:23, 38:2, 38:4, 48:5, 79:23. 80:9. 89:17. 89:19, 104:21, 107:4, 107:13, 115:11, 132:3, 132:22, 132:28, 133:3, 133:10, 148:21, 148:26, 148:29, 149:24, 151:13, 153:28, 154:3, 157:23, 159:18, 165:9, 173:27, 178:6, 178:20, 178:24, 179:4, 179:9, 179:11, 179:15, 180:8, 183:27, 184:28 O'Sullivan [63] -50:20, 51:12, 51:13, 52:25, 53:7, 54:8, 55:13, 56:17, 57:3, 57:8, 59:12, 63:6, 63:10. 63:19. 64:5. 64:23, 65:23, 66:3, 67:10, 67:12, 67:19, 67:25, 67:28, 68:2, 69:27, 70:6, 70:14, 71:7, 71:13, 71:15, 72:17, 72:25, 75:11, 75:27, 76:2, 77:11, 78:19, 80:5, 80:26, 86:12. 86:21. 87:23. 117:19, 128:3, 128:5,

128:19, 128:28,
129:21, 129:23,
130:20, 131:20,
132:25, 133:13,
133:20, 133:26,
134:3, 134:7, 134:14,
134:18, 134:26,
135:8, 135:17, 135:23
O'Sullivan's [1] 88:12
objected [1] - 33:21
objective [1] - 51:7
obligation [1] 165:16
observation [1] 95:29

observation [1] 95:29
obtain [1] - 120:23
obtained [4] - 22:3,
22:6, 23:20, 148:14
obtaining [1] - 32:25
obvious [5] - 111:7,
132:1, 132:26,
132:29, 133:2
obviously [22] 33:13, 34:5, 35:7,
35:8, 40:19, 41:23,

42:17, 42:26, 44:9, 50:15, 51:29, 52:18, 71:29, 88:19, 108:24, 108:26, 135:27, 146:28, 149:15, 180:13, 183:10, 184:23

occasion [19] - 25:7.

25:28, 25:29, 40:4, 44:25, 45:16, 45:28, 48:13, 49:14, 49:21, 56:14, 110:23, 128:29, 129:2, 129:3, 129:11, 129:20, 146:15, 159:14

47:23 occasioned [1] -162:9

occasionally [1] -

occasions [4] - 36:22, 109:28, 138:8, 140:16

occupational [1] - 12:2

occur [2] **-** 49:19, 61:4

occurred [7] - 15:22, 16:5, 17:28, 66:17, 66:19, 66:20, 67:12 October [30] - 32:12.

October [30] - 32:12, 32:17, 35:18, 36:6, 36:7, 36:21, 36:22, 36:24, 36:26, 37:13, 37:20, 38:8, 40:3,

40:13, 41:19, 46:8, 46:10, 70:25, 71:5, 71:10, 73:13, 73:16, 89:23, 154:9, 155:2, 155:10, 155:21, 167:21, 167:27, 180:18

October/November 11 - 167:4

odd [1] - 71:25 OF [11] - 1:1, 1:7, 1:11, 1:12, 2:3, 2:18, 4:7, 4:8 off-the-hook [2] -

102:19, 102:21

Offences [1] - 29:26

offences [2] - 102:4,

138:22 offer [3] - 45:18, 61:13, 61:16 offering [2] - 24:26, 164:16

offers [1] - 12:16

Office [4] - 37:9, 91:2, 91:4, 91:7 office [43] - 35:11, 37:2, 39:15, 54:15, 55:23, 55:28, 56:26, 59:7, 60:23, 62:4, 63:13, 63:28, 63:29, 66:6, 66:28, 66:29,

70:15, 71:19, 74:8, 78:10, 79:29, 113:24, 115:14, 115:15, 115:16, 115:17, 121:14, 133:22,

67:4, 68:24, 69:1,

69:6, 69:7, 70:6, 70:8,

150:19, 162:19, 162:22, 164:1, 165:23, 167:22,

180:27 **OFFICE** [1] - 2:22

Officer [1] - 91:11 officer [8] - 17:29, 34:15, 35:28, 91:27, 91:29, 155:1, 155:22, 160:12

officers [9] - 16:5, 49:26, 60:11, 79:28, 80:23, 102:2, 102:26, 106:8, 161:12 officers' [1] - 102:12 offices [1] - 51:18

official [1] - 37:8 often [1] - 74:27 omnibus [1] - 6:22 ON [5] - 1:4, 1:8,

1:17, 6:1 **once** [1] - 176:7

one [35] - 6:16, 6:26, 17:13, 18:29, 19:25, 20:3, 23:8, 25:18, 26:23, 26:25, 35:20, 36:25, 41:21, 60:2, 66:12, 74:24, 79:25, 93:16, 110:18, 112:2, 112:8, 115:14, 115:15, 126:15,

131:2, 131:5, 140:19, 143:25, 145:7, 160:24, 162:6, 175:14 one-liner [1] - 126:15

ongoing [4] - 24:21, 46:12, 105:6, 171:15 onwards [1] - 136:6 open [6] - 119:21, 120:4, 120:16.

120:22, 130:7 **opened** [3] - 17:2, 93:6, 150:5

operate [1] - 59:18 operated [1] - 170:2 operation [2] -

33:18, 38:18 **opinion** [4] - 16:13, 175:12, 175:27, 176:21

opportunity [1] -21·1

opposite [2] - 72:5, 182:16

opted [1] - 72:29 oral [1] - 51:26 orally [1] - 161:10 ordeal [1] - 43:6

oppress [1] - 160:10

order [16] - 17:5, 17:19, 22:4, 22:16, 22:25, 23:20, 32:18, 32:26, 40:8, 98:25, 113:26, 137:20,

139:17, 151:2, 151:10 ORDER [1] - 4:7 ordered [1] - 39:21 ORDERED [2] - 4:12,

ordinary [6] - 16:15, 16:21, 16:22, 18:3, 18:16. 18:23

organisation [2] -81:4, 147:18

organised [1] - 32:13 organising [1] -39:13

original [5] - 47:9, 92:29, 117:23, 117:26, 118:24 originally [1] -159:11

OSMOND [1] - 2:22 OTHER [1] - 1:2 otherwise [4] - 11:4, 33:17, 81:13, 155:27 ought [10] - 98:7, 142.1 144.19 145:14, 147:21, 147:29, 148:22, 149:5, 152:14, 167:8 oughtn't [1] - 166:6 ourselves [2] -118:23, 136:1 outcome [1] - 158:22 outline [5] - 98:25, 127:26, 137:21, 139:17, 150:6 outlined [2] - 80:25, outlines [2] - 127:22, 154:12 outlining [3] - 94:18, 94:27, 95:2 outrank [1] - 79:16 outset [3] - 86:16, 106:26, 167:18 outside [3] - 35:16, 38:28, 168:1 overall [9] - 11:24, 18:12, 79:2, 80:27, 99:6, 101:18, 101:20, 166:23 overview [2] - 139:1 own [29] - 9:1, 9:3, 9:15, 37:12, 44:18, 44:25, 44:26, 45:2, 45:12, 45:16, 45:25, 46:26, 49:7, 50:17, 58:18, 87:6, 88:2, 108:29, 124:2, 124:11, 126:22, 129:16, 137:24, 140:6, 161:11, 174:24, 174:25, 177:28, 180:9

Р

packed [1] - 60:3 PAGE [1] - 5:2 page [75] - 6:22, 6:28, 10:7, 10:9, 10:17, 11:26, 11:27, 13:13, 13:14, 14:2, 14:27, 15:4, 15:7, 15:9, 15:10, 15:24, 15:26, 19:1, 26:17, 26:19, 27:6, 27:7, 27:20, 29:18, 37:17, 37:18, 54:8, 54:10, 62:29, 73:10, 73:14, 73:15, 73:17, 83:2, 89:15, 89:22, 94:4, 94:5, 98:1, 104:23, 104:26, 122:13, 123:6, 125:3, 125:11, 129:26, 130:2, 137:3, 137:4, 137:7, 139:7, 143:21, 143:25, 144:2, 150:8, 150:11, 150:17, 151:14, 152:3, 152:6, 154:4, 154:5, 155:14, 172:2, 174:10, 175:7, 178:6, 178:7, 178:28 pages [2] - 10:7, 37:29 Paper [1] - 135:28 paper [3] - 57:27, 122:21, 126:29 papers [3] - 163:11, 166:27, 167:1 paragraph [23] -10:10, 10:18, 13:14, 14:3, 17:27, 29:28, 30:22, 83:5, 91:18, 98:6, 104:29, 127:4, 137:7, 139:3, 154:21, 155:14, 155:15, 158:24, 175:29, 178:28, 179:1, 179:16, 183:29 paragraphs [1] -54:11 pardon [10] - 62:18, 69:11, 82:27, 84:16, 108:6, 128:7, 129:1, 131:4, 175:2, 175:23 parent [1] - 119:10 parent-teacher [1] -119:10 parlance [1] - 98:15 part [25] - 12:14, 63:21, 68:6, 73:12, 75:28, 76:1, 76:2, 79:20, 80:26, 85:12, 111:26, 116:20, 118:4, 127:18, 138:14, 140:7, 141:20, 145:5, 166:17, 171:5, 171:6, 171:10, 175:14, 183:18, 183:19

partially [1] - 58:7

participate [1] -

participated [1] -

particular [7] -

16:24, 23:15, 93:12,

59:26

24:9

134:6, 134:10, 134:17, 147:23 particularly [3] -19:1, 27:1, 180:18 partly [11] - 176:27, 177:16, 177:29, 178:2, 179:29, 180:11, 181:12, 181:14, 181:27, 182:12 partner [6] - 22:8, 24:15, 30:8, 38:25, 96:23, 179:26 PARTNERS [1] party [2] - 4:17, 80:4 pass [2] - 124:7, 155:12 passage [4] - 7:1, 60:15, 147:24, 172:28 PASSED[1] - 1:3 passed [3] - 85:8, 85:28 **past** [3] - 30:17, 117:17, 140:16 pasted [1] - 73:21 pasting [1] - 82:2 PATRICK[1] - 2:7 patrol [1] - 31:3 **PAUL**[1] - 2:26 Paul [1] - 6:16 pause [2] - 91:16, 155:5 pay [3] - 10:20, 11:2, 11:21 **PC** [1] - 127:15 pejoratively [2] -63:22, 175:9 pending [1] - 16:22 penultimate [1] -154:5 people [25] - 34:5, 60:1, 61:28, 65:20, 74:27, 78:10, 87:3, 87:4, 87:25, 88:29, 89:8. 89:13. 93:7. 93:11. 94:11. 96:4. 97:22, 103:14, 132:16, 132:17, 146:1, 146:4, 146:27, 182:15, 184:29 perceived [1] -128:23 percent [1] - 145:7 perfectly [2] - 50:27, 149.1 perhaps [4] - 25:24, 94:8, 180:22, 180:25

143:1, 163:28, 164:3, 166:5, 166:7, 166:20, 175:10, 178:17 **periods** [1] - 181:3 permitting [1] - 6:15 perpetrated [1] -11:25 persist [1] - 82:18 persisting [1] - 85:22 Person [1] - 29:27 person [19] - 9:9, 30:1, 35:4, 46:23, 61:8, 63:27, 70:26, 88:18, 121:11, 121:12, 131:5, 132:17, 138:22, 146:6, 146:7, 147:11, 182:5 personal [2] - 43:7, 131:27 personally [4] -28:11, 52:2, 179:23, 180:2 **personnel** [1] - 60:2 perspective [7] -76:25, 86:5, 102:11, 146:23, 146:25, 156:6 persuade [1] - 25:12 pertaining [4] -24:11, 25:19, 61:10, 97:12 pertinent [2] - 7:12, **PETER** [1] - 2:5 Phillips [6] - 120:8, 158:5, 158:28, 159:11, 160:12, 160:15 philosophical [1] -109:6 phone [6] - 43:27. 69:29, 108:1, 110:11, 119:4, 123:22 phoned [3] - 107:28, 110:19, 168:10 photocopied [2] -43:17, 47:8 phrase [1] - 80:20 phrased [2] - 83:11, 144.8 physically.. [1] -94:15 physiological [1] -122:29 picked [1] - 178:21 picture [6] - 22:23, 87:10, 88:6, 104:14, 120:15, 171:13 pieces [1] - 168:25

pikestaff [1] - 135:10

place [7] - 43:12, 61:28, 67:6, 157:5, 167:14, 173:4, 182:21 placed [1] - 65:17 plain [1] - 135:10 planning [1] - 57:16 platform [1] - 75:22 play [1] - 86:11 plea [4] - 43:4, 43:5, 43:15, 123:15 pleaded [1] - 42:22 pleased [2] - 65:29, 166:17 **plural** [1] - 54:5 point [21] - 7:11, 9:7, 18:10, 41:4, 42:22, 79:8, 89:7, 89:21, 97:25, 114:8, 116:29, 132:1, 153:6, 157:27, 159:19, 159:29, 162:16, 170:6, 170:16, 175:26, 182:1 pointed [2] - 112:16, 113:5 pointing [2] - 76:28, 151.9 points [4] - 106:1. 128:18, 153:8, 156:6 police [4] - 69:6, 121:14, 141:22, 147:18 policing [5] - 51:18, 54:15, 55:23, 78:28, 103:25 **poorly** [2] - 56:18, 56:27 portion [1] - 14:28 portions [1] - 122:16 posed [1] - 136:12 position [39] - 9:11, 21:10, 22:7, 50:17, 56:9, 58:19, 60:21, 63:18, 63:23, 80:10, 86:10, 86:14, 86:15, 86:18, 95:20, 105:14, 105:15, 105:16, 105:18, 105:19, 106:3, 108:29, 114:9, 127:13, 127:24, 127:25, 128:14, 128:16, 132:6, 133:17, 137:24, 163:26, 164:16, 166:19, 168:7, 169:16, 181:22, 183:12 positive [1] - 123:22 **possessed** [1] - 55:3 possession [20] -

77:2, 90:7, 90:16,

period [12] - 25:2,

48:9, 49:28, 94:13,

90:17, 91:5, 94:28, 130:15, 136:13, 139:19, 139:28, 141:11, 144:17, 144:19, 144:27, 144:28, 145:2, 145:12, 145:13, 152:8, 152:14 possibility [2] -109:2, 149:29 possible [12] - 31:21, 41:17, 51:8, 62:8, 88:11, 119:13, 119:26, 119:27, 130:6, 140:23, 165:18, 165:25 possibly [9] - 8:8, 47:21, 48:25, 52:19, 64:11, 64:12, 124:21, 124:23, 167:12 potential [2] - 62:8, 127.19 power [1] - 127:13 powers [1] - 142:4 **PP's** [1] - 115:16 practicable [1] -151:24 practical [2] - 32:11, 151:7 practitioner [1] -9:16 pragmatic [1] - 32:7 **pre** [2] - 167:25, 169.12 pre-prepared [2] -167:25, 169:12 precipitated [1] -179:19 precise [2] - 51:23, 52:8 precisely [1] - 31:2 predetermined [1] -149:27 predicament [2] -180:6, 183:29 prefer [1] - 182:29 preferred [2] -138:22, 174:1 preferring[1]-151:29 preliminary [7] -39:9, 98:13, 106:2, 106:18, 106:22, 152:23, 154:17 prepare [2] - 64:19, 67:20 prepared [9] - 39:22, 40:9, 57:26, 58:7, 67:21, 67:24, 67:27, 167:25, 169:12

preparing [3] -41:24, 68:2, 81:25 prescribed [1] -174:29 present [4] - 31:27, 40:5, 45:4, 45:6 presentation [2] -174:15, 179:18 presentation.. [1] -178:29 presented [1] - 147:1 PRESIDENT [2] -1:12, 2:3 press [5] - 76:6, 76:13, 76:22, 76:27, 160:3 pressing [1] - 51:4 pressure [1] - 36:18 presumably [7] -42:26, 65:5, 66:2, 68:14, 68:19, 70:9, 101:25 presume [6] - 34:15, 64:4, 75:18, 82:16, 163:1, 168:16 pretty [3] - 61:29, 167:5, 184:17 prevent [3] - 53:18, 53:22, 108:15 prevented[1] -180:25 prevention[1] previous [4] - 27:25, 92:18, 113:7, 184:3 previously [3] - 8:4, 41:14, 172:13 primarily [1] - 128:5 primary [1] - 12:22 print [1] - 19:22 prison [9] - 23:24, 24:3, 26:8, 36:13, 38:14, 44:14, 105:6, 123:26, 179:28 private [1] - 38:27 proactive [1] - 37:7 problem [9] - 6:25, 19:20. 19:27. 20:26. 21:8, 48:4, 50:29, 159:27, 182:9 problems [2] - 51:22, 149:3 procedure [1] procedures [6] -13:18, 170:2, 170:5,

170:8, 170:9, 170:10

proceed [10] - 20:6,

21:3, 21:10, 23:16,

38:11, 48:3, 99:3,

106:9, 165:19, 165:27 proceedings [2] -10:3, 76:18 process [33] - 7:18, 8:26, 9:13, 9:22, 15:7, 17:6, 17:25, 71:22, 73:9, 85:17, 93:10, 117:23, 141:2, 143:29, 148:15, 153:20, 156:14, 156:20, 158:3, 158:26, 160:18, 162:23, 162:25, 162:29, 166:23, 166:24, 166:25, 167:15, 170:2, 170:11, 170:15, 171:14, 174:5 processed [1] -157:29 processes [3] - 8:26, 12:3, 13:22 processing [3] -128:6, 128:8, 166:9 procured [1] - 13:28 procurement [1] -127:27 produce [2] - 22:17, 119:20 produced [4] - 47:9, 57:24, 65:2, 122:19 professional [9] -50:28, 51:22, 52:27, 58:10, 58:19, 58:21, 62:9, 62:21, 95:26 professionally [5] -50:11, 50:18, 51:6, 52:2, 93:24 profitable [1] -153:11 progress [1] - 163:3 **prohibited** [1] - 4:15 prompted [1] - 86:19 prompting [1] -132:7 promptly [2] - 30:27, 116:27 pronged [1] - 145:23 proper [4] - 18:18, 41:23, 46:20, 88:2 properly [7] - 102:6, 102:7, 103:18, 103:19, 104:12, 111:15, 112:29 property [1] - 39:9 proportionate [4] -158:8, 159:1, 159:6, 159:10 prosecuted [1] -

prosecuting [2] -39:16, 146:26 prosecution [6] -33:9, 95:17, 100:13, 105:7, 105:29, 137:14 Prosecutions [1] -25:21 protected [9] - 82:9, 82:13, 82:19, 102:29, 104:3, 104:5, 104:6, 136:3 PROTECTED [2] -1:1, 1:2 protection [30] -32:26, 63:15, 64:1, 64:8, 65:18, 66:4, 66:14, 69:3, 70:4, 70:18, 70:22, 70:24, 70:28, 71:3, 71:11, 72:2, 74:10, 75:1, 75:9, 78:9, 79:28, 81:2, 128:11, 131:27, 133.14 133.23 134:9, 134:19, 179:21, 181:1 protracted [1] -14:10 protracting [1] -136:7 prove [1] - 12:8 proved [1] - 17:26 **provide** [9] - 11:6, 11:29, 17:16, 17:20, 49:25, 74:2, 84:1, 92:2. 128:10 provided [16] -41:29, 49:24, 74:1, 84:11, 137:13, 137:28, 139:29, 140:9, 167:6, 167:25, 169:13, 170:21, 170:22, 171:9, 171:13, 171:19 providing [2] -17:20, 173:13 provision [1] -179:21 prudent [1] - 39:14 psychiatric [4] -175:12, 175:27, 176:21, 178:4 psychiatrist [8] - 9:7, 174:21, 177:15, 177:28, 178:2, 180:10, 181:19, 184:2 **pub** [1] - 68:9

Public [1] - 25:21

PULSE [19] - 20:7,

20:12, 20:16, 20:21,

pull [1] - 127:1

21:12, 26:11, 29:10, 33:2, 33:4, 36:23, 37:22, 92:21, 96:17, 97:10, 97:11, 97:12, 98:3, 102:7, 138:1 purged [1] - 24:4 purporting [2] -95:15, 100:11 purpose [12] - 23:25, 35:22, 54:20, 60:8, 76:29, 77:4, 102:27, 108:2, 110:5, 111:26, 127:18, 145:5 purposes [2] -115:26, 142:20 **PURSUANT**[1] - 4:7 pursuant [1] - 23:21 pursue [4] - 9:18, 25:15, 48:17, 48:26 pursued [2] - 7:16, 8:20 push [1] - 164:1 put [29] - 20:18, 23:11, 29:10, 31:7, 40:29, 43:6, 46:20, 53:13, 71:27, 72:20, 73:1, 73:26, 74:17, 77:20, 78:11, 79:27, 80:1, 81:11, 81:29, 82:1, 86:26, 96:16, 97:12, 98:3, 98:7, 122:29, 144:26, 159:25, 179:15 puts [4] - 31:20, 56:22, 96:2, 156:10 putting [6] - 26:11, 31:1, 42:5, 44:14. 119:27, 123:26 puzzled [2] - 96:27, 97:4 puzzling [2] - 77:27, 78:2 Q

qualify [3] - 109:3, 113:14, 163:9 **quality** [1] - 103:24 quarters [2] - 125:5, 125.8 QUAY [2] - 2:29, 3:7 queries [1] - 150:19 questioned [2] -24:6, 34:1 questioning [5] -23:26, 67:5, 67:6, 148:16, 148:17 questionnaire [2] -158:4, 165:6

33:19

questions [17] -6:15, 6:19, 7:2, 7:24, 8:28, 24:11, 62:12, 66:3, 67:2, 67:8, 133:11, 147:10, 163:18, 164:27, 164:29, 174:7, 177:21 **quibble** [1] - 170:7 quick [1] - 174:16 quickly [3] - 31:21, 163:26, 165:18 Quigley [6] - 174:9, 174:11, 174:22, 179:3, 179:5, 179:9 Quigley's [1] -178:20 quite [9] - 24:5, 41:7, 61:29, 93:18, 136:23, 149:10. 164:3. 172:24, 174:17

R

racket [1] - 67:24 racking [4] - 53:16, 108:14, 108:29, 109:8 raise [4] - 86:22. 88:2, 88:4, 88:8 raised [6] - 87:6, 87:7, 150:19, 171:20, 173:1, 180:26 ran [1] - 68:7 rang [7] - 53:11, 53:12, 107:27, 109:22, 109:24, 117:17, 130:5 rank [1] - 151:24 ranking [2] - 13:8, rather [4] - 52:8, 98:19, 103:20, 118:3 rationale [2] -136:28, 147:6 re [1] - 149:9 re-interview [1] -149:9 reached [3] - 94:10, 106:2, 137:5 reaching [1] - 98:29 react [1] - 41:5 read [46] - 7:2, 39:5, 45:8, 50:2, 50:4, 50:13, 50:15, 52:1, 58:25, 62:11, 62:28, 65:11, 65:12, 96:12, 108:5, 108:7, 124:26, 126:17, 126:23, 135:7, 138:27, 140:17, 142:17,

142:18, 146:25, 147:23, 147:25, 147:27, 148:4, 148:5, 148:8, 148:12, 148:17, 148:18, 148:23, 149:3, 149:5, 149:12, 151:1, 151:10, 151:15, 155:24, 155:28, 156:7, 160:26 readily [4] - 97:14, 137:19, 139:16, 143:3 reading [9] - 65:10, 65:11, 100:8, 131:24, 131:27, 133:28, 147:3, 148:11, 178:4 reads [2] - 155:16, 179:16 real [8] - 142:2, 144:20, 145:15, 147:2, 147:10, 152:15, 155:19, 155:29

realisation [1] -82.24 realise [1] - 87:3 really [17] - 31:10, 41:2, 42:12, 44:2, 48:7, 55:26, 56:10, 64:18, 65:12, 75:22, 108:20, 109:6, 111:27, 117:12, 152:27, 162:2, 169:6 reason [15] - 48:27, 49:5, 66:1, 67:1, 80:2, 80:3, 140:12, 140:19, 153:3, 162:1, 166:28, 169:7, 169:8, 182:21, 182:27 reasonable [11] -

106:24, 114:9, 140:24, 140:28, 152:22, 155:5, 168:7, 170:1 reasonably [2] -142:25, 163:25 reasoning [3] - 71:2, 71:10, 71:13 reasons [6] - 66:25, 70:21, 89:8, 107:27, 134:25, 136:26

50:27, 95:19, 95:28,

reassure [3] - 52:5, 53:25, 160:5 receipt [2] - 69:3, 172:4 receive [1] - 164:20

received [15] - 8:24, 10:12, 13:21, 18:3, 25:20, 36:26, 36:27, 51:9, 60:26, 63:15, 67:15, 109:29, 110:4, 116:26, 165:15
receiving [4] - 13:2, 60:8, 69:14, 158:9
recent [1] - 154:15
recently [1] - 39:11
recipient [5] - 71:22, 73:9, 93:10, 93:16, 129:6
recipient's [1] - 71:19

recklessness [2] -145:28 recognised [2] -

149:17, 184:15
recollect [26] - 51:23,
59:15, 84:16, 85:3,
109:19, 109:27,
110:9, 110:13,

110:22, 111:3, 111:10, 111:16, 111:20, 112:4, 112:10, 112:15, 113:9, 114:11, 114:14, 114:19,

116:22, 118:5, 118:26, 121:29, 129:19, 129:25 recollecting [1] -

131:14 recollection [15] -53:13, 55:9, 84:23,

108:9, 109:11, 109:21, 116:11, 118:29, 119:6, 122:8, 130:28, 131:11, 169:6, 174:18, 176:24 recollections [1] -

140:29 recommendation [2] - 16:12, 139:26 recommendations

[2] - 12:3, 90:6 recommended [3] -138:20, 139:20, 165:23

recommending [2] -9:3, 140:25 record [8] - 47:3,

111:25, 120:17, 122:7, 123:9, 127:18, 127:29, 135:15 recorded [2] - 122:7,

134:21 recording [1] - 128:14

records [15] - 20:8, 20:12, 20:16, 20:21, 21:12, 36:24, 38:9,

42:14, 45:22, 115:2, 125:3, 125:25, 138:1, 138:3, 182:26 recovery [1] - 183:14

redact [1] - 47:27 reduced [1] - 43:3 refer [8] - 14:21, 16:5, 17:29, 41:2, 74:27, 94:23, 138:2, 175:15

referable [3] - 26:14, 33:4, 37:13 reference [15] -

13:24, 14:20, 27:20, 59:28, 65:3, 77:7, 89:27, 96:3, 105:14, 133:19, 151:14, 155:6, 172:19, 178:20, 178:22 references [1] -

47:27
referred [10] - 8:4,
51:10, 52:26, 91:18,
140:14, 172:9,
172:14, 174:20,
175:29, 176:23
referring [21] - 8:23

referring [21] - 8:23, 11:14, 11:23, 12:21, 12:25, 14:13, 15:12, 21:12, 47:22, 48:21, 48:24, 51:5, 51:24, 74:26, 96:15, 97:16, 105:20, 112:22, 115:28, 142:15,

115:28, 142:15, 160:29 refers [3] - 56:19, 133:20, 137:5 refusal [2] - 128:10

refused [6] - 63:16, 64:2, 70:3, 74:10, 81:3, 133:15

refusing [3] - 12:16, 13:9, 65:17 regard [30] - 8:7,

10:2, 11:2, 13:29,

18:5, 37:2, 41:6, 43:7, 44:23, 60:19, 113:3, 117:13, 124:12, 129:7, 130:20, 131:20, 131:25, 132:25, 133:26,

148:13, 150:19, 154:23, 159:20, 164:11, 166:5,

134:3, 146:19,

166:11, 172:7, 180:15 regarded [1] - 36:28 regarding [11] -

16:10, 36:29, 49:7, 119:16, 122:19, 122:28, 136:12, 142:27, 155:1, 168:2, 171:21

REGISTRAR [1] - 2:5

144:13, 151:15, 151:27, 172:20 **Regulations** [3] -10:27, 10:29, 11:6 **regulations** [3] -144:14, 149:25, 153:21

regulation [4] -

Reilly [3] - 174:27, 175:13, 176:23

Reilly's [1] - 175:7 **rejected** [2] - 78:9, 79:29

relate [2] - 45:27, 124:18

related [5] - 11:3, 11:22, 43:20, 124:19, 175:4

relating [3] - 36:2, 141:12, 167:19 relation [120] - 8:4, 8:24, 9:20, 12:9, 15:8, 16:28, 18:2, 18:26, 23:5, 23:26, 24:6, 33:18, 34:1, 35:24, 38:18, 45:2, 45:15, 46:11, 47:16, 49:3, 49:13, 50:7, 52:12, 52:21, 54:27, 55:10, 56:2, 56:14, 58:7,

58:24, 59:21, 60:9,

60:13, 61:1, 62:10, 64:7, 64:18, 65:25, 67:5, 68:28, 70:7, 70:25, 70:29, 71:4, 71:8, 71:28, 72:1, 75:8, 75:26, 76:3, 76:10, 77:6, 78:13, 78:17, 78:22, 80:27, 82:2, 82:21, 84:19, 85:3, 85:13, 85:26, 85:27, 86:2, 87:4, 88:12, 90:16, 93:11, 96:6, 96:9, 96:14, 96:28, 98:9, 100:3.

96:6, 96:9, 96:14, 96:28, 98:9, 100:3, 102:16, 103:1, 103:17, 106:12, 108:10, 108:25, 109:4, 110:1, 113:19, 114:4, 120:28.

121:16, 121:23, 124:29, 125:23, 128:9, 128:22, 128:23, 133:22, 137:17, 138:12, 139:14, 141:3,

141:11, 141:21, remembered [1] -127:10, 127:21, reprise [1] - 138:28 responsible [17] -142:10, 147:1, 162:20 130:15, 130:16, request [17] - 63:15, 12:29, 13:2, 44:13, 137:7, 137:11, 138:4, 148:17, 149:7, remind [2] - 135:29, 63:16, 66:14, 69:3, 65:13, 123:26, 161:14, 162:12, 138:12, 138:20, 176:27, 177:8, 168:13 70:18, 70:22, 70:24, 162:20, 162:27, reminded [6] - 29:17, 139:4, 139:11, 75:11, 79:19, 79:28, 177:29, 178:2, 163:9, 170:7, 171:20, 139:16, 139:28, 179:29, 180:11, 32:24, 36:23, 40:16, 81:2, 84:1, 117:18, 175:3, 175:4, 177:20, 91:20, 91:24 140:9, 140:16, 118:7, 133:14, 134:9, 181:12, 181:14, 140:19, 141:14, 181:27, 181:28, 177:23, 180:13, reminder [1] - 48:2 134:19 180:20, 180:24, 142:8, 142:15, 182:12, 183:6 requested [14] remit [1] - 169:13 180:28 142:17, 142:18, 30:25, 71:3, 74:14, restained [1] - 26:3 remove [1] - 25:8 Relative [1] - 89:24 143:4, 143:23, 74:22, 75:1, 90:4, restrain [2] - 26:6, repeat [4] - 68:18, 143:29, 145:2, relative [7] - 89:28, 80:22, 106:16, 135:11 90:10, 90:20, 90:23, 28:20 147:22, 149:8, 152:4, 90:7, 91:5, 91:8, 90:26, 127:9, 169:3, restraining [2] reply [3] - 66:9, 154:6, 154:10, 91:21, 92:2, 92:23 169:20. 172:13 28:17, 28:19 150:7, 165:1 154:12, 154:23, relay [10] - 77:10, requesting [2] result [9] - 30:14, Report [9] - 39:22, 155:2, 155:9, 155:25, 120:11, 120:28, 118:6, 168:10 70:27, 95:23, 139:19, 51:11, 51:22, 52:10, 155:28, 158:17, 121:1, 129:27, requests [2] - 13:29, 144:17, 144:29, 64:14, 89:24, 92:10, 158:18, 158:21, 130:19, 131:19, 152:9, 158:25, 171:17 100:2, 103:21 75.8 132:24, 133:24, 134:2 158:23, 158:29, require [1] - 48:24 **RESUMED** [2] - 6:1, report [177] - 7:14, 159:12, 160:6, relayed [11] - 36:11, required [2] - 17:5, 107:10 8:16, 9:6, 37:12, 161:19, 170:20, 46:4, 62:23, 65:23, 60:13 retain [1] - 49:25 37:18, 45:5, 45:11, 171:2, 171:4, 171:5, 88:11, 95:6, 120:7, 46:19, 48:6, 49:10, researc [1] - 92:5 reticent [4] - 71:28, 120:12, 122:16, 171:10, 171:16, 49:13, 49:27, 51:1, researched [2] -72:2, 78:13, 78:16 173:16, 173:22, 133:12, 159:19 62:26, 64:18, 71:18, 92:13, 92:17 **retire** [5] - 7:15, 8:19, 175:7. 178:3. 178:4. relaying [3] - 64:14, resentful [2] -9:4, 9:10, 9:17 71:20, 72:7, 72:12, 178:21, 178:24, 64:24 72:14, 72:20, 72:27, 179:24, 180:3 retired [3] - 86:3, 179:4, 180:27, 181:6, release [6] - 76:6, 73:5, 73:6, 73:9, reservoir [2] - 61:9, 91:28, 141:10 181:19, 182:24, 76:14, 76:22, 76:27, 73:11, 73:15, 73:20, 61:17 retirement [9] - 7:8, 183:28 160:3 73:21, 77:13, 78:12, 7:13, 7:27, 8:1, 8:2, resides [1] - 30:9 released [1] - 32:19 report.. [2] - 90:21, 78:25, 80:1, 80:4, resolute [1] - 25:14 8:7, 8:26, 10:1, 13:22 relevance [4] -80:6, 81:24, 81:26, resolution [1] - 12:4 retreat [1] - 104:13 reported [21] - 46:26, 50:14, 72:18, 86:28, 82:8, 82:12, 82:22, **RESOLUTIONS**[1] retrospective[1] -47:17, 49:20, 57:12, 170:21 82:25, 82:28, 83:2, 121:25 58:6. 63:24. 96:17. relevant [8] - 16:8, 83:3, 83:16, 83:29, resolve [1] - 19:20 return [1] - 32:13 102:5, 109:28, 81:13, 81:15, 81:16, 84:7, 84:8, 84:9, returned [2] - 32:8, resolved [3] - 9:21, 111:23, 129:4, 141:21, 165:12, 84:12, 84:17, 84:20, 32:18 19:24 184:23 137:26, 137:29, 171:4, 174:6 86:26, 87:18, 87:20, returning [2] - 54:7, Resource [1] -138:1, 138:8, 138:25, reliable [1] - 36:28 89:19, 89:27, 90:5, 175:25 150:21 154:15, 159:12, 90:21, 90:24, 90:27, relied [1] - 106:9 resources [5] - 31:5, revealed [1] - 102:4 162:17, 177:27, 184:1 relieved [5] - 43:5, 90:29, 91:9, 91:11, revelation [1] - 135:2 60:5, 165:15, 165:23, reporting [6] - 71:28, 64:4, 64:9, 64:11, 91:17, 91:22, 93:14, 165:26 revelations [1] -72:3. 78:14. 129:4. 93:15, 94:4, 94:18, 65:5 respect [9] - 61:16, 82:11 159:13, 182:11 94:24, 94:27, 95:1, relying [1] - 18:20 74:29, 84:25, 93:20, revert [1] - 165:18 reports [33] - 8:6, 95:8, 97:9, 98:9, remained [2] - 24:2, 151:7, 157:17, review [2] - 13:19, 8:23, 8:29, 9:3, 10:1, 24:3 98:13, 99:6, 99:18, 170:27, 180:17, 149.8 12:8, 12:12, 13:26, 99:19, 99:20, 99:24, remaining [1] - 97:6 180:21 reviewed [1] - 64:29 13:27, 14:26, 18:3, 99:28, 99:29, 101:5, remanded [2] respectfully [3] revisited [1] - 68:16 18:13, 18:25, 23:8, 101:7, 101:11, 27:28, 30:3 98:26, 137:21, 153:7 Richard [1] - 174:9 27:26, 35:20, 41:6, 101:14. 101:29. remarks [1] - 124:12 responded [5] right-hand [6] - 19:3, 49:16, 82:3, 91:8, 102:10, 103:15, remedied [1] -30:27, 110:24, 26:20, 27:10, 29:24, 91:21, 97:15, 97:22, 104:8, 104:16, 117:16 125:29, 163:7, 168:11 83:13, 143:27 100:4, 102:11, 106:9, 104:22, 104:23, remember [21] - 9:1, response [8] - 8:28, Rights [1] - 141:27 129:6, 129:7, 137:20, 104:25, 112:18, 36:25, 46:27, 109:22, 71:1, 71:9, 158:4, rights [1] - 147:7 115:19, 116:19, 139:16, 140:18, 174:6 109:24. 112:21. 164:20, 166:10, ring [2] - 91:23, representation[1] -117:20, 118:3, 118:4, 113:2, 113:17, 115:6, 168:24, 169:28 113:12 151:18 119:19, 120:9, 121:6, 116:2, 117:10, 119:8, responses [1] - 51:9 ringing [7] - 36:15, represented [2] -121:24, 122:10, 119:9, 159:22, responsibilities [1] -108:2, 108:9, 109:27, 30:19, 104:18 122:25, 124:28, 163:11, 165:20, 141:22 110:24, 111:19, representing[1] -124:29, 125:23, 178:1, 178:4, 181:16, responsibility [1] -157:24 6:17 126:7, 126:29, 181:21, 183:10 141:17 rise [2] - 50:28,

151:11 risk [13] - 142:2, 142:5, 144:20, 144:23, 145:15, 145:21, 147:2, 147:11, 147:13, 150:28, 152:16, 155:20, 156:1 ROBINSON [1] -2:12 role [1] - 55:2 room [2] - 41:29, 60:3 root [2] - 177:25, 184:8 round [1] - 160:24 route [3] - 107:29, 110:27, 148:20 routine [2] - 148:14, 148:16 row [1] - 184:9 rule [1] - 146:19 RYAN [3] - 1:11, 2:2, 4.8

S

safely [1] - 13:20 safety [27] - 44:18. 44:25, 44:27, 44:28, 45:3, 45:7, 45:12, 45:16, 45:25, 45:26, 46:26, 49:8, 124:2, 124:3, 124:11, 140:6, 140:23, 155:1, 161:4, 161:11, 179:22 sake [1] - 21:7 sanction [2] - 11:21, 105:11 satisfaction [2] -184:15. 184:16 satisfactorily [1] -184:23 Saulite [126] - 22:1, 22:3, 23:10, 24:17, 24:19, 24:26, 25:12, 28:24, 30:8, 30:13, 30:17, 31:13, 31:27, 32:14, 32:22, 35:19, 38:25, 39:22, 39:28, 41:10, 43:11, 44:17, 45:23, 54:23, 57:12, 57:27, 61:10, 63:14, 63:29, 65:26, 71:4, 71:12, 72:1, 72:15, 72:23, 72:27, 74:10, 74:29, 75:2, 75:9, 77:3, 77:6, 79:7, 80:28, 82:26, 82:29,

86:3, 86:4, 87:5, 88:23, 89:1, 90:8, 91:8, 91:22, 92:10, 92:23, 92:26, 93:1, 93:12, 93:22, 94:13, 95:10, 96:5, 96:10, 96:29, 97:7, 97:14, 98:3, 99:22, 100:1, 100:22, 100:25, 102:5, 102:23, 103:17, 105:5, 105:24, 106:12, 109:5, 121:7, 128:25, 133:15, 134:9, 134:20, 137:13, 137:18, 137:19, 137:28, 138:2, 138:9, 138:14, 139:15, 139:29, 140:5. 140:23, 141:12, 142:11, 142:28, 143:12, 144:18, 144:21. 145:1. 145:16, 147:1, 150:28, 152:10, 152:16, 154:11, 154:14, 154:19, 154:23, 155:2, 155:22, 156:1, 160:22, 161:9, 167.19 177.8 180:22, 180:25 Saulite" [1] - 96:14 Saulite' [1] - 155:20 Saulite's [10] - 35:13, 38:27, 39:8, 56:29, 58:6, 113:1, 122:8, 128:1, 136:13, 176:28 saw [7] - 8:27, 59:16, 60:10, 76:22, 120:17, 159:11. 175:19 **SC** [7] - 2:6, 2:7, 2:10, 2:10, 2:18, 2:18, 2:26 scapegoated [3] -76:8, 76:21, 160:2 scared [2] - 140:3, 154:25

scene [2] - 107:29,

scope [1] - 142:4

scoping [6] - 98:15,

138:29, 139:1, 152:24

screen [4] - 29:18,

73:26, 125:7, 129:26

schedule [1] -

106:14, 106:18,

110:28

156:22

83:9, 83:26, 84:20,

85:13, 85:27, 86:1,

scroll [19] - 37:21, 37:23, 37:28, 38:20, 57:7, 58:4, 73:17, 94:7, 94:9, 104:26, 123:5, 127:4, 137:8, 138:6, 143:25, 150:13, 150:16, 155:15, 178:25 scrolling [1] - 179:7 SEAN [3] - 1:11, 2:2, Sean [1] - 168:19 **SEANAD**[1] - 1:4 seat [1] - 127:7 sec [1] - 38:4 second [9] - 10:10, 14:2, 19:26, 24:10, 83:5, 91:11, 91:17, 94:4, 123:2 secondly [3] - 62:25, 145:19, 147:11 section [5] - 23:21, 26:8, 29:26, 92:5, 138:21 secure [1] - 14:26 security [1] - 115:15 **see** [116] - 6:29, 9:12, 10:6, 10:10, 10:18, 10:24, 11:20, 13:5, 14:3, 14:29, 15:7, 15:9, 15:10, 15:12, 15:13, 16:1, 18:29, 26:15, 26:19, 26:21, 27:17, 27:21, 27:25, 28:13, 29:20, 29:23, 33:6, 36:5, 37:21, 39:27, 40:12, 41:12, 43:24, 45:17, 48:27, 53:17, 56:4, 56:22, 57:7, 57:13, 57:19, 59:8, 60:24, 60:27, 62:7, 64:13, 67:9, 73:15, 73:20, 73:25, 78:11, 82:21, 83:5, 88:4, 89:11, 89:21, 89:22, 93:3, 93:10, 93:28, 94:4, 94:8, 94:9, 98:5, 98:12, 98:13, 98:20, 98:23, 108:14, 110:19, 116:28, 120:6, 121:28, 122:12, 122:18, 122:24, 122:28, 123:6, 123:17, 123:21, 124:5, 125:3, 125:7, 126:14, 126:20, 127:4, 129:27, 130:9, 130:22, 133:18, 139:3, 141:24,

143:20, 147:3, 150:1, 152:6, 153:6, 160:19, 162:5, 164:17, 166:29, 167:3, 168:9, 169:6, 171:3, 175:13, 175:19, 175:21, 175:29, 176:19, 176:23, 176:25, 177:25, 178:26, 179:13, 183:29 seeing [4] - 131:29, 133:1, 133:8, 174:22 **seek** [4] - 16:6, 28:25, 30:13, 85:7 seeking [4] - 25:3, 120:22, 162:10, 168:21 seem [6] - 47:20, 82:17, 109:22, 153:11, 156:23 seemingly [1] - 8:2 **seismic** [2] - 68:25, 89.3 send [9] - 49:10. 49:13, 49:27, 51:1, 51:4, 164:26, 164:27, 164:29, 165:5 sending [3] - 29:15, 36:16, 49:16 senior [12] - 11:29, 12:24, 13:8, 54:21, 60:10, 78:10, 84:26, 85:15, 102:12, 102:26, 106:8, 181:2 sense [6] - 25:7, 32:27, 34:16, 74:23, 82:17, 175:9 sensible [1] - 25:8 sent [10] - 10:1, 12:27, 12:28, 13:3, 13:28, 37:12, 62:25, 115:13, 155:9, 180:27 sentence [8] - 33:17, 38:13, 38:17, 42:20, 98:23, 125:11, 135:7, 176:20 sentences [1] -133:28 sentencing [1] -43:20 separate [2] -116:19, 126:29 separately [1] -168:4 September [4] -31:24, 165:22,

SERGEANT[3] -2:10, 5:3, 6:12 Sergeant [72] - 6:5, 6:29, 16:26, 20:22, 21:18, 27:2, 28:15, 34:5, 37:19, 54:14, 54:25, 55:3, 55:21, 55:22, 56:24, 57:11, 57:24, 57:27, 58:6, 67:28, 79:27, 90:20, 90:21, 90:27, 90:28, 91:13, 92:11, 93:1, 94:17, 94:26, 95:11, 95:24, 100:27, 100:29, 101:27, 102:28, 103:21, 104:7, 109:29, 110:5, 110:7, 113:7, 123:14, 124:1, 125:13, 125:17, 126:17, 126:23, 131:24, 132:13, 138:17, 138:20, 139:27, 140:10, 140:13, 140:17, 144:16, 150:3, 150:4, 152:8, 152:28, 153:7, 154:9, 154:24, 154:29, 155:21, 155:24, 159:26, 178:13, 179:2, 179:13 sergeant [48] - 6:16, 26:28, 29:20, 30:20, 34:8. 37:16. 37:27. 38:6, 38:16, 39:21, 44:17, 46:24, 48:6, 49:23, 54:17, 56:4, 59:1, 61:5, 65:15, 72:7, 73:20, 79:26, 83:5, 86:10, 91:10, 91:16, 93:3, 95:4, 98:12, 99:10, 104:21, 107:13, 124:15, 129:12, 133:11, 133:28, 143:15, 143:28, 151:13, 154:4, 157:23, 161:23, 163:25, 167:21, 172:27, 177:14, 180:8, 183:28 sergeants [1] - 94:28 series [2] - 78:29, 89:13 serious [13] - 7:11, 7:12, 8:15, 11:19, 33:28, 39:2, 50:6, 50:7, 61:14, 78:18, 147:4, 153:13, 180:19

seriously [1] - 78:10

served [6] - 22:17,

174:12, 174:14

sequence [3] -

89:28, 114:12, 116:25

Sequence [1] - 89:23

22:25, 36:3, 163:11, SIM [2] - 43:26, somewhat [2] -141:23, 160:27 129:17, 129:28, 153:2, 176:4 166:27, 172:20 123:22 specifically [11] -130:28, 131:12, **service** [3] - 146:15, similar [4] - 56:6, soon [8] - 51:8, 73:8, 11:23, 12:14, 14:14, 131:18, 131:26, 137:3, 140:6, 141:25, 140:5, 180:21, 180:23 167:1, 172:24 116:27, 119:13, 42:11, 43:14, 63:11, Services [1] - 1:23 similarly [1] - 71:21 130:5, 151:23, 99:11. 108:26. 153:10, 160:16, 108:28, 117:8, 119:16 167:25, 168:1, **SERVICES** [1] - 1:28 simply [5] - 21:5, 165:17, 165:25 99:2, 128:26, 152:20, sorry [87] - 15:23, speech [2] - 154:1, 168:15, 168:22, serving [2] - 38:13, 169:12, 171:5, 174:8, 38:17 161:18 15:24, 15:29, 17:7, 182:23 174:10 speeding [1] -20:8. 20:9. 20:11. set [10] - 7:5, 21:25, SINéAD [1] - 2:7 24:2, 24:5, 26:17, 162:28 Statement [16] -41:9. 101:15. 101:17. sit [1] - 106:6 101:25, 138:12, 26:26, 34:25, 35:8, spelt [1] - 83:3 46:19, 49:18, 57:26, situation [10] -140:8, 153:22, 153:23 24:19, 32:28, 47:26, 40:13, 40:18, 46:4, spend [1] - 21:21 57:28, 58:7, 58:9, 62:29, 70:7, 95:12, setting [2] - 10:8, 71:1, 99:7, 105:10, 47:24, 53:12, 59:24, spoken [2] - 57:14, 61:16, 61:17, 61:23, 95:16, 100:12, 114:6, 162:3 164:1, 177:23, 181:5, 94:10 116:4, 127:27, 140:2, 62:18, 65:10, 65:27, spot [1] - 184:27 **seven** [2] - 143:26, 182:18 66:18, 68:18, 70:28, 158:10 spotlight [5] - 65:6, 171:24 situations [1] -72:6, 75:26, 77:16, statements [8] -65:15, 65:16, 65:19, several [4] - 102:4, 170:25 78:1, 79:25, 79:26, 24:27, 92:7, 92:18, 103:16, 109:28, 149:6 Siuochana [1] -66:1 92:25, 96:20, 138:14, 82:27, 83:4, 84:16, severe [1] - 176:14 100:25 spring [2] - 87:17, 88:28, 97:22, 99:15, 138:16, 161:13 **shaking** [3] - 121:18, six [7] - 10:20, 56:15, 175:10 101:21, 103:2, 104:1, states [4] - 57:8, 121:21, 127:6 113:16, 117:17, stage [1] - 183:27 104:10, 105:17, 137:12, 155:25, 158:5 shall [1] - 151:23 123:11, 166:29, 167:2 stages [1] - 61:23 106:16, 109:16, stating [2] - 58:9, Skerries [2] - 119:10, stamp [3] - 29:22, **SHANE** [1] - 2:18 110:3, 115:1, 115:17, 137:16 **shape** [1] - 124:10 120:21 29:24, 38:8 115:22, 117:24, station [24] - 25:9, skimmed [1] -SHEEHAN [1] - 2:13 **stand** [4] - 43:1, 117:25, 120:12, 32:22, 34:6, 40:12, 122.23 53:1, 53:3, 153:16 **sheet** [1] - 126:29 125:17, 126:21, 40:21, 40:23, 41:28, skip [1] - 30:11 standing [2] - 66:11, **SHELLEY** [1] - 2:19 128:5, 129:5, 129:15, 42:7, 45:4, 62:22, **SHIP** [1] - 2:23 slightly [2] - 20:10, 133:22 131:4, 131:17, 64:15, 87:11, 105:26, SHO [1] - 113:25 84:17 standout [1] - 25:18 131:22, 135:11, 113:25, 114:3, shock [6] - 50:6, slips [1] - 47:23 start [6] - 27:2, 142:21, 144:8, 114:15, 119:11, 35:25, 36:8, 81:25, slowed [1] - 173:4 50:7, 58:16, 62:10, 146:28, 148:27, 119:13, 121:8, 121:9, SMITHFIELD [1] -121:16, 146:20 114:10, 121:22 150:2, 150:12, 154:1, 122:9, 128:2, 184:10 shocked [3] - 53:14, started [5] - 86:22, 161:16, 164:7, Station [13] - 23:15, Smyth [1] - 22:14 87:3, 126:8, 157:29 55:29, 108:12 166:15, 168:13, 25:1, 40:1, 41:11, so.. [2] - 42:13, **starting** [5] - 123:3, shooting [1] - 35:5 169:2, 169:25, 54:13, 55:20, 91:3, short [1] - 49:28 137:7, 139:3, 175:29, 126:27 170:16, 171:14, 91:8, 107:14, 113:28, 183:29 **SOLE** [1] - 2:2 shorthand [2] -173:12, 174:22, 120:5, 127:14, 130:13 startling [6] - 65:28, **solely** [1] - 93:5 134:25, 156:4 179:6, 179:7, 179:8, **stationery** [1] - 57:27 68:19, 86:28, 87:23, solicitor [22] - 22:11, **shortly** [3] - 35:12, 179:10, 181:10, status [1] - 33:21 35:5, 38:24, 57:17, 95:5, 128:19 57:6, 172:21 182:23 statutory [1] - 92:6 starts [4] - 15:5, 91:12, 150:4, 154:11, show [1] - 10:29 sort [6] - 28:6, 55:27, stay [2] - 80:17, 163:7, 164:15, 19:18, 54:8, 143:24 showed [2] - 146:6, 79:15. 116:12. 89:22 164:24, 167:23, starving [2] - 11:11, 146:7 153:27, 182:14 stemmed [1] -168:12, 168:18, 11:16 **shown** [1] - 183:3 sought [10] - 53:25, 164.12 shows [3] - 17:12, 168:21, 169:11, **STATE**[1] - 2:22 71:11, 72:2, 72:24, **stemming** [1] - 80:9 **state** [9] - 74:7, 169:17, 169:27, 18:7, 182:17 120:26, 146:15, stenographic [1] -171:19, 173:7, 173:9, 121:22. 139:17. sick [1] - 162:9 167:5, 170:28, 140:14, 140:18, 173:13, 179:22 sickness [1] - 16:20 171:27, 172:7 stenography [1] -SOLICITOR'S [1] -172:22, 179:28, side [8] - 26:20, sound [1] - 17:21 1:23 182:4, 182:5 27:10, 29:24, 120:24, southern [1] -STENOGRAPHY[1] Solicitor's [1] - 37:8 State [1] - 37:8 165:26, 168:29, 122:20 - 1:28 solicitor's [2] statement [42] -169:1, 184:10 speaking [9] - 22:21, step [4] - 29:12, 112:19, 112:28 6:19, 6:23, 7:6, 25:4, signed [8] - 15:3, 35:27, 52:8, 62:16, 29:15, 44:1, 153:22 SOLICITORS [2] -42:1, 49:25, 54:8, 29:21, 39:18, 89:21, 105:21, 111:19, steps [4] - 37:7, 2:28, 3:7 56:22, 57:8, 58:2, 124:28. 125:24. 126:8, 139:6, 168:17 89:13, 147:12, 157:25 66:29, 82:15, 85:10, solved [1] - 21:8 126:27, 127:22 specific [11] - 26:2, **still** [12] - 37:21, someone [2] - 42:3, 97:5, 97:13, 105:4, significance [3] -37:3, 53:29, 64:22, 39:9, 53:14, 64:27, 105:7, 105:23, 112:1 51:11, 111:7, 140:13 94:28, 99:16, 110:26, 65:1, 65:2, 65:4, 105:27, 105:28, sometime [2] significant [1] -110:29, 115:6, 103:6, 103:10, 121:3, 129:16, 54:13, 57:13 20:28

108:11, 167:14, 178:13 stolen [2] - 38:18, 67:23 stood [1] - 105:9 stools [1] - 18:2 stop [3] - 79:25, 130:24, 160:5 stopped [4] - 43:23, 44:10, 123:21, 123:24 **Store** [1] - 163:4 story [2] - 63:21, 132:20 straight [1] - 71:27 straightaway [1] -52:21 **STREET**[2] - 2:14, Street [1] - 163:5 stress [4] - 11:21, 11:22, 176:14, 176:18 stressed [3] -121:18, 127:5, 176:4 strictly [1] - 168:17 strike [2] - 71:25, 154:2 strongly [2] - 7:19, 9:23 structure [1] - 72:4 stuff [1] - 20:27 subject [9] - 33:25, 38:28, 39:12, 138:10, 151:18, 153:10, 161:15, 161:17, 172:11 subjected [1] - 22:7 submission [2] -152:28. 153:26 submit [3] - 90:21, 90:24, 90:27 submitted [15] -8:29, 18:25, 82:5, 83:28, 84:7, 84:17, 90:21, 90:24, 90:29, 92:10, 92:18, 94:17, 94:26, 95:1, 95:10 **subpoena** [1] - 36:3 subpoenaing [1] -177:19 subsequently [5] -24:24, 63:24, 124:26, 137:26. 173:21 substantive[1] - 8:6 sudden [1] - 121:24 suffered [1] - 94:14 sufficiently [1] -86.18 suggest [27] - 17:22, 46:23, 48:27, 52:25, 58:22, 74:23, 86:11,

86:19, 88:14, 89:11, 93:4, 97:19, 98:26, 105:24, 110:6, 128:14, 136:10, 137:21, 145:6, 146:21, 151:15, 152:25, 153:7, 161:7, 162:5, 181:25, 182:29 suggested [4] - 19:4, 116:9, 166:29, 168:18 suggesting [48] -9:10, 11:1, 16:26, 17:3, 17:11, 18:6, 18:18, 46:25, 47:4, 49:5, 50:26, 51:20, 52:14, 53:6, 61:17, 62:7, 62:16, 64:25, 65:28, 75:10, 75:18, 80:19, 97:24, 97:26, 106:1, 106:5, 107:28, 108:19, 110:7, 111:29, 120:15, 132:11, 136:22, 136:26, 142:22, 145:11, 146:22, 147:25, 147:26, 147:27, 148:4, 149:1, 152:2, 152:18, 160:9, 160:23, 166:4, 181:7 suggestion [5] -9:25, 19:2, 148:12, 158:1, 176:23 suggests [1] -116:12 summation [2] -7:13, 8:16 summations [1] -8:25 summoned [1] - 60:4 Sunday [6] - 107:28, 109:23, 109:24, 109:27, 110:8, 110:27 superimposing [1] -119:28 superintendent [13] - 19:6, 23:20, 29:22, 37:13, 37:19, 38:7, 49:11, 49:26, 112:7, 138:18, 149:25, 154:10, 157:7

Superintendent [39]

- 19:6, 46:27, 86:23,

87:7, 87:9, 89:20,

90.3 90.10 90.15

91:27, 93:9, 104:24,

137:2, 137:5, 139:5,

141:14, 141:20,

143:16, 143:22,

144:12, 146:11,

136:2, 136:3, 136:21,

157:18, 158:5, 158:7, 158:28, 159:11, 160:14, 161:8, 162:19, 165:10, 165:13, 173:18, 173:22 superior [1] - 49:26 superiors [2] -102:2, 180:4 supported [1] -161:7 **suppose** [3] - 25:18, 67:6, 147:28 Supterintendent [2] - 89:25, 90:1 surely [2] - 157:3, 157:9 surrounding [2] -127:26, 158:9 suspect [7] - 4:13, 34:24, 34:26, 39:7, 39:10, 39:13, 140:20 suspected [1] -154:16 suspicions [1] -77:25 swathes [1] - 73:21 Sweeney [1] -167:23 switch [1] - 65:6 Swords [27] - 22:18, 22:26, 23:15, 25:1, 30:9, 34:29, 40:1, 40:21. 41:10. 54:13. 55:20, 69:7, 107:13, 113:25, 113:28, 118:13, 118:19, 118:20, 118:22, 119:8, 119:11, 120:5, 120:21, 121:9, 121:14, 127:14, 130.13 system [9] - 11:17, 11:18, 11:24, 20:17, 31:8, 84:12, 92:22, 138.1 systems [18] - 76:3, 76:9, 78:24, 78:27, 79:16, 79:17, 79:20, 80:16, 80:24, 80:27, 84 19 85 4 85 9 87:8, 88:8, 128:23, 129:4, 180:15 **SÍOCHÁNA** [1] - 2:18 Síochána [28] - 4:15, 7:20, 21:19, 52:22, 77:2, 85:27, 85:29, 88:23, 90:7, 93:21, 97:14, 98:17, 99:13,

146:16, 152:4, 157:8,

102:9, 102:23, 136:24, 137:19, 138:9, 139:14, 139:15, 139:20, 141:5, 141:10, 142:26, 143:11, 167:19, 177:7, 181:3

T tackled [1] - 149:16 tactic [1] - 11:10 TAKE [1] - 4:7 tantamount [4] -146:1, 146:12, 152:20, 152:29 target [9] - 99:11, 99:19, 101:25, 101:26, 101:27, 102:28, 136:2, 157:2, 160:10 targeted [8] - 7:7, 7:26, 99:5, 99:9, 99:26, 101:15, 158:3, 167:17 targeting [21] - 7:21, 96:2, 99:10, 100:10, 101:4, 101:16, 101:17, 104:2, 104:18. 106:7. 156:28, 157:4, 157:7, 157:9, 158:2, 166:8, 166:21, 166:25, 166:26, 167:12, 169:1 targets [1] - 99:25 tasked [5] - 83:17, 87:18, 89:14, 146:11, 163:29 teacher [1] - 119:10 team [6] - 59:11, 60:28, 163:2, 163:16, 163:17, 163:23 technical [1] -157:24 telephone [6] -12:18, 70:1, 107:23, 109:16, 109:18, 109:29 template [1] - 147:20 **TEMPLE**[1] - 3:8 ten [1] - 119:3

ten-minute [1] -

tend [1] - 100:6

tendencies [1] -

tension [1] - 43:2

tentatively[1] -

119:3

30:16

152:1

termed [2] - 106:17, 122:29 terminology [3] -51:24, 51:25, 80:23 terms [11] - 34:5, 34:24, 34:26, 45:6, 58:20, 77:7, 82:4, 97:28, 151:2, 151:10, 161:23 terrible [1] - 182:17 terribly [2] - 153:11, 155:12 text [1] - 10:7 texts [1] - 36:16 **THAT**[2] - 4:12, 4:17 **THE** [16] - 1:2, 1:6, 1:7, 1:12, 2:3, 2:6, 2:15, 2:17, 4:7, 4:8, 6:1, 6:7, 21:16, 107:10, 185:3 theirs [1] - 19:29 themselves [2] -30:26, 89:9 there'd [3] - 103:13, 106:13 there'll [1] - 143:8 thereabouts [1] -112:12 thereafter [1] - 23:29 therefore [4] - 62:13, 102:12, 143:6, 143:7 therein [1] - 155:7 thinking [10] - 30:29, 76:25, 119:1, 119:2, 139:26, 140:27, 168:28, 180:23, 182:27 thinks [1] - 182:2 third [3] - 10:18, 13:14, 80:4 thirdly [1] - 62:28 thirds [1] - 178:29 thorough [5] - 93:15, 93:19, 93:20, 101:8, 101:12 thoughts [1] - 113:3 threat [25] - 26:1, 28:3, 28:10, 34:27, 36:29, 39:12, 39:13, 69:2. 72:15. 77:3. 79:7, 79:11, 95:2, 98:10, 98:16, 111:7, 111:10, 120:10, 120:16, 120:29, 136:12, 140:23, 141:23, 155:24, 156:9 threaten [2] - 25:28, 28:25

term [3] - 77:6,

80:24, 84:14

threatened [5] -28:8, 96:17, 96:18, 96:22, 180:2 threatening [1] -138:11 threats [23] - 26:1, 28:1, 28:15, 49:1, 54:1, 63:14, 63:28, 65:3, 74:9, 90:7, 92:23, 94:28, 96:9, 96:14, 96:28, 105:9, 110:17, 110:26, 111:1, 137:18, 139:14, 142:11, 142:27 three [10] - 62:17, 62:19, 63:3, 125:5, 125:8, 126:22, 127:29, 136:4, 164:19, 184:4 throughout [1] - 48:7 **Thursday** [2] - 17:2, 67:25 tide [1] - 71:29 time/delay [1] -166.21 timeframe [1] -117:10 timeline [11] - 25:17, 31:23, 32:21, 33:24, 35:19, 83:20, 83:21, 83:22, 163:27, 167:21, 173:6 timing [1] - 161:23 tiny [2] - 6:25, 132:8 tired [2] - 121:18, 127:5 title [1] - 89:23 **TO**[1] - 4:7 to.. [1] - 184:27 today [1] - 71:26 together [1] - 42:5 took [22] - 14:18, 25:7, 26:10, 29:12, 29:14, 37:7, 41:29, 89:13, 93:25, 123:9, 123:10, 124:28, 124:29, 125:22, 130:14, 147:15, 157:25, 163:15, 164:3, 166:10, 174:14, 174:15 top [7] - 11:26, 29:24, 83:13, 94:9, 130:2, 143:27, 150:16 totally [1] - 162:20 touch [1] - 60:17 towards [18] - 24:25, 26:1, 26:20, 28:4, 28:7, 28:8, 28:11,

28:21, 30:16, 73:17, 76:28, 104:26, 123:6, 125:2, 130:2, 170:12, 178:27, 179:1 track [1] - 133:7 train [3] - 112:21, 113:9, 117:28 transactions [1] -117:13 transcript [1] - 1:24 transmission [1] -138:19 transpired [1] -108:25 travel [1] - 32:14 treated [7] - 16:22, 29:5, 29:11, 31:3, 31:11, 31:16, 84:26 trial [10] - 35:25, 36:2, 36:8, 38:11, 38:23, 40:6, 43:3, 43:6, 154:13, 180:28 TRIBUNAL [3] - 1:1, 2:6, 4:9 tribunal [1] - 4:19 Tribunal [29] - 6:20, 6:23, 11:29, 19:29, 21:24, 39:26, 59:1, 75:29, 76:12, 81:25, 85:10, 111:28, 129:16, 129:17, 129:22, 129:28, 130:29, 131:8, 132:13, 133:12, 133:17, 134:22, 134:28, 135:28, 137:3, 158:4, 162:17, 165:11, 174:7 **TRIBUNALS**[1] - 1:7 tried [1] - 109:13 trouble [1] - 28:5

troubled [4] - 56:18,

56:27, 108:20, 108:27

troubles [1] - 151:20

troubling [1] - 63:3

55:29, 62:15, 113:26,

try [4] - 14:26, 24:21,

TUESDAY[1] - 185:3

Tuesday [11] - 53:8,

true [6] - 55:28,

trying [6] - 9:18,

19:20, 62:2, 75:15,

135:24

52:5, 111:14

99:16, 160:5

107:22, 108:2,

109:18, 110:12,

113:27, 114:20,

115:3, 115:18,

116:10, 159:23

ultimate [1] - 7:21 17:22, 17:25, 173:28, 174:2, 177:8 unable [4] - 92:2, 105:5, 105:27, 176:13 unblock [1] - 166:1 uncertainty [1] -131:23 unclear [1] - 60:20 uncomfortable [1] -182:9 uncover [4] - 88:26, 88:28, 89:2, 89:5 uncovered [1] -88.18 uncovering [1] -88:20 undated [1] - 122:21

151:14, 153:20, 155:24, 156:9, 174:6, 176:14, 176:18 underlined [3] -15:20, 73:25, 74:5 underneath [2] -57:25, 155:13 understood [1] -124.13 undertaken [3] -4:14, 7:8, 167:16 undertook [1] -118:13 underway [1] - 85:13 undesirable [1] -167:8 unduly [1] - 162:7 unfair [4] - 88:14, 106:7, 156:24, 181:8 unfairness [2] -132:11, 168:27 unfit [5] - 9:11, 11:3, 163:8, 164:13, 164:16 unfortunately [1] -172:29 unified [2] - 79:4, 79:5 uniform [2] - 56:25, 112:2 unit [2] - 35:1, 111:13 units [2] - 31:6, 48:19 unless [2] - 52:15, 182:26

U

turn [6] - 6:15, 66:23,

70:19, 118:21, 120:4,

 $\pmb{\text{turned}}\ [5]\ \textbf{-}\ 41:25,$

turning [1] - 118:20

twelve [1] - 114:20

two [38] - 8:29, 18:2,

66:25, 69:4, 79:19,

turns [1] - 19:7

twice [1] - 110:1

25:2, 27:24, 32:17,

38:23, 39:2, 56:8,

67:27, 71:23, 73:7,

91:18, 91:21, 107:27,

74:20, 78:6, 91:8,

115:16, 126:14,

132:16, 133:28,

138:13, 138:15,

138:21, 140:8,

145:23, 149:11,

149:28, 154:12,

156:13, 160:13,

168:25, 169:3,

169:25, 172:17,

145:23

174:3, 175:14, 178:29

two-day [1] - 25:2

two-pronged [1] -

42:12, 113:17, 181:1

typed [1] - 126:26

type [4] - 28:6,

179:20

183:15

unlikely [1] - 155:28 unpleasant [1] ultimately [6] - 8:10, 152:21 unrealistic [1] -47:21 unreasonable [2] -181:7. 181:10 unreasonably [1] -136:8 unrelated [1] - 38:14 unresolved [6] -7:11, 7:17, 8:21, 8:22, 184:11, 184:16 unsigned [2] - 57:29, 122:21 **UNTIL** [1] - 185:3 untrue [1] - 121:3 untypical [1] -140:15 unwell [1] - 121:28 UNDER [2] - 1:1, 1:7 **up** [59] - 7:7, 7:10, under [16] - 13:19, 7:27, 8:1, 8:2, 10:12, 28:4, 32:29, 33:21, 12:27, 26:11, 40:29, 39:9, 46:15, 138:21, 41:25, 49:10, 49:11, 141:23, 149:25, 49:13, 49:16, 49:27,

51:1, 55:22, 62:25, 66:12, 68:19, 68:23, 81:27, 85:12, 85:20, 85:24, 88:16, 94:9, 96:16, 99:7, 111:28, 118:20, 118:21, 120:4, 122:15, 123:4, 126:9, 127:1, 127:6, 132:8, 135:18, 143:7, 143:25, 153:22, 153:24, 155:9, 158:27, 160:4, 160:6, 162:3, 162:8, 162:13, 162:28, 164:3, 167:2, 177:3, 178:21, 178:25, 180:27, 183:14 upbeat [1] - 123:23 upset [3] - 56:17, 56:26, 108:27 upstairs [2] - 19:22, 55:23 urgent [1] - 31:3 urgently [4] - 29:5, 29:11, 31:11, 31:16 useful [1] - 20:29

٧

various [5] - 9:29, 82:23, 82:24, 111:24, 140:17 vehicle [1] - 29:6 veiled [4] - 26:1, 28:1, 28:3, 28:15 verb [1] - 43:4 verbatim [1] - 1:24 verse [1] - 96:21 version [1] - 126:26 versus [1] - 59:25 **via**[1] - 37:12 vicinity [1] - 31:4 victim [57] - 38:26, 40:8, 40:24, 45:4, 47:8, 50:2, 51:2, 51:4, 52:19, 58:25, 61:20, 62:11, 64:19, 64:24, 64:28, 92:18, 100:4, 100:9, 105:2, 105:20, 105:22, 114:5, 114:26, 115:19, 115:26, 115:29, 116:3, 116:5, 116:9, 116:18, 116:19, 116:23, 116:24, 117:20, 118:4, 118:15, 119:17, 119:18, 120:25, 120:27, 121:6,

121:24, 122:19,	65:23, 66:2, 67:4,	widespread [1] -	woven [1] - 73:29	6
122:24, 124:29,	67:9, 67:12, 67:24,	102:15	wrapped [1] - 167:2	
126:7, 142:15, 145:2,	67:28, 68:2, 69:26,	WILLIAM [3] - 2:10,	wreck [1] - 55:28	
155:25, 156:8,	70:6, 70:8, 70:14,	5:3, 6:12	write [7] - 80:1,	'A' [1] - 4:13
159:12, 160:6,	71:7, 71:13, 72:17,	William [6] - 54:14,	102:25, 122:2, 127:9,	
160:15, 160:20,	72:24, 75:11, 76:2,	57:11, 57:24, 144:16,	127:10, 127:17,	_
161:4, 161:19, 184:5	77:10, 80:25, 86:12,	152:8, 176:3	164:24	
Victim [24] - 39:22,	86:21, 87:23, 88:12,	wish [5] - 89:11,	writing [4] - 4:19,	4 -
46:19, 49:18, 51:10,	128:3, 128:4, 128:27,	89:27, 134:6, 134:16,	71:27, 127:15, 179:10	- [1] - 4:7
51:21, 52:10, 57:26,	129:21, 129:23,	150:21	written [17] - 15:15,	É
57:28, 58:7, 58:9,	133:13, 134:25	wished [1] - 134:10	27:18, 42:1, 42:3,	E
62:28, 64:14, 70:7,	wants [2] - 19:17,	wit [1] - 172:10	42:4, 43:17, 73:6,	
92:10, 95:11, 95:15,	111:28	withdraw [3] - 24:26,	122:10, 125:23,	ÉABHALL [1] - 3:6
100:2, 100:12,	warrant [2] - 22:27,	25:3, 25:12	126:17, 126:24,	ÉIREANN [2] - 1:3,
103:20, 114:6, 116:4,	23:22	withheld [6] - 73:3,	129:7, 130:15,	1:4
127:27, 140:1, 158:9	warranted [3] -	73:4, 75:6, 88:21,	133:19, 150:4, 165:1,	
victims [1] - 154:15	98:20, 106:23, 106:25	88:27, 89:7	165:5	
view [12] - 18:10,	wary [2] - 162:22,	withhold [1] - 89:6	wrote [14] - 9:29,	
32:25, 41:4, 76:7,	162:24	WITNESS [3] - 5:2,	71:14, 71:17, 71:18,	
76:9, 76:17, 76:20,	WAS [2] - 6:12,	6:7, 21:16	126:25, 165:23,	
86:15, 95:24, 140:22,	21:16	witness [8] - 21:13,	167:27, 168:21,	
159:20, 160:1	was" [1] - 110:19	21:14, 26:16, 33:9,	169:11, 169:19,	
viewing [2] - 49:22,	watching [1] -	132:3, 150:14, 151:4,	171:25, 173:7, 173:9,	
146:21	124:25	183:1	173:13	
views [4] - 16:12,	Waters [3] - 60:17,	witnesses [4] -		
56:12, 90:6, 171:28	91:4	38:23, 60:3, 154:13,	Υ	
violence [3] - 22:8,	Wayne [1] - 92:14	161:13		
138:10, 138:12	we [1] - 37:21	wonder [6] - 45:17,	yeah [1] - 176:15	
violent [1] - 30:16	weapon [1] - 37:4	109:21, 119:26,	year [5] - 25:18,	
VIR [2] - 156:7,	Wednesday [11] -	143:21, 168:27,	38:13, 87:11, 163:14,	
159:27	45:21, 56:8, 113:7,	177:25	166:10	
visibly [2] - 56:17, 56:26	114:7, 114:20,	wondered [2] -	years [17] - 9:18,	
	114:25, 115:22,	109:9, 118:8	56:15, 71:23, 73:7,	
visit [15] - 35:23, 35:24, 36:20, 36:21,	118:14, 119:7,	wondering [1] -	74:20, 78:6, 82:1,	
41:21, 42:7, 43:11,	127:29, 159:23 week [3] - 67:10,	121:25	113:16, 132:16,	
46:14, 64:15, 64:26,	68:15, 123:3	word [7] - 64:11, 65:19, 67:15, 94:20,	146:27, 149:11,	
105:25, 121:7, 122:8,	weeks [3] - 85:28,	109:14, 120:13,	156:14, 160:13,	
128:1	166:29, 167:2	120:14	162:14, 174:3,	
visited [9] - 32:22,	WELLINGTON [1] -	wording [5] - 143:20,	178:15, 184:4	
35:19, 40:2, 46:9,	3:7	144:3, 144:25,	yes [2] - 80:18,	
49:23, 64:19, 91:2,	whatsoever [1] -	151:16, 152:3	103:29	
181:2	45:2	words [11] - 14:7,	yourself [27] - 24:1,	
visiting [1] - 46:2	wherein [4] - 140:2,	28:5, 44:4, 52:9, 74:5,	24:9, 25:25, 28:8,	
visits [4] - 40:14,	154:24, 155:25,	75:27, 109:12,	29:21, 37:19, 38:6,	
41:18, 86:7, 114:14	172:22	112:11, 149:5,	39:18, 44:11, 47:10,	
vividly [1] - 119:9	whilst [2] - 29:19,	164:27, 181:13	48:1, 63:10, 97:19, 108:21, 110:17,	
volatile [1] - 177:23	173:27	workplace [1] -	112:13, 122:18,	
100	whistleblower [2] -	14:10	149:2, 160:6, 175:12,	
W	11:11, 11:16	worn [2] - 7:18, 9:22	177:6, 177:14,	
	whistleblowing [1] -	worried [4] - 80:3,	177:15, 177:26,	
wait [3] - 26:29,	161:26	134:12, 153:4, 153:12	177:27, 181:8, 182:3	
131:17	whole [12] - 62:10,	worry [9] - 51:11,		
waiting [1] - 122:15	63:21, 75:25, 75:26,	51:25, 52:11, 64:6,	Ζ	
Walsh [2] - 19:21,	75:28, 79:6, 93:25,	66:12, 75:16, 104:8,		
91:29	114:10, 143:1, 146:24, 170:13,	153:25, 183:20		
Walter [38] - 50:20,		worrying [2] - 134:8,	zero [1] - 143:26	
51:12, 63:6, 63:10,	I 170·14	13 <u>4</u> ·18		
01.12, 00.0, 00.10,	170:14 wholly 121 - 158:1	134:18		
63:18, 64:5, 64:23,	170:14 wholly [2] - 158:1, 160:9	134:18 worse [1] - 160:1 worth [1] - 149:22		